



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Cofnod y Trafodion)**

**The National Assembly for Wales
(The Record of Proceedings)**

**Dydd Mercher, 8 Mehefin 2005
Wednesday, 8 June 2005**

Cynnwys Contents

Cwestiynau ar Lywodraeth Leol i'r Gweinidog Cyllid Questions on Local Government to the Finance Minister	3
Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes Questions to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning	20
Datganiad Busnes Diwygiedig Revised Business Statement	37
Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau o dan Ddeddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000, Deddf Diogelu Data 1998 a'r Rheoliadau Gwybodaeth Amgylcheddol Delegation of Functions under the Freedom of Information Act, 2000, the Data Protection Act 1998 and the Environmental Information Regulations	37
Canlyniad yr Ymgynghoriad ar y Polisi o uno'r Cyrff Cyhoeddus a Noddir gan y Cynulliad The Outcome of the Consultation on the Policy of the Assembly Sponsored Public Bodies Merger	45
Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order	101
Dadl Fer: O ble daw'r Shan Cothi a'r Bryn Terfel nesaf? Dyfodol yr Eisteddfodau Bach Short Debate: Where will the next Shan Cothi and Bryn Terfel come from? The future of small Eisteddfodau	101

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been
included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Cwestiynau ar Lywodraeth Leol i'r Gweinidog Cyllid Questions on Local Government to the Finance Minister

Gwasanaethau Lleol yn Sir Benfro Local Services in Pembrokeshire

Q1 Christine Gwyther: Will the Minister outline Assembly measures to support local services in Pembrokeshire? OAQ0273(LGP)

C1 Christine Gwyther: A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu mesurau'r Cynulliad i gefnogi gwasanaethau lleol yn sir Benfro? OAQ0273(LGP)

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): I concluded a policy agreement with Pembrokeshire County Council in September 2004. Under this, the authority will make significant improvements in service delivery by 2007. The agreement reflects both our national strategic priorities and Pembrokeshire's particular needs.

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex): Lluniais gytundeb polisi gyda Chyngor Sir Penfro ym mis Medi 2004. O dan y cytundeb hwn, bydd yr awdurdod yn gwneud gwelliannau sylweddol yn y ffordd y darperir gwasanaethau erbyn 2007. Mae'r cytundeb yn adlewyrchu ein blaenoriaethau strategol cenedlaethol ac anghenion penodol sir Benfro.

Christine Gwyther: One of the most exciting and innovative programmes in Pembrokeshire, as in other parts of Wales, is Sure Start. I would like to bang the drum on behalf of Pembrokeshire in terms of the work being done there. Over the last year, it has supported more than 223 families directly, who could otherwise have ended up in crisis. Parenting and healthy-eating classes are being held, which are making a huge difference to the people who are most in need. I urge you to continue to fund that sort of work for our young families.

Christine Gwyther: Un o'r rhaglenni mwyaf cyffrous ac arloesol yn sir Benfro, fel mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru, yw Cychwyn Cadarn. Hoffwn ganu clodydd sir Benfro o ran y gwaith a wneir yno. Yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, mae wedi cefnogi mwy na 223 o deuluoedd yn uniongyrchol, a allai fod wedi wynebu argyfwng fel arall. Cynhelir dosbarthiadau rhianta a bwya'n iach, sy'n gwneud gwahaniaeth aruthrol i'r bobl sydd â'r angen mwyaf. Fe'ch anogaf i barhau i ariannu'r math hwnnw o waith ar gyfer ein teuluoedd ifanc.

Sue Essex: That sounds really exciting and is good news from Pembrokeshire. When I find the time, I will come with you to meet some of the people involved. It is important that we work with local authorities, not only in bringing in resources but in sharing good ideas to tackle problems for, as you say, families. One point of the policy agreement is to provide more childcare places for working families, which we have agreed. That total package is there to improve the quality of life of people in Pembrokeshire.

Sue Essex: Mae hynny'n swinio'n gyffrous iawn ac mae'n newyddion da i sir Benfro. Pan fydd amser gennyf, dof gyda chi i gwrdd â rhai o'r bobl sy'n gysylltiedig â'r gwaith. Mae'n bwysig inni weithio gydag awdurdodau lleol, nid yn unig er mwyn cael adnoddau, ond er mwyn rhannu syniadau da i fynd i'r afael â phroblemau ar gyfer teuluoedd, fel y dywedwch. Un o ddibenion y cytundeb polisi yw darparu mwy o leoedd gofal plant ar gyfer teuluoedd sy'n gweithio, ac yr ydym wedi cytuno i hynny. Diben y pecyn hwnnw yw gwella ansawdd bywyd i bobl yn sir Benfro.

Helen Mary Jones: Minister, you may be aware of the high number of workers expected to come into the Pembrokeshire area soon as a result of the development at the liquefied natural gas site. What discussions have you had with Pembrokeshire County Council about the possible increased demand for local services, particularly housing for rent? Would you be prepared to consider any representations from the council should it find it difficult to fund any such increased demand for services?

Sue Essex: I had some discussions in the broader sense when I was in Pembrokeshire some months ago looking at the spatial plan. We were talking about this very point, which appears to be good news for the growth of that economy. We did not talk specifically about housing, but about wider issues, such as what it would mean for infrastructure and general context improvements. That would be part of the ongoing programme on the spatial plan, and we are trying to see what that will mean. Now that you have mentioned it, housing will need to be a part of that.

Lisa Francis: Under Assembly guidance issued under section 7 of the Local Authority and Social Services Act 1970, circular 10/01 outlines the expectations put upon local authorities in relation to persons suffering from deaf-blindness. I do not expect you to be au fait with the technicalities of that circular, but it would ensure that, for example, any person suffering from deaf-blindness could obtain appropriate support and respite care. That is always important for a person suffering from any disability, but particularly so in relation to deaf-blindness. How does your Government ensure that local authorities, such as Pembrokeshire, adhere to such guidance, especially when so many local authorities are now complaining about a lack of resources, which would help them to meet their obligations?

Sue Essex: I am very glad that you mentioned circular 10/01—if it had been circular 10/02, I would have been lost. Ever since I have been involved with local

Helen Mary Jones: Weinidog, efallai eich bod yn ymwybodol o'r nifer fawr o weithwyr y disgwylir iddynt ddod i ardal sir Benfro cyn hir o ganlyniad i ddatblygiad ar y safle nwy hylifol naturiol. Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi eu cael gyda Chyngor Sir Penfro ynglŷn â'r cynnydd posibl yn y galw am wasanaethau lleol, yn arbennig tai ar rent? A fydddech yn fodlon ystyried unrhyw sylwadau gan y cyngor os digwydd iddo ei chael yn anodd ariannu cynnydd o'r fath yn y galw am wasanaethau?

Sue Essex: Cefais rai trafodaethau fwy cyffredinol pan oeddwn yn sir Benfro rai misoedd yn ôl yn edrych ar y cynllun gofodol. Buom yn siarad am yr union bwynt hwn, ac ymddengys ei fod yn newyddion da i dwf yr economi honno. Ni fu siarad yn benodol am dai, ond am faterion ehangach, er enghraifft, beth fyddai'r goblygiadau ar gyfer seilwaith a gwelliannau cyd-destun cyffredinol. Byddai hynny'n rhan o'r rhaglen barhaus ar y cynllun gofodol, ac yr ydym yn ceisio gweld beth fydd goblygiadau hynny. Gan eich bod wedi'i grybwyll, bydd yn rhaid inni gynnwys tai fel rhan o hynny.

Lisa Francis: O dan ganllawiau'r Cynulliad a gyflwynwyd o dan adran 7 Deddf Awdurdodau Lleol a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol 1970, mae cylchlythyr 10/01 yn amlinellu'r disgwyliadau ar awdurdodau lleol mewn perthynas â phobl sy'n fyddar ac yn ddall. Nid wyf yn disgwyl ichi fod yn gyfarwydd â manylion technegol y cylchlythyr hwnnw, ond byddai'n sicrhau, er enghraifft, y gallai unrhyw un sy'n fyddar ac yn ddall gael cymorth priodol a gofal seibiant. Mae hynny bob amser yn bwysig i berson sydd ag unrhyw anabledd, ond mae'n arbennig o wir am bobl sy'n fyddar ac yn ddall. Sut y mae eich Llywodraeth yn sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol, fel sir Benfro, yn cydymffurfio â chanllawiau felly, yn arbennig â chynifer o awdurdodau lleol erbyn hyn yn cwyno am brinder adnoddau, a fyddai'n eu helpu i gyflawni eu rhwymedigaethau?

Sue Essex: Yr wyf yn falch iawn ichi grybwyll cylchlythyr 10/01—pe bydddech wedi crybwyll cylchlythyr 10/02, byddwn ar goll. Ers imi fod yn ymwneud ag

authorities, they have always demanded more resources, and I include myself in that. That guidance is there, but I do not know whether it is statutory or advisory. I will have to check with my colleague, Brian Gibbons, to see what is required and how it is monitored. However, I agree with you on the general principle. You are right to say that respite care is an important component of the relief that needs to be given to carers in particular. I will make sure that I follow this up with Brian. I do not know whether you were only concerned with Pembrokeshire, but perhaps we could discuss this later.

awdurdodau lleol, maent bob amser wedi mynnu mwy o adnoddau, ac yr wyf yn cynnwys fy hun yn y gosodiad hwnnw. Mae'r canllawiau hynny ar gael, ond nid wyf yn siŵr a ydynt yn rhai statudol ynteu'n rhai cynghorol. Bydd yn rhaid imi gadarnhau gyda'm cyd-Weinidog, Brian Gibbons, i weld beth sy'n ofynnol a sut y caiff ei fonitro. Fodd bynnag, cytunaf â chi ar yr egwyddor gyffredinol honno. Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle i ddweud bod gofal seibiant yn elfen bwysig o ysgafnhau'r baich ar ofalwyr yn arbennig. Byddaf yn sicrhau fy mod yn mynd ar drywydd hyn gyda Brian. Nid wyf yn siŵr ai sir Benfro yw'r unig ardal sy'n destun pryder ichi, ond efallai y gallem drafod hyn yn ddiweddarach.

Blaenoriaethau Gwario Spending Priorities

Q2 Alun Cairns: Will the Minister make a statement on the autonomy of local authorities in setting spending priorities? OAQ0260(LGP)

C2 Alun Cairns: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ymreolaeth awdurdodau lleol wrth bennu blaenoriaethau gwario? OAQ0260(LGP)

Sue Essex: Approximately 80 per cent of local authority funding from the Welsh Assembly Government is unhypothecated, or not ring-fenced. This allows local authorities autonomy to determine their spending according to their own needs and priorities. The balance of that funding is made up of specific grants from the Assembly Government and other Government departments to meet specific needs.

Sue Essex: Mae tua 80 y cant o'r arian a gaiff awdurdodau lleol gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru heb ei neilltuo, neu heb ei glustnodi. Mae hyn yn rhoi rhyddid i awdurdodau lleol bennu eu gwariant yn unol â'u hanghenion a'u blaenoriaethau eu hunain. Mae gweddill y cyllid hwnnw yn cynnwys grantiau penodol gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ac adrannau eraill y Llywodraeth i ddiwallu anghenion penodol.

Alun Cairns: It is interesting to note, Minister, that 80 per cent is unhypothecated. Is that not a fantastic increase in the hypothecation of funding since before 1997 and particularly since 1999? In 1997, 4 per cent of local government funding was hypothecated. Furthermore, given the lack of local authority resources, the lack of funding from the Assembly Government and, therefore, that the budget is so tight, the additional obligations that you are placing on authorities mean they do not have the capacity to set priorities according to local needs.

Alun Cairns: Mae'n ddiddorol nodi, Weinidog, bod 80 y cant heb ei neilltuo. Onid yw hynny'n gynydd aruthrol o ran arian nad yw wedi'i neilltuo ers cyn 1997 ac yn arbennig ers 1999? Yn 1997, yr oedd 4 y cant o arian llywodraeth leol heb ei neilltuo. Yn ogystal, o gofio prinder adnoddau awdurdodau lleol, diffyg arian gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r ffaith, felly, fod y gyllideb mor dynn, golyga'r rhwymedigaethau ychwanegol yr ydych yn eu rhoi ar awdurdodau nad oes ganddynt y gallu i bennu blaenoriaethau yn unol ag anghenion lleol.

Sue Essex: You started by using the word 'fantastic', and I thought that you were going to refer to the fantastic increase in funding

Sue Essex: Dechreuasoch drwy ddefnyddio'r gair 'aruthrol', ac yr oeddwn yn meddwl eich bod am gyfeirio at y

that the Welsh Assembly Government has provided. Alun, you have to recognise that some people ask for non-ring-fenced funding, while many say that they want more funding ring-fenced. That is particularly true of people in the voluntary sector. I do not know whether or not we have got the balance right. As I said in my answer, we are moving away from specific grants where we can see some certainty of the service provision being embedded. We are moving away from that in order to reduce the amount hypothecated. You might find this difficult, but you must also recognise that, over the last three years, we have increased additional funding to local government in order to kick off some important initiatives. The grants protocol is about phasing out some of the grants and turning the money into mainstream revenue support grant funding.

Irene James: Would you agree that there is a distinct culture of working in partnership across different levels of government in Wales to improve public services for the people of Wales? Would you agree with the spending priorities of Caerphilly County Borough Council, which is working with extra Assembly investment to invest in new schools and work in partnership with the Assembly to deliver a new hospital for the people of Caerphilly and Wales?

Sue Essex: I hope that the extra funding given to Caerphilly in terms of the local authority and the local health board, which links in with our social care agenda, enables the area to get the modern facilities that it so rightly deserves.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Hoffwn ddod yn ôl at gwestiwn gwreiddiol Alun Cairns a symud y ddadl ymlaen ychydig. Mae nifer o awdurdodau lleol yn ei chael yn fwyfwy anodd i gyllido mudiadau gwirfoddol, megis rhai sy'n cynnig gwasanaethau i bobl ag anghenion arbennig, ac i gyllido gweithwyr mudiadau fel Cyngor ar Bopeth a Relate. Mae hyn wedi digwydd am fod y Llywodraeth yn rhoi mwy o

cynnydd aruthrol yn yr arian y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi'i ddarparu. Alun, rhaid ichi gydnabod y ffaith fod rhai pobl yn gofyn am arian nad yw wedi'i glustnodi, a nifer yn dweud eu bod am weld mwy o arian yn cael ei glustnodi. Mae hynny'n arbennig o wir am bobl yn y sector gwirfoddol. Ni wn a ydym wedi cael y cydbwysedd iawn ai peidio. Fel y dywedais yn fy ateb, yr ydym yn symud oddi wrth grantiau penodol lle gallwn weld rhywfaint o sicrwydd ymgorffori'r broses o ddarparu gwasanaethau. Yr ydym yn symud i ffrwd oddi wrth hynny er mwyn lleihau'r swm a gaiff ei neilltuo. Efallai y bydd hyn yn anodd ichi, ond rhaid ichi gydnabod hefyd, yn ystod y tair blynedd diwethaf, ein bod wedi cynyddu'r cyllid ychwanegol i lywodraeth leol er mwyn rhoi cychwyn ar rai mentrau pwysig. Mae'r protocol grantiau yn ymwneud â dileu rhai o'r grantiau'n raddol a throï'r arian yn arian grant cynnal refeniw prif ffrwd.

Irene James: A fydddech yn cytuno bod yna ddiwylliant penodol o weithio mewn partneriaeth ar draws lefelau gwahanol o lywodraeth yng Nghymru er mwyn gwella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ar gyfer pobl Cymru? A fydddech yn cytuno â blaenoriaethau gwariant Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili, sy'n gweithio gyda buddsoddiad ychwanegol gan y Cynulliad i fuddsoddi mewn ysgolion newydd a gwaith mewn partneriaeth â'r Cynulliad i ddarparu ysbyty newydd ar gyfer pobl Caerffili a phobl Cymru?

Sue Essex: Gobeithio y bydd yr arian ychwanegol a roddwyd i Gaerffili o ran yr awdurdod lleol a'r bwrdd iechyd lleol, sy'n gysylltiedig â'n hagenda gofal cymdeithasol, yn galluogi'r ardal i gael y cyfleusterau modern y mae'n eu haeddu.

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): I should like to return to Alun Cairns' original question and move the debate on a little. Many local authorities are finding it increasingly difficult to fund voluntary organisations, such as those which provide services for people with special needs, or to fund the work of Citizens Advice or Relate counsellors. This has happened because the Government has

gyfrifoldebau statudol ar gynghorau heb eu cyllido yn llawn. Os yw awdurdodau lleol yn ei chael yn gynyddol anodd, fel y dywed y mudiadau wrthym, i ganfod yr arian yn eu cyllidebau lleol, a fydech yn fodlon ystyried rhoi cyllid yn ganolog i helpu'r mudiadau gwirfoddol hyn?

Sue Essex: That depends on whether one agrees with your premise that we are not providing adequate funding for statutory agreements. I signed the agreement along with Sir Harry Jones, when he was leader of the Welsh Local Government Association. I try my best to keep to the agreement, and Welsh local government has not come back to me to say that we are not doing that. That was an important breakthrough two years ago.

2.10 p.m.

In terms of funding voluntary organisations, you must allow some local discretion, and that is where voluntary compacts come in. There are different needs in different areas, and, accordingly, there are different voluntary organisations. One of the issues that we are looking at, because this is not just about funding, but about skills and capacity, is whether we can ensure greater linkage, so that, over a wider geographical area than the local authority covers, and perhaps in a regional context, you can get that arrangement with the voluntary sector so that it can serve a wider area and perhaps reach more people, particularly in rural areas. That is one of the issues that we are considering. However, I would point out that local government funding gives local government a lot of discretion, to go back to Alun Cairns's point: 80 per cent of local government funding is not ring-fenced.

imposed more statutory responsibilities on councils without providing sufficient funding. If it is the case, as these organisations tell us, that local authorities are finding it increasingly difficult to find the money from their local budgets, would you be prepared to provide central funding to help these voluntary organisations?

Sue Essex: Mae hynny'n dibynnu a yw rhywun yn cytuno â'ch gosodiad nad ydym yn darparu digon o gyllid ar gyfer cytundebau statudol. Llofnodais y cytundeb ynghyd â Syr Harry Jones, pan oedd yn arweinydd Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru. Yr wyf yn gwneud fy ngorau i gadw at y cytundeb, ac nid yw llywodraeth leol Cymru wedi dod yn ôl ataf i ddweud nad ydym yn gwneud hynny. Yr oedd hynny'n ddatblygiad pwysig ddwy flynedd yn ôl.

O ran ariannu mudiadau gwirfoddol, rhaid ichi ganiatau rhywfaint o ryddid yn lleol, a dyna pryd y mae angen cytundebau gwirfoddol. Mae anghenion gwahanol mewn ardaloedd gwahanol, ac felly mae yna fudiadau gwirfoddol gwahanol. Un o'r materion yr ydym yn eu hystyried— oherwydd nid mater o gyllid yn unig yw hyn: mae'n ymwneud â sgiliau ac adnoddau hefyd, a allwn sicrhau mwy o gysylltiad, er mwyn sicrhau, ar draws ardal ddaearyddol ehangach na'r ardal y mae'r awdurdod lleol yn ei chwmpasu, ac efallai mewn cyd-destun rhanbarthol, y gallwch gael y trefniant hwnnw gyda'r sector gwirfoddol fel y gall wasanaethu ardal ehangach ac efallai gyrraedd mwy o bobl, yn arbennig mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Dyna un o'r materion yr ydym yn eu hystyried. Fodd bynnag, dylwn nodi bod cyllid llywodraeth leol yn rhoi llawer o ryddid i lywodraeth leol, i ddychwelyd at bwynt Alun Cairns: mae 80 y cant o gyllid llywodraeth leol heb ei glustnodi.

Pleidleisio drwy'r Post Postal Voting

Q3 Jocelyn Davies: Will the Minister make a statement on plans to tackle security deficiencies in postal voting prior to the next local authority elections? OAQ0244(LGP)

C3 Jocelyn Davies: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar gynlluniau i fynd i'r afael â diffygion diogelwch wrth bleidleisio drwy'r post cyn yr etholiadau awdurdodau lleol

nesaf? OAQ0244(LGP)

Sue Essex: I am not aware of any allegations of electoral malpractice in Wales. However, the UK Government has announced that it intends to introduce legislation to improve the administration of elections. Proposals will include measures aimed at improving security and confidence in the postal voting system.

Jocelyn Davies: Quite rightly, the public is increasingly concerned about the security of its votes, and, as you know, Sue, the Electoral Commission is an independent body set up to advise on the running of elections, although its recommendations are sometimes ignored by the UK Government. Do you feel that it may now be time to allow the Electoral Commission to decide on election rules rather than limiting it to offering advice?

Sue Essex: That is an interesting question. On balance, I would say 'no', because there are things that the Electoral Commission has said that we have found difficult to accept—and that is not to speak just for myself on a party-political basis. We do listen to it carefully. As you know, I have hosted events here with the Electoral Commission, and we have used it to look at local authority elections in terms of researching what happened with those elections. I take the issues that it raises seriously. There have been some bad cases, which is the basis of your concern, but we do not want to unduly worry people. As I said, to the best of my knowledge, no-one has found evidence of malpractice in Wales. That does not mean that we are complacent, but it does offer some reassurance.

Jenny Randerson: I agree that the Electoral Commission is not the fount of all wisdom, but we all know that it was right on this issue: it predicted that there would be problems and there are. It is a great pity that the Labour Government in Westminster refused to take that advice for purely narrow party-political advantage. Therefore, I welcome its change of heart. What discussions have you had with the UK

Sue Essex: Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o unrhyw honiadau o gamarfer etholaethol yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, mae Llywodraeth y DU wedi cyhoeddi ei bod yn bwriadu cyflwyno deddfwriaeth i wella'r broses o weinyddu etholiadau. Bydd y cynigion yn cynnwys mesurau i geisio gwella diogelwch a hyder yn y system bleidleisio drwy'r post.

Jocelyn Davies: Mae'r cyhoedd yn pryderu fwyfwy am ddiogelwch eu pleidleisiau, a hynny'n gwbl deg. Fel y gwyddoch, Sue, mae'r Comisiwn Etholiadol yn gorff annibynnol a sefydlwyd i roi cyngor sut i gynnal etholiadau, er y caiff ei argymhellion eu hanwybyddu weithiau gan Lywodraeth y DU. A ydych yn teimlo efallai ei bod yn bryd bellach i adael i'r Comisiwn Etholiadol benderfynu'r rheolau ar etholiadau, yn hytrach na chyfyngu hynny i gynnig cyngor yn unig?

Sue Essex: Mae hwnnw'n gwestiwn diddorol. Ar y cyfan, byddwn yn dweud 'na', gan fod y Comisiwn Etholiadol wedi dweud pethau yr ydym wedi ei chael yn anodd eu derbyn—ac nid fy marn i yn unig yw hynny o safbwynt pleidiol. Byddwn yn gwranddo arno'n ofalus. Fel y gwyddoch, yr wyf wedi trefnu digwyddiadau yma gyda'r Comisiwn Etholiadol, ac yr ydym wedi ei ddefnyddio i edrych ar etholiadau awdurdodau lleol o ran ymchwilio i'r hyn sydd wedi digwydd gyda'r etholiadau hynny. Yr wyf yn cymryd y materion a godir ganddo o ddifrif. Cafwyd rhai achosion gwael, sef yr hyn sy'n sail i'ch pryder, ond nid ydym am boeni pobl yn ddiangen. Fel y dywedais, hyd y gwn i, nid oes neb wedi gweld tystiolaeth o gamarfer yng Nghymru. Nid yw hynny'n golygu ein bod yn hunanfodlon, ond mae'n rhoi rhywfaint o sicrwydd er hynny.

Jenny Randerson: Cytunaf nad y Comisiwn Etholiadol yw ffynhonnell pob doethineb, ond gŵyr pawb ei fod yn gywir ar y mater hwn: rhagwelodd y byddai problemau ac mae hynny'n wir. Mae'n drueni mawr fod y Llywodraeth Lafur yn San Steffan wedi gwrthod derbyn y cyngor hwnnw er mwyn mantais hollol bleidiol. Felly, yr wyf yn croesawu'r ffaith iddi newid ei meddwl. Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi eu cael gyda

Government about the additional resources that will be required by returning officers if they are to make the stringent checks that are proposed by the Electoral Commission, which I hope will now be taken on board in the new legislation?

Sue Essex: I refute what you said about the Government: that is very unfair. However, moving on, any legislation has a financial appraisal attached to it, and money will be Barnettised. In fairness, you are probably not aware of the work that the Local Government and Public Services Committee is doing on this. We had a very good session on this issue this morning: the committee is producing a report on electoral services. Some very interesting things have come forward from that. One interesting and, I think, quite exciting idea that came forward this morning was about how we change the nature of electoral services within local government, and about looking at it much more in terms of participation rather than just something that operates at election time. My response will be very much influenced, and quite rightly so, by what the committee says in its report, which will come out later this year. I would really like to reserve judgment until I see what comes forward in that report.

Llywodraeth y DU ynglŷn â'r adnoddau ychwanegol y bydd eu hangen ar swyddogion canlyniadau, os ydynt i wneud y gwiriadau llym sy'nc ael eu cynnig gan y Comisiwn Etholiadol ac y gobeithiaf y cânt eu mabwysiadu nawr yn y ddeddfwriaeth newydd?

Sue Essex: Gwrthodaf yr hyn a ddywedwch am y Llywodraeth: mae hynny'n annheg iawn. Fodd bynnag, i symud ymlaen, mae arfarniad ariannol ynghlwm wrth unrhyw ddeddfwriaeth, a chaiff arian ei Farneteiddio. A bod yn deg, mae'n debyg nad ydych yn gwybod am y gwaith y mae'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus yn ei wneud ar hyn. Cawsom drafodaeth dda iawn ar y mater hwn y bore yma: mae'r pwyllgor yn cynhyrchu adroddiad ar wasanaethau etholiadol. Mae rhai pethau diddorol iawn wedi deillio o hynny. Un syniad diddorol, a digon cyffrous yn fy marn i, a gyflwynwyd y bore yma oedd sut i newid natur gwasanaethau etholiadol o fewn llywodraeth leol, ac edrych arnynt o safbwynt cyfranogi, yn hytrach na rhywbeth sydd ar waith adeg etholiadau'n unig. Bydd yr hyn y bydd y pwyllgor yn ei ddweud yn ei adroddiad, a gyhoeddir yn ddiweddarach eleni, yn dylanwadu'n fawr ar fy ymateb, a hynny'n briodol. Byddai'n well gennyf beidio â lleisio fy marn nes imi weld yr hyn a fydd yn yr adroddiad hwnnw.

Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Public Services

Q4 Jeff Cuthbert: What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to improve the way that public services in Wales are designed and delivered? OAQ0296(LGP)

C4 Jeff Cuthbert: Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i wella'r ffordd y caiff gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru eu cynllunio a'u darparu? OAQ0296(LGP)

Q5 Christine Gwyther: Will the Minister outline Assembly measures to improve the design and delivery of public services in Wales? OAQ0272(LGP)

C5 Christine Gwyther: A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu mesurau'r Cynulliad i wella'r broses o gynllunio a darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru? OAQ0272(LGP)

Q11 Janice Gregory: What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to improve the way that public services are designed and delivered? OAQ0267(LGP)

C11 Janice Gregory: Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i wella'r ffordd y caiff gwasanaethau cyhoeddus eu cynllunio a'u darparu? OAQ0267(LGP)

Sue Essex: We set out our vision for high-quality, responsive public services in 'Making the Connections'. This means services being centred around people and the community, and co-ordinating and, where possible, simplifying service delivery in the context of making the most of our resources.

Jeff Cuthbert: Do you agree that the Labour-led Caerphilly County Borough Council should be congratulated on its achievement in receiving a prestigious carbon management award—*[Interruption.]*

The Presiding Officer: Order. I am anxious to listen to this supplementary question.

Jeff Cuthbert: It should be congratulated on its achievement in receiving a prestigious carbon management award from the Carbon Trust for its energy efficiency efforts across the county borough. Indeed, by 2007, the borough council intends to reduce its carbon emissions by 6 per cent.

Sue Essex: That is a serious point for people who care about climate change and carbon emissions. The kind of practical evidence that you referred to in the case of Caerphilly is crucial. If my memory serves me right, Caerphilly was one of two Welsh authorities that were part of that local government pilot scheme. It is incumbent upon us to try to mainstream the lessons learned and the best practice from Caerphilly. Carbon emissions are a serious issue, and we must find good examples to be mainstreamed throughout the public sector.

Christine Gwyther: One of the fears surrounding the merger of Assembly sponsored public bodies, which we will discuss later this afternoon, is that it could lead to the centralisation of public services. Can you assure me that you will do everything within your power, working with your Welsh Assembly Government colleagues, to ensure that the regional focus that we currently enjoy with some ASPBs is retained and, wherever possible, enhanced?

Sue Essex: That, again, is an important point. This is about getting the levels right, in terms

Sue Essex: Nodwyd ein gweledigaeth ar gyfer gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ymatebol o safon uchel yn 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau'. Mae hyn yn golygu canoli gwasanaethau ar bobl a'r gymuned a chydgyssylltu, a lle mae hynny'n bosibl, symleiddio'r broses o ddarparu gwasanaethau yng nghyd-destun manteisio i'r eithaf ar ein hadnoddau.

Jeff Cuthbert: A gytunwch y dylai Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili sydd o dan arweiniad y blaid Lafur gael ei longyfarch am ennill gwobr o fri am reoli carbon—*[Torri ar draws.]*

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr wyf yn awyddus i glywed y cwestiwn atodol hwn.

Jeff Cuthbert: Dylid ei longyfarch am ennill gwobr o fri am reoli carbon gan yr Ymddiriedolaeth Garbon am ei ymdrechion ym maes effeithlonrwydd ynni ledled y fwrdeistref sirol. Yn wir, erbyn 2007 mae'r cyngor bwrdeistref yn bwriadu gostwng ei ollyngiadau carbon 6 y cant.

Sue Essex: Mae hwnnw'n bwynt difrifol i bobl sy'n pryderu am newid hinsawdd a gollyngiadau carbon. Mae'r math o dystiolaeth ymarferol yr oeddech yn cyfeirio ati yn achos Caerffili yn hanfodol. Os cofiaf yn iawn, yr oedd Caerffili yn un o ddau awdurdod yng Nghymru a oedd yn rhan o'r cynllun peilot llywodraeth leol hwnnw. Rhaid inni geisio prif-frydio'r gwersi a ddysgwyd a'r arfer gorau o Gaerffili. Mae gollyngiadau carbon yn fater difrifol, a rhaid inni ddarganfod enghreifftiau da i'w prif-frydio drwy'r sector cyhoeddus.

Christine Gwyther: Un o'r pryderon ynghylch uno cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad, a buddwn yn trafod hynny'n ddiweddarach y prynhawn yma, yw y gallai arwain at ganoli gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. A allwch fy sicrhau y byddwch yn gwneud popeth o fewn eich gallu, drwy weithio gyda'ch cyd-Aelodau yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, i sicrhau bod y ffocws rhanbarthol sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd gyda rhai CCNC yn parhau, ac yn cael ei wella lle bynnag y bydd yn bosibl?

Sue Essex: Unwaith eto, mae hwnnw'n bwynt pwysig. Mae'n ymwneud â sicrhau'r

of an all-Wales level, a regional level and a local level. It is important that we do those things that have to be done on an all-Wales basis at that level. The regional level is becoming increasingly important. I am certain that you were referring in your question to the structure of the Welsh Development Agency, among others, through which you feel, in places like Pembrokeshire, that you are getting the right attention and responsiveness. As far as I am concerned—Rhodri will cover this later this afternoon—I am supportive of the regional level. To the best of my knowledge, that will be reinforced through the ASPB merger.

Janice Gregory: Under a Labour administration, Bridgend County Borough Council formed and strongly supported one of the UK's first youth councils. It placed an emphasis on youth services within the county borough. However, under the current Rainbow Alliance administration, and even with the best-ever settlement from the Welsh Assembly Government, £37,000 is being cut from the youth service budget. The administration is blaming the Welsh Assembly Government for that decision. Do you share my concerns that such a significant reduction in this funding will have serious implications for these vulnerable groups?

Sue Essex: I am concerned that the Welsh Assembly Government is automatically blamed; Bridgend council received about £144 million in unencumbered funding, and there was also money on top of that. At the end of the day, it is for local councils to make their own decisions, and I understand that Bridgend council is going to look again at this particular case.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): I was intrigued yesterday that, during your speech on identity cards, you referred to an electronic integrated smartcard for Wales. I think that there is a distinction in your mind between an ID card and an integrated smartcard. Will there be any connection between the information or data collected for an integrated smartcard and that of an ID card, which is what is being proposed by the

lefelau cywir, o ran Cymru gyfan, lefel ranbarthol a lefel leol. Mae'n bwysig inni wneud y pethau hynny y mae'n rhaid eu gwneud ar sail Cymru gyfan ar y lefel honno. Mae'r lefel ranbarthol yn dod yn fwyfwy pwysig. Yr wyf yn siŵr mai cyfeirio at strwythur Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, ymhlith rhai eraill, yr oeddech yn eich cwestiwn, am eich bod o'r farn, mewn lleoedd megis sir Benfro, eich bod yn cael y sylw a'r ymateb priodol. Yr wyf yn cefnogi'r lefel ranbarthol, a bydd Rhodri yn trafod hyn yn ddiweddarach y prynhawn yma. Hyd y gwn, caiff hynny ei atgyfnerthu drwy uno'r CCNC.

Janice Gregory: O dan weinyddiaeth Lafur, sefydlodd Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr un o gynghorau ieuencid cyntaf y DU. Rhoddodd bwyslais ar wasanaethau ieuencid yn y fwrdeistref sirol. Fodd bynnag, o dan weinyddiaeth bresennol y gynghrair amryliw, a hyd yn oed gyda'r setliad gorau erioed gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, mae £37,000 yn cael ei dorri o'r gyllideb ar gyfer y gwasanaeth ieuencid. Mae'r weinyddiaeth yn rhoi'r bai ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru am y penderfyniad hwnnw. A ydych chi, fel finnau, yn pryderu y bydd gostyngiad mor sylweddol yn y gyllideb hon yn cael effaith ddifrifol ar y grwpiau diamddiffyn hyn?

Sue Essex: Yr wyf yn pryderu ynghylch y ffaith fod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cael ei beio beth bynnag; cafodd cyngor Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr tua £144 miliwn o arian heb ei glustnodi, ac yr oedd arian yn ychwanegol at hynny hefyd. Yn y pen draw, cyfrifoldeb cynghorau lleol yw gwneud eu penderfyniadau eu hunain, a deallaf fod cyngor Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr am ailedrych ar yr achos penodol hwn.

Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): Cefais fy nghyfareddu ddoe wrth ichi gyfeirio at gardiau call integredig electronig i Gymru, yn ystod eich araith ar gardiau adnabod. Credaf eich bod yn gwahaniaethu rhwng cerdyn adnabod a cherdyn call integredig. A fydd unrhyw gysylltiad rhwng y wybodaeth neu'r data a gesglir ar gyfer cerdyn call integredig a cherdyn adnabod, sef yr hyn a gaiff ei gynnig gan Lywodraeth

UK Government?

Sue Essex: I remember your summing up at the end of yesterday's debate—you went through your original speech without noting that I said something different to what you had expected. Putting that aside, I talked, as you rightly said, about the smartcard, on which we are still undertaking a scoping study. I made it clear that that was an entitlement card in relation to public service delivery—particularly around the initiatives that we have introduced in Wales—and we are discussing this in the older people's working group. At the moment, all I can say is that the information collected in relation to that card will be around the delivery of public services and on the scope of the smartcard. I see no reason for it to be used beyond public service delivery.

Michael German: Incidentally, I said that there was a difference between an entitlement card and an ID card. I am now probing the difference to see whether it is as I understand it. Therefore, it will not be a card that will hold personal information. Looking at the other side of the issue, if the card will be needed to access services in Wales, *ipso facto*, will it not gradually become a compulsory card to hold if you want to access services?

2.20 p.m.

Sue Essex: If you monitor a system, you must be assured about identity, and the bus pass system is well accepted. This goes back to a previous point that in terms of registering, the information may be required. The basis of your earlier question was whether that that data would be shared in any kind of way. If there is a difference, I will come back to you, but this will be purely about ensuring that there is fair access to public services.

David Lloyd: Further to that point, can you clarify which public services will require a service user to produce a smartcard?

y DU?

Sue Essex: Yr wyf yn cofio eich casgliad ar ddiwedd y ddadl ddoe—aethoch drwy eich araith wreiddiol heb sylwi fy mod wedi dweud rhywbeth gwahanol i'r hyn yr oeddech wedi ei ddisgwyl. Ac eithrio hynny, soniais, fel y dywedwch yn ddigon cywir, am y cerdyn call, ac yr ydym yn cynnal astudiaeth gwmpasu o hwnnw o hyd. Eglurais mai cerdyn hawl oedd hwnnw mewn perthynas â darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus—yn enwedig o ran y mentrau yr ydym wedi eu cyflwyno yng Nghymru—ac yr ydym wrthi'n trafod hyn yn y gweithgor ar bobl hŷn. Ar hyn o bryd, yr unig beth y gallaf ei ddweud yw y bydd y wybodaeth a gesglir mewn perthynas â'r cerdyn hwnnw yn ymwneud â darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a chwmpas y cerdyn call. Ni welaf unrhyw reswm dros ei ddefnyddio y tu hwnt i ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus.

Michael German: Gyda llaw, dywedais fod gwahaniaeth rhwng cerdyn hawl a cherdyn adnabod. Yr wyf yn awr yn ymchwilio i'r gwahaniaeth i weld a yw fy nealltwriaeth ohono'n gywir. Felly, ni fydd yn gerdyn sy'n cadw gwybodaeth bersonol. I edrych ar ochr arall y geiniog, os bydd angen cyflwyno'r cerdyn i ddefnyddio gwasanaethau yng Nghymru, *ipso facto*, oni ddaw yn gerdyn gorfodol yn raddol os byddwch am ddefnyddio gwasanaethau?

Sue Essex: Os ydych yn monitro system, rhaid ichi fod yn sicr ynghylch adnabyddiaeth, ac mae system y cerdyn bws yn cael ei derbyn yn dda. Cyfeiria hyn yn ôl at bwynt blaenorol, y gall fod angen y wybodaeth o ran cofrestru. Sail eich cwestiwn cynharach oedd a fyddai'r data hwnnw yn cael ei rannu mewn unrhyw ffordd. Os oes gwahaniaeth, dof yn ôl atoch, ond bydd hyn yn ymwneud yn unig â sicrhau mynediad teg i wasanaethau cyhoeddus.

David Lloyd: Y ychwanegol at y pwynt hwnnw, a allwch egluro pa wasanaethau cyhoeddus fydd yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i ddefnyddiwr gwasanaeth gyflwyno cerdyn call?

Sue Essex: When you say ‘require’, I should note that many public services will not require cards, and that is an absolutely fundamental point. At the moment, we are trying to develop a smartcard that provides an easier method of identifying people and of tracking numbers. The bus pass is currently used only as a bus pass, but we could introduce an entitlement card—John Griffiths has been looking at this issue in terms of older people—which will make it easier for people by only having one smartcard on an electronic, swipe basis that keeps a good record of use and offers accessibility to a range of services. That is the principle at the moment, but it is still early days. However, this is about supporting people in accessing services, not denying access.

Jonathan Morgan: A few weeks ago, your colleague the Health and Social Services Minister produced a document called ‘Designed for Life’, which is a 10-year strategy for the health service. Part of the document suggests a need to eradicate the deficits faced by local health boards. How will we reach a position in Wales where we will be able to eradicate those deficits faced by LHBs and, in particular, by NHS trusts? What discussions have you had with your colleague since the report’s publication to see how that can be achieved?

Sue Essex: I have frequent discussions with Brian on funding and public service delivery. The whole thrust of this issue relates to the reduction of deficits and financial recovery. We want to move away from a situation where deficits were added up over time to an unsustainable level. The point of the programme, in terms of deficits, is to try to move the deficits back and stabilise the position. In fairness, a major public organisation can never be 100 per cent on the level, and you would not expect it to come down to the last penny. However, I think that everyone would agree that that it would not be sensible to run public services with a deficit of millions of pounds being stacked up. In fairness, it is not easy for the

Sue Essex: Pan ddywedwch ‘yn ofynnol’, dylwn nodi na fydd angen cyflwyno cardiau ar gyfer nifer o wasanaethau cyhoeddus, ac mae hwnnw’n bwynt hollol sylfaenol. Ar hyn o bryd, yr ydym yn ceisio datblygu cerdyn call sy’n ei gwneud yn haws adnabod pobl ac olrhain rhifau. Ar hyn o bryd, dim ond fel cerdyn bws y defnyddir y cerdyn bws, ond gallem gyflwyno cerdyn hawl—mae John Griffiths wedi bod yn edrych ar y mater hwn o ran pobl hŷn—a fydd yn ei gwneud yn haws i bobl drwy gael un cerdyn call yn unig ar ffurf cerdyn llithro electronig sy’n cadw cofnod da o’i ddefnyddio ac yn galluogi defnyddio amrywiaeth o wasanaethau. Dyna’r egwyddor ar hyn o bryd, ond megis dechrau yr ydym o hyd. Fodd bynnag, mae hyn yn ymwneud â chynorthwyo pobl i ddefnyddio gwasanaethau, nid eu hatal rhag gwneud hynny.

Jonathan Morgan: Ychydig wythnosau yn ôl, cyflwynodd eich cyd-Aelod, y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, ddogfen o’r enw ‘Cynllun Oes’, sef strategaeth ddeng mlynedd ar gyfer y gwasanaeth iechyd. Awgryma rhan o’r ddogfen fod angen dileu’r diffygion y mae byrddau iechyd lleol yn eu hwynebu. Sut y byddwn yn cyrraedd sefyllfa yng Nghymru lle y gallwn ddileu’r diffygion hynny y mae BILL yn eu hwynebu, ac ymddiriedolaethau’r GIG yn arbennig? Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi eu cael gyda’ch cyd-Aelod ers cyhoeddi’r adroddiad i weld sut y gellir cyflawni hynny?

Sue Essex: Byddaf yn cael trafodaethau rheolaidd gyda Brian ynghylch cyllid a darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Mae’r holl fater hwn yn ymwneud â lleihau diffygion a sicrhau adferiad ariannol. Yr ydym am symud oddi wrth sefyllfa lle mae diffygion wedi cynyddu gydag amser i lefel na ellir ei chynnal. Pwynt y rhaglen, o ran diffygion, yw ceisio eu lleihau a cheisio sefydlogi’r sefyllfa. A bod yn deg, ni all sefydliad cyhoeddus mawr fyth fod yn hollol gytbwys, ac ni fyddech yn disgwyl iddo gofnodi’r geiniog ddiwethaf. Fodd bynnag, credaf y byddai pawb yn cytuno na fyddai’n synhwyrol rhedeg gwasanaethau cyhoeddus gyda diffyg o filiynau o bunnoedd yn cronni. A bod yn deg, nid yw’n hawdd i’r

organisations involved, but that is our aim.

sefydliadau dan sylw, ond dyna yw ein nod.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Following a statement by a Cardiff GP that the local out-of-hours service was dangerous and potentially life-threatening, do you not feel that the people of Cardiff need to be reassured about the service? Should you not be making a statement in Plenary, and should the Welsh Assembly Government not be holding an inquiry into the service?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yn dilyn datganiad gan feddyg teulu o Gaerdydd fod y gwasanaeth lleol ar ôl oriau yn beryglus ac y gallai beryglu bywydau, oni chredwch fod angen tawelu meddyliau pobl Caerdydd am y gwasanaeth? Oni ddylech fod yn gwneud datganiad yn y Cyfarfod Llawn, ac oni ddylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wneud ymchwiliad i'r gwasanaeth?

Sue Essex: It is a difficult question for me to answer because, as an Assembly Member, I have been taking up the case of the out-of-hours contract for some time. As local elected representatives, my colleague, Julie Morgan, and I have been closely involved with this issue.

Sue Essex: Mae hwnnw'n gwestiwn anodd i mi ei ateb, fel Aelod o'r Cynulliad, oherwydd yr wyf wedi bod yn dadlau dros y contract ar ôl oriau ers cryn amser. Fel cynrychiolwyr etholedig lleol, mae fy nghyd-Aelod, Julie Morgan, a mi wedi bod yn ymwneud yn fanwl â'r mater hwn.

In terms of whether a statement to the Assembly is require, that is for Brian Gibbons to decide, but I have every confidence that the LHB will get to grips with the issue and provide the public reassurance that people, including myself, want.

O ran y cwestiwn a oes angen cyflwyno datganiad i'r Cynulliad, penderfyniad Brian Gibbons yw hynny, ond hyderaf y bydd y BILL yn mynd i'r afael â'r mater ac yn tawelu meddyliau'r cyhoedd, a dyna'r hyn y mae pobl, gan gynnwys fi fy hun, am ei weld.

System Cofrestru Pleidleiswyr Voter Registration System

Q6 Ann Jones: What discussions has the Minister had with the Electoral Commission regarding reforms to the voter registration system? OAQ0278(LGP)

C6 Ann Jones: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael gyda'r Comisiwn Etholiadol ynglŷn â diwygio'r system cofrestru pleidleiswyr? OAQ0278(LGP)

Sue Essex: To date, there have been no discussions with the Electoral Commission on this matter, but I am encouraged by the work and proposals set out in the Electoral Commission's report, 'Securing the Vote'.

Sue Essex: Hyd yn hyn, ni chafwyd unrhyw drafodaethau gyda'r Comisiwn Etholiadol ar y mater hwn, ond mae'r gwaith a'r cynigion a nodir yn adroddiad y Comisiwn Etholiadol, sef 'Securing the Vote' yn galonogol.

Ann Jones: Yesterday, I had the opportunity to ask the First Minister whether he would join me in urging local authorities in this regard. I have raised the issue of how we get people onto the electoral register with you and with the First Minister on many occasions. There are many ways in which we can do that, and we heard about some exciting ways from Scope in this morning's committee meeting. Do you agree that we have to look at ways in which Denbighshire County Council—not just Denbighshire County Council, but that is the one that I am

Ann Jones: Ddoe, cefais y cyfle i ofyn i'r Prif Weinidog a fyddai'n ymuno â mi i annog awdurdodau lleol yn hyn o beth. Yr wyf wedi codi'r mater sut y gallwn gael pobl ar y gofrestr etholiadol gyda chi a'r Prif Weinidog lawer gwaith. Gallwn wneud hynny mewn llawer ffordd, a chlywsom am rai ffyrdd cyffrous gan Scope yn ystod cyfarfod y pwyllgor y bore yma. A gytunwch fod yn rhaid inni edrych ar ffyrdd y gall Cyngor Sir Ddinbych—nid dim ond Cyngor Sir Ddinbych, ond dyna'r un yr wyf yn meddwl amdano—gael pobl i ymgysylltu â'r

thinking of—can get people to engage with those in our communities who perhaps cannot, or do not, fill in forms for whatever reason, to get them on the register and to engage them in the democratic process? Do you agree that, whatever system we agree, whether it is household or individual registration, we must ensure that there is wide access so that people have the ability to put themselves on the register?

Sue Essex: We had a very interesting discussion in committee, and, obviously most Members were not part of that, but there was a big debate around the issue of having household registration or individual registration, and there was concern based on the Northern Ireland experience, where the number of individual registrations has dropped. There are some disturbing questions around that. I agree with you that registration is vital for participation, and Bryn Parry-Jones endorsed this when he came to speak to the committee. There are lots of good ideas out there. We do not want to get to the situation that they have in America where registration is down to 50 per cent. We have to look at all good ideas and ensure that, where they work, they are mainstreamed.

rheini yn ein cymunedau na allant, neu nad ydynt efallai, yn llenwi ffurflenni am ba reswm bynnag, i'w cael ar y gofrestr ac i'w cynnwys yn y broses ddemocrataidd? A gytnuwch, pa system bynnag y cytunir arni, boed yn gofrestru cartrefi neu unigolion, fod yn rhaid inni sicrhau mynediad eang er mwyn i bobl allu rhoi eu henwau ar y gofrestr?

Sue Essex: Cawsom drafodaeth ddiddorol iawn yn ystod cyfarfod y pwyllgor, ac wrth gwrs nid oedd y rhan fwyaf o'r Aelodau yn rhan o hynny. Ond cafwyd dadl fawr ynghylch cofrestru cartrefi neu unigolion, a mynegwyd pryder ar sail y profiad yng Ngogledd Iwerddon, lle y mae nifer yr unigolion sy'n cofrestru wedi gostwng. Mae yna rai cwestiynau anghyffyrddus ynghylch hynny. Cytunaf â chi ei bod yn hanfodol cofrestru er mwyn cymryd rhan, a chefnogodd Bryn Parry-Jones hyn pan ddaeth i siarad â'r pwyllgor. Mae nifer o syniadau da ar gael. Nid ydym am weld sefyllfa fel yr hyn sydd yn America, lle y mae nifer yr unigolion sy'n cofrestru wedi gostwng 50 y cant. Rhaid inni ystyried pob syniad da a sicrhau ei fod yn cael ei brifffrydio, os yw'n gweithio.

Biwrocratiaeth Bureaucracy

Q7 Rosemary Butler: What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to reduce the bureaucracy faced by local authorities in Wales? OAQ0282(LGP)

C7 Rosemary Butler: Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i leihau'r fiwrocratiaeth sy'n wynebu awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru? OAQ0282(LGP)

Sue Essex: I strongly support removing unnecessary bureaucratic burdens from local authorities. That is why, in April, I announced our plans to radically reduce the number of plans that local authorities have to prepare. We are about to embark on a consultation process on that, which I think is due to start at the end of the week.

Sue Essex: Yr wyf yn cefnogi'n gryf yr ymgais i ddileu beichiau biwrocrataidd diangen oddi ar ysgwyddau awdurdodau lleol yn fawr. Dyna pam y cyhoeddais, ym mis Ebrill, ein cynlluniau i ostwng yn sylweddol nifer y cynlluniau y mae'n rhaid i awdurdodau lleol eu paratoi. Yr ydym ar fin dechrau proses ymgynghori ar hynny, a chredaf ei bod i gychwyn ddiwedd yr wythnos.

Rosemary Butler: I am sure that the reduction in the number of headline plans, from 35 to 5, will be well received by local authorities across Wales. The Government

Rosemary Butler: Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y gostyngiad yn nifer y prif gynlluniau, o 35 i 5, yn cael ei groesawu'n fawr gan awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru. Mae

thrust of working in partnership to deliver on new initiatives is a good idea in principle. However, in practice, local authorities and, particularly, the voluntary sector, are being stretched almost beyond their capabilities to ensure that there is partnership working. For example, in order to deliver the Welsh Assembly Government's excellent young people's initiative, we have the children and young people's partnership, the children's partnership, the young people's partnership, Sure Start, the 14-19 network, the community consortia for education and training and the RISE partnership, among others. Each partnership is extremely valuable on its own, but the total effect is damping enthusiasm and is draining energy from the delivery of the service. Will you look at the rationalisation of partnership working in the same way as you have looked at the rationalisation of statutory plans?

Sue Essex: That is a good point. I guess that we all wanted local government to act in a more outgoing way, and partnerships are important: they are intrinsic to the community plan. However, like anything, if you are not watching it carefully, it can proliferate and make unnecessary demands. Therefore, once we have the work on plan rationalisation out, I would be interested to move on to partnership arrangements and to seeing whether we can ensure that all partnerships are there, have a purpose and do not put undue demands on local authorities or the voluntary sector.

pwyslais y Llywodraeth ar weithio mewn partneriaeth i gyflwyno mentrau newydd yn syniad da fel egwyddor. Fodd bynnag, yn ymarferol mae awdurdodau lleol, a'r sector gwirfoddol yn arbennig, yn cael eu hymestyn y tu hwnt i'w gallu bron er mwyn sicrhau gweithio mewn partneriaeth. Er enghraifft, er mwyn cyflwyno menter ardderchog Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer pobl ifanc, mae gennym y bartneriaeth plant a phobl ifanc, y bartneriaeth plant, y bartneriaeth pobl ifanc, Cychwyn Cadarn, y rhwydwaith 14-19 oed, y consortia cymunedol ar gyfer addysg a hyfforddiant a phartneriaeth RISE, ymhlith eraill. Mae pob partneriaeth yn werthfawr iawn ar ei phen ei hun, ond mae'r effaith gyffredinol yn llesteirio brwdfrydedd ac yn dihysbyddu egni'r broses o ddarparu'r gwasanaeth. A fyddwch yn edrych ar resymoli gweithio mewn partneriaeth fel yr ydych wedi edrych ar resymoli cynlluniau statudol?

Sue Essex: Mae hwnnw'n bwynt da. Mae'n sicr ein bod i gyd am weld llywodraeth leol yn gweithredu mewn ffordd fwy allblyg, ac mae partneriaethau'n bwysig: maent yn rhan hanfodol o'r cynllun cymunedol. Fodd bynnag, fel unrhyw beth, os na fyddwch yn ei wyllo'n ofalus, gall ymledu a chreu pwysau diangen. Felly, pan fydd y gwaith ar resymoli cynlluniau yn mynd rhagddo, byddai gennyf ddiddordeb mewn symud ymlaen i drefniadau partneriaeth a gweld a allwn sicrhau bod pob partneriaeth yn ei lle, bod pwrpas iddi ac nad yw'n rhoi pwysau diangen ar awdurdodau lleol neu'r sector gwirfoddol.

Effaith y Dreth Gyngor ar y Rhai sydd ar Incwm Isel The Impact of Council Tax on Low Income Earners

Q8 Jocelyn Davies: Will the Minister make a statement on the impact of council tax on low-income earners? OAQ0242(LGP)

C8 Jocelyn Davies: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar effaith y dreth gyngor ar bobl sydd ar incwm isel? OAQ0242(LGP)

Sue Essex: I recognise that those on low incomes may need help to pay their council tax. Council tax benefit is key to this. I continue to press for a more inclusive scheme.

Sue Essex: Yr wyf yn cydnabod y gall fod angen help ar bobl sydd ar incwm isel i dalu eu treth gyngor. Mae budd-dal treth gyngor yn allweddol i hyn. Yr wyf yn parhau i bwyso am gynllun mwy cynhwysol.

Jocelyn Davies: A recent report by the University of Warwick found that the less well off have to part with a disproportionate

Jocelyn Davies: Yr oedd adroddiad diweddar gan Brifysgol Warwick yn ddiweddar yn dangos ei bod yn rhaid i bobl

amount of their income for council tax compared with those who are better off, even when you take benefits into account. Therefore, do you believe that the powers to abolish this repressive system should be devolved to the National Assembly so that we may replace it with a system based on the ability to pay?

Sue Essex: If you are talking about the powers for local taxation and where they lie, everyone is waiting to see what comes out of the Lyons report later this year, and it would not be sensible to try to pre-empt that. I take your point about council tax benefit's impact, but one of the key things is that the regime needs to be changed, possibly in terms of threshold and eligibility. We are doing our best to try to promote take-up, because that is the system that we currently have and it is important that those who are eligible receive those benefits.

2.30 p.m.

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): Has an assessment been carried out on the impact of the council tax revaluation on the number of people in Wales who are eligible for council tax benefit?

Sue Essex: I am not exactly sure what you mean, but, as you know, council tax benefit is calculated according to assets and income level. Therefore, the same principles are being applied, and it will depend on people's assets and income. However, underneath that question is the idea that the overall council tax rises in Wales were excessive. I have looked at the yield figures, which show that the rise was about the same as it has been in previous years.

Nick Bourne: What particularly concerns me is the evidence that we have, which is admittedly patchy, but which shows that a large number of people in Wales are eligible for council tax benefit and yet are not tapping into it. As a result of the increases seen since 1997, it appears that the figure of those eligible has increased steadily, though not massively, but that the number of people

sy'n waeth eu byd dalu swm anghymesur o'u hincwm fel ar dreth gyngor o'u cymharu â'r rheini sy'n well eu byd, hyd yn oed ar ôl ystyried budd-daliadau. Felly, a gredwch y dylai'r pwerau i gael ddileu'r system ormesol hon gael eu datganoli i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol er mwyn inni allu cyflwyno system yn seiliedig ar y gallu i dalu yn ei lle?

Sue Essex: Os ydych yn sôn am y pwerau ar gyfer trethiant lleol a phwy sy'n meddu arnynt, mae pawb yn aros i weld beth ddaw allan o adroddiad Lyons, a gyhoeddir yn ddiweddarach eleni, ac ni fyddai'n synhwyrol ceisio achub y blaen ar hwnnw. Derbyniaf eich pwynt ynghylch effaith y budd-dal treth gyngor. Ond un o'r pethau allweddol yw bod angen newid y gyfundrefn, o bosibl o ran trothwy a chymhwysedd. Yr ydym yn gwneud ein gorau i geisio annog pobl i hawlio'r budd-dal, oherwydd dyna'r system sydd ohoni, ac mae'n bwysig bod y rheini sy'n gymwys yn cael y budd-daliadau hynny.

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): A wnaed asesiad o effaith yr ymarfer ailbriso'r dreth gyngor ar nifer y bobl yng Nghymru sy'n gymwys i gael budd-dal treth gyngor?

Sue Essex: Nid wyf yn hollol siŵr beth yr ydych yn ei olygu, ond fel y gwyddoch, cyfrifir budd-dal treth gyngor yn ôl asedau a lefel incwm. Felly, defnyddir yr un egwyddorion, a bydd yn dibynnu ar asedau ac incwm pobl. Fodd bynnag, yn sail i'r cwestiwn hwnnw mae'r syniad fod y cynnydd cyffredinol yn y dreth gyngor yng Nghymru yn ormodol. Yr wyf wedi bwrw golwg dros y ffigurau arennill, sy'n dangos bod y cynnydd tua'r un maint ag ydoedd mewn blynyddoedd blaenorol.

Nick Bourne: Yr hyn sydd achosi pryder arbennig imi yw'r dystiolaeth sydd gennym. Mae'n anghyson, rhaid cyfaddef, ond mae'n dangos bod nifer fawr o bobl yng Nghymru yn gymwys i gael budd-dal treth gyngor ond nad ydynt wedi dechrau ei hawlio eto. O ganlyniad i'r cynnydd a welwyd er 1997, ymddengys bod y niferoedd hynny sy'n gymwys wedi cynyddu'n gyson, er nad yn

applying for council tax benefit has not. What efforts are you or your Government making to ensure that the benefit is well advertised and that the number of people applying for council tax benefit increases?

Sue Essex: That is a fair point. We know—and this is the figure that I currently have—that 271,000 people are receiving benefit. I do not know how that matches out in terms of households, but I am considering that and I would be happy to share that information with you. We have done a considerable amount of work on this. A working group is considering this, and many authorities have tried innovative schemes. However, as I said to Jocelyn, I believe that the scheme needs to be widened, assuming that there is no change in the nature of local taxation, and we will not know that until we see what the Lyons review recommends and what the Government will do. We have to change the nature of the benefit so that more people are eligible, but we must also make it easier to access. I do not know whether you discuss this with your constituents, but I do and it quite a complicated process. They have simplified it, but it would help if it were simplified further. We know that it is older people who are claiming it less than others, and we need to help them to ensure that they receive the benefits that they deserve.

sylweddol, ond na fu unrhyw gynnydd yn nifer y bobl sy'n gwneud cais am fudd-dal treth gyngor. Beth yr ydych chi neu eich Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod y budd-dal yn cael ei hysbysebu'n dda a bod nifer y bobl sy'n gwneud cais am fudd-dal treth gyngor yn cynyddu?

Sue Essex: Pwynt teg. Gwyddom—a dyma'r ffigur sydd gennyf ar hyn o bryd—fod 271,000 o bobl yn cael budd-dal. Ni wn beth yw'r ffigur o ran nifer y cartrefi, ond yr wyf yn ystyried hynny a byddwn yn fwy na pharod i roi'r wybodaeth honno ichi. Yr ydym wedi gwneud cryn dipyn o waith ar hyn. Mae gweithgor wrthi'n ystyried hyn, ac mae llawer awdurdod wedi rhoi cynnig ar gynlluniau arloesol. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais wrth Jocelyn, credaf fod angen ehangu'r cynllun, a bwrw na fydd unrhyw newid yn natur trethiant lleol, ac ni fyddwn yn gwybod hynny nes inni weld argymhellion adolygiad Lyons a'r hyn a wna'r Llywodraeth. Rhaid inni newid natur y budd-dal fel y bydd mwy o bobl yn gymwys, ond rhaid inni hefyd ei gwneud yn haws ei hawlio. Ni wn a fyddwch yn trafod hyn gyda'ch etholwyr, ond yr wyf fi'n gwneud hynny, ac mae'n broses eithaf cymhleth. Maent wedi'i symleiddio, ond byddai o gymorth pe câi ei symleiddio hyd yn oed yn fwy. Gwyddom mai pobl hŷn sy'n llai tebygol o hawlio'r budd-dal, ac mae angen inni eu helpu i sicrhau eu bod yn cael y budd-daliadau a haeddant.

Y Dreth Gyngor Council Tax

Q9 Karen Sinclair: Will the Minister outline what measures she is taking to improve levels of council tax benefit take-up in Clwyd South? OAQ0270(LGP)

C9 Karen Sinclair: A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu pa fesurau y mae'n eu cymryd i gynyddu nifer y bobl sy'n cael budd-dal treth gyngor yn Ne Clwyd? OAQ0270(LGP)

Sue Essex: I think that that very much follows on from the previous question. We have this working group that was set up and, over the past six months, local authorities have developed various initiatives. We have been talking about Caerphilly County Borough Council, which has been very active, and I know that its leader is keen on pursuing this. So, the council has been working with the Department for Work and Pensions on linking up with pension credit,

Sue Essex: Credaf fod hynny'n dilyn y cwestiwn blaenorol i raddau helaeth. Sefydlwyd gweithgor gennym, ac yn ystod y chwe mis diwethaf mae awdurdodau lleol wedi datblygu gwahanol fentrau. Yr ydym wedi sôn am Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili, a fu'n weithgar iawn, a gwn fod ei arweinydd yn awyddus iawn i ddilyn hyn. Felly, mae'r cyngor wedi bod yn gweithio gyda'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau ar gysylltu â'r credyd pensiwn, er enghraifft.

for example. Often, if people receive one benefit and they are not passported, they may be able receive more. We need to give them that basic help. The council has been working on that and publicising it and giving specific advice to people. There is a whole range of examples that I could give to you, and I will pass on that information.

Karen Sinclair: I do not want to go over what Nick has explored with you, as that would be pointless. He highlighted the fact that not enough people are taking up benefit, which is a real worry. Many people on low incomes and on jobseekers' allowance still leave money that is set aside to ease their annual council tax bills unclaimed at the town hall. It is important that we acknowledge that this group of people is not taking up benefit, and take practical steps to encourage those people to do so. You mentioned a working group, Sue. What practical work on the ground could be done now to increase that take-up? It is imperative that we encourage local authorities to be proactive on this at the moment.

Sue Essex: I think that there are two important issues. You mentioned local authorities, which are an important access point for people looking for benefits and advice. On council tax benefit, we need more passporting, but I think that local authorities are in a prime position to help those people who come through their doors by seeing whether they are eligible and helping them with that. The other critical issue is helping people, by going through the complexities with them, by supporting citizens' advice bureaux and giving that kind of practical advice and help. That is brilliant for those who need help—going through their forms and financial situations and helping them through that process. From my experience, that is key to making a breakthrough in terms of getting people, at least, to submit a form.

Yn aml, os bydd pobl yn cael un budd-dal a heb gael eu cyfeirio at fudd-daliadau eraill, gallent gael mwy. Mae angen inni roi'r cymorth sylfaenol hwnnw iddynt. Mae'r cyngor wedi bod yn gweithio ar hynny a rhoi cyhoeddusrwydd iddo a rhoi cyngor penodol i bobl. Gallwn roi nifer fawr o enghreifftiau ichi, a throsglwyddaf y wybodaeth honno ichi.

Karen Sinclair: Nid wyf am ailadrodd y pwyntiau y mae Nick wedi'u codi gyda chi, gan mai diwerth fyddai hynny. Tynnodd sylw at y ffaith nad oes digon o bobl yn hawlio'r budd-dal, sy'n bryder gwirioneddol. Mae nifer o bobl ar incwm isel ac ar lwfans ceisio gwaith yn dal i beidio â hawlio'r arian sydd wedi'i neilltuo ar eu cyfer yn neuadd y dref i'w helpu i dalu eu biliau treth gyngor blynyddol. Mae'n bwysig inni gydnabod nad yw'r grŵp hwn o bobl yn hawlio'r budd-dal, a chymryd camau ymarferol i annog y bobl hynny i wneud hyn. Cyfeiriech at weithgor, Sue. Pa waith ymarferol y gellid ei wneud yn awr ar lawr gwlad i gynyddu'r niferoedd sy'n cael budd-dal? Mae'n hanfodol inni annog awdurdodau lleol i fod yn rhagweithiol yn hyn o beth yn awr.

Sue Essex: Credaf fod dau fater pwysig o dan sylw. Yr oeddech yn sôn am awdurdodau lleol, sy'n bwynt mynediad pwysig i bobl sydd am gael budd-daliadau a chyngor. O ran budd-dal treth gyngor, mae angen i bobl gael eu cyfeirio at fudd-daliadau eraill yn amlach, ond credaf fod awdurdodau lleol mewn sefyllfa wych i helpu'r bobl hynny sy'n mynd atynt drwy weld a ydynt yn gymwys a'u helpu gyda hynny. Y mater allweddol arall yw rhoi cymorth i bobl, drwy esbonio unrhyw faterion cymhleth iddynt, drwy gefnogi gwaith canolfannau cyngor ar bopeth a thrwy roi'r math hwnnw o gyngor a chymorth ymarferol. Mae hynny'n wych i'r rheini y mae angen cymorth arnynt—bwrw golwg dros eu ffurflenni a'u sefyllfa ariannol a'u helpu i fynd drwy'r broses honno. O brofiad, gwn fod hynny'n allweddol i gael pobl o leiaf i gyflwyno ffurflen.

**Llywodraeth Leol yn y Gogledd
Local Government in North Wales**

Q10 Eleanor Burnham: Will the Minister **C10 Eleanor Burnham:** A wnaiff y

outline what the Welsh Assembly Government has done to facilitate achievements in the field of local government in north Wales? OAQ0274(LGP)

Gweinidog amlinellu beth y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi'i wneud i hwyluso cyflawniadau ym maes llywodraeth leol yn y Gogledd? OAQ0274(LGP)

Sue Essex: We have established a framework within all local authorities in Wales, which helps them to provide high-quality and cost-effective services. We have also helped them to identify, meet and respond to the needs and aspirations of their communities.

Sue Essex: Yr ydym wedi sefydlu fframwaith ym mhob un o awdurdodau lleol Cymru, sy'n eu helpu i ddarparu gwasanaethau cost-ffeithiol o safon dda. Yr ydym hefyd wedi eu helpu i nodi, diwallu ac ymateb i anghenion a dyheadau eu cymunedau.

Eleanor Burnham: When do you expect Sir Michael Lyons's review, and do you hope, like me, that it will possibly recommend local income tax as a much fairer system of local taxation, particularly when one considers the amount of taxes that remain unpaid in many local authorities?

Eleanor Burnham: Pryd yr ydych yn disgwyl i adolygiad Syr Michael Lyons gael ei gyhoeddi, ac a ydych yn gobeithio, fel minnau, y bydd o bosibl yn argymhell treth incwm leol fel system lawer tecach o drethiant lleol, yn enwedig o ystyried faint o drethi sydd heb eu talu mewn llawer awdurdod lleol?

Sue Essex: We expect his review at the end of the year. When Sir Michael Lyons came to the Local Government and Public Services Committee, that was his stated date. We will not go into the property-tax-versus-income-tax debate at length, but an advantage of the property tax base is that it gives a high return in taxes paid. I have quoted the figures in the past and I can do so again. So, that is one of its merits, though there are other downsides. I am sure that you could quote the downsides chapter and verse, but unpaid taxes are not necessarily one of them.

Sue Essex: Disgwyliwn i'w adolygiad ddod i law erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn. Pan ddaeth Syr Michael Lyons at y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus, dyna'r dyddiad a nodwyd ganddo. Nid awn ati i drafod yn fanwl rinweddau'r dreth ar eiddo o'i chymharu â'r dreth incwm, ond un o fanteision y dreth ar eiddo yw bod canran fawr o drethi yn cael ei chasglu. Yr wyf wedi dyfynnu'r ffigurau yn y gorffennol, a gallaf wneud hynny eto. Felly, dyna un o'r manteision, er bod anfanteision eraill. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gallech restru'r holl anfanteision, ond nid yw trethi heb eu talu yn un ohonynt o reidrwydd.

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes Questions to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning

Aildrefnu Addysg Bellach The Reconfiguration of Further Education

Q1 Peter Black: Will the Minister make a statement on the reconfiguration of further education in Wales? OAQ0274(ELL)

C1 Peter Black: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar aildrefnu addysg bellach yng Nghymru? OAQ0274(ELL)

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): There are no specific plans to reconfigure further education in Wales, but collaboration or merger between providers can yield

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Nid oes cynlluniau penodol i aildrefnu addysg bellach yng Nghymru, ond gall cydweithredu rhwng darparwyr neu uno esgor ar fanteision

important benefits for learners in the range and quality of learning. Further education institutions have a pivotal role to play in developing new learning networks.

Peter Black: As you know, around half the further education institutions in Wales are in deficit or close to it. Many are struggling to make ends meet. Do you think that, because the Assembly is funding staff pay rises and not giving any additional moneys to colleges for growth, it is effectively forcing the colleges' hands in terms of merger and collaboration? Do you not think that there are more subtle ways of forcing colleges to work together?

Jane Davidson: We have encouraged colleges to work together through a £6 million incentive fund for colleges to work with schools and other post-16 education providers. That money is additional to the further education budget. Since you were at the Fforwm conference, you will know that it was notable that, for the first time, I was not asked a question about funding this year. Although, there was a deficit of some £7.3 million across the whole sector last year, that was largely in the hands of two colleges. It is predicted that, by next year, there will be a small surplus.

John Griffiths: One aspect of widening access to further and higher education in Wales is the provision of further education for mature students. In the reconfiguration process, will you bear in mind keenly the sort of developments that would encourage more mature students in Wales to enter further and higher education?

Jane Davidson: Right at the core of this Government's agenda is that one should be encouraged into learning at any age. When we introduced our Assembly learning grants for those on the lowest incomes, they were based on anyone of any age being able to take them up. I know that they have been particularly taken up by mature students on very low incomes. It is good to see an increase in the number of mature students in our education system.

pwysig i ddysgwyr o ran yr ystod o ddysgu sydd ar gael a'i ansawdd. Mae gan sefydliadau addysg bellach ran allweddol i'w chwarae i ddatblygu rhwydweithiau dysgu newydd.

Peter Black: Fel y gwyddoch, mae diffyg ariannol gan oddeutu hanner y sefydliadau addysg bellach yng Nghymru, neu maent yn agos at hynny. Mae nifer yn cael anhawster i gael dau ben llinyn ynghyd. A gredwch, gan mai'r Cynulliad sy'n ariannu codiadau cyflog staff ac nad yw'n rhoi unrhyw arian ychwanegol i golegau ar gyfer twf, ei fod yn gorfodi colegau i bob diben i uno a chydweithredu? Oni chredwch fod ffyrdd mwy cynnil o orfodi colegau i gydweithio?

Jane Davidson: Yr ydym wedi annog colegau i gydweithio drwy gronfa gwerth £6 miliwn i gymell colegau i weithio gydag ysgolion a chyrff eraill sy'n darparu addysg ar ôl 16. Mae'r arian hwnnw yn ychwanegol at gyllideb addysg bellach. Yr oeddech yn bresennol yng nghynhadledd Fforwm, ac felly fe wyddoch ei bod yn werth nodi, am y tro cyntaf, nad oedd neb wedi gofyn cwestiwn imi ynglŷn ag ariannu eleni. Er bod diffyg o tua £7.3 miliwn ar draws y sector cyfan y llynedd, dau goleg a oedd yn gyfrifol am hynny i raddau helaeth. Rhagwelir, erbyn y flwyddyn nesaf, y bydd gwarged bach.

John Griffiths: Un agwedd ar ehangu mynediad i addysg bellach ac uwch yng Nghymru yw darpariaeth addysg bellach i fyfyrwyr aeddfed. Yn ystod y broses aildrefnu, a wnewch chi gadw mewn cof yn arbennig y math o ddatblygiadau a fyddai'n annog mwy o fyfyrwyr aeddfed yng Nghymru i ddilyn cyrsiau addysg bellach ac uwch?

Jane Davidson: Wrth wraidd agenda'r Llywodraeth hon y mae'r egwyddor y dylai pawb gael ei annog i ddysgu, waeth beth fo'i oedran. Pan gyflwynwyd grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad gennym ar gyfer pobl ar yr incwm isaf, yr oeddent yn seiliedig ar fod ar gael i unrhyw un, waeth beth fo'i oedran. Gwn fod myfyrwyr aeddfed ar incwm isel iawn yn enwedig wedi bod yn gwneud cais am y grant. Mae'n braf gweld cynnydd yn nifer y myfyrwyr aeddfed yn ein cyfundrefn addysg.

Janet Ryder: We want to encourage more people from different backgrounds into further and higher education, but we know that financial barriers will put them off. In your report to the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee this morning, you highlighted the worker learning project. When the financial barriers were lifted, the interest in, and demand for, that course increased phenomenally among those from non-traditional backgrounds. Do you not think that the same would happen in higher education if we were not to impose top-up fees?

2.40 p.m.

Jane Davidson: I think that there is always a balance to be struck between the contribution of Government and that of those who receive the education. What was notable in the contribution from Professor Teresa Rees and her team in committee this morning was that they had started from a position where many of them did not want to see fees introduced in the system in Wales. However, given that there would be no up-front fees, there would be increased student maintenance, no student would pay a fee during their higher education experience, and as only graduates earning over a minimum threshold would pay in the future—with the balance of funding, therefore, transferred to working people—they reached the view that it was better not to divert too much money away from the Assembly Government that could be better used, for example, on early years provision. I agree absolutely about removing financial barriers, and particularly while students are in learning. I hope that you will bear that in mind in looking at the right kind of maintenance support for further and higher education students while they are in learning, not after they are earning.

William Graham: Minister, with regard to the funding of further education in Wales, how would you describe a college like Yale College, Wrexham in north Wales, which has had two years of voluntary redundancies, and which now has compulsory redundancies, because you are not adequately funding

Janet Ryder: Yr ydym am annog mwy o bobl o wahanol gefndiroedd i ddilyn cyrsiau addysg bellach ac uwch, ond gwyddom y bydd rhwystrau ariannol yn gwneud iddynt benderfynu peidio â gwneud hynny. Yn eich adroddiad i'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes y bore yma, yr oeddech yn tynnu sylw at y prosiect gweithwyr sy'n dysgu. Pan ddilewyd y rhwystrau ariannol, bu cynnydd aruthrol yn y galw am y cwrs hwnnw ac yn nifer y bobl a oedd â diddordeb ynddo ymhlith pobl o gefndiroedd nad ydynt yn rhai traddodiadol. Oni chredwch y byddai'r un peth yn digwydd mewn addysg uwch pe na baem yn gosod ffioedd atodol?

Jane Davidson: Credaf fod angen sicrhau cydbwysedd bob amser rhwng cyfraniad y Llywodraeth a chyfraniad y rheini sy'n cael yr addysg. Yr hyn a oedd yn hynod yng nghyfraniad yr Athro Teresa Rees a'i thîm yn y pwyllgor y bore yma oedd eu bod wedi dechrau o sefyllfa lle yr oedd nifer ohonynt yn gwrthwynebu cyflwyno ffioedd yn y gyfundrefn yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, o gofio na fyddai ffioedd cyn cychwyn, y byddai grant cynnal uwch i fyfyrwyr, na fyddai unrhyw fyfyrwr yn talu ffi yn ystod ei brofiad addysg uwch, ac mai graddedigion sy'n ennill dros drothwy gofynnol yn unig fyddai'n talu yn y dyfodol—a gweddill yr arian, felly, yn cael ei drosglwyddo i bobl sy'n gweithio—daethant i'r casgliad y byddai'n well peidio â dargyfeirio gormod o arian oddi wrth Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, oherydd gellid ei ddefnyddio'n well, er enghraifft, ar ddarpariaeth y blynyddoedd cynnar. Cynutaf yn llwyr ynglŷn â dileu rhwystrau ariannol, yn enwedig tra bydd myfyrwyr yn dysgu. Gobeithio y byddwch yn cadw hynny mewn cof wrth ystyried y math cywir o grant cynnal i fyfyrwyr addysg bellach ac uwch tra byddant yn dysgu, nid ar ôl iddynt ddechrau ennill.

William Graham: Weinidog, o ran ariannu addysg bellach yng Nghymru, sut y byddech yn disgrifio coleg fel Coleg Iâl, Wrecsam, yn y Gogledd, sydd wedi cyflwyno diswyddiadau gwirfoddol am ddwy flynedd, ac sydd bellach yn cyflwyno diswyddiadau gorfodol, oherwydd nad ydych yn ariannu

colleges?

Jane Davidson: As I said to Peter Black, it is projected that, by next year, there will be a surplus in several colleges in Wales. Colleges have to respond to changing needs in terms of courses. We have argued long and hard in the Assembly that learning providers must offer courses that increase people's skills levels, that are appropriate for those skills needs, and which contribute particularly to employment at a local level. Colleges continually need to keep these issues under review. Colleges are autonomous bodies that have had substantial funding; the recurrent funding methodology has increased by 6 per cent this year to ensure that colleges maintain the right levels of commitment and take the right action at the local level.

colegau'n ddigonol?

Jane Davidson: Fel y dywedais wrth Peter Black, erbyn y flwyddyn nesaf, rhagwelir y bydd gwarged gan nifer o golegau yng Nghymru. Rhaid i golegau ymateb i anghenion sy'n newid o ran cyrsiau. Yr ydym wedi dadlau'n faith yn y Cynulliad ei bod yn rhaid i ddarparwyr dysgu gynnig cyrsiau sy'n gwella sgiliau pobl, sy'n briodol ar gyfer yr anghenion sgiliau hynny ac sy'n cyfrannu'n arbennig at gyflogaeth yn lleol. Mae angen i golegau fod yn adolygu'r materion hyn yn barhaus. Mae colegau'n gyrrff annibynnol sydd wedi cael cryn dipyn o gyllid; mae'r fethodoleg ariannu reolaidd wedi cynyddu 6 y cant eleni er mwyn sicrhau bod ymrwymiad colegau yn parhau ar y lefel iawn a'u bod yn cymryd y camau cywir yn lleol.

Cynorthwyr Dysgu Amser Llawn Full-time Learning Assistants

Q2 Jenny Randerson: Will the Minister make a statement on the budget for full-time learning assistants in Wales? OAQ0287(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Generally, headteachers and governors make decisions about the appropriate staffing levels for their schools, including the number and roles of support staff, within their overall school budget. Additionally, local education authorities may provide funding for learning support assistants to work with individual pupils who have a specific identified need for such support.

Jenny Randerson: Learning or teaching assistants are being widely used as substitutes for teachers released from the classroom as part of the teachers' workload agreement, because schools cannot afford to employ fully qualified teachers on the woefully inadequate funding that you have made available. In many schools, budgets are so tight that they are employing part-time learning assistants, who are not being given in-service training days or other training to improve their skills. What guidance have you given to local authorities and to headteachers on the employment of teaching assistants in these circumstances?

C2 Jenny Randerson: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y gyllideb ar gyfer cynorthwyr dysgu amser llawn yng Nghymru? OAQ0287(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Yn gyffredinol, penaethiaid a llywodraethwyr sy'n gwneud penderfyniadau ynglŷn â'r lefelau staffio priodol ar gyfer eu hysgolion, gan gynnwys nifer y staff cymorth a'u rôl, o fewn cyllideb gyffredinol yr ysgol. Yn ogystal, gall awdurdodau addysg lleol ddarparu cyllid ar gyfer cynorthwyr cymorth dysgu i weithio gyda disgyblion unigol sydd ag angen cymorth penodol o'r fath wedi ei nodi.

Jenny Randerson: Caiff cynorthwyr dysgu neu addysgu eu defnyddio'n helaeth yn lle athrawon sy'n cael eu rhyddhau o'r ystafell ddosbarth fel rhan o'r cytundeb ar lwyth gwaith athrawon, am na all ysgolion fforddio cyflogi athrawon cymwysedig ar y cyllid hynod annigonol a ddarperir gennych. Mewn nifer o ysgolion, mae'r gyllideb mor dynn nes eu bod yn gorfod cyflogi cynorthwyr dysgu rhan-amser, nad ydynt yn cael diwrnodau hyfforddiant mewn swydd na hyfforddiant arall i wella eu sgiliau. Pa ganllawiau yr ydych wedi'u rhoi i awdurdodau lleol ac i benaethiaid ar gyflogi cynorthwyr dysgu o dan yr amgylchiadau

hyn?

Jane Davidson: We agreed in the Assembly—and you were there—specified work regulations, which clarify absolutely the respective roles of teachers and support staff in schools. This agreement, which was signed in January 2003, is now a part of pay and conditions. Schools and local authorities are under an obligation to deliver. We have provided additional funding that, by next year, will total £161 million, when you take the £33 million that we put in place last year, the £58 million that we put in place this year, and the £70 million that we will put in place next year, to ensure that the funding for this agreement is comparative with that provided in England.

Glyn Davies: What research are you carrying out to establish whether full-time classroom assistants are being used as substitute teachers? If you found that that was happening, on any scale, what action would you take to stop it?

Jane Davidson: The agreement is clear: teachers and support staff are not interchangeable. If you look at the specified work regulations, you will see that there are specified circumstances under which other adults, supported by, and with the agreement of, the headteacher, can undertake specific functions in schools. What we have seen, which is really exciting to see, is a whole range of new sorts of activities, such as sporting and arts activities, being provided in schools, where people have been brought in from outside the school to enrich children's experiences. We would all want to see that.

Jane Davidson: Cytunwyd yn y Cynulliad—ac yr oeddech yno—ar reoliadau gwaith penodedig, sy'n egluro'n llawn beth yw priod rolau athrawon a staff cymorth mewn ysgolion. Mae'r cytundeb hwn, a lofnodwyd ym mis Ionawr 2003, bellach yn rhan o gyflog ac amodau athrawon. Mae'n ddyletswydd ar ysgolion ac awdurdodau lleol i'w roi ar waith. Yr ydym wedi darparu cyllid ychwanegol, sef cyfanswm o £161 miliwn erbyn y flwyddyn nesaf, os ychwanegwch y £33 miliwn a ddarparwyd gennym y llynedd, y £58 miliwn a ddarparwyd gennym eleni, a'r £70 miliwn y byddwn yn ei ddarparu y flwyddyn nesaf, i sicrhau bod y cyllid ar gyfer y cytundeb hwn yn debyg i'r hyn a ddarperir yn Lloegr.

Glyn Davies: Pa waith ymchwil yr ydych yn ei wneud i sefydlu a yw cynorthwywyr ystafell ddosbarth amser llawn yn cael eu defnyddio yn lle athrawon? Pe baech yn darganfod bod hynny'n digwydd, ar unrhyw raddfa, pa gamau y byddech yn eu cymryd i'w atal?

Jane Davidson: Mae'r cytundeb yn glir: nid oes modd cyfnewid athrawon a staff cymorth. Os edrychwch ar y rheoliadau gwaith penodedig, fe welwch y gall oedolion eraill, o dan amgylchiadau penodedig, gyda chefnogaeth a chytundeb y pennaeth, ymgymryd â swyddogaethau penodol mewn ysgolion. Yr hyn a welsom, ac sy'n gyffrous iawn i'w weld, yw pob math o weithgareddau newydd, megis chwaraeon a gweithgareddau celfyddydol, yn cael eu darparu mewn ysgolion, lle mae pobl o'r tu allan i'r ysgol wedi dod i mewn i gyfoethogi profiadau plant. Byddem oll am weld hynny.

Cyllideb Addysg Anghenion Arbennig Budget for Special Needs Education

Q3 Ieuan Wyn Jones: Will the Minister make a statement on the budget for special needs education? OAQ0323(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Funding is provided to local authorities through the revenue support grant. Its distribution is based on a range of factors that are currently under review by the distribution sub-group, which is responsible

C3 Ieuan Wyn Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar gyllideb addysg anghenion arbennig? OAQ0323(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Darperir arian i awdurdodau lleol drwy gyfrwng y grant cynnal refeniw. Mae ei ddsbarthiad yn seiliedig ar amryw o ffactorau sydd, ar hyn o bryd, yn cael eu hadolygu gan yr is-grŵp

to the Finance Minister. Support is also allocated through the better schools fund, and directly for specific initiatives that improve service delivery.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I am sure that the Minister will be aware of the excellent reputation of Ysgol y Bont, which provides special needs education for children in my constituency of Ynys Môn. The parents of the children, of both primary and secondary age, at the school, are worried that, as a result of Welsh Assembly Government policy, the local authority feels that it cannot build a replacement school for Ysgol y Bont when the existing school is demolished to make way for a supermarket. I urge the Minister to enter into discussions with the local authority to ensure that the provision currently supplied at Ysgol y Bont is available to children when a new school is established.

Jane Davidson: It is not Welsh Assembly Government policy that schools should be demolished to make way for supermarkets. I have been to Ysgol y Bont and, along with many other special schools in Wales, it offers a very high quality of education. I am not aware of any statutory proposals on the table at the moment in terms of Ysgol y Bont. This is a matter for you to take up with the local authority, which has the responsibility, at the local level, for ensuring the best kind of education.

I would expect the local authority to make sure that any alternative provision that is put in place is equivalent to or of better standard than the current provision. Our policy is about improved education, and I am happy to endorse that again today.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: In fairness, I did not suggest that it was Government policy to demolish a school. I think that you can give me a little more credit than that. I simply put to you that, following the demolition of the school, which is happening because the site is to be used for another purpose, the parents and the local authority expected that a new school would be built to replace it. They now understand that, because there is a policy of

dosbarthu, ac mae hwnnw'n atebol i'r Gweinidog Cyllid. Caiff cymorth ei ddyrannu hefyd drwy gyfrwng y gronfa ysgolion gwell, ac yn uniongyrchol ar gyfer mentrau penodol sy'n gwella darparu gwasanaethau.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o'r enw da iawn sydd gan Ysgol y Bont, sy'n darparu addysg anghenion arbennig ar gyfer plant yn fy etholaeth i yn Ynys Môn. Mae rhieni plant yr ysgol, o oedran cynradd ac uwchradd, yn bryderus fod yr awdurdod lleol, o ganlyniad i bolisi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, yn teimlo na all adeiladu ysgol newydd yn lle Ysgol y Bont pan gaiff yr ysgol bresennol ei dymchwel i wneud lle ar gyfer archfarchnad. Pwysaf ar y Gweinidog i drafod gyda'r awdurdod lleol i sicrhau bod y ddarpariaeth a gynigir ar hyn o bryd yn Ysgol y Bont ar gael i blant pan sefydlir ysgol newydd.

Jane Davidson: Nid polisi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yw i ysgolion gael eu dymchwel i wneud lle ar gyfer archfarchnadoedd. Yr wyf wedi ymweld ag Ysgol y Bont, ac fel nifer o ysgolion arbennig eraill yng Nghymru mae'n cynnig addysg o safon uchel iawn. Nid wyf yn ymwybodol bod unrhyw gynigion statudol gerbron ar hyn o bryd o ran Ysgol y Bont. Mae hwn yn fater ichi ei drafod gyda'r awdurdod lleol, gan mai hwnnw sy'n gyfrifol, yn lleol, am sicrhau'r math gorau o addysg.

Byddwn yn disgwyl i'r awdurdod lleol sicrhau bod unrhyw ddarpariaeth amgen a gaiff ei chynnig o'r un safon â'r ddarpariaeth bresennol, neu'n well na hynny. Mae a wnelo ein polisi ni â gwell addysg, ac yr wyf yn falch o gadarnhau hynny eto heddiw.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: A bod yn deg, nid awgrymu yr oeddwn mai polisi'r Llywodraeth yw dymchwel ysgol. Credaf y gallwch ddisgwyl mwy ohonof na hynny. Dweud yr ydwyf fod y rhieni a'r awdurdod lleol wedi disgwyl i ysgol newydd gael ei hadeiladu yn lle'r un a gaiff ei dymchwel, sy'n digwydd oherwydd bwriedir defnyddio'r safle at ddiben arall. Am fod polisi'n bodoli o brif-ffrydio plant o oedran

mainstreaming children of primary age, in particular, into primary schools, the new school will not provide for children of both primary and secondary age. There may be good reasons for that, but it means that, potentially, the new school will not be viable, given the number of pupils needed to sustain it. That is as a result of your policy—that is what the local authority says. If you are denying that, and do so on record today, I can take up the matter with the local authority. Are you prepared to talk to the local authority so that the parents can be satisfied that when the new provision is in place, their children will be educated to the same standard as previously, and which they expect in the future?

Jane Davidson: It has always been the policy of this Assembly Government that where children need the support of special needs education in a special school, they should have it. Where children can be better educated in mainstream provision, to give them a wider range of entitlements to a full range of services, they should have that. It is about an educational decision in relation to the individual child. That is, and remains, our policy, and it would not necessarily lead to the outcome that you describe. That is why I say that, in fact, the discussion is between you and your local authority. Local authorities are responsible for the provision at the local level. If the authority put a statutory proposal forward and there were objections to it, we would want to be sure that any alternative provision proposed by the local authority was at least as good as, if not better, than the previous provision.

Those who have been involved in this debate before will know that we have always specifically looked at the issues in relation to children with special educational needs in this context, to ensure that their needs are adequately met.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I would like to have a matter clarified. I have been given the impression that there have been discussions between your department and the local education authority about the provision. Is

cynradd, yn arbennig, mewn ysgolion cynradd, maent yn deall bellach na fydd yr ysgol newydd yn darparu ar gyfer plant oedran cynradd ac uwchradd. Efallai fod rhesymau da dros hynny, ond mae'n golygu bod posibilrwydd na fydd yr ysgol newydd yn ymarferol, o ystyried nifer y disgyblion y bydd eu hangen i'w chynnal. Canlyniad eich polisi chi yw hynny—dyna a ddywed yr awdurdod lleol. Os ydych yn gwadu hynny, ac yn gwneud hynny ar goedd heddiw, gallaf drafod y mater gyda'r awdurdod lleol. A ydych yn fodlon trafod gyda'r awdurdod lleol, fel y gall y rhieni fod yn fodlon, pan fydd y ddarpariaeth newydd ar waith, y caiff eu plant eu haddysgu i'r un safon ag yn y gorffennol, ac a ddisgwylir ganddynt yn y dyfodol?

Jane Davidson: Mae'n bolisi gan y Llywodraeth Cynulliad hon erioed y dylai plant y mae angen cymorth addysg anghenion arbennig arnynt mewn ysgol arbennig, ei chael. Pan all plant gael gwell addysg mewn darpariaeth prif-ffrwd, er mwyn rhoi ystod ehangach o hawliau iddynt i ystod lawn o wasanaethau, dylent gael hynny. Mae a wnelo hyn â phenderfyniad addysgol ar gyfer y plentyn unigol. Dyna oedd ein polisi, a dyna yw ein polisi, ac ni fyddai o reidrwydd yn arwain i'r canlyniad a ddisgrifiwch. Dyna pam y dywedaf, mewn gwirionedd, mai trafodaeth rhyngoch chi a'r awdurdod lleol ydyw. Mae awdurdodau lleol yn gyfrifol am y ddarpariaeth yn lleol. Pe bai'r awdurdod yn cyflwyno cynnig statudol, a phe byddai gwrthwynebiadau iddo, byddem am sicrhau bod unrhyw ddarpariaeth amgen a gynigid gan yr awdurdod lleol o leiaf cystal â'r ddarpariaeth flaenorol, os nad yn well.

Bydd y rheini a fu'n rhan o'r ddadl hon o'r blaen yn gwybod ein bod bob amser wedi ystyried yn benodol y materion sy'n ymwneud â phlant ag anghenion addysgol arbennig yn y cyd-destun hwn, er mwyn sicrhau y caiff eu hanghenion eu diwallu'n ddigonol.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Hoffwn gael eglurhad ar un mater. Yr oeddwn o dan yr argraff fod trafodaethau wedi eu cynnal rhwng eich adran chi a'r awdurdod addysg lleol ynglŷn â'r ddarpariaeth. A yw hynny'n wir?

that the case?

Jane Davidson: I could not tell you whether that was the case or not. I can tell you that I have not had any discussions, and it would be improper for me to do so; I never discuss with either proposers or objectors any school that might come to me for statutory determination.

Jane Davidson: Ni allaf ddweud wrthych a yw hynny'n wir neu beidio. Gallaf ddweud wrthych na chefais i unrhyw drafodaethau, ac y byddai'n amhriodol imi wneud hynny; ni fyddaf byth yn trafod gyda chynigwyr na gwrthwynebwyr unrhyw ysgol a allai ddod ataf am benderfyniad statudol.

2.50 p.m.

Y Gyllideb Addysg The Education Budget

C4 Alun Ffred Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ei blaenoriaethau yn y gyllideb addysg? OAQ0316(ELL)

Q4 Alun Ffred Jones: Will the Minister make a statement on her priorities within the education budget? OAQ0316(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Fel y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'i nodi'n ddiweddar, y prif flaenoriaeth yw moderneiddio stoc ysgolion Cymru. Mae £627 miliwn wedi'i fuddsoddi yn y gwaith hwn, a'r rhain sydd wedi eu cytuno yn 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu' 2001 ac 'Iaith Pawb' 2003.

Jane Davidson: As the First Minister has stated recently, the main priority is to modernise the school stock in Wales. A total of £627 million has been invested in this work, and this is what has been agreed in 'The Learning Country' 2001 and 'Iaith Pawb' 2003.

Alun Ffred Jones: Dywed yr Athro Teresa Rees yn ei hadroddiad fod gwahaniaeth o £100 miliwn rhwng y cyllid y mae'r prifysgolion yng Nghymru yn ei dderbyn o'i gymharu â'r hyn y mae prifysgolion yn Lloegr yn ei dderbyn. A ellwch esbonio sut y digwyddodd hyn?

Alun Ffred Jones: Professor Teresa Rees states in her report that there is a difference of £100 million between the funding which Welsh universities receive compared to that which universities in England receive. Can you explain how this has happened?

Jane Davidson: Ar hyn o bryd nid yw swyddogion Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ystyried cywirdeb y ffigurau yn adroddiad yr Athro Rees. Yr hyn sydd yn glir yw y bydd yn rhaid inni roi mwy o arian i'r sector er mwyn iddo lwyddo, ac fel y bydd yn gallu darparu cyrsiau llwyddiannus, yn gallu annog mwy o bobl i weithio yn y sector, ac yn gallu rhoi'r cyfle i fwy o bobl bod yn fyfyrwr mynediad, ac i helpu pobl o gefndiroedd tlawd i fynd i brifysgol, ac yn y blaen. Yr wyf yn cytuno â'r holl bethau hyn, a gobeithiaf y bydd pawb yn eu hystyried yn y ddadl.

Jane Davidson: Assembly Government officials are not currently looking at the accuracy of the figures in Professor Rees's report. What is clear is that we will have to give the sector more money for it to succeed, so that it can provide successful courses, can encourage more people to work within the sector, and can give more people the opportunity to become access students, and to help those from poorer backgrounds to go to university, and so on. I agree with all these things, and I hope everyone will consider them during the debate.

Leighton Andrews: Would you agree that Labour won the election in 2003 on a manifesto commitment not to introduce top-up fees before 2007? Would you also therefore agree that the priority for many of us would not be to subsidise students from

Leighton Andrews: A fydddech yn cytuno bod Llafur wedi ennill yr etholiad yn 2003 ar ymrwymiad maniffesto na fyddent yn cyflwyno ffioedd atodol cyn 2007? A fydddech hefyd yn cytuno, felly, mai'r flaenoriaeth i nifer ohonom fyddai peidio â

England from the Welsh block grant after that?

Jane Davidson: The key issue from the Rees report—had people waited until it was published—is that it does present an opportunity for the Assembly to do something different in terms of the students studying in Welsh higher education. This Government would strongly support doing something different on an evidence base. We need to act on an evidence base in order to ensure that there is sufficient funding in the sector for all of the things that I have just described. We want a successful sector. Those of you who were not in the committee this morning would not have heard Teresa Rees say that if we do not put additional funding into the sector, and only put it into the pockets of graduates when they are earning, then our sector will die. We must ensure that that does not happen, and that we support the sector to deliver successfully for Wales.

Nick Bourne: I will not come in on that specific issue, for obvious reasons. I wish to ask about the issue of primary schools closures, on which the Minister and I have corresponded a great deal in the past. It is not so much a question about the closure of schools, which I accept must sometimes take place, as much as about the notice period. I think that the Minister may have some sympathy with this. The statutory provision is for at least a month's notice, but, in practice, as the Minister has indicated in correspondence, it is generally around nine months. That does, however, blight schools, because parents will not send their children to those schools as they are unlikely to complete the whole school period there if there is a possibility of closure. Will the Minister therefore look within the budget to see if there is some way of lengthening that period so that a cohort can pass through the school, or at least so that the period is longer than at the moment? This does, inevitably, lead to schools being blighted at the moment, and to them sometimes closing unnecessarily.

darparu cynhaliaeth i fyfyrwyr o Loegr o grant bloc Cymru wedi hynny?

Jane Davidson: Y mater allweddol sy'n deillio o adroddiad Rees—pe bai pobl wedi aros nes iddo gael ei gyhoeddi—yw ei fod yn cynnig cyfle i'r Cynulliad wneud rhywbeth gwahanol o ran myfyrwyr sy'n astudio ym maes addysg uwch yng Nghymru. Byddai'r Llywodraeth hon yn gadarn o blaid gwneud rhywbeth gwahanol ar sail tystiolaeth. Rhaid inni weithredu ar sail tystiolaeth er mwyn sicrhau bod cyllid digonol yn y sector ar gyfer yr holl bethau yr wyf newydd eu disgrifio. Mae arnom eisiau sector llwyddiannus. Ni fydd y rheini ohonoch nad oeddech yn y pwyllgor y bore yma wedi clywed Teresa Rees yn dweud, os na roddwn gyllid ychwanegol i'r sector, a'i roi ym mhocedi graddedigion dim ond pan fyddant yn ennill cyflog, yna bydd ein sector yn peidio â bod. Rhaid inni sicrhau na fydd hynny'n digwydd, a'n bod yn cynorthwyo'r sector i ddarparu'n llwyddiannus ar gyfer Cymru.

Nick Bourne: Nid wyf am drafod y mater penodol hwnnw, am resymau amlwg. Dymunaf holi ynghylch cau ysgolion cynradd, sef mater y mae'r Gweinidog a minnau wedi gohebu llawer yn ei gylch yn y gorffennol. Nid cwestiwn am gau ysgolion yn gymaint ydyw, a derbynaf fod hynny'n rhywbeth sy'n gorfod digwydd weithiau, ond cwestiwn am y cyfnod rhybudd. Credaf efallai y bydd gan y Gweinidog ychydig o gydymdeimlad â hyn. Mae'r ddarpariaeth statudol yn galw am o leiaf fis o rybudd, ond yn ymarferol, fel y dangosodd y Gweinidog mewn gohebiaeth, rhoddir naw mis o rybudd fel rheol. Mae hyn, fodd bynnag, yn cael effaith andwyol ar ysgolion, gan na fydd rhieni yn anfon eu plant i'r ysgolion hynny am eu bod yn annhebygol o gwblhau'r cyfnod llawn yn yr ysgol os oes posibilrwydd y bydd yn cau. A wnaiff y Gweinidog, felly edrych yn y gyllideb i weld a yw'n bosibl ymestyn y cyfnod hwnnw, fel y gall carfan o blant gwblhau eu haddysg yn yr ysgol, neu o leiaf bod y cyfnod yn hwy nag ydyw ar hyn o bryd? Mae hyn, yn anochel, yn cael effaith andwyol ar ysgolion ar hyn o bryd, gan olygu eu bod weithiau'n cael eu cau'n ddiangen.

Jane Davidson: I do not think that any school closure that has been agreed by this Assembly Government—and there have not been many—has been unnecessary from the local authority's perspective. There is a very strong set of tests, as you know, because we have corresponded on the issue. We are all interested in ensuring the best possible education for every child in Wales. We know that not only are some of our school buildings not fit for purpose, but the cost involved in making them fit for purpose, or their location, makes it inappropriate to do the work.

It is then quite right and proper for the local authority to look elsewhere. I have had several representations on the counter argument, which is that, rather than blight a school by indicating that a local authority may wish to make a decision and it then not taking it forward, it is far more effective if the local authority makes a decision in the context of a strategic plan, and people know about the strategic plan. The authority should then proceed quickly to decide whether or not it is going to make any proposals in terms of any individual school, and then carry out the statutory functions so that it does not blight the school, and so that we do not see headteachers and other staff and pupils leaving. That is not fair on children and their education.

Nick Bourne: On the figures, there have been 17 closures, I think, in the last year for which figures are available, so the number is not perhaps as small as the Minister wishes to indicate. However, in terms of the blight issue, the Minister misses the point slightly. It is not about whether a case can be made in relation to a specific school. If parents see a school with a fairly small roll, and they fear that if their children start at that school they will only have one or perhaps two years there, they will send them to a larger school in the next village or community. That is my point. Would the Minister not agree, and I can give examples, that there are cases where schools are closing because of this fear of closure rather than, objectively, because that school should close for reasons based on education? One way of dealing with that would be to have a longer period before

Jane Davidson: Ni chredaf fod unrhyw ysgol a gafodd ei chau gyda chytundeb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad hon—ac ni fu llawer—wedi ei chau'n ddiangen o safbwynt yr awdurdod lleol. Mae yna gyfres gref o brofion, fel y gwyddoch, gan ein bod wedi gohebu ar y mater. Mae gennym oll ddiddordeb mewn sicrhau'r addysg orau posibl i bob plentyn yng Nghymru. Gwyddom nad ein hadeiladau ysgol yn unig sy'n anaddas i'r pwrpas, ond bod y gost o'u gwneud yn addas i'r pwrpas, neu eu lleoliad, yn ei gwneud yn amhriodol gwneud y gwaith.

Felly, mae'n hollol gywir ac yn briodol i'r awdurdod lleol chwilio am rywle arall. Cefais nifer o sylwadau ar yr wrth-ddadl, sef yn hytrach nag effeithio'n andwyol ar ysgol drwy nodi efallai y bydd awdurdod lleol am wneud penderfyniad a'i fod wedyn yn penderfynu peidio â'i ddatblygu, ei bod lawer yn fwy effeithiol os yw'r awdurdod lleol yn gwneud penderfyniad yng nghydestun cynllun strategol a phobl yn gwybod am y cynllun strategol. Yna, dylai'r awdurdod symud yn gyflym i benderfynu a ddylai wneud unrhyw gynigion mewn cysylltiad ag unrhyw ysgol unigol, a chyflawni'r swyddogaethau statudol wedyn fel nad yw hynny'n cael effaith andwyol ar yr ysgol, ac fel na welwn benaethiaid a staff eraill a disgyblion yn gadael. Nid yw hyn yn deg â'r plant na'u haddysg.

Nick Bourne: O ran y ffigurau, credaf i 17 o ysgolion gael eu cau yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf pan oedd ffigurau ar gael ar ei chyfer. Felly, efallai nad yw'r nifer mor fach ag y dymuna'r Gweinidog ei nodi. Fodd bynnag, mewn cysylltiad â'r effaith andwyol, mae'r Gweinidog yn camddeall ychydig. Nid oes a wnelo hyn â'r cwestiwn a ellir dadlau dros gadw ysgol benodol. Os bydd rhieni yn gweld ysgol sydd â chofrestr gymharol fach ac yn ofni, os bydd eu plant yn dechrau yn yr ysgol honno, mai blwyddyn neu ddwy yn unig a gânt yno, byddant yn eu hanfon i ysgol fwy yn y pentref neu'r gymuned nesaf. Dyna fy nadl i. Onid yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno, a gallaf nodi enghreifftiau, fod yna achosion lle mae ysgolion yn cau oherwydd y pryder hwn y byddant yn cau, yn hytrach nag oherwydd y dylai'r ysgol honno, yn wrthrychol, gau am

allowing the school closure to go forward.

Jane Davidson: It is important to say that, in terms of the closures that have taken place, a number have taken place with the support of local authorities and parents, because they know that the alternative provision is better for their children, and only some closures have come to the Assembly. On your point about timetables, this is already in the hands of local authorities. In a sense, I only get involved in a quasi-judicial role, following the statutory consultation on closure proposals, and then there is a strictly laid out timetable. However, it is perfectly possible for local authorities to engage with local schools in a strategic plan that takes place over a number of years, and several authorities are doing that at present.

Nick Bourne: I am well aware of that, Minister. However, the point is that there is no statutory requirement that they should do that. You say that parents support closure on occasion, and I know that. However, this does not take account of those parents who have perhaps sent their children to another school because they fear the closure of the school in their own community. Therefore, I repeat the point—with a longer period before a closure can take place, we are likely to find that schools are only closing for objectively justifiable reasons that are based on education, rather on the fact that parents, fearing a closure, will send their children to another school. That is the point that I am getting at—I do not think that you have grasped that point, or you are ignoring it.

Jane Davidson: I have fully grasped the point, have not ignored it, and have answered it—you clearly did not grasp the answer. The answer is in the relationship with local authorities. It is important to note that, if you look at demographics, which I mentioned in answers that I gave William Graham a few months ago, you will see that a huge reduction in the number of primary school children in Wales is predicted over the next few years. It is a huge reduction—some

resymau sy'n seiliedig ar addysg? Un ffordd o ymdrin â hynny fyddai cael cyfnod hwy cyn caniatáu i'r ysgol gau.

Jane Davidson: Mae'n bwysig dweud, o ran yr ysgolion sydd wedi cau, bod rhai wedi cau gyda chefnogaeth awdurdodau lleol a rhieni, am eu bod yn gwybod bod y ddarpariaeth amgen yn well ar gyfer eu plant, a dim ond rhai achosion o gau ysgolion sydd wedi dod gerbron y Cynulliad. O ran eich pwynt am amserlenni, mae hyn eisoes yn nwylo awdurdodau lleol. Ar un ystyr, dim ond mewn rôl led-farnwrol y byddaf yn gysylltiedig â hyn, yn dilyn yr ymgynghori statudol am gynigion cau ysgol, ac yna mae amserlen gaeth wedi ei gosod. Fodd bynnag, mae'n hollol bosibl i awdurdodau lleol ymgysylltu ag ysgolion lleol mewn cynllun strategol sy'n digwydd dros nifer o flynyddoedd, ac mae nifer o awdurdodau'n gwneud hynny ar hyn o bryd.

Nick Bourne: Yr wyf yn hollol ymwybodol o hynny, Weinidog. Fodd bynnag, y pwynt yw nad oes unrhyw ofyniad statudol iddynt wneud hynny. Dywedwch fod rhieni weithiau o blaid cau ysgol, a gwn am hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hyn yn cymryd i ystyriaeth y rhieni hynny sydd efallai wedi anfon eu plant i ysgol arall am eu bod yn ofni y bydd yr ysgol yn eu cymuned eu hunain yn cau. Felly, yr wyf yn ailadrodd y pwynt—gyda chyfnod hwy cyn y gellir cau ysgol, yr ydym yn debygol o weld mai dim ond am resymau y gellir eu cyfiawnhau'n wrthrychol ar sail addysg y bydd ysgolion yn cau, yn hytrach na'r ffaith y bydd rhieni, sy'n ofni y bydd ysgol yn cau, yn anfon eu plant i ysgol arall. Dyna'r pwynt yr wyf yn ceisio'i wneud—ni chredaf ichi ddeall y pwynt hwnnw, neu yr ydych yn ei anwybyddu.

Jane Davidson: Yr wyf wedi deall y pwynt yn llawn: nid wyf wedi ei anwybyddu, ac yr wyf wedi ei ateb—mae'n amlwg nad ydych chi wedi deall yr ateb. Mae'r ateb yn y gydberthynas ag awdurdodau lleol. Mae'n bwysig sylwi, os edrychwch ar ddemograffeg, fel y cyfeiriais mewn atebion a roddais i William Graham ychydig fisoedd yn ôl, y byddwch yn gweld bod gostyngiad anferth yn nifer y plant ysgol gynradd yng Nghymru i'w ragweld dros yr ychydig

50,000 fewer primary school places than there are now. We know that we have a similar number of spare places in our schools now, so we are talking about 100,000 spare places in Wales. When you are talking about that, you are also looking at how you can deliver the national curriculum and how you can ensure that children get a good quality education. I would not be prepared to build anything into the process that restricted children's opportunities for a high-quality education. However, at the local level, many authorities are going through a strategic process whereby they have a timeline, which builds in exactly the kind of issues that you describe.

flynyddoedd nesaf. Mae'n ostyngiad anferth—tua 50,000 o leoedd ysgolion cynradd yn llai nag sydd ar hyn o bryd. Gwyddom fod gennym nifer tebyg o leoedd dros ben yn ein hysgolion ar hyn o bryd. Felly, mae hyn yn golygu tua 100,000 o leoedd dros ben yng Nghymru. Wrth sôn am hynny, yr ydych hefyd yn ystyried sut y gallwch ddarparu'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol a sut y gallwch sicrhau bod plant yn cael addysg o safon. Ni fyddwn yn fodlon cynnwys unrhyw beth yn y broses a fyddai'n cyfyngu ar gyfleoedd plant i allu cael addysg o safon. Fodd bynnag, ar y lefel leol, mae nifer o awdurdodau'n cynnal proses strategol lle mae ganddynt amserlen, sy'n cynnwys yn union y mathau o faterion a ddisgrifiwch.

Adnoddau Ariannol ar Gyfer Ysgolion Uwchradd Funding Resources for Secondary Schools

Q5 Mark Isherwood: Will the Minister make a statement on funding resources for secondary schools? OAQ0333(ELL)

C5 Mark Isherwood: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar adnoddau ariannol ar gyfer ysgolion uwchradd? OAQ0333(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Funding for pre-16 provision in secondary schools is provided largely through the local government revenue settlement for distribution by local education authorities through their school funding formula, which recognises local circumstances. Funding for school sixth-forms is provided by ELWa, also via the LEAs.

Jane Davidson: Darperir arian ar gyfer darpariaeth cyn-16 mewn ysgolion uwchradd yn bennaf drwy'r setliad refereniw llywodraeth leol i'w ddsbarthu gan awdurdodau addysg lleol drwy eu fformiwla ariannu ysgolion. Mae hwnnw'n cydnabod amgylchiadau lleol. Darperir arian ar gyfer darpariaeth chweched dosbarth mewn ysgolion gan ELWa, hefyd drwy'r AALI.

Mark Isherwood: Clearly, front-line professionals are the experts, not Government. How do you therefore respond to the statement by the Secondary Heads Association that this year saw the worst budget for schools in 15 years, and that they cannot meet their statutory obligations, or plan or sustain performance on this basis. How does she respond to the statement by the National Association of Headteachers Cymru that only redundancies at school level can achieve the so-called efficiency savings that they are now having to make?

Mark Isherwood: Yn amlwg, pobl broffesiynol rheng flaen yw'r arbenigwyr, nid y Llywodraeth. Sut, felly, yr ydych yn ymateb i'r datganiad gan Gymdeithas y Prifathrawon Uwchradd mai eleni y cafwyd y gyllideb waethaf ar gyfer ysgolion mewn 15 mlynedd, ac na allant gyflawni eu rhwymedigaethau statudol, na chynllunio na chynnal perfformiad ar y sail hon. Sut y mae'n ymateb i'r datganiad gan Gymdeithas Genedlaethol y Prifathrawon, Cymru mai dim ond diswyddiadau mewn ysgolion all sicrhau'r arbedion effeithlonrwydd bondigrybwyll y mae'n rhaid iddynt eu gwneud yn awr?

3.00 p.m.

Jane Davidson: I respond by saying that

Jane Davidson: Ymatebaf drwy ddweud

investment in education is at its highest level ever, and we can physically demonstrate that. If we look at budget increases over the past year, total budgeted spend on education by local authorities rose by 4.4 per cent, which was over twice the rate of inflation, compared with 3.9 per cent in England; and average local authority budgeted per-pupil spend in Wales rose by 4.7 per cent, compared with 4.1 per cent in England. It is higher than in many English regions. It is at the highest level that it has ever been. Under a Conservative Government, education spending barely hit inflation levels.

bod y buddsoddiad mewn addysg yn uwch nag erioed, a gallwn ddangos hynny. Os edrychwn ar y cynnydd yn y gyllideb dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, bu cynnydd o 4.4 y cant yng nghyfanswm y gwariant a gyllidebwyd ar addysg gan awdurdodau lleol, sef dwywaith y gyfradd chwyddiant, o'i gymharu â 3.9 y cant yn Lloegr. Bu cynnydd o 4.7 y cant yng ngwariant cyfartalog awdurdodau lleol am bob disgybl yng Nghymru, o'i gymharu â 4.1 y cant yn Lloegr. Mae'n uwch na llawer rhanbarth yn Lloegr. Mae ar y lefel uchaf erioed. O dan Lywodraeth Geidwadol, prin yr oedd gwariant ar addysg yn cyrraedd lefelau chwyddiant.

Problemau Presenoldeb a Dadrithiad mewn Ysgolion Attendance and Disaffection in Schools

Q6 Sandy Mewies: What action is the Minister taking to tackle issues of attendance and disaffection in schools? OAQ0302(ELL)

C6 Sandy Mewies: Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i fynd i'r afael â phroblemau presenoldeb a dadrithiad mewn ysgolion? OAQ0302(ELL)

Jane Davidson: We have issued 'Inclusion and Pupil Support' for consultation. This revised guidance provides advice and sets out responsibilities for maintaining high levels of attendance and positive behaviour in schools. It addresses the need to support pupils with specific needs to ensure that they receive suitable education and avoid becoming disengaged from education.

Jane Davidson: Yr ydym wedi cyhoeddi 'Inclusion and Pupil Support' er mwyn ymgynghori. Mae'r canllawiau diwygiedig hyn yn rhoi cyngor ac yn gosod allan gyfrifoldebau dros gynnal lefelau uchel o bresenoldeb ac ymddygiad cadarnhaol mewn ysgolion. Mae'n mynd i'r afael â'r angen i gefnogi disgyblion ag anghenion penodol i sicrhau eu bod yn cael addysg briodol ac i osgoi ymddieithrio o addysg.

Sandy Mewies: Absence and disaffection blight the lives of young people—even if they do not realise it at the time—leaving them without the skills to move forward. Do you agree that the best support that they can get is from a holistic approach, offered by local authorities such as Flintshire local education authority, which has a range of diverse schemes to tackle these issues, and whose tracking procedures have been praised by Estyn as 'very effective and an outstanding feature of their service'?

Sandy Mewies: Mae absenoldeb a dadrithio yn bla ar fywydau pobl ifanc—hyd yn oed os nad ydynt yn sylweddoli hynny ar y pryd—sy'n eu gadael heb sgiliau i symud ymlaen. A ydych yn cytuno mai'r cymorth gorau y gallant ei gael yw drwy ymagwedd gyfannol, a gynigir gan awdurdodau lleol fel awdurdod addysg sir y Fflint, sydd ag ystod o amrywiol gynlluniau i fynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn. Mae eu gweithdrefnau olrhain hwy wedi eu canmol gan Estyn fel rhai effeithiol iawn sy'n nodwedd amlwg yn eu gwasanaeth?

Jane Davidson: I certainly agree. That is one of the reasons why the partnership between local education authorities and schools is so effective in Wales. Attendance levels in our schools are getting better; we introduced an attendance benchmarking system from the

Jane Davidson: Yr wyf yn sicr yn cytuno â hynny. Dyna un o'r rhesymau pam mae'r bartneriaeth rhwng awdurdodau addysg lleol ac ysgolion mor effeithiol yng Nghymru. Mae lefelau presenoldeb yn ein hysgolion yn gwella; cyflwynwyd system o feincnodi

end of May this year; we are making £6 million of funding available over the next three years to invest in electronic attendance packages; and we have invested £5.85 million from the better schools fund in pupil engagement projects. We are also making a huge investment into 14 to 19-year-olds in terms of a holistic approach to the future. We are looking at the tracking issues, and at the best kind of education. Flintshire's tracking is something that the rest of us are looking at.

presenoldeb gennym o ddiwedd Mai eleni; yr ydym yn darparu £6 miliwn dros y tair blynedd nesaf i'w fuddsoddi mewn pecynnau presenoldeb electronig; ac yr ydym wedi buddsoddi £5.85 miliwn o'r gronfa gwell ysgolion mewn prosiectau ymgysylltu â disgyblion. Yr ydym hefyd yn buddsoddi'n helaeth iawn mewn pobl ifanc rhwng 14 a 19 oed o ran ymagwedd gyfannol at y dyfodol. Yr ydym yn edrych ar y problemau olrhain, ac ar y math gorau o addysg. Mae gweithdrefnau olrhain sir y Fflint yn rhywbeth y mae'r gweddill ohonom yn ei ystyried.

Sgiliau Sylfaenol Oedolion a Phlant The Basic Skills of Adults and Children

Q7 Lisa Francis: Will the Minister make a statement on the basic skills of adults and children in Wales? OAQ0291(ELL)

C7 Lisa Francis: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar sgiliau sylfaenol oedolion a phlant yng Nghymru? OAQ0291(ELL)

Jane Davidson: There is a long-standing basic skills problem in Wales, and it will not be resolved quickly. We have made good progress since the launch of our all-age basic skills strategy in 2001, and our new strategy document, 'Words Talk—Numbers Count', launched in April, explains how we will build on that progress.

Jane Davidson: Mae yna broblem faith o sgiliau sylfaenol yng Nghymru, ac ni fydd yn cael ei datrys yn gyflym. Yr ydym wedi gwneud cynnydd da ers lansio ein strategaeth sgiliau sylfaenol i bob oed yn 2001, ac mae ein dogfen strategol newydd 'Geiriau'n Galw—Rhifau'n Cyfri', a lansiwyd fis Ebrill, yn esbonio sut y byddwn yn adeiladu ar y cynnydd hwnnw.

Lisa Francis: In recent answers to my written questions on the basic skills of adults, you have stated that interim results of an all-Wales survey found that 24 per cent of the working age population have literary skills below level one, and that 53 per cent have numeracy skills below that level. Level one is the approximate level expected of a competent 11-year-old. Now that the British Market Research Bureau survey has been completed, how have you assessed the results, and what discussions have you had with the Minister for Economic Development and Transport about how this low level of skills is affecting the economy in Wales?

Lisa Francis: Mewn atebion i'm cwestiynau ysgrifenedig yn ddiweddar ar sgiliau sylfaenol oedolion, yr ydych wedi dweud bod canlyniadau interim arolwg dros Gymru gyfan wedi gweld bod gan 24 y cant o'r boblogaeth o oedran gweithio sgiliau llythrennedd sy'n is na lefel un, a bod gan 53 y cant sgiliau rhifedd sy'n is na'r lefel honno. Lefel un yw'r lefel a ddisgwylir gan blentyn cymwys 11 oed. Gan fod arolwg gan British Market Research Bureau bellach wedi'i gwblhau, sut yr ydych wedi asesu'r canlyniadau, a pha drafodaethau yr ydych wedi eu cael gyda'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth am y ffordd y mae'r lefel isel hon o sgiliau yn effeithio ar economi Cymru?

Jane Davidson: Thank you for your continuing interest in the basic skills agenda—I think you ask more questions about basic skills than any other Member. Andrew Davies and I have regular

Jane Davidson: Diolch i chi am eich diddordeb parhaus yn yr agenda sgiliau sylfaenol—credaf eich bod chi'n gofyn mwy o gwestiynau am sgiliau sylfaenol nag unrhyw Aelod arall. Caiff Andrew Davies a

discussions on the skills agenda, and we are particularly keen to ensure that we are able to lift the level of education in adults in Wales above level one. It is notable that 86 per cent of schools in Wales now have the basic skills quality mark, which is by far the highest rate of any part of the United Kingdom. The number of people with no qualifications has come down quite dramatically over the past few years, so we are moving in the right direction. We are putting in place not only a deficit strategy that addresses the problems of people once they leave school, but with our early investment in language and play and the quality marks in schools, we are trying to ensure that we do not turn out similar adults in future. In our 14 to 19-year-olds agenda, there will be many more vocational opportunities for young people to experience so that they can become more skilled.

minnau drafodaethau rheolaidd ar yr agenda sgiliau, ac yr ydym yn awyddus iawn i sicrhau ein bod yn gallu gwella lefel addysg ymhlith oedolion yng Nghymru i lefel uwch na lefel un. Mae'n nodedig bod gan 86 y cant o ysgolion yng Nghymru nod ansawdd sgiliau sylfaenol erbyn hyn, sef y gyfradd uchaf o bell ffordd yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae nifer y bobl heb unrhyw gymwysterau wedi gostwng yn sylweddol dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf, felly, yr ydym yn symud i'r cyfeiriad cywir. Yr ydym nid yn unig yn rhoi strategaeth ar waith i ddelio â diffygion sy'n mynd i'r afael â phroblemau pobl wedi iddynt adael yr ysgol, ond gyda'n buddsoddiad cynnar mewn iaith a chwarae, a'r nodau ansawdd mewn ysgolion, yr ydym yn ceisio sicrhau na fyddwn yn cynhyrchu oedolion tebyg yn y dyfodol. Yn ein hagenda ar gyfer pobl ifanc 14 i 19 oed, bydd llawer mwy o gyfleoedd galwedigaethol i bobl ifanc eu profi er mwyn iddynt allu bod yn fwy medrus.

Rhaglen Beilot o Gyrsiau Sabothol Cymraeg The Pilot Programme of Sabbatical Welsh Language Courses

C8 Owen John Thomas: Sut fydd y rhaglen beilot o gyrsiau sabothol Cymraeg yn gwahaniaethu rhwng anghenion amrywiol athrawon? OAQ0314(ELL)

Q8 Owen John Thomas: How will the pilot programme of sabbatical Welsh-language courses differentiate between the various needs of teachers? OAQ0314(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Ar hyn o bryd, yr ydym yn gweithio gydag ystod o bartneriaid er mwyn datblygu rhaglen beilot sabothol drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg er mwyn diwallu anghenion ymarferwyr sylfaen, cynradd, uwchradd ac ôl-16. Bydd y rhaglen hon yn darparu hyfforddiant iaith dwys, wedi'i gyfuno â hyfforddiant methodolegol ar gyfer dysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, dysgu dwyieithog a gwybodaeth am derminoleg sy'n benodol i bwnc neu gyfnod penodol.

Jane Davidson: We are currently working with a range of partners to develop a Welsh-language sabbatical pilot programme to meet the needs of foundation, primary, secondary and post-16 practitioners. This programme will provide intensive language training, combined with methodological training in Welsh-medium and bilingual teaching and knowledge of terminology specific to a given subject or phase.

Owen John Thomas: Mae chwe gwahanol maes mewn addysg, a hefyd ceir y Gymraeg fel ail-iaith a addysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Y chwe maes yw unedau meithrin, cynradd, uwchradd, addysg bellach, ail-iaith a chyfrwng y Gymraeg, fel y dywedais. Sut ydych chi am sicrhau bod y bobl sy'n dysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg mewn addysg uwchradd a'r rhai sy'n dysgu'r Gymraeg fel ail-iaith mewn addysg uwchradd yn cael cyrsiau sy'n addas ar eu cyfer, heb sôn am yr

Owen John Thomas: There are six different phases in education, and there is also Welsh as a second language and Welsh-medium education. The six phases are nursery, primary, secondary and further education, second language and Welsh medium, as I said. How will you ensure that those who learn through the medium of Welsh in secondary education, and those who learn Welsh as a second language in secondary education, have courses that are suitable for

amrywiaeth mewn meysydd eraill?

Jane Davidson: Cytunaf fod hwn yn fater pwysig. Yn gyntaf, byddwn yn targedu athrawon o ysgolion lle mae'r Gymraeg yn cael ei defnyddio fel cyfrwng dysgu mewn rhan o'r cwricwlwm, er mwyn creu mwy o gyfle ar gyfer y dyfodol. Gobeithiwn, cyn diwedd y tymor hwn, y bydd y trefniadau ar gyfer y ddau gynllun peilot sabothol wedi'u gwneud, ac y gallwn drafod hyn yn y pwyllgor.

them, without mentioning the variation in other phases?

Jane Davidson: I agree that this is an important issue. First, we will target teachers from schools where Welsh is used as a teaching medium for part of the curriculum, to create more opportunities for the future. We hope, before the end of this term, that the arrangements for the two sabbatical pilot schemes will be in place, and that we can discuss this in committee.

Anghenion Addysgol Arbennig Special Educational Needs

Q9 Alun Cairns: Will the Minister make a statement on special educational needs? OAQ0276(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Support for pupils with special educational needs is covered by the SEN code of practice for Wales, which sets out the procedures to be followed by schools and local education authorities in meeting a range of needs. The Education and Lifelong Learning Committee is also in the process of undertaking its own policy review.

Alun Cairns: Minister, pupils and students who have special educational needs receive services from local authorities, Education and Learning Wales and other organisations. Do you recognise that while each of those organisations have their own spending pots, with no co-ordination between those pots, we are not necessarily giving the best levels of service to those individuals? I have highlighted one example specifically to the First Minister, and written to you about it, but I raise the case again in general. Do you not agree that there is a case for multi-agency funding that will save money for the taxpayer, not only in the short-term, but in the long-term, by providing the best services for the individual and by also saving money for the public purse?

Jane Davidson: The way in which the funding operates at present is that funding for those under the age of 16 comes directly from the local government settlement. As you

C9 Alun Cairns: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar anghenion addysgol arbennig? OAQ0276(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Caiff cymorth i ddisgyblion ag anghenion addysgol arbennig ei gwmpasu gan y cod ymarfer AAA ar gyfer Cymru, sy'n gosod allan y gweithdrefnau y dylai ysgolion ac awdurdodau addysg lleol eu dilyn wrth ddiwallu ystod o anghenion. Mae'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes hefyd yn y broses o ymgymryd â'i adolygiad polisi ei hun.

Alun Cairns: Weinidog, mae disgyblion a myfyrwyr ag anghenion addysgol arbennig yn cael gwasanaethau gan awdurdodau lleol, Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru a sefydliadau eraill. A ydych yn cydnabod, er bod gan bob un o'r sefydliadau hynny eu cronfeydd gwario eu hunain, heb unrhyw gydgyssylltu rhwng y cronfeydd hynny, nad ydym o anghenraid yn rhoi'r gwasanaeth gorau i'r unigolion hynny? Yr wyf wedi tynnu sylw'r Prif Weinidog at un enghraifft yn benodol ac wedi ysgrifennu atoch chi ynglŷn amdano, ond yr wyf yn codi'r achos eto yn gyffredinol. Oni chytunwch fod achos dros ariannu aml-asiantaeth a fydd yn arbed arian i'r trethdalwr, nid yn unig yn y tymor byr, ond yn y tymor hir drwy ddarparu'r gwasanaethau gorau i'r unigolyn a hefyd drwy arbed arian i'r trethdalwr?

Jane Davidson: Y ffordd y mae'r broses ariannu'n gweithio ar hyn o bryd yw bod arian ar gyfer plant dan 16 oed yn dod yn uniongyrchol o'r setliad llywodraeth leol. Fel

know, the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee is at present looking at the whole issue of the delivery of the SEN agenda. Some fantastic work is going on in Wales, but there are also real absences in delivery. We do not want the postcode lottery to remain in the future. The funding for post-16 education also comes via local government settlement and via provision for colleges. Funding has been given to local authorities on the basis of their requirements and needs, so there is total co-ordination in the funding mechanisms, and we want to ensure that that co-ordination remains.

y gwyddoch, mae'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ar hyn o bryd yn edrych ar holl fater darparu'r agenda AAA. Mae gwaith rhagorol yn cael ei wneud yng Nghymru, ond mae yma fylchau amlwg hefyd. Nid ydym am i'r loteri cod post barhau yn y dyfodol. Daw'r arian ar gyfer addysg ar ôl 16 drwy'r setliad llywodraeth leol hefyd a thrwy ddarpariaeth ar gyfer colegau. Rhoddwyd arian i awdurdodau lleol ar sail eu gofynion a'u hanghenion, felly, mae cydgysylltu llwyr yn y mecanweithiau ariannu, ac yr ydym am sicrhau bod y cydgysylltu hwnnw'n parhau.

Addysg Cyfrwng Cymraeg yn Sir Gaerfyrddin Welsh-medium Education in Carmarthenshire

C10 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg yn sir Gaerfyrddin? OAQ0317(ELL)

Q10 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Will the Minister make a statement on Welsh-medium education in Carmarthenshire? OAQ0317(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Mae gan sir Gaerfyrddin 127 o ysgolion cynradd. Mae 79 ohonynt yn perthyn i gategori A, sef cyfrwng Cymraeg, 33 yn perthyn i gategori B, sef Cymraeg a Saesneg yn cael eu defnyddio mewn meithrinfeydd ac ysgolion babanod, a 15 yn perthyn i gategori A/B, sef ffrydiau o'r ddau gategori. O'r 15 o ysgolion uwchradd, mae tair ohonynt yn ddwyieithog. Mae nifer o rai eraill yn dysgu ystod o bynciau drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg.

Jane Davidson: Carmarthenshire has 127 primary schools. A total of 79 are category A, which means that they are mainly Welsh-medium, 33 are in category B, where Welsh and English are used in nursery and infant schools, and 15 are in category A/B, which includes streams of each category. Of the 15 secondary schools, three are bilingual. A number of others teach a range of subjects in Welsh.

3.10 p.m.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Fel y gwyddoch, mae adran addysg cyngor sir Gaerfyrddin yn bwriadu datblygu addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn y sector cynradd. Bydd yn cynyddu nifer y pynciau a ddysgir drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg mewn ysgolion categori A. Fodd bynnag, yn eich ateb i Nick Bourne, yr oeddech yn rhoi pwyslais ar y lleoedd gwag, ac yn dweud fod yn rhaid mynd i'r afael â'r broblem honno. A ydych yn derbyn, o wneud hynny yn sir Gaerfyrddin, y byddwch o reidrwydd yn creu sefyllfa lle bydd ysgolion categori A yn cau, a mwy o ysgolion categori A/B yn datblygu am eu bod yn gwasanaethu ardal fwy? Golyga hynny yr effeithir nid yn unig ar ethos yr ysgolion hynny ond hefyd ar hyrwyddo addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: As you know, Carmarthenshire education department intends to develop Welsh-medium education in the primary sector. It will increase the number of subjects taught through the medium of Welsh in category A schools. In your response to Nick Bourne, however, you emphasised surplus places, and said that that was a problem that must be tackled. Do you accept, if that is done in Carmarthenshire, that you will inevitably create a situation where category A schools will close, and more A/B category schools will develop because they can serve a wider area? That will have an effect not only on the ethos of those schools but also on the promotion of Welsh medium education.

Jane Davidson: Efallai y bydd o gymorth i ddweud yn glir na fyddwn yn barod i gymeradwyo cau ysgol cyfrwng Cymraeg ond bai y cynigir darpariaeth yn ei lle a fydd yn cynnig addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg ac a fydd hefyd yn gyfatebol o ran ansawdd.

Jane Davidson: It may be helpful to state clearly that we will not be prepared to approve the closure of a Welsh-medium school unless provision is made in its place to provide Welsh-medium education of a similar quality.

Datganiad Busnes Diwygiedig Revised Business Statement

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I informed the Assembly yesterday of determinations made in accordance with Standing Order No. 5.7.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Hysbysais y Cynulliad ddoe am benderfyniadau a wnaed yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 5.7.

Y Llywydd: A oes gwrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes drafft? Ymddengys nad oes. Nid oes gennyf rybudd fod neb am siarad ar y datganiad busnes drafft.

The Presiding Officer: Are there any objections to the draft business statement? It appears not. I have not received prior notice that anyone wishes to speak on the draft business statement.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Byddaf yn fyr. Diolchwn i'r Gweinidog am newid y datganiad busnes ac am roi datganiad inni ar y cynllun adeiladu o fewn y sector iechyd. Yr ydym yn dal yn anhapus nad ydym yn cael datganiad ar y ddarpariaeth y tu hwnt i oriau yng Nghaerdydd na chyfle i gwestiynu'r Gweinidog ynglŷn â newidiadau yn amserlen First Great Western. Ni fyddwn yn gwrthwynebu'r datganiad busnes y tro hwn.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I will be brief. We thank the Minister for changing the business statement and for allowing a statement on the building programme within the health sector. We are still unhappy that there is no statement on out-of-hours provision in Cardiff nor an opportunity to question the Minister on the changes to the First Great Western timetable. We will not be opposing the business statement on this occasion.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr oeddwn yn casglu hynny, Rhodri Glyn Thomas.

The Presiding Officer: Order. I gathered that, Rhodri Glyn Thomas.

Jane Hutt: It will not be a statement, but a debate on the NHS capital programme, which I am sure you will welcome, as you will the other change underlined in the statement—the debate on the Older People's Commissioners Bill coming on 18 June.

Jane Hutt: Nid datganiad mohono, ond dadl ar raglen gyfalaf y GIG. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn croesawu hynny, yn ogystal â'r newid arall a danlinellir yn y datganiad—y ddadl ar y Mesur Comisiynydd Pobl Hŷn a gyflwynir ar 18 Mehefin.

*Derbyniwyd y datganiad busnes.
Business statement adopted.*

Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau o dan Ddeddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000, Deddf Diogelu Data 1998 a'r Rheoliadau Gwybodaeth Amgylcheddol Delegation of Functions under the Freedom of Information Act, 2000, the Data Protection Act 1998 and the Environmental Information Regulations

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I propose that

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales while noting that nothing in the motion will have the effect of reducing the pre-eminence of the authority of the full Assembly or of reducing the role of the Assembly committees in the exercise of the functions delegated by this motion, in exercise of its powers under sections 62 and 63 of the Government of Wales Act 1998,

(1) revokes any existing delegation by it to the Assembly First Minister of its functions under:

(a) sections 70(4) and 71(2) of the Government of Wales Act 1998;

(b) the Data Protection Act 1998, and

(c) the Freedom of Information Act 2000;

(2) delegates to the Assembly First Minister its functions under:

(a) sections 70(4) and 71(2) of the Government of Wales Act 1998;

(b) the Freedom of Information Act 2000; and

(c) the Environmental Information Regulations 2004 (S.I. 2004/3391),

in each case in so far as concerns documents or information in the possession or under the control of any Assembly Minister or member of the staff of the Assembly in respect of whom civil service management functions, within the meaning of section 1 of the Civil Service (Management Functions) Act 1992, stand delegated to the First Minister;

(3) delegates to the Assembly First Minister its functions under the Data Protection Act 1998, in so far as concerns data processed (within the meaning of the Data Protection Act 1998) by any Assembly Minister or member of the staff of the Assembly in respect of whom civil service management functions, within the meaning of section 1 of the Civil Service (Management Functions) Act 1992, stand delegated to the First Minister, or data processed on behalf of the National Assembly for Wales at the request of an Assembly Minister or member of staff such as

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru er ei fod yn nodi na fydd unrhyw beth yn y cynnig yn lleihau goruchafiaeth awdurdod y Cynulliad llawn nac yn lleihau rôl pwyllgorau'r Cynulliad wrth gyflawni'r swyddogaethau a ddirprwywyd gan y cynnig hwn, wrth arfer ei bwerau o dan adrannau 62 a 63 Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998,

(1) yn diddymu unrhyw ddirprwyaeth bresennol ganddo i Brif Weinidog y Cynulliad o dan:

(a) adrannau 70(4) a 71(2) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998;

(b) Deddf Diogelu Data 1998, a

(c) Deddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000;

(2) yn dirprwyo ei swyddogaethau i Brif Weinidog y Cynulliad o dan:

(a) adrannau 70(4) a 71(2) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998;

(b) Deddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000; a

(c) Rheoliadau Gwybodaeth Amgylcheddol 2004 (O.S. 2004/3391),

ym mhob achos, mewn perthynas â dogfennau neu wybodaeth sydd ym meddiant neu o dan reolaeth unrhyw un o Weinidogion y Cynulliad neu unrhyw aelod o staff y Cynulliad y mae swyddogaethau rheoli'r gwasanaeth sifil, o fewn ystyr adran 1 Deddf y Gwasanaeth Sifil (Swyddogaethau Rheoli) 1992, wedi'u dirprwyo i'r Prif Weinidog mewn perthynas â hwy;

(3) yn dirprwyo ei swyddogaethau o dan Ddeddf Diogelu Data 1998 i'r Prif Weinidog, mewn perthynas â data a brosesir (o fewn ystyr Deddf Diogelu Data 1998) gan unrhyw un o Weinidogion y Cynulliad neu unrhyw aelod o staff y Cynulliad y mae swyddogaethau rheoli'r gwasanaeth sifil, o fewn ystyr adran 1 Deddf y Gwasanaeth Sifil (Swyddogaethau Rheoli) 1992, wedi'u dirprwyo i'r Prif Weinidog mewn perthynas â hwy, neu ddata a brosesir ar ran Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ar gais un o Weinidogion y Cynulliad neu aelod o'r staff

<i>mentioned above;</i>	<i>fel y nodwyd uchod;</i>
<i>(4) delegates to the House Committee its functions under:</i>	<i>(4) yn dirprwyo ei swyddogaethau i Bwyllgor y Tŷ o dan:</i>
<i>(a) sections 70(4) and 71(2) of the Government of Wales Act 1998;</i>	<i>(a) adrannau 70(4) a 71(2) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998;</i>
<i>(b) the Freedom of Information Act 2000; and</i>	<i>(b) Deddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000; a</i>
<i>(c) the Environmental Information Regulations 2004 (S.I. 2004/3391),</i>	<i>(c) Rheoliadau Gwybodaeth Amgylcheddol 2004 (O.S. 2004/3391),</i>
<i>in each case in so far as concerns documents or information which are in the possession or under the control of:</i>	<i>Ym mhob achos, mewn perthynas â dogfennau neu wybodaeth sydd ym meddiant neu o dan reolaeth:</i>
<i>(i) that Committee, or</i>	<i>(i) y Pwyllgor hwnnw, neu</i>
<i>(ii) any member of that Committee acting in his or her capacity as such, or</i>	<i>(ii) unrhyw aelod o'r Pwyllgor hwnnw sy'n gweithredu yn rhinwedd ei swydd, neu</i>
<i>(iii) any member of staff of the Assembly serving that Committee for the purposes of that Committee's terms of reference;</i>	<i>(iii) unrhyw aelod o staff y Cynulliad sy'n gwasanaethu'r Pwyllgor hwnnw at ddibenion cylch gorchwyl y Pwyllgor hwnnw;</i>
<i>(5) delegates to the House Committee its functions under the Data Protection Act 1998, in so far as concerns:</i>	<i>(5) yn dirprwyo ei swyddogaethau o dan Ddeddf Diogelu Data 1998 i Bwyllgor y Tŷ, mewn perthynas â:</i>
<i>(a) data processed (within the meaning of the Data Protection Act 1998) by:</i>	<i>(a) data a brosesir (o fewn ystyr Deddf Diogelu Data 1998) gan:</i>
<i>(i) that Committee, or</i>	<i>i) y Pwyllgor hwnnw, neu</i>
<i>(ii) any member of that Committee acting in his or her capacity as such, or</i>	<i>(ii) unrhyw aelod o'r Pwyllgor hwnnw sy'n gweithredu yn rhinwedd ei swydd, neu</i>
<i>(iii) any member of staff of the Assembly serving that Committee, or</i>	<i>(iii) unrhyw aelod o staff y Cynulliad sy'n gwasanaethu'r Pwyllgor hwnnw, neu</i>
<i>(b) data processed on behalf of the National Assembly for Wales at the request of that Committee or a member of staff such as mentioned above, in each case for the purposes of the Committee's terms of reference;</i>	<i>(b) data a brosesir ar ran Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ar gais y Pwyllgor hwnnw neu aelod o'r staff fel y nodir uchod, ym mhob achos at ddibenion cylch gorchwyl y Pwyllgor;</i>
<i>(6) delegates to staff of the Assembly its functions (except in so far as such functions have been delegated to the House Committee by this delegation motion) under:</i>	<i>(6) yn dirprwyo ei swyddogaethau i staff y Cynulliad (ac eithrio pan fydd swyddogaethau felly wedi'u dirprwyo i Bwyllgor y Tŷ o dan y cynnig dirprwyo hwn) o dan:</i>

(a) sections 70(4) and 71(2) of the Government of Wales Act 1998;

(b) the Freedom of Information Act 2000; and

(c) the Environmental Information Regulations 2004 (S.I. 2004/3391),

in each case in so far as concerns documents or information in the possession or under the control of any member of the staff of the Assembly in respect of whom civil service management functions, within the meaning of section 1 of the Civil Service (Management Functions) Act 1992, stand delegated to the House Committee; and

(7) delegates to staff of the Assembly its functions (except in so far as such functions as have been delegated to the House Committee by this delegation motion) under the Data Protection Act 1998, in so far as concerns:

(a) data processed (within the meaning of the Data Protection Act 1998) by any member of the staff of the Assembly in respect of whom civil service management functions, within the meaning of section 1 of the Civil Service (Management Functions) Act 1992, stand delegated to the House Committee, or

(b) data processed on behalf of the National Assembly for Wales at the request of such a member of staff.

This delegation will be made in the knowledge that those functions may, as appropriate, be further delegated to the appropriate Assembly Minister and to staff. (NDM2476)

Brynle Williams: I am concerned that only 15 minutes have been allocated for the most important item under discussion today. It is essential, when questioning politicians or officials at every tier of Government, that they are not able to hide behind the fact that the issues could conflict with the Data Protection Act 1998, or possibly be exempt under the Freedom of Information Act 2000. In order for the general public to unite behind any Government, people need to feel that

(a) adrannau 70(4) a 71(2) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998;

(b) Deddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000; a

(c) Rheoliadau Gwybodaeth Amgylcheddol 2004 2004 (O.S. 2004/3391),

ym mhob achos, mewn perthynas â dogfennau neu wybodaeth sydd ym meddiant neu o dan reolaeth unrhyw aelod o staff y Cynulliad y mae swyddogaethau rheoli'r gwasanaeth sifil, o fewn ystyr adran 1 Deddf y Gwasanaeth Sifil (Swyddogaethau Rheoli) 1992, wedi'u dirprwyo i Bwyllgor y Tŷ mewn perthynas â hwy; ac

(7) yn dirprwyo ei swyddogaethau i staff y Cynulliad (ac eithrio pan fydd swyddogaethau o'r fath wedi'u dirprwyo i Bwyllgor y Tŷ drwy'r cynnig dirprwyo hwn) o dan Deddf Diogelu Data 1998, mewn perthynas â:

(a) data a brosesir (o fewn ystyr Deddf Diogelu Data 1998) gan unrhyw aelod o staff y Cynulliad y mae swyddogaethau rheoli'r gwasanaeth sifil, o fewn ystyr adran 1 Deddf y Gwasanaeth Sifil (Swyddogaethau Rheoli) 1992, wedi'u dirprwyo i Bwyllgor y Tŷ mewn perthynas â hwy, neu

(b) data a brosesir ar ran Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ar gais aelod staff o'r fath.

Gwneir y ddirprwyaeth hon gyda'r sicrwydd y gellir dirprwyo'r swyddogaethau hynny, fel sy'n briodol, i Weinidog perthnasol y Cynulliad ac i'rr staff. (NDM2476)

Brynle Williams: Yr wyf yn pryderu mai dim ond chwarter awr sydd wedi ei rhoi ar gyfer yr eitem bwysicaf a drafodir heddiw. Mae'n hollbwysig, wrth holi gwleidyddion neu swyddogion ar bob haen o Lywodraeth, na allant guddio y tu ôl i'r ffaith y gallai'r materion wrthdaro â Deddf Diogelu Data 1998, neu o bosibl gael eu heithrio o dan Ddeddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000. Er mwyn i'r cyhoedd uno i gefnogi unrhyw Lywodraeth, mae angen i bobl deimlo y caiff

their questions and queries will be answered as fully as possible. I obviously understand that confidential information needs to be kept confidential, but, on occasion, I must question judgments which have been made precluding people from obtaining certain information.

I am also concerned by some of the issues relating to the Freedom of Information Act. I accept that, if several thousand pages of documentation are requested, then the Government body or department should not be out of pocket; however, other arrangements should be made, including making the documents available for people to see with photocopying facilities. I am in receipt of correspondence from one council in north Wales saying that copies of the not unreasonable information that has been requested can cost more than £5,000 in paperwork. Obviously, this puts the information out of the reach of most people.

In conclusion, Minister, I am saying that the Freedom of Information Act and the Data Protection Act 1998 are essential for good governance, but requests made under the Acts must be dealt with in a consistent and helpful way, providing as much information as possible to the people who request that data.

Mick Bates: The Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome these regulations. Openness and access to Government information are intrinsic to democratic accountability. We welcome the fact that the regulations will also apply to the environmental information regulations. It is a crucial part of democratic accountability that people are able to access information about the environment in which they live. However, we would like to see the regulations go further. It is crucial to create a culture of openness and access to information, which will mean a change of mindset from automatically trying to release as little information as possible to making available as much information as possible. Openness, not secrecy, should be the norm.

In Wales, we are ahead of Westminster with

eu cwestiynau a'u hymholiadau eu hateb mor llawn â phosibl. Wrth gwrs yr wyf yn deall bod angen i wybodaeth gyfrinachol gael ei chadw'n gyfrinachol, ond ar brydiau rhaid imi amau penderfyniadau sydd wedi eu gwneud sy'n atal pobl rhag gallu cael gwybodaeth benodol.

Yr wyf hefyd yn pryderu ynghylch rhai o'r materion sy'n ymwneud â'r Ddeddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth. Yr wyf yn derbyn, os gofynnir am ddogfennaeth sy'n filoedd o dudalennau, na ddylai'r corff neu'r adran o'r Llywodraeth fod ar ei cholled; fodd bynnag, dylid gwneud trefniadau eraill, gan gynnwys rhyddhau'r dogfennau i bobl allu eu gweld gyda chyfleusterau llungopïo. Yr wyf wedi cael gohebiaeth gan un cyngor yn y Gogledd sy'n dweud y gall copïau o'r wybodaeth y gofynnwyd amdani, heb i hynny fod yn afresymol, gostio mwy na £5,000 mewn gwaith papur. Yn amlwg, mae hyn yn golygu nad yw'r wybodaeth o fewn cyrraedd y rhan fwyaf o bobl.

I gloi, Weinidog, dywedaf fod y Ddeddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth a Deddf Diogelu Data 1998 yn hanfodol ar gyfer llywodraethu da, ond rhaid ymdrin â cheisiadau o dan y Deddfau mewn modd cyson a defnyddiol, gan ddarparu cymaint o wybodaeth â phosibl i'r bobl sy'n gwneud cais am y data hwnnw.

Mick Bates: Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn croesawu'r rheoliadau hyn. Mae bod yn agored a gallu cael gwybodaeth y Llywodraeth yn rhan annatod o atebolrwydd democrataidd. Croesawn y ffaith y bydd y rheoliadau hefyd yn berthnasol i'r rheoliadau gwybodaeth amgylcheddol. Mae galluogi pobl i gael gwybodaeth am eu hamgylchedd yn elfen hanfodol mewn atebolrwydd democrataidd. Fodd bynnag, hoffem weld y rheoliadau'n mynd ymhellach. Mae'n hanfodol creu diwylliant agored a mynediad i wybodaeth, a fydd yn golygu newid o feddylfryd sy'n awtomatig yn ceisio rhyddhau cyn lleied o wybodaeth â phosibl, i sicrhau bod cymaint o wybodaeth â phosibl ar gael. Dylid sicrhau mai bod yn agored, nid cyfrinachedd, yw'r norm.

Yng Nghymru, yr ydym wedi achub y blaen

regard to openness in general, but we lag behind Scotland. Thanks to the fact that it has primary lawmaking powers, Scotland has its own information commissioner whereas we come under the remit of Westminster's information commissioner. To us, the Welsh Liberal Democrats, this does not make sense because our code is tougher than the Act that the information commissioner oversees. Surely, there is a case, Minister, for a Welsh information commissioner who will be much more in tune with how we do things here, rather than how things are done in Westminster or Whitehall. If we are truly serious about a rigorous culture of openness and access, as set out in the code, which is tougher than the Act, it is surely an anomaly that it is enforced by someone in Whitehall or Westminster who is operating in a less open atmosphere and culture than we are.

The Scottish information commissioner has more power than the UK commissioner. Under the Act, any Minister of the Crown or the Attorney General can issue a certificate in relation to exempt information and override the commissioner. In Scotland, the Scottish Executive can only issue an overriding certificate in relation to certain exemptions, and the information must be of exceptional sensitivity. Only the First Minister, following extensive consultation with the rest of the Scottish Executive, can issue a certificate of exemption to override the commissioner. Minister, will you do everything in your power to lobby your colleagues in Westminster to create the post of commissioner for Wales like the one in Scotland?

Y Llywydd: Gan fod y pwerau hyn yn cael eu dirprwyo i Bwyllgor y Tŷ yn ogystal ag i'r Prif Weinidog, galwaf ar y Dirprwy Lywydd i siarad ar ran Pwyllgor y Tŷ, ac yna'r Gweinidog i ymateb.

The Deputy Presiding Officer (John Marek): Mick, forgive me for not following on with the train of your argument, however much I might agree with it personally. I will make two points as Chair of the House

ar San Steffan o ran bod yn agored yn gyffredinol. Ond yr ydym ar ei hôl hi o'n cymharu â'r Alban. Oherwydd bod gan yr Alban bwerau deddfu sylfaenol, mae ganddi ei chomisiynydd gwybodaeth ei hun, ond yr ydym ni'n dod o dan gylch gwaith comisiynydd gwybodaeth San Steffan. I ni, Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, nid yw hyn yn gwneud synnwyr gan fod ein cod ni yn llymach na'r Ddeddf y mae'r comisiynydd gwybodaeth yn ei goruchwyllo. Onid oes achos, Weinidog, dros gael comisiynydd gwybodaeth yng Nghymru a fydd lawer yn fwy cyfarwydd â'r modd y gwnawn bethau yma, yn hytrach na'r modd y gwneir pethau yn San Steffan neu Whitehall. Os ydym o ddifrif ynglŷn â diwylliant trwyadl o fod yn agored a sicrhau mynediad fel y nodir yn y cod, sy'n llymach na'r Ddeddf, onid yw'n anghyson mai rhywun yn Whitehall neu San Steffan, sy'n gweithredu mewn hinsawdd a diwylliant llai agored nag a wnawn ni, sy'n gorfodi'r cod hwn.

Mae gan gomisiynydd gwybodaeth yr Alban fwy o bŵer na chomisiynydd y DU. O dan y Ddeddf gall unrhyw un o Weinidogion y Goron neu'r Twrnai Cyffredinol gyhoeddi tystysgrif ar gyfer eithrio gwybodaeth a diystyru'r comisiynydd. Yn yr Alban, dim ond yng nghyd-destun rhai eithriadau y gall Gweithrediaeth yr Alban gyhoeddi tystysgrif ddiystyru, a rhaid i'r wybodaeth fod yn hynod sensitif. Dim ond Prif Weinidog yr Alban, ar ôl ymgynghori'n helaeth â gweddill Gweithrediaeth yr Alban, all gyhoeddi tystysgrif eithrio i ddiystyru'r comisiynydd. Weinidog, a wnewch bopeth o fewn eich gallu i lobïo eich cyd-Weinidogion yn San Steffan i greu swydd comisiynydd i Gymru fel honno sydd yn yr Alban?

The Presiding Officer: As this is a delegation of functions to the House Committee as well as to the First Minister, I will call the Deputy Presiding Officer to speak on behalf of the House Committee, and then the Minister to respond.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd (John Marek): Mick, maddeuwch imi am beidio â dilyn trywydd eich dadl, gymaint ag y cytunaf â hi yn bersonol o bosibl. Gwnaf ddau bwynt fel Cadeirydd Pwyllgor y Tŷ. Mae Pwyllgor y

Committee. The House Committee has considered this motion, as has the Government, and we are agreed that this is the best way of handling the procedures for the disclosure of information. I urge Members to support the motion.

Secondly, certain functions have been devolved to the House Committee, for which the committee is responsible, but there are other matters for which the House Committee is not responsible and ought not to have responsibility, for example, the question of release of information as far as subject committees are concerned. That is why you will not find complete symmetry between delegations to the First Minister and delegations to the House Committee. Where delegations are made to staff, of course, it will be the Clerk who will ultimately make the decision and carry the can for it. However, there will be a protocol whereby the Clerk will consult with the Presiding Officer in order to make sure that elected Members are involved in any disclosures before they are made. With that explanation, I can only say again that this must be done, and we think that this is the best way of doing it. I urge Members to support the motion.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I welcome the commitment expressed by Members to open government, and we must remember that our Code of Practice on Public Access to Information provides us with a framework, not only for complying with the Freedom of Information Act 2000, but also for going further than was required, as we have been doing for the last four years.

3.20 p.m.

Alun Cairns: The Welsh Assembly Government and Labour backbenchers constantly repeat that claim, but, in practice, that is not quite the case. Why is it that identical questions can be tabled to the Welsh Development Agency and to the Welsh Assembly Government, and in the version released by the Welsh Assembly Government, large parts of the written response, appropriately, have been edited, whereas, in the version from the Welsh Development Agency, the response is

Tŷ wedi ystyried y cynnig hwn, yn yr un modd â'r Llywodraeth, ac yr ydym yn gytûn mai dyma'r ffordd orau i ymdrin â'r gweithdrefnau ar gyfer datgelu gwybodaeth. Anogaf yr Aelodau i gefnogi'r cynnig.

Yn ail, mae rhai swyddogaethau wedi'u datganoli i Bwyllgor y Tŷ, a'r pwyllgor yn gyfrifol amdanynt. Ond mae yna faterion eraill nad yw Pwyllgor y Tŷ yn gyfrifol amdanynt ac na ddylai fod yn gyfrifol amdanynt, er enghraifft, rhyddhau gwybodaeth yng nghyd-destun pwyllgorau pwnc. Dyna paham na chewch gymesuredd llwyr rhwng dirprwyaethau i'r Prif Weinidog a dirprwyaethau i Bwyllgor y Tŷ. Pan ddirprwyir i staff, wrth gwrs, y Clerc fydd yn penderfynu yn y pen draw, ac ef fydd yn gyfrifol amdano. Fodd bynnag, fe fydd protocol lle bydd y Clerc yn ymgynghori â'r Llywydd er mwyn sicrhau bod Aelodau etholedig yn cael eu cynnwys mewn unrhyw ddatgeliadau cyn eu gwneud. Gyda'r esboniad hwnnw, ni allaf ond pwysleisio eto bod yn rhaid gwneud hyn, ac yr ydym o'r farn mai dyma'r ffordd orau i wneud hynny. Anogaf yr Aelodau i gefnogi'r cynnig.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Croesawaf yr ymrwymiad a fynegwyd gan yr Aelodau i lywodraeth agored, a rhaid inni gofio bod ein Cod Ymarfer ar Ganiatáu i'r Cyhoedd Wedd Gwybodaeth yn cynnig fframwaith inni, nid yn unig ar gyfer cydymffurfio â Deddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000, ond hefyd ar gyfer mynd y tu hwnt i'r hyn a oedd yn ofynnol, fel y buom yn ei wneud am y pedair blynedd diwethaf.

Alun Cairns: Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ac aelodau meinciau ôl Llafur yn ailadrodd yr honiad hwnnw yn gyson, ond mewn gwirionedd nid yw hynny'n gwbl gywir. Pam y gellir cyflwyno'r un cwestiynau'n union i Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, a'r fersiwn sy'n cael ei rhyddhau gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cynnwys rhannau helaeth o'r ymateb ysgrifenedig wedi'u golygu, yn briodol, ond y fersiwn gan Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru yn rhyddhau'r

released in its entirety? That clearly highlights an inconsistency and a much tighter approach on behalf of the Welsh Assembly Government, which claims to be far more open.

Jane Hutt: When you consider that 548 requests have been made under the Freedom of Information Act 2000 since January, and that we have only had one or two complaints about the way in which we have handled requests, you will see that the openness comes through as a result of our Code of Practice on Public Access to Information and the fact that we have embraced it. This is not relevant to this particular delegation, but, with regard to the points that Brynle made, that takes us forward in ensuring that we have good governance. That is why I brought forward this delegation, to ensure that, as the Deputy Presiding Officer said, everyone is clear about who is responsible in this respect in terms of the Welsh Assembly Government and the Assembly Parliamentary Service. Also, issues have been raised today that are not relevant to the delegation under discussion, but which nonetheless are useful to note, and, as with Mick's point on the information commissioner under the Scottish arrangement—I believe that we will be, and are being, well served by the Information Commissioner's Office—we listen to those points and take them on board. You made your point, Alun, but today is about ensuring clarity as to who is responsible for decisions and judgments across the Assembly, in the Welsh Assembly Government, the House Committee and the Assembly Parliamentary Service. I am glad to urge support for the delegation on that basis.

ymateb yn gyfan? Mae hynny'n amlwg yn tynnu sylw at anghysondeb ac ymagwedd fwy caeth o lawer ar ran Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, sy'n honni bod lawer yn fwy agored.

Jane Hutt: Pan ystyriwch fod 548 o geisiadau wedi'u gwneud o dan Ddeddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000 ers mis Ionawr, ac mai dim ond un neu ddwy o gwynion a gawsom am y ffordd yr ydym wedi ymdrin â cheisiadau, fe welwch fod bod yn agored yn amlwg o ganlyniad i'n Cod Ymarfer ar Ganiatáu i'r Cyhoedd Weld Gwybodaeth, a'r ffaith ein bod wedi ei arddel yn llawn. Nid yw hyn yn berthnasol i'r ddirprwyaeth benodol hon, ond o ran y pwyntiau a wnaed gan Brynle, mae hyn yn ein tywys yn ein blaenau wrth sicrhau bod gennym lywodraethu da. Dyna pam y deuthum â'r ddirprwyaeth hon ymlaen, i sicrhau, fel y dywed y Dirprwy Lywydd, fod pawb yn deall pwy sy'n gyfrifol yn y cyd-destun hwn o ran Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad. Hefyd, codwyd materion heddiw nad ydynt yn berthnasol i'r ddirprwyaeth dan sylw ond sydd, serch hynny, yn ddefnyddiol i'w nodi. Ac fel y dywedodd Mick am y comisiynydd gwybodaeth o dan y trefniant yn yr Alban--yr wyf o'r farn ein bod yn cael ac y byddwn yn cael gwasanaeth da gan Swyddfa'r Comisiynydd Gwybodaeth--yr ydym yn gwranddo ar y pwyntiau hynny ac yn eu hystyried. Gwnaethoch eich pwynt, Alun, ond mae heddiw'n ymwneud â sicrhau eglurder o ran pwy sy'n gyfrifol am benderfyniadau a dyfarniadau ar draws y Cynulliad, yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, Pwyllgor y Tŷ a Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad. Mae'n bleser gennyf eich annog i gefnogi'r ddirprwyaeth ar y sail honno.

Cynnig (NDM2476): O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM2476): For 54, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun

Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

**Canlyniad yr Ymgynghoriad ar y Polisi o uno'r Cyrff Cyhoeddus a Noddir gan
y Cynulliad
The Outcome of the Consultation on the Policy of the Assembly Sponsored
Public Bodies Merger**

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2, 3 a 4 yn enw Kirsty Williams, gwelliant 5 yn enw Jocelyn Davies a gwelliannau 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15 a 16 yn enw David Melding.

The Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1, 2, 3 and 4 in the name of Kirsty Williams, amendment 5 in the name of Jocelyn Davies and amendments 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15 and 16 in the name of David Melding.

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): I Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan):

propose that

the National Assembly for Wales

notes the outcome of the consultation exercise that was carried out by the Welsh Assembly Government on the mergers of the Welsh Development Agency (WDA), the Wales Tourist Board (WTB) and the National Council for Education and Training for Wales (ELWa), which was published on 24 May 2005. (NDM2481)

I announced the mergers of the Welsh Development Agency, the Wales Tourist Board, and Education and Learning Wales with the relevant Assembly Government Departments on 14 July 2004, and I made a further announcement of other ASPB areas of responsibility on 30 November 2004, dealing with Health Professions Wales, the Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales and the Welsh Language Board. The mergers consultation document fits into the public service reform agenda to provide better services for the people of Wales, create a much stronger force to improve public services, put citizens and communities centre stage, empower the citizens of Wales and stakeholders of the ASPBs, and ensure that users and providers can work together in the design and delivery of services to create a potent service force to drive up service quality and provide a more integrated Welsh public service structure that has clearer accountabilities, simpler structures and lower transaction costs that can be widely and easily understood, and more efficient and effective public services.

The mergers are a step forward in simplifying Government and the process of devolution, and they will provide an integrated, best-in-class, improved Welsh public service that is fit for purpose and which puts the customer first and delivers better value for money. Essentially, they will mean a culture change for the civil service, as well as a name change and much else for the ASPBs. For the customer, it will involve business as usual or better.

Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

yn nodi canlyniad yr ymarfer ymgynghori a gyflawnwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ynghylch cyfuno Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru (ADC), Bwrdd Croeso Cymru (BCC) a Chyngor Cenedlaethol Cymru dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant (ELWa), a gyhoeddwyd ar 24 Mai 2005. (NDM2481)

Cyhoeddais y byddai Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, Bwrdd Croeso Cymru a Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru yn cael eu huno â'r Adranau perthnasol yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar 14 Gorffennaf 2004, a gwneuthum gyhoeddiad pellach ar feysydd cyfrifoldeb CCNC eraill ar 30 Tachwedd 2004, gan ymdrin â Phroffesiynau Iechyd Cymru, Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru a Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg. Mae'r ddogfen ymgynghori ar yr uno yn gydnaws â'r agenda diwygio gwasanaethau cyhoeddus i ddarparu gwasanaethau gwell i bobl Cymru, gan greu grym cryfach o lawer i wella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, gosod dinasyddion a chymunedau ar ganol y llwyfan, grymuso dinasyddion Cymru a rhanddeiliaid y CCNC. Bydd hefyd yn sicrhau y gall defnyddwyr a darparwyr gydweithio wrth gynllunio a darparu gwasanaethau i greu grym gwasanaeth pwerus i godi ansawdd gwasanaethau a darparu strwythur gwasanaeth cyhoeddus mwy integredig yng Nghymru. Bydd i'r strwythur hwnnw atebolrwydd cliriach, strwythurau symlach a chostau is ar gyfer trafodion y gellir eu deall yn helaeth ac yn hawdd, a gwasanaethau cyhoeddus mwy effeithlon ac effeithiol.

Mae'r uno yn gam ymlaen wrth symleiddio Llywodraeth a'r broses ddatganoli, a bydd yn cynnig gwasanaeth cyhoeddus integredig, gwell yng Nghymru sydd heb ei ail ac a fydd yn wasanaeth addas at ei ddiben, sef rhoi'r cwsmer yn gyntaf a darparu gwell gwerth am yr arian. Yn ei hanfod bydd yn golygu newid diwylliant i'r gwasanaeth sifil, yn ogystal â newid enw a llawer iawn mwy i'r CCNC. I'r cwsmer, bydd yn golygu'r busnes arferol neu well.

Alun Cairns: A key benefit of the merger is the cost savings that you have just highlighted in your opening remarks. Is it therefore not reasonable for us to ask for a detailed breakdown of where this £10.6 million comes from? The information provided so far has been extremely broad, and it has not been accepted by the wider community as being clear enough.

The First Minister: I am not sure if I accept your definition of 'the wider community', but I will come to this point in more detail later in my speech.

I launched the consultation on the first three ASPB mergers on 19 January. We consulted a wide range of organisations, seeking ideas and views on how the proposed structures could best meet the needs of our customers. Ministers, senior officials and I have met key stakeholders to discuss the proposals set out in the consultation paper. The consultation ended on 15 April 2005, and I was very impressed with the quality of responses received from a wide range of organisations, and I thank all those who participated. The views we received were very constructive by and large, and they will play an important role in the implementation of the newly merged organisations. The 125 responses were analysed collaboratively, involving staff from across the ASPBs and Assembly Government officials and Ministers. The outcome of the consultation, including the key themes that emerged, is summarised in the report that is now available.

One of the six key themes that emerged was regional delivery wherever possible. We support that conclusion—it is not different from the conclusion that we were drawing ourselves. It means different things in different circumstances. Where there is a north Wales office, it does not exclude staff who are already undertaking all-Wales functions but from a north Wales office, as happens with ELWa, and that will continue. The staff will continue to have full freedom to deliver an all-Wales function, where appropriate, from a place that is a long way from Cardiff. Regional delivery was strongly seen as something to be supported, and we

Alun Cairns: Un o brif fuddiannau'r uno fydd yr arbedion cost yr ydych newydd dynnu sylw atynt yn eich sylwadau agoriadol. Onid yw, felly, yn rhesymol inni ofyn am ddadansoddiad manwl o ble y daw'r £10.6 miliwn hwn? Mae'r wybodaeth a ddarparwyd hyd yma wedi bod yn hynod gyffredinol, ac nid yw'r gymuned ehangach wedi derbyn ei bod yn ddigon eglur.

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn siŵr a wyf yn derbyn eich diffiniad o'r 'gymuned ehangach', ond manylaf ar y pwynt hwnnw yn nes ymlaen yn fy araith.

Lansiwyd yr ymgynghori ar uno'r tri CCNC cyntaf ar 19 Ionawr. Ymgynghorwyd ag amrywiaeth helaeth o sefydliadau, gan geisio syniadau a barn am y modd y gallai'r strwythurau arfaethedig ddiwallu anghenion ein cwsmeriaid orau. Mae Gweinidogion, uwch swyddogion a minnau wedi cyfarfod â rhanddeiliaid allweddol i drafod y cynigion sydd wedi eu gosod allan yn y papur ymgynghorol. Daeth yr ymgynghori i ben ar 15 Ebrill 2005, ac fe'm plesiodd yn fawr gan ansawdd yr ymatebion a gafwyd gan ystod eang o sefydliadau, ac yr wyf yn diolch i'r rheini a gymerodd ran. Roedd y sylwadau a gafwyd yn adeiladol iawn ar y cyfan, a byddant yn bwysig yn y broses o weithredu'r sefydliadau hyn wrth eu huno. Dadansoddwyd y 125 o ymatebion ar y cyd, gan gynnwys staff o'r CCNC, swyddogion a Gweinidogion Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Caiff canlyniad yr ymgynghori, gan gynnwys y prif themâu a ddaeth i'r amlwg, ei grynhoi yn yr adroddiad sydd bellach ar gael.

Un o'r chwe thema allweddol a ddaeth i'r amlwg oedd darpariaeth ranbarthol lle bynnag y mae'n bosibl. Yr ydym yn cefnogi'r casgliad hwnnw—nid yw'n wahanol i'r casgliadau yr oeddem yn eu llunio ein hunain. Golyga bethau gwahanol mewn amgylchiadau gwahanol. Pan fydd swyddfa yn y Gogledd, nid yw'n eithrio staff sydd eisoes yn ymgymryd â swyddogaethau Cymru gyfan, ond o swyddfa yn y Gogledd, fel sy'n digwydd gydag ELWa, a bydd hynny'n parhau. Bydd gan y staff ryddid o hyd i gyflawni swyddogaeth ar draws Cymru gyfan, lle mae'n briodol, o le sydd ymhell o Gaerdydd. Roedd teimlad cryf y dylid

support that.

On the account management system for key business customers, this is already developed to a degree with the Welsh Development Agency, but it needs to be spread across the economic development and transport and education and lifelong learning departments, and the three quangos being brought in. We want to get it on very quickly in order to have a more robust relationship with key customers such as Airbus or Ford. There is no reason why there should be one account manager on the skills side for Airbus and another on the physical investment in plant, machinery and buildings side. The same applies to Ford in Bridgend, and so on. It would be one account manager per big customer, not two or three or none at all, as we might have at the moment. We support integration across the account manager system, and the point was strongly made in the consultation.

On performance indicators, we want to know where we are now, so that we can say whether or not there is measurable improvement, and we fully accept that. The same goes for benchmarking and robust evaluation—they are all part of robust performance indication.

Lisa Francis: One of the aims of the merger seems to be that we should have better customer-focused delivery. Do you agree that it would be important to achieve that by implementing independent monitoring of customer service delivery?

The First Minister: That depends on what you mean by ‘independent’. Benchmarking is not possible if you do not ask someone who is reasonably independent to do it, nor can you undertake robust evaluation internally because no-one will find it dependable. However, the principle of what you said is absolutely right.

I turn to decision making and retaining expertise, and ensuring that there is business continuity and that all business continuity

cefnogi darpariaeth ranbarthol, ac yr ydym yn cefnogi hynny.

O ran y system rheoli cyfrifon ar gyfer cwsmeriaid busnes allweddol, mae hyn eisoes wedi’i datblygu i raddau gydag Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru. Ond bydd angen ei ledaenu ar draws adrannau datblygu economaidd a thrafnidiaeth ac addysg a dysgu gydol oes, a’r tri chwango sy’n cael eu huno. Yr ydym am ddatblygu hyn ar fyrder er mwyn sicrhau perthynas gadarnach â chwsmeriaid allweddol fel Airbus neu Ford. Nid oes unrhyw rheswm pam na ddylid cael un rheolwr cyfrifon ar yr ochr sgiliau ar gyfer Airbus ac un arall ar fuddsoddi ffisegol mewn offer, peirianwaith ac adeiladau. Mae’r un peth yn berthnasol i Ford ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, ac yn y blaen, sef un rheolwr cyfrifon am bob cwsmer mawr, nid dau neu dri neu ddim o gwbl, fel a all fod yn wir ar hyn o bryd. Yr ydym yn cefnogi proses integreiddio ar draws y system rheolwyr cyfrifon, a gwnaed y pwynt yn gryf yn ystod yr ymgynghori.

O ran dangosyddion perfformiad, yr ydym am wybod ble yr ydym arni ar hyn o bryd, er mwyn inni allu dweud a oes yna welliant y gellir ei fesur, a derbyniwn hynny’n llwyr. Mae’r un peth yn wir am feincnodi a gwerthuso trwyadl—maent i gyd yn rhan o ddangosydd perfformiad trwyadl.

Lisa Francis: Ymddengys mai un o nodau’r rhaglen uno yw y dylai fod gennym well darpariaeth sy’n canolbwyntio ar gwsmeriaid. A gytunwch y byddai’n bwysig cyflawni hynny drwy broses fonitro annibynnol o ddarparu gwasanaeth cwsmeriaid?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae hynny’n dibynnu ar yr hyn a olygwch wrth ‘annibynnol’. Nid yw meincnodi yn bosibl os na ofynnwch i rywun sy’n rhesymol o annibynnol ei wneud. Ni allwch ychwaith ymgymryd â gwerthusiad trwyadl yn fewnol am na fydd neb yn credu ei fod yn ddibynadwy. Fodd bynnag, mae egwyddor yr hyn a ddywedwch yn gwbl gywir.

Trof at y broses o lunio penderfyniadau a diogelu arbenigedd, a sicrhau parhad busnes a bod yr holl barhad busnes yn arwain at

points in an upward direction as regards service delivery. There will be a staff churn—not everyone will fit into the new structure, because that never happens. Whenever there is change, there is some pain. Ensuring business continuity and business as usual or better as a standard is something that we strongly support.

On the departmental structures, people want to know where they are. This is primarily a staff point, rather than a customer point, but work is progressing well on the issue, and the Permanent Secretary will publish the proposed senior management structures of the newly merged departments by the end of the month. Full departmental structures will be announced before the end of the summer, preferably before the beginning of the recess, and we will be consulting staff and trade unions on those structures.

On advisory panels, external advice will play a key role in joining up policy and in service delivery.

3.30 p.m.

The advisory panels or ASPB boards that we currently have make an independent contribution in evaluating effectiveness, identifying long-term trends, strategy and innovation in public-service delivery. I expect to make a further announcement about the number of panels and their remit later on, but, although we will have integrated account management for the big customers, one can imagine that that does not mean that you can have one advisory panel for the entire business world. It is more likely—although I do not want to pre-empt any further announcements on this—that you will need some form of advisory panel in the skills and lifelong learning area, another one, almost certainly, for tourism and likewise for economic development, where we effectively have two at the moment. One, the Welsh Industrial Development Advisory Board, is primarily involved in trying to stop Ministers spending money unwisely, and one, the Welsh Development Agency board, is primarily involved in trying to spend public money. Trying to integrate the stopper and starter functions at that level will almost

welliant mewn darpariaeth gwasanaethau. Bydd newidiadau o ran staff—ni fydd y strwythur newydd yn cynnwys pawb, gan nad yw hynny bydd yn digwydd. Pryd bynnag y bydd newidiadau, bydd rhywfaint o ddiodef. Yr ydym yn gefnogol iawn i sicrhau parhad busnes a busnes arferol neu well fel safon arferol.

O ran strwythurau adrannol, mae ar bobl angen gwybod ble maent yn sefyll. Mae hyn yn ymwneud yn bennaf â staff yn hytrach na chwsmeriaid, ond mae gwaith yn mynd rhagddo'n dda ar y mater hwn. Bydd yr Ysgrifennydd Parhaol yn cyhoeddi strwythurau uwch reoli arfaethedig yr adrannau a fydd wedi'u huno erbyn diwedd y mis. Caiff strwythurau adrannol llawn eu cyhoeddi erbyn diwedd yr haf, yn ddelfrydol cyn y toriad, a byddwn yn ymgynghori â staff ac undebau llafur am y strwythurau hynny.

O ran paneli cynghori, bydd cyngor allanol yn chwarae rhan allweddol wrth gyfuno polisi a darparu gwasanaethau.

Mae'r paneli cynghori neu'r byrddau CCNC sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd yn cyfrannu'n annibynnol wrth werthuso effeithiolrwydd, nodi tueddiadau tymor hir, strategaeth ac arloesedd wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Disgwyliaf wneud cyhoeddiad pellach yn ddiweddarach ynglŷn â nifer y paneli a'u cylch gwaith, ond er y bydd gennym reolaeth cyfrifon integredig ar gyfer y cwsmeriaid mawr, gallwch ddychmygu nad yw hynny'n golygu y gallwch gael un panel ymgynghorol ar gyfer yr holl fyd busnes. Mae'n fwy tebygol—er nad wyf am achub y blaen ar unrhyw gyhoeddiadau pellach ar hyn—y bydd angen rhyw fath o banel ymgynghorol arnoch yn y maes sgiliau a dysgu gydol oes, un arall, bron yn sicr, ar gyfer twristiaeth ac un ar gyfer datblygu economaidd, lle mae gennym ddau i bob pwrpas ar hyn o bryd. Mae un, sef Bwrdd Ymgynghorol Datblygu Diwydiannol Cymru, yn ymwneud yn bennaf â cheisio atal Gweinidogion rhag gwario arian yn annoeth, ac un, sef bwrdd Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, yn ymwneud yn bennaf â cheisio gwario arian cyhoeddus. Bydd ceisio

certainly feature in the final design of the advisory panels.

Moving on to legislation, we are currently consulting on the draft legislation to formally abolish the boards of four bodies, namely the WDA, the Wales Tourist Board, Education and Learning Wales and the Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales, and merge their functions into the administration. That consultation ends on 15 July. The legislation will then be presented to the Assembly immediately after the summer recess, with the intent that it should be in place before the end of the year.

As regards the second wave of announcements, the new Culture Department will be at the forefront of delivering a more integrated approach to cultural and language policy and building synergies between the stakeholders involved in those fields. We hope that that will be implemented by 1 April 2007.

A consultation on the closure of Health Professions Wales will be taking place shortly and it will seek views on the establishment of a workforce-development education commissioning unit as part of the National Leadership and Innovation Agency for Healthcare in Wales. Work is also continuing to bring Tir Gofal into the Assembly Government's Environment, Planning and Countryside Department, from the Countryside Council for Wales.

I will come back to the amendments and will cover the point that Alun Cairns raised in my closing remarks.

Kirsty Williams: I propose the following amendments in my name. Amendment 1: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

notes that the success or otherwise of the merger will be judged by the extent to which there is a discernible improvement in service delivery, with effect from the first day of the merger.

I propose amendment 2. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

integreiddio'r swyddogaethau atal a chychwyn ar y lefel honno bron yn sicr yn rhan o gynllun terfynol y paneli cynghori.

I droi at ddeddfwriaeth, yr ydym ar hyn o bryd yn ymgynghori am y ddeddfwriaeth drafft i ddiddymu byrddau pedwar corff yn ffurfiol, sef WDA, Bwrdd Croeso Cymru, Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru ac Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru, gan uno eu swyddogaethau yn y weinyddiaeth. Daw'r ymgynghori hwnnw i ben ar 15 Gorffennaf. Yna caiff y ddeddfwriaeth ei chyflwyno i'r Cynulliad yn union ar ôl toriad yr haf, gyda'r bwriad o'i rhoi ar waith cyn diwedd y flwyddyn.

O ran yr ail don o gyhoeddiadau, bydd yr Adran Ddiwylliant newydd ar flaen y gad yn cyflwyno ymagwedd fwy integredig tuag at bolisi diwylliannol ac iaith a chreu synergeddau rhwng y rhanddeiliaid sy'n gysylltiedig â'r meysydd hynny. Gobeithiwn y caiff hynny ei weithredu erbyn 1 Ebrill 2007.

Bydd ymgynghori'n digwydd yn fuan ar gau Proffesiynau Iechyd Cymru, a bydd yn ceisio barn am sefydlu uned i gomisiynu addysg datblygiad gweithlu fel rhan o'r Asiantaeth Genedlaethol Arwain ac Arloesi mewn Gofal Iechyd yng Nghymru. Mae gwaith hefyd yn mynd rhagddo i drosglwyddo Tir Gofal i Adran Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o Gyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru.

Byddaf yn dychwelyd at y gwelliannau ac yn ymdrin â'r pwynt a gododd Alun Cairns yn fy sylwadau cloi.

Kirsty Williams: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn fy enw i. Gwelliant 1: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

y bydd llwyddiant yr uno neu fel arall yn cael ei farnu yn ôl y graddau y ceir gwelliant amlwg wrth ddarparu gwasanaeth, o ddiwrnod cyntaf yr uno.

Cynigiau welliant 2. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

expresses concern that the merger process will take the focus away from service delivery; that staff and expertise could be lost; and requires service delivery to be no less customer orientated than before the merger was announced.

I propose amendment 3. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

requires the Assembly Government to publish, by 31 December 2005, a full financial statement of the extra resources committed to the change management programme.

I propose amendment 4. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

requires the Assembly Government to provide certainty of the roles for which staff will be required by 14 July 2005 in order to retain skills and expertise.

On 14 July last year, the First Minister decided to stage his own storming of the Bastille, but rather than saying 'Off with their heads' to the aristocrats, he decided that it was the quangos that he wanted to send to the guillotine, with Andrew Davies, in the supporting role of Madame Defage, knitting by the side of it.

This decision—what the First Minister calls 'the defining project' of the Assembly—to axe the WDA, WTB and ELWa and bring them in-house has belatedly been the subject of a consultation. I am glad that, at last, those involved have been able to have their say, although it would have been better, and would have seemed to me to make much more sense, had they been given that chance before the die was cast.

The overriding issue for the Welsh Liberal Democrats now is that which the WDA board raised in its response to the consultation exercise: what this will mean to customers. I quote the board when it says that:

'The success or otherwise of the merger will

yn mynegi pryder y bydd y broses uno yn tynnu sylw oddi ar ddarparu gwasanaethau; y gellid colli staff ac arbenigedd; ac yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i ddarparu gwasanaethau ganolbwyntio lawn cymaint ar y cwsmer ar ôl cyhoeddi'r uno ag yr ydoedd gynt.

Cynigiad welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad gyhoeddi, erbyn 31 Rhagfyr 2005, ddatganiad ariannol llawn o'r adnoddau ychwanegol a ymrwymwyd i'r rhaglen rheoli newid.

Cynigiad welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn gofyn bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn rhoi sicrwydd o'r swyddogaethau y bydd angen staff ar eu cyfer erbyn 14 Gorffennaf 2005, er mwyn cadw gafaél ar sgiliau ac arbenigedd.

Ar 14 Gorffennaf y llynedd, penderfynodd y Prif Weinidog drefnu ei ymosodiad ei hun ar y Bastille. Ond yn hytrach na dweud 'Torrwch eu pennau i ffwrdd' wrth yr uchelwyr, penderfynodd mai'r cwangos oedd y rhai yr oedd am eu hanfon i'r gilofin, gydag Andrew Davies, yn rôl ategol Madame Defage, yn gwau wrth ei ochr.

Mae'r penderfyniad hwn—yr hyn a eilw'r Prif Weinidog yn 'brosiect diffiniol' y Cynulliad—i ddileu WDA, Bwrdd Croeso Cymru ac ELWa a'u rhoi o dan adain y Cynulliad wedi bod, yn rhy ddiweddar, yn destun ymgynghori. Yr wyf yn falch fod y rheini sy'n gysylltiedig â hyn o'r diwedd wedi cael dweud eu dweud, er y buasai'n well, ac wedi gwneud llawer mwy o synnwyr yn fy marn i, pe baent wedi cael y cyfle hwnnw cyn gwneud y penderfyniad.

Y mater hollbwysig i Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn awr yw'r hyn a godwyd gan fwrdd WDA yn ei ymateb i'r ymarfer ymgynghori: beth fydd hyn yn ei olygu i gwsmeriaid. Dyfynnaf y bwrdd pan ddywed :

y bydd llwyddiant yr uno neu fel arall yn

be judged by the extent to which there is a discernible improvement in service delivery to customers, with effect from 1 April 2006.'

The Welsh Liberal Democrat group has proposed four amendments, which reflect our concerns that, to date, there seems to be little evidence that that will be achieved. Instead, the evidence suggests that the Ministers and their advisers were tired and wary of the autonomy of bodies implementing Assembly policy, and wanted to bring them under a tighter rein. The danger in removing these bodies is that we will lose the expertise of their staff and board members, and it is important that the baby is not lost with the bath water.

Anyone who knows anything about organisations will know that form must follow function, and there is little evidence that that has been the case in this reorganisation. Indeed, this morning in the Economic Development and Transport Committee, a Confederation of British Industry representative said that he was unaware of any discussions around issues of function and that they had all been about form. If this organisation is truly about delivering for its customers, whether students, business or tourism, it is worrying that those at the front end are not aware of the mountains of work that the Minister claims that he has done on this issue.

The independent monitoring and evaluation of performance is crucial. The Minister says that he wants a reasonable amount of independence; in this case, I would call it an unreasonable amount.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.34 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.34 p.m.*

Amendment 2 develops these ideas. We need to ensure that, during the merger process, the services that all three organisations provide continue to be of a high quality. Between them, these quangos spend billions of pounds of public money and they play a crucial role in terms of spending structural funds, supporting businesses, developing tourism and giving people the skills that they need to play their part in an ever-changing world.

cael ei farnu yn ôl y graddau y ceir gwelliant amlwg yn y gwasanaethau a ddarperir i gwsmeriaid o 1 Ebrill 2006 ymlaen.

Mae grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru wedi cynnig pedwar gwelliant, sy'n adlewyrchu ein pryderon nad oes, hyd yma, fawr ddim tystiolaeth y caiff hynny ei gyflawni. Yn lle hynny, awgryma'r dystiolaeth fod y Gweinidogion a'u cynghorwyr wedi blino ar ymreolaeth cyrff a oedd yn gweithredu polisi'r Cynulliad ac yn ofnus ohonynt ac am eu rheoli'n fwy llym. Y perygl wrth ddileu'r cyrff hyn yw y byddwn yn colli arbenigedd eu staff ac aelodau eu byrddau, ac mae'n bwysig inni beidio â chadw'r brych a lluchio'r babi.

Bydd unrhyw un sy'n gwybod unrhyw beth am sefydliadau yn gwybod bod yn rhaid i ffurf ddilyn swyddogaeth, ac nid oes llawer o dystiolaeth bod hynny wedi digwydd yn y broses ailstrwythuro hon. Yn wir, y bore yma yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth, dywedodd cynrychiolydd o Gydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain na wyddai am unrhyw drafodaethau ynghylch materion swyddogaeth, a'u bod oll wedi ymwneud â ffurf. Os yw'r sefydliad hwn o ddifrif yn ymwneud â darparu ar gyfer ei gwsmeriaid, boed yn fyfyrwyr, busnesau neu dwristiaeth, mae'n ofid nad yw'r rhai yn y rheng flaen yn ymwybodol o'r holl waith y mae'r Gweinidog yn honni iddo ei wneud ar y mater hwn.

Mae monitro a gwerthuso perfformiad yn annibynnol yn hollbwysig. Dywed y Gweinidog ei fod am gael lefel resymol o annibyniaeth; yn yr achos hwn, byddwn yn dweud ei bod yn lefel afresymol.

Mae gwelliant 2 yn datblygu'r syniadau hyn. Mae angen inni sicrhau, yn ystod y broses uno, fod y gwasanaethau a ddarperir gan y tri sefydliad yn parhau o safon uchel. Rhyngddynt, mae'r cwangos hyn yn gwario biliynau o bunnoedd o arian cyhoeddus ac yn chwarae rhan hollbwysig wrth wario cronfeydd strwythurol, cefnogi busnesau, datblygu twristiaeth a rhoi'r sgiliau sydd eu hangen ar bobl i wneud eu rhan mewn byd

These bodies carry out their duties according to the remit letter set by the Minister, and they are, or at least they should be, doing the Minister's bidding. It is vital that, in considering their future, we do not totally take our eye off the ball.

It is inevitable that those people working within these organisations will find the reorganisation hugely distracting. One high-profile tourism operator has already gone on record as saying that she felt that her company had been done down in terms of the development of future projects, because of the inattention of the WDA and its staff. They must continue to be outward looking and responsive to the needs of their customers, be they business people, learners or tourists.

While the absorption of Assembly sponsored public bodies promises to save money in the longer term, it seems inevitable that costs will be incurred in the short term. Our amendment 3 will ensure that Assembly Members and the wider public can scrutinise the money spent on the change management programme. Scrutiny is one of the great question marks that hang over this project. The fear, perhaps most eloquently voiced by Professor Kevin Morgan in his articles for the Institute of Welsh Affairs, is shared much more widely. The scrutiny of ASPBs was previously carried out by Ministers, their boards and Assembly Members. It could be argued that they were the most scrutinised bodies in the UK. In the future, with the Minister in the driving seat, there will be a heavy burden on Assembly Members to ensure that scrutiny is maintained, and a full financial statement will assist us greatly in that regard.

This morning, we identified the fact that the statement of savings already provided by the Government cannot be backed up by significant detail. That fact was not only highlighted by opposition Members, but by the Welsh Local Government Association, the Confederation of British Industry Wales and the unions, who all gave evidence this morning. The costings are not fully worked up, and the first issue that needs to be addressed is the pension black hole of over

sy'n newid. Mae'r cyrff hyn yn cyflawni eu dyletswyddau yn ôl y llythyr cylch gwaith a bennir gan y Gweinidog, ac maent, neu o leiaf dylent fod, yn gwneud fel y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei orchymyn. Mae'n hollbwysig, wrth ystyried eu dyfodol, inni beidio â cholli golwg ar hyn.

Mae'n anochel y bydd yr ad-drefnu'n cael effaith fawr ar y bobl hynny sy'n gweithio yn y sefydliadau hyn. Mae un weithredwraig twristiaeth amlwg eisoes wedi dweud yn gyhoeddus ei bod yn teimlo bod ei chwmmi wedi cael cam gwael wrth ddatblygu prosiectau yn y dyfodol, oherwydd esgeulustod WDA a'i staff. Rhaid iddynt barhau i fod yn flaengar ac ymatebol i anghenion eu cwsmeriaid, boed yn bobl fusnes, dysgwyr neu dwristiaid.

Er bod ymgorffori cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad yn addo arbed arian yn y tymor hwy, ymddengys yn anochel y tynnir costau yn y tymor byr. Bydd ein gwelliant 3 yn sicrhau y gall Aelodau'r Cynulliad a'r cyhoedd yn fwy cyffredinol graffu ar y ffordd y caiff arian ei wario ar y rhaglen rheoli newid. Y broses graffu yw un o'r amheuon ynglŷn â'r prosiect hwn. Mae'r pryder, a leisiwyd efallai yn fwyaf huawdl gan yr Athro Kevin Morgan yn ei erthyglau ar gyfer y Sefydliad Materion Cymreig, yn fwy eang o lawer. Câl'r gwaith o graffu ar CCNC ei gyflawni gynt gan Weinidogion, eu byrddau ac Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Gellid dadlau mai hwy oedd y cyrff a oedd fwyaf agored i'r broses graffu yn y DU. Yn y dyfodol, gyda'r Gweinidog wrth y llyw, bydd baich mawr ar ysgwyddau Aelodau'r Cynulliad i sicrhau bod y broses graffu yn parhau, a bydd datganiad ariannol llawn yn ein helpu'n fawr iawn yn hynny o beth.

Y bore yma, nodwyd y ffaith na all y datganiad arbedion a ddarparwyd eisoes gan y Llywodraeth gael ei ategu gan wybodaeth fanwl. Tynnwyd sylw at y ffaith honno nid yn unig gan Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau, ond gan Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain Cymru a'r undebau, y rhoddodd pob un ohonynt dystiolaeth y bore yma. Nid yw'r costau wedi eu gweithio allan yn llwyr eto, a'r broblem gyntaf y mae angen ymdrin â hi

£40 million that exists in the WDA sector.

yw'r diffyg o dros £40 miliwn mewn pensiynau yn sector WDA.

Our amendment 4 considers the role of the staff in these organisations. They deserve to know what their roles will be in the new organisations. In a letter sent to staff yesterday, the First Minister has already had to scramble to say that redundancies will be kept to a minimum. However, some people in the media have already spoken of 200 job losses, and I suspect that there will be many more. Those members of staff need to know what their roles will be in the new organisations. I am sure that the promise given this morning that they could be shunted into the NHS will be of no comfort to them.

Mae ein gwelliant 4 yn ystyried rôl y staff yn y sefydliadau hyn. Maent yn haeddu gwybod beth fydd eu rolau yn y sefydliadau newydd. Mewn llythyr a anfonwyd at staff ddoe, mae'r Prif Weinidog eisoes wedi gorfod rhuthro i ddweud y ceisir sicrhau cyn lleied â phosibl o ddiswyddiadau. Fodd bynnag, mae rhai pobl yn y cyfryngau eisoes wedi sôn am golli 200 o swyddi, a thybiaf y caiff llawer mwy eu colli. Mae angen i'r aelodau staff hynny wybod beth fydd eu rolau yn y sefydliadau newydd. Yr wyf yn siŵr na fydd yr addewid a roddwyd y bore yma y gallent gael eu symud i'r GIG o unrhyw gysur iddynt.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Cynigiaf welliant 5 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I propose amendment 5 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gynhyrchu adroddiadau rheolaidd i'r pwyllgorau Cynulliad perthnasol ynglŷn â chost rhaglen uno'r cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad; ac i ddatgelu gerbron Cyfarfod Llawn y Cynulliad ei chynlluniau i wella'r broses o graffu ar bolisi'r Llywodraeth a gwariant yn y meysydd polisi hynny yr effeithir arnynt drwy uno CCNC.

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to produce regular reports to the relevant Assembly committees on the cost of the Assembly sponsored public body merger programme; and to disclose to the Assembly in Plenary its plans to improve the scrutiny of Government policy and spending in those policy areas affected by the ASPB mergers.

Mae'r gwelliant yn cyfeirio at ddau bwynt yn benodol, sef cost cael gwared ar y cwangos hynny y cyfeiriodd y Prif Weinidog atynt ac y mae'n ymgynghori arnynt ar hyn o bryd, a phwysigrwydd sicrhau bod elfen gryfach o graffu ar y cyfrifoldebau a drosglwyddir i'r Llywodraeth wedi i'r cwangos gael eu diddymu.

The amendment refers to two specific points, namely the cost of abolishing those quangos to which the First Minister referred and on which he is consulting at the moment, and the importance of ensuring that there is a stronger element of scrutiny of the responsibilities to be transferred to the Government when the quangos have been wound up.

Hoffwn ailadrodd rhai o'r pwyntiau a wnaeth Kirsty Williams ar yr elfen o graffu. Dywedodd y Prif Weinidog wrth agor y ddadl hon y croesawyd y ddogfen ymgynghorol. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod oll wedi cael gwybodaeth gan y gwahanol gyrff a fu'n rhan o'r broses ymgynghori sy'n dangos bod pryderon eithaf dwys ynglŷn â'r broses y bu'r Llywodraeth yn ei dilyn. Y prif fater y mae'r cyrff hyn yn cyfeirio ato yw'r diffyg manylion. Ceir yr argraff fod y penderfyniad hwn wedi ei

I wish to reiterate some of the points made by Kirsty Williams on the element of scrutiny. The First Minister, in opening this debate, said that the consultation document had been welcomed. However, I am sure we have all received information from the various organisations that have been part of the consultation process showing that there are some quite grave concerns about the process which the Government has followed. The main issue referred to by these organisations is the lack of detail. The

wneud ar frys ym mis Gorffennaf y llynedd heb fod digon o fanylion wedi cael eu rhoi o flaen llaw o ran yr hyn a gynigiwyd. Yr ail bwynt sy'n cael ei gyfleu yn eithaf clir yw'r methiant o ran cyhoeddi mesuriadau perfformiad a dangos bod y drefn newydd yn gost effeithiol.

It was rather instructive that the CBI's response to the consultation document referred in particular to the fact that it would have expected a business plan to be set out for the merger, giving details of the costings and a cost-benefit analysis. The point that the CBI has made regularly, either to individual Assembly Members or to us as a corporate body is the lack of a commercial focus to how the Government has announced its proposals. Rather than simply saying that there has been a broad welcome, it should acknowledge the serious concerns that have been raised, particularly by the business community in terms of the WDA and the CBI. The Government needs to take those on board.

3.40 p.m.

Credaf hefyd y dylem ganolbwyntio ar yr amheuan anochel ynghylch lefelau atebolrwydd unwaith y bydd y cwangos wedi eu diddymu a'r elfen o graffu y bydd rhaid i ni, fel Aelodau'r Cynulliad, ei gyflawni unwaith y bydd y drefn newydd yn ei lle. Byddem yn falch pe bai'r Prif Weinidog yn mynd i'r afael â'r pwynt hwnnw yn ei ymateb i'r ddadl oherwydd, yn ystod 18 mlynedd o Lywodraeth y Torïaid, soniwyd yn aml nad oedd y cwangos yn atebol i neb nac yn cael neb yn craffu arnynt.

Ers datganoli, mae'n debyg nad yw hynny wedi bod yr un mor wir ond, yn sicr, pan fydd y drefn newydd yn ei lle, bydd y Gweinidogion a'r adrannau yn cymryd arnynt gyfrifoldebau uniongyrchol llawer yn fwy na'r hyn sydd ganddynt ar hyn o bryd. Felly, mae'n bwysig sefydlu elfennau cryf o atebolrwydd a chraffu. Rhaid i'r Gweinidogion dderbyn y bydd rhaid cael mwy o sesiynau craffu, mwy o gyfleoedd i ofyn cwestiynau ac y bydd rhaid iddynt fod yn fwy agored am y penderfyniadau a wneir.

impression is that this decision was taken in haste in July of last year without adequate details having been provided in advance about what was being proposed. The second issue being conveyed quite clearly is the failure to provide performance indicators and showing that the new system is cost effective.

Yr oedd yn agoriad llygad fod ymateb Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain i'r ddogfen ymgynghori yn cyfeirio'n benodol at y ffaith y byddai wedi disgwyl i gynllun busnes gael ei lunio ar gyfer yr uno, gan roi manylion am y costau a dadansoddiad o gost a budd. Y pwynt y mae Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain wedi ei wneud yn rheolaidd, naill ai i Aelodau Cynulliad unigol neu i ni fel corff corfforaethol, yw nad oes canolbwynt masnachol i'r ffordd y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi cyhoeddi ei chynigion. Yn hytrach na dweud i hyn gael ei groesawu'n gyffredinol, dylai gydnabod y pryderon difrifol a godwyd, yn enwedig gan y gymuned fusnes o ran WDA a Chyddfederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain. Mae angen i'r Llywodraeth ystyried y rhain.

I think also that we should concentrate on the inevitable doubts about the levels of accountability once these quangos are abolished, and the element of scrutiny that we, as Assembly Members, must carry out once the new system is in place. I would appreciate it if the First Minister could tackle that point when he responds to the debate because, during 18 years of Tory Government, it was often said that the quangos were answerable to no one and were scrutinised by no one.

Since devolution, it seems that has not been quite been as true. But certainly, when the new system is in place, Ministers and departments will assume greater direct responsibilities than they currently have. Therefore, it is important we establish strong elements of scrutiny and accountability now. Ministers must accept that there will have to be more scrutiny sessions and more opportunities to ask questions, and that they will need to be more open about the decisions taken.

Mae'r pwynt arall ar ddiffyg strategaeth yn y dogfennau hyn yn ailadrodd y pwynt a wnaed gan nifer o siaradwyr heddiw a chan y bobl a oedd yn rhan o'r broses ymgynghori. Gwnaed y penderfyniad gwreiddiol gyda chymaint o ruthr, mae'n ymddangos bod diffyg strategaeth yn y broses.

O ran yr hyn sy'n digwydd i'r staff, gwyddom, fel y dywedodd y Prif Weinidog, y bydd nifer o staff o bosibl yn gadael; ni fydd hi'n bosibl i bawb symud draw. Cyfeiriodd Kirsty Williams at y ffaith bod nifer o staff yn pryderu am eu pensiynau. Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn gwybod bod y mater hwnnw'n effeithio ar bawb yn ein cymdeithas a bod problemau mawr yn y sector. Fodd bynnag, tra bod pobl yn gorfod newid eu hamodau gwaith, ac, yn yr achos hwn, yn gorfod symud o weithio i gwango i weithio i'r Llywodraeth, bydd nifer o bethau yn digwydd sydd y tu allan i'w rheolaeth yn llwyr. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Prif Weinidog yn medru rhoi addewidion clir ynghylch y ffaith na fydd neb yn colli allan ar gynlluniau pensiwn oherwydd bod pobl yn cael eu symud o weithio i gwango i weithio i'r Llywodraeth.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You need to wind up.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Rhaid i'r Prif Weinidog dderbyn y feirniadaeth bod cost y broses wedi ei thanbriso gan ei Lywodraeth. Rhaid iddo wneud yn glir yr hyn y mae'n ei weld fel yr arbedion er mwyn ymateb i'r gost a osodwyd yn wreiddiol.

Alun Cairns: I propose the following amendments in the name of David Melding. Amendment 6: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

regrets the ad hoc approach taken and the lack of strategic planning by the Welsh Assembly Government, which has led to staff confusion and low morale, and notes that 45.1 per cent of staff have considered leaving the employment of the WDA within the last six months.

I propose amendment 7. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

The other point in the documents about the lack of strategy reiterates the point made by several speakers today and by those people who were part of the consultation process. The original decision was made in such haste that the process seems to lack strategy.

As for what is to happen to the staff, as the First Minister said, we know that a number of staff will probably leave; it will not be possible for everyone to move across. Kirsty Williams referred to the fact that many staff are concerned about their pensions. The First Minister knows that that is a matter which affects everyone in society, and there are huge problems in the sector. However, as long as people have to change their conditions of work, and, in this case, move from working for a quango to working for the Government, there will be many issues totally beyond their control. I hope the First Minister can give clear commitments that no-one will lose out on their pension schemes because people are being moved from working for a quango to working for the Government.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae angen ichi ddirwyn i ben.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: The First Minister must accept the criticism that the cost of the process has been underestimated by his Government. He must clarify what he sees as the savings to respond to the cost originally fixed.

Alun Cairns: Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw David Melding. Gwelliant 6: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn gresynu at yr agwedd ad hoc a'r diffyg cynllunio strategol ar ran Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, sydd wedi peri dryswch i staff a morâl isel, ac yn sylwi bod 45.1 y cant o staff wedi ystyried gadael eu swyddi gydag Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru yn y chwe mis diwethaf.

Cynigiaf welliant 7. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

- calls for an immediate statement on the pension implications for ASPB staff, to include any plans to correct pension fund shortfalls and the source of finance to be used.*
- I propose amendment 8. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:
- regrets the way in which the Welsh Assembly Government now criticises the ASPBs, having previously defended and complimented them on their actions.*
- I propose amendment 9. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:
- calls for the immediate publication of notes, memoranda and minutes of discussions that have considered redundancies resulting from the merger.*
- I propose amendment 10. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:
- calls for a costed business plan to be presented to the Assembly immediately for consideration.*
- I propose amendment 11. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:
- calls for the immediate publication of a breakdown of the £10 million per annum savings that the Welsh Assembly Government intends to realise as a result of the merger.*
- I propose amendment 12. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:
- calls for the establishment of an independent evaluation team to present an annual report to the Assembly on the delivery of services, outcomes and value for money of the new departments created by the merger. The make-up of the evaluation team is to be agreed by all political parties.*
- I propose amendment 13. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:
- recognises the need for a strong regional approach to which budgets will be devolved.*
- yn galw am ddatganiad ar fyrder am y goblygiadau pensiwn i staff CCNC, i gynnwys unrhyw gynlluniau i gywiro diffygion mewn cronfeydd pensiwn a'r ffynhonnell ariannol sydd i'w defnyddio i wneud hynny.*
- Cynigiad welliant 8. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn gresynu at y ffordd y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn awr yn beirniadu CCNC a hithau wedi eu hamddiffyn a'u canmol gynt am eu gweithredu.*
- Cynigiad welliant 9. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn galw am gyhoeddi ar fyrder nodiadau, memoranda a chofnodion trafodaethau sydd wedi ystyried diswyddiadau'n deillio o'r uno.*
- Cynigiad welliant 10. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn galw am gyflwyno ar fyrder gynllun busnes, wedi'i gostio, i'r Cynulliad ei ystyried.*
- Cynigiad welliant 11. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn galw am gyhoeddi ar fyrder ddadansoddiad o'r arbedion o £10 miliwn y flwyddyn y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn bwriadu eu sicrhau yn sgîl yr uno.*
- Cynigiad welliant 12. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn galw am sefydlu tîm gwerthuso annibynnol i gyflwyno adroddiad blynyddol i'r Cynulliad ar ddarparu gwasanaethau, canlyniadau a gwerth am arian gan yr adrannau newydd a gaiff eu creu gan yr uno. Rhaid i gyfansoddiad y tîm gwerthuso gael ei gytuno gan yr holl bleidiau gwleidyddol.*
- Cynigiad welliant 13. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn cydnabod yr angen am agwedd ranbarthol gref ynglŷn â pha gyllidebau a*

gaiff eu datganoli.

I propose amendment 14. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

requires the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure the adequate scrutiny of ELWa functions once it has been absorbed into an Assembly Education and Lifelong Learning Department.

I propose amendment 15. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

calls upon the Welsh Assembly Government to emphasise that the ELL Department fully responds to the needs of the workplace and the learner.

I propose amendment 16. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

ensures that an Assembly Education and Lifelong Learning Department advances the requirements of part-time further education, both vocational and academic, and enhances pathways towards further and higher education.

I am not sure whether five minutes will be enough to cover all of the issues, but you will be pleased to hear that I have highlighted three clear themes arising from the amendments to make my comments more concise. The three clear themes are: the ad hoc approach that the Assembly Government has taken in this respect; the need to safeguard scrutiny; and our need to focus on delivery.

On the first theme, we all know that this is an ill-thought-out policy. The receivers of the service have clearly highlighted the lack of strategic thinking. They have commented that, in the private sector and even in other public-sector organisations, when two or more organisations are merged, you would need a business plan, highlighting the benefits, drawbacks and risks, and you would then make a decision based on that evidence. From a so-called evidence-based administration, there has been no evidence in that respect. It was conceived by the First Minister on the back of a fag packet, and he is now seeking to justify that decision by

Cynigiaf welliant 14. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru sicrhau craffu digonol ar swyddogaethau ELWa ar ôl iddo ddod o dan Adran Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes y Cynulliad.

Cynigiaf welliant 15. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i bwysleisio bod yr Adran Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn ymateb yn llwyr i anghenion y gweithle a'r dysgwr.

Cynigiaf welliant 16. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn sicrhau bod Adran Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes y Cynulliad yn hyrwyddo gofynion addysg bellach ran amser, ar lefel alwedigaethol a lefel academaidd, ac yn hwyluso llwybrau tuag at addysg bellach ac uwch.

Nid wyf yn siŵr a fydd pum munud yn ddigon i gwmpasu pob mater, ond byddwch yn falch clywed fy mod wedi tynnu sylw at dair thema bendant sy'n deillio o'r gwelliannau, er mwyn gwneud fy sylwadau yn fwy cryno. Y tair thema bendant yw: yr ymagwedd ad hoc gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn hyn o beth; yr angen i ddiogelu'r broses graffu, a'r angen i ni ganolbwyntio ar ddarpariaeth.

O ran y thema gyntaf, gwyddom i gyd fod hwn yn bolisi sydd wedi ei lunio'n wael. Mae'r rheini sy'n cael y gwasanaeth wedi tynnu sylw'n glir at y diffyg meddwl strategol. Maent wedi dweud, yn y sector preifat a hyd yn oed mewn sefydliadau eraill yn y sector cyhoeddus, pan unir dau neu fwy o sefydliadau y byddai angen cynllun busnes arnoch, i amlygu'r manteision, yr anfanteision a'r risgiau, ac yna byddech yn gwneud penderfyniad ar sail y dystiolaeth honno. O weinyddiaeth sy'n honni ei bod yn gweithredu ar sail tystiolaeth, ni welwyd unrhyw dystiolaeth o hynny. Fe'i lluniwyd gan y Prif Weinidog ar gefn pecyn sigarêts,

putting together all of these cases.

On the £10.6 million in so-called savings that will be achieved, we note that it will be achieved in the long term, and that the Minister for Economic Development and Transport could not give us a detailed breakdown this morning of how that will be made up. Therefore, one of the amendments has been tabled to highlight the ad-hoc approach that the Assembly Government has taken. One consequence of this ad-hoc approach is the damage to the morale and the enthusiasm of the staff. It led to the departure of the chief executive officer, and also caused the director of the international division and board members to leave. Many of those leaving have given the official reason that they wanted to spend more time with their families, which is what many football managers say, of course, but they are being kicked out because their faces do not fit. That is what is happening here.

Leighton Andrews: Is it not the case, Alun, that one of the officials whom you have just mentioned said explicitly that her reasons for leaving were nothing to do with the merger process, and that no-one should read that into it?

Alun Cairns: I think that it was Carl Sargeant who said in committee this morning that you should not believe all that you read in the papers. From discussions with the staff within the WDA—

Leighton Andrews: Will you give way?

Alun Cairns: No, I will not, as I want to answer the point. If you give me the opportunity to answer the point, then I will give way.

From discussions with those at the most senior levels, with board members, and with those at more junior levels, it is obvious why those people have left: it is because they are not satisfied with the Minister's intervention, and they cannot face being directly run by the Minister following the merger with the Welsh Assembly Government.

ac yn awr mae'n ceisio cyfiawnhau'r penderfyniad hwnnw drwy roi'r holl achosion hyn at ei gilydd.

O ran y £10.6 miliwn o arbedion honedig a gaiff eu sicrhau, sylwn y caiff hynny ei sicrhau dros gyfnod hir, ac na allai'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth roi dadansoddiad manwl inni y bore yma sut fydd yr arbedion yn digwydd. Felly, cyflwynwyd un o'r gwelliannau er mwyn tynnu sylw at yr ymagwedd ad-hoc gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Un o ganlyniadau'r ymagwedd ad-hoc hon yw'r niwed i forâl a brwdfrydedd y staff. Arweiniodd at ymadawiad y prif swyddog gweithredol, ac achosodd hefyd i gyfarwyddwr yr isadran ryngwladol ac aelodau'r bwrdd adael. Mae nifer o'r rheini sy'n gadael wedi rhoi'r rheswm swyddogol eu bod am dreulio mwy o amser gyda'u teuluoedd, fel y bydd nifer o reolwyr pêldroed yn ei ddweud, wrth gwrs. Ond cael eu gwthio o'r neilltu y maent am nad ydynt yn dderbyniol. Dyna sy'n digwydd yma.

Leighton Andrews: Onid yw'n wir, Alun, fod un o'r swyddogion a grybwyllwyd gennych wedi dweud yn benodol nad oedd ei rhesymau dros adael yn ymwneud â'r broses uno o gwbl, ac na ddylai neb ei ystyried felly?

Alun Cairns: Credaf mai Carl Sargeant a ddywedodd yn y pwyllgor y bore yma na ddylech gredu popeth a ddarllenwch yn y wasg. O drafodaethau gyda staff yn WDA—

Leighton Andrews: A wnewch ildio?

Alun Cairns: Na wna, am fy mod am ateb y pwynt. Os rhowch y cyfle imi ateb y pwynt, yna fe ildiaf.

O drafodaethau gyda'r rheini ar y lefel uchaf, gydag aelodau byrddau, a chyda'r rheini ar lefelau is, mae'n amlwg pam mae'r bobl hynny wedi gadael: maent yn gadael am nad ydynt yn fodlon ag ymyriad y Gweinidog, ac am na allant wynebu cael eu rhedeg yn uniongyrchol gan y Gweinidog ar ôl uno â Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

We have seen evidence of low staff morale in the leaked survey. I am surprised that the Minister has not been able to answer—although it was over a week ago that the questions were first raised in committee—why 45 per cent of WDA staff have considered leaving the agency. This is a service organisation, so all of its assets are in its staff. The ad-hoc approach of the Assembly Government is clearly enormously damaging.

Pension matters have not been raised; if there had been a business plan, pension matters would have been covered, and that would have been one of the drawbacks and potentially one of the risks.

The statement that fewer staff are leaving the WDA and the other quangos now than have left in the previous six months is logical: there are, potentially, redundancy packages on offer. If you are thinking about going to work for another organisation, but know that if you hang on for a couple of months you might be offered redundancy, you are not going to leave. That answer, Minister, clearly does not wash.

Moving on, the second theme that I highlighted is the need to safeguard scrutiny. We all know that the current structures within the Assembly, particularly the committee structures, do not allow for adequate scrutiny. At the moment, we know that we can go to see the chief executives and the board members of the relevant quangos. However, following the merger, we can only question the Minister. We all see the quality of the answers that the Minister gives when we table questions, and we all see the responses to freedom of information questions: not only are they delayed until uncomfortable times have passed, but when questions are tabled to the Welsh Assembly Government, they only provide half of the information, where, in contrast, the agencies now provide all of the information. The Government clearly edits the uncomfortable bits of information, which demonstrates that its commitment to open government and to scrutiny is nothing more than rhetoric.

Gwelsom dystiolaeth o forâl isel ymhlith staff yn yr arolwg a gafodd ei ddatgelu. Yr wyf yn synnu nad oedd y Gweinidog yn gallu ateb—er i'r cwestiynau gael eu codi y tro cyntaf yn y pwyllgor dros wythnos yn ôl—pam mae 45 y cant o staff WDA wedi ystyried gadael yr awdurdod. Sefydliad gwasanaethu yw hwn, felly, ei staff yw ei holl asedau. Mae ymagwedd ad-hoc Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn amlwg yn niweidiol iawn.

Ni chodwyd materion pensiwn; pe bai cynllun busnes wedi bodoli, byddai materion pensiwn wedi eu cwmpasu, a byddai hynny wedi bod yn un o'r anfanteision ac, o bosibl, yn un o'r risgiau.

Mae'r datganiad bod llai o staff yn gadael WDA a'r cwangos eraill yn awr nag sydd wedi gadael yn y chwe mis diwethaf yn rhesymegol: mae pecynnau dileu swyddi, o bosibl, yn cael eu cynnig. Os ydych yn ystyried mynd i weithio i sefydliad arall, ond yn gwybod pe baech yn aros am ychydig fisoedd y gallech gael cynnig tâl dileu swyddi, ni fyddwch yn gadael. Mae'n amlwg, Weinidog, na wnaiff yr ateb hwnnw mo'r tro.

I symud ymlaen, yr ail thema yr wyf wedi tynnu sylw ati yw'r angen i ddiogelu'r swyddogaeth graffu. Gwyddom oll nad yw'r strwythurau presennol yn y Cynulliad, yn enwedig strwythurau'r pwyllgorau, yn caniatáu ar gyfer craffu digonol. Ar hyn o bryd, gwyddom y gallwn fynd at y prif weithredwyr ac aelodau byrddau'r cwangos perthnasol. Fodd bynnag, yn dilyn yr uno ni allwn ond holi'r Gweinidog. Yr ydym oll yn gweld safon atebion y Gweinidog pan gyflwynwn gwestiynau, ac yr ydym oll yn gweld yr ymatebion i gwestiynau rhyddid gwybodaeth: cânt nid yn unig eu gohirio nes bydd adegau anghyfforddus wedi mynd heibio, ond pan gyflwynir cwestiynau i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, dim ond hanner y wybodaeth a ddarperir ganddynt. Ond i'r gwrthwyneb, mae'r asiantaethau nawr yn darparu'r holl wybodaeth. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn amlwg yn golygu'r darnau anghyfforddus o wybodaeth, sy'n dangos nad yw ei hymrwymiad i lywodraeth agored ac i graffu yn ddim mwy na rhethreg.

In closing—I recognise that time is short—I want to focus on delivery, and to ask the First Minister what he means by ‘reasonably independent’. Will it be like the task and finish groups? These are supposed to be independent, but when we tabled questions, we found out that large numbers of them were made up of either Labour Party members, former Labour Party members or Labour Party activists in some shape or form. An independent evaluation would be a genuinely independent evaluation agreed by all Assembly Members, or at least by all parties within the Assembly. If you agree to that, then you will at least have made one concession that is in the interest of public service delivery in Wales. If you reject that amendment and that request it shows that, as with everything else that you have said, this is all rhetoric and means nothing: you just want centralist control so that you can claim the credit for everything. However, there is one final consolation. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘Oh.’] Up until now, when something has gone wrong with the quangos—and Jane Davidson was a perfect example of this, in relation to the Pop Factory—it has been nothing to do with the Minister. After 1 April, these matters will have absolutely everything to do with you.

3.50 p.m.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I think that everyone should be able to speak. I have exercised some latitude in allowing people to have well over five minutes. From now on, I will call Members’ attention to the time when five minutes have lapsed.

Leighton Andrews: I think that it is worth starting by saying how relatively smooth the process of these mergers has been. Often, in any kind of change programme, whether it is a merger, or a takeover in the private sector, for example, you get a huge amount of staff dissatisfaction and you see large numbers of people—

Eleanor Burnham: Will you take an intervention?

Leighton Andrews: Not yet. I will take one

I gloi—yr wyf yn cydnabod bod yr amser yn brin—yr wyf am ganolbwyntio ar ddarpariaeth, a gofynnaf i’r Prif Weinidog beth yw ystyr ‘yn rhesymol o annibynnol’. A fydd yn debyg i’r grwpiau gorchwyl a gorffen? Mae’r rhain i fod yn annibynnol, ond pan gyflwynwyd cwestiynau gennym, gwelsom fod nifer fawr ohonynt yn cynnwys naill ai aelodau o’r Blaid Lafur, cyn aelodau o’r Blaid Lafur neu actifyddion y Blaid Lafur mewn rhyw ffordd neu’i gilydd. Gwerthusiad annibynnol fyddai gwerthusiad cwbl annibynnol wedi ei gytuno gan holl Aelodau’r Cynulliad, neu o leiaf yr holl bleidiau yn y Cynulliad. Os cytunwch i wneud hynny, yna byddwch o leiaf wedi gwneud un consesiwn sy’n llesol i ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Os gwrthodwch y gwelliant hwnnw a’r cais hwnnw, mae’n dangos, fel gyda phopeth arall a ddywedwyd gennych, mai rhethreg lwyf yw hyn i gyd ac nad yw’n golygu dim: yr unig beth a ddymunwch yw rheolaeth ganolog fel y gallwch hawlio’r clod am bopeth. Fodd bynnag, mae un cysur arall. [AELODAU’R CYNULLIAD: ‘O.’] Hyd yn hyn, pan aeth rhywbeth o’i le gyda’r cwangos—ac yr oedd Jane Davidson yn enghraifft berffaith o hyn, mewn perthynas â’r Ffatri Bop—nid oedd a wnelo o gwbl â’r Gweinidog. Ar ôl 1 Ebrill, bydd y materion hyn yn ymwneud yn gyfan gwbl â chi.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Credaf y dylai pawb gael cyfle i siarad. Rhoddais rywfaint o benrhyddid drwy ganiataú i bobl gael ymhell dros bum munud. O hyn ymlaen, byddaf yn dweud wrth yr Aelodau pan fydd pum munud wedi mynd heibio.

Leighton Andrews: Credaf ei bod yn werth dechrau drwy ddweud mor gymharol ddiraffferth fu’r uniadau hyn. Yn aml, mewn unrhyw fath o raglen newid, boed yn uniad neu’n achos o drosfeddiannu yn y sector preifat, er enghraifft, cewch lawer iawn o anfonlonrwydd ymhlith staff a gwelwch nifer fawr o bobl—

Eleanor Burnham: A wnewch dderbyn mymriad?

Leighton Andrews: Ddim eto. Derbyniaf yn

later.

You see large numbers of people in surveys expressing their concerns about how matters are developing. However, as the unions said this morning in the Economic Development and Transport Committee meeting, the process has involved them, and staff have felt able to raise the issues that have concerned them.

Alun Cairns: Will you take an intervention?

Leighton Andrews: I will in a moment. If I were a member of staff in the WDA or ELWa, I would far rather put my trust, in terms of having a decent deal on pensions and other issues, in the leadership of Prospect and Unison, than in Alan B'Stard over there. I give way to Alun Cairns.

Alun Cairns: I am grateful to the Member for giving way, but I do not recognise anyone by the name of Alan B'Stard here: the joke fell on deaf ears, obviously.

In relation to the point about the unions, they said that the process was smoother than previously: that is not to say how good it was in the first instance. Also, are you not concerned by the fact that the union representatives were not even aware of a staff survey that showed that 45 per cent of the staff have considered leaving the organisation in the last six months?

Leighton Andrews: Alun, I think that the time that you spent as temporary Chair at the Economic Development and Transport Committee meeting this morning has caused you to lose a little of your hearing. The unions said that they thought that this was an excellent process, and that they genuinely thought that they were being listened to in that process, which is the key issue.

The survey issue does not surprise me. These organisations are going through significant change. That will inevitably result in people questioning where they sit. That is the issue. The real test of this will be how many people are taken through into the new organisation. That is what we should look forward to.

nes ymlaen.

Gwelwch nifer fawr o bobl mewn arolygon sy'n mynegi eu pryderon am y ffordd y mae pethau'n datblygu. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedodd yr undebau y bore yma yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth, mae'r broses wedi eu cynnwys hwy, ac mae staff wedi teimlo y gallant godi'r materion a oedd yn eu pryderu.

Alun Cairns: A wnewch dderbyn ymyriad?

Leighton Andrews: Fe wnaif mewn eiliad. Pe bawn yn aelod o staff WDA neu ELWa, byddai'n well o lawer gennyf roi fy ymddiriedaeth, o ran cael cynnig pensiwn boddhaol a phethau eraill, yn arweinyddiaeth Prospect ac Unsain nag yn Alan B'Stard acw. Ildiaf i Alun Cairns.

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Aelod am ildio, ond nid wyf yn adnabod unrhyw un o'r enw Alan B'Stard yma: mae'r jôc wedi disgyn ar glustiau byddar, mae'n amlwg.

Ynglŷn â'r pwynt am yr undebau, maent wedi dweud bod y broses wedi mynd rhagddi'n esmwythach nag o'r blaen: nid yw hynny'n golygu nad oedd y broses yn dda yn y lle cyntaf. Hefyd, onid ydych yn poeni am y ffaith nad oedd y cynrychiolwyr undeb hyd yn oed yn gwybod am arolwg staff a oedd yn dangos bod 45 y cant o'r staff wedi ystyried gadael y sefydliad yn y chwe mis diwethaf?

Leighton Andrews: Alun, credaf fod eich cyfnod fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth dros dro y bore yma wedi eich gwneud ychydig yn fyddar. Dywedodd yr undebau eu bod yn credu bod hon yn broses ardderchog, ac yn credu'n wirioneddol bod pobl yn gwrando arnynt yn y broses honno, a dyna sy'n bwysig.

Nid yw mater yr arolwg yn peri syndod imi. Mae'r sefydliadau hyn yn wynebu newid sylweddol. Bydd hyn yn anochel yn golygu bod pobl yn amau ble maent yn eistedd. Dyna'r broblem. Prawf gwirioneddol hyn fydd faint o bobl a gaiff eu trosglwyddo i'r sefydliad newydd. Dyna beth y dylem

edrych ymlaen ato.

We had an interesting and helpful paper from the WDA Unison branch. Some important points were made in its submission in response to the consultation. It states that it believes that the new process could result in streamlined delivery, which would be facilitated by reducing over-bureaucratic hierarchical management structures and by the introduction of new flat management structures. It is significant that the union says that it thinks that the public sector has much to learn from the private sector about empowering staff, particularly customer-facing staff. That contribution from Unison goes to the heart of where this reform programme for the public services needs to be directed. It chimes very well with what the CBI has said in its evidence. The CBI has raised—quite rightly—the issue of accountability to customers, alongside political accountability. This morning, the CBI elaborated that it was specifically talking about service level agreements, the development of key performance indicators and a strong account management structure, which we heard about from the First Minister today. The impetus that is coming not only from the business community but also from the workforce within the WDA on the need for a customer focus, shows that there is a meeting of minds about the direction in which this is going.

It is important to look at how we harness expertise from outside. Again, we discussed that in the Economic Development and Transport Committee meeting this morning. On this, I am rather more in sympathy with the CBI and its approach, in talking about harnessing expertise rather than having a system based on harnessing stakeholders. A number of people have raised issues about scrutiny and accountability, and it is important that, in the new process, we have the opportunity to scrutinise and hold to account the departments that these organisations will become in future. I welcome the acknowledgement by the Minister for Economic Development and Transport of the need to ensure that that

Cawsom bapur diddorol a defnyddiol gan gangen Unsain yn WDA. Gwnaed rhai pwyntiau pwysig yn ei gyflwyniad i ymateb i'r ymgynghori. Mae'n datgan ei fod o'r farn y gallai'r broses newydd arwain at ddarpariaeth symlach, a fyddai'n cael ei hwyluso drwy leihau strwythurau rheoli hierarchaidd gor-fiwrocraidd, a thrwy gyflwyno strwythurau rheoli sylfaenol newydd. Mae'n arwyddocaol bod yr undeb yn dweud ei fod yn credu bod gan y sector cyhoeddus lawer i'w ddysgu gan y sector preifat am rymuso staff, yn enwedig staff sy'n dod wyneb yn wyneb â chwsmeriaid. Mae'r cyfraniad hwnnw gan Unsain yn mynd i wraidd y mater ble mae angen i'r rhaglen ddiwygio hon ar gyfer gwasanaethau cyhoeddus gael ei chyfeirio. Mae'n cyd-fynd yn dda iawn â'r hyn a ddywedodd Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain yn ei dystiolaeth. Mae Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain—a hynny'n briodol—wedi codi mater atebolrwydd i gwsmeriaid, ochr yn ochr ag atebolrwydd gwleidyddol. Y bore yma, eglurodd Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain ei fod yn siarad yn benodol am gytundebau lefel gwasanaeth, datblygu dangosyddion perfformiad allweddol a strwythur cadarn i reoli cyfrifon y soniodd y Prif Weinidog amdanynt heddiw. Mae'r symbyliad, nid yn unig gan y gymuned fusnes ond hefyd gan y gweithlu yn WDA, fod angen am ffocws cwsmeriaid yn dangos bod cytundeb ynglŷn â'r cyfeiriad y mae hyn yn mynd iddo.

Mae'n bwysig edrych ar y ffordd yr ydym yn harneisio arbenigedd o'r tu allan. Unwaith eto, trafodwyd hynny gennym yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth y bore yma. O ran hyn, yr wyf yn cydymdeimlo ychydig yn fwy â Chyddfederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain a'i ymagwedd, wrth drafod y broses o harneisio arbenigedd yn hytrach na chael system sy'n seiliedig ar harneisio rhanddeiliaid. Mae nifer o bobl wedi codi materion am graffu ac atebolrwydd, ac mae'n bwysig, yn y broses newydd, inni gael y cyfle i graffu ar yr adrannau a fydd yn deillio o'r sefydliadau hyn yn y dyfodol ac i'w dwyn i gyfrif. Croesawaf y gydnabyddiaeth gan y Gweinidog dros

process exists. It is worth pointing out, however, that we now have freedom of information legislation, which provides a much more transparent framework for scrutiny of the public sector than existed in the days of the quango state under the Conservative Party. *[Interruption.]*

I did take an intervention, Deputy Presiding Officer, so I would be grateful if I could have a little longer. I remember those days because I was a member of a quango in Wales. I joined the board of Tai Cymru and I was a member for two years. When I joined in November 1996 five out of the other seven members of that quango board were members or supporters of the Conservative Party. *[ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: Oh.]* Oh yes. I saw how the quango state operated under the Tories, and there will be plenty of opportunities to spell out in more detail, when I have more time, how it used to operate under the Tories.

Owen John Thomas: Will you give way?

Leighton Andrews: I will happily take an intervention, if I have time.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: You have six minutes—it is up to you.

Owen John Thomas: Did you feel at home among your fellow Conservative board members?

Leighton Andrews: No, I did not, and, funnily enough, I was censured for suggesting that things could be done in a more democratic, open and transparent way, and they had to reverse that under legal challenge. So, no, I did not feel at home in the Tory quango culture, and I am delighted that we are reforming the Tory quango state now.

Elin Jones: Yr wyf yn datgan buddiant ynghylch gwelliant 7: mae gennyf bensiw'n WDA o hyd, felly ni fyddaf yn pleidleisio ar y gwelliant hwnnw.

Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth fod angen sicrhau bod y broses yn bodoli. Mae'n werth nodi, fodd bynnag, fod gennym ddeddfwriaeth rhyddid gwybodaeth yn awr, sy'n darparu fframwaith llawer mwy tryloyw ar gyfer craffu ar y sector cyhoeddus na'r hyn a oedd yn bodoli yn nyddiau'r wladwriaeth cwangos o dan y Blaid Geidwadol. *[Torri ar draws.]*

Derbyniais ymyriad, Ddirprwy Lywydd, felly, byddwn yn ddiolchgar am ychydig yn fwy o amser. Cofiaf y dyddiau hynny oherwydd yr oeddwn yn aelod o gwango yng Nghymru. Ymunais â bwrdd Tai Cymru a bûm yn aelod am ddwy flynedd. Pan ymunais ym mis Tachwedd 1996, yr oedd pump o'r saith aelod arall o'r bwrdd cwango hwnnw yn aelodau o'r Blaid Geidwadol neu'n ei chefnogi. *[AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: O.]* Oeddent, yn wir. Gwelais sut yr oedd y wladwriaeth cwangos yn gweithredu o dan y Ceidwadwyr, a bydd digon o gyfleoedd i egluro'n fanylach, pan fydd gennyf fwy o amser, sut y byddai'n arfer gweithredu o dan y Toriaid.

Owen John Thomas: A wnewch ildio?

Leighton Andrews: Yr wyf yn ddigon parod i dderbyn ymyriad, os bydd gennyf amser.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae gennych chwe munud—chi sydd i ddewis.

Owen John Thomas: A oeddech yn teimlo'n gartrefol ymysg eich cyd-aelodau Ceidwadol ar y bwrdd?

Leighton Andrews: Nac oeddwn, ac yn rhyfedd iawn cefais fy ngheryddu am awgrymu y gellid gwneud pethau mewn ffordd fwy democrataidd, agored ac eglur, a bu'n rhaid iddynt wrth-droi hynny o dan her gyfreithiol. Felly, na, nid oeddwn yn teimlo'n gartrefol yn niwylliant y cwangos Toriaidd, ac yr wyf wrth fy modd ein bod yn diwygio gwladwriaeth y cwangos Toriaidd yn awr.

Elin Jones: I declare an interest in relation to amendment 7, as I still have a WDA pension. I will not therefore vote on that amendment.

Mae'n bwysig ein bod, yn y broses hon, yn gwneud cynllunio a gweithredu ar lefel ranbarthol yn rhan ganolog o waith adrannau newydd y Llywodraeth. Mae'n siŵr mai ar sail y pedawr rhanbarth economaidd presennol y dylid sefydlu hyn i gychwyn, er bod gennyf rywffaint o bryder nad yw'r ffiniau hyn wir yn adlewyrchu patrwm economi Cymru. Dylid rhoi ystyriaeth yn y dyfodol agos i ranbarth ar hyd arfordir y gorllewin o Fôn i sir Benfro, ac un arall ar gyfer y Cymoedd. Byddai hynny yn canolbwyntio adnoddau ac arbenigedd ar ranbarthau sydd â phroblemau cyffredin.

Fodd bynnag, yr hyn sydd yn ganolog i lwyddiant y gwasanaethau busnes yw sicrhau bod pŵer dros benderfyniadau ar wariant yn cael ei ddatganoli i swyddogion yn y rhanbarthau. Mae'n allweddol bod swyddog mewn swyddfa yn Aberystwyth, er enghraifft, yn medru penderfynu ar wariant ar brosiectau lleol sy'n deillio o strategaeth sydd wedi ei chymeradwyo. Byddai'n drychinebus pe bai pob math o benderfyniadau yn gorfod cael eu cyfeirio at uwchswyddogion, neu hyd yn oed at Weinidogion, yn Nghaerdydd. Byddai'r system yn cael ei llethu'n sydyn iawn a byddai gwasanaethau i fusnesau a chymunedau'n dirywio. Dywedodd Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru yn y pwyllgor y bore yma fod yn rhaid cyhoeddi'r pwerau cyllido sydd yn cael eu datganoli i swyddogion a rhanbarthau fel bod hyn yn gwbl dryloyw wedi Ebrill 2006.

Rhywbeth sy'n gysylltiedig â hyn yw'r angen i gryfhau'r gyfundrefn o swyddogion cyfrif yn gweithio gyda busnesau unigol. Mae gan y dull hwn o weithio record gadarn yn y Canolbarth, ac mae'n cynnig dilyniant ac arbenigedd i fusnesau. Mae cefnogaeth gref i'r dull hwn o weithio yn yr ymatebion i'r ymgynghoriad. Mae'n bwysig, felly, i sefydlu o'r cychwyn cyntaf mai rhoi gwasanaeth i fusnesau a chymunedau fydd gwaith swyddogion adran yr economi—neu beth bynnag fydd enw'r adran yn y pen draw. Yr wyf am weld swyddogion yn mynd i gwrdd â busnesau ac yn gweithio yn y gymuned, ac nid fel llais ar ben arall y ffôn yn unig.

Gobeithiaf hefyd y bydd swyddogion cyfrif

It is important, in this process, that we make planning and operating at a regional level central to the work of the new Government departments. This should probably be based on the four current economic regions at the outset, although I am somewhat concerned that these boundaries do not really reflect the pattern of the Welsh economy. Consideration should be given in the near future to a region along the west coast from Anglesey to Pembrokeshire, and another for the Valleys. That would concentrate resources and expertise on regions with common problems.

However, central to the success of the business services is ensuring that power over decisions on expenditure is devolved to officials in the regions. It is crucial for an official in Aberystwyth, for example, to be able to make decisions on expenditure on local projects within an approved strategy. It would be disastrous if all kinds of decisions had to be referred to senior officials, or even Ministers, in Cardiff. The system would be very quickly overwhelmed and services to businesses and communities would deteriorate. The Welsh Local Government Association said in committee this morning that the financial powers to be devolved to officials and regions must be announced so that this is completely transparent after April 2006.

Linked to this is the need to strengthen the system of account officers working with individual businesses. This method of working has a strong record in mid Wales, and it offers continuity and expertise to businesses. There is strong support in the responses to the consultation for this method of working. It is important, therefore, to establish from the outset that the work of officials in the economy department—or whatever it will be called in the end—will be to provide services to businesses and communities. I want to see officials meeting businesses on the ground and working within communities, rather than merely a voice at the other end of the phone.

I also hope account officers will be able to

yn medru trafod pob agwedd ar fusnes gyda busnesau unigol, gan gynnwys anghenion hyfforddiant, a'r grantiau busnes, cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol a grant buddsoddi'r Cynulliad, mewn ffordd nad yw'n bosibl ar hyn o bryd o dan y strwythur presennol. Yr wyf yn croesawu sylwadau'r Prif Weinidog yn ei araith agoriadol ac yn credu y bydd y math hwn o ddatblygiad ym mhatrwm swyddogion cyfrif yn gam sylweddol ymlaen wedi Ebrill 2006.

4.00 p.m.

I gloi, mae'n hollbwysig cadw hunaniaeth ac arbenigedd y gwasanaethau i fusnesau twristiaeth yn y gyfundrefn newydd. Fel y mae nifer wedi'i nodi yn yr ymatebion i'r broses ymgynghori, mae angen sicrhau strwythur penodol ar gyfer twristiaeth, yn gyfrifol am farchnata Cymru i ymwelwyr, ac am wasanaethau busnes i fusnesau twristiaeth. Er hyn, mae'n hollbwysig bod y gwaith hwn hefyd yn integreiddio'n llawn i strategaethau'r gwahanol ranbarthau a'i fod yn cael ei ddarparu yn rhanbarthol.

Jeff Cuthbert: The merger process to create a unified Welsh public service is a once-in-a-lifetime opportunity to regenerate, restructure and refocus the entire approach of strategic policy development and its administration. This process must not be interpreted by anyone as just a matter of abolishing quangos and bringing their functions inside the existing Assembly Government structure. This process is an exciting chance to streamline the whole civil service and inject an innovative and commercial focus into the delivery of Assembly Government objectives. This will mean taking best practice from the ASPBs and the civil service, and uniting them in a much improved structure—a structure that is more focused on front-line delivery, with empowered and target-focused staff, and a shortened decision-making process that truly delivers results on the front line.

Education and economic development are two sides of the same coin when it comes to delivering on the skills agenda. Therefore, it would be a missed opportunity if the merger did not create innovative, collaborative opportunities between economic

discuss all aspects of business with individual businesses, including training needs and the business grants, regional selective assistance and the Assembly investment grant, in a way that is not currently possible under the present structure. I welcome the First Minister's comments on this in his opening speech, and I believe this kind of development in the pattern of account officers will be a considerable step forward after April 2006.

To conclude, it is vital to retain the autonomy and expertise of the services to tourism businesses in the new system. As several have noted in the responses to the consultation process, we need to secure a specific structure for tourism, responsible for marketing Wales to visitors, and for business services for tourism businesses. However, it is crucial that this work is also fully integrated into the various regional strategies and delivered on a regional basis.

Jeff Cuthbert: Mae'r broses uno i greu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus unedig yng Nghymru yn gyfle unigryw i adfywio, ailstrwythuro ac addasu ymagwedd gyfan y gwaith o ddatblygu polisi strategol a'i weinyddu. Ni ddylai neb ddehongli'r broses hon fel mater o ddiddymu cwangos ac ymgorffori eu swyddogaethau yn strwythur presennol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae'r broses hon yn gyfle cyffrous i symleiddio'r gwasanaeth sifil cyfan a rhoi ffocws arloesol a masnachol i'r gwaith o gyflawni amcanion Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Bydd hyn yn golygu cymryd arfer gorau o'r CCNC a'r gwasanaeth sifil, a'u huno mewn strwythur llawer gwell—strwythur sy'n rhoi mwy o sylw i brosesau darparu rheng flaen, gyda staff wedi'u grymuso sy'n canolbwyntio ar dargedau, a phroses gwneud penderfyniadau fyrrach sy'n wirioneddol yn sicrhau canlyniadau yn y rheng flaen.

Mae addysg a datblygu economaidd yn ddwy ochr o'r un geiniog wrth ddarparu'r agenda sgiliau. Felly, byddem yn colli cyfle pe na byddai'r broses uno yn creu cyfleoedd arloesol, cydweithredol rhwng datblygu economaidd ac addysg a dysgu gydol oes. Yr

development and education and lifelong learning. I am pleased to see that many of the respondents to this consultation also expressed this view. The skills and employment action plans and the sector skills agreements are designed to ensure that employers' demands for skills are predicted and met in a sector-specific way. This merger provides a perfect opportunity to ensure that the best people in the WDA, ELWa, ACCAC, and the Assembly's education and economic development departments work in a more integrated fashion.

It is vital that the merged Welsh public service has a strong sectoral focus. I am impressed by the written response to this consultation by Skills for Business, which is an umbrella organisation for the sector skills councils. I agree with it when it writes that the merged organisation must ensure that integrated account managers shadow sector skills councils and sector-specific groups, and continue to build closer links between sectoral fora. The merger must build on existing links with employers in Wales, and not seek to duplicate them.

I therefore come on to the important use of advisory panels. I am pleased that the report on the consultation recognises that we must avoid, at all costs, the development of a plethora of advisory panels that may duplicate similar ones already in existence. For example, careful and innovative thought should be given to how we can best use Future Skills Wales and the sector skills networks, and more general—but existing—regional partnership arrangements. Many of the ones in existence are also already devising a common cross-industry approach to research into skills that will allow the development and implementation of key performance indicators.

I also welcome the fact that the report has stressed the need to ensure that advice from these advisory panels of key stakeholders is really listened to. The Assembly's reputation with the business and education community would be damaged if panel members felt that their advice carried little weight. This

wyf yn falch o weld bod nifer o'r rheini sydd wedi ymateb i'r ymgynghori hwn hefyd wedi mynegi'r farn hon. Lluniwyd y cynlluniau gweithredu sgiliau a chyflogaeth a'r cytundebau sgiliau sector i sicrhau bod y galw gan gyflogwyr am sgiliau yn cael ei ragweld a'i fodloni mewn ffordd sy'n benodol i'r sector. Mae'r broses uno hon yn gyfle perffaith i sicrhau bod y bobl orau yn WDA, ELWa, ACCAC ac adrannau addysg a datblygu economaidd y Cynulliad yn gweithio mewn ffordd fwy integredig.

Mae'n hollbwysig fod gan y gwasanaeth cyhoeddus unedig yng Nghymru ffocws sectoraidd cadarn. Creodd yr ymateb ysgrifenedig i'r ymgynghori hwn gan Sgiliau ar gyfer Busnes, sy'n sefydliad ymbarél ar gyfer y cynghorau sgiliau sector, argraff dda arnaf. Cytunaf ag ef pan ddywed fod yn rhaid i'r sefydliad wedi'i uno sicrhau bod rheolwyr cyfrifon integredig yn cysgodi cynghorau sgiliau sectorau a grwpiau sy'n benodol i'r sector, ac yn parhau i feithrin cysylltiadau agosach rhwng fforymau sector. Rhaid i'r broses uno ddatblygu'r cysylltiadau presennol â chyflogwyr yng Nghymru, yn hytrach na cheisio'u dyblygu.

Felly, yr wyf am drafod y defnydd pwysig a wneir o baneli cynghori. Yr wyf yn falch bod yr adroddiad ar yr ymgynghori yn cydnabod bod yn rhaid inni, ar bob cyfrif, osgoi datblygu toeth o baneli cynghori a allai ddyblygu rhai tebyg sydd eisoes yn bodoli. Er enghraifft, dylid meddwl yn ofalus ac yn arloesol am y ffordd orau y gallwn ddefnyddio Sgiliau Dyfodol Cymru a'r rhwydweithiau sgiliau sector, a threfniadau partneriaeth rhanbarthol mwy cyffredinol sydd eisoes yn bod. Mae nifer o'r rheini sy'n bodoli hefyd eisoes yn llunio ymagwedd gyffredin ar draws y diwydiant tuag at ymchwilio i sgiliau a fydd yn caniatau datblygu a gweithredu dangosyddion perfformiad allweddol.

Croesawaf hefyd y ffaith fod yr adroddiad wedi pwysleisio bod angen sicrhau y gwrandewir yn wirioneddol ar gyngor gan y paneli cynghori hyn o randdeiliaid allweddol. Byddai enw da'r Cynulliad yn y gymuned busnes ac addysg yn cael ei niweidio pe bae aelodau'r paneli yn teimlo

consultation is a great opportunity to create a more efficient and responsive public service. The manner in which this consultation process has been carried out augurs well for the process itself, as the consultation has been open and inclusive. The Assembly Government has taken on the chin all the criticisms thrown its way. We cannot underestimate all the challenges, but I am confident that we are heading in the right direction.

Lisa Francis: I declare an interest as a non-stipendiary director of the Mid Wales Tourism company, which responded to 'Making the Connections'.

Today, according to the motion put before us by the Government, we are debating the outcome of the consultation exercise that was carried out on the mergers of the WDA, WTB and ELWa. It will be important for us to have a debate on the policies of the merger; perhaps we could set aside some time for that.

Many organisations have responded to the 'Making the Connections' document, in particular, the CBI, which said that it is concerned by the lack of a costed business plan for the merger. Let us face it, any private business worth its salt should have clearly set out a series of deliverables, including costs and benefits, before anticipating any such merger. The effect of the situation is hardly to send a message of clarity and confidence to business, and as David Rosser, head of CBI, told the Economic Development and Transport Committee this morning, any business applying for assistance from the WDA or WTB would have to set out a very clear and precise business plan before even hoping to access funding. Given that the Minister talks of customer focus and best in class, should the Welsh Assembly Government not be leading by example?

From a regional point of view, the Minister for Economic Development and Transport has said that he upholds and fully recognises the importance of the regional tourism partnerships and their ability to deliver an

na roddir llawer o bwys ar eu cyngor. Mae'r ymgynghori hwn yn gyfle gwych i greu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus mwy effeithlon ac ymatebol. Mae'r modd y cyflawnwyd y broses ymgynghori hon yn argoeli'n dda ar gyfer y broses ei hun, oherwydd mae'r ymgynghori wedi bod yn agored ac yn gynhwysol. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi derbyn yr holl feirniadaeth ohoni yn ddi-gŵyn. Ni allwn fychanu'r holl heriau, ond hyderaf ein bod yn mynd i'r cyfeiriad cywir.

Lisa Francis: Datganaf fuddiant fel un o gyfarwyddwyr anghyflogedig cwmni Twristiaeth y Canolbarth, sydd wedi ymateb i 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau'.

Heddiw, yn unol â'r cynnig y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi ei roi ger ein bron, yr ydym yn trafod canlyniad yr ymarfer ymgynghori a wnaed ar uno WDA, Bwrdd Croeso Cymru ac ELWa. Bydd yn bwysig inni drafod polisiau'r uno; efallai y gallem neilltuo rhywfaint o amser ar gyfer hynny.

Mae llawer sefydliad wedi ymateb i'r ddogfen 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau', yn arbennig CBI, a ddywedodd ei fod yn pryderu nad oes cynllun busnes wedi'i gostio ar gyfer y broses uno. Wedi'r cyfan, dylai unrhyw fusnes preifat gwerth ei halen fod wedi gosod allan yn glir gyfres o bethau i'w cyflawni, gan gynnwys costau a buddiannau, cyn rhagweld unrhyw broses uno o'r fath. Prin mai effaith y sefyllfa yw cyfleu neges o eglurder a hyder i fusnes, ac fel y dywedodd David Rosser, pennaeth CBI, wrth y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth y bore yma, byddai'n rhaid i unrhyw fusnes sy'n gwneud cais am gymorth gan WDA neu Fwrdd Croeso Cymru osod allan gynllun busnes clir a manwl cyn gobeithio gallu cael arian hyd yn oed. O gofio bod y Gweinidog yn cyfeirio at y sylw a roddir i gwsmeriaid a'r gorau yn y dosbarth, oni ddylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru fod yn arwain drwy esiampl?

O safbwynt rhanbarthol, dywedodd y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth ei fod yn cadarnhau ac yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd y partneriaethau twristiaeth rhanbarthol yn llawn a'u gallu i

effective and local voice for tourism. In fact, he has suggested that they will have a key role. However, the roles and responsibilities of RTPs post-merger are still unclear, and the WLGA pointed out this morning that delegated budgets are still unknown. Therefore, we do not know what regional powers will exist for these organisations.

In the 'Making the Connections' document, the assumption that the WTB's key customers are visitors is an incorrect assumption. WTB currently provides expert assistance and specialist knowledge to the tourism industry, and that needs to be maintained within the new structures. There is concern, which has been voiced at various tourism conferences, including one that the Minister attended last November, that this will mean that there is more than a chance that we will lose the expertise of board members who are brought in-house, because they do not wish, or have any inclination, to submit to political control or pressure.

We must continue to have streamlined delivery in tourism. One of the main strengths of the WTB was its ability to respond quickly and decisively to threats to the industry—I am thinking particularly of the foot and mouth disease epidemic—which it did by working effectively with tourism organisations. There is genuine concern that absorption into the civil service will bring about a decline in the dynamism and decisiveness of tourism delivery. Fast-moving organisations cannot afford to engage with an organisation burdened with an onerous compliance culture.

Commercial decisions require the ability to respond to current circumstances. The merger is yet to prove or manifest how it will facilitate the marketing growth and development of tourism businesses, as Elin Jones pointed out. The Welsh Assembly Government has suggested that the merger will produce potential savings of around £10 million per annum. However, what has not been represented is the percentage of running

fod yn llais effeithiol a lleol dros dwristiaeth. Yn wir, awgrymodd y bydd ganddynt ran allweddol. Fodd bynnag, mae rolau a chyfrifoldebau partneriaethau twristiaeth rhanbarthol ar ôl y broses uno yn dal yn aneglur, ac nododd WLGA y bore yma fod cyllidebau wedi eu dirprwyo yn anhysbys o hyd. Felly, ni wyddom pa bwerau rhanbarthol a fydd yn bodoli ar gyfer y sefydliadau hyn.

Yn y ddogfen 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau', mae'r dybiaeth mai ymwelwyr yw cwsmeriaid allweddol Bwrdd Croeso Cymru yn dybiaeth anghywir. Mae'r Bwrdd yn darparu cymorth a gwybodaeth arbenigol ar hyn o bryd i'r diwydiant twristiaeth, ac mae angen i hynny barhau yn y strwythurau newydd. Mae pryder, a leisiwyd mewn amrywiol gynadleddau twristiaeth, gan gynnwys un a fynychodd y Gweinidog fis Tachwedd diwethaf, y bydd hyn yn golygu ein bod yn debygol iawn o golli arbenigedd aelodau byrddau a ddaw o dan adain y Cynulliad, oherwydd nad oes ganddynt unrhyw ddymuniad nac awydd i ymostwng i reolaeth neu bwysau gwleidyddol.

Rhaid inni barhau i gael prosesau darparu wedi'u symleiddio ym maes twristiaeth. Un o brif gryfderau Bwrdd Croeso Cymru oedd ei allu i ymateb yn gyflym ac yn bendant i fygythiadau i'r diwydiant—yr wyf yn meddwl yn benodol am argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau—a gwnaeth hynny drwy weithio'n effeithiol gyda sefydliadau twristiaeth. Mae yna bryder gwirioneddol y bydd ymgorffori'r bwrdd croeso yn y gwasanaeth sifil yn achosi dirywiad yng ngrymster a phendantwydd darparu twristiaeth. Ni all sefydliadau sy'n symud yn gyflym fforddio ymgysylltu â sefydliad sy'n ysgwyddo baich diwylliant cydymffurfiaeth llethol.

Mae penderfyniadau masnachol yn gofyn am y gallu i ymateb i amgylchiadau presennol. Nid yw'r broses uno, hyd yma, wedi profi na dangos sut y bydd yn hwyluso twf marchnata a datblygiad busnesau twristiaeth, fel y dywedodd Elin Jones. Awgrymodd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru y bydd yr uno yn dod ag arbedion posibl o ryw £10 miliwm y flwyddyn. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn na chafodd ei ddangos yw canran y costau

costs that the saving represents. The WLGA responded thus:

'Figures concerning savings are...very difficult to scrutinise due to their inherent vagueness.'

No mention either has been made of any form of independent monitoring of customer service delivery. So where are we really with this, Minister? I fear that the Welsh Assembly Government donkey is once again truly behind the cart. I see little forethought or planning and scanty research. Minister, you seem to be bent on steering us on a course that takes us into uncharted waters without the benefit of any relevant navigation aids.

Deputy Presiding Officer, forgive my use of mixed metaphors, but tourism operators and visitors to my country deserve far more than to be flown in on a wing and a prayer by the seat of their pants.

4.10 p.m.

Michael German: It is worthwhile to remind ourselves of the journey that we are on and how it started. I am sure that Members recall that it was on the very last day before summer recess last year that the First Minister made the announcement about bringing the quangos in-house. Many people asked 'where is the plan that will take us on this journey?'. We discovered that there was no real plan and that we were inside a maze and working our way through it. It is within this muddled maze that I have some difficulty in understanding how the First Minister and his colleagues have addressed the key issues that were raised then and which are still as relevant today. Those are the issues that have clearly emerged as themes throughout the 125 consultation responses.

The first is the direction in which we are heading. Does the First Minister agree with the WDA that the success, or otherwise, of this whole project will be judged by the extent to which there is a discernable improvement in service delivery to customers with effect from 1 April 2006? If that is the case, we need to know now that we are comfortable with the change, and that by 1

rhedeg y mae'r arbedion yn eu cynrychioli. Ymatebodd CLILC fel hyn:

Mae'n anodd iawn craffu ar ffigurau sy'n ymwneud ag arbedion oherwydd eu hamhendranrwydd cynhenid.

Ni soniwyd ychwaith am unrhyw fath o fonitro annibynnol o ddarparu gwasanaeth cwsmeriaid. Felly, beth yw'r sefyllfa yn hyn o beth, Weinidog? Ofnaf fod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru unwaith eto wedi gwneud pethau o chwith. Ni welaf lawer o ragfeddwl na chynllunio, a gwelaf waith ymchwil annigonol. Weinidog, ymddengys eich bod yn benderfynol o fynd i gyfeiriad sy'n ein harwain i dir newydd heb allu manteisio ar unrhyw gymhorthion llywio perthnasol.

Ddirprwy Lywydd, mae gweithredwyr twristiaeth ac ymwelwyr â'm gwlad yn haeddu llawer mwy na darpariaeth ffwrdd-â-hi.

Michael German: Mae'n werth inni atgoffa ein hunain o'n taith a sut y dechreuodd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Aelodau'n cofio mai ar y diwrnod olaf un cyn toriad yr haf y llynedd y gwnaeth y Prif Weinidog y cyhoeddiad ynglŷn â dod â'r cwangos o dan adain y Cynulliad. Gofynnodd nifer o bobl 'ble mae'r cynllun a fydd yn ein tywys ar y daith?'. Gwelsom nad oedd yno gynllun gwirioneddol a'n bod mewn drysfa ac yn gweithio ein ffordd allan ohoni. Yn y ddrysfa hon, caf anhawster i ddeall sut y mae'r Prif Weinidog a'i gyd-Aelodau wedi mynd i'r afael â'r materion allweddol a godwyd bryd hynny ac sy'n dal yr un mor berthnasol heddiw. Dyna'r materion a ddaeth i'r amlwg yn glir fel themâu drwy'r 125 o ymatebion i'r ymgynghori.

Y cyntaf yw'r cyfeiriad yr ydym yn mynd iddo. A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn cytuno â WDA y bydd llwyddiant y prosiect cyfan hwn, neu fel arall, yn cael ei farnu yn ôl y graddau y bydd gwelliannau gweladwy wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau i gwsmeriaid o 1 Ebrill 2006 ymlaen? Os felly, mae angen inni wybod yn awr ein bod yn fodlon â'r newid, ac erbyn 1 Ebrill 2006 mai dyna fydd

April 2006, that will be the objective.

Let us look at some of the issues that relate to achieving that objective. Jeff Cuthbert, who has now left, was right about the advisory committees. Setting up an advisory committee to provide expertise and advice to the Government about the decisions to be made would be fine and dandy provided that people were listening. The question that must be asked—it was asked by Jeff Cuthbert, and it is the suspicion of all board members of the quangos that will be abolished—is will we be listened to if we are placed upon an advisory committee. It is the difference between being there with or without expertise, which leads in a way to the whole process of being professional about what happens. Will this be done professionally, and will we have the business expertise on board?

Another fundamental question, which I remember raising last July, is about the incompatibility between what might be discerned as a civil service culture and that of a business delivery culture, which is what we have been considering with regard to ELWa, the WTB and the WDA. I would like the First Minister to respond to this in his reply. There is a civil service culture, which, in general terms, could be described as ‘we are responsible for seeing ourselves through an objective that has been set for us by going through the hoops and by ensuring that we have checked off that we can do these things and reach the eventual goal’. On the other hand, you might describe the reason and rationale behind the quangos as being to energise, support and encourage their customers and clients. It is on the bringing together of those two different cultures that I seek reassurance from the First Minister today.

Alun Cairns: Do you agree that the difference between the civil service and the business-like culture that we are seeking is that civil servants lose their jobs because a process has not been followed, but businessmen lose their jobs because they have not achieved an outcome?

Michael German: I agree with what Jeff

y nod.

Gadewch inni edrych ar y materion sy'n ymwneud â chyflawni'r amcan hwnnw. Yr oedd Jeff Cuthbert, sydd bellach wedi gadael, yn llygad ei le ynglŷn â'r pwyllgorau cynghori. Byddai sefydlu pwyllgor cynghori i ddarparu arbenigedd a chynghor i'r Llywodraeth am y penderfyniadau i'w gwneud yn wych pe bae pobl yn gwrando. Y cwestiwn y mae'n rhaid imi ei ofyn—fe'i gofynnwyd gan Jeff Cuthbert, ac mae pob un o aelodau byrddau'r cwangos a gaiff eu diddymu yn ei amau—yw a fydd rhywun yn gwrando arnom os cawn ein rhoi ar bwyllgor cynghori. Dyna'r gwahaniaeth rhwng bod yno gydag arbenigedd neu heb arbenigedd, sy'n arwain mewn ffordd at yr holl broses o fod yn broffesiynol ynglŷn â'r hyn sy'n digwydd. A gaiff hyn ei wneud yn broffesiynol, ac a fydd gennym yr arbenigedd busnes?

Mae cwestiwn sylfaenol arall yr wyf yn cofio ei godi fis Gorffennaf diwethaf yn ymwneud â'r anghydweddi rhwng yr hyn a allai gael ei ddirnad yn ddiwylliant gwasanaeth sifil a diwylliant darparu busnes, sef yr hyn y buom yn ei ystyried o ran ELWa, y Bwrdd Croeso a WDA. Hoffwn i'r Prif Weinidog ymateb i hyn yn ei ateb. Mae yma ddiwylliant gwasanaeth sifil y gellid, yn gyffredinol, ei ddisgrifio fel 'rydym yn gyfrifol am gyflawni amcan a bennwyd ar ein cyfer drwy fynd drwy'r felin a thrwy sicrhau ein bod wedi gwirio y gallwn wneud y pethau hyn a chyrraedd y nod terfynol'. Ar y llaw arall, efallai y byddech yn disgrifio'r rheswm a'r rhesymeg y tu ôl i'r cwangos fel symbylu, cefnogi ac annog eu cwsmeriaid a'u cleientiaid. Yr wyf yn gofyn am sicrwydd gan y Prif Weinidog heddiw am y gwaith o ddod â'r ddau ddiwylliant gwahanol hyn ynghyd.

Alun Cairns: A gytunwch mai'r gwahaniaeth rhwng y gwasanaeth sifil a'r diwylliant busnes yr ydym yn ei geisio yw bod gweision sifil yn colli eu swyddi oherwydd na ddilynwyd proses, ond bod dynion busnes yn colli eu swyddi oherwydd nad ydynt wedi sicrhau canlyniad?

Michael German: Cytunaf â'r hyn a

Cuthbert said earlier, in that this must affect the whole civil service culture in Wales. I am yet to hear what will happen with regard to the new civil service culture—will it mean a new contract, a new relationship or will there be differences in the contract from what we have already seen and heard? I am none the wiser at present as to whether that will happen, and I seek that reassurance from the First Minister.

We are worried about loss of expertise, and I ask the First Minister, as I did a few weeks ago, whether he is satisfied that there have been 19 leavers and only two joiners in the finance and risk division of ELWa since he made his first announcement? That division deals with the financial aspects of ELWa and there is concern about the nature of the job that is to be done. It is natural that people are concerned in a changing environment. However, if reassurance is not provided quickly, it will not encourage the achievement of that delivery, which is the eventual aim of any process of this kind.

My final point is about the savings to which people have alluded. We are told that we will have to meet the deficit in the pensions and try to achieve these savings. We are also told that all of these quangos will have to make the 1 per cent year-on-year savings that are set out for all public authorities in Wales. If that is so, there will be a cost to this merger process and to the pensions process. Where will we end up financially? What is the financial calculation for this whole process? Will we see savings or will they be swallowed up in what is essentially going to be a cost-cutting exercise in order to meet the 1 per cent year-on-year savings?

Owen John Thomas: Byddaf yn canolbwyntio ar dri o'r hen gwangos, sef Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru, ELWa a Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg. Mae gan ACCAC rôl ganolog yn y gwaith o hybu'r Cwricwlwm Cymreig a pharatoi darpariaeth ar gyfer addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg. Mae gan ELWa hefyd ddiddordeb mawr yn yr iaith, mewn datblygu dysgu

ddywedodd Jeff Cuthbert yn gynharach, sef bod yn rhaid i hyn effeithio ar holl ddiwylliant y gwasanaeth sifil yng Nghymru. Nid wyf wedi clywed beth fydd yn digwydd o ran y diwylliant gwasanaeth sifil newydd hyd yma—a fydd yn golygu contract newydd, cydberthynas newydd neu a fydd y contract yn wahanol i'r hyn yr ydym eisoes wedi'i weld a'i glywed? Nid wyf fawr callach ar hyn o bryd am y cwestiwn a fydd hynny'n digwydd, ac yr wyf yn gofyn i'r Prif Weinidog am y sicrwydd hwnnw.

Yr ydym yn poeni am golli arbenigedd, a gofynnaf i'r Prif Weinidog, fel y gwneuthum ychydig wythnosau'n ôl, a yw'n fodlon bod 19 o bobl wedi gadael is-adran cyllid a risg ELWa a dau yn unig wedi ymuno â'r is-adran ers iddo wneud ei gyhoeddiad cyntaf? Mae'r is-adran honno'n ymdrin ag agweddau ariannol ELWa ac mae pryder am natur y gwaith sydd i'w wneud. Mae pobl yn naturiol bod yn bryderus mewn amgylchedd sy'n newid. Fodd bynnag, os na roddir sicrwydd yn fuan, ni fydd anogaeth i sicrhau'r ddarpariaeth honno, sef nod unrhyw broses o'r math hwn yn y pen draw.

Mae a wnelo fy mhwynt olaf â'r arbedion y mae pobl wedi cyfeirio atynt. Dywedir wrthym y bydd yn rhaid inni dalu'r diffyg yn y pensiynau a cheisio sicrhau'r arbedion hyn. Dywedir wrthym hefyd y bydd yn rhaid i bob un o'r cwangos hyn wneud yr arbedion o flwyddyn i flwyddyn o 1 y cant sydd wedi eu gosod allan ar gyfer pob awdurdod cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Os felly, bydd cost i'r broses uno hon ac i'r broses bensiynau. Beth fydd y sefyllfa ariannol yn y pen draw? Beth yw'r cyfrifiad ariannol ar gyfer y broses gyfan hon? A fyddwn yn gweld arbedion, neu a gânt eu llyncu yn yr hyn a fydd, yn ei hanfod, yn ymarfer lleihau costau er mwyn gwneud yr arbedion o flwyddyn i flwyddyn o 1 y cant?

Owen John Thomas: I will focus on three of the former quangos, namely the Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales, ELWa and the Welsh Language Board. ACCAC has a central role in promoting Y Curriculum Cymreig and in preparing the provision of Welsh-medium education. ELWa also has a great interest in the language, in developing the teaching of

Cymraeg i oedolion ac mewn hybu dysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg mewn colegau addysg bellach. Wrth gwrs, mae gan y bwrdd iaith gyfrifoldeb dros fonitro cynlluniau iaith cyrff cyhoeddus, ac yn arbennig dros gynlluniau addysg Gymraeg awdurdodau lleol.

Yn ogystal â'r cyrff hyn, mae adrannau fel yr adran ddiwylliant, sydd yn gyfrifol am sefydliadau cenedlaethol fel Llyfrgell Genedlaethol Cymru, yr amgueddfeydd cenedlaethol ac yn y blaen. Hefyd, mae'r uned iaith Gymraeg, sef uned newydd sy'n goruchwyllo'r gwaith o ddatblygu a gweithredu 'Iaith Pawb.'

Wrth sefyll yn ôl ac edrych yn wrthrychol ar y sefyllfa, gwelaf gyfle i wneud cyfle o'r cawl fel tae. Y dewis arall, wrth gwrs, yw i wneud cawl o'r cyfle. Mae gennym gyfle gwych i uno'r rhannau o'r cyrff sy'n ymwneud ag addysg Gymraeg, fel yr adran yn ELWa sy'n ymwneud â dysgu Cymraeg i oedolion, gyda'r bwrdd iaith a'r uned sy'n gyfrifol am yr iaith yn y Cynulliad. Dylem edrych ar yr adran ddiwylliant i weld a oes modd defnyddio dawn, sgiliau ac arbenigedd yn yr holl gyrff yma er mwyn creu peiriant sy'n gallu gyrru ymlaen ddatblygiad yr iaith Gymraeg a chryfhau cymeriad cenedlaethol Cymru. Yr wyf yn gobeithio, Brif Weinidog, y cymerwch y cyfle hwn i edrych ar hyn o ddifrif ar sut y gellir creu rhyw fath o beiriant i yrru ymlaen a datblygu cymeriad Cymru a'i chymeriad Cymraeg. Mae'n bwysig eich bod yn gwneud hyn.

Er mwyn gwneud hyn, mae eisiau blaengynllunio, oherwydd bydd y gwaith o dynnu'r cyrff i mewn yn digwydd dros gyfnod hir, efallai dwy flynedd neu fwy. Yr wyf yn apelio arnoch, Brif Weinidog, i ddwys ystyried hyn fel y gall Rhodri Morgan fod yn Rhodri Fawr.

William Graham: It is clearly vital that we retain the confidence of companies and organisations in Wales if we are to secure an enhanced co-operation between the workplace, learning institutions and the

Welsh to adults, and in promoting Welsh-medium teaching in further education colleges. The language board, of course, is responsible for monitoring the language schemes of public bodies, particularly local authority plans for Welsh-medium education.

In addition to these bodies, there are departments such as the culture department, which is responsible for national organisations such as the National Library of Wales, the national museums and so on. There is also the Welsh language unit, a new unit which is responsible for overseeing the development and implementation of 'Iaith Pawb.'

By taking a step back and looking objectively at the situation, I can see an opportunity to make something of this mess, or maybe to make a mess of the opportunity. I believe this is an excellent opportunity to bring together those parts of these bodies involved with Welsh-language education, such as the division within ELWa involved with the teaching of Welsh to adults, with the language board and the Assembly unit responsible for the Welsh language. We should look to the culture department to see whether it is possible to utilise the expertise, talent and skills of these bodies to create some kind of engine to drive forward the development of the Welsh language and the identity of Wales as a nation. I hope, First Minister, that you will take this opportunity to seriously examine the creation of some kind of engine to drive forward and develop the character of Wales and its Welsh-speaking nature. It is important that you do that.

We need to plan ahead, of course, in order to do this, because the process of bringing in these bodies will take a long time, perhaps two years or more. I implore you, First Minister, to give this serious consideration so that Rhodri Morgan can be called Rhodri Fawr.

William Graham: Mae'n amlwg yn hollbwysig i gwmnïau a sefydliadau yng Nghymru barhau i ymddiried ynom os ydym i sicrhau gwell cydweithio rhwng y gweithle, sefydliadau dysgu a'r dysgwr. Wrth

learner. In acknowledging that the majority of further and higher education students in Wales are part time, it is vital that these pathways towards achieving a knowledge-driven economy for Wales are retained. Again, it is clearly vital that the Assembly education department vigorously pursues policies to promote access to lifelong learning.

Sadly, we are all aware that ELWa has a troubled past with regard to accountability. Under scrutiny, the Auditor General has repeatedly identified failures of administrative procedures, which were largely defended by the present Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning. The Assembly Government must ensure adequate scrutiny of ELWa functions once it has been absorbed. The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning will now be fully accountable and will accept full responsibility for ensuring that such errors are not repeated.

To be able to respond to all the needs of the workplace and the learner, to advance the requirements of part-time, vocational academic courses, and to enhance pathways towards higher education, the Minister must demonstrate clear lines for decision making and continuity of service to meet the expectations of all service users. Some 1,600 staff are involved, and I note that a cost of £35 million was suggested at one time, but that did not take into account redundancies or new IT. The First Minister suggested in February of this year that there might be savings of £120 million, which could perhaps be a convenient amount towards paying tuition fees in Wales.

4.20 p.m.

The chairman of one of the affected bodies said last November that

‘it is very difficult to maintain the enthusiasm and forward movement of your staff while at the same time dealing with a situation of change and great uncertainty’.

That is what Sheila Drury told delegates at the conference of the Chartered Institute of

gydnabod bod y mwyafrif o fyfyrwyr addysg bellach ac addysg uwch yng Nghymru yn fyfyrwyr rhan amser, mae'n hollbwysig cadw'r llwybrau hyn tuag at sicrhau economi yn seiliedig ar wybodaeth yng Nghymru. Unwaith eto, mae'n amlwg yn hollbwysig i adran addysg y Cynulliad fynd ati'n egniol i ddatblygu polisiau i hyrwyddo mynediad i ddysgu gydol oes.

Yn anffodus, fe wyddom bob un fod ELWa wedi cael trafferthion yn y gorffennol o ran atebolrwydd. O dan broses graffu, mae'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol droeon a thro wedi nodi methiannau mewn gweithdrefnau gweinyddol a gafodd eu hamddiffyn i raddau helaeth gan y Gweinidog presennol dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad sicrhau bod craffu digonol ar swyddogaethau ELWa ar ôl ei ymgorffori. Bydd y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes bellach yn gwbl atebol, a bydd yn cymryd cyfrifoldeb llawn dros sicrhau na fydd camgymeriadau o'r fath yn digwydd eto.

Er mwyn gallu ymateb i holl anghenion y gweithle a'r dysgwr, er mwyn datblygu gofynion cyrsiau academaidd galwedigaethol rhan amser, ac er mwyn gwella llwybrau i addysg uwch, rhaid i'r Gweinidog ddangos llinellau clir dros wneud penderfyniadau a pharhad gwasanaethau i fodloni disgwyliadau pawb sy'n defnyddio gwasanaethau. Mae tua 1,600 o staff yn gysylltiedig â hyn, a sylwaf fod cost o £35 miliwn wedi ei hawgrymu ar un adeg, ond nid oedd hynny'n ystyried diswyddiadau na TG newydd. Awgrymodd y Prif Weinidog ym mis Chwefror eleni y gallai fod arbedion o £120 miliwn, a allai fod yn swm cyfleus, hwyrach, i dalu ffioedd dysgu yng Nghymru.

Dywedodd cadeirydd un o'r cyrff dan sylw fis Tachwedd diwethaf

ei bod yn anodd iawn sicrhau bod eich staff yn dal yn frwdfrydig ac yn dal i ddatblygu a hwythau ar yr un pryd yn ymdrin â sefyllfa o newid ac ansicrwydd mawr.

Dyna'r hyn a ddywedodd Sheila Drury wrth gynadleddwyr yng nghynhadledd y

Public Finance and Accountancy in Wales last November. She said that ELWa's 400 employees were concerned about becoming civil servants and that

'people have a mental picture of what a civil servant is like. Sir Humphrey is a caricature... but staff have uncertainties, and as long as you have staff with uncertainties you are going to have an impact on performance, potentially during the transition period'.

She concludes that

'if these mergers are to be more than a political exercise, the world out there has to get a better service. The organisations shouldn't fold into government and be lost in a black hole never to be seen again'.

Decision making must not become burdened by unnecessary bureaucratic hurdles, and staff must be empowered to make decisions at appropriate levels. There must be continuity of service if we are to develop further ventures such as the Wasp-IT project. This two-year initiative, which was launched in April this year, secured £10 million of private funding to match a similar amount from ELWa and the European Union. It provides outsourcing to 50 firms, and any disruption to this scheme would not only place in jeopardy future private funding investment streams, but would damage relationships between the workplace and the learner, closing down opportunities to enhance further and higher education. I await Ministers' assurances on these matters and anticipate the acceptance of responsibility for future failure in accountability, scrutiny and service delivery.

Peter Black: As a former civil servant, I think that I should say that the life is not all that bad. Honestly, you do get to use your initiative a bit and I quite enjoyed being a civil servant. I do not think that we should do down civil servants too much.

When we talk about the merger process, it is inevitable that we concentrate on the process

Sefydliad Siartredig Cyllid Cyhoeddus a Chyfrifyddiaeth yng Nghymru fis Tachwedd diwethaf. Dywedodd fod y 400 o gyflogeion yn ELWa yn pryderu am fod yn weision sifil a

bod gan bobl ddarlun yn eu meddwl o was sifil. Mae Syr Humphrey yn gymeriad dychan... ond mae ansicrwydd ymhlith staff, a thra bydd gennych ansicrwydd ymhlith staff, bydd effaith ar berfformiad, o bosibl yn ystod y cyfnod pontio.

Mae'n gorffen drwy ddweud

os yw'r broses o uno'r cyrff hyn i fod yn fwy nag ymarfer gwleidyddol, rhaid darparu gwasanaeth gwell. Ni ddylai'r sefydliadau gael eu hymgorffori yn y llywodraeth a diflannu i dwll du lle na chânt eu gweld byth eto.

Ni ddylai fod rhwystrau biwrocraidd diangen yn y broses o wneud penderfyniadau, a rhaid grymuso staff i wneud penderfyniadau ar lefelau priodol. Rhaid sicrhau parhad gwasanaeth os ydym i ddatblygu mentrau eraill megis prosiect Wasp-IT. Cafodd y fenter ddwy flynedd hon, a lansiwyd ym mis Ebrill eleni, £10 miliwn o arian preifat i gyfateb i swm tebyg gan ELWa a'r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Mae'n darparu contractau allanol i 50 o gwmnïau, ac yn ogystal â pheryglu ffrydiau buddsoddi arian preifat yn y dyfodol, byddai unrhyw darfu ar y cynllun hwn yn niweidio'r berthynas rhwng y gweithle a'r dysgwr, gan ddileu cyfleoedd i wella addysg bellach ac addysg uwch. Disgwyliaf sicrwydd gan y Gweinidogion ar y materion hyn, a rhagwelaf y byddant yn derbyn y cyfrifoldeb dros fethiant mewn atebolrwydd, craffu a darparu gwasanaethau yn y dyfodol.

Peter Black: Fel cyn-was sifil, credaf y dylwn ddweud nad yw'r bywyd cynddrwg â hynny. A bod yn onest, cewch gyfle i wneud pethau ar eich menter eich hun i ryw raddau, ac yr oeddwn yn ddigon hapus yn bod yn was sifil. Nid wyf yn credu y dylem fod mor fychanol o weision sifil.

Pan soniwn am y broses uno, mae'n anochel inni ganolbwyntio ar y broses ei hun yn

itself rather than on the issues. I think that the issues are important and the outcome of the process, whatever it may be—although I think that that is predetermined—will have to be better services and a better way for Wales to be run, which means a better Government and a better process of government. If that is not achieved, this process will have failed.

I know that many people have talked about the process of bringing these bodies into the Assembly, how this merger was announced, the consultation on it, how the decision was taken, and how it is being implemented. I want to talk about what happened after that stage—the second part of the process, if you like—the process of how we deal with the new departments once they have been created. I think that that is just as important, and possibly more important, if this goes ahead. How to scrutinise the new education and lifelong learning department was discussed briefly in the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee this morning. I consider scrutiny a very important aspect of the process of government. It is vital that we get to the heart of what is happening so that we ensure that the Government is operating effectively and efficiently. If there are problems, we should get to the bottom of them and find out what has caused them so that we can put them right. If there are people who are to be blamed, we will need to deal with that.

The whole idea behind this, of course, is that if there are people to be blamed, quite clearly those people will be the Ministers. Ministers will be far more on the line, if you like, in terms of defending the decisions taken by bodies that will no longer be directly accountable to them. That is to be welcomed and supported. My concern is that once the Minister is responsible and the organisation becomes part of the department, we will not have the same level of scrutiny as we have now. At present, you can go along and talk to the chief executive, visit the body, spend the day there, and quiz people in some detail as to what exactly has happened and what they are doing. There is a paradox in that the whole decision-making process will become more accountable with the Minister taking responsibility, while having less access to the

hytrach nag ar y materion. Credaf fod y materion yn bwysig, a rhaid sicrhau mai canlyniad y broses, beth bynnag fydd hynny—er bod hynny wedi'i bennu ymlaen llaw, yn fy marn i—fydd gwasanaethau gwell a ffordd well o redeg Cymru, sy'n golygu Llywodraeth well a phroses lywodraethu well. Os na chyflawnir hynny, bydd y broses hon wedi methu.

Gwn fod nifer wedi sôn am y broses o ymgorffori'r cyrff hyn yn y Cynulliad, sut y cyhoeddwyd y broses uno honno, yr ymgynghori amdani, sut y gwnaed y penderfyniad, a sut y caiff ei roi ar waith. Byddaf fi'n sôn am yr hyn a ddigwyddodd wedyn—ail ran y broses, os mynnwch—y broses sut y byddwn yn ymdrin â'r adrannau newydd ar ôl eu creu. Credaf fod hynny lawn mor bwysig, ac o bosibl yn bwysicach, os bydd hyn yn mynd yn ei flaen. Trafodwyd yn fras y ffordd o graffu ar yr adran addysg a dysgu gydol oes newydd yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes y bore yma. Credaf fod craffu yn agwedd bwysig iawn ar y broses lywodraethu. Mae'n hanfodol inni fynd at graidd yr hyn sy'n digwydd, fel y gallwn sicrhau bod y Llywodraeth yn gweithredu'n effeithiol ac effeithlon. Os oes problemau, dylem fynd at graidd y problemau hynny a darganfod beth sydd wedi eu hachosi fel y gallwn eu datrys. Os bydd pobl ar fai, bydd angen inni ymdrin â hynny.

Wrth wraidd hyn i gyd, wrth gwrs, mae'r syniad mai'r Gweinidogion fydd y bobl ar fai, wrth gwrs, os bydd rhywun ar fai. Bydd Gweinidogion lawer yn fwy atebol, os mynnwch, o ran amddiffyn y penderfyniadau a wneir gan gyrff na fyddant mwyach yn uniongyrchol atebol iddynt. Dylid croesawu a chefnogi hynny. Pryderaf na fydd gennym yr un lefel o graffu ag sydd gennym yn awr, pan fydd y Gweinidog yn gyfrifol a phan fydd y sefydliad yn rhan o'r adran. Ar hyn o bryd, gallwch fynd i siarad â'r prif weithredwr, gallwch ymweld â'r corff, treulio'r diwrnod yno, a holi pobl yn fanwl am yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd yn union a'r hyn y maent yn ei wneud. Mae yma paradocs oherwydd bydd y broses o wneud penderfyniadau'n dod yn fwy atebol gyda'r Gweinidog yn cymryd y cyfrifoldeb ond

process by which those decisions were taken and the reasons for them. It will only be possible to question the Minister, but that would invite political answers and political dialogue. The dialogue would become more political and less about the administration of government, and that is what concerns me most. The process of scrutiny becomes more difficult, because you have to do that through committees that meet in a three-weekly cycle, which means that there would not be enough time to carry out the necessary scrutiny.

In a way, the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee has largely followed what the Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee did by visiting the ASPBs. We found that beneficial, and it was a useful process through which we learnt a great deal. I think that we now have a better understanding of what was happening in those bodies. I commend the Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee for pioneering that approach. However, we will not be able to do that with ELWa and ACCAC once they have been merged with the Government because we will not have the same level of access. That is the biggest regret that I have, and it must be addressed when the new structures are put in place.

I only have a few seconds left, so I will make two quick points about ELWa. I want an answer as to what will happen to the community consortia for education and training. Also, we need an idea about the cost of this process. Financial cost has been incurred, which has detracted from the bodies' spending on service delivery, and we need to know about that.

Mark Isherwood: In north Wales, there is already widespread feeling that the Assembly is a Cardiff-dominated organisation, and there was a sharp, collective intake of corporate breath, to quote the *Daily Post*, when it was announced that the WDA was to be subsumed into the workings of the Welsh Assembly Government.

Leighton Andrews referred to Tai Cymru—

gyda llai o fynediad i'r broses ar gyfer gwneud y penderfyniadau hynny a'r rhesymau drostynt. Ni allwn ond gofyn cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog, ond byddai hynny'n gwahodd atebion gwleidyddol a thrafodaeth wleidyddol. Byddai'r drafodaeth yn mynd yn fwy gwleidyddol ac yn ymwneud llai â'r broses o weinyddu llywodraeth, a dyna'r hyn sy'n peri'r pryder mwyaf imi. Bydd y broses graffu yn mynd yn fwy anodd, oherwydd bydd yn rhaid ichi wneud hynny drwy bwyllgorau sy'n cyfarfod mewn cylch o dair wythnos, gan olygu na fyddai digon o amser i wneud y gwaith craffu angenrheidiol.

Ar un ystyr, mae'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i raddau helaeth wedi dilyn yr hyn a wnaeth y Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon drwy ymweld â'r CCNC. Yr oedd hynny o fudd, ac yr oedd yn broses ddefnyddiol a ddysgodd lawer inni. Credaf ein bod bellach yn deall yn well yr hyn a oedd yn digwydd yn y cyrff hynny. Yr wyf yn cymeradwyo'r Pwyllgor Diwydiant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon am arloesi yn hynny o beth. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddwn yn gallu gwneud hynny gydag ELWa ac ACCAC ar ôl iddynt uno â'r Llywodraeth, oherwydd ni fydd gennym yr un lefel o fynediad. Dyna'r hyn y gresynaf amdano fwyaf, a rhaid ymdrin â hynny pan roddir y strwythurau newydd ar waith.

Dim ond ychydig eiliadau sydd gennyf ar ôl, felly, soniaf am ddau bwynt bach ynglŷn ag ELWa. Yr wyf am gael ateb am yr hyn a fydd yn digwydd i'r consortia cymunedol dros addysg a hyfforddiant. A hefyd mae angen inni gael syniad o gost y broses hon. Mae cost ariannol wedi ei hachosi, sydd wedi lleihau gwariant y cyrff ar ddarparu gwasanaethau, ac mae angen inni wybod am hynny.

Mark Isherwood: Yn y Gogledd, mae nifer yn teimlo eisoes fod y Cynulliad yn sefydliad dan ddylanwad Caerdydd, ac yr oedd syndod mawr yn y byd corfforaethol, yn ôl adroddiad y *Daily Post*, pan gyhoeddwyd y byddai WDA yn cael ei gynnwys yng ngweithrediadau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Cyfeiriodd Leighton Andrews at Tai

Housing for Wales, and it might be timely for us to remind ourselves that Tai Cymru built four times as many affordable houses as this Labour shower has done since it abolished that body.

Concern at national level about the abolition of the WDA was expressed jointly by the CBI, the Institute of Directors, the Federation of Small Businesses and the British Chambers of Commerce. However, recognition that existing structures will be changed has led them to prioritise the need for the successor body to be customer-focused and accountable. They note that there is little substance on how much the merger process will ultimately cost and how the improvements are to be delivered and subsequently measured, adding that greater recognition in the consultation paper that a strong private sector role is key to achieving sustained economic growth in Wales 'would have been welcomed'. What an understatement. Meanwhile, research by Cardiff University concludes that there is a great danger that the abolition of the quangos and the merger with the Assembly Government will create a larger, more bureaucratic and more risk-averse organisation.

Meeting Andrew Davies after the merger announcement, the Institute of Directors outlined its concern that the culture in which the public sector dealt with the private sector was not driven by the need for efficiency and customer satisfaction. Noting that concern, Andrew Davies promised an options paper by the end of November 2004, but he even failed that efficiency test. The Institute of Directors is not so much interested in structures as in outcomes that are measured on the basis of customer feedback. It wants to ensure that any future business board is not chaired by a Minister or civil servant, and that the business sector has a strategic input into Business Wales.

CBI Cymru states that the current economic development budget warrants a thorough review to establish what is being delivered, to whom, by whom, and to what effect—a

Cymru—Housing for Wales, ac efallai ei bod yn bryd inni atgoffa ein hunain fod Tai Cymru wedi adeiladu pedair gwaith gymaint o dai fforddiadwy ag a wnaeth y criw Llafur hwn ers iddo ddiddymu'r corff hwnnw.

Mynegwyd pryder yn genedlaethol ynghylch diddymu WDA gan y CBI, Sefydliad y Cyfarwyddwyr, Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach a chan Siambrau Masnach Prydain. Fodd bynnag, mae'r gydnabyddiaeth y bydd y strwythurau presennol yn newid wedi eu harwain i flaenoriaethu'r angen i'r corff a fydd yn dilyn ganolbwyntio ar gwsmeriaid a bod yn atebol. Sylwant nad oes llawer o fanylion am gost y broses uno yn y pen draw, a sut y bwriedir cyflwyno'r gwelliannau a'u mesur wedyn. Ychwanegant y byddai mwy o gydnabyddiaeth yn y papur ymgynghori fod rôl gref i'r sector preifat yn allweddol i sicrhau twf economaidd parhaus yng Nghymru 'yn cael ei groesawu'. A dweud y lleiaf! Yn y cyfamser, daw gwaith ymchwil gan Brifysgol Caerdydd i'r casgliad fod perygl mawr y bydd y broses o ddiddymu'r cwangos a'r uno â Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn creu sefydliad mwy o faint a mwy biwrocraidaidd a fydd yn llai parod i fentro.

Wrth gyfarfod ag Andrew Davies ar ôl cyhoeddi'r uno, amlinellodd Sefydliad y Cyfarwyddwyr ei bryder nad oedd y diwylliant lle mae'r sector cyhoeddus yn delio â'r sector preifat yn cael ei lywio gan yr angen am effeithlonrwydd a boddhad cwsmeriaid. Gan nodi'r pryder hwnnw, addawodd Andrew Davies y byddai papur opsiynau ar gael erbyn diwedd mis Tachwedd 2004, ond methodd y prawf effeithlonrwydd hwnnw hyd yn oed. Nid oes gan Sefydliad y Cyfarwyddwyr gymaint o ddiddordeb mewn strwythurau ag mewn canlyniadau sy'n cael eu mesur yn ôl ymateb cwsmeriaid. Mae am sicrhau na chaiff unrhyw fwrdd busnes yn y dyfodol ei gadeirio gan Weinidog na gwas sifil, ac y caiff y sector busnes wneud cyfraniad strategol i Fusnes Cymru.

Dywed CBI Cymru fod y gyllideb datblygu economaidd gyfredol yn haeddu adolygiad trylwyr i bennu beth sy'n cael ei ddarparu, i bwy, gan bwy, a chyda pha effaith—

review with extensive involvement by the business sector. Having then established a baseline, it states that the Welsh Assembly Government must discuss with the business community any improvements it wishes to see brought about—improvements underpinned by accountability to customers, by business representation on a supervisory board and by the separation of delivery from policy making, with many areas delivered outside the civil service administration on economic rather than political grounds.

In the medium term, there must also be a fundamental review of Welsh Assembly Government ministerial portfolios and departments to determine whether they are appropriate for the needs of Wales. The Institute of Directors states that the split ministerial responsibility for business training must end with the abolition of ELWa and the WDA and that clear accountability be established. As we have heard, the independent Resolv 'Lost Children of Wales' report, falling functional literacy and numeracy, and worrying levels of economic inactivity among young people confirm that education policy is not meeting the needs of an enterprising Wales. Front-line business people and front-line educational professionals must therefore now work together to transform education and training so that the skills needed by the workplace may be developed and the needs of learners met. With grave concern over budgets being expressed by schools and further education colleges across Wales, the Welsh Assembly Government must heed the call in Fforwm's post ELWa position paper for the establishment of an effective regional structure within a strong national framework, with front-line responsibility for funding, developing and ensuring a quality learning infrastructure.

4.30 p.m.

The bonfire of the quangos must now deliver for the changing needs of Wales in the twenty-first century. Customers, whether businesses or education providers, need to have the chance to inform and shape what is delivered, and Ministers must agree to hold

adolygiad gyda chyfranogiad sylweddol gan y sector busnes. Wedyn, ar ôl pennu llinell sylfaen, mae'n dweud bod yn rhaid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru drafod gyda'r gymuned fusnes unrhyw welliannau y mae'n dymuno eu cyflwyno—gwelliannau ar sail atebolrwydd i gwsmeriaid, cynrychiolaeth busnes ar fwrdd goruchwyllo a gwahanu'r broses ddarparu oddi wrth y broses o wneud penderfyniadau, a nifer o feysydd yn cael eu darparu y tu allan i weinyddiaeth y gwasanaeth sifil am resymau economaidd yn hytrach na rhesymau gwleidyddol.

Yn y tymor canolig, rhaid gwneud adolygiad sylfaenol hefyd o bortffolios gweinidogion ac adrannau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru er mwyn cadarnhau a ydynt yn briodol ar gyfer anghenion Cymru. Dywed Sefydliad y Cyfarwyddwyr fod yn rhaid i gyfrifoldeb gweinidogion dros hyfforddiant busnes sy'n cael ei rannu ddod i ben pan gaiff ELWa a WDA eu diddymu, ac y dylid sefydlu atebolrwydd clir. Fel y clywsom, mae adroddiad annibynnol Resolv 'Plant Coll Cymru', safonau llythrennedd a rhifedd gweithredol sy'n gostwng, a lefelau anweithgarwch economaidd ymhlith pobl ifanc sy'n peri gofid yn cadarnhau nad yw polisi addysg yn diwallu anghenion Cymru flaengar. Felly, rhaid i bobl fusnes a gweithwyr proffesiynol addysgu yn y rheng-flaen gydweithio yn awr i drawsnewid addysg a hyfforddiant fel y gall y sgiliau y mae eu hangen ar y gweithle gael eu datblygu ac anghenion dysgwyr eu diwallu. Gan fod ysgolion a cholegau addysg bellach ledled Cymru yn mynegi pryder mawr ynglŷn â chyllidebau, rhaid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru roi sylw i'r galw yn y papur gan Fforwm ar y sefyllfa wedi uno ELWa am sefydlu strwythur rhanbarthol effeithiol o fewn fframwaith cenedlaethol cryf, gyda chyfrifoldeb rheng-flaen dros ariannu, datblygu a sicrhau seilwaith dysgu o safon.

Rhaid i goelcerth y cwangos gyflawni yn awr ar gyfer anghenion Cymru sy'n newid yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Mae angen i gwsmeriaid, yn fusnesau neu'n ddarparwyr addysg, gael cyfle i lunio'r hyn a gyflawnir, a rhaid i'r Gweinidogion gytuno i fod yn

themselves accountable for the services that are delivered and the outcomes that they produce. After all, putting economic development into the hands of this lot is like putting an operating theatre into the hands of the euthanasia society.

Janet Davies: Concerns have emerged this afternoon among Members about the merger. Plaid Cymru's concerns are that the mergers will provide the best solutions for Wales. We will work with the Assembly Government, provided that we are given the information to understand what is happening. In his closing remarks, will the First Minister tell us whether there will be another Plenary debate on the mergers when we have much fuller information about them than we have at present?

I wish to focus on the merger of the Wales Tourist Board in particular. Tourism's economic potential, particularly in rural areas, needs to be maximised to give as much well-paid employment as possible. In recent years, the service provided by the WTB to attract people to Wales has improved tremendously. Advertising and information in other countries is better, the standard of accommodation is improving, and private business has been supported to provide new attractions. So, the challenge is to make this merger improve on improvements. Will the Government's actions match up to its words? Can the merger provide better working by bringing in new ideas and, possibly, a new culture to the Assembly Government?

As Peter Black just mentioned, new integrated departments will be established in the Assembly. Crucially, they must be accountable to ensure that customers and stakeholders are given the best possible service. The first lines of scrutiny are through the Subject Committees and the Ministers' Plenary questions, therefore we need to know how the new departments will relate to the two Ministers and the two Subject Committees. What is the mechanism for enabling civil society involvement?

The 'Making the Connections' report talks

atebol am y gwasanaethau a ddarperir a'r canlyniadau a gynhyrchir ganddynt. Wedi'r cyfan, mae rhoi datblygu economaidd yn nwylo'r criw hwn fel rhoi ystafell lawdriniaeth yn nwylo'r gymdeithas dros ewthanasia.

Janet Davies: Mae pryderon wedi dod i'r golwg y prynhawn yma ymhlith Aelodau am yr uno. Yr hyn sy'n gofidio Plaid Cymru yw mai'r uno fydd yn esgor ar yr atebion gorau i Gymru. Byddwn yn gweithio gyda Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ar yr amod ein bod yn cael y wybodaeth i ddeall yr hyn sy'n digwydd. Yn ei sylwadau cloi, a wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddweud wrthym a fydd dadl arall mewn Cyfarfod Llawn ar yr uno pan fydd gennym wybodaeth lawer llawnach am hynny nag sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd?

Hoffwn ganolbwyntio ar uno Bwrdd Croeso Cymru yn arbennig. Mae angen i botensial economaidd twristiaeth, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd gwledig, gael ei wireddu i'r eithaf er mwyn rhoi cymaint o waith â phosibl gyda chyflog da. Yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, mae'r gwasanaeth a ddarparwyd gan y bwrdd croeso i ddenu pobl i Gymru wedi gwella'n aruthrol. Mae hysbysebu a gwybodaeth mewn gwledydd eraill yn well, mae safon llety'n gwella, ac mae busnesau preifat wedi cael cymorth i ddarparu atyniadau newydd. Felly, yr her yw sicrhau bod y broses uno hon yn gwella gwelliannau. A fydd gweithredoedd y Llywodraethystal â'i geiriau? A all y broses uno arwain at weithio gwell drwy gyflwyno syniadau newydd ac, o bosibl, ddiwylliant newydd i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad?

Fel y mae Peter Black newydd sôn, caiff adrannau integredig newydd eu sefydlu yn y Cynulliad. Mae'n hollbwysig fod yn rhaid iddynt fod yn atebol er mwyn sicrhau y caiff cwsmeriaid a rhanddeiliaid y gwasanaeth gorau posibl. Y Pwyllgorau Pwnc a'r cwestiynau i Weinidogion yn y Cyfarfod Llawn fydd y cyfle cyntaf i graffu. Felly, mae angen inni wybod beth fydd y berthynas rhwng yr adrannau newydd a'r ddau Weinidog a'r ddau Bwyllgor Pwnc. Beth fydd y mecanwaith er mwyn i gymdeithas ddinesig gymryd rhan?

Mae'r adroddiad 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau' yn

about pilot projects for best practices and says that they are under way. Successful projects need to become mainstream, which demands money and effort. In the national health service in Wales, there are many areas of good practice, but they are not mainstreamed and are patchy. How does the Government propose to overcome the patchiness of best practice in tourism, when it has so far failed to do so for the national health service, where there has been much greater political and practical pressure?

Considerable emphasis is also given in the report to saving on corporate costs, by reducing the back-room jobs and increasing jobs in the front line. I hope that this means that the Assembly Government has learned the lessons of restructuring the national health service, which seemed to do the opposite. Is this a tacit admission that the Government got the national health service restructuring wrong?

A good outcome of these mergers would be better working with private business and the voluntary sector. Improvements have been made with the Wales Tourist Board, which we have all welcomed, but sometimes I see basic things missing. They are often small things, but they are important to the people who are affected. For example, why do tourist information offices close on a Saturday morning on bank holiday weekends when they are open all week? Why has the upper Afan valley tourist accommodation still not been sorted out? We have been talking for years about bed-and-breakfast accommodation for mountain bikers. *[Interruption.]* Well, the Minister agreed with me on this issue this morning, so I do not think that I am wrong. Why is there still a lack of bed-and-breakfast accommodation in the upper Afan valley? They are small things, but they are important.

Y Prif Weinidog: Cyn dod at y gwelliannau, ymdrinaf â rhai o'r themâu sydd wedi codi a rhai o'r cyfraniadau a wnaed, a maddeuwch imi os na chewch sylwadau ar bob cyfraniad.

sôn am brosiectau peilot ar gyfer arferion gorau, a dywed eu bod ar droed. Mae angen i brosiectau llwyddiannus ddod yn rhan o'r brif ffrwd, sy'n gofyn am arian ac ymdrech. Yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru, mae nifer o feysydd lle mae arfer da, ond ni chânt eu prif ffrydio ac y maent yn anghyson. Sut y mae'r Llywodraeth yn bwriadu goresgyn yr anghysondeb mewn arfer gorau ym maes twristiaeth, a hithau wedi methu gwneud hynny hyd yma ar gyfer y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol, lle bu llawer iawn mwy o bwysau gwleidyddol ac ymarferol?

Rhoddir cryn bwyslais yn yr adroddiad ar arbed costau corfforaethol, drwy leihau nifer y swyddi swyddfa gefn a chynyddu nifer y swyddi yn y rheng flaen. Gobeithio y bydd hyn yn golygu bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi dysgu'r gwersi o ailstrwythuro'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol, a oedd yn gwneud y gwrthwyneb i bob golwg. Ai cyfaddefiad tawel yw hwn fod y Llywodraeth wedi gwneud cawlach o ailstrwythuro'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol?

Un o ganlyniadau da y broses o uno'r cyrff hyn fyddai gwell perthynas waith â busnesau preifat a'r sector gwirfoddol. Gwnaed gwelliannau gyda Bwrdd Croeso Cymru, ac yr ydym i gyd wedi eu croesawu, ond weithiau gwelaf fod pethau sylfaenol yn eisiau. Pethau bach yn aml, ond maent yn bwysig i'r bobl yr effeithir arnynt. Er enghraifft, pam mae swyddfeydd gwybodaeth i dwristiaid ar gau ar fore dydd Sadwrn ar benwythnosau gŵyl y banc er eu bod ar agor drwy'r wythnos? Pam nad yw'r broblem llety i dwristiaid yng nghwm Afan uchaf wedi'i datrys eto? Yr ydym wedi bod yn sôn ers blynnyddoedd am lety gwely a brechwast i feicwyr mynydd. *[Torri ar draws.]* Wel, cytunodd y Gweinidog â mi ynglŷn â'r mater hwn y bore yma, felly, ni chredaf fy mod yn anghywir. Pam mae prinder llety gwely a brechwast yng nghwm Afan uchaf? Pethau bach yw'r rhain, ond maent yn bwysig.

The First Minister: Before I come to the amendments, I will deal with some of the themes raised and some of the contributions made, and forgive me if I do not comment on every contribution.

Gan Ieuan Wyn Jones, cawsom y chwedl gyfarwydd bod cyhoeddiad gwreiddiol mis Gorffennaf diwethaf wedi'i ruthro allan ar ormod o frys. Wrth ymdrin â'r egwyddor, byddwn yn ailddhongli'r gosodiad hwnnw i ddweud ein bod wedi cadw'r cyfrinach ac yr oedd yn sioc i'r gwrthbleidiau gan nad oeddynt wedi gallu darllen amdano yn y *Western Mail* wythnos yn gynt. Dyna i gyd.

O ran y cwestiynau am yr ymatebion, bu i Ieuan geisio eu disgrifio a'u hailddhongli fel rhai beirniadol, ond mae hynny'n annheg. Bu'r rhan fwyaf o gyfraniadau yn dra adeiladol er bod tipyn o gwyno fan hyn a man draw, wrth gwrs. Fodd bynnag, nid ydynt yn ymdrin â'r egwyddor. Mae'n siŵr bod bloc o bobl nad ydynt yn cytuno â'r egwyddor ond eu bod yn derbyn, yn y broses ddemocrataidd sydd ohoni, mai ni sy'n gorfod cymryd y penderfyniadau ar yr egwyddor, ac yr ydym yn ymgynghori ar sut i wneud hynny.

Ni chredaf fod Kirsty wedi bod yn deg ychwaith. Mae'n dweud mai holhti blew ynglŷn â phroses fewnol oedd y rhan fwyaf o'r cyfraniadau ac mai proses o grybwyll y cyfraniadau oedd fy araith gyntaf. Ni chredaf ei fod yn fater o holhti blew pan ydych yn siarad am ba un a ddylech gael paneli ymgynghori neu ddarpariaeth ar gyfer system o weithredu ar raddfa ranbarthol, neu system o weinyddu cyfrifon i gwmnïau mawr megis Airbus, Ford ac yn y blaen. Mae elfen o egwyddor yn hynny o ran sut yr ydych yn gweithio. Bu i gyfraniad Elin Jones ymdrin â'r pwynt hwnnw, ac mae'n cytuno â'r egwyddor yr wyf wedi'i gosod.

Bu i Elin siarad am bwynt arall—ac mae hwn yn bwynt anodd iawn—sef faint o ddirprwyaeth i lawr i'r lefel ranbarthol a fydd. Y pwynt arall yw—ac yr oedd gan y WDA system newydd ar y gweill pan wnaed y cyhoeddiad—sut i gysoni faint yr ydych yn ei ddirprwyo i'r is-adrannau, sef y rhai ar gyfer eiddo, buddsoddiad, benthyciadau ac yn y blaen, a faint yr ydych yn ei ddirprwyo i'r raddfa ranbarthol. Mae hwn yn gwestiwn o ran matrices, ac mae'n broblem i unrhyw gyfundrefn neu sefydliad yn y sector gyhoeddus neu yn y sector breifat. Y peth gorau yw imi ysgrifennu atoch i ymdrin â'r

From Ieuan Wyn Jones, we heard the familiar tale that the original announcement last July was rushed out in too much haste. In dealing with the principle, I would reinterpret that statement by saying that we managed to keep the secret well, and it was a shock to the opposition parties because they had not read about it in the *Western Mail* the week before. That is all.

On the questions about the responses, Ieuan tried to describe and reinterpret them as unfavourable, but that is unfair. Most of the contributions were quite constructive although there were, of course, some complaints here and there. However, they do not deal with the principle. I am sure there is a block of people who do not accept the principle but who accept that, in this democratic process, it is we who must make the decisions about the principle, and we are consulting on how to do so.

I do not believe Kirsty was being fair either. She said that most of the contributions were internal hair splitting about an internal process and that my first speech was just a process of hinting at the contributions. I do not think it is a matter of splitting hairs when you are talking about whether we should have consultative panels or provide for a system of working on a regional basis or a system of administrating accounts for large companies such as Airbus, Ford and so on. There is an element of principle in that in terms of how you will operate. Elin Jones's contribution dealt with that point, and it is in keeping with the principle that I have set out.

Elin made another point—and this is a very difficult point—that is, how much devolution there will be to the regional level. The other point is—and the WDA had a system in progress when the announcement was made—how to reconcile how much you delegate to divisions, namely those of investment, property, loans and so on, and how much you delegate to the regional level. This is a question of matrix and is a problem for any organisation or institution in the public or private sector. The best thing would be for me to write to you to deal with this point of how to get the matrix and how

pwynt hwn ar sut i gael y matrices a'r cysoni o ran y ddwy elfen o ddirprwyaeth sydd eu heisiau, sef dirprwyo i'r ochr ranbarthol ac i'r is-adrannau.

Alun Ffred Jones: Yn dilyn o hynny i raddau, sut allwn roi sicrwydd i unigolion neu gwmnïau nad oes ymyrraeth wleidyddol yn y broses o osod grantiau? Mae traddodiad mewn llywodraeth leol i gadw cynghorwyr allan o'r broses am resymau digon teg. Deallaf fod grantiau mawr yn dod at sylw Gweinidogion ar hyn o bryd, ond rhaid bod elfen o wrthrychedd ac eglurder yn y broses neu, fel arall, mae'n bosibl—a chymeraf bwynt Leighton Andrews, mewn ffordd—y gallai gwleidyddiaeth ymyrryd yn y broses.

Y Prif Weinidog: Wrth gwrs, a dyna pam mae Bwrdd Ymgynghorol Datblygu Diwydiannol Cymru yn y darlun yn awr. Mae'n gorff statudol sydd yn bod er mwyn osgoi un ai bod arian da yn cael ei daflu ar ôl arian drwg, sy'n dwp, neu bod pethau yn cael eu gwneud am resymau gwleidyddol. Gallaf eich gwarantu pe bai unrhyw achos o unrhyw Weinidog yn mynd yn groes i gyngor o ran dyfarnu grantiau, byddem yn gorfod cael system o wneud datganiad a rhoi neges i Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Archwilio, neu rywbeth o'r fath, fel sydd ei angen yn awr gyda WIDAB.

Yr oedd Ieuan a sawl un arall yn siarad am graffu. Yr wyf wedi dweud hyn o'r blaen ac fe'i dywedaf unwaith eto: nid hyd nac amllder y craffu sy'n bwysig, ond cryfder, safon ac uniongyrcholdeb—os oes gair o'r fath—y craffu. Mae sawl un wedi dweud yr un peth. Soniodd Peter Black, ond nid ef oedd yr unig un, am natur uniongyrchol cyfrifoldeb y Gweinidog dros benderfyniadau ynghylch sut y caiff arian ei wario ac ati, sy'n bwysig.

4.40 p.m.

Before I come to the amendments, I will refer to Alun Cairns's speech. Looking back to the election results in the Vale of Glamorgan, Alun, do not let failure go to your head. [*Laughter.*]

It is important to realise that we are being kind and generous today by supporting six of

to reconcile the two elements of delegation required, namely delegating to the regional side and to divisions.

Alun Ffred Jones: Following on from that to a certain extent, how can we reassure individuals or companies that there is no political interference in the award of grants? In local government, it is customary to keep councillors out of the process for quite legitimate reasons. I understand that large grants come to the attention of Ministers at present, but an element of objectivity and transparency in the process is essential, otherwise, it is possible—and I accept Leighton Andrews's point, in a way—that politics could interfere with the process.

The First Minister: Of course, and that is why the Welsh Industrial Development Advisory Board is now in the picture. It is a statutory body whose job it is to prevent either good money being thrown after bad, which is just stupid, or things being done for political reasons. I can give you a guarantee that, if there were any question of any Minister going against advice on the award of a grant, we would have to introduce a system of making a statement and giving a message to the Chair of the Audit Committee, or something similar, as is now required with WIDAB.

Ieuan and many others mentioned scrutiny. I have said this before, and I will say it again: it is not the length or the frequency of the scrutiny that is important, but the strength, the quality and the directness of the scrutiny. Many have said the same thing. Peter Black, though not the only one, referred to the direct nature of the Minister's responsibility for decisions how money is spent and so on, which is important.

Cyn imi ddod at y gwelliannau, cyfeiriaf at araith Alun Cairns. Gan edrych yn ôl at ganlyniadau'r etholiad ym Mro Morgannwg, Alun, peidiwch â gadael i fethiant roi syniadau yn eich pen. [*Chwerthin.*]

Mae'n bwysig sylweddoli ein bod yn ymddwyn mewn ffordd garedig a hael

the Conservatives' amendments, including that on the publication of the costings. We published a statement of costings on where the savings of over £10 million came from on 23 March, I think. Further work is being done on those costings, which will be published as soon as it is finished. Therefore, we will support amendment 11. We will support nine amendments in total, namely amendments 1 and 3 tabled by the Liberal Democrats, amendment 5 tabled by Plaid Cymru and amendments 7, 11, 13, 14, 15 and 16 tabled by the Conservatives. That must constitute a record.

Hoffwn ymdrin ag un pwynt arall a godwyd gan Lisa Francis neu Elin Jones ynghylch arbenigedd o fewn twristiaeth a'r ffaith bod marchnata yn rhan bwysig o swyddogaethau'r bwrdd croeso. Mae'n bwysig bod yr arbenigedd yn aros, ond yr ydym hefyd wedi hysbysu'r bwrdd croeso ein bod am iddo ledu'r arbenigedd hwnnw ar draws ein sefydliad ni gan mai ef yw'r unig gorff yn y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru a arweinir gan y swyddogaeth farchnata. Yr ydym am i'r bwrdd ddangos yr arweiniad hwnnw ar draws y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.

Owen John Thomas: A ydych yn fodlon ystyried fy nghynnig, sef rhoi cyfle i'r iaith gael pwerdy go iawn, fel bod pawb yn gwybod pwy sy'n atebol?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Owen, you must sit down after you have intervened.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn wir. Mae blwyddyn arall i fynd cyn y caiff bwrdd yr iaith ei uno gyda'r Weinyddiaeth lywodraethol. Felly, ymdriniaf â'r cwestiwn hwnnw mewn llythyr atoch.

Finally, people have referred to the fact that there is worry and a price involved in organisational change. That is true, and we do not hide that fact. There is always a price to pay; there is always pain before gain. You have to spend money up front to achieve lower transactional costs and clearer delivery of services, so that Ministers are more

heddiw drwy gefnogi chwech o welliannau'r Ceidwadwyr, sy'n cynnwys y gwelliant ynglŷn â chyhoeddi costau. Cyhoeddwyd datganiad gennym ar 23 Mawrth, mi gredaf, ynglŷn â ble y daeth yr arbedion o dros £10 miliwn. Gwneir rhagor o waith ar y costau hyn, a chaiff ei gyhoeddi cyn gynted ag y bydd wedi ei orffen. Felly, byddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant 11. Byddwn yn cefnogi naw gwelliant i gyd, sef gwelliannau 1 a 3 a gyflwynwyd gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, gwelliant 5 a gyflwynwyd gan Blaid Cymru a gwelliannau 7, 11, 13, 14, 15 a 16 a gyflwynwyd gan y Ceidwadwyr. Rhaid bod hynny'n record.

I wish to deal with one other point that Lisa Francis or Elin Jones raised about expertise in tourism and the fact that marketing is an important part of the tourist board's functions. It is important that the expertise remains, but we have also told the tourist board that we want it to spread that expertise across our organisation because it is the only public-service body in Wales that is led by the marketing function. We want the board to demonstrate that leadership across the public sector in Wales.

Owen John Thomas: Would you be willing to consider my proposal, that is, to give the language the opportunity to have a real powerhouse so that everyone knows who is accountable?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Owen, rhaid ichi eistedd i lawr ar ôl ymyrryd.

The First Minister: Indeed. There is another year to go before the language board is merged with the governmental Executive. Therefore, I will deal with that question in a letter to you.

Yn olaf, cyfeiriodd pobl at y ffaith fod pryderon a phris i'w dalu am newid sefydliadol. Mae hynny'n wir, ac nid ydym yn celu'r ffaith honno. Mae pris i'w dalu bob amser; drwy boen y newidia'r byd. Rhaid ichi wario arian yn gyntaf er mwyn cael costau trafodion is a darpariaeth gliriach o wasanaethau, er mwyn i Weinidogion fod yn

directly accountable to the Assembly and to the people of Wales for the way in which the public sector uses the resources that are available to spend on economic development, education, skills and lifelong training. We believe that the way in which we will organise this will be a price worth paying.

fwy uniongyrchol atebol i'r Cynulliad ac i bobl Cymru am y ffordd y mae'r sector cyhoeddus yn defnyddio'r adnoddau sydd ar gael i'w gwario ar ddatblygu economaidd, addysg, sgiliau a hyfforddiant gydol oes. Credwn y bydd y ffordd y trefnwn hyn yn bris sy'n werth ei dalu.

Gwelliant 1: O blaid 45, Ymatal 10, Yn erbyn 0.

Amendment 1: For 45, Abstain 10, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Davies, Jocelyn
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 2: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 55, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 3: For 55, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor

Butler, Rosemary
 Cairns, Alun
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Isherwood, Mark
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
 Amendment 4: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew

Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 55, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 5: For 55, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary

Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 16, Ymatal 10, Yn erbyn 29.
 Amendment 6: For 16, Abstain 10, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Glyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
 The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn

Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 7: For 54, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen

Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 8: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
 Amendment 8: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 9: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 39.
 Amendment 9: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 39.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Glyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn

Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 10: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
 Amendment 10: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl

Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 11: O blaid 55, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 11: For 55, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 12: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 12: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 13: O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 1.
Amendment 13: For 54, Abstain 0, Against 1.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Thomas, Gwenda

Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.

Amendment carried.

Gwelliant 14: O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Amendment 14: For 54, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn

Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

4.50 p.m.

*Gwelliant 15: O blaid 55, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 15: For 55, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet

Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 16: O blaid 55, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 16: For 55, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn

Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment carried.*

Cynnig NDM2481 fel y'i diwygiwyd:
 Motion NDM2481 as amended:

the National Assembly for Wales

notes the outcome of the consultation exercise that was carried out by the Welsh Assembly Government on the mergers of the Welsh Development Agency (WDA), the Wales Tourist Board (WTB) and the National Council for Education and Training for Wales (ELWa), which was published on 24 May 2005;

notes that the success or otherwise of the merger will be judged by the extent to which there is a discernible improvement in service delivery, with effect from the first day of the

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

yn nodi canlyniad yr ymarfer ymgynghori a gyflawnwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ynghylch cyfuno Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru (ADC), Bwrdd Croeso Cymru (BCC) a Chyngor Cenedlaethol Cymru dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant (ELWa), a gyhoeddwyd ar 24 Mai 2005;

yn nodi y bydd llwyddiant yr uno neu fel arall yn cael ei farnu yn ôl y graddau y ceir gwelliant amlwg wrth ddarparu gwasanaeth, o ddiwrnod cyntaf yr uno;

merger;

requires the Assembly Government to publish by 31 December 2005 a full financial statement of the extra resources committed to the change management programme;

yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad gyhoeddi, erbyn 31 Rhagfyr 2005, ddatganiad ariannol llawn o'r adnoddau ychwanegol a ymrwymwyd i'r rhaglen rheoli newid;

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to produce regular reports to the relevant Assembly Committees on the cost of the ASPB merger programme; and disclose to the Assembly in plenary its plans to improve the scrutiny of government policy and spending in those policy areas affected by ASPB mergers.

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gynhyrchu adroddiadau rheolaidd i'r Pwyllgorau Cynulliad perthnasol ynglyn â chost rhaglen uno'r CCNC; ac i ddatgelu gerbron cyfarfod llawn o'r Cynulliad ei chynlluniau i wella'r broses o graffu ar bolisi'r llywodraeth a gwariant yn y meysydd polisi hynny yr effeithir arnynt drwy uno CCNC;

calls for an immediate statement on the pension implications for ASPB staff, to include any plans to correct pension fund shortfalls and the source of finance to be used;

yn galw am ddatganiad ar fyrder ar y goblygiadau pensiwn i staff CCNC, i gynnwys unrhyw gynlluniau i gywiro diffygion mewn cronfeydd pensiwn a'r ffynhonnell ariannol i'w defnyddio i wneud hynny;

calls for the immediate publication of a breakdown of the £10 million per annum savings the Welsh Assembly Government intends to realise as a result of the merger;

yn galw am gyhoeddi ar fyrder ddadansoddiad o'r arbedion o £10 miliwn y flwyddyn y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn bwriadu eu sicrhau yn sgîl yr uniad;

recognises the need for a strong regional approach to which budgets will be devolved;

yn cydnabod yr angen am agwedd ranbarthol gref ynglyn â pha gyllidebau a gaiff eu datganoli;

requires the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure adequate scrutiny of ELWa functions once it has been adsorbed into an Assembly Education and Lifelong Learning Department;

yn ei gwneud yh ofynnol i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru sicrhau craffu digonol ar swyddogaethau ELWa ar ôl iddo ddod o dan Adran Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes y Cynulliad;

calls upon Welsh Assembly Government to emphasise that the ELL Department fully responds to the needs of the work place and the learner; and

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i bwysleisio bod yr Adran Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn ymateb yn llwyr i anghenion y gweithle a'r dysgwr; ac

ensures that an Assembly Education and Lifelong Learning Department advances the requirements of part-time further education, both vocational and academic, and enhances pathways toward further and higher education.

yn sicrhau bod Adran Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes y Cynulliad yn hyrwyddo gofynion addysg bellach ran-amser, ar lefel alwedigaethol ac ar lefel academaidd, ac yn hwyluso llwybrau i addysg bellach ac uwch.

*Cynnig fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 55, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion as amended: For 55, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig fel y'i diwygiwyd.
Amended motion carried.*

Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

Lorraine Barrett: Euthanasia is a serious issue and should not be used to make a cheap political jibe that can be upsetting to many people. I found the context in which Mark Isherwood used the word in the debate offensive, and I seek your advice.

Lorraine Barrett: Mae ewthanasia yn fater difrifol, ac ni ddylid ei ddefnyddio fel sail i ymosodiadau gwleidyddol dirmygus a all beri gofid. I mi, yr oedd y ffordd y defnyddiodd Mark Isherwood y gair yn y ddadl ddiwethaf yn sarhaus, a cheisiaf eich cyngor.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I do not believe that I heard anything that was out of order, but following your point, I will examine the record and, if necessary, I will return to the matter. However, at this stage, I do not believe that I heard anything that was out of order.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Nid wyf yn credu imi glywed unrhyw beth nad oedd mewn trefn, ond yn sgîl yr hyn a ddywedwch, byddaf yn astudio'r cofnod; dychwelaf at y mater hwn os bydd angen. Fodd bynnag, ar hyn o bryd, nid wyf yn credu imi glywed unrhyw beth nad oedd mewn trefn.

Dadl Fer Short Debate

O ble daw'r Shan Cothi a'r Bryn Terfel nesaf? Dyfodol yr Eisteddfodau Bach Where will the next Shan Cothi and Bryn Terfel come from? The future of small Eisteddfodau

Elin Jones: Mae dau Aelod wedi gofyn am gael cyfrannu at y ddadl hon, sef Eleanor Burnham ac Alun Cairns. Credaf fod y ddau ohonynt, yn eu tro, wedi troedio ambell i lwyfan eisteddfod ar hyd a lled Cymru.

Elin Jones: Two Members have asked to contribute to this debate, namely Eleanor Burnham and Alun Cairns. I believe they have, in their day, have appeared on a few eisteddfod stages across Wales.

Mae'n siŵr bod rhai wedi troi'u trwyn pan welsant deitl y ddadl fer heddiw—ddim cweit yn ddigon cyfoes neu cŵl ar gyfer y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, neu ddim yn ddigon gwleidyddol hyd yn oed. Yr wyf yn siŵr na gollodd y Gweinidog, Alun Pugh lawer o gwsg neithiwr yn poeni am densiwn y ddadl hon ar eisteddfodau bach heddiw. Fodd bynnag, mae'n gyfrifoldeb arnom yma i drafod materion sy'n rhan o brofiad pob dydd pobl, ac mae eisteddfodau lleol yn rhan bwysig o fywyd Cymraeg nifer o bentrefi a threfi.

I am sure some will have turned their noses up at the title of today's short debate—not quite contemporary or cool enough for the National Assembly, or not even political enough. I am sure the Minister, Alun Pugh, did not lose too much sleep last night worrying that this debate on minor eisteddfodau today would be tense. However, it is our responsibility here to discuss issues that are part of people's everyday lives, and local eisteddfodau are an important part of the Welsh-speaking life of a number of villages and towns.

Mae traddodiad cyfoethog o eisteddfodau lleol yn fy etholaeth i yng Ngheredigion, a hefyd, tair eisteddfod Pantyfedwen ym Mhontrhydfendigaid, Aberteifi a Llanbed. Fodd bynnag, mae diogelu eu dyfodol o gynyddol bwys i'r rhai sy'n trefnu ac yn cefnogi'r eisteddfodau hyn. Cyn sôn mwy am hynny, efallai y dylwn amlinellu pam fod

There is a proud tradition of local eisteddfodau in my constituency of Ceredigion, and three Pantyfedwen eisteddfodau at Pontrhydfendigaid, Cardigan and Lampeter. However, safeguarding their future is increasingly important to those who organise and support these eisteddfodau. Before expanding on that, perhaps I should

eisteddfod leol yn bwysig. Mae dau brif reswm. Yn gyntaf, mae'r eisteddfod yn bwysig i'r gymuned y mae'n cael ei chynnal ynddi. Mae'n ddigwyddiad cymunedol, drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn bennaf, ond nid yn gyfan gwbl, ac mae'n perthyn i hen draddodiad. Mae'n adloniant, mae'n rhad ac mae'n cael ei threfnu'n gwbl wirfoddol, ond yn gwbl broffesiynol. Mae'r rheolau'n llym fel arfer, ac mae angen cadw at y rheolau hynny. Mae pobl o bob oedran yn cymryd rhan mewn eisteddfod, o'r crwt bach chwech mlwydd oed sy'n canu 'dewch gyda fi yn y car bach coch' i'r fam-gu sy'n canu emyn i bobl dros 60.

Dyna'r ail reswm pam fod eisteddfod fach yn bwysig, sef y profiad i'r cystadleuydd. Mae'r eisteddfodau bach hyn yn feithrinfeydd anhygoel i dalent ifanc. Yn nheitl y ddadl, cyfeiriais at Shan Cothi a Bryn Terfel, y ddau ohonynt yn eu tro wedi trapan o un eisteddfod i'r llall yn eu plentyndod a'u hieuentid; maent wedi dysgu eu crefft, wedi derbyn beirniadaeth, profi llwyddiant a siom, a datblygu eu hyder. Mae digonedd o bobl eraill fel Shan Cothi a Bryn Terfel a ddechreuodd ar lwyfan eisteddfod leol ac sydd yn awr yn unawdwyr opera, yn rhan o gorws Opera Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn brifeirdd, yn actorion ac yn Aelodau Cynulliad. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwn i gyd yn ymhyfrydu flwyddyn nesaf pan ddaw Bryn Terfel i ganu Wagner ar lwyfan Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru; cychwynnodd ei yrfa ar lwyfannau neuaddau pentref yng Ngwynedd.

Yn ogystal â bod yn llwyfan i berfformwyr, mae eisteddfodau bach yn feithrinfa i lenorion a beirdd hefyd. Drwy gyd-ddigwyddiad, darlledwyd rhaglen ar eisteddfodau bach ar S4C neithiwr—*O Flaen dy Lygaid*. Dangosodd y rhaglen Llinos Dafydd, merch ifanc o Landysul, yn ennill cadair eisteddfod Dinas Mawddwy. Yr wythnos diwethaf, enillodd Llinos Dafydd y goron yn Eisteddfod yr Urdd yng Nghanolfan Mileniwm Cymru. Mae nifer fawr o blant a phobl ifanc a gystadleuodd yn yr Urdd yr wythnos diwethaf wedi ymarfer eu crefft yn yr eisteddfodau bach; maent yn mynd o gwmpas yr eisteddfodau yn cystadlu ar ddarn prawf yr Urdd fel ymarfer i'r gystadleuaeth fawr, yn yr un ffordd â'r athletwyr sy'n mynd o gwmpas cyrddau athletau drwy'r haf cyn y

outline why a local eisteddfod is important. There are two main reasons. First, the eisteddfod is important to the community where it is held. It is a community event, held mainly through the medium of Welsh, though not exclusively, and it is part of an ancient tradition. It is a form of entertainment, it is inexpensive, and it is organised completely voluntarily, but completely professionally. The rules are normally strict, and they must be obeyed. People of all ages take part, from the six-year-old singing 'dewch gyda fi yn y car bach coch' to the grandmother singing a hymn for the over 60s.

That is the second reason why small eisteddfodau are important, namely the experience for the competitor. These small eisteddfodau are excellent breeding grounds for young talent. In the title of the debate, I referred to Shan Cothi and Bryn Terfel, both of whom tramped from one eisteddfod to another during their youth; they learned their craft, received criticism, experienced success and disappointment, and built up their confidence. There are plenty of others like Shan Cothi and Bryn Terfel who started out on the stage at a local eisteddfod and who are now opera singers, members of the WNO chorus, chaired bards, actors and Assembly Members. I am sure we will all be delighted next year when Bryn Terfel appears on the stage of the Wales Millennium Centre to sing Wagner; he started his career on village hall stages in Gwynedd.

As well as providing a stage for performers, small eisteddfodau are also breeding grounds for authors and poets. By coincidence, a programme on small eisteddfodau was shown last night on S4C—*O Flaen dy Lygaid*. The programme showed Llinos Dafydd, a young girl from Llandysul, winning the chair at Dinas Mawddwy eisteddfod. Last week, Llinos Dafydd won the crown at the Urdd Eisteddfod at the Wales Millennium Centre. A vast number of children and young people who competed at the Urdd Eisteddfod last week have practised their craft at the small eisteddfodau; they go from eisteddfod to eisteddfod competing in the set piece for the Urdd, practising for the main event in the same way as the athletes who go to athletics meetings during the

gemau Olympaidd ddiwedd mis Awst.

summer months leading up to the Olympics at the end of August.

Gan fy mod wedi cyfeirio at yr Urdd, hoffwn gymryd y cyfle i longyfarch yr Urdd am lwyfannu gŵyl mor llwyddiannus yn y bae yr wythnos diwethaf. Nid wyf yn gwybod faint ohonoch chi a welodd y sioe *Les Miserables*, ond yr oedd yn gwbl wych. Hoffwn longyfarch pob cystadleuydd ifanc a phob enillydd a gymerodd ran yr wythnos diwethaf, yn enwedig y rhai o Geredigion.

Since I have mentioned the Urdd, I should like to take this opportunity to congratulate the Urdd on staging such a successful festival in the Bay last week. I am not sure how many of you saw the show *Les Miserables*, but it was outstanding. I should like to congratulate every young competitor and every winner who took part last week, particularly those from Ceredigion.

Yr wyf yn siŵr bod rhyw fersiwn o'r eisteddfod yn bodoli, neu wedi bodoli, ym mhob diwylliant, ond yr wyf yn amau a oes unrhyw beth fel yr eisteddfod Gymreig, a chyda'r un graen. Mae'r cyfan yn cael ei drefnu yn gwbl wirfoddol, gan bwyllgorau lleol diwyd. Er eu hymdrechion, mae pryderon ynglŷn â'r nifer llai o gystadleuwyr a'r niferoedd cynulleidfaoel sydd yn lleihau hefyd. Dyma gyrraedd calon y ddadl; mae'r angen i adfywio a moderneiddio rhai o'r eisteddfodau llai wedi'i gydnabod ers sawl blwyddyn. Sefydlwyd Cymdeithas Eisteddfodau Cymru yn 1998 i gydlynu'r ymdrechion i hyrwyddo'r eisteddfodau bach. Mae'n gymdeithas elusennol, cwbl wirfoddol. Yn 2000, derbyniodd y gymdeithas grant o £22,000 gan gyngor y celfyddydau i gyflogi dau swyddog datblygu rhan amser, un i'r de ac un i'r gogledd. Yr oedd yn rhaid iddynt gael cyllid cyfatebol ar gyfer y grant hwn, a derbyniwyd hynny gan Ymddiriedolaeth Carnegie. Derbyniwyd yr arian yn wreiddiol am dair blynedd, ond fe gynigiodd Carnegie flwyddyn arall o arian am ei bod mor hapus gyda gwaith y gymdeithas eisteddfodau. Nid yw amodau Ymddiriedolaeth Carnegie yn caniatáu iddi ariannu tu hwnt i bedair blynedd. Felly, daeth yr arian i gyflogi'r ddau swyddog i ben ddiwedd mis Mawrth. Heb arian cyfatebol, daeth arian cyngor y celfyddydau hefyd i ben. Mae'r ddau swyddog datblygu yn dal i weithio, ond yn gwneud hynny heb gyflog, ac felly, am ba hyd?

I am sure a version of the eisteddfod exists, or has existed, in every culture, but I doubt if there is anything quite like the Welsh eisteddfod, or as polished. It is entirely arranged by volunteers, by hard-working local committees. Despite their efforts, there are concerns over the dwindling numbers of competitors and audiences. Here we get to the heart of the debate; it has been recognised for a number of years that some of the smaller eisteddfodau need to be revitalised and modernised. An Association of Welsh Eisteddfodau was established in 1998 to co-ordinate efforts to promote small eisteddfodau. It is a charitable society, run entirely voluntarily. In 2000, the society received a grant of £22,000 from the arts council to employ two part-time development officers, one for the north, and one for the south. Match funding was required for this grant, and this was provided by the Carnegie Trust. The funding was provided initially for three years, but Carnegie provided funding for an additional year because it was so pleased with the work of the Association. However, the conditions of the Carnegie Trust do not allow it to fund for more than four years. Therefore, the funding to employ these officers ended in March. Without match funding, the arts council funding also ended. The development officers are both still working, but without pay, so how much longer will that continue?

Mae Cymdeithas Eisteddfodau Cymru wedi gwneud sawl cais am gyllid cyfatebol, ond heb lwyddiant. Mae rhywfaint o arian yn cael ei dderbyn gan ambell gyngor sir, ond yn bell o fod yn ddigon. Y siom fwyaf i'r gymdeithas eisteddfodau oedd cael ei

The Association of Welsh Eisteddfodau has made several bids for match funding, but without success. Some funding is received from a few county councils, but this is far from adequate. The greatest disappointment for the association was to be rejected by the

gwrthod gan Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg. Mae'n wir fod yr eisteddfodau yn ddigwyddiadau celfyddydol, ond maent hefyd yn ddigwyddiadau byw Cymraeg. Yr wyf yn cydnabod fod angen staff ar Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg i gynllunio, datblygu a monitro twf y Gymraeg. Fodd bynnag, ni chredaf fod y cydbwysedd yn iawn pan nad oes £20,000 y flwyddyn ar gael gan Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg i ariannu datblygiad eisteddfodau byw Cymraeg, er bod digon o arian yn y gyfundrefn i gyflogi 50 aelod o staff ychwanegol dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf i gynllunio a monitro tu ôl i ddesg yn y swyddfa. Ni ddylem anghofio hefyd y £350,000 o danwariant gan Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg yn y flwyddyn ariannol ddiwethaf sydd wedi cael ei gario drosodd i'r flwyddyn ariannol hon. Nid wyf ychwaith yn credu y dylid taflu arian at rywbeth sydd yn marw. Fodd bynnag, mae Cymdeithas Eisteddfodau Cymru, y swyddogion datblygu a minnau yn gweld fod potensial mawr i adfywio eisteddfodau, a bod hynny eisoes wedi dechrau.

5.00 p.m.

Yn ystod y pedair blynedd diwethaf mae dwy eisteddfod newydd wedi'u sefydlu yn y De, un yn y Fenni a'r llall wedi ail-gychwyn, yn llwyddiannus iawn, yn Dihewyd ar ôl toriad o 40 mlynedd.

Mae seminarau wedi'u cynnal i ysbrydoli syniadau newydd ar farchnata a threfniadaeth ar gyfer trefnwyr eisteddfodau. Ceir cystadlaethau hefyd sy'n adeiladu credydau ar gyfer cystadleuaeth derfynol yn yr Eisteddfod Genedlaethol; mae hyn wedi profi'n llwyddiannus iawn i gynyddu nifer y cystadleuwyr. Yn ogystal, cynigir ysgoloriaeth o £2,000 gan Brifysgol Cymru, Llanbedr Pont Steffan ar gyfer cystadleuaeth lenyddol drwy'r eisteddfodau lleol.

Nid stori mo hon felly o ddiwylliant sy'n marw ar ei draed, ond stori am botensial, am angen i adfywio a chynnal diwylliant byw Cymreig, sydd bob hyn a hyn yn cyflwyno ambell unawdydd megis Bryn Terfel neu Shan Cothi.

I alluogi'r broses o addasu a chryfhau, mae angen cydnabyddiaeth gan Gyngor

Welsh Language Board. It is true that the eisteddfodau are artistic events, but they are also living Welsh-language events. I recognise that the Welsh Language Board needs staff to plan, develop and monitor the growth of the Welsh language, but I do not think it is striking the right balance when the Welsh Language Board does not have £20,000 a year available to support the development of living Welsh-language eisteddfodau, although there has been enough funding in the system to employ an additional 50 members of staff over the past years to monitor and plan behind a desk in the office. Let us not to forget also he £350,000 underspend by the Welsh Language Board in the last financial year, which has been carried forward to this financial year. I do not believe we should throw money at something which is dying. However, the Association of Welsh Eisteddfodau, the development officers and I recognise that there is considerable potential to revive eisteddfodau, and that that has already begun.

During the past four years, two new eisteddfodau have been established in south Wales, the one at Abergavenny and the other re-introduced, very successfully, at Dihewyd after a gap of 40 years.

Seminars have been held to inspire new marketing and organisation ideas for eisteddfod organisers. There are also competitions which allow credits to be built up for a final competition at the National Eisteddfod; this has proved very successful in increasing competitor numbers. There is also a scholarship worth £2,000 offered by the University of Wales, Lampeter for a literary competition held through the local eisteddfodau.

This is not a story about a culture on its last legs, but a story about great potential, about the need to rejuvenate and sustain a vibrant Welsh culture which, from time to time, gives us a Bryn Terfel or a Shan Cothi.

In order for this process of adaptation and reinforcement to continue, the Arts Council

Celfyddydau Cymru a Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg fod yr eisteddfodau bach yn werth ychydig fuddsoddiad. Mae angen rhywfaint o arweiniad gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon i ddweud ein bod, yng Nghymru, yn parchu ein diwylliant cystadleuol, cerddorol a llenyddol. Er ei fod yn gwbl wirfoddol, mae'n raenus ac yn broffesiynol ac yn haeddu ychydig gefnogaeth ariannol.

Nid wyf yn disgwyl i'r Gweinidog ddweud ei fod yn ymateb i'r ddadl hon drwy anfon sic drwy'r post i'r gymdeithas eisteddfodau. Gobeithiaf y bydd yn gallu cydnabod rôl greiddiol eisteddfodau bach i'r diwylliant celfyddydol Cymreig a, drwy hynny, godi ychydig gywilydd ar Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg am ei fod wedi methu â chydabod hynny. Gobeithiaf hefyd y bydd yn gallu perswadio'r bwrdd i ail-feddwl rhywfaint ar ei flaenoriaethau. Ar hyn o bryd, mae Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg yn gorff hyd-braich—ond ni fydd felly am hir.

Eleanor Burnham: Yr wyf yn diolch yn fawr i'r Urdd am yr wythnos diwethaf. Yr oedd yr eisteddfod yn werth chweil yma yn y Bae.

Yr wyf yn cyfaddef mai plentyn swil oeddwn i ac fy mod yn ofni perfformio'n unigol. Yr oeddwn yn hwyr yn datblygu. Serch hynny, deuthum yn ail i Mary Lloyd Davies yn yr eisteddfod sirol yn Nghorwen—os cofiaf yn iawn, am ganu 'Grug y Gwanwyn Olaf'. Cefais y drydedd wobwr yn Llangollen tua 15 mlynedd yn ôl, felly yr oeddwn wedi magu hyder erbyn hynny.

Wedi dweud hynny, rhaid imi fod o ddifrif a chytuno ag Elin a dweud y dylem ymfalchïo yn ein diwylliant, a chefnogi ac annog y Gweinidog i roi ei arian ar ei air. Gyda Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg yn uno â'r Cynulliad, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn annog y Gweinidog. Yn y pen draw, dylem ymfalchïo yn ein diwylliant ac ehangu'r hyn y mae'r Eisteddfod Genedlaethol yn ei wneud a mynd dros y ffin i Lerpwl. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y cawn yr arian i wneud hynny. Yr wyf mewn trafodaethau gydag arweinydd cyngor Lerpwl ar hyn o bryd—

of Wales and the Welsh Language Board need to recognise that it is worthwhile investing in small eisteddfodau. We need some leadership from the National Assembly and the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport to say that we, in Wales, respect our competitive, musical and literary culture. Although it is entirely voluntary, it is also extremely polished and professional and warrants some financial support.

I do not expect the Minister to respond by saying that he is sending a cheque in the post to the eisteddfod association. I hope that he will recognise the crucial role of small eisteddfodau in the artistic culture of Wales, and in doing so make the Welsh Language Board feel a little ashamed that it has failed to recognise this. I hope he can persuade the board to reconsider its priorities somewhat. The Welsh Language Board is currently an arm's-length organisation—but not for long.

Eleanor Burnham: I thank the Urdd very much for last week. We had an excellent eisteddfod here in the Bay.

I admit I was a very shy child and scared of performing on my own. I was a late developer. However, I came second to Mary Lloyd Davies in the county eisteddfod in Corwen—if my memory serves me well, we sang 'Grug y Gwanwyn Olaf'. I had third prize in Llangollen some 15 years ago, so I had gained some confidence by then.

Having said that, and on a more serious note, I agree with Elin that we should be proud of our culture, and that we should support and encourage the Minister to put his money where his mouth is. Given that the Welsh Language Board is merging with the Assembly, it is important that we encourage the Minister. Ultimately, we should be proud of our culture and should expand what the National Eisteddfod is doing and cross the border to Liverpool. I hope we shall have the money to do that. I am currently in discussions with the leader of Liverpool council—

Owen John Thomas: Cofia Dryweryn.

Owen John Thomas: Remember Tryweryn.

Eleanor Burnham: Yn ogystal â chofio Tryweryn—er bod rhaid i ni gofio—rhaid inni symud ymlaen gyda'n gilydd. A wnaiff y Gweinidog sicrhau y cawn ychydig arian? Hyd yn oed os nad aiff y sioe gyfan i Lerpwl, gallwn ddefnyddio Lerpwl am ei bod yn dymuno ein cael ni yno ac mae gan y ddinas yr arian i'n helpu.

Eleanor Burnham: As well as remembering Tryweryn—and we must remember that—we must also move forward together. Will the Minister ensure that we are given some money? Even if we do not take the whole show to Liverpool, we could use Liverpool since the city wants to have us there and it has the money to help us.

Alun Cairns: Diolch yn fawr i Elin am godi'r pwnc hwn. Cofiaf—fel eraill, mae'n siŵr—adrodd darnau fel 'Y Pwff Pwff Trên', 'Bwyta Gormod' a 'Ffonio'r Fet'. Cefais bleser arbennig o gymryd rhan mewn eisteddfodau bach. Mae eisteddfodau bach yn bwysig i'r gymuned ac yn enwedig i'r gymuned Gymraeg ei hiaith.

Alun Cairns: I thank Elin for raising this subject. I remember—like many others, I am sure—reciting pieces such as 'Y Pwff Pwff Trên', 'Bwyta Gormod' and 'Ffonio'r Fet'. I had great pleasure in competing at small eisteddfodau. They are extremely important to the community and to the Welsh-speaking community in particular.

Dywedodd Elin eu bod yn feithrinfeydd i dalent fel sydd gan Shan Cothi a Bryn Terfel, sy'n wir, ond hefyd, mae eisteddfodau bach yn datblygu personoliaeth a hyder unigolion drwy lefaru a siarad o flaen cynulleidfa fawr, ac, yn y pen draw, o flaen cynulleidfa fel a geir yng Nghanolfan Mileniwm Cymru.

Elin said that they were a breeding ground for talents such as Shan Cothi and Bryn Terfel, which is true. But small eisteddfodau also develop people's personality and confidence by reciting and speaking in front of a large audience, and, ultimately, in front of an audience such as that in the Wales Millennium Centre.

Cawsom Eisteddfod yr Urdd yr wythnos diwethaf a chawn yr Eisteddfod Genedlaethol ym mis Awst. Mae llwyddiant Eisteddfod yr Urdd a'r Eisteddfod Genedlaethol yn dibynnu ar lwyddiant yr eisteddfodau bach, gan mai yno y datblygir personoliaeth unigolion er mwyn rhoi digon o hyder iddynt gymryd rhan yn Eisteddfod yr Urdd neu'r Eisteddfod Genedlaethol. Felly, yr wyf yn gobeithio bod Alun Pugh yn gwrando yn astud ar y ddadl hon, y bydd yn dangos blaenoriaeth i fwrdd yr iaith ac, wedi dyddiau bwrdd yr iaith, y bydd yn cynnig arian i'r gyfundrefn hon er mwyn cefnogi eisteddfodau bach yn y tymor hir.

We had the Urdd Eisteddfod last week, and in August the National Eisteddfod will be held. The Urdd Eisteddfod and the National Eisteddfod rely on the success of the minor eisteddfodau, because that is where the personalities of individuals are developed. They then have sufficient confidence to take part in the larger eisteddfodau. So, I hope Alun Pugh is listening carefully to this debate, that he will show the language board what priorities are, and when the language board has been merged, I hope he will offer funding for this system to provide small eisteddfodau with long-term support.

Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon (Alun Pugh): Diolchaf i Elin Jones am ddewis y testun hwn, sef dyfodol yr eisteddfodau bach. Yr wyf wedi clywed Shan Cothi a Bryn Terfel yn canu sawl gwaith, a chredaf ei bod yn hanfodol hybu cantorion y genhedlaeth nesaf. Siaradodd Elin Jones am Bryn Terfel a Wagner, ac yr wyf yn edrych ymlaen at y perfformiad hwnnw y flwyddyn nesaf. Cyfeiriodd hefyd at eisteddfod yr Urdd

The Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport (Alun Pugh): I thank Elin Jones for choosing the future of minor eisteddfodau as the subject for this debate. I have heard Shan Cothi and Bryn Terfel sing many times, and I believe it is vital to encourage the singers of the next generation. Elin Jones spoke about Bryn Terfel and Wagner, and I look forward to that performance next year. Elin Jones also

yma ym mae Caerdydd yr wythnos diwethaf; yr oedd yr eisteddfod honno yn llwyddiannus dros ben.

Ers 2004, yr ydym wedi darparu dros £800,000 er mwyn cefnogi gwyliau Cymru. Yr ydym wedi cefnogi Cymdeithas Eisteddfodau Cymru drwy Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru. Y mae'r gymdeithas wedi derbyn tua £20,000 bob blwyddyn, ac eleni mae'r cyngor wedi addo £23,000 ychwanegol ar yr amod y darperir arian cyfatebol. Bydd yr arian hwn yn cefnogi swyddogion datblygu rhan-amser—un yn Aberaeron, ac un yn Negannwy.

Yn ystod y ddwy flynedd diwethaf, mae swyddogion datblygu wedi helpu i sefydlu dwsin o eisteddfodau newydd yn ogystal â'r nifer y maent yn eu cefnogi'n barod. Mae'r gymdeithas eisteddfodau wedi cael ei noddi gan fanc HSBC i gyflawni prosiect yn ymweud ag enwau lleoedd Cymraeg. Y mae wedi derbyn grant oddi wrth ymddiriedolaeth Carnegie, a phe bai'r cais yn llwyddiannus, byddai'n galluogi rhyddhau yr arian gan Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru.

Y mae eisteddfodau lleol yn elwa o gefnogaeth miloedd o wirfoddolwyr, sydd yn rhoi o'u hamser ac o'u harian. Yr ydym, fel Llywodraeth, wedi datblygu gwefan www.volunteerinwales.net sydd, yn ôl Gwgl, yn brysur ac yn boblogaidd iawn. Yn ogystal, yr ydym yn ariannu llinell ffôn arbennig ar gyfer gwirfoddolwyr, sef 0845 365 2005.

Yr wyf am nodi pwysigrwydd gwaith Cymdeithas Eisteddfodau Cymru. Yn ein barn ni, mae hybu celfyddydau drwy gyfrwng yr iaith Gymraeg yn bwysig iawn. Yr ydym am weld cymdeithas ddwyieithog yng Nghymru yn y pen draw—dyna brif egwyddor 'Iaith Pawb'. Yr ydym yn buddsoddi £28 miliwn ychwanegol yn yr iaith Gymraeg, gyda'r arian ychwanegol ar gyfer Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg yn cefnogi mudiadau fel yr Urdd, yr Eisteddfod Genedlaethol a Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin.

Y mae eisteddfodau lleol yn gwneud cyfraniad sylweddol i gymunedau Cymraeg eu hiaith. Maent yn darparu cyfleoedd er mwyn adeiladu cymunedau cryfach—yr wyf yn cytuno ag Elin Jones ar hynny.

mentioned last week's Urdd eisteddfod here in Cardiff bay; that was an extremely successful eisteddfod.

Since 2004, we have provided over £800,000 to support festivals in Wales. We have supported the Association of Welsh Eisteddfodau through the Arts Council of Wales. The society has received an annual sum of around £20,000, and the council has promised an additional £23,000 this year on the condition that match funding is provided. This money would support part-time development officers—one in Aberaeron and another in Degannwy.

During the past two years, development officers have helped to establish a dozen new eisteddfodau in addition to those that they currently support. The eisteddfod association has been sponsored by HSBC Bank to undertake a project on Welsh placenames. It has received a grant from the Carnegie Trust, and if the bid was to succeed, it would enable the Arts Council of Wales money to be released.

Local eisteddfodau benefit from the support of thousands of volunteers, who give of their time and money. As a Government, we have developed the website www.volunteerinwales.net which, according to Google, is very popular and busy. We are also financing a special phone line for volunteers—0845 3652005.

I want to stress the importance of the Association of Welsh Eisteddfodau. We believe it is very important to promote the arts through the medium of Welsh. Our aim is to create a bilingual Wales—that is the main principle of 'Iaith Pawb'. We are investing an additional £28 million in the Welsh language, with the additional money for the Welsh Language Board going towards supporting organisations such as the Urdd, the National Eisteddfod and Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin.

Local eisteddfodau make a substantial contribution to Welsh-speaking communities. They provide opportunities to build stronger communities—I agree with Elin Jones on that.

5.10 p.m.

Elin Jones: Y mae popeth a ddywedwch yn gymeradwy iawn, ond i fynd yn ôl at y pwynt ynglŷn â'r grant o £23,000 y mae Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru wedi ei gynnig i Gymdeithas Eisteddfodau Cymru, ac sydd yn amodol ar gyllid cyfatebol, y broblem sydd gan y gymdeithas—sef prif fyrddwn fy nadl i—yw ei bod wedi methu â dod o hyd i'r arian ar gyfer y cyllid cyfatebol. Mae wedi ceisio gwneud hynny mewn sawl man, ac mae'n arbennig o siomedig—a rhannaf ei siom—na all Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg weld bod ganddo rôl i'w chwarae wrth gefnogi digwyddiadau diwylliannol, byw yn y Gymraeg, ac y gall gynnig y cyllid cyfatebol angenrheidiol hwnnw i barhau'r gwaith da y mae'r swyddogion datblygu a'r gymdeithas yn ei wneud.

Alun Pugh: I understand that. However, it is also my understanding that the match funding possibilities have not yet been fully exhausted, including the possibility of some lottery funding. Therefore, we are not entirely at the end of the road there. The money from the arts council is still very much on the table. I know exactly what you have said regarding the Welsh Language Board. We meet the language board regularly, and I am prepared to give you an assurance this afternoon that I will raise this specific matter with it in my next meeting, and will report back to the Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee on that.

Yr wythnos diwethaf, yr oeddwn yng Nghanolfan Mileniwm Cymru i weld seremoni'r coroni. Bu'r enillydd, Llinos Dafydd, yn llwyddiannus mewn sawl eisteddfod leol—y cam cyntaf hynod bwysig. Mae'r eisteddfodau bach yn rhan bwysig o'n treftadaeth ac yn rhan bwysig o weithgareddau sy'n helpu i gynnal ein diwylliant.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That concludes today's proceedings.

Elin Jones: Everything you say is highly commendable, but to return to the point about the grant of £23,000 that the Arts Council of Wales has offered to the Association of Welsh Eisteddfodau, which is conditional upon match funding, the problem for the Association—and the main thrust of my argument—is that it has not found the money required for the match funding. It has tried to do that in many places, and it is extremely disappointed—and I share its disappointment—that the Welsh Language Board cannot recognise that it has a role to play in supporting cultural, living events through the medium of Welsh, and that it can offer that necessary match funding to continue the good work done by the development officers and the association.

Alun Pugh: Yr wyf yn deall hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf hefyd ar ddeall nad yw'r holl bosibiliadau o ran cyllid cyfatebol wedi'u hystyried yn llwyr, gan gynnwys y posibilrwydd o gael rhywfaint o arian gan y Loteri. Felly, nid ydym wedi cyrraedd pen y daith. Mae'r arian gan gyngor y celfyddydau ar gael o hyd. Yr wyf yn deall yr hyn a ddywedwch ynglŷn â Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg. Byddwn yn cyfarfod â bwrdd yr iaith yn rheolaidd, ac yr wyf yn barod i roi sicrwydd i chi y prynhawn yma y byddaf yn codi'r mater penodol hwn yn fy nghyfarfod nesaf gyda'r bwrdd ac yn adrodd ar hynny i'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon.

Last week, I was at the Wales Millennium Centre to see the crowning ceremony. The winner, Llinos Dafydd, had been successful in many local eisteddfodau—the first very crucial step. The small eisteddfodau are an important part of our heritage and an important part of the activities that help sustain our culture.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.11 p.m.
The meeting ended at 5.11 p.m.*

Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
Members and their Parties

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Law, Peter (Annibynnol – Independent)
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
 Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)