



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mawrth, 27 Medi 2005
Tuesday, 27 September 2005**

Cynnwys Contents

Ethol Aelodau i Gyngor Partneriaeth Llywodraeth Leol Election of Members to the Local Government Partnership Council.....	4
Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister	5
Cwestiwn Brys Urgent Question	29
Cynnig i Drafod Mater Brys sydd o Bwys Cyhoeddus (Achosion E.coli) Proposal to Consider a Matter of Urgent Public Importance (E.coli Outbreak).....	36
Datganiad Busnes Business Statement.....	39
Datganiad gan y Llywydd Statement by the Presiding Officer.....	43
Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Tai (Hawl Cynnig Cyntaf) (Cymru) 2005 a Gorchymyn Tai (Hawl i Brynu) (Gwybodaeth i Denantiaid Diogel) (Cymru) 2005 Approval of the Housing (Right of First Refusal) (Wales) Regulations 2005 and the Housing (Right to Buy) (Information to Secure Tenants) (Wales) Order 2005.....	44
Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Mynediad i Wybodaeth (Mabwysiadu Ôl-gychwyn) (Cymru) 2005 a Rheoliadau Gwybodaeth Mabwysiadu a Gwasanaethau Cyfryngol (Mabwysiadu Cyn-gychwyn) (Cymru) 2005 Approval of the Access to Information (Post-commencement Adoptions) (Wales) Regulations 2005 and the Adoption Information and Intermediary Services (Pre-commencement Adoptions) (Wales) Regulations 2005	58
Cymeradwyo'r Safonau Gofynnol Cenedlaethol ar gyfer Asiantaethau Cymorth Mabwysiadu Approval of the National Minimum Standards for Adoption Support Agencies	65
Cymeradwyo Cynllun Grant Dysgu'r Cynulliad 2005-06 Approval of the Assembly Learning Grant Scheme 2005-06	68
Cymeradwyo'r Trefniadau Gweinyddol o dan Adran 14 Deddf Addysg 2002 sy'n Rheoli Talu Lwfans Cynhaliaeth Addysg (Cynllun) Approval of Administrative Arrangements under Section 14 of the Education Act 2002 Governing the Payment of Education Maintenance Allowance (Scheme)	72
Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Y Blaid Geidwadol): Polisi Ynni Adnewyddadwy Minority Party Debate (The Conservative Party): Renewable Energy Policy	75
Dadl o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 31: Glendid Ysbytai Debate under Standing Order No. 31: Hospital Cleanliness	108

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

**Ethol Aelodau i Gyngor Partneriaeth Llywodraeth Leol
Election of Members to the Local Government Partnership Council**

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cynigiau fod

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I propose that

y Cynulliad, yn unol â pharagraffau 1 (1) a 4 o Atodlen 11 Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn penodi'r personau canlynol i fod yn aelodau o'r Gyngor Partneriaeth Llywodraeth Leol:

the Assembly, in accordance with paragraphs 1 (1) and 4 of Schedule 11 to the Government of Wales Act 1998, appoints the following persons to be members of the Local Government Partnership Council:

Y Cyng Emlyn Davies o Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy yn lle'r Cyng Dai Lloyd Evans o Gyngor Sir Ceredigion;

Cllr Emlyn Davies of Conwy County Borough Council in place of Cllr Dai Lloyd Evans of Ceredigion County Council;

Y Cyng Raymond Thomas o Awdurdod Heddlu De Cymru a Chyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Merthyr Tudful yn lle'r Cyng Haydn Lewis o Awdurdod Heddlu Dyfed Powys. (NDM2568)

Cllr Raymond Thomas of South Wales Police Authority and Merthyr Tydfil County Borough Council in place of Cllr Haydn Lewis of Dyfed Powys Police Authority. (NDM2568)

*Cynnig (NDM2568): O blaid 35, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2568): For 35, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Randerson, Jenny

Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister

Darlledu Sain Digidol Digital Audio Broadcast

Q1 Gwenda Thomas: What discussions have Welsh Assembly Government Ministers had with the UK Government regarding the provision of digital audio broadcast radio in Wales? OAQ0780(FM)

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): Broadcasting is not devolved to the National Assembly for Wales. However, we regularly discuss broadcasting issues that affect Wales, including DAB digital radio, with the UK Government and other appropriate bodies, such as the Office of Communications.

Gwenda Thomas: What extra assurances can you give that you will continue to have negotiations with central Government regarding the wider provision of this service, to give improved reception and increased choice for my constituents and for the rest of Wales?

The First Minister: We will continue to do that, because we recognise that DAB radio coverage is limited at present, although it is possible to listen to the majority of digital radio stations via other platforms, including digital terrestrial, satellite and cable television. However, many people, including me, take a long time to get used to the idea of listening to the radio on television; I do not think that I have done it yet. It is important that we recognise that 71 per cent of households in Wales have digital television, via terrestrial platforms, satellite or cable and that they could get a lot of DAB radio in that way.

C1 Gwenda Thomas: Pa drafodaethau y mae Gweinidogion Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi eu cael gyda Llywodraeth y DU ynglŷn â darparu radio darlledu sain digidol yng Nghymru? OAQ0780(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan): Nid yw darlledu wedi'i ddatganoli i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn trafod materion darlledu sy'n effeithio ar Gymru'n rheolaidd, gan gynnwys radio digidol DAB, gyda Llywodraeth y DU a chyrff priodol eraill, megis y Swyddfa Gyfathrebu.

Gwenda Thomas: Pa sicrwydd ychwanegol y gallwch ei roi y byddwch yn parhau i gynnal trafodaethau gyda'r Llywodraeth ganolog ynghylch darpariaeth ehangach o'r gwasanaeth hwn, i roi gwell derbyniad a mwy o ddewis i fy etholwyr i a gweddill Cymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Byddwn yn parhau i wneud hynny, gan ein bod yn derbyn bod derbyniad radio DAB yn gyfyngedig ar hyn o bryd, er bod modd clywed y rhan fwyaf o orsafoedd radio digidol drwy gyfryngau eraill, gan gynnwys gwasanaethau digidol daearol, teledu lloeren a chebl. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer o bobl, gan fy nghynnwys i, yn cymryd amser maith i ddod i arfer â'r syniad o wrando ar y radio ar y teledu; nid wyf yn teimlo fy mod wedi llwyddo i wneud hynny eto. Mae'n bwysig inni gydnabod bod gan 71 y cant o gartrefi Cymru deledu digidol, drwy gyfryngau daearol, lloeren neu gebl a'u bod yn medru derbyn llawer o orsafoedd radio DAB felly.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yr ydych yn dweud bod derbyniad yn gyfyngedig ar hyn o bryd, ond, i fod yn fanwl, mae'r derbyniad hwnnw wedi'i gyfyngu i ardaloedd Abertawe a Chaerdydd, gan mai yn y lleoedd hynny y mae'r unig drosglwyddyddion sy'n gallu trosglwyddo'r gwasanaeth hwn. A ydych yn hapus â sefyllfa lle mae gwrandawyr yng Nghymru yn gallu derbyn sianelau 1 i 7 ar y BBC ond nad ydynt yn gallu cael Radio Cymru na Radio Wales? Beth yr ydych chi a'ch Llywodraeth yn ei wneud ynglŷn â hynny?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid yw'r ardaloedd yr ydych chi wedi'u henwi yn cyfateb â'r rhai a nodwyd yn fy nodyn briffio i. Mae'r nodyn hwnnw yn sôn am yr ardal rhwng Caerfyrddin a Chasnewydd a rhai rhannau o'r Cymoedd, sy'n cynnwys ardaloedd Caerdydd ac Abertawe. Mae hefyd yn cyfeirio at y Gogledd-ddwyrain, sy'n cael ei wasanaethu gan drosglwyddydd Moel y Parc yn sir y Fflint. Nid oes amheuaeth nad yw hynny'n gyfyngedig, ond mae'r ganran o bobl sy'n gallu derbyn llawer o sianelau radio digidol—er nad pob un—drwy deledu digidol yn gryfach yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr, ac mae'r ffigur yn uwch na 70 y cant.

Lisa Francis: I appreciate that this is not a devolved matter but, as the digital net is cast wider in Wales, we could see more commercial radio provision. Currently, 56 per cent of Welsh speakers listen to commercial radio, so what will you do to further encourage Welsh-language provision in broadcasting, particularly by means of DAB, ensuring that it provides an integral thread to our cultural life?

The First Minister: I agree that commercial radio has developed strongly in Wales, and that the percentage of people who listen to it, compared with the BBC and other traditional broadcasters, is high. Commercial radio has been successful, but that is not to say that all such stations have been using a large amount of Welsh-language programming: I do not think that they have. The numbers do not always justify it in a situation where they depend on advertising. However, if I were the BBC, I would be concerned about the competitive strength that commercial radio

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: You say that reception is limited at present, but, in fact, that reception is only available in the Swansea and Cardiff areas, as the only transmitters capable of delivering this service are located in those areas. Are you satisfied with a situation where listeners in Wales can receive BBC channels 1 to 7 but cannot receive Radio Cymru and Radio Wales? What are you and your Government doing about this?

The First Minister: The areas that you mention are not the same as those listed in my briefing note. That note talks of the area between Carmarthen and Newport and some parts of the Valleys, which includes the Cardiff and Swansea areas. It also refers to north-east Wales, which is served by the Moel y Parc transmitter in Flintshire. There is no doubt that that is limited, but the percentage of people able to receive many digital radio channels—although not all—by means of digital television is higher in Wales than in England, at over 70 per cent.

Lisa Francis: Yr wyf yn derbyn nad yw hwn yn fater sydd wedi'i ddatganoli ond, wrth i'r rhwyd ddigidol gael ei thaflu'n ehangach yng Nghymru, gallwn weld rhagor o ddarpariaeth radio masnachol. Ar hyn o bryd, mae 56 y cant o siaradwyr Cymraeg yn gwrandao ar orsafoedd radio masnachol, felly beth a wnewch i annog mwy o ddarpariaeth Gymraeg mewn darlledu, yn enwedig drwy gyfrwng DAB, gan sicrhau ei fod yn elfen ganolog o'n bywyd diwylliannol?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn cytuno bod radio masnachol wedi datblygu'n gryf yng Nghymru, a bod canran y bobl sy'n gwrandao ar y gorsafoedd, o'i gymharu â'r BBC a darlledwyr traddodiadol eraill, yn uchel. Mae radio masnachol wedi bod yn llwyddiant, ond nid yw hynny'n golygu bod yr holl orsafoedd hyn wedi bod yn darlledu llawer o raglenni Cymraeg: nid wyf yn credu eu bod wedi gwneud hynny. Nid yw'r niferoedd yn cyfiawnhau hynny bob amser pan fônt yn dibynnu ar hysbysebion. Fodd bynnag, pe bawn i yn sefyllfa'r BBC, byddwn yn

has shown in carving out a big market share across Wales by being more local, if you like, and more relevant to local people.

Eleanor Burnham: Going into the digital age will be exciting, but would you agree that it is a bit of a dog's dinner at the moment? Many people do not understand what is going on—the providers who sell the gear and the people sitting at home who will, hopefully, come to understand more about what we do here—particularly, for example, in north-east Wales, where they are unable to watch what we are doing here. There is a democratic deficit throughout broadcasting. What will you do to help people understand and access coverage of what we do here, particularly in north-east Wales?

The First Minister: Those are the kinds of points that we have made constantly to Ofcom. It is sad that it is extremely difficult for certain parts of north-east-facing slopes in north-east Wales, including some of the coastal areas such as Bagillt and Mostyn, to get a tidy picture on any Welsh-originating transmission. It is far easier to get clear transmission where there is clear intervisibility with the Pennines and Midlands-based masts. That contributes to difficulty of connection with the Assembly as a democratic body elected by the whole of Wales, not by parts of Wales. We cannot amend the geography of Wales, and, sometimes, it defeats us. It is important to note that new investment in a combination of satellite and digital provision will overcome that problem.

The Presiding Officer: Before I call Peter Law to ask his question, I wish to note that this question is about digital radio, which I believe not to be the same as television.

Peter Law: I thought that that was rather unkind.

First Minister, is it not time that you got to grips with the issue? There is a link with the broadcasting of television channels, because there is a rapidly growing underclass in

bryderus ynghylch y grym cystadleuol y mae radio masnachol wedi'i ddangos wrth ennill cyfran sylweddol o'r farchnad ledled Cymru drwy fod yn fwy lleol, os mynnwch, ac yn fwy perthnasol i bobl leol.

Eleanor Burnham: Bydd ymuno â'r oes ddigidol yn gyffrous, ond a fydddech yn cytuno bod y sefyllfa'n llanast braidd ar hyn o bryd? Mae llawer nad ydynt yn deall beth sy'n digwydd—bydd y darparwyr sy'n gwerthu'r offer a'r bobl sy'n eistedd yn eu cartrefi, gobeithio, yn dod i ddeall mwy am yr hyn sy'n mynd ymlaen—yn enwedig, er enghraifft, yn y Gogledd-ddwyrain, lle nad ydynt yn medru gwyllo'r hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud yma. Mae diffyg democrataidd yn bodoli ym maes darlledu. Beth a wnewch i helpu pobl i ddeall a gwrando ar y darllediadau o'r hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud yma, yn enwedig yn y Gogledd-ddwyrain?

Y Prif Weinidog: Dyma'r mathau o bwytiau yr ydym wedi bod yn eu codi gydag Ofcom yn gyson. Mae'n drist ei bod yn eithriadol o anodd i rai rhannau o'r llethrau yn y Gogledd-ddwyrain sy'n wynebu'r gogledd-ddwyrain, gan gynnwys rhai ardaloedd ar yr arfordir fel Bagillt a Mostyn, gael llun derbynol o ddarllediadau o Gymru. Mae'n llawer haws cael derbynol eglur os yw mastiau ym mynyddoedd y Pennines a Chanolbarth Lloegr yn y golwg. Mae hynny'n ei gwneud yn anos creu cysylltiadau gyda'r Cynulliad fel corff etholedig sy'n cael ei ethol gan Gymru gyfan, yn hytrach na chan rannau o Gymru. Ni allwn newid daearyddiaeth Cymru, ac, weithiau, mae'n drech na ni. Mae'n bwysig nodi y bydd buddsoddiad newydd mewn cyfuniad o ddarpariaethau lloeren a digidol yn goresgyn y broblem honno.

Y Llywydd: Cyn imi alw ar Peter Law i ofyn ei gwestiwn, hoffwn nodi bod y cwestiwn hwn yn ymwneud â radio digidol, sydd yn fy marn i yn wahanol i deledu.

Peter Law: Yr oeddwn yn teimlo bod hynny braidd yn angharedig.

Brif Weinidog, onid yw hi'n bryd i chi fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn? Mae cysylltiad â darlledu sianelau teledu, gan fod is-ddosbarth yn datblygu'n gyflym yng Nghymru sy'n talu

Wales that pays its licence fee and gets nothing in return. These people feel left out. Could you have some kind of summit meeting with the Home Secretary to discuss this subject, to show that we are doing the best that we can to make sure that those who want the audio and television services are being catered for as far as possible?

The First Minister: I do not know what you mean by 'got to grips with the issue', particularly as I just mentioned that the problem is the geography of Wales. Are you suggesting that we find some way of flattening the hills of Wales so that we have rolling plains and no difficult valley situations? That is not practical. You will always find that responses will be matched to the geography. North-facing valleys cannot be served by satellite and east-facing valleys will always have dodgy reception. However, the digital switchover will cure that problem, and cure the problem with DAB radio, as you will be able to receive it through your television.

Y Llywydd: Cyn inni symud at y cwestiwn nesaf, carwn groesawu dirprwyaeth o arweinyddion eglwysig o'n chwaerwlad, Lesotho, sydd yn yr oriel gyhoeddus. Mae'n hyfryd eich cael yn ein plith. [*Cymeradwyaeth.*]

am ei drwydded ac nad yw'n cael dim yn ôl am ei arian. Mae'r bobl hyn yn teimlo eu bod ar eu colled. Oni allwch drefnu rhyw fath o uwchgyfarfod gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref i drafod y pwnc, i ddangos ein bod yn gwneud ein gorau i sicrhau bod darpariaeth yn cael ei threfnu hyd y gellir i'r rhai sydd am gael y gwasanaethau radio a theledu?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni wn beth yr ydych yn ei olygu wrth 'fynd i'r afael â'r mater', yn enwedig gan fy mod newydd ddweud mai daearyddiaeth Cymru yw'r broblem. A ydych yn awgrymu ein bod yn chwilio am ffordd i wastatáu bryniau Cymru fel bod gennym wastadeddau eang a dim dyffrynnoedd trafferthus? Nid yw hynny'n ymarferol. Gwelwch bob amser fod daearyddiaeth yn dylanwadu ar yr ateb. Nid oes modd gwasanaethu dyffrynnoedd sy'n wynebu'r gogledd gyda lloeren a bydd dyffrynnoedd sy'n wynebu'r dwyrain bob amser yn dioddef oherwydd derbyniad gwael. Fodd bynnag, pan fydd y ddarpariaeth ddigidol yn cymryd drosodd bydd y broblem honno'n cael ei datrys, a bydd hefyd yn datrys y broblem gyda radio DAB, gan y bydd modd ichi ei derbyn drwy'ch teledu.

The Presiding Officer: Before we move on to the next question, I extend a warm welcome to the delegation of church leaders from our sister nation, Lesotho, in the public gallery. We are very pleased to have you with us. [*Applause.*]

Cynhyrchu Dur yng Ngogledd Cymru Steel Manufacturing in North Wales

Q2 Carl Sargeant: Will the First Minister make a statement on steel manufacturing in north Wales? OAQ0772(FM)

The First Minister: Corus Shotton remains a significant manufacturing employer in north-east Wales, although with a tiny fraction of the jobs that it provided before the massive closure in 1980. Seven hundred workers manufacture high-value colour-coated steels for automotive, construction and white-goods industries. Significant investment has been made in the plant during the last 10 years.

C2 Carl Sargeant: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar gynhyrchu dur yng ngogledd Cymru? OAQ0772(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae Corus Shotton yn parhau'n gyflogwr gweithgynhyrchu pwysig yn y Gogledd-ddwyrain, er mai dim ond canran fechan iawn sy'n cael eu cyflogi yno bellach o'i gymharu â'r nifer a oedd yno cyn colli nifer fawr o swyddi yn 1980. Mae 700 o weithwyr yn cynhyrchu dur gwerth uchel wedi'i orchuddio â lliw i'r diwydiannau ceir, adeiladu a nwyddau gwyn. Mae adnoddau sylweddol wedi'u buddsoddi yn y gwaith yn ystod y 10 mlynedd diwethaf.

Carl Sargeant: You mentioned the 1980s, which were the dark days of the Conservative Government. Some 10,000 jobs in my constituency were lost thanks to the policies of the Tory administration. *[Interruption.]*

The Presiding Officer: Order. As I said last week, and I will continue to say it, I enjoy listening to supplementary questions.

2.10 p.m.

Carl Sargeant: The Corus workforce has turned the business around, with the Community Union and the Transport and General Workers' Union, and an £11 million investment rail spur will be opened in Flintshire in a few weeks' time. I am sure that you will join me on that day to congratulate the workforce.

The First Minister: I will be visiting the site in November to open the new railhead and I look forward to congratulating the employees, who have effected a massive turnaround in productivity and quality at Shotton and made Corus see it as a strategic plant for the company in the colour-coated steel part of the market.

Mark Isherwood: I will amend my question, following that response. What action will you take to remove party politics from steel manufacturing in Shotton, noting the statement that

'the British steel corporation has announced its proposal to close open-hearth steelmaking at Shotton, together with associated iron-making and the hot strip mill'

and that

'because of the cost penalty, the corporation was forced to conclude that replacement of Shotton steelmaking could not be justified',

published in the 1976 Labour Government White Paper, 'British Steel Corporation: Ten year development strategy'?

The First Minister: The 10-year

Carl Sargeant: Soniasoch am yr 1980au, sef dyddiau du'r Llywodraeth Geidwadol. Collwyd tua 10,000 o swyddi yn fy etholaeth i, diolch i bolisiau'r Llywodraeth Doriaidd. *[Torri ar draws.]*

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Fel y dywedais yr wythnos diwethaf, a byddaf yn parhau i'w ddweud, yr wyf yn mwynhau gwranddo ar gwestiynau atodol.

Carl Sargeant: Mae gweithlu Corus wedi trawsnewid y busnes, gyda'r Undeb Community ac Undeb y Gweithwyr Cludiant a Chyffredinol, a changen reilffordd sydd wedi cael buddsoddiad o £11 miliwn a gaiff ei hagor yn sir y Fflint ymhen ychydig wythnosau. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch am ymuno â mi y diwrnod hwnnw i longyfarch y gweithlu.

Y Prif Weinidog: Byddaf yn ymweld â'r safle ym mis Tachwedd i agor y lein newydd ac edrychaf ymlaen at gael llongyfarch y gweithwyr, sydd wedi trawsnewid y busnes yn Shotton o ran cynhyrchiant ac ansawdd ac sydd wedi gwneud i Corus sylweddoli ei fod yn waith strategol i'r cwmni yn y rhan o'r farchnad sy'n cynhyrchu dur wedi'i orchuddio â lliw.

Mark Isherwood: Newidiaf fy nghwestiwn yn dilyn yr ymateb blaenorol. Pa gamau a gymerwch i gael gwared ar wleidyddiaeth plaid o weithgynhyrchu dur yn Shotton, gan nodi'r datganiad bod

corfforaeth ddur Prydain wedi cyhoeddi ei chynnig i gau gwaith cynhyrchu dur tân agored yn Shotton, ynghyd â gwaith cynhyrchu haearn cysylltiedig a'r felin strip boeth

ac

oherwydd y gosb ariannol, gorfodwyd y gorfforaeth i gasglu na ellid cyfiawnhau adnewyddu dulliau cynhyrchu dur yn Shotton,

a gyhoeddwyd ym Mhapur Gwyn y Llywodraeth Lafur yn 1976, 'British Steel Corporation: Ten year development strategy'?

Y Prif Weinidog: Cyhoeddwyd y cynllun

development plan that you refer to was published under the Conservative Government in 1972. Perhaps you should look at your Conservative central office briefing again and refer back to the office for more accurate data. If that is your idea of taking party politics out of steel, you have another thing coming. It is a matter of historical record that this was possibly the largest redundancy in one place and at one time anywhere in Europe. I do not think it unfair, therefore, for either Carl or me to refer to it. What is remarkable, however, is how north-east Wales has recovered incredibly well. It was a very difficult time and enormously painful, but now, of course, it is the great economic powerhouse of Wales, through the Deeside industrial park and through Airbus, five or six miles away, at Broughton. The way in which that area has recovered from that colossal and historic one-off redundancy when the heavy end of Shotton closed down 25 years ago is remarkable.

datblygu 10 mlynedd yr ydych yn cyfeirio ato o dan y Llywodraeth Geidwadol yn 1972. Efallai y dylech edrych eto ar eich briff a gawsoch gan Swyddfa Ganolog y Ceidwadwyr a mynd yn ôl at y swyddfa i gael data mwy cywir. Os mai hynny yw eich syniad chi o gael gwared ar wleidyddiaeth plaid o gynhyrchu dur, byddai'n well i chi feddwl eto. Mae'n ffaith hanesyddol mai hwn o bosibl oedd yr achos mwyaf o ddiswyddo mewn un lle ar yr un pryd erioed yn Ewrop. Nid wyf yn credu ei bod yn annheg, felly, i Carl na minnau gyfeirio ato. Yr hyn sy'n rhyfeddol, fodd bynnag, yw'r ffordd y mae'r Gogledd-ddwyrain wedi goresgyn hynny mor dda. Yr oedd yn amser anodd iawn ac yn boenus tu hwnt, ond yn awr, wrth gwrs, dyma rym economaidd mawr Cymru, drwy barc diwydiannol Glannau Dyfrdwy a thrwy Airbus, bum neu chwe milltir i ffwrdd, ym Mrychdyn. Mae'r modd y mae'r ardal wedi ffynnu ers y diswyddo untro enfawr a hanesyddol, pan gaewyd y gwaith trwm yn Shotton 25 mlynedd yn ôl yn rhyfeddol.

Blaenoriaethau'r Llywodraeth ym Maes Addysg Welsh Assembly Government's Priorities for Education

Q3 The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): Will the First Minister provide an update on the Welsh Assembly Government's priorities for education?
OAO0777(FM)

The First Minister: Our priority is to continue to do the basics right, as shown this summer in the increase in the pass rate at A-level and GCSE, including an increase in top-level passes, as well as to innovate, as shown in the success of the Welsh baccalaureate pilots, and the new foundation curriculum for three to seven-year-olds and 14 to 19-year-olds.

Nick Bourne: I was surprised, in looking at the draft budget, to see that there was no provision for closing the funding gap between Welsh and English higher education institutions, given the very successful meetings that we had in the spring to discuss the issue. I understood that you had recognised that there was a funding gap, and had committed to closing it, beginning with

C3 Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog roi'r newyddion diweddaraf ynglŷn â blaenoriaethau gwario Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ym maes addysg?
OAO0777(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Ein blaenoriaeth yw parhau i wneud y pethau sylfaenol yn iawn, fel y gwelwyd yn ystod yr haf gyda'r cynnydd yng nghyfradd llwyddiant yr arholiadau safon A a TGAU, gan gynnwys cynnydd yn y graddau uchaf, yn ogystal ag arloesi, fel y gwelwyd yn llwyddiant prosiectau peilot bagloriaeth Cymru, a'r cwricwlwm sylfaen newydd ar gyfer disgyblion tair i saith oed a 14 i 19 oed.

Nick Bourne: Wrth edrych ar y gyllideb ddrafft, synnais weld nad oedd darpariaeth i gau'r bwloch o ran cyllid rhwng sefydliadau addysg uwch Cymru a Lloegr, o gofio'r cyfarfodydd llwyddiannus iawn a gawsom yn y gwanwyn i drafod y mater. Cefais ar ddeall eich bod wedi cydnabod bodolaeth y bwloch o ran cyllid, a'ch bod wedi ymrwymo i'w gau, gan ddechrau gyda'r gyllideb hon.

this budget.

The First Minister: We agreed that research on this issue should be commissioned from the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales and completed by the end of this year. That work is being done and, when it is completed, we will consider its outcomes. If additional funding is agreed, it could be factored into the 2007-08 budget. We cannot factor it into this budget, because we do not know yet whether there is a gap.

Nick Bourne: That is not what was agreed in those meetings. You acknowledged that there was a gap—[*Interruption.*] Yes, you did. You said that you did not know what the gap was. That is why the research was necessary. It is a completely new line to say that there is no such gap, or that we have not established whether there is one. You acknowledged that there was a gap, and that we would make a start on addressing it in this draft budget. That is why I was stunned that there is no provision for it in the budget, because that is not what I understood from what was agreed in those meetings.

The First Minister: Rather like Mark Isherwood, you are rewriting history. I am clear in my mind that I said that we were not sure whether there was a gap, that we were happy to concede that research be conducted on an open-book basis to see whether there was a gap, and, if there was a gap, that we would then seek to address it in the way that we have agreed.

Nick Bourne: You are the one rewriting history. You acknowledged that there was a gap. We did not know what the gap was—we would not have set this up if we were not satisfied that there was a gap; that would be a ridiculous thing to do. You acknowledged that there was such a gap, and that we did not know what it was, but that you would start work on addressing it in this draft budget. That has not happened and I would like an explanation as to why.

The First Minister: For the simple reason that I have just given: if you do not know

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr oeddem wedi cytuno y dylai ymchwil i'r mater gael ei gomisiynu gan Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru chael ei gwblhau erbyn diwedd eleni. Mae'r gwaith hwnnw'n mynd yn ei flaen a, phan fydd wedi'i gwblhau, byddwn yn ystyried ei ganlyniadau. Os cytunir ar gyllid ychwanegol, gellid ei ymgorffori yng nghyllideb 2007-08. Ni allwn ei ymgorffori yn y gyllideb hon, gan na wyddom eto a oes bwlch ai peidio.

Nick Bourne: Nid dyna beth y cytunwyd arno yn y cyfarfodydd hynny. Bu ichi gydnabod bod bwlch—[*Torri ar draws.*] Do, fe wnaethoch. Dywedasoch nad oeddech yn gwybod maint y bwlch. Dyna pam yr oedd angen yr ymchwil. Yr ydych yn dilyn trywydd hollol newydd drwy ddweud nad oes bwlch o'r fath, neu nad oeddem wedi canfod a oedd un ai peidio. Bu ichi gydnabod bod bwlch, ac y byddem yn mynd ati i roi sylw iddo yn y gyllideb ddrafft hon. Dyna pam yr oeddwn wedi fy syfrdanu am nad oedd darpariaeth ar ei gyfer yn y gyllideb, oherwydd nid felly yr oeddwn yn deall y sefyllfa yn ôl yr hyn y cytunwyd arno yn y cyfarfodydd hynny.

Y Prif Weinidog: Fel Mark Isherwood, yr ydych yn ailysgrifennu hanes. Yr wyf yn bendant yn fy meddwl fy mod wedi dweud nad oeddem yn siŵr a oedd bwlch ai peidio, ein bod yn fodlon derbyn y dylid cynnal yr ymchwil mewn modd penagored i weld a oedd bwlch, ac, os oedd bwlch, y byddem wedyn yn ymdrechu i fynd i'r afael â'r bwlch hwnnw yn y modd yr ydym wedi cytuno arno.

Nick Bourne: Chi yw'r un sy'n ailysgrifennu hanes. Bu ichi gydnabod bod bwlch. Ni wyddem beth oedd y bwlch—ni fyddem wedi gofyn am yr ymchwil oni bai ein bod yn sicr bod bwlch yn bodoli; byddai hynny wedi bod yn beth hurt i'w wneud. Bu ichi gydnabod bod bwlch, ac nad oeddem yn gwybod maint y bwlch hwnnw, ond y byddech yn dechrau mynd i'r afael ag ef yn y gyllideb ddrafft hon. Nid yw hynny wedi digwydd a hoffwn gael esboniad pam.

Y Prif Weinidog: Am y rheswm syml yr wyf newydd ei roi: os nad ydych yn gwybod a oes

whether there is a gap, you cannot put a sum in the budget.

Jeff Cuthbert: Do you agree, in terms of our priorities for education in Wales, that we must ensure that there is a good mixture of courses for our young people? We must ensure that there is a proper balance between traditional academic courses and vocational courses. Initiatives such as our 14-19 learning pathways must be supported, together with broader initiatives such as the Welsh baccalaureate.

Finally, while it is right and proper that we celebrate the success of our GCSE and A-level students, do you agree that we must also celebrate the successes of those achieving modern apprenticeships and similar courses?

The First Minister: I could not agree with you more. Education is about an awful lot more than A-levels and GCSEs, and making sure that everyone in the education system is motivated to learn and to achieve, and to exploit their potential to the full, must be at the heart of it. That is the reason for the innovations, which I mentioned in reply to Nick Bourne earlier, about the Welsh baccalaureate and the 14-19 curriculum. Right at the heart of that is the foundation phase for children aged three to seven.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Wrth edrych ar y gyllideb unwaith eto, gwelaf y bydd £20 miliwn yn cael ei gyflwyno i golegau addysg uwch yng Nghymru y flwyddyn nesaf i wneud iawn am yr arian y byddwch chi yn ei roi iddynt am na fyddwch yn codi ffioedd atodol yn 2006-07. Y ffigur a ddatgelwyd i ni gennyh ynghylch yr angen am y ffrwd incwm ychwanegol oedd £36 miliwn, ac eto £20 miliwn sydd yn y gyllideb. Pam?

Y Prif Weinidog: Sue Essex sy'n delio gyda manylion y gyllideb ac nid myfi, wrth gwrs. Os cofiaf yn iawn—ac yr wyf yn agored i gael fy nghywiro ar hyn, wrth gwrs—y ffigur oedd £25 miliwn ac nid £36 miliwn, er nad wyf yn siŵr am ba flwyddyn yr ydych yn sôn. Mae'n amlwg i mi mai at Sue Essex y dylid cyfeirio unrhyw gwestiynau manwl am y gyllideb.

bwlch ai peidio, ni allwch roi swm yn y gyllideb.

Jeff Cuthbert: A ydych yn cytuno, o ran ein blaenoriaethau ar gyfer addysg yng Nghymru, fod rhaid inni sicrhau bod cymysgedd dda o gyrsiau ar gael i'n pobl ifanc? Rhaid inni sicrhau cydbwysedd priodol rhwng cyrsiau academiaidd traddodiadol a chyrsiau galwedigaethol. Rhaid cefnogi mentrau fel ein llwybrau dysgu 14-19, ynghyd â chynlluniau ehangach megis bagloriaeth Cymru.

Yn olaf, er ei bod yn iawn inni ddathlu llwyddiant ein myfyrwyr TGAU a safon A, a ydych yn cytuno y dylem hefyd ddathlu llwyddiannau'r rhai sy'n llwyddo ar gyrsiau prentisiaeth fodern a rhai eraill tebyg?

Y Prif Weinidog: Cytunaf yn llwyr â chi. Mae addysg yn ymwneud â llawer mwy na safon A a TGAU, ac yn rhan ganolog o hyn rhaid sicrhau bod pawb yn y system addysg yn cael ei ysgogi i ddysgu ac i gyflawni, ac i fanteisio i'r eithaf ar eu potensial. Dyna'r rheswm dros yr arloesi, y soniais amdano yn fy ateb i Nick Bourne yn gynharach, dros fagloriaeth Cymru a'r cwricwlwm 14 – 19. Efen hanfodol o hynny yw'r cyfnod sylfaen i blant rhwng tair a saith oed.

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): In looking at the budget once again, I see that £20 million will be given to higher education colleges in Wales next year to compensate them for the money that you will give to them because you will not be increasing top-up fees in 2006-07. The figure that you revealed to us relating to the need for the supplementary income stream was £36 million, and yet £20 million is in the budget. Why?

The First Minister: Sue Essex deals with the budget details, of course, and not me. If I recall correctly—and I am, of course, happy to be corrected on this—the figure was £25 million and not £36 million, although I am not sure to which year you are referring. It is obvious to me that you should direct any detailed questions that you have about the budget to Sue Essex.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Yr ydych yn fy synnu, Brif Weinidog, oherwydd eich cyllideb chi yw hon, chi yw'r Prif Weinidog ac mae gennyf yr hawl i ofyn cwestiynau i chi am y gyllideb. Y ffigurau y bu ichi eu datgelu i ni oedd mai cost y ffrwd incwm ychwanegol yn 2006-07 fyddai £36.7 miliwn.

The amount in the budget is £20 million. I ask the question again: why?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae fy nghof i ohono yn hollol wahanol, rhaid imi ddweud. Er hynny, nid oes gennyf friff manwl ar y pwnc, ac nid oeddwn yn bresennol y bore yma, am resymau amlwg, pan oedd Sue yn cyflwyno'r gyllideb yn fanwl ac yn ei gosod gerbron y Cynulliad, felly nid wyf yn siŵr o'r gwahaniaeth rhwng y ffigurau nac o ble y cawsoch y ffigur o £36 miliwn. Y ffigur yr wyf fi'n cofio ei drafod oedd £25 miliwn.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Of course, we will have a further opportunity to consider that aspect. However, I must bring you back to your astonishing reply to Nick Bourne earlier on the funding gap between higher education institutions in Wales and those in the rest of the United Kingdom. There was a clear understanding that the gap would begin to be addressed in this budget round and, if it is not included in this budget round, we will take that to be an error on the part of the Government. We will be checking this budget very carefully to make absolutely sure that the commitment that was made by the National Assembly to the universities of Wales is kept. Will you now ensure, First Minister, that this draft budget is taken back and an appropriate figure included?

The First Minister: How on earth can you insert an appropriate figure, when the figures on which you would base that have not yet been completed because HEFCW has started but not yet completed its study? It has given us an undertaking that it will complete those figures by the end of this year; we can revisit this matter then.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):

Ieuan Wyn Jones: You surprise me, First Minister, because this is your budget, you are the First Minister of Wales and I have the right to ask you questions about the budget. The figures that you disclosed to us were that the cost of the supplementary income stream in 2006-07 would be £36.7 million.

Y swm sydd yn y gyllideb yw £20 miliwn. Eto, gofynnaf y cwestiwn: pam?

The First Minister: My recollection is completely different, I must say. However, I do not have a detailed brief on that, and I was not present this morning, for obvious reasons, when Sue gave a detailed presentation on the budget and laid it before the Assembly, so I am not sure about the disparity in the figures, nor of where you got that figure of £36 million. The figure that I remember being discussed was £25 million.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Wrth gwrs, cawn gyfle arall i ystyried yr agwedd honno. Fodd bynnag, rhaid imi ddod â chi yn ôl at eich ateb syfrdanol i Nick Bourne yn gynharach ynghylch y bwlch o ran cyllid rhwng sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru a rhai gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig. Yr oedd dealltwriaeth glir y byddai'r bwlch hwn yn dechrau derbyn sylw yn y rownd gyllideb bresennol ac, os nad yw'n cael ei gynnwys yn y rownd gyllideb hon, byddwn yn cymryd mai camgymeriad ar ran y Llywodraeth yw hynny. Byddwn yn mynd drwy'r gyllideb hon gyda chrib fân i wneud yn gwbl siŵr bod yr ymrwymiad a wnaethpwyd gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i brifysgolion Cymru yn cael ei gadw. A wnewch sicrhau yn awr, Brif Weinidog, fod y gyllideb ddrafft hon yn cael ei dychwelyd a ffigur priodol yn cael ei gynnwys?

Y Prif Weinidog: Sut ar y ddaear y gallwch gynnwys ffigur priodol pan fo'r ffigurau y byddech yn seilio hynny arnynt heb eu cwblhau eto am fod Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru wedi dechrau ond heb orffen ei astudiaeth eto? Mae wedi rhoi ymrwymiad y bydd yn cwblhau'r ffigurau hynny erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn; gallwn edrych ar y mater hwn eto bryd hynny.

Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): A

Could I just follow this logic through, First Minister? The Rees commission said that there was a £330 million funding gap over three years—that is a difference between England and Wales of nearly £1,000 per student. If it is the case that you have asked HEFCW to complete its work on finding the size of that funding gap, could you tell me whether you will receive that information by the end of this month or by the end of October? I understand that you are due to get it by the end of this month.

The First Minister: I am told that it will be by the end of this year, not the end of this month. I do not recall the Rees commission saying that there was a funding gap; it said that allegations of a funding gap had been made to it during evidence. Perhaps you would like to clarify that and write to me about it.

Michael German: I am rather more interested in the timetable here, First Minister. It was our understanding, on this side of the Chamber, that the funding gap would be addressed in the budget. Regardless of your dispute as to whether there is a funding gap or not, it is important that the information that we get from HEFCW is designed in such a way as to allow us to influence next year's budget.

2.20 p.m.

If there is a funding gap, the motion from the National Assembly for Wales was that we would begin to address that funding gap. If there is a funding gap, we need to know about it in time for the budget. Can you at least assure us that you will get that information into the public domain so that we know what the funding gap is—according to HEFCW—before the budget round is ended and before the final budget is provided by the National Assembly?

The First Minister: I would have thought that to be perfectly possible from the timings that I have, namely that research has been commissioned and that HEFCW will complete it by the end of this year. I would have thought that that would be before the end of all budget considerations.

gaf barhau gyda'r rhesymu hwn, Brif Weinidog? Dywedodd comisiwn Rees fod bwlch o ran cyllid o £330 miliwn dros dair blynedd—sef gwahaniaeth rhwng Cymru a Lloegr o bron £1,000 y myfyriwr. Os ydych wedi gofyn i Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru gwblhau ei waith ar ganfod maint y bwlch o ran cyllid, a allech ddweud wrthyf a fyddwch yn cael y wybodaeth honno erbyn diwedd y mis hwn neu erbyn diwedd mis Hydref? Deallaf y dylai fod yn eich llaw erbyn diwedd y mis hwn.

Y Prif Weinidog: Dywedwyd wrthyf y bydd yn fy llaw erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn, nid erbyn diwedd y mis. Nid wyf yn cofio comisiwn Rees yn dweud bod bwlch o ran cyllid; dywedodd fod rhai wedi honni wrtho fod bwlch o ran cyllid yn ystod y dystiolaeth. Efallai yr hoffech fanylu ymhellach ac ysgrifennu ataf ar y mater.

Michael German: Mae gennyf fwy o ddiddordeb yn yr amserlen yn y cyswllt hwn, Brif Weinidog. Ein dealltwriaeth ni, ar yr ochr hon i'r Siambr, oedd y byddai'r bwlch o ran cyllid yn cael sylw yn y gyllideb. Er eich bod yn anghydweld ynghylch a oes bwlch o ran cyllid ai peidio, mae'n bwysig bod y wybodaeth a gawn gan y cyngor cyllido yn cael ei llunio fel y gallwn ddylanwadu ar gyllideb y flwyddyn nesaf.

Os oes bwlch o ran cyllid, y cynnig gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru oedd y byddem yn dechrau mynd i'r afael â'r bwlch hwnnw. Os oes bwlch o ran cyllid, rhaid inni gael gwybod amdano mewn pryd ar gyfer y gyllideb. A allwch o leiaf ein sicrhau y byddwch yn cyhoeddi'r wybodaeth honno fel y gallwn wybod beth yw'r bwlch cyllido—yn ôl y cyngor cyllido—cyn i gylch y gyllideb ddod i ben a chyn i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gyflwyno'r gyllideb derfynol?

Y Prif Weinidog: Byddwn yn tybio bod hynny'n berffaith bosibl yn ôl yr amserlen sydd gennyf, sef bod yr ymchwil wedi'i chomisiynu ac y bydd y cyngor cyllido yn ei chwblhau erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn. Byddwn yn tybio y byddai hynny cyn ystyried pob dim ynghylch y gyllideb.

Michael German: As you know, we have to complete the final budget to a certain date, and it comes under an unamendable motion. We therefore need some sort of mechanism in place to ensure that that debate takes place. It is also my understanding that HEFCW has briefed the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee that it is using two methodologies to arrive at its conclusions. There will, therefore, be two answers to the question on the funding gap. Will you ensure that we get both answers to both formulas published, so that we do not simply have the lowest common figure being taken by the Government?

The First Minister: I have made it absolutely clear that the matter is an open book. That is a commitment, and we will continue with it. It may be the subject of argument precisely because there may be two perfectly sound methods of comparing England and Wales, or England and Wales and Scotland—I am not sure. Either way, I believe it to be the case that you cannot compromise the quality of the information by asking people to do three months' work in one month. That would make no sense at all.

Michael German: Fel y gwyddoch, rhaid inni gwblhau'r gyllideb derfynol erbyn dyddiad penodol, a daw o dan gynnig na ellir ei ddiwygio. Felly, mae angen rhyw fath o fecanwaith i sicrhau bod y ddadl honno'n digwydd. Yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf hefyd, mae'r cyngor cyllido wedi briffio'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ei fod yn defnyddio dwy fethodoleg i lunio'i gasgliadau. Gan hynny, bydd dau ateb i'r cwestiwn am y bwlch o ran cyllid. A wnewch sicrhau y cyhoeddir y ddau ateb i'r ddwy fformiwla, fel nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn gwneud dim ond derbyn y ffigur cyffredin isaf?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf wedi dweud yn hollol glir bod y mater yn benagored. Mae hynny'n ymrwymiad, a byddwn yn parhau gydag ef. Efallai y bydd dadlau yn ei gylch am y rheswm syml y bydd efallai ddau ddull cwbl ddibynadwy o gymharu Cymru a Lloegr, neu Gymru a Lloegr a'r Alban—nid wyf yn siŵr. Y naill ffordd neu'r llall, credaf na allwch gyfaddawdu o ran ansawdd y wybodaeth drwy ofyn i bobl wneud gwaith tri mis mewn mis. Ni fyddai hynny'n gwneud dim synnwyr o gwbl.

Dyled ymhlith Myfyrwyr Meddygol Debt among Medical Students

C4 David Lloyd: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar dyled ymhlith myfyrwyr meddygol? OAQ0751(FM)

Q4 David Lloyd: Will the First Minister make a statement on debt among medical students? OAQ0751(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Telir ffioedd myfyrwyr meddygol, ac mae bwrsariau ar sail profion modd ar gael o flwyddyn 5 eu hastudiaethau, neu o flwyddyn 2 i fyfyrwyr meddygol sy'n ymuno fel graddedigion. Yr ydym wedi gofyn i sefydliadau addysg uwch ystyried sut y gellid lleihau costau i fyfyrwyr yn ystod eu lleoliad.

The First Minister: Medical students have fees paid and are eligible for means-tested bursaries from year 5 of their studies, or year 2 for graduate-entry medical students. Higher education institutions have been asked to consider where expenses for students during placements may be minimised.

David Lloyd: Myfyrwyr meddygol sydd â rhai o'r dyledion mwyaf, ac un coleg meddygol yn unig sydd yng Nghymru. Beth a wnewch i helpu gyda dyledion, neu ai dim ond pobl gyfoethog a all ddod yn feddygon?

David Lloyd: Medical students have some of the biggest debts, and there is only one medical college in Wales. What will you do to help with the debt issue, or will only wealthy people be able to become doctors?

Y Prif Weinidog: Un coleg meddygol sydd, wrth gwrs, ond bydd dau gampws ychwanegol—a thrydydd, cyn hir—i raddedigion fynd iddynt, sef Abertawe,

The First Minister: There is, of course, only one medical college, but there are two additional campuses—and a third, before long—for graduates to attend, namely at

Bangor a Wrecsam, neu Ysgol Glinigol Gogledd Cymru, a Gwent. Mewn gwirionedd, mae pedwar campws. Yr ydym wedi codi nifer y bobl sy'n dod i mewn i ysgolion meddygol, neu gampysau meddygol, 90 y cant dros y chwe blynedd diwethaf, gan bron â'i dyblu. Hefyd, ni welaf unrhyw dystiolaeth mai dim ond pobl o deuluoedd sy'n gyffyrddus yn ariannol sy'n ymgymryd ag astudiaethau meddygol. Er ein bod wedi codi cyfanswm y bobl sy'n mynd i'r ysgolion meddygol 90 y cant mewn chwe blynedd, mae'r sefydliadau yn parhau i gael saith cais am bob lle. Felly, mae'r sefyllfa yn un iachus dros ben o ran ceisiadau am y lleoedd sydd ar gael, er bod nifer y lleoedd hynny bron wedi dyblu.

Jonathan Morgan: You might be aware of the joint survey undertaken by the *Nursing Times* and Unison of 2,000 nurses. The survey found that 14 per cent of student nurses had accumulated debts of over £10,000. That is up from 6 per cent in 2003, and it demonstrates the rapid increase in the number of student nurses who are now experiencing real hardship. Bearing in mind that we are now registering more nurses from overseas to work in the NHS in Wales, do you not think that we ought to start addressing this real problem, and is it any wonder, therefore, that we have to fill staffing gaps with nurses from overseas because of the financial constraints faced by many young people?

The First Minister: I think that you had a non sequitur in there somewhere. You would have to demonstrate, to support your thesis that, somehow or other, student debt among nurses was causing us to bring in more nurses from overseas, that there was evidence that we were failing to produce more of our own nurses. Actually, we are increasing massively the number of nurses because we have increased enormously the number of nursing places, and nurses are getting good-quality jobs as a result of that major increase in nursing places. Therefore, the matter of nurses from overseas is a completely different issue and relates more to policy decisions taken decades ago.

Jenny Randerson: An impact of the debt that student nurses get into is that many are

Swansea, Bangor and Wrexham, or the North Wales Clinical School, and Gwent. In effect, there are four campuses. We have increased the number of people entering the medical schools, or medical campuses, by 90 per cent over the last six years, almost doubling it. Also, I do not see any evidence that it is only people from financially comfortable families who are taking up medical studies. Although we have increased the total number attending medical school by 90 per cent in six years, the institutions continue to receive seven applications for every place. Therefore, the situation with regard to applications against available places is in rude health, despite the fact that the number of places has almost doubled.

Jonathan Morgan: Efallai y gwyddoch am yr arolwg ar y cyd a wnaed gan y *Nursing Times* ac Unsain ymhlith 2,000 o nyrsys. Yn ôl yr arolwg, yr oedd 14 y cant o nyrsys dan hyfforddiant wedi cronni dyledion o dros £10,000. Mae hynny'n gynydd o'i gymharu â 2003 pan oedd y ffigur yn 6 y cant, ac yn dangos y cynnydd cyflym iawn yn nifer y nyrsys dan hyfforddiant sy'n wynebu caledi go iawn erbyn hyn. O gofio ein bod bellach yn cofrestru mwy o nyrsys tramor i weithio yn y GIG yng Nghymru, onid ydych yn credu y dylem ddechrau rhoi sylw i'r broblem real iawn hon, ac a oes unrhyw syndod, felly, fod yn rhaid inni lenwi bylchau o ran staffio gyda nyrsys tramor oherwydd y cyfyngiadau ariannol sydd ar lawer o bobl ifanc?

Y Prif Weinidog: Credaf fod gennych gamgasgliad yn eich cwestiwn yn rhywle. I gefnogi eich honiad bod dyled ymhlith nyrsys dan hyfforddiant, rywsut neu'i gilydd, yn arwain at recriwtio mwy o nyrsys tramor, byddai'n rhaid ichi ddangos tystiolaeth ein bod yn methu â chynhyrchu mwy o'n nyrsys ein hunain. Mewn gwirionedd, mae nifer y nyrsys wedi cynyddu'n aruthrol gan ein bod wedi cynyddu nifer y lleoedd nyrsio'n sylweddol iawn, ac mae nyrsys yn cael swyddi da o ganlyniad i'r cynnydd enfawr hwn mewn lleoedd. Felly, mae recriwtio nyrsys tramor yn fater cwbl wahanol ac yn ymwneud mwy â phenderfyniadau polisi a wnaethpwyd ddegau o flynyddoedd yn ôl.

Jenny Randerson: Un o effeithiau'r ddyled y mae nyrsys dan hyfforddiant yn gorfod ei

forced to work in order to supplement their income, on top of their studies. The survey to which Jonathan referred found that more than half of student nurses are working at least 11 hours per week in supplementary jobs. We are used to the idea that students, in general, work to supplement their income, and we have accepted that to a large extent. However, there are surely problems in terms of patient safety if student nurses have to work exceptionally long hours, because, unlike other students, they are doing their training on the job, which means dealing with real patients for most of the time. What is your response to the problems that student nurses face in terms of having to take additional jobs in order to supplement their income?

The First Minister: Like you, Jenny, I do not think that there is a problem as long as the hours are not excessive and do not lead to people being exhausted on the job. Everyone has accepted that it is part of life today, as it has been in American universities for decades, if not centuries. A small amount of supplementing income from doing jobs on Saturdays, Sundays and some evenings is part of the way in which students learn to balance their incomes and reduce their debts, without compromising their studies. When you work in the same field, as many nursing students do by working in nursing or care homes, it is relevant to their studies, up to the point where exhaustion becomes a problem. However, I am not aware of any problems of that kind emerging, unless the survey indicates that.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 5, OAQ0778(FM), yn ôl.

hysgwyddo yw bod llawer yn gorfod gweithio i gynyddu eu hincwm, a hynny ar ben eu hastudiaethau. Yn ôl yr arolwg y cyfeiriodd Jonathan ato, mae mwy na hanner y nyrsys dan hyfforddiant yn gweithio o leiaf 11 awr yr wythnos mewn swyddi ychwanegol. Yr ydym wedi arfer â'r syniad bod myfyrwyr, yn gyffredinol, yn gweithio i chwyddo eu hincwm, ac wedi derbyn hynny i raddau helaeth. Fodd bynnag, onid oes problem gyda diogelwch cleifion os oes rhaid i nyrsys dan hyfforddiant weithio oriau maith iawn, oherwydd, yn wahanol i fyfyrwyr eraill, maent yn hyfforddi wrth eu gwaith, sy'n golygu delio â chleifion go iawn y rhan fwyaf o'r amser? Beth yw eich ymateb i'r problemau a wynebdir gan nyrsys dan hyfforddiant o ran gorfod gwneud swyddi ychwanegol i gynyddu eu hincwm?

Y Prif Weinidog: Fel chi, Jenny, nid wyf yn credu bod problem cyn belled nad yw'r oriau'n ormodol ac nad ydynt yn arwain at bobl sydd wedi gorflino'n llwyr yn eu gwaith. Mae pawb yn derbyn ei fod yn rhan o fywyd heddiw, fel y mae mewn prifysgolion yn America ers degau lawer o flynyddoedd, os nad canrifoedd. Mae rhywfaint o weithio i gynyddu incwm drwy wneud swyddi ar ddydd Sadwrn, ar ddydd Sul a rhai nosweithiau yn rhan o'r ffordd y mae myfyrwyr yn dysgu sut i gydbwysu eu hincwm a lleihau eu dyledion, heb effeithio ar eu hastudiaethau. Os yw'r gwaith yn yr un maes, fel sy'n digwydd yn achos nifer o nyrsys dan hyfforddiant sy'n gweithio mewn cartrefi nyrsio neu gartrefi gofal, mae'n berthnasol i'w hastudiaethau, hyd at y pwynt lle y mae gorflinder llwyr yn dod yn broblem. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn ymwybodol o broblemau felly yn codi, oni bai fod yr arolwg yn dweud hynny.

The Presiding Officer: Question 5, OAQ0778(FM), has been withdrawn.

Undebau Credyd yng Nghymru Credit Unions in Wales

Q6 Jeff Cuthbert: What discussions has the First Minister had with the UK Government on the role of credit unions in Wales? OAQ0758(FM)

C6 Jeff Cuthbert: Pa drafodaethau a fu rhwng y Prif Weinidog a Llywodraeth y DU ynglŷn â rôl undebau credyd yng Nghymru? OAQ0758(FM)

The First Minister: I have had no

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf wedi cael

discussions personally, however, Edwina Hart's officials within the Social Justice and Regeneration Department are in regular contact with a variety of UK Government departments including the Department of Trade and Industry, the Department for Work and Pensions and the Treasury.

Jeff Cuthbert: Do you join me in applauding the Caerphilly and District Credit Union, whose new building was opened by Janice Gregory and me on 8 September, and which now has over 1,500 members on its books? It will shortly employ a financial inclusion officer, one of whose main jobs will be to encourage new members to invest their child trust fund with it. Do you agree that credit unions go a long way to enhancing our programme of social justice, particularly by tackling the very dubious role played by loan sharks in our poorer communities?

The First Minister: I agree with you. Unless it has moved office again, the Caerphilly credit union was the one that I visited with you some months ago, during the general election. It is an extremely successful credit union. I do not know where the credit union would be placed in the league table in Wales—quite high up, I would imagine—but it is still well below the big Irish credit unions that have 30,000 or 40,000 members. We have started a long way behind Ireland, and we have a lot of catching up to do.

Laura Anne Jones: As we are all aware, many families in Wales find it very difficult to afford school uniforms. I was, therefore, very pleased to note a pilot project that enables some credit unions to provide instant access to low-cost loans in order to purchase school uniforms. If the project is successful, will you ensure that it is rolled out to all corners of Wales, including Monmouthshire, which currently has no credit union? Some residents of Monmouthshire would benefit greatly from this.

The First Minister: I would commend the people of the Monmouthshire area, which is part of your regional constituency, to involve

trafodaethau fy hun, fodd bynnag mae swyddogion Edwina Hart yn yr Adran Cyfiawnder Troseddol ac Adfywio mewn cysylltiad rheolaidd â gwahanol adrannau o Lywodraeth y DU, gan gynnwys yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant, yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau, a'r Trysorlys.

Jeff Cuthbert: A wnewch ymuno â mi i gymeradwyo Undeb Credyd Caerffili a'r Cylch, yr agorwyd ei adeilad newydd gan Janice Gregory a minnau ar 8 Medi, ac sydd bellach â mwy na 1,500 o aelodau ar ei lyfrau? Cyn bo hir bydd yn cyflogi swyddog cynhwysiant ariannol ac un o brif dasgau'r swyddog hwnnw fydd annog aelodau newydd i fuddsoddi eu cronfa ymddiriedolaeth plant gyda'r undeb. A gytunwch fod undebau credyd yn gwneud llawer iawn i ehangu ein rhaglen cyfiawnder cymdeithasol, yn enwedig drwy fynd i'r afael â'r rôl amheus iawn a chwaraeir gan fenthycwyr diegwyddor yn ein cymunedau tlotaf?

Y Prif Weinidog: Cytunaf yn llwyr. Oni bai ei fod wedi symud swyddfa eto, undeb credyd Caerffili oedd yr un y bûm yn ymweld ag ef gyda chi rai misoedd yn ôl, yn ystod yr etholiad cyffredinol. Mae'n undeb credyd hynod lwyddiannus. Ni wn ym mhle y byddem yn gosod yr undeb credyd yn nhabl y gynghrair yng Nghymru—yn eithaf uchel, byddwn yn tybio—ond mae'n dal i fod yn llawer llai na'r undebau credyd mawr yn Iwerddon sydd â 30,000 neu 40,000 o aelodau. Yr ydym wedi dechrau ymhell ar ôl Iwerddon, ac mae llawer eto ar ôl i'w wneud cyn i ni gyrraedd y lefel honno.

Laura Anne Jones: Fel y gwyddom i gyd, mae nifer o deuluoedd yng Nghymru yn ei chael yn anodd iawn fforddio prynu gwisg ysgol. Yr oeddwn yn falch iawn, felly, o weld prosiect peilot lle y mae undebau credyd yn gallu cynnig benthyciadau rhad ar unwaith i brynu gwisg ysgol. Os yw'r prosiect yn llwyddiannus, a wnewch sicrhau ei fod yn cael ei gyflwyno i bob cwr o Gymru, gan gynnwys sir Fynwy, sydd heb undeb credyd o gwbl ar hyn o bryd? Byddai rhai o drigolion sir Fynwy yn elwa'n fawr ohono.

Y Prif Weinidog: Byddwn yn annog pobl ardal sir Fynwy, sy'n rhan o'ch etholaeth ranbarthol, i ymroi i'r gwaith o redeg

themselves in running credit unions, where appropriate. It would be a very good thing to do, because it would enable them to access the provisions of the measure that Huw Lewis passed through our procedures and which allows people to bring in measures that we accepted. These include the provision by credit unions of low-coast loans for school uniforms where families have suffered real hardship, particularly with the lumpy nature of the amount of expenditure during the weeks before children go back to school in September.

Catherine Thomas: Many credit unions in Wales are working very hard to improve and diversify their services. Will you join me, as the two-thousandth member of the credit union in Llanelli, in congratulating it on its work, especially its work with many sub-post offices in Communities First areas in Llanelli? The fact that the credit union is branching out in this way ensures that many vulnerable constituents in Llanelli are accessing services that they would otherwise not be able to access.

2.30 p.m.

The First Minister: I do, especially against the background of decreasing numbers of banks and post offices in deprived areas. However, credit unions are not immune to the same problem. To run an efficient credit union, you need to get many thousands of people on your books, and they are therefore under pressure to amalgamate, but if you amalgamate, you lose some of the voluntary-body ethos that I spoke of in my reply to Laura Anne Jones. Sometimes you lose the local access points, which are perhaps the glory of the credit union, but you still have to be efficient. To be efficient, you have to be big, but you want to keep the spirit that imbued you when you were small and the access in the most deprived areas that are unbanked and sometimes do not have a post office either.

undebau credyd, lle y bo hynny'n briodol. Byddai'n beth rhagorol iawn gan y byddai'n eu galluogi i wneud defnydd o ddarpariaethau'r mesur a basiwyd gan Huw Lewis drwy ein gweithdrefnau, ac sy'n caniatáu i bobl gyflwyno mesurau a dderbyniwyd gennym. Mae'r rhain yn cynnwys darpariaeth lle y bydd undebau credyd yn cynnig benthyciadau rhad i brynu gwisg ysgol lle y bydd teuluoedd wedi dioddef caledi go iawn, yn enwedig gyda chyfnodau o wario trwm megis yr wythnosau cyn i'r plant fynd yn ôl i'r ysgol ym mis Medi.

Catherine Thomas: Mae nifer o undebau credyd yng Nghymru yn gweithio'n galed iawn i wella ac arallgyfeirio eu gwasanaethau. A wnewch ymuno â mi, y ddwy filfed aelod o'r undeb credyd yn Llanelli, i'w longyfarch ar ei waith, yn enwedig ei waith gyda nifer o is-swyddfeydd post mewn ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn Llanelli? Mae'r ffaith bod yr undeb credyd yn ehangu fel hyn yn sicrhau bod nifer o etholwyr agored i niwed yn Llanelli yn cael mynediad at wasanaethau na fyddent fel arall yn gallu cael mynediad atynt.

Y Prif Weinidog: Ydwyf, yn enwedig yn erbyn cefndir y gostyngiad yn niferoedd banciau a swyddfeydd post mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig. Fodd bynnag, nid yw undebau credyd yn ddiogel rhag yr un broblem. I redeg undeb credyd effeithlon, mae angen cael miloedd lawer o bobl ar eich llyfrau, ac felly maent dan bwysau i uno â'i gilydd, ond o uno, collir rhywfaint o ethos corff gwirfoddol y soniais amdano yn fy ateb i Laura Anne Jones. Weithiau collir y pwyntiau mynediad lleol, sef pennaf rhinwedd yr undeb credyd o bosib, ond mae'n rhaid bod yn effeithlon er hynny. I fod yn effeithlon, rhaid bod yn fawr, ond mae eisiau cadw'r ysbryd a'ch taniodd pan oeddech yn fach a'r cyfle i gael mynediad yn yr ardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig sydd heb fanc ac weithiau heb swyddfa bost ychwaith.

**Llywyddiaeth y DU o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd
UK Presidency of the European Union**

Q7 Sandy Mewies: Will the First Minister make a statement on Wales's role in the UK presidency of the European Union? OAQ0761(FM)

The First Minister: Wales is hosting several UK presidency events, including the two ministerial informal meetings, which have now been held. There are another eight badged events, which are not, strictly speaking, EU Ministers' meetings but they are under the heading of the UK presidency. I had the pleasure of participating, with Jack McConnell, when all of the UK Cabinet and Jack and I met the College of Commissioners of the European Union on 1 July, when the British presidency started, so that we could also get our six pennyworth in.

Sandy Mewies: Having already hosted the Gimmich, as you have already mentioned, and looking forward to the youth event being held here in Cardiff at the end of October, would you agree that such events play a wonderful part in raising the profile of Wales in Europe and Europe in Wales, which we regularly see in our Committee on European and External Affairs meetings when we hear of the work that the Welsh Assembly Government is doing in Europe?

The First Minister: The committee does that job of keeping Europe on the agenda in Wales, and these presidency events, which have until now taken place once every seven and a half years, and which, from now on, will be once every 12 and a half years—unless the rules change—serve the opposite role of raising Wales's profile in Europe. We have taken every opportunity to promote it to the travelling coterie of many hundreds of journalists who travel around with these ministerial meetings, and none of the Ministers who have visited Wales so far will forget that they have been to Wales for their ministerial informal council meeting because of the warmth of the welcome that they received.

Janet Davies: The UK presidency is now halfway through its term. Looking for some drive and momentum in this presidency is

C7 Sandy Mewies: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar rôl Cymru yn llywyddiaeth y DU o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd? OAQ0761(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae Cymru'n cynnal nifer o ddigwyddiadau cysylltiedig â llywyddiaeth y DU, gan gynnwys y ddau gyfarfod anffurfiol i weinidogion sydd bellach wedi'u cynnal. Mae wyth digwyddiad bathodynol arall nad ydynt, a bod yn fanwl gywir, yn gyfarfodydd Gweinidogion yr UE ond deuant dan bennawd llywyddiaeth y DU. Cefais y pleser o gymryd rhan, gyda Jack McConnell, pan gyfarfu Cabinet cyfan y DU a Jack a minnau â Choleg Comisiynwyr yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ar 1 Gorffennaf, pan ddechreuodd llywyddiaeth Prydain, fel y gallem ninnau hefyd roi ein pig i mewn.

Sandy Mewies: Wedi cynnal y Ginnich yn barod, fel y soniasoch eisoes, a chan edrych ymlaen at y digwyddiad ieuenticid a gynhelir yma yng Nghaerdydd ddiwedd mis Hydref, a gytunech fod digwyddiadau o'r fath yn chwarae rhan fendigedig o ran codi proffil Cymru yn Ewrop ac Ewrop yng Nghymru, rhywbeth a welwn yn rheolaidd yng nghyfarfodydd ein Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd ac Allanol pan glywn am y gwaith y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n ei wneud yn Ewrop?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r pwyllgor yn gwneud y gwaith hwnnw o gadw Ewrop ar yr agenda yng Nghymru, ac mae'r digwyddiadau hyn yn sgîl y llywyddiaeth, sydd hyd yma wedi digwydd un waith bob saith mlynedd a hanner, ac a fydd, o hyn allan, yn digwydd un waith bob 12 mlynedd a hanner—os na newidir y rheolau—yn cyflawni'r rôl i'r gwrthwyneb o godi proffil Cymru yn Ewrop. Yr ydym wedi manteisio ar bob cyfle i'w hyrwyddo i'r criw teithiol o gannoedd o ohebwy'r a fydd yn teithio o amgylch gyda'r cyfarfodydd gweinidogol hyn, ac ni wnaiff neb o'r Gweinidogion sydd wedi ymweld â Chymru hyd yn hyn anghofio eu bod wedi dod i Gymru i'w cyfarfod anffurfiol o gyngor y gweinidogion oherwydd cynhesrwydd y croeso a gawsant.

Janet Davies: Mae llywyddiaeth y DU hanner ffordd drwy ei thymor erbyn hyn. Mae edrych am rywfaint o egni a momentwm

like looking for a needle in a haystack. What pressure have you, as First Minister, put on the UK Government, which holds the presidency, to move towards making a decision on the budget and subsequently on eligibility for structural funds?

The First Minister: I think that you are being a bit harsh there in your judgment because there are three months to go; effectively there have only been two months so far because August is, despite best British efforts, a bit of a wipeout in the heart of European institutions. The big thing is whether all the ducks can be got in a row for a budget settlement and how much of that budget settlement, which is a massive issue, can be achieved in the presidency halfway through December. It would be a huge achievement if that could be brought together during the British presidency because it would please eight of the 10 new member states and it would also please us in Wales.

Cnydau Ynni Energy Crops

Q8 Mick Bates: Will the First Minister make a statement on energy crops in Wales?
OAO0768(FM)

The First Minister: We have brought in the wood energy business scheme, with a budget of £13.3 million as at May 2004. There were 33 applications involved for wood-fuel plants under that scheme.

Mick Bates: I am sure that you are aware that energy crops have much-needed potential to help resolve some of our problems with the supply of oil, and they could also generate a great deal of wealth in rural Wales. Your colleagues in London have taken up those points and have offered £29 million to support energy crops in England. However, there is no such scheme in Wales. I know what communications are like in the Cabinet at present, but the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside has £40 million unspent in his budget, half of which is farmers' money. Why are you not using that money for an energy crop scheme in Wales?

yn y llywyddiaeth hon fel chwilio am nodwydd mewn tas wair. Pa bwysau yr ydych chi, fel Prif Weinidog, wedi'i roi ar Lywodraeth y DU, sydd â'r llywyddiaeth, i symud tuag at wneud penderfyniad ar y gyllideb ac yn sgîl hynny ar gymhwysedd i dderbyn arian o'r cronfeydd strwythurol?

Y Prif Weinidog: Credaf eich bod ychydig yn hallt yn eich beirniadaeth oherwydd y mae tri mis i fynd; i bob pwrpas dim ond deufis a gafwyd hyd yma gan fod mis Awst, er i Brydain wneud ei gorau, yn dipyn o dwll du yng nghalon sefydliadau Ewrop. Y peth mawr yw a ellir trefnu'r hwyaid yn rhes ar gyfer setlo'r gyllideb a faint o'r setliad hwnnw, sydd yn fater enfawr, y gellir ei sicrhau yn y llywyddiaeth hanner ffordd drwy fis Rhagfyr. Byddai'n gamp aruthrol pe gellid dwyn hynny ynghyd yn ystod llywyddiaeth Prydain oherwydd byddai'n plesio wyth o'r 10 aelod-wladwriaeth newydd a byddai hefyd yn ein plesio ni yng Nghymru.

C8 Mick Bates: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar gnydau ynni yng Nghymru?
OAO0768(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym wedi cyflwyno'r cynllun busnes ynni coed, gyda chyllideb o £13.3 miliwn ym Mai 2004. Cafwyd 33 o geisiadau am weithfeydd tanwydd coed dan y cynllun hwnnw.

Mick Bates: Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol bod gan gnydau ynni botensial sy'n wirioneddol angenrheidiol i helpu i ddatrys rhai o'n problemau gyda chyflenwad olew, a gallent greu llawer iawn o gyfoeth yng nghefn gwlad Cymru hefyd. Mae eich cyd-aelodau yn Lloegr wedi gweithredu ar y pwyntiau hynny ac wedi cynnig £29 miliwn i gynorthwyo cnydau ynni yn Lloegr. Fodd bynnag, nid oes cynllun o'r fath yng Nghymru. Gwn sut y mae o ran cyfathrebu yn y Cabinet ar hyn o bryd, ond mae gan y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad £40 miliwn heb eu gwario yn ei gyllideb, a hanner hynny'n arian ffermwyr. Pam nad ydych yn defnyddio'r arian hwnnw i dalu am gynllun cnydau ynni yng Nghymru?

The First Minister: You are wrong. The wood energy business scheme to which I referred has an allocation of £13.3 million. It helps to develop markets for energy crops and to set up local wood-burning fuel plants. That is a high priority for us, because when Shotton Paper Company plc started to use only recycled paper, it did not need a lot of the thinnings that previously went into the mixture of recycled paper and wood. As a result, we now have a lot of surplus wood, and, therefore, our priority is to use that wood in wood-burning fuel plants.

Brynle Williams: Only last week, several Members stated their concerns regarding the short-sighted approach of technical advice note 8 in addressing the energy issue. As a substitute for conventional fuels, as my colleague, Mr Bates, has pointed out, biofuels could offer security for the UK energy sector by increasing the diversity of sources. It is accepted that biofuels could reduce carbon dioxide emissions from transport to a low level, and this fuel would most likely be sourced from energy crops. Given the support from the industry and rural communities, will you consider introducing incentives to farmers for diversification into this area?

The First Minister: The budget issues relating to having an identity of scheme between Wales and England do not make sense, because we decided that we would use our modulation money to expand Tir Cynnal, whereas in England they decided that they do not really have schemes that are as highly regarded as Tir Cynnal. They therefore went for an early investment in wood energy burning crops. We have gone for Tir Cynnal and developing the market for wood energy crops. I have had discussions this summer, following the National Eisteddfod of Wales, with the Centre for Alternative Land Use about the potential for Miscanthus and other wood energy burning crops. That was interesting, but it is not ready for the market yet; there is still quite a lot of research to be done—probably over a period of around two to three years—before we can go for a Miscanthus-burning scheme.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych yn anghywir. Mae dyraniad o £13.3 miliwn ar gyfer y cynllun busnes ynni coed y cyfeiriais ato. Mae'n helpu i ddatblygu marchnadoedd ar gyfer cynydau ynni ac i sefydlu gweithfeydd lleol sy'n rhedeg ar danwydd llosgi coed. Mae hynny'n flaenoriaeth uchel i ni, oherwydd pan ddechreuodd Cwmni Papur Shotton ccc ddefnyddio dim ond papur wedi'i ailgylchu, nid oedd arno angen llawer o'r teneuon a âi gynt i'r cymysgedd o bapur wedi'i ailgylchu a choed. O ganlyniad, bellach mae gennym lawer o goed dros ben, ac felly, ein blaenoriaeth yw defnyddio'r coed hynny mewn gweithfeydd tanwydd llosgi coed.

Brynle Williams: Yr wythnos diwethaf, mynegodd sawl Aelod eu pryderon ynghylch agwedd fyrolwg nodyn cyngor technegol 8 wrth drafod cwestiwn ynni. Yn lle tanwydd confensiynol, fel y nododd fy nghyd-Aelod, Mr Bates, gallai biodanwydd gynnig sicrwydd i sector ynni'r DU drwy gynyddu'r amrywiaeth o ffynonellau. Derbynir y gallai biodanwydd leihau gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid o drafndiaeth i lefel isel, ac mae'n eithaf tebygol mai o gnydau ynni y ceid y tanwydd hwn. O ystyried y gefnogaeth o du'r diwydiant a'r cymunedau gwledig, a wnewch ystyried cyflwyno cymhellion i ffermwyr i arallgyfeirio i'r maes hwn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid yw'r cwestiynau'n ymwneud â'r gyllideb mewn perthynas â chael yr un cynllun rhwng Cymru a Lloegr yn gwneud synnwyr, oherwydd penderfynasom y byddem yn defnyddio ein harian modiwlleiddio ni i ehangu Tir Cynnal, tra penderfynwyd yn Lloegr nad oes ganddynt mewn gwirionedd gynlluniau sydd mor uchel eu parch â Tir Cynnal. Aethant hwy ati felly i fuddsoddi'n gynnar mewn cynydau llosgi ynni coed. Yr ydym ni wedi dewis Tir Cynnal a datblygu'r farchnad ar gyfer cynydau ynni coed. Yr wyf wedi cael trafodaethau yn ystod yr haf, ar ôl yr Eisteddfod Genedlaethol, gyda'r Ganolfan Defnydd Tir Amgen ynglŷn â'r potensial ar gyfer Miscanthus a chnydau eraill sy'n llosgi ynni coed. Yr oedd hynny'n ddiddorol, ond nid yw'n barod ar gyfer y farchnad eto; mae cryn dipyn o waith ymchwil i'w wneud o hyd—dros gyfnod o ryw ddwy i dair blynedd, mae'n debyg—cyn

y gallwn fwrw ati â chynllun llosgi Miscanthus.

Parafeddygon yng Nghymru Paramedics in Wales

Q9 Glyn Davies: What plans does the First Minister have to increase the number of paramedics in Wales? OAQ0766(FM)

The First Minister: The number of paramedics in Wales has increased from 627 in 2002 to 668 in 2004—those are the latest figures available. Future increases will need to be considered in the light of the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust's workforce plans.

Glyn Davies: I am sure that you accept that the key matter in responding to accidents is how quickly someone reaches the scene to make a decision about what is the appropriate treatment. In rural areas, it is difficult for ambulance services to reach their destination quickly. The growing number of first responders is welcome, but it does not serve the required purpose. You said that there has been a slight increase in the number of paramedics. However, do you accept that the ambulance service in Wales, if it is going to do the job that we all want it to do, needs to be supported by a much greater number of paramedics than you seem to be currently planning for?

The First Minister: I think that is quite a healthy increase in the space of two years, Glyn; you are perhaps not accepting the importance of the figures that I gave. We are also bringing in the developing emergency care services plan, which involves trying to work out the balance between first responders, paramedics with different levels of qualifications—there are four different kinds of paramedics now—and community care services because we all know, probably from examples in our own families, that there is a lot of inefficient use of paramedics, particularly because of the changes in the out-of-hours service. Paramedics will go to a house, see somebody and all that they can do is take them to hospital, because they are not yet trained to be able to do a triage in the

C9 Glyn Davies: Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Prif Weinidog i gynyddu nifer y parafeddygon yng Nghymru? OAQ0766(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae nifer y parafeddygon yng Nghymru wedi cynyddu o 627 yn 2002 i 668 yn 2004—dyna'r ffigurau diweddaraf sydd ar gael. Bydd angen ystyried unrhyw gynnydd pellach yng ngoleuni cynlluniau gweithlu Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwlans Cymru.

Glyn Davies: Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn derbyn mai'r mater allweddol wrth ymateb i ddamweiniau yw pa mor gyflym y cyrhaeddir y fan a'r lle i wneud penderfyniad ynghylch beth yw'r driniaeth briodol. Mewn ardaloedd gwledig, mae'n anodd i wasanaethau ambiwlans gyrraedd eu cyrchfan yn gyflym. Mae'r twf yn nifer yr ymatebwyr cyntaf i'w groesawu, ond nid yw'n ateb y diben. Dywedasoed fod cynnydd bach wedi bod yn nifer y parafeddygon. Fodd bynnag, a dderbyniwch fod angen i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yng Nghymru, os yw am wneud y gwaith y mae ar bawb ohonom eisiau iddo ei wneud, gael ei gefnogi gan nifer llawer mwy o barafeddygon nag yr ymddengys eich bod yn cynllunio ar ei gyfer ar hyn o bryd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Credaf fod hynny'n gynnydd eithaf iach o fewn dwy flynedd, Glyn; efallai nad ydych yn derbyn pwysigrwydd y ffigurau a roddais. Yr ydym hefyd yn cyflwyno'r cynllun datblygu gwasanaethau gofal brys, lle y ceisir canfod y cydbwysedd rhwng ymatebwyr cyntaf, parafeddygon gyda gwahanol lefelau o gymwysterau—mae pedwar math gwahanol o barafeddyg erbyn hyn—a gwasanaethau gofal cymunedol oherwydd gŵyr pawb ohonom, ar sail enghreifftiau yn ein teuluoedd ein hunain yn ôl pob tebyg, fod llawer o ddefnydd aneffeithiol o barafeddygon, yn arbennig oherwydd y newidiadau yn y gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau. Bydd parafeddygon yn mynd i dŷ ac yn gweld rhywun, a'r cwbl y gallant ei wneud yw mynd â hwy i'r ysbyty, oherwydd

house. We have to try to sort that out. That is why we have this development plan to get the right skills to make the best use of those scarce skills that paramedics have and to make the best use of all the paramedics who have those extra qualifications, some of which take two or three years to achieve.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yr wyf yn falch o'ch clywed yn canu clodydd parafeddygon, ac yn pwysleisio eu pwysigrwydd i'r gwasanaeth. A dderbyniwch fod morâl parafeddygon yn arbennig o isel ar hyn y bryd, a bod llawer ohonynt yn cwyno eu bod, fel rhan o'r Agenda ar gyfer Newid, wedi gweld eu graddfeydd cyflog yn gostwng yn hytrach nag yn codi? Tybiais o'ch ateb eich bod am bwysleisio eu pwysigrwydd ac am eu cydnabod yn ariannol.

2.40 p.m.

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid yw'n briodol i mi i sefyll yn y fan hon yn sôn am yr arian sydd yn cael ei dalu i barafeddygon nac i unrhyw un arall. Ni chlywais fod morâl yn eu plith yn arbennig o isel. Wrth gwrs, bu llawer o newid yn yr yrfa honno ac mae ganddynt fwy o gyfleoedd i raddio ac ennill sgiliau ychwanegol a chael eu talu am y sgiliau ychwanegol hynny, er ei bod yn cymryd tair neu bedair blynedd o astudio i ennill y sgiliau hynny.

nad ydynt wedi'u hyfforddi eto i allu gwneud brysbenediad yn y tŷ. Rhaid inni geisio datrys hynny. Dyna pam mae'r cynllun datblygu hwn gennym i gael y sgiliau iawn i wneud y defnydd gorau o'r sgiliau prin hynny sydd gan barafeddygon ac i wneud y defnydd gorau o'r holl barafeddygon sydd yn meddu ar y cymwysterau ychwanegol hynny, ac mae'n cymryd dwy neu dair blynedd i gael rhai o'r cymwysterau hynny.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I am glad to hear you praising paramedics, and emphasising their importance to the service. Do you accept that morale among paramedics is very low, and that many of them complain that, as part of the Agenda for Change, they have seen their pay scales decrease rather than increase? I assumed from your answer that you wanted to emphasise their importance and acknowledge them financially.

The First Minister: It is not appropriate for me to stand here and raise the issue of the money paid to paramedics or anyone else. I have not heard that morale among them is especially low. Of course, there has been a great deal of change in the profession and they now have more opportunities to gain degrees and additional skills and be paid for those additional skills, even though it takes three or four years to gain those skills.

Economi Wledig Cymru Wales's Rural Economy

Q10 Helen Mary Jones: Will the First Minister make a statement on the rural economy of Wales? OAQ0757(FM)

The First Minister: Between 1999 and the 12 months up to May 2004, the employment rate in rural Wales grew by 4.4 percentage points. That is up to 75.1 per cent of the working age population, which is considerably higher than the all-Wales figure. The number of people claiming unemployment-related benefits in rural Wales fell by 43.3 per cent compared with 34 per cent for Wales as a whole.

C10 Helen Mary Jones: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar yr economi wledig yng Nghymru? OAQ0757(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Rhwng 1999 a'r 12 mis hyd at fis Mai 2004, tyfodd y gyfradd gyflogaeth yn y Gymru wledig 4.4 pwynt canrannol. Mae hynny i fyny at 75.1 y cant o'r boblogaeth oed gweithio, sydd gryn dipyn yn uwch na'r ffigur ar gyfer Cymru gyfan. Cafwyd gostyngiad o 43.3 y cant yn nifer y bobl sydd yn hawlio budd-daliadau'n ymwneud â diweithdra yn y Gymru wledig o'i gymharu â 34 y cant yng Nghymru gyfan.

Helen Mary Jones: Your Government has often stated its commitment to developing the economy of rural Wales. Can you explain—in the context of that commitment, which we would all like to believe in—how the standstill budget in today’s draft budget for the supporting rural communities line and the £1.8 million cut in the helping agriculture adapt budget line will contribute to the development of the rural economy?

The First Minister: I cannot answer questions on every individual point of the budget in detail because there will be many hundreds of such points in the budget and they are matters to which Sue Essex will respond in detail and will consider. The budget has to be taken in the round; it does not mean that every year, every single item that was in the budget in the last year will have a 2 per cent, 5 per cent or 10 per cent increase. Sometimes, individual items in a budget will decrease in order to make room for other budget areas to increase. I am not saying that that is true in this case, but Sue will answer the question in detail. However, you cannot say that every single item in a budget must always increase and that there must never be changes in the proportion of the budget going to every sub-section.

Christine Chapman: Earlier this year, in response to a question that I asked, the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside agreed that Welsh produce markets in town centres could help to strengthen the link between urban and rural areas. Following discussions with Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council, I am pleased to learn that it is undertaking a great deal of work to try to establish such markets. Do you agree that Welsh produce markets can play an important role in bringing the rural economy to urban areas, allowing farmers, in particular, to maximise the potential of the urban consumer base? Do you think that there is much to gain from rural and urban economies working together for mutual benefit?

The First Minister: I do, and that is why I frequent the Riverside organic food market on a Sunday morning, as do several other

Helen Mary Jones: Mae eich Llywodraeth yn aml wedi datgan ei hymrwymiad i ddatblygu economi'r Gymru wledig. A allwch esbonio—yng nghyd-destun yr ymrwymiad hwnnw, yr hoffem ni i gyd gredu ynddo—sut y bydd y gyllideb ddigyfnewid yn y gyllideb ddrafft heddiw ar gyfer llinell cefnogi cymunedau gwledig, a'r cwtogiad o £1.8 miliwn yn llinell gyllideb helpu amaethyddiaeth i ymaddasu, yn cyfrannu at ddatblygiad yr economi wledig?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni allaf ateb cwestiynau ar bob pwynt unigol o'r gyllideb yn fanwl oherwydd bydd cannoedd o bwyntiau o'r fath yn y gyllideb ac maent yn faterion y bydd Sue Essex yn ymateb iddynt yn fanwl ac yn eu hystyried. Rhaid cymryd y gyllideb yn ei chyfanrwydd; nid yw'n golygu bob blwyddyn y bydd pob un eitem a oedd yn y gyllideb yn y flwyddyn ddiwethaf yn cael cynnydd o 2 y cant, 5 y cant neu 10 y cant. Weithiau, bydd eitemau unigol mewn cyllideb yn gostwng er mwyn gwneud lle i gynydd mewn meysydd eraill yn y gyllideb. Nid wyf yn dweud bod hynny'n wir yn yr achos hwn, ond gwnaiff Sue ateb y cwestiwn yn fanwl. Fodd bynnag, ni allwch ddweud bod yn rhaid i bob un eitem mewn cyllideb gynyddu bob tro ac na ddylai fod newid byth yn y gyfran o'r gyllideb a aiff i bob is-adran.

Christine Chapman: Yn gynharach eleni, mewn ymateb i gwestiwn a ofynnais, cytunodd y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad y gallai marchnadoedd cynnyrch Cymru yng nghanol trefi helpu i gryfhau'r cysylltiad rhwng ardaloedd trefol a gwledig. Yn dilyn trafodaethau gyda Chyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf, mae'n dda gennyf gael gwybod ei fod yn gwneud llawer iawn o waith i geisio sefydlu marchnadoedd o'r fath. A ydych yn cytuno y gall marchnadoedd cynnyrch Cymru chwarae rhan bwysig i ddod ag economi cefn gwlad i'r ardaloedd trefol, gan ganiatáu i ffermwyr, yn enwedig, fanteisio i'r eithaf ar y potensial o ran cwsmeriaid trefol? A ydych yn credu bod llawer i'w ennill o gael cydweithio rhwng economïau'r wlad a'r dref er lles y ddwy?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ydwyf, a dyna pam y byddaf yn mynychu marchnad bwyd organig Riverside ar fore Sul, fel y gwna sawl

Ministers. It is enjoyable and the quality of the organic food that you can buy there is superb. It is not the only farmers' market in Wales by any means, and not all of them are organic. Indeed, there are many specialist food fairs, which people travel many miles to visit, such as the Abergavenny Food Festival that has become a national showcase for the wonderful flavour that you get from having locally produced food, which has sometimes been produced by less intensive methods.

Kirsty Williams: Recent changes to EU rules could see regional selective assistance maps changing to enable the whole of east Wales to be eligible for higher rates of intervention. What are you doing to persuade the Government in London to ensure that my constituency of Brecon and Radnorshire is covered by this and that all areas of Brecon and Radnorshire will be able to apply for regional selective assistance and higher levels of intervention of Assembly investment grants and local authority investment grants?

The First Minister: That subject is under discussion now, namely how flexible the EU rules need to be for there to be local determination by the member state Government, which will obviously want to do that in conjunction with us, and how that would impact on areas that were excluded last time because they were too prosperous, which obviously includes the whole of Powys. Last time, many people expressed concern that a particular community in Powys, namely Ystradgynlais—which, in socio-economic terms, is similar to the rest of the Swansea valley—was not included, but the same strength of case was not seen for the whole of Powys or for the rural areas of Powys beyond Ystradgynlais. We will have to consider that when we know the final details on how much flexibility is given to each member state.

Gweinidog arall. Mae'n braf ac mae ansawdd y bwyd organig y gallwch ei brynu yno'n wych. Nid honno yw'r unig farchnad ffermwyr yng Nghymru o bellffordd, ac nid yw pob un ohonynt yn organig. Yn wir, ceir llawer o ffeiriau bwyd arbenigol, y mae pobl yn teithio milltiroedd lawer i ymweld â hwy, megis Gŵyl Fwyd y Fenni sydd erbyn hyn yn llwyfan arddangos genedlaethol i'r blas hyfryd a geir o gael bwyd sydd wedi'i gynhyrchu'n lleol, sydd weithiau wedi'i gynhyrchu drwy ddulliau llai dwys.

Kirsty Williams: Gallai newidiadau diweddar i reolau'r UE olygu y bydd mapiau cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol yn newid i alluogi dwyrain Cymru gyfan i fod yn gymwys ar gyfer cyfraddau uwch o ymyriad. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i berswadio'r Llywodraeth yn Llundain i sicrhau y caiff fy etholaeth i, sef Brycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed, ei chynnwys yn hyn ac y bydd pob ardal ym Mrycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed yn gallu gwneud cais am gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol a lefelau uwch o ymyriad o ran grantiau buddsoddi'r Cynulliad a grantiau buddsoddi'r awdurdod lleol?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r pwnc hwnnw'n destun trafod ar hyn o bryd, sef pa mor hyblyg y mae angen i reolau'r UE fod i ganiatáu penderfyniad lleol gan Lywodraeth yr aelod-wladwriaeth, a fydd yn amlwg yn dymuno gwneud hynny ar y cyd â ni, a sut y byddai hynny'n effeithio ar ardaloedd a adawyd allan y tro diwethaf oherwydd eu bod yn rhy lewyrchus, sydd yn amlwg yn cynnwys Powys gyfan. Y tro diwethaf, mynegodd llawer o bobl bryder bod cymuned arbennig ym Mhowys, sef Ystradgynlais—sydd, mewn termau cymdeithasol-economaidd, yn debyg i weddill dyffryn Tawe—heb ei chynnwys, ond ni welid bod y ddadl mor gryf o blaid Powys gyfan na thros ardaloedd gwledig Powys y tu hwnt i Ystradgynlais. Bydd yn rhaid inni ystyried hynny pan fyddwn yn gwybod y manylion terfynol ynghylch faint o hyblygrwydd a roddir i bob aelod-wladwriaeth.

Twf Economaidd yng Nghymru Economic Growth in Wales

Q11 Mark Isherwood: Will the First **C11 Mark Isherwood:** A wnaiff y Prif

Minister make a statement on economic growth in Wales? OAQ0776(FM)

The First Minister: Headline gross value added, which is the modern definition of GDP, increased by 6 per cent in Wales in 2003, according to the latest figures. Of the different countries and regions of the UK, Wales was joint second, and only the east midlands grew faster, at 6.3 per cent. The UK as a whole grew by 5 per cent, so that was an extremely good performance.

Mark Isherwood: Now that Gordon Brown has had to admit that his growth forecasts were wrong, and with the Bank of England reducing its growth forecast to around 2 per cent for the UK, how do you respond to the Welsh Economy Research Unit forecast that Welsh economic growth will be even lower this year at around 1.8 per cent, and to the latest GVA growth forecast from Cambridge Econometrics that Welsh per capita GVA will fall this year to just 78.8 per cent of the UK figure?

The First Minister: I would have to look at the forecasting records of those bodies. I am advised that we will surpass the £40 billion GDP this year for the first time. It is a great landmark for the Welsh economy that our GDP—or GVA to use the modern expression—will be in excess of £40 billion. It grew by 6 per cent in 2003. That is the latest figure, and it was a very healthy performance. I do not know about these other projections, and nor do I know what the forecasting records of those bodies are like. I am talking about facts and figures.

Weinidog ddatganiad ar dwf economaidd yng Nghymru? OAQ0776(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn ôl y ffigurau diweddaraf, gwelwyd cynnydd o 6 y cant yn y prif werth ychwanegol crynswth yng Nghymru, sef y diffiniad modern o CMC. O blith y gwahanol wledydd a rhanbarthau yn y DU, yr oedd Cymru'n gydradd ail, a dim ond dwyrain canoldir Lloegr a welodd gynnydd cyflymach, sef 6.3 y cant. Gwelwyd cynnydd o 5 y cant yn y DU yn ei chyfanrwydd, felly yr oedd hynny'n berfformiad arbennig o dda.

Mark Isherwood: Gan fod Gordon Brown wedi gorfod cyfaddef yn awr fod ei ragolygon twf yn anghywir, a Banc Lloegr yn gostwng ei ragolwg twf i tua 2 y cant yn y DU, sut yr ydych yn ymateb i ragolwg Uned Ymchwil Economi Cymru y bydd twf economaidd Cymru hyd yn oed yn is eleni, tuag 1.8 y cant, ac i'r rhagolwg twf GYC diweddaraf gan Cambridge Econometrics y bydd GYC y pen yng Nghymru yn disgyn cyn ised eleni â 78.8 y cant o ffigur y DU?

Y Prif Weinidog: Byddai'n rhaid imi weld pa mor llwyddiannus y bu'r cyrff hynny o ran rhagweld ffigurau yn y gorffennol. Fe'm hysbysir y bydd CMC yn fwy na £40 biliwn eleni am y tro cyntaf. Mae'n garreg filltir o bwys yn economi Cymru fod ein CMC—neu GYC a defnyddio'r term modern—dros £40 biliwn. Bu cynnydd o 6 y cant ynddo yn 2003. Hwnnw yw'r ffigur diweddaraf, ac yr oedd yn berfformiad calonnog iawn. Nid wyf yn gyfarwydd â'r rhagamcanion eraill hyn, ac nid wyf ychwaith yn gwybod pa mor gywir y bu rhagolygon y cyrff hynny yn y gorffennol. Yr wyf yn sôn am ffeithiau a ffigurau.

Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans Ambulance Services

Q12 Jocelyn Davies: What recent discussions has the First Minister held with NHS representatives regarding ambulance services in Wales? OAQ0749(FM)

The First Minister: It is not I who is responsible for this subject, but the Minister for Health and Social Services. He meets regularly with NHS representatives,

C12 Jocelyn Davies: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi eu cynnal yn ddiweddar gyda chynrychiolwyr y GIG ynglŷn â gwasanaethau ambiwlans yng Nghymru? OAQ0749(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid fy nghyfrifoldeb i yw'r mater hwn, ond cyfrifoldeb y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Mae ef yn cyfarfod yn

including the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust.

rheolaidd â chynrychiolwyr y GIG, gan gynnwys Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwlans Cymru.

Jocelyn Davies: Has the Minister discussed 'Agenda for Change' with the paramedics and emergency medical technicians, who say that they have been waiting for years for implementation? Were they not promised that they would be paid properly for what they do? When will 'Agenda for Change' be properly funded?

Jocelyn Davies: A yw'r Gweinidog wedi trafod yr 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' gyda'r parafeddygon a'r technegwyr meddygol brys, sy'n dweud eu bod yn disgwyl ers blynyddoedd iddi gael ei gweithredu? Oni addawyd iddynt y caent eu talu'n briodol am yr hyn yr oeddent yn ei wneud? Pryd y bydd yr 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' yn cael ei hariannu'n ddigonol?

The First Minister: I do not have the details on that, but I am sure that Brian will write to you about it. The really big change in this field is the additional training that has been made available for paramedics in order that they can become medical technicians. They are able to participate in one of the great life-saving developments, namely the reduced needle time for administering thrombolytic drugs to people who have had a heart attack. Initially, because the problem is more acute in mid Wales, paramedics there were trained first, and paramedics in the other three sub-areas of Wales were then trained. Because of that, a great advance in life saving can be achieved. Paramedics and their extra training are at the heart of that, administering thrombolytic drugs at people's homes, rather than waiting until people are at hospital, by which time it may be too late.

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid yw'r manylion am hynny gennyf, ond yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnaiff Brian ysgrifennu atoch yn ei gylch. Y newid gwirioneddol sylweddol yn y maes hwn yw'r hyfforddiant ychwanegol sydd ar gael i barafeddygon er mwyn iddynt allu dod yn dechnegwyr meddygol. Maent yn gallu bod yn rhan o un o'r datblygiadau mawr o ran achub bywyd, sef lleihad yn yr amser i roi pigiad ar gyfer rhoi cyffuriau thrombolytig i bobl sydd wedi cael trawiad ar y galon. I ddechrau, oherwydd bod y broblem yn fwy difrifol yn y Canolbarth, rhoddwyd hyfforddiant i barafeddygon yr ardal honno yn gyntaf, ac yna hyfforddwyd parafeddygon yn nhair is-ardal arall Cymru. O'r herwydd, gellir cymryd camau breision a ran achub bywydau. Mae parafeddygon a'u hyfforddiant ychwanegol yn rhan ganolog o hynny, yn rhoi cyffuriau thrombolytig i bobl yn eu cartrefi, yn hytrach na disgwyl nes i bobl gyrraedd yr ysbyty, sydd weithiau'n rhy hwyr.

Dyfodol y Chweched Dosbarth The Future of Sixth Forms

Q13 Peter Black: Will the First Minister make a statement on the future of sixth forms in Wales? OAQ0748(FM)

C13 Peter Black: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar ddyfodol y chweched dosbarth yng Nghymru? OAQ0748(FM)

The First Minister: I went to one myself, Peter. They are an integral part of the post-16 sector across Wales. They will remain so, as the department of education and lifelong learning seeks to build on Education and Learning Wales's work to improve opportunities across the board for all learners.

Y Prif Weinidog: Bûm yn ddisgybl mewn un fy hun, Peter. Maent yn rhan anhepgor o'r sector ôl-16 ledled Cymru. Byddant yn parhau'n anhepgor, wrth i'r adran addysg a dysgu gydol oes geisio adeiladu ar waith Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru i wella'r cyfleoedd ym mhob maes i bob dysgwr.

Peter Black: Thank you, First Minister, especially for the detail of your childhood.

Peter Black: Diolch, Brif Weinidog, yn enwedig am y cip ar eich plentyndod. Mae

ELWa now has the power to reform sixth forms, subject to the Minister's confirmation. Once ELWa is taken into the Assembly, the Minister will have that power and will effectively be acting as judge and jury on any proposals on the future of sixth forms. Do you share the concerns that many Members and I have that the proper process will not be followed once the change is implemented?

The First Minister: I do not accept your last point. I will repeat what Jane and we have said: there must be, and there will be effective Chinese walls in order to avoid the problem that you are referring to.

gan ELWa y grym yn awr i ddiwygio'r chweched dosbarth, yn amodol ar gadarnhad y Gweinidog. Wedi i ELWa ddod dan adain y Cynulliad, y Gweinidog fydd â'r grym hwnnw a bydd ef i bob pwrpas yn gweithredu fel barnwr a rheithgor ar unrhyw gynigion ynglŷn â dyfodol chweched dosbarth. A ydych yn rhannu'r pryderon sydd gan nifer o Aelodau a minnau na fydd y broses briodol yn cael ei dilyn, wedi gweithredu'r newid?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn derbyn eich pwynt olaf. Dywedaf unwaith yn rhagor yr hyn a ddywedodd Jane a ninnau: bydd rhaid cael waliau Tseinïaidd effeithiol, a bydd rhai, er mwyn osgoi'r broblem y cyfeiriwch ati.

Cwestiwn Brys Urgent Question

Y Llywydd: Diolch yn fawr, Brif Weinidog. Yr wyf wedi derbyn cais am gwestiwn brys gan arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.34.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, First Minister. I have received a request from the leader of the Welsh Conservatives to ask an urgent question under Standing Order No. 6.34.

Nick Bourne: Will the Minister provide an update on the E.coli outbreak in Wales, and indicate whether he intends to call an inquiry into the outbreak?

Nick Bourne: A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am yr achosion o E.coli yng Nghymru, a dweud a yw'n bwriadu galw am ymchwiliad i'r achosion?

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): I issued a written statement on this matter today, and the position has not altered since the statement was distributed. If the matter is discussed again in Plenary tomorrow, I will provide another update in light of the circumstances.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Cyhoeddais ddatganiad ysgrifenedig ynglŷn â'r mater hwn heddiw, ac nid yw'r sefyllfa wedi newid ers dosbarthu'r datganiad hwnnw. Os bydd y mater yn cael ei drafod eto yn y Cyfarfod Llawn yfory, rhoddaf ddiweddariad arall yng ngoleuni'r amgylchiadau.

2.50 p.m.

Nick Bourne: I am grateful for the response and the written statement. However, this is an issue of some importance that we should address, as we are not certain what the position will be tomorrow in terms of the debate. I extend my sympathy, and that of my group, to those affected and to their families and friends, particularly to the four children in specialist care.

Nick Bourne: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am yr ymateb ac am y datganiad ysgrifenedig. Fodd bynnag, mae hwn yn fater o gryn bwys y dylem ymdrin ag ef, gan nad ydym yn sicr beth fydd y sefyllfa yfory o ran y ddadl. Estynnaf fy nghydymdeimlad, a chydymdeimlad fy ngrŵp, i bawb yr effeithiwyd arnynt, a'u teuluoedd a'u ffrindiau, ac yn arbennig i'r pedwar plentyn sy'n derbyn gofal arbenigol.

You indicated a week ago that you thought

Dywedasoch wythnos yn ôl eich bod yn

that the number had peaked; it has since doubled. That presents a serious situation. First, can you reassure us and tell us what is being done to educate members of the public? Secondly, in hindsight—and I appreciate that this may be looked at by an inquiry—should the closure of schools happen immediately in such circumstances, because the number of cases has doubled in the last week? Thirdly, can you give an indication of how this inquiry will roll out, as this is not entirely clear? Fourthly, I have been notified that 13 authorities out of 22 in Wales have not conducted appropriate hygiene inspections in their schools, which is serious. Can you address those particular questions as a priority, Minister?

Brian Gibbons: First, I agree that it must have been a terrible week or 10 days for the children and young people who have been affected by this outbreak, and for their families. It must have been a very stressful time even for those who were not directly affected, because of concerns about what would happen after the outbreak and the potentially serious implications of an E.coli infection. I concur with everything that you said on that.

When I said that the incidents had peaked, I was talking about the initial conclusion after the weekend epidemiological studies, which suggested that the infection had a single source and that the pattern of cases at the start of the infection followed what one would have expected from a single-source infection terminated before the previous weekend. In other words, the first case was picked up on a Friday and, over the weekend, the subsequent risk to individuals was contained because the weekend intervened and because the outbreak team had been convened over the weekend.

In terms of peaking, the pattern of the outbreaks was consistent with it having a single source and the likely time of exposure. Since that, a number of other cases have been noted, even though the initial infection may have occurred at an earlier stage. Notification is not always given at the time that the incident begins. There were also some

credu bod y nifer wedi cyrraedd ei anterth; mae wedi dyblu ers hynny. Mae hynny'n creu sefyllfa ddifrifol. Yn gyntaf, a ydych yn gallu tawelu ein meddyliau a dweud wrthym beth sy'n cael ei wneud i addysgu aelodau'r cyhoedd? Yn ail, wrth edrych yn ôl—a sylweddolaf y gallai ymchwiliad ystyried hyn—a ddylai ysgolion gael eu cau yn syth mewn sefyllfa o'r fath, gan fod nifer yr achosion wedi dyblu yn ystod yr wythnos? Yn drydydd, a allwch roi rhyw awgrym i mi ynglŷn â sut y bydd yr ymchwiliad hwn yn cael ei gynnal, gan nad yw hyn yn hollol glir? Yn bedwerydd, fe'm hysbyswyd nad yw 13 o'r 22 awdurdod yng Nghymru wedi cynnal archwiliadau hylendid priodol yn eu hysgolion, sy'n fater difrifol. A allwch roi sylw i'r cwestiynau penodol hynny fel mater o flaenoriaeth, Weinidog?

Brian Gibbons: I ddechrau, cytunaf ei bod wedi bod yn wythnos neu 10 diwrnod hunllefus, yn sicr, i'r plant a'r bobl ifanc yr effeithiwyd arnynt gan yr haint hwn, ac i'w teuluoedd. Mae'n rhaid ei fod wedi bod yn gyfnod anodd iawn, hyd yn oed i'r rhai nad effeithiwyd yn uniongyrchol arnynt, yn sgîl y pryderon am yr hyn a ddigwyddai ar ôl yr haint a'r goblygiadau a allai fod yn ddifrifol yn sgîl haint E.coli. Cytunaf â phopeth a ddywedasoeh am hynny.

Pan ddywedais fod nifer yr achosion wedi cyrraedd ei anterth, sôn yr oeddwn am y casgliad dechreuol ar ôl astudiaethau epidemiologol y penwythnos, a awgrymai mai un ffynhonnell a oedd i'r haint a bod patrwm yr achosion ar ddechrau'r haint yn dilyn yr hyn y byddai dyn wedi ei ddisgwyl gan haint un ffynhonnell a ddaeth i ben cyn y penwythnos blaenorol. Mewn geiriau eraill, canfuwyd yr achos cyntaf ar ddydd Gwener a, thros y penwythnos, cafodd y perygl i unigolion wedi hynny ei atal oherwydd y penwythnos ac oherwydd bod y tîm achosion wedi ei gynnull dros y penwythnos.

O ran cyrraedd ei anterth, yr oedd patrwm yr achosion yn gyson â haint a oedd ag un ffynhonnell a'r amser tebygol y daeth pobl i gysylltiad ag ef. Ers hynny, nodwyd nifer o achosion eraill, er ei bod yn bosibl bod yr haint cychwynnol wedi digwydd yn gynharach. Nid yw'r hysbysiad yn cael ei roi pan fydd yr achos yn dechrau bob tro.

secondary cases—as one would expect in an outbreak such as this—where people who have been infected spread the infection to others. There will, therefore, be some lag in terms of when individual cases are brought to the attention of the notifying authorities. However, overall, the spread of the infection and the pattern of spread of the infection was what we would expect from a single source where the source of the infection ended on the previous weekend. Everything fits in with that, and subsequent events tend to confirm that.

The outbreak control team was very effective in getting the key messages across in ensuring that high levels of personal hygiene were rigorously adhered to, that pre-cooked meats were not used in the schools, that any food that was used was cooked, and ensuring that plasticine and other play things that might have been a source of infection were not used by children. That public education role was successful. We must commend the parents, who responded very well and in a responsible way to the advice that was given. The advice was authoritative and was generally proven to be correct. There was a good synergy between the public response in the affected schools and the advice given.

You are right to say that it is still a little early to give the specifics relating to the form that the inquiry will take. We, in the Assembly, must be clear about the legal powers within which we would carry out such an inquiry, and whether legal action will take place such as prosecutions; they would have a profound effect on the nature and range of the inquiry. We also need some initial debriefing from the main agencies involved in responding to this outbreak, to give us some indication of the critical areas that any inquiry would need to consider. It would be a mistake to give a knee-jerk reaction to dealing with the specifics and mechanics of an inquiry.

I am sure that your point is that we must fully understand what happened, why it happened, and what we need to do to ensure that it does

Cafwyd rhai achosion eilaidd hefyd—fel y byddai dyn yn disgwyl mewn amgylchiadau o'r fath—lle y bydd pobl sydd wedi'u heintio yn lledaenu'r haint ymhlith eraill. Ceir rhywfaint o fwch felly, o ran pryd y bydd achosion unigol yn cael eu dwyn i sylw'r awdurdodau sy'n hysbysu. Fodd bynnag, ar y cyfan, roedd lledaeniad yr haint a phatrwm lledaeniad yr haint yn unol â'r hyn y byddem wedi ei ddisgwyl gan un ffynhonnell pryd y byddai ffynhonnell yr haint wedi dod i ben y penwythnos blaenorol. Mae popeth yn cydfynd â hynny, ac mae'r digwyddiadau wedi hynny fel pe baent yn cadarnhau hynny.

Bu'r tîm rheoli achosion yn hynod effeithiol o ran cyfleu'r negeseuon allweddol i sicrhau bod pobl yn glynu'n gaeth wrth lefelau uchel o hylendid personol, nad oedd dim cig a oedd wedi'i goginio ymlaen llaw yn cael ei ddefnyddio yn yr ysgolion, fod unrhyw fwyd a ddefnyddid yn cael ei goginio, a sicrhau nad oedd clai ac offer chwarae arall a allai fod yn ffynhonnell haint yn cael eu defnyddio gan blant. Yr oedd y gwaith o addysgu'r cyhoedd yn llwyddiannus. Rhaid inni longyfarch y rhieni, a ymatebodd yn dda iawn ac mewn ffordd gyfrifol, i'r cyngor a roddwyd. Yr oedd y cyngor yn awdurdodol ac yn gyffredinol profwyd ei fod yn gywir. Yr oedd synergedd da rhwng yr ymateb cyhoeddus yn yr ysgolion yr effeithiwyd arnynt a'r cyngor a roddwyd.

Yr ydych yn gywir wrth ddweud ei bod yn dal braidd yn gynnar i bennu manylion ynglŷn â ffurf yr ymchwiliad. Rhaid i ni, yn y Cynulliad, fod yn glir ynglŷn â'r pwerau cyfreithiol a fyddai'n sail i gynnal ymchwiliad o'r fath, ac a gymerir camau cyfreithiol, megis erlyniadau, ai peidio; byddent yn cael effaith sylweddol ar natur a rhychwant yr ymchwiliad. Mae'n rhaid inni hefyd gael rhywfaint o wybodaeth i ddechrau gan y prif asiantaethau a fu'n ymwneud ag ymateb i'r achosion, er mwyn cael rhyw syniad ynghylch y meysydd allweddol y byddai gofyn i unrhyw ymchwiliad eu hystyried. Byddai'n gamgymeriad ymateb yn fyrbwyll i faterion yn ymwneud â manylion a mecanwaith ymchwiliad.

Yr wyf yn siŵr mai'r pwynt yr ydych yn ei wneud yw bod yn rhaid inni ddeall yn llwyr beth a ddigwyddodd, pam y digwyddodd, a

not recur. If we agree on those principles, I am sure that we will be able to reach an agreement on how best to proceed.

I cannot deal with the 13 local authorities, but I will take that matter away and clarify whether that is the case. I will ask my officials to contact you to provide an answer.

Leighton Andrews: As you will be aware, I wrote to you last Thursday asking you to hold the formal inquiry into the E.coli outbreak. First, I thank you for agreeing so quickly to hold such an inquiry.

This remains an issue of serious concern throughout the communities affected. I urge you to ensure that any such inquiry looks specifically at the food supply chain into schools among other issues, and addresses the issue of the regularity and constancy of inspections of suppliers, which is a key issue. Can you assure us that it will be a broad inquiry that will look at a range of other issues, including the advice and information supplied?

Brian Gibbons: Yes. You are quite right; the sourcing of food, inspections, traceability, the response from the outbreak control team, liaison between local authorities, between local education authorities and local authorities, the involvement of the Food Standards Agency, and environmental health departments—to name just a few issues, as there are many more—are crucial areas to be engaged in, which is my intention. Hopefully, we can reach an agreement here to make sure that whatever inquiry takes place we will agree that all of these crucial issues are covered and dealt with.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Given the issues raised by Nick Bourne and Leighton Andrews and your response to them, we should all commend the swift and efficient action taken by the various agencies and authorities in response to this incident. Can you confirm that the advice that you received from the experts was that schools were

beth y mae gofyn inni ei wneud i sicrhau nad yw'n digwydd eto. Os ydym yn cytuno ynglŷn â'r egwyddorion hynny, yr wyf yn siŵr y gallwn gael cytundeb ynglŷn â'r dull gorau o weithredu.

Ni allaf ddelio â'r 13 awdurdod lleol, ond ystyriaf y mater a gweld ai dyna'r sefyllfa. Gofynnaf i'm swyddogion gysylltu â chi i roi ateb ichi.

Leighton Andrews: Fel y gwyddoch, ysgrifennais atoch ddydd Iau diwethaf yn gofyn ichi gynnal ymchwiliad ffurfiol i'r achosion o E.coli. Yn gyntaf, diolch ichi am gytuno mor gyflym i gynnal ymchwiliad o'r fath.

Mae hwn yn parhau'n fater sy'n peri pryder mawr ledled y cymunedau yr effeithiwyd arnynt. Pwysaf arnoch i sicrhau bod unrhyw ymchwiliad o'r fath yn edrych yn benodol ar y gadwyn cyflenwi bwyd i ysgolion, ymhlith materion eraill, ac yn rhoi sylw i'r cwestiwn pa mor rheolaidd a chyson y mae cyflenwyr yn cael eu harchwilio, sy'n fater allweddol. A allwch roi sicrwydd inni y bydd yn ymchwiliad eang a fydd yn ystyried ystod o faterion eraill, gan gynnwys y cyngor a'r wybodaeth a ddarparwyd?

Brian Gibbons: Gallaf. Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle; mae ffynhonnell y bwyd, archwiliadau, olrhain, ymateb tîm rheoli'r achosion, y cyswllt rhwng awdurdodau lleol, rhwng awdurdodau addysg lleol ac awdurdodau lleol, cyfraniad yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd, ac adrannau iechyd yr amgylchedd—ac enwi dim ond rhai materion, gan fod llawer mwy—yn feysydd allweddol i fynd i'r afael â hwy, a dyna yw fy mwriad. Gobeithio y gallwn gytuno yma i wneud yn siŵr, pa fath bynnag o ymchwiliad a gynhelir, y byddwn yn cytuno bod yr holl faterion allweddol hyn yn cael eu hystyried a'u trin.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yn wyneb y materion a godwyd gan Nick Bourne a Leighton Andrews a'ch ymateb chi iddynt, dylai pawb ohonom gymeradwyo'r camau cyflym ac effeithiol a gymerwyd gan yr amrywiol asiantaethau ac awdurdodau i'r digwyddiad hwn. A allwch gadarnhau mai'r cyngor a dderbyniwyd gennych gan yr

controlled environments and that it was safer for children to return to schools than it was for them to remain at home?

Have you given any consideration to the possibility of holding a full public inquiry under the Inquiries Act 2005, which allows you to hold a full public inquiry without it being a judicial inquiry necessarily, and without it costing an exorbitant amount of money? When will you tell us whether you are prepared to proceed along those lines?

Brian Gibbons: I thank all health spokespeople of the opposition parties. As Leighton said, this has been a difficult time for many communities and families. It was important that, when the outbreak was at its worst, no-one took advantage of the situation to try to pursue narrow party-political advantage. The fact that people were behaving in a non-partisan way allowed experts to provide clear advice on this. In addition, the fact that we deferred from making this an area of political dispute contributed, in no small part, to the very responsible behaviour throughout.

3.00 p.m.

In relation to the advice in respect of schools, I understand that, certainly from Sunday of last week—not two, but nine days ago—this was one of the key things that the outbreak control team considered at length. When the outbreak occurred and information started to come in on Friday and Saturday, it was difficult even to start pinning down where it was coming from. However, once the evidence began to suggest that there might be a school focus for some of the concern, the outbreak control team spent a considerable amount of time and effort on deciding on precisely the issue that you have raised, in terms of what would be the best response. It was a judgment call at the end of the day, but, on balance, the team felt that it would be better, for the reasons that you said—a better-controlled environment and less risk of secondary spread—to allow the schools to remain open. In fairness, unless something unforeseen happens, time and events have, by and large, vindicated that particular judgment, but it was a very difficult judgment

arbenigwyr oedd bod ysgolion yn amgylcheddau dan reolaeth a'i bod yn fwy diogel i blant ddychwelyd i'r ysgolion nag ydoedd iddynt aros gartref?

A ydych wedi ystyried y posibilrwydd o gynnal ymchwiliad cyhoeddus llawn dan Ddeddf Ymchwiliadau 2005, sy'n caniatáu ichi gynnal ymchwiliad cyhoeddus llawn heb iddo, o reidrwydd, fod yn ymchwiliad barnwrol, a heb iddo gostio swm afresymol o arian? Pryd y dywedwch wrthym a ydych yn barod i weithredu yn y modd hwnnw?

Brian Gibbons: Carwn ddiolch i bob un o lefarwyr iechyd y gwrthbleidiau. Fel y dywedodd Leighton, bu hwn yn gyfnod anodd i nifer o gymunedau a theuluoedd. Yr oedd yn bwysig, pan oedd yr haint ar ei waethaf, nad oedd neb yn manteisio ar y sefyllfa i geisio cael mantais i'w plaid. Yr oedd y ffaith bod pobl yn ymddwyn mewn modd amhleidiol yn golygu bod yr arbenigwyr yn gallu rhoi cyngor clir ar y mater. Ar ben hynny, bu i'r ffaith inni ymatal rhag creu anghydfod gwleidyddol o hyn gyfrannu'n sylweddol at yr ymddygiad cyfrifol iawn drwy gydol yr amser.

Yng nghyswllt y cyngor ar gyfer ysgolion, deallaf, yn sicr ers dydd Sul yr wythnos diwethaf—nid dau ddiwrnod, ond naw diwrnod yn ôl—mai dyma oedd un o'r prif bethau y bu'r tîm rheoli haint yn ei ystyried am hydoedd. Pan gafwyd yr achosion cyntaf a phan ddechreuodd y wybodaeth gyrraedd ddydd Gwener a dydd Sadwrn, yr oedd yn anodd mynd ati i ddarganfod o ble yn union yr oedd yn dod. Fodd bynnag, wedi i'r dystiolaeth ddechrau awgrymu y gallai ffocws peth o'r pryder fod ar ysgolion, treuliodd y tîm rheoli haint amser ac ymdrech sylweddol yn penderfynu ar yr union fater yr ydych wedi'i godi, o ran beth fyddai'r ymateb gorau. Mater o wneud penderfyniad ydoedd yn y pen draw, ond, ar y cyfan, teimlai'r tîm y byddai'n well, am y rhesymau yr ydych wedi eu rhoi—amgylchedd wedi'i reoli'n well a llai o berygl o ail-leadaenu'r haint—gadael i'r ysgolion aros ar agor. A bod yn deg, oni bai fod rhywbeth annisgwyl yn digwydd, mae amser a'r digwyddiadau ar y cyfan wedi cyfiawnhau'r penderfyniad

that had to be made on that Sunday.

An inquiry is important. It has to be one that generates confidence, does not create scapegoats, and is not seen to be a whitewash. There are a number of pretty tricky legal issues to be teased out first, not least those relating to your suggestion that this should be carried out under the Inquiries Act 2005. It is not clear to me whether we can do that, in the light of last week's vote.

Jenny Randerson: I would like to extend the sympathies of the Welsh Liberal Democrats to those affected by this outbreak, and our thanks to all those people, including the hard-pressed environmental health officers, who have been working behind the scenes to ensure that the outbreak is contained as much as possible.

I have a few specific questions. First, are you confident that all the 600 or so outlets to which meat was supplied from the apparent source of the outbreak have now been traced, because there was a time-lag in establishing the full list?

My second question is on the issue of the spread of the outbreak to the wider community. There were fears raised by those working on this issue at the weekend that it was now becoming established at a second level within the wider community. One hopes that the abeyance in the number of fresh cases in the last few days indicates that that is not the case. Do you have any information on whether the outbreak has now been satisfactorily contained within the wider community?

I welcome your commitment, in the last sentence of your written statement, to a debate tomorrow. I also note that you state that any inquiry must be 'open, transparent and thorough'. Setting aside your final caveat about the legality of procedures under the Inquiries Act 2005, and all the other issues which, I am sure, we will be debating, does your use of the word 'open' mean that you are committed to holding any inquiry in public? I am sure that you are aware that the

penodol hwnnw, ond yr oedd yn benderfyniad anodd iawn ei wneud y dydd Sul hwnnw.

Mae ymchwiliad yn bwysig. Rhaid iddo fod yn un sy'n ennyn hyder, nad yw'n creu bychod dihangol, ac nad yw'n ceisio gwyngalchu pethau. Mae nifer o faterion cyfreithiol eithaf dyrys i'w trin yn gyntaf, yn enwedig y rhai sy'n ymwneud â'ch awgrym y dyliid gwneud hyn o dan Ddeddf Ymchwiliadau 2005. Nid yw'n glir i mi a allwn wneud hynny, yng ngoleuni'r bleidlais yr wythnos diwethaf.

Jenny Randerson: Hoffwn estyn cydymdeimlad Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru i'r rhai yr effeithiwyd arnynt gan yr haint hwn, a diolch i'r holl bobl hynny, gan gynnwys y swyddogion iechyd amgylchedd a oedd o dan gryn straen ac a fu'n gweithio'n galed y tu ôl i'r llenni i sicrhau bod yr achosion yn cael eu hatal hyd y gellid.

Mae gennyf rai cwestiynau penodol. Yn gyntaf, a ydych yn ffyddiog bod pob un o'r 600 siop y cyflenwyd cig iddynt gan ffynhonnell debygol yr haint bellach wedi eu canfod, o ystyried bod oedi wedi bod o ran darganfod beth oedd y rhestr lawn?

Mae fy ail gwestiwn yn ymwneud â'r haint yn lledaenu i'r gymuned ehangach. Lleisiwyd pryder dros y penwythnos gan y rhai sy'n gweithio ar y mater hwn ei fod yn dechrau sefydlu bellach ar ail lefel yn y gymuned ehangach. Mae rhywun yn gobeithio bod prinder yr achosion newydd yn y diwrnodau diwethaf yn arwydd nad yw hynny'n wir. A oes gennych unrhyw wybodaeth ynghylch a ydyw'r haint wedi ei atal yn foddhaol o fewn y gymuned ehangach erbyn hyn?

Croesawaf eich ymrwymiad, ym mrawddeg olaf eich datganiad ysgrifenedig, i gynnal dadl yfory. Nodaf hefyd eich bod yn dweud bod yn rhaid i unrhyw ymchwiliad fod 'yn agored, yn dryloyw ac yn drylwyr'. Gan roi heibio eich cafeat olaf ynghylch cyfreithlondeb y gweithdrefnau o dan Ddeddf Ymchwiliadau 2005, a'r holl faterion eraill y byddwn, yr wyf yn siŵr, yn eu trafod, a ydyw eich defnydd o'r gair 'agored' yn golygu eich bod yn ymrwymedig i gynnal unrhyw

inquiry in Scotland at the time of a similar outbreak, although it established important principles, and lessons were learned from it, was criticised because it was not held in public. Do you accept that any inquiry should be held in public so that public confidence on this issue is restored?

Brian Gibbons: I know that the local authorities, which are responsible for trying to contact the various outlets, made a determined effort to contact as many as physically possible. I would not be able to give you a definite answer as to whether or not each individual case out of the 600 was physically contacted. Some of the outlets that had been picked up through the various trawls may not be in business any more; they may have closed down, or the staff might be away on holiday—there are many reasons why that might not be the case.

However, I will try to find out specifically how many of the outlets were thought to be a possible source of infection, and to give you some estimate as to how many of those were contacted. Presumably, you were asking whether person-to-person contact was made with those outlets. We will see whether we can get that information—I am not sure whether I have that figure, but I will see whether we can do that.

You are right that there was concern about secondary infection, and there have been sporadic instances of secondary infection. However, I do not think that there was a substantial wave of secondary infection—those fears have not transpired—but there were some cases.

To engender public confidence, it is important that the inquiry must be open and thorough. My only concern, and I think that you mentioned this in relation to Scotland, which is a relevant example, is that a public inquiry that will take place at the same time as legal proceedings are being taken against individuals, organisations or corporate bodies creates a dilemma and a potential conflict. An open inquiry cannot in any way prejudice legal proceedings or prosecutions that are taking place at the same time, and could not be seen to prejudice the outcome of those

ymchwiliad yn gyhoeddus? Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn gwybod bod yr ymchwiliad yn yr Alban pan ddigwyddodd achosion tebyg yno, er iddo sefydlu egwyddorion pwysig, ac er i wersi gael eu dysgu, wedi cael ei feirniadu am na chafodd ei gynnal yn gyhoeddus. A ydych yn derbyn y dylid cynnal unrhyw ymchwiliad yn gyhoeddus fel bod hyder y cyhoedd o ran y mater hwn yn cael ei adfer?

Brian Gibbons: Gwn fod yr awdurdodau lleol, sy'n gyfrifol am geisio cysylltu â'r gwahanol siopau, wedi gwneud ymdrech o ddifrif i gysylltu â chynifer ohonynt ag oedd yn bosibl yn gorfforol. Ni fyddwn yn gallu rhoi ateb pendant ichi a gysylltwyd ai peidio â phob un o'r 600 yn unigol, wyneb yn wyneb. Efallai nad yw rhai o'r siopau a oedd wedi cael eu darganfod drwy'r gwahanol ymholiadau mwyach mewn busnes; efallai eu bod wedi cau, neu efallai fod y staff ar eu gwyliau—mae nifer o resymau pam nad oedd hynny'n bod efallai.

Fodd bynnag, ceisiaf ddarganfod yn benodol faint o'r siopau y tybiwyd eu bod yn ffynhonnell bosibl i'r haint, er mwyn rhoi rhyw syniad ichi ynghylch faint o'r rheini y cysylltwyd â hwy. Gofyn yr oeddech, yr wyf yn cymryd, a gysylltwyd â'r siopau hyn wyneb yn wyneb. Cawn weld a allwn gael y wybodaeth honno—nid wyf yn siŵr a ydyw'r ffigur hwnnw gennyf, ond ceisiaf weld a allwn wneud hynny.

Yr ydych yn iawn wrth ddweud bod pryder ynghylch heintio eilaidd, a chafwyd rhai achosion prin o heintio eilaidd. Er hynny, ni chredaf fod ton sylweddol o heintio eilaidd—nid yw'r pryderon hynny wedi eu gwireddu—ond cafwyd rhai achosion.

I ennyn ffydd y cyhoedd, mae'n bwysig ei bod yn ofynnol i'r ymchwiliad fod yn agored ac yn drylwyr. Fy unig bryder, a chredaf eich bod wedi sôn am hyn yng nghyswllt yr Alban, sy'n enghraifft berthnasol, yw bod ymchwiliad cyhoeddus a fydd yn digwydd ar yr un pryd ag y bydd achosion cyfreithiol yn cael eu dwyn yn erbyn unigolion, sefydliadau neu gyrff corfforaethol, yn creu cyfyng-gyngor a gwrthdaro posibl. Ni all ymchwiliad agored mewn modd yn y byd niweidio achosion cyfreithiol neu erlyniadau sy'n digwydd ar yr un pryd, ac ni allent gael eu

proceedings.

Therefore, until we are clearer as to what is happening in terms of prosecutions and so on, we cannot give an absolute, categorical commitment in relation to a fully open inquiry. This is what emerged in Scotland, as I understand it. Some areas of the Scottish inquiry had to be put on the backburner because legal proceedings were taking place, and therefore it was not possible for that inquiry to fully delve into every aspect of that outbreak.

gweld fel pe baent yn niweidio canlyniad yr achosion hynny.

Felly, hyd nes y byddwn yn gliriach ynghylch yr hyn sy'n digwydd o ran erlyniadau ac yn y blaen, ni allwn roi ymrwymiad absoliwt a diymwad ynghylch ymchwiliad agored llawn. Dyma'r hyn a ddigwyddodd yn yr Alban, fel yr wyf yn deall. Bu'n rhaid rhoi rhai agweddau ar ymchwiliad yr Alban o'r naill ochr oherwydd bod achosion cyfreithiol yn cael eu cynnal, ac ni fu'n bosibl felly i'r ymchwiliad hwnnw dreiddio'n llawn i bob agwedd ar yr haint hwnnw.

Cynnig i Drafod Mater Brys sydd o Bwys Cyhoeddus (Achosion E.coli) Proposal to Consider a Matter of Urgent Public Importance (E.coli Outbreak)

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi cydymffurfio â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.10 ar y mater hwn. Ystyriaf fod y pwnc sydd i'w godi, sef y pwnc a godwyd mewn cwestiwn brys heddiw a'r wythnos diwethaf, yn fater o bwys cyhoeddus.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.10, yn cynnal dadl frys i drafod yr achosion E.coli.

Yr wyf wedi gwneud cais am ddadl o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.10 oherwydd bod y mater yr wyf am ei drafod, yr achosion diweddar o E.coli yn ne Cymru, yn fater brys o bwys cyhoeddus.

Cysylltaf fy hun â'r dymuniadau gorau a anfonir at y rhai sy'n dioddef—y rhan fwyaf ohonynt yn blant, er bod rhai oedolion hefyd erbyn hyn. Gwyddom fod 117 achos hyd yn hyn, sy'n effeithio ar 32 o ysgolion, ac, fel y clywsom eisoes, cododd 40 o'r achosion yn ystod y penwythnos diwethaf. Fel y clywsom yn ystod cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog, mae 25 yn derbyn triniaeth ysbyty, ac mae pedwar plentyn mewn gofal dwys. Mae'n effeithio ar o leiaf bedwar awdurdod lleol—Rhondda Cynon Taf, Merthyr Tudful, Caerffili, a Phen-y-bont ar Ogwr. Er ein bod yn deall bod ymchwiliad i'r cysylltiad ag un cwmni cyflenwi bwyd, nid yw hynny wedi ei

The Presiding Officer: I have conformed to Standing Order No. 6.10 on this issue. I consider that the subject to be discussed, that is, the subject that was raised by means of an urgent question today and last week, is a matter of public importance.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales, under Standing Order No. 6.10, holds an urgent debate to discuss the E.coli outbreak.

I have requested a debate under Standing Order No. 6.10 as the matter that I wish to discuss, the recent outbreak of E.coli in south Wales, is a matter of urgent public importance.

I extend my best wishes to those who are suffering—the majority of whom are children, although there are now some adults as well. We know that there are 117 cases so far, affecting 32 schools, and, as we have already heard, 40 of these cases occurred during the past weekend. As we heard during questions to the First Minister, 25 people are receiving hospital treatment, and four children are in intensive care. It affects at least four local authorities—Rhondda Cynon Taf, Merthyr Tydfil, Caerphilly, and Bridgend. Although we understand that there is an inquiry into the link with one food supply company, that has not yet been

gadarnhau eto.

Mae E.coli 0157 yn fater difrifol; mewn achosion difrifol gall achosi niwed i'r iau. Mae pryder mawr ymhlith y cyhoedd, ac, fel Cynulliad etholedig, mae'n rhaid inni ymateb i'r pryder hwnnw fel bod pobl yn teimlo ein bod yn cymryd ein cyfrifoldeb o ddifrif, a bod ganddynt hyder yn y ffordd yr ydym yn ymateb.

3.10 p.m.

The National Assembly must respond positively to the grave public concern about this latest E.coli outbreak in the four local authority areas that I have mentioned. I believe that the Minister referred to the conclusions of the Pennington report—the 32 recommendations. One matter that we would want to consider is the extent to which the lessons learned from that Scottish outbreak were put into practice here, and whether there were matters that should have been dealt with differently. What concerns me about the Government's response so far is that it says that it wants an open and independent inquiry, but has not yet committed itself to a public inquiry. In relation to the Inquiries Act 2005, I disagree with the Minister; it is perfectly proper that the National Assembly itself decides upon that, because if we have not delegated the powers to the First Minister, we can decide. This is an issue that the whole Assembly should consider and we should not be deflected by what the Minister said. If the inquiry is set up, and there are prosecutions, the inquiry would be in abeyance until those prosecutions were concluded. However, it is important that the Assembly makes clear that it believes that there should be a public inquiry into these matters.

Y Llywydd: Cyn imi alw'r Gweinidog i ymateb, efallai y byddai o ddiddordeb i'r Cynulliad wybod fy mwriad innau pe byddai'r Cynulliad yn pleidleisio o blaid cynnal y ddatl. Defnyddiwn fy mhwerau, o dan y Rheol Sefydlog i addasu'r amserlen er mwyn i'r ddatl ddigwydd yn y Cyfarfod Llawn yfory.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I also offer my sympathies to the parents of those

confirmed.

E.coli 0157 is a serious matter; in serious cases it can damage the liver. There is great concern among the public, and, as an elected Assembly, we must respond to that concern so that people feel that we are taking our responsibility seriously, and have confidence in the way that we are responding.

Rhaid i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ymateb yn gadarnhaol i'r pryder cyhoeddus dwfn iawn ynghylch yr haint E.coli diweddaraf hwn yn y pedair ardal awdurdod lleol y soniais amdanynt. Credaf fod y Gweinidog wedi cyfeirio at gasgliadau adroddiad Pennington—y 32 argymhelliad. Un mater y byddem eisiau ei ystyried yw i ba raddau y rhoddwyd y gwersi a ddysgwyd o'r achosion yn yr Alban ar waith yma, ac a ddylid bod wedi delio â rhai materion yn wahanol. Yr hyn sy'n fy mhoeni i am ymateb y Llywodraeth hyd yma yw ei bod yn dweud ei bod eisiau ymchwiliad agored ac annibynnol, ond nid yw eto wedi ymrwymo i ymchwiliad cyhoeddus. Yng nghyswllt Deddf Ymchwiliadau 2005, anghytunaf gyda'r Gweinidog; mae'n gwbl iawn i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol benderfynu ynghylch hynny ei hun, oherwydd os nad ydym wedi dirprwyo'r pwerau i Brif Weinidog Cymru, gallwn ni benderfynu. Mae hwn yn fater y dylai'r Cynulliad cyfan ei ystyried ac ni ddylai'r hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog ein bwrw i'r naill ochr. Os sefydlir ymchwiliad, ac os bydd erlyniadau, byddai'r ymchwiliad yn cael ei ohirio hyd nes cwblhau'r erlyniadau. Er hynny, mae'n bwysig i'r Cynulliad ddweud yn glir ei fod yn credu y dylid cynnal ymchwiliad cyhoeddus i'r materion hyn.

The Presiding Officer: Before I call upon the Minister to respond, it may be of interest to the Assembly to know my intention if the Assembly votes in favour of holding the debate. I would use my powers under the Standing Order to adapt the timetable in order for the debate to take place in tomorrow's Plenary.

Y Gweinidog Busnes (Jane Hutt): Yr wyf finnau hefyd yn cydymdeimlo â rhieni'r plant

children affected, and thank the professionals, local authorities and the National Public Health Service, who have responded so effectively to this. We support the consideration of Standing Order No. 6.10 with regard to a debate on the E.coli outbreaks in Wales, and hope that the debate will take place tomorrow, with business amended accordingly.

yr effeithiwyd arnynt, a hoffwn ddiolch i'r staff proffesiynol, yr awdurdodau lleol a'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cenedlaethol am ymateb mor effeithiol i hyn. Yr ydym yn cefnogi ystyried Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.10 ynglŷn â chael dadl ar yr achosion E.coli yng Nghymru, a gobeithiwn y bydd y ddadl yn digwydd yfory, a'r busnes yn cael ei ddiwygio i adlewyrchu hynny.

Cynnig: O blaid 57, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion: For 57, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Marek, John
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet

Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Datganiad Busnes Business Statement

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): With regard to this week's business, it has already been agreed, with our support, that the Assembly will, in accordance with Standing Order No. 6.10, consider the matter of the E.coli outbreaks in Plenary tomorrow. There will not be a short debate at the end of Plenary tomorrow afternoon. Business for the next three weeks is as set out in the draft statement, which can be found on the Chamberweb, under supporting documents. Further to this morning's deliberations in the Business Committee, it has been determined that the following items of subordinate legislation need not be referred to a subject committee for extended consideration: the Change of Category of Maintained Schools (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2005, the New Maintained Schools (Wales) Regulations 2005, the Annual Parents' Meeting (Exemptions) (Wales) Regulations 2005, the Government of Maintained Schools (Wales) Regulations 2005, the Governor Allowances (Wales) Regulations 2005, the Education Act 2002 (Transitional Provisions and Consequential Amendments) (Wales) Regulations 2005, the Education Act 2002 (Commencement No. 7) (Wales) Order 2005 and the TSE (Wales) (Amendment) (No. 2) Regulations 2005.

Y Llywydd: A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiadau i'r datganiad busnes drafft? Gwelaf fod mwy na 10. Gofynnaf felly i'r Trefnydd gynnig y datganiad busnes yn ffurfiol.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cynigiaf fod

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): O ran busnes yr wythnos hon, cytunwyd eisoes, gyda'n cefnogaeth ni, y bydd y Cynulliad, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.10, yn ystyried yr achosion o E.coli yn y Cyfarfod Llawn yfory. Ni fydd dadl fer ar ddiwedd y Cyfarfod Llawn brynhawn yfory. Mae'r busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y mae wedi ei nodi yn y datganiad drafft, sydd ar we'r Siambr, o dan ddogfennau ategol. Yn dilyn y trafodaethau y bore yma yn y Pwyllgor Busnes, penderfynwyd nad oes angen cyfeirio'r eitemau canlynol o is-ddeddfwriaeth at bwylgor pwnc i'w hystyried ymhellach: Rheoliadau Newid Categori Ysgolion a Gynhelir (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2005, Rheoliadau Ysgolion a Gynhelir Newydd (Cymru) 2005, Rheoliadau Cyfarfodydd Rhieni Blynnyddol (Eithriadau) (Cymru) 2005, Rheoliadau Llywodraethu Ysgolion a Gynhelir (Cymru) 2005, Rheoliadau Lwfansau Llywodraethwyr (Cymru) 2005, Rheoliadau Deddf Addysg 2002 (Darpariaethau Trosiannol a Diwygiadau Canlyniadol) (Cymru) 2005, Gorchymyn Deddf Addysg 2002 (Cychwyn Rhif 7) (Cymru) 2005 a Rheoliadau TSE (Cymru) (Diwygio) (Rhif 2) 2005.

The Presiding Officer: Are there any objections to the business statement? I see that there are more than 10. I therefore ask the Business Minister to formally propose the business statement.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I propose that

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn derbyn y datganiad busnes.

the National Assembly for Wales adopts the business statement.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: O ystyried pwysigrwydd Deddf Ymchwiliadau 2005 yn y mater hwn i ganiatáu i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru gynnal ymchwiliadau cyhoeddus llawn, pryd y byddwch yn cyflwyno Gorchymyn cychwyn y Mesur hwnnw i ganiatáu'r pwerau inni wneud hynny?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Considering the importance of the Inquiries Act 2005 in this matter in allowing the National Assembly for Wales to hold full public inquiries, when will you bring forward the commencement Order on that Bill to give us the powers to do that?

Ni fyddwn yn cefnogi'r datganiad busnes nes y cawn ymrwymiad i'r diben hwnnw, ac ymrwymiad i gynnal dadl lawn, o dan gynnig â dyddiad trafod, ar y mater. Credaf fod yr hyn sydd wedi ei roi inni yn gwbl annerbyniol, a chafodd ei orfodi arnoch gan y gwrthbleidiau. Mewn sefyllfa fel hon, lle mae rhieni angen sicrwydd fod mesurau cadarn yn cael eu cymryd gan y Llywodraeth, mae hyn yn gwbl annerbyniol.

We will not support the business statement until we receive a commitment to that end, and a commitment to holding a full debate, with a named day motion, on the issue. What we have been given is wholly unacceptable, and it was forced on you by the opposition parties. In a situation such as this, where parents need assurances that robust steps are being taken by the Government, this is totally unacceptable.

Codaf un mater arall o ran cyfrifoldebau y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Mae pryder ledled Cymru ynglŷn ag ysbytai cymunedol bach. Mae angen datganiad llawn am fwriadau'r Gweinidog yng nghyd-destun yr ysbytai hyn, oherwydd y mae cymunedau ledled Cymru yn poeni y byddant yn colli'r gwasanaeth a'r adnodd gwerthfawr hwn.

I raise one further issue with regard to the responsibility of the Minister for Health and Social Services. There is concern throughout Wales about small community hospitals. We need a full statement on the intentions of the Minister in the context of these hospitals, because communities across Wales are concerned that they will lose this valuable service and resource.

David Melding: Minister, I am pleased that you have responded to the request—which, in fairness, came from right across the Chamber—for a debate on the E.coli issue. The adequacy of the Government's response will be determined in that debate, and I say nothing about that, but I hope that you will accept that there is a need for a full and open inquiry that has public confidence.

David Melding: Weinidog, yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi ymateb i'r cais—sydd, a bod yn deg, wedi dod o bob rhan o'r Siambr—am ddadl ar gwestiwn E.coli. Penderfynir ar briodoldeb ymateb y Llywodraeth yn y ddadl honno, ac ni ddywedaf ddim am hynny, ond gobeithiaf y byddwch yn derbyn bod angen ymchwiliad llawn ac agored a fydd yn ennyn hyder y cyhoedd.

The commencement Order to the Inquiries Act 2005 is something that is now quite pressing, and I agree with the remarks that Rhodri Glyn Thomas made in this regard.

Mae Gorchymyn cychwyn Deddf Ymchwiliadau 2005 yn rhywbeth sydd bellach o'r pwys mwyaf, a chytunaf â sylwadau Rhodri Glyn Thomas ynglŷn â hyn.

I am disappointed that the Government refuses a debate on the council tax, even though that we can see the deleterious effect it is having in Wales, particularly compared with England. Our postbags are full of letters from people who are very frustrated that they

Yr wyf yn siomedig bod y Llywodraeth yn gwrthod cynnal dadl ar y dreth gyngor, er ein bod yn gallu gweld yr effaith niweidiol y mae'n ei chael yng Nghymru, yn enwedig o'i gymharu â Lloegr. Yr ydym yn cael llawer o lythyrau gan bobl sy'n rhwystredig iawn

have been denied justice on this issue. It is something that needs to be debated urgently. Therefore, until you concede that, we will oppose the business statement.

Kirsty Williams: I support the call made by David Melding for a debate on the council tax, and the call made by Rhodri Glyn Thomas with regard to the need for a debate on community hospitals. In my constituency, the local health board is considering closing community hospital wards this winter because of the dire financial situation that it is facing.

Returning to the most pressing point at hand, which is the E.coli situation, we cannot support the business statement until we are assured that the debate tomorrow—and we welcome that it will now be a debate and not a statement—gives proper and comprehensive details of what form an inquiry will take. Also, given the fact that it was your intention to bring forward the delegations with regard to public inquiries last week, the Government's defeat on that is not an excuse for not bringing forward the commencement of the regulations. Given the situation that we are obviously in, and that you are in, Minister, namely that the Assembly does not support the delegation of those functions, you must, in this very serious public health situation, allow the Assembly to vote on that commencement Order so that a proper public inquiry can be instigated.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I find this extraordinary. What happened last week? It was the opposition parties that refused to allow the delegation to the First Minister in relation to inquiries. [*Interruption.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order. The Minister is entitled to respond, in line with Standing Orders.

Jane Hutt: It is quite extraordinary that you are now playing politics with what is, Kirsty, a most important public health issue. I am grateful to David Melding for recognising that the Minister not only came forward last week, but issued a written statement today.

oherwydd nad ydynt wedi cael tegwch o ran y mater hwn. Mae angen dadl yn ei gylch ar fyrder. Felly, hyd nes y byddwch yn barod i dderbyn hynny, byddwn yn gwrthwynebu'r datganiad busnes.

Kirsty Williams: Yr wyf yn cefnogi galwad David Melding am ddadl ar y dreth gyngor, a galwad Rhodri Glyn Thomas ynghylch yr angen am ddadl ar ysbytai cymunedol. Yn fy etholaeth i, mae'r bwrdd iechyd lleol yn ystyried cau wardiau ysbytai cymunedol y gaeaf hwn oherwydd ei fod yn wynebu sefyllfa ariannol mor ddifrifol.

A dychwelyd at y mater pwysicaf sydd ger ein bron, sef y sefyllfa o ran E.coli, ni allwn gefnogi'r datganiad busnes hyd nes y cawn sicrwydd y bydd y ddadl yfory—ac yr ydym yn croesau'r ffaith y bydd bellach yn ddadl ac nid yn ddatganiad—yn rhoi manylion priodol a chynhwysfawr am natur unrhyw ymchwiliad. Hefyd, o gofio mai eich bwriad oedd cyflwyno'r dirprwyo o ran ymchwiliadau cyhoeddus yr wythnos diwethaf, nid yw'r ffaith bod y Llywodraeth wedi'i threchu ar hynny'n esgus dros beidio â chyflwyno cychwyn y rheoliadau. O ystyried y sefyllfa yr ydym yn amlwg ynddi, ac yr ydych chi ynddi, Weinidog, sef nad yw'r Cynulliad yn cefnogi dirprwyo'r swyddogaethau hyn, rhaid i chi, yn y sefyllfa ddifrifol iawn hon o ran iechyd y cyhoedd, ganiatáu i'r Cynulliad bleidleisio ar y Gorchymyn cychwyn hwnnw fel bod modd mynd ati i gynnal ymchwiliad cyhoeddus priodol.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Mae hyn yn anhygoel. Beth ddigwyddodd yr wythnos diwethaf? Y gwrthbleidiau a wrthododd ganiatáu dirprwyo i'r Prif Weinidog o ran ymchwiliadau. [*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae gan y Gweinidog hawl i ymateb, yn unol â'r Rheolau Sefydlog.

Jane Hutt: Mae'n anhygoel eich bod yn chwarae gêmaw gwleidyddol gyda'r hyn sydd, Kirsty, yn fater o'r pwys mwyaf o ran iechyd y cyhoedd. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i David Melding am gydnabod bod y Gweinidog nid yn unig wedi dod gerbron yr

We offered an oral statement and have accepted and supported the call for a debate. That is what has happened. It is about a responsible Government responding to opposition parties' concerns.

However, we need to face the fact that this is about the issues that Brian responded to in relation to this outbreak. It is the E.coli outbreaks in Wales that we must debate, and we have today supported the call for that debate, and we will find time to ensure that we have that debate as a result of the request made under Standing Order No. 6.10. That request came from you. We have agreed to it and supported it, so let us please move forward in a responsible way as the National Assembly for Wales.

3.20 p.m.

We will have that debate tomorrow, and the Minister has said that when it is appropriate, an inquiry will take place, but there are many issues that must be dealt with. He will come back to you, as you know, and I am sure that this will be dealt with again tomorrow. Please, let us move forward together so that the public can see that we are dealing responsibly with this public health issue of E.coli outbreaks when we debate it tomorrow.

Rhodri Glyn and Kirsty raised the issue of small community hospitals, but they know that we should have the debate about funding and the situation of small community hospitals in the context of 'Designed for Life'. We have already allocated time for that, and the debate on the 10-year strategy is key.

On the issues relating to council tax, which David Melding and Kirsty Williams raised, I do not intend to schedule time to debate these issues because the Assembly Government has complied with legislation. A revaluation exercise has been completed in Wales and it is now being implemented. What happens in England is a matter for the UK Government; we have moved forward in Wales.

wythnos diwethaf, ond ei fod wedi cyhoeddi datganiad ysgrifenedig heddiw. Cynigiasom ddatganiad llafar ac yr ydym wedi derbyn a chefnogi'r alwad am ddadl. Dyna sydd wedi digwydd. Mae'n ymwneud â Llywodraeth gyfrifol yn ymateb i bryderon y gwrthbleidiau.

Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni dderbyn bod hyn yn ymwneud â'r materion yr ymatebodd Brian iddynt ynglŷn â'r achosion hyn. Rhaid i'r ddadl ymwneud â'r achosion o E.coli yng Nghymru, a heddiw yr ydym wedi cefnogi'r alwad am y ddadl honno, a byddwn yn dod o hyd i amser i sicrhau ein bod yn cael y ddadl honno o ganlyniad i'r cais a wnaethpwyd o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.10. Gwnaethpwyd y cais hwnnw gennych chi. Yr ydym wedi cydsynio â'r cais ac wedi ei gefnogi, felly gadewch inni fwrw ymlaen mewn modd gyfrifol fel Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru.

Cawn y ddadl honno yfory, ac mae'r Gweinidog wedi dweud pan fydd hynny'n briodol, y cynhelir ymchwiliad, ond mae llawer o faterion eraill y mae'n rhaid delio â hwy. Daw yn ôl atoch, fel y gwyddoch, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwn yn ymdrin â hyn eto yfory. Gadewch inni symud ymlaen gyda'n gilydd er mwyn i'r cyhoedd weld pan fyddwn yn cynnal y ddadl yfory ein bod yn ymdrin mewn modd cyfrifol â'r achosion hyn o E.coli, sy'n fater pwysig o ran iechyd y cyhoedd.

Cododd Rhodri Glyn a Kirsty fater ysbytai cymunedol bach, ond gwyddant y dylem fod yn cynnal y ddadl ar gyllid a sefyllfa ysbytai cymunedol bach yng nghyd-destun 'Cynllun Oes'. Yr ydym eisoes wedi neilltuo amser ar gyfer hynny, ac mae'r ddadl ynghylch y strategaeth 10 mlynedd yn allweddol.

Ynglŷn â'r materion yn ymwneud â'r dreth gyngor, a godwyd gan David Melding a Kirsty Williams, nid wyf yn bwriadu neilltuo amser i gael dadl ar y materion hyn gan fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cydymffurfio â'r ddeddfwriaeth. Mae ailbrisiad wedi'i gwblhau yng Nghymru ac mae'n awr yn cael ei roi ar waith. Mater i Lywodraeth y DU yw'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn Lloegr; yr ydym wedi symud ymlaen yng Nghymru.

*Cynnig: O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
Motion: For 28, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lloyd, David
Marek, John
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.
Motion defeated.*

Datganiad gan y Llywydd Statement by the Presiding Officer

Y Llywydd: Yn ystod datganiad y Trefnydd ar ddatganiad busnes drafft yr wythnos hon, cyfeiriwyd at y ffaith na chynhelir dadl fer yfory. Carwn wneud datganiad am hynny. Nid dyma'r tro cyntaf i hyn ddigwydd, ac mae'r sefyllfa yn anfoddfaol iawn o'm safbwynt i fel Llywydd. Mae'r ddadl fer yn hwylustod pwysig sy'n caniatáu i Aelodau'r meinciau cefn, fel y'u gelwir mewn man arall, i godi pynciau a gofyn am ymateb gan Weinidogion ar faterion na fyddai o bosibl yn derbyn llawer o sylw mewn Cyfarfod Llawn fel arall. Mae'r llwyfan pwysig hwn yn cael ei warchod o ran ei amseriad gan ein Rheolau Sefydlog.

The Presiding Officer: During the Business Minister's statement on this week's draft business statement, reference was made to the fact that there will not be a short debate tomorrow. I wish to make a statement on that. This is not the first time that this has happened, and the situation is most unsatisfactory from my point of view as Presiding Officer. The short debate is an important facility that allows backbench Members, as they are termed in another place, to raise issues and ask for a ministerial response on matters that might not otherwise receive much attention in Plenary. The allocation of time for this important platform is protected by our Standing Orders.

Nid wyf yn cyfeirio at unigolion, oherwydd y I am not referring to individuals, because this

mae hyn wedi digwydd o'r blaen ond, yn fy marn i, mae Aelod sy'n cael ei ddethol i gyflwyno dadl fer ar ddiwrnod penodol ac sy'n gwrthod gwneud hynny, heb reswm da, yn tramgwyddo yn erbyn hawliau Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Byddai gwneud hynny yn gwastraffu cyfle Aelod arall i ddefnyddio'r llwyfan pwysig hwn ac yn rhoi amser ar blât i'r Llywodraeth, sydd yn fater o bwys i unrhyw un sy'n ceisio dal y fantol wrth lywyddu yn y lle hwn. Fy nghyfarwyddyd i Aelodau yw os nad ydynt yn bwriadu manteisio ar y cyfle neu os nad oes ganddynt bwnc i'w osod gerbron y Cynulliad, dylent sicrhau nad yw eu henwau yn cael eu cynnwys yn y detholiad ar gyfer y diwrnod penodol hwnnw.

Yr wyf yn sicr y byddwch oll yn cytuno bod y ddadl fer yn llwyfan pwysig i holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad ac na ddylai byth gael ei cham-drin.

has happened previously, but, in my opinion, a Member who is chosen by ballot to present a short debate on a certain date and who refuses to do so, without good reason, is abusing the rights of Assembly Members. To do so is to waste another Member's opportunity to use this important platform and hands debating time on a plate to the Government, which is a matter of great importance to anyone who is trying to maintain a balance when presiding in this place. My direction to Members is that if they do not intend to take advantage of the opportunity, or if they do not have a subject that they wish to discuss in the Assembly, they should ensure that their names are not included in the ballot for that particular day.

I am sure that you will all agree that the short debate is an important platform for all Assembly Members and it should never be abused.

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Tai (Hawl Cynnig Cyntaf) (Cymru) 2005 a Gorchymyn Tai (Hawl i Brynu) (Gwybodaeth i Denantiaid Diogel) (Cymru) 2005
Approval of the Housing (Right of First Refusal) (Wales) Regulations 2005 and the Housing (Right to Buy) (Information to Secure Tenants) (Wales) Order 2005**

Y Llywydd: Cynigiwyd i'r eitemau hyn gael eu trafod gyda'i gilydd, a phleidleisio arnynt ar wahân, oni bai fod gwrthwynebiad i hynny. Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad. Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 i NDM2569 yn enw David Melding a gwelliannau 1 a 2 i NDM2571 yn enw David Melding.

The Presiding Officer: It is proposed that these items be debated together, with separate votes, unless there are any objections. I see that there are no objections. I have selected amendment 1 to NDM2569 in the name of David Melding and amendments 1 and 2 to NDM2571 in the name of David Melding.

The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart): Cynigiad fod

the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Housing (Right of First Refusal) (Wales) Regulations 2005 a copy of which was laid in Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 20 September 2005. (NDM2569)

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Tai (Hawl Cynnig Cyntaf) (Cymru) 2005 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 20 Medi 2005. (NDM2569)

I propose that

Cynigiad fod

the National Assembly for Wales approves that the Housing (Right of First Refusal) (Wales) Regulations 2005 is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 20 September 2005. (NDM2570)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Housing (Right to Buy) (Information to Secure Tenants) (Wales) Order 2005 a copy of which was laid in Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 20 September 2005. (NDM2571)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales approves that the Housing (Right to Buy) (Information to Secure Tenants) (Wales) Order 2005 is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 20 September 2005. (NDM2572)

The two instruments are required to give effect to amendments made by the Housing Act 2004 with regard to the right to buy. The right of first refusal regulations are required to enable the landlords of secure tenants to insert a covenant and right-to-buy transfer documents, giving them priority in repurchasing properties so that they may be let to other people in need of housing. The right will exist for 10 years following the original purchase. If the former landlord does not wish to repurchase, he or she may nominate another registered social landlord—usually a housing association—to consider the matter. The instrument allows eight weeks for this process to ensure that the owner is not delayed unreasonably in disposing of the property.

The information to tenants Order is intended to provide tenants, at an early stage, with all the information necessary to help them decide whether they wish to exercise the right to buy. Concern has been raised by Shelter and others, as some purchasers have found themselves in financial difficulties, for example, when the purchasers of leasehold flats have to pay significant service charges

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn cymeradwyo gwneud Rheoliadau Tai (Hawl Cynnig Cyntaf) (Cymru) 2005 yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 20 Medi 2005. (NDM2570)

Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Tai (Hawl i Brynu) (Gwybodaeth i Denantiaid Diogel) (Cymru) 2005 y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 20 Medi 2005. (NDM2571)

Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn cymeradwyo gwneud Gorchymyn Tai (Hawl i Brynu) (Gwybodaeth i Denantiaid Diogel) (Cymru) 2005 yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 20 Medi 2005. (NDM2572)

Mae'r ddau offeryn yn ofynnol i weithredu diwygiadau a wnaethpwyd gan Ddeddf Tai 2004 o ran yr hawl i brynu. Mae'r rheoliadau hawl cynnig cyntaf yn ofynnol i alluogi landlordiaid tenantiaid diogel i gynnwys cyfamod a dogfennau trosglwyddo hawl i brynu, gan roi blaenoriaeth iddynt ailbrynu eiddo er mwyn eu gosod i bobl eraill sydd arnynt angen cartref. Bydd yr hawl yn parhau am 10 mlynedd ar ôl y pryniant gwreiddiol. Os na fydd y cyn landlord yn dymuno ailbrynu, gall ef neu hi enwebu landlord cymdeithasol cofrestredig arall—cymdeithas dai fel arfer—i ystyried y mater. Mae'r offeryn yn caniatáu wyth wythnos ar gyfer y broses i sicrhau nad yw'r perchennog yn wynebu oedi afresymol wrth waredu'r eiddo.

Bwriedir i'r Gorchymyn gwybodaeth i denantiaid ddarparu'r holl wybodaeth sydd ei hangen ar denantiaid i'w helpu i benderfynu a ydynt am fanteisio ar eu hawl i brynu, a hynny'n gynnar yn y broses. Mynegwyd pryderon gan Shelter ac eraill, gan fod rhai prynwyr wedi wynebu anawsterau ariannol, er enghraifft, pan fydd prynwyr fflatiau prydles yn gorfod talu costau gwasanaethu

for major repairs to the block. The 2004 Act introduces a requirement for every body that lets property under secure tenancies to prepare a document containing information on the right to buy and the responsibilities of home ownership, which I think is quite important.

We consulted a wide range of stakeholders last year on the policy framework for these statutory instruments. The proposals received widespread support, although there was some concern about the ability of local authorities to fund repurchases. However, if they wish, authorities may nominate another social landlord to accept an offer, as they might have access to a wider range of funding. I have written to the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee to inform it of my intention to seek Cabinet approval to make the regulations using the executive procedure and that the statutory instruments would be taken to Plenary, as they have been today. As Members know, I am not keen on the executive procedure, but I hope that I have been able to explain fully to committee why this was necessary on this occasion. I commend these Orders to the Assembly.

Leanne Wood: No-one can deny that we are facing one of the biggest housing challenges that we have seen for a long time. We already have high levels of homelessness, private houses are out of the reach of first-time buyers, and there is a serious shortage of social housing. A report published last week by the Hay Group showed that the average house price in some Welsh towns is now seven times the national average salary, and, according to the Chartered Institute of Housing Cymru, nearly one in 10 homes is not fit for habitation and social housing is so scarce that one person presents himself or herself as homeless every six minutes.

While we in Plaid Cymru are supportive of the introduction of these regulations, because they are going in the right direction, we are clear that they do not go far enough. We would like to an end to the right to buy. The

sylweddol am waith atgyweirio mawr i'r bloc. Mae Deddf 2004 yn cyflwyno gofyniad bod pawb sy'n gosod eiddo o dan denantiaethau diogel yn paratoi dogfen sy'n cynnwys gwybodaeth am yr hawl i brynu a chyfrifoldebau perchennog cartref, sy'n eithaf pwysig yn fy marn i.

Buom yn ymgynghori ag amrywiaeth eang o randdeiliaid y llynedd am y fframwaith polisi ar gyfer yr offerynnau statudol hyn. Derbyniodd y cynigion gefnogaeth eang, er bod peth pryder ynghylch gallu ariannol awdurdodau lleol i ailbrynu eiddo. Fodd bynnag, os ydynt yn dymuno, gall awdurdodau enwebu landlord cymdeithasol cofrestredig arall i dderbyn cynnig, gan ei bod y bosibl y gallant hwy gael cyllid o amryw o ffynonellau. Yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio i'w hysbysu o'm bwriad i geisio cael cymeradwyaeth y Cabinet i wneud y rheoliadau gan ddefnyddio'r weithdrefn weithredol ac y byddai'r offerynnau statudol yn cael eu rhoi gerbron y Cyfarfod llawn, fel sydd wedi digwydd heddiw. Fel y gŵyr yr Aelodau, nid wyf yn or-hoff o'r weithdrefn weithredol, ond hyderaf fy mod wedi rhoi esboniad llawn i'r pwyllgor pam y mae hyn yn angenrheidiol ar yr achlysur hwn. Cymeradwyaf y Gorchmynion hyn i'r Cynulliad.

Leanne Wood: Ni all neb wadu nad ydym yn wynebu un o'r heriau mwyaf a welwyd ym maes tai ers amser maith. Mae gennym eisoes lefelau uchel o ddiartrefedd, mae tai preifat y tu hwnt i gyrraedd prynwyr tro cyntaf, ac mae prinder difrifol o ran tai cymdeithasol. Dangosodd adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd gan yr Hay Group yr wythnos diwethaf fod pris cyfartalog tai mewn rhai trefi yng Nghymru erbyn hyn saith gwaith yn fwy na'r cyflog cyfartalog cenedlaethol, ac, yn ôl Sefydliad Siartredig Tai Cymru, nid yw cyflwr bron un tŷ o bob 10 yn ddigon da i bobl fyw ynddynt ac mae tai cymdeithasol mor brin fel bod rhywun yn cyflwyno'i hun fel person digartref bob chwe munud.

Er ein bod ni ym Mhlaid Cymru'n cefnogi cyflwyno'r rheoliadau hyn, gan eu bod yn mynd i'r cyfeiriad cywir, yr ydym am ei gwneud yn amlwg nad ydynt yn mynd yn ddigon pell. Hoffem weld diwedd ar yr hawl i

right to buy is one of the main reasons why we have such a serious shortage of social housing. At the very least, local authorities should be able to opt out of the right to buy.

Finally, on the Conservatives' amendments, Plaid Cymru will vote against them. The Conservatives are not to be trusted on the matter of social housing. It was they who introduced the right to buy, and that has caused huge problems. It is absolutely vital that we get to grips with the housing crisis, and the first step is to accept that we have a housing crisis.

David Davies: Are you aware of various surveys that prove that the majority of people who do not own their own houses actually want the right to buy them, and that extending the right to buy would be a wonderful act? Why are you trying to deny working people the chance to own their own homes?

Leanne Wood: Sometimes, what individuals want is incompatible with the greater good, and this is a classic example. Now is the time to start undoing the damaging policies of the past and to invest in housing for future generations.

Lorraine Barrett: Do you agree that people have the right to rent, which I feel is more important than the right to buy?

Leanne Wood: I would agree that people have the right to rent, and I would work with you on trying to extend the right to rent.

Now is the time to start undoing the damaging policies of the past and to invest in housing for future generations. If we continue to bury our heads in the sand on this issue, the crisis will get worse.

3.30 p.m.

brynu. Yr hawl i brynu yw un o'r rhesymau pennaf pam mae tai cymdeithasol mor brin. Dylai awdurdodau lleol, yn y man lleiaf, fod â'r hawl i eithrio'u hunain o'r cynllun hawl i brynu.

Yn olaf, ynglŷn â gwelliannau'r Ceidwadwyr, bydd Plaid Cymru'n pleidleisio yn eu herbyn. Ni ellir ymddiried yn y Ceidwadwyr yng nghyswllt tai cymdeithasol. Hwy oedd yn gyfrifol am gyflwyno'r hawl i brynu yn y lle cyntaf, ac mae hynny wedi achosi problemau enfawr. Mae'n gwbl hanfodol inni fynd i'r afael â'r argyfwng tai, a'r cam cyntaf yw derbyn bod gennym argyfwng tai.

David Davies: A ydych yn gyfarwydd â'r gwahanol arolygon sy'n profi y byddai mwyafrif y bobl sydd heb fod yn berchen ar eu tai eu hunain yn dymuno cael yr hawl i'w prynu, ac y byddai ymestyn yr hawl i brynu'n weithred werth chweil? Pam yr ydych yn ceisio gwrthod y cyfle i bobl sy'n gweithio i fod yn berchen ar eu cartrefi eu hunain?

Leanne Wood: Weithiau, mae'r hyn y mae unigolion yn dymuno'i gael yn anghydnaws â lles y mwyafrif, ac mae hyn yn enghraifft berffaith o hynny. Dyma'r adeg i ddechrau dad-wneud polisiau niweidiol y gorffennol a buddsoddi mewn tai ar gyfer cenedlaethau'r dyfodol.

Lorraine Barrett: A ydych yn cytuno bod gan bobl yr hawl i rentu, sydd, yn fy nhyb i, yn bwysicach na'r hawl i brynu?

Leanne Wood: Byddwn yn cytuno bod gan bobl yr hawl i rentu, a byddwn yn gweithio gyda chi i geisio ehangu'r hawl i rentu.

Dyma'r adeg i ddechrau dad-wneud polisiau niweidiol y gorffennol a buddsoddi mewn tai ar gyfer cenedlaethau'r dyfodol. Os byddwn yn parhau i gladdu ein pennau yn y tywod ynglŷn â hyn, bydd yr argyfwng yn gwaethygu.

Mark Isherwood: I propose amendment 1 to NDM2569 in the name of David Melding. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

agrees that when purchasing a property, the residential social landlord must pay full market price based upon independent valuation, unless the tenant is informed otherwise when initially exercising their right to buy option.

I propose the following amendments to NDM2571 in the name of David Melding. Amendment 1: add a new point at the end of the motion:

agrees that information on the terms and conditions applying to any discount under right to buy, in the event of an early resale or non-residential use by the purchaser, be provided as part of the document published by the landlord.

I propose amendment 2. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

agrees that information on the importance of engaging with a lender as soon as any financial difficulties arise be provided as part of the document published by the landlord.

At this time of housing crisis in Wales, with house prices, waiting lists and homelessness rising as the supply of new affordable housing for rent and purchase has fallen dramatically, we recognise that housing schemes which restrict resale to people in housing need must be considered as part of the solution. However, we also recognise that the homeowner, as vendor, should not be financially disadvantaged unless fully informed of the circumstances prior to purchase.

Although we know that social landlords, under these regulations, must fund repurchases at market value, we recognise the concern that local authorities will suffer from a shortage of funds for repurchase, and that property sales within a restricted market can inevitably depress prices and, therefore, trap rather than keep local people in their home communities. There is a danger, if they

Mark Isherwood: Cynigiau welliant 1 i NDM2569 yn enw David Melding. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn cytuno bod yn rhaid i'r landlord preswyl, pan fydd yn prynu eiddo, dalu pris y farchnad yn llawn yn seiliedig ar brisiad annibynnol, oni hysbysir y tenant fel arall pan fydd yn arfer ei opsiwn hawl i brynu i ddechrau.

Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol i NDM2571 yn enw David Melding. Gwelliant 1: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn cytuno y dylid darparu gwybodaeth am delerau ac amodau sy'n berthnasol i unrhyw ostyngiad o dan yr hawl i brynu, mewn achos o ailwerthu cynnar neu ddefnydd nad yw at ddibenion preswyl gan y prynwr, fel rhan o'r ddogfen a gyhoeddir gan y landlord.

Cynigiau welliant 2. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn cytuno y dylid darparu gwybodaeth am bwysigrwydd cysylltu â benthyciwr cyn gynted ag y bydd unrhyw anawsterau ariannol yn codi fel rhan o'r ddogfen a gyhoeddir gan y landlord.

Yn y cyfnod hwn pryd y ceir argyfwng tai yng Nghymru, gyda phrisiau tai, rhestrau aros a digartrefedd yn cynyddu wrth i'r cyflenwad o dai fforddiadwy newydd sydd ar gael i'w rhentu a'u prynu ostwng yn sylweddol, yr ydym yn cydnabod bod rhaid inni ystyried cynlluniau tai sy'n cyfyngu ailwerthu'r tai i bobl sydd arnynt angen tai, yn rhan o'r ateb. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym hefyd yn cydnabod na ddylai perchennog y tŷ, fel gwerthwr, fod dan anfantis ariannol oni bai ei fod yn gwbl ymwybodol o'r amgylchiadau cyn ei brynu.

Er ein bod yn gwybod bod landlordiaid cymdeithasol, yn unol â'r rheoliadau hyn, yn gorfod ailbrynu yn ôl gwerth y farchnad, yr ydym yn cydnabod y pryder y bydd awdurdodau lleol yn dioddef yn sgîl prinder arian ar gyfer ailbrynu, ac y gall gwerthu eiddo o fewn marchnad gyfyngedig, yn ddiethriad, ostwng y prisiau ac, felly, gaethiwo pobl leol yn hytrach na'u cadw yn

choose to move within Wales or beyond in the future, that they will find that the market has left them behind. In the interest of fairness and equity, sales to social landlords within the restricted period of eight weeks must, therefore, be at the full market price, based upon independent valuation.

On the proposed Order which requires landlords to provide tenants with the necessary information to decide whether they wish to apply for the right to buy, I note that the consultation has been undertaken and that organisations such as Shelter have referred to some purchasers experiencing some financial difficulties. Having worked in building societies for more than two decades, I am concerned by this. It is apparent from the schedule provided that almost all the matters detailed relate to information which should be provided to the purchaser by the lender under the mortgage code, or by the conveyancing solicitor. Therefore, I cannot avoid questioning whether the Order may, in part, be designed to scapegoat the right-to-buy scheme once again for the shortage of affordable homes in Wales.

Having helped probably hundreds of secure tenants to purchase their council homes under the right-to-buy scheme, of which I am very proud, I know that the successful mortgage applicants were responsible, intelligent and informed working people who had chosen to exercise their right to join what the Conservative Government described as a property-owning democracy, and what Gordon Brown yesterday described as a home-owning, share-owning democracy.

However, with respect to the evidence provided by organisations such as Shelter, I must accept that there are instances where the duty of care owed by solicitors and lenders fails, and that a safety net of information, along the lines proposed, should be provided by local authorities. Such information will nonetheless be incomplete unless it also includes reference to the terms and conditions

eu cymunedau. Y mae perygl y byddant yn gweld bod y farchnad wedi symud ymlaen hebddynt, os byddant yn dewis symud o fewn Cymru neu'r tu hwnt yn y dyfodol. Er mwyn tegwch a chyfiawnder, rhaid i'r eiddo a werthir i landlordiaid cymdeithasol o fewn y cyfnod cyfyngedig o wyth wythnos fod, felly, am bris llawn y farchnad, yn seiliedig ar brisiad annibynnol.

Ynghylch y Gorchymyn a gynigir, sy'n mynnu bod landlordiaid yn rhoi'r wybodaeth angenrheidiol i denantiaid er mwyn iddynt benderfynu a ydynt yn dymuno gwneud cais am yr hawl i brynu, carwn nodi bod yr ymgynghoriad wedi'i gynnal a bod mudiadau megis Shelter wedi sôn bod rhai prynwyr yn wynebu anawsterau ariannol. A minnau wedi gweithio mewn cymdeithasau adeiladu am dros ddau ddegawd, yr wyf yn bryderus ynghylch hyn. Y mae'n amlwg o'r atodlen a ddarparwyd bod bron pob un o'r materion a nodwyd yn ymwneud â'r wybodaeth y dylai'r benthyciwr, yn unol â'r cod morgais, neu'r twrnai trawsgludo ei darparu ar gyfer y prynwr. Felly, ni allaf osgoi holi a yw'r Gorchymyn wedi'i lunio, yn rhannol, i wneud bwch dihangol o'r cynllun hawl i brynu unwaith eto oherwydd prinder tai fforddiadwy yng Nghymru.

A minnau wedi helpu cannoedd, yn ôl pob tebyg, o denantiaid diogel i brynu eu tai cyngor dan y cynllun hawl i brynu, ac yr wyf yn falch iawn o hyn, yr wyf yn gwybod mai pobl a oedd yn gweithio ac a oedd yn gyfrifol, yn ddeallus ac yn wybodus oedd yr ymgeiswyr llwyddiannus am forgais, ac yr oeddent wedi dewis arfer eu hawl i ymuno â'r hyn a ddisgrifiwyd gan Lywodraeth y Ceidwadwyr fel democratiaeth sy'n perchenogi eiddo, a'r hyn a ddisgrifiodd Gordon Brown ddoe fel democratiaeth sy'n perchenogi cartref ac yn perchenogi cyfranddaliadau.

Fodd bynnag, o ran y dystiolaeth a ddarparwyd gan fudiadau megis Shelter, mae'n rhaid imi dderbyn bod sefyllfaoedd lle y bydd twrneiod a benthycwyr yn methu o ran eu dyletswydd yn ymwneud â gofal, ac y dylai awdurdodau lleol ddarparu gwybodaeth, yn unol â'r hyn a gynigiwyd. Ni fydd gwybodaeth o'r fath, serch hynny, yn gyflawn oni bai ei bod yn cyfeirio at y telerau

which apply to the discount repayable by the purchaser if the property is sold or used for non-residential purposes during the first five years of ownership under the right-to-buy scheme. I say to Leanne that that is not a party political matter—that is simply protecting the rights of the prospective purchaser. It should also make reference to the priority over discount rights granted to the mortgage lender, in relation to the purchase and any subsequent qualifying home improvements within the discount period.

In the interests of tenants, I suggest that it would be equally beneficial if the information provided stressed the importance of engaging with their mortgage lender as soon as any financial difficulties arise, where all reputable mortgage lenders will seek to provide support and agree terms that avoid the need to repossess the property on which their loan is secured.

The bottom line is that a greater proportion of council house tenants in Wales have taken the opportunity to purchase their property under the right-to-buy scheme than in any other part of the United Kingdom. Independent research shows that 90 per cent or more were still resident ten years later, as they would have been if they had remained tenants. The impact on the supply of affordable housing has, therefore, been negligible.

The Housing Act 1985 transferred the responsibility for the provision of new affordable housing to housing associations and registered social landlords, in order to generate increased development through greater housing finance and to benefit from the virtues of social enterprise, based on public sector values and private sector standards, which the Welsh Assembly Government claims to support. It was always the intention that the supply of affordable housing should, therefore, increase, and it remains a matter of public concern that the number of new social housing dwellings completed in Wales has fallen from 14,457 between 1992 and 1996, to just 3,183 during the first four years of devolution. That is the reason for the housing crisis that the people

a'r amodau sy'n berthnasol i'r gostyngiad y bydd rhaid i'r prynwr ei ad-dalu os gwerthir neu os defnyddir yr eiddo at ddefnydd nad yw at ddibenion preswyl yn ystod pum mlynedd cyntaf y berchnogaeth dan y cynllun hawl i brynu. Dywedaf wrth Leanne nad mater pleidiol yw hynny—amddiffyn hawliau'r darpar brynwr ydyw. Dylai hefyd gyfeirio at y flaenoriaeth dros hawliau gostyngiad a roddir i fenthycwyr morgeisi, o ran y prynu ac unrhyw welliannau cymwys a wneir i'r cartref wedyn o fewn cyfnod y gostyngiad.

Er budd tenantiaid, awgrymaf y byddai yr un mor fuddiol pe bai'r wybodaeth a ddarperid yn pwysleisio pwysigrwydd cysylltu â'u benthyciwr morgais cyn gynted ag y cyfyd unrhyw anawsterau ariannol. Bydd pob benthyciwr morgais dibynadwy yn ceisio rhoi cymorth ac yn cytuno ar delerau a fydd yn osgoi gorfod adfeddiannu'r eiddo a ddefnyddiwyd yn sicrwydd ar gyfer y benthyciad.

Diwedd y gân yw bod cyfran fwy o denantiaid tai cyngor yng Nghymru wedi manteisio ar y cyfle i brynu eu heiddo dan y cynllun hawl i brynu nag mewn dim un rhan arall o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Yn ôl ymchwil annibynnol, yr oedd 90 y cant neu fwy yn dal i breswyllo yno ddeng mlynedd yn ddiweddarach, fel y buasant pe baent wedi parhau'n denantiaid. Prin fu'r effaith, felly, ar y cyflenwad o dai fforddiadwy.

Yn sgîl Deddf Tai 1985, trosglwyddwyd y cyfrifoldeb dros ddarparu tai newydd fforddiadwy i gymdeithasau tai a landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig, er mwyn creu mwy o ddatblygiad drwy gyfrwng mwy o gyllid tai ac er mwyn elwa o rinweddau mentergarwch cymdeithasol, yn seiliedig ar werthoedd y sector cyhoeddus a safonau'r sector preifat y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn honni ei bod yn eu cefnogi. Y bwriad erioed oedd y dylai'r cyflenwad o dai fforddiadwy, felly, gynyddu, ac mae'n parhau'n fater sy'n peri pryder i'r cyhoedd fod nifer y tai cymdeithasol newydd a gwblhawyd yng Nghymru wedi gostwng o 14,457 rhwng 1992 ac 1996 i ddim ond 3,183 yn ystod pedair blynedd cyntaf datganoli. Dyna'r rheswm dros yr argyfwng tai y mae

of Wales are suffering today.

Mick Bates: The Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome these regulations and wish to add a comment to the argument for the right to buy. The Conservative Party makes up one force in favour of the right to buy, and the outright opposition on the Labour benches has not been proven by the Labour Party's actions. We believe that there has to be an option to suspend the right to buy in places. Simply burying your head in the sand about the principle does not resolve the issues of homelessness and people's inability to find suitable rented property or even to buy suitable property. Therefore, there has to be a sensible option where the right to buy can be suspended so that the crisis in places such as Ceredigion or Powys, where we have an acute affordable housing and renting crisis, can be resolved. The sooner that people understand that and get to the point, the better for those people who are currently suffering.

On amendment 1, we have great respect for Mark's experience in dealing with mortgaging properties and in the way in which registered social landlords operate, and we found some merit in the concept of having an independent valuation. However, we consider that there was not enough information to assess how this valuation would take place, because there has been an impact in the past when the social housing grant has been used as part of the discount. How would we assess that when the property comes up for resale and how would people repay the discount? That may impose a distinct burden on the independent valuer, who will then have to place the burden on the vendor. There is merit, however, in looking at protecting the market value.

The other two amendments that have been proposed are completely in line with our view that information should be transparent and that tenants should be protected.

The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart): On amendment 1 to the Housing (Right to Buy) (Information to Secure Tenants) (Wales) Order 2005, paragraph 1 of the schedule to

pobl Cymru yn ei ddiodeff heddiw.

Mick Bates: Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn croesawu'r rheoliadau hyn ac yn dymuno ychwanegu sylw at y ddadl o blaid yr hawl i brynu. Y Blaid Geidwadol yw un grym sydd o blaid yr hawl i brynu ac er bod y meinciau Llafur wedi gwrthwynebu hyn yn llwyr, nid yw gweithredoedd y Blaid Lafur wedi adlewyrchu hynny. Credwn fod rhaid rhoi dewis i atal yr hawl i brynu mewn mannau. Nid yw cuddio eich pen yn y tywod ynghylch yr egwyddor yn mynd i ddatrys digartrefedd ac anallu pobl i ddod o hyd i eiddo addas ar rent neu hyd yn oed brynu eiddo addas. Felly, mae'n rhaid cynnig dewis call lle y gellir atal yr hawl i brynu er mwyn datrys yr argyfwng mewn ardaloedd megis Ceredigion neu Bowys, sy'n wynebu argyfwng difrifol o ran tai fforddiadwy a rhentu. Gorau po gyntaf y bydd pobl yn deall hynny ac yn gwneud rhywbeth yn ei gylch, er budd y bobl hynny sy'n diodeff ar hyn o bryd.

Ynghylch gwelliant 1, y mae gennym barch mawr at brofiad Mark o ran delio â sicrhau morgeisi ar gyfer eiddo ac o ran y modd y mae landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig yn gweithredu, ac yr oeddem yn gweld rhyw rinwedd yn y syniad o gael prisiad annibynnol. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym o'r farn nad oedd digon o wybodaeth ar gael i asesu sut y byddid yn cynnal y prisiad, oherwydd gwelwyd effaith yn y gorffennol pan ddefnyddiwyd y grant tai cymdeithasol fel rhan o'r gostyngiad. Sut y byddem yn asesu hynny pan fyddai'r eiddo yn cael ei ailwerthu, a sut y byddai pobl yn ad-dalu'r gostyngiad? Gallai hynny osod baich amlwg ar y prisiwr annibynnol a fydd, wedyn, yn gosod y baich ar y gwerthwr. Mae rhinwedd, fodd bynnag, mewn ceisio amddiffyn gwerth y farchnad.

Mae'r ddau welliant arall a gynigiwyd yn cyd-fynd yn llwyr â'n barn y dylai gwybodaeth fod yn dryloyw ac y dylid amddiffyn tenantiaid.

Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart): Ynghylch gwelliant 1 i Orchymyn Tai (Hawl i Brynu) (Gwybodaeth i Denantiaid Diogel) (Cymru) 2005, mae paragraff 1 yn yr atodlen

the Order requires landlords to give an outline of the effects of the provision of the right to buy. The repayment of the discount in the event of an early disposal is an important part of the right to buy and should be covered in any outline of the scheme. Therefore, the amendment is not required.

On amendment 2 to NDM2571, the purpose of the Order is to specify matters in which it would be desirable for secure tenants to have information when considering whether to exercise the right to buy and it is not to provide advice on matters that may or may not arise subsequently. Paragraph 4 of the schedule to the Order requires landlords to provide information on the risk of the dwelling house being repossessed if regular mortgage payments are not made. I believe that paragraphs 4 and 3(2)(a) are sufficient to alert tenants to the fact that they will need to make regular payments in respect of a mortgage or risk repossession. Therefore, that amendment is not required.

On the amendment to the Housing (Right of First Refusal) (Wales) Regulations 2005, the Housing Act 1985, as amended by the Housing Act 2004, states that consideration for a disposal under these regulations is the amount agreed between the parties or determined by the district valuer as being the value of the dwelling house from the time when the offer is made. Therefore, I do not believe that that amendment is required either.

On the discussion on affordable housing and other such issues, I concur with Leanne's comments on the right to buy. We have a manifesto commitment to suspend the right to buy in areas of housing pressure, but that will require primary legislation. Until then, introducing the facility that allows the repurchase of former right-to-buy properties is a clear demonstration that we are doing all that we can to ensure that properties are available for rent by those in housing need. Sometimes the rights of the individual are not as great as the rights of society in general, and we have to put people who need housing first.

i'r Gorchymyn yn mynnu bod landlordiaid yn cyflwyno amlinelliad o effeithiau rhoi'r hawl i brynu. Mae ad-dalu'r gostyngiad pe gwaredid yr eiddo'n gynnar yn rhan bwysig o'r hawl i brynu a dylid ei gynnwys mewn unrhyw amlinelliad o'r cynllun. Felly, nid oes angen y gwelliant.

Ynghylch gwelliant 2 i NDM2571, diben y Gorchymyn yw nodi'r materion hynny y byddai'n dda i denantiaid diogel gael gwybodaeth amdanynt wrth iddynt ystyried a ydynt am arfer eu hawl i brynu, ac nid er mwyn rhoi cyngor am faterion a allai godi wedyn efallai. Mae paragraff 4 yr atodlen i'r Gorchymyn yn mynnu bod landlordiaid yn rhoi gwybodaeth am y perygl y gellir adfeddiannu'r tŷ annedd oni thelir y taliadau morgais yn rheolaidd. Credaf fod paragraffau 4 a 3(2)(a) yn ddigonol i rybuddio tenantiaid y bydd rhaid iddynt dalu taliadau rheolaidd ar gyfer y morgais neu wynebu'r perygl o adfeddiannu'r eiddo. Felly, nid oes angen y gwelliant hwnnw.

Ynghylch y gwelliant i Reoliadau Tai (Hawl Cynnig Cyntaf) (Cymru) 2005, mae Deddf Tai 1985, fel y'i diwygiwyd gan Ddeddf Tai 2004, yn datgan mai'r tâl am waredu eiddo dan y rheoliadau hyn yw'r swm y cytunir arno rhwng y partion neu'r hyn a bennir gan y prisiwr rhanbarth fel gwerth y tŷ annedd adeg gwneud y cynnig. Ni chredaf, felly, fod angen y gwelliant hwnnw ychwaith.

O ran y drafodaeth ynghylch tai fforddiadwy a materion eraill o'r fath, cytunaf â sylwadau Leanne am yr hawl i brynu. Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo yn ein maniffesto i atal yr hawl i brynu mewn mannau lle y gwelir bod y farchnad dai dan bwysau, ond bydd rhaid cael deddfwriaeth sylfaenol i sicrhau hynny. Hyd nes y ceir hynny mae cyflwyno'r cyfleuster sy'n caniatáu ailbrynu eiddo a oedd gynt yn eiddo hawl i brynu, yn dangos yn glir ein bod yn gwneud ein gorau glas i sicrhau bod eiddo ar gael i'w rentu i'r rhai sydd arnynt angen tai. Weithiau nid yw hawliau'r unigolyn yn gyfwerth â hawliau'r gymdeithas yn gyffredinol, ac mae'n rhaid i ni roi blaenoriaeth i bobl sydd arnynt angen tŷ.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 8, Ymatal 6, Yn erbyn 31.
Amendment 1: For 8, Abstain 6, Against 31.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Laura Anne
Morgan, Jonathan
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wood, Leanne

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
German, Michael
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM2569): O blaid 46, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2569): For 46, Abstain 1, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff

Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelod canlynol:
The following Member abstained:

Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

3.40 p.m.

*Cynnig (NDM2570): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2570): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew

Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 13, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 35.
Amendment 1: For 13, Abstain 0, Against 35.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann

Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 14, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 35.
Amendment 2: For 14, Abstain 0, Against 35.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Laura Anne
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM2571): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2571): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2572): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2572): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Mynediad i Wybodaeth (Mabwysiadu Ôl-gychwyn)
(Cymru) 2005 a Rheoliadau Gwybodaeth Mabwysiadu a Gwasanaethau
Cyfryngol (Mabwysiadu Cyn-gychwyn) (Cymru) 2005
Approval of the Access to Information (Post-commencement Adoptions) (Wales)
Regulations 2005 and the Adoption Information and Intermediary Services (Pre-
commencement Adoptions) (Wales) Regulations 2005**

Y Llywydd: Cynigiwyd i'r ddwy eitem nesaf **The Presiding Officer:** It has been proposed
gael eu trafod gyda'i gilydd, gyda that the next two items be debated together,

phleidleisiau ar wahân. Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad i'r cynnig.

The Minister for Health and Social Service (Brian Gibbons): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Access to Information (Post-commencement Adoptions) (Wales) Regulations 2005, a copy of which was laid in Table Office on 6 September 2005. (NDM2573)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 20 September 2005 in relation to the draft Access to Information (Post-commencement Adoptions) (Wales) Regulations 2005; and

2. approves that the Access to Information (Post-commencement Adoptions) (Wales) Regulations 2005 is made in accordance with:

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 6 September 2005; and

b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 6 September 2005. (NDM2574)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Adoption Information and Intermediary Services (Pre-commencement Adoptions) (Wales) Regulations 2005, a copy of which was laid in Table Office on 6 September 2005. (NDM2575)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 20 September 2005 in relation to the draft Adoption Information and Intermediary

with separate votes. I see that there are no objections.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Cynigïaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Mynediad i Wybodaeth (Mabwysiadu Ôl-gychwyn) (Cymru) 2005, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Medi 2005. (NDM2573)

Cynigïaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 20 Medi 2005 mewn perthynas â'r Rheoliadau Mynediad i Wybodaeth (Mabwysiadu Ôl-gychwyn) (Cymru) 2005 drafft; ac

2. yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Mynediad i Wybodaeth (Mabwysiadu Ôl-gychwyn) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:

a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Medi 2005; a

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Medi 2005. (NDM2574)

Cynigïaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Gwybodaeth Mabwysiadu a Gwasanaethau Cyfryngol (Mabwysiadu Cyn-gychwyn) Cymru 2005, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Medi 2005. (NDM2575)

Cynigïaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 20 Medi 2005 mewn perthynas â'r Rheoliadau Gwybodaeth Mabwysiadu a Gwasanaethau

Services (pre-commencement Adoptions) (Wales) Regulations 2005; and

Cyfryngol (Mabwysiadu Cyn-gychwyn) (Cymru) 2005 drafft; ac

2. *approves that the Adoption Information and Intermediary Services (pre-commencement Adoptions) (Wales) Regulations 2005 is made in accordance with:*

2. *yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Gwybodaeth Mabwysiadu a Gwasanaethau Cyfryngol (Mabwysiadu Cyn-gychwyn) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 6 September 2005; and

a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Medi 2005; a

b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 6 September 2005. (NDM2576)

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Medi 2005. (NDM2576)

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Croesawn y rheoliadau hyn. A yw'r Gweinidog wedi ystyried llunio fersiwn o'r rheoliadau a fyddai'n ddefnyddiol i bobl ifanc a phlant a fyddai eisiau cael y fath wybodaeth, a fyddai'n llai cymhleth na'r wybodaeth sydd i'w chael yn y rheoliadau? Gwn fod nifer o fudiadau plant ac ieuencid yn cefnogi hynny.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: We welcome these regulations. Has the Minister considered producing a version of the regulations that would be useful to young people and children who would wish to receive this kind of information, which would be less complex than the information provided in the regulations? I know that many organisations that support children and young people support that.

Jenny Randerson: I welcome these regulations on behalf of the Welsh Liberal Democrats. There have been serious problems in the past, and the situation has been unsatisfactory. There is a natural desire for people to want to find out about the children that they have given up for adoption, or their parents when they have been adopted. There is a great deal of human tragedy, anguish and trauma behind these regulations.

Jenny Randerson: Croesawaf y rheoliadau hyn ar ran Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru. Gwelwyd problemau difrifol yn y gorffennol, ac mae'r sefyllfa wedi bod yn anfodddhaol. Mae'n naturiol bod pobl am wybod beth yw hynt a helynt y plant y maent wedi'u rhoi i'w mabwysiadu, neu eu rhieni os ydynt wedi cael eu mabwysiadu. Y mae cryn dipyn o drasiedi ddynol, pryder a thrawma y tu ôl i'r rheoliadau hyn.

There has also been a great deal of unevenness in terms of the way in which information has been provided. There have been occasions when people have been given information that others did not want to be imparted, and there has been a great deal of unevenness in the advice and counselling that people have received. Make no mistake, in many cases, people need counselling on this issue. Therefore, I particularly welcome the principle and details in the regulations. I want to draw out the fact that, if someone refuses permission for information to be disclosed, it is now possible to have a halfway house. For example, if a mother wants to know about her daughter, she can at least be given information about her general welfare, such

Gwelwyd hefyd lawer iawn o anghysondeb o ran y modd y darparwyd y wybodaeth. Mae rhai pobl wedi cael gwybodaeth nad oedd ar eraill eisiau iddi gael ei rhannu, a bu llawer iawn o anghysondeb yn y cyngor a'r cwnsela a roddwyd i bobl. Peidiwch â chamgymryd, mewn llawer o achosion, mae angen cwnsela ar bobl ar y mater hwn. Felly, croesawaf yn arbennig yr egwyddor a'r manylion yn y rheoliadau. Hoffwn dynnu sylw at y ffaith, os bydd rhywun yn gwrthod caniatâd i ddatgelu gwybodaeth, ei bod bellach yn bosibl cael tŷ hanner ffordd. Er enghraifft, os bydd ar fam eisiau gwybod am ei merch, gellir o leiaf roi gwybodaeth iddi am ei lles cyffredinol, megis ei bod yn fyw, yn hapus, yn iach, a bod ganddi ei theulu ei hun. Yr wyf yn cymryd—

as that she is alive, happy, healthy, and has a family of her own. I assume—and perhaps the Minister could clarify this point—that, increasingly, people feel the need to know genetic information. They want to know whether there are particular illnesses or conditions in the family. Will such information be covered by the halfway house measure so that it can be revealed without the identifying information on the individual being revealed?

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): I thank Jenny for her comments, which sum up the whole ethos behind this set of regulations. It is true that they are underpinned by the principle of consent, as well as the right to veto, which is equally important. With regard to your question on the availability of non-identifying information, I think that that is part of these regulations. I will get confirmation of that, but it is my understanding that, if the information is generic and could not be used to identify someone, providing it would be within the letter and spirit of the regulation. I will clarify that, rather than making the law up as I go along.

Rhodri Glyn made a very good point. There have been incidences where we have tried to make information available in children-friendly terms, and part of the national minimum standards—which we will come to later—is that information must be made available in a user-friendly way. However, it might be useful to deal specifically with your point about giving information to children. I will take that on board and bring it back to my officials.

ac efallai y gallai'r Gweinidog fwrw goleuni ar y pwynt hwn—fod pobl yn teimlo fwyfwy yr angen i wybod am eu genynnau. Mae arnynt eisiau gwybod a oes afiechydon neu gyflyrau penodol yn y teulu. A fydd gwybodaeth o'r fath yn cael ei chynnwys yn y mesur hanner ffordd fel y gellir ei datgelu heb ddatgelu'r wybodaeth a fyddai'n dangos pwy yw'r unigolyn?

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Diolch i Jenny am ei sylwadau, sydd yn crynhoi holl ethos y rheoliadau hyn. Mae'n wir bod egwyddor cydsyniad yn sylfaenol iddynt, yn ogystal â'r hawl i ddefnyddio fetó, sydd yr un mor bwysig. O ran eich cwestiwn am ddarparu gwybodaeth na fyddai'n dangos pwy yw unigolyn, credaf fod hynny'n rhan o'r rheoliadau hyn. Caf gadarnhad o hynny, ond yn ôl a ddeallaf, os yw'r wybodaeth yn gyffredinol ac na ellid ei defnyddio i adnabod rhywun, byddai rhoi'r wybodaeth honno o fewn llythyren ac ysbryd y rheoliad. Caf eglurhad ar hynny, yn hytrach na dyfeisio'r ddeddf o'm pen a'm pastwn fy hun.

Gwnaeth Rhodri Glyn bwynt da iawn. Cafwyd digwyddiadau lle'r ydym wedi ceisio darparu gwybodaeth mewn termau hawdd eu deall gan blant, ac mae'n rhan o'r safonau gofynnol cenedlaethol—y deunw atynt toc—fod yn rhaid darparu gwybodaeth mewn modd y gall y defnyddiwr ei ddeall yn rhwydd. Fodd bynnag, efallai y byddai'n fuddiol delio'n benodol â'ch pwynt ynghylch rhoi gwybodaeth i blant. Ystyriaf hynny a'i drafod eto â'm swyddogion.

*Cynnig (NDM2573): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2573): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane

Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2574): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2574): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa

German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2575): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2575): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine

Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

3.50 p.m.

*Cynnig (NDM2576): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2576): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark

James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Cymeradwyo'r Safonau Gofynnol Cenedlaethol ar gyfer Asiantaethau Cymorth Mabwysiadu

Approval of the National Minimum Standards for Adoption Support Agencies

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the National Minimum Standards for Adoption Support Agencies a copy of which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 20 September 2005. (NDM2577)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales acting under Standing Order No. 29.3(iii) approves the National Minimum Standards for Adoption Support Agencies, which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 20 September 2005. (NDM2578)

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Croesawaf y rheoliadau hyn, ond mae'r system yng Nghymru yn wahanol i'r hyn a ddilyniir yn Lloegr a chroesawaf wahaniaethau o'r fath pan fo rheswm da drostynt. Fodd bynnag, sut

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor y Safonau Gofynnol Cenedlaethol ar gyfer Asiantaethau Cymorth Mabwysiadu y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 20 Medi 2005. (NDM2577)

Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3(iii) yn cymeradwyo'r Safonau Gofynnol Cenedlaethol ar gyfer Asiantaethau Cymorth Mabwysiadu, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 20 Medi 2005. (NDM2578)

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I welcome these regulations, but the system in Wales is different from that which is followed in England though I welcome such differences if there is a good reason for them. However,

y byddwch yn monitro'r system newydd hon?
A oes canllawiau mewn lle i sicrhau bod hynny'n cael ei wneud yn drylwyr?

how will you monitor this new system? Are there any guidelines in place to ensure that that is done diligently?

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): These regulations will be monitored through the normal inspection process—that would certainly be my intention and that of the regulations. You are right to say that it has been a while since this Act was enacted in 2002, and a considerable amount of back-room work needs to be done to ensure that the specific regulations fit in with the precise situations in England and Wales. It has taken us a long time to get to this particular stage because we wanted to fine tune the regulations that would be specific to Wales rather than rush the job. Hopefully, we have achieved that and they will be subject to the normal inspection process.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Caiff y rheoliadau hyn eu monitro drwy'r broses arolygu arferol—dyna'n sicr fyddai fy mwriad a bwriad y rheoliadau. Yr ydych yn iawn wrth ddweud bod cryn amser wedi mynd heibio heibio ers i'r Ddeddf hon ddod i rym yn 2002, ac mae angen gwneud cryn dipyn o waith yn yr ystafell gefn i sicrhau bod y rheoliadau penodol yn cyd-fynd â'r union sefyllfaoedd yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Cymerodd amser maith inni gyrraedd y fan hon oherwydd bod arnom eisiau manwl diwnio'r rheoliadau a fyddai'n benodol i Gymru yn hytrach na gwneud y gwaith mewn modd brysiog. Gobeithio ein bod wedi llwyddo i wneud hynny a byddant yn destun y broses arolygu arferol.

Cynnig (NDM2577): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM2577): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw

Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2578): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2578): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun

Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Cymeradwyo Cynllun Grant Dysgu'r Cynulliad 2005-06 Approval of the Assembly Learning Grant Scheme 2005-06

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Cynllun Grant Dysgu'r Cynulliad ar gyfer 2005-06 y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 20 Medi 2005. (NDM2579)

Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3(iii) yn cymeradwyo Cynllun Grant Dysgu'r Cynulliad ar gyfer 2005-06, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 20 Medi 2005. (NDM2580)

Janet Ryder: I draw the Minister's attention to the fact that, in higher education, only 4 per cent of part-time students were successful in their applications for Assembly learning grants and, in further education, only 14 per cent of students were successful. While a commission is currently looking at support for part-time students, what is the Minister doing to make that Assembly learning grant more accessible to part-time students? You could make it more accessible to more people by looking at the cut-off level above which you do not qualify for an Assembly learning grant. At the moment that is set at £16,066 and so, if your household income is above that, you do not qualify for that grant. That excludes many people who are just above that level, who really need this grant and who cannot apply for it.

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Assembly Learning Grant Scheme 2005-06 a copy of which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 20 September 2005. (NDM2579)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales acting under Standing Order No. 29.3(iii) approves the Assembly Learning Grant Scheme 2005-06, which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 20 September 2005. (NDM2580)

Janet Ryder: Tynnaf sylw'r Gweinidog at y ffaith mai dim ond 4 y cant o fyfyrwyr rhan-amser mewn addysg uwch a fu'n llwyddiannus yn eu ceisiadau am grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad, ac mai dim ond 14 y cant o fyfyrwyr mewn addysg bellach a fu'n llwyddiannus. Tra bo comisiwn wrthi ar hyn o bryd yn edrych ar gymorth i fyfyrwyr rhan-amser, beth y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud i sicrhau ei bod yn haws i fyfyrwyr rhan-amser gael grant dysgu'r Cynulliad? Gallech ei wneud yn haws ei gael i fwy o bobl drwy edrych ar y torbwynt o ran bod yn gymwys ar gyfer grant dysgu'r Cynulliad. Ar hyn o bryd, £16,066 yw hwnnw, ac felly, os yw incwm eich cartref yn fwy na hynny, nid ydych yn gymwys i gael y grant. Mae hynny'n cau allan nifer o bobl sydd ychydig uwchlaw'r lefel honno, sydd â gwir angen am y grant ac sydd yn methu â gwneud cais amdano.

In contrast, if you look at the financial and household qualifications for the education maintenance grant allowance, which we will be considering next, you will see that that does not start to taper off any funding until you get over £20,000, if the regulations are approved today. You are allowed a household income of up to £30,000 before that is cut off altogether. It is time for the Minister to look again at that baseline for qualifying for an Assembly learning grant to help to raise students out of student debt, to help households on a very low income, and to encourage more people into education.

William Graham: I would like to offer broad support for these two measures, but how will the Minister assure the Assembly that all eligible students will apply for the Assembly learning grant, and how will that be adequately advertised? How will she ensure that the application system for the Assembly learning grant scheme is efficiently applied by local education authorities, and how will she monitor that, and, if necessary offer correction and advice? Will the Minister also outline her considerations for the adjustment of the income criteria for awarding the grant? Will she state her consideration of how the level of grant will adequately reflect the increased cost of living? In particular, on item 10, is the Minister satisfied that adequate systems are in place to ensure that no student is disadvantaged regarding whether they qualify for the Assembly learning grant?

Peter Black: Like the previous speakers, we broadly support these regulations. The Assembly learning grant is crucial in trying to reduce student debt and in assisting students in going through college. The points made about how the learning grant is assessed are perfectly valid. We should be trying to get the widest possible take-up of these grants. We should certainly be looking at the current take-up rate under the present system, to make sure that everything is being done to ensure that those students who are entitled to these grants receive them.

Mewn cyferbyniad, os edrychwch ar y cymwysterau, yn ariannol ac o ran y cartref, ar gyfer y lwfans grant cynhaliaeth addysg, y byddwn yn ei ystyried nesaf, gwelwch nad yw hwnnw'n dechrau lleihau'r cyllid nes ichi fynd dros £20,000, os cymeradwyir y rheoliadau heddiw. Caniateir incwm cartref ichi o hyd at £30,000 cyn iddo gael ei dorri i ffwrdd yn gyfan gwbl. Mae'n bryd i'r Gweinidog edrych eto ar y llinell waelod honno ar gyfer bod yn gymwys i gael grant dysgu'r Cynulliad i helpu i godi myfyrwyr allan o ddyled, i helpu teuluoedd ar incwm isel iawn, ac i annog rhagor o bobl i gael addysg.

William Graham: Hoffwn gynnig cefnogaeth gyffredinol i'r ddau fesur hyn, ond sut y gwnaiff y Gweinidog sicrhau'r Cynulliad y bydd pob myfyrwr cymwys yn gwneud cais am grant dysgu'r Cynulliad, ac y caiff hwnnw ei hysbysebu'n ddigonol? Sut y gwnaiff hi sicrhau y caiff y system ymgeisio am grant dysgu'r Cynulliad ei gweithredu'n effeithlon gan awdurdodau addysg lleol, a sut y gwnaiff hi fonitro hynny, ac, os bydd angen, cynnig cyngor a chywiro camgymeriadau? A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu hefyd ei hystyriaethau ar gyfer addasu'r meini prawf o ran incwm ar gyfer dyfarnu'r grant? A wnaiff hi ddatgan, yn ei barn hi, y modd y bydd lefel y grant yn adlewyrchu'n ddigonol y cynnydd mewn costau byw? Yn benodol, ar eitem 10, a ydyw'r Gweinidog yn sicr bod systemau digonol wedi'u sefydlu i sicrhau na fydd yr un myfyrwr dan anfantais o ran a ydynt yn gymwys i gael grant dysgu'r Cynulliad?

Peter Black: Fel y siaradwyr blaenorol, yr ydym ninnau'n cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn yn gyffredinol. Mae grant dysgu'r Cynulliad yn allweddol wrth geisio lleihau dyled myfyrwyr ac i gynorthwyo myfyrwyr i fynd drwy'r coleg. Mae'r pwyntiau a wnaethpwyd am y modd yr asesir y grant dysgu'n berffaith ddilys. Dylem fod yn ceisio cael cymaint o bobl ag sydd yn bosibl i fanteisio ar y grantiau hyn. Yn sicr, dylem fod yn edrych ar gyfradd y rhai sy'n manteisio arnynt ar hyn o bryd dan y system bresennol, er mwyn gwneud yn siŵr bod popeth yn cael ei wneud i sicrhau bod y myfyrwyr hynny sydd â hawl i gael y grantiau hyn yn eu derbyn.

Secondly, we should look at the qualification criteria. We should try to increase the number of students who are eligible for Assembly learning grants. As part of the overall student support packages that are being put in place, and certainly as part of the measures that were agreed earlier this year, I hope that we can encourage more students to take up those grants and make more students eligible for them in Wales, so that we can deal with the level of debt that many students face when they graduate from colleges across Wales.

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I will deal with higher education first. The Assembly learning grant will work closely alongside the new higher education grant that has been introduced by the UK Government. For this year and the next, it will provide top-ups for those who are eligible for greater grants as a result of the new higher education grant, where appropriate. It will be rolled up in the new £2,700 grant in future.

In terms of further education, it is worth reminding Assembly Members that we are the only legislature offering grants like these. In terms of higher education, eligibility is automatic, and so students have a take-up that is related to their eligibility for the major grants under the UK system and that is also delivered through the local authorities based on the income assessment. We have to encourage further education students to apply. It is important to demonstrate that an increasing number of students from further education colleges are claiming the Assembly learning grant. I am sure that Members will be pleased about that.

We decided, as an Assembly, that people needed to undertake sufficient part-time study to qualify for an additional grant. We have set that at 275 contact, or taught, hours for further education students, and 30-credits course content for higher education students. The part-time study group will be looking at the relationship between these when making recommendations to the Assembly for the future.

Yn ail, dylem edrych ar y meini prawf ar gyfer bod yn gymwys. Dylem geisio cynyddu nifer y myfyrwyr sydd yn gymwys i gael grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad. Fel rhan o'r pecynnau cymorth cyffredinol i fyfyrwyr sydd yn cael eu rhoi ar waith, ac yn sicr fel rhan o'r mesurau y cytunwyd arnynt yn gynharach eleni, gobeithiaf y gallwn annog rhagor o fyfyrwyr i fanteisio ar y grantiau hynny a threfnu bod rhagor o fyfyrwyr yn gymwys i'w cael yng Nghymru, fel y gallwn ddelio â lefel y ddyled y mae llawer o fyfyrwyr yn ei hwynebu wrth iddynt raddio mewn colegau ar hyd a lled Cymru.

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Deliaf gydag addysg uwch yn gyntaf. Bydd grant dysgu'r Cynulliad yn cyd-fynd â'r grant addysg uwch newydd sydd wedi'i gyflwyno gan Lywodraeth y DU. Ar gyfer eleni a'r flwyddyn nesaf, bydd yn darparu arian ychwanegol i rai sydd yn gymwys i dderbyn grantiau mwy o ganlyniad i'r grant addysg uwch newydd, lle y bo'n briodol. Caiff ei gyflwyno yn y grant newydd o £2,700 yn y dyfodol.

O ran addysg bellach, mae'n werth atgoffa Aelodau'r Cynulliad mai ni yw'r unig ddeddfwrfa sydd yn cynnig grantiau fel y rhain. O ran addysg uwch, mae cymhwysedd yn awtomatig, ac felly mae nifer y myfyrwyr sy'n cael y grantiau yn gysylltiedig â'u cymhwysedd ar gyfer y prif grantiau dan system y DU ac maent yn cael eu talu hefyd drwy'r awdurdodau lleol ar sail yr asesiad incwm. Rhaid inni annog myfyrwyr addysg bellach i wneud cais. Mae'n bwysig dangos bod nifer gynyddol o fyfyrwyr o golegau addysg bellach yn hawlio grant dysgu'r Cynulliad. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yr Aelodau'n falch o hynny.

Penderfynasom, fel Cynulliad, fod angen i bobl ymgymryd ag astudiaeth ran-amser ddigonol i fod yn gymwys ar gyfer grant ychwanegol. Yr ydym wedi pennu hynny ar 275 o oriau cyswllt, neu oriau derbyn addysg, i fyfyrwyr addysg bellach, a chynnwys cwrs 30 credyd i fyfyrwyr addysg uwch. Bydd y grŵp astudio rhan-amser yn edrych ar y berthynas rhwng y rhain wrth wneud argymhellion i'r Cynulliad ar gyfer y dyfodol.

4.00 p.m.

*Cynnig (NDM2579): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2579): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2580): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2580): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.

**Cymeradwyo'r Trefniadau Gweinyddol o dan Adran 14 Deddf Addysg 2002 sy'n
Rheoli Talu Lwfans Cynhaliath Addysg (Cynllun)**
**Approval of Administrative Arrangements under Section 14 of the Education
Act 2002 Governing the Payment of Education Maintenance Allowance (Scheme)**

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol **The Minister for Education and Lifelong**
Oes (Jane Davidson): Cynigiaf fod **Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose that

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried *the National Assembly for Wales considers*

egwyddor y Trefniadau Gweinyddol o dan Adran 14 Deddf Addysg 2002 sy'n Rheoli Talu Lwfans Cynhaliaeth Addysg (Cynllun), y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 20 Medi 2005. (NDM2581)

Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3 (iii) yn cymeradwyo'r Trefniadau Gweinyddol o dan Adran 14 Deddf Addysg 2002 sy'n Rheoli Talu Lwfans Cynhaliaeth Addysg (Cynllun), a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 20 Medi 2005. (NDM2582)

The Presiding Officer: It seems that no-one wishes to speak to the motion, we will therefore move to a vote.

Cynnig (NDM2581): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM2581): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne

the principle of the Administrative Arrangements Under Section 14 of the Education Act 2002 Governing The Payment of Education Maintenance Allowance (Scheme), a copy of which was laid in Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 20 September 2005. (NDM2581)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales acting under Standing Order No. 29.3 (iii) approves the Administrative Arrangements Under Section 14 of the Education Act 2002 Governing The Payment of Education Maintenance Allowance (Scheme), which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 20 September 2005. (NDM2582)

Y Llywydd: Ymddengys nad oes neb am siarad ar y cynnig, felly awn ati i bleidleisio.

Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2582): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2582): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne

Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.02 p.m.
 The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.02 p.m.*

Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Y Blaid Geidwadol) Minority Party Debate (The Conservative Party)

Polisi Ynni Adnewyddadwy Renewable Energy Policy

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams, and amendments 2, 3 and 4 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams a gwelliannau 2, 3 a 4 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

Alun Cairns: I propose that

Alun Cairns: Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales instructs the Welsh Assembly Government to review its renewable energy policy, and redraft TAN 8 so that the over-reliance on wind power is replaced by a full range of alternative energy sources. (NDM2567)

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn rhoi cyfarwyddyd i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru adolygu ei pholisi ynni adnewyddadwy, ac ailddrafftio TAN 8 fel bod yr orddibyniaeth ar bŵer gwynt yn cael ei ddisodli gan amrywiaeth lawn o ffynonellau ynni amgen. (NDM2567)

I propose the Conservative Party's motion, which calls on the Government to review its renewable energy policy, to redraft technical advice note 8 and to encourage and facilitate new forms of renewable energy, thus reducing its emphasis on wind.

Cynigiaf gynnig y Blaid Geidwadol, sy'n galw ar y Llywodraeth i adolygu ei pholisi ynni adnewyddadwy, ailddrafftio nodyn cyngor technegol 8 ac annog a hwyluso ffurfiau newydd ar ynni adnewyddadwy, gan leihau'r pwyslais sydd ganddi ar wynt.

Central to our concerns is that TAN 8 is a quick fix to reach Government targets that, in the long term, will do little to make a difference to global warming, but which will, in the short term, destroy our landscape and seascape, and the tourist economy that depends on our natural environment.

Sail ein pryderon yw mai ateb sydyn yw TAN 8 er mwyn cyflawni targedau'r Llywodraeth ac na fydd, yn y tymor hir, yn gwneud nemor ddim i leihau'r cynhesu bydeang, ond a fydd, yn y tymor byr, yn dinistrio ein tirwedd a'n morlun, ynghyd ag economi twristiaeth, sy'n dibynnu ar ein hamgylchedd naturiol.

The origins of this policy extend from the former Economic Development Committee's energy review, and the Conservative Party

Mae gwreiddiau'r polisi hwn yn adolygiad ynni'r hen Bwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, ac mae'r Blaid Geidwadol wedi bod yn gyson

has been consistent throughout. We have always highlighted that this would be the eventual outcome of the policy, which is why we voted against it at each stage. It will be interesting to note how individual Members and parties will vote on the motion. The Conservative Party will vote against the first two amendments, but in favour of amendments 3 and 4.

The marketing and branding of Wales for much of the last century was hampered by the scars of heavy industry—slag and coal tips, among other things. During the latter part of the century, successive Governments made a conscious effort to reclaim the land. As a result the way in which people from outside Wales view the country has been transformed. They now see unspoilt landscape and seascape, and the tourist economy has flourished. However, TAN 8, and the Government's overemphasis on wind power, means that tourism, the fastest growing sector of the economy, will be damaged enormously.

Rural Wales has suffered significantly over recent times and the wealth gap between rural and urban parts has grown dramatically, with rural areas being the poorer relation. When the Assembly was formed in 1999, tourism became central to bridging that divide. This demonstrates the Government's inconsistency. On the one hand it sets stretching targets to grow tourism spend by 6 per cent per annum, but, on the other, it proposes to cover the best parts—the natural assets of Wales—with wind turbines.

Alun Ffred Jones: You seem to suggest that the policy means that we are covering the best parts of Wales with windmills, but it does not apply to Snowdonia national park, for example. I live in that area, and there are no windmills there at the moment.

ar hyd yr adeg. Yr ydym wastad wedi pwysleisio mai dyma fyddai canlyniad y polisi hwn yn y pen draw, a dyna pam y bu inni bleidleisio yn ei erbyn bob cam o'r daith. Bydd yn ddi-ddorol gweld sut y bydd Aelodau unigol a phleidiau'n pleidleisio ar y cynnig. Bydd y Blaid Geidwadol yn pleidleisio yn erbyn y ddau welliant cyntaf ond o blaid gwelliannau 3 a 4.

Yn ystod rhan helaeth o'r ganrif ddiwethaf bu creithiau'r diwydiannau trymion yn rhwystr o ran marchnata a brandio Cymru—tomennydd slag a glo, ymhlith pethau eraill. Tua diwedd y ganrif, aeth y naill Llywodraeth a'r llall ati i adfer y tir. O ganlyniad cafodd y modd y bydd pobl o'r tu allan i Gymru'n gweld y wlad ei drawsffurfio. Bellach gwelant dirwedd a morlun sydd heb eu difetha, ac mae economi twristiaeth wedi ffynnu. Fodd bynnag, golyga TAN 8, a'r gorbwyslais a rydd y Llywodraeth ar ynni'r gwynt, y caiff twristiaeth, y sector o'r economi sy'n tyfu gyflymaf, ei niweidio'n ofnadwy.

Mae'r Gymru wledig wedi dioddef yn helaeth yn ddiweddar ac mae'r bwlc o ran cyfoeth rhwng yr ardaloedd gwledig a'r ardaloedd trefol wedi cynyddu'n ddirfawr, a'r ardaloedd gwledig sy'n dlawd. Pan ffurfiwyd y Cynulliad ym 1999, daeth twristiaeth yn elfen ganolog o ran pontio'r gagendor hwnnw. Mae hyn yn dangos anghysondeb y Llywodraeth. Ar y naill law mae'n gosod targedau uchelgeisiol i gynyddu'r gwariant ar dwristiaeth 6 y cant y flwyddyn, ond, ar y llaw arall, mae'n bwriadu gorchuddio'r rhannau gorau—asedau naturiol Cymru—â thyrbinau gwynt.

Alun Ffred Jones: Ymddengys eich bod yn awgrymu bod y polisi'n golygu ein bod yn gorchuddio'r rhannau gorau o Gymru â melinau gwynt, ond nid yw'n berthnasol i barc cenedlaethol Eryri, er enghraifft. Yr wyf yn byw yn yr ardal honno, ac nid oes melinau gwynt yno ar hyn o bryd.

Alun Cairns: I am sure that you would not say that the only attractive part of Wales is Snowdonia national park, and there are proposals to put wind turbines elsewhere in Wales, in many attractive areas that depend on the tourist industry. The feedback, and the original research from the Wales Tourist Board, shows that turbines will damage tourism. The impact on the economy is why it is recommended against wind turbines, and why national park authorities are against locating them within the national parks.

The timing of this debate is useful, in that it is almost a year to the week since I tabled a notice of dissatisfaction against the Government's plans to sanction the erection of 30 wind turbines a short distance from the shoreline of Porthcawl. I do not wish to repeat that debate, but it is important to highlight the efforts made by the Labour Party machine to secure that decision, despite the independent inspector's recommendation against it. The Secretary of State for Wales, even, had a private reception with the managing director of the developers. That led Peter Hain to send a letter to the First Minister with the clear instruction that he would like the scheme to go ahead. These letters had to be prised from the Welsh Assembly Government under European legislation, despite the Welsh Assembly Government's claim to be the most open Government in western Europe.

The implication of this intervention at the highest levels of the Labour Party disproves the Minister for the Environment, Planning and Countryside's key argument, that TAN 8 is only guidance. That may well work in terms of deflecting pressure from his angry constituents, but he knows that the reality is that if a local authority rejects an application in one of the seven strategic search areas, the developers are likely to appeal to the Assembly, which would lead to the decision being overturned and costs awarded against the planning authority. This has the effect of curtailing local judgment and centralising power in the Minister's hands.

Furthermore, TAN 8, as it stands, removes

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn sicr na fydddech yn dweud mai parc cenedlaethol Eryri yw'r unig ran o Gymru sy'n ddeniadol, ac mae cynigion i osod tyrbinau gwynt mewn mannau eraill yng Nghymru, mewn nifer o ardaloedd deniadol sy'n dibynnu ar y diwydiant twristiaid. Mae'r adborth, a'r ymchwil wreiddiol gan y Bwrdd Croeso, yn dangos y bydd tyrbinau'n peri niwed i dwristiaeth. Oherwydd yr effaith ar yr economi yr argymhellodd y dylid peidio â chodi tyrbinau gwynt, a dyna pam y mae awdurdodau'r parciau cenedlaethol yn erbyn eu codi mewn parciau cenedlaethol.

Mae amseriad y ddadl hon yn hwylus, gan mai blwyddyn bron i'r wythnos hon y cyflwynais gynnig o anfonlonrwydd yn erbyn cynlluniau'r Llywodraeth i ganiatáu codi 30 o dyrbinau gwynt nid nepell o lan y môr ym Mhorthcawl. Nid wyf am ailadrodd y ddadl honno, ond mae'n bwysig tynnu sylw at ymdrechion peiriant y Blaid Lafur i sicrhau'r penderfyniad hwnnw, er gwaethaf argymhelliad yr arolygydd annibynnol yn ei erbyn. Cafodd Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, hyd yn oed, dderbyniad preifat gyda chyfarwyddwr rheoli'r datblygwyr. Yn sgîl hynny anfonodd Peter Hain lythyr at Brif Weinidog Cymru gyda chyfarwyddyd eglur yr hoffai i'r cynllun fynd rhagddo. Bu'n rhaid gwasgu'r llythyrau hyn o ddwylo Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru dan ddeddfwriaeth Ewropeaidd, er gwaethaf honiadau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru mai hi yw'r Llywodraeth fwyaf agored yng ngorllewin Ewrop.

Mae goblygiadau'r ymyriad hwn yn uchelfannau'r Blaid Lafur yn gwrthbrofi dadl allweddol y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad, mai arweiniad yn unig yw TAN 8. Efallai fod hynny'n gweithio o ran troi'r pwysau o du ei etholwyr dig i'r naill ochr, ond mae'n gwybod mai'r gwir yw petai awdurdod lleol yn gwrthod cais yn un o'r saith ardal chwilio strategol, y bydd y datblygwyr yn debygol o apelio i'r Cynulliad, ac y byddai hynny'n arwain at wrthdroi'r penderfyniad a dyfarnu costau yn erbyn yr awdurdod cynllunio. Mae hyn yn cyfyngu ar y farn leol gan ganoli grym yn nwylo'r Gweinidog.

Hefyd, mae TAN 8, fel y mae, yn dileu

cumulative impact as a valid reason for objection. Cumulative impact could offer a way out for many local authorities, which, knowing their areas better than anyone else, believe that the local tourism economy will be damaged. Although Wales is only 8.5 per cent of the UK's landmass, it already has 50 per cent of the UK's wind turbines. That number will increase dramatically under TAN 8. The Welsh Assembly Government's short-sighted approach means that other forms of renewable energy are being ignored. If Wales is seen as such a convenient dumping ground for the UK's wind turbines, why should any company invest in wave, tidal or solar energy, or biomass or other renewable energy resources?

Earlier this month the Public Accounts Committee stated that the cost of subsidising the current green energy programmes was in the region of £1 billion a year. Wind, at 5.5p per kWh, is well above the cost of other reliable renewable energy sources. Not only will TAN 8 and the Government's policy destroy the tourism economy in many rural parts, it centralises power. This, under a Government that claims to decentralise, demonstrates its inconsistency. One thing, however, remains consistent: like every other policy that the Government has developed, it will not support the economy. The Government looks forward to kicking in with its new document, 'WAVE'. If it only made more effort with wave power, we might support it.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I should give warning that, after the proposers of amendments have had their five minutes in which to speak, I will restrict other Members to three minutes. There should then be a good chance of including everybody.

Mick Bates: I propose amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Delete all after 'the National Assembly for Wales' and insert:

1. notes the Welsh Assembly Government's policy to alleviate climate change;

effaith gronol fel rheswm dilys dros wrthwynebu. Gallai effaith gronol gynnig achubiaeth i lawer o awdurdodau lleol sy'n credu, o adnabod eu hardaloedd yn well na neb arall, y caiff yr economi dwristaidd leol ei niweidio. Er nad oes gan Gymru ond 8.5 o dirfas y Deyrnas Unedig, mae ganddi eisoes 50 y cant o dyrbinau gwynt y Deyrnas Unedig. Bydd y niferoedd hynny'n cynyddu'n ddirfawr dan TAN 8. Mae agwedd gibddall Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n golygu bod ffurfiau eraill ar ynni adnewyddadwy'n cael eu hanwybyddu. Os gwelir Cymru fel lle cyfleus i roi tyrbinau gwynt y Deyrnas Unedig, pam y dylai unrhyw gwmni fuddsoddi yn ynni'r tonnau, ynni'r llanw neu ynni'r haul, neu fio-màs neu adnoddau eraill sy'n cynnig ynni adnewyddadwy?

Yn gynharach y mis hwn dywedodd y Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus fod cost sybsideiddio'r rhaglenni ynni gwyrdd cyfredol tua £1 biliwn y flwyddyn. Mae cost ynni'r gwynt, sy'n 5.5c am bob kWh, yn llawer uwch na chost ffynonellau ynni adnewyddadwy dibynadwy eraill. Bydd TAN 8 a pholisi'r Llywodraeth nid yn unig yn dinistrio'r economi dwristaidd mewn nifer o ardaloedd gwledig, mae hefyd yn canoli grym. Mae hyn, dan Lywodraeth sy'n honni ei bod yn datganoli, yn dangos ei hanghysiondeb. Fodd bynnag, erys un peth yn gyson: fel pob polisi arall y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi ei ddatblygu, ni fydd yn cynnal yr economi. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn edrych ymlaen at fwrw ymlaen â'i dogfen newydd, 'WAVE'. Pe na bai ond yn ymdrechu'n fwy dygn gydag ynni'r tonnau, efallai y byddem yn ei chefnogi.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Dylwn eich rhybuddio, ar ôl i gynigwyr y gwelliannau gael pum munud yr un i siarad, y byddaf yn cyfyngu'r Aelodau eraill i dri munud. O wneud hynny dylai pawb gael cyfle.

Mick Bates: Cynigaf welliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Dileu popeth ar ôl 'Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru' ac ychwanegu:

1. yn nodi polisi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i liniaru newid yn yr hinsawdd;

2. *instructs the Government to invest in all renewable energy technologies to help meet its 2010 targets;*

3. *calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to improve energy security by producing energy locally for the benefit of local communities and reduce energy poverty by a focused energy saving campaign in Wales.*

2. *yn cyfarwyddo'r Llywodraeth i fuddsoddi ym mhob technoleg ynni adnewyddadwy i helpu i fodloni ei thargedau yn 2010;*

3. *yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wella diogelwch ynni drwy gynhyrchu ynni yn lleol er budd cymunedau lleol a lleihau tlodi o ran ynni drwy ymgyrch arbed ynni yng Nghymru.*

I would like to preface my remarks about our amendment by saying that we are concerned that if this motion is carried today, it would simply be a delaying tactic. As we understand the situation, the current TAN 8 document would stand until such time as a redrafting or review of the current TAN 8 is implemented. We, as a party, consider that the aims of combating climate change, improving energy security, and reducing energy poverty are paramount. Despite misgivings over some of the details—which I will come to in a moment—just throwing it out of the window at present and reviewing it would be a mistake. We need to examine some things carefully.

4.10 p.m.

I will dispel some of the points that are often made to me about the development of renewable energy systems, and, in particular, windfarms. Alun's argument about tourism is a serious one. There was heated argument over this in Montgomeryshire, many years ago, when the first windfarms were built. There was also heated argument over the price of houses. Windfarms have not proved to decrease the price of houses or the number of tourists who come to mid Wales. Improvements can always be made with regard to the number of tourists, and, as mentioned earlier, affordable housing. However, the Welsh Consumer Council, for example, produced a report—which it launched here some three years ago, I believe—that contradicted some of the anecdotal evidence that Alun used in his speech. Therefore, the arguments need to be examined with harder evidence than you have put forward so far.

As in last week's debate on sustainable development, we also need to examine the

Hoffwn ddweud, cyn cyflwyno fy sylwadau ynghylch ein gwelliant, ein bod yn bryderus os caiff y cynnig hwn ei dderbyn heddiw, na fyddai ond yn ystryw i beri oedi. Yn ôl fel y deallwn y sefyllfa, byddai'r ddogfen TAN 8 gyfredol yn aros nes câi'r TAN 8 cyfredol ei ailddrafftio neu'i adolygu. Credwn, fel plaid, fod y nod o atal y newid yn yr hinsawdd, gwella diogelwch ynni, a lleihau tlodi o ran ynni'n hollbwysig. Er gwaethaf ein hamheuon ynglŷn â rhai o'r manylion—y deuaif atynt yn y man—byddai ei daflu heibio ar hyn o bryd a'i adolygu'n gamgymeriad. Mae angen inni archwilio rhai pethau'n fanwl.

Yr wyf am chwalu rhai o'r pwyntiau a fynegir wrthyf yn aml am ddatblygu systemau ynni adnewyddadwy, ac, yn arbennig felly, ffermydd gwynt. Mae dadl Alun ynghylch twristiaeth yn un ddirifol. Bu dadlau ffyrnig am hyn yn sir Drefaldwyn, flynyddoedd yn ôl, pan godwyd y ffermydd gwynt cyntaf. Bu dadlau ffyrnig hefyd ynghylch prisiau tai. Ni welwyd bod ffermydd gwynt yn gostwng prisiau tai na nifer y twristiaid sy'n dod i'r Canolbarth. Mae modd gwneud gwelliannau yn wastad o ran nifer y twristiaid, ac, fel y soniwyd yn gynharach, o ran tai fforddiadwy. Fodd bynnag, lluniodd Cyngor Defnyddwyr Cymru, er enghraifft, adroddiad—a lansiodd yma tua thair blynedd yn ôl, fe gredaf—a oedd yn gwrth-ddweud rhywfaint o'r dystiolaeth anecdotaidd a ddefnyddiodd Alun yn ei araith. Felly, mae angen archwilio'r dadleuon gyda thystiolaeth gadarnach na'r hyn yr ydych wedi ei gyflwyno hyd yma.

Fel yn y drafodaeth yr wythnos diwethaf ynghylch datblygu cynaliadwy, mae angen

crucial issue of the frustration felt by many of us about the pace at which we have been able to meet our international agreement to reduce carbon emissions. The most recent figures, which I have here, show clearly that carbon emissions in Wales have increased. The Government is failing in its duty, embodied in the Government of Wales Act 1998, clause 121, to reduce carbon emissions. I regret the delay in producing this planning guidance, and I would like to see us move forward.

How do we move forward? I believe that there is general agreement that everyone would like to see more investment in the renewable energy sources portfolio. With regard to the necessary research and development in higher education establishments or in industry, most of us would like to see the Minister say, 'Here is the money'. However, some of the actions do not back this up. During questions to the First Minister today, I mentioned energy crops, looking to the future. We do not have a scheme at present, Minister, to invest in energy crops, which are a great way of reducing carbon emissions.

As you know, 60 per cent of carbon emissions come from households and transport. On households, at present, we do not have the investment that the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs announced in order to undertake large energy-saving programmes. That is why point 2 of our amendment refers to energy saving. In order to gain public confidence in renewable energy policies, they must be coupled with a tremendous awareness-raising campaign about energy saving. We can make an impact on energy poverty here. When people see a reduction in their bills through increased insulation in their home, and being aware about switching off lights, computers and so on, it engages with the whole population, and we need to see extra investment in that process, Minister.

The same is true of building regulations. I recently visited the Nuair company in Caerphilly, which has a positive ventilation system. That tremendous system would help

inni archwilio mater allweddol y rhwystredigaeth y mae llawer ohonom yn ei theimlo o ran ein harafwch i gyflawni ein cytundeb rhyngwladol i leihau gollyngiadau carbon. Dengys y ffigurau diweddaraf yn glir, ac maent gennyf yma, fod gollyngiadau carbon wedi cynyddu yng Nghymru. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn methu o ran ei dyletswydd, sydd wedi ei chynnwys yn Neddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, cymal 121, i leihau gollyngiadau carbon. Mae'n flin gennyf fod oedi o ran llunio'r cyfarwyddyd cynllunio hwn, a hoffwn ein gweld yn symud ymlaen.

Sut y mae symud ymlaen? Credaf fod cytundeb cyffredinol yr hoffai pawb weld rhagor o fuddsoddi yn y portffolio ffynonellau ynni adnewyddadwy. O ran yr ymchwil a'r datblygu angenrheidiol mewn sefydliadau addysg uwch neu mewn diwydiant, hoffai'r rhan fwyaf ohonom glywed y Gweinidog yn dweud, 'Dyma'r arian'. Fodd bynnag, nid yw rhai o'r gweithredoedd yn ategu hyn. Yn ystod y cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog heddiw, soniais am gnydau ynni, gan edrych i'r dyfodol. Nid oes gennym gynllun ar hyn o bryd, Weinidog, i fuddsoddi mewn cnydau ynni, sy'n ffordd wych o leihau gollyngiadau carbon.

Fel y gwyddoch, daw 60 y cant o ollyngiadau carbon o aelwydydd a thrafnidiaeth. O ran aelwydydd, ar hyn o bryd, nid oes gennym y buddsoddiad a gyhoeddodd Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig er mwyn ymgymryd â rhaglenni mawr i arbed ynni. Dyna pam y mae pwynt 2 ein gwelliant yn cyfeirio at arbed ynni. Er mwyn ennyn hyder y cyhoedd mewn polisiau ynni adnewyddadwy, rhaid eu cyplysu gydag ymgyrch fawr i godi ymwybyddiaeth am arbed ynni. Gallwn wneud argraff ar dlodi o ran ynni yn hyn o beth. Pan wêl pobl ostyngiad yn eu biliau yn sgîl rhagor o insiwleiddio yn eu cartrefi, a thrwy fod yn ymwybodol ynglŷn â diffodd goleuadau, cyfrifiaduron ac yn y blaen, mae'n ennyn diddordeb yn y boblogaeth gyfan, ac mae angen buddsoddi rhagor yn y broses honno, Weinidog.

Mae'r un peth yn wir am reoliadau adeiladu. Yn ddiweddar ymwelais â chwmni Nuair yng Nghaerffili, sydd â system awyru bositif. Byddai'r system hynod honno'n helpu i

reduce energy use, which is not catered for in building regulations. We need to hear what you are doing, Minister, in terms of using building regulations to ensure that our homes are greener and cheaper to run.

Finally, on community energy trusts, in the TAN 8 document the example of Carno is used, where npower has a trust to put money into the community. Again, we must emphasise the need to recycle profits from all types of developments into energy saving, so that we can use public buildings, in the first place, as exemplars of where we want to be. The Welsh Liberal Democrats will support the other amendments.

Helen Mary Jones: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 2: delete all after 'policy' and replace with:

and calls on the Government to reverse the trend of underinvestment in diverse renewable energy technologies by both current and previous UK Governments and the current National Assembly Government.

I propose amendment 3. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

expresses concern at the failure of the Welsh Assembly Government to successfully negotiate with their UK colleagues the devolution of planning decisions of energy projects over 50 megawatts.

I propose amendment 4. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

notes with concern the limitations that the condition of the national grid places on the location of any developments in renewable technologies.

I am grateful to the Assembly's Conservative group for putting this important matter on the whole Assembly's agenda. While we are all aware that the Minister was not obliged to hold a debate on TAN 8, we feel that he should have done, given both the importance

leihau'r defnydd a wneir ar ynni, nad oes darpariaeth ar ei gyfer yn y rheoliadau adeiladu. Mae angen inni glywed beth yr ydych chi'n ei wneud, Weinidog, o ran defnyddio rheoliadau adeiladu i sicrhau bod ein cartrefi'n wyrddach ac yn rhatach i'w rhedeg.

Yn olaf, o ran ymddiriedolaethau ynni cymunedol, yn y ddogfen TAN 8 cynigir Carno fel enghraifft, lle y mae gan npower ymddiriedolaeth i roddi arian i'r gymuned. Eto i gyd, rhaid pwysleisio'r angen i ailgylchu'r elw a geir o bob math o ddatblygiad i arbed ynni, fel y gallwn ddefnyddio adeiladau cyhoeddus, yn y lle cyntaf, fel enghreifftiau o ble yr hoffem fod. Bydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n cefnogi'r gwelliannau eraill.

Helen Mary Jones: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 2: dileu popeth ar ôl 'adnewyddadwy' ac yn ei le rhoi:

ac yn galw ar y Llywodraeth i wyrdroi tuedd Llywodraethau blaenorol y DU a Llywodraeth bresennol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i danfuddsoddi mewn technolegau ynni adnewyddadwy amrywiol.

Cynigiau welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn mynegi pryder ynghylch methiant Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gyd-drafod datganoli penderfyniadau cynllunio ar brosiectau ynni dros 50 megawatt yn llwyddiannus gyda'u cyd-aelodau yn y DU.

Cynigiau welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn nodi gyda phryder y cyfyngiadau o ran lleoli unrhyw ddatblygiadau mewn technolegau adnewyddadwy yn sgil cyflwr y grid cenedlaethol.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i grŵp Ceidwadwyr y Cynulliad am roi'r mater pwysig hwn ar agenda'r Cynulliad cyfan. Er bod pawb yn ymwybodol nad oedd rheidrwydd ar y Gweinidog gynnal dadl ynghylch TAN 8, teimlwn y dylasai wneud hynny, o gofio

of the issues of addressing climate change and the very serious controversy.

I stress the importance that Plaid Cymru—the Party of Wales places on developing renewables, and, as a nation, we must play our part in addressing climate change. If we fail to do that, the results will be catastrophic for us, and possibly worse for people in developing countries, who are less well able to defend themselves from the effects of climate change. Plaid Cymru’s concerns about TAN 8, as it stands, are already on the record. We are concerned that the mapping approach is, or could be, inflexible, and we believe that a criteria-based approach would have made much more sense. We agree with some comments with regard to the overemphasis on land-based wind to the exclusion of all other methods.

The approach in TAN 8 illustrates this Government’s lack of vision, imagination and real commitment to addressing climate change. In that context, I understand the intention of the original motion and I have some sympathy for it, but we are unable to support it as it stands. However, I support some of what Mick Bates said about the risk of chaos if we opt for a redraft at this stage. We all know that there are many other very important technical advice notes that we have been waiting years to see, and I do not think that the capacity for a full review exists within the system.

Our amendments seek to address both the ongoing underinvestment in renewables and two of the practical problems that the Assembly Government, and Wales as a nation, faces in effectively promoting renewable energy. We will abstain on the motion as it stands if our amendments are not carried—we must develop renewables now. The tone of nimbyism in some of the Conservative contribution so far is as disappointing as it is unsurprising.

Glyn Davies: That is outrageous.

pwysigrwydd cwestiynau’n ymwneud â mynd i’r afael â’r newid yn yr hinsawdd ac o gofio hefyd ei fod yn bwnc llosg difrifol iawn.

Pwysleisiaf y pwysigrwydd y mae Plaid Cymru—the Party of Wales yn ei roi i ddatblygu ynni adnewyddadwy, ac, fel cenedl, rhaid inni chwarae ein rhan i fynd i’r afael â’r newid yn yr hinsawdd. Os na wnawn hynny, bydd y canlyniadau’n drychinebus i ni, ac efallai’n waeth i bobl mewn gwledydd sy’n datblygu, sydd yn llai abl i amddiffyn eu hunain rhag effeithiau’r newid yn yr hinsawdd. Mae pryderon Plaid Cymru ynghylch TAN 8, fel y mae ar hyn o bryd, eisoes wedi’u cofnodi. Yr ydym yn poeni bod mapio yn ddull anhyblyg, neu y gallai fod, a chredwn y byddai dull yn seiliedig ar feini prawf wedi gwneud llawer mwy o synnwyr. Cytunwn â rhai sylwadau ynglŷn â’r gorbwyslais ar felinau gwynt ar y tir nes anwybyddu pob technoleg arall.

Mae’r dull o weithredu sydd yn TAN 8 yn dangos diffyg gwelediad, dychymyg a gwir ymroddiad y Llywodraeth hon i fynd i’r afael â’r newid yn yr hinsawdd. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, deallaf fwriad y cynnig gwreiddiol ac mae gennyf beth cydymdeimlad ag ef, ond ni allwn ei gefnogi fel y mae. Fodd bynnag, cefnogaf rywfaint o’r hyn a ddywedodd Mick Bates am y perygl o anhrefn os dewiswn aiddrafftio ar hyn o bryd. Gŵyr pawb ohonom fod llawer o nodiadau cyngor technegol eraill pwysig iawn yr ydym wedi bod yn aros blynyddoedd i’w gweld, ac ni chredaf fod y gallu i gynnal adolygiad llawn yn bodoli o fewn y system.

Mae ein gwelliannau’n ceisio rhoi sylw i’r tanfuddsoddi parhaus mewn ynni adnewyddadwy yn ogystal â dwy o’r problemau ymarferol y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, a Chymru fel cenedl, yn eu hwynebu wrth geisio hyrwyddo ynni adnewyddadwy yn effeithiol. Byddwn yn ymatal ar y cynnig fel y mae ar hyn o bryd os na dderbynnir ein gwelliannau—rhaid inni ddatblygu ynni adnewyddadwy yn awr. Mae’r tinc o ‘nid yn fy iard gefn i’ a glywyd yn britho cyfraniad y Ceidwadwyr hyd yma yn peri siom ond nid syndod.

Glyn Davies: Mae hynny’n warthus.

Helen Mary Jones: If either Glyn Davies or Alun Cairns would like to make an intervention, I would be happy to take it.

Alun Cairns: I would like you to specify where I talked about a NIMBY policy.

Helen Mary Jones: Your references to Porthcawl could be read in that way, but that is a matter for you and others to judge.

Alun Cairns: I object to that statement, Dirprwy Lywydd, because my statements in relation to Porthcawl were consistent with that of the independent planning inspector. That is certainly not nimbyism, as it was on the criteria laid down by the Welsh Assembly Government.

Helen Mary Jones: I have no intention of withdrawing the allegation, Deputy Presiding Officer, and you, of course, will rule as to whether I need to do so.

In abstaining on the motion, we do so in the context of urging the Government to be as flexible as possible in the interpretation of the TAN as it stands. We must retain local decision making, and, in that context, I ask the Minister specifically how he would advise a local authority that is now assessing a sizeable—

Denise Idris Jones: While supporting the Government's plans for power from sustainable sources, I am aware of how the people of Llandudno are living in absolute fear of the Gwynt y Môr scheme of 200 offshore wind turbines. I know that this is not part of TAN 8, but they are living in fear of that. We must bear that in mind, and we must look at schemes that do not impinge so drastically upon the natural environment.

Helen Mary Jones: That shows that nimbyism is alive and well and not only living in the Conservative Party, but the Minister will no doubt respond to Denise Idris Jones; it is for him to do that, not for me.

Helen Mary Jones: Os hoffai naill ai Glyn Davies neu Alun Cairns wneud ymyriad, byddwn yn fodlon ei dderbyn.

Alun Cairns: Hoffwn ichi ddweud ym mhle yn benodol y soniais am bolisi 'nid yn fy iard gefn i'.

Helen Mary Jones: Gellid dehongli eich cyfeiriadau at Borthcawl yn y modd hwnnw, ond mater i chi ac eraill ei farnu yw hynny.

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn gwrthwynebu'r gosodiad hwnnw, Ddirprwy Lywydd, oherwydd yr oedd fy natganiadau ynglŷn â Phorthcawl yn gyson â datganiad yr arolygydd cynllunio annibynnol. Nid agwedd 'nid yn fy iard gefn i' yw hynny, gan ei fod yn unol â'r meini prawf a bennwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Helen Mary Jones: Nid yw'n fwriad gennyf dynnu'r cyhuddiad yn ôl, Ddirprwy Lywydd, ac fe ddyfarnwch chi, wrth gwrs, a oes angen imi wneud hynny.

Wrth ymatal ar y cynnig, gwnawn hynny yng nghyd-destun annog y Llywodraeth i fod mor hyblyg ag y bo modd yn eu dehongliad o'r nodyn cyngor technegol fel y mae. Rhaid inni gadw'r gallu i wneud penderfyniadau'n lleol, ac, yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog yn benodol sut y byddai'n cynghori awdurdod lleol sydd ar hyn o bryd yn asesu—

Denise Idris Jones: Tra'n cefnogi cynlluniau'r Llywodraeth ar gyfer pŵer o ffynonellau adnewyddadwy, yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r modd y mae pobl Llandudno'n ofnus hollol o ran cynllun Gwynt y Môr ar gyfer 200 tyrbîn gwynt yn y môr. Gwn nad yw hyn yn rhan o TAN 8, ond maent yn byw mewn ofn yn sgîl hynny. Rhaid inni gofio hynny, a rhaid inni edrych ar gynlluniau nad ydynt yn amharu mor ddifrifol ar yr amgylchedd naturiol.

Helen Mary Jones: Mae hynny'n dangos bod yr agwedd 'nid yn fy iard gefn i' yn fyw ac iach, a hynny nid yn unig yn y Blaid Geidwadol, ond diau y gwnaiff y Gweinidog ymateb i Denise Idris Jones; mater iddo ef yw gwneud hynny, nid i mi.

To refer to the point as to how the Minister would advise a local authority that is currently assessing a sizeable application for a windfarm development of, let us say, 25 MW, which is outside a strategic search area—

Nick Bourne *rose*—

Helen Mary Jones: I will take your intervention in a minute, but I need to finish this question to Carwyn Jones, or he will have yet another excuse not to answer it. How would the Minister advise a local authority, if it felt that such an application was still appropriate to local circumstance, on whether it has the flexibility to support such an application?

Carwyn Jones *rose*—

Helen Mary Jones: Perhaps, Minister you could respond in your summing up time because I have used a lot of time—

Carwyn Jones: I am not responding.

Helen Mary Jones: In that case, I will happily take an intervention.

Carwyn Jones: As the majority of the debate is about energy policy, my colleague Andrew Davies will respond, but, in response to your particular point, the TAN is flexible enough, and it makes the case that the 5 MW would be acceptable outside the SSA. However, that is not an absolute rule, and it is for local authorities to decide what is appropriate. As with any planning guidance, nothing is absolute, but the guidance clearly has weight.

Helen Mary Jones: I am grateful for that, and there will be local authorities that will find it easier. I was not aware that you were not responding to the debate, as I would otherwise have given way immediately.

Nick Bourne: I am very grateful to Helen Mary Jones for giving way; how we missed her when she was in Aviemore last week. On

A chyfeirio at y pwynt ynglŷn â sut y byddai'r Gweinidog yn cynghori awdurdod lleol sydd ar hyn o bryd yn asesu cais o gryn faintioli am ddatblygu fferm wynt o 25 MW, dyweder, sydd y tu allan i ardal chwilio strategol—

Nick Bourne *a gododd*—

Helen Mary Jones: Derbynïaf eich ymyriad mewn munud, ond mae arnaf eisiau gorffen y cwestiwn hwn i Carwyn Jones, neu bydd ganddo esgus arall eto fyth i beidio â'i ateb. Sut y byddai'r Gweinidog yn cynghori awdurdod lleol, pe teimlai'r awdurdod fod cais o'r fath yn dal i fod yn briodol i'r amgylchiadau yn lleol, ynghylch a oes ganddo'r hyblygrwydd i gefnogi cais o'r fath?

Carwyn Jones *a gododd*—

Helen Mary Jones: Efallai, Weinidog, y gallech ymateb yn eich amser crynhoi, oherwydd yr wyf wedi defnyddio llawer o amser—

Carwyn Jones: Nid ymateb yr wyf.

Helen Mary Jones: Os felly, derbynïaf ymyriad yn llawen.

Carwyn Jones: Gan fod a wnelo'r rhan fwyaf o'r ddadl â pholisi ynni, bydd fy nghyd-Aelod Andrew Davies yn ymateb, ond, i ateb eich pwynt penodol, mae'r nodyn cyngor technegol yn ddigon hyblyg, ac mae'n dal y byddai'r 5 MW yn dderbyniol y tu allan i'r ardal chwilio strategol. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n rheol absoliwt, a mater i awdurdodau lleol yw penderfynu beth sydd yn briodol. Fel gydag unrhyw ganllawiau cynllunio, nid oes dim yn absoliwt, ond yn amlwg mae gan y canllawiau bwysau.

Helen Mary Jones: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am hynny, a bydd rhai awdurdodau lleol a fydd yn ei chael yn haws. Nid oeddwn yn ymwybodol nad oeddech yn ymateb i'r ddadl, neu byddwn wedi ildio'n syth.

Nick Bourne: Yr wyf yn dra diolchgar i Helen Mary Jones am ildio; yr oedd yn chwith ar ei hôl pan oedd yn Aviemore yr

a point of interest for all of us, we have seen your policy document that suggests that perhaps you have been a little too pro on windfarm policy and that you should now be a little less pro. Does this represent a soft-shoe shuffle, or is your policy just as it always was?

4.20 p.m.

Helen Mary Jones: The policy is just as it always was, which is that we need to actively promote renewable energy developments of considerable size, but that that has to be done with regard to what is in the best interest of the local community. For example, we believe that it is ludicrous that the Government has opted all the Ministry of Defence's flying areas out of its strategic search areas. I can think of a lot of people in our shared constituency of Mid and West Wales who would be glad to have a few wind turbines to replace the low flying that makes their life a misery.

Gwenda Thomas *rose—*

Helen Mary Jones: I cannot take an intervention, Gwenda, as I am running short of time.

There are many areas in which we do not support the Government, but we feel that, at this stage, it may be too late to go back.

I will refer briefly to the amendments. We believe that we need a much greater level of investment and research and development in renewables. Some of the possibilities were mentioned by Alun Cairns, and these included tidal lagoons, biomass and small-scale hydro. The Government's investment record so far is a disgrace and needs to be addressed. The lack in amendment 3—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You must be brief, as you have 10 seconds.

Helen Mary Jones: I will be brief. Regarding amendment 3, we need those powers. I have urged the Minister to get on with trying to get them, as we have been

wythnos diwethaf. O ran pwynt o ddiddordeb inni i gyd, yr ydym wedi gweld eich dogfen bolisi sydd yn awgrymu efallai eich bod wedi bod ychydig yn rhy bleidiol i bolisi ffermydd gwynt ac y dylech yn awr fod ychydig yn llai cefnogol. Ai dawnsio o gwmpas y polisi yr ydych, ynteu a ydyw eich polisi yn union fel yr oedd drwy'r amser?

Helen Mary Jones: Mae'r polisi'n union fel yr oedd drwy'r amser, sef bod angen inni fwrw ati i hyrwyddo datblygiadau ynni adnewyddadwy o faint sylweddol, ond bod yn rhaid gwneud hynny gan ystyried beth sydd er budd y gymuned leol. Er enghraifft, credwn ei bod yn chwerthinllyd bod y Llywodraeth wedi eithrio holl ardaloedd hedfan y Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn o'i hardaloedd chwilio strategol. Gallaf feddwl am lawer o bobl yn yr etholaeth a rannwn ni, sef Canolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru, a fyddai'n falch o gael ychydig o felinau gwynt yn lle'r hedfan isel sy'n gwneud eu bywyd yn boen.

Gwenda Thomas *a gododd—*

Helen Mary Jones: Ni allaf dderbyn ymyriad, Gwenda, gan fy mod yn mynd yn brin o amser.

Mae llawer maes lle nad ydym yn cefnogi'r Llywodraeth, ond teimlwn efallai ei bod, erbyn hyn, yn rhy hwyr i droi'n ôl.

Cyfeiriaf yn fyr at y gwelliannau. Credwn fod arnom angen lefel lawer uwch o fuddsoddi ac ymchwil a datblygu ym maes ynni adnewyddadwy. Crybwyllwyd rhai o'r posibilïadau gan Alun Cairns, gan gynnwys lagwnau'r llanw, bio-màs a thrydan dŵr ar raddfa fach. Mae record buddsoddi'r Llywodraeth hyd yn hyn yn gywilyddus ac mae angen edrych arni. Mae'r diffyg yng ngwelliant 3—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Rhaid ichi fod yn fyr, gan mai 10 eiliad sydd gennych.

Helen Mary Jones: Byddaf yn fyr. Ynglŷn â gwelliant 3, mae angen y pwerau hynny arnom. Yr wyf wedi annog y Gweinidog i fwrw ymlaen â cheisio eu cael, gan ein bod

waiting for them for six years. We must address the capacity of the national grid, and I hope that Andrew Davies will have something to say about that. The Government's response so far on tackling climate change has been seriously flawed. It is lacklustre and piecemeal, it probably will not deliver and it arguably breaches our duty to promote sustainable development. Future generations will not forgive us if we do not get this right.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. That was a good 10 seconds.

Lisa Francis: The fact that the siting of large-scale windfarms in national parks and areas of natural beauty has been deemed inappropriate clearly demonstrates the problems of large-scale windfarms. TAN 8 does not appear to recognise the importance of tourism to the Welsh economy, and that is a tragedy. I find that astonishing, given that tourism is worth £2.5 billion per annum to this country, and is a sector of the economy that is expanding faster than its equivalents in Scotland and England.

Alun Ffred Jones: What proof do you have that windfarms damage the tourism economy? Are there any figures on that? After all, there have been windfarms for a considerable period in mid Wales. Do you have any facts?

Lisa Francis: You may be aware of a survey conducted in 2003 by the Wales Tourist Board, and more than half the people surveyed at that time thought that windfarms would spoil the landscape. None of these people had clapped eyes on Cefn Croes, Alun Ffred. I do not know if you have been there to see the new generation of huge turbines erected there, but it is the equivalent of Teletubbyland coming to Ceredigion. It is hardly a beacon that would draw tourists to the area; it is a policy that is completely Laa-Laa.

Does the Minister responsible for tourism really think—

Elin Jones *rose*—

yn aros amdanynt ers chwe mlynedd. Rhaid inni roi sylw i gapasiti'r grid cenedlaethol, a gobeithiaf y bydd gan Andrew Davies rywbeth i'w ddweud am hynny. Mae diffygion difrifol yn ymateb y Llywodraeth hyd yn hyn o ran delio â'r newid yn yr hinsawdd. Mae'n ddi-fflach ac yn dameidiog, mae'n debyg na wnaiff gyflawni ei amcanion a gellir dadlau ei fod yn esgeuluso ein dyletswydd i hyrwyddo datblygu cynaliadwy. Ni fydd cenedlaethau'r dyfodol yn maddau inni os na wnawn hyn yn iawn.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Yr oedd hynny'n 10 eiliad a mwy.

Lisa Francis: Mae'r ffaith bod lleoli ffermydd gwynt mawr mewn parciau cenedlaethol ac ardaloedd o harddwch naturiol yn cael ei ystyried yn amhriodol yn dangos yn glir y problemau sy'n gysylltiedig â ffermydd gwynt mawr. Nid yw TAN 8 fel petai'n sylweddoli pwysigrwydd twristiaeth i economi Cymru, ac mae hynny'n drasiedi. Mae hynny'n rhyfeddol i mi, o gofio bod twristiaeth yn werth £2.5 biliwn y flwyddyn i'r wlad hon, a'i fod yn sector o'r economi sydd yn ehangu'n gyflymach na'r sectorau sy'n gyfatebol iddo yn yr Alban a Lloegr.

Alun Ffred Jones: Pa brawf sydd gennych fod ffermydd gwynt yn niweidio'r economi dwristiaeth? A oes unrhyw ffigurau ar hynny? Wedi'r cwbl, mae ffermydd gwynt yn bodoli ers cryn amser yn y Canolbarth. A oes gennych unrhyw ffeithiau?

Lisa Francis: Efallai eich bod yn ymwybodol o arolwg a wnaethpwyd yn 2003 gan Fwrdd Croeso Cymru, ac yr oedd dros hanner y bobl a holwyd ar y pryd o'r farn y byddai ffermydd gwynt yn difetha'r tirwedd. Nid oedd neb o'r bobl hyn wedi gweld Cefn Croes, Alun Ffred. Ni wn a ydych wedi bod yno i weld y to newydd o dyrbinau anferth sydd wedi'u codi yno, ond mae'n gyfystyr â dod â Teletubbyland i Geredigion. Go brin ei fod yn atyniad a fyddai'n denu ymwelwyr i'r ardal; mae'n bolisi sydd yn gwbl Laa-Laa.

A ydyw'r Gweinidog sydd yn gyfrifol am dwristiaeth yn credu o ddifrif—

Elin Jones *a gododd*—

Lisa Francis: Do you want to make an intervention on this, Elin? You can see the turbines from 20 miles away, as they are nearly 350 ft high.

Does the Minister responsible for tourism really think that visitors and hill walkers in mid Wales will be impressed by the sight of more than 100 of Europe's tallest generators, some at a height of 320 ft, as well as a conglomeration of substations, overhead power lines and new roads blasted through an unspoiled and hitherto beautiful landscape, which has lain undisturbed for centuries? Where is the sense in that? Tell me where the sense is.

Elin Jones: This landscape that you call undisturbed for centuries was planted with spruce forestation 50 years ago. It is hardly undisturbed landscape.

Lisa Francis: What about the trees that will be felled in the seven other areas to make way for more wind turbines?

We know from the weather events of the last month that climate change is one of the biggest issues facing not just Wales but, obviously, the planet. Is it not shameful that this Government did not consider it important enough to hold a full Plenary debate on its proposals for TAN 8? Why does TAN 8 not deal with energy losses and energy efficiency? Let us see a full and in-depth assessment of the alternatives to wind power. TAN 8, as it stands, is merely a quick fix to reach Government targets.

Only last week, we heard Tony Blair say that he believes that disagreements over the Kyoto treaty can never be resolved when not all countries sign up to it. By making that statement, is he now signing up to the agenda of George W. Bush? The United States of America has consistently refused to sign the Kyoto treaty. There needs to be further exploration of and investment in biomass, tidal, solar and wave power. We must adopt environmental policies that are right for our

Lisa Francis: A oes arnoch eisiau gwneud ymyriad ar hyn, Elin? Gallwch weld y melinau 20 milltir i ffwrdd, gan eu bod bron yn 350 troedfedd o uchder.

A ydyw'r Gweinidog sydd yn gyfrifol am dwristiaeth yn credu o ddifrif y caiff ymwelwyr a cherddwyr mynyddoedd yn y Canolbarth argraff ffafriol o weld dros 100 o felinau gwynt talaf Ewrop, rhai cyn uched â 320 troedfedd, yn ogystal â pheth wmbredd o isorsafoedd, gwifrau trydan uwchben a ffyrdd newydd wedi'u creu drwy ganol tirwedd dilychwin a oedd gynt yn brydferth, ac a fu heb ymyrraeth ers canrifoedd? Ble y mae'r synnwyr yn hynny? Dywedwch wrthyf ble y mae'r synnwyr.

Elin Jones: Plannwyd coedwigoedd sbrïws 50 mlynedd yn ôl yn y tirwedd hwn a oedd, meddwch chi, heb ymyrraeth ers canrifoedd. Go brin ei fod yn dirwedd a oedd heb ymyrraeth.

Lisa Francis: Beth am y coed a gaiff eu cwmpo yn y saith ardal arall i wneud lle i ragor o dyrbinau gwynt?

Gwyddom oddi wrth yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd o ran y tywydd yn y mis diwethaf fod y newid yn yr hinsawdd yn un o'r problemau mwyaf sydd yn wynebu nid Cymru'n unig, ond, mae'n amlwg, y blaned. Onid yw'n gywilyddus nad oedd y Llywodraeth yn barnu bod hyn yn ddigon pwysig i gynnal dadl lawn yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar ei chynigion ar gyfer TAN 8? Pam nad yw TAN 8 yn delio â cholledion ynni ac effeithlonrwydd ynni? Gadewch inni weld asesiad llawn a thrylwyr o'r dewisiadau eraill heblaw pŵer gwynt. Nid yw TAN 8, fel y mae ar hyn o bryd, yn ddim byd ond ateb sydyn i gyrraedd targedau'r Llywodraeth.

Yr wythnos diwethaf, clywsom Tony Blair yn dweud ei fod yn credu na ellir fyth ddatrys yr anghytundebau ynghylch cytuniad Kyoto pan nad yw pob gwlad yn ymuno ag ef. Wrth wneud y datganiad hwnnw, a ydyw yntau bellach yn derbyn agenda George W. Bush? Mae Unol Daleithiau America yn gyson wedi gwrthod llofnodi cytuniad Kyoto. Mae angen ymchwilio ymhellach i fio-màs, ynni'r llanw, ynni'r haul ac ynni'r tonnau, a buddsoddi ynddynt. Rhaid inni fabwysiadu polisiau

country. Disappointingly, European funding for tidal technology at Ramsey Sound in Pembrokeshire was turned down last year. Why is the Welsh Assembly Government obsessed with wind? Is it because it is variable, unreliable and unpredictable? I rest my case.

Carl Sargeant: It is no surprise that it is the not-in-my-backyard Tories and the not-if-it-is-in-my-leaked-memo nationalists who are objecting to these—

Alun Cairns: I would be grateful if Carl Sargeant would share with us where, specifically, we have spoken about a not-in-my-backyard attitude.

Carl Sargeant: Alun, you will be aware of all the interventions that you have made in the Chamber about not-in-my-backyard scenarios. This is about an evidence base, not lobbyists coming to see Alun Cairns.

The Labour Welsh Assembly Government's renewable energy policy and TAN 8 guidance have been developed over time, with extensive research, consultation and engagement with stakeholders, in the context of the UK's energy policy. The policy illustrates a commitment to promote a broad range of renewable technologies in Wales, including solar, biomass, wave and tidal power, as well as wind power. However, apart from wind power, which is a proven and mature technology, most of the others are not yet commercially viable projects. This means that, for the present, we need to rely on wind turbines to provide the majority of renewable power. As other technologies mature, they will be able to play an increasing role.

Helen Mary Jones: I absolutely agree with what you said about wind technology. How do you respond to the comments made by your colleague, Denise Idris Jones, a few moments ago? Was that nimbyism or not?

Carl Sargeant: I am responding to your intervention, Helen Mary. What is more

amgylcheddol sydd yn iawn i'n gwlad ni. Er mawr siom, gwrthodwyd cyllid Ewropeaidd ar gyfer technoleg y llanw yn Swnt Dewi yn sir Benfro y llynedd. Pam mae gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru obsesiwn â gwynt? Ai am ei fod yn gyfnewidiol, yn annibynadwy ac yn anrhagweladwy? Dyna gloi fy nadl.

Carl Sargeant: Nid yw'n syndod mai'r Torïaid nid-yn-fy-iard-gefn-i a'r cenedlaetholwyr nid-os-yw-yn-fy-memo-a-ddatgelwyd sydd yn gwrthwynebu'r—

Alun Cairns: Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe bai Carl Sargeant yn rhoi gwybod inni ym mhle, yn benodol, yr ydym wedi sôn am agwedd 'nid yn fy iard gefn i'.

Carl Sargeant: Alun, mae'n siŵr eich bod chi'n ymwybodol o'r holl ymyriadau yr ydych wedi'u gwneud yn y Siambr am sefyllfaoedd 'nid yn fy iard gefn i'. Cwestiwn o sylfaen o dystiolaeth yw hyn, nid lobiwyr yn dod i weld Alun Cairns.

Mae polisi ynni adnewyddadwy Llywodraeth Lafur Cynulliad Cymru a'i chanllawiau TAN 8 wedi'u datblygu dros gyfnod, gan ymchwilio, ymgynghori ac ymwneud yn helaeth â rhanddeiliaid, yng nghyd-destun polisi ynni'r DU. Mae'r polisi'n dangos ymrwymiad i hyrwyddo amrediad eang o dechnolegau adnewyddadwy yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys ynni'r haul, bio-màs, ynni'r tonnau ac ynni'r llanw, yn ogystal ag ynni'r gwynt. Fodd bynnag, ar wahân i ynni'r gwynt, sydd yn dechnoleg aeddfed sydd wedi'i phrofi, nid yw'r rhan fwyaf o'r lleill yn brosiectau hyfyw yn fasnachol eto. Mae hyn yn golygu, ar hyn o bryd, fod angen inni ddibynnu ar dyrbinau gwynt i ddarparu'r rhan fwyaf o bŵer adnewyddadwy. Wrth i dechnolegau eraill aeddfedu, gallant hwythau chwarae rhan gynyddol.

Helen Mary Jones: Cytunaf yn llwyr â'r hyn a ddywedasoch am dechnoleg gwynt. Sut yr ydych yn ymateb i'r sylwadau a wnaethpwyd gan eich cyd-Aelod, Denise Idris Jones, ychydig funudau'n ôl? Ai mater o 'nid yn fy iard gefn i' oedd hynny ai peidio?

Carl Sargeant: Yr wyf yn ymateb i'ch ymyriad, Helen Mary. Beth sydd yn fwy

interesting is that according to the leaked memo that we all received, you decided to change your policy following the theory that 'if it loses votes, we will not support it'. Nevertheless, Labour is committed to addressing—

Janet Ryder: Will you take an intervention?

Carl Sargeant: Not yet. I will do so if I have time. Labour is committed to addressing the issue of climate change. *[Interruption.]* Deputy Presiding Officer, am I to be allowed to carry on?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Yes, you are; you have the floor.

Carl Sargeant: Thank you very much. Labour is committed to addressing the issue of climate change and meeting our international obligations in relation to energy production and greenhouse gas emissions. It is the vision of the Labour Welsh Assembly Government to make Wales a showcase for clean energy, while maintaining international competitiveness.

We all have a part to play in this and, as Mick Bates said, climate change poses a huge threat to the environment and our social and economic infrastructure. The Kyoto protocol is a legally binding international agreement to curb carbon dioxide emissions by 5 per cent, to pre-1990 levels, by 2012. It came into force on 16 February. On average, a UK property could save £200 a year on fuel bills and be more comfortable by being more energy aware and installing energy efficiency measures such as loft and cavity-wall insulation. Projects such as the Three Villages project aim to promote and encourage such things and raise awareness of the thousands of pounds available in my constituency in Flintshire. Energy conservation and efficiency are difficult to promote and implement, given the prevailing consumerist culture, but they represent the only sustainable route forward, and emphasis needs to be placed on raising public awareness and changing behaviours.

diddorol, yn ôl y memo a ryddhawyd ac a dderbyniasom i gyd, yw eich bod wedi newid eich polisi gan ddilyn yr egwyddor 'os yw'n colli pleidleisiau, ni wnawn ei gefnogi'. Serch hynny, mae Llafur yn ymroddedig i fynd i'r afael â—

Janet Ryder: A wnewch dderbyn ymyriad?

Carl Sargeant: Na wnaaf ar hyn o bryd. Gwnaf hynny os bydd gennyf amser. Mae Llafur yn ymroddedig i fynd i'r afael â phroblem y newid yn yr hinsawdd. *[Torri ar draws.]* Ddirprwy Lywydd, a ydwyf am gael mynd ymlaen?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Ydych; chi biau'r llawr.

Carl Sargeant: Diolch yn fawr. Mae Llafur yn ymroddedig i fynd i'r afael â phroblem y newid yn yr hinsawdd a chyflawni ein hymrwymiaidau rhyngwladol mewn perthynas â chynhyrchu ynni a gollyngiadau nwyon tŷ gwydr. Gweledigaeth Llywodraeth Lafur Cynulliad Cymru yw gwneud Cymru'n esiampl o ynni glân, gan gynnal y gallu i gystadlu'n rhyngwladol.

Mae gennym i gyd ran i'w chwarae yn hyn ac, fel y dywedodd Mick Bates, mae'r newid yn yr hinsawdd yn fygythiad enfawr i'r amgylchedd ac i'n seilwaith cymdeithasol ac economaidd. Mae protocol Kyoto'n gytundeb rhyngwladol sydd yn rhwymedigaeth gyfreithiol i gwtogi gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid 5 y cant, i lefelau cyn-1990, erbyn 2012. Daeth i rym ar 16 Chwefror. Ar gyfartaledd, gallai eiddo yn y DU arbed £200 y flwyddyn ar filiau tanwydd a bod yn fwy cyfforddus drwy fod yn fwy ymwybodol ynghylch ynni a rhoi ar waith fesurau effeithlonrwydd ynni fel insiwleiddio llofftydd ac insiwleiddio waliau dwbl. Nod prosiectau fel prosiect y Tri Phentref yw hyrwyddo ac annog pethau o'r fath a chodi ymwybyddiaeth o'r miloedd o bunnoedd sydd ar gael yn fy etholaeth i yn sir y Fflint. Mae arbed ynni ac effeithlonrwydd ynni'n anodd eu hyrwyddo a'u gweithredu, yn wyneb y diwylliant prynu'n ddi-ddiwedd sydd yn bodoli, ond dyna'r unig ffordd gynaliadwy ymlaen, ac mae angen rhoi pwyslais ar godi ymwybyddiaeth y cyhoedd a newid ymddygiad pobl.

Glyn Davies: As usual, I have to declare a potential family interest in a wind farm. As a general comment, I have been deeply disappointed by the introduction of TAN 8 and the debate since then, in that it has brought a real sense of division to the Chamber on an issue that had everyone looking for consensus. However, I was hugely encouraged by the speeches made by Mick Bates and Helen Mary Jones, and I think that there has been much greater acceptance of the points that I have been trying to make. I largely agreed with much of what they said today, and there is room for a measure of agreement on this matter. However, for two reasons, I have been against TAN 8 since I first saw a draft of it. First, it undermines local democracy and, secondly, it focuses too much on one particular sort of renewable energy.

4.30 p.m.

To develop those points, with regard to the undermining of local democracy, and speaking as one who was chairman of a local planning authority for about six years, my local planning authority and I saw guidance in a context against which we took all our decisions. We knew that, if we turned down an application contrary to guidance, not only was that application likely to be approved on appeal, but we would also be subject to heavy costs. It was, therefore, highly unlikely that a planning authority would go against guidance.

I am interested in the Minister's response, particularly in what he said in last week's debate on sustainable development in reply to Gwenda Thomas's contribution. The Minister's response was hugely encouraging, and totally contrary to local planning authorities' view of planning guidance. To help the Minister, I am arranging to send a copy of his words to all planning authorities so that they can attach it to the guidance, because the Minister's words are significant, and they are also material to a planning authority's decision and should be added to the guidance. As far as I can see, the Minister's words, generally, show a

Glyn Davies: Fel arfer, rhaid i mi ddatgan buddiant teuluol posibl mewn fferm wynt. Fel sylw cyffredinol, siomedig iawn i mi fu cyflwyno TAN 8 a'r ddadl ers hynny, gan ei fod wedi cyflwyno ymdeimlad gwirioneddol o rwyg i'r Siambr ar fater lle'r oedd pawb yn chwilio am gonsensws. Fodd bynnag, codwyd fy nghalon yn fawr gan yr areithiau a wnaethpwyd gan Mick Bates a Helen Mary Jones, a chredaf fod y pwyntiau yr wyf wedi bod yn ceisio eu gwneud wedi cael eu derbyn yn llawer gwell. Yr oeddwn yn cytuno i raddau helaeth â llawer o'r hyn a ddywedasant heddiw, ac mae lle i ryw gymaint o gytundeb ynglŷn â'r mater hwn. Fodd bynnag, am ddau reswm, yr wyf wedi bod yn erbyn TAN 8 ers y tro cyntaf y gwelais ddrafft ohono. Yn gyntaf, mae'n tanseilio democratiaeth leol ac, yn ail, mae'n canolbwyntio gormod ar un math penodol o ynni adnewyddadwy.

A datblygu'r pwyntiau hyn, ynglŷn â thanseilio democratiaeth leol, a chan siarad fel un a fu'n gadeirydd awdurdod cynllunio lleol am tua chwe mlynedd, yr oedd fy awdurdod cynllunio lleol a minnau'n ystyried canllawiau mewn cyd-destun yr oeddem yn gwneud ein holl benderfyniadau ar ei sail. Gwyddem, pe baem yn gwrthod cais yn groes i ganllawiau, nid yn unig fod y cais hwnnw'n debygol o gael ei gymeradwyo ar apêl, ond hefyd y byddem yn wynebu costau sylweddol. Yr oedd yn annhebygol iawn, felly, y byddai awdurdod cynllunio yn gweithredu'n groes i'r canllawiau.

Mae gennyf ddiddordeb yn ymateb y Gweinidog, yn enwedig yr hyn a ddywedodd yn y ddadl yr wythnos diwethaf ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy mewn ymateb i gyfraniad Gwenda Thomas. Yr oedd ymateb y Gweinidog yn galonogol iawn, ac yn gwbl groes i farn awdurdodau cynllunio lleol ynglŷn â chanllawiau cynllunio. Er mwyn helpu'r Gweinidog, yr wyf yn trefnu i anfon copi o'i eiriau at bob awdurdod cynllunio er mwyn iddynt allu rhoi'r geiriau ynghlwm wrth y canllawiau, oherwydd y mae geiriau'r Gweinidog yn bwysig, ac maent hefyd yn berthnasol i benderfyniadau awdurdodau cynllunio a dylent gael eu hychwanegu at y

substantial disagreement with TAN 8, and if he and the other relevant Minister, Andrew Davies, were on speaking terms, they may well have had a far more coherent policy.

Carwyn Jones: I fully support TAN 8; it went out in my name. I still cannot reconcile, Glyn, this idea that windfarms are bad unless they are proposed by Tories.

Glyn Davies: I do not truly understand the point that the Minister made. I think that he enjoys the debate when it is brought down to a certain level. When conducted more seriously, he finds debate rather uncomfortable.

The second reason why we are not in favour of TAN 8 is because of its unnecessary focus on one particular form; that of wind energy. When I listened to the First Minister earlier today, and to some of the Minister's comments, I noticed a large measure of agreement in what we are saying. What we have had, however, is a document produced by the Government for a purpose and which does not stack up. It is a bad document and it should be redrafted. Because it has turned out so, there will be much more opposition across Wales than was ever expected. Whenever you speak in public about this matter, Minister, you use completely different words, so that the people of Wales think that you are saying one thing while the instructions that you are issuing to local planning authorities are something entirely different.

Peter Law: I am glad that the Conservatives have given us the chance to debate this matter, because the Minister has used every means he has to run rings around us to avoid our having the opportunity to scrutinise TAN 8. That is why I was pleased to hear Denise Idris Jones's contribution, as well as Alun Cairns's, whose stance on the proposed Scarweather Sands development I supported, because this matter is about the people and how it affects their lives, which is why Members are speaking sincerely on this matter. This must affect us in every part of

canllawiau. Hyd y gwelaf, mae geiriau'r Gweinidog, yn gyffredinol, yn dangos anghytundeb sylweddol â TAN 8, a phe bai ef a'r Gweinidog perthnasol arall, Andrew Davies, yn siarad â'i gilydd, mae'n bosibl y byddent wedi cael polisi llawer mwy cydlynol.

Carwyn Jones: Yr wyf yn gwbl gefnogol i TAN 8; aeth allan yn fy enw i. Yr wyf yn dal i fethu â derbyn y syniad hwn, Glyn, fod ffermydd gwynt yn bethau drwg oni bai eu bod yn cael eu cynnig gan Doriaid.

Glyn Davies: Nid wyf yn deall yn iawn y pwynt a wnaethpwyd gan y Gweinidog. Tybiaf ei fod yn mwynhau'r ddadl pan ddeuir â hi i lawr i ryw lefel. Pan ymdrinnir â hi'n fwy o ddifrif, mae'n ddadl braidd yn anghyffyrddus iddo.

Yr ail reswm pam nad ydym o blaid TAN 8 yw'r ffocws diangen sydd ynddo ar un math penodol o ynni, sef ynni'r gwynt. Pan oeddwn yn gwrandao ar y Prif Weinidog yn gynharach heddiw, ac ar rai o sylwadau'r Gweinidog, sylwais ein bod yn cytuno ar lawer iawn o bethau. Yr hyn a gawsom, fodd bynnag, yw dogfen wedi ei chynhyrchu gan y Llywodraeth at ddiben penodol heb ddim cysondeb. Mae'n ddogfen wael a dylid ei hailddrafftio. Gan mai dogfen felly yw hi, bydd llawer mwy o wrthwynebiad ym mhob cwr o Gymru nag a ragwelwyd erioed. Pa bryd bynnag yr ydych yn siarad yn gyhoeddus am y mater hwn, Weinidog, yr ydych yn defnyddio geiriau hollol wahanol, fel bod pobl Cymru'n meddwl eich bod yn dweud un peth tra bo'r cyfarwyddiadau yr ydych yn eu rhoi i awdurdodau cynllunio lleol yn hollol wahanol.

Peter Law: Yr wyf yn falch bod y Ceidwadwyr wedi rhoi cyfle inni gael dadl ar y mater hwn, oherwydd y mae'r Gweinidog wedi gwneud ei orau glas i roi tri thro am un inni a cheisio'n rhwystro rhag cael cyfle i graffu ar TAN 8. Dyna pam yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed cyfraniad Denise Idris Jones, yn ogystal ag Alun Cairns, yr oeddwn yn cefnogi ei safbwynt ar ddatblygiad arfaethedig Scarweather Sands, oherwydd y mae'r mater hwn yn ymwneud â phobl a sut y mae'n effeithio ar eu bywydau, a dyma pam y mae'r Aelodau'n siarad yn ddiwyll yn ei

Wales, and I think it is important to remember that.

I have told the Minister before that he is happy not to have these windfarms located in the national parks because he is happy to shove them on poor people in the Valleys communities. That is what it is like in my constituency, where people who have worked all their lives to invest in a property are now being told that they cannot even sell their properties because of a proposed windfarm, and no-one is prepared to mortgage the properties. That is the reason for my remarks and my opposition to TAN 8, because it is a licence for big business, and it is definitely working against the people who have invested their lives in their homes and who are committed to them.

That leads to another aspect, in that people believe in their environment, they care for their environment, and they do not want to see mountains full of these turbines, which are so large—we have heard about the dimensions. Because there is such disbelief with regard to wind turbines generally, I do not think that we do anything in the Assembly in the interest of the people of Wales by perpetuating the proposals of TAN 8, because, at the end of the day, it is the poorer people who will pay. They will not be bought off by big businesses that offer large amounts of ransom money to communities so that they will agree to proposals. People appreciate their environment. They have grown up in it; they want to save it; and it is precious to them. That is why the Minister should be championing these people, and the Labour Government should be caring about poor people, not exploiting them. That is why this is wrong. We shall see a reaction to TAN 8 all over Wales.

Tamsin Dunwoody: You continually mention the poorer people of Wales. Do you agree that the scheme that has been opened and assisted by the Mount Community Association in my constituency, which will allow wind power to feed directly into a housing estate to reduce fuel poverty, is a good thing? It is helping the people that you allege we are damaging with wind power.

gylch. Bydd hyn yn effeithio ar bobl ym mhob rhan o Gymru, a chredaf ei bod yn bwysig cofio hynny.

Yr wyf wedi dweud wrth y Gweinidog o'r blaen ei fod yn fodlon peidio â lleoli'r ffermydd gwynt hyn yn y parciau cenedlaethol oherwydd ei fod yn barod i'w gyrru i gymunedau tlawd y Cymoedd. Dyna sut y mae pethau yn fy etholaeth i, lle y mae pobl sydd wedi gweithio'n galed drwy gydol eu hoes i fuddsoddi mewn eiddo bellach yn clywed na allant hyd yn oed werthu eu heiddo oherwydd fferm wynt arfaethedig, ac nad oes neb yn barod i roi morgais ar yr eiddo. Dyna'r rheswm dros fy sylwadau a'm gwrthwynebiad i TAN 8, oherwydd y mae'n rhoi penrhyddid i fusnesau mawr, ac mae'n sicr yn gweithio yn erbyn y bobl sydd wedi buddsoddi popeth sydd ganddynt yn eu cartrefi ac wedi ymrwymo iddynt.

Mae hyn yn arwain at agwedd arall, oherwydd y mae pobl yn credu yn eu hamgylchedd, maent yn poeni am eu hamgylchedd, ac nid ydynt eisiau gweld y mynyddoedd yn frith o dyrbinau enfawr—yr ydym wedi clywed am eu maint. Gan fod y fath anghrediniaeth ynglŷn â thyrbinau gwynt yn gyffredinol, nid wyf yn credu ein bod yn gweithredu er lles pobl Cymru yn y Cynulliad drwy barhau â chynigion TAN 8, oherwydd, yn y pen draw, y bobl dlawd fydd yn talu'r pris. Ni fynnant gael eu prynu gan fusnesau mawr sy'n cynnig pridwerth hael i gymunedau er mwyn iddynt gytuno â'u cynigion. Mae pobl yn gwerthfawrogi eu hamgylchedd. Maent wedi eu magu ynddo; maent eisiau ei ddiogelu; ac mae'n werthfawr iddynt. Dyna pam y dylai'r Gweinidog fod yn cefnogi'r bobl hyn, ac y dylai'r Llywodraeth Lafur fod yn gofalu am bobl dlawd, yn hytrach na manteisio arnynt. Dyna pam y mae hyn yn anghywir. Byddwn yn gweld adwaith i TAN 8 ym mhob rhan o Gymru.

Tamsin Dunwoody: Yr ydych yn cyfeirio'n barhaus at bobl dlawd Cymru. A ydych yn cytuno bod y cynllun sydd wedi cael ei sefydlu a'i gefnogi gan Gymdeithas Gymunedol y Mownt yn fy etholaeth i, a fydd yn caniatáu i ynni gwynt fwydo'n uniongyrchol i ystâd dai er mwyn lleihau tloidi o ran tanwydd, yn beth da? Mae'n helpu'r bobl yr ydych chi'n honni ein bod yn

eu niweidio ag ynni'r gwynt.

Peter Law: That might be helpful to some people. To be fair, I am not going to say that that will not be helpful. However, I just picked up a letter in my office from people in mid Wales who say that their communities have already been blighted. I know that people in the communities that I represent are really frightened. They have difficulties selling houses even now. I have to stand up and represent those people. It may work for you, but I do not subscribe to your view. This is not in the interests of Wales and poorer people, and I happen to represent a lot of the poorer people in Wales.

Peter Law: Efallai fod hynny o fudd i rai pobl. A bod yn deg, nid wyf am ddweud na fydd o ddim budd. Fodd bynnag, darllenais lythyr yn fy swyddfa yn ddiweddar gan bobl yn y Canolbarth sy'n dweud bod eu cymunedau hwy wedi eu difetha'n barod. Gwn fod pobl yn y cymunedau yr wyf fi'n eu cynrychioli yn bryderus iawn. Maent yn cael trafferth wrth werthu tai yn awr hyd yn oed. Rhaid imi sefyll ar fy nhraed a chynrychioli'r bobl hyn. Efallai ei fod yn gweithio i chi, ond nid wyf yn cytuno â'ch barn. Nid yw hyn er lles Cymru a phobl dlawd, ac yr wyf yn digwydd bod yn cynrychioli llawer o'r bobl dlotaf yng Nghymru.

Brynle Williams: One of the biggest problems with TAN 8 and the Government's renewable energy policy is that they simply fail to promote alternatives to large-scale onshore windfarms. I would like to see a rewritten document that plays up, not down, the great potential of biomass in particular. We need research into how we can better utilise—you may laugh—human and animal sludge. For example, sewage can create biogas. There is research being done into anaerobic digestion, which, with Government investment and support, could present us with a real opportunity to reduce carbon emissions.

Brynle Williams: Un o'r problemau mwyaf gyda TAN 8 a pholisi ynni adnewyddadwy'r Llywodraeth yw nad ydynt yn hyrwyddo dewisiadau eraill yn lle ffermydd gwynt mawr ar y tir. Hoffwn weld dogfen wedi ei hailysgrifennu a fyddai'n hybu, yn hytrach na bychanu, potensial aruthrol bio-màs yn fwyaf arbennig. Mae angen inni gael ymchwil i ffyrdd o wneud gwell defnydd—gallwch chwethin—o garthion pobl ac anifeiliaid. Er enghraifft, gall carthion gynhyrchu bio-nwy. Mae gwaith ymchwil yn cael ei wneud i dreuliad anerobig, a gallai hyn, â buddsoddiad a chefnogaeth gan y Llywodraeth, fod yn gyfle gwirioneddol inni leihau gollyngiadau carbon.

It is not only biofuels that present exciting alternatives. We need investment in tidal, wave and solar power. Why does TAN 8 not set out investment in these technologies, Minister?

Nid biodanwydd yn unig sy'n cynnig dewisiadau eraill cyffrous. Mae angen buddsoddiad yn ynni'r llanw, y tonnau a'r haul. Pam nad yw TAN 8 yn sôn am fuddsoddiad yn y technolegau hyn, Weinidog?

On a recent visit to Denmark and Holland, it was interesting to see that wind turbines were placed outside factories to cut down pollution there on brownfield sites. Why can we not do the same? That is the sort of forward thinking that we need to adopt if we are serious about tackling carbon emissions. Another avenue that TAN 8 simply does not address—and where I came into the equation—is vehicle fuel. It is not the answer to build more diesel refineries, not least because it takes over five years to build one and we are told that there are only 10 to 15 years' worth of oil supply

Ar ymweliad diweddar â Denmarc a'r Iseldiroedd, yr oedd yn ddiddorol gweld bod tyrbinau gwynt yn cael eu gosod y tu allan i ffatrïoedd er mwyn lleihau llygredd yno ar safleoedd tir llwyd. Pam na allwn ni wneud yr un peth? Dyna'r math o feddwl ar gyfer y dyfodol y mae angen inni ei fabwysiadu os ydym o ddifrif ynglŷn â mynd i'r afael â gollyngiadau carbon. Mater arall nad yw TAN 8 yn rhoi sylw iddo—ac sy'n berthnasol iawn i mi—yw tanwydd cerbydau. Nid adeiladu rhagor o burfeydd diesel yw'r ateb, yn un peth oherwydd ei bod yn cymryd dros

left. What would be the point? Why not put that money into alternative technologies for cleaner vehicle fuels? What about electricity? We hear a lot about hydrogen, but yet again, TAN 8 and the Government's renewable energy policy conveniently ignore those options. If we are serious about combating climate change, we must be serious about embracing all forms of renewable energy and not settle for second best in a rush to meet targets.

bum mlynedd i adeiladu un, a dywedir wrthym mai dim ond digon o olew am 10 i 15 mlynedd sydd ar ôl. Beth fyddai'r pwrpas? Pam na ellir buddsoddi'r arian hwnnw mewn technolegau amgen ar gyfer tanwydd glanach i gerbydau? Beth am drydan? Yr ydym yn clywed llawer am hydrogen, ond unwaith eto, mae TAN 8 a pholisi ynni adnewyddadwy'r Llywodraeth yn gyfleus iawn yn anwybyddu'r dewisiadau hynny. Os ydym o ddifrif ynglŷn â gwneud rhywbeth ynglŷn â'r newid yn yr hinsawdd, rhaid inni fod yn barod i ystyried pob math o ynni adnewyddadwy a pheidio â bodloni ar yr ail orau oherwydd ein bod ar frys i gyrraedd targedau.

4.40 p.m.

Alun Ffred Jones: Mae dadl heddiw yn un gwbl ragrithiol ar ran y Torïaid. Mae'n ymgais i fanteisio ar ymgyrch sydd â llawer iawn o gefnogaeth iddi yng Nghymru. Dywed datganiad Torïaid Cymru eu bod yn rhoi newid hinsawdd ar ben yr agenda, ond ni chlywsom yr un gair yn y drafodaeth o du'r Torïaid am hynny.

Alun Ffred Jones: Today's debate is quite hypocritical on behalf of the Tories. It tries to take advantage of a campaign which has much support in Wales. The Welsh Conservatives' statement says that they are putting climate change at the top of the agenda, but we have not heard one word about that from the Tories in this debate.

O ran yr honiad bod codi melinau gwynt yn gostwng gwerth cartrefi, gadewch inni edrych ar enghraifft yng Ngheredigion, ym mhentref Tal-y-bont. Mae melinau gwynt ar fryn uwchben Tal-y-bont, ond nid wyf yn ymwybodol bod poblogaeth y pentref yn ffyrnig yn erbyn melinau gwynt, ac nid yw prisiau'r tai wedi gostwng yno. Felly, nid wyf yn deall yr ofn mawr am brisiau tai.

In terms of the allegation that wind turbines brings down house prices, we should look at an example in Ceredigion, in the village of Tal-y-bont. There are wind turbines on a hillside above Tal-y-bont, but I am not aware that the village's population are ardently against wind turbines, and house prices have not fallen. So, I cannot understand this great fear about high prices.

Y gwir amdani yw nad ydym yn cymryd y newid yn yr hinsawdd, na mesurau i geisio lleihau effaith tŷ gwydr, o ddifrif. Nid yw ar frig yr agenda wleidyddol ym Mhrydain, yn rhyngwladol nac yn y Cynulliad chwaith. Mae'r pleidiau yn dweud y pethau cywir, ond y gwir amdani yw ein bod ofn canlyniadau neu oblygiadau gweithredu ar hynny i'r boblogaeth yn gyffredinol. Mae'n anodd iawn mynd at bobl a dweud wrthynt fod yn rhaid iddynt newid eu ffordd o fyw, ond dyna fydd yn rhaid inni ei wynebu.

The truth is that we do not take climate change, nor measures to attempt to reduce the greenhouse effect, seriously. It is not at the top of the agenda in Britain, internationally nor in the Assembly. The parties say the right things, but the truth is that we fear the outcomes or the implications of acting upon that to the general population. It is very difficult to approach people and tell them that they must change their way of life, but that is what we must face.

Dylem fod yn canolbwyntio ein hegri ar leihau'r defnydd o danwydd ffosil ac olew. Mae hynny'n golygu cael cerbydau mwy effeithlon, defnyddio llai arnynt a gwneud ein

We should focus our efforts on reducing the use of fossil fuel and oil. That means having more effective vehicles and using less of them, and making our homes far more

tai yn llawer mwy effeithlon. Os ydym o ddifrif am geisio gwneud gwahaniaeth, rhaid inni weithredu yn llawer mwy grymus nag a wnaethom hyd yma.

Dylem hefyd annog cynlluniau ynni adnewyddadwy lleol sydd o fudd i'r gymuned, a chyplysu'r cynlluniau hynny gyda manteision i'r cymunedau. Fel plaid, dyna un newid yr hoffem ei weld o fewn nodyn cyngor technegol 8.

O droi at gwelliant 3, os ydym o ddifrif yng Nghymru am wneud gwahaniaeth, rhaid inni gael cymaint o bwerau â phosibl yn ein dwylo yn y maes hwn. Mae'r setliad presennol yn gwbl annigonol. Rhaid inni gael yr hawl i wneud y penderfyniadau cynllunio ar bob cynllun ynni, ac nid dim ond ar y rhai cymharol fach.

Mae gennyf bryderon gwirioneddol am y polisi presennol—rhaid inni oll gydnabod mai ateb rhannol yw ynni gwynt. Er nad wyf yn cytuno ag union gyfeiriad nodyn cyngor technegol 8, yr wyf o leiaf yn cydnabod ei fod yn ceisio rhoi rhyw gyfeiriad i lywodraeth leol wrth ymdrin â cheisiadau cynllunio.

Os nad ydym o ddifrif am ynni adnewyddadwy, yr ydym yn wynebu'r dewis niwclear. Faint ohonom fydd yn dweud wedyn fod ein hetholwyr yn fodlon derbyn gorsafoedd niwclear yn eu pentrefi a'u hardaloedd?

Mark Isherwood: Speaking in Plenary on 1 February, I said:

'Wind turbines are part of the problem, not the solution—based on a policy of hot air, not clean air. They are a quick-fix option on the cheap by a Labour Government that cannot deliver on carbon emission targets, and which, with Welsh Assembly Government collusion, therefore spun a smoke-screen of renewable energy targets which require an increase in overall generation capacity, without cutting carbon emissions.'

Technical advice note 8 presents the ugly face of political expedience and commercial greed, with no respect for environmental

efficient. If we are serious about trying to make a difference, we must take firmer action than we have thus far.

We should also encourage local renewable energy schemes which benefit the community, and combine those schemes with benefits to the community. As a party, that is one change that we would like to see in technical advice note 8.

Turning to amendment 3, if we are serious in Wales about making a difference, we must have responsibility over as many powers as possible in this area. The current settlement is completely inadequate. We must be able to make the planning decisions on every energy scheme, and not just on the relatively small schemes.

I have real concerns about the current policy—we must all accept that wind energy is only a partial answer. Even though I do not agree with the exact direction of technical advice note 8, I will at least acknowledge that it attempts to give some kind of direction to local government in attempting to deal with planning applications.

If we are not serious about renewable energy, we face the nuclear option. How many of us will then say that our constituents are willing to accept nuclear power stations in their villages and localities?

Mark Isherwood: Wrth siarad yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 1 Chwefror, dywedais:

'Mae tyrbinau gwynt yn rhan o'r broblem, yn hytrach na bod yn ateb iddi—maent yn seiliedig ar bolisi o falu awyr, yn hytrach nag awyr lân. Maent yn ddewis rhad a hawdd i Lywodraeth Lafur nad yw'n gallu cyrraedd ei thargedau ar ollyngiadau carbon ac sydd, felly, drwy gynllwynio â Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, wedi cuddio y tu ôl i dargedau dryslyd ar ynni adnewyddadwy sy'n gofyn mwy o gapasiti cynhyrchu'n gyffredinol, heb dorri ar ollyngiadau carbon.'

Mae nodyn cyngor technegol 8 yn amlygu hwylustod gwleidyddol a thrachwant masnachol o'r math gwaethaf, heb ddim

consideration. I referred to a German Government report which warned that windfarm programmes will greatly increase energy costs, and which casts doubt on the claim that wind power cuts greenhouse gas pollution. At that point in the debate, Carwyn Jones intervened and asked what the research was and who had funded it. I hope that he saw the front page article in *The Guardian* two weeks later, which provided all the details required to substantiate my comments.

I referred to a former reader in ecology at the University of Wales, who told me of his increasing concern and certainty that the pursuit of renewable energy targets, based on wind power, is at the expense of genuine savings of fossil fuels, that is carbon targets, and that this will cause a serious problem in Wales and across the UK. He also told me that, in May 2004, the generating company of west Denmark, Elsam, admitted in a presentation to the Danish Government that

‘increased development of wind turbines does not reduce Danish carbon dioxide emissions’.

This has serious implications for the future of wind energy in Wales and the United Kingdom. To provide us with 10 per cent of realised wind generation, we would have to deploy about three times that installed capacity, because the wind-imposed load factor onshore in the United Kingdom is about 30 per cent. The only resort would be to provide dedicated fossil fuel standby, in which case, much of the carbon dioxide saving would be negated. In other words, if we only want electricity when the wind blows, wind turbines will do the job nicely, but if we want electricity 24/7 and put all our renewable eggs in the wind turbine basket, there will be little or no reduction in greenhouse gases.

parch at ystyriaethau amgylcheddol. Cyfeiriais at adroddiad gan Lywodraeth yr Almaen a oedd yn rhybuddio y bydd rhaglenni ffermydd gwynt yn arwain at gynydd sylweddol yng nghostau ynni, ac sy'n bwrw amheuaeth ar yr honiad bod ynni'r gwynt yn lleihau llygredd nwyon tŷ gwydr. Ar yr adeg honno yn y ddadl, torrodd Carwyn Jones ar fy nhraws a gofyn beth oedd yr ymchwil hon a phwy a dalodd amdani. Yr wyf yn gobeithio ei fod wedi gweld yr erthygl ar dudalen flaen *The Guardian* bythefnos yn ddiweddarach, a roddodd yr holl fanylion a oedd yn angenrheidiol i gadarnhau fy sylwadau.

Cyfeiriais at gyn-ddarllenwydd mewn ecoleg ym Mhrifysgol Cymru, a ddywedodd wrthyf ei fod yn fwyfwy pryderus a sicr bod yr ymgais i gyrraedd targedau o ran ynni adnewyddadwy, drwy ddefnyddio ynni'r gwynt, yn digwydd ar draul sicrhau gwir arbedion o ran tanwyddau ffosil, hynny yw targedau carbon, ac y bydd hyn yn arwain at broblem ddifrifol yng Nghymru ac ym mhob rhan o'r DU. Dywedodd wrthyf hefyd fod y cwmni cynhyrchu yng ngorllewin Denmarc, Elsam, wedi cyfaddef, ym Mai 2004, mewn cyflwyniad i Lywodraeth Denmarc

nad yw'r datblygu cynyddol ar dyrbinau gwynt yn lleihau gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid Denmarc.

Mae goblygiadau difrifol yn hyn i ddyfodol ynni'r gwynt yng Nghymru ac yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Er mwyn gallu cynhyrchu 10 y cant o'n trydan o ynni'r gwynt, byddem yn gorfod cael y capasiti i gynhyrchu tua thair gwaith yn fwy na hynny, gan mai tua 30 y cant yw'r ffactor llwyth oherwydd y gwynt ar y tir yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Ni fyddai dim dewis, byddai'n rhaid wrth ddarpariaeth bwrpasol wrth gefn a fyddai'n defnyddio tanwyddau ffosil, a fyddai'n golygu dad-wneud llawer o'r arbedion o ran carbon deuocsid. Mewn geiriau eraill, os mai dim ond pan fo'r gwynt yn chwythu y bydd arnom eisiau trydan, bydd tyrbinau gwynt yn gwneud y gwaith yn iawn, ond os oes arnom eisiau trydan 24/7 a rhoi ein holl wyau adnewyddadwy ym masged tyrbinau gwynt, ni chawn ond ychydig iawn o ostyngiad neu ddim gostyngiad o gwbl mewn nwyon tŷ gwydr.

Professor Peter Cobbold summed up the reality in north Wales in his presentation to Llandudno Town Council last month, when he stated that windfarms would devastate tourism in north Wales, would have little or no impact on reducing carbon dioxide emissions and may indirectly lead to increased pollution levels. I endorse Denise Idris Jones's comments and refer you to a local tourism trader's petition that has been brought to my attention, which collected 1,500 signatures from tourists in just a few short weeks during the summer.

If we really support renewable energy and targets, it is critical that we consider all forms of renewable energy, technology and energy efficiency. The polluting reality in Labour Wales is summed up by the constituent who wrote to me to state that he had been involved in the development of better biofuel and bioenergy technology over the last four years—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I ask you to look at the clock. You have run over time already. Please wind up.

Mark Isherwood: I will conclude with a comment that Tony Blair made at a conference in New York a few weeks ago. He said,

'I would say probably I'm changing my thinking about this in the past two or three years...The truth is, no country is going to cut its growth or consumption substantially in the light of a long-term environmental problem.'

What Blair-faced cheek and how very New Labour.

The Minister for Economic Development and Transport (Andrew Davies): I find this Conservative motion amazing, and the words 'Alice in Wonderland' readily spring to mind. This motion implies that we have developed our renewable energy policy and the TAN 8 planning guidance on a whim. I heard the Tories' new soundbite when Alun

Crynhodd yr Athro Peter Cobbold y realiti yng ngogledd Cymru yn ei gyflwyniad gerbron Cyngor Tref Llandudno fis diwethaf, pan ddywedodd y byddai ffermydd gwynt yn distrywio twristiaeth yng ngogledd Cymru, ac na fyddai ond yn effeithio ychydig neu ddim o gwbl ar ostwng gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid ac y gallai arwain yn anuniongyrchol at lefelau llygredd uwch. Cefnogaf sylwadau Denise Idris Jones ac fe'ch cyfeiriai at ddeiseb masnachwr twristiaeth lleol y dygwyd fy sylw ati, deiseb a gasglodd 1,500 o lofnodion oddi wrth dwristiaid mewn ychydig o wythnosau yn unig yn ystod yr haf.

Os ydym yn gwir gefnogi ynni a thargedau adnewyddadwy, mae'n hollbwysig inni ystyried pob ffurf ar ynni adnewyddadwy, technoleg ac effeithlonrwydd ynni. Mae'r realiti ynglŷn â llygredd yn y Gymru Lafur yn cael ei chrynhoi gan yr etholwr a ysgrifennodd ataf i ddweud ei fod wedi bod yn gysylltiedig â datblygu gwell technoleg o ran biodanwydd a bioynni dros y pedair blynedd diwethaf—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Yr wyf yn gofyn ichi edrych ar y cloc. Yr ydych eisoes wedi cael mwy o amser nag a ddylech. A wnewch ddirwyn i ben os gwelwch yn dda?

Mark Isherwood: Clof gyda sylwadau a wnaeth Tony Blair mewn cynhadledd yn Efrog Newydd ychydig wythnosau yn ôl. Dywedodd,

Byddwn yn dweud o bosibl fy mod yn newid fy meddwl am hyn yn y ddwy neu dair blynedd diwethaf...Y gwir yw, nid oes yr un wlad yn mynd i gwtogi yn sylweddol ar ei thwf na'i defnydd yng ngoleuni problem amgylcheddol hirdymor.

Sôn am ddigywilydd-dra Blairaidd sydd mor nodweddiadol o Lafur Newydd.

Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth (Andrew Davies): Yr wyf yn teimlo bod y cynnig hwn gan y Ceidwadwyr yn syfrdanol, a daw'r geiriau 'Alis yng Ngwlad Hud' i'r meddwl. Mae'r cynnig hwn yn awgrymu ein bod wedi datblygu ein polisi ynni adnewyddadwy a chanllawiau cynllunio TAN 8 ar sail

Cairns, Lisa Francis and Mark Isherwood all said that it was a 'quick fix'. In fact, nothing could be further from the truth.

Some interesting contributions have been made this afternoon, but Alun Ffred Jones's was the most pertinent. He made some valuable points, but the overwhelming point that he made was that this is about challenging global warming in a responsible way. Not once in their contributions have members of the party that tabled this motion talked about nuclear power. During the last general election, their shadow Minister, Tim Yeo, said that the party was committed to introducing nuclear power. Most parties in this Chamber are deeply concerned about that policy.

Alun Cairns: The only person whom I remember talking about nuclear power since the last general election is the Prime Minister.

Andrew Davies: Not at all. I remember Tim Yeo being asked explicitly about it in a television studio and he said that, if the Tories were elected as a Government at Westminster, they would seize the nuclear power option.

Ever since the Assembly came into being in 1999, we have been carefully considering our policy on renewable energy. We have been carefully observing what has been happening in Wales and elsewhere in the world with regard to renewable energy. Several people have mentioned the Assembly's Economic Development and Transport Committee report on energy and energy efficiency matters, and it was that committee that first suggested that we should have 4 TWh as a renewable electricity target for 2010. I do not recall anyone in the Chamber objecting when I first made my statement on energy policy in Wales three years ago, when we introduced the 4 TWh by 2010 target or the 7 TWh by 2020 target. If anything, we were criticised for our alleged lack of ambition; we are now being told that we are too ambitious.

Alun Cairns: I ask the Minister to check the

mymmpwy. Clywais eiriau slic newydd y Toriaid pan ddywedodd Alun Cairns, Lisa Francis a Mark Isherwood, ill tri, mai 'ateb sydyn' ydoedd. Mewn gwirionedd, ni allai dim fod ymhellach oddi wrth y gwir.

Cafwyd rhai cyfraniadau diddorol iawn y prynhawn yma, ond sylwadau Alun Ffred Jones a oedd fwyaf perthnasol. Gwnaeth bwyntiau gwerthfawr, ond y prif bwynt a wnaeth oedd bod hyn yn ymwneud â herio cynhesu byd-eang mewn ffordd gyfrifol. Nid yw aelodau'r blaid a gyflwynodd y cynnig hwn wedi crybwyll ynni niwclear unwaith. Yn ystod yr etholiad cyffredinol diwethaf, dywedodd eu Gweinidog yn yr wrthblaid, Tim Yeo, fod y blaid wedi ymrwymo i gyflwyno ynni niwclear. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r pleidiau yn y Siambr hon yn pryderu'n ddirfawr am y polisi hwnnw.

Alun Cairns: Yr unig un yr wyf fi'n ei gofio'n sôn am ynni niwclear ers yr etholiad cyffredinol diwethaf yw Prif Weinidog Prydain.

Andrew Davies: Ddim o gwbl. Cofiaf Tim Yeo'n cael ei holi'n benodol yn ei gyloch mewn stiwdio deledu a dywedodd, pe byddai'r Toriaid yn cael eu hethol yn Llywodraeth yn San Steffan, y byddent yn manteisio ar yr opsiwn ynni niwclear.

Ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad yn 1999, yr ydym wedi bod yn ystyried ein polisi ar ynni adnewyddadwy yn ofalus. Yr ydym wedi bod yn edrych yn ofalus ar yr hyn sydd wedi bod yn digwydd yng Nghymru ac mewn mannau eraill o'r byd o safbwynt ynni adnewyddadwy. Mae sawl un wedi crybwyll adroddiad Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth y Cynulliad am faterion ynni ac effeithlonrwydd ynni, a'r pwyllgor hwn oedd y cyntaf i awgrymu y dylem gael 4 TWh fel targed trydan adnewyddadwy ar gyfer 2010. Ni chofiaf neb yn y Siambr yn gwrthwynebu pan wneuthum fy natganiad am y tro cyntaf am bolisi ynni yng Nghymru dair blynedd yn ôl, pan gyflwynasom y targed 4 TWh erbyn 2010 neu'r targed 7 TWh erbyn 2020. Os rhywbeth, fe'n beirniadwyd am ein diffyg uchelgais honedig; dywedir wrthym yn awr ein bod yn rhy uchelgeisiol.

Alun Cairns: Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog

records again and to check how we voted in the debate following the statement, because we are the only party that has been consistent—from my actions in committee and those of my colleagues in the Conservative Party with regard to the statement that we questioned here, to the debate on energy policy that has led to this position. I made it clear in my statement that we are the only party that has been consistent in this matter, irrespective of the comments that come from every side.

Andrew Davies: I can see that you are clearly and consistently in favour of nuclear power. We have offered you the opportunity of trying to seriously address the challenge of global warming and to embrace renewable energy; the only tangible way that we can do that is through TAN 8 and through an agreed approach. Talk about opportunism knocks—your party has been jumping on a bandwagon and appealing to a vociferous minority.

4.50 p.m.

In addition, we have had many major workshops on the prospects for renewable energy in Wales, and have taken general advice from consultants, such as AEA Technology plc, Arup and Garrad Hassan. TAN 8 has gone through an extremely long gestation process, and was subjected to extensive public consultation. We were publicly criticised for not producing it earlier. Therefore, whatever we do, we are not going to win on this one with the Conservative Party.

This has been an in-depth process. It has identified that the only renewable energy process that is sufficiently large scale, financially viable and technologically advanced at this stage is wind power. Other technologies are of long-term importance; we agree with that. However, they are long term.

Helen Mary Jones: Will you give way?

Andrew Davies: No, sorry. I do not have time.

archwilio'r cofnodion unwaith eto a gweld sut y gwnaethom bleidleisio yn y ddadl wedi'r datganiad, oherwydd nyni yw'r unig blaid sydd wedi bod yn gyson—o'm gweithredoedd yn y pwyllgor a gweithredoedd fy nghyd-Aelodau yn y Blaid Geidwadol o safbwynt y datganiad y bu inni ei gwestiynu yma, i'r ddadl ynghylch polisi ynni sydd wedi arwain at y sefyllfa hon. Dywedais yn glir yn fy natganiad mai nyni yw'r unig blaid sydd wedi bod yn gyson yn y mater hwn, beth bynnag yw'r sylwadau a ddaw o bob ochr.

Andrew Davies: Gallaf weld eich bod yn bendant ac yn gyson o blaid ynni niwclear. Yr ydym wedi cynnig ichi'r cyfle i geisio mynd i'r afael o ddifrif â her cynhesu bydeang a chroesawu ynni adnewyddadwy; yr unig ffordd wirioneddol y gallwn wneud hyn yw drwy TAN 8 a thrwy ddull o weithredu y cytunir arno. Sôn am fachu ar bob cyfle—mae eich plaid wedi bod yn mynd i ganlyn y llif gan apelio at leiafrif uchel ei gloch.

Yn ogystal, cawsom nifer o weithdai pwysig am y rhagolygon ar gyfer ynni adnewyddadwy yng Nghymru, ac yr ydym wedi cymryd cyngor cyffredinol oddi wrth ymgynghorwyr, megis AEA Technology plc, Arup a Garrad Hassan. Mae TAN 8 wedi bod drwy broses eithriadol o faith o ran ei ddatblygu, a chynhaliwyd ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus helaeth yn ei glych. Fe'n beirniadwyd yn gyhoeddus am beidio â'i gynhyrchu ynghynt. Felly, beth bynnag a wnawn, nid ydym yn mynd i ennill ar y mater hwn gyda'r Blaid Geidwadol.

Mae hon wedi bod yn broses drylwyr. Mae wedi canfod mai'r unig broses ynni adnewyddadwy sydd ar raddfa ddigon mawr, sydd yn ddigon hyfyw yn ariannol ac yn ddigon datblygedig yn dechnolegol ar hyn o bryd yw ynni'r gwynt. Mae gan y technolegau eraill bwysigrwydd hirdymor; cytunwn â hynny. Hirdymor ydynt, fodd bynnag,

Helen Mary Jones: A wnewch ildio?

Andrew Davies: Na wnaf, mae'n ddrwg gennyf. Nid oes gennyf amser.

We are determined, however, to see them exploited in due course. For the moment, they do not offer the prospect of the generation of affordable energy on a large scale.

Lisa Francis: Will you give way?

Andrew Davies: No, sorry. I do not have time.

I will go through a few of them just to exemplify the problems with which you are faced in terms of non-wind renewable energy. Take photovoltaics; they are important for us economically because Sharp's European PV manufacturing facility is in Wrexham. Photovoltaics operate well in certain circumstances, but I will give you a scale of subsidy and output. Germany and Japan have invested an enormous amount of money in subsidising PV installations, but even in these countries, the amount of electricity produced from photovoltaics is only in the order of 0.5 per cent.

I am sure that biomass will be significant, but it will not be on the scale that we need to reach our targets. It offers significant potential from the perspective of minimising carbon dioxide emissions for both small-scale and large-scale heating systems, and it can be effective. However, as I have seen for myself when I have visited Navarra over the last couple of years, it is expensive and there are big issues about the supply chain.

No-one is suggesting that we encourage new large-scale hydro systems. It is not enough to refer to Dinorwig; most large-scale hydro-electric schemes in Wales, and the potential for them, have already been exploited. While wave and tidal marine energy offers great prospects for Wales, full-scale exploitation looks most unlikely until post 2015.

That leaves wind power, both onshore and offshore. Offshore wind power is still an embryonic technology, and, on a large scale, it is not expected to come forward until after

Yr ydym yn benderfynol, fodd bynnag, o'u gweld yn cael eu defnyddio maes o law. Ar hyn o bryd, ni chynigiant y posibilrwydd o greu ynni fforddiadwy ar raddfa fawr.

Lisa Francis: A wnewch ildio?

Andrew Davies: Na wnaaf, mae'n ddrwg gennyf. Nid oes gennyf amser.

Af drwy ychydig ohonynt dim ond er mwyn dangos y problemau a wynebwech gydag ynni adnewyddadwy ar wahân i ynni gwynt. Ystyriwch ffotofoltedd; mae'n bwysig inni yn economaidd oherwydd bod cyfleuster gweithgynhyrchu ffotofoltedd Ewropeaidd Sharp yn Wrecsam. Mae ffotofoltedd yn gweithredu'n dda mewn amgylchiadau penodol, ond rhoddaf ichi raddfa'r cymorthdal a'r allbwn. Mae'r Almaen a Siapan wedi buddsoddi swm aruthrol o arian mewn rhoi cymorthdaliadau ar gyfer systemau ffotofoltedd, ond hyd yn oed yn y gwledydd hyn, nid yw'r trydan a gynhyrchir drwy ffotofoltedd ond tua 0.5 y cant.

Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd bio-màs yn bwysig, ond ni fydd ar y raddfa y mae arnom ei hangen i gyrraedd ein targedau. Mae'n cynnig potensial sylweddol i ostwng gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid mewn systemau gwresogi graddfa fechan a graddfa fawr fel ei gilydd, a gall fod yn effeithiol. Fodd bynnag, fel yr wyf wedi gweld drosof fy hun wrth ymweld â Navarra yn ystod y ddwy flynedd ddiwethaf, mae'n ddrud a cheir problemau mawr gyda'r gadwyn gyflenwi.

Nid oes neb yn awgrymu ein bod yn annog systemau trydan dŵr newydd ar raddfa fawr. Nid yw'n ddigon cyfeirio at Ddinorwig; mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r cynlluniau trydan dŵr ar raddfa fawr yng Nghymru, a'r potensial ar eu cyfer, eisoes wedi cael eu datblygu. Tra bo ynni'r tonnau a llanw'r môr yn cynnig rhagolygon ardderchog i Gymru, nid yw eu datblygu ar raddfa fawr yn debygol iawn tan ar ôl 2015.

Mae hynny'n gadael ynni'r gwynt, ar y tir ac ar y môr. Mae ynni'r gwynt ar y môr yn dal i fod yn dechnoleg annatblygedig, ac, ar raddfa fawr, ni ddisgwylir iddo fod yn ddefnyddiol

2010, post the TAN 8 period. Therefore, while TAN 8 discusses the opportunities for a wide range of renewables, its prime focus is the potential for creating 800 MW of new onshore wind capacity in Wales by 2010. The analysis that underpins TAN 8 has been carried out on an entirely objective basis. It identifies a limited number of areas in Wales where strategic development can take place, against the perspective of various practical environmental and topographical constraints.

We have not adopted a free-for-all approach. I believe that our considered approach is by far the preferable one, and one that I know that other parts of the United Kingdom envy. We owe it to local planning authorities, developers, communities and interested groups to produce a realistic policy-making context. It would be irresponsible to overpromote unproven technologies that cannot yet make a major contribution to our renewable energy targets.

Against this background, why are we debating this issue today? It is perhaps because our Conservative colleagues are burying their heads in the sand with regard to the perils of global warming. One would hope not, because this is far too important an issue to be a political football. I believe that we are debating this issue today because our Conservative colleagues do not agree with the technological arguments that have been put forward. They are against wind power and they are jumping on a bandwagon.

On a few points that were raised, yes, the House of Commons Public Accounts Committee has recently questioned the extent of the cost to consumers of UK windfarm developments. However, I can assure the Assembly that this issue is being examined through the UK Government's renewables obligation review, to which the Assembly Government is party. This review will identify ways of minimising the cost to consumers without damaging investor confidence.

To conclude, our renewable energy policy

tan ar ôl 2010, wedi cyfnod TAN 8. O'r herwydd, tra bo TAN 8 yn trafod y cyfleoedd ar gyfer amrywiaeth fawr o ynni adnewyddadwy, ei brif ffocws yw'r potensial i greu 800 MW o gapasiti newydd o ran gwynt ar y tir yng Nghymru erbyn 2010. Gwnaed y dadansoddiad sy'n sylfaen i TAN 8 ar sail hollol wrthrychol. Mae'n dynodi nifer cyfyngedig o ardaloedd yng Nghymru lle y gall datblygiadau strategol ddigwydd, yn erbyn perspectif amrywiol gyfyngiadau amgylcheddol a thopograffig.

Nid ydym wedi mabwysiadu dull pawb drosto'i hun. Credaf mai ein dull ystyriol yw'r gorau o ddigon, ac mae'n ddull y gwn fod rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig yn eiddigeddu wrtho. Er mwyn awdurdodau cynllunio lleol, datblygwyr, cymunedau a grwpiau cyfrannog, dylem greu cyd-destun realistig ar gyfer llunio polisiau. Byddai'n anghyfrifol gorhwyddo technolegau nas profwyd ac na allant eto wneud cyfraniad pwysig at ein targedau ynni adnewyddadwy.

Yn erbyn y cefndir hwn, pam yr ydym yn dadlau ynghylch y mater hwn heddiw? Y rheswm posibl yw oherwydd bod ein cyd-Aelodau Ceidwadol yn cuddio eu pennau yn y tywod rhag peryglon cynhesu byd-eang. Byddai rhywun yn gobeithio nad ydynt, oherwydd y mae hwn yn fater llawer rhy bwysig i fod yn bêl-droed wleidyddol. Credaf ein bod yn dadlau ynghylch y mater hwn heddiw oherwydd nad yw ein cyd-Aelodau Ceidwadol yn cytuno â'r dadleuon technolegol a gyflwynwyd. Maent yn erbyn ynni'r gwynt ac maent yn mynd i ganlyn y llif.

Ynghylch rhai pwyntiau a godwyd, ydyw, mae Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus Tŷ'r Cyffredin yn ddiweddar wedi cwestiynu cost datblygiadau ffermydd gwynt y DU i ddefnyddwyr. Fodd bynnag, gallaf sicrhau'r Cynulliad fod y mater hwn yn cael ei archwilio drwy gyfrwng adolygiad rhwymedigaeth ynni adnewyddadwy Llywodraeth y DU, adolygiad y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn rhan ohono. Bydd yr adolygiad hwn yn canfod dulliau o leihau'r gost i ddefnyddwyr heb niweidio hyder buddsoddwyr.

I gloi, gwnaethpwyd ymchwil helaeth i'n

and TAN 8 have been extensively researched. They accord with expert thinking across the UK and further afield. Nothing that has been said today gives any grounds for withdrawing TAN 8. We, therefore, oppose the main motion. We also oppose the amendments, because they do not add anything to TAN 8 or to achieving our renewable energy targets.

Nick Bourne: I start by saying that

‘We must look at civil nuclear energy’.

Those are not my words, but, just to update the Minister, those of Tony Blair in Brighton today. Therefore, we will take no lessons from the Minister about the nuclear option that he seems to decry. I remind him furthermore that he had a discussion on nuclear energy, which I have in an admission, but I cannot get the papers on that discussion. I wonder why; there must be something embarrassing there, presumably, or he would be willing to disclose them. I have tried to get the papers on the discussions that he has had with Westminster colleagues on nuclear energy, but I cannot get them under the Freedom of Information Act 2000. However, we will appeal. Therefore, we will take no lessons from the Minister on the nuclear option.

I must say, as many opposition Members have said, that it is shaming to the Government that we have to raise this topic as a minority party debate; it is an important issue that goes to the heart of everything that we should be looking for in the Assembly. It is about the future of our country.

I believe that this headlong flight for large-scale windfarms—and we are talking about much larger and higher windfarms than those that we have at the moment—will be one of the great mysteries of our age. Why have all the eggs been put into one energy basket? That is what is at the heart of this debate. If the Minister cared to read the motion—he clearly has not done so—he would see that

polisi ynni adnewyddadwy a TAN 8. Maent yn gyson â safbwyntiau arbenigol ar draws y DU ac mewn lleoedd eraill. Nid oes dim a ddywedwyd heddiw yn rhoi rheswm dros dynnu TAN 8 yn ei ôl. Yr ydym, o’r herwydd, yn gwrthwynebu’r prif gynnig. Yr ydym hefyd yn gwrthwynebu’r gwelliannau, oherwydd nad ychwanegant ddim at TAN 8 nac at gyrraedd ein targedau ynni adnewyddadwy.

Nick Bourne: Dechreuaf drwy ddweud

bod yn rhaid inni edrych ar ynni niwclear sifil.

Nid fy ngeiriau i yw’r rhain, ond yn hytrach, er mwyn rhoi’r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i’r Gweinidog, geiriau Tony Blair yn Brighton heddiw. O’r herwydd, ni chymerwn wersi gan y Gweinidog am yr opsiwn niwclear yr ymddengys ei fod yn ei feirniadu. Atgoffaf ef ymhellach ei fod wedi cael trafodaeth am ynni niwclear, trafodaeth sydd gennyf mewn datganiad, ond ni allaf gael y papurau ynghylch y drafodaeth honno. Yr wyf yn meddwl pam tybed; rhaid bod rhywbeth i beri embaras ynddynt, yn ôl bob tebyg, neu byddai’n barod i’w datgelu. Yr wyf wedi ceisio cael y papurau am y trafodaethau y mae wedi eu cael gyda chyd-Aelodau yn San Steffan am ynni niwclear, ond ni allaf eu cael dan Ddeddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000. Serch hynny, byddwn yn apelio. O’r herwydd, ni chymerwn wersi gan y Gweinidog am yr opsiwn niwclear.

Rhaid imi ddweud, fel y dywedodd nifer o Aelodau’r gwrthbleidiau, ei fod codi cywilydd ar y Llywodraeth fod yn rhaid inni godi’r testun hwn fel dadl plaid leiafrifol; mae’n fater pwysig sy’n mynd at wraidd popeth y dylem ddisgwyl ei gael yn y Cynulliad. Mae’n ymwneud â dyfodol ein gwlad.

Credaf y bydd rhuthro’n wyllt i godi ffermydd gwynt ar raddfa fawr—ac yr ydym yn sôn am ffermydd gwynt llawer mwy ac uwch na’r rhai sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd—yn un o ddirgelion mawr ein hoes. Pam y mae’r holl wyau wedi cael eu rhoi mewn un fasedg ynni? Dyna sydd wrth wraidd y ddadl hon. Pe dymunai’r Gweinidog ddarllen y cynnig—mae’n amlwg na wnaeth—byddai’n

there is a commitment to other sources of renewable energy. Let us consider the development of those; nothing has been done about those. Ask yourselves whether we are helping Welsh jobs, given the companies that construct these windfarms. No, we are helping Danish and Spanish jobs largely—not Welsh jobs.

I have been consistent on this issue and no-one could say otherwise. I am against these large-scale, high windfarms. I remember going on a demonstration at Cefn Croes with Lisa Francis. The other parties were not there, so Plaid Cymru may well engage in their soft-shoe shuffle. Despite what she said, Helen Mary Jones put up quite a good show of trying to move the party a little in the direction of common sense, but not far enough I think.

Helen Mary Jones: Will you give way?

Nick Bourne: I will, provided that you will not spoil the outbreak of common sense.

Helen Mary Jones: I have absolutely no intention of spoiling the outbreak of common sense, but I will put you right—we have not shifted our position. We have always said that windfarm technology needs to be promoted, where it is supported, where it works for the community and where it is not too damaging to the natural environment. That is no different from what we were saying five or 10 years ago. You know the criticisms that we have made of TAN 8, so come on, Nick, I am not the kind of girl to do a soft-shoe shuffle and you should know that by now.

Nick Bourne: Yes, but you are the kind of girl who tries to. Despite what you say, we have all seen the policy document, suggesting that your party should move its position. Presumably, you are the person who is engaged in trying to move it.

Come what may, this motion is about the desecration of the Welsh countryside, and about alternative sources of renewable energy. It is nothing like what was presented by the Minister, as if we are somehow

gweld bod ymrwymiad i ffynonellau ynni adnewyddadwy eraill. Gadewch inni ystyried datblygu'r rheini; ni wnaed dim ynghylch y rheini. Gofynnwch i chi eich hun a ydym yn helpu swyddi yng Nghymru, o gofio'r cwmnïau sy'n adeiladu'r ffermydd gwynt hyn. Nac ydym, yr ydym yn helpu swyddi yn Nenmarc ac yn Sbaen yn bennaf—nid swyddi yng Nghymru.

Yr wyf wedi bod yn gyson ynghylch y mater hwn ac ni allai neb ddweud fel arall. Yr wyf yn erbyn y ffermydd gwynt uchel hyn sydd ar raddfa fawr. Cofiaf fynd i arddangosfa yng Nghefn Croes gyda Lisa Francis. Nid oedd y pleidiau eraill yno, felly mae'n eithaf posibl bod Plaid Cymru'n newid rhywfaint ar eu safiad. Er gwaethaf yr hyn a ddywedodd, gwnaeth Helen Mary Jones sioe eithaf da o geisio symud y blaid ychydig i gyfeiriad synnwyr cyffredin, ond nid yn ddigon pell, fe gredaf.

Helen Mary Jones: A wnewch ildio?

Nick Bourne: Gwnaf, ar yr amod na wnewch ddifetha'r pwl hwn o synnwyr cyffredin.

Helen Mary Jones: Nid yw'n fwriad gennyf o gwbl ddifetha'r pwl o synnwyr cyffredin, ond fe'ch cywiraf—nid ydym wedi newid ein safbwynt. Yr ydym wastad wedi dweud bod yn rhaid hybu technoleg ffermydd gwynt, lle y mae'n cael ei gefnogi, lle y mae'n gweithio er budd y gymuned a lle nad yw'n rhy niweidiol i'r amgylchedd naturiol. Nid yw hyn yn wahanol i'r hyd yr oeddem yn ei ddweud bum neu 10 mlynedd yn ôl. Gwyddoch ein bod wedi beirniadu TAN 8, felly dewch yn eich blaen, Nick, nid y math o ferch sy'n gwamalu ydwyf a dylech wybod hynny erbyn hyn.

Nick Bourne: Ie, ond yr ydych y math o ferch sy'n ceisio gwneud hynny. Er gwaethaf yr hyn a ddywedwch, yr ydym oll wedi gweld y ddogfen bolisi, sy'n awgrymu y dylai eich plaid newid ei safbwynt. Yr wyf yn cymryd mai chi yw'r un sy'n wrthi'n ceisio ei newid.

Doed a ddêl, mae'r cynnig hwn yn ymwneud â halogi cefn gwlad Cymru, ac â ffynonellau amgen o ynni adnewyddadwy. Nid yw'n ddim byd tebyg i'r hyn a gyflwynwyd gan y Gweinidog, fel pe baem rywsut yn

ignoring all other sources of renewable energy and favouring the nuclear option. That seems to be the Prime Minister's stance today in Brighton, so let us get that straight.

We are looking at other renewable sources. We are very much against the transfer of large-scale energy projects, which has taken far too long. Again, that is in the Minister's in-tray gathering dust; it has been there for at least four years. That is why the Minister who decided about Cefn Croes was a Scottish Minister who came down to Carmarthen on a day return ticket, went nowhere near Cefn Croes, decided that that was where the windfarm should go and got back on the train to London. It is a disgrace and it is about time the Minister cleared it up, because it has taken far too long. There has been no satisfactory reason why that is the case. Again, I suspect that that is also the reason why we cannot get at those minutes. I urge people to support this common-sense motion and let us have some sense in our energy policy in Wales.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I remind Members that, if amendment 1 is passed, amendment 2 will fall.

anwybyddu'r holl ffynonellau ynni adnewyddadwy eraill ac yn ffafrio'r opsiwn niwclear. Ymddengys mai hynny yw safbwynt Prif Weinidog Prydain heddiw yn Brighton, felly gadewch inni ddeall hynny.

Yr ydym yn edrych ar ffynonellau adnewyddadwy eraill. Yr ydym yn daer yn erbyn trosglwyddo prosiectau ynni ar raddfa fawr, sydd wedi cymryd llawer gormod o amser. Unwaith eto, mae hyn ym masged 'gwaith-i'w-wneud' y Gweinidog yn hel llwch; mae yno ers o leiaf bedair blynedd. Dyna pam mai Gweinidog o'r Alban a ddaeth i lawr i Gaerfyrddin ar docyn dychwelyd undydd, heb fynd ar gyfyl Cefn Croes, penderfynu mai dyna lle y dylai'r fferm wynt fod a mynd yn ôl ar y trêen i Lundain, oedd y Gweinidog a benderfynodd ynghylch Cefn Croes. Mae'n warthus ac mae'n hen bryd i'r Gweinidog ddelio â hyn, oherwydd y mae wedi cymryd gormod o amser o lawer. Ni chafwyd dim rheswm digonol pam mai felly y mae. Unwaith eto, amheuf mai dyna yw'r rheswm hefyd pam na allwn weld y cofnodion hynny. Anogaf bobl i gefnogi'r cynnig hwn sy'n synnwyr cyffredin a gadewch inni gael rhyw gymaint o synnwyr yn ein polisi ynni yng Nghymru.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Atgoffaf yr Aelodau, os derbynir gwelliant 1, y bydd gwelliant 2 yn methu.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 6, Ymatal 9, Yn erbyn 40.
Amendment 1: For 6, Abstain 9, Against 40.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
German, Michael
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina

Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Brynle

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Jocelyn
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wood, Leanne

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.

5.00 p.m.

Gwelliant 2: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 39.
Amendment 2: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 39.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, Jocelyn
German, Michael
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina

Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 27, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
 Amendment 3: For 27, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Law, Peter
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 27, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
 Amendment 4: For 27, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM2567): O blaid 11, Ymatal 10, Yn erbyn 34.
Motion (NDM2567): For 11, Abstain 10, Against 34.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Francis, Lisa
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Laura Anne
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy

Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
 The following Members abstained:

Davies, Jocelyn
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Law, Peter
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.
 Motion defeated.*

Dadl o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 31: Glendid Ysbytai Debate under Standing Order No. 31: Hospital Cleanliness

Val Lloyd: I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order No. 31.1, supports in principle legislation to:

require all NHS trusts in Wales to identify a senior director who will have responsibility for hospital cleanliness, and to place the following statutory obligations on the director so identified:

a) to report, on a quarterly basis to the full trust board, during the public part of that trust board's agenda;

b) to provide this same report on a quarterly basis, to the community health councils that serve that trust. (NDM2535)

My reason for proposing this motion is to enable the public to have full and focused information about the cleanliness of its hospitals. My postbag has reflected the rise in public interest and concern regarding this issue, as, no doubt, has yours. Patient care is my primary concern. We all want to make

Val Lloyd: Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 31.1, yn cefnogi, mewn egwyddor, ddeddfwriaeth a fydd:

yn ei gwneud hi'n ofynnol ar bob ymddiriedolaeth GIG yng Nghymru enwi uwch gyfarwyddwr/wraig i fod yn gyfrifol am lendid ysbytai, a gosod yr ymrwymiad statudol canlynol ar y cyfarwyddwr/wraig a enwir felly:

a) i adrodd, ar sail chwarterol, i fwrdd llawn y bwrdd, yn ystod rhan gyhoeddus agenda bwrdd yr ymddiriedolaeth honno;

b) i gyflwyno'r un adroddiad, ar sail chwarterol, i'r cynghorau iechyd cymuned sy'n gwasanaethu'r ymddiriedolaeth honno. (NDM2535)

Fy rheswm dros wneud y cynnig hwn yw fel bod gan y cyhoedd wybodaeth lawn a chlir ynghylch glendid eu hysbytai. Mae nifer y llythyrau yr wyf yn eu cael wedi adlewyrchu'r cynnydd mewn diddordeb a phryder cyhoeddus am y mater hwn, fel y mae eich llythyrau chithau yn ddiamau. Gofal

sure that our constituents have the best quality of care, and this needs to be delivered in a fresh, clean environment. A Wales-wide public consultation, commissioned by the Welsh Assembly Government, and undertaken jointly by the board of community health councils and the Welsh Institute for Health and Social Care, has recently been completed. The outcome of that consultation led me to propose today's motion. It is clear that the public wants better information regarding the causes of healthcare-associated infections. It also wants to know what part it can play in reducing the spread of infection, and, more importantly, what NHS trusts are doing to reduce infections, and what progress they have achieved in that regard.

An important element of the challenge of reassuring patients is the delivery of key information to them about healthcare-associated infections and how they can play their personal role in keeping infection to a minimum, in conjunction with the other actions taken by trusts.

As my motion outlines, the appointment of a senior director within each local trust to undertake these roles would be a positive step forward, and build on the progress to date. For the first time, the three elements of infection control—in which Wales has a strong record—hospital cleanliness, and public information and guidance, would be brought together in a coherent and holistic approach.

Before I elaborate on the role of the director, I want to touch on the causes of healthcare-associated infections. They are not particular to Wales, but are a serious global problem. Many such infections are caused by drug-resistant bacteria, which have been a problem for the last six to seven decades. I was amazed to read that penicillin resistance was described soon after penicillin became available. The promotion of best practice in prevention and control by healthcare workers is essential. Such infection control is a top priority and it is important that staff, patients and visitors are all kept aware of their personal responsibility.

am gleifion yw'r hyn sydd o'r pwys mwyaf i mi. Yr ydym i gyd eisiau gwneud yn siŵr bod ein hetholwyr yn derbyn y gofal gorau, a rhaid darparu hyn mewn amgylchedd glân a ffres. Yn ddiweddar, cwblhawyd ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus Cymru gyfan, wedi'i gomisiynu gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, ac wedi'i gyflawni ar y cyd gan fwrdd y cynghorau iechyd cymuned a Sefydliad Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol Cymru. Canlyniad yr ymgynghoriad hwnnw sydd wedi peri imi gynnig y cynnig hwn heddiw. Mae'n glir bod y cyhoedd eisiau gwybodaeth well am achosion heintiau sy'n gysylltiedig â gofal iechyd. Mae hefyd eisiau gwybod pa ran y gall ei chwarae o ran atal haint rhag ymledu, ac, yn anad dim, beth y mae ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG yn ei wneud i leihau heintiau, a pha gynnydd a wnaed ganddynt yn y cyswllt hwnnw.

Elfen bwysig o'r her i dawelu meddyliau cleifion yw darparu gwybodaeth allweddol iddynt am heintiau sy'n gysylltiedig â gofal iechyd, a sut y medrant wneud eu rhan yn bersonol i atal haint, ar y cyd â'r gweithredoedd eraill a gyflawnir gan yr ymddiriedolaethau.

Fel yr amlinellir yn fy nghynnig, byddai penodi uwch gyfarwyddwr ym mhob ymddiriedolaeth leol i gyflawni'r rolau hyn yn gam cadarnhaol ymlaen, ac yn adeiladu ar y cynnydd a wnaed hyd yma. Am y tro cyntaf, byddai'r tair elfen sydd ynghlwm wrth reoli haint—lle y mae gan Gymru record dda—glendid ysbytai, a gwybodaeth a chanllawiau i'r cyhoedd, yn cael eu dwyn ynghyd mewn dull cydlynol a holistig.

Cyn imi ymhelaethu ar rôl y cyfarwyddwr, hoffwn sôn am achosion heintiau sy'n gysylltiedig â gofal iechyd. Nid ydynt yn unigryw i Gymru, maent yn broblem fyd-eang ddifrifol. Achosir llawer o heintiau o'r fath gan facteria sy'n gallu gwrthsefyll cyffuriau, ac sy'n broblem bellach ers chwech neu saith degawd. Synnais ddarllen bod y gallu i wrthsefyll penisilin wedi ei ganfod yn fuan ar ôl i benisilin ddod ar gael. Mae hyrwyddo'r arferion gorau o ran atal a rheoli gan weithwyr gofal iechyd yn hanfodol. Mae rheolaeth haint o'r fath yn flaenoriaeth uchel iawn ac mae'n bwysig bod y staff, y cleifion ac ymwelwyr i gyd yn

gyson ymwybodol o'u cyfrifoldebau personol.

It is intuitive that a clean, fresh environment makes us feel better, and, in the context of healthcare facilities, it is essential for the health and wellbeing of staff and visitors alike. Patients expect wards to be clean, and have every right to do so. Effective cleaning is vital to maintain a healthy and safe environment, as having a clean hospital limits the risk of infection and contributes to the quality of care for patients.

Mae'n beth cynhenid ynom fod amgylchedd glân a ffres yn gwneud inni deimlo'n well, ac, yng nghyd-destun cyfleusterau gofal iechyd, mae'n hanfodol i iechyd a lles y staff a'r ymwelwyr fel ei gilydd. Mae cleifion yn disgwyl i wardiau fod yn lân, ac mae ganddynt bob hawl i ddisgwyl hynny. Mae glanhau'n effeithiol yn eithriadol bwysig i gynnal amgylchedd iach a diogel, fel y mae ysbytai glân yn lleihau'r perygl o haint ac yn cyfrannu at ansawdd y gofal i gleifion.

We now have national standards of cleanliness developed by a multi-disciplinary group, which included infection control specialists. These standards are to be applied in all NHS trust premises in Wales in which patient services are delivered. However, I fear that difficulties are faced by cleaning staff: there are often too few of them, and, as a result, they are spread too thinly. I would like to see cleaning specifications that acknowledge the role of cleaning staff, and the need for sufficient cleaning staff to do the work necessary to maintain the required standards, and even better, as far as I am concerned, the need to have them as an integral part of the ward team, with all the sense of ownership and responsibility that brings.

Mae gennym bellach safonau cenedlaethol ar gyfer glendid sydd wedi eu datblygu gan grŵp aml-ddisgyblaeth, a oedd yn cynnwys arbenigwyr rheoli haint. Dylid rhoi'r safonau hyn ar waith ym mhob adeilad sydd gan ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG yng Nghymru lle y darperir gwasanaethau i gleifion. Er hynny, mae arnaf ofn bod staff glanhau yn wynebu anawsterau: yn aml iawn, nid oes digon ohonynt, ac, o ganlyniad, maent yn cael eu gwasgaru yn rhy denau. Hoffwn weld manylebau glanhau sy'n cydnabod rôl staff glanhau, ac yn cydnabod bod angen digon o staff glanhau i wneud y gwaith sy'n ofynnol i gynnal y safonau sy'n angenrheidiol, ac yn well fyth, o'm rhan i, fod angen iddynt fod yn rhan annatod o dîm y ward, gyda'r holl ymdeimlad o berchnogaeth a chyfrifoldeb a ddaw yn sgîl hynny.

Earlier, I spoke of public perception and the need for focused knowledge. Examples of questions asked by those participating in the Wales-wide consultation included: 'How can you reassure people that everything is being done to protect ourselves and our families?', 'Is there anything that we can do to protect ourselves and families?' That gives quite a potent flavour of the response. Clearly, there is a demand for knowledge. People have a right to know the facts about the situation in their trusts, and that is at the heart of my motion.

Yn gynharach, soniais am ganfyddiad y cyhoedd a bod angen gwybodaeth sydd â ffocws. Yr oedd y cwestiynau a ofynnwyd gan rai a gymerodd ran yn yr ymgynghoriad drwy Gymru gyfan yn cynnwys, er enghraifft: 'Sut y gallwch dawelu meddyliau pobl fod popeth yn cael ei wneud i'n gwarchod ni a'n teuluoedd?', 'A oes unrhyw beth y gallwn ni ei wneud i warchod ein hunain a'n teuluoedd?'. Mae hynny'n rhoi blas eithaf cryf o'r ymateb. Yn amlwg, mae galw am wybodaeth. Mae gan bobl hawl i wybod y ffeithiau am y sefyllfa yn eu hymddiriedolaethau, a hynny sydd wrth wraidd fy nghynnig.

My motion asks for all NHS trusts to appoint a senior director who will have responsibility for hospital cleanliness. My view is that it should be a non-executive director, who

Mae fy nghynnig yn gofyn i bob ymddiriedolaeth GIG benodi uwch gyfarwyddwr i fod yn gyfrifol am lendid ysbytai. Yn fy marn i, dylai fod yn

would lead board activity on the issue.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: For clarification, how is what is proposed in your motion different from the current situation? Following the Audit Committee report, we had a Government of Wales response, laid on 27 January 2004, which stated that each trust should nominate a director to be responsible for hospital cleanliness, and that he or she should report on a regular basis.

Val Lloyd: Yes, but it did not specify that that person should be a trust board member. I am looking for a non-executive director, as many of those people have good communication skills and are linked with the community. I think that that person can do the job and be a bridge to the community health councils. I will go on to explain that later.

Having that person as a trust board member would send a signal to the local population that this issue is being taken seriously. The appointment of such an advocate would show that it is high on the trust's continuing agenda. I am aware that many trusts may already have reporting mechanisms in place, but my motion is intended to move that from the level of being desirable to being essential, by making it a statutory duty.

The nominated director will lead board activity and ensure that there is full engagement with the issue. By requiring that the nominated director reports to the trust board and the community health council, I am seeking to build a bridge between the health community and the wider public. Community health councils are the independent voice of those who use the health services, and listen to what the public has to say about the quality of health services. Their members also have an inspection role, and visit services and talk to staff and patients. Therefore, they are well placed to act as a bridge to the public. The report should be full, clear and useful. It should cover information on healthcare-associated infections and targets, identify

gyfarwyddwr anweithredol, a fyddai'n arwain gweithgarwch y bwrdd ar y mater.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Er mwyn deall yn glir, sut y mae'r hyn a gynigir yn eich cynnig yn wahanol i'r sefyllfa bresennol? Yn dilyn adroddiad y Pwyllgor Archwilio, cawsom ymateb gan Lywodraeth Cymru, a gyflwynwyd ar 27 Ionawr 2004, a ddywedodd y dylai pob ymddiriedolaeth enwebu cyfarwyddwr i fod yn gyfrifol am lendid ysbytai, ac y dylai ef neu hi adrodd yn rheolaidd.

Val Lloyd: Ie, ond nid oedd yn nodi'n benodol y dylai'r unigolyn hwnnw fod yn aelod o fwrdd yr ymddiriedolaeth. Chwilio'r wyf am gyfarwyddwr anweithredol, gan fod gan nifer o'r bobl hynny sgiliau cyfathrebu da a chyswllt gyda'r gymuned. Credaf y gallai hwnnw wneud y gwaith a bod yn bont i'r cynghorau iechyd cymuned. Byddaf yn esbonio hynny yn nes ymlaen.

Byddai cael yr unigolyn hwnnw fel aelod o fwrdd yr ymddiriedolaeth yn cyfleu i'r boblogaeth leol fod y mater yn cael ei gymryd o ddifrif. Byddai penodi eiriolwr o'r fath yn dangos ei fod yn uchel ar agenda barhaus yr ymddiriedolaeth. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod gan lawer o ymddiriedolaethau fecanweithiau adrodd ar waith eisoes, efallai, ond bwriad fy nghynnig yw newid hynny o fod yn ddymunol i fod yn hanfodol, drwy ei wneud yn ddyletswydd statudol.

Bydd y cyfarwyddwr enwebedig yn arwain gweithgarwch y bwrdd ac yn sicrhau bod ymgysylltu'n llawn â'r mater yn digwydd. Drwy ofyn i'r cyfarwyddwr enwebedig adrodd i fwrdd yr ymddiriedolaeth ac i'r cyngor iechyd cymuned, yr wyf yn ceisio creu pont rhwng y gymuned iechyd a'r cyhoedd yn ehangach. Cynghorau iechyd cymuned yw llais annibynnol y rhai sy'n defnyddio'r gwasanaethau iechyd, ac maent yn gwrando ar yr hyn sydd gan y cyhoedd i'w ddweud am ansawdd gwasanaethau iechyd. Mae gan eu haelodau rôl arolygu hefyd, ac maent yn ymweld â gwasanaethau a siarad â staff a chleifion. Felly, maent mewn sefyllfa dda i fod yn bont i'r cyhoedd. Dylai'r adroddiad fod yn llawn, yn glir ac yn ddefnyddiol. Dylai gynnwys gwybodaeth am

areas for improvement, and, importantly, be written in plain, understandable language in order to make it accessible to as wide a range of people as possible.

To conclude, we should always be looking for ways to improve the delivery of services and to make our healthcare facilities the best that they can be for patients who rely on them. I see the development of this new role as bringing together the important aspects of fighting infection, that is, the business of making our hospitals cleaner places, and as providing the public with a local advocate and champion, and with all the information that people need about their hospital's record in fighting infection.

5.10 p.m.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): The Assembly Government welcomes this debate and the proposal for secondary legislation. It is vital that patients, staff and other hospital users should be able to work and receive care in an environment which is clean and hygienic, and in which risks are minimised. It is equally important that patients and the public see that this is happening. There are occasions when a lack of attention to cleanliness can undermine the confidence of patients and the public when other measures are being addressed. I therefore see this proposal from my colleague, Val Lloyd, as an important confidence-building exercise. Given that Val has considerable frontline clinical and teaching experience, there are few in the Assembly better placed to make this proposal.

The cleaning of hospitals, patient hygiene and clinical infection control are all interwoven, and should be addressed in a cohesive and integrated way. That is the approach that we have taken in Wales, which this proposed secondary legislation would underpin.

In the standards and guidance that we have already issued to date we require that trusts have a nominated executive director for hospital cleanliness, and that role has been

heintiau a thargedau sy'n gysylltiedig â gofal iechyd, nodi pa feysydd sydd angen eu gwella, a dylai fod mewn iaith syml, ddealladwy, mae hynny'n bwysig, fel bod ystod mor eang â phosibl o bobl yn gallu ei ddarllen.

I gloi, dylem fod yn chwilio drwy'r amser am ffyrdd o wella'r modd y mae gwasanaethau'n cael eu darparu ac o wneud ein cyfleusterau gofal iechyd y rhai gorau posibl i gleifion sy'n dibynnu arnynt. Yr wyf yn gweld datblygiad y rôl newydd hon fel modd i ddwyn ynghyd yr holl agweddau pwysig ar ymladd haint, hynny yw, y dasg o wneud ein hysbytai yn lanach, ac fel modd i ddarparu eiriolwr lleol i'r cyhoedd, ac i ddarparu'r holl wybodaeth y mae ar bobl ei hangen am record eu hysbyty o ran ymladd haint.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn croesawu'r ddatl hon a'r cynnig ar gyfer is-ddeddfwriaeth. Mae'n hanfodol bod y cleifion, y staff a defnyddwyr eraill yr ysbyty yn gallu gweithio a derbyn gofal mewn amgylchedd sy'n lân a glanwaith, a lle y gwneir pob ymdrech i leihau peryglon. Mae yr un mor bwysig bod cleifion a'r cyhoedd yn gweld bod hyn yn digwydd. Ceir adegau pryd y mae'r diffyg sylw i lendid yn gallu tanseilio hyder cleifion a'r cyhoedd, pan fydd sylw'n cael ei roi i fesurau eraill. Felly, yr wyf yn gweld y cynnig hwn gan fy nghyd-Aelod, Val Lloyd, fel ymarferiad pwysig o ran meithrin hyder. O gofio bod gan Val brofiad sylweddol o ran gweithio'n glinigol ac addysgu yn y rheng flaen, ychydig iawn yn y Cynulliad sydd mewn sefyllfa well i wneud y cynnig hwn.

Mae glanhau ysbytai, hylendid cleifion, a rheoli haint clinigol i gyd yn gysylltiedig â'i gilydd, a dylid rhoi sylw iddynt mewn dull cydlynol ac integredig. Hwnnw yw'r dull yr ydym wedi ei ddewis yng Nghymru, a byddai'r is-ddeddfwriaeth arfaethedig hon yn cadarnhau hynny.

Yn y safonau a'r canllawiau yr ydym eisoes wedi eu cyhoeddi hyd yma, yr ydym yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol bod gan ymddiriedolaethau gyfarwyddwr gweithredol

well described in the guidance. CHCs are involved in trust multi-disciplinary teams, and the control of infection teams are fully involved in everything from environmental cleaning to the clinical care of patients.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: You stated that it is required that trusts have an executive director responsible for cleanliness. I understood from what Val said that the situation was that it is desirable to have such an appointment at present, but you are telling us is that it is already a requirement. Therefore, how will this proposal strengthen the situation? I understand the point that Val is making about public communication, but how would it strengthen the situation in terms of monitoring cleanliness?

Brian Gibbons: I will come to that. Compared to other parts of the United Kingdom, our record is good, but there is still concern, and we need to address this concern and demonstrate that we are taking action. I agree that we should take this further, and ensure that patients, via their community health councils, can be guaranteed a voice. We must ensure that patients' views are heard within trusts at the highest level, and that feedback is given. The Government fully supports the view that there is a greater need for CHCs to be involved in this area. A nominated non-executive trust director will be seen to be acting as a patient's advocate and champion on the trust boards in a clear and decisive way.

I propose to incorporate a more explicit role for CHCs and non-executive directors to network on these issues across Wales, and I will be aiming to ensure that CHCs obtain regular feedback on the issues raised. I will be underlining the need for a greater sharing of information, which will include performance data, identifying areas for improvement, cleaning plans, targets for improvement and full, clear and useful information for patients on healthcare-associated infections and how they may convey their concerns.

enwebedig yn gyfrifol am lendid ysbytai, ac mae'r rôl honno wedi ei disgrifio'n dda yn y canllawiau. Mae cynghorau iechyd cymuned yn rhan o dimau aml-ddisgyblaeth yr ymddiriedolaethau, ac mae gan y timau rheoli haint rôl lawn ym mhopeth, o lanhau amgylcheddol i ddarparu gofal clinigol i gleifion.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Dywedasoch ei bod yn ofynnol i ymddiriedolaethau benodi cyfarwyddwr gweithredol i fod yn gyfrifol am lendid. Fel y deallais yn ôl yr hyn a ddywedodd Val, y sefyllfa bresennol yw mai dymunol yn unig yw penodiad o'r fath, ond yr hyn yr ydych yn ei ddweud yw bod hyn eisoes yn rheidrwydd. Felly, sut y bydd y cynnig hwn yn cryfhau'r sefyllfa? Deallaf y pwynt y mae Val yn ei wneud ynghylch cysylltu â'r cyhoedd, ond sut y byddai'n cryfhau'r sefyllfa o ran monitro glendid?

Brian Gibbons: Dof yn ôl at hynny. O'i chymharu â rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig, mae gan Gymru record dda, ond mae pryder o hyd, a rhaid inni roi sylw i'r pryder hwn a dangos ein bod yn gwneud rhywbeth yn ei gylch. Cytunaf y dylem fynd â hyn ymhellach, a sicrhau bod gan gleifion lais, drwy eu cynghorau iechyd cymuned. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod barn cleifion yn cael ei chlywed yn yr ymddiriedolaethau ar y lefel uchaf, ac y rhoddir adborth. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn cefnogi'n llawn y farn bod angen i gynghorau iechyd cymuned gael mwy o rôl yn y cyswllt hwn. Bydd cyfarwyddwr ymddiriedolaeth anweithredol yn cael ei weld fel eiriolwr dros gleifion ar fyrddau'r ymddiriedolaethau, mewn modd clir a phendant.

Bwriadaf ymgorffori rôl fwy eglur i'r cynghorau iechyd cymuned a chyfarwyddwr anweithredol o ran rhwydweithio ar y materion hyn ledled Cymru, a byddaf yn ceisio sicrhau bod y cynghorau iechyd cymuned yn cael adborth rheolaidd ar y materion a godir. Byddaf yn pwysleisio bod angen mwy o rannu gwybodaeth, a fydd yn cynnwys data perfformiad, nodi meysydd lle y mae angen gwella, cynlluniau glanhau, targedau ar gyfer gwella ynghyd â gwybodaeth lawn, glir a defnyddiol i gleifion am heintiau sy'n gysylltiedig â gofal iechyd a sut y gallant gyfleu eu pryderon.

Overall responsibility and accountability for all activity in trusts, including hygiene, cleaning, and prevention and control of healthcare-associated infections, lies with the chief executive and the board. The proposed secondary legislation will not affect this, but will ensure that patients and other hospital users have an effective route to the trust board in order to voice their concerns and receive information.

As I have said, these proposals are very welcome, and the Welsh Assembly Government is keen to take them away and to present, in due course, concrete proposals on how we can move this important agenda forward.

Catherine Thomas: I would like to take this opportunity, in the brief time I am allowed, to thank Val for putting forward this very important proposal. Healthcare-associated infections are an issue that the Welsh Assembly Government has taken extremely seriously, with support from all the Welsh NHS trusts. I take this opportunity to acknowledge the work that NHS staff are doing to combat infections in our hospital in Llanelli. I was pleased to support and attend the clean hands campaign, which was launched at Llanelli's Prince Phillip Hospital by Carmarthenshire NHS Trust, and, after that launch, to welcome other NHS trusts in their support.

A reduction in levels of infection is one of the key actions of Health Challenge Wales, which is supported by this Government. These initiatives, together with Val's important proposal, demonstrate how committed the Government is to improving the health of Wales's people, through its approach to tackling this issue, which could potentially impact on us all.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Diolchaf i Val Lloyd am ddod â'r cynnig hwn ger ein bron. Fel y bydd hi a'r Gweinidog eisoes wedi casglu, mae gennyf rai cwestiynau ynglŷn â gwerth gwneud hyn. Wedi dweud hynny, fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn ceisio rhwystro hyn rhag digwydd—mae'n gam y dylid ei ystyried yn fanylach.

Mae'r cyfrifoldeb a'r atebolrwydd cyffredinol am holl weithgarwch yr ymddiriedolaeth, gan gynnwys hylendid, glanhau, ac atal a rheoli heintiau sy'n gysylltiedig â gofal iechyd, gan y prif weithredwr a'r bwrdd. Ni fydd yr is-ddeddfwriaeth arfaethedig yn effeithio ar hyn, ond bydd yn sicrhau bod gan gleifion a defnyddwyr eraill yr ysbyty lwybr effeithiol at fwrdd yr ymddiriedolaeth i leisio eu pryderon ac i dderbyn gwybodaeth.

Fel y dywedais, mae'r cynigion hyn i'w croesawu'n fawr iawn, ac mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn awyddus i weithio ymhellach arnynt a chyflwyno, maes o law, gynigion pendant ar sut y gallwn symud yr agenda bwysig hon ymlaen.

Catherine Thomas: Hoffwn achub ar y cyfle hwn, yn yr amser byr a roddir imi, i ddiolch i Val am gyflwyno'r cynnig hynod bwysig hwn. Mae heintiau sy'n gysylltiedig â gofal iechyd yn fater y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi'i gymryd o ddifrif, gyda chefnogaeth yr holl ymddiriedolaethau GIG yng Nghymru. Cymeraf y cyfle hwn i gydnabod y gwaith y mae staff y GIG yn ei wneud i ymladd heintiau yn ein hysbyty yn Llanelli. Yr oeddwn yn falch o gael cefnogi a mynychu'r ymgyrch dwylo glân a lansiwyd yn Ysbyty'r Tywysog Phillip gan Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Sir Gaerfyrddin, ac ar ôl y lansio, croesawu cefnogaeth ymddiriedolaethau eraill y GIG.

Mae gostyngiad yn lefelau heintiau yn un o gamau allweddol Her Iechyd Cymru, sy'n cael ei gefnogi gan y Llywodraeth hon. Mae'r mentrau hyn, ynghyd â chynnig pwysig Val, yn arwydd o ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth i wella iechyd pobl Cymru, drwy ei dull o fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn, a allai effeithio ar bob un ohonom.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I thank Val Lloyd for proposing this motion. As she and the Minister will have already concluded, I have some questions on the value of these proposals. However, having said that, I am not trying to stop this from happening—it is a move that we should consider in more detail.

Mae'r Gweinidog eisoes wedi dweud wrthym fod y cyfrifoldeb, yn y pen draw, yn gorwedd gyda phrif weithredwyr yr ymddiriedolaethau, a bod cyfarwyddwyr eisoes wedi eu penodi ym mhob ymddiriedolaeth i ofalu am hyn. Nid yw'n glir o hyd i mi sut y byddai derbyn y cynnig hwn yn cryfhau'r sefyllfa, ac eithrio sefyllfa cyfathrebu gyda'r cyhoedd. Derbyniaf fod hynny'n bwysig, ac, o ran ymddiriedolaeth y cyhoedd, mae'n bwysig bod y negeseuon hyn yn cael eu cyflwyno'n glir. Tybiaf mai dyna yw bwriad Val gyda'r cynnig hwn.

Hoffwn ein gweld yn mynd ymhellach na hynny, gan edrych yn fanwl ar y sefyllfa yn ysbytai Cymru o ran glanweithdra. Mae canfyddiad yn broblem, ac mae glanweithdra yn broblem real. Gwyddom am y problemau a all godi. Buaswn yn dadlau bod eisiau edrych ar system y cytundebau eto. Yr wyf yn anhapus â sefyllfa lle mae cytundebau yn cael eu cynnig am y pris isaf yn aml. Mae hynny'n creu sefyllfa lle nad glanweithdra yw'r flaenoriaeth ond natur gosteffeithiol y system lanhau. Yn y sefyllfa bresennol, buaswn am ein gweld yn edrych yn fanwl ar y system honno.

Buaswn am gael mwy o eglurhad ynglŷn â sut yn union y bydd hyn yn gweithio. Mae'r Gweinidog eisoes wedi dweud na fydd yn effeithio ar gyfrifoldeb y prif weithredwyr yn y pen draw. Felly, a yw hyn ddim ond yn ffordd o gyfathrebu neges i'r cyhoedd? Gallaf weld gwerth hynny, ond buaswn yn gobeithio y byddai'n mynd lawer ymhellach na hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn hapus i roi cefnogaeth, hyd yn oed os yw'n gefnogaeth amodol ar hyn o bryd, i'r hyn y mae Val yn ei gynnig, a gwerthfawrogaf yn fawr ei bod wedi cyflwyno hyn ger ein bron.

Jenny Randerson: I thank Val for bringing forward this motion. The Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome and support the principle laid out in the motion. However, I have some questions about the proposal as set out by Val. My questions relate to the concept of a non-executive director. My information on this is based on my recent visit to the director of infection, prevention and control at Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust. His message was clear. First, he said that he

The Minister has already told us that the responsibility, in the end, lies with the chief executives of the trusts, and that directors have already been appointed in each trust to deal with this. I am still not sure how supporting this motion would improve the situation, with the exception of public communication. I accept that that is important, and, in terms of the public's trust, it is important that these messages are clearly conveyed. I believe that that is Val's intention in this motion.

I would like for us to go further than that, and look in detail at the situation in terms of the cleanliness in hospitals in Wales. The real problem is not only perception, but the level of cleanliness itself. We know about the problems that can arise. I would argue that we need to look at the contract regime again. I am unhappy with a system where those contracts are often awarded for the lowest price. That creates a situation where cleanliness is not the priority, but rather the cost-effectiveness of the cleaning system. Under the circumstance, I would like to see us looking in detail at that system.

I would like more clarification on how exactly this will operate. The Minister has already told us that it will not affect the responsibility of the chief executives. Therefore, is this anything more than a means of communicating a message to the public? I can see the value in that, but I would hope that it would go much further than that. However, I am happy to give my support, even if it is conditional support at present, to what Val proposes, and I appreciate her bringing this motion before us today.

Jenny Randerson: Diolchaf i Val am gyflwyno'r cynnig hwn. Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n croesawu ac yn cefnogi'r egwyddor a geir yn y cynnig. Fodd bynnag, mae gennyf rai cwestiynau ynghylch y cynnig fel mae wedi ei amlinellu gan Val. Mae fy nghwestiynau'n ymwneud â'r cysyniad o gyfarwyddwr anweithredol. Mae fy ngwybodaeth yn seiliedig ar fy ymweliad diweddar â'r cyfarwyddwr heintiau, atal a rheoli yn Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r

was the only such director—and he is not a non-executive director, as it is his daily job—in Wales, and that this needed replicating elsewhere. He also pointed out that it is only by having someone at a high level—and I strongly agree with these sentiments—with the clout to ensure a change of attitude and to implement trust-wide practices, that such a change can be achieved.

5.20 p.m.

It has to be someone whose sole day-to-day responsibility is the control of infection, and who has the power, the influence and the budget to carry this out. He said that the message had to go to the heart of management. Even simple things such as the provision of the most effective alcohol gel at each bedside only works across a whole trust if you have the power from the centre. He also emphasised the importance of the training of all staff in things as simple as hand washing to the kind of preventative behaviour that might not occur to people, such as the need to change a person's drip on a regular basis and for that person to be taken off that drip as soon as possible in order to prevent infection. The message is that many of us carry MRSA, and, as visitors to hospitals, we take it in with us. It does not affect us because we are healthy, but it affects open wounds. Many of us remember the criticism of Michael Howard, at the time of the general election, who, out of politeness, shook hands with people in a hospital, potentially transferring infection from one person to another. The director also said that one of the things that people in hospitals have to do is to stop shaking hands.

The First Minister: Very briefly, I was pleased recently when someone stopped me from shaking hands with someone. It is an instinct as a 'VIP' to shake hands with everyone wherever you go. I was told not to do it and to immediately wash my hands with alcohol rub, and I felt deeply gratified by that response, which taught me a valuable lesson.

Fro. Yr oedd ei neges yn un bendant. Yn gyntaf, dywedodd mai ef oedd yr unig gyfarwyddwr o'r fath—ac nid cyfarwyddwr anweithredol ydyw, gan mai dyna yw ei swydd bob dydd—yng Nghymru, a bod angen ailadrodd hyn mewn ardaloedd eraill. Dywedodd mai dim ond drwy gael rhywun ar lefel uchel—ac yr wyf yn cytuno'n gryf â'r safbwynt hwn—gyda'r dylanwad i sicrhau newid mewn agwedd ac i weithredu arferion ar draws yr ymddiriedolaethau cyfan, y gellir cyflawni newid o'r fath.

Rhaid iddo fod yn rhywun nad yw'n gyfrifol am ddim byd o ddydd i ddydd ond rheoli heintiau, ac sydd â'r pŵer, y dylanwad a'r gyllideb i gyflawni hyn. Dywedodd fod rhaid i'r neges hon gyrraedd y rheolwyr. Ni fydd hyd yn oed pethau bach syml fel darparu'r gel alcohol mwyaf effeithiol wrth erchwyn pob gwely'n gweithio ar draws yr ymddiriedolaeth gyfan oni bai fod gennych y pŵer o'r canol. Pwysleisiodd hefyd bwysigrwydd hyfforddi pob aelod o staff mewn pethau syml fel golchi dwylo a'r math o ymddygiad ataliol na fyddai pobl o bosibl yn meddwl amdano, fel yr angen i newid diferwyr yn rheolaidd ac i roi'r gorau i ddefnyddio'r diferwyr cyn gynted â phosibl er mwyn lleihau'r siawns o heintiau. Y neges yw bod llawer ohonom yn cario MRSA, ac, wrth ymweld ag ysbytai, yr ydym yn mynd ag ef gyda ni. Nid yw'n cael effaith arnom ni gan ein bod yn iach, ond mae'n effeithio ar glwyfau agored. Mae llawer ohonom yn cofio Michael Howard yn cael ei feirniadu ar y pryd, adeg yr etholiad cyffredinol, pan fu, o ran cwrteisi, yn ysgwyd llaw â phobl mewn ysbyty, gan gynyddu'r perygl o drosglwyddo haint rhwng pobl. Dywedodd y cyfarwyddwr hefyd mai un o'r pethau y bydd rhaid i bobl rhoi'r gorau i'w wneud mewn ysbytai yw ysgwyd llaw.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn fyr iawn, yr oeddwn yn falch yn ddiweddar pan ddywedodd rhywun wrthyf am beidio ag ysgwyd llaw â rhywun arall. Mae'n rhywbeth greddfoll i rywun sy'n 'VIP' ysgwyd llaw â phawb lle bynnag yr ydych yn mynd. Dywedwyd wrthyf am beidio ac am olchi fy nwylo ar unwaith gyda rhwbiwr alcohol, ac yr oeddwn yn ddiolchgar iawn am yr ymateb hwnnw, a

ddysgodd wers werthfawr imi.

Jenny Randerson: This year's strategy for the University Hospital of Wales includes communication not just with the community health councils, but with the local health boards, and I would like the Minister to take that on board.

Jenny Randerson: Mae'r strategaeth ar gyfer Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru eleni yn cynnwys cysylltu nid yn unig gyda'r cynghorau iechyd cymuned, ond gyda'r byrddau iechyd lleol, a hoffwn pe bai'r Gweinidog yn rhoi sylw i hynny.

Brian Gibbons: The whole point of Val Lloyd's proposals is to ensure that the public point of view is represented by a public champion at the highest possible level in a trust. While there is an officer in Cardiff, there is a clear lead on infection in every trust in Wales. It is important that everybody understands that there are people, usually medical doctors, who have clear responsibility for leading on infection, and that the chief executives and others are very much part of the team in ensuring that we tackle this particular scourge. The fact that there is no director along the Cardiff lines in the other trusts does not mean that those trusts do not have a rigorous system in place.

Brian Gibbons: Holl bwrpas cynigion Val Lloyd yw sicrhau bod safbwynt y cyhoedd yn cael ei gynrychioli gan eiriolwr cyhoeddus ar y lefel uchaf posibl mewn ymddiriedolaeth. Er bod swyddog yng Nghaerdydd, ceir arweiniad eglur ar heintiau ym mhob ymddiriedolaeth yng Nghymru. Mae'n bwysig bod pawb yn deall bod pobl ar gael, meddygon fel arfer, sydd â chyfrifoldeb penodol dros arwain ar heintiau, a bod y prif weithredwyr ac eraill yn rhan anhepgor o'r tîm sy'n sicrhau ein bod yn mynd i'r afael â'r felltith benodol hon. Nid yw'r ffaith nad oes cyfarwyddwr tebyg i'r un a geir yng Nghaerdydd mewn ymddiriedolaethau eraill yn golygu nad oes gan yr ymddiriedolaethau hynny system drwyadl mewn grym.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Before you resume, Jenny, I remind you that the Business Committee's agreement states that these speeches must be short.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Cyn i chi aildechrau, Jenny, hoffwn eich atgoffa bod cytundeb y Pwyllgor Busnes yn datgan bod rhaid i'r areithiau hyn fod yn rhai byr.

Jenny Randerson: I will conclude and reply to the Minister by saying that my point is that the member of staff must be at director level, which is why we agree with this motion. Finally, the other message is that training costs money, as do other things such as MRSA screening of high-risk patients and those coming in for implant surgery. This kind of measure alone is excellent, but it will not do the job without the funding to back it up.

Jenny Randerson: Yr wyf am gloi ac ateb y Gweinidog drwy ddweud mai fy mhwynt yw bod rhaid i'r aelod hwnnw o'r staff fod ar lefel cyfarwyddwr, a dyna pam yr ydym yn cytuno â'r cynnig hwn. Yn olaf, y neges arall yw bod hyfforddiant yn costio arian, yn yr un modd â phethau eraill megis sgrinio am MRSA mewn cleifion risg uchel a'r rhai sy'n mynd i'r ysbyty i gael llawfeddygaeth mewnblannu. Mae'r math hwn o fesur ohono'i hun yn rhagorol, ond ni wnaiff gyrraedd y nod heb yr arian yn gefn iddo.

Jonathan Morgan: We will support this motion. As Assembly Members, but also as health service users, we are all concerned about the levels of cleanliness in our hospitals, and I am sure that, as Members, we have all had to deal with constituents who have some very real concerns about the levels of cleanliness, particularly in our acute hospitals. I welcome the proposal that a director at trust level will have that

Jonathan Morgan: Byddwn yn cefnogi'r cynnig hwn. Fel Aelodau'r Cynulliad, ond hefyd fel defnyddwyr y gwasanaeth iechyd, yr ydym i gyd yn bryderus ynghylch lefelau glanweithdra yn ein hysbytai, ac yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod, fel Aelodau, i gyd wedi gorfod delio ag etholwyr sydd â phryderon gwirioneddol iawn ynglŷn â lefelau glanweithdra, yn enwedig yn ein hysbytai aciwt. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r cynnig y bydd

responsibility, and, regardless of what happens at present in Cardiff, or in any other trust, it is having that level of consistency across Wales that is important. It is also important to be able to communicate with members of the public and colleagues on trust boards about particular problems relating to cleanliness in a trust area. I am pleased that a report will be published on the levels of cleanliness in hospitals, on, hopefully, the levels of infection and the way in which resources are being used to tackle that infection, and on whether staff have appropriate training and are aware of how to combat infection and of what their roles and responsibilities are.

I say to Val and the Government that it is the day-to-day management of cleanliness in hospital wards, and not just the current routine of ward cleaning, that is important. I have dealt with too many cases where constituents have real concerns about dirty beds and equipment and patients being left in unacceptable conditions on hospital wards. These are not issues relating to the cleaning that happens at the end of the day by an outside contractor. This is about the way in which a ward and the cleanliness of that ward are managed by the nursing staff.

On too many occasions, I have heard from members of community health councils who have done spot checks and found that the way in which wards are managed is not to a suitable standard, and, in some cases, that put a sharp focus on patient safety. In other cases, patients have been put at risk. Whatever happens at the end of this process and whatever proposals the Government comes back with, I hope that this will lead to a greater focus on patient safety and a greater allocation of resources to treating infections and to keeping hospitals clean. At the end of the day, unless we ensure that cleanliness is a top priority, many people in Wales will simply lack confidence in our nursing staff and will not have the confidence to go to hospital if that were necessary.

cyfarwyddwr ar lefel ymddiriedolaeth yn derbyn y cyfrifoldeb hwnnw, a, beth bynnag sy'n digwydd yng Nghaerdydd ar hyn o bryd, neu mewn unrhyw ymddiriedolaeth arall, y peth pwysig yw sicrhau'r lefel honno o gysondeb ar draws Cymru. Mae'n bwysig hefyd gallu cyfathrebu â'r cyhoedd a chydweithwyr ar fyrddau ymddiriedolaethau ynglŷn â phroblemau penodol yn ymwneud â glanweithdra o fewn ardal yr ymddiriedolaethau. Yr wyf yn falch y bydd adroddiad yn cael ei gyhoeddi ar lefelau glanweithdra mewn ysbytai, ar lefelau haint, gobeithio, a sut y mae adnoddau'n cael eu defnyddio i fynd i'r afael â'r haint hwnnw, ac a yw'r staff yn derbyn hyfforddiant priodol ac a ydynt yn gwybod sut i fynd i'r afael â heintiau a beth yn union yw eu rolau a'u cyfrifoldebau.

Dywedaf wrth Val a'r Llywodraeth mai rheoli glanweithdra o ddydd i ddydd mewn wardiau ysbytai, ac nid dim ond y drefn bresennol o lanhau wardiau, sy'n bwysig. Yr wyf wedi delio â gormod o achosion lle y mae gan etholwyr bryderon gwirioneddol ynglŷn â gwelyau ac offer budr a chleifion yn cael eu gadael mewn amgylchiadau annerbyniol ar wardiau ysbytai. Nid oes a wnelo'r materion hyn ddim â'r gwaith glanhau sy'n cael ei wneud gan contractwr allanol ar ddiwedd pob diwrnod. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â'r ffordd y mae ward a glanweithdra'r ward honno'n cael eu rheoli gan y staff nyrsio.

Yr wyf, yn rhy aml, wedi clywed gan aelodau cynghorau iechyd cymuned sydd wedi cynnal archwiliadau dirybudd mewn ysbytai ac wedi canfod nad yw'r ffordd y mae wardiau'n cael eu rheoli'n cyrraedd safon dderbyniol, ac, mewn rhai achosion, yr oedd hynny'n rhoi cryn ffocws ar ddiogelwch y cleifion. Mewn achosion eraill, mae cleifion wedi bod mewn perygl. Beth bynnag a ddigwydd ar ddiwedd y broses hon a beth bynnag fydd cynigion y Llywodraeth yn y pen draw, gobeithiaf y bydd hyn yn arwain at fwy o bwyslais ar ddiogelwch y cleifion ac y bydd mwy o adnoddau ar gael i drin heintiau ac i gadw ysbytai'n lân. Yn y diwedd, os na allwn sicrhau bod glanweithdra'n brif flaenoriaeth, bydd llawer o bobl yng Nghymru'n colli ffydd yn ein staff nyrsio ac ni fydd ganddynt ddigon o hyder i fynd i'r ysbyty pe bai

gwneud hynny.

Val Lloyd: I thank Members for their valuable contributions and for the consensual spirit of the debate. We all share the same objective, which is to provide Welsh patients with a healthcare system in which the quality of care is the best that it can possibly be. Giving the public better information as to what their local trusts are doing to combat infection is an element of that.

Val Lloyd: Diolchaf i'r Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau gwerthfawr ac am yr ysbryd o gonsensws yn ystod y ddadl. Mae'r un nod gan bawb ohonom, sef darparu system gofal iechyd i gleifion Cymru lle y mae safon y gofal mor uchel ag y gall fod. Mae rhoi gwell gwybodaeth i'r cyhoedd ynglŷn â'r hyn y mae eu hymddiriedolaethau lleol yn ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â heintiau yn elfen bwysig o hynny.

Minister, thank you for your kind personal words, and even more so for your broad acceptance of my proposals; that was appreciated. Rhodri, I am delighted to say that I share your views about cleaning contracts. I think that I touched on this in my opening remarks, and it is nice to have an area of agreement with you. Jenny, I agree with you on the importance of a non-executive director, which is why I stressed it. There is no intention to take away from the professional responsibility, but the intention is to focus it on one person at a high level and bring the information together. Jonathan, I agree with you that there is a need for ward-based cleaning staff, as was the case in my earlier career.

Weinidog, diolch i chi am eich geiriau caredig, ac yn fwy fyth am dderbyn fy nghynigion yn gyffredinol; yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi hynny. Rhodri, yr wyf yn falch o gael dweud fy mod yn cyd-fynd â chi ynghylch contractau glanhau. Credaf fy mod wedi crybwyll hyn yn fy sylwadau agoriadol, ac mae'n braf cael maes lle yr wyf yn cytuno â chi. Jenny, cytunaf â chi ynglŷn â phwysigrwydd cyfarwyddwr anweithredol, a dyna pam y rhoddais bwyslais ar hynny. Nid yw'n fwriad mynd â'r cyfrifoldeb proffesiynol oddi ar neb, y bwriad yn hytrach yw ei ganolbwyntio ar un unigolyn ar lefel uchel a dwyn y wybodaeth ynghyd. Jonathan, cytunaf â chi fod angen staff glanhau yn seiliedig ar y wardiau, fel oedd yn digwydd yn fy ngyrfa flaenorol.

By providing patients with more clarity about hospital-acquired infections and appointing a local advocate as a source of public information, patients will be able to play their part in minimising the spread of infection. The role of the advocate will certainly be challenging, but also innovative. It is important that the Assembly takes the lead in engaging with the new nominated directors in terms of training and guidance. Each director, of course, will develop his or her own way of working, but this will essentially be responsive to local circumstances.

Drwy roi rhagor o eglurder i gleifion ynghylch yr heintiau a geir yn yr ysbyty a phenodi eiriolwr lleol fel ffynhonnell gwybodaeth i'r cyhoedd, bydd cleifion yn gallu cyfrannu at yr ymdrechion i leihau lledaeniad heintiau. Bydd rôl yr eiriolwyr yn sicr yn un anodd, ond bydd hefyd yn un arloesol. Mae'n bwysig i'r Cynulliad arwain wrth ymgysylltu â'r cyfarwyddwyr enwebedig newydd o ran hyfforddiant a chanllawiau. Bydd pob cyfarwyddwr, wrth gwrs, yn datblygu ei ffordd ei hun o weithio, ond yn y bôn bydd yn ymateb i amgylchiadau lleol.

To conclude, patients are at the centre of this proposal. It is a well-informed public that leads to better understanding of, and thus an improved quality of healthcare. On that basis, I ask you to support the motion.

I gloi, mae'r cleifion yn ganolog i'r cynnig hwn. Bydd cyhoedd sy'n wybodus yn arwain at well dealltwriaeth o ofal iechyd, a thrwy hynny ceir gofal iechyd o safon uwch. Ar sail hynny, gofynnaf ichi gefnogi'r cynnig.

*Cynnig (NDM2535): O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2535): For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â
concludes business for this afternoon. chyarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.30 p.m.
The meeting ended at 5.30 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)

Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Law, Peter (Annibynnol – Independent)
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
 Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)