



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mercher, 28 Medi 2005**

**Wednesday, 28 September 2005**

**Cynnwys  
Contents**

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services .....	3
Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon Questions to the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport.....	18
Cwestiynau i Bwyllgor y Tŷ Questions to the House Committee .....	33
Datganiad Busnes Diwygiedig Revised Business Statement .....	33
Datganiad ar Wasanaethau'r Heddlu yn Lloegr a Chymru Statement on Police Services in England and Wales .....	35
Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order .....	53
Achosion E. coli yng Nghymru E.coli Outbreaks in Wales .....	54
Adroddiad Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefн Gwlad: Trydydd Ymchwiliad— Bodloni Targedau Tirlenwi ac Ailgylchu The Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee's Report: Third Inquiry—Meeting Landfill and Recycling Targets .....	75
Cyllideb Ddrafft Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad The Assembly Parliamentary Service's Draft Budget.....	91

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y Siambwr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair*

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services**

### **Dyrannu Meddygon Teulu Allocation of GPs**

**Q1 Mark Isherwood:** Will the Minister make a statement on the allocation of general practitioners in Wales? OAQ0404(HSS)

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** The latest GP census data indicates that Wales has 1,816 GPs. Thirty three per cent of GPs are female and 21 per cent of GPs work part time. The average number of GPs per 10,000 of the population is 6.2, which is similar to the figure in England.

**Mark Isherwood:** What action do you propose to allocate GPs to women's refuges? I was told at a Women's Aid annual general meeting in north Wales during the recess that it can take seven to 10 days to allocate a GP to a woman or family arriving at a refuge in Wales, even though they may need treatment or a prescription urgently.

**Brian Gibbons:** You would not have a practice allocated to a Women's Aid centre, as patients at such a centre would register with a GP. If there were open lists in a particular area, those living in the centre could approach the practice in question to register, and, if there were closed lists, it would be necessary for them to approach the local health board with a view to allocation.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi gwneud ymrwymiad yngylch gallu pobl i weld eu meddyg teulu o fewn 24 awr. Mae hyn wedi arwain at sefyllfa lle mae nifer o feddygfeydd ddim ond yn barod i dderbyn apwyntiadau ar gyfer y diwrnod dan sylw. A ydych yn derbyn bod hyn yn rhwystro pobl rhag gweld meddyg teulu ar adegau gan nad ydynt yn gallu mynd i'r feddygfa ar y

**C1 Mark Isherwood:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddyrannu meddygon teulu yng Nghymru? OAQ0404(HSS)

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Mae data diweddaraf y cyfrifiad ar feddygon teulu yn dangos bod 1,816 o feddygon teulu yng Nghymru. Mae 33 y cant o feddygon teulu yn ferched ac mae 21 y cant ohonynt yn gweithio'n rhan amser. Nifer y meddygon teulu ar gyfartaledd i bob 10,000 o'r boblogaeth yw 6.2, sy'n debyg i'r ffigur yn Lloegr.

**Mark Isherwood:** Pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cynnig i ddyrannu meddygon teulu i lochesau i fenywod? Cefais fy hysbsu mewn cyfarfod cyffredinol blynnyddol o Gymorth i Fenywod yn y Gogledd yn ystod y toriad y gall gymryd rhwng saith a 10 diwrnod i ddyrannu meddyg teulu i fenyw neu deulu sy'n cyrraedd lloches yng Nghymru, er y gallai fod angen triniaeth neu bresgripsiwn arnynt ar frys.

**Brian Gibbons:** Ni fyddai practis yn cael ei ddyrannu i ganolfan Cymorth i Fenywod, gan y byddai cleifion mewn canolfan o'r fath yn cofrestru gyda meddyg teulu. Pe bai rhestru agored mewn ardal benodol, gallai'r rhai sy'n byw yn y ganolfan gysylltu â'r practis dan sylw er mwyn cofrestru, a, phe bai rhestru caeëdig, byddai angen iddynt gysylltu â'r bwrdd iechyd lleol er mwyn cael eu dyrannu.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** The Government has made a commitment to ensuring that people can see their GPs within 24 hours. This has led to a situation whereby many surgeries are only prepared to accept appointments for the day in question. Do you accept that this prevents people from seeing their GPs on occasion because they may not be able to attend on that day and surgeries will not

diwrnod hwnnw ac nad yw'r feddygfa yn fodlon gwneud apwyntiadau ar gyfer y diwrnodau canlynol?

**Brian Gibbons:** There is a requirement for patients to see an appropriate member of the primary healthcare team within 24 hours. A very mechanical operation of that requirement probably does not facilitate access, as you suggested. The National Leadership and Innovation Agency for Healthcare is working with practices across Wales to ensure that they follow best practice in relation to improving access, and I think that a significant minority of practices have attended the Nliah courses. If good practice is being implemented across Wales, the problem that you highlighted should not be happening.

arrange appointments for subsequent days?

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae gofyniad i gleifion weld aelod priodol o'r tîm gofal iechyd sylfaenol o fewn 24 awr. Mae'n debyg nad yw gweithredu gofyniad o'r fath mewn ffordd fecanyddol iawn yn hwyluso mynediad, fel y bu ichi awgrymu. Mae'r Asiantaeth Genedlaethol Arwain ac Arloesi mewn Gofal Iechyd yn gweithio gyda phractisau ledled Cymru i sicrhau eu bod yn dilyn arfer gorau o ran gwella mynediad, a chredaf fod lleiafrif sylweddol o'r practisau wedi dilyn cyrsiau'r Asiantaeth. Os yw arferion da yn cael eu gweithredu ledled Cymru, ni ddylai'r broblem a amlygwyd gennych godi.

### **Gwasanaethau Meddygon Teulu y Tu Allan i Oriau Arferol** **The Provision of GP Out-of-hours Services**

**Q2 Leanne Wood:** Will the Minister make a statement on the provision of GP out-of-hours services? OAQ0379(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Local health boards have been commissioning GP out-of-hours services since autumn 2004. The performance of these services has continued to improve, in line with the national standards laid down. I have visited a number of out-of-hours services and heard directly from LHBs how they are planning further improvements.

**C2 Leanne Wood:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddarparu gwasanaethau meddygon teulu y tu allan i oriau arferol? OAQ0379(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Bu byrddau iechyd lleol yn comisiynu gwasanaethau meddygon teulu y tu allan i oriau arferol ers hydref 2004. Mae perfformiad y gwasanaethau hyn wedi parhau i wella, yn unol â'r safonau cenedlaethol a bennwyd. Yr wyf wedi ymweld â nifer o wasanaethau y tu allan i oriau arferol ac wedi clywed yn uniongyrchol gan Fyrrdau Iechyd Lleol sut y maent yn cynllunio i wneud rhagor o welliannau.

**Leanne Wood:** You will be aware of the criticisms of the Auditor General for Wales and of the revelations made in last night's edition of *Taro Naw* regarding the GP out-of-hours contract in Cardiff. Checks made on the private company's financial background and clinical experience did not go far enough, and, effectively, the LHB was duped. I have received more than a dozen complaints about the service in Cardiff, and I am sure that other Members will have similar experience. However, you claim, Minister, that you have not received many complaints about the service. How can people be expected to have confidence in the GP out-of-hours service in Cardiff, and what do you intend to do about

**Leanne Wood:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol o feirniadaeth Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru a'r datgeliadau a wnaethpwyd yn rhifyn neithiwr o *Taro Naw* am y contract y tu allan i oriau arferol yng Nghaerdydd. Nid oedd y gwiriadau a wnaed ar gefndir ariannol a phrofiad clinigol y cwmni preifat yn ddigonol, ac, i bob pwrras, cafodd y Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol ei dwyllo. Yr wyf wedi derbyn mwy na dwsin o gwynion ynglŷn â'r gwasanaeth yng Nghaerdydd, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd gan Aelodau eraill brofiad tebyg. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych yn honni, Weinidog, nad ydych wedi derbyn llawer o gwynion ynghylch y gwasanaeth. Sut y gellir disgwyl i bobl ymddiried yn y gwasanaeth meddygon

the increase in the number of people accessing accident and emergency services because of lack of confidence in the out-of-hours service?

**Brian Gibbons:** There were several questions there. You are right that there was criticism in relation to the extent that the LHB checked on the financial stability of the company that secured the contract. The need to make further checks on the financial basis of companies providing out-of-hours services will have to be included in future guidance.

However, the number of complaints about the out-of-hours service from the clinical point of view is relatively small, particularly, as you yourself said, given that the demands on that service continue to increase. One reason why the number of complaints is low is because performance is improving. For example, the percentage of abandoned calls was 2.3 per cent when the service began; it is now down to 0.3 per cent. Triage within 60 minutes was 70 per cent when the service started; it is now 87 per cent. The number of calls answered within 60 seconds has increased from 90 per cent to 98 per cent. Therefore, there is consistent improvement. However, I agree that if people are not getting a good service, they should make a complaint. That is the only way to ensure feedback into the system so that the service can continue to improve. I would urge anyone who is unhappy about the quality of the service to lodge a complaint, so that the service will continue to improve.

**Leighton Andrews:** Do you accept that many of us are, from time to time, fielding complaints from constituents about out-of-hours services? Indeed, I will certainly be raising those complaints with my local health board when I next have a meeting with it. Do you agree that it is essential that local health boards strike tough deals with out-of-hours contract providers, and that they keep those services under constant review?

teulu y tu allan i oriau arferol yng Nghaerdydd, a beth yr ydych yn bwriadu ei wneud ynglŷn â'r cynnydd yn nifer y bobl sy'n defnyddio'r gwasanaethau damweiniau ac achosion brys oherwydd diffyg hyder yn y gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau arferol?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr oedd sawl cwestiwn gennych. Yr ydych yn gywir i ddweud y cafwyd beirniadaeth ynglŷn â'r graddau y bu i'r Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol wirio sefydlogrwydd ariannol y cwmni y rhoddwyd y contract iddo. Bydd angen cynnwys yr angen i gynnal gwiriadau pellach ar sefyllfa ariannol cwmniâu sy'n darparu gwasanaethau y tu allan i oriau arferol mewn canllawiau yn y dyfodol.

Fodd bynnag, mae nifer y cwynion ynglŷn â'r gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau arferol o safbwyt clinigol yn gymharol fach, yn arbennig, fel y bu ichi ddweud eich hun, o ystyried bod y galw ar y gwasanaeth hwn yn parhau i gynyddu. Un rheswm pam mae nifer y cwynion yn isel yw oherwydd bod perfformiad yn gwella. Er enghraift, yr oedd canran y galwadau y rhoddwyd y gorau iddynt cyn iddynt gael eu hateb yn 2.3 y cant pan ddechreuodd y gwasanaeth; mae bellach yn 0.3 y cant. Yr oedd 70 y cant o gleifion yn cael eu blaenoriaethu o fewn 60 munud pan ddechreuodd y gwasanaeth; mae'r ganran bellach yn 87 y cant. Mae nifer y galwadau a atebir o fewn 60 eiliad wedi cynyddu o 90 y cant i 98 y cant. Felly, mae gwelliant parhaus. Fodd bynnag, cytunaf y dylai pobl gwyno os nad ydynt yn cael gwasanaeth da. Dyna'r unig ffordd o sicrhau adborth i'r system er mwyn i'r gwasanaeth barhau i wella. Byddwn yn annog unrhyw un sy'n anfodlon ar ansawdd y gwasanaeth i gwyno, er mwyn sicrhau y bydd y gwasanaeth yn parhau i wella.

**Leighton Andrews:** A dderbyniwch fod llawer ohonom, o bryd i'w gilydd, yn derbyn cwynion gan etholwyr ynglŷn â gwasanaethau y tu allan i oriau arferol? Yn wir, byddaf yn sicr yn codi'r cwynion hynny gyda'm bwrdd iechyd lleol yn ein cyfarfod nesaf. A gytunwch ei bod yn hanfodol bod byrddau iechyd lleol yn gosod telerau llym ar ddarparwyr contractau y tu allan i oriau arferol, a'u bod yn adolygu'r gwasanaethau hynny yn gyson?

**Brian Gibbons:** There is a fairly strict list of requirements under the new out-of-hours contract, which, as I say, probably did not exist under the old out-of-hours contract. The general medical services contract for out-of-hours provision was not very prescriptive in the past. There are now clear standards against which we can measure performance, and we in the Assembly, and our regional offices, are managing this carefully to see that those improvements continue.

**Brian Gibbons:** Ceir rhestr o ofynion cymharol llym o dan y contract newydd ar gyfer gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau arferol, nad oedd, fel y dywedais, yn bodoli o dan yr hen contract y tu allan i oriau arferol yn ôl pob tebyg. Nid oedd y contract gwasanaethau meddygol cyffredinol ar gyfer y ddarpariaeth y tu allan i oriau gwaith yn benodol iawn yn y gorffennol. Mae safonau clir bellach ar gyfer mesur perfformiad, ac yr ydym ni yn y Cynulliad, a'n swyddfeydd rhanbarthol, yn rheoli hyn yn ofalus i sicrhau bod y gwelliannau hynny'n parhau.

**Jonathan Morgan:** The question, Minister, is whether there is existing guidance that is strong enough to support the role that local health boards play in the tendering process. The Wales Audit Office report referred to by Leanne Wood contained some very mixed messages: on the one hand, it criticised local health boards for not doing the necessary financial and clinical checks, but, on the other, it said that they followed the guidance for tendering and procurement processes. Therefore, does not part of the responsibility perhaps lie with the Assembly Government in terms of ensuring that the tendering and procurement process is tightened up?

**Jonathan Morgan:** Y cwestiwn, Weinidog, yw pa un a oes canllawiau presennol sy'n ddigon cryf i gefnogi'r rôl a chwaraeir gan fyrddau iechyd lleol yn y broses dendro. Yr oedd adroddiad Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru y cyfeiriwyd ato gan Leanne Wood yn cynnwys rhai negeseuon cymysg iawn: ar y naill law, yr oedd yn beirniadu byrddau iechyd lleol am beidio â chynnal y gwiriadau ariannol a chlinigol angenrheidiol, ond, ar y llaw arall, yr oedd yn dweud iddynt ddilyn y canllawiau ar gyfer y prosesau tendro a chaffael. Felly, onid yw rhan o'r cyfrifoldeb efallai yn gorwedd gyda Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn nhermau sicrhau bod y broses dendro a chaffael yn fwy cadarn?

**Brian Gibbons:** That is precisely what I said.

**Brian Gibbons:** Dyna'n union beth a ddywedais.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Do you accept responsibility?

**Jonathan Morgan:** A ydych yn derbyn y cyfrifoldeb?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. You are only allowed one supplementary, unless you are a party leader, which I do not believe you are yet.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Dim ond un cwestiwn atodol a ganiateir, oni bai eich bod yn arweinydd plaid, a chredaf nad ydych yn un eto.

### **Perfformiad Gwasanaethau Meddygon Teulu y Tu Allan i Oriau Arferol The Performance of GP Out-of-hours Services**

**Q3 Mick Bates:** Will the Minister make a statement on the performance of GP out-of-hours services in Montgomeryshire? OAQ0393(HSS)

**C3 Mick Bates:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am berfformiad gwasanaethau meddygon teulu y tu allan i oriau arferol yn sir Drefaldwyn? OAQ0393(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Most of the GP out-of-hours service in Montgomeryshire is provided by Shropdoc, which has been providing the service for about four years. Local

**Brian Gibbons:** Darperir y rhan fwyaf o'r gwasanaeth meddygon teulu y tu allan i oriau arferol yn sir Drefaldwyn gan Shropdoc, a fu'n darparu'r gwasanaeth ers tua phedair

arrangements also exist for two practices. The service is regularly monitored by the local health board, which commissioned the service against national standards. The level of performance is good.

blynedd. Mae trefniadau lleol yn bodoli hefyd ar gyfer dau bractis. Caiff y gwasanaeth ei fonitro'n rheolaidd gan y bwrdd iechyd lleol, a gomisiynodd y gwasanaeth yn erbyn safonau cenedlaethol. Mae'r perfformiad yn dda.

**Mick Bates:** You mentioned the level of performance, but I would first draw your attention to the fact that Shropdoc cost the Powys Local Health Board £0.9 million more than was allocated in its budget. I would also draw your attention to some joined-up thinking here. When Shropdoc delivers its services in Newtown, for example, the Newtown doctors do not deliver them. On pages 53 and 54 of your new document, 'Designed for Life', there is a section about the delivery of local acute services. We have no such services in Montgomeryshire. Is it not time that Montgomeryshire had such services? We do not have a district general hospital. Would you not agree that Montgomeryshire is an ideal place in which to carry out the recommendations in 'Designed for Life', and in which to see some outcomes in terms of the delivery of acute services?

**Mick Bates:** Bu ichi sôn am berfformiad, ond hoffwn dynnu eich sylw yn gyntaf at y ffaith bod Shropdoc yn costio £0.9 miliwn yn fwy i Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Powys na'r hyn a ddyrannwyd yn ei gyllideb. Hoffwn hefyd dynnu eich sylw at rywfaint o feddwl cydgysylltiedig yma. Pan fo Shropdoc yn darparu ei wasanaethau yn y Drenewydd, er enghraifft, nid meddygon y Drenewydd sy'n eu darparu. Ar dudalennau 53 a 54 o'ch dogfen newydd, 'Cynllun Oes', ceir adran ar gyflwyno gwasanaethau aciwt lleol. Nid oes gennym wasanaethau o'r fath yn sir Drefaldwyn. Onid yw'n bryd i sir Drefaldwyn gael gwasanaethau o'r fath? Nid oes gennym ysbty cyffredinol dosbarth. Oni fydddech yn cytuno bod sir Drefaldwyn yn lle delfrydol i weithredu argymhellion 'Cynllun Oes', a gweld rhai canlyniadau o ran darparu gwasanaethau aciwt?

**Brian Gibbons:** I am not sure what you are saying, to be honest. The vast majority of acute services are provided within normal hours by local general practitioners. There is an out-of-hours service, which caters for a minority of primary care emergency services, and I presume that that is what you are talking about.

**Brian Gibbons:** Nid wyf yn siŵr am beth yr ydych yn sôn, a dweud y gwir. Darperir y mwyafrif helaeth o wasanaethau aciwt o fewn oriau arferol gan feddygon teulu lleol. Mae gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau arferol ar gael, sy'n darparu ar gyfer lleiafrif o wasanaethau gofal sylfaenol brys, a thybiaf mai am hynny yr ydych yn sôn.

2.10 p.m.

The nature of the new contract is that GPs have the right to opt out of out-of-hours duty should they decide to exercise that right. If you are suggesting that it is Liberal Democrat policy for GPs not to have that right, that is fine; otherwise, I find it difficult to follow the point that you are making.

O dan y contract newydd, mae gan feddygon teulu yr hawl i eithrio o ddyletswydd y tu allan i oriau arferol os penderfynant arfer yr hawl honno. Os ydych yn awgrymu bod atal meddygon teulu rhag cael yr hawl honno yn un o bolisiau'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, mae hynny'n iawn; fel arall, yr wyf yn ei chael hi'n anodd i ddilyn y pwyt a wnewch.

**Lisa Francis:** Minister, how do you anticipate that the deficit of £1.4 million, recently identified in Powys Local Health Board's budget, will impact upon the future of GP out-of-hours services or the Shropdoc service in the area? Have you had any talks

**Lisa Francis:** Weinidog, sut yr ydych yn rhagweld y bydd y diffyg o £1.4 miliwn, a nodwyd yn ddiweddar yng nghyllideb Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Powys, yn effeithio ar ddyfodol gwasanaethau y tu allan i oriau arferol neu wasanaeth Shropdoc yn yr ardal? A ydych

with Powys Local Health Board about this, and do you anticipate that there will be any more funding streams available?

**Brian Gibbons:** We have given many millions in additional money to ensure that the GP out-of-hours service is in place. I am sure that you will be pleased to know that Powys, as was implicit in Mick Bates's question, was one of the most generously funded local health boards in Wales in terms of GP out-of-hours services, so Powys is particularly well off as regards the level of funding that it has received from the Welsh Assembly Government.

In addition to that, we are looking at total unscheduled care in the round from the context of delivering emergency care services—and I have mentioned the DECS project in the Health and Social Services Committee. I hope that that project will deliver the type of joined-up thinking that is needed to ensure that we make the best use of all services to deliver emergency care, whether ambulances, GPs, minor accident units or whatever.

wedi cael unrhyw drafodaethau gyda Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Powys ynglŷn â hyn, ac a ydych yn rhagweld y bydd unrhyw ffrydiau ariannu eraill ar gael?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr ydym wedi rhoi miliynau o bunnoedd mewn arian ychwanegol i sicrhau bod y gwasanaeth meddygon teulu y tu allan i oriau arferol ar waith. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn falch o glywed bod Powys, a a grybwylwyd yng nghwestiwn Mick Bates, yn un o'r byrddau iechyd lleol sydd wedi derbyn y cymorth ariannol mwyaf yng Nghymru yn nhermau gwasanaethau meddygon teulu y tu allan i oriau arferol, felly mae Powys yn dda iawn ei fydd o ran yr arian y mae wedi'i gael gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Yn ogystal â hynny, yr ydym yn edrych ar gyfanswm y gofal nas trefnwyd yn ei gyfanrwydd yng nghyd-destun darparu gwasanaethau gofal brys—ac yr wyf wedi sôn am y prosiect hwn yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Gobeithiaf y bydd y prosiect hwnnw yn arwain at y math o feddwl cydgysylltiedig sydd ei angen i sicrhau ein bod yn gwneud y defnydd gorau o'r holl wasanaethau i ddarparu gofal brys, boed yn ambiwlansys, meddygon teulu, unedau mân ddamweiniau neu beth bynnag.

### **Gwasanaeth Deintyddol y GIG NHS Dental Services**

**Q4 Brynle Williams:** Will the Minister make a statement on NHS dental services in Wales? OAQ0424(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** We are introducing a new dental contract to improve access to dental care and to improve the working lives of dentists. A sum of £5 million is available to roll out personal dental service schemes, encouraging dentists to stay in the NHS. We have increased dental undergraduate training places by 17 per cent, and we support more than 50 general dental vocational trainee schemes.

**Brynle Williams:** Minister, you will be aware of the White Gables Dental Practice in Colwyn Bay, which only this week announced its intention to deregister more

**C4 Brynle Williams:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am wasanaeth deintyddol y GIG yng Nghymru? OAQ0424(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr ydym yn cyflwyno contract deintyddol newydd i wella mynediad i ofal deintyddol ac i wella bywydau gwaith deintyddion. Mae swm o £5 miliwn ar gael i gyflwyno cynlluniau gwasanaeth deintyddol personol, i annog deintyddion i aros yn y GIG. Yr ydym wedi cynyddu nifer y lleoedd hyfforddi ar gyrsiau deintyddol israddedig 17 y cant, ac yr ydym yn cefnogi mwy na 50 o gynlluniau hyfforddi galwedigaethol deintyddol cyffredinol.

**Brynle Williams:** Weinidog, byddwch yn ymwybodol o Ddeintyddfa White Gables ym Mae Colwyn, a gyhoeddodd yr wythnos hon ei bod yn bwriadu dadgofrestru mwy na

than 7,000 patients. The local health board has stated that only 40 per cent of people in the area will have access to a national health service dentist, leaving 60 per cent without any dental cover. These figures speak for themselves, and are a sad reflection of the general state of the NHS in Wales. Minister, I demand to know what you intend to do for the ever-increasing number of patients in Wales who find themselves in the same situation as those of White Gables.

**Brian Gibbons:** The first thing that we will do is get rid of the old dental contract that your Government introduced 15 years ago. Particularly in north Wales, we are moving ahead with the personal dental service schemes that will allow dentists to move towards a new type of dental contract. One practice has been approved in Denbighshire with four down for consideration, one has been approved in Conwy with two taken forward for further consideration, one has been approved in Wrexham with three moving forward under the personal dental service contract and, in Flintshire, one practice has been approved with another four moving forward. Three have also been approved in Gwynedd and a further five in Anglesey. Therefore, we are engaging actively with the dental profession in north Wales to ensure that patient access to an NHS dental service continues.

**Irene James:** Minister, I have also heard many concerns from constituents in Islwyn about the availability of local NHS dental services. Will you give me your assurance that you will work with the local health board to ensure that everyone in Islwyn has access to an NHS dentist? [Interruption.]

**Brian Gibbons:** I am pleased to hear that the opposition is acknowledging the work that we are doing in improving dental services through the roll-out of the PDS scheme, as an interim step towards having a full new dental contract in Wales. A particular proposal that we are also developing is the use of the Welsh dental initiative, which gives uniquely Welsh assistance to practices that want to

7,000 o gleifion. Mae'r bwrdd iechyd lleol wedi datgan mai dim ond 40 y cant o bobl yn yr ardal fydd yn gallu gweld deintydd y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol, gan adael 60 y cant heb ddeintydd. Mae'r ffigurau hyn yn dweud y cyfan, ac maent yn adlewyrchiad trist o gyflwr cyffredinol y GIG yng Nghymru. Weinidog, mynnaf wybod beth yr ydych yn bwriadu ei wneud ar gyfer y nifer gynyddol o gleifion yng Nghymru sy'n canfod eu bod yn yr un sefyllfa â chleifion White Gables.

**Brian Gibbons:** Y peth cyntaf a wnawn yw cael gwared ar yr hen gcontract deintyddol a gyflwynwyd gan eich Llywodraeth chi 15 mlynedd yn ôl. Yn y Gogledd yn arbennig, yr ydym yn bwrw ati gyda'r cynlluniau gwasanaeth deintyddol personol a fydd yn caniatáu i ddeintyddion gymryd cam yn nes tuag at fath newydd o gcontract deintyddol. Mae un ddeintyddfa wedi'i chymeradwyo yn sir Ddinbych ac mae pedair arall yn cael eu hystyried, mae un wedi'i chymeradwyo yng Nghonwy a dwy yn cael eu hystyried ymhellach, mae un wedi'i chymeradwyo yn Wrecsam a thair yn dilyn trywydd y contract gwasanaeth deintyddol personol ac, yn sir y Fflint, mae un ddeintyddfa wedi'i chymeradwyo a phedair arall yn yr arfaeth. Mae tair wedi'u cymeradwyo yng Ngwynedd a phump arall yn Ynys Môn hefyd. Felly, yr ydym yn ymgysylltu â'r proffesiwn deintyddol yn y Gogledd i sicrhau bod cleifion yn parhau i gael mynediad i wasanaeth deintyddol y GIG.

**Irene James:** Weinidog, yr wyf innau hefyd wedi clywed llawer o bryderon gan etholwyr yn Islwyn ynghylch argaeedd gwasanaethau deintyddol lleol y GIG. A allwch roi sicrywydd imi y byddwch yn gweithio gyda'r bwrdd iechyd lleol i sicrhau bod pawb yn Islwyn yn gallu gweld deintydd y GIG? [Torri ar draws.]

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr wyf yn falch o glywed bod y gwrthbleidiau yn cydnabod y gwaith yr ydym yn ei wneud i wella gwasanaethau deintyddol drwy gyflwyno'r cynllun gwasanaeth deintyddol personol, fel cam dros dro tuag at gcontract deintyddol newydd llawn yng Nghymru. Cynnig penodol yr ydym yn ei ddatblygu hefyd yw defnyddio menter ddeintyddol Cymru, sy'n rhoi cymorth i

upgrade or open new practices to improve access for patients.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Yr ydych yn gwybod fy mod wedi eich holi sawl gwaith ynglŷn â diffyg deintyddion y gwasanaeth iechyd yn Ynys Môn. Mae nifer fawr o drigolion yr ynys yn methu â dod o hyd i ddeintydd y gwasanaeth iechyd. Clywaf yr hyn yr ydych yn ei ddweud, ond mae nifer fawr o bobl yn Ynys Môn wedi cael llond bol ar y llusgo traed cyson a welwyd ar y mater hwn. Mae'r bobl hynny yn mynnu gwelliannau buan. Pwynt pwysig arall yw bod diffyg deintyddion gwasanaeth iechyd ar gyfer plant yn golygu bod cyflwr eu dannedd wedi gwaethyg u'n sylweddol yn Ynys Môn ac yng ngweddl Cymru dros y blynnyddoedd diwethaf. Golyga hynny, pan ddaw contract newydd i rym, y bydd llawer o waith gan ddeintyddion i'w wneud ar ddannedd plant Cymru.

**Brian Gibbons:** You will be pleased that five practices in Anglesey have applied for the personal dental scheme. The whole point of that scheme is to allow dentists to work in new and innovative ways, and for more patients to be able to join their lists. That is a welcome step forward, of which, I am sure, you are aware. You will also know that two of the vocational training dental schemes are in Anglesey; one of the great advantages of that is that people, in general, tend to stay where their training takes place. Therefore, by continuing to support the two vocational training scheme posts that we are funding there, we will hopefully encourage people to train and stay in Anglesey.

ddeintyddfeydd yng Nghymru sy'n dymuno uwchraddio neu agor deintyddfeydd newydd i wella mynediad i gleifion.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** You will know that I have questioned you on many occasions about the lack of health service dentists in Anglesey. Many of the island's inhabitants have failed to find a health service dentist. I hear what you say, but many Anglesey residents have had enough of the constant feet-dragging on this issue. These people are demanding swift improvements. Another important point is that the lack of health service dentists for children means that there has been a significant deterioration in the condition of children's teeth in Anglesey, and across Wales, over the last few years. That means that, when a new contract is introduced, the teeth of children in Wales will require a lot of attention.

**Brian Gibbons:** Byddwch yn falch o glywed bod pump deintyddfa yn Ynys Môn wedi gwneud cais am y cynllun deintyddol personol. Diben y cynllun hwnnw yw caniatâu i ddeintyddion weithio mewn ffyrdd newydd ac arloesol, a sicrhau y gall mwy o gleifion gofrestru gyda hwy. Mae hwn yn gam cadarnhaol ymlaen, yr ydych yn ymwybodol ohono, mae'n siŵr. Gwyddoch hefyd fod dau o'r cynlluniau deintyddol hyfforddi galwedigaethol yn Ynys Môn; un o brif fanteision hynny yw bod pobl, yn gyffredinol, yn tuedd i aros yn y lle y'u hyfforddwyd. Felly, drwy barhau i gefnogi dwy swydd y cynllun hyfforddi galwedigaethol yr ydym yn eu hariannu yno, gobeithio y byddwn yn llwyddo i annog pobl i hyfforddi ac aros yn Ynys Môn.

### Damweiniau ac Achosion Brys yn y Canolbarth Emergency Services in Mid Wales

**Q5 Kirsty Williams:** Will the Minister make a statement on accident and emergency services in mid Wales? OAQ0391(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** The commissioning and provision of services, including accident and emergency services, is for NHS organisations and their partners to determine locally. The

**C5 Kirsty Williams:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am wasanaethau damweiniau ac achosion brys yn y Canolbarth? OAQ0391(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae'r gwaith o gomisiynu a darparu gwasanaethau, yn cynnwys gwasanaethau damweiniau ac achosion brys, yn waith i sefydliadau'r GIG a'u partneriaid

Welsh Assembly Government will continue to work closely with NHS Wales to drive forward improvements in performance.

**Kirsty Williams:** You will know that emergency ambulance response times in Brecon and Radnorshire are among the poorest in the principality. Health Commission Wales has devolved its budget for ambulance services in Powys back to the local health board, but in order for its proposed scheme of unscheduled emergencies to work, we need the co-operation of the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust. Will you do what you can to ensure that the management of the ambulance trust in Wales involves itself creatively in this, with a will to improving the situation in Brecon and Radnorshire, rather than with the stance that it has taken to date, which is that it cannot do anything about it?

**Brian Gibbons:** In fairness, the ambulance service in your constituency is engaging fairly constructively. I am aware, from my discussions with the service, that it is involved in a number of initiatives to improve ambulance services, such as thrombolysis provision; mid and west Wales led the way on that. It is also engaged in innovative schemes currently being piloted, such as the see and treat or assess and refer schemes, which will be of tremendous benefit to people in Powys. One of the reasons why ambulance services are not always readily available is that ambulances are called away on long journeys to district general hospitals; by allowing the ambulance services to respond more flexibly, they will be more readily available in local communities.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** Response times are slower in Brecon and Radnorshire and throughout Powys. There is a problem with regard to liaison with the all-Wales ambulance trust, which I encourage the Minister to look into, so that the service provided can be improved. At present, the provision is woefully inadequate in terms of response times.

**Brian Gibbons:** When you look at the

benderfynu arno yn lleol. Bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn parhau i weithio'n agos gyda GIG Cymru i hyrwyddo gwelliannau o ran perfformiad.

**Kirsty Williams:** Gwyddoch fod amseroedd ymateb brys ambiwlansys ym Mrycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed ymhlih y gwaethaf yng Nghymru. Mae Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru wedi datganoli ei gyllideb ar gyfer gwasanaethau ambiwlansys ym Mhowys yn ôl i'r bwrdd iechyd lleol, ond er mwyn i'w gynllun arfaethedig o argyfngau nas cynlluniwyd weithio, mae angen cydweithrediad Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwlansys Cymru arnom. A wnewch yr hyn a allwch i sicrhau bod rheolwyr yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlansys yng Nghymru yn eu cynnwys eu hunain yn greadigol yn hyn, gyda'r bwriad o wella'r sefyllfa ym Mrycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed, yn hytrach na mabwysiadu eu safbwyt hyd yma, sef na allant wneud dim am y sefyllfa?

**Brian Gibbons:** A bod yn deg, mae'r gwasanaeth ambiwlansys yn eich etholaeth yn gweithio'n gymharol adeiladol. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol, o'm trafodaethau gyda'r gwasanaeth, ei fod yn rhan o nifer o fentrau i wella gwasanaethau ambiwlansys, fel darpariaeth thrombolysis; yr oedd y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin wedi arwain y ffordd o ran hynny. Mae hefyd yn rhan o'r cynlluniau arloesol sy'n cael eu treialu ar hyn o bryd, fel y cynllun gweld a thrin neu'r cynllun asesu a chyfeirio, a fydd o fudd aruthrol i bobl ym Mhowys. Un o'r rhesymau nad yw'r gwasanaethau ambiwlans bob amser ar gael yw am fod yr ambiwlansys yn cael eu hanfon ar deithiau hir i ysbytai cyffredinol dosbarth; drwy ganiatáu i'r ambiwlansys ymateb yn fwy hyblyg, byddant ar gael yn well mewn cymunedau lleol.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Mae amseroedd ymateb yn arafach ym Mrycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed a ledled Powys. Mae problem o ran cysylltu ag ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans Cymru gyfan, yr wyf yn annog y Gweinidog i ymchwilio iddi, fel y gellir gwella'r gwasanaeth a ddarperir. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r ddarpariaeth yn druenus o annigonol o ran amseroedd ymateb.

**Brian Gibbons:** Pan edrychwrch ar y

figures, Powys is probably one area—along with parts of south-east Wales—where the ambulance service's performance level is way off what we would like it to be. In fairness to the ambulance service, it does acknowledge the problem, and it has invited help from the Staffordshire Ambulance Service NHS Trust, as that is one of the best-performing ambulance trusts in the United Kingdom. I attended an innovations conference at the Holland House hotel in Cardiff last week, and I was impressed with some of the innovative schemes that the ambulance service is piloting to provide more rapid access for patients.

ffigurau, mae'n debyg bod Powys yn un ardal—ynghyd â rhannau o'r De-ddwyrain—lle mae lefel perfformiad gwasanaeth ambiwlans ymhell o gyrraedd yr hyn yr hoffem iddi fod. A bod yn deg â'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans, mae'n cydnabod y broblem, ac mae wedi gwahodd cymorth gan Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwlans Swydd Stafford, ac mae honno'n un o'r ymddiriedolaethau ambiwlans sy'n perfformio orau yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Mynychais gynhadledd arloesedd yng ngwesty Holland House yng Nghaerdydd yr wythnos diwethaf, a chreodd rhai o'r cynlluniau arloesol y mae'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn eu treialu i ddarparu ymateb cyflymach i gleifion argraff fawr arnaf.

2.20 p.m.

**Y Llywydd:** Trosglwyddwyd cwestiwn 6 (OAQ0418) i'w ateb yn ysgrifenedig.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 6 (OAQ0418) has been transferred for written answer.

### **Ymosodiadau ar Staff y GIG Attacks on NHS Staff**

**Q7 Ann Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on the Assembly Government's measures to address the problem of attacks on staff working in the NHS and social services departments in Wales? OAQ0429(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** In July, we published a national security framework to improve operational guidance and national standards for NHS Wales. Although the responsibility of employers is to their staff, we have promoted a framework in social care including the consideration of working conditions and the promotion of a positive culture of support and leadership.

**Ann Jones:** You agree that these attacks are inexcusable, and it is often only the mindless few who attack staff working in the NHS or within social care. However, the trend is increasing, which we must be concerned about. We must take some positive action on this. It is no longer just a fracas on a Friday or Saturday night in the accident and emergency departments; there are now attacks on health visitors and other health

**C7 Ann Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am fesurau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i fynd i'r afael ag ymosodiadau ar staff sy'n gweithio yn y GIG ac mewn adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yng Nghymru? OAQ0429(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Ym mis Gorffennaf, cyhoeddwyd fframwaith diogelwch cenedlaethol gennym er mwyn gwella canllawiau gweithredol a safonau cenedlaethol ar gyfer GIG Cymru. Er mai cyfrifoldeb y cyflogwyr yw'r staff, yr ydym wedi hyrwyddo fframwaith ym maes gofal cymdeithasol yn cynnwys ystyried amodau gwaith a hyrwyddo diwylliant cadarnhaol o ran cymorth ac arweinyddiaeth.

**Ann Jones:** Cytunwch fod yr ymosodiadau hyn yn anfaddeuol, ac yn aml, dim ond ambell un difeddwyl sy'n ymosod ar staff sy'n gweithio yn y GIG neu ym maes gofal cymdeithasol. Fodd bynnag, mae'r duedd ar gynnydd, a rhaid inni fod yn bryderus yn ei chylch. Rhaid inni gymryd camau cadarnhaol ar hyn. Nid dim ond helynt ar nos Wener neu nos Sadwrn yn yr adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys yw hyn; bellach, mae

care staff who are lone workers in the community. Will you give assurances that you will have discussions with the relevant bodies—including the police, local authorities, trade unions and the health boards—to see what we can do in terms of lone workers, in particular, so that we can do something positive to eradicate this growing problem?

**Brian Gibbons:** The 2002 circular from the Assembly asked every health organisation to adopt a zero tolerance policy towards violence against staff, and similar guidance and suggestions have also been issued to the social care sector. As the recent Wales Audit Office report stated, there have been over 8,000 episodes of violence against NHS staff during the last year for which we have figures. That is totally unacceptable. This is a challenge for the NHS, but it is also a challenge for wider society.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** Like you, I also share Ann Jones's concern about the number of attacks on NHS and social services staff. One of the biggest deterrents would be for these people to be prosecuted successfully for their actions. Do you have any information on the number of successful prosecutions to date? Would keeping a record of prosecutions, so that a report could be given to Plenary on how it is progressing, give some confidence to those on the frontline in the health service that we are tracking the problems?

**Brian Gibbons:** We do not collect figures centrally in terms of prosecutions through the courts. I am aware, from the Wales Audit Office report, that five or six Trusts have actively supported their staff in bringing legal proceedings following assaults. We are also working with the Counter Fraud and Security Management Service to work up plans to see whether it is possible to give more proactive assistance to members of staff who wish to pursue action if they have been assaulted during the course of their work.

**Michael German:** There are two sides to

ymosodiadau ar ymwelwyr iechyd a staff gofal iechyd eraill sy'n weithwyr annibynnol yn y gymuned. A allwch ein sicrhau y cewch drafodaethau gyda'r cyrff perthnasol—yn cynnwys yr heddlu, awdurdodau lleol, undebau masnach a'r byrddau iechyd—i weld yr hyn y gallwn ei wneud o ran gweithwyr annibynnol yn arbennig, fel y gallwn wneud rhywbeth cadarnhaol i ddileu'r broblem hon sydd ar gynnydd?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr oedd cylchlythyr 2002 o'r Cynulliad yn gofyn i bob sefydliad iechyd fabwysiadau polisi dim goddefgarwch tuag at drais yn erbyn staff, a chyhoeddwyd canllawiau ac awgrymiadau tebyg eraill i'r sector gofal cymdeithasol. Fel y nododd adroddiad diweddar Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru, bu dros 8,000 o achosion o drais yn erbyn staff y GIG yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf y mae gennym ffigurau ar ei chyfer. Mae hyn yn gwbl annerbyniol. Mae hyn yn her i'r GIG, ond mae hefyd yn her i'r gymdeithas ehangach.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratioaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Fel chi, yr wyf hefyd yn rhannu pryder Ann Jones o ran nifer yr ymosodiadau ar staff y GIG a'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Un o'r prif ffyrdd o rwystro hyn fyddai erlyn y bobl hyn yn llwyddiannus am eu gweithredoedd. A oes gennych unrhyw wybodaeth am nifer yr erlyniadau llwyddiannus hyd yn hyn? A fyddai cadw cofnod o erlyniadau, fel y gellir cyflwyno adroddiad i'r Cyfarfod Llawn ar y cynnydd, yn rhoi rhywfaint o hyder i'r rhai sydd yn rheng flaen y gwasanaethau iechyd ein bod yn ymdrin â'r problemau?

**Brian Gibbons:** Nid ydym yn casglu ffigurau yn ganolog o ran yr erlyniadau drwy'r llysoedd. Gwn, o adroddiad Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru, fod pump neu chwech o Ymddiriedolaethau wedi cefnogi eu staff i ddwyn achosion cyfreithiol yn dilyn ymosodiadau. Yr ydym hefyd yn gweithio gyda Gwasanaeth Atal Twyll a Rheoli Diogelwch i greu cynlluniau i weld a yw'n bosibl rhoi mwy o gymorth rhagweithiol i aelodau o staff sydd am ddwyn achos cyfreithiol os ymosodwyd arnynt yn rhinwedd eu gwaith.

**Michael German:** Mae dwy ochr i'r gwaith

being supported: the first is to receive support from managers, and the second is to see successful prosecutions. That is what will ultimately deter those who feel that they can walk in to accident and emergency units and abuse the staff trying to help them. Would it be sensible to ask your officials to record information on prosecutions, to provide some guidance to NHS managers on assisting staff in successful prosecutions, and to show unequivocally that the National Assembly will not tolerate such behaviour towards public services staff?

**Brian Gibbons:** The initial guidance suggested that Trusts should be of more assistance to members of their staff in terms of pursuing cases, if they so wished. By engaging with the Counter Fraud and Security Management Service, that practical support would hopefully be given. The CFSMS is already involved in undertaking some of this work in England where they are much more involved in this type of activity. Therefore, we will hopefully be able to avail ourselves of its knowledge and expertise in moving this agenda forward. However, we are still in the phase of negotiating how we can move the agenda forward.

o gael cymorth: yr ochr gyntaf yw cael cymorth gan reolwyr, a'r ail yw gweld erlyniadau llwyddiannus. Yn y pen draw, dyna a fydd yn rhwystro'r rhai sy'n teimlo y gallant gerdded i mewn i unedau damweiniau ac achosion brys a cham-drin y staff sy'n ceisio eu helpu. A fyddai'n ddoeth gofyn i'ch swyddogion gofnodi gwybodaeth am erlyniadau, darparu rhyw fath o ganllawiau i reolwyr y GIG ar roi cymorth i staff mewn erlyniadau llwyddiannus, a dangos yn ddigamsyniol na fydd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn goddef ymddygiad o'r fath tuag at staff y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus?

**Brian Gibbons:** Awgrymodd y canllawiau cychwynnol y dylai Ymddiriedolaethau fod yn rhoi mwy o gymorth i staff ddwyn achos cyfreithiol, pe baent yn dymuno hynny. Drwy weithio gyda'r Gwasanaeth Atal Twyll a Rheoli Diogelwch, gobeithio y byddai'r cymorth ymarferol hwnnw yn cael ei roi. Mae'r Gwasanaeth Atal Twyll a Rheoli Diogelwch eisoes yn ymgymryd â rhywfaint o'r gwaith hwn yn Lloegr, lle maent yn cyfrannu mwy i'r math hwn o weithgarwch. Felly, gobeithio y gallwn elwa ar ei wybodaeth a'i arbenigedd wrth ddatblygu'r agenda hon. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn parhau i drafod sut y gallwn ddatblygu'r agenda.

### Profion am Ganser y Coluddy Testing for Bowel Cancer

**Q8 Lorraine Barrett:** Will the Minister make a statement on testing for bowel cancer in Wales? OAQ0399(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** The cancer services co-ordinating group will shortly be consulting on its work and we expect to receive a final draft costed bowel cancer framework for consideration early in the new year. Final decisions on its content, including a national bowel cancer screening programme for Wales, will then be announced.

**Lorraine Barrett:** You will know that I have been in correspondence with you regarding the home testing kit in England, which is due to be rolled out in 2007. I would like to push you a little further on the likely timescale that we would be looking at to have a similar sort

**C8 Lorraine Barrett:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am brofion am ganser y coluddy yng Nghymru? OAQ0399(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Bydd grŵp cydlynau'r gwasanaethau cancer yn ymgynghori ar ei waith maes o law a disgwyliwn gael fersiwn drafft terfynol o fframwaith cancer y coluddy wedi'i brisio i'w ystyried ddechrau'r flwyddyn newydd. Cyhoeddir penderfyniadau terfynol ar ei gynnwys, yn cynnwys rhaglen sgrinio cancer y coluddy cenedlaethol, bryd hynny.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Gwyddoch y bûm yn gohebu â chi o ran y pecyn profi gartref yn Lloegr, a gaiff ei gyflwyno'n raddol yn 2007. Hoffwn bwys o ychydig yn fwy arnoch o ran yr amserlen debygol y byddem yn disgwl ei chael pe baem yn cyflwyno'r un math o

of testing kit in Wales, given the processes that you have just mentioned that have to be finalised.

**Brian Gibbons:** We are impressed with the findings from the screening programme; the evidence suggests that there could be an improvement of 16 per cent in the mortality rate for bowel cancer as a result of an effective screening programme. The approach that we are taking in Wales is to be slightly more holistic in terms of ensuring that a good advice system underpins the screening programme and that we give the patients a little more information so that they understand the risks, rather than simply sending out a testing kit. We may be a little slower than England at present, not least because the original pilot work was done in England and the roll-out in England is essentially a continuation of those pilots. However, we will hopefully learn from the experience in England, and will take steps within the next couple of years.

**David Melding:** Do you agree any strategy to tackle bowel cancer requires an excellent public information programme? It is a common cancer but early detection is possible and it is crucial that any change in habits is investigated, and people have to realise that. They often know that something is wrong but wait far too long to seek medical advice.

**Brian Gibbons:** Bowel cancer is one of the conditions that can be improved by, and benefit from, a better lifestyle in terms of having a better diet and doing more exercise. However, you are correct that we also need to ensure that the screening programme is underpinned by a good public information programme. We are convinced of the merits of screening but we want to ensure that it is underpinned by the precise public information programme that you suggest.

**Lynne Neagle:** It is important that we move as soon as possible to introduce a screening programme for bowel cancer. Considerable evidence exists about the benefits of such a programme. I understand that the work in

becyn profi yng Nghymru, o ystyried y prosesau yr ydych newydd sôn amdanyst sydd i'w cwblhau.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae canfyddiadau'r rhaglen sgrinio wedi creu argraff fawr arnom; mae'r dystiolaeth yn awgrymu y gallai fod gwelliant o 16 y cant yn y gyfradd marwolaethau ar gyfer canser y coluddyn o ganlyniad i raglen sgrinio effeithiol. Bydd yr ymagwedd yr ydym yn ei mabwysiadu yng Nghymru rywfaint yn fwy cyfannol o ran sicrhau bod system cynggori da yn sail i'r rhaglen sgrinio ac y byddwn yn rhoi ychydig mwy o wybodaeth i gleifion fel y gallant ddeall y risgau, yn hytrach na dim ond anfon pecyn profi yn unig. Efallai ein bod ychydig yn arafach o gymharu â Lloegr ar hyn o bryd, yn bennaf oherwydd i'r gwaith treialu gwreiddiol gael ei wneud yn Lloegr ac am fod y broses o'i roi ar waith yn Lloegr yn barhad o'r treialon hynny yn ei hanfod. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiwn y byddwn yn dysgu o'r profiad yn Lloegr, ac y byddwn yn cymryd y camau yn ystod yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf.

**David Melding:** A gytunwch fod angen rhaglen gwybodaeth gyhoeddus wych ar unrhyw strategaeth i fynd i'r afael â chanser y coluddyn? Mae'r canser yn un cyffredin ond mae modd ei ganfod yn gynnar ac mae'n hanfodol ymchwilio i unrhyw newid mewn arfer, a rhaid i bobl sylweddoli hynny. Yn aml gwyddant fod rhywbeth o'i le, ond maent yn aros yn rhy hir i ofyn am gyngor meddygol.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae canser y coluddyn yn un o'r cyflyrau hynny y gall gwell ffordd o fyw ei wella a lle y gall gwell ffordd o fyw fod o fudd, o ran cael diet gwell a gwneud mwy o ymarfer corff. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych yn iawn bod angen inni sicrhau bod y rhaglen gwybodaeth gyhoeddus dda yn sail i'r rhaglen sgrinio. Yr ydym yn argyhoeddedig o rinweddau sgrinio ond yr ydym am sicrhau bod y rhaglen gwybodaeth gyhoeddus fanwl a awgrymir gennych yn sail i'r rhaglen sgrinio.

**Lynne Neagle:** Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn symud cyn gynted â phosibl i gyflwyno rhaglen sgrinio ar gyfer canser y coluddyn. Mae dystiolaeth sylweddol ar gael am fanteision rhaglen o'r fath. Deallaf fod y

England has been preceded by significant investment and a prioritisation of resources in terms of ensuring that staff will be there to support such a screening programme. That would also have to happen in Wales. What assurance can you give that the Assembly Government is prioritising this at present?

gwaith yn Lloegr wedi ei ragflaenu gan fuddsoddiad sylweddol ac i adnoddau gael eu blaenoriaethu o ran sicrhau y bydd staff yno i gefnogi rhaglen sgrinio o'r fath. Byddai'n rhaid i hynny ddigwydd yng Nghymru hefyd. Pa sicrwydd y gallwch ei roi bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn blaenoriaethu hyn ar hyn o bryd?

**Brian Gibbons:** No screening programme will work if we do not have extra capacity in laboratories or endoscopists to carry out tests on patients who turn out to be positive. We are considering the possibility of having a centralised screening laboratory and we are looking at the training programmes that would be necessary to allow the successful roll-out of bowel cancer screening.

**Brian Gibbons:** Ni fydd unrhyw raglen sgrinio yn gweithio os nad oes gennym adnoddau ychwanegol mewn labordai neu endosgopyddion i gynnal profion ar gleifion sy'n cael canlyniadau positif. Yr ydym yn ystyried y posibilrwydd o gael labordy sgrinio canolog ac yr ydym yn edrych ar y rhaglenni hyfforddi a fyddai'n hanfodol er mwyn caniatáu inni roi'r broses o sgrinio canser y coluddyd ar waith yn llwyddiannus.

### **Gofal Deintyddol yn Nyffryn Clwyd Dentistry in the Vale of Clwyd**

**Q9 Ann Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on access to dentistry in the Vale of Clwyd? OAQ0430(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** I have announced a further £5 million for the roll-out of personal dental service schemes, encouraging dentists to stay and work in the NHS and provide increased access. Denbighshire Local Health Board has approved one PDS proposal and there are a further four to be taken forward. Flintshire Local Health Board is also in discussions with four practices.

**Ann Jones:** I thank you and my colleague, Alun Pugh, for attending the Elwy dental practice in Rhyl, which also practises in Abergale, to witness how the PDS will benefit people in the Vale of Clwyd and in the Abergale area of Clwyd West. We need to consider how many more dentists we can get signed up to the new PDS contract.

2.30 p.m.

Some negotiations with local health boards and us will be needed to persuade those dentists not to follow the private route. Do you recognise that, while a new contract is vital in securing the future for dentists in the

**C9 Ann Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am fynediad at ofal deintyddol yn Nyffryn Clwyd? OAQ0430(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr wyf wedi cyhoeddi £5 miliwn ychwanegol ar gyfer rhoi cynlluniau gwasanaethau deintyddol personol ar waith, gan annog deintyddion i aros yn y GIG a gweithio yno a sicrhau mwy o fynediad. Mae Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Sir Ddinbych wedi cymeradwyo un cynnig o PDS ac mae pedwar arall i'w rhoi ar waith. Mae Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Sir y Fflint hefyd yn cael trafodaethau gyda phedair deintyddfa arall.

**Ann Jones:** Diolchaf i chi a'm cyd-Aelod Alun Pugh, am fynychu deintyddfa Elwy yn y Rhyl, sydd hefyd â phractis yn Abergale, i dystio sut y bydd y PDS o fudd i bobl Dyffryn Clwyd ac yn ardal Abergale yng Ngorllewin Clwyd. Mae angen inni ystyried faint yn rhagor o ddeintyddion y gallwn eu hannog i ymrwymo i'r contract PDS newydd.

Bydd angen cynnal rhywfaint o drafodaethau ryngom ni a byrddau iechyd lleol er mwyn darbwyllo'r deintyddion hynny i beidio â mynd yn breifat. A gydnabyddwch, er bod contract newydd yn hanfodol er mwyn

Vale of Clwyd and Wales, we need to consider alternative forms of provision, such as salaried dentists? What assurance can you give me that you will work with health boards to provide salaried dentists in areas of deprivation, such as those that Brynle has alluded to? However, I must say that dentists in the Vale of Clwyd are actually staying true to the national health service and are pleased with the PDS scheme that you have introduced.

**Brian Gibbons:** I was pleased to visit Mr and Mrs Hawkes, Mr McCoubrey and their colleagues at the Elwy Dental Practice in Rhyl. I was impressed by the keen commitment to excellence and dedication to the national health service displayed there. You are quite right that salaried dentists are an important element of an overall dental service in Wales, particularly in the context of the community dental services scheme. A consultation process is currently taking place on the future of CDS in Wales, and I urge anyone who wishes to make a contribution to do so before it ends.

**David Melding:** The Vale of Clwyd and the rest of Wales are waiting for the Welsh Assembly Government's response to see what will be the availability of NHS dentistry. Are we moving to a position wherein we want to make services available for all those who wish to take them up, or will we go in the other direction? Britain, after all, is one of the few countries in the western world that provides dental services within a social model, but we are currently in between systems, which is quite damaging.

**Brian Gibbons:** The Welsh Assembly Government's aspiration is to strengthen and promote access to an NHS dentist service. People are free to sign on with an NHS dentist, to go privately or to sign up to an insurance scheme, should they wish. However, the Government is anxious to promote access to NHS dentistry for all those who wish to use that service.

sicrhau dyfodol deintyddion yn Nyffryn Clwyd a Chymru, fod angen inni ystyried mathau eraill o ddarpariaeth, megis deintyddion cyflogedig. Pa sicrwydd y gallwch ei roi imi y byddwch yn gweithio gyda byrddau iechyd er mwyn darparu deintyddion cyflogedig mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig, megis y rhai y mae Brynle wedi cyfeirio atynt? Fodd bynnag, rhaid imi ddweud bod deintyddion yn Nyffryn Clwyd yn parhau'n ufudd i'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol ac maent yn fodlon ar y cynllun PDS a gyflwynwyd gennych.

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr oeddwn yn falch o ymweld â Mr a Mrs Hawkes, Mr McCoubrey a'u cydweithwyr yn Neintyddfa Elwy yn y Rhyl. Bu i'r ymrwymiad cadarn i ragoriaeth a'r ymroddiad i'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol a ddangoswyd yno greu argraff arnaf. Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle pan ddywedwch fod deintyddion cyflogedig yn elfen bwysig o wasanaeth deintyddol cyffredinol yng Nghymru, yn enwedig yng nghyd-destun y cynllun gwasanaethau deintyddol cymunedol. Mae proses ymgynghori yn cael ei chynnal ar hyn o bryd ar ddyfodol gwasanaethau deintyddol cymunedol yng Nghymru, ac anogaf unrhyw un sy'n dymuno cyfrannu i wneud hynny cyn iddi orffen.

**David Melding:** Mae Dyffryn Clwyd a gweddill Cymru yn aros am ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i weld beth fydd argaeedd deintyddiaeth y GIG. A ydym yn symud tuag at sefyllfa lle yr ydym am sicrhau bod gwasanaethau ar gael i bawb sydd am eu defnyddio, neu a fyddwn yn symud i'r cyfeiriad arall? Mae Prydain, wedi'r cyfan, yn un o'r gwledydd prin hynny yn y gorllewin sy'n darparu gwasanaethau deintyddol o fewn model cymdeithasol, ond ar hyn o bryd yr ydym rhwng systemau, sy'n eithaf niweidiol.

**Brian Gibbons:** Dyhead Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yw atgyfnherthu a hyrwyddo mynediad i wasanaeth deintyddol y GIG. Gall pobl gofrestru gyda deintydd y GIG, mynd yn breifat neu ymuno â chynllun yswiriant, os dymunant wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Llywodraeth yn awyddus i hyrwyddo mynediad i ddeintyddiaeth y GIG ar gyfer pawb sy'n dymuno defnyddio'r gwasanaeth hwnnw.

**Denise Idris Jones:** I am sure that you will agree that we need to encourage Welsh dental students on qualifying to practise locally. I am registered with a recently qualified young dentist from Llanfairfechan, who is now practising in Conwy. That has enabled more NHS patients to enrol with that particular practice.

**Brian Gibbons:** That is why we have increased the number of dental school places in Wales, why it is important that we ensure that the vocational training for graduate dentists is spread evenly across Wales, and why we have the Welsh dental initiative for those practices that want to expand their premises to take on more dentists or to have more equipment to treat patients.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch fod angen inni annog myfyrwyr deintyddol yng Nghymru i ymarfer yn lleol ar ôl iddynt gymhwys. Yr wyf wedi fy nghofrestru gyda deintydd ifanc sydd newydd gymhwys o Lanfairfechan, sydd bellach yn ymarfer yng Nghonwy. Mae hynny wedi galluogi mwy o gleifion y GIG i gofrestru gyda'r ddeintyddfa benodol honno.

**Brian Gibbons:** Dyna pam yr ydym wedi cynyddu nifer y lleoedd mewn ysgolion deintyddol yng Nghymru, pam ei bod yn bwysig ein bod yn sicrhau bod yr hyfforddiant galwedigaethol ar gyfer deintyddion graddedig yn cael ei ledaenu'n gyfartal ledled Cymru, a pham mae gennym fenter ddeintyddol Cymru ar gyfer y deintyddfeydd hynny sydd am ehangu er mwyn cyflogi mwy o ddeintyddion neu er mwyn cael mwy o offer i drin cleifion.

## Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon Questions to the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport

### Signal Teledu Ehangach dan y Drefn Ddigidol Television Signal Coverage under Digital

**Q1 Mick Bates:** Will the Minister make a statement on the meetings that he has had with the Office of Communications to discuss increasing television signal coverage under digital? OAQ0374(CWL)

**The Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport (Alun Pugh):** I have raised the issue of television coverage after digital switchover with Ofcom both in our responses to its consultations on its review of public service broadcasting and in meetings.

**Mick Bates:** I am sure that you are aware that 85,000 people across Wales, many of them in my constituency of Montgomeryshire, currently have no access to Welsh public service broadcasting. I am sure that you agree that this level of inequality cannot be healthy for democracy. Do you agree that the new Freesat technology has great potential in terms of extending coverage to that disenfranchised section of Welsh society? In light of this, what plans do

**C1 Mick Bates:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y cyfarfodydd a gafodd gyda'r Swyddfa Gyfathrebu i drafod signal teledu ehangach dan y drefn ddigidol? OAQ0374(CWL)

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon (Alun Pugh):** Yr wyf wedi codi'r mater yngylch signal teledu ar ôl trosglwyddo i ddigidol gydag Ofcom yn ein hymatebion i'w ymgynghoriadau ar ei adolygiad o ddarlledu cyhoeddus ac mewn cyfarfodydd.

**Mick Bates:** Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol o'r ffaith bod 85,000 o bobl ledled Cymru, y mae llawer ohonynt yn byw yn fy etholaeth i sef Sir Fynwy, heb unrhyw fynediad i ddarlledu cyhoeddus Cymraeg. Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch na all y lefel hon o anghydraddoldeb fod yn dda i ddemocratiaeth. A gytunwch fod gan y dechnoleg Freesat newydd gryn botensial o ran ehangu'r signal i'r rhan ddifreiniedig honno o'r gymdeithas yng Nghymru? Yn sgil

you have to help provide fair and equal access to public service broadcasting across Wales before the next Assembly elections in 2007?

**Alun Pugh:** On 15 September, the Secretary of State for Culture, Media and Sport announced the detailed timetable for digital switchover in the UK. Wales will now be switched over in 2009. Developments in information and broadcasting technology have an enormous role to play in ensuring that appropriate public service broadcasting is available the length and breadth of Wales, and that people who currently receive a good signal on analogue will be able to receive a good signal on digital.

Your point about Freesat was well made, because, as well as BSkyB, where you can get a free satellite service, the BBC and ITV plan to launch their own subscription free Freesat package next year. We look forward to getting the details of that.

**Leighton Andrews:** This is an issue of great concern in many Valleys constituencies, where Freeview reception is not largely available. I endorse the call by Mick Bates for further support for the Freesat service. I urge you to take that up in discussions with Ofcom, with your colleagues in Westminster, and with broadcasters to ensure its availability at a price that is affordable.

**Alun Pugh:** I will indeed. Freesat has the option of making wider coverage available in difficult-to-reach areas, such as the Valleys. The position of the digital terrestrial signal will improve following switch-off, because, at the moment, there are big problems with bandwidth. The situation for terrestrial digital will be greatly improved after the analogue switch-off.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Pan fydd y trosglwyddo yn digwydd yn 2009, bydd y sbectrwm analog yn rhydd. Pa drafodaethau ydych wedi'u cael gydag Ofcom i weld sut y gall Cymru elwa o ddefnyddio'r sbectrwm hwn?

**Alun Pugh:** It is not fair to say that this spectrum will be entirely free. Much of the

hyn, pa gynlluniau sydd gennych i helpu i sicrhau mynediad teg a chyfartal i ddarlledu cyhoeddus ledled Cymru cyn etholiadau nesaf y Cynulliad yn 2007?

**Alun Pugh:** Ar 15 Medi, cyhoeddodd y Gweinidog Gwladol dros Ddiwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon yr amserlen fanwl ar gyfer trosglwyddo i ddigidol yn y DU. Bydd Cymru yn awr yn cael ei throsglwyddo i ddigidol yn 2009. Mae gan y datblygiadau ym maes technoleg gwybodaeth a thechnoleg darlledu ran enfawr i'w chwarae yn y gwaith o sicrhau bod darlledu cyhoeddus priodol ar gael ar hyd a lled Cymru, a bod pobl sy'n derbyn signal analog da yn gallu derbyn signal digidol da.

Yr oedd eich pwynt ynghylch Freesat yn un da, oherwydd, yn ogystal â BSkyB, lle y gallwch gael gwasanaeth lloeren am ddim, mae'r BBC ac ITV yn bwriadu lansio eu pecyn tanysgrifio Freesat eu hunain a fydd am ddim y flwyddyn nesaf. Edrychwn ymlaen at gael manylion hynny.

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae'r mater hwn yn peri cryn bryder i sawl etholaeth yn y Cymoedd, lle nad yw gwasanaeth Freeview ar gael ar y cyfan. Ategaf alwad Mick Bates am fwy o gefnogaeth i wasanaeth Freesat. Fe'ch anogaf i drafod hynny gydag Ofcom, gyda'ch cyd-Aelodau yn San Steffan, a chyda darllewyr er mwyn sicrhau ei fod ar gael am bris sy'n fforddiadwy.

**Alun Pugh:** Gwnaf hynny'n bendant. Gall Freesat ddarparu signal ehangach mewn ardaloedd anodd eu cyrraedd, megis y Cymoedd. Bydd y signal digidol daearol yn gwella ar ôl diffodd analog, oherwydd, ar hyn o bryd, ceir problemau mawr gyda lled band. Bydd y sefyllfa o ran y signal digidol daearol yn gwella'n ddirfawr ar ôl diffodd analog.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** When the switchover occurs in 2009, the analogue spectrum will be free. What discussions have you had with Ofcom to see how Wales can benefit from using that spectrum?

**Alun Pugh:** Nid yw'n deg dweud y bydd y sbectrwm hwn am ddim yn gyfan gwbl. Bydd

bandwidth that is currently occupied by a relatively small number of analogue channels will be taken up by a much greater number of digital channels. There are many advantages to that. It means, for example, that Channel 4 and Channel 5, as well as the parliament channel and one or two other channels, will be available on a far wider basis. I do not think that it is fair to say that there will be a free amount of bandwidth out there.

**Alun Cairns:** The output of digital terrestrial transmitters is somewhat limited until the analogue transmitters are switched off. Therefore, in the interim, do you accept that this provides, in many communities where that range is pretty limited, a monopoly for BSkyB and Rupert Murdoch? What specific action do you plan to take to overcome that monopoly in the short term?

**Alun Pugh:** It is good to hear members of the Conservative Party railing against monopoly capitalists. I fully accept that the present situation is not ideal. Digital terrestrial does not reach everywhere, and the situation will greatly improve at switch-off. It is good to see that the BBC is involved in Freesat technology, as this provides a public service alternative to Mr Murdoch's operation.

y rhan fwyaf o'r lled band a ddefnyddir ar hyn o bryd gan nifer gymharol fach o sianeli analog yn cael ei ddefnyddio gan nifer fwy o lawer o sianeli digidol. Rhydd hynny lawer o fanteision. Golyga, er enghraift, y bydd Channel 4 a Channel 5, yn ogystal â sianel y senedd ac un neu ddwy sianel arall, ar gael yn llawer ehangach. Ni chredaf ei bod yn deg dweud y bydd digonedd o led band ar gael.

**Alun Cairns:** Mae allbwn trosglwyddyddion digidol daearol braidd yn gyfyngedig nes y caiff y trosglwyddyddion analog eu diffodd. Felly, yn y cyfamser, a dderbyniwch fod hyn, mewn llawer o gymunedau lle y mae'r ystod honno yn eithaf cyfyngedig, yn darparu monopol i BSkyB a Rupert Murdoch? Pa gamau penodol yr ydych yn bwriadu eu cymryd i oresgyn y monopol hwnnw yn y byrdymor?

**Alun Pugh:** Mae'n dda clywed aelodau o'r Blaid Geidwadol yn rhefru yn erbyn cyfalafwyr monopol. Derbyniaf nad yw'r sefyllfa bresennol yn ddelfrydol. Nid yw teledu digidol daearol yn cyrraedd pob man, a bydd y sefyllfa yn gwella'n sylweddol pan ddiffoddir analog. Mae'n dda gweld bod y BBC yn ymwnaed â thechnoleg Freesat, gan fod hyn yn darparu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus arall yn lle gwasanaeth Mr Murdoch.

### Criced yng Nghymru Cricket in Wales

**Q2 Rosemary Butler:** Will the Minister make a statement on any initiatives to promote cricket in Wales? OAQ0346(CWL)

**C2 Rosemary Butler:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am unrhyw gynlluniau i hyrwyddo criced yng Nghymru? OAQ0346(CWL)

**Alun Pugh:** Our sports council works closely with the Cricket Board of Wales to promote the game of cricket through a range of schemes and initiatives, primarily in schools. This year, more than £300,000 is being invested in developing the sport in Wales, which is nearly 10 per cent more than last year.

**Rosemary Butler:** It is good to hear that that amount of money is being put in, but I am sure that you will agree that provision and quality vary across Wales. A superb example of a successful club is Newport Cricket Club.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae ein cyngor chwaraeon yn gweithio'n agos gyda Bwrdd Criced Cymru i hyrwyddo criced drwy amrywiaeth o gynlluniau a mentrau, mewn ysgolion yn bennaf. Eleni, mae mwy na £300,000 yn cael ei fuddsoddi yn y gwaith o ddatblygu criced yng Nghymru, sydd bron 10 y cant yn fwy na'r llynedd.

**Rosemary Butler:** Mae'n dda clywed bod y swm hwnnw o arian yn cael ei fuddsoddi, ond yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch fod darpariaeth ac ansawdd yn amrywio ledled Cymru. Mae Clwb Criced Casnewydd yn

This season, its boys' under-13 team swept away all before it; the boys are the UK national champions, the Welsh cup winners, the Gwent league winners, and the Monmouthshire Building Society Gwent shield award winners. On the other hand, there is Caerleon, a club with a fine playing history. It has an award-winning cricket pavilion, which was recently opened by Carwyn Jones in his role as Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside. It has an excellent cricket pitch but, unfortunately, there is no longer a Caerleon cricket team. It managed to attract a number of players with potential, but failed to get enough support to run the club. As well as the initiatives that you have just mentioned, which are to train players, coaches and umpires, could you look at ways of attracting and supporting people to administer the game at grass-roots level?

enghraifft wych o glwb llwyddiannus. Y tymor hwn, enillodd ei dîm bechgyn o dan 13 oed bob cystadleuaeth y bu'n cystadlu ynddi; mae'r bechgyn yn bencampwyr cenedlaethol y DU, yn fuddugwyr cwpan Cymru, yn fuddugwyr cynghrair Gwent, ac yn fuddugwyr tarian Cymdeithas Adeiladu Sir Fynwy Gwent. Ar y llaw arall, mae Caerllion, clwb â hanes godidog o chwarae. Mae ganddo bafiliwn criced o'r radd flaenaf, a agorwyd yn ddiweddar gan Carwyn Jones yn rhinwedd ei swydd fel y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad. Mae ganddo gae criced ardderchog ond, yn anffodus, nid oes tîm criced yng Nghaerllion erbyn hyn. Llwyddodd i ddenu nifer o chwaraewyr â photensial, ond ni lwyddodd i gael digon o gymorth i redeg y clwb. Yn ogystal â'r mentrau yr ydych newydd sôn amdanyst, sef hyfforddi chwaraewyr, hyfforddwyr a dyfarnwyr, a allech ystyried ffyrdd o ddenu pobl i reoli'r gêm ar lawr gwlad, a'u cynorthwyo i wneud hynny?

**Alun Pugh:** It is good to hear of success, and it is always sad to hear of teams disbanding. As an Assembly Government policy objective, we want to increase the number of people taking part in sport and active recreation across all sports and across all parts of Wales. It is a key part of our 'Climbing Higher' strategy, and this is precisely what we will work on, with budgets, in the sports council in the near future.

2.40 p.m.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Er gwaethaf blwyddyn drychinebus i glwb criced Morgannwg, a wnewch chi ymuno â mi i'w longyfarch ar ei arfer o chwarae gemau y tu allan i Gaerdydd, yn enwedig ei ymweliad blynnyddol â Bae Colwyn, sydd yn llwyddiant mawr? A wnewch chi ymuno â mi hefyd i longyfarch Clwb Criced Bae Colwyn ar ei llwyddiant wrth lwyfannu'r gêm a sicrhau y bydd adnoddau ar gael i wella caeau criced fel un Bae Colwyn ar hyd a lled y Gogledd?

**Alun Pugh:** I am always happy to congratulate sporting successes, particularly those that occur in my Clwyd West constituency, in Colwyn Bay. Your point

**Alun Pugh:** Mae'n dda clywed am lwyddiant, ac mae bob amser yn drist clywed am dimau'n mynd ar chwâl. Fel un o amcanion polisi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yr ydym am gynyddu nifer y bobl sy'n cymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon a gweithgareddau hamdden ymhob maes a ledled Cymru. Mae'n rhan allweddol o'n strategaeth 'Anelu'n Uwch', a dyma'n union yr hyn y byddwn yn gweithio arno, gyda chyllidebau, yn y cyngor chwaraeon yn y dyfodol agos.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Despite a disastrous year for the Glamorgan cricket club, will you join me in congratulating it on its practice of playing matches outside Cardiff, and particularly on its annual visit to Colwyn Bay, which is a great success? Will you also join me in congratulating Colwyn Bay Cricket Club on its successful staging of the game, and will you ensure that facilities will be available to improve cricket pitches such as the one at Colwyn Bay and others across north Wales?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr wyf bob amser yn falch o longyfarch llwyddiannau ym myd chwaraeon, yn enwedig y rhai sy'n digwydd yn fy etholaeth i sef Gorllewin Clwyd, ym

about Glamorgan's visit to north Wales is well made. As well as being a great sporting event, it is a very important economic development event. It is not only cricket fans who look forward to the event; it is eagerly anticipated by people who run hotels, pubs and restaurants.

**Catherine Thomas:** I am sure that you will agree that players, such as the extremely talented Simon Jones—who, I am very proud to say, was born and brought up in my home village of Dafen in Llanelli—have done much to promote the game of cricket. What encouragement and support is being given to girls to play cricket? We must also remember the wonderful victory of the women's team against the Australians.

**Alun Pugh:** I am pleased to say that girls' cricket is growing. There are 65 girls' school teams taking part. There is good growth in girls' cricket and in disabled cricket, which I know is a special interest of yours. I am pleased to see progress in those areas.

**Laura Anne Jones:** I would like to take the opportunity to congratulate the male and female England cricket teams on their fantastic and well deserved victories over Australia in the Ashes—[*Interruption.*] For those on the other side of the Chamber who obviously do not understand, there are both English and Welsh players in the England team. The high standard of play and team spirit in the game serve to attract many—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I find the discussion very tedious. As someone who has always supported all Welsh players from Glamorgan in the England team, I am very happy to rejoice in all celebrations of this kind.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Thank you. We need to capitalise on the victory. Over the summer, I undertook a review of cricket, talking to the England and Wales Cricket Board, schools, and the head of the United Cricket Board of South Africa to see what they do. I will report the results of the review to the Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee over

Mae Colwyn. Mae eich pwynt ynghylch ymweliad Morgannwg â'r Gogledd yn un da. Yn ogystal â bod yn ddigwyddiad o bwys ym myd chwaraeon, mae'n ddigwyddiad pwysig iawn ym maes datblygu economaidd. Nid dim ond dilynwyr criced sy'n edrych ymlaen at y digwyddiad; mae pobl sy'n rhedeg gwestai, tafarnau a bwytai yn edrych ymlaen yn eiddgar ato hefyd.

**Catherine Thomas:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch fod chwaraewyr, megis Simon Jones sy'n dalentog dros ben—ac, y mae'n braf gennyf ddweud, a anwyd ac a fagwyd yn fy mhentref genedigol sef Dafen yn Llanelli—wedi gwneud cryn dipyn i hyrwyddo criced. Pa anogaeth a chymorth a roddir i ferched i chwarae criced? Rhaid inni hefyd gofio buddugoliaeth wych y tîm merched yn erbyn Awstralia.

**Alun Pugh:** Yr wyf yn falch o ddweud bod criced ymhliith merched yn tyfu. Mae 65 o dimau ysgol merched yn cymryd rhan. Ceir twf da mewn criced merched a chried pobl anabl, sydd o ddiddordeb arbennig ichi miwn. Yr wyf yn falch o weld cynydd yn y meysydd hyn.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Hoffwn achub ar y cyfle i longyfarch timau criced dynion a merched Lloegr ar eu buddugoliaethau gwych a haeddiannol yn erbyn Awstralia yng nghystadlaeth y Lludw—[*Tori ar draws.*] Ar gyfer y rhai ar ochr arall y Siambra nad ydynt yn amlwg yn deall, mae chwaraewyr o Gymru a Lloegr yn nhîm Lloegr. Mae safon uchel y chwarae ac ysbryd y tîm yn siŵr o ddenu llawer-

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r drafodaeth yn ddiflas iawn yn fy marn i. Fel rhywun sydd bob amser wedi cefnogi holl chwaraewyr Cymru o Forgannwg yn nhîm Lloegr, yr wyf yn falch iawn o ddathlu pob llwyddiant o'r fath.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Diolch. Mae angen inni fanteisio ar y fuddugoliaeth. Dros yr haf, cynhaliais adolygiad o griced, gan siarad â Bwrdd Criced Cymru a Lloegr, ysgolion, a phennaeth Bwrdd Criced Unedig De Affrica i weld yr hyn a wnânt hwy. Byddaf yn cyflwyno canlyniadau'r adolygiad i'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a

Christmas. Can you assure me that, on the back of my review and the outstanding Ashes victory, which has served to increase enthusiasm for the sport, you will look into the structure and funding of cricket in Wales, so that we can ensure that people, particularly children, have the same opportunities as those in England and other parts of the world?

**Alun Pugh:** As I said earlier, the funding situation is improving, with public investment at around £300,000. That is a substantial real-terms increase in investment in cricket. I am very happy to join you and the Llywydd in celebrating the Ashes success. I wish that every Assembly Member felt that way.

Chwaraeon dros gyfnod y Nadolig. A allwch fy sicrhau, yn sgil fy adolygiad a llwyddiant gwyn y Lludw, sydd wedi cynyddu brwdfrydedd ym maes criced, y gwnewch ymchwilio i strwythur a phroses ariannu criced yng Nghymru, fel y gallwn sicrhau bod pobl, yn enwedig plant, yn cael yr un cyfleoedd â'r rhai yn Lloegr a rhannau eraill o'r byd?

**Alun Pugh:** Fel y soniais yn gynharach, mae'r sefyllfa ariannu yn gwella, gyda buddsoddiad cyhoeddus oddeutu £300,000. Mae hynny'n gynnydd gwirioneddol sylweddol o ran buddsoddi mewn criced. Yr wyf yn falch iawn o ymuno â chi a'r Llywydd i ddathlu llwyddiant y Lludw. Trueni nad yw pob Aelod o'r Cynulliad yn teimlo felly.

### **Hybu'r Gymraeg yn Sir Gaerfyrddin Promoting the Welsh Language in Carmarthenshire**

**C3 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Pa gynnlluniau newydd sydd gan y Llywodraeth i hybu'r iaith Gymraeg yn sir Gaerfyrddin? OAQ0370(CWL)

**Alun Pugh:** Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn hybu'r Gymraeg ym mhob rhan o Gymru gan gynnwys sir Gaerfyrddin. Edrychaf ymlaen at lansio'r pecyn 'Symud i Gymru' yng Nghaerfyrddin ar 13 Hydref.

**Q3 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** What new initiatives does the Assembly Government have to promote the Welsh language in Carmarthenshire? OAQ0370(CWL)

**Alun Pugh:** The Assembly Government promotes the use of the Welsh language in every part of Wales, including Carmarthenshire. I am looking forward to launching the 'Moving to Wales' pack in Carmarthen on 13 October.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Weinidog, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn derbyn mai sir Gaerfyrddin sydd â'r nifer fwyaf o siaradwyr Cymraeg yng Nghymru. A fyddch hefyd yn derbyn bod y lliaws tyngedfennol yn sylfaenol ar gyfer cynnal a hybu'r Gymraeg? O dderbyn bod natur ieithyddol y sir yn newid, beth ydych yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod nifer y siaradwyr Cymraeg yn sir Gaerfyrddin nid yn unig yn parhau ar yr un lefel, ond yn cynyddu, er mwyn sicrhau nad ydym yn colli'r elfen honno o liaws tyngedfennol?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Minister, I am sure that you will accept that Carmarthenshire is the county with the highest number of Welsh speakers in Wales. Do you also accept that the critical mass is something that is fundamental to maintaining and promoting the Welsh language? Accepting that the linguistic nature of the county is changing, what are you doing to ensure that the number of Welsh speakers in Carmarthenshire is not only maintained, but increased, to ensure that we do not lose that element of critical mass?

**Alun Pugh:** Carmarthenshire is indeed the county with the highest number of Welsh speakers. It is, therefore, crucial to the future of the language. We are increasing the funding for the mentrau iaith to £221,000, and there is increased funding for other organisations with a strong presence in the

**Alun Pugh:** Sir Gaerfyrddin yn wir yw'r sir â'r nifer fwyaf o siaradwyr Cymraeg. Felly, mae'n hanfodol i ddyfodol yr iaith. Yr ydym yn cynyddu'r arian a roddir i'r mentrau iaith i £221,000, ac mae mwy o arian hefyd ar gael ar gyfer sefydliadau eraill sy'n amlwg iawn yn y sir, megis y Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin,

county, such as Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin, Urdd Gobaith Cymru and the *papurau bro*.

We have opened a Welsh Language Board regional office in Carmarthen with eight members of staff. The *athrawon bro* get £168,000 and the county has a full-time Twf officer, whereas other counties only have a part-time officer for the work. Therefore, there is a great deal of public investment taking place in that county, I am pleased to say.

**Lisa Francis:** What discussions have you had with the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning on the effects of potential closures of small schools in Carmarthenshire on the Welsh language, and what conclusions did you reach?

**Alun Pugh:** The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning is as committed as I am to the Assembly Government's policy objective of creating a bilingual Wales. We both support Welsh-medium education, and, in terms of school closures, the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning has a statutory role in that matter.

Urdd Gobaith Cymru a'r *papurau bro*.

Yr ydym wedi agor swyddfa ranbarthol Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg yng Nghaerfyrddin gydag wyth aelod o staff. Mae'r *athrawon bro* yn cael £168,000 ac mae gan y sir swyddog Twf llawn amser, ond dim ond swyddog rhan amser sydd gan siroedd eraill ar gyfer y gwaith. Felly, mae cryn dipyn o fuddsoddi cyhoeddus yn y sir honno, y mae'n falch gennyl ddweud.

**Lisa Francis:** Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi eu cael gyda'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ar yr effaith y gallai cau ysgolion bach yn Sir Gaerfyrddin ei chael ar yr iaith Gymraeg, a pha gasgliadau y daethoch iddynt?

**Alun Pugh:** Mae'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yr un mor ymrwymedig â mi i amcan polisi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o greu Cymru ddwyieithog. Yr ydym ill dau yn cefnogi addysg cyfrwng Gymraeg, ac, o ran cau ysgolion, mae gan y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes rôl statudol yn hynny o beth.

### Dyfodol Cwmniâu Theatr Rhanbarthol yng Nghaerdydd The Future of Regional Theatre Companies in Cardiff

**Q4 Jenny Randerson:** Will the Minister make a statement on the future of regional theatre companies in Cardiff?  
OAQ0377(CWL)

**Alun Pugh:** Cardiff's theatre companies are key to the development of English-language theatre, mainstream drama productions and cross-border touring in south Wales. The Sherman Theatre and the New Theatre are working with the Arts Council of Wales to consider ways in which individual venues can work together on programming that will benefit all of our capital city.

**C4 Jenny Randerson:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am dyfodol cwmniâu theatr rhanbarthol yng Nghaerdydd?  
OAQ0377(CWL)

**Alun Pugh:** Mae cwmniâu theatr Caerdydd yn chwarae rhan allweddol yn y gwaith o ddatblygu theatr iaith Saesneg, cynyrciadau drama prif ffrwd a theithiau trawsffiniol yn Ne Cymru. Mae Theatr y Sherman a'r New Theatre yn gweithio gyda Chyngor Celfyddydau Cymru er mwyn ystyried ym mha ffyrdd y gall lleoliadau unigol gydweithio ar raglennu a fydd o fudd i'n prifddinas gyfan.

**Jenny Randerson:** You mentioned the Sherman Theatre, which is the only producing house in Cardiff. It does some excellent work with disadvantaged young people, which has been much acclaimed. The building occupied by the theatre is owned by the Arts Council of Wales and is in urgent

**Jenny Randerson:** Crybwyllyd Theatr y Sherman gennych, sef yr unig dî cynhyrchu yng Nghaerdydd. Mae'n gwneud gwaith ardderchog gyda phobl ifanc ddifreintiedig, sydd wedi'i ganmol yn fawr. Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru sy'n berchen ar yr adeilad y mae'r theatr yn ei ddefnyddio ac

need of refurbishment. The theatre is now through to phase D of a feasibility study, but is not able to apply for money because it happens to be in Cardiff. Will you review your instruction that further money should not be made available for activities in Cardiff in the light of the great importance of the community work that such organisations do?

**Alun Pugh:** I do not think that there are any arguments over the fact that the Sherman Theatre is in need of capital investment. Anyone who has been around the facility will be aware of that. You appear to be labouring under a misapprehension in terms of arts funding. There is a special, additional pot of money for the arts outside Cardiff, which is appropriate given our major investment in the Wales Millennium Centre. However, there is certainly no ban on investment in our capital city.

mae angen ei adnewyddu ar frys. Mae'r theatr wedi cyrraedd cam D astudiaeth ddichonoldeb bellach, ond ni all wneud cais am arian am ei bod yng Nghaerdydd. A wnewch adolygu eich cyfarwyddyd na ddylid darparu rhagor o arian ar gyfer gweithgareddau yng Nghaerdydd yng ngoleuni pwysigrwydd mawr y gwaith cymunedol a wna sefydliadau o'r fath?

**Alun Pugh:** Ni chredaf fod unrhyw ddadleuon yng hylch y ffaith bod angen buddsoddiad cyfalaf ar Theatr y Sherman. Bydd unrhyw un sydd wedi bod yno yn ymwybodol o hyunny. Ymddengys eich bod wedi camddeall y cysyniad o ariannu'r celfyddydau. Mae cronfa ychwanegol, arbennig o arian ar gael ar gyfer y celfyddydau y tu allan i Gaerdydd, sy'n briodol o gofio ein buddsoddiad mawr yng Nghanol fan Mileniwm Cymru. Fodd bynnag, nid oes unrhyw waharddiad ar fuddsoddi yn ein prifddinas.

### Dyfodol Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg The Future of the Welsh Language Board

**C5 Eleanor Burnham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am swyddogaethau statudol Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg unwaith iddo ddod yn rhan o Lywodraeth y Cynulliad? OAQ0357(CWL)

**Alun Pugh:** The Welsh Language Board will not have any statutory functions once it has been merged into the Assembly Government, because there will not be a Welsh Language Board.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Ag ystyried bod bwrdd yr iaith wedi'i sefydlu i fonitro a chadw golwg ar ddatblygiad a defnydd yr iaith, gan gynnwys defnydd yr iaith gan y Llywodraeth, sut caiff hyn ei weithredu'n effeithlon o dan y drefn newydd, ac a wnewch sicrhau y bydd hyn yn digwydd?

**Alun Pugh:** Issues ranging from the short-term promotion of the Welsh language to the realisation of the Assembly Government's stated policy aim of delivering a bilingual Wales in the long term will be a clear policy responsibility of the culture department. The only area that will not fall within the culture department is the role of the dyfarnydd.

**Q5 Eleanor Burnham:** Will the Minister make a statement on the statutory functions of the Welsh Language Board once it is merged into the Assembly Government? OAQ0357(CWL)

**Alun Pugh:** Ni fydd gan Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg swyddogaethau statudol unwaith y bydd yn rhan o Lywodraeth y Cynulliad gan na fydd Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg yn bodoli.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Given that the Welsh Language Board was established to monitor the development and use of the language, including the use of the language by the Government, how will this be implemented effectively under the new system, and will you ensure that this will happen?

**Alun Pugh:** Bydd materion yn amrywio o hyrwyddo'r iaith Gymraeg yn y byrdymor i gyflawni nod polisi datganedig Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, sef sicrhau Cymru ddwyieithog yn yr hirdymor, yn un o gyfrifoldebau polisi clir yr adran diwylliant. Yr unig faes na fydd yr adran diwylliant yn gyfrifol amdano yw'r rôl y dyfarnydd.

**Leighton Andrews:** The Welsh Language Board normally publishes a report on the carrying out of its statutory functions with some fanfare. Will you speculate on why there was rather less fanfare on the publication of its annual report this year?

**Alun Pugh:** I believe that the Welsh Language Board's annual report is widely available in printed form and on the internet.

**Owen John Thomas:** A ydych yn rhagweld y caiff dyletswyddau Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg i fonitro cynlluniau addysg Gymraeg yr awdurdodau lleol eu trosglwyddo o'r adran diwylliant i uned iaith Gymraeg o fewn yr adran addysg?

2.50 p.m.

**Alun Pugh:** Responsibility for all Welsh-language issues will move to the culture department following the merger. Future allocations of policy responsibilities, across Government, will remain a matter for the First Minister.

**William Graham:** Now that the executive structure is to go, how will you ensure that morale is maintained among the excellent staff who have run the Welsh Language Board for so many years?

**Alun Pugh:** I have met many Welsh Language Board staff on many occasions, and, on every occasion possible, I state the Welsh Assembly Government's very clear aim of creating a bilingual Wales. We want to work with the staff in achieving that. I see no reason why individual members of the Welsh Language Board should be downcast about this; this puts the Welsh language on a stronger, rather than a weaker, footing.

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg fel arfer yn cyhoeddi adroddiad ar gyflawni ei swyddogaethau statudol gyda rhywfaint o ymffrost. A wnewch ddyfalu pam y bu llai o ymffrost pan gyhoeddwyd ei adroddiad blynnyddol eleni?

**Alun Pugh:** Credaf fod adroddiad blynnyddol Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg ar gael yn eang ar ffurf argraffedig ac ar y rhyngrwyd.

**Owen John Thomas:** Do you anticipate that the duties of the Welsh Language Board in monitoring local authorities' Welsh-medium education schemes will be transferred from the culture department to a Welsh language unit within the Assembly's education department?

**Alun Pugh:** Bydd y cyfrifoldeb dros bob mater sy'n ymwneud â'r iaith Gymraeg yn cael ei drosglwyddo i'r adran diwylliant yn dilyn yr uno. Y Prif Weinidog a fydd yn parhau i ddyrannu cyfrifoldebau dros bolisiau yn y dyfodol, ar draws y Llywodraeth.

**William Graham:** Gan fod y strwythur gweithredol yn cael ei ddileu yn awr, sut y gwnewch sicrhau bod morâl yn cael ei gynnal ymhlið y staff ardderchog sydd wedi rhedeg Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg am gymaint o flynyddoedd?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr wyf wedi cwrdd â sawl aelod o staff Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg ar sawl achlysur, ac, ar bob achlysur posibl, amlinellaf nod clir iawn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o greu Cymru ddwyieithog. Yr ydym am weithio gyda'r staff i gyflawni hynny. Ni welaf unrhyw reswm pam y dylai aelodau unigol o Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg fod yn ddigalon yn hyn o beth; mae hyn yn rhoi'r iaith Gymraeg mewn sefyllfa gryfach, yn hytrach na gwannach.

### Dyfarnydd Iaith

**C6 Elin Jones:** Pa drafodaethau diweddar mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cynnal gyda Llywodraeth San Steffan ynglŷn â chreu swydd y dyfarnydd iaith? OAQ0364(CWL)

**Q6 Elin Jones:** What recent discussions has the Minister had with the Government in Westminster regarding the creation of the post of dyfarnydd iaith? OAQ0364(CWL)

**Alun Pugh:** Cefais gyfarfod gyda'r Is-Ysgrifennydd Gwladol, Nick Ainger, er mwyn trafod rôl y dyfarnydd.

**Elin Jones:** Weinidog, gan fod angen deddfwriaeth newydd ar swyddogaeth y dyfarnydd—a gobeithiaf taw'r Cynulliad fydd yn gwneud hynny, nid San Steffan—a ydych wedi ystyried rhoi i'r dyfarnydd swyddogaeth llawer mwy cynhwysfawr na phwerau presennol Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg i ddyfarnu ar gynlluniau iaith, a bod y pwerau hynny yn cynnwys yr elfen o hyrwyddo'r Gymraeg ym mhob maes, fel bod y swydd yn debycach i gomisiynydd iaith yn hytrach nag un sydd â rôl ddyfarnol yn unig?

**Alun Pugh:** You are right that we will need new legislation to put the role of dyfarnydd on a fully statutory footing; that is clear. It is not our intention, however, to have a very wide-ranging brief for the dyfarnydd. We see issues such as the promotion of the Welsh language as very much a policy responsibility, and a responsibility for Government.

**Bryngle Williams:** Weinidog, a ydych yn credu, drwy ymgorffori Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg, gan lusgo'r mater yn ôl i'r maes gwleidyddol, eich bod yn dangos diffyg ymrwymiad tuag at greu dyfarnydd llwyddiannus i warchod iaith yr ydym mor falch ohoni?

**Alun Pugh:** There is nothing non-committal about my belief in a bilingual Wales. You suggest that having a policy responsibility for the Welsh language with an ASPB somehow depoliticises it—that is not something that I have noticed in the last two years.

**Alun Pugh:** I had a meeting with the Parliamentary Under-Secretary of State for Wales, Nick Ainger, to discuss the role of the dyfarnydd.

**Elin Jones:** Minister, as new legislation is required on the dyfarnydd's functions—and I hope that that will be done by the Assembly, not Westminster—have you considered giving the dyfarnydd a role that is far more comprehensive than the Welsh Language Board's current powers to adjudicate on language schemes, and having those powers include the promotion of the Welsh language in all fields, so that the post is more like that of a language commissioner rather than one that simply has an adjudicatory role?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr ydych yn gywir i ddweud y bydd angen deddfwriaeth newydd arnom i sicrhau bod rôl dyfarnydd yn gwbl statudol; mae hynny'n amlwg. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n fwriad gennym bennu brîff eang iawn ar gyfer y dyfarnydd. Yn ein barn ni mae materion megis hyrwyddo'r iaith Gymraeg yn gyfrifoldeb polisi, ac yn gyfrifoldeb y Llywodraeth.

**Bryngle Williams:** Minister, do you believe that, by bringing the Welsh Language Board in-house, thus dragging the matter back into the political arena, you are being non-committal towards the creation of a successful dyfarnydd to protect the language of which we are so proud?

**Alun Pugh:** Nid oes diffyg ymrwymiad gennyl tuag at Gymru ddwyieithog. Yr ydych yn awgrymu bod cyfrifoldeb polisi dros yr iaith Gymraeg gyda CCNC yn ei ddadwleidyddoli rywffordd—nid wyf wedi sylwi ar hynny yn ystod y ddwy flynedd diwethaf.

## Cadw

**Q7 Mark Isherwood:** Will the Minister make a statement on Cadw? OAQ0383(CWL)

**Alun Pugh:** Cadw is a division within the Welsh Assembly Government that advises me on the statutory protection, conservation and promotion of the historic environment of Wales.

**C7 Mark Isherwood:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am Cadw? OAQ0383(CWL)

**Alun Pugh:** Mae Cadw yn adran o fewn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru sy'n fynghynghori ar y broses statudol o ddiogelu, cadw a hyrwyddo amgylchedd hanesyddol Cymru.

**Mark Isherwood:** At its annual general meeting in Bangor this year, the British Association of Friends of Museums Cymru stated that heritage regenerated communities. I am sure that you will agree. However, without funding from the private sector, Cadw can only do 10 per cent of what it wants to achieve. What measures are you therefore proposing, or undertaking, to maximise private sector support for Cadw, so that it may fully contribute to community regeneration?

**Alun Pugh:** We are not looking for private sector support for Cadw as such, of course. Cadw has a very clearly defined statutory role. However, you are right to say that Cadw cannot simply do this on its own. That is very clear, and that is why we welcome investment from the private sector to develop the historic environment of Wales. We have a terrific legacy of historic buildings. The public sector has an important role to play, but so has the private sector.

**Mark Isherwood:** Yn ei chyfarfod cyffredinol blynnyddol ym Mangor eleni, nododd Cymdeithas Cyfeillion Amgueddfeydd Prydain Cymru fod treftadaeth yn adfywio cymunedau. Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch â hynny. Fodd bynnag, heb arian gan y sector preifat, dim ond 10 y cant o'r hyn y mae Cadw am ei gyflawni y gall ei gyflawni. Felly pa fesurau yr ydych yn eu cynnig, neu'n eu cymryd, i fanteisio i'r eithaf ar gymorth sector preifat ar gyfer Cadw, fel y gall gyfrannu'n llawn at adfywio cymunedau?

**Alun Pugh:** Nid ydym yn chwilio am gymorth sector preifat ar gyfer Cadw fel y cyfryw, wrth gwrs. Mae gan Cadw rôl statudol sydd wedi'i diffinio'n glir. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych yn gywir i ddweud na all Cadw wneud hyn ar ei ben ei hun. Mae hynny'n amlwg, a dyna pam yr ydym yn croesawu buddsoddiad gan y sector preifat i ddatblygu amgylchedd hanesyddol Cymru. Mae gennym etifeddiaeth wych o adeiladau hanesyddol. Mae gan y sector cyhoeddus ran bwysig i'w chwarae, ond mae hynny'n wir am y sector preifat hefyd.

### Nifer yr Oedolion sy'n Dysgu Cymraeg The Number of Adults Learning Welsh

**Q8 Mick Bates:** Will the Minister make a statement on the number of adults learning Welsh? OAQ0375(CWL)

**Alun Pugh:** In 2003-04, the latest year for which figures are available, 18,862 adults were learning Welsh on the Welsh for adults programme, thus exceeding Education and Learning Wales's Welsh for adults target for that year of 18,000 learners.

**Mick Bates:** I am sure that we welcome that number. However, I have had some concern expressed to me about support for adults learning Welsh after the Welsh Language Board is subsumed into the Government, and, in particular, the role of the mentrau iaith. Can you give us assurance that the support that they currently give will continue?

**Alun Pugh:** I can. When the Welsh

**C8 Mick Bates:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am nifer yr oedolion sy'n dysgu Cymraeg? OAQ0375(CWL)

**Alun Pugh:** Yn 2003-04, sef y flwyddyn ddiweddaraf y mae ffigurau ar gael ar ei chyfer, yr oedd 18,862 o oedolion yn dysgu Cymraeg ar y rhaglen Cymraeg i oedolion, gan ragori felly ar darged Cymraeg i oedolion Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru ar gyfer y flwyddyn honno sef 18,000 o ddysgwyr.

**Mick Bates:** Yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod yn croesawu'r nifer honno. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf wedi clywed pryderon ynghylch y cymorth a fydd ar gael i oedolion sy'n dysgu Cymraeg ar ôl i Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg ddod yn rhan o'r Llywodraeth, ac, yn arbennig, rôl y mentrau iaith. A allwch roi sicrwydd inni y bydd y cymorth y maent yn ei gael ar hyn o bryd yn parhau?

**Alun Pugh:** Gallaf. Pan fydd Bwrdd yr Iaith

Language Board is merged into the Assembly Government there will be no attempt to cut back on the number of Welsh for adults courses. We should celebrate the fact that so many thousands of adults every year take up the challenge of learning Welsh. It is a tough thing, as I know from personal experience, but we want to encourage more adults to learn Welsh, rather than fewer.

**Janet Ryder:** Many adults come into learning through centres such as Canolfan Iaith Clwyd in Denbigh. In ELWa's plans for developing language hubs, there does not seem to be a place for the canolfan iaith to step into. What do you see as being the future for centres such as Canolfan Iaith Clwyd, which has had such massive success in teaching adults Welsh?

**Alun Pugh:** You should refer detailed questions on education provision and funding to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning. I am familiar with that centre, having visited it and spoken with the staff there, and it does a good job of teaching Welsh to adults locally, as well as providing a wider resource to allow adults to practice conversing in Welsh.

Gymraeg yn uno â Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ni fydd unrhyw ymgais i gwtogi ar nifer y cyrsiau Cymraeg i oedolion. Dylem ddatlu'r ffaith bod cymaint o oedolion yn mynd i'r afael â'r her o ddysgu Cymraeg bob blwyddyn. Mae'n beth anodd ei wneud, fel y gwn o brofiad, ond yr ydym am annog mwy o oedolion i ddysgu Cymraeg, yn hytrach na llai ohonynt.

**Janet Ryder:** Mae llawer o oedolion yn dechrau dysgu drwy ganolfannau megis Canolfan Iaith Clwyd yn Ninbych. Yng nghynlluniau ELWa ar gyfer datblygu canolbwyt iaith, nid ymddengys fod lle i'r ganolfan iaith. Yn eich barn chi, beth yw dyfodol canolfannau megis Canolfan Iaith Clwyd, sydd wedi bod yn llwyddiannus iawn ym maes dysgu Cymraeg i oedolion?

**Alun Pugh:** Dylech gyfeirio cwestiynau manwl ar ddarparu ac ariannu addysg i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Yr wyf yn gyfarwydd â'r ganolfan honno, gan fy mod wedi ymweld â hi ac wedi siarad â'r staff yno, ac mae'n gwneud gwaith da o ran dysgu Cymraeg i oedolion yn lleol, yn ogystal â darparu adnodd ehangach i alluogi oedolion i ymarfer sgwrsio yn Gymraeg.

### Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru The Arts Council of Wales

**Q9 Lisa Francis:** Will the Minister make a statement on the Arts Council of Wales? OAQ0385(CWL)

**Alun Pugh:** The Arts Council of Wales is an Assembly sponsored public body and falls within my portfolio. It distributes grant-in-aid funding for the arts in Wales according to an annual remit letter set by me, and is accountable to the Welsh Assembly Government. It is also a lottery funding distributor.

**Lisa Francis:** The recent emasculation of the arts council has meant that it will lose its strategic planning role to the Welsh-Assembly-Government-controlled culture board. How will this new culture board glean and draw on the important local knowledge embodied in arts council officers, and how will the Government ensure that this important knowledge is not bypassed?

**C9 Lisa Francis:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru? OAQ0385(CWL)

**Alun Pugh:** Mae Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru yn gorff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad ac mae'n rhan o'm portffolio i. Mae'n dyrannu cymorth grant ar gyfer y celfyddydau yng Nghymru yn unol â llythyr cylch gwaith blynnyddol a lunnr gennyf, ac mae'n atebol i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Mae hefyd yn dyrannu arian loteri.

**Lisa Francis:** Mae dirymiad diweddar cyngor y celfyddydau wedi golygu y bydd yn colli ei rôl gynllunio strategol i'r bwrdd diwylliant a reolir gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Sut y bydd y bwrdd diwylliant newydd hwn yn manteisio ar y wybodaeth leol bwysig a feddir gan swyddogion cyngor y celfyddydau, a sut y bydd y Llywodraeth yn sicrhau nad anwybyddir y wybodaeth

bwysig hon?

**Alun Pugh:** We are not, as some people seem to think, abolishing the arts council; neither are we emasculating it. There will be a new relationship, and we want to work on developing a joint strategic planning capacity. However, the future for the arts in Wales is good; you only need to look at the budget figures—the historic spending figures and the planned budget, which was put on the web this week—to see that there is major investment in the arts in Wales.

**Alun Pugh:** Nid ydym, fel y mae rhai pobl yn ei gredu, yn diddymu cyngor y celfyddydau; nac ychwaith yn ei ddirymu. Bydd cydberthynas newydd yn cael ei chreu, ac yr ydym am weithio ar ddatblygu adnoddau cynllunio strategol ar y cyd. Fodd bynnag, mae'r dyfodol ar gyfer y celfyddydau yng Nghymru yn dda; dim ond edrych ar ffigurau'r gyllideb sydd angen ei wneud—y ffigurau gwariant hanesyddol a'r gyllideb arfaethedig, a roddwyd ar y we yr wythnos hon—i weld bod buddsoddi sylweddol yn y celfyddydau yng Nghymru.

### Arwyddocâd Diwylliant i Gymru The Significance of Culture in Wales

**Q10 Irene James:** What action has the Welsh Assembly Government taken to improve opportunities for young people to learn about the significance of culture to Wales? OAQ0399(CWL)

**Alun Pugh:** There is a myriad of activities under each of the subject areas within my portfolio to ensure that children and young people's effective participation. One example is Cadw's free visits for schools and education programmes initiative; there have been 80,000 free school visits to its sites across Wales this year alone.

**Irene James:** Initiatives such as free access to museums and galleries in Wales have opened up Welsh culture and Welsh history to children across the country. Do you agree that greater access and information about Welsh culture across information technology networks is an important complement to the measures taken to increase awareness of Welsh culture?

**Alun Pugh:** You are right that free admission has played a part in growing visitor numbers—a look at the admissions figures for the National Museums and Galleries of Wales shows that. Information technology also has an important part to play in delivering this to a much wider audience. That is why I am pleased to see that organisations as diverse as the National

**C10 Irene James:** Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi eu cymryd i wella'r cyfleoedd sydd ar gael i bobl ifanc i ddysgu am arwyddocâd diwylliant i Gymru? OAQ0399(CWL)

**Alun Pugh:** Ceir amryw weithgareddau ymhob maes pwnc yn fy mhortffolio i sicrhau bod plant a phobl ifanc yn chwarae rhan effeithiol. Un enghraift yw ymweliadau am ddim Cadw ar gyfer ysgolion a'r fenter rhagleni addysg; cynhaliwyd 80,000 o ymweliadau am ddim ar gyfer ysgolion â safleoedd ledled Cymru eleni'n unig.

**Irene James:** Mae mentrau megis mynediad am ddim i amgueddfeydd ac orielau yng Nghymru wedi cyflwyno diwylliant Cymru a hanes Cymru i blant ledled y wlad. A gytunwch fod mwy o fynediad i ddiwylliant Cymru a mwy o wybodaeth amdano ar draws rhwydweithiau technoleg gwybodaeth yn ychwanegiad pwysig i'r mesurau a gymerwyd i godi ymwybyddiaeth o ddiwylliant Cymru?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr ydych yn gywir bod mynediad am ddim wedi chwarae rhan yn nhwf niferoedd ymwelwyr—mae ffigurau mynediad Amgueddfeydd ac Orielau Cenedlaethol Cymru yn dangos hynny. Hefyd mae technoleg gwybodaeth yn chwarae rhan bwysig yn y gwaith o'i gyflwyno i gynulleidfa lawer ehangach. Dyna pam y mae'n bleser gennylf weld sefydliadau mor

Library of Wales, our museums and galleries service, and local museums—supported by CyMAL grants and the royal commission—are all involved in these activities. A great deal of innovative practice is taking place on websites, which I am sure will be a theme of our CyMAL debate in a few weeks' time.

amrywiol â Llyfrgell Genedlaethol Cymru, ein gwasanaeth amgueddfeydd ac orielau, ac amgueddfeydd lleol—a gefnogir gan grantiau CyMAL a'r comisiwn brenhinol—yn rhan o'r gweithgareddau hyn. Mae cryn dipyn o waith arloesol yn cael ei wneud ar wefannau, a fydd, mae'n siŵr, yn un o themâu ein dadl CymAL ymheng ychydig wythnosau.

**Kirsty Williams:** I am sure that you will agree, Minister, that we need to offer as many young people and children as possible the opportunity to learn the Welsh language as part of a broader understanding of Welsh culture. Due to a series of unfortunate events on the part of Powys County Council, the £350,000 that was allocated to Powys by the National Assembly for a purpose-built setting for three-year-olds to learn the language is now under threat. The parents of those children who attend the three-year-old setting, as well as the local meithrin group, are appealing to the National Assembly to allow that money to roll over for a further year so that Powys County Council can get its act together, and provide a purpose-built setting for young people in Brecon to have the opportunity to learn and play through the medium of Welsh. Will you speak to your colleague, the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, to ensure that the children of Brecon do not lose this money?

3.00 p.m.

**Alun Pugh:** I cannot answer for Powys County Borough Council, but, as a Government, we certainly want to encourage people of all ages, particularly children, to learn both our national languages.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 11, OAQ0372(CWL), yn ôl.

**Kirsty Williams:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn cytuno, Weinidog, bod angen inni gynnig y cyfle i gymaint o bobl ifanc a phlant â phosibl ddysgu Cymraeg fel rhan o ddealltwriaeth ehangach o ddiwylliant Cymru. O ganlyniad i gyfres o ddigwyddiadau anffodus o fewn Cyngor Sir Powys, mae'r £350,000 a ddyrannwyd i Bowys gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar gyfer adeilad pwrrpasol i blant tair blwydd oed dan fygythiad bellach. Mae rhieni'r plant hynny sy'n mynchy'u'r adeilad i blant tair blwydd oed, yn ogystal â'r grŵp meithrin lleol, yn erfyn ar y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i ganiatáu i'r arian hwnnw barhau am flwyddyn arall fel y gall Cyngor Sir Powys roi trefn ar bethau, a darparu adeilad pwrrpasol ar gyfer pobl ifanc yn Aberhonddu fel y gallant gael y cyfle i ddysgu a chwarae drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. A wnewch siarad â'ch cyd-aelod, y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, er mwyn sicrhau nad yw plant Aberhonddu yn colli'r arian hwn?

**Alun Pugh:** Ni allaf ateb ar ran Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Powys, ond, fel Llywodraeth, yr ydym yn sicr am annog pobl o bob oedran, yn enwedig plant, i ddysgu ein dwy iaith genedlaethol.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 11, OAQ0372(CWL), has been withdrawn.

### Mynediad y Cyhoedd at Ddiwylliant Cymru Public Access to Welsh Culture

**Q12 Denise Idris Jones:** What action has the Welsh Assembly Government taken to improve public access to Welsh culture? OAQ0398(CWL)

**Alun Pugh:** We have made considerable investment in improving public access to Welsh culture. One leading example is our

**C12 Denise Idris Jones:** Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi eu cymryd i wella mynediad y cyhoedd at ddiwylliant Cymru? OAQ0398(CWL)

**Alun Pugh:** Yr ydym wedi buddsoddi'n sylweddol i wella mynediad y cyhoedd at ddiwylliant Cymru. Un enghraifft amlwg yw

policy of free entry to the national museums and galleries of Wales, which has increased public access to our great national collections. This policy has been an enormous success, generating a 77 per cent increase in visitor numbers in 2004-05.

**Denise Idris Jones:** I am sure that you would agree that taking drama, dance and music into Communities First areas such as the Tudno ward in Llandudno and Maesgeirchen in Bangor, has given people living in those areas better access to cultural events. I visited the St Asaph festival last Saturday, and I was pleased to hear that workshops had been carried out with well-known artists such as Catrin Finch. She had worked in deprived areas, and I am sure that many people benefited.

**Alun Pugh:** That point is very well made. The arts council is about to publish a major participation survey, which takes the numbers right down to local authority level. If you look at participation in the arts, and who actually benefits from arts spending, it tends not to break across linguistic lines, nor does it relate to the part of Wales you live in—it is very much about socio-economic groups. People from deprived communities have not had a fair share of arts funding in the past, which is why we are deliberately steering the funding into Communities First areas, examples of which would be Theatr Clwyd's *Brassed Off* tour and the events that you have also brought to the Assembly's attention.

**Janet Davies:** You referred to the increase in visitor numbers since free entry to museums was introduced; I believe you said that it was 77 per cent. What percentage of that increase comprised of people from deprived communities?

**Alun Pugh:** I will certainly write to you on that. I do not have the exact figure in front of me this afternoon, but it is my clear understanding that that growth has been disproportionate across socio-economic groups, and that people from poorer communities have taken more advantage of

ein polisi o fynediad am ddim i amgueddfeydd ac orielau Cymru, sydd wedi gwella mynediad y cyhoedd at ein casgliadau cenedlaethol mawr. Mae'r polisi hwn wedi bod yn llwyddiant ysgubol, ac mae wedi peri i nifer yr ymwelwyr gynyddu 77 y cant yn 2004-05.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddech yn cytuno bod mynd â drama, dawns a cherddoriaeth i ardaloedd Cymunedau'n Gyntaf fel ward Tudno yn Llandudno a Maesgeirchen ym Mangor wedi rhoi gwell mynediad i ddigwyddiadau diwylliannol i bobl yn yr ardaloedd hynny. Ymwelais â gŵyl Llanelwy ddydd Sadwrn diwethaf ac yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed bod gweithdai wedi eu cynnal gydag artistiaid adnabyddus fel Catrin Finch. Bu'n gweithio mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig, ac yr wyf yn siŵr bod llawer o bobl wedi elwa ar hynny.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae hwnnw'n bwynt da iawn. Mae cyngor y celfyddydau ar fin cyhoeddi arolwg mawr o gyfranogiad, sy'n edrych ar niferoedd hyd at lefel awdurdodau lleol. Os edrychwch ar gyfranogiad yn y celfyddydau, a phwy sy'n elwa ar wariant ar y celfyddydau, nid yw'n tueddu i groesi llinellau ieithyddol, ac nid yw ychwaith yn gysylltiedig â'r rhan o Gymru yr ydych yn byw yn ddi—mae llawer ohono'n ymwneud â grwpiau economaidd-gymdeithasol. Nid yw pobl o gymunedau difreintiedig wedi cael cyfran deg o arian y celfyddydau yn y gorffennol. Dyna pam yr ydym yn llywio arian i ardaloedd Cymunedau'n Gyntaf yn fwriadol, a byddai taith Theatr Clwyd, *Brassed Off*, a'r digwyddiadau yr ydych wedi tynnu sylw'r Cynulliad atynt yn enghreifftiau o hyn.

**Janet Davies:** Bu ichi gyfeirio at y cynnydd yn nifer yr ymwelwyr ers cyflwyno mynediad am ddim i amgueddfeydd; credaf ichi ddweud ei fod yn 77 y cant. Pa ganran o'r cynnydd hwnnw oedd yn bobl o gymunedau difreintiedig?

**Alun Pugh:** Yn sicr fe ysgrifennaf atoch ynglŷn â hynny. Nid yw'r union ffigurau wrth law gennyf y prynhawn yma, ond deallaf y bu'r cynnydd yn anghymesur ar draws grwpiau economaidd-gymdeithasol, a bod pobl o gymunedau tlotach wedi manteisio'n fwy ar fynediad am ddim na'r rhai sydd bob

the free access than people who are always able to pay. amser yn gallu talu.

## Cwestiynau i Bwyllgor y Tŷ Questions to the House Committee

### Y Siambrau Drafod Newydd The New Debating Chamber

**C1 Owen John Thomas:** A wnaiff cynrychiolydd Pwyllgor y Tŷ roi'r newyddion diweddaraf i ni ynghlyn â phryd fydd Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad yn ysgwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb dros y siambr drafod newydd? OAQ0007(HC)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer (John Marek):** The House Committee will decide whether to take responsibility for the new building when satisfied that it is complete in accordance with the building contract and properly fitted out.

**Owen John Thomas:** Pryd ydych yn disgwyl inni allu symud mewn i'r adeilad a'i ddefnyddio fel siambr?

**John Marek:** The timetable has slipped a little, but I expect that we will get it ready, be in there and in operation before St David's Day next year.

**Q1 Owen John Thomas:** Will the representative of the House Committee update us on when the Assembly Parliamentary Service will take responsibility for the new debating chamber? OAQ0007(HC)

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd (John Marek):** Bydd Pwyllgor y Tŷ yn penderfynu a fydd yn cymryd cyfrifoldeb dros yr adeilad newydd pan fydd yn fodlon ei fod wedi'i gwblhau yn unol â'r contract adeiladu a bod popeth yn ei le.

**Owen John Thomas:** When do you expect to be able to move into the building and to use it as a chamber?

**John Marek:** Mae'r amserlen wedi llithro ychydig, ond disgwyliaf y bydd yn barod, y byddwn wedi symud i mewn iddo ac y bydd yn weithredol cyn Dydd Gŵyl Dewi'r flwyddyn nesaf.

## Datganiad Busnes Diwygiedig Revised Business Statement

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I come forward with the revised business statement for the next three weeks, in accordance with Standing Orders No. 5.4 and 5.5. I have revised the business statement to take into account the will of the Assembly. Members will see that I have scheduled time on Wednesday, 5 October, for a motion to establish a Standing Order No. 8.1 committee, in accordance with the Inquiries Act 2005 to consider the terms of reference for an inquiry to be held into the recent E.coli outbreaks in Wales. On 11 October, I have scheduled time for the motion to elect the members to that committee, and I have scheduled time on 12 October for a debate on council tax in Wales. To accommodate this

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cyflwynaf y datganiad busnes diwygiedig am y tair wythnos nesaf, yn unol â Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 5.4 a 5.5. Yr wyf wedi diwygio'r datganiad busnes i ystyried ewyllys y Cynulliad. Bydd Aelodau'n gweld fy mod wedi trefnu amser ddydd Mercher, 5 Hydref, ar gyfer cynnig i sefydlu pwyllgor Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 8.1, yn unol â Deddf Ymchwiliadau 2005 i ystyried cylch gorchwyl ar gyfer cynnal ymchwiliad i'r achosion diweddar o E.coli yng Nghymru. Ar 11 Hydref, yr wyf wedi trefnu amser ar gyfer y cynnig i ethol aelodau i'r pwyllgor hwnnw, ac yr wyf wedi trefnu amser ar 12 Hydref ar gyfer dadl ar y dreth gyngor yng Nghymru. Er mwyn caniatáu amser ar gyfer y ddadl

debate, I have deferred the debate on the annual report of the local government partnership scheme 2004-05 until 18 October. The remainder of the statement is as yesterday and can be found on the Chamberweb under supporting documents.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiadau i'r datganiad busnes diwygiedig? Gwelaf nad oes. A oes sylwadau?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Weinidog, ar ran grŵp Plaid Cymru, diolchaf yn fawr ichi am dderbyn ewyllys y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ac am sylweddoli mai dyma'r ffordd ymlaen a bod rhaid i unrhyw ymchwiliad fod yn gyhoeddus, ac, yn bwysicach na hynny, fod yn rhaid iddo gael ymddiriedaeth y bobl. Yr unig ffordd y caiff ymddiriedaeth lwyd y bobl yw drwy ei gwneud yn glir fod pawb yn y lle hwn yn unfryd eu cefnogaeth. Yr ydym yn diolch i chi am dderbyn barn y mwyaf.

**David Melding:** The Conservative group is also grateful to the Business Minister for responding in a graceful fashion. It is incumbent on the Government to give more control over Assembly business to the opposition parties from time to time, and I am grateful that there will be a debate on the council tax position. However, as a minority Government, you have to recognise that there are times when you are going to lose votes on business, but whenever you come back in this fashion and generally take seriously the concerns that have been raised, you will find that we are equally serious and graceful in our response.

**Kirsty Williams:** I should like to think that I am reasonably graceful most of the time. I congratulate the Business Minister on the wise way in which she has responded to the Assembly's stance yesterday. She does well to acknowledge the political realities with which she is faced.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** Political wisdom is of the essence, and I believe that it was political wisdom that made the First Minister, and, indeed, the Minister for Health and Social Services, say last week that we would have to hold an inquiry. That

hon, yr wyf wedi gohirio'r ddadl ar adroddiad blynnyddol cynllun partneriaeth llywodraeth leol 2004-05 tan 18 Hydref. Mae gweddill y datganiad fel yr oedd ddoe a gellir dod o hyd iddo ar We'r Siambr o dan yr adran dogfennau ategol.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there any objections to the revised business statement? I see that there are none. Are there any comments?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Minister, on behalf of the Plaid Cymru group, I thank you very much for accepting the will of the National Assembly, and for recognising that this is the way forward and that any inquiry must be a public one, and, more importantly, that it must have people's confidence. The inquiry will only gain people's complete confidence if it is apparent that everyone here is united in support of it. We thank you for accepting the majority opinion.

**David Melding:** Mae grŵp y Ceidwadwyr hefyd yn ddiolchgar i'r Trefnydd am ymateb yn raslon. Mae'n ddyletswydd ar y Llywodraeth i roi mwy o reolaeth dros fusnes y Cynulliad i'r gwrthbleidiau o bryd i'w gilydd, ac yr wyf yn falch y bydd dadl ar y sefyllfa o ran y dreth gyngor. Fodd bynnag, fel Llywodraeth leiafrifol, rhaid ichi gydnabod bod adegau pan fyddwch yn colli pleidleisiau ar fusnes, ond pryd bynnag y byddwch yn dod yn ôl atom fel hyn ac yn ystyried y pryderon a godwyd o ddifrif, fe welwch ein bod ninnau'n hefyd yn ymateb o ddifrif ac yn raslon.

**Kirsty Williams:** Hoffwn feddwl fy mod yn eithaf graslon y rhan fwyaf o'r amser. Llongyfarchaf y Trefnydd ar ddoethineb y ffordd y bu iddi ymateb i safbwyt y Cynulliad ddoe. Llwydda i gydnabod y sefyllfa wleidyddol sy'n ei hwynебу.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Mae doethineb gwleidyddol yn hanfodol, chredaf mai doethineb gwleidyddol a achosodd i'r Prif Weinidog, ac, yn wir, y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, ddweud yr wythnos diwethaf y byddai'n rhaid

was really the starting point of what has been a welcome cross-party approach. I am delighted that we are moving forward in this constructive way, and I am grateful for the comments from the opposition parties.

inni gynnal ymchwiliad. Dyna oedd man cychwyn yr hyn sydd erbyn hyn yn agwedd trawsbleidiol a groesewir. Yr wyf yn falch iawn ein bod yn bwrw ati mewn ffordd mor adeiladol, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y sylwadau gan y gwrthbleidiau.

*Debyniwyd y datganiad busnes diwygiedig.  
Revised business statement adopted.*

## **Datganiad ar Wasanaethau'r Heddlu yn Lloegr a Chymru Statement on Police Services in England and Wales**

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** I am grateful for the opportunity to make a statement on the Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Constabulary's report on police force structures, 'Closing the Gap', which was published on 16 September. The Home Secretary commissioned this report in June 2004 in response to growing concern from within the police service about an emerging gap in tackling serious cross-border crime.

The Home Secretary asked the HMIC to provide its professional assessment of whether the existing force structure is fit for purpose in the twenty-first century. As well as looking at forces' capacity and capability to tackle serious organised crime, it also reviewed forces' ability to provide a range of protective services in the fields of serious organised crime, counter terrorism and domestic extremism, civil contingencies and emergency planning, critical incident management, major crimes such as homicide, and public order and strategic roads policing.

The HMIC found a correlation between a force's size and its ability to provide effective protective services. It considered that forces with fewer than 4,000 officers or 6,000 staff simply do not have the necessary critical mass to provide the necessary level of protective services. Only seven forces in England meet this threshold. None of the Welsh forces currently has this capability—South Wales Police, the largest force in Wales, has 3,268 officers.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyflawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i wneud datganiad ar adroddiad Arolygiaeth Cwnstabliaeth Ei Mawrhydi ar strwythurau heddluoedd, 'Closing the Gap', a gyhoeddwyd ar 16 Medi. Comisiynwyd yr adroddiad gan yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref ym mis Mehefin 2004 mewn ymateb i bryder cynyddol yng ngwasanaeth yr heddlu bod bwlc yn ymddangos o ran mynd i'r afael â throseddu difrifol ar draws ffiniau.

Gofynnodd yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref i'r Arolygiaeth ddarparu asesiad proffesiynol i weld a yw strwythur presennol heddluoedd yn addas at ddibenion yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Yn ogystal ag edrych ar allu heddluoedd i fynd i'r afael â throseddu cyfundrefnol difrifol, adolygydwyd gallu heddluoedd i ddarparu amrywiaeth o wasanaethau diogelu ym meysydd troseddu cyfundrefnol, gwrthderfysgaeth ac eithafiaeth ddomestig, argyfyngau sifil a chynllunio brys, rheoli digwyddiadau tyngedfennol, troseddu difrifol fel dynladdiad, a phlismona trefn gyhoeddus a ffyrdd strategol.

Canfu'r Arolygiaeth gydberthynas rhwng maint heddlu a'i allu i ddarparu gwasanaethau diogelu effeithiol. Ystyriai nad oes gan heddluoedd sydd â llai na 4,000 o swyddogion neu 6,000 o staff y mas critigol sy'n angenrheidiol i ddarparu'r lefel angenrheidiol o wasanaethau diogelu. Dim ond saith o heddluoedd yn Lloegr sy'n cyrraedd y trothwy hwn. Nid oes yr un o heddluoedd Cymru yn meddu ar y gallu hwn—mae gan Heddlu De Cymru, yr heddlu mwyaf yng Nghymru, 3,268 o swyddogion.

The report explored a number of options for ensuring that the public has the necessary level of protection, but it concluded that the current 43-force structure is no longer fit for purpose and that, in the interests of the efficiency and effectiveness of policing, it should change. It suggested that the best way forward would be the creation of strategic police forces of sufficient size to provide both effective neighbourhood policing and protective services, and that this was not incompatible with the delivery of locally based neighbourhood police. The constabulary also concluded that disruption to basic command units, which are the key operating platform for the delivery of neighbourhood policing, can and should be minimised while protective services are reshaped. It is the basic command unit structure that, of course, underpins community safety partnerships in Wales. The HMIC is clear that mergers will not be sufficient on their own. The new strategic forces will need to reconfigure the way that protective services are provided in future in order to comply with minimum national standards.

3.10 p.m.

Last week, the Home Secretary wrote to inform me that the Westminster Government will be endorsing the findings of the report. The Westminster Government's view is that would be negligent to retain the current ineffective structure of policing. Charles Clarke considers that his first duty as Home Secretary is to ensure that the public is properly protected from a variety of threats to which the police have to respond. It is clear that he firmly believes that some reorganisation of forces and reconfiguration of protective services are necessary. The Home Secretary, as you are all aware, met the chief constables and the chairs of the police authorities last week, to discuss how to respond to the challenges set out in the report. They have been invited, in consultation with their criminal justice and local government partners, to come forward, by the end of this calendar year, with firm proposals for restructuring in each region. Although the timetable that will follow the consultation has not been announced, I understand that it is intended that agreed

Ymchwiliodd yr adroddiad i nifer o ddewisiadau ar gyfer sicrhau bod y cyhoedd yn cael eu diogelu i'r lefel sy'n angenrheidiol, ond daeth i'r casgliad nad yw'r strwythur presennol o 43 o heddluoedd yn addas at y pwrrpas ac y dylid ei newid er budd plismona effeithiol ac effeithlon. Awgrymodd mai'r ffordd orau o fwrrw ymlaen fyddai creu heddluoedd strategol o faint digonol i ddarparu gwasanaeth plismona cymdogaethau a gwasanaethau diogelu effeithiol, ac nad oedd hyn yn anghydnaws â heddlu lleol yn y gymdogaeth. Daeth y gwnstabliaeth hefyd i'r casgliad bod modd lleihau ymyrraeth ar unedau gorchymyn sylfaenol, sef sylfaen plismona yn y gymdogaeth, a bod angen gwneud hynny tra bod gwasanaethau diogelu'n cael eu hadnrefnu. Wrth gwrs, strwythur yr unedau gorchymyn sylfaenol yw sail y partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol yng Nghymru. Mae'r Arolygiaeth yn bendant na fydd uno yn ddigon ynddo'i hun. Bydd angen i'r heddluoedd strategol newydd ailgyflunio'r ffordd y maent yn darparu gwasanaethau diogelu yn y dyfodol er mwyn cydymffurfio â safonau cenedlaethol gofynnol.

Yr wythnos diwethaf, ysgrifennodd yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref ataf i'm hysbysu y bydd Llywodraeth San Steffan yn cefnogi canfyddiadau'r adroddiad. Barn Llywodraeth San Steffan yw y byddai'n esgeulus parhau â'r strwythur plismona aneffeithiol presennol. Ystyria Charles Clarke mai ei brif ddyletswydd fel Ysgrifennyd Cartref yw sicrhau bod y cyhoedd yn cael eu diogelu'n briodol rhag yr amrywiaeth o fygithiadau y mae'n rhaid i'r heddlu ymateb iddynt. Mae'n amlwg ei fod yn credu'n gryf bod angen hadnrefnu rhai heddluoedd ac ailgyflunio gwasanaethau diogelu. Fel y gwyddoch i gyd, cyfarfu'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref â phrif gwnstabliaid a chadeiryddion awdurdodau'r heddlu yr wythnos diwethaf i drafod sut i ymateb i'r heriau yn yr adroddiad. Fe'u gwahoddwyd, drwy ymgynghori â'u partneriaid cyflawnder troseddol a llywodraeth leol, i gyflwyno cynigion pendant cyn diwedd y flwyddyn galendr hon ar ailstrwythuro ym mhob rhanbarth. Er nad yw'r amserlen a fydd yn dilyn yr ymgynghori wedi'i chyhoeddi eto, yr wyf yn deall y

changes should take place within as short a time frame as possible, to avoid an extended period of disruption.

The Home Secretary wishes local discussions to be informed by the set of nationally determined criteria that were set out in the report, including such matters as the size of the force, crime patterns, consistency of boundaries with those of local government and criminal justice partners, geography, and local identity. He has made it clear that the starting point, in considering the response, must be that the strategic forces identified by HMIC are the right way forward, unless it can be clearly demonstrated that some other configuration would more effectively deliver the required changes.

In his letter to me, the Home Secretary clearly recognises that while policing is not devolved, any move to strategic forces will clearly have an impact on the critical relationship between the police and local government. He also recognises that there are issues that are particular to Wales, which will play a part in the discussions about the appropriate future structure for policing in Wales. The Home Secretary has said that he would welcome the National Assembly's views on the report's findings.

In order to ensure that the Assembly provides an informed response to the HMIC report, I wrote to the Chair of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee, Janice Gregory, last week, to ask if the committee would undertake a review on this, taking views on the report's findings and considering the different ways in which the aims set out by the Home Secretary might be achieved in Wales. I am pleased that the committee agreed, at its meeting this morning, to take that forward. Clearly, there are timescales involved, and I am grateful that committee members are prepared to give of their time to ensure that there is good evidence gathering on this issue.

I am sure that we all share an overriding priority for the future of the police service in Wales, which is to make sure that we support a structure that ensures that the police

bwriedir i newidiadau y cytunwyd arnynt ddigwydd o fewn cyfnod mor fyr â phosibl, er mwyn osgoi amharu am gyfnod hir.

Mae'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref am i drafodaethau lleol ddigwydd yng nghydestun mein prawf y cytunwyd arnynt yn genedlaethol fel y nodir yn yr adroddiad, gan gynnwys materion fel maint yr heddlu, patrymau trosedd, cysondeb ffiniau â ffiniau llywodraeth leol a phartneriaethau cyflawnder troseddol, daearyddiaeth, a hunaniaeth leol. Gwnaeth yn eglur mai'r man cychwyn, wrth ystyried yr ymateb, oedd cydnabod mai'r heddluoedd strategol a nodwyd gan yr Arolygiaeth yw'r ffordd gywir ymlaen, oni ellir dangos yn eglur y byddai rhyw ffordd arall o ailgyflunio yn cyflawni'r newidiadau angenrheidiol yn fwy effeithiol.

Mae'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref yn ei lythyr ataf yn cydanbod yn eglur, er nad yw plismona wedi ei ddatganoli y byddai unrhyw gam tuag at heddluoedd strategol yn cael effaith ar y berthynas hollbwysig rhwng yr heddlu a llywodraeth leol. Mae'n cydnabod hefyd bod y materion sy'n ymwneud yn benodol â Chymru, a fydd yn chwarae rhan yn y trafodaethau am strwythur newydd addas ar gyfer plismona yng Nghymru. Mae'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref wedi dweud y byddai'n croesawu barn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar ganfyddiadau'r adroddiad.

Er mwyn sicrhau bod y Cynulliad yn ymateb yn hyddysg i adroddiad yr Arolygiaeth, ysgrifennais at Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyflawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywi, Janice Gregory, yr wythnos diwethaf, i ofyn a fyddai'r pwylgor yn fodlon cynnal adolygiad o hyn, nodi barn pobl ar ganfyddiadau'r adroddiad ac ystyried y gwahanol ffyrdd y gellid cyflawni'r amcanion a nodir gan yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn falch bod y pwylgor wedi cytuno, yn ei gyfarfod y bore yma, i fwrw ymlaen â hynny. Yn amlwg, mae angen ystyried amserlenni, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar bod aelodau'r pwylgor yn barod i roi o'u hamser i sicrhau bod dystiolaeth dda yn cael ei chasglu ar hyn.

Yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod i gyd yn cytuno ar y flaenoriaeth fwyaf ar gyfer dyfodol gwasanaeth yr heddlu yng Nghymru, sef sicrhau bod yr heddlu'n parhau i weithio

continue to work in partnership with other local agencies, to bear down on crime and anti-social behaviour and to enable communities in Wales to receive the quality of service that they have the right to expect.

**Leanne Wood:** I welcome the fact that the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee is to conduct a review of these proposals, even though it looks as though there will be little scope for us to develop an alternative structure that would meet the needs of Wales. We are concerned that all this has to be done within a tight timescale. What is the rush? There appears to be a political drive to get this through quickly. Why is that so? Charles Clarke has stated that there should be a minimum of 4,000 officers in each new service, but in Wales we have 7,500 police officers, which gives us few options. We, in Plaid Cymru, are not prepared to support any restructuring prior to the devolution of police services. We want to see the responsibility for policing devolved to Wales and we do not want the Assembly's hands to be tied. From our perspective, any reorganisation should take place after those services are devolved, not before.

Regardless of these issues, the UK Government appears to be determined to push ahead. Therefore, I have some questions for the Minister. The centralisation of services will reduce forces' ability to deliver anti-terrorism laws and to detect organised crime. It is small services with good local intelligence links that are good at detecting such crime. Do you have a view on this? Can you tell us how risks to current performance will be minimised during any transitional period?

Finally, I am concerned that the politics driving this restructuring is the anti-terrorism agenda. We have to take that agenda seriously, which is why we should all oppose a quick-fix knee-jerk-reaction approach to this. I look forward to the committee review where I hope that some of these issues can be examined further.

mewn partneriaeth ag asiantaethau eraill lleol, er mwyn mynd i'r afael â throseddau ac ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol ac er mwyn galluogi cymunedau yng Nghymru i dderbyn y gwasanaeth safonol y mae ganddynt hawl i'w ddisgwyl.

**Leanne Wood:** Croesawaf y ffaith bod y Pwyllgor Cyflawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio yn cynnal adolygiad o'r cynigion hyn, er yr ymddengys mai ychydig o gyfle fydd inni ddatblygu strwythur amgen a fyddai'n diwallu anghenion Cymru. Yr ydym yn pryderu bod angen cyflawni hyn i gyd o fewn amserlen dynn. Beth yw'r brys? Ymddengys bod ymgyrch wleidyddol i gymeradwyo hyn yn gyflym. Beth yw'r rheswm dros hynny? Mae Charles Clarke wedi dweud y dylai 4,000 o swyddogion fod ym mhob gwasanaeth newydd, ond yng Nghymru 7,500 o heddlweision sydd gennym, felly prin yw ein dewisiadau. Nid ydym ni ym Mhlaid Cymru yn barod i gefnogi unrhyw ailstrwythuro cyn datganoli gwasanaethau'r heddlu. Yr ydym am weld y cyfrifoldeb dros blismona'n cael ei ddatganoli i Gymru ac nid ydym am weld dwylo'r Cynulliad yn cael eu clymu. O'n safbwyt ni, dylai unrhyw addrefnu ddigwydd ar ôl i'r gwasanaethau hynny gael eu datganoli, nid cyn hynny.

Er gwaethaf y materion hyn, ymddengys bod Llywodraeth y DU yn benderfynol o fwrw yn ei blaen. Os felly, mae gennyf rai cwestiynau gennyf i'r Gweinidog. Bydd canoli gwasanaethau yn lleihau gallu heddluoedd i weithredu cyfreithiau gwrthderfysgaeth a chanfod troseddau cyfundrefnol. Gwasanaethau bach gyda chysylltiadau cuddwybodaeth lleol da sy'n llwyddo i ganfod troseddau o'r fath. A oes gennych farn am hyn? A allwch ddweud wrthym sut y sicrheir y bydd y gwaith presennol yn cael ei ddiogelu yn ystod unrhyw gyfnod trosiannol?

Yn olaf, yr wyf yn pryderu mai'r agenda wrthderfysgaeth yw'r wleidyddiaeth sy'n llywio'r ailstrwythuro hwn. Rhaid inni gymryd yr agenda honno o ddifrif, a dyna pam y dylai pawb ohonom wrthwynebu ymateb byrbwyll a thymor byr wrth ymdrin â hyn. Edrychaf ymlaen at adolygiad y pwyllgor, a gobeithiaf y gellir ymchwilio ymhellach i rai o'r materion hyn.

**Edwina Hart:** The tight timescale is not, of course, of my making. As you are aware, the Home Secretary wants views in by the end of December to make further decisions, so it is not coming from here. I am just grateful that the committee can produce the report within that time, which will assist me in responding to the Westminster Government on these particular issues.

There are many ways to tackle devolution. It would be nice, in some respects, to always say, 'Let us have these powers devolved', but there are many issues, particularly those of policing, that would need to be sorted out first. There are financial issues, such as the way the settlement works, and the complicated police funding formula. Ultimately, I am sure that we would like responsibility for the police to be devolved, sometime down the road, but we have to recognise that certain issues have to be sorted out first. It is important to have a structure that is fit for purpose for devolution in future, and that is what the committee will look at in its discussions with the various groups that will come before it, and it will ask them what they feel is good about this report from the constabulary and what is not right.

Your questions about current risks from terrorism involve issues that will come out in discussion, which will include the matter of our need for a service that is fit for purpose. The anti-terrorism agenda is one issue, but my point was that the most important aspect of the police service is the service provided to communities and the relationship with those communities. Look at what has happened with the police in some Communities First areas: excellent relationships have developed, and there is now more trust in the police in some of these areas. That is enormously encouraging. It is important that, in looking at these issues in what is a non-devolved area—and I welcome the fact that Charles Clarke has written to me wanting to know our views on this; that does not necessarily happen in non-devolved areas—we recognise our responsibility to our communities, and

**Edwina Hart:** Nid fi sy'n gyfrifol am yr amserlen dynn, wrth gwrs. Fel y gwyddoch, mae'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref am gasglu barn pobl erbyn diwedd mis Rhagfyr er mwyn gnweud rhagor o benderfyniadau ymhellach, felly nid rhywbeth a benderfynwyd yma yw hynny. Yr wyf yn falch y gall y pwylgor gynhyrchu'r adroddiad yn yr amser hwnnw; bydd hynny o gymorth imi ymateb i Lywodraeth San Steffan ar y materion penodol hyn.

Mae sawl ffordd o fynd i'r afael â datganoli. Byddai'n ddymunol, ar un ystyr, pe gellid bob amser dweud, 'Gadewch inni gael y pwerau hyn wedi'u datganoli', ond cyfyd sawl mater, yn enwedig materion yn ymwneud â phlismona, y byddai angen ymdrin â hwy yn gyntaf. Cyfyd materion ariannol, megis y ffordd y mae'r setliad yn gweithio, a'r fformiwla gymhleth i ariannu'r heddlu. Yn y pen draw, yr wyf yn siŵr yr hoffem weld cyfrifoldeb dros yr heddlu yn cael ei ddatganoli, rywbryd yn y dyfodol, ond rhaid inni gydnabod bod yn rhaid ymdrin â rhai materion yn gyntaf. Mae'n bwysig cael strwythur sy'n addas at y diben ar gyfer datganoli yn y dyfodol, a dyna'r hyn y bydd y pwylgor yn ei ystyried yn ei drafodaethau gyda'r gwahanol grwpiau a fydd yn dod ger ei fron, a bydd yn gofyn iddynt ddweud beth sy'n dda ynglŷn â'r adroddiad hwn gan yr heddlu a beth sy'n amhriodol yn eu barn hwy.

Mae eich cwestiynau ynglŷn â'r risgau presennol sy'n deillio o derfysgaeth yn ymwneud â materion a gaiff eu gwyntyllu mewn trafodaethau, a fydd yn cynnwys ein hangen am wasanaeth sy'n addas at y diben. Un mater yw'r agenda gwrthderfysgaeth, ond fy mhwynt i oedd mai'r agwedd bwysicaf ar wasanaeth yr heddlu yw'r gwasanaeth a roddir i gymunedau a'r berthynas rhwng y cymunedau hynny. Edrychwch ar yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd gyda'r heddlu yn rhai ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf: meithrinwyd cydberthnasau ardderchog, ac erbyn hyn ceir mwy o ymddiriedaeth yn yr heddlu mewn rhai o'r ardaloedd hyn. Mae hynny yn hynod galonogol. Mae'n bwysig, wrth edrych ar y materion hyn mewn maes nas datganolwyd—a chroesawaf y ffaith bod Charles Clarke wedi ysgrifennu ataf i geisio ein barn ar hyn; nid yw hynny yn digwydd o

how that policing structure will work.

With regard to your remarks on terrorism and serious organised crime, those are operational matters for the police and transcend police boundaries in the conduct of operations. We have to concentrate on the relationship between communities and the police and on how we get to the position that we want to achieve with regard to the police and their powers and their relationship with the Assembly. It is important that there is a role for the Assembly to play in looking at police priorities in Wales, even if it is not a devolved matter.

**Mark Isherwood:** We are concerned that merging the existing Welsh police forces into two, or even one, nationwide body is less about efficiency than it is about cost-cutting and is a backdoor method of transferring more police power to the Labour Government in London and, potentially, in Cardiff in the future. We are told that such a merger will tackle terrorism, drug trafficking and crime across a larger geographical area, but how will we, at the same time, safeguard and enhance local policing when the public already feels that the police has become too remote? How will this proposal restore visible policing and the bobby on the beat? How will this act to deter, as well as react to, crime, and how will this reflect the unique geographical and cultural features of Wales? How will it tackle the fundamental issues, such as not enough front-line police officers and too much time wasted on red tape and central targets? We believe that these issues are more urgent and more fundamental than the reorganisation of some police forces.

Is it right that the police performance monitoring report for 2004 should show that police are spending almost half their time at their desks, and that, from April this year, every time they stop someone on the street, officers have had to fill in a form that, according to the Police Federation, is 1 ft

reidrwydd mewn meysydd nas datganolwyd—ein bod yn cydnabod ein cyfrifoldeb i'r cymunedau, a'r ffordd y bydd y strwythur plismona hwnnw yn gweithio.

O ran eich sylwadau ynglŷn â therfysgaeth a throseddau cyfundrefnol difrifol, materion gweithredol i'r heddlu ydynt ac maent yn croesi ffiniau heddluoedd o ran cynnal ymgyrchoedd. Rhaid inni ganolbwytio ar y berthynas rhwng cymunedau a'r heddlu ac ar sut yr ydym yn cyrraedd y sefyllfa yr ydym am fod ynddi o ran yr heddlu a'i bwerau a'i berthynas â'r Cynulliad. Mae'n bwysig bod rôl i'r Cynulliad ei chwarae i ystyried blaenoriaethau i'r heddlu yng Nghymru, hyd yn oed os nad mater datganoledig ydyw.

**Mark Isherwood:** Pryderwn mai cwtogi ar gostau yn hytrach nag effeithlonwydd fydd wrth wraidd unrhyw gynnig i uno heddluoedd presennol Cymru yn ddu neu hyd yn oed yn un corff cenedlaethol ac mae'n ffordd lechwraidd o drosglwyddo mwy o bwerau dros yr heddlu i'r Llywodraeth Lafur yn Llundain ac, o bosibl, yng Nghaerdydd yn y dyfodol. Dywedir wrthym y bydd uno o'r fath yn mynd i'r afael â therfysgaeth, masnachu mewn cyffuriau a throseddau ar draws ardal ddaearyddol ehangach, ond sut y byddwn ni, ar yr un pryd, yn diogelu ac yn gwella plismona'n lleol, pan fo'r cyhoedd eisoes yn teimlo bod yr heddlu wedi colli gormod o gysylltiad â hwy? Sut y bydd y cynnig hwn yn adfer plismona ar ein strydoedd a'r heddwys ar ei rawd? Sut y bydd yn helpu i atal troseddau, yn ogystal ag ymateb iddynt, a sut y bydd yn adlewyrchu nodweddion daearyddol a diwylliannol unigryw Cymru? Sut y bydd yn mynd i'r afael â'r materion sylfaenol, megis dim digon o swyddogion yr heddlu ar y rheng flaen a gormod o amser yn cael ei wastraffu ar fiwrocratiaeth a thargedau canolog? Credwn fod y materion hyn yn bwysicach ac yn fwy sylfaenol nag ad-drefnu rhai heddluoedd.

A yw'n briodol bod adroddiad monitro perfformiad yr heddlu ar gyfer 2004 yn dangos bod swyddogion yr heddlu yn treulio hanner eu hamser wrth eu desgau, ac o fis Ebrill eleni, bod yn rhaid i swyddogion lenwi ffurflen sydd, yn ôl Ffederasiwn yr Heddlu, yn droedfedd o hyd, bob tro y maent yn

long? In the event of a beauty contest between senior officers in our existing forces, what performance measures will be put in place? Will they reflect the fact that, according to the latest Home Office figures for 2004-05, although overall recorded crime in England and Wales is still 9 per cent higher than for 1999, this ranges from a fall of 7.91 per cent in south Wales to an increase of 23 per cent in north Wales? Will this reflect the fact that, although recorded violent crime across Wales has risen 64 per cent since 1999, it ranges from an increase of 15 per cent in Gwent to an increase of 149 per cent in north Wales? Referring to the findings of a north Wales county council citizens' panel crime and disorder report published this month, how will this reflect the fact that 53 per cent of panel members stated that they or a member of their household had experienced crime in the last 12 months, but that only 21 per cent of them had reported all the crimes that they had experienced to the police, and that, when asked why that was so, the two main reasons given for not reporting were both related to a lack of expected action by the police?

Moving to my last questions, how will this reflect the concerns raised with the Shadow Home Secretary, David Davis MP, and me this morning in a meeting with Victim Support South Wales, that violent crime has increased across its area, and how will it reflect the concerns expressed by a North Wales Police officer in the autumn issue of the North Wales Police Federation magazine, that figures showing that 42 per cent of north Wales's crimes were solved were a myth? Suspects were asked to sign Home Office clear-up forms, which stopped them from going to court. In responding to this point, Minister, please be aware that I am advised by my colleague, David Jones, MP for Clwyd West, that the officer concerned has recently won a court case against—

stopio rhywun ar y stryd? Os bydd uwch swyddogion yn ein heddluoedd presennol yn gorfod cystadlu â'i gilydd am swyddi, pa fesurau o berfformiad a roddir ar waith? A fyddant yn adlewyrchu'r ffaith, er bod nifer y troseddau a gofnodwyd yng Nghymru a Lloegr yn parhau i fod yn 9 y cant yn uwch nag yn 1999, yn ôl ffigurau diweddaraf y Swyddfa Gartref, bod y ffigur hwn yn amrywio o ostyngiad o 7.91 y cant yn y De i gynnydd o 23 y cant yn y Gogledd? A fydd hyn yn adlewyrchu'r ffaith, er bod troseddau treisgar a gofnodwyd ar draws Cymru wedi codi 64 y cant ers 1999, eu bod yn amrywio o gynnydd o 15 y cant yng Ngwent i gynnydd o 149 y cant yn y Gogledd? Gan gyfeirio at ganfyddiadau adroddiad troseddau ac anhreft panel dinasyddion un o'r cyngorau sir yn y Gogledd a gyhoeddwyd y mis hwn, sut y bydd hyn yn adlewyrchu'r ffaith i 53 y cant o aelodau'r panel nodi eu bod hwy neu aelod o'r teulu wedi cael profiad o drosedd yn y 12 mis diwethaf, ond mai dim ond 21 y cant ohonynt a hysbysodd yr heddlu o bob trosedd yn eu herbyn, a, phan ofynnwyd iddynt ddweud pam, yr oedd y ddau brif reswm a roddwyd dros beidio â hysbysu'r heddlu yn ymwneud â'r disgwyliad na fyddent yn gweithredu?

Gan symud i'm cwestiynau olaf, sut y bydd hyn yn adlewyrchu'r pryderon a godwyd gydag Ysgrifennydd Cartref yr wrthblaid, David Davis AS, a minnau y bore yma mewn cyfarfod gyda Chymorth i Ddioddefwyr De Cymru, bod nifer y troseddau treisgar wedi cynyddu ar draws ei ardal, a sut y bydd yn adlewyrchu'r pryderon a fynegwyd gan swyddog o Heddlu Gogledd Cymru yn rhifyn yr hydref o gylchgrawn Ffederasiwn Heddlu Gogledd Cymru, mai myth oedd y ffigurau sy'n dangos bod 42 y cant o droseddau yn y Gogledd wedi'u datrys? Gofynnwyd i unigolion a amheuir lofnodi ffurflenni clirio'r Swyddfa Gartref, a'u hataliodd rhag mynd i'r llys. Wrth ymateb i'r pwyt hwn, Weinidog, byddwch yn ymwybodol bod fy nghyd-Aelod, David Jones AS dros Orllewin Clwyd wedi dweud wrthyf fod y swyddog dan sylw wedi ennill achos llys yn ddiweddar yn erbyn—

3.20 p.m.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I did hear you

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Fe'ch clywais yn dweud

say 'last question' about a minute ago.

**Mark Isherwood:** The officer is not a troublemaker, and North Wales Police has encouraged the Police Federation, which published the magazine, to write an immediate retraction.

**Edwina Hart:** Some of those questions would be better addressed to the Home Secretary and the police. On the salient points in your contribution, the three police forces in south Wales already work together effectively on Operation Tarian. That deals with some of your points on police forces coming together to look at some issues relating to drugs.

Your comment about a beauty contest—and I stand to be corrected on this—brings into question the professionalism of chief officers and chief constables in Wales, and I do not accept that. We are talking about individuals in the police force who have been prepared to engage with the National Assembly and their communities, and I will not have any suggestion that they are looking after their own interests, rather than the interests of the service—we are the people that they serve. In terms of the issue, it was Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Constabulary which wrote the report for the Home Secretary—he asked the inspectorate to do it. The inspectorate is respected and it understands the issues of policing—you only have to look at who is involved—from their own individual experience.

I wrote to Janice Gregory in good faith to ensure that all parties in the Assembly, and on a cross-party basis, through a committee discussion, could come to some conclusions that might be helpful after taking evidence. That is the spirit in which I am approaching this issue. I am not responsible for the police—it is not a devolved matter—but I obviously have an interest in the way in which the police service works with the National Assembly and the communities of Wales. We need to have an intelligent and articulate discussion about the Home Secretary's proposals, which are in the interest of the people of Wales and the services which the police provide.

'cwestiwn olaf' ryw funud yn ôl.

**Mark Isherwood:** Nid yw'r swyddog yn creu helynt, ac mae Heddlu Gogledd Cymru wedi annog Ffederasiwn yr Heddlu a gyhoeddodd y cylchgrawn i dynnu'r stori yn ôl ar unwaith.

**Edwina Hart:** I'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref a'r heddlu y dylid gofyn rhai o'r cwestiynau hynny. O ran y pwyntiau amlwg yn eich cyfraniad, mae'r tri heddlu yn y De eisoes yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd yn effeithiol ar Ymgyrch Tarian. Mae hynny yn ymdrin â rhai o'ch pwyntiau ynglŷn â heddluoedd yn dod ynghyd i edrych ar rai materion yn ymwneud â chyffuriau.

Mae eich sylw ynglŷn â chystadleuaeth—a bydd angen imi gadarnhau hynny—yn bwrw amheuaeth ar broffesiynoldeb prif swyddogion a phrif gwnstablaid yng Nghymru, ac ni dderbyniaf hynny. Yr ydym yn sôn am unigolion yn yr heddlu a fu'n barod i ymgysylltu â'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a'u cymunedau, ac ni dderbyniaf unrhyw awgrym eu bod yn gofalu am eu buddiannau eu hunain, yn hytrach na buddiannau'r gwasanaeth—ni yw'r bobl a wasanaethant. O ran y mater hwn, Arolygiaeth Heddlu Ei Mawrhydi a ysgrifennodd yr adroddiad i'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref—gofynnodd i'r arolygiaeth wneud hynny. Mae'r arolygiaeth yn uchel ei pharch ac mae'n deall materion plismona—nid oes ond angen ichi weld pwy sy'n rhan ohoni—o'u profiad eu hunain.

Ysgrifennais at Janice Gregory yn ddidwyll i sicrhau y gallai'r holl bleidiau yn y Cynulliad, ac ar sail drawsbleidiol, drwy drafodaeth mewn pwylgor, ddod i rai casgliadau a allai fod yn ddefnyddiol ar ôl cymryd tystiolaeth. Yn yr ysbryd hwnnw yr wyf yn ymdrin â'r mater hwn. Nid wyf yn gyfrifol am yr heddlu—nid mater datganoledig mohono—ond yn amlwg mae gennyl ddiddordeb yn y ffordd y mae gwasanaeth yr heddlu yn gweithio gyda'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a'r cymunedau yng Nghymru. Mae angen inni gael trafodaeth ddeallus a chroyw ynglŷn â chynigion yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref, sydd er budd pobl Cymru a'r gwasanaethau a ddarperir gan yr heddlu.

**Mick Bates:** I approach my comments with some trepidation in terms of what I may hear from you. [Interruption.] I will be as sensible as ever.

There is a saying that, if it is not broken, do not fix it. On what basis do we have to change the current structures? There is no earthly reason why further co-operation between forces cannot be encouraged. However, the geography of Wales and the sparsity of our population give rise to other solutions. The title of the document is 'Closing the Gap'; to what gap does the title refer? Why does the system need to be changed?

I accept that this is a process of consultation, and that there will be engagement with a list of consultees. As I have already mentioned the geography and the sparsity of Wales, should an organisation specifically concerned with rural proofing, such as the Institute of Rural Health, not be invited to comment on policing in rural areas? I cannot see that they are included, but I may be wrong.

My next issue is about Assembly determination. Do you consider that part of this process—and I praise the speed with which you have approached this issue—should involve the whole of the Assembly, so that there is a determination in the Chamber of what we wish to see, which could then be presented to Charles Clarke? There have been many sensible comments about our desire to retain the level of policing, and to ensure the presence of a policeman or even a community support officer. There are also many issues surrounding funding structures. We would all like to see more bobbies; if the structure that they want is one of 4,000 police officers, let us employ more officers and build every force up to 4,000.

There is a financial pressure here. Will you undertake to protect financial structures to assist rural forces, because there is a threat to the extra funding given to forces of a more rural nature? Can you assure me that that is not threatened in this restructuring?

**Mick Bates:** Ofnaf ychydig cyn dechrau gwneud sylwadau o ran yr hyn y byddaf yn ei glywed gennych. [Torri ar draws.] Byddaf yr un mor synhwyrol ag erioed.

Mae dywediad yn Saesneg os nad oes rhywbedd wedi'i dorri, peidiwch â'i drwsio. Ar ba sail y mae'n rhaid inni newid y strwythurau cyfredol? Nid oes unrhyw reswm yn y byd pam na ellir annog mwy o gydweithredu rhwng yr heddluoedd. Fodd bynnag, mae daearyddiaeth Cymru a theneurwydd ein poblogaeth yn esgor ar atebion eraill. Teitl y ddogfen yw 'Closing the Gap'; i ba fwlch y cyfeiria'r teitl? Pam y mae angen newid y system?

Derbyniaf mai proses o ymgynghori yw hon, ac y bwriedir cysylltu â rhestr o ymgynghoreion. A minnau wedi sôn eisoes am daearyddiaeth a theneurwydd poblogaeth Cymru, oni ddylai sefydliad sy'n ymwneud yn benodol â phrawfesur polisiau gwledig, megis Sefydliad Iechyd Gwledig, gael ei wahodd i wneud sylwadau ar blismona mewn ardaloedd gwledig? Ni allaf weld ei fod wedi'i gynnwys, ond efallai fy mod yn anghywir.

Mae'r mater nesaf sydd gennyf yn ymwneud â phenderfynu yn y Cynulliad. A gredwch y dylai rhan o'r broses hon—ac fe'ch canmolaf am y ffordd yr ydych wedi codi'r mater hwn yn gyflym—gael ei thrin gan y Cynulliad cyfan, fel y bo modd penderfynu yn y Siambra'r yr hyn yr ydym am ei weld, y gellid wedyn ei gyflwyno i Charles Clarke? Gwnaed llawer o sylwadau synhwyrol ynglŷn â'n dymuniad i gadw'r lefel o blismona, ac i sicrhau presenoldeb heddwlas neu hyd yn oed swyddog cymorth cymunedol. Cyfyd llawer o faterion hefyd ynglŷn â strwythurau ariannu. Hoffem oll weld mwy o heddwreision; os mai strwythur o 4,000 o swyddogion yr heddlu a ddymunant, gadewch inni gyflogi rhagor o swyddogion a chreu gweithlu o 4,000 ym mhob heddlu.

Ceir pwysau ariannol. A wnewch addo diogelu strwythurau ariannol i gynorthwyo heddluoedd gwledig, oherwydd mae bygythiad i'r cyllid ychwanegol a roddir i heddluoedd mwy gwledig eu natur? A allwch roi sicrwydd imi nad oes bygythiad i hynny

yn yr ailstrwythuro hwn?

**Edwina Hart:** On the issue of forces and co-operation, there is good co-operation between forces across Wales in a number of areas. Many things could be done in emergency services, on payroll and a host of other human resources issues, which could provide more money for front-line services. Those discussions are ongoing within the service, in the fire service, and everywhere. That type of work will eventually evolve into cost savings that will go into front-line services.

I thought that I was at the same Social Justice and Regeneration Committee meeting as you this morning. I distinctly heard the Chair asking, ‘Are you happy with this, or are there any more people you would like to give evidence?’. She gave all Members the opportunity to comment. I recall that Leanne made some valid points about including additional people. Therefore, I am afraid that you have had your opportunity and this is a matter for the Chair of the committee who opened it up to discussion this morning, when you agreed the terms of reference.

On involving the whole Assembly, having the committee report debated here in December will involve the whole Assembly. I will be perfectly happy, whether or not I accept all the report’s recommendations, to pass on the Assembly’s collected view on policing to Charles Clarke. I have been open and transparent on these issues because I have yet to make my mind up about the issues in Charles Clarke’s report. There is a lot to be gained from seeing what comes in from the evidence from various parties and from the discussions that I will hold with organisations about their feelings on policing. The quality of policing should be no different in an urban area than in a rural area. We require quality policing across the board. My view has always been that, as a Welsh Assembly Government, we have to be involved in discussions on how policing should be managed in Wales. That does not necessarily mean having financial responsibility, but there should be policy links. We could then determine the quality of service in rural areas. That is an important

**Edwina Hart:** O ran yr heddluoedd a chydweithredu, mae'r heddluoedd ledled Cymru yn cydweithio'n dda mewn sawl maes. Gellid gwneud llawer o bethau mewn gwasanaethau brys, o ran y gyflogres a llu o faterion adnoddau dynol, a allai ddarparu mwy o arian ar gyfer gwasanaethau rheng flaen. Mae'r trafodaethau hynny yn parhau o fewn y gwasanaeth, yn y gwasanaeth tân, ac ym mhobman. Bydd y math hwnnw o waith yn arwain at arbedion mewn costau yn y pen draw a bydd y rhain yn mynd i wasanaethau rheng flaen.

Meddyliais fy mod yn yr un cyfarfod o'r Pwyllgor Cyflawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio y bore yma. Clywais yn glir y Cadeirydd yn gofyn, ‘A ydych yn fodlon ar hyn, neu a oes mwy o bobl yr ydych am iddynt roi dystiolaeth?’ Rhoddodd gyfle i bob Aelod wneud sylwadau. Cofiaf i Leanne wneud rhai pwyntiau diliys am gynnwys pobl ychwanegol. Felly, cawsoch chi eich cyfle mae arnaf ofn, ac mae hwn yn fater i Gadeirydd y pwylgor a agorodd y drafodaeth arno y bore yma, pan gytunasoch ar y cylch gorchwyl.

O ran cynnwys y Cynulliad cyfan, drwy gynnal dadl ar adroddiad y pwylgor yma ym mis Rhagfyr byddwn yn cynnwys y Cynulliad cyfan. Byddaf yn holol fodlon, pa un a dderbyniaf holl argymhellion yr adroddiad ai peidio, i gyfleo barn y Cynulliad cyfan ar blismona i Charles Clarke. Bûm yn agored ac yn dryloyw ar y materion hyn oherwydd nid wyf wedi penderfynu eto ynglŷn â'r materion yn adroddiad Charles Clarke. Gwell fyddai aros i weld beth sy'n dod i law o'r dystiolaeth gan wahanol bobl ac o'r trafodaethau y byddaf yn eu cynnal gyda sefydliadau ynglŷn â'u teimladau ar blismona. Ni ddylai fod unrhyw wahaniaeth yn ansawdd plismona rhwng ardal drefol ac ardal wledig. Mae angen plismona o safon ym mhob ardal. Yr wyf wedi credu erioed, fel Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, fod yn rhaid inni fod yn rhan o drafodaethau ar y ffordd y dylid rheoli plismona yng Nghymru. Nid yw hynny o anghenraig yn golygu cael cyfrifoldeb ariannol, ond dylai fod cysylltiadau o ran polisi. Yna gallem benderfynu ar ansawdd y gwasanaeth mewn

issue, which I hope will be addressed in committee discussions.

**John Griffiths:** I am encouraged by what you say on these matters. Gwent Police has an impressive and continually improving performance as evidenced by, for example, its high percentage of crimes solved. That is greatly assisted by a strong policy of neighbourhood policing teams, which build good relationships with communities, gaining consent, support and assistance in producing crucial intelligence. As the chief constable stressed at a meeting that I attended at the end of last week, local accountability is key to this, because it produces good local relationships and channels of communication so that, together, local communities and police can implement the most effective policing best suited to local circumstances and responsive to local need.

Therefore, do you agree that local accountability must be an important factor in deciding future policing structures and that there must be no weakening of that? Do you also agree that any new structure should only be determined following a careful, detailed and open-minded examination of all the options? It is important to recognise the integrity of Wales as a region in this sense and to recognise devolution. Future arrangements must recognise the Assembly's important and growing role in policing and community safety and involve the Assembly Government in setting policing strategy in Wales.

**Edwina Hart:** I also think that the identity of Wales as a nation, not just as a region, is important. We must acknowledge that in any discussions on these matters. Like you, I would be loath to see any change that might threaten our community safety partnerships, which are making a real impact across Wales. That consideration is probably the soundest argument for not interfering in the police's basic command unit structure, where a major interface for the partnership is found. We can protect that in terms of what we do in neighbourhood policing. That has worked effectively in Wales.

ardaloedd gwledig. Mae hynny yn fater pwysig, a gobeithio y caiff ei drafod yn ystod trafodaethau'r pwylgor.

**John Griffiths:** Fe'm calonogir gan yr hyn a ddywedwch ar y materion hyn. Mae perfformiad Heddlu Gwent yn dda ac mae'n parhau i wella fel y dengys y ganran fawr o droseddau a ddatryswyd ganddo, er enghraifft. Ategir hynny yn ddirfawr gan bolisi cryf ynglŷn â thimau plismona cymdogaeth, sy'n meithrin perthynas dda â chymunedau, gan sierhau cydsyniad, cefnogaeth a chymorth i gael gwybodaeth hollbwysig. Fel y pwysleisiodd y prif gwnstabl mewn cyfarfod a fynychais ar ddiwedd yr wythnos diwethaf, atebolrwydd lleol yw'r allwedd i hyn, oherwydd mae'n creu cydberthnasau a sianelau cyfathrebu lleol da, fel y gall cymunedau lleol a'r heddlu, gyda'i gilydd, weithredu'r dulliau plismona mwyaf effeithiol sy'n gwedu orau i amgylchiadau lleol ac sy'n ymateb i anghenion lleol.

Felly, a gytunwch fod yn rhaid i atebolrwydd lleol fod yn ffactor pwysig wrth benderfynu ar strwythurau plismona yn y dyfodol ac na ddylid glastwreiddio hynny? A gytunwch hefyd mai dim ond ar ôl archwiliad gofalus, manwl ac agored o'r holl opsiynau y dylid penderfynu ar unrhyw strwythur newydd? Mae'n bwysig cydnabod cyfanrwydd Cymru fel rhanbarth yn yr ystyr hon a chyd nabod datganoli. Rhaid i drefniadau yn y dyfodol gydnabod rôl bwysig a chynyddol y Cynulliad o ran plismona a diogelwch cymunedol a chynnwys Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wrth bennu'r strategaeth blismona yng Nghymru.

**Edwina Hart:** Credaf hefyd fod hunaniaeth Cymru fel cenedl, ac nid fel rhanbarth yn unig, yn bwysig. Rhaid inni gydnabod hynny mewn unrhyw drafodaethau ar y materion hyn. Fel chithau, byddai'n gas gennyf weld unrhyw newid a allai fod yn fygythiad i'n partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol, sy'n cael effaith wirioneddol ledled Cymru. Yr ystyriaeth honno siŵr o fod yw'r ddadl gryfaf dros beidio ag ymyrryd yn strwythur unedau rheoli sylfaenol yr heddlu, sy'n rhwngwyneb pwysig i'r bartneriaeth. Gallwn ddiogelu hynny o ran yr hyn a wnaawn mewn plismona cymdogaeth. Mae hynny wedi gweithio'n

effeithiol yng Nghymru.

I have seen the real benefit of designated police teams in my Communities First areas and they have come about as a result of discussions with local people and local politicians on how to get the best out of policing. Therefore, you are right, we have to stress the neighbourhood policing agenda and we must also, in an all-Wales sense, look at the distinctive history and culture of Wales and how that would be relevant to a modern policing agenda. As you say, it is important that we keep, at the heart of this issue, the people and how policing works. The four forces in Wales have worked well and have worked well together, but sometimes change is inevitable. I am open to the discussion that will take place on this issue and Members should start to make their views known to the committee, through the Chair, if they have anything specific that needs to be picked up. Thank you for your comments. Our first duty is to our citizens and what they require from policing.

3.30 p.m.

**William Graham:** I am delighted to hear that you have persuaded the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee to undertake this review, as it is worthwhile. However, in looking at the comments made by the Home Secretary to the chief police officers, I hope that you will agree with me that it will be difficult to complete this restructuring within the timescale. As your Government contributes virtually 50 per cent of the cost of policing in Wales, you must have a major input into this. What do you think the chief inspector of police means by ‘coterminosity’? More particularly, in terms of costs and efficiency, is it not the truth that this is a cost-cutting exercise and that it has little to do with accountability or ensuring that we have an adequate police service in Wales?

**Edwina Hart:** I do not like to disagree with you, William, because we normally agree more than we disagree. However, I do not think that this is a cost-efficiency exercise on

Yr wyf wedi gweld mantais wirioneddol timau heddlu wedi'u dynodi yn fy ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf a chânt eu creu o ganlyniad i drafodaethau gyda phobl leol a gwleidyddion lleol ar y ffordd o gael y budd mwyaf o blismona. Felly, yr ydych yn llygad eich lle, rhaid inni bwysleisio'r agenda plismona cymdogaeth a rhaid inni hefyd, ar ystyr Cymru gyfan, edrych ar hanes a diwylliant unigryw Cymru a'r ffordd y byddai'n berthnasol i agenda plismona modern. Fel y dywedwch, mae'n bwysig inni gadw'r bobl a'r ffordd y mae'r heddlu yn gweithio wrth wraidd y mater hwn. Mae'r pedwar heddlu yng Nghymru wedi gweithio'n dda ac wedi cydweithio'n dda, ond weithiau mae newid yn anochel. Mae gennyl feddwl agored ynglŷn â'r drafodaeth a gynhelir ar y mater hwn a dylai Aelodau ddechrau mynegi eu barn i'r pwylgor, drwy'r Cadeirydd, os oes ganddynt unrhyw beth penodol y mae angen ei godi. Diolch am eich sylwadau. I'n dinasyddion a'r hyn a ddymunant o blismona y mae ein dyletswydd gyntaf.

**William Graham:** Yr wyf yn falch o glywed eich bod wedi darbwyllo'r Pwyllgor Cyflawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio i gynnal yr adolygiad hwn, am ei fod yn adolygiad gwerthfawr. Fodd bynnag, wrth edrych ar y sylwadau a wnaed gan yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref i brif swyddogion yr heddlu, gobeithiaf y cytunwch â mi y bydd yn anodd cwblhau'r broses ailstrwythuro hon o fewn yr amserlen. Gan fod eich Llywodraeth yn cyfrannu ymron i 50 y cant o gost plismona yng Nghymru, rhaid bod gennych gryn fewnbwn i'r mater hwn. Beth, yn eich barn chi, a olyga prif arolygydd yr heddlu wrth 'gydffiniol'? Yn fwy penodol, o ran costau ac effeithlonrwydd, onid yw'n wir mai ymarfer i dorri costau yw hyn ac na wnelo fawr ddim ag atebolrwydd na sicrhau bod gennym wasanaeth heddlu digonol yng Nghymru?

**Edwina Hart:** Nid wyf yn hoff o anghytuno â chi, William, gan ein bod fel arfer yn cytuno mwy nag yr ydym yn anghytuno. Fodd bynnag, ni chredaf mai ymarfer cost

this occasion; it is a genuine attempt to look at policing for the future. Defining the meaning of ‘coterminosity’ is difficult; does it refer to Wales? Does coterminosity for us mean links with the three fire brigade regions, for example? Therefore, there are some difficult issues in that, which I am not sure that I have got to the bottom of yet, either. I hope that discussions in committee will flesh out some of these issues.

It is a difficult timetable; I would be the first to acknowledge that. However, chief constables and police authorities have been aware for a long time that the Home Office has been having these discussions, and I think that they are probably well prepared to respond within the timescale. Therefore, the Assembly, I am afraid, might have to play catch-up on this via the committee.

**Janice Gregory:** I am delighted that you attended the same meeting as I did this morning, because it would appear that you and I were the only two people there. I am deeply concerned about the comments made by members of my committee. While I praised committee members this morning for the consensual way in which they agreed to take forward this review at your request—and I was delighted to do that—I am concerned that Members, and one in particular who was absent during that agenda item, for whatever reason, then come to this public arena and make certain statements and ask questions that could have been asked this morning, particularly those regarding who is on the consultation list. I do not want the Assembly to be under any misapprehension; the committee was given sufficient time this morning to discuss the consultation list. You are correct, Minister, when you say that I also asked them to write to me or the clerk if they wished to add anyone else. You have asked us to undertake a serious review; I, as Chair, intend to treat it with the seriousness that it deserves. I hope that committee members will reflect on what you and I have said this afternoon, and on what they have said in committee and in the Chamber.

effeithlonrwydd yw hwn y tro hwn; mae'n ymgais wirioneddol i edrych ar blismona ar gyfer y dyfodol. Mae'n anodd diffinio ystyr 'cydffiniol'; a yw'n cyfeirio at Gymru? A yw cydffiniol, i ni, yn golygu cysylltiadau â'r tri rhanbarth brigâd Tân, er enghraifft? Felly, mae problemau anodd yn bodoli yn hynny o beth ac nid wyl yn siŵr imi eu datrys eto ychwaith. Gobeithiaf y bydd y trafodaethau yn y pwylgor yn rhoi cig ar esgyrn rhai o'r materion hyn.

Mae'n amserlen anodd; fi fyddai'r cyntaf i gydnabod hynny. Fodd bynnag, bu'r prif gwnstabliaid ac awdurdodau'r heddlu yn ymwybodol ers tro i'r trafodaethau hyn fod yn mynd rhagdynt gyda'r Swyddfa Gartref, a thybiaf eu bod, fwy na thebyg, yn gwbl barod i ymateb o fewn yr amserlen. Felly, ofnaf y bydd yn rhaid i'r Cynulliad ddal i fyny ar y mater hwn drwy gyfrwng y pwylgor.

**Janice Gregory:** Yr wyf yn falch ichi fynychu'r un cyfarfod â mi y bore yma oherwydd ymddengys mai chi a mi oedd yr unig ddau yno. Mae'r sylwadau a wnaed gan aelodau fy mhwylgor yn peri pryder o'r mwyaf imi. Er imi ganmol aelodau'r pwylgor y bore yma am iddynt gytuno i barhau â'r adolygiad hwn yn ôl eich cais mewn modd mor gydsyniol—ac yr oeddwn yn falch o wneud hynny—mae'n bryder imi fod Aelodau, ac un yn arbennig a oedd yn absennol yn ystod yr eitem agenda honno, am ba reswm bynnag, wedyn yn dod i'r arena gyhoeddus hon ac yn gwneud datganiadau penodol ac yn gofyn cwestiynau y gellid bod wedi'u gofyn y bore yma, yn enwedig y rheini'n ymwneud â phwy sydd ar y rhestr ymgynghori. Nid wyf yn dymuno i'r Cynulliad fod o dan unrhyw gamargraff; rhoddwyd digon o amser i'r pwylgor y bore yma i drafod y rhestr ymgynghori. Yr ydych yn gywir, Weinidog, pan ddywedwch fy mod hefyd wedi gofyn iddynt ysgrifennu ataf fi neu'r clerc petaent am ychwanegu unrhyw un arall. Yr ydych wedi gofyn inni gynnal adolygiad pwysig; yr wyf fi, fel Cadeirydd, yn bwriadu trin y mater gyda'r difrifoldeb haeddiannol. Gobeithiaf y bydd aelodau'r pwylgor yn cnoi cul ar yr hyn yr ydych chi ac yr wyf innau wedi'i ddweud y prynhawn yma, ac ar yr hyn y maent wedi'i ddweud yn y pwylgor ac yn y Siambr.

**Edwina Hart:** I thank Janice, as we were both at the same meeting.

**Michael German:** I thank the Minister for her statement today, and I am pleased to hear that the inquiry is being held. I will just reflect on the timetable, however. You have just admitted, Minister, that the timetable was not of your making, yet some would say that making such major decisions involving all communities in Wales is a task far beyond the timescale provided to us; it is even beyond the capability of getting a full committee report together in time to inform the Home Secretary's decisions. Do you agree that one of the best things that we could do would be to ask the Home Secretary whether he would be prepared to allow us to have a longer consultation period than has already been provided?

Given also that there is widespread concern that the communities that these police forces serve, particularly those in Gwent, will not have the same local accountability, is it possible to get the level of response that we need for the Assembly to be able to make a reasonable comment?

Finally, given that the Assembly and the council tax payers of Wales provide half the purse for the structure of our policing service, is it not appropriate that we should have more say on what will be the new policing structure in Wales, if there is to be one?

**Edwina Hart:** The timetable is not of my making, but I have already decided to ask Charles Clarke whether I can have more time. I have based the timetable on the fact that a committee report will probably be published early in December. I can then take that forward. I am grateful that the committee was prepared to put in extra time and hold additional meetings to take the evidence forward. I would like our views to be submitted with everyone else's, if that is possible.

I think that you are worrying too much about the links with the communities, because, as long as we keep that basic command unit

**Edwina Hart:** Diolchaf i Janice, gan inni fynychu'r un cyfarfod.

**Michael German:** Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei datganiad heddiw, ac yr wyf yn falch o glywed y bydd yr ymchwiliad yn cael ei gynnal. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf am ystyried yr amserlen. Yr ydych newydd gyfaddef, Weinidog, nad chi sy'n gyfrifol am yr amserlen, er y byddai rhai yn dweud mai tasg sydd ymhell y tu hwnt i'r amserlen a roddwyd inni yw'r gwaith o wneud penderfyniadau mor allweddol sy'n cynnwys pob cymuned yng Nghymru; mae hyd yn oed y tu hwnt i'n gallu i lunio adroddiad pwylgor llawn mewn pryd i lywio penderfyniadau'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref. A gytunwch mai un o'r pethau gorau y gallem ei wneud fyddai gofyn i'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref a fyddai'n barod i ganiatáu inni gael cyfnod ymgynghori hwy na'r hyn a roddwyd eisoes?

O gofio hefyd, fod pryder cyffredinol na fydd yr un atebolwydd lleol gan y cymunedau a wasanaethir gan yr heddluoedd hyn, yn enwedig y rheini yng Ngwent, a yw'n bosibl sicrhau'r lefel o ymateb sydd ei hangen arnom er mwyn i'r Cynulliad allu cyflwyno sylwadau rhesymol?

Yn olaf, o gofio mai'r Cynulliad a thalwyr treth gyngor Cymru sy'n darparu hanner yr arian ar gyfer strwythur ein gwasanaeth plismona, onid yw'n briodol inni gael mwy o lais o ran ffurf y strwythur plismona newydd yng Nghymru, os daw?

**Edwina Hart:** Nid fi sy'n gyfrifol am yr amserlen, ond yr wyf eisoes wedi penderfynu gofyn i Charles Clarke a allaf gael mwy o amser. Yr wyf wedi seilio'r amserlen ar y ffaith y caiff adroddiad pwylgor ei gyhoeddi ddechrau Rhagfyr, yn ôl pob tebyg. Gallaf wedyn barhau â'r broses. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r pwylgor fod mor barod i neilltuo amser ychwanegol a chynnal cyfarfodydd ychwanegol er mwyn gweithredu ar y dystiolaeth. Hoffwn i'n barn ni gael ei chyflwyno gyda barn pawb arall, petai hynny'n bosibl.

Credaf eich bod yn poeni gormod yngylch y cysylltiadau â'r cymunedau, oherwydd, cyhyd ag y byddwn yn cadw'r strwythur

structure, we will keep the relationship that we now have in terms of delivery at a local level. It is important that we keep that command structure in our discussion.

In the future, we have to progress our relationship, in how we deal with these issues, and the roles and responsibilities. That is something that I am giving consideration to. If we have a different structure, I would like to feel that the National Assembly had an input with any new police authorities regarding policing priorities for Wales. Some policing priorities for Wales will not be identical to those in metropolitan England, and we have to recognise that. Therefore, I will be considering these issues over the next few months before I draft my response to the Home Secretary.

**Carl Sargeant:** North Wales Police has the highest detection rate in UK—for which we must thank Ann Jones's son, as he is one of my local bobbies. That is also thanks to Labour's investment of 850 new police officers since 1997. Although Mick Bates says that we should have more police officers, we are delivering police on the street. There may be a perception that it could always be better, but that is true of everything. The current close working relationship that North Wales Police has with Cheshire and Merseyside police forces is something that should be considered. I am fully supportive of devolution, but even in a fully devolved state, we must remember to maintain and retain those links, which are crucial to high-quality policing.

**Edwina Hart:** Carl has it in a nutshell when he talks about relationships with other forces. Structural change does not have to change operational relationships. It is the same in the fire service; the three fire and rescue authorities in Wales retain their links with other authorities across the border regarding counter-terrorism measures and civil contingency planning. The same will be maintained with the police. There is cross-border work on drugs and similar issues with Merseyside and Cheshire, where authorities

uned reoli sylfaenol hwnnw, byddwn yn cadw'r gydberthynas sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd o ran cyflwyno gwasanaethau yn lleol. Mae'n bwysig inni gadw'r strwythur rheoli hwnnw yn ein trafodaethau.

Yn y dyfodol, bydd rhaid inni ddatblygu ein cydberthynas yn y modd y byddwn yn ymdrin â'r materion hyn a'r rolau a'r cyfrifoldebau. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth yr wyf yn ei ystyried. Os cawn strwythur gwahanol, hoffwn deimlo i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol wneud cyfraniad i unrhyw awdurdodau heddlu newydd parthed blaenoriaethau plismona i Gymru. Ni fydd rhai blaenoriaethau plismona i Gymru yn union debyg i'r rheini yn ardaloedd metropolitan Lloegr, a rhaid inni gydnabod hynny. Felly, byddaf yn ystyried y materion hyn dros yr ychydig fisoeedd nesaf cyn imi ddrafftio fy ymateb i'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref.

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae gan Heddlu Gogledd Cymru y gyfradd uchaf o achosion a gaiff eu datrys yn y DU—rhaid inni ddiolch i fab Ann Jones am hyn, gan ei fod yn un o'm heddweision lleol. Mae hynny'n ddiolch hefyd i fuddsoddiad Llafur o 850 o swyddogion heddlu newydd ers 1997. Er i Mick Bates ddweud y dylem fod â mwy o swyddogion yr heddlu, yr ydym yn sicrhau presenoldeb heddlu ar y strydoedd. Gall fod canfyddiad y gallai fod yn well bob amser, ond mae hynny'n wir am bopeth. Mae'r gydberthynas waith agos sydd gan Heddlu Gogledd Cymru ar hyn o bryd â heddluoedd Swydd Gaer a Glannau Merswy yn rhywbeth y dylid ei ystyried. Yr wyf yn gwbl gefnogol i ddatganoli, ond hyd yn oed mewn gwladwriaeth gwbl ddatganoledig, rhaid inni gofio cynnal a chadw'r cysylltiadau hynny, sy'n hanfodol i blismona o'r radd flaenaf.

**Edwina Hart:** Mae Carl wedi crisialu popeth wrth sôn am y gydberthynas â heddluoedd eraill. Nid oes angen i newid strwythuol newid cydberthynas weithredol. Mae'r un peth yn wir yn y gwasanaeth tân; mae'r tri awdurdod tân ac achub yng Nghymru yn cadw eu cysylltiadau ag awdurdodau eraill dros y ffin yng nghyd-destun mesurau gwrthderfysgaeth a chynllunio ar gyfer argyfngau sifil posibl. Caiff yr un cysylltiadau eu cynnal â'r heddlu. Ceir gwaith trawsffiniol ym maes cyffuriau a

work together. It is the same with the South Wales Police, which has a close relationship with the forces all across the M4. Those are operational matters.

We are looking at the democratic issues: the accountability and how we link in. We need to look at whether this report changes what we need to look at and how we ensure more efficient policing. I am mindful of the points that you made. North Wales Police has an excellent record. The forces in Wales generally have a good record on a wide range of issues, and we should be proud of the work that they have done. They have also been good at understanding devolution. They have worked with us on a host of issues, and we have given reciprocal support, for example, on operation Tarian.

**Peter Law:** I am aware, Minister, of your personal commitment to the police service, and there is a lot to be gained from working closer together. The chief constables have always said how much they favoured the view that the National Assembly should assume responsibility for policing. Under the Home Office, the police service in Wales is just a remote annexe. It will never get the level of attention as one of the 48 forces that would be the case if it came under the devolved powers of the Assembly.

I come from Gwent, where there is great concern that an efficient force, which also has a high detection rate and has served people very well, will be dismantled. The safety partnerships that you spoke of earlier have been successful. By that combination, we have a good showcase in Gwent. We were worried when you said last year—which I thought was the writing on the wall to some extent—that the Welsh Assembly Government felt that the future for policing should be based more on the other existing emergency services structure. I am glad to see that the Chair of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee will look at this thoroughly and report back.

materion tebyg gyda Glannau Merswy a Swydd Gaer, lle bydd yr awdurdodau'n cydweithio. Mae'r un peth yn wir gyda Heddlu De Cymru sydd â chydberthynas agos â'r heddluoedd ar draws yr M4. Materion gweithredol yw'r rheini.

Yr ydym yn edrych ar y materion democrataidd: atebolrwydd a'n cyswllt ni yn hynny o beth. Rhaid inni ystyried pa un a yw'r adroddiad hwn yn newid yr hyn y mae angen inni edrych arno a'r modd y gallwn sicrhau plismona mwy effeithlon. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r pwyntiau a wnaethoch. Mae record ardderchog gan Heddlu Gogledd Cymru. Yn gyffredinol mae record dda gan heddluoedd Cymru ar ystod eang o faterion a dylem ymfalchiô yn y gwaith a wnaed ganddynt. Buont hefyd yn dda yng nghyddes tun deall datganoli. Maent wedi cydweithio â ni ar lu o faterion, ac yr ydym wedi rhoi cymorth o'n hochr ni, er enghraifft, ar ymgyrch Tarian.

**Peter Law:** Yr wyf yn ymwybodol, Weinidog, o'ch ymrwymiad personol i wasanaeth yr heddlu ac mae llawer i'w gael yn sglîl cydweithio'n agos. Mae'r prif gwnstabliaid wedi dweud erioed gymaint y maent o blaid y farn y dylai'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gymryd y cyfrifoldeb dros blismona. O dan y Swyddfa Gartref, atodiad pellennig yw gwasanaeth yr heddlu yng Nghymru. Ni fydd byth yn cael cymaint o sylw fel un o'r 48 o heddluoedd ag y byddai'n ei gael pe byddai'n dod o dan bwerau datganoledig y Cynulliad.

Yr wyf yn dod o Went, ac yno mae cryn bryder y bydd heddlu effeithlon, sydd yntau â chyfradd uchel o ddatrys achosion ac sydd wedi gwasanaethu pobl yn dda iawn, yn cael ei ddatgymalu. Bu'r partneriaethau diogelwch y cyfeirioch atynt ynghynt yn llwyddiannus. Drwy'r cyfuniad hwnnw, mae esiampl dda gennym yng Ngwent. Yr oeddym yn bryderus pan wnaethoch ddweud y llynedd—sef ysgrifen ar y mur i ryw raddau, yn fy marn i—fod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o'r farn y dylid seilio dyfodol plismona yn fwy ar strwythur presennol y gwasanaethau brys eraill. Yr wyf yn falch o weld y bydd Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyflwynwr Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio yn edrych ar hyn yn fanwl ac yn cyflwyno

adroddiad arno.

3.40 p.m.

Inevitably, there may come a time when we think the unthinkable. If we cannot keep what we have, which is trusted, and true, we may look to a future where there is one police force for the whole of Wales. However, what is important is that the Government moves as quickly as it can to obtain powers over the police. The Assembly should endorse that, because devolved powers to run the police service in Wales are undoubtedly what people generally want to see and will support. I hope that that can happen in future. I hope that you remain totally committed to that, as I have heard you say you are so many times in the past.

Yn anochel, efallai y daw amser pan fyddwn yn dychmygu'r annychmygol. Os na allwn gadw'r hyn sydd gennym, sef rhywbeth yr ymddiriedir ynddo, sydd i'r dim, efallai y byddwn yn ystyried dyfodol lle bydd un heddlu ar gyfer Cymru gyfan. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw bod y Llywodraeth yn symud mor gyflym â phosibl er mwyn sicrhau pwerau dros yr heddlu. Dylai'r Cynulliad gymeradwyo hynny, oherwydd, yn ddi-au, mae pwerau datganoledig i redeg gwasanaeth yr heddlu yng Nghymru yn rhywbeth, ar y cyfan, y mae pobl am ei weld ac yn rhywbeth y byddant yn ei gefnogi. Gobeithiaf y gall hynny ddigwydd yn y dyfodol. Gobeithiaf eich bod yn parhau i fod yn gwbl ymrwymedig i hynny, fel yr wyl wedi'ch clywed yn dweud cynifer o weithiau yn y gorffennol.

**Edwina Hart:** You are right to say that we get attached to our forces and our structures, and when we see them doing a good job, especially through the community safety partnerships, we recognise that things are working well. Unfortunately, this is not a devolved matter, and at the end of the day, you are right that we might be faced with a police force for the whole of Wales. It would then be up to us to make positive suggestions about how to deal with democratic accountability, and the views of communities and how they fit in, so that we do not lose anything through any structural change.

**Edwina Hart:** Yr ydych yn iawn i ddweud ein bod yn mynd yn bleidiol i'n heddluoedd a'n strwythurau, a phan y'u gwelwn yn gwneud gwaith da, yn enwedig drwy bartneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol, yr ydym yn cydnabod bod pethau'n gweithio'n dda. Yn anffodus, nid mater datganoledig yw hwn, ac yn y pen draw, yr ydych yn gywir i ddweud y gallem wynebu sefyllfa lle y ceir heddlu ar gyfer Cymru gyfan. Byddai wedyn, yn gyfrifoldeb arnom i gynnig awgrymiadau cadarnhaol ynglŷn â'r modd o ymdrin ag atebolrwydd democrataidd, a barn cymunedau a'u rhan hwy, fel nad ydym yn colli unrhyw beth drwy unrhyw newid strwythurol.

You also talked about the important issue of the eventual devolution of the police. However, as a former local government Minister, you will be aware of the difficulties and complexities of the police funding formula. These are issues that would have to be looked at in the round. Therefore, we must take a staged approach to some of these issues. Let us look at structure and what is best for us, at how we could be involved in how the police could develop, at our relationship with the police, and at policing priorities for Wales. Then we would have to look at the financial issues, because we

Bu ichi sôn hefyd am fater pwysig datganoli'r heddlu yn y pen draw. Fodd bynnag, fel cyn Weinidog Llywodraeth leol, byddwch yn ymwybodol o anawsterau a chymhlethdodau fformiwl ariannu'r heddlu. Mae'r rhain yn faterion y byddai angen eu hystyried yn eu cyfarwydd. Felly, rhaid inni ystyried rhai o'r materion hyn fesul cam. Gadewch inni edrych ar strwythur a'r hyn sydd orau inni, ar y rhan y gallem ei chwarae yn y modd y gellid datblygu'r heddlu, ar ein cydberthynas â'r heddlu ac ar flaenoriaethau plismona i Gymru. Yna byddai'n rhaid inni edrych ar y materion ariannol, oherwydd

would have to ensure that, if there was devolution, we would have sufficient cash to keep up with any demands on policing. You have raised quite a complex set of issues, but they are worth discussing.

**Nick Bourne:** The Minister has spoken very fairly about the issues and the fact that this is not a devolved matter. May I press her on the extended consultation period that she has been pressing the Home Secretary for, as it is vital? Could Assembly Members be kept informed of her progress on that discussion? Linked with that, how does she intend to involve communities in Wales in that dialogue?

We have just heard Peter speak very truthfully and accurately about Gwent Police, which is a very effective police force, and others. In my area, we have Dyfed-Powys Police Force, which is probably the best in the country. There is genuine concern that we will put that at risk if we go headlong down the path being suggested. Others have said, 'If it ain't broke, don't fix it'. Parallels have been drawn with directory enquiries and, in general, things that work very well should be left alone, with perhaps a bit of tweaking here and there. I seek the Minister's assurance that all communities will be involved in the process, and that we are going to have long enough to consult on it, because I have grave concerns about my area.

**Edwina Hart:** I will be responding to Charles Clarke's letter to me, and I will indicate that I would like a little longer. I do not think that I can ask for much longer, but that might help the committee. However, I need to keep within the timescales, as I want to get our messages across.

You said that, in Dyfed Powys, you have the best police force, but everyone here will say that theirs is the best. That is the trouble when you discuss anything as emotive as changing services; you always worry that provision will become worse, rather than improve. However, because the report has come from the Home Secretary, I think that it is driven by a genuine will to change policing

byddai'n rhaid inni sicrhau, petai datganoli, bod digon o arian gennym i dalu am unrhyw ofynion ar blismona. Yr ydych wedi codi cyfres eithaf cymhleth o faterion, ond mae'n werth eu trafod.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae'r Gweinidog wedi siarad yn deg iawn am y materion a'r ffait nad yw hwn yn fater datganoledig. A allaf bwysu arni fod y cyfnod ymgynghori estynedig y mae wedi rhoi pwysau ar yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref amdano yn hanfodol? A fyddai modd iddi roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i Aelodau'r Cynulliad am ei chynnydd ar y drafodaeth honno? Yn gysylltiedig â hynny, sut y mae'n bwriadu cynnwys cymunedau yng Nghymru yn y dialog hwnnw?

Yr ydym newydd glywed Peter yn siarad yn wir ac yn gywir am Heddlu Gwent, sy'n heddlu effeithiol iawn, ac eraill. Yn fy ardal i, mae gennym Heddlu Dyfed-Powys, sydd, fwy na thebyg, y gorau yn y wlad. Mae pryder gwirioneddol y byddwn yn peryglu hyn os dilynwn y trywydd a awgrymir. Mae eraill wedi dweud, 'os nad yw wedi torri, peidiwch â'i drwsio'. Gwnaed cymariaethau â'r gwasanaeth ymholaadau ffôn ac, yn gyffredinol ni ddylid ymyrryd â phethau sy'n gweithio'n dda iawn, ac eithrio ychydig o fireinio yma a thraw. Ceisiaf sicrwydd gan y Gweinidog y caiff pob cymuned ei chynnwys yn y broses, ac y byddwn yn cael digon o amser i ymgynghori yn ei chylch oherwydd bod gennyl f gryn bryderon ynglŷn â'm hardal i.

**Edwina Hart:** Byddaf yn ymateb i lythyr Charles Clarke ataf, a byddaf yn nodi yr hoffwn ychydig yn fwy o amser. Ni chredaf y gallaf ofyn am lawer yn fwy, ond efallai y gallai hynny fod o gymorth i'r pwylgor. Fodd bynnag, rhaid imi gadw o fewn yr amserlen, oherwydd fy mod am drosglwyddo ein negeseuon.

Dywelasoch, yn Nyfed Powys, mai chi sydd â'r heddlu gorau, ond byddai pawb yma yn dweud mai eu heddlu hwy yw'r gorau. Dyna'r broblem pan fyddwch yn trafod unrhyw beth sydd mor emosiynol â newid gwasanaethau; yr ydych bob amser yn pryderu y bydd y ddarpariaeth yn gwaethyg yn hytrach na'n gwella. Fodd bynnag, oherwydd mai gan yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol

for the better in future. I do not think that it is just about cost-cutting efficiency savings; it is about getting the right structure for the police force for changing circumstances in the UK. That is quite important.

On the consultation, the committee will obviously decide who it will consult with. We also need to be aware that the police authorities, which essentially represent the communities, will be responding to the document, as will chief constables. Therefore, plenty of people are collecting opinions to provide to Charles Clarke.

y daeth yr adroddiad, credaf ei fod wedi'i ysgogi gan ewyllys gwirioneddol i newid plismona er gwell yn y dyfodol. Ni chredaf mai arbedion effeithlonrwydd i dorri costau yn unig yw hyn; mae'n ymwneud â sicrhau'r strwythur cywir i'r heddlu ar gyfer amgylchiadau cyfnewidiol y DU. Mae hynny'n eithaf pwysig.

O ran yr ymgynghoriad, mae'n amlwg y bydd y pwylgor yn penderfynu â phwy y bydd yn ymgynghori. Rhaid inni hefyd fod yn ymwybodol y bydd awdurdodau'r heddlu, sydd, i bob pwrrpas, yn cynrychioli'r cymunedau, yn ymateb i'r ddogfen, yn ogystal â phrif gwnstabliaid. Felly, mae digon o bobl yn casglu barn i'w cyflwyno i Charles Clarke.

### Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

**Jenny Randerson:** I raise a point of order under Standing Order No. 6.36. I submitted a question under the Freedom of Information Act 2000 to the Minister for Economic Development and Transport some time ago. I have had a reply in which I am told by the official concerned that not all the documents that I have requested can be provided. The reason given is:

'the documents relate to discussions between Ministers and officials, who are encouraged to be imaginative and consider innovative ideas. The exposure of some of these discussions to the public domain, via a freedom of information request, may lead to individuals or Cabinet being targeted for ridicule through the media. Such a prospect would, or would be likely to, inhibit the free and frank exchange of ideas'.

You have previously ruled on the issue of questions and freedom of information, Presiding Officer, therefore is it your view that it is a legitimate exemption from the Freedom of Information Act 2000 that information should not be supplied because a Minister may be held up to ridicule as a result?

**The Presiding Officer:** Freedom of

**Jenny Randerson:** Codaf bwynt o drefn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.36. Cyflwynais gwestiwn o dan Ddeddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000 i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth beth amser yn ôl. Cefais ateb gan y swyddog dan sylw a ddywedodd wrthyf na ellir darparu pob un o'r dogfennau y gofynnais amdanynt. Dyma'r rheswm a roddir:

mae'r dogfennau yn ymwneud â thrafodaethau rhwng Gweinidogion a swyddogion, a anogir i fod yn ddychmygus ac i ystyried syniadau arloesol. Gallai datgelu rhai o'r trafodaethau hyn i'r cyhoedd, drwy gyfrwng cais rhyddid gwybodaeth, arwain at wawdio unigolion neu'r Cabinet drwy'r cyfryngau. Byddai rhagolwg o'r fath yn atal syniadau rhag cael eu rhannu'n rhydd ac yn agored, neu byddai'n debygol o wneud hynny.

Yr ydych eisoes wedi rhoi dyfarniad ar gwestiynau rhyddid gwybodaeth, Lywydd, felly a ydych o'r farn mai eithriad diliys rhag y Ddeddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000 yw na ddylid darparu gwybodaeth oherwydd gallai Gweinidog fod yn destun gwawd o ganlyniad i hynny?

**Y Llywydd:** Ymdrinnir â cheisiadau rhyddid

information requests, whether from Assembly Members, journalists—dare I say—or the public, are dealt with under freedom of information legislation. That is not a matter for me. There is an information commissioner in Cardiff and in London responsible for determining these matters. It is up to Ministers, who have responsibility for matters relating to freedom of information as far as the Cabinet is concerned, to provide reasons as to why information is not revealed. It is not for me to comment on those reasons. However, I assure Members that I will continue to take the view that Assembly Members have rights beyond those of other citizens and in respect of the institution of which they are members and will support those rights. I do not believe that these rights have been transgressed in this matter.

It seems that the Minister does not wish to rise on this occasion.

gwybodaeth, boed gan Aelodau'r Cynulliad, newyddiadurwyr—os meiddiaf ei ddweud—neu'r cyhoedd, o dan ddeddfwriaeth rhyddid gwybodaeth. Nid mater i mi yw hyn. Mae comisiynydd gwybodaeth yng Nghaerdydd ac yn Llundain yn gyfrifol am benderfynu ar y materion hyn. Dyletswydd Gweinidogion sy'n gyfrifol am faterion sy'n ymwneud â rhyddid gwybodaeth o ran y Cabinet yw rhoi rhesymau dros beidio â datgelu gwybodaeth. Nid fy lle i yw rhoi sylwadau ar y rhesymau hynny. Fodd bynnag, gallaf sicrhau Aelodau y byddaf yn parhau i arddel y farn bod gan Aelodau'r Cynulliad hawliau y tu hwnt i hawliau dinasyddion eraill o ran y sefydliad y maent yn aelodau ohonynt a byddaf yn cefnogi'r hawliau hynny. Nid wyf o'r farn i'r hawliau hyn gael eu torri yn y mater hwn.

Ymddengys nad yw'r Gweinidog am godi y tro hwn.

### **Achosion E. coli yng Nghymru E.coli Outbreaks in Wales**

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Yr wyf yn falch bod cytundeb ar draws y pleidiau ein bod yn cynnal dadl ar yr achosion E.coli yn ystod y dyddiau diwethaf.

Un o gyfrifoldebau pwysicaf y Cynulliad yw ein bod, ar faterion brys fel hyn, yn ymateb i gonsýrn a phryder y cyhoedd.

Mae'n bwysig bod y Cynulliad nid yn unig yn trafod y mater heddiw, ond hefyd yn cytuno ar ymchwiliad i'r digwyddiadau hyn fydd â hyder y cyhoedd. Cyfeiriaf yn nes ymlaen at y math o ymchwiliad y gobeithiaf ei weld.

Erbyn hyn, gwyddom fod 122 o achosion o E.coli 0157, a chredwn mai dyna'r achos mwyaf o'i fath yng Nghymru. Mae achosion wedi digwydd mewn pedwar awdurdod lleol a chawn ar ddeall bod dau achos arall nad ydynt yn gysylltiedig â'r achosion penodol yn y pedwar awdurdod lleol. Er hynny, bydd rhaid inni ddisgwyl am ganlyniadau'r profion. Gwyddom hefyd fod mwyaf yr achosion yn ymwneud â phlant. Mae 25 wedi bod mewn ysbty, ac, fel y clywsom ddoe,

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** I am pleased that there was cross-party agreement on holding a debate on the E.coli outbreaks during the past few days.

One of the Assembly's most important responsibilities, in relation to urgent matters such as this, is to respond to the concerns and fears of the public.

It is important that the Assembly not only discusses this issue today, but also agrees on an inquiry into this outbreak that will have the confidence of the public. I will return later to the kind of inquiry that I hope to see.

We now know that there are 122 cases of E.coli 0157, and we believe that this is the largest outbreak of its kind in Wales. There have been cases in four local authorities and we understand that there are a further two cases that are not linked to the specific outbreak in the four local authorities. However, we will have to await the test results. We also know that the majority of cases relate to children. A total of 25 people have been in hospital, and, as we heard

mae pedwar mewn gofal dwys. Mae'r ffaith ein bod yn trafod hyn heddiw yn ymateb cadarnhaol i'r sefyllfa o safbwyt y Cynulliad. Er hynny, credaf ei bod yn bwysig i ni drafod y math o ymchwiliad y dylid ei gynnal i'r achosion.

Deallwn fod E.coli yn haint sy'n gallu, mewn rhai achosion, beryglu bywydau pobl. Yr ydym wedi gweld yr haint yng ngwledydd Prydain ers 1980 a gwelsom cynnydd yn yr achosion yn ystod y 1990au. Yr oedd yr achos mwyaf yn yr Alban ym 1996 a 1997. Yn dilyn yr achosion hynny, cafwyd adroddiad Pennington, ac argymhellion oedd i fod i gael eu gweithredu. Cyfeiriad at nifer ohonynt yn fyr. Yr oedd argymhellion bod angen gwensi trin bwyd ar gyfer plant, bod hyfforddiant ar gyfer gweithwyr mewn lladd-dai, bod gwybodaeth ar E.coli ar gyfer gweithwyr fferm, bod cifyddion yn cael eu trwyddedu er mwyn sicrhau hyfforddiant i staff ar sut i drin bwyd, ac, wrth gwrs, mae rheoliadau sy'n mynnu bod cig amrwd a chig wedi ei goginio yn cael eu cadw ar wahân.

3.50 p.m.

Felly, mae'r adroddiad hwennw yn sail i ystyried pa rai o'r argymhellion hynny, os o gwbl, na chafodd eu dilyn yn yr achosion dan sylw yng Nghymru.

When we have a serious outbreak, such as this recent outbreak of E.coli, we must respond in a way that has full public support. As I have indicated, this not only means holding a debate today, but having a way forward to which the whole Assembly can agree and which has public support. The public must be satisfied that the Assembly is responsive to its concerns.

I will touch on the initial response of the Minister and the First Minister, and say how happy we were, and how content we are, that we have moved forward from that initial response. The Minister and the First Minister said, in their initial response, that they were happy for there to be an inquiry, that an inquiry would be set up, and that it should be open, independent and transparent. The missing word was 'public', and, despite being challenged on a number of occasions by

yesterday, four are in intensive care. The fact that we are discussing this today is a positive response to the situation from the Assembly's point of view. However, it is important that we discuss the type of inquiry that should be held into the outbreak.

We understand that E.coli is an infection that, in some cases, can put people's lives in danger. We have seen the infection in Britain since 1980 and saw an increase in cases during the 1990s. The largest outbreak was in Scotland in 1996 and 1997. Following those outbreaks, we had the Pennington report, and recommendations that were supposed to be implemented. I will refer to a number of them briefly. There were recommendations that children should be given lessons on how to treat food, that training be provided for slaughterhouse workers, that information be provided on E.coli for farm workers, that butchers be licensed to ensure training for staff on how to handle food, and, of course, there are regulations to ensure that raw and cooked meat are kept separate.

So, that report forms a basis on which to consider which of those recommendations, if any, were not followed in the outbreak in Wales.

Pan fydd llawer o achosion yn codi, megis yr achosion diweddar hyn o E.coli, rhaid inni ymateb mewn ffordd y mae'r cyhoedd yn ei chefnogi'n llawn. Fel yr wyf wedi ei nodi, mae hyn yn golygu nid yn unig cynnal dadl heddiw, ond cael ffordd ymlaen y gall y Cynulliad cyfan gytuno arni ac y mae'r cyhoedd yn ei chefnogi. Rhaid i'r cyhoedd fod yn fodlon bod y Cynulliad yn ymateb i'w bryderon.

Byddaf yn cyfeirio at ymateb cychwynnol y Gweinidog a'r Prif Weinidog, ac yn dweud pa mor hapus yr oeddem, a pha mor fodlon yr ydym ein bod wedi symud ymlaen o'r ymateb cychwynnol hwennw. Dywedodd y Gweinidog a'r Prif Weinidog, yn eu hymateb cychwynnol, eu bod yn fodlon i ymchwiliad gael ei gynnal, y cai ymchwiliad ei sefydlu ac y dylai fod yn agored, yn annibynnol ac yn dryloyw. Y gair coll oedd 'cyhoeddus', ac, er iddynt gael eu herio sawl gwaith gan

television journalists and others, they were not prepared to say that the inquiry should be held in public.

Of course, there are legal issues—and I shall come to those in a minute—which, I believe, can be overcome by the method that I hope the Assembly will accept next week as the way forward.

One has to remember that, despite the fact that the First Minister and the Minister were talking about an open, transparent and independent inquiry, parents of many of the children involved were not happy with that response, because they wanted the inquiry to be held in public. In responding to that, we in Plaid Cymru fully accepted—as I am sure did all other parties in the Assembly—the need to respond to this, carrying the public with us, but recognising that we must do so sensibly. We took a great deal of trouble to assess whether an inquiry under the Inquiries Act 2005 was the appropriate way of moving forward. There were five main issues that we were concerned about, and we wanted to be satisfied that the Inquiries Act fell within what we felt was necessary.

The first thing that we wanted to ensure was that the inquiry would be held in public, that is, that there would be open sessions where witnesses would give evidence, and that those witnesses would have their views reported. That is crucial for public confidence.

The second thing that we wanted to ensure was that the Assembly itself would be in control of the terms of reference of any inquiry. It is very important that the Assembly, as a corporate body in this instance, is happy that the terms of reference cover all the issues that we feel need to be covered.

Another matter that we felt was crucial was that there had to be—in extremis—the power to compel witnesses to appear before the inquiry. Not all inquiries have that power. We recognize that it can be a draconian power, but, in this instance, we believed that it was essential.

newyddiadurwyr teledu ac eraill, nid oeddent yn barod i ddweud y dylid cynnal ymchwiliad cyhoeddus.

Wrth gwrs, mae materion cyfreithiol—ac fe ddof at y rheini mewn munud—y credaf y gellir eu goresgyn drwy'r dull y gobeithiaf y bydd y Cynulliad yn ei dderbyn yr wythnos nesaf fel y ffordd ymlaen.

Rhaid cofio, er gwaethaf y ffaith bod y Prif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog yn siarad am ymchwiliad agored, tryloyw ac annibynnol, nid oedd rhieni llawer o'r plant cysylltiedig yn fodlon ar yr ymateb hwnnw, oherwydd eu bod am i ymchwiliad cyhoeddus gael ei gynnwl. Wrth ymateb i hynny, yr oeddem ni ym Mhlaid Cymru yn derbyn yn llawn—fel pob plaid arall yn y Cynulliad, mae'n siŵr—bod angen ymateb i hyn, gan sicrhau cefnogaeth y cyhoedd ond gan gydnabod bod angen inni wneud hynny'n synhwyrol. Aethom i grym drafferth i asesu pa un ai ymchwiliad o dan Ddeddf Ymchwiliadau 2005 oedd y ffordd briodol o symud ymlaen. Yr oedd pum prif fater yr oeddem yn pryderu yn eu cylch, ac yr oeddem am fod yn fodlon bod y Ddeddf Ymchwiliadau yn cwmpasu'r hyn a oedd yn angenrheidiol, yn ein barn ni.

Y peth cyntaf yr oeddem am ei sicrhau oedd y byddai'r ymchwiliad yn cael ei gynnwl yn gyhoeddus, hynny yw, y byddai sesiynau agored lle y byddai tystion yn rhoi tystiolaeth, ac y byddai barn y tystion hynny yn cael ei nodi. Mae hynny'n hanfodol i sicrhau hyder y cyhoedd.

Yr ail beth yr oeddem am ei sicrhau oedd y byddai'r Cynulliad ei hun yn rheoli cylch gorchwyl unrhyw ymchwiliad. Mae'n bwysig iawn bod y Cynulliad, fel corff corfforaethol yn yr achos hwn, yn fodlon bod y cylch gorchwyl yn cwmpasu'r holl faterion y mae angen eu cwmpasu, yn ein barn ni.

Mater arall a oedd yn allweddol, yn ein barn ni, oedd bod yn rhaid cael—mewn cyfyngder—y pŵer i orfodi tystion i ymddangos gerbron yr ymchwiliad. Nid oes gan bob ymchwiliad y pŵer hwnnw. Cydnabyddwn y gall fod yn bŵer llym, ond, yn yr achos hwn, yr oeddem o'r farn ei fod yn hanfodol.

We then needed to make sure that any documents connected to the inquiry had to be made available, and that the ordering, if necessary, of documents and papers, could be done.

Finally, we wanted to make sure that not only could the public follow the proceedings and hear people giving evidence, but that the recommendations would then be published, so that the public could link the evidence to the recommendations made. In my experience, provided that people can see that the recommendations follow the evidence, they have greater confidence in the system. The new procedure that we are talking about in the Inquiries Act 2005 was not available, for example, in the Nantygwyddon-type inquiry. It is now available—in fact, it has only been available to us in the National Assembly since June this year.

That is why we felt that an inquiry under the Inquiries Act 2005 was suitable, because it is much quicker, easier, and I daresay cheaper than the old-style public inquiry, which many people baulked at because of the expense and the delays involved. This is a way to move forward, with the confidence of the people of Wales. It would be an innovative inquiry, because we would be the first body to use this procedure.

There are several issues about which we are concerned here. However, what concerns me, and what is highlighted again in this incident, is the need to ensure that we source food for our schools as locally as possible, and make the best use of local produce. I hope that the inquiry will be able to look at such matters. That should be done not only in schools, but in all public bodies, to ensure the provision of high-quality, good local food, as well as maximum traceability.

I am sure that other Members will wish to contribute to this debate. I hope that at the end, after a great deal of discussion, we will be able to move forward as a united Assembly with an inquiry under the Inquiries Act 2005.

Wedyn, yr oedd angen inni sicrhau bod unrhyw ddogfennau yn gysylltiedig â'r ymchwiliad ar gael, ac y gellid archebu dogfennau a phapurau, os oedd angen.

Yn olaf, yr oeddem am sicrhau y gallai'r cyhoedd nid yn unig ddilyn y trafodion a chlywed pobl yn rhoi dystiolaeth, ond y cai'r argymhellion eu cyhoeddi, er mwyn i'r cyhoedd allu cysylltu'r dystiolaeth â'r argymhellion a wnaed. O'm profiad i, a bod pobl yn gallu gweld bod yr argymhellion yn dilyn y dystiolaeth, mae ganddynt fwy o ffydd yn y system. Nid oedd y weithdrefn newydd y siaradwn amdani yn Neddf Ymchwiliadau 2005 ar gael, er enghraifft, mewn ymchwiliad tebyg i ymchwiliad Nantygwyddon. Mae ar gael bellach—yn wir, dim ond ers mis Mehefin eleni y bu ar gael i ni yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

Dyna pam y credem fod ymchwiliad o dan Ddeddf Ymchwiliadau 2005 yn addas, oherwydd ei fod yn llawer cyflymach, yn haws, a mentraf ddweud, yn rhatach na'r hen fath o ymchwiliad cyhoeddus, yr oedd llawer o bobl yn cilio rhagddo oherwydd y gost a'r oedi cysylltiedig. Mae hon yn ffordd o symud ymlaen, gyda hyder pobl Cymru. Byddai'n ymchwiliad arloesol, oherwydd ni fyddai'r corff cyntaf i ddefnyddio'r weithdrefn hon.

Ceir nifer o faterion yr ydym yn bryderus yn eu cylch yma. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn sy'n fy mhryderu i, a'r hyn a amlygir eto yn y digwyddiad hwn, yw'r angen i sicrhau ein bod yn prynu bwyd ar gyfer ein hysgolion mor lleol â phosibl, ac yn gwneud y defnydd gorau o gynnyrch lleol. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr ymchwiliad yn gallu edrych ar faterion o'r fath. Dylid gwneud hynny nid yn unig mewn ysgolion, ond o fewn pob corff cyhoeddus, i sicrhau bod bwyd lleol da o safon yn cael ei ddarparu, yn ogystal â bwyd y gellir ei olrhain gymaint â phosibl.

Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Aelodau eraill yn dymuno cyfrannu at y ddadl hon. Gobeithiaf ar y diwedd, ar ôl cryn drafod, y gallwn symud ymlaen fel Cynulliad unedig i gynnal ymchwiliad o dan Ddeddf Ymchwiliadau 2005.

**Leighton Andrews:** I welcome this debate. I state, once again, my sympathy for the families affected by this crisis. It is a serious situation—we believe that there are over 120 cases, which, from this one outbreak, is four times as many as we have had, on average, in any one year. It is affecting communities in my constituency.

I have spoken to all the schools affected in my constituency. I spoke to the first one 10 days ago, when news of the outbreak first became public. I have also spoken to some of the parents and grandparents affected, including one of the families worst affected. There is no question that the public wants the full facts to come out, and wants to know why this has occurred. I am sure that we all start from the position of wanting to know ourselves why this outbreak has occurred.

On behalf of a couple of the schools in my constituency, I would like to comment on some of the publicity surrounding this outbreak. Two of the headteachers of schools in my constituency have told me that their schools were named as being affected before the results of tests had confirmed cases of E.coli. That is worrying, as you will appreciate, for parents and teachers in those schools. One school told me that, understandably, children have been withdrawn from the schools meals service, even though the school does not take produce from the supplier that has been named in public. These things gather momentum in this context, and we have seen that happen over the last 10 days. However, there is no doubt about the concerns that exist.

I called for an inquiry last week, and wrote to the Minister to ask that there be an inquiry into this outbreak. I state again on record my thanks to the Minister for responding so positively, and I also thank the First Minister for stating that the inquiry will be open and transparent. That is important. I can well understand why the parents and grandparents of those affected may be considering legal action; that is very understandable. I suspect that there will need to be more information

**Leighton Andrews:** Croesawaf y ddadl hon. Nodaf, unwaith eto, fy mod yn cydymdeimlo â'r teuluoedd y mae'r argyfwng hwn wedi effeithio arnynt. Mae'n sefyllfa ddifrifol—crewn fod dros 120 o achosion, sydd, o'r un digwyddiad hwn, bedair gwaith yn fwy nag yr ydym wedi ei weld, ar gyfartaledd, mewn unrhyw flwyddyn. Mae'n effeithio ar gymunedau yn fy etholaeth.

Yr wyf wedi siarad â'r holl ysgolion yr effeithiwyd arnynt yn fy etholaeth. Siaradais â'r cyntaf 10 niwrnod yn ôl, pan ddaeth newyddion am yr achosion i sylw'r cyhoedd am y tro cyntaf. Yr wyf hefyd wedi siarad â rhai o'r rhieni a'r neiniau a'r teidiau yr effeithiwyd arnynt, gan gynnwys un o'r teuluoedd yr effeithiwyd arnynt waethaf. Nid oes unrhyw amheuaeth bod y cyhoedd am glywed y ffeithiau llawn, a'i fod am wybod pam mae hyn wedi digwydd. Yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod oll yn dechrau o'r safbwyt ein bod am wybod ein hunain pam mae'r achosion hyn wedi digwydd.

Ar ran dwy ysgol yn fy etholaeth, hoffwn wneud sylwadau ar rywfaint o'r cyhoeddusrwydd a roddwyd i'r achosion hyn. Dywedodd dau bennaeth ysgolion yn fy etholaeth i'w hysgolion gael eu henwi fel rhai yr effeithiwyd arnynt cyn i ganlyniadau profion gadarnhau achosion o E.coli. Mae hynny'n achosi pryder, fel y byddwch yn ei werthfawrogi, i rieni ac athrawon yn yr ysgolion hynny. Dywedodd un ysgol wrthyf, fod plant, yn ddealladwy, wedi cael eu tynnu o'r gwasanaeth prydu bwyd ysgol, er nad yw'r ysgol yn prynu cynnrych gan y cyflenwr a enwyd yn gyhoeddus. Mae'r pethau hyn yn magu momentwm yn y cyd-destun hwn, ac yr ydym wedi gweld hynny'n digwydd yn ystod y 10 niwrnod diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, nid oes amheuaeth am y pryderon sy'n bodoli.

Bu imi alw am ymchwiliad yr wythnos diwethaf, ac ysgrifennais at y Gweinidog yn gofyn i ymchwiliad gael ei gynnal i'r achosion hyn. Cofnodaf eto fy niolch i'r Gweinidog am ymateb mor gadarnhaol, a diolchaf hefyd i'r Prif Weinidog am ddweud y bydd yr ymchwiliad yn agored ac yn dryloyw. Mae hynny'n bwysig. Gallaf ddeall pam y gallai rhieni a neiniau a theidiau'r sawl yr effeithiwyd arnynt fod yn ystyried dwyn achos cyfreithiol; mae hynny'n ddealladwy

before any legal cases can be mounted. It is important that any inquiry can get the fullest evidence, and get answers quickly. That is what is of concern to the community. That is one reason why I had doubts about the old traditional kind of public inquiry and the difficulties that could result from that, as well as the difficulties—and it is a genuine concern—of a public inquiry running alongside legal cases. There are difficulties in those situations, and I think that people understand that; I do not believe that it is a great mark of division between us across the Chamber.

4.00 p.m.

One thing that is important is that we have a culture of accountability in Wales. I do not want to prejudge the outcome of any inquiry, but one of the aspects of reassurance will be that if people have done things wrongly, whether they are in the private sector or public sector, they will be held to account for that, or for having failed to do things that they should have done. That is essential. The public does not believe in outcomes of inquiries where people are not seen to take the blame or the rap. It is important, in a new democratic Wales, that we have a culture of accountability. There are some key questions. One key question that I have raised throughout is the issue of the food supply chain into schools. Have the right inspections of suppliers been carried out at regular intervals? That is a key question. The national public health service and the environmental health officers have worked amazingly hard over the last 10 days to try to find the answers and reassure the public, and we should put on record our thanks for their work. I understand the point about local sourcing, but that is no good if the inspections are not carried out, which is clearly the final thing.

Finally, I have looked at the Pennington conclusions, of which there are a vast number. The ones on enforcement are ones that we must look at closely, but I agree with

iawn. Tybiaf y bydd angen rhagor o wybodaeth cyn y gellir dwyn unrhyw achosion cyfreithiol. Mae'n bwysig bod unrhyw ymchwiliad yn gallu cael y dystiolaeth lawnaf, a chael atebion yn gyflym. Dyna'r hyn sy'n peri pryder i'r gymuned. Dyna un rheswm pam yr oedd gennyl amheuon am yr hen fath traddodiadol o ymchwiliad cyhoeddus a'r anawsterau a allai ddeillio o hynny, yn ogystal a'r anawsterau—ac mae'n bryder gwirioneddol—sy'n gysylltiedig ag ymchwiliad cyhoeddus yn cydrededig ag achosion cyfreithiol. Mae anawsterau ynglwm wrth y sefyllfaodd hynny, a chredaf fod pobl yn deall hynny; ni chredaf ei bod yn arwydd mawr o fwlch rhngom ar draws y Siambrau.

Un peth pwysig yw bod gennym ddiwylliant o atebolrwydd yng Nghymru. Nid wyf am ragfarnu canlyniad unrhyw ymchwiliad, ond un agwedd ar gadarnhad yw, os bydd pobl wedi gwneud rhywbeth o'i le, pa un a ydynt yn y sector preifat neu'r sector cyhoeddus, y caint eu galw i gyfrif am hynny, neu am fethu â gwneud pethau y dylent fod wedi eu gwneud. Mae hynny'n hanfodol. Ni fydd y cyhoedd yn credu canlyniadau ymchwiliadau pan nad yw'n amlwg bod pobl yn derbyn y bai neu'r cerydd. Mae'n bwysig, mewn Cymru ddemocratiaidd newydd, bod gennym ddiwylliant o atebolrwydd. Mae rhai cwestiynau allweddol yn codi. Un cwestiwn allweddol yr wyf wedi'i godi o'r cychwyn yw'r gadwyn cyflenwi bwyd i ysgolion. A gynhalwyd yr archwiliadau rheolaidd cywir o gyflenwyr? Mae hynny yn gwestiwn allweddol. Mae'r gwasanaeth iechyd cyhoeddus cenedlaethol a swyddogion iechyd yr amgylchedd wedi gweithio'n rhyfeddol o galed dros y 10 diwrnod diwethaf i geisio dod o hyd i'r atebion a thawelu meddyliau'r cyhoedd, a dylem gofnodi ein diolch am eu gwaith. Deallaf y pwynt ynglŷn â defnyddio cyflenwyr lleol, ond nid yw hynny'n werth dim os na chynhelir yr archwiliadau, sef y gweithgaredd terfynol.

Yn olaf, yr wyf wedi edrych ar gasgliadau Pennington, ac mae nifer fawr ohonynt. Y rhai ar orfodaeth yw'r rhai y dylem edrych yn fanwl arnynt, ond cytunaf ag arweinydd yr

the leader of the opposition that we need to investigate whether all of those have been carried out. Today, it is important that we unite behind this and that this is seen as the whole Assembly coming together to say that this is an issue of serious concern in Wales, and that we are concerned and want answers.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I associate myself with the comments of the leader of the opposition, in stating that this inquiry should be a public inquiry and one that inspires confidence in the minds of the families, and particularly the parents, of those children who have been affected by this dreadful strain of food poisoning. Any attempt to confine this to merely a Government inquiry would first limit the role of the inquiry, but secondly, not convince the parents that we had the best interests of their families and children in mind. An open and independent inquiry, that has that breadth in its remit, will be one that will inspire confidence, and I hope that that is something that we can unite around. Food poisoning—E.coli and other bacterial infections—can be extremely nasty and, in certain cases, fatal, particularly for young children who can be susceptible to such bacterial infections, and who also demonstrate the really nasty effects that these infections can bring. As someone who was hospitalised for an entire week in 1993 with salmonella food poisoning, I can certainly sympathise with the children who have been infected by the E.coli bacteria. It is a very nasty experience, and I can only imagine what was going through the minds of the parents of those children on seeing them suffering.

We must start from the premise that the protection of the health and wellbeing of young children must be absolutely paramount in our debate, and the terms of reference of any inquiry must demonstrate breadth in its remit and depth in terms of its scientific and procedural considerations. Having looked at the Pennington inquiry, and in particular the people who advised that inquiry, it was very clear from the outset that there was a very strong policy influence from people within Government to consider what procedures were in place and whether they were sufficient. There was a very strong medical input from people in the field of public

wrthblaid bod angen inni ymchwilio i ba un a weithredwyd bob un ohonynt. Heddiw, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn uno yn hyn o beth ac y gwelir bod y Cynulliad yn uno i ddatgan bod hyn yn fater o bryder mawr yng Nghymru, a'n bod yn pryderu ac yn awyddus i gael atebion.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Cytunaf â sylwadau arweinydd yr wrthblaid, sy'n datgan y dylai'r ymchwiliad hwn fod yn ymchwiliad cyhoeddus ac yn un sy'n ennyn hyder ym meddyliau teuluoedd, ac yn bennaf ym meddyliau rhieni'r plant yr effeithiwyd arnynt gan y math dychrynllyd hwn o wenwyn bwyd. Byddai unrhyw ymgais i gyfyngu hyn i ymchwiliad gan y Llywodraeth yn unig yn y lle cyntaf yn cyfyngu ar rôl yr ymchwiliad, ond yn ail, ni fyddai'n argyhoeddi'r rhieni mai lles eu teuluoedd a'u plant sydd wrth ei wraidd. Bydd ymchwiliad agored ac annibynnol, ag iddo gylch gwaith eang, yn ennyn hyder, a gobeithio bod hynny yn rhywbeth y gallwn i gyd gytuno arno. Gall gwenwyn bwyd—E.coli a heintiau eraill sy'n deillio o factoria—fod yn ddifrifol iawn ac, mewn rhai achosion, yn angheuol, yn arbennig i blant bach sy'n fwy agored i heintiau o'r fath, ac sydd hefyd yn dangos effeithiau annymunol iawn yr heintiau hyn. Fel un a fu mewn ysbyty am wythnos gyfan yn 1993 gyda gwenwyn bwyd salmonela, gallaf yn sicr gydymdeimlo â'r plant sydd wedi eu heintio gan y bacteria E.coli. Mae'n brofiad annymunol iawn, ac ni allaf ond dychmygu'r hyn sy'n mynd drwy feddyliau rhieni'r plant hynny wrth eu gweld yn dioddef.

Rhaid inni gychwyn gyda'r rhagdybiaeth mai iechyd a lles plant bach yw'r elfen bwysicaf un yn ein dadl, a rhaid i gylch gorchwyl unrhyw ymchwiliad ddangos ehangder yn ei gylch gwaith a dyfnder yn ei ystyriaethau gwyddonol a gweithdrefnol. Ar ôl edrych ar ymchwiliad Pennington, ac yn benodol ar y bobl a roddodd gyngor ar ymchwiliad hwnnw, yr oedd yn amlwg o'r dechrau bod dylanwad polisi cryf gan bobl oedd yn rhan o'r Llywodraeth i ystyried pa weithdrefnau oedd ar waith a pha un a oeddent yn ddigonol. Cafwyd cyfraniad meddygol cryf gan bobl ym maes iechyd y cyhoedd, a oedd yn chwarae rhan amlwg yn y gwaith o

health, who had a strong role in developing policies to protect public health. We must ensure that we draw upon all that experience and expertise in Wales to get the fullest possible inquiry.

According to the National Public Health Service for Wales, the authorities knew about the existence of the E.coli outbreak on the Sunday, but many parents, oblivious to this fact by their own admission, sent their children to school on the Monday. We need to examine the procedures that are in place to convey information to parents when the authorities become aware of the existence of this sort of bacterial infection.

We have to look at the role of the school and the school staff, who could be utilised on such occasions to ensure that parents are given the fullest possible information. I can fully sympathise with those parents who were extremely concerned at having been put in a situation whereby they were sending their children to school without knowing the full facts. I hope that the issue of communication and the procedures in place will form part of any inquiry that is undertaken.

We have raised the issue of whether a school should close in such circumstances, and the Government has said that its scientific advice suggested that a school was a controlled environment. In fact, in its briefing note, the national public health service says that contact with other people is, obviously, one way in which the bacteria can be passed on, but that all teachers and pupils—bearing in mind that we are talking about primary school pupils—were advised on good personal hygiene. I am not a parent, but anyone who has visited primary schools will know that in trying to lecture primary school pupils on good personal hygiene, you are not necessarily talking to pupils who may fully understand the ramifications of washing their hands. I am not absolutely convinced at this stage that keeping a school open is the best way of controlling a bacterial infection of this sort. Therefore I ask that, in terms of the inquiry's remit, this issue is part of our consideration.

In terms of the source of the infection, are we certain that this company in Bridgend is the

ddatblygu polisiau i ddiogelu iechyd y cyhoedd. Rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn defnyddio'r holl brofiad a'r arbenigedd hynny yng Nghymru er mwyn cael yr ymchwiliad llawnaf posibl.

Yn ôl Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cenedlaethol Cymru, gwyddai'r awdurdodau am fodolaeth yr haint E.coli ar y dydd Sul, ond, anfonodd llawer o rieni eu plant i'r ysgol ar y dydd Llun, gan nad oeddent, meddant hwy, yn ymwybodol o hynny. Rhaid inni ystyried y gweithdrefnau sydd ar waith i gyfleu gwybodaeth i rieni pan ddaw'r awdurdodau yn ymwybodol o fodolaeth y math hwn o haint bacterol.

Rhaid inni edrych ar rôl yr ysgol a staff yr ysgol. Gellid eu defnyddio ar achlysuron fel hyn i sicrhau y caiff y rhieni'r wybodaeth lawnaf posibl. Gallaf gydymdeimlo'n llwyr â'r rhieni hynny a oedd yn bryderus iawn eu bod wedi cael eu rhoi mewn sefyllfa lle roeddent yn anfon eu plant i'r ysgol heb fod yn ymwybodol o'r holl ffeithiau. Gobeithio y bydd cyfathrebu a'r gweithdrefnau sydd ar waith yn rhan o unrhyw ymchwiliad a gynhelir.

Yr ydym wedi trafod y mater pa un a ddylid cau ysgol mewn amgylchiadau o'r fath, a dywedodd y Llywodraeth fod ei chyngor gwyddonol yn awgrymu fod ysgol yn amgylchedd a reolir. Yn wir, yn ei nodyn briffio, dywed y gwasanaeth iechyd cyhoeddus cenedlaethol bod cysylltiad â phobl eraill, yn amlwg, yn un ffordd o drosglwyddo'r bacteria, ond bod pob athro a disgybl—a chofiwch mai disgyblion ysgol gynradd sydd dan sylw—wedi cael cyngor ar hylendid personol da. Nid wyf yn rhiant, ond bydd unrhyw un sydd wedi ymweld ag ysgolion cynradd yn gwybod, pan fyddwch yn ceisio rhoi darlith ar hylendid personol da i ddisgyblion ysgol gynradd, nad ydych o anghenraig yn siarad â disgyblion a fydd yn deall yn llwyr oblygiadau golchi eu dwylo. Nid wyf yn gwbl argyhoedddegig ar hyn o bryd mai cadw ysgol ar agor yw'r ffordd orau o reoli haint bacterol o'r math hwn. Gofynnaf felly, o ran cylch gwaith yr ymchwiliad, i'r mater hwn fod yn rhan o'n hystyriaethau.

O ran ffynhonnell yr haint, a ydym yn sicr mai'r cwmni hwn ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr

only source? Are we certain that this was Welsh meat or imported meat? We do not know exactly what the source was, and from where the meat originated. What is the role of local authorities in examining school premises in terms of kitchen cleanliness and storage facilities? All of that must be considered as part of an inquiry.

The role of our chief medical officer is important. We have an acting Chief Medical Officer for Wales who should play a full role in these sorts of proceedings, as the Chief Medical Officer for Scotland did. Therefore, I hope that the acting CMO in Wales, along with other officials who have a key role in public health, will have a part to play in this inquiry. We must get this right, for if we do not, then we will have some answering to do if this occurs in the future.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I do not want to repeat anything that has already been said; I asked to contribute because of the case of E.coli that was announced yesterday in Stanwell Comprehensive School in Penarth; it was reported in the press yesterday. Minister, can you offer some sort of reassurance for parents and the families of children outside of the areas that were first affected that this is an isolated case and that it is not spreading to other schools? The Vale of Glamorgan Council has written to the parents of children in Stanwell school to say that the case is not linked to the school. So, I am just looking for reassurance for parents in the Vale of Glamorgan.

Leighton touched on how the media has a responsibility in how it reports these matters. While it is important that people are aware of the issues, the dangers and what they should be doing to protect themselves, we do not want to scaremonger.

**Jenny Randerson:** I will concentrate on the issue of the nature of the public inquiry, but I preface that by reiterating that this is a very serious outbreak. It is characterised by a wide geographical spread. A couple of days ago, we were on the verge of this becoming more deeply rooted in the community at large

yw'r unig ffynhonnell? A ydym yn sicr mai cig o Gymru oedd hwn, ynteu gig o dramor ydoedd? Ni wyddom yn bendant beth oedd y ffynhonnell, nag o ble y daeth y cig. Beth yw rôl yr awdurdodau lleol mewn archwilio adeiladau ysgolion mewn cysylltiad â glanweithdra ceginau a chyfleusterau storio? Rhaid ystyried hynny fel rhan o'r ymchwiliad.

Mae rôl ein prif swyddog meddygol yn bwysig. Mae gennym Brif Swyddog Meddygol yng Nghymru a ddylai chwarae rhan lawn yn y math yma o achos, fel y gwnaeth Prif Swyddog Meddygol yr Alban. Felly, gobeithio y bydd Prif Swyddog Meddygol dros dro Cymru, ynghyd â swyddogion eraill sy'n chwarae rhan allweddol ym maes iechyd y cyhoedd, yn cymryd rhan yn yr ymchwiliad hwn. Rhaid inni gael hyn yn gywir, oherwydd os na lwyddwn, bydd gennym gwestiynau i'w hateb os digwydd hyn eto yn y dyfodol.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Nid wyf am ailadrodd unrhyw beth a ddywedwyd eisoes; gwneuthum gais i gyfrannu oherwydd yr achos o E.coli a gyhoeddwyd ddoe yn Ysgol Gyfun Stanwell ym Mhenarth; cafodd sylw yn y wasg ddoe. Weinidog, a allwch gynnig rhyw fath o sicrwydd i rieni a theuluoedd plant sy'n byw y tu allan i'r ardaloedd yr effeithiwyd arnynt mai achos unigol yw hwn ac nad yw'n ymledu i ysgolion eraill? Mae Cyngor Bro Morgannwg wedi ysgrifennu at rieni plant ysgol Stanwell i ddweud nad yw'r achos yn gysylltiedig â'r ysgol. Felly, yr wyf yn chwilio am sicrwydd i rieni ym Mro Morgannwg.

Cyfeiriodd Leighton at y cyfrifoldeb sydd gan y cyfryngau o ran y ffordd y maent yn rhoi sylw i'r materion hyn. Er ei bod yn bwysig bod pobl yn ymwybodol o'r problemau, y peryglon a'r hyn y dylent ei wneud i ddiogelu eu hunain, nid ydym am godi bwganod.

**Jenny Randerson:** Canolbwytiaf ar natur yr ymchwiliad cyhoeddus, ond cyn hynny hoffwn ategu bod hwn yn achos difrifol iawn. Caiff ei nodweddu gan ledaeniad daearyddol eang. Ddiwrnod neu ddau yn ôl, yr oedd hyn ar fin dod yn rhywbeth a oedd wedi ei wreiddio'n ddwfn yn y gymuned gyfan yn

rather than simply being something that people had caught from the meat that they ate in school. We must reflect on the fact that the impact in terms of mortality would have been very serious if, for instance, it had affected old people in elderly people's homes. The seriousness of the issue is without doubt.

4.10 p.m.

Yesterday, when I questioned the Minister, he set out a number of reasons why it would be difficult to hold the inquiry in public, and these were reasons associated with the courts and legal proceedings. However, when I asked him what he meant by using, in his written statement, the terms 'open' and 'transparent' in the context of the inquiry, he dodged the question as to whether that meant a public inquiry. I therefore conclude that it was not, at that point, his intention to hold the inquiry in public. I believe that holding the inquiry in public is vital to public confidence.

We need to lift this issue beyond party politics, onto a cross-party consensus platform, to avoid any potential criticism that there has been political spin or a possible cover-up. The inquiry has to be as open as possible, and involving a cross-party committee in establishing it would do much to achieve that, as would hearing all the evidence in public. The Pennington inquiry in Scotland was criticised for not doing that, and although it produced useful and important recommendations, there is still a view that it should have been held in public. Hearing the evidence in public will not necessarily cost more—I cannot envisage what additional costs you would have.

**Janice Gregory:** While I understand your desire for the inquiry to be held in public, and I will not argue with you on that, due to the nature of the E.coli outbreak, how do you see young people being able to give evidence on personal issues—I do not think that we need to go into them here, but I am sure that you understand what I mean—when they would have to give that evidence in public? Do you

hytrach na rhywbeth yr oedd pobl wedi ei gael oddi wrth y cig a fwytawyd ganddynt yn yr ysgol. Rhaid inni ystyried y ffaith y byddai'r effaith o ran marwolaethau wedi bod yn ddifrifol iawn pe bai, er enghraifft, wedi effeithio ar bobl hŷn mewn cartrefi henoed. Nid oes amheuaeth bod y mater yn un difrifol.

Ddoe, pan holais y Gweinidog, nododd sawl rheswm pam y byddai'n anodd cynnal ymchwiliad cyhoeddus, ac yr oedd y rhesymau hyn yn gysylltiedig â'r llysoedd ac achosion cyfreithiol. Fodd bynnag, pan ofynnais iddo beth a olygai, wrth ddefnyddio'r geriau 'agored' a 'thryloyw' yn ei ddatganiad ysgrifenedig, yng nghyd-destun yr ymchwiliad, bu iddo osgoi'r cwestiwn ynghylch a oedd hynny'n golygu ymchwiliad cyhoeddus. Felly dof i'r casgliad nad oedd yn fwriad ganddo, yr adeg honno, i gynnal ymchwiliad cyhoeddus. Credaf fod cynnal ymchwiliad cyhoeddus yn hanfodol o ran hyder y cyhoedd.

Rhaid inni godi'r mater hwn uwchlaw gwleidyddiaeth plaid, i sicrhau consensws trawsbleidiol, er mwyn osgoi unrhyw feirniadaeth bosibl o sbini gwleidyddol neu ymgais bosibl i guddio'r gwirionedd. Rhaid i'r ymchwiliad fod mor agored â phosibl, a byddai cynnwys pwylgor trawsbleidiol yn y broses o'i sefydlu o gymorth mawr i gyflawni hynny, yn ogystal â chlywed yr holl dystiolaeth yn gyhoeddus. Beirniadwyd ymchwiliad Pennington yn yr Alban am beidio â gwneud hynny, ac er iddo gynhyrchu argymhellion defnyddiol a phwysig, mae rhai yn parhau i gredu y dylai fod wedi cael ei gynnal yn gyhoeddus. Ni fydd clywed y dystiolaeth yn gyhoeddus yn fwy costus o anghenraig—ni allaf ragweld pa gostau ychwanegol a ddeuai i'ch rhan.

**Janice Gregory:** Er fy mod yn deall eich awydd i gynnal ymchwiliad cyhoeddus, ac nid anghytunaf â chi ynglŷn â hynny, oherwydd natur yr achosion o E.coli, sut, yn eich barn chi y byddai pobl ifanc yn gallu rhoi dystiolaeth am faterion personol—ni chredaf fod angen inni fanylu arnynt yma, ond yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn deall yr hyn sydd gennyl dan sylw—pan fyddai angen

not accept that part of the inquiry should be held in private?

**Jenny Randerson:** I do not think that it would be necessary for young people to give evidence in public. We have well-used processes here for young people to give evidence, and I cannot think of a better organisation for showing sensitivity if it were necessary for a young person to give evidence. However, I think that the evidence will come from officials, teachers and parents rather than from young children.

We appreciate that there is an issue concerning legal problems and there should not be an impact on the legal process. It is also important that we are able to compel witnesses to attend. I do not anticipate that this ability would be important, but one can never foresee that there will not be a witness who would not be prepared to come forward.

On the scope of the inquiry, it needs to look at the speed and method by which the source of the outbreak was identified, and the efficiency of the methods of spreading information. It appears that despite the publicity on this outbreak being linked to a firm in Bridgend, the latest information that I have is that a direct link has not been found. Therefore, there will undoubtedly be issues associated with that. The inquiry should also look at the resources of environmental health departments in local authorities, although it appears that the new Liberal Democrat-led council in Bridgend has greatly increased the budget of that department, so that may not be an issue, but it is certainly an issue in other parts of Wales.

Was it the right decision, as Jonathan said, to encourage parents to continue to send their children to school? It may or may not have been. There may be other lessons to be learnt about the letting of contracts for school meals. With our emphasis on good-quality school food, that is a perfectly legitimate aspect to be looked at. The inquiry needs to be wide enough in scope to deal with all

iddynt roi'r dystiolaeth honno yn gyhoeddus? Onid ydych yn derbyn y dylid cynnal rhan o'r ymchwiliad yn breifat?

**Jenny Randerson:** Ni chredaf y byddai angen i bobl ifanc roi dystiolaeth yn gyhoeddus. Mae gennym brosesau cyfarwydd yma i bobl ifanc roi dystiolaeth, ac ni allaf feddwl am well sefydliad i ddangos sensitifrwydd pe bai angen i berson ifanc roi dystiolaeth. Fodd bynnag, credaf y daw'r dystiolaeth gan swyddogion, athrawon a rhieni yn hytrach na phlant ifanc.

Gwerthfawrogwn y ffaith bod problem yn ymwneud â thrafferthion cyfreithiol ac na ddylid effeithio ar y broses gyfreithiol. Mae hefyd yn bwysig inni allu gorfodi tystion i fod yn bresennol. Ni ragwelaf y byddai'r gallu hwn yn bwysig, ond ni ellir rhagweld na fydd tyst na fyddai'n fodlon rhoi dystiolaeth.

O ran cwmpas yr ymchwiliad, mae angen iddo edrych ar ba mor gyflym y daethpwyd o hyd i ffynhonnell yr achos a sut y daethpwyd o hyd iddo, ac effeithiolrwydd y dulliau a ddefnyddiwyd i ledaenu gwybodaeth. Ymddengys, er gwaethaf y cyhoeddusrwydd bod yr achos hwn yn gysylltiedig â chwmni ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, bod y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf sydd gennyl yn nodi nad oes cysylltiad uniongyrchol wedi ei ganfod. Felly mae'n amlwg y bydd problemau yn gysylltiedig â hynny. Dylai'r ymchwiliad hefyd edrych ar yr adnoddau sydd ar gael i adrannau iechyd yr amgylchedd mewn awdurdodau lleol, er ei bod yn ymddangos bod y cyngor newydd dan arweiniad y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr wedi cynyddu cyllideb yr adran honno yn sylweddol felly efallai nad yw hynny'n broblem, ond mae'n sicr yn broblem mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru.

Ai'r penderfyniad cywir, fel y dywedodd Jonathan, oedd annog rhieni i barhau i anfon eu plant i'r ysgol? Pwy a wyr. Efallai bod gwensi eraill i'w dysgu am osod contractau ar gyfer prydau ysgol. Gyda'r pwyslais ar fwyd ysgol o ansawdd da, mae'n gwbl ddilys ystyried yr agwedd honno. Rhaid i'r ymchwiliad fod yn ddigon eang ei chwmpas i fynd i'r afael â'r holl faterion hyn ac eraill

these issues and with others that I have not touched on. It needs, above all, to engage public confidence, and we need cross-party will to ensure that the recommendations are implemented.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** As the Assembly Member for the Caerphilly constituency, I have been watching the E.coli outbreak with concern. Four of the 32 Valleys schools affected by the outbreak are within my constituency, and the latest update that I received this morning from a Caerphilly environmental health manager is that, of the 13 cases in the Caerphilly borough, 10 have been confirmed as E.coli. Thankfully, these people are all receiving the best possible medical care, and the national public health service informs us that new cases are now declining and that control measures are already in place.

At this time, our thoughts must clearly be with the families involved in this outbreak. I am informed by public health officials that strong control measures are now in place, and their investigations into the outbreak will include the Caerphilly constituency. I have been impressed by the conduct and response of the outbreak control team so far. The team, comprising the national public health service and officers of affected local authorities and local health boards, has been working exceptionally long hours to bring this outbreak under control. It is worth pointing out that the outbreak control team began its central co-ordinating role on the same day—Friday, 16 September—as the first cases were reported. I share the concerns that others have expressed about the issue of timing, particularly with regard to the media's role. One school in my constituency, Cwrt Rawlin Primary School, had a case identified last Saturday, which was then announced in the media on the Sunday, before the headteacher had an opportunity to explain exactly what was happening to parents on the Monday morning. That type of approach is not necessarily always helpful.

I welcome the commitment by the First Minister and the Minister for Health and Social Services to an independent and open inquiry into this outbreak. It is vital that lessons are learned from this episode. The

nad wyf wedi ymdrin â hwy. Yn anad dim, mae angen iddo ennyn hyder y cyhoedd, ac mae angen ewyllys trawsbleidiol arnom i sicrhau y caiff yr argymhellion eu gweithredu.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Fel Aelod y Cynulliad dros etholaeth Caerffili, bûm yn gwyllo'r achosion o E.coli gyda phryder. Mae pedair o'r 32 o ysgolion yn y Cymoedd yr effeithiwyd arnynt gan yr achosion yn fy etholaeth i, a'r newyddion diweddaraf a gefais y bore yma gan reolwr iechyd yr amgylchedd yng Nghaerffili yw bod 10, o'r 13 o achosion ym mwrdeistref Caerffili, wedi eu cadarnhau fel achosion o E.coli. Diolch i'r drefn, mae'r bobl hyn oll yn cael y gofal meddygol gorau posibl, ac mae'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cenedlaethol yn ein hysbysu bod nifer yr achosion newydd yn gostwng erbyn hyn a bod mesurau rheoli eisoes ar waith.

Ar hyn o bryd, rhaid inni feddwl am y teuluoedd dan sylw yn yr achosion hyn. Cefais fy hysbysu gan swyddogion iechyd y cyhoedd bod mesurau rheoli cryf ar waith bellach, ac y bydd eu hymchwiliadau i'r achosion yn cynnwys etholaeth Caerffili. Mae ymddygiad ac ymateb y tîm rheoli achosion hyd yma wedi creu argraff arnaf. Mae'r tîm, sy'n cynnwys y Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cenedlaethol a swyddogion awdurdodau lleol a byrddau iechyd lleol yr effeithiwyd arnynt, wedi bod yn gweithio oriau eithriadol o hir i reoli'r achosion hyn. Mae'n werth nodi i'r tîm rheoli achosion ddechrau ar ei rôl gydlyn u ganolog ar yr un diwrnod—dydd Gwener, 16 Medi—ag y cofnodwyd yr achosion cyntaf. Rhannaf y pryderon a leisiwyd gan eraill ynghylch amseru, yn arbennig mewn perthynas â rôl y cyfryngau. Nodwyd achos mewn un ysgol yn fy etholaeth, Ysgol Gynradd Cwrt Rawlin, ddydd Sadwrn diwethaf, ac fe'i cyhoeddwyd yn y cyfryngau ar y dydd Sul, cyn i'r pennath gael cyfle i esbonio yn union beth oedd yn digwydd i rieni fore Llun. Nid yw'r math hwnnw o ymagwedd o anghenrajd yn ddefnyddiol bob tro.

Croesawaf yr ymrwymiad gan y Prif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus i gynnal ymchwiliad annibynnol ac agored i'r achosion hyn. Mae'n hanfodol y caiff gwersi

investigation should ensure that strong lessons are learned so that such an outbreak can never happen again. This outbreak is, thankfully, not on the scale of the outbreak in Scotland in 1996, in which, tragically, 18 people died from E.coli. I believe that it is sensible to allow current investigations being conducted by the national public health service to conclude before any formal decision is taken on whether to hold a full public inquiry.

I am informed that detailed interviews by the national public health service are already taking place with a number of the families of the 122 cases. These interviews must be allowed to take their logical course, and people with the infection must be allowed to recover in their own time, and only be interviewed when they are well enough. The national public health service is the expert agency in this field. It would be wrong to interfere with its response by calling for a public inquiry at this early stage. It is in the best position to decide the next steps and, of course, when its detailed reports are made public, I am sure that a public debate will then follow on what the Assembly's next steps should be. If it is then shown that a public inquiry is appropriate, then so be it. We need at this moment to give our support and assistance to the outbreak control team and the families at the centre of this outbreak. It is vital that all resources and public support go towards enabling the public health response to be the best that it can be, especially as the outbreak still needs to be taken to a controlled end. When it comes to that end, then will be the time to ensure that a full and transparent investigation takes place that guarantees that strong lessons are learned so that such an outbreak can never happen again.

Such an investigation needs to look at all areas of public health, especially the rules governing food procurement by local authorities and local education authorities. The food that enters our schools must be of the highest quality, and any investigation must look at hazard analysis, critical control point systems, and practices and hygiene standards in slaughterhouses and meat

eu dysgu o'r digwyddiad hwn. Dylai'r ymchwiliad sicrhau y caiff gwersi cadarn eu dysgu fel na fydd achosion o'r fath byth yn digwydd eto. Yn ffodus, nid yw'r achosion hyn ar yr un raddfa a'r achosion yn yr Alban yn 1996, pan fu farw 18 o bobl o E.coli. Credaf ei bod yn synhwyrol caniatáu i'r ymchwiliadau presennol sy'n cael eu cynnal gan y Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cenedlaethol gael eu cwblhau cyn gwneud unrhyw benderfyniad ffurfiol ar ba un a ddylid cynnal ymchwiliad cyhoeddus llawn.

Cefais fy hysbysu bod y Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cenedlaethol eisoes yn cynnal cyfweliadau manwl gyda nifer o'r teuluoedd yn y 122 o achosion. Rhaid caniatáu i'r cyfweliadau hyn ddilyn eu trywydd rhesymegol, a rhaid galluogi'r bobl a'r haint i wella yn eu hamser eu hunain, gan aros iddynt wella'n ddigonol cyn cael eu cyfweld. Y Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cenedlaethol yw'r asiantaeth arbenigol yn y maes hwn. Ni ddylem ymyrryd a'i ymateb drwy alw am ymchwiliad cyhoeddus ar y cam cynnar hwn. Y Gwasanaeth sydd yn y sefyllfa orau i benderfynu ar y camau nesaf ac, wrth gwrs, pan gyhoeddir ei adroddiadau manwl, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd trafodaeth gyhoeddus yn dilyn ar ba gamau y dylai'r Cynulliad eu cymryd nesaf. Yna, os gwelir bod ymchwiliad cyhoeddus yn briodol, dyna fydd yn digwydd. Ar hyn o bryd, mae angen inni gefnogi a chynorthwyo'r tîm rheoli achosion a'r teuluoedd sydd yn eu canol. Mae'n hanfodol bod yr holl adnoddau a chymorth cyhoeddus yn cael eu defnyddio i sicrhau bod ymateb iechyd y cyhoedd crystal ag y gall fod, yn enwedig gan fod angen dirwyn yr achosion i ben a hynny dan reolaeth. Pan ddont i ben, dyna fydd yr adeg i sicrhau y caiff ymchwiliad llawn a thryloyw ei gynnwl sy'n sicrhau y caiff gwersi cryf eu dysgu fel na all achosion o'r fath byth ddigwydd eto.

Mae angen i ymchwiliad o'r fath edrych ar bob maes o iechyd y cyhoedd, yn enwedig y rheolau sy'n llywodraethu prosesau caffael bwyd awdurdodau lleol ac awdurdodau addysg lleol. Rhaid i'r bwyd sy'n mynd i'n hysgolion fod o'r ansawdd uchaf, a rhaid i unrhyw ymchwiliad edrych ar ddadansoddiad peryglon, systemau pwyt rheoli critigol, ac arferion a safonau hylendid mewn lladd-dai

production premises. It should review food hygiene at the point of consumption and look at how environmental health officers can be better helped by stronger enforcement powers and surveillance.

4.20 p.m.

Any investigation must also look at how well our existing arrangements worked at handling the outbreak. I agree with Leighton Andrews that anyone who is shown to have done wrong, or not to have done what they should have done, should be brought to account. At the same time, we also want to ensure that there are no scapegoats.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You have had five minutes. If you are reading the speech out, you should try to practise first, to see that it is lasts less than five minutes.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** I did that but, in the spirit of debate, I tried to modify it in the light of points made by other speakers, which is meant to be—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Do finish.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** All these issues need to be considered in detail, but we would be wise to enable the outbreak control team to collect its evidence before an Assembly independent investigation begins in earnest.

**William Graham:** I urge the Minister to reconsider and to hold a proper public inquiry. You must realise that it is necessary to restore confidence, not just in the education system, but also in the fate of many jobs in the industry itself.

I am told that there are two levels of inspection. The main level of inspection is where there is an EU registration. Firms with such registration must have a regular inspection, including an inspection by a veterinary surgeon. However, in firms where only processing takes place, the level of inspection is regulated by local authorities. It is less frequent, and we must therefore rely on the integrity of the producer at every stage.

ac adeiladau cynhyrchu cig. Dylai adolygu hylendid bwyd yn y man y caiff ei fwyta ac edrych ar sut y gellir rhoi mwy o gymorth i swyddogion iechyd yr amgylchedd drwy bwerau gorfodi a goruchwyllo cryfach.

Rhaid i unrhyw ymchwiliad hefyd edrych ar ba mor dda y bu i'n trefniadau presennol weithio wrth ymdrin â'r achosion. Cytunaf â Leighton Andrews y dylid dwyn unrhyw un sydd wedi gwneud camgymeriad, neu nad ydynt wedi gwneud yr hyn y dylent ei wneud, i gyfrif. Ar yr un pryd, yr wyf hefyd am sicrhau na chaiff pobl eu defnyddio fel bwch dihangol.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Yr ydych wedi cael pum munud. Os ydych yn darllen yr arraith, dylech ymarfer i ddechrau, er mwyn sicrhau ei bod yn parhau am lai na phum munud.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Gwneuthum hynny ond, yn ysbryd y drafodaeth, ceisiais ei haddasu o ystyried y pwyntiau a wnaed gan siaradwyr eraill, sydd i fod yn—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** A wnewch orffen?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Mae angen ystyried yr holl faterion hyn yn fanwl, ond byddai'n ddoeth inni alluogi'r tîm rheoli achosion i gasglu ei dystiolaeth cyn i'r Cynulliad ddechrau ymchwiliad annibynnol o ddifrif.

**William Graham:** Pwysaf ar y Gweinidog i ailystyried a chynnal ymchwiliad cyhoeddus priodol. Rhaid ichi sylweddoli bod angen adfer hyder, nid yn unig yn y system addysg, ond hefyd yn nhygded llawer o swyddi yn y diwydiant ei hun.

Dyweddwyd wrthyf bod dau archwiliad. Y prif archwiliad yw pan fydd cofrestriad UE. Rhaid i gwmniau gyda chofrestriad o'r fath gael eu harchwilio'n rheolaidd, yn cynnwys archwiliad gan lawfeddyg milfeddygol. Fodd bynnag, mewn cwmniau sy'n prosesu yn unig, awdurdodau lleol sy'n rheoleiddio'r archwiliad. Cynhelir y rhain yn llai aml, ac felly rhaid inni ddibynnu ar onestrwydd y cynhyrchydd yn ystod pob cam.

We also request that you look more closely at some of the information to education authorities. Anyone who has dealt with small children will know that it is often a problem to contain infection within the home, and prevent cross-infection to other family members. I urge the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning and the Minister for Health and Social Services to ensure early action for closure in schools with nursery or special needs provision. We wish to ensure that no further infection takes place at the earliest possible opportunity.

As other speakers have indicated, we pay particular tribute to the public health officers who have contained this infection particularly well. Public confidence now needs to be restored, and I urge the Minister to agree that the inquiry takes place in public.

**Christine Chapman:** My thoughts also go to those affected. The outbreak has been played out in the media, which has been traumatic for many people. There are lessons to be learnt, with which I hope the inquiry will deal, but I will put on record some experiences from my constituency.

Having spoken to every school affected in my constituency—of which there were many, initially—they said that the response from the local authority has been very good. It has ensured that the schools have had additional, thorough cleaning over the weekend, and that parents have been kept informed. Schools and teachers have also acted responsibly in dealing with the crisis, in keeping with the swift and calm action of local authorities and the outbreak control team.

On the inquiry's scope and remit, it is crucial that it looks at how we can identify how far and among which sectors the outbreak could potentially have spread. That is important, not just in terms of this situation, but in order that we learn about the scale of what could possibly happen again in the future, so that it can be prevented. We need to know how quickly we would be able to determine the scale of an outbreak once a supplier has been identified.

Gofynnwn hefyd ichi edrych yn fanylach ar rywfaint o'r wybodaeth i awdurdodau addysg. Bydd unrhyw un sydd wedi delio â phlant bach yn gwybod bod problem yn aml o ran cadw'r haint o fewn y cartref, ac atal traws-heintio i aelodau eraill y teulu. Anogaf y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes a'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus i sicrhau y cymerir camau cynnar i gau ysgolion gyda darpariaeth meithrinfa neu ddarpariaeth anghenion arbennig. Yr ydym am sicrhau na fydd rhagor o heintio yn digwydd, a hynny cyn gynted â phosibl.

Fel y dywedodd siaradwyr eraill, hoffem ddiolch yn arbennig i swyddogion iechyd y cyhoedd sydd wedi cadw rheolaeth ar yr haint hwn yn arbennig o dda. Mae angen adfer hyder y cyhoedd bellach, ac anogaf y Gweinidog i gytuno y dylid cynnal yr ymchwiliad yn gyhoeddus.

**Christine Chapman:** Hoffwn innau hefyd gydymdeimlo â'r rhai yr effeithiwyd arnynt hefyd. Rhoddyd llawer o sylw i'r achosion yn y cyfryngau, sydd wedi peri loes i lawer o bobl. Mae gwensi i'w dysgu, a gobeithio y bydd yr ymchwiliad yn ymdrin â'r rhain, ond hoffwn gofnodi rhai o'r profiadau o'm hetholaeth i.

Ar ôl siarad â phob ysgol yr effeithiwyd arni yn fy etholaeth—ac yr oedd llawer ohonynt, i ddechrau—bu iddynt ddweud bod yr ymateb gan yr awdurdod lleol wedi bod yn dda iawn. Mae wedi sicrhau bod yr ysgolion yn cael eu glanhau'n drylwyr dros y penwythnos, a bod rhieni'n cael y newyddion diweddaraf. Mae'r ysgolion a'r athrawon hefyd wedi gweithredu mewn modd cyfrifol wrth ymdrin â'r argyfwng, gan ddilyn camau cyflym a digynnwr yr awdurdodau lleol a'r tîm rheoli achosion.

O ran cwmpas a chylch gwaith yr ymchwiliad, mae'n hanfodol ei fod yn edrych ar sut y gallwn nodi i ba raddau y gallai'r achosion fod wedi lledaenu ac ymysg pa sectorau. Mae hynny'n bwysig, nid o ran y sefyllfa hon yn unig, ond hefyd er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn dysgu am raddau'r hyn a allai ddigwydd eto yn y dyfodol, er mwyn ei atal. Mae angen inni wybod pa mor gyflym y gallem bennu nifer yr achosion unwaith y bydd cyflenwr wedi'i nodi.

Like other speakers, I welcome the announcement of an open, transparent and thorough inquiry. It must be an inquiry in which people have trust, or otherwise it will not work. We must have the right experts involved, and it must also include people such as parents, who have been involved at the front-line level. In my constituency, I am pleased to report that a number of children who were seriously ill—I know of one little boy in particular—are now on the mend, so we are all pleased about that. Nevertheless, we must do everything possible to minimise the chance of a repeat of these circumstances.

**Nick Bourne:** I will make my contribution brief, as I know that time is scarce. I once again state my sympathy for the family and friends of those who have been affected. As has been stated, this is by far the most serious outbreak of E.coli that we have had in Wales and that alone justifies the holding of this public inquiry; we have passed a motion today that indicates, as far as I am concerned, that that has to be a public inquiry; nothing else will suffice.

Dreadful though this is, and Jenny Randerson stated this, if this had affected an old people's home, it would have been even more serious. Young people are vulnerable but old people are more vulnerable still.

I will focus on the media's role, which has been alluded to, and it is important that there is responsible media reporting of these issues. The inquiry should also look at the role of education in terms of ensuring that messages regarding hygiene get across at an early stage. Other people have mentioned the importance of possibly ensuring that we do not send children to schools where there is an outbreak. I hope that the inquiry will look at that.

I thank the Minister for Health and Social Services for moving on this. It is important that we go forward as a whole Assembly on such a serious issue and that we get the feedback and learn the lessons quickly to stop this happening again, because, as I say, dreadful though it is, it could have been that

Fel siaradwyr eraill, croesawaf y cyhoeddiad y bwriedir cynnal ymchwiliad agored, tryloyw a thrylwyr. Rhaid iddo fod yn ymchwiliad y mae pobl yn ymddiried ynddo, neu ni fydd yn gweithio. Rhaid inni gynnwys yr arbenigwyr cywir, a rhaid ido hefyd gynnwys pobl fel rhieni, sydd wedi bod yn y rheng flaen. Yn fy etholaeth i, mae'n bleser gennyl nodi bod nifer o blant a fu'n ddifrifol wael—gwn am un bachgen bach yn benodol—bellach yn gwella bellach, felly mae pawb ohonom yn falch o hynny. Er hynny, rhaid inni wneud popeth posibl i leihau i'r eithaf y posibilwydd y bydd yr amgylchiadau hyn yn digwydd eto.

**Nick Bourne:** Bydd fy nghyfraniad yn fyr, oherwydd gwn fod amser yn brin. Unwaith eto hoffwn gydymdeimlo â theulu a ffrindiau'r rhai yr effeithiwyd arnynt. Fel y nodwyd, dyma'r achosion mwyaf difrifol o E.coli a welwyd yng Nghymru ac mae hyn ynddo'i hun yn cyflawnhau cynnal yr ymchwiliad cyhoeddus hwn; yr ydym wedi derbyn cynnig heddiw sy'n nodi, o'm safbwyt i, bod yn rhaid i'r ymchwiliad fod yn un cyhoeddus; ni fydd unrhyw beth arall yn ddigon.

Er mor ofnadwy yw hyn, a dywedodd Jenny Randerson hyn, pe byddai hyn wedi effeithio ar gartref henoed, byddai wedi bod yn fwy difrifol byth. Mae pobl ifanc yn fregus, ond mae henoed yn fwy bregus byth.

Canolbwytiaf ar rôl y cyfryngau, y cyfeiriwyd ato, ac mae'n bwysig bod y cyfryngau yn trin y materion hyn mewn modd cyfrifol. Dylai'r ymchwiliad hefyd edrych ar rôl addysg o ran sicrhau bod negeseuon yn ymwneud â hylendid yn cael eu trosglwyddo ar gam cynnar. Mae pobl eraill wedi nodi pwysigrwydd sicrhau nad ydym yn anfon plant i ysgolion lle mae achos o E.coli. Gobeithio y bydd yr ymchwiliad yn edrych ar hynny.

Hoffwn ddiolch i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol am weithredu ar hyn. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn symud ymlaen fel Cynulliad cyfan ar faterion mor ddifrifol a'n bod yn cael yr adborth ac yn dysgu gwersi'n gyflym er mwyn atal hyn rhag digwydd eto, oherwydd, fel y dywedais, er

much worse if it had hit, for example, old people's homes. Therefore, I thank the Government for the movement that it has shown on this issue.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** There is no doubt that this has been a serious and worrying epidemic, not just because it has been the largest outbreak in Wales, but, unfortunately, some children and families have seen how severe this illness can be in terms of the necessity for hospital admission and some of the more extreme complications of the disease. It is probably scant reassurance that no deaths have taken place, but that is how serious the illness that we are dealing with can be.

It is a strength of a devolved democracy that we are able to have this type of open debate and discussion on the best way for us as an Assembly to move this agenda forward. We can discuss why the outbreak took place and what we can do collectively in the Assembly to ensure that the lessons are learned and that it will not happen again.

As colleagues have done, I pay tribute to the work of the outbreak control team, led by Gwen Lowe. The members of the team have spent massive numbers of hours over the last two weeks or so dealing with this outbreak and they have done so with a great sense of professionalism and dedication. They would say that their task was helped in no small measure by our foresight in promoting and delivering a more integrated National Public Health Service in Wales, which allowed the various elements of the team to work more effectively and to deliver the co-ordinated response that was necessary, particularly at the start of the outbreak. I was informed about the outbreak late on Saturday and, at that early stage, the initial reports coming through were disjointed and disparate. It was difficult to make sense of what was happening until Sunday afternoon, when the situation started to take some sort of shape and we were able to understand what was beginning to happen. It was impressive, and the national public health service, environmental health officers and the outbreak control team in general, put a great

mor ofnadwy yw hyn, gallai fod wedi bod yn llawer gwaeth pe bai wedi effeithio ar gartrefi'r henoed er enghraifft. Felly, hoffwn ddiolch i'r Llywodraeth am weithredu fel y gwnaeth ar y mater hwn.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Heb amheuaeth bu hwn yn epidemig difrifol a gofidus, nid yn unig am mai'r rhain oedd y nifer fwyaf o achosion a welwyd yng Nghymru, ond, yn anffodus, mae rhai plant a theuluoedd wedi gweld pa mor ddifrifol y gall y salwch hwn fod o ran yr angen i bobl gael eu derbyn i'r ysbyty a rhai o gymhlethdodau mwy eithafol y clefyd. Nid yw'rffaith na chafwyd unrhyw farwolaethau yn fawr o gysur, ond dyna pa mor ddifrifol y gall y salwch yr ydym yn ymdrin ag ef fod.

Un o gryfderau democratioeth ddatganoledig yw'rffaith y gallwn gynnal dadl a thrafodaeth agored fel hyn ar y ffordd orau i ni fel Cynulliad ddatblygu'r agenda hon. Gallwn drafod pam y digwyddodd yr achosion a beth y gallwn ei wneud gyda'n gilydd yn y Cynulliad i sicrhau bod y gwersi'n cael eu dysgu ac na fydd yn digwydd eto.

Fel y gwnaeth fy nghyd-Aelodau, talaf deyrnsged i waith y tîm rheoli achosion, dan arweiniad Gwen Lowe. Mae aelodau'r tîm wedi treulio oriau maith dros y pythefnos diwethaf yn delio â'r achosion hyn ac maent wedi gwneud hynny yn broffesiynol iawn a chydag ymroddiad mawr. Byddent yn dweud y bu ein rhagwelediad o ran hybu a darparu Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cenedlaethol mwy integredig yng Nghymru o gymorth mawr iddynt, gan ganiatâu i elfennau amrywiol o'r tîm weithio'n fwy effeithiol a darparu'r ymateb cydgysylltiedig yr oedd ei angen, yn enwedig pan ddechreuodd yr achosion. Fe'm hysbyswyd am yr achosion yn hwyr ddydd Sadwrn ac, ar y cam cynnar hwnnw, yr oedd yr adroddiadau cychwynnol yn fratiog ac yn brin. Yr oedd yn anodd gwneud synnwyr o'r hyn oedd yn digwydd tan brynhawn dydd Sul, pan ddechreuodd y sefyllfa ddatblygu ac yr oeddem yn gallu deall beth oedd yn dechrau digwydd. Creodd hyn argraff arnaf, a gweithiodd y Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cenedlaethol, swyddogion iechyd yr amgylchedd a'r tîm rheoli achosion yn gyffredinol yn galed iawn i sicrhau

deal of work into ensuring that that level of understanding developed. We owe them a great debt.

While we must continue to take all the necessary steps, as colleagues—Jeff Cuthbert in particular—have said, to ensure that the current outbreak is brought under full control, it is time to move on to the next phase in terms of understanding what happened and seeing what lessons can be learned.

4.30 p.m.

Following inquiries made by Leighton Andrews and others, I was in a position last Friday to state that, in light of the fact that the peak of the outbreak seemed to be passing, it was appropriate to start considering what type of inquiry needed to take place. I do not know where William Graham was, but, very much from the start, we said that this would be an open, transparent inquiry in which the public would be fully involved, and that no stone would remain unturned in trying to get to the bottom of it. As the First Minister said, no holds would be barred in addressing the particular issues that were raised.

It is also important, in setting up this inquiry, that we learn the lessons as early as possible, so that we do not delay in taking any remedial action or putting any remedial measures in place. Jeff Cuthbert is right; we do not need a knee-jerk reaction just for the sake of being seen to do something. It is equally important that we examine the issues in a considered way, while being able to move judiciously in order to learn the lessons. It will not be satisfactory if we have to wait two or three years to fully learn the lessons from this inquiry. We must consider the nature of the inquiry, but it is equally important that we learn the lessons as early as possible.

**Janice Gregory:** I share your desire, as I am sure the whole Assembly does, for an open and transparent inquiry into this. Do you share my concern that, when a local paper, which was trying to publicise a reasoned response to this dreadful outbreak, particularly in my area, contacted the local authority to get information on when the

datblygiad y lefel honno o ddealltwriaeth. Mae ein dyled yn fawr iddynt.

Er bod angen inni barhau i gymryd yr holl gamau angenrheidiol, fel y dywedodd fy nghyd-Aelodau—Jeff Cuthert yn benodol—i sicrhau y daw'r achosion presennol o dan reolaeth lwyd, mae'n amser i symud at y cam nesaf o ran deall beth ddigwyddodd a gweld pa wersi y gellid eu dysgu.

Yn dilyn ymholiadau gan Leighton Andrews ac eraill, yr oeddwn mewn sefyllfa ddydd Gwener diwethaf i ddatgan, yng ngoleuni'r ffaith ei bod yn ymddangos fod y gwaethaf wedi mynd heibio, ei bod yn briodol dechrau ystyried pa fath o ymchwiliad yr oedd ei angen. Ni wn lle yr oedd William Graham, ond, o'r dechrau, dywedasom y byddai hwn yn ymchwiliad agored, tryloyw y byddai'r cyhoedd yn cymryd rhan lawn ynddo, ac y caiff pob carreg ei droi wrth geisio cyrraedd gwaelod y mater. Fel y dywedodd y Prif Weinidog, caiff popeth posibl ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â'r materion a godwyd.

Mae hefyd yn bwysig, wrth sefydlu'r ymchwiliad hwn, ein bod yn dysgu'r gwersi cyn gynted â phosibl, fel nad ydym yn oedi wrth gymryd unrhyw gamau adfer neu weithredu unrhyw fesurau adfer. Mae Jeff Cuthbert yn gywir, nid oes angen inni ymateb yn ddifeddwol er mwyn bod pobl yn gweld ein bod yn ymateb. Mae yr un mor bwysig ein bod yn archwilio'r materion mewn modd ystyriol, tra'n gallu ymateb yn bwyllog er mwyn dysgu'r gwersi. Ni fydd yn dderbynio'l os oes rhaid inni aros dwy neu dair blynedd i ddysgu'r gwersi o'r ymchwiliad hwn yn llawn. Rhaid inni ystyried natur yr ymchwiliad, ond mae yr un mor bwysig ein bod yn dysgu'r gwersi mor gynnar ag sy'n bosibl.

**Janice Gregory:** Rhannaf eich awydd, fel y gwna'r Cynulliad cyfan, mae'n siŵr, am ymchwiliad agored a thryloyw i hyn. A ydych yn rhannu fy mhryder ar ôl i bapur newydd lleol, a oedd yn ceisio cyhoeddi ymateb rhesymol i'r achosion erchyll hyn, yn enwedig yn fy ardal i, gysylltu â'r awdurdod lleol i gael gwybod pryd y byddai'r cwmni

company in question would be inspected, it was told to put in a freedom of information request? If the Assembly Government wants to have an open and transparent inquiry, the local authority should do everything in its power to behave in exactly the same way.

**Brian Gibbons:** If an inquiry takes place, I would hope that such behaviour would not occur and that the inquiry will have the necessary powers to ensure that that is the case.

**Peter Black:** Do you accept that the local authority is in a difficult position, because if it finds an infringement on its watch, it may well have to undertake legal proceedings? Any information that it may provide to the press may prejudice those proceedings. Is it not reasonable, in that situation and in those specific instances, for the local authority to keep its powder dry and not provide the press with all sorts of information that may prejudice proceedings and stop anyone who may be responsible for such an outbreak from being brought to book for their actions?

**Brian Gibbons:** Without responding particularly to that point, I think that Peter touches upon an important point in terms of the inquiry being heard in public. It is important that the inquiry does not prejudice due legal process or action that will take place on the back of this. Insofar as I had reticence in stating that there would be a public inquiry on these matters, I did so to ensure that the inquiry that takes place—whatever its form may be—does not hinder judicial process, so that those who are culpable, in a criminal or civil way, will be brought to book for failing to deliver their duties. That is entirely appropriate, and I hope that the inquiry that we are embarking upon will be able to address the issue without resulting in such delays that the necessary lessons will be put off for an unduly long period.

**Alun Cairns:** I support Janice Gregory's comments and understand the perception that could come out of the reluctance to give information at this early stage, notwithstanding the point that Peter Black

dan sylw yn cael ei archwilio, y dywedwyd wrtho am wneud cais o dan y ddeddf rhyddid gwybodaeth? Os yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad am gael ymchwiliad agored a thryloyw, dylai'r awdurdod lleol wneud popeth o fewn ei allu i ymateb yn yr un modd yn union.

**Brian Gibbons:** Os digwydd ymchwiliad, gobeithiaf na fyddai'r fath ymddygiad yn digwydd ac y bydd gan yr ymchwiliad y pwerau angenrheidiol i sicrhau mai felly y bydd.

**Peter Black:** A dderbyniwch fod yr awdurdod lleol mewn seyllfa anodd, oherwydd os daw i wybod am unrhyw dramgyddo mae'n bosibl y bydd yn rhaid iddo ddwyn achos cyfreithiol? Gallai unrhyw wybodaeth y mae'n ei darparu i'r wasg niweidio'r achosion hynny. Onid yw'n rhesymol, yn y fath seyllfa ac o dan yr amgylchiadau hynny, i'r awdurdod lleol beidio â datgelu dim a pheidio â rhoi i'r wasg bob math o wybodaeth a allai niweidio achosion a'i atal rhag dwyn rhywun a allai fod yn gyfrifol am y fath salwch i gyfrif am eu gweithredoedd?

**Brian Gibbons:** Heb ymateb i'r pwynt penodol hwnnw, credaf fod Peter yn cyffwrdd â phwynt pwysig o ran gwrando'r ymchwiliad yn gyhoeddus. Mae'n bwysig nad yw'r ymchwiliad yn niweidio'r broses gyfreithiol neu'r camau gweithredu priodol a fydd yn digwydd yn sgil hyn. I'r graddau yr oeddwn yn ansicr i ddatgan y byddai ymchwiliad cyhoeddus ar y materion hyn, gwneuthum hynny er mwyn sicrhau nad yw'r ymchwiliad a gynhelir—ar ba ffurf bynnag a fo—yn amharu ar y broses gyfreithiol, fel y caiff y rhai a fu'n gyfrifol, mewn modd troeddol neu sifil eu dwyn, i gyfrif am fethu â chyflawni'u dyletswyddau. Mae hynny'n holol briodol, a gobeithiaf y bydd yr ymchwiliad yr ydym yn dechrau arno yn gallu mynd i'r afael â'r mater heb achosi'r fath oedi fel na chaiff y gwersi angenrheidiol eu dysgu am gyfnod o hir eto.

**Alun Cairns:** Cefnogaf sylwadau Janice Gregory a deallaf y canfyddiad a allai godi o'r amharodwydd i roi gwybodaeth mor gynnar â hyn, er gwaethaf pwynt Peter Black. Fodd bynnag, deallaf i swyddog o fewn yr

made. However, I understand that an officer within the local authority had taken the decision in the first instance, and that the relevant cabinet member will be considering it in order to release that information.

**Brian Gibbons:** Moving on to the points raised in discussion, Lorraine mentioned the outbreak in her constituency. If there are outbreaks, especially if a pathogenic E.coli is identified, and in particular the 0157 strain, the same procedure would be triggered as that which was triggered in this outbreak. Starting with an individual case, people then need to work to build up the whole picture, which was done so well by the outbreak control team over 24 hours or so on the Sunday. I hope that that would happen again, if required.

Jenny Randerson suggested that the E.coli organism may be deeply rooted. I am not sure what that was a reference to, though I think—

**Jenny Randerson:** Will you give way?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. The Minister has already overrun. Please be very brief, as we must bring the debate to its conclusion.

**Jenny Randerson:** In less than the time that that took, I could have clarified that I meant that there was danger—[*Interruption.*]

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I have pressed the red button, so no-one heard any of that. Be very brief. There is a lot of business, there are many speakers for the next debate, and we will be here until after 6 p.m. unless we make progress. For the record, Jenny, I would be grateful if you will repeat that very quickly because I had pressed the red button.

**Jenny Randerson:** I was simply implying that there were reports that it was spreading into the general population.

**Brian Gibbons:** No. The infection curve shows fairly decisively that the outbreak is in decline, and unless something completely new and untoward happens, that will not be

awdurdod lleol wneud y penderfyniad yn y lle cyntaf, ac y bydd yr aelod perthnasol o'r cabinet yn ei ystyried er mwyn rhyddhau'r wybodaeth honno.

**Brian Gibbons:** Gan symud at y pwyntiau a godwyd yn y drafodaeth, soniodd Lorraine am yr achosion yn ei hetholaeth. Os oes achosion, yn enwedig os canfyddir E.coli pathogenaidd, ac yn enwedig hil 0157, cychwynnir yr un weithdrefn ag a gychwynnwyd gyda'r achosion hyn. Gan ddechrau gydag achos unigol, mae angen i bobl ffurffio'r darlun cyfan, a wnaed cystal gan y tîm rheoli dros y 24 awr neu oddeutu hynny ar y dydd Sul. Gobeithiaf y byddai hynny'n digwydd eto, os byddai angen.

Awgrymodd Jenny Randerson y gallai'r organeb E.coli fod â gwreiddiau dyfnion. Nid wyf yn siŵr at beth yr oedd yn cyfeirio, er credaf—

**Jenny Randerson:** A wnewch ildio?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r Gweinidog eisoes wedi mynd dros ei amser. Byddwch yn gryno, gan fod yn rhaid dirwyn y ddadl i ben.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mewn llai o amser nag a gymerodd hynny, byddwn wedi gallu egluro fy mod wedi golygu fod perygl—[*Tori ar draws.*]

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Yr wyf wedi gwasgu'r botwm coch, felly ni chlywodd neb ddim o hynny. Byddwch yn gryno iawn. Mae llawer o fusnes, mae llawer o siaradwyr ar gyfer y ddadl nesaf, a byddwn yma hyd 6 p.m. os na symudwn ymlaen. Er mwyn y cofnod, Jenny, byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe baech yn gallu ailadrodd hynny'n gyflym iawn oherwydd fy mod wedi gwasgu'r botwm coch.

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr oeddwn yn awgrymu fod adroddiadau ei fod yn lledaenu i'r cyhoedd yn gyffredinol.

**Brian Gibbons:** Nac ydyw. Mae'r gromlin haint yn dangos yn gymharol bendant fod yr achosion yn lleihau, ac oni bai fod rhywbeth hollol newydd ac anffodus yn codi, ni fydd

the case.

Finally, concern has been expressed about food in schools, and the inquiry will look at that issue. The Assembly Government is already doing a considerable amount of work on ensuring that our schools are supplied with a good programme and curriculum to promote healthy foods through various initiatives. We are consulting on a food and health action plan. A food action plan for schools is being considered by the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning. I hope that the inquiry will be able to build on these developments.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Credaf mai'r peth pwysig a ddaeth o'r drafodaeth y prynhawn yma ac o'r bleidlais ddoe yw ei bod yn glir i bawb bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn unfrydol o blaidd cael ymchwiliad cyhoeddus, ac mae hynny yn rhywbeth i'w groesawu. Bydd y neges honno yn rhoi hyder i bobl y bydd pob peth yn cael ei ystyried yn fanwl.

Gan mai fi yw'r siaradwr olaf, hoffwn estyn fy nghydymdeimlad hefyd at bawb sydd wedi dioddef a llonyfarch y tîm rheoli am y gwaith arbennig o dda. Hoffwn estyn fy llonyfarchiadau i'r Gweinidog am y ffordd y mae wedi cydlynu yn y mater hwn. Rhaid bod y sefyllfa wedi rhoi pwysau ychwanegol ar ben ei faich gwaith sydd eisoes yn gynhwysfawr.

This is a very serious incident. It is important to note that the 0157 strain of E.coli is particularly virulent. Given the seriousness of the outbreak, it is important that the public has confidence in the inquiry.

I have said that the outbreak control team carried out its work very effectively. The one criticism that one might make is that the messages to the public were not clear enough. I come back to the point that Jonathan Morgan raised about the role of the Chief Medical Officer. I would have thought that, in England and Scotland, if such a situation were to arise, the Chief Medical Officer would be the public figure, the voice and the face that people could identify the statements with. In that way, everybody would know what the situation was. I understand the role

hynny yn digwydd.

I orffen, mynegwyd pryder ynglŷn â bwyd yn yr ysgolion, a bydd yr ymchwiliad yn edrych ar y mater hwnnw. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad eisoes yn gwneud cryn dipyn o waith i sicrhau y cyflenwir rhaglen a chwricwlwm da i'n hysgolion i hyrwyddo bwydydd iach drwy fentrau amrywiol. Yr ydym yn ymgynghori ar gynllun gweithredu bwyd ac iechyd. Ystyrir cynllun gweithredu bwyd ar gyfer ysgolion gan y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr ymchwiliad yn gallu adeiladu ar y datblygiadau hyn.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I believe that the important thing to emerge from this afternoon's debate and yesterday's vote is that it is clear to everyone that the National Assembly for Wales is unanimously in favour of holding a public inquiry, which is to be welcomed. That message will give people confidence that everything will be examined in detail.

Given that I am the final speaker, I also wish to express my sympathy for everyone who has suffered, and to congratulate the control team for its tremendous work. I would also like to congratulate the Minister on the way in which he has co-ordinated this response. I am sure that the situation has brought additional pressure to bear on his already considerable workload.

Mae hwn yn ddigwyddiad difrifol iawn. Mae'n bwysig nodi fod hil 0157 E.coli yn arbennig o ffyrnig. Oherwydd difrifoldeb y sefyllfa, mae'n bwysig fod gan y cyhoedd hyder yn yr ymchwiliad.

Dywedais fod y tîm rheoli'r achosion wedi gwneud ei waith yn effeithiol iawn. Yr unig feirniadaeth y gellir ei gwneud yw nad oedd y negeseuon a roddwyd i'r cyhoedd yn ddigon clir. Dychwelaf at y pwynt a gododd Jonathan Morgan ynglŷn â'r rôl y Prif Swyddog Meddygol. Byddwn wedi meddwl, yn Lloegr a'r Alban, pe bai'r fath sefyllfa yn codi, mai'r Prif Swyddog Meddygol fyddai'r ffigwr, y llais a'r wyneb cyhoeddus y byddai pobl yn gallu cysylltu'r datganiadau gydag ef. Yn y modd hwnnw, byddai pawb yn gwybod beth oedd y sefyllfa. Deallaf y rôl y

that the Minister decided to take; he did not want to politicise the position. I understand and sympathise with that.

**Leighton Andrews:** I take it that you would accept that Dr Salmon from the national public health service has played a very responsible role in the interviews that he has undertaken.

4.40 p.m.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I agree. I am certainly not being critical. As I said, I commend the work that they carried out. However, we need to see whether there are lessons to be learned from that. I think that we are all agreed that there needs to be a public inquiry. The people will know that there will be a full inquiry and they will have confidence in it.

**Adroddiad Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad: Trydydd Ymchwiliad—Bodloni Targedau Tirlenwi ac Ailgylchu  
The Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee's Report: Third Inquiry—Meeting Landfill and Recycling Targets**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have received the names of many Members who wish to contribute to this debate. Although some Members have pulled out, I intend to impose a three minute time-limit for Members when they are called.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reolau Sefydlog Rhifau 6.6 a 9.9, yn nodi trydydd adroddiad Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad o dan y teitl ‘Cyrraedd Targedau Tirlenwi ac Ailgylchu’, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Medi 2005. (NDM2566)*

Y mae'n bleser gennyf gyflwyno trydydd adroddiad Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad ar fodloni targedau tirlenwi ac ailgylchu.

Fel pwylgor, daethom at yr ymchwiliad gan wybod bod rheoli gwastraff yn broblem gynyddol a thra difrifol yng Nghymru. Cyhoeddwyd nifer o adroddiadau yn y maes hwn yn gymharol ddiweddar—un gan Bwyllgor Archwilio y Cynulliad a chan y comisiwn archwilio blaenorol—a oedd yn amlinellu'r her i'r sector cyhoeddus o reoli

penderfynodd y Gweinidog ymgymryd â hi, nid oedd am droi'r sefyllfa'n wleidyddol. Deallaf a chydymdeimlaf â hynny.

**Leighton Andrews:** Tybiaf eich bod yn derbyn bod Dr Salmon o'r gwasanaeth iechyd cyhoeddus cenedlaethol wedi chwarae rôl gyfrifol iawn yn y cyfweliadau a roddodd.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Cytunaf. Nid wyf yn bod yn feirniadol o gwbl. Fel y dywedais, cymeradwyaf y gwaith a wnaed ganddynt. Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni weld a oes gwensi y gellid eu dysgu o hynny. Credaf ein bod ni i gyd yn cytuno fod angen ymchwiliad cyhoeddus. Bydd y bobl yn gwybod y bydd ymchwiliad llawn a bydd ganddynt hyder ynddo.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Orders Nos. 6.6 and 9.9, notes the third report of the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee titled ‘Meeting Landfill and Recycling Targets’, which was laid in the Table Office on 13 September 2005. (NDM2566)*

It gives me great pleasure to present the third report of the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee on meeting landfill and recycling targets.

As a committee, we approached our inquiry knowing that waste management is a growing and extremely serious problem in Wales. Several reports have been published in this field quite recently—one by the Assembly's Audit Committee and the former audit commission—which outlined the challenge facing the public sector in terms of waste

gwastraff. Yn lle ailadrodd gwaith eraill yn y maes, ac er mwyn llunio argymhellion pendant fyddai'n bosibl i'r Gweinidog a'i adran eu gweithredu, penderfynodd y pwylgor ganolbwytio ar wastraff trefol a bodloni targedau tirlenwi ac ailgylchu Ewrop a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Yn ogystal â derbyn dystiolaeth gan ystod eang o gyrrff cyhoeddus ac o'r sectorau gwirfoddol a chymunedol, bu inni ymweld ag amryw o safleoedd a chyfleusterau i weld drosom ein hunain y gwahanol ddulliau a thechnolegau ar gyfer ailgylchu a chompostio.

Yr wyf yn ffyddiog bod ein hadroddiad yn cynnig atebion ymarferol i'r broblem o reoli gwastraff yng Nghymru ac i'r her o fodloni'r targedau tirlenwi ac ailgylchu y mae'n ofynnol eu cyrraedd. Yr ydym wedi cynnig ffordd realistig o fynd i'r afael â'r broblem o reoli gwastraff, o wella'r system gynllunio ac o godi ymwybyddiaeth y cyhoedd o'n cyfrifoldebau ni oll i ailgylchu rhagor o'n gwastraff. Yr ydym hefyd wedi gofyn i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ystyried o ddifrif gynyddu'r cyllid sydd ar gael ar gyfer helpu llywodraeth leol i gwrdd â'i thargedau.

Mae'r adroddiad yn cynnwys 25 o argymhellion. Yr oeddwn wedi gobeithio y byddai llawer llai, on mae'n faes cymhleth. Mae'r argymhellion wedi eu grwpio o dan chwe phennawd: targedau, cynllunio a gweithio'n rhanbarthol, cylldio, ymwybyddiaeth y cyhoedd, marchnadoedd a chymorth i fusnes, ac ymchwil a datblygu. Amlinellaf y meysydd hyn yn fras. Mae'n siŵr y bydd aelodau'r pwylgor eisai canolbwytio ar argymhellion unigol yn y man.

O ran targedau, daeth yn amlwg i'r pwylgor y bydd nifer o awdurdodau lleol yn ei chael hi'n anodd cyrraedd targed y Llywodraeth i ailgylchu a chompostio 40 y cant o wastraff trefol erbyn 2009-10. Felly, argymhellwn fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn eu cynorthwyo i sicrhau y defnyddir strategaethau rheoli gwastraff trefol fel prif offeryn cynllunio i ateb anghenion lleol ac i gyrraedd y targed. Yr oedd y pwylgor hefyd yn cytuno â'r Llywodraeth y dylai pobl wahanu deunydd ailgylchu gartref, ond y dylid caniatáu i awdurdodau lleol ddewis sut i gasglu

management. Rather than duplicating the work of others in this field, and in order to draft specific recommendations for the Minister and his department to implement, the committee decided to focus on municipal waste and meeting European and Assembly Government landfill and recycling targets.

In addition to receiving evidence from a wide range of public bodies and from the voluntary and community sector, we visited various sites and facilities to see the various methods and technologies involved in recycling and composting for ourselves.

I am confident that our report presents practical solutions to the problem of waste management in Wales, and to the challenge of meeting mandatory landfill targets. We have offered a realistic way of getting to grips with the problem of waste management, improving the planning system and raising the public's awareness of all of our responsibilities to recycle more of our waste. We have also asked the Welsh Assembly Government to give serious consideration to increasing the funding that is available to enable local authorities to meet their targets.

The report contains 25 recommendations. I had hoped that there would be far fewer, but it is a complex area. The recommendations are grouped under six headings: targets, planning and regional working, funding, public awareness, markets and business support, and research and development. I will briefly outline these areas. I am sure that other committee members will want to focus on individual recommendations during the debate.

In terms of targets, it became evident to the committee that a number of local authorities will struggle to meet the Government's target of recycling or composting 40 per cent of municipal waste by 2009-10. For that reason, we recommend that the Assembly Government assists them to ensure that municipal waste management strategies are used as the principal planning instrument to meet local needs and to achieve that target. The committee also agreed with the Government that people should separate recyclable materials in the home, but that

deunyddiau a wahanwyd. Nid oes unfrydedd barn ynglŷn â hyn; mae dwy farn wahanol. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd y pwylgor yn gytûn mai dyna'r agwedd orau.

Bu i fater y broses gynllunio yng Nghymru godi ei ben mwy nag unwaith yn ystod yr ymchwiliad, a'n hargymhelliad pwysicaf yn y maes hwn yw y dylid gwneud cynlluniau gwastraff rhanbarthol yn statudol, ac, yn y cyfamser, y dylid diwygio cynlluniau gwastraff rhanbarthol i sicrhau eu bod yn dynodi lleoliadau daearyddol addas ar gyfer cyfleusterau rhanbarthol. Codwyd y pwynt hwn hefyd yn adroddiad Pwyllgor Archwilio y Cynulliad.

Ar fater y technolegau i drin gwastraff sydd ar gael, credwn y dylai'r Llywodraeth ddarparu canllawiau cliriach i awdurdodau lleol ynghylch pa dechnolegau yr hoffai eu gweld ar waith yng Nghymru a pha dechnolegau y dylid eu defnyddio i drin gwastraff gweddilliol hyd nes y bydd modd cael gwared arno.

Ar fater cyllid, yr ydym yn cydnabod i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gynyddu'r cyllid y mae'n ei roi i awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau lefelau uwch o ailgylchu a chompostio, ond yr ydym yn galw am lawer mwy er mwyn inni allu bod yn ffyddio y bodlonir y targedau ar gyfer 2009-10.

Dros y blynnyddoedd nesaf bydd yn bwysig bod gan awdurdodau lleol yr adnoddau i allu rhoi systemau casglu o'r palmant ar waith fesul cam, fel y gallant ailgylchu a chompostio ac osgoi tirlenwi y mwyafrif llethol o'n gwastraff, fel sy'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd.

Fodd bynnag, nid arian yw'r unig allwedd. Bydd fawr o wella ar ein harferion ailgylchu a chompostio oni wneir rhagor i godi ymwybyddiaeth y cyhoedd. Er gwaethaf yr holl ymgyrchoedd a thrafodaethau dros y blynnyddoedd diwethaf, ni fu ond ychydig o wahaniaeth yn ymddygiad pobl wrth ymdrin ag ysbwriel. Mae angen addysgu pobl i leihau, ailddefnyddio ac ailgylchu gwastraff, a gwneud hynny'n barhaus, yn lleol ac mewn modd sydd wedi ei dargedu. Mae hyn yn

local authorities should choose how to collect the separated materials. There was no unanimity on this, but two distinct views. However, the committee agreed that this was the best way forward.

The issue of the planning system in Wales reared its head on several occasions during the inquiry, and our main recommendation in this regard is that regional waste plans should have a statutory basis, and, in the meantime, regional waste plans should be revised to ensure that they identify suitable geographical locations for regional facilities. This point was also raised in the Assembly's Audit Committee report.

In respect of the technologies available to deal with waste, we believe that the Government should provide clearer guidance to local authorities on which technologies it would like to see operating in Wales and which technologies should be used to deal with residual waste until such time as it is possible to eliminate it.

On the matter of funding, we recognise that the Welsh Assembly Government has increased the funding that it gives local authorities in order to ensure greater levels of recycling and composting, but we call for much more funding so that we can be confident that the 2009-10 targets will be met.

Over the next few years it will be important that local authorities have the resources to enable them to gradually implement kerbside collection schemes so that they can recycle and compost waste and avoid the landfilling of most of our waste, as is currently the case.

However, funding is not the only key. Our recycling and composting habits will not greatly improve if more is not done to raise public awareness. Despite all the campaigns and discussions over recent years, there has not been much change in how people deal with waste. We need to educate people to reduce, re-use and recycle and to do so continuously, locally and in a targeted way. That is possible. We have seen encouraging examples in places such as Powys and

bosibl. Gwelwyd enghreifftiau calonogol mewn lleoedd megis Powys a Chasnewydd.

Yn ymarferol, os bydd rhagor o ddefnyddiau yn cael eu compostio a'u hailgylchu, rhaid cefnogi'r busnesau hynny sy'n chwilio am farchnadoedd i nwyddau newydd a gwahanol. Gyda chyngor y Llywodraeth, gallai awdurdodau lleol a chyrff cyhoeddus eraill gaffael rhagor o gynnrych a ailgylchwyd. Mae'n rhaid inni edrych ar reolau DEFRA ynglŷn â threthu'r peiriannu sy'n ymdrin ag ailgylchu. Mae'n rhyfedd ein bod yn disgwyl i fusnesau gael eu sefydlu i ailgylchu gwastraff trefol a diwydiannol, ac yna trethu'r peiriannau ar lefelau eithriadol o uchel drwy godi trwyddedau arbennig ar beiriannau ailgylchu. Daeth y mater hwnnw i'm sylw yn ddiweddar.

Yn olaf, mae angen rhagor o waith ymchwil a datblygu yn y maes hwn i feithrin dealltwriaeth o'r gwahanol dechnolegau, i ddileu gwastraff yn gyfan gwbl, ac i annog defnydd mwy dyfeisgar o'r defnyddiau a ailgylchwyd.

Dyna, yn fras, argymhellion y pwylgor. Cafwyd cefnogaeth drawsbleidiol i bob un ohonynt, a mawr obeithiaf y ceir cefnogaeth yn y ddadl heddiw. Diolchaf yn arbennig i'r rhai a gyfrannodd i'r ymchwiliad. Bu cyfraniad y tystion yn help i sicrhau ein bod yn deall maint y broblem, a threoon yn ystod yr ymchwiliad, fe'n hatgoffwyd o'r brys o ddatrys y broblem ein bod yn tirlenwi canran lawer rhy uchel o'n gwastraff tra bod y gofod ar gyfer gwneud hynny yn prysur leihau. Fel mewn cymaint o enghreifftiau eraill, yr ydym yn bell ar ei hôl hi, o safbwyt gwledydd y cyfandir.

I gloi, talaf deyrnged i'r swyddogion am eu gwaith o reoli a threfnu ein hymchwiliad ac yn arbennig i staff gwasanaeth ymchwil yr Aelodau am eu gwaith a fu o gymaint o gymorth inni ddeall maes technegol a chymhleth. Ni fedraf ddweud gormod am ansawdd y gefnogaeth hon i Aelodau unigol ac i'r pwylgor yn gyffredinol. Mae'n deyrnged i'r gwasanaeth.

Edrychwn ymlaen at dderbyn ymateb y Gweinidog i'n hargymhellion yn y dyfodol

Newport.

In practical terms, if more material is composted and recycled, we must support those businesses that are seeking markets for new and different products. With advice from the Government, local authorities and other public bodies could procure more recycled products. We must look at DEFRA regulations in relation to the taxing of recycling machinery. It is odd that we should expect companies to be established to recycle municipal and industrial waste, and yet tax the machinery at a very high rate through insisting on special licences for recycling machinery. This matter was brought to my attention recently.

Finally, we need further research and development work in this area to increase understanding of the various technologies, to eliminate waste completely, and to encourage the more innovative use of recycled materials.

Those are, broadly, the recommendations of the committee. There was cross-party support for all the recommendations, and I hope that they will be supported in today's debate. I give particular thanks to those who contributed to the inquiry. Witnesses' contributions helped us to understand the scale of the problem, and, on numerous occasions during the inquiry, we were reminded of the urgency of solving the problem that we landfill far too high a percentage of our waste while the space available for it is rapidly decreasing. As in many other cases, we are far behind countries on the continent.

To close, I pay tribute to the officials for their work in managing and organising our inquiry, particularly the Members' research service staff for their invaluable work in helping us to understand a technical and complex field. I cannot praise highly enough the quality of the support for individual Members and the committee in general. It is a tribute to the service.

We look forward to receiving the Minister's response to our recommendations shortly. For

agos. Am heddiw, yr wyf am dawelu, gan rhoi gyfle i aelodau'r pwyllgor ac eraill i fynegi eu hymateb i'n hymchwiliad ac i'n hadroddiad.

4.50 p.m.

**Ann Jones:** I thank Alun Ffred for introducing the report, and the committee for the report itself. Although it is a complex subject, I found the report easy to read, which is always a good thing. We all care about the environment in one way or another. The great thing about recycling that it is the easiest way in which we can all make a contribution. As the report points out, 98 per cent of people consider recycling to be worthwhile, yet the vast majority of people do not see it as their responsibility, but as someone else's—usually, the Government should do something. Whether those excuses are due to a lack of interest or inadequate space in which to accommodate wheelie or multiple bins, we have to explain that in order to achieve national and international goals for sustainable waste management every household has to play its part.

As the report says, householders in Wales recycled and composted over 16 per cent of their rubbish, which beat the target of 15 per cent. Much more ambitious national targets of 25 per cent have been set, rising to 40 per cent by 2010. While it was good to see that the first all-Wales target had been raised, I was disappointed that Denbighshire, my own county, missed its target for the recycling and composting of household waste by a country mile.

In terms of recycling alone, Denbighshire's figures are very low. However, I am pleased to say, having met officials of Denbighshire County Council, that the council is now keen to improve, and has set in train ways in which to improve kerbside recycling. Also, with the money that the council has received from the Assembly to develop recycling schemes, it is now looking at ways of reaching those targets.

I was also pleased that, following intervention by me and many of my residents,

today, I will say no more, and give committee members and others the opportunity to respond to our inquiry and our report.

**Ann Jones:** Diolchaf i Alun Ffred am gyflwyno'r adroddiad, ac i'r pwyllgor am yr adroddiad ei hun. Er ei fod yn bwnc cymhleth, yr oedd yr adroddiad, yn fy marn i, yn hawdd ei ddarllen, sydd bob amser yn beth da. Mae pob un ohonom yn goficio am yr amgylchedd mewn rhyw ffordd. Y peth gwych am ailgylchu yw mai dyma'r ffordd hawsaf y gallwn oll wneud cyfraniad. Fel y noda'r adroddiad, mae 98 y cant o bobl yn credu bod ailgylchu yn werth ei wneud, ac eto nid yw'r mwyafrif helaeth o bobl yn credu mai eu cyfrifoldeb hwy ydyw, ond cyfrifoldeb rhywun arall—fel arfer, y Llywodraeth ddylai wneud rhywbeth. Ni wn a yw'r esgusodion hynny oherwydd diffyg diddordeb neu am nad oes digon o le i gadw biniau ag olwynion neu finiau llosgog, ond rhaid inni egluro, er mwyn cyflawni nodau cenedlaethol a rhyngwladol ar gyfer rheoli gwastraff cynaliadwy, bod yn rhaid i bob cartref chwarae ei ran.

Fel y noda'r adroddiad, gwnaeth cartrefi yng Nghymru ailgylchu ac ailgompostio dros 16 y cant o'u gwastraff, a ragorodd ar y targed o 15 y cant. Gosodwyd targedau cenedlaethol llawer mwy uchelgeisiol o 25 y cant, gan godi i 40 y cant erbyn 2010. Er ei fod yn dda gweld bod y targed cyntaf i Gymru gyfan wedi cael ei gynyddu, yr oeddwn yn siomedig bod sir Ddinbych, fy sir i, wedi methu ei tharged ar gyfer ailgylchu ac ailgompostio gwastraff cartrefi o bell ffordd.

O ran ailgylchu yn unig, mae ffigurau sir Ddinbych yn isel iawn. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bleser gennyl ddweud, ar ôl cyfarfod â swyddogion o Gyngor Sir Ddinbych, fod y cyngor bellach yn awyddus i wella, ac wedi rhoi trefniadau ar waith i wella ailgylchu ymyl ffordd. Hefyd, gyda'r arian a gafodd y cyngor gan y Cynulliad i ddatblygu cynlluniau ailgylchu, mae'n edrych ar ffyrdd o gyrraedd y targedau hynny yn awr.

Yr oeddwn yn falch o nodi hefyd, yn dilyn myrraeth gennyl fi a llawer o'm trigolion,

through a survey that I conducted on the introduction of wheelie bins, Denbighshire County Council has now agreed that wheelie bins will form part of its waste management. While we all may argue about whether wheelie bins are the right way forward, and whether or not they just encourage people to dump their rubbish, I think that wheelie bins will be of a great value to the constituency that I represent. There will not only be one bin, but two—one is for compostable material—because, as you quite rightly point out in your report, the segregation of materials at source for recycling is vital. It is then up to local authorities to decide how they deal with that material. It is not a case of ‘one size fits all’.

Landfill tax and other measures focus the minds of Welsh local authorities, but we need to encourage authorities such as Denbighshire, and the other eight authorities that did not reach their targets. We have to encourage them, and ensure that they are given all the carrots to move forward on these recommendations. That is why I hope that the Welsh Assembly Government will take note of the recommendations in your report on working with those authorities that are still failing. However, we have to recognise that we cannot always ask those authorities who are not making the time—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You need to wind up.

**Ann Jones:** I had prepared a five-minute speech, Deputy Presiding Officer—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I did say that I was imposing a three-minute time limit.

**Ann Jones:** Yes, but having prepared to speak for five minutes, it is very difficult. I will finish on this point, and say that I hope that the Government will work with the local authorities that are co-operating and, where they are not, take firm measures to ensure that we can meet those recycling targets.

**Glyn Davies:** It falls to Governments, and those who advise Governments—and,

drwy arolwg a gynhalais ar gyflwyno biniau ag olwynion, fod Cyngor Sir Ddinbych bellach wedi cytuno y bydd biniau ag olwynion yn ffurfio rhan o'r ffordd y mae'n rheoli gwastraff. Er y gall pob un o honom ddadlau ai biniau ag olwynion yw'r ffordd orau o wneud pethau yn y dyfodol, ac ai'r unig beth a wnânt yw annog pobl i daflu eu sbwriel, credaf y bydd biniau ag olwynion o werth mawr i'r etholaeth a gynrychiolaf. Nid un bin yn unig fydd, ond dau—bydd un ar gyfer deunydd y gellir ei gompostio—oherwydd, fel y dywedasoch yn eich adroddiad, a hynny'n briodol, mae didoli deunyddiau o'r cychwyn i'w hailgylchu yn hollbwysig. Cyfrifoldeb awdurdodau lleol wedyn yw penderfynu sut i ymdrin â'r deunydd hwnnw. Nid un ateb i bawb yw hyn.

Mae treth tirlenwi a mesurau eraill yn hoelio sylw awdurdodau lleol Cymru, ond mae angen inni annog awdurdodau megis sir Ddinbych, a'r wyth awdurdod arall na chyrhaeddasant eu targedau. Rhaid inni eu hannog, a sicrhau eu bod yn cael pob cymhelliad i weithredu ar yr argymhellion hyn. Dyna pam yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn nodi'r argymhellion yn eich adroddiad ar weithio gyda'r awdurdodau hynny sy'n parhau i fethu. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gydnabod na allwn bob amser ofyn i'r awdurdodau hynny nad ydynt yn caniatáu amser—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Rhaid ichi ddirwyn i ben.

**Ann Jones:** Yr oeddwn wedi paratoi arraith o bum munud, Ddirprwy Lywydd—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Dywedais fy mod yn gosod terfyn amser o dair munud.

**Ann Jones:** Do, ond ar ôl paratoi i siarad am bum munud, mae'n anodd iawn. Gorffennaf y pwyt hwn, a dywedaf fy mod yn gobeithio y bydd y Llywodraeth yn gweithio gyda'r awdurdodau lleol sy'n cydweithredu a, lle nad ydynt yn cydweithredu, eu bod yn cymryd camau cadarn i sicrhau y gallwn gyrraedd y targedau ailgylchu hynny.

**Glyn Davies:** Llywodraethau, a'r rheini sy'n cynghori Llywodraethau—ac, yn amlwg, mae

clearly, Assembly committees are involved in the process of advising Governments—to tackle issues that are not on the lips of the nation, are difficult to deal with, and to which the solutions are likely to be very unpopular. Yesterday, in this Chamber, we were dealing with climate change—the solutions there will be very difficult—and today we are looking at the issue of dealing with household waste. This is exactly that sort of issue. The solutions that we have to come forward with in order to deal with these matters will not be popular across Wales, but they are crucial. Issues relating to protecting and enhancing our environment are going to become dominant over the next few years.

The solutions will not be popular, and that is why it is good that we can have consensus in this Chamber. I have had a chance to contribute to this debate in committee, and I have enjoyed going around learning about the issues, and seeing some of the very good examples of dealing with this across Wales. Indeed, in Powys, where I live, we were able to see a very good example of how recycling has been taken very seriously indeed.

I would like to raise two important points. One relates to the varying performance among local authorities. Ann Jones has just spoken, as have I, and have talked about our local authorities, and there is clearly varying performance. The issue is how we deal with this. I say to the Government that dealing with poor-performing authorities is crucial. It is much easier to make a saving in relation to the national scene if you can persuade a low-performing authority to improve, than if you are trying to make a good-performing authority improve. It becomes increasingly difficult to raise the percentage of waste recycled the higher you get. That is one crucial issue.

My natural instinct is not to be in favour of making things a statutory responsibility. However, if we are to make a difference, we have to enforce this and ensure that it happens. This is one instance where I have supported the move towards this, and I would

pwylgorau'r Cynulliad yn ymwneud â'r broses o gynghori Llywodraethau—sy'n gyfrifol am fynd i'r afael â materion nad ydynt yng ngenau pawb, materion y mae'n anodd ymdrin â hwy, a materion y mae'n debygol y bydd yr atebion iddynt yn amhoblogaidd iawn. Ddoe, yn y Siambwr hon, yr oeddem yn ymdrin â newid yn yr hinsawdd—bydd yr atebion yno yn anodd iawn—a heddiw yr ydym yn edrych ar y mater o ymdrin â gwastraff cartrefi. Dyma'r union fath o fater. Ni fydd yr atebion y bydd yn rhaid inni eu cyflwyno er mwyn ymdrin â'r materion hyn yn boblogaidd ledled Cymru, ond maent yn hanfodol. Bydd materion sy'n ymwneud â diogelu a gwella ein hamgylchedd yn dod yn fwylwyd pwysig dros y blynnyddoedd nesaf.

Ni fydd yr atebion yn boblogaidd, a dyna pam y mae'n braff ein bod yn gallu cael consensws yn y Siambwr hon. Yr wyf wedi cael cyfle i gyfrannu at y ddadl hon yn y pwylgor, ac yr wyf wedi mwynhau mynd o amgylch yn dysgu am y materion, a gweld rhai o'r enghreifftiau da iawn o ymdrin â hyn ledled Cymru. Yn wir, ym Mhowys, lle yr wyf yn byw, yr oeddem yn gallu gweld enghraifft dda iawn o sut y cymerwyd ailgylchu o ddifrif.

Hoffwn godi dau bwynt pwysig. Mae un yn ymwneud â'r ffaith bod perfformiad yn amrywio rhwng awdurdodau lleol. Mae Ann Jones newydd siarad, fel minnau, ac wedi sôn am ein hawdurdodau lleol, ac mae'n amlwg bod perfformiad yn amrywio. Y broblem yw sut yr ydym yn ymdrin â hyn. Dywedaf wrth y Llywodraeth fod ymdrin ag awdurdodau sy'n perfformio'n wael yn hanfodol. Mae'n llawer haws ailgylchu mwy mewn perthynas â'r sefyllfa genedlaethol os gallwch ddarbwyllo awdurdod sy'n perfformio'n wael i wella, nag ydyw os ydych yn ceisio cael awdurdod sy'n perfformio'n dda i wella. Po fwyaf yr ailgylchwrch, mwyaf anodd yw codi'r ganran o wastraff a ailgylchir. Mae hwnnw'n un mater hanfodol.

Fy ngreddf naturiol yw peidio â bod o blaidd gwneud pethau'n gyfrifoldeb statudol. Fodd bynnag, os ydym yn mynd i wneud gwahaniaeth, rhaid inni orfodi hyn a sicrhau ei fod yn digwydd. Mae hon yn un enghraifft lle yr wyf wedi cefnogi'r cam tuag at hyn, a

like to see the Government make regional waste plans statutory. That is the right way to go.

It will be hugely difficult for us to move forward from the current position of less than 20 per cent of waste being recycled, to 40 per cent of it being recycled—it is one of those hugely ambitious targets. I hope that the Government accepts the report and comes back with a strong response to it, and that we can maintain an all-party commitment to taking us forward on recycling.

**John Griffiths:** I congratulate the committee. As has already been mentioned, this is a succinct, well-set-out, clear and easy to understand report. I am also pleased that a visit was made to Newport Wastesavers, because it is a well-recognised exemplar of good practice in the recycling field. Along with many other households in Newport, I put out two plastic boxes for kerbside recycling weekly, as well as regularly putting out a garden waste bin. I have a home compost bin, and now, with four adults in my household, when we put out our weekly wheelie bin for landfill, it is half empty, which is encouraging.

This situation exists thanks to a constructive and productive partnership between Newport City Council and Wastesavers. Wastesavers has grown phenomenally, and is now in purpose-built, top-quality premises, with the help of European structural funds. It has gained widespread recognition, and is now short-listed for major UK recycling awards, to be presented in Sheffield later this month. One of those awards is for partnership between a voluntary sector organisation and a local authority, and the other is for the best community-based organisation. Therefore, there is real recognition for top-quality performance.

It continues to grow apace. This August, a new pilot scheme was introduced, whereby 8,000 residents are taking part in the composting of food and cardboard waste—it is called the FAB scheme. In the first month

hoffwn weld y Llywodraeth yn gwneud cynlluniau gwastraff rhanbarthol yn statudol. Dyna'r ffordd gywir ymlaen.

Bydd yn eithriadol o anodd inni symud ymlaen o'r sefyllfa bresennol, sef ailgylchu llai nag 20 y cant o wastraff, i ailgylchu 40 y cant ohono—mae'n un o'r targedau hynny sy'n eithriadol o uchelgeisiol. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Llywodraeth yn derbyn yr adroddiad ac yn ymateb yn gryf iddo, ac y gallwn barhau ag ymrwymiad hollbleidiol tuag at ddatblygu ailgylchu.

**John Griffiths:** Llongyfarchaf y pwylgor. Fel y crybwyllyd eisoes, mae hwn yn adroddiad cryno, graenus, clir a hawdd ei ddeall. Yn ogystal, yr wyf yn falch i'r pwylgor ymweld â Newport Wastesavers, gan ei fod yn engraifft gydnabyddedig o arferion da ym maes ailgylchu. Ynghyd â llawer o gartrefi eraill yng Nghasnewydd, yr wyf yn rhoi dau flwch plastig allan ar gyfer ailgylchu ymyl ffordd bob wythnos, yn ogystal â rhoi bin gwastraff gardd allan yn rheolaidd. Mae gennyf fin compost cartref, ac erbyn hyn, gyda phedwar oedolyn yn fy nghartref, pan fyddwn yn rhoi ein bin ag olwynion allan bob wythnos ar gyfer gwastraff i'w dirlenwi, mae'n hanner gwag, ac mae hynny'n galonogol

Mae'r sefyllfa hon yn bodoli diolch i bartneriaeth adeiladol a chynhyrchiol rhwng Cyngor Sir Casnewydd a Wastesavers. Mae Wastesavers wedi tyfu'n aruthrol, ac mae bellach mewn safle o'r radd flaenaf a godwyd at y diben, gyda chymorth cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd. Enillodd gydnabyddiaeth gyffredinol, ac mae bellach ar y rhestr fer ar gyfer prif wobrau ailgylchu yn y DU, i'w cyflwyno yn Sheffield yn ddiweddarach y mis hwn. Mae un o'r gwobrau hynny ar gyfer partneriaeth rhwng sefydliadau yn y sector gwirfoddol ac awdurdod lleol, ac mae'r llall ar gyfer y sefydliad gorau yn y gymuned. Felly, ceir cydnabyddiaeth wirioneddol am berfformiad o'r radd flaenaf.

Parhau i dyfu a wna. Fis Awst eleni, cyflwynwyd cynllun peilot newydd lle mae 8,000 o drigolion yn compostio gwastraff bwyd a chardbord—fe'i gelwir yn gynllun Bwyd a Chardbord (FAB). Yn y mis cyntaf

alone, those 8,000 residents composted 225 tonnes, which is impressive. That involved working in partnership with Monmouthshire County Council, using its worm facility. This waste is put out in garden waste bins, which now total 25,000, and which have themselves resulted in some 300 tonnes of garden waste being composted last month by the 17,000 residents not included in the FAB pilot scheme. This goes to Newport's outdoor composting facility, and is then put to good use in parks and gardens.

All that is hugely encouraging. However, what is extremely positive is the buy-in and support from Newport residents. When, for example, under another pilot scheme, households went to a fortnightly collection of their landfill waste, there was a big debate and an outcry in the local press, saying that people needed to put out their landfill waste weekly not fortnightly, particularly if they had large families. However, in the survey done after this pilot scheme, 72 per cent of the households taking part supported it, 71 per cent now recycle or compost more, and the percentage recycling every week has gone from 28 per cent to 88 per cent. It is likely that this will be extended across the city council area soon.

We know that we have to change behaviour and thinking. The behaviour and thinking in Newport shows that that is possible, and I am sure that we can do that across Wales, and achieve our targets.

5.00 p.m.

**Mick Bates:** I would like to start by praising the inquiry process and the way in which it was led by the Chair. The support provided and Members' research was absolutely excellent. As the Chair mentioned, it is important to view this in conjunction with audit reports because the issues are very similar and it helps to bring a greater focus to what we need to do in Wales. The background is very encouraging. The previous Minister, Sue Essex, provided the

yn unig, compostiwyd 225 o dunelli gan yr 8,000 o drigolion hynny, sy'n swm trawiadol. Yr oedd hynny'n cynnwys gweithio mewn partneriaeth â Chyngor Sir Fynwy, gan ddefnyddio ei gyfleuster mwydod. Rhoddir y gwastraff hwn allan mewn biniau gwastraff gerddi, sef cyfanswm o 25,000 bellach, ac sydd, ynddynt eu hunain, wedi arwain at gompostio rhyw 300 o dunelli o wastraff gerddi y mis diwethaf gan y 17,000 o drigolion nad ydynt wedi'u cynnwys yng nghynllun peilot FAB. Trosglwyddir y gwastraff i gyfleuster compostio awyr agored Casnewydd, ac yna caiff ei ddefnyddio mewn parciau a gerddi.

Mae hynny oll yn galonogol iawn. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn sy'n eithriadol o gadarnhaol yw'r ymrwymiad a'r gefnogaeth gan drigolion Casnewydd. Er enghraifft, yn sgîl cynllun peilot arall, pan ddechreuwyd casglu gwastraff tirlenwi cartrefi bob pythefnos, bu dadl fawr a phrotest yn y wasg leol, gan ddweud bod yn rhaid i bobl roi eu gwastraff tirlenwi allan yn wythnosol ac nid bob pythefnos, yn arbennig os oedd ganddynt deuluoedd mawr. Fodd bynnag, yn yr arolwg a wnaed ar ôl y cynllun peilot hwn, yr oedd 72 y cant o'r cartrefi a gymerodd ran yn ei gefnogi, mae 71 y cant bellach yn ailgylchu neu'n compostio mwy, ac mae'r ganran o ailgylchu bob wythnos wedi cynyddu o 28 y cant i 88 y cant. Mae'n debygol y caiff hyn ei estyn ar draws ardal cyngor y ddinas yn fuan.

Gwyddom fod yn rhaid inni newid ymddygiad a ffordd o feddwl. Mae'r ymddygiad a'r ffordd o feddwl yng Nghasnewydd yn dangos bod hynny'n bosibl, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y gallwn wneud hynny ledled Cymru, a chyflawni ein targedau.

**Mick Bates:** Hoffwn ddechrau drwy ganmol y broses ymchwilio a'r ffordd y cafodd ei harwain gan y Cadeirydd. Yr oedd y cymorth a roddwyd ac ymchwil yr Aelodau yn rhagorol. Fel y crybwyllyd y Cadeirydd, mae'n bwysig ystyried hyn ar y cyd ag adroddiadau archwilio am fod y materion yn debyg iawn ac am ei bod yn helpu i wneud yr hyn y mae angen inni ei wneud yng Nghymru yn gliriach. Mae'r cefndir yn galonogol iawn. Rhoddodd y cyn-Weinidog, Sue Essex, y

right amount of funding, so that local authorities could get on with the job of meeting the landfill reduction targets. The targets are quite big, because landfill space is fast running out. If we are going to achieve a reduction of 35 per cent by 2020, the pace will have to be very quick.

It is hard to avoid a conclusion that we in Wales are producing too much waste. Recommendations 18 to 21 on awareness-raising are fundamental to reducing the amount of waste. When we look at local authority funding, it is important to ensure that awareness-raising continues. That is where educational programmes, such as the Eco-Schools programme, are essential to ensure that we breed good habits early on. It is us, as adults, who have created this mess, and it is the job of this Government to resolve the issue. This report is a very good starting point.

I would like to draw attention to recommendation 7. It talks about using producer-responsibility levies and tax reduction as incentives in the process. All too often, the process is viewed as being a burden. We must look at it from another angle and incentivise the process by offering tax reductions. When the Minister responds, I hope that he has some positive suggestions to make, because it is within the power of Government to look at, for example, the tax on plastic bags. That is a very successful part of the Irish process, and it is now being considered in Scotland. We have to be a bit more creative.

On planning, everyone is of the mind that the strategic answer is regional plans that should be statutory. That is very useful. Many sites are needed. My own authority in Powys, as Glyn Davies mentioned earlier, has a good record, mainly because of what are called bring sites, which involves people bringing their waste to a site to be collected by a local company.

One of the most worrying things is that the recycling rates are very low in the areas of highest deprivation. We must look at that issue through whatever agencies we can to

swm cywir o gyllid, fel y gallai awdurdodau lleol fynd ati i gyrraedd targedau lleihau tirlenwi. Mae'r targedau yn eithaf uchel, am fod lle tirlenwi yn prysur ddiflannu. Er mwyn inni sicrhau gostyngiad o 35 y cant erbyn 2020, bydd yn rhaid i hynny ddigwydd yn gyflym iawn.

Mae'n anodd peidio â dod i'r casgliad ein bod yn cynhyrchu gormod o wastraff yng Nghymru. Mae argymhellion 18 i 21 ar godi ymwybyddiaeth yn hanfodol er mwyn lleihau gwastraff. Pan ystyriwn gyllid awdurdodau lleol, mae'n bwysig sicrhau bod y gwaith o godi ymwybyddiaeth yn parhau. Dyna lle y mae rhagleni addysg, megis y rhaglen Eco-Ysgolion, yn allweddol er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn meithrin arferion da yn gynnar. Nyni, fel oedolion, sydd wedi creu'r llanastr hwn, a rhaid i'r Llywodraeth hon ddatrys y broblem. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn fan cychwyn da iawn.

Hoffwn dynnu eich sylw at argymhelliad 7. Mae'n sôn am ddefnyddio ardollau cyfrifoldeb cynhyrchwyr a gostyngiad treth fel cymhellion yn y broses. Yn rhy aml, ystyrir y broses yn faich. Rhaid inni ei hystyried o safbwyt arall a rhoi cymhellion i bobl drwy gynnig gostyngiadau treth. Pan fydd y Gweinidog yn ymateb, gobeithiaf y bydd yn cynnig rhai awgrymiadau cadarnhaol, am ei bod o fewn pŵer y Llywodraeth i ystyried, er enghraifft, y dreth ar fagiau plastig. Mae hynny'n rhan lwyddiannus iawn o'r broses yn Iwerddon, ac mae'n cael ei ystyried yn yr Alban ar hyn o bryd. Rhaid inni fod ychydig yn fwy creadigol.

O ran cynllunio, mae pawb o'r farn mai cynlluniau rhanbarthol yw'r ateb strategol a dylai'r rhain fod yn statudol. Mae hynny'n ddefnyddiol iawn. Mae angen llawer o safleoedd. Mae gan fy awdurdod innau ym Mhowys record dda, fel y crybwylloedd Glyn Davies yn gynharach, yn bennaf oherwydd yr hyn a elwir yn safleoedd dod â gwastraff, lle y mae pobl yn dod â'u gwastraff i safle i'w gasglu gan gwmni lleol.

Un o'r pethau sy'n peri'r pryder mwyaf yw bod y cyfraddau ailgylchu yn isel iawn yn yr ardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig. Rhaid inni ystyried y mater hwnnw drwy ba asiantaethau

ensure that recycling is taken on in these areas. We must engage with the private sector in particular in order to meet the targets, because, all too often, the public sector is not capable of delivering very stringent targets such as these, without capital investment. Eventually, I think that it will be the private sector that makes the investment.

**Sandy Mewies:** I am a bit of a late runner on the committee, but I am glad to pay tribute to the work of the Chair and to other Members who worked very hard in taking evidence from a huge number of sources. I want to direct my remarks to the work that is being done by some authorities. It is disappointing that nine authorities did not reach the targets. However, my authority, Flintshire County Council, has done very well on recycling. It has used Welsh Assembly Government funds very well in innovative schemes. It has exceeded the 2005 and 2007 recycling targets, and we must congratulate its achievements. I was talking recently to the council's portfolio holder, Kevin Jones. It is his hope and intention to ensure that all domestic biowaste will be diverted from landfill over the next few years.

In my constituency, the Greenfield composting plant is very well used, and kerbside recycling goes on. We have talked about the co-operation that is needed not just from householders, but from industry. Shotton Paper, as many will know, now operates on 100 per cent recyclables, directed by Flintshire County Council, among others. Aluminium and steel cans are targeted at those who can use them.

I want to draw attention to something that Glyn said, which is that this subject is not popular, but, when I visit schools, one of the things that school pupils always raise with me is the environment and recycling. I hope that that gives us hope for the future. The Eco-Schools project, which we discussed in committee, is doing well, and I have seen it operate successfully throughout Wales. Therefore, there is certainly hope for the future.

bynag a allwn er mwyn sicrhau y mabwysiedir ailgylchu yn yr ardaloedd hyn. Rhaid inni ymgysylltu â'r sector preifat yn arbennig er mwyn cyrraedd y targedau, oherwydd, yn rhy aml, ni all y sector cyhoeddus gyrraedd targedau llym iawn megis y rhain, heb fuddsoddiad cyfalaf. Yn y pen draw, credaf mai'r sector preifat a fydd yn gwneud y buddsoddiad.

**Sandy Mewies:** Yr wyf yn aelod eithaf newydd o'r pwylgor, ond yr wyf yn falch o dalu teyrnged i waith y Cadeirydd ac i Aelodau eraill a weithiodd mor galed wrth gymryd tystiolaeth o nifer fawr iawn o ffynonellau. Yr wyf am gyfeirio at y gwaith a wneir gan rai awdurdodau. Mae'n siomedig i naw awdurdod fethu â chyrraedd y targedau. Fodd bynnag, mae fy awdurdod i, sef Cyngor Sir y Fflint, wedi gwneud yn dda iawn o ran ailgylchu. Mae wedi defnyddio arian Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn dda iawn mewn cynlluniau arloesol. Mae wedi rhagori ar dargedau ailgylchu 2005 a 2007, a rhaid inni longyfarch ei gyflawniadau. Yr oeddwn yn siarad â deiliad portffolio'r cyngor, Kevin Jones, yn ddiweddar. Ei obaith a'i fwriad yw sicrhau y caiff pob math o fiowastraff domestig ei ailgyfeirio oddi wrth safleoedd tirlenwi yn ystod yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf.

Yn fy etholaeth i, gwneir defnydd helaeth iawn o waith compostio Maes Glas, ac mae'r ailgylchu ymyl ffordd yn parhau. Yr ydym wedi sôn am y cydweithredu sydd ei angen gan y diwydiant, ac nid dim ond deiliaid tai. Mae cwmni Shotton Paper, fel y gŵyr llawer, bellach yn defnyddio defnyddiau wedi'u hailgylchu yn unig, a gyfeiriwyd yno gan Gyngor Sir y Fflint, ymhlið eraill. Targedir caniau alwminiwm a dur at y rhai a all eu defnyddio.

Yr wyf am dynnu eich sylw at rywbeth a ddywedodd Glyn, sef nad yw'r pwnc hwn yn boblogaidd iawn, ond, pan ymwelaf ag ysgolion, un o'r pethau y mae disgyblion ysgol bob amser yn ei godi yw'r amgylchedd ac ailgylchu. Gobeithiaf y bydd hyn yn rhoi gobaith inni ar gyfer y dyfodol. Mae'r prosiect Eco-Ysgolion, a drafodwyd gennym yn y pwylgor, yn gwneud yn dda, ac yr wyf wedi'i weld yn gweithredu'n llwyddiannus ledled Cymru. Felly, yn sicr mae gobaith ar

gyfer y dyfodol.

The recommendations are good ones, and I hope that the Welsh Assembly Government will respond positively to them and that the work that has been done here will go forward, because, in the end, if we do not do it, we will be penalised. Glyn said that he is not keen on statutory regulation, but if we do not reach our landfill targets, we will be penalised in future. So, I am glad to see this. It is a good start, and let us go on from here. It will be a great achievement for Wales, and, when we succeed, it will be good for the generations to come, and we will succeed if we carry on in this manner.

**Bryngle Williams:** As a member of the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee, I welcomed the opportunity to contribute to the inquiry that is being discussed today. I would also like to thank those who gave evidence to the committee and contributed to the report.

Wales now finds itself at a pivotal point in addressing the growing problem of waste and how best to deal with it. We must all accept that we have a role to play if Wales is to meet the target of recycling and composting some 40 per cent of its waste by 2010. Wales faces a significant challenge in addressing this issue. Funding and communications are obviously key to this. If the target is to be met, the Welsh Assembly Government must ensure that additional funding is allocated for setting up the necessary regional and local infrastructure to deal with waste. Alongside this, it must set out its goals with clear and concise guidance on how they will be achieved.

The business community has demonstrated a significant interest in recycling and reuse. The Welsh Assembly Government must provide further and greater funding to ensure a more commercially viable environment in which businesses can operate. To give you one example, the owner of a timber processing plant in north Wales has expressed an interest in extending his business into a combined heat and power plant, and I believe that this could be linked

Mae'r argymhellion yn dda, a gobeithiaf y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ymateb yn gadarnhaol iddynt ac y bydd y gwaith sydd wedi'i wneud yma yn datblygu, oherwydd, yn y pen draw, os na wnawn hynny, cawn ein cosbi. Dywedodd Glyn nad yw'n hoff o reoleiddio statudol, ond os na chyrhaeddwn ein targedau o ran tirlenwi, cawn ein cosbi yn y dyfodol. Felly, yr wyf yn falch o weld hyn. Mae'n ddechrau da, a gadewch inni adeiladu ar hyn. Bydd yn gyflawniad gwych i Gymru, a, phan fyddwn yn llwyddo, bydd yn fuddiol i'r cenedlaethau i ddod, a byddwn yn llwyddo os parhawn yn y modd hwn.

**Bryngle Williams:** Fel aelod o Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad, croeswais y cyfle i gyfrannu at yr ymchwiliad a drafodir heddiw. Hoffwn ddiolch hefyd i'r rhai a roddodd dystiolaeth i'r pwylgor ac a gyfrannodd at yr adroddiad.

Mae Cymru bellach ar adeg allweddol o ran ymdrin â phroblem gynyddol gwastraff a'r ffordd orau o ymdrin ag ef. Rhaid i bob un ohonom dderbyn bod gennym rôl i'w chwarae er mwyn i Gymru gyrraedd y targed o ailgylchu a chompostio rhyw 40 y cant o'i gwastraff erbyn 2010. Mae Cymru yn wynebu her fawr wrth ymdrin â'r mater hwn. Mae'n amlwg bod cyllid a chyfathrebu yn allweddol i hyn. Er mwyn cyrraedd y targed, rhaid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru sicrhau y dyrennir arian ychwanegol i sefydlu'r seilwaith rhanbarthol a lleol angenrheidiol i ymdrin â'r gwastraff. Ochr yn ochr â hyn, rhaid iddi amlinellu ei nodau gan roi canllawiau clir a chryno ar sut y caint eu cyflawni.

Mae'r gymuned fusnes wedi dangos cryn ddiddordeb mewn ailgylchu ac ailddefnyddio. Rhaid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru roi mwy o gyllid i sicrhau amgylchedd sy'n fwy dichonadwy yn fasnachol lle y gall busnesau weithredu. Fel enghraifft, mae perchennog gwaith prosesu coed yn y Gogledd wedi mynegi diddordeb mewn ehangu ei fusnes i greu gwaith gwres a phŵer cyfunedig, a chredaf y gellid cysylltu hyn â datblygiad newydd arfaethedig. Fel y

to a proposed new development. As things stand, the lack of funding and information means that opportunities could be passing us by.

Alongside funding and guidance, public awareness must be addressed. The evidence put to the committee demonstrated that very little information is conveyed to the general public about the merits and methods of recycling. Encouragement to reduce, reuse and recycle is essential if public co-operation is to be gained.

We must face the fact that we have a lot to achieve in a short space of time, and if the Welsh Assembly Government acts to address the recommendations of this inquiry, I believe that Wales's landfill and recycling targets will be met, while we hopefully develop a long-term answer to the growing problem of waste management.

**Catherine Thomas:** I also welcome the report and thank the committee for its work. This is an issue which is of growing interest and concern to the people of Wales, and, I know, to my constituents in Llanelli. I welcome the progress that is being made by Carmarthenshire County Council in working towards the recycling target set by this Government. Like thousands of other Llanelli people, I am doing my bit to help make Carmarthenshire an even greener county, and one in which recycling becomes a natural part of our daily routine.

There is much to be done, but I know that the council is stepping up its efforts to improve local performance in this area with the help of significant funding from the Welsh Assembly Government. Today's debate is a timely one for many of my constituents. As many in the Chamber will have been aware, residents of Hendy have had their lives seriously disrupted by a major fire at Griffiths Pallets, a business that recycles waste timber. The fire has now been burning for well over a week. I have visited the area on numerous occasions to monitor the fire and meet residents, and I am relieved to learn that it should soon burn itself out. However, in the past week, local residents have been

saif pethau, mae diffyg arian a gwybodaeth yn golygu y gallem fod yn colli cyfleoedd.

Ochr yn ochr â chyllid a chanllawiau, rhaid ymdrin ag ymwybyddiaeth y cyhoedd. Dangosodd y dystiolaeth a gyflwynwyd i'r pwylgor mai ychydig iawn o wybodaeth a roddir i'r cyhoedd ynghylch rhinweddau ailgylchu a dulliau ailgylchu. Mae annog y cyhoedd i leihau gwastraff, ei ailddefnyddio a'i ailgylchu yn allweddol er mwyn sicrhau cydweithrediad y cyhoedd.

Rhaid inni wynebu'r ffaith bod llawer gennym i'w gyflawni mewn cyfnod byr, ac os bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cymryd camau i ymdrin ag argymhellion yr ymchwiliad hwn, credaf y caiff targedau Cymru ar gyfer tirlenwi ac ailgylchu eu cyflawni, wrth inni ddatblygu ateb hirdymor, gobeithio, i'r broblem gynyddol o reoli gwastraff.

**Catherine Thomas:** Croesawaf innau'r adroddiad hefyd a diolchaf i'r pwylgor am ei waith. Mae hwn yn fater sydd o ddiddordeb cynyddol ac yn achos pryder cynyddol i bobl Cymru ac i'm hetholwyr yn Llanelli, fe wn. Croesawaf y cynydd a wneir gan Gyngor Sir Caerfyrddin i weithio tuag at gyrraedd y targed ailgylchu a bennwyd gan y Llywodraeth hon. Fel miloedd o drigolion eraill Llanelli, chwaraeaf fy rhan i helpu i sicrhau bod sir Gaerfyrddin yn sir hyd yn oed yn wyrddach, ac yn un lle y daw ailgylchu yn rhan naturiol o'n bywyd pob dydd.

Mae llawer i'w wneud, ond gwn fod y cyngor yn cynyddu ei ymdrechion i wella perfformiad lleol yn y maes hwn gyda chymorth cyllid sylweddol gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Mae'r ddadl heddiw yn amserol i lawer o'm hetholwyr. Fel y gŵyr llawer yn y Siambwr, mae tân mawr yn Griffiths Pallets, sef busnes sy'n ailgylchu pren gwastraff, wedi tarfu'n sylweddol ar fywydau trigolion yr Hendy. Mae'r tân wedi bod yn llosgi am ymhell dros wythnos erbyn hyn. Yr wyf wedi ymweld â'r ardal sawl gwaith i fonitro'r tân ac i gyfarfod â thrigolion, ac yr wyf yn falch o glywed y dylai ddiffodd ohono'i hun yn fuan. Fodd bynnag, yn ystod yr wythnos diwethaf, bu'n

evacuated from their homes, one person has been taken to hospital, a local road was temporarily closed, and several people have complained of respiratory problems. This is all as a result of this appalling incident.

5.10 p.m.

As the local Member, I have requested a meeting with the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside to raise my concerns, and I have been in regular contact with the local authority to ensure that everything possible is being done to bring this unacceptable situation to an end, and to ensure that a thorough investigation is undertaken. However, while the causes of the incident are currently under investigation, it is vital that the wider lessons of the fire are learnt quickly. That is where the wider issues arising from this incident need to be taken on board in this debate.

With a growing recycling industry in Wales, it is critical that those who are involved recycle in a safe and environmentally responsible way. I do not want my constituents, or any others throughout Wales, to be exposed to such a dire incident again. We need to ensure that the procedures that authorities have in place to deal with incidents of this nature are robust, reflect local wishes and are clearly understood by communities. Also, the siting of such businesses is crucial. The effects of accidents involving seemingly harmless materials can have unforeseen and hazardous effects on communities and the health and safety of local people, as my constituents in Hendy now know to their cost.

rhaid i drigolion lleol adael eu cartrefi, aed ag un person i'r ysbyty, caewyd heol leol dros dro, ac mae sawl un wedi cwyno am broblemau anadlu. Mae hyn oll yn deillio o'r digwyddiad echrydus hwn.

Fel yr Aelod lleol, yr wyf wedi gofyn am gyfarfod â'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad i godi fy mhryderon, a bûm mewn cysylltiad rheolaidd â'r awdurdod lleol i sicrhau y gwneir popeth posibl i ddod â'r sefyllfa annerbyniol hon i ben, ac i sicrhau y cynhelir ymchwiliad trylwyr. Fodd bynnag, er yr ymchwilir i'r hyn a achosodd y tân ar hyn o bryd, mae'n hanfodol bod gwersi ehangach y tân yn cael eu dysgu'n gyflym. Dyna lle y mae angen ystyried y materion ehangach sy'n deillio o'r digwyddiad hwn yn y ddadl hon.

Gyda diwydiant ailgylchu cynyddol yng Nghymru, mae'n hollbwysig bod y rhain dan sylw yn ailgylchu mewn ffordd ddiogel a chyfrifol yn amgylchedd. Ni wyf am i'm hetholwyr i, nac unrhyw etholwyr eraill yng Nghymru, wynebu digwyddiad mor ddifrifol eto. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod y gweithdrefnau sydd gan awdurdodau ar waith i ymdrin â digwyddiadau o'r fath yn gadarn, eu bod yn adlewyrchu dymuniadau trigolion lleol a bod cymunedau yn eu deall yn glir. Hefyd, mae lleoliad busnesau o'r fath yn hollbwysig. Gall digwyddiadau sy'n ymwneud â deunyddiau diberygl yn ôl pob golwg gael effeithiau peryglus nas rhagwelwyd ar gymunedau ac ar iechyd a diogelwch pobl leol, fel y gŵyr fy etholwyr yn yr Hendy bellach er gofid iddynt.

*Daeth y Llywydd i'r Gadair am 5.11 p.m.  
The Presiding Officer took the Chair at 5.11 p.m.*

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolchaf i bawb a gyfrannodd at y drafodaeth heddiw. Mae mwyafrif y sylwadau a wnaethpwyd yn berthnasol i'r adroddiad ac i'r drafodaeth ehangach yn y maes hwn. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y sylwadau a'r gefnogaeth gyffredinol i'r adroddiad.

Ann Jones made a remark about failing councils. It is true that eight or nine of the

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I thank all those who have contributed to the debate today. Most of the comments made were relevant to the report and wider discussions in this field. I am grateful for the comments and the general support for the report.

Gwnaeth Ann Jones sylw ynghylch cynghorau sy'n methu. Mae'n wir i wyt neu

councils did not meet their targets, but most of them were very close to meeting those targets, and most are on the right track. The challenge will come in the future, in trying to reach the higher level. However, this emphasises the point that councils will have to work together on many aspects of this work because, to put it bluntly, many of the councils are too small to cope with some of the demands made upon them in this area.

Gwnaeth Glyn y pwynt fod rhaid cael dealltwriaeth ranbarthol a sicrhau bod cynghorau yn cydweithio i ddelio â rhai o'r problemau hyn. Yr wyf yn derbyn y pwynt hwnnw yn llwyr, ac yr wyf yn siŵr bod y Gweinidog yn ei dderbyn hefyd.

Yr oedd yr adroddiad yn canolbwytio ar wastraff trefol, sef gwastraff a gynhyrchir gan gartrefi yn bennaf. Mewn gwirionedd, cyfran fach o wastraff yw'r gwastraff hwnnw o'i gymharu â'r gwastraff a gynhyrchir gan ddiwydiant. Er yr ailgylchir canran uchel o'r gwastraff hwnnw eisoes, rhaid inni gydnabod fod problemau o ran capaciti safleoedd tirlenwi yn fwy perthnasol i wastraff o ddiwydiant yn hytrach na gwastraff o gartrefi.

John Griffiths, you praised the report, saying that it was succinct. That is down to the quality of the staff, and I think that I have already praised the support staff enough. You also mentioned Newport Wastesavers and the co-operation between that company and the local council. Although we only had a one-day visit, it struck me that that could be the way forward for other councils. I know that there is a great deal of co-operation between various local authorities in that area in this field. Again, it seems to me that that is an excellent example of how things might, could, and should proceed for the future.

The way that Newport Wastesavers not only dealt with the waste, but also involves itself in the community to try to raise awareness and get people to change their ways of disposing of waste, is a great success story.

naw o'r cynghorau fethu â chyrraedd eu targedau, ond yr oedd y mwyafrif o fewn dim i gyrraedd y targedau, ac mae'r rhan fwyaf ohonynt ar y trywydd cywir. Bydd yr her yn codi yn y dyfodol, wrth geisio cyrraedd y lefel uwch. Fodd bynnag, mae hyn yn pwysleisio'rffaith y bydd yn rhaid i gynghorau weithio gyda'i gilydd mewn sawl agwedd ar y gwaith hwn oherwydd, a siarad yn blaen, mae llawer o'r cynghorau yn rhy fach i ymdopi â rhai o'r galwadau arnynt yn y maes hwn.

Glyn made the point that we must have regional collaboration and ensure that councils co-operate to deal with some of these problems. I fully accept that point, and I am sure that it is also accepted by the Minister.

The report concentrated on municipal waste, which is household waste in the main. The fact of the matter is that this waste makes up a small proportion of total waste when compared with the waste produced by industry. Although a high percentage of that waste is already recycled, we must recognise that problems relating to the capacity of landfill sites are compounded more by industrial waste rather than household waste.

John Griffiths, gwnaethoch ganmol yr adroddiad, gan ddweud ei fod yn gryno. Ansawdd y staff sy'n gyfrifol am hynny, a chredaf fy mod wedi canmol y staff cymorth digon eisoes. Gwnaethoch gyfeirio hefyd at Newport Wastesavers a'r cydweithredu rhwng y cwmni a'r cyngor lleol. Er mai dim ond ymwelliad undydd a gawsom, fe'm trawyd mai dyna'r ffordd ymlaen i gynghorau eraill o bosibl. Gwn fod llawer iawn o gydweithredu rhwng awdurdodau lleol gwahanol yn yr ardal honno yn y maes hwn. Unwaith eto, ymddengys i mi fod hynny'n engrhrafft ardderchog o sut y gellid ac y dylid gwneud pethau yn y dyfodol.

Mae'r ffordd y mae Newport Wastesavers nid yn unig wedi delio â'r gwastraff, ond hefyd wedi ymgysylltu â'r gymuned i geisio codi ymwybyddiaeth a chael pobl i newid eu ffyrdd o waredu gwastraff, yn llwyddiant arbennig.

On the matter of composting, which is a bee in my bonnet, we should be concentrating more on composting at home. That should contribute to the targets. I know that officials are working on this matter, but I cannot for the life of me see the point in using a lorry to collect compost, that is mostly water anyway, and carry it vast distances to other places. I believe that that is mentioned in the report in some way.

O ran sylwadau Mick Bates, mae'r pwynt ynglŷn â'r angen i leihau maint y gwastraff yr ydym yn ei gynhyrchu yn eithriadol o bwysig, ond yr wyf yn meddwl mai ar lefel Prydain, San Steffan ac Ewrop y dylid mynd i'r afael â hynny. Mae'n dipyn o sialens, ond os nad ydym yn wynebu hynny, beth bynnag a wnawn gyda lefelau ailgylchu, byddwn yn dal i dirlenwi mwy a mwy bob blwyddyn. Hyd yn hyn, nid ydym wedi llwyddo i gonicro'r broblem arbennig a amlygwyd genych.

Terfynnaf drwy ddiolch i bawb am eu cyfraniadau heddiw ac i bawb a gynorthwyodd gyda'r adroddiad.

O ran compostio, sy'n boen meddwl imi, dylem fod yn canolbwytio mwy ar gompostio yn y cartref. Dylai hynny gyfrannu at y targedau. Gwn fod swyddogion yn gweithio ar y mater hwn, ond ni allaf ddeall o gwbl beth yw diben defnyddio lori i gasglu compost, sy'n ddŵr gan fwyaf beth bynnag, a'i gludo am bellteroedd maith i leoedd eraill. Credaf fod hynny'n cael ei grybwyllyn yr adroddiad mewn rhyw ffordd.

With regard to Mick Bates's comments, the point about the need to reduce the amount of waste produced is extremely important, but I think that that should be tackled at the British, Westminster and European level. It is quite a challenge, but if we do not take it up, no matter what we do about the levels of recycling, we will still be using landfill more and more each year. Until now, we have not succeeded in solving the particular problem that you highlighted.

I close by thanking all for their contributions today and thanking everyone who assisted with the report.

*Cynnig (NDM2566): O blaid 38, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2566): For 38, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy

Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sergeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Cyllideb Ddrafft Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad The Assembly Parliamentary Service's Draft Budget**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer (John Y Dirprwy Lywydd (John Marek):** I propose that Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 21.1, adopts the budget for the Assembly Parliamentary Service for 2006-07 and indicative allocations for the subsequent two years as set out in the table entitled 'Assembly Parliamentary Service Budget for 2006-07 and Indicative Budget for 2007-08 and 2008-09' laid in the Table Office on 14 September 2005. (NDM2565)*

This year will be a demanding one for the committee and the Assembly Parliamentary Service, involving the bedding down of the new building, further moves towards administrative separation and the likelihood of additional responsibilities under the 'Better Governance for Wales' White Paper proposals.

The draft budget was approved by the House Committee without dissent. There are increases, and they are largely as a result of the following issues. First is a 20 per cent increase in rates. We have to fund that, and the budget is increased in order to be able to meet that cost. We anticipate increases in costs for running the new Assembly building, for example, for maintenance, catering, security and extended opening hours for the public. We have anticipated costs for separating the Assembly Parliamentary Service from the Welsh Assembly Government's staff. Certainly, in terms of

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 21.1, yn mabwysiadu'r gyllideb ar gyfer Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad ar gyfer 2006-07 a dyraniadau dangosol ar gyfer y ddwy flynedd ddilysol fel y nodwyd yn y tabl o dan y teitl 'Cyllideb Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad ar gyfer 2006-07 a'r Gyllideb Ddangosol ar gyfer 2007-08 a 2008-09' a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Medi 2005. (NDM2565)

Bydd eleni yn flwyddyn anodd i'r pwylgor ac i Wasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad, a fydd yn cynnwys ymsefydlu yn yr adeilad newydd, symudiadau pellach tuag at wahaniad gweinyddol a'r tebygolrwydd o gyfrifoldebau ychwanegol o dan gynigion y Papur Gwyn 'Trefn Lywodraethu Well i Gymru'.

Cymeradwywyd y gyllideb ddrafft gan Bwyllgor y Tŷ heb anghytundeb. Mae ambell gynnydd, ac maent yn deillio'n bennaf o ganlyniad i'r materion canlynol. Yn gyntaf, mae cynnydd o 20 y cant mewn ardrethi. Rhaid inni ariannu hynny, a chaiff y gyllideb ei chynyddu er mwyn inni allu talu'r gost honno. Rhagwelwn gynnydd yng nghostau rhedeg adeilad newydd y Cynulliad, er enghraift, gwaith cynnal a chadw, arlwo, diogelwch ac oriau agor estynedig ar gyfer y cyhoedd. Yr ydym wedi rhagweld costau ar gyfer gwahanu staff Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad oddi wrth staff Llywodraeth

costs, this will amount to some £150,000. However, we will absorb the planning and temporary costs from our existing budgets. Finally, as a major increase, of course, we have the consequences of our acceptance of the recommendations of the Senior Salaries Review Board. The total is contained, and I commend this motion to Plenary.

Cynulliad Cymru. Yn sicr, o ran costau, bydd hyn yn cyfateb â thua £150,000. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn amsugno'r costau cynllunio a'r costau dros dro o'n cylidebau presennol. Yn olaf, fel cynnydd mawr, wrth gwrs, mae canlyniadau ein penderfyniad i dderbyn argymhellion y Bwrdd Adolygu Cyflogau Uwch. Caiff y cyfanswm ei gynnwys, a chymeradwyaf y cynnig hwn i'r Cyfarfod Llawn.

**Owen John Thomas:** Fel aelod o Bwyllgor y Tŷ, yr wyf yn fodlon rhoi sêl fy mendith ar gyllideb ddrafft Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cymulliad.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer (John Marek):** Thank you, Owen John.

**Owen John Thomas:** As a member of the House Committee, I am content to give the Assembly Parliamentary Service's draft budget my seal of approval.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd (John Marek):** Diolch, Owen John.

*Cynnig (NDM2565): O blaid 35, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM2565): For 35, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelod canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Member voted against:

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

**Y Llywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw  
i ben. **The Presiding Officer:** That brings today's  
proceedings to a close.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.20 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 5.20 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau**  
**Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Law, Peter (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)

Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)