



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru**  
**(Cofnod y Trafodion)**

**The National Assembly for Wales**  
**(The Record of Proceedings)**

**Dydd Mercher, 6 Gorffennaf 2005**  
**Wednesday, 6 July 2005**

## Cynnwys Contents

Ethol y Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Ysgolion Election to the Committee on School Funding.....	3
Cwestiynau ar Lywodraeth Leol i'r Gweinidog Cyllid Questions on Local Government to the Finance Minister .....	4
Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes Questions to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning.....	18
Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order .....	34
Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau o dan Ddeddf Ombwdsmon Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus (Cymru) 2005 i'r Prif Weinidog Delegation of Functions under the Public Services Ombudsman (Wales) Act 2005 to the First Minister .....	36
Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Addysg Uwch 2004 (Cychwyn Rhif 2 a Darpariaeth Drosiannol) (Cymru) 2005 Approve the Higher Education Act 2004 (Commencement No. 2 and Transitional Provisions) (Wales) Order 2005 .....	38
Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Ffioedd mewn Sefydliadau Addysg Uwch (Cymru) 2005 Approval of the Fees in Higher Education Institutions (Wales) Regulations 2005.....	43
Diwygiad dros dro i'r Rheolau Sefydlog er mwyn Caniatáu Dirprwyon ar gyfer y Pwyllgor ar y Papur Gwyn—Trefn Lywodraethu Well i Gymru Temporary Revision to Standing Orders to allow Substitutions to the Committee on the Better Governance for Wales White Paper .....	48
Adroddiad Blynnyddol y Prif Weinidog 2004-05 The First Minister's Annual Report 2004-05 .....	49
Dadl Fer: Anghenion Addysgol Arbennig Short Debate: Special Educational Needs .....	94

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadaid.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

**Ethol y Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Ysgolion  
Election to the Committee on School Funding**

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiaf fod

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 8.4, yn ethol yr Aelodau canlynol i'r Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Ysgolion:*

*Denise Idris Jones, Lynne Neagle, Janet Ryder, William Graham, a Peter Black.*

*Bydd y pwyllgor yn ethol ei gadeirydd ei hun. (NDM2527)*

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 8.4, elects the following Members to the Committee on School Funding:*

*Denise Idris Jones, Lynne Neagle, Janet Ryder, William Graham, and Peter Black.*

*The committee shall elect its own chair. (NDM2527)*

*Cynnig (NDM2527): O blaid 31, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 1.  
Motion (NDM2527): For 31, Abstain 0, Against 1.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hutt, Jane  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Neagle, Lynne  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelod canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Member voted against:

Idris Jones, Denise

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Cwestiynau ar Lywodraeth Leol i'r Gweinidog Cyllid**  
**Questions on Local Government to the Finance Minister**

**Dangosyddion Perfformiad Craidd ar gyfer Llywodraeth Leol**  
**Core Performance Indicators for Local Government**

**C1 Alun Ffred Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar gynnydd parthed paratoi dangosyddion perfformiad craidd ar gyfer llywodraeth leol? OAQ0311(LGP)

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** Core indicator sets will continue to be developed by reference groups during 2005, with the aim of having more complete core sets in place for April 2006. I will ensure that cross-cutting issues, such as equalities, Welsh language and sustainable development, are considered by the reference groups.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Cawsom drafodaeth ddoe at 'Iaith Pawb', a chlywyd newyddion da. Er bod dau ddangosydd statudol wedi cael eu mabwysiadu, nid oes un dangosydd craidd yn ymwneud â'r iaith Gymraeg, felly mae'n amhosibl monitro cynnydd llywodraeth leol yn y maes hwn yn 2005-06. A oes grŵp cyfeirio wedi cyfarfod i drafod dangosyddion craidd ynglŷn â'r Gymraeg, ac a fydd dangosyddion craidd yn ymwneud â'r Gymraeg ar gael erbyn 2006-07?

**Sue Essex:** The reference group met, I think, in June. It is my intention to have the indicators in place by April 2006. I understand Alun Ffred's concern about this, and he has raised this point in many committee meetings as well as in yesterday's debate on 'Iaith Pawb'. With the Welsh Language Board's support through the reference group and through its participation in other reference groups, as well as having core indicators on the language, we will be looking to disaggregate some of the other indicators to see if we can get a complete picture across the board.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** The development of core data sets is not yet as advanced as some of your proposals for changing the plans. While your proposals seek to reduce bureaucracy for authorities,

**Q1 Alun Ffred Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on progress in preparing core performance indicators for local government? OAQ0311(LGP)

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Bydd setiau dangosyddion craidd yn parhau i gael eu datblygu gan grwpiau cyfeirio yn ystod 2005, gyda'r nod o gael setiau craidd mwy cyflawn ar waith ar gyfer mis Ebrill 2006. Byddaf yn sicrhau bod y grwpiau cyfeirio yn ystyried materion trawsbynciol, megis cydraddoldebau, yr iaith Gymraeg a datblygu cynaliadwy.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** We had a debate yesterday on 'Iaith Pawb', and we heard some good news. Even though two statutory indicators have been adopted, none of the core indicators relate to the Welsh language, so it will not be possible to monitor the progress of local government in this regard in 2005-06. Has a reference group met to discuss core indicators in relation to the Welsh language, and will core indicators on the language be in place by 2006-07?

**Sue Essex:** Cyfarfu'r grŵp cyfeirio ym mis Mehefin, mi gredaf. Bwriadaf sicrhau bod dangosyddion ar waith erbyn mis Ebrill 2006. Deallaf bryder Alun Ffred ynglŷn â hyn, ac mae wedi codi'r pwyt hwn mewn llawer cyfarfod o'r pwylgor yn ogystal ag yn y ddadl ddoe ar 'Iaith Pawb'. Gyda chefnogaeth Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg drwy'r grŵp cyfeirio a thrwy ei gyfranogiad mewn grwpiau cyfeirio eraill, yn ogystal â chael dangosyddion craidd o ran yr iaith, bwriadwn ddadgyfuno rhai o'r dangosyddion eraill i weld a allwn gael darlun cyflawn yn gyffredinol.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Nid oes cymaint o waith wedi'i wneud i ddatblygu setiau data craidd â'r gwaith ar rai o'ch cynigion i newid y cynlluniau. Er bod eich cynigion yn ceisio lleihau biwrocratiaeth

there was some concern during consultation on this matter that the core indicators might go in the other direction and might somehow increase. This would mean giving with the one hand and taking with the other. Are you still committed to seeing the burden reduced, because, if so, this is just as much an element of the burden as the other indicators and plans that you are seeking to produce?

**Sue Essex:** That is a fair point. Rationalisation of plans has taken place, and that is part of the total performance framework. To remind you, the statutory strategic indicators amount to 22. So, that was a substantial reduction. We must get the right balance to make sure that we cover all the areas that need to be covered—and that is relevant to Alun Ffred's point—without merely having a plethora of indicators that are collected for the sake of it and not used in the way that we want. We must be mindful to get the balance right, and ensure that it is sufficient to do the job without being an excessive burden, as you pointed out.

**Michael German:** Almost counterintuitively I ask you about sustainable development, because this is an area for which you would expect to find core data. Given that it spans so much of local government activity, you could almost imagine the data becoming a burgeoning collection in their own right. Have you given any consideration to how information on progress against performance as regards sustainable development will be collected by local authorities?

**Sue Essex:** We have specific indicators on sustainable development, and that is part of the action plan. However, as you rightly suggest, other areas are perhaps not so obvious. It is pretty obvious for the environmental aspect, because you have indicators on biodiversity and so on. You have things like local biodiversity action plans that will pick that up. On matters such as carbon dioxide emissions and other perhaps less obvious areas, we will have to make sure that the information is collected in a way that does not duplicate the process for

i awdurdodau, mynegwyd rhywfaint o bryder yn ystod yr ymgynghori ar y mater hwn y gallai'r dangosyddion craidd fynd i'r cyfeiriad arall ac y gallent gynyddu rywsut. Byddai hynny'n golygu rhoi â'r naill llaw a chymryd â'r llall. A ydych yn dal wedi ymrwymo i isio lleihau'r baich, oherwydd os felly, mae hyn yn golygu cymaint o faich â'r dangosyddion eraill a'r cynlluniau yr ydych yn ceisio eu cynhyrchu?

**Sue Essex:** Mae hwnnw'n bwynt teg. Mae'r cynlluniau wedi'u symleiddio, ac mae hynny'n rhan o'r fframwaith perfomio cyfan. I'ch atgoffa, mae yna ddangosyddion strategol statudol. Felly, yr oedd hynny'n ostyngiad sylweddol. Rhaid inni sicrhau'r cydbwysedd cywir er mwyn gwneud yn siŵr ein bod yn cwmpasu'r holl feysydd y mae angen eu cwmpasu—ac mae hynny'n berthnasol i bwynt Alun Ffred—heb gael llu o ddangosyddion a gesglir dim ond er mwyn eu casglu, ac na chânt eu defnyddio yn y ffordd yr ydym am iddynt gael eu defnyddio. Rhaid inni sicrhau'r cydbwysedd cywir, a sicrhau ei fod yn ddigonol i wneud yn gwaith heb fod yn faich gormodol, fel y nodwyd gennych.

**Michael German:** Bron yn groes i'm greddf, gofynnaf ichi ynghylch datblygu cynaliadwy, am fod hwn yn faes na fyddch yn disgwyl cael data craidd ar ei gyfer. O gofio ei fod yn rhychwantu cymaint o weithgarwch llywodraeth leol, galleg bron ddychmygu y byddai'r data yn dod yn gasgliad cynyddol ynddo'i hun. A ydych wedi rhoi unrhyw ystyriaeth i'r ffordd y caiff gwybodaeth am gynnydd yn erbyn perfformiad o ran datblygu cynaliadwy ei chasglu gan awdurdodau lleol?

**Sue Essex:** Mae dangosyddion penodol gennym o ran datblygu cynaliadwy, ac mae hynny'n rhan o'r cynllun gweithredu. Fodd bynnag, fel yr awgrymwch, a hynny'n briodol, efallai nad yw meysydd eraill mor amlwg. Mae'n amlwg iawn ar gyfer yr agwedd amgylcheddol, am fod yna ddangosyddion ar fioamrywiaeth ac ati. Mae pethau fel cynlluniau gweithredu bioamrywiaeth lleol ar gael a fydd yn ymdrin â hynny. O ran materion megis carbon deuocsid sy'n cael ei ryddhau a meysydd eraill sy'n llai amlwg, efallai, bydd yn rhaid

our core indicators. It is highly complex; that is why it takes time. It is important that, when we produce the full set, everyone feels comfortable with it, particularly those who have to collect the information. If it is not meaningful for them, or becomes too burdensome, I suspect that some of those things will slip, and that is not what we want to happen.

To pick up on what I said to Alun Ffred, sustainable development, along with equality and the language, are cross-cutting issues that will have to be considered across a range of indicators in order for us to get the complete picture.

inni sicrhau y caiff y wybodaeth ei chasglu mewn ffordd nad yw'n dyblygu'r broses ar gyfer ein dangosyddion craidd. Mae'n gymhleth iawn; dyna pam mae'n cymryd amser. Mae'n bwysig, pan gynhyrchwn y set lawn, fod pawb yn fodlon arni, yn enwedig y rhai sy'n gorfol casglu'r wybodaeth. Os nad yw'n ystyrlon iddynt, neu os yw'n rhy feichus, yr wyf yn tybied na chaiff rhai o'r pethau hynny eu gwneud, ac nid ydym am i hynny ddigwydd.

I barhau â'r hyn a ddywedais wrth Alun Ffred, mae datblygu cynaliadwy, yn ogystal â chydreddoldeb a'r iaith, yn faterion trawsbynciol y bydd yn rhaid eu hystyried ar draws amrywiaeth o ddangosyddion er mwyn inni gael y darlun cyflawn.

### **Y Fformiwlw Grant Cymorth Refeniw The Revenue Support Grant Formula**

**Q2 Owen John Thomas:** What discussion has the Minister had with Cardiff County Council about provision within the revenue support grant formula to take account of the capital city hosting major events? OAQ0303(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** I met representatives of Cardiff council when this year's local government finance settlement was being prepared. We discussed a range of issues, including the particular needs of Cardiff.

**Owen John Thomas:** Have you had any discussions at all with the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport to ensure that the Millennium Stadium is used to hold some of the sporting events of the Olympic games, now that they are coming to London?

**Sue Essex:** I know that there has been considerable discussion between the Minister and Cardiff council and across the board, so preparation in terms of what might be needed has been going on. That is very much within his portfolio; I am aware of what has been discussed, but he has the particular details on that.

**Jonathan Morgan:** One of the major events this year—or it should be a major event—is

**C2 Owen John Thomas:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael gyda Chyngor Sir Caerdydd ynglŷn â darpariaeth o fewn y fformiwlw grant cymorth refeniw i ystyried yffaith fod digwyddiadau mawr yn cael eu cynnal yn y brifddinas? OAQ0303(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Cefais gyfarfod â chynrychiolwyr cyngor Caerdydd pan oedd setliad cyllid llywodraeth leol eleni yn cael ei baratoi. Buom yn trafod amrywiaeth o faterion, gan gynnwys anghenion penodol Caerdydd.

**Owen John Thomas:** A gawsoch unrhyw drafodaethau o gwbl gyda'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon i sicrhau y bydd Stadiwm y Mileniwm yn cael ei ddefnyddio i gynnal rhai o ddigwyddiadau chwaraeon y gemau Olympaidd, gan eu bod i ddod i Lundain?

**Sue Essex:** Gwn fod llawer o drafodaethau wedi'u cynnal rhwng y Gweinidog a chyngor Caerdydd ac yn gyffredinol, ac felly mae gwaith paratoi wedi ei wneud o ran yr hyn y gallai fod ei angen. Mae hynny'n rhan amlwg o'i bortffolio; yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r hyn sydd wedi'i drafod, ond ganddo ef mae'r manylion penodol.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Un o'r prif ddigwyddiadau eleni—neu dylai fod yn un

the centenary of Cardiff's becoming a city, and 50 years of its being the capital city of Wales. There has been some dispute over the past few months between the Assembly Government and the leader of Cardiff council as to how much support the Assembly Government will provide for celebrating those two major events. Will you, with the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport, ensure that the events planned in Cardiff will go ahead, and that you will do all that you can to provide the necessary resources to Cardiff to make this year a special year for the residents of the city, and for people throughout Wales?

o'r prif ddigwyddiadau—yw canmlwyddiant Caerdydd fel dinas, a 50 mlynedd ers ei gwneud yn brifddinas Cymru. Bu rhywfaint o anghydfod yn ystod yr ychydig fisoedd diwethaf rhwng Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ac arweinydd cyngor Caerdydd ynglŷn â faint o gymorth y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei ddarparu i ddathlu'r ddau ddigwyddiad pwysig hynny. A wnewch chi, ar y cyd â'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon, sicrhau y bydd y digwyddiadau sydd wedi'u cynllunio yng Nghaerdydd yn mynd rhagddynt, ac y byddwch yn gwneud popeth a allwch i ddarparu'r adnoddau angenrheidiol i Gaerdydd i sicrhau y bydd hon yn flwyddyn arbennig i drigolion y ddinas, ac i bobl ledled Cymru?

**Sue Essex:** The events that you are probably referring to are the celebrations around the capital city. I presume that the other one may be the 'Wales remembers' event, which is taking place in Cooper's Field on Sunday. We have agreed to put £100,000 towards that. I know that there are ongoing discussions with the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport, but I am not party to those; they are between him and Cardiff council. However, I think that the Minister was awaiting a specified bid, or a certain amount of information, which has not been provided yet. Perhaps you can direct the question to him.

**Sue Essex:** Y digwyddiadau y cyfeiriwch atynt, mae'n siŵr, yw'r dathliadau o amgylch y brifddinas. Cymeraf mai digwyddiad 'Cymru'n cofio', a gynhelir yng Nghaeau Cooper ddydd Sul, yw'r digwyddiad arall. Yr ydym wedi cytuno i gyfrannu £100,000 at hynny. Gwn fod trafodaethau yn mynd rhagddynt gyda'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon, ond nid wyf yn rhan ohonynt; trafodaethau rhyngddo ef a chyngor Caerdydd ydynt. Fodd bynnag, credaf fod y Gweinidog yn aros am gais penodol, neu rywfaint o wybodaeth, nad yw eto wedi ei darparu. Efallai y gallwch ofyn y cwestiwn iddo ef.

**Jenny Randerson:** The news today about London winning the bid to host the Olympics is excellent, and Cardiff can look forward—with some confidence, I believe—to hosting many more major events as a result. In London, the police receive £217 million in additional support in recognition of London's role as a capital city. Cardiff fulfils that role in Wales. Last year, the cost of policing VIP and royal visits was £100,000 and the eight football matches had a net cost to the police of nearly £1.5 million. There are also significant extra costs for local government from major events. Do you not agree that, as a general principle, it is time that the additional cost to Cardiff was recognised, rather than it being dealt with on the piecemeal basis to which you referred just now, Minister? Will you agree to discuss the issue of policing, in particular, with both

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae'r newyddion heddiw fod Llundain wedi ennill y cais i gynnal y gemau Olympaidd yn ardderchog, a gall Caerdydd edrych ymlaen—gyda rywfaint o hyder, mi gredaf—at gynnal llawer mwy o ddigwyddiadau pwysig o ganlyniad i hynny. Yn Llundain, caiff yr heddlu £217 miliwn o gymorth ychwanegol i gydnabod rôl Llundain fel prifddinas. Mae Caerdydd yn cyflawni'r rôl honno yng Nghymru. Y llynedd, yr oedd y gost o blismona ymwelliadau gan aelodau'r teulu brenhinol ac ymwelwyr pwysig yn £100,000, ac yn sgîl yr wyth gêm bêl-droed yr oedd cost net i'r heddlu o bron £1.5 miliwn. Mae costau ychwanegol sylweddol i lywodraeth leol hefyd pan gynhelir digwyddiadau pwysig. Oni chytunwch, fel egwyddor gyffredinol, ei bod yn bryd cydnabod y gost ychwanegol i Gaerdydd, yn hytrach nag

your Welsh Assembly Government colleagues and ask them to talk to the relevant UK Government Ministers?

ymdrin â hi ar y sail ddarniog yr ydych newydd gyfeirio ati, Weinidog? A gytunwch i drafod plismona, yn benodol, gyda'ch cyd-Weinidogion yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a gofyn iddynt siarad â'r Gweinidogion perthnasol yn Llywodraeth y DU?

**Sue Essex:** There is an issue with policing, and I know that discussions are going on between Edwina Hart and Barbara Wilding. It is my understanding that the police get a sum of money through the Home Office.

**Sue Essex:** Mae plismona'n fater pwysig, a gwn fod trafodaethau yn mynd rhagddynt rhwng Edwina Hart a Barbara Wilding. Deallaf fod yr heddlu yn cael swm o arian drwy'r Swyddfa Gartref.

2.10 p.m.

There might be some dispute as to whether or not that is big enough. The other point is that they receive funding when the FA holds events here. They get paid for policing, just as football clubs pay for policing their events. The stadium needs to look again at some of its charges, because it might want to review that in light of experience. I understand where this is coming from, but we must be fair to all local authorities. When you look at some elements of the SSA funding, and taking into consideration visitor and extra refuse burdens, various streams are included. Many people would think that the underpinning of the Cardiff Harbour Authority was quite a substantial contribution to the wellbeing of the city.

Gall fod ychydig ddadlau a yw hynny'n ddigon. Y pwynt arall yw eu bod yn cael arian pan fydd y Gymdeithas Bêl-droed yn cynnal digwyddiadau yma. Cânt eu talu am blismona, yn union fel y bydd clybiau pêldroed yn talu am blismona eu digwyddiadau. Mae angen i'r stadiwm edrych eto ar rai o'i daliadau, oherwydd efallai y byddai am adolygu hynny yn sgil profiad. Deallaf y rheswm dros hyn, ond rhaid inni fod yn deg wrth bob awdurdod lleol. Pan edrychwrch ar rai elfennau yng nghyllid yr Asesiad o Wariant Sylfaenol, a chan ystyried beichiau o ran ymwelwyr a sbwriel ychwanegol, caiff amryw ffrydiau eu cynnwys. Byddai nifer o bobl o'r farn fod tanategu Awdurdod Harbwr Caerdydd wedi bod yn gyfraniad sylweddol at les y ddinas.

My final point is that the LABGI money—which is the dreadful name for the local authority business growth incentive grant, or the money that Gordon Brown sends via the Assembly to local authorities—recognises the kinds of burdens and benefits faced by places like Cardiff, as a growing city. It enables the city to get money back in a way that did not exist until this was introduced in the current financial year.

Fy mhwynt olaf yw'r ffaith fod yr arian LABGI—yr enw dychrynllyd am grant awdurdodau lleol i gymhell twf busnesau, neu'r arian y mae Gordon Brown yn ei anfon drwy'r Cynulliad i awdurdodau lleol—yn cydnabod y mathau o feichiau a'r buddiannau y mae lleoedd fel Caerdydd, fel dinas sy'n tyfu, yn eu hwynebu. Mae'n galluogi'r ddinas i gael arian yn ôl mewn ffordd nad oedd ar gael nes i hyn gael ei gyflwyno yn y flwyddyn ariannol gyfredol.

### Rôl Cyngorau Cymuned The Role of Community Councils

**Q3 David Melding:** Will the Minister make a statement on the role of community councils in South Wales Central? OAQ0336(LGP)

**C3 David Melding:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar rôl cyngorau cymuned yng Nghanol De Cymru? OAQ0336(LGP)

**Q10 David Melding:** Will the Minister make a statement on the role of community councils in Wales? OAQ0335(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Community and town councils enhance the local government system as a whole and provide important benefits to the communities that they serve. In the area that you represent, there are many effective community councils.

**David Melding:** For six years, we have been discussing ways in which community councils could do more, but we have still not quite got there. Do you think that one of the major obstacles is how funding is devolved to community councils for services that they could effectively deliver?

**Sue Essex:** Yes. The main source of funding for community councils is through the precept mechanism. There are some delegated arrangements that seem to work quite well, but we have agreed to look at the charter to try to ensure that those kinds of delegated arrangements come through more quickly and effectively than they did in the past. The one word of caution that I would add—as I have said before in the Chamber—is that not all community councils want to take this up. We must say that it is for those who want to take it up, and facilitate that, rather than put pressure on those that do not want to do so.

**Owen John Thomas:** I agree with David that community councils do great work, but they have limited powers. Those powers could be increased, as David said. Do you have any plans to improve funding for community councils?

**Sue Essex:** I thought that that was what David just asked. The Aberystwyth study, with which I am sure you are familiar, Owen John, sets out a range of recommendations, including some on finance and funding. It relates to the way that community councils operate. I intend to fund a research study on this. Quite a number of different, but interlinked, recommendations came out of the Aberystwyth study, and we all agreed

**C10 David Melding:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar rôl cynghorau cymuned yng Nghymru? OAQ0335(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Mae cynghorau cymuned a thref yn gwella'r system llywodraeth leol gyfan ac yn darparu buddiannau pwysig i'r cymunedau a wasanaethir ganddynt. Yn yr ardal a gynrychiolir gennych chi, mae yna nifer o gynghorau cymuned effeithiol.

**David Melding:** Ers chwe blynedd, buom yn trafod ffyrdd y gallai cynghorau cymuned wneud mwy, ond nid ydym wedi cyflawni hynny eto. A ydych yn credu mai un o'r prif rwystrau yw'r ffordd y caiff arian ei ddatganoli i gynghorau cymuned ar gyfer gwasanaethau y gallent eu darparu'n effeithiol?

**Sue Essex:** Ydwyt. Y brif ffynhonnell ariannu ar gyfer cynghorau cymuned yw'r dull praesept. Mae rhai trefniadau wedi eu dirprwyo sy'n ymddangos yn gweithio'n eithaf da. Ond yr ydym wedi cytuno i edrych ar y siarter i geisio sicrhau y caiff y mathau hynny o drefniadau wedi eu dirprwyo eu gweithredu'n gyflymach ac yn fwy effeithiol nag yn y gorffennol. Yr unig rybudd y byddwn yn ei roi—a dywedais hyn yn y Siambra o'r blaen—yw'r ffaith nad yw pob cyngor cymuned am ymgymryd â hyn. Rhaid inni ddweud bod hyn ar gael ar gyfer y rheini sydd am fanteisio arno, a hwyluso hynny, yn hytrach na rhoi pwysau ar y rheini nad ydynt am wneud hynny.

**Owen John Thomas:** Cytunaf â David fod cynghorau cymuned yn gwneud gwaith arbennig, ond mae eu pwerau'n gyfyngedig. Gellid cynyddu'r pwerau hynny, fel y dywedodd David. A oes gennych unrhyw gynlluniau i wella cyllid ar gyfer cynghorau cymuned?

**Sue Essex:** Yr oeddwn yn meddwl mai dyna'r hyn a ofynnodd David funud yn ôl. Mae astudiaeth Aberystwyth - ac yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn gyfarwydd â hi, Owen John -yn gosod allan ystod o argymhellion, gan gynnwys rhai ar gyllid ac ariannu. Mae'n ymwneud â'r ffordd y mae cynghorau cymuned yn gweithredu. Bwriadaf ariannu astudiaeth ymchwil ar hyn. Deilliodd cryn dipyn o argymhellion gwahanol, ond

that, in order to disentangle that, we needed a specific piece of research to give us some clear guidance on taking this forward.

cydgysylltiedig, o astudiaeth Aberystwyth, ac yr oedd pob un o honom yn cytuno, er mwyn ymdrin â hynny, fod angen darn penodol o ymchwil i roi canllawiau clir inni ynglŷn â gweithredu hyn.

### **Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus yn y Gogledd Public Services in North Wales**

**Q4 Janet Ryder:** Will the Minister make a statement on the provision of public services in north Wales? OAQ0312(LGP)

**Q5 Janet Ryder:** Will the Minister make a statement on the ability of local authorities to provide public services in north Wales? OAQ0299(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** We set out our vision for high-quality, responsive public services in ‘Making the Connections’. This means services being centred on people and the community, joining up and simplifying service delivery, and making the most of our resources. I am sure that you will recall that ‘Delivering the Connections’, our action plan, was launched on 14 June.

**Janet Ryder:** Much reference has been made to the fact that London will host the 2012 Olympic games. Local authorities provide many sporting facilities and, as an elected Member whose regional constituency stretches across the whole of north Wales and not confined to one small constituency, I am concerned to see the whole of north Wales benefiting from the Olympic bid. North Wales did not benefit very much from the Commonwealth games in Manchester. How will you work with north Wales councils to ensure that, through the tourism and leisure services that is on offer, the region will benefit greatly from London’s bid to host the Olympic games in 2012?

**Sue Essex:** All of Wales should benefit from this, and that is the goal that we have set our sights on. It gives us a wonderful opportunity to sell all the good aspects of Wales, so it is not just a matter of providing leisure facilities on the ground; we must promote

**C4 Janet Ryder:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng ngogledd Cymru? OAQ0312(LGP)

**C5 Janet Ryder:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar allu awdurdodau lleol i ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng ngogledd Cymru? OAQ0299(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Mae ein gweledigaeth ar gyfer gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ymatebol o safon uchel wedi ei gosod allan yn ‘Creu’r Cysylltiadau’. Golyga hyn fod gwasanaethau’n canolbwytio ar bobl a’r gymuned, cydgysylltu a symleiddio’r broses o ddarparu gwasanaethau, a manteisio i’r eithaf ar ein hadnoddau. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn cofio bod ‘Cyflawni’r Cysylltiadau’, ein cynllun gweithredu, wedi’i lansio ar 14 Mehefin.

**Janet Ryder:** Cyfeiriwyd yn helaeth at y ffaith y bydd Llundain yn cynnal gemau Olympaidd 2012. Mae awdurdodau lleol yn darparu nifer o gyfleusterau chwaraeon, ac fel Aelod etholedig â’m hetholaeth ranbarthol yn ymestyn ar draws y Gogledd yn gyfan ac nid yn gyfyngedig i un etholaeth fach, yr wyf yn awyddus i weld y Gogledd i gyd yn elwa o’r cais i gynnal y gemau Olympaidd. Ni chafodd y Gogledd ryw lawer o fantais o gemau’r Gymanwlad ym Manceinion. Sut y byddwch yn gweithio gyda chyngorau’r Gogledd i sicrhau, drwy’r gwasanaethau twristiaeth a hamdden a gynigir, y bydd y rhanbarth yn elwa’n sylweddol o gynnig Llundain i gynnal y gemau Olympaidd yn 2012?

**Sue Essex:** Dylai Cymru gyfan elwa o hyn, a dyna yw ein nod. Mae’n gyfle arbennig inni werthu’r holl agweddau da ar Gymru, felly, nid mater o ddarparu cyfleusterau hamdden ar lawr gwlad yn unig yw hyn; rhaid inni hyrwyddo Cymru drwy sicrhau bod digon o

Wales by ensuring that enough accommodation and information is available. We have a fairly long lead-in time, but it will require, as you suggested, a comprehensive approach between us and ancillary and other important outside bodies.

**Janet Ryder:** On another issue, the Licensing Act 2003 has required many forms to be reissued, which have been given to county councils solely through the medium of English. Conwy County Borough Council has translated those forms using its own resources, and I know that you have held it up as an example of good practice. What will you do in future to ensure that you provide councils across Wales with a common Welsh version of all forms, instead of councils having to use their own limited resources for translation?

**Sue Essex:** That form should have been provided in Welsh by the responsible ministry in London. We had this debate in committee, and I have written to Tessa Jowell on the matter. While stressing that we ask for forms to be done as quickly as possible, I appreciate what Conwy has done, and am grateful for it. On the back of that, we must remind English departments that, when schemes are jointly for Wales, the relevant literature must be available in the Welsh language.

**Brynle Williams:** I have received many letters from constituents in north Wales who are concerned about service cuts in the council. Will you and your Government fund local government adequately to provide effective public services that will meet the basic expectations of my constituents?

**Sue Essex:** I got a bit lost there, Brynle. You talked about north Wales and then you said ‘the council’, so I am not sure whether you were talking about a specific council.

**Brynle Williams:** Sorry, I meant north Wales councils.

**Sue Essex:** You will know that, over the

lety a gwybodaeth ar gael. Mae gennym grynnip o amser paratoi, ond fel yr awgrymec'h, bydd yn gofyn am ddull cynhwysfawr rhngom ni a chyrff ategol a chyrff allanol pwysig eraill.

**Janet Ryder:** Ar fater arall, mae Deddf Trwyddedu 2003 wedi ei gwneud yn ofynnol i nifer o ffurflenni gael eu hailddosbarthu, a dim ond drwy gyfrwng y Saesneg y rhoddyd y rhain i gynghorau cymuned. Mae Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy wedi cyfeithu'r ffurflenni hynny gan ddefnyddio'i adnoddau ei hun, a gwn eich bod wedi cyfeirio ato fel esiampl o arfer da. Beth a wnewch yn y dyfodol i sicrhau eich bod yn darparu fersiwn Cymraeg cyffredin o'r holl ffurflenni i gynghorau ledled Cymru, yn hytrach na bod cynghorau'm gorfol defnyddio'u hadnoddau prin eu hunain i'w cyfeithu?

**Sue Essex:** Dylai'r ffurflen honno fod wedi'i darparu yn Gymraeg gan y weinyddiaeth gyfrifol yn Llundain. Cawsom y ddadl hon yn y pwylgor, ac yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at Tessa Jowell ar y mater. Er imi bwysleisio ein bod yn gofyn i ffurflenni gael eu llunio cyn gynted â phosibl, gwerthfawrogaf yr hyn a wnaeth Conwy, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am hynny. Yn dilyn hynny, rhaid inni atgoffa adrannau yn Lloegr, pan fydd cynlluniau ar gyfer Cymru hefyd, fod yn rhaid i'r llenyddiaeth berthnasol fod ar gael yn Gymraeg.

**Brynle Williams:** Cefais nifer o lythyron gan etholwyr yn y Gogledd sy'n pryderu yngylch toriadau gwasanaeth yn y cyngor. A wnewch chi a'ch Llywodraeth ariannu llywodraeth leol yn ddigonol er mwyn darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus effeithiol a fydd yn bodloni disgwyliadau sylfaenol fy etholwyr?

**Sue Essex:** Yr wyf wedi drysu braidd, Brynle. Soniech am y Gogledd ac yna dywedasoch ‘y cyngor’. Felly, nid wyf yn siŵr a oeddech yn siarad am gyngor penodol.

**Brynle Williams:** Mae'n flin gennyf, cynghorau'r Gogledd yr oeddwn yn ei olygu.

**Sue Essex:** Fe wyddoch, dros y

years—certainly prior to your joining the Assembly, and since—we have seen major increases in the growth of the revenue support grant and other money going to local authorities. Local council members are elected, like you and me, and it is up to local authorities to make those decisions. I would not presume to do that for them. It is their job to manage their budgets.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Bu ichi ateb cwestiwn Janet ynghylch gemau Olympaidd Llundain—a llonyfarchwn Llundain am ennill y frwyd honno—ond byddwch yn ymwybodol ein bod ni yn Ynys Môn yn disgwyli ateb cadarnhaol, gobeithio, ar ein cais i gynnal Gemau'r Ynysoedd. Mae gemau eleni wedi dechrau yr wythnos hon yn ynysoedd Shetland. Os bydd Ynys Môn yn llwyddiannus—a hyderwn y bydd hi—bydd angen adnoddau sylweddol arnom i wella'r ddarpariaeth mewn canolfannau hamdden, er enghraifft. Gwn fod y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon wedi dangos ei gefnogaeth i'r fenter. A fedrwch chi gadarnhau y bydd y Llywodraeth yn edrych yn ffafriol ar unrhyw gais ariannol y bydd angen i'r cyngor ei wneud?

**Sue Essex:** I can confirm that I am in regular contact with Ynys Môn County Council. In fact, I met its representatives last week. They know that my door is always open and that my telephone is always ready to receive their calls, as and when needed.

**Ann Jones:** Minister, do you think that the ability of those who provide public services in north Wales is being hampered by the fact that acts of violence and anti-social behaviour are being committed against emergency service workers and those who deliver public services? What can you do, as Minister with responsibility for local government and public services, to assist the campaign led by the Fire Brigades Union to stamp out this violence?

**Sue Essex:** Thank you for mentioning what is a serious matter. It affects those who are trying to do their job, as well as those who

blynnyddoedd—yn sicr cyn ichi ymuno â'r Cynulliad, ac ers hynny—ein bod wedi gweld cynydd sylweddol yn nhwf y grant cynnal refeniw ac arian arall sy'n mynd i awdurdodau lleol. Caiff aelodau cynghorau lleol eu hethol, fel chi a fi, a chyfrifoldeb awdurdodau lleol yw gwneud y penderfyniadau hynny. Ni fyddwn yn mentro gwneud hynny ar eu rhan. Eu cyfrifoldeb hwy yw rheoli eu cyllebau.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** You answered Janet's question about the London Olympic games—and we congratulate London on winning that battle—but you will know that, in Anglesey, we are awaiting the positive outcome, we hope, of our bid to host the Island Games. This year's games commenced this week in the Shetland Isles. If Anglesey's bid is successful—and we are confident it will be—major resources will be needed to improve provision in leisure centres, for instance. I know that the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport has lent his support to the bid. Could you confirm whether the Government will look favourably on any request for finance which the council will need to make?

**Sue Essex:** Gallaf gadarnhau fy mod yn cysylltu'n rheolaidd â Chyngor Sir Ynys Môn. Yn wir, cefais gyfarfod â'i gynrychiolwyr yr wythnos diwethaf. Gwyddant fod fy nrws bob amser ar agor a'm bod bob amser yn barod i dderbyn eu galwadau ffôn, yn ôl yr angen.

**Ann Jones:** Weinidog, a gredwch fod gallu'r rhai sy'n darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn y Gogledd yn cael ei rwystro gan y ffaith fod gweithredoedd treisgar ac ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yn digwydd yn erbyn gweithwyr gwasanaethau brys a'r rheini sy'n darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus? Beth allwch ei wneud, fel Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am lywodraeth leol a gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, i gynorthwyo'r ymgyrch sy'n cael ei harwain gan Undeb y Brigadau Tân i ddileu'r traist hwn?

**Sue Essex:** Diolch ichi am grybwyl y mater difrifol hwn. Mae'n effeithio ar bobl sy'n ceisio gwneud eu gwaith yn ogystal â'r

attend accident and emergency departments with legitimate concerns, injuries and illnesses. We have seen some good models. For example, I know that, down here, the police have come in to support accident and emergency staff. That is the case in my local hospital. This helps to reassure patients and staff, and police can intervene if there are any unfortunate occurrences. From a wider perspective, we need to support public sector workers right across the board, and make the public realise that we all need these people at times, and we should treat them as our friends, not as the objects of the battering rams of our frustrations, which often happens.

2.20 p.m.

### **Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus yn Abertawe Public Services in Swansea**

**C6 David Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn Abertawe? OAQ0310(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** The Assembly's spending on local authority-delivered public services will have almost doubled in cash terms in the period between 1999-2000 and 2007-08. We are providing £250 million in unhypothecated funding to Swansea County Council for 2005-06 to assist in the provision of public services, and this represents an increase of 5.3 per cent from the 2004-05 base.

**David Lloyd:** Mae pryderon ynglŷn â gweinyddiaeth yr ymddiriedolaeth iechyd yn ogystal â dicter ynglŷn ag ad-drefnu'r ysgolion yn Abertawe. Fel y Gweinidog â chyfrifoldeb am wasanaethau cyhoeddus, beth ydych yn ei wneud i helpu i ddatrys y problemau hyn?

**Sue Essex:** I have the overall remit for public services, but, clearly, in terms of the NHS trust, my colleague Brian Gibbons will take the lead, and equally clearly, on schools, my colleague Jane Davidson, as the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning will have a view. On the issues that are arising in Swansea about the reorganisation of schools, we know that virtually every authority in Wales is facing reconfiguration issues in

rheini sy'n mynd i adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys gyda phryderon, anafiadau ac afiechyd yn diliys. Gwelsom rai modelau da. Er enghraifft, gwn fod yr heddlu, yn yr ardal hon, wedi dod i mewn i gynorthwyo staff adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys. Mae hynny'n wir yn fy ysbyty lleol i. Mae hyn yn helpu sicrhau clefion a staff, a gall yr heddlu ymyrryd os bydd unrhyw ddigwyddiadau anffodus. O safbwyt ehangach, mae angen inni gynorthwyo gweithwyr y sector cyhoeddus yn gyffredinol, a sicrhau bod y cyhoedd yn sylweddoli bod angen y bobl hyn ar bob un ohonom ar adegau, ac y dylem eu trin fel ein ffrindiau, nid fel gwrthrych ein rhwystredigaethau, sy'n digwydd yn aml.

**Q6 David Lloyd:** Will the Minister make a statement on the provision of public services in Swansea? OAQ0310(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Bydd gwariant y Cynulliad ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus a ddarperir gan awdurdodau lleol bron wedi dyblu mewn arian parod yn y cyfnod rhwng 1999-2000 a 2007-08. Yr ydym yn darparu £250 miliwn mewn arian heb ei neilltuo i Gyngor Sir Abertawe ar gyfer 2005-06 i'w helpu i ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, ac mae hyn yn cyfateb i gynnydd o 5.3 y cant o sylfaen 2004-05.

**David Lloyd:** There are concerns regarding the administration of the health trust, and anger about the reorganisation of schools in Swansea. As the Minister with responsibility for public services, what are you doing to help solve these problems?

**Sue Essex:** Fi sydd â'r cylch gwaith cyffredinol dros wasanaethau cyhoeddus, ond, yn amlwg, o ran ymddiriedolaeth y GIG, fy nghyd-Weinidog Brian Gibbons fydd yn gyfrifol am hynny, ac yr un mor amlwg, o ran ysgolion, bydd gan fy nghyd-Weinidog Jane Davidson, fel y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, farn am hynny. O ran y materion sy'n codi yn Abertawe ynglŷn ag ad-drefnu ysgolion, gwyddom fod bron pob

view of demographic changes. So, I try not to pass comment on what local authorities are doing individually, on the basis, as I said to Brynle, that they are elected and that we need to respect that mandate.

**Val Lloyd:** I agree that this year's 5.3 per cent increase in the local government settlement for Swansea was excellent news, and will guarantee improvements to front-line public services. Do you share my view that an increase in that budget should ensure that public services in Swansea are safeguarded from cuts and above-average increases in charges on public services?

**Sue Essex:** As you said, the overall increase was 5.3 per cent, which is well above inflation levels. I would have thought that that would be sufficient for the authority to avoid making cuts. At the end of the day, it is the authority's job to make decisions and to manage its budgets effectively in order to ensure that services are delivered to the people that it represents.

**Alun Cairns:** You have made much of the increase in funding that the Swansea local authority has received, and you highlighted that, in cash terms, the funding has doubled since the Assembly came into being. I think that that is what you said in response to Dai Lloyd. However, do you recognise that some of those statements can be misleading, because additional responsibilities have also been placed on local authorities? Furthermore, the proportion of unhypothecated funding has also decreased, so would you give us the other side of the argument in order to balance out the situation, rather than just giving rhetoric that might mislead some people?

**Sue Essex:** It is not rhetoric; those are the facts and they stand for themselves. They compare well with what we faced when I was a Labour councillor in Cardiff and a Tory Government was dishing out the money, or not dishing it out, as the case may be. Many of those additional responsibilities have been welcomed by local government.

awdurdod yng Nghymru yn wynebu materion ailgyflunio yn sgîl newidiadau demograffig. Felly, ceisiaf beidio â mynegi barn am yr hyn mae awdurdodau lleol yn ei wneud yn unigol, ar y sail, fel y dywedais wrth Brynle, eu bod yn cael eu hethol a bod angen inni barchu'r mandad hwnnw.

**Val Lloyd:** Cytunaf fod y cynnydd eleni o 5.3 y cant yn y setliad llywodraeth leol ar gyfer Abertawe yn newyddion ardderchog, a bydd yn sicrhau gwelliannau mewn gwasanaethau rheng flaen. A gytunwch â mi y dylai cynnydd yn y gyllideb honno sicrhau y caiff gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn Abertawe eu diogelu rhag toriadau a chynnydd mewn taliadau ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus sy'n uwch na'r cyfartaledd?

**Sue Essex:** Fel y dywedech, 5.3 y cant oedd y cynnydd cyffredinol, sydd lawer yn uwch na lefelau chwyddiant. Byddwn wedi tybio y byddai hynny'n ddigonol i'r awdurdod allu osgoi gwneud toriadau. Yn y pen draw, cyfrifoldeb yr awdurdod yw gwneud penderfyniadau a rheoli ei gyllidebau'n effeithiol er mwyn sicrhau bod gwasanaethau'n cael eu darparu i'r bobl y mae'n eu cynrychioli.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr ydych wedi rhoi llawer o sylw i'r cynnydd yn yr arian a gafodd awdurdod lleol Abertawe, ac yr oeddech yn tynnu sylw fod yr arian, fel arian parod, wedi dyblu ers i'r Cynulliad gael ei sefydlu. Credaf mai dyna a ddywedasoch wrth ateb Dai Lloyd. Fodd bynnag, a ydych yn cydnabod y gall rhai o'r datganiadau hynny fod yn gamarweiniol, am fod cyfrifoldebau ychwanegol hefyd wedi'u gosod ar awdurdodau lleol? At hynny, mae cyfran yr arian heb ei neilltuo wedi gostwng hefyd. Felly, a wnewch chi roi ochr arall y ddadl inni er mwyn cydbwyso'r sefyllfa, yn hytrach na dim ond rhoi rhethreg a allai gamarwain rhai pobl?

**Sue Essex:** Nid rhethreg mohono; dyna'r ffeithiau. Maent yn cymharu'n dda â'r hyn a oedd yn ein hwynебу pan oeddwn yn gynghorydd Llafur yng Nghaerdydd a'r Llywodraeth Doriaid yn dosbarthu'r arian, neu'n peidio â'i ddosbarthu, yn ôl yr achos. Mae llywodraeth leol wedi croesawu nifer o'r cyfrifoldebau ychwanegol hynny. Er

For example, the workload agreement and other things are all about improvements in services. We have tried to work those through. Currently, relations with the Welsh Local Government Association are excellent across the board. All parties are trying to work towards greater understanding of what is needed to give good funding for local services and how we can offer value for money.

In terms of the split between unhypothecated and hypothecated funding, the proportion might have changed, but that is because the total pot has changed. What we did, in the early years, was to introduce a whole range of special grants, which were particularly focused on important initiatives for children and elderly people. We provided funding for reducing class sizes in education, and support to local authorities in many ways.

To assure you, we have signed up, with Welsh local government, to try to move those special grants, once they have been up and running for several years and people feel confident that that area of service will be delivered, back into mainstream revenue support grant. We manage to do so each year with some of those grants. I am sure that there will be extra grants this year that will move from specific grants into the revenue support grant.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 7, OAQ0319(LGP), was transferred for written answer.

**Q8 Peter Black:** What is the Minister doing to ensure that community councils in Wales are adequately funded? OAQ0316(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** As I said during the previous discussion, the majority of funding for community councils is raised through the precept levied in council tax. Individual councils are responsible for setting the precept to support the services that they provide.

enghraift, mae a wnelo'r cytundeb llwyth gwaith a phethau eraill â gwelliannau mewn gwasanaethau. Yr ydym wedi ceisio mynd i'r afael a'r rheini. Ar hyn o bryd, mae cysylltiadau â Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru yn ardderchog yn gyffredinol. Mae'r holl bleidiau yn ceisio gweithio tuag at well dealtwriaeth o'r hyn sydd ei angen i roi arian da i wasanaethau lleol a sut y gallwn roi gwerth yr arian.

O ran y rhaniad rhwng arian heb ei neilltuo ac arian wedi'i neilltuo, mae'n bosibl fod y gyfran wedi newid, ond mae hynny am fod y gronfa gyfan wedi newid. Yr hyn a wnaethom, yn y blynnyddoedd cynnar, oedd cyflwyno ystod eang o grantiau arbennig, a oedd yn canolbwytio'n arbennig ar fentrau pwysig i blant a'r henoed. Darparwyd arian gennym i leihau maint dosbarthiadau ym myd addysg, ac i gynorthwyo awdurdodau lleol mewn llawer ffordd.

Gallaf eich sicrhau ein bod wedi ymuno â'r cynllun hwn, gyda llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru, i geisio symud y grantiau arbennig hynny, ar ôl iddynt fod ar waith am nifer o flynyddoedd a phan fydd pobl yn teimlo'n hyderus y bydd y maes gwasanaeth hwnnw'n cael ei ddarparu, yn ôl i grant cymorth refeniw prif ffrwd. Llwyddwn i wneud hynny bob blwyddyn gyda rhai o'r grantiau hynny. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd grantiau ychwanegol ar gael eleni a fydd yn symud o grantiau penodol i'r grant cymorth refeniw.

**Y Llywydd:** Trosglwyddwyd cwestiwn 7, OAQ0319(LGP), i'w ateb yn ysgrifenedig.

### Cyngorau Cymuned Community Councils

**C8 Peter Black:** Beth y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod cyngorau cymuned yng Nghymru yn cael eu hariannu'n ddigonol? OAQ0316(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Fel y dywedais yn y drafodaeth flaenorol, caiff y rhan fwyaf o'r arian a ddyrennir i gyngorau cymuned ei godi drwy'r praesept yn y dreth gyngor. Cyngorau unigol sy'n gyfrifol am bennu'r praesept i gefnogi'r gwasanaethau a ddarperir gan ddynt.

**Peter Black:** The Assembly has undertaken a considerable amount of work looking at the role and functions of community councils which will have an implication in terms of how they are funded. Will you give a progress report on what is happening to that work, and how does the Assembly Government intend to take it forward?

**Sue Essex:** In terms of taking it forward, some measures have already been put in place, particularly the training packages to support clerks and the training packages for Members, which we have discussed before.

In relation to finance, I should also mention the £100,000 grant provided to Once Voice Wales and the other £100,000 that is earmarked for next year, subject to a business plan. To repeat the answer that I gave to previous questions, we are looking at packaging those funding and financing issues with a piece of work that will probably take place in the autumn and winter. We will do this just to disentangle some issues such as the borrowing powers of community councils and some of those complications that have come from quite ancient legislation, and to see how much room we have for manoeuvrability.

**Lisa Francis:** The continuation of the Welsh Assembly Government's grant into the financial year 2006-07 for One Voice Wales will be dependent on the organisation apparently submitting a satisfactorily revised business plan to you. What are the main revisions that you expect One Voice to make?

**Sue Essex:** I do not necessarily want revisions, as such. I personally sat down with One Voice and its officials to go through its business plan this year to make sure that the core business plan was one which is acceptable through our compliance regime. One of the key points that I will be looking for will be this issue of moving the association from being dependent upon our money into a self-financing organisation which, in fairness, is what One Voice Wales wants. I have discussed this with the organisation's chair. We will not look at that

**Peter Black:** Mae'r Cynulliad wedi gwneud cryn dipyn o waith ar edrych ar rôl a swyddogaethau cyngorau cymuned a fydd yn effeithio ar y modd y cantic eu hariannu. A rowch adroddiad cynnydd inni ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd i'r gwaith hwnnw, a sut y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn bwriadu ei ddatblygu?

**Sue Essex:** O ran ei ddatblygu, mae rhai mesurau wedi eu rhoi ar waith eisoes, yn enwedig y pecynnau hyfforddiant i gynorthwyo clercod a'r pecynnau hyfforddiant i Aelodau, a drafodwyd gennym eisoes.

O ran cyllid, dylwn grybwyl hefyd y grant o £100,000 a roddwyd i Un Llais i Gymru a'r £100,000 arall a glustnodwyd ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf, yn amodol ar gynllun busnes. i ailadrodd yr ateb a roddais i gwestiynau blaenorol, yr ydym yn ystyried pecynnu'r materion ariannu a chyllido hynny gyda darn o waith sy'n debygol o gael ei wneud yn yr hydref a'r gaeaf. Gwnawn hyn er mwyn datrys rhai materion megis pwerau benthyca cyngorau cymuned a rhai o'r cymhlethdodau hynny sy'n deillio o hen ddeddfwriaeth, ac i weld faint o gyfle sydd gennym i fod yn hyblyg.

**Lisa Francis:** Bydd parhad grant Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i mewn i'r flwyddyn ariannol 2006-07 ar gyfer Un Llais i Gymru yn dibynnu gyflwyno cynllun busnes diwygiedig boddhaol ichi gan y sefydliad. Beth yw'r prif ddiwygiadau y disgwyliwch i Un Llais eu gwneud?

**Sue Essex:** Nid wyf am weld diwygiadau o reidrwydd. Eisteddais i lawr gydag Un Llais a'i swyddogion er mwyn trafod ei gynllun busnes eleni i sierhau bod y cynllun busnes craidd yn dderbynol drwy ein cyfundrefn gydymffurfio. Un o'r pwyntiau allweddol y byddaf yn chwilio amdano fydd datblygu'r sefydliad o fod yn un sy'n ddibynnol ar ein harian ni i fod yn sefydliad hunan-ariannu, a dyna, i fod yn deg, y mae Un Llais i Gymru am ei weld. Yr wyf wedi trafod hyn gyda chadeirydd y sefydliad. Ni fyddwn yn edrych ar hynny'n unig, ond edrychaf ymlaen at

alone, but I look forward to seeing movement and perhaps to see training programmes and so on established, and how it brings the organisation some income.

weld datblygiadau ac at weld rhaglenni hyfforddiant ac ati yn cael eu sefydlu efallai, a sut mae hynny'n creu rhywfaint o incwm i'r sefydliad.

### **Gwasanaethau Lleol yn Sir y Fflint Local Services in Flintshire**

**Q9 Sandy Mewies:** What measures has the Minister taken since 2003 to support Flintshire in improving the local services it delivers? OAQ0342(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** A particular measure that I think is important for Flintshire County Council and other councils is the policy agreement. Under this agreement, the authority will make significant improvements in service delivery by 2007. The agreement reflects both our strategic aims as an Assembly Government and the local objectives and particular needs of Flintshire.

**Sandy Mewies:** I think that it is true that, in many ways, it is not what you get but what you do with it that counts. Will you join me in congratulating Flintshire County Council on the vast improvements that the authority has made in the statutory performance indicators over the past 12 months? For example, the collection of recyclable waste at the kerbside is up from 93 per cent to 94.1 per cent, when the Wales average is 67 per cent. The number of older people enabled to live at home is up from 79.2 per cent to 83.76 per cent. Sickness absence is down from 14.5 days to 10.6 days.

**C9 Sandy Mewies:** Pa fesurau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cymryd er 2003 i gynorthwyo sir y Fflint i wella'r gwasanaethau lleol a ddarperir ganddi? OAQ0342(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Mesur penodol sy'n bwysig i Gyngor Sir y Fflint a chyngorau eraill, yn fy marn i, yw'r cytundeb polisi. O dan y cytundeb hwn, bydd yr awdurdod yn gwneud gwelliannau sylweddol ym maes darparu gwasanaethau erbyn 2007. Mae'r cytundeb yn adlewyrchu ein nodau strategol fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ac amcanion lleol ac anghenion penodol sir y Fflint.

**Sandy Mewies:** Credaf ei bod yn wir dweud, mewn llawer ffordd, nad beth a gewch sy'n bwysig ond yr hyn a wnewch ag ef. A wnewch ymuno â mi i longyfarch Cyngor Sir y Fflint am y gwelliannau helaeth y mae'r awdurdod wedi eu gwneud yn y dangosyddion perfformiad statudol dros y 12 mis diwethaf? Er enghraifft, mae casglu gwastraff ailgylchu ar fin y ffordd wedi codi o 93 y cant i 94.1 y cant, a'r cyfartaledd ar gyfer Cymru yw 67 y cant. Mae nifer y bobl hŷn sy'n cael eu galluogi i fyw gartref wedi codi o 79.2 y cant i 83.76 y cant. Mae absenoldeb oherwydd salwch wedi gostwng o 14.5 diwrnod i 10.6 diwrnod.

2.30 p.m.

**Sue Essex:** I accord with your first statement, as I am sure would most Members. Flintshire County Council is really trying to make sure that it delivers. Its performance measures actually show that. Compared to the old days, I am particularly pleased to see it is doing well in terms of waste, and I know that one member of the council has put a particular emphasis on ensuring that it becomes an exemplar authority in the way that it operates. The work that is going on is to be commended, and where there is best practice that can be

**Sue Essex:** Cytunaf â'ch datganiad cyntaf, fel yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'r rhan fwyaf o Aelodau. Mae Cyngor Sir y Fflint yn gwneud ei orau glas i sicrhau ei fod yn cyflawni ei nodau. Mae ei fesurau perfformiad yn dangos hynny. O'i gymharu â'r hen ddyddiau, yr wyf yn arbennig o falch gweld ei fod yn gwneud yn dda o ran gwastraff, a gwn fod un aelod o'r cyngor wedi rhoi pwyslais penodol ar sicrhau y bydd yn batrwm o awdurdod yn y modd y mae'n gweithredu. Rhaid cymeradwyo'r gwaith sy'n cael ei wneud, a lle mae arfer gorau y

learnt by other authorities, I am sure that Flintshire would be willing to spread it.

gall awdurdodau eraill ddysgu ohono, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai sir y Fflint yn barod i'w rannu.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 11, OAQ0330(LGP), yn ôl.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 11, OAQ0330(LGP), has been withdrawn.

### **Llywodraethu Corfforaethol Da mewn Awdurdodau Lleol Good Corporate Governance in Local Authorities**

**Q12 Mark Isherwood:** Will the Minister make a statement on good corporate governance in local authorities? OAQ0340(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Corporate governance is an essential prerequisite in the planning and delivery of high-quality, cost-effective public services. Therefore, it features centrally in the draft guidance of the Wales Programme for Improvement which is currently the subject of a wide-ranging consultation.

**Mark Isherwood:** A report to Flintshire County Council's overview and scrutiny committee on 14 June referred to the future challenges facing local government, as a consequence of Welsh Assembly Government budget reductions. It stated that while the intention was to continue to protect services as far as possible, it would not be possible to continue to protect current employment levels. How will good corporate governance be achieved and sustained if the Welsh Assembly Government is, as the local authority contends, forcing cuts and compulsory redundancies on the council?

**Sue Essex:** You are confusing two things. Corporate governance is looked at clearly in the Wales Programme for Improvement. It is not a matter of finance—it is essentially a matter of culture, attitudes and, sometimes, training and capacity. Therefore, what you said is a kind of non sequitur.

**C12 Mark Isherwood:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar lywodraethu corfforaethol da mewn awdurdodau lleol? OAQ0340(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Mae llywodraethu corfforaethol yn rhagofyniad hanfodol yn y gwaith o gynllunio a darparu gwasanaethau cost effeithiol o ansawdd uchel. Felly, mae'n rhan ganolog o ganllawiau drafst Rhaglen Cymru ar gyfer Gwella, sy'n destun ymgynghori eang ar hyn o bryd.

**Mark Isherwood:** Mewn adroddiad a gyflwynwyd i bwylgor trosolwg a chraffu Cyngor Sir y Fflint ar 14 Mehefin, cyfeiriwyd at yr heriau a fydd yn wynebu llywodraeth leol yn y dyfodol, o ganlyniad i ostyngiadau cyllideb gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Dywedai, er mai'r bwriad oedd parhau i ddiogelu gwasanaethau gymaint â phosibl, na fyddai'n bosibl parhau i ddiogelu lefelau cyflogaeth cyfredol. Sut y bydd gwaith llywodraethu corfforaethol da yn cael ei gyflawni a'i gynnwl os yw Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, fel yr honna'r awdurdod lleol, yn gorfodi'r cyngor i wneud toriadau ac ymddiswyddiadau gorfodol?

**Sue Essex:** Yr ydych yn cymysgu dau beth. Edrychir ar lywodraethu corfforaethol yn glir yn Rhaglen Cymru ar gyfer Gwella. Nid mater o gyllid ydyw—mae'n ymwneud â diwylliant ac agweddau yn bennaf, ac weithiau hyfforddiant ac adnoddau. Felly, mae'r hyn a ddywedasoch yn fath o non sequitur.

### **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes Questions to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning**

#### **Cyllideb i Ysgolion yng Ngheredigion Funding for Schools in Ceredigion**

**C1 Elin Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ynglŷn â'r gyllideb i ysgolion yng Ngheredigion? OAQ0352(ELL)

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Darperir y cyllid ar gyfer cyllidebau ysgol drwy setliad refeniw llywodraeth leol. Derbyniodd Ceredigion grant cymorth refeniw heb ei neilltuo'n benodol gwerth £84.3 miliwn oddi wrth Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn 2005-06, sef cynydd o 6.4 y cant ers 2004-05. Yr awdurdod sy'n gyfrifol am ddyrannu arian i ysgolion, yn unol â'i fformwla ariannu lleol.

**Elin Jones:** Dywedodd y Prif Weinidog yn y Siambwr na ddylid cau ysgolion ar sail ariannol yn unig. Er hyn, mae Cyngor Sir Ceredigion yn dweud mai pwysau gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol i edrych ar gostau sy'n mynnu ei fod yn gorfol ystyried dyfodol ysgolion bach. A ydych yn barod i mi gyfleu'r neges i Gyngor Sir Ceredigion nad yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn dymuno i'r cyngor asesu ysgolion ar sail ariannol yn unig, ac mai mater o flaenoriaeth wleidyddol i'r cyngor yw dyfodol y rhwydwaith wych o ysgolion bach sydd yn yr ardal?

**Jane Davidson:** Bydd yn rhaid i chi ddarllen y canllawiau—

**Elin Jones:** Yr wyf wedi darllen y canllawiau.

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'r canllawiau yn ei gwneud yn glir mai'r peth pwysicaf yn y ddadl hon yw addysg.

**Lisa Francis:** Education and Learning Wales's funding formula in the post-16 sector will effectively force sixth forms to examine their viability. In Ceredigion, there are seven high-achieving Welsh-medium schools with sixth forms. What measures will the Government take to protect those sixth forms, and to ensure that they continue to flourish?

**Jane Davidson:** In a sense, the answer is

**Q1 Elin Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement regarding the budget for schools in Ceredigion? OAQ0352(ELL)

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** Funding for school budgets is provided through the local government revenue settlement. Ceredigion received £84.3 million in unhypothecated revenue support grant from the Assembly Government in 2005-06—an increase of 6.4 per cent on 2004-05. The authority is responsible for distributing funding to schools according to its local funding formula.

**Elin Jones:** The First Minister has stated in the Chamber that schools should not be closed for purely financial reasons. However, Ceredigion County Council says that it is pressure from the Assembly Government and the Auditor General that forces it to look at costs and to consider the future of small schools. Are you happy for me to convey the message to Ceredigion County Council that the Assembly Government does not wish the council to assess schools on a purely financial basis, and that the future of the excellent network of small schools in the area is a matter of political priority for the council?

**Jane Davidson:** You will have to read the guidance—

**Elin Jones:** I have read the guidance.

**Jane Davidson:** The guidance makes it clear that the most important point in this debate is education.

**Lisa Francis:** Bydd fformiwl ariannu Addysgu a Dysgu Cymru yn y sector ar ôl 16 yn gorfoli blynnyddoedd chweched dosbarth i archwilio eu dichonoldeb, i bob diben. Yng Ngheredigion, mae saith ysgol Gymraeg gyda chweched dosbarth sy'n cael canlyniadau da. Pa gamau y bydd y Llywodraeth yn eu cymryd i ddiogelu'r ysgolion hynny sydd â chweched dosbarth, ac i sicrhau eu bod yn parhau i ffynnu?

**Jane Davidson:** Mewn un ystyr, mae'r ateb

similar to the one for the previous question. The agenda that the Welsh Assembly Government is running, supported in the Assembly in terms of the initial establishment of ELWa, is to ensure that all education establishments provide the best range of opportunities possible for the learner. There are many examples of schools in rural Wales which offer wide portfolio opportunities to their learners. Sometimes, schools offer it on their own and sometimes in partnership with other schools and colleges. I am sure that you agree that wherever people live, they should have opportunities to gain access to the widest range of courses available. ELWa's funding formula supports that agenda, and schools which actively collaborate—we have put £6 million of additional funding into those kinds of collaborations this year—will actively benefit from the proposals.

yn debyg i'r ateb ar gyfer y cwestiwn blaenorol. Agenda Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, a gefnogir yn y Cynulliad o ran sefydlu ELWa yn gychwynnol, yw sicrhau bod pob sefydliad addysgol yn darparu'r cyfleoedd gorau posibl i'r dysgwr. Mae yna lawer enghraifft o ysgolion yng Nghymru wledig sy'n cynnig cyfleoedd portffolio eang i'w dysgwyr. Weithiau, bydd ysgolion yn eu cynnig ar eu pen eu hunain, ac weithiau mewn partneriaeth ag ysgolion a cholegau eraill. Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch, ble bynnag y mae pobl yn byw, y dylent gael cyfleoedd i fanteisio ar yr ystod ehangaf o gyrsiau sydd ar gael. Mae fformiwl ariannu ELWa yn cefnogi'r agenda honno, a bydd yr ysgolion sydd wrthi'n cydweithio—yr ydym wedi dyrannu £6 miliwn o arian ychwanegol ar gyfer y math hwn o gydweithio eleni—yn elwa'n effeithiol o'r cynigion.

### Addysg Anghenion Arbennig Special Needs Education

**Q2 Gwenda Thomas:** Will the Minister make a statement on special needs education in Wales? OAQ0373(ELL)

**Q5 Lisa Francis:** Will the Minister make a statement on special needs education in Mid and West Wales? OAQ0383(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Local education authorities are required to make suitable education provision available for all children within their boundaries, including those with additional learning needs. The SEN Code of Practice for Wales 2002 outlines the statutory framework and clearly explains the procedures to be adopted in support of pupils with special educational needs.

**Gwenda Thomas:** A recent report by the British-Irish Inter-Parliamentary Body states that devolution has boosted the education provision for children with special needs in Scotland and Wales. Will you join me in recognising the commitment of teachers and classroom assistants who are key, if we are to realise the Welsh Assembly Government's aim of meeting the statemented needs of some of our most special children?

**C2 Gwenda Thomas:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar addysg anghenion arbennig yng Nghymru? OAQ0373(ELL)

**C5 Lisa Francis:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar addysg anghenion arbennig yng Nghanolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru? OAQ0383(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'n ofynnol i awdurdodau addysg lleol sicrhau bod darpariaeth addysg briodol ar gael i bob plentyn o fewn ei ffiniau, gan gynnwys plant ag anghenion dysgu ychwanegol. Mae Cod Ymarfer AAA Cymru 2002 yn amlinellu'r fframwaith statudol, ac mae'n egluro'n glir y gweithdrefnau i'w mabwysiadu i gynorthwyo disgylion ag anghenion addysgol arbennig.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Mae adroddiad yn ddiweddar gan y Corff Rhyngseneddol Prydeinig-Gwyddelig yn dweud bod datganoli wedi hybu'r ddarpariaeth addysg ar gyfer plant ag anghenion arbennig yng Nghymru a'r Alban. A ymunwch â mi i gydnabod ymrwymiad athrawon a chynorthwywyr ystafell ddosbarth sy'n allweddol, os ydym i gyflawni nod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o ddiwallu'r

**Jane Davidson:** I would like to read that report. When the committee went to Scotland recently, it was interesting to look at their provision in terms of advising our policy development on special educational needs, but the Scots indicated that, in many ways, they were learning from us. We have been able, since devolution, to set out a distinctive agenda, including Wales-only provision for regional collaboration to widen opportunities for young people with additional learning needs. I am happy to congratulate the teachers who are involved in that process.

**Lisa Francis:** What assurances can you give that educational statements for special needs are completed and adhered to on a regular basis? What assessment do you take to ensure that county councils undertake their responsibilities with regard to children with special needs?

**Jane Davidson:** As you know, the obligation lies with local authorities. There have been some differences in the way that local authorities statement and the committee is currently looking in depth at this issue. That has included taking evidence from the special educational needs tribunal, where parents can have recourse if they are dissatisfied with the outcome at the local authority level.

**Catherine Thomas:** In the Llanelli constituency, I have received numerous queries about provision for children with autistic spectrum disorders, who are high functioning in terms of speech and language. Can you tell me if there are plans for specific provision for such children, throughout Wales, as the current autistic units often cannot meet their language needs?

**Jane Davidson:** The power for regional collaboration was the key Wales-only power that we took, and the ascription of £12 million in terms of looking at regional developments for additional learning needs is starting to be effective. In north Wales we have Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn; a major new establishment that deals with autistic

anghenion sydd wedi eu datgan ar gyfer rhai o'n plant mwyaf arbennig?

**Jane Davidson:** Hoffwn ddarllen yr adroddiad hwnnw. Pan aeth y pwylgor i'r Alban yn ddiweddar, yr oedd yn ddiddorol edrych ar y ddarpariaeth yno o ran llywio'r gwaith o ddatblygu ein polisi ar anghenion addysgol arbennig, ond nododd yr Alban ei bod, mewn llawer ffordd, yn dysgu oddi wrthym ni. Ers datganoli, yr ydym wedi gallu pennu agenda benodol, gan gynnwys darpariaeth yng Nghymru'n unig ar gyfer cydweithio rhanbarthol er mwyn ehangu'r cyfleoedd i bobl ifanc ag anghenion dysgu ychwanegol. Mae'n bleser gennyf longyfarch yr athrawon sy'n rhan o'r broses honno.

**Lisa Francis:** Pa sicrwydd y gallwch ei roi fod datganiadau addysgol ar gyfer anghenion arbennig yn cael eu cwblhau ac y cedwir atynt yn rheolaidd? Pa asesiadau a wnewch i sicrhau bod cynghorau sir yn cyflawni eu cyfrifoldebau o ran plant ag anghenion arbennig?

**Jane Davidson:** Fel y gwyddoch, awdurdodau lleol sy'n gyfrifol am hynny. Bu rhai gwahaniaethau yn y ffordd y mae'r datganiad gan awdurdodau lleol a'r pwylgor yn edrych yn fanwl ar y mater hwn ar hyn o bryd. Mae'r gwaith hwn wedi cynnwys cymryd tystiolaeth gan y tribiwnlys anghenion addysgol arbennig, lle y gall rhieni ofyn am gymorth os na fyddant yn fodlon â'r canlyniad ar lefel awdurdod lleol.

**Catherine Thomas:** Yn etholaeth Llanelli, yr wyl wedi cael nifer o ymholiadau yngylch darpariaeth ar gyfer plant ag anhwylderau yn y sbectwm awtistig, sydd â gallu da o ran iaith a lleferydd. A allwch ddweud wrthyf a fwriedir darparu'n benodol ar gyfer plant o'r fath, ledled Cymru, am na all yr unedau awtistig presennol yn aml ddiwallu eu hanghenion iaith?

**Jane Davidson:** Y pŵer i gydweithio'n rhanbarthol oedd y pŵer alleweddol i Gymru'n unig a gymerwyd gennym, ac mae'r dyraniad o £12 miliwn o ran edrych ar ddatblygiadau rhanbarthol ar gyfer anghenion dysgu ychwanegol yn dechrau dwyn ffrwyth. Yn y Gogledd mae Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn; sefydliad newydd mawr sy'n

spectrum disorders and is linked to Denbigh High School. We also have the new establishment of Fairwater High School in Cwmbran, working with the Gwent authorities on autistic spectrum disorders. We are looking to generate similar initiatives across Wales, on a regional basis, to ensure that children with an autistic spectrum disorder have the right kind of opportunities at as local a level as possible.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Fis yn ôl, cyfeiriais at achos Ysgol y Bont ac fe atebasoch fwy nag unwaith mai mater i mi ei drafod gyda'r awdurdod lleol oedd darpariaeth newydd yn yr hyn a obeithiwn a fyddai'n ysgol newydd ar y safle.

Mae'n debyg eich bod yn gwybod fy mod wedi trafod y mater—yn wir, yr oeddwn wedi ei drafod cyn gofyn y cwestiwn—gyda'r awdurdod lleol, yr ysgol a chynrychiolwyr y bwrdd llywodraethu. Ni allwch ddarparu unrhyw beth ond yr hyn sydd o fewn fframwaith polisi'r Llywodraeth. A ydyw o fewn y fframwaith hwnnw i'r awdurdod lleol gydweithredu gyda'r ysgol i gael adeilad newydd?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae cyfrifoldeb ar yr awdurdod lleol i sicrhau bod y trefniadau yn yr ardal yn drefniadau da.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Mae'n flin gennyf, Weinidog, ond nid yw'r math hwnnw o ateb o unrhyw gymorth pan ydych yn trafod y mater gyda rhieni. Mae rhieni'n dweud bod rhaid iddynt gael sicrwydd pan fyddant yn trafod â'r awdurdod lleol y caiff unrhyw ddarpariaeth o fewn fframwaith polisi ei chyd nabod a'i chefnogi gan y Llywodraeth. A wnewch ateb y cwestiwn, os gwelwch yn dda?

2.40 p.m.

**Jane Davidson:** Yr un yw'r ateb, achos fframwaith polisi'r Llywodraeth yw sicrhau bod ysgolion arferol ac ysgolion arbennig drwy Gymru pan fo'u hangen, ond mae'r cyfrifoldeb yn aros gyda'r awdurdod lleol.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Gan eich bod yn dweud

ymdrin ag anhwylderau yn y sbectrwm awtistig ac sy'n gysylltiedig ag Ysgol Uwchradd Dinbych. Hefyd mae Ysgol Uwchradd newydd Fairwater yng Nghwmbrân, sy'n gweithio gydag awdurdodau Gwent ar anhwylderau yn y sbectrwm awtistig. Yr ydym am gyflwyno mentrau tebyg ledled Cymru, ar sail ranbarthol, i sicrhau bod plant ag anhwylder yn y sbectrwm awtistig yn cael y math iawn o gyfleoedd mor lleol â phosibl.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** A month ago, I referred to the case of Ysgol y Bont and you answered, more than once, that new provision, in what will hopefully be a new school on the site, was a matter for me to discuss with the local authority.

You probably know that I have discussed this matter—in fact, I had discussed it before asking the question—with the local authority, the school and representatives of the governing body. You cannot provide anything except what is within the Government's policy framework. Is it within that framework for the local authority to co-operate with the school to secure a new building?

**Jane Davidson:** The local authority has a responsibility to ensure that there are satisfactory arrangements in the area.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I am sorry, Minister, but that kind of answer is of no use when you discuss the matter with parents. Parents say they must have certainty in discussions with local authorities that any provision within the policy framework will be acknowledged and supported by the Government. Will you answer the question, please?

**Jane Davidson:** The answer is the same, because the Government's policy framework is to ensure that there are regular schools and special schools throughout Wales according to need, but the responsibility remains with the local authority.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Given that you state that

bod y cyfrifoldeb yn unig ar lywodraeth leol ac nad oes gan y Llywodraeth rôl o gwbl i'w chwarae mewn unrhyw drafodaethau, a wnewch gadarnhau felly, os bydd awdurdod lleol yn penderfynu bod angen ysgol newydd, a bod angen cyllid arbennig i adeiladu, y byddwch yn darparu'r cyllid?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae arian yn mynd at bob un awdurdod lleol ar gyfer adeiladu. Mae mwy o arian yn awr nag erioed, a rhaid i awdurdodau lleol ddefnyddio'r arian yn dda.

**Kirsty Williams:** The ward of Llandrindod North has one of the highest levels of deprivation and child poverty, and it is also home to the women's refuge in that town. It is served by Trefonnen School which, two weeks ago, was devastated by the news that Powys County Council had once again put off plans to redevelop that school. I have visited the school, and the teaching spaces are completely inadequate for modern teaching practices. Will you discuss with the council whether it is using all the funds available to it to improve school buildings, such as those at Trefonnen School in Llandrindod Wells? If the council is using those resources well, what can you do to help them to ensure that schools such as Trefonnen do not have to wait even longer for the improvements that they need to provide an excellent service to pupils in what is a deprived ward?

**Jane Davidson:** Local authorities are required to ensure that they spend Assembly-allocated money in accordance with the proper requirements of the Assembly. They are also required to submit plans to the Assembly for the schools of which they will undertake their refurbishment or replacement. I am happy to look at the dialogue that Powys County Council has had with our officials over that particular school and come back to you on the matter.

the responsibility rests with the local authority alone and that the Government has no role whatsoever to play in any discussions, will you therefore confirm, should a local authority decide that a new school is needed, and that special funding is required to build it, that you will provide that funding?

**Jane Davidson:** Every local authority receives funding for building work. There is more funding now than ever before, and local authorities must use that funding well.

**Kirsty Williams:** Yn ward Gogledd Llandrindod y mae un o'r lefelau uchaf o amddifadedd a thlodi plant, ac mae hefyd yn gartref i loches menywod yn y dref honno. Fe'i gwasanaethir gan Ysgol Trefonnen a glywedd, bythefnos yn ôl, y newyddion trychinebus fod Cyngor Sir Powys unwaith eto wedi gohirio'r cynlluniau i ailddatblygu'r ysgol honno. Yr wyf wedi ymweld â'r ysgol, ac mae'r lleoedd dysgu yn hollol annigonol ar gyfer arferion addysgu modern. A fyddwch yn trafod gyda'r cyngor a yw'n defnyddio'r holl arian sydd ar gael i wella adeiladau ysgol, megis y rhai yn Ysgol Trefonnen yn Llandrindod? Os yw'r cyngor yn defnyddio'r adnoddau hynny'n dda, beth allwch chi ei wneud i'w helpu i sicrhau nad oes raid i ysgolion fel Trefonnen aros hyd yn oed yn hwy am y gwelliannau sydd eu hangen arnynt i ddarparu gwasanaeth rhagorol i ddisgyblion mewn ward ddifreintiedig?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'n ofynnol i awdurdodau lleol sicrhau eu bod yn gwario arian a ddyrannwyd gan y Cynulliad yn unol â gofynion priodol y Cynulliad. Mae'n ofynnol iddynt hefyd gyflwyno cynlluniau i'r Cynulliad ar gyfer yr ysgolion y byddant yn eu hadnewyddu neu'n adeiladu rhai newydd yn eu lle. Yr wyf yn fodlon ystyried y trafodaethau y mae Cyngor Sir Powys wedi eu cael gyda'n swyddogion ynghylch yr ysgol arbennig honno a dod yn ôl atoch ar y mater.

### Cynllun Moderneiddio Addysg (Dwyrain Caerfyrddin a Dinefwr) Plan to Modernise Education (Carmarthen East and Dinefwr)

**C3 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y cynllun i

**Q3 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Will the Minister make a statement on the plan to modernise

foderneiddio addysg yn Nwyrain Caerfyrddin a Dinefwr? OAQ0349(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Mae AALL Sir Gaerfyrddin wedi cyhoeddi rhaglen foderneiddio buddsoddi i wella sylweddol yn eich etholaeth a fydd yn parhau am 10 mlynedd. Mae'r rhaglen yn cynnwys prosiectau gwella a rhesymoli ysgolion. Ni allaf roi sylwadau ar gynigion penodol i ad-drefnu ysgolion a fydd yn destun ymgynghoriad lleol a gweithdrefnau statudol, ond croesawaf ymagwedd strategol cyffredinol yr awdurdodau ledled Cymru.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Ni ofynnaf ichi fynegi barn ar unrhyw gynllun unigol, ond byddwch yn derbyn mai sir Gaerfyrddin sydd â'r nifer fwyaf o siaradwyr Cymraeg o unrhyw sir yng Nghymru. A ydych yn derbyn felly, pan fo'n fater o ad-drefnu addysg yn y sir, y dylai continwwm ar gyfer y Gymraeg a dilyniant o'r sectorau meithrin, cynradd ac uwchradd fod yn rhan ganolog o'r ad-drefnu hwnnw? Gwrandewais ar eich ateb i'm cwestiwn sylfaenol, ac, er eich bod yn canmol y dull y mae awdurdodau wedi'i ddilyn, a wnewch dderbyn bod llawer o grwpiau sy'n cynrychioli rhieni a chymunedau yn sir Gaerfyrddin yn teimlo na chafwyd ymgynghori gwirioneddol cyn lansio'r cynllun? A fyddch hefyd yn barod i gwrdd â'r fforwm sy'n cynrychioli'r rhieni hynny?

**Jane Davidson:** Yr un yw'r ateb â'r hyn a roddais i Ieuan Wyn Jones: mae'r cyfrifoldeb yn aros gyda'r awdurdod lleol i wneud trefniadau yn yr ardal leol. Er hynny, mae'n bwysig imi wneud yn glir o ran yr iaith Gymraeg—ac yr wyf wedi ei gwneud yn glir ichi cyn heddiw—pan oeddwn yn ystyried cynigion i'r Cynulliad gan yr awdurdod lleol, ystyriaus a oedd yr ymgynghoriad ac yn y blaen yn dda—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Nid yw'r Gweinidog yn ateb y cwestiwn.

**Y Llywydd:** Nid yw hynny'n fater i mi. Mae'r Gweinidog yn ateb y cwestiwn yn ei

education in Carmarthen East and Dinefwr? OAQ0349(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Carmarthenshire LEA has announced a substantial 10-year invest-to-improve modernisation programme in your constituency. The programme includes school improvement and rationalisation projects. I cannot comment on specific school reorganisation proposals, which will be the subject of local consultation and statutory procedures, but I welcome the strategic approach taken by authorities across Wales.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I will not ask you to express an opinion on any individual scheme, but you will accept that Carmarthenshire has the greatest number of Welsh speakers of any county in Wales. Do you therefore accept that, when it becomes a matter of reorganising education in the county, that continuum for the Welsh language and progression for the nursery, primary and secondary sectors should be central to that reorganisation? I listened to your answer to my main question, and although you praise the approach the authorities have taken, would you accept that many groups representing parents and communities in Carmarthenshire feel that there was no real consultation before the scheme was launched? And are you prepared to meet the forum which represents those parents?

**Jane Davidson:** The answer is the same as that which I gave to Ieuan Wyn Jones: the responsibility rests with the local authority to make arrangements in the local area. However, it is important for me to make clear with regard to the Welsh language—and I have made it clear to you previously—that, when I considered proposals submitted to the Assembly by the local authority, I considered whether the consultation and so on was good—[*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** The Minister is not answering the question.

**The Presiding Officer:** That is not a matter for me. The Minister is replying to the

ffordd ei hun. Nid yw'n briodol i Aelodau geisio gofyn ail a thrydydd cwestiwn pan eu bod wedi cael eu cyfle unwaith.

**Jane Davidson:** Fel yr oeddwn yn ei ddweud, mae'n bwysig sicrhau bod cyfle i barhau gyda'r iaith Gymraeg. Felly, yr ydym yn edrych ar y mater hwn yn agos.

**Glyn Davies:** Yr wyf am ofyn cwestiwn sydd yn debyg i gwestiwn Rhodri Glyn Thomas. Pan fo Cyngor Sir Gaerfyrddin yn cau neu'n cyfuno ysgolion bach lle'r Gymraeg yw iaith yr iard chwarae mae'n cael effaith negyddol hirdymor ar yr iaith dros yr ardal i gyd. A gytunwch y dylid ystyried yr effaith ar yr iaith Gymraeg fel mater o bwys bob tro y bydd cau ysgol fach ar yr agenda?

**Jane Davidson:** Fel yr oeddwn yn ei ddweud—ac yr wyf wedi dweud hyn yn gyhoeddus—mae'r iaith Gymraeg yn bwysig. Ni fyddwn yn cytuno i gynnig gan awdurdod lleol pe na bai'n cynnwys digon o ddarpariaeth Gymraeg neu pe bai'n cynnwys llai o ddarpariaeth Gymraeg na'r cynnig arall. Mae'n bwysig fy mod yn sicrhau bod yr ysgol o'r un math a bod safon y Gymraeg hefyd yn gyfartal.

#### **'Creu'r Cysylltiadau' ac Adolygiad Gershon o Effeithlonrwydd y Sector Cyhoeddus 'Making the Connections' and the Gershon Review of Public Sector Efficiency**

**Q4 Peter Black:** Will the Minister make a statement on the impact of the savings required by 'Making the Connections' and the Gershon review of public sector efficiency on her budgets? OAQ0347(ELL)

**Q11 Peter Black:** Will the Minister make a statement on the impact of the savings required by 'Making the Connections' and the Gershon review of public sector efficiency on the budget of Education and Learning Wales? OAQ0348(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Efficiency gains are to be achieved across all public service bodies, including the Assembly Government, by using the resources available even more

question in her own way. It is not appropriate for Members to try to ask a second or a third question when they have already had their chance.

**Jane Davidson:** As I was saying, it is important to ensure that there is opportunity to continue with the Welsh language. Therefore, we are looking carefully at this matter.

**Glyn Davies:** I want to ask a question similar to that asked by Rhodri Glyn Thomas. When Carmarthenshire County Council closes or merges small schools where Welsh is the language of the playground, it has a long-term negative effect on the language in the entire area. Would you agree that the impact on the Welsh language should be considered an important issue whenever the closure of a small school is on the agenda?

**Jane Davidson:** As I was saying—and I have said this publicly—the Welsh language is important. I would not agree to a local authority proposal if it did not include enough Welsh-language provision, or if it entailed less Welsh-language provision than the other proposal. It is important for me to ensure that it is the same kind of school and that the standard of Welsh is also equivalent.

**C4 Peter Black:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar effaith yr arbedion y mae eu hangen yn ôl 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau' ac adolygiad Gershon o effeithlonrwydd y sector cyhoeddus ar ei chyllidebau? OAQ0347(ELL)

**C11 Peter Black:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar effaith yr arbedion y mae eu hangen yn ôl 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau' ac adolygiad Gershon o effeithlonrwydd y sector cyhoeddus ar gyllideb Addysg ac Addysgu Cymru? OAQ0348(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Caiff enillion effeithlonrwydd eu sicrhau ar draws pob corff gwasanaeth cyhoeddus, gan gynnwys Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, drwy ddefnyddio'r

productively. This is about reallocating resources to front-line delivery, making services more responsive to citizens and communities to achieve even better educational outcomes in Wales.

**Peter Black:** It is important that we are able to reallocate resources to education, particularly to schools. As the Assembly Government has effectively top-sliced the 1 per cent of savings from local education budgets before they even reach local authorities, how is it possible to reallocate that money to help schools, and why is it therefore the case that many local authorities are taking 1 per cent away from schools because of the financial situation that this Government has put them in?

**Jane Davidson:** That is not the case in terms of the aims of this programme. This programme will not, for example, see the Assembly Government spending any less money on education and lifelong learning; it is about ensuring that that money is spent more effectively. Local authorities are free to look at how they will deliver the 1 per cent efficiency savings in terms of ensuring that the investment goes to the front-line services. We hope that they will look at each individual service when they do that, because there is no obligation in terms of the Assembly Government's saying, for example, that there has to be a 1 per cent cut across services. That is not what this programme is about, as Sue Essex has said on many occasions.

**Peter Black:** The reality is that there has been a cut in front-line education services across Wales, and the reason for that is that local authorities have not been given this money to recycle and reinvest in those services. Is it not the case that the way in which the Assembly Government is approaching this issue, contrary to the way in which it is being approached in England, is putting education at risk of being undefended and underfunded across the whole of Wales?

**Jane Davidson:** That is a misunderstanding of the process. Their money has not been cut;

adnoddau sydd ar gael hyd yn oed yn fwy cynhyrchiol. Mae a wnelo hyn ag ailddyrannu adnoddau i wasanaethau rheng flaen, gan wneud y gwasanaethau'n fwy ymatebol i ddinasyyddion a chymunedau er mwyn sicrhau canlyniadau addysgiadol hyd yn oed yn well yng Nghymru.

**Peter Black:** Mae'n bwysig inni allu ailddyrannu adnoddau i addysg, yn arbennig i ysgolion. Fel y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad fwy neu lai wedi brigdorri'r 1 y cant o arbedion o gyllidebau addysg lleol cyn iddynt hyd yn oed gyrraedd awdurdodau lleol, sut y mae'n bosibl ailddyrannu'r arian hwnnw i helpu ysgolion, a pham felly mae nifer o awdurdodau lleol yn cymryd 1 y cant oddi ar ysgolion oherwydd y sefyllfa ariannol y mae'r Llywodraeth hon wedi eu rhoi yniddi?

**Jane Davidson:** Nid felly y mae o ran nodau'r rhaglen hon. Ni fydd y rhaglen hon, er enghraifft, yn gweld Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwario llai o arian ar addysg a dysgu gydol oes; mae a wnelo â sicrhau y caiff arian ei wario'n fwy effeithiol. Mae awdurdodau lleol yn rhydd i edrych ar y ffordd y byddant yn sicrhau'r arbedion effeithlonrwydd o 1 y cant o ran sicrhau bod y buddsoddiad yn mynd i'r gwasanaethau rheng flaen. Gobeithio y byddant yn edrych ar bob gwasanaeth unigol pan wnânt hynny, oherwydd nid oes unrhyw rwymedigaeth i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ddweud, er enghraifft, fod yn rhaid cael toriad o 1 y cant ar draws y gwasanaethau. Nid dyna yw hanfod y rhaglen hon, fel y mae Sue Essex wedi ei ddweud lawer gwaith.

**Peter Black:** Y gwir yw bod toriad wedi bod mewn gwasanaethau addysg rheng flaen ledled Cymru, a'r rheswm am hynny yw nad yw awdurdodau lleol wedi cael yr arian hwn i'w ailgylchu a'i ail-fuddsoddi yn y gwasanaethau hynny. Onid yw'n wir fod y ffordd y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ymdrin â'r mater hwn, yn groes i'r ffordd y mae Lloegr yn ymdrin ag ef, yn golygu bod perygl na fydd addysg yn cael ei hamddiffyn ac na fydd yn cael ei hariannu'n ddigonol ar draws Cymru gyfan?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae hynny'n gamddealltwriaeth o'r broses. Nid yw eu

they have been asked to look at 1 per cent efficiency savings across the piece in terms of ensuring that, in a sense, there is a 1 per cent better outcome for those people experiencing the benefits of front-line delivery.

**Janet Ryder:** You have just said that the aim of your policy may not have been to deliver that 1 per cent cut in school funding but the reality of it, as Peter Black has just said, is that schools are experiencing a 1 per cent cut in their budget. What are you doing to monitor the impact of your policies on front-line services? Schools felt that they had your personal assurance that they would not see this cut, and yet they all say that they have to take this 1 per cent cut. How are you going to put that money back into those schools to ensure that they do not have to suffer it?

2.50 p.m.

**Jane Davidson:** I would repeat what I have said before, namely that the funding has gone to the local authorities, and it is up to them to decide how they invest the budget allocated. They have received the highest level of investment ever from the Assembly Government, and if schools have issues with the way in which local authorities are looking for efficiency savings, they must take them up with those authorities. My colleague, Sue Essex, is working with local authorities in looking at these issues.

**William Graham:** You have a £15 million annual public service dividend, and £32 million allocated over three years for an improvement fund. Which specific education initiatives are you now going to improve?

**Jane Davidson:** I am sorry, but I did not hear the second part of that question.

**William Graham:** The second part was, how are you going to use the additional money that you have announced to improve education in Wales?

harian wedi ei dorri; gofynnwyd iddynt edrych ar arbedion effeithlonrwydd o 1 y cant yn gyffredinol o ran sicrhau, mewn un ystyr, fod canlyniad gwell o 1 y cant i'r bobl hynny sy'n cael buddiannau gwasanaethau rheng flaen.

**Janet Ryder:** Yr ydych newydd ddweud nad nod eich polisi efallai oedd sicrhau'r toriad hwnnw o 1 y cant mewn arian ysgolion, ond y gwir yw, fel y mae Peter Black newydd ei ddweud, fod ysgolion yn gweld toriad o 1 y cant yn eu cyllideb. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i fonitro effaith eich polisiau ar wasanaethau rheng flaen? Yr oedd ysgolion yn teimlo eich bod wedi rhoi eich sicrwydd personol na fyddent yn gweld y toriad hwn. Ac eto, dywed pob un ohonynt fod yn rhaid iddynt gymryd y toriad hwn o 1 y cant. Sut yr ydych yn mynd i roi'r arian hwnnw yn ôl yn yr ysgolion i sicrhau nad oes yn rhaid iddynt ei ddioddef?

**Jane Davidson:** Byddwn yn ailadrodd yr hyn yr wyf wedi ei ddweud o'r blaen, sef bod yr arian wedi mynd i'r awdurdodau lleol, a'u cyfrifoldeb hwy yw penderfynu sut y byddant yn buddsoddi'r gyllideb a ddyrannwyd. Maent wedi cael y lefel uchaf erioed o fuddsoddiad gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, ac os nad yw ysgolion yn fodlon â'r ffordd y mae awdurdodau lleol yn chwilio am arbedion effeithlonrwydd, rhaid iddynt drafod hynny gyda'r awdurdodau hynny. Mae fy nghyd-Aelod, Sue Essex, yn gweithio gydag awdurdodau lleol i ystyried y materion hyn.

**William Graham:** Mae gennych ddifidend gwasanaeth cyhoeddus blynnyddol o £15 miliwn, a £32 miliwn wedi ei ddyrannu dros dair blynnydd ar gyfer cronfa wella. Pa fentrau addysg penodol yr ydych yn mynd i'w wella yn awr?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ond ni chlywais ail ran y cwestiwn hwnnw.

**William Graham:** Yr ail ran oedd sut yr ydych yn mynd i ddefnyddio'r arian ychwanegol a gyhoeddwyd gennych i wella addysg yng Nghymru?

**Jane Davidson:** We have announced substantial increased funding for education in Wales since we have been in Government here. If you are looking for improvements, you need go no further than the report of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education and Training in Wales, for example, which states that all aspects of education improved more last year than during any other previous year, and that the trend over the last five years has been upwards. That is right across the piece, and that is what the Assembly should be considering.

### **Cost Cynllun Brecwast Am Ddim y Llywodraeth The Cost of the Government's Free Breakfast Scheme**

**Q6 Jocelyn Davies:** Will the Minister make a statement on the cost of the Government's 'free breakfast' scheme? OAQ0365(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** A sum of £1.5 million was made available in 2004-05 to cover the anticipated costs of the pilot, and £3.5 million was provided for 2005-06, rising to £8.5 million in 2007-08. We will revisit these funding levels once we have considered the evidence from the pilot and the independent evaluation.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Around two years have passed since you made this manifesto commitment, which you claimed at the time was fully costed. When can we expect you to publish the final costings?

**Jane Davidson:** We have published costings and they are on the website. We will publish the evaluative outcomes from the last financial year when they are available. We have already given that undertaking on a number of occasions.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Are you, like me, getting heartily fed-up of the carping on of the opposition parties on this issue? They continually raise the question of finance while never referring to the clear educational benefits of this scheme and its benefits in terms of attendance. Do you agree that this is an excellent initiative organised by the Assembly Government?

**Jane Davidson:** I would agree that it is an excellent initiative. We must consider the

**Jane Davidson:** Yr ydym wedi cyhoeddi swm sylweddol fwy o arian ar gyfer addysg yng Nghymru ers inni ddod i rym. Os ydych yn chwilio am welliannau, edrychwrch yn adroddiad Prif Arolygydd Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ei Mawrhydi yng Nghymru, er enghraifft, sy'n dweud bod pob agwedd ar addysg wedi gwella mwy y llynedd nag yn ystod unrhyw flwyddyn flaenorol, a bod y duedd dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf wedi bod ar i fyny. Mae hynny'n wir yn gyffredinol, a dyna'r hyn y dylai'r Cynulliad fod yn ei ystyried.

**C6 Jocelyn Davies:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar gost cynllun 'brecwast am ddim' y Llywodraeth? OAQ0365(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Sicrhawyd bod swm o £1.5 miliwn ar gael yn 2004-05 i dalu costau rhagweladwy'r cynllun peilot, a darparwyd £3.5 miliwn ar gyfer 2005-06, yn codi i £8.5 miliwn yn 2007-08. Byddwn yn ailystyried y lefelau ariannu hyn pan fyddwn wedi ystyried y dystiolaeth o'r cynllun peilot a'r gwerthusiad annibynnol.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Mae tua dwy flynedd ers ichi wneud yr ymrwymiad maniffesto hwn, a oedd wedi ei gostio'n llawn yn ôl eich honiad ar y pryd. Pryd y gallwn ddisgwyl ichi gyhoeddi'r costau terfynol?

**Jane Davidson:** Yr ydym wedi cyhoeddi costau ac maent ar y wefan. Byddwn yn cyhoeddi'r canlyniadau wedi eu gwerthuso o'r flwyddyn ariannol ddiwethaf pan fyddant ar gael. Yr ydym eisoes wedi addo hynny droeon.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** A ydych chi, fel minnau, wedi alaru ar glywed y gwrthbleidiau'n cwyno yngylch hyn byth a beunydd? Maent yn codi cwestiwn cyllid byth a beunydd heb gyfeirio at fanteision addysgiadol amlwg y cynllun hwn a'i fanteision o ran presenoldeb. A gytunwch fod hon yn fenter ragorol sydd wedi ei threfnu gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad?

**Jane Davidson:** Byddwn yn cytuno bod hon yn fenter ragorol. Rhaid inni ystyried y

interest that the public now has in following a healthy diet, in ensuring that we have fewer obese children in future and that there is healthy provision throughout the school day. I hope that all Assembly Members will get behind an initiative that ensures that the children of Wales can start off their days with a healthy breakfast inside them.

**Nick Bourne:** Returning to the misleading promise that was made, she presupposes that every schoolchild will have a free school breakfast. The Government promised

'to provide for all primary schoolchildren to have free breakfasts',

and this was re-issued in June of this year. If that is the case, and she seems to be indicating again that she expects all schoolchildren to benefit from this, what will be the cost of all schoolchildren having that free school breakfast that you keep promising?

**Jane Davidson:** You are right; we did promise that and we are delivering on our promise to provide for all children registered at maintained primary schools in Wales to have a free healthy breakfast at school every day. We are actively promoting the scheme and encouraging schools to take part. However, we have also said from the beginning that this scheme is voluntary, and that those schools that do not participate would be accountable to their governing bodies. Therefore, in the quite proper and efficient way of government, we have ensured that we have accurate costings. Over half of the authorities are now involved and 80 schools in some of the poorest areas in Wales are delivering on this, and are positive about the programme. We will be rolling it out progressively through to 2007 to all the other schools that wish to take part.

**Nick Bourne:** Given that I accurately stated what the promise was, as you have just indicated, you should have no difficulty in answering my second question that you just ducked: what would be the cost of all schoolchildren in Wales benefiting by taking up this promise?

diddordeb sydd gan y cyhoedd yn awr mewn bwyta deiet iach, a sicrhau bod gennym lai o blant gordew yn y dyfodol a bod darpariaeth iach drwy gydol y diwrnod ysgol. Gobeithio y bydd pob Aelod Cynulliad yn gefnogol i fenter sy'n sicrhau y gall plant Cymru ddechrau'r diwrnod gyda brecwast iach yn eu boliau.

**Nick Bourne:** I ddychwelyd at yr addewid camarweiniol a wnaed, mae'n rhagdybio y caiff pob plentyn ysgol frecwast ysgol am ddim. Addawodd y Llywodraeth

ddarparu i bob plentyn ysgol gynradd gael brecwast am ddim,

ac ailgyhoeddwyd hyn ym mis Mehefin eleni. Os felly, ac ymddengys ei bod unwaith eto yn awgrymu y bydd yn disgwyli bob plentyn ysgol elwa o hyn, faint fydd y gost os bydd pob plentyn ysgol yn cael y brecwast ysgol hwnnw am ddim fel yr ydych yn ei addo o hyd?

**Jane Davidson:** Yr ydych yn iawn; addawyd hynny gennym, ac yr ydym yn cadw at ein haddewid i ddarparu ar gyfer pob plentyn wedi ei gofrestru mewn ysgolion cynradd a gynhelir yng Nghymru i gael brecwast iach am ddim yn yr ysgol bob dydd. Yr ydym yn hyrwyddo'r cynllun ac yn annog ysgolion i gymryd rhan. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym hefyd wedi dweud o'r dechrau fod y cynllun hwn yn wirfoddol, ac y byddai'r ysgolion hynny nad ydynt yn cymryd rhan yn atebol i'w cyrff llywodraethu. Felly, yn y ffordd eithaf priodol ac effeithlon o lywodraethu, yr ydym wedi sicrhau bod gennym gostau cywir. Bellach mae mwy na hanner yr awdurdodau yn rhan o'r cynllun, ac mae 80 o ysgolion yn rhai o ardaloedd tlataf Cymru yn cyflawni o ran hyn, ac yr ydym yn gadarnhaol ynglŷn â'r rhaglen. Byddwn yn ei chyflwyno'n raddol hyd at 2007 ym mhob ysgol arall sy'n dymuno cymryd rhan.

**Nick Bourne:** O gofio imi ddweud yn gywir beth oedd yr addewid, fel yr ydych newydd awgrymu, ni ddylech gael anhawster i ateb fy ail gwestiwn yr ydych newydd ei osgoi: beth fyddai'r gost pe bai pob plentyn ysgol yng Nghymru yn elwa drwy fanteisio ar yr addewid hwn?

**Jane Davidson:** As I said in my previous answer, this is a demand-led budget, so we operate on the basis on which we have take-up and we encourage further take-up. We remain committed to our promise to provide all children in Wales with that opportunity. We will provide the funding, but take-up is a matter for them at local level.

**Nick Bourne:** For an evidence-based Minister, it is stunning that you do not have the evidence of what it would cost. Let me help you out for when someone else takes over your job—and that cannot happen a minute too soon. It would cost 81.75 million in a full year. If that money is in the budget and is not being used for this, could you ensure that it goes to local authorities so that they can use it on sensible initiatives, such as providing the teaching space at Trefonnen school in Radnorshire that is needed, and helping on school transport in Radnorshire, which is also needed, and so that we are brought up to the level that exists in England, and do not have this 1 per cent cut in the school budgets, which we all know will happen?

**Jane Davidson:** There is no 1 per cent cut in the school budget, and your costings are extremely out of date. Look at the website: the costings are there in terms of the elements that are coming forward for the pilot scheme. As an evidence-based Minister, I will wait for the evidence from the pilot scheme in looking at the final budget of full roll-out. You are always happy to assume that there is a large amount of expenditure in here that you can take away. I am happy, on behalf of my party, to tell you that there is a reasonable amount of expenditure, as I have described in the answer, that we are putting into this. We will make more money available for take-up. I hope that you will be encouraging take-up so that we can ensure that we provide healthy opportunities for the children of Wales. Will you give me the confirmation that you will encourage that take-up? I think not.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I do not believe that you are asking the questions,

**Jane Davidson:** Fel y dywedais yn fy ateb blaenorol, mae hon yn gyllideb wedi ei harwain gan y galw, felly, gweithredwn ar y sail lle mae gennym geisiadau, a byddwn yn hybu ceisiadau pellach. Yr ydym yn dal wedi ymrwymo i'n haddewid i ddarparu'r cyfle hwnnw i holl blant Cymru. Byddwn ni'n darparu'r cyllid, ond mater iddynt hwy ar lefel leol yw manteisio ar y hynny.

**Nick Bourne:** O ystyried eich bod yn Weinidog sy'n gweithredu ar sail tystiolaeth, mae'n syndod nad oes gennych dystiolaeth o'r gost. Gadewch imi eich helpu gan edrych ymlaen at adeg pan fydd rhywun arall yn cymryd eich swydd—ac mae'n hen bryd i hynny ddigwydd. Byddai'n costio 81.75 miliwn mewn blwyddyn lawn. Os yw'r arian hwnnw yn y gyllideb ac os nad yw'n cael ei ddefnyddio ar gyfer hyn, a allech sicrhau y caiff ei roi i awdurdodau lleol fel y gallant ei ddefnyddio ar fentrau synhwyrol, megis darparu'r lle addysgu yn ysgol Trefonnen yn sir Faesyfed, a helpu gyda chludiant ysgol yn sir Faesyfed - mae angen hyn hefyd - ac er mwyn inni gyrraedd y lefel sy'n bodoli yn Lloegr, ac fel na chawn y toriad hwn o 1 y cant yng nghyllidebau ysgolion, y gwyddom oll a fydd yn digwydd?

**Jane Davidson:** Nid oes unrhyw doriad o 1 y cant yng nghyllideb ysgolion, ac mae eich costau yn hen iawn. Edrychwch ar y wefan: mae'r costau yno o ran yr elfennau a gaiff eu cyflwyno ar gyfer y cynllun peilot. Fel Gweinidog sy'n gweithredu ar sail tystiolaeth, byddaf yn aros am y dystiolaeth a ddaw o'r cynllun peilot wrth edrych ar y gyllideb derfynol ar gyfer rhoi'r cynllun ar waith yn llawn. Yr ydych bob amser yn barod i gymryd yn ganiataol fod swm mawr o wariant yma y gallwch ei gymryd. Yr wyf yn falch dweud wrthych, ar ran fy mhlaid, fod yna swm rhesymol o wariant, fel y disgrifiad yn fy ateb, yr ydym yn ei neilltuo ar gyfer hyn. Byddwn yn sicrhau bod mwy o arian ar gael ar gyfer ceisiadau. Gobeithio y byddwch yn hybu ceisiadau fel y gallwn sicrhau ein bod yn cynnig cyfleoedd iach i holl blant Cymru. A wnewch chi gadarnhau wrthyf y byddwch yn annog y ceisiadau hynny? Ni chredaf hynny.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni chredaf mai chi sy'n gofyn y cwestiynau, Weinidog; chi sy'n

Minister; you are providing the answers.

rholi'r atebion.

### **Cronfa Ddysgu Undebau Cymru The Wales Union Learning Fund**

**Q7 Ann Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on the success of the Wales union learning fund? OAQ0404(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** In the seven years since its launch, the Wales union learning fund has provided nearly £4 million to fund 97 projects in a variety of unions across Wales. To reflect its success, the fund has risen steadily since its launch and now stands at £1 million for 2005-06.

**Ann Jones:** As someone who benefited from a similar union learning fund, I am grateful to you for increasing the funding for the Wales union learning fund. Will you continue to ensure that this valuable learning fund is encouraged among trade unionists, because often it is those people who were failed by the education system previously who take advantage of this second chance?

**Jane Davidson:** The majority of those who benefit from the Wales union learning fund come from non-traditional learning backgrounds. That has been one of its tremendous successes. Nineteen applications were received during the 2005 bidding round and 11 projects will be supported, with total funding of £696,945 over two years. So, I can demonstrate my continued commitment and we will always look at ways of ensuring that we reach those non-traditional learners.

**C7 Ann Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar lwyddiant cronfa ddysgu undebau Cymru? OAQ0404(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Yn y saith mlynedd ers ei lansio, mae cronfa ddysgu undebau Cymru wedi darparu bron £4 miliwn i ariannu 97 o brosiectau mewn nifer o undebau ledled Cymru. Er mwyn adlewyrchu ei llwyddiant, mae'r gronfa wedi cynyddu'n raddol ers ei lansio ac mae bellach yn £1 filiwn ar gyfer 2005-06.

**Ann Jones:** Fel rhywun a gafodd fantais o gronfa ddysgu debyg i undebau, yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am gynyddu'r arian ar gyfer cronfa ddysgu undebau Cymru. A wnewch chi barhau i sicrhau y caiff y gronfa ddysgu hon ei hybu ymystg undebwyr llafur, gan mai'r bobl hynny yn aml iawn a gafodd eu siomi gan y system addysg flaenorol sy'n manteisio ar yr ail gyfle hwn?

**Jane Davidson:** Daw mwyafrif y rhai sy'n elwa o gronfa ddysgu undebau Cymru o gefndiroedd dysgu anhraddodiadol. Dyna un o'i llwyddiannau mwyaf. Cafwyd 19 o geisiadau yn ystod cylch ceisiadau 2005, a chaiff 11 o brosiectau eu cynorthwyo, gyda chyfanswm o £696,945 dros ddwy flynedd. Felly, gallaf ddangos fy ymrwymiad parhaus, a byddwn bob amser yn chwilio am ffyrdd i sicrhau ein bod yn cyrraedd y dysgwyr anhraddodiadol hynny.

### **Goruchwyliau Disgyblion ar Dripiau Ysgol The Supervision of Pupils on School Trips**

**Q8 Brynle Williams:** Does the Minister have any plans to introduce a Wales-wide policy for the supervision of pupils on school trips? OAQ0387(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Assembly Government guidance on the supervision of pupils on school trips, 'Health and Safety of Pupils on Educational Visits', has been available since 1999. The guidance advises schools on how to plan and manage off-site visits to ensure, as far as possible, the health and safety of

**C8 Brynle Williams:** A oes gan y Gweinidog unrhyw gynlluniau i gyflwyno polisi Cymru gyfan ar gyfer goruchwyliau disgyblion ar dripiau ysgol? OAQ0387(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Mae canllawiau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar oruchwyliau disgyblion ar deithiau ysgol, 'Iechyd a Diogelwch Disgyblion ar Ymweliadau Addysgol', wedi bod ar gael er 1999. Mae'r canllaw yn cyngori ysgolion sut i gynllunio a rheoli ymwdiadau y tu allan i safle'r ysgol,

participating pupils.

**Brynle Williams:** I am pleased to hear that. However, is there sufficient funding to ensure that this goes ahead? You have said that you have put measures in place, but is there sufficient funding to protect our valuable assets, the children, on school trips?

**Jane Davidson:** The guidance provides core principles around health and safety. It is important because we need to ensure consistency across the piece. We are always looking for opportunities to renew the guidance in the light of experiences of individual events.

i sicrhau, cyn belled â phosibl, iechyd a diogelwch y disgylion sy'n cymryd rhan.

**Brynle Williams:** Yr wyf yn falch o glywed hynny. Fodd bynnag, a oes arian digonol i sicrhau y bydd hyn yn digwydd? Yr ydych wedi dweud ichi roi cynlluniau ar waith, ond a oes arian digonol i ddiogelu ein hasedau gwerthfawr, sef plant, ar deithiau ysgol?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'r canllaw yn darparu egwyddorion craidd yn ymwneud ag iechyd a diogelwch. Mae'n bwysig am fod angen inni sicrhau cysondeb yn gyffredinol. Yr ydym yn chwilio am gylleoedd o hyd i adnewyddu'r canllawiau yng ngoleuni profiadau digwyddiadau unigol.

### **Damweiniau mewn Ysgolion Uwchradd Accidents in Secondary Schools**

**Q9 David Melding:** How many accidents requiring hospital treatment occurred in Welsh secondary schools in the latest year for which statistics are available?  
OAQ0397(ELL)

**C9 David Melding:** Faint o ddamweiniau lle yr oedd angen triniaeth ysbyty a ddigwyddodd mewn ysgolion uwchradd yng Nghymru yn y flwyddyn ddiweddaraf y mae ystadegau ar gael ar ei chyfer?  
OAQ0397(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Using data from the all-Wales injury surveillance system, it is estimated that 11,400 injuries to children aged between 11 and 16 which occurred in an educational establishment were treated in an accident and emergency or casualty department in Wales during 2003, the last year for which we have figures.

**Jane Davidson:** Gan ddefnyddio data o system gwyliadwriaeth anafiadau Cymru gyfan, amcangyfrifir bod 11,400 o anafiadau i blant rhwng 11 ac 16 oed mewn sefydliad addysgol wedi cael eu trin mewn adran damweiniau ac achosion brys, neu adrannau damweiniau yng Nghymru yn ystod 2003, sef y flwyddyn ddiwetharaf y mae gennym ffigurau ar ei chyfer.

3.00 p.m.

**David Melding:** Do you believe, as I do, that a most thorough risk assessment ought to be made of the playing of contact sports in secondary schools, particularly those sports graded by age band rather than physical development, and that over 11,000 accidents that require hospital treatment is far too many?

**David Melding:** A ydych chi, fel finnau, yn credu y dylid gwneud risg trylwyr iawn mewn cysylltiad â chwaraeon cyswllt mewn ysgolion uwchradd, yn arbennig y chwaraeon hynny a gaiff eu graddio yn ôl band oedran yn hytrach na datblygiad corfforol, a bod dros 11,000 o ddamweiniau lle mae angen triniaeth yn yr ysbyty lawer yn ormod?

**Jane Davidson:** It is worth pointing out that that number went down by 1,000 between 2001 and 2003, and until we are able to interrogate that data better, we will not have

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'n werth nodi bod y nifer wedi gostwng 1,000 rhwng 2001 a 2003, a nes y gallwn archwilio'r data hwnnw'n well, ni fydd gennym ddarlun clir

a clear picture about the level to which that relates to contact or other sports. I would be happy to look at whether we can get better data on injuries from contact sports, but I am not confident that we can at the moment.

am y graddau y mae hynny'n gysylltiedig â chwaraeon cyffwrdd neu chwaraeon eraill. Byddwn yn fwy na bodlon edrych i weld a allwn gael gwell data am anafiadau mewn chwaraeon cyffwrdd, ond nid wyf yn hyderus y gallwn wneud hynny ar hyn o bryd.

### Blaenoriaethau ar gyfer Addysg Uwch Priorities for Higher Education

**Q10 Nick Bourne:** Will the Minister make a statement on her priorities for higher education in Wales? OAQ0374(ELL)

**C10 Nick Bourne:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ei blaenoriaethau ar gyfer addysg uwch yng Nghymru? OAQ0374(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** My priority is to secure a strong, effective sector, collaborating to contribute to the economic, cultural, social and civic life of Wales through research, wider access and participation, and excellence in teaching and learning. I believe that higher education should be available to anyone who can benefit from it.

**Jane Davidson:** Fy mlaenoriaeth yw sicrhau sector cryf, effeithiol, sy'n cydweithio i gyfrannu at fywyd economaidd, diwylliannol, cymdeithasol a dinesig Cymru drwy waith ymchwil, mynediad a chyfranogiad ehangach, a rhagoriaeth mewn addysgu a dysgu. Credaf y dylai addysg uwch fod ar gael i unrhyw un a all elwa ohoni.

**Nick Bourne:** Could the Minister update the Assembly on the attitude that she will be adopting to that part of the resolution that we passed in relation to top-up fees for courses that are not available in Wales? People from Wales will have to go to England or elsewhere to study those courses, such as veterinary science, for example. Could she give an indication as to how she is going about progressing that part of the resolution to see what help can be provided to those students?

**Nick Bourne:** A allai'r Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i'r Cynulliad am yr agwedd y bydd yn ei mabwysiadu yn y rhan honno o'r cynnig a basiwyd gennym mewn cysylltiad â ffioedd dysgu atodol ar gyfer cyrsiau nad ydynt ar gael yng Nghymru? Bydd pobl o Gymru yn gorfol mynd i Loegr neu rywle arall i astudio'r cyrsiau hynny, megis gwyddoniaeth filfeddygol, er enghraifft. A allai roi awgrym sut y mae'n datblygu'r rhan honno o'r cynnig i weld pa gymorth y gellir ei ddarparu i'r myfyrwyr hynny?

**Jane Davidson:** I will be reporting to committee at appropriate moments on all of the aspects that we took forward in the motion that we agreed in Plenary, so Assembly Members can see action being taken forward, as we agreed.

**Jane Davidson:** Byddaf yn adrodd yn ôl i'r pwylgor ar adegau priodol am bob un o'r agweddau a dderbyniwyd gennym yn y cynnig a gytunwyd yn y Cyfarfod Llawn, fel y gall Aelodau'r Cynulliad weld y camau yn cael eu gweithredu, fel y cytunwyd gennym.

### Cymorth i Fyfyrwyr Rhan Amser Support for Part-time Students

**C12 Eleanor Burnham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar gefnogaeth i fyfyrwyr rhan amser? OAQ0390(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Mae myfyrwyr rhan amser

**Q12 Eleanor Burnham:** Will the Minister make a statement on support for part-time students? OAQ0390(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Part-time students living in

sydd yn byw yng Nghymru yn cael gwneud cais am grant dysgu'r Cynulliad ac am grantiau am ffioedd a chostau statudol os ydynt yn astudio mewn coleg addysg bellach.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Gan fod cyrsiau rhan amser yn allweddol i lawer o fyfyrwyr gael mynediad i addysg bellach ac uwch, pa fuddsoddiad fydd ar gael gan eich Llywodraeth ar gyfer yr adolygiad a argymhellwyd gan gomisiwn Rees yn ddiweddar?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae cytundeb ar draws y Cynulliad i gefnogi argymhelliaid comisiwn Rees i gynnal adolygiad ar fyfyrwyr rhan amser. Bydd popeth o dan ystyriaeth yn yr adolygiad.

Wales can apply for the Assembly's learning grant and grants for fees and statutory costs if they study in a college of further education.

**Eleanor Burnham:** As part-time courses are key to enabling many students to access further and higher education, what kind of investment will be available from your Government for the review recommended recently by the Rees commission?

**Jane Davidson:** There is agreement across the Assembly to support the Rees commission's recommendation to undertake a review of part-time students. Everything will be considered in the review.

### Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order

**Mark Isherwood:** I wish to raise a point of order under Standing Order Nos. 7.2 and 7.7. Have you received any requests from the Minister for Economic Development and Transport to correct his statement yesterday that there are only two local Members in Flintshire? In fact, under the current electoral arrangements, law and practice, Flintshire has six local Members.

**The Presiding Officer:** I believe that I was presiding during the statement made yesterday, and I heard what the Minister said. It was in the usual vein of our discussions of this matter in this Chamber, and I heard nothing out of order. Had I done so, I would have interrupted at the time, and would have been prompted to do so, no doubt, by Members and those who advise me. There are at least two local Members in Flintshire.

**Elin Jones:** Codaf bwynt o drefn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 7.7(v), ar iaith sydd yn camwahaniaethu neu sydd yn peri tramgywydd.

Ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad, bu'n fater o falchder i mi fod siaradwyr Cymraeg a Saesneg yma yn cael eu trin yn gwbl gydradd. Nid oes gwahaniaethau ar sail gallu yn y Gymraeg

**Mark Isherwood:** Dymunaf godi pwynt o drefn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhifau 7.2 a 7.7. A ydych wedi cael unrhyw geisiadau gan y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth i gywiro ei ddatganiad ddoe mai dau Aelod lleol yn unig sydd yn sir y Fflint? Mewn gwirionedd, o dan y trefniadau etholaethol, cyfraith ac arferion cyfredol, mae gan sir y Fflint chwe Aelod lleol.

**Y Llywydd:** Credaf mai fi oedd yn llywyddu yn ystod y datganiad a wnaed ddoe, a chlywais yr hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog. Yr oedd yn dilyn cywair arferol ein trafodaethau ar y mater hwn yn y Siambraon, ac ni chlywais unrhyw beth a oedd allan o drefn. Pe bawn wedi clywed rhywbeth, byddwn wedi ymyrryd ar y pryd, ac wedi cael fy annog i wneud hynny, yn ddiamau, gan yr Aelodau a'r rhai sy'n fy nghynghori. Mae o leiaf ddau Aelod lleol yn sir y Fflint.

**Elin Jones:** I wish to raise a point of order under Standing Order No. 7.7(v) on discriminatory or offensive language.

Since the Assembly was established, it has been source of pride to me that Welsh and English speakers here are treated on a completely equal basis. There is no

neu'r Saesneg yn ein trafodaethau yn y Cynulliad.

Torrwyd y cydraddoldeb hwn ddoe yn ystod y ddadl ar 'Iaith Pawb', pan wahaniaethodd Denise Idris Jones rhyngddi hi fel siaradwraig Gymraeg ac Owen John Thomas fel dysgwr, gan roi'r argraff glir i mi ei bod yn ystyried ei sylwadau ef fel dysgwr yn eilradd i'w rhai hi. Mae'n siŵr y bydd Denise Idris Jones am gymryd y cyfle i ymddiheuro i Owen John, ac i ddysgwyr eraill, os mai camargraff yw hyn ar fy rhan i. Fodd bynnag, bwriad fy mhwnt o drefn yw gofyn i chi, Lywydd, a ydych yn barod i edrych ar y Cofnod ac ystyried a dorrwyd Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.7 gan Denise Idris Jones ddoe.

**Y Llywydd:** Nid oeddwn yn llywyddu ddoe, ond yr wyf wedi cael cyfle i edrych ar y Cofnod. Sylwaf eich bod, Elin Jones, wedi ymyrryd ar araith Denise Idris Jones a'i bod hi wedi datgan bod ganddi bob parch tuag at Owen John Thomas.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Y rheswm y dywedais hynny—a gwn efallai na ddylaswn fod wedi ei ddweud, oherwydd, chwarae teg, mae Owen John Thomas wedi gwneud pob ymdrech i ddysgu'r iaith, ac mae gennyf barch mawr iddo am hynny—ond teimlaf efallai nad yw Aelodau Plaid Cymru yn meddwl bod yr iaith Gymraeg mor agos i'm calon i ag ydyw i'w calonnau hwy.

**Y Llywydd:** Nid yw'n fater i mi beth sydd wrth galon neb—yr hyn sy'n fater i mi yw beth sydd ardafod pobl, a hawl pobl i ddefnyddio'r iaith Gymraeg ar sail cwbl gyfartal. Ni chredaf fod unrhyw Reol Sefydlog nac unrhyw fater o drefn wedi ei dorri, yn enwedig gan bod datganiad pellach wedi cael ei wneud. Fodd bynnag, apelias ar y Cynulliad i barhau â'r agwedd adeiladol ynglŷn â chyfartaedd iaith sydd wedi nodweddu ein gweithdrefnau o'r dechrau. Mae wedi bod yn llawer gwell nag yr oeddwn yn ei ddisgwyl, fel un sy'n gyn gadeirydd Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg ac sy'n cofio'r gwastraff anadl yng Nghymru mewn dadleuon ieithyddol.

discrimination on the basis of ability in Welsh or in English in our deliberations in the Assembly.

That equality was broken yesterday during the 'Iaith Pawb' debate, when Denise Idris Jones differentiated between herself as a Welsh speaker and Owen John Thomas as a learner, giving me the clear impression that she considered his comments as a learner as inferior to hers. I am sure Denise Idris Jones would wish to take this opportunity to apologise to Owen John, and to other learners, if this is a mistaken impression on my behalf. However, my point of order is to ask you, Presiding Officer, whether you are willing to review the Record and consider whether Standing Order No. 7.7 was broken by Denise Idris Jones yesterday.

**The Presiding Officer:** I was not presiding yesterday, but I have had an opportunity to review the Record. I note that you, Elin Jones, intervened during Denise Idris Jones's speech, and that she had stated that she had every respect for Owen John Thomas.

**Denise Idris Jones:** The reason why I said it—and I know that possibly I should not have said it, because, fair play, Owen John Thomas has made every effort to learn the language, and I have a great deal of respect for him for that—but I feel that maybe Plaid Cymru Members do not believe that the Welsh language is as close to my heart as it is to theirs.

**The Presiding Officer:** It is not a matter for me what is close to anyone's heart—what is a matter for me is what is on people's tongues, and people's right to use the Welsh language on a completely equal basis. I do not believe any Standing Order or any matter of order has been broken, particularly as a further statement has been made. However, I appeal to the Assembly to continue the constructive attitude towards language equality that has been a feature of our deliberations from the outset. It has been much better than I had expected, as one who is a former chair of the Welsh Language Board and who remembers the time wasted in Wales on linguistic arguments.

**Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau o dan Ddeddf Ombwdsmon Gwasanaethau  
Cyhoeddus (Cymru) 2005 i'r Prif Weinidog  
Delegation of Functions under the Public Services Ombudsman (Wales) Act  
2005 to the First Minister**

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** I **Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under section 62(1)(b) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, resolves to delegate all functions of the National Assembly contained in or under the Public Services Ombudsman (Wales) Act 2005 to the Assembly First Minister, save those which by law cannot be so delegated:*

*Nothing in the motion will have the effect of reducing the pre-eminence of the authority of the full Assembly or of reducing the role of the Assembly Committees in the exercise of the above functions.*

*This delegation will be made in the knowledge that those functions will, as appropriate, be further delegated to the appropriate Assembly Minister and to staff.* (NDM2529)

As Members are aware, the purpose of this motion is to delegate several Assembly functions under the Public Services Ombudsman (Wales) Act 2005 to the First Minister. It is an essential first step in the process of implementing this Act so that the Public Services Ombudsman for Wales can become fully operational from April next year.

**Brynle Williams:** My party's position on this is clear—we welcome the Public Services Ombudsman (Wales) Act 2005. No-one can deny that this Act has been developed in recent years to give Wales a more joined-up complaints procedure, which was clearly lacking. This Act sees the abolition of the Commissioner for Local Administration in Wales, the Health Service Commissioner for Wales and the Welsh Administration Ombudsman. Having one body overseeing the three offices in Wales has been effective, and I am delighted that the offices are in an Objective 1 area.

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan adran 62(1)(b) Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn penderfynu dirprwyo i'r Prif Weinidog holl swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a gynhwysir yn neu o dan Ddeddf Ombwdsmon Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus (Cymru) 2005, ac eithrio'r rhai na ellir, yn ôl y gyfraith, eu dirprwyo yn y modd hwnnw.*

*Ni fydd dim yn y cynnig hwn yn lleihau goruchafiaeth awdurdod y Cynulliad llawn nac yn lleihau rôl Pwyllgorau'r Cynulliad wrth arfer y swyddogaethau uchod.*

*Gwneir y dirprwyo hwn ar y ddealltwriaeth y dirprwyir y swyddogaethau hynny ymhellach, fel y bo'n briodol, i'r Gweinidog Cynulliad priodol ac i staff.* (NDM2529)

Fel y gŵyr yr Aelodau, diben y cynnig hwn yw dirprwyo nifer o swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad o dan Ddeddf Ombwdsmon Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus (Cymru) 2005 i'r Prif Weinidog. Mae'n gam cyntaf hanfodol yn y broses o weithredu'r Ddeddf hon, fel y gall Ombwdsmon Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Cymru fod yn gweithredu'n llawn o fis Ebrill y flwyddyn nesaf.

**Brynle Williams:** Mae safbwyt fy mhlaid ar hyn yn glir—yr ydym yn croesawu Deddf Ombwdsmon Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus (Cymru) 2005. Ni all neb wadu nad yw'r Ddeddf hon wedi ei datblygu dros y blynnyddoedd diwethaf i roi gweithdrefn gwyno fwy cydgysylltiedig nad oedd gennym o'r blaen yn sicr. Drwy'r Ddeddf hon, mae'r Comisiynydd dros Weinyddu Lleol yng Nghymru, Comisiynydd Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cymru ac Ombwdsmon Gweinyddiaeth Cymru yn cael eu dileu. Mae cael un corff i oruchwylion tair swyddfa yng Nghymru wedi bod yn effeithiol, ac yr wyf

wrth fy modd fod y swyddfeydd mewn ardal Amcan 1.

This Act introduces a clear process for people who wish to make a complaint to the ombudsman. This is essential for good governance, and I would like to see as many complaints dealt with as swiftly as possible in order for the public to see that its concerns are listened to and acted upon. The ombudsman now has several new and important powers bestowed on him. He has the powers to investigate in his own right, and also to seek to resolve disputes between complainants and the relevant public bodies without the need for a formal investigation. This is an important way forward for democracy.

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** There is not much to say in reply. We are all pleased to get this piece of legislation through. It delegates the provisions of the Act to the First Minister, as appropriate.

Mae'r Ddeddf hon yn cyflwyno proses glir ar gyfer pobl sydd am gyflwyno cŵyn i'r ombwdsmon. Mae hyn yn hanfodol ar gyfer llywodraethu da, a hoffwn weld cynifer â phosibl o gwynion yn cael eu trin mor gyflym â phosibl, fel y gall y cyhoedd weld ein bod yn gwrando ac yn gweithredu ar eu pryderon. Mae gan yr ombwdsmon bellach nifer o bwerau newydd a phwysig. Mae ganddo'r pwerau i ymchwilio, a hefyd i geisio datrys anghydfod rhwng achwynwyr a'r cyrff cyhoeddus perthnasol heb fod angen ymchwiliad ffurfiol. Mae hyn yn gam pwysig ymlaen ar gyfer democratiaeth.

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Nid oes llawer i'w ddweud mewn ymateb. Yr ydym bob un yn falch fod y darn hwn o ddeddfwriaeth wedi'i basio. Mae'n dirprwyo darpariaethau'r Ddeddf i'r Prif Weinidog, fel sy'n briodol.

*Cynnig (NDM2529): O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2529): For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

- Andrews, Leighton
- Barrett, Lorraine
- Bates, Mick
- Black, Peter
- Burnham, Eleanor
- Chapman, Christine
- Cuthbert, Jeff
- Davidson, Jane
- Davies, Andrew
- Davies, Jocelyn
- Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
- Essex, Sue
- Francis, Lisa
- Gibbons, Brian
- Graham, William
- Gregory, Janice
- Griffiths, John
- Gwyther, Christine
- Hart, Edwina
- Hutt, Jane
- Idris Jones, Denise
- Isherwood, Mark
- James, Irene
- Jones, Alun Ffred
- Jones, Ann
- Jones, Carwyn
- Jones, Elin
- Jones, Helen Mary

Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Addysg Uwch 2004 (Cychwyn Rhif 2 a  
Darpariaeth Drosiannol) (Cymru) 2005  
Approve The Higher Education Act 2004 (Commencement No. 2 and  
Transitional Provisions) (Wales) Order 2005**

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose that **Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Higher Education Act 2004 (Commencement No. 2 and Transitional Provisions) (Wales) Order 2005 a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 23 June 2005. (NDM2531)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 28 June 2005 in relation to the draft the Higher Education Act 2004 (Commencement No. 2 and Transitional Provisions) (Wales) Order 2005; and*

*2. approves that the Higher Education Act 2004 (Commencement No. 2 and Transitional Provisions) (Wales) Order 2005 is made in accordance with:*

*a) the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 23 June 2005; and*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Deddf Addysg Uwch 2004 (Cychwyn Rhif 2 a Darpariaeth Drosiannol) (Cymru) 2005 y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 23 Mehefin 2005. (NDM2531)*

Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Mehefin 2005 ynghylch y Gorchymyn Deddf Addysg Uwch 2004 (Cychwyn Rhif 2 a Darpariaeth Drosiannol) (Cymru) 2005 drafft; a*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Deddf Addysg Uwch 2004 (Cychwyn Rhif 2 a Darpariaeth Drosiannol) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:*

*a) y Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 23 Mehefin 2005; a*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y*

*Office on 17 June 2005. (NDM2532)*

*Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Mehefin 2005.  
(NDM2532)*

3.10 p.m.

The Order will commence certain provisions under the Higher Education Act 2004. It will commence provisions dealing with the Arts and Humanities Research Council, established under the Act. The Act creates a statutory UK-wide Arts and Humanities Research Council to replace the existing Arts and Humanities Research Board, and for the direct funding of arts and humanities research by the Assembly. This puts arts and humanities research on the same footing as science-based research, and reflects its importance. The Order also transfers to the Assembly certain functions relating to the provision of financial support to students by way of loans or grant, under section 22 of the Teaching and Higher Education Act 1998. This will enable us to deliver on student support to Welsh students from the academic year 2006-07. I commend the Order to the Assembly.

Bydd y Gorchymyn yn cychwyn darpariaethau penodol o dan Ddeddf Addysg Uwch 2004. Bydd yn cychwyn darpariaethau'n ymwneud â'r Cyngor Ymchwil i'r Celfyddydau a'r Dyniaethau. Mae'r Ddeddf yn creu Cyngor Ymchwil statudol i'r Celfyddydau a'r Dyniaethau ar gyfer y DU gyfan i ddisodli'r Bwrdd Ymchwil presennol i'r Celfyddydau a'r Dyniaethau, ac ar gyfer ariannu ymchwil i'r celfyddydau a'r dyniaethau yn uniongyrchol gan y Cynulliad. Mae hyn yn rhoi i ymchwil i'r celfyddydau a'r dyniaethau yr un statws ag ymchwil wyddonol, ac mae'n adlewyrchu ei phwysigrwydd. Mae'r Gorchymyn hefyd yn trosglwyddo rhai swyddogaethau i'r Cynulliad yn ymwneud â darparu cymorth ariannol i fyfyrwyr drwy fenthyciadau neu grant, o dan adran 22 o Ddeddf Addysgu ac Addysg Uwch 1998. Bydd hyn yn ein galluogi i roi cymorth i fyfyrwyr o Gymru o'r flwyddyn academaidd 2006-07 ymlaen. Cymeradwyaf y Gorchymyn i'r Cynulliad.

**Janet Ryder:** The aspects of the Act that are most welcome are the development of the arts and humanities research facility, and, as the Minister said, the act of putting arts and humanities on an equal footing with science subjects. We hope that, when we look ahead to the future of higher education in Wales, that sector will be able to get a good share of the research money when it is distributed, to enable the research to develop the Welsh economy. There are many ways in which arts and humanities subjects can help to develop the Welsh economy, along with science. It is high time that these had equal status.

**Janet Ryder:** Yr agweddau ar y Ddeddf sydd i'w croesawu fwyaf yw datblygu'r cyfleuster ymchwil i'r celfyddydau a'r dyniaethau, ac fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, y weithred o sicrhau bod y celfyddydau a'r dyniaethau yn cael yr un statws â phynciau gwyddonol. Gobeithiwn, pan edrychwn ymlaen at ddyfodol addysg uwch yng Nghymru, y bydd y sector yn gallu cael cyfran dda o'r arian ymchwil pan gaiff ei ddosbarthu, er mwyn galluogi'r ymchwil i ddatblygu economi Cymru. Mae llawer ffordd y gall pynciau celfyddydol a'r dyniaethau helpu datblygu economi Cymru, ar y cyd â gwyddoniaeth. Mae'n hen bryd i'r rhain gael statws cyfartal.

**William Graham:** We broadly welcome the commencement Order. It contains the power to fund arts and humanities research activities in relation to Wales, which will allow a wider promotion and use of the Welsh language in all aspects of higher education. We gladly accept the transfer of functions that will bring Wales into line with devolved issues in Scotland and Northern

**William Graham:** Croesawn y Gorchymyn cychwyn yn gyffredinol. Mae'n cynnwys y grym i ariannu gweithgareddau ymchwil i'r celfyddydau a'r dyniaethau mewn perthynas â Chymru. Bydd yn caniatáu hyrwyddo a defnyddio'r iaith Gymraeg yn ehangach ym mhob agwedd ar addysg uwch. Yr ydym yn croesawu'r broses o drosglwyddo swyddogaethau, a fydd yn sicrhau bod

Ireland, as regards allowing full discretion for the funding systems for higher education and student support. We note that the failure to commence the relevant provisions of the Higher Education Act 2004 will result in the National Assembly for Wales being unable to regulate the student support arrangement for students already resident in Wales.

We expect the Minister to be mindful of the Assembly agreement on student support, and to seek to ensure that the spirit of the agreement is incorporated into policies, as directed by the Secretary of State, until September 2006, and beyond this date, when the matters become the responsibility of the Assembly. We note with concern the discrepancy in the figures given for the cost of implementing the Act in the United Kingdom, which range between £430 million and £635 million. Will the Minister give us an assurance that she has agreed with the Secretary of State for Education and Skills the full funding for the transfer of student finance functions? I know that she had some difficulty with figures earlier this afternoon, so will she specify the amount as soon as possible?

We appreciate that local education authorities in Wales administer the Assembly learning grant, and that they would not be required to run two parallel student support systems after the Department for Education and Skills-administered student system is transferred to the National Assembly. However, we expect the Minister to reflect the agreement of non-means-tested funding for students in Wales once this transfer has been finalised.

**Peter Black:** We welcome the commencement Order. It is important that we now get on with the work of implementing the agreement that the Assembly came to only a week or two ago, in terms of providing proper student support and assistance with fees across Wales. It is imperative that this is in place so that universities and students know what regime they are to expect after 2006-07, and so that we can get on with the work of implementing the agreement that was

Cymru yn yr un sefyllfa â'r Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon o ran caniatáu disgrifiwn llawn ar gyfer y systemau ariannu ar gyfer addysg uwch a chymorth i fyfyrwyr. Sylwn y bydd methu â chychwyn darpariaethau perthnasol Deddf Addysg Uwch 2004 yn golygu na all Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru reoleiddio'r trefniant cymorth i fyfyrwyr ar gyfer myfyrwyr sydd eisoes yn byw yng Nghymru.

Disgwyliwn i'r Gweinidog gadw mewn cof gytundeb y Cynulliad ar gymorth i fyfyrwyr, a cheisio sicrhau y caiff ysbryd y cytundeb ei ymgorffori mewn polisiau, yn unol â chyfarwyddyd yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol, tan fis Medi 2006, ac wedi'r dyddiad hwnnw, pan ddaw'n gyfrifoldeb y Cynulliad. Sylwn gyda phryder yr anghysondeb yn y ffigurau a roddir am y gost o weithredu'r Ddeddf yn y Deyrnas Unedig, sy'n amrywio o £430 miliwn i £635 miliwn. A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi sicrwydd inni ei bod wedi cytuno'r cyllid llawn gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Addysg a Sgiliau ar gyfer trosglwyddo swyddogaethau'n ymwneud â chyllid myfyrwyr? Gwn iddi gael ychydig anhawster gyda ffigurau yn gynharach y prynhawn yma, felly, a wnaiff bennu'r swm cynynt â phosibl?

Sylweddolwn mai awdurdodau addysg lleol yng Nghymru sy'n gweinyddu grant dysgu'r Cynulliad, ac na fyddai gofyn iddynt weithredu dwy system gyfochrog o gymorth i fyfyrwyr ar ôl i'r system myfyrwyr a weinyddir gan yr Adran Addysg a Sgiliau gael ei throsglwyddo i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Fodd bynnag, disgwyliwn i'r Gweinidog adlewyrchu'r cytundeb cyllid i fyfyrwyr yng Nghymru nad yw'n seiliedig ar brawf modd wedi i'r trosglwyddiad hwn gael ei gwblhau.

**Peter Black:** Croesawn y Gorchymyn cychwyn. Mae'n bwysig yn awr inni fwrrw ymlaen â'r gwaith o weithredu'r cytundeb y penderfynwyd arno gan y Cynulliad wythnos neu ddwy yn ôl, o ran darparu cymorth priodol i fyfyrwyr a chymorth gyda ffioedd ledled Cymru. Mae'n hollbwysig i hyn fod ar waith er mwyn sicrhau bod prifysgolion a myfyrwyr yn gwybod pa system y gallant ei disgwyi ar ôl 2006-07, ac er mwyn inni allu mynd ymlaen â'r gwaith o weithredu'r cytundeb y daethpwyd iddo ar gynigion

reached on the Rees commission proposals. The agreement will ensure that students have help with fees and do not have to pay top-up fees in Wales. This is a unique situation that has been brought about only because of devolution and the co-operation of all the parties in the Assembly, and particularly by the actions of the opposition parties in ensuring that the measure was taken.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I agree with a great deal of what has been said, but I say to the opposition parties that the only party that was able to bring devolution of this measure to Wales was the Labour Party, and we did that because we believed that it was right for us to take an overall view of student support issues. I am very pleased that we are now properly starting to debate the outcomes of the Rees report, which outline clearly the way in which we should move forward. We will be taking that agenda forward alongside the motion agreed in the Assembly.

In terms of issues around the transitional functions, William is right to point out that the Order has a transitional provision because that provision needs to be in place until the functions transfer to the Assembly in 2006, but that is just in relation to the funding mechanism. All other matters of higher education policy were in the hands of the Assembly prior to this Act, and remain so now. I am happy to reaffirm once again that we had proper dialogue with our colleagues in the UK in terms of the transfer of funding in relation to this issue.

I reject the notion that I had difficulty with figures earlier. As I said earlier, we use an evidence base for our policy delivery, so we need actual figures before we can make actual assumptions about delivery mechanisms. However, I am happy to make the information available to you.

comisiwn Rees. Bydd y cytundeb yn sicrhau bod myfyrwyr yn cael cymorth gyda ffioedd ac nad oes rhaid iddynt dalu ffioedd atodol yng Nghymru. Mae hon yn sefyllfa unigryw sydd wedi deillio'n gyfan gwbl o ddatganoli a chydweithrediad pob plaid yn y Cynulliad, ac yn arbennig o gamau gweithredu'r gwrthbleidiau i sicrhau cymryd y cam hwn.

#### **Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):**

Cytunaf â llawer o'r hyn a ddywedwyd, ond dywedaf wrth y gwrthbleidiau mai'r unig blaids a fu'n gyfrifol am ddatganoli'r mesur hwn i Gymru oedd y Blaid Lafur, a gwnaethom hynny am ein bod yn credu ei bod yn briodol inni ystyried cymorth i fyfyrwyr yn ei gyfanwydd. Yr wyf yn falch ein bod erbyn hyn yn dechrau trafod canlyniadau adroddiad Rees o ddifrif, sy'n amlinellu'n glir i ba gyfeiriad y dylem fynd. Byddwn yn datblygu'r agenda honno ochr yn ochr â'r cynnig y cytunwyd arno yn y Cynulliad.

O ran materion yn ymwneud â swyddogaethau trosiannol, mae William yn iawn i ddangos bod darpariaeth drosiannol yn y Gorchymyn oherwydd bod angen i'r ddarpariaeth honno fod ar waith nes i'r swyddogaethau gael eu trosglwyddo i'r Cynulliad yn 2006, ond mewn perthynas â'r dull ariannu'n unig y mae hynny. Yr oedd pob mater arall yn ymwneud â pholisi addysg uwch yn nwylod Cynulliad cyn y Ddeddf hon, ac mae'n parhau felly yn awr. Yr wyf yn falch cael cadarnhau unwaith yn rhagor inni gael trafodaeth briodol gyda'n cyd-aelodau yn y DU am drosglwyddo cyllid mewn perthynas â'r mater hwn.

Gwrthodaf yr awgrym imi gael anhawster gyda ffigurau yn gynharach. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, yr ydym yn defnyddio dystiolaeth fel sail ar gyfer cyflwyno'n polisiau. Felly, mae angen ffigurau arnom cyn y gallwn wneud unrhyw dybiaethau ynghyrchulliau darparu. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn ddigon parod i ddarparu'r wybodaeth honno ichi.

*Cynnig (NDM2531): O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM2531): For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2532): O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2532): For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff

Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwin  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Ffioedd mewn Sefydliadau Addysg Uwch (Cymru)  
2005**

**Approval of the Fees in Higher Education Institutions (Wales) Regulations 2005**

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Fees in Higher Education Institutions (Wales) Regulations 2005, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 28 June 2005. (NDM2533)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales approves that the Fees in Higher Education Institutions (Wales) Regulations 2005 is*

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Ffioedd mewn Sefydliadau Addysg Uwch (Cymru) 2005 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Mehefin 2005. (NDM2533)*

Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn cymeradwyo bod y Rheoliadau Ffioedd mewn Sefydliadau Addysg Uwch (Cymru)*

*made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 28 June 2005. (NDM2534)*

These regulations will set the tuition fee level for the academic year 2006-07 at £1,200. This fulfils the Assembly Government's manifesto commitment not to introduce variable fees in the lifetime of this Assembly, and will, I am sure, be welcomed by all Members. The wider package of student support for the academic year 2006-07 will be subject to consultation over the summer. Under this package of support, from September 2006, no student will have to pay upfront fees—there will be loans for fees. No student will have to start repaying fee loans until they are earning £15,000 and above. There will be a new means-tested maintenance grant, incorporating the Assembly learning grant, of up to £2,700. A maintenance loan will be available. These regulations will cover the academic year 2006-07, and I commend these regulations to Plenary.

**Janet Ryder:** It is interesting to note that, as we said when we debated this issue in the Chamber not too long ago, the Assembly in Wales has decided to supply the additional fees to their students and the Scottish Parliament has decided to supply additional fees for its students studying at home. This now lays the burden well and truly back on the Westminster Government and on English MPs to ensure that they get a better settlement for students in England, as that would also have a great effect on the higher education systems here in Wales and in Scotland, and to think again about how higher education is funded, taking it out of the marketplace completely and funding it properly as a fully funded public service.

3.20 p.m.

**William Graham:** We note the wider political will within the Assembly and recognise that this has been reflected in the agreement to prioritise higher education in Wales. We believe that this is a major step forward in the creation of a knowledge-based

*2005 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Mehefin 2005. (NDM2534)*

Bydd y rheoliadau hyn yn pennu lefel ffioedd dysgu am y flwyddyn 2006-07 yn £1,200. Mae hynny'n cyflawni ymrwymiad manifesto Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i beidio â chyflwyno ffioedd amrywiadwy yn ystod y cyfnod y Cynulliad hwn, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y caiff ei groesawu gan bob Aelod. Ymgynghorir ar y pecyn ehangach o gymorth i fyfyrwyr am y flwyddyn academaidd 2006-07 dros yr haf. O dan y pecyn cymorth hwn, o fis Medi 2006 ni fydd yn rhaid i unrhyw fyfyrwr dalu ffioedd cyn cychwyn—bydd benthyciadau ar gael i dalu ffioedd. Ni fydd yn rhaid i unrhyw fyfyrwr ddechrau ad-dalu benthyciadau ar gyfer ffioedd nes bydd yn ennill £15,000 neu fwy. Bydd grant cynhaliaeth newydd yn seiliedig ar brawf modd, gan ymgorffori grant dysgu'r Cynulliad, hyd at £2,700. Bydd benthyciad cynhaliaeth ar gael. Bydd y rheoliadau hyn yn cwmpasu'r flwyddyn academaidd 2006-07, a chymeradwyaf y rheoliadau hyn i'r Cyfarfod Llawn.

**Janet Ryder:** Mae'n ddiddorol sylwi, fel y dywedwyd pan drafodwyd y mater hwn gennym yn y Siambro dro yn ôl, i'r Cynulliad yng Nghymru benderfynu rhoi'r ffioedd ychwanegol i'w myfyrwyr ac i Senedd yr Alban benderfynu rhoi ffioedd ychwanegol i'w myfyrwyr sy'n astudio gartref. Mae hyn yn awr yn rhoi'r baich yn ôl yn gadarn ar ysgwyddau Llywodraeth San Steffan ac ar AS Lloegr i sicrhau eu bod yn cael setliad gwell i fyfyrwyr yn Lloegr, oherwydd byddai hynny hefyd yn cael effaith fawr ar y systemau addysg uwch yma yng Nghymru ac yn yr Alban. Mae'r baich arnynt hefyd i feddwl eto sut yr ariennir addysg uwch, i'w thynnu'n gyfan gwbl allan o'r farchnad ac i'w hariannu'n briodol fel gwasanaeth cyhoeddus sy'n cael ei ariannu'n llawn.

**William Graham:** Yr ydym yn sylw ar yr ewyllys wleidyddol ehangach yn y Cynulliad ac yn cydnabod i hyn gael ei adlewyrchu yn y cytundeb i flaenoriaethu addysg uwch yng Nghymru. Credwn fod hwn yn gam pwysig ymlaen wrth greu economi'n seiliedig ar

economy in which everyone is allowed the opportunity to gain access to higher education, regardless of their financial circumstances. The Welsh Conservatives believe that if a person has the academic ability to qualify for higher education, it is a function of responsible government to provide the funding mechanism that will allow them to realise their full potential. That is why we have the long-term objective of abolishing all tuition fees.

The growing realisation that the graduate dividend is not equitable throughout the UK, and particularly within Wales, together with an increasing awareness of the debt burden accumulated by students, will eventually highlight how current Labour policies for higher education have not only increased divisions in higher education institutions in the United Kingdom, but they will be shown to impede increasing aspirations to gain a university education. While it is necessary to agree these regulations, we seek the Minister's assurance that she will consider the wider view agreed by the Assembly and direct future actions to reflect that agreement.

**Peter Black:** I note that these regulations are specifically intended to implement the Government's manifesto commitment in relation to 2006-07, and clearly it is welcome that the Government is at last implementing that commitment.

We have already been through the issue that we are, effectively, subsidising English students to the tune of £14 million out of the Welsh block. Clearly, there are differences between what is proposed here and what has been agreed between the four parties for future years. One difference that occurred to me as the Minister was speaking was that when we had the discussion on what would happen as a result of the Rees commission's review after 2007-08, many Members on the opposite side of the Chamber argued strongly that any fee grants should be means-tested. However, what we have in front of us today is not a means-tested grant, even though it is based on the Government's manifesto commitment. On the one hand, we have the Government arguing that, after 2007-08, the grants should be means-tested,

wybodaeth lle rhoddir cyfle i bawb allu cael addysg uwch, beth bynnag yw eu hamgylchiadau ariannol. Cred Ceidwadwyr Cymru, os yw person yn meddu ar y gallu academaidd i gymhwys o'r gyfleoedd addysg uwch, mai swyddogaeth llywodraeth gyfrifol yw darparu'r dull ariannu a fydd yn ei alluogi i gyflawni ei botensial llawn. Dyna pam y mae gennym y nod hirdymor o ddiddymu ffioedd dysgu'n gyfan gwbl.

Bydd y ffaith fod pobl yn sylweddoli fwyfwy nad yw'r fuddran i raddedigion yn gyfartal ledled y DU, ac yn arbennig yng Nghymru, ynghyd ag ymwybyddiaeth gynyddol o'r baich dyledion sydd ar fyfyrwyr, yn y pen draw yn tynnu sylw nid yn unig at y ffordd y mae polisiau cyfredol Llafur ar gyfer addysg uwch wedi cynyddu'r rhaniadau mewn sefydliadau addysg uwch yn y DU, ond hefyd sut y byddant yn llesteirio dyheadau cynyddol i gael addysg prifysgol. Er bod yn rhaid cytuno â'r rheoliadau hyn, gofynnwn am sicrwydd gan y Gweinidog y bydd yn ystyried y farn ehangach y cytunwyd arni gan y Cynulliad, a chamau uniongyrchol yn y dyfodol i adlewyrchu'r cytundeb hwnnw.

**Peter Black:** Sylwaf mai bwriad penodol y rheoliadau hyn yw gweithredu ymrwymiad manifesto'r Llywodraeth mewn perthynas â 2006-07. Ac yn amlwg mae i'w groesawu fod y Llywodraeth o'r diwedd yn gweithredu'r ymrwymiad hwnnw.

Yr ydym eisoes wedi trafod y ffaith ein bod, fwy neu lai, yn rhoi cymhorthdal gwerth £14 miliwn i fyfyrwyr o Loegr allan o grant bloc Cymru. Yn amlwg, mae gwahaniaethau rhwng yr hyn a gynigir yma a'r hyn a gytunwyd rhwng y pedair plaid ar gyfer y dyfodol. Un gwahaniaeth a ddaeth i'm meddwl tra oedd y Gweinidog yn siarad oedd fod nifer o Aelodau ar ochr arall y Siambwr, pan gawsom y drafodaeth ar yr hyn a ddylai ddigwydd o ganlyniad i adolygiad comisiwn Rees ar ôl 2007-08, wedi dadlau'n gryf y dylai unrhyw grantiau ar gyfer ffioedd fod yn seiliedig ar brawf modd. Fodd bynnag, nid grant yn seiliedig ar brawf modd yw'r hyn sydd ger ein bron heddiw, er ei fod yn seiliedig ar ymrwymiad manifesto'r Llywodraeth. Ar y naill law, mae gennym Lywodraeth sy'n dadlau y dylai grantiau fod

and, on the other, we have it proposing to implement what is effectively a fee grant that is not means-tested. That is an interesting point, although it is not central, and I found it amusing at the time.

It is important that we do everything that we can to protect students from the impact of fees, deferred or otherwise. I understand quite clearly that students will not have to pay these fees upfront from 2006-07, nevertheless they will still encounter substantial debt when they graduate from university. We in Wales, as in Scotland, can set a different course, and put substantial pressure on the UK Government to follow that course in England. Although English students obviously benefit from this measure, they will not do so after 2007-08. It should be made clear to them that if they feel that they are being disadvantaged, they should write to No. 10, and have their say by asking why the UK Government is putting them at a disadvantage.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I think that the only response that I need to make is that a £2,700 means-tested grant will be available from 2006-07. That is why this side of the Chamber was prepared to support the motion, and it reflects our continuing commitment to tackling disadvantage.

*Cynnig (NDM2533): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2533): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

- Andrews, Leighton
- Barrett, Lorraine
- Bates, Mick
- Black, Peter
- Burnham, Eleanor
- Chapman, Christine
- Cuthbert, Jeff
- Davidson, Jane
- Davies, Andrew
- Davies, Jocelyn
- Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
- Essex, Sue
- Francis, Lisa
- German, Michael
- Gibbons, Brian
- Graham, William

yn seiliedig ar brawf modd ar ôl 2007-08, ac ar y llaw arall mae'n cynnig gweithredu'r hyn sydd fwy neu lai yn grant ar gyfer ffioedd nad yw'n seiliedig ar brawf modd. Mae hwn yn bwynt diddorol, er nad yw'n bwynt canolog, ac yr oedd yn ddoniol i mi ar y pryd.

Mae'n bwysig inni wneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i ddiogelu myfyrwyr rhag effaith ffioedd, wedi eu gohirio neu beidio. Deallaf yn gwbl glir na fydd yn rhaid i fyfyrwyr dalu'r ffioedd hyn cyn cychwyn ar ôl 2006-07. Serch hynny byddant yn parhau i wynebu dyled sylweddol wrth raddio o'r brifysgol. Gallwn ni yng Nghymru, fel yn yr Alban, dorri ein cwys ein hunain, a rhoi cryn bwysau ar Lywodraeth y DU i ddilyn y gwys honno yn Lloegr. Er bod myfyrwyr yn Lloegr yn amlwg yn elwa o'r mesur hwn, ni fyddant yn gwneud hynny ar ôl 2007-08. Dylid pwyslesio wrthynt, os teimlant eu bod o dan anfantais, y dylent ysgrifennu i Rif 10 a dweud eu dweud drwy ofyn pam mae Llywodraeth y DU yn eu rhoi o dan anfantais.

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Credaf mai'r unig ymateb y mae angen imi ei wneud yw y bydd grant o £2,700 ar sail prawf modd ar gael o 2006-07. Dyna pam yr oedd yr ochr hon i'r Siambra yn fodlon cefnogi'r cynnig, ac mae'n adlewyrchu ein hymrwymiad parhaus i fynd i'r afael ag anfantais.

Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2534): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2534): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaidd:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene

Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Diwygiad dros dro i'r Rheolau Sefydlog er mwyn Caniatáu Dirprwyon ar gyfer  
y Pwyllgor ar y Papur Gwyn—Trefn Lywodraethu Well i Gymru  
Temporary Revision to Standing Orders to allow Substitutions to the  
Committee on the Better Governance for Wales White Paper**

**Y Llywydd:** Mae angen mwyafrif o ddwy ran o dair o blaid y cynnig hwn er mwyn iddo gael ei dderbyn.

**The Presiding Officer:** A two-thirds majority vote in favour is required for this motion to be carried.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiaf fod

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â  
Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 37.1 a 37.4:*

*the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Orders Nos. 37.1 and 37.4:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Busnes i ddiwygio'r Rheolau Sefydlog, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 29 Mehefin 2005;*

*1. considers the report of the Business Committee to revise Standing Orders, laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 29 June 2005;*

*2. yn cytuno i ddiwygio'r Rheol Sefydlog fel yr amlinellir yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor Busnes; a*

*2. agrees to revise the Standing Order as set out in the Business Committee report; and*

*3. yn cytuno y daw'r diwygiad hwn o'r Rheol Sefydlog i ben ar 30 Hydref 2005.  
(NDM2530)*

*3. agrees that this Standing Order revision shall cease to have effect on 30 October 2005.(NDM2530)*

*Cynnig (NDM2530): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2530): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Adroddiad Blynnyddol y Prif Weinidog 2004-05  
The First Minister's Annual Report 2004-05**

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2, 3, 4 a 5 yn enw Kirsty Williams a gwelliannau 6, 7, 8, 9 a 10 yn enw David Melding.

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5 in the name of Kirsty Williams and amendments 6, 7, 8, 9 and 10 in the name of David Melding.

**The First Minister:** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales notes the Annual Report of the First Minister 2005.*  
(NDM2528)

We are halfway through our second term of government, therefore this is a suitable opportunity for us to take stock and to look at the content of ‘Wales: A Better Country’, which was published 21 months ago, in September 2003, outlining our values, goals, priorities and what we intended to do during our second term. This is my fourth report as First Minister and it records the significant steps that we have taken towards delivering that agenda. Our priorities are simple and significant: to improve the health of the nation, to reduce unemployment, to improve safety in our communities, to create better jobs, and to help people to develop the raised skill levels that they require to carry out those better jobs. We believe that we are well on our way to delivering our promises and the full document of record that has been put before you today highlights how we are progressing against the commitments outlined in ‘Wales: A Better Country’.

O ran iechyd, yr ydym wedi sicrhau gostyngiad yn y rhestrau aros hiraf, gyda thoriad o 99 y cant yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf o ran y niferoedd sy’n aros mwy na 18 mis am apwyntiadau cleifion allanol, a thoriad o 42 y cant yn y niferoedd sy’n aros dros 12 mis. O ran y cleifion sy’n aros am driniaeth fel cleifion mewnol neu undydd, yr ydym wedi sicrhau toriad o 87 y cant yn y niferoedd sy’n aros dros 12 mis, yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Rhaid i bawb dderbyn bod hyn yn welliant ysgubol, ond mae llawer o le i sicrhau gwelliant pellach, ysgubol a pharhaol er mwyn cyrraedd y garreg filltir nesaf o gyfanswm amser aros o 16 mis, erbyn Ebrill 2007, o ran cleifion mewnol ac allanol. Rhaid symud ymlaen wedyn at y garreg filltir nesaf, sef peidio ag aros mwy na chwe mis, gan gynnwys, am y tro cyntaf, unrhyw amser aros am brofion diagnostig neu unrhyw driniaeth ar yr ochr therapi.

Er mwyn moderneiddio ein canolfannau iechyd a’n hysbytai, yr ydym wedi

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn nodi Adroddiad Blynnyddol y Prif Weinidog 2005.*  
(NDM2528)

Yr ydym hanner y ffordd drwy ein hail dymor mewn grym, felly, mae hwn yn gyfle addas inni gloriannu ac ystyried cynnwys ‘Cymru: Gwlad Well’, a gyhoeddwyd 21 mis yn ôl ym mis Medi 2003, yn amlinellu ein gwerthoedd, ein nodau, ein blaenorciaethau a’r hyn yr oeddem yn bwriadu ei wneud yn ystod ein hail dymor. Hwn yw fy mhedwerydd adroddiad fel Prif Weinidog ac mae’n cofnodi’r camau breision yr ydym wedi’u cymryd i gyflawni’r agenda honno. Mae ein blaenorciaethau’n syml ac yn arwyddocaol: gwella iechyd y genedl, lleihau diweithdra, gwella diogelwch yn ein cymunedau, creu swyddi gwell, a helpu pobl i godi’r lefelau sgiliau y mae eu hangen arnyti i wneud y swyddi gwell hynny. Credwn ein bod ar y trywydd iawn i gyflawni ein haddewidion, ac mae’r ddogfen gofnod lawn a roddwyd ger eich bron heddiw yn tynnu sylw at y cynnydd yr ydym yn ei wneud yn erbyn yr ymrwymiadau sydd wedi eu hamlinellu yn ‘Cymru: Gwlad Well’.

In terms of health, we have cut the longest waiting lists, with a reduction of 99 per cent during the past year in the numbers waiting more than 18 months for out-patient appointments, and a cut of 42 per cent in the numbers waiting more than 12 months. In terms of those patients waiting for in-patient or daycare treatment, we have secured a reduction of 87 per cent in the numbers waiting more than 12 months during the past year. Everyone must accept that this is an astonishing improvement, but there is plenty of room for further, astonishing and permanent improvement to reach the next milestone of a total waiting time of 16 months, by April 2007, for in-patients and out-patients. We must then move on to the next milestone, which is to wait no more than six months, including, for the first time, any waiting time for diagnostic testing or any treatment on the therapy side.

To modernise our health centres and our hospitals, we have added £100 million this

ychwanegu £100 miliwn eleni at raglen cyfalaf y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol, gan godi i £300 miliwn mewn dwy flynedd. Ar yr un pryd, yr ydym yn hyfforddi llawer mwy nag erioed o'r blaen o feddygon, nyrssy ac eraill mewn gyrfaoedd sy'n gysylltiedig â meddygaeth, er mwyn iddynt weithio yn yr ysbytai a'r canolfannau iechyd newydd.

Improving the health of our nation is about much more than what happens inside our hospitals. Probably, 90 per cent of the potential health gain that we can achieve will be achieved outside the hospital door. Health Challenge Wales is fundamental to achieving that; it is a remarkable partnership between the citizens of Wales, the national health service and the Assembly Government. It is a programme to help everyone to improve his or her health and wellbeing. We are also doing our bit to make the Assembly, as an institution, healthier; indeed, since last Friday, all Assembly Government buildings are smoke free. We hope that powers will be transferred to us, in the Government's Public Health Bill, so that we can determine the issue of banning smoking in enclosed public places.

year to the national health service's capital programme, increasing to £300 million in two years' time. At the same time, we are training many more doctors, nurses and others in professions allied to medicine than ever before, so that they can work in the new hospitals and health centres.

Mae gwella iechyd ein cenedl yn golygu llawer mwy na'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn ein hysbytai. Mae'n debygol y bydd 90 y cant o'r budd iechyd posibl y gallwn ei sicrhau yn cael ei sicrhau y tu allan i'r ysbyty. Mae Her Iechyd Cymru yn hanfodol i gyflawni hynny; mae'n bartneriaeth hynod rhwng dinasyddion Cymru, y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae'n rhaglen i helpu gwella iechyd a lles pawb. Yr ydym hefyd yn gwneud ein rhan i sicrhau bod y Cynulliad, fel sefydliad, yn iachach; yn wir, ers dydd Gwener diwethaf, mae pob un o adeiladau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ddi-fwg. Gobeithiwn y caiff pwerau eu trosglwyddo inni, ym Mesur Iechyd Cyhoeddus y Llywodraeth, fel y gallwn benderfynu mater gwahardd ysmegu mewn mannau cyhoeddus caeedig.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.29 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.29 p.m.*

On employment, since devolution, Wales has seen the biggest fall in unemployment of any of the constituent parts of the UK, with a current unemployment rate that is lower than the UK average, from having been 30 per cent higher six years ago. There are over 120,000 more people in work now in Wales than in 1999, when we took over our responsibilities. That is an increase of roughly 10 per cent, compared with a 5 per cent increase in the UK. There is a successful economy overall, but ours is one of its most successful parts in terms of job gain. Unemployment is now 42 per cent less than six years ago and that fall is twice the 21 per cent fall in the rest of the UK, albeit that the UK is remarkably successful itself by European standards.

O ran cyflogaeth, ers datganoli, Cymru sydd wedi gweld y gostyngiad mwyaf mewn diweithdra o unrhyw ran o'r DU, gyda chyfradd ddiweithdra ar hyn o bryd sy'n is na chyfartaledd y DU, ar ôl bod 30 y cant yn uwch chwe blynedd yn ôl. Mae dros 120,000 yn fwy o bobl mewn gwaith heddiw yng Nghymru nag a oedd yn 1999, pan ymgymerasom â'n cyfrifoldebau. Mae hynny'n gynnnydd o tua 10 y cant, o'i gymharu â chynnydd o 5 y cant yn y DU. Mae yma economi lwyddiannus ar y cyfan, ond mae ein heconomi ni yn un o'i rhannau mwyaf llwyddiannus o ran swyddi newydd. Mae diweithdra yn 42 y cant yn llai heddiw nag ydoedd chwe blynedd yn ôl, ac mae'r gostyngiad hwnnw yn ddwywaith y gostyngiad o 21 y cant yng ngweddill y DU, er bod y DU ei hun yn hynod lwyddiannus yn ôl safonau Ewrop.

3.30 p.m.

I will try to set that in the context of the sad news about the well publicised difficulties of certain companies during the last week. There is never a good time to be given your P45 or to lose your job, but if there is a least-worst time, then that is when jobs are available and when the unemployment rate is at its lowest since early 1975, when the unemployment figure was at about 4.5 per cent, as it is today, and when more people are in work in Wales than ever before. Since 1999, employment growth has been dominated by growth in the private sector, which accounts for over 70 per cent of the net gain. Wales is the only part of the UK in which private-sector employment growth outstrips public-sector employment growth.

We are also trying to encourage the top quality of jobs such as the 240 jobs expected from the £50 million life science investment in Swansea, which is a partnership between four or five partners in the public sector and IBM. Public and private sector investment of this kind is at levels not seen for over a generation. Indeed, for the past two years, average earnings in Wales have risen faster than those of the UK as a whole. In the past year, the rise in average earnings was 5.4 per cent compared to 4.1 per cent in the UK as a whole. As regards European funding, the Welsh European Funding Office has delivered over £3-billion-worth of investment via the European funding available, and not just through Objective 1, but from all the other structural funds programmes as well, with over 106,000 jobs either created or safeguarded.

On the development of skills, our manufacturing task and finish group, made up of union and employer representatives, explores how we can improve and deliver targeted support for the manufacturing sector in Wales, particularly with regard to the new need to raise skills levels across this crucial sector. Members will be aware that the number of apprenticeships has risen from 9,000 in 1999 to 15,000 now—a quite remarkable level of increase. We are also proud of our joint community-based

Ceisiaf osod hynny yng nghyd-destun y newyddion trist am anawsterau rhai cwmniau, sydd wedi cael cryn sylw yn ystod yr wythnos diwethaf. Nid oes amser da byth i gael eich P45 neu i golli'ch swydd, ond oes yna amser sy'n llai trist, yna'r amser hwnnw yw pan fydd swyddi ar gael a phan fydd y gyfradd gyflogaeth ar ei hisaf ers dechrau 1975, pan oedd diweithdra tua 4.5 y cant, fel y mae heddiw, a phan fydd mwy o bobl mewn gwaith yng Nghymru nag erioed o'r blaen. Er 1999, y twf yn y sector preifat fu'r twf mwyaf mewn cyflogaeth, gan gyfrif am tua 70 y cant o'r cynnydd net. Cymru yw'r unig ran o'r DU lle mae twf mewn cyflogaeth yn y sector preifat yn fwy na'r twf mewn cyflogaeth yn y sector cyhoeddus.

Yr ydym hefyd yn ceisio hyrwyddo swyddi a'r radd flaenaf, fel y 240 o swyddi a ddisgwylir o'r buddsoddiad gwerth £50 miliwn mewn gwyddor bywyd yn Abertawe, sy'n bartneriaeth rhwng pedwar neu bump o bartneriaid yn y sector cyhoeddus ac IBM. Ni welwyd lefelau buddsoddi fel hyn gan y sector preifat a'r sector cyhoeddus ers dros genhedlaeth. Yn wir, yn y ddwy flynedd diwethaf mae enillion cyfartalog yng Nghymru wedi cynyddu'n gyflymach nag enillion cyfartalog y DU gyfan. Yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, mae enillion cyfartalog wedi cynyddu 5.4 y cant o'u cymharu â 4.1 y cant yn y DU gyfan. O ran arian Ewropeaidd, mae Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru wedi darparu buddsoddiad gwerth dros £3 biliwn drwy'r arian Ewropeaidd sydd ar gael. Nid drwy Amcan 1 yn unig y mae hyn wedi digwydd, ond drwy holl raglenni'r cronfeydd strwythurol eraill hefyd, a thros 106,000 o swyddi naill ai wedi'u creu neu wedi'u diogelu.

O ran datblygu sgiliau, mae ein grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar weithgynhyrchu, sy'n cynnwys cynrychiolwyr undebau a chyflogwyr, yn ystyried sut y gallwn wella a darparu cymorth wedi'i dargedu i'r sector gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru, yn enwedig o ran yr angen newydd i godi lefelau sgiliau ar draws y sector hollbwysig hwn. Gŵyr yr Aelodau fod nifer y prentisiaethau wedi cynyddu o 9,000 yn 1999 i 15,000 heddiw—cynnydd hynod iawn. Yr ydym hefyd yn falch o'n mentrau ar y cyd yn y gymuned

initiatives with Jobcentre Plus—an arm of the UK Government's Department of Work and Pensions. The scheme is called Want to Work and is operational in key wards in Merthyr Tydfil, Neath Port Talbot and Cardiff, and it is helping people who are currently economically inactive to find employment.

We recognise that educational success later on in one's educational career depends on supporting children's learning from the very start. We are revolutionising childcare in Wales by investing in specialist services for babies and infants, and we are piloting a new curriculum for children aged three to seven that encourages them to learn through play. This system may be new to the United Kingdom, but it is based on best practice in Scandinavia and elsewhere in Europe.

With regard to equalising life chances, educational maintenance allowances for 16-year-olds and 17-year-olds, with 18-year-olds following next year, mean that there is no financial penalty to prevent young people from less-well-off families staying on in school. That is the key determinant for whether people proceed onwards to university. Students from Wales attending Welsh universities will not have to pay deferred top-up fees of £1,800 a year because the Assembly Government will be paying those to the universities instead. All this will create a highly qualified and skilled pool of top-notch employees to upgrade and reskill the Welsh workforce over the next few years.

On community safety, we believe that it is important for the people of Wales to feel safe and happy in their communities. That is why we are investing in the development of our Communities First programme as a long-term strategy to improve living conditions in the most disadvantaged areas and responding to concerns on anti-social behaviour by placing co-ordinators in all of our 22 community safety partnerships. We are also providing help to people and their communities by investing £61 million in tackling drug and alcohol abuse in addition to implementing a national strategy to

gyda'r Ganolfan Byd Gwaith—cangen o Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau Llywodraeth y DU. Enw'r cynllun yw Yn Awyddus i Weithio ac mae ar waith mewn wardiau allweddol ym Merthyr Tudful, Castell-nedd Port Talbot a Chaerdydd, ac mae'n helpu pobl sy'n economaidd anweithgar ar hyn o bryd i gael gwaith.

Yr ydym yn cydnabod bod llwyddiant addysgol yn ddiweddarach mewn gyrrfa addysgol yn dibynnu ar gefnogi dysgu plant o'r cychwyn cyntaf. Yr ydym yn chwyldroi gofal plant yng Nghymru drwy fuddsoddi mewn gwasanaethau arbenigol ar gyfer babanod a phlant bach, ac yr ydym yn treialu cwricwlwm newydd i blant rhwng tair a saith oed sy'n eu hamnog i ddysgu drwy chwarae. Hwyrach fod y system hon yn newydd i'r Deyrnas Unedig, ond mae'n seiliedig ar arfer gorau yn Llychlyn ac mewn gwledydd eraill yn Ewrop.

O ran rhoi cyfle cyfartal mewn bywyd, mae lwfansau cynhaliaeth addysgol i bobl 16 oed a 17 oed, a phobl 18 oed yn dilyn flwyddyn nesaf, yn golygu nad oes unrhyw gosb ariannol i atal pobl ifanc o deuluedd llai cefnog rhag aros yn yr ysgol. Dyna'r ffactor allweddol sy'n penderfynu a yw pobl yn mynd ymlaen i brifysgol. Ni fydd yn rhaid i fyfyrwyr o Gymru sy'n mynd i brifysgolion yng Nghymru dalu ffioedd atodol gohiriedig o £1,800 y flwyddyn, oherwydd bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn eu talu i'r prifysgolion yn lle hynny. Bydd hyn oll yn creu cronfa o gyflogeion cymwysedig a medrus iawn o'r radd flaenaf i uwchraddio ac adnewyddu sgiliau gweithlu Cymru dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf.

O ran diogelwch cymunedol, credwn ei bod yn bwysig i bobl Cymru allu teimlo'n ddiogel ac yn hapus yn eu cymunedau. Dyma pam yr ydym yn buddsoddi yn natblygiad ein rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, fel strategaeth hirdymor i wella amodau byw yn y wardiau mwyaf difreintiedig. A dyna pam yr ydym yn ymateb i bryderon ynglŷn ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol drwy roi cydlynwyr ym mhob un o'n 22 o bartneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol. Yr ydym hefyd yn rhoi cymorth i bobl a'u cymunedau drwy fuddsoddi £61 miliwn i fynd i'r afael â chamdefnyddio

suppress domestic violence.

We are also investing in the needs of older and disabled people, and we are well on our way to creating an older persons' commissioner via the legislation proceeding through the Houses of Parliament. This is another first for Wales and, in this case, a world first. Also, we are investing to ensure that elderly and disabled people have the means to maintain their independence through the introduction of schemes and grants to allow people to stay in their own homes, to which, overwhelmingly, they wish to return when leaving hospital, or to avoid going in to hospital as in-patients, or to receive residential care as soon as they can. This will ensure that they have good quality homes that are fit for them to live in. It is important that we develop policies that are not based on the one-size-fits-all principle, but rather that we try to ensure that we recognise the diversity of Wales. The exercise that we are carrying out through the Wales spatial plan looks at Wales in six broad areas with visions and actions suited to each one of those areas.

We are halfway through our second term in Government and we are well on the way to delivering the promises that we made. I am proud to show the people of Wales what we have achieved so far and to indicate to them how we intend to go on to achieve the goals that we have ambitiously set out for this nation of ours.

**Michael German:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 1: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*regrets that the Labour Assembly Government is only achieving its school building target through the use of private finance initiative.*

I propose amendment 2. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

cyffuriau ac alcohol, yn ogystal â gweithredu strategaeth genedlaethol i leihau traus yn y cartref.

Yr ydym hefyd yn buddsoddi yn anghenion pobl hŷn a phobl anabl, ac yr ydym ymhell ar y ffordd i greu comisiynydd i bobl hŷn drwy'r ddeddfwriaethol sy'n mynd drwy'r Senedd. Cymru yw'r wlad gyntaf yn y DU i wneud hyn, ac yn yr achos hwn hi yw'r wlad gyntaf yn y byd. Hefyd, yr ydym yn buddsoddi i sicrhau bod pobl oedrannus ac anabl yn cael y moddion i barhau i fyw'n annibynnol, drwy gyflwyno cynlluniau a grantiau sy'n rhoi cyfle i bobl aros yn eu cartrefi eu hunain. Mae'r mwyafrif llethol am ddychwelyd i'r cartrefi hynny ar ôl gadael yr ysbty. Mae'r cynlluniau a'r grantiau hefyd yn helpu osgoi mynd i'r ysbty fel cleifion mewnol, neu i gael gofal preswyl cyn gynted ag y bo modd. Bydd hyn yn sicrhau bod ganddynt gartrefi o safon sy'n addas i fyw ynddynt. Mae'n bwysig inni ddatblygu polisiau nad ydynt yn seiliedig ar yr egwyddor bod un polisi yn addas i bawb, ond yn hytrach ein bod yn ceisio sicrhau ein bod yn cydnabod amrywiaeth Cymru. Mae'r ymarfer yr ydym yn ei gynnal drwy gynllun gofodol Cymru yn edrych at Gymru mewn chwe ardal eang, gyda gweledigaethau a chamau gweithredu sy'n addas ar gyfer pob un o'r ardaloedd hynny.

Yr ydym hanner y ffordd drwy ein hail dymor mewn grym, ac yr ydym ar y trywydd iawn i gyflawni'r addewidion a wnaed gennym. Yr wyf yn falch cael dangos i bobl Cymru yr hyn a gyflawnwyd gennym hyd yma, ac i ddweud wrthynt sut y bwriadwn fynd ati i gyflawni'r nodau uchelgeisiol a benwyd gennym ar gyfer y wlad hon.

**Michael German:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 1: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn gresynu mai dim ond drwy ddefnyddio menter cyllid preifat y mae Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad yn cyflawni ei tharged ar gyfer adeiladu ysgolion.*

Cynigiaf welliant 2. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*calls for the production of a transparent, integrated strategy for the use of the crime-fighting fund.*

I propose amendment 3. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*regrets the failure, over halfway through the Assembly term, of the Labour Assembly Government to deliver half-price bus travel for 16 to 18-year-olds.*

I propose amendment 4. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*condemns the Labour Assembly Government for back-tracking from its manifesto commitment for 'Free breakfasts for all primary school kids'.*

I propose amendment 5. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*regrets that, after two and half years, the Labour Assembly Government is only now piloting the scrapping of home-care charges for disabled people.*

Your annual report gives us a moment to reflect on your actions over the preceding 12 months. The piecemeal populism that defines your Government is ticking along. You like to tell us about the progress that you have made on the feel-good pledges that you wheeled out for the 2003 election, but, as far as I can see, there is little to show for your set of intentions. Your top-ten pledges are still there. Most are still not enacted beyond a pilot scheme here and there. You have more pilots than a top-gun academy, but few of your ideas have yet taken off.

You promised free breakfasts for all children, but now you acknowledge that most of them will never get them. You promised free swimming for the elderly, but few have got their toes wet, gratis, yet. You promised free prescriptions, but not yet, and you promised a knowledge bank but, again, that promise has not yet been cashed in.

*yn galw am gynhyrchu strategaeth dryloyw, integredig ar gyfer defnyddio'r gronfa ymladd-troseddu.*

Cynigiaf welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwytnewydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn gresynu at fethiant Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad, hanner ffordd drwy dymor y Cynulliad, i gyflwyno tocynnau bws hanner-pris i bobl ifanc 16 i 18 oed.*

Cynigiaf welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwytnewydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn condemnio Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad am gefnu ar yr ymrwymiad yn ei manifesto i ddarparu 'Brecwast am ddim i bob plentyn ysgol gynradd'.*

Cynigiaf welliant 5. Ychwanegu pwytnewydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn gresynu mai dim ond yn awr, ar ôl dwy flynedd a hanner, y mae Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad yn treialu cael gwared â thaliadau gofal cartref i bobl anabl.*

Mae eich adroddiad blynnyddol yn rhoi ennyd fach i ni fyfyrir ar eich gweithredoedd dros y 12 mis blaenorol. Mae'r boblyddiaeth ddarniog sy'n nodwedd o'ch Llywodraeth yn mynd rhagddi'n braff. Yr ydych yn hoff o ddweud wrthym am y cynnydd a wnaed gennych ar yr addewidion a restrwyd gennych ar gyfer etholiad 2003 i fodloni'r etholwyr, ond hyd y gwelaf fi, nid oes gennych fawr ddim i ddangos am eich bwriadau. Erys eich deg addewid pennaf. Mae'r rhan fwyaf heb eu rhoi ar waith, ar wahân i ambell gynllun peilot yma a thrall. Mae gennych lwyth o gynlluniau peilot, ond ychydig iawn o'ch syniadau sydd wedi datblygu hyd yma.

Yr oeddech yn addo brecwast am ddim i bob plentyn, ond erbyn hyn yr ydych yn cydnabod na fydd y rhan fwyaf ohonynt byth yn ei gael. Yr oeddech yn addo nofio am ddim i'r henoed, ond ychydig iawn sydd wedi rhoi eu traed yn y dŵr, am ddim, hyd yma. Yr oeddech yn addo presgripsiynau am ddim, ond nid eto. Ac yr oeddech yn addo cronfa wybodaeth, ond unwaith eto, nid yw'r addewid honno wedi'i chyflawni.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** I am baffled as to what your policy is in terms of free school breakfasts. Are you suggesting that those parents of children who do not wish to partake of the free school breakfast should somehow be forced to do so?

**Michael German:** My suggestion is exactly what you have written in your manifesto. I will repeat it for you, and you might like to write it down:

'Free breakfasts for all primary school kids'.

I like the word 'kids' because it shows that it is from your manifesto. You have amplified that subsequently with the words,

'We promised to provide for all primary school children to have free breakfasts.'

In other words, there is a caveat. That is not what you promised the people of Wales in your manifesto; you have gone back on it.

I will remind you of some other points. You say today,

'We promised to introduce free swimming for older people.'

However, the sentence following that says,

'This is in place for young people during all school holidays'

I ask you. The pledge was about swimming for older people, so why mention younger people, especially when free swimming for them during the school holidays was introduced by the previous partnership Government? After two years, free swimming for older people is only a pilot scheme. Do you see what I mean about pilots?

You promised to scrap home-care charges for disabled people; you said it quite clearly. After two years, you have not delivered that and we are told—guess what?—that a pilot scheme will be starting this summer. Is that

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Yr wyf yn drysu'n lân yn ceisio deall beth yw eich polisi ar ddarparu brecwast am ddim mewn ysgolion. A ydych yn awgrymu y dylai rhieni'r plant hynny nad ydynt am gael brecwast am ddim yn yr ysgol gael eu gorfodi rywsut i wneud hynny?

**Michael German:** Mae fy awgrym yn union fel yr ydych wedi ei ysgrifennu yn eich maniffesto. Fe'i ailadroddaf ichi, ac efallai yr hoffech ei ysgrifennu i lawr.

Brecwast am ddim i bob plentyn ysgol gynradd.

Yr wyf yn hoffi'r defnydd o'r gair 'kids' yn Saenseg, gan ei fod yn dangos iddo ddod o'ch maniffesto. Wedyn yr ydych wedi ymhelaethu ar hynny gyda'r geiriau,

Yr oeddem yn addo darparu i bob plentyn ysgol gynradd gael brecwast am ddim.

Mewn geiriau eraill, mae cafeat. Nid dyna a addawyd gennych i bobl Cymru yn eich maniffesto; yr ydych wedi torri eich gair.

Hoffwn eich atgoffa am rai pwyntiau eraill.  
Yr ydych yn dweud heddiw,

Yr oeddem yn addo cyflwyno nofio am ddim i bobl hŷn.

Fodd bynnag, dywed y frawddeg sy'n dilyn hynny,

Mae hyn ar waith i bobl ifanc yn ystod pob un o'r gwyliau ysgol

Wel. Yr oedd yr addewid yn ymwneud â nofio i bobl hŷn, felly, pam sôn am bobl ifanc, yn enwedig gan fod nofio am ddim iddynt yn ystod gwyliau'r ysgol wedi ei gyflwyno gan y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth flaenorol? Ar ôl dwy flynedd, dim ond cynllun peilot yw nofio am ddim i bobl hŷn. A ydych yn deall fy mhwynt ynglŷn â chynlluniau peilot?

Yr oeddech yn addo dileu taliadau gofal cartref i bobl anabl; yr oeddech yn dweud hynny'n holol glir. Ar ôl dwy flynedd, nid ydych wedi cyflawni hynny a dywedir wrthym—credwch neu beidio—y bydd

not an example of exactly what we have just been saying?

You promised to invest to tackle the problems of small and rural schools, and let me remind you, just in case you do not remember it:

'We will invest additional money to tackle the problems faced by small and rural schools,'

but there has not been any additional money and the small and rural schools grant has been subsumed into other schemes, for example, workload funding, the revenue support grant and safer communities funding. You said that you would cut junior class sizes, whereas before you had said that all primary school class sizes would be of 25 pupils or fewer within the second term of the National Assembly. That was your previous promise, and you have reneged on that for the time being.

Our amendments highlight this Government's failure to live up to its promises—its failure to simply do what it said it would do. We will also be supporting the amendments in the name of David Melding. Not for the first time today, Mr Melding's words make a lot of sense to those with a mind to listen to them—that should help your career, Mr Melding.

Alongside the lack of progress on your top-10 pledges, Labour, you have undertaken what you call 'the defining project of this Second Assembly'. You are right because the shambolic progress of the Assembly sponsored public body mergers, announced almost 12 months ago, out of a clear, red sky, is truly defining your administration. Where you could have offered leadership in a popular cause, you have brought muddle and uncertainty. Here was an opportunity to develop a distinctive Welsh approach to service delivery, which would enthuse the organisations and the staff within them, but the opposite has happened. An opportunity to develop a collaborative approach, building on Welsh values to provide world-class

cynllun peilot yn dechrau yn ystod yr haf eleni. Onid yw hynny'n enghraifft o'r union beth yr ydym newydd fod yn sôn amdano?

Yr oeddech yn addo buddsoddi i fynd i'r afael â phroblemau ysgolion bach ac ysgolion gwledig, a gadewch imi eich atgoffa, rhag ofn nad ydych yn cofio hynny:

Byddwn yn buddsoddi arian ychwanegol i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau sy'n wynebu ysgolion bach ac ysgolion gwledig.

ond ni fu unrhyw arian ychwanegol, ac mae'r grant i ysgolion bach ac ysgolion gwledig wedi ei gynnwys mewn cynlluniau eraill, er enghraifft, arian llwyth gwaith, y grant cynnal refeniw, ac arian cymunedau diogelach. Yr oeddech yn dweud y byddech yn torri maint dosbarthiadau mewn ysgolion iau, ond gynt yr oeddech wedi dweud y byddai pob dosbarth mewn ysgol gynradd yn 25 o ddisbyglion neu lai o fewn ail dymor y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Dyna oedd eich addewid blaenorol, ac yr ydych wedi torri'r addewid hwnnw am y tro.

Mae ein gwelliannau'n tynnu sylw at fethiant y Llywodraeth hon i gadw ei haddewidion—ei methiant i wneud yr hyn y dywedodd y byddai'n ei wneud. Byddwn hefyd yn cefnogi'r gwelliannau yn enw David Melding. Nid am y tro cyntaf heddiw, yr oedd geiriau Mr Melding yn gwneud llawer o synnwyr i'r rhai sy'n barod i wrando arnynt—dylai hynny fod yn hwb i'ch gyrfa, Mr Melding.

Ochr yn ochr â'r diffyg cynnydd gyda'ch 10 addewid pennaf, Lafur, yr ydych wedi ymgymryd â'r hyn a alwch yn 'brosiect diffiniol yr Ail Gynulliad hwn'. Yr ydych yn iawn, oherwydd mae helyntion y broses o uno cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad, fel y cyhoeddwyd bron 12 mis yn ôl, yn gwbl ddifyrwyd gan Lafur, yn nodwedd sy'n wirioneddol yn diffinio eich gweinyddiaeth. Lle y gallich fod wedi rhoi arweiniad er lles y bobl, yr ydych wedi peri dryswch ac ansierwydd. Yr oedd yma gyfle i ddatblygu ffordd unigryw yng Nghymru o ddarparu gwasanaethau, a fyddai wedi ennyn brwdfrydedd y sefydliadau a'r staff ynddynt, ond y gwrthwyneb a gafwyd. Collwyd cyfle i ddatblygu ymagwedd gydwethredol, gan

services, has been tossed away. Instead, you have dropped a bombshell on the three biggest agencies, and it is no wonder that their morale has detonated in the explosion.

3.40 p.m.

First Minister, your failure to provide leadership has also been highlighted by your timid approach to the future of this institution. The publication of the Richard commission report gave you a platform, and you initially said that you were enthusiastic about its outcome. You could have taken a stand and led your party and the country to a brighter tomorrow by ensuring that this institution has the powers to do its job. It is instructive that the greatest achievement of this term was something that was forced upon you, namely the abolition of top-up fees. To paraphrase Shakespeare, some are born with great ideas, some achieve great ideas, and others have great ideas thrust upon them. It is to your credit that you embraced the idea when it was thrust upon you. However, it is a pity that you could not have thought of it yourself.

**Nick Bourne:** I propose the following amendments in the name of David Melding. Amendment 6: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*regrets the failure of the First Minister to address the waiting list crisis.*

I propose amendment 7. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*regrets the failure of the First Minister to address the financial shortfalls facing many local health boards and NHS trusts.*

I propose amendment 8. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*believes that the knowledge economy will be strengthened by the National Assembly's decision not to introduce top-up fees for Welsh students.*

I propose amendment 9. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

adeiladu ar werthoedd Cymreig i ddarparu gwasanaethau o'r radd flaeaf. Yn lle hynny, yr ydych wedi syfrdanu'r tair asiantaeth fwyaf, ac nid oes rhyfedd eu bod wedi digaloni'n llwyr.

Brif Weinidog, mae eich methiant i ddarparu arweinyddiaeth wedi ei amlygu hefyd gan eich ymagwedd wangalon tuag at ddyfodol y sefydliad hwn. Yn sgîl cyhoeddi adroddiad comisiwn Richard, cawsoch lwyfan, ac i ddechrau dywedasoch eich bod yn frwdfrydig ynglŷn â'i ganlyniad. Gallech fod wedi sefyll yn gadarn ac arwain eich plaid a'ch gwlad i well yfory drwy sicrhau bod gan y sefydliad hwn y pwerau i wneud ei waith. Mae'n ddiddorol mai'r llwyddiant mwyaf y tymor hwn oedd rhywbeth a orfodwyd arnoch chi, sef diddymu ffioedd atodol. I aralleirio Shakespeare, genir rhai gyda syniadau gwych, mae eraill yn cael syniadau da a gorfodir syniadau gwych ar eraill. Rhaid eich canmol am groesawu'r syniad pan gafodd ei orfodi arnoch. Fodd bynnag, trueni na allech fod wedi meddwl am hynny eich hun.

**Nick Bourne:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw David Melding. Gwelliant 6: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn gresynu at fethiant y Prif Weinidog i fynd i'r afael ag argyfwng y rhestri aros.*

Cynigiaf welliant 7. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn gresynu at fethiant y Prif Weinidog i fynd i'r afael â'r diffygion ariannol sy'n wynebu sawl bwrdd iechyd lleol ac ymddiriedolaeth GIG.*

Cynigiaf welliant 8. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn credu y cryfheir yr economi wybodaeth yn sgîl penderfyniad y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i beidio â chyflwyno ffioedd ychwanegol i fyfyrwyr Cymru.*

Cynigiaf welliant 9. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*notes that the economic strategy is being compromised by the failure of the Welsh Assembly Government to bridge the wealth gap between Wales and the rest of the United Kingdom.*

I propose amendment 10. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*condemns the First Minister for his failure to develop a coherent strategy with regards to the wind-up of the ASPBs, which has contributed to the relegation of Wales to ninth place in the United Kingdom's inward investment league.*

Having not had an annual report for the first 18 months of the Assembly, we have now had two reports in nine months. You would assume that this sudden flurry of wild activity would mean that the Assembly Government finally had something to crow about. The reality is that we have yet another list of excuses.

We are treated again to a re-statement of Labour's top 10 commitments. These have little or nothing to do with tackling the appalling hospital waiting list crisis that confronts Wales. Something is clearly wrong with the Government's priorities as hospital waiting lists went up again last month. Waiting lists are 73 per cent higher than they were in May 1999 when the National Assembly was established, and this translates to an extra 122,325 people waiting for treatment compared with six years ago. One in 10 of the Welsh population is on a waiting list, and the problem is scarcely mentioned in this annual report.

As has been said, there is something to shout about in terms of education, namely the Assembly's commitment to rule out top-up fees in Wales for Welsh-domiciled students after 2007. Strangely, there is nothing about this achievement in this annual report. It may be that the good news came too late for the annual report. However, I cannot help feeling that, if this had been a Labour-led policy rather than an opposition policy that had been adopted by the Government, the news might just have crept into this annual

*yn nodi bod y strategaeth economaidd yn cael ei pheryglu gan fethiant Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i bontio'r bwlc cyfoeth rhwng Cymru a gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig.*

Cynigiaf welliant 10. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn condemnio'r Prif Weinidog am ei fethiant i ddatblygu strategaeth gydlynus mewn perthynas â therfynu'r CCNC, gan fod hynny wedi cyfrannu at ostwng Cymru i'r nawfed safle yng nghyngahrair mewnfuddsoddi y Deyrnas Unedig.*

A ninnau heb gael adroddiad blynnyddol am 18 mis cyntaf y Cynulliad, yr ydym yn awr wedi cael dau adroddiad mewn naw mis. Byddech yn cymryd yn ganiataol y byddai'r holl weithgaredd gwyllt a sydyn hwn yn golygu bod gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad rhywbeth i ymffrostio yn ei gylch o'r diwedd. Y gwir yw mai rhestr arall o esgusodion sydd gennym.

Unwaith eto clywn ailddatganiad o 10 ymrwymiad pennaf Llafur. Nid oes a wnelo'r rhain fawr ddim neu ddim oll â mynd i'r afael â'r argyfwng erchyll o ran rhestrau aros ysbytai sy'n wynebu Cymru. Yn amlwg, mae rhywbeth o'i le ar flaenoriaethau'r Llywodraeth gan i restrau aros ysbytai godi eto fis diwethaf. Mae rhestrau aros 73 y cant yn uwch nag yr oeddent ym mis Mai 1999 pan sefydlwyd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ac mae hyn yn golygu bod 122,325 ychwanegol o bobl yn aros am driniaeth o gymharu â chwe blynedd yn ôl. Mae un o bob 10 o bobl Cymru ar restr aros, a phrin y cyfeirir at y broblem yn yr adroddiad blynnyddol hwn.

Fel y dywedwyd, mae rhywbeth i ymffrostio yn ei gylch o ran addysg, sef ymrwymiad y Cynulliad i ddiystyr u ffioedd atodol yng Nghymru ar gyfer myfyrwyr sy'n byw yng Nghymru ar ôl 2007. Yn rhyfedd iawn, nid oes sôn o gwbl am y cyflawniad hyn yn yr adroddiad blynnyddol hwn. Efallai i'r newyddion da ddod yn rhy hwyr ar gyfer yr adroddiad blynnyddol. Fodd bynnag, teimlaf, pe bai hyn wedi bod yn bolisi o dan arweiniad Llafur yn hytrach na pholisi gwrthblaid a fabwysiadwyd gan y

report. Although, to be fair to the First Minister, he did mention it, although briefly, in his address. If I am wrong about this, I look forward to its inclusion in next year's report; we can expect it to be trumpeted then, no doubt, that it was championed by the opposition parties and taken up by the Labour Assembly Government. This achievement, which was initiated by opposition Members in the form of a Welsh Conservative debate, dwarfs many of the so-called success stories in the annual report.

To continue with education, I wish to mention the commitment on school breakfasts, which is all spin again. In the First Minister's annual report and in 'Delivering our Promises' the promise to provide for all primary school children to have free breakfasts is re-stated. However, we know that this was never the intention. The Welsh Assembly Government has done costings on the basis that the take-up will be minimal, and it could not possibly afford it if it were not. That has been confirmed during today's questions. It was a misleading promise then, and it remains a misleading promise now.

**Jane Davidson:** No, it is not.

**Nick Bourne:** I will gladly give way to the Minister if she wants to say something other than from a sedentary position.

**Jane Davidson:** I would be glad to intervene. It was not a misleading promise then and it is not a misleading promise now. We promised to provide for children to have access to free breakfasts.

**Nick Bourne:** Not access.

**Jane Davidson:** We promised for all children to have free breakfasts. We also said that the scheme was entirely voluntary and that we would provide the money. We have had people working over a long time now to ensure that the costings are being done

Llywodraeth, efallai y byddai'r newyddion wedi cael eu cynnwys yn yr adroddiad blynnyddol hwn. Ond i fod yn deg i'r Prif Weinidog, soniodd am hyn, er yn fras, yn ei arraith. Os wyf yn anghywir ynglŷn â hyn, edrychaf ymlaen at ei gynnwys yn adroddiad y flwyddyn nesaf; gallwn ddisgwyl llawer o sôn amdano bryd hynny, yn sicr, fel rhywbedd a hyrwyddwyd gan y gwrthbleidiau ac a dderbyniwyd gan Lywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad. Bydd llawer o'r llwyddiannau honedig yn yr adroddiad blynnyddol yn ymddangos yn fach o'u cymharu â'r llwyddiant hwn, a gychwynnwyd gan Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau ar ffurf dadl gan Geidwadwyr Cymru.

I barhau gydag addysg, hoffwn sôn am yr ymrwymiad ar frecwast ysgol, dim byd ond sbin unwaith eto. Yn adroddiad blynnyddol y Prif Weinidog ac yn 'Cyflawni ein Haddewidion', mae'r addewid i ddarparu brecwast ysgol am ddim i bob plentyn ysgol yn cael ei ailddatgan. Fodd bynnag, gwyddom nad oedd hyn erioed yn fwriad. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi llunio costau ar y sail y bydd y nifer a fydd yn mantiesio ar hyn yn fach iawn, ac ni allai ei fforddio o gwbl pe na bai hynny'n wir. Cadarnhawyd hynny yn ystod cwestiynau heddiw. Yr oedd yn addewid camarweiniol bryd hynny, ac y mae'n dal yn addewid camarweiniol yn awr.

**Jane Davidson:** Nac ydyw.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn fodlon ildio i'r Gweinidog os yw am ddweud rhywbedd heblaw ar ei heistedd.

**Jane Davidson:** Byddwn yn falch o ymyrryd. Nid oedd yn addewid camarweiniol bryd hynny ac nid yw'n addewid camarweiniol yn awr. Addawyd y byddem yn darparu i blant allu cael brecwast am ddim.

**Nick Bourne:** Nid gallu cael.

**Jane Davidson:** Addawyd y byddai pob plentyn yn cael brecwast am ddim. Dywedasom hefyd fod y cynllun yn holol wîrfoddol ac y byddem yn darparu'r arian. Mae pobl wedi bod yn gweithio ers amser hir bellach i sicrhau bod y costau'n cael eu

properly, because we believe in evidence-based costings going into budget cycles.

**Nick Bourne:** Okay. We have heard enough now.

**Jane Davidson:** The funding that goes into the budget cycle every year will be what is needed to deliver that at that point. We promised to deliver that by 2007. You may not have noticed that it is only 2005.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. This is not a speech, but an intervention. However, it is also right that Members listen to those interventions that they agree to take.

**Nick Bourne:** In 'Delivering our Promises', you stated:

'We promised to provide for all primary school children to have free breakfasts'.

We know that you had absolutely no intention to deliver that. I heard you say so today during questions.

**Mark Isherwood:** Do you share my concern that the primary school that my son attends is now threatened with having to close its breakfast club because of cuts in funding to the local authority by this Welsh Assembly Government?

**Nick Bourne:** I certainly do share that concern. I also feel that the Minister should stop digging herself a hole, because this is a misleading promise. We know that if schools do not opt in but pupils want to benefit from this, they cannot—it was a misleading promise.

On the position of the ASPBs and the mergers, as is known, we have grave concerns about the proposals, for example, relating to the Welsh Development Agency and the Wales Tourist Board, and it was stated in debate yesterday in relation to the Welsh Language Board. However, I will focus on one particular aspect of the work of the foremost of our ASPBs: the WDA. The First Minister's annual report talks in the

gwneud yn gywir, oherwydd credwn mewn costau ar sail tystiolaeth ar gyfer cylchoedd cyllidebau.

**Nick Bourne:** Iawn. Yr ydym wedi clywed digon yn awr.

**Jane Davidson:** Yr arian sy'n mynd i mewn i'r cylch cyllideb bob blwyddyn fydd yr hyn sydd ei angen i ddarparu hynny ar yr adeg honno. Yr oeddem yn addo cyflawni hynny erbyn 2007. Efallai nad ydych wedi sylwi mai dim ond 2005 ydyw.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Nid arraith yw hon, ond ymyriad. Fodd bynnag, mae'n iawn hefyd i Aelodau wrando ar yr ymyriadau hynny y maent yn cytuno i'w derbyn.

**Nick Bourne:** Yn 'Cyflawni ein Haddewidion', yr oeddech yn dweud:

'Addawyd darparu brecwast am ddim yn yr ysgol i blant ym mhob ysgol gynradd.'

Gwyddom nad oedd gennych unrhyw fwriad gwneud hynny. Fe'ch clywais yn dweud hynny heddiw yn ystod y cwestiynau.

**Mark Isherwood:** A ydych chi, fel finnau, yn pryderu bod bygythiad y bydd yr ysgol gynradd y mae fy mab yn ei mynchyu yn gorfod cau ei chlwb brecwast oherwydd toriadau mewn arian i'r awdurdod lleol gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru?

**Nick Bourne:** Yn sicr, yr wyf fi hefyd yn pryderu am hynny. Teimlaf hefyd y dylai'r Gweinidog roi'r gorau i greu problemau iddi hi ei hun, gan fod hwn yn addewid camarweiniol. Gwyddom, os yw ysgolion yn dewis peidio ag ymuno â'r cynllun ond bod disgylion am elwa o hyn, na allant—yr oedd yn addewid camarweiniol.

O ran CCNCau a'r broses uno, fel y'i gelwir, yr ydym yn pryderu'n fawr iawn am y cynigion, er enghraifft, sy'n ymwneud ag Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a Bwrdd Croeso Cymru, ac fe'i nodwyd yn y ddadl ddoe mewn perthynas â Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg. Fodd bynnag, canolbwytiaf ar un agwedd benodol ar waith ein CCNCau blaenaf: sef WDA. Mae adroddiad blynnyddol y Prif Weinidog yn sôn yn yr adran ar 'Getting

section on ‘Getting close to the people’ of the Government’s commitment to openness and consultation. Indeed, just yesterday, I heard the Minister for Economic Development and Transport in this Chamber talk about openness and consultation, and I heard him condemn, correctly, employers who do not consult with their staff. Yet, only last week, he initiated a due diligence review into the WDA. It was announced without a single word to the chairman of the WDA before hand—not a single word. That is deplorable.

We have seen the unedifying spectacle of a Minister, who is not in control of his portfolio, blaming one of the institutions for which he is responsible. A Minister floundering, searching for a life raft, pushing the international division of Wales’s foremost institution off the raft and getting on it himself. The commitment to consultation rings a bit hollow in the light of that. It is scarcely surprising that morale in the WDA is at rock bottom. However, I know that we will return to this matter next week.

In short, the Government has little to be proud of in the last year, except the very welcome news in relation to top-up tuition fees. I pay tribute to the First Minister for adopting a statesman-like approach so that we could move on that important issue on behalf of everyone here. However, that policy was thrust upon this Labour Government by the opposition forces during a Welsh Conservative minority debate.

**Irene James:** I welcome the annual report and the opportunity to take stock of measures and progress, which move us closer to our vision for a better Wales. It is important that we do not consider this report in isolation, but as a milestone that recognises the steps taken, since 1997 and 1999, to ensure more prosperous communities across Wales. We must build on the foundation of key investment to regenerate our poorest communities that we have laid down to achieve Objective 1 status, to regenerate the economic infrastructure of west Wales and the Valleys and, more recently, Communities First, which provides just under £100 million

close to the people’ am ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth i fod yn agored ac i ymgynghori. Yn wir, ddoe yn unig y clywais y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth yn y Siambra hon yn sôn am fod yn agored ac i ymgynghori, a chlywais ef yn condemnio cyflogwyr nad ydynt yn ymgynghori â'u staff, ac yr oedd yn iawn i wneud hynny. Ac eto, yr wythnos diwethaf dechreuodd adolygiad diwydrwydd dyledus o WDA. Fe'i cyhoeddwyd heb ddweud yr un gair wrth gadeirydd WDA ymlaen llaw—dim un gair. Mae hynny'n warthus.

Yr ydym wedi gweld yr olygfa gywilyddus lle mae Gweinidog, nad yw'n gallu rheoli ei bortffolio, yn beio un o'r sefydliadau y mae'n gyfrifol amdanynt. Gweinidog yn ymbalfalu, yn chwilio am rafft achub, yn gwthio'r is-adran ryngwladol yn sefydliad mwyaf blaenllaw Cymru oddi ar y rafft ac yn dringo arni ei hun. Nid yw'r ymrwymiad i ymgynghori yn argyhoeddi o gwbl o gofio hynny. Nid yw'n syndod fod yw morâl yn WDA ar ei isaf erioed. Fodd bynnag, gwn y byddwn yn dychwelyd at y mater hwn yr wythnos nesaf.

Yn fras, nid oedd gan y Llywodraeth lawer i ymfalchiö yn ei gylch yn y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, heblaw'r newyddion da iawn mewn perthynas â ffioedd dysgu atodol. Yr wyf yn rhoi teyrned i'r Prif Weinidog am ymddwyn yn ddoeth fel y gallwn symud ymlaen i'r mater pwysig hwnnw ar ran pawb yma. Fodd bynnag, gorfodwyd y polisi hwnnw ar y Llywodraeth Lafur hon gan y gwrthbleidiau yn ystod dadl leiafrifol gan Gedwadwyr Cymru.

**Irene James:** Croesawaf yr adroddiad blynnyddol a'r cyfle i ystyried mesurau a chynnydd, sy'n mynd â ni gam yn nes at ein gweledigaeth ar gyfer Cymru well. Mae'n bwysig inni beidio ag ystyried yr adroddiad hwn ar ei ben ei hun, ond yn hytrach fel carreg filltir sy'n cydnabod y camau a gymerwyd, er 1997 a 1999, i sicrhau cymunedau mwy ffyniannus ledled Cymru. Rhaid inni adeiladu ar sail y buddsoddi allweddol i adfywio ein cymunedau tlotaf a bennwyd gennym er mwyn cyrraedd statws Amcan 1, i adfywio seilwaith economaidd y Gorllewin a'r Cymoedd, ac yn ddiweddarach yn Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, sy'n darparu

over 2003 to 2006-07. That will ensure a welcome injection of funding into the poorest wards in Wales.

Unemployment has fallen fastest in the Objective 1 region, and programmes and measures such as the New Deal and the national minimum wage, working alongside the Assembly economic development policy and investment through funding streams such as the Assembly investment grant and regional selective assistance are having a positive impact.

We must press forward with continuing emphasis on measures to benefit the poorest and most deprived, maintaining economic growth and stability as the key drivers of a more prosperous Wales. There is still much to do to champion these in the most socially excluded communities. I particularly look forward to the further implementation of the Narrowing the Gap project and the further action necessary to reduce the disparity and the causes of disparity between schools across Wales.

I welcome the commitment to an integrated public transport service and urge that the Ebbw Vale line reopening be strengthened strategically, promoted and prioritised. I am sure that you would agree that it will bring vital improvements to transport links in my constituency of Islwyn.

As a milestone, a Labour administration can celebrate the depth and breadth of achievement documented in this report. More importantly, we must ensure that it is a platform to deliver measures that, in my view, will go much further to deliver for our communities across Wales.

3.50 p.m.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Diolch am y cyfle i gyfrannu at y drafodaeth hon, er nad wyf yn holol siŵr beth yw ei phwrpas bellach. Cafwyd trafodaeth ar yr adroddiad y llynedd, ac er iddo gael ei wrthod gan y Cynulliad, ni ni welwyd newid o ganlyniad i hynny. Un

ychydig llai na £100 miliwn rhwng 2003 i 2006-07. Bydd hynny'n sicrhau chwistrelliad gwych o arian i'r wardiau tlotaf yng Nghymru.

Mae'r gostyngiad cyflymaf mewn diweithdra wedi digwydd yn rhanbarth Amcan 1, ac mae rhaglenni a mesurau megis y Fargen Newydd a'r isafswm cyflog cenedlaethol, drwy weithio ochr yn ochr â pholisi datblygu economaidd y Cynulliad a buddsoddi drwy ffrydau ariannu megis grant buddsoddi'r Cynulliad a chymorth rhanbarthol dewisol, yn cael effaith gadarnhaol.

Rhaid inni ddal ati a pharhau i roi pwyslais ar fesurau y bydd y cymunedau tlotaf a mwyaf difreintiedig yn elwa ohonynt, gan gynnal twf a sefydlogrwydd economaidd fel y prif ffactorau i hyrwyddo Cymru fwy ffyniannus. Mae llawer eto i'w wneud i hyrwyddo'r rhain yn y cymunedau sydd wedi eu hallgáu fwyaf yn gymdeithasol. Edrychaf ymlaen yn arbennig at weithredu prosiect Cau'r Bwlch ymellach, a'r camau pellach y mae angen eu cymryd i leihau'r anghydraddoldeb a'r rhesymau dros anghydraddoldeb rhwng ysgolion ledled Cymru.

Croesawaf yr ymrwymiad i wasanaeth cludiant cyhoeddus integredig, a phwysaf i'r gwaith o ailagor llinell Glynebw y gael ei gryfhau yn strategol, ei hyrwyddo a'i flaenoriaethu. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddech yn cytuno y bydd yn golygu gwelliannau hollbwysig mewn cysylltiadau cludiant yn fy etholaeth i yn Islwyn.

Fel carreg filltir, gall gweinyddiaeth Lafur ddathlu'r holl lwyddiannau a gofnodir yn yr adroddiad hwn. Yn bwysicach na hynny, rhaid inni sicrhau bod hyn yn llwyfan i gyflawni mesurau a fydd, yn fy marn i, yn mynd lawer ymhellach i wneud gwahaniaeth i'n cymunedau ledled Cymru.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I am grateful for the opportunity to contribute to this discussion, although I am no longer sure of its purpose. There was a discussion on the report last year, and although the report was rejected by the Assembly, there has been no change as a

rheswm pam yr ydym wedi penderfynu peidio â chyflwyno gwelliannau i'r cynnig y tro hwn yw ei bod yn amlwg nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn gwrando hyd yn oed pan fydd yn colli ei dadleuon ei hun.

Felly y mae'n anodd cymryd yr adroddiad hwn o ddifrif. Mae'r Llywodraeth hon wedi bod mewn grym ers dwy flynedd bellach, ers etholiad 2003, ac mae'n anodd gweld i ba raddau yn union y mae'n cadw at ei haddewidion, fel yr awgryma deitl y ddogfen. Nid ydym yn cytuno â'r addewidion hynny bob tro, ond mater arall yw hynny. Ein tasg ni yw mesur llwyddiant y Llywodraeth wrth gadw'r addewidion yn ei maniffesto. Y mae sawl Aelod eisoes wedi rhestru'r pethau a nodwyd ynddo, megis presgripsiynau am ddim, teithio ar fws am hanner pris i rai rhwng 16 a 18 oed, darparu brecwast am ddim i bob plentyn mewn ysgol gynradd, a'r cynllun i ddiddymu taliadau gofal cartref i'r anabl.

Hynod ddiddorol yw gweld pa mor sensitif yw'r Llywodraeth pan honnwn, yn holol gywir, nad ydyw wedi gwireddu'r amcanion hyn. Hyfryd hefyd yw gweld cefnogaeth y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol i'r Prif Weinidog heddiw, pan wnawn y pwynt bod y Llywodraeth yn gwrthod dweud wrthym beth yw cost srichau brecwast am ddim i bob plentyn ysgol gynradd yng Nghymru, ac mai dim ond cynlluniau peilot sydd ar gael ar hyn o bryd.

Gadewch inni edrych ar y pedair addewid a wnaed. Nid ydym wedi cyrraedd hanner ffordd o ran dileu taliadau am brescripsiynau. Ar deithio, dywed y Llywodraeth ei bod yn datblygu cynllun; mae'n sôn am gynlluniau peilot yn unig o ran brecwastau am ddim, a gwyddom mai dyna'r sefyllfa hefyd ynghylch taliadau gofal i'r anabl.

Ni chlywsom o gwbl pryd fydd y Llywodraeth yn gwireddu'r addewidion hyn. Dywed ei bod yn gobeithio gwneud y pethau hyn rhyw flwyddyn yn y dyfodol, ond ni chawn addewidion pendant. Yr hyn sy'n fy synnu yw ei bod yn dweud nad yw'r gwrthbleidiau wedi costio'r syniadau a gyflwynant. Yr ateb i hynny yw nad yw'r Llywodraeth wedi costio'r cynlluniau hyn

result. One reason why we have decided not to table amendments to the motion this time is that it is obvious the Government does not listen even when it loses its own arguments.

Therefore it is difficult to take this report seriously. This Government has now been in power for two years, since the 2003 election, and it is difficult to see the exact extent to which it is delivering its promises, as is suggested in the report's title. We do not always agree with those promises, but that is another matter. Our job is to gauge the Government's success in keeping the pledges made in its manifesto. Several Members have already listed the things contained in the manifesto, such as free prescriptions, half-price bus travel for those aged between 16 and 18, free breakfast for all primary school children, and the scheme to abolish homecare payments for disabled people.

It is most interesting to see how sensitive this Government is when we claim, quite rightly, that it has not realised these aims and objectives. It is also wonderful to see the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning giving the First Minister every support today, when we make the point that the Government refuses to tell us the cost of providing free breakfast for every primary school child in Wales, and that pilot schemes only are available at present.

Let us look at the four promises made. We have not yet reached halfway in abolishing prescription charges. On travel, the Government says it is developing a scheme; it mentions only pilot schemes in relation to free breakfasts, and we know that that is also the case with regard to care charges for the disabled.

We have not heard at all when the Government will accomplish these promises. It says it hopes to do so some time in the future, but there are no definite promises. I am surprised to hear the Government say that the opposition parties have not costed the plans they put forward. The answer to that is that neither has the Government costed these plans.

ychwaith.

Sylwais i'r Llywodraeth ddweud ei bod yn arwain y ffordd ar ryddid gwybodaeth.

When embarrassing questions have been asked by journalists from the *Western Mail*, the Government is not prepared to release information that it considers might be embarrassing.

Hoffwn ganolbwytio am eiliad ar y geiriau hyn yn yr adroddiad, lle y dywedir y dylai Cymru fod yn wlad lle dylai pobl fod yn dewis byw. Ni allwn anghytuno ag un sill o'r gosodiad hwnnw. Y cwestiwn yw, fodd bynnag, beth a wna'r Llywodaeth pan fo pobl ifanc yn dewis byw yn eu cymunedau ond yn methu â fforddio prynu tai ynddynt? Ni welaf fod y Llywodraeth yn cymryd y broblem hon o ddifrif. Rhaid inni gael cynlluniau gofalus, pwysig a phellgyrhaeddol i sicrhau bod pobl ifanc yn cael cartrefi yn eu cymunedau. Nid wyf yn sôn yn unig am gymunedau gwledig, ond am rai trefol a dinesig, oherwydd yr un broblem sy'n bodoli mewn nifer o'n cymunedau ar draws Cymru.

The First Minister mentioned the agreement that we had in the Assembly on the issue of top-up fees, something of which we can all be proud. However, an issue arose in that debate about the funding gap between universities in Wales and those in the rest of the United Kingdom. This was addressed by the Rees commission.

It is an issue that is agreed across the spectrum, and I hope that, when the First Minister responds, he will be able to tell us how far he thinks the Government can go in addressing that gap in the next financial year.

**Sandy Mewies:** I welcome the opportunity to support the Minister's mid-term report, which is timed to take stock of exactly what has been achieved since May 2003. I go on the evidence of my constituents in Delyn, who talk with great enthusiasm about many of our policies. The safety of our children, for example, has been enhanced greatly because Flintshire County Council has been able to take advantage of grants for 20-mph

I noticed the Government said it was leading the way on freedom of information.

Pan ofynnir cwestiynau annifyr gan newyddiadurwyr o'r *Western Mail*, nid yw'r Llywodraeth yn barod i ryddhau gwybodaeth a allai greu embaras.

I should like to concentrate for a moment on the words in the report that say that Wales should be a country where people choose to live. I do not dispute a single syllable of that statement. The question, however, is what does the Government do when young people choose to live in their communities but cannot afford to buy homes there? I cannot see that the Government is taking this problem seriously. We need important, far-reaching and carefully thought-out schemes to ensure that young people can buy homes in their communities. I am not referring to rural communities alone, but to urban and city communities, because the problem is the same in many of our communities across Wales.

Soniodd y Prif Weinidog am y cytundeb a oedd gennym yn y Cynulliad ar ffioedd atodol, sy'n rhywbeth y gallwn oll ymfalchiö ynddo. Fodd bynnag, cododd problem yn y ddadl honno am y bwlc ariannu rhwng prifysgolion yng Nghymru a'r rheini yng ngweddill y Deyrnas Unedig. Aeth comisiwn Rees i'r afael â hyn.

Mae'n fater y cytunir arno'n gyffredinol, a gobeithio, pan fydd y Prif Weinidog yn ymateb, y gall ddweud wrthym pa mor bell y mae'n credu y gall y Llywodraeth fynd i ddelio â'r bwlc hwnnw yn y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf.

**Sandy Mewies:** Croesawaf y cyfle i gefnogi adroddiad canol tymor y Gweinidog, a amserwyd er mwyn ystyried yn union yr hyn a gyflawnwyd ers mis Mai 2003. Yr wyf yn siarad ar sail tystiolaeth fy etholwyr yn Nelyn, sy'n frwd frydig iawn ynghylch nifer o'n polisiau. Mae diogelwch ein plant, er enghraifft, wedi gwella'n sylweddol oherwydd bod Cyngor Sir y Fflint wedi gallu manteisio ar grantiau i sicrhau parthau 20

zones around schools, and for safe routes to schools.

I talk to constituents, especially those in business, who have welcomed broadband access, which has sharpened their edge in business. This weekend, I was in Holywell at the Lluesty fete, which I opened. I was able to talk to many constituents there who were looking forward to the new Holywell Hospital—one of seven that we will be opening. The sooner that opens the better, First Minister. Constituents tell me about the benefits of free swimming, which is enjoyed by many young people. Whatever opposition Members want to say, I have seen older people taking advantage of the social and health-giving aspects of free swimming.

Communities First is making a difference in Delyn, from the setting up of tenants and residents associations, to running enormously successful food co-operatives, which give people who cannot afford it free, fresh food regularly. In Bryn Gwalia in Mold, another Communities First area, we have just given a great deal of money to enhance community facilities, which will enable the community there to carry on their good work. We have an arson reduction team based in Mold. We have recognised the difficulties, and have come up with answers to the problems. We know that many people would prefer to live in their own homes, and we are giving them the opportunity to do so. We are doing it by supporting organisations such as Care and Repair, and through measures such as the rapid response adaptations programme, which enables people to leave hospital as soon as they can.

I therefore welcome this report wholeheartedly. Mike German talked about piecemeal populism—it is better than wholesale populism, is it not? I am afraid that your populism is not proving too popular, if you consider the sparsity of your numbers. I look at the Conservatives and what they talk about. Their biggest opposition is their own Conservative counterparts in London; they have to get their policies past them first, because they do

milltir yr awr o amgylch ysgolion, ac ar gyfer llwybrau diogel i ysgolion.

Byddaf yn siarad ag etholwyr, yn enwedig y rheini ym myd busnes, sydd wedi croesawu gallu cael band eang. Mae hynny wedi rhoi mantais gystadleuol iddynt. Y penwythnos hwn, yr oeddwn yn Nhreffynnon yn agor ffair Lluesty. Cefais y cyfle i siarad â llawer etholwr yno a oedd yn edrych ymlaen at weld ysbty newydd Treffynnon—un o saith y byddwn yn eu hagor. Gorau po gyntaf y bydd hwnnw'n agor, Brif Weinidog. Dywed etholwyr wrthyf am fanteision nofio am ddim y mae nifer o bobl ifanc yn eu mwynhau. Beth bynnag a ddywed Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau, yr wyf wedi gweld pobl hŷn yn manteisio ar yr agweddau cymdeithasol a'r manteision iechyd sy'n gysylltiedig â nofio am ddim.

Mae Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn gwneud gwahaniaeth yn Nelyn, o sefydlu cymdeithasau tenantiaid a thrigolion, i redeg cwmniau bwyd cydweithredol llwyddiannus, sy'n rhoi bwyd ffres am ddim ac yn rheolaidd i bobl na allant ei fforddio. Ym Mrynn Gwalia yn yr Wyddgrug, un o ardaloedd eraill Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, yr ydym newydd roi llawer iawn o arian i wella cyfleusterau cymunedol, a fydd yn galluogi'r gymuned yno i barhau ei gwaith da. Mae gennym dîm atal tanau bwriadol yn yr Wyddgrug. Yr ydym wedi cydnabod yr anawsterau, ac wedi dod o hyd i atebion i'r problemau. Gwyddom y byddai'n well gan nifer o bobl fyw yn eu cartrefi eu hunain, ac yr ydym yn rhoi'r cyfle iddynt wneud hynny. Gwnawn hynny drwy gefnogi sefydliadau megis Gofal a Thrwsio, a thrwy fesurau megis y rhaglen addasiadau brys, sy'n galluogi pobl i adael yr ysbty cyn gynted ag y gallant.

Felly, croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn yn llwyr. Soniodd Mike German am boblyddiaeth ddarniog—onid yw hynny'n well na phoblyddiaeth benbaladr? Ofnaf nad yw eich poblyddiaeth chi yn rhy boblogaidd, os ystyriwch fod cyn lleied ohonoch. Edrychaf ar y Ceidwadwyr a'r hyn y maent yn sôn amdano. Eu gwrthwynebwyr mwyaf yw eu cyd-aelodau Ceidwadol yn Llundain; rhaid iddynt hwy gymeradwyo eu polisiau yn gyntaf, gan nad ydynt yn cytuno â datganoli.

not agree with devolution. As for the Welsh nationalists, they cannot agree on a leader, never mind a policy.

**David Melding:** I am rather surprised by the tirade that what was a rational speech, up to that point, descended into. No doubt, we may get a full explanation in time.

I was always told as a small child that self-praise was no recommendation, but this does not seem to have been an axiom in the Morgan household. We have the usual litany of, ‘We have said this’ and ‘We have done that’, and a lot of plastering over the cracks. I will concentrate on the record in the health service, because this is one of the great measures of the success or failure of devolution, because so many people continue to identify the Assembly as the Assembly Government, which is not strictly accurate, but it is perhaps understandable that that is how people make their judgment.

We still do not have a strategic grip on how we are going to develop the national health service. I say this with a heavy heart, because a universal and comprehensive health service is worth fighting for. It was won by the generations in the mid-twentieth century, and Wales has a proud record in its development. However, it will not survive by magic, and it will not survive without sweat and tears, if I can use that language. We are going to have to innovate and be brave in what we do and what we are prepared to experiment with. When you compare, in general, the NHS in Wales with that in England, we have fallen behind the developments that have occurred in England. I do not think that everything that has happened in England by magic is brilliant—there have been many mistakes there. We should be prepared to learn from England’s good practice; we do not want to emulate the poorer practice.

4.00 p.m.

However, a lack of innovation has impaired the development of the NHS since 1997, and particularly since 1999. Are we going to have treatment centres? I have put the question to the First Minister, and we do not

O ran y cenedlaetholwyr Cymreig, ni allant gytuno ar arweinydd, heb sôn am bolisi.

**David Melding:** Yr wyf yn synnu bod yr hyn a oedd yn araith resymol i ddechrau wedi troi’n ymosodiad llym. Mae’n sicr y cawn esboniad llawn ymhen amser.

Pan oeddwn yn blentyn bach, dywedid wrthyf bob amser nad oedd hunan-gamol yn golygu dim, ond ymddengys nad oedd hyn yn wireb yng nghartref y teulu Morgan. Cawn y litani arferol o, ‘Yr ydym wedi dweud hyn’ ac ‘Yr ydym wedi gwneud y llall’, a llawer o ceisio celu’r drwg. Canolbwytiaf ar record y gwasanaeth iechyd, oherwydd dyna yw un o brif fesurau llwyddiant neu fethiant datganoli, am fod cynifer o bobl yn parhau i adnabod y Cynulliad fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Nid yw hynny’n gwbl gywir, ond efallai ei bod yn ddealladwy mai dyma sut y mae pobl yn ei farnu.

Nid oes gennym eto afael strategol ar y ffordd y byddwn yn datblygu’r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Dywedaf hyn yn drwmgalon, oherwydd mae gwasanaeth iechyd cyffredinol a chynhwysfawr yn werth brwydro drosto. Fe’i henillwyd gan y cenedlaethau yng nghanol yr ugeinfed ganrif, ac mae gan Gymru record y gall ymfalchïo ynddi o ran ei ddatblygu. Fodd bynnag, ni fydd yn goroesi ar ei ben ei hun, ac ni fydd yn goroesi heb lawer o waith caled. Bydd yn rhaid inni fod yn arloesol ac yn ddewr yn yr hyn a wnaeon a’r hyn yr ydym yn barod i arbrofi ag ef. Pan gymharwch y GIG yng Nghymru â’r GIG yn Lloegr yn gyffredinol, yr ydym ar ei hôl hi o ran y datblygiadau yn Lloegr. Ni chredaf fod popeth sydd wedi digwydd yn Lloegr fel pe bae drwy hud yn wych—gwnaed nifer o gamgymeriadau yno. Dylem fod yn barod i ddysgu o arferion da Lloegr; nid ydym am efelychu’r arferion gwael.

Fodd bynnag, mae diffyg arloesedd wedi llesteirio datblygiad y GIG er 1997, ac yn arbennig er 1999. A ydym am gael canolfannau triniaeth? Yr wyf wedi gofyn y cwestiwn hwnnw i’r Prif Weinidog, ac ni

know what the answer is going to be. We are in a new phase of investment in capital development. I welcome that, but it must be put in the context of the reductions that were implemented in the early years of the Assembly. To be fair, there is now a fairly healthy level of capital spending. I wish that it could be even greater, possibly through the use of European moneys and private finance initiatives. I still do not have much idea about whether we have planned for the type of capital that we need. Are we looking at other providers, such as the private or voluntary sector? How long do we think that the average specialist facilities in hospitals are going to last? Five to 10 years is the sort of estimate that is current in England. Are we going to plan on the 25 to 35-year model, which was current from the late 1970s? These are very important issues, and we do not hear them debated here very often.

I do not have great faith in the current commissioning process either. It has been shaken apart in the past couple of years, with the abolition of the health authorities and the replacement of local health boards. We are now contracting into the three health economies or regions—call them what you will—and reviewing the commissioning processes. It sends a very confused signal as to what we intend to plan for and deliver in Wales. As an example, the latest paper prepared by the research service in the Library on waiting lists is pretty hair-raising reading, when you look at the waiting lists for mental health services. The very worst waiting lists in mental health are for children and adolescents, the next worst waiting lists are for adults who need acute care, and the lists get slightly better for the elderly population. We need to ask very hard questions about our health service, and the policy generated by the Government that has delivered that.

We are nearly halfway through the strategy for child and adolescent mental health, and yet a recent meeting of the Health and Social Services Committee was told that the commissioning process is still not robust. Halfway through a 10-year strategy we are

wyddom beth fydd yr ateb. Yr ydym mewn cyfnod newydd o fuddsoddi mewn datblygiadau cyfalaf. Croesawaf hynny, ond rhaid ei roi yng nghyd-destun y gostyngiadau a welwyd yn ystod blynnyddoedd cyntaf y Cynulliad. Er tegwch, mae yna lefel ddigon iach o wariant cyfalaf bellach. Trueni na allai fod yn fwy fyth, hwyrach drwy ddefnyddio arian Ewrop a mentrau cyllid preifat. Nid wyf yn sicr o hyd a ydym wedi cynllunio ar gyfer y math o gyfalaf y mae ei angen arnom. A ydym yn edrych ar ddarparwyr eraill, megis y sector preifat neu'r sector gwirfoddol? Am ba hyd y credwn y bydd cyfleusterau arbenigol cyffredin mewn ysbytai yn para? Pump i 10 mlynedd yw'r math o amcangyfrif yn Lloegr ar hyn o bryd. A ydym am gynllunio ar sail y model 25 i 35 mlynedd, a oedd yn gyfredol o ddiweddy 1970au? Mae'r rhain yn faterion pwysig iawn, ac nid ydynt yn cael eu trafod yma'n aml iawn.

Nid oes gennyf lawer o ffydd yn y broses gomisiynu gyfredol ychwaith. Mae wedi ei thrawsnewid yn yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf, drwy ddiddymu awdurdodau iechyd a'u disodli gan fyrrdau iechyd lleol. Yr ydym bellach wrthi'n ymrwymo i'r tair economi iechyd neu'r tri rhanbarth iechyd—beth bynnag yr hoffech eu galw—ac yn adolygu'r prosesau comisiynu. Mae'n cyfleo neges gymsglyd iawn am yr hyn y bwriadwn gynllunio ar ei gyfer a'i gyflwyno yng Nghymru. Er enghraifft, mae'r papur diweddaraf i'w baratoi gan y gwasanaeth ymchwil yn y Llyfrgell ar restrau aros yn eithaf syfrdanol, pan edrychwch ar yr amseroedd aros ar gyfer gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl. Mae'r rhestrau aros gwaethaf ym maes iechyd meddwl ar gyfer plant a'r glasoed, y rhestrau aros gwaethaf ond un yw oedolion sydd ag angen gofal aciwt, ac mae'r rhestrau'n gwella fymryn ar gyfer yr henoed. Mae angen inni ofyn cwestiynau anodd iawn am ein gwasanaethau iechyd, a'r polisi a luniwyd gan y Llywodraeth sydd wedi ei ddarparu.

Yr ydym bron hanner y ffordd drwy'r strategaeth ar gyfer iechyd meddwl ymhliith plant a'r glasoed, ac eto mewn cyfarfod o'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn ddiweddar, dywedwyd nad yw'r broses gomisiynu yn gadarn o hyd.

still not confident about how we commission the services that we need. This sends a pretty dramatic and dismal message to the Government.

To be fair, the First Minister has talked about the balance between homecare and hospital services—although I am not sure that he yet has the policy. I encourage innovation. I read in the *Western Mail* about the Colorado model, which was an independent service that was provided. Congratulations. I hope that you are looking at that sort of thing, because that may be the road that we need to go down, in part. It will not replace all the services that we need to deliver, but we need different models to deliver NHS services.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Your five minutes is up.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** The importance of community regeneration must not be underestimated. Government investments enable the re-establishment of strong and sustainable communities. The report gives Assembly Members a chance to speak about the big picture: about how the Assembly Government is delivering, across all departments, real improvements to the quality of people's lives in Wales.

According to the index of multiple deprivation, the Caerphilly borough has most of the top 25 deprived wards in Wales. Thirty-nine per cent of the population of the borough have no qualifications. Investment in our communities, therefore, is vital if we are to turn that around. The Caerphilly borough is seeing how investment by the Assembly Government in public services can reap these rewards. The recently announced Assembly Government investment of almost £100 million in a local general hospital for Caerphilly will deliver tangible community regeneration and clear service improvements. The new hospital, which is on course to be open by the end of 2009, will ensure that local people benefit from twenty-first century services, delivered in a state-of-the-art setting, all thanks to the Assembly Government's commitment to investing in the NHS and its ability to provide almost

Hanner y ffordd drwy strategaeth 10 mlynedd, a ninna'u dal yn amheus sut i gomisiynu'r gwasanaethau y mae eu hangen arnom. Mae hyn yn cyfleu neges ddigon dramatig a digalon i'r Llywodraeth.

I fod yn deg, mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi sôn am y cydbwysedd rhwng gofal yn y cartref a gwasanaethau ysbty—er nad wyf yn siŵr a yw'r polisi ganddo eto. Yr wyf yn annog arloesedd. Darllenais am fodel Colarado yn y *Western Mail*, sef gwasanaeth annibynnol a ddarparwyd. Llongyfarchiadau. Gobeithio eich bod yn edrych ar bethau felly, oherwydd efallai mai dyna'r llwybr y bydd angen inni ei droedio, yn rhannol. Ni fydd yn disodli'r holl wasanaethau y mae angen inni eu darparu, ond mae arnom angen modelau gwahanol i ddarparu gwasanaethau'r GIG.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae eich pum munud wedi dod i ben.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Ni ddylid tanbrisio pwysigrwydd adfywio cymunedol. Mae buddsoddiadau'r Llywodraeth yn ei gwneud yn bosibl ailsefydlu cymunedau cryf a chynaliadwy. Mae'r adroddiad yn gyfle i Aelodau'r Cynulliad siarad am y darlun mawr: am y ffordd y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn sicrhau gwelliannau gwirioneddol, ar draws pob adran, yn ansawdd bywydau pobl yng Nghymru.

Yn ôl y mynegai amlamddifadedd, mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r 25 o wardiau mwyaf difreintiedig yng Nghymru ym mwrdeistref Caerffili. Nid oes gan 39 y cant o'r boblogaeth yn y fwrdeistref unrhyw gymwysterau. Felly, mae buddsoddi yn ein cymunedau yn hanfodol er mwyn newid hynny. Mae bwrdeistref Caerffili yn gweld sut y gall buddsoddiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ddwyn ffrwyth. Bydd y buddsoddiad o bron i £100 miliwn gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad mewn ysbty cyffredinol lleol ar gyfer Caerffili, a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar, yn sicrhau gwaith adfywio cymunedol pendant a gwelliannau amlwg mewn gwasanaethau. Bydd yr ysbty newydd, y bwriedir iddo fod ar agor erbyn diwedd 2009, yn sicrhau bod pobl leol yn elwa o wasanaethau'r unfed ganrif ar hugain. Bydd y rheini'n cael eu darparu mewn adeilad modern, diolch i

£100 million to the Gwent Healthcare NHS Trust and Caerphilly Local Health Board for this purpose.

Caerphilly has also benefited from the Assembly Government's understanding that good transport links deliver a plethora of benefits. Leveraging in private sector investment is a key benefit of the Assembly-funded Bargoed relief road. Not only will this long-awaited road bring life back into Bargoed town centre, it will deliver more jobs and opportunities for residents. Several private companies have already expressed interest in creating new businesses in plots that run parallel to the new road. Furthermore, as Chair of the Objective 1 Programme Monitoring Committee for west Wales and the Valleys, I know the benefits that structural funds have brought, and will continue to bring, to the people of Wales.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Are you aware that at the end of the last week's first meeting of the Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister, the public, of which there were quite a few present, burst into spontaneous applause? I have not experienced that since the onset of the Assembly. Do you agree, therefore, that that shows how in tune with the people of Wales the First Minister is, and that his appeal to the people of Wales far exceeds that of other leaders in the Assembly?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** I am not in the least surprised to hear that. The key figures on how structural funds have delivered for Wales are simply staggering. Since the beginning of the programme, structural funds have delivered for Wales around 110,000 gross jobs and £1.25 billion-worth of investment in over 2,413 approved projects, which have generated a further £3 billion of investment directly into Wales.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I was looking at the figures for the INTERREG areas, which are the old Dyfed and Gwynedd and a bit of Denbighshire, and the gross value added for 1999 was 62 per cent of the UK average; the Irish equivalent is 113 per cent, by the way.

ymrwymiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i fuddsoddi yn y GIG, a'i gallu i ddarparu bron £100 miliwn ar gyfer Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gofal Iechyd Gwent a Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Caerffili, at y diben hwn.

Mae Caerffili hefyd wedi elwa o ddealltwriaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad fod cysylltiadau cludiant da yn arwain at lu o fuddiannau. Mae trosoli buddsoddi gan y sector preifat yn un o fuddiannau allweddol ffordd liniaru Bargod, sy'n cael ei hariannu gan y Cynulliad. Bydd y ffordd hirddisgwylledig hon nid yn unig yn adfywiow canol tref Bargod, ond bydd hefyd yn creu mwy o swyddi a chyflleoedd i drigolion. Mae nifer o gwmniau preifat eisoes wedi mynegi diddordeb mewn creu busnesau newydd ar leiniau tir wrth ochr y ffordd newydd. At hynny, fel Cadeirydd Pwyllgor Monitro Rhaglen Amcan 1 ar gyfer y Gorllewin a'r Cymoedd, gwn am y buddiannau y mae cronfeydd strwythurol wedi eu darparu, ac a fydd yn parhau, ar gyfer pobl Cymru.

**Gwenda Thomas:** A ydych yn ymwybodol o'r ffaith fod y cyhoedd - ac yr oedd cryn nifer yn bresennol - wedi dechrau cymeradwyo'n ddigymhell ar ddiwedd cyfarfod yr wythnos diwethaf o'r Pwyllgor Craffu ar Waith y Prif Weinidog? Nid wyf wedi gweld hynny ers dyfodiad y Cynulliad. A gytunwch, felly, fod hynny'n dangos bod y Prif Weinidog ar yr un donfedd â phobl Cymru, a bod ei apêl i bobl Cymru yn rhagori ar arweinwyr eraill yn y Cynulliad?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Nid wyf yn synnu o gwbl i glywed hynny. Mae'r ffigurau allweddol ar y ffordd y mae cronfeydd strwythurol wedi darparu ar gyfer Cymru yn rhyfeddol. Ers dechrau'r rhaglen, mae cronfeydd strwythurol wedi sicrhau tua 110,000 o swyddi gros i Gymru, ac £1.25 biliwn o fuddsoddi mewn mwy na 2,413 o brosiectau cymeradwy, sydd wedi creu £3 biliwn pellach o fuddsoddi uniongyrchol i Gymru.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Yr oeddwn yn edrych ar y ffigurau ar gyfer ardaloedd INTERREG, sef hen siroedd Ddyfed a Gwynedd a rhan o sir Ddinbych, a'r gwerth gros a ychwanegwyd ar gyfer 1999 oedd 62 y cant o'r cyfartaledd ar gyfer y DU; 113 y cant

In 2002, which is when the latest figures were published, it was still 62 per cent. How do you explain that?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** As has been said many times, those figures are out of date, and, as you have just said, they were the figures for 2002. I am confident that when more recent figures become available in due course, they will show a measurable improvement. In addition, the activities of Finance Wales have helped to create and safeguard a further 9,500 jobs and the skills and employment action plan 2005 ensures that Wales's skills base is responsive to employer needs.

**Alun Cairns:** Will you give way?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** No, I will not give way again.

For example, we have invested £40 million in improving basic literacy and numeracy skills, and there has been a 66 per cent increase in the uptake of modern apprenticeships, as has been referred to. All these initiatives prove that the Assembly is serious about equipping real people with real skills for real jobs. These investments are a clear sign of the Assembly working to sustain and generate jobs at the front line within our communities. Investment in communities and good quality jobs are essential for local regeneration, and the commitment to the investments within Caerphilly prove that the Assembly Government is serious about delivering a better life for the people of Wales.

**Jenny Randerson:** This is a very thin document on very thick paper. If you strip out the spin, and take away the achievements that date back to the partnership Government, what do you have? Not very much. There have been two years of treading water by this Labour Assembly Government, and two years of dog paddling around in a circle—there are no Olympic swimmers in that Cabinet. To turn to the details of the Welsh Liberal Democrat criticisms and concerns about this document, I will start with the promise to scrap homecare charges

yw'r hyn sy'n cyfateb yn Iwerddon, gyda llaw. Yn 2002, pan gyhoeddwyd y ffigurau diweddaraf, yr oedd yn dal yn 62 y cant. Sut yr ydych yn esbonio hynny?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Fel y dywedwyd droeon, nid yw'r ffigurau hynny'n gyfredol bellach, ac fel yr ydych newydd ei ddweud, ffigurau ar gyfer 2002 oeddent. Hyderaf pan fydd ffigurau diweddarach ar gael maes o law, y byddant yn dangos gwelliant mesuradwy. Yn ogystal, mae gweithgareddau Cyllid Cymru wedi helpu creu a diogelu 9,500 o swyddi eraill, ac mae cynllun gweithredu sgiliau a chyflogaeth 2005 yn sicrhau bod sylfaen sgiliau Cymru yn ymateb i anghenion cyflogwyr.

**Alun Cairns:** A ildiwrch?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Na wnaf, nid ildiaf eto.

Er enghraifft, yr ydym wedi buddsoddi £40 miliwn i wella sgiliau llythrennedd a rhifedd sylfaenol, a bu cynydd o 66 y cant yn nifer y bobl sy'n cofrestru ar gyfer prentisiaethau modern, fel y cyfeiriwyd. Mae'r holl fentrau hyn yn profi bod y Cynulliad o ddifrif yngylch meithrin sgiliau gwirioneddol ymhlih pobl wirioneddol ar gyfer swyddi gwirioneddol. Mae'r buddsoddiadau hyn yn arwydd clir bod y Cynulliad yn gweithio i gynnal a chreu swyddi yn y rheng flaen yn ein cymunedau. Mae buddsoddi mewn cymunedau a swyddi o safon yn hanfodol ar gyfer gwaith adfywio lleol, ac mae'r ymrwymiad i'r buddsoddiadau yng Nghaerffili yn profi bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o ddifrif yngylch darparu bywyd gwell i bobl Cymru.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae hon yn ddogfen denau iawn ar bapur trwchus iawn. Os tynnwch y sbini allan, a'r llwyddiannau sy'n mynd yn ôl i'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth, beth sydd ar ôl? Dim llawer. Mae Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad wedi troedio'n ysgafn, ac wedi bod yn troi mewn cylch ers dwy flynedd—nid oes nofwr y Olympaidd yn y Cabinet hwnnw. I droi at fanylion beirniadaeth a phryderon Democraidiad Rhyddfrydol Cymru am y ddogfen hon, dechreuaf gyda'r addewid i gael gwared ar daliadau gofal yn y cartref i

for disabled people. The Welsh Liberal Democrats would have much preferred a commitment to free personal care for the elderly, as that would have fulfilled an earlier promise of this Government. However, we welcomed the more modest commitment that eventually came out in relation to disabled people. It is therefore truly reprehensible that over two years on from that promise the Government can only announce a pilot scheme starting in the autumn.

On free prescriptions, they are on the way, but the Welsh Liberal Democrats would have much preferred a concentration on those most in need, namely those with chronic illnesses. Those people have to wait four unnecessary years before they get free prescriptions, while free prescriptions will go, at the same time, to people with a much lesser need.

4.10 p.m.

On the promise on nurses' training, there are more nurses being trained, but evidence given by the Royal College of Nursing's last week outlined that that was not keeping pace with the profession's drop-out rate and the high percentage of nurses who qualify but do not register and join the profession. Low morale is tearing away continuously at the profession in Wales, and the agency bill rockets annually.

The older people's commissioner was not our priority, as we would have concentrated on front-line services for the elderly, but it was Labour's priority. The First Minister has just trumpeted progress on that. However, I hear that the Bill has this week been withdrawn from the House of Lords because of the large number of amendments that were put down, and that it will not return until October. It would be helpful if the First Minister could explain the impact of this further delay on this promise.

It is a great pity that this document does not refer to successful roll-out of the Wanless report, which is only just getting going. Along those lines, I want to make it clear that we will be supporting the Conservative's

bobl anabl. Byddai lawer yn well gan Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru weld ymrwymiad i gynnig gofal personol am ddim i'r henoed, oherwydd byddai hynny wedi gwireddu addewid cynharach gan y Llywodraeth hon. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn croesawu'r ymrwymiad llai a wnaed yn y pen draw mewn perthynas â phobl anabl. Felly, mae'n gwbl warthus mai'r cyfan y gall y Llywodraeth ei wneud ddwy flynedd yn ddiweddarach yw cyhoeddi cynllun peilot a fydd yn dechrau yn yr hydref.

O ran presgripsiynau am ddim, maent ar eu ffordd, ond byddai lawer yn well gan Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru weld canolbwytio ar y rheini sydd â'r angen mwyaf, sef pobl sydd â salwch croning. Rhaid i'r bobl hynny aros am bedair blynedd diangen cyn cael presgripsiynau am ddim, tra bydd pobl lawer llai anghenus, ar yr un pryd, yn cael presgripsiynau am ddim.

O ran addo hyfforddiant i nyrsys, mae mwy o nyrsys yn cael eu hyfforddi, ond yr oedd dystiolaeth a roddwyd gan y Coleg Nyrsio Brenhinol yr wythnos diwethaf yn amlinellu nad oedd hynny'n cyfateb i nifer y nyrsys sy'n gadael y proffesiwn, a chanran uchel y nyrsys sy'n cymhwys o ond nad ydynt yn cofrestru ac yn ymuno â'r proffesiwn. Mae morâl isel yn cael effaith barhaus ar y proffesiwn yng Nghymru, ac mae bil yr asiantaethau'n saethu i fyny bob blwyddyn.

Nid ein blaenoriaeth ni oedd comisiynydd pobl hŷn, oherwydd byddem wedi canolbwytio ar wasanaethau rheng flaen i'r henoed: blaenoriaeth Llafur ydoedd. Mae'r Prif Weinidog newydd gyhoeddi cynnydd ar hynny. Fodd bynnag, clywais i'r Mesur gael ei dynnu'n ôl o Dŷ'r Arglwyddi yr wythnos hon oherwydd y nifer fawr o welliannau a gyflwynwyd, ac na fydd yn dychwelyd tan fis Hydref. Byddai'n ddefnyddiol pe gallai'r Prif Weinidog egluro effaith yr oedi pellach hwn ar yr addewid hwn.

Mae'n drueni mawr nad yw'r ddogfen hon yn cyfeirio at y broses lwyddiannus o gyflwyno adroddiad Wanless, sydd newydd gychwyn. Ar hyd y llinellau hynny, hoffwn bwysleisio'r ffait y byddwn yn cefnogi

amendment 7, because we believe that the financial problems of local health boards and trusts and the need to review the Townsend formula are pressing issues. I would like to know when we will get firm information on the review of the Townsend formula that has been taking place. I do not get any firm response from the Minister when I ask him in Plenary questions. Will it be like the autism strategy, many years in the cooking and then abandoned on the stove?

I have concentrated on health, but I want to briefly refer to yesterday's debate and the 13 amendments on 'Iaith Pawb'. Today's document makes only one reference to achievements related to the Welsh language. This one reference is in the section on culture, and it relates to the £28 million of extra spending. My recollection is that that was a commitment that was made by the previous partnership Government. Is it not appalling, therefore, that, two years on, this Labour Government cannot highlight a single achievement that has come out of its two years in office?

If this were the annual report of an Assembly sponsored public body or a public limited company, it would not pass muster. It would be condemned as inaccurate. This report should bear the subtitle, 'The Good News Only'. To be a credible document, it has to cover the downside as well. I am truly amazed at the stretching of the truth on waiting lists. You would think, from reading the document, that we had the best example of waiting lists in Europe, that they are negative or that they have come down phenomenally. There is no mention of how high they climbed to begin with.

Your administration will be remembered for the abolition of the quangos, First Minister, but that is not so much a bonfire as a series of damp squibs. However, it will be remembered in the right way for one major achievement, and that is the decision not to go for top-up fees in Wales, and that was a decision that proves that the best ideas in Government in Wales consistently come

gwelliant 7 gan y Ceidwadwyr, oherwydd credwn fod problemau ariannol byrddau iechyd lleol ac ymddiriedolaethau a'r angen i adolygu fformiwla Townsend yn faterion pwysig. Hoffwn wybod pryd y cawn wybodaeth gadarn am yr adolygiad sydd wedi bod ar y gweill o fformiwla Townsend. Ni châf unrhyw ymateb cadarn gan y Gweinidog pan ofynnaf iddo yn sesiwn gwestiynau'r Cyfarfod Llawn. A fydd yn debyg i'r strategaeth awtistaeth, rhywbeth yr ymchwilir iddo am flynyddoedd lawer ond na chaiff byth ei weithredu?

Yr wyf wedi canolbwytio ar iechyd, ond yr wyf am gyfeirio'n gryno at ddadl ddoe a'r 13 o welliannau yn 'Iaith Pawb'. Dim ond un cyfeiriad at Iwyddiannau'n ymwneud â'r iaith Gymraeg sydd yn y ddogfen hon heddiw. Mae'r un cyfeiriad hwnnw yn yr adran ar ddiwylliant, ac mae'n ymwneud â'r £28 miliwn o wariant ychwanegol. Cofiaf i'r ymrwymiad hwnnw gael ei wneud gan y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth flaenorol. Onid yw'n warthus, felly, ddwy flynedd yn ddiweddarach, na all y Llywodraeth Lafur hon dynnu sylw at unrhyw beth a gyflawnwyd yn ystod ei dwy flynedd mewn grym?

Pe bai hwn yn adroddiad blynnyddol gan gorff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad neu gorff cyfyngedig cyhoeddus, ni fyddai'n gwneud y tro. Câi ei gondemnio fel gwaith anghywir. Dylai'r adroddiad hwn gael yr is-deitl, 'Y Newyddion Da yn Unig'. Er mwyn iddi fod yn ddogfen gredadwy, rhaid iddi drafod yr elfennau negyddol hefyd. Yr wyf yn wir yn rhyfeddu at y graddau yr ystumiwyd y gwirionedd am restrau aros. Byddech yn tybio, o ddarllen y ddogfen, fod gennym yr enghraifft orau o restrau aros yn Ewrop, eu bod yn rhai negyddol neu eu bod wedi gostwng yn sylweddol. Ni sonnir mor uchel yr oeddent i ddechrau.

Caiff eich gweinyddiaeth ei chofio am iddi ddileu'r cwangos, Weinidog. Ond nid coelcerth mo hynny, ond yn hytrach cyfres o fatsys gwylb. Fodd bynnag, caiff ei chofio yn y ffordd iawn am un llwyddiant mawr, sef y penderfyniad i beidio â chyflwyno ffioedd atodol yng Nghymru. Ac yr oedd hwnnw'n benderfyniad sy'n profi bod syniadau gorau'r Llywodraeth yng Nghymru yn gyson yn dod

from parties other than Labour.

**Christine Chapman:** This report certainly does justice to the many achievements of this Assembly Government, but, obviously, it cannot include them all. I welcome the evidence that the Assembly Government is committed to protecting the interests of the most vulnerable people in society. There are broad strategies, but there are also specific policies that are making a real difference to people's lives. I do not share the opposition's pessimism on this.

We have seen the establishment of a commissioner for older people come one step closer with the securing of a draft Westminster Bill to legislate for this. Only yesterday, we had visitors from the Rhondda Cynon Taf older people's forum in the Assembly, and they were very excited about the possibility of having a commissioner for older people.

We have seen prescription charges further reduced, and they remain on track to be abolished by the end of this Assembly. In my constituency, like Jeff Cuthbert's, my constituents are looking forward to new modernised healthcare in Cynon Valley with the new hospital. This is about raising people's aspirations. They have had it tough for many years, but, as a result of this Assembly Government's work, my constituents are looking forward to modernised services.

Another recent achievement in my constituency is the removal of contaminated land left behind by the former Phurnacite fuel plant in Abercwmboi. I am delighted that this land can now be used for regeneration purposes, for the regeneration of communities that is being replicated across Wales. We should not underestimate its importance. Only a few weeks ago, we were told that there has been an increase of 50 per cent in the number of rail passengers on the trains in Cynon Valley, as a result of investment by the Assembly Government.

Looking to the future, I believe that the

oddi wrth bleidiau eraill ar wahân i Lafur.

**Christine Chapman:** Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn sicr yn gwneud cyflawnder â llwyddiannau niferus Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Ond, wrth reswm, ni all gynnwys pob un ohonynt. Croesawaf y dystiolaeth fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ymrwymo i ddiogelu buddiannau'r bobl fwyaf diamdiffyn mewn cymdeithas. Mae yna strategaethau eang, ond mae yna bolisiau penodol hefyd sy'n gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol i fywydau pobl. Nid wyf fi'n besimistaidd, fel y gwrthbleidiau, ynglŷn â hyn.

Daeth y broses o sefydlu comisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn gam yn nes ar ôl sicrhau Mesur drafft yn San Steffan i ddeddfu ar hyn. Ddoe yn unig, daeth ym welwyr o fforwm pobl hŷn Rhondda Cynon Taf i'r Cynulliad, ac yr oeddent yn llawn cyffro yng hylch y posiblwydd o gael comisiynydd i bobl hŷn.

Gwelsom daliadau presgripsiwn yn cael eu gostwng ymhellach, ac maent ar y trywydd iawn i gael eu dileu'n llwyr erbyn diwedd y Cynulliad hwn. Yn fy etholaeth i, yn debyg i etholaeth Jeff Cuthbert, mae fy etholwyr yn edrych ymlaen at ofal iechyd newydd wedi'i foderneiddio yng Nghwm Cynon yn sgîl yr ysbyty newydd. Mae a wnelo hyn â chodi dyheadau pobl. Maent wedi'i chael yn anodd am flynyddoedd lawer, ond o ganlyniad i waith Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, mae fy etholwyr yn edrych ymlaen at wasanaethau wedi'u moderneiddio.

Llwyddiant diweddar arall yn fy etholaeth yw cael gwared ar dir wedi'i halogi a adawyd gan yr hen waith Phurnacite yn Abercwm-boi. Yr wyf yn eithriadol o falch y gall y tir hwn gael ei ddefnyddio yn awr at ddibenion adfywio, er mwyn adfywio cymunedau, rhywbeth sy'n cael ei efelychu ledled Cymru. Ni ddylem danbrisio ei bwysigrwydd. Dim ond ychydig wythnosau yn ôl dywedwyd wrthym fod cynnydd o 50 y cant yn nifer y teithwyr rheilffordd ar y trenau yng Nghwm Cynon, o ganlyniad i fuddsoddiad gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad.

I edrych i'r dyfodol, credaf fod y pwyslais a

emphasis placed on economic inactivity by the Welsh Assembly Government is the right one. We have the lowest level of unemployment in Wales for 30 years, but economic inactivity is a wider, long-term problem. Years of underinvestment under Conservative Governments, and the dumping of many workers onto the economic and social scrap heap, has left a bitter legacy of economic inactivity in our communities. This cycle of second-generation and third-generation unemployment, and the symptoms that go with it, is one that we must break, if we are to integrate people into economic productivity.

**Alun Cairns:** Do you not accept that if the policies of the last Conservative Government were so bad, there would be a uniform level of inactivity rates across the country, or certainly in similar regions? That being the case, after eight years of a Labour Government, Wales has the highest inactivity rate in the whole of the United Kingdom. Do you not think that that does not add up to the statements that you just made?

**Christine Chapman:** We qualified for Objective 1 funding under that Government. We only need to look around us. I remember clearly, as do many in the Chamber, that you only had to look around to see what it was like under those Conservative Governments. Talk to the people and you will realise that they have suffered for many years, and it is now that they are starting to see a change.

I am interested in the development of the Heads of the Valleys strategy and in removing the barriers to economic prosperity in some of our most deprived areas—the areas that Alun Cairns was trying to allude to—and replacing those barriers with the tools and vehicles for people to achieve economic prosperity. In my constituency, and those of neighbouring Members, the strategy is one of the foremost priorities for the Welsh political agenda for the coming years. Providing the physical, social and economic environment in which people can realise their full potential will require local authorities, communities, and key

roddir ar anweithgarwch economaidd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gywir. Mae gennym y lefel isaf o ddiweithdra yng Nghymru ers 30 mlynedd, ond mae anweithgarwch economaidd yn broblem ehangach, hirdymor. Mae blynyddoedd o ddiffyg buddsoddi gan Lywodraethau Ceidwadol, a gadael nifer o weithwyr ar y domen sbwriel economaidd a chymdeithasol, wedi gadael etifeddiaeth chwerw o anweithgarwch economaidd yn ein cymunedau. Mae'r cylch hwn o ddiweithdra ail a thrydedd cenhedlaeth, a'r symptomau sy'n gysylltiedig ag ef, yn un y mae'n rhaid inni ei dorri, os ydym i integreiddio pobl mewn gweithgarwch economaidd.

**Alun Cairns:** Oni dderbyniwch, os oedd polisiau'r Llywodraeth Geidwadol ddiwethaf cynddrwg, y byddai lefel unffurf o gyfraddau anweithgarwch ledled y wlad, neu yn sicr mewn rhanbarthau tebyg? Os felly, ar ôl wyth mlynedd o Lywodraeth Lafur, mae gan Gymru y gyfradd anweithgarwch uchaf yn y Deyrnas Unedig gyfan. Oni chredwch nad yw hynny'n cyfateb i'r gosodiadau a wnaethoch funud yn ôl?

**Christine Chapman:** Yr oeddem yn gymwys i gael arian Amcan 1 o dan y Llywodraeth honno. Dim ond edrych o'n cwmpas sydd angen inni. Cofiaf yn glir, fel y gall nifer ohonom yn y Siambr, mai dim ond edrych o'ch cwmpas oedd angen ichi weld sut oedd pethau o dan y Llywodraethau Ceidwadol hynny. Siaradwch â'r bobl, ac fe sylweddolwch eu bod wedi dioddef ers blynyddoedd lawer, ac mai yn nawr y maent yn dechrau gweld newid.

Mae gennyf ddiddordeb yn natblygiad strategaeth Blaenau'r Cymoedd a dileu'r rhwystrau i ffyniant economaidd mewn rhai o'n hardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig—yr ardaloedd yr oedd Alun Cairns yn ceisio cyfeirio atynt—a rhoi offer a dulliau i'r bobl sicrhau ffyniant economaidd yn lle'r rhwystrau hynny. Yn fy etholaeth i, ac etholaethau Aelodau cyfagos, y strategaeth hon yw un o'r prif flaenorriaethau ar gyfer agenda wleidyddol Cymru am y blynyddoedd i ddod. Bydd darparu'r amgylchedd ffisegol, cymdeithasol ac economaidd lle y gall pobl wireddu eu potensial llawn yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i

stakeholders to work in partnership rather than in competition. This is important for the Heads of the Valleys strategy. I feel that this, in some ways, will require a break from the past and strong political direction to harvest it. I believe that the Welsh Assembly Government is delivering on its promises, and I am grateful to see this presented concisely in the report.

**Mark Isherwood:** As Tony Blair's economic adviser, Derek Scott, has stated, Gordon Brown's economic inheritance in 1997 was better than that of any previous Chancellor in living memory. However, the Labour Government is now badly in the red, and the reason for this, according to the director general of the CBI, is that Labour has failed to reform the public services; he says, 'They have wasted our money'. Nowhere is this more the case than in Wales under its First Minister-for-front-line-service-cuts, Slasher Morgan. Outside Labour land, Welsh secondary headteachers have highlighted significant cuts in schools. After years of cuts and deficits, further education colleges are now imposing compulsory redundancies.

Welsh economic growth is falling and unemployment is now on the rise again. We heard yesterday about the 1,000 job losses in my home county of Flintshire in recent weeks. The hidden jobless figure now includes 65,000 people aged under 25. No-one is in employment in 156,000 Welsh working-age households, and 87,000 Welsh children are being raised in homes where no-one has a job. Meanwhile, the number of 16-year-old school leavers not in education, training or employment is rising again.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** I find this amazing. At the time of the last Conservative Government, when Michael Howard was a Minister, the

awdurdodau lleol, cymunedau, a rhanddeiliaid allweddol weithio mewn partneriaeth, yn hytrach na chystadlu. Mae hyn yn bwysig ar gyfer strategaeth Blaenau'r Cymoedd. Credaf y bydd hyn, mewn rhai ffyrdd, yn gofyn am gefnu ar y gorffennol a sicrhau cyfeiriad gwleidyddol cadarn er mwyn iddi ddwyn ffrwyth. Credaf fod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cyflawni ei haddewidion, ac yr wyf yn falch gweld hyn yn cael ei gyflwyno'n gryno yn yr adroddiad.

**Mark Isherwood:** Fel cynghorydd economaidd i Tony Blair, dywedodd Derek Scott fod etifeddiaeth economaidd Gordon Brown yn 1997 yn well nag etifeddiaeth unrhyw Ganghellor blaenorol o fewn cof. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Llywodraeth Lafur yn y coch yn ddifrifol yn awr, a'r rheswm dros hynny, yn ôl cyfarwyddwr cyffredinol Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain, yw'r ffaith fod Llafur wedi methu â diwygio'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol; meddai, 'Maent wedi gwastraffu ein harian'. Mae hyn ar ei fwyaf amlwg yng Nghymru, o dan ei Phrif Weinidog dros doriadau mewn gwasanaethau rheng flaen, Slasher Morgan? Y tu allan i dir Llafur, mae penaethiaid ysgolion uwchradd yng Nghymru wedi tynnu sylw at doriadau sylweddol mewn ysgolion. Ar ôl blynnyddoedd o doriadau a diffygion, mae colegau addysg bellach yn awr yn gweithredu rhaglen o ddiswyddiadau gorfodol.

Mae twf economaidd Cymru yn gostwng a diweithdra ar gynnydd unwaith eto. Clywsom ddoe am y 1,000 o swyddi a gollwyd yn fy sir enedigol, Sir y Fflint, yn ystod yr wythnosau diwethaf. Mae ffigur cudd y di-waith bellach yn cynnwys 65,000 o bobl o dan 25 oed. Nid oes neb yn cael ei gyflogi mewn 156,000 o gartrefi o oedran gweithio yng Nghymru, a chaiff 87,000 o blant yng Nghymru eu magu mewn cartrefi lle nad oes gan neb swydd. Yn y cyfamser, mae nifer y bobl ifanc 16 oed sydd wedi gadael yr ysgol ac nad ydynt mewn addysg, hyfforddiant neu gyflogaeth yn codi unwaith eto.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Credaf fod hyn yn rhyfeddol. Pan oedd y Llywodraeth Geidwadol ddiwethaf mewn grym a phan oedd Michael

figure for unemployment in Wales stood at 134,000, whereas it is now about 30,000. The Conservative Government's stewardship of the Welsh economy enabled us to qualify for Objective 1 status. How do you justify your remarks?

4.20 p.m.

**Mark Isherwood:** In 1997, you inherited in Wales the second-best inward investment record on the planet after the United States and the best job creation record in Europe. The figures relating to that are not mine, but those of independent economists. With regard to inward investment, during the 1980s and 1990s, Wales was one of the top regions in securing inward investment across Europe. Those are the independent facts.

However, Wales now has lower prosperity and poorer basic skills than any other nation or region in the United Kingdom. Its prosperity as a proportion of the UK average is actually forecast, independently, to fall even further, thereby widening the gap between 'losing Wales' reality and the Welsh Assembly Government's 'A Winning Wales' targets. Reductions in Welsh Assembly Government budgets for local authorities have led to cuts in services ranging from social services to home improvement grants, and local authorities such as Flintshire County Council are now having to implement large-scale redundancies. As house prices, waiting lists and homelessness have increased, Labour's housing cuts have created a housing crisis. The hard Labour reality in Wales is that new-build social housing has been slashed by three quarters, yet the number of unfit properties has risen to 98,000, and Labour's forecast social housing budget increase to 2008 will still leave the budget lower in real terms and in absolute terms than it was in 1997.

For every one Welsh patient waiting more than six months for his or her first hospital appointment in 1997, there are now 11 in 2005. The gravity of the situation was summed up for me by the constituent who

Howard yn Weinidog, y ffigur diweithdra yng Nghymru oedd 134,000. Deg mil ar hugain yw'r ffigur yn awr. Yr oedd stiwardiaeth y Llywodraeth Geidwadol dros yr economi yng Nghymru yn ein galluogi i gymhwysyo ar gyfer statws Amcan 1. Sut yr ydych yn cyflawnhau eich sylwadau?

**Mark Isherwood:** Yn 1997, bu ichi etifeddu yng Nghymru y record fewnfuddi orau ond un ar y ddaear hon, ar ôl yr Unol Daleithiau, a'r record orau yn Ewrop o ran creu swyddi. Nid fy ffigurau i yw'r rheini, ond ffigurau economyddion annibynnol. O ran mewnfuddsoddi, yn ystod y 1980au a'r 1990au yr oedd Cymru ymhllith y prif ranbarthau yn Ewrop i sicrhau mewnfuddsoddiad. Dyna'r ffeithiau annibynnol.

Fodd bynnag, erbyn hyn mae llai o ffyniant yng Nghymru a sgiliau sylfaenol gwaeth nag mewn unrhyw genedl neu ranbarth arall yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Yn wir, rhagwelir yn annibynnol y bydd ei ffyniant fel cyfran o gyfartaledd y DU yn gostwng ymhellach fyfth, gan ehangu'r bwlc rhwng realiti 'colli Cymru' a thargedau 'Cymru'n Ennill' gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Mae gostyngiadau yng nghyllidebau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol wedi arwain at doriadau mewn gwasanaethau sy'n amrywio o wasanaethau cymdeithasol i grantiau gwella cartrefi, a rhaid i awdurdodau lleol fel Cyngor Sir y Fflint weithredu rhaglen fawr o ddiswyddiadau yn awr. Wrth i brisiau tai, rhestrau aros a digartrefedd gynyddu, mae toriadau Llafur ym maes tai wedi creu argyfwng tai. Y gwir amdanu yw bod Llafur yng Nghymru wedi torri tri chwarter y tai cymdeithasol newydd sy'n cael eu codi. Ond mae nifer yr adeiladau anaddas wedi codi i 98,000, a bydd y cynnydd a ragwelir yng nghyllideb tai cymdeithasol Llafur yn 2008 yn parhau i adael y gyllideb yn is mewn termau real ac mewn termau absoliwt nag yr oedd yn 1997.

Am bob un claf yng Nghymru a oedd yn aros dros chwe mis am ei apwyntiad cyntaf yn yr ysbyty yn 1997, mae 11 erbyn hyn yn 2005. Crynhowyd difrifoldeb y sefyllfa gan yr etholwr a gysylltodd â mi ar ran ei phartner,

contacted me on behalf of her partner, who is a cancer patient, and said that she, 'Cannot be sure about the adequacy of the medical treatment in the hospital where he is being seen, but the administration, organisation and cleanliness are awful'. We are not denigrating, and do not denigrate, the hard-working staff of the NHS, many of whom seemingly produce miracles in difficult circumstances; we blame Labour.

I am told that cuts are threatened right across the voluntary sector, ranging from hospices to neighbourhood watch and victim support. Constituents bring to us serious allegations of wrongdoing in Labour government locally and nationally, and, as Dylan Jones Evans highlighted in the *Daily Post* last week, a more open Welsh society is not helped by people in authority who maintain their status in Wales through patronage and fear. Adult learning is threatened by a lack of Welsh Assembly Government contingency planning, cuts in numbers of care home beds, according to the local health boards and hospitals that I speak to, are leading to bedblocking and delayed transfers of care.

Citizens Advice reports that debt inquiries in Wales are increasing faster than anywhere else in the United Kingdom, and cynical Labour promises that council tax rebanding would be revenue neutral have been broken, thereby hitting those on fixed incomes the hardest. What a disgraceful legacy from a First Minister who always talks and behaves as though he knows more than anyone else on any subject, and who is, therefore, poor at drawing on the knowledge and experience of those who do know more. Clearly, he and his Ministers cannot countenance the possibility that they might be wrong, for that would reveal the enormity of the injustice. Two months ago in England, more people voted Conservative than Labour in their attempt to get rid of a discredited Labour regime. The future wellbeing of Wales will only be secured when the people of Wales finally show the door to this shambolic Labour shower.

sy'n dioddef gan ganser. Dywedodd na all 'fod yn siŵr am ddigonolrwydd y driniaeth feddygol yn yr ysbtyt lle mae'n cael ei drin, ond mae'r weinyddiaeth, y drefniadaeth a'r glanweithdra yn ofnadwy'. Nid ydym yn dirmygu, ac ni wnawn ddirmygw, staff gweithgar y GIG. Mae nifer ohonynt fel pe baent yn cyflawni gwyrthiau mewn amgylchiadau anodd; yr ydym yn beio'r blaid Lafur.

Dywedir wrthyf fod bygwth toriadau ar draws y sector gwirfoddol, yn amrywio o hosbisau i warchod y gymdogaeth a chymorth i ddioddefwyr. Mae etholwyr yn dwneud wrthym am honiadau difrifol o gamweddau yn y llywodraeth Lafur, yn lleol ac yn genedlaethol, ac fel yr oedd Dylan Jones Evans yn tynnu sylw yn y *Daily Post* yr wythnos diwethaf, ni chaiff cymdeithas fwy agored yng Nghymru ei helpu gan bobl ag awdurdod sy'n cynnal eu statws yng Nghymru drwy nawddogaeth ac ofn. Mae dysgu i oedolion yn cael ei fygwth gan ddiffyg gwaith cynllunio wrth gefn gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Ac mae toriadau yn nifer y gwelyau gofal cartref, yn ôl y byrddau iechyd lleol a'r ysbtyai yr wyf yn siarad â hwy, yn arwain at flocio gwelyau ac achosion o oedi cyn trosglwyddo gofal.

Dywed canolfannau Cyngor Ar Bopeth fod ymholaiddau am ddyledion yng Nghymru yn cynyddu'n gyflymach nag unman arall yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Ac mae addewidion sinigai gan y blaidd Lafur y byddai ailfandio'r dreth gyngor yn niwtral o ran refeniw wedi'u chwalu, gan effeithio fwyaf ar y rheini sydd ag incwm sefydlog. Dyna i chi etifeddiaeth warthus gan Brif Weinidog sydd bob amser yn siarad ac yn ymddwyn fel pe bai'n gwybod mwy na phawb arall am y pwnc, ac sydd, felly, yn methu manteisio ar wybodaeth a phrofiad y rheini sydd yn gwybod mwy. Yn amlwg, ni all ef na'i Weinidogion ganiatau'r posibilrwydd y gallent fod yn anghywir, oherwydd byddai hynny'n datgelu maint yr anghyfiawnder. Ddu fis yn ôl yn Lloegr, pleidleisiodd mwy o bobl dros y blaidd Geidwadol na'r blaidd Lafur yn eu hymgais i gael gwared ar gyfundrefn Lafur warthus. Dim ond pan gaiff pobl Cymru wared ar y giwed Lafur anhreftus hon y caiff lles Cymru ei ddiogelu ar gyfer y dyfodol.

**Peter Black:** I was at the meeting of the Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister when the spontaneous applause erupted at the end. Alas, I do not expect spontaneous applause for this document. Important though it is, the document does not have the substance and level of achievement to merit such an outpouring of support, either from the public or anybody else.

I will concentrate on two or three issues highlighted by the report. First, on the creation of a £100 million crime-fighting fund, I am grateful to the Assembly Government for finally putting the funding in place for this. We had to table many questions to get to that stage, but clearly, the money was there, and you have to give credit to the Government for putting it in place. However, if it is a crime-fighting fund, how does it to form a coherent whole? What are its objectives, what are its targets, how are they measured, and how do you determine whether they have been achieved or not?

It seems to me, as I have said previously, that this crime-fighting fund is essentially a hotchpotch of individual initiatives, most of which were already in place, and which have been put together to create something that is outwardly attractive to the public: the Assembly doing something about crime in people's communities. Yes, things are being done about individual aspects of crime, but we do not have the coherence that this crime-fighting fund promises, and maybe, in future First Minister's reports, we could start to address that issue and have some indication as to how the crime-fighting fund is to be used to deliver on the expectations that the public has vested in it as, presumably, 36 or 37 per cent of it voted for the Labour manifesto in 2003.

The Labour Assembly Government made a very clear pledge regarding a £560 million investment in school buildings, and we read in this report that it has exceeded this investment with a £629 million programme

**Peter Black:** Yr oeddwn yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Craffu ar Waith y Prif Weinidog pan glywyd y gymeradwyaeth ddigymhell ar y diwedd. Ysywaeth, nid wyf yn disgwyl cymeradwyaeth ddigymhell i'r ddogfen hon. Er ei bod yn bwysig, nid oes gan y ddogfen y sylwedd na'r lefel lwyddiant i'w gwneud yn deilwng o gefnogaeth mor frwd, gan y cyhoedd na chan neb arall.

Canolbwytiaf ar ddau neu dri mater y mae'r adroddiad yn tynnu sylw atynt. Yn gyntaf, o ran creu'r gronfa ymladd troseddau gwerth £100 miliwn, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Llywodraeth y Cynulliad am drefnu'r arian ar gyfer y gronfa hon o'r diwedd. Bu'n rhaid inni gyflwyno nifer o gwestiynau i gyrraedd y cam hwnnw, ond yn amlwg, yr oedd yr arian yno, a rhaid ichi roi clod i'r Llywodraeth am ei roi ar waith. Fodd bynnag, os cronfa ymladd troseddau ydyw, sut y mae'n creu cyfanwaith cydlynol? Beth yw ei hamcanion, beth yw ei thargedau, sut y caint eu mesur, a sut ydych yn cadarnhau a ydynt wedi eu cyflawni ai peidio?

Ymddengys i mi, fel y dywedais eisoes, fod y gronfa ymladd troseddau hon yn y bôn yn gymysgedd ddi-drefn o fentrau unigol. Mae'r rhan fwyaf ohonynt yn weithredol ac wedi eu gosod ynghyd i greu rhywbeth sy'n ymddangos, ar yr wyneb, yn ddeniadol i'r cyhoedd: sef y Cynulliad yn gwneud rhywbeth ynglŷn â throseddu yng Nghymunedau pobl. Oes, mae pethau'n cael eu gwneud ynglŷn ag agweddau unigol ar droseddu, ond nid oes gennym y cydlyniant a addewir gan y gronfa hon i ymladd troseddau. Efallai, mewn adroddiadau gan y Prif Weinidog yn y dyfodol, y gallem ddechrau mynd i'r afael â'r mater hwnnw a chael rhyw arwydd o'r ffordd y dylid defnyddio'r gronfa ymladd troseddau i fodloni disgwyliadau'r cyhoedd yniddi, gan fod 36 neu 37 y cant o'r cyhoedd, yn ôl pob tebyg, wedi pleidleisio dros fanifesto Llafur yn 2003.

Gwnaeth Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad addewid clir iawn ynghylch buddsoddiad o £560 miliwn mewn adeiladau ysgolion, a darllenwn yn yr adroddiad hwn iddi fynd y tu hwnt i'r buddsoddiad hwnnw gyda

to improve school buildings. What it does not say is that to achieve that, and to go past that £560 million target, it had to bring in private finance initiatives. I am not opposed to private finance initiatives if they are merited and can be shown to be value for money, but this Government appears to be opposed to them, because whenever we have stood up and asked Ministers whether they will have any more PFI projects to build new, or repair, schools around Wales, they have said 'No', presumably because they are ideologically opposed to it. Yet, quite conveniently, the Government is prepared to rely on the commitment that is already there for various schemes to try to meet a target that it has failed to meet. Everybody understands this target to mean the investment of £560 million of public money in schools, and the investment is somewhat short of that.

There is no guarantee that those PFI schemes will be completed, or even committed, by 2007-08 or that that £629 million will be spent. Some schemes are already slipping and some may fall by the wayside and, when we come to tot up, at the end of this Assembly Government, how much money was spent in schools, we may well find that it has failed to meet the target after all, certainly within the timeframe that it has set for it.

We all know, having talked to our constituents, having been out to schools and having talked to local education authorities, that, even with this commitment to spend money on schools, welcome as it is, it is still not enough. The backlog of maintenance and repair in schools around Wales is significantly greater than this and if the Assembly Government is going to achieve anything like the target that it has to make all schools fit for purpose by 2010, a significantly greater sum than this will have to be committed in the Assembly term after 2007. I look forward to hearing commitments on that.

Mike German has already touched on

rhaglen gwerth £629 miliwn i wella adeiladau ysgolion. Yr hyn na ddywed yw iddi orfod troi at fentrau cyllid preifat i gyflawni hynny, a mynd y tu hwnt i'r targed hwnnw o £560 miliwn. Nid wyf yn erbyn mentrau cyllid preifat os gellir eu cyfiawnhau ac os gellir dangos eu bod yn rhoi gwerth yr arian. Ond ymddengys fod y Llywodraeth hon yn eu gwrthwynebu, oherwydd pryd bynnag yr ydym wedi sefyll ar ein traed i ofyn i Weinidogion a fyddant yn trefnu rhagor o brosiectau menter cyllid preifat i adeiladu ysgolion newydd neu i atgyweirio ysgolion o gwmpas Cymru, yr ateb yw 'Na', gan eu bod, mae'n debyg, yn gwrthwynebu'r ideoleg. Eto, yn gyfleus iawn, mae'r Llywodraeth yn barod i ddibynnu ar yr ymrwymiad sydd eisoes wedi'i wneud ar gyfer amrywiol gynlluniau i geisio cyrraedd targed y mae wedi methu ei gyrraedd. Mae pawb yn cymryd bod y targed hwn yn golygu buddsoddiad o £560 miliwn o arian cyhoeddus mewn ysgolion, ac nid yw'r buddsoddiad wedi cyrraedd y swm hwnnw.

Nid oes sicrwydd y caiff y cynlluniau PFI hynny eu cwblhau, nac y bydd ymrwymiad i'w cwblhau hyd yn oed, erbyn 2007-08, nac y caiff y £629 miliwn hwnnw ei wario. Mae rhai cynlluniau eisoes yn llithro a gall rhai fethu'n gyfan gwbl. A phan ddaw'r amser, ar ddiwedd cyfnod y Llywodraeth hon yn y Cynulliad, i gyfrif faint o arian a wariwyd mewn ysgolion, mae'n ddigon possb y gwelwn iddi fethu â chyrraedd y targed wedi'r cyfan, yn sicr o fewn yr amserlen a bennwyd ganddi ar gyfer hynny.

Gwyddom i gyd, drwy siarad â'n hetholwyr, drwy ymweld ag ysgolion a thrwy siarad ag awdurdodau addysg lleol, hyd yn oed gyda'r ymrwymiad hwn i wario arian ar ysgolion, er cymaint y mae i'w groesawu, nad yw'n ddigon o hyd. Mae'r gwaith cynnal a chadw ac atgyweirio sydd wedi crynhoi mewn ysgolion ledled Cymru gryn dipyn yn fwy na hyn, ac os yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i gyflawni unrhyw beth tebyg i'r ei bod yn rhaid iddi wneud pob ysgol yn addas at y pwrpas erbyn 2010, bydd yn rhaid ymrwymo swm llawer mwy na hwn yn nhymor y Cynulliad ar ôl 2007. Edrychaf ymlaen at glywed yr ymrwymiadau ar hynny.

Mae Mike German eisoes wedi sôn am

investment in small and rural schools, so I will gloss over that, but it is important to stress that the Labour manifesto said that it would invest additional money to tackle the problems faced by small and rural schools, and, yet, there has been no additional money and the small and rural schools grant has effectively been subsumed elsewhere.

This First Minister's report is strong on promise, but we still have to see the delivery.

**Glyn Davies:** The debate on an annual report is an opportunity to make an overall judgment on performance, and that applies to the private sector and public sector alike. In the private sector, it is fairly easy to make that overall judgment: you can make it, essentially, from the shareholder price. It is a bit more difficult in terms of a Government because of the different perceptions that we have. Mrs Gwenda Thomas talks about the bursting out of spontaneous applause when the First Minister appears. That sort of practice is an honourable tradition in one-party states; it is a bit unusual in Wales. While that happens in some areas, you get a different response in others, for example, in mid Wales. The response that I hear in mid Wales is one of extreme disappointment, not only with the First Minister but with the Government and the way that it performs.

4.30 p.m.

Yesterday, I was in the Assembly Neuadd, during a part of First Minister's questions, and the First Minister referred to one of my colleagues as having 'two brain cells'. He also made an intemperate attack on another Member. There were people outside in the Assembly Neuadd who were pretty disgusted with what they were hearing, and who thought that this was an entirely inappropriate way for the leader of a body such as this to behave. That is part of people's judgment of this body. It is just a question of knowing how to behave, and the Government has quite a bit to learn about that.

fuddsoddi mewn ysgolion bach ac ysgolion gwledig, felly, ni fanylaf ar hynny. Ond mae'n bwysig pwysleisio bod maniffesto Llafur wedi dweud y byddai'n buddsoddi arian ychwanegol i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau sy'n wynebu ysgolion bach ac ysgolion gwledig. Ac eto, ni welwyd unrhyw arian ychwanegol, ac mae'r grant ysgolion bach ac ysgolion gwledig fwy neu lai wedi ei gynnwys rywle arall.

Mae addewidion mawr yn adroddiad y Prif Weinidog, ond nid ydym eto wedi gweld eu cyflawni.

**Glyn Davies:** Mae'r ddadl ar adroddiad blynyddol yn gyfle i ffurfio barn gyffredinol am berfformiad, ac mae hynny'n berthnasol i'r sector preifat a'r sector cyhoeddus fel ei gilydd. Yn y sector preifat, mae'n eithaf hawdd ffurfio'r farn gyffredinol honno: gallwch ei ffurfio, fwy neu lai, ar sail pris cyfranddeiliaid. Mae ychydig yn anos gyda Llywodraeth oherwydd y gwahanol gysyniadau sydd gennym. Mae Mrs Gwenda Thomas yn sôn am gymeradwyaeth wresog ddigymhell pan fydd y Prif Weinidog yn ymddangos. Mae'r arfer hwnnw'n draddodiad clodwiw mewn gwladwriaethau un blaid; mae braidd yn anarferol yng Nghymru. Tra bydd hynny'n digwydd mewn rhai ardaloedd, cewch ymateb gwahanol mewn ardaloedd eraill, er enghraifft, yn y Canolbarth. Yr ymateb a glywaf yn y Canolbarth yw siom fawr, nid yn unig gyda'r Prif Weinidog ond gyda'r Llywodraeth a'r ffordd y mae'n perfformio.

Ddoe, yr oeddwn yn Neuadd y Cynulliad yn ystod rhan gyntaf y cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog, a chyfeiriodd y Prif Weinidog at un o'm cyd-Aelodau fel rhywun heb fawr o ymennydd. Ymosododd yn giaidd ar Aelod arall hefyd. Yr oedd pobl y tu allan i Neuadd y Cynulliad yn ddigon dig am yr hyn yr oeddent yn ei glywed, ac yn credu bod hyn yn ffordd gwbl amhriodol i arweinydd corff o'r math hwn ymddwyn. Mae hynny'n rhan o farn pobl am y corff hwn. Mater o wybod sut i ymddwyn ydyw, ac mae gan y Llywodraeth gryn dipyn i'w ddysgu am hynny.

The health service is a big issue in mid Wales. I must tell Members on the opposite side of the Chamber that people there have a poor opinion of the Assembly because of what they see as its performance in terms of the health service. The situation is stark in mid Wales because most people in my area receive treatment over the border in England, and they make direct comparisons with those who are on waiting lists in England. There are huge disparities there. I hope that you understand that in mid Wales, because of this disparity of treatment under the health service, the Government and the Assembly are held in low esteem. It is difficult to judge the Government in a normal way because of the confusion that exists in terms of differentiating between the Government and the Assembly. Normally, as an opposition Member, I should not be too concerned about the public having a disparaging view of the Government. However, this reflects on the whole Assembly. I hope that the White Paper, if approved, will bring more clarity in that regard and that the Government will reap the deserved benefits of its poor performance.

I wish to touch upon two other issues. The first is the bonfire of the quangos and the First Minister's announcement that he was going to incorporate all the quangos within the Government. The principle of his announcement is entirely reasonable. When you establish an assembly with 60 members, as we did here, it is right and proper that it should consider public bodies, and whether we want them and what they are doing. It may well be that everyone could agree that we need to dismantle some of them, and that is right. However, the way in which he delivered the judgment was utterly appalling. I think that it is the worst political decision ever made. The Government and the First Minister will stand condemned forever because of the way in which that decision was handled. This will reflect negatively on the Assembly eventually, because people will ask, 'If the First Minister can make the most important decision without any reference to anyone, seemingly following discussion with no more than one or two people, what on earth is the point of having

Mae'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn fater pwysig yn y Canolbarth. Rhaid imi ddweud wrth Aelodau ar ochr arall y Siambra nad oes gan y bobl yno fawr o feddwl o'r Cynulliad oherwydd yr hyn a welant fel ei berfformiad o ran y gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae'r sefyllfa'n llwm yn y Canolbarth, oherwydd caiff y rhan fwyaf o'r bobl yn fy ardal i driniaeth dros y ffin yn Lloegr, ac maent yn tynnun cymhariaeth uniongyrchol â'r rheini sydd ar restrau aros yn Lloegr. Mae gwahaniaethau mawr yno. Gobeithio eich bod yn deall yn y Canolbarth, oherwydd y gwahaniaeth hwn mewn triniaeth o dan y gwasanaeth iechyd, nad oes fawr o feddwl o'r Llywodraeth na'r Cynulliad. Mae'n anodd barnu'r Llywodraeth yn y ffordd arferol oherwydd y dryswch wrth wahaniaethu rhwng y Llywodraeth a'r Cynulliad. Yn arferol, fel Aelod o'r gwrthbleidiau ni ddylwn bryderu'n ormodol am yffaith nad oes gan y cyhoedd lawer o feddwl o'r Llywodraeth. Fodd bynnag, mae hyn yn adlewyrchiad ar y Cynulliad cyfan. Gobeithio y bydd y Papur Gwyn, os caiff ei gymeradwyo, yn sicrhau mwy o eglurder yn hynny o beth, ac y bydd y Llywodraeth yn cael ei haeddiant yn sgil ei pherfformiad gwael.

Hoffwn sôn am ddau fater arall. Y cyntaf yw coelcerth y cwangos a chyhoeddiad y Prif Weinidog ei fod am ymgorffori'r holl gwangos yn y Llywodraeth. Mae egwyddor ei gyhoeddiad yn gwbl resymol. Pan fyddwch yn sefydlu cynulliad gyda 60 o aelodau, fel y gwnaethom ni yma, mae'n gywir ac yn briodol y dylem ystyried cyrff cyhoeddus, ac a oes eu hangen arnom a beth y maent yn ei wneud. Efallai'n wir y gallai pawb gytuno bod angen inni ddatgymalu rhai ohonynt, ac mae hynny'n briodol. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd y modd y cyflwynodd y penderfyniad yn gwbl warthus. Credaf mai dyma'r penderfyniad gwleidyddol gwaethaf a wnaed erioed. Caiff y Llywodraeth a'r Prif Weinidog eu condemnio am byth oherwydd y ffordd y deliwyd â'r penderfyniad hwnnw. Caiff hyn effaith negyddol ar y Cynulliad yn y pen draw, oherwydd bydd pobl yn gofyn, 'Os gall y Prif Weinidog wneud y penderfyniad pwysicaf heb ymgynghori â neb, ar ôl trafod gydag un neu ddau o bobl, mae'n ymddangos, beth yn y byd yw pwrrpas cael sefydliad tebyg i hwn?'. Dyna'r neges.

any sort of institution such as this?'. That is the message. The shock that I felt as a result of the way in which this was announced will also be felt by many other people.

This has also been reflected in the announcement on due diligence being needed in terms of the WDA. I did not know until Nick mentioned it earlier that the chairman of the WDA did not know what was going on. It is utterly scandalous for a Government to behave in this way. It has no idea how to behave; that is the trouble with this Government and our First Minister. He does not realise the responsibility that he has in terms of representing Wales in the way in which he behaves. He does not know how to do it.

I do not have time to deal with the second issue, which is the White Paper. However, this is another example of the First Minister not being open with us about what he wants. He has come forward with a scheme that is designed to benefit the interests of the Labour Party and not Wales. That is another serious error on which he will stand condemned by the people of Wales in the future.

**The First Minister:** I have been astonished by the amount of carping and hair-splitting by the opposition parties on the issue of free breakfasts for children. Do they realise what they are saying? They are saying that we should be budgeting for free breakfasts for primary school children on the basis that it is compulsory and that 100 per cent of children will be having free breakfasts. The Conservative and Liberal Democrat parties sometimes claim to be the parties of individual freedom. However, they now believe in making free breakfasts compulsory. We have said all along, without deviation, that free breakfasts will be available and that we will provide and budget for them, but that they will not be compulsory for the schools or for the children. If parents or the school cannot provide breakfast, or do not wish to provide it, then that is how it will be. We will encourage and promote, but it is not compulsory and never has been.

**Jenny Randerson:** First Minister, you are

Bydd nifer o bobl eraill hefyd yn teimlo'r un sioc ag a gefais i oherwydd y ffordd y cyhoeddwyd hyn.

Mae hyn hefyd wedi ei adlewyrchu yn y cyhoeddiad ar yr angen am ddiwydrwydd dyladwy ar gyfer WDA. Ni wyddwn tan i Nick sôn yn gynharach nad oedd cadeirydd WDA yn gwybod beth oedd yn digwydd. Mae'n sgandal llwyr fod Llywodraeth yn ymddwyn fel hyn. Nid oes ganddi'r un syniad sut i ymddwyn; dyna'r drafferth gyda'r Llywodraeth hon a'n Prif Weinidog. Nid yw'n sylweddoli'r cyfrifoldeb sydd ganddo wrth gynrychioli Cymru yn y ffordd y mae'n ymddwyn. Nid yw'n gwybod sut i wneud hynny.

Nid oes amser gennyf i ymdrin â'r ail fater, sef y Papur Gwyn. Fodd bynnag, mae hyn yn enghrafft arall o fethiant y Prif Weinidog i fod yn agored gyda ni am yr hyn y mae arno ei eisiau. Mae wedi cyflwyno cynllun gyda'r nod o fod o fudd i'r Blaid Lafur, nid i Gymru. Mae hynny'n gamgymeriad dybryd arall, a chaiff ei gondemnio amdano gan bobl Cymru yn y dyfodol.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyl yn rhyfeddu at y rhefro a'r holtti blew gan y gwrthbleidiau ar frecwast am ddim i blant. A ydynt yn sylweddoli'r hyn y maent yn ei ddweud? Dywedant y dylem fod yn cyllidebu ar gyfer brecwast am ddim i blant ysgol gynradd ar y sail ei fod yn orfodol ac y bydd 100 y cant o blant yn cael brecwast am ddim. Weithiau mae'r Ceidwadwyr a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn honni mai nhw yw partïon rhyddid yr unigolyn. Fodd bynnag, credant erbyn hyn mewn gwneud brecwast am ddim yn orfodol. Yr ydym wedi dweud o'r cychwyn, yn ddiwyro, y bydd brecwast am ddim ar gael ac y byddwn yn darparu ar gyfer ac yn cyllido ar gyfer hynny, ond na fydd yn orfodol i ysgolion nac i blant. Os na all rhieni na'r ysgol ddarparu brecwast, neu os nad ydynt am ei ddarparu, yna dyna fydd. Byddwn yn ei annog a'i hyrwyddo, ond nid yw'n orfodol, ac ni fu'n orfodol erioed.

**Jenny Randerson:** Brif Weinidog, yr ydych

confused; we are not saying that we want all children to have a free breakfast—that is certainly not the Welsh Liberal Democrat policy. We are telling you what your manifesto said. Amazing and astonishing as it might sound, that is what it said.

**The First Minister:** You were the one talking about stretching the truth. You appear to be an expert on stretching the truth, Jenny. No-one, other than opposition parties, wished to undermine an exceedingly popular policy to provide free breakfasts for children, which is going very well in those schools that have introduced it. However, that has not been done on the basis of making it compulsory either for the school or for the child. It is so obvious and so based in common sense that I cannot understand your response, other than the fact that you want to make the policy unpopular.

**Nick Bourne:** Will you give way?

**The First Minister:** Later, if I have time.

Nick, you made the point earlier that I had not referred to the waiting list. In fact, I said that waiting lists had reduced, but that we had to go much further to reach the milestones in 2007 of the 16-month combined list. I also said that we would have to go even further to reach the combined six-month list, including, for the first time, diagnostic and therapy waits. So, I was not being complacent about waiting lists. We must get away from this personal abuse. I do not know how many times you threw out the word ‘misleading’; you must have said it around half a dozen times. You must bear in mind how much damage you do, along the lines of what Glyn Davies said earlier, when you throw out words like ‘misleading’ and when Jenny Randerson throws out words like ‘stretching the truth’.

**Nick Bourne:** If the First Minister consults the Record, he will see that I said that there was scant reference to waiting lists in the annual report. I acknowledge that he mentioned it in his oral address. That is true.

wedi drysu; nid ydym yn dweud ein bod am i bob plentyn gael brecwast am ddim—yn sier nid dyna yw polisi Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru. Yr ydym yn dweud wrthych beth oedd yn eich maniffesto. Er mor anhygoel a rhyfeddol yw hynny, dyna'r hyn a oedd ynddo.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Chi oedd yn sôn am ymestyn y gwirionedd. Ymddengys eich bod chi'n arbenigwraig ar ystumio'r gwirionedd, Jenny. Nid oedd neb, ar wahân i'r gwrthbleidiau, am dansilio polisi hynod boblogaidd i ddarparu brecwast am ddim i blant, sy'n gweithio'n dda iawn yn yr ysgolion sydd wedi ei gyflwyno. Fodd bynnag, ni wnaed hynny ar sail ei wneud yn orfodol i'r ysgol nac i'r plentyn. Mae mor amlwg, ac mae wedi ei seilio gymaint ar synnwyr cyffredin fel na allaf ddeall eich ymateb, ar wahân i'rffaith eich bod am wneud y polisi'n amhoblogaidd.

**Nick Bourne:** A ildiwrch?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn ddiweddarach, os bydd gennyl amser.

Nick, yr oeddech yn gwneud y pwynt yn gynharach nad oeddwn wedi cyfeirio at y rhestr aros. Yn wir, dywedais fod rhestrau aros wedi lleihau, ond bod angen inni wneud llawer mwy i gyrraedd y cerrig milltir yn 2007 i sicrhau'r rhestr gyfunol o 16 mis. Dywedais hefyd y bydd yn rhaid inni wneud mwy fyth i gyrraedd y rhestr gyfun o chwemis, gan gynnwys, am y tro cyntaf, restrau aros diagnostig a therapi. Felly, nid oeddwn yn bod yn hunanfodlon ynghylch rhestrau aros. Rhaid inni roi'r gorau i'r ymosodiadau personol hyn. Ni wn sawl gwaith y bu ichi ddefnyddio'r gair 'camarweiniol'; mae'n siŵr ichi ei ddweud o leiaf hanner dwsin o weithiau. Rhaid ichi gofio faint o niwed a wnewch, fel y dywedodd Glyn Davies yn gynharach, wrth ddefnyddio geiriau fel 'camarweiniol', a phan fydd Jenny Randerson yn defnyddio geiriau fel 'ymestyn y gwirionedd'.

**Nick Bourne:** Os edrycha'r Prif Weinidog ar y Cofnod, fe wêl imi ddweud bod cyfeiriad byr at restrau aros yn yr adroddiad blynyddol. Yr wyf yn cydnabod iddo sôn am hyn yn ei anerchiad agoriadol. Mae hynny'n

wir.

Coming back to the point on free school breakfasts, I have the document in front of me; it was circulated in June this year and it states that

‘We promise to provide for all primary schoolchildren to have free breakfast.’

That promise was not made by any other party; it was made by your party. That is a misleading promise because, by your own admission, that is not what you intended. That is misleading.

**The First Minister:** If all people and all schools want free breakfast, they will get it, but it has never been compulsory. Only you have tried to imply that it is compulsory despite being the party of individual freedom. You should consider whether it was fair to say that it was misleading when it is in fact common sense.

On the ASPB mergers, raised by you and Mike German, none of you will accept—not yesterday nor today—that the issue in relation to the due diligence review announced by Andrew Davies arose from a report that was produced autonomously by, and within, the WDA by its new chief executive, Gareth Hall. It was the fallout from that that caused Andrew Davies to order the due diligence review. You simply cannot accept that; you think that there must be something more sinister behind it, but that is the origin of that report. You must accept that.

There were many constructive contributions from Christine Chapman in reference to the enormous progress in Abercwmboi and the contribution that we are making on incapacity benefit. The points made by Jeff Cuthbert and David Melding about hospitals were also important. We are right to avoid the private finance initiative behemoth, which England now fears it has overcommitted itself to. The provision will not last in a useful, fit-for-purpose form for 50 or 60 years, even though the financial

I ddod yn ôl at frecwast am ddim, mae'r ddogfen yma ger fy mron; fe'i dosbarthwyd ym mis Mehefin eleni a dywed

Yr ydym yn addo sicrhau darpariaeth i bob plentyn ysgol gynradd allu cael brecwast am ddim.

Ni wnaed yr addewid hwnnw gan unrhyw blaidd arall; fe'i gwnaed gan eich plaid chi. Mae hynny'n addewid camarweiniol oherwydd, yn ôl eich cyfaddefiad eich hun, nid dyna oedd eich bwriad. Mae hynny'n gamarweiniol.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Os yw pawb a phob ysgol am gael brecwast am ddim, byddant yn ei gael, ond ni fu erioed yn orfodol. Dim ond chi sydd wedi ceisio awgrymu ei fod yn orfodol er mai chi yw plaid rhyddid yr unigolyn. Dylech ystyried a oedd yn deg dweud ei fod yn gamarweiniol. Synnwyr cyffredin ydyw mewn gwirionedd.

O ran uno'r CCNCau, mater a godwyd gennych chi a Mike German, ni fydd yr un ohonoch yn derbyn—nid ddoe na heddiw—fod y mater am yr adolygiad diwydrwydd dyladwy a godwyd gan Andrew Davies yn ddeilio o adroddiad a gynhyrchwyd yn annibynnol gan WDA ac o fewn WDA gan ei brif weithredwr newydd, Gareth Hall. Canlyniadau hynny a achosodd i Andrew Davies orchymyn gwneud adolygiad diwydrwydd dyladwy. Yr ydych yn methu derbyn hynny; yr ydych yn credu bod rhywbeth sinistr y tu ôl iddo, ond dyna wraidd yr adroddiad hwnnw. Rhaid ichi dderbyn hynny.

Cafwyd sawl cyfraniad adeiladol gan Christine Chapman wrth gyfeirio at y cynnydd mawr yn Abecwm-boi a'r cyfraniad a wnaeon ar y trafodaethau ar fudd-dal analluogrwydd. Yr oedd y pwyntiau a wnaed gan Jeff Cuthbert a David Melding ynglŷn ag ysbystai hefyd yn bwysig. Mae'n briodol inni osgoi behemoth y fenter cyllid preifat: y mae Lloegr erbyn hynny yn ofni ei bod wedi gorymrwymo iddi. Ni fydd y ddarpariaeth yn parhau ar ffurf ddefnyddiol, addas at y pwrrpas am 50 neu 60 mlynedd, er y bydd y

contracts will. We are pleased that the design that we have in mind for a major new hospital in Caerphilly is for a flexible hospital. It is the first, proper, twenty-first century design for a hospital.

We also believe that we have an appropriate programme of treatment centres, including the new treatment centres at Llandough and at St Woolos for dealing with the most persistent waiting list problems in Wales, namely orthopaedic waiting times. So, great progress is being made. The opposition amendments are entirely of a hair-splitting, carping and negative nature and I recommend that they are all rejected.

contractau ariannol yn parhau. Yr ydym yn falch bod y cynllun sydd gennym dan sylw ar gyfer ysbty newydd mawr yng Nghaerffili yn gynllun ar gyfer ysbty hyblyg. Dyma'r cynllun priodol cyntaf o'i fath yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain ar gyfer ysbty.

Yr ydym hefyd yn credu bod gennym raglen briodol o ganolfannau triniaeth yn Llandochar ac yng Ngwynllyw i ymdrin â'r problemau rhestrau aros mwyaf dybryd yng Nghymru, sef amseroedd aros orthopedig. Felly, gwneir cynnydd rhagorol. Mae gwelliannau'r gwrrbleidiau yn gyfan gwbl seiliedig ar holtti blew, rhefru a natur negyddol ac argymhellaf wrthod pob un ohonynt.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 13, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 36.*

*Amendment 1: For 13, Abstain 0, Against 36.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
German, Michael  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

4.40 p.m.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 13, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 36.  
Amendment 1: For 13, Abstain 0, Against 36.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
German, Michael  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 2: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin

German, Michael	Essex, Sue
Graham, William	Gibbons, Brian
Isherwood, Mark	Gregory, Janice
Jones, Alun Ffred	Griffiths, John
Jones, Ieuan Wyn	Gwyther, Christine
Jones, Laura Anne	Hart, Edwina
Lloyd, David	Hutt, Jane
Melding, David	Idris Jones, Denise
Randerson, Jenny	James, Irene
Ryder, Janet	Jones, Ann
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn	Jones, Carwyn
Williams, Brynle	Law, Peter
Williams, Kirsty	Lewis, Huw
	Lloyd, Val
	Mewies, Sandy
	Morgan, Rhodri
	Neagle, Lynne
	Pugh, Alun
	Sargeant, Carl
	Sinclair, Karen
	Thomas, Catherine
	Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*

*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 7, Ymatal 13, Yn erbyn 28.*

*Amendment 3: For 7, Abstain 13, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
German, Michael  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Glyn

Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 5, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 38.  
Amendment 4: For 5, Abstain 5, Against 38.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
German, Michael  
Randerson, Jenny

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn

Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 11, Ymatal 9, Yn erbyn 28.*  
*Amendment 5: For 11, Abstain 9, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
German, Michael  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Melding, David  
Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.*  
*Amendment 6: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick	Andrews, Leighton
Black, Peter	Barrett, Lorraine
Bourne, Nick	Chapman, Christine
Burnham, Eleanor	Cuthbert, Jeff
Cairns, Alun	Davidson, Jane
Davies, Glyn	Davies, Andrew
Francis, Lisa	Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
German, Michael	Essex, Sue
Graham, William	Gibbons, Brian
Isherwood, Mark	Gregory, Janice
Jones, Alun Ffred	Griffiths, John
Jones, Ieuan Wyn	Gwyther, Christine
Jones, Laura Anne	Hart, Edwina
Lloyd, David	Hutt, Jane
Melding, David	Idris Jones, Denise
Randerson, Jenny	James, Irene
Ryder, Janet	Jones, Ann
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn	Jones, Carwyn
Williams, Brynle	Lewis, Huw
Williams, Kirsty	Lloyd, Val
	Mewies, Sandy
	Morgan, Rhodri
	Neagle, Lynne
	Pugh, Alun
	Sargeant, Carl
	Sinclair, Karen
	Thomas, Catherine
	Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*

*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.*

*Amendment 7: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 8: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
Amendment 8: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 9: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
Amendment 9: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 10: O blaid 19, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.*  
*Amendment 10: For 19, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM2528): O blaid 30, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 19.*  
*Motion (NDM2528): For 30, Abstain 0, Against 19.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Francis, Lisa

Davies, Andrew	German, Michael
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin	Graham, William
Essex, Sue	Isherwood, Mark
Gibbons, Brian	Jones, Alun Ffred
Gregory, Janice	Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Griffiths, John	Jones, Laura Anne
Gwyther, Christine	Lloyd, David
Hart, Edwina	Melding, David
Hutt, Jane	Randerson, Jenny
Idris Jones, Denise	Ryder, Janet
James, Irene	Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Jones, Ann	Williams, Brynle
Jones, Carwyn	Williams, Kirsty
Law, Peter	
Lewis, Huw	
Lloyd, Val	
Mewies, Sandy	
Morgan, Rhodri	
Neagle, Lynne	
Pugh, Alun	
Sargeant, Carl	
Sinclair, Karen	
Thomas, Catherine	
Thomas, Gwenda	

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

## **Dadl Fer Short Debate**

### **Anghenion Addysgol Arbennig Special Educational Needs**

**Alun Cairns:** In accordance with custom and practice, I have agreed to give a minute to Janet Ryder, Peter Black and Val Lloyd to respond within my time.

No-one would disagree that pupils and students with special educational needs are among the most vulnerable in society. Therefore, our obligation to people with learning difficulties is greater than it would otherwise be. Many strategies and reports have been published by the Welsh Assembly Government on special educational needs and, to a large extent, the principles and policies have been welcomed by all. There are concerns about the autism strategy, and it is useful that the Minister for Health and Social Services is in the Chamber to hear concerns that have been relayed to me, as well as to many other Members, on the way that the Government's version has been watered down from that which was originally proposed.

**Alun Cairns:** Yn ôl yr arfer, yr wyf wedi cytuno i roi munud i Janet Ryder, Peter Black a Val Lloyd i ymateb o fewn fy amser i.

Ni fyddai neb yn anghytuno bod disgylion a myfyrwyr ag anghenion addysgol arbennig ymhli y rhai mwyaf diamddifynn mewn cymdeithas. Felly, mae ein dyletswydd i bobl ag anawsterau dysgu yn fwy nag a fyddent fel arall. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi cyhoeddi nifer o strategaethau ac adroddiadau ar anghenion addysgol arbennig, ac i raddau helaeth mae pawb wedi croesawu'r egwyddorion a'r polisiau. Cyfyd pryderon ynglŷn â'r strategaeth ar gyfer awtistiaeth, ac mae'n ddefnyddiol fod y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn y Siambra i glywed y pryderon sydd wedi eu cyfleu imi, ac i nifer llawer o Aelodau eraill hefyd, am y ffordd y mae fersiwn y Llywodraeth wedi ei lastwreiddio o'i chymharu â'r hyn a gynigiwyd yn wreiddiol.

In this debate, however, I want to reflect on the practice, and highlight how so many people with learning disabilities are being let down by the state. I want to test the principle that all children have equal opportunity, because that is what we must aim towards. I have raised countless questions on special educational needs with the Minister over many years, because hardly a week passes without hearing of a terrible injustice where a special educational need for a child is not being met.

I should make it clear at this point that my wife is an education lawyer, which possibly means that I am in a position to hear of more cases than most—though, obviously, they are shared in general terms and on an anonymous basis. My point is that, whatever laudable policy is in place, or whatever principles, no matter how positive, are set, far too many pupils and students do not get the extra support that they need and deserve. Therefore, it is the implementation of Assembly policies that is the cause for concern. Sadly, it seems that the Minister's stock answer to many of my questions has been that it is a matter for the local authority, and not for her.

I accept that local education authorities hold the legal responsibility, and that they should be the first port of call in any concern. However, the Minister must accept that she has a strategic responsibility towards the matters across Wales. Society in general has become more litigious, but the number of parents who resort to the law to defend their child's interest and the number of challenges against local education authorities has increased dramatically over recent years.

My original supposition was anecdotal and, having tabled questions to the Minister about the number of cases pursued against local education authorities, I was disappointed with the response, which said that it was not a matter for her, and that the data were not collected centrally. On the other hand, the Members' Research Service was far more helpful, and was able to present some data—

Yn y ddadl hon, foddyd bynnag, yr wyf am ystyried yr arfer, a thynnu sylw at y ffaith fod cynifer o bobl ag anableddau dysgu yn cael eu siomi gan y wladwriaeth. Yr wyf am roi prawf ar yr egwyddor bod pob plentyn yn cael cyfle cyfartal, oherwydd dyna beth y mae'n rhaid inni anelu ato. Yr wyf wedi codi cwestiynau dirifedi am anghenion addysgol arbennig gyda'r Gweinidog dros flynyddoedd lawer, oherwydd prin y bydd wythnos yn mynd heibio heb inni glywed am ryw anghyflawned dybryd lle nad yw angen addysgol arbennig i blentyn yn cael ei ddiwallu.

Dylwn egluro yn awr fod fy ngwraig yn gyfreithwraig addysg, sy'n golygu, o bosibl, fy mod mewn sefyllfa i glywed am fwy o achosion na'r rhan fwyaf o bobl—ond wrth reswm, dim ond manylion cyffredinol ac yn ddienw a gaiff eu rhannu. Fy mhwynt i, pa bolisi clodwiw bynnag sydd ar waith, neu pa egwyddorion bynnag a gaiff eu gosod, waeth pa mor gadarnhaol, yw fod llawer gormod o ddisgyblion a myfyrwyr yn methu â chael y cymorth ychwanegol y mae ei angen arnynt ac y maent yn ei haeddu. Felly, gweithredu polisiau'r Cynulliad eu gweithredu sy'n achosi pryder. Yn anffodus, i nifer o'm cwestiynau, ymddengys mai ateb y Gweinidog bob amser yw mai mater i'r awdurdod lleol ydyw, nid iddi hi.

Derbyniaf mai awdurdodau addysg lleol sydd â'r cyfrifoldeb cyfreithiol, ac atynt hwy y dylid troi yn gyntaf os cyfyd unrhyw bryder. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i'r Gweinidog dderbyn fod arni gyfrifoldeb strategol dros y materion ledled Cymru. Mae cymdeithas yn gyffredinol wedi mynd yn barotach i ddwyn achosion, ond mae nifer y rhieni sydd wedi troi at y gyfraith i amddiffyn buddiant eu plentyn, a nifer yr heriau yn erbyn awdurdodau addysg lleol, wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf.

Yr oedd fy nhybaciaeth wreiddiol yn anecdotaidd, ac ar ôl cyflwyno cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog ynglŷn â nifer yr achosion a ddygydd yn erbyn awdurdodau addysg lleol, yr oeddwn yn siomedig â'r ymateb, a ddywedai nad mater iddi hi ydoedd, ac nad oedd y data'n cael ei gasglu'n ganolog. Ar y llaw arall, yr oedd Gwasanaeth Ymchwil yr Aelodau lawer yn fwy defnyddiol ac yn gallu

not all, of course—which, as I suspected, showed a large increase in the number of legal cases over recent times.

That is worrying for two reasons. Vital resources, regularly tens of thousands of pounds, are being used by local authorities to defend themselves in the increased number of legal cases—funds that could be used to improve the provision for the very pupils that we have all agreed should be helped to a greater degree. More importantly, however, this is evidence that children and young people do not have equal opportunities and are being let down by the state.

4.50 p.m.

Although it is not an exact science, the data suggest that some local authorities are worse than others at meeting special educational needs agendas, and that the sort of support that a pupil or student receives depends on where they live. That is wrong. Therefore, I hope that the Minister accepts the debate in the positive way in which it is intended. In fact, it could be considered as an effort to put education lawyers out of business. That is what we should aim to achieve.

The Education and Lifelong Learning Committee's three-stage policy review is important. It deals with early identification, the statementing process, and transition through the various levels of education. Early identification is a key factor, and teachers need to be trained to recognise the signs. Support from special educational needs co-ordinators also plays an important part. Feedback from parents suggests that, in practice, these elements of the process operate satisfactorily. The next stage is reference to the local education authority, which is where the difficulties begin. Given the potential financial implications, some local authorities are more reluctant than others even to start the statementing assessment. This was highlighted by the Audit Commission in 2002, but the problems still exist so many years on.

However, one of the significant factors is the waiting time. The code of practice says that

rholi rhywfaint o ddata—nid popeth, wrth gwrs—i ddangos, fel yr oeddwn yn amau, fod cynydd mawr yn nifer yr achosion cyfreithiol yn ddiweddar.

Mae hynny'n achosi pryder am ddau reswm. Mae awdurdodau lleol yn defnyddio adnoddau hollbwysig, degau ar filoedd o bunnau yn gyson, i amddiffyn eu hunain yn y nifer cynyddol o achosion cyfreithiol—cyllid a allai gael ei ddefnyddio i wella'r ddarpariaeth ar gyfer yr union ddisgyblion yr ydym oll wedi cytuno y dylid rhoi mwy o gymorth iddynt. Yn bwysicach na hynny, fodd bynnag, mae hyn yn tystio nad yw plant a phobl ifanc yn cael cyfle cyfartal a'u bod yn cael eu siomi gan y wladwriaeth.

Er nad yw'r data yn fanwl gywir, awgryma fod rhai awdurdodau lleol yn waeth nag eraill wrth ddiwallu anghenion addysgol arbennig, a bod y math o gymorth a gaiff disgybl neu fyfyriwr yn dibynnu ar ble y mae'n byw. Mae hynny'n annheg. Felly, gobeithio bod y Gweinidog yn derbyn y ddadl yn y ffordd gadarnhaol a fwriedir. Yn wir, gellid ei hystyried yn ymgais i roi cyfreithwyr addysg allan o fusnes. Dyna beth y dylem anelu at ei gyflawni.

Mae'r adolygiad polisi tri cham gan y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn bwysig. Mae'n ymdrin â nodi anghenion yn gynnar, y broses ddatganiadau, a phontio'r gwahanol lefelau addysg. Mae nodi anghenion yn gynnar yn ffactor allweddol, ac mae angen hyfforddi athrawon i adnabod yr arwyddion. Mae cymorth gan gydlynwyr anghenion addysgol arbennig hefyd yn rhan bwysig. Mae adborth gan rieni'n awgrymu, mewn gwirionedd, fod yr elfennau hyn yn y broses yn gweithio'n foddaol. Y cam nesaf yw cyfeirio achos at yr awdurdod addysg lleol, lle bydd yr anawsterau'n dechrau. O gofio'r goblygiadau ariannol posibl, mae rhai awdurdodau lleol yn fwy amharod nag eraill hyd yn oed i ddechrau asesiad y datganiad. Tynnwyd sylw at hyn gan y Comisiwn Archwilio yn 2002, ond mae'r problemau'n parhau flynyddoedd yn ddiweddarach.

Fodd bynnag, un o'r ffactorau arwyddocaoл yw'r amser aros. Dywed y cod ymarfer y

the statementing process should take 16 weeks, but some take up to two years to complete. Much of the reason for the delay is the lack of language and speech therapists, a problem that needs to be addressed urgently. Speech, language and motor skills are integral parts of a child's learning and development. If children cannot express themselves, it leads to frustration, which manifests itself in delinquency.

There was a case in my constituency where records showed clear recommendations from clinicians highlighting a child's need for occupational therapy. The records state that, when the child was aged seven, occupational therapy was needed. The recommendation was repeated two years later, and, when the child was 10, the record stated explicitly that, unless the child received occupational therapy, there was a high risk of the child becoming a young offender. Sadly, no occupational therapy was received, and, unfortunately, the child is now a young offender. The policies state that every child is equal, and that every child should have equal opportunities. The reality is that that is not the case under the current arrangements. If that child had been born to a middle-class family, evidence suggests that the parents would have persisted with the authorities, complained to an Assembly Member or Member of Parliament, and even resorted to legal action if necessary to ensure that speech, language or occupational therapy—as required in this case—was received.

Similarly, the need for facilities in schools to meet children's requirements is a matter of concern. Some schools have first-class facilities and support structures, and, equally importantly, have developed the culture necessary for special needs pupils to develop their full potential. Dylan Thomas Community School in Swansea is an excellent example of where that has been achieved. It is therefore alarming that, as part of its reorganisation plans, Swansea City and County Council is consulting on whether the school should be closed. Although I recognise that the council has difficult decisions to make, the risk of closing a

dylai'r broses ddatganiadau gymryd 16 wythnos, ond mae rhai yn cymryd hyd at ddwy flynedd i'w cwblhau. Prinder therapyddion iaith a lleferydd sy'n gyfrifol i raddau helaeth am y rheswm dros yr oedi, problem y mae angen mynd i'r afael â hi ar fyrdwr. Mae sgiliau lleferydd, iaith a symud yn rhan annatod o addysg a datblygiad plentyn. Os na all plant fynegi eu hunain, mae'n arwain at rwystredigaeth, sy'n amlyu ei hun mewn ymddygiad tramgwyddus.

Cafwyd achos yn fy etholaeth lle dangosai cofnodion argymhellion clir gan glinigwyr yn dweud bod angen therapi galwedigaethol ar blentyn. Dywed y cofnod fod angen therapi galwedigaethol ar y plentyn pan oedd yn saith oed. Ailadroddwyd yr argymhelliaid ddwy flynedd yn ddiweddarach, a phan oedd y plentyn yn 10 oed dywedai'r cofnod yn glir, oni fyddai'r plentyn yn cael therapi galwedigaethol, fod risg fawr y byddai'n mynd yn droseddwr ifanc. Yn anffodus, ni roddwyd unrhyw therapi galwedigaethol, ac yn anffodus mae'r plentyn yn droseddwr ifanc erbyn hyn. Dywed y polisiau fod pob plentyn yn gydradd, ac y dylai pob plentyn gael cyfle cyfartal. Y gwir yw nad yw hynny'n digwydd o dan y trefniadau presennol. Pe bai'r plentyn hwnnw wedi ei eni mewn teulu dosbarth canol, awgryma'r dystiolaeth y byddai'r rhieni wedi dal i godi'r mater gyda'r awdurdodau, wedi cwyno wrth Aelod Cynulliad neu Aelod Seneddol, a hyd yn oed wedi cymryd camau cyfreithiol, os oedd angen, i sicrhau bod eu plentyn yn cael therapi lleferydd, iaith neu alwedigaethol—fel yr oedd ei angen yn yr achos hwn.

Yn yr un modd, mae'r angen am gyfleusterau mewn ysgolion i ddiwallu gofynion plant yn achosi pryder. Mae gan rai ysgolion gyfleusterau a strwythurau cymorth o'r radd flaenaf, a'r hyn sydd lawn mor bwysig yw eu bod wedi datblygu'r diwylliant angenheidol i ddisgyblion ag anghenion arbennig gyflawni eu potensial llawn. Mae Ysgol Gymuned Dylan Thomas yn Abertawe yn engraifft ardderchog o ysgol lle cyflawnwyd hynny. Felly, mae'n frwydhus deall bod Cyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe, fel rhan o'i gynlluniau ad-drefnu, yn ymgynghori am y cwestiwn a ddylid cau'r ysgol. Er y cydnabyddaf fod gan y cyngor

school with all the important, and even cultural, elements is extremely worrying. I do not believe that students' special needs will be met under these proposals. They will not have the same opportunities to move around the school, like every other pupil, and the quality of education provided for their development will be harmed. In answering the question of whether all children have equal opportunities, I wonder whether the recommendation to close the Dylan Thomas Community School would be made if it were located in a more prosperous part of Swansea.

Finally, I want to pick up on the third theme of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee's review, which is the transition through the various levels of education. The ultimate goal must be for every child or student to have the opportunity to become independent. Even when a learning difficulty is identified at a sufficiently early stage, and when the various statutory obligations have been met, development towards independence is not as straightforward as it should be.

Previously, I have raised with the Minister the case of Daniel Martin, a student with Down's syndrome from Llantwit Major, who, with the right support, has the capacity and opportunity to become a chef. He has already completed a course at Bridgend College and the next stage to give him the chance of becoming independent is a course at Foxes Academy in Minehead. The cost is in the region of £70,000 or £80,000 over three years. ELWa says that this would be disproportionate expenditure. The alternative is that he becomes wholly dependent on social services, where he will end up doing things such as gardening and other tasks in day care—areas that are rewarding to many people, but in which Daniel has no interest. He needs to be motivated and exploited in a positive way and Foxes Academy can deliver this. The cost of social care over his expected lifetime would be well in excess of £1 million. The funding structure prevents Daniel from meeting his full potential and having that equality of opportunity that we are all so committed to achieving. In the crudest terms, we are not prepared to spend

benderfyniadau anodd i'w gwneud, mae'r perygl i'r ysgol gael ei chau, a'r holl elfennau pwysig, hyd yn oed y rhai diwylliannol, ei chau yn achos pryder mawr. Ni chredaf y bydd anghenion arbennig myfyrwyr yn cael eu diwallu o dan y cynigion hyn. Ni chânt yr un cyfleoedd i symud o amgylch yr ysgol, fel pob disgylbl arall, ac amherir ar ansawdd yr addysg a roddir ar gyfer eu datblygiad. Wrth ateb y cwestiwn a yw pob plentyn yn cael cyfle cyfartal, tybed a fyddai'r argymhelliaid i gau Ysgol Gymuned Dylan Thomas yn cael ei wneud pe bai mewn rhan fwy llewyrchus o Abertawe.

Yn olaf, hoffwn gyfeirio at drydedd thema adolygiad y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, sef pontio'r gwahanol lefelau addysg. Rhaid mai'r nod yn y pen draw yw fod pob plentyn neu fyfyrwr yn cael y cyfle i fod yn annibynnol. Hyd yn oed pan gaiff anhawster dysgu ei nodi'n ddigon cynnar, a phan fydd y gwahanol rwymedigaethau statudol wedi'u bodloni, nid yw datblygiad at annibyniaeth mor syml ag y dylai fod.

Yn y gorffennol yr wyf wedi codi achos Daniel Martin gyda'r Gweinidog, myfyriwr o Lanilltuod Fawr sydd â syndrom Down. Gyda'r cymorth cywir, mae'n meddu ar y gallu a'r cyfle i fod yn gogydd. Mae eisoes wedi cwblhau cwrs yng Ngholeg Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr, a'r cam nesaf i roi cyfle iddo fod yn annibynnol yw cwrs yn Academi Foxes yn Minehead. Mae'n costio oddeutu £70,000 neu £80,000 dros dair blynedd. Dywed ELWa y byddai hyn yn wariant anghyfartal. Y dewis arall yw iddo ddibynnu'n llwyr ar wasanaethau cymdeithasol, lle bydd yn gwneud pethau fel garddio a thasgau eraill mewn sefyllfa gofal dydd—meysydd sy'n rhoi boddhad i nifer, ond nad ydynt o unrhyw ddiddordeb i Daniel. Rhaid iddo gael ei ysgogi a'i ddefnyddio mewn ffordd gadarnhaol, a gall Academi Foxes wneud hynny. Byddai costau gofal cymdeithasol iddo am weddill ei fywyd dros £1 filiwn. Mae'r strwythur ariannu yn rhwystro Daniel rhag cyflawni ei botensial llawn a chael y cyfle cyfartal yr ydym oll wedi ymrwymo i'w sicrhau. Mewn gwirionedd, nid ydym yn fodlon gwario £80,000 i arbed £1 filiwn.

£80,000 to save £1 million. Surely, a multi-agency approach is not only logical in meeting laudable policies and principles, but also will save money in the longer term.

In closing, let me bring together the themes that I have sought to highlight. There is clearly an issue with statementing. In general, disadvantaged pupils are not receiving the same opportunities as everyone else. The Minister needs to take a strategic approach to analysing the activities of local authorities. The special needs postcode lottery is unacceptable and the shortage of speech and language therapists is directly hindering the development of these pupils, whom we all agree should be supported. Facilities are vital and any rationalisation of schools needs to take into account the implications on cultural issues, which cannot be replicated easily. Multi-agency funding can not only save money in the longer term but can also give that equality of opportunity for special needs pupils to achieve their full potential. I would not pretend for a minute that all these deficiencies have arisen because of the Minister, or even during her time as Minister, but there is no doubt that she has a responsibility to resolve them. The legal authority may lie with local education authorities and other bodies, but the moral, strategic and funding responsibility lies with the Minister.

**Janet Ryder:** As the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee has been taking evidence in its review of special educational needs, many of the points that Alun has made have already been made by various groups. I will touch briefly upon that transition period that Alun talked about, and the difficulty of funding what is not respite care, although it sometimes classed as respite care, for the parents. When youngsters get to an age where they need to go away and live to learn independent living skills, it is difficult, very often, to find the funding for that. Education throws it back to social services and says that it is respite care for the parents, and social services throw it back to education and says, 'No, it is actually learning, because those young people are learning those independent skills'. They do not have to go very far—we have an

Mae'n sicr fod ymagwedd aml-asiantaeth nid yn unig yn rhesymegol i gyflawni polisiau ac egwyddorion canmoladwy, ond bydd hefyd yn arbed arian ymhent amser.

Wrth gloi, gadewch imi ddwyn ynghyd y themâu yr wyf wedi ceisio'u hamlinellu. Mae'n amlwg bod angen trafod mater datganiadau. Yn gyffredinol, nid yw disgyblion difreintiedig yn cael yr un cyfleoedd â phawb arall. Rhaid i'r Gweinidog gymryd ymagwedd strategol tuag at ddadansoddi gweithgareddau awdurdodau lleol. Mae loteri cod post anghenion arbennig yn annerbyniol, ac mae prinder therapyddion lleferydd ac iaith yn rhwystr uniongyrchol i ddatblygiad y disgyblion hyn, y cytunwn oll y dylent gael eu cynorthwyo. Mae cyfleusterau'n hanfodol, a rhaid i unrhyw waith ad-drefnu ysgolion ystyried yr oblygiadau o ran materion diwylliannol, na ellir eu hatgynhyrchu yn hawdd. Yn ogystal ag arbed arian dros gyfnod hwy, gall arian aml-asiantaeth hefyd roi cyfle cyfartal i ddisgyblion ag anghenion arbennig gyflawni eu llawn botensial. Ni fyddwn yn honni am funud fod yr holl ddiffygion hyn wedi codi oherwydd y Gweinidog, na hyd yn oed yn ystod ei hamser fel Gweinidog, ond nid oes amheuaeth nad oes ganddi gyfrifoldeb i'w datrys. Efallai mai'r awdurdodau addysg lleol a chyrff eraill sydd â'r cyfrifoldeb cyfreithiol, ond y Gweinidog sydd â'r cyfrifoldeb moesol, strategol ac ariannol.

**Janet Ryder:** Gan fod y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes wedi bod yn cymryd tystiolaeth yn ei adolygiad o anghenion addysgol arbennig, mae nifer o'r pwyntiau a wnaed gan Alun eisoes wedi eu gwneud gan grwpiau amrywiol. Soniaf yn gryno am y cyfnod pontio y cyfeiriai Alun ato, a'r anhawster i ariannu'r hyn nad yw'n ofal seibiant, er y caiff ei alw weithiau yn ofal seibiant, i'r rhieni. Pan fydd pobl ifanc yn cyrraedd oedran pan fydd angen iddynt fynd i ffwrdd a dysgu sgiliau byw'n annibynnol, mae'n aml yn anodd cael yr arian ar gyfer hynny. Mae'r adrannau addysg yn ei daflu yn ôl at y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol gan ddweud mai gofal seibiant i'r rhieni ydyw, a'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn ei daflu yn ôl i'r adrannau addysg gan ddweud 'Na, dysgu ydyw mewn gwirionedd gan fod y bobl ifanc hynny yn dysgu'r sgiliau

excellent centre in Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn in Denbigh, which offers those skills and the residential care that is needed. However, we need to find a way of overcoming that social services/education barrier and of allowing those independent living skills to be funded properly so that those people can live away from home and learn the skills that will enable them to live independent and fruitful lives.

**Peter Black:** I welcome the opportunity to contribute to this debate, and I thank Alun for raising this subject in the Assembly. As Alun has said, the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee has been carrying out an extensive review of special educational needs, and any contribution to that review and debate is very welcome. If Alun wants to submit evidence to us, particularly on the statementing process that we are looking at now, we will be more than happy to look at that and take it on board as part of the review. The issue with regard to statementing in particular is very much that it tries to take a multi-agency approach to the delivery of services, without having the multi-agency planning processes and delivery on the other side to put those services in place. For example, the workforce planning for speech and language therapists tends to be based on secondary health needs, rather than primary health needs, in terms of what local education authorities or other bodies might require with regard to those particular professions. If we can start to address those planning issues, and ensure that the professionals are there to deliver the services, then a lot of the dissatisfaction over statements, with which there are many other issues, could be overcome.

5.00 p.m.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I am pleased to reply to this debate, and I accept the positive spirit in which Alun tried to present the whole debate. He was unable to present the

annibynnol hynny'. Nid oes angen iddynt fynd ymhell—mae gennym ganolfan ragorol yn Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn yn Ninbych, sy'n cynnig y sgiliau hynny a'r gofal preswyl angenrheidiol. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gael ffordd i oresgyn y rhwystr hwnnw a godir gan wasanaethau cymdeithasol ac addysg, a galluogi'r sgiliau byw annibynnol hynny i gael eu hariannu'n briodol, fel y gall y bobl hynny fyw oddi cartref a dysgu'r sgiliau a fydd yn eu galluogi i fyw bywydau annibynnol a ffrwythlon.

**Peter Black:** Croesawaf y cyfle i gyfrannu at y ddadl hon, a diolchaf i Alun am godi'r pwnc hwn yn y Cynulliad. Fel y dywedodd Alun, mae Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes y Cynulliad wedi bod yn gwneud adolygiad eang o anghenion addysgol arbennig, ac mae unrhyw gyfraniad i'r adolygiad hwnnw a'r ddadl honno i'w groesawu'n fawr. Os yw Alun am gyflwyno tystiolaeth inni, yn arbennig am y broses ddatganiadau yr ydym yn ei hystyried ar hyn o bryd, byddwn yn fwy na bodlon edrych ar hynny a'i ystyried fel rhan o'r adolygiad. Y broblem o ran datganiadau yn arbennig yw ei bod yn ceisio cymryd ymagwedd aml-asiantaeth i ddarparu gwasanaethau, heb i'r prosesau cynllunio a'r ddarpariaeth aml-asiantaeth fod ar waith ar yr ochr arall i weithredu'r gwasanaethau hynny. Er enghraifft, mae'r gwaith o gynllunio gweithlu ar gyfer therapyddion lleferydd ac iaith yn dueddol o fod yn seiliedig ar anghenion iechyd eilaidd, yn hytrach nag anghenion iechyd sylfaenol, o ran yr hyn a fyddai ei angen ar awdurdodau addysg lleol neu gyrff eraill mewn cysylltiad â'r proffesiynau penodol hynny. Os gallwn ddechrau mynd i'r afael â'r materion cynllunio hynny, a sicrhau bod y gweithwyr proffesiynol ar gael i ddarparu'r gwasanaethau, yna byddai'n bosibl lleddfu llawer o'r anfodlonrwydd am ddatganiadau lle mae nifer o broblemau eraill yn codi yn eu cylch.

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Yr wyf yn falch ymateb i'r ddadl hon, a derbyniaf yr ysbryd cadarnhaol y ceisiodd Alun ei gyflwyno i'r holl ddadl. Ni allai gyflwyno'r holl ddadl

whole debate in a positive spirit, but we are used to that. There are a range of reasons why we are where we are with special educational needs. Many years ago, when I was involved with the Welsh Local Government Association, with a responsibility for social care, one of the things that we were looking at was the impact of local government reorganisation in Wales, which lead to the creation of many small authorities. The risk that was perceived back in 1996 was that small authorities would be unable to deliver the full range of services that were needed, particularly where you had children or adults with additional needs in the education or social care system.

That has now been borne out in fact. Over the past few years, we have been trying—with, I thought, all-party support—to reach a point whereby we can ensure that we bring services as close as possible to the individuals who need them. That is why we had all-party support from the Assembly when we took the Wales-only powers for regional collaboration, for example. That, of course, created Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn, with additional investment from the Assembly. The principle is to work with local authorities who have the strategic and absolute responsibility, but I fully accept, which is why I used that school as an example, that the Assembly can take an overview. With funding incentives, we can guide the strategic responsibility in terms of the local authorities, working with them to ensure that we improve delivery at the local level.

One of the things that has happened since 1999, and has been a feature of the way that this Assembly has worked, is that almost every aspect of the special educational needs agenda has been up for review. You said in your contribution that people welcome the principles and policies, but that we are still some way from absolute implementation across Wales, and I would accept that. Every speech that I make in terms of additional learning needs starts with the premise that we have a postcode lottery. That is for a range of reasons, one of which I have already identified, in terms of the difficulties for

mewn ysbryd cadarnhaol, ond yr ydym wedi arfer â hynny. Mae amrywiol resymau pam yr ydym yn y sefyllfa hon o ran anghenion addysgol arbennig. Flynyddoedd lawer yn ôl, pan oeddwn yn ymwneud â Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, gyda chyfrifoldeb dros ofal cymdeithasol, un o'r pethau yr oeddem yn edrych arno oedd effaith ad-drefnu llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru, a arweiniodd at greu nifer o awdurdodau bach. Y risg a ragwelwyd yn ôl yn 1996 oedd na allai awdurdodau bach ddarparu'r ystod lawn o wasanaethau angenrheidiol, yn arbennig mewn sefyllfa lle mae plant neu oedolion ag anghenion addysgol arbennig yn y system addysg neu ofal cymdeithasol.

Cadarnhawyd hynny bellach. Dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf, yr ydym—gyda chefnogaeth yr holl bleidiau, fel y tybiwn—wedi bod yn ceisio cyrraedd man lle y gallwn sicrhau ein bod yn cynnig gwasanaethau mor agos â phosibl i'r unigolion y mae arnynt eu hangen. Dyna pam y cawsom gefnogaeth gan holl bleidiau'r Cynulliad pan ymgwymerwyd â'r pwerau cydweithio rhanbarthol dros Gymru gyfan, er enghraift. Hynny, wrth gwrs, a greodd Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn, gyda buddsoddiad ychwanegol gan y Cynulliad. Yr egwyddor yw gweithio gydag awdurdodau lleol sydd â chyfrifoldeb strategol a llwyr. Ond derbyniaf yn llawn y gall y Cynulliad gymryd trosolwg, a dyna pam y defnyddiai yr ysgol honno fel enghraift. Gyda chymhellion ariannol, gallwn arwain y cyfrifoldeb strategol o ran yr awdurdodau lleol, gan weithio gyda hwy i sicrhau ein bod yn gwella darpariaeth ar lefel leol.

Un o'r pethau sydd wedi digwydd er 1999, ac sydd wedi bod yn nodweddiadol o'r ffordd y mae'r Cynulliad hwn wedi gweithio, yw bod bron pob agwedd ar yr agenda anghenion addysgol arbennig wedi ei hadolygu. Dywedech yn eich cyfraniad fod pobl yn croesawu'r egwyddorion a'r polisiau, ond fod gennym grym bellter i fynd eto cyn gweithredu'n llawn ar draws Cymru, a byddwn yn derbyn hynny. Rhaid i bob arai a wnaf o ran anghenion dysgu ychwanegol ddechrau gyda'r gosodiad fod gennym loteri cod post. Mae hynny'n digwydd am nifer o resymau, a nodais un

small authorities to deliver, particularly for low-incidence, high-dependency young people.

Although local authorities have the absolute responsibility in terms of delivery, and although there are issues in terms of the prime and ultimate responsibility, which we have explored in detail, between the health and education services in the delivery of services such as speech and language therapy, with devolution, we can take the agenda forward in Wales in a way that will cumulatively lead to the reduction of the current postcode lottery. I gave the example earlier of Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn, and we have opened the unit in Fairwater, which also focuses on autism, and operates in the former Gwent local authority areas. Other proposals are coming forward in Wales. We have reviewed all the sensory impairment additional learning needs, and strategies are coming forward in those areas.

We are now in a position whereby we have managed to audit a number of the actual situations in different local authorities across Wales. Some information that you may have received from the Members' Research Service in terms of legal cases will have been obtained from local authorities. That is why we have a Members' research service, but, from the ministerial perspective, some data are collected centrally, and some are not. We do not collect information centrally where the responsibilities lie absolutely within local authorities.

I am clear about the policies of this Assembly Government, broadly, in terms of the delivery of the special educational needs agenda. Our commitment is, and always has been, to fully achieve the key principle set out in the special educational needs code of practice in Wales, which is that all children who have special educational needs will have those needs met. That is a basic right, and one that I imagine that all Assembly Members remain committed to. We are developing our policies in relation to additional learning needs to meet this basic

ohonynt eisoes, o ran anhawster awdurdodau bach i ddarparu gwasanaethau, yn arbennig ar gyfer pobl ifanc dibyniaeth uchel sydd ag anghenion llai cyffredin.

Er mai'r awdurdodau lleol sydd â'r cyfrifoldeb llwyr o ran darpariaeth, ac er bod ychydig ansicrywydd am y prif gyfrifoldeb a'r cyfrifoldeb terfynol, sydd wedi ei archwilio'n fanwl gennym, rhwng y gwasanaethau iechyd ac addysg o ran darparu gwasanaethau megis therapi lleferydd ac iaith, gyda datganoli gallwn ddatblygu'r agenda yng Nghymru mewn ffordd a fydd yn y pen draw yn arwain at leihau'r loteri cod post presennol. Rhoddais enghrafft yn gynharach o Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn, ac yr ydym wedi agor yr uned yn y Tyllgoed, sydd hefyd yn canolbwytio ar awtisiaeth, ac yn gweithredu yn ardaloedd hen awdurdodau lleol Gwent. Caiff cynigion eraill eu cyflwyno yng Nghymru. Yr ydym wedi adolygu'r holl anghenion dysgu ychwanegol o ran nam ar y synhwyrau, ac mae strategaethau'n cael eu cyflwyno yn y meysydd hynny.

Yr ydym bellach mewn sefyllfa lle yr ydym wedi llwyddo i archwilio llawer o'r sefyllfaoedd gwirioneddol mewn awdurdodau lleol gwahanol ledled Cymru. Bydd peth o'r wybodaeth a allech fod wedi ei derbyn gan Wasanaeth Ymchwil yr Aelodau o ran achosion cyfreithiol wedi ei chael gan awdurdodau lleol. Dyna pam y mae gennym wasanaeth ymchwil i'r Aelodau, ond, o safbwynt gweinidogol, cesglir peth data yn ganolog, ond nid popeth. Ni fyddwn yn casglu data yn ganolog pan fydd y cyfrifoldebau yn llwyr ar awdurdodau lleol.

Yr wyf yn glir am bolisiau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn fras, o ran cyflawni'r agenda anghenion addysgol arbennig. Ein hymrwymiad yn awr, fel erioed, yw cyflawni'n llawn yr egwyddor allweddol sydd wedi ei gosod allan yng nghod ymarfer anghenion addysgol arbennig Cymru, sef y caiff anghenion pob plentyn sydd ag anghenion addysgol arbennig eu diwallu. Mae hynny'n hawl sylfaenol, ac yn un y tybiaf fod holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn dal wedi ymrwymo iddi. Yr ydym yn datblygu ein polisiau mewn cysylltiad ag anghenion

principle.

We also made a clear commitment in ‘The Learning Country’ in terms of addressing and overcoming barriers to learning, supporting diversity and inclusion, and narrowing the gap in achievement between advantaged and disadvantaged areas, groups and individuals. It is important that when we talk about the principles of inclusion, we make it clear that we have always taken a pragmatic approach to inclusion in Wales. As I said earlier, some children are better served in special schools and some in mainstream education. We should maintain that principle; it is enshrined in legislation, as your wife, in her role, will know. Inclusion is not about one size fitting all or about where a child receives his or her education, whether in a mainstream or specialist setting, it is about inclusion within a wider community and creating an ethos that values and supports diversity.

There are a number of areas on which we can commend the way that the Assembly, as well as the Assembly Government, is taking these issues forward. I have sat with the Chair of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee and other Members, listening to the evidence that has come forward on early intervention and statementing, and, as you pointed out, there is a real difference in how local authorities statement. It is also worth noting that several of the people who have given evidence have not said that any individual local authority is worse or better because it does or does not put more statements in the system. The ultimate aim for us all must be to get to a position where there are fewer statements in the system because the service is reacting more appropriately to needs. The statement should be a final recourse. Several of those who have given evidence have made it clear that they feel, at the moment, that we must have statements in the system to give the child and his or her parents their entitlement, but that, in the long game, that is not where they would want to go.

dysgu ychwanegol i fodloni'r egwyddor sylfaenol hon.

Gwnaethom ymrwymiad clir hefyd yn ‘Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu’ i fynd i'r afael â rhwystrau rhag dysgu, cynnal amrywiaeth a chynhwysiant a goesgyn y rhwystrau hynny, a chau'r bwlc mewn cyrhaeddiad rhwng ardaloedd, grwpiau ac unigolion breintiedig a difreintiedig. Mae'n bwysig, wrth inni siarad am egwyddorion cynhwysiant, inni wneud yn glir ein bod wedi mabwysiadu dull bragmatig tuag at gynhwysiant yng Nghymru. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, caiff rhai plant well gwasanaeth mewn ysgolion arbennig ac eraill mewn addysg brif-ffrwd. Dylem gadw at yr egwyddor honno; mae wedi ei hymgorffori mewn deddfwriaeth, fel y gŵyr eich gwraig yn ei rôl hi. Nid mater o un gwasanaeth yn addas ar gyfer pawb yw cynhwysiant, nac ychwaith ble y caiff plentyn ei addysg, boed mewn sefydliad prif-ffrwd neu arbenigol. Mae'n ymwneud â chynhwysiant yn y gymuned ehangach a chreu ethos sy'n gwerthfawrogi amrywiaeth ac yn ei chynnal.

Mae nifer o feysydd lle gallwn ganmol y ffordd y mae'r Cynulliad, yn ogystal â Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn gweithredu ar y materion hyn. Yr wyf wedi eistedd gyda Chadeirydd y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ac Aelodau eraill, yn gwrando ar y dystiolaeth a ddaeth i law am ymyriad a pharatoi datganiad yn gynnar, ac fel yr ydych wedi dweud, mae gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol yn y ffordd y mae awdurdodau lleol yn gwneud datganiadau. Mae hefyd yn werth nodi nad yw nifer o'r bobl sydd wedi rhoi dystiolaeth wedi dweud bod unrhyw awdurdod lleol yn waeth neu'n well na'r llall am ei fod yn rhoi mwy o ddatganiadau yn y system, neu i'r gwrthwyneb. Rhaid gosod fel nod i bob un ohonom yn y pen draw gyrraedd sefyllfa lle mae llai o ddatganiadau yn y system am fod y gwasanaeth yn ymateb yn fwy priodol i anghenion. Cam olaf ddylai datganiad fod. Mae nifer o'r rheini a roddodd dystiolaeth wedi gwneud yn glir eu bod yn teimlo, ar hyn o bryd, fod angen inni gael datganiadau yn y system er mwyn rhoi i'r plentyn a'r rheini yr hyn y mae ganddynt hawl i'w gael, ond nad. Ond nid dyna yw eu dynuniad yn y pen draw.

It is also important to say that there have been some substantial developments, for example, on speech and language therapy. It takes time to train new speech and language therapists. In 2000, 86 were being trained per year, but that was up to 131 in 2004, and workforce plans indicate that additional numbers are required. Due to capacity issues at the University of Wales Institute Cardiff, the Assembly is looking to expand the training provision to other institutions in Wales. We have to plan that, alongside the higher education sector. We appointed a speech and language co-ordinator at the end of January, and pilot projects have been established, working across the health and education fields to develop joint commissioning arrangements and a pooled-budget approach to the delivery of speech and language services for children and young people in Wales. This approach was strongly endorsed by the occupational therapists, for example, who came to speak to our committee last week.

The inclusion agenda is important in schools in Wales and we have given the index of inclusion to all schools. I would commend all schools that actively take on board the needs of children with special educational needs. They are disproportionately represented in areas of disadvantage, and it is incredibly important that we ensure that we carry on taking forward such agendas as Narrowing the Gap, which looks at how we can encourage schools across Wales to lift their achievement base and their support base.

You have asked many questions over the years on special educational needs and I was looking back at the answers in preparation for this debate. The answers show clearly how this debate has moved on over time, as more work has been done, more strategies have been put in place, and people are more understanding.

**Lisa Francis:** You said that things are moving on, but I have concerns. I know that you are looking in depth at special educational needs at the moment, but, in respect of statementing and the delays that

Mae hefyd yn bwysig dweud bod rhai datblygiadau sylweddol wedi digwydd, er enghraifft o ran therapi lleferydd ac iaith. Mae'n cymryd amser i hyfforddi therapyddion lleferydd ac iaith. Yn 2000, yr oedd 86 yn cael eu hyfforddi bob blwyddyn, ond cynyddodd hynny i 131 yn 2004, ac mae cynlluniau gweithlu yn dangos bod angen niferoedd ychwanegol. Oherwydd problemau lle yn Athrofa Prifysgol Cymru Caerdydd, mae'r Cynulliad yn gobeithio ehangu'r ddarpariaeth hyfforddiant i sefydliadau eraill yng Nghymru. Rhaid cynllunio hynny, ochr yn ochr â'r sector addysg uwch. Penodwyd cydlynnydd lleferydd ac iaith gennym ddiweddu Ionawr, ac mae prosiectau peilot wedi eu sefydlu, sy'n gweithio ar draws y meysydd iechyd ac addysg i ddatblygu trefniadau cyd-gomisiynu ac ymagwedd gyd-gyllidebu wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau lleferydd ac iaith i blant a phobl ifanc yng Nghymru. Cafwyd cefnogaeth bendant i'r ymagwedd hon gan therapyddion galwedigaethol, er enghraifft, a ddaeth i siarad â'n pwylgor yr wythnos diwethaf.

Mae'r agenda gynhwysiant hon yn bwysig mewn ysgolion yng Nghymru ac yr ydym wedi rhoi'r mynegai cynhwysiant i bob ysgol. Byddwn yn cymeradwyo pob ysgol sy'n ystyried anghenion plant ag anghenion addysgol arbennig o ddifrif. Mae niferoedd anghymesur ohonynt mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig, ac mae'n hynod o bwysig inni sicrhau ein bod yn parhau i ddatblygu agendâu megis 'cau'r bwlc', sy'n edrych ar y ffordd y gallwn annog ysgolion ledled Cymru i godi eu sail cyflawniadau a'u sail gefnogi.

Yr ydych wedi gofyn nifer o gwestiynau dros y blynnyddoedd am anghenion addysgol arbennig, ac yr oeddwn yn edrych yn ôl ar yr atebion wrth baratoi ar gyfer y ddadl hon. Mae'r atebion yn dangos yn glir y ffordd y mae'r ddadl hon wedi datblygu gydag amser, wrth i fwy o waith gael ei wneud, wrth i fwy o strategaethau gael eu rhoi ar waith, ac wrth i bobl ddod yn fwy ystyriol.

**Lisa Francis:** Yr oeddech yn dweud bod pethau'n symud ymlaen, ond yr wyf yn brydersu. Gwn eich bod yn edrych yn fanwl ar anghenion addysgol arbennig ar hyn o bryd, ond mewn cysylltiad â datganiadau a'

many people incur through local authorities not bringing it about quickly enough, many parents look to the private sector.

5.10 p.m.

You must be aware of that, as it is certainly something that has been raised with me in surgeries recently. What do you intend to do to improve that, and what sort of timescale are you setting to bring about a change in that? You cannot keep saying that the local authorities need to set it out. I am sure that the Assembly Government has a means by which to push this forward.

**Jane Davidson:** The timescales are written in law, and we have a tribunal system so that parents and children can take recourse to that system. We would all aim for the tribunal system to see as few cases as possible because the appropriate provision has been put in place for the individual children earlier. Interestingly enough, an issue that we will have to resolve when we look at this matter in committee is that you can have advice from professionals commissioned by parents to take reports to the tribunal that is different from the advice that the service professionals who are required to deliver the outcome of the statement would give. That issue has come up twice in committee, and we need to look at that kind of area.

I know that you have raised the issue of Daniel Martin with me before. It is important to say that that matter will come before an independent appeals panel. What has not been said in this debate is that ELWa has already funded Daniel Martin for three years' residential learning experience, and that it is not just an issue of cost, as ELWa does, in fact, fund other residential placements in Foxes Academy.

**Alun Cairns rose—**

**Jane Davidson:** I will not talk any more about that case as it would be entirely inappropriate for me to do so. All I am doing is laying out the fact that that was not recognised in the contribution that you made

oedi sy'n wynebu nifer o bobl am fod awdurdodau lleol wedi methu â gweithredu yn ddigon cyflym, mae nifer o rieni yn troi at y sector preifat.

Rhaid eich bod yn gwybod am hynny, gan ei fod yn sicr yn rhywbeth a godwyd gyda mi mewn cyngorfeydd yn ddiweddar. Beth yr ydych yn bwriadu ei wneud i wella hynny, a pha fath o amserlen yr ydych yn ei phennu i sicrhau newid yn hynny? Ni allwch ddal i ddweud bod angen i'r awdurdodau lleol ddatrys y broblem. Yr wyf yn siŵr fod modd i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad weithredu ar hyn.

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'r terfynau amser wedi'u pennu o dan y gyfraith, ac mae gennym system tribiwnlys y gall rhieni a phlant droi ati. Byddem oll yn anelu at sicrhau bod y system tribiwnlys yn gweld cyn lleied o achosion â phosib, am fod y ddarpariaeth briodol wedi'i rhoi ar waith i blant unigol yn gynharach. Yn ddiddorol ddigon, un broblem y bydd yn rhaid inni ei datrys pan edrychwn ar y mater hwn yn y pwylgor yw y gallwch gael cyngor gan weithwyr proffesiynol wedi'i gomisiynu gan rieni i gyflwyno adroddiadau i'r tribiwnlys sy'n wahanol i'r cyngor y byddai gweithwyr proffesiynol y gwasanaeth, sy'n gorfol darparu'r hyn a nodir yn y datganiad, yn ei roi. Codwyd y mater hwn ddwywaith yn y pwylgor, ac mae angen inni edrych ar faterion o'r fath.

Gwn eich bod wedi codi achos Daniel Martin gyda mi o'r blaen. Mae'n bwysig dweud y daw'r mater hwnnw gerbron panel apeliadau annibynnol. Yr hyn na ddywedwyd yn y ddadl hon yw bod ELWa eisoes wedi ariannu Daniel Martin i gael profiad dysgu preswyl am dair blynedd, ac nad mater o gost ydyw gan fod ELWa, mewn gwirionedd, yn ariannu lleoliadau preswyl eraill yn Academi Foxes.

**Alun Cairns a gododd—**

**Jane Davidson:** Ni soniaf ddim mwy am yr achos hwnnw oherwydd byddai'n holol amhriodol imi wneud hynny. Y cyfan yr wyf yn ei wneud yw nodi'r ffait na chydnbauwyd hynny yn eich cyfraniad

today. There has been previous funding and there will be an independent appeal panel. It is not a panel in which you or I will be involved, but an independent one that will then take that issue forward.

In closing, I believe that the general principles on which this Government operates are the right ones. They are the principles of inclusion wherever possible, special schools wherever possible, looking at ways in which we can ensure that the needs of the learner are enhanced, wherever that learner is and whatever his or her needs are, and looking at ways in which we can improve the initial teacher education and training system so that our teachers come in with a greater understanding of the diversity of needs in the classroom, which is another area that the committee wanted to take forward.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That completes today's business.

heddiw. Mae arian wedi ei roi eisoes, a bydd panel apeliadau annibynnol. Nid yw'n banel y byddwch chi na finnau'n cymryd rhan yn ddo, ond yn banel annibynnol a fydd wedyn yn ystyried y mater hwnnw ymhellach.

I gloi, credaf fod egwyddorion cyffredinol y Llywodraeth hon yn gywir, sef egwyddorion o gynhwysiant lle bynnag y mae'n bosibl, o ysgolion arbennig lle bynnag y mae'n bosibl, o chwilio am ffyrdd i sicrhau bod anghenion y dysgwr yn cael eu diwallu'n well, ble bynnag y mae'r dysgwr a beth bynnag yw ei anghenion ef neu hi, ac o chwilio am ffyrdd i wella'r system addysg a hyfforddiant cychwynnol i athrawon er mwyn i'n hathrawon ddechrau yn eu swyddi yn deall yn well yr amrywiaeth anghenion yn yr ystafell ddosbarth, sef maes arall yr oedd y pwylgor am weithredu arno.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.13 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 5.13 p.m.*

#### **Aelodau a'u Pleidiau Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)

Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Law, Peter (Annibynnol – Independent)  
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)  
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)