



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mercher, 2 Tachwedd 2005  
Wednesday, 2 November 2005**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services .....	3
Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon Questions to the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport.....	19
Tai Fforddiadwy Affordable Housing.....	36
Dadl Fer: A Fydd Carthu'n Dinistrio'r Ardal o Harddwch Naturiol Eithriadol Gyntaf yn y DU? Short Debate: Will Dredging Destroy the UK's First Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty?.	88

Cofnodir y trafodion hyn yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal, cynhwysir cyfieithiad Saesneg o gyfraniadau yn y Gymraeg. Mae hon yn fersiwn ddrafft o'r cofnod. Cyhoeddir fersiwn derfynol ymhen pum diwrnod gwaith.

These proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee. In addition, an English translation of Welsh speeches is included. This is a draft version of the record. The final version will be published within five working days.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services**

### **Gofal Iechyd (Gogledd Cymru) Healthcare (North Wales)**

**Q1 Janet Ryder:** Will the Minister make a statement on how he is improving access to healthcare in north Wales? OAQ0504(HSS)

**C1 Janet Ryder:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y ffordd mae'n gwella mynediad i ofal iechyd yng ngogledd Cymru? OAQ0504(HSS)

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** 'Designed for Life' includes action to improve health, social care and wellbeing for all, and to transform services. In the first three years, it will focus on improving coronary heart disease, cancer, mental health services for older people and children, and services for those with chronic diseases awaiting elective treatment.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Mae 'Cynllun Oes' yn cynnwys camau gweithredu i wella iechyd, gofal cymdeithasol a lles i bawb, ac i drawsnewid gwasanaethau. Yn ystod y tair blynedd cyntaf, bydd yn canolbwyntio ar wella clefyd coronaidd y galon, canser, gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl i bobl hŷn a phlant, a gwasanaethau i bobl â chlefydau cronig sy'n aros am driniaeth ddewisol.

**Janet Ryder:** Minister, well over 1,000 people were formerly served by the medical practice based in Cerrigydrudion, and they do not feel as though they will have good access to healthcare if and when the local health board goes ahead with its plan to transfer the contract to the Corwen practice. I went to a very well-attended public meeting at Cerrigydrudion, along with your colleague, Alun Pugh, at which he promised the people of Cerrigydrudion and the seven surrounding community councils that he would broker a meeting between you, those seven councils and the local county councillor, to make sure that we discuss these issues thoroughly. Those patients do not want to be registered at Corwen; they want an independent practice to be retained in Cerrigydrudion. Are you willing to agree to that meeting, Minister?

**Janet Ryder:** Weinidog, yr oedd ymhell dros 1,000 o bobl yn cael eu gwasanaethu gan y feddygfa yng Ngherrigydrudion, ac nid ydynt yn teimlo y byddant yn cael mynediad da i ofal iechyd os a phan aiff y bwrdd iechyd lleol ati i drosglwyddo'r contract i'r practis yng Nghorwen. Bŵm mewn cyfarfod cyhoeddus yng Ngherrigydrudion lle yr oedd nifer fawr o bobl yn bresennol, ynghyd â'ch cyd-Weinidog, Alun Pugh, ac addawodd i bobl Cerrigydrudion a'r saith cyngor cymuned cyfagos y byddai'n trefnu cyfarfod rhyngoch chi, y saith cyngor hynny a'r cynghorydd sir lleol i sicrhau ein bod yn trafod y materion hyn yn fanwl. Nid yw'r cleifion hynny am gael eu cofrestru yng Nghorwen; mae arnynt eisiau practis annibynnol i barhau yng Ngherrigydrudion. A ydych yn fodlon cytuno i'r cyfarfod hwnnw, Weinidog?

**Brian Gibbons:** I am not in a position to agree to that, and certainly not today. This matter has been raised with me by my colleague, Alun Pugh, but you will know that this is not a straightforward or uncomplicated issue. There are several contending views as

**Brian Gibbons:** Nid wyf mewn sefyllfa i gytuno i hynny, ac yn sicr nid heddiw. Mae fy nghyd-Weinidog, Alun Pugh, wedi codi'r mater hwn gyda mi, ond gwyddoch nad yw hwn yn fater syml. Mae llawer barn groes am y ffordd orau ymlaen. Yr oedd mwyafrif clir

to the best way forward. There was a clear majority in the interview panel on the best choice of establishing the new practice at Corwen. In establishing that, one consideration was that it would give local people stability and a range of quality services in a local setting. That was one issue to which the local health board paid a lot of attention, taking the advice of the interview panel. This proposed way forward could guarantee local services, an increased range of services and improved quality.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Surely the underlying principle of local health boards is to ensure local accountability. I was at the protest on Monday, and I feel strongly that the *raison d'être* of local health boards is to go with the wishes of the local community. As my AM colleague, Janet Ryder, has just said, most of the local people who were asked said that they wanted the Cerrigydrudion practice retained. The doctor has been there for them 100 per cent, and the two local councillors on the local health board wanted that same doctor to continue. What is the point of having a local health board if there is no local accountability?

**Brian Gibbons:** The purpose of having local accountability is to listen to the views of local people, as well as to take into account a thorough needs assessment of local health services. I know that the local health board has listened to what local people have said. However, it does not necessarily follow that the board has to agree with what is said by local people, if it feels that the proposals that it is putting forward will provide improved, more sustainable services, as well as a wider range of services. The local health board listened to what local people said, but it also took into account how best to provide an increased range of services in a more sustainable way.

**Brynle Williams:** To follow on from the points made by my north Wales colleagues, the position in Cerrigydrudion is that a local doctor is required by the community. The local health board should, instead of putting in another practice, provide another doctor to assist the doctor already there. That is local democracy at work. Would you look into the

yn y panel cyf-weld o blaid y dewis gorau o sefydlu'r practis newydd yng Nghorwen. Wrth sefydlu hynny, un o'r ystyriaethau oedd y byddai'n rhoi sefydlogrwydd ac amrywiaeth o wasanaethau o safon yn lleol i bobl lleol. Rhoddodd y bwrdd iechyd lleol gryn sylw i'r mater hwnnw, gan wrando ar gyngor y panel cyf-weld. Gallai'r ffordd arfaethedig hon ymlaen sicrhau gwasanaethau lleol, amrywiaeth ehangach o wasanaethau a gwell safon.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Onid egwyddor sylfaenol byrddau iechyd lleol yw sicrhau atebolrwydd lleol? Yr oeddwn yn bresennol yn y brotest ddydd Llun, a themlaff yn gryf mai'r rheswm dros fodolaeth byrddau iechyd lleol yw parchu dymuniadau'r gymuned lleol. Fel y mae fy nghyd-Aelod, Janet Ryder, newydd ei ddweud, dywedodd mwyafrif y bobl lleol a holwyd eu bod yn dymuno gweld practis Cerrigydrudion yn parhau. Mae'r meddyg wedi bod yno iddynt bob amser, ac yr oedd y ddau gynghorydd lleol ar y bwrdd iechyd lleol am i'r meddyg hwnnw barhau. Beth yw diben cael bwrdd iechyd lleol os nad oes unrhyw atebolrwydd lleol?

**Brian Gibbons:** Diben atebolrwydd lleol yw gwrandawro ar safbwyntiau pobl lleol, yn ogystal ag ystyried asesiad trylwyr o anghenion gwasanaethau iechyd lleol. Gwn fod y bwrdd iechyd lleol wedi gwrandawro ar yr hyn y mae pobl lleol wedi'i ddweud. Fodd bynnag, nid yw o reidrwydd yn golygu bod yn rhaid i'r bwrdd gytuno â'r hyn y mae pobl lleol yn ei ddweud, os yw o'r farn y bydd y cynigion a gyflwynir ganddo yn darparu gwasanaethau gwell, mwy cynaliadwy, yn ogystal ag amrywiaeth ehangach o wasanaethau. Gwrandawodd y bwrdd iechyd lleol ar yr hyn a ddywedodd y bobl lleol, ond hefyd ystyriodd y ffordd orau i ddarparu amrywiaeth ehangach o wasanaethau mewn ffordd fwy cynaliadwy.

**Brynle Williams:** I pwyntiau a wnaed gan fy nghyd-Aelodau o'r gogledd, y sefyllfa yw fod angen meddyg lleol ar y gymuned yng Ngherrigydrudion. Yn hytrach na chreu practis arall, dylai'r bwrdd iechyd lleol ddarparu meddyg arall i gynorthwyo'r meddyg sydd yno'n barod. Dyna yw democratiaeth lleol ar waith. A wnewch

matter, Minister? I would appreciate it if you would do so.

**Brian Gibbons:** It is the case, is it not, Brynle, that the local health board is putting forward these proposals with a view to providing a sustainable local practice in the area? The whole point of the board's decision is to guarantee a local service of improved quality, as well as a wider range of services. Therefore, the commitment is to provide primary care and GP services in that community. It is the local health board's decision as to the way to deliver that in the long term with consistent quality, having taken into consideration the interview panel and local opinion.

ymchwilio i'r mater, Weinidog? Byddwn yn gwerthfawrogi hynny.

**Brian Gibbons:** Onid yw'n wir, Brynle, fod y bwrdd iechyd lleol yn cyflwyno'r cynigion hyn gyda'r bwriad o ddarparu practis lleol cynaliadwy yn yr ardal? Diben penderfyniad y bwrdd yw sicrhau gwasanaeth lleol o well safon, yn ogystal ag amrywiaeth ehangach o wasanaethau. Felly, yr ymrwymiad yw darparu gwasanaethau gofal sylfaenol a gwasanaethau meddyg teulu yn y gymuned honno. Penderfyniad y bwrdd iechyd lleol yw sut i ddarparu hynny dros gyfnod hir a sicrhau ansawdd cyson, ar ôl ystyried barn y panel cyf-weld a barn y bobl lleol.

### Amseroedd Aros y GIG NHS Waiting Times

**Q2 The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** Will the Minister update us on the length of NHS waiting times in Wales? OAQ0465(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** As at 30 September, improvements were recorded in those waiting more than 12 months for in-patients, day cases and out-patients. The number waiting more than 12 months for in-patient treatment is at its lowest since 1994, when records began based on Welsh residents. The number of those waiting more than 12 months for out-patient appointments is at its lowest for half a decade.

**Nick Bourne:** I hope that I did not note a tinge of complacency entering into the Minister's response. There are still 230,000 on the out-patient waiting list and more than 64,000 on the in-patient waiting list. Do you expect to meet your target of no-one waiting more than 12 months by March next year, and, if so, by how much?

**Brian Gibbons:** We are not going to start predicting by how much we will exceed it, but we are committed to working to deliver the targets that we have already put on public record.

**C2 Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i ni am hyd amseroedd aros y GIG yng Nghymru? OAQ0465(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Ar 30 Medi, cofnodwyd gwelliannau yn nifer y rheini a oedd yn aros mwy na 12 mis fel cleifion mewnol, achosion dydd a chleifion allanol. Mae'r nifer sy'n aros mwy na 12 mis am driniaeth fel cleifion mewnol ar ei isaf er 1994, pan ddechreuodd cofnodion yn seiliedig ar bobl sy'n byw yng Nghymru. Mae nifer y rheini sy'n aros mwy na 12 mis am apwyntiad fel cleifion allanol ar ei isaf ers hanner degawd.

**Nick Bourne:** Gobeithio na sylwais ar nodyn o hunanfodddhad yn ymateb y Gweinidog. Mae 230,000 o bobl ar y rhestr aros fel cleifion allanol o hyd, a mwy na 64,000 o bobl ar y rhestr aros fel cleifion mewnol. A ydych yn disgwyl cyflawni eich targed, sef na fydd neb yn aros mwy na 12 mis erbyn mis Mawrth y flwyddyn nesaf, ac os felly, o faint?

**Brian Gibbons:** Nid ydym am ddechrau rhagfynegi faint y byddwn yn rhagori ar y targed hwnnw, ond yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i weithio i gyflawni'r targedau yr ydym eisoes wedi eu rhoi ar gofnod cyhoeddus.

**Nick Bourne:** I would hope that you are committed to trying to reach the target, but that was not the question that I asked. I asked whether you were standing by your statement that you will reach the target by March next year. A simple 'yes' or 'no' would do.

**Brian Gibbons:** Yes, that is certainly our intention.

**Nick Bourne:** I did not ask what your intention was; I asked whether you were confident of reaching the target. Either you are unable to understand a simple question, or you do not want to give the answer. Over one in 10 people in Wales is on a waiting list still. There is no room for complacency. You have not restated the target, Minister, and have not said whether you are confident that you will reach that target by March next year. Will you reach the target of no-one waiting longer than 12 months?

**Brian Gibbons:** If you are asking whether I am confident, then the answer is 'yes'.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 3, OAQ0443(HSS), yn ôl.

**Nick Bourne:** Byddwn yn gobeithio eich bod wedi ymrwymo i geisio cyflawni'r targed, ond nid dyna'r cwestiwn a ofynnais. Gofynnais a oeddech yn cadw at eich datganiad y byddwch yn cyrraedd y targed erbyn mis Mawrth y flwyddyn nesaf. Byddai 'ie' neu 'na' yn gwneud y tro.

**Brian Gibbons:** Ie, dyna ein bwriad yn bendant.

**Nick Bourne:** Ni ofynnais beth oedd eich bwriad; gofynnais a oeddech yn hyderus y byddwch yn cyrraedd y targed. Naill ai nid ydych yn gallu deall cwestiwn syml, neu nid ydych am roi'r ateb. Mae mwy nag un person bob 10 yng Nghymru ar restr aros o hyd. Nid oes lle i fod yn hunanfodlon. Nid ydych wedi ailddatgan y targed, Weinidog, ac nid ydych wedi dweud a ydych yn hyderus y byddwch yn cyrraedd y targed hwnnw erbyn mis Mawrth y flwyddyn nesaf. A fyddwch yn cyrraedd y targed o sicrhau na fydd neb yn aros mwy na 12 mis?

**Brian Gibbons:** Os ydych yn gofyn a wyf yn hyderus, yna 'ydw' yw'r ateb.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 3, OAQ0443(HSS), has been withdrawn.

#### **'Agenda ar Gyfer Newid' 'Agenda for Change'**

**C4 Owen John Thomas:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am yr 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid'? OAQ0454(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Currently, 60 per cent of staff in Wales have been matched, and nearly 20 per cent have been assimilated to 'Agenda for Change' pay scales. The agreement in Wales, reached in partnership, is that the matching and assimilation process should be broadly completed by the end of this year.

**Owen John Thomas:** I understand that the Welsh Assembly Government allocated £12.5 million to implement 'Agenda for Change' for 2005-06, including cover for back-dated payments to the Welsh ambulance service staff. However, it is envisaged that full implementation would create a deficit of £2.5 million. Will 'Agenda for Change'

**Q4 Owen John Thomas:** Will the Minister make a statement on 'Agenda for Change'? OAQ0454(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Ar hyn o bryd, mae 60 y cant o staff yng Nghymru wedi'u paru â swyddi, ac mae bron 20 y cant wedi'u cymathu â graddfeydd cyflog 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid'. Y cytundeb yng Nghymru, a wnaed mewn partneriaeth, yw y dylid cwblhau'r broses o baru a chymathu yn fras erbyn diwedd eleni.

**Owen John Thomas:** Deallaf fod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi dyrannu £12.5 miliwn i weithredu'r 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' yn 2005-06, gan gynnwys arian ar gyfer taliadau ôl-ddyddiedig i staff gwasanaeth ambiwlans Cymru. Fodd bynnag, rhagwelir y byddai gweithredu hynny'n llawn yn creu diffyg o £2.5 miliwn. A fydd yr

survive this financial crisis, and, if so, what steps are you taking to ensure its survival?

**Brian Gibbons:** I would think that we are actually allocating three to four times the amount that you have indicated.

2.10 p.m.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** We are now only six months away from the start of the new dental contract, after a number of false starts. Your Government's record in introducing new initiatives is not the best; the out-of-hours contract was one indication that new contracts are not always implemented in a simple and straightforward way. Can you give dentists and patients a guarantee that this new contract will be introduced smoothly?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yes.

**Michael German:** In that case, what difference do you expect to see from current circumstances, in which people who want to get onto an NHS list by registering with a local dentist find themselves at the end of a queue going around the block, several times on occasion? In Wales, 45.5 per cent of adults and 59.3 per cent of children are registered with an NHS dentist. Those are the worst figures on record for adults and the second worst set of figures for children. Patients are desperate to register. Can you assure us that what you do with the new dental contract ensures that this state of affairs does not continue into the future and that people will not have to queue around the block to register with an NHS dentist?

**Brian Gibbons:** You will know, Mike, that something of the order of 30 or 32 practices have registered with personal dental service schemes. This has successfully led to over 10 per cent of the present number of patients on NHS dental lists transferring to PDS schemes. More than 100 practices have applied to join PDS schemes. If those practices continue with their applications, the increased access that PDS is already delivering will also be further extended,

'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' yn gallu dod drwy'r argyfwng ariannol hwn, ac os felly, pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd i sicrhau hynny?

**Brian Gibbons:** Credaf ein bod mewn gwirionedd yn dyrannu tair neu bedair gwaith y swm a nodwyd gennych.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Dim ond chwe mis bellach sydd cyn dechrau'r contract deintyddol newydd, ar ôl llawer cam gwag. Nid yw record eich Llywodraeth o ran cyflwyno mentrau newydd ymhlith y gorau; yr oedd y contract y tu allan i oriau yn un arwydd nad yw contractau newydd bob amser yn cael eu gweithredu mewn ffordd syml. A allwch roi sicrwydd i ddeintyddion a chleifion y bydd y contract newydd hwn yn cael ei gyflwyno'n ddiraffferth?

**Brian Gibbons:** Gallaf.

**Michael German:** Os felly, pa wahaniaeth y disgwyliwch ei weld o'i gymharu â'r sefyllfa bresennol, lle mae pobl sydd am ymuno â rhestr GIG drwy gofrestru gyda deintydd lleol yn gorfod ymuno â rhes hirfaith o bobl, a hynny lawer gwaith ar adegau? Yng Nghymru, mae 45.5 y cant o oedolion a 59.3 y cant o blant wedi cofrestru gyda deintydd y GIG. Dyna'r ffigurau gwaethaf erioed ar gyfer oedolion a'r ffigurau gwaethaf erioed ond un ar gyfer plant. Mae cleifion yn ysu am gael cofrestru. A allwch roi sicrwydd inni y bydd yr hyn a wnewch gyda'r contract deintyddol newydd yn sicrhau na fydd y sefyllfa hon yn parhau yn y dyfodol, ac na fydd yn rhaid i bobl ymuno â rhes hirfaith i gofrestru gyda deintydd y GIG?

**Brian Gibbons:** Fe wyddoch, Mike, fod tua 30 neu 32 o bractisau wedi cofrestru gyda chynlluniau gwasanaeth deintyddol personol. Mae hyn wedi arwain at drosglwyddo dros 10 y cant o'r nifer bresennol o gleifion sydd ar restrau deintyddol y GIG i gynlluniau GDP yn llwyddiannus. Mae dros 100 o bractisau wedi gwneud cais am ymuno â chynlluniau GDP. Os bydd y practisau hynny'n parhau â'u ceisiadau, bydd y cynnydd o ran mynediad a ddarperir eisoes gan GDP hefyd

pending the introduction of the new contract in April 2006.

**Michael German:** If I were to ask you in 12 months' time about the number of people registered with an NHS dentist, currently only 45.5 per cent of adults and 59.3 per cent of children, what would you expect that figure to be?

**Brian Gibbons:** I would expect it to have substantially increased. Whether or not you want me to give you a figure in terms of 52.369 per cent or whatever—

**Michael German:** That would be a reduction.

**Brian Gibbons:** That would not be a reduction for adults, but that sort of prognostication is not possible, and it is fatuous even to suggest that. However, the intention is that many more people who wish to access dental treatment through the NHS can do so following PDS and the introduction of the new dental contract.

**David Melding:** 'Agenda for Change' will have a knock-on effect on other sectors, such as nursing homes. When local authorities are encouraged to use the new toolkit to assess the proper rate for fees, will you ensure that 'Agenda for Change' is taken into account, as well as the need to implement it in that sector?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yes. You will be aware that the Assembly Government is looking with interest at the work undertaken by the Welsh Local Government Association on the toolkit. If you look at the draft budget, you will see a substantial increase in the allocation for social services from the Assembly as well as an indicative line of support for the toolkit. Both the dramatic increase in resources going into adult social services and the allocation for the implementation of the toolkit provide a clear indication of the direction in which we would like to travel.

yn ehangu ymhellach, nes i'r contract newydd gael ei gyflwyno ym mis Ebrill 2006.

**Michael German:** Pe byddwn yn eich holi ymhen 12 mis am nifer y bobl sydd wedi cofrestru gyda deintydd y GIG, sef 45.5 y cant o oedolion a 59.3 y cant o blant yn unig ar hyn o bryd, beth fydddech yn disgwyl i'r ffigur hwnnw fod?

**Brian Gibbons:** Byddwn yn disgwyl iddo fod wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol. Pe baech am imi roi ffigur i chi o ran 52.369 y cant neu beth bynnag—

**Michael German:** Byddai hynny'n ostyngiad.

**Brian Gibbons:** Ni fyddai hynny'n ostyngiad o ran oedolion, ond nid yw'r math hwnnw o ddarogan yn bosibl, ac mae'n wirion hyd yn oed awgrymu hynny. Fodd bynnag, y bwriad yw galluogi llawer iawn mwy o bobl sydd am gael triniaeth ddeintyddol drwy'r GIG i wneud hynny, yn sgil GDP a chyflwyno'r contract deintyddol newydd.

**David Melding:** Bydd yr 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' yn effeithio ar sectorau eraill, megis cartrefi nyrsio. Pan anogir awdurdodau lleol i ddefnyddio'r pecyn offer newydd i asesu'r gyfradd gywir ar gyfer ffioedd, a fyddwch yn sicrhau bod yr 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' yn cael ei hystyried, yn ogystal â'r angen i'w gweithredu yn y sector hwnnw?

**Brian Gibbons:** Byddaf. Byddwch yn ymwybodol fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cymryd diddordeb yn y gwaith a wneir gan Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ar y pecyn offer. Os edrychwch ar y gyllideb ddrafft, gwelwch gynnydd sylweddol yn y dyraniad ar gyfer gwasanaethau cymdeithasol gan y Cynulliad, yn ogystal â chefnogaeth amlwg i'r pecyn offer. Mae'r cynnydd sylweddol mewn adnoddau ar gyfer gwasanaethau cymdeithasol oedolion a'r dyraniad ar gyfer gweithredu'r pecyn offer yn arwydd clir o'r cyfeiriad yr hoffem anelu ato.

#### **Deintyddiaeth y GIG (Gorllewin De Cymru) NHS Dentistry (South Wales West)**

**Q5 Peter Black:** Will the Minister make a statement on the future of NHS dentistry in

**C5 Peter Black:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddyfodol deintyddiaeth y GIG



South Wales West? OAQ0489(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** We are introducing the new dental contract to improve access for patients and the working lives of dentists. A sum of £5 million is available to roll out PDS services, encouraging dentists to stay in the NHS. We are continuing to work with local health boards to use dental initiative grants to secure further NHS provision.

**Peter Black:** My dentist has opted out of the NHS, and I understand from the local press that your dentist has also opted out of the NHS. Hundreds of people in Neath Port Talbot have recently lost their NHS dentist. Can you explain how all these initiatives will help those people in the short term, and how will they get their NHS dentists back?

**Brian Gibbons:** The answer is by addressing the concerns of dentists about their current contractual arrangements, which, as you know, we inherited from the previous Conservative Government. It was the need to change that legacy that led to our bringing forward this new contract.

Hopefully, by providing dentists with better working conditions and an opportunity to work on a guaranteed income in line with current best practice, dentists will see that there is an exciting opportunity in pursuing a career within the NHS.

**Val Lloyd:** Unfortunately, we are all too well aware that many local dentists favour the more lucrative option of private practice. However, there are dentists who wish to practice within the NHS. Would you join me in recognising the results achieved by Swansea Local Health Board in rolling out nine PDS schemes, with another to go live in a few days' time, and in having a further eight under discussion?

**Brian Gibbons:** In view of the good progress being made by Swansea LHB, it is remarkable that Peter Black did not choose to highlight that in his contribution. He obviously prefers to concentrate on the negative, but that does not surprise me.

yng Ngorllewin De Cymru? OAQ0489(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr ydym yn cyflwyno'r contract deintyddol newydd i wella mynediad i gleifion ac i wella bywyd gwaith deintyddion. Mae £5 miliwn ar gael i gyflwyno gwasanaethau GDP, gan annog deintyddion i aros yn y GIG. Yr ydym yn parhau i weithio gyda byrddau iechyd lleol i ddefnyddio grantiau menter ddeintyddol i sicrhau darpariaeth GIG bellach.

**Peter Black:** Mae fy neintydd i wedi eithrio o'r GIG, a deallaf o'r wasg leol fod eich deintydd chi hefyd wedi eithrio o'r GIG. Mae cannoedd o bobl yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot wedi colli eu deintydd GIG yn ddiweddar. A allwch egluro sut y bydd yr holl fentrau hyn yn helpu'r bobl hynny dros gyfnod byr, a sut y cânt eu deintyddion GIG yn ôl?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr ateb yw drwy fynd i'r afael â phryderon deintyddion ynghylch eu trefniadau cytundebol presennol, a etifeddwyd gennym, fel y gwyrddoch, gan y Llywodraeth Geidwadol flaenorol. Yr angen am newid yr etifeddiaeth honno a arweiniodd at gyflwyno'r contract newydd hwn.

Drwy roi gwell amodau gwaith i ddeintyddion a chyfle i weithio am incwm gwarantedig yn ôl yr arfer cyfredol, gobeithio y bydd deintyddion yn gweld bod cyfle cyffrous iddynt ddilyn gyrfa yn y GIG.

**Val Lloyd:** Yn anffodus, gŵyr pob un ohonom yn dda ei bod yn well gan nifer o ddeintyddion lleol ddewis practis preifat proffidiol. Fodd bynnag, mae yna ddeintyddion sydd am ymarfer yn y GIG. A ymunwch â mi i gydnabod llwyddiannau Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Abertawe wedi iddynt roi naw cynllun Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol ar waith, ac un arall i gychwyn ymhen ychydig ddyddiau, a thrafodaethau'n mynd rhagddynt i sefydlu wyth arall?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yng ngoleuni'r cynnydd da y mae Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Abertawe yn ei wneud, mae'n rhyfedd na ddewisodd Peter Black dynnu sylw at hynny yn ei gyfraniad. Mae'n amlwg yn well ganddo ganolbwyntio ar yr ochr negyddol, ond nid yw hynny'n fy

synnu.

**Janet Davies:** There seems to be a major problem in the Neath Port Talbot area with many dentists going private suddenly without giving patients notice of the change. You have referred to the introduction of the PDS scheme. What assurance can you give that there will be a co-ordinated changeover for patients who have to transfer from their current dentists to PDS dentists? Will we see thousands of patients left stranded in terms of dental time and capacity in the next few months, which is a nightmare possibility?

**Brian Gibbons:** The way that practices transfer from their current contractual arrangements to PDS invariably means that they take their own patients with them. Consequently, there is continuity for patients moving from the old dental contract to the PDS contract. One of the advantages of the PDS contract is that it provides an opportunity for dentists to take on extra patients. Current evidence shows that dentists in practices that have already moved over to the PDS contract are taking on an extra 5 to 10 per cent of patients. I am sure that you will be aware of, and welcome, the fact that six to 10 dental practices in the Neath Port Talbot area are considering PDS.

**Gwenda Thomas:** I understand that Neath Port Talbot Local Health Board has submitted PDS bids that would increase the number of local dental places significantly. Will you give a commitment that these proposals will be reviewed as a matter of urgency given the recent loss of NHS dentists in Neath Port Talbot?

**Brian Gibbons:** Absolutely. I realise that there is a real issue in terms of making sure that we get the new contractual arrangements in place. We, as an Assembly Government, are using the options available to us. We are looking at the regulations being proposed for the new dental contract, so that we provide dentists under the type of contractual arrangements that people wish to see. Hopefully, in trying to move the dental agenda forward, we will be able to use the devolution dividend to ensure that dentistry

**Janet Davies:** Ymddengys fod problem fawr yn ardal Castell-nedd Port Talbot lle mae nifer o ddeintyddion yn mynd yn breifat yn sydyn heb roi gwybod i gleifion am y newid. Yr ydych wedi cyfeirio at gyflwyno'r cynllun GDP. Pa sicrwydd y gallwch ei roi y bydd proses drosglwyddo gydgysylltiedig ar gyfer cleifion sy'n gorfod trosglwyddo o'u deintyddion presennol i ddeintyddion GDP? A fyddwn yn gweld miloedd o gleifion heb amser nac adnoddau deintyddol yn ystod yr ychydig fisoedd nesaf, sy'n bosibilrwydd hunllefus?

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae'r ffordd y mae practisau'n trosglwyddo o'u trefniadau contract presennol i GDP o reidrwydd yn golygu y byddant yn mynd â'u cleifion gyda hwy. O ganlyniad, mae yna barhad i gleifion sy'n symud o'r hen gontract deintyddol i'r contract GDP. Un o fanteision y contract GDP yw ei fod yn gyfle i ddeintyddion gymryd cleifion ychwanegol. Dengys tystiolaeth bresennol fod deintyddion mewn practisau sydd eisoes wedi symud i'r GDP yn cymryd rhwng 5 a 10 y cant o gleifion ychwanegol. Mae'n siŵr y byddwch yn ymwybodol, ac y byddwch yn croesawu'r ffaith, fod rhwng chwech a 10 practis yn ardal Castell-nedd Port Talbot yn ystyried GDP.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Deallaf fod Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Castell-nedd Port Talbot wedi cyflwyno ceisiadau GDP a fyddai'n cynyddu nifer y lleoedd deintyddol lleol yn sylweddol. A allwch roi ymrwymiad y caiff y cynigion hyn eu hadolygu ar frys, o gofio ein bod wedi colli deintyddion GIG yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot yn ddiweddar?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yn sicr. Yr wyf yn sylweddoli bod yna broblem wirioneddol i sicrhau ein bod yn rhoi'r trefniadau contract newydd ar waith. Yr ydym ni, fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn defnyddio'r dewisiadau sydd ar gael inni. Yr ydym yn edrych ar y rheoliadau a arfaethir ar gyfer y contract deintyddol newydd, fel y gallwn ddarparu deintyddion dan y math o drefniadau contract y mae pobl am eu gweld. Gobeithio, drwy geisio symud yr agenda ddeintyddol yn ei blaen, y gallwn

continues to be a mainstream provision under the NHS.

ddefnyddio'r difidend datganoli i sicrhau bod deintyddiaeth yn parhau'n wasanaeth prif ffrwd dan y GIG.

### Capasiti'r GIG The Capacity of the NHS

**Q6 Alun Cairns:** Will the Minister make a statement on the capacity of the NHS in Wales? OAQ0486(HSS)

**C6 Alun Cairns:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gapasiti'r GIG yng Nghymru? OAQ0486(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Our policy is to build capacity so that more patients can be treated more quickly through sustainable NHS services. 'Designed for Life' aims to improve health, social care and wellbeing for all, and improving services for those awaiting elective treatment is one of its initial priorities.

**Brian Gibbons:** Ein polisi yw cynyddu capasiti fel y gellir trin mwy o gleifion yn gyflymach drwy wasanaethau GIG cynaliadwy. Mae 'Cynllun Oes' yn anelu at wella iechyd, gofal cymdeithasol a lles i bawb, ac mae gwella gwasanaethau i'r rheini sy'n disgwyl triniaeth ddewisol yn un o'i flaenoriaethau cychwynnol.

**Alun Cairns:** I want to take you back to dental capacity in the NHS. The PDS scheme may well be an effective scheme, but it is only effective if you can get enough people to sign up to it. Given the number of people moving over to Denplan and other private schemes compared with the number signing up to the PDS scheme, are you not whistling down the wind in this regard?

**Alun Cairns:** Hoffwn fynd â chi yn ôl at gapasiti deintyddol yn y GIG. Mae'n ddigon posibl fod y cynllun GDP yn gynllun effeithiol, ond dim ond os gallwch gael digon o bobl i ymuno ag ef y mae'n effeithiol. O gofio nifer y bobl sy'n trosglwyddo i Denplan a chynlluniau preifat eraill, o'u cymharu â'r nifer sy'n ymuno â'r cynllun GDP, onid yw eich ymdrech yn ofer yn hyn o beth?

I have a specific question on domiciliary dental care, because elderly people in care are often left out. Denplan will not take them on, and dental practices that have switched to Denplan or other similar services, completely disassociate themselves with those who need domiciliary dental care. Unless there is an NHS dentist in the area, those patients are going without care. The reality is that there is no NHS dental care in large areas of Wales, so what action are you taking for those domiciliary dental patients?

Mae gennyf gwestiwn penodol am ofal deintyddol yn y cartref, oherwydd mae pobl hŷn mewn gofal yn cael eu hesgeuluso yn aml. Nid yw Denplan yn fodlon eu derbyn, ac mae practisau deintyddion sydd wedi newid i Denplan, neu wasanaethau tebyg eraill, yn cefnu'n llwyr ar y rhai y mae angen gofal deintyddol arnynt yn y cartref. Os nad oes deintydd GIG yn yr ardal, nid yw'r cleifion hynny'n cael gofal. Y gwir yw nad oes gofal deintyddol GIG mewn rhannau helaeth o Gymru. Felly, pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd ar ran y cleifion hynny sydd am gael gwasanaeth deintyddol yn y cartref?

2.20 p.m.

**Brian Gibbons:** Having spoken about insurance-based healthcare and private dentistry, I hope that Alun will take on board the fact that a market-based system in healthcare does not work. I hope that he will take the message back to his party that commercialisation of healthcare is not a way

**Brian Gibbons:** Ar ôl siarad am ofal iechyd yn seiliedig ar yswiriant ac am ddeintyddiaeth breifat, gobeithio y bydd Alun yn derbyn y ffaith nad yw system iechyd yn seiliedig ar y farchnad yn gweithio. Gobeithio y bydd yn mynd â'r neges yn ôl at ei blaid nad yw masnacheiddio gofal iechyd

of delivering services.

Turning specifically to the question, without making a point about double standards in terms of Conservative policy on this issue, a consultation process is currently looking at the way that community dental services need to be reconfigured to make them fit for purpose, to supplement mainstream general dental services. In addition, after 1 April, when the new contract comes in, local health boards will be in a position to specifically commission the type of services that local populations require. Local health boards have not been able to do this commissioning in the past and, hopefully, the new contract will address the specific services that you mention, and they will be delivered within a national health service and not through insurance or privatisation.

**Leighton Andrews:** I welcome the investment in capacity in the Rhondda, including that of the new Llwynypia Hospital and the new health centre plan for Ynys-hir. As a former general practitioner in the Valleys, you will recognise the high prevalence of ill health that we have there and the need for continuing investment throughout the NHS, in primary care services in particular. Can you give me your commitment that local health boards in areas with high levels of ill health and poverty will continue to receive appropriate support?

**Brian Gibbons:** Absolutely. I recently had the opportunity to meet the chair of Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Health Board, Dr Chris Jones. I was impressed with the range of initiatives that are going on there to address the specific issue of primary care. Equally, you will know that the Townsend formula is being revisited and that work is ongoing to review its workings, which allocate resources according to illness in a local population. Therefore, we are committed to securing a fair NHS and to tackling the inverse care law, which continues to exist in too much of Wales.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I droi eich sylw at gapasiti yn Ysbyty Glangwili yng ngorllewin Cymru, gwyddoch fod addewid wedi'i roi y bydd adran i bobl sydd yn gwella ar ôl

yn ffordd i ddarparu gwasanaethau.

I droi'n benodol at y cwestiwn, heb wneud pwynt ynghylch safonau deublyg polisi'r Ceidwadwyr ar y mater hwn, mae yna ymgynghori ar hyn o bryd ar y ffordd y mae angen ail-gyflunio'r gwasanaethau deintyddol cymunedol i'w gwneud yn addas at y diben, er mwyn ategu gwasanaethau deintyddol cyffredinol prif ffrwd. Ar ben hynny, ar ôl 1 Ebrill, pan gyflwynir y contract newydd, bydd byrddau iechyd lleol mewn sefyllfa i gomisiynu'r math o wasanaethau y mae ar boblogaethau lleol eu hangen. Nid yw byrddau iechyd lleol wedi gallu gwneud hyn yn y gorffennol, a gobeithio y bydd y contract newydd yn mynd i'r afael â'r gwasanaethau penodol y soniwyd amdanynt, ac y cânt eu darparu o fewn gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yn hytrach na thrwy yswiriant neu breifateiddio.

**Leighton Andrews:** Croesawaf y buddsoddiad mewn capasiti yn Rhondda, gan gynnwys yn ysbyty newydd Llwynypia a'r cynllun i gael canolfan iechyd newydd yn Ynys-hir. Fel cyn-feddyg teulu yn y Cymoedd, fe wyddoch fod llawer iawn o afiechyd gennym yno a bod angen parhau i fuddsoddi ym mhob rhan o'r GIG, mewn gwasanaethau gofal sylfaenol yn arbennig. A allwch roi ymrwymiad imi y bydd byrddau iechyd lleol mewn ardaloedd lle mae lefelau uchel o afiechyd a thlodi yn parhau i gael cefnogaeth briodol?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yn sicr. Cefais gyfle'n ddiweddar i gwrdd â chadeirydd Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Rhondda Cynon Taf, Dr Chris Jones. Fe'm synnwyd gan yr amrywiaeth o fentrau sy'n digwydd yno i fynd i'r afael â gofal sylfaenol yn benodol. Yn yr un modd, gwyddoch fod fformiwla Townsend yn cael ei hailstyried, a bod gwaith yn mynd rhagddo i adolygu'r ffordd y mae'n gweithio, sy'n dyrannu adnoddau yn ôl salwch yn y boblogaeth leol. Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo, felly, i sicrhau GIG teg ac i fynd i'r afael â chyfraith gofal wrthdro, sy'n parhau i fodoli mewn gormod o ardaloedd yng Nghymru.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** To turn your attention to capacity at Glangwili Hospital in west Wales, you will know that a department for people recovering from heart disease has

afiechyd y galon yn cael ei hadeiladu ar ben yr uned dialysis newydd. Pryd fydd yr uned honno yn agor?

**Brian Gibbons:** I cannot give you the specifics of that, but I would be willing to write to you on it if you are not able to get the information otherwise.

**Jonathan Morgan:** According to one of your Welsh health circulars, there is a 10-day wait for an initial assessment when a suspected cancer patient is referred urgently by a GP. I was contacted last week by a constituent in Cardiff who has a lump on her breast, identified by her GP. She has been told that she will have to wait the best part of six weeks until she will be seen by the breast clinic to establish whether or not she has cancer. Do you agree that that is an unacceptable state of affairs for any patient to find themselves in? I understand that many more patients in Cardiff are facing similarly long waits. Will you intervene on this matter to see how the situation can be expedited?

**Brian Gibbons:** We are aware that, following fairly significant improvement in Cardiff, there has been deterioration again in terms of access to breast cancer services. I am aware that the health community in Cardiff recognises that this is a growing problem and that it is working with the professional teams within Cardiff, for example, to provide an extra weekend or evening clinic to help address this particular backlog. I also understand that they are working with a number of neighbouring trusts, such as Pontypridd and Rhondda NHS Trust and North Glamorgan NHS Trust, to try to work in partnership to address the unacceptable long waiting times that you have just highlighted. Therefore, I think that there is an awareness that there has been a deterioration, and the health community is actively taking steps to bring the length of waits back within the norms that we would expect.

**Jenny Randerson:** I will return to the issue of dentists, Minister. I have written to every NHS dental practice in Wales, and their replies have been enthusiastic in their condemnation of the new dental contract. Nine out of 10 say that it is more likely,

been promised, to be built in addition to the new dialysis unit. When will that new unit open?

**Brian Gibbons:** Ni allaf roi manylion ichi am hynny, ond byddwn yn barod i ysgrifennu atoch ynghylch hynny os na allwch gael y wybodaeth fel arall.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yn ôl un o gylchlythyron iechyd Cymru, mae cyfnod aros o 10 diwrnod am asesiad cychwynnol ar ôl i glaf y credir ei fod yn dioddef gan ganser gael ei gyfeirio gan feddyg teulu ar frys. Yr wythnos diwethaf cysylltodd etholwraig yng Nghaerdydd â mi wedi i feddyg teulu weld bod lwmp yn ei bron. Dywedwyd wrthi y bydd yn rhaid iddi aros tua chwe wythnos cyn i glinig y fron ei gweld i benderfynu a oes canser arni neu beidio. A gytunwch fod hynny'n sefyllfa annerbyniol i unrhyw glaf? Deallaf fod nifer mwy o gleifion yng Nghaerdydd yn aros am gyfnodau tebyg. A fyddwch yn ymyrryd yn y mater hwn i weld sut y gellir cyflymu'r sefyllfa?

**Brian Gibbons:** Ar ôl gwelliant eithaf sylweddol yng Nghaerdydd, gwyddom fod dirywiad wedi bod eto o ran mynediad gallu cael gwasanaethau canser y fron. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol fod y gymuned iechyd yng Nghaerdydd yn cydnabod bod hon yn broblem gynyddol, a'u bod yn gweithio gyda'r timau proffesiynol yng Nghaerdydd, er enghraifft, i ddarparu clinig ychwanegol ar y penwythnos neu gyda'r nos i fynd i'r afael â'r ôl-groniad penodol hwn. Deallaf hefyd eu bod yn gweithio gyda nifer o ymddiriedolaethau cyfagos, megis Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Pontypridd a Rhondda ac Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gogledd Morgannwg, i geisio gweithio ar y cyd i fynd i'r afael â'r amseroedd aros annerbyniol o hir yr ydych newydd dynnu sylw atynt. Felly, credaf fod yna ymwybyddiaeth o ddirywiad, ac mae'r gymuned iechyd wrthi'n cymryd camau i sicrhau bod y cyfnodau aros yn dychwelyd i'r cyfnodau y byddem yn eu disgwyl.

**Jenny Randerson:** Dychwelaf at fater y deintyddion, Weinidog. Yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at bob practis deintyddol y GIG yng Nghymru, ac mae eu hatebion yn condemnio'r contract deintyddol newydd yn frwd. Dywed naw o bob 10 ei fod yn fwy

rather than less likely, to make them go private. The British Dental Association is training people in how to become private dentists. What are you going to do to ensure that the new dental contract suits Wales and its needs rather than slavishly following the process in England?

**Brian Gibbons:** I think that I have just given the answer to that. I am sure that you know that, in our discussions with the dental profession in Wales and in the communications that we have sent to dentists, we have already introduced a number of significant variations in the contract that was negotiated between the Department of Health and the BDA in London. I have met a number of dental profession representatives in Wales, and, while there are still outstanding issues that I think we definitely need to address, and I am not trying to pretend otherwise, there is no doubt that the dental profession feels that we have moved much further in trying to address its concerns in Wales than in England. The discussions on Friday between the Department of Health and the BDA indicated that there has been some shift in terms of addressing the outstanding issues. Hopefully, this evening, I will meet with BDA representatives to further carry on the discussions that we are having to ensure that the contract that is introduced is fit for purpose and will be attractive to dentists.

tebygol, yn hytrach na llai tebygol, o wneud iddynt droi'n bractis preifat. Mae Cymdeithas Ddeintyddol Prydain yn hyfforddi pobl sut i fynd yn ddeintyddion preifat. Beth y bwriadwch ei wneud i sicrhau bod y contract deintyddol newydd yn addas i Gymru a'i hanghenion, yn hytrach na dilyn y broses yn Lloegr yn slafaidd?

**Brian Gibbons:** Credaf fy mod newydd ateb hynny. Mae'n siŵr eich bod yn gwybod ein bod eisoes, yn ein trafodaethau gyda'r proffesiwn deintyddol yng Nghymru, ac yn yr ohebiaeth yr ydym wedi ei hanfon at ddeintyddion, wedi cyflwyno nifer o amrywiadau sylweddol yn y contract a negodwyd rhwng Cymdeithas Ddeintyddol Prydain a'r Adran Iechyd yn Llundain. Yr wyf wedi cyfarfod â nifer o gynrychiolwyr y proffesiwn deintyddol yng Nghymru, ac er bod yna faterion o hyd y mae angen inni fynd i'r afael â hwy, ac nid wyf yn ceisio esgus fel arall, nid oes amheuaeth nad yw'r proffesiwn deintyddol yn teimlo ein bod wedi gwneud llawer mwy i geisio mynd i'r afael â'i bryderon yng Nghymru nag a wnaed yn Lloegr. Dangosodd y trafodaethau rhwng Cymdeithas Ddeintyddol Prydain a'r Adran Iechyd ddydd Gwener fod rhywfaint o newid wedi bod wrth fynd i'r afael â'r materion sy'n weddill. Byddaf yn cwrdd â chynrychiolwyr Cymdeithas Ddeintyddol Prydain heno, gobeithio, i barhau'r drafodaeth rhyngom er mwyn sicrhau bod y contract a gyflwynir yn addas at y diben ac yn atyniadol i ddeintyddion.

### **Mabwysiadu'r Dechnoleg Newydd Adopting New Technology**

**Q7 Kirsty Williams:** Will the Minister make a statement on the adoption of new technology in the NHS? OAQ0499(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Informing Healthcare is the national programme to improve healthcare delivery through providing better access to information technology. It is one of the critical enabling activities underpinning 'Designed for Life', the future national strategy for healthcare for the next 10 years.

**C7 Kirsty Williams:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am fabwysiadu'r dechnoleg newydd yn y GIG? OAQ0499(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Hysbysu Gofal Iechyd yw'r rhaglen genedlaethol ar gyfer gwella gwasanaethau gofal iechyd drwy wneud technoleg gwybodaeth yn fwy hygyrch. Mae'n un o'r gweithgareddau galluogi allweddol sy'n sail i 'Cynllun Oes', y strategaeth ar gyfer gofal iechyd am y 10 mlynedd nesaf.

**Kirsty Williams:** There is evidence to suggest that, in Wales, we have sometimes been slower to adapt new drug technologies for patients. You will be aware that, in England, the Department of Health has issued guidelines to primary care trusts stating that those women, following testing, who would benefit from the prescription of Herceptin for early stage breast cancer should have that treatment made available to them. What is the Assembly Government's policy regarding the prescription of Herceptin for women with early stage breast cancer in Wales, and will you make resources available to LHBs and trusts to fund such drugs should women be able to benefit from them?

**Brian Gibbons:** As I understand it, the Department of Health stated that primary care trusts are free to support the prescription of Herceptin in England, and that is the situation that exists in Wales. There is no ban on the prescription of Herceptin. However, we need to be aware, if people are going to take Herceptin, that that drug has not been licenced for the treatment of early stage cancer; it is licenced for secondary cancer. A number of papers that have been published, particularly in the United States, show that there are clear survival advantages for breast cancer patients. However, if you read those papers, you will see that there is not a clear consensus on the best treatment regimes. There are also some other issues in terms of side-effect profiles, which I think need to be bottomed out before we can give a full go-ahead in terms of the National Institute of Clinical Excellence's evaluation.

2.30 p.m.

However, hopefully, the clinical trials, which show a significant benefit for people who are HER2 positive, will be shown to be correct and that the National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence, when it carries out its vetting of the drug, will be able to give a positive outcome. Again, hopefully, the drug company will be able to apply for a licence so that the drug can be prescribed in line with its licensed notification.

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae yna dystiolaeth sy'n awgrymu ein bod ni, yng Nghymru, weithiau wedi bod yn arafach wrth fabwysiadau technoleg cyffuriau newydd ar gyfer cleifion. Byddwch yn ymwybodol fod yr Adran Iechyd yn Lloegr wedi rhoi canllawiau i ymddiriedolaethau gofal sylfaenol yn dweud y dylai'r menywod hynny a fyddai, ar ôl cael prawf, yn elwa o gael presgripsiwn Herceptin am ganser y fron yn ei gyfnod cynnar, gael y driniaeth honno. Beth yw polisi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar roi presgripsiwn Herceptin i fenywod yng Nghymru sydd â chanser y fron yn ei gyfnod cynnar, ac a fyddwch yn darparu adnoddau i Fyrddau Iechyd Lleol ac ymddiriedolaethau i gyllido cyffuriau felly os bydd menywod yn elwa ohonynt?

**Brian Gibbons:** O'r hyn a ddeallaf, mae'r Adran Iechyd wedi dweud bod ymddiriedolaethau gofal sylfaenol yn rhydd i gefnogi rhoi presgripsiwn Herceptin yn Lloegr, a dyna'r sefyllfa yng Nghymru. Nid oes gwaharddiad ar bresgripsiwnau Herceptin. Fodd bynnag, os yw pobl yn mynd i gymryd Herceptin, mae angen inni fod yn ymwybodol nad yw'r cyffur hwnnw wedi ei drwyddedu ar gyfer canser yn ei gyfnod cynnar; mae wedi ei drwyddedu ar gyfer canser eilaidd. Mae nifer o bapurau sydd wedi eu cyhoeddi, yn enwedig yn yr Unol Daleithiau, yn dangos bod manteision goroesi pendant i gleifion canser y fron. Fodd bynnag, os darllenwch y papurau hynny, fe welwch nad oes cytundeb clir ynghylch y triniaethau gorau. Mae yna rai materion eraill o ran proffiliau sgil-effaith y mae'n rhaid aros iddynt gael eu datrys cyn y gallwn roi sêl bendith lawn o safbwynt gwerthusiad y Sefydliad Cenedlaethol dros Ragoriaeth Glinigol.

Fodd bynnag, gobeithio y profir bod y treialon clinigol, sy'n dangos budd sylwedddol i bobl sy'n HER2 positif, yn gywir ac y bydd y Sefydliad Cenedlaethol dros Iechyd a Rhagoriaeth Glinigol, pan fydd yn gwneud archwiliad o'r cyffur, yn gallu rhoi canlyniad cadarnhaol. Unwaith eto, y gobaith yw y bydd y cwmni cyffuriau'n gallu gwneud cais am drwydded fel y gellir rhagnodi'r cyffur yn unol â'i hysbysiad trwyddedig.

**William Graham:** You will know that rapid access to quality emergency care can also curb serious illnesses such as asthma, contagious infections and cardiovascular disease before they progress to more costly and morbid conditions. Therefore, it is necessary that you should devote as many resources as you can to modern technology. Furthermore, could rather simpler technology such as x-ray be more closely examined and further enhanced in hospitals throughout Wales?

**Brian Gibbons:** You will know that the quality framework in general practice has been an outstanding success in the new GP contract. The quality outcome framework is very much predicated around treating chronic disease, including heart disease, epilepsy, thyroid disease, blood pressure and so on. I think that the new contract for general practitioners is very much delivering on that. Therefore, the concern that you raise in your question is being addressed.

There is a big challenge to ensure that as many hospital trusts and so on try to transfer over to the picture archiving and communication radiological system because it is certainly an improvement on what we had before in terms of allowing x-rays to be examined so that they can be more effectively stored and in terms of allowing the data to be transmitted more widely throughout the NHS. 'Informing Healthcare' provides one method of ensuring that radiological services are updated in Wales.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol fod Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gogledd Orllewin Cymru wedi sefydlu system technoleg gwybodaeth sy'n cysylltu rhai ysbytai cymuned gyda'r prif ysbyty, sef Ysbyty Gwynedd. A wnewch chi ymuno â mi i longyfarch yr ymddiriedolaeth ar ei llwyddiant? Mae'n cael ei chydabod fel un o'r rhai gorau ym Mhrydain. Yn ogystal, a wnewch chi ymuno â mi i longyfarch a dymuno'n dda i Keith Thompson, y prif weithredwr, sy'n ymddeol yr wythnos hon ar ôl cyfnod llwyddiannus a llewyrchus yn arwain yr ymddiriedolaeth honno?

**Brian Gibbons:** I do not know whether

**William Graham:** Fel y gwyddoch, mae gallu cael gofal brys o ansawdd da yn gyflym hefyd yn gallu atal salwch difrifol fel asthma, afiechydon heintus a chlefyd cardiofasgwlaidd rhag datblygu'n gyflyrau mwy costus ac afiachus. Felly, mae angen ichi neilltuo cynifer o adnoddau ag y gallwch ar gyfer technoleg fodern. At hynny, a allai technoleg symlach, fel pelydr-x, gael ei harchwilio'n fwy trylwyr a'i gwella ymhellach mewn ysbytai ledled Cymru?

**Brian Gibbons:** Fel y gwyddoch, mae'r fframwaith ansawdd mewn practisau cyffredinol wedi bod yn llwyddiant ysgubol yn y contract newydd i feddygon teulu. Caiff y fframwaith ansawdd canlyniadau ei briodoli i raddau helaeth i drin clefydau cronig, gan gynnwys clefyd y galon, epilepsi, clefyd thyroid, pwysedd gwaed, ac ati. Credaf fod y contract newydd i feddygon teulu yn cyflawni hynny i raddau helaeth iawn. Felly, eir i'r afael â'r pryder a godwyd gennych yn eich cwestiwn.

Mae yna her fawr i sicrhau bod cynifer o ymddiriedolaethau ysbyty ac ati yn ceisio trosglwyddo i'r system archifo lluniau a chyfathrebu radiolegol, gan fod y system hon yn sicr yn welliant ar yr hyn a oedd gennym gynt i ganiatáu archwilio pelydrau-x er mwyn eu storio'n fwy effeithiol, ac i ganiatáu trosglwyddo'r data yn ehangach ledled y GIG. Mae 'Hysbysu Gofal Iechyd' yn un dull i sicrhau bod gwasanaethau radiolegol yn cael eu diweddarau yng Nghymru.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** You will be aware that the North West Wales NHS Trust has established an IT system that links some community hospitals with the main hospital, Ysbyty Gwynedd. Will you join me in congratulating the trust on its success? It is acknowledged as one of the best in Britain. Will you also join me in congratulating and extending our best wishes to Keith Thompson, the chief executive, who retires this week after a successful and prosperous period leading that trust?

**Brian Gibbons:** Ni wn a fyddai Keith yn



Keith would agree that he had a prosperous time, but you may know that better than me. Certainly, he has left an excellent legacy in north-west Wales. It is, without doubt, one of the best performing trusts in the UK. I would also like to extend my best wishes to Martin Jones, the new chief executive. I know, from a personal context, that Martin is interested in new technology and ICT in healthcare services. I am sure that his experience in that field will expand the range of telemedicine and the use of ICT to further improve healthcare in north-west Wales.

cytuno ei fod wedi cael cyfnod llewyrchus, ond efallai eich bod yn gwybod yn well na mi. Yn bendant, bydd ei waith yn etifeddiaeth wych yn y gogledd orllewin. Yn sicr, mae'n un o'r ymddiriedolaethau sy'n perfformio orau yn y DU. Hoffwn hefyd anfon fy nymuniadau gorau i Martin Jones, y prif weithredwr newydd. Gwn yn bersonol fod gan Martin ddiddordeb mewn technoleg newydd a TGCh yn y gwasanaethau gofal iechyd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd ei brofiad yn y maes hwnnw yn ehangu'r amrywiaeth o defnyddiaeth a defnyddio TGCh i wella gofal iechyd yn y gogledd orllewin ymhellach.

### Strategaeth Rhestrau Aros Waiting List Strategy

**C8 Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am strategaeth rhestrau aros Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru? OAQ0508(HSS)

**Q8 The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Will the Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's waiting list strategy? OAQ0508(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** By March 2006, no patient will be waiting longer than 12 months either for a first out-patient appointment or on an in-patient waiting list without having had the opportunity of a second offer. By December 2009, the maximum waiting time from GP referral to treatment will be six months.

**Brian Gibbons:** Erbyn mis Mawrth 2006, ni fydd unrhyw glaf yn aros mwy na 12 mis, am apwyntiad cyntaf fel claf allanol nac ar restr aros i gleifion mewnol heb gael ail gynnig. Erbyn mis Rhagfyr 2009, ni fydd yr amser aros rhwng cyfeirio gan feddyg teulu a chael triniaeth yn fwy na chwe mis.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** A allwch chi ddweud wrthyf pa bryd yr ydych yn disgwyl amseroedd aros crynswth i ostwng i'r lefel yr oeddynt arni ym Mai 1999?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Can you tell me when you expect gross waiting times to decrease to the May 1999 level?

**Brian Gibbons:** As I have already said, the in-patient waiting list is down to the 1994 level. That has already been achieved with some fairly spectacular success. Similarly, the number of patients waiting over 12 months for out-patient treatment has decreased to its lowest level since 2000, or, in other words, for the last half decade. On the basis of the projections that we see, we certainly will have improved on the 1999 target in terms of waiting times by the end of this year.

**Brian Gibbons:** Fel y dywedais eisoes, mae'r rhestr aros i gleifion mewnol wedi gostwng i lefel 1994. Mae hynny eisoes wedi'i wneud gyda chryn lwyddiant. Yn yr un modd, mae nifer y cleifion sy'n aros mwy na 12 mis am driniaeth fel cleifion allanol wedi gostwng i'w lefel isaf er 2000, neu mewn geiriau eraill, yn yr hanner degawd diwethaf. Ar sail y rhagamcaniadau a welwn, byddwn yn bendant wedi rhagori ar darged 1999 o ran amseroedd aros erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr wyf yn deall eich bod yn ei chael hi'n anodd i gymharu eich ffigurau gyda rhai 1999 am fod y gymhariaeth yn dangos pa mor warthus yw

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I realise that you find it difficult to compare your figures with those of 1999 because the comparison reflects your Government's dreadful record on waiting

record eich Llywodraeth ar restrau aros. Yr ydych yn gwybod yn iawn, rhwng mis Mai 1999 a mis Medi eleni, fod 80,00 yn fwy o bobl Cymru wedi bod yn aros naill ai am apwyntiad fel claf allanol neu am driniaeth mewn ysbyty. Mae hynny yn dangos bod rhestrau aros wedi codi 14,000 bob blwyddyn ers i'r Llywodraeth hon ddod i rym. Gwyddoch hefyd fod cyfanswm crynswth o 75,000 o bobl wedi bod yn aros yn hwy na chwe mis naill ai i weld arbenigwr neu i gael triniaeth. A dderbyniwch, Weinidog, fod y record honno yn warthus ac yn gymhariaeth wael iawn â'r hyn sydd yn digwydd yn Lloegr?

**Brian Gibbons:** I do not agree at all. If you look at the statistics, you are right to say that the number of people on out-patient waiting lists, for example, is higher than it was previously. These are people who are making use of the improved quality of treatment available on the NHS in Wales. In one sense, we should welcome the fact that so many people are able to benefit from the high-quality care that is available. However, despite the fact that there are higher numbers of people on out-patient waiting lists in Wales, the proportion of people who wait less than six months has gone up from 66 per cent to 75 per cent. More people are on the waiting lists, but more people have shorter waiting times. I think that that is a good news story, but perhaps Ieuan does not agree.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** What I am doing, Minister, is giving you a reasonable comparison with what has happened in England over the same period—between 1999 and 2005. The reality is, Minister, that if your figures were replicated in England, the 75,000 people now waiting either for in-patient or out-patient treatment in Wales would be equivalent in population terms to 1.5 million people in England. You know perfectly well that hardly anyone is waiting that length of time in England either for in-patient treatment or for an out-patient appointment. That is the scale of the problem, Minister. Alongside this, you have to consider not only the massive increase in waiting list figures since 1999, but that your budget will have doubled between 1999 and 2007-08 from £2.7 billion to £5.5 billion. The people of Wales have a right to ask where

lists. You know very well, between May 1999 and September this year, that an additional 80,000 people in Wales were waiting either for an out-patient appointment or for in-patient treatment. That shows that waiting lists have increased by 14,000 every year since this Government came to power. You are also aware that an overall total of 75,000 people have been waiting more than six months to see a specialist or to receive treatment. Do you accept, Minister, that that is an appalling record and that it compares very badly with what is happening in England?

**Brian Gibbons:** Nid wyf yn cytuno o gwbl. O edrych ar yr ystadegau, yr ydych yn gywir i ddweud bod nifer y bobl ar restrau aros i gleifion allanol, er enghraifft, yn uwch nag yr oedd gynt. Pobl yw'r rhain sy'n manteisio ar y driniaeth well sydd ar gael yn y GIG yng Nghymru. Ar un olwg, dylem groesawu'r ffaith fod cynifer o bobl yn gallu elwa ar y gofal o safon uchel sydd ar gael. Fodd bynnag, er bod nifer y bobl ar restrau aros i gleifion allanol yng Nghymru yn uwch, mae cyfran y bobl sy'n aros llai na chwe mis wedi codi o 66 y cant i 75 y cant. Mae mwy o bobl ar y rhestrau aros, ond mae gan fwy o bobl amseroedd aros byrrach. Credaf fod hynny'n newyddion da, ond efallai nad yw Ieuan yn cytuno.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr hyn yr wyf yn ei wneud, Weinidog, yw rhoi cymhariaeth resymol i chi â'r hyn sydd wedi digwydd yn Lloegr yn ystod yr un cyfnod—rhwng 1999 a 2005. Y gwir yw, Weinidog, pe bai eich ffigurau'n cael eu hatgynhyrchu yn Lloegr, byddai'r 75,000 o bobl sydd yn awr yn aros naill ai am driniaeth fel cleifion mewnol neu gleifion allanol yng Nghymru yn cyfateb i 1.5 miliwn o bobl yn Lloegr. Gwyddoch yn iawn nad oes braidd neb yn aros cyhyd am driniaeth fel cleifion mewnol neu am apwyntiad fel cleifion allanol yn Lloegr. Dyna faint y broblem, Weinidog. Ochr yn ochr â hyn, mae'n rhaid ichi ystyried nid yn unig y cynnydd anferth mewn ffigurau rhestrau aros er 1999, ond y ffaith y bydd eich cyllideb wedi dyblu rhwng 1999 a 2007-08 o £2.7 biliwn i £5.5 biliwn. Mae gan bobl Cymru yr hawl i ofyn i ble yr aeth yr arian

that money has gone. What has happened to those waiting lists? You have given us some waiting list targets, but not a single waiting list target introduced by this Government since 1999 has been kept, so why should we believe you this time?

**Brian Gibbons:** In answer to the question about where the money has gone, the NHS is a service that treats people, and there has been a dramatic increase in the number of people working in the NHS. Also, the cost of new contracts such as Agenda for Change, along with consultant contracts, GP contracts, the number of people in training and an increase in capital investment—which means that more people can get better-quality treatment—explains where the money has gone. During a Radio Wales interview, Nicola Heywood Thomas asked the chairman of the Patients Association, Michael Summers, how we are doing in terms of the comparison between Wales and England. Michael Summers responded by saying that we are doing very well in comparison. The Patients Association does not take the view taken by Ieuan Wyn Jones. It goes to show how out of touch he is in terms of what is happening.

**The Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Minister. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘And Nicola Heywood Thomas.’] Order. She is not accountable to the Assembly.

hwnnw. Beth sydd wedi digwydd i'r rhestrau aros hynny? Yr ydych wedi rhoi rhai targedau inni ar gyfer rhestrau aros, ond nid oes un targed rhestrau aros a gyflwynwyd gan y Llywodraeth hon er 1999 wedi ei gyflawni, felly, pam y dylem eich credu y tro hwn?

**Brian Gibbons:** I ateb y cwestiwn ble'r aeth yr arian, mae'r GIG yn wasanaeth sy'n trin pobl, a gwelwyd cynnydd dramatig yn nifer y bobl sy'n gweithio yn y GIG. Hefyd, mae cost contractau newydd fel yr Agenda ar gyfer Newid, ynghyd â chontractau meddygon ymgynghorol, contractau meddygon teulu, nifer y bobl sy'n cael hyfforddiant a chynnydd mewn buddsoddi cyfalaf—sy'n golygu y gall mwy o bobl gael triniaeth o well safon—yn esbonio i ble yr aeth yr arian. Mewn cyfweiliad ar Radio Wales, gofynnodd Nicola Heywood Thomas i gadeirydd Cymdeithas y Cleifion, Michael Summers, sut y mae pethau o gymharu Cymru a Lloegr. Atebodd Michael Summers drwy ddweud ein bod yn gwneud yn dda iawn mewn cymhariaeth. Nid yw Cymdeithas y Cleifion o'r un farn â Ieuan Wyn Jones. Mae hynny'n dangos ei fod wedi colli gafael ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch, Weinidog. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: ‘A Nicola Heywood Thomas.’] Trefn. Nid yw hi'n atebol i'r Cynulliad.

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon Questions to the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport**

### **Gemau Olympaidd Llundain The London Olympics**

**Q1 Alun Cairns:** Has the Minister made any assessment of how Wales can play a part in the London Olympics? OAQ0454 (CWS)

**The Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport (Alun Pugh):** Yes, I have.

2.40 p.m.

**Alun Cairns:** For those Members who did not hear the response, the Minister said that

**C1 Alun Cairns:** A yw'r Gweinidog wedi asesu sut gall Cymru gymryd rhan yng Ngemau Olympaidd Llundain? OAQ0454 (CWS)

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon (Alun Pugh):** Ydw.

**Alun Cairns:** I'r Aelodau hynny na chlywsant yr ymateb, dywedodd y

he has, although he is obviously not prepared to share the assessment. In that assessment, what conclusions have you come to in establishing which aspect of the games we can host? Secondly, what improvements need to be made to facilities so that we can either host aspects of the Olympics or, at least, host teams during the months leading up to the games? Thirdly, what assessment have you made of facilities in Wales to develop Welsh talent and sporting skills so that we can compete on a level playing field?

**Alun Pugh:** The UK Sports Cabinet met at 7.30 a.m. today with Ministers from all parts of the United Kingdom. A major issue on the agenda for that meeting was the Olympic Games, and we were joined by Sebastian Coe, now Lord Coe. We discussed Cardiff, which will be a major venue for the Olympic football tournament, and we also discussed training camps. We have some excellent training camp facilities around Wales, including the velodrome in Newport, white-water centres in north Wales and the national swimming pool in Swansea. There is also the cultural side of the games. Many people forget that a large cultural festival runs at the same time as the Olympic Games. It is our view, as the Assembly Government, that the Wales Millennium Centre would be an appropriate venue for parts of those celebrations.

**Val Lloyd:** You referred to Swansea, and I agree that it has several outstanding and world-class sports facilities that could be utilised during the London Olympics. You mentioned the national swimming pool, but we also have the £5.5 million sports village, which, as you well know, has world-class facilities. What assessment has been done of Swansea's potential role, and can you assure me that you will represent Swansea's potential in any discussions that you may have on the matter with your UK colleagues?

**Alun Pugh:** It is fair to draw attention to some of the excellent facilities that have been developed in Swansea in recent years. In terms of Assembly Government involvement,

Gweinidog ei fod wedi gwneud hynny, er nad yw, yn amlwg, yn barod i rannu'r asesiad. Yn yr asesiad hwnnw, pa gasgliadau y daethoch iddynt wrth sefydlu pa agweddau ar y gemau y gallwn eu croesawu? Yn ail, pa welliannau y mae angen eu gwneud mewn cyfleusterau er mwyn inni allu naill ai groesawu agweddau ar y Gemau Olympaidd, neu o leiaf groesawu timau yn ystod y misoedd cyn y gemau? Yn drydydd, pa asesiad a wnaed gennych o gyfleusterau yng Nghymru i ddatblygu cawn a sgiliau chwaraeon yng Nghymru fel y gallwn gystadlu ar yr un lefel?

**Alun Pugh:** Cyfarfu Cabinet Chwaraeon y DU â Gweinidogion o bob rhan o'r Deyrnas Unedig am 7.30 a.m. heddiw. Un o'r prif faterion ar yr agenda ar gyfer y cyfarfod hwnnw oedd y Gemau Olympaidd, ac ymunodd Sebastian Coe, yr Arglwydd Coe erbyn hyn, â ni. Buom yn trafod Caerdydd, a fydd yn un o'r prif leoliadau ar gyfer cystadleuaeth bêl-droed y Gemau Olympaidd, a buom yn trafod gwersylloedd hyfforddi hefyd. Mae gennym gyfleusterau gwersylloedd hyfforddi ardderchog yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys y felodrom yng Nghasnewydd, canolfannau dŵr gwyn yn y gogledd a'r pwll nofio cenedlaethol yn Abertawe. Mae yna ochr ddiwylliannol y gemau hefyd. Mae nifer o bobl yn anghofio y bydd gŵyl ddiwylliannol fawr yr un pryd â'r Gemau Olympaidd. Ein barn ni, fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yw y byddai Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru yn lleoliad priodol ar gyfer rhai o'r dathliadau hynny.

**Val Lloyd:** Yr oeddech yn cyfeirio at Abertawe, a chytunaf fod yno amryw o gyfleusterau chwaraeon ardderchog o'r radd flaenaf y gellid eu defnyddio yn ystod Gemau Olympaidd Llundain. Soniech am y pwll nofio cenedlaethol, ond mae gennym hefyd y pentref chwaraeon gwerth £5.5 miliwn, fel y gwyddoch yn dda, lle mae cyfleusterau o'r radd flaenaf. Pa asesiad sydd wedi'i wneud o rôl posibl Abertawe, ac a allwch fy sicrhau y byddwch yn cynrychioli potensial Abertawe mewn unrhyw drafodaethau a gewch ar y mater gyda'ch cyd-weinidogion yn y DU?

**Alun Pugh:** Mae'n deg tynnu sylw at rai o'r cyfleusterau ardderchog sydd wedi'u datblygu yn Abertawe yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf. O ran cyfranogiad

Wales will be represented by Gareth Hall, who is currently the chief executive of the Welsh Development Agency and who will shortly take up his post as director of economic development. He will be our senior representative on the Nations and Regions Group, but there are a number of other working groups. The Sports Council for Wales is heavily involved, and it will be drawing attention to some of the excellent facilities in Swansea and in other parts of Wales.

**Owen John Thomas:** Mewn datganiad ddoe, cyfeiriasoch at gemau 1908 a'r tîm rygbi o Gernyw a gynrychiolodd Prydain. Yr oeddech efallai yn awgrymu y gallai tîm pêldroed o Gymru gynrychioli Prydain. A ydych yn ceisio camu tuag at gael tîm Olympaidd i Gymru? Byddai hynny'n annog pobl i anelu at ragoriaeth mewn sawl maes. I ba gyfeiriad ewch chi yn hyn o beth?

**Alun Pugh:** For Wales to have a separate team in the Olympic Games, Wales would have to be a separate nation state. As you know, only a tiny number of people in Wales want that, along with each member of Plaid Cymru, of course.

**The Presiding Officer:** No. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.']

**Alun Pugh:** I would be happy to continue this debate. [*Laughter.*]

**John Griffiths:** A ydych yn cytuno bod gan Gasnewydd lawer i'w gynnig i'r timau hynny a fydd yn dod i Brydain ar gyfer y Gemau Olympaidd, gyda'r felodrom, er enghraifft? A wnewch chi bopeth o fewn eich gallu i sicrhau y bydd Casnewydd yn elwa o'r Gemau Olympaidd?

**Alun Pugh:** You are right to draw attention to the world-class facility in Newport, namely the velodrome. There are few world-class velodromes in the UK. I am sure that there will be a great deal of demand for that track as a training camp in the weeks and months leading up to the 2012 games, and in the years to come.

Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, caiff Cymru ei chynrychioli gan Gareth Hall, prif weithredwr Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru ar hyn o bryd, a fydd yn fuan yn ymgymryd â'i swydd fel cyfarwyddwr yr adran datblygu economaidd. Ef fydd ein huwch gynrychiolydd ar y Grŵp Gwledydd a Rhanbarthau, ond mae yna nifer o weithgorau eraill. Mae gan Gyngor Chwaraeon Cymru ran flaenllaw, a bydd yn tynnu sylw at rai o'r cyfleusterau ardderchog sydd ar gael yn Abertawe ac mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru.

**Owen John Thomas:** In a statement yesterday, you referred to the 1908 games, in which a rugby team from Cornwall represented Britain. You were perhaps suggesting that a Welsh football team could represent Britain. Are you trying to move towards having a Welsh Olympic team? It would encourage people to try to attain excellence in a number of sports. To what extent will you develop that idea?

**Alun Pugh:** Er mwyn i Gymru gael tîm ar wahân yn y Gemau Olympaidd, byddai'n rhaid i Gymru fod yn genedl-wladwriaeth ar wahân. Fel y gwyddoch, dim ond nifer fach o bobl yng Nghymru sy'n dymuno i hynny ddigwydd, ynghyd â phob aelod o Blaid Cymru, wrth gwrs.

**Y Llywydd:** Na. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.']

**Alun Pugh:** Byddwn yn hapus i barhau â'r ddadl hon. [*Chwerthin.*]

**John Griffiths:** Do you agree that Newport has a great deal to offer those teams who will be coming to Britain for the Olympic Games, with the velodrome, for example? Will you do all that you can to ensure that Newport benefits from the Olympic Games?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr ydych yn gywir i dynnu sylw at y cyfleuster arbennig yng Nghasnewydd o'r radd flaenaf, sef y felodrôm. Ychydig iawn o felodromau o'r radd flaenaf sydd yn y DU. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd galw mawr am yr trac hwnnw fel gwrsyll hyfforddi yn yr wythnosau a'r misoedd cyn gemau 2012, ac yn y blynyddoedd i ddod.

**Grantiau Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru ym Merthyr Tudful**  
**Arts Council of Wales Grants in Merthyr Tydfil**

**Q2 Huw Lewis:** Will the Minister please give an update on Arts Council of Wales grants in Merthyr? OAQ0434 (CWS)

**C2 Huw Lewis:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am grantiau Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru ym Merthyr? OAQ0434 (CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** It is fair to say that the history of arts investment in Merthyr Tydfil has not been great over the years, but the position is now improving. Two applications have recently been approved, and a further six are currently under consideration by the Arts Council of Wales.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae'n deg dweud na fu llawer o fuddsoddi yn y celfyddydau ym Merthyr Tudful dros y blyneddau, ond mae'r sefyllfa'n awr yn gwella. Cymeradwywyd dau gais yn ddiweddar, ac mae chwe chais pellach yn cael eu hystyried gan Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru ar hyn o bryd.

**Huw Lewis:** My figures show that, since 2003, the Arts Council of Wales has dispersed £47.8 million throughout Wales, of which the Merthyr borough has received £2,500. That is 0.0005 per cent of the total. That is next to nothing; it makes no difference. Caerphilly has received £154,000, which is 0.003 per cent of the total. It is clear that the arts council has failed my constituency. If you look at the figures, pretty much the whole of the Valleys has been comprehensively ignored by the arts council. I know that you agree that this pattern of spending cannot be allowed to continue. What will be done to ensure that the pattern of spending for the next two years will be radically different from that of the last two?

**Huw Lewis:** Mae'r ffigurau sydd gennyf yn dangos bod Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru wedi dosbarthu £47.8 miliwn ledled Cymru er 2003, ac mae bwrdeistref Merthyr wedi cael £2,500 o hwnnw. Mae hynny'n 0.0005 y cant o'r cyfanswm. Mae hynny'r nesaf peth i ddim; nid yw'n gwneud dim gwahaniaeth. Mae Caerffili wedi cael £154,000, sy'n 0.003 y cant o'r cyfanswm. Mae'n amlwg bod cyngor y celfyddydau wedi siomi fy etholaeth. Os edrychwch ar y ffigurau, anwybyddwyd y rhan fwyaf o'r Cymoedd yn llwyr gan gyngor y celfyddydau. Gwn y cytunwch na ellir caniatáu i'r patrwm gwario hwn barhau. Beth a wneir i sicrhau y bydd y patrwm gwario am y ddwy flynedd nesaf yn sylweddol wahanol i batrwm y ddwy flynedd diwethaf?

**Alun Pugh:** I draw the attention of Assembly Members to a speech that I made to the annual conference of the arts council. It dealt in very strong terms with social exclusion. To give you some figures about a few of those grants, Tydfil Training Consortium Ltd received a £15,000 grant for the Yo-Maz youth music award, and Merthyr Tydfil County Borough Council received £10,000 for the development of opportunities for young musicians. We need to do more; I agree with you on that. For example, I know that in 1999 a grant of around £16,000 was awarded to the Tydfil Training Consortium to allow a feasibility study to look at transforming the current Castle Bingo premises into a theatre and art centre, including community art facilities. This was a very important study; it came up with a positive recommendation, but it was not

**Alun Pugh:** Tynnaf sylw Aelodau'r Cynulliad at araith a draddodais yng nghynhadledd flynyddol cyngor y celfyddydau. Yr oedd pwyslais cryf iawn ynddi ar ymdrin ag allgáu cymdeithasol. I roi ychydig ffigurau ichi am rai o'r grantiau hynny, cafodd Tydfil Training Consortium Ltd grant o £15,000 ar gyfer gwobr cerddoriaeth ieuencid Yo-Maz, a chafodd Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Merthyr Tudful £10,000 i ddatblygu cyfleoedd i gerddorion ifanc. Mae angen inni wneud mwy; cytunaf â chi ar hynny. Er enghraifft, gwn fod grant o ryw £16,000 wedi ei ddyfarnu i Tydfil Training Consortium yn 1999 i ganiatáu astudiaeth dichonolrwydd i ystyried trawsnewid adeilad presennol Castle Bingo yn theatr a chanolfan gelfyddydau, yn cynnwys cyfleusterau celfyddydau cymunedol. Yr oedd hon yn astudiaeth

possible to take it forward at that time because the revenue requirements could not be met by the local authority. I would be happy to meet you to discuss this in more detail.

**Laura Anne Jones:** As I am sure you are aware, Minister, visitors to a Cardiff arts centre recently were faced with a Japanese artist—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. How can a Cardiff arts centre relate to Merthyr Tydfil?

**Laura Anne Jones:** The question is about arts council grants.

**The Presiding Officer:** It is about arts council grants in Merthyr.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Recently, I have been concerned to learn that there were large discrepancies in the allocations of National Lottery grants to various Welsh constituencies—Blaenau Gwent, and Monmouth in my constituency of South Wales East, for example.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This question is about Merthyr.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Merthyr, I am afraid, has fared little better. Minister, do you agree that it is wrong that Monmouthshire has been granted £11,409,860 since the lottery began in 1995, while counties such as Carmarthenshire have received £48,000,000?

**Alun Pugh:** Ten out of 10 for inventiveness, but, as you know, many of these decisions are made, under the arm's-length principle, by the arts council. I know that the Conservative Party supports that principle.

bwysig iawn; yr oedd yn cyflwyno argymhelliad cadarnhaol, ond nid oedd yn bosibl ei roi ar waith ar y pryd am na allai'r awdurdod lleol fodloni'r gofynion refeniw. Byddwn yn fodlon cyfarfod â chi i drafod hyn yn fanylach.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y gwyddoch, Weinidog, fod ymwelwyr â chanolfan gelfyddydau yng Nghaerdydd weld artist Siapaniaidd yn ddiweddar —

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Beth yw'r cyswllt rhwng canolfan gelfyddydau yng Nghaerdydd a Merthyr Tudful?

**Laura Anne Jones:** Mae'r cwestiwn yn ymwneud â grantiau cyngor y celfyddydau.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae'n ymwneud â grantiau cyngor y celfyddydau ym Merthyr.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Yr wyf wedi bod pryderu'n ddiweddar am anghysonderau sylweddol yn nyraniadau grant y Loteri Cenedlaethol i amrywiol etholaethau yng Nghymru—Blaenau Gwent, a Threfynwy yn fy etholaeth i yn Nwyrain De Cymru, er enghraifft.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r cwestiwn hwn yn ymwneud â Merthyr.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Yn anffodus, ni wnaeth Merthyr fawr gwell. Weinidog, a gytunwch ei bod yn annheg fod sir Fynwy wedi cael £11,409,860 ers i'r loteri ddechrau yn 1995, ond bod siroedd eraill fel Sir Gaerfyrddin wedi cael £48,000,000?

**Alun Pugh:** Deg allan o 10 am ddyfeisgarwch, ond fel y gwyddoch, gwneir nifer o'r penderfyniadau hyn, gan ddilyn yr egwyddor hyd braich, gan gyngor y celfyddydau. Gwn fod y Blaid Geidwadol yn cefnogi'r egwyddor honno.

### Chwaraeon yn Sir y Fflint Sports in Flintshire

**Q3 Sandy Mewies:** Will the Minister make a statement on how the Welsh Assembly Government is promoting young people's participation in sports in Flintshire? OAQ0428 (CWS)

**C3 Sandy Mewies:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y ffordd mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn hybu pobl ifanc i gymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon yn sir y Fflint? OAQ0428 (CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** The Assembly Government's free swimming initiative, plus successful programmes such as Dragon Sport, Disability Sport, Sportsmatch, and the PE and school sport initiative, delivered by our sports council, are having positive effects on the number and quality of sport and physical activity opportunities for young people in Flintshire.

**Sandy Mewies:** You mentioned Dragon Sport, which is doing very well in Flintshire. People will know that sport such as tennis, football and hockey are offered in adapted format for young people. Currently we have 170 extra-curricular clubs operating in Flintshire, and more than 12,000 children took part in more than one club last year. Would you agree that such initiatives are a great success and that we must do everything that we can to increase participation? Can you therefore tell me what the Welsh Assembly Government will be doing to ensure that the numbers taking part in sport increase so that we can ensure a healthy future generation?

**Alun Pugh:** It is entirely fair to draw attention to the success of Dragon Sport, which involves some 1,200 schools across Wales. It is our intention to move Dragon Sport from its current base in the primary school system into secondary schools. I am sure that that will create far more opportunities for young people to take part in sport.

**Mark Isherwood:** As a former sponsor of the Flintshire sports personality awards, I celebrate the fact that Flintshire punches above its weight in sporting terms. As well as providing health gains for young people, sport can play a major part in community regeneration. What action, therefore, are you taking to support community regeneration schemes that are focused on providing young people with activities that benefit them and their communities, such as those championed by Flintshire neighbourhood watch, Stars north Wales in Rhyl, and north Wales rural sports in its campaign for a new boxing club

**Alun Pugh:** Mae'r fenter nofio am ddim gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn ogystal â rhaglenni llwyddiannus fel Campau'r Ddraig, Chwaraeon Anabledd, Sportsmatch, a'r fenter addysg gorfforol a chwaraeon ysgol, a ddarperir gan ein cyngor chwaraeon, yn cael effeithiau cadarnhaol ar nifer ac ansawdd y cyfleoedd chwaraeon a gweithgarwch corfforol sydd ar gael i bobl ifanc yn sir y Fflint.

**Sandy Mewies:** Yr oeddech yn sôn am Gampau'r Ddraig, sy'n gwneud yn dda iawn yn sir y Fflint. Bydd pobl yn gwybod bod chwaraeon fel tenis, pêl-droed a hoci yn cael eu cynnig mewn ffurf wedi ei haddasu ar gyfer pobl ifanc. Ar hyn o bryd, mae 170 o glybiau allgyrsiol ar waith yn sir y Fflint, a chymerodd dros 12,000 o blant ran mewn mwy nag un clwb y llynedd. A fydddech yn cytuno bod mentrau o'r fath yn llwyddiant mawr a bod yn rhaid inni wneud popeth yn gallu i gynyddu'r niferoedd sy'n cymryd rhan? Felly, a allwch ddweud wrthyf beth fydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod y niferoedd sy'n cymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon yn cynyddu fel y gallwn sicrhau cenhedlaeth iach ar gyfer y dyfodol?

**Alun Pugh:** Mae'n hollol deg tynnu sylw at lwyddiant Campau'r Ddraig, sy'n cynnwys tua 1,200 o ysgolion ledled Cymru. Ein bwriad yw symud Campau'r Ddraig o'u lleoliad presennol yn y system ysgolion cynradd i ysgolion uwchradd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd hynny'n cynnig llawer mwy o gyfleoedd i bobl ifanc gymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon.

**Mark Isherwood:** Fel cyn-noddwr gwobrau personoliaeth chwaraeon Sir y Fflint, yr wyf yn dathlu'r ffaith fod sir y Fflint yn cael llwyddiant ysgubol ym myd chwaraeon. Yn ogystal â chynnig manteision iechyd i bobl ifanc, gall chwaraeon chwarae rhan bwysig wrth adfywio cymunedau. Felly, pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd i gefnogi cynlluniau adfywio cymunedau sy'n canolbwyntio ar ddarparu gweithgareddau i bobl ifanc a fydd yn fuddiol iddynt hwy a'u cymunedau, fel y rheini sy'n cael eu hyrwyddo gan gynllun gwarchod y gymdogaeth yn sir y Fflint, Stars gogledd Cymru yn y Rhyl, a chwaraeon



in Llangernyw?

gwledig y gogledd sy'n ymgyrchu dros glwb bocsiu newydd yn Llangernyw?

2.50 p.m.

**Alun Pugh:** I am glad to see that you have had some association with a personality award. On community regeneration schemes, you will know that the Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee, which is ably led by Rosemary Butler, has held a major review of the role of sport and culture in community regeneration. Subject to the ongoing budget discussions, I would want to make a sum available to take that work forward.

**Alun Pugh:** Yr wyf yn falch o weld ichi fod yn gysylltiedig â gwobr bersonoliaeth. O ran cynlluniau adfywio cymunedol, gwyddoch fod y Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon dan arweiniad Rosemary Butler wedi gwneud adolygiad pwysig o rôl chwaraeon a diwylliant mewn adfywio cymunedol. Yn amodol ar y trafodaethau parhaus am y gyllideb, hoffwn sicrhau bod swm ar gael i hyrwyddo'r gwaith hwnnw.

**Janet Ryder:** Many of those young people in the Flintshire area, and across north Wales, are rugby league fans, and they would like to be able to participate in rugby league in their communities. In July, rugby league made an application to you to have some form of recognition from the Welsh Assembly Government to help it to develop in Wales; it is doing phenomenally in south Wales and wants to make a breakthrough in north Wales. In England, its input into deprived communities, particularly, is strong, and is recognised in Downing Street. Is your Government prepared to accept and acknowledge the work that rugby league does in communities?

**Janet Ryder:** Mae nifer o'r bobl ifanc hynny yn ardal sir y Fflint, a ledled y gogledd, yn cefnogi rygbi'r gynghair, a dymunant gymryd rhan yn rygbi'r gynghair yn eu cymunedau. Ym mis Gorffennaf, gwnaeth rygbi'r gynghair gais ichi am ryw fath o gydnabyddiaeth gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i'w helpu i ddatblygu yng Nghymru; mae'n llwyddo'n rhyfeddol yn y de ac mae am lwyddo yn y gogledd. Yn Lloegr, mae ei gyfraniad i gymunedau difreintiedig, yn arbennig, yn gryf ac fe'i cydnabyddir yn Downing Street. A yw eich Llywodraeth yn barod i dderbyn a chydabod y gwaith a wneir gan rygbi'r gynghair mewn cymunedau?

**Alun Pugh:** Yes, we are. Rugby league is a great sport.

**Alun Pugh:** Ydym. Mae rygbi'r gynghair yn gamp wych.

### **Y Defnydd o'r Gymraeg mewn Sefydliadau Chwaraeon The Use of the Welsh Language in Sporting Organisations**

**C4 Alun Ffred Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am bwysigrwydd y defnydd o'r Gymraeg yn ein sefydliadau chwaraeon? OAQ0467 (CWS)

**Q4 Alun Ffred Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on the importance of the use of the Welsh language in our sporting organisations? OAQ0467 (CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Fel Llywodraeth, yr ydym eisiau creu mwy o gyfleoedd yn y Gymraeg, yn ogystal ag yn Saesneg, i gymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon a hamdden corfforol. Ar hyn o bryd, dim ond 30 y cant o boblogaeth Cymru sy'n cadw'n heini.

**Alun Pugh:** As a Government, we want to create more opportunities in Welsh, as well as in English, to participate in sports and physical leisure activities. At present, only 30 per cent of the population of Wales is keeping fit.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Gan gyfeirio at achos penodol, a ydych yn ymwybodol bod

**Alun Ffred Jones:** To refer to a specific case, are you aware that the Football

Cymdeithas Bêl-droed Cymru wedi datgan yn ddiweddar nad yw'n bwriadu cydnabod y Gymraeg nac ateb llythyron yn Gymraeg? Digwyddodd hyn mewn gohebiaeth rhwng swyddogion Cynghrair Pêl-droed Caernarfon a'r Cylch a Chymdeithas Bêl-droed Cymru. A ydych yn barod i ymyrryd, yn eich rôl fel y Gweinidog â chyfrifoldeb dros y Gymraeg, i sicrhau bod y gymdeithas yn sylweddoli bod y Gymraeg a'r Saesneg i'w trin yn gyfartal yng Nghymru?

**Alun Pugh:** We would encourage all national governing bodies to increase their use of the Welsh language. We have just decided that we will fund a Welsh language development officer within the Welsh Sports Association. I would have thought that if someone writes a letter to a major governing body in Wales in the Welsh language, they should receive a reply in the Welsh language.

**Carl Sargeant:** Will the Minister join me in emphasising the importance of normalising the Welsh language so that it is a natural aspect of people's everyday lives, including in sporting organisations? Does he agree that reversing this Government's democratisation of Welsh language policy would be a disaster for this agenda? That is why Plaid Cymru has failed to gain the support of opposition parties to strip away democratic accountability for the Assembly.

**Alun Pugh:** We want to increase the number of Welsh speakers in Wales. At present, it is around the 20 per cent mark, and we want to get steady growth on that. The best way of doing that is to bring the Welsh Language Board into the heart of Government so that the Government leads the agenda on this. I cannot speak on behalf of Plaid Cymru; one minute it wants to get rid of every quango in Wales, the next it is the quangos' best friend.

**William Graham:** You will know that the Welsh Sports Association appointed an officer earlier this year to ensure that governing bodies put in place procedures to facilitate service provision in Wales. When you get the opportunity, would you give us a report on that, and how well that is being implemented? Could you also advise the

Association of Wales has said recently that it has no intention of acknowledging the Welsh language or respond to letters in Welsh? This happened in correspondence between officials of the Caernarfon and District Football League and the Football Association of Wales. Are you prepared to intervene, in your role as the Minister responsible for the Welsh language, to ensure that the association realises that Welsh and English are to be treated equally in Wales?

**Alun Pugh:** Byddem yn annog pob corff llywodraethu cenedlaethol i ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg yn ehangach. Yr ydym newydd benderfynu y byddwn yn ariannu swyddog datblygu'r Gymraeg yng Nghymdeithas Chwaraeon Cymru. Byddwn yn credu, pe bai rhywun yn ysgrifennu llythyr at brif gorff llywodraethu yng Nghymru yn Gymraeg, y dylent gael ateb yn Gymraeg.

**Carl Sargeant:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ymuno â mi i bwysleisio pwysigrwydd normaleiddio'r Gymraeg fel ei bod yn agwedd naturiol ar fywyd bob dydd pobl, gan gynnwys sefydliadau chwaraeon? A yw'n cytuno y byddai gwrthdroi proses y Llywodraeth hon o ddemocrateiddio polisi'r iaith Gymraeg yn drychineb llwyr i'r agenda hon? Dyna pam mae Plaid Cymru wedi methu ag ennill cefnogaeth y gwrthbleidiau i gael gwared ar atebolrwydd democrataidd ar gyfer y Cynulliad.

**Alun Pugh:** Yr ydym am gynyddu nifer y siaradwyr Cymraeg yng Nghymru. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r ffigur oddeutu 20 y cant, ac yr ydym am weld hynny'n cynyddu'n gyson. Y ffordd orau i wneud hynny yw drwy roi Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg wrth galon y Llywodraeth fel y gall y Llywodraeth arwain yr agenda ar hyn. Ni allaf siarad ar ran Plaid Cymru; un funud mae am gael gwared ar bob cwango yng Nghymru, a'r funud nesaf mae'n gyfaill pennaf iddynt.

**William Graham:** Gwyddoch fod Sefydliad Chwaraeon Cymru wedi penodi swyddog yn gynharach eleni i sicrhau bod cyrff llywodraethu yn rhoi gweithdrefnau ar waith i hwyluso'r gwaith o ddarparu gwasanaethau yng Nghymru. Pan gewch gyfle, a allech roi adroddiad inni ar hynny, a pha mor dda y mae'n cael ei weithredu? Hefyd, a allech

Welsh Rugby Union to perhaps use a little more Welsh in its website?

**Alun Pugh:** I am happy to do that. I will report formally to the Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee, and I will ensure that you get a copy of that report. I had an interesting conversation with David Pickering from the WRU on a charity fundraiser a few weekends ago when we walked together to the top of Snowdon. I discussed the use of the Welsh language in the WRU with him. We are pushing at an open door there, and I would want to have rather more detailed and formal talks about this.

**Eleanor Burnham:** A allwch wneud datganiad ynglŷn â'r ddarpariaeth o gyfleoedd hyfforddi chwaraeon drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg? A oes unrhyw archwiliad diweddar ar hyn ac ar ba ddarpariaeth sydd ar gael drwy Gymru, efallai hyd yn oed ynglŷn â nofio am ddim? A yw hynny'n cael ei ddarparu drwy'r Gymraeg?

**Alun Pugh:** We put a substantial amount of investment into this through the Urdd. We invest a six-figure sum every year, which allows the Urdd to employ specialist sport development officers, who do a great job in providing opportunities to take part in sport and active recreation through the medium of Welsh. We want to do more of that.

gyngori Undeb Rygbi Cymru i ddefnyddio ychydig mwy o Gymraeg ar ei wefan?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr wyf yn fodlon gwneud hynny. Anfonaf adroddiad ffurfiol at y Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon, a sicrhaf y byddwch yn cael copi o'r adroddiad hwnnw. Cefais sgwrs ddiddorol gyda David Pickering o Undeb Rygbi Cymru ar achlysur codi arian i elusen rai penwythnosau'n ôl, pan oeddem yn cerdded i gopa'r Wyddfa. Trafodais ddefnyddio'r iaith Gymraeg yn Undeb Rygbi Cymru gydag ef. Yr ydym yn gwthio drws agored yno, a hoffwn gynnal trafodaethau manylach, mwy ffurfiol ynglŷn â hyn.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Could you make a statement about the provision of sports training opportunities through the medium of Welsh? Has there been an audit of this recently and of what provision is available throughout Wales, perhaps even regarding free swimming? Is that offered through the medium of Welsh?

**Alun Pugh:** Gwnaethom fuddsoddiad sylweddol yn hyn drwy'r Urdd. Yr ydym yn buddsoddi swm chwe ffigur bob blwyddyn, sy'n caniatáu i'r Urdd gyflogi swyddogion datblygu chwaraeon arbenigol, sy'n gwneud gwaith gwych i gynnig cyfleoedd i gymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon a hamdden corfforol drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Yr ydym am wneud mwy o hynny.

### **Yr Amgylchedd Hanesyddol The Historic Environment**

**Q5 Lisa Francis:** Will the Minister make a statement on the historic environment?  
OAQ0406 (CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Wales has a unique historic environment, with some 30,000 buildings of special architectural or historic interest, some 3,700 scheduled ancient monuments, 514 conservation areas and two world heritage sites of international renown.

**Lisa Francis:** In the last Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee meeting, you said that

**C5 Lisa Francis:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am yr amgylchedd hanesyddol?  
OAQ0406 (CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Mae gan Gymru amgylchedd hanesyddol unigryw, gyda thua 30,000 o adeiladau o ddiddordeb archeolegol neu hanesyddol arbennig, tua 3,700 o henebion rhestredig, 514 o ardaloedd cadwraeth a dau safle treftadaeth y byd sy'n enwog yn rhyngwladol.

**Lisa Francis:** Yng nghyfarfod diwethaf y Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon, yr oeddech yn dweud

'Cadw is just another piece of the culture ministry'

and does not form any part of the culture board. Given that it will not have anything to do with Cadw, what plans does your Government have to develop a proper strategic plan for the historic environment in Wales, and how do you intend to carry that forward?

**Alun Pugh:** Let us be clear about what Cadw is. Formerly, a lot of people thought that Cadw was a quango; it was not, it was an executive agency. However, that anomalous status caused a number of difficulties. One of the most important things that we have done, as part of a much wider programme of public service reform, has been to reshape the culture department to ensure that Cadw is not just another department, but is rather more than that and an important part of Government. It does an important and statutory job in protecting the historic environment, and has a much wider contribution to make towards regeneration in Wales.

**Irene James:** Since 1999, the most deprived communities in the south Wales Valleys have received a fraction of the funding allocated to other parts of Wales for historic environment projects. Would you agree that the strategic delivery of funding for the historic environment must account for poorer communities across Wales, and what action are you taking, working in partnership with potential applicants, to ensure that the shortfall in funding is eliminated?

**Alun Pugh:** The whole agenda of social inclusion needs to be run across not just Government funding, but also lottery funding. In terms of areas such as the south Wales Valleys, it is fair to say that the pattern of funding has been a little lumpy. That is inevitable with major capital expenditure projects. Taking Blaenavon as an example, there has been major investment there, in terms of the Big Pit and the ironworks, yet if you go to the other side of the hill, to a valley that has not had a major project like that, the figure looks significantly smaller.

Dim ond darn arall o'r weinyddiaeth ddiwylliannol yw Cadw

ac nad yw'n rhan o'r bwrdd diwylliant o gwbl. O ystyried na fydd gan hyn ddim i'w wneud â Cadw, pa gynlluniau sydd gan eich Llywodraeth i ddatblygu cynllun strategol gwirioneddol ar gyfer amgylchedd hanesyddol Cymru, a sut yr ydych yn bwriadu ei weithredu?

**Alun Pugh:** Gadewch inni fod yn glir ynglŷn â beth yw Cadw. Arferai nifer o bobl gredu mai cwango oedd Cadw; nid oedd hynny'n wir: asiantaeth weithredol ydoedd. Fodd bynnag, achosodd y statws afreolaidd hwnnw nifer o anawsterau. Un o'r pethau pwysicaf yr ydym wedi eu gwneud, fel rhan o raglen ehangach o ddiwygio gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, yw ail-lunio'r adran ddiwylliant er mwyn sicrhau bod Cadw yn fwy na dim ond adran arall, ond ei fod lawer yn fwy na hynny, ac yn rhan bwysig o'r Llywodraeth. Mae'n gwneud gwaith pwysig a statudol o ran diogelu'r amgylchedd hanesyddol, ac mae ganddo gyfraniad llawer ehangach i'w wneud tuag at adfywio yng Nghymru.

**Irene James:** Er 1999, dim ond mymryn o'r arian a ddyrannwyd i rannau eraill o Gymru ar gyfer prosiectau amgylchedd hanesyddol Cymru a gafodd y cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig yng Nghymoedd y de. A fydech yn cytuno bod yn rhaid i'r broses strategol o ddarparu arian ar gyfer yr amgylchedd hanesyddol ystyried cymunedau tlotach ledled Cymru, a pha gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd, drwy weithio mewn partneriaeth â darpar ymgeiswyr, i sicrhau y caiff y diffyg ariannu hwn ei ddileu?

**Alun Pugh:** Mae angen i arian y Loteri yn ogystal ag arian y Llywodraeth gwmpasu'r agenda cynhwysiant cymdeithasol gyfan. O ran ardaloedd fel Cymoedd y de, mae'n deg dweud bod y patrwm ariannu wedi bod braidd yn anghyson. Mae hynny'n anochel gyda phrosiectau gwariant cyfalaf mawr. I gymryd Blaenafon fel enghraifft, gwelwyd buddsoddi mawr yno, yn y Pwll Mawr a'r gwaith haearn. Ond os ewch i ochr arall y bryn, i gwm na chafodd brosiect mawr fel hwnnw, mae'r ffigur gryn dipyn yn llai.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Gan gyfeirio at Cadw, mae'r derbyniadau ariannol yng nghastell Caernarfon dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf wedi bod yn llawer uwch na'r gwariant ar yr adeiladwaith yn y castell, ac yn arbennig o fewn y dref gaerog. Mae cyfleon gwych i ehangu apêl Caernarfon fel safle i ymwelwyr drwy'r fath arian. A ydych yn barod i ddwyn pwysau ar Cadw—yr ydych yn dweud mai chi sydd yn cyfeirio gwaith Cadw—i fanteisio ar yr arian ac ehangu ar y cyfleon i sefydlu'r hen dref fel safle gwirioneddol bwysig i ymwelwyr?

**Alun Pugh:** It is fair to say that Caernarfon castle makes a huge contribution to the tourism effort in that part of north-west Wales. In terms of charges, we do not treat individual castles and properties as individual profit centres. We have to take a more balanced view across the whole of Wales in terms of Cadw's collective income and its much greater expenditure. I only wish that all Cadw's big expenditure could be met by admissions, but that is not the case, of course.

**Mick Bates:** Minister, you may be aware that many chapels and their burial grounds are being sold. Would you agree that chapels and their burial grounds are an important part of the Welsh historic environment, and that they deserve much better protection than they receive at the moment? What can you do to provide that important protection?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Chapels feature under question six.

**Mick Bates:** They are part of the Welsh historic environment.

**The Presiding Officer:** Have a go, Minister.

3.00 p.m.

**Alun Pugh:** We are witnessing a decline in attendances in church, and, in many cases, the sympathetic reuse of chapel buildings, giving them a new lease of life—though not necessarily as religious buildings—makes a positive contribution to the local environment.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** With reference to Cadw, financial receipts in Caernarfon castle over the last few years have been far higher than the expenditure on the structure of the castle, and especially within the walled town. There are excellent opportunities to extend the appeal of Caernarfon as a visitor site through such money. Are you prepared to put pressure on Cadw—you say that you direct the work of Cadw—to take advantage of the money and expand the opportunities to establish the old town as a site of real importance to visitors?

**Alun Pugh:** Mae'n deg dweud bod Castell Caernarfon yn gwneud cyfraniad anferth i hybu twristiaeth yn y rhan honno o'r gogledd-orllewin. O ran codi tâl, nid ydym yn trin cestyll ac adeiladau unigol fel canolfannau gwneud elw. Rhaid inni lunio barn fwy cytbwys dros Gymru gyfan am incwm cyfunol Cadw a'i wariant, sydd lawer yn fwy. Byddai'n dda gennyf pe gellid talu holl gostau Cadw drwy dâl mynediad, ond wrth gwrs, nid felly y mae.

**Mick Bates:** Weinidog, efallai eich bod yn ymwybodol fod nifer o gapeli a'u mynwentydd yn cael eu gwerthu. A fydddech yn cytuno bod capeli a'u mynwentydd yn rhan bwysig o amgylchedd hanesyddol Cymru, a'u bod yn haeddu eu diogelu lawer yn well nag a wneir ar hyn o bryd? Beth y gallwch ei wneud i ddarparu'r diogelwch pwysig hwnnw?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Daw capeli o dan gwestiwn chwech.

**Mick Bates:** Maent yn rhan o amgylchedd hanesyddol Cymru.

**Y Llywydd:** Rhowch gynnig arni, Weinidog.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae nifer y bobl sy'n mynychu eglwys neu gapel heddiw yn gostwng, ac mewn llawer achos mae aildefnyddio hen gapeli mewn ffordd addas, gan roi bywyd newydd iddynt—er nad fel addoldai o reidrwydd—yn gwneud cyfraniad cadarnhaol i'r amgylchedd lleol.

## Capeli â Statws Adeilad Rhestredig Listed Chapels

**Q6 David Melding:** How many chapels in South Wales Central with listed status are considered to be at risk from dilapidation? OAQ0422 (CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** There are just fewer than 100 chapels, but the position is more complex in that, sometimes, chapels, railings, lichgates and other architectural features are listed separately in your area of South Wales Central. There is no central estate record, because most of these buildings are in private ownership.

**David Melding:** Wales has more non-conformist chapels, in terms of concentration, than any other place on earth, and they are a glorious part of our heritage, with styles from the vernacular, classical, neo-gothic and eclectic. We need to celebrate them and be more aware of those assets so that they can be sympathetically converted should they fall out of religious use. That is very important to our historical and cultural traditions.

**Alun Pugh:** That is a fair point, and that is why we have a comprehensive set of listing criteria, and statutory protection involving local authorities. As well as the statutory protection, we also have Assembly grants; I have just made a recent announcement on the latest round of grants. Over the last five years, some £13 million has been available to owners of historic buildings for their conservation, repair and upkeep.

**Leighton Andrews:** One chapel in South Wales Central that is receiving significant investment from the Arts Council of Wales is Soar Ffrwdamos in my constituency, which will be providing an enhanced arts facility to be run by Valleys Kids in my constituency. I welcome that. However, would you agree that there are organisations in Wales, such as the Heritage Lottery Fund and the National Trust, whose record in supporting projects for the renovation of chapels and other community buildings in the south Wales Valleys is not as good as it should be?

**C6 David Melding:** Sawl capel yng Nghanol De Cymru, sydd â statws adeilad rhestredig, sy'n cael ei ystyried mewn perygl o ddadfeilio? OAQ0422 (CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Mae yna ychydig yn llai na 100 o gapeli, ond mae'r sefyllfa'n fwy cymhleth yn yr ystyr fod capeli, rheiliau, pyrth mynwentydd a nodweddion pensaernïol eraill, weithiau, yn cael eu rhestru ar wahân yn eich ardal chi, sef Canol De Cymru. Nid oes cofnod canolog o ystadau, gan fod y rhan fwyaf o'r adeiladau hyn yn eiddo i berchenogion preifat.

**David Melding:** Mae mwy o gapeli anghydfurfiol yng Nghymru, o ran dwysedd, nag yn unman arall yn y byd, ac maent yn rhan odidog o'n treftadaeth, gydag arddulliau brodorol, clasurol, neo-gothig ac eclectic. Mae angen inni eu dathlu a bod yn fwy ymwybodol o'r asedau hynny, fel y gallant gael eu haddasu'n briodol os ydynt yn peidio â bod yn addoldai. Mae hynny'n bwysig iawn i'n traddodiadau hanesyddol a diwylliannol.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae hynny'n bwynt teg, a dyna pam mae gennym gyfres gynhwysfawr o feini prawf ar gyfer rhestru, ynghyd â diogelwch statudol sy'n cynnwys awdurdodau lleol. Yn ogystal â'r diogelwch statudol, mae gennym hefyd grantiau'r Cynulliad; yr wyf newydd wneud cyhoeddiad yn ddiweddar ar y cylch diweddaraf o grantiau. Dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf, darparwyd tua £13 miliwn i berchenogion adeiladau hanesyddol i'w diogelu, eu hatgyweirio a'u cynnal a'u cadw.

**Leighton Andrews:** Un capel yng Nghanol De Cymru lle mae cryn fuddsoddiad gan Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru yw Soar, Ffrwdamos yn fy etholaeth i, a fydd yn darparu gwell cyfleuster i'r celfyddydau ac yn cael ei redeg gan Blant y Cymoedd yn fy etholaeth. Croesawaf hynny. Fodd bynnag, a fydddech yn cytuno bod yna sefydliadau yng Nghymru, megis Cronfa Dreftadaeth y Loteri a'r Ymddiriedolaeth Genedlaethol, nad yw eu record o gefnogi prosiectau adnewyddu capeli ac adeiladau cymunedol eraill yng Nghymoedd y De cystal ag y dylai fod?

**Alun Pugh:** The Valleys Kids project is a cracking example of bringing a chapel building back into a modern and very productive use. Everyone who has been involved in that project—and it has been good to see it for myself—should be commended for the quality of their work.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae prosiect Plant y Cymoedd yn enghraifft wych o ddefnyddio adeilad capel mewn ffordd fodern a chynhyrchiol iawn. Dylid canmol pawb sydd wedi bod yn ymwneud â'r prosiect hwnnw—ac yr oedd yn braf cael gweld y prosiect fy hun—am ansawdd eu gwaith.

### Chwaraeon yng Ngheredigion Sports in Ceredigion

**C7 Elin Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am chwaraeon yng Ngheredigion? OAQ00462(CWS)

**Q7 Elin Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on sports in Ceredigion? OAQ00462(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Mae dros £4.5 miliwn wedi cael ei fuddsoddi yng Ngheredigion er mwyn gwella chwaraeon yn y sir. Mae rhaglenni fel nofio am ddim a phrosiectau'r loteri yn llwyddiannus iawn yn yr ardal honno, ond yr oeddwn yn siomedig i weld nad oedd tîm o'r sir yn cystadlu yn y gala nofio cenedlaethol yn Abertawe yr wythnos diwethaf.

**Alun Pugh:** More than £4.5 million has been invested in Ceredigion to improve sports in the county. Programmes such as free swimming and lottery projects are very successful in that area. But I was disappointed to see that there was no team from the county competing in the national swimming gala in Swansea last week.

**Elin Jones:** Mae galw mawr am drac rhedeg yng Ngheredigion; mae athletwyr ifanc ar hyn o bryd yn gorfod teithio ar hyd coridor yr M4 i gyrraedd trac rhedeg—taith sy'n cymryd dros bedair awr bob tro. Ag ystyried bod y Gemau Olympaidd yn dod i Lundain yn 2012, a yw'n ormod i ddisgwyl y bydd trac rhedeg ar gyfer pobl ifanc y gorllewin a'r canolbarth erbyn hynny?

**Elin Jones:** There is great demand for a running track in Ceredigion; young athletes currently have to travel the length of the M4 corridor to reach a running track—a four-hour trip each time. Bearing in mind that the Olympic Games will be coming to London in 2012, is it too much to expect that there will be a running track for the young people of mid and west Wales by then?

**Alun Pugh:** I can understand the frustration of having to travel for a long distance to get to a high-quality facility. Obviously, the Sports Council for Wales, which deals with lottery schemes, must take Wales very much in the round. However, if you look at the published statistics, you will see that around £57 per head has been spent in your county on capital projects, which is the second highest figure for the whole of Wales.

**Alun Pugh:** Gallaf ddeall y rhwystredigaeth a deimlir gan y rheini sy'n gorfod teithio ymhell i gyrraedd cyfleuster o safon uchel. Yn amlwg, rhaid i Gyngor Chwaraeon Cymru, sy'n ymdrin â chynlluniau'r loteri, ystyried Cymru yn ei chyfanrwydd. Fodd bynnag, os edrychwch ar yr ystadegau sydd wedi eu cyhoeddi, fe welwch fod tua £57 y pen wedi ei wario yn eich sir ar brosiectau cyfalaf, sef y ffigur uchaf ond un yng Nghymru gyfan.

**Nick Bourne:** I thank the Minister for his comments on spending on sports in Ceredigion, and also on what he said earlier about support for the London 2012 Olympics and Welsh involvement in that; he knows how supportive I am of his efforts on that front. Given the capital expenditure in Ceredigion, has any thought been given to the use of those facilities for the London-based Olympics, or perhaps water-based sports? If

**Nick Bourne:** Hoffwn ddiolch i'r Gweinidog am ei sylwadau ynglŷn â gwariant ar chwaraeon yng Ngheredigion, a hefyd yr hyn a ddywedodd yn gynharach am gefnogi'r Gemau Olympaidd yn Llundain yn 2012 a rhan Cymru yn hynny; fe wŷr mor gefnogol yr wyf i'w ymdrechion yn hynny. O gofio'r gwariant cyfalaf yng Ngheredigion, a ystyriwyd defnyddio'r cyfleusterau hynny ar gyfer y Gemau Olympaidd yn Llundain, neu

not, will the Minister push forward with that, so that we can have some events in mid-Wales, as well as the use of water-based sports in north Wales, and the football in south Wales?

**Alun Pugh:** We need to be clear regarding the distinction between Olympic events and training and preparation camps. The venue in Wales for Olympic events will be the Millennium Stadium, and that will host the football tournament. Outside that, there will be lots of opportunities for training camps all over Wales. I have mentioned a few of them as there are one or two obvious venues, such as the velodrome and the pool and so on. However, given the number and quality of the facilities in which we have invested in Wales in recent years, I think that it will go much wider than that.

ar gyfer chwaraeon dŵr, efallai? Os na, a wnaiff y Gweinidog bwysu am hynny, fel y gallwn gael rhai digwyddiadau yn y Canolbarth, yn ogystal â defnyddio chwaraeon dŵr yn y Gogledd, a phêl-droed yn y De?

**Alun Pugh:** Mae angen inni fod yn glir ynglŷn â'r gwahaniaeth rhwng digwyddiadau'r Gemau Olympaidd a gwerysloedd ymarfer a pharatoi. Stadiwm y Mileniwm fydd y lleoliad yng Nghymru ar gyfer digwyddiadau'r Gemau Olympaidd, ac yno y caiff y bencampwriaeth bêl-droed ei chynnal. Ar wahân i hynny, bydd nifer o gyfleoedd am wersylloedd ymarfer ledled Cymru. Yr wyf wedi sôn am rai ohonynt gan fod yna un neu ddau o leoliadau amlwg, megis y felodrom a'r pwll nofio, ac ati. Fodd bynnag, o gofio nifer ac ansawdd y cyfleusterau yr ydym wedi buddsoddi ynddynt yng Nghymru yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, credaf y caiff llawer mwy na hynny eu defnyddio.

### **Y Fforwm Iaith The Fforwm Iaith**

**C8 Leighton Andrews:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am lwyddiant y Fforwm Iaith cyntaf? OAQ0417(CWS)

**Q8 Leighton Andrews:** Will the Minister make a statement on the success of the first Fforwm Iaith? OAQ0417(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** I am pleased to report that the first Fforwm Iaith, which was held on 20 October in Porthmadog, was a success. The fforwm attracted some 200 people from the locality and across Wales, all with a shared interest in the future of the Welsh language.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae'n bleser gennyf adrodd bod y Fforwm Iaith cyntaf, a gynhaliwyd ar 20 Hydref ym Mhorthmadog, yn llwyddiant. Daeth tua 200 o bobl o'r ardal leol ac o bob rhan o Gymru i'r fforwm, bob un â diddordeb yn nyfodol yr iaith Gymraeg.

**Leighton Andrews:** A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno bod y Fforwm Iaith yn fodd ardderchog o adeiladu dyfodol llwyddiannus i'r iaith Gymraeg? A yw'n cytuno mai'r ffordd orau o dyfu'r iaith yw drwy ddadl a thrafodaeth gyhoeddus? A yw'n cytuno bod yn rhaid i ni sicrhau bod yr iaith yn perthyn i bawb?

**Leighton Andrews:** Does the Minister agree that the Fforwm Iaith is an excellent way of building a successful future for the Welsh language? Does he agree that the best way to stimulate language growth is through public discussion and debate? Does he agree that we must ensure that the language belongs to everyone?

**Alun Pugh:** It is important that we have an open forum on the language, as it presents an opportunity to engage at length with the people of Wales on a serious subject. The Cabinet is unique in western Europe in the fact that we have open sessions to which the public can turn up and ask questions on

**Alun Pugh:** Mae'n bwysig fod gennym fforwm agored ar yr iaith, gan fod hynny'n gyfle i drafod pwnc difrifol yn fanwl gyda phobl Cymru. Mae'r Cabinet yn unigryw yng ngorllewin Ewrop yn gymaint â'n bod yn cynnal sesiynau agored y gall y cyhoedd ddod iddynt a gofyn cwestiynau ar unrhyw



anything, on a without-notice basis. We get the occasional question on the Welsh language, but, given the importance of the subject, it is important that we have a specialist forum to discuss the matter on its own.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Ochr yn ochr â chi yng nghyfarfod y Fforwm Iaith, Weinidog, yr oedd cynrychiolwyr Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg. Gwyddoch y gwnaed penderfyniad yn y Cynulliad ychydig yn ôl yn gorchymyn y Llywodraeth i beidio â pharhau i dynnu bwrdd yr iaith i mewn, nes bod cynnig pellach, derbynol o ran yr hyn a ddaw yn lle'r bwrdd, yn cael ei gyflwyno i'r Cynulliad. Yr oeddwn yn hynod o siomedig o ddeall bod llefarydd ar ran y Llywodraeth wedi dweud na fyddai'r Llywodraeth yn teimlo rheidrwydd i dderbyn na pharchu penderfyniad y Cynulliad. Yr wyf am i chi, Weinidog, ddatgan yn glir heddiw y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn parchu'r cynnig hwnnw yn llawn.

**Alun Pugh:** We have taken careful legal advice on this matter, and we are not going to stop the process. We have a series of different work streams on personnel, information technology, legal work and so on; all that detailed preparation work is under way and I think that it would be irresponsible to simply throw it into reverse gear.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Weinidog, yr wyf yn siomedig gyda'ch ateb a bydd y bobl sydd â diddordeb ym muddiannau'r iaith Gymraeg yn siomedig hefyd. Beth yw pwrpas y Cynulliad yn pasio cynnig i orchymyn y Llywodraeth i beidio â chario ymlaen os nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn derbyn hynny? Weinidog, a wnewch chi ailfeddwl?

**Alun Pugh:** You cannot say, on the one hand, 'You must stop the work' and, on the other hand, say, 'You are not ready'. That is just logically inconsistent. I will tell you that there will be a further process. It will have to go through the Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee, the Business Committee and the Legislation Committee, and it will terminate with a vote on the floor of the Assembly. If the Assembly takes the view that that preparatory work is not up to standard, at that point, it can decide to stop it.

beth, heb rybudd. Cawn ambell gwestiwn ar y Gymraeg, ond o gofio pwysigrwydd y pwnc, mae'n bwysig fod gennym fforwm arbenigol i drafod y mater ar ei ben ei hun.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Representatives of the Welsh Language Board were sitting next to you at the Fforwm Iaith, Minister. You know that a decision was made in the Assembly a while ago ordering the Government to refrain from merging the language board until a further, more acceptable motion is proposed in the Assembly, regarding what will replace of the board. I was extremely disappointed to learn that a Government spokesperson had said that the Government would not feel obliged to accept or respect the decision by the Assembly. I want you, Minister, to state clearly today that the Government of Wales will respect that motion in full.

**Alun Pugh:** Yr ydym wedi cael cyngor cyfreithiol gofalus ar y mater hwn, ac ni fyddwn yn atal y broses. Mae gennym gyfres o linynnau gwaith gwahanol ar bersonél, technoleg gwybodaeth, gwaith cyfreithiol ac ati; mae'r holl waith paratoi manwl yn mynd rhagddo a chredaf y byddai'n anghyfrifol ei wrth-droi.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Minister, I am disappointed with your answer, and people who are concerned about the future of the Welsh language will also be disappointed. What is the point of the Assembly agreeing a motion directing the Government not to proceed if the Government will not accept that? Minister, will you reconsider?

**Alun Pugh:** Ni allwch ddweud ar y naill law 'Rhaid ichi atal y gwaith', ac ar y llaw arall ddweud 'Nid ydych yn barod'. Mae hynny'n anghyson yn rhesymegol. Dywedaf wrthyh y bydd proses arall. Bydd yn rhaid mynd gerbron Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon, y Pwyllgor Busnes, a'r Pwyllgor Deddfau, a daw'r broses i ben gyda phleidlais yn y Cyfarfod Llawn. Os bydd y Cynulliad o'r farn nad yw'r gwaith paratoi yn ddigon da, gall benderfynu ei atal bryd hynny.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Mae'n flin gennyf i ddweud nad yw eich ateb yn fy argyhoeddi o gwbl. Yr wyf yn gwybod yn iawn, fel yr ydych chi, os ydych yn dod i mewn ar ddiwedd y broses gyda chynnig gerbron y Cynulliad, mae hwnnw'n *fait accompli*. Bydd yr holl waith paratoi wedi ei wneud, bydd y staff wedi cael gwybod beth fydd eu dyfodol ac i ble y bydd eu swyddi'n mynd. Weinidog, yr wyf yn gofyn am y tro olaf, a ydych yn fodlon parchu penderfyniad y Cynulliad? Os na, byddwch yn wynebu cynnig i dynnu'r pwerau hynny oddi arnoch.

**Alun Pugh:** I am sorry that you take that view. We are moving forward, having taken careful legal advice. Your colleagues on the culture committee are kept fully informed of the detailed preparation work that is going ahead and, as I said, there will be a formal process and a vote of the floor of the Assembly before the Welsh Language Board is merged. What you are doing is destabilising the board and its staff. That sort of nonsense is causing considerable uncertainty to staff, so you need to think carefully about what you are doing.

3.10 p.m.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Rhaid i chi fod yn ofalus iawn hefyd, Weinidog, achos y Llywodraeth sy'n dadsefydlogi bwrdd yr iaith. Yr ydych yn gwrthod dweud wrth bobl Cymru beth yn union fydd y patrwm gwaith a fydd yn dilyn diddymu'r bwrdd. Dyna paham y derbyniwyd y cynnig. Yr wyf yn hynod siomedig eich bod yn fodlon defnyddio dadleuon gwleidyddiaeth bleidiol ar fater y mae modd inni ddod i ddealltwriaeth arno. Y cyfan yr ydym yn ei ofyn yw eich bod yn gwrthod parhau â'r broses o dynnu bwrdd yr iaith i mewn hyd nes y byddwn yn hapus gyda'r hyn sy'n dilyn hynny. A yw hynny'n afresymol?

**Alun Pugh:** There was a great deal of nonsense there. I have explained on many occasions in detail the differences in the regulatory and the appellate functions—*[Interruption.]* Yes, you know exactly what we are proposing. The work will continue, and there will be an opportunity for a vote.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I am sorry to say that your answer does not convince me at all. I know full well, as do you, that if you come in at the end of the process with a motion before the Assembly, that is a *fait accompli*. All the preparatory work will have been done, the staff will know what their futures hold and where their jobs will go. Minister, I ask for the last time, are you willing to respect the decision by the Assembly? If not, you will face a motion to have those powers taken away from you.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf eich bod yn mynegi'r farn honno. Yr ydym yn symud yn ein blaenau, ar ôl cael cyngor cyfreithiol gofalus. Mae eich cyd-aelodau ar y pwyllgor diwylliant yn cael yr holl wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y gwaith paratoi manwl sy'n mynd rhagddo, ac fel y dywedais bydd proses ffurfiol a phleidlais yn y Cyfarfod Llawn cyn uno Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg. Yr hyn yr ydych chithau'n ei wneud yw dadsefydlogi'r bwrdd a'i staff. Mae dwli o'r fath yn achosi cryn ansicrwydd ymhlith y staff. Felly, mae angen ichi feddwl yn ofalus am yr hyn yr ydych yn ei wneud.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** You must also be extremely careful, Minister, because it is the Government that is destabilising the language board. You are refusing to tell the people of Wales exactly what the working arrangements will be following the abolition of the board. That is why the motion was approved. I am extremely disappointed that you are prepared to use party-political arguments in a matter on which we can reach an understanding. All we ask is that you suspend the process of merging the language board until such time as we are happy with whatever is to replace it. Is that unreasonable?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr oedd llawer o ddwli yn hynny. Yr wyf wedi esbonio'n fanwl droeon y gwahaniaethau rhwng y swyddogaethau rheoleiddio ac apelio—*[Torri ar draws.]* Ie, fe wyddoch yn iawn yr hyn yr ydym yn ei gynig. Bydd y gwaith yn parhau, a bydd cyfle am bleidlais.

**Jenny Randerson:** I can assure you that there is no destabilisation of the staff at the Welsh Language Board as a result of that vote; they regard it as a ray of hope and a sign of some sanity here. However, if your legal advice is that you can ride roughshod over the Assembly and plough ahead with this crazy notion despite the will of the Assembly, and if you are continuing with your preparation, what discussions have you had with your UK counterpart about parliamentary time being made available for the necessary abolition or amendment of the Welsh Language Act 1993? As you well know, you are at the mercy of the UK Government in allowing parliamentary time to proceed with your plans.

**Alun Pugh:** You misunderstand the procedures that have to be followed in Parliament and in the Assembly. I will write to you, once again, to confirm those details. However, we do not need the approval of Parliament to proceed in this matter.

**Glyn Davies:** To take you back to the question on the Fforwm Iaith, it certainly generated a lot of publicity, but attendees tell me that they were disappointed by the fact that you had little to say that satisfied their questions. For there to be a point to the Fforwm Iaith, what specific proposals are you considering that came out of the meeting, or was it just a publicity gimmick for yourself?

**Alun Pugh:** You were not there, of course. It was an important opportunity to engage in a detailed discussion about language policy. I made the Assembly Government's commitment to creating a bilingual future clear. We had a detailed discussion on demographics in that part of Gwynedd, and some important issues were raised with regard to economic development, housing, tourism and general cultural development. It was an excellent discussion, and we will make a summary of it available on the Assembly's website next week.

**Jenny Randerson:** Gallaf eich sicrhau nad yw staff Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg wedi eu dadsefydlu o ganlyniad i'r bleidlais honno; llygedyn o obaith ydyw, yn eu barn hwy, ac arwydd o ychydig gallineb yma. Fodd bynnag, os yw eich cyngor cyfreithiol yn dweud eich bod yn gallu anwybyddu dymuniadau'r Cynulliad yn llwyr, a bwrw ymlaen â'r syniad gwirion hwn yn groes i ewyllys y Cynulliad, ac os ydych yn parhau â'ch gwaith paratoi, pa drafodaethau a gawsoch gyda'ch cyd-Weinidogion yn y DU ynglŷn â neilltuo amser seneddol ar gyfer diddymu neu ddiwygio Deddf yr Iaith Gymraeg 1993, fel sydd ei angenrheidiol? Fel y gwyddoch, yr ydych ar drugaredd Llywodraeth y DU i roi amser seneddol i fwrw ymlaen â'ch cynlluniau.

**Alun Pugh:** Yr ydych yn camddeall y gweithdrefnau y mae'n rhaid eu dilyn yn y Senedd ac yn y Cynulliad. Ysgrifennaf atoch, unwaith eto, i gadarnhau'r manylion hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid oes angen cymeradwyaeth y Senedd i fwrw ymlaen â'r mater hwn.

**Glyn Davies:** I ddychwelyd at y cwestiwn am y Fforwm Iaith, yn sicr mae wedi denu cryn gyhoeddusrwydd. Ond dywed y rhai a oedd yn bresennol wrthyf eu bod yn siomedig nad oedd gennych fawr ddim i'w ddweud i fodloni eu cwestiynau. Er mwyn sicrhau bod diben i'r Fforwm Iaith, pa gynigion penodol yr ydych yn eu hystyried a gododd o'r cyfarfod, neu ai gimig i gael cyhoeddusrwydd i chi'ch hun ydoedd?

**Alun Pugh:** Nid oeddech yno, wrth gwrs. Yr oedd yn gyfle pwysig i gael trafodaeth fanwl ar bolisi iaith. Eglurais ymrwymiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i greu dyfodol dwyieithog. Cawsom drafodaeth fanwl ar ddemograffeg yn y rhan honno o Wynedd, a chodwyd rhai materion pwysig ynglŷn â datblygu economaidd, tai, twristiaeth a datblygu diwylliannol cyffredinol. Cafwyd trafodaeth ardderchog, a byddwn yn darparu crynodeb ohoni ar wefan y Cynulliad yr wythnos nesaf.

## Tai Fforddiadwy Affordable Housing

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7 ac 8 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, gwelliannau 9, 10 ac 11 yn enw Kirsty Williams, a gwelliannau 12, 13 a 14 yn enw David Melding.

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

1. *recognises the difficulties facing younger working households in accessing the housing market in parts of Wales;*

2. *accepts that it is for local authorities to identify their own housing requirements and priorities in the light of local circumstances;*

3. *notes the practical measures taken by the Assembly Government in addressing these issues. (NDM2652)*

I am pleased that we are debating the issue of affordable housing today. It is a broad topic that ranges from the provision of socially rented housing for general needs, and bespoke accommodation for older people or those with disabilities, to the intervention in the market for home ownership. I am therefore pleased to accept amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies; it widens the scope of the debate but is consistent with the intention of the motion.

I will concentrate my opening remarks on the aspect of affordability, which has generated the most interest recently; there has been much debate on the Barker review of housing supply. The UK Government will shortly publish more details of its response to that report, but we need to remember that our circumstances are wholly different to those in the south east of England, which was the main driver for the Barker review. The latest household projections for Wales show that the average growth of households is broadly

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7 and 8 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, amendments 9, 10, and 11 in the name of Kirsty Williams, and amendments 12, 13 and 14 in the name of David Melding.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** Cynigiad fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

1. *yn cydnabod y trafferthion sy'n wynebu aelwydydd iau sy'n gweithio i allu mynd i mewn i'r farchnad dai mewn rhannau o Gymru;*

2. *yn derbyn mai mater i awdurdodau lleol yw nodi eu gofynion a'u blaenoriaethau eu hunain o ran tai, yng ngoleuni amgylchiadau lleol;*

3. *yn nodi'r camau ymarferol a gymerwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i roi sylw i'r materion hyn. (NDM2652)*

Yr wyf yn falch ein bod yn trafod mater tai fforddiadwy heddiw. Mae'n bwnc eang ei gwmpas sy'n amrywio o ddarparu tai cymdeithasol ar rent ar gyfer anghenion cyffredinol, a llety arbennig i bobl hŷn neu bobl ag anableddau, i ymyrryd yn y farchnad perchentyaeth. Felly, mae'n bleser gennyf dderbyn gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies; mae'n estyn cwmpas y ddadl, ond mae'n gyson â bwriad y cynnig.

Yn fy sylwadau agoriadol, byddaf yn canolbwyntio ar fod yn fforddiadwy, sydd wedi denu'r sylw mwyaf yn ddiweddar; bu llawer o drafodaeth ar adolygiad Barker o'r cyflenwad tai. Bydd Llywodraeth y DU yn cyhoeddi rhagor o fanylion am ei hymateb i'r adroddiad hwnnw cyn hir, ond mae angen inni gofio bod ein hamgylchiadau yn hollol wahanol i'r rheini yn ne ddwyrain Lloegr, sef prif ysgogydd adolygiad Barker. Dengys y rhagamcanion diweddaraf o aelwydydd yng Nghymru fod y twf cyfartalog mewn

the same as house building and completions, but this masks localised difficulties, especially for first-time buyers.

For example, the Halifax's first-time buyer review 2005 indicates that the average price paid by first-time buyers in Wales increased by 25 per cent in 2004. The number of first-time buyers was also at its lowest for 10 years. Some parts of Wales have also been subject to sustained net immigration in recent years. Inevitably, if incomers have higher purchasing power than local people, that is difficult. We need to consider the appropriate policy response on that issue.

We also need to look at planning for housing. The provision of new housing is often one of the most contentious issues that local authorities have to address. In developing the Wales spatial plan, it was agreed that it was not for the Assembly to prescribe how many houses should be built in each local authority area. Nevertheless, authorities must take the household projections as their starting point, and work collaboratively to determine and agree their regionally based requirements. To complement this approach, we have recently consulted on our draft local housing assessment guide. It provides authorities with detailed guidance on establishing their overall housing requirements and the local need for affordable housing. It emphasises the need for housing and planning authorities to work together with key stakeholders and other local authorities to establish housing requirements that reflect the realities of the housing market.

As Members know, the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside is reforming the planning system in Wales, under the 'Planning: Delivering for Wales' programme. This includes a new streamline system of local development plans. We also commissioned research under the Wales planning research programme, which indicated that more clarity was needed in guidance on the use of certain powers through the technical advice notes. We want to ensure that the land-use planning system plays its part in delivering affordable

aelwydydd yr un fath yn fras â nifer y tai sy'n cael eu codi neu wedi eu cwblhau. Ond mae hyn yn celu anawsterau lleol, yn enwedig i'r rheini sy'n prynu cartref am y tro cyntaf.

Er enghraifft, mae adolygiad Halifax yn 2005 o bobl sy'n prynu cartref am y tro cyntaf yn nodi bod y pris cyfartalog a dalwyd gan y bobl hynny yng Nghymru wedi cynyddu 25 y cant yn 2004. Yr oedd nifer y bobl a brynodd gartref am y tro cyntaf hefyd ar ei isaf ers 10 mlynedd. Mae rhai rhannau o Gymru hefyd wedi dioddef mewnfudo net cyson yn y blynyddoedd diweddar. Yn anochel, os oes gan fewnfudwyr bŵer prynu uwch na phobl lleol, mae hynny'n anodd. Mae angen inni ystyried yr ymateb polisi priodol ar y mater hwnnw.

Mae angen inni hefyd edrych ar gynllunio ar gyfer tai. Mae darparu tai newydd yn aml yn un o'r materion mwyaf cynhennus y mae'n rhaid i awdurdodau lleol fynd i'r afael â hwy. Wrth ddatblygu cynllun gofodol Cymru, cytunwyd nad cyfrifoldeb y Cynulliad oedd rhagnodi faint o dai y dylid eu hadeiladu ym mhob ardal awdurdod lleol. Serch hynny, rhaid i awdurdodau gymryd yr amcanestyniadau o aelwydydd fel eu man cychwyn, a gweithio ar y cyd i bennu eu gofynion ar sail ardal, a chytuno arnynt. I ategu'r dull hwn, yr ydym wedi ymgynghori'n ddiweddar ar ddrafft ein canllaw asesu tai lleol. Mae'n rhoi arweiniad manwl i awdurdodau ar sefydlu eu gofynion tai cyffredinol a'r angen lleol am dai fforddiadwy. Mae'n pwysleisio'r angen i awdurdodau tai ac awdurdodau cynllunio weithio gyda rhanddeiliaid allweddol ac awdurdodau lleol eraill i sefydlu gofynion tai sy'n adlewyrchu realiti'r farchnad dai.

Fel y gŵyr Aelodau, mae'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad yn diwygio'r system gynllunio yng Nghymru dan y rhaglen 'Cynllunio: Cyflawni dros Gymru'. Mae'r rhaglen hon yn cynnwys system newydd wedi'i symleiddio o gynlluniau datblygu leol. Yr ydym hefyd wedi comisiynu ymchwil dan raglen ymchwil cynllunio Cymru, a oedd yn nodi bod angen mwy o eglurder mewn canllawiau ynglŷn â defnyddio pwerau penodol drwy'r nodiadau cyngor technegol. Yr ydym am sicrhau bod y system cynllunio defnyddio tir yn gwneud ei

housing, and I am confident that, when we finalise the package of measures, no authority will be able to suggest that it is not adequately equipped to do that.

I will oppose Jocelyn Davies's amendment 2, in which she calls upon us 'to enable local authorities to provide affordable housing in the countryside', because local planning authorities can use rural exception sites adjoining existing rural settlements to provide affordable housing to meet local need. Therefore I do not believe that the amendment is necessary.

Turning to the affordable housing toolkit, which is another key part of the package, it effectively provides a one-stop shop for professionals involved in the provision of affordable housing, and identifies the tools and powers available to them under housing planning and other legislation. It also highlights the most relevant extracts from the guidance that we provide in technical advice notes and in the other documents referred to, and provides examples of good practice from around Wales.

The social housing grant programme is our principal means of intervening directly in the provision of affordable housing. Last summer, I consulted on proposals to improve programme delivery distribution and so on. The consultation paper proposed the establishment of longer-term development programmes with housing associations that were prepared to commit to the principle of working collaboratively to achieve measurable improvements in procurement efficiency. In return, we offered the prospect of assured allocations for up to three years, inviting authorities to submit evidence-based bids that accord with our national policies and priorities for investment.

In 'Delivering Partnerships', we set out how we can implement the proposals in light of the consultation responses. We have begun to implement these changes in distributing the programme for 2005-06, and subsequently for 2006-08. In doing so, we have reasserted the Assembly Government's continuing

rhan yn y gwaith o ddarparu tai fforddiadwy. Ac yr wyf yn hyderus, wrth inni gwblhau'r pecyn o fesurau, na fydd yr un awdurdod yn gallu awgrymu nad oes ganddo adnoddau digonol i wneud hynny.

Byddaf yn gwrthwynebu gwelliant 2 gan Jocelyn Davies, lle mae'n galw arnom i 'alluogi awdurdodau lleol i ddarparu tai fforddiadwy yng nghefn gwlad', oherwydd gall awdurdodau cynllunio lleol ddefnyddio safleoedd eithriedig gwledig sy'n ffinio ag aneddiadau gwledig presennol i ddarparu tai fforddiadwy i ddiwallu anghenion lleol. Felly, nid wyf yn ystyried bod y gwelliant yn angenrheidiol.

I droi at y pecyn cymorth ar dai fforddiadwy, sy'n rhan allweddol arall o'r pecyn, mae'n darparu siop bopeth effeithiol ar gyfer gweithwyr proffesiynol sy'n ymwneud â darparu tai fforddiadwy. Mae hefyd yn nodi'r offer a'r pwerau sydd ar gael iddynt dan ddeddfwriaeth cynllunio tai a deddfwriaeth arall. Mae hefyd yn tynnu sylw at y darnau mwyaf perthnasol o'r canllawiau a ddarparwn mewn nodiadau cyngor technegol ac yn y dogfennau eraill y cyfeiriwyd atynt, ac mae'n darparu enghreifftiau o arfer da ledled Cymru.

Y rhaglen grant tai cymdeithasol yw ein prif ddull o ymyrryd yn uniongyrchol yn y gwaith o ddarparu tai fforddiadwy. Yn ystod yr haf diwethaf, bûm yn ymgynghori ar gynigion i wella dosbarthiad y rhaglenni a ddarperir, ac ati. Cynigiai'r papur ymgynghori sefydlu rhaglenni datblygu tymor hwy gyda chymdeithasau tai a oedd yn barod i ymrwymo i'r egwyddor o weithio ar y cyd i sicrhau gwelliannau mesuradwy mewn effeithlonrwydd caffael. Yn gyfnewid am hynny, bu inni gynnig y posibilrwydd o ddyraniadau sicr am hyd at dair blynedd, gan wahodd awdurdodau i gyflwyno cynigion ar sail tystiolaeth sy'n cyd-fynd â'n polisiau cenedlaethol a'n blaenoriaethau ar gyfer buddsoddi.

Yn 'Delivering Partnerships', yr oeddem yn gosod allan sut y gallwn weithredu'r cynigion yng ngoleuni'r ymatebion i'r ymgynghori. Yr ydym wedi dechrau gweithredu'r newidiadau hyn wrth ddsbarthu'r rhaglen ar gyfer 2005-06, ac wedyn ar gyfer 2006-08. Wrth wneud hynny, yr ydym wedi ailddatgan dibyniaeth

reliance on effective local housing strategies, and the recognition of their leading role in determining local investment priorities. That approach is consistent with the position that I have outlined on planning for housing, and is why I commend the second part of the resolution to you.

Turning to the third part of the motion, we have introduced a number of other measures to ensure that authorities are fully equipped to meet their housing needs. During the budget planning process last year, we decided to progressively increase the resources allocated to the social housing grant programme. This budget will rise from £59.4 million in 2004-05 to £96.4 million in 2007-08. This funding is supplemented by private finance raised by registered social landlords and should be producing an annual investment of about £166 million by 2007. Together with the reforms that I have just referred to, this provides the platform for authorities to provide evidence-based bids for a share in an expanded programme in which they can plan ahead with greater certainty.

On the homebuy scheme, which provides a simple and cost-effective route to home ownership through the provision of an interest-free equity loan, funding is provided from within the SHG budget, and there is no limit on the amount of their bid that authorities can dedicate for providing help. We have been able to allocate in full their bids for the homebuy scheme for the period 2005-06 to 2007-08. We have increased the equity loan available in the scheme to 50 per cent in rural areas, and we have also extended the scheme to enable housing associations to offer the opportunity of home ownership to existing tenants. This does not require the provision of additional funding, and registered social landlords are able to apply covenants to ensure that the property remains available for affordable housing upon its resale, which is quite important.

3.20 p.m.

Right-to-buy and right-to-acquire schemes are enshrined in primary legislation, but we have used the powers available to us to make Orders restricting the right-to-acquire and the

barhaus Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar strategaethau tai lleol effeithiol, ac wedi cydnabod eu rôl arweiniol wrth benderfynu blaenoriaethau buddsoddi lleol. Mae'r ymagwedd honno'n gyson â'r safbwynt a amlinellais ar gynllunio ar gyfer tai, a dyna'r rheswm yr wyf yn cymeradwyo ail ran y cynnig ichi.

I droi at drydedd ran y cynnig, yr ydym wedi cyflwyno nifer o fesurau eraill i sicrhau bod gan awdurdodau yr adnoddau llawn i ddiwallu eu hanghenion tai. Yn ystod proses gynllunio'r gyllideb y llynedd, penderfynasom gynyddu bob yn gam yr adnoddau a ddyrennir i'r rhaglen grant tai cymdeithasol. Bydd y gyllideb hon yn codi o £59.4 miliwn yn 2004-05 i £96.4 miliwn yn 2007-08. Caiff yr arian hwn ei ategu gan gyllid preifat wedi ei godi gan landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig, a dylai fod yn cynhyrchu buddsoddiad blynyddol o ryw £166 miliwn erbyn 2007. Ynghyd â'r diwygiadau yr wyf newydd gyfeirio atynt, mae hyn yn llwyfan i awdurdodau ddarparu cynigion ar sail tystiolaeth ar gyfer cyfran mewn rhaglen wedi ei hymestyn lle gallant gynllunio ymlaen gyda mwy o sicrwydd.

O ran y cynllun cymorth prynu, sy'n ffordd syml a chost-effeithiol i brynu tŷ drwy ddarparu benthyciad ecwiti di-log, darperir arian o'r gyllideb Grant Tai Cymdeithasol, ac nid oes terfyn ar y gyfran yn y cynnig gan awdurdodau y gallant ei neilltuo ar gyfer darparu cymorth. Yr ydy wedi gallu dyrannu eu cynigion yn llawn ar gyfer y cynllun cymorth prynu am y cyfnod 2005-06 i 2007-08. Yr ydym wedi cynyddu'r benthyciad ecwiti sydd ar gael yn y cynllun i 50 y cant mewn ardaloedd gwledig, ac yr ydym hefyd wedi ehangu'r cynllun i alluogi cymdeithasau tai i roi'r cyfle i denantiaid presennol brynu tŷ. Nid yw hyn yn gofyn am ddarparu arian ychwanegol, a gall landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig ddefnyddio cyfamodau i sicrhau bod yr eiddo'n dal ar gael ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy ar ôl ei ailwerthu, sy'n eithaf pwysig.

Mae cynlluniau hawl i brynu a hawl i gael meddiant wedi eu hymgorffori mewn deddfwriaeth sylfaenol. Ond yr ydym wedi defnyddio'r pwerau sydd ar gael inni i wneud

resale of former right-to-buy properties, and we have reduced the maximum discount to £16,000. Recently, we made an Order to give social landlords priority in repurchasing former right-to-buy properties, so that they can be relet to people in housing need. These measures will hopefully help to preserve the stock of affordable housing, particularly in rural areas.

Land costs can amount to around 40 per cent of the cost of building a home. Reducing these costs therefore helps to increase the supply of affordable housing, which is one of the reasons why we issued a general consent which enables local authorities to sell housing land to housing associations at a discount.

We are also looking critically at the Assembly's own estate and the land owned by other public bodies. The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside has set up a pilot project to consider the potential for providing affordable housing on Forestry Commission land. Officials are working closely with planning authorities when planning the reuse of surplus national health service land.

There are other ways in which land costs can be reduced, principally through the use of section 106 agreements and rural exception sites under planning legislation. Together with the advice and good practice identified in the toolkit, the revised technical advice note 2 should strengthen the hands of authorities in planning negotiations and encourage others to bring forward sites specifically for affordable housing.

On rural housing, enablers work with communities to identify housing needs, raise awareness of current and future housing pressures and work with stakeholders to find suitable sites and bring them to fruition. On a pilot basis, I am helping to fund the employment of rural enablers as a result of the positive progress being made in terms of awareness of affordable housing issues. They are also useful at a more practical level.

Gorchmynion i gyfyngu'r hawl i gael meddiant ac ailwerthu eiddo blaenorol a gafwyd drwy hawl i brynu, ac yr ydym wedi gostwng y disgownt mwyaf i £16,000. Yn ddiweddar, gwnaethom Orchymyn i roi blaenoriaeth i landlordiaid cymdeithasol wrth ail-brynu eiddo blaenorol a gafwyd drwy hawl i brynu, er mwyn ailosod yr eiddo i bobl ag anghenion tai. Bydd y mesurau hyn, gobeithio, yn helpu diogelu'r stoc o dai fforddiadwy, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd gwledig.

Gall costau tir fod tua 40 y cant o'r gost o adeiladu tŷ. Mae lleihau'r costau hyn, felly, yn helpu cynyddu'r cyflenwad o dai fforddiadwy, sy'n un o'r rhesymau pam yr ydym wedi rhoi caniatâd cyffredinol sy'n galluogi awdurdodau lleol i werthu tir ar gyfer tai i gymdeithasau tai am bris gostyngol.

Yr ydym hefyd yn rhoi ystyriaeth ddirifol i ystâd y Cynulliad ei hun a'r tir sy'n eiddo i gyrrff cyhoeddus eraill. Mae'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad wedi sefydlu prosiect peilot i ystyried y posibilrwydd o ddarparu tai fforddiadwy ar dir y Comisiwn Coedwigaeth. Mae swyddogion yn gweithio'n agos gydag awdurdodau cynllunio wrth gynllunio'r broses o aildefnyddio tir sydd dros ben gan y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol.

Mae ffyrdd eraill y gellir lleihau costau tir, yn bennaf drwy ddefnyddio cytundebau adran 106 a safleoedd eithriedig gwledig dan ddeddfwriaeth gynllunio. Ynghyd â'r cyngor a'r arfer da a nodir yn y pecyn cymorth, dylai nodyn cyngor technegol 2 atgyfnerthu llais awdurdodau mewn trafodaethau cynllunio, ac annog eraill i gyflwyno safleoedd yn benodol ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy.

O ran tai gwledig, mae galluogwyr yn gweithio gyda chymunedau i nodi anghenion tai, cynyddu ymwybyddiaeth am y pwysau am dai heddiw ac yn y dyfodol, ac i weithio gyda rhanddeiliaid i ddod o hyd i safleoedd addas a gwireddu'r cynlluniau ar eu cyfer. Ar sail peilot, yr wyf yn helpu ariannu'r gwaith o gyflogi galluogwyr gwledig o ganlyniad i'r cynnydd cadarnhaol a wneir i gynyddu ymwybyddiaeth am faterion tai fforddiadwy.



Maent hefyd yn ddefnyddiol ar lefel fwy ymarferol.

To conclude on the motion issues, it is clear that the range of practical measures and the comprehensive package of advice and guidance will support authorities in terms of addressing the need for affordable housing. I commend the motion to you.

I gloi ar faterion y cynnig, mae'n glir y bydd yr ystod o fesurau ymarferol a'r pecyn cynhwysfawr o gyngor a chanllawiau yn cynorthwyo awdurdodau i fynd i'r afael â'r angen am dai fforddiadwy. Cymeradwyaf y cynnig ichi.

Turning to the amendments, my advice would be to oppose amendment 3, because our strategy is being rolled out through packages that I recently consulted upon and the increased resources for the social housing grant. On amendment 4, the right-to-buy scheme has reduced—and I agree with this—the stock of social housing for rent. However, we have used the powers available to us to try to do something, and, as many Members know, I have also made the appropriate representations to the UK Government on the right-to-buy scheme.

I droi at y gwelliannau, fy nghyngor i fyddai gwrthwynebu gwelliant 3, oherwydd bod ein strategaeth yn cael ei chyflwyno drwy becynnau yr wyf wedi bod yn ymgynghori arnynt yn ddiweddar a'r cynnydd mewn adnoddau ar gyfer y grant tai cymdeithasol. O ran gwelliant 4, mae'r cynllun hawl i brynu wedi lleihau—a chytunaf â hynny—y cyflenwad tai cymdeithasol i'w rhentu. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wedi defnyddio'r pwerau sydd ar gael inni i geisio gwneud rhywbeth, ac fel y gŵyr nifer o Aelodau, yr wyf hefyd wedi cyflwyno'r sylwadau priodol i Lywodraeth y DU am y cynllun hawl i brynu.

On amendment 7, a new use class is not practical due to the considerable difficulties in defining second and holiday homes, and enforcing such control. That is the issue which concerns me in terms of the amendment. On amendment 8, we have a commitment to achieve a housing condition standard which is appropriate for the twenty-first century. The means by which authorities are able to generate resources for this are constrained by the public sector borrowing rules, which are not within the Assembly Government's control; they are within the Westminster Government's control. As Members know, I have produced extensive correspondence on issues about the way in which we could deal with this particular issue, which has not been favourably looked upon elsewhere.

O ran gwelliant 7, nid yw dosbarth defnydd newydd yn ymarferol oherwydd yr anawsterau sylweddol wrth ddiffinio ail gartrefi a chartrefi gwyliau, a gorfodi rheolaeth o'r fath. Dyna'r mater sy'n achosi pryder i mi yn y gwelliant. O ran gwelliant 8, yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau safon cyflwr tai sy'n briodol ar gyfer yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Caiff y ffordd y gall awdurdodau gynhyrchu adnoddau ar gyfer hyn ei chyfyngu gan reolau benthyca'r sector cyhoeddus, ac nid yw'r rheini dan reolaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad; maent dan reolaeth Llywodraeth San Steffan. Fel y gŵyr Aelodau, yr wyf wedi gohebu'n helaeth ar faterion ynglŷn â'r ffordd y gallem ddelio â'r mater penodol hwn, ac ni chafwyd ymateb ffafriol i hynny mewn manau eraill.

We are pleased to support amendments 9, 10 and 11 tabled by the Liberal Democrats.

Mae'n bleser gennym gefnogi gwelliannau 9, 10 ac 11 a gyflwynwyd gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol.

On amendment 12, as I stated in my speech, we are significantly increasing the resources available for affordable housing. During the budget debate, no-one seemed to want to increase this budget line, so I will oppose that amendment. Amendment 13 talks of noting

O ran gwelliant 12, fel y dywedais yn fy araith, yr ydym yn cynyddu'n sylweddol yr adnoddau sydd ar gael ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy. Yn ystod y drafodaeth ar y gyllideb, nid oedd yn ymddangos bod neb am gynyddu'r llinell wariant hon. Felly, yr wyf

this issue, but our policy has not been compromised in any way in my portfolio. Our policies are moving forward very well, and the people of Wales recognise that.

On amendment 14, the advice, guidance and the practical measures are good for Welsh-speaking communities. We understand the language of Welsh-speaking communities and what they require and the problems in rural areas quite well, so I will also oppose that amendment. I might have opposed it on the basis that there was an issue about a split infinitive, but David Melding tells me that that is now old hat in terms of grammar.

**Leanne Wood:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 1: delete point 1 and insert as a new point 1:

*expresses concern at the difficulties facing a growing number of people in accessing the housing market across Wales;*

I propose amendment 2. In point 2 insert after 'circumstances':

*, and calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to enable local authorities to provide affordable housing in the countryside, in addition to affordable housing in towns and villages;*

I propose amendment 3. Delete point 3 and insert as new point 3:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to develop an affordable housing strategy for Wales, while acknowledging that the lack of powers hinders the ability of the National Assembly for Wales to fully address the housing crisis in Wales;*

I propose amendment 4. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*acknowledges that New Labour's continuation of the Conservatives' right-to-buy policies has resulted in the depletion of some of Wales's best social housing stock*

yn gwrthwynebu'r gwelliant hwnnw. Mae Gwelliant 13 yn sôn am nodi'r mater hwn, ond nid yw ein polisi wedi ei beryglu mewn unrhyw ffordd yn fy mhortffolio. Mae ein polisiau yn mynd rhagddynt yn dda iawn, ac mae pobl Cymru yn cydnabod hynny.

O ran gwelliant 14, mae'r cyngor, y canllawiau a'r mesurau ymarferol yn dda i gymunedau Cymraeg eu hiaith. Yr ydym yn deall yn iawn iaith cymunedau Cymraeg a'r hyn y mae ei angen arnynt a'r problemau mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Felly, yr wyf yn gwrthwynebu'r gwelliant hwnnw hefyd. Gallwn fod wedi ei wrthwynebu ar y sail bod problem ynglŷn â berfenw hollt yn y Saesneg, ond dywed David Melding wrthyf fod hynny bellach yn hen hanes o ran gramadeg.

**Leanne Wood:** Cynigïaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 1: dileu pwynt 1 a chynnwys fel pwynt 1 newydd:

*yn mynegi pryder ynghylch y trafferthion a wynebir gan nifer cynyddol o bobl i gael mynediad i'r farchnad dai ledled Cymru;*

Cynigïaf welliant 2. Ym mhwynt 2, cynnwys ar ôl 'amgylchiadau lleol':

*ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i alluogi awdurdodau lleol i ddarparu tai fforddiadwy yng nghefn gwlad, yn ogystal â thai fforddiadwy mewn trefi a phentrefi;*

Cynigïaf welliant 3. Dileu pwynt 3 a chynnwys fel pwynt 3 newydd:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ddatblygu strategaeth tai fforddiadwy i Gymru, gan gydnabod bod diffyg pwerau'n rhwystro gallu Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru i roi sylw llawn i'r argyfwng tai yng Nghymru;*

Cynigïaf welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn cydnabod bod parhad Llafur Newydd o bolisiau'r Ceidwadwyr ar hawl i brynu wedi golygu disbyddu rhywfaint o stoc tai cymdeithasol gorau Cymru, ac mai dyma un*

*and is one of the main factors in the current housing crisis and rising levels of homelessness.*

I propose amendment 5. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*deplores New Labour's support for the new pension funds, self-invested personal pensions (SIPPs), which will enable the wealthy to own and profit from second homes ownership in Wales while many people in Wales are living in unfit accommodation or spending an increasing amount of their income on housing.*

I propose amendment 6. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to make representations to the UK Government for properties in Wales to be excluded from SIPPs.*

I propose amendment 7. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*instructs the Welsh Assembly Government to introduce a new planning class for second homes, allowing local authorities to manage the level of second homes where high numbers would lead to social problems.*

I propose amendment 8. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*regrets that the Welsh Assembly Government's housing policy forces many local authorities into making housing stock transfer decisions.*

We in Plaid Cymru have amended the Government motion because many of the latest housing studies and statistics show that we now have the biggest housing challenges that Wales has faced for a long time, and our view is that this Government has not got to grips with that. I am grateful that the Minister has said that she is prepared to support our amendment 1, but even with that amendment, my view is that the motion is still not good enough.

*o'r prif ffactorau yn yr argyfwng tai presennol a'r lefelau cynyddol o ddigartrefedd.*

Cynigiaf welliant 5. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn gresynu at gefnogaeth Llafur Newydd i'r cronfeydd pensiwn newydd, pensiynau personol hunan-fuddsoddi (SIPPS), a fydd yn galluogi'r cyfoethog i fod yn berchen ar ail-gartrefi yng Nghymru ac elwa ohonynt tra mae nifer o bobl yng Nghymru yn byw mewn tai anaddas neu'n gwario cyfran gynyddol o'u hincwm ar dai.*

Cynigiaf welliant 6. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gyflwyno sylwadau i Lywodraeth y DU i eiddo yng Nghymru gael eu heithrio o SIPPS.*

Cynigiaf welliant 7. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn cyfarwyddo Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gyflwyno dosbarth cynllunio newydd ar gyfer ail gartrefi, gan ganiatáu i awdurdodau lleol reoli lefelau ail gartrefi lle byddai niferoedd uchel yn arwain at broblemau cymdeithasol.*

Cynigiaf welliant 8. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn gresynu bod polisi tai newydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gorfodi nifer o awdurdodau lleol i wneud penderfyniadau i drosglwyddo'u stoc tai.*

Yr ydym ni ym Mhlaid Cymru wedi diwygio cynnig y Llywodraeth oherwydd bod nifer llawer o'r astudiaethau a'r ystadegau tai diweddaraf yn dangos ein bod yn wynebu'r heriau tai mwyaf y mae Cymru wedi'u hwynebu ers amser hir, ac yn ein barn ni nid yw'r Llywodraeth hon wedi mynd i'r afael â hynny. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar bod y Gweinidog wedi dweud ei bod yn barod i gefnogi ein gwelliant 1. Ond hyd yn oed gyda'r gwelliant hwnnw, credaf nad yw'r cynnig yn ddigon da o hyd.

Every new study that we see shows that the problems in housing are getting worse as time goes on. More and more people are finding it impossible to buy their own home. The Joseph Rowntree Foundation estimates that one fifth of households of those aged 40 and under cannot buy and are not eligible for housing benefit. The average house price in many Welsh towns is now more than seven times the national average salary. Shelter undertook a recent survey, which found that nearly three quarters of the children in the families that they surveyed had to sleep in the same room as their parents and, in 17 per cent of cases, children were forced to sleep in lounges, dining rooms or kitchens because of a lack of space. According to the Chartered Institute of Housing Cymru, nearly one in 10 people live in houses that are not fit for habitation. Social housing is so scarce that one person presents themselves as homeless in Wales every six minutes.

Between 1997 and 2003, Welsh councils reported a 100 per cent increase in homeless acceptances, with a 215 per cent increase in temporary accommodation and a 500 per cent increase in bed and breakfast accommodation. These problems are partly caused, and definitely compounded, by the 1980 right-to-buy legislation. Under Welsh Labour, 22,667 council houses were sold off between 1999 and 2003. The cumulative total of all sales amounts to 45 per cent of the total local authority and town stock. Labour's 2003 manifesto said that it would suspend the right to buy in areas where there is housing pressure. It would be interesting to know what progress has been made on that.

All of this has an impact on communities where Welsh is a living community language. The language is under threat in those pretty, rural, coastal areas because of house-price inflation and the selling off of council housing, and there is now the threat of self-invested personal pensions, where the wealthy will be able to get tax breaks if they invest in property for their pensions. This Government's response to the fact that the language is in decline has been to bury its head in the sand. Cymdeithas yr Iaith

Dengys pob astudiaeth newydd a welwn fod y problemau tai yn gwaethygu wrth i'r amser fynd ymlaen. Mae mwy a mwy o bobl yn ei chael yn amhosibl prynu eu cartref eu hunain. Mae Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree yn amcangyfrif bod un rhan o bump o aelwydydd sy'n cynnwys pobl 40 oed ac iau yn methu prynu eu cartref eu hunain ac nad ydynt yn gymwys i gael budd-dal tai. Mae pris tŷ ar gyfartaledd mewn nifer o drefi yng Nghymru yn awr dros saith gwaith y cyflog cenedlaethol ar gyfartaledd. Gwnaeth Shelter arolwg yn ddiweddar a ddarganfu fod bron i dri chwarter y plant yn y teuluoedd a arolygwyd yn gorfod cysgu yn yr un ystafell â'u rhieni, ac mewn 17 y cant o achosion, yr oedd plant yn gorfod cysgu mewn lolfeydd, ystafelloedd bwyta neu geginau oherwydd prinder lle. Yn ôl Sefydliad Tai Siartredig Cymru, mae bron un person o bob deg yn byw mewn tŷ sy'n anaddas i bobl fyw ynddo. Mae tai cymdeithasol mor brin nes bydd un person yn cyflwyno'i hun fel person digartref yng Nghymru bob chwe munud.

Rhwng 1997 a 2003, soniodd cynghorau yng Nghymru am gynnydd o 100 y cant yn nifer y rhai a dderbyniwyd fel pobl ddigartref, a chynnydd o 215 y cant mewn llety dros dro a chynnydd o 500 y cant mewn llety gwely a brecwast. Caiff y problemau hyn eu hachosi'n rhannol, a'u gwaethygu'n sicr, gan ddeddfwriaeth hawl i brynu 1980. Dan y Blaid Lafur yng Nghymru, gwerthwyd 22,667 o dai cyngor rhwng 1999 a 2003. Mae cyfanswm cronol pob gwerthiant yn cyfateb i 45 y cant o gyfanswm y stoc awdurdodau lleol a threfi. Dywedai maniffesto'r Blaid Lafur yn 2003 y byddai'n atal yr hawl i brynu mewn ardaloedd lle mae pwysau tai. Byddai'n ddiddorol gwybod pa gynnydd a wnaed ar hynny.

Mae hyn i gyd yn effeithio ar gymunedau lle mae'r Gymraeg yn iaith gymunedol fyw. Mae'r iaith dan fygythiad yn yr ardaloedd hardd, gwledig ac arfordirol hynny oherwydd chwyddiant mewn prisiau tai a'r broses o werthu tai cyngor. Ac erbyn hyn mae bygythiad pensiynau personol hunan-fuddsoddi, lle bydd y cyfoethog yn gallu cael saib rhag talu treth os byddant yn buddsoddi mewn eiddo ar gyfer eu pensiynau. Ymateb y Llywodraeth hon i'r ffaith fod yr iaith yn dirywio yw anwybyddu'r sefyllfa.

Gymraeg presented a petition to the Assembly Government today calling for a property Act for Wales. It is asking for a Wales-wide strategic approach to the issue of affordable housing. It has some excellent ideas and I implore the Minister to give those ideas serious consideration.

We face many problems now and will face many in the future as a result of the political decisions that have been made in the past. Just as you thought things could not get any worse, because of New Labour's commitment to the principles of privatisation, more and more local authorities are being forced to sell off the few council houses that they have left.

The experience in England so far has taught us that homeless people are not being adequately considered in these stock transfer processes. We desperately need political will to address the housing problems facing Wales. We need to be more creative in our thinking and, frankly, we need a huge amount of cash. Just think what we could do with the Barnett share of the billions of pounds that have been spent on the illegal war in Iraq, the billions that are to be spent on identity cards and the estimated £20 billion that it will cost to replace Trident. How many homes could be built with our share of that expenditure? There is greater political will to kill people than there is to provide homes for people.

I am glad that the Minister has welcomed the consideration of land ownership. If we are to meet housing need, we have to build more houses. The amount of land available to public authorities is limited. Yet the Crown, various aristocrats and the Duchy of Cornwall own huge swathes of land in this country. They owe a huge amount to the people of Wales for their wealth. Is it not now time that they paid back?

*Daeth y Diprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.30 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.30 p.m.*

If small parts of these estates could be given up for small-scale housing projects, they

Cyflwynodd Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg ddeiseb i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad heddiw yn galw am Ddeddf eiddo i Gymru. Mae'n gofyn am ymagwedd strategol ledled Cymru at fater tai fforddiadwy. Mae ganddi rai syniadau ardderchog, ac ymbiliaf ar y Gweinidog i roi ystyriaeth ddifrifol i'r syniadau hynny.

Yr ydym yn wynebu nifer o broblemau yn awr a byddwn yn wynebu nifer yn y dyfodol o ganlyniad i'r penderfyniadau gwleidyddol a wnaed yn y gorffennol. Pan oeddech yn meddwl na allai pethau fod yn waeth, oherwydd ymrwymiad Llafur Newydd i egwyddorion preifateiddio, mae mwy a mwy o awdurdodau lleol yn cael eu gorfodi i werthu'r ychydig dai cyngor sydd ganddynt ar ôl.

Mae'r profiad yn Lloegr hyd yma wedi dangos inni nad yw pobl ddigartref yn cael ystyriaeth ddigonol yn y prosesau trosglwyddo stoc hyn. Mae arnom angen dybryd am ewyllys wleidyddol i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau tai sy'n wynebu Cymru. Mae angen inni feddwl yn fwy creadigol, ac i ddweud y gwir mae arnom angen llawer iawn o arian. Meddyliwch beth y gallem ei wneud â chyfran Barnett o'r biliynau o bunnoedd a wariwyd ar y rhyfel anghyfreithlon yn Irac, y biliynau a gaiff eu gwario ar gardiau adnabod, a'r amcangyfrif o £20 biliwn y bydd cael system yn lle Trident yn ei gostio. Faint o dai y gellid eu hadeiladu â'n cyfran ni o'r gwariant hwnnw? Mae mwy o ewyllys gwleidyddol i ladd pobl nag i ddarparu cartrefi i bobl.

Yr wyf yn falch fod y Gweinidog wedi croesawu'r ystyriaeth o berchnogaeth tir. Os ydym i ddiwallu anghenion tai, rhaid inni adeiladu mwy o dai. Mae faint o dir sydd ar gael i awdurdodau cyhoeddus yn gyfyngedig. Eto mae'r Goron, amryw aristocratiaid a Dugaeth Cernyw yn meddu ar ddarnau enfawr o dir yn y wlad hon. Mae arnynt swm enfawr i bobl Cymru am eu cyfoeth. Onid yw'n bryd iddynt ei dalu'n ôl?

Pe gellid defnyddio rhannau bach o'r ystadau hyn ar gyfer prosiectau tai ar raddfa fach,

could make a great contribution to the solution to the Welsh housing crisis. Tinkering around the edges on housing will not solve the huge problems that we face, not to mention the even bigger problems that we are storing up for the future. Now is the time to be bold. We need bold thinking and big spending. The alternative is unprecedented homelessness, which would be a disaster for the vulnerable people in our communities.

**Mick Bates:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 9: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to encourage and promote the formation of community housing trusts.*

I propose amendment 10. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls for restrictions on the right to buy in areas of high demand.*

I propose amendment 11. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Assembly Government to support and encourage local planning authorities in engendering greater flexibility for different affordable housing planning policies to be developed.*

I start by saying that I think that every political party agrees that the right to have decent housing or rental property at an affordable price is a basic right that we all wish to promote. While I agree with a lot of what Leanne said, the throw-away rhetoric and the analogy about war and building houses are not necessary in this context. Edwina Hart has worked with people in order to ensure that there is more affordable property in Wales. As I develop my rationale in commenting on the amendments, I hope that it is clear, from the rhetoric that we have heard today, that we need a bit more action, and I will expand on that later.

There was no clear definition of 'affordability' in the Minister's opening

gallent wneud cyfraniad mawr i'r ateb i argyfwng tai Cymru. Ni fydd mân newidiadau o ran tai yn datrys y problemau anferthol a wynebwn, heb sôn am y problemau mwy byth sy'n crynhoi i'r dyfodol. Dyma'r amser i fod yn feiddgar. Mae angen inni feddwl yn feiddgar a gwario'n helaeth. Y dewis arall yw nifer na welwyd erioed o'r blaen o bobl ddigartref, a fyddai'n drychinebus i'r bobl ddiameddifyn yn ein cymunedau.

**Mick Bates:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 9: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i annog a hyrwyddo creu ymddiriedolaethau tai cymunedol.*

Cynigiau welliant 10. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw am gyfyngiadau ar yr hawl i brynu mewn ardaloedd lle mae galw mawr.*

Cynigiau welliant 11. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gefnogi ac annog awdurdodau cynllunio lleol i greu mwy o hyblygrwydd ar gyfer datblygu gwahanol bolisiau cynllunio ar dai fforddiadwy.*

Dechreuaf drwy ddweud bod pob plaid wleidyddol, yn fy marn i, yn cytuno bod yr hawl i gael tai neu eiddo addas ar rent am bris fforddiadwy yn hawl sylfaenol yr ydym oll yn dymuno ei hyrwyddo. Er fy mod yn cytuno â llawer o'r hyn a ddywedodd Leanne, nid oes angen y rhethreg wag a'r gyfatebiaeth ynghylch rhyfel ac adeiladu tai yn y cyddestun hwn. Mae Edwina Hart wedi gweithio gyda phobl i sicrhau bod mwy o eiddo fforddiadwy yng Nghymru. Wrth imi ddatblygu fy rhesymeg wrth roi sylwadau ar y gwelliannau, gobeithio ei bod yn amlwg, o'r rhethreg a glywsom heddiw, fod angen ychydig mwy o weithredu arnom, ac ymhelaethaf ar hynny yn nes ymlaen.

Nid oedd diffiniad clir o 'fod yn fforddiadwy' yn araith agoriadol y

address. I understand the difficulties in that regard, but National Statistics information is available today to give us average local incomes and house prices, which makes it possible, through the planning system, to say how much an affordable house costs in a certain area. I believe that it can be as simple as that. There are many complex formulae, but if we took a high-street multiplier—and I am sure that my colleague, Mark Isherwood, will tell you that four is sufficient today—we can find out what the average income is in an area and therefore say what an affordable price for a home is. We have to move in that direction.

The Minister said that the Barker report did not have much relevance to Wales. However, I believe that it does, because one of its key features refers to working with builders in order to build affordable housing. One of the difficulties that we have today is that, as far as I can see, builders have been excluded from the debate about affordability. There is a need to engage with builders in the private sector to ensure that affordable properties are built. We all have figures from our own areas that we can use. This would have a good multiplier effect, because if you get local builders building at an affordable price, say £60,000, it is good for the local economy.

The issue of planning and housing is often overlooked. While the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee has undertaken a review of sustainable communities and the concept of affordable housing, there still needs to be a greater understanding of housing needs and the way in which the planning system can meet them.

You commented on the social housing grant, Minister, and we need to bring greater clarity to the budgeting process in that regard. As you know—and I see you smiling already—I have long argued, for the sake of transparency and our scrutiny of your homebuy scheme, that there should be a separate budgetary line for homebuy. There are issues in terms of the scheme because, while we all accept that it is a good scheme,

Gweinidog. Gallaf ddeall yr anawsterau yn hynny o beth, ond mae gwybodaeth yr Ystadegau Gwladol ar gael heddiw i roi incymau a phrisiau tai lleol cyfartalog i ni, sy'n ein galluogi, drwy'r system gynllunio, i ddweud faint y mae tŷ fforddiadwy yn ei gostio mewn ardal benodol. Credaf y gall fod mor syml â hynny. Mae yna sawl fformwla gymhleth, ond os defnyddiwn luosydd y stryd fawr—ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd fy nghyd-Aelod, Mark Isherwood, yn dweud wrthyfch fod pedwar yn ddigonol heddiw—gallwn weld beth yw incwm cyfartalog mewn ardal, a dweud felly beth yw pris y gellir ei fforddio am gartref. Rhaid inni symud i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw.

Dywedodd y Gweinidog nad oedd adroddiad Barker yn berthnasol iawn i Gymru. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf fi o'r farn ei fod yn berthnasol, am fod un o'i nodweddion allweddol yn cyfeirio at weithio gydag adeiladwyr er mwyn adeiladu tai fforddiadwy. Un o'r anawsterau a wynebwn heddiw yw nad yw adeiladwyr, hyd y gwelaf fi, wedi eu cynnwys yn y ddadl am fod yn fforddiadwy. Mae angen ymgysylltu ag adeiladwyr yn y sector preifat i sicrhau bod eiddo fforddiadwy yn cael ei adeiladu. Mae gan bob un ohonom ffigurau o'n hardaloedd ein hunain y gallwn eu defnyddio. Byddai hyn yn cael effaith luosogi dda, oherwydd os bydd adeiladwyr lleol yn adeiladu am bris fforddiadwy, dyweder £60,000, mae o fudd i'r economi leol.

Mae mater cynllunio a thai yn cael ei anwybyddu'n aml. Er bod Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad wedi gwneud adolygiad o gymunedau cynaliadwy a'r cysyniad o dai fforddiadwy, mae angen mwy o ddealltwriaeth o hyd o anghenion tai a'r modd y gall y system gynllunio eu diwallu.

Yr oeddech yn sôn am y grant tai cymdeithasol, Weinidog, ac mae angen i'r broses gyllidebu fod yn gliriach ynglŷn â hynny. Fel y gwyddoch—a gwelaf eich bod yn gwenu eisoes—yr wyf wedi dadlau ers amser maith, er mwyn bod yn eglur ac er mwyn craffu ar eich cynllun cymorth prynu, y dylai fod llinell gyllidebol ar wahân ar gyfer cymorth prynu. Mae yna broblemau o ran y cynllun oherwydd, er ein bod oll yn

it causes a problem for local authorities. Their budgets are under enough pressure, and when they come to allocate social housing grants, the homebuy budget is quite a low priority. If, in your wisdom, you could see to include this as a separate line, I am sure that it would be a helpful mechanism to local authorities and those who wish to buy a home.

I am pleased that you support our amendments. However, I want to state briefly why it is important that community land trusts are encouraged. They have a role to play, but they are not the total solution. As we know, in terms of the planning system, housing departments need to work together. I would urge that we move beyond the statement that you made about the fact that the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside has set up a working party. He set that up nearly two years ago. In my own constituency of Montgomeryshire, there is a site at Ceinws where people have undertaken the local housing needs assessment and want to build houses. However, the lack of progress by your Government is preventing that. It is time that we moved quicker to provide these solutions.

I am pleased that you accept the right to buy, and I hope that, in your final remarks, you will say exactly what stage you are at with your Government in Westminster in order to provide that flexibility. So many local authorities are strapped for cash and do not have the houses, but want that flexibility to give houses to people in desperate need.

Finally, on the planning issues, the exceptions rule is an important process in terms of allowing people who want to build their own houses to have sites. I would put that forward because the environmental standards that self-build housing conforms to are generally high.

**Mark Isherwood:** I propose the following amendments in the name of David Melding. Amendment 12: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

derbyn ei fod yn gynllun da, mae'n peri problem i awdurdodau lleol. Mae digon o bwysau ar eu cyllidebau, a phan fyddant yn dyrannu grantiau tai cymdeithasol, mae'r gyllideb cymorth prynu yn flaenoriaeth gymharol isel. Pe gallech, yn eich doethineb, gynnwys hyn fel llinell ar wahân, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'n ddull defnyddiol i awdurdodau lleol a'r rheini sydd am brynu cartref.

Yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn cefnogi ein gwelliannau. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn nodi'n gyflym pam y mae'n bwysig annog ymddiriedolaethau tir cymunedol. Mae ganddynt rôl i'w chwarae, ond nid dyna'r ateb i gyd. Fel y gwyddom, o ran y system gynllunio mae angen i adrannau tai weithio gyda'i gilydd. Byddwn yn ein hannog i symud y tu hwnt i'r datganiad a wnaethoch am y ffaith bod y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad wedi sefydlu gweithgor. Sefydlodd y gweithgor hwnnw bron ddwy flynedd yn ôl. Yn fy etholaeth i, sef sir Drefaldwyn, mae yna safle yng Ngheinws lle mae pobl wedi gwneud asesiad o'r angen lleol am dai ac yn awyddus i adeiladu tai. Fodd bynnag, mae diffyg cynnydd gan eich Llywodraeth chi yn rhwystro hynny. Mae'n bryd inni symud yn gyflymach i ddarparu'r atebion hyn.

Yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn derbyn yr hawl i brynu, a gobeithio y byddwch, yn eich sylwadau terfynol, yn dweud yn union ble yr ydych wedi cyrraedd gyda'ch Llywodraeth yn San Steffan er mwyn rhoi'r hyblygrwydd hwnnw. Mae arian yn brin mewn cynifer o awdurdodau lleol ac nid oes ganddynt y tai, ond maent am gael yr hyblygrwydd hwnnw i roi tai i bobl y mae arnynt angen dybryd amdanynt.

Yn olaf, ar y materion cynllunio, mae'r rheol eithriadau yn broses bwysig i ganiatáu i bobl sydd am adeiladu eu tai eu hunain gael safleoedd. Byddwn yn cynnig hynny am fod y safonau amgylcheddol y mae tai hunan-adeiladu yn cydymffurfio â hwy yn uchel ar y cyfan.

**Mark Isherwood:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw David Melding. Gwelliant 12: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:



*believes that the current housing crisis has been aggravated by the Welsh Assembly Government's policy to reduce the level of resources available for affordable housing.*

I propose amendment 13. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*notes that the Welsh Assembly Government's social justice and regeneration policies have been compromised by the housing crisis.*

I propose amendment 14. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*regrets the failure of the Welsh Assembly Government to properly recognise the deleterious affect the housing crisis is having on many Welsh-speaking communities.*

We welcome the opportunity to debate affordable housing in this Assembly today, but condemn the Welsh Assembly Government for the complacency it has shown by not prioritising this debate sooner and by the offensive, inaccurate and buck-passing nature of its motion today.

This debate should be entitled 'a debate on the crisis in affordable housing in Wales'. However, we should not expect any better from a Labour Welsh Assembly Government, which appears to be the only body involved in Welsh housing that is not describing the current situation as a crisis. It is for that reason that I propose amendments 12, 13 and 14.

In the topsy-turvy, smoke-and-mirrors world of this discredited Labour administration, less is described as more and more as less. To Labour, less is more when it has imposed massive cuts on affordable housing as homelessness, housing waiting lists and house prices have been increasing.

To Labour, less is more when it cuts the Welsh social housing grant programme by 45 per cent, from £174 million in 1996-97 to just £96 million last year. To Labour, less is more when, even with Labour's planned budget increases over the next three years, about which the Minister constantly boasts, the

*yn credu bod yr argyfwng tai presennol wedi'i waethygu gan bolisi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ostwng lefel yr adnoddau sydd ar gael ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy.*

Cynigiau welliant 13. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn nodi bod polisiau cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac adfywio Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi'u peryglu gan yr argyfwng tai.*

Cynigiau welliant 14. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn gresynu at fethiant Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gydnabod effaith niweidiol yr argyfwng tai ar lawer cymuned Gymraeg ei hiaith.*

Croesawn y cyfle i drafod tai fforddiadwy yn y Cynulliad heddiw, ond condemniwn Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru am ei hunanfodhad o beidio â rhoi blaenoriaeth i'r ddadl hon ynghynt, a thrwy natur sarhaus ac anghywir ei chynnig heddiw, sy'n rhoi'r baich ar rywun arall.

Dylid galw'r ddadl hon yn 'ddadl ar yr argyfwng tai fforddiadwy yng Nghymru'. Fodd bynnag, ni ddylem ddisgwyl gwell gan Lywodraeth Lafur Cynulliad Cymru, sef yr unig gorff, yn ôl pob tebyg, sy'n gysylltiedig â thair yng Nghymru ac nad yw'n disgrifio'r sefyllfa bresennol fel argyfwng. Am y rheswm hwnnw, felly, cynigiau welliannau 12, 13 a 14.

Ym myd anghyson a thwyllodrus y weinyddiaeth Lafur hon sydd mewn anfri, caiff llai ei ddisgrifio fel mwy, a mwy ei ddisgrifio fel llai. I'r blaid Lafur, mae llai yn fwy pan fydd wedi gosod toriadau enfawr ar dai fforddiadwy wrth i ddigartrefedd, rhestrau aros am dai a phrisiau tai gynyddu.

I'r blaid Lafur, mae llai yn fwy pan fydd yn torri rhaglen grant tai cymdeithasol Cymru 45 y cant, o £174 miliwn yn 1996-97 i ddim ond £96 miliwn y llynedd. I'r blaid Lafur, hyd yn oed pan fydd cyllideb arfaethedig Llafur yn cynyddu yn ystod y tair blynedd nesaf, ac mae'r Gweinidog yn ymffrostio yn hyn yn

social housing grant will still be less in absolute terms and massively less in real terms than it was 10 years earlier—*[Laughter.]* Ann Jones can laugh as much as she wants, but she should check the facts.

To Labour, less is more when the overall level of funding for social housing in Wales is significantly lower than the levels in Scotland and England. To Labour, less is more when the number of first-time buyers in Wales has fallen by 50 per cent since 2001.

To Labour, less is more when the number of new affordable houses built in Wales fell by over 11,000 to just 3,183 during the first four years of devolution as compared with the last four years of the Conservative Government. To Labour, less is more when just 376 affordable houses were completed in north Wales, particularly given that housing waiting lists in north Wales now exceed 20,000.

To Labour, less is more when the number of homebuy, low-cost home ownership purchases in Wales has fallen by two thirds since devolution. To Labour, less is more when the Welsh Assembly Government dictates housing allocation policy to local authorities without providing the resources to deliver it.

To Labour, less is more when the shortage of affordable rural housing is putting new businesses off from settling, and forcing young people to leave as rural depopulation gathers pace, in traditional Welsh-speaking communities. To Labour, less is more when, for all its glossy, unfunded affordable housing toolkits, it has still failed, after all these years, to update low-cost home ownership schemes to match current market conditions.

To Labour, of course, when less is not more, then more must be less. To Labour, more is less when housing waiting lists across Wales have risen 50 per cent over the last year alone and are projected to exceed a scandalous 100,000 in a total population of less than 3

gyson, mae llai yn fwy pan fydd y grant tai cymdeithasol yn parhau i fod yn llai mewn termau absoliwt ac yn sylweddol lai mewn termau gwirioneddol nag yr oedd 10 mlynedd yn gynt—*[Chwerthin.]* Gall Ann Jones chwerthin gymaint ag a fydd, ond dylai gadarnhau'r ffeithiau.

I'r blaid Lafur, mae llai yn fwy pan fydd lefel gyffredinol yr arian ar gyfer tai cymdeithasol yng Nghymru yn sylweddol is na'r lefelau yn yr Alban a Lloegr. I'r blaid Lafur, mae llai yn fwy pan fo nifer y rhai sy'n prynu cartref am y tro cyntaf yng Nghymru wedi gostwng 50 y cant er 2001.

I'r blaid Lafur, mae llai yn fwy fo nifer y tai fforddiadwy newydd a adeiladwyd yng Nghymru wedi gostwng o fwy nag 11,000 i ddim ond 3,183 yn ystod pedair blynedd cyntaf datganoli, o'u cymharu â phedair blynedd olaf y Llywodraeth Geidwadol. I'r blaid Lafur, mae llai yn fwy pan gwblhawyd dim ond 376 o dai fforddiadwy yn y gogledd, yn arbennig o gofio bod rhestrau aros yn y gogledd bellach yn uwch nag 20,000.

I'r blaid Lafur, mae llai yn fwy pan fydd nifer y pryniannau perchentyaeth cost isel dan y cynllun cymorth prynu yng Nghymru wedi gostwng dwy ran o dair ers datganoli. I'r blaid Lafur, mae llai yn fwy pan fydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn pennu polisi dyrannu tai i awdurdodau lleol heb roi'r adnoddau i gyflawni hynny.

I'r blaid Lafur, mae llai yn fwy pan fydd y prinder tai gwledig fforddiadwy yn annog busnesau newydd i beidio ag ymsefydlu, ac yn gorfodi pobl ifanc i adael wrth i ddiboblogi gwledig waethygu, mewn cymunedau Cymraeg traddodiadol. I'r blaid Lafur, mae llai yn fwy pan yw wedi methu eto, er ei holl becynnau offer tai fforddiadwy gloyw heb eu hariannu, ac ar ôl yr holl flynyddoedd hyn, â diweddarau cynlluniau perchentyaeth cost isel i gyd-fynd ag amodau'r farchnad gyfredol.

I'r blaid Lafur, wrth gwrs, pan nad yw llai yn fwy, yna rhaid bod mwy yn llai. I'r blaid Lafur, mae mwy yn llai pan fydd rhestrau aros am dai ledled Cymru wedi codi 50 y cant yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf yn unig, a phan ddisgwylir iddynt fod yn fwy na

million.

To Labour, more is less when 8.5 per cent of Welsh housing stock in home ownership is now classified as unfit, impacting on people's health and wellbeing. To Labour, more is less when some 72 per cent of Welsh properties now officially designated as unfit are owner-occupied, and are one in two of the poorest households, and three in five pensioners live in their own homes.

To Labour, more is less when the backlog of urgent repair work to Welsh social housing has now passed £3 billion. To Labour, more is less when the backlog of urgent repair work to Welsh private housing has now exceeded £1 billion.

To Labour, more is less when, according to Shelter, 98,000 Welsh properties are unfit for human habitation. To Labour, more is less when priority homelessness in Wales more than doubled between 1997 and the end of last year. Again, those are Shelter figures, Ann. To Labour, more is less when housing repossessions are on the increase again.

This Welsh Assembly Government has failed to appreciate that housing is one of the key pillars of social justice and that its failure to prioritise this alongside health and education has betrayed a whole generation of Welsh people.

**Leanne Wood:** You claim to be concerned about rising levels of homelessness, but your party's policy is to continue with the right to buy legislation and, in fact, extend that to sell off housing association properties. How do you marry those two issues, Mark?

3.40 p.m.

**Mark Isherwood:** I will get to that shortly, but I will just say that independent evidence shows that if we restricted the right to buy now it would have little or no impact on the current supply of affordable housing, and

100,000 mewn poblogaeth gyfan o lai na 3 miliwn, sy'n warthus.

I'r blaidd Lafur, mae mwy yn llai pan gaiff 8.5 y cant o stoc tai Cymru, sy'n eiddo i berchnogion tai, eu galw erbyn hyn yn dai anaddas, gan effeithio ar iechyd a lles pobl. I'r blaidd Lafur, mae mwy yn llai pan fydd tua 72 y cant o gartrefi yng Nghymru sydd erbyn hyn wedi eu pennu'n swyddogol yn anaddas ym meddiant perchenogion, ac yn cyfrif am hanner y cartrefi tlotaf, a thri phensyynwr o bob pump yn byw yn eu cartrefi eu hunain.

I'r blaidd Lafur, mae mwy yn llai pan fo ôl-groniad y gwaith atgyweirio brys ar dai cymdeithasol yng Nghymru bellach yn fwy na £3 biliwn. I'r blaidd Lafur, mae mwy yn llai pan fo ôl-groniad y gwaith atgyweirio brys ar dai preifat yng Nghymru bellach dros £1 biliwn.

I'r blaidd Lafur, mae mwy yn llai pan yw 98,000 o gartrefi yng Nghymru, yn ôl Shelter, yn anaddas i bobl fyw ynddynt. I'r blaidd Lafur, mae mwy yn llai pan fu i ddigartrefedd blaenoriaeth yng Nghymru fwy na dyblu rhwng 1997 a diwedd y llynedd. Unwaith eto, ffigurau Shelter yw'r rheini, Ann. I'r blaidd Lafur, mae mwy yn llai pan fo nifer yr achosion o adfeddiannu tai yn cynyddu unwaith eto.

Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi methu â gwerthfawrogi bod tai yn un o golofnau allweddol cyfiawnder cymdeithasol, a bod ei methiant i flaenoriaethu hyn ynghyd ag iechyd ac addysg wedi bradychu cenhedlaeth gyfan o bobl Cymru.

**Leanne Wood:** Honnwech eich bod yn pryderu am lefelau cynyddol digartrefedd, ond polisi eich plaid chi yw parhau'r ddeddfwriaeth hawl i brynu, ac yn wir, ymestyn hynny i werthu eiddo cymdeithasau tai. Sut y gallwch gysoni'r ddau fater hynny, Mark?

**Mark Isherwood:** Trafodaf hynny maes o law, ond dywedaf fod tystiolaeth annibynnol yn dangos, pe byddem yn cyfyngu'r hawl i brynu yn awr, na fyddai'n cael llawer o effaith, os o gwbl, ar y cyflenwad presennol o

certainly not on the scale that we are talking about.

The Assembly Government has failed to take action on the advice and urgings of front-line housing professionals in Wales.

**Glyn Davies:** On the right to buy, Mark, would you agree that all we are concerned about is who owns the house—the public sector or the private sector? The same people are living in it. The obsession with affordability and ownership by the public sector as social housing is extremely bad for the argument and simply will not deliver.

**Mark Isherwood:** Exactly. I was going to get to that point, but I will make it now. The people who buy council houses are the tenants, most of whom will continue to live in those houses for many years, if not for the rest of their lives. Three fifths of those who have bought their council houses still reside there. Given the scale of the problem, restricting people and denying them of their right to choose would not even begin to eat into the crisis that we are facing today.

**Leanne Wood** *rose*—

**Mark Isherwood:** I do not have time to take an intervention, Leanne. I think that time is running short.

The Regeneration Institute of Cardiff University states that housing has a major role to play in community regeneration, where better housing is linked to the revival of local economies, the delivery of improved services and the development of sustainable local communities. So, what has this Welsh Assembly Government done? It has delivered worse housing for the young, for the old and for those least able to afford the quality housing that they deserve. Further, its failure to link homelessness with the many other social problems facing us today demands nothing less than a public information campaign to raise awareness of homelessness as a key concern for us all. I know that the *Big Issue* shares that concern.

dai fforddiadwy, ac yn sicr nid ar y raddfa yr ydym yn sôn amdani.

Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi methu â chymryd camau gweithredu yn unol â chyngor ac anogaeth gweithwyr proffesiynol rheng flaen ym maes tai yng Nghymru.

**Glyn Davies:** O ran yr hawl i brynu, Mark, a fydddech yn cytuno mai'r cyfan yr ydym yn pryderu yn ei gylch yw pwy biau'r tŷ—y sector cyhoeddus ynteu'r sector preifat? Yr un bobl sy'n byw yno. Mae'r obsesiwn gyda bod yn fforddiadwy a pherchnogaeth gan y sector cyhoeddus fel tai cymdeithasol yn hynod wael i'r ddadl, ac ni fydd yn dal dŵr.

**Mark Isherwood:** Yn union. Yr oeddwn yn mynd i ddod at y pwynt hwnnw, ond fe'i gwnaf yn awr. Y bobl sy'n prynu tai cyngor yw'r tenantiaid, y bydd y mwyafrif ohonynt yn parhau i fyw yn y tai hynny am flynyddoedd lawer, os nad am weddill eu hoes. Mae tair rhan o bump o'r rheini sydd wedi prynu eu tai cyngor eu hunain yn parhau i fyw ynddynt. O gofio maint y broblem, ni fyddai rhwystro pobl a gwrthod yr hawl iddynt ddewis yn effeithio o gwbl ar yr argyfwng a wynebwn heddiw.

**Leanne Wood** *a gododd*—

**Mark Isherwood:** Nid oes gennyf amser i dderbyn ymyriad, Leanne. Credaf fod yr amser yn brin.

Dywed Sefydliad Adfywio Prifysgol Caerdydd fod tai yn bwysig mewn adfywio cymunedol, lle mae tai gwell yn gysylltiedig ag adfywiad economïau lleol, darparu gwasanaethau gwell a datblygu cymunedau lleol cynaliadwy. Felly, beth y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ei wneud? Mae wedi darparu tai gwaeth i'r ifanc, i'r hen ac i'r rheini sydd leiaf tebygol o allu fforddio'r tai o safon y maent yn eu haeddu. Yn ogystal, mae methiant y Llywodraeth i gysylltu digartrefedd â nifer o broblemau cymdeithasol eraill a wynebwn heddiw yn gofyn am ymgyrch gwybodaeth gyhoeddus i gynyddu ymwybyddiaeth o ddigartrefedd fel pryder allweddol i bob un. Gwn fod *Big Issue* hefyd yn pryderu ynghylch hynny.

For some ideologists still trapped in what I consider to be undergraduate-level debate, everything is the fault of the right to buy given to tenants to purchase their council houses. To them I say, ‘Grow up, get real and start dealing with the crisis facing us today’.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Affordable housing, which enables first-time buyers to access the housing market, is vital to maintaining vibrant, dynamic communities across Wales. Local authorities across Wales must ensure that they have a responsible local strategy with a clear and sustainable plan for the provision of affordable housing that provides a choice of sites that are both suitable and available for house building. This is important not only to ensure that everyone has the opportunity to have a decent home, but to maintain the momentum of economic growth.

The value of a neighbourhood as a place to live depends not only on the availability of housing, but on the access that it affords to other valued resources and services, including job opportunities, schools, environmental amenity, aspects of the social environment and so on.

The Welsh Assembly Government strategy rightly states that local authorities should take account of assessments of local housing need in determining the type and size of additional housing for which they should plan. Development should be promoted and justified in the unitary development plan. Social housing, developed in conjunction with private sector new build, as has occurred in Bethesda and Llandudno Junction in my constituency, and the operation of the Assembly homebuy scheme, must work with other local strategies to provide suitably diverse housing options to meet everyone’s individual and particular needs. This was something that Mark did not mention.

Improvements in spatial planning and better data from local authorities will enable strategies to be better targeted and planned on a more holistic regional basis within the context of all planning developments.

I rai ideolegwyr sy’n dal i arddel syniadau myfyrwyr coleg, yn fy marn i, yr hawl i brynu a roddir i denantiaid i brynu eu tai cyngor sydd ar fai yn llwyr. Dywedaf wrthynt, ‘Tyfwch i fyny, calliwch a dechreuwch fynd i’r afael â’r argyfwng sy’n ein hwynebu heddiw’.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Mae tai fforddiadwy, sy’n galluogi’r rheini sy’n prynu cartrefi am y tro cyntaf i ymuno â’r farchnad dai, yn hanfodol i gynnal cymunedau bywiog a deinamig ledled Cymru. Rhaid i awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru sicrhau bod ganddynt strategaeth leol gyfrifol gyda chynllun clir a chynaliadwy i ddarparu tai fforddiadwy sy’n rhoi dewis o safleoedd sy’n addas ac ar gael ar gyfer adeiladu tai. Mae hyn yn bwysig, nid yn unig i sicrhau bod gan bawb y cyfle i gael cartref addas, ond i gynnal momentwm twf economaidd.

Mae gwerth cymdogaeth fel lle i fyw ynddi yn dibynnu nid yn unig ar fod tai ar gael, ond ar y gallu a ddarperir ganddi i gael adnoddau a gwasanaethau gwerthfawr eraill, gan gynnwys cyfleoedd swyddi, ysgolion, amwynderau amgylcheddol, agweddau ar yr amgylchedd cymdeithasol, ac ati.

Dywed strategaeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ddigon cywir y dylai awdurdodau lleol ystyried asesiadau o’r angen lleol am dai wrth benderfynu’r math o dai ychwanegol y dylent gynllunio ar eu cyfer a’u maint. Dylid hyrwyddo datblygiadau a’u cyfiawnhau yn y cynllun datblygu unedol. Rhaid i dai cymdeithasol, wedi eu datblygu ar y cyd â gwaith adeiladu newydd yn y sector preifat, fel sydd wedi digwydd ym Methesda a Chyffordd Llandudno yn fy etholaeth i, a’r gwaith o weithredu cynllun cymorth prynu’r Cynulliad, weithio gyda strategaethau lleol eraill i ddarparu dewisiadau tai sy’n addas o amrywiol i ddiwallu anghenion unigol a phenodol pawb. Yr oedd hyn yn rhywbeth na soniodd Mark amdano.

Bydd gwelliannau mewn cynllunio gofodol a gwell data gan awdurdodau lleol yn galluogi strategaethau i gael eu targedu a’u cynllunio’n well ar sail ranbarthol fwy cyfannol yng nghyd-destun yr holl ddatblygiadau cynllunio.

**Helen Mary Jones:** There is so much in this important debate to which one might wish to refer, and so much that needs to be said. I associate myself with Mick Bates's comments when he said that all of us would acknowledge that this is a major problem that needs to be addressed. However, there are clear differences regarding how those problems should be addressed. As I have said, there is much to be said, but I will confine myself to addressing amendments 5, 6 and 7, which relate to second-home ownership in Wales.

I acknowledge that second-home ownership is not the major pressure on affordable housing in most parts of Wales. However, it is a major pressure in many areas, some of which come as a surprise. These include, for example, Penarth, while the south and west Gower areas are perhaps less of a surprise. The pressure is increasing in the Vale of Glamorgan and in Burry Port and Kidwelly in eastern Carmarthenshire, which are areas that have not been traditionally affected. In some specific communities, second homes are the key pressure.

Around the village of Abersoch 33 per cent of the homes are holiday homes. In Aberdovey, the figure is 25 per cent, and in the Pembrokeshire coastal park, it is 18.24 per cent. That is the factual background to amendments 5, 6 and 7.

The Chancellor's proposals to allow property to be included in self-invested personal pension plans amount to a 40 per cent public subsidy to the rich to encourage second-home ownership. I understand that the Conservatives might feel that this is acceptable. They have always mistakenly believed in allowing the market to solve everything. However, we know the result of that, do we not? [*Interruption.*] The leader of the Conservative Party is quite right to say that I should not blame him for it, but I was merely putting on the record the Conservatives' closeness, in terms of attitude, to what the Chancellor is doing.

I would like to believe that Labour Assembly

**Helen Mary Jones:** Mae cymaint yn y ddadl bwysig hon y gellid cyfeirio ato a chymaint y mae angen ei ddweud. Yr wyf yn uniaethu â sylwadau Mick Bates pan ddywedodd y byddai pob un ohonom yn cydnabod bod hon yn broblem enfawr y mae angen mynd i'r afael â hi. Fodd bynnag, mae yna wahaniaethau amlwg o ran sut y dylid mynd i'r afael â'r problemau hynny. Fel y dywedais, mae llawer i'w ddweud, ond byddaf yn cyfyngu fy sylwadau i ymdrin â gwelliannau 5, 6 a 7, sy'n ymwneud â pherchnogaeth ail gartrefi yng Nghymru.

Yr wyf yn cydnabod nad perchnogaeth ail gartrefi sy'n rhoi'r pwysau mwyaf ar dai fforddiadwy yn y rhan fwyaf o Gymru. Fodd bynnag, y mae'n rhoi pwysau mawr mewn llawer ardal, ac mae rhai o'r rheini'n peri syndod. Ymhlith y rhain, er enghraifft, mae Penarth, er bod ardaloedd yn ne a gorllewin Penrhyn Gŵyr yn peri llai o syndod, efallai. Mae'r pwysau'n cynyddu ym Mro Morgannwg ac ym Mhorth Tywyn a Chydeweli yn nwyrain sir Gaerfyrddin, sy'n ardaloedd nad effeithiwyd arnynt yn draddodiadol. Mewn rhai cymunedau penodol, ail gartrefi yw'r pwysau allweddol.

O amgylch pentref Aber-soch mae 33 y cant o'r cartrefi yn gartrefi gwyliau. Yn Aberdyfi, 25 y cant yw'r ffigur, ac ym mharc arfordir sir Benfro, mae'n 18.24 y cant. Dyna'r cefndir ffeithiol i welliannau 5, 6 a 7.

Mae cynigion y Canghellor i ganiatáu i eiddo gael ei gynnwys mewn cynlluniau pensiwn personol hunanfuiddsoddi yn golygu cymhorthdal cyhoeddus o tua 40 y cant i bobl gyfoethog i annog pobl i fod yn berchen ar ail gartref. Yr wyf yn deall bod y Ceidwadwyr hwyrach yn credu bod hyn yn dderbyniol. Maent erioed wedi credu, yn gyfeiliornus, mewn caniatáu i'r farchnad ddatrys popeth. Fodd bynnag, gwyddom ganlyniad hynny, oni wyddom? [*Torri ar draws.*] Mae arweinydd y Blaid Geidwadol yn gywir i ddweud na ddylwn ei feio ef am hyn, ond dim ond cofnodi yr oeddwn mor agos yw'r Ceidwadwyr, o ran agwedd, i'r hyn y mae'r Canghellor yn ei wneud.

Hoffwn gredu y byddai Aelodau Cynulliad

Members would be able to support these amendments, deplore this policy and, importantly, to seek an exemption for Wales. The Business Minister's reply to my question yesterday suggested that she might be of that view.

**Mark Isherwood:** Do you share my concern that far from relying purely on the market, the Housing Act 1985 switched responsibility for new affordable housing to voluntary non-profit housing associations precisely in order to increase the housing supply by making better use of existing public and private resources, and that it is Labour dogma that has now cut those resources and slashed the supply of new affordable housing?

**Helen Mary Jones:** Whatever I think about the Labour Party, I do not think that it was responsible for the right to buy, for example. I cannot completely agree with you.

I believe that it may be possible for us in the opposition to persuade Labour Assembly Members to deplore theoretically what the Chancellor proposes to do. My question is whether or not they will be prepared to do something, that is, to use the planning system. I acknowledge, as the Minister said in her speech, that there are some practical challenges. We are convinced that those could be overcome if there was the political will to do that. It is clear what a second home is when it is defined in terms of council tax. It is clear that you must state for your income tax purposes what your second home is. I believe that under Gordon Brown's proposals relating to pensions, you will have to state what your second home is. Given those circumstances, I urge Labour Assembly Members and the Government to look at this again. There is a serious issue to be addressed and I know that the Minister will agree. It is possible to find a practical way forward. Given the increased pressure that the Chancellor's policy will put on those communities that I have referred to, I would urge the Minister to think again.

We know that rural communities are not necessarily a high priority for some Labour

Llafur yn gallu cefnogi'r gwelliannau hyn, gwrthod y polisi hwn ac, yn bwysig, ceisio cael eithriad i Gymru. Awgrymodd ymateb y Trefnydd i'm cwestiwn ddoe efallai y byddai'n cytuno â hynny.

**Mark Isherwood:** A ydych chi, fel finnau, yn pryderu bod Deddf Tai 1985, yn hytrach na dibynnu ar y farchnad yn unig, wedi trosglwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb dros dai fforddiadwy newydd i gymdeithasau tai nad ydynt yn gwneud elw yn benodol er mwyn cynyddu'r cyflenwad tai drwy wneud defnydd gwell o adnoddau cyhoeddus a phreifat a oedd sydd eisoes yn bod, ac mai credo Llafur sydd bellach wedi lleihau'r adnoddau hynny ac wedi cwtogi'r cyflenwad o dai fforddiadwy newydd yn arw?

**Helen Mary Jones:** Beth bynnag yw fy marn i am y Blaid Lafur, ni chredaf ei bod yn gyfrifol am yr hawl i brynu, er enghraifft. Ni allaf gytuno â chi yn llwyr.

Credaf y gallai fod yn bosibl i ni'r gwrthbleidiau berswadio Aelodau Llafur y Cynulliad i wrthod yn ddamcaniaethol yr hyn y mae'r Canghellor yn bwriadu ei wneud. Fy nghwestiwn yw a fyddant yn barod i wneud rhywbeth, hynny yw, defnyddio'r system gynllunio. Yr wyf yn cydnabod, fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog yn ei haraith, fod yna rai heriau ymarferol. Yr ydym yn argyhoeddedig y gellid goresgyn y rheini pe bai ewyllys wleidyddol i wneud hynny. Mae'n amlwg beth yw ail gartref pan gaiff ei ddiffinio o ran y dreth gyngor. Mae'n amlwg ei bod yn rhaid ichi nodi at ddibenion eich treth incwm beth yw eich ail gartref. Credaf dan gynigion Gordon Brown ar bensiynau, y bydd yn rhaid ichi nodi beth yw eich ail gartref. O ystyried yr amgylchiadau hynny, anogaf Aelodau Llafur y Cynulliad a'r Llywodraeth i ailedrych ar hyn. Mae yma fater difrifol i fynd i'r afael ag ef, a gwn y bydd y Gweinidog yn cytuno. Mae'n bosibl dod o hyd i ffordd ymlaen sy'n ymarferol. O ystyried y pwysau cynyddol y bydd polisi'r Canghellor yn eu rhoi ar y cymunedau hynny y cyfeiriais atynt, apelïaf ar y Gweinidog i ailfeddwl.

Gwyddom nad yw cymunedau gwledig yn flaenoriaeth uchel o reidrwydd i rai o

Assembly Members, but there are Members in the Government party that know as well as I do the pressures that second homes bring to particular communities. They will have seen, as I have, the pitiful experiences of families thrown out of homes that they have been renting, sometimes for years, so that the homes can be sold as holiday properties to wealthy outsiders. Some Members of the Government party may not care about that, but I know that Members such as Tamsin Dunwoody and Christine Gwyther do. Can they really sit there, and perhaps agree to deplore the Chancellor's offer of a 40 per cent subsidy to the rich, at the same time as supporting their Government in not using the powers that it has? It is important that the Government uses its powers. We might like to see a situation where the Minister will be able to tell Gordon Brown to take his SIPPs out of Wales and where to put them. Unfortunately, that is not the case, but the Government could be more creative about looking at using the planning system.

I urge the Assembly to support amendments 5, 6 and 7. I say to the Labour Members that some of you may still call yourselves socialists, but failure to support these amendments will bring that really into question.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Listening to some of today's debate, you would think that nothing is being done to help people to access affordable housing. This is not true. Many people think that it is an issue for rural areas, and so-called Welsh-speaking areas—Welsh is spoken in many areas in Wales. However, access to affordable housing affects many urban communities, none more so than my constituency of Cardiff South and Penarth. The Cardiff part of my constituency has witnessed massive house price increases over the last five years or so, particularly in places such as Splott, Grangetown and Butetown, where new generations of families have been unable to buy or rent houses to enable them to stay in their communities. However, to give the impression that nothing is being done is a disservice to organisations such as Cardiff Community Housing Association, which is working hard trying to address the issues.

Aelodau Llafur y Cynulliad. Ond mae rhai Aelodau ym mhlaidd y Llywodraeth sy'n gwybod cystal â minnau am y pwysau y mae ail gartrefi yn eu rhoi ar gymunedau penodol. Byddant wedi gweld, fel finnau, brofiadau truenus teuluoedd sy'n cael eu taflu allan o'r cartrefi y maent wedi bod yn eu rhentu, ers blynyddoedd weithiau, fel y gellir gwerthu'r cartrefi fel tai gwyliau i bobl gyfoethog o'r tu allan. Efallai nad yw rhai o Aelodau plaid y Llywodraeth yn poeni am hynny, ond gwn fod Aelodau fel Tamsin Dunwoody a Christine Gwyther yn poeni. A allant eistedd yno, a chytuno efallai i wrthod cynnig y Canghellor o gymhorthdal o 40 y cant i bobl gyfoethog, ac ar yr un pryd gefnogi eu Llywodraeth i beidio â defnyddio'r pwerau sydd ganddi? Mae'n bwysig i'r Llywodraeth ddefnyddio'i phwerau. Efallai yr hoffem weld sefyllfa lle bydd y Gweinidog yn gallu dweud wrth Gordon Brown am fynd â'i SIPP allan o Gymru a ble i'w rhoi. Yn anffodus, nid felly y mae, ond gallai'r Llywodraeth fod yn fwy creadigol wrth ystyried sut i ddefnyddio'r system gynllunio.

Anogaf y Cynulliad i gefnogi gwelliannau 5, 6 a 7. Dywedaf wrth yr Aelodau Llafur fod rhai ohonoch efallai yn dal i alw'ch hunain yn sosialwyr. Ond os na chefnogwch y gwelliannau hyn, bydd cryn amheuaeth am hynny.

**Lorraine Barrett:** O wrando ar rannau o'r ddadl heddiw, gallech gredu nad oes dim yn cael ei wneud i helpu pobl i allu cael tai fforddiadwy. Nid yw hynny'n wir. Cred llawer mai mater i ardaloedd gwledig, a'r ardaloedd Cymraeg eu hiaith fel y'u gelwir, yw hwn—siaredir Cymraeg mewn llawer ardal yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, mae gallu cael tai fforddiadwy yn effeithio ar nifer o gymunedau trefol, yn enwedig yn fy etholaeth i yn Ne Caerdydd a Phenarth. Mae'r rhan o'm hetholaeth yng Nghaerdydd wedi gweld cynnydd anferth ym mhrisiau tai dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd fel Sblot, Grangetown a Butetown, lle mae cenedlaethau newydd o deuluoedd wedi methu â phrynu neu rentu tai i'w galluogi i aros yn eu cymunedau. Fodd bynnag, nid yw rhoi'r argraff nad oes dim yn cael ei wneud yn deg â sefydliadau fel Cymdeithas Tai Cymuned Caerdydd, sy'n gweithio'n galed i fynd i'r afael â'r



problemau.

3.50 p.m.

I will focus my contribution on two specific areas.

The first is the need to develop innovative schemes that provide affordable options for individuals and families to rent or buy. Cardiff Community Housing Association has developed a number of these innovative schemes, with financial support from the Welsh Assembly Government, to provide those affordable properties to buy or rent. As Members will know, Cardiff bay has seen a fundamental shift in the provision of housing from houses to apartments. I have been quite critical of some of the huge apartment blocks that have gone up in the area, as I think that much of this development is speculative. The opportunity to rent, let alone to buy, is beyond the financial means of many local residents. Cardiff Community Housing Association is beginning to tackle this challenge head on. Many of the measures developed by the association over recent years recognise the desperate need for a balance, and to help people access affordable housing in face of the economic strength of rich property developers.

The development on Harrowby Street in Butetown is a classic example. CCHA has developed its first ever low-cost home-ownership scheme, bringing new apartments to the bay for around £70,000. This will benefit key workers in the area. The same is true of the Waterquarter development. While I have been critical of the number of apartments being built, if some at least can be used for social housing, then that is all well and good. Once completed, the development in the Waterquarter will consist of 42 affordable one and two-bedroomed apartments. It will bring much-needed affordable accommodation for rent to Butetown, which should be ready by next summer. The Junction Lock development will also benefit the Butetown community. Ninety-eight one-bedroomed apartments and 58 three-bedroomed apartments will become available at an affordable rent. However, increasing the number of properties available

Canolbwyntiaf yn fy nghyfraniad ar ddau faes penodol.

Y cyntaf yw'r angen am ddatblygu cynlluniau arloesol sy'n darparu dewisiadau fforddiadwy i unigolion a theuluoedd i rentu neu brynu. Mae Cymdeithas Tai Cymuned Caerdydd wedi datblygu nifer o'r cynlluniau arloesol hyn, gyda chefnogaeth ariannol gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, i ddarparu'r tai fforddiadwy hyn i'w prynu neu eu rhentu. Fel y gŵyr Aelodau, mae bae Caerdydd wedi gweld newid sylfaenol yn y ddarpariaeth o eiddo, o dai i fflatiau. Yr wyf wedi bod yn ddigon beirniadol o rai o'r blociau fflatiau anferth a godwyd yn yr ardal, gan fy mod o'r farn mai adeiladu hapfasnachol yw llawer o'r datblygiad hwn. Mae'r cyfle i rentu, heb sôn am brynu, ymhell y tu hwnt i allu ariannol nifer o'r trigolion lleol. Mae Cymdeithas Tai Cymuned Caerdydd yn dechrau mynd i'r afael â'r her hon yn uniongyrchol. Mae nifer o'r mesurau a ddatblygwyd gan y gymdeithas yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf yn cydnabod yr angen dirfawr am gydbwysedd, ac i helpu pobl i allu cael tai fforddiadwy yn wyneb cryfder economaidd datblygwyr eiddo cyfoethog.

Mae'r datblygiad yn Harrowby Street yn Butetown yn enghraifft dda. Mae Cymdeithas Tai Cymuned Caerdydd wedi datblygu ei chynllun cartrefi rhad cyntaf erioed, gan ddarparu â fflatiau newydd yn y bae am ryw £70,000. Bydd hyn o fantais i weithwyr allweddol yn yr ardal. Mae'r un peth yn wir am y datblygiad Waterquarter. Er imi feirniadu nifer y fflatiau sy'n cael eu hadeiladu, os gellir defnyddio rhai ohonynt o leiaf fel tai cymdeithasol, mae hynny'n beth da. Ar ôl ei gwblhau, bydd y datblygiad yn Waterquarter yn cynnwys 42 o fflatiau fforddiadwy un a dwy ystafell wely. Bydd yn darparu llety fforddiadwy ar rent yn Butetown lle mae angen dirfawr amdano, a dylai fod yn barod erbyn yr haf nesaf. Bydd datblygiad Junction Lock hefyd o fudd i gymuned Butetown. Bydd 98 o fflatiau un ystafell wely a 58 o fflatiau tair ystafell wely ar gael am rent fforddiadwy. Fodd bynnag, dim ond rhan o'r ateb fydd cynyddu nifer yr

for affordable rent is only a part of the solution.

The second point is ensuring that measures are taken to protect the availability of the existing social housing stock. As I have said many times, and as recently as a few weeks ago in the Chamber, it is time for the right-to-buy scheme to at least be temporarily halted. Around 10,000 council houses have been lost in Cardiff since the introduction of the right-to-buy scheme. I would remind those council tenants who have bought their houses that when they first rented their council house they could not afford to buy. It is a shame that we do not provide that same opportunity to so many more families now. They had a chance to get into a nice council house at the time. If you look at my case load, Mark, you will see that there are hundreds of desperate families who cannot afford to rent in the private sector, and 10,000 council houses have been lost in Cardiff. This continues to rob families of those good-quality and affordable—

**Glyn Davies:** Will you take an intervention?

**Lorraine Barrett:** No. It is brass neck for the Tories to even speak in this debate, and, particularly after what Mark said, I am not giving way to any Tory.

**Mark Isherwood:** Will you give way?

**Lorraine Barrett:** I will not take an intervention, especially from you, Mark.

I will close by saying that the right-to-buy scheme needs to be halted now, and I congratulate the Minister on continuing her battle to bring this in.

**Brynle Williams:** I was rather sad to hear you say, Lorraine, that you would not take an intervention from us. It is impossible to deny that there is a serious lack of affordable homes in Wales. Too many young people cannot get a foothold on the housing ladder. House prices in Wales are now, on average, three and a half times annual incomes, and as much as seven times annual incomes in key business and commuter areas. The impact that this is having and will have on our

eiddo sydd ar gael am rent y gellir ei fforddio.

Yr ail bwynt yw sicrhau cymryd camau i ddiogelu'r stoc tai cymdeithasol presennol. Fel y dywedais droeon, ac mor ddiweddar ag ychydig wythnosau'n ôl yn y Siambr, mae'n bryd i'r cynllun hawl i brynu gael ei atal dros dro o leiaf. Collwyd tua 10,000 o dai cyngor yng Nghaerdydd ers cyflwyno'r cynllun hawl i brynu. Hoffwn atgoffa'r tenantiaid tai cyngor hynny sydd wedi prynu eu tai na allent hwythau fforddio prynu pan oeddent yn rhentu eu tŷ cyngor i ddechrau. Mae'n drueni na allwn roi'r un cyfle i gymaint yn fwy o deuluoedd heddiw. Cawsant gyfle i symud i mewn i dŷ cyngor dymunol ar y pryd. Os edrychwch ar fy llwyth achosion, Mark, fe welwch fod cannoedd o deuluoedd, sydd wedi cyrraedd pen eu tennyn, yn methu â fforddio rhentu yn y sector preifat, ac mae 10,000 o dai cyngor wedi'u colli yng Nghaerdydd. Mae hyn yn parhau i amddifadu teuluoedd o'r tai safonol fforddiadwy hynny—

**Glyn Davies:** A dderbyniwch ymyriad?

**Lorraine Barrett:** Na wnaf. Mae'n beth hyf iawn i'r Ceidwadwyr hyd yn oed siarad yn y ddadl hon, ac yn enwedig ar ôl yr hyn a ddywedodd Mark, nid wyf am ildio i unrhyw Geidwadwr.

**Mark Isherwood:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Lorraine Barrett:** Ni dderbyniaf ymyriad, yn enwedig gennych chi, Mark.

Hoffwn gloi drwy ddweud bod angen atal y cynllun hawl i brynu yn awr, a llongyfarchaf y Gweinidog am barhau i frwydro i sicrhau y bydd hyn yn digwydd.

**Brynle Williams:** Tristwch imi oedd eich clywed yn dweud na fyddech yn derbyn ymyriad gennym, Lorraine. Mae'n amhosibl gwadu nad oes prinder mawr o dai fforddiadwy yng Nghymru. Mae gormod o bobl ifanc yn methu â chael eu troed ar yr ysgol dai. Mae prisiau tai yng Nghymru bellach, ar gyfartaledd, dair gwaith a hanner yr incwm blynyddol, a chymaint â saith gwaith yr incwm blynyddol mewn ardaloedd busnes a chymudo allweddol. Ni allai'r

communities could not be plainer. The younger generation, particularly in rural areas, is effectively being forced out of the communities in which they grew up, and in which they wish to continue to live. The loss of young families in such areas will be a blow felt by all as rural schools—the focal points of the communities—will face closure in ever-increasing numbers. Likewise, the future of the Welsh language is placed in jeopardy when fewer Welsh-speaking communities have young people growing up in them. The lack of affordable housing also excludes key workers, who are needed in rural Wales. In particular those who work in essential areas such as nursing and farming face a serious barrier to living in the places that need them the most.

If this situation continues, we will be left with an aged and disadvantaged rural community with no long-term future. Simply put, too few local authorities are setting targets for affordable housing, and demand, particularly from first-time house buyers, is outstripping the current levels of housing stock.

As the Office of the Deputy Prime Minister admitted in August:

‘It is only by building more new homes that we will make housing affordable in the future.’

The Welsh Assembly Government needs to reverse its failings over the last six years, and must provide a coherent and well-supported approach to encourage the creation of new and affordable homes across Wales. All local authorities should be required to set clear targets for creating affordable housing, and the process must be transparent so that the public can hold those in charge accountable if their needs are not met. Local authorities must not be left to cope with this situation alone. The Welsh Assembly Government must provide the necessary funding and guidance to meet these targets.

The first priority must be on the development of brownfield sites, which will be doubly

effaith y mae hyn yn ei chael ac y bydd yn ei chael ar ein cymunedau fod yn gliriach. Mae'r genhedlaeth iau, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd gwledig, yn cael eu gorfodi i adael y cymunedau lle cawsant eu magu, a lle maent am barhau i fyw. Bydd colli teuluoedd ifanc mewn ardaloedd felly yn ergyd a deimlir gan bawb wrth i niferoedd cynyddol o ysgolion gwledig—calon y cymunedau—orfod cau. Yn yr un modd, mae dyfodol yr iaith Gymraeg mewn perygl pan fydd gan lai o gymunedau Cymraeg bobl ifanc yn tyfu i fyny ynddynt. Mae prinder tai fforddiadwy hefyd yn rhwystro gweithwyr allweddol y mae eu hangen yng Nghymru wledig rhag byw yn yr ardaloedd hynny. Yn benodol, mae'r rheini sy'n gweithio mewn meysydd hanfodol fel nyrsio a ffermio yn wynebu rhwystr difrifol rhag gallu byw yn y mannau lle mae eu hangen fwyaf.

Os bydd y sefyllfa hon yn parhau, bydd gennym gymuned wledig oedrannus a difreintiedig heb ddyfodol hirdymor. Yn syml, nid oes digon o awdurdodau lleol yn gosod targedau ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy, ac mae'r galw, yn enwedig gan rai sy'n prynu tŷ am y tro cyntaf, yn uwch na lefelau presennol y stoc tai.

Fel y cyfaddefodd Swyddfa'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ym mis Awst:

Dim ond drwy adeiladu rhagor o gartrefi newydd y byddwn yn sicrhau bod tai fforddiadwy ar gael yn y dyfodol.

Mae angen i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wneud iawn am ei methiannau dros y chwe blynedd diwethaf, a rhaid iddi fynd ati i gydlynu a rhoi cefnogaeth er mwyn annog creu tai newydd a fforddiadwy ar draws Cymru. Dylai fod yn ofynnol i bob awdurdod lleol osod targedau clir ar gyfer creu tai fforddiadwy, a rhaid i'r broses fod yn eglur er mwyn i'r cyhoedd allu dwyn y rhai sydd â gofal i gyfrif os na chaiff eu hanghenion eu diwallu. Ni ddylid gadael i awdurdodau lleol ymdopi â'r sefyllfa hon ar eu pen eu hunain. Rhaid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ddarparu'r arian a'r arweiniad angenrheidiol i gyflawni'r targedau hyn.

Rhaid gwneud datblygu safleoedd tir llwyd yn flaenoriaeth gyntaf, a bydd hynny

valuable in the regeneration of our communities. The WDA has played an outstanding role in making these sites available to local authorities, and this must not be harmed when the brand is lost and its successor is politicised. Some local authorities have had success in making an amount of affordable housing available through rural exception sites, and negotiating section 106 agreements. When correctly managed and enforced, these methods have given long-term residents a practical means of staying in their communities—and I emphasise the word ‘enforced’. Their success in retaining young households needs to be brought into a coherent approach across Wales, so that more can benefit in the same way.

The Welsh Assembly Government must act to ensure that enough affordable homes are created for those people currently unable to enter the market, and for the thousands who join them each year.

**Peter Black:** When we talk about affordable housing, we have to get back to basics sometimes, and acknowledge that the best way to achieve affordable housing is to get the economy right. If you create high-value jobs and invest in areas, people are more able to afford to live in those areas. We should not lose sight of that in talking about the whole range of initiatives in this motion.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I endorse what you say, Peter. However, would you agree that there are some circumstances—for example, when properties are predominantly bought by people from the outside, with much greater economic power, as second homes—where we will never correct the job market to the extent that that gap will be filled, and that other action is necessary?

**Peter Black:** If you have an affluent area and invest in it, local people are more able to compete with people buying into the community. That is part of that as well.

I wanted to start with that caveat, because that has not been mentioned yet, and it is

ddwywaith mor werthfawr wrth adfywio ein cymunedau. Mae WDA wedi chwarae rhan eithriadol i sicrhau bod y safleoedd hyn ar gael i awdurdodau lleol, ac ni ddylid peryglu hyn pan gollir y brand a phan gaiff ei olynydd ei wleidyddoli. Mae rhai awdurdodau lleol wedi llwyddo i sicrhau bod rhai tai fforddiadwy ar gael drwy safleoedd eithriedig gwledig, a thrwy negodi cytundebau adran 106. O gael eu rheoli a’u gorfodi’n gywir, mae’r dulliau hyn wedi bod yn gyfrwng ymarferol i drigolion hirdymor aros yn eu cymunedau—a phwysleisiaf y gair ‘gorfodi’. Mae angen i’w llwyddiant i gadw aelwydydd ifanc fod yn rhan o ymagwedd gydynol ledled Cymru, fel y gall mwy o bobl elwa yn yr un ffordd.

Rhaid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru weithredu i sicrhau y caiff digon o gartrefi fforddiadwy eu creu ar gyfer y bobl hynny na allant gael mynediad i’r farchnad ar hyn o bryd, ac ar gyfer y miloedd a fydd yn ymuno â hwy bob blwyddyn.

**Peter Black:** Pan soniwn am dai fforddiadwy, rhaid inni ddychwelyd at yr hanfodion weithiau, a chydabod mai’r ffordd orau i ddarparu tai fforddiadwy yw sicrhau bod yr economi yn iawn. Os byddwch yn creu swyddi gwerth uchel ac yn buddsoddi mewn ardaloedd, mae pobl yn fwy abl i fyw yn yr ardaloedd hynny. Ni ddylem anghofio am hynny wrth sôn am yr holl amrywiaeth mentrau yn y cynnig hwn.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Cytunaf â’r hyn a ddywedwch, Peter. Fodd bynnag, a fydddech yn cytuno bod rhai amgylchiadau—er enghraifft, pan gaiff eiddo ei brynu gan bobl o’r tu allan yn bennaf, gyda llawer mwy o bŵer economaidd, fel ail gartrefi—pan na fyddwn byth yn unioni’r farchnad swyddi nes bydd y bwlch hwnnw wedi ei lenwi, a bod angen camau eraill?

**Peter Black:** Os byddwch yn buddsoddi mewn ardal gefnog, bydd yn fwy posibl i bobl leol gystadlu â phobl sy’n prynu i mewn i’r gymuned. Mae hynny’n fater sy’n gysylltiedig â hyn hefyd.

Yr oeddwn am ddechrau gyda’r cafeat hwnnw, am nad oes neb wedi sôn am hyn

important that we bear that in mind. Lorraine Barrett was right that affordable housing is not just relevant to rural areas, but urban areas as well. Lorraine talked about the area in which we are standing and sitting at present, where we have expensive housing next to the most deprived community in Wales, according to the Welsh index of multiple deprivation 2005. We must bear that in mind when we start to devise policies for dealing with this. Although many of these policies apply to rural and urban areas, some just apply to rural areas, and we need to think of how we can apply those to urban areas as well and tackle the problems that apply there.

As Lorraine said, many areas of Wales, both rural and urban, have a high demand for social housing and for houses to rent, where people cannot afford at present to get into those properties. There is a case that we should suspend the right to buy in those areas, not because the housing stock is diminished by the fact that you sell the houses on, but simply because, while those houses are in the socially rented sector, it is a possibility, either in the short term or in the long term, that they will become available again for others to rent. Taking them out of the stock to rent, especially when you have so few houses in the rented sector in high-demand areas is a retrograde step. We have to look very seriously at that issue.

4.00 p.m.

**Glyn Davies:** The record shows that about 75 per cent of the people who have bought a house still live in them. I am not sure what you are suggesting is happening. Do you not think that it is a far better argument for a council to be allowed to reinvest the money that it has had through the right to buy, than to restrict the principle, when all that it has done is transfer people from the public sector to the private sector, where they incur their own costs?

**Peter Black:** I point out that councils can reinvest the money from the sale of their houses; that regime was changed when you lost power, Glyn, in 1997. In addition, if 70

eto, ac mae'n bwysig inni gofio hyn. Yr oedd Lorraine Barrett yn llygad ei lle pan ddywedodd fod tai fforddiadwy yn berthnasol nid yn unig i ardaloedd gwledig, ond i ardaloedd trefol hefyd. Soniodd Lorraine am yr ardal lle yr ydym yn sefyll ac yn eistedd ar hyn o bryd, lle y mae tai drud wrth ymyl y gymuned fwyaf difreintiedig yng Nghymru, yn ôl y mynegai amddifadedd lluosog yng Nghymru 2005. Rhaid inni gofio hynny wrth ddechrau llunio polisiau ar gyfer ymdrin â hyn. Er bod nifer o'r polisiau hyn yn berthnasol i ardaloedd gwledig ac ardaloedd trefol, mae rhai'n berthnasol i ardaloedd gwledig yn unig, ac mae angen inni ystyried sut y gallwn ddefnyddio'r rhain mewn ardaloedd trefol yn ogystal ac ymdrin â'r problemau sy'n gymwys yno.

Fel y dywedodd Lorraine, mae galw mawr am dai cymdeithasol ac am dai ar rent mewn llawer ardal yng Nghymru, ardaloedd gweledig a threfol, lle na all pobl fforddio symud i mewn i'r cartrefi hyn ar hyn o bryd. Mae dadl dros atal yr hawl i brynu yn yr ardaloedd hyn, nid am fod y stoc tai yn lleihau am eich bod yn gwerthu'r tai, ond yn syml oherwydd ei bod yn bosibl, er bod y tai hynny yn y sector rhentu cymdeithasol, naill ai yn y tymor byr neu yn yr hirdymor, y byddant ar gael eto i eraill eu rhentu. Mae eu tynnu o'r stoc i'w rhentu, yn enwedig a chyn lleied o dai yn y sector rhentu mewn ardaloedd lle mae galw mawr, yn gam yn ôl. Rhaid inni edrych ar y mater o ddifrif.

**Glyn Davies:** Mae'r cofnod yn dangos bod tua 75 y cant o'r bobl sydd wedi prynu tŷ yn dal i fyw ynddo. Nid wyf yn sicr beth yr ydych yn ei awgrymu sy'n digwydd. Oni chredwch ei bod yn ddadl llawer gwell i gyngor gael ail-fuddsoddi'r arian sydd ganddo drwy'r hawl i brynu nag i gyfyngu'r egwyddor, o gofio mai'r cwbl y mae wedi ei wneud yw trosglwyddo pobl o'r sector cyhoeddus i'r sector preifat lle maent yn tynnu eu costau eu hunain?

**Peter Black:** Tynnaf sylw at allu cynghorau i ail-fuddsoddi arian o werthu eu tai, newidiodd y gyfundrefn honno ar ôl i chi golli grym, Glyn, yn 1997. Yn ogystal, os yw

per cent of houses are still in the same ownership, that leaves 30 per cent that are not under the same ownership. When you look at areas, such as Cardiff, in which the price of housing is shooting through the roof and where the demand is greater, you find that a much higher proportion of people is selling their house on. It is not as simple as you say it is, and you have to look at that issue.

I want to elaborate on the case for having a separate fund for homebuy, which is an issue that Mick Bates raised. It is important to say, where you have a fund from which you are building rented housing and from which you are also helping people to buy houses, that you can get confusion. You can also get local authorities using all that money to subsidise people in buying a house while neglecting the building of rented housing at the same time. That has happened in parts of Wales. Therefore, my view is that you should have separate funds: one fund for local authorities to use to help people to buy their properties and another fund so that they could continue to build properties to rent. Even in rural areas, where there is a demand to buy houses, there is also a demand for rented housing. In some areas, that demand has been neglected; it has not been met and that is why we have to have that separate fund.

The right to rent is important, and we should not overlook it. I also think that the supply of social housing is important. We obviously welcome the extra money that has gone into the social housing grant, but we need to look at how we can significantly increase the availability of housing to rent in the sector.

If we are talking about homebuy, the advantages that are available to rural areas should also be available in urban areas. There is a strong case that the 50 per cent homebuy scheme in rural areas should also be available for key workers or people on low incomes in urban areas.

**Mark Isherwood** *rose*—

**Peter Black:** I do not have time to take an intervention. I ask the Minister to look at whether it is possible to extend homebuy in that way, to assist people to purchase homes

70 y cant o'r tai yn dal yn nwylo'r un bobl, mae hynny'n gadael 30 y cant nad ydynt yn nwylo'r un bobl. Pan edrychwch ar ardaloedd megis Caerdydd, lle mae prisiau tai yn cynyddu'n aruthrol a lle mae mwy o alw, fe welwch fod canran lawer uwch o bobl yn gwerthu eu tŷ ymlaen. Nid yw mor syml ag yr honnwy, a rhaid ichi edrych ar y mater hwnnw.

Hoffwn ymhelaethu ar y ddadl dros gael cronfa ar wahân ar gyfer Cymorth Prynu, sy'n fater a godwyd gan Mick Bates. Mae'n bwysig dweud, lle mae gennyh gronfa i dalu am adeiladu tai i'w rhentu, a lle yr ydych hefyd yn cynorthwyo pobl i brynu tai, y gall hynny achosi dryswch. Gall awdurdodau lleol hefyd ddefnyddio'r holl arian hwnnw i roi cymhorthdal i bobl i brynu tŷ, ond yn esgeuluso adeiladu tai i'w rhentu ar yr un pryd. Digwyddodd hynny mewn rhannau o Gymru. Felly, fy marn i yw y dylech gael cronfeydd ar wahân: un ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol i gynorthwyo pobl i brynu eu heiddo, ac un arall fel y gallent barhau i adeiladu tai i'w rhentu. Hyd yn oed mewn ardaloedd gwledig, lle mae galw am gael prynu tai, mae hefyd alw am dai i'w rhentu. Mewn rhai ardaloedd mae'r galw hwnnw wedi ei esgeuluso; nid atebwyd y galw hwnnw a dyna pam mae'n rhaid inni gael cronfa ar wahân.

Mae'r hawl i rentu'n bwysig, ac ni ddylem esgeuluso hynny. Credaf hefyd bod darparu tai cymdeithasol yn bwysig. Croesawn yr arian ychwanegol a neilltuwyd ar gyfer y grant tai cymdeithasol, wrth gwrs, ond mae angen inni edrych ar y ffordd y gallwn sicrhau bod llawer mwy o dai ar gael ar rent yn y sector.

Os ydym yn sôn am gymorth i brynu, dylai'r manteision sydd ar gael i ardaloedd gwledig fod ar gael hefyd mewn ardaloedd trefol. Mae dadl gref dros ddweud y dylai'r cynllun cymorth 50 y cant i brynu mewn ardaloedd gwledig fod ar gael hefyd i weithwyr allweddol neu bobl ar incwm isel mewn ardaloedd trefol.

**Mark Isherwood** *a gododd*—

**Peter Black:** Nid oes gennyf amser am ymyriad. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog edrych i weld a yw'n bosibl ymestyn cymorth i brynu fel hynny, i gynorthwyo pobl i brynu tai

in areas of high demand as well as in urban areas.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwnaf fy nghyfraniad fel *so-called* Cymro Cymraeg. Dechreuaf drwy edrych ar ddatganiad polisi'r Llywodraeth ei hun, sydd yn dweud yn glir y dylai pawb yng Nghymru gael y cyfle i fyw mewn tŷ fforddiadwy o ansawdd da, i fedru dewis ymhle y maent yn byw, a phenderfynu ai prynu neu rentu sydd orau iddynt hwy a'i teuluoedd. Gan ddefnyddio ffon fesur y Llywodraeth ei hun, mae'r Llywodraeth wedi methu yn llwyr i wireddu ei hamcanion.

Os ydych yn sôn am gyflwr tai mewn ardaloedd ôl-ddiwydiannol, er enghraifft, mae'r grantiau i wella tai o'r fath bron wedi diflannu, ac yr oedd y rheini'n gyfraniad pwysig yn yr ardaloedd hynny. O ran dewis pobl i gael byw ble'r ydynt yn dymuno byw, mae'r polisi hwn yn chwilfriw. Mae'n werth sôn am ffigurau astudiaethau a wnaed yng Ngwynedd dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Bu gostyngiad yn y ganran o dai fforddiadwy yng Ngwynedd fel cyfran o'r holl dai sydd ar y farchnad, sef y tai oedd ar werth, o 15 y cant ym mis Hydref 2003 i lai na 5 y cant ym mis Hydref 2004. Mewn blwyddyn, felly, yr oedd y ganran o dai fforddiadwy a oedd ar gael i'w prynu wedi gostwng o 15 y cant i 5 y cant.

Yr ardal lle'r oedd y broblem hon ar ei gwaethaf oedd Dwyfor, sydd yn ardal wledig lle mae mewnlifiad, ail gartrefi a thai gwyliau yn gyrru prisiau ymhell o afael pobl leol, yn enwedig pobl ifanc. Mae hefyd yn fan lle mae diffyg tai ar rent, oherwydd mae'r tai ar rent yn yr ardaloedd braf wedi cael eu gwerthu i raddau helaeth, ac mae'r sector preifat wedi'i anelu'n llwyr at y farchnad wyliau.

Mae werth cofio hefyd fod cyflog cyfartalog Gwynedd gyda'r isaf yng Nghymru, a phan soniwch am amddifadedd mewn gwahanol gymunedau yng Nghymru, dylai honno fod yn ffactor bwysig. Yr ydym yn creu cymunedau cwbl anghynaliadwy mewn ardaloedd o Gymru, lle bydd gwasanaethau, ysgolion, siopau a garejys yn diflannu. Pwy fydd ar ôl? Yr ydych yn sôn am Gymru fel cymuned o gymunedau, ond am ba hyd?

mewn ardaloedd lle mae galw mawr, yn ogystal ag mewn ardaloedd trefol.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I will make my contribution as a *so-called* Welsh speaker. I shall begin by looking at the Government's own policy statement, which clearly states that everyone in Wales should have the opportunity to live in affordable housing of good quality, to be able to choose where to live, and to decide whether buying or renting is best for them and their family. Using the Government's own yardstick, the Government has totally failed to achieve its objectives.

If you are talking about the condition of housing in post-industrial areas, for example, the grants to improve such houses have practically disappeared, though they made an important contribution in those areas. In terms of people's choice to live where they wish, this policy is in tatters. It is worth quoting figures from studies undertaken in Gwynedd in recent years. There was a decrease in the percentage of affordable housing in Gwynedd as a percentage of all housing on the market, namely, houses for sale, from 15 per cent in October 2003 to fewer than 5 per cent in October 2004. Within one year, therefore, the percentage of affordable housing available to buy had decreased from 15 per cent to 5 per cent.

The area where this problem was at its worst was Dwyfor, a rural area where inward migration, second homes and holiday homes have driven prices way beyond the reach of local people, especially young people. It is also an area where there is a shortage of rented housing, because the houses for rent in the pleasant areas have mainly been sold off, and the private sector is aimed entirely at the holiday market.

It is also worth bearing in mind that the average salary in Gwynedd is among the lowest in Wales, and when you talk about deprivation in communities across Wales, that should be an important consideration. We are creating communities that are totally unsustainable in areas of Wales, where services, schools, shops and garages are disappearing. Who will be left? You talk about Wales as a community of communities,

but for how long?

Cyfeiriwyd at bris tir, ac mae gan ymddiriedolaethau tir lleol ran bwysig i'w chwarae yn hyn o beth, ond trist yw gweld cynghorau yn Lloegr, gogledd Dyfnaint, de'r Amwythig a Pharc Cenedlaethol Efrog yn bwrw ymlaen â pholisïau cynlluniau blaengar pan fod Cymru'n cael ei gadael ar ôl. Dylai Cymru fod ar flaen y gâd yn y mater hwn, ac nid yn llusgo ar ôl.

Gorffennaf gyda chyfeiriad Helen Mary Jones at y SIPPS. Mae'n werth dyfynnu *The Times* yma:

'the real appeal of SIPPS is, as it always was, as a tax shelter for those wealthy enough...to buy a second home'.

Some higher rate taxpayers will be able to enjoy an effective 40 per cent discount on the cost of a second property by setting the investment against tax.

Sut y gall plaid, sy'n dweud ei bod o blaid tegwch cymdeithasol, gynnig rhodd mor hael i'r cyfoethog, pan fod pobl ifanc yn methu â chael to uwch eu pennau yn eu cymunedau eu hunain? Mae'n warthus.

**William Graham:** I ask the Minister whether she hopes to introduce empty dwelling management orders in Wales, as these are often, or can be—although a novel experiment, perhaps—a good way of bringing empty homes back into use. I ask her to consider once again the use of space above shops, and the possibility of tax incentives to do that. Clearly, it is necessary with regard to affordability that we also use as many brownfield sites as possible.

I use this opportunity, Minister, to make a particular plea to you that you and your Government will not go down the line that the Office of the Deputy Prime Minister is following in England. The wholesale destruction of terraced communities in parts of England must not be replicated here in Wales. Many of us here will be well aware of the wholesale destruction of communities during the 1960s, and again in the 1970s. While there was a necessity for some clearance, the way in which it was done

The cost of land has already been referred to, and local land trusts have an important part to play in this. But it is sad to see councils in England, in north Devon, south Shropshire and Yorkshire National Park moving forward with innovative planning policies while Wales is left behind. Wales should have been leading in this matter, not lagging behind.

I conclude with Helen Mary Jones's reference to SIPPS. It is worth quoting *The Times* here:

Apêl wirioneddol SIPPS, fel erioed, yw fel lloches treth i'r rheini sy'n ddigon cyfoethog...i brynu ail gartref.

Bydd rhai trethdalwyr cyfradd uwch yn gallu elwa o ostyngiad o 40 y cant ar gost ail eiddo i bob diben drwy wrthbwysu'r buddsoddiad yn erbyn treth.

How can a party, which says it is in favour of social equality, offer such a generous gift to the wealthy, when young people cannot afford a roof over their heads in their own communities? It is a disgrace.

**William Graham:** Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog a yw'n gobeithio cyflwyno gorchmynion i reoli anheddau gwag yng Nghymru, gan eu bod yn aml, neu y gallent yn aml—er yn arbrawf gwreiddiol, hwyrach—fod yn ffordd dda i ddefnyddio tai gwag drachefn. Gofynnaf iddi ystyried unwaith eto ddefnyddio'r lle uwchben siopau, a'r posibilrwydd o gymhellion treth i wneud hynny. Yn amlwg, mae'n angenrheidiol o ran fforddiadwyedd inni hefyd ddefnyddio cynifer â phosibl o safleoedd tir llwyd.

Hoffwn achub ar y cyfle hwn, Weinidog, i erfyn yn arbennig arnoch na fyddwch chi na'ch Llywodraeth yn dilyn y llwybr y mae Swyddfa'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn ei ddilyn yn Lloegr. Ni ddylid efelychu dinistrio cymunedau tai teras ar raddfa eang, fel sy'n digwydd mewn rhannau o Loegr, yma yng Nghymru. Bydd nifer ohonom yma yn ymwybodol iawn o'r ffordd y cafodd cymunedau eu dinistrio'n llwyr yn ystod y 1960au ac eto yn y 1970au. Er bod angen rhywfaint o glirio, aethpwyd ati mewn ffordd



destroyed communities throughout Wales. People were dumped on sink estates on the outskirts of towns and cities with rubbish transport—no wonder we have such appalling social problems in some of our towns and cities today. Will you give an endorsement, Minister, that you will not follow that line?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Canolbwyntiaf ar welliant 2 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, sy'n ymwneud â chynllunio a chyfrifoldebau awdurdodau lleol. Cyn dod at y pwynt hwnnw, hoffwn wneud rhai sylwadau cyffredinol.

Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn edrych ar dai fforddiadwy yng nghyd-destun ein cymunedau ni yng Nghymru. Mae Alun Ffred Jones wedi gwneud y pwynt yma'n barod, sef os ydym yn sôn am gynaliadwyedd cymunedau, rhaid inni sicrhau bod amrywiaeth o dai ar gael, bod tai ar gael i bobl sy'n prynu am y tro cyntaf, a bod tai i'w rhentu o ansawdd uchel sydd o fewn cyrraedd pobl leol. Yr ydym yn prysur ddatblygu sefyllfa ar hyn o bryd lle mae'n amhosibl i bobl ifanc, a theuluoedd hyd yn oed, gael mynediad i'r farchnad dai. Mae hynny'n fater o gyfiawnder cymdeithasol, a rhaid i'r Llywodraeth gymryd hwnnw o ddifrif. Mae'n gyfrifoldeb ar Lywodraeth, yn enwedig un sy'n honni ei bod yn Llywodraeth sosialaidd â chydwybod gymdeithasol, i ymyrryd yn y farchnad er mwyn sicrhau bod cyfle gan bobl i gael mynediad i'r tai hynny.

Mae'n bwysig hefyd i edrych ar y mater hwn mewn ffordd gyfannol, ac yr oedd Peter Black yn gwbl gywir i sôn am bwysigrwydd yr economi a swyddi yn ein cymunedau, ond sôn yr ydym yn y pen draw am gynaliadwyedd ein cymunedau, a'r angen i'w hamddiffyn a'u datblygu mewn ffordd gyfrifol.

Cyfeiriaf hefyd at y cynlluniau pensiynau personol hunanfuiddsoddi, a bydd y Gweinidog yn gwybod bod y Pwyllgor dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio wedi penderfynu'n unfrydol i ysgrifennu at y Trysorlys i fynegi pryder ynghylch y cynllun hwn a'r effaith y caiff ar y farchnad dai yng Nghymru. Mawr obeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog hefyd yn gallu cefnogi'r llythyr hwnnw a rhoi pwysau ar y Trysorlys i

a oedd yn dinistrio cymunedau ledled Cymru. Gwthiwyd pobl i ystadau ymylol ar gyrion trefi neu ddinasoedd gyda chludiant gwael—does ryfedd fod gennym broblemau cymdeithasol arswydus yn rhai o'n trefi a'n dinasoedd heddiw. A wnewch chi gadarnhau, Weinidog, na fyddwch yn dilyn y llwybr hwnnw?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I will concentrate on amendment 2 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, which deals with planning and the responsibilities of local authorities. Before coming to that point, I wish to make some general remarks.

It is important that we look at affordable housing in the context of our communities in Wales. Alun Ffred Jones has already made this point, namely that if we are talking about the sustainability of communities, we must ensure that a range of housing is available, that housing is available for first-time buyers, and that high-quality rented accommodation is also within the reach of local people. We are fast developing a situation at present where it is impossible for young people, and even families, to enter the housing market. That is a matter of social justice, and the Government must take that seriously. A Government has a responsibility, particularly one that claims to be a socialist Government with a social conscience, to intervene in the market to ensure that people have the opportunity to obtain those houses.

It is also important to look at this matter holistically, and Peter Black was absolutely right to refer to the importance of the economy and jobs in our communities. But ultimately we are talking about the sustainability of our communities, and the need to protect and develop them in a responsible manner.

I refer also to the self-investment personal pension schemes, and the Minister will be aware that the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee was unanimous in its decision to write to the Treasury expressing its concern about this scheme and the effect it will have on the housing market in Wales. I very much hope that the Minister will support that letter and put pressure on the Treasury to grasp the implications and

sylweddoli beth fydd canlyniadau a goblygiadau'r cynllun hwn i bobl yng Nghymru.

outcomes of this scheme for people in Wales.

4.10 p.m.

Mae'r Gweinidog wedi dweud na fydd hi'n derbyn gwelliant 2 am fod yr hawl eisoes gan gynghorau sir i weithredu yn y ffordd hon. A wnewch chi dderbyn, Weinidog, yn anffodus, nad yw hynny'n digwydd ledled Cymru? Yr wyf yn derbyn yr hyn a ddywedwyd gennych, fod y pwerau yn bodoli eisoes, ond fel yn achos cynifer o bethau eraill y mae gan gynghorau yr hawl i'w gwneud, nid ydynt o reidrwydd yn eu gwneud.

The Minister says she will not support amendment 2 because county councils already have the right to operate in this way. Minister, will you accept that that, unfortunately, does not happen right across Wales? I accept what you have said, that the powers already exist, but as with so many other things that councils have the right to do, they do not necessarily do them.

Mae gennyf ddegau o esiamplau o sir Gaerfyrddin o bobl a fyddai'n gallu manteisio ar y math hwn o gyfle, pe bai'r cyngor yn caniatáu hynny. Yn hytrach na chynllunio mewn ffordd sy'n caniatáu mynediad i'r farchnad dai i bobl ifanc a phobl leol, maent yn gadael i alw reoli'r farchnad yn gyfan gwbl ac, ar hyn o bryd, yn sir Gaerfyrddin, mae degau os nad cannoedd o dai mawr yn cael eu hadeiladu, ond nid yw hynny'n adlewyrchu'r angen lleol. Mae angen tai cymhedrol, o ran maint a phris, a fydd yn addas ar gyfer pobl leol.

I have dozens of examples in Carmarthenshire of people who could take advantage of this sort of opportunity, if the council allowed it. Rather than planning in a way that gives young people and local people access to the housing market, they allow market forces to rule entirely, and at present in Carmarthenshire, scores, if not hundreds, of large houses are being built, though that does not reflect local need. Moderate houses, in terms of size and price, are needed for local people.

Yr wythnos hon, yr oeddwn gyda theulu yn Ffarmers, sir Gaerfyrddin, sydd wedi ceisio mynediad i'r farchnad dai. Mae tîrfeddiannwr lleol wedi cynnig gwerthu darn o dir iddynt am bris rhesymol iawn am eu bod yn bobl leol gyda phlant, ond nid ydynt yn gallu cael caniatâd cynllunio. Eto, ymddengys fod rhai pobl yng Nghaerfyrddin—yn enwedig os Tesco Extra yw eich enw—yn gallu cael caniatâd cynllunio i adeiladu unrhyw beth. Mae'n fater o bwys, Weinidog, a gofynnaf i chi ymyrryd a phwyso ar gynghorau i'w hannog i ddefnyddio'r pwerau sydd ganddynt, ac i sicrhau bod cynghorau ledled Cymru yn gweithredu'n gyson ar y mater hwn.

Earlier this week, I was with a family in Ffarmers, Carmarthenshire, who have been trying to enter the housing market. A local landowner has offered to sell them a plot of land at a very reasonable price because they are local people and they have children. Yet, they cannot get planning permission. However, it appears that some people in Carmarthen—especially if your name is Tesco Extra—can get planning permission to build almost anything. It is a matter of importance, Minister, and I ask you to intervene and put pressure on councils to urge them to use their powers, and to ensure that councils across Wales act consistently in this matter.

Yn olaf, a wnewch chi edrych ar gynlluniau cynghorau o ran amaethwyr sy'n ceisio adeiladu tai ar gyfer eu plant ar eu tir? Mae amaethwyr, ar gyfartaledd, yn agos at 60 oed ac mae angen cymorth arnynt ar eu ffermydd, felly mae angen iddynt sicrhau bod eu teuluoedd yn byw yn agos atynt. Mae

Finally, will you look at plans by councils for farmers who are trying to build houses for their children on their land? Farmers, on average, are close to 60 years of age and they need assistance on their farms. Therefore, they need to ensure that their families live nearby. They have land that is suitable for

ganddynt dir sy'n addas ar gyfer adeiladu tai, ond, yn anffodus, mae'r cyngor yn gwrthod hawl cynllunio oherwydd nid yw'n credu bod y fferm yn hyfyw ar gyfer mwy nag un teulu. Mae anghenion yn y fan honno ac mae angen i gynghorau edrych ar y mater hwnnw.

**Nick Bourne:** I welcome this important debate. I think that this is a complex problem; it always has been and I suspect that it always will be. Curiously, I agree with some of the points that Peter Black made about jobs. It is an important point that, when well-paid jobs are attracted to an area, it is easier for people to compete in the housing market. I do not think that that provides the whole answer, but it certainly provides part of it.

Demographic changes contribute to the problem—people are living longer and more healthily—which means that we have to consider what types of houses are being built. In relation to the public and private sector, there will always be a need for a certain amount of public housing, but I do not think that we should forget that many people aspire to buying their own homes. Indeed, we should encourage that and help them where we can. I suspect that everyone here owns their home, and so we should understand that aspiration and help people where we can, while recognising that not everyone will be able to, or will want to, buy their own home.

On second-house syndrome, to which Helen Mary and others referred—citing Abersoch, Aberdyfi and so on as examples—their points are valid and there is certainly a problem in those communities, but I think that the issue is more complex than Helen, for example, allowed. Sometimes, and I can certainly speak with some authority on Aberdyfi, people who have owned second houses in a community have later moved in, lock stock and barrel, and contributed significantly, learning the language, and becoming part of the backbone of the community. Again, I think that we must realise that this is a complex problem when you look at the whole situation. However, it is a problem, and more so than in many parts of the country. Average house prices in Wales are higher than those in Scotland, Northern Ireland, the north-east, the north-west, Yorkshire, and the Humber, which presents us with more of a problem.

housing, but unfortunately the council refuses planning permission because it does not believe the farm is viable for more than one family. There are needs there and councils need to look at this matter.

**Nick Bourne:** Croesawaf y ddadl bwysig hon. Credaf ei bod yn broblem gymhleth; bu felly erioed, ac yr wyf yn tybied na fydd hynny byth yn newid. Yn ddigon rhyfedd, cytunaf â rhai o'r pwyntiau a wnaeth Peter Black ynglŷn â swyddi. Mae'n bwynt pwysig ei bod yn haws, pan gaiff swyddi gyda chyflog da eu denu i ardal, i bobl gystadlu yn y farchnad tai. Ni chredaf mai dyna'r ateb yn llawn, ond mae'n rhan ohono, yn sicr.

Mae newidiadau demograffig yn cyfrannu at y broblem—mae pobl yn byw yn hirach ac yn fwy iach—sy'n golygu bod yn rhaid inni ystyried y mathau o dai sy'n cael eu hadeiladu. O ran y sector cyhoeddus a'r sector preifat, bydd angen bob amser am nifer penodol o dai cyhoeddus, ond ni chredaf y dylem anghofio bod nifer o bobl yn dyheu am brynu eu cartrefi eu hunain. Yn wir, dylem annog hynny a'u cynorthwyo pan allwn. Tybiaf fod pawb yma yn berchen ar eu cartrefi, ac felly dylem ddeall y dyhead hwnnw a chynorthwyo pobl lle gallwn, gan sylweddoli na fydd pawb yn gallu nac yn dymuno prynu eu cartref eu hunain.

Ynglŷn â'r syndrom ail gartrefi y cyfeiriodd Helen Mary ac eraill ato—gan enwi Abersoch, Aberdyfi ac ati fel enghreifftiau—mae eu pwyntiau'n ddilys ac yn sicr mae problem yn y cymunedau hynny. Ond credaf fod y mater yn fwy cymhleth nag yr oedd Helen, er enghraifft, yn ei addef. Ar brydiau, a gallaf siarad gyda chryn awdurdod am Aberdyfi yn sicr, mae pobl a oedd yn berchen ar ail gartrefi wedi symud i mewn yn ddiweddarach, yn gyfan gwbl, ac wedi cyfrannu'n sylweddol, gan ddysgu'r iaith a dod yn rhan o asgwrn cefn y gymuned. Eto, credaf y dylem sylweddoli fod hon yn broblem gymhleth pan edrychwch ar y sefyllfa gyfan. Fodd bynnag, mae'n broblem, ac yn fwy o broblem yma nag mewn llawer rhan o'r wlad. Mae prisiau tai yng Nghymru ar gyfartaledd yn uwch na'r rheini yn yr Alban, Gogledd Iwerddon, gogledd-ddwyrain Lloegr, gogledd-orllewin Lloegr, Swydd

Efrog a'r Humber, sy'n rhoi mwy o broblem inni.

On the homebuy scheme, I welcome what the Minister said about the extensions. We need flexibility in that regard. Mick Bates had a point about a separate line in the budget, which would probably help.

O ran y cynllun cymorth i brynu, croesawaf yr hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog am yr estyniadau. Mae angen hyblygrwydd yn hyn. Yr oedd gan Mick Bates bwynt ynglŷn â llinell ar wahân yn y gyllideb, a fyddai'n debygol o helpu, hwyrach.

The Minister will no doubt address this point, but local authorities have a part to play, and many need to manage their housing stock much more effectively than at present. That point has not been made by many, but it is true. In fairness to the Minister, it is a much more diffuse issue than just her portfolio. It affects issues in rural communities in terms of healthcare, police cover, the ambulance service, the fire service, post offices and so on—the whole problem that results from depopulation. It is partly a demographic problem which must be addressed over a longer term, which is partly the Assembly's responsibility and partly Westminster's responsibility. This debate has enabled us to highlight some of the problems. I am not sure that we have come up with too many solutions, but it is, in fairness, a difficult problem. It is important that we can air these issues and perhaps look at some of the things that may help.

Mae'n bur debyg y bydd y Gweinidog yn trafod y pwynt hwn, ond mae gan awdurdodau lleol ran i'w chwarae, a rhaid i nifer ohonynt reoli eu stoc tai lawer yn fwy effeithiol nag a wnânt ar hyn o bryd. Ni wnaed y pwynt hwnnw gan nifer o bobl, ond mae'n wir. Er tegwch i'r Gweinidog, mae'n fater llawer mwy eang na'i phortffolio hi yn unig. Mae'n effeithio ar faterion mewn cymunedau gwledig o ran gofal iechyd, presenoldeb yr heddlu, y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, y gwasanaeth tân, swyddfydd post, ac ati—yr holl broblemau sy'n deillio o ddiboblogi. Mae'n broblem ddemograffig yn rhannol ac mae angen ei hystyried dros gyfnod hwy. Mae'r Cynulliad yn rhannol gyfrifol amdani a San Steffan yn rhannol gyfrifol amdani. Mae'r ddadl hon wedi ein galluogi i dynnu sylw at rai o'r problemau. Nid wyf yn siŵr a ydym wedi dod o hyd i lawer o atebion, ond i fod yn deg, mae'n broblem anodd. Mae'n bwysig inni allu trafod y materion hyn ac efallai edrych ar rai o'r pethau a allai helpu.

On the SIPPs issue, the Welsh Conservatives are not convinced by the device. We will not support the amendment, but we will not vote against it. We are abstaining on the issue, because we are not convinced that it should happen. The second home issue may be much more complex than simply to say that second homes are a bad thing. That is not necessarily the case.

O ran mater SIPP, nid yw Ceidwadwyr Cymru wedi eu hargyhoeddi gan y ddyfais. Ni fyddwn yn cefnogi'r gwelliant, ond ni fyddwn yn pleidleisio yn ei erbyn. Yr ydym yn ymatal ar y mater, gan nad ydym wedi ein hargyhoeddi y dylai ddigwydd. Efallai bod mater ail gartrefi lawer yn fwy cymhleth na dweud yn syml fod ail gartrefi yn beth drwg. Nid yw hynny o reidrwydd yn wir.

**Elin Jones:** Yr wyf am siarad am welliant 2. Mae'r gwelliant yn cyfeirio'n benodol at gynllunio a thai fforddiadwy yng nghefn gwlad o dan nodyn cyngor technegol 2.

**Elin Jones:** I wish to speak on amendment 2. The amendment refers specifically to planning and affordable housing in rural areas under technical advice note 2.

Mewn ardaloedd gwledig, byddwn yn dosbarthu tai mewn tri chategori: tai mewn trefi, tai mewn pentrefi a thai yng nghefn gwlad, ac felly y tu allan i linellau du unrhyw dref neu bentref a ddaw o dan amodau'r

In rural areas, I would divide housing into three categories: houses within towns, houses within villages, and houses in the countryside and therefore beyond the black lines of any town or village under the terms of the unitary

cynllun datblygu unedol. Tai unigol fyddai'r rhain, yn aml mewn clystyrau o dai eraill, ac mae'r categori hwn yn cael ei anwybyddu'n llwyr gan bolisiau cynllunio ar hyn o bryd.

Mae nodyn cyngor technegol 2 yn caniatáu i awdurdodau lleol ddarparu tai fforddiadwy ar safleoedd o fewn pentrefi a threfi drwy drothwy neu darged. Mae hefyd yn caniatáu safleoedd eithriedig gwledig, ac yr wyf yn croesawu hynny. Gobeithiaf y bydd awdurdodau lleol yn defnyddio'r dulliau hyn; gwn fod Cyngor Sir Ceredigion yn ystyried mynd i'r cyfeiriad hwn ar hyn o bryd.

Fodd bynnag, beth am y categori tai yng nghefn gwlad sydd y tu allan i linellau du penrefi a threfi? Ar hyn o bryd, nid yw'n bosibl, oni bai am ambell eithriad, i gynyddu'r stoc tai yng nghefn gwlad. Yng Ngheredigion, os ydych am fyw yng nghefn gwlad bydd tŷ newydd yn costio dros £200,000—mae hynny ymhell tu hwnt i'r hyn y gall pobl ifanc lleol ei fforddio. Felly, mae tai yng nghefn gwlad ar hyn o bryd yn eiddo yn unig i'r cyfoethog a'r rhai sy'n etifeddu'r tai hynny. Yn draddodiadol, ceir cymdeithas wledig fywiog mewn lle fel Ceredigion, ond mae'r gyfundrefn gynllunio bresennol o dan nodyn cyngor technegol 2 yn gyfundrefn drefol, ac mae ei defnyddio yng Ngheredigion yn anwybyddu anghenion cefn gwlad. Pam mai'r cyfoethog yn unig a ddylai feddu ar yr hawl i fyw yng nghefn gwlad erbyn hyn? Pam na ellid caniatáu tai fforddiadwy yng nghefn gwlad?

Dywedodd y Gweinidog yn ei chyflwyniad i'r ddadl na fyddai'r Llywodraeth yn cefnogi gwelliant 2 gan fod safleoedd eithriedig gwledig eisoes yn diwallu'r angen hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, mae safleoedd eithriedig gwledig i fod yn gyfochrog â phentrefi, ac maent yn safleoedd penodol lle na chaniateir adeiladu tai unigol. Daw pobl ifanc i'm gweld yn aml mewn cymorthfeydd, fel y soniodd Rhodri Glyn Thomas, sydd am fyw yn eu cymunedau yn nyfnder cefn gwlad ac adeiladu tŷ, ond mae'r canllawiau cynllunio yn gorfodi i dai fforddiadwy gael eu hadeiladu ar safleoedd mewn pentrefi a threfi yn unig. Nid yw canllawiau cynllunio fel hyn yn adlewyrchu datblygiad hanesyddol cymdeithas mewn ardal fel Ceredigion, ac nid ydynt yn bodloni dyheadau pobl ifanc yn

development plan. These would be individual houses, sometimes in clusters with other houses, and this category is being completely ignored by current planning at present.

Technical advice note 2 allows local authorities to provide affordable housing on sites within villages and towns by means of a threshold or a target. It also allows exception sites in rural areas, which I welcome. I hope local authorities use these methods; I know that Ceredigion County Council is currently considering moving in this direction.

But what about the category of housing in rural areas, outside the black lines of villages and towns? At present it is not possible, with a few exceptions, to increase the housing stock in rural areas. In Ceredigion, if you want to live in a rural area a new house will cost over £200,000—that is well beyond what local young people can afford. Therefore, houses in rural areas are currently restricted to the well-off and those who have inherited those houses. Traditionally, there has been a vibrant rural community in places such as Ceredigion, but the current planning regime under technical advice note 2 is an urban regime, and using it in Ceredigion ignores the needs of rural areas. Why should it only be the well-off who have the right to live in rural areas? Why cannot affordable housing be allowed in rural areas?

The Minister said in her introduction to the debate that the Government would not support amendment 2 because rural exception sites already fulfil that need. But rural exception sites are meant to be alongside villages, and they are specific sites where the building of individual houses is not allowed. I am often visited in my surgeries, as Rhodri Glyn Thomas has said, by young people who want to live in their communities in the heart of the countryside and build a house. But planning guidelines insist that affordable housing be built only on sites within villages and towns. Such planning guidelines do not reflect the historical development of communities in areas such as Ceredigion, and they do not fulfil the aspirations of young people in my constituency.

fy etholaeth i.

Yr wyf wedi ymateb i'r ymgynghoriad presennol ar nodyn cyngor technegol 2, gan gynnig y dylai cyflwyno a chreu categori arall o dai fforddiadwy, gan ganiatáu i awdurdodau lleol allu rhoi caniatâd cynllunio i dai fforddiadwy ag amod cynllunio priodol yng nghefn gwlad. Dylid asesu, ar lefel cyngor cymuned gwledig, y galw am dai fforddiadwy i bobl leol a dylid caniatáu ceisiadau cynllunio o fewn yr asesiad angen hwnnw. Hefyd, dylid gosod canllawiau clir ar leoliad a dyluniad tai o'r math hwn. Mae cyfle yn awr, a ninnau'n ei ddiwygio, i wneud nodyn cyngor technegol 2 yn fwy perthnasol i anghenion cefn gwlad, gan nad yw'n berthnasol ar hyn o bryd.

4.20 p.m.

**Glyn Davies:** This is an interesting subject for debate. I believe that there is a shared concern across parties, but there are genuine and differing responses as to how we should deal with the matter. The availability of affordable housing is a hugely complex issue and, in Wales, it is made even more complex by policies outwith our borders. I would like to speak on many aspects of this issue, many of which have been raised already, but I will concentrate on two points, both of which relate to the role of the private sector. This issue is so huge that, unless we harness the private sector in coming up with a solution, we will not be able to deal with it.

When I first contested a council election, a long time ago, my only campaign issue was the planning rules that prevented landowners from building on their own land. I did not believe in planning at all. [*Laughter.*] I refined my view after being elected, but my fellow councillors were so impressed with it that they elected me chair of the planning committee for the next six years. Although I have refined my view, I still believe that planning is far too restrictive. In many instances, we see problems that arise in rural areas—partly because of what happens in the south east of England, in terms of demand—made considerably worse by restrictive policies, and made worse again by the desire for a standard policy across all planning

I have responded to the current consultation on technical advice note 2, proposing that another category of affordable housing be introduced and created, to enable local authorities to grant planning permission for affordable housing with an appropriate planning condition in rural areas. Assessment should be made, at rural community council level, of the demand for affordable housing for local people, and planning applications should be granted within that assessment of need. Clear guidelines should also be set as to the location and design of housing of that type. In revising TAN 2, we now have an opportunity to make it more relevant to the needs of rural areas, since it is not relevant at present.

**Glyn Davies:** Mae hwn yn bwnc diddorol i'w drafod. Credaf fod pob plaid yn rhannu'r un pryderon, ond mae ymatebion gwirioneddol a gwahanol i'r modd y dylem ymdrin â'r mater. Mae sicrhau bod tai fforddiadwy ar gael yn fater eithriadol o gymhleth, ac yng Nghymru caiff ei gymhlethu ymhellach gan bolisiâu y tu allan i'n ffiniau. Hoffwn sôn am lawer agwedd ar y mater hwn, a soniwyd am nifer ohonynt eisoes. Ond byddaf yn canolbwyntio ar ddau bwynt, ac mae'r ddau'n ymwneud â rôl y sector preifat. Mae'r mater hwn mor enfawr fel na allwn ei drin o gwbl os nad awn ati i harneisio'r sector preifat i ddarparu ateb.

Pan sefais fel ymgeisydd mewn etholiad cyngor am y tro cyntaf, amser maith yn ôl, yr unig fater yr oeddwn yn ymgyrchu arno oedd rheolau cynllunio a oedd yn rhwystro tirfeddianwyr rhag adeiladu ar eu tir eu hunain. Nid oeddwn yn credu mewn cynllunio o gwbl. [*Chwerthin.*] Cymhwysais fy marn ar ôl cael fy ethol, ond gwnaeth y mater gymaint o argraff ar fy nghydgynghorwyr fel y cefais fy ethol yn gadeirydd y pwyllgor cynllunio am y chwe blynedd nesaf. Er fy mod wedi cymhwyso fy marn, yr wyf yn dal i gredu bod cynllunio lawer yn rhy gaeth. Mewn llawer enghraifft, gwelwn broblemau sy'n codi mewn ardaloedd gwledig-yn rhannol oherwydd yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn ne ddwyrain Lloegr, o ran

authorities in Wales, when some have significantly differing positions.

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside is taking one or two interesting initiatives, and the committee is discussing these. In particular, there is the idea to use Forestry Commission land to develop low-cost affordable housing. However, I cannot for the life of me understand why, if the Government can do something on its own land, the private sector cannot do the same on its own land to address the same problem. There is massive potential for the private sector to deal with this problem, especially in rural areas. I know that there is a problem in urban areas as well, but, in rural areas in particular, it can be of significant help.

The second issue relates to investment policies in the public sector, and I speak from my own experience. If you go back a decade, even in Powys, there was a public sector budget of around £10 million a year. The majority of that went on repair grants for the private sector—that is a huge amount. Sometimes, I thought it an overgenerous grant. Today, that budget has dropped to around a quarter of what it was, and there is no money at all for repair grants to support the private sector. Look at the consequences of what has happened. What used to happen was that local authority environmental health officers used to go to a house that was in disrepair, and they had with them a carrot and a stick. They would say, ‘This house simply is not fit, and we are going to close it down unless you improve it. On the other hand, we have a very generous grant that will help you to do it’. That used to work.

Today, there is no carrot at all; there is just the stick. Officers go to properties and say, ‘This is not fit for repair; you will have to throw the people out on the street as homeless’. You might think that that is an exaggeration, but a senior housing officer

galwyn gwaethygu’n sylweddol oherwydd polisïau caeth, ac sy’n gwaethygu eto oherwydd yr awydd am bolisi safonol ar draws yr holl awdurdodau cynllunio yng Nghymru, er bod safbwyntiau gwahanol iawn gan rai.

Mae’r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad yn ystyried un neu ddwy o fentrau diddorol, ac mae’r pwyllgor yn eu trafod. Yn arbennig mae’r syniad o ddefnyddio tir y Comisiwn Coedwigaeth i ddatblygu tai rhad fforddiadwy. Fodd bynnag, ni allaf yn fy myw ddeall pam, os gall y Llywodraeth wneud rhywbeth ar ei thir ei hun, na all y sector preifat wneud yr un fath ar ei dir ei hun i fynd i’r afael â’r un broblem. Mae potensial enfawr i’r sector preifat fynd i’r afael â’r broblem hon, yn arbennig mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Gwn fod problem mewn ardaloedd trefol hefyd, ond mewn ardaloedd gwledig gall fod o help sylweddol.

Mae’r ail fater yn ymwneud â pholisïau buddsoddi yn y sector cyhoeddus, ac yr wyf yn siarad o brofiad. Ddegawd yn ôl, hyd yn oed ym Mhowys, yr oedd yna gyllideb sector cyhoeddus o ryw £10 miliwn y flwyddyn. Defnyddid y rhan fwyaf o hwnnw ar gyfer grantiau atgyweirio i’r sector preifat—mae hynny’n swm enfawr. Weithiau, byddwn yn meddwl y grant yn rhy hael o lawer. Heddiw, mae’r gyllideb honno wedi gostwng i ryw chwarter yr hyn ydoedd, ac nid oes unrhyw arian o gwbl ar gyfer grantiau atgyweirio i gynorthwyo’r sector preifat. Edrychwch ar ganlyniadau’r hyn sydd wedi digwydd. Yr hyn a arferai ddigwydd oedd y byddai swyddogion iechyd amgylcheddol yr awdurdod lleol yn mynd i dŷ a oedd mewn cyflwr gwael, a byddai ganddynt fygythiadau ac addewidion. Byddent yn dweud, ‘Nid yw’r tŷ hwn mewn cyflwr digon da, a byddwn yn ei gau os na fyddwch yn ei wella. Ar y llaw arall, mae gennym grant hael iawn a fydd yn eich helpu i wneud hynny’. Arferai hynny weithio.

Heddiw, nid oes unrhyw addewidion o gwbl; dim ond bygythiadau. Bydd swyddogion yn mynd i dai ac yn dweud, ‘Nid yw hwn mewn cyflwr digon da i’w atgyweirio; bydd yn rhaid ichi daflu’r bobl allan ar y stryd a’u gwneud yn ddigartref’. Efallai eich bod yn

from Powys County Council said at a conference in Llandrindod Wells last month that, in the last year alone, the council had put 30 families out on the street as homeless. Another part of the authority then had to house those people as they were homeless. We have no investment in the private sector, and no recognition that the private sector can deliver the solution in partnership with the public sector, of course. Without this recognition, we are seeing the consequences that are making the problem worse. When I listen to debates in Plenary, some of which are extremely useful, if I hear an argument on the pension fund issue, which is a perfectly valid issue, and I have a lot of sympathy for the points that have been made—

**Mark Isherwood:** Do you welcome the proposals from Business in the Community to involve the private sector in the matters that you raise? With reference to homelessness, between 1993 and 1997, homelessness more than halved. At the same time, for every house that was not available for relet through a right-to-buy scheme, two new affordable houses were built. Since 1997, the situation has reversed. Homelessness has more than doubled, and for every two houses not available for relet through a right-to-buy scheme, only one new affordable house is being built. Do you agree that there is a clear link between those facts?

**Glyn Davies:** I do, and it is true that if we involve the private sector, we get more for less, which is something that I remember from Mark's speech.

I can see that the Deputy Presiding Officer will not allow me to take up much more time, but the general point that I want to make in relation to all these issues, including the pension fund issue, is that if they simplify the purchase of second homes and those homes are not made available to support the private rented market, I will oppose them too. However, I am not convinced that that is going to happen.

With regard to the sale of council houses, I

meddwl mai gorliwio yw hynny, ond dywedodd uwch swyddog tai o Gyngor Sir Powys mewn cynhadledd yn Llandrindod fis diwethaf fod y cyngor, yn y flwyddyn ddiwethaf yn unig, wedi rhoi 30 o deuluoedd allan ar y stryd a'u gwneud yn ddi-gartref. Yna bu'n rhaid i ran arall o'r awdurdod ailgartrefu'r bobl hynny gan eu bod yn ddi-gartref. Nid oes gennym unrhyw fuddsoddiad yn y sector preifat, nac unrhyw gydnabyddiaeth y gall y sector preifat gynnig yr ateb mewn partneriaeth â'r sector cyhoeddus, wrth gwrs. Heb y gydnabyddiaeth honno, gwelwn y canlyniadau sy'n gwaethygu'r broblem. Wrth wrando ar ddadleuon mewn Cyfarfodydd Llawn, rai ohonynt yn ddefnyddiol iawn, os clywaf ddadl ar fater y gronfa pensiwn, sy'n fater hollol ddilys, ac mae gennyf lawer o gydymdeimlad â'r pwyntiau sydd wedi eu gwneud—

**Mark Isherwood:** A ydych yn croesawu cynigion Busnes yn y Gymuned i gynnwys y sector preifat yn y materion a godwch? O ran y digartref, rhwng 1993 a 1997 gostyngodd nifer y digartref fwy na hanner. Ar yr un pryd, ar gyfer pob tŷ nad oedd ar gael i'w ail-osod drwy gynllun hawl i brynu, adeiladwyd dau dŷ fforddiadwy newydd. Er 1997, mae'r sefyllfa wedi ei gwyrddroi. Mae nifer y digartref wedi mwy na dyblu, ac am bob dau dŷ nad ydynt ar gael i'w hail-osod drwy gynllun hawl i brynu, dim ond un tŷ fforddiadwy newydd sy'n cael ei adeiladu. A ydych yn cytuno bod cysylltiad clir rhwng y ffeithiau hynny?

**Glyn Davies:** Ydw, ac mae'n wir, os byddwn yn cynnwys y sector preifat, byddwn yn cael mwy am lai, sy'n rhywbeth a gofiai o araith Mark.

Gwelaf na fydd y Dirprwy Lywydd yn caniatáu imi ddefnyddio llawer mwy o amser, ond y pwynt cyffredinol yr hoffwn ei wneud am yr holl faterion hyn, gan gynnwys mater y gronfa bensiwn, yw hyn: os byddant yn symleiddio'r broses o brynu ail gartrefi, ac os na chaiff y tai hynny eu cynnig i gefnogi'r farchnad rhentu preifat, byddaf innau yn eu gwrthwynebu hefyd. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf wedi fy argyhoeddi y bydd hynny'n digwydd.

O ran gwerthu tai cyngor, nid wyf o



do not necessarily accept that it has removed affordable housing. It has reduced the amount of housing that the public sector has to manage; I accept that, but I do not think that it has affected the amount of affordable housing. What we need to do is ask how we can use the private sector to deal with all the problems that we face. How can we work in partnership with it? How can we stimulate the massive enterprise and invention that exists right through the private sector to deal with every problem that we have in our country? There is no bigger problem than this.

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** A considerable number of points have been raised in this debate. I will review the Record of Proceedings to look at some of the useful suggestions that have been made. Leanne began by talking about statistics, and on some of these issues, the statistics still speak for themselves. I am aware of the recent research into affordability and of the briefing papers produced by the Chartered Institute of Housing. I fully appreciate how overheated the market has become in rural Wales and in Cardiff. However, it should be apparent that authorities are fully equipped to deal with some of these issues. Whether individual authorities give sufficient priority to meeting their housing needs is a matter for debate, as is whether local authorities are fully using their powers under planning. I will be reinforcing our expectations, and those of the whole Assembly, of this area in the housing summit at the end of the month.

With reference to some of the planning issues, my colleague Carwyn Jones was present for the whole debate, and we have discussed at length which issues we can look at on the planning agenda and how we can discuss them with local authorities. With him, I will look in a positive manner at the comments on planning that were raised in the debate.

When we talk about the Welsh language issues, of which I am acutely aware, of the 24 development plans in Wales, 11 authorities have produced a specific policy relating to

reidrwydd yn derbyn ei fod wedi dileu tai fforddiadwy. Mae wedi lleihau nifer y tai y mae'n rhaid i'r sector cyhoeddus eu rheoli; derbyniaf hynny, ond ni chredaf ei fod wedi effeithio ar nifer y tai fforddiadwy. Yr hyn y mae angen inni ei wneud yw gofyn sut y gallwn ddefnyddio'r sector preifat i fynd i'r afael â'r holl broblemau a wynebwn. Sut y gallwn weithio mewn partneriaeth? Sut y gallwn ysgogi'r fenter a'r dyfeisgarwch anferth sy'n bodoli drwy'r sector preifat i fynd i'r afael â phob problem sydd gennym yn ein gwlad? Nid oes problem fwy na hynny.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** Codwyd nifer sylweddol o bwyntiau yn ystod y ddadl hon. Byddaf yn adolygu Cofnod y Trafodion i edrych ar rai o'r awgrymiadau defnyddiol a wnaed. Dechreuodd Leanne drwy sôn am ystadegau, ac o ran rhai o'r materion hynny mae'r ystadegau'n dal i siarad drostynt eu hunain. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r gwaith ymchwil yn ddiweddar i fforddiadwyedd a'r papurau briffio a gynhyrchwyd gan y Sefydliad Tai Siartredig. Yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi'n llwyr y graddau y mae'r farchnad yng Nghymru wledig a Chaerdydd wedi gordwymo. Fodd bynnag, dylai fod yn amlwg fod gan awdurdodau y gallu i fynd i'r afael â rhai o'r materion hyn. Mater i'w drafod yw a yw awdurdodau unigol yn rhoi digon o flaenoriaeth i ddiwallu eu hanghenion tai, ac a yw awdurdodau lleol yn defnyddio'u pwerau cynllunio yn llawn. Byddaf yn atgyfnerthu ein disgwyliadau, ynghyd â rhai'r Cynulliad, o'r maes hwn yn yr uwchgynhadledd tai ar ddiwedd y mis.

O ran rhai o'r materion cynllunio, yr oedd Carwyn Jones, fy nghyd-Weinidog, yn bresennol ar gyfer yr holl ddadl, ac yr ydym wedi trafod yn drwyadl y materion y gallwn eu hystyried ar yr agenda cynllunio a'r ffordd y gallwn eu trafod gydag awdurdodau lleol. Gydag ef, byddaf yn edrych yn gadarnhaol ar y sylwadau ar gynllunio a godwyd yn y ddadl.

Wrth drafod materion yn ymwneud â'r iaith Gymraeg, materion yr wyf yn ymwybodol iawn ohonynt, o'r 24 o gynlluniau datblygu yng Nghymru mae 11 awdurdod wedi

planning and the Welsh language, which is good news. Many refer in their development plans to the production of supplementary planning guidance to support the policy, but have been waiting for Welsh language research to come forward to do it. There is a consortium involved in doing this work. Therefore, the Welsh language is high on the agenda in our discussions on the link between that and some housing issues.

Others have spoken about the agenda on homelessness. Tackling homelessness is one of this Government's priorities, but I will not take any lectures on statistics from 1993 to 1997, which somebody mentioned. We have changed the priority categories in Wales. We have been honest and open about the way that we measure homelessness, which has meant that the figures have gone up. I hope that they will now come down. We have focused in the review of our strategy on how to deal with these issues.

I also do not intend to take any lectures on budgetary priorities and finance, because the social housing grant started to slip during the Tory period. Since I have had responsibility, and particularly since the last budget round, social housing funding has started to increase. It is important to recognise that.

Much has been made of the issue of affordability. I will not take any lectures on the marketplace and how it is affecting affordability from certain parties who have always been such friends of the market. However, I was taken by Mick's thoughtful contribution about how difficult it is to look at these arguments as single issues, from second homes to affordability. They go across so many portfolios and involve so many things that are not within our control. On the right to buy, Peter and Lorraine spoke about the difficulties experienced in Cardiff and other places.

4.30 p.m.

Would it not be nice if there were no right to

cynhyrchu polisi penodol yn ymwneud â chynllunio a'r iaith Gymraeg, sy'n newyddion da. Mae nifer ohonynt yn cyfeirio yn eu cynlluniau datblygu at gynhyrchu canllawiau cynllunio atodol i ategu'r polisi, ond wedi bod yn aros am waith ymchwil ar yr iaith Gymraeg gael ei wneud. Mae consortiwm yn rhan o'r gwaith hwn. Felly, mae'r iaith Gymraeg yn uchel ar yr agenda yn ein trafodaethau ar y cysylltiad rhwng hynny a rhai materion tai.

Mae eraill wedi sôn am yr agenda ar gyfer pobl ddigartref. Mae mynd i'r afael â nifer y bobl sy'n ddigartref yn un o flaenoriaethau'r Llywodraeth hon, ond ni wrandawaf ar unrhyw bregeth am ystadegau o 1993 i 1997 y soniodd rhywun amdanynt. Yr ydym wedi newid y categorïau blaenoriaeth yng Nghymru. Yr ydym wedi bod yn onest ac yn agored am y ffordd yr ydym yn mesur digartrefedd, sy'n golygu bod y ffigurau wedi cynyddu. Gobeithio y byddant yn gostwng yn awr. Yn ein hadolygiad o'n strategaeth, yr ydym wedi canolbwyntio ar y ffordd i fynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn.

Ni fwriadaf wrando ar unrhyw bregeth ychwaith ar flaenoriaethau cyllideb a chyllid, gan fod y grant tai cymdeithasol wedi dechrau llithro yn ystod cyfnod y Ceidwadwyr. Ers i mi fod yn gyfrifol, ac yn arbennig ers y cylch cynllunio cyllideb diwethaf, mae cyllid tai cymdeithasol wedi dechrau cynyddu. Mae'n bwysig cydnabod hynny.

Bu llawer o drafod ar fater gallu fforddio tai. Ni wrandawaf ar unrhyw bregeth am y farchnad a'r ffordd y mae'n effeithio ar fforddiadwyedd, gan rai carfanau sydd bob amser wedi bod mor hoff o'r farchnad. Fodd bynnag, fe'm trawyd gan gyfraniad ystyrllon Mick ynglŷn ag anhawster edrych ar y dadleuon hyn fel materion unigol, o ail gartrefi i fforddiadwyedd. Maent yn pontio cynifer o bortffolios ac yn cynnwys cynifer o bethau nad oes gennym reolaeth drostynt. O ran yr hawl i brynu, soniodd Peter a Lorraine am yr anawsterau y mae pobl wedi eu hwynebu yng Nghaerdydd a mannau eraill.

Oni fyddai'n braf pe na fyddai hawl i brynu

buy and if it could be suspended? That would help in part with the housing markets in that area.

Mick always raises the point—and I have to address it here in Plenary—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You need to wind up.

**Edwina Hart:** This is the issue of homebuy. I have promised that, as we are reviewing the low-cost housing ownership scheme, we will consider that. I will pick up the other points, if I may, when I look to do a further report on housing in committee.

ac y gellid ei hatal? Byddai hynny'n helpu i ryw raddau gyda'r marchnadoedd tai yn y maes hwnnw.

Mae Mick yn codi'r pwynt bob amser—a rhaid imi fynd i'r afael ag ef yma yn y Cyfarfod Llawn—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae angen ichi gau pen y mwdwl.

**Edwina Hart:** Mae hyn yn ymwneud â'r hawl i brynu. Gan ein bod yn adolygu cynllun perchnogaeth tai rhad, yr wyf wedi addo y byddwn yn ystyried hynny. Byddaf yn ymdrin â'r pwyntiau eraill, os gallaf, wrth baratoi adroddiad pellach ar dai ar gyfer y pwyllgor.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 1: For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val

Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbynwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
 Amendment 2: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 15, Ymatal 9, Yn erbyn 29.  
 Amendment 3: For 15, Abstain 9, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Davies, Janet  
German, Michael  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Melding, David  
Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 38.  
Amendment 4: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 38.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Davies, Janet  
German, Michael  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Francis, Lisa  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 15, Ymatal 38, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 5: For 15, Abstain 38, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Davies, Janet  
German, Michael  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 10, Ymatal 43, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 6: For 10, Abstain 43, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Davies, Janet  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue

Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 15, Ymatal 8, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 7: For 15, Abstain 8, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Davies, Janet  
German, Michael  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl



Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Melding, David  
Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 8: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 38.*  
*Amendment 8: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 38.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Davies, Janet  
German, Michael  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*

*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 9: O blaid 44, Ymatal 9, Yn erbyn 1.  
Amendment 9: For 44, Abstain 9, Against 1.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Melding, David  
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Pugh, Alun

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 10: O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 9.  
Amendment 10: For 45, Abstain 0, Against 9.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Melding, David  
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 11: O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 11: For 54, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 12: O blaid 25, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 12: For 25, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine

Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 13: O blaid 25, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
 Amendment 13: For 25, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 14: O blaid 25, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 14: For 25, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

Cynnig NDM2494 wedi'i ddiwygio:  
Motion NDM2494 as amended:

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

- 1. expresses concern at the difficulties facing a growing number of people in accessing the housing market across Wales;*
- 2. accepts that it is for local authorities to identify their own housing requirements and priorities in the light of local circumstances;*
- 3. notes the practical measures taken by the Assembly Government in addressing these issues;*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

- 1. yn mynegi pryder ynghylch y trafferthion a wynebwr gan nifer cynyddol o bobl i gael mynediad i'r farchnad dai ledled Cymru;*
- 2. yn derbyn mai mater i awdurdodau lleol yw nodi eu gofynion a'u blaenoriaethau eu hunain o ran tai, yng ngoleuni amgylchiadau lleol;*
- 3. yn nodi'r camau ymarferol a gymerwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i roi sylw i'r materion hyn;*

- |   |  |
|---|--|
| <p>4. <i>deplores New Labour's support for the new pension funds, self-invested personal pensions (SIPPs), which will enable the wealthy to own and profit from second homes ownership in Wales while many people in Wales are living in unfit accommodation or spending an increasing amount of their income on housing;</i></p> | <p>4. <i>yn gresynu at gefnogaeth Llafur Newydd i'r cronfeydd pensiwn newydd, pensiynau personol hunan-fuddsoddi (SIPPs), a fydd yn galluogi'r cyfoethog i fod yn berchen ar ail gartrefi yng Nghymru ac elwa ohonynt, tra mae nifer o bobl yng Nghymru yn byw mewn tai anaddas neu'n gwario swm cynyddol o'u hincwm ar dai;</i></p> |
| <p>5. <i>calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to make representations to the UK government for properties in Wales to be excluded from SIPPs;</i></p>   | <p>5. <i>yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gyflwyno sylwadau i lywodraeth y DU i eiddo yng Nghymru gael eu heithrio o SIPP;</i></p>  |
| <p>6. <i>calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to encourage and promote the formation of community housing trusts;</i></p>   | <p>6. <i>yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i annog a hyrwyddo creu ymddiriedolaethau tai cymunedol;</i></p>  |
| <p>7. <i>calls for restrictions on the right to buy in areas of high demand; and</i></p>  | <p>7. <i>yn galw am gyfyngiadau ar yr hawl i brynu mewn ardaloedd lle mae galw mawr; ac</i></p>  |
| <p>8. <i>calls on the Assembly Government to support and encourage local planning authorities in engendering greater flexibility for different affordable housing planning policies to be developed.</i></p>  | <p>8. <i>yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gefnogi ac annog awdurdodau cynllunio lleol i greu mwy o hyblygrwydd ar gyfer datblygu gwahanol bolisiau cynllunio ar dai fforddiadwy.</i></p>  |

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 9.  
Amended motion: For 43, Abstain 0, Against 9.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Melding, David  
Williams, Brynle

Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
 Amended motion carried.*

### **Dadl Fer Short Debate**

#### **A Fydd Carthu'n Dinistrio'r Ardal o Harddwch Naturiol Eithriadol Gyntaf yn y DU? Will Dredging Destroy the UK's First Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty?**

**Alun Cairns:** According to the custom of the short debate, I have agreed to allow Edwina Hart, Peter Black and Dai Lloyd to speak for a minute each.

**Alun Cairns:** Yn unol ag arfer y ddadl fer, yr wyf wedi cytuno i adael i Edwina Hart, Peter Black a Dai Lloyd siarad am funud yr un.

Under the title of this debate, 'Will Dredging Destroy the UK's First Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty?', there are two main issues that I wish address and that I ask the Minister to respond to. The first issue relates to recognising Gower's fiftieth anniversary as the UK's first area of outstanding natural beauty and the significance of that event. The second is about drawing attention to the continued impact of dredging on the coastline.

O dan deitl y ddadl hon, 'A fydd Carthu'n Dinistrio'r Ardal o Harddwch Naturiol Eithriadol Gyntaf yn y DU?', yr wyf am fynd i'r afael â dau brif fater a gofyn i'r Gweinidog ymateb iddynt. Mae'r mater cyntaf yn ymwneud â chydabod hanner canmlwyddiant dynodi Penrhyn Gŵyr yn ardal o harddwch naturiol eithriadol gyntaf y DU, ac arwyddocâd y digwyddiad hwnnw. Mae'r ail fater yn ymwneud â thynnu sylw at effaith barhaus carthu ar yr arfordir.

4.40 p.m.

The National Parks and Countryside Act 1949 called for areas with particular qualities to be identified as areas of outstanding natural beauty and to be preserved for the benefit of the nation. An area of outstanding natural beauty is labelled as such because it combines precious landscape with beauty, almost giving it a personality of its own. Since Gower became the first AONB in 1956, 41 further areas have been identified in England and Wales.

Yr oedd Deddf Parciau Cenedlaethol a Chefn Gwlad 1949 yn galw am ddynodi ardaloedd ag iddynt nodweddion arbennig yn ardaloedd o harddwch naturiol eithriadol, a'u cadw er budd y genedl. Caiff ardal ei dynodi yn ardal o harddwch naturiol eithriadol oherwydd ei bod yn cyfuno tirwedd werthfawr â harddwch, sy'n golygu bod gan yr ardal bron ei phersonoliaeth ei hun. Ers i Benrhyn Gŵyr gael ei ddynodi'n ardal o harddwch naturiol eithriadol yn 1956, mae 41 o ardaloedd eraill wedi'u dynodi yng Nghymru a Lloegr.



Gower's designation is made up of 73 square miles of breathtaking seascape, landscape, cliff tops, expansive beaches, excellent agricultural land and a number of distinct individual communities. Each individual part of Gower has certain aspects that contribute to the entire area and its designation as an AONB. The area contains breathtaking limestone scenery and large woodlands and valleys lined with stone-faced banks and complemented by Norman castles. Views seen from Mumbles and Wormshead leave people speechless. Gower also experiences the second highest tidal rise and fall in the world. An ever-changing climate and microclimates give the area the ability to grow over a 1,000 species of flora, some of which are unique to the peninsula. These act as a magnet to much wildlife, with many different species of birds nesting in one of Gower's 21 nature reserves or along the heritage coastline. The scientific community also recognises 27 different areas as sites of special scientific interest.

With such fantastic natural resources, there is little wonder that Gower was designated as an AONB. Tourists flock to the area for the views and wildlife and the great beaches to explore. The coastline offers magical properties and some of the most attractive beaches in Europe. There is little wonder, therefore, that the potential loss of sand along the coastline is so alarming and such a worry to locals and visitors alike.

Most sand in the Gower is dredged from the Helwick Bank, one of the largest sandbanks in Britain, which is a short distance from the Port Eynon to Wormshead coastline. In the 27 years prior to 1991, 741,000 tonnes of sand were dredged from the Helwick Bank. In the nine years up to 1999, 524,000 tonnes were dredged. Sand has been dredged from the bank for more than 100 years and, unfortunately, accurate records over the century are not available. However, over the short periods that I have mentioned, well over 1 million tonnes of sand have been dredged from the Helwick Bank. That equates to an area the size of an average football field, 100m deep. If we take into account all of the sand that has been dredged from the Bristol Channel, it amounts to 21 million tonnes,

Mae dynodiad Penrhyn Gŵyr yn cwmpasu 73 milltir sgwâr o forlun, tirlun, clogwyni, traethau helaeth, tir amaethyddol rhagorol a nifer o gymunedau unigol hynod. Mae i bob rhan o Benrhyn Gŵyr agweddau penodol sy'n cyfrannu at yr ardal gyfan a'i dynodiad yn ardal o harddwch naturiol eithriadol. Mae'r ardal yn cynnwys tirlun calchfaen ysbennydd a choetiroedd mawr, a dyffrynnoedd ag iddynt lethrau creigiog gyda chestyll Normanaidd yn goron ar y cwbl. Caiff pobl eu syfrdanu gan y golygfeydd o'r Mwmbwls a Phen Pyrod. Ym Mhenrhyn Gŵyr mae'r lefelau llanwol ail isaf ac uchaf yn y byd. Mae hinsawdd a microhinsoddau sy'n newid yn gyson yn golygu y gall dros 1,000 o fathau o fflora dyfu yn yr ardal, rai ohonynt yn unigryw i'r penrhyn. Mae'r rhain yn denu llawer iawn o fywyd gwylt, a bydd nifer o wahanol rywogaethau o adar yn nythu yn un o'r 21 o warchodfeydd natur ar Benrhyn Gŵyr, neu ar hyd yr arfordir treftadaeth. Mae'r gymuned wyddonol hefyd wedi dynodi 27 o wahanol ardaloedd yn safleoedd o ddiddordeb gwyddonol arbennig.

Gydag adnoddau naturiol mor wych, nid rhyfedd fod Penrhyn Gŵyr gael ei ddynodi'n ardal o harddwch naturiol eithriadol. Mae twristiaid yn heidio i'r ardal i fwynhau'r golygfeydd, y bywyd gwylt a'r traethau gwych. Ar yr arfordir mae tai hudolus a rhai o draethau harddaf Ewrop. Nid yw'n syndod felly fod trigolion lleol ac ymwelwyr fel ei gilydd yn pryderu'n fawr am y posibilrwydd y bydd tywod yn diflannu ar hyd yr arfordir.

Caiff y rhan fwyaf o dywod ym Mhenrhyn Gŵyr ei garthu o Helwick Bank, un o'r banciau tywod mwyaf ym Mhrydain, nid nepell o'r morlin o Borth Eynon i Ben Pyrod. Yn ystod y 27 mlynedd cyn 1991, carthwyd 741,000 o dunelli metrig o dywod o Helwick Bank. Yn y naw mlynedd hyd at 1999, carthwyd 524,000 o dunelli metrig. Mae tywod wedi ei garthu o'r banc ers dros 100 mlynedd, ac yn anffodus nid oes cofnodion cywir dros y ganrif ar gael. Fodd bynnag, dros y cyfnodau byr a grybwyllais, mae dros 1 filiwn o dunelli metrig o dywod wedi'u carthu o Helwick Bank. Mae hynny'n cyfateb i faint cae pêl-droed arferol 100m o ddyfnder. Os ystyriwn yr holl dywod a garthwyd o Fôr Hafren, sef 21 miliwn o dunelli metrig, mae hynny'n cyfateb i faint cae pêl-droed arferol,

which is equivalent to an area the size of an average football field, a mile and a quarter deep.

On some areas of beaches, the level of sand loss is blatantly obvious. Rocks that have never been seen before are now visible. On some formerly sandy beaches, sand has been replaced by pebbles. The Helwick Bank plays an important part in protecting the Gower coastline from the full force of the tide. It also helps disperse the energy of a strong current against the beaches at low tide, and, at high tide, it plays a part in preventing cliff erosion.

Tourism plays a major part in the Gower economy. The growth in the short breaks market has allowed it to become a year-round resort, offering fantastic facilities for walkers and cyclists and for other activity holidays. It was a delight to see one of Gower's famous hostelrys, the King Arthur Hotel, included in this year's list of Wales's fastest growing 50 businesses. If sand dredging continues, these once beautiful and heavily populated areas could be destroyed forever. The economic impact would be devastating, but the environmental consequences would be unthinkable.

This debate also provides an opportunity to recognise the Welsh Assembly Government's plans to hold a public inquiry into the latest licence application to continue dredging off the Helwick Bank. At long last, the campaign by thousands of people in Gower and the wider community has, at least, had some impact.

I will never forget a Government official at a presentation some years ago stating that the marine currents and sand movements were a dynamic, complex environment that they were trying to understand.

That shows that we are not clear as to the impact. The available evidence clearly highlights that a precautionary approach should be taken. The obligation should be on the dredgers to prove that their activities do not have an impact, rather than the other way

filltir a chwarter o ddyfnder.

Ar rai traethau mae lefel y tywod a gollwyd yn gwbl amlwg. Mae creigiau na welwyd erioed o'r blaen bellach yn y golwg. Ar rai traethau a oedd unwaith yn draethau tywod, mae cerrig bellach. Mae Helwick Bank yn bwysig i ddiogelu morlin Penrhyn Gŵyr rhag grym y llanw. Mae hefyd yn helpu lliniaru grym cerrynt cryf yn erbyn y traethau ar lanw isel, ac ar lanw uchel mae'n atal erydu clogwyni.

Mae twristiaeth yn amlwg yn economi Penrhyn Gŵyr. Mae'r twf yn y farchnad gwyliau byr yn golygu fod yr ardal wedi datblygu'n gyrchfan drwy gydol y flwyddyn, gan gynnig cyfleusterau gwych i gerddwyr a beicwyr, ac ar gyfer gwyliau gweithgaredd eraill. Roedd yn bleser gweld un o westai enwocaf Penrhyn Gŵyr, Gwesty King Arthur, yn cael ei gynnwys yn un o'r 50 o fusnesau yng Nghymru sy'n tyfu gyflymaf. Os bydd carthu tywod yn parhau, gallai'r ardaloedd hardd a phoblog hyn gael eu dinistrio am byth. Byddai'r effaith economaidd yn ddinistriol, ond byddai'r canlyniadau amgylcheddol y tu hwnt i bob amgylfred.

Mae'r ddadl hon hefyd yn gyfle i gydnabod cynlluniau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wneud ymchwiliad cyhoeddus i'r cais diweddaraf am drwydded i barhau i garthu tywod ar Helwick Bank. O'r diwedd, mae'r ymgyrch gan filoedd o bobl ym Mhenrhyn Gŵyr a'r gymuned ehangach wedi cael rhywfaint o effaith.

Nid anghofiaf fyth glywed swyddog o'r Llywodraeth mewn cyflwyniad rai blynyddoedd yn ôl yn dweud bod ceryntau morol a symudiadau tywod yn amgylchedd deinamig a chymhleth yr oeddent yn ceisio'i ddeall.

Dengys hynny nad ydym yn deall yr effaith yn iawn. Mae'n amlwg fod y dystiolaeth sydd ar gael yn tynnu sylw at y ffaith y dylid bod yn ofalus iawn. Dylai fod yn ofynnol i'r rheini sy'n cymryd y tywod brofi nad yw eu gweithgareddau'n cael effaith, yn hytrach nag

around.

It is interesting to note that the company driving the application is Llanelli Dredging, a subsidiary of the Dutch company, Royal Boskalis Westminster. What is wrong with that? Absolutely nothing at first glance, until you understand that the Netherlands does not allow dredging within 20 km of its coastline. It clearly highlights the precautionary approach that is being taken in the Netherlands.

Let me bring my contribution to this debate to a close. Gower is one of the UK's most beautiful areas, with some of the best beaches in Europe. Next year will be the fiftieth anniversary of its designation as the UK's first area of outstanding natural beauty. Surely, we should celebrate that with a festival of events. There should be a co-ordinated approach to highlight the fantastic environment that is on our doorstep. With this in mind, I approached the First Minister, the chief executive of the Wales Tourist Board and the leader of the local authority last July to ask what plans were afoot. It was clear that nothing had been thought through, and there is now a scramble to get something underway. All the tourism brochures and calendars have already been published or are at the printers. A great opportunity has been missed. All credit to Cardiff, it certainly made the most of its celebration of 100 years as a city and 50 years as the capital city of Wales. Such a series of events should already be organised to run throughout next year to celebrate the fiftieth anniversary of Gower's becoming the UK's first area of outstanding natural beauty.

**Edwina Hart:** As someone who was born and brought up in Gower, and as the Assembly Member for Gower, I have witnessed the drastic changes to our beaches, and welcome the opportunity to contribute this afternoon. I also welcome the Minister's recent announcement of a public inquiry. The Save Our Sands campaign previously presented us with a petition of over 30,000 signatures, and the Gower Society has been proactive. Visitors' views are very important as it is a tourist area, and the Gower AONB

fel arall.

Mae'n ddiddorol sylwi mai'r cwmni sy'n hybu'r cais yw Llanelli Dredging, un o is-gwmnïau Royal Boskalis Westminster o'r Iseldiroedd. Beth sydd o'i le ar hynny? Dim byd ar yr olwg gyntaf, nes ichi ddeall nad yw'r Iseldiroedd yn caniatáu carthu o fewn 20km i'w harfordir. Mae'n tynnu sylw'n amlwg at y camau gofal yn yr Iseldiroedd.

Dof â'm cyfraniad i'r ddadl hon i ben. Mae Penrhyn Gŵyr yn un o ardaloedd harddaf y DU, ac mae yma rai o'r traethau gorau yn Ewrop. Y flwyddyn nesaf, bydd yn hanner canrif ers dynodi'r lle yn ardal o harddwch naturiol eithriadol gyntaf y DU. Mae'n sicr y dylem ddathlu hynny gyda gŵyl o ddigwyddiadau. Dylid mynd ati mewn ffordd gydgyssylltiedig i dynnu sylw at yr amgylchedd gwych sydd yn ein milltir sgwâr. O gofio hyn, cysylltais â'r Prif Weinidog, prif weithredwr Bwrdd Croeso Cymru ac arweinydd yr awdurdod lleol fis Gorffennaf diwethaf i ofyn pa gynlluniau a oedd ar y gweill. Yr oedd yn amlwg nad oedd dim byd wedi'i ystyried, ac mae bellach yn dipyn o frys i drefnu rhywbeth. Mae pob un o'r llyfrynnau a'r calendrau twristiaeth wedi'u cyhoeddi eisoes neu wrthi'n cael eu hargraffu. Mae cyfle gwych wedi'i golli. Pob clod i Gaerdydd: mae'n sicr ei bod wedi manteisio i'r eithaf ar ddathlu ei chanmlwyddiant fel dinas a'i hanner canmlwyddiant fel prifddinas Cymru. Dylid bod wedi trefnu cyfres o ddigwyddiadau o'r fath eisoes i'w cynnal drwy gydol y flwyddyn nesaf i ddathlu hanner canrif ers dynodi Penrhyn Gŵyr yn ardal harddwch naturiol eithriadol gyntaf y DU.

**Edwina Hart:** Fel un a gafodd ei geni a'i magu ym Mhenrhyn Gŵyr, ac fel Aelod y Cynulliad dros Wŷr, yr wyf wedi gweld y newidiadau mawr yn ein traethau, a chroesawaf y cyfle i gyfrannu y prynhawn yma. Croesawaf hefyd gyhoeddiad y Gweinidog yn ddiweddar i gynnal ymchwiliad cyhoeddus. Cyflwynodd yr ymgyrch Save Our Sands ddeiseb o fwy na 30,000 o enwau yn ddiweddar, ac mae Cymdeithas Penrhyn Gŵyr wedi cymryd rhan ragweithiol. Mae barn ymwelwyr yn

management has stated that the beaches and coastline feature strongly among the main reasons why people visit Gower. People are concerned that the dredging poses a risk. I am proud that Gower was the first designated AONB, and I am grateful that I live in beautiful surroundings. However, this is a complex issue and requires a precautionary-principle approach until we have a greater understanding of the environmental impact. We cannot afford to get it wrong for our future citizens.

**Peter Black:** I agree with Alun about the need to have a suitable commemoration of the fiftieth anniversary. To many people in Swansea, Gower seems to be tagged on; we need to get away from that view and look upon Gower not only as an integral part of the city and county of Swansea, but also as a major and very important area for the whole of Wales. The Assembly, the city council and all the other bodies that have a stake in Gower should be involved in celebrating that anniversary and the way that the designation has protected an extremely important part of the countryside of Wales.

The issue of protection is very important in the context of this debate. We have lost a lot of sand from the beaches of Gower as a result of dredging. I know that it is difficult to prove, but the perception of most people in the Swansea area and in south-west Wales is that that is what has happened. The dredging off the coast of Gower has had an impact. I welcome the public inquiry on the latest application. We need to look seriously at a proper precautionary approach to make sure that any dredging that takes place is a suitably long distance off the coast of Gower so that it does not have that impact in the future.

**David Lloyd:** Diolchaf i Alun am godi'r pwnc pwysig hwn a dangos ochr sensitif ei natur yn ei ddisgrifiadau o draethau Penrhyn Gŵyr. Cwestiwn ei ddadl oedd: a fydd carthu'n dinistrio ardal o harddwch naturiol eithriadol gyntaf y Deyrnas Unedig? Credaf y bydd. Yr wyf wedi ymgyrchu yn erbyn carthu ers blynyddoedd. Yn naturiol, mae dadleuon ar y ddwy ochr, ond drwy gael gwared ar garthu cawn weld a oes unrhyw effaith ar

bwysig iawn am mai ardal dwristaidd ydyw, ac mae rheolwyr AHNE Penrhyn Gŵyr wedi dweud bod y traethau a'r arfordir ymhlith y prif resymau pam y mae pobl yn ymweld â Phenrhyn Gŵyr. Mae pobl yn pryderu bod y gwaith carthu yn achosi perygl. Yr wyf yn falch mai Penrhyn Gŵyr oedd yr AHNE gyntaf i'w dynodi, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar fy mod yn byw mewn lle hardd. Fodd bynnag, mae hwn yn fater cymhleth ac mae angen bod yn ofalus nes inni ddeall yn well yr effaith ar yr amgylchedd. Ni allwn fforddio gwneud camgymeriad ar ran dinasyddion y dyfodol.

**Peter Black:** Cytunaf ag Alun fod angen dathlu canmlwyddiant dynodi Penrhyn Gŵyr yn AHNE. I nifer o bobl yn Abertawe, mae Penrhyn Gŵyr fel pe bae'n atodiad; mae angen inni ddileu'r farn honno ac ystyried Penrhyn Gŵyr yn rhan annatod o ddinas a sir Abertawe, yn ogystal â bod yn ardal bwysig iawn i Gymru gyfan. Dylai'r Cynulliad, Cyngor y Ddinas a'r holl gyrff eraill sydd â diddordeb ym Mhenrhyn Gŵyr gymryd rhan yn y digwyddiadau i ddathlu hynny a'r ffordd y mae'r dynodiad wedi diogelu rhan bwysig iawn o gefn gwlad Cymru.

Mae diogelwch yn bwysig iawn yng nghydestun y ddadl hon. Yr ydym wedi colli llawer o dywod o draethau Penrhyn Gŵyr oherwydd carthu. Gwn ei bod yn anodd profi hynny, ond canfyddiad y rhan fwyaf o bobl yn ardal Abertawe ac yn y De-orllewin yw mai dyna sydd wedi digwydd. Mae carthu oddi ar arfordir Penrhyn Gŵyr wedi cael effaith. Croesawaf yr ymchwiliad cyhoeddus i'r cais diweddaraf. Mae angen inni ystyried o ddifrif ymagwedd ofalus briodol er mwyn sicrhau y bydd unrhyw waith carthu yn digwydd yn ddigon pell o arfordir Penrhyn Gŵyr, i sicrhau na fydd yn cael yr effaith honno yn y dyfodol.

**David Lloyd:** I thank Alun for raising this important issue, and for showing his sensitive nature in his description of the beaches of the Gower Peninsula. The question of his debate was: will dredging destroy the first area of outstanding natural beauty in the United Kingdom? I believe it will. I have campaigned against dredging for many years. Naturally, there are arguments on both sides, but by getting rid of dredging we shall see

draethau hyfryd Penrhyn Gŵyr dros gyfnod o amser.

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** I thank Alun for bringing this matter before the National Assembly.

4.50 p.m.

Unfortunately, my response has to be uncharacteristically short, because there is little that I can say specifically with regard to the public inquiry regarding Helwick Bank, or about any other application that would come before me as a Minister, at this stage.

First, I will deal with the easy part, about whether I would recognise and celebrate with Alun and other speakers the fiftieth anniversary of Gower's becoming an area of outstanding natural beauty. That is easy enough to do, and we can all celebrate that. The Gower is unusual in many ways in that development seems to have passed it by, to its advantage. It has not seen urbanisation, even though it is so close to Swansea. As a result, the character of the peninsula has been largely preserved, including its social character. The Gower traditionally has seen a similar linguistic divide to Pembrokeshire, with its landsker line between the north and south, and that gives it quite an unusual history as far as Wales is concerned.

In terms of dredging generally, there are other applications for dredging in the Bristol Channel. I have no influence over what happens in English waters, which are close to the Gower and the beaches further east in Wales. There are currently three applications that are due to be determined, relating to Nobel Banks, North Middle Ground, and North Bristol Deep, which, despite its name, is in Welsh waters. Those are matters on which I cannot comment. Similarly, I cannot comment on Helwick Bank in terms of the potential outcome, because I have a role in decision making.

I will just explain what I felt was the important issue in terms of ordering a public

whether there is any effect on the beautiful beaches of the Gower Peninsula over time.

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Diolch Alun am ddod â'r mater hwn gerbron y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

Yn anffodus, rhaid i'm hymateb fod yn annodweddiadol o fyr, am nad oes llawer y gallaf ei ddweud yn benodol am yr ymchwiliad cyhoeddus ynghylch Helwick Bank, nac am unrhyw gais arall a fyddai'n dod ger fy mron fel Gweinidog, ar hyn o bryd.

Yn gyntaf, deliaf â'r rhan hawdd, sef a fyddwn yn cydnabod ac yn dathlu gydag Alun a siaradwyr eraill hanner canmlwyddiant dynodi Penrhyn Gŵyr yn ardal o harddwch naturiol eithriadol. Mae hynny'n ddigon hawdd i'w wneud, a gall pob un ohonom ddathlu hynny. Mae Penrhyn Gŵyr yn anghyffredin mewn llawer ffordd am fod datblygiad, rywsut, heb ei gyffwrdd, er budd i'r lle. Nid yw wedi'i drefoli, er ei fod mor agos i Abertawe. O ganlyniad, mae cymeriad Penrhyn Gŵyr wedi'i gadw i raddau helaeth, gan gynnwys ei gymeriad cymdeithasol. Yn draddodiadol, mae Penrhyn Gŵyr wedi gweld rhaniad ieithyddol tebyg i sir Benfro, gyda'i linell landsger rhwng y gogledd a'r de, ac mae hynny'n creu hanes digon anghyffredin yng nghyd-destun Cymru.

O ran carthu'n gyffredinol, mae yna geisiadau eraill i garthu ym Môr Hafren. Nid oes gennyf unrhyw ddylanwad dros yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn nyfroedd Lloegr, sy'n agos i Benrhyn Gŵyr a'r traethau ymhellach i'r dwyrain yng Nghymru. Mae tri chais wedi'u cyflwyno sydd i gael eu pendefynu, ar gyfer Nobel Banks, North Middle Ground, a North Bristol Deep. Mae hwnnw, er yr enw, yn nyfroedd Cymru. Ni allaf ddweud dim am y materion hynny. Yn yr un modd, ni allaf ddweud dim am Helwick Bank o ran y canlyniad posibl, am fod gennyf rôl yn y broses o wneud penderfyniad.

Egluraf yr hyn yr oeddwn yn teimlo'i fod yn fater pwysig o ran gorchymyn cynnal

inquiry into Helwick Bank. It has been clear to me for some time that a number of questions have been asked over the years, for and against the issue of sand dredging. While it has been said that there is no easy answer, I thought that it was important that we had a public inquiry to test the evidence that is available and to try to answer some of these questions. I also thought that it was important that many of those people who had a real interest in putting forward their point of view and in presenting evidence to an inquiry had the opportunity to do so, which is why the inquiry will take place, and more details will be made available in due course. It is a matter for the inspectorate, of course, as to how to set up the inquiry.

Llanelli Dredging's present consent expired on 22 October, so that company no longer has permission to dredge. As far as any inquiry is concerned, it is important that the inquiry is as comprehensive as possible and that as many interested people and parties as possible put forward their views and that the inquiry at least tries to provide answers to so many of those questions that have vexed people over the years.

That is the latest situation with regards to the inquiry. I regret that I cannot say anything more because of my position. I cannot prejudice my position in advance of any findings of such an inquiry or in relation to any other application that there might be to dredge in the area. However, I hope that as a result of the inquiry the situation at least becomes clearer and that information for decision makers is easier to understand and to examine than it has been in the past.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That concludes today's proceedings.

ymchwiliad cyhoeddus i Helwick Bank. Mae'n amlwg imi ers cryn amser fod nifer o gwestiynau wedi'u gofyn dros y blynyddoedd, o blaid ac yn erbyn carthu tywod. Er bod pobl wedi dweud nad oes ateb hawdd, credwn ei bod yn bwysig cynnal ymchwiliad cyhoeddus i brofi'r dystiolaeth sydd ar gael ac i geisio ateb rhai o'r cwestiynau hyn. Credwn hefyd ei bod yn bwysig i nifer o'r bobl hynny a oedd â diddordeb gwirioneddol mewn cyflwyno'u barn, a chyflwyno dystiolaeth i ymchwiliad, gael cyfle i wneud hynny. Dyna pam y cynhelir yr ymchwiliad, a bydd mwy o fanylion ar gael maes o law. Yr arolygiaeth, wrth gwrs, sy'n gyfrifol am y ffordd i drefnu'r ymchwiliad.

Daeth caniatâd presennol Llanelli Dredging i ben ar 22 Hydref. Felly, nid oes gan y cwmni hwnnw ganiatâd i garthu mwyach. O ran unrhyw ymchwiliad, mae'n bwysig i'r ymchwiliad fod mor gynhwysfawr â phosibl a bod cynifer â phosibl o bobl a charfanau sydd â diddordeb yn lleisio'u barn, a bod yr ymchwiliad o leiaf yn ceisio rhoi atebion i gynifer o'r cwestiynau hynny sydd wedi pryderu pobl dros y blynyddoedd.

Dyna'r sefyllfa ddiweddaraf o ran yr ymchwiliad. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf na allaf ddweud dim mwy oherwydd fy sefyllfa. Ni allaf beryglu fy sefyllfa cyn unrhyw ganfyddiadau gan ymchwiliad o'r fath, nac mewn cysylltiad ag unrhyw gais arall a allai gael ei gyflwyno i garthu yn yr ardal. Fodd bynnag, gobeithio y bydd y sefyllfa o leiaf yn gliriach a bod y wybodaeth i'r rhai sy'n gwneud penderfyniadau yn haws ei deall a'i harchwilio nag yn y gorffennol, o ganlyniad i'r ymchwiliad.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 4.53 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 4.53 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau  
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)

Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Law, Peter (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)