



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru**  
**(Cofnod y Trafodion)**

**The National Assembly for Wales**  
**(The Record of Proceedings)**

**Dydd Mercher, 29 Mehefin 2005**  
**Wednesday, 29 June 2005**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

Datganiad gan y Dirprwy Lywydd Statement by the Deputy Presiding Officer .....	3
Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services .....	3
Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon Questions to the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport.....	20
Cwestiynau i Gynrychiolydd Pwyllgor y Tŷ Questions to the Representative of the House Committee .....	35
Datganiad ar Sony Statement on Sony .....	36
Rhaglen Buddsoddi Cyfalaf y GIG The NHS Capital Investment Programme .....	48
Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order .....	75
Dadl Fer: Gweithio dros Gymru Hyderus Short Debate: Working for a Confident Wales .....	77
Dadl Fer: Tetra—yr achos dros reolaeth Short Debate: Tetra—the case for control .....	87

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Dirprwy Lywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Deputy Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

### **Datganiad gan y Dirprwy Lywydd Statement by the Deputy Presiding Officer**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The Presiding Officer has asked me to say that he is meeting the Lord Chancellor in the Palace of Westminster this afternoon and, for that reason, I will be presiding all afternoon.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae'r Llywydd wedi gofyn imi ddweud ei fod yn cyfarfod â'r Arglwydd Ganghellor ym Mhalas San Steffan y prynhawn yma, ac o'r herwydd fi fydd yn llywyddu drwy'r prynhawn.

### **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services**

#### **Y Gwasanaeth y Tu Allan i Oriau The Out-of-hours Service**

**Q1 William Graham:** What assessment has the Minister made on the sustainability of the current GP out-of-hours service? OAQ0293(HSS)

**C1 William Graham:** Pa asesiad y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i wneud o gynaliadwyedd y gwasanaeth cyfredol gan feddygon teulu y tu allan i oriau? OAQ0293(HSS)

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** The new out-of-hours arrangements have gone well, with close working between local health boards and key partners. I have no reason to doubt the sustainability of these services, but the review by the Wales Audit Office will be helpful on all aspects of the new general medical services contract.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Mae'r trefniadau newydd ar gyfer y gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau wedi bod yn llwyddiannus, gyda byrddau iechyd lleol a phartneriaid allweddol yn cydweithio'n agos. Nid oes gennyf unrhyw reswm i amau cynaliadwyedd y gwasanaethau hyn, ond bydd yr adolygiad gan Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru yn ddefnyddiol ym mhob agwedd ar y contract gwasanaethau meddygol cyffredinol newydd.

**William Graham:** You will be well aware of the public concern about GP practices throughout Wales being sustained by doctors from Europe. Can you not do better than that?

**William Graham:** Fe wyddoch am bryder y cyhoedd ynglŷn â'r ffaith bod practisau meddygon teulu ledled Cymru yn cael eu cynnal gan feddygon o Ewrop. Oni allwch wneud yn well na hynny?

**Brian Gibbons:** I do not know about the doctors from Europe, because I am from Europe myself, which I hope is acceptable to William. There is no doubt that, at the outset, the out-of-hours service had a certain credibility issue in terms of establishing itself. We have been monitoring the service, and there has been a clear and decided improvement in the quality of delivery. I am sure that William will know from his experience in Gwent that about 98 per cent of calls are triaged within the 60-minute target.

**Brian Gibbons:** Ni wn am y meddygon o Ewrop, gan fy mod innau yn dod o Ewrop, sy'n dderbyniol i William, gobeithio. Yn ddiau, yr oedd ychydig broblem hygredd gyda'r gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau ar y dechrau wrth ymsefydlu. Yr ydym wedi bod yn monitro'r gwasanaeth, a gwelwyd gwelliant clir a phendant yn ansawdd y darparu. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gŵyr William, o'i brofiad yng Ngwent, fod tua 98 y cant o alwadau yn cael eu blaenoriaethu o fewn y targed o 60 munud. Mae hwnnw'n welliant sylweddol ers inni gychwyn.

That is a considerable improvement on where we started from.

**Jenny Randerson:** You said at last week's meeting of the Health and Social Services Committee that accident and emergency units had a clear knock-on effect on ambulance waiting times. Accident and emergency staff are clear that problems with the out-of-hours service have had an impact on the number of people seeking to use their services. Will you conduct a review, in addition to the one that you have just mentioned, to look at the impact of those three services on each other and at the crisis facing some parts of Wales?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yes, we have already started work on that with the developing emergency care services project. The DECS project has commissioned some research from accident and emergency departments in the University Hospital of Wales, in Bridgend and in Swansea, in relation to how people are using the services and travel to the service and whether they use private transport or ambulances. We have gathered a considerable amount of evidence to feed into the DECS project. Hopefully, when that project comes to fruition, we will be able to deliver the holistic response that you require.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Weinidog, a wnewch chi ddweud rhywbeth wrthym am gylch gwaith yr adolygiad? A fydd yr adolygiad yn edrych ar y cyflogau a delir i feddygon teulu am ddarparu gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau? A wnewch chi dderbyn, o gofio consŷrn y cyhoedd am y gwasanaeth hwn, y byddai wedi bod yn well pe baem wedi cael cyfnod cysgodi cyn cyflwyno'r system newydd, er mwyn sicrhau bod unrhyw broblemau yn cael eu datrys ymlaen llaw?

**Brian Gibbons:** I think that Rhodri Glyn will know that the timing of the introduction of the new out-of-hours arrangements was very much dictated by the new GP out-of-hours contract, which was due to come in in April. Consequently, there was not a great deal of flexibility in terms of time for a shadow period, as was suggested.

**Jenny Randerson:** Dywedasoeh yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yr wythnos diwethaf fod unedau damweiniau ac achosion bryd yn cael effaith amlwg ar amseroedd aros am ambiwlans. Mae staff damweiniau ac achosion brys yn hollol glir fod problemau gyda'r gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau wedi cael effaith ar nifer y bobl sydd am ddefnyddio eu gwasanaethau. A wnewch chi gynnal adolygiad, yn ychwanegol at yr un yr ydych newydd ei grybwyll, i edrych ar effaith y tri gwasanaeth hynny ar ei gilydd a'r argyfwng sy'n wynebu rhai rhannau o Gymru?

**Brian Gibbons:** Gwnaf, yr ydym eisoes wedi dechrau gweithio ar hynny gyda'r prosiect datblygu gwasanaethau gofal brys. Mae'r prosiect hwnnw wedi comisiynu rhywfaint o waith ymchwil gan adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru, ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr ac yn Abertawe, mewn cysylltiad â'r ffordd y mae pobl yn defnyddio'r gwasanaethau ac yn teithio i'r gwasanaeth, ac a ydynt yn defnyddio cludiant preifat neu ambiwlans. Yr ydym wedi casglu llawer o dystiolaeth i'w hymgorffori yn y prosiect. Gobeithio, pan gaiff y prosiect hwnnw ei wireddu, y byddwn yn gallu darparu'r ymateb cyfannol a ddymunwch.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Minister, will you tell us a little about the review's remit? Will the review consider the salaries paid to general practitioners for providing the out-of-hours service? Will you accept, given the public concern about this service, that it would have been better to have a shadow period before the new system was introduced, so that any problems could have been ironed out beforehand?

**Brian Gibbons:** Credaf y bydd Rhodri Glyn yn gwybod bod y contract newydd i feddygon teulu ar gyfer y gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau, y bwriedid iddo ddod i rym ym mis Ebrill, wedi rheoli i raddau helaeth amseriad y broses o gyflwyno'r trefniadau newydd ar gyfer y gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau. O ganlyniad, nid oedd llawer o hyblygrwydd amser ar gyfer cyfnod cysgodi, fel yr awgrymwyd.

We are monitoring the service carefully. I had a very useful regional meeting in Bronllys a few weeks ago with all the out-of-hours providers through the local health board. I hope to replicate this meeting in south-east Wales and north Wales so that I become fully up to speed with what is happening at a local level. As you know, the Wales Audit Office is carrying out a wide-ranging review to demonstrate efficient and effective practice and value for money. I cannot tell you whether it will decide to make a judgment on levels of pay for individual doctors operating within the system, but I do not think that this will be specifically included in its remit. The WAO may wish to comment on this in the report, but I doubt that this is a headline issue that the WAO would have been asked to consider from the start.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Before I call Val Lloyd, I inform Members that five minutes have gone on the first question, and we need to get past question 6.

Yr ydym yn monitro'r gwasanaeth yn ofalus. Cefais gyfarfod rhanbarthol defnyddiol iawn ym Mronllys ychydig wythnosau'n ôl gyda'r holl ddarparwyr y tu allan i oriau drwy'r bwrdd iechyd lleol. Gobeithiaf gael yr un math o gyfarfod yn y De-ddwyrain ac yn y Gogledd er mwyn gallu ymgyswrtio â'r hyn i gael clywed y diweddaraf am yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn lleol. Fel y gwyddoch, mae Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru yn cynnal adolygiad eang i ddangos arferion effeithlon ac effeithiol a gwerth am arian. Ni allaf ddweud wrthyfch a fydd yn penderfynu rhoi barn am lefelau cyflogau i feddygon unigol sy'n gweithredu o fewn y system, ond ni chredaf y bydd hyn wedi'i gynnwys yn benodol yn ei chylch gwaith. Efallai y bydd y Swyddfa am roi sylwadau ar hyn yn yr adroddiad, ond ni chredaf fod hwn yn un o'r prif faterion y byddai'r Swyddfa wedi cael cais i'w hystyried o'r dechrau.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Cyn imi alw ar Val Lloyd, hysbysaf Aelodau fod pum munud wedi mynd heibio ar y cwestiwn cyntaf, a bod angen inni gyrraedd cwestiwn 6.

### **Glanweithdra mewn Ysbytai Cleanliness in Hospitals**

**Q2 Val Lloyd:** Will the Minister make a statement on cleanliness in hospitals? OAQ0298(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** All NHS trusts are required to implement the national standards of cleanliness, which were published in 2003. The standards provide a framework for cleaning services and apply whether services are provided in-house or by external contractors. The standards include cleaning plans, staffing, training programmes and cleaning responsibilities.

**Val Lloyd:** I am sure that you will share my concern that some of the wards in a hospital in Swansea were recently found to be below Assembly requirements. Would you assure me that hospital cleanliness is a priority and that you will continue to engage with trusts to ensure that Assembly standards are enforced and maintained?

**Brian Gibbons:** Certainly. There is no doubt

**C2 Val Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar lanweithdra mewn ysbytai? OAQ0298(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae gofyn i bob ymddiriedolaeth GIG weithredu'r safonau glendid cenedlaethol, a gyhoeddwyd yn 2003. Mae'r safonau'n darparu fframwaith ar gyfer gwasanaethau glanhau, ac maent yn gymwys p'un a ddarperir gwasanaethau yn fewnol ynteu gan gontractwyr allanol. Mae'r safonau'n cynnwys cynlluniau glanhau, staffio, rhaglenni hyfforddi a chyfrifoldebau glanhau.

**Val Lloyd:** Mae'n siŵr eich bod chi, fel finnau, yn pryderu am y darganfyddiad yn ddiweddar fod rhai wardiau mewn ysbyty yn Abertawe yn is na gofynion y Cynulliad. A wnewch chi roi sicrwydd imi fod glendid mewn ysbytai yn flaenoriaeth, ac y byddwch yn parhau i gysylltu ag ymddiriedolaethau i sicrhau bod safonau'r Cynulliad yn cael eu gorfodi a'u cynnal?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yn sicr. Mae'n ddiamau nad

that nothing undermines public confidence in the safety of a hospital more than problems with standards of cleanliness. If people come into a hospital and do not see standards of the highest calibre, that undermines their confidence. That is why one of the new healthcare standards makes specific reference to cleanliness and hygiene standards in hospitals, and that will be externally audited by Healthcare Inspectorate Wales. You will also know that community health councils regularly carry out inspections of our hospitals, and I would suggest that, if people are concerned, they should contact their community health council.

**Janet Davies:** One issue relating to the cleanliness of hospitals is the lack of communication between different units within an NHS trust, for example, between cleaning units and maintenance units or those who are spending money on floor coverings and so on. This causes severe problems with cleaning. What are you doing to address this lack of communication?

**Brian Gibbons:** I would not have said that that was the most substantial problem. I think that the most substantial problem relates to good criteria for the cleaning contract, and then ensuring that the contract is complied with. I am particularly concerned to ensure that the chief nurse in any clinical area is clearly responsible for what happens in that area. I would agree that there have been difficulties in the past, in that lines of communication have not been as good as they should be at that level. In other words, cleaners or contractors may have felt answerable to their employers, rather than to the senior nurse in charge of a clinical area. Hopefully, that situation will be clarified further in the not-too-distant future.

**David Melding:** In the capital programme that you have recently announced, will you ensure that cleaning strategies are at the heart of those projects, because well-designed buildings are easier to keep clean?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yes. There is a design element to it, and clearly we have to design these hospitals from the point of view of making cleanliness and hygiene easy to

oes dim yn tanseilio hyder y cyhoedd mewn diogelwch ysbyty yn fwy na phroblemau gyda safonau glendid. Os daw pobl i ysbyty a gweld safonau nad ydynt o'r radd flaenaf, mae hynny'n tanseilio eu hyder. Dyna pam mae un o'r safonau gofal iechyd newydd yn cyfeirio'n benodol at safonau glendid a hylendid mewn ysbytai, a chaiff y rheini eu harchwilio'n allanol gan Arolygiaeth Gofal Iechyd Cymru. Byddwch hefyd yn gwybod bod cynghorau iechyd cymuned yn gwneud arolygiadau o'n hysbytai yn rheolaidd, a byddwn yn awgrymu, os yw pobl yn pryderu, y dylent gysylltu â'u cyngor iechyd cymuned.

**Janet Davies:** Un broblem sy'n gysylltiedig â glendid mewn ysbytai yw'r diffyg cyfathrebu rhwng y gwahanol unedau o fewn ymddiriedolaethau GIG, er enghraifft, rhwng unedau glanhau ac unedau cynnal a chadw, neu'r rheini sy'n gwario arian ar ddeunydd gorchuddio lloriau, ac ati. Mae hyn yn achosi problemau difrifol wrth lanhau. Beth ydych chi'n ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â'r diffyg cyfathrebu hwn?

**Brian Gibbons:** Ni fyddwn wedi dweud mai honno oedd y broblem fwyaf. Credaf fod y broblem fwyaf yn ymwneud â meini prawf da ar gyfer y contract glanhau, ac yna sicrhau cydymffurfio â'r contract. Yr wyf yn awyddus iawn i sicrhau bod y brif nyrs mewn unrhyw ran glinigol yn amlwg yn gyfrifol am yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn y rhan honno. Byddwn yn cytuno bod anawsterau wedi digwydd yn y gorffennol, gan nad yw llinellau cyfathrebu wedi bod cystal ag y dylent ar y lefel honno. Hynny yw, efallai fod glanhawyr neu gontractwyr wedi teimlo eu bod yn atebol i'w cyflogwyr, yn hytrach nag i'r uwch nyrs sy'n gyfrifol am adran glinigol. Gobeithio y caiff y sefyllfa honno ei hegluro ymhellach yn y dyfodol agos.

**David Melding:** Yn y rhaglen gyfalaf a gyhoeddwyd gennych yn ddiweddar, a wnewch sicrhau bod strategaethau glanhau wrth wraidd y prosiectau hynny, oherwydd bod adeiladau sydd wedi eu dylunio'n dda yn haws i'w cadw'n lân?

**Brian Gibbons:** Gwnaf. Mae elfen ddylunio yn y rhaglen, ac yn amlwg rhaid inni ddylunio'r ysbytai hyn o safbwynt sicrhau bod safonau glendid a hylendid yn hawdd eu cynnal. Mae

maintain. That is important. However, I would go back to my earlier point, that even more important than that are good standards, good compliance and good monitoring.

hynny'n bwysig. Fodd bynnag, dychwelaf at y pwynt a wneuthum yn gynharach, sef mai'r hyn sydd hyd yn oed yn bwysicach na hynny yw safonau da, cydymffurfio da a monitro da.

### Apwyntiadau Cleifion Allanol Out-patient Appointments

**Q3 Jonathan Morgan:** How many patients waited six months or more for an out-patient appointment in 1997 and how many are waiting today? OAQ0346(HSS)

**C3 Jonathan Morgan:** Faint o gleifion a oedd yn disgwyl am chwe mis neu ragor cyn cael apwyntiad claf allanol ym 1997, a faint sydd yn disgwyl heddiw? OAQ0346(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** As of May 2005 to date, there were 63,943 patients waiting over six months for an out-patient appointment, a reduction of 10,197 on the previous year. This compares with 5,956 patients waiting over six months at the end of March 1997.

**Brian Gibbons:** O Fai 2005 hyd heddiw, mae 63,943 o gleifion wedi bod yn aros dros chwe mis am apwyntiad claf allanol, gostyngiad o 10,197 ers y flwyddyn flaenorol. Mae hyn yn cymharu â 5,956 o gleifion yn aros dros chwe mis ar ddiwedd Mawrth 1997.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I am grateful for the figures, but that demonstrates the real state of affairs in the NHS at the moment. More and more people are expected to wait many months, if not years, for, in many cases, basic and simple procedures. The waiting list figures announced today indicate an increase of some 5,000 on the global waiting list figure. The number has gone from 284,000 to roughly 290,000. Do you accept that this is an unacceptable position for the Welsh NHS to be in, and do you accept responsibility for the fact that, three months into the present final year, you have only just managed to negotiate the contracts to deal with those who are being given a second offer of treatment?

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y ffigurau, ond mae hynny'n dangos sefyllfa wirioneddol y GIG ar hyn o bryd. Mae disgwyl i fwy a mwy o bobl aros am fisoedd lawer, os nad am flynyddoedd, i gael triniaeth sylfaenol a syml mewn rhai achosion. Mae'r ffigurau rhestrau aros a gyhoeddwyd heddiw yn dangos cynnydd o ryw 5,000 yn y rhestr aros gyfan. Mae'r ffigur wedi cynyddu o 284,000 i tua 290,000. A ydych yn derbyn bod hyn yn sefyllfa annerbyniol i GIG Cymru, ac a dderbyniwch y cyfrifoldeb am y ffaith mai dim ond newydd lwyddo i negodi'r contractau yr ydych i ddelio â'r rheiny sy'n cael ail gynnig triniaeth, dri mis ar ôl i'r flwyddyn derfynol bresennol ddechrau?

**Brian Gibbons:** There were two or three questions there. While there are more patients on the out-patient waiting list, I do not accept your general thesis, which is that more and more people are waiting. I am sure that you know that the number of people waiting for in-patient treatment is less than it was when the Conservatives left office in 1997. The number has gone from 67,609 in March 1997—I can see Ieuan Wyn checking his papers—compared to 65,771 currently. Therefore, there is progress. It is also encouraging that if we look at the early part of the financial year, we will see that there has been no increase in the number of out-patients waiting, which is quite remarkable compared with previously, when there always was a bounce in the months of April, May,

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr oedd dau neu dri chwestiwn gennyh. Er bod mwy o gleifion ar y rhestr aros o gleifion allanol, ni dderbyniaf eich gosodiad cyffredinol, sef bod mwy a mwy o bobl yn aros. Mae'n siŵr eich bod yn gwybod bod nifer y bobl sy'n aros am driniaeth fel cleifion mewnol yn llai nag ydoedd pan adawodd y Ceidwadwyr y Llywodraeth yn 1997. Mae'r nifer wedi gostwng o 67,609, ym mis Mawrth 1997—gallaf weld Ieuan Wyn yn edrych ar ei bapurau—i 65,771 ar hyn o bryd. Felly, mae yna gynydd. Mae hefyd yn galonogol os edrychwn ar ran gyntaf y flwyddyn ariannol, lle gwelwn na fu unrhyw gynydd yn nifer y cleifion allanol sy'n aros. Mae hynny'n ddiogn rhyfeddol o'i gymharu â'r sefyllfa flaenorol, lle byddai cynnydd bob amser ym mis Ebrill, Mai, Mehefin a Gorffennaf. Ni ddigwyddodd hynny

June, and July. That has not happened this year, which is a clear sign that the Assembly Government is getting to grips with this problem.

2.10 p.m.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I am always grateful to the Minister for helping me with my research—he is good at that.

**Brian Gibbons:** I know. The *Western Mail* does not have an answer.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** However, the figures that I will quote do not come from the *Western Mail*, but rather from the figures that he publishes and that his Government has published since 1999. Let us go back to the question, Minister. The question put to you was not about in-patients, but out-patients, and the difference in the numbers waiting between 1997, which you quite rightly quoted at 5,956, and the current figure of 63,943. That is a massive difference in the number of out-patients waiting over six months. Let me remind you also that, in 1997, the Assembly was not in being. However, in 1999, the figure was 21,828, which means that there has been a 42,000 increase since that time. Does this not show that your looking after the health service has been nothing but an unmitigated disaster?

**Brian Gibbons:** I would hand it to you, Ieuan Wyn, for seeing that the glass is empty, or half empty at least. If you also care to look at the statistics, you will see that, in terms of the number of patients waiting less than six months—in other words, real patients' waiting time—there were 96,300 waiting, while the total is now 160,000. In other words, the number of patients being seen and treated within the six-month period in Wales has gone up quite dramatically, reflecting the increased number of patients who are being referred to the NHS, being treated, and getting a first-class service.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** It is all very well for you to talk about these marginal differences that have happened, Minister, but I am talking about the scale of the problem that you face. Can you tell me now, with your hand on your

eleni, sy'n arwydd clir bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn mynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr wyf bob amser yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am fy helpu gyda'm hymchwil—mae'n gwneud hynny'n dda.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mi wn. Nid oes gan y *Western Mail* ateb.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Fodd bynnag, nid o'r *Western Mail* y daw'r ffigurau a ddyfynnaf. Yn hytrach, ffigurau ydynt a gyhoeddir ganddo ef ac sydd wedi eu cyhoeddi gan ei Lywodraeth ef er 1999. Gadewch inni ddychwelyd at y cwestiwn, Weinidog. Gofynnwyd gwestiwn ichi ynglŷn â chleifion allanol, nid cleifion mewnlol, a'r gwahaniaeth yn y nifer ar y rhestr aros rhwng 1997, y ddyfynnwyd yn gywir gennych fel 5,956, a'r ffigur presennol o 63,943. Mae hynny'n wahaniaeth enfawr yn nifer y cleifion allanol sy'n aros dros chwe mis. Gadewch imi eich atgoffa hefyd nad oedd y Cynulliad yn bodoli yn 1997. Fodd bynnag, yn 1999, yr oedd y ffigur yn 21,828, sy'n golygu bod cynnydd o 42,000 ers hynny. Onid yw hyn yn dangos bod y ffordd yr ydych wedi gofalu am y gwasanaeth iechyd yn ddim llai na thrychineb llwyr?

**Brian Gibbons:** Bron na fyddwn yn eich canmol, Ieuan Wyn, am weld bod y gwydr yn wag, neu'n hanner gwag o leiaf. Os hoffech edrych ar yr ystadegau hefyd, fe welwch, o ran nifer y cleifion sy'n aros llai na chwe mis—hynny yw, amser aros cleifion gwirioneddol—yr oedd 96,300 o gleifion yn aros, a'r cyfanswm yn awr yw 160,000. Mewn geiriau eraill, mae nifer y cleifion sy'n cael eu gweld ac sy'n cael triniaeth o fewn y cyfnod chwe mis yng Nghymru wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol. Ac mae hynny'n adlewyrchu'r cynnydd yn nifer y cleifion sy'n cael eu cyfeirio at y GIG, sy'n cael triniaeth, ac sy'n cael gwasanaeth o'r radd flaenaf.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Mae'n ddigon hawdd ichi sôn am y mân wahaniaethau hyn sydd wedi digwydd, Weinidog, ond yr wyf fi'n sôn am faint y broblem sy'n eich wynebu. A allwch ddweud wrthyf yn awr, a'ch llaw ar eich calon,



heart, when will Wales again see the figures that you inherited in 1997 or 1999? It will take you years to go back to where you started from. It is not about making an improvement on the position in 1997, but about getting back to where we were. Do you not recognise that that is the scale of your problem?

**Brian Gibbons:** I would not think that 64,000 is a marginal improvement. I would think that, in anyone's book, except possibly yours, Ieuan Wyn, it is a dramatic improvement. I am sure that you are also aware of the fact, but probably choose not to highlight, that something like 70 per cent to 75 per cent of patients on out-patient waiting lists are seen within six months. It is this, and not talking about the extremes of waiting, that reflects the reality.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** I note from the *Western Mail* that you exude confidence. However, do you show the same degree of confidence about those people who are waiting more than twelve months for out-patient treatment? Over the last month alone, that figure has increased by just under 14 per cent. For those people in the worst situation, who are waiting for lengthy periods of time, that figure is now going up again. Surely, you cannot be as confident as you may have appeared in the *Western Mail* about these matters?

**Brian Gibbons:** There are lies, damned lies, and statistics. The percentage to which Mike refers is a percentage increase on a very small handful of patients. Therefore, while the percentage figure looks pretty horrific, the absolute numbers are quite small, and we remain confident of achieving our targets for the end of the next financial year.

**Michael German:** It may be a small number, but it amounts to 1,173 people waiting over 12 months—that is not small. There has been an increase of 14 per cent since last month. You must add to that the second-offer scheme, which is how you tried to ensure that people waiting over 18 months do not appear on waiting lists. The number tackled at that level is about 450, but a huge number of

pryd y bydd Cymru'n gweld y ffigurau a etifeddwyd gennych yn 1997 neu 1999 unwaith yn rhagor? Bydd yn cymryd blynyddoedd ichi ddychwelyd i'r man cychwyn hwnnw. Nid gwella'r sefyllfa yn 1997a olygir, ond dychwelyd i'r sefyllfa honno. Onid ydych yn cydnabod mai dyna yw maint eich problem?

**Brian Gibbons:** Ni fyddwn yn credu mai gwelliant bach yw 64,000. Byddwn yn credu bod unrhyw un o'r farn, ac eithrio chi, efallai, Ieuan Wyn, ei fod yn welliant sylweddol. Mae'n siŵr eich bod hefyd yn ymwybodol o'r ffaith fod rhwng 70 a 75 y cant o gleifion ar restrau aros cleifion allanol yn cael eu gweld cyn pen chwe mis, ffaith yr ydych fwy na thebyg yn dewis peidio â thynnu sylw at. Hyn sy'n adlewyrchu'r realiti, nid sôn am eithafion rhestrau aros.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Sylwaf eich bod yn siarad yn llawn hyder yn y *Western Mail*. Fodd bynnag, a ydych yn dangos yr un faint o hyder am y bobl hynny sy'n aros mwy na deuddeg mis am driniaeth fel cleifion allanol? Dros y mis diwethaf yn unig, mae'r ffigur hwnnw wedi cynyddu ychydig yn llai na 14 y cant. I'r rheini yn y sefyllfa waethaf sy'n aros am gyfnodau maith, mae'r ffigur hwnnw'n cynyddu unwaith eto. Mae'n amheus gennyf a allwch fod mor hyderus ag yr oeddech yn ymddangos yn y *Western Mail* ynglŷn â'r materion hyn.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae yna gelwydd, celwydd noeth, ac ystadegau. Mae'r ganran y cyfeiria Mike ati yn gynydd canrannol mewn nifer fach iawn o gleifion. Felly, er bod y ffigur canran yn ymddangos yn ddigon brawychus, mae'r niferoedd gwirioneddol yn ddigon bach, ac yr dal yn hyderus y byddwn yn cyrraedd ein targedau ar gyfer diwedd y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf.

**Michael German:** Efallai fod y nifer yn fach, ond mae'n gyfanswm o 1,173 o bobl sy'n aros dros 12 mis—nid nifer fach yw hwnnw. Bu cynnydd o 14 y cant ers y mis diwethaf. Rhaid ichi ychwanegu cynllun yr ail gynnig at hynny, sef y modd yr ydych wedi ceisio sicrhau na fydd pobl sy'n aros dros 18 mis yn ymddangos ar restrau aros. Mae'r nifer yr eir i'r afael â hi ar y lefel honno tua 450, ond mae nifer fawr iawn o

people do not want to leave Wales for treatment because they would not have any support mechanisms. Can you honestly say, with your hand on your heart, that the number of people who are waiting, and the increase from last month to this month, is just a blip on the screen, that next month it will be different, and that that number of people will not be waiting over 12 months?

**Brian Gibbons:** Again, I do not know where you are getting your figures from in relation to the second-offer scheme. My understanding is that around 18,000 to 19,000 people were offered treatment under the second-offer scheme, and approximately 40 to 50 per cent of the people who were offered it took it up. Of those people, the vast majority were treated in-house here in Wales. I do not recognise the statistics that you are presenting.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** You referred earlier to the glass being half empty; to say that it is half empty would be overstating the case, would it not? Under your stewardship, and that of the Labour Party, we have seen a 974 per cent increase in the out-patient waiting list, and part of the reason for that increase is your failure to put in place the contractual arrangements for the second-offer guarantee scheme on your watch. Is this not a very serious issue, and is it not time that you apologised for it?

**Brian Gibbons:** If you cared to look at the figures, you would see that the second-offer scheme is actually in operation, and that a significant number of patients have been treated under that scheme; in fact, more patients have probably been treated under the second-offer scheme by this point in the financial year compared to this time last year. Obviously, as all the contracts are put in place—and my understanding is that they are all in place, even in some hospitals that had not consistently signed up to the second-offer scheme last year—the number of people going through the system will be sufficient to allow us to deliver our targets for this time next year.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Question 4, OAQ0324(HSS), has been withdrawn.

bobl nad ydynt am adael Cymru i gael triniaeth gan na fyddai ganddynt unrhyw ddulliau cynnal. A allwch ddweud yn onest, a'ch llaw ar eich calon, mai dim ond digwyddiad anarferol yw nifer y bobl sy'n aros, a'r cynnydd o'i gymharu â'r mis diwethaf, y bydd y mis nesaf yn wahanol, ac na fydd y nifer hwnnw o bobl yn aros mwy na 12 mis?

**Brian Gibbons:** Unwaith eto, ni wn o ble y cewch eich ffigurau am gynllun yr ail gynnig. Deallaf fod rhwng 18,000 a 19,000 o bobl wedi cael cynnig triniaeth o dan gynllun yr ail gynnig, a bod rhwng 40 a 50 y cant o'r bobl a gafodd y cynnig wedi manteisio arno. O'r bobl hynny, cafodd y mwyafrif helaeth driniaeth yma yng Nghymru. Nid wyf yn adnabod yr ystadegau yr ydych yn eu cyflwyno.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Yr oeddech yn cyfeirio'n gynharach at wydr hanner gwag; onid yw dweud ei fod yn hanner gwag yn or-ddweud? O dan eich stiwardiaeth chi, a'r Blaid Lafur, yr ydym wedi gweld cynnydd o 974 y cant yn y rhestr aros i gleifion allanol, a rhan o'r rheswm dros y cynnydd hwnnw yw eich methiant i roi'r trefniadau cytundebol ar gyfer y cynllun gwarant ail gynnig ar waith yn ystod eich cyfnod chi. Onid yw hyn yn fater difrifol iawn, ac onid yw'n bryd ichi ymddiheuro am hynny?

**Brian Gibbons:** Os hoffech edrych ar y ffigurau, fe welwch fod cynllun yr ail gynnig ar waith mewn gwirionedd, a bod nifer fawr o gleifion wedi cael triniaeth o dan y cynllun hwnnw. Yn wir, mae'n bosibl bod mwy o gleifion wedi cael triniaeth o dan gynllun yr ail gynnig erbyn yr adeg hon yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol o'u cymharu â'r adeg hon y llynedd. Mae'n amlwg, wrth i'r holl gcontractau gael eu rhoi ar waith—a deallaf fod pob un ohonynt ar waith, hyd yn oed mewn rhai ysbytai nad oeddent wedi ymrwymo'n gyson i gynllun yr ail gynnig y llynedd—bydd nifer y bobl a fydd yn mynd drwy'r system yn ddigon i'n galluogi i gyrraedd ein targedau erbyn yr amser hwn y flwyddyn nesaf.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 4, OAQ0324(HSS), yn ôl.

**Darpariaeth Ambiwylans yn y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin**  
**Ambulance Cover in Mid and West Wales**

**Q5 Lisa Francis:** Will the Minister make a statement on any considerations he has given regarding 24-hour ambulance cover in Mid and West Wales? OAQ0320(HSS)

**C5 Lisa Francis:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar unrhyw ystyriaeth y mae wedi'i rhoi i ddarpariaeth ambiwlans 24-awr yng Nghanolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru? OAQ0320(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** As Lisa knows, it is for Health Commission Wales, as the commissioner of emergency ambulance services, and the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust, to determine how emergency ambulance services are delivered across Wales, including the Mid and West Wales region, as long as they are in line with the targets set by the Welsh Assembly Government.

**Brian Gibbons:** Fel y gŵyr Lisa, cyfrifoldeb Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru, fel y comisiynydd gwasanaethau ambiwlans brys, ac Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwylans Cymru yw penderfynu sut y caiff gwasanaethau ambiwlans brys eu darparu ledled Cymru, gan gynnwys rhanbarth y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin, cyhyd â'u bod yn cydymffurfio â'r targedau a osodir gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

**Lisa Francis:** When I asked the First Minister two months ago about ambulance response times in Mid and West Wales, he told me that

**Lisa Francis:** Pan holais y Prif Weinidog ddau fis yn ôl ynglŷn ag amseroedd ymateb y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin, dywedodd wrthyf

'The key point in terms of providing a better service for heart attack patients may not be in having 24-hour cover but in training all of the ambulance staff to administer thrombolytic drugs...because that saves 25 minutes and could make the difference between life and death'.

Efallai nad darparu gwasanaeth 24 awr yw'r prif bwynt o ran darparu gwell gwasanaeth i gleifion sy'n cael trawiad ar y galon, ond yn hytrach hyfforddi'r holl staff ambiwlans i roi cyffuriau thrombolytig...oherwydd mae hynny'n arbed 25 munud a gallai wneud y gwahaniaeth rhwng bywyd a marwolaeth.

Written answers to me have subsequently confirmed that the thrombolytic treatment that used to be—

Yn dilyn hynny mae atebion ysgrifenedig yr wyf wedi eu cael wedi cadarnhau bod triniaeth thrombolytig a oedd yn arfer bod—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. We need a question.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae angen cwestiwn arnom.

**Lisa Francis:** Thrombolytic training for paramedics is, thus far, a mere aspiration. Those kinds of drugs are no longer stocked at many community hospitals. When do you anticipate that this training will be a reality, Minister, and what are the people of Mid and West Wales, who live in areas where there is no 24-hour ambulance cover, supposed to do in the meantime?

**Lisa Francis:** Hyd yma, dyhead yn unig yw hyfforddiant thrombolytig i barafeddygon. Ni chaiff y mathau hynny o gyffuriau eu cadw mewn llawer ysbyty cymuned mwyach. Pryd yr ydych yn rhag-weld y daw'r hyfforddiant hwn yn realiti, Weinidog, a beth a ddisgwylir i bobl y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin, sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd lle nad oes gwasanaeth ambiwlans 24 awr, ei wneud yn y cyfamser?

**Brian Gibbons:** Every paramedic in Mid and West Wales has been trained in thrombolytic therapy treatment. You said that no-one had been trained, but the figure for Mid and West

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae pob parafeddyg yn y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin wedi cael hyfforddiant mewn triniaeth therapi thrombolytig. Yr oeddech yn dweud nad oes neb wedi cael

Wales is 100 per cent, and 40 to 50 patients have been successfully treated by trained paramedics delivering thrombolytic treatment. The basic supposition of your thesis, therefore, is, factually, 100 per cent untrue.

**Kirsty Williams:** Due to the paucity of ambulance vehicles in Brecon and Radnorshire, last week, the ambulance crew at Ystradgynlais had to respond to a 999 call in Glasbury-on-Wye, some 55 miles away. That is the equivalent of a Cardiff ambulance responding to a call in Llanelli. It would not be acceptable to people in Llanelli, so why is it acceptable for people in my constituency?

**Brian Gibbons:** No-one is saying that it is acceptable to people in your constituency. Clearly, we are aware that the overall performance level of the ambulance trust in Powys, and some other parts of Wales, is not acceptable and is well below the target that we expect the ambulance service to reach. It is on that basis that the ambulance service has agreed to make use of the services of Staffordshire Ambulance Service NHS Trust to review the performance of ambulance services in Wales in order to deliver the type of improvements that you, your constituents and I, as the Minister, reasonably expect.

hyfforddiant, ond mae'r ffigur ar gyfer y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin yn 100 y cant, ac mae rhwng 40 a 50 o gleifion wedi cael eu trin yn llwyddiannus gan barafeddygon sy'n rhoi triniaeth thrombolytic. Mae tybiaeth sylfaenol eich gosodiad, felly, yn gwbl anghywir.

**Kirsty Williams:** Oherwydd prinder cerbydau ambiwlans ym Mrycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed, yr wythnos diwethaf, bu'n rhaid i griw ambiwlans Ystradgynlais ymateb i alwad 999 yn y Clas ar Wy, ryw 55 milltir i ffwrdd. Mae hynny'n gyfystyr ag ambiwlans o Gaerdydd yn ymateb i alwad yn Llanelli. Ni fyddai'n dderbyniol i bobl yn Llanelli, felly, pam mae'n dderbyniol i bobl yn fy etholaeth i?

**Brian Gibbons:** Nid oes neb yn dweud ei bod yn dderbyniol i bobl yn eich etholaeth chi. Yn amlwg, yr ydym yn ymwybodol nad yw perfformiad cyffredinol yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans ym Mhowys, a rhai rhannau eraill o Gymru, yn dderbyniol a'i fod lawer yn is na'r targed yr ydym yn disgwyl i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans ei gyrraedd. Ar y sail honno y mae'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans wedi cytuno i ddefnyddio gwasanaethau Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaeth Ambiwllans Swydd Stafford i adolygu perfformiad gwasanaethau ambiwlans yng Nghymru er mwyn sicrhau'r math o welliannau yr ydych chi, eich etholwyr a minnau, fel y Gweinidog, yn rhesymol yn eu disgwyl.

2.20 p.m.

### **Gwasanaethau Damweiniau ac Achosion Brys Accident and Emergency Services**

**Q6 Brynle Williams:** Will the Minister make a statement on accident and emergency services in Wales? OAQ0341(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** The Welsh Assembly Government is committed to reducing the pressure on accident and emergency departments, ensuring that all patients can access timely and appropriate services. At present, nearly nine out of 10 patients in Wales are admitted, transferred, or discharged from the accident and emergency department within the four-hour target.

**Brynle Williams:** Thank you for that answer, Minister, but there is nothing like personal

**C6 Brynle Williams:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar wasanaethau damweiniau ac achosion brys yng Nghymru? OAQ0341(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ymrwmo i leihau'r pwysau ar adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys, gan sicrhau y gall pob claf gael gwasanaethau amserol a phriodol. Ar hyn o bryd, caiff bron i naw o bob 10 claf yng Nghymru eu derbyn, eu trosglwyddo neu eu rhyddhau o'r adran damweiniau ac achosion brys o fewn y targed o bedair awr.

**Brynle Williams:** Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog, ond nid oes dim byd tebyg i brofiad

experience. On 14 June, I was taken ill and went to the University Hospital of Wales. I was shocked first of all to see a sign advising that there would be a four-hour wait in the accident and emergency department, and then I was told after waiting for two hours that I had a possible six to eight-hour wait. This is only one example—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I ask for a question, please, Brynle.

**Brynle Williams:** Using your expertise in medicine and the associated consequences of restricted staff, do you feel that two doctors for the whole of Cardiff constitute acceptable accident and emergency cover? Just give me a ‘yes’ or ‘no’, please.

**Brian Gibbons:** Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust has accepted that the level of medical staffing in the accident and emergency department of that hospital is not adequate, and has given a commitment that it will increase the number of senior medical staff working in that department.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Do you agree that investment under Labour in new equipment, the modernisation and development of new hospitals in Wales, a new day-care centre and a clinical school in north-east Wales, are to be welcomed? I was also pleased to hear Ann Lloyd’s comments at the Audit Committee meeting last week that Ysbyty Gwynedd was one of the best performing hospitals in north Wales, if not the best.

**Brian Gibbons:** I would agree with that. North Wales accident and emergency units are consistently performing at 90 per cent plus. In one or two trusts, there has recently been a slight deterioration, and we are having discussions with those trusts to ensure that they improve their performances to the previously high standards.

**David Lloyd:** Beth yr ydych wedi’i wneud i weithredu argymhellion adroddiad gan Goleg Brenhinol y Nyrsys, a gyhoeddwyd ddeufis yn ôl, am yr angen i leihau baich gwaith nyrsys a’r straen ar nyrsus mewn adrannau damweiniau?

personol. Ar 14 Mehefin, fe’m trawyd yn wael ac euthum i Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru. Fe’m synnwyd yn gyntaf oll i weld arwydd yn dweud y byddai’n rhaid aros am bedair awr yn yr adran damweiniau ac achosion brys, ac yna ar ôl imi aros am ddwy awr, dywedwyd wrthyf y gallai fod angen imi aros am chwech i wyth awr. Dim ond un enghraifft yw hon—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Gofynnwch gwestiwn, Brynle, os gwelwch yn dda.

**Brynle Williams:** Gan ddefnyddio’ch arbenigedd mewn meddygaeth a’r canlyniadau sy’n gysylltiedig â nifer gyfyngedig o staff, a ydych yn teimlo bod dau feddyg i Gaerdydd gyfan yn ddarpariaeth dderbyniol ar gyfer damweiniau ac achosion brys? Dywedwch ‘ydwyf’ neu ‘nac ydwyf’, os gwelwch yn dda.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a’r Fro wedi derbyn nad yw lefel y staff meddygol yn yr adran damweiniau ac achosion brys yn yr ysbyty hwnnw yn ddigonol, ac mae wedi ymrwymo i gynyddu nifer y staff meddygol uwch sy’n gweithio yn yr adran honno.

**Denise Idris Jones:** A gytunwch fod buddsoddiad o dan Lafur mewn offer newydd, moderneiddio a datblygu ysbytai newydd yng Nghymru, canolfan gofal dydd newydd ac ysgol glinigol yn y Gogledd-ddwyrain i’w croesawu? Yr oeddwn hefyd yn falch o glywed sylwadau Ann Lloyd yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Archwilio yr wythnos diwethaf fod perfformiad Ysbyty Gwynedd gyda’r gorau ymhlith ysbytai’r Gogledd, os nad y gorau.

**Brian Gibbons:** Byddwn yn cytuno â hynny. Mae unedau damweiniau ac achosion brys y Gogledd yn gyson yn perfformio ar 90 y cant a mwy. Mewn un neu ddwy o ymddiriedolaethau, bu dirywiad bach yn ddiweddar, ac yr ydym yn trafod gyda’r ymddiriedolaethau hynny i sicrhau eu bod yn gwella’u perfformiad er mwyn cyrraedd eu safonau uchel blaenorol.

**David Lloyd:** What have you done to implement the recommendations of a report by the Royal College of Nursing, published two months ago, on the need to reduce the workload of nurses and the stress that they are under in accident units?

**Brian Gibbons:** We are proceeding with that in two ways. There is the work that is going on with the DECS project, which is looking at accident and emergency services, unscheduled care in primary care and the use of ambulance services as a whole. As well as that, we are having discussions with the ambulance service in terms of how it responds to emergency calls and unscheduled care. Hopefully, that will also reduce pressures on accident and emergency departments.

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr ydym yn symud ymlaen ar hynny mewn dwy ffordd. Mae'r gwaith ar brosiect DECS yn mynd rhagddo, sy'n edrych ar wasanaethau damweiniau ac achosion brys, gofal heb ei drefnu yn y sector gofal sylfaenol, a defnyddio gwasanaethau ambiwlans yn ei gyfanrwydd. Yn ogystal â hynny, yr ydym yn trafod gyda'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans sut y mae'n ymateb i alwadau brys a gofal heb ei drefnu. Gobeithio y bydd hynny hefyd yn lleihau'r pwysau ar adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys.

### **Risgiau Tyrau Telathrebu i Iechyd Health Risks from Telecommunications Towers**

**Q7 Carl Sargeant:** Will the Minister make a statement on health risks from telecommunications towers? OAQ0323(HSS)

**C7 Carl Sargeant:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar risgiau tyrau telathrebu i iechyd? OAQ0323(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** The Health Protection Agency advises the Welsh Assembly Government on the possible health implications of exposure to electromagnetic fields, including the radio waves that are associated with telecommunications. While it is not possible to say with absolute clarity, the evidence to date has not shown a link between this technology and ill health.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae'r Asiantaeth Diogelu Iechyd yn cynghori Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar y goblygiadau posibl i iechyd o fod yn agored i feysydd electromagnetig, gan gynnwys y tonnau radio sy'n gysylltiedig â thelathrebu. Er nad oes modd dweud i sicrwydd, nid yw'r dystiolaeth hyd yma wedi dangos cysylltiad rhwng y dechnoleg hon a salwch.

**Carl Sargeant:** Given the immense numbers of mobile phones, even small adverse effects on health could give rise to major public health concerns. The World Health Organisation has come to a similar conclusion to you, that there have been no actual findings as yet. However, there is a clear gap in the research behind telecommunication towers.

**Carl Sargeant:** O gofio'r niferoedd mawr o ffonau symudol, gallai hyd yn oed fân effeithiau niweidiol ar iechyd arwain at bryderon mawr o ran iechyd y cyhoedd. Mae Sefydliad Iechyd y Byd wedi dod i gasgliad tebyg i chithau, sef na chafwyd unrhyw ddarganfyddiadau gwirioneddol hyd yma. Fodd bynnag, mae bwlch amlwg yn y gwaith ymchwil ar dyrau telathrebu.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I ask for a question, please, Carl.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Gofynnaf am gwestiwn, Carl, os gwelwch yn dda.

**Carl Sargeant:** The people of Wepre and Ewloe are concerned about the health implications of telephone masts. Do you agree that we should not be putting up telephone masts anywhere where there could be a potential health risk?

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae pobl Gwepre ac Ewlo yn pryderu am oblygiadau'r mastiau ffôn i iechyd. A ydych yn cytuno na ddylem osod mastiau ffôn mewn unrhyw fan lle y gallent fod yn risg posib i iechyd?

**Brian Gibbons:** There is undoubtedly concern on this matter, there are a number of issues that need to be clarified, and research is ongoing on that. However, it is important

**Brian Gibbons:** Yn ddiau mae pryder ynglŷn â'r mater hwn, mae nifer o faterion yn codi y mae angen eglurhad yn eu cylch, ac mae gwaith ymchwil yn mynd rhagddo ar hynny. Fodd

to realise that the risk to individuals is probably greater from using mobile phones than from the masts. In assessing the risks in relation to masts, people need to consider whether the risk is proportionate, if they are using mobile phones. In the auditing of the risks from radio frequency signals, the signal from your mobile phone and the associated heat is probably a greater risk to your health than the transmitting mast.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** You admit that there is a risk. Your argument seems to be that there is a greater risk from mobile phones, but that there is a risk in relation to Tetra masts. Will you therefore accept that locating a Tetra mast next to a primary school, as happened in Haverfordwest, is totally irresponsible?

**Brian Gibbons:** I said that if there is a risk, it is likely that there would be a greater risk from a mobile phone than from the mast, so as to give people a sense of proportion about whatever risk exists. If people regard the use of mobile phones as an acceptable and proportional risk, the risk from the masts must be viewed in that context. I think that there is currently no evidence that Tetra masts pose a health hazard. However, following the Stewart review, some questions were raised and research is under way into those, in a number of areas, to see whether the potential risks that the Stewart report raised are verified in practice. However, the evidence at the moment is that that verification does not exist.

bynag, mae'n bwysig deall bod defnyddio ffonau symudol yn debygol o fod yn fwy o risg i unigolion na'r mastiau. Wrth asesu'r risgiau mewn cysylltiad â mastiau, mae angen i bobl ystyried a yw'r risg yn gymesur, os ydynt yn defnyddio ffonau symudol. Wrth archwilio'r risgiau o signalau amledd radio, mae'n debyg bod y signal o'ch ffôn symudol a'r gwres sy'n gysylltiedig â hynny yn fwy o risg i'ch iechyd na'r mast trawsyrru.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr ydych yn cyfaddef bod yna risg. Ymddengys mai'ch dadl chi yw bod mwy o risg yn gysylltiedig â ffonau symudol ond bod yna risg o ran mastiau Tetra. Felly, a ydych yn derbyn bod gosod mast Tetra wrth ymyl ysgol gynradd, fel y digwyddodd yn Hwlfordd, yn hollol anghyfrifol?

**Brian Gibbons:** Dywedais, os oes risg, ei bod yn debygol y byddai mwy o risg yn gysylltiedig â ffôn symudol na'r mast, er mwyn i rhoi i bobl syniad o gydbwysedd am unrhyw risg sy'n bodoli. Os cred pobl fod defnyddio ffonau symudol yn dderbyniol, a'r risg yn gymesur, rhaid ystyried y risg sy'n gysylltiedig â'r mastiau yn y cyd-destun hwnnw. Ni chredaf fod unrhyw dystiolaeth ar hyn o bryd fod mastiau Tetra yn peryglu iechyd. Fodd bynnag, yn dilyn adolygiad Stewart, codwyd rhai cwestiynau ac mae ymchwil yn cael ei gwneud, mewn llawer ardal, i weld a yw'r risgiau posibl a godwyd yn adroddiad Stewart yn cael eu cadarnhau mewn gwirionedd. Fodd bynnag, yn ôl y dystiolaeth sydd ar gael ar hyn o bryd, nid yw hynny'n cael ei gadarnhau.

### Ysbytai Cymunedol Community Hospitals

**Q8 Mick Bates:** What is the Assembly Government doing to ensure that community hospitals are put to effective use? OAQ0307(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** The role and use of community hospitals has been considered in the preparation of Wanless local action plans, and health, social care and wellbeing strategies, by all local health communities across Wales. Community hospitals form the background of service commissioning for health and social care in many communities

**C8 Mick Bates:** Beth y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod ysbytai cymunedol yn cael eu defnyddio'n effeithiol? OAQ0307(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Ystyriwyd rôl ysbytai cymunedol a'r defnydd a wneir ohonynt wrth baratoi cynlluniau gweithredu lleol Wanless, a strategaethau iechyd, gofal cymdeithasol a lles, gan bob cymuned iechyd leol ledled Cymru. Ysbytai cymunedol yw cefndir comisiynu gwasanaethau ar gyfer iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol mewn llawer cymuned yng

in Wales.

**Mick Bates:** I take it from that that you are a keen supporter of the continued existence of community hospitals. Do you agree that delivering nursing care for the elderly is a realistic and viable option for much of the unused space in our community hospitals, such as the one in my constituency at Machynlleth? What support can you offer to encourage the co-ordination of health and social care to provide services on the same site as our community hospitals?

**Brian Gibbons:** There is no doubt from the Wanless report, and many other reviews, including the national audit office report, that we are not making best use of our community hospital stock. Equally, you are correct in saying that the failure to properly develop an intermediate tier of care in Wales has been a deficiency. I would also agree that using community hospitals is one of the ways in which the failure to achieve an intermediate tier of care could be addressed. It is important that we proceed on the basis of the services that are being provided and the needs of local communities. The community hospitals must be fit for purpose, and address local needs in the most effective way, in terms of quality and value for money.

**Elin Jones:** Mae eich ateb wedi fy nghalonogi yn fawr. Caewyd ysbyty Aberaeron, sydd yn fy etholaeth, bum mlynedd yn ôl gan eich Llywodraeth, gyda'r addewid i fuddsoddi mewn canolfan iechyd newydd. Mae'r arian wedi ei glustnodi ar gyfer y gwaith ond, hyd yn hyn, nid yw'r gwaith adeiladu wedi dechrau. A allwch roi dyddiad i mi heddiw o ran pryd fydd y gwaith o adeiladu canolfan iechyd newydd Aberaeron yn cychwyn?

**Brian Gibbons:** I cannot give you a date, but the expectation is that the new facility at Aberaeron will go ahead because it is an imaginative and innovative project. If it develops according to the plans that I have seen for the facility, it will be showing the way in terms of the delivery of healthcare and I hope that other communities will be able to learn from that. However, I will check on the specific date and drop you a line on that.

Nghymru.

**Mick Bates:** Deallaf o hynny eich bod yn cefnogi'n frwd barhad ysbytai cymunedol. A gytunwch fod darparu gofal nyrsio i'r henoed yn ddewis realistig ac ymarferol ar gyfer llawer o'r manau yn ein hysbytai cymunedol nad ydynt yn cael eu defnyddio, megis yr un yn fy etholaeth i ym Machynlleth? Pa gymorth y gallwch ei gynnig i hybu cydlynu iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol er mwyn darparu gwasanaethau ar yr un safle â'n hysbytai cymunedol?

**Brian Gibbons:** Nid oes amheuaeth o ddarllen adroddiad Wanless, a llawer adolygiad arall, gan gynnwys adroddiad y swyddfa archwilio genedlaethol, nad ydym yn methu gwneud y defnydd gorau o'n hysbytai cymunedol. Yn yr un modd, yr ydych yn gywir i ddweud bod y methiant i fynd ati i ddatblygu haen ganolradd o ofal yng Nghymru yn wendid. Cytunaf hefyd fod defnyddio ysbytai cymunedol yn un o'r ffyrdd y gellid ymdrin â'r methiant i sefydlu haen ganolradd o ofal. Mae'n bwysig inni fynd ymlaen ar sail y gwasanaethau a ddarperir ac anghenion cymunedau lleol. Rhaid i ysbytai cymunedol fod yn addas at y diben a diwallu anghenion lleol yn y ffordd fwyaf effeithiol, o ran ansawdd a gwerth am arian.

**Elin Jones:** Your reply has encouraged me greatly. Aberaeron hospital, in my constituency, was closed five years ago by your Government, with a promise to invest in a new health centre. The funding is ring-fenced for the work, but, to date, construction has not started. Can you give me a date today as to when construction work will begin on the new health centre in Aberaeron?

**Brian Gibbons:** Ni allaf roi dyddiad ichi, ond y disgwyl yw y bydd y cyfleuster newydd yn Aberaeron yn cael ei adeiladu oherwydd mae'n brosiect arloesol a llawn dychymyg. Os bydd yn datblygu yn ôl y cynlluniau a welais ar gyfer y cyfleuster, bydd yn dangos y ffordd o ran darparu gofal iechyd, a gobeithio y bydd cymunedau eraill yn gallu dysgu o hynny. Fodd bynnag, byddaf yn holi ynglŷn â'r dyddiad penodol a chewch ateb ysgrifenedig am hynny.



**Mark Isherwood:** How do you respond to statements made to me by community hospital staff in north Wales that community hospitals cannot afford the increase in general practitioner pay, under the general medical services contract, and are relying on the goodwill of GPs until a sufficient number of nurse practitioners are trained? They told me that that could take up to five years. In addition, district nurses are being further demoralised as they struggle with increasing demands.

2.30 p.m.

**Brian Gibbons:** Individual community hospitals in north Wales will have to decide how best to configure the services that they provide. This is not just an issue of GP pay; some GPs, in any event, do not wish to engage with how community hospitals operate at the moment. Each community hospital and the commissioners in that region need to re-examine, as I said to Mick Bates, the range of services that they provide and the requirements of the local population and then put the staff in place to meet those requirements. That will not necessarily mean GPs in every instance, although it will be GPs in many instances.

**Mark Isherwood:** Sut yr ydych yn ymateb i'r hyn y mae staff mewn ysbytai cymunedol yn y Gogledd wedi ei ddweud wrthyf, sef na all ysbytai cymunedol fforddio'r cynnydd yng nghyflogau meddygon teulu, o dan y contract gwasanaethau meddygol cyffredinol, a'u bod yn dibynnu ar ewyllys da meddygon teulu nes bydd digon o ymarferwyr nyrsio wedi cael eu hyfforddi? Dywedwyd wrthyf y gallai hynny gymryd hyd at bum mlynedd. Yn ogystal, mae morâl nyrsys ardal yn mynd yn is wrth iddynt geisio ymdopi â galwadau cynyddol.

**Brian Gibbons:** Bydd yn rhaid i ysbytai cymunedol unigol yn y Gogledd benderfynu ar y ffordd orau i gyflunio'r gwasanaethau a ddarperir ganddynt. Nid mater o gyflog meddygon teulu yn unig yw hyn; nid yw rhai meddygon teulu, beth bynnag, yn dymuno ymwneud â'r ffordd y mae ysbytai cymunedol yn gweithredu ar hyn o bryd. Mae angen i bob ysbyty cymunedol a'r comisiynwyr yn y rhanbarth hwnnw ail-archwilio, fel y dywedais wrth Mick Bates, yr ystod o wasanaethau a ddarperir ganddynt a gofynion y boblogaeth leol, ac yna ddarparu'r staff i fodloni'r gofynion hynny. Ni fydd hynny o reidrwydd yn golygu defnyddio meddygon teulu ym mhob achos, er mai meddygon teulu a gaiff eu defnyddio mewn llawer achos.

### **Buddsoddi mewn Adeiladau Iechyd Investment in Health Buildings**

**C9 Alun Ffred Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar gynlluniau'r Llywodraeth ar gyfer buddsoddi mewn adeiladau iechyd? OAQ0313(HSS)

**Q9 Alun Ffred Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on the Government's plans for investment in health buildings? OAQ0313(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** The Welsh Assembly Government's three-year budget for 2005-06 to 2007-08 contained a commitment to increase capital spending in the Welsh NHS from £120 million in 2005-06 to £309 million in 2007-08. There are currently five major publicly-funded hospital schemes progressing through the capital investment process.

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr oedd y gyllideb tair blynedd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer 2005-06 i 2007-08 yn cynnwys ymrwymiad i gynyddu gwariant cyfalaf yn y GIG yng Nghymru o £120 miliwn yn 2005-06 i £309 miliwn yn 2007-08. Ar hyn o bryd mae pum cynllun ysbyty mawr sy'n cael eu hariannu'n gyhoeddus yn mynd rhagddynt drwy'r broses buddsoddiad cyfalaf.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog gadarnhau nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn bwriadu ymgymryd â chynlluniau gwastraffus menter cyllid preifat yn y dyfodol yn y maes hwn?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Will the Minister confirm that the Government does not intend to engage in wasteful private finance initiative schemes in future in this area? Also, can he explain why the

Hefyd, a all esbonio pam nad yw'r Llywodraeth wedi annog ymddiriedolaethau a byrddau iechyd lleol i fenthg arian oddi wrth y Banc Buddsoddi Ewropeaidd, fel y gwnaeth cyrff yn Lloegr, at adeiladu ysbytai?

**Brian Gibbons:** That is a pretty contradictory question. Most of the borrowing from the European Investment Bank has been by PFI schemes in England.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Minister, do you agree that the continued support for the new hospital in Caerphilly borough shows that this Labour administration is putting its money where its mouth is by making a major investment that will benefit the people of that borough, and that that is sharp contrast to the Tory years, when we suffered cutbacks, not increases in provision?

**Brian Gibbons:** Thank you for that, Jeff. That provides me with the opportunity to assure people in the Caerphilly area that, contrary to somewhat alarmist press reports, the Assembly Government is fully behind providing a new hospital in the Caerphilly area, and that any suggestion of a major setback in that project's going ahead is completely misinformed and wrong.

**Alun Cairns:** Minister, there are reports that Fairwood Hospital in Swansea is under threat, and the excuse often given at the time when vital facilities such as this are closed is that the buildings themselves are not adequate. What commitment can you give that the capital investment programme that you are apparently developing will be able to save Fairwood Hospital?

**Brian Gibbons:** The key challenge for Fairwood Hospital, or any other hospital in Wales, is whether it is fit for purpose and delivering a quality service to patients. You will probably know that, as part of the roll-out of 'Designed for Life' and the Wanless renovation programme, we are asking for regional programmes or plans to be drawn up for each of the three regions. The future configuration of hospital services in the Swansea area will be seen in that particular context. However, that report has not yet been completed, and it probably will not be with us until late autumn.

Government has not encouraged trusts and local health boards to borrow funds from the European Investment Bank, as organisations in England have done, to build hospitals?

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae'r cwestiwn hwnnw'n gwrth-ddweud. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r arian o'r Banc Buddsoddi Ewropeaidd wedi ei fenthg ar gyfer cynlluniau PFI yn Lloegr.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Weinidog, a gytunwch fod y gefnogaeth barhaus i'r ysbyty newydd ym mwrdeistref Caerffili yn dangos bod y weinyddiaeth Lafur hon yn rhoi ei harian ar ei gair, drwy wneud buddsoddiad mawr a fydd o fudd i bobl y fwrdeistref honno, a bod hynny'n gwrthgyferbynnu'n llwyr â chyfnod y Llywodraeth Doriaidd, pan gafwyd toriadau, nid cynnydd, mewn darpariaeth?

**Brian Gibbons:** Diolch ichi am hynny, Jeff. Mae hynny'n gyfle imi roi sicrwydd i bobl yn ardal Caerffili fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn wahanol i adroddiadau yn y wasg sy'n creu dychryn braidd, yn llwyr gefnogi'r cynnig i ddarparu ysbyty newydd yn ardal Caerffili, a bod unrhyw awgrym bod rhwystr mawr i'r prosiect hwnnw fynd rhagddo yn hollol anghywir.

**Alun Cairns:** Weinidog, mae yna adroddiadau bod Ysbyty Fairwood yn Abertawe o dan fygythiad, a'r esgus a roddir yn aml pan fydd cyfleusterau hollbwysig fel hwn yn cau yw bod yr adeiladau eu hunain yn annigonol. Pa ymrwymiad y gallwch ei roi y bydd y rhaglen buddsoddi cyfalaf y mae'n ymddangos eich bod yn ei datblygu yn gallu arbed Ysbyty Fairwood?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr her allweddol i Ysbyty Fairwood, neu unrhyw ysbyty arall yng Nghymru, yw a yw'n addas at y diben ac yn darparu gwasanaeth o safon i gleifion. Fe wyddoch, mae'n siŵr, fel rhan o gyflwyno 'Cynllun Oes' a rhaglen adnewyddu Wanless, ein bod yn gofyn i raglenni neu gynlluniau rhanbarthol gael eu llunio ar gyfer pob un o'r tri rhanbarth. Caiff cyflunio gwasanaethau ysbytai yn ardal Abertawe yn y dyfodol ei ystyried yn y cyd-destun penodol hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r adroddiad wedi'i gwblhau eto, ac nid yw'n debygol o ddod i law tan ddiwedd yr hydref.

**Buddsoddiad Cyfalaf yn y GIG yn y Gorllewin**  
**Capital Investment in the NHS in West Wales**

**Q10 Christine Gwyther:** Will the Minister make a statement on capital investment in the NHS in west Wales? OAQ0331(HSS)

**C10 Christine Gwyther:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar fuddsoddiad cyfalaf yn y GIG yng ngorllewin Cymru? OAQ0331(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** There are many capital projects progressing in west Wales at present, totalling over £50 million. An extra £8.78 million was announced last year to help bring down waiting times even further across the Mid and West Wales region. This funding will be invested in new equipment and buildings.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae nifer o brosiectau cyfalaf yn mynd ymlaen yn y Gorllewin ar hyn o bryd, sy'n werth dros £50 miliwn. Cyhoeddwyd y byddai £8.78 miliwn arall ar gael y llynedd i helpu lleihau amseroedd aros hymhellach ar draws rhanbarth y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin. Caiff yr arian hwn ei fuddsoddi mewn offer ac adeiladau newydd.

**Christine Gwyther:** One of those projects is the renal dialysis building in Carmarthen. The building was originally designed with a 10-year life span, but it has now been in place for 20 years and desperately needs replacing. A replacement is in the pipeline, and in normal circumstances, a few months' slippage on a project of this kind would not matter, but in this case it does. It is due to be finished by December, but the water system is very friable, the pipes are brittle and it must be finished before we hit the harshness of winter in January and February. Can I have your assurance that you will keep a special eye on this capital project to ensure that it is finished by Christmas?

**Christine Gwyther:** Un o'r prosiectau hynny yw adeilad dialysis yr arenau yng Nghaerfyrddin. Cynlluniwyd yr adeilad yn wreiddiol i bara am 10 mlynedd, ond mae 20 mlynedd wedi mynd heibio ers ei godi ac mae angen dybryd am adeilad newydd. Mae un newydd ar y gweill, ac o dan amgylchiadau arferol ni fyddai llithriant o ychydig fisoedd ar brosiect o'r fath o bwys. Ond yn yr achos hwn, y mae'n bwysig. Y dyddiad ar gyfer cwblhau'r adeilad yw mis Rhagfyr, ond mae'r system ddŵr yn frau iawn, mae'r pibellau'n fregus a rhaid ei gorffen cyn tywydd garw'r gaef ym mis Ionawr a mis Chwefror. A allwch fy sicrhau y byddwch yn cadw llygad barcud ar y prosiect cyfalaf hwn er mwyn sicrhau ei orffen erbyn y Nadolig?

**Brian Gibbons:** I cannot give that categorical commitment because I am not in a position to talk about the technical engineering difficulties. However, you are right to say that there is a strong Government commitment to ensuring that this updated facility is provided in Carmarthen. You may also be aware that the facility will provide extra units so that more people can be treated.

**Brian Gibbons:** Ni allaf ymrwymo i wneud hynny'n ddiamed oherwydd nid wyf mewn sefyllfa i sôn am yr anawsterau peirianeg technegol. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych yn llygad eich lle i ddweud bod ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth yn gryf i sicrhau y bydd y cyfleuster hwn wedi'i uwchraddio yn cael ei ddarparu yng Nghaerfyrddin. Hwyrach eich bod yn gwybod hefyd y bydd y cyfleuster yn darparu unedau ychwanegol fel y gellir trin mwy o bobl.

The issue of water has been a bottleneck in terms of addressing the issue, but I will ask my officials to make specific inquiries in relation to the progress made, and I will write to you with the specific details.

Mae'r broblem ddŵr wedi ein hatal rhag mynd i'r afael â'r mater, ond gofynnaf i'm swyddogion wneud ymholiadau penodol am y cynnydd a wnaed, ac ysgrifennaf atoch gyda'r manylion penodol.

**Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon**  
**Questions to the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport**

**Cyfleusterau Clybiau Uwch-gynghrair Cymru**  
**The Facilities of Welsh Premier League Clubs**

**Q1 Glyn Davies:** What discussions has the Minister had with the Football Association of Wales about the HatTrick money that should have been invested in the facilities of Welsh premier league clubs? OAQ0272(CWS)

**The Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport (Alun Pugh):** None, but I am aware that the FAW's decision has met with criticism inside the world of football and further afield.

**Glyn Davies:** The development of the Welsh premier league is hugely important to the development of Welsh football in general, and there is a desperate need to upgrade football grounds to a standard that can accommodate European football ties. Do you share my concern that the £1 million of HatTrick money which should have gone to improve the premier grounds has been spent on a scheme to provide new headquarters for the Football Association of Wales? Development of football is your responsibility, and I would have thought that it would be a Ministerial responsibility to at least meet with the Football Association of Wales to establish the reasoning behind the decision.

**Alun Pugh:** I am aware that a number of people inside the world of football and further afield have made criticisms of that decision. That money was made available by UEFA; it could have been used in a number of ways, including investment in stadia. The FAW indicated that it wanted to use the money to improve its offices, and I understand that UEFA approved the decision. However, I am aware that many football organisations and individuals across Wales are not happy with the decision.

**Ann Jones:** The FAW's decision is nothing less than disgraceful, and I call on David Collins to reverse it. The Welsh premier league is at the top of the pyramid, along with the national team. Should the FAW not be

**C1 Glyn Davies:** Pa drafodaethau a fu rhwng y Gweinidog a Chymdeithas Bêl-droed Cymru ynghylch yr arian HatTrick y dylid bod wedi'i fuddsoddi yng nghyfleusterau clybiau uwch-gynghrair Cymru? OAQ0272(CWS)

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon (Alun Pugh):** Dim o gwbl. On gwn fod penderfyniad Cymdeithas Bêl-droed Cymru wedi ei feirniadu yn y byd pêl-droed a thu hwnt.

**Glyn Davies:** Mae datblygu uwch-gynghrair Cymru yn hollbwysig i ddatblygu pêl-droed yng Nghymru yn gyffredinol, ac mae gwir angen uwchraddio caeau pêl-droed i safon a all fodloni anghenion gemau pêl-droed Ewropeaidd. A ydych chi, fel finnau, yn pryderu bod yr £1 filiwn o arian HatTrick, y dylid bod wedi ei wario i wella caeau pêl-droed clybiau'r uwch-gynghrair, wedi ei wario ar gynllun i ddarparu pencadlys newydd ar gyfer Cymdeithas Bêl-droed Cymru? Chi sy'n gyfrifol am ddatblygu pêl-droed, a byddwn wedi tybio mai cyfrifoldeb Gweinidog fyddai cyfarfod â Chymdeithas Bêl-droed Cymru o leiaf i sefydlu'r rhesymau dros y penderfyniad.

**Alun Pugh:** Gwn fod nifer o bobl yn y byd pêl-droed a thu hwnt wedi beirniadu'r penderfyniad hwnnw. Darparwyd yr arian hwnnw gan UEFA; gellid bod wedi ei ddefnyddio mewn nifer o ffyrdd, gan gynnwys buddsoddi mewn stadiymau. Dywedodd Cymdeithas Bêl-droed Cymru ei bod am ddefnyddio'r arian i wella ei swyddfeydd, a deallaf fod UEFA wedi cymeradwyo'r penderfyniad hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r ffaith fod nifer o sefydliadau pêl-droed a nifer o unigolion ledled Cymru yn anfodlon am y penderfyniad.

**Ann Jones:** Mae penderfyniad Cymdeithas Bêl-Droed Cymru yn warthus, a galwaf ar David Collins i'w wrthdroi. Mae uwch-gynghrair Cymru ar frig y pyramid, ynghyd â'r tîm cenedlaethol. Oni ddylai Cymdeithas Bêl-droed

looking to grounds such as Welshpool, Newtown and Bangor? Poor old Bangor City football club had to play its European cup tie at Rhyl's ground. Had Bangor City played its home tie at its own ground, perhaps it would have been able to win that league. Do you agree that the FAW needs to seriously consider how it spends its money?

**Alun Pugh:** I have taken up your invitations in the past to visit Rhyl's ground—I saw a European game there last year when Rhyl played a team from Latvia. The quality of Rhyl's pitch is second to none, but the stadium could do with some investment, including investment behind the scenes.

In view of what I have heard from Members from all sides of the Chamber, I am prepared to put a letter on record to the FAW, and I shall place a copy in the Library.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Ategaf yr hyn a ddywedwyd, gan gyfeirio at glybiau Porthmadog a Chaernarfon sydd hefyd angen y buddsoddiad hwn. Yr wyf yn rhyfeddu nad ydych wedi cael cyfarfod â'r gymdeithas. A wnewch ymuno â ni i gondemnio penderfyniad y gymdeithas bêl-droed i wario'r arian hwn ar swyddfeydd moethus ym mae Caerdydd, yn hytrach na'i fuddsoddi mewn pêl-droed ar lawr gwlad?

**Alun Pugh:** The FAW has spent the money within the criteria approved by UEFA. However, many people on all sides of the Chamber and inside the world of football are not very happy with it, and I can understand the reason for that.

2.40 p.m.

**Leighton Andrews:** I have also written to the FAW on this matter, and it is a concern not just to those who have Welsh premier league clubs in their constituencies, but to those who have clubs in leagues below that, such as Ton Pentre Association Football Club, which won the league below the Welsh premier league. We are concerned about this matter and want you to express the views of

Cymru fod yn edrych ar gaeau pêl-droed megis y Trallwng, y Drenewydd a Bangor? Bu'n rhaid i glwb pêl-droed Dinas Bangor druan chwarae ei gêm cwpan Ewropeaidd ar gae pêl-droed y Rhyl. Pe bai tîm Dinas Bangor wedi chwarae ei gêm gartref ar ei gae ei hun, efallai y byddai wedi gallu ennill y gynghrair honno. A gytunwch fod angen i Gymdeithas Bêl-droed Cymru ystyried o ddifrif sut y mae'n gwario ei harian?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr wyf wedi derbyn eich gwahoddiadau yn y gorffennol i ymweld â chae pêl-droed y Rhyl—gwyliais gêm Ewropeaidd yno'r llynedd pan chwaraeodd y Rhyl dîm o Latfia. Mae ansawdd y maes yn y Rhyl o'r radd flaenaf, ond mae angen buddsoddi yn y stadiwm, gan gynnwys buddsoddi y tu ôl i'r llenni.

Yng ngoleuni'r hyn yr wyf wedi ei glywed gan yr Aelodau o bob ochr i'r Siambr, yr wyf yn barod i anfon llythyr swyddogol at Gymdeithas Bêl-droed Cymru, a gwnaf roi copi ohono yn y Llyfrgell.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I echo what has been said, and I refer to Porthmadog and Caernarfon football clubs, which also need this investment. I am surprised you have not met the association. Will you join us in condemning the football association's decision to spend this money on luxurious offices in Cardiff bay, rather than invest it in grass-roots football?

**Alun Pugh:** Mae Cymdeithas Bêl-droed Cymru wedi gwario'r arian o fewn y meini prawf a gymeradwywyd gan UEFA. Fodd bynnag, mae nifer o bobl o bob ochr i'r Siambr ac ym myd pêl-droed yn anfodlon ar hynny, a gallaf ddeall y rheswm am hynny.

**Leighton Andrews:** Yr wyf fi hefyd wedi ysgrifennu at Gymdeithas Bêl-droed Cymru ynghylch y mater hwn, ac mae'n peri pryder nid yn unig i'r rheini sydd â chlybiau uwch-gynghrair Cymru yn eu hetholaethau, ond hefyd i'r rheini sydd â chlybiau mewn cynghreiriau is, megis Clwb Pêl-droed Ton Pentre, a enillodd y gynghrair islaw uwch-gynghrair Cymru. Yr ydym yn pryderu ynghylch y mater hwn a

the Chamber on it.

**Alun Pugh:** As a Government, we have invested over £2 million in money over which we have direct control in grass-roots football, on coaching the next generation of Ryan Giggses. Obviously, those grants have very tight conditions. The UEFA money, of course, is not Government money; it has to be spent according to UEFA's conditions. That has been done but I hear clearly the opinions from Members all around this Chamber that they are not happy with this, and that will be reflected in my letter.

**Karen Sinclair:** To add another voice to this, the North East Wales Institute of Higher Education Cefn Druids Association Football Club, in my constituency, has had a difficult time recently funding improvements to its grounds, following new regulations set down on the floodlighting arrangements at League of Wales grounds. In its attempt to fully fund the upgrade, the club has had to go outside the football community to find assistance. Do you agree that that is a disgrace?

**Alun Pugh:** You have put that matter to me forcefully on behalf of your constituency in the past. We are all familiar with football grounds, big and small, the length and breadth of the nation. They could all do with this investment, including that in Colwyn Bay, in my own constituency. There is always competition for funds for sporting investment, but I hear the opinions of all Members very clearly on this matter.

dymunwn ichi fynegi barn y Siambr am hynny.

**Alun Pugh:** Fel Llywodraeth, yr ydym wedi buddsoddi dros £2 filiwn o arian y mae gennym reolaeth uniongyrchol drosto mewn pêl-droed ar lawr gwlad, ar hyfforddi'r genhedlaeth nesaf o chwaraewyr tebyg i Ryan Giggs. Wrth reswm, mae amodau llym iawn gyda'r grantiau hynny. Nid arian y Llywodraeth yw arian UEFA, wrth gwrs; rhaid ei wario yn unol ag amodau UEFA. Gwnaed hynny, ond yr wyf yn clywed yn glir farn aelodau o bob rhan o'r Siambr hon, sef eu bod yn anfodlon, a bydd hynny'n cael ei adlewyrchu yn fy llythyr.

**Karen Sinclair:** I ychwanegu barn arall at hyn, mae Clwb Pêl-droed Cefn Druids, sy'n perthyn i Sefydliad Addysg Uwch Gogledd Ddwyrain Cymru yn fy etholaethi, wedi cael amser anodd yn ddiweddar i ariannu gwelliannau yn eu cae pêl-droed, yn dilyn rheoliadau newydd ar drefniadau llifolau ar gyfer caeau pêl-droed Cynghrair Cymru. Wrth geisio ariannu'r gwaith uwchraddio hwn yn llawn, mae'r clwb wedi gorfod gofyn am gymorth o'r tu allan i'r gymuned bêl-droed. A ydych yn cytuno bod hyn yn warthus?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr ydych wedi cyflwyno'r mater hwnnw imi'n rymus yn y gorffennol ar ran eich etholaeth. Yr ydym oll yn gyfarwydd â chaeau pêl-droed, yn rhai bach a rhai mawr, ar hyd a lled y wlad. Byddai'r buddsoddiad hwn o fudd i bob un ohonynt, gan gynnwys y cae pêl-droed ym Mae Colwyn, yn fy etholaeth i. Mae cystadleuaeth bob amser am arian ar gyfer buddsoddiadau chwaraeon, ond mae barn pob Aelod am y mater hwn yn glir iawn imi.

### **Mynediad i Theatrau a Sinemâu**

#### **Access to Theatres and Cinemas**

**Q2 Ann Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on access to theatres and cinemas in Wales? OAQ0286(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Theatres and cinemas in Wales have to comply with the provisions of the Disability Discrimination Act 1995, which came into force on 1 October 2004. Venues are now required to consider making permanent changes to the physical features of their buildings to accommodate access for disabled people.

**C2 Ann Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar fynediad i theatrau a sinemâu yng Nghymru? OAQ0286(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Rhaid i theatrau a sinemâu yng Nghymru gydymffurfio â darpariaethau Deddf Gwahaniaethu ar sail Anabledd 1995, a ddaeth i rym ar 1 Hydref 2004. Mae bellach yn ofynnol iddynt ystyried gwneud newidiadau parhaol yn nodweddiad ffisegol eu hadeiladau er mwyn darparu mynediad i bobl anabl.

**Ann Jones:** As chair of the all-party group on deaf issues, I was disturbed to hear reports, at the group's last meeting, that Wales has fallen behind other parts of the UK on cinema accessibility for people with sensory losses. I am concerned about this, as is the whole group. Wales has a wide range of cinemas, from large commercial chains to independents and those owned by small companies. Failure to find appropriate funding mean that accessible performances are unlikely to be provided in our cinemas. Would you be prepared to meet with me and with the all-party group on deaf issues to discuss this and ways in which we can make our cinemas and theatres accessible to all?

**Alun Pugh:** I am certainly happy to meet you and the delegation to discuss that. We ought to draw a very clear distinction between the not-for-profit, community-cinema sector on the one hand and the needs of private sector commercial multiplexes on the other. Grants are available to support not-for-profit and community groups, where an audit of facilities indicates that that would be appropriate. We are prepared to do something to support measures such as soft subtitling and digital projection. However, in the case of private sector commercial multiplexes, it is a matter of making adaptations according to the Disability Discrimination Act 1995.

**Jocelyn Davies:** I thank you for your recent visit to Newbridge Memo. You will know, from your visit, that there are high hopes that, eventually, the building, including its cinema, will be restored to its former glory. What support can the Welsh Assembly Government offer to assist in securing that building for future community use?

**Alun Pugh:** As I have said, there are a variety of grant schemes, including the grant for improving access for people with disabilities. There is also lottery funding, although I do not make decisions on lottery funding. I met you and Irene at the Memo, and it is a terrific facility. I had seen newsreel footage on the television, but, in seeing the glory of that building, you get some sense of what it could be in the future if we could put

**Ann Jones:** Fel cadeirydd grŵp yr holl bleidiau ar faterion pobl fyddar, annifyr oedd clywed adroddiadau, yng nghyfarfod diwethaf y grŵp, bod Cymru ar ei hôl hi o'i chymharu â rhannau eraill o'r DU wrth sicrhau bod sinemâu yn gyfleus i bobl sydd wedi colli synhwyrâu. Yr wyf yn pryderu ynghylch hyn, fel y mae'r grŵp cyfan. Mae gan Gymru amrywiaeth eang o sinemâu, o gadwyni masnachol mawr i rai annibynnol a'r rheini sy'n eiddo i gwmnïau bach. Mae methu sicrhau arian priodol yn golygu ei bod yn annhebygol y caiff perfformiadau sy'n gyfleus i bawb eu darparu yn ein sinemâu. A fydddech yn barod i gyfarfod â mi a grŵp yr holl bleidiau ar faterion pobl fyddar i drafod hyn, ac i drafod ffyrdd y gallwn wneud ein sinemâu a'n theatrau'n gyfleus i bawb?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr wyf yn sicr yn fodlon cyfarfod â chi a'r ddirprwyaeth i drafod hynny. Dylem wahaniaethu'n glir rhwng y sector sinemâu cymunedol dielw ar y naill law ac anghenion sinemâu aml-sgrîn masnachol y sector preifat ar y llaw arall. Mae grantiau ar gael i gynorthwyo grwpiau dielw a grwpiau cymunedol, pan fydd archwiliad o'r cyfleusterau yn dangos y byddai hynny'n briodol. Yr ydym yn barod i wneud rhywbeth i gefnogi mesurau megis isdeitlau meddal a thafllunio digidol. Fodd bynnag, yn achos sinemâu aml-sgrîn masnachol yn y sector preifat, mae angen iddynt addasu yn unol â Deddf Gwahaniaethu ar sail Anabledd 1995.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Hoffwn ddiolch ichi am ymweld â Neuadd Goffa Trecelyn yn ddiweddar. Fe wyddoch, o'ch ymweliad, fod gobeithion mawr y bydd yr adeilad, gan gynnwys ei sinema, yn cael ei adfer i'w gyflwr gwreiddiol. Pa gymorth y gall Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ei gynnig i sicrhau bod yr adeilad hwnnw'n cael ei ddefnyddio gan y gymuned yn y dyfodol?

**Alun Pugh:** Fel y dywedais, mae yna amrywiaeth o gynlluniau grantiau, gan gynnwys y grant i wella mynediad i bobl ag anableddau. Mae yna arian loteri hefyd, er nad fi sy'n gwneud penderfyniadau am arian loteri. Cyfarfûm â chi ac Irene yn y Neuadd, ac mae'n gyfleuster gwych. Yr oeddwn wedi gweld ffilm newyddion ar y teledu, ond wrth weld yr adeilad ysblennydd hwnnw cewch ryw syniad sut y gallai fod yn y dyfodol pe gallem greu pecyn

together a suitable package of capital investment. It is a fine building.

**Nick Bourne:** In support of what Ann Jones said on the deaf and hard of hearing—and I note what the Minister says about the not-for-profit side of the issue—I wonder whether the Minister would be willing to speak to commercial operators to see whether there is anything that can be done and whether a code could be developed. This is an important part of the sector and many people who are deaf and hard of hearing wish to go to the cinema but are presented with the problems that we are all too familiar with.

**Alun Pugh:** This is relatively new technology; I understand that some 670 cinemas are operating across the UK, but only 129 have suitable equipment to provide this technology. I am happy to meet with the trade bodies of the private sector to see how we can take this forward.

**Peter Black:** Will you join me in congratulating the City and County of Swansea Council on its recent announcement that it is going to introduce open captioning in the Grand Theatre later this year? Will you encourage other local-authority-owned theatres to follow suit?

**Alun Pugh:** I support all local authorities in their efforts to make buildings for cultural activities more accessible for people with disabilities.

priodol o fuddsoddiad cyfalaf. Mae'n adeilad gwych.

**Nick Bourne:** I ategu'r hyn a ddywedodd Ann Jones ynglŷn â phobl fyddar a phobl drwm eu clyw - ac yr wyf wedi nodi'r hyn a ddywed y Gweinidog am yr agwedd ddi-elw ar y mater - tybed a fyddai'r Gweinidog yn barod i siarad â chwmnïau masnachol i weld a ellir gwneud unrhyw beth ac a ellid datblygu cod. Mae hyn yn rhan bwysig o'r sector, ac mae nifer o bobl sy'n fyddar ac yn drwm eu clyw yn dymuno mynd i'r sinema ond yn wynebu'r problemau yr ydym yn gyfarwydd iawn â hwy.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae hon yn dechnoleg gymharol newydd; deallaf fod tua 670 o sinemâu yn gweithredu ledled y DU, ond dim ond 129 ohonynt sydd ag offer addas i ddarparu'r dechnoleg hon. Yr wyf yn fodlon cyfarfod â chyrff masnachol y sector preifat i weld sut y gallwn ddatblygu'r maes hwn.

**Peter Black:** A wnewch ymuno â mi i longyfarch Dinas a Sir Cyngor Abertawe ar y cyhoeddiad diweddar ei bod am gyflwyno isdeitlau agored yn Theatr y Grand yn ddiweddarach eleni? A wnewch annog theatrau eraill sy'n eiddo i awdurdodau lleol i ddilyn yr esiampl hon?

**Alun Pugh:** Cefnogaf bob awdurdod lleol yn eu hymdrechion i wneud adeiladau ar gyfer gweithgareddau diwylliannol yn fwy cyfleus i bobl ag anableddau.

### Lleoliadau Celfyddydau Arts Venues

**Q3 Kirsty Williams:** Will the Minister make a statement on arts venues in rural Wales? OAQ0305(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** We spend some £2.5 million a year via the Arts Council of Wales on arts venues in rural Wales. On top of this, seven of the regional performing arts centres that will benefit from the £2 million arts outside Cardiff money are in rural Wales.

**Kirsty Williams:** Is the Minister aware of the arts council's intention to cut back on the

**C3 Kirsty Williams:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar leoliadau celfyddydau yng Nghymru wledig? OAQ0305(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Yr ydym yn gwario oddeutu £2.5 miliwn y flwyddyn drwy Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru ar leoliadau celfyddydau yng nhgefn gwlad Cymru. Yn ogystal â hyn, mae saith o'r canolfannau celfyddydau perfformio rhanbarthol a fydd yn elwa o'r £2 filiwn o arian ar gyfer y celfyddydau y tu allan i Gaerdydd yng nhgefn gwlad Cymru.

**Kirsty Williams:** A yw'r Gweinidog yn ymwybodol bod cyngor y celfyddydau yn



number of revenue clients? This puts the Wyeside Arts Centre at Builth Wells under threat. Do you agree that the Wyeside Arts Centre is a geographically and strategically important venue, providing an art exhibition space and a cinema facility as well as live performance facilities, and that we need to ensure that those facilities are there for future generations to enjoy?

**Alun Pugh:** The Wyeside Arts Centre is a very important facility. I drive past it most weeks, on my drives up and down the A470. It is supported by Assembly Government grants and lottery grants. The latest grant that it received was for £26,735 to undertake work to improve disabled access.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Do you agree that the extra investment and forthcoming extension to the Oriel Mostyn Art Gallery in Llandudno, which is not far from your constituency, will allow this arts venue to continue to expand, bringing the arts to a greater audience in north Wales?

**Alun Pugh:** Unfortunately I do not get to see all the exhibitions in Oriel Mostyn, although I have seen a number of them over the years. They are always interesting, challenging and thought-provoking. It is an important centre of expertise, not just for your Conwy constituency, but as a venue for the whole of north Wales.

**Lisa Francis:** The Torch Theatre in Milford Haven serves many rural communities. It is currently on a Welsh European Funding Office reserve list for European funding, and a decision on this will be made on 27 July. At a recent Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee meeting you told me that the Welsh Assembly Government would clearly have to look at alternative sources of funding for the Torch Theatre, should its bid fail. Your colleague, Andrew Davies, told the Economic Development and Transport Committee today that contingency plans for that would not be addressed until after 27 July, and that it was largely a theatre matter. Has he told you that?

bwriadu cwtogi ar nifer y cleientiaid refeniw? Mae hyn yn bygwth Canolfan Gelfyddydau Glannau Gwy yn Llanfair-ym-Muallt. A gytunwch fod Canolfan Gelfyddydau Glannau Gwy yn lleoliad daearyddol a strategol pwysig sy'n darparu lle ar gyfer arddangosfeydd celf a sinema yn ogystal â pherfformiadau byw, a bod angen inni sicrhau bod y cyfleusterau hynny ar gael i genedlaethau'r dyfodol eu mwynhau?

**Alun Pugh:** Mae Canolfan Gelfyddydau Glannau Gwy yn gyfleuster pwysig iawn. Byddaf yn gyrru heibio iddi'n aml, ar fy nhaith i fyny ac i lawr ar hyd yr A470. Fe'i cefnogir gan grantiau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a grantiau loteri. Y grant diwethaf a gafodd oedd £26,735 i wneud gwaith i wella mynediad i'r anabl.

**Denise Idris Jones:** A gytunwch y bydd y buddsoddiad ychwanegol a'r estyniad arfaethedig yn Oriel Mostyn yn Llandudno, nid nepell o'ch etholaeth chi, yn galluogi'r lleoliad celfyddydau hwn i barhau i ehangu, gan ddod â'r celfyddydau i gynulleidfa helaethach yn y Gogledd?

**Alun Pugh:** Yn anffodus ni fyddaf yn llwyddo i weld yr holl arddangosfeydd yn Oriel Mostyn, er fy mod wedi gweld nifer dros y blynyddoedd. Maent bob amser yn ddiddorol, yn heriol ac yn gwneud ichi feddwl. Mae'n ganolfan arbenigedd bwysig, nid yn unig i'ch etholaeth chi yng Nghonwy, ond fel lleoliad i'r Gogledd i gyd.

**Lisa Francis:** Mae Theatr y Torch yn Aberdaugleddau yn gwasanaethu nifer o gymunedau gwledig. Ar hyn o bryd, mae ar restr wrth gefn Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru am arian Ewropeaidd, a bydd penderfyniad ar hyn yn cael ei wneud ar 27 Gorffennaf. Mewn cyfarfod o'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon yn ddiweddar, dywedasoeh wrthyf y byddai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn amlwg yn gorfod chwilio am arian o ffynonellau eraill ar gyfer Theatr y Torch, pe bai ei chynnig yn methu. Heddiw, dywedodd eich cyd-weinidog, Andrew Davies, wrth y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth na fyddai cynlluniau wrth gefn ar gyfer hynny yn cael eu trafod tan ar ôl 27 Gorffennaf, ac mai mater i'r theatr ydoedd yn bennaf. A yw wedi dweud hynny wrthyf chi?

**Alun Pugh:** Let us cross that bridge if we have to. The Torch Theatre is an excellent venue. Some of the front-of-house areas look quite good, but if you have had the privilege of a backstage tour, you will know, by looking at the dressing rooms, rehearsal facilities, showers and so on, that it is badly in need of some additional capital investment.

**Alun Pugh:** Gadewch inni beidio â mynd o flaen gofid. Mae Theatr y Torch yn lleoliad ardderchog. Mae rhai o'r mannau ym mlaen y tŷ yn edrych yn ddigon da. Ond os cawsoch y fraint o fynd y tu cefn i'r llwyfan, fe wyddoch, o edrych ar yr ystafelloedd gwisgo, y cyfleusterau ymarfer, y cawodydd, ac ati, fod arni angen drybryd am fuddsoddiad cyfalaf ychwanegol.

### **Eisteddfod yr Urdd ym Mae Caerdydd The Urdd Eisteddfod in Cardiff Bay**

**Q4 Lorraine Barrett:** Will the Minister make a statement on this year's Urdd Eisteddfod in Cardiff bay? OAQ0288(CWS)

**C4 Lorraine Barrett:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar Eisteddfod yr Urdd eleni ym Mae Caerdydd? OAQ0288(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** This year's Urdd Eisteddfod in Cardiff bay was a great success. Over 100,000 visitors came to enjoy and experience Europe's largest youth festival in an exciting and novel inner-city setting. The Donald Gordon Theatre came out of it really well. Apparently, some 15,000 competitors had the privilege of performing on our national stage.

**Alun Pugh:** Yr oedd Eisteddfod yr Urdd eleni ym Mae Caerdydd yn llwyddiant ysgubol. Daeth dros 100,000 o bobl i fwynhau a phrofi gŵyl ieuenctid fwyaf Ewrop mewn lleoliad cyffrous a newydd yng nghanol y ddinas. Cafodd Theatr Donald Gordon gyhoeddusrwydd da o'r herwydd. Mae'n debyg bod oddeutu 15,000 o gystadleuwyr wedi cael y fraint o berfformio ar ein llwyfan cenedlaethol.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I congratulate the outstanding performances of the thousands of young people of Wales. However, the event caused major disruption for many in Cardiff bay for nearly three weeks, because of the set-up and take-down time for the marquees. I never envisaged that the car park would be taken over by a fairground, and having the oval basin area as a no-go area for visitors also caused resentment. Will you do what you can in discussions to ensure that, if the Urdd holds its very successful Eisteddfod in Cardiff bay next time, all these things will be taken into account so that everyone can enjoy the area?

**Lorraine Barrett:** Hoffwn longyfarch y miloedd o Gymry ifanc am eu perfformiadau gwych. Fodd bynnag, amharodd y digwyddiad yn fawr ar nifer o bobl ym Mae Caerdydd am bron i dair wythnos, oherwydd yr amser a gymerwyd i osod y pebyll a'u tynnu i lawr. Ni ddychmygais fyth y byddai ffair yn meddiannu'r maes parcio, ac yr oedd rhai yn ddig hefyd am fod ymwelwyr wedi'u hatal rhag cerdded ar hyd y Basn Hirgrwn. A wnewch bopeth o fewn eich gallu mewn trafodaethau i sicrhau, os bydd yr Urdd yn cynnal ei heisteddfod lwyddiannus iawn ym Mae Caerdydd y tro nesaf, y bydd yr holl faterion hyn yn cael eu hystyried er mwyn i bawb allu mwynhau'r ardal?

2.50 p.m.

**Alun Pugh:** It will be a number of years before the Urdd returns to Cardiff bay. Obviously, that was the first time that it experienced running such a major festival in an inner-city venue. Everybody can learn lessons from putting that on in such a different setting. I think that the Urdd has only fielded two complaints, but I know that a number of your constituents have been in

**Alun Pugh:** Ni fydd yr Urdd yn dychwelyd i Fae Caerdydd am lawer blwyddyn eto. Yn amlwg, dyma'r tro cyntaf iddi gynnal gŵyl mor fawr mewn lleoliad yng nghanol dinas. Gall pawb ddysgu gwersi o'i chynnal mewn man mor wahanol. Credaf mai dwy gŵyn yn unig a gafodd yr Urdd, ond gwn fod nifer o'ch etholwyr wedi cysylltu'n uniongyrchol â'ch swyddfa. Yn sicr, bydd angen inni sefydlu

direct contact with your office. We will certainly need to establish early liaison with the Urdd so that if mistakes have been made, we do not repeat them when the eisteddfod returns in a couple of years' time.

**Owen John Thomas:** Ymunaf â Lorraine i longyfarch yr Urdd am gynnal wyl mor arbennig. Mae'n anodd credu y byddai 100,000 o bobl wedi ymweld â'r bae oni bai am yr eisteddfod. Fodd bynnag, a fydech yn cytuno y byddai wedi bod yn well efallai pe bai'r stondinau wedi cael eu lleoli yn y basn hirgrwn yn hytrach na chael eu gosod yng nghorneli pellaf y maes? Yr oedd yn dawel iawn o gwmpas y stondinau, ac ni chredaf y bydd rhai stondinau yn dychwelyd os caiff y maes ei drefnu fel y'i trefnwyd y tro hwn.

**Alun Pugh:** It was quite complex to arrange the maes, not least because a great deal of building work was taking place, including the refurbishing of the Pierhead building and the construction work on the new Assembly building. That will not be an issue when the eisteddfod returns in a couple of years' time.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yr wyf wedi llongyfarch yr Urdd eisoes, fel pawb arall; yr oedd yn eisteddfod lwyddiannus iawn. Fodd bynnag, nid oeddwn yn siŵr pa werth oedd mewn cael pabell y Cynulliad, er enghraifft, mor agos yn y basn, gan fod adeilad y Cynulliad yn y fan hon. Pe na bai pabell y Cynulliad yno, byddai lle wedi bod ar gael i stondinau eraill, ac fe fyddai hynny wedi'i gwneud yn haws i bobl ymweld â'r stondinau, fel y dywedodd Owen John. A gawsoch chi unrhyw drafodaeth gyda'r Urdd ynglŷn â'r broblem yn ymwneud ag arwyddion? Yr oedd dau fynediad i'r maes, ac yr oedd anodd i bawb, hyd yn oed y rhai ohonom oedd yn dod i'r gwaith, weld yn union lle yr oedd y fynedfa.

**Alun Pugh:** We will have to consider signage and the organisation of the maes carefully before the eisteddfod returns. There will be a different configuration then because all the building work will be completed. When a festival is set up in an inner-city area for the first time and you pour 100,000 visitors in, it is not surprising if you get one or two wrinkles. They had to consider what was the best way to get people in and the best way to park cars and so on. All those lessons

cysylltiad buan â'r Urdd, fel na chaiff unrhyw gamgymeriadau a wnaed eu hailadrodd pan fydd yr eisteddfod yn dychwelyd ymhen ychydig flynyddoedd.

**Owen John Thomas:** I join Lorraine in congratulating the Urdd on such a splendid festival. It is difficult to believe that 100,000 people would have visited the bay had it not been for the eisteddfod. However, would you agree that it would be better perhaps if the stalls had been located in the oval basin, rather than in the furthest corners of the *maes*? It was very quiet around the stalls, and I do not believe some will return if the *maes* is arranged as it was this time.

**Alun Pugh:** Yr oedd trefnu'r maes yn ddigon cymhleth, yn bennaf am fod llawer o waith adeiladu yn digwydd, gan gynnwys adnewyddu adeilad Pierhead a'r gwaith adeiladu ar adeilad newydd y Cynulliad. Ni fydd hynny'n broblem pan ddaw'r eisteddfod yn ôl ymhen ychydig flynyddoedd.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I have previously congratulated the Urdd, as everyone else; it was a very successful eisteddfod. However, I was not certain of the value of having the Assembly stand, for example, so close in the basin, since the Assembly building is here. Had the Assembly stand not been there, it would have meant space for other stalls, and people would have found it easier to access the stalls, as Owen John has said. Have you had any discussions with the Urdd regarding the problem with signage? There were two entrances to the field, and it was difficult for everyone, even those of us coming to work, to see exactly where the entrance was.

**Alun Pugh:** Bydd yn rhaid inni ystyried arwyddion a threfniadau'r maes yn ofalus cyn i'r eisteddfod ddychwelyd. Bydd y cyfluniad yn wahanol bryd hynny, oherwydd bydd y gwaith adeiladu wedi ei gwblhau. Pan drefnir gŵyl yng nghanol dinas am y tro cyntaf gyda thros 100,000 o ymwelwyr, nid yw'n syndod os bydd problem neu ddwy. Yr oedd yn rhaid iddynt ystyried y ffordd orau i gael y bobl i mewn a'r ffordd orau i barcio ceir, ac ati. Dysgir y gwersi hynny i gyd mewn da bryd erbyn i'r eisteddfod

will be learnt in good time for the return of the eisteddfod in three or four years' time.

**Laura Anne Jones:** The Urdd Eisteddfod was a resounding success. However, some non-Welsh-speaking members of the public have expressed dismay at the fact that they were treated with contempt by some eisteddfod officials because they could not speak Welsh. Everyone should be able to enjoy the eisteddfod, particularly when it is held in south Wales, where less than 15 per cent of the population speak Welsh.

**Alun Pugh:** I want all the people of Wales, those who speak both national languages and those who only speak one, to enjoy the Urdd Eisteddfod. This is the first complaint of this nature that I have heard.

ddychwelyd ymhen tair neu bedair blynedd.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Yr oedd Eisteddfod yr Urdd yn llwyddiant ysgubol. Fodd bynnag, mae rhai aelodau o'r cyhoedd nad ydynt yn siarad Cymraeg wedi mynegi siom oherwydd iddynt gael eu trin yn ddirmygus gan rai o swyddogion yr eisteddfod am na allant siarad Cymraeg. Dylai pawb allu mwynhau'r eisteddfod, yn arbennig pan gaiff ei chynnal yn y De, lle mae llai na 15 y cant o'r boblogaeth yn siarad Cymraeg.

**Alun Pugh:** Yr wyf am i holl bobl Cymru, y rhai sy'n siarad y ddwy iaith genedlaethol a'r rhai sy'n siarad dim ond un yn unig, fwynhau Eisteddfod yr Urdd. Dyna'r gŵyn gyntaf o'r fath imi ei chlywed.

### **Arian y Loteri Lottery Spending**

**C5 David Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar wariant arian y loteri? OAQ0337(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Ers ei lansio 10 mlynedd yn ôl, mae'r Loteri Genedlaethol wedi buddsoddi mwy na £800 miliwn mewn dros 20,000 o brosiectau sydd wedi gwella bywydau miloedd o bobl ledled Cymru.

**David Lloyd:** Mae arian y loteri yn gynyddol yn ariannu prosiectau ym maes iechyd ac addysg. A ydych yn cytuno y dylai'r Llywodraeth ariannu iechyd ac addysg yn hytrach na bod y loteri yn darparu'r arian ar hap a damwain?

**Alun Pugh:** We have important statutory responsibilities in terms of health and education, and it is entirely right that the tax dollar should fund that. However, there will be many opportunities to put additional investment around that. An example of that is the Mentro Allan project, which has received £6 million of lottery money. It is designed to get people, particularly those from deprived communities, out into the great Welsh outdoors. The primary aim of that is to give people a healthy and fun experience, but that, in turn, will pay dividends in 10, 15 or perhaps 20 years' time in terms of the health budget. I see no reason why that should not

**Q5 David Lloyd:** Will the Minister make a statement on lottery spending? OSQ0337(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Since it was launched 10 years ago, the National Lottery has invested more than £800 million in over 20,000 projects that have improved the lives of thousands of people across Wales.

**David Lloyd:** Lottery money is increasingly funding health and education projects. Do you agree that the Government should fund health and education, rather than the lottery providing funding arbitrarily?

**Alun Pugh:** Mae gennym gyfrifoldebau statudol pwysig o ran iechyd ac addysg, ac mae'n hollol gywir mai doler y dreth ddylai ariannu hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae yna lawer cyfle i roi buddsoddiad ychwanegol o amgylch hynny. Un enghraifft o hynny yw'r prosiect Mentro Allan, sydd wedi cael £6 miliwn o arian loteri. Fe'i cynlluniwyd i gael pobl, yn arbennig y rhai o gymunedau difreintiedig, allan i gefn gwlad gwyh Cymru. Prif nod hynny yw rhoi profiad iach a hwyliog i bobl, ond bydd hynny, yn ei dro, yn talu ar ei ganfed mewn 10, 15 neu efallai 20 mlynedd o ran y gyllideb iechyd. Ni welaf unrhyw reswm pam na ddylai arian loteri dalu am hynny.

be paid for by lottery funds.

**John Griffiths:** Yn ddiweddar ym Mhwyllgor Rhanbarth Dwyrain De Cymru, gofynnais i Fwrdd Croeso Cymru am y syniad o gael gwaith celf eiconig arbennig ar Lefelau Gwent er mwyn croesawu pobl i Gymru. Mae cefnogaeth i'r syniad yn sicr yn bodoli. Felly, a gytunwch y byddai o les i Gymru ac yn gwneud defnydd da o arian loteri?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr wyf yn mwynhau gwaith celf cyhoeddus, a gwn fod y prosiect hwn yn agos at eich calon, ond bydd y penderfyniad, wrth gwrs, yn fater i gronfa'r loteri.

**Mark Isherwood:** In 1997, Tony Blair stated:

'We do not believe that it would be right to use lottery money to pay for things that are the Government's responsibility.'

Why, therefore, has Labour allocated almost £0.5 billion of lottery money to schools and hospitals across the UK? If Labour's Lottery Bill becomes law, will it be establishing not the people's lottery, but the Labour Party's lottery?

**Alun Pugh:** That is, frankly, a daft remark. As I explained earlier, the Government has important statutory responsibilities relating to health and education and so on. There is no question of lottery money being diverted to fund those. However, where we can use lottery money additionally around the edges, not to fund statutory responsibilities, but to improve the health of the people of Wales and their experiences of education outside the statutory sector, I see no reason why it cannot be used.

**John Griffiths:** Recently at the South Wales East Regional Committee, I asked the Wales Tourist Board about the idea of having a unique iconic sculpture on the Gwent Levels to welcome people to Wales. Support for the idea certainly exists. Do you agree that this would benefit Wales and would make good use of lottery funding?

**Alun Pugh:** I enjoy public artwork, and I know that this project is close to your heart, but the decision will, of course, be a matter for the lottery fund.

**Mark Isherwood:** Yn 1997, dywedodd Tony Blair:

Ni chredwn y byddai'n iawn defnyddio arian loteri i dalu am bethau y mae'r Llywodraeth yn gyfrifol amdanynt.

Pam, felly, y mae Llafur wedi dyrannu bron £0.5 biliwn o arian loteri i ysgolion ac ysbytai ledled y DU? Os daw Mesur Loteri Llafur yn gyfraith gwlad, a fydd yn sefydlu loteri'r Blaid Lafur yn hytrach na loteri'r bobl?

**Alun Pugh:** Mae hynny, a dweud y gwir, yn sylw gwirion. Fel yr eglurais yn gynharach, mae gan y Llywodraeth gyfrifoldebau statudol pwysig mewn cysylltiad ag iechyd ac addysg, ac ati. Nid oes unrhyw gwestiwn y bydd arian loteri yn cael ei ddargyfeirio i ariannu'r rheiny. Fodd bynnag, pan allwn ddefnyddio arian loteri yn ychwanegol o amgylch yr ymylon, nid i ariannu cyfrifoldebau statudol, ond i wella iechyd pobl Cymru a'u profiadau addysgol y tu allan i'r sector statudol, ni welaf unrhyw reswm pam na ellir ei ddefnyddio.

### **Mynediad i Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru Access to the Wales Millennium Centre**

**Q6 Alun Cairns:** Will the Minister make a statement on access to the Wales Millennium Centre? OAQ0299(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Access to the centre depends on good public transport and local car parking. The new car park development adjacent to the centre will start this calendar year. On

**C6 Alun Cairns:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar fynediad i Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru? OAQ0299(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Mae mynediad i'r ganolfan yn dibynnu ar gludiant cyhoeddus da a pharciau ceir lleol. Bydd datblygu'r parc ceir newydd ger y ganolfan yn dechrau yn ystod y flwyddyn

public transport, there are bus and train services to the bay.

**Alun Cairns:** I am grateful for your answer, but do you not agree that the current arrangements are wholly unacceptable? There needs to be a swift development to build this car park, and do you appreciate that you have a responsibility relating to that? It may well be the direct responsibility of the Wales Millennium Centre to encourage negotiations and discussions between the local authority and the car park developers, but the Assembly has invested millions in the WMC, therefore, do you agree that you need to play a part in preserving our investment by ensuring that people can access the centre? Otherwise, I suspect that, in a couple of years' time, if matters have not developed as they should have, we will be here discussing whether or not the centre needs extra grants?

**Alun Pugh:** Transport arrangements into Cardiff bay are not wholly unacceptable, to use your phrase, but they are capable of improvement. There are dozens of buses and trains into the bay. The train service, as I explained yesterday in my statement, particularly late-night trains, will be improved when we move to the standard pattern timetable. The provision of a large car park will be a major improvement, but in view of your driving record in car parks, I hope that they will let you in.

**Leighton Andrews:** Please accept my thanks for your support for later train services to run to the Valleys from Cardiff for those who want to visit the WMC. However, I urge you and your ministerial colleagues to keep up the pressure on the train operators and the WMC to ensure that we get even later services for my constituents.

**Alun Pugh:** I know that the question of late-night trains from Cardiff to the Valleys is important for the WMC, but it is also important for those wanting a night out in Cardiff, and not only to visit our landmark centre. The situation will improve when we get that new standard pattern timetable. Andrew Davies is monitoring this closely, and we have regular discussions with Arriva Trains Wales.

galendr hon. O ran cludiant cyhoeddus, mae yna wasanaethau bws a thrên i'r bae.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich ateb, ond oni chytunwch fod y trefniadau cyfredol yn hollol annerbyniol? Mae angen datblygiad cyflym i adeiladu'r parc ceir hwn, ac a ydych yn sylweddoli bod gennych gyfrifoldeb yn y cyswllt hwnnw? Efallai mai cyfrifoldeb uniongyrchol Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru yw annog negodiadau a thrafodaethau gyda'r awdurdod lleol a datblygwyr y parc ceir. Ond mae'r Cynulliad wedi buddsoddi miliynau yn y Ganolfan, felly, a gytunwch fod angen ichi gymryd rhan i ddiogelu ein buddsoddiad drwy sicrhau y gall pobl gyrraedd y ganolfan? Fel arall, ymhen ychydig flynyddoedd, yr wyf yn drwgdybio, os na fydd pethau wedi datblygu fel y dylent, y byddwn yma yn trafod a oes angen grantiau ychwanegol ar y ganolfan ai peidio?

**Alun Pugh:** Nid yw'r trefniadau cludiant i fae Caerdydd yn hollol annerbyniol, i ddefnyddio eich geiriau chi, ond mae'n bosibl eu gwella. Mae dwsinau o fysiau a threnau'n dod i mewn i'r bae. Bydd y gwasanaeth trên, fel yr eglurais yn fy natganiad ddoe, yn arbennig trenau hwyr yn y nos, yn gwella pan symudwn i'r amserlen patrwm safonol. Bydd darparu parc ceir mawr yn welliant sylweddol, ond o ystyried eich record chi o yrru mewn parciau ceir, gobeithio y byddant yn eich gadael i mewn.

**Leighton Andrews:** Hoffwn ddiolch ichi am eich cefnogaeth i wasanaethau trên hwyrach o'r Cymoedd i Gaerdydd ar gyfer pobl sydd am ymweld â'r Ganolfan. Fodd bynnag, apeliâf arnoch chi a'ch cyd-Weinidogion i barhau i bwysu ar y cwmnïau trenau a'r Ganolfan i sicrhau y cawn wasanaethau hwyrach hyd yn oed i'm hetholwyr.

**Alun Pugh:** Gwn fod mater trenau hwyr yn y nos o Gaerdydd i'r Cymoedd yn bwysig i'r Ganolfan, ond mae hefyd yn bwysig i'r rheini sydd am gael noson allan yng Nghaerdydd, nid yn unig i ymweld â'n canolfan nodedig. Bydd y sefyllfa'n gwella pan gawn yr amserlen patrwm safonol newydd honno. Mae Andrew Davies yn cadw llygad craff ar hyn, a byddwn yn cael trafodaethau rheolaidd gyda Threnau Arriva Cymru.

The provision of trains even later might be a problem because of the overnight possessions that are sometimes required for essential maintenance work so that the early-morning commuter trains can get people down into the capital for their day's work.

Gallai darparu trenau hyd yn oed yn hwyrach fod yn broblem oherwydd yr angen am gadw trenau dros nos weithiau er mwyn gwneud gwaith cynnal a chadw hanfodol, fel y gall trenau cymudwyr cynnar gludo pobl i lawr i'r brifddinas i'w gwaith bob dydd.

### **Cyfleusterau Nofio Swimming Facilities**

**Q7 Carl Sargeant:** Will the Minister make a statement on swimming facilities in Wales?  
OAO0316(CWS)

**C7 Carl Sargeant:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar gyfleusterau nofio yng Nghymru?  
OAO0316(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** The Sports Council for Wales has a responsibility for developing and improving sports facilities throughout Wales. We already have the magnificent Wales national pool in Swansea, and closer to both our constituencies is the proposed new 25m, eight-lane swimming pool in Llandudno. When that is completed, it will have a major and positive impact on swimming in north Wales.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae'n gyfrifoldeb ar Gyngor Chwaraeon Cymru i ddatblygu a gwella cyfleusterau chwaraeon ledled Cymru. Mae gennym eisoes y pwll nofio cenedlaethol gwych i Gymru yn Abertawe, ac yn nes i'ch etholaeth chi a'm hetholaeth innau mae'r pwll nofio newydd 25m wyth-lôn yn Llandudno. Ar ôl ei gwblhau, bydd yn cael effaith fawr a chadarnhaol ar nofio yn y Gogledd.

3.00 p.m.

**Carl Sargeant:** You and your Cabinet colleagues should be congratulated on your decision to provide free swimming for young children and older people. It is an excellent facility, which is a result of Labour Party policy. Do you agree that this is an excellent opportunity for Flintshire County Council and the Buckley town councillors, under the excellent stewardship of Alex Aldridge, in light of the grand opening of the Buckley swimming baths that will take place in the next few weeks?

**Carl Sargeant:** Dylid eich llongyfarch chi a'ch cyd-Weinidogion yn y Cabinet am eich penderfyniad i ddarparu nofio am ddim i blant ifanc a phobl hŷn. Mae'n gyfleuster ardderchog, o ganlyniad i bolisi'r Blaid Lafur. A gytunwch fod hyn yn gyfle ardderchog i Gyngor Sir y Fflint a chynghorwyr tref Bwcle, o dan arweinyddiaeth ardderchog Alex Aldridge, yng ngoleuni agor pwll nofio Bwcle yn ystod yr ychydig wythnosau nesaf?

**Alun Pugh:** Free swimming is a manifesto commitment of this Government, and we were delighted to turn that promise into reality. I am sure that schoolchildren in Wales will be looking forward to getting involved in a fun and healthy activity during their school holidays this summer. The new swimming facility in Buckley will have a major impact on your constituents, and I look forward to it being full of children enjoying their free swimming during the summer.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae nofio am ddim yn un o ymrwymadau maniffesto'r Llywodraeth hon, ac yr oeddem wrth ein bodd yn gwireddu'r addewid hwnnw. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd plant ysgol yng Nghymru yn edrych ymlaen at gymryd rhan mewn gweithgareddau hwyliog ac iach yn ystod eu gwyliau haf eleni. Caiff y cyfleuster nofio newydd ym Mwcle effaith fawr ar eich etholwyr, ac edrychaf ymlaen at ei weld yn llawn plant yn mwynhau'r cyfle i nofio am ddim yn ystod yr haf.

**Laura Anne Jones:** During the recent hot weather, there have been some well-publicised unfortunate accidents involving

**Laura Anne Jones:** Yn ystod y tywydd poeth yn ddiweddar, bu rhai damweiniau anffodus a gafodd lawer o sylw pan aeth pobl ifanc i mewn

young people going into rivers and lakes to cool down. Some young people have got into severe difficulties because they are not competent swimmers. With this in mind, what is your Government doing to train and encourage swimming teachers, and to ensure that swimming lessons are part of the so-called free swimming initiative?

**Alun Pugh:** I agree that rivers and lakes are dangerous places. They may be tempting places, but they can be intensely dangerous, especially in hot weather. The air temperature might be warm, but the lake temperature, even on the hottest day, can be very cold and can cause all sorts of problems. There have, unfortunately, been many instances of people getting into serious trouble and drowning. That is one of the reasons why Labour has a free swimming scheme; we want to improve the technical ability of our young children. There are lessons in schools, but free extra practice during the school holidays is an excellent thing.

**David Lloyd:** Beth ydych yn ei wneud i wella mynediad i byllau nofio mewn ardaloedd gwledig?

**Alun Pugh:** That is an issue that we will look at when we get the definitive results of our audit of the free swimming scheme, not only for schoolchildren, but for senior citizens. Access can be difficult where people live considerable distances from pools, and this is not something that is susceptible to a quick fix. A number of local authorities have put on free buses, in addition to the free transport that Labour provides for pensioners. Those buses are not always as busy as we would hope. This is a complex problem.

**Janice Gregory:** This is a wonderful policy that has been welcomed throughout Wales. Do you share my disappointment that the rainbow alliance of Bridgend County Borough Council consistently refuses to fully engage with this policy?

**Alun Pugh:** Some local authorities have an excellent record; they have not just delivered our manifesto promise, but have put on extra activities such as free dry sports—a very imaginative approach on which I congratulate them. However, you are right to say that

i afonydd a llynnoedd i oeri. Aeth rhai pobl ifanc i drafferthion mawr am nad oeddent yn nofwyr da. Gan gadw hyn mewn cof, beth mae eich Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i hyfforddi ac annog athrawon nofio, a sicrhau bod gwersi nofio yn rhan o'r fenter nofio am ddim, fel y'i gelwir?

**Alun Pugh:** Cytunaf fod afonydd a llynnoedd yn lleoedd peryglus. Gallant fod yn lleoedd deniadol, ond gallant fod yn hynod beryglus, yn arbennig mewn tywydd poeth. Gall tymheredd yr aer fod yn gynnes, ond gall tymheredd y llyn, hyd yn oed ar y diwrnod poethaf, fod yn oer iawn ac achosi pob math o broblemau. Yn anffodus, bu nifer o achosion pan aeth pobl i drafferthion mawr a boddi. Dyna un o'r rhesymau pam mae gan Lafur gynllun nofio am ddim; yr ydym am wella gallu technegol ein plant ifanc. Mae yna wersi mewn ysgolion, ond mae ymarfer ychwanegol am ddim yn ystod gwyliau'r ysgol yn beth ardderchog.

**David Lloyd:** What are you doing to improve access to swimming pools in rural areas?

**Alun Pugh:** Mae hynny'n fater y byddwn yn ei ystyried pan gawn ganlyniadau terfynol ein harchwiliad o'r cynllun nofio am ddim, nid yn unig ar gyfer plant ysgol, ond ar gyfer pobl hŷn. Gall mynediad fod yn anodd pan fydd pobl yn byw gryn bellter o byllau, ac nid oes ateb cyflym i hynny. Mae nifer o awdurdodau lleol wedi darparu bysiau am ddim, yn ogystal â'r cludiant am ddim a gaiff ei ddarparu gan Lafur ar gyfer pensïynwyr. Nid yw'r bysiau hynny bob amser mor brysur ag y byddem yn ei obeithio. Mae hyn yn broblem gymhleth.

**Janice Gregory:** Mae hwn yn bolisi gwych sydd wedi cael croeso ledled Cymru. A ydych chi, fel finnau, yn siomedig fod y gynghrair amryliw ar Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr yn dal i wrthod cymryd rhan lawn yn y polisi hwn?

**Alun Pugh:** Mae gan rai awdurdodau lleol record ardderchog. Maent nid yn unig wedi cyflawni addewid ein maniffesto, ond maent hefyd wedi darparu gweithgareddau ychwanegol megis chwaraeon sych am ddim—dull llawn dychymyg yr wyf yn eu llongyfarch



some local authorities have done the absolute minimum.

amdano. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych yn gywir i ddweud mai dim ond y lleiafswm lleiaf sydd wedi ei wneud gan rai awdurdodau lleol.

### **Amcanestyniadau Ariannol ar gyfer Stadiwm y Mileniwm Caerdydd Financial Projections for Cardiff's Millennium Stadium**

**Q8 Jonathan Morgan:** What financial projections for Cardiff's Millennium Stadium has the Minister made following the opening of the new Wembley Stadium? OAQ0302(CWS)

**C8 Jonathan Morgan:** Pa amcanestyniadau ariannol ar gyfer Stadiwm y Mileniwm Caerdydd y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u gwneud yn dilyn agor stadiwm newydd Wembley? OAQ0302(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** I have made no such projections because it is not our stadium.

**Alun Pugh:** Nid wyf wdi gwneud unrhyw amcanestyniadau o'r fath gan nad ein stadiwm ni ydyw.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I appreciate your response, Minister, but do you agree that once the new Wembley Stadium opens, the Millennium Stadium could lose certain events? Do you also agree that the stadium has been instrumental in marketing Cardiff and Wales as an ideal tourist destination and as somewhere that is good for sport and for business? Do you think that all of that good work could be in jeopardy?

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yr wyf yn gwerthfawri eich ymateb, Weinidog, ond a gytunwch, pan gaiff Stadiwm newydd Wembley ei agor, y gallai Stadiwm y Mileniwm gollu rhai digwyddiadau? A gytunwch hefyd fod y stadiwm wedi chwarae rhan bwysig wrth farchnata Caerdydd a Chymru fel cyrchfan ddelfrydol i dwristiaid, ac fel lle da ar gyfer chwaraeon ac ar gyfer busnes? A ydych yn credu y gallai'r holl waith caled hwnnw fod mewn perygl?

**Alun Pugh:** You were right to say that it has been a very popular tourist attraction and a powerful contributor to the regional economy of south Wales. However, you used the word 'lose', but the stadium will not lose any events as a result of the completion of the new Wembley Stadium because it was always intended that the football and other events that were previously staged at Wembley would return there when the new stadium is completed.

**Alun Pugh:** Yr oeddech yn iawn i ddweud ei fod yn atyniad poblogaidd iawn i dwristiaid ac wedi gwneud cyfraniad mawr i economi ranbarthol y De. Fodd bynnag, yr oeddech yn defnyddio'r gair 'colli'. Ond ni fydd y stadiwm yn colli unrhyw ddigwyddiadau oherwydd cwblhau Stadiwm newydd Wembley, gan mai'r bwriad erioed oedd y byddai'r gemau pêl-droed a'r digwyddiadau eraill a arferai gael eu cynnal yn Wembley yn dychwelyd yno pan gâi'r stadiwm newydd ei gwblhau.

**Owen John Thomas:** A survey carried out in 2001 revealed that the first FA Cup final in Cardiff generated between £10 million and £12 million for the local economy. Since then, this figure has increased year on year. You seem reluctant to take forward my proposal to bid for the European Champions League final to come to Cardiff in 2008. I do not believe that UEFA's guidelines on this matter are cast in stone. Will you try again, and press the case for Cardiff, with all its wonderful amenities, to host this prestigious event?

**Owen John Thomas:** Dangosodd arolwg a wnaed yn 2001 fod rownd derfynol Cwpan yr FA a gynhaliwyd yng Nghaerdydd y tro cyntaf wedi cynhyrchu rhwng £10 miliwn a £12 miliwn i'r economi leol. Ers hynny, mae'r ffigur hwnnw wedi cynyddu bob blwyddyn. Ymddengys eich bod yn amharod i dderbyn fy nghynnig i wneud cais am gynnal gêm derfynol Cynghrair Pencampwyr Ewrop yng Nghaerdydd yn 2008. Ni chredaf fod canllawiau UEFA ar y mater hwn yn bendant. A wnewch chi geisio eto, a phwysleisio achos Caerdydd, gyda'i holl amwynderau, i gynnal y digwyddiad pwysig hwn?

**Alun Pugh:** As I have explained to you on several occasions—you do not seem to be able to grasp it—the Millennium Stadium is perfect in terms of its play surface, it is excellent in terms of the spectator facilities, but there is a major problem with the sheer scale of hospitality for that major European Champions League game. For games below that, such as the UEFA game, it is suitable. Welsh Assembly Government investment has secured the Heineken Cup final for 2006 for the Millennium Stadium. Given that, taken together with events such as the U2 concert, which will take place at the Millennium Stadium tonight, I am convinced of the powerful effect that having that landmark stadium has on south Wales. That is why we continue to selectively support events there.

**Janice Gregory:** I place on record my thanks to you for your efforts and those of your officials to ensure that the D.C. Thomas Cup game was played in the Millennium Stadium. As you know, the D.C. Thomas Cup is played for by the Bridgend and district schools league. Unfortunately, they were not able to play at the Millennium Stadium, but will you consider the arrangements for next year so that these young players are not disappointed again that they cannot play on the national field?

**Alun Pugh:** I know that many of your constituents were greatly disappointed when they could not get on to the turf of our national stadium. Ultimately, it is a matter for the stadium authorities, but I am happy to write to them on your behalf.

**Alun Pugh:** Fel yr wyf wedi esbonio wrthydd droeon—ymddengys nad ydych yn deall y pwynt hwn—mae Stadiwm y Mileniwm yn berffaith o ran y man chwarae, mae'n ardderchog o ran cyfleusterau i'r dorf, ond mae problem fawr o ran maint y lletygarwch ar gyfer y gêm bwysig honno yng Nghyngair Pencampwyr Ewrop. Ar gyfer gemau islaw'r lefel honno, megis gêm UEFA, mae'n addas. Mae buddsoddiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi sicrhau gêm derfynol Cwpan Heineken ar gyfer 2006 yn Stadiwm y Mileniwm. O gofio hynny, ynghyd â digwyddiadau megis cyngerdd U2, a fydd yn digwydd yn Stadiwm y Mileniwm heno, yr wyf wedi fy argyhoeddi am effaith rymus cael stadiwm nodedig ar y De. Dyna pam yr ydym yn parhau i gefnogi detholiad o ddigwyddiadau yno.

**Janice Gregory:** Hoffwn gofnodi fy niolch ichi am eich ymdrechion ac ymdrechion eich swyddogion i sicrhau bod Cwpan D.C. Thomas wedi ei chwarae yn Stadiwm y Mileniwm. Fel y gwyddoch, cystadleuaeth ar gyfer cynghrair ysgolion Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr a'r cylch yw Cwpan D.C. Thomas. Yn anffodus, nid oeddent yn gallu chwarae yn Stadiwm y Mileniwm, ond a ystyriwch y trefniadau ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf, fel na chaiff y chwaraewyr ifanc hyn eu siomi eto am nad ydynt yn gallu chwarae ar y maes cenedlaethol?

**Alun Pugh:** Gwn fod nifer o'ch etholwyr yn siomedig iawn am nad oeddent yn gallu chwarae ar faes ein stadiwm cenedlaethol. Yn y pen draw, mater i awdurdodau'r stadiwm ydyw, ond yr wyf yn fwy na pharod i ysgrifennu atynt ar eich rhan.

### **Hyrwyddo'r Iaith Gymraeg yn Sir Gaerfyrddin The Promotion of the Welsh language in Carmarthenshire**

**C9 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Pa drafodaethau diweddar y mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cynnal ynglŷn â hyrwyddo'r iaith Gymraeg yn Sir Gaerfyrddin? OAQ0332(CWS)

**Q9 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** What recent discussions has the Minister had regarding the promotion of the Welsh language in Carmarthenshire? OAQ0332(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gweithio'n galed i greu Cymru ddwyieithog, a hynny drwy hybu'r Gymraeg ym mhob rhan o Gymru, gan gynnwys Sir Gaerfyrddin.

**Alun Pugh:** The Welsh Assembly Government is working hard to create a bilingual Wales by promoting the Welsh language in every part of Wales, including Carmarthenshire.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae'n siŵr gennyf y

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I am sure you will

derbyniwch mai yn Sir Gaerfyrddin y mae'r nifer fwyaf o siaradwyr Cymraeg. O dderbyn y theori o'r lliaws tyngedfennol sy'n angenrheidiol er mwyn cynnal y Gymraeg fel iaith hyfyw, gobeithiaf eich bod yn derbyn bod Sir Gaerfyrddin yn sir eithriadol o bwysig o ran dyfodol y Gymraeg. A dderbyniwch bod methiant Cyngor Sir Gaerfyrddin i gydweithio â Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg ar nifer o bethau yn ddiweddar, yn fater o dristwch? Fel Gweinidog, a wnewch chi ymyrryd i sicrhau bod y cyngor sir yn cydweithredu'n llawn â Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg?

**Alun Pugh:** You will understand that I may well have a statutory adjudicatory role on this matter, therefore I cannot comment.

accept that Carmarthenshire has the greatest number of Welsh speakers. Accepting the theory of the critical mass that is essential to sustain Welsh as a viable language, I hope you will accept that Carmarthenshire is an exceptionally important county in terms of the future of the Welsh language. Do you accept that Carmarthenshire County Council's failure to co-operate with the Welsh Language Board on a number of issues recently is disappointing? As Minister, will you ensure that the county council co-operates fully with the Welsh Language Board?

**Alun Pugh:** Byddwch yn deall y gall fod gennyf rôl ddyfarnu statudol ar y mater hwn. Felly, ni allaf wneud sylwadau.

### **Cwestiynau i Gynrychiolydd Pwyllgor y Tŷ Questions to the Representative of the House Committee**

#### **Cyfleuster Meithrinfa yn Adeilad y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Crèche Facility at the National Assembly Building**

**Q1 Owen John Thomas:** A wnaiff Cynrychiolydd Pwyllgor y Tŷ ddatganiad ar ddarparu cyfleuster meithrinfa yn adeilad y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol? OAQ0006(HC)

**Janice Gregory:** As a member of the House Committee you will be aware that a survey is to be issued shortly to seek the views of Assembly Members and staff on the demand for a crèche.

**Owen John Thomas:** Gobeithiaf y bydd yr arolwg yn cynnwys cwestiwn fydd yn galluogi'r rhai sydd am gael gofal cyfrwng Cymraeg i'w plant fynegi hynny. Hynny yw, gobeithiaf y bydd yn feithrinfa ddwyieithog lle bydd yn bosibl i blant siarad Cymraeg a Saesneg gyda'r bobl sy'n gofalu amdanynt.

**Janice Gregory:** That is an important point. I am sure that that will have been heard loud and clear. The survey has not yet been issued. I would hope that consideration will be given to that matter. If there is demand, I am sure that the House Committee will look sympathetically at providing a crèche facility in this building.

**C1 Owen John Thomas:** Will the representative of the House Committee make a statement on the provision of a crèche facility in the National Assembly building? OAQ0006(HC)

**Janice Gregory:** Fel aelod o Bwyllgor y Tŷ, gwyddoch fod arolwg ar fin cael ei ddsbarthu i ofyn am farn Aelodau'r Cynulliad a'r staff ar y galw am feithrinfa.

**Owen John Thomas:** I hope the survey will include a question which will allow those who want to have their children cared for through the medium of Welsh to express that wish. That is, I hope it will be a bilingual crèche where children can speak with their carers in Welsh and in English.

**Janice Gregory:** Mae hwnnw'n bwynt pwysig. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd pawb wedi clywed hynny. Nid yw'r arolwg wedi'i ddsbarthu eto. Gobeithio y bydd y mater hwnnw'n cael ei ystyried. Os bydd galw, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Pwyllgor y Tŷ yn ystyried gyda chydymdeimlad ddarparu cyfleuster meithrinfa yn yr adeilad hwn.

3.10 p.m.

**Kirsty Williams:** As well as providing crèche facilities for those working within this building, would you consider the Scottish experience? Open access is provided to people visiting the Scottish Parliament, so they can bring their children with them, whether they are visiting, giving evidence, or participating in some aspect of the Scottish Parliament's work.

**Janice Gregory:** Yes, absolutely. When the original survey went out, there was no demand for a crèche facility within this building. We must understand that to provide crèche facilities costs public money. It is vital that we look outside of this building, so as to encourage visitors not only to come here, but to visit the Millennium Centre, so that they can have a double experience. With the new debating chamber coming onstream, we could encourage people to have the Cardiff bay experience, as it were, and as a member of the House Committee, I would be delighted to see us providing crèche facilities for all types of visitors here. I understand that the committee members that went to Scotland were very impressed by facilities there.

**Alun Cairns:** I note that, in your response to Kirsty Williams, you mentioned that a survey had gone out. I do not recall a survey having been done for some time. Let us not forget that these types of surveys would have to be conducted on a regular basis—even every nine months.

**Janice Gregory:** I cannot think why you put that timeframe on it, Alun. Let me clarify the situation. The survey has not yet gone out, but it is due to go out imminently. I accept that perhaps we should conduct a survey more often. The fact that the new debating chamber is coming onstream releases space within this building, so we can look creatively at what we have available.

**Kirsty Williams:** Yn ogystal â darparu cyfleusterau meithrinfa i'r rhai sy'n gweithio yn yr adeilad hwn, a ystyriwch brofiad yr Alban? Darperir mynediad agored i bobl sy'n ymweld â Senedd yr Alban, fel y gallant ddod â'u plant gyda hwy, p'un a ydynt yn ymweld â'r adeilad, yn rhoi tystiolaeth, neu'n cymryd rhan mewn rhyw agwedd ar waith Senedd yr Alban.

**Janice Gregory:** Gwnaf, yn sicr. Pan ddosbarthwyd yr arolwg gwreiddiol, nid oedd galw am gyfleuster meithrinfa yn yr adeilad hwn. Rhaid inni ddeall bod darparu cyfleusterau meithrinfa yn costio arian cyhoeddus. Mae'n hollbwysig inni edrych y tu allan i'r adeilad hwn, er mwyn annog ymwelwyr nid yn unig i ddod yma, ond i ymweld â Chanolfan y Mileniwm, i gael dau brofiad ar yr un pryd. A'r siambr ddadlau newydd ar fin cael ei chwblhau, gallem annog pobl Caerdydd i gael profiad o Fae Caerdydd, fel petai. Ac fel aelod o Bwyllgor y Tŷ, byddwn yn falch gweld cyfleusterau meithrinfa yn cael eu darparu gennym ar gyfer pob math o ymwelwyr yma. Deallaf fod y cyfleusterau yn yr Alban wedi gwneud argraff fawr ar aelodau'r pwyllgor a aeth yno.

**Alun Cairns:** Sylwaf yn eich ymateb i Kirsty Williams ichi gyfeirio at y ffaith fod arolwg wedi cael ei ddosbarthu. Ni chofiaf arolwg yn cael ei wneud ers cryn amser. Ni ddylem anghofio y byddai'n rhaid i'r mathau hyn o arolygon gael eu gwneud yn rheolaidd—bob naw mis, hyd yn oed.

**Janice Gregory:** Ni allaf feddwl pam yr ydych yn cynnig y terfyn amser hwnnw, Alun. Gadewch imi egluro'r sefyllfa. Nid yw'r arolwg wedi'i ddosbarthu eto, ond mae ar fin cael ei ddosbarthu. Derbyniaf y dylem gael arolwg yn amlach, efallai. Mae'r ffaith fod y siambr ddadlau newydd ar fin cael ei chwblhau yn rhyddhau lle yn yr adeilad hwn. Felly, gallwn edrych yn greadigol yr hyn sydd ar gael inni.

### **Datganiad ar Sony Statement on Sony**

**The Minister for Economic Development Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a**

**and Transport (Andrew Davies):** I am sure that all Members, as I am, will be extremely disappointed to hear the announcement that Sony is to cease produce cathode-ray-tube-based televisions at its sites at Bridgend and Pencoed. Our thoughts are with those affected by this announcement. With our Team Wales partners, we are leading a rapid-response team to provide support for those affected by today's announcement, which is the result of a rapid and irreversable decline in European demand for CRT-based technologies. These jobs will not be relocated anywhere else; it is purely a matter of this product ceasing production.

The closure of the Bridgend facility will mean the loss of 400 jobs, and of 250 related jobs at the Pencoed plant. Three hundred employees will be retained at the Pencoed site, which will focus largely on the production of high-technology camera systems.

In addition, we will work closely with the company at the highest levels to identify and develop further opportunities for the Pencoed site. These could include extra work within the areas of service, logistics and customer-support facilities. However, we will also be working with top management to explore opportunities for high-end work, which will build on Pencoed's excellent reputation within the Sony group. We will also redouble our efforts to identify commercial opportunities arising from the company's link with the digital technium at the University of Wales Swansea.

We are also looking at any impact on the Sony supply chain, and, where appropriate, will offer support for diversification to companies affected by today's announcement. The company has publicly praised the excellent performance of the manufacturing facility at Bridgend, and has stressed that this very difficult decision in no way reflects upon the performance of the employees at the plants in south Wales. I echo those sentiments, and pay tribute to the quality of the Sony workforce.

I am also conscious that the job reductions will have an impact on the local economy.

**Thrafnidiaeth (Andrew Davies):** Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd pob Aelod, fel finnau, yn hynod siomedig i glywed y cyhoeddiad fod Sony yn rhoi'r gorau i gynhyrchu setiau teledu tiwb pelydryn cathod ar ei safleoedd ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr a Phen-coed. Yr ydym yn cydymdeimlo â'r rhai yr effeithir arnynt gan y cyhoeddiad hwn. Ynghyd â'n partneriaid yn Nhîm Cymru, yr ydym yn arwain tîm ymateb cyflym i roi cymorth i'r rhai yr effeithir arnynt gan y cyhoeddiad heddiw, sy'n deillio o ostyngiad sydyn a diwrthdro yn y galw yn Ewrop am dechnolegau sy'n seiliedig ar CRT. Nid yw'r swyddi hyn yn cael eu symud i unman arall. Yn syml iawn, mae'r cwppi yn rhoi'r gorau i gynhyrchu'r nwydd hwn.

Bydd cau'r cyfleuster ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr yn arwain at golli 400 o swyddi, a 250 o swyddi cysylltiedig yn y gwaith ym Mhen-coed. Bydd 300 o weithwyr yn cadw eu swyddi ar safle Pen-coed, a fydd yn canolbwyntio'n bennaf ar gynhyrchu systemau camera uwch-dechnoleg.

Yn ogystal, byddwn yn gweithio'n agos gyda'r cwppi ar y lefel uchaf i nodi a datblygu cyfleoedd eraill i safle Pen-coed. Gallai'r rhain gynnwys gwaith ychwanegol ym meysydd gwasanaeth, logisteg a chyfleusterau cymorth i gwsmeriaid. Fodd bynnag, byddwn hefyd yn gweithio gyda'r uwch reolwyr i ystyried cyfleoedd i gynhyrchu nwyddau soffistigedig, a fydd yn adeiladu ar enw gwych Pen-coed o fewn grŵp Sony. Byddwn hefyd yn ymdrechu o'r newydd i nodi cyfleoedd masnachol sy'n codi o gysylltiad y cwppi â'r technium digidol ym Mhrifysgol Cymru Abertawe.

Yr ydym hefyd yn ystyried unrhyw effaith ar gadwyn gyflenwi Sony, a lle bydd yn briodol byddwn yn cynnig cymorth i gwmnïau yr effeithir arnynt gan y cyhoeddiad heddiw i arallgyfeirio. Mae'r cwppi wedi canmol yn gyhoeddus berfformiad ardderchog y cyfleuster gweithgynhyrchu ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, ac wedi pwysleisio bod hwn yn benderfyniad anodd iawn nad yw'n adlewyrchiad o gwbl ar berfformiad y gweithwyr yn y ffatrioedd yn y De. Ategaf y sylwadau hynny, ac yr wyf yn rhoi teyrnged i safon gweithlu Sony.

Yr wyf hefyd yn ymwybodol y bydd y gostyngiad yn nifer y swyddi yn cael effaith ar

We will, again with our Team Wales partners, consider what might be done to reduce this impact. I can confirm today that the Welsh European Funding Office will bring forward for immediate appraisal the proposed development of Bridgend town centre, which was originally submitted for Objective 1 funding. Bridgend was the next project on the reserve list for town centre redevelopment, and WEFO has confirmed that sufficient funds are now available to bring it forward.

In conclusion, our officials are already in discussion with the director for European operations at Sony, and I will be speaking to Sir Howard Stringer, the chief executive officer of Sony, to reinforce that we will do our utmost to build on the company's development at Pen-coed.

**Janet Davies:** First of all, I join the Minister in expressing sympathy for the workforce and their families. It is always a very hard time when something like this happens. As you say, Minister, this has been an excellent workforce, and there is nothing but praise for them.

I am also pleased to see that Team Wales has a rapid-response team going in. However, there has been local awareness for many months that these jobs were likely to go. Therefore, given that everyone knew that this would come about because of the change of product, has any attempt been made to encourage the development of an alternative product by you or by the Welsh Development Agency? Although I welcome the development of Bridgend town centre, that is hardly a replacement for these sorts of jobs. I believe that the WDA visited Sony yesterday, so it seemed rather unfortunate that you were not aware in the Economic Development and Transport Committee meeting, just after 9 a.m. this morning, about these job losses. I was also quite alarmed by your statement in committee that the WDA's international division had seen a collapse in its performance, which included safeguarding what must be these sorts of jobs. Therefore, given that you have ordered a due diligence review of the WDA's international division, what will you do in the immediate future to encourage the replacement of these jobs, and

yr economi leol. Unwaith yn rhagor, gyda'n partneriaid yn Nhîm Cymru byddwn yn ystyried yr hyn y gellid ei wneud i leihau'r effaith hon. Gallaf gadarnhau heddiw y bydd Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru yn dechrau ar unwaith ar y gwaith o werthuso'r cynnig i ddatblygu canol tref Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr, a gyflwynwyd yn wreiddiol ar gyfer arian Amcan 1. Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr oedd y prosiect nesaf ar y rhestr wrth gefn ar gyfer ailddatblygu canol trefi, ac mae'r Swyddfa wedi cadarnhau bod digon o arian ar gael bellach i'w roi ar waith.

I gloi, mae ein swyddogion eisoes yn cael trafodaethau gyda chyfarwyddwr gweithrediadau Ewrop Sony, a byddaf yn siarad â Syr Howard Stringer, prif swyddog gweithredol Sony, i bwysleisio y byddwn yn gwneud ein gorau glas i adeiladu ar ddatblygiad y cwmni ym Mhen-coed.

**Janet Davies:** Yn gyntaf oll, ymunaf â'r Gweinidog i gydymdeimlo â'r gweithlu a'u teuluoedd. Mae hi bob amser yn anodd iawn pan fydd rhywbeth fel hyn yn digwydd. Fel y dywedwch, Weinidog, mae hwn wedi bod yn weithlu ardderchog, ac ni chaiff ddim byd ond canmoliaeth.

Yr wyf hefyd yn falch o weld bod Tîm Cymru yn anfon ei dîm ymateb cyflym. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd pobl leol yn ymwybodol ers misoedd lawer fod y swyddi hyn yn debygol o gael eu colli. Felly, o gofio bod pawb yn gwybod y byddai hyn yn digwydd oherwydd newid cynnyrch, a ydych chi neu Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru wedi gwneud unrhyw ymgais i annog datblygu cynnyrch gwahanol? Er fy mod yn croesawu datblygu canol tref Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr, prin bod hynny'n gwneud iawn am gollir'r math hwn o swyddi. Credaf fod WDA wedi ymweld â Sony ddoe, felly, ymddengys yn anffodus braidd nad oeddech yn ymwybodol yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth, ychydig wedi 9 a.m. y bore yma, fod y swyddi hyn wedi eu colli. Testun cryn fraw i mi hefyd oedd eich datganiad yn y pwyllgor fod perfformiad isadran ryngwladol WDA wedi dirywio'n sylweddol, a oedd yn cynnwys diogelu'r math hwn o swyddi, mae'n rhaid. Felly, o gofio eich bod wedi gofyn am adolygiad diwydrwydd dyladwy o isadran ryngwladol WDA, beth fyddwch yn ei wneud yn awr i gael swyddi newydd yn lle'r rhai a gollwyd, ac i ddiogelu

safeguard any others—the ones that remain in Pencoed, for example? What exactly is Team Wales going to do? Finally, can you give me any information on the repayment of the grants that I understand have been paid recently to Sony?

**Andrew Davies:** I will answer your last question first. My officials are considering the issue of regional selective assistance. We have supported the company over the years in terms of developing its facility in Pencoed, and will be looking at whether the company is still within the grant conditions, and whether there will be any clawback. Therefore, that gives the lie to the suggestion that we have not been working with the company. It is clear that, if you have a facility that is making what is now relatively old technology, such as cathode-ray-tube television screens, and people like you and me, and many people in this Chamber, are buying flat plasma, or liquid crystal display screens—not everyone, but some—that affects matters. That is why the company made it clear that it is ceasing production. It is not a question of relocating the jobs or production elsewhere.

We have been in consultation with the company for some time, exploring opportunities for further investment. The digital technium satellite at Pencoed, linking to the University of Wales Swansea, is an example of that co-operation. I will clarify one point; what I said in committee this morning was that I was not willing to comment on press speculation, which is all that it was at that time. My officials have been in discussion, along with the WDA, with the company. The company had made us aware of its intention to make this announcement, which, I believe, was originally to be made tomorrow, and therefore I was just commenting that it was press speculation and I had not, at that time in committee, seen the company's statement. That statement has now been made, which is why I am making this oral statement this afternoon.

On working with Sony, I have said already that I will be seeking an early conversation and, I hope, an early meeting with Sir Howard Stringer to look at what we can do

unrhyw swyddi eraill—y rhai sydd ar ôl ym Mhen-coed, er enghraifft? Beth yn union y mae Tîm Cymru yn mynd i'w wneud? Yn olaf, a allwch roi unrhyw wybodaeth imi am ad-dalu'r grantiau a roddwyd i Sony yn ddiweddar, yn ôl y deallaf?

**Andrew Davies:** Atebaf y cwestiwn olaf yn gyntaf. Mae fy swyddogion wrthi'n ystyried cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol. Yr ydym wedi rhoi cymorth i'r cwmni ar hyd y blynyddoedd o ran datblygu ei gyfleuster ym Mhen-coed, a byddwn yn edrych i weld a yw'r cwmni wedi cadw at amodau grantiau, ac a fydd modd adennill unrhyw arian. Felly, mae hynny'n gwrthbrofi'r awgrym nad ydym wedi bod yn gweithio gyda'r cwmni. Mae'n amlwg, os yw cyfleuster yn cynhyrchu'r hyn sy'n gymharol hen yn dechnolegol, megis sgriniau teledu tiwb pelydryn cathod, a bod pobl fel chi a mi, a nifer o bobl yn y Siambr hon, yn prynu sgriniau plasma gwastad, neu sgriniau ag arddangosfeydd crisial hylifol—nid pawb, ond rhai—fod hynny'n effeithio ar bethau. Dyna pam yr eglurodd y cwmni ei fod yn rhoi'r gorau i weithgynhyrchu'r cynnyrch hwn. Nid mater o symud swyddi neu brosesau cynhyrchu ydyw.

Yr ydym wedi bod yn ymgynghori â'r cwmni ers cryn amser, gan ystyried cyfleoedd ar gyfer buddsoddi pellach. Mae'r lloeren technium digidol ym Mhen-coed, sy'n cysylltu â Phrifysgol Cymru Abertawe, yn enghraifft o'r cydweithrediad hwnnw. Hoffwn egluro un pwynt: yr hyn a ddywedais yn y pwyllgor y bore yma oedd nad oeddwn yn barod i wneud sylwadau am y dyfalu yn y wasg, a dyfalu yn unig ydoedd bryd hynny. Bu fy swyddogion yn trafod, ynghyd â WDA, gyda'r cwmni. Yr oedd y cwmni wedi dweud wrthym ei fod yn bwriadu gwneud y cyhoeddiad hwn, a oedd i gael ei wneud yfory yn wreiddiol, mi gredaf, ac felly dweud yr oeddwn mai dyfalu yn y wasg ydoedd ac nad oeddwn bryd hynny yn y pwyllgor wedi gweld datganiad y cwmni. Mae'r datganiad hwnnw wedi'i wneud erbyn hyn, a dyna pam yr wyf yn gwneud y datganiad llafar hwn y prynhawn yma.

O ran gweithio gyda Sony, yr wyf eisoes wedi dweud y byddaf yn ceisio siarad yn fuan â Syr Howard Stringer, a chael cyfarfod gydag ef, gobeithio, yn fuan i edrych ar yr hyn y gallwn ei

with Sony. However, we will be working with the WDA and other stakeholders to see what we can do to create more employment opportunities in the Bridgend travel-to-work area. Earlier this year, I opened the new LogicaCMG facilities in Bridgend, which is now its European headquarters for outsourcing. With financial assistance from my budget, it will be creating 750 jobs and is currently recruiting. I know that it will be interested in those people affected by this announcement at Sony, as possible vacancies arise at LogicaCMG.

I have made my views on the international division known. I was commenting on the WDA's own internal review, which the chief executive had commissioned, which clearly identified that the international division, in its own words, had significantly underperformed.

3.20 p.m.

A range of measures have been brought forward to restructure and refocus the operations of the international division. Looking at how the market has changed, it was clear from the review that the WDA international division had not responded to changes in the foreign direct investment market—it will be doing so now.

**Janice Gregory:** We have been here before, Minister, as recently as January of this year, when we all expressed our regret at the job losses that Sony was experiencing at that time. I know that further job losses have been the subject of speculation by the workforce. I hope that you will share my dismay at the way in which the story was leaked. I believe, and I am prepared to say, that this story was leaked to the press by a local authority. If that is true, I am absolutely appalled by it because the workforce deserved better and should have been informed by the company. I understand that the company wanted to inform the workforce, as did the trade union, Amicus. I join you in saying that there are no words to describe the devastation that must be felt by the Sony workforce and their families at this time. Sony has been based in the Bridgend county borough area for some 30 years, and its workforce is magnificent.

wneud gyda Sony. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn gweithio gyda WDA a rhanddeiliaid eraill i weld beth y gallwn ei wneud i greu mwy o gyfleoedd cyflogaeth yn ardal teithio i'r gwaith Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr. Yn gynharach eleni, agorais y cyfleusterau LogicaCMG newydd ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, sydd bellach yn bencadlys Ewropeaidd y cwmni ar gyfer gosod contractau. Gyda chymorth ariannol o'm cyllideb, bydd yn creu 750 o swyddi, ac mae wrthi'n recriwtio ar hyn o bryd. Gwn y bydd ganddo ddiddordeb yn y bobl hynny yr effeithir arnynt gan y cyhoeddiad hwn yn Sony, wrth i swyddi gwag posibl godi yn LogicaCMG.

Yr wyf wedi mynegi fy marn am yr is-adran ryngwladol. Yr oeddwn yn gwneud sylwadau am adolygiad mewnol WDA ei hun, a gomisiynwyd gan y prif weithredwr ac a oedd yn nodi'n glir fod yr is-adran ryngwladol, a defnyddio ei eiriau ei hun, wedi tangyflawni'n sylweddol.

Cyflwynwyd amrywiaeth o fesurau i ailstrwythuro ac aildrefnu gweithrediadau'r is-adran ryngwladol. O edrych ar y modd y mae'r farchnad wedi newid, yr oedd yn amlwg o'r adolygiad nad oedd is-adran ryngwladol WDA wedi ymateb i newidiadau yn y farchnad fuddsoddi uniongyrchol dramor—bydd yn gwneud hynny yn awr.

**Janice Gregory:** Yr ydym wedi trafod hyn o'r blaen, Weinidog, a hynny mor ddiweddar â mis Ionawr eleni, pan ddywedodd pob un ohonom ein bod yn gresynu at y colli swyddi yn Sony ar y pryd. Gwn fod y gweithlu wedi bod yn dyfalu ynghylch colli rhagor o swyddi. Gobeithio eich bod chi, fel finnau, yn siomedig ynglŷn â'r ffordd y datgelwyd y stori. Credaf, ac yr wyf yn barod i ddweud, fod y stori hon wedi ei datgelu i'r wasg gan awdurdod lleol. Os yw hynny'n wir, mae'n gwbl warthus oherwydd yr oedd y gweithlu'n haeddu gwell, a dylai'r cwmni fod wedi dweud wrthynt. Deallaf fod y cwmni wedi dymuno dweud wrth y gweithlu, ac felly hefyd yr undeb llafur, Amicus. Ymunaf â chi i ddweud nad oes geiriau i ddisgrifio'r trallod y mae'n rhaid bod gweithlu Sony a'u teuluoedd yn ei deimlo ar hyn o bryd. Mae Sony wedi bod yn ardal bwrdeistref sirol Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr ers tua 30 blynedd, ac mae ei weithlu yn rhagorol. Bydd Logica CMG yn ffodus iawn i allu cyflogi



Logica CMG will be very lucky to take on such a highly-skilled, motivated and committed workforce, should it choose to do so.

I am delighted that the Pencoed plant will, as far as possible, be preserved, and I hope, Minister, that you will continue to support that plant and also the diversification of Sony products. I am pleased that my colleague, Carwyn Jones, the Assembly Member for Bridgend, and I have been in touch with the Sony management and the union, and we hope to meet the workforce, management and union as soon as possible to discuss the way forward. You mentioned Howard Stringer, but will you please ensure that not only do you seek a meeting with him, but an urgent meeting, to re-emphasise the Welsh Assembly Government's commitment to a company such as Sony?

**Andrew Davies:** I join you in deploring the fact that it would appear, on the face of it, that this decision was leaked to the press. Such a decision is always difficult to relay to the workforce, but there are appropriate mechanisms for doing so; I believe that the company was going to brief Amicus, with which it has an agreement. Announcing it on the radio this morning was not the right way of doing it, and I join you in deploring whoever was responsible; it is irresponsible and not good practice. Clearly, we would want to work with everybody, and I pay tribute to you and Carwyn for the work that you have done, with the union, in defending the rights of the workers at Pencoed and Bridgend. We would want to work with both of you, the local authority, the WDA and all the stakeholders to ensure that we can soften the blow for the workforce at the Bridgend plant in particular, but also at Pencoed. I will seek an urgent meeting with Sir Howard Stringer—I will speak to him on the phone as soon as possible; I understand that he is Japan at present, but I have already indicated that I will be seeking an early meeting. In the meantime, my officials, and those of the WDA, are in contact with Sony officials at a very senior level in Sony Europe.

**Alun Cairns:** I am grateful to the Minister for his statement, and I echo the comments made about those people who have lost their

gweithlu mor fedrus ac uchel ei gymhelliant ac ymrwymedig, os bydd yn dewis gwneud hynny.

Yr wyf yn falch iawn y bydd ffatri Pen-coed, cyhyd ag y bo modd, yn cael ei chadw a gobeithio, Weinidog, y byddwch yn parhau i gefnogi'r ffatri honno a hefyd y gwaith o arallgyfeirio cynnyrch Sony. Yr wyf yn falch fod fy nghyd-Aelod, Carwyn Jones, yr Aelod Cynulliad dros Ben-y-bont ar Ogwr, a minnau wedi cysylltu â rheolwyr Sony a'r undeb, a gobeithiwn gwrdd â'r gweithlu, y rheolwyr a'r undeb cyn gynted â phosibl i drafod y dyfodol. Yr oeddech yn sôn am Howard Stringer, ond a wnewch chi sicrhau, yn ogystal â cheisio cyfarfod ag ef, y byddwch yn trefnu cyfarfod brys i ail-bwysleisio ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gwmi megis Sony?

**Andrew Davies:** Yr wyf fi fel chithau yn gresynu at y ffaith ei bod yn ymddangos i'r penderfyniad hwn gael ei ddatgelu i'r wasg. Mae penderfyniad o'r fath bob amser yn anodd ei gyfleu i'r gweithlu, ond mae dulliau priodol o wneud hynny; credaf fod y cwmni'n bwriadu briffio Amicus, gan fod mae ganddo gytundeb gydag ef. Nid ei gyhoeddi ar y radio y bore yma oedd y ffordd gywir i wneud hynny, ac yr wyf fi fel chithau yn gresynu at bwy bynnag a fu'n gyfrifol; mae'n anghyfrifol ac nid yw'n arfer da. Yn amlwg, byddem yn awyddus i weithio gyda phawb, ac yr wyf yn rhoi teyrnged i chi a Carwyn am y gwaith a wnaed gennych, gyda'r undeb, i amddiffyn hawliau'r gweithwyr ym Mhen-coed ac ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr. Byddem yn awyddus i weithio gyda'r ddau ohonoch, WDA a'r holl randdeiliaid i sicrhau y byddwn yn gallu lliniaru'r ergyd i'r gweithlu yn ffatri Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr yn arbennig, ond hefyd ym Mhen-coed. Gofynnaf am gyfarfod brys gyda Syr Howard Stringer—byddaf yn siarad ag ef ar y ffôn cyn gynted a phosibl; deallaf ei fod yn Siapan ar hyn o bryd, ond yr wyf eisoes wedi nodi y byddaf yn ceisio cyfarfod ag ef yn fuan. Yn y cyfamser, mae fy swyddogion, a swyddogion WDA, mewn cysylltiad â swyddogion Sony ar lefel uchel iawn yn Sony Europe.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am ei ddatganiad, ac ategaf y sylwadau a wnaed am y bobl hynny sydd wedi

jobs; let us not forget that there are mortgages that depend on those jobs, and many people have already committed, or spent, money on holidays, who might not have done so had they known the situation in which they would find themselves, namely on the dole queue. It is extremely worrying, and we must do all that we can to support those affected, not only those directly laid off today, but also the wider community.

Let us not forget the significant number of supplier jobs that are linked to Sony. I certainly know of two suppliers in Swansea, off the top of my head; that will lead to scores of jobs being lost. Those are just the ones that I can think of immediately, without considering wider implications. The announcement that you have made about Bridgend town centre is obviously welcome, but pales into insignificance when we are discussing the sort of jobs that have been lost here. People travelled a considerable distance in order to work at Sony, because it was seen as a good employer that paid good salaries and invested in its workforce, ensuring that it was highly skilled. The announcement about the town centre is welcome but certainly cannot compare to the jobs being lost.

I would also be grateful for any statement that you can give on Wrigley's, the former Kraft factory, where 173 jobs will be lost in the next six to nine months. I am disappointed that you have, as yet, made no comment on this, because it obviously affects the same areas and communities.

The wider issue here, Minister, is the lack of competitiveness within the manufacturing sector because of the economic environment in which it works. That is what it comes down to. It is extremely worrying in the context of the figures that have been announced today, that we have dropped from first to ninth of UK regions in attracting inward investment. It is easy for you to call for a due diligence investigation now; that surely demonstrates the panicky and illogical nature of policy development within the Welsh Assembly Government. If you had concerns about the international division, bearing in mind the interfering way that you

colli eu swyddi. Rhaid inni gofio bod pobl yn dibynnu ar y swyddi hynny i ad-dalu eu morgesei, ac mae nifer o bobl eisoes wedi ymrwymo arian, neu wedi ei wario, ar wyliau, ac na fyddent wedi gwneud hynny pe baent yn ymwybodol o'r sefyllfa y maent ynddi ar hyn o bryd, sef y byddent ar y dôl. Mae'n peri cryn bryder, a rhaid inni wneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i gefnogi'r bobl y mae hyn yn effeithio arnynt, nid yn unig y rhai sydd wedi colli eu swyddi'n uniongyrchol heddiw, ond y gymuned ehangach hefyd.

Rhaid inni gofio am y nifer sylweddol o swyddi cyflenwyr sy'n gysylltiedig â Sony. Gwn yn bendant am ddau gyflenwr yn Abertawe, o feddwl yn gyflym; bydd hynny'n arwain at golli ugeiniau o swyddi. Dim ond rhai y gallaf feddwl amdanynt yn gyflym yw'r rheini, heb ystyried goblygiadau ehangach. Yn amlwg, mae croeso i'r cyhoeddiad a wnaed gennych ynglŷn â chanol tref Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr, ond mae'n ddibwys pan drafodwn y mathau o swyddi sydd wedi eu colli yma. Byddai pobl yn teithio o bell i weithio yn Sony, oherwydd ystyrid ei fod yn gyflogwr da a oedd yn talu cyflogau da ac yn buddsoddi yn ei weithwyr, gan sicrhau eu bod yn fedrus iawn. Croesewir y cyhoeddiad am ganol y dref, ond yn sicr ni all gymharu â'r swyddi a gaiff eu colli.

Byddwn hefyd yn ddiolchgar am unrhyw ddatganiad y gallwch ei wneud ar Wrigley's, sef ffatri Kraft gynt, lle bydd 173 o swyddi'n cael eu colli yn y chwe i naw mis nesaf. Yr wyf yn siomedig nad ydych, hyd yma, wedi gwneud unrhyw sylw ar hyn, oherwydd mae'n amlwg yn effeithio ar yr un ardaloedd a'r un cymunedau.

Y mater ehangach yma, Weinidog, yw methu bod yn gystadleuol yn y sector gweithgynhyrchu oherwydd yr amgylchedd economaidd y mae'n gweithio ynddo. Dyna ddiwedd y gân. Mae'n peri cryn bryder yn nghyd-destun y ffigurau a gyhoeddwyd heddiw, sef ein bod wedi gostwng o'r safle cyntaf i'r nawfed o ran rhanbarthau yn y DU sy'n denu mewnfuddsoddiad. Digon hawdd i chi alw am ymchwiliad gofal priodol yn awr; mae hynny'n siŵr o ddangos natur frysiog ac afresymol y gwaith o ddatblygu polisiau o fewn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Os oedd gennych bryderon am yr is-adran ryngwladol, o gofio'r ffordd ymyrgar yr ydych wedi ymdrin

have handled the Welsh Development Agency since you have been Minister, you would have conducted the due diligence investigation before deciding to merge the agency with the Welsh Assembly Government. This clearly shows that there is no logic to your policy, and these people are now paying the price for that.

There has been a meltdown in manufacturing; manufacturing output in Wales has dropped by 10 per cent since mid 2001. Today's figures, which show that we have dropped to ninth in the league table, are another indication of the failure of the Welsh Assembly Government's economic development policy. These people are paying the price of your policies.

**Andrew Davies:** I am not sure where to start after that tirade; it was the usual political tin ear from Alun. At a time when 650 people are facing redundancy, he draws all sorts of extraneous matters into the debate.

However, I will respond to your points. Britain and Wales have some of the most competitive economies in Europe, if not the world. We now have one of the lowest unemployment rates in the EU, and Wales is benefiting from that. Wales now has its lowest unemployment rate since 1975. I am not going to take any lectures from the Conservatives about the loss of manufacturing jobs when 360,000 manufacturing jobs were lost between 1979 and 1997. That is an average of 20,000 manufacturing jobs a year lost in Wales for every year that your Conservative Government was in power. I will not take any lectures about a manufacturing meltdown from the Conservatives.

Are you actually saying that this decision by Sony is a result of our macro-economic policies? I made it clear, as did the company, that the reason for ceasing production is that the market for what is an old technology has largely declined. Sony is not claiming that it is anything to do with our macro-economic policy or the relative competitive position of Wales in the UK. The decision was nothing to do with that. The market for an old technology had declined.

ag Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru ers i chi ddod yn Weinidog, byddech wedi gwneud yr ymchwiliad gofal priodol cyn penderfynu uno'r awdurdod â Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Mae hyn yn dangos yn eglur nad oes unrhyw resymeg i'ch polisi, ac mae'r bobl hyn yn awr yn talu'r pris am hynny.

Mae'r maes gweithgynhyrchu wedi mynd ar chwâl; mae cynnyrch gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru wedi gostwng 10 y cant ers canol 2001. Mae ffigurau heddiw, sy'n dangos ein bod wedi gostwng i'r nawfed safle yn y gynghrair, yn arwydd arall o fethiant polisi datblygu economaidd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Mae'r bobl hyn yn talu'r pris am eich polisiau.

**Andrew Davies:** Ni wn ble i ddechrau ar ôl yr araith lem yna; yr un hen dôn gron wleidyddol gan Alun. Gyda 650 o bobl yn wynebu cael eu diswyddo, mae'n tynnu pob math o faterion diangen i mewn i'r ddadl.

Fodd bynnag, fe atebaf eich pwyntiau. Mae gan Brydain a Chymru rai o'r economïau mwyaf cystadleuol yn Ewrop, os nad yn y byd. Bellach, mae gennym un o'r cyfraddau diweithdra isaf yn yr UE, ac mae Cymru yn elwa o hynny. Mae cyfradd diweithdra Cymru ar ei hisaf er 1975. Nid wyf am wrando ar unrhyw ddarlith gan y Ceidwadwyr ynglŷn â cholli swyddi gweithgynhyrchu, pan gollwyd 360,000 o swyddi gweithgynhyrchu rhwng 1979 a 1997. Mae hynny'n gyfartaledd o golli 20,000 o swyddi gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru am bob blwyddyn pan oedd eich Llywodraeth Geidwadol chi mewn grym. Ni wrandawaf ar unrhyw ddarlith gan y Ceidwadwyr ynglŷn â'r diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu yn chwalu.

A ydych yn dweud mewn difrif mai oherwydd ein polisiau macro-economaidd ni y gwnaed y penderfyniad hwn gan Sony? Yr wyf wedi egluro, a'r cwmni hefyd, mai'r rheswm dros roi'r gorau i gynhyrchu yw bod y farchnad ar gyfer yr hyn sydd bellach yn hen dechnoleg wedi dirywio'n fawr. Nid yw Sony yn honni bod a wnelo hyn unrhyw beth â'n polisi macro-economaidd ni na sefyllfa gystadleuol berthnasol Cymru yn y DU. Nid oedd a wnelo'r penderfyniad ddim â hynny. Yr oedd y farchnad ar gyfer hen dechnoleg wedi dirywio.

3.30 p.m.

I find it interesting that you still want to be champion of the quangos. On the international division, these are not my words; this was an internal review, undertaken by the WDA's chief executive. For those Members who were not at the Economic Development and Transport Committee meeting this morning, the WDA's internal review of its international division found that the international division 'significantly underperformed'. International offices represented less than 10 per cent of output, but over 50 per cent of costs. The highly resourced north American team severely underperformed, creating only 70 new jobs—1 per cent of output, versus 39 per cent of costs. The head of the north American operation was based in Amsterdam. The operation will now be based in north America and the head of European operations will be based in Cardiff.

Are you saying that this decision by Sony was somehow down to the underperformance of the WDA? This was brought to light not through our internal audit processes, but through the WDA's internal review. If I, as Minister, was not aware of what has been going on, one must question the present system of ASPBs, which are largely unaccountable, and where the audit procedures are clearly not robust enough to identify such severe underperformance as has been identified by the internal review of the WDA. That is why we are bringing the quangos in-house; we are not getting value for money and they are not commercially focused enough for the new world in which we must compete. We need an organisation that is fit for purpose, which responds to the needs of the market, not to outmoded nostrums of what the market is about.

**Kirsty Williams:** I thank the Minister for ceding to the request to make a statement this afternoon; it is very welcome. I extend the sympathies of the Liberal Democrat group to the people who have had this devastating news today, not only to the workers at Sony, but to those at the former Kraft factory who

Mae'n ddiddorol eich bod yn dal yn awyddus i bledio achos y cwangos o hyd. O ran yr is-adran ryngwladol, ac nid fy ngeiriau i yw'r rhain; adolygiad mewnol oedd hwn a wnaed gan brif weithredwr WDA. Ar gyfer yr Aelodau hynny nad oeddent yn bresennol yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth y bore yma, gwelodd adolygiad mewnol WDA o'i is-adran ryngwladol fod yr is-adran honno wedi 'tanberfformio'n sylweddol'. Yr oedd swyddfeydd rhyngwladol yn cynrychioli llai na 10 y cant o'r cynnyrch, ond dros 50 y cant o gostau. Tanberfformiodd y tîm gogledd America, a oedd yn cael llawer iawn o adnoddau, yn sylweddol gan greu dim ond 70 o swyddi newydd—1 y cant o ran cynnyrch, o'i gymharu â 39 y cant o ran costau. Yr oedd pennaeth gweithrediadau gogledd America yn gweithio yn Amsterdam. Bydd y gweithrediadau nawr yn cael eu lleoli yng ngogledd America, a bydd y pennaeth gweithrediadau Ewropeaidd yn gweithio yng Nghaerdydd.

A ydych yn dweud bod rhyw gysylltiad rhwng y penderfyniad hwn gan Sony â thanberfformiad WDA? Daeth hyn i'r amlwg drwy adolygiad mewnol WDA, nid drwy ein prosesau archwilio mewnol ni. Os nad oeddwn i, fel Gweinidog, yn ymwybodol o'r hyn sydd wedi bod yn digwydd, rhaid amau'r system bresennol o CCNCau, nad ydynt yn atebol gan mwyaf, a lle nad yw'r gweithdrefnau archwilio yn amlwg yn ddigon cadarn i nodi tanberfformio mor ddifrifol â'r hyn a nodwyd gan adolygiad mewnol WDA. Dyna'r rheswm dros wneud y cwangos yn fewnol; nid ydym yn cael gwerth yr arian ac nid oes ganddynt ddigon o ffocws masnachol ar gyfer y byd newydd y mae'n rhaid inni gystadlu ynddo. Mae angen sefydliad arnom sy'n addas at y diben, sy'n ymateb i anghenion y farchnad ac nid i goegfeddyginiaethau hen-ffasiwn y farchnad sydd ohoni.

**Kirsty Williams:** Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ildio i'r cais am wneud datganiad y prynhawn yma; fe'i croesewir yn fawr. Hoffwn gydymdeimlo ar ran grŵp y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol â'r bobl sydd wedi cael y newyddion ysgytwol hyn heddiw, nid yn unig â gweithwyr Sony, ond â'r bobl yn ffatri Kraft

represent another 173 job losses in the same region. It is a difficult day for all concerned.

The last time that we discussed job losses at Sony, you said that you intended to visit Japan at Easter, and I assume that you did so. It was your intention to meet Sony officials. Will you outline the nature of the discussions that you had with Sony officials? I trust that you went there to improve the situation, not to finish it off. You also said, in answer to the same urgent question, that you did not feel that there was a need to consider a further manufacturing taskforce or plan for Wales because you had already set up a group that reported to you, and you were already delivering with regard to safeguarding and developing manufacturing jobs. Can you point to any evidence of that, given the job losses that have been announced today and the figures that have been quoted concerning the fact that we now have almost 16,000 fewer manufacturing jobs in Wales than in 2001?

While you are correct to state that unemployment figures are currently low, do you accept that Wales has the lowest GVA rate? People are working, but, for the most part, they are working for relatively low-level wages, and we need to do something about that. Do you agree that one of the ways in which we can tackle that, and avoid situations such as the one experienced in Sony today, is to put greater emphasis on research and development and product development in the Welsh economy, so that we do not fall foul of such a situation, where we have lost jobs because we have not kept up to date with customer demands for high-tech products?

It is difficult not to consider the figures that relate to the underperformance of the international division of the WDA; after all, it is its job to safeguard inward-investment jobs in Wales, as well as to attract new ones. I am amazed that you continue to say that that team is a failure, because you were not saying that last year, when Wales was top of the league for inward-investment jobs; it was then hailed as a great success. That team, sometime during the last 12 months, has gone from being number 1 in the league to number 9, and I wonder what has changed in the last

gynt, sy'n cynrychioli 173 o ddiswyddiadau eraill yn yr un rhanbarth. Mae'n ddiwrnod anodd i bawb.

Y tro diwethaf inni drafod colli swyddi yn Sony, dywedasoch eich bod yn bwriadu ymweld â Siapan dros y Pasg, a chymeraf eich bod wedi gwneud hynny. Eich bwriad oedd cwrdd â swyddogion Sony. A amlinellwch natur y trafodaethau a gawsoch gyda swyddogion Sony? Hyderaf ichi fynd yno i wella'r sefyllfa, ac nid i'w gwaethygu. Dywedasoch hefyd, mewn ateb i'r un cwestiwn brys, nad oeddech o'r farn fod angen ystyried tasglu na chynllun gweithgynhyrchu arall ar gyfer Cymru gan eich bod eisoes wedi sefydlu grŵp a oedd yn atebol i chi, ac yr oeddech eisoes yn llwyddo llwyddo i ddiogelu a datblygu swyddi gweithgynhyrchu. A allwch ddangos unrhyw dystiolaeth o hynny, o gofio'r diswyddiadau a gyhoeddwyd heddiw a'r ffigurau a ddyfynnwyd ynghylch y ffaith fod gennym tua 16,000 yn llai o swyddi gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru nawr nag yn 2001?

Er eich bod yn iawn i ddweud bod ffigurau diweithdra yn isel ar hyn o bryd, a dderbyniwch mai yng Nghymru mae'r gyfradd GVA isaf? Mae pobl yn gweithio, ond gan fwyaf maent yn gweithio am gyflogau cymharol isel, ac mae angen inni wneud rhywbeth ynglŷn â hynny. A gytunwch mai un ffordd i fynd i'r afael â hynny, ac osgoi sefyllfaoedd fel a welwyd yn Sony heddiw, yw rhoi mwy o bwyslais ar ymchwil a datblygu a datblygu cynnyrch yn economi Cymru, fel na fyddwn yn cael ein dal mewn sefyllfa o'r fath, lle yr ydym wedi colli swyddi oherwydd nad ydym wedi ateb y galw'n ddiweddar gan gwsmeriaid am gynnyrch uwch-dechnoleg?

Mae'n anodd peidio ag ystyried y ffigurau sy'n ymwneud â thanberfformiad is-adran ryngwladol WDA. Wedi'r cyfan, ei gwaith hi yw diogelu swyddi mewnfuddsoddiad yng Nghymru, yn ogystal â denu rhai newydd. Mae'r ffaith eich bod yn dal i ddweud bod y tîm hwnnw yn fethiant yn fy synnu, oherwydd nid oeddech yn dweud hynny y llynedd, pan oedd Cymru ar y brig o ran swyddi mewnfuddsoddiad; fe'i galwyd yn llwyddiant ysgubol bryd hynny. Mae'r tîm hwnnw, rywbryd yn ystod y 12 mis diwethaf, wedi mynd o fod yn rhif 1 yn y gynghrair i rif 9, a

12 months. The biggest change is the obvious one, namely that you announced the merger process. In committee this morning, you did not accept that that was the case. You seemed to suggest that it had always been an underperforming team, which begs the question, where was the Minister? If you say that you were unable to identify these problems because of the figures and data supplied to you as Minister, do you not find it extremely disturbing that the WDA was able to pull the wool over your eyes with regard to its performance, and, indeed, all the auditing processes that should be in place to identify the failure of this course?

**Andrew Davies:** I quite agree with the last point. That is exactly why I have asked for due diligence to be undertaken and an audit of its activities, because we will need to know, prior to the merger that will take effect from 1 April next year, what has been delivered, what is being delivered, the number of people involved, and the amount of money spent on various activities. Clearly, we did not have accurate figures on how the international division was performing.

The international division contains many hard-working people, and my point is that the strategy was misguided, as acknowledged in the internal review, and that there were clear issues with regard to management. I have spoken to American companies that were flabbergasted that the international division's north American operation was operating out of Amsterdam and not north America. Therefore, with regard to the changes at the WDA, the WDA has acknowledged the conclusions of the report, and restructuring will be undertaken. However, I agree with you that serious questions have to be asked about the accuracy of the figures that were supplied to us in the past. That is precisely why I have asked for due diligence

It is not only in the last year that there has been significant underperformance. There has been a decline over the last few years, and we are now finding that, as my senior official said in this morning's committee meeting, some of the jobs safeguarded for 2002-03 included 2,000 jobs at the Defence Aviation Repair Agency at St Athan. The international division was not involved in the DARA

thybed beth sydd wedi newid yn ystod y 12 mis diwethaf? Y newid mwyaf yw'r un amlwg, sef ichi gyhoeddi'r broses uno. Yn y pwyllgor y bore yma, yr oeddech yn gwrthod derbyn mai dyna'r achos. Yr oeddech fel pe baech yn awgrymu ei fod yn dîm sydd wedi tanberfformio erioed, ac felly, rhaid gofyn y cwestiwn, ble oedd y Gweinidog? Os dywedwch na allech weld y problemau hyn oherwydd y ffigurau a'r data a roddwyd ichi fel Gweinidog, onid yw'n peri pryder mawr ichi fod WDA wedi gallu taflu llwch i'ch llygaid am ei berfformiad, ac, yn wir, am yr holl brosesau archwilio a ddylai fod ar waith i nodi methiant hyn?

**Andrew Davies:** Cytunaf yn llwyr â'r pwynt olaf. Dyna'n union pam y gofynnais am ddiwydrwydd priodol ac archwiliad o'i weithgareddau, oherwydd bydd angen inni wybod, cyn yr uno a fydd yn digwydd ar 1 Ebrill y flwyddyn nesaf, beth a gyflawnwyd, beth sy'n cael ei gyflawni, nifer y bobl dan sylw, a faint o arian a gafodd ei wario ar amrywiol weithgareddau. Yn amlwg, nid oedd gennym ffigurau cywir am y ffordd yr oedd yr isadran ryngwladol yn perfformio.

Mae'r isadran ryngwladol yn cynnwys nifer o bobl sy'n gweithio'n galed, a'r hyn yr wyf am ei bwysleisio yw bod y strategaeth yn wallus, fel y cydnabuwyd yn yr adolygiad mewnol, a bod problemau amlwg o ran rheolaeth. Yr wyf wedi siarad â chwmnïau yn America a oedd yn rhyfeddu bod gweithgareddau'r isadran ryngwladol yng ngogledd America yn gweithio yn Amsterdam, nid yng ngogledd America. Felly, o ran y newidiadau yn WDA, mae WDA wedi cydnabod casgliadau'r adroddiad, a bydd gwaith ailstrwythuro'n cael ei wneud. Fodd bynnag, cytunaf â chi y bydd yn rhaid gofyn cwestiynau difrifol ynglŷn â chywirdeb y ffigurau a ddarparwyd inni yn y gorffennol. Dyna'n union pam yr wyf wedi gofyn am ddiwydrwydd priodol.

Dim ond yn y flwyddyn ddiwethaf y gwelwyd tangyflawni sylweddol. Bu dirywiad dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf, a gwelwn yn awr, fel y dywedodd fy uwch swyddog yng nghyfarfod y pwyllgor y bore yma, fod rhai o'r swyddi a ddiogelwyd ar gyfer 2002-03 wedi cynnwys 2,000 o swyddi yn yr Asiantaeth Atgyweirio Awyrennau Amddiffyn yn Sain Tathan. Nid oedd yr isadran ryngwladol yn

project in any way, yet it claimed those 2,000 jobs as being safeguarded. If you take those 2,000 away from the 6,500 that were officially claimed, that shows that the decline has been over a longer term than just in the last year.

With regard to Sony, I did not go to Japan at Easter because Sir Howard Stringer had just been appointed chief executive, and he has made it clear that he will remain in New York. I am due to go to America later this year, and it was felt more appropriate that I seek an early meeting with him where he is based. If, however, he will be in Japan, then I will seek to meet him there.

I wholeheartedly agree with you about research and development, which is why the WDA's international division strategy was misguided. It was not focused on the needs of the economy now. The inward investment market has changed. The announcement, for example, by IBM earlier this year of its £50 million investment, with £20 million going to the Institute of Life Science at the University of Wales Swansea, is the type of new, foreign, direct investment that we are seeking. It is high-knowledge-based, includes high elements of research and development, and that was done as a result of the Assembly Government working with the Welsh European Funding Office, and it was the Assembly Government that led that project with the university, not the WDA.

It is not true that Wales is getting poorer. In fact, according to the latest figures, GVA rose in Wales, and only the east midlands had a greater increase of all the regions and nations of the UK. Wales is not getting poorer on the basis of earnings either. Average earnings for the last two years have increased at well above the UK average rate. I have to say, therefore, that your economic research is a bit faulty, Kirsty.

**Lisa Francis:** I reiterate the comments of my colleagues and sympathise with all those who have received notification of job losses today. You will have no doubt heard by now, Minister, that the Prime Minister told the House of Commons that, in respect of the job

gysylltiedig â phrosiect DARA mewn unrhyw ffordd, ac eto honnodd fod y 2,000 o swyddi hynny wedi eu diogelu. Os tynnwch y 2,000 hynny o'r 6,500 a honnwyd yn swyddogol, dengys hynny fod y dirywiad wedi bod yn digwydd ers mwy na'r flwyddyn ddiwethaf yn unig.

O ran Sony, nid euthum i Siapan adeg y Pasg oherwydd yr oedd Syr Howard Stringer newydd gael ei benodi'n brif weithredwr, ac mae wedi pwysleisio y bydd yn aros yn Efrog Newydd. Mae disgwyl imi fynd i America yn ddiweddarach eleni, a theimlais y byddai'n fwy priodol ceisio trefnu cyfarfod cynnar gydag ef yno. Fodd bynnag, os bydd yn Siapan, yna byddaf yn ceisio cyfarfod ag ef yno.

Cytunaf yn llwyr â chi ynglŷn ag ymchwil a datblygu, a dyna pam yr oedd strategaeth isadran ryngwladol WDA yn wallus. Nid oedd yn canolbwyntio ar anghenion yr economi nawr. Mae'r farchnad mewnfuddsoddi wedi newid. Y cyhoeddiad a wnaed, er enghraifft, gan IBM yn gynharach eleni am ei fuddsoddiad o £50 miliwn, gydag £20 miliwn i'r Athrofa Gwyddorau Bywyd ym Mhrifysgol Cymru Abertawe, yw'r math o fuddsoddiad newydd, tramor, uniongyrchol yr ydym yn ei geisio. Mae'n seiliedig ar wybodaeth uwch, yn cynnwys elfennau uchel o ymchwil a datblygu, a gwnaed hynny o ganlyniad i waith Llywodraeth y Cynulliad gyda Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru. Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a oedd yn arwain y prosiect gyda'r brifysgol, nid WDA.

Nid yw'n wir bod Cymru yn mynd yn dlotach. A dweud y gwir, yn ôl y ffigurau diweddaraf, cododd GVA yng Nghymru, a dim ond dwyrain canolbarth Lloegr a gafodd fwy o gynnydd o'r holl ranbarthau a gwledydd yn y DU. Nid yw Cymru yn mynd yn dlotach ar sail enillion ychwaith. Mae enillion ar gyfartaledd ar gyfer y ddwy flynedd diwethaf wedi cynyddu lawer yn uwch na chyfartaledd y gyfradd yn y DU. Felly, rhaid imi ddweud bod eich ymchwil economaidd ychydig yn wallus, Kirsty.

**Lisa Francis:** Ategaf sylwadau fy nghyd-Aelodau a chydymdeimlaf â phawb sydd wedi clywed heddiw eu bod i gollu swydd. Byddwch yn sicr wedi clywed erbyn hyn, Weinidog, fod Prif Weinidog y DU wedi dweud wrth Dŷ'r Cyffredin, mewn perthynas â cholli swyddi,

losses, he has promised that the UK Government will develop a package to help those who are made redundant. What do you know thus far about this package, and, if it transpires that you know little, when will you know and will you keep us updated? You say that the job losses are being blamed on the fact that demand for cathode-ray tube televisions in Europe and the UK has fallen significantly. I notice that digital cameras will continue to be made at the Pen-coed site. Presumably, demand for those is not under threat, but have you had any discussions about that with Sony?

3.40 p.m.

**Andrew Davies:** I understand that the Prime Minister was responding to a question in the House of Commons earlier today from Huw Irranca-Davies, the Member of Parliament for Ogmere, and Janice Gregory's colleague. I do not have the details of any package that was offered, but my officials will be in touch with, I presume in this case, DTI officials, to see what package, if any, has been offered and what it constitutes. As a Minister, I have always made this kind of information available, whether it is provided through the committee or distributed to all Members.

In terms of Sony's production of digital cameras at Pen-coed, we have been discussing the future with the company at senior executive level, and we want to work with it to see what can be done to expand production and employment at the Pen-coed plant, and to look at other ways in which we can increase investment in the locality.

### **Rhaglen Buddsoddi Cyfalaf y GIG The NHS Capital Investment Programme**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1 and 3 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, amendments 4 and 5 in the name of David Melding and amendment 6 and 7 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 2 has not been selected.

Before I call on the Minister, I wish to note that we will be under pressure for time, so, after the Minister has opened the debate, and the proposers of the amendments have had

iddo addo y bydd Llywodraeth y DU yn datblygu pecyn i helpu'r rhai a gaiff eu diswyddo. Beth a wyddoch hyd yma am y pecyn hwn, ac os daw'n hysbys na wyddoch lawer, pryd y byddwch yn gwybod ac a fyddwch yn rhoi'r newyddion diweddaraf inni? Dywedwch mai'r gostyngiad sylweddol yn y galw am setiau teledu tiwbiau pelydrau cathod yn Ewrop a'r DU sy'n cael y bai am y colli swyddi. Sylwaf y bydd camerâu digidol yn parhau i gael eu gwneud ar safle Pen-coed. Hyd y gwn i, nid oes bygythiad i'r galw am y rheini, ond a ydych wedi cael unrhyw drafodaethau ynglŷn â hynny gyda Sony?

**Andrew Davies:** Deallaf fod Prif Weinidog y DU yn ymateb i gwestiwn yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin yn gynharach heddiw gan Huw Irranca-Davies, yr Aelod Seneddol dros Ogwr, a chyd-Aelod Janice Gregory. Nid oes gennyf fanylion am unrhyw becyn a gynigiwyd, ond bydd fy swyddogion mewn cysylltiad â swyddogion yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant, mi dybiwn yn yr achos hwn, i weld pa becyn, os o gwbl, sydd wedi ei gynnig a beth sydd ynddo. Fel Gweinidog, yr wyf bob amser wedi sicrhau bod y math hwn o wybodaeth ar gael, p'un a gaiff ei darparu drwy'r pwyllgor neu ei dosbarthu i bob Aelod.

O ran cynhyrchu camerâu digidol gan Sony ym Mhen-coed, buom yn trafod y dyfodol gyda'r cwmni ar lefel uwch swyddogion, ac yr ydym am weithio gyda'r cwmni i weld beth y gellir ei wneud i ehangu cynhyrchiad a chyflogaeth yng ngwaith Pen-coed, ac i edrych ar ffyrdd eraill i gynyddu buddsoddiad yn yr ardal.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 3 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, gwelliannau 4 a 5 yn enw David Melding a gwelliannau 6 a 7 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ni ddetholwyd gwelliant 2.

Cyn imi alw ar y Gweinidog, hoffwn nodi y bydd amser yn brin, felly, ar ôl i'r Gweinidog agor y ddadl, ac ar ôl i gynigwyr y gwelliannau gael pum munud, bwriadaf osod terfyn amser o



five minutes, I intend to apply a three-minute time limit on Members, but not to the second, because we are not that desperate for time.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales welcomes the Welsh Assembly Government's capital investment programme in health and social services for 2005-06 to 2007-08, as detailed in the Minister for Health and Social Services' written cabinet statements of 16 and 17 March 2005. (NDM2505)*

We need to ensure that Wales has the best buildings and equipment through which to develop the health services, and this is key to delivering a world-class health service in Wales. 'Designed for Life' is a 10-year vision to provide the people of Wales with that world-class health service that delivers the right care, by the right person, in the right place at the right time. To deliver this, we need to transform our health and social care services to provide the highest quality of services safely, quickly and efficiently.

To do this, we must train extra staff, develop new clinical and social care pathways, and train more staff and release their full professional expertise and dedication. We must update and adapt our buildings, provide new equipment and build new facilities, and this is what our capital programme involves.

This major capital programme will be increasing from the present £120 million or so to over £300 million over the next few years, and it will provide us with a critical lever to deliver our ambitious programme. The three regions are completing their plans this year, and every scheme will be appraised for a value-for-money assessment of its contribution to transform the NHS, as set out in our 10-year strategy.

The funding will be directed at improving diagnostic capacity. For example, it will provide more MRI scanners in Wales, one of the first being the scanner purchased for Llandough Hospital. It will also improve tele-

dair munud ar Aelodau, ond nid i'r eiliad, oherwydd nid ydym mor brin o amser â hynny.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Cynigïaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn croesawu rhaglen buddsoddi cyfalaf Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru mewn iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol rhwng 2005-06 i 2007-08, a nodwyd yn natganiadau ysgrifenedig y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar 16 ac 17 Mawrth 2005. (NDM2505)*

Mae angen inni sicrhau bod gan Gymru yr adeiladau a'r offer gorau i ddatblygu'r gwasanaethau iechyd, ac mae hyn yn allweddol i ddarparu gwasanaeth iechyd o'r radd flaenaf yng Nghymru. Mae 'Cynllun Oes' yn weledigaeth 10 mlynedd i roi'r gwasanaeth iechyd hwnnw o'r radd flaenaf, sy'n darparu'r gofal cywir, gan y person cywir, yn y lle cywir ar yr adeg gywir i bobl Cymru. I gyflawni hyn, mae angen inni drawsnewid ein gwasanaethau iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol i ddarparu gwasanaethau o'r safon uchaf yn gyflym, yn ddiogel ac yn effeithlon.

Er mwyn gwneud hyn, rhaid inni hyfforddi staff ychwanegol, datblygu llwybrau clinigol a gofal cymdeithasol newydd, a hyfforddi mwy o staff a rhyddhau eu harbenigedd proffesiynol a'u hymroddiad. Rhaid inni ddiweddarau ein hadeiladau a'u haddasu, darparu offer newydd ac adeiladu cyfleusterau newydd, a dyna'r hyn y mae ein rhaglen gyfalaf yn ei olygu.

Bydd y rhaglen gyfalaf bwysig hon yn cynyddu o ryw £120 miliwn ar hyn o bryd i fwy na £300 miliwn dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf, a bydd yn ffordd hollbwysig inni ddarparu ein rhaglen uchelgeisiol. Mae'r tri rhanbarth yn cwblhau eu cynlluniau eleni, a chaiff pob cynllun ei arfarnu am asesiad gwerth yr arian o'i gyfraniad i drawsnewid y GIG, fel sydd wedi ei osod allan yn ein strategaeth 10 mlynedd.

Caiff yr arian ei gyfeirio at wella capasiti diagnostig. Er enghraifft, bydd yn darparu mwy o sganwyr MRI yng Nghymru, ac un o'r cyntaf fydd y sganiwr a brynwyd ar gyfer Ysbyty Llandochau. Bydd hefyd yn gwella

medicine, and improve our mental health infrastructure by, for example, replacing the old ward at Whitchurch Hospital and looking at the hospital infrastructure in Swansea. It will deliver the message of Wanless, as outlined in 'Designed for Life', through new builds in Caerphilly and Tenby. It will deliver new and renewed building programmes and equipment such as was mentioned for Merthyr Tydfil, and provide investment to deliver improved access for care and to improve the overall experience of patients. That is how we intend to spend the £674 million of capital investment over the next three years.

The capital programme, with its unprecedented investment, will be a major step in ensuring that we have a service that is fit for the future and finally free from the restrictions imposed upon us by decades of underinvestment.

I oppose the amendments. The National Assembly for Wales should welcome what is a major commitment to renewing and modernising health and social care in our country. It is not simply a matter to note. As I have stated, one of the priorities for funding is creating the capacity within the NHS to meet rising demands. It is inconceivable that we will meet these demands without investing in our staff, in our buildings and in new equipment.

The Health and Social Care Department is introducing a new range of measures and initiatives to ensure that the capital investment plan is delivered. The capital investment programme provides the opportunity for the NHS not only to provide more appropriate, effective care, but to do so much more efficiently. With new buildings purpose-built for the twenty-first century, hospitals will be able to do more for patients at a lower cost. This should ensure that adequate revenue is available.

The very best practice for developing business cases for new capital investment has been introduced. That means that all new schemes will be considered rigorously from the outset and throughout their lifetime to ensure that the case for change has been clearly demonstrated and supports the aims

telefeddygaeth, ac yn gwella ein seilwaith iechyd meddwl, er enghraifft drwy gael ward newydd yn lle'r hen un yn Ysbyty'r Eglwys Newydd ac edrych ar y seilwaith ysbytai yn Abertawe. Bydd yn cyflawni neges Wanless, fel yr amlinellwyd yn 'Cynllun Oes', drwy adeiladau newydd yng Nghaerffili a Dinbych-y-pysgod. Bydd yn cyflawni rhaglenni adeiladau ac offer newydd a rhai wedi eu hadnewyddu fel y rhai a grybwyllwyd ar gyfer Merthyr Tudful, ac yn darparu buddsoddiad i sicrhau gwell mynediad i ofal a gwella profiad cyffredinol cleifion. Dyna sut y bwriadwn wario'r £674 miliwn o fuddsoddiad cyfalaf dros y tair blwydd nesaf.

Bydd y rhaglen gyfalaf, gyda'i buddsoddiad di-ail, yn gam mawr tuag at sicrhau bod gennym wasanaeth sy'n addas ar gyfer y dyfodol ac sy'n rhydd, o'r diwedd, o'r cyfyngiadau a osodwyd arnom gan ddegawdau o danfuddsoddi.

Yr wyf yn gwrthwynebu'r gwelliannau. Dylai Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru groesawu'r hyn sydd yn ymrwymiad mawr i adnewyddu a moderneiddio iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yn ein gwlad. Nid mater i'w nodi'n syml ydyw. Fel y dywedais, un o'r blaenoriaethau o ran ariannu yw creu'r capasiti yn y GIG i fodloni galwadau cynyddol. Mae bodloni'r galwadau hynny heb fuddsoddi yn ein staff, ein hadeiladau ac mewn offer newydd y tu hwnt i unrhyw amgylfred.

Mae'r Adran Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol yn cyflwyno ystod newydd o fesurau a mentrau i sicrhau cyflawni'r cynllun buddsoddi cyfalaf. Mae'r rhaglen buddsoddi cyfalaf yn gyfle i'r GIG ddarparu gofal mwy priodol ac effeithiol, ond i wneud hynny lawer yn fwy effeithlon. Gydag adeiladau newydd wedi eu codi at y diben ar gyfer yr unfed ganrif ar hugain, bydd ysbytai'n gallu gwneud mwy dros gleifion am gost is. Dylai hyn sicrhau bod refeniw digonol ar gael.

Mae'r arfer gorau oll ar gyfer datblygu achosion busnes ar gyfer buddsoddiad cyfalaf newydd wedi ei gyflwyno. Mae hynny'n golygu y caiff pob cynllun newydd ei ystyried yn drylwyr o'r cychwyn a thrwy gydol ei gyfnod i sicrhau bod y ddadl dros newid wedi ei ddangos yn glir ac yn ategu'r nodau a'r dyheadau yn 'Cynllun

and ambitions of 'Designed for Life'. The scheme is the most cost-effective and is affordable. We will get the best commercial deal in line with the new approach to procurement. The outline business cases will be published as they are now, and we will ensure that capital investment is managed effectively.

We will help the NHS to deliver. We are funding a new team with the expertise required to support NHS trusts and local health boards in developing business cases and managing projects. This new team—the investment policy and appraisal group—will work directly with NHS trusts and LHBs on developing good-quality business cases, ensure that any external advisers that we use are cost-effective and understand our specific requirements, provide and commission training and development for boards, individuals and teams involved in the various aspects of capital appraisal and development, provide standard templates, guidance and documentation to ensure that we share good practice and that we will not continually reinvent the wheel, ensure that there is appropriate and thorough scrutiny of proposals to spend public money, demonstrating good value for money, and help boards and accountable officers to establish their own business-assuredness approach. The improvements in developing the business cases, together with the changes in procurement, will speed up the delivery of projects.

The message here is not whether we can afford this capital programme but whether we can afford not to have such an ambitious and challenging programme. If we are to deliver the vision in 'Designed for Life' of a world-class health service that is fit for the twenty-first century, we must ask ourselves whether we can go in any other direction. If we are to deliver to targets that the First Minister announced in March, is there any other way to go forward?

I hope that the whole Assembly shares this vision and that we can work together to deliver it. If Members say that we are too ambitious, that we are trying to do too much, or that we are going in the wrong direction, we will, hopefully, hear that in this debate,

Oes'. Y cynllun yw'r un mwyaf cost effeithiol ac mae'n fforddiadwy. Byddwn yn cael y cytundeb masnachol gorau yn unol â'r ymagwedd newydd tuag at gaffael. Caiff yr achosion busnes amlinellol eu cyhoeddi fel ar hyn o bryd, a byddwn yn sicrhau bod buddsoddiad cyfalaf yn cael ei reoli'n effeithiol.

Byddwn yn helpu'r GIG i gyflawni. Yr ydym yn ariannu tîm newydd sydd â'r arbenigedd angenrheidiol i gefnogi ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG a byrddau iechyd lleol i ddatblygu achosion busnes a rheoli prosiectau. Bydd y tîm newydd—y grŵp polisi buddsoddi ac arfarnu—yn gweithio'n uniongyrchol gydag ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG a byrddau iechyd lleol ar ddatblygu achosion busnes o safon, yn sicrhau bod unrhyw gynghorwyr allanol a ddefnyddiwn yn gost effeithiol ac yn deall ein gofynion penodol, yn darparu a chomisiynu hyfforddiant a datblygiad ar gyfer byrddau, unigolion a thimau sy'n ymwneud â'r agweddau amrywiol ar arfarnu a datblygu cyfalaf, yn darparu templedi safonol, canllawiau a dogfennaeth i sicrhau ein bod yn rhannu arfer da ac na fyddwn yn ailddyfeisio'r olwyn yn barhaus, yn sicrhau bod proses briodol a thrylwyr o graffu ar gynigion i wario arian cyhoeddus, gan arddangos gwerth da am yr arian, ac yn helpu byrddau a swyddogion atebol i sefydlu eu hymagwedd sicrwydd busnes eu hunain. Bydd y gwelliannau wrth ddatblygu'r achosion busnes, ynghyd â'r newidiadau mewn caffael, yn cyflymu'r gwaith o gyflawni'r prosiectau.

Y neges yma yw nid a allwn fforddio'r rhaglen gyfalaf hon, ond a allwn fforddio peidio â chael rhaglen mor uchelgeisiol a heriol. Er mwyn gwireddu'r weledigaeth yn 'Cynllun Oes' o wasanaeth iechyd o'r radd flaenaf sy'n addas ar gyfer yr unfed ganrif ar hugain, rhaid inni ofyn inni ein hunain a allwn fynd i unrhyw gyfeiriad arall. Os ydym i gyflawni'r targedau a gyhoeddwyd gan y Prif Weinidog ym mis Mawrth, a oes unrhyw ffordd arall i fynd ymlaen?

Gobeithio bod y Cynulliad cyfan yn rhannu'r weledigaeth hon ac y gallwn gydweithio i'w chyflawni. Os dywed Aelodau ein bod yn rhy uchelgeisiol, ein bod yn ceisio gwneud gormod, neu ein bod yn mynd i'r cyfeiriad anghywir, gobeithio y byddwn yn clywed hynny yn y

and not only where they disagree with our proposals, but where they have alternatives to deliver the challenging agenda that we are facing.

We have a vision and we have the ambition to deliver a world-class health service in Wales, and this capital budget scheme is there to help us deliver.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 1: dileu 'croesawu' a rhoi 'nodi' yn ei le.

Cynigiaf welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn pryderu nad yw'r gofyniad i gyrff iechyd gyflawni arbedion effeithlonrwydd er mwyn ariannu buddsoddiad cyfalaf yn cynnig sicrwydd digonol o ran yr adnoddau fydd ar gael ar gyfer gwariant cyfalaf yn y dyfodol.*

Byddwn yn cefnogi gwelliannau 4, 5, 6 a 7.

Mae'r Gweinidog wedi gofyn pam yr ydym am ddileu 'croesawu' a gosod 'nodi' yn ei le. Y rheswm, yn syml, yw bod record y Llywodraeth dros y chwe blynedd diwethaf o ran buddsoddi yn y gwasanaeth iechyd genedlaethol yng Nghymru wedi bod yn warthus. Yr ydych wedi methu yn gyfan gwbl â buddsoddi yn y gwasanaeth ac yr ydych wedi methu â chreu capasiti, a dyna pam yr ydym ni yng Nghymru wedi methu â mynd i'r afael â'r rhestrau aros a'r amseroedd aros.

Yr ydych yn sôn yn awr, ar ôl chwe blynedd, am fuddsoddi mewn adnoddau diagnostig, ond mae hynny eisoes wedi digwydd yn Lloegr ac yn yr Alban, ac, oherwydd hynny, maent wedi mynd i'r afael â phroblemau yn y maes hwn.

Mae'r ffigurau a gyhoeddwyd heddiw ar y rhestrau aros a'r amseroedd aros yn profi bod eich Llywodraeth yn dal i fethu. Er eich bod chi a'r Prif Weinidog yn dweud wrth bobl Cymru eich bod yn llwyddo, mae pobl Cymru yn gwybod eich bod yn methu. Un o'r rhesymau am hynny yw'r methiant i fuddsoddi mewn capasiti yn y gwasanaeth iechyd.

ddadl hon, ac nid yn unig lle maent yn anghytuno â'n cynigion, ond lle mae ganddynt gynigion gwahanol ar gyfer cyflawni'r agenda heriol yr ydym yn ei hwynebu.

Mae gennym weledigaeth ac mae gennym yr uchelgais i ddarparu gwasanaeth iechyd o'r radd flaenaf yng Nghymru, ac mae'r cynllun cyllideb cyfalaf hwn yno i'n helpu i'w ddarparu.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 1: delete 'welcomes' and replace with 'notes'.

I propose amendment 3. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*notes with concern that the prerequisite for health bodies to achieve efficiency savings in order to fund capital investment offers inadequate certainty as to the resources that will be available for future capital spending.*

We will support amendments 4, 5, 6 and 7.

The Minister has asked why we wish to delete 'welcomes' and replace it with 'notes'. The simple reason is that the Government's record over the past six years on investment in the national health service has been appalling. You have altogether failed to invest in the service and you have failed to create capacity, and that is why we, in Wales, have failed to get to grips with the waiting lists and waiting times.

You are talking now, after six years, of investing in diagnostic resources. But that has already happened in England and Scotland, and as a result they have got to grips with problems in this regard.

The figures published today on the waiting lists and waiting times prove that your Government is still failing. Although you and the First Minister tell the people of Wales that you are succeeding, the people of Wales know that you are failing. One of the reasons for that is the failure to invest in capacity in the health service.

*Daeth Alun Ffred Jones i'r Gadair am 3.49 p.m.  
Alun Ffred Jones took the Chair at 3.49 p.m.*

Yr ydych yn sôn am raglen uchelgeisiol o ran buddsoddiad, ond yr ydych eisoes yn gosod amodau ar hynny. Yr ydych wedi dweud wrth yr ymddiriedolaethau ei bod yn bosibl na fydd yr adnoddau ar gael, ac, os ydynt am fuddsoddi, fod yn rhaid iddynt hwy wneud arbedion sylweddol er mwyn gwneud hynny. Yr ydych eisoes yn camu yn ôl oddi wrth eich addewid o ran gwneud buddsoddiad sylweddol yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Yr ydych yn sôn am fuddsoddiad, ond a ydym yn ychwanegu at y niferoedd o welyau sydd ar gael i drin cleifion yng Nghymru?

You talk of an ambitious programme of investment, but you are already setting conditions for that. You have told the trusts in Wales that the resources might not be available, and that if they want to invest, they will have to make significant savings in order to do that. You are already stepping back from your promise of significant investment in the health service. You talk of investment, but are we adding to the number of beds available to treat patients in Wales?

3.50 p.m.

Gadewch inni ystyried eich cynlluniau i adeiladu ysbyty newydd yng Nghaerffili. Ni chyflawnwyd y cynllun busnes ar gyfer hynny eto. A allwch ddweud wrthym heddiw pryd a lle yn union y caiff yr ysbyty ei adeiladu? A yw'r Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am gynllunio wedi tanseilio eich cynlluniau yn gyfan gwbl oherwydd bod ei reolau newydd ef o ran yr ardaloedd sydd dan fygythiad llifogydd yn golygu y caiff eich cynlluniau i adeiladu'r ysbyty eu hatal oherwydd bod y safle a neilltuwyd ar gyfer hyn bellach yn cael ei ystyried fel safle sydd dan fygythiad llifogydd? Wedi i'r ysbyty gael ei adeiladu, a fydd mwy o welyau ar gael nag sydd ar gael ar hyn o bryd yn yr ysbytai fydd yn cau oherwydd bod yr ysbyty newydd hwn yn cael ei adeiladu?

Let us consider your plans to build a new hospital in Caerphilly. The business plan for that has yet to be completed. Can you tell us today exactly when and where the hospital will be built? Has the Minister with responsibility for planning completely undermined your plans because his new rules in relation to flood-risk areas mean that your plans to build the hospital will be shelved because the site earmarked for this is now considered to be under threat from flooding? When the hospital is built, will there be more beds available than are currently available in the hospitals which will close because this new hospital is being built?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** You should know that the flood impact survey and traffic assessment were always part of the study, and that is ongoing. The results will be brought back to the local health board in a month or so and will form part of the information before the full business case is presented. Therefore, you are saying nothing new, but are causing a bit more confusion and worry for the people of Caerphilly.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Dylech wybod bod yr arolwg o effaith llifogydd a'r asesiad o draffig bob amser yn rhan o'r astudiaeth, ac mae hynny'n parhau. Caiff y canlyniadau eu cyflwyno i'r bwrdd iechyd lleol ymhen tua mis, a bydd yn rhan o'r wybodaeth cyn cyflwyno'r achos busnes llawn. Felly, nid ydych yn dweud dim byd newydd, ond yr ydych yn peri ychydig yn fwy o ddryswch a phryder i bobl Caerffili.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I am certainly not causing any concern or worry for the people of Caerphilly. I am asking a simple question, which you chose not answer. If and when this hospital is built, will there be more beds there than there are currently in the hospitals that

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yn sicr, nid wyf yn peri gofid na phryder i bobl Caerffili. Yr wyf yn gofyn cwestiwn syml, ac yr ydych yn dewis peidio â'i ateb. Os caiff yr ysbyty hwn ei adeiladu, pryd bynnag fydd hynny, a fydd mwy o welyau yno nag sydd ar hyn o bryd yn yr

serve the people of Caerphilly? It is a simple question, and, hopefully, the Minister will take the opportunity to answer it, given that the local Member has decided not to. The fact is that the business plan has not been agreed.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** I am not sure whether you, or someone on your behalf, attended any of the public consultation events that were held throughout the borough. I attended at least three of them, and it was made clear that, in terms of projecting how many beds are needed, the number of beds available will be more than adequate, because approximately 20 per cent of the beds currently available are used up due to delayed transfers of care. Together with all the other work that is going on, the volume of beds has been deemed by the professionals involved to be perfectly adequate.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I am grateful for that answer, but I am none the wiser. It was a simple question. Will more beds be available in the new hospital than are currently available? I think that what you were trying to say in a long-winded way was that there will be no further capacity in terms of beds. As you well know, Minister, we have lost 500 beds during the six years that this Labour Government has been in charge of health in Wales. That is the fact of the matter. Therefore, when you talk about your intentions in terms of capital build, we have to be cautious in our response. That is why we wish to note the programme rather than welcome it.

On the European Investment Bank, when Alun Ffred asked you a question on that earlier, you tried to avoid the issue. You admitted during the Health and Social Services Scrutiny Sub-committee meeting that there is nothing stopping local trusts from drawing down money from the bank. At a time when there is a desperate need to invest in capacity in the NHS in Wales, why are you not telling trusts to look at any option in terms of drawing down money to build capacity in the NHS? If you allowed that to happen, Minister, you would not be spending £6 million on the second-offer scheme to send people outside Wales for treatment because there is no capacity within Wales to

ysbytai sy'n gwasanaethu pobl Caerffili? Mae hynny'n gwestiwn syml, a gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn manteisio ar y cyfle i'w ateb, o gofio bod yr Aelod lleol wedi dewis peidio â gwneud hynny. Y ffaith yw na chytunwyd ar y cynllun busnes.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Nid wyf yn siŵr a fuoch chi, neu rywun ar eich rhan, yn unrhyw un o'r digwyddiadau ymgynghori cyhoeddus a gynhaliwyd ledled y fwrdeistref. Bûm i mewn o leiaf dri ohonynt, a gwnaethpwyd yn glir, o ran rhagamcanu nifer y gwelyau y bydd eu hangen, y bydd nifer y gwelyau a fydd ar gael yn fwy na digonol, oherwydd defnyddir tuag 20 y cant o'r gwelyau sydd ar gael ar hyn o bryd oherwydd oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal. Ynghyd â'r holl waith arall sy'n mynd rhagddo, mae'r gweithwyr proffesiynol o'r farn fod nifer y gwelyau yn gwbl ddigonol.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am yr ateb hwnnw, ond nid wyf fawr callach. Yr oedd yn gwestiwn syml. A fydd mwy o welyau ar gael yn yr ysbyty newydd nag sydd ar gael ar hyn o bryd? Credaf mai'r hyn yr oeddech yn ceisio'i ddweud mewn ffordd hirwyntog oedd na fydd mwy o welyau. Fel y gwyddoch, Weinidog, yr ydym wedi colli 500 o welyau yn ystod y chwe mlynedd y mae'r Llywodraeth Lafur hon wedi bod yn gyfrifol am iechyd yng Nghymru. Dyna'r gwir. Felly, pan soniwch am eich bwriadau o ran gwaith adeiladu cyfalaf, rhaid inni fod yn oichelgar wrth ymateb. Dyna pam yr ydym am nodi'r rhaglen yn hytrach na'i chroesawu.

O ran Banc Buddsoddi Ewrop, pan ofynnodd Alun Ffred gwestiwn ichi am y mater hwnnw yn gynharach, yr oeddech yn ceisio osgoi'r mater. Yr oeddech yn cyfaddef yn ystod cyfarfod yr Is-bwyllgor Craffu Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol nad oes dim yn rhwystro ymddiriedolaethau lleol rhag hawlio arian o'r banc. Ar adeg o angen dybryd am fuddsoddi yng nghapasiti'r GIG yng Nghymru, pam nad ydych yn dweud wrth ymddiriedolaethau am edrych ar unrhyw ddewis i hawlio arian i ddatblygu capasiti yn y GIG? Pe baech yn caniatáu i hynny ddigwydd, Weinidog, ni fydddech yn gwario £6 miliwn ar gynllun yr ail gynnig i anfon pobl allan o Gymru i gael triniaeth am na ellir eu trin yng Nghymru. Pe

treat them. If you had invested in capacity, treatment would be available for the people of Wales in Wales, where they want it.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I propose the following amendments in the name of David Melding. Amendment 4. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*expresses concern that revenue shortfalls and budget constraints may prevent full use of the capital resources.*

I propose amendment 5. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*condemns the Assembly Government for failing to increase the capacity of the NHS to meet rising demands.*

I welcome this debate and the Government's commitment to holding this debate after much argument and persuasion from this side of the Chamber. I appreciate the rather more consensual approach that we are now having on the scheduling of Assembly business.

On the figures that the Government has announced, and in particular the commitment to providing £309 million by 2007-08, I welcome the extra money that the Government is allocating for capital spend. However, I am not as optimistic as the Minister for Health and Social Services is about whether or not this money will be effectively used and accessed by the relevant NHS bodies to develop the capacity of the NHS. The Assembly Government is already warning that the increases in the health budget witnessed in recent years will not continue. In fact, on page 36 of 'Designed for Life' there is reference to

'a level of resources that will challenge commissioners'

and

'a time of limited financial growth'.

It is clear that the Assembly Government is preparing the NHS, and, I expect, the Assembly in general, for a slower growth in expenditure than in previous years. That would sit fairly comfortably with the

baech wedi buddsoddi mewn capasiti, byddai triniaeth ar gael i bobl Cymru yng Nghymru, lle y maent am ei chael.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw David Melding. Gwelliant 4: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn mynegi pryder y gall diffygion refeniw a chyfyngiadau cyllidebol rwystro adnoddau cyfalaf rhag cael eu defnyddio'n llawn.*

Cynigiau welliant 5. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn condemnio Llywodraeth y Cynulliad am fethu â chynyddu capasiti'r GIG i ddiwallu'r galw cynyddol.*

Croesawaf y ddadl hon ac ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth i gynnal y ddadl hon ar ôl llawer o drafodaeth a pherswâd gan yr ochr hon o'r Siambr. Gwerthfawrogaf yr ymagwedd ychydig yn fwy cydsyniol sydd gennym bellach o ran amserlenni busnes y Cynulliad.

O ran y ffigurau a gyhoeddodd y Llywodraeth, ac yn benodol yr ymrwymiad i ddarparu £309 miliwn erbyn 2007-08, croesawaf yr arian ychwanegol y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei ddyrannu ar gyfer gwariant cyfalaf. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf mor obeithiol â'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol am y cwestiwn a gaiff yr arian hwn ei hawlio a'i ddefnyddio'n effeithiol gan gyrrff perthnasol y GIG i ddatblygu capasiti'r GIG. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad eisoes yn rhybuddio na fydd y codiadau yn y gyllideb iechyd a welwyd yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf yn parhau. Yn wir, ar dudalen 36 yn 'Cynllun Oes' cyfeirir at

lefel o adnoddau a fydd yn herio comisiynwyr

a

cyfnod o dwf ariannol cyfyngedig.

Mae'n amlwg bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn paratoi'r GIG, a'r Cynulliad yn gyffredinol, mae'n siŵr, ar gyfer twf arafach mewn gwariant nag yn y blynyddoedd blaenorol. Byddai hynny'n cyd-fynd yn gymharol dda â'r

economic forecasts for the UK as a whole. For example, we know that, last month, Gordon Brown borrowed £9 billion. That is more money borrowed by a Chancellor of the Exchequer than in any other month since 1993. We are clearly heading for financial difficulty in the UK Treasury, and, as a result, I suspect, here in the National Assembly as well.

This is borne out in the Cabinet paper, where there is reference to the fact that the programme of investment can be completed only if—if—the £309 million continues, and that

‘Revenue resources over the three year period are however less than the inescapable commitments identified’.

When Brian Gibbons talks about the problems of LHBs and trusts signing up to the revenue consequences of capital investment programmes, it is not just about future capital programmes; there are clearly revenue constraints and problems that exist at the moment. I believe that this uncertainty will continue.

When you consider that the combined cumulative deficit of NHS trusts in Wales now stands at £43 million, and that LHBs are indebted to the Assembly Government to the tune of £9 million for the assistance provided to them, there are clearly going to be problems with certain trusts and LHBs that would like to pursue capital projects under the £309 million the Government has outlined, but which will find it difficult to do so because of their revenue constraints. I do not doubt that £309 million is a lot of money, but I am not at all convinced that that money will be spent in the fullest possible way, simply because of the way in which you expect LHBs and trusts to find these sorts of efficiency savings over and above those that are already imposed on NHS bodies. They will really struggle to meet such commitments.

You have confirmed already, in the Health and Social Services Committee, that LHBs and trusts that wish to pursue capital projects have to sign up to those revenue

rhagolygon economaidd ar gyfer y DU gyfan. Er enghraifft, gwyddom fod Gordon Brown wedi benthycu £9 biliwn y mis diwethaf. Mae hynny'n fwy o arian wedi ei fenthycu gan Ganghellor y Trysorlys nag mewn unrhyw fis arall er 1993. Yn sicr, mae anhawster ariannol yn wynebu Trysorlys y DU, ac o ganlyniad, mi dybiaf, yma yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol hefyd.

Cadarnheir hyn ym mhapur y Cabinet, lle cyfeirir at y ffaith y gellir cwblhau'r rhaglen fuddsoddi dim ond os—os—bydd y £309 miliwn yn parhau, a

Fodd bynnag, mae adnoddau refeniw yn ystod y cyfnod o dair blynedd yn llai na'r ymrwymadau anochel a nodwyd.

Pan sonia Brian Gibbons am broblemau'r byrddau iechyd lleol a'r ymddiriedolaethau wrth dderbyn canlyniadau refeniw rhaglenni buddsoddi cyfalaf, nid rhaglenni cyfalaf yn y dyfodol yn unig sydd dan sylw; mae'n amlwg fod yna gyfyngiadau a phroblemau refeniw yn bodoli ar hyn o bryd. Credaf y bydd yr ansicrwydd hwn yn parhau.

Pan ystyriwch fod diffyg cronnoł ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG yng Nghymru gyda'i gilydd yn £43 miliwn erbyn hyn, a bod ar fyrddau iechyd lleol ddyled o £9 miliwn i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad am y cymorth a roddwyd iddynt, mae'n amlwg y bydd problemau gyda rhai ymddiriedolaethau a byrddau iechyd lleol a hoffai weithredu prosiectau cyfalaf o dan y £309 miliwn a amlinellwyd gan y Llywodraeth, ond a fydd yn cael anhawster i wneud hynny oherwydd y cyfyngiadau refeniw arnynt. Yn sicr, mae £309 miliwn yn swm mawr, ond nid wyf wedi fy argyhoeddi o gwbl y caiff yr arian hwnnw ei wario yn y ffordd lawnaf sy'n bosibl, oherwydd y ffordd yr ydych yn disgwyl i fyrddau iechyd lleol ac ymddiriedolaethau sicrhau'r mathau hyn o arbedion effeithlonrwydd yn ychwanegol at y rhai sydd eisoes wedi eu gosod ar gyrff y GIG. Byddant yn cael anhawster gwirioneddol i gyflawni ymrwymadau o'r fath.

Yr ydych wedi cadarnhau eisoes, yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, fod yn rhaid i fyrddau iechyd lleol ac ymddiriedolaethau sydd am weithredu



consequences. I remember that I put it to you in the committee that, in a situation such as in Gwent, where there is the Gwent NHS trust and five LHBs, if one local health board is struggling to meet the revenue consequences of the capital investment programme, I suspect that the entire programme would collapse. The bureaucratic way in which the NHS is being administered in Wales is becoming a very real threat to how this money can be spent in future. It is very well the money being there, but I say again, Minister, that I severely doubt that that money will be spent, because of the problems that our trusts are facing. That is why we tabled the amendment about the revenue problems and constraints faced by our trusts and LHBs.

The amendment in relation to the capacity of the NHS in Wales is very important. There are many examples of situations where the capacity of the NHS has not been increased in the six years since the Assembly was established. For example, accident and emergency facilities are bursting at the seams, without any innovative changes being made to the delivery of services to meet rising demand. Money is being spent to treat patients in England, but that is not a long-term measure. You now need to look at a long-term strategy that can increase capacity in the NHS in Wales, which, frankly, has not happened in the past six years.

**Jenny Randerson:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 6: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Minister to publish a value for money case for each capital project to ensure the transparent use of public money.*

I propose amendment 7. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*expresses concern at the implication in the Minister's statements that appropriate capital investment projects could be delayed by inadequate revenue funding by the Labour Assembly Government.*

prosiectau cyfalaf dderbyn y canlyniadau refeniw hynny. Cofiaf imi awgrymu wrthych yn y pwyllgor, mewn sefyllfa fel yng Ngwent, lle mae yna ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwent a phum bwrdd iechyd lleol, pe bai un bwrdd iechyd lleol yn cael anhawster i fodloni canlyniadau refeniw y rhaglen buddsoddi cyfalaf, byddwn yn tybio y byddai'r rhaglen gyfan yn methu. Mae'r ffordd fiwrocraataidd y caiff y GIG ei weinyddu yng Nghymru yn dod yn fygythiad gwirioneddol i'r ffordd y caiff yr arian hwn ei wario yn y dyfodol. Mae'n dda bod yr arian yno, ond dywedaf eto, Weinidog, fy mod yn amheus iawn y caiff yr arian hwnnw ei wario, oherwydd y problemau y mae ein hymddiriedolaethau yn eu hwynebu. Dyna pam y cyflwynwyd y gwelliant gennym am y problemau a'r cyfyngiadau refeniw sy'n wynebu ymddiriedolaethau a byrddau iechyd lleol.

Mae'r gwelliant yng nghapasiti'r GIG yng Nghymru yn bwysig iawn. Mae llawer enghraifft o sefyllfaoedd lle nad yw capasiti'r GIG wedi cynyddu yn ystod y chwe mlynedd ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad. Er enghraifft, mae adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys yn llawn at yr ymylon, ac nid oes unrhyw newidiadau arloesol yn y ffordd y caiff gwasanaethau eu darparu i fodloni'r galw cynyddol. Caiff arian ei wario i drin cleifion yn Lloegr, ond nid yw hynny'n fesur dros gyfnod hir. Mae angen yn awr ichi edrych ar strategaeth dros gyfnod hir a all gynyddu capasiti yn y GIG yng Nghymru, rhywbeth nad yw wedi digwydd yn ystod y chwe mlynedd diwethaf, a bod yn onest.

**Jenny Randerson:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 6. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar y Gweinidog i gyhoeddi achos gwerth am arian ar gyfer pob prosiect cyfalaf i sicrhau defnyddio arian cyhoeddus mewn modd eglur.*

Cynigiau welliant 7. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn mynegi pryder am y goblygiad yn natganiadau'r Gweinidog y gallai prosiectau buddsoddi cyfalaf priodol wynebu oedi oherwydd ariannu refeniw annigonol gan Lywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad.*

The Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome the additional funds that have been announced for capital spend. This is clearly vital for the implementation of 'Designed for Life', and for the implementation of the implications of the Wanless review—and, after all, we have waited long enough for that. However, like previous speakers, we have serious reservations. There are serious questions marks over the ability to spend this money in the way that has been outlined in this document.

4.00 p.m.

There is a Cabinet paper associated with the Minister's written statement on capital spending. It states that trusts

'will therefore be required to deliver significant efficiency savings above the current requirement, and before the reconfiguration of the services has been enabled. This is a significant risk to the successful achievement of the CIP. Commissioners are required as part of the Business Case process to sign up to the revenue consequences of any investment. Business Cases will be caught in long delays where there are potential revenue shortfalls.'

What does that actually mean? It means that trusts are already being pushed to make efficiency savings as a matter of course, as all public sector organisations are, and as we would expect. However, they will have to make even more savings to fund the revenue consequences of the capital spend. In other words, one part of the NHS will have to make efficiency savings in order to fund the revenue implications of the capital spend in another part of the NHS within a particular area. I wonder about the practicality of that approach.

To look at an example of how this would work, let us consider a new type of development, such as a walk-in centre, which would be a possibility. You are asking other parts of the NHS to save money to fund the revenue consequences of a walk-in centre. As you have stated on several occasions, Minister, you will not provide central funding for walk-in centres because you do not think that they are good value for money or

Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn croesawu'r arian ychwanegol a gyhoeddwyd ar gyfer gwariant cyfalaf. Mae'n amlwg yn hollbwysig er mwyn gweithredu 'Cynllun Oes', ac er mwyn gweithredu goblygiadau adolygiad Wanless—ac wedi'r cyfan, yr ydym wedi aros yn ddigon hir am hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, fel siaradwyr blaenorol, yr ydym yn amheus iawn. Mae amheuan difrifol o ran y gallu i wario'r arian hwn yn y ffordd a amlinellir yn y ddogfen hon.

Mae yna bapur Cabinet yn gysylltiedig â datganiad ysgrifenedig y Gweinidog ar wariant cyfalaf. Mae'n dweud

y bydd yn ofynnol felly i ymddiriedolaethau sicrhau arbedion effeithlonrwydd sylweddol yn ychwanegol at y gofyniad presennol, a chyn ailgyflunio'r gwasanaethau. Mae hyn yn risg sylweddol wrth gyflawni'r rhaglen buddsoddi cyfalaf yn llwyddiannus. Mae angen comisiynwyr fel rhan o'r broses Achos Busnes i dderbyn canlyniadau refeniw unrhyw fuddsoddiad. Bydd yr Achosion Busnes yn wynebu oedi hir lle mae diffygion refeniw posibl.

Beth y mae hynny yn ei olygu mewn gwirionedd? Golyga fod ymddiriedolaethau eisoes yn cael eu gwthio i sicrhau arbedion effeithlonrwydd fel mater o drefn, fel pob sefydliad yn y sector cyhoeddus, ac fel y byddem yn ei ddisgwyl. Fodd bynnag, bydd yn rhaid iddynt sicrhau mwy fyth o arbedion i ariannu canlyniadau refeniw y gwariant cyfalaf. Hynny yw, bydd yn rhaid i un rhan o'r GIG sicrhau arbedion effeithlonrwydd er mwyn ariannu goblygiadau refeniw y gwariant cyfalaf mewn rhan arall o'r GIG mewn maes penodol. Yr wyf yn amau a yw hynny'n ymarferol.

I edrych ar enghraifft o'r ffordd y byddai hyn yn gweithio, gadewch inni ystyried math newydd o ddatblygiad, megis canolfan galw i mewn, a fyddai'n bosibilrwydd. Yr ydych yn gofyn i rannau eraill o'r GIG arbed arian er mwyn ariannu canlyniadau refeniw canolfan galw i mewn. Fel yr ydych wedi ei ddweud droeon, Weinidog, ni fyddwch yn darparu arian canolog ar gyfer canolfannau galw i mewn oherwydd nad ydych yn credu eu bod yn rhoi gwerth da

effective or because you do not approve of them in some way. Yet, there is increasing evidence in England, where more than 30 walk-in centres are up and running, that they take pressure off accident and emergency departments. We heard last week in the Health and Social Services Committee that pressures on accident and emergency departments cause problems with ambulance waiting times. Therefore, by giving way on one issue, you would make it possible to solve problems in different parts of the NHS structure.

The statement does not address the question of getting local health boards to work together. When we pressed you on this in committee, Minister, you suggested that you would be encouraging them to work together. Encouragement does not always work. There needs to be a mechanism to ensure co-operation. For example—and this is a slightly different example of a lack of co-operation—the Cardiff Royal Infirmary site has been scandalously empty for over eight years since it was closed as a district general hospital immediately after Labour came to power in 1997. The health authority decided to sell it off, but that decision was rejected by the community health council, which was good. The health authority wanted to move out to an unspecified green field, with no public transport—what a wonderful plan that was. Now, at last, we have a plan. We are way into the consultation process and suddenly the trust—because the local health board is doing the consultation—is raising question marks over how it will fund any changes that are introduced. If you cannot get a trust to co-operate with its local health board, goodness knows how you get two local health boards to co-operate with each other.

Our amendment 6 refers simply to the publication of a value-for-money case for each capital project. That should be published. The case should be made, the work should be done and it should be published. We do not care where the money comes from. Whether it comes from the European Investment Bank, a public finance initiative project or the public purse, it is a case of public transparency and getting the

am yr arian nac yn effeithiol, neu am nad ydych yn eu cymeradwyo mewn rhyw ffordd. Fodd bynnag, mae tystiolaeth gynyddol yn Lloegr, lle mae mwy na 30 o ganolfannau galw i mewn yn gweithio, eu bod yn lleihau'r pwysau ar adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys. Clywsom yr wythnos diwethaf yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol fod pwysau ar adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys yn peri problemau o ran amseroedd aros am ambiwlans. Felly, drwy ildio ar un mater, byddech yn ei gwneud yn bosibl datrys problemau mewn rhannau gwahanol o strwythur y GIG.

Nid yw'r datganiad yn mynd i'r afael â mater sicrhau bod byrddau iechyd lleol yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd. Pan bwyswyd arnoch mewn perthynas â hyn yn y pwyllgor, Weinidog, yr oeddech yn awgrymu y byddech yn eu hannog i weithio gyda'i gilydd. Nid yw anogaeth yn gweithio bob tro. Mae angen mecanwaith i sicrhau cydweithredu. Er enghraifft—ac mae hyn yn enghraifft ychydig yn wahanol o ddiffyg cydweithredu—mae safle Ysbyty Brenhinol Caerdydd yn wag ers dros wyth mlynedd ers ei gau fel ysbyty cyffredinol dosbarth yn union wedi i Lafur ddod i rym yn 1997, sy'n warthus. Penderfynodd yr awdurdod iechyd ei werthu, ond gwrthodwyd y penderfyniad hwnnw gan y cyngor iechyd cymuned, ac yr oedd hwnnw'n benderfyniad da. Yr oedd yr awdurdod iechyd am symud allan i faes glas amhenodol, heb gludiant cyhoeddus—dyna ichi gynllun gwych. Nawr, o'r diwedd, mae gennym gynllun. Mae'r broses ymgynghori yn mynd rhagddi ers cryn amser, ac yn sydyn mae'r ymddiriedolaeth—am mai'r bwrdd iechyd lleol sy'n gwneud yr ymgynghori—yn codi amheuan o ran sut y bydd yn ariannu unrhyw newidiadau a gyflwynir. Os na all ymddiriedolaeth gydweithredu â'i bwrdd iechyd lleol, dyn a wŷr sut yr ydych am gael dau fwrdd iechyd lleol i gydweithredu.

Mae ein gwelliant 6 yn cyfeirio'n syml at gyhoeddi achos gwerth yr arian ar gyfer pob prosiect cyfalaf. Dylid cyhoeddi hynny. Dylid cyflwyno'r achos, gwneud y gwaith a'i gyhoeddi. Nid oes gwahaniaeth gennym o ble y daw'r arian. P'un a ddaw o Fanc Buddsoddi Ewrop, prosiect menter cyllid preifat neu bwrs y wlad, mater yw o eglurder cyhoeddus a sicrhau'r gwerth gorau am yr arian. Byddwn yn cefnogi'r holl welliannau, ond yn fyr ar welliant

best value for money. We will support all the amendments, but, briefly on amendment 5, we want to make it clear that we do not believe that there is a problem with the total capacity in the NHS; it is rather a case of where that capacity is.

**Val Lloyd:** Like previous speakers, I welcome the threefold increase to the capital investment programme. This massive increase underpins the vision to create a sustainable, modern and responsive NHS. I emphasise the word ‘responsive’, because the service has to be such that it can respond to the changing needs of its users now and in the future. That is absolutely crucial. These unprecedented levels of additional capital investment will provide a major boost to services for patients throughout Wales. The programme will deliver a range of new and enhanced facilities, and will increase and diversify capacity in order to meet the changing patterns of healthcare needs—that is where the responsiveness comes in once again. The Wanless review presented the need to reconfigure and to become responsive to patient need. The Designed for Life programme builds on that work for a sustainable NHS. The increase in budget to the capital investment programme marks a significant step forward towards achieving this.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.06 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.06 p.m.*

I share the concerns about the procedure and potential risk in signing up to any revenue consequences. The health and social services scrutiny sub-committee provided Members with a valuable opportunity to scrutinise the proposals further and for the Minister to address concerns regarding this necessary evaluation of financial risk.

The additional measures that have been implemented within the NHS to ensure that the CIP is delivered efficiently and effectively are vital. I welcome the increased scrutiny and support factored in to progress the development of business cases. Outline business cases now require far more information than previously, particularly regarding the value-for-money aspects as well as additional tests about economic

5, hoffem egluro'n nad ydym yn credu bod problem o ran capasiti cyfan y GIG; yn hytrach, lleoliad y capasiti hwnnw sy'n peri problem.

**Val Lloyd:** Fel y siaradwyr blaenorol, yr wyf yn croesawu cynyddu'r rhaglen buddsoddi cyfalaf dri chant y cant. Mae'r cynnydd enfawr hwn yn sail i'r weledigaeth o greu GIG cynaliadwy, modern ac ymatebol. Pwysleisias y gair ‘ymatebol’, oherwydd rhaid i'r gwasanaeth allu ymateb i anghenion ei ddefnyddwyr yn awr ac yn y dyfodol, a'r rheiny'n newid. Mae hynny'n hollol hanfodol. Bydd y lefelau di-ail hyn o fuddsoddiad cyfalaf ychwanegol yn hwb sylweddol i wasanaethau i gleifion ledled Cymru. Bydd y rhaglen yn darparu ystod o gyfleusterau newydd a gwell, ac yn cynyddu ac amrywio capasiti er mwyn bodloni patrymau anghenion gofal iechyd sy'n newid—dyna lle y mae'r gallu i ymateb yn berthnasol unwaith eto. Yr oedd adolygiad Wanless yn cyflwyno'r angen am ailgyflunio a bod yn ymatebol i anghenion cleifion. Mae'r rhaglen Cynllun Oes yn adeiladu ar y gwaith hwnnw er mwyn sicrhau GIG cynaliadwy. Mae'r cynnydd yn y gyllideb i'r rhaglen buddsoddi cyfalaf yn nodi cam sylweddol ymlaen tuag at gyflawni hyn.

Yr wyf fi hefyd yn pryderu am y weithdrefn a'r risg bosibl wrth ymrwymo i unrhyw ganlyniadau refeniw. Cafodd yr Aelodau gyfle gwerthfawr yn yr is-bwyllgor craffu iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol i graffu ar y cynigion ymhellach, a chafodd y Gweinidog y cyfle i ymdrin â phryderon am y gwerthusiad angenrheidiol hwn o risg ariannol.

Mae'r mesurau ychwanegol sydd wedi eu gweithredu yn y GIG i sicrhau cyflwyno'r rhaglen buddsoddi cyfalaf yn effeithlon ac effeithiol yn hanfodol. Croesawaf y gwaith craffu a'r cymorth cynyddol sydd wedi eu hymgorffori er mwyn ysgogi datblygu achosion busnes. Mae achosion busnes amlinellol bellach yn gofyn am lawer mwy o wybodaeth nag yr oedd ei hangen gynt, yn enwedig o ran agweddau gwerth yr arian, yn ogystal â phroffion

viability and sustainability. The new procedures will ensure that there is real scrutiny of what is being proposed, and the likely outcomes. Help and assist teams, which have already been referred to, have been created to deliver additional support. There will also be continuing support from the Welsh Assembly Government over the coming years to deliver the ambitious targets and generate revenue opportunities.

People change is important, as delivery depends on staff and carers. I welcome the National Leadership and Innovations Agency for Healthcare, which will provide support for people change and will complement the CIP. The beneficiaries of increased investment will be the patients using the reconfigured and responsive services. They will be the ultimate judges of the value brought about by the capital investment programme. I believe that it will not be found wanting.

**David Lloyd:** I start by reaffirming Plaid Cymru's commitment to a publicly funded NHS. Today's debate about the publicly funded capital programme is welcome, though there are significant challenges, particularly in terms of reconfiguration. I will begin with the challenges regarding delayed discharges. What direction is the Minister giving regarding tackling the loss of care homes with this proposed capital spend, specifically regarding reconfiguration in social services—as this is not only about health, it is also about social services—and tackling the mismatch of where care homes are located and where the people with delayed discharges tend to be? What directions is the Minister giving? In Wanless, the first point of immediate action was to sort out the meltdown in the care home situation.

Reconfiguration is the big idea within both social services and health, though there is a strange lack of detail about this reconfiguration. There is a lot of talk about the word reconfiguration, and we know from Wanless that the NHS is unsustainable in its present form. In *Designed for Life*, around page 55, there is the potentially exciting confirmation of Swansea as a regional centre

ychwanegol am ymarferoldeb economaidd a chynaliadwyedd. Bydd y gweithdrefnau newydd yn sicrhau craffu'n wirioneddol ar yr hyn a gynigir a'r canlyniadau tebygol. Mae timau cymorth a chynhorthwy, y cyfeiriwyd atynt eisoes, wedi'u creu i ddarparu cymorth ychwanegol. Bydd cymorth parhaus hefyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru dros y blynyddoedd i ddod i gyflawni'r targedau uchelgeisiol a chreu cyfleoedd referniw.

Mae newid o ran pobl yn bwysig, gan fod y darparu'n dibynnu ar staff a gofaluwr. Croesawaf yr Asiantaeth Genedlaethol Arwain ac Arloesi mewn Gofal Iechyd, a fydd yn darparu cymorth ar gyfer newidiadau o ran pobl ac yn ategu'r rhaglen buddsoddi cyfalaf. Y cleifion a fydd yn defnyddio'r gwasanaethau ymatebol wedi eu hailgyflunio fydd yn elwa o'r buddsoddiad uwch. Hwyl fydd y beirniaid yn y pen draw a ddaw yn sgil y rhaglen buddsoddi cyfalaf. Hyderaf y bydd yn ddigonol.

**David Lloyd:** Dechreuaf drwy ategu ymrwymiad Plaid Cymru i GIG sy'n cael ei ariannu'n gyhoeddus. Croesawn y ddatl heddiw ar y rhaglen gyfalaf sy'n cael ei hariannu'n gyhoeddus, er bod heriau sylweddol, yn enwedig yng nghyd-destun ailgyflunio. Dechreuaf gyda'r heriau'n ymwneud ag oedi cyn ryddhau cleifion. Pa gyfarwyddyd a roddir gan y Gweinidog i fynd i'r afael â mater colli cartrefi gofal gyda'r gwariant cyfalaf arfaethedig hwn, yn enwedig o ran ailgyflunio ym maes gwasanaethau cyhoeddus—gan fod hyn yn ymwneud nid yn unig â gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, ond hefyd ag iechyd—a mynd i'r afael â'r anghydbwysedd o ran lleoliad cartrefi gofal a'r ardaloedd lle mae'r bobl sy'n wynebu oedi cyn eu rhyddhau yn tueddu i fod? Pa gyfarwyddiadau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu rhoi? Yn Wanless, y pwynt gweithredu brys cyntaf oedd datrys y lleihad mawr ym maes cartrefi gofal.

Ailgyflunio yw'r syniad mawr ym maes gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ac iechyd, er bod prinder rhyfedd o fanylion ynglŷn â'r ailgyflunio hwn. Mae llawer o sôn am y gair ailgyflunio, a gwyddom, yn sgîl Wanless, nad yw'r GIG yn gynaliadwy ar ei ffurf bresennol. Yn y Cynllun Oes, tua thudalen 55, mae cadarnhad a allai fod yn gyffrous o weld Abertawe yn ganolfan ragoriaeth ranbarthol.

of excellence. I ask the Minister again what direction he will take and what link exists between the reconfiguration in Designed for Life and this capital investment programme? Surely, the one should inform the other. In terms of reconfiguration, for example in Swansea, is the Minister minded to be bold? Is he willing to cement Swansea's regional status and stop the drain of services to Cardiff and Bristol? Is he willing to grasp the true nettle of reconfiguration in Swansea and create one super hospital on one site in the city?

4.10 p.m.

We note with concern the prerequisite for health bodies to achieve efficiency savings in order to fund capital investment—that is one of our amendments, and has been mentioned by others—coupled with the fact that many trusts are already in financial deficit; Swansea NHS Trust is currently £7 million in deficit and looking to close Fairwood hospital and three wards in Singleton and Morriston hospitals just to address the deficit, let alone address any efficiency savings required to fund any capital investment. It will certainly be a tough challenge for Swansea NHS Trust to build up efficiency savings in order to fund capital investment under the present financial situation.

There are other issues in terms of tackling primary care buildings, GP surgery premises, and the £12.6 million required to fund the backlog of maintenance. That is why we note the capital investment programme and I seek assurances from the Minister on the challenges facing the NHS in terms of reconfiguration and moving forward.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** The NHS capital investment programme will deliver much improved services by providing cutting-edge diagnostic treatments in twenty-first century buildings. No-one can be in any doubt that, since 1999, investment in the NHS in Wales has hugely increased.

The Assembly Government is investing approximately £100 million in a brand-new

Gofynnaf eto i'r Gweinidog, i ba gyfeiriad y bydd yn mynd a pha gyswllt sy'n bodoli rhwng yr ailgyflunio yn y Cynllun Oes a'r rhaglen hon o fuddsoddi cyfalaf? Oni ddylai'r naill fwydo'r llall? O ran ailgyflunio, er enghraifft yn Abertawe, a oes gan y Gweinidog fwriad i fod yn fentrus? A yw'n fodlon cadarnhau statws rhanbarthol Abertawe a rhoi terfyn ar lif y gwasanaethau i gyfeiriad Caerdydd a Bryste? A yw'n fodlon mynd i'r afael yn wirineddol â'r broses o ailgyflunio yn Abertawe a chreu un ysbyty mawr ar un safle yn y ddinas?

Sylwn gyda phryder ar y rhaganghenraid i gyrff iechedd sicrhau arbedion effeithlonrwydd er mwyn ariannu buddsoddiad cyfalaf—mae hynny'n un o'n gwelliannau, ac fe'i crybwyllwyd gan eraill—ynghyd â'r ffaith fod gan nifer o ymddiriedolaethau eisoes ddiffyg ariannol; ar hyn o bryd mae gan Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Abertawe ddiffyg o £7 miliwn ac mae'n bwriadu cau ysbyty Mynydd Llwyn-teg a thair ward yn ysbyty Singleton ac ysbyty Treforys dim ond er mwyn mynd i'r afael â'r diffyg, heb sôn am fynd i'r afael ag unrhyw arbedion effeithlonrwydd sy'n angenrheidiol i ariannu unrhyw fuddsoddi cyfalaf. Bydd yn sicr yn her aruthrol i Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Abertawe grynhoi arbedion effeithlonrwydd er mwyn ariannu buddsoddiad cyfalaf yn y sefyllfa ariannol sydd ohoni.

Mae yna faterion eraill o ran mynd i'r afael ag adeiladau gofal sylfaenol, meddygfeydd a'r £12.6 miliwn sy'n angenrheidiol i ariannu'r gwaith cynnal a chadw sydd wedi crynhoi. Dyna pam yr ydym yn nodi'r rhaglen buddsoddi cyfalaf, a cheisïaf sicrwydd gan y Gweinidog am yr heriau sy'n wynebu'r GIG o ran ailgyflunio a symud ymlaen.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Bydd rhaglen buddsoddi cyfalaf y GIG yn darparu gwasanaethau gwell o lawer drwy gynnig triniaethau diagnostig arloesol mewn adeiladau o'r unfed ganrif ar hugain. Ni all neb amau nad yw'r buddsoddiad yn y GIG yng Nghymru wedi cynyddu'n aruthrol ers 1999.

Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn buddsoddi tua £100 miliwn mewn ysbyty newydd sbon i

hospital for the Caerphilly borough. The new hospital will replace existing community hospitals such as the Caerphilly District Miners' Hospital which was built in 1923 and has served the people of the Caerphilly borough excellently over the past 80 years. Times move on and local people and health professionals now recognise the demand for a new general hospital that can better deal with the needs of today's patients under one roof.

As we heard earlier, the Assembly Government is committed to delivering this hospital. It has committed the money in its capital investment programme to guarantee that the people of Caerphilly benefit from improved services as soon as possible. In response to Rhodri Glyn's statement, the Ystrad Fawr site in Ystrad Mynach is the preferred site. It is not the only site but it is the current site of some of the council's existing offices. It was formerly the site of the National Coal Board regional office. Immediately across the road is the existing Ystrad Mynach Hospital and while it is on the bank of the Rhymney river, it has not, to the best of my knowledge, flooded for a substantial number of years. If the flood prevention scheme, which is under consideration, deems the site to be at risk, there is another site which could be utilised for this hospital although it would be a mile or so further away from Caerphilly, so it would not be as good as the current preferred site.

As new services are opened, an alternative and complimentary use of Caerphilly District Miners' Hospital will rightly be considered as services are transferred to the new building.

The reconfiguration of hospital provision within Caerphilly and the investment of about £100 million is just part of a Wales-wide record level of investment by the Assembly Government. The capital investment programme money, amounting to some £309 million by 2007-08, is being channelled strategically into key areas thus ensuring that we implement the recommendations of Wanless. Caerphilly county borough has already received £5.25 million. This is the highest amount of Wanless money of all Welsh authorities. The Assembly

fwrdeistref Caerffili. Bydd yr ysbyty newydd yn disodli'r ysbytai cymunedol presennol, fel Ysbyty Glowyr Caerffili a godwyd yn 1923 ac sydd wedi gwasanaethu trigolion bwrdeistref Caerffili yn wych dros y 80 mlynedd diwethaf. Gyda threigl amser mae pobl leol a gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol yn cydnabod yr angen bellach am ysbyty cyffredinol newydd a all ymdrin ag anghenion cleifion heddiw o dan yr un to.

Fel y clywsom yn gynharach, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ymrwymo i ddarparu'r ysbyty hwn. Mae wedi ymrwymo'r arian yn ei rhaglen buddsoddi cyfalaf i sicrhau y bydd pobl Caerffili yn elwa o wasanaethau gwell cyn gynted â phosibl. I ateb gosodiad Rhodri Glyn, safle Ystrad Fawr yn Ystrad Mynach yw'r dewis safle. Nid hwn yw'r unig safle, ond yma mae safle presennol rhai o swyddfeydd y cyngor. Safle swyddfa ranbarthol y Bwrdd Glo Cenedlaethol ydoedd gynt. Gyferbyn mae Ysbyty presennol Ystrad Mynach, ac er ei fod ar lannau afon Rhymni, hyd y gwn i ni yw wedi dioddef llifogydd ers blynyddoedd maith. Pe bai'r cynllun atal llifogydd, sydd o dan ystyriaeth, yn dynodi bod y safle mewn perygl, mae safle arall y gellid ei ddefnyddio ar gyfer yr ysbyty hwn, er y byddai hwnnw ryw filltir ymhellach o Gaerffili, ac felly, ni fyddai cystal â'r dewis safle presennol.

Wrth gyflwyno gwasanaethau newydd, ystyrir defnyddio Ysbyty Glowyr Caerffili mewn ffordd wahanol ac ategol, a hynny'n briodol ddigon, wrth i wasanaethau gael eu trosglwyddo i'r adeilad newydd.

Rhan yn unig o'r buddsoddiad mwyaf erioed yng Nghymru gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yw'r broses o ailgyflunio'r ddarpariaeth ysbytai yng Nghaerffili, a'r buddsoddiad o ryw £100 miliwn. Mae arian y rhaglen buddsoddi cyfalaf, sef rhyw £309 miliwn erbyn 2007-08, yn cael ei sianelu'n strategol i feysydd allweddol gan sicrhau ein bod yn gweithredu argymhellion Wanless. Mae bwrdeistref sirol Caerffili eisoes wedi cael £5.25 miliwn. Dyma'r swm mwyaf o arian Wanless i unrhyw awdurdod yng Nghymru. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwreiddio ei haddewidion, ac yn darparu gwell

Government is putting its money where its mouth is, and delivering improved front-line services in line with the recommendations of evidence-based reports.

One aspect of Caerphilly's local action plan illustrates how this capital investment programme is delivering real service improvements on the front line. The local health board has developed a rapid response team of eight specialist nurses who provide an immediate response to referrals from 7 a.m. until 11 p.m. every day.

This is a time of change for the NHS and its staff, so we must now focus all our energy on promoting local health plans, delivering on our capital investments, as it is programmes like these that will deliver clear benefits to our local communities.

**David Melding:** First, I welcome the fact that we will be investing more in NHS capital; it is right that we now prioritise this area. Whatever the Minister says, or however he plans to spin the issue, it has not been the highest priority to date. In the early years of the Labour Government, the amount of capital spending was reduced. I think that we have had a confusion of a strategy in terms of providing for future capital resources. It has an inability to grasp more flexible working, such as the private finance initiative or the European investment bank. However, I acknowledge that we will be spending a considerable amount of money over the next five to 10 years, and we will ensure that, where that money is spent, it is properly scrutinised and that we get the best value for money.

I will be particularly keen to ensure that the mental health component is used effectively. I have urged the Minister to consider acute provision in mental health, and to ensure that it is fit for purpose, as well as specialist provision for children. It is a disgrace that teenagers currently find themselves, more often than not, on adult wards when they are particularly vulnerable.

Effective planning is essential. We need an accurate assessment of need in terms of what we expect to require in 10 years' time.

gwasanaethau rheng flaen yn unol â'r argymhellion mewn adroddiadau ar sail tystiolaeth.

Un agwedd ar gynllun gweithredu lleol Caerffili yw'r modd y mae'r rhaglen buddsoddi cyfalaf hon yn darparu gwelliannau gwirioneddol mewn gwasanaethau rheng flaen. Mae'r bwrdd iechyd lleol wedi datblygu tîm ymateb cyflym o wyth nyrs arbenigol, sy'n sicrhau ymateb ar unwaith i atgyfeiriadau o 7 a.m. i 11 p.m. bob dydd.

Mae hwn yn gyfnod o newid i'r GIG a'i staff, felly, rhaid inni yn awr ganolbwyntio ein hegri ar hyrwyddo cynlluniau iechyd lleol, gan wireddu ein buddsoddiadau cyfalaf, gan mai rhaglenni fel y rhain a fydd yn sicrhau buddiannau amlwg i'n cymunedau lleol.

**David Melding:** Yn gyntaf, croesawaf y ffaith y byddwn yn buddsoddi mwy yng nghyfalaf y GIG; mae'n briodol inni flaenoriaethu'r maes hwn yn awr. Beth bynnag a ddywed y Gweinidog, neu beth bynnag fydd y sbin ar y mater, nid hon yw'r flaenoriaeth uchaf hyd yma. Ym mlynnyddoedd cynnar y Llywodraeth Lafur, gwelwyd gostyngiad ym maint y gwariant cyfalaf. Credaf inni gael drysfa o strategaeth o ran darparu ar gyfer adnoddau cyfalaf yn y dyfodol. Ni all fynd i'r afael â gweithio mwy hyblyg, fel y fenter cyllid preifat neu fanc buddsoddi Ewrop. Fodd bynnag, cydnabyddaf y byddwn yn gwario swm sylweddol o arian dros y pump i ddeng mlynedd nesaf, a byddwn yn sicrhau craffu'n briodol ar yr arian hwnnw, lle bynnag y caiff ei wario, ac y cawn y gwerth gorau am yr arian.

Byddaf yn arbennig o awyddus i sicrhau defnyddio'r elfen iechyd meddwl yn effeithiol. Yr wyf wedi annog y Gweinidog i ystyried darpariaeth aciwt ym maes iechyd meddwl a sicrhau ei bod yn addas at y diben, yn ogystal â darpariaeth arbenigol i blant. Mae'n warthus fod pobl ifanc yn eu harddegau ar hyn o bryd yn cael eu gosod mewn wardiau i oedolion, yn amlach na pheidio, lle maent yn arbennig o ddiameddifyn.

Mae cynllunio effeithiol yn hanfodol. Mae angen asesiad cywir arnom o'r angen o ran yr hyn y disgwyliwn y bydd ei angen ymhen 10



Healthcare is changing constantly, and the average lifespan of health buildings is now probably nearer 10 years rather than the 25-year benchmark that has existed since the 1980s. This causes formidable challenges.

We also have to think of the type of health service that we will require in another generation, 20 years hence. What type of accident and emergency cover will be required, and where will that be provided? These are fundamental, long-term issues.

I believe that the use of PFI could be considered. We need value for money in contracts; we do not want money coming into the system in an unstructured way. We need expertise, which individual trusts or local health boards often cannot provide alone. We need a central facility to ensure effective planning and negotiation. PFI can be an effective use of public money to provide what we may not have the upfront resources to pay for immediately.

Like other speakers, I believe that walk-in centres—and I would add private treatment centres—could be considered. We may not have to provide the building ourselves; we could perhaps allow the private sector to provide some NHS services, particularly in orthopaedics.

Finally, diagnostics is clearly an important area. Again, we will be scrutinising performance in this respect to ensure that we are spending enough. Large amounts are being announced, but we need the most modern kit to ensure that we improve health outcomes for our people.

**Huw Lewis:** This capital investment programme for Wales's NHS represents yet another step change, unprecedented since 1948, in securing the best healthcare, which is universal and free at the point of delivery. Only Welsh Labour is both willing and able to make this kind of investment, and I welcome it wholeheartedly.

Given that, I press the Minister for more detail, and perhaps for a greater sense of

mlynedd. Mae gofal iechyd yn newid yn barhaus, ac mae oes adeiladau iechyd ar gyfartaledd bellach oddeutu 10 mlynedd, yn hytrach na'r meincnod o 25 mlynedd sydd wedi bodoli ers y 1980au. Mae hyn yn dod â heriau sylweddol.

Rhaid inni feddwl hefyd am y math o wasanaeth iechyd y bydd ei arnom angen ymhen cenhedlaeth arall, ymhen 20 mlynedd. Pa fath o ddarpariaeth damweiniau ac achosion brys fydd ei hangen, a ble y darperir y gwasanaeth hwnnw? Mae'r rhain yn faterion sylfaenol dros gyfnod hir.

Credaf y gellid ystyried defnyddio PFI. Mae angen gwerth yr arian mewn contractau; nid ydym am weld arian yn dod i mewn i'r system mewn ffordd ddistrywthur. Mae angen arbenigedd arnom, ac ni all ymddiriedolaethau na byrddau iechyd lleol unigol ddarparu hynny ohonynt eu hunain. Mae angen cyfleuster canolog arnom i sicrhau cynllunio a negodi effeithiol. Gall PFI fod yn ffordd effeithiol o ddefnyddio arian cyhoeddus i ddarparu'r hyn na fyddai gennym yr adnoddau cychwynol efallai i dalu amdano ar unwaith.

Fel siaradwyr eraill, credaf y gellid ystyried canolfannau galw i mewn—byddwn hefyd yn ychwanegu canolfannau triniaeth preifat. Efallai na fydd yn rhaid inni ddarparu'r adeilad ein hunain; hwyrach y gallem ganiatáu i'r sector preifat ddarparu rhai gwasanaethau GIG, yn enwedig ym maes orthopedeg.

Yn olaf, mae diagnosteg, yn amlwg, yn faes pwysig. Unwaith eto, byddwn yn craffu ar berfformiad yn y cyd-destun hwn i sicrhau ein bod yn gwario digon. Mae symiau mawr yn cael eu cyhoeddi ond mae arnom angen yr offer mwyaf modern i sicrhau ein bod yn gwella canlyniadau iechyd i'n pobl.

**Huw Lewis:** Mae'r rhaglen buddsoddi cyfalaf hon i GIG Cymru yn newid sylweddol arall na welwyd mo'i debyg er 1948, wrth sicrhau'r gofal iechyd gorau i bawb yn ddiwahân ac am ddim yn y man darparu. Dim ond Llafur Cymru sy'n fodlon ac yn abl i wneud y math hwn o fuddsoddiad, ac fe'i croesawaf yn frwd.

Wedi dweud hynny, pwysaf ar y Gweinidog am ragor o fanylion, ac efallai fwy o ymdeimlad o

urgency, particularly as far as this programme relates to my constituency, which is, by almost every measure, the unhealthiest in Wales. Tackling that inheritance will be complex, but the programme does, and should, include a major boost in primary and secondary healthcare capacity. I am pleased to see in the programme that around £86 million is committed to the further upgrading of Prince Charles Hospital. I am also pleased that around £28 million is earmarked for a new primary care hospital in Merthyr. The Minister will know that Merthyr was among the first communities to be promised such a primary care hospital, but while the project in Merthyr has remained at the planning stage, such facilities have been started in Porthmadog, Cardiff and Tenby. This autumn, work will start in Ebbw Vale and the Rhondda; work will begin next year in Holywell; and work will start in Caerphilly the following year. These projects have all leap-frogged the Merthyr hospital; why? Given Merthyr's status as the sickest town in Wales, why is it not at the top of the list? I seek the Minister's assurance that he will not only give personal attention to the overlong gestation of the Merthyr hospital, but that he will instruct officials to accelerate the timetable for investment as soon as the public consultation is over.

I make another specific plea, regarding MRI services in north Glamorgan—since there are none. North Glamorgan is in the position of buying services from Pontypridd and Rhondda NHS Trust at the Royal Glamorgan Hospital. Apart from that, we have the occasional use of a mobile scanner. I repeat that Merthyr needs this vital diagnostic tool more than any other community in the country. All the statistics show Merthyr as the first priority, so why is it not top of the list? Every surrounding trust has an MRI service. The Wanless action plan for North Glamorgan NHS Trust showed this as a basic requirement, not an additional extra. Will the Minister commit to using some of the £21 million announced for investment in MRI for a scanner at Prince Charles Hospital?

frys, yn enwedig yn y modd y mae'r rhaglen hon yn ymwneud â'm hetholaeth i. Ymhob ffordd bron, hon yw'r fwyaf afiach yng Nghymru. Bydd mynd i'r afael â'r etifeddiaeth honno yn broses gymhleth, ond mae'r rhaglen yn cynnwys hwb sylweddol i gapasiti gofal iechyd sylfaenol ac eilaidd, a dylai wneud hynny. Yr wyf yn falch o weld yn y rhaglen fod tua £86 miliwn wedi'i ymrwymo i uwchraddio Ysbyty'r Tywysog Siarl ymhellach. Yr wyf hefyd yn falch fod tua £28 miliwn wedi'i glustnodi ar gyfer ysbyty gofal sylfaenol newydd ym Merthyr. Gŵyr y Gweinidog fod Merthyr ymhlith y cymunedau cyntaf i gael addewid am ysbyty gofal sylfaenol o'r fath. Ond er bod y prosiect ym Merthyr yn dal yn y cyfnod cynllunio, mae cyfleusterau o'r fath wedi'u cychwyn ym Mhorthmadog, Caerdydd a Dinbych-y-pysgod. Yn ystod yr hydref, bydd gwaith yn dechrau yng Nglynebwy a Rhondda; bydd gwaith yn dechrau flwyddyn nesaf yn Nhreffynnon; a bydd gwaith yn dechrau yng Nghaerffili y flwyddyn ganlynol. Mae'r prosiectau hyn oll wedi achub y blaen ar ysbyty Merthyr. Pam? O gofio statws Merthyr fel y dref lle mae'r nifer mwyaf o achosion o salwch yng Nghymru, pam nad ydyw ar frig y rhestr? Ceisiaf sicrwydd gan y Gweinidog y bydd nid yn unig yn rhoi sylw personol i esblygiad hirhoedlog ysbyty Merthyr, ond yn cyfarwyddo swyddogion i gyflymu'r amserlen fuddsoddi cyn gynted ag y daw'r ymgynghori cyhoeddus i ben.

Mae gennyf ble benodol arall, o ran gwasanaethau MRI yng ngogledd Morgannwg—gan nad oes yno wasanaethau o'r fath. Mae gogledd Morgannwg yn prynu gwasanaethau gan Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Pontypridd a Rhondda yn Ysbyty Brenhinol Morgannwg. Ar wahân i hynny, mae sganiwr symudol ar gael inni o bryd i'w gilydd. Dywedaf eto fod ar Ferthyr angen yr offeryn diagnostig hanfodol hwn yn fwy nag unrhyw gymuned arall yn y wlad. Dengys yr holl ystadegau mai Merthyr yw'r brif flaenoriaeth. Felly, pam nad yw ar frig y rhestr? Mae gan bob ymddiriedolaeth o gwmpas wasanaeth MRI. Dangosodd cynllun gweithredu Wanless ar gyfer Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gogledd Morgannwg fod hwn yn ofyniad sylfaenol, nid yn rhywbeth ychwanegol. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ymrwymo i ddefnyddio rhywfaint o'r £21 miliwn a gyhoeddwyd i'w fuddsoddi mewn MRI i brynu sganiwr ar gyfer Ysbyty'r

Tywysog Siarl.

4.20 p.m.

This investment programme is a source of pride for me as a Labour politician; it is good news for everyone in Wales. I simply make the case that there is a town that is at the bottom of virtually every health measure, and so it deserves to be at the top of the priority list for capital investment. That town's name is Merthyr Tydfil.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** Wales is justifiably proud of having coined the inverse care law, in which the areas of greatest healthcare need tend to get the worst services. However, listening to some of today's contributions, I think that we might also have the inverse begrudgery law, because the more investment there is in the NHS in Wales, the more opposition parties seem to be unhappy about it.

In the last few months, Rhodri Glyn has made some positive and welcome comments about service reconfiguration and looking to the future. However, his total contribution to today's debate was well and truly bedded in the past, and he did not seem to have any vision of how the NHS was going forward. I am sure that Rhodri Glyn, as health spokesperson for the opposition, will have read the Wanless review and the various audit reports, and will probably have read all the major documents on reconfiguring the health service in Wales. Will he tell me where it is chapter and verse that the biggest challenge facing the NHS in Wales is the need for more beds? I do not think that any of these well-respected documents have suggested that this is what we need. Indeed, the Wanless review stated that the present configuration of services was unsustainable, and that the whole point of this capital budget programme, and 'Designed for Life', was to tackle the fundamental challenge set by Wanless—will we be able to reconfigure and reorganise services so that they are sustainable?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Denise, you cannot hold a conversation

Mae'r rhaglen fuddsoddi hon yn destun balchder imi fel gwleidydd Llafur; mae'n newyddion da i bawb yng Nghymru. Y cyfan a ddywedaf yw bod un dref ar waelod bron pob mesur iechyd, ac felly mae'n haeddu bod ar frig y rhestr blaenoriaethau ar gyfer buddsoddiad cyfalaf. Enw'r dref honno yw Merthyr Tudful.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Mae Cymru yn falch o fod wedi creu cyfraith gofal gwrthgyfartal, a hynny yn haeddiannol, lle mae'r ardaloedd mwyaf anghenus o ran gofal iechyd yn tueddu i gael y gwasanaethau gwaethaf. Fodd bynnag, o wrando ar rai o'r cyfraniadau heddiw, credaf fod gennym hefyd efallai y gyfraith amharod wrthdro, oherwydd po fwyaf y buddsoddiad yn y GIG yng Nghymru, y mwyaf anfodlon yr ymddengys y gwrthbleidiau am hynny.

Yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf, mae Rhodri Glyn wedi gwneud rhai sylwadau cadarnhaol sydd i'w croesawu ynglŷn ag ailgyflunio gwasanaethau ac edrych i'r dyfodol. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd ei gyfraniad cyfan i'r ddadl heddiw yn perthyn yn gyfan gwbl i'r gorffennol, ac nid oedd ganddo unrhyw weledigaeth sut yr oedd y GIG yn datblygu. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Rhodri Glyn, fel llefarydd iechyd yr wrthblaid, wedi darllen adolygiad Wanless a'r amrywiol adroddiadau archwilio, ac mae'n sicr y bydd wedi darllen pob dogfen bwysig ar ailgyflunio'r gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru. A all ddweud wrthyf ble yn union y dywedir yn bendant mai'r her fwyaf y mae'r GIG yng Nghymru yn ei hwynebu yw'r angen am fwy o welyau? Ni chredaf fod yr un o'r dogfennau uchel eu parch hyn wedi awgrymu mai dyna sydd ei angen arnom. Yn wir, dywedodd adolygiad Wanless fod y broses bresennol o ailgyflunio gwasanaethau yn anghynaliadwy, ac mai holl bwynt y rhaglen cyllideb cyfalaf hon, a'r 'Cynllun Oes', oedd mynd i'r afael â'r her sylfaenol a osodwyd gan Wanless—a fydd modd inni ailgyflunio ac ad-drefnu gwasanaethau i sicrhau eu bod yn gynaliadwy?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Denise, ni allwch gael sgwrs tra byddwch ar eich traed yn y

standing up in the Chamber; please sit down.

**Brian Gibbons:** David Melding's point was pertinent and worthwhile. He pointed out the challenge that the life of buildings, in terms of bricks and mortar, and so on, may be quite time-limited, and the challenge for us is whether this investment in buildings and equipment will facilitate the configuration of services to deliver long-term sustainability in Wales. Will it fundamentally change the way that services are delivered? This is the challenge. Rhodri Glyn's comment showed that, having made progress in terms of reading these reports, he has gone back to an old, antediluvian way of considering the challenges facing the health service.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** As you have said and as you know full well, I am fully in favour of the reconfiguration of health service provision in Wales and believe that we must move on. However, that will take time. My point, Minister, is that we have lost 500 beds during the time in which Labour has been in charge of health in Wales. During that time, waiting times and waiting lists have shot up, and you have had to devise the second-offer scheme, which means that £6 million is being spent on sending people out of Wales for treatment because you have lack of capacity. That is a fact. Is it not a reflection of this Government's incompetence that you did not know that trusts could draw down money from the European Investment Bank? When I first made that statement, I was told by the Welsh Assembly Government that I was wrong and that trusts could not draw down that money. You have now been forced to admit that they can, and you have not even looked at the possibility of that investment in terms of increasing capacity.

**Brian Gibbons:** One of the key fundamentals about the regional reconfiguration of services that will come to fruition for debate and discussion towards the end of the year will be to specifically identify whether there are capacity gaps in the service. Where there are capacity gaps that cannot be filled by service reconfiguration, then we as an Assembly Government will clearly move to plug those gaps, just like we

Siambr. Eisteddwch i lawr os gwelwch yn dda.

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr oedd pwynt David Melding yn berthnasol ac yn werthfawr. Nododd yr her y gall oes adeiladau, o ran eu hadeiladwaith, ac ati, fod yn gyfyngedig o ran amser, a'n her inni yw dewis a fydd y buddsoddiad hwn mewn adeiladau ac offer yn hwyluso'r broses o ailgyflunio gwasanaethau i sicrhau cynaliadwyedd dros gyfnod hir yng Nghymru. A fydd yn newid yn sylfaenol y ffordd y caiff gwasanaethau eu darparu? Dyna'r her. Dangosodd sylw Rhodri Glyn ei fod, ar ôl gwneud cynnydd wrth ddarllen yr adroddiadau hyn, wedi mynd yn ôl i ffordd hen-ffasiwn y cynfyd o ystyried yr heriau sy'n wynebu'r gwasanaeth iechyd.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Fel y dywedwch ac fel y gwyddoch yn iawn, yr wyf yn llwyr o blaid ailgyflunio'r ddarpariaeth gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru, a chredaf fod yn rhaid inni symud ymlaen. Fodd bynnag, bydd hynny'n cymryd amser. Fy mhwynt, Weinidog, yw ein bod wedi colli 500 o welyau yn ystod yr amser y bu Llafur yn gyfrifol am iechyd yng Nghymru. Yn ystod yr amser hwnnw, mae amseroedd aros a rhestrau aros wedi cynyddu'n enfawr, a bu'n rhai ichi greu'r cynllun ailgynnig, sy'n golygu bod £6 miliwn yn cael ei wario ar anfon pobl allan o Gymru i gael triniaeth oherwydd diffyg adnoddau. Mae hynny'n ffaith. Onid yw'r ffaith nad oeddech yn ymwybodol y gallai ymddiriedolaethau fenthyca arian o Fanc Buddsoddi Ewrop yn adlewyrchu anghymhwyster y Llywodraeth hon? Pan wneuthum y datganiad hwnnw gyntaf, dywedodd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wrthyf fy mod yn anghywir ac na allai ymddiriedolaethau gael yr arian hwnnw. Yr ydych wedi'ch gorfodi yn awr i gyfaddef y gallant wneud hynny, ac nid ydych hyd yn oed wedi edrych a bosibilrwydd y buddsoddiad hwnnw o ran cynyddu adnoddau.

**Brian Gibbons:** Un o hanfodion y broses ranbarthol o ailgyflunio gwasanaethau a fydd yh barod ar gyfer dadl a thrafodaeth tua diwedd y flwyddyn fydd nodi'n benodol a oes bylchau yn y gwasanaeth o ran adnoddau. Lle bydd bylchau mewn adnoddau na ellir eu llenwi gan y broses ailgyflunio gwasanaeth, byddwn ni fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn amlwg yn ceisio cau'r bylchau hynny, yn union fel yr ydym yn darparu'r cyfleusterau orthopedig yn Ysbyty

are delivering with the orthopaedics facilities at Llandough Hospital and St Woolos Hospital. Part of the reason for bringing forward this capital programme is to fill capacity gaps. However, these capacity gaps will only be filled where other efficiencies and reconfiguration cannot deliver. Clearly, we need to have our perspective and forward view correct.

Jonathan Morgan said that the budget will not be maintained, and that the revenue that will be available to us in the future will not be the same as it was in the past. I think that that is a fair statement. Under the Labour Government, over the last four to five years, we have had unprecedented levels of public investment in our public services, and it is not reasonable to expect that will be able to sustain that indefinitely in terms of the high level of increase. It is absolutely vital that we use this capital investment to introduce the necessary reconfiguration so that we can use the revenues that are available to us more efficiently. The imperative of the diminished revenue streams is an incumbent reason as to why we need to go down this particular road.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Your Cabinet paper said that the programme could only be maintained and completed if the £309 million funding level is continued into future years. How far into future years are we are talking about, and is there a risk, therefore, that that £309 million, beyond 2007-08, may not be continued?

**Brian Gibbons:** We are operating in the three-year cycle of the comprehensive spending review, and we are not in a position to give a categorical assurance, but the expectation is that this level of capital expenditure will continue so long as that is what is required to deliver the necessary service reconfiguration.

Further to some of the points made by Val Lloyd and Jeff Cuthbert, one of the key elements of the programme is that we will be working and procuring services in a new way and that we will not be going down the traditional way of procuring the services. We will be using the latest methodology and supply-chain construction, so as to ensure that the money that we are spending will not

Llandochau ac Ysbyty Gwynllyw. Rhan o'r rheswm dros gyflwyno'r rhaglen gyfalaf hon yw llenwi bylchau o ran adnoddau. Fodd bynnag, caiff y bylchau hyn mewn adnoddau eu llenwi dim ond lle na all dulliau effeithiolrwydd ac ailgyflunio eraill wneud hynny. Yn amlwg, mae angen inni sicrhau bod ein safbwynt a'n rhagolwg yn gywir.

Dywedodd Jonathan Morgan na chaiff y gyllideb ei chynnal, ac na fydd y refeniw a fydd ar gael inni yn y dyfodol yr un faint ag yn y gorffennol. Credaf fod hwnnw'n ddatganiad teg. O dan Lywodraeth Lafur, yn ystod y pedair neu bum mlynedd diwethaf, cawsom lefelau buddsoddi cyhoeddus yn ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus na welwyd eu bath o'r blaen, ac nid yw'n rhesymol disgwyl y gallwn gynnal hynny'n amhenodol o ran lefel uchel y cynnydd. Mae'n hollbwysig inni ddefnyddio'r buddsoddiad cyfalaf hwn i sicrhau'r ailgyflunio angenrheidiol er mwyn inni allu defnyddio'r refeniw sydd ar gael inni yn fwy effeithlon. Mae hanfodion y llifau refeniw llai yn rheswm dilys pam mae angen inni ddilyn y trywydd penodol hwn.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yr oedd eich papur Cabinet yn dweud mai dim ond os bydd y lefel ariannu o £309 miliwn yn parhau yn y dyfodol y gellid cynnal y rhaglen a'i chwblhau. Pa mor bell i'r dyfodol a olygwn, ac a oes perygl, felly, na fydd y £309 miliwn hwnnw'n parhau ar ôl 2007-08?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr ydym yn gweithredu yng nghylch tair blynedd yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant, ac nid ydym mewn sefyllfa i roi sicrwydd pendant. Ond disgwylir y bydd y lefel hon o wariant cyfalaf yn parhau cyhyd ag y bydd angen i gyflawni'r broses angenrheidiol o ailgyflunio'r gwasanaeth.

I ychwanegu at rai o'r pwyntiau a wnaed gan Val Lloyd a Jeff Cuthbert, un o elfennau allweddol y rhaglen yw'r ffaith y byddwn yn gweithio ac yn caffael gwasanaethau mewn ffordd newydd, ac na fyddwn yn dilyn y ffordd draddodiadol o gaffael y gwasanaethau. Byddwn yn defnyddio'r fethodoleg ddiweddaraf ac adeiladwaith cadwyn gyflenwi, er mwyn sicrhau y bydd yr a wariwn yn sicrhau

only deliver efficiencies in the service, but the procurement process itself will be more streamlined and speedy, thereby putting us in a position to spend the money.

This leads me on to Huw Lewis's point. It is true that health service needs in Merthyr are among the greatest in Wales, and I hope that because we are using a much smarter and better-informed procurement process and have a much higher level of public engagement in Merthyr, we will be able to proceed at the speed that will give people in Merthyr the quality of healthcare services to which they are entitled. However, those services must be based on the needs assessment of the population in Merthyr. I am sure that you will agree that it cannot be just more of the same—it must be a new service that will completely transform the health prospects of the people of Wales.

Finally, on Jenny Randerson's points, it is true that we need to look at the wider context with regard to how accident and emergency centres are designed and delivered. One of the objectives of the DECS project is to ensure that there will be single points of access into emergency and unscheduled care in Wales, wherever that is possible and wherever it makes sense. Clearly, that single point of access will not be a one-shoe-fits-all approach—it will need to be flexible, imaginative and innovative.

4.30 p.m.

It is possible that walk-in centres may be part of that, but there is no real evidence that such centres, plopped down on their own are an effective solution to the problem of pressures on accident and emergency departments. All that they do is to stoke up demand in an area of the health service where demand was probably not being met. The evidence is just not there to support it as a way of solving problems in accident and emergency.

Finally, I agree with the point regarding transparency and, as always, the outline business cases will be available in the public domain so that people can see how these projects are being brought forward.

effeithlonrwydd yn y gwasanaeth, ac y bydd y broses gaffael ei hun yn fwy syml a chyflym a thrwy hynny'n ein rhoi mewn sefyllfa i wario'r arian.

Mae hyn yn fy arwain at bwynt Huw Lewis. Mae'n wir fod anghenion gwasanaeth iechyd ym Merthyr ymhlith yr uchaf yng Nghymru, a gobeithio, gan ein bod yn defnyddio proses gaffael llawer mwy craff a gwybodus, a bod y cyhoedd yn ymgysylltu ar lefel lawer uwch ym Merthyr, y byddwn yn gallu parhau ar gyflymdra a fydd yn rhoi i bobl Merthyr y safon gwasanaethau gofal iechyd y mae ganddynt hawl iddi. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i'r gwasanaethau hynny fod yn seiliedig ar asesiad o anghenion poblogaeth Merthyr. Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch na all y gwasanaeth fod yn ddim mwy na'r gwasanaeth presennol—rhaid iddo fod yn wasanaeth newydd a fydd yn trawsnewid rhagolygon iechyd pobl Cymru yn llwyr.

Yn olaf, o ran pwyntiau Jenny Randerson, mae'n wir fod angen inni edrych ar y cyddestun ehangach o ran y modd y caiff canolfannau damweiniau ac achosion brys eu cynllunio a'u darparu. Un o amcanion prosiect DECS yw sicrhau y bydd manau mynediad unigol ar gyfer achosion brys a gofal heb ei drefnu yng Nghymru, ble bynnag y bydd hynny'n bosibl a ble bynnag y bydd yn synhwyrol. Yn amlwg, nid un dull sy'n addas i bawb fydd y man mynediad hwnnw—bydd angen iddo fod yn hyblyg, yn llawn dychymyg ac yn arloesol.

Mae'n bosibl y gall canolfannau galw i mewn fod yn rhan o hynny. Ond nid oes tystiolaeth wirioneddol fod canolfannau o'r fath, ar eu pen eu hunain, yn ateb effeithiol i broblem y pwysau sydd ar adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys. Y cyfan a wnânt yw cynyddu'r galw mewn maes gwasanaeth iechyd lle nad oedd y galw efallai'n cael ei ddiwallu. Nid oes tystiolaeth ar gael i ategu hyn fel ffordd i ddatrys problemau gyda damweiniau ac achosion brys.

Yn olaf, cytunaf â'r pwynt am eglurder, ac fel bob amser bydd yr achosion busnes amlinellol ar gael i'r cyhoedd fel y gall pobl weld sut y caiff y prosiectau hyn eu cyflwyno.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 1: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

Ni ddetholwyd gwelliant 2.  
Amendment 2 was not selected.

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 3: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise

Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty

James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
 Amendment 4: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
 Amendment 5: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary



Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty

Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
 Amendment 6: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 7: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM2505): O blaid 35, Ymatal 16, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2505): For 35, Abstain 16, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

### **Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order**

**Peter Black:** This is a point of order under Standing Order No. 7.7.

**Peter Black:** Mae hwn yn bwynt o drefn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 7.7.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. There are Members standing about in the Chamber; it is not permitted for more than one person to stand in the Chamber at the same time.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae Aelodau'n sefyll yn y Siambr; ni chaniateir i fwy nag un person ar y tro sefyll yn y Siambr.

**Peter Black:** During the statement on Sony, a serious allegation was made that Bridgend council had leaked the announcement before an official announcement had been made. From inquiries that I have made, it appears that that is not the case—

**Peter Black:** Yn ystod y datganiad ar Sony, gwnaed honiad difrifol fod cyngor Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr wedi datgelu'r cyhoeddiad cyn i gyhoeddiad swyddogol gael ei wneud. Yn dilyn fy ymholiadau, ymddengys nad yw hyn yn wir—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. What

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Beth yw'r pwynt o

is the point of order for me?

**Peter Black:** The point of order is that I thought it important to correct the record on this issue, and that the source may have been one of the local Members of Parliament.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. That is not a point of order. What you have said stands on the record, but if you wish to correct the record further in any way, you will have to use your ingenuity to do so.

**Janice Gregory:** Further to that point of order—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I do not think that any further point of order arises.

**Janice Gregory:** Is it on record—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Is this a genuine point of order, following a point that is not a point of order?

**Janice Gregory:** With respect, Deputy Presiding Officer—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Is it a point of order?

**Janice Gregory:** I think that it is.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I will take it, Janice.

**Janice Gregory:** Thank you for your indulgence, Deputy Presiding Officer. May I just put on record that the inquiries that Peter made show that it was not the case, but the inquiries that I have made show that it was?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. No.

**Janice Gregory:** If his point stands on the record, so should mine.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. We will call that a draw. That has absolutely nothing to do with order in the Chamber this afternoon.

drefn ar fy nghyfer i?

**Peter Black:** Y pwynt o drefn yw fy mod yn credu ei bod yn bwysig cywiro'r cofnod o ran y mater hwn, ac y gallai'r ffynhonnell fod wedi bod yn un o'r Aelodau Seneddol lleol.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Nid pwynt o drefn yw hwnnw. Mae'r hyn a ddywedasoch yn parhau ar y cofnod, ond os hoffech gywiro'r cofnod ymhellach mewn unrhyw ffordd, bydd yn rhaid ichi ddefnyddio'ch dyfeisgarwch i wneud hynny.

**Janice Gregory:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Ni chredaf fod unrhyw bwynt o drefn arall yn codi.

**Janice Gregory:** Mae ar y cofnod—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. A yw hwn yn bwynt o drefn dilys, yn dilyn pwynt nad yw'n bwynt o drefn?

**Janice Gregory:** Gyda phob parch, Ddirprwy Lywydd—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. A yw'n bwynt o drefn?

**Janice Gregory:** Credaf ei fod.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Fe'i cymeraf, Janice.

**Janice Gregory:** Diolch ichi am eich haelioni, Ddirprwy Lywydd. A gaf fi gofnodi fod yr ymholiadau a wnaeth Peter yn dangos nad oedd hynny'n wir, ond bod yr ymholiadau a wneuthum i yn dangos ei fod yn wir?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Na allwch.

**Janice Gregory:** Os yw ei bwynt ef yn cael ei gynnwys ar y cofnod, dylai fy mhwynt i hefyd gael ei gynnwys.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r ornest yn gyfartal. Nid oes a wnelo hynny ddim â'r gorchymyn yn y Siambr y prynhawn yma.

## Dadl Fer Short Debate

### Gweithio dros Gymru Hyderus Working for a Confident Wales

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** We now move to the first of two short debates, but the first does not fall under Standing Order No. 6.40. We will need to finish by 5 p.m. in order for us to begin the second short debate.

**Owen John Thomas:** Yr wyf wedi rhoi munud yr un i Eleanor a Lisa.

What are the added values that enable a nation to have a shared experience of feeling good? It is likely that there were few comforts or prospects in pre-industrial, pre-non-conformist Wales. There was little to create a national feeling of confidence or enterprise. Our hilly terrain, sparse population, small towns and poor communications made us dependent on Bristol, Hereford, Shrewsbury or Chester for certain services that could only be sustained by sizeable towns or cities. Moreover, the overwhelmingly monoglot Welsh-speaking population was excluded and outlawed from holding public office under the Acts of Incorporation of 1536 and 1542.

The opportunities to be enterprising in more than a moderate way were restricted, unless one took to the sea and became a pirate or a buccaneer, as many a Welshman did. Certainly the likes of Henry Morgan and Bartholomew Roberts showed plenty of enterprise, as did late adventurers such as Middleton and Prys. Welsh enterprise, however, was confined by our subordinate circumstances, but not by any innate reluctance to be venturesome. We were governed by English law, but were not the beneficiaries of good government, but there never lived a nation yet that ruled another well.

While England had endowed itself with universities as early as the fourteenth century, Wales's needs in this and most respects were not considered. The governing of Wales was synonymous, not with care and development, but with control and subordination. We still have some way to go, as confirmed by the

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Symudwn yn awr at y cyntaf o ddwy ddadl fer, ond ni ddaw'r cyntaf o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.40. Bydd angen inni orffen erbyn 5 p.m. er mwyn inni ddechrau'r ail ddadl fer.

**Owen John Thomas:** I have allowed Eleanor and Lisa a minute each.

Beth yw'r gwerthoedd ychwanegol sy'n galluogi cenedl i rannu'r profiad o deimlo'n dda? Nid yw'n debygol fod yna lawer o gysuron neu ragolygon yng Nghymru yn y cyfnod cyn dyfodiad diwydiant ac anghydfurfiaeth. Nid oedd fawr ddim i greu ymdeimlad o hyder na mentergarwch. Yr oedd ein tirwedd fryniog, ein poblogaeth wasgaredig, ein trefi bach a'n cysylltiadau gwael yn ein gwneud yn ddibynnol ar Fryste, Henffordd, Amwythig neu Gaer am rai gwasanaethau na ellid eu cynnal ond gan drefi mawr neu ddinasoedd. Yn ogystal, câi'r boblogaeth, a oedd yn uniaith Gymraeg i raddau helaeth iawn, ei hamddifadu a'i gwahardd rhag dal swyddi cyhoeddus o dan Ddeddfau Uno 1536 a 1542.

Yr oedd y cyfleoedd i fod yn fentrus mewn ffordd fwy na chymedrol yn gyfyngedig, oni fyddai rhywun yn mynd i'r môr ac yn troi'n fôr-leidr neu'n anturiwr, fel y gwaeth aml i Gymro. Yn sicr, dangosodd pobl fel Harri Morgan a Barti Ddu ddigon o fentergarwch, a hefyd anturwyr diweddarach fel Middleton a Prys. Fodd bynnag, cyfyngid mentergarwch y Cymry gan ein hamgylchiadau israddol, ond nid gan unrhyw amharodrwydd cynhenid i fod yn fentrus. Caem ein llywodraethu gan gyfraith Loegr, ond nid oeddem yn cael ein llywodraethu'n dda. Ond ni fu cenedl erioed a lywodraethodd genedl arall yn dda.

Er i Loegr freintio ei hun â phrifysgolion mor gynnar â'r bedwaredd ganrif ar ddeg, nid ystyriwyd anghenion Cymru yn y cyswllt hwn nac ym mron unrhyw gyswllt arall. Yr oedd y modd y llywodraethid Cymru yn gyfystyr â rheolaeth ac israddoldeb, yn hytrach na gofal a datblygiad. Mae llawer i'w wneud o hyd, fel y

First Minister on Radio Wales recently when he declared that the Westminster Parliament is an elective dictatorship that could do what it liked to Wales and its demands for meaningful democracy.

Dechreuodd hunan hyder y Cymry flodeuo yng nghanol y ddeunawfed ganrif, gyda dyfodiad y chwyldro diwydiannol, twf anghydfurfiaeth, a sefydlu ysgolion cylchynol Cymraeg Griffith Jones. Dysgwyd hanner y boblogaeth i ddarllen ac ysgrifennu gan yr ysgolion hyn, a noddwyd gan Madam Bevan. Mae'n debyg mai'r wlad fechan hon oedd gwlad fwyaf llythrennog y byd ar yr adeg honno. Offeiriad Eglwys Lloegr oedd Griffith Jones ac yr oedd cryn wrthwynebiad gan yr eglwys sefydledig i'w ymgyrch i greu cannoedd o ysgolion cylchynol Cymraeg ym mhob sir yng Nghymru. Sefydlwyd 25 ysgol o'r fath ym mhlwyfi Caerdydd yn unig.

4.40 p.m.

Y wers i'w dysgu yw nad Llywodraeth San Steffan ddechreuodd y prosiect addysgol ysbrydoledig hon, a barai am hanner can mlynedd. Menter hollol Gymreig oedd, ac nid oedd pobl ddylanwadol yr oes yn gefnogol o gwbl. Heddiw, wrth siarad am addysg gydol oes, mae'n werth inni gofio nad yw dosbarthiadau o ddisgyblion tair blwydd oed hyd at 90 mlynedd oed yn gyffredin, ond yr oeddynt yn weddol gyffredin yn amser Griffith Jones. Newidiwyd a goleuwyd bywydau miloedd ar filoedd o bobl o bob oedran gan waith Griffith Jones a Madam Bevan, a rhoddid hwb enfawr i hyder y genedl o'r herwydd. Bryd hynny, dechreuodd yr eglwys sefydledig gefnu ar y Gymraeg, ac felly, gyda'r ddealltwriaeth newydd a gawsant drwy lythrennedd, dechreuodd y bobl adeiladu capeli anghydfurfiol ledled y wlad, a'r Gymraeg oedd prif iaith yr addoldai hyn.

These buildings, such as the magnificent Tabernacl in Swansea, were built by the people of Wales, despite discouragement from the Westminster Government's treacherous Blue Books, published in 1847. That report poured scorn and contempt on the Welsh, their language, their religion, their social habits and their radical politics, as manifested in the Rebecca riots, the Merthyr

cadarnhawyd gan y Prif Weinidog ar Radio Wales yn ddiweddar, pan gyhoeddodd mai unbennaeth etholedig yw Senedd San Steffan a allai wneud yr hyn a fynnai i Gymru a'i galwadau am ddemocratiaeth ystyrlon.

It was in the mid eighteenth century, with the advent of the industrial revolution, the growth of nonconformity and the establishment of the Griffith Jones circulatory schools, that the self confidence of the Welsh began to blossom. The schools of Griffith Jones, sponsored by Madam Bevan, taught half the population to read and write. It seems that this small nation, at that time, was the most literate country in the world. Griffith Jones was a Church of England clergyman, and his setting up of hundreds of Welsh circulatory schools in every county in Wales was much opposed by the established church. Twenty five such schools were established in the parishes of Cardiff alone.

The lesson to be learned is that this great life-enhancing educational project spanning half a century did not originate from the Government at Westminster. It was an entirely Welsh enterprise, and the influential people of the day were not at all supportive of it. Today, when we talk of lifelong education, it is worth remembering that classes of pupils ranging from three years old to 90 years old are uncommon, but were commonplace in Griffith Jones's day. The lives of thousands upon thousands of people of all ages were transformed and enlightened by the work of Griffith Jones and Madame Bevan, and the nation's confidence was given a huge boost. At that time, the established church began to turn its back on the Welsh language, and so, with their new understanding gained through literacy, the people began to build nonconformist chapels throughout the land, Welsh being the main language in those places of worship.

Codwyd yr adeiladau hyn, fel y Tabernacl godidog yn Abertawe, gan bobl Cymru er gwaethaf anghymeradwyaeth Llyfrau Gleision bradwrus Llywodraeth San Steffan, a gyhoeddwyd yn 1847. Yr oedd yr adroddiad hwnnw'n bwrw sen a gwawd ar y Cymry, eu hiaith, eu crefydd, eu harferion cymdeithasol a'u gwleidyddiaeth radical, fel yr amlygwyd yn nherfysgoedd Beca, terfysgoedd Merthyr a chan

uprising and by the Chartists. The roots of our radical political tradition lie in the stones of those chapels and in the egalitarian spirit that gave birth to them and underpinned the actions of those who dared to make a stand against the injustices of the age. Yet again, this progressive change and growth in national awareness and confidence was driven by the people of Wales. Indeed, like much else that seeks to promote the wellbeing of our people, it brought a negative reaction from Westminster and the establishment in the shape of the Blue Books and the Education Act of 1870—punitive measures that sought to destroy the Welsh language through the use of the ‘Welsh not’.

By the second half of the nineteenth century, Wales’s population had reached 1.5 million—threefold the figure of 100 years earlier. There was a growing demand for a university, and that demand came from within Wales. The support and provision also came from within Wales. We can take pride and confidence in the fact that the people of Wales, though bereft of a Government that was concerned for their wellbeing, cooperated with each other, north and south, east and west, Welsh-speaking and non-Welsh-speaking, labourers and entrepreneurs, in creating the University of Wales—not bad for a small nation without a capital city and without a national government. Yet again, progress was planned from within.

Following in the wake of the University of Wales at Aberystwyth came other institutions, such as the Football Association of Wales, the Welsh Rugby Union, the national museum and the national library. All these new channels for cultural expression were Welsh initiatives, financed by the efforts of the people of Wales. None of them stem from Westminster, to whose apron strings we are still firmly bound.

The history of Wales in itself is a great source of pride and confidence, but in most of our schools and for most of our people, it is a closely-guarded secret. Just look at the place of Welsh history in the curriculum, which has its origins in Westminster. In reality, as it is applied in most of our schools, our great heroes and heroines are displaced by England’s kings and queens. Why do we

y Siartwyr. Mae gwreiddiau ein traddodiad gwleidyddol radical yng ngherrig y capeli hynny ac yn yr ysbryd egalitaraidd a’u hysgogodd, ac a oedd yn sail i weithredoedd y rhai a feiddiodd sefyll yn erbyn anghyfiawnder yr oes. Unwaith eto, cafodd y newid a’r twf graddol hwn mewn ymwybyddiaeth a hyder cenedlaethol ei ysgogi gan bobl Cymru. Yn wir, fel llawer peth arall sy’n ceisio hyrwyddo lles ein pobl, arweiniodd at ymateb negyddol gan San Steffan a sefydlu Deddf Addysg 1870 ar lun y Llyfrau Gleision—mesurau cosbol a oedd yn ceisio dinistrio’r iaith Gymraeg drwy ddefnyddio’r ‘Welsh not’.

Erbyn ail hanner y bedwaredd ganrif ar bymtheg, yr oedd poblogaeth Cymru wedi cyrraedd 1.5 miliwn—deirgwaith yn fwy na’r nifer 100 mlynedd yn gynharach. Yr oedd galw cynyddol am brifysgol, ac o fewn ffiniau Cymru y daeth y galw hwnnw. O Gymru hefyd y daeth y cymorth a’r ddarpariaeth. Gallwn ymfalchïo gyda hyder yn y ffaith fod pobl Cymru, er eu bod wedi eu hamddifadu o Lywodraeth a oedd yn ofalus o’u lles, wedi cydweithredu o’r gogledd i’r de, o’r dwyrain i’r gorllewin, yn Gymru Cymraeg a di-Gymraeg, yn llafurwyr ac yn entrepreneuriaid, i greu Prifysgol Cymru—tipyn o gamp i genedl fach heb brifddinas a heb lywodraeth genedlaethol. Unwaith eto, o’r tu mewn y cynlluniwyd cynnydd.

Yn sgîl sefydlu Prifysgol Cymru yn Aberystwyth, daeth sefydliadau eraill, fel Cymdeithas Bêl-droed Cymru, Undeb Rygbi Cymru, yr amgueddfa genedlaethol a’r llyfrgell genedlaethol. Mentrau Cymreig oedd pob un o’r sianeli newydd hyn ar gyfer mynegiant diwylliannol, wedi’u hariannu gan ymdrechion pobl Cymru. Nid oes yr un ohonynt wedi deillio o San Steffan, er ein bod yn dal ynghlwm wrthi.

Mae hanes Cymru ei hun yn rhywbeth i ymfalchïo’n fawr ynddo ac i ennyn hyder, ond yn y rhan fwyaf o’n hysgolion ac i fwyaf ein pobl, mae’n gyfrinach fawr. Edrychwch ar le hanes Cymru yn y cwricwlwm, sydd â’i wreiddiau yn San Steffan. Y gwir amdani yw bod y ffordd y caiff ei defnyddio yn y rhan fwyaf o’n hysgolion yn golygu bod ein harwyr a’n harwresau mawr yn cael eu disodli gan

operate this strange perversion? Is it Cambrophobia, Anglophilia, or perhaps both? The education curriculum is another opportunity to boost the confidence of the people.

The built environment can also be a fountainhead of inspiration and pride, although the plans and costs to the public purse are often initially a cause of disagreement, and a chance for Jeremiahs to make prophecies of doom. The people, in general, are proud of the civic centre in Cathays, of the Millennium Stadium and of the Wales Millennium Centre. Those buildings are of an international standard, reflecting our national aspirations and presenting icons of our status as a nation. Wise investment in the built environment can bring long-lasting benefits, adding to the appearance of the landscape and providing an uplifting experience for the people. The inspiration for these splendid developments, again, came from within Wales. The topography of Wales is often referred to in relation to the difficulties that it presents for travel and for the transmission of television and radio signals in some parts. However, far from being a drawback, our landscape has enormous potential—its variety is intriguing and its beauty outstanding. However, as yet, its attractions are not being fully utilised. I will come back to that.

The Welsh nation is divided by poor internal transport links that hinder access and co-ordination, thus undermining economic development, especially in Objective 1 areas. The attractions of north Wales are rarely if ever experienced by the people of south-east Wales, while people from north Wales feel that the capital city's attractions are not easily accessed. Who will take the initiative by providing a modern road network and an efficient rail service between Caerdybi and Caerdydd? In the south Wales Valleys, ultra-modern rail travel would be a cheap price to pay for raising the image of the region, increasing its economic prospects and giving the people a much-needed sense of being closer to the cutting edge of technology, rather than lingering in the shadow of King Coal.

Wales is not lacking in distinctiveness and

frenhinoedd a breninesau Lloegr. Pam yr ydym yn gweithredu'r gwyrdd rhyfedd hwn? Ai Cambroffobia, Angloffilia ydyw, ynteu'r ddau, efallai? Mae'r cwricwlwm addysg yn gyfle arall i roi hwb i hyder pobl.

Gall yr amgylchedd adeiledig hefyd fod yn ffynhonnell ganolog o ysbrydoliaeth a balchder, er bod y cynlluniau a'r costau i bwrs y wlad yn aml yn destun dadl ac yn gyfle i'r proffwydi gwae fanteisio arno. Mae'r bobl, yn gyffredinol, yn ymfalchïo yn y ganolfan ddinesig yn Cathays, yn Stadiwm y Mileniwm ac yng Nghanolfan Mileniwm Cymru. Mae'r adeiladau hynny o safon ryngwladol, sy'n adlewyrchu ein dyheadau cenedlaethol ac sy'n rhoi inni eiconau o'n statws fel cenedl. Gall buddsoddi'n ddoeth yn yr amgylchedd adeiledig ddod â buddiannau parhaol yn ei sgîl, gan ychwanegu at y dirwedd a darparu profiad ysbrydoledig i'r bobl. Daeth yr ysbrydoliaeth ar gyfer y datblygiadau gwych hyn, unwaith eto, o Gymru. Cyfeirir at dopograffeg Cymru yn aml mewn cysylltiad â'r anawsterau y mae'n eu hachosi o ran teithio a throsglwyddo signalau teledu a radio mewn rhai ardaloedd. Fodd bynnag, yn hytrach na bod yn anfantais, mae gan ein tirwedd botensial aruthrol—mae ei hamrywiaeth yn ddiddorol iawn a'i phrydferthwch yn eithriadol. Fodd bynnag, hyd yma, nid yw ei hatyniadau'n cael eu defnyddio i'r eithaf. Dof yn ôl at hynny.

Mae'r genedl Gymreig yn cael ei holli oherwydd cysylltiadau trafndiaeth mewnl gwael sy'n llesteirio mynediad a chydgyssylltu, ac sy'n tanseilio datblygu economaidd, yn arbennig mewn ardaloedd Amcan 1. Anaml iawn y caiff pobl y De-ddwyrain gyfle i weld atyniadau'r Gogledd, os o gwbl, a bydd pobl y Gogledd yn teimlo nad yw atyniadau'r brifddinas yn hawdd eu cyrraedd. Pwy fydd yn cymryd y cam i ddarparu rhwydwaith ffyrdd modern a gwasanaeth rheilffordd effeithlon rhwng Caerdybi a Chaerdydd? Yng Nghymoedd y De, byddai teithio ar reilffordd fodern yn bris rhad i'w dalu am wella delwedd y rhanbarth, cynyddu ei ragolygon economaidd a rhoi ymdeimlad y mae ei ddirfawr angen ar bobl o fod lawer yn nes at dechnoleg fodern, yn hytrach na byw yng nghysgod y Diwydiant Glo.

Nid oes diffyg hynodrydd a photensial yng



potential. There is the Welsh language, our cultural traditions, eisteddfodau at international, national and local levels, our rich history, our natural and built environment and our talented singers and musician—that is but a brief list of some of the many positive characteristics of this nation.

During the first six years of the National Assembly, we have seen support for the Wales Millennium Centre, the new Assembly debating chamber, the adoption of 'Iaith Pawb', the introduction of the foundation phase in education and the pegging of student fees, which are all decisions that will do much to strengthen the image of Wales as a distinct and progressive nation, and, in the latter case, to reverse the brain drain.

The foundation phase, for example, will mean that children will be introduced to learning through structured play and practical experiences at three years of age, when their capacity for acquiring knowledge is so profound. If we are to build on this promising foundation and raise the levels of achievement of older pupils, we need to provide more than facile gestures towards the needs of the non-academic majority. The confidence of the people of Wales is lowest among those whose school life left them with low self-esteem, because the main measure of their ability was an academic one. In building a confident nation, we need to identify the skills of the non-academically inclined at an early stage, and develop the staff and facilities to provide an education that increasingly addresses the needs of these pupils. Such a move would decrease social disaffection and provide a large workforce of skilled people. Here lies another huge opportunity to raise the confidence of the many.

Another factor that depresses the confidence of the Welsh people is their frequent failure to utilise opportunities on their doorstep due to a lack of capital. The tourism industry in Wales, with its great potential, seems to be controlled by incomers from richer parts.

Similarly, the Government of Wales is held back from improving our economic structures, and much else besides, because it

Nghymru. Mae gennym yr iaith Gymraeg, ein traddodiadau diwylliannol, eisteddfodau rhyngwladol, cenedlaethol a lleol, ein hanes cyfoethog, ein hamgylchedd naturiol ac adeiledig, a'n cantorion a'n cerddorion dawnus—dim ond rhestr fer yw honno o rai o nodweddion cadarnhaol niferus y wlad hon.

Yn ystod chwe mlynedd cyntaf y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yr ydym wedi gweld cefnogaeth i Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru, siambr ddadlau newydd y Cynulliad, mabwysiadu 'Iaith Pawb', cyflwyno'r cam sylfaen ym myd addysg, sefydlogi ffioedd myfyrwyr, sydd i gyd yn benderfyniadau a fydd yn gwneud llawer i gryfhau delwedd Cymru fel gwlad hynod a blaengar, ac yn achos yr olaf, i wyrdroi draenio doniau o Gymru.

Bydd y cyfnod sylfaen, er enghraifft, yn golygu y caiff plant eu cyflwyno i ddysgu drwy chwarae strwythuredig a phrofiadau ymarferol yn dair oed, pan fydd eu gallu i amsugno gwybodaeth mor sylweddol. Os ydym am adeiladu ar y sylfaen addawol hon a gwella lefelau cyflawni disgyblion hŷn, mae angen inni ddarparu mwy na chydabyddiaeth arwynebol o anghenion y mwyafrif anacademaidd. Mae hyder pobl Cymru ar ei isaf ymysg y rheini y mae eu cyfnod yn yr ysgol wedi eu gwneud yn ddihyder, gan mai'r prif ddull o fesur eu gallu oedd dull academaidd. Er mwyn datblygu cenedl hyderus, mae angen inni nodi sgiliau pobl anacademaidd yn gynnar, a datblygu'r staff a'r cyfleusterau i ddarparu addysg sy'n mynd i'r afael fwyfwy ag anghenion y disgyblion hyn. Byddai cam o'r fath yn lleihau dadrithio cymdeithasol ac yn darparu gweithlu helaeth o bobl fedrus. Yma mae cyfle enfawr arall i gynyddu hyder y mwyafrif.

Ffactor arall sy'n ergyd i hyder pobl Cymru yw eu methiant cyson i fanteisio ar y cyfleoedd sydd ar garreg eu drws, oherwydd prinder cyfalaf. Ymddengys fod y diwydiant twristiaeth yng Nghymru, gyda'i botensial mawr, yn cael ei reoli gan fewnfudwyr o ardaloedd cyfoethocach.

Yn yr un modd, caiff Llywodraeth Cymru ei hatal rhag gwella ein strwythurau economaidd, a nifer o bethau eraill yn ogystal, gan nad oes

lacks the power of a proper government, such as that of Ireland, to borrow money. This lack of financial control makes our resources vulnerable to exploitation from elsewhere, and puts us in an inferior position to our neighbours in Ireland and England.

As a nation, Wales is rich in opportunities and potential and the development of the Welsh nation is the result of our own initiative and enterprise and owes little to Westminster. Co-operation and determination have been essential factors in strengthening the identity of Wales. Although a clear process of national development is easily identifiable, its progress has been fitful because decision making lies elsewhere. The National Assembly Government lacks the powers, and, too often, the will and the vision, to expand the confidence and prosperity of the people of Wales.

It is essential for the self-confidence and well-being of our people that Westminster releases its brake on our progress.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yr wyf yn meddwl y dylwn i ddweud 'follow that'. Nid wyf yn siŵr beth arall y gallaf ddweud, na lle i ddechrau na gorffen. Yr wyf yn diolch i Owen John Thomas am ei araith heriol. Yr wyf yn cyd-fynd yn llwyr â'r angen am Senedd a phwerau deddfwriaeth sylfaenol i Gymru, ac mae'n bwysig ein bod i gyd yn gwneud ein gorau yn y Cynulliad i gefnogi a magu hunan-hyder drwy Gymru.

4.50 p.m.

**Lisa Francis:** Diolch, Owen John, am roi munud i mi yn y ddadl hon.

You spoke about the growth in confidence in Wales being driven by the people of Wales, demands for a university coming from within Wales and so on, and I am sure that you will agree with me that the demand for a referendum on future powers for this place is also coming from the people of Wales. However, just as the established church turned its back on the language over 100 years ago, as you mentioned, the Welsh Labour Government, which is all about maintaining control and thwarting ambition

ganddi'r pŵer sydd gan lywodraeth go iawn, fel llywodraeth Iwerddon, i fenthyca arian. Mae'r diffyg rheolaeth ariannol hwn yn golygu bod perygl i rywun arall gam-fanteisio ar ein hadnoddau, a'n rhoi ni mewn sefyllfa israddol o'n cymharu â'n cymdogion yn Iwerddon a Lloegr.

Fel cenedl, mae Cymru yn gyfuriog lu o gyfleoedd, ac mae ganddi lawer o botensial. Mae'r genedl hon wedi datblygu o ganlyniad i'n cymhelliant a'n mentergarwch ni ein hunain, ac ni ellir priodoli bron ddim o hyn i San Steffan. Mae cydweithredu a dyfalbarhad wedi bod yn hanfodol o ran cryfhau hunaniaeth Cymru. Er bod proses glir o ddatblygiad cenedlaethol yn hawdd i'w gweld, mae'r cynnydd wedi bod yn anwastad gan mai rywle arall y gwneir y penderfyniadau. Nid oes gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru y pwerau, na'r ewylllys na'r weledigaeth yn aml iawn, i wella hyder a ffyniant pobl Cymru.

Mae'n hanfodol, er mwyn hunanhyder a lles ein pobl, i San Steffan roi'r gorau i atal ein cynnydd.

**Eleanor Burnham:** 'Follow that', I think I should say. I am not sure what else I can say, or where I should start or finish. I thank Owen John Thomas for his challenging speech. I entirely agree with the need for a Parliament and primary legislative powers for Wales, and it is important that we all do our best in the Assembly to support and encourage self-confidence throughout Wales.

**Lisa Francis:** Thank you, Owen John, for allowing me a minute in this debate.

Yr oeddech yn sôn bod y twf mewn hyder yng Nghymru yn cael ei ysgogi gan bobl Cymru, a bod y galw am brifysgol wedi dod o fewn ffiniau Cymru, ac ati, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch â mi fod y galw am refferendwm ar bwerau i'r wlad yn y dyfodol hefyd yn dod o blith pobl Cymru. Fodd bynnag, yn union fel y bu i'r eglwys sefydledig droi ei chefn ar yr iaith dros 100 mlynedd yn ôl, fel y dywedech, mae Llywodraeth Lafur Cymru, sydd am gadw rheolaeth a rhwystro uchelgais a dychymyg i'n gwlad, yn gwrthod rhoi refferendwm inni. Mae

and imagination for our country, is denying us a referendum. The people of Wales have placed their trust in Welsh Labour, but Welsh Labour will not trust them.

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** I did not know quite what to expect in this debate, Owen John, but I thought that we might have a trip down memory lane, and I was not disappointed. As someone who used to represent Gwyn Alf Williams in Plasturton Gardens, I had many a conversation with him about the interpretation of Welsh history, and I am currently reading a book that covers the eighteenth century in Wales, so I can identify with, and know the origins of, many of the things that he said. However, I wanted to bring us a bit more up to date, although Owen John also did that at the end of your speech. I also hope to give a less pessimistic tone to that which Owen John gave. He talked a lot about ambition and confidence as if it did not exist now, and that is not my experience of the modern Wales or my experience of talking to people, young and old, across Wales. There is a great deal of confidence at present.

Fundamental to your speech, Owen John—although you might not have addressed it—was the issue of the state and the people. When I look at history, it seems to me that, wherever they are in the world, it is nearly always people who bring the changes on. The state can interfere at times, can hold them back and can encourage them at times, but if you look at the great changes across the world, you will find that they are more or less driven by people determine to improve their lot.

**Owen John Thomas:** Will you give way?

**Sue Essex:** Let me say my bit and then perhaps there will be a couple of minutes left at the end.

That was just a personal view of history. You attacked Westminster, and I understand why; I have known you for many years. However, wherever you are in this world, you find that it is people wanting to have change and wanting Governments to respond that makes the difference, along, sometimes, with changing Governments; I acknowledge that.

pobl Cymru wedi ymddiried yn Llafur Cymru, ond nid yw Llafur Cymru am ymddiried ynnddynt hwy.

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Nid oeddwn yn siŵr beth yn union i'w ddisgwyl yn y ddadl hon, Owen John, ond yr oeddwn wedi meddwl mai hel atgofion y byddem, ac ni chefais fy siomi. Fel rhywun a arferai gynrychioli Gwyn Alf Williams yng Ngerddi Plasturton, cefais lawer sgwrs gydag ef ynglŷn â dehongli hanes Cymru, ac yr wyf yn darllen llyfr ar hyn o bryd sy'n trafod y ddeunawfed ganrif yng Nghymru, felly, gallaf uniaethu â nifer o'r pethau a ddywedodd a gwybod o ble yr oeddent yn tarddu. Fodd bynnag, yr oeddwn am ddiweddarau pethau ryw faint, er i Owen John wneud hynny ar ddiwedd eich araith. Gobeithiaf hefyd greu naws llai pesimistaidd nag a gafwyd gan Owen John. Soniodd lawer am uchelgais a hyder fel pe na bai hynny'n bodoli yn awr. Nid dyna fy mhrofiad i o'r Gymru fodern na'r profiad a gaf wrth siarad â phobl, hen ac ifanc, ledled Cymru. Mae yma lawer iawn o hyder ar hyn o bryd.

Rhan sylfaenol o'ch araith, Owen John—er efallai nad oeddech yn ymdrin â hynny—oedd mater y wladwriaeth a'r bobl. Pan edrychaf ar hanes, ymddengys i mi mai pobl, waeth ble y maent yn y byd, sy'n ysgogi'r newidiadau bron bob amser. Gall y wladwriaeth ymyrryd ar adegau, gall eu dal yn ôl a'u hannog ar adegau, ond os edrychwch ar y newidiadau mawr ar draws y byd, fe welwch eu bod fwy neu lai wedi'u llywio gan bobl a oedd yn benderfynol o wella eu sefyllfa.

**Owen John Thomas:** A wnewch ildio?

**Sue Essex:** Gadewch imi ddweud fy rhan, ac yna efallai y bydd ychydig funudau'n weddill ar y diwedd.

Golwg bersonol ar hanes oedd honno. Yr oeddech yn ymosod ar San Steffan, ac yr wyf yn deall pam; yr wyf yn eich adnabod ers llawer blwyddyn. Fodd bynnag, ble bynnag y byddwch yn y byd hwn, fe welwch mai pobl sydd am gael newid ac sydd am i lywodraethau ymateb sy'n gwneud y gwahaniaeth, ynghyd â llywodraethau sydd yn newid, weithiau; yr wyf yn cydnabod

hynny.

Perhaps one of the fundamental differences between us on the Labour side and you in the other parties is that we fundamentally feel that we try to tell the truth, but you must not knock people's confidence—and this is true in terms of bringing up the subject of people—so that they are unable to make that journey. You have to say—and I believe that this is happening in Wales—that we are making great strides and great improvements but that that is not the full story: we have to strive more and we have to go further, as I think that you were intimating.

Efallai mai un o'r gwahaniaethau sylfaenol rhyngom ni ar yr ochr Lafur a chi yn y pleidiau eraill yw ein bod, yn y bôn, yn teimlo ein bod yn ceisio dweud y gwir. Ond ni ddylech danseilio hyder pobl—ac mae hyn yn wir wrth drafod mater pobl—fel na allant wneud y daith honno. Rhaid ichi gydnabod—a chredaf fod hyn yn digwydd yng Nghymru—ein bod yn cymryd camau mawr ac yn gwneud gwelliannau mawr. Ond nid dyna'r stori gyfan: rhaid inni ymdrechu'n galetach a rhaid inni fynd ymhellach, fel yr oeddech yn ei awgrymu, mi gredaf.

If you look at the economy—

Os edrychwch ar yr economi—

**Owen John Thomas:** Will you give way?

**Owen John Thomas:** A wnewch ildio?

**Sue Essex:** No, let me speak; you had a long say.

**Sue Essex:** Na wnaaf, gadewch imi siarad; cawsoch chi roi araith hir.

**Owen John Thomas:** It was my debate.

**Owen John Thomas:** Fy nadl i ydoedd.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn.

**Sue Essex:** That is right. You have had your debate, so you are expecting a response, and I am doing my best to respond to you.

**Sue Essex:** Mae hynny'n wir. Yr ydych wedi cael eich dadl, felly, yr ydych yn disgwyl ymateb, ac yr wyf yn gwneud fy ngorau i ymateb ichi.

If you look at the economy, the figures speak for themselves. We have had some bad news now with Sony, but, nevertheless, overall, employment has risen by 109,000 since the Assembly came into being. That is a dramatic change in a Wales that, 30 years ago, had dreadful levels of unemployment. We have never before seen the figures that we are seeing now.

Os edrychwch ar yr economi, mae'r ffigurau'n dweud y cyfan. Cawsom ychydig newyddion drwg yn awr gyda Sony, ond er hynny, ar y cyfan, mae cyflogaeth wedi codi 109,000 ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad. Mae hynny'n newid dramatig mewn gwlad lle yr lefelau diweithdra ofnadwy 30 mlynedd yn ôl. Nid ydym erioed o'r blaen wedi gweld y ffigurau a welwn yn awr.

That is also portrayed in what we are expecting in terms of education. You quite rightly pinpointed education. Education is about youngsters coming through with ambition and, as you intimated, with hopes in terms of what they want to do in the future. If you look at things such as results and class sizes, again, you will see dramatic changes in Wales. Importantly, as I said, this is just the beginning of the story. The Rees report clearly pointed out that we need to bring more young people through who are expecting to go into full-time education, so

Caiff hynny ei bortreadu hefyd yn yr hyn a ddisgwylwn o ran addysg. Cyfeirich at addysg, a hynny'n briodol ddiogn. Mae a wnelo addysg ag ieuenctid yn datblygu gydag uchelgais, ac fel yr awgrymech, gyda gobaith am yr hyn y maent am ei wneud yn y dyfodol. Os edrychwch ar bethau fel canlyniadau a maint dosbarthiadau, eto fe welwch newidiadau mawr yng Nghymru. Yn bwysicach, fel y dywedais, dim ond dechrau'r daith yw hyn. Cyfeiriai adroddiad Rees yn glir at y ffaith fod angen inni baratoi mwy o bobl ifanc sy'n disgwyl dilyn addysg amser llawn. Felly, mae angen inni

we need to raise ambitions and the confidence to do that.

We are seeing a dramatic change in terms of the environment. The number of blue-flag beaches and the levels of recycling in Wales are increasing. A great deal of effort is being made. Occasionally, Owen John, we see some good things coming from Westminster. Carwyn recently took the lead in terms of the legislation on access to open countryside, which has been drastically needed across the UK for many years as people had been denied access. It is an important piece of legislation that has enabled Wales to contribute to that.

You mentioned cultural life; I think that that is often a good indicator of how confident people are. People are willing to perform, to be involved and to participate in a way that they perhaps would not have been 20 or 30 years ago. Therefore, the cultural vitality expressed through the Wales Millennium Centre, in a dramatic form, and in other areas that are not quite so obvious to us here, is about the way in which people perceive themselves and about their self-confidence.

How Wales is viewed internationally has also changed dramatically, partly because of devolution. There is also the idea that Wales, as a relatively small country, can play its part in the development of the world. The sustainable development regions that Carwyn has been leading on have been a good indication that there is confidence in Wales in terms of trying out ideas and different ways of doing things that can be shared across the world.

If we consider what the Government can do and how it can intervene, I would suggest that many of the things that we have done—and all of us have been involved in that work, be that through committees or Plenary—have helped to revitalise people's faith in themselves in Wales. They have helped to raise expectations, certainly among young people. It is interesting that when children from my constituency visit the Assembly—and I and Lorraine probably have more schools from our constituencies visiting the Assembly than any other Member—and I ask them what they want to do in the future, their

wella uchelgais a'r hyder i wneud hynny.

Gwelwn newid mawr o ran yr amgylchedd. Mae nifer y traethau baner glas a lefelau ailgylchu yng Nghymru yn cynyddu. Mae yma ymdrechu caled. Ar adegau, Owen John, fe welwn rai pethau da yn dod o San Steffan. Yr oedd Carwyn ar y blaen yn ddiweddar yn arwain y ddeddfwriaeth ar fynediad i gefn gwlad agored. Yr oedd angen mawr am hynny ledled y DU ers blynyddoedd lawer am nad oedd pobl wedi cael mynediad o'r fath. Mae'n ddarn pwysig o ddeddfwriaeth sydd wedi galluogi Cymru i gyfrannu at hynny.

Yr oeddech yn crybwyll bywyd diwylliannol; credaf fod hynny'n arwydd da o hyder pobl. Mae pobl yn barod i berfformio, i gymryd rhan ac i gyfranogi mewn ffordd na fyddent wedi gwneud, efallai, 20 neu 30 mlynedd yn ôl. Felly, mae a wnelo'r bywiogrwydd diwylliannol a fynegwyd drwy Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru, ar ffurf ddramatig, ac mewn meysydd eraill nad ydynt mor amlwg inni yma, â'r ffordd y mae pobl yn gweld eu hunain a'u hunanhyder.

Mae'r farn ryngwladol am Gymru wedi newid yn ddramatig hefyd, yn rhannol oherwydd datganoli. Tybir hefyd y gall Cymru, fel gwlad gymharol fach, chwarae ei rhan yn y broses o ddatblygu'r byd. Mae'r rhanbarthau datblygu cynaliadwy, lle mae Carwyn wedi arwain, wedi bod yn arwydd da fod yma hyder yng Nghymru o ran profi syniadau a ffyrdd gwahanol o wneud pethau y gellir eu rhannu ar draws y byd.

Os ystyriwn beth y gall y Llywodraeth ei wneud a sut y gall ymyrryd, byddwn yn awgrymu bod nifer o'r pethau yr ydym wedi'u gwneud—ac yr ydym i gyd wedi bod yn gysylltiedig â'r gwaith hwnnw, boed drwy bwyllgorau neu'r Cyfarfod Llawn—wedi helpu adnewyddu ffydd pobl ynddynt eu hunain yng Nghymru. Maent wedi helpu codi disgwyliadau, yn sicr ymhlith pobl ifanc. Mae'n ddiddorol sylwi, pan fydd plant yn fy etholaeth i yn ymweld â'r Cynulliad—ac mae'n siŵr fod mwy o ysgolion o'm etholaeth i ac etholaeth Lorraine yn ymweld â'r Cynulliad nag unrhyw Aelod arall—pan fyddaf yn gofyn iddynt beth maent am ei wneud yn y dyfodol,

ambitions are quite exciting. They do not limit their ambitions and say, 'Well, this is all that I think that I can do'. They have high ambitions, and I am glad to say that some of them want to do my job.

**Owen John Thomas:** You said that the ordinary people of England had created its great institutions. Do you think that it was the people of Somerset and Yorkshire that built the Palace of Westminster? That idea came from the Lords. Let us get things straight here. You also talked about what Westminster has given us. The Welsh Intermediate Education Act 1889 was a Welsh education Act brought about by pressure from Welsh MPs so that secondary schools that provided free education could be created in Wales. They were the first schools in Britain that pupils did not have to pay to attend. You attended them on your own merit and not if your parents were rich enough. Also, what Carwyn did came from him; it did not come from Westminster.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I will have to interrupt proceedings at 5 p.m..

**Sue Essex:** I bow to your knowledge of Welsh history, but I think that you have got it wrong on my example. The motion did not come from Carwyn; it came from Westminster and the people who walked and trespassed on Kinder Scout many years ago. That was the basis of that piece of legislation that took all those years to become law. Therefore, I think that we can agree to disagree on that.

I strongly believe that our job as politicians is to help people to have self-confidence and to have the opportunity to lead a fulfilling life. That is our role, and that is what our party is about. If you do not think that that is a noble cause to be part of, Lisa, the gulf between us is bigger than I thought it was. It is our job to support everyone, regardless of their race, creed or origin, so that they have the best opportunities in their lives to fulfil that role. That is the—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I am required under Standing Order No. 6.40 to

mae eu huchelgeisiau'n ddigon cyffrous. Nid ydynt yn cyfyngu eu huchelgeisiau ac yn dweud, 'Wel, rwyf yn credu mai dyma'r cyfan y gallaf ei wneud'. Mae ganddynt uchelgeisiau uchel, ac yr wyf yn falch o ddweud bod rhai ohonynt am wneud fy swydd i.

**Owen John Thomas:** Yr oeddech yn dweud mai pobl gyffredin Lloegr a greodd ei sefydliadau mawr hi. A ydych yn credu mai pobl Gwlad yr Haf a Swydd Efrog a adeiladodd Balas San Steffan? Yr Arglwyddi a feddyliodd am hynny. Gadewch inni egluro ychydig bethau yma. Yr oeddech yn siarad hefyd am yr hyn y mae San Steffan wedi ei roi i ni. Deddf addysg Gymreig oedd Deddf Addysg Ganolradd Cymru 1889 a gyflwynwyd yn sgîl pwysau gan Aelodau Seneddol o Gymru fel y gellid creu ysgolion uwchradd a oedd yn darparu addysg am ddim yng Nghymru. Y rheini oedd yr ysgolion cyntaf ym Mhrydain nad oedd yn rhaid i ddisgyblion dalu i'w mynychu. Byddech yn eu mynychu yn ôl eich haeddiant eich hun, nid yn ôl a oedd eich rhieni'n ddigon cyfoethog neu beidio. Hefyd, Carwyn oedd yn gyfrifol am yr hyn a wnaeth; nid San Steffan.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Bydd yn rhaid imi dorri ar draws y trafodion am 5 p.m.

**Sue Essex:** Yr wyf yn cydnabod eich bod yn wybodus am hanes Cymru, ond credaf ichi wneud camgymeriad yn fy enghraifft i. Ni ddaeth y cynnig gan Carwyn; daeth o San Steffan a chan y bobl a gerddodd ac a dresmasodd ar Kinder Scout flynyddoedd maith yn ôl. Dyna oedd sail y darn hwnnw o ddeddfwriaeth a gymerodd yr holl flynyddoedd hynny i ddod yn gyfraith. Felly, credaf y gallwn gytuno i anghytuno ar hynny.

Credaf yn gryf mai ein swydd fel gwleidyddion yw helpu pobl i fagu hunanhyder a chael y cyfle i fyw bywyd cyflawn. Dyna yw ein rôl, a dyna yw nod ein plaid. Os na chredwch ei fod yn achos clodwiw i fod yn rhan ohono, Lisa, yna mae'r bwlch rhyngom yn fwy nag a feddyliais. Ein swydd ni yw cefnogi pawb, waeth beth fo'u hil, eu credo neu eu tarddiad, fel y gallant gael y cyfleoedd gorau yn eu bywydau i gyflawni'r rôl honno. Dyna'r—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.40 rhaid imi dorri ar draws y

interrupt proceedings so that we can move on to the next item.

trafodion fel y gallwn symud ymlaen i'r eitem nesaf.

5.00 p.m.

## **Dadl Fer Short Debate**

### **Tetra—yr achos dros reolaeth Tetra—the case for control**

**Nick Bourne:** I thank Owen John for the build up to this final short debate. I have agreed to take contributions from Tamsin, Helen Mary, Rhodri Glyn—who is not here—and Mick Bates.

**Nick Bourne:** Diolchaf i Owen John am y cyflwyniad i'r ddadl fer olaf hon. Cytunais i dderbyn cyfraniadau gan Tamsin, Helen Mary, Rhodri Glyn—nad yw'n bresennol—a Mick Bates.

Tetra, or terrestrial trunked radio, the digital cell phone system that the Government has chosen for the police, has been causing anxieties since the masts started to be erected to support the system in 2001. Tetra, like mobile phone systems, uses masts or base stations. The advantages of the system for the police are well known. The system offers the user fairly secure communications that, like all other digital radio technologies, deliver clear speech. It allows users to talk in a group with radios, and to talk to other users with similar digital systems elsewhere. It has a help button that enables the user to call for assistance very quickly. Other facilities, such as the ability to look up police computer information, are said to be possible in the future.

Mae Tetra, neu uwch-radio daearol, y system ffôn gellol ddigidol a ddewiswyd gan y Llywodraeth ar gyfer yr heddlu, wedi bod yn achosi pryderon ers i'r mastiau ddechrau cael eu codi i gynnal y system yn 2001. Mae Tetra, fel systemau ffôn symudol, yn defnyddio mastiau neu orsafoedd. Mae manteision y system i'r heddlu yn hysbys iawn. Mae'r system yn cynnig dull cyfathrebu cymharol ddiogel i'r defnyddiwr sydd, fel pob technoleg radio ddigidol arall, yn sicrhau bod y llais yn glir. Mae'n caniatáu i'r defnyddiwr siarad mewn grŵp sydd â setiau radio, ac i siarad â defnyddwyr eraill sydd â systemau digidol tebyg mewn mannau eraill. Mae yn y system fotwm cymorth sy'n galluogi'r defnyddiwr i alw am gymorth yn gyflym iawn. Dywedir y bydd cyfleusterau eraill, fel gallu chwilio am wybodaeth ar gyfrifiaduron yr heddlu, yn bosibl yn y dyfodol.

Without doubt, there are many advantages to the system. However, there are also associated potential health risks related to the signal strength and associated electromagnetic fields. Tetra technology has not been tested to ascertain whether it is safe over the medium or long term. It is a microwave system, like ordinary mobile phones, but the masts talk to each other directly, and, unlike mobile phone masts, they transmit 24 hours a day. Signals are sent in pulses or bursts, which are transmitted at a frequency that coincides with the electrical frequency of the human brain in its waking state. Its amplitude is modulated at a rate of 17.65 Hz, very close to the beta waves of the human brain, which pulse at 16 Hz. It has the potential to interfere with, and overwhelm,

Yn ddiau, mae nifer o fanteision i'r system. Fodd bynnag, mae risgiau iechyd posibl hefyd yn gysylltiedig sy'n ymwneud â chryfder y signal a meysydd electromagnetig cysylltiedig. Nid yw technoleg Tetra wedi ei phrofi i gadarnhau a yw'n ddiogel dros gyfnod canolog neu gyfnod hir neu beidio. Mae'n system feicrodon, fel ffonau symudol cyffredin, ond mae'r mastiau'n siarad â'i gilydd yn uniongyrchol, ac, yn wahanol i fastiau ffonau symudol, maent yn trosglwyddo 24 awr y dydd. Anfonir signalau mewn curiadau neu hyrddiadau, a drosglwyddir ar amledd sy'n cyfateb i amledd trydan ymennydd dyn pan fydd yn effro. Caiff ei osgled ei fodylu ar gyfradd o 17.65 Hz, yn agos iawn at donfeddi beta ymennydd dyn, sy'n curo yn ôl 16 Hz. Gall ymyrryd â swyddogaethau cyffredin y corff a'u

normal bodily functions. This may sound terribly Dr Who, but systems that pulse at a similar frequency to Tetra were investigated for their potential as non-lethal weapons by the US during the cold war. Tetra has been known to have an effect on pacemakers, baby alarms, medical equipment—including first aid heart defibrillators—and vehicle electronics. I know that Assembly Members from all parties have some of these concerns.

Although much research has to be done on the siting of masts, the potential risk cannot be ignored, and must be factored in to any consideration on the siting of the masts. It is the issue that is of primary concern to me in this debate. At the moment, the stringent planning conditions that apply to other forms of construction do not apply to Tetra phone masts. Assembly planning guidance Technical Advice Note 19 sets out guidance on the siting of the masts and the specific situations where planning permission is not needed. One of these exemptions is where the height of the mast is less than 15m. Importantly, this also applies where such a mast is placed on top of an existing building.

This loophole, as I see it, has recently been exposed by a case in Haverfordwest. I have had a great deal of correspondence on the matter, as have other Assembly Members. I am sure that some other suitable location could be found for this Tetra mast. It should not be sited on top of a police station in the centre of a busy town. The police station is right in the centre of Haverfordwest, in probably the most densely populated area in the county, and is in close proximity to eight schools, seven of which are primary schools, and one of which is a special needs school. Parents and concerned residents in the town are campaigning hard for the removal of the mast, and I strongly support them, as do others.

Stephen Crabb, the MP for Preseli Pembrokeshire, with whom I am working closely on the issue, told me that Tetra has been the biggest single component of his mail bag since he was elected in early May—such is the concern about the issue. We have both written, as I know have others, to the managing director of O2 Airwaves, which is

gorlethu. Efallai bod hyn yn swnio fel rhywbeth allan o Dr Who, ond yn ystod y rhyfel oer, ymchwiliodd yr UD i systemau sy'n curo yn ôl amledd tebyg i Tetra i ddarganfod eu potensial fel arfau nad oeddent yn angheuol. Mae'n hysbys bod Tetra wedi cael effaith ar reoliaduron y galon, larymau babanod, offer meddygol—gan gynnwys peiriannau diffibrileiddio i roi cymorth cyntaf i'r galon—ac electroneg cerbydau. Gwn fod gan Aelodau'r Cynulliad o bob plaid hefyd yn pryderu am hyn.

Er bod yn rhaid gwneud llawer o ymchwil ar leoliad mastiau, ni ellir anwybyddu'r risg bosibl, a rhaid i hyn gael ei gynnwys fel ffactor mewn unrhyw ystyriaeth wrth leoli'r mastiau. Dyma'r mater pwysicaf i mi yn y ddadl hon. Ar hyn o bryd, nid yw'r amodau cynllunio llym sy'n gymwys i ddulliau eraill o adeiladu yn gymwys i fastiau ffôn Tetra. Mae Nodyn Cyngor Technegol 19 yng nghanllawiau cynllunio'r Cynulliad yn gosod allan ganllawiau ar leoliad y mastiau a'r sefyllfaoedd penodol lle nad oes angen caniatâd cynllunio. Un o'r eithriadau hyn yw lle mae uchder y mast yn llai na 15m. Yn bwysig iawn, mae hyn yn gymwys hefyd lle caiff mast o'r fath ei osod ar ben adeilad presennol.

Cafodd y man gwan hwn, fel y'i gwelaf, ei amlygu'n ddiweddar mewn achos yn Hwlfordd. Cefais gryn lawer o ohebiaeth ar y mater, fel y cafodd Aelodau eraill y Cynulliad. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gellid dod o hyd i leoliad addas arall ar gyfer y mast Tetra hwn. Ni ddylai gael ei leoli ar ben gorsaf heddlu ynghanol tref brysur. Mae gorsaf yr heddlu ynghanol Hwlfordd, yn yr ardal fwyaf poblog yn y sir, mae'n siŵr, ac mae'n agos at wyth ysgol, saith ohonynt yn ysgolion cynradd, ac un sy'n ysgol anghenion arbennig. Mae rhieni a thrigolion y dref sy'n pryderu yn ymgyrchu'n galed i gael gwarded ar y mast, ac yr wyf yn eu cefnogi'n gryf, fel y mae eraill.

Yr wyf yn gweithio'n agos gyda Stephen Crabb, yr AS dros Breseli Sir Benfro, ar y mater a dywedodd wrthyf mai Tetra yw testun y rhan fwyaf o'r post y mae wedi ei gael ers ei ethol ddechrau mis Mai—cymaint yw'r pryder ynghylch y mater. Yr ydym ein dau wedi ysgrifennu, a gwn fod eraill wedi gwneud hynny hefyd, at gyfarwyddwr rheoli O2 Airwaves,



responsible for the mast, asking for it to be moved or turned off until such a time as it can be agreed that the mast be sited elsewhere. Unfortunately, this request did not get very far, to say the least.

It is fair to say that there is no illegality involved. Local authorities and the company have complied with the law. They are following Assembly Government guidance, clearly illustrated in a letter that I received in May from Pembrokeshire County Council, which said that if the telecommunications equipment complies with International Commission for Non-ionising Radiation Protection guidelines on power emissions, it should not be necessary for a local planning authority, in processing an application for planning permission or prior approval, to consider further health aspects and concerns about them. In my opinion, that is totally wrong—not legally, but in terms of common sense and morality. Masts under 15m should be subject to the same planning considerations as those above that height, but, in all cases, I am keen to see a change in the planning system so that proper account is taken of health considerations at the planning stage, which does not happen at the moment.

The lack of public consultation is naturally a major cause of grievance in people who suffer a loss of amenity when masts are erected without adequate consultation. I consider, as do others, the current situation to be unacceptable. This is, of course, not only a matter of health risks. There is the problem that the siting of base stations, particularly masts, can result in a loss of amenity and almost certainly a reduction in the value of property. Furthermore, the frustrations and concerns have a negative effect on people's health and wellbeing.

A mapping exercise should be undertaken in each local authority area to ascertain the most appropriate sites for masts away from residential developments, like Usmeston on the outskirts of Haverfordwest, which is being considered and has been the subject of unsuccessful applications in the past. They should certainly be sited away from schools, but schools in Haverfordwest are affected by the mast on the police station. I know that

sy'n gyfrifol am y mast, i ofyn am ei symud neu ei ddiffodd nes y gellir cytuno i leoli'r mast rywle arall. Yn anffodus, ni chafodd y cais lawer o effaith, a dweud y lleiaf.

Mae'n deg dweud nad yw hyn yn anghyfreithlon o gwbl. Mae awdurdodau lleol a'r cwmni wedi cydymffurfio â'r gyfraith. Maent yn dilyn canllawiau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, fel y nodir yn glir mewn llythyr a gefais ym mis Mai oddi wrth Gyngor Sir Penfro. Yr oedd hwnnw'n dweud, os bydd yr offer telathrebu yn cydymffurfio â chanllawiau'r Comisiwn Rhyngwladol ar Ddiogelu rhag Pelydredd nad yw'n Ïoneiddio ar gyfer gollyngiadau pŵer, na ddylai fod angen i awdurdod cynllunio lleol, wrth brosesu cais am ganiatâd cynllunio neu gymeradwyaeth ymlaen llaw, roi ystyriaeth bellach i agweddau iechyd a phryderon amdanynt. Yn fy marn i, mae hynny'n gwbl anghywir—nid yn gyfreithiol, ond o ran synnwyr cyffredin a moesoldeb. Dylai mastiau llai na 15m fod yn agored i'r un ystyriaethau cynllunio â rhai mwy na'r uchder hwnnw. Ond ym mhob achos, yr wyf yn awyddus i weld newid yn y system gynllunio fel y gellir rhoi ystyriaeth briodol i faterion iechyd yn y cam cynllunio, nad yw'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd.

Yn naturiol, mae'r diffyg ymgynghori â'r cyhoedd yn destun cwyn gan nifer o bobl sy'n colli amwynder pan godir mastiau heb ymgynghori digonol. Yr wyf fi, fel pob eraill, o'r farn nad yw'r sefyllfa bresennol yn dderbyniol. Nid risgiau iechyd yn unig sydd dan sylw yma, wrth gwrs. Gall lleoliad prif orsafoedd, yn arbennig mastiau, olygu colli amwynder, ac mae bron yn sicr y bydd gwerth eiddo'n gostwng. Yn ogystal, mae'r rhwystredigaethau a'r pryderon yn cael effaith negyddol ar iechyd a lles pobl.

Dylid gwneud ymarfer mapio ym mhob ardal awdurdod lleol i gadarnhau'r safleoedd mwyaf priodol ar gyfer mastiau ymhell o ddatblygiadau preswyl, fel Uzmaston ar gyrion Hwlfordd, sy'n cael ei ystyried ac a fu'n destun ceisiadau aflwyddiannus yn y gorffennol. Yn sicr, dylid eu lleoli ymhell o ysgolion, ond mae'r mast ar orsaf yr heddlu yn effeithio ar ysgolion yn Hwlfordd. Gwn fod hynny wedi peri pryder mewn mannau eraill yng Nghymru.

that has been a concern elsewhere in Wales.

Stewart conducted a review of the position on mobile and Tetra masts, and I strongly support many of the findings. For example, it recommended that a national register of base stations should be established. I am pleased that, in the wake of that report, we now have a site-finder system so that it is easier for the public to access information about the location of base stations. Such resources are excellent, but they are only one part of the issue. It is ludicrous, as I said, that masts shorter than 15m, particularly when they are on top of existing buildings, do not require planning consent; that should be a requirement. Basically, we need a far more robust planning framework that incorporates an input by health authorities and local health boards and a clear and open system of documentation that can be readily inspected by the general public. Transparency is paramount.

The evidence amassed over time suggests that children in particular, hence the significance of the schools issue, might be especially vulnerable to any adverse effects of radio frequency radiation. On the frequencies used in mobile-phone technology and Tetra, there is strong evidence that children absorb more energy per kilogram of body weight than do adults. As Stewart points out in the review, a one-year-old could absorb around double that a mature adult could, and a five-year-old, around 60 per cent more. Additionally, since children are being exposed to radio frequency radiation from base stations from a younger age than adults, over a longer time they risk accumulating more exposure than us over the course of their lives because this technology is new.

The case for keeping these masts away from schools is massive. Stewart argued for a precautionary approach. Such is the concern that many countries have prohibited the placement of base stations near schools, and we should do more to echo that approach. We need to adopt a precautionary approach to Tetra masts in Wales.

The advantages of Tetra may be great, and I am sure that they are, but we cannot go on as

Gwnaeth Stewart adolygiad o'r safbwynt ar fastiau ffonau symudol a Tetra, ac yr wyf yn cefnogi'n gryf nifer o'r darganfyddiadau. Er enghraifft, argymhellodd y dylid sefydlu cofrestr genedlaethol o orsafoedd. Yn sgîl yr adroddiad hwnnw, yr wyf yn falch fod gennym yn awr system i ddod o hyd i safle er mwyn ei gwneud yn haws i'r cyhoedd allu cael gwybodaeth am leoliad gorsafoedd. Mae adnoddau o'r fath yn ardderchog, ond dim ond un rhan o'r broblem ydynt. Mae'n hurt, fel y dywedais, nad oes angen caniatâd cynllunio i godi mastiau llai na 15m o uchder, yn enwedig pan fyddant ar ben adeiladau presennol; dylai hynny fod yn ofynnol. Yn y bôn, mae angen fframwaith cynllunio llawer cadarnach arnom sy'n cynnwys cyfraniad gan awdurdodau iechyd a byrddau iechyd lleol, a system ddogfennu glir ac agored y gall y cyhoedd ei harchwilio'n hawdd. Mae eglurder o'r pwys mwyaf.

Awgryma'r dystiolaeth sydd wedi ei chasglu dros gyfnod y gallai plant yn enwedig fod yn arbennig o agored i unrhyw effeithiau andwyol gan ymbelydredd amledd radio, a dyna'r arwyddocâd y mater ysgolion. O ran yr amleddau a ddefnyddir mewn technoleg ffonau symudol a Tetra, mae tystiolaeth gref fod plant yn amsugno mwy o ynni fesul cilogram o bwysau eu corff nag y mae oedolion. Fel y mae Stewart yn tynnu sylw yn yr adolygiad, gallai plentyn blwydd oed amsugno tua dwywaith yr ynni y gallai oedolyn aeddfed ei amsugno, a gallai plentyn pum mlwydd oed amsugno tua 60 y cant yn fwy. Yn ogystal, oherwydd bod plant yn agored i ymbelydredd amledd radio o orsafoedd yn iau nag oedolion, dros gyfnod hwy, mae perygl y byddant yn agored i fwy o ymbelydredd na ni yn ystod eu bywydau am fod y dechnoleg hon yn newydd.

Mae dadl enfawr dros leoli'r mastiau hyn ymhell o ysgolion. Dadleuodd Stewart dros weithredu'n ofalus. Mae llawer gwlad yn pryderu cymaint am hyn fel eu bod wedi gwahardd gosod gorsafoedd ger ysgolion, a dylem wneud mwy i ddilyn y ffordd honno o weithredu. Mae angen rhagofal o ran mastiau Tetra yng Nghymru.

Hwyrach fod manteision Tetra yn fawr, ac yr wyf yn siŵr bod hynny'n wir, ond ni allwn

we have been going. I hope that this debate will focus attention on those key issues. However, I will summarise my conclusions and ask the Minister to address them specifically. All masts should require planning consent from the local authority. I know that that is not currently the case, but they should require consent, whatever their height. The planning process must consider potential health hazards of masts. No masts should be situated close to schools. A mapping exercise should be undertaken in each case to locate the best possible site for the mast in a given area. The process must incorporate an element of public consultation in all cases, and there should be a continuing review of the medium and long-term health risks of Tetra masts. That is the case for the control of Tetra.

**Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey:** I speak in my capacity as Assembly Member representing Preseli Pembrokeshire. As Nick mentioned in his speech, a temporary mast has been erected on top of the police station in the centre of Haverfordwest. It is indeed in close proximity to several schools, one of which is Portfield, a school specialising in special educational needs. The children at this school represent those who are most vulnerable and most at risk from anything in society.

I have huge concerns about the location of this mast, and I would have concerns about its location if it were to be put in Usmeston. I must reflect the concerns of my constituents and their understandable fears about something that is being placed in their midst. They will be as aware as you are, Nick, that I have written to the Office of the Deputy Prime Minister, the Home Office, the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside and the Minister for Health and Social Services. I have possibly written to every single person who has any influence over this matter, including the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, to whom I have written regarding taking children out of school. My children have been taken out of school to be taught at home, and that can only be to their disadvantage.

5.10 p.m.

Another aspect that you did not touch on, but

barhau fel ar hyn o bryd. Gobeithio y bydd y ddadl hon yn canolbwyntio sylw ar y materion allweddol hynny. Fodd bynnag, crynhoaf fy nghasgliadau a gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ymdrin â hwy'n benodol. Dylai fod yn ofynnol cael caniatâd cynllunio gan yr awdurdod lleol i godi pob mast. Gwn nad yw hynny'n wir ar hyn o bryd, ond dylai fod yn ofynnol cael caniatâd cynllunio, waeth pa mor uchel ydynt. Rhaid i'r broses gynllunio ystyried y peryglon posibl mae mastiau'n eu hachosi i iechyd. Ni ddylid lleoli unrhyw fast yn agos at ysgolion. Dylid gwneud ymarfer mapio ym mhob achos i gael hyd i'r safle gorau posibl ar gyfer y mast mewn ardal benodol. Rhaid i'r broses ymgorffori elfen o ymgynghori cyhoeddus ym mhob achos, a dylid adolygu'r barhaus y risgiau iechyd cyfnod canolig a chyfnod hir o gael mastiau Tetra. Dyna'r ddadl dros reoli Tetra.

**Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey:** Siaradaf yn rhinwedd fy swydd fel Aelod Cynulliad sy'n cynrychioli Preseli Sir Benfro. Fel y crybwyllodd Nick yn ei araith, mae mast dros dro wedi'i godi ar ben gorsaf yr heddlu yng nghanol Hwlfordd. Mae'n wir yn agos iawn i nifer o ysgolion, gan gynnwys Portfield, yr ysgol sy'n arbenigo mewn anghenion addysgol arbennig. Y plant yn yr ysgol hon yw'r rhai sydd fwyaf agored i niwed a risg o unrhyw beth mewn cymdeithas.

Mae pryderon enfawr gennyf ynghylch lleoliad y mast hwn, a byddwn i yn pryderu ynghylch ei leoliad pe bai'n cael ei leoli yn Uzmaston. Rhaid imi adlewyrchu pryderon fy etholwyr a'u hofnau naturiol ynghylch rhywbeth sy'n cael ei osod yn eu plith. Fe wyddant cystal â chi, Nick, fy mod wedi ysgrifennu i Swyddfa Dirprwy Brif Weinidog y DU, y Swyddfa Gartref, y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad a'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Mae'n bosibl fy mod wedi ysgrifennu at bawb sydd ag unrhyw ddylanwad yn y mater hwn, gan gynnwys y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu ati hi ynglŷn â thynnu plant o'r ysgol. Yr wyf wedi tynnu fy mhlant fy hun o'r ysgol i gael eu haddysgu gartref, a dim ond anfantais iddynt all hynny fod.

Agwedd arall na chrybwyllwyd gennyh, ond a

which should be recorded, is that there are blind spots within a mile radius of the temporary mast on Haverfordwest police station—a mast that will be there for at least a year. There are whole streets that cannot pick up the information being relayed from that mast in its current location, so it is not even serving its purpose. I echo the need for the siting of any mast, including allegedly temporary masts, to go through the full planning process. Preseli is an area with vast tracts of land, so we have the space. I urge you, Minister, to work with your Westminster colleagues on this to ensure that it does not happen again.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I am grateful to Nick Bourne for raising this issue. All of us who represent Haverfordwest will have received many representations about this issue, and I associate myself with everything that Nick Bourne and Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey have said on this matter. However, this is not just an issue for Haverfordwest, though the situation there is particularly shocking because of the proximity of the mast to schools. I urge the Minister to take this matter very seriously; the potential health risks for children are being taken seriously in other nations. We need to look at the evidence on which they have made their decisions, and act on it. It cannot be right that these masts can be erected without the permission of the local people through the local authority. I urge the Minister to change the guidance, which I believe it is within his power to do.

**Mick Bates:** I thank Nick Bourne for raising this important issue. Two communities in Montgomeryshire—Llanidloes and Caersŵs—have opposed the erection of a Tetra mast in their communities. This is the essential point. I have a copy of a petition signed by 750 people from Llanidloes who were not consulted in any way when the company put forward its proposal to erect a mast in the middle of Llanidloes.

The key issue that needs to be addressed is the precautionary principle in terms of the real or perceived health hazard. In order to overcome that, there has to be recognition within the planning system that no masts should be erected within a community. This

ddylai gael ei chofnodi, yw bod mannau dall o fewn cwmpas o filltir i'r mast dros dro ar orsaf heddlu Hwlfordd—mast a fydd yno am flwyddyn o leiaf. Mae strydoedd cyfan na allant gael y wybodaeth sy'n cael ei throsglwyddo o'r mast hwnnw yn ei leoliad presennol, ac felly nid yw'n cyflawni ei ddiben hyd yn oed. Adleisiaf yr angen am gynnal proses gynllunio lawn ar gyfer lleoli unrhyw fast, gan gynnwys mastiau yr honnir eu bod yn fastiau dros dro. Mae Preseli yn ardal lle mae darnau helaeth o dir, felly mae gennym y lle. Fe'ch anogaf, Weinidog, i weithio gyda'ch cyd-weinidogion yn San Steffan ar y mater hwn er mwyn sicrhau na fydd yn digwydd eto.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Nick Bourne am godi'r mater hwn. Bydd pob un ohonom sy'n cynrychioli Hwlfordd wedi cael nifer o sylwadau ar y mater hwn, ac ategaf bopeth y mae Nick Bourne a Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey wedi'i dweud ar y mater hwn. Fodd bynnag, nid mater i Hwlfordd yn unig ydyw, er bod y sefyllfa yno yn arbennig o arswydus am fod y mast mor agos i ysgolion. Anogaf y Gweinidog i ystyried y mater hwn yn ddifrifol iawn; caiff y risgiau posibl i iechyd plant eu cymryd o ddifrif mewn gwledydd eraill. Mae angen inni edrych ar y dystiolaeth y maent wedi seilio eu penderfyniadau arni, a gweithredu ar hynny. Ni all fod yn iawn i'r mastiau hyn gael eu codi heb ganiatâd pobl leol drwy'r awdurdod lleol. Anogaf y Gweinidog i newid y canllawiau, a chredaf fod ganddo'r pŵer i wneud hynny.

**Mick Bates:** Diolchaf i Nick Bourne am godi'r mater pwysig hwn. Mae dwy gymuned yn sir Drefaldwyn—Llanidloes a Chaersŵs—wedi gwrthwynebu codi mast Tetra yn eu cymunedau. Dyma'r pwynt hanfodol. Mae copi gennyf o ddeiseb a lofnodwyd gan 750 o bobl o Llanidloes nad ymgynghorwyd â hwy mewn unrhyw ffordd pan gyflwynodd y cwmni ei gynnig i godi mast yng nghanol Llanidloes.

Y mater allweddol y mae angen ymdrin ag ef yw'r egwyddor o ragofal am berygl gwirioneddol neu ganfyddedig i iechyd. I oresgyn hynny, rhaid cydnabod o fewn y system gynllunio na ddylid codi mastiau o fewn cymuned. Mae hyn yn hanfodol i oresgyn y

is essential to overcoming the problem. I have a Vodafone mast on my farm, which is isolated. Following the principle of siting masts in isolated place is how we will overcome the risks to health, particularly to the health of young people. I urge you, Minister, to do that and to make sure that communities are consulted. In the case of Llanidloes, MM02 did not even attend a town council meeting at which the mast was discussed. That is disgraceful. I hope that, following this debate, you will see fit to write to these companies to inform them that they have to perform their mandatory duty to consult.

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):**

I would like to thank all of those who contributed to the debate. Airwave is a secure digital radio network dedicated to the exclusive use of the UK's emergency and public safety services. Police Airwave system, Tetra, is based on the European terrestrial trunked radio standard. Airwave is contracted by the Home Office to provide a certain level of coverage across the UK because, as has been mentioned, the nature of police work means that users require coverage that is as comprehensive as possible.

I will now turn to Assembly Government policy and what the Government tries to do via planning guidance. What needs to be done is to facilitate the growth of new and existing telecommunications systems, including Tetra, while at the same time meeting environmental objectives and concerns. That means that it is important that we have a roll-out of new telecommunications, but, at the same time, are able to give public reassurance that a precautionary approach is being adopted.

Planning policy on telecommunications development, as Nick said, is contained in 'Planning Policy Wales' and in TAN 19. Planning permission granted by the general permitted development Order allows the local planning authority to influence siting and design of masts up to 15m in height via the prior approval procedure. Therefore, it is not the case that there is no control over masts under 15m. Full planning permission via the

problem. Mae mast Vodafone ar fy fferm anghysbell i. Drwy ddilyn yr egwyddor o osod mastiau mewn lleoedd anghysbell y byddwn yn goresgyn y risgiau i iechyd, yn arbennig i iechyd pobl ifanc. Pwysaf arnoch, Weinidog, i wneud hynny ac i sicrhau ymgynghori â chymunedau. Yn achos Llanidloes, nid aeth MM02 hyd yn oed i gyfarfod cyngor y dref pan drafodwyd y mast. Mae hynny'n warthus. Gobeithio y byddwch yn gweld yn dda, ar ôl y ddadl hon, i ysgrifennu at y cwmnïau hyn i ddweud wrthynt fod yn rhaid iddynt gyflawni eu dyletswydd orfodol i ymgynghori.

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):**

Hoffwn ddiolch i bawb a gyfrannodd at y ddadl. Mae Airwave yn rhwydwaith radio digidol sicr sy'n cael ei ddefnyddio'n benodol gan wasanaethau brys a diogelwch cyhoeddus y DU. Mae system Airwave yr heddlu, Tetra, yn seiliedig ar y safon uwch-radio daearol Ewropeaidd. Mae Airwave dan contract i'r Swyddfa Gartref i ddarparu lefel benodol o dderbyniad ledled y DU oherwydd, fel y'i crybwyllwyd, mae natur gwaith yr heddlu yn golygu bod ar ddefnyddwyr angen derbyniad mor eang â phosibl.

Trof yn awr at bolisi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r hyn y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ceisio'i wneud drwy ganllawiau cynllunio. Yr hyn y mae angen ei wneud yw hwyluso twf systemau telathrebu newydd a'r rheini sy'n bodoli eisoes, gan gynnwys Tetra, gan fodloni amcanion a phryderon am yr amgylchedd. Golyga hynny ei bod yn bwysig inni gyflwyno systemau telathrebu newydd, ond ar yr un pryd inni allu sicrhau'r cyhoedd y byddwn yn gweithredu'n ofalus.

Cynhwysir polisi cynllunio ar ddatblygu telathrebu, fel y dywedodd Nick, yn 'Polisi Cynllunio Cymru' ac yn nodyn cyngor technegol (TAN) 19. Mae caniatâd cynllunio a roddir drwy'r Gorchymyn datblygu cyffredinol a ganiateir yn caniatáu i'r awdurdod cynllunio lleol ddylanwadu ar leoliad a chynllun mastiau hyd at 15m o uchder drwy'r weithdrefn cymeradwyaeth ymlaen llaw. Felly, nid yw'n wir nad oes unrhyw reolaeth dros fastiau llai na

full planning process is required for masts over 15m in height.

Where specific planning permission is required, applications need to be determined, having regard to Assembly Government and local policies. In terms of consultation, the mobile phone industry has given 10 commitments with a view to improving the transparency of the process of building mobile telecommunications networks, including increasing the role of public consultation on the siting of base stations. I am concerned to hear the examples given by Mick Bates where that has not happened. If Mick wants to furnish me with further details, I will investigate it. As a Government, we have produced a code of best practice that builds on Assembly Government policy and on the operators' commitments. It provides advice to ensure that delivery of a better and more effective communication and consultation process takes place between operators, authorities and the community. Airwave is one of the operators that has signed up to the code and abides by the 10 commitments.

In terms of health, it can be a material consideration in determining planning applications and in the prior approval process. The same applies to public concern about such effects. Admittedly, this is a difficult exercise for any local planning authority to carry out in terms of trying to work out what weight it can give to health as a material circumstance. However, it is the case, under the current system that it is a matter for the courts to interpret what is and what is not an appropriate weight to give to a particular material consideration.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Codais y mater o ddiogelwch iechyd y cyhoedd gyda'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn gynharach, a dywedodd yntau nad oes tystiolaeth bod y mastiau hyn o reidrwydd yn cynrychioli unrhyw fygythiad i iechyd. Gan fod consŷrn yn gyffredinol, a chan fod arbenigwyr meddygol wedi codi rhai materion yn ymwneud â iechyd y cyhoedd, oni gredwch y dylai fod rhagdybiaeth o blaid diogelwch iechyd y cyhoedd yn y mater hwn a, nes bod

15m. Mae angen caniatâd cynllunio llawn drwy'r broses gynllunio lawn ar gyfer mastiau dros 15m o uchder.

Lle mae angen caniatâd cynllunio penodol, mae angen penderfynu ceisiadau gan ystyried polisiau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a pholisiau lleol. O ran ymgynghori, mae'r diwydiant ffônau symudol wedi rhoi 10 ymrwymiad gyda'r nod o wella eglurder y broses o adeiladu rhwydweithiau telathrebu symudol, gan gynnwys cynyddu rôl ymgynghori cyhoeddus ar leoliad gorsafoedd. Mae'r enghreifftiau a roddwyd gan Mick Bates lle na ddigwyddodd hyn yn peri pryder imi. Os bydd Mick am roi manylion pellach imi, byddaf yn ymchwilio iddynt. Fel Llywodraeth, yr ydym wedi cynhyrchu cod arfer gorau sy'n datblygu polisi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ac ymrwymadau'r gweithredwyr. Mae'n rhoi cyngor er mwyn sicrhau proses well a mwy effeithiol o gyfathrebu ac ymgynghori rhwng gweithredwyr, awdurdodau a'r gymuned. Mae Airwave yn un o'r gweithredwyr sydd wedi cytuno i'r cod ac yn cadw at y 10 ymrwymiad.

O ran iechyd, gall fod yn ystyriaeth berthnasol wrth benderfynu ceisiadau cynllunio ac yn y broses cymeradwyaeth ymlaen llaw. Mae'r un peth yn gymwys i bryder y cyhoedd am effeithiau felly. Rhaid cyfaddef bod hyn yn ymarfer anodd i unrhyw awdurdod cynllunio lleol ei gyflawni wrth geisio penderfynu pa bwysau y gall eu rhoi ar iechyd fel ystyriaeth berthnasol. Mae'n wir, fodd bynnag, dan y system bresennol, fod yn rhaid i'r llysoedd ddehongli beth sy'n bwysau priodol i'w rhoi ar ystyriaeth berthnasol benodol.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I raised the issue of public health protection with the Minister for Health and Social Services earlier, who said that there is no evidence that these masts necessarily represent any threat to health. As there is general concern, and as experts in the medical field have raised some issues about public health, do you not think there should be a presumption in favour of public health and that, until there is absolutely clear evidence that no threat is posed, public health should be a heavily weighted consideration in the planning

tystiolaeth gwbl glir nad oes bygythiad, y process?  
dylai iechyd y cyhoedd fod yn fater a ystyrir  
â phwys mawr yn y broses gynllunio?

**Carwyn Jones:** Y broblem yw diffinio ‘clir’. Nid yw’n hawdd gwneud hynny mewn sefyllfa lle mae gennych dechnoleg newydd sydd heb ei phrofi dros amser. Fodd bynnag, dyna sut y cyflwynir technoleg newydd. Cynhelir astudiaethau ar y pryd, ac mae’n bwysig bod rheiny yn cael sylw.

Mae’n rhaid ini sylweddoli—ac nid fy ngeiriau i yw’r rhain ond geiriau adroddiad Stewart—fod balans y dystiolaeth yn dangos nad oes risg cyffredinol i iechyd pobl sy’n byw ger y gorsafoedd. Mae’r adroddiad yn rhagweld mai nifer fechan o bobl a effeithir ac na fyddai hynny’n effaith uniongyrchol oherwydd y mastiau hyn.

Mae’r grŵp ymgynghori ar *non-ionizing radiation* wedi cadarnhau nad oes rheswm i drin mastiau Tetra yn wahanol i sut y caiff mastiau ffonau symudol eu trin. Dyna’r sefyllfa ar hyn o bryd o safbwynt y cyngor annibynnol sydd wedi dod gerbron y Llywodraeth.

That said, of course, the Stewart report indicated that the Government should take into account a precautionary approach. That is how I have developed the argument in terms of where we are at the moment.

**Elin Jones:** Clywais eich dadleuon ynglŷn â risg ond, os oes risg, a gredwch fod y risg fwyaf yn wynebu plant a phobl ifanc, a bod lleoli mastiau Tetra ger ysgolion yn fater o bryder sylweddol i rieni? Mae hynny wedi digwydd yn Aberystwyth. Felly, a wnewch chi ystyried rhoi moratoriwm ar leoli mastiau Tetra, ac ystyried y canllawiau sy’n caniatáu eu lleoli ger ysgolion?

5.20 p.m.

**Carwyn Jones:** Nid oes gennyf y pŵer i roi moratoriwm ar unrhyw beth. Mae’r un peth yn wir am Swyddfa’r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn Llundain. Mae’r system gynllunio yn dibynnu ar roi arweiniad, yn hytrach na gosod rheolau. Felly, mae’n rhaid sylweddoli nad yw’n bosibl rhoi moratoriwm ar ddim byd. Fodd bynnag, mae’n bosibl sicrhau, fel

**Carwyn Jones:** The problem is defining ‘clear’. It is not easy to do that in a situation where you have new technology which has not been tested over time. However, that is how new technology is rolled out. Studies are taking place as we speak, and it is important that those studies receive attention.

We must realise—and these are not my words, but those of the Stewart report—that the balance of evidence shows there is no general risk to the health of people who live in close proximity to the base stations. The report anticipates that very few people will be affected and that that would not be as a direct result of these masts.

The advisory group on non-ionizing radiation has confirmed that there is no reason to treat Tetra masts differently from mobile phone masts. That is the situation at present in terms of the independent advice submitted to the Government.

Wedi dweud hynny, wrth gwrs, yr oedd adroddiad Stewart yn dweud y dylai’r Llywodraeth ystyried gweithredu’n rhagofalus. Dyna sut yr wyf wedi datblygu’r ddadl o ran y sefyllfa bresennol.

**Elin Jones:** I heard your arguments about risk, but if there is a risk, do you believe that the greatest risk is to children and young people, and that the siting of Tetra masts near schools is of considerable concern to parents? This has happened in Aberystwyth. Therefore, will you consider placing a moratorium on the siting of Tetra masts, and consider the guidance which permits siting them near schools?

**Carwyn Jones:** I do not have the power to place a moratorium on anything. The same is true of the Office of the Deputy Prime Minister in London. The planning system depends on giving guidance rather than on setting rules. Therefore, it must be realised that it is not possible to place a moratorium on anything. It is possible to ensure, however, as part of the

rhan o'r broses ymgynghori, fod barn gref yn cael ei datgan yn erbyn rhywbeth os dengys tystiolaeth fod yn rhaid gwneud hynny.

At the moment, there is a statutory requirement in Wales for all applications for planning permission and prior approval for telecommunications base stations to be accompanied by a declaration of compliance with the international exposure guidelines. The Home Office has made a clear statement that if at any time an adverse effect is found arising from the use of Tetra, it will immediately make the information available and take appropriate action. This position is wholly in keeping with the approach taken by the Assembly Government. We are now considering how to improve the way in which health concerns are dealt with in the planning process.

**Nick Bourne:** The Minister has mentioned the Stewart report and the precautionary principle in relation to younger people. The report places great emphasis on that. It is not mentioned in TAN 19, and local authorities are not required to consider it. In Haverfordwest there is a mast in the middle of an area where there are eight schools, one of which is a special-needs school. As has been mentioned, other masts are being erected near schools. Bearing in mind what the Stewart report has said, and the very serious precautionary principle that it contains, should not you, as Minister, and we, as an Assembly, be looking at this guidance and reviewing it, so that this is not allowed to happen?

**Carwyn Jones:** We have accepted the precautionary approach recommended by the Stewart report, to keep the policy under review. At the moment there is no evidence to suggest that Tetra masts are not safe. Conversely, it is right to say that there is probably not a great deal of evidence the other way. The fact, however, is that there is no evidence at present to suggest that they are not safe. Similarly, there is no evidence to suggest that they are more unsafe than conventional mobile phone masts.

In terms of what we are doing to keep an eye on the situation, the National Radiological Protection Board has recently published a

consultation process, that a strong voice is raised against something if evidence shows that that must be done.

Ar hyn o bryd, mae'n ofynnol yn statudol yng Nghymru i bob cais am ganiatâd cynllunio a chymeradwyaeth ymlaen llaw ar gyfer gorsafoedd telathrebu gynnwys datganiad am gydymffurfio â chanllawiau rhyngwladol ar fod yn agored. Mae'r Swyddfa Gartref wedi gwneud datganiad clir y bydd yn sicrhau bod y wybodaeth ar gael ac yn cymryd y camau priodol ar unwaith, os gwelir, ar unrhyw adeg, fod defnyddio Tetra yn cael effaith andwyol. Mae'r safbwynt hwn yn cyd-fynd yn llwyr âg ymagwedd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Yr ydym yn ystyried yn awr sut i wella'r ffordd yr ymdrinnir â phryderon iechyd yn y broses gynllunio.

**Nick Bourne:** Soniodd y Gweinidog am adroddiad Stewart a'r egwyddor ragofal mewn perthynas â phobl iau. Mae'r adroddiad yn rhoi pwyslais mawr ar hynny. Ni sonnir amdano yn TAN 19, ac nid yw'n ofynnol i awdurdodau lleol ei ystyried. Yn Hwlfordd mae mast ynghanol ardal lle mae wyth ysgol, ac mae un yn ysgol anghenion arbennig. Fel y soniwyd, mae mastiau eraill yn cael eu codi ger ysgolion. Gan gofio'r hyn a ddywedodd adroddiad Stewart a'r egwyddor ragofal ddirifol sydd ynddo, oni ddylech chi fel Gweinidog a ninnau fel Cynulliad fod yn edrych ar y canllawiau hyn ac yn eu hadolygu fel na chaniateir i hyn ddigwydd?

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr ydym wedi derbyn yr argymhellad yn adroddiad Stewart i weithredu'n rhagofalus, i adolygu'r polisi'n gyson. Ar hyn o bryd, nid oes tystiolaeth i awgrymu nad yw mastiau Tetra yn ddiogel. I'r gwrthwyneb, mae'n iawn dweud nad oes llawer iawn o dystiolaeth hwyrach y ffordd arall. Fodd bynnag, y gwir yw nad oes unrhyw dystiolaeth ar hyn o bryd i awgrymu nad ydynt yn ddiogel. Yn yr un modd, nid oes unrhyw dystiolaeth i awgrymu eu bod yn llai diogel na mastiau ffonau symudol confensiynol.

O ran yr hyn a wnawn i gadw llygad ar y sefyllfa, cyhoeddodd y Bwrdd Cenedlaethol Diogelwch Radiolegol yn ddiweddar adroddiad



review report of the recommendations made in the Stewart report. The board believes that the main conclusions of the report still apply, and that a precautionary approach to the use of mobile phone technology should continue to be adopted. It recommends that a precautionary approach be adopted by users of the Tetra system due to occupational exposure to the handsets, rather than in relation to public exposure to the masts.

In terms of research on mobile phone technology, this has been taken forward by the mobile phone telecommunications research programme, and the latest NRPB report on mobile phones and health has recommended continued support for the research programme and the need for further research in certain areas. As Assembly Government, we have undertaken to monitor existing planning arrangements for mobile phone masts.

**Lorraine Barrett:** When you are reviewing the situation, and perhaps the guidelines, will you take into account premises that have multiple masts? We have a few in Penarth with five, six or seven masts, and it seems that there is nothing that the local authority can do to stop them.

**Carwyn Jones:** We would want to review that in the future, especially as we move into an age where we see a plethora of masts, as I often do in my part of the world. That does beg the question as to why operators cannot share masts—that is an obvious question, which I am sure that many of us have been asked.

In terms of schools, I am aware of the case in Haverfordwest—Tamsin and others have written to me about it—where a Tetra mast has been sited on a police station near to a number of schools. We place great emphasis on the need for pre-application discussions involving the operators, the authorities and the community, where a planning application or prior approval is required. Let me make it clear that in cases where proposed masts will affect schools and colleges, operators and local planning authorities are urged to consult the governing bodies. I know that my colleague, Jane Davidson, has also issued advice to local education authorities and

adolygu o'r argymhellion a wnaed yn adroddiad Stewart. Cred y bwrdd fod prif gasgliadau'r adroddiad yn gymwys o hyd, ac y dylid parhau i weithredu'n rhagofalus wrth ddefnyddio technoleg ffonau symudol. Mae'n argymhell y dylai defnyddwyr system Tetra weithredu'n rhagofalus am fod bod pobl wrth eu galwedigaeth yn agored oherwydd y setiau llaw, yn hytrach nag am fod y cyhoedd yn agored oherwydd y mastiau.

O ran ymchwil ar dechnoleg ffonau symudol, mae hyn wedi ei ddatblygu gan y rhaglen ymchwil ar delathrebu ffonau symudol, ac mae'r adroddiad diweddaraf gan y Bwrdd Cenedlaethol Diogelwch Radiolegol ar ffonau symudol ac iechyd wedi argymhell cefnogaeth barhaus i'r rhaglen ymchwil a'r angen am ymchwil pellach mewn rhai meysydd. Fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yr ydym wedi addo monitro trefniadau cynllunio presennol ar gyfer mastiau ffonau symudol.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Pan fyddwch yn adolygu'r sefyllfa, ac efallai'r canllawiau, a ystyriwch safleoedd lle mae nifer o fastiau? Mae gennym rai ym Mhenarth lle mae pump, chwech neu saith mast, ac ymddengys nad oes dim y gall yr awdurdod lleol ei wneud i'w hatal.

**Carwyn Jones:** Byddem am adolygu hynny yn y dyfodol, yn enwedig wrth inni symud i oes lle byddwn yn gweld lluo o fastiau, fel y gwnaf yn aml yn fy ardal i. Mae hynny'n rhagdybio'r ateb pam na all gweithredwyr rannu mastiau—mae hynny'n gwestiwn amlwg, sydd wedi ei ofyn i nifer ohonom, mae'n siŵr.

O ran ysgolion, gwn am yr achos yn Hwlfordd—mae Tamsin ac eraill wedi ysgrifennu ataf yn ei gylch—lle mae mast Tetra wedi ei osod ar orsaf heddlu yn agos i nifer o ysgolion. Rhown bwyslais mawr ar yr angen am drafodaethau cyn gwneud cais, sy'n cynnwys y gweithredwyr, yr awdurdodau a'r gymuned lle mae angen cais cynllunio neu gymeradwyaeth ymlaen llaw. Gadewch imi wneud yn glir, mewn achosion lle bydd mastiau arfaethedig yn effeithio ar ysgolion a cholegau, caiff gweithredwyr ac awdurdodau cynllunio lleol eu hannog i ymgynghori â'r cyrff llywodraethu. Gwn fod fy nghyd-Aelod, Jane Davidson, hefyd wedi rhoi cyngor i awdurdodau addysg lleol ac

schools about base stations and the use of mobile phones by children. Ofcom is also carrying out audits of emission levels from base stations situated on or near school or hospital premises. The results so far show emission levels considerably below the national exposure guidelines.

The Stewart report recommended that the beam of greatest radio frequency intensity from a base station site within or near school grounds should not be permitted to fall on any, or part, of the school's grounds or buildings without agreement from the school or parents. Operators have agreed to provide schools with information on radio frequency radiation. If the school or parents are concerned, they can ask the operator to adjust the beam of radiation. It is good practice to consult the governing body and to get the agreement of the body and of parents. If I am shown that this is not happening, and that these guidelines are being ignored, I will deal with the matter and take action on it. It is important that, where we have guidelines, we expect applicants to respect them, in the absence of planning guidance that specifically deals with the situation.

To conclude, we have introduced changes to planning procedures for telecommunications masts to meet the objectives of the Stewart report. It is probably fair to say, although not everyone will agree with me on this, that the current planning arrangements strike the right balance in terms of improving public consultation. However, there is still work to be done in terms of research and ensuring that the examples that I have been given in the Chamber today are not typical examples; I await more information on what Mick said. In accordance with the precautionary approach, I will continue to monitor the existing planning arrangements for telecommunications masts, and, if necessary, I will amend policy. In terms of taking this matter forward, I would be more than willing to discuss this in committee, should the committee wish to offer its views on how planning guidance may be strengthened.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings today's proceedings to a close.

ysgolion ar orsafoedd a defnyddio ffonau symudol gan blant. Mae Ofcom yn gwneud archwiliadau o lefelau gollyngiadau o orsafoedd sydd ar safle ysgol neu ysbyty neu gerllaw. Dengys y canlyniadau hyd yma lefelau gollyngiadau sylweddol is na'r canllawiau cenedlaethol ar fod yn agored.

Yr oedd adroddiad Stewart yn argymhell na ddylid caniatáu i'r pelydryn arddwysedd radio-amledd mwyaf o safle gorsaf ar dir ysgol neu gerllaw syrthio ar dir neu adeiladau'r ysgol, neu unrhyw ran ohonynt, heb gytundeb yr ysgol neu'r rhieni. Mae gweithredwyr wedi cytuno i roi gwybodaeth i ysgolion am ymbelydredd radio-amledd. Os bydd yr ysgol neu'r rhieni'n pryderu, gallant ofyn i'r gweithredwr addasu pelydryn yr ymbelydriad. Mae'n arfer da i ymgynghori â'r corff llywodraethu a chael cytundeb y corff a'r rhieni. Os dangosir imi nad yw hyn yn digwydd, a bod y canllawiau hyn yn cael eu hanwybyddu, byddaf yn delio â'r mater ac yn cymryd camau. Mae'n bwysig, lle mae canllawiau ar gael, ein bod yn disgwyl i ymgeiswyr eu parchu, pan nad oes canllawiau cynllunio ar gael sy'n ymdrin yn benodol â'r sefyllfa.

I gloi, yr ydym wedi cyflwyno newidiadau mewn gweithdrefnau cynllunio ar gyfer mastiau telathrebu er mwyn bodloni amcanion adroddiad Stewart. Mae'n debyg ei bod yn deg dweud, er na fydd pawb yn cytuno â mi ar hyn, fod y trefniadau cynllunio presennol yn sicrhau'r cydbwysedd cywir o ran gwella ymgynghori cyhoeddus. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer o waith ymchwil eto i'w wneud i sicrhau nad yw'r enghreifftiau a roddwyd imi yn y Siambr heddiw yn rhai nodweddiadol; disgwyliaf ragor o wybodaeth am yr hyn a ddywedodd Mick. Yn unol â'r dull o weithredu'n rhagofalus, byddaf yn parhau i fonitro'r trefniadau cynllunio presennol ar gyfer mastiau telathrebu, ac os bydd angen, byddaf yn diwygio'r polisi. O ran symud y mater hwn ymlaen, byddwn yn fwy na pharod i drafod hyn yn y pwyllgor, pe bai'r pwyllgor am gynnig ei safbwyntiau ar y ffordd y gellid cryfhau canllawiau cynllunio.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.26 p.m.*

*The meeting ended at 5.26 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau**  
**Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Law, Peter (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)

