



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Cofnod y Trafodion)**

**The National Assembly for Wales
(The Record of Proceedings)**

**Dydd Mercher, 18 Mai 2005
Wednesday, 18 May 2005**

Cynnwys
Contents

Cwestiynau ar Gyllid i'r Gweinidog Cyllid Questions on Finance to the Finance Minister	3
Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad Questions to the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside.....	22
'Niwed Cudd—Ymateb i anghenion plant defnyddwyr cyffuriau' 'Hidden Harm—Responding to the needs of children of problem drug users'	38
Band Eang Cymru Broadband Wales	62
Dadl Fer: Pam mae rhai Pleidleiswyr yn fwy Cyfartal nag Eraill Short Debate: Why Some Voters are More Equal than Others	91

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Cwestiynau ar Gyllid i'r Gweinidog Cyllid Questions on Finance to the Finance Minister

Cyllideb y Cynulliad The Assembly's Budget

Q1 Rosemary Butler: What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to explain how the Assembly's budget is distributed? OAQ0116(FIN)

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): This year, for the first time, we have tried to get more information out to people. I have prepared a full document and a leaflet explaining the budget allocations and their distribution. These have been distributed widely.

Rosemary Butler: I welcome the publication of this document, which shows clearly how you are spending money and lays out your budget plans for the next three years, which include better health, better jobs, and helping people to create stronger and safer communities. The document uses some very nice colours, as I am sure you would agree. As Chair of the Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee, I am interested in design, so I wonder whether you could redesign the pie for next year. I think that the culture budget is shown in green, but it would be nice if next year's culture budget were as big as the budget shown in purple. Could you look into that?

Sue Essex: I cannot remember which budget is shown in purple but, if it is health, the answer would be 'no'. I take the thrust of your point, and I know that culture and the arts are dear to you and that expenditure in this area is crucial. As committee Chair, you will be aware of the budget planning round. The thrust of your point was well demonstrated this week, because, from a relatively small spend on art for the new building, we saw some fantastic projects

C1 Rosemary Butler: Beth y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei wneud i esbonio sut y dosberthir cyllideb y Cynulliad? OAQ0116(FIN)

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex): Eleni, am y tro cyntaf, yr ydym wedi ceisio cael rhagor o wybodaeth i bobl. Yr wyf wedi paratoi dogfen lawn a thaflen yn esbonio sut y caiff y gyllideb ei dyrannu a'i dosbarthu. Dosbarthwyd y rhain yn eang.

Rosemary Butler: Croesawaf gyhoeddi'r ddogfen hon, sy'n dangos yn glir sut yr ydych yn gwario arian a yn nodi eich cynlluniau cyllideb ar gyfer y tair blynedd nesaf, sy'n cynnwys iechyd gwell, swyddi gwell, a helpu pobl i greu cymunedau cryfach a diogelach. Mae'r ddogfen yn defnyddio rhai lliwiau hyfryd, fel yr wyf yn siŵr y byddech yn cytuno. Fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon, mae gennyf ddiddordeb mewn dylunio, felly, tybed a allech ddylunio'r siart cylch ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf. Credaf mai'r lliw gwyrdd sy'n cynrychioli'r gyllideb ar gyfer diwylliant, ond byddai'n braf pe byddai cyllideb y flwyddyn nesaf ar gyfer diwylliant yr un mor fawr â'r gyllideb a ddangosir mewn lliw porffor. A allech ymchwilio i hynny?

Sue Essex: Ni allaf gofio pa gyllideb y mae'r lliw porffor yn ei chynrychioli, ond os iechyd ydyw, yr ateb fyddai 'na'. Derbynïaf brif fyrdwn eich pwynt, a gwn fod diwylliant a'r celfyddydau yn bwysig ichi a bod gwariant yn y maes hwn yn hollbwysig. Fel Cadeirydd y pwyllgor, byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r cylch cynllunio cyllideb. Cyflewyd prif fyrdwn eich pwynt yn dda yr wythnos hon, oherwydd, o wariant cymharol fach ar gelf ar gyfer yr adeilad newydd, gwelwyd cynnydd

coming through. As well as direct Assembly spending, which is important, we need to encourage the view that through spending a small amount on art and culture, whether by the private sector, local authorities or other bodies, a big difference can be made. This was one of the key messages of the committee's recent report.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Gan fod cymaint o gyfyngiadau ar bwerau'r Cynulliad, yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunech nad oes gennych yr hyblygrwydd y dymunech wrth ddosbarthu arian y gyllideb. Fel un sydd wedi dangos cefnogaeth frwd i ddatganoli ar hyd y blynyddoedd, a fydddech yn cytuno y byddai eich swydd gymaint â hynny'n haws pe bai gan y Cynulliad bwerau deddfwriaethol llawn?

Sue Essex: You are right to say that I have always supported primary legislative powers, and I think that that is the way in which we will travel. I am not so sure whether I accept your premise that there are a lot of restrictions on me as Finance Minister in terms of budgeting. Clearly, you are right to say that, with primary legislative powers, we would need to consider the financial side. There will be negotiations with colleagues in London as to how that would be achieved.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I will take you to another area where the distribution of money is important, which is the continuation of Objective 1. It is generally agreed across the Chamber that if negotiations on structural funds and the budget are agreed in June, Wales would benefit, whereas it is questionable whether we would benefit if the decision is postponed. Are you, as Finance Minister, part of these discussions to put pressure on the UK Government to make an early settlement? What pressure have you been able to put on the Treasury to make it realise that there has to be flexibility on the UK position on the size of the EU budget to make sure that west Wales and the Valleys benefits to the fullest possible extent from Objective 1 funding, given the low gross domestic product per capita figures there?

gyda rhai prosiectau gwych. Yn ogystal â gwariant uniongyrchol y Cynulliad, sy'n bwysig, mae angen inni annog y farn, trwy wario swm bach ar gelf a diwylliant, boed gan y sector preifat, awdurdodau lleol neu gyrff eraill, y gellir gwneud gwahaniaeth mawr. Dyma oedd un o'r negeseuon allweddol yn adroddiad y pwyllgor yn ddiweddar.

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Given the numerous restrictions on the Assembly's powers, I am sure that you would agree that you do not enjoy as much flexibility as you would like in making your budget allocations. As a fervent supporter of devolution over many years, would you agree that your job would be that much easier if the Assembly had full legislative powers?

Sue Essex: Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle wrth ddweud fy mod bob amser wedi cefnogi pwerau deddfwriaethol sylfaenol, a chredaf mai dyma'r llwybr y byddwn yn ei ddilyn. Nid wyf mor siŵr a allaf dderbyn eich cynsail bod llawer o gyfyngiadau arnaf fel Gweinidog Cyllid o ran cyllidebu. Yn amlwg, yr ydych yn llygad eich lle wrth ddweud, o ran pwerau deddfwriaethol sylfaenol, y byddai angen inni ystyried yr ochr ariannol. Cynhelir trafodaethau â chyd-aelodau yn Llundain o ran sut y byddai hynny'n cael ei wneud.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Af â chi i faes arall lle y mae dosbarthu arian yn bwysig, sef parhad Amcan 1. Yn gyffredinol, cytuna'r Siambr gyfan, os cytunir ar drafodaethau ar gronfeydd strwythurol a'r gyllideb ym mis Mehefin, y byddai Cymru'n elwa. Ond y mae'n amheus a fyddem yn elwa pe bai'r penderfyniad yn cael ei ohirio. A ydych chi, fel y Gweinidog Cyllid, yn rhan o'r trafodaethau hyn i roi pwysau ar Lywodraeth y DU i wneud setliad cynnar? Pa bwysau yr ydych wedi gallu eu rhoi ar y Trysorlys i sicrhau ei fod yn sylweddoli bod yn rhaid cael hyblygrwydd ar safbwynt y DU o ran maint cyllideb yr UE, er mwyn sicrhau bod y Gorllewin a'r Cymoedd yn elwa i'r eithaf o arian Amcan 1, o gofio'r ffigurau cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth isel y pen yno?

Sue Essex: As you know, GDP per capita figures have improved. That is the dilemma for us, is it not? Your point about the decision being made in June was based around the fact that the early figures would be used. As time goes on, the later figures might come into play, and show a decreasing gap between GDP per capita figures. That is good news in that it shows that the Assembly Government's and UK Government's policies are working in Wales. The dilemma, as you say, is that it might reduce our ability to get European funding. The First Minister, as you know, takes the lead on this. However, as Finance Minister, I have made it very clear in the meetings that I have had with the Treasury how important that European funding is to Wales, and what a significant difference I think that it makes. Whatever the outcome of the negotiation, I am firmly behind the First Minister in wanting to see the best deal in terms of funding for Wales.

Jenny Randerson: There are over 30 walk-in centres in England that are successfully taking pressure off accident and emergency departments, yet we have none in Wales. In England, these centres are centrally funded, the logic being that they provide a service to all, and are not just restricted to serving local residents. Can you explain to me, so that I can explain to my constituents, why your Government is not prepared to centrally finance walk-in centres in Wales, as is done in England?

Sue Essex: There are different views on whether walk-in centres are the panacea that you suggest. Medically, there are mixed views on them. As you know, health and social care policy falls within Brian Gibbons' remit, and it is for him to come forward with proposals for that, if that is the route that he chooses. I do not think that Brian necessarily sees the picture in that way.

David Melding: In my view, as Chair of the Health and Social Services Committee, how

Sue Essex: Fel y gwyddoch, mae ffigurau CMC y pen wedi gwella. Onid dyna'r benbleth inni? Yr oedd eich pwynt ynglŷn â gwneud y penderfyniad ym mis Mehefin yn seiliedig ar y ffaith y câi'r ffigurau cynnar eu defnyddio. Gydag amser, efallai y caiff y ffigurau diweddarach eu defnyddio, a byddant yn dangos bwlch sy'n lleihau rhwng ffigurau CMC y pen. Mae hynny'n newyddion da yn yr ystyr ei fod yn dangos bod polisiâu Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a Llywodraeth y DU yn gweithio yng Nghymru. Y benbleth, fel y dywedwch, yw y gallai leihau ein gallu i gael arian Ewropeaidd. Mae'r Prif Weinidog, fel y gwyddoch, yn arwain y ffordd yn hyn o beth. Fodd bynnag, fel y Gweinidog Cyllid, yr wyf wedi egluro'n groyw yn y cyfarfodydd a gefais gyda'r Trysorlys mor bwysig yw arian Ewropeaidd i Gymru, a chymaint o wahaniaeth sylweddol y mae'n ei wneud yn fy marn i. Beth bynnag fydd canlyniad y trafodaethau, yr wyf yn gadarn o blaid awydd y Prif Weinidog i gael y fargen orau o ran arian i Gymru.

Jenny Randerson: Mae yna dros 30 o ganolfannau galw-i-mewn yn Lloegr sy'n llwyddo i leihau'r pwysau ar adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys. Ond eto nid oes gennym un yng Nghymru. Yn Lloegr, ariennir y canolfannau hyn yn ganolog, a'r rhesymeg y tu ôl i hyn yw eu bod yn darparu gwasanaeth i bawb, ac nad ydynt yn gyfyngedig i wasanaethu trigolion lleol yn unig. A allwch egluro wrthyf, er mwyn imi allu egluro hyn wrth fy etholwyr, pam nad yw eich Llywodraeth yn fodlon ariannu canolfannau galw-i-mewn yn ganolog yng Nghymru, fel y gwneir yn Lloegr?

Sue Essex: Mae yna safbwyntiau gwahanol am y cwestiwn a yw canolfannau galw-i-mewn, fel yr awgrymwch, yn ateb i bopeth. Yn feddygol, mae safbwyntiau cymysg amdanynt. Fel y gwyddoch, mae polisi iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yn rhan o gylich gwaith Brian Gibbons, a'i gyfrifoldeb ef yw cyflwyno cynigion ar gyfer hynny, os dyna'r llwybr y bydd yn ei ddewis. Nid wyf yn credu mai dyna o reidrwydd sut y mae Brian yn gweld pethau.

David Melding: Yn fy marn i, fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau

we scrutinise the budget in this place is probably the weakest element of the work that we do. Do you agree that backbenchers need assistance, support and training to hold you to account effectively?

Sue Essex: I do not know about holding me to account; you have sessions like today's. If it is a weak element, there are some remedies in your own hands. Last year, we tried hard to support you to do that job. The Members' Research Service did a considerable amount of work to support Members in committee, my officials came to meetings when required, and I offered to go through a lot of issues, such as the spending review. I went to a Panel of Chairs meeting—you were there, David—early in the process to ask what information the committees needed. I think that we did our best, David. It is up to members of the committee to follow up on the information that they receive and ask questions. If you want more training, I am sure the Members' Research Service would facilitate that.

Cymdeithasol, mae'n siŵr mai'r ffordd yr ydym yn craffu ar y gyllideb yn y lle hwn yw'r elfen wannaf yn y gwaith yr ydym yn ei wneud. A gytunwch fod angen cymorth, cefnogaeth a hyfforddiant ar aelodau'r meinciau cefn i'ch dwyn i gyfrif yn effeithiol?

Sue Essex: Nid wyf yn sicr ynglŷn â chael fy nwyn i gyfrif, cymerwch sesiynau fel hon heddiw. Os yw'n elfen wan, mae rhai o'r atebion yn eich dwylo chi'ch hun. Y llynedd, buom yn ymdrechu'n galed i'ch cynorthwyo i wneud y swydd honno. Gwnaeth Gwasanaeth Ymchwil yr Aelodau gryn dipyn o waith i gynorthwyo Aelodau yn y pwyllgor, daeth fy swyddogion i'r cyfarfodydd yn ôl yr angen, a chynigiais fynd drwy nifer o faterion, fel yr adolygiad o wariant. Euthum i gyfarfod o Banel y Cadeiryddion—yr oeddech chi yno, David—yn gynnar yn ystod y broses i ofyn pa wybodaeth yr oedd ei hangen ar y pwyllgorau. Credaf inni wneud ein gorau, David. Cyfrifoldeb aelodau'r pwyllgor yw ymchwilio i'r wybodaeth a gânt a gofyn cwestiynau. Os hoffech gael rhagor o hyfforddiant, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai Gwasanaeth Ymchwil yr Aelodau yn hwyluso hynny.

Fformiwla Barnett The Barnett Formula

Q2 Mick Bates: Will the Minister make a statement on reviewing the Barnett formula? OAQ0122(FIN)

Sue Essex: The general view is that the Barnett formula serves Wales well, but as I have said many times, we keep this under review and consideration.

Mick Bates: Thank you, Minister, for admitting that you keep it under review and consideration. On the face of it, it does not sound to the general populace of Wales like a very exciting subject, but when you consider the difference between what we receive and what Scotland receives under the Barnett formula, then it becomes an exciting issue. How much more does a Scottish person get on average through the Barnett formula than people in Wales do?

Sue Essex: I agree that this is not talked

C2 Mick Bates: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar adolygu fformiwla Barnett? OAQ0122(FIN)

Sue Essex: Y farn gyffredinol yw bod fformiwla Barnett yn gwasanaethu Cymru yn dda, ond fel yr wyf wedi dweud droeon, rydym yn parhau i adolygu hyn a'i ystyried.

Mick Bates: Diolch, Weinidog, am gyfaddef eich bod yn parhau i hadolygu'r fformiwla a'i hystyried. Ar yr olwg gyntaf, nid yw'n swnio'n bwnc cyffrous iawn i boblogaeth gyffredinol Cymru. Ond wrth ystyried y gwahaniaeth rhwng yr hyn a gawn ni a'r hyn a gaiff yr Alban o dan fformiwla Barnett, daw'n fater cyffrous iawn. Faint yn fwy a gaiff person yn yr Alban ar gyfartaledd drwy fformiwla Barnett nag a gaiff pobl yng Nghymru?

Sue Essex: Cytunaf nad yw pawb yn siarad

about on every street corner in Wales. I do not think that I had one question on Barnett during the last election campaign. What it amounts to is important. I cannot give you the differential for Scotland, but I will get that information for you.

2.10 p.m.

The background to that comment was right because Scotland has traditionally done pretty well from the Barnett formula, but that does not necessarily mean that we go to it and ask for a review. As you will understand, the Scots feel that they do pretty well from it.

Jonathan Morgan: I am curious to know your view on the future powers of the Assembly, particularly the way in which the Assembly receives and spends its budget. Bearing in mind that any money transferred to us from Westminster will always be a finite resource, is it your view that we should have the power to raise taxes in Wales in order to spend that money in Wales?

Sue Essex: I do not think that that is being bandied about at the moment, and my view on it is neither here nor there. The debate has moved on on primary law-making powers, and that is where we currently are. In terms of the money that we receive—and this is undeniably true—we have received a huge increase in money in the last few years, under a Labour administration. You may disagree, but I believe that the way in which we have distributed that money under different budgets has been vastly appreciated by the public and by the organisations that I deal with. The increase announced in the last budget was tremendous news, and we were able to put a three-year spending programme in place. We were able to invest extra money in healthcare and childcare, and in all the areas that we feel are crucial. That budget was widely welcomed.

David Lloyd: With Wales to lose its Objective 1 funding post 2006, do you not agree that it is imperative that the Barnett

am hyn ar gornel pob stryd yng Nghymru. Ni chredaf imi gael unrhyw gwestiwn ar fformiwla Barnett yn ystod yr ymgyrch etholiadol ddiwethaf. Mae'r swm yn bwysig. Ni allaf roi'r gwahaniaeth i chi ar gyfer yr Alban, ond fe anfonaf y wybodaeth honno atoch.

Roedd y cefndir i'r sylw hwnnw'n gywir, oherwydd mae'r Alban yn draddodiadol wedi cael bargaen eithaf da o dan fformiwla Barnett. Ond nid yw hynny o reidrwydd yn golygu ein bod yn mynd ati ac yn gofyn am adolygiad. Fel y byddwch yn deall, mae'r Albanwyr yn teimlo eu bod yn cael bargaen eithaf da o hyn.

Jonathan Morgan: Mae gennyf ddiddordeb i glywed eich barn ar bwerau'r Cynulliad yn y dyfodol, yn arbennig y ffordd y mae'r Cynulliad yn cael ei gyllideb ac yn ei gwario. Gan gadw mewn cof y bydd unrhyw arian a drosglwyddir inni o San Steffan bob amser yn adnodd cyfyngedig, ai eich barn chi yw y dylai fod gennym y pŵer i godi trethi yng Nghymru er mwyn gwario'r arian hwnnw yng Nghymru?

Sue Essex: Ni chredaf fod hynny'n cael ei grybwyll ar hyn o bryd, ac nid yw fy marn i arno o bwys. Mae'r ddadl wedi symud ymlaen ar bwerau deddfu sylfaenol, a dyna ein sefyllfa ar hyn o bryd. O ran yr arian a gawn—ac mae hyn yn ddiau yn wir—yr ydym wedi cael cynnydd enfawr mewn arian yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, o dan weinyddiaeth Lafur. Efallai eich bod yn anghytuno, ond credaf fod y cyhoedd a'r sefydliadau yr wyf yn delio â hwy wedi gwerthfawrogi'n fawr y ffordd yr ydym wedi dosbarthu'r arian hwnnw o dan gyllidebau gwahanol. Yr oedd y cynnydd a gyhoeddwyd yn y gyllideb y llynedd yn newyddion gwyb, ac yr oeddem yn gallu rhoi rhaglen dair blynedd o wariant ar waith. Yr oeddem yn gallu buddsoddi arian ychwanegol mewn gofal iechyd a gofal plant, ac ym mhob maes sy'n hollbwysig yn ein barn ni. Croesawyd y gyllideb honno yn helaeth.

David Lloyd: Gyda Chymru ar fin colli ei harian Amcan 1 ar ôl 2006, oni chytunwch ei bod yn hanfodol i fformiwla Barnett gael ei

formula is reviewed, so that we have fair, needs-based funding?

Sue Essex: I cannot understand what you are saying. I have just had a conversation with the leader of the opposition, who is looking forward to our continuing to receive Objective 1 funding. At the moment, we do not know what the situation will be. Clearly, what we received from the UK Government was Barnett plus, as a result of the public expenditure cover. We have received money over and above Barnett twice, as a result of two decisions made by the Chancellor of the Exchequer. That has given us the money to respond to Objective 1, which has been a successful programme in Wales.

hadolygu, er mwyn i ni gael cyllideb deg, yn seiliedig ar anghenion?

Sue Essex: Nid wyf yn deall beth yr ydych yn ei ddweud. Yr wyf newydd gael trafodaeth gydag arweinydd yr wrthblaid, sy'n edrych ymlaen at weld arian Amcan 1 yn parhau. Ar hyn o bryd, ni wyddom beth fydd y sefyllfa. Yn amlwg, yr hyn a gawsom gan Lywodraeth y DU oedd Barnett a mwy, o ganlyniad i'r sicrwydd gwariant cyhoeddus. Yr ydym ddwywaith wedi cael arian yn ychwanegol at Barnett, o ganlyniad i ddau benderfyniad a wnaed gan Ganghellor y Trysorlys. Mae hynny wedi rhoi'r arian inni ymateb i Amcan 1, a fu'n rhaglen lwyddiannus yng Nghymru.

Cyllid Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol Social Justice Funding

Q3 Catherine Thomas: Will the Minister make a statement on what additional funding she has allocated to the social justice portfolio? OAQ0147(FIN)

C3 Catherine Thomas: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ba gyllid ychwanegol y mae wedi'i ddyrannu i'r portffolio cyfiawnder cymdeithasol? OAQ0147(FIN)

Sue Essex: The overall funding allocated to the social justice and regeneration portfolio has increased by nearly £164 million between 2005-06 and 2007-08. This reflects the fundamental commitments of 'Wales: A Better Country'.

Sue Essex: Mae cyfanswm yr arian sy'n cael ei ddyrannu i'r portffolio cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac adfywio wedi cynyddu bron £164 miliwn rhwng 2005-06 a 2007-08. Mae hyn yn adlewyrchu'r ymrwymadau sylfaenol yn 'Cymru: Gwlad Well'.

Catherine Thomas: As you are aware, Supporting People funding was cut this year by the UK Treasury, although we would all agree that you made great efforts to prevent that from happening. Up to now, short-term measures to protect the voluntary sector have been paid for from the social justice and regeneration budget. However, to continue to develop that valuable programme and to address the concerns of organisations across Wales—although we have fared well in Carmarthenshire—would you consider making extra money available in addition to the social justice and regeneration budget?

Catherine Thomas: Fel y gwyddoch, cwtogwyd arian ar gyfer Cefnogi Pobl eleni gan Drysorlys y DU, er y byddai pob un ohonom yn cytuno ichi ymdrechu'n galed i atal hynny rhag digwydd. Hyd yn hyn, talwyd am fesurau byrdymor i ddiogelu'r sector gwirfoddol o'r gyllideb cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac adfywio. Fodd bynnag, er mwyn parhau i ddatblygu'r rhaglen werthfawr honno ac i fynd i'r afael â phryderon sefydliadau ledled Cymru—er ein bod wedi gwneud yn dda yn sir Gaerfyrddin—a fydddech yn ystyried darparu mwy o arian yn ychwanegol at y gyllideb cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac adfywio?

Sue Essex: We are in a budget planning round at present, and I have had a meeting with the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration on this. Working with the Assembly, following the cuts in what were

Sue Essex: Yr ydym mewn cylch cynllunio cyllideb ar hyn o bryd, ac yr wyf wedi cael cyfarfod gyda'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio am hyn. Gan weithio gyda'r Cynulliad, yn dilyn y toriadau

important projects, local authorities have done well with difficult finances, and have done a good job in trying to protect the vulnerable people that that budget serves. I pay tribute to Carmarthenshire and other authorities for that.

William Graham: Figures published for October 2004 show little money for the Children and Family Court Advisory and Support Service or for the fire and rescue services. What implications will this have for the social justice portfolio in 2006-07?

Sue Essex: If my memory serves me right, the consequential money for CAFCASS will be incorporated in this year's budget; I believe that the same is true in terms of the fire and rescue services. I am sure that you will explore that further in committee. We are still working out the figures for the fire and rescue services, and, as I said last year, I will not incorporate it into the budget until I have certainty of figures.

Helen Mary Jones: Constituency casework from across the region that I represent suggests that housing and homelessness are becoming more of an issue, perhaps due to pressures in the private housing sector. Will you be prepared to look favourably on any requests that are made to increase the National Assembly's housing budget to enable, particularly, some of the issues of homelessness to be addressed?

Sue Essex: I agree with you, Helen Mary, that the figures on homelessness are worrying. There is a multitude of reasons for that, but one reason might well be the rise in the value of houses and land. Last year, I put an injection of money into housing. In particular—if you remember—there was a substantial injection into funds for housing for the elderly, to try to get some decanting in order to release some family accommodation. I will look at that in terms of the submissions that come forward to me over this budget round.

mewn prosiectau a oedd yn rhai pwysig, mae awdurdodau lleol wedi gwneud yn dda gyda chyllideb dynn, ac wedi gwneud gwaith da i geisio amddiffyn y bobl ddi-amddiffyn y mae'r gyllideb honno'n eu gwasanaethu. Yr wyf yn canmol sir Gaerfyrddin ac awdurdodau eraill am hynny.

William Graham: Mae'r ffigurau a gyhoeddwyd ar gyfer mis Hydref 2004 yn dangos ychydig iawn o arian ar gyfer y Gwasanaeth Cynghori a Chynorthwyo Llys i Blant a Theuluoedd ac ar gyfer y gwasanaethau tân ac achub. Beth fydd goblygiadau hyn ar gyfer y portffolio cyfiawnder cymdeithasol yn 2006-07?

Sue Essex: Os cofiaf yn iawn, caiff yr arian canlyniadol ar gyfer y Gwasanaeth Cynghori a Chynorthwyo Llys i Blant a Theuluoedd ei gynnwys yn y gyllideb eleni; credaf fod yr un peth yn wir o ran y gwasanaethau tân ac achub. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn ymchwilio i hynny ymhellach yn y pwyllgor. Yr ydym yn dal i weithio allan y ffigurau ar gyfer y gwasanaethau tân ac achub, ac, fel y dywedais y llynedd, ni fyddaf yn eu cynnwys yn y gyllideb nes y bydd gennyf ffigurau pendant.

Helen Mary Jones: Mae gwaith achos etholaethol ledled y rhanbarth yr wyf yn ei gynrychioli yn awgrymu bod tai a digartrefedd yn dod yn bwysicach, efallai oherwydd pwysau yn y sector tai preifat. A fyddwch yn barod i edrych yn ffafriol ar unrhyw geisiadau a wneir i gynyddu cyllideb dai y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, er mwyn galluogi mynd i'r afael, yn arbennig, â rhai materion yn ymwneud â digartrefedd?

Sue Essex: Cytunaf â chi, Helen Mary, fod y ffigurau digartrefedd yn peri pryder. Mae nifer o resymau am hynny, ond efallai mai un o'r rhesymau yw'r cynnydd yng ngwerth tai a thir. Y llynedd, rhoddais arian ychwanegol yn y maes tai. Yn arbennig—os cofiwch—buddsoddwyd yn sylweddol mewn tai ar gyfer yr henoed, i geisio sicrhau rhywfaint o adleoli er mwyn rhyddhau rhywfaint o lety i deuluoedd. Edrychaf ar hynny o ran y sylwadau a gyflwynir imi yn ystod y cylch cyllidebu hwn.

Y Llywydd: Cyn galw'r tri chwestiwn nesaf, sydd mewn grŵp, yr wyf am groesawu ein gwestai arbennig heddiw o Senedd De Cymru Newydd, sef Dirprwy Lefarydd y Senedd honno, a hen gyfaill i mi, yr anrhydeddus John Price, Aelod Seneddol. Croeso mawr i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. [*Cymeradwyaeth.*]

The Presiding Officer: Before calling the next three questions, which are grouped, I should like to welcome our special guest today from the New South Wales Parliament, the Deputy Speaker of that Parliament and an old friend of mine, the Honourable John Price, Member of Parliament. A warm welcome to the National Assembly. [*Applause.*]

Cyllid Portffolio Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes Education and Lifelong Learning Portfolio Funding

Q4 Mark Isherwood: Will the Minister make a statement on the budget provision for the education and lifelong learning portfolio? OAQ0143(FIN)

C4 Mark Isherwood: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y gyllideb a ddarperir ar gyfer y portffolio addysg a dysgu gydol oes? OAQ0143(FIN)

Q8 Lynne Neagle: Will the Minister make a statement on the overall funding that the Assembly Government has allocated to the education and lifelong learning portfolio for 2005-06? OAQ0142(FIN)

C8 Lynne Neagle: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y cyllid cyffredinol y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi'i ddyrannu i'r portffolio addysg a dysgu gydol oes ar gyfer 2005-06? OAQ0142(FIN)

Q9 Jeff Cuthbert: Will the Minister make a statement on the overall funding that she has allocated to the education and lifelong learning portfolio for 2005-06? OAQ0139(FIN)

C9 Jeff Cuthbert: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y cyllid cyffredinol y mae wedi'i ddyrannu i'r portffolio addysg a dysgu gydol oes ar gyfer 2005-06? OAQ0139(FIN)

Sue Essex: The overall funding allocated to the education and lifelong learning portfolio represents an increase of more than 20 per cent between 2004-05 and 2007-08. This investment reflects the importance of education and lifelong learning to delivering our strategic agenda as set out in 'Wales: A Better Country'.

Sue Essex: Mae'r cyllid cyffredinol sy'n cael ei ddyrannu i'r portffolio addysg a dysgu gydol oes yn gynydd o fwy nag 20 y cant rhwng 2004-05 a 2007-08. Mae'r buddsoddiad hwn yn adlewyrchu pwysigrwydd addysg a dysgu gydol oes wrth gyflwyno ein hagenda strategol fel y mae wedi ei gosod allan yn 'Cymru: Gwlad Well'.

Mark Isherwood: How does the Minister respond to the statement by the National Association of Headteachers Cymru that Education and Learning Wales's 2.17 per cent uplift does not even cover increases in teachers' salaries, and the effect of the resulting shortfall will not be limited to sixth-form provision and could destabilise the financial position of entire schools? How does the Minister respond to the statement by the Secondary Heads Association Cymru that Assembly Members have been misled over school funding and that there must now be an independent inquiry into budget provision for schools in Wales? Finally, how does the Minister respond to the call by Professor

Mark Isherwood: Sut y mae'r Gweinidog yn ymateb i'r datganiad gan Gymdeithas Genedlaethol y Prifathrawon, Cymru nad yw'r cynnydd o 2.17 y cant gan Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru yn ddigon hyd yn oed i dalu'r cynnydd yng nghyflogau athrawon, ac na fydd effaith y diffyg a fydd yn sgil hynny yn gyfyngedig i ddarpariaeth chweched dosbarth yn unig ac y gallai ansefydlogi sefyllfa ariannol ysgolion cyfan? Sut y mae'r Gweinidog yn ymateb i'r datganiad gan Gymdeithas y Prifathrawon Uwchradd, Cymru fod Aelodau'r Cynulliad wedi eu camarwain am gyllid ysgolion, a bod yn rhaid cynnal ymchwiliad annibynnol yn awr i'r gyllideb a ddarperir i ysgolion yng Nghymru?

David Reynolds that there should be no more primary school closures until nationally-based research has been conducted on the pros and cons of small primary schools?

Yn olaf, sut y mae'r Gweinidog yn ymateb i alwad yr Athro David Reynolds na ddylid cau rhagor o ysgolion cynradd nes caiff ymchwil genedlaethol ei gwneud ar fanteision ac anfanteision ysgolion cynradd bach?

Sue Essex: The last point is a matter for the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, and it would not be right for me to comment on that. In respect of the previous points about the funding levels, we do not always agree with comments from people outside. As the budgets go through, you will have a chance to scrutinise those budgets, and a chance to make those comments yourself. Jane Davidson and I have frequent discussions about funding on education, if that reassures you. I know that Jane has asked the Audit Commission to do some work on looking at funding levels. I believe that that will come to the committee in September. If you like, our response is to go to the Audit Commission to ask whether it will do a piece of work for us.

Sue Essex: Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes sy'n gyfrifol am y pwynt olaf, ac ni fyddai'n briodol imi wneud sylw ar hynny. O ran y pwyntiau blaenorol am lefelau ariannu, nid ydym bob amser yn cytuno â sylwadau gan bobl o'r tu allan. Wrth i'r cyllidebau gael eu cyflwyno, fe gewch gyfle i graffu arnynt ac i wneud y sylwadau hynny eich hun. Bydd Jane Davidson a minnau'n cael trafodaethau'n aml ar ariannu byd addysg, os yw hynny'n tawelu eich meddwl. Gwn fod Jane wedi gofyn i'r Comisiwn Archwilio wneud ychydig waith ar lefelau ariannu. Credaf y bydd y gwaith hwnnw'n cael ei gyflwyno i'r pwyllgor ym mis Medi. Hynny yw, ein hymateb yw gofyn i'r Comisiwn Archwilio wneud darn o waith inni.

Lynne Neagle: You made a welcome announcement of significant extra funding for early years education in your budget. As you know, the UK Government has made an ambitious pledge to have children's centres in every community, starting with the most deprived communities. A recent Economic Development and Transport Committee report on economic inactivity highlighted the need for the Assembly Government to go much further than current policy, as did the Assembly Government's own childcare review. Can you provide an update on how the early years funding is to be spent, and when will the Assembly Government be in a position to make an announcement on matching the children's centre expansion that we will see in England?

Lynne Neagle: Gwnaethoch gyhoeddiad calonogol am arian ychwanegol sylweddol ar gyfer addysg blynyddoedd cynnar yn eich cyllideb. Fel y gwyddoch, mae Llywodraeth y DU wedi gwneud addewid uchelgeisiol i sefydlu canolfannau plant ym mhob cymuned, gan ddechrau gyda'r cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig. Yr oedd adroddiad yn ddiweddar gan y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth ar anweithgarwch economaidd yn tynnu Llywodraeth y Cynulliad fod angen iddo fynd ymhellach na'r polisi presennol, fel y gwnaeth adolygiad gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ei hun ar ofal plant. A allwch roi'r sefyllfa diweddaraf inni am y ffordd y caiff yr arian blynyddoedd cynnar ei wario, a phryd y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad mewn sefyllfa i wneud cyhoeddiad ar ehangu canolfannau plant fel yr hyn a welir yn Lloegr?

Sue Essex: Early years funding is being led by Jane Hutt, on behalf of children. However, there is also input from the education budget, and from Brian Gibbons's health and social care budget. It is up to the Cabinet sub-committee to take a lead on this and decide the allocations. I believe that that will happen

Sue Essex: Jane Hutt sy'n arwain ar gyllid blynyddoedd cynnar, ar ran plant. Fodd bynnag, ceir cyfraniad hefyd gan y gyllideb addysg, a chan y gyllideb iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol gan Brian Gibbons. Cyfrifoldeb is-bwyllgor y Cabinet yw cymryd yr awenau yn hyn o beth a phenderfynu'r dyraniadau.

fairly soon. There are chunks of money in those budgets from last year's budget review, but we will be able to define those more clearly as we approach the draft budget in the autumn.

There are wide calls on that budget, but as you say, one area in which it is important to invest is childcare to support families, both in terms of parents returning to work and ensuring that children have the best care possible. On the idea of having integrated centres, I visited one at Llwynypia, and I thought it was an imaginative way of dealing with that. I hope that there will be progress in the most needy communities in terms of getting those through.

2.20 p.m.

Jeff Cuthbert: Given that we have ambitious programmes for improving vocational education, such as the 14-19 learning pathways and other initiatives with significant vocational content, such as the Welsh baccalaureate, and the whole programme of vocational training for adults, do you agree that it is crucial that funding is placed at the heart of these programmes and that they must be properly funded if they are to be successful?

Sue Essex: Yes, that is true. Those kind of investments in the future of young people, including the baccalaureate, require money. I discuss those issues with Jane Davidson, as the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning. I also think that it is about a change of culture, and about saying to young people, particularly those aged 14 and 15, that there is a place for them in Wales, and that there are opportunities for them here. We must ensure that they have the chance and the choice to take up those opportunities.

Janet Ryder: To follow up on the point that Jeff made, much of adult education and community outreach education in Wales is funded from European sources. What assessment have you made of the effect on the education budget should Wales fail to get a second round of European funding? If you have carried out an assessment, how much additional funding do you anticipate having

Credaf y bydd hyn yn digwydd yn fuan. Mae yna arian yn y cyllidebau hynny o adolygiad y gyllideb y llynedd, ond byddwn yn gallu diffinio'r rheini'n gliriach wrth inni nesáu at y gyllideb ddrafft yn yr hydref.

Mae galwadau eang ar y gyllideb honno, ond fel y dywedwch, un maes y mae'n bwysig buddsoddi ynddo yw gofal plant i gynorthwyo teuluoedd, o ran rhieni sy'n dychwelyd i'r gwaith ac i sicrhau bod plant yn cael y gofal gorau posibl. O ran y syniad o sefydlu canolfannau integredig, bûm yn ymweld ag un yn Llwynypia, ac yr oeddwn o'r farn ei bod yn ffordd greadigol o ymdrin â hynny. Gobeithio y bydd cynnydd yn y cymunedau mwyaf anghenus o ran sefydlu'r rhain.

Jeff Cuthbert: O gofio bod gennym raglenni uchelgeisiol i wella addysg alwedigaethol, megis y llwybrau dysgu 14-19 a mentrau eraill sydd â chryn gynnwys galwedigaethol, megis bagloriaeth Cymru, a'r holl raglen hyfforddiant galwedigaethol i oedolion, a gytunwch ei bod yn hanfodol sicrhau bod arian ar gael wrth wraidd y rhaglenni hyn, a'u bod yn cael eu hariannu'n briodol os ydynt i lwyddo?

Sue Essex: Cytunaf, mae hynny'n wir. Mae angen arian ar y mathau hynny o fuddsoddi yn nyfodol pobl ifanc, gan gynnwys y fagloriaeth. Trafodaf y materion hynny gyda Jane Davidson, fel y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Credaf fod a wnelo hyn hefyd â newid diwylliant, a dweud wrth bobl ifanc, yn enwedig y rhai rhwng 14 a 15 oed, fod lle iddynt yng Nghymru, a bod cyfleoedd iddynt yma. Rhaid inni sicrhau eu bod yn cael y cyfle a'r dewis i fanteisio ar y cyfleoedd hynny.

Janet Ryder: I ddilyn ymlaen o'r pwynt a wnaed gan Jeff, caiff llawer iawn o addysg i oedolion ac addysg allgymorth yn y gymuned yng Nghymru ei ariannu gan ffynonellau Ewropeaidd. Pa asesiad yr ydych wedi'i wneud o'r effaith ar y gyllideb addysg pe byddai Cymru yn methu â sicrhau ail gylch o arian Ewropeaidd? Os ydych wedi gwneud asesiad, faint o arian ychwanegol yr ydych yn

to put into the education budget to pick up that shortfall in European funding?

Sue Essex: That is a fair question. I do not carry out the assessments on adult education; that comes from the education side. However, you are right to say that that is an important component in terms of creating a sustainable Wales. I do not have figures to hand, but I am pretty sure that that work is going on within the education portfolio. We are currently in limbo because we do not know exactly where we will be. However, as a general principle, we are looking at where funding streams might not materialise in the future. That also applies to lottery funding, which is an issue that we are watching.

Peter Black: Returning to school funding, do you accept that there is a difficulty in terms of properly scrutinising the level of money going to local education authorities for schools, given that the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee cannot directly scrutinise the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning on the budgets for that line, which come under the local government portfolio? Would you, with your local government hat on, be willing to attend a meeting of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee and be scrutinised on those particular budgets?

Sue Essex: I am keen that scrutiny of the finances—and this goes back to David Melding's point—stays within the committee arena. There is slight confusion, and there are some issues that we can clarify more. However, in terms of local government, what goes over is the money in the revenue support grant. It is a process and a mechanism. We have tried to define, particularly for issues such as the teachers' workload agreement, how much money—it was not hypothecated, but it was made clear because of the concerns—is put within the RSG. We did that clearly, and it was therefore considered by the Local Government Partnership Council and the consultative forum on finance, and it is there for you to consider in the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee. Therefore, I think that degree of clarity is there.

rhag-weld y bydd yn rhaid ichi ei neilltuo ar gyfer y gyllideb addysg er mwyn unioni'r diffyg hwnnw mewn arian Ewropeaidd?

Sue Essex: Mae hwnnw'n gwestiwn teg. Nid fi sy'n gwneud yr asesiadau ar addysg i oedolion; yr ochr addysg sy'n gwneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych yn llygad eich lle ei bod yn elfen bwysig o ran creu Cymru gynaliadwy. Nid yw'r ffigurau gennyf wrth law, ond yr wyf yn eithaf sicr fod y gwaith hwnnw'n mynd rhagddo yn y portffolio addysg. Ar hyn o bryd yr ydym mewn gwagle oherwydd ni wyddom ble yn union y byddwn. Fodd bynnag, yn gyffredinol yr ydym yn ystyried meysydd lle na fydd arian ar gael, efallai, yn y dyfodol. Mae hynny hefyd yn berthnasol i arian loteri, sy'n fater yr ydym yn cadw golwg arno.

Peter Black: I ddychwelyd at gyllid ysgolion, a dderbyniwch ei bod yn anodd craffu'n briodol ar faint o arian a gaiff ei roi i awdurdodau addysg lleol ar gyfer ysgolion, o gofio na all y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes graffu'n uniongyrchol ar y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes am y cyllidebau ar gyfer y llinell honno, sy'n dod o dan y portffolio llywodraeth leol? A fydddech, yn rhinwedd eich swydd llywodraeth leol, yn barod i fynd i gyfarfod o'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes a bod yn destun craffu ar y cyllidebau penodol hynny?

Sue Essex: Yr wyf yn awyddus i'r broses o graffu ar gyllid—ac mae hyn yn cyfeirio'n ôl at bwynt David Melding—barhau gyda'r pwyllgor. Mae yna ychydig ddrwsych, a gellir egluro rhai materion ymhellach. Fodd bynnag, o ran llywodraeth leol, yr hyn a gaiff ei drosglwyddo yw'r arian yn y grant cymorth refeniw. Mae'n broses ac yn fecanwaith. Yr ydym wedi ceisio diffinio faint o arian—ni chafodd ei neilltuo, ond fe'i gwnaed yn glir oherwydd y pryderon—a roddir yn y GCR, yn enwedig ar gyfer materion megis y cytundeb ar lwyth gwaith athrawon. Gwnaethom hynny'n glir, ac felly fe'i ystyriwyd gan y Cyngor Partneriaeth Llywodraeth Leol a'r fforwm ymgynghorol ar gyllid, ac mae ar gael ichi ei ystyried yn y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Felly, credaf fod yr eglurder yno.

Monitro Cyllid Monitoring Funding

Q5 Kirsty Williams: What measures does the Minister propose to introduce to monitor funding within Assembly Government departments to ensure effectiveness and delivery of spending? OAQ0123(FIN)

Sue Essex: The 2004 budget round, if you remember, was informed by a major spending review, which looked across the border at all the Assembly's spending programmes. Therefore, it was used to look at whether our spending was effective, as well as to monitor the output of the money. The review was not a one-off exercise, I hasten to add; there is a series of other reviews. I think that 10 per cent of the total budget is being taken forward under specific reviews this year.

Kirsty Williams: Given the concerns expressed in your own Cabinet papers regarding the lack of revenue funding to support the capital programme in the NHS, do you believe it to be an effective use of public money to build hospitals when you have not identified money to run them?

Sue Essex: That is exactly what you said yesterday, and I would have thought that the very precise answer that the First Minister gave would have been enough to deter you from coming back and asking this question. The paper did not raise concerns about revenue. There are two issues. Let me make it clear. What we have done—*[Interruption.]*

The Presiding Officer: Order. Let us get out of these bad habits associated with the Westminster election. I ask Members to ensure that they do not try to ask additional supplementary questions from a sedentary position.

Sue Essex: We put a major injection of capital spend into all sorts of programmes, particularly into hospitals and education. You then have to be absolutely clear that the revenue is there to complement that capital spend. There are two points on this: one was made clear by the First Minister, and I will add the other. Reconfiguration is certainly

C5 Kirsty Williams: Pa fesurau y mae'r Gweinidog yn bwriadu eu cyflwyno i fonitro cyllid o fewn adrannau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i sicrhau effeithiolrwydd a gwario'n llwyddiannus? OAQ0123(FIN)

Sue Essex: Os cofiwch, llywiwyd cylch cyllideb 2004 gan adolygiad mawr o wariant, a edrychai'n gyffredinol ar holl raglenni gwariant y Cynulliad. Felly, fe'i defnyddiwyd i weld a oedd ein gwariant yn effeithiol, yn ogystal â monitro canlyniadau'r arian a wariwyd. Nid ymarfer untro oedd yr adolygiad, rhaid imi bwysleisio; mae yna gyfres o adolygiadau eraill. Credaf fod 10 y cant o'r gyllideb gyfan yn cael ei drosglwyddo o dan adolygiadau penodol eleni.

Kirsty Williams: O ystyried y pryderon a fynegwyd yn eich papurau Cabinet eich hun ynghylch diffyg arian refeniw i gefnogi'r rhaglen gyfalaf yn y GIG, a gredwch ei bod yn ffordd effeithiol o ddefnyddio arian cyhoeddus i adeiladu ysbytai pan nad ydych wedi nodi arian i'w rhedeg?

Sue Essex: Dyna'n union beth a ddywedasoch ddoe, a byddwn yn meddwl y byddai'r ateb penodol iawn a roddodd y Prif Weinidog wedi bod yn ddigon i'ch atal rhag dychwelyd a gofyn y cwestiwn hwn. Nid oedd y papur yn codi pryderon ynghylch refeniw. Mae yma ddau fater. Gadewch imi wneud hynny'n glir. Yr hyn yr ydym wedi'i wneud—*[Torri ar draws.]*

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Gadewch inni roi'r gorau i'r arferion gwael hyn sy'n gysylltiedig ag etholiad San Steffan. Gofynnaf i'r Aelodau sicrhau na fyddant yn ceisio gofyn cwestiynau atodol ychwanegol ar eu heistedd.

Sue Essex: Byddwn yn ychwanegu gwariant cyfalaf mawr ym mhob math o raglenni, yn enwedig ym maes ysbytai ac addysg. Rhaid ichi wedyn fod yn hollol glir fod y refeniw ar gael i ategu'r gwariant cyfalaf hwnnw. Mae dau bwynt ar hyn: gwnaed y cyntaf yn glir gan y Prif Weinidog, ac ychwanegaf yr ail. Mae ail-gyflunio yn sicr yn rhan o agenda

part of the Wanless agenda. It is not necessary to just add on new capital programmes without compensatory change—the Rhymney valley Caerphilly hospital is a good case in point. It is not just an automatic add on. The other thing about new build—and with my environmental background, I am strongly in favour of this—is that in the construction of new capital projects, we have to look at ways of reducing revenue costs, particularly, but not solely, through energy efficiency. That is the other side of the revenue calculations that need to be made.

Janet Davies: I understand that monitoring bodies are getting together to improve co-ordination, thereby avoiding duplication and filling in gaps. Are you aware of any grey areas between UK Government bodies and National Assembly bodies, particularly any that could, in the long term, weaken the National Assembly?

Sue Essex: The introduction of the Public Audit (Wales) Act 2004 and the new Auditor General allows much of the co-ordination that we all agree is needed to ensure proper monitoring. In terms of your specific question, I think that you are referring to a UK health organisation. There is a service-level agreement with that organisation to carry out particular studies, but you are right to stress, and we would certainly stress, that accountability lies here. That has to be made crystal clear, as you have said, so that there is no creep in any direction other than you and I would want. This is the responsibility of the Welsh Assembly Government.

Alun Cairns: To return to Kirsty Williams's original question, the monitoring of spending within Government departments is obviously extremely important, particularly in the economic development main expenditure group where there is the added complication of structural funding and changes in the Pathways to Prosperity levels of expenditure. Therefore, if a Minister misleads the Assembly in terms of the level of Pathways to Prosperity spend, do you think that that is a resigning matter?

Wanless. Nid oes angen ychwanegu rhaglenni cyfalaf newydd heb newid digolledu—mae ysbyty Cwm Rhymni Caerffili yn enghraifft dda o hynny. Nid ychwanegiad awtomatig yn unig yw hyn. Y peth arall ynghylch adeiladu o'r newydd—a chyda'm cefndir amgylcheddol, yr wyf yn gryf o blaid hyn—yw'r ffaith bod yn rhaid inni edrych ar ffyrdd o leihau costau refeniw wrth adeiladu prosiectau cyfalaf newydd, yn enwedig drwy sicrhau effeithlonrwydd ynni, ond nid drwy hynny'n unig. Dyna'r ochr arall i'r cyfrifiadau refeniw y mae'n rhaid eu gwneud.

Janet Davies: Deallaf fod cyrff monitro yn dod at ei gilydd i wella gwaith cydlyn, gan felly osgoi dyblygu gwaith a llenwi bylchau. A wyddoch am unrhyw ansicrwydd sy'n bodoli rhwng cyrff Llywodraeth y DU a chyrff y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn enwedig rhai a allai, yn yr hirdymor, wanhau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol?

Sue Essex: Mae cyflwyno Deddf Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru) 2004 a'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol newydd yn caniatáu llawer o'r gwaith cydgyssylltu y cytunwn bob un ei fod yn angenrheidiol, i sicrhau proses fonitro briodol. O ran eich cwestiwn penodol, credaf eich bod yn cyfeirio at sefydliad iechyd y DU. Mae yna gytundeb lefel gwasanaeth gyda'r sefydliad hwnnw i wneud astudiaethau penodol. Ond yr ydych yn llygad eich lle i bwysleisio bod atebolrwydd yn elfen yn hyn, a byddem ni yn sicr yn pwysleisio hynny. Rhaid gwneud hynny'n hollol glir, fel y dywedwch, er mwyn sicrhau nad eir i unrhyw gyfeiriad heblaw'r cyfeiriad y byddech chi a mi am ei weld. Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru sy'n gyfrifol am hynny.

Alun Cairns: I fynd yn ôl at gwestiwn gwreiddiol Kirsty Williams, mae'r gwaith o fonitro gwariant o fewn adrannau'r Llywodraeth yn amlwg yn bwysig iawn, yn enwedig yn y prif grŵp gwariant datblygu economaidd lle mae yna gymhlethdod pellach yn ymwneud ag arian strwythurol a newidiadau yn lefelau gwariant Ffyrdd i Ffyniant. Felly, os yw Gweinidog yn camarwain y Cynulliad ar lefel gwariant Ffyrdd i Ffyniant, a gredwch fod hynny'n rheswm iddo ymddiswyddo?

Sue Essex: You are obviously talking about one Minister and I do not think that there was a basis for the accusation that he misled you. I know that he would not do so wilfully, and I do not believe that that has happened.

Y Llywydd: Cyn i mi alw'r cwestiynau nesaf, byddai'n briodol i mi gyfarch y ddirprwyaeth o fenywod o Irac sydd yn yr oriel gyhoeddus heddiw, sy'n cysgodi Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Croeso i chi. [Cymeradwyaeth.] Efallai byddai *Salam aleichem* yn briodol.

Sue Essex: Yr ydych yn amlwg yn siarad am un Gweinidog, ac ni chredaf fod sail i'r cyhuddiad ei fod wedi'ch camarwain. Gwn na fyddai'n gwneud hynny'n fwiadol, ac ni chredaf fod hynny wedi digwydd.

The Presiding Officer: Before I call the next questions, it would be appropriate for me to greet the delegation of women from Iraq who are in the public gallery today. They are shadowing Assembly Members. Welcome. [Applause.] *Salam aleichem* might be appropriate.

Ariannu Portffolio Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Local Government and Public Services Portfolio Funding

Q6 The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): Will the Minister make a statement on the overall funding of the local government and public services portfolio? OAQ0146(FIN)

C10 David Lloyd: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y gyllideb gyffredinol sydd ar gael ar gyfer ariannu blaenoriaethau'r Llywodraeth ar gyfer y portffolio llywodraeth leol a gwasanaethau cyhoeddus? OAQ0118(FIN) [W]

Sue Essex: The overall funding allocated to the local government main expenditure group for the next three years represents an increase of more than 16 per cent between 2004-05 and 2007-08.

Nick Bourne: Does the Minister regret making a statement at the time of the council tax revaluation that there would be as many winners as losers, given the figures that she disclosed to me on 29 April indicate that that clearly is not the case? In the light of that, does she feel that an apology is overdue?

Sue Essex: As I continue to make clear about the revaluation, I could only deal with the figures that were passed to me from the Valuation Agency. I was not the person who was carrying out the revaluation of more than a million homes in Wales. I stress that the revaluation changed the relative contributions of householders in Wales. Although more people went up a band than came down, there was a bigger sweep of accommodation in the

C6 Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ariannu cyffredinol y portffolio llywodraeth leol a gwasanaethau cyhoeddus? OAQ0146(FIN)

Q10 David Lloyd: Will the Minister make a statement on the overall budget available to fund the Government's priorities for the local government and public services portfolio? OAQ0118(FIN) [W]

Sue Essex: Mae'r cyllid cyffredinol a ddyrannwyd i brif grŵp gwariant llywodraeth leol am y tair blynedd nesaf yn gynydd o fwy nag 16 y cant rhwng 2004-05 a 2007-08.

Nick Bourne: A yw'n edifar gan y Gweinidog wneud datganiad adeg ailbrisió'r dreth gyngor y byddai cynifer o bobl ar eu hennill ag a fyddai ar eu colled, o ystyried bod y ffigurau a ddatgelodd imi ar 29 Ebrill yn dangos nad yw hynny, yn amlwg, yn wir? Yng ngoleuni hynny, a yw o'r farn ei bod yn hen bryd ymddiheuro?

Sue Essex: Fel yr wyf yn parhau i'w egluro am yr ymarfer ailbrisió, dim ond y ffigurau a roddwyd imi gan yr Asiantaeth Brisió y gallwn ymdrin â hwy. Nid fi fu'n gyfrifol am ailbrisió dros filiwn o dai yng Nghymru. Hoffwn bwysleisio bod yr ymarfer ailbrisió wedi newid cyfraniadau cymharol deiliaid tai yng Nghymru. Er i fwy o bobl symud i fand uwch yn hytrach na symud i lawr, yr oedd mwy o lety i'w gael yn y canol, a'r hyn a wna

centre, and what that does is feed through into the amount of income that local authorities have to claim through the council tax. I agree that the final figures that we had were different from the ones that I was given and I always shared those, but, because it is an issue of relative contribution, the impact, perhaps, was not so great.

2.30 p.m.

Nick Bourne: That might almost have been a qualified apology. We know, and I accept, that you did not do the revaluation, but you predicted the outcome, which did not prove to be true. I have the figures here: the middle bands, C, D and E, barely altered in value, bands A and B dropped significantly, bands E and F were substantially higher, band G increased by a little, H by quite a lot, and a new band, I, was created. The consequence is taxation by the back door, is it not? There is far more being raised by the revaluation exercise than would have been the case without it. Do you not think that you owe some explanation for this taxation by the back door?

Sue Essex: In order to reassure you and many others, I did not predict the outcome; that was done by the Valuation Office Agency and my officials. I did not personally predict the outcome with a calculator. As I said at the end of the revaluation, it was based on a sample that the VOA had used in terms of changes in house prices. That was a 1.6 per cent sample—I will give you the exact figures—which is why the figures at the end were different from the prediction.

I make no apologies for the introduction of Band I. We consulted on it, and I think that it was the right thing to do. By and large, people have accepted that we now have a much fairer level than the original tax banding, which your Government introduced in 1992.

In terms of tax by the back door, I disagree with you, because the figures show otherwise. The figures on yield in this current year, now that all council tax rates have been

hynny yw bwydo i mewn i swm yr incwm y mae'n rhaid i awdurdodau lleol ei hawlio drwy'r dreth gyngor. Cytunaf fod y ffigurau terfynol a roddwyd inni yn wahanol i'r rhai a gefais i, ac yr wyf wedi rhannu'r rheini o'r cychwyn. Ond oherwydd bod hyn yn ymwneud â chyfraniad cymharol, nid oedd yr effaith, efallai, mor fawr.

Nick Bourne: Gallai hynny fod bron yn ymddiheuriad amodol. Gwyddom nad chi a wnaeth yr ymarfer ailbriso, a derbynaf hynny, ond yr oeddech yn rhagweld y canlyniad, ond ni chafodd ei wireddu. Mae'r ffigurau gennyf yma: prin y bu i'r bandiau canol, C, D, ac E, newid o ran gwerth, a gostyngodd bandiau A a B yn sylweddol, yr oedd bandiau E ac F yn sylweddol uwch, a gwelwyd cynnydd bach ym mand G, cynnydd eithaf mawr ym mand H a chrëwyd band newydd, sef Band I. Onid trethiant drwy'r drws cefn yw'r canlyniad? Mae llawer mwy yn cael ei godi drwy'r ymarfer ailbriso nag a fyddai'n digwydd hebdo. Oni chredwch fod arnoch ryw fath o esboniad am y trethiant hwn drwy'r drws cefn?

Sue Essex: Er mwyn eich sicrhau chi a llawer un arall, ni ragwelais y canlyniad; gwnaed hynny gan Asiantaeth y Swyddfa Brisio a'm swyddogion i. Nid euthum ati i rag-weld y canlyniad â chyfrifiannell. Fel y dywedais ar ddiwedd yr ymarfer ailbriso, yr oedd yn seiliedig ar sampl a ddefnyddiwyd gan Asiantaeth y Swyddfa Brisio o'r newidiadau ym mhrisiau tai. Yr oedd hwnnw'n sampl o 1.6 y cant—rhoddaf yr union ffigurau ichi—a dyna pam yr oedd y ffigurau yn y pen draw yn wahanol i'r hyn a ragwelwyd.

Nid ymddiheuraf am gyflwyno Band I. Bûm yn ymgynghori ar hynny, a chredaf mai dyna oedd y peth cywir i'w wneud. Ar y cyfan, mae pobl wedi derbyn bod gennym lefel lawer tecach erbyn hyn na'r bandiau treth gwreiddiol a gyflwynwyd gan eich Llywodraeth chi 1992.

O ran treth drwy'r drws cefn, anghytunaf â chi, oherwydd dengys y ffigurau i'r gwrthwyneb. Mae'r ffigurau ar incwm yn y flwyddyn gyfredol, gan fod pob cyfradd treth

set, stand at just over 9 per cent. That compares very favourably with the yield in previous years, and especially so with the 18 per cent rise that I am told occurred during the last year of the Tory Government. Please do not misinterpret the banding changes in terms of council tax yield.

Nick Bourne: Let us be honest about this, Minister: this banding exercise will produce more revenue, on a constant basis, than previously was the case. The figures demonstrate that, so this is clearly taxation by the back door. How local councils responded is a different matter. You say that you are not influencing the decision, but the introduction of Band I was bound to skew the revaluation exercise unless you made it clear that this should be a neutral exercise. I do not think that you did that. This is taxation by the back door.

Sue Essex: You keep saying that it is clear, as if it is one of the ten commandments; you are wrong. That is why I used the word, 'redistribution'. The important factor was the rate that councils set, and you will remember that I have said clearly throughout this process that I did not expect councils in Wales to take unfair advantage of revaluation. I said that numerous times in the Assembly, and that is why I introduced the principles. Many opposition Members—though perhaps not in your party—disagreed with that, saying that I should not set out capping principles, but I did. I thank local government for ensuring that everything came into line eventually without my having to apply a cap. Urging councils not to take unfair advantage of revaluation—and I use those words deliberately—was crucial, and that is why your premise is wrong.

David Lloyd: Weinidiog, sut fyddwch chi'n taclo diffygion cyllidol pensiynau llywodraeth leol?

Sue Essex: As you sit on the Local Government and Public Services Committee and on the Consultative Forum on Finance you will know that this issue has been

gyngor wedi ei phennu, ychydig dros 9 y cant. Mae hynny'n cymharu'n ffafriol iawn â'r incwm mewn blynnyddoedd blaenorol, ac yn arbennig felly â'r cynnydd o 18 y cant y dywedir iddo ddigwydd yn ystod y flwyddyn olaf pan oedd y Llywodraeth Doriaidd mewn grym. Peidiwch â chamddehongli'r newidiadau bandio o ran incwm o'r dreth gyngor.

Nick Bourne: Gadewch inni fod yn onest ynglŷn â hyn, Weinidog: bydd yr ymarfer bandio hwn yn cynhyrchu mwy o refeniw, yn gyson, nag a gynhyrchied gynt. Mae'r ffigurau'n profi hynny, felly, mae'n amlwg mai trethiant drwy'r drws cefn yw hyn. Mater arall yw'r modd yr ymatebodd cynghorau lleol. Dywedwch nad ydych yn dylanwadu ar y penderfyniad, ond yr oedd cyflwyno Band I yn sicr o ystumio'r ymarfer ailbrisiu oni fydddech yn gwneud yn glir y dylai fod yn ymarfer niwtral. Ni chredaf ichi wneud hynny. Trethiant drwy'r drws cefn yw hyn.

Sue Essex: Yr ydych dweud byth a hefyd ei fod yn glir, fel pe bai'n un o'r deg gorchymyn; yr ydych yn anghywir. Dyna pam y defnyddiais y gair 'aiddosbarthu'. Y ffactor pwysig oedd y gyfradd a bennwyd gan y cynghorau, ac fe gofiwch imi ddweud yn glir drwy gydol y broses hon nad oeddwn yn disgwyl i gynghorau yng Nghymru fanteisio'n annheg ar yr ailbrisiu. Dywedais hynny droeon yn y Cynulliad, a dyna pam y cyflwynais yr egwyddorion. Yr oedd nifer o Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau—er nad yn eich plaid chi hwyrach—yn anghytuno â hynny, gan ddweud na ddylwn bennu egwyddorion capio, ond fe wneuthum hynny. Diolch i lywodraeth leol am sicrhau bod popeth wedi disgyn i'w le yn y pen draw heb imi orfod pennu cap. Yr oedd annog cynghorau i beidio â manteisio'n annheg ar yr ailbrisiu—a defnyddiaf y geiriau hynny'n fwriadol—yn hollbwysig, a dyna pam mae eich tybiaeth yn anghywir.

David Lloyd: Minister, how will you tackle financial shortfalls in local government pensions?

Sue Essex: Gan eich bod yn eistedd ar y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus ac ar y Fforwm Ymgynghorol ar Gyllid, fe wyddoch fod y mater hwn wedi ei

included in the annual calculations of need in recent years—that has certainly been the case during the last two years while I have been Minister with responsibility for local government. I cannot remember exactly how much we have put in this year, but it was exactly what local government had asked for. That money went in to cover pay, price and pensions pressure. We are guided by what the actuaries say on the state of current pension schemes. I have not seen the details this year, but it is part of the local government assessment of need.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): In your 2003 manifesto you said,

‘In our second term—

which we are now in—

we will provide funding for all primary school children to have free breakfasts at school’.

Elsewhere in your manifesto, you said that the next step is free breakfasts for all primary school kids. What would be the cost, in a full financial year, of providing free school breakfasts for all primary school children in Wales?

Sue Essex: This is obviously not a situation for all primary schools in Wales, because, as the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning has said time and again, it is for all schools who want it. We have no power to impose free school breakfasts on every school. The calculations and estimates have been made on take-up in terms of numbers of schools and the numbers in schools, and that is why, with that work going on, I was careful not to put sums in the budget unless we knew what the figures were. If you are honest, you know that there was never any real expectancy that there would be take-up by all schools and by all children in Wales.

Michael German: I find that staggering, because I am only reading from your

gynnwys yn y cyfrifiadau angen blynyddol yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf—yn sicr mae hynny wedi bod yn wir yn ystod y ddwy flynedd diwethaf tra y bûm i’n Weinidog gyda chyfrifoldeb dros lywodraeth leol. Ni allaf gofio faint yn union yr ydym wedi ei gyfrannu eleni, ond dyna’n union yr oedd llywodraeth leol wedi gofyn amdano. Aeth yr arian hwnnw i dalu’r pwysau o ran cyflogau, prisiau a phensiynau. Cawn ein harwain gan yr hyn a ddywed yr actiwariaid am sefyllfa’r cynlluniau pension cyfredol. Nid wyf wedi gweld y manylion eleni, ond mae’n rhan o’r asesiad anghenion gan lywodraeth leol.

Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): Yn eich maniffesto yn 2003, dywedech,

Yn ein hail dymor—

sef y cyfnod hwn yn awr—

byddwn yn darparu arian er mwyn i bob plentyn ysgol gynradd gael brecwast am ddim yn yr ysgol.

Mewn man arall yn eich maniffesto, dywedwch mai’r cam nesaf yw brecwast am ddim i bob plentyn ysgol gynradd. Beth fyddai cost darparu brecwast am ddim i bob plentyn ysgol gynradd yng Nghymru mewn blwyddyn ariannol lawn?

Sue Essex: Mae’n amlwg nad yw hon yn sefyllfa sy’n berthnasol i bob ysgol gynradd yng Nghymru, oherwydd fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes droeon, mae ar gael i’r ysgolion sy’n dymuno hynny. Nid oes pwerau gennym i orfodi brecwast am ddim ym mhob ysgol. Gwnaed y cyfrifiadau a’r amcangyfrifon ar sail nifer yr ysgolion sy’n dewis brecwast am ddim a niferoedd y disgyblion sy’n ei ddewis. Dyna pam, gyda’r gwaith hwnnw’n mynd rhagddo, yr oeddwn yn ofalus i beidio â chynnwys symiau yn y gyllideb oni bai ein bod yn gwybod beth oedd y ffigurau. Pe baech yn onest, fe wyddech nad oedd unrhyw ddisgwyliad gwirioneddol y byddai pob ysgol a phob plentyn yng Nghymru yn dewis brecwast am ddim.

Michael German: Mae hynny’n fy syfrdanu, oherwydd y cyfan a wnaif yw darllen o’ch

manifesto; I am not making this up. I repeat what it says: you will provide funding for all primary school children and that there will be free breakfasts for all primary school children. I understand the word 'all' to mean all primary school children. Your manifesto did not say only those who might want it, or all primary school children except those who say 'no', or all primary school children except those for whom teachers say 'no', or all primary school children except those whose schools say 'no'. It says, 'all primary school children', so, clearly this is a broken manifesto promise, or would you at least agree with me, because you just said it, that by 'all' you do not mean all and therefore that this was a devious promise?

Sue Essex: The Liberal Democrats are clutching at straws now in terms of false manifesto promises. If you are suggesting that you want a regulation brought through here—and I am pretty sure that we do not have the primary powers for this—insisting that all schools have this and that all schoolchildren, regardless of what their parents think, should be forced to have a breakfast, then I would like you to explain that to the population of Wales, because that is not my understanding of choice and democratic policy.

Michael German: I wish that you had explained that in your manifesto. These are not my words; they are your words, which are clearly not true. If you meant that you were going to provide funding for all primary school children but then could not provide it because you did not have the powers or whatever, it would mean that you had some money left over in your budget. That is my point. Clearly, you did not put money aside for what you promised. You did not mean what you promised and you do not have any money to put aside for it anyway, so, clearly it was not a proper promise and you have tried to delude the people of Wales on it.

Sue Essex: This is a very tortuous argument

manifesto; nid rhywbeth yr wyf yn ei greu yw hyn. Ailadroddaf yr hyn a ddywed: byddwch yn darparu arian ar gyfer pob plentyn ysgol gynradd, a bydd brecwast ar gael am ddim i bob plentyn ysgol gynradd. Cymeraf y gair 'pob' i olygu pob plentyn ysgol gynradd. Nid oedd eich manifesto'n nodi dim ond y rhai fyddai'n ei ddewis, neu bob plentyn ysgol gynradd ac eithrio'r rhai a fyddai'n dweud 'na', neu bob plentyn ysgol gynradd ac eithrio'r rhai y mae athrawon yn dweud 'na' ar eu rhan, neu bob plentyn ysgol gynradd ac eithrio'r rhai y mae ysgolion yn dweud 'na' ar eu rhan. Mae'n dweud, 'pob plentyn ysgol gynradd'. Felly, mae hwn yn amlwg yn addewid manifesto yr ydych wedi'i dorri. Neu a fydddech o leiaf yn cytuno â mi, gan eich bod newydd ddweud hynny, nad yw'r gair 'pob' yn golygu pob plentyn ac mai addewid cyfeiliornus oedd hwn?

Sue Essex: Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn cydio mewn gwelltyn yn awr o ran addewidion manifesto ffug. Os ydych yn awgrymu eich bod am weld rheoliad yn cael ei gyflwyno—ac yr wyf yn eithaf sicr nad ydym yn meddu ar y pwerau sylfaenol i wneud hyn—yn mynnu y dylai hyn fod ar gael ym mhob ysgol, ac y dylid gorfodi pob plentyn ysgol, beth bynnag fo barn ei rieni, i gael brecwast, yna hoffwn ichi egluro hynny wrth boblogaeth Cymru, oherwydd nid dyna fy nealltwriaeth i o ddewis a pholisi democrataidd.

Michael German: Trueni na fydddech wedi esbonio hynny yn eich manifesto. Nid fy ngeiriau i yw'r rhain; eich geiriau chi ydynt, ac mae'n amlwg nad ydynt yn wir. Os oeddech yn golygu eich bod wedi bwriadu darparu arian ar gyfer pob plentyn ysgol gynradd, ond nad oeddech yn gallu ei ddarparu am nad oeddech yn meddu ar y pwerau neu beth bynnag, byddai'n golygu bod rhywfaint o arian ar ôl yn eich cyllideb. Dyna fy mhwynt. Yn amlwg, ni roesoch arian o'r neilltu ar gyfer yr hyn yr oeddech wedi ei addo. Nid oeddech yn golygu'r hyn a addawsoch, ac nid oes arian gennyh i'w neilltuo ar ei gyfer beth bynnag. Felly, mae'n amlwg nad oedd hwn yn addewid go iawn ac yr ydych wedi ceisio twyllo pobl Cymru yn hyn o beth.

Sue Essex: Mae hon yn ddadl drofaus iawn

and it is not shared by people on the doorsteps and streets of Wales. People understand choice and it seems to be only you, Mike, who has a problem with this. This is about choice. We think that it is a good idea. We cannot force schools or parents to choose this if they do not want it but we are piloting it, and then we will see. I am not in the business of forcing schools and parents to have free school breakfasts if they do not want them. If you think more calmly and rationally about it, I am sure that you will find that the Liberal Democrats are not either.

Jeff Cuthbert: I am sure that, like me, you find this discussion incredible. No-one has ever suggested, until now, that we should be force-feeding primary school children. Do you agree that this excellent Assembly initiative to provide free breakfasts, especially for primary school children in our most deprived areas, has massive benefits for schoolchildren and their parents, and in terms of teaching and learning?

Sue Essex: One of the best examples that I have seen is in a school in Jeff's constituency, and those of you who have doubts and who seem to want to catcall from the side should go there to see how this is working on the ground and see the benefits for children. We believe in the future of children in Wales even if some of you do not.

ac nid pobl ar garreg y drws ac ar strydoedd Cymru o'r un farn am y ddatl. Mae pobl yn deall beth yw dewis, ac ymddengys mai dim ond chi, Mike, sy'n cael anhawster gyda hyn. Mae a wnelo hyn â dewis. Credwn ei fod yn syniad da. Ni allwn orfodi ysgolion na rhieni i ddewis hyn os nad ydynt am ei gael. Ond byddwn yn ei dreialu, ac yna cawn weld. Nid wyf yn credu mewn gorfodi ysgolion a rhieni i gael brecwast am ddim yn yr ysgol os nad ydynt yn dymuno ei gael. Os meddylwch yn fwy pwyllog a rhesymegol am y peth, yr wyf yn siŵr y gwelwch nad yw'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol am wneud hynny ychwaith.

Jeff Cuthbert: Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod chi, fel finnau, wedi'ch syfrdanu gan y drafodaeth hon. Nid oes neb wedi awgrymu, cyn heddiw, y dylem orfodi plant ysgolion cynradd i fwyta. A gytunwch fod manteision y fenter wych hon gan y Cynulliad i ddarparu brecwast am ddim, yn arbennig i blant ysgolion cynradd yn ein hardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig, yn enfawr i blant ysgol a'u rhieni, ac o ran addysgu a dysgu?

Sue Essex: Mae un o'r enghreifftiau gorau yr wyf wedi'u gweld yn etholaeth Jeff, a dylai'r rhai ohonoch sydd ag amheuon ac sydd am weiddi o'r cyrion fynd yno i weld sut y mae hyn yn gweithio ar lawr gwlad a gweld y manteision i blant. Yr ydym yn credu yn nyfodol plant Cymru hyd yn oed os nad yw rhai ohonoch chi yn credu yn hynny.

Goblygiadau Ariannol y Strategaeth Adleoli Relocation Strategy Funding Implications

Q7 Brynle Williams: Will the Minister make a statement on the funding implications of the National Assembly relocation strategy? OAQ0132(FIN)

Sue Essex: With regard to the Merthyr Tydfil office, work on which is starting now, I confirm that the Assembly has entered into a lease purchase contract for 15 years, to the value of £1.254 million net per annum. Commitment for the new Cadw office amounts to a 15-year lease agreement of £272,000 net per annum. Due to ongoing commercial negotiations, it is not appropriate for me to discuss the costs of the Llandudno Junction and Aberystwyth offices yet.

C7 Brynle Williams: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar oblygiadau ariannu strategaeth adleoli'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol? OAQ0132(FIN)

Sue Essex: O ran swyddfa Merthyr Tudful, lle mae gwaith yn dechrau'n awr, gallaf gadarnhau bod y Cynulliad wedi arwyddo contract prynu ar brydles am 15 mlynedd, sy'n werth £1.254 miliwn net y flwyddyn. Mae'r ymrwymiad i'r swyddfa newydd i Cadw yn dod i gytundeb prydles 15 mlynedd o £272,000 y flwyddyn. Oherwydd negodiadau masnachol parhaus, nid yw'n briodol imi drafod costau'r swyddfeydd yng Nghyffordd Llandudno ac Aberystwyth eto.

Brynle Williams: You will be aware that many people presently working in the National Assembly are concerned about the prospects of relocating. Can you advise what consultation has been undertaken with potentially affected staff and what provision has been made to safeguard the jobs of people who are unable to move to different locations?

2.40 p.m.

Sue Essex: There has been a huge amount of consultation with our staff; this is not a policy that we would embark upon to the exclusion of our staff. Trade unions have also been closely involved. It is far too early to say what the outcome of the Aberystwyth and Llandudno buildings will be, but I believe that the Merthyr building—work on which, as I said, is starting now—will be full in terms of the activities there. We have had a good response. I can probably give you figures in terms of the number of people who do not want to move, but many of them have already been allocated other jobs. We are working with the human resources department on this to ensure that our staff, whom we value considerably, are involved in all decisions, are taken through the process, and that alternatives are offered to them if they do not want to move.

Elin Jones: A ydych mewn sefyllfa eto i gadarnhau union leoliad swyddfa ranbarthol newydd y Cynulliad yn Aberystwyth? Mae'n debyg bod arwyddion wedi cael eu codi yn y dyddiau diwethaf ar un safle yn Aberystwyth yn nodi y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn adeiladu yno, ond nid wyf yn ymwybodol eich bod chi wedi gwneud datganiad swyddogol ar hynny hyd yn hyn.

Sue Essex: No, I have not. You have kept your eagle eyes open and I will certainly get back to you on that one.

Brynle Williams: Gwyddoch fod nifer o bobl sy'n gweithio yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar hyn o bryd yn pryderu am y posibilrwydd o adleoli. A allwch ddweud wrthym sut yr ymgynghorwyd â staff y gallai hyn effeithio arnynt, a pha ddarpariaeth sydd wedi ei gwneud i ddiogelu swyddi pobl na allant symud i fannau gwahanol?

Sue Essex: Bu llawer iawn o ymgynghori â'n staff; nid yw hyn yn bolisi y byddem yn ei ystyried heb gynnwys ein staff. Mae undebau llafur hefyd wedi bod yn rhan o'r broses. Mae hi lawer yn rhy gynnar dweud beth fydd canlyniad yr adeiladau yn Aberystwyth a Llandudno, ond credaf y bydd adeilad Merthyr—lle mae'r gwaith yn mynd rhagddo ar hyn o bryd, fel y dywedais—yn llawn o ran y gweithgareddau yno. Yr ydym wedi cael ymateb da. Mae'n debyg y gallaf roi ffigurau ichi am infer y bobl nad ydynt yn dymuno symud, ond mae swyddi eraill wedi eu rhoi i nifer ohonynt. Yr ydym yn gweithio gyda'r adran adnoddau dynol ar hyn i sicrhau bod ein staff, yr ydym yn eu gwerthfawrogi'n fawr, yn cael eu cynnwys ym mhob penderfyniad, yn cael eu harwain drwy'r broses, ac yn cael cynnig dewisiadau gwahanol os nad ydynt yn dymuno symud.

Elin Jones: Are you in a position yet to confirm the exact location of the new regional Assembly office in Aberystwyth? It appears that signs have been erected in the past few days at one site in Aberystwyth stating that the Welsh Assembly Government will be building there. But I am not aware that you have made an official statement on this to date.

Sue Essex: Nac ydwyf. Yr ydych wedi bod yn sylwgar, a byddaf yn sicr yn cysylltu â chi ynglŷn â hynny.

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad Questions to the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside

Effaith Ffermio ar Afonydd Impact of Farming on Rivers

Q1 Huw Lewis: Will the Minister make a **C1 Huw Lewis:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog

statement on Assembly Government efforts to reduce the environmental impact of farming on rivers in Wales? OAQ0241(EPC)

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): Officials are consulting on action to improve river catchments, and the consultation ends on 31 May. We are also applying for Objective 1 funding to support a demonstration project in two areas of Wales.

Huw Lewis: There is great concern, as you may know, among anglers, including the active Merthyr Tydfil Angling Association, about the pollution of rivers and waterways, and, in particular, about the lack of adequate measures to prevent chemicals such as sheep dip from entering rivers. Can you tell me a little more about the action that we need to take in order to avoid Welsh farming being labelled a dirty industry, which largely avoids 'the polluter pays' principle?

Carwyn Jones: First, many of the requirements of cross-compliance and agri-environment schemes are aimed specifically at improving water quality. If farmers are not compliant, they will not receive subsidies, which is an important point. Secondly, in terms of the future direction of river catchment sensitive farming, the European Commission's water framework directive, which requires a good chemical and ecological status in surface water, will be in place by 2015. Other policy drivers will include the nitrates directive, the bathing waters directive, the shellfish hygiene and freshwater fish directives and the habitats directive, all of which will involve farming and looking at farming practices.

Brynle Williams: I am glad that Huw has raised this. The polluter does pay at present, from farmers right through. I am sure that you will agree that rivers have been heavily monitored for many years with regard to toxic chemicals, slurry and silage effluents—there are many others; I will not defend the industry entirely, but it has cleaned up its act—and prosecutions of farmers have been extremely successful. However, will you

ddatganiad ar ymdrechion Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i leihau effaith amgylcheddol ffermio ar afonydd Cymru? OAQ0241(EPC)

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Mae swyddogion yn ymgynghori ar gamau i wella dalgylchoedd afonydd, a daw'r ymgynghori i ben ar 31 Mai. Yr ydym hefyd yn gwneud cais am arian Amcan 1 i gefnogi prosiect arddangos mewn dwy ardal yng Nghymru.

Huw Lewis: Mae pryder mawr, fel y gwyddoch efallai, ymhlith pysgotwyr, gan gynnwys Cymdeithas Bysgota weithgar Merthyr Tudful, am y llygredd mewn afonydd a dyfirffyrdd, ac yn arbennig am y diffyg mesurau digonol i atal cemegau fel dip defaid rhag cyrraedd afonydd. A allwch ddweud ychydig mwy wrthyf am y camau y mae angen inni eu cymryd i atal diwydiant ffermio Cymru rhag cael ei labelu yn ddiwydiant budr, sydd ar y cyfan yn osgoi'r egwyddor mai'r 'llygrwr sy'n talu'?

Carwyn Jones: Yn gyntaf, mae nifer o ofynion traws-gydymffurfio a chynlluniau amaeth-amgylchedd yn anelu'n benodol at wella ansawdd dŵr. Os na fydd ffermwyr yn cydymffurfio, ni chânt gymorthdaliadau, sy'n bwynt pwysig. Yn ail, o ran cyfeiriad ffermio sy'n sensitif i ddalgylch afonydd yn y dyfodol, bydd cyfarwyddeb fframwaith dŵr y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd, sy'n gofyn am statws cemegol ac ecolegol da mewn dŵr wyneb, ar waith erbyn 2015. Ymhlith y ffactorau eraill a fydd yn dylanwadu ar bolisi bydd y gyfarwyddeb nitradau, cyfarwyddeb dyfroedd ymdrochi, cyfarwyddebau hylendid pysgod cregyn a physgod dŵr croyw, a'r gyfarwyddeb cynefinoedd. Byddant oll yn cwmpasu ffermio ac yn edrych ar arferion ffermio.

Brynle Williams: Yr wyf yn falch fod Huw wedi codi hyn. Ar hyn o bryd y llygrwr sy'n talu, yn ffermwyr a phawb. Mae'n siŵr y cytunwch fod afonydd wedi cael eu monitro'n drylwyr ers blynnyddoedd lawer o ran cemegau gwenwynig, slyri ac elifion silwair—a llawer peth arall; nid wyf yn amddiffyn y diwydiant cyfan, ond mae wedi gwella—ac mae erlyn ffermwyr wedi bod yn llwyddiannus iawn. Fodd bynnag, a

agree to have the necessary conversation with officials to ensure that such diligence is applied to industry, not just to agriculture, and to guarantee a level playing field for all?

Carwyn Jones: Industry is regularly monitored by the Environment Agency in terms of discharges into water courses. It is important that, where industries—and agriculture is an industry—are responsible for discharging potential pollution into water courses, they are monitored and ultimately brought to account for it.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Yr wyf yn siŵr bod y Gweinidog hefyd yn derbyn bod ansawdd dŵr afonydd wedi gwella'n sylweddol yn ystod y blynyddoedd diweddar. Mae hynny'n rhannol oherwydd yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd mewn diwydiant yn gyffredinol a'r diwydiant amaethyddol yn benodol. Bu i chi gyfeirio hefyd at y rheolau trawsgydymffurfiol newydd sy'n golygu bod rhaid i ffermwyr gadw at reolau amgylcheddol caeth er mwyn derbyn y taliad sengl newydd. Pa fath o effaith yr ydych yn disgwyl i hynny gael ar lendid afonydd?

Carwyn Jones: Mae'n wir bod afonydd Cymru heddiw yn llawer glanach nag y buont ers canrif neu fwy, ond mae'n anodd mesur pa effaith a gaiff y rheoliadau hynny gan mai ychydig iawn o ffermwyr sy'n gyfrifol am lygredd afonydd. Fodd bynnag, mae rhai yn gyfrifol amdano ac mae'n bwysig eu bod yn ymwybodol o'r hyn y maent yn ei wneud ac y gellid dwyn achos yn eu herbyn. Ond, fel y dywedais, nifer fach sy'n gwneud hyn. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd effaith, ond ni fydd mor sylweddol fel bod modd dangos gwelliant mawr oherwydd bu gwelliannau eisoes yn y blynyddoedd diweddar.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I ehangu ar y pwynt hwnnw, yr ydych wedi cyfeirio at yr ymgynghoriad sydd i ddod ar y rheoliadau newydd, a gwyddoch fod rheoliadau iechyd anifeiliaid a nifer o fesurau o'r fath wedi eu cyflwyno dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf yn gofyn i'r diwydiant gadw at reolau caeth, gan gynyddu'r costau i'r diwydiant. Yn ogystal â sicrhau bod ffermwyr yn cadw at y rheolau hyn, a wneuch chi hefyd sicrhau eich bod yn ymwybodol o'r costau ychwanegol a ddaw

gytunwch i gael y sgwrs angenrheidiol gyda swyddogion i sicrhau defnyddio'r trylwyredd hwnnw yn y diwydiant, nid mewn amaethyddiaeth yn unig, a sicrhau sefyllfa deg i bawb?

Carwyn Jones: Caiff y diwydiant ei fonitro'n rheolaidd gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd o ran gollyngiadau i gyrsiau dŵr. Mae'n bwysig, lle mae diwydiannau—ac mae amaethyddiaeth yn ddiwydiant—yn gyfrifol am ollwng llygredd posibl i gyrsiau dŵr, eu bod yn cael eu monitro a'u dwyn i gyfrif am hynny yn y pen draw.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I am sure the Minister also accepts that the quality of river water has improved substantially over recent years. That is due in part to what has happened in industry generally and in the agricultural industry specifically. You also referred to the new cross-compliance regulations, which mean that farmers must adhere to strict environmental rules in order to receive the new single payment. What impact do you expect that will have on the cleanliness of rivers?

Carwyn Jones: It is true that Welsh rivers are much cleaner than they have been for a century or more. But it is difficult to measure what impact those regulations have because very few farmers are responsible for river pollution. Some are, and it is important that those farmers are aware of what they are doing and that proceedings can be taken against them. However, as I said, a small number do this. I am sure that there will be an impact, but it will not be so great as to enable us to demonstrate a big improvement because there have been improvements already during the past few years.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: To expand on that point, you have referred to the forthcoming consultation on the new regulations, and you know that animal health regulations and several other similar measures have been introduced over the years whereby the industry has been forced to adhere to restrictive rules and has therefore faced increased costs. In addition to ensuring that farmers adhere to these regulations, will you also ensure that you are aware of the

drwy gadw at y rheolau? Rhaid inni fod yn ofalus nad yw cost y rheoliadau hyn yn uwch na'r hyn y mae'r diwydiant yn gallu ei dalu yn y pen draw?

Carwyn Jones: Mae pob diwydiant yn gorfod talu mwy i fynd i'r afael â llygredd. Mae hynny wedi bod yn wir ers degawd neu fwy o ran y rheolau a gyflwynwyd yn ystod y 10 mlynedd diwethaf; nid yw hynny'n afresymol. Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhaid cofio bod ffermio yn wahanol i ddiwydiannau eraill gan fod ffermwyr yn cael eu talu gan y trethdalwr i ffermio, felly mae'n rhesymol i erfyn safonau uchel gan ffermwyr. Mae hynny'n wir yn y mwyafrif o achosion o ran cynhyrchu bwyd a chynnal safonau amgylcheddol.

Mick Bates: We all welcome the higher environmental standards that have reduced river pollution. However, there is also an impact on the farmers caused by using these chemicals. Organophosphorus was used as a dip, which was then banned for the sake of synthetic pyrethroids, which have an environmental impact that is 100 times greater? What are you doing to examine the health status of those farmers who suffered from the use of chemicals such as organophosphorus? They are still suffering and, as yet, no-one has taken up their cause to ensure that their health status is monitored just like that of a river.

Carwyn Jones: The monitoring of their health is largely a matter for their medical practitioners. On the effect on farmers, it is right to say that the effect of dipper's flu, for example, was quite marked in some people. On monitoring the environmental situation, that is a matter for the Environment Agency, and monitoring the health of individuals is a matter largely for the medical authorities.

additional costs incurred in doing this? We must ensure that the cost of these regulations is no higher than what the industry ultimately can pay.

Carwyn Jones: Every industry has to pay more to tackle pollution. That has been true for a decade or more, given the regulations that have been introduced over the past 10 years; that is not unreasonable. However, we must always remember that farming is different from other industries because farmers are paid by the taxpayer to farm, and it is, therefore, reasonable to expect high standards from farmers. That is true in most cases in terms of food production and maintaining environmental standards.

Mick Bates: Mae pob un ohonom yn croesawu'r safonau amgylcheddol uwch sydd wedi lleihau llygredd mewn afonydd. Fodd bynnag, mae defnyddio'r cemegau hyn yn cael effaith ar y ffermwyr hefyd. Arferid defnyddio organoffosfforws fel dip. Yna fe'i gwaharddwyd a defnyddiwyd pyrethroidau sythetig yn ei le, sy'n cael effaith amgylcheddol ganwaith yn fwy. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i archwilio statws iechyd y ffermwyr hynny a ddiodeffodd oherwydd defnyddio cemegau fel organoffosfforws? Maent yn dal i ddiodeff, a hyd yma nid oes neb wedi ymgyrchu drostynt i sicrhau y caiff eu statws iechyd ei fonitro fel statws iechyd afon.

Carwyn Jones: Eu meddygon teulu sy'n bennaf cyfrifol am fonitro eu hiechyd. O ran yr effaith ar ffermwyr, mae'n wir dweud bod ffliw'r dipwyr, er enghraifft, wedi cael effaith ddigon amlwg ar rai pobl. O ran monitro'r sefyllfa amgylcheddol, mater i Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yw hynny, a mater i'r awdurdodau meddygol ar y cyfan yw monitro iechyd unigolion.

Ehangu Cyfleusterau Niwclear Expansion of Nuclear Facilities

Q2 Jocelyn Davies: What discussions has the Minister recently held with UK Government Ministers regarding possible expansion of nuclear facilities? OAQ0193(EPC)

C2 Jocelyn Davies: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cael yn ddiweddar gyda Gweinidogion Llywodraeth y DU ynglŷn â'r posibilrwydd o ehangu cyfleusterau niwclear? OAQ0193(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: No such discussions have taken place.

Jocelyn Davies: In light of the Royal Society's report on energy published on Monday and the First Minister's refusal yesterday to rule out new nuclear power generation in Wales, will you state your view on this matter and pressurise your Westminster colleagues to transfer powers over large energy projects to the Assembly so that we may determine our own energy policy?

Carwyn Jones: It is not just a matter for me to pursue, but also for my colleague, Andrew Davies, who is responsible for energy policy. I am responsible for planning policy in this regard.

2.50 p.m.

It is difficult to give an opinion in terms of what might be proposed in the future with regard to nuclear power without knowing what those proposals might be, but I am sure that the matter will be discussed at great length in the Assembly if there are firm proposals in the future.

John Griffiths: Would you agree that there have not been convincing answers from the nuclear industry to the many questions posed about issues such as nuclear waste, and that the nuclear industry has been characterised by a lack of transparency and openness, and, sometimes as providing plain misinformation?

Carwyn Jones: There has probably been no more debated form of energy production than nuclear energy over the years. It has significant drawbacks, one of which is finding somewhere to put nuclear waste while fission nuclear power stations are the only means available of producing nuclear power. That will be taken into account, should there be any move in this direction in the future.

Glyn Davies: About 25 per cent of energy currently comes from nuclear power stations, which will be closed down over the next 20 years or so. What plans do you have to ensure that there is not an absolute requirement for

Carwyn Jones: Nid oes unrhyw drafodaethau o'r fath wedi digwydd.

Jocelyn Davies: Yng ngoleuni adroddiad y Gymdeithas Frenhinol ar ynni a gyhoeddwyd ddydd Llun, a'r ffaith fod y Prif Weinidog wedi gwrthod dweud yn bendant ddoe na fyddai cenhedlaeth newydd o orsafoedd ynni niwclear yng Nghymru, a rowch eich barn am y mater hwn a phwyso ar eich cyd-aelodau yn San Steffan i drosglwyddo pwerau dros brosiectau ynni mawr i'r Cynulliad, fel y gallwn benderfynu ein polisi ynni ein hunain?

Carwyn Jones: Nid mater i mi yn unig yw hwn, ond mae'n fater hefyd i'm cyd-Weinidog, Andrew Davies, sy'n gyfrifol am bolisi ynni. Am bolisi cynllunio yr wyf fi'n gyfrifol yn hyn o beth.

Mae'n anodd rhoi barn am yr hyn a allai gael ei gynnig yn y dyfodol o ran ynni niwclear heb wybod beth allai'r cynigion hynny fod. Ond yr wyf yn siŵr y caiff y mater ei drafod yn helaeth yn y Cynulliad os daw cynigion pendant i law yn y dyfodol.

John Griffiths: A fyddech yn cytuno bod y diwydiant niwclear wedi methu â rhoi unrhyw atebion argyhoeddiadol i'r cwestiynau niferus y mae materion megis gwastraff niwclear yn eu codi, ac mai un o nodweddion y diwydiant niwclear yw ei fethiant i fod yn dryloyw ac yn agored, ac weithiau'n darparu gwybodaeth sy'n gamarweiniol llwyr?

Carwyn Jones: Bu'n debyg fod mwy o ddadlau am ynni niwclear nag unrhyw fath arall o ynni dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Mae iddo anfanteision sylweddol, ac un ohonynt yw cael hyd i rywle i roi'r gwastraff niwclear, a'r ffaith mai gorsafoedd ynni niwclear ymholli yw'r unig ffordd sydd ar gael i gynhyrchu ynni niwclear. Caiff hynny ei ystyried, os bydd unrhyw newid i'r cyfeiriad hwn yn y dyfodol.

Glyn Davies: Ar hyn o bryd daw tua 25 y cant o ynni o orsafoedd ynni niwclear, a fydd yn cael eu cau dros yr 20 mlynedd nesaf. Pa gynlluniau sydd gennych i sicrhau nad oes gofyniad diamod am ragor o osafaoedd ynni

more nuclear power stations, by coming up with an alternative form of energy to replace the 25 per cent, in addition to what is projected to be an increased demand for energy?

Carwyn Jones: Again, this is a matter for my colleague Andrew Davies as the Minister responsible for energy. We have made a commitment to renewable energy, and we have targets to be met by 2010. From my discussions with the Minister, I am aware that many other possibilities are being looked at, such as wave and tidal power, which are not viable at the moment but which could be viable over the next decade. They have the capacity to generate, in some instances, as much electricity as a nuclear power station.

niwclear, drwy gynnig math gwahanol o ynni i gymryd lle y 25 y cant hynny, ar ben galw cynyddol a ragwelir am ynni?

Carwyn Jones: Unwaith eto, mater i'm cyd-Weinidog, Andrew Davies fel y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am ynni yw hwn. Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i ynni adnewyddadwy, ac mae gennym dargedau i'w cyrraedd erbyn 2010. O'm trafodaethau gyda'r Gweinidog, gwn fod nifer o bosibiliadau eraill yn cael eu hystyried, megis ynni tonnau ac ynni llanw, nad ydynt yn ymarferol ar hyn o bryd ond a allai fod yn ymarferol dros y degawd nesaf. Maent yn gallu cynhyrchu cymaint o drydan â gorsaf ynni niwclear, mewn rhai achosion.

Arfordir Sir y Fflint Flintshire Coastline

Q3 Carl Sargeant: What actions is the Minister taking to protect coastlines in Flintshire? OAQ0208(EPC)

C3 Carl Sargeant: Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i ddiogelu'r arfordiroedd yn sir y Fflint? OAQ0208(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Powers to protect the coastline lie with Flintshire County Council and the Environment Agency. The Welsh Assembly Government provides funding for coastal defence schemes and investigations. We have issued guidance and have encouraged local authorities to prepare shoreline management plans to achieve sustainable coastal defence management.

Carwyn Jones: Cyngor Sir y Fflint ac Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd sydd â'r pwerau i ddiogelu'r arfordir. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn rhoi arian ar gyfer cynlluniau amddiffyn yr arfordir ac ymchwiliadau. Yr ydym wedi cyhoeddi canllawiau ac wedi annog awdurdodau lleol i baratoi cynlluniau rheoli traethlin, er mwyn sicrhau rheoli'r gwaith o amddiffyn yr arfordir yn gynaliadwy.

Carl Sargeant: I am sure that it is not just Flintshire which you are protecting in the north Wales economy, and perhaps you could elaborate on that in your response. Companies such as BHP Billiton, Warwick International, Corus Colors and Airbus are major factories in north-east Wales that work very hard in partnership on the environment. Examples include the project taken on by BHP Billiton on Talacre beach dunes, where sand is being replaced after dredging. Can you enlighten me on the progress of dredging the river Dee, in which my colleagues at Airbus are particularly interested?

Carl Sargeant: Yr wyf yn siŵr nad sir y Fflint yn unig yr ydych yn ei hamddiffyn yn economi'r Gogledd, ac efallai y gallech ymhelaethu ar hynny yn eich ymateb. Mae cwmnïau fel BHP Billiton, Warwick International, Corus, Colors ac Airbus yn ffatrioedd pwysig yn y Gogledd-ddwyrain sy'n gweithio'n galed iawn mewn partneriaeth ar yr amgylchedd. Ymhlith yr enghreifftiau mae'r prosiect y mae BHP Billiton wedi ymgymryd ag ef ar dwyni traeth Talacre, lle mae tywod yn cael ei roi'n ôl ar ôl gwaith carthu. A allwch ddweud wrthyf am y cynnydd yn carthuo afon Dyfrdwy, rhywbeth y mae gan staff Airbus ddiddordeb arbennig ynddo?

Carwyn Jones: I understand that a decision

Carwyn Jones: Deallaf y caiff penderfyniad

on the Food and Environment Protection Act applications, and others, will be made shortly. We appreciate the importance of Airbus to the local economy of Flintshire and beyond, but we must be scrupulous in our considerations to ensure the environmental integrity of the estuary. You will be aware that a number of organisations are involved, and a decision will hopefully be made as soon as possible.

Janet Ryder: What assessment has been made should the dredging go ahead in the Dee estuary? What assessment has been made of the impact on the north Wales coast and the north-west coast of England?

Carwyn Jones: The organisations involved include regulators, the Assembly, the Department for Transport, as it was, and the Environment Agency. We will take the expertise offered by the organisations involved, and a study will be made of the area to assess the implications of dredging. It is a matter for those with expertise in the area to judge the situation and to provide advice to the Government so that the matter can be taken forward.

Mark Isherwood: In reference to the dredging, are you referring to a decision that will be taken after all the alternative solutions have been considered, or are you referring to a decision based on overriding public interest? What discussions have you had to ensure that the function of the sand dunes system at Talacre, as a natural sea defence barrier, is not impaired?

Carwyn Jones: We have provided £10,000 to Flintshire County Council to study the Talacre dunes. As I mentioned earlier, a number of organisations are involved in providing advice to the Government, and a decision is expected shortly.

Eleanor Burnham: We are aware of the need for sensitivity and balanced vigilance along the coastline in Flintshire, and elsewhere in Wales. What discussions have you had with your Westminster colleague regarding the introduction of a marine Bill? Will you make a statement on the effect of coastal protection and the continued work on

ar gymhwyso'r Ddeddf Diogelu Bwyd a'r Amgylchedd, ac eraill, ei wneud cyn hir. Yr ydym yn sylweddoli mor bwysig yw Airbus i economi leol sir y Fflint a thu hwnt. Ond rhaid inni ystyried yn ofalus er mwyn sicrhau cyfanrwydd amgylcheddol y foryd. Fe wyddoch fod nifer o sefydliadau'n ymwneud â hyn, a gobeithio y caiff penderfyniad ei wneud mor fuan â phosibl.

Janet Ryder: Pa asesiad a wnaed os penderfynir mynd ati i garthu moryd Afon Dyfrdwy? Pa asesiad a wnaed o'r effaith ar arfordir gogledd Cymru ac arfordir gogledd-orllewin Lloegr?

Carwyn Jones: Mae'r sefydliadau'n cynnwys cyrff rheoleiddio, y Cynulliad, yr Adran dros Drafnidiaeth gynt, ac Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd. Byddwn yn cymryd yr arbenigedd a gynigir gan y sefydliadau dan sylw, a chaiff astudiaeth ei gwneud o'r ardal i asesu goblygiadau carthu. Mater i'r rhai sydd ag arbenigedd yn y maes yw barnu'r sefyllfa a rhoi cyngor i'r Llywodraeth fel y gellir bwrw ymlaen â'r mater.

Mark Isherwood: Mewn cysylltiad â'r gwaith carthu, ai cyfeirio yr ydych at benderfyniad a gaiff ei wneud ar ôl ystyried yr holl wahanol atebion, neu ai cyfeirio yr ydych at benderfyniad a fydd yn seiliedig ar fudd y cyhoedd sy'n bwysicach na dim byd arall? Pa drafodaethau a gawsoch i sicrhau nad amherir ar weithrediad y system twyni tywod yn Nhalacre, fel amddiffynfa naturiol rhag y môr?

Carwyn Jones: Yr ydym wedi darparu £10,000 i Gyngor Sir y Fflint i astudio twyni Talacre. Fel y soniais yn gynharach, mae nifer o sefydliadau yn rhan o'r broses hon o roi cyngor i'r Llywodraeth, a disgwylir cael penderfyniad cyn hir.

Eleanor Burnham: Gwyddom fod angen sensitifrwydd a gwyliadwriaeth gytbwys ar hyd arfordir sir y Fflint, ac mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru. Pa drafodaethau a gawsoch gyda'ch cyd-Weinidog yn San Steffan ar cyflwyno Mesur morol? A wnewch ddatganiad am effaith amddiffyn yr arfordir a'r gwaith sy'n mynd rhagddo ar gynllun

the Dee coastal path scheme in Flintshire?

llwybr arfordir Afon Dyfrdwy yn sir y Fflint?

Carwyn Jones: There have been preliminary discussions regarding a marine Bill, but no more than that. There is nothing yet in the marine Bill beyond the idea itself.

Carwyn Jones: Cafwyd trafodaethau cychwynnol am Fesur morol, ond dim mwy na hynny. Nid oes dim byd eto yn y Mesur morol heblaw'r syniad ei hun.

On your second question, I will have to write to you with the detail.

O ran eich ail gwestiwn, bydd yn rhaid imi ysgrifennu atoch gyda'r manylion.

Canllawiau Polisi Cynllunio Planning Policy Guidance

Q4 Christine Chapman: Will the Minister make a statement on planning policy guidance in relation to retailing and town centres? OAQ0250(EPC)

C4 Christine Chapman: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ganllawiau polisi cynllunio gyda golwg ar fanwerthu a chanol trefi? OAQ0250(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: 'Planning Policy Wales' and 'Technical Advice Note 4, Retailing and Town Centres', set out the Assembly Government's retail policies, including a sequential approach to development outside town centres. A ministerial interim planning policy statement clarifying aspects of the policy has been consulted on, and is due to be issued in June.

Carwyn Jones: Mae 'Polisi Cynllunio Cymru' a Nodyn Cyngor Technegol 4, Manwerthu a Chanol Trefi', yn nodi polisiâu manwerthu Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, gan gynnwys ymagwedd ddilyniannol tuag at ddatblygiadau y tu allan i ganol trefi. Cynhaliwyd ymgynghoriad ar ddatganiad polisi cynllunio interim gweinidogol sy'n egluro agweddau ar y polisi, a bwriedir ei gyhoeddi ym mis Mehefin.

Christine Chapman: In a reply to a recent Assembly question from me, you said that you did not wish to see a scenario where the vast majority of retail activity leaves town centres and takes place on the outskirts, the so-called doughnutting effect. I was pleased to hear you say this, as thriving town centres are central to strong, healthy communities. Do you agree that there are many people, particularly pensioners, who still wish to do their shopping on a daily basis, and that local amenities such as general stores and independent shops provide the personal, friendly customer care that these people appreciate?

Christine Chapman: I ymateb i gwestiwn a ofynnwyd gennyf yn ddiweddar yn y Cynulliad, dywedasoch nad oeddech am weld sefyllfa lle mae'r mwyafrif llethol o fanwerthwyr yn gadael canol trefi ac yn symud i gyrion trefi, effaith toesen fel y'i gelwir. Yr oeddwn yn falch o'ch clywed yn dweud hyn, gan fod canol trefi ffyniannus yn ganolog i gymunedau cryf ac iach. A gytunwch fod nifer o bobl o hyd, yn arbennig pensïynwyr, am wneud eu siopa bob dydd, a bod amwynderau lleol megis siopau popeth a siopau annibynnol yn rhoi'r gofal cwsmeriaid cyfeillgar a phersonol y mae'r bobl hyn yn ei werthfawrogi?

Carwyn Jones: I think that there is room for both types of retailing, out-of-town and in-town shopping centres. However, we have to ensure, because town centres are more vulnerable than out-of-town shopping centres, that town centres are viable. The policy that we have aims to protect town centres while allowing appropriate development outside to ensure a competitive retail sector. It is not the case that we want to

Carwyn Jones: Credaf fod lle i'r ddau fath o fanwerthu, ar gyrion trefi ac mewn canolfannau siopa yng nghanol trefi. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni sicrhau bod canol trefi yn hyfyw, gan eu bod mewn sefyllfa fwy bregus na chanolfannau siopa ar gyrion trefi. Mae ein polisi yn anelu at amddiffyn canol trefi gan ganiatáu datblygiadau addas y tu allan iddynt er mwyn sicrhau sector manwerthu cystadleuol. Nid yw'n wir dweud ein bod am

see all shopping done out of town with shopping centres ending up with nothing in them, as we have seen in some parts of the United States. It is important to have a healthy balance as there are many people who want to shop in town centres, and it is important that towns have centres.

Nick Bourne: I appreciate, Minister, that you cannot comment on individual applications—there is currently an application for a large supermarket on the outskirts of Llandrindod Wells—but do you agree that it is desirable for large supermarkets, if possible, to be close to the town centre rather than out of town on a large retail park, because it brings people into the town centre who may shop elsewhere at the same time?

Carwyn Jones: Without referring to particular planning applications, it stands to reason that where large shops are located in town centres, more of the people who shop in those particular supermarkets will go into town centres than is the case if those supermarkets are located some distance from town centres.

Lisa Francis: You may be aware, Minister, that in many situations where enhancement of a town takes place, local authorities are making roads narrower, building kerb build-outs and so on, which affects retailers. In the past, consultants have not properly consulted with retailers on matters like delivery audits and simple things like refuse collections and routes for emergency vehicles. You mentioned a TAN earlier, but what is your Government specifically doing to ensure that local authorities that employ such consultants make sure that the message gets across that they should properly consult with retailers on issues such as these?

Carwyn Jones: It is a matter for local authorities to ensure that that happens. If there is a lack of consultation, then there are steps that can be taken in the courts. The Welsh Assembly Government seeks to provide general planning guidance for the whole of Wales. It would not be appropriate for us to provide guidance on a micro scale where local authorities have a better

weld yr holl siopau ar gyrion trefi a chanolfannau siopa yn mynd yn wag yn y diwedd, fel sydd wedi digwydd mewn rhai rhannau o'r Unol Daleithiau. Mae'n bwysig cael cydbwysedd iach gan fod nifer o bobl yn dymuno siopa yng nghanol trefi, ac mae'n bwysig bod canol gan drefi.

Nick Bourne: Deallaf, Weinidog, na allwch roi sylwadau ar geisiadau unigol—gwneir cais ar hyn o bryd am gael archfarchnad fawr ar gyrion Llandrindod—ond a gytunwch ei bod yn ddymunol i archfarchnadoedd mawr, os yw'n bosibl, fod yn agos i ganol trefi yn hytrach nag ar eu cyrion mewn parc manwerthu mawr, oherwydd mae'n dod â phobl i mewn i ganol y dref a all siopa mewn siopau eraill ar yr un pryd?

Carwyn Jones: Heb gyfeirio at geisiadau cynllunio penodol, mae synnwyr yn dweud, lle mae siopau mawr yng nghanol tref, y bydd mwy o bobl sy'n siopa yn yr archfarchnadoedd hynny yn mynd i mewn i ganol y dref nag sy'n digwydd os yw'r archfarchnadoedd hynny ymhell o ganol y trefi.

Lisa Francis: Fe wyddoch, Weinidog, mewn nifer o sefyllfaoedd lle bydd tref yn cael ei gwella, fod awdurdodau lleol yn gwneud ffyrdd yn gulach, yn adeiladu estyniadau at ymyl palmentydd, ac ati, sy'n effeithio ar fanwerthwyr. Yn y gorffennol, nid yw ymgynghorwyr wedi ymgynghori'n iawn â manwerthwyr ar faterion fel archwiliadau dosbarthu, a phethau syml fel casglu sbwriel a llwybrau ar gyfer cerbydau brys. Yr oeddech yn cyfeirio at TAN yn gynharach, ond beth mae eich Llywodraeth yn ei wneud yn benodol i sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol sy'n cyflogi ymgynghorwyr o'r fath yn gwneud yn siŵr eu bod yn clywed yn glir y neges y dylent ymgynghori'n iawn â manwerthwyr ar faterion fel y rhain?

Carwyn Jones: Mater i awdurdodau lleol yw sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd. Os bydd diffyg ymgynghori, yna gellir cymryd camau yn y llysoedd. Nod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yw darparu canllawiau cynllunio cyffredinol ar gyfer Gymru gyfan. Ni fyddai'n briodol inni ddarparu canllawiau ar raddfa fach iawn lle mae gan awdurdodau lleol well gwybodaeth na ni.

knowledge than us.

Taliadau'r Cynllun Amaeth-Amgylcheddol Agri-Environmental Scheme Payments

Q5 Helen Mary Jones: Will the Minister make a statement on changes to agri-environment scheme payments? OAQ0200(EPC)

C5 Helen Mary Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar newidiadau yn nhaliadau'r cynllun amaeth-amgylchedd? OAQ0200(EPC)

Q11 Glyn Davies: Will the Minister make a statement on recently announced changes to payments under agri-environment schemes? OAQ0219(EPC)

C11 Glyn Davies: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar newidiadau a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar mewn taliadau dan gynlluniau amaeth-amgylchedd? OAQ0219(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Payment rates are under review to comply with EU regulations to remove compensation for loss of subsidies. They will not be introduced until the industry has examined the detailed calculations. The Tir Gofal review has been published and is available on the National Assembly's website.

Carwyn Jones: Mae'r taliadau'n cael eu hadolygu i gydymffurfio â rheoliadau'r UE, fel na thelir iawndal am golli cymorthdaliadau. Ni fyddant yn cael eu cyflwyno nes bydd y diwydiant wedi archwilio'r cyfrifon manwl. Cyhoeddwyd adolygiad o Tir Gofal, ac mae ar gael ar wefan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

Helen Mary Jones: Can you confirm, in the context of what you have just told us, when exactly the proposed changes will have to be sent to Europe for approval? Can you detail for us the opportunities that will exist for the agricultural industry and other interested parties to contribute to the consultation on the proposed changes before they are submitted?

Helen Mary Jones: A allwch gadarnhau, yng nghyd-destun yr hyn yr ydych newydd ei ddweud wrthym, pryd yn union y bydd yn rhaid anfon y newidiadau arfaethedig i Ewrop i'w cymeradwyo? A allwch roi manylion inni am y cyfleoedd a fydd ar gael i'r diwydiant amaethyddol a phobl eraill i gyfrannu at yr ymgynghori am y newidiadau arfaethedig cyn y cânt eu cyflwyno?

3.00 p.m.

Carwyn Jones: The proposed changes are with the farming unions now. I have no doubt that the changes will go through committee as well, so there will be ample opportunity to offer views on them. The notifying of the European Commission of the changes will need to be done as soon as possible, but we know that we can offer both the committee and the farming unions a chance to respond before we take a final decision.

Carwyn Jones: Mae'r newidiadau arfaethedig gyda'r undebau ffermio yn awr. Nid oes amheuaeth gennyf na chyflwynir y newidiadau i'r pwyllgor hefyd, felly bydd digon o gyfle i roi barn amdanynt. Bydd yn ofynnol rhoi gwybod i'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd am y newidiadau cyn gynted â phosibl, ond gwyddom y gallwn roi cyfle i'r pwyllgor ac i'r undebau ffermio ymateb cyn inni wneud penderfyniad terfynol.

Glyn Davies: Over the last few years, Minister, your Government has entered into agreements with farming businesses to pay them a certain sum of money for the delivery of environmental goods. You intend—I do not know whether you have made up your mind on this or not, perhaps you might tell us—to renege on those agreements

Glyn Davies: Dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf, Weinidog, mae eich Llywodraeth wedi llunio cytundebau gyda busnesau ffermio i dalu swm penodol o arian am ddarparu nwyddau amgylcheddol. Yr ydych yn bwriadu—ni wn a ydych wedi penderfynu ar hyn ai peidio, efallai y dywedwch wrthym—torri'r cytundebau hynny yn

unilaterally, despite the fact that they were for 10 years, with a break clause after five. Do you think that cutting back that sum of money, sometimes by up to a third, is a reasonable way for a Government to behave?

Carwyn Jones: When the payments or subsidy system changes, as the single farm payment has—and that certainly could not have been anticipated five years ago—then arrangements must be made to change the payment system, so that people are not paid twice to do exactly the same thing. There is no way that that would survive the audit process, and it is right that it is changed. It is impossible to predict how individual farmers will be affected by this, but it is anticipated that the amount of money that is paid to the farming industry will remain broadly the same.

Kirsty Williams: Minister, you have just stated that these changes to the environmental payment schemes are to ensure that farmers are not paid twice. How, therefore, do you justify the changes to the Tir Gofal payments to one of my constituents, who will not be in receipt of the single farm payment? How can someone be paid twice when they are not going to be in receipt of the first payment? What do you say to constituents in those situations?

Carwyn Jones: I cannot possibly comment without further details, but I would be pleased to comment if you provide me with those details.

ochrog, er y bwriadwyd iddynt bara 10 mlynedd, gyda chymal torri ar ôl pum mlynedd. A gredwch fod cwtogi ar y swm hwnnw o arian, weithiau hyd at draean, yn ffordd resymol i Lywodraeth ymddwyn?

Carwyn Jones: Pan newidia'r system daliadau neu gymorthdaliadau, fel y gwnaeth y taliad sengl—ac yn sicr ni ellid bod wedi rhag-weld hynny bum mlynedd yn ôl—yna rhaid gwneud trefniadau i newid y system dalu, fel na fydd pobl yn cael eu talu ddwywaith am wneud yr un peth. Nid oes unrhyw ffordd i hynny fynd drwy'r broses archwilio, ac mae'n iawn ei fod wedi ei newid. Mae'n amhosibl rhag-weld sut y bydd hyn yn effeithio ar ffermwyr unigol, ond disgwylir y bydd swm yr arian a delir i'r diwydiant ffermio yn parhau fwy neu lai yr un fath.

Kirsty Williams: Weinidog, yr ydych newydd ddatgan mai bwriad y newidiadau hyn yn y cynlluniau talu amgylcheddol yw sicrhau na thelir ffermwyr ddwywaith. Sut, felly, yr ydych yn cyfiawnhau'r newidiadau yn y taliadau Tir Gofal i un o'm hetholwyr, na fydd yn cael y taliad sengl? Sut y gellir talu rhywun ddwywaith pan na fydd yn cael y taliad cyntaf? Beth a ddywedwch wrth etholwyr yn y sefyllfaoedd hynny?

Carwyn Jones: Nid yw'n bosibl imi wneud sylwadau heb fanylion pellach, ond byddai'n bleser gennyf roi sylwadau os rhowch y manylion hynny imi.

Adeiladu Tai mewn Cymunedau Lleol The Building of Properties in Local Communities

Q6 Glyn Davies: What policies does the Minister have to change the planning system so that young people have greater opportunity to build properties in their local communities? OAQ0218(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Guidance on planning and housing is set out in technical advice notes 1 and 2, which are currently being reviewed and are due to be issued for public consultation early in the summer, when these points can be made.

Glyn Davies: You have already said that you

C6 Glyn Davies: Pa bolisiau sydd gan y Gweinidog i newid y system gynllunio fel y bydd gan bobl ifanc fwy o gyfle i adeiladu tai yn eu cymunedau lleol? OAQ0218(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Mae canllawiau ar gynllunio a thai i'w cael yn nodiadau cyngor technegol 1 a 2, sy'n cael eu hadolygu ar hyn o bryd. Bwriedir eu cyhoeddi ar gyfer ymgynghori cyhoeddus ddechrau'r haf a gellir gwneud y pwyntiau hyn bryd hynny.

Glyn Davies: Yr ydych wedi dweud eisoes

intend to allow building for local people on land owned by the Government, on Forestry Commission land. I applaud that decision, but if that goes ahead, will you extend the principle to private-sector landowners, who can meet the need perfectly easily, in same way that the Government can?

Carwyn Jones: Provided that we can find a mechanism to ensure that those houses are not sold on immediately or in the short term on the open market, I am not only willing to consider that, but am actively considering it.

Alun Ffred Jones: Pa gamau yr ydych a'ch adran wedi eu cymryd i hyrwyddo datblygiad ymddiriedolaethau tir cymunedol?

Carwyn Jones: Yr ydym yn edrych ar y mater hwn. Mae'n gorwedd ym mhortffolio Edwina Hart yn fwy na'm portffolio innau. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn edrych arno o ran tir y Comisiwn Coedwigaeth a thir a fydd efallai yn cael ei ddefnyddio i adeiladu arno. Os yr ydym yn adeiladu ar y tir hyn, bydd yn rhaid dod o hyd i ryw fath o strwythur a fydd yn sicrhau bod y tai yn cael eu cadw oddi ar y farchnad agored. Byddai ymddiriedolaeth yn un opsiwn i'w ystyried ac yna i weithredu arno, ac efallai yn enghraifft i'w ddangos i eraill yn y dyfodol.

eich bod yn bwriadu caniatáu adeiladu ar gyfer pobl leol ar dir sy'n eiddo i'r Llywodraeth, ar dir y Comisiwn Coedwigaeth. Cymeradwyaf y penderfyniad hwnnw, ond os bydd hyn yn digwydd, a fyddwch yn ymestyn yr egwyddor i gynnwys tîrfeiddianwyr y sector preifat, a all ddiwallu'r angen yn hawdd, yn yr un modd ag y gall y Llywodraeth?

Carwyn Jones: Ar yr amod y gallwn ddod o hyd i dull i sicrhau na chaiff y tai hynny eu gwerthu ymlaen ar unwaith neu yn y byr dymor ar y farchnad agored, yr wyf nid yn unig yn fodlon ystyried hynny, ond yr wyf yn ei ystyried.

Alun Ffred Jones: What steps have you and your department taken to promote the development of community land trusts?

Carwyn Jones: We are looking at this. It lies in Edwina Hart's portfolio more than it does in mine. However, we are looking at this in terms of Forestry Commission land, and land that might be used for building. If we do build on this land, we will have to find some mechanism to ensure that the houses are kept off the open market. A trust would be one option to consider and then to act upon, and perhaps to be an example to show to others in the future.

Effaith Amgylcheddol Ceir Gadawedig The Environmental Impact of Abandoned Cars

Q7 Michael German: Will the Minister make a statement on the environmental impact of abandoned cars in Wales? OAQ0238(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Abandoned vehicles are a potential pollution and safety hazard. Following consultation this summer, I will introduce measures to reduce the notification periods for the police and local authorities to remove these vehicles.

Michael German: Thank you for that answer, Minister. As you know, Merthyr Tydfil is the 'dumped car capital of Wales', though the situation has eased slightly, because the Chinese are now prepared to pay

C7 Michael German: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar effaith amgylcheddol ceir gadawedig yng Nghymru? OAQ0238(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Mae ceir sy'n cael eu gadael yn achosi peryglon posibl o ran llygredd a diogelwch. Ar ôl ymgynghori yn ystod yr haf, byddaf yn cyflwyno mesurau i leihau'r cyfnodau hysbysu i'r heddlu a'r awdurdodau lleol allu symud y cerbydau hyn.

Micahel German: Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Fel y gwyddoch, Merthyr Tudful yw canolfan Cymru o ran ceir sy'n cael eu gadael, er bod y sefyllfa wedi gwella ychydig, gan fod y Tsieineaid bellach yn

£40 for any car that can be exported there for scrap metal. However, it means that local authorities are hamstrung, because the cars remain on the street for seven days with a poster on the front asking the owner to remove the car. In reducing the figures, do you think that you may be able to reduce that timeframe to, say, two days, which would mean that the local authority can take swift action and reduce the number of dumped and immobile cars left around the streets?

Carwyn Jones: That can be considered when the matter is brought forward for consultation. Inevitably, with these matters, a figure is looked at, but that figure can be subject to change. Where there is evidence that a shorter notice period would be more appropriate, that could be considered.

fodlon talu £40 am unrhyw gar y gellir ei allforio yno ar gyfer metel sgrap. Fodd bynnag, golyga hynny y caiff awdurdodau lleol eu rhwystro, gan fod y ceir yn dal ar y stryd am saith diwrnod gyda phoster ar y blaen yn gofyn i'r perchennog symud y car. Wrth leihau'r ffigurau, a gredwch y gallech leihau'r amser hwnnw, er enghraifft, i ddau ddiwrnod, a fyddai'n golygu y gallai'r awdurdod lleol weithredu'n gyflym a lleihau nifer y ceir sy'n cael eu gadael ar ein strydoedd ac na ellir eu symud?

Carwyn Jones: Gellir ystyried hynny pan gyflwynir y mater ar gyfer ymgynghori. Mae'n anochel, gyda'r materion hyn, pan edrychir ar ffigur y gall hwnnw newid. Pan fydd tystiolaeth y byddai cyfnod hysbysu byrrach yn fwy priodol, gellid ystyried hynny.

Cynhesu Byd-eang Global Warming

Q8 Peter Black: Will the Minister make a statement on how global warming will affect Wales? OAQ0215(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: If left unchecked, global warming will have serious consequences for Wales. We remain fully committed to playing our part in reducing its threat by moving to a low-carbon economy. Climate change will, for example, play a prominent part in our environment strategy, upon which we will consult during the summer.

Peter Black: Do you share my concern at how the Environment Agency is interpreting TAN 15 in relation to flooding? That is causing a major problem in parts of Swansea, particularly Swansea Vale, where the agency estimates that there will be a flood of biblical proportions, which would prevent any further development going ahead in that important economic area. What can you do to try to mitigate this and enable the council to continue to promote the development of this area?

C8 Peter Black: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y modd y bydd cynhesu byd-eang yn effeithio ar Gymru? OAQ0215(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Os gadewir pethau fel y maent, bydd cynhesu byd-eang yn dod â chanlyniadau difrifol i Gymru. Yr ydym yn dal wedi ymrwymo'n llwyr i wneud ein rhan i leihau'r bygythiad hwnnw drwy symud tuag at economi sy'n isel o ran carbon. Bydd newid yn yr hinsawdd, er enghraifft, yn rhan amlwg yn ein strategaeth amgylcheddol, a byddwn yn ymgynghori ar honno yn ystod yr haf.

Peter Black: A ydych chi fel finnow yn pryderu am y ffordd y mae Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn dehongli TAN 15 mewn cysylltiad â llifogydd? Mae hynny'n achosi problem anferth mewn rhannau o Abertawe, yn arbennig yn natblygiad Swansea Vale, lle mae'r asiantaeth yn amcangyfrif y bydd llifogydd tebyg i'r Dilyw yn rhwystro unrhyw ddatblygiadau pellach yn yr ardal economaidd bwysig honno. Beth y gallwch ei wneud i geisio lleddfu hyn a galluogi'r cyngor i barhau i hybu datblygiad yr ardal honno?

Carwyn Jones: TAN 15 does not seek to prevent development. TAN 15 asks that local authorities conduct assessments of planning applications within the floodplain, and then make a judgment on certain criteria to see whether an application should go ahead or not. What is important is that local authorities conduct that assessment in the first place, that the assessment is robust and that it can inform them properly when they take their decision.

Christine Chapman: Minister, you may be aware that recent research has predicted that the annual mean temperature of the sea bordering Wales will rise above its current level of 1 degree C to 3.5 degrees C in the south, and 2.5 degrees C in northern parts. The research, carried out by the University of East Anglia, also reveals that, over the past 25 years, nearly two thirds of North Sea species, including commercially important fish such as cod and haddock, have shifted, either further south, or to colder depths. This trend is expected to continue, and points to an entire population of fish becoming less viable in response to global warming. What considerations have been given in Wales to the effects on the fishing industry of global warming?

Carwyn Jones: Our fishing industry is made up mainly of shellfish boats. We have relatively few deep-sea fishing trawlers. There will be an effect on them, particularly when it comes to cod. There is no question that the numbers of cod have decreased, as has the size of the cod being caught, and that cod are moving further north, some into Icelandic waters and others, strangely enough, underneath the North Sea oil rigs, which are, apparently, almost like nature reserves because fishing is banned within 50m of the rigs. Therefore, it is right to say that many of the white fish species that we have traditionally relied on in the UK for our fish stocks will become more scarce as time goes on. As far as Wales is concerned, most of our fishing vessels will fish for lobster, crabs and whelks—mainly shellfish—and it is not anticipated that there will be an effect on those species.

Carwyn Jones: Nid yw TAN 15 yn ceisio rhwystro datblygiadau. Bwriad TAN 15 yw gofyn i awdurdodau lleol wneud asesiadau o geisiadau cynllunio o fewn y gorlifdir, a barnu wedyn ar sail meini prawf penodol a ddylai'r cais fynd yn ei flaen neu beidio. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw bod awdurdodau lleol yn gwneud yr asesiad hwnnw yn y lle cyntaf, bod yr asesiad yn gadarn ac y gall roi gwybodaeth briodol pan fyddant yn gwneud eu penderfyniad.

Christine Chapman: Weinidog, efallai eich bod yn ymwybodol bod ymchwil yn ddiweddar wedi rhag-weld y bydd tymheredd cymedrig blynyddol y môr o amgylch Cymru yn codi 1 radd C yn uwch na'i lefel bresennol i 3.5 gradd C yn y de a 2.5 gradd C yn y gogledd. Mae'r ymchwil, a wnaed gan Brifysgol East Anglia, hefyd yn dangos bod bron i ddwy ran o dair o rywogaethau Môr y Gogledd, gan gynnwys pysgod sy'n bwysig yn fasnachol, fel y penfras a'r corbenfras, wedi symud dros y 25 mlynedd diwethaf, naill ai ymhellach i'r de neu i ddyfnderoedd oerach. Disgwylir i'r tueddiad hwn barhau, ac mae'n awgrymu y gall y boblogaeth gyfan o bysgod fynd yn llai hyfyw o ganlyniad i gynhesu byd-eang. Pa ystyriaethau a roddwyd yng Nghymru i effeithiau cynhesu byd-eang ar y diwydiant pysgota?

Carwyn Jones: Cychod pysgod cregyn yw'r rhan fwyaf o'n diwydiant pysgota. Nifer gymharol fach o longau pysgota môr-dwfn sydd gennym. Bydd effaith arnynt hwy, yn arbennig mewn cysylltiad â'r penfras. Nid oes unrhyw amheuaeth nad yw nifer y penfras wedi gostwng, a hefyd maint y penfras sy'n cael eu dal, bod y penfras yn symud ymhellach i'r gogledd, rhai i foroedd Gwlad yr Iâ ac eraill, yn rhyfedd iawn, o dan lwyfannau olew Môr y Gogledd. Mae'n debyg fod y rhain bron fel gwarchodfeydd natur am fod pysgota wedi ei wahardd o fewn 50m i'r llwyfannau. Felly, mae'n gywir dweud y bydd nifer o'r rhywogaethau pysgod gwynion yr ydym ni yn y DU wedi dibynnu arnynt yn draddodiadol am ein stoc pysgod yn prinhaus gydag amser. O ran Cymru, bydd mwyafrif ein llongau pysgota yn pysgota am gimwch, crancod a gwichiaid moch—pysgod cregyn yn bennaf—ac ni ragwelir y bydd unrhyw effaith ar y rhywogaethau hynny.

Janet Davies: A recent study by Oxford's Environmental Change Institute has shown how it is possible to move to a low-carbon economy through using a balanced mix of ways of producing energy, basically wind and sun, together with major conservation improvements and some lean-burn coal to achieve flexibility. However, the use of wind turbines needs to be distributed consistently throughout the United Kingdom, not just down the west coast and off the coast of East Anglia. Therefore, what discussions are you having with your UK colleagues to achieve such a distribution and, therefore, relieve pressure on planning in Wales?

Janet Davies: Dangosodd astudiaeth yn ddiweddar gan y Sefydliad Newid Amgylcheddol yn Rhydychen sut y mae'n bosibl symud i economi carbon-isel drwy ddefnyddio cymysgedd gytbwys o ddulliau cynhyrchu ynni, sef gwynt a haul yn y bôn, ynghyd â gwelliannau cadwraethol helaeth ac ychydig lo llosg-denau i gael hyblygrwydd. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i ddefnyddio tyrbinau gwynt fod yn gyson ledled y Deyrnas Unedig, nid ar hyd arfordir y gorllewin ac oddi ar arfordir East Anglia yn unig. Felly, pa drafodaethau yr ydych yn eu cael gyda'ch cyd-weinidogion yn y DU i sicrhau dosbarthiad felly, a thrwy hynny ysgafnhau'r pwysau sydd ar gynllunio yng Nghymru?

Carwyn Jones: We have our own targets in Wales, which we want to meet by 2010. Wind turbines have to go where there is wind, and there are certain parts of the UK that are more appropriate than others—this Chamber may on occasion be appropriate, who knows. However, they have to go where the wind is, and that is the approach that the draft TAN 8 has sought to take. Rather than taking an approach of placing wind turbines everywhere, the approach is for turbines to be potentially placed where the wind is and where there is access to the national grid. There is a difficult balance to strike, especially given that these developments are inevitably controversial. However, we in Wales can play our part in meeting our targets and, certainly, others in the UK are following the same route to meet their targets.

Carwyn Jones: Mae gennym ein targedau ein hunain yng Nghymru, ac yr ydym am eu cyrraedd erbyn 2010. Rhaid gosod tyrbinau gwynt lle mae gwynt, ac mae rhai rhannau o'r DU yn fwy addas nag eraill—efallai fod y Siambr hon yn addas ar adegau, pwy a wŷr. Fodd bynnag, rhaid iddynt gael eu codi lle mae'r gwynt, a dyna'r ymagwedd mae'r drafft o TAN 8 wedi ceisio'i chymryd. Yn hytrach na gosod tyrbinau gwynt ym mhobman, bwriedir mynd ati i geisio gosod tyrbinau lle mae'r gwynt a lle mae mynediad i'r grid cenedlaethol. Mae'r cydbwysedd yn anodd, yn arbennig gan fod y datblygiadau hyn yn anochel yn ddadleuol. Fodd bynnag, gallwn ni yng Nghymru wneud ein rhan i gyrraedd ein targedau, ac yn sicr mae eraill yn y DU yn dilyn yr un llwybr i gyrraedd eu targedau hwythau.

3.10 p.m.

Eco-ysgolion Eco-schools

Q9 Jeff Cuthbert: Will the Minister make a statement on eco-schools in Wales? OAQ0223(EPC)

C9 Jeff Cuthbert: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar eco-ysgolion yng Nghymru? OAQ0223(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: On 2 March, I announced annual grant funding of £100,000 for Keep Wales Tidy for the next three years in support of its eco-schools programme. This will increase the number of eco-schools in Wales to 1,500 by 2008.

Carwyn Jones: Ar 2 Mawrth, cyhoeddais gyllid grant blynyddol o £100,000 i Cadwch Gymru'n Daclus dros y tair blynedd nesaf i gefnogi ei rhaglen o eco-ysgolion. Bydd hyn yn dod â nifer yr eco-ysgolion yng Nghymru i 1,500 erbyn 2008.

Jeff Cuthbert: I welcome the additional money for eco-schools in Wales, and the 46 eco-schools in my constituency do a great deal of work to raise awareness of environmental issues among young students in Caerphilly. However, Caerphilly has just under a 50 per cent take-up of eco-school status. What provisions are being made within the eco-schools programme to increase take-up so that even more schools benefit from this worthwhile programme?

Jeff Cuthbert: Croesawaf yr arian ychwanegol i eco-ysgolion yng Nghymru, ac mae'r 46 o eco-ysgolion yn fy etholaeth i yn gwneud llawer o waith i wneud pobl yn fwy ymwybodol o faterion amgylcheddol ymysg myfyrwyr ifanc yng Nghaerffili. Fodd bynnag, ychydig yn llai na 50 y cant o ysgolion Caerffili sy'n ymgeisio am statws eco-ysgol. Pa ddarpariaethau a wneir o fewn y rhaglen eco-ysgolion i gynyddu'r nifer fel y bydd hyd yn oed mwy o ysgolion yn cael budd o'r rhaglen werthfawr hon?

Carwyn Jones: The lead is being taken by Keep Wales Tidy, which has so far been successful in bringing several schools into the scheme, and it is using its core funding to promote eco-schools and therefore to bring more schools into the scheme. It is for Keep Wales Tidy to decide on how it does that, but it has been successful up until to now; its track record speaks for itself.

Carwyn Jones: Cadwch Gymru'n Daclus sy'n arwain, a bu'n llwyddiannus hyd yn hyn yn cyflwyno nifer o ysgolion i'r cynllun. Mae'n defnyddio ei gyllid craidd i hybu eco-ysgolion ac felly i gyflwyno mwy o ysgolion i'r cynllun. Gwaith Cadwch Gymru'n Daclus yw penderfynu sut i wneud hynny, ond bu'n llwyddiannus hyd yma; mae ei record yn dweud y cyfan.

Laura Anne Jones: Are the cost savings that a school might make through compliance with the eco-schools programme retained by the school, and not taken out of its next budget allocation?

Laura Anne Jones: A yw'r arbedion cost y gallai ysgol eu gwneud drwy gydymffurfio â'r rhaglen eco-ysgolion yn cael eu cadw gan yr ysgol, heb gael eu tynnu'n ôl o ddyraniad cyllideb nesaf yr ysgol?

Carwyn Jones: That is a matter for local authorities, although I would be surprised if local authorities were removing money from schools that are become more energy efficient.

Carwyn Jones: Mater i'r awdurdodau lleol yw hynny, er y byddwn yn synnu pe bai awdurdodau lleol yn tynnu arian oddi wrth ysgolion sy'n defnyddio ynni'n fwy effeithlon.

Safonau Pensaernïol Architectural Standards

Q10 David Melding: What planning guidance has the Minister issued to promote architectural standards in Wales? OAQ0194(EPC)

C10 David Melding: Pa ganllawiau cynllunio y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cyhoeddi i hyrwyddo safonau pensaernïol yng Nghymru? OAQ0194(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: 'Technical Advice Note (Wales) 12: Design', provides policy and guidance on achieving good design throughout Wales. We have also established the Design Commission for Wales, which is championing high standards of architecture.

Carwyn Jones: Mae 'Nodyn Cyngor Technegol (Cymru) 12: Dylunio', yn rhoi polisi a chanllawiau ar sicrhau gwaith dylunio da ledled Cymru. Yr ydym hefyd wedi sefydlu Comisiwn Dylunio Cymru, sy'n hybu safonau pensaernïol uchel.

David Melding: Did your officials draw your attention to the *Financial Times* review of the

David Melding: A dynnodd eich swyddogion eich sylw at adolygiad y

Wales Millennium Centre on 26 April? It says that the theatre is a stunner, handsome in aspect, welcoming, vastly attractive in its interiors, with slate and oak and polished steel, and with an auditorium that stresses terracotta and pale wood with faultless sight lines and acoustics, and a stage that shows off dancing excellently. We need more of this.

Financial Times o Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru ar 26 Ebrill? Dywed fod y theatr yn drawiadol, yn hardd yr olwg, yn atyniadol, yn ddeniadol iawn y tu mewn, gyda llechen a derw a haearn gloyw, ac awditoriwm sy'n pwysleisio terracotta a phren golau gyda llinellau golwg ac acwsteg perffaith, a llwyfan sy'n arddangosfa wych ar gyfer dawnsio. Mae angen mwy o hyn arnom.

Carwyn Jones: I entirely agree.

Carwyn Jones: Cytunaf yn llwyr.

**‘Niwed Cudd—Ymateb i anghenion plant defnyddwyr cyffuriau’
‘Hidden Harm—Responding to the needs of children of problem drug users’**

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw David Melding a gwelliant 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

The Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 in the name of David Melding and amendment 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I propose that

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales notes the recommendations from the Advisory Panel on Substance Misuse to the report ‘Hidden Harm—responding to the needs of children of problem drug users’. (NDM2451)

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn nodi argymhellion y Panel Ymgynghori ar Gamddefnyddio Sylweddau ar yr adroddiad ‘Niwed Cudd—ymateb i anghenion plant defnyddwyr cyffuriau’. (NDM2451)

As the Minister with responsibility for children, I am pleased to open the debate on the report on ‘Hidden Harm—Responding to the needs of children of problem drug users’. This debate must start with the needs of children and how we co-ordinate action to protect children effectively. We would all agree that every child is entitled to a safe and secure childhood, where all are protected from all forms of abuse and neglect. In Wales, we place the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child at the heart of our policy making in relation to children’s development. The convention states that children have a right to the highest possible standard of health and a right to engage in leisure and play activities and to enjoy life to the full. We need to be particularly aware of and responsive to the needs of children whose lives are blighted by the complex problems faced by their parents, including where those problems are associated with substance misuse. We need to listen to those children and their experiences and be informed by them, and have them influence our response.

Fel y Gweinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb dros blant, yr wyf yn falch o agor y ddadl ar yr adroddiad ‘Niwed Cudd—ymateb i anghenion plant defnyddwyr cyffuriau’. Rhaid i’r ddadl hon ddechrau gydag anghenion plant a’r ffordd yr ydym yn cydlynu camau i amddiffyn plant yn effeithiol. Byddem oll yn cytuno bod gan bob plentyn yr hawl i blentyndod diogel, lle caiff pob un ei amddiffyn rhag pob math o gamdriniaeth ac esgeulustod. Yng Nghymru, yr ydym yn gosod Confensiwn y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar Hawliau’r Plentyn yn y canol wrth lunio polisiau sy’n gysylltiedig â datblygiad plant. Dywed y confensiwn fod gan blant yr hawl i’r safon iechyd uchaf sy’n bosibl a’r hawl i gymryd rhan mewn gweithgareddau hamdden a chwarae a mwynhau bywyd i’r eithaf. Mae angen inni fod yn arbennig o ymwybodol o anghenion plant lle mae’r problemau cymhleth a wynebir gan eu rhieni yn cael effaith andwyol arnynt, gan gynnwys yr amgylchiadau hynny lle mae’r problemau’n gysylltiedig â chamddefnyddio sylweddau, ac ymateb i’w hanghenion. Mae

I have no doubt that every Assembly Member will wish to take action to enable children to achieve their full potential and to grow up in a safe and secure environment.

On that basis, I support the amendments tabled in the name of David Melding and Kirsty Williams as constructive contributions to this debate. That is why we are bringing this report before you today, to make you aware of our proposals to implement the recommendations endorsed by our advisory panel on substance misuse, which advises the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration, Edwina Hart.

The Minister has taken significant steps to increase investment in treatment services, and to improve the planning and co-ordination of services. The priority given to expanding treatment is the key to reducing drug dependency and its related harm. Reducing the number of people using drugs will reduce the number of children living in families where drug use is a problem. This is the cornerstone of, and one of the six key messages from, the 'Hidden Harm' report, as it recognises that the number of affected children is likely to decrease only when the number of problem drug users decreases.

'Hidden Harm—Responding to the needs of children of problem drug users', is a report of the inquiry by the UK Government's advisory council on the misuse of drugs. The council embarked on the inquiry because there was awareness that, 25 years ago, there were relatively few problem drug users in the UK, but that since then, the numbers have increased dramatically. The increase in drug use has been matched by the growth in the number of children affected by their parents' problem drug use.

The 'Hidden Harm' report contains six key messages. It is estimated that there are between 250,000 and 350,000 children of

angen inni wrando ar y plant hynny a'u profiadau a chael ein llywio ganddynt, a gadael iddynt ddylanwadu ar ein hymateb. Nid oes gennyf unrhyw amheuaeth na fydd pob Aelod o'r Cynulliad am gymryd camau i alluogi plant i gyflawni eu potensial llawn a thyfu mewn amgylchedd diogel.

Ar y sail honno, cefnogaf y gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd yn enwau David Melding a Kirsty Williams fel cyfraniadau adeiladol i'r ddadl hon. Dyna pam yr ydym yn cyflwyno'r adroddiad hwn ger eich bron heddiw, er mwyn eich gwneud yn ymwybodol o'n cynigion i weithredu'r argymhellion a gymeradwywyd gan ein panel cynghori ar gamddefnyddio sylweddau, sy'n cynghori Edwina Hart, y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio.

Mae'r Gweinidog wedi cymryd camau sylweddol i gynyddu'r buddsoddi mewn gwasanaethau triniaeth, ac i wella'r broses o gynllunio a chydgysylltu gwasanaethau. Mae'r flaenoriaeth a roddir i ehangu triniaeth yn allweddol i leihau dibyniaeth ar gyffuriau a'r niwed sy'n gysylltiedig â hynny. Bydd lleihau nifer y bobl sy'n defnyddio cyffuriau yn lleihau nifer y plant sy'n byw mewn teuluoedd lle mae defnyddio cyffuriau'n broblem. Mae hyn yn un o'r chwe phrif neges sy'n deillio o adroddiad 'Niwed Cudd' ac yn gonglfaen i'r adroddiad hwnnw, gan ei fod yn cydnabod bod nifer y plant yr effeithir arnynt yn debygol o ostwng dim ond pan fydd nifer y bobl sydd â phroblem defnyddio cyffuriau yn lleihau.

Adroddiad yr ymchwiliad gan gyngor cynghori Llywodraeth y DU ar gamddefnyddio cyffuriau yw 'Niwed Cudd—Ymateb i anghenion plant defnyddwyr cyffuriau'. Penderfynodd y cyngor gynnal yr ymchwiliad oherwydd yr ymwybyddiaeth fod nifer y bobl a oedd â phroblem gyffuriau 25 mlynedd yn ôl yn gymharol fach, ond bod cynnydd aruthrol yn y niferoedd er hynny. Law yn llaw â'r cynnydd yn y nifer o bobl sy'n defnyddio cyffuriau bu cynnydd yn nifer y plant y mae problem gyffuriau eu rhieni yn effeithio arnynt.

Mae'r adroddiad 'Niwed Cudd' yn cynnwys chwe phrif neges. Amcangyfrifir bod rhwng 250,000 a 350,000 o blant yn y DU i rieni

problem drug users in the UK, which is about one for every problem drug user. That could equate to between 12,500 and 17,500 children in Wales. Parental problem drug use can cause serious harm to children at every age, from conception to adulthood. Reducing the harm to children from parental problem drug use should become a main objective of policy and practice. Effective treatment of the parent can have major benefits for the child. By working together, services can take many practical steps to protect and improve the health and wellbeing of affected children. As I said, the number of affected children is likely to decrease only when the number of problem drug users decreases.

The six key messages highlight the cross-cutting nature of the report and the need for joint work between services, particularly at the point where substance misuse services, and services that provide protection and support to children, meet. In Wales, we have already taken steps to address the messages contained in 'Hidden Harm', following its publication in June 2003. Edwina Hart launched the report for stakeholder consultation and asked the advisory panel on substance misuse to consider the consultation responses and provide recommendations on how we can take forward work on the 'Hidden Harm' report for Wales.

The panel then held a conference and considered the recommendations alongside the consultation responses. After analysis, the advisory panel has agreed a framework for action for implementing work on 'Hidden Harm'. The framework covers five themes, the first of which is family support services. The aim here is to promote the health, safety and well-being of the children of substance misusing parents. The second theme is health, where the aim is to improve health outcomes for substance misusing women, their partners and children. Thirdly, training and awareness raising, where the aim is to ensure that the health and social care workforce, through education, are better equipped to understand and respond to the needs of substance misusers and their children. Fourthly, criminal justice, where the aim is to ensure

sydd â phroblem gyffuriau, sef tuag un am bob person sydd â phroblem gyffuriau. Gallai hynny fod yn gyfystyr â rhwng 12,500 a 17,500 o blant yng Nghymru. Gall problem gyffuriau ymhlith rhieni achosi cryn niwed i blant o bob oed, o'u cenedlu nes iddynt dyfu'n oedolion. Fel prif amcan mewn polisi ac arfer, dylid anelu at leihau'r niwed i blant oherwydd problem gyffuriau eu rhieni. Gall trin y rhiant yn effeithiol fod o fudd mawr i'r plentyn. Drwy gydweithio, gall gwasanaethau gymryd nifer o gamau ymarferol i ddiogelu a gwella iechyd a lles yr effeithir arnynt. Fel y dywedais, dim ond pan fydd nifer y bobl sydd â phroblem gyffuriau yn gostwng y mae nifer y plant yr effeithir arnynt yn debygol o ostwng.

Mae'r chwe phrif neges yn tynnu sylw at natur drawsbynciol yr adroddiad a'r angen i'r gwasanaethau weithio ar y cyd, yn enwedig lle bydd gwasanaethau camddefnyddio sylweddau a gwasanaethau sy'n amddiffyn ac yn cefnogi plant yn dod ynghyd. Yng Nghymru yr ydym eisoes wedi cymryd camau i fynd i'r afael â'r negeseuon sydd yn 'Niwed Cudd' ar ôl ei gyhoeddi ym Mehefin 2003. Lansiodd Edwina Hart yr adroddiad ar gyfer ymgynghori ymhlith rhanddeiliaid, a gofynnwyd i'r panel cynghori ar gamddefnyddio sylweddau ystyried yr ymatebion i'r ymgynghoriad a darparu argymhellion am y modd y gallwn ddatblygu'r gwaith ar adroddiad 'Niwed Cudd' i Gymru.

Yn dilyn hynny, cynhaliodd y panel gynhadledd gan ystyried yr argymhellion ochr yn ochr â'r ymatebion i'r ymgynghori. Ar ôl dadansoddi, mae'r panel cynghori wedi cytuno ar fframwaith ar gyfer gweithredu ar 'Niwed Cudd'. Mae'r fframwaith yn cwmpasu pum thema. Y thema gyntaf yw gwasanaethau cymorth i deuluoedd. Y nod yw hyrwyddo iechyd, diogelwch a lles plant i rieni sy'n camddefnyddio sylweddau. Yr ail thema yw iechyd a'r nod yw gwella canlyniadau iechyd i ferched sy'n camddefnyddio sylweddau, eu partneriaid a'u plant. Yn drydydd, mae hyfforddiant a chynyddu ymwybyddiaeth gyda'r nod o sicrhau bod y gweithlu iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol, drwy addysg, mewn sefyllfa well i ddeall anghenion pobl sy'n camddefnyddio sylweddau a'u plant, ac i

that, where possible, the outcomes for substance misusers subject to the criminal justice system have regard to their parenting role. Finally, data collection, where the aim is to enhance the relevance of policy development and implementation by informing the process with relevant quantitative data.

Foundations have already been laid for collaborative work across Wales. Our community safety partnerships are already aware of 'Hidden Harm', and all make reference to actions in their three-year substance misuse action plans, which we require from them to ensure that each of the 22 partners have produced action plans that refer to 'Hidden Harm'. The quality of these plans and the level of collaboration are very significant, and the process must already be commended.

In addition, we are hoping to build on work already undertaken by colleagues in the National Public Health Service for Wales, who have conducted an audit of joint-working policies and procedures between area child protection committees and substance misuse action teams. That is a real step forward in terms of protecting and safeguarding vulnerable children.

3.20 p.m.

Action on the framework and its themes is now moving forward with cross-Government support, having been considered by the full Cabinet and the Cabinet sub-committee for children and young people, which I chair. The support of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee, the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee, and the Health and Social Services Committee is vital for this purpose. Work on implementation will be taken through groups of appropriate Assembly officials, members of the advisory panel, and key stakeholders in relevant fields. Work will also include looking at cost-related issues and considering the framework proposals. Therefore, support from across the Assembly, as a result of this debate, will be welcomed.

ymateb i'r rheiny. Yn bedwerydd, cyfiawnder troseddol sydd â'r nod o sicrhau, lle mae hynny'n bosibl, fod y system cyfiawnder troseddol yn ystyried rôl camddefnyddwyr sylweddau a ddaw ger ei bron fel rhieni. Yn olaf, casglu data sydd â'r nod o wella perthnasedd gwaith datblygu a gweithredu polisi drwy ychwanegu data maint perthnasol at y broses.

Gosodwyd seiliau eisoes ar gyfer cydweithio ledled Cymru. Mae ein partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol eisoes yn ymwybodol o 'Niwed Cudd', ac maent i gyd yn cyfeirio at gamau gweithredu yn eu cynlluniau gweithredu tair blynedd ar gamddefnyddio sylweddau. Yr ydym wedi'i gwneud yn ofynnol i bob un o'r 22 partner gynhyrchu cynlluniau gweithredu sy'n cyfeirio at 'Niwed Cudd'. Mae ansawdd y cynlluniau hyn a lefel y cydweithredu yn arwyddocaol iawn ac eisoes rhaid cymeradwyo'r broses.

Yn ogystal, yr ydym yn gobeithio datblygu gwaith sydd eisoes wedi'i wneud gan weithwyr yng Ngwasanaeth Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cenedlaethol Cymru. Mae hwn wedi gwneud archwiliad o bolisiau a gweithdrefnau cydweithio rhwng pwyllgorau ardal amddiffyn plant a thimau gweithredu ar gamddefnyddio sylweddau. Mae hyn yn gam gwirioneddol ymlaen o ran amddiffyn a diogelu plant sy'n agored i niwed.

Mae gweithredu ar y fframwaith a'i themâu bellach yn mynd rhagddo gyda chefnogaeth ar draws y Llywodraeth, ar ôl i'r Cabinet llawn ac is-bwyllgor y Cabinet ar blant a phobl ifanc yr wyf yn gadeirydd arno, eu hystyried. Mae cefnogaeth y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes a'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn hanfodol at y diben hwn. Bydd y gwaith ar weithredu'r fframwaith yn mynd drwy grwpiau o swyddogion priodol y Cynulliad, aelodau o'r panel cynghori a'r prif randdeiliaid yn y meysydd perthnasol. Bydd gwaith hefyd yn cynnwys edrych ar faterion yn ymwneud â chost ac ystyried y cynigion ar y fframwaith. Felly, croesewir cefnogaeth gan y Cynulliad cyfan o ganlyniad i'r ddadl hon.

Training and awareness raising is one of the five themes in the framework for action, so a training-needs analysis has also been conducted to give us a clearer picture of the development needs of all those who work in substance misuse and related fields.

Finally, as we are aware of the need to address the impact of substance misuse on all children, and because of my concern regarding the consequences of exposing children to problematic substance misuse by their parents, work is beginning on a framework of substance misuse education, prevention and treatment for children and young people.

We must now concentrate efforts on helping to identify and protect these children, recognising that perhaps the greatest impact is on the children affected, many of whom become young carers themselves, as a result of lack of parenting due to drug misuse. This brings home to us that we should give particular consideration to the burden of care that children may experience when their parents are problem drug users. An 11-year old boy, interviewed for 'Hidden Harm', said:

'I cannot tell my teacher that I was late, because I was getting my sister ready for nursery as my mam is a smackhead and could not get up'.

That brings it home to us. It is key that we pull together in the Assembly and through all the agencies. We have made progress in this field but there is much more to be done. I am sure that this debate will fully inform the action to be taken as a result of the publication of this report.

Mark Isherwood: I propose amendment 1 in the name of David Melding. Add new point at end of motion:

believes that rehabilitation programmes should do everything possible to involve and support family units.

Un o'r pum thema yn y fframwaith gweithredu yw hyfforddiant a chynyddu ymwybyddiaeth. Felly, gwnaed dadansoddiad o anghenion hyfforddi hefyd er mwyn rhoi darlun cliriach inni o anghenion datblygu pawb sy'n gweithio ym maes camddefnyddio sylweddau a meysydd cysylltiedig.

Yn olaf, gan ein bod yn ymwybodol fod angen mynd i'r afael ag effaith camddefnyddio sylweddau ar bob plentyn, ac oherwydd fy mhryder am ganlyniadau problemau camddefnyddio sylweddau gan rieni ar blant, mae gwaith yn dechrau ar fframwaith o addysgu, atal a thrin plant a phobl ifanc am gamddefnyddio sylweddau.

Rhaid inni yn awr ganolbwyntio'n hymdrechion ar nodi ac amddiffyn y plant hyn, gan gydnabod mai'r effaith fwyaf efallai yw honno ar y plant sy'n dioddef. Bydd nifer ohonynt yn dod yn ofalwyr ifanc eu hunain oherwydd anallu eu rhieni o ganlyniad i gamddefnyddio cyffuriau. Mae hyn yn ein gwneud yn ymwybodol y dylem roi ystyriaeth benodol i faich y gofal a all wynebu plant pan fydd gan eu rhieni broblem gyffuriau. Dyma a ddywedodd bachgen 11 oed mewn cyfweliad ar gyfer 'Niwed Cudd':

Ni allaf ddweud wrth fy athro mai'r rheswm pam yr oeddwn yn hwyr oedd am fy mod yn paratoi fy chwaer i fynd i'r feithrinfa am fod fy mam yn methu codi oherwydd ei bod yn gaeth i gyffuriau.

Mae hynny'n crisialu popeth inni. Mae'n allweddol i ni yn y Cynulliad dynnu gyda'n gilydd a thrwy'r holl asiantaethau. Yr ydym wedi gwneud cryn gynnydd yn y maes hwn, ond mae llawer mwy i'w wneud. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y ddadl hon yn sail i'r camau gweithredu a fydd i'w cymryd o ganlyniad i gyhoeddi'r adroddiad hwn.

Mark Isherwood: Cynigiau welliant 1 yn enw David Melding. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

cred y dylai rhaglenni adsefydlu wneud popeth sy'n bosibl i gynnwys a chynnal unedau teuluol.

I also confirm our support for amendment 2.

As this report states, there are between 250,000 and 350,000 children of problem drug users in the United Kingdom. Parental problem drug use can and does cause serious harm to children at every age, from conception to adulthood. Effective treatment of the parent can have major benefits for the child, and services must work together so that they can take practical steps to protect and improve the health and wellbeing of affected children.

We welcome this report, but note that a number of questions remain outstanding. We call on the Welsh Assembly Government to respond to those questions, and, in particular, to tell us how the health outcomes for older children will be improved through action which focuses on antenatal and maternity services. What will be the role of specialist substance misuse midwives in ensuring that the needs of substance misusing parents and their babies are met? How will the necessary substance misuse focused training be incorporated into the current basic professional training provisions for social workers, teachers, nurses and doctors? How will children be encouraged to provide information about their circumstances?

To address this latter point, both the National Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Children and the Children's Commissioner for Wales have called for an independent school counselling service. They state that independence is essential precisely because of the dilemmas and conflicts of interest faced by teachers and by school or local education authority employees. I understand that this is an area of disagreement with the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, and if this is the case, I would urge her and her colleagues to heed the advice of the front-line experts.

I am also concerned to know how the actions within this framework will result in increased capacity and accessibility within the drug treatment services and how this framework

Yr wyf hefyd yn cadarnhau ein cefnogaeth i welliant 2.

Fel y dywed yr adroddiad hwn, mae rhwng 250,000 a 350,000 o blant i rieni sydd â phroblem gyffuriau yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Gall problem gyffuriau ymhlith rhieni achosi niwed difrifol i blant o bob oed, o'u cenedlu nes iddynt dyfiu'n oedolion, ac mae hynny'n digwydd. Gall triniaeth effeithiol i'r rhiant olygu buddiannau mawr i'r plentyn, a rhaid i wasanaethau gydweithio fel y gallant gymryd camau ymarferol i ddiogelu a gwella iechyd a lles plant yr effeithir arnynt.

Croesawn yr adroddiad hwn, ond sylwn fod nifer o gwestiynau heb eu hateb. Galwn ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ymateb i'r cwestiynau hynny a dweud wrthym, yn enwedig, ym mha fodd y bydd y canlyniadau iechyd i blant hŷn yn cael eu gwella drwy gamau gweithredu sy'n canolbwyntio ar wasanaethau cyn geni a mamolaeth. Beth fydd rôl bydwragedd arbenigol ym maes camddefnyddio sylweddau wrth sicrhau diwallu anghenion rhieni sy'n camddefnyddio sylweddau a'u babanod? Sut fydd yr hyfforddiant angenrheidiol sy'n canolbwyntio ar gamddefnyddio sylweddau yn cael ei ymgorffori yn y darpariaethau hyfforddiant proffesiynol sylfaenol presennol ar gyfer gweithwyr cymdeithasol, athrawon, nyrsys a meddygon? Sut y caiff plant eu hannog i roi gwybodaeth am eu hamgylchiadau?

I ymdrin â'r pwynt olaf hwn, mae'r Gymdeithas Genedlaethol er Atal Creulondeb i Blant a Chomisiynydd Plant Cymru wedi galw am wasanaeth cyngori annibynnol i ysgolion. Dywedant fod annibyniaeth yn hanfodol yn union oherwydd y problemau a'r gwrthdaro buddiannau a wynebir gan athrawon a chan weithwyr awdurdodau addysg lleol neu ysgolion. Deallaf fod hwn yn faes lle mae'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn anghytuno. Os yw hyn yn wir, byddwn yn ei hannog hi a'i chyd-Aelodau i wrando ar gyngor yr arbenigwyr yn y rheng flaen.

Yr wyf hefyd am wybod sut y bydd y camau yn y fframwaith hwn yn arwain at gynyddu adnoddau a hygyrchedd yn y gwasanaethau triniaeth gyffuriau, a sut y bydd y fframwaith

will link in with other Assembly Government strategies and policies for children.

We must note Drugscope's statement that it is

'disappointing that the Government has rejected calls that all social workers be required to undertake training on parental substance misuse as a condition of registration. Social care workers must have the necessary information and skills to identify potential substance misuse problems. A high proportion of child protection cases involve hard drug use in the home'.

Drugscope adds that it is

'disappointed that no timescale is given as to when the National Treatment Agency will begin collecting data about the children of people accessing treatment services',

and that

'too many drug-using parents are currently deterred from accessing services for fear their children will automatically be taken away from them'.

When safe, children and young people are best brought up by their own families. To address this, I commend the Save the Family charity, which is a good practice model that I recently hosted in the Assembly, as a cost-effective model to be studied and supported as a solution for families who fall through the net of statutory provision. Without Save the Family, families are smashed apart, and innocent children start their lives as many of their parents did, facing a lifetime of social exclusion and with no example of normal life to follow or to aim towards. With Save the Family, homeless families are kept together and social problems are addressed at their roots, and not made worse by constant relocations between departments and agencies, which are often located in different parts of the country. The organisation accepts referrals from across Wales and beyond as there are no other known family centres where whole families can be accommodated together and helped in this way. The referrals

hwn yn cysylltu â strategaethau a pholisïau eraill gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i blant.

Rhaid inni nodi datganiad Drugscope ei fod

yn siomedig fod y Llywodraeth wedi gwrthod galwadau i'w gwneud yn ofynnol i bob gweithiwr cymdeithasol ymgymryd â hyfforddiant ar gamdefnyddio sylweddau ymhlith rhieni fel amod i'w cofrestru. Rhaid i weithwyr gofal cymdeithasol feddu ar y wybodaeth a'r sgiliau angenrheidiol i allu nodi problemau posibl o gamdefnyddio sylweddau. Mae cyfran fawr o achosion amddiffyn plant yn ymwneud â chamdefnyddio cyffuriau caled yn y cartref.

Ychwanega Drugscope ei fod

yn siomedig na roddwyd amserlen pryd fydd yr Asiantaeth Driniaeth Genedlaethol yn dechrau casglu data am blant pobl sy'n defnyddio gwasanaethau trin,

a bod

gormod o rieni sy'n defnyddio cyffuriau yn cael eu hatal ar hyn o bryd rhag defnyddio gwasanaethau oherwydd eu bod yn ofni y caiff eu plant eu cymryd oddi arnynt yn awtomatig.

Pan fydd yn ddiogel, mae'n well i blant a phobl ifanc gael eu magu gan eu teuluoedd eu hunain. I fynd i'r afael â hyn, cymeradwyaf yr elusen Save the Family, sy'n batrwm o arfer da ac a groesawyd yn ddiweddar gennyf yn y Cynulliad fel patrwm sy'n effeithiol o ran cost i'w astudio a'i gefnogi fel ateb i deuluoedd sy'n mynd drwy'r rhwyd darpariaeth statudol. Heb Save the Family, mae teuluoedd yn chwalu a phlant diniwed yn dechrau eu bywydau yr un fath â nifer o'u rhieni, drwy wynebu oes o allgáu cymdeithasol heb unrhyw enghreifftiau o fywyd normal i'w hefelychu neu i anelu atynt. Gyda Save the Family, cedwir teuluoedd digartref gyda'i gilydd ac eir i'r afael â gwraidd problemau cymdeithasol, yn hytrach na'u gwaethygu drwy drosglwyddo cyson rhwng adrannau ac asiantaethau, sy'n aml mewn rhannau gwahanol o'r wlad. Mae'r sefydliad yn derbyn pobl sy'n cael eu hatgyfeirio o bob rhan o Gymru a thu hwnt, gan nad oes unrhyw ganolfannau teulu eraill

include drug and alcohol abusers who are on a programme to address their addiction and those classed as intentionally homeless. We should also note that the organisation is able to do this at a cost of only £350 per week for a family to reside and to learn life skills and to be educated, compared with the cost of £600 a week for staying in unsuitable bed and breakfast accommodation.

We also need a mediation service that will intervene early to ensure that disputes are sorted out in the best interests of the children and do not have to go to court unless child safety is at risk.

We must heed the call by the Children's Society for children whose parents misuse alcohol not to be forgotten. Agencies must consider all the needs of children and their welfare when working with a parent who misuses alcohol and drugs. We must also be mindful of the worrying rise in the number of offenders entering the youth justice system with drug and alcohol dependency problems.

I will conclude by referring to the Joseph Rowntree Foundation study carried out in Scotland, which found that drug abuse brought with it more anxiety and social stress, while alcohol abuse was more associated with violence and parental absence. As in Scotland, so in Wales. I therefore urge the Welsh Assembly Government to back the findings of this report, not just with words, but with action, and to apply it, not only to the needs of children of problem drug abusers, but to the needs of children of alcohol abusers.

Peter Black: I propose amendment 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to review its guidance on teachers' training so as to ensure that newly qualified teachers are given the skills to identify and take action on

y gwyddom amdanynt a all letya teulu cyfan gyda'i gilydd a'i helpu fel hyn. Mae'r rhai sy'n cael eu hatgyfeirio yn cynnwys pobl sy'n camddefnyddio cyffuriau ac alcohol ac sydd ar raglen i ymdrin â'u problem, a'r rheini a elwir yn bobl sy'n ddigartref yn fwriadol. Dylem hefyd nodi y gall y sefydliad wneud hyn am gost o £350 yn unig yr wythnos i deulu gael aros yno a dysgu sgiliau bywyd a chael eu haddysgu. Mae hyn yn cymharu â chost o £600 yr wythnos am aros mewn llety gwely a brecwast anaddas.

Mae arnom angen gwasanaeth cyfryngu hefyd a fydd yn ymyrryd yn gynnar i sicrhau y caiff anghydfodau eu ddatrys er lles y plant, ac na fydd yn rhaid mynd i'r llys oni fydd diogelwch plant mewn perygl.

Rhaid inni wrando ar yr alwad gan Gymdeithas y Plant am beidio ag anghofio am blant sydd â'u rhieni'n camddefnyddio alcohol. Rhaid i asiantaethau ystyried holl anghenion plant a'u lles wrth weithio gyda rhiant sy'n camddefnyddio alcohol a chyffuriau. Rhaid inni hefyd gadw mewn cof y cynnydd sy'n peri pryder yn nifer y troseddwr sy'n dod i mewn i'r system cyfiawnder troseddol gyda phroblemau dibyniaeth ar gyffuriau ac alcohol.

Deuaf i ben drwy gyfeirio at yr astudiaeth gan Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree a wnaed yn yr Alban. Gwelodd fod mwy o bryder a straen cymdeithasol ynghlwm wrth gamddefnyddio cyffuriau, a bod camddefnyddio alcohol yn fwy cysylltiedig â thrais ac absenoldeb rhieni. Mae'r un peth yn wir yng Nghymru ag yn yr Alban. Felly, anogaf Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gefnogi darganfyddiadau'r adroddiad hwn, nid drwy eiriau yn unig, ond drwy weithredu a'i gymhwyso nid yn unig at anghenion plant i bobl sy'n camddefnyddio cyffuriau, ond hefyd i anghenion plant i bobl sy'n camddefnyddio alcohol.

Peter Black: Cynigiaf welliant 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i adolygu ei arweiniad ar hyfforddi athrawon er mwyn sicrhau y caiff athrawon newydd gymhwyso y sgiliau i adnabod a chymryd

children who are affected by parental substance misuse.

I thank the Minister for indicating that the Government is prepared to accept our amendment. It is vital, if we are to tackle this in a holistic way, that everybody who comes into contact with children who may be subject to the pressures of having parents who abuse substances such as drugs and alcohol should be trained and equipped to recognise the issue and to deal with it, and also to give advice and help to the children. For schools, there is no better way of doing this than by incorporating it into teacher training, along with a number of other issues. It is vital that schools have a major role to play in this, particularly in terms of trying to mitigate the effects of parental abuse.

Having visited a large number of schools, I have come across some where the headteacher has told me that children as young as six or seven years of age are able to demonstrate to their teacher how to inject drugs, having watched their parents doing it. That sort of exposure to disturbing ways of using drugs is unacceptable and must be mitigated and tackled head on if we are to protect children from the consequences of parental substance misuse in the future.

We must also bear in mind that this is not just about drugs. If you talk to anybody in the field of substance misuse, they will tell you that alcohol is as big a problem as drugs, if not a bigger problem, among adults and young people. The effects of drinking alcohol are entirely different to those of taking drugs. Alcohol misuse can lead to violence and the abuse of children and other family members. That is unacceptable. It is invaluable that that issue is recognised and dealt with early as part of this strategy and it must be taken in hand. We should not just concentrate on drugs; we must consider the whole issue of substance misuse.

Substance misuse in the UK is strongly associated with social economic deprivation, and we have our fair share of socially

camau i gynorthwyo plant yr effeithir arnynt gan y ffaith bod eu rhieni yn camddefnyddio sylweddau.

Yr wyf yn diolch i'r Gweinidog am nodi bod y Llywodraeth yn barod i dderbyn ein gwelliant. Os ydym i fynd i'r afael â hyn mewn ffordd gyfannol, mae'n hanfodol i bawb sy'n dod i gysylltiad â phlant, a all fod dan pwysau oherwydd bod eu rhieni yn camddefnyddio sylweddau, fel cyffuriau ac alcohol, gael eu hyfforddi a'u galluogi i adnabod y broblem a delio â hi, a hefyd i roi cyngor a chymorth i'r plant. O ran ysgolion, nid oes ffordd well i wneud hyn na'i ymgorffori mewn hyfforddiant athrawon, ynghyd â nifer o faterion eraill. Mae'n hanfodol i ysgolion gael rhan allweddol yn hyn oll, yn enwedig wrth geisio lleddfu effeithiau'r camddefnyddio gan eu rhieni.

Ar ôl ymweld â nifer fawr o ysgolion, yr wyf wedi dod ar draws rhai lle mae'r pennaeth wedi dweud wrthyf fod plant mor ifanc â chwech neu saith oed yn gallu dangos i'w hathrawon sut i chwistrellu cyffuriau, ar ôl gwyllo'u rhieni yn gwneud hynny. Mae'r math hwnnw o amlygiad i ffyrdd annymunol o ddefnyddio cyffuriau yn annerbyniol, a rhaid mynd i'r afael â hyn ar unwaith a'i leddfu os ydym i amddiffyn plant rhag canlyniadau camddefnyddio sylweddau ymhlith rhieni yn y dyfodol.

Rhaid inni hefyd gadw mewn cof nad yw hyn yn ymwneud â chyffuriau'n unig. Os siaradwch ag unrhyw un ym maes camddefnyddio sylweddau, dywedant wrthyf fod alcohol yn gymaint o broblem â chyffuriau, os nad yn fwy, ymhlith oedolion a phobl ifanc. Mae effeithiau yfed alcohol yn gwbl wahanol i effeithiau cymryd cyffuriau. Gall camddefnyddio alcohol arwain at drais a cham-drin plant ac aelodau eraill o'r teulu. Mae hynny'n annerbyniol. Mae cydnabod y mater hwn ac ymdrin ag ef yn gynnar fel rhan o'r strategaeth hon yn amhrisiadwy, a rhaid mynd i'r afael â hynny. Ni ddylem ganolbwyntio ar gyffuriau'n unig; rhaid inni ystyried yr holl fater o gamddefnyddio sylweddau.

Yn y DU, mae cysylltiad cryf rhwng camddefnyddio sylweddau ac amddifadedd economaidd cymdeithasol, ac mae gennym

deprived communities in Wales with all these problems. Parental substance misuse can lead to serious health and social consequences, it can leave children exposed to poverty, physical and emotional abuse or neglect, and it can lead to dangerously inadequate supervision and other inappropriate parenting practices, such as intermittent or permanent separation, inadequate accommodation and frequent changes in residence. All that is deeply unsettling for the child, and it is the Government's duty to put that right. That is why the Welsh Liberal Democrats, as I am sure do all Assembly Members, welcome 'Hidden Harm' and the recommendations that it brings forward. My only regret is that the report is almost two years old and it is only now that we are debating it. I am sure that a number of the recommendations have already been initiated, and I hope that we will be able to expedite the implementation of those recommendations that are not already in hand.

3.30 p.m.

It is absolutely vital that we get all these issues in place and, in particular, that we establish the multi-agency work and the co-ordination of sharing of information between the voluntary sector, social services, schools, local health boards and GPs and so on, so that the information is available to those people who come across children in their professional lives. We need to ensure that services for adult substance misusers are in place, so that we can treat those people who have a problem, to try to bring them back to the ordinary world where they are not so dependant on those substances. That is why I think that, as well as this report, the money and investment that the Welsh Assembly Government is putting into substance misuse is vital, as is the report that the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee is currently looking at in terms of how effectively that money is being spent and what gaps there are in service provision. We need to fill those gaps and protect children, but above all we need to help substance misusers who lead to this problem in the first place, and put treatment regimes in place to try to get them

yng Nghymru fwy na digon o gymunedau sy'n dioddef o amddifadedd cymdeithasol a lle mae'r problemau hyn i gyd i'w gweld. Gall camdefnyddio sylweddau ymhlith rhieni arwain at ganlyniadau iechyd a chanlyniadau cymdeithasol difrifol. Gall plant fod yn agored i dlodi, esgeulustod neu gamdriniaeth gorfforol ac emosiynol, a gall arwain at oruchwyliaeth sy'n beryglus o annigonol ynghyd ag arferion amhriodol eraill wrth fagu plant, fel cael eu gwahanu yn barhaol neu o bryd i'w gilydd, llely annigonol a symud cartref yn gyson. Mae hyn i gyd yn tarfu'n fawr iawn ar y plentyn, a dyletswydd y Llywodraeth yw unioni hynny. Dyna pam y mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn croesawu 'Niwed Cudd' a'r argymhellion y mae'n eu cynnig, ac yr wyf yn siŵr fod pob Aelod o'r Cynulliad yn ei groesawu. Fy unig ofid yw bod yr adroddiad bron yn ddwyflwydd oed a dim ond yn awr yr ydym yn ei drafod. Yr wyf yn siŵr fod nifer o'r argymhellion eisoes wedi eu rhoi ar waith, a gobeithio y byddwn yn gallu cyflymu'r broses o weithredu'r argymhellion hynny nad ydynt eisoes ar waith.

Mae'n hollbwysig inni roi'r holl faterion hyn ar waith, ac yn arbennig inni sefydlu'r gwaith aml-asiantaeth a chydgyssylltu'r broses o rannu gwybodaeth rhwng y sector gwirfoddol, gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, ysgolion, byrddau iechyd lleol a meddygon teulu ac yn y blaen, er mwyn i'r wybodaeth fod ar gael i'r bobl hynny sy'n dod ar draws plant yn eu bywydau proffesiynol. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod gwasanaethau ar gael ar gyfer oedolion sy'n camdefnyddio sylweddau, fel y gallwn drin y bobl hynny sydd â phroblem, i geisio dod â hwy yn ôl i mewn i'r byd cyffredin lle na fyddant mor ddibynnol ar y sylweddau hynny. Dyna pam y credaf, yn ogystal â'r adroddiad hwn, fod yr arian a'r buddsoddiad gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru mewn camdefnyddio sylweddau yn hollbwysig, fel y mae'r adroddiad y mae'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio yn ei ystyried ar hyn o bryd i weld pa mor effeithiol y mae'r arian hwnnw'n cael ei wario, a pha fylchau sydd yn y ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau. Mae angen inni lenwi'r bylchau hynny ac amddiffyn plant. Ond yn anad dim mae angen

off the substances on which they are dependent.

inni helpu pobl sy'n camddefnyddio sylweddau ac sy'n creu'r broblem hon yn y lle cyntaf, a sicrhau bod systemau triniaeth ar gael i geisio tynnu pobl oddi ar y sylweddau maent yn ddibynnol arnynt.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.32 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.32 p.m.*

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Croesawaf yr adroddiad a nodaf y byddwn yn cefnogi'r naill welliant a'r llall, sydd eisoes wedi'u derbyn gan y Llywodraeth. Mae hwn yn fater o'r pwys mwyaf sy'n ymwneud â gwrando ar a pharchu lleisiau plant. Trafodasom y mater hwn yn y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio y bore yma yn Abertawe. Yr oedd nifer o bwyntiau o'r drafodaeth honno, yng nghwmni swyddog o CAF/CASS a Peter Clarke, y comisiynydd plant, sy'n berthnasol i'r hyn sy'n gorfod digwydd. Y cwestiwn mawr yw a oes modd sicrhau bod y fframwaith hwn yn troi'n weithredy er mwyn sicrhau y clywir lleisiau plant.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I welcome the report and note that we will support both amendments, which have already been accepted by the Government. This is a matter of the greatest importance, about listening to and respecting the voice of children. We discussed this matter at the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee meeting this morning in Swansea. A number of points were raised in that discussion, in the presence of an official from CAF/CASS and Peter Clarke, the children's commissioner, that are relevant to what must happen. The major question is whether there is a way of ensuring that this framework turns into action to ensure that children's voices are heard.

Un pwynt a godwyd oedd bod llawer o esiamplau o arferion da yng Nghymru. Rhai misoedd yn ôl, yr oeddwn yn bresennol adeg lansio cynllun arbrofol gan Heddlu Dyfed Powys a nifer o fudiadau sy'n ymwneud â hawliau plant. Bwriad y cynllun oedd rhoi cyfle i blant defnyddio'r we er mwyn rhannu eu gofidiau gyda swyddogion oedd wedi eu hyfforddi i ymateb yn gymwys i'r sylwadau hynny. Byddai hwn yn un ffordd iddynt fynegi eu pryderon am y ffaith bod eu rhieni yn camddefnyddio sylweddau ac alcohol, a bod hynny'n cael effaith andwyol ar ansawdd eu bywydau. Fel y gofynnais y bore yma, sut gallwn sicrhau bod yr arferion da yn cael eu rhannu drwy Gymru gyfan?

One point raised was that there are many examples of good practice in Wales. Some months ago, I was present at the launch of an experimental scheme by Dyfed Powys Police and a number of organisations that deal with children's rights. The scheme aims to give children an opportunity to use the internet to share their concerns with officers trained in how to respond properly to those comments. This would be one way for them to express their concerns about the fact that their parents misuse substances and alcohol, and that this is having a detrimental effect on their quality of life. As I requested this morning, how can we ensure that good practice is shared throughout Wales?

Os yw hwn i gael ei weithredu'n effeithiol, mae cwestiwn yn codi ynglŷn ag adnoddau ariannol—cyfeiriwyd at hynny gan y Gweinidog â chyfrifoldeb am blant—a'r angen am raglen hyfforddi cynhwysfawr ar gyfer pawb fydd yn ymwneud â'r gwaith hwn. Dymunaf sicrwydd y bydd system i fonitro a gwerthuso hynny, a fydd yn golygu bod hyfforddiant yn cael ei roi yn ei le, ac y bydd yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn cael ei oruchwylio er mwyn sicrhau bod y bobl a fydd yn gyfrifol am y gwaith yn gweithredu

If this is to be implemented effectively, a question arises of financial resources—the Minister with responsibility for children has referred to that—and the need for a comprehensive training programme for all those who will be involved with this work. I seek assurance that there will be a monitoring and appraisal system, which will mean that training will be in place, and that the work will be supervised to ensure that those responsible for the work operate in a way that will help children to express their concerns.

mewn ffordd a fydd yn helpu plant i fynegi eu pryderon.

Mae angen gweithredu rhyng-asiantaethol a rhwng gwahanol Weinidogion. O ran yr angen am wasanaeth cyngori ar gyfer plant a gwasanaeth iechyd i blant mewn ysgolion, bydd angen i chi, Weinidog, weithio gyda'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Awgrymodd Mark Isherwood y byddwch yn gwrthdaro â'r Gweinidog addysg. Fe'ch sicrhaf, os yw hynny'n digwydd, cewch gefnogaeth unfrydol y gwrthbleidiau, yn wir cewch gefnogaeth frwdfrydig. Yr ydym yn sicr o'ch llwyddiant pe digwyddai hynny.

Byddai'n rhaid ichi hefyd gynnwys y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymeithasol a'r Gweinidog â chyfrifoldeb dros blant. Mae'n rhaid sicrhau bod y cydweithredu hwnnw'n digwydd ar lefel lywodraethol, a chyda'r asiantaethau perthnasol.

Y pwynt olaf, sydd yn ymwneud â rôl y comisiynydd plant, yw sut yr effeithir yn andwyol ar ansawdd bywyd plant pan yw rhieni yn camddefnyddio sylweddau neu alcohol. Wrth i'r plant hyn dyfu'n bobl ifanc, mae perygl iddynt droseddu neu weithredu'n wrthgymdeithasol. Mewn sefyllfa gyfreithiol o'r fath, ni fyddai modd i'r comisiynydd plant ymyrryd, am fod materion cyfreithiol y tu hwnt i'r pwerau datganoledig. Cawsom sicrwydd gan y comisiynydd y bore yma y bydd yn parhau i weithredu dros hawliau plant Cymru hyd nes y bydd unrhyw un yn ei atal. Yr wyf yn hyderus na fyddwch chi, Weinidog, yn ceisio ei atal, ond a gawn ni sicrwydd gennych na fydd neb arall yn Llywodraeth Cymru yn ceisio ei atal rhag amddiffyn a hyrwyddo buddiannau plant a phobl ifanc Cymru? Croesawn yn adroddiad hwn, a gyhoeddwyd ers peth amser, fel y soniodd Peter Black. Nid oes dim byd newydd ynddo, ond y prawf fydd sicrhau y caiff ei argymhellion eu gweithredu, ac os gwneir hynny, gallaf ddweud y cewch chi ein cefnogaeth lwyr.

Janice Gregory I welcome the fact that the Welsh Assembly Government has agreed the framework for action recommended by the advisory panel on substance misuse and the

We need multi-agency working and co-operation between various Ministers. As for the need for an advice service for children and a health service for children in schools, you, Minister, will need to work with the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning. Mark Isherwood suggested that you would come into conflict with the education Minister. I assure you, if that happens you will have the unanimous support of the opposition parties, indeed, you will have enthusiastic support. We are confident of your success should that happen.

You would also have to include the Minister for Health and Social Services, and the Minister with responsibility for children. We must ensure that such collaboration happens at government level, and with the relevant agencies.

The final point, which concerns the role of the children's commissioner, is the detrimental effect on the quality of children's lives when parents misuse substances or alcohol. When those children become young people, they are in danger of becoming offenders or behave anti-socially. In a legal situation such as this, the children's commissioner could not intervene, as legal matters are beyond the devolved powers. The commissioner gave assurance this morning that he will continue to work for the rights of Welsh children until someone prevents him. I am confident that you, Minister, will not attempt to prevent him. But will you assure us that no-one else within the Government of Wales will try to prevent him from defending and promoting the interests of the children and young people of Wales? We welcome this report, which was published some time ago, as Peter Black said. It has nothing new to offer, but the acid test will be to ensure that its recommendations are implemented. If that happens, I can assure you that you will have our full support.

Janice Gregory: Croesawaf y ffaith fod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi cytuno ar y fframwaith ar gyfer gweithredu a argymhellwyd gan y panel cyngori ar

proposals to establish a 'Hidden Harm' steering group to monitor and lead on the implementation of the report's recommendations.

When the framework for action was considered at the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee meeting on 16 March, Members welcomed the Minister's paper and, in particular, recognised the need for a protocol to be put in place to encourage health, social services and education authorities to exchange information on substance misuse cases that may impact on children. The 'Hidden Harm' report estimates that there are between 250,000 and 350,000 children of problem drug users in the United Kingdom—about one for every problem drug user. Parental problem drug use can cause serious harm to children at every age, from conception to adulthood. Reducing the harm to children from parental problem drug use should become a main objective of policy and practice. Effective treatment of the parent can have major benefits for the child. By working together, services can take many practical steps to protect and improve the health and wellbeing of affected children. The number of affected children is only likely to decrease when the number of problem drug users decreases.

These messages draw attention to the cross-cutting nature of the report, and the need for joint working between health and social services, community care and children's services, substance misuse services, generic services and other systems such as the education and criminal justice systems. The critical interface is that between substance misuse services and those services that protect and support children. Members will know that the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee is carrying out a policy review into substance misuse. It is concentrating, at the outset, on treatment and rehabilitation services, and I believe that this is right.

So, the lot of affected children will only improve with a reduction in usage among the adult population. This, however, will not be an easy task. I was convinced of this recently

gamddefnyddio sylweddau, a'r cynigion i sefydlu grŵp llywio 'Niwed Cudd' i fonitro ac arwain ar y gwaith o weithredu argymhellion yr adroddiad.

Pan ystyriwyd y fframwaith ar gyfer gweithredu yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ar 16 Mawrth, croesawodd yr Aelodau bapur y Gweinidog, ac yn arbennig cydnabyddwyd bod angen rhoi protocol ar waith i annog awdurdodau iechyd, gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ac addysg i gyfnewid gwybodaeth am achosion o gamddefnyddio sylweddau a all effeithio ar blant. Mae'r adroddiad 'Niwed Cudd' yn amcangyfrif bod rhwng 250,000 a 350,000 o blant i rieni sydd â phroblem gyffuriau yn y Deyrnas Unedig—tuag un plentyn i bob rhiant sydd â phroblem gyffuriau. Gall rhieni sydd â phroblem gyffuriau achosi niwed difrifol i blant o bob oed, o'u cenhedlu nes y tyfant yn oedolion. Dylai lleihau'r niwed i blant oherwydd bod gan eu rhieni broblem gyffuriau fod yn brif amcan polisi ac arfer. Gall trin y rhiant yn effeithiol fod o fudd mawr i'r plentyn. Drwy gydweithio, gall gwasanaethau gymryd nifer o gamau ymarferol i ddiogelu a gwella iechyd a lles plant yr effeithir arnynt. Mae nifer y plant yr effeithir arnynt yn debygol o ostwng dim ond pan fydd nifer y bobl sydd â phroblem gyffuriau yn gostwng.

Mae'r negeseuon hyn yn tynnu sylw at natur drawsbynciol yr adroddiad, a'r angen am gydweithio rhwng iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, gofal cymunedol a gwasanaethau plant, gwasanaethau camddefnyddio sylweddau, gwasanaethau generig a systemau eraill megis y systemau addysg a chyfiawnder troseddol. Y rhyngwyneb hollbwysig yw hwnnw rhwng gwasanaethau camddefnyddio sylweddau a'r gwasanaethau hynny sy'n amddiffyn ac yn cynnal plant. Gŵyr Aelodau fod y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio yn gwneud adolygiad polisi o gamddefnyddio sylweddau. Mae'n canolbwyntio, ar y cychwyn, ar wasanaethau triniaeth ac adsefydlu, a chredaf fod hyn yn iawn.

Felly, dim ond os bydd llai o ddefnyddio sylweddau ymhlith oedolion y bydd bywydau plant yr effeithir arnynt yn gwella. Fodd bynnag, ni fydd hyn yn dasg hawdd. Cefais

when, as part of the committee's review, I visited a rehabilitation centre in Newport. During the course of the visit, I met a young couple who were both on the programme and, during our conversation, I learned that the couple had just had a baby. In my naivety, I asked whether this happy event had been the factor that had persuaded them to join the programme. I was disillusioned on hearing that the baby was not the trigger, but rather the courts had issued an order that both should undergo rehabilitation after being found guilty of stealing in order to finance their drug habit.

Throughout our review we continue to hear that most referrals to drug and alcohol agencies come from the courts, police, social services or the medical profession, with very few self-referrals. The 'Hidden Harm' report focused on children in the UK whose parent, parents or other guardian's drug use had serious negative consequences for themselves and those around them. It is a good report, but it deals with just one of the impacts of drugs misuse on children.

3.40 p.m.

The committee's findings to date have indicated that services for children who misuse substances are limited. They will generally be referred to child and adolescent mental health services, which might not be appropriate in all cases. Such children are not covered by this report, but we should not turn our back on this problem.

William Graham: The Welsh Conservatives welcome the advisory panel's report and particularly welcome the recent changing of the policy and practice of focusing upon the individual with the drug problem to focusing on the wider consideration of the severe and enduring impact of problem drug use on families.

Problem drug use has a profound impact on all family members. Furthermore, when

fy argyhoeddi o hyn yn ddiweddar pan ymwelais, fel rhan o adolygiad y pwyllgor, â chanolfan adsefydlu yng Nghasnewydd. Yn ystod yr ymweliad, gwelais bâr ifanc a oedd yn rhan o'r rhaglen, ac yn ystod ein sgwrs dywedwyd wrthyf eu bod newydd gael babi. Yn fy niniweidrwydd, gofynnais ai'r digwyddiad hapus hwnnw oedd wedi eu cymell i ymuno â'r rhaglen. Fe'm dadrithiwyd pan glywais nad y babi oedd wedi ysgogi hyn, ond yn hytrach bod y llysoedd wedi gorchymyn y dylai'r ddau gael cwrs adsefydlu ar ôl eu dyfarnu'n euog o ddwyn er mwyn ariannu eu harfer o ddefnyddio cyffuriau.

Drwy gydol ein hadolygiad yr ydym yn dal i glywed bod y rhan fwyaf o'r achosion o atgyweirio i'r asiantaethau cyffuriau ac alcohol yn dod oddi wrth y llysoedd, yr heddlu, gwasanaethau cymdeithasol neu'r proffesiwn meddygol, ac mai prin iawn yw'r achosion o hunan-gyfeirio. Yr oedd yr adroddiad 'Niwed Cudd' yn canolbwyntio ar blant yn y DU yr oedd problem gyffuriau eu rhiant, eu rhieni neu warcheidwad arall wedi achosi canlyniadau negyddol iawn iddynt hwy eu hunain a'r rhai o'u hamgylch. Mae'n adroddiad da, ond mae'n ymdrin â dim ond un o effeithiau camddefnyddio cyffuriau ar blant.

Mae darganfyddiadau'r pwyllgor hyd yma wedi dangos mai cyfyngedig yw gwasanaethau i blant sy'n camddefnyddio sylweddau. Byddant fel rheol yn cael eu hatgyfeirio i wasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasoed, nad ydynt efallai yn briodol ym mhob achos. Nid yw'r adroddiad hwn yn ymdrin â phlant felly, ond ni ddylem droi ein cefnau ar y broblem hon.

William Graham: Mae Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn croesawu adroddiad y panel cynghori, ac yn arbennig yn croesawu newid y polisi a'r arfer yn diweddar o ganolbwyntio ar yr unigolyn sydd â'r broblem gyffuriau i ganolbwyntio ar ystyriaeth ehangach o'r effaith ddifrifol a pharhaus y mae problem defnyddio cyffuriau yn ei chael ar deuluoedd.

Mae problem defnyddio cyffuriau yn cael effaith ddifrifol ar bob aelod o'r teulu. At

drugs come into a family, there is the danger that siblings may become involved in problem drug use, thus adding to those family problems. The influence of a child's drug problem on a younger brother or sister lacks emphasis, despite evidence that some siblings are at higher risk of developing drug problems themselves.

Commonly, the family response upon discovery is utter confusion and panic and is often in the context of profound naivety about drugs, their effects and their consequences. The often-felt shame of having a child with a drug problem further cements the impulse to contain the problem, and, at best, the family consult with their general practitioner, but most attempt to contain the problem within the family and resolve it without recourse to external agencies.

Further pressures are placed upon the family, parents, the problem-drug-using child and his or her brothers and sisters, especially if the drug-using child is stealing goods and money from the family home. That leads to a tendency for the family member's drug problem to take centre stage and to drained parental time and energy, resulting in an imbalance in the attention and resources available for other children.

We need to acknowledge that it is not necessarily the older sibling who initiates the drug use; it could happen with younger children's peers. However, being consistently exposed to drugs and drug taking and demystified drug use through proximity makes casual experimentation possible.

We acknowledge the work done by the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee and in particular by the Minister, but we need to recognise that there is a much greater need for wider support, training and funding for family support groups, together with, where possible, therapeutic respite. The importance of local community family support groups cannot be overemphasised. The opportunity for parents of children with substance abuse

hynny, pan fydd cyffuriau yn dod i mewn i fywyd teulu, mae perygl y gall brodyr neu chwiorydd ddod yn rhan o'r broblem defnyddio cyffuriau, gan ychwanegu at y problemau teuluol hynny. Nid oes digon o bwyslais ar ddylanwad problem gyffuriau plentyn ar frawd neu chwaer iau, er bod tystiolaeth fod rhai brodyr neu chwiorydd mewn mwy o berygl o ddatblygu problemau cyffuriau eu hunain.

Gan amlaf, ymateb y teulu wrth ddarganfod problem gyffuriau yw dryswch a phanig llwyr, a hynny'n aml yng nghyd-destun diniweidrwydd llwyr am gyffuriau, eu heffeithiau a'u canlyniadau. Mae'r cywilydd a deimlir yn aml o gael plentyn sydd â phroblem gyffuriau yn cryfhau ymhellach yr awydd i gelu'r broblem, ac ar y gorau bydd y teulu'n troi at eu meddyg teulu. Ond bydd y mwyafrif yn ceisio cadw'r broblem o fewn y teulu a'i datrys heb droi at asiantaethau allanol.

Rhoddir pwysau pellach ar y teulu, y rhieni, y plentyn sy'n defnyddio cyffuriau a'i frodyr neu ei chwiorydd, yn enwedig os yw'r plentyn sy'n defnyddio cyffuriau yn dwyn nwyddau ac arian o gartref y teulu. Mae hynny'n tueddu i olygu bod problem gyffuriau'r aelod o'r teulu yn cael y sylw blaenaf ac yn mynd â holl amser ac egni'r rhieni, gan olygu nad oes yr un sylw ac adnoddau ar gael i blant eraill.

Mae angen inni gydnabod nad y brawd neu'r chwaer hyn o reidrwydd sy'n dechrau camdefnyddio cyffuriau; gallai ddigwydd gyda chyfoedion plant iau. Fodd bynnag, mae bod mewn cysylltiad cyson â chyffuriau a phobl sy'n cymryd cyffuriau a chwalu'r hud sy'n gysylltiedig â chymryd cyffuriau drwy fod yn agos iddynt yn gwneud arbrofi achlysurol yn bosibl.

Cydnabyddwn y gwaith a wneir gan y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ac yn arbennig gan y Gweinidog. Ond mae angen inni gydnabod bod mwy o angen o lawer am gefnogaeth ehangach, hyfforddiant ac arian ar gyfer grwpiau cymorth i deuluoedd, ynghyd â seibiant therapiwtig lle mae hynny'n bosibl. Ni ellir gorbwysleisio pwysigrwydd grwpiau cymorth i deuluoedd yn y gymuned leol.

and alcohol problems to meet other parents in similar circumstances allows them to see that they are not isolated. We need to provide advice and finance to allow these opportunities to be accessed immediately the problem is identified and not after perhaps many years of living with a serious problem. We also need to draw attention to the fact that family support groups can be short-lived, as they are often informally constituted and self-funded. We most need to extend their attraction to the whole family, as studies highlight that it is usually mothers rather than other family members who are most in evidence in promoting these groups.

The effects and dangers of drug use extend beyond the child of a drug-using family. They engulf the wider community in their funding and the provision of support services. That is why the impact is most acutely experienced by those who become the victims of drug-related crime.

Perhaps we can continue this development, focusing policy and practice on the families and communities experiencing problem drug use, and raise awareness of hidden harm, making it shared responsibility.

Irene James: I pay tribute to the organisation, Kaleidoscope, which helps drug users to rebuild their lives and offers support for families in my constituency. One of my constituents is now seeing his children for the first time in several years as a result of this support. Kaleidoscope is known nationally and internationally for its pioneering, community-based drug-treatment programmes. As the 'Hidden Harm' report's key message sets out, parental problem drug use can cause serious harm to children of every age, from conception to adulthood, but, by working together, services can take many practical steps to protect and improve the health and wellbeing of children.

As a former special needs teacher, I support recommendations 27 and 28, which state that

Mae'r cyfle i rieni plant sydd â phroblemau camddefnyddio sylweddau ac alcohol gyfarfod â rhieni eraill mewn amgylchiadau tebyg yn caniatáu iddynt weld nad ydynt ar eu pen eu hunain. Mae angen inni ddarparu cyngor a chyllid er mwyn gallu defnyddio'r cyfleoedd hyn cyn gynted ag y nodir y broblem, ac nid hwyrach ar ôl blynyddoedd lawer o fyw gyda phroblem ddifrifol. Mae angen hefyd inni dynnu sylw at y ffaith y gall grwpiau cymorth i deuluoedd fod yn rhywbeth dros dro, gan eu bod yn aml yn cael eu cyfansoddi'n anffurfiol ac yn eu hariannu eu hunain. Mae angen yn bennaf inni eu gwneud yn atyniadol i'r teulu cyfan, gan fod astudiaethau'n dangos mai mamau fel rheol, yn hytrach nag aelodau eraill o'r teulu, sydd fwyaf amlwg yn hyrwyddo'r grwpiau hyn.

Gall effeithiau a pheryglon defnyddio cyffuriau estyn y tu hwnt i blentyn mewn teulu sy'n defnyddio cyffuriau. Maent yn cwmpasu'r gymuned ehangach wrth ariannu a darparu gwasanaethau cymorth. Dyna pam mae'r effaith drymaf ar y rheini sydd wedyn yn dioddef oherwydd troseddau'n gysylltiedig â chyffuriau.

Efallai y gallwn barhau gyda'r datblygiad hwn, gan ganolbwyntio polisi ac arfer ar y teuluoedd a'r cymunedau sy'n wynebu problemau cyffuriau, a chynyddu ymwybyddiaeth o niwed cudd, gan ei wneud yn gyfrifoldeb i'w rannu.

Irene James: Yr wyf yn rhoi teyrnged i sefydliad Kaleidoscope sy'n helpu pobl sy'n defnyddio cyffuriau i ailafael yn eu bywydau gan gynnig cymorth i deuluoedd yn fy etholaeth i. Mae un o'm hetholwyr yn awr yn gweld ei blant am y tro cyntaf ers llawer blwyddyn o ganlyniad i'r cymorth hwn. Mae Kaleidoscope yn adnabyddus yn genedlaethol ac yn rhyngwladol am ei raglenni arloesol yn y gymuned i drin problemau cyffuriau. Fel y dywed neges allweddol yr adroddiad 'Niwed Cudd', gall problem gyffuriau ymhlith rhieni achosi niwed difrifol i blant o bob oedran, o'u cenhedlu nes iddynt dyfu'n oedolion. Ond drwy gydweithio, gall gwasanaethau gymryd llawer o gamau ymarferol i ddiogelu a gwella iechyd a lles plant.

Fel cyn athrawes anghenion arbennig, cefnogaf argymhellion 27 a 28, sy'n dweud y

all schools should identify at least one designated, trained person who is able to deal with problems that might arise from parental drug use, and that training should be part of teacher training and professional development. However, more is already being done to achieve this. There is scope in the current regulations for guidance on these matters during teacher training and for school-based guidance to be established in the induction period for new teachers. We are currently reviewing the criteria that govern teacher training courses and are carrying out a wider review of teacher training in Wales. Amendment 2 therefore would be a redundant addition to the motion. It may also be the case that these issues and teacher trainees' awareness of them could be developed further in the teacher training curriculum.

With the multi-agency approach adopted by the voluntary sector, and the acknowledgement that the number of affected children will only decrease when the number of problem drug users decreases, it is vital that we look to reflect multi-agency working in our programmes and policies in the interests of integrated support for drug users and their families across Wales.

Gwenda Thomas: Yng nghyd-destun y ddadl hon, a chan fod heddiw yn ddiwrnod heddwch ac ewyllys da, mae'n bwrpasol—ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch chi i gyd yn ymuno â mi yn hyn—i longyfarch plant Ysgol Gyfun Treorci am lunio neges heddwch ac ewyllys da 2005 gan ieuencid Cymru i ieuencid y byd. Cyhoeddir a hyrwyddir y neges gan Urdd Gobaith Cymru.

It is worth taking a moment to consider the title of the report, 'Hidden Harm', and to reflect upon the suffering of a child who is hiding abuse and neglect, whatever its cause. I have asked myself the question, 'How much of this harm is really hidden?' How many of us have witnessed an incident in the schoolyard or in the supermarket, but have decided that we should not interfere? How many times has a grandmother been branded a 'domineering so-and-so' by officialdom,

dylai pob ysgol enwi o leiaf un person wedi ei ddynodi a'i hyfforddi sy'n gallu delio â phroblemau a all godi am fod rhieni'n defnyddio cyffuriau ymhlith rhieni, ac y dylai hyfforddiant fod yn rhan o hyfforddiant athrawon a datblygiad proffesiynol. Fodd bynnag, mae mwy eisoes yn cael ei wneud i gyflawni hyn. Mae cyfle yn y rheoliadau cyfredol ar gyfer arweiniad yn y materion hyn yn ystod hyfforddiant athrawon, ac i ganllawiau yn yr ysgol gael eu sefydlu yn ystod y cyfnod sefydlu i athrawon newydd. Yr ydym wrthi'n adolygu'r meini prawf sy'n rheoli cyrsiau hyfforddi athrawon, ac yr ydym yn gwneud adolygiad ehangach o hyfforddiant athrawon yng Nghymru. Byddai gwelliant 2, felly, yn ychwanegiad diangen i'r cynnig. Gall fod hefyd y gallai'r materion hyn ac ymwybyddiaeth athrawon dan hyfforddiant ohonynt gael eu datblygu ymhellach yn y cwricwlwm hyfforddi athrawon.

O ystyried yr ymagwedd aml-asiantaeth sydd wedi ei mabwysiadu gan y sector gwirfoddol, a'r gydnabyddiaeth y bydd nifer y plant yr effeithir arnynt yn gostwng dim ond pan fydd nifer y bobl sydd â phroblem gyffuriau yn gostwng, mae'n hanfodol inni geisio adlewyrchu gwaith aml-asiantaeth yn ein rhaglenni a'n polisïau, er mwyn rhoi cymorth integredig i bobl sy'n defnyddio cyffuriau ac i'w teuluoedd ledled Cymru.

Gwenda Thomas: In the context of this debate, and since this is a day of peace and goodwill, it is appropriate—and I am sure you will all join me in this—to congratulate children from Treorchy Comprehensive School on writing the message of peace and goodwill for 2005 from the youth of Wales to the youth of the world. The message is issued and promoted by Urdd Gobaith Cymru.

Mae'n werth oedi am eiliad i ystyried teitl yr adroddiad, 'Niwed Cudd', ac i ystyried dioddefaint plentyn sy'n cuddio camdriniaeth ac esgeulustod, beth bynnag fo'r achos. Yr wyf wedi holi fy hun, 'Faint o'r niwed hwn sy'n gudd mewn gwirionedd?' Faint ohonom sydd wedi gweld digwyddiad ar iard yr ysgol neu mewn archfarchnad, ond sydd wedi penderfynu na ddylem ymyrryd? Sawl gwaith y cafodd mam-gu ei chyhuddo o fod yn 'rhy fusneslyd' gan swyddogion, er mai'r bwriad

when often the intention has been to protect a dearly loved child? How alert are we at identifying a child carer who desperately needs support? I might have told you before about the highways engineer who worked on a road building project in my constituency, who took the trouble to contact me when I chaired the Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council Social Services Committee because of his concern for a brother and sister who were late leaving home for school, and who, some days, carried heavy bags of shopping home. These children had come to his attention because the access to their home had been disrupted by the highway works. It transpired that the older of these children was caring for their mother—a single parent who had a serious addiction problem. The caring action of that engineer served to improve the welfare and prospects of that family.

I may also have mentioned how impressed I was upon discovering that the training of firefighters by the Mid and West Wales Fire and Rescue Service includes training on child protection policy. Where firefighters become aware, having attended an incident, that children are at risk of harm due to the lifestyles of adults who live with them, they are trained to make a referral to social services. Often, the vigilance of neighbours, teachers, primary health personnel, police, firefighters and so on, can make a vast difference to the protection of a vulnerable child. However, I am impressed by the way in which the advisory panel, set up by Edwina Hart, has responded to the 48 recommendations made by the advisory council. This council was established by the Misuse of Drugs Act 1971. The advisory panel has developed a framework for action, having classed the 48 recommendations into five themes. This is refreshing and is to be applauded. The document is easy to read, but the implementation of the action plan will be a challenge. The Welsh Assembly Government has agreed this framework and has set up, as Janice Gregory said, a steering group to lead and monitor the implementation of the recommendations of 'Hidden Harm'. This is to be welcomed. Five implementation groups are also to be established. Jane Hutt's role, as Minister for children, with co-

yn aml oedd amddiffyn plentyn yr oedd yn ei garu o waelod calon? Pa mor effro yr ydym i weld bod angen cymorth gwirioneddol ar blentyn sy'n gofalu am rywun? Efallai imi ddweud wrthyhych o'r blaen am y peiriannydd ffyrdd a oedd yn gweithio ar brosiect adeiladu ffyrdd yn fy etholaeth. Aeth i'r drafferth o gysylltu â mi pan oeddwn yn cadeirio Pwyllgor Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Castell-nedd Port Talbot am ei fod yn poeni am frawd a chwaer a oedd yn hwyr yn gadael eu cartref i fynd i'r ysgol ac a fyddai, ambell ddiwrnod, yn cario bagiau siopa trwm adref. Yr oedd y plant hyn wedi dod i'w sylw am fod y gwaith ar y briffordd yn amharu ar y mynediad i'w cartref. Daeth yn amlwg fod yr hynaf o'r plant hyn yn gofalu am eu mam—rhiant sengl a oedd â phroblem ddifrifol o fod yn gaeth i gyffuriau. Oherwydd natur ofalgar y peiriannydd hwnnw, bu gwelliant yn lles a rhagolygon y teulu hwnnw.

Efallai imi grybwyll hefyd mor falch yr oeddwn o glywed bod hyfforddiant diffoddwyr tân gan Wasanaeth Tân ac Achub Canolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru yn cynnwys hyfforddiant ar bolisi amddiffyn plant. Pan fydd diffoddwyr tân, ar ôl ymateb i alwad, yn dod yn ymwybodol bod plant mewn perygl o niwed o ganlyniad i ffyrdd o fyw oedolion sy'n byw gyda hwy, cânt eu hyfforddi i atgyfeirio'r plant at y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Gall gwyliadwriaeth cymdogion, athrawon, personél iechyd sylfaenol, yr heddlu, diffoddwyr tân ac ati, yn aml wneud gwahaniaeth wrth amddiffyn plentyn sy'n agored i niwed. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn edmygu'r ffordd y mae'r panel cynghori, a sefydlwyd gan Edwina Hart, wedi ymateb i'r 48 o argymhellion a wnaed gan y cyngor cynghori. Sefydlwyd y cyngor hwn gan Ddeddf Camddefnyddio Cyffuriau 1971. Mae'r panel cynghori wedi datblygu fframwaith gweithredu, ac wedi dosbarthu'r 48 o argymhellion yn bum thema. Mae hyn yn rhywbeth newydd ac y mae i'w ganmol. Mae'r ddogfen yn hawdd ei darllen, ond bydd rhoi'r cynllun gweithredu ar waith yn her. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi cytuno ar y fframwaith hwn, ac fel y dywedodd Janice Gregory mae wedi sefydlu grŵp llywio i arwain a monitro'r broses o weithredu'r argymhellion yn 'Niwed Cudd'. Mae hyn i'w groesawu. Bwriedir sefydlu

ordinating responsibilities, will be key to a successful outcome. However, I would welcome a ministerial commitment that the advisory council's recommendation 6 will be implemented so that the voices of the children of problem drug users will be heard and listened to, and the action framework will be taken forward from a child's perspective.

3.50 p.m.

The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart): William Graham's contribution on the reality of life in some families sets the scene for this afternoon's debate about the difficulties that arise between siblings and parents and how those difficulties impact on some of these youngsters throughout their lives.

It was nice of Gwenda to start with a message of peace and goodwill from the Urdd to the rest of the world. All of this is about children and our duty to them. I thought that it took a particularly philosophical overview, but what you said linked in nicely with William Graham's point about our shared responsibilities on this—we all have a responsibility, in some way, to help with these issues.

I thank you for complimenting the framework, which I think is very good. I think that how we implement it will also be good. However, ultimately, the proof of that will be whether or not we can get these recommendations out into the real world and have them implemented properly so that it will not be 'hidden harm', but a justice agenda for these children.

I am pleased that I am taking this forward jointly with Jane Hutt, because implementing the report's recommendations is a massive task, which cuts across many portfolios. Therefore, it is good that it has been given the priority of being taken through a Cabinet sub-committee. It has already been discussed in Cabinet, as Jane indicated, which shows the high priority that it has been given.

pum grŵp gweithredu hefyd. Bydd rôl Jane Hutt, fel y Gweinidog dros blant sydd â chyfrifoldebau cydgysylltiedig, yn allweddol i sicrhau canlyniad llwyddiannus. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn croesawu ymrwymiad gan y gweinidog y bydd argymhelliaid 6 gan y cyngor cynghori yn cael ei weithredu er mwyn i leisiau plant i rieni sydd â phroblem gyffuriau gael eu clywed ac y byddwn yn gwrandao arnynt, ac y caiff y fframwaith gweithredu ei gyflwyno o safbwynt plentyn.

Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart): Mae cyfraniad William Graham ar realiti bywyd mewn rhai teuluoedd yn gosod y llwyfan ar gyfer y ddadl y prynhawn yma am yr anawsterau sy'n codi rhwng brodyr a chwiorydd a rhieni, a sut y mae'r anawsterau hynny'n effeithio ar rai o'r bobl ifanc hyn drwy gydol eu bywyd.

Braf oedd clywed Gwenda yn dechrau gyda neges o heddwch ac ewyllys da gan yr Urdd i weddill y byd. Mae a wnelo hyn oll â phlant a'n dyletswydd iddynt. Yr oeddwn yn meddwl bod y neges wedi rhoi trosolwg athronyddol iawn, ond yr oedd yr hyn a ddywedasoeh yn cysylltu'n dda â phwynt William Graham am ein cyfrifoldeb ni bob un yn hyn—mae gennym oll gyfrifoldeb, mewn rhyw ffordd neu'i gilydd, i helpu gyda'r materion hyn.

Diolch ichi am ganmol y fframwaith. Mae'n un da iawn yn fy marn i. Credaf y bydd y ffordd y byddwn yn ei weithredu yn dda hefyd. Fodd bynnag, yn y pen draw, y prawf fydd pa un a allwn gyflwyno'r argymhellion hyn yn y byd go iawn a'u gweithredu'n briodol fel na fydd 'niwed cudd', ond yn hytrach agenda o gyfiawnder i'r plant hyn.

Yr wyf yn falch o fod yn cyflwyno hyn ar y cyd â Jane Hutt, gan fod gweithredu argymhellion yr adroddiad yn dasg enfawr, sy'n torri ar draws llawer portffolio. Felly, mae'n beth da iddo gael y flaenoriaeth o'i gyflwyno drwy is-bwyllgor y Cabinet. Fe'i trafodwyd eisoes yn y Cabinet, fel y dywedodd Jane, sy'n dangos y flaenoriaeth uchel a roddwyd iddo.

The voice of the child is crucial to the deliberations on this report. Rhodri Glyn also referred to the voice of the child from the perspective of other discussions that we have had today, particularly with the children's commissioner, on other issues in the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee. It is important to highlight safeguarding the children of substance misusers, which I will do in the forthcoming guidance to the new local safeguarding children boards. Local substance misuse teams should be invited to attend area child protection committees and the other new boards. Advocacy is essential, and I think everyone made this point, to safeguard children and protect them from poor practice or harm. To ensure that children have a voice we are extending advocacy to children in health services. It is particularly important in social care and education settings. A task group has been set up to make recommendations on the future provision of advocacy in those services.

Joint working to provide a whole-systems approach to the focus on preventative services, by provision of early intervention before a crisis occurs, is essential to safeguard children. Keeping the family unit together and preventing children from having to go into local authority care is also a key issue. The Children Act 2004 will strengthen local children and young people's partnerships so that they can better plan children's services at a local level across key agencies. So there are many issues there that we can address.

It is important to look at good practice that allows the voice of the child to be heard. It is also important that we evaluate training programmes in which all people are involved in the evaluation. Rhodri Glyn also alluded to the commissioner's role in the youth justice scheme, where people sometimes end up. I have been strong on the role of the children's commissioner. I do not want to get into arguments or discussions that may have gone across the border. If the commissioner is welcome to visit young offenders in Parc Prison, I will certainly not stand in his way.

Mae llais y plentyn yn hanfodol i'r trafodaethau ar yr adroddiad hwn. Cyfeiriodd Rhodri Glyn hefyd at lais y plentyn o safbwynt trafodaethau eraill a gawsom heddiw, yn enwedig gyda'r comisiynydd plant, ar faterion eraill yn y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio. Mae'n bwysig tynnu sylw at ddiogelu plant pobl sy'n camddefnyddio sylweddau, a gwnaf hynny yn y canllawiau a gaiff eu cyflwyno maes o law i'r byrddau lleol newydd ar ddiogelu plant. Dylid gwahodd timau lleol ar gamddefnyddio sylweddau i fynychu pwyllgorau ardal amddiffyn plant a'r byrddau newydd eraill. Mae eiriolaeth yn hanfodol, a chredaf fod pawb wedi gwneud y pwynt hwn, i ddiogelu plant a'u hamddiffyn rhag arferion gwael neu niwed. Er mwyn sicrhau bod gan blant lais, yr ydym yn ehangu eiriolaeth i blant mewn gwasanaethau ieuchyd. Mae'n arbennig o bwysig mewn lleoliadau gofal cymdeithasol ac addysg. Sefydlwyd tasglu i wneud argymhellion ar ddarparu eiriolaeth yn y gwasanaethau hynny yn y dyfodol.

Mae gweithio ar y cyd i ddarparu ymagwedd sy'n cynnwys yr holl systemau wrth ganolbwyntio ar wasanaethau ataliol, drwy ymyrryd yn gynnar cyn i argyfwng ddigwydd, yn hanfodol er mwyn diogelu plant. Mae cadw'r uned deuluol gyda'i gilydd ac atal plant rhag gorfod mynd i ofal awdurdod lleol hefyd yn fater allweddol. Bydd Deddf Plant 2004 yn atgyfnerthu partneriaethau lleol i blant a phobl ifanc fel y gallant gynllunio gwasanaethau plant yn well ar lefel leol ar draws asiantaethau allweddol. Felly, mae yma nifer o faterion y gallwn fynd i'r afael â hwy.

Mae'n bwysig edrych ar arfer da sy'n caniatáu i lais y plentyn gael ei glywed. Mae'n bwysig hefyd inni werthuso rhaglenni hyfforddi lle mae pawb yn rhan o'r gwerthuso. Cyfeiriodd Rhodri Glyn hefyd at rôl y comisiynydd yn y cynllun cyfiawnder ieuencid, lle bydd pobl weithiau'n cyrraedd yn y pen draw. Bûm yn gadarn ar rôl y comisiynydd plant. Nid wyf am ddechrau dadleuon na thrafodaethau a allai fod wedi digwydd ar draws y ffin. Os oes croeso i'r comisiynydd ymweld â throseddwr ifanc yng Ngharchar y Parc, yn sicr ni fyddaf yn ei

It is important for children in Wales to have someone to whom they can talk and to have their voices heard on these issues.

Peter Black alluded to the role of schools in these discussions. It is important for us to recognise the role of schools in terms of offering a preventative approach through discussion. The continuing educational programmes that emphasise life skills have proved that you can have an impact on substance misuse problems and may prevent youngsters from misusing substances. We are keen to ensure the best possible vision of substance misuse education across Wales; that is key to making a real difference in tackling substance misuse. It is very important that schools are aware that these children sometimes need someone to talk to, which is an area that we must develop further within our discussions. These children should not be hidden—they need to have somewhere to go, wherever it may be, to talk to someone who is trained to understand these particular issues.

I welcome the fact that the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee is undertaking a review of substance misuse. The funds in the budget have increased 550 per cent between 2002-03 and 2007-08. In terms of resources, this is an ongoing issue, because small amounts of money in this fund can make a tremendous difference to the agenda. Janice Gregory, as Chair of the committee, has a particular interest in the review that we are undertaking, and she is right to look at this in terms of the service issues. We have a good model in the children and young people's framework, and I have received good ministerial support for a substance misuse treatment framework for children and young people, which will go out to consultation in March 2006, so that we can begin to address some of the issues.

Irene kindly complimented the successful Kaleidoscope project. Her contribution was also made on the basis of her experience as a teacher, and I welcome her commitment to recommendations 27 and 28, which are

rwystro. Mae'n bwysig i blant yng Nghymru gael rhywun y gallant siarad ag ef a bod eu lleisiau'n cael eu clywed ar y materion hyn.

Cyfeiriodd Peter Black at rôl ysgolion yn y trafodaethau hyn. Mae'n bwysig inni gydnabod rôl ysgolion wrth gynnig ymagwedd ataliol drwy drafod. Mae'r rhaglenni addysg barhaus sy'n pwysleisio sgiliau bywyd wedi profi y gallwch gael effaith ar broblemau camddefnyddio sylweddau ac y gallwch atal pobl ifanc rhag camddefnyddio sylweddau. Yr ydym yn awyddus i sicrhau'r weledigaeth orau sy'n bosibl o gael addysg ar gamddefnyddio sylweddau ledled Cymru; mae hynny'n allweddol i wneud gwahaniaeth go iawn wrth fynd i'r afael â chamddefnyddio sylweddau. Mae'n bwysig iawn i ysgolion fod yn ymwybodol fod ar y plant hyn weithiau angen rhywun i siarad ag ef neu hi, ac mae hwnnw'n faes y mae'n rhaid inni ei ddatblygu ymhellach o fewn ein trafodaethau. Ni ddylai'r plant hyn gael eu celu—mae angen iddynt gael rhywle i fynd, ble bynnag fydd hynny, i siarad â rhywun sydd wedi ei hyfforddi i ddeall y materion arbennig hyn.

Croesawaf y ffaith fod y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio yn gwneud adolygiad o gamddefnyddio sylweddau. Mae'r arian yn y gyllideb wedi cynyddu 550 y cant rhwng 2002-03 a 2007-08. O ran adnoddau, mae hwn yn fater parhaus, oherwydd gall symiau bach o arian yn y gronfa hon wneud gwahaniaeth enfawr i'r agenda. Mae gan Janice Gregory, fel Cadeirydd y pwyllgor, ddiddordeb arbennig yn yr adolygiad yr ydym yn ei wneud, ac mae'n iawn i edrych ar hyn o ran y materion gwasanaeth. Mae gennym batrwm da yn y fframwaith plant a phobl ifanc, ac yr wyf wedi cael cefnogaeth dda gan weinidogion ar gyfer fframwaith triniaeth camddefnyddio sylweddau i blant a phobl ifanc. Byddwn yn ymgynghori ar hwn ym mis Mawrth 2006, er mwyn inni allu dechrau mynd i'r afael â rhai o'r materion.

Mae Irene yn garedig wedi canmol llwyddiant y prosiect Kaleidoscope. Cyfrannodd hefyd ar sail ei phrofiad fel athrawes, a chroesawaf ei hymrwymiad i argymhellion 27 a 28, sy'n arbennig o bwysig

particularly important within this area.

yn y maes hwn.

Across the board, because we have discussed this issue in committee, there is general agreement that this is a good report, and that the recommendations need to be taken forward. I appreciate that people think that it has taken a long time, but the way in which we have implemented this, and discussed and drawn the strands together, is the right way to approach the issue. The proof now will be whether we can deliver it.

Mark Isherwood spoke about a number of issues in relation to how we must take matters forward, but we have been particularly proactive in dealing with this agenda across portfolios, and have had tremendous cross-party support. It is a welcome report, and it has been a welcome debate, because we do not want these children to be hidden, as Gwenda Thomas said. They are out there, we can see them, and it is our duty to do something to help these children. I hope that this report will go some way towards doing that.

Yn gyffredinol, gan ein bod wedi trafod y mater hwn yn y pwyllgor, mae yna gytundeb cyffredinol fod hwn yn adroddiad da, a bod angen gweithredu ar yr argymhellion. Deallaf fod pobl yn credu ei fod wedi cymryd amser hir, ond y ffordd yr ydym wedi gweithredu hyn, ac wedi trafod a dod â'r darnau at ei gilydd, yw'r ffordd iawn o ymdrin â'r mater. Y prawf yn awr fydd a allwn ei gyflawni.

Soniodd Mark Isherwood am nifer o faterion mewn perthynas â'r ffordd y dylem symud pethau ymlaen. Ond yr oeddem yn arbennig o ragweithiol wrth ddelio â'r agenda hon ar draws portffolios, a chawsom gefnogaeth enfawr ar draws y pleidiau. Mae'n adroddiad sy'n cael croeso, a bu'n drafodaeth a gafodd groeso, oherwydd nid ydym am i'r plant hyn fod ynghudd, fel y dywedodd Gwenda Thomas. Maent allan yna, a gallwn eu gweld, a'n dyletswydd ni yw gwneud rhywbeth i helpu'r plant hyn. Gobeithio y bydd yr adroddiad hwn yn llwyddo i ryw raddau i wneud hynny.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 1: For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene

Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 2: For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn

Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment carried.*

Cynnig NDM2451 fel y'i diwygiwyd:
 Motion NDM2451 as amended:

the National Assembly for Wales

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

1. notes the recommendations from the Advisory Panel on Substance Misuse to the report 'Hidden Harm—responding to the needs of children of problem drug users';

1. yn nodi argymhellion y Panel Ymgynghori ar Gamddefnyddio Sylweddau ar yr adroddiad 'Niwed Cudd—ymateb i anghenion plant defnyddwyr cyffuriau';

2. believes that the roll-out of broadband in Wales should ensure full value for money, and an open and wholly competitive process in delivering broadband infrastructure; and

2. yn credu y dylai'r gwaith o gyflwyno band eang yng Nghymru sicrhau gwerth llawn am arian, a phroses agored a chwbl gystadleuol wrth gyflwyno seilwaith band eang; ac

3. calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to review its guidance on teachers' training so as to ensure that newly qualified teachers are given the skills to identify and take action on children who are affected by parental substance misuse. (NDM2451)

3. yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i adolygu ei arweiniad ar hyfforddi athrawon er mwyn sicrhau y caiff athrawon newydd gymhwyso y sgiliau i adnabod a chymryd camau i gynorthwyo plant yr effeithir arnynt gan y ffaith bod eu rhieni yn camddefnyddio sylweddau. (NDM2451)

*Cynnig NDM2451 fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
 Motion NDM2451 as amended: For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter

Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd cynnig NDM2451 fel y'i diwygiwyd.
Motion NDM2451 as amended carried.*

Band Eang Cymru Broadband Wales

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

The Minister for Economic Development and Transport (Andrew Davies): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth (Andrew Davies): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales notes the Welsh Assembly Government's commitment and effort in developing and extending broadband in Wales, and the strategic targets set out in the broadband Wales programme strategy 2005-07, which was launched in January 2005. (NDM2452)

Just under three years ago, in July 2002, I launched the five-year Broadband Wales programme. I said at the time that the programme represented a significant challenge for Wales, but also a tremendous opportunity. It would be an opportunity for us to take action in meeting a demanding set of objectives designed to give Wales a clear vision of where we needed to go to take full advantage of the benefits that broadband could offer. Our starting point was a complete understanding and recognition of the fact that to create what I have called a prosperous 'dragon' economy that is best in class requires us to have the broadband infrastructure to match.

The Broadband Wales programme has focused squarely upon delivering that first-class infrastructure, through targeted interventions to address demand and supply-side deficiencies, and through a focused yet flexible approach capable of responding to the latest technological and regulatory advances we are equipping ourselves with the essential infrastructure to compete and win for Wales in the knowledge economy of today.

4.00 p.m.

In fewer than three years the programme has made a significant contribution to transforming for the better our broadband landscape. With two years of the programme still to run we have already achieved half of the eight original targets that we set ourselves. We have met and exceeded our target to reach 310,000 extra homes and 67,000 extra businesses. The latest figures show that broadband services are now available to at least 772,500 extra homes and 67,500 extra businesses. We have met and exceeded our target to broadband-enable an additional 1,200 public sector sites. As of March this year 1,649 sites, including schools, libraries and ICT learning centres, have access to broadband at a baseline of

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn nodi ymrwymiad ac ymdrech Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ddatblygu ac ehangu band eang yng Nghymru, a'r targedau strategol a amlinellwyd yn strategaeth rhaglen band eang Cymru 2005-07, a gafodd ei lansio ym mis Ionawr 2005. (NDM2452)

Gwta dair blynedd yn ôl, ym mis Gorffennaf 2002, lansiais y rhaglen bum mlynedd Band Eang Cymru. Dywedais ar y pryd fod y rhaglen yn her sylweddol i Gymru, ond ei bod hefyd yn gyfle gwych. Byddai'n gyfle inni gymryd camau i fodloni set heriol o amcanion wedi eu cynllunio i roi gweledigaeth glir i Gymru o'r hyn yr oedd angen inni ei wneud i fanteisio'n llawn ar y buddiannau y gallai band eang eu cynnig. Ein man cychwyn oedd dealltwriaeth a chydabyddiaeth lawn o'r ffaith, er mwyn creu'r hyn yr wyf wedi ei alw'n economi lewychus y 'ddraig', fiod angen inni gael y seilwaith band eang i gyfateb i hynny.

Mae rhaglen Band Eang Cymru wedi canolbwyntio'n gadarn ar ddarparu'r seilwaith rhagorol hwnnw, drwy ymyriadau wedi'u targedu i fynd i'r afael â diffygion yn y galw a'r cyflenwi. Drwy ymagwedd benodol ond hyblyg a fydd yn gallu ymateb i'r datblygiadau technolegol a rheoliadol diweddaraf, yr ydym yn darparu'r seilwaith hanfodol inni allu cystadlu ac ennill dros Gymru yn yr economi wybodaeth sydd ohoni.

Mewn llai na thair blynedd, mae'r rhaglen wedi gwneud cyfraniad sylweddol i drawsnewid ein tirwedd band eang er gwell. Gyda dwy flynedd o'r rhaglen ar ôl, yr ydym eisoes wedi cyflawni hanner yr wyth targed gwreiddiol a bennwyd gennym. Yr ydym wedi cyrraedd ein targed i gyrraedd 310,000 o gartrefi ychwanegol a 67,000 o fusnesau ychwanegol ac wedi rhagori ar y targed hwnnw. Dengys y ffigurau diweddaraf fod gwasanaethau band eang ar gael yn awr i o leiaf 772,500 o gartrefi ychwanegol a 67,500 o fusnesau ychwanegol. Yr ydym wedi cyrraedd ein targed i sicrhau bod cysylltiad band eang mewn 1,200 o safleoedd sector cyhoeddus ychwanegol ac wedi rhagori ar y targed hwnnw. Ers mis Mawrth eleni, mae

either 2 or 8Mbps, which represents a seismic increase from the 156 sites that had such access just three years ago.

In the public sector, NHS Wales continues to reap the benefits of a broadband-enabled service. All GPs now have broadband access through the digital all-Wales network 2. Some 75 sites are enabled for video communication—something that benefits accident and emergency and minor injury departments in particular, and allows doctors to do remote diagnostic tests. This is, once again, proof of broadband making a real difference to our quality of life and the ability of our public services to meet our needs.

However, because we recognise that infrastructure is not an end in itself, the Broadband Wales programme has driven forward, and will continue to drive forward, demand-side activities that complement what is happening on the supply side. Therefore, that infrastructure is not only there, but is being used.

The marketing campaign, which began in earnest towards the end of last year, is fundamental to increasing awareness of broadband and its benefits. Poster and bus advertising campaigns along with regular press focused activity and direct mailing have done much to raise the profile of broadband and the use of this new technology. There is a continuing online presence available through the Broadband Wales website, which on average receives 308 hits per week, increasing to 626 hits per week during a period of intense media activity.

In common with all technological environments, broadband is extremely fast changing. The market, the technology, and the regulatory environment are subject to almost continual change. In the face of that change, we cannot afford to stand still; we

1,649 o safleoedd, gan gynnwys ysgolion, llyfrgelloedd a chanolfannau dysgu TGCh, yn gallu cael band eang ar linell sylfaen o naill ai 2 neu 8Mbps, sy'n gynydd aruthrol o'r 156 o safleoedd a oedd â chysylltiad o'r fath ddim ond tair blynedd yn ôl.

Yn y sector cyhoeddus, mae GIG Cymru yn parhau i elwa o wasanaeth sy'n cael ei alluogi gan fand eang. Gall pob meddyg teulu ddefnyddio band eang erbyn hyn drwy rwydwaith digidol Cymru gyfan 2. Mae tua 75 o safleoedd wedi'u galluogi i gyfathrebu ar fideo—rhywbeth sy'n fuddiol i adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys ac adrannau mân anafiadau yn arbennig, ac mae'n caniatáu i feddygon wneud profion diagnostig o bell. Mae hyn, unwaith eto, yn profi bod band eang yn gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol i ansawdd ein bywyd a gallu ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus i ddiwallu ein hanghenion.

Fodd bynnag, oherwydd ein bod yn cydnabod nad yw seilwaith yn ddiben ynddo'i hun, mae'r rhaglen Band Eang Cymru wedi hyrwyddo gweithgareddau'n seiliedig ar alw sy'n ategu'r hyn sy'n digwydd o ran cyflenwi, a bydd hynny'n parhau. Felly, yn ogystal â bod yn bresennol, mae'r seilwaith hwnnw hefyd yn cael ei ddefnyddio.

Mae'r ymgyrch farchnata, a ddechreuodd o ddifrif ddiwedd y llynedd, yn hanfodol i wneud pobl yn fwy ymwybodol o fand eang a'i fanteision. Mae ymgyrchoedd hysbysebu ar ffurf posteri neu ar fsys, ynghyd â gweithgarwch rheolaidd sy'n canolbwyntio ar y wasg ac ymgyrch bostio uniongyrchol, wedi gwneud llawer i godi proffil band eang a'r defnydd a wneir o'r dechnoleg newydd hon. Mae presenoldeb ar-lein parhaus ar gael drwy wefan Band Eang Cymru, a honno, ar gyfartaledd, yn cael 308 o ymwelwyr yr wythnos, sy'n codi i 626 o ymwelwyr yr wythnos yn ystod cyfnod o weithgarwch mawr ar y cyfryngau.

Fel pob amgylchedd technolegol, mae band eang yn newid yn gyflym iawn. Mae'r farchnad, y dechnoleg a'r amgylchedd rheoleiddio yn agored i newidiadau parhaus bron. Yn wyneb hyn, ni allwn fforddio bod yn segur; rhaid inni allu cydnabod sut y

have to be able to recognise how these changes affect our approach and be adaptable and responsive to them. That is why, partly in response to the rapidly changing broadband environment and the progress that we have already made, I launched a revised strategy with further ambitious targets for 2005-07. The full comprehensive list of targets is available in the broadband strategy document. These include ensuring that the take-up of first-generation broadband in Wales is at least equal to the UK average.

Recent surveying of the Welsh consumer population has proven that broadband take-up, for connection speeds in excess of 512Kbps, has increased, in a year, from 11 to 17 per cent; that is encouraging news.

On the business front, 27 per cent of all Welsh businesses have a broadband connection—again at speeds in excess of 512Kbps. With larger businesses, this figure leaps dramatically to 82 per cent.

A further target to award a contract to allow homes, businesses and the voluntary sector to have access to first-generation broadband, focuses on an issue I know is of great concern to the population of Wales. With this in mind, my officials are continuing to work hard to progress the eagerly anticipated regional innovation broadband support programme project, in line with European Union state-aid rules. A public interest notice has been issued and some very positive responses have been received from suppliers.

Jocelyn Davies: Will you take an intervention on that point?

Andrew Davies: Yes.

Jocelyn Davies: I have received a letter from Ian Tooms of Chepstow in Monmouthshire. He lives within the recommended distance of an enabled exchange but cannot get broadband because he has a shared line. Many of us will remember shared telephone lines from decades ago, but some people in rural areas still have them. The first-class

mae'r newidiadau hyn yn effeithio ar ein hymagwedd, a rhaid inni allu addasu ac ymateb iddynt. Dyna pam, yn rhannol mewn ymateb i'r amgylchedd band eang sy'n newid yn gyflym a'r cynnydd yr ydym eisoes wedi'i wneud, yr wyf wedi lansio strategaeth ddiwygiedig gyda rhagor o dargedau uchelgeisiol ar gyfer 2005-07. Mae'r rhestr gynhwysfawr lawn o dargedau ar gael yn y ddogfen strategaeth band eang. Ymhlith y rhain mae sicrhau bod nifer y bobl sy'n cael cenhedlaeth gyntaf band eang yng Nghymru o leiaf yn gyfartal â'r cyfartaledd yn y DU.

Mae arolygon o ddefnyddwyr Cymru yn ddiweddar wedi profi bod nifer y bobl sy'n cael band eang, ar gyfer cyflymderau cysylltu o fwy na 512Kbps, wedi cynyddu, mewn blwyddyn, o 11 y cant i 17 y cant; mae hynny'n newyddion calonogol.

O ran busnesau, mae gan 27 y cant o holl fusnesau Cymru gysylltiad band eang—eto ar gyflymderau o fwy na 512Kbps. O ran busnesau mwy o faint, mae'r ffigur hwn yn cynyddu'n sylweddol i 82 y cant.

Mae targed pellach, i ddyfarnu contract i alluogi cartrefi, busnesau a'r sector gwirfoddol i gael mynediad i genhedlaeth gyntaf band eang, yn canolbwyntio ar fater y gwn ei fod yn peri pryder mawr i bobl Cymru. O gofio hyn, mae fy swyddogion yn parhau i weithio'n galed i ddatblygu'r prosiect cymorth band eang arloesol rhanbarthol sydd â disgwyl eiddgar amdano, yn unol â rheolau'r Undeb Ewropeaidd ar gymorth y wladwriaeth. Cyhoeddwyd hysbysiad lles y cyhoedd a chafwyd rhai ymatebion cadarnhaol iawn gan gyflenwyr.

Jocelyn Davies: A dderbyniwch ymyriad ar y pwynt hwnnw?

Andrew Davies: Gwnaf.

Jocelyn Davies: Yr wyf wedi cael llythyr gan Ian Tooms o Gas-gwent yn sir Fynwy. Mae'n byw o fewn y pellter a argymhellir i gyfnewidfa sydd wedi ei galluogi, ond ni all gael band eang am fod ganddo linell a rennir. Bydd nifer ohonom yn cofio llinellau ffôn yn cael eu rhannu, fel y defnyddid ddegawdau yn ôl. Ond mae rhai pobl mewn ardaloedd

infrastructure that you talk of is not available to this individual. We know that BT is the sole provider of telephone lines in the UK, so will you use your good offices to persuade BT to look at this issue, to see whether it can give people who still share lines in rural areas, access to have a broadband connection?

Andrew Davies: I am sure, Jocelyn, that other telecommunication providers will be surprised to hear that BT is the sole provider of telecommunications in Wales.

Jocelyn Davies: It is of lines.

Andrew Davies: There is a list of a large number of suppliers providing telecommunication infrastructure in cable, wireless and so on. That point notwithstanding, I have taken up issues regarding shared lines with BT that Members—many of whom are here today—have raised with me. Ultimately, provision is a matter for those private companies; nevertheless, where there is a failure in the market, rather than a technological program, which this essentially is, where it is appropriate for the public sector to intervene, and where we can help create a market, then we will do so. I take the point that BT is by far the dominant supplier.

To return to the point about the RIBS project, which is addressing some of the deficiencies in the market's provision for the Welsh network, the European Union has been notified of it. State-aid issues are extremely complex, they are not a fixed issue, they constantly move as the market develops. Nevertheless, the European Union has been notified of this project, and I am hopeful that the project will soon be approved for state-aid clearance.

Alun Cairns: Those same European regulations apply to Scotland and to Northern Ireland, so why have they been able to overcome those regulations? Northern Ireland has already completed 100 per cent broadband coverage, and Scotland

gwledig yn dal i'w defnyddio. Nid yw'r seilwaith o'r radd flaenaf y soniwyd amdano ar gael i'r unigolyn hwn. Gwyddom mai BT yw'r unig ddarparwr llinellau ffôn yn y DU, felly, a fydddech cystal â cheisio darbwyllo BT i ystyried y mater hwn, i weld a all roi mynediad i gysylltiad band eang i bobl sy'n dal i rannu llinellau mewn ardaloedd gwledig?

Andrew Davies: Yr wyf yn siŵr, Jocelyn, y bydd darparwyr telathrebu eraill yn synnu o glywed mai BT yw'r unig ddarparwr telathrebu yng Nghymru.

Jocelyn Davies: Ie, o ran llinellau.

Andrew Davies: Mae yna restr o nifer fawr o gyflenwyr sy'n darparu seilwaith telathrebu ar ffurf cebl, diwifr, ac ati. Serch hynny, yr wyf wedi codi gyda BT faterion rhannu llinellau y mae Aelodau—ac mae nifer ohonynt yma heddiw—wedi'u codi gyda mi. Yn y pen draw, y cwmnïau preifat hynny sy'n gyfrifol am y ddarpariaeth. Serch hynny, lle mae methiant yn y farchnad, yn hytrach nag mewn rhaglen dechnolegol, fel sydd yma yn y bôn, lle mae'n briodol i'r sector cyhoeddus ymyrryd, a lle gallwn helpu creu marchnad, yna byddwn yn gwneud hynny. Yr wyf yn cytuno â'r pwynt mai BT yw'r prif gyflenwr o bell ffordd.

I ddychwelyd at y pwynt am y prosiect cymorth band eang arloesol rhanbarthol, sy'n mynd i'r afael â rhai o'r diffygion yn narpariaeth y farchnad ar gyfer y rhwydwaith yng Nghymru, hysbyswyd yr Undeb Ewropeaidd amdano. Mae materion sy'n ymwneud â chymorth y wladwriaeth yn hynod o gymhleth; nid ydynt yn faterion sefydlog, maent yn newid yn gyson wrth i'r farchnad ddatblygu. Serch hyn, hysbyswyd yr Undeb Ewropeaidd am y prosiect hwn, a gobeithio y caiff y prosiect ei gymeradwyo'n fuan i'w glirio ar gyfer cymorth y wladwriaeth.

Alun Cairns: Mae'r un rheoliadau Ewropeaidd hynny'n gymwys i'r Alban ac i Ogledd Iwerddon. Felly, pam maent wedi llwyddo i oresgyn y rheoliadau hynny? Mae Gogledd Iwerddon eisoes wedi sicrhau bod gan bawb gysylltiad band eang, ac mae'r

has committed to public investment in order to achieve 100 per cent broadband connectivity. Why is Wales yet again lagging behind?

Andrew Davies: That is not true. Even when the latest intervention by the Scottish Executive will have been delivered, it will deliver lower coverage than we will achieve by the end of this summer, when BT completes its ADSL-enabled exchanges. All but 35 exchanges will be covered by BT's roll-out programme, and I am confident that the RIBS project will take up the remaining deficiencies in the market.

The regulatory system is extremely complex, and each project has to be considered on its merits. The geography of a country is a major determinant. Scotland and Northern Ireland are different from Wales. I know that the opposition always wants to do down Wales, but by the end of this summer—the RIBS project aside—Wales will, to a large extent, be ahead of the rest of the UK in terms of its coverage.

Alun Cairns: Will you give way?

Andrew Davies: No, I do not have enough time.

In conclusion, I believe that the broadband Wales programme has been extremely successful, but I am by no means complacent. There is still considerable distance to travel before we achieve our ambitions. I am, however, confident that the broadband programme continues to underpin our desire for a stronger Welsh economy and keeps us on track to realising the 'A Winning Wales' vision of a stronger, more sustainable and prosperous economy. We have seen significant advances in both take-up of, and access to, broadband services, and I hope that you will join me in acknowledging the progress made to date towards the programme's aim of a truly broadband Wales.

Alban wedi ymrwymo i fuddsoddiad cyhoeddus er mwyn sicrhau bod gan bawb gysylltiad â band eang. Pam mae Cymru ar ei hôl hi unwaith eto?

Andrew Davies: Nid yw hynny'n wir. Hyd yn oed pan fydd yr ymyriad diweddaraf gan Weithrediaeth yr Alban wedi ei gyflawni, bydd yn darparu cysylltiad i lai o bobl nag a fyddwn ni erbyn diwedd yr haf, pan fydd BT yn cwblhau ei gyfnewidfeydd sy'n cael eu galluogi gan ADSL. Bydd pob un ond 35 o gyfnewidfeydd yn cael eu cynnwys gan raglen gyflwyno BT, a hyderaf y bydd y prosiect cymorth band eang arloesol rhanbarthol yn mynd i'r afael â'r diffygion eraill yn y farchnad.

Mae'r system reoleiddio yn hynod o gymhleth, a rhaid i bob prosiect gael ei ystyried yn ôl ei rinweddau ei hun. Mae daearyddiaeth gwlad yn elfen bwysig iawn wrth benderfynu. Mae'r Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon yn wahanol i Gymru. Gwn fod y gwrthbleidiau bob amser yn awyddus i fychanu Cymru, ond erbyn diwedd yr haf eleni—heb ystyried y prosiect cymorth band eang arloesol rhanbarthol—bydd Cymru, i raddau helaeth, ar y blaen i weddill y DU o ran cysylltiad â band eang.

Alun Cairns: A wnewch ildio?

Andrew Davies: Na wna, nid oes gennyf ddigon o amser.

I gloi, credaf fod rhaglen band eang Cymru wedi bod yn llwyddiannus iawn, ond nid wyf yn hunanfodlon o bell ffordd. Mae llawer o waith i'w wneud o hyd cyn inni gyflawni ein huchelgeisiau. Fodd bynnag, hyderaf fod y rhaglen band eang yn parhau i ategu ein hawydd am economi gryfach yng Nghymru ac yn ein cadw ar y trywydd iawn i wireddu'r weledigaeth yn 'Cymru'n Ennill, sef economi gryfach sy'n fwy cynaliadwy a ffyniannus. Yr ydym wedi gweld cynnydd sylweddol yn nifer y bobl sy'n cael gwasanaethau band eang, a mynediad i'r gwasanaethau hynny, a gobeithio y byddwch yn ymuno â mi i gydnabod y cynnydd a wnaed hyd yma tuag at gyflawni nod y rhaglen o gael Cymru sydd â chysylltiad llawn â band eang.

Jenny Randerson: I propose amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

believes that the roll-out of broadband in Wales should ensure full value for money, and an open and wholly competitive process in delivering broadband infrastructure.

This is a fascinating topic, simply because of the speed of the development of the technology and of the market as a whole. Looking back at the original documents, such as ‘Online for a Better Wales’ and at the Record of our previous debates, it is immediately obvious how far the debate has moved on. Even this document, produced in January this year—which, for some reason, we have not got around to debating until now—is being overtaken by events. When we have debated this issue in the past, we have concentrated on the extent of broadband availability, as the Minister did to a great extent now, with the emphasis being on the fact that it should be available to all. That issue has now been largely overcome, assuming that the RIBS project gets the go-ahead. However, I welcome today’s debate and the Minister’s clear commitment to move on. I welcome the opportunity to debate the big issues that now face us in the next phase of development.

4.10 p.m.

Reading through the programme strategy, one is immediately struck by the pivotal role of BT, to which Jocelyn has drawn attention, in the development of broadband. At every point, the pace of development has been managed by BT. For example, the fact that over 99 per cent of Welsh people can now access broadband is down to the speed at which BT has been prepared to enable the exchanges.

However, there are big issues ahead, which need to be addressed. The debate has now moved on to the speed of the broadband that is available. Band speeds suitable for domestic use are inadequate for even small businesses, and there is also the question of symmetry needed by many businesses, especially those high-value-added

Jenny Randerson: Cynigiaf welliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn credu y dylai'r gwaith o gyflwyno band eang yng Nghymru sicrhau gwerth llawn am arian, a phroses agored a chwbl gystadleuol wrth gyflwyno seilwaith band eang.

Mae hwn yn bwnc diddorol, oherwydd cyflymder y dechnoleg a'r farchnad gyfan wrth ddatblygu. Gan edrych yn ôl ar y dogfennau gwreiddiol, megis ‘Cymru Ar-lein’, ac ar Gofnod ein dadleuon blaenorol, mae'n amlwg ar unwaith faint y mae'r ddadl wedi datblygu. Mae hyd yn oed y ddogfen hon, a gynhyrchwyd ym mis Ionawr eleni—ac am ryw reswm nid ydym wedi cael cyfle i'w thrafod tan heddiw—yn dechrau mynd yn hen erbyn hyn. Pan drafodwyd y broblem hon gennym yn y gorffennol, yr oeddem yn canolbwyntio ar y graddau y mae band eang ar gael, fel y gwnaeth y Gweinidog i raddau helaeth yn awr, gan bwysleisio'r ffaith y dylai fod ar gael i bawb. Mae'r broblem honno wedi'i goresgyn erbyn hyn i raddau helaeth, a bwrw y bydd y prosiect cymorth band eang arloesol rhanbarthol yn cael ei ganiatáu. Fodd bynnag, croesawaf y ddadl heddiw ac ymrwymiad amlwg y Gweinidog i symud ymlaen. Croesawaf y cyfle i drafod y materion pwysig sy'n ein hwynebu yn awr yn y cam datblygu nesaf.

Gan ddarllen drwy strategaeth y rhaglen, mae rôl ganolog BT yn y gwaith o ddatblygu band eang yn amlwg ar unwaith, ac mae Jocelyn eisoes wedi tynnu sylw at hyn. Ar bob cam, BT sydd wedi rheoli pa mor gyflym yw'r datblygu. Er enghraifft, mae'r ffaith fod dros 99 y cant o boblogaeth Cymru yn awr yn gallu cael mynediad i fand eang yn ganlyniad i gyflymdra BT i fod yn barod i alluogi'r cyfnewidfeydd.

Fodd bynnag, mae problemau mawr o'n blaenau, ac y mae angen mynd i'r afael â hwy. Mae'r ddadl bellach wedi symud ymlaen i drafod cyflymder y band eang sydd ar gael. Mae cyflymderau band sy'n addas i'w defnyddio yn y cartref yn annigonol ar gyfer busnesau bach hyd yn oed. Felly, rhaid ystyried y cymesuredd y mae ei angen ar

information-technology-based businesses that we so badly need to attract.

Therefore, we need to move on from ADSL to SDSL, but the condition of the basic infrastructure can prevent the higher speeds that are needed from being achieved. Distance from the exchange remains a particular issue in rural areas; in short, broadband is a great deal less fast and less efficient in rural areas. Therefore, we urgently need to discuss a wider variety of broadband provision, such as fibre optic cables, satellite, wireless technology, mobile telephone networks, 3G and then on to 4G, which will be with us soon. It is ironic that recent research by Point Topic shows that Wales has both the best and the worst broadband access in Britain. Cardiff has the highest take-up, partly due to NTL and its wi-fi project, and, in contrast, Meirionnydd Nant Conwy has the lowest availability in the UK and, therefore, the lowest take-up. There are six other rural Welsh constituencies among the bottom 10 in Britain, which should worry us. To overcome this problem, we need the widest range of technology available.

Another issue on which BT has played a major role is the speed of local loop unbundling. This is a key to the stimulation of greater competition in the wholesale broadband sector, which was, and is, disappointingly slow in Wales. In 2004, Ofcom announced the appointment of an independent telecoms adjudicator, whose job it is to establish better relations between BT and LLU operators. I hope that this will go ahead more cost effectively now that BT has cut the cost of LLU products, to bring them in line with the rest of Europe. However, Wales lags alarmingly behind the rest of the UK on this, and I would like to hear the Minister's comments on it. I have also raised here before the disappointingly slow development of wireless technology in Wales, and the need to stimulate this aspect.

lawer busnes, yn arbennig y busnesau hynny y mae angen dirfawr inni eu denu, sef busnesau'n seiliedig ar dechnoleg gwybodaeth sy'n ychwanegu gwerth sylweddol.

Felly, mae angen inni symud ymlaen o ADSL i SDSL, ond gall cyflwr y seilwaith sylfaenol atal cyflawni'r cyflymderau uwch y mae eu hangen. Mae pellter o'r gyfnewidfa yn dal yn broblem benodol mewn ardaloedd gwledig; yn fras, mae band eang lawer yn llai cyflym a llai effeithlon mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Felly, mae angen inni drafod amrywiaeth ehangach o ddarpariaeth band eang ar frys, megis ceblau ffeibr optig, lloerennau, technoleg diwifr, rhwydweithiau teleffonau symudol, 3G ac yna ymlaen i 4G, a fydd ar gael yn fuan. Mae'n eironig fod gwaith ymchwil yn ddiweddar gan Point Topic yn dangos mai yng Nghymru mae'r mynediad gorau a'r mynediad gwaethaf i fand eang ym Mhrydain. Yng Nghaerdydd y mae'r nifer fwyaf o bobl yn cael band eang, yn rhannol o ganlyniad i NTL a'i brosiect wif. I'r gwrthwyneb, Meirionnydd Nant Conwy sydd â'r ddarpariaeth leiaf yn y DU ac felly yno mae'r nifer leiaf o bobl sy'n cael band eang. Mae chwe etholaeth wledig arall yng Nghymru ymhlith y 10 gwaethaf ym Mhrydain, a ddylai beri pryder inni. I oresgyn y broblem hon, mae angen inni gael yr ystod ehangaf o dechnoleg sydd ar gael.

Mater arall y mae BT wedi chwarae rhan bwysig ynddo yw cyflymder dadfwnделu dolenni lleol. Mae hyn yn allweddol i ysgogi mwy o gystadleuaeth yn y sector band eang cyfanwerthu, a oedd, ac sydd, yn siomedig o araf yng Nghymru. Yn 2004, cyhoeddodd Ofcom ei fod wedi penodi dyfarnwr telathrebu annibynnol, sy'n gyfrifol am feithrin gwell perthynas rhwng BT a gweithredwyr Dadfwnделu Dolenni Lleol. Gobeithio y bydd hyn yn mynd rhagddo yn fwy effeithiol o ran cost gan fod BT yn awr wedi gostwng cost cynnyrch dadfwnделu dolenni lleol, i fod yr un fath â gweddill Ewrop. Fodd bynnag, mae Cymru ar ei hôl hi yn frawychus o'i chymharu â gweddill y DU yn y mater hwn, a hoffwn glywed sylwadau'r Gweinidog ar hyn. Yr wyf hefyd cyn hyn wedi codi yma y ffaith fod technoleg diwifr yn datblygu'n siomedig o araf yng Nghymru, a bod angen ysgogi'r agwedd hon.

On our amendment, the story of broadband has shown that a mixture of competition and Ofcom intervention have a major role to play in stimulating broadband roll-out. Without that, we would be moving at a much slower pace and a much higher price, which would not be best for Wales. Market operators do not find rural Wales as attractive as densely populated parts of south-east England, so the Assembly Government's role is crucial. Therefore, the amendment seeks to ensure that the projects and processes established by the Welsh Development Agency and the Labour Assembly Government are designed to ensure that the tendering process is straightforward and transparent, and allows robustly competitive tender from several companies.

Leighton Andrews: I start with my usual declaration that my wife is the director of BT in Wales, and is also a director of Better Business Wales, which is behind Opportunity Wales.

What I want to say today is based on 15 years' experience of working in the media, telecoms and technology industries, as an adviser or for companies who are competitors, suppliers or customers of companies such as BT. A debate on broadband strategy—a debate on any strategy—is an opportunity to look at what has worked well and to review what has perhaps worked less well in the context of that strategy. As the Minister said, there has been significant change in the situation in Wales in the past three years, and that is important. In a sense, we are moving from the debate on availability—and Jenny Randerson has just said that—to the issue of to what uses broadband is put. That is where we need to go in future, and that is also where the strategy needs to be directed in future.

In any strategy, we look for a clear market analysis, which means some understanding of the speed of supply, of the likely demand for certain kinds of services, and of what is needed to stimulate demand in particular

O ran ein gwelliant, mae hanes band eang wedi dangos bod gan gymysgedd o gystadleuaeth ac ymyriad Ofcom ran bwysig i'w chwarae i ysgogi'r gwaith o gyflwyno band eang. Heb hynny, byddem yn symud lawer yn arafach a byddai'n costio llawer mwy, ac nid hynny fyddai orau i Gymru. Nid yw gweithredwyr y farchnad yn ystyried bod cefn gwlad Cymru mor ddeniadol ag ardaloedd poblog iawn yn ne-ddwyrain Lloegr, ac felly mae rôl Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn allweddol. Felly, mae'r gwelliant yn ceisio sicrhau bod y prosiectau a'r prosesau sy'n cael eu sefydlu gan Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad wedi'u cynllunio i sicrhau bod y broses dendro yn syml ac yn eglur, ac yn caniatáu i nifer o gwmnïau gyflwyno tendrau cystadleuol iawn.

Leighton Andrews: Dechreuaf gyda'm datganiad arferol mai fy ngwraig yw cyfarwyddwr BT yng Nghymru, a chyfarwyddwr Gwell Busnes Cymru hefyd, sy'n gyfrifol am Cyfle Cymru.

Mae'r hyn yr wyf am ei ddweud heddiw yn seiliedig ar 15 mlynedd o brofiad o weithio yn y cyfryngau, y diwydiant telathrebu a'r diwydiant technoleg, fel cynghorydd neu i gwmnïau sy'n gystadleuwyr, yn gyflenwyr neu'n gwsmeriaid i gwmnïau fel BT. Mae dadl ar strategaeth band eang—dadl ar unrhyw strategaeth—yn gyfle i edrych ar hyn sydd wedi gweithio'n dda ac i adolygu'r hyn nad yw wedi gweithio cystal, efallai, yng nghyd-destun y strategaeth honno. Fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, mae newid mawr wedi bod yn y sefyllfa yng Nghymru yn ystod y tair blynedd diwethaf, ac mae hynny'n bwysig. Ar un ystyr, yr ydym yn symud oddi wrth y ddadl am allu cael band eang—ac mae Jenny Randerson newydd ddweud hynny—i drafod pa ddefnydd a wneir o fand eang. Dyna'r cyfeiriad y mae angen inni fynd yn y dyfodol, a dyna'r cyfeiriad hefyd y mae angen cyfeirio'r strategaeth yn y dyfodol.

Mewn unrhyw strategaeth, yr ydym yn edrych am ddadansoddiad clir o'r farchnad, sy'n golygu rhywfaint o ddealltwriaeth o gyflymder y cyflenwad, y galw tebygol am fathau penodol o wasanaethau, a'r hyn y mae

areas. We also look for a clear analysis of market failure, a clear understanding of the regulatory issues, and a clear focus on where we, as a National Assembly, can make a difference. On market understanding, the speed of market supply has outpaced the strategy in Wales. The roll-out of broadband has exceeded what people expected only two or three years ago. With regard to understanding the market, it is also important to understand the uses to which the technology can be put. The reality is that the technology has changed rapidly, and the way that it can be compressed in certain circumstances makes a significant difference to the amount of data that can be distributed over different bandwidths. Therefore, we should not necessarily get too hung up about the particular kinds of need for certain sizes of bandwidth, whether we are talking about use by consumers in the home or by small businesses.

There is also a particular problem with regard to data collection in this field, and I know that the UK Government has now charged Ofcom with the job of ensuring that we have adequate data on the issue. Clearly, there are some areas of market failure, and the regional innovative broadband support project is designed to address those in Wales. It is important, and I am sure that we all hope that the project goes ahead.

Alun Cairns: Does the Member recognise that similar schemes to the RIBS project were developed in Northern Ireland and Scotland, which have now received European approval, and, if so, will he join me in asking the Minister why the Welsh scheme has not yet gained approval, despite the fact that we were the first to announce it?

Leighton Andrews: I am sorry but I do not know the ins and outs of discussion with the European Union over the RIBS proposals, so you will have to direct that question to the Minister.

Within the context of the strategy, it is important to be clear on the regulatory issues involved. Ofcom's role is spelled out in the broadband strategy document, but what we

ei angen i ysgogi'r galw mewn meysydd penodol. Yr ydym hefyd yn edrych am ddadansoddiad clir o fethiant y farchnad, dealltwriaeth glir o'r materion rheoleiddio, a ffocws clir ar ble y gallwn ni, fel Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, wneud gwahaniaeth. O ran deall y farchnad, mae cyflymder cyflenwi gan y farchnad wedi datblygu'n gyflymach na'r strategaeth yng Nghymru. Mae cyflwyno band eang wedi rhagori ar yr hyn yr oedd pobl yn ei ddisgwyl ddim ond dwy neu dair blynedd yn ôl. O ran deall y farchnad, mae hefyd yn bwysig deall y defnydd y gellir ei wneud o'r dechnoleg. Y gwir amdani yw bod technoleg wedi newid yn gyflym, ac mae'r ffordd y gellir ei chywasgu mewn rhai amgylchiadau yn gwneud gwahaniaeth sylweddol i faint o ddata y gellir eu dosbarthu dros wahanol led bandiau. Felly, ni ddylem o anghenraid boeni'n ormodol am y mathau penodol o angen am feintiau penodol o led band, pa un a ydym yn sôn am ddefnyddio gan ddefnyddwyr yn y cartref neu ddefnyddio gan fusnesau bach.

Mae yna broblem benodol hefyd o ran casglu data yn y maes hwn, a gwn fod Llywodraeth y DU bellach wedi rhoi'r dasg o sicrhau ein bod gennym ddata digonol ar hyn i Ofcom. Yn amlwg, mae yna rai meysydd lle mae'r farchnad yn methu, ac mae'r prosiect cymorth band eang arloesol rhanbarthol wedi'i gynllunio i fynd i'r afael â'r rheini yng Nghymru. Mae'n bwysig, ac yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod i gyd yn gobeithio yr aiff y prosiect rhagddo.

Alun Cairns: A yw'r Aelod yn cydnabod bod cynlluniau tebyg i'r prosiect RIBS wedi eu datblygu yng Ngogledd Iwerddon a'r Alban, a'u bod bellach wedi cael cymeradwyaeth Ewrop? Os felly, a wnaiff ymuno â mi i ofyn i'r Gweinidog pam nad yw cynllun Cymru wedi ei gymeradwyo hyd yma, er mai ni oedd y cyntaf i'w gyhoeddi?

Leighton Andrews: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ond ni wn fanylion y drafodaeth gyda'r Undeb Ewropeaidd ynglŷn â'r cynigion RIBS, felly, bydd yn rhaid ichi gyfeirio'r cwestiwn hwnnw i'r Gweinidog.

Yng nghyd-destun y strategaeth, mae'n bwysig sicrhau bod yn glir am y materion rheoliadol. Caiff rôl Ofcom ei hegluro yn y ddogfen strategaeth band eang, ond nid ydym

have not documented are the key issues that we in Wales believe that Ofcom needs to address in respect of solving some of the specific problems in Wales. Those need to be spelled out and documented. However, it is also important that we do not second-guess or seek to supplant the regulator with regard to some of the solutions being put forward.

Turning to issues where we can make a difference, the key is enhancing future take-up. That means that people need to understand what broadband is for. They do not buy broadband to have broadband; they buy it in order to use it for different purposes. Therefore, people are actually more interested in the services, applications and content that can be run on broadband than they are in the specific technology of broadband itself.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: On that point of content, do you agree that it is very important that, within the broadband provision in Wales, we have a Welsh context for broadband content, and the ability to use broadband through the medium of Welsh? Otherwise, people in Wales will look outside Wales and all over the world to get that service, rather than have it in a Welsh context.

Leighton Andrews: I agree with that, and, if you recall, a debate in my name was held on digital content in Wales just before Christmas in which I made that point.

People may want to use broadband to download music, or they may want to use it to download a video of John Redwood failing to sing the national anthem, as 485,000 did during the general election. There is a series of uses.

4.20 p.m.

It is encouraging that many local schemes work in the community to encourage people to take up broadband. We have everybody online in Clydach vale in my constituency, supported by BT and Microsoft, encouraging parents and grandparents to get involved in broadband. We have the Digilab at People's

wedi nodi'r prif faterion yr ydym ni yng Nghymru yn credu bod angen i Ofcom fynd i'r afael â hwy o ran datrys rhai o'r problemau penodol yng Nghymru. Mae angen nodi'r rheini'n fanwl a'u cofnodi. Fodd bynnag, mae hefyd yn bwysig inni beidio â sgîl-feirniadu na cheisio disodli'r rheoleiddiwr o ran rhai o'r atebion a yngir.

I droi at y materion lle gallwn wneud gwahaniaeth, yr allwedd yw cynyddu'r nifer sy'n cael band eang yn y dyfodol. Mae hynny'n golygu bod angen i bobl ddeall beth yw pwrpas band eang. Nid ydynt yn prynu band eang er mwyn cael band eang; maent yn ei brynu er mwyn ei ddefnyddio at wahanol ddibenion. Felly, mae gan bobl fwy o ddi-ddordeb yn y gwasanaethau, y cymwysiaid a'r cynnwys y gellir eu defnyddio ar fand eang nag yn nhechnoleg benodol band eang ei hun.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Ar y pwynt hwnnw, sef cynnwys, a gytunwch ei bod yn bwysig iawn, o fewn y ddarpariaeth band eang yng Nghymru, inni gael cyd-destun Cymreig ar gyfer cynnwys band eang, a'r gallu i ddefnyddio band eang drwy gyfrwng y Gyrraeg? Fel arall, bydd pobl yng Nghymru yn edrych y tu allan i Gymru ac ym mhob cwr o'r byd i gael y gwasanaeth hwnnw, yn hytrach na'i gael mewn cyd-destun Cymreig.

Leighton Andrews: Cytunaf â hynny, ac os cofiwch cynhaliwyd dadl yn fy enw ar gynnwys digidol yng Nghymru ychydig cyn y Nadolig, pan wneuthum y pwynt hwnnw.

Efallai y bydd pobl am ddefnyddio band eang i lawrlwytho cerddoriaeth, neu efallai y byddant am ei ddefnyddio i lawrlwytho fideo o John Redwood yn methu â chanu'r anthem genedlaethol, fel y gwnaeth 485,000 yn ystod yr etholiad cyffredinol. Mae yna lu o wahanol ddefnyddiau.

Mae'n galonogol fod nifer o gynlluniau lleol yn gweithio yn y gymuned i annog pobl i ddewis band eang. Mae pawb ar-lein yng nghwm Clydach yn fy etholaeth i, gyda chefnogaeth BT a Microsoft, sy'n annog rhieni a neiniau a theidiau i ymwneud â band eang. Mae gennym Labordy Digidol yn

First in Porth, supported by Fujitsu Services, Canllaw Online and Objective 1 funding from the Assembly, which is also introducing young people to high-quality digital media. These are important initiatives.

In conclusion, Minister, you are aware—we have had conversations on this matter—that it is important in the future to focus on the usage of broadband and move away from the focus on availability. That needs to be more present in the strategy going forward.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I would appreciate if Members could stick to the time limit. There is just enough time to get everybody in if we keep to the limits, with the extra minute for interventions.

Elin Jones: Ddydd Gwener diwethaf, cyfarfûm â phrif weithredwr Organic Farm Foods yn Llanbedr Pont Steffan i drafod bwriad y cwmni i gau'r ffatri pacio llysiau a ffrwythau organig. Bydd 50 o bobl yn colli eu gwaith mewn cwmni a ddechreuodd ei daith yn y Llambod. Prif anfantais y dref fel lleoliad i'r cwmni hwn oedd y gost a'r amser a gymer i gludo nwyddau oddi yno. Mae economi'r Gorllewin dan anfantais sylweddol oherwydd y pellter a'r amser teithio o brif farchnadoedd. Dyna pam, wrth gwrs, mae'r chwyldro technolegol yn cynnig y posibilrwydd o chwalu'r pellteroedd hyn, ac, ar raddfa fach, yr ydym yn dechrau gweld hynny'n digwydd. Ar y rhaglen *O Flaen Dy Lygaid* neithiwr ar S4C, gwyliais Ted Jones o Ffair Rhos yng nghanol mynyddoedd Cambria yn sôn am sefydlu busnes yn Ffair Rhos, gan ddychwelyd o Loegr i wneud hynny, a'i fod yn awr yn rhedeg ei fusnes yn creu meddalwedd beirianyddol ac yn ei hanfon i lawr y lein i'w gwsmeriaid yn ne Lloegr.

Er hynny, a yw'r dechnoleg band eang yn llwyddo i wastatáu'r cae chwarae, ac yn cynnig yr un cyfleoedd i bawb, ble bynnag y bôn, neu ai'r 'usual suspects' sy'n cael y manteision i gyd? Mae BT, fel y clywsom, wedi cyflawni rhai o dargedau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar ei rhan, ac mae ymhell dros 90 y cant o boblogaeth Cymru ar fin cael cysylltiad band eang. Mae fy nghartref i yn Aberystwyth wedi cael band eang erbyn hyn;

People's First yn y Porth, gyda chefnogaeth Fujitsu Services, arian Canllaw Ar-lein ac Amcan 1 gan y Cynulliad, sydd hefyd yn cyflwyno pobl ifanc i gyfryngau digidol o safon. Mae'r rhain yn fentrau pwysig.

I gloi, Weinidog, fe wyddoch—cawsom lawer sgwrs ar y mater hwn—ei bod yn bwysig canolbwyntio yn y dyfodol ar ddefnyddio band eang a symud oddi wrth y ffocws ar allu ei gael. Mae angen i hynny fod yn amlycach yn y strategaeth wrth symud ymlaen.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Byddwn yn gwerthfawrogi pe byddai Aelodau yn cadw at y cyfyngiadau amser. Mae digon o amser i gynnwys pawb os cadwn at y terfynau amser, a munud ychwanegol ar gyfer ymyriadau.

Elin Jones: Last Friday, I met the chief executive of Organic Farm Foods in Lampeter to discuss the company's intention to close the organic fruit and vegetable packing factory. Some 50 people will lose their jobs in a company which began in Lampeter. The town's main disadvantage as a location for this company is the cost and the time it takes to transport goods. The economy of west Wales is severely disadvantaged because of distance and travelling times to the main markets. That is why, of course, the technological revolution offers the possibility to obliterate those distances, and to a small extent we are starting to see that happen. On the programme *O Flaen Dy Lygaid* on S4C last night, I heard Ted Jones of Ffair Rhos in the heart of the Cambrian mountains talk about establishing a business in Ffair Rhos, having come home from England to do so. He now runs his engineering software business, sending products down the line to his customers in the south of England.

However, is broadband technology succeeding in levelling the playing field and offering the same opportunities to all, wherever they may be? Or is it the usual suspects who are getting the all the cream? BT, as we heard, has reached some of the Assembly Government's targets on its behalf, and well over 90 per cent of the population of Wales is about to have broadband connection. My own home in Aberystwyth

yr unig drueni yw nad ydwyf o hyd yn gallu defnyddio *laptop* y Cynulliad ar fand eang gan ei fod y cyswllt yn gorfod mynd drwy linell ffôn—ond mater arall yw hwnnw.

Mae problemau yn ardaloedd y cyfnewidfeydd sydd wedi eu trosi, yn enwedig lle yr oedd yr isadeiledd eisoes yn annigonol, fel y soniodd Jocelyn Davies. Rhaid sicrhau, yn achos y 35 cyfnewidfa y penderfynodd BT beidio â'u trosi i fand eang, megis honno yng Nglandyfi, yn fy etholaeth, fod y Cynulliad yn ariannu cynllun i'w trosi, gan fod y farchnad wedi methu gwneud hynny. Cadarnhaodd y Gweinidog fod y gwaith gyda'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn mynd yn ei flaen, ond hoffwn iddo ddweud pryd y mae'n rhagweld y bydd y 35 cyfnewidfa hynny yn debygol o gael eu trosi i fand eang. Mae gennyf lythyr oddi wrtho yn dweud ei fod yn rhagweld hynny o fis Hydref 2005 ymlaen, ond hoffwn iddo, a ninnau yng nghanol 2005, roi amserlen tamaid bach mwy penodol i'r bobl hynny sy'n disgwyl am gadarnhad y bydd y gwaith hwnnw'n digwydd.

Wrth feddwl am y pwnc hwn, mae'n bryder imi fod ardaloedd gwledig unwaith eto y tu ôl i ardaloedd trefol. Mae mwy o ddewis technolegol yn y trefi o'i gymharu ag ardaloedd gwledig a'r Cymoedd, ac mae dinasoedd mawr yn awr yn cael cynnig band eang ar gyflymder llawer mwy nag a fydd ar gael i ardaloedd mwy gwledig ac ymylol am flynyddoedd. Nid yw technoleg gwybodaeth felly wedi llwyddo i leihau'r anfanteision sy'n wynebu busnesau a phobl mewn ardaloedd ymylol. Yn wir, mae wedi ailosod yr un anfanteision ag a fodolai drwy'r ugeinfed ganrif ar gyfer technoleg a throsglwyddo gwybodaeth yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Dyna pam y dylai strategaeth band eang y Llywodraeth roi llawer mwy o slyw i sicrhau bod yr isadeiledd band eang sydd ar gael yn ardaloedd Amcan 1 yn defnyddio'r dechnoleg ddiweddaraf ac nid ar ei hôl hi yn barhaus. Yr wyf yn sôn yn benodol am fand eang yn mynd â ni y tu hwnt i ADSL ac ar gyflymderoedd llawer ehangach o ran trosglwyddo gwybodaeth.

Mae band eang a thelathrebu yn bwysig i fusnesau ac unigolion. Yr ydym eisoes wedi clywed hynny y prynhawn yma. I ardal fel fy

now has broadband; the only pity is that I still cannot use the Assembly laptop on broadband as it has to use a dial-up modem—but that is another matter.

There are problems in the areas covered by those exchanges that have been converted, especially where the infrastructure was already inadequate, as Jocelyn Davies mentioned. We must ensure that, in the case of the 35 exchanges that BT has decided not to convert to broadband, such as that at Glandyfi in my constituency, the Assembly funds a scheme to convert them, since the market has failed to do so. The Minister has confirmed that the work with the European Commission is continuing, but I should like him to tell us when he foresees those 35 exchanges are likely to be converted to broadband. I have a letter in which he states that he envisages that happening from October 2005 onwards. But now that we are mid way through 2005, I ask him to provide a slightly firmer timetable for those who are waiting for confirmation that that work will happen.

Thinking about this subject, I am concerned that rural areas are once more lagging behind urban areas. There is greater technological choice in the towns compared with rural areas and the Valleys, and large cities are now being offered broadband at much higher speeds than will be available to more rural and peripheral areas for years. Information technology, therefore, has not succeeded in reducing the disadvantages facing businesses and people in peripheral areas. Indeed, it has reinstated the same disadvantages as existed throughout the twentieth century for technology and information transmission in the twenty-first century. That is why the Government's broadband strategy should pay much more attention to ensuring that the broadband infrastructure which is available in Objective 1 areas uses the latest technology and is not continually playing catch up. I am speaking in particular about broadband taking us way beyond ADSL and at much greater speeds with regard to the transmission of information.

Broadband and telecommunication are important to businesses and individuals. We have already heard so this afternoon. For an

un i yng Ngheredigion, mae'n gynyddol bwysig i'r gwasanaeth iechyd hefyd, ac mae'r cyswllt cyfrifiadurol llawn rhwng ysbyty megis Bron-glais a chanolfannau arbenigol yn Abertawe a Chaerdydd yn bwysig tu hwnt, er mwyn adnabod pob math o afiechydon, o'r galon i'r croen. Gwn fod y Gweinidog wedi cyfeirio at hyn, ond byddwn yn hoffi gweld yn ei strategaeth lawer mwy o flaenoriaeth yn cael ei rhoi i wella'r rhwydwaith cyfrifiadurol rhwng ysbytai—y rhai arbenigol, cyffredinol a chymunedol—unwaith eto, er mwyn lleihau'r anfanteision o fyw yng nghefn gwlad. Mae potensial mawr yn y maes hwn ond mae'n rhaid i ni fod ar flaen y gad, a rhaid i ni dargedu adnoddau'r Llywodraeth i'r ardaloedd mwyaf ymylol a difreintiedig—y lleoedd sydd o ychydig ddiddordeb i'r cwmnïau masnachol fel manau i fuddsoddi ynddynt, ond rhai y mae arnynt angen ymyrraeth gyhoeddus.

Denise Idris Jones: I will talk about the use of broadband to encourage businesses, especially tourism. Broadband has the capacity to make a significant impact on the different communities across my constituency, from Llandudno to Bangor. It is vital to the economy of tourist areas, as hotels and bed and breakfast establishments in areas such as Llandudno, in order to keep up with increasing use of online holiday booking facilities, must provide details of their services on the internet.

In rural areas, as already mentioned, it can, at best, provide excellent advertising, promotion and sales opportunities for the growth of rural businesses. In more remote communities, it provides access to facilities that are too far away to otherwise make use of, and it can bridge the community, enable older people who are sometimes isolated to be part of an online community, and provide contact to friends and family members who are too far away or too immobile to visit.

Broadband can do all these things and more. It can encourage learning and further research across universities. However, in order to maximise the potential of broadband across Wales, it is vital that Assembly sponsored

area such as mine in Ceredigion, it is also increasingly important for the health service, and full computer connectivity between hospitals such as Bron-glais, and specialist centres in Swansea and Cardiff, is extremely important, in order to diagnose all sorts of conditions, from heart disease to skin conditions. I know the Minister has referred to this, but I should like to see far more priority given in his strategy to improving the computer network between hospitals—those with specialist sections, and both general and community hospitals—in order to lessen the disadvantages of living in rural areas. There is great potential in this field and we need to be in the vanguard, and must target Government resources on the most peripheral and deprived areas—those places that are of little interest to commercial companies as possible locations for expansion, but places that need public intervention.

Denise Idris Jones: Soniaf am ddefnyddio band eang i annog busnesau, yn arbennig twristiaeth. Gall band eang gael effaith fawr ar y gwahanol gymunedau ar draws fy etholaeth i, o Landudno i Fangor. Mae'n hollbwysig i economi ardaloedd twristiaeth, gan fod yn rhaid i westai a llety gwely a brecwast mewn ardaloedd fel Llandudno ddarparu manylion am eu gwasanaethau ar-lein er mwyn sicrhau nad ydynt ar ei hôl hi gyda'r defnydd cynyddol o gyfleusterau archebu gwyliau ar-lein.

Mewn ardaloedd gwledig, fel y soniwyd eisoes, ar ei orau gall ddarparu cyfleoedd hysbysebu, hyrwyddo a gwerthu rhagorol i hybu twf busnesau gwledig. Mewn cymunedau mwy anghysbell, mae'n rhoi mynediad i gyfleusterau sy'n rhy bell i'w defnyddio fel arall, a gall bontio'r gymuned, galluogi pobl hŷn sydd weithiau'n cael eu hynysu i fod yn rhan o'r gymuned ar-lein, a darparu cyswllt â ffrindiau ac aelodau'r teulu sy'n rhy bell i ymweld â hwy neu sydd â phroblem symudedd.

Gall band eang wneud yr holl bethau hyn a mwy. Gall annog dysgu a rhagor o ymchwil mewn prifysgolion. Fodd bynnag, er mwyn manteisio i'r eithaf ar botensial band eang dros Gymru gyfan, mae'n hanfodol i gyrrff

public bodies, local authorities, Government, the voluntary sector and other stakeholders work together. For example, VisitWales.com now provides an easy-to-book package holiday plan for golfing, fishing, walking, conferences and adventure holidays, which could be expanded to provide event-specific package bookings.

Alun Cairns: VisitWales.com is an important tool. However, does the Member not recognise that there are enormous problems with VisitWales.com, particularly in terms of developing it to provide new services, due to the infrastructure problems within the program itself?

Denise Idris Jones: I am not sure whether that is true, because I looked at it. [*Laughter.*]

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: The Minister said—

Denise Idris Jones: The Minister said that it is accessible. The opposition parties will argue that everything that we say is not true. I suggest that, if anyone is watching this on television, they should look at VisitWales.com and have a look at it for yourselves.

The website also provides links to accommodation and nearby places to visit. The promotion of activities and events across Wales is as important as the package break, and its success in tourism terms, depends on secondary services available to browse online. Restaurants, travel links, activities and places nearby, are all factors that people consider when planning a break. I know that they do that when they come to Llandudno. They go to Snowdonia and Bangor, and will possibly go golfing as there are three golf clubs nearby.

Increasingly, diverse high-quality tourism is vital to the stability and growth of the rural economy. Used correctly, broadband can play a substantial part in bringing this about, encouraging tourists and in developing a wider selection of quality accommodation, activities, and inward investment in rural and

cyhoeddus sy'n cael eu noddi gan y Cynulliad, awdurdodau lleol, y Llywodraeth, y sector gwirfoddol a rhanddeiliaid eraill gydweithio. Er enghraifft, mae VisitWales.com erbyn hyn yn darparu cynllun gwyliau parod hawdd i'w archebu ar gyfer gwyliau golff, pysgota, cerdded, cynadleddau a gwyliau antur, a gellid ehangu hyn i ddarparu gwasanaeth archebu gwyliau ar gyfer digwyddiadau penodol.

Alun Cairns: Mae VisitWales.com yn offeryn pwysig. Fodd bynnag, onid yw'r Aelod yn cydnabod bod problemau mawr gyda VisitWales.com, yn arbennig o ran ei ddatblygu i ddarparu gwasanaethau newydd, oherwydd y problemau seilwaith o fewn y rhaglen ei hun?

Denise Idris Jones: Ni wn a yw hynny'n wir, oherwydd yr wyf wedi edrych arno. [*Chwerthin.*]

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Dywedodd y Gweinidog—

Denise Idris Jones: Dywedodd y Gweinidog ei fod yn hygyrch. Bydd y gwrthbleidiau yn dadlau nad oes unrhyw beth a ddywedwn yn wir. Awgrymaf, os oes unrhyw un yn gwyllo hyn ar y teledu, y dylent edrych ar VisitWales.com drostynt eu hunain.

Mae'r wefan hefyd yn darparu cysylltiadau i lety a manau cyfagos i ymweld â hwy. Mae hyrwyddo gweithgareddau a digwyddiadau ledled Cymru yr un mor bwysig â gwyliau parod, ac mae ei lwyddiant mewn twristiaeth yn dibynnu ar wasanaethau eilaidd i bori ar-lein. Mae bwytai, cysylltiadau teithio, gweithgareddau a lleoedd cyfagos oll yn ffactorau y mae pobl yn eu hystyried wrth gynllunio gwyliau. Gwn eu bod yn gwneud hynny pan ddônt i Landudno. Ânt i Eryri a Bangor, ac o bosibl i chwarae golff gan fod tri chlwb golff gerllaw.

Mae twristiaeth amrywiol o safon yn gynyddol yn hanfodol i sefydlogrwydd a thwf yr economi wledig. O'i ddefnyddio'n gywir, gall band eang chwarae rhan bwysig wth wneud hyn, gan annog twristiaid a datblygu dewis ehangach o lety o safon a gweithgaredd o safon, a mewnfuddsoddiad

coastal communities.

mewn cymunedau yng nghefn gwlad ac ar yr arfordir.

4.30 p.m.

Alun Cairns: There is no doubt that the role of the opposition is to scrutinise the Government's decisions during the process of developing its strategies, as well as to scrutinise the success, or otherwise, that it has had in doing that. As the Minister said, it was in July 2002 that he heralded the broadband strategy, which would enable all communities to be linked up to broadband within five years, I believe that he said. It is fair to say that five years have not yet passed, but it is also fair to say that the market has moved on significantly. It is interesting to note that he is prepared to take an awful lot of the credit for the 320,000 or so extra houses that are linked up—I forget the exact figures that he quoted. We know that that has not happened as a result of the Government's actions or stimulation of the market; it has happened as a result of market delivery. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.'] I note the heckling from the back of the Chamber, and I would happy to take interventions on these points, because everything that I am saying is hard, accurate and right, contrary to the denials that we hear from the Minister.

It has been announced that 99.5 per cent of communities will be connected to broadband by the end of July, but let us not forget that we are talking about the lower level of broadband. It is a step in the right direction. However, 35 communities, many in mid and west Wales, will not be connected to broadband. One is on the outskirts of Swansea, namely Penmaen, and it has the right to be connected to broadband if the Minister's strategy is right.

The Minister is blaming the European Commission for the delays and for the fact that these delicate negotiations have not yet succeeded. Why is it, therefore—and I stand by everything that I say—that Northern Ireland has succeeded and that 100 per cent of its communities are linked to broadband? There are geographical differences between Northern Ireland and Wales, granted, but

Alun Cairns: Nid oes amheuaeth nad rôl y gwrthbleidiau yw craffu ar benderfyniadau'r Llywodraeth yn ystod y broses o ddatblygu ei strategaethau, yn ogystal â chraffu ar ei llwyddiant, neu ei methiant, yn hynny. Fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, cyhoeddodd y strategaeth band eang ym mis Gorffennaf 2002, a chredaf iddo ddweud y byddai'n sicrhau bod pob cymuned yn gysylltiedig â band eang cyn pen pum mlynedd. Mae'n deg dweud nad oes pum mlynedd eto ers hynny, ond mae'n deg dweud hefyd fod y farchnad wedi symud ymlaen yn sylweddol. Mae'n ddiddorol sylwi ei fod yn barod i dderbyn llawer o'r clod fod oddeutu 320,000 o dai ychwanegol wedi eu cysylltu â band eang—ni allaf gofio'r union ffigurau a roddwyd ganddo. Gwyddom nad yw hynny wedi digwydd oherwydd camau gweithredu'r Llywodraeth neu ysgogi'r farchnad; mae wedi digwydd oherwydd darpariaeth y farchnad. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.'] Sylwaf ar yr heclo o gefn y Siambr, a byddwn yn fodlon derbyn ymyriadau ar y pwyntiau hyn, am fod popeth a ddywedaf yn gadarn ac yn gywir, yn groes i'r gwadiadau a glywsom gan y Gweinidog.

Cyhoeddwyd y bydd 99.5 y cant o gymunedau yn gysylltiedig â band eang erbyn diwedd mis Gorffennaf, ond ni ddylem anghofio ein bod yn sôn am fand eang ar y lefel is. Mae'n gam i'r cyfeiriad cywir. Fodd bynnag, ni fydd 35 o gymunedau - nifer ohonynt yn y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin - yn gysylltiedig â band eang. Mae un o'r cymunedau hyn ar gyrion Abertawe, sef Penmaen, ac mae ganddi'r hawl i chael ei chysylltu â band eang, os yw strategaeth y Gweinidog yn gywir.

Mae'r Gweinidog yn beio'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd am yr oedi ac am y ffaith nad yw'r negodiadau bregus hyn wedi llwyddo eto. Pam, felly—ac yr wyf yn dal at bopeth a ddywedaf—mae Gogledd Iwerddon wedi llwyddo a 100 y cant o'i chymunedau yn gysylltiedig â band eang? Mae gwahaniaethau daearyddol rhwng Gogledd Iwerddon a Chymru, mae'n wir, ond beth am

what about the geographical similarities between Scotland and Wales? Why is it that Scotland has also succeeded in its negotiations? It has succeeded because it has committed to spending between £10 million and £12 million to link up 399 communities that would not be linked up were it left to market forces.

The Minister was the first to announce, in 2002, that all communities would have broadband connectivity as of right. However, he is the last to deliver when you compare the situation of Wales with that of Scotland and Northern Ireland. That is the case. There has been a public sector commitment in Scotland to deliver broadband to those 399 communities.

Andrew Davies: A little knowledge is a dangerous thing, and goes a very small distance. On the Scottish project, even now that it has been given state-aid clearance by the European Commission, when it is delivered, coverage in Scotland will still be less than in Wales. You quoted the figure of 99 per cent. Even with the Scottish project, there will be coverage of 95 or 96 per cent. Therefore, your argument does not stand up.

Alun Cairns: You have just exposed your complete failure, because you said, 'even now that it has been given state-aid clearance'. The difference is that Scotland has had state-aid clearance for that £12 million investment, and you have not. You were the first to announce it but you are the last to deliver it, just as with everything else in your broadband strategy. It has been clearly shown that Scotland has managed to succeed in this respect, whereas you have failed.

My second point is on content development and looking to the future. There was a £20 million underspend within priority 2, measure 1, which was about developing ICT infrastructure. It is right to say that market forces have moved forward, and so we did not need to use the funds in that respect, although we are still waiting for around £2

y tebygrwydd daearyddol rhwng yr Alban a Chymru? Pam y mae negodiadau'r Alban hefyd wedi llwyddo? Mae wedi llwyddo am ei bod wedi ymrwymo i wario rhwng £10 miliwn a £12 miliwn i gysylltu 399 o gymunedau na fyddent yn cael eu cysylltu pe bai hynny'n dibynnu ar rymoedd y farchnad.

Y Gweinidog oedd y cyntaf i gyhoeddi, yn 2002, y byddai pob cymuned yn gysylltiedig â band eang fel hawl. Fodd bynnag, fe yw'r olaf i gyflawni hyn pan gymharweh y sefyllfa yng Nghymru â'r sefyllfa yn yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon. Dyna'r gwir. Cafwyd ymrwymiad yn y sector cyhoeddus yn yr Alban i ddarparu band eang i'r 399 o gymunedau hynny.

Andrew Davies: Mae ychydig wybodaeth yn beth peryglus, ac nid yw'n golygu llawer. O ran y prosiect yn yr Alban, hyd yn oed gan fod y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn awr wedi caniatáu iddo gael cymorth y wladwriaeth, pan gaiff ei gyflwyno bydd llai o gymunedau wedi eu cysylltu â band eang nag yng Nghymru o hyd. Soniech am ffigur o 99 y cant. Hyd yn oed ym mhrosiect yr Alban, 95 neu 96 y cant fydd y ganran a gaiff ei chysylltu â band eang. Felly, nid yw eich dadl yn dal dŵr.

Alun Cairns: Yr ydych newydd ddangos eich methiant llwyr, gan ichi ddweud 'hyd yn oed gan fod y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn awr wedi caniatáu iddo gael cymorth y wladwriaeth'. Y gwahaniaeth yw bod yr Alban wedi cael caniatâd i gael cymorth y wladwriaeth ar gyfer y buddsoddiad hwnnw gwerth £12 miliwn, ond nid yw hynny'n wir amdanoch chi. Chi oedd y cyntaf i gyhoeddi hynny, ond chi yw'r olaf i'w gyflwyno, fel gyda phopeth arall yn eich strategaeth band eang. Dangoswyd yn glir bod yr Alban wedi llwyddo yn hyn, ond yr ydych chi wedi methu.

Mae a wnelo fy ail bwynt â datblygu cynnwys ac edrych i'r dyfodol. Cafwyd tanwariant o £20 miliwn ym mlaenoriaeth 2, mesur 1, a oedd yn ymwneud â datblygu seilwaith TGCh. Mae'n gywir dweud bod grymoedd y farchnad wedi datblygu, ac felly ni fu angen inni ddefnyddio'r arian ar gyfer hynny, er ein bod yn dal i aros am oddeutu £2

million to link up those 35 communities. However, that £20 million could have been used to develop other services, such as some of those highlighted by Leighton Andrews, although, if he is happy to look back at the downloadings of John Redwood that he mentioned, it only goes to show that he is looking to the past rather than to the future and some of the exciting technologies, such as gaming. [Interruption.] If that is the sum of his ambition, perhaps he will stay on the backbenches for the rest of his life; who knows what will happen. There is exciting potential and development in terms of gaming, and for further research and development, and we could have used the £20 million for that. There is also exciting potential to introduce more competition into the market and of much greater bandwidth. I have talked about the success of the market base in delivering for 99.5 per cent of communities, but let us not forget that those communities are receiving the first level of broadband, rather than the much greater bandwidth that some business communities demand.

I appreciate that I have been speaking for five minutes, although I did take an intervention. I will therefore draw my comments to a close. We are looking for reassurance, Minister, that in the next round of European regional development fund bidding and negotiations ICT will be a cross-cutting theme. We look for a specific answer as to whether that is the case. We also look for a specific answer on when you expect to overcome those European negotiations. It is fair for us to scrutinise, as I said at the outset, the success of the strategy. The strategy contained the information age group. Will the Minister tell us how often this information age group has met, when did it last meet, and when is it next due to meet? I think that questions under the Freedom of Information Act 2000 would come out with interesting responses in that respect.

The broadband strategy that he launched in 2002 highlighted and heralded broadband champions. How many of these champions exist? What are their activities and where were they last active, if they have been active at all, because we know that the truth is very

filiwn i gysylltu'r 35 o gymunedau hynny. Fodd bynnag, gellid bod wedi defnyddio'r £20 miliwn hwnnw i ddatblygu gwasanaethau eraill, megis rhai o'r gwasanaethau a amlygwyd gan Leighton Andrews. Ond os ef yn fodlon edrych yn ôl ar lawrlwythiadau o John Redwood fel y crybwyllwyd ganddo, mae'n dangos ei fod yn edrych i'r gorffennol yn hytrach nag i'r dyfodol a rhai o'r technolegau cyffrous, megis hapchwarae. [Torri ar draws.] Os dyna yw swm a sylwedd ei uchelgais, efallai y bydd yn aros ar y meinciau cefn weddill ei fywyd; pwy a wŷr beth all ddigwydd. Mae potensial a datblygiad cyffrous mewn hapchwarae, ac mewn ymchwil a datblygu pellach, a gallem fod wedi defnyddio'r £20 miliwn ar gyfer hynny. Mae potensial cyffrous hefyd i gyflwyno mwy o gystadleuaeth yn y farchnad ac i gael lled band mwy. Yr wyf wedi cyfeirio at lwyddiant y farchnad yn llwyddo i gysylltu 99.5 y cant o gymunedau, ond ni ddylem anghofio bod y cymunedau hynny yn cael band eang ar y lefel gyntaf, yn hytrach na'r lled band llawer mwy y mae rhai cymunedau busnes yn ei fynnu.

Yr wyf yn sylweddoli fy mod wedi siarad am bum munud, er imi dderbyn ymyriad. Felly, dof i ben. Yr ydym yn gofyn am sicrwydd, Weinidog, y bydd TGCh yn thema drawsbynciol yn y cylch nesaf o geisiadau a negodiadau am gronfa datblygu rhanbarthol Ewrop. Gofynnwn am ateb penodol a yw hynny'n wir. Gofynnwn hefyd am ateb penodol pryd y disgwyliwch oresgyn y negodiadau Ewropeaidd hynny. Mae'n deg inni graffu ar lwyddiant y strategaeth, fel y dywedais ar y cychwyn. Yr oedd y strategaeth yn cynnwys y grŵp oes gwybodaeth. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym pa mor aml y mae'r grŵp oes gwybodaeth wedi cyfarfod, pryd fu'r cyfarfod diwethaf a phryd y bwriedir cynnal y cyfarfod nesaf? Credaf y byddai cwestiynau o dan Ddeddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000 yn rhoi atebion diddorol am hynny.

Yr oedd y strategaeth band eang a lansiodd yn 2002 yn amlygu ac yn cyhoeddi hyrwyddwyr band eang. Faint o'r hyrwyddwyr hynny sydd? Beth yw eu gweithgareddau a ble fuont yn gweithio ddiwethaf, os buont yn gweithio o gwbl,

different?

Michael German: I would like to contribute on a few matters on pages 39 and 40 of the strategy document that is before us today. I find it slightly strange that we are having a debate on a document that was published in January 2005, and which had obviously been prepared in advance of that date. The committee may have had a chance to look at it, but we ought to debate this issue using a current document: the questions that I have relate to dates that are now well in the past.

Many Assembly Members have talked about the use of broadband, and I want to focus on the top end of broadband, where we are looking to future generations of broadband. I am interested in fibre speed, and page 40 of the document talks about how it will move forward. I have a number of questions for the Minister. First, since this document talks about a notification

‘to the European Commission no later than end of January 2005’,

I suppose that he should be able to tell us now whether the commission has approved it, or how far off approval is, since it must have gone in some four months ago. Where are we on that? Secondly, I know that the Minister has been considering two forms of procurement with regard to this. He says that the project will cost £60 million and that that project will either be funded through a public-sector or a private-sector procurement route. Can the Minister tell us which of those two procurement routes he has chosen? Will that route—using his words from earlier in the strategy—

‘increase opportunities for competition between suppliers, contractors and service providers’

to ensure that public bodies obtain value for money? Whichever route he has chosen, could he justify the rationale behind that in terms of what is stated earlier in the document? As an aside to that, could the

oherwydd gwyddom fod y gwirionedd yn wahanol iawn?

Michael German: Hoffwn gyfrannu ar ychydig faterion ar dudalennau 39 a 40 yn y ddogfen strategaeth sydd ger ein bron heddiw. Mae braidd yn rhyfedd ein bod yn cael dadl ar ddogfen a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Ionawr 2005 ac a oedd wedi’i pharatoi cyn y dyddiad hwnnw, mae’n amlwg. Efallai fod y pwyllgor wedi cael cyfle i edrych arni, ond dylem drafod y mater hwn gan ddefnyddio dogfen gyfredol: mae’r cwestiynau sydd gennyf yn ymwneud â dyddiadau sydd yn y gorffennol erbyn hyn.

Mae nifer o Aelodau’r Cynulliad wedi siarad am ddefnyddio band eang, ac yr wyf am ganolbwyntio ar y mathau gorau o fand eang, lle yr ydym yn ystyried cenedlaethau band eang yn y dyfodol. Mae diddordeb gennyf mewn cyflymder ffeibr, ac mae tudalen 40 yn y ddogfen yn cyfeirio at y ffordd y bydd yn symud ymlaen. Mae nifer o gwestiynau gennyf i’r Gweinidog. Yn gyntaf, am fod y ddogfen hon yn cyfeirio at hysbysiad

i’r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd erbyn diwedd Ionawr 2005 fan pellaf,

Cymeraf y dylai allu dweud wrthym yn awr a yw’r comisiwn wedi’i gymeradwyo, neu pryd y bydd yn ei gymeradwyo, oherwydd rhaid ei fod wedi’i gyflwyno ryw bedwar mis yn ôl. Beth yw’r sefyllfa gyda hynny? Yn ail, gwn i’r Gweinidog fod yn ystyried dau fath o gaffael o ran hyn. Dywed y bydd y prosiect yn costio £60 miliwn ac y caiff y prosiect ei ariannu drwy ddull caffael yn y sector cyhoeddus neu ddull caffael yn y sector preifat. A all y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym pa un o’r ddau ddull hynny y mae wedi’i ddewis? A fydd y dull hwnnw—gan ddefnyddio ei eiriau o ran gynharach o’r strategaeth—

yn cynyddu cyfleoedd am gystadleuaeth rhwng cyflenwyr, contractwyr a darparwyr gwasanaethau

er mwyn sicrhau bod cyrff cyhoeddus yn cael gwerth yr arian? Pa ddull bynnag y mae wedi’i ddewis, a allai gyfiawnhau’r rhesymeg dros hynny o ran yr hyn a ddywedir yn gynharach yn y ddogfen? Wrth fynd heibio, a

Minister tell us what the cost was of the consultants that he used to provide him with advice in order to create the proposal that he must have put forward in January 2005?

allai'r Gweinidog ddweud wrthym beth oedd cost yr ymgynghorwyr a ddefnyddiodd i'w gynghori er mwyn creu'r cynnig y mae'n rhaid ei fod wedi ei gyflwyno ym mis Ionawr 2005?

My second set of questions relate to page 39 of the document, which refers to the changing position of the telecommunications market, commercially addressing the provision of second-generation broadband—I am now moving back to second-generation broadband. Could the Minister outline what statements the private sector has made in order to make Wales a more attractive area than was previously thought? Are we seeing more than one contractor now moving into this area in a much more vigorous way? Again, which route will give us the most competition opportunities between suppliers, contractors and service providers? Further down page 39, he talks about the demand that

Mae fy ail gyfres o gwestiynau'n ymwneud â thudalen 39 yn y ddogfen, sy'n cyfeirio at sefyllfa gyfnewidiol y farchnad delathrebu, gan ymdrin â darpariaeth ail genhedlaeth band eang yn fasnachol—yr wyf yn mynd yn ôl at ail genhedlaeth band eang yn awr. A allai'r Gweinidog amlinellu pa ddatganiadau y mae'r sector preifat wedi'u gwneud i sicrhau bod Cymru yn ardal fwy deniadol nag yr oedd pobl yn ei gredu o'r blaen? A ydym yn gweld mwy nag un contractwr yn awr yn symud i'r maes hwn mewn ffordd lawer mwy grymus? Unwaith eto, pa ddull a fydd yn rhoi'r cyfleoedd mwyaf inni gael cystadleuaeth rhwng cyflenwyr, contractwyr a darparwyr gwasanaethau? Ymhellach i lawr ar dudalen 39, mae'n sôn am y galw

'will be captured and made available to the private sector'

a gaiff ei ddal a'i roi i'r sector preifat

and the private sector not addressing the latent demand. That was written in January 2005, and he was talking about brokerage then. Can he tell us now whether there are private sector contractors who are interested in addressing the latent demand for second-generation broadband? If so, how many are there, and how competitive will that business be? Finally, on that page, he talks about the brokerage operation in January and market intelligence being gathered within six months. Is the Minister able to tell us that by the end of next month he will be able to report back either to the committee or by written statement to the Assembly on the firm evidence that he will then have as to whether the Welsh Assembly Government needs to intervene in this area or whether we can leave it to the private sector?

a'r ffaith nad yw'r sector preifat yn ymdrin â'r galw cudd. Ysgrifennwyd hynny ym mis Ionawr 2005, ac yr oedd yn sôn am froceriaeth bryd hynny. A all ddweud wrthym yn awr a oes unrhyw gontractwyr yn y sector preifat sydd â diddordeb mewn ymdrin â'r galw cudd am ail genhedlaeth band eang? Os felly, faint sydd, a pha mor gystadleuol fydd y busnes hwnnw? I gloi, ar y tudalen hwnnw, mae'n sôn am y gwaith broceru ym mis Ionawr ac am gasglu'r wybodaeth am y farchnad cyn pen chwe mis. A all y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym y bydd, erbyn diwedd y mis nesaf, yn gallu rhoi adroddiad i'r pwyllgor neu gyflwyno datganiad ysgrifenedig i'r Cynulliad am y dystiolaeth gadarn a fydd ganddo bryd hynny am y cwstiwn a oes angen i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ymyrryd yn y maes hwn, neu a allwn ei adael i'r sector preifat?

4.40 p.m.

Lisa Francis: By the end of July, broadband could be available to 99.5 per cent of homes in Wales, and as Jimmy Saville might say, 'This is marvellous, marvellous, marvellous'.

Lisa Francis: Erbyn diwedd mis Gorffennaf, gallai band eang fod ar gael i 99.5 y cant o gartrefi yng Nghymru, ac mae hynny'n wirioneddol wych.

However, since the broadband strategy was launched in 2002 we know that there are 35 blackspots in Wales—26 of them in my constituency, Mid and West Wales. They include six communities in Meirionnydd Nant Conwy, nine in Powys and five in Pembrokeshire. As Elin Jones has said, in respect of the target set out in the five-year broadband plan, we know that it is thanks to BT that there has been an increase of approximately 30 per cent in the availability of affordable terrestrial broadband services in Wales. Through BT, broadband services have been achieved at near-DSL prices. Minister, as I understand it—and I use the word ‘understand’ loosely, because I know that you sometimes feel that the opposition here has difficulty in understanding anything—the broadband strategy stated that it would use public procurement to get broadband in rural areas. That was in 2002, but this has still not happened in Wales. If Scotland or Northern Ireland have invested approximately £10 million or £12 million, enabling a total number of 399 areas, it would surely stand to reason that, applied to Wales, that gives an approximate cost of £2 million per location. Can we, therefore, have a commitment from you today that this will be done, so that we can move on, as Jenny Randerson has said, and sooner rather than later?

The five-year plan states that 50 to 100 local or regional initiatives will be developed to deliver broadband solutions. How is the broadband taskforce progressing, and, if you will pardon the pun, is it on line to deliver its targets? We have heard much about the regional innovative broadband support project, or RIBS, ensuring that everyone in Wales has access to at least first-generation broadband. The European Commission has had to be notified of that, because it is considered a state aid. Can you confirm that the outcome of the notification process was positive, and will you reaffirm your commitment to initiating a successful procurement project to enable that to progress?

You have mentioned the brokerage site

Fodd bynnag, ers lansio'r strategaeth band eang yn 2002, gwyddom fod 35 o ardaloedd anodd yng Nghymru-mae 26 ohonynt yn fy etholaeth i, sef Canolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru. Maent yn cynnwys chwe chymuned ym Meirionnydd Nant Conwy, naw ym Mhowys a phump yn sir Benfro. Fel y dywedodd Elin Jones, o ran y targed a nodir yn y cynllun band eang pum mlynedd, gwyddom mai i BT mae'r diolch fod cynnydd o ryw 30 y cant wedi bod yn y gwasanaethau band eang daearol fforddiadwy sydd ar gael yng Nghymru. Drwy BT, mae gwasanaethau band eang wedi'u darparu am brisiau sy'n agos i brisiau DSL. Weinidog, fel yr wyf yn ei ddealla defnyddiaf y gair 'deall' yn llac, oherwydd gwn eich bod yn teimlo weithiau fod y gwrthbleidiau yma yn cael anhawster i ddeall dim byd-yr oedd y strategaeth band eang yn dweud y byddai'n defnyddio prosesau caffael cyhoeddus i sicrhau bod ardaloedd gweledig yn cael eu cysylltu â band eang. Dywedwyd hynny yn 2002, ond nid yw wedi digwydd yng Nghymru eto. Os yw'r Alban neu Ogledd Iwerddon wedi buddsoddi tua £10 miliwn neu £12 miliwn, gan roi band eang i gyfanswm o 399 o ardaloedd, mae'n sicr yn amlwg fod hynny'n gyfystyr â chost amcangyfrifedig o £2 filiwn fesul lleoliad o'i gymhwyso i Gymru. Felly, a gawn ni ymrwymiad gennyh heddiw y caiff hyn ei wneud cyn gynted â phosibl, fel y gallwn symud ymlaen, fel y dywedodd Jenny Randerson?

Mae'r cynllun pum mlynedd yn dweud y caiff 50 i 100 o fentrau lleol neu ranbarthol eu datblygu i ddarparu atebion band eang. Sut mae'r tasglu band eang yn datblygu, ac a yw ar y trywydd iawn i gyrraedd ei dargedau? Clywsom lawer am y prosiect cymorth band eang arloesol rhanbarthol, neu RIBS, sy'n sicrhau y gall pawb yng Nghymru fanteisio ar o leiaf genhedlaeth gyntaf band eang. Yr oedd yn rhaid hysbysu'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd am hynny, oherwydd caiff ei ystyried yn gymorth y wladwriaeth. A allwch gadarnhau bod canlyniad y broses hysbysu yn gadarnhaol, ac a wnewch ailddatgan eich ymrwymiad i gychwyn prosiect caffael llwyddiannus er mwyn i hynny symud ymlaen?

Yr ydych wedi sôn am y safle broceru

today, Minister. This apparently ‘captures’—a wonderful Assembly-speak word; it sounds a little like a Venus Flytrap—the names, addresses and details of organisations or individuals unable to connect to broadband. I am concerned, however, that, with these 600 or so registrations that you have mentioned, the whole thing is in danger of becoming a kind of wish list. I understand that it works along the following lines. If you are running a small business in Aberystwyth and you want a 100Mbps connection, you enter this on the site, and also how much you would expect or hope to pay for it. However, would any commercial company take that seriously? How is that verified?

Finally, I will mention the creative industries’ review. I understand that the review does not support web content. This is a new way of content development, which will become a fundamentally important part of broadcasting. Some operators have said that while the review may be strong on intellectual property, it is weak on internet protocol. What will you do, Minister, to ensure that that is changed?

Glyn Davies: I only need to raise one point in what has been an informative and interesting debate. It is the issue, to which many have already referred, of the 35 communities in Wales for which we do not have a guarantee that broadband will be provided. I live very close to the village of Castell Caereinion, which is one of those 35 communities, and I have already been approached by two people who live there—both consultants, for whom the availability of broadband is crucial. They are deeply concerned at whether they can continue to live in that village, and this worry must be replicated in those 35 communities across Wales. We already know—other speakers have mentioned this, at least—that equivalent communities in Northern Ireland are included; there is 100 per cent provision of broadband there.. The same will apply with regard to the 339 equivalent communities in Scotland.

I accept the Minister’s point that the sheer periphery of the settlement pattern in

heddiw, Weinidog. Mae hyn yn ‘dal’—gair poblogaidd yn y Cynulliad; mae’n swnio ychydig fel y planhigyn magl Gwener—enwau, cyfeiriadau a manylion sefydliadau neu unigolion na allant gysylltu â band eang. Fodd bynnag, pryderaf, o ran y 600 o gofrestriadau hyn a grybwyllwyd gennych, fod perygl y bydd y cyfan yn rhyw fath o restr o ddymuniadau. Deallaf ei bod yn gweithio fel a ganlyn. Os ydych yn rhedeg busnes bach yn Aberystwyth ac yn dymuno cael cysylltiad 100Mbps, byddwch yn cofnodi hynny ar y safle, gan nodi hefyd faint y byddech yn disgwyl neu’n gobeithio ei dalu amdano. Fodd bynnag, a fyddai unrhyw gwmni masnachol yn cymryd hynny o ddifrif? Sut y caiff hynny ei wirio?

I gloi, soniaf am yr adolygiad o’r diwydiannau creadigol. Deallaf nad yw’r adolygiad yn cefnogi cynnwys gwefannau. Mae hon yn ffordd newydd i ddatblygu cynnwys, a fydd yn dod yn rhan hollbwysig o ddarlledu. Mae rhai gweithredwyr wedi dweud, er bod cryn gyfeiriad yn yr adolygiad at eiddo deallusol, nad oes llawer o gyfeiriadau at brotocol y rhyngrwyd. Beth fyddwch yn ei wneud, Weinidog, i sicrhau bod hynny’n newid?

Glyn Davies: Dim ond un pwynt y mae angen imi ei godi yn y ddadl ddiddorol hon sy’n llawn gwybodaeth, sef y mater y mae nifer wedi cyfeirio ato eisoes fod 35 o gymunedau yng Nghymru nad oes ganddynt sicrwydd y caiff band eang ei ddarparu iddynt. Yr wyf yn byw’n agos iawn i bentref Castell Caereinion, sef un o’r 35 o gymunedau hynny, ac mae dau o’r trigolion—y ddau yn ymgynghorwyr, ac mae’n hanfodol iddynt allu manteisio ar fand eang—wedi cysylltu â mi. Maent yn pryderu’n fawr a allant barhau i fyw yn y pentref hwnnw, a rhaid bod pryderon o’r fath yn y 35 o gymunedau hynny ledled Cymru. Gwyddom eisoes—mae siaradwyr eraill wedi cyfeirio at hyn, o leiaf—y caiff cymunedau cyfatebol yng Ngogledd Iwerddon eu cynnwys; caiff band eang ei ddarparu i bawb yno. Bydd yr un peth yn gymwys yn y 339 o gymunedau cyfatebol yn yr Alban.

Yr wyf yn derbyn pwynt y Gweinidog fod natur hollol ymylol y patrwm anheddu yn yr

Scotland means that a number of individual households will produce 3 or 4 per cent, or whatever, of people who do not have access to broadband—the equivalent of the 35 communities in Wales who do not have it. However, the key point for us is that, in both countries, there is access for all communities.

The Minister said that we have notified Europe about the scheme that will enable this to happen, but I hope—because many Members have raised it and want to hear this—that the Minister, in his summing up, gives a commitment about the future for the 35 communities, such as that in Castle Caereinion. Will they be left in the lurch or will they have some prospect of broadband provision being delivered for them at some definitive time in the future?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Mae'r Gweinidog wedi gwneud yn fawr o'r ffaith y bydd nifer y bobl sydd yn gallu cael mynediad at fand eang yng Nghymru erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn hon yn fwy na'r cyfartaledd yn yr Alban ac yn Lloegr, ac mae'n rhaid derbyn hynny; mae'n ffaith. Fodd bynnag, i raddau helaeth, mae hynny wedi digwydd drwy gyfrwng y farchnad yn hytrach na drwy gyfrwng y Llywodraeth, ac mae goblygiadau a chanlyniadau i hynny. Un o'r goblygiadau hynny yw bod 35 o gymunedau yng Nghymru heb unrhyw sicrwydd y byddent yn cael cysylltiad i fand eang. A wnaiff y Gweinidog dderbyn cyfrifoldeb uniongyrchol, fel y mae nifer o Aelodau wedi gofyn iddo ei wneud, am y 35 cymuned hynny? Mae sefyllfa'r cymunedau hynny wedi datblygu o'r ffaith ei fod wedi caniatáu i'r farchnad arwain y broses hon. Byddai modd dadlau ai dyna oedd y ffordd orau o sicrhau'r cysylltiadau, a byddai'r Gweinidog yn dweud ei fod wedi bod yn hynod o lwyddiannus ar y cyfan a bod popeth yn iawn. Ond mae wedi gadael 35 o gymunedau ar ôl, ac yr ydym am gael sicrwydd am hynny.

Leighton Andrews: If you are not going to let the market lead on broadband, what are you going to do?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Y ddadl fyddai y dylai'r Llywodraeth fod wedi derbyn y

Alban yn golygu y bydd nifer o gartrefi unigol yn cynrychioli 3 neu 4 y cant, neu beth bynnag, o bobl nad ydynt yn gallu cael band eang—yr hyn sy'n cyfateb i'r 35 o gymunedau yng Nghymru nad oes ganddynt fand eang. Fodd bynnag, y pwynt allweddol inni yw fod band eang ar gael i bob cymuned yn y ddwy wlad.

Dywedodd y Gweinidog ein bod wedi hysbysu Ewrop am y cynllun a fydd yn galluogi hyn i ddigwydd. Ond gobeithio—gan fod llawer o Aelodau wedi codi'r pwynt ac am glywed hyn—y bydd y Gweinidog, wrth grynhoi'r ddadl, yn rhoi ymrwymiad am ddyfodol y 35 o gymunedau, fel y gymuned yng Nghastell Caereinion. A fyddant yn cael eu hanwybyddu, neu a fydd ganddynt ryw obaith o gael band eang ar ryw adeg benodol yn y dyfodol?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: The Minister has made much of the fact that the number of people who will have access to broadband in Wales by the end of this year will be greater than the average in Scotland and England, and we must accept that; it is a fact. However, that has happened, to a large extent, by means of the market rather than by means of the Government, and that has implications and consequences. One of those implications is that 35 communities in Wales have no guarantee of broadband access. Will the Minister take direct responsibility, as several Members have asked him to do, for those 35 communities? They are in that position because he has allowed the market to lead in this process. We could argue whether or not that was the best way to ensure broadband connectivity, and the Minister would say that he has been extremely successful on the whole and that everything is fine. However, he has left 35 communities behind, and we need assurance on this.

Leighton Andrews: Os nad ydych yn mynd i adael i'r farchnad arwain y ffordd gyda band eang, beth yr ydych yn mynd i'w wneud?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: The argument would be that the Government should have taken

cyfrifoldeb i ledaenu'r cysylltiad hwn. Yr oedd £66 miliwn o fewn Amcan 1 ar gyfer datblygu'r math hwn o gysylltiad. Dewisodd y Gweinidog ddilyn trywydd arall. Mae wedi llwyddo i'r graddau y mae wedi sôn amdanynt y prynhawn yma; derbynaf hynny. Nid wyf am ddadlau gydag ef ynglŷn â sut y dylid fod wedi gwneud y cysylltiadau. Nid wyf yn cytuno â'r Gweinidog, ond mae 35 o gymunedau wedi cael eu gadael heb gysylltiad ac yr wyf yn disgwyl iddo dderbyn y cyfrifoldeb am hynny.

Cyn i chi ymyrryd, Leighton, yr oeddwn am ddweud fy mod yn cytuno â llawer o'r pethau yr oeddech yn eu dweud y prynhawn yma; yr oedd hynny yn peri peth pryder imi. Yr ydych yn berffaith iawn i ddweud y dylem symud ymlaen o'r sefyllfa o ran y cysylltu—gan gofio'r angen i gysylltu'r 35 o gymunedau sydd ar ôl—i gynnwys band eang, ac i sicrhau bod gan bobl y sgiliau sylfaenol i'w ddefnyddio.

Byddwn yn anghytuno â chi—ac nid wyf yn siŵr a fu imi gamglywed yr hyn yr oeddech yn ei ddweud—o ran peidio â phoeni am ba mor eang yw'r band. Mae hynny'n bwysig o ran y capasiti sydd i'w gael a'r defnydd y gallwn ei wneud ohono o ran cyflymdra.

Leighton Andrews: I think that people can get a bit obsessed about the size of bandwidth—if that is not being rude. Compression technologies are significantly changing the way in which data can be transmitted down different kinds of broadband facilities, and if you focus entirely on that, you can end up diverting huge amounts of public money in directions in which they need not go.

4.50 p.m.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Mae Jocelyn Davies newydd ddweud wrthyf fod cyflymder yn bwysicach na maint, ond nid oes gennyf ffordd o gadarnhau hynny. Yr oeddwn yn sylwi bod y Gweinidog yn cynhyrfu wrth ichi sôn am faint y band, Leighton. Cytunaf nad oes eisiau inni gael obsesiwn am hyn, ond mae elfennau pwysig ynddo. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn sicrhau bod gan bobl y sgiliau sylfaenol i ddefnyddio hyn ar gyfer eu buddiannau personol ac ar gyfer busnesau. Er

responsibility for the roll-out of this connection. There was £66 million in Objective 1 to develop this kind of connection. The Minister chose to go down another route. He has succeeded to the extent that he has talked about today; I accept that. I will not argue with him as to how those connections should have been made. I do not agree with the Minister, but 35 communities have been left without connection and I expect him to take responsibility for that.

Before you intervened, Leighton, I was about to say that I agreed with many of the points which you made this afternoon; that caused me some concern. You are perfectly correct to say that we should move on from the situation regarding connection—bearing in mind the need to connect those 35 communities—to broadband content, and to ensuring that people have the skills to use it.

I would disagree with you—and I am not sure whether I misheard what you said—about not being concerned about band width. That is important in terms of the capacity that is available and the use we can make of it in terms of speed.

Leighton Andrews: Credaf y gall pobl boeni gormod am led band—os nad yw hynny braidd yn anweddus. Mae technolegau cywasgu yn newid yn sylweddol y ffordd y gellir trosglwyddo data drwy fathau gwahanol o gyfleusterau band eang, ac wrth ganolbwyntio ar hynny'n gyfan gwbl gallwch wario symiau enfawr o arian cyhoeddus lle nad oes ei angen.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Jocelyn Davies has just told me that speed is more important than size, but I cannot confirm that. I noticed the Minister became quite agitated when you mentioned bandwidth, Leighton. I agree there is no need for us to get obsessed with this, but it does have important elements. It is important that we ensure that people have the fundamental skills to use this for their personal interests and for business. For example, one area that does not have access

enghraifft, un ardal sydd heb fynediad at fand eang ar hyn o bryd yw Myddfai. Yr oedd prosiect cyffrous a blaengar yno beth amser yn ôl ar berlysiâu, ynghyd â marchnad ryngwladol ar gyfer hynny. Pe bai gan ardal Myddfai fynediad at y math cywir o fand eang, mae'n bosibl y gallai fod wedi marchnata'r prosiect yn hynod o effeithiol, a gallai fod wedi golygu'r gwahaniaeth rhwng methiant a llwyddiant y prosiect. Gobeithiaf, Weinidog, y byddwch yn dweud wrthym eich bod yn paratoi a chynnig rhaglen gynhwysfawr o sgiliau sylfaenol i bobl, sy'n sicrhau bod hyfforddiant ar gael, os ydynt yn dymuno hynny, er mwyn iddynt wneud y defnydd gorau o fand eang.

Mae fy mhwynt olaf, a godais yn gynharach gyda Leighton Andrews, yn ymwneud â chynnwys band eang yng Nghymru. Mae'n eithriadol o bwysig fod gan y cynnwys hwnnw gyd-destun Cymreig, ac nad yw pobl yn dewis band eang i fynd allan o Gymru, fel petai, ond eu bod yn gallu derbyn cymaint ag y bo modd o'r gwasanaeth yng Nghymru, a'i fod yn wasanaeth ag iddo naws Cymreig. Hoffwn glywed y Gweinidog yn dweud rhywbeth ynglŷn â'r defnydd o'r iaith Gymraeg o fewn band eang. Mawr obeithiaf nad ydym yn creu ffordd i bobl adael Cymru—nid yn gorfforol—drwy agor y drws iddynt ddefnyddio'r band hwn mewn cyd-destun rhyngwladol, heb allu ei ddefnyddio yng nghyd-destun eu gwlad a'u diwylliant eu hunain.

Gobeithiaf y gallwch roi'r sicrwydd hwnnw i ni y prynhawn yma. Mae gan Gymru gyfle gwych, o ran ansawdd bywydau pobl ac o ran yr economi, os yw'r datblygiadau hyn yn parhau yn y ffordd gywir.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I am always sympathetic to late requests to speak as a result of listening to a debate, so I call Mark Isherwood. However, I must call the Minister to reply at 4.53 p.m..

Mark Isherwood: I have two specific questions. We have heard rightly that broadband is good for business, so why has BT told me that business take-up thus far across Wales has only been 9 per cent, and lower in some key areas? Why is that, and what are you going to do about it? Secondly,

to broadband at present is Myddfai. There was an exciting and innovative project on herbs there some time ago, which had an international market. If the Myddfai area had had access to the correct type of broadband, it is possible it could have marketed that project particularly effectively, which could have meant the difference between the success and failure of the project. I hope, Minister, that you will tell us that you will prepare and offer a comprehensive programme of basic skills for people, ensuring that training is available, if they wish, so that people can make the best possible use of broadband.

My final point, which I raised earlier with Leighton Andrews, is on broadband content in Wales. It is crucial for that content to have a Welsh context, and that people do not choose broadband to leave Wales, as it were, but that they can receive as much as possible of the service in Wales, and that it has a Welsh flavour. I should like to hear the Minister say something about the use of the Welsh language within broadband. I very much hope we are not creating a way for people to leave Wales—I do not mean in a physical sense—by opening doors for them to use broadband in an international context, without being able to use it in the context of their own nation and culture.

I hope you can give us that assurance this afternoon. There are excellent opportunities for Wales, in terms of the quality of people's lives and in terms of the economy, if these developments continue in the right way.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf bob amser yn cydymdeimlo â cheisiadau hwyr i siarad ar ôl gwranddo ar ddadl. Felly, galwaf ar Mark Isherwood. Fodd bynnag, rhaid imi alw ar y Gweinidog i ateb am 4.53 p.m..

Mark Isherwood: Mae gennyf ddau gwestiwn penodol. Yr ydym wedi clywed, a hynny'n gywir, fod band eang yn dda i fusnes. Felly, pam mae BT wedi dweud wrthyf mai dim ond 9 y cant o fusnesau ledled Cymru sydd wedi manteisio ar fand eang hyd yma, a chanran is mewn rhai

will you now emulate the Scottish Executive and instruct your officials to meet representatives of the Welsh deaf community to ensure that there is no digital divide for British sign language users?

The Minister for Economic Development and Transport (Andrew Davies): This has been an interesting debate and many issues have been raised. Given the time limits, I will write to Members on some specific questions. In many cases, this is a technical debate. However, one of the problems that we have in terms of benchmarking progress, or trying to measure progress, is that, on the one hand, there is no agreed definition of what broadband is, which relates to Leighton Andrews's point about bandwidth, and, on the other hand, there are no robust measures for measuring the take-up of broadband. That is why there is clearly a role for Ofcom in this, and I am delighted that Rhodri Williams, the director of Ofcom Wales and Hywel Williams, his colleague, are here today. We need definitive measures in order to measure progress.

There has been a substantial change in the market for broadband. While BT is clearly, in many cases, the monopoly supplier of telecommunications in Wales, it is not the only provider. Where there is now a robust market, in places such as Cardiff, Swansea, Newport and along the M4 belt, the take-up of broadband is substantial. One of the reasons that we as a Government wanted to get a fix on the development in the market in Wales was to analyse what was going on in the market. We commissioned research, which showed that progress was substantial, and where there was competition between telecommunications suppliers, a vigorous market was developing. That relates to the last point that Mark made about business take-up. Ultimately, as Leighton Andrews said, this is about a market-driven solution. If you do not have a market-driven solution, what is the alternative? BT's take-up in certain areas may be small, but where there is competition, together with intervention by ourselves through the broadband Wales marketing campaign, there has been a

ardaloedd allweddol? Pam hynny, a beth yr ydych am ei wneud amdano? Yn ail, a wnewch efelychu Gweithrediaeth yr Alban yn awr a chyfarwyddo'ch swyddogion i gyfarfod â chynrychiolwyr y gymuned fyddar yng Nghymru i sicrhau nad oes rhanriad digidol ar gyfer pobl sy'n defnyddio iaith arwyddion Prydain?

Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth (Andrew Davies): Mae hon wedi bod yn ddadl ddiddorol a chodwyd nifer o faterion. Oherwydd y terfynau amser, ysgrifennaf at Aelodau ar rai cwestiynau penodol. Mewn llawer achos, mae hon yn ddadl dechnegol. Fodd bynnag, un o'r problemau sydd gennym o ran meincnodi cynnydd, neu geisio mesur cynnydd, ar y naill law yw nad oes gennym ddiffiniad cytûn o beth yw band eang, sy'n gysylltiedig â phwynt Leighton Andrews am led band, ac ar y llaw arall, nad oes gennym fesurau cadarn i fesur faint o bobl sy'n manteisio ar fand eang. Dyna pam y mae'n amlwg fod rôl i Ofcom yn hyn, ac yr wyf yn falch iawn bod Rhodri Williams, cyfarwyddwr Ofcom Cymru a Hywel Williams, ei gydweithiwr, yma heddiw. Mae arnom angen mesurau pendant er mwyn mesur cynnydd.

Bu cryn newid yn y farchnad ar gyfer band eang. Er ei bod yn amlwg mai BT, mewn llawer achos, yw'r cyflenwr telathrebu sydd â monopoli yng Nghymru, nid BT yw'r unig gyflenwr. Lle mae marchnad gadarn erbyn hyn mewn lleoedd fel Caerdydd, Abertawe a Chasnewydd ac ardaloedd ar hyd yr M4, mae nifer fawr o bobl wedi manteisio ar fand eang. Un o'r rhesymau pam yr oeddem ni fel Llywodraeth am gael gwybod am y datblygiad yn y farchnad yng Nghymru oedd er mwyn dadansoddi'r hyn a oedd yn digwydd yn y farchnad. Bu inni gomisiynu ymchwil a oedd yn dangos bod cynnydd sylweddol wedi'i wneud, a lle yr oedd cystadleuaeth rhwng cyflenwyr telegyfathrebu, fod marchnad gadarn yn datblygu. Mae hynny'n gysylltiedig â'r pwynt olaf gan Mark ynglŷn â nifer y busnesau sydd wedi manteisio ar fand eang. Yn y pen draw, fel y dywedodd Leighton Andrews, mae a wnelo hyn ag ateb sy'n cael ei lywio gan y farchnad. Os nad oes gennych ateb sy'n cael ei lywio gan y farchnad, beth yw'r dewis arall? Efallai mai nifer fach yn

substantial take-up of broadband in many areas. That relates to the points that Jenny Randerson and Mike German raised about a market solution to this because we are trying to encourage the development of a market.

unig sydd wedi manteisio ar wasanaeth BT mewn ardaloedd penodol, ond lle mae cystadleuaeth, ynghyd ag ymyriad gennym ni drwy ymgyrch farchnata band eang Cymru, mae nifer y bobl sydd wedi manteisio ar fand eang mewn llawer ardal wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol. Mae hynny'n cysylltu â'r pwyntiau a godwyd gan Jenny Randerson a Mike German ynglŷn ag ateb y farchnad i hyn, oherwydd yr ydym yn ceisio annog datblygiad marchnad.

The reason why BT is not enabling 35 exchanges with ADSL technology is for the same reason why, in some of those areas, you cannot get a good mobile phone signal. When determining suppliers, there is no market for that. I would argue that, as a Government, it is legitimate for us to intervene where the market has failed. Given that there has been substantial development in the market over the last two years, we need to focus our attention on where the market has not responded. Therefore, to answer the question that was asked, it is intended that those 35 exchanges not yet ADSL-enabled by BT will be covered by the RIBS project, which will also hopefully cover other black holes in the existing network where, despite the local exchange being ADSL-enabled, people are still not able to get ADSL broadband.

Y rheswm nad yw BT yn galluogi 35 o gyfnewidfeydd â thechnoleg ADSL yw'r union reswm pam na allwch, yn rhai o'r ardaloedd hynny, gael signal da ar ffonau symudol. Wrth bennu cyflenwyr, nid oes marchnad ar gyfer hynny. Byddwn yn dadlau ei bod yn ddilys inni, fel Llywodraeth, ymyrryd lle mae'r farchnad wedi methu. O gofio bod y farchnad wedi datblygu'n sylweddol yn ystod y ddwy flynedd diwethaf, mae angen inni ganolbwyntio ar y manau lle nad yw'r farchnad wedi ymateb. Felly, i ateb y cwestiwn a ofynnwyd, y bwriad yw y bydd prosiect cymorth band eang arloesol rhanbarthol yn cynnwys y 35 o gyfnewidfeydd nad yw BT eto wedi darparu ADSL iddynt. Bydd hyn hefyd, gobeithio, yn llenwi bylchau eraill yn y rhwydwaith presennol lle nad yw pobl yn gallu cael band eang ADSL o hyd, er bod ADSL wedi ei ddarparu yn y gyfnewidfa leol.

Jenny Randerson: This rather old document that we are debating today refers to the fact that you expect approval from the European Commission by spring 2005. By my calculation, we are more or less at the end of what could probably be called spring 2005. Can you update us as to when you are likely to get that approval?

Jenny Randerson: Mae'r ddogfen hen braidd yr ydym yn ei thrafod heddiw yn cyfeirio at y ffaith eich bod yn disgwyl cael cymeradwyaeth gan y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd erbyn y gwanwyn 2005. Yn ôl fy nghyfrifiad i, yr ydym fwy neu lai ar ddiwedd yr hyn y gallem ei alw'n wanwyn 2005. A allwch roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf inni pryd yr ydych yn debygol o gael y gymeradwyaeth honno?

Andrew Davies: I cannot give a definitive answer. If you asked the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration a question about credit union notification, she would not be able to say when the EC could give a definitive answer on that. That is part of the process.

Andrew Davies: Ni allaf roi ateb pendant. Pe baech yn gofyn cwestiwn i'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio am hysbysiad undeb credyd, ni fyddai'n gallu dweud pryd y gallai'r CE roi ateb pendant am hynny. Mae hynny'n rhan o'r broses.

In response to Alun Cairns's question about what has happened elsewhere, Scotland contravened one of its previous projects—the

I ateb cwestiwn Alun Cairns ynglŷn â'r sydd wedi digwydd mewn manau eraill, aeth yr Alban yn groes i un o'i phrosiectau

Atlas project—two or more years ago. That was called in by the EU; it was recognised that Scotland contravened state-aid issues. It was tied up for the best part of two years as part of that EC notification process. Northern Ireland did not notify the EC and it remains open to legal challenge. If that happens, as in Scotland's case, the whole project will be put on ice; you cannot predict when there will be a resolution.

To be absolutely clear on this, for the sake of Alun and colleagues, even with the latest Scottish project, now that it has been notified, coverage in Scotland will not be as extensive as in Wales, even with that intervention. With current market coverage and public sector intervention, and if the RIBS project is notified and delivered, coverage in Wales will be substantially greater than it is in Scotland.

Alun Cairns: I acknowledge that point, but my point was not that coverage would be more extensive in Scotland after its public sector intervention, but that it is further forward in its public sector intervention negotiations than we are. In spite of us having announced it first, in July 2002, we are still waiting whereas Scotland is further forward and Northern Ireland has completed.

Andrew Davies: Most people that we represent, whether consumers, individuals or business representatives, will be more interested in how quickly they can access broadband rather than in some arcane internal EU process.

I realise that I have little time left, but I will quickly say that there has been substantial progress. The market has changed significantly, which is why the broadband Wales strategy has been revised. The strategy is working. Where we have helped to encourage a market, it has been vigorous. Take-up of broadband is increasing significantly and in many cases, on many indicators, such as internet access, take-up in Wales is higher than that for the UK as a

blaenorol-y prosiect Atlas-ddwy flynedd neu fwy yn ôl. Galwyd hynny i mewn gan yr UE; cydnabuwyd bod yr Alban wedi mynd yn groes i faterion cymorth y wladwriaeth. Ni allai wneud dim am ddwy flynedd bron fel rhan o broses hysbysu'r CE. Ni hysbysodd Gogledd Iwerddon y CE, ac mae'n dal yn agored i gael ei herio o dan y gyfraith. Os digwydd hynny, fel yn achos yr Alban, caiff y prosiect cyfan ei ohirio; ni allwch ragweld pryd y ceir penderfyniad.

I fod yn gwbl glir am hyn, er mwyn Alun a'i gyd-Aelodau, hyd yn oed gyda phrosiect diweddaraf yr Alban, gan ei fod nawr wedi ei hysbysu, ni fydd y ddarpariaeth yn yr Alban mor eang ag yng Nghymru, hyd yn oed gyda'r ymyriad hwnnw. Gyda darpariaeth bresennol y farchnad ac ymyriad y sector cyhoeddus, ac os bydd prosiect cymorth band eang arloesol rhanbarthol yn cael ei hysbysu a'i gyflwyno, bydd y ddarpariaeth gryn dipyn yn fwy yng Nghymru nag y mae yn yr Alban.

Alun Cairns: Cydnabyddaf y pwynt hwnnw, ond fy mhwynt oedd hyn: nid y byddai mwy o ddarpariaeth yn yr Alban ar ôl ymyriad y sector cyhoeddus, ond ei bod wedi gwneud mwy o gynnydd na ni gyda negodiadau ymyrryd y sector cyhoeddus. Er mai ni a gyhoeddodd hynny gyntaf, ym mis Gorffennaf 2002, yr ydym ni yn dal i aros, ond mae'r Alban wedi gwneud mwy o gynnydd a Gogledd Iwerddon eisoes wedi cwblhau'r gwaith.

Andrew Davies: Bydd gan y rhan fwyaf o bobl yr ydym yn eu cynrychioli, boed yn ddefnyddwyr, yn unigolion neu'n gynrychiolwyr busnes, fwy o ddiddordeb i wybod pa mor gyflym y gallant ddefnyddio band eang nag mewn rhyw broses fewnol gyfrin yn yr UE.

Sylweddolaf nad oes gennyf lawer o amser ar ôl, ond dywedaf yn gyflym fod cynnydd sylweddol wedi'i wneud. Mae'r farchnad wedi newid yn sylweddol, a dyna pam y diwygiwyd strategaeth band eang Cymru. Mae'r strategaeth yn gweithio. Lle'r ydym wedi helpu annog marchnad, mae wedi bod yn fywiog. Mae nifer y bobl sy'n manteisio ar fand eang yn cynyddu'n sylweddol, ac mewn llawer achos, yn ôl nifer o ddangosyddion, fel mynediad i'r rhyngwyd,

whole. Nevertheless, there is a substantial way to go and I am confident that our strategy, working with the private sector, can deliver the benefits of broadband for the people of Wales.

mae nifer y bobl sydd wedi manteisio ar hyn yng Nghymru yn fwy nag yn y DU gyfan. Er hynny, mae angen gwneud llawer iawn o hyd, ac yr wyf yn hyderus y gall ein strategaeth, gan weithio gyda'r sector preifat, sicrhau manteision band eang i bobl Cymru.

Gwelliant 1: O blaid 23, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.

Amendment 1: For 23, Abstain 0, Against 29.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

Cynnig (NDM2452): O blaid 43, Ymatal 8, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM2452): For 43, Abstain 8, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn

Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.

5.00 p.m.

Dadl Fer **Short Debate**

Pam mae rhai Pleidleiswyr yn fwy Cyfartal nag Eraill **Why Some Voters are More Equal than Others**

Peter Black: I have received requests from Mike German, Nick Bourne and Helen Mary Jones to participate in the debate.

Peter Black: Yr wyf wedi cael ceisiadau gan Mike German, Nick Bourne a Helen Mary Jones i gymryd rhan yn y ddadl hon.

On 5 May, Labour won a third term of Government with a majority of 66 seats. It did that with the smallest share of the vote secured by any British Government for more

Ar 5 Mai, enillodd Llafur drydydd tymor mewn grym gyda mwyafrif o 66 sedd. Gwnaeth hynny gyda'r gyfran leiaf o'r bleidlais a sicrhawyd gan unrhyw

than 100 years. Labour's share of the vote was 35.2 per cent, amounting to just 21 per cent of the 44 million people eligible to vote, and yet Tony Blair now commands 55 per cent of the seats in the House of Commons. The Tories, who were only 2.8 per cent behind, have fewer seats than the number won in 1983 by Michael Foot and the Labour Party, in one of the most disastrous results ever experienced by modern Labour. They failed to break through the 200-seat barrier despite running the Government so close in the popular vote. The Liberal Democrats received just under two thirds of the vote share of Labour and the Tories, and yet they have less than a third of the number of MPs returned by the Conservatives, and 17.5 per cent of Labour's total.

The Guardian commented that, for the first time, a majority Government in Britain had been elected by fewer people than the number of those who could not be bothered to vote, and that Labour's 36 per cent share of the vote was lower than the 39 per cent of the electorate who did not make it to the polling station.

On these results, a Labour MP only needed 26,858 votes to be elected, compared with 44,241 votes for a Tory MP, and a staggering 98,484 votes for each Liberal Democrat MP. It could be argued that Liberal Democrat Members of Parliament have a much broader base of support, but the reality is that the value of one's vote is different depending on where you live. Some voters truly are more equal than others.

It is because of the distorted nature of this winner-takes-all system that Tony Blair was able to make the outrageous and untrue claim that a vote for the Liberal Democrats would let in the Tories. As was proved by the outcome, even a close-run thing in terms of the popular vote left Michael Howard floundering way behind.

The British electoral system is in a very poorly condition. That fact is now recognised by 62 per cent of British people, who,

Lywodraeth Brydeinig ers dros ganrif. Tri deg pump pwynt dau y cant oedd cyfran Llafur o'r bleidlais, sef dim ond 21 y cant o'r 44 miliwn o bobl sy'n gymwys i bleidleisio, ac eto mae Tony Blair yn hawlio 55 y cant o'r seddi yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin. Mae gan y Torïaid, na oeddent ond 2.8 y cant ar ei hôl hi, lai o seddi nag a enillwyd yn 1983 gan Michael Foot a'r Blaid Lafur, yn un o'r canlyniadau gwaethaf erioed yn hanes Llafur modern. Methwyd â sicrhau mwy na 200 o seddi er iddynt herio'r Llywodraeth mor agos ym mhleidlais y bobl. Cafodd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ychydig yn llai na dwy ran o dair o gyfran y bleidlais a gafodd Llafur a'r Torïaid, ac eto mae ganddynt lai na thraean yr ASau sydd gan y Ceidwadwyr, a 17.5 y cant o gyfanswm Llafur.

Dywedodd *The Guardian* fod Llywodraeth fwyafrifol wedi'i hethol ym Mhrydain am y tro cyntaf gan lai o bobl na'r nifer a oedd heb drafferthu pleidleisio, a bod cyfran Llafur o'r bleidlais, sef 36 y cant, yn is na'r 39 y cant o etholwyr nad aethant i'r orsaf bleidleisio.

O ystyried y canlyniadau hyn, dim ond 26,858 o bleidleisiau yr oedd ar AS Llafur eu hangen i gael ei ethol, o'u cymharu â 44,241 ar gyfer AS Torïaidd, a 98,484 ar gyfer pob AS Democrat Rhyddfrydol, sy'n ffigur rhyfeddol. Gellid dadlau bod gan Aelodau Seneddol y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol gefnogaeth lawer ehangach. Ond y gwirionedd yw bod gwerth pleidlais yn wahanol yn ôl ble yr ydych yn byw. Mae rhai pleidleiswyr yn wir yn fwy cyfartal na'i gilydd.

Natur wyrdröedig y system hon o'r cyntaf i'r felin yw'r rheswm pan yr oedd yn bosibl i Tony Blair wneud yr honiad gwarthus ac anwir y byddai pleidleisio dros y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn arwain at Lywodraeth Dorïaidd. Fel y profwyd gan y canlyniad, yr oedd hyd yn oed canlyniad agos ym mhleidlais y bobl yn golygu bod Michael Howard ymhell ar ei hôl hi.

Mae system etholiadol Prydain mewn cyflwr truenus iawn. Cydnabyddir y ffaith honno yn awr gan 62 y cant o bobl Prydain, sydd, yn ôl

according to an opinion poll in yesterday's edition of *The Independent*, believe that Britain should introduce a fair voting system. A comparison of the general election result with those of the other G8 countries reveals a stark and worrying trend. By far the best turnouts are those of Germany, with 79.1 per cent of those eligible to vote casting a ballot, Italy, with a turnout of 81.3 per cent, and Spain, with a 77.2 per cent turnout. All of these countries have a form of fair voting. Germany, which uses a system devised for it by the British after the second world war, elected a Government that attracted the support of 37.4 per cent of those eligible to vote.

The country that comes closest to reflecting Britain's dysfunctional result is the United States of America. In its presidential election last year, 60 per cent of those eligible to vote did so, which is 1.3 per cent less than in the UK. However, George Bush secured the support of 30.6 per cent of those Americans eligible to vote, which is a 9 per cent improvement on Tony Blair's performance. The chads may still be hanging in Florida, but here in Britain, the Labour Government cannot even motivate people to spoil their ballot paper, never mind cast a positive vote for a third term.

A closer look at the outcome of the election result throws up more and more anomalies. In Surrey for example, 148,000 votes were cast for the Liberal Democrats, 87,000 people voted Labour, and yet every seat was won by the Conservatives. The Tories gained 50,000 more votes than Labour in England, but won 92 fewer English seats. If the number of votes cast had been reflected in the number of seats in Parliament, then the Liberal Democrats would have more than doubled the number of seats they won, from 62 to 141, Labour would have had 227 seats, not 356, and the Tories would have won 209 seats rather than 197.

All of this presupposes a pure form of proportional representation. We in the Assembly know that such a creature does not exist. Any new system that seeks to retain a constituency link will always produce a less

arolwg barn yn rhifyn ddoe o *The Independent*, yn credu y dylai Prydain gyflwyno system bleidleisio deg. Mae cymharu canlyniad yr etholiad cyffredinol â chanlyniad rhai gwledydd eraill y G8 yn dangos tuedd sy'n peri gofid. Ymhlith y gwledydd sydd â'r ganran orau o bobl gymwys yn pleidleisio mae'r Almaen, gyda 79.1 y cant yn gwneud hynny, yr Eidal, gyda chanran o 81.3 y cant, a Sbaen, gyda chanran o 77.2 y cant. Mae gan bob un o'r gwledydd hyn system bleidleisio deg. Etholodd yr Almaen, sy'n defnyddio system a luniwyd iddi gan Brydain ar ôl yr ail ryfel byd, Lywodraeth a gafodd gefnogaeth 37.4 y cant o'r rhai sy'n gymwys i bleidleisio.

Y wlad sydd debycaf i Brydain o ran ei chanlyniad camweithredol yw Unol Daleithiau America. Yn ei hetholiad i ddewis arlywydd y llynedd, bu i 60 y cant o'r rhai sy'n gymwys i bleidleisio wneud hynny, sef 1.3 y cant yn llai nag yn y DU. Fodd bynnag, sicrhodd George Bush gefnogaeth 30.6 y cant o'r Americanwyr hynny sy'n gymwys i bleidleisio, sef 9 y cant yn uwch na pherfformiad Tony Blair. Efallai bod y darnau mân o bapur yn dal i hedfan yn Florida, ond yma ym Mhrydain ni all y Llywodraeth Lafur hyd yn oed ysgogi pobl i ddifetha eu papurau pleidleisio, heb sôn am roi pleidlais gadarnhaol am drydydd tymor.

O edrych yn fanylach ar ganlyniad yr etholiad, gwelir mwy a mwy o anghysonderau. Yn Surrey, er enghraifft, cafodd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol 148,000 o bleidleisiau, pleidleisiodd 87,000 o bobl i Lafur, ac eto'r Ceidwadwyr a enillodd bob sedd. Enillodd y Torïaid 50,000 yn fwy o bleidleisiau na Llafur yn Lloegr, ond 92 yn llai o seddi yn Lloegr. Pe byddai nifer y pleidleisiau a fwriwyd wedi'i adlewyrchu yn nifer y seddi yn y Senedd, yna byddai'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wedi mwy na dyblu nifer y seddi a enillodd, o 62 i 141, byddai Llafur wedi ennill 227 o seddi, nid 356, a byddai'r Torïaid wedi ennill 209 o seddi yn hytrach na 197.

Mae hyn oll yn rhagdybio ffurf bur ar gynrychiolaeth gyfrannol. Yn y Cynulliad, fe wyddom nad yw'r fath beth yn bod. Bydd unrhyw system newydd sy'n ceisio cadw cysylltiad etholaethol bob amser yn sicrhau

than proportional result, but at least it might lead to an approximately fair result, unlike the travesty that we are saddled with at present.

It is vital that any replacement system of voting is properly proportional and retains a constituency link. The Assembly system conspicuously fails to do this, as is illustrated by the fact that Labour won half the seats in 2003 with less than 40 per cent of the vote. I would never argue for the hybrid that we have here because it effectively produces two different types of Assembly Member with different loyalties and interests.

I would argue for the single transferable vote system, in which constituencies elect between three and six MPs. Under this system, voters do not just say which candidate they like best, but place the candidates in order of preference. It is already used in Northern Ireland for all elections other than to the House of Commons, and will be used in Scottish local government elections from 2007. Locally popular independents and minor party candidates such as Peter Law and John Marek could win the occasional seat under the single transferable vote system, although they would still be under-represented. For the rest, the single transferable vote system places a premium on an ability to pick up the second preferences of other parties' supporters, a feature that in Wales would be likely to benefit Labour, the Welsh Liberal Democrats, and possibly Plaid Cymru. However, that need not be the case in other parts of the country where there might be different outcomes in terms of people's second preferences. Importantly, the single transferable vote system retains a constituency link and does so in a way that all the MPs elected from a particular constituency operate on a level playing field.

One argument that is often quoted against this system is that it might lead to a weak or coalition Government. Having served in a coalition Government myself, there is nothing weak about such a creature. Most political parties are coalitions, and the

canlyniad nad yw'n hollol gyfrannol. Ond o leiaf gallai arwain at ganlyniad gweddol deg, yn wahanol i'r ystumiad sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd.

Mae'n hanfodol i unrhyw system bleidleisio newydd fod yn hollol gyfrannol ac yn cadw cysylltiad etholaethol. Mae system y Cynulliad yn amlwg yn methu â gwneud hyn, fel y dangosir gan y ffaith fod Llafur wedi ennill hanner y seddi yn 2003 gyda llai na 40 y cant o'r bleidlais. Ni fyddwn byth yn dadlau dros yr hybrid sydd gennym yma oherwydd mae, i bob diben, yn creu dau fath gwahanol o Aelod Cynulliad sydd â theyrngarwch a buddiannau gwahanol.

Byddwn yn dadlau dros system pleidlais sengl drosglwyddadwy, lle mae etholaethau yn ethol rhwng tri a chwe AS. O dan y system hon, nid dim ond dweud pa ymgeiswyr sydd orau ganddynt fydd pleidleiswyr, ond maent yn gosod yr ymgeiswyr yn nhrefn blaenoriaeth. Fe'i defnyddir yng Ngogledd Iwerddon eisoes ar gyfer pob etholiad heblaw Tŷ'r Cyffredin, a chaiff ei defnyddio yn etholiadau llywodraeth leol yr Alban o 2007. Gallai ymgeiswyr annibynnol poblogaidd lleol ac ymgeiswyr pleidiau bach megis Peter Law a John Marek ennill ambell sedd o dan system y bleidlais sengl drosglwyddadwy, er ba fyddent wedyn yn cael eu cynrychioli'n llawn. Am y gweddill, mae system y bleidlais sengl drosglwyddadwy yn rhoi gwerth ar y gallu i ennill ail bleidlais cefnogwyr pleidiau eraill, sy'n nodwedd a fyddai'n debygol o fod o fudd i Lafur, y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, a Phlaid Cymru efallai, yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddai hynny'n digwydd o reidrwydd mewn rhannau eraill o'r wlad lle gellid cael canlyniadau gwahanol o ran ail ddewis pobl. Yn bwysicach na dim, mae system y bleidlais sengl drosglwyddadwy yn cadw cysylltiad etholaethol ac yn gwneud hynny mewn ffordd sy'n sicrhau bod pob AS a etholir o etholaeth benodol yn gydradd.

Un ddadl a ddefnyddir yn aml yn erbyn y system hon yw y gallai arwain at Lywodraeth wan neu glymblaid. Ar ôl bod yn rhan o Lywodraeth glymblaid, gallaf ddweud nad oes unrhyw beth gwan yn ei chylch. Mae'r mwyafrif o bleidiau gwleidyddol yn

implementation of policy and the act of governance is a constant process of negotiation. The only difference in a coalition of parties is that the process of negotiation is wider and may require all sides to moderate their stance; that is no bad thing. On the contrary, political parties working together for the good of the country is a good thing. More to the point, if they are able to command a majority in the House of Commons, then they are also likely to have majority support in the country, a luxury denied to every post-war Government.

All of these arguments have been put before. However, the reason that they are becoming more relevant lies in the voting trends in the UK since the second world war. In 1945, Labour was elected with a 146-seat majority and 47.8 per cent of the vote. In that election, the two main parties commanded the support of 87.6 per cent of those voting.

In 1950, Labour and the Tories together attracted 89.6 per cent of the vote, while in 1951 they persuaded 96.8 per cent of those going to the polling station to support one or the other. Since then, the habit of voting Labour or Conservative in a general election has been in steady decline. In both 1974 elections, the two parties attracted the support of 75 per cent of those voting, in 1987 it was 73 per cent, in 2001 it was 72.4 per cent, and earlier this month it was only 67.5 per cent.

5.10 p.m.

The old loyalties are dying out; people are becoming more motivated by issues than by party allegiance. Our political system is becoming more diverse and people want more choice. The problem is that when they exercise that choice, the system suppresses it. It is no wonder that people are disillusioned.

Deputy Presiding Officer, the 2005 general election has underlined the need for change far more eloquently than anything I can say. This is no longer an argument about fairness. It is about the process of engagement with the electorate, it is about ensuring that when they

glymbleidiau, a'r gwaith o weithredu polisïau a llywodraethu yn broses negodi barhaus. Yr unig wahaniaeth mewn clymblaid yw bod y broses negodi yn ehangach a gall fod yn ofynnol i bob plaid gymedroli ei safbwyntiau; nid yw hynny'n beth drwg. I'r gwrthwyneb, mae cydweithio rhwng pleidiau gwleidyddol er lles y wlad yn beth da. Yn fwy penodol, os gallant sicrhau mwyafrif yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin, maent hefyd yn debygol o gael cefnogaeth y mwyafrif ledled y wlad, sy'n rhywbeth amheuthun nad oes yr un Llywodraeth wedi'i fwynhau ers diwedd y rhyfel.

Mae'r holl ddadleuon hyn wedi'u mynegi o'r blaen. Fodd bynnag, y rheswm pam maent yn dod yn fwy perthnasol yw'r tueddiadau pleidleisio yn y DU ers yr ail ryfel byd. Yn 1945, etholwyd Llafur gyda mwyafrif o 146 o seddi a 47.8 y cant o'r bleidlais. Yn yr etholiad hwnnw, sicrhaodd y ddwy brif blaid gefnogaeth 87.6 y cant o'r rhai a bleidleisiodd.

Yn 1950, cafodd Llafur a'r Torïaid 89.6 y cant o'r bleidlais gyda'i gilydd, ac yn 1951 pleidleisiodd 96.8 y cant o'r rhai a aeth i'r orsaf dros y naill neu'r llall. Ers hynny, mae'r duedd o bleidleisio i Lafur neu'r Ceidwadwyr mewn etholiad cyffredinol wedi dirywio'n raddol. Yn y ddau etholiad yn 1974, cafodd y ddwy blaid gefnogaeth 75 y cant o'r rhai a bleidleisiodd, yn 1987 cawsant gefnogaeth 73 y cant, yn 2001 cawsant gefnogaeth 72.4 y cant, ac yn gynharach y mis hwn cawsant ddim ond 67.5 y cant.

Mae'r hen deyrngarwch yn diflannu; mae pobl yn cael eu hysgogi'n fwy gan bynciau na chan deyrngarwch i blaid. Mae ein system wleidyddol yn dod yn fwy amrywiol ac mae pobl am gael mwy o ddewis. Y broblem yw, pan fyddant yn arfer y dewis hwnnw, fod y system yn atal hynny. Nid yw'n syndod fod pobl wedi eu dadrithio.

Ddirprwy Lywydd, mae etholiad cyffredinol 2005 wedi tanlinellu'r angen am newid lawer yn fwy huawdl nag unrhyw beth y gallaf fi ei ddweud. Nid dadl ynghylch tegwch mo hyn mwyach. Mae'n ymwneud â'r broses o ymgysylltu ag etholwyr, mae'n ymwneud â

choose, people get what they voted for, and it is about giving people a reason to vote because they might feel for the first time that it makes a difference no matter what part of the country they live in. For the first time, all voters might be as equal as each other.

Michael German: I thank Peter for bringing this important issue to our attention today. He is right to say that we have an electoral system that is outmoded and inadequate, and, more fundamentally, it is one that cheats the voters of Britain.

I will mention three stark facts in the minute that I have. First, it took 20,511 voters in Wales to elect a Labour MP, yet it took 99,376 to elect a Conservative. While it might have been great fun and sport to have a Tory-free Wales, I think that it was unfair on the voters who voted Conservative not to be represented. Secondly, this is the first election in which the number of people who voted for the majority Government, that is 35.2 per cent, was less than the number of people that decided not to go out and vote at all, which was 39 per cent. The third statistic refers to the fact that Neil Kinnock lost the 1992 general election with almost precisely the same share of the vote that gave Tony Blair an overarching majority.

Peter is right that the first past the post system has long outlived its usefulness, and it is time that it is reformed and recreated, and replaced by one that does not cheat voters.

Nick Bourne: I am grateful to Peter for bringing this forward and giving me a minute of his time. I will say a little about proportional representation and about the present system of first past the post. Even though it is a case of first past the post, the present system undoubtedly operates in an unfair way, because constituencies are very different sizes. The Isle of Wight, with a population of some 115,000 to 116,000, elects one MP, while many other constituencies are half that size. Therefore, there are discrepancies within our current system.

sicrhau, pan fyddant yn dewis, fod pobl yn cael yr hyn y maent yn pleidleisio drosto, ac mae'n ymwneud â rhoi rheswm i bobl bleidleisio oherwydd gallent deimlo, am y tro cyntaf, ei bod yn gwneud gwahaniaeth waeth ym mha ran o'r wlad y maent yn byw. Am y tro cyntaf, efallai y bydd pob etholwr mor gyfartal â'i gilydd.

Michael German: Hoffwn ddiolch i Peter am dynnu ein sylw at y mater pwysig hwn heddiw. Mae yn llygad ei le yn y ffaith fod gennym system etholiadol hen ffasiwn ac annigonol, ac yn bwysicach na hynny, mae'n system sy'n twyllo pleidleiswyr Prydain.

Fe soniaf am dair ffaith foel yn y munud sydd gennyf. Yn gyntaf, cymerodd 20,511 o bleidleiswyr yng Nghymru i ethol AS Llafur, ond cymerodd 99,376 i ethol Ceidwadwr. Er y gallai fod wedi yn llawer o hwyl a sbri i fod wedi cael Cymru heb Dorïaid, credaf ei bod yn annheg â'r rhai a bleidleisiodd i'r Ceidwadwyr beidio â chael eu cynrychioli. Yn ail, dyma'r etholiad cyntaf lle yr oedd nifer y bobl a bleidleisiodd dros y Llywodraeth fwyafrifol, sef 35.2 y cant, yn llai na nifer y bobl a benderfynodd beidio â phleidleisio o gwbl, sef 39 y cant. Mae'r trydydd ystadegyn yn cyfeirio at y ffaith fod Neil Kinnock wedi colli etholiad cyffredinol 1992 gyda bron yn union yr un gyfran o'r bleidlais ag a roddodd fwyafrif cynhwysfawr i Tony Blair.

Mae Peter yn gywir bod defnyddioldeb system y cyntaf i'r felin wedi hen ddod i ben, ac mae'n bryd inni ei diwygio a'i hail-greu, a chyflwyno system nad yw'n twyllo pleidleiswyr.

Nick Bourne: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Peter am gyflwyno'r mater hwn a rhoi munud o'i amser imi. Soniaf ychydig am gynrychiolaeth gyfrannol a system bresennol y cyntaf i'r felin. Er mai'r cyntaf i'r felin a gaiff falu, mae'r system bresennol yn annheg yn ddiau, oherwydd bod maint etholaethau yn wahanol iawn. Mae Ynys Wyth, sydd â phoblogaeth o ryw 115,000 i 116,000, yn ethol un AS, ond hanner maint honno yw nifer o etholaethau eraill. Felly, mae yna anghysonderau yn ein system bresennol.

Peter referred to people voting for parties in greater numbers previously but, even in 1951, there was a Conservative Government although more people had voted for Labour. In February 1974, the situation was reversed when Harold Wilson entered 10 Downing Street even though more people had voted for Ted Heath. So, there is no doubt that there are difficulties with the present system.

This is a serious issue that deserves serious consideration. There are many different forms of PR, and Peter has outlined one. The matter demands closer attention. There are two possible difficulties that I will mention; they are not necessarily fatal. One is that even though what Peter has outlined is undoubtedly more democratic, you could still have a situation where a party with a very small number of votes—the Free Democrats in Germany is an example of this, with support from 5 per cent of the electorate—is constantly in Government because of horse-trading.

Finally, there is a danger that we give strength to some of the fringe parties, and I do not mean yours, John, but to parties that are very unlike yours, like the BNP. One merit of the British system at present is that it tends to ensure that such parties do not get represented.

Helen Mary Jones: I too am grateful to Peter Black for raising this important issue. There can be no doubt that the first-past-the-post system that we use for Westminster elections was highly radical and innovative in the 1870s. It is fundamentally out of date and archaic now. It is time for a change to a system that makes everyone's vote count. While I take Nick Bourne's point about the danger of minority parties coming into Parliament, perhaps it is better to have them in Parliament, if they must be there, than to have them sniping from the outside. The risk is that if people do not feel involved in the democratic process, then they will turn to that kind of extremism. We all have a job to do on that.

In Wales, much research has been done about this, and the work of the Richard commission

Cyfeiriodd Peter at y ffaith fod mwy o bobl gynt yn pleidleisio dros bleidiau, ond hyd yn oed yn 1951 cafwyd Llywodraeth Geidwadol er i fwy o bobl bleidleisio dros Lafur. Ym mis Chwefror 1974, gwyrddwyd y sefyllfa pan etholwyd Harold Wilson i 10 Downing Street er i fwy o bobl bleidleisio dros Ted Heath. Felly, mae yna anawsterau gyda'r system bresennol yn ddiau.

Mae hwn yn fater difrifol sy'n haeddu ei gymryd o ddifrif. Mae yna lawer math gwahanol o gynrychiolaeth gyfrannol, ac mae Peter wedi amlinellu un ohonynt. Mae angen edrych yn fanylach ar y mater. Fe grybwyllaf ddau anhawster posibl; nid rhai tyngedfennol o reidrwydd. Y naill yw hwn, sef er bod yr hyn y mae Peter wedi'i amlinellu yn fwy democrataidd yn ddiau, gallech gael sefyllfa o hyd lle mae plaid â nifer fach iawn o bleidleisiau—mae'r Democratiaid Rhydd yn yr Almaen yn enghraifft o hyn, gyda chefnogaeth 5 y cant o'r etholaeth—mewn grym yn barhaus oherwydd bargeinio.

Yn olaf, mae perygl inni rymuso rhai o'r pleidiau ymylol, ac nid wyf yn golygu eich plaid chi, John, ond pleidiau sy'n wahanol iawn i'ch plaid, megis y BNP. Un o rinweddau'r system bresennol sydd gennym ym Mhrydain yw ei bod yn tueddu sicrhau nad yw pleidiau felly'n cael eu cynrychioli.

Helen Mary Jones: Hoffwn i hefyd ddiolch i Peter Black am godi'r mater pwysig hwn. Nid oes amheuaeth nad oedd system y cyntaf i'r felin a ddefnyddiwn ar gyfer etholiadau San Steffan yn radical ac yn arloesol iawn yn y 1870au. Erbyn hyn mae'n hen ffasiwn ac yn hynafol. Mae'n bryd newid i system sy'n sicrhau bod pleidlais pawb yn cyfrif. Er fy mod yn derbyn pwynt Nick Bourne ynghylch y perygl y caiff pleidiau lleiafrifol eu hethol i'r Senedd, efallai ei bod yn well iddynt fod yn y Senedd, os oes rhaid eu cael o gwbl, yn hytrach na'u cael yn cyfarth ar yr ymylon. Y perygl yw, os nad yw pobl yn teimlo eu bod yn rhan o'r broses ddemocrataidd, y byddant yn troi at y math hwnnw o eithafiaeth. Mae gan bob un ohonom waith i'w wneud yn y maes hwnnw.

Yng Nghymru, mae llawer o waith ymchwil wedi'i wneud am hyn, a rhaid canmol gwaith

must be commended. It is clear that we should adopt the single transferable vote system as advocated by the Richard commission, and I am afraid that it is only the Labour Party's self-interest that will prevent us from doing so.

The Deputy Minister for Local Government and Public Services (Christine Chapman): I thank Peter Black and those who have contributed to this important debate. I am responding in my position as Deputy Minister to Sue Essex.

Peter has chosen to focus his concern for equality on proportional representation, and a critique of the first-past-the-post electoral system, to which I will respond. However, our concern for equality should require us to examine many other aspects of the electoral system—we should be concerned with accessibility, and the difficulties that some people have in reaching polling stations, or in understanding the system.

The most obvious way in which some voters have an advantage over others is in accessibility to the system. Disability, infirmity, and not speaking English are among a number of limitations, and should be part of the wider debate. There are still polling stations that are difficult for disabled people to access. I am pleased that Bryn Parry-Jones, the leading spokesman for Welsh returning officers, reported last week to the Local Government and Public Services Committee that this situation is gradually improving. The Electoral Commission has proposed that all polling station places be regularly reviewed, and that returning officers should have the right to use any public buildings in their area. I support both these positions.

We should also be concerned with matters relating to electoral registration, postal voting, and language difficulties. Recent cases in Birmingham and elsewhere have indicated that, in certain circumstances, the system of postal voting on demand can be abused by people determined to achieve a fraudulent result. There is no evidence of this

comisiwn Richard. Mae'n amlwg y dylem fabwysiadu'r system pleidlais sengl drosglwyddadwy fel y cymeradwywyd gan gomisiwn Richard, ac ofnaf mai dim ond hunan fudd y Blaid Lafur fydd yn ein hatal rhag gwneud hynny.

Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Lywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus (Christine Chapman): Hoffwn ddiolch i Peter Black a'r rhai sydd wedi cyfrannu i'r ddadl bwysig hon. Yr wyf yn ymateb yn rhinwedd fy swydd fel Dirprwy Weinidog i Sue Essex.

Wrth godi ei bryderon mae Peter wedi dewis canolbwyntio ar gydraddoldeb mewn cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol, a beirniadaeth ar system etholiadol y cyntaf i'r felin, a byddaf yn ymateb i hynny. Fodd bynnag, dylai ein hawydd am gydraddoldeb ei gwneud yn ofynnol inni archwilio llawer agwedd arall ar y system etholiadol—dylem ymboeni ynghylch hygyrchedd, a'r anawsterau a gaiff rhai pobl i gyrraedd gorsafoddedd pleidleisio, neu i ddeall y system.

Y ffordd fwyaf amlwg lle mae gan rai pleidleiswyr fantais dros eraill yw hygyrchedd y system. Mae anabledd, llesgedd a'r anallu i siarad Saesneg ymhlith nifer o gyfyngiadau, a dylent fod yn rhan o'r ddadl ehangach. Mae yna orsafoddedd pleidleisio o hyd lle mae'n anodd i bobl anabl fynd i mewn. Yr wyf yn falch fod Bryn Parry-Jones, y prif lefarydd dros swyddogion canlyniadau Cymru, wedi dweud wrth y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus yr wythnos diwethaf fod y sefyllfa hon yn gwella'n raddol. Mae'r Comisiwn Etholiadol wedi cynnig y dylai pob gorsaf bleidleisio gael ei hadolygu'n rheolaidd, ac y dylai fod hawl gan swyddogion canlyniadau i ddefnyddio unrhyw adeiladau cyhoeddus yn eu hardal. Cefnogaf y ddau safbwynt hyn.

Dylem hefyd ymboeni am faterion yn ymwneud â chofrestru etholiadol, pleidleisio drwy'r post, ac anawsterau iaith. Mae achosion yn Birmingham yn ddiweddar ac mewn lleoedd eraill wedi awgrymu, o dan rai amgylchiadau, y gall y system pleidleisio drwy'r post ar gais gael ei chamdefnyddio gan bobl sy'n benderfynol o gael canlyniad

happening in Wales, but I am pleased to hear that the UK Government has said that it will address this matter urgently. Yesterday's Queen's Speech announced plans for a new offence of fraudulently applying for a postal vote, which will be important ahead of the next Assembly elections. In general, however, we should welcome moves to modernise the electoral system.

The primary responsibility for encouraging people to vote lies with us, the politicians. We have the responsibility to explain to voters the significance of government for people in their everyday lives, and the importance of the choices that we offer. However, if people want to use different technologies to make their electoral choices, we should consider how we can increase the convenience of voting without reducing the security of the system.

I will say a few words about voter registration. We must ensure that the process of registration does not prevent or discourage people from voting. Many people felt unequal on 5 May because they found out too late that they were not registered. The traditional annual canvassing of householders can lead to many missing out in an age when there are increasing numbers of young people living in houses in multiple occupation, and when people move house more often than was the case in the past. Those who are aware of electoral processes will ensure that they register, but most people, despite the increased level of advertising, will not be aware. They think that if the council tax department, or the Inland Revenue, knows where they are, then so does the registration officer. We need to move to individual registration, but that must be supported by more powers and more encouragement for registration officers to increase the numbers on the register.

Peter Black *rose*—

Christine Chapman: I am coming on to the point now.

twyllodrus. Nid oes unrhyw dystiolaeth fod hyn wedi digwydd yng Nghymru, ond yr wyf yn falch o glywed bod Llywodraeth y DU wedi dweud y bydd yn ymdrin â'r mater hwn ar fyrder. Yn Araith y Frenhines ddoe cyhoeddwyd cynlluniau ar gyfer trosedd newydd o wneud cais twyllodrus am bleidlais drwy'r post, a bydd hyn yn bwysig wrth inni ddynesu at etholiadau nesaf y Cynulliad. Yn gyffredinol, fodd bynnag, dylem groesawu unrhyw ymgais i foderneiddio'r system etholiadol.

Arnom ni, y gwleidyddion, y mae'r cyfrifoldeb pennaf dros annog pobl i bleidleisio. Mae cyfrifoldeb arnom i esbonio wrth bleidleiswyr arwyddocâd llywodraeth i bobl yn eu bywydau pob dydd, a phwysigrwydd y dewisiadau a gynigiwn. Fodd bynnag, os yw pobl am ddefnyddio gwahanol dechnolegau i wneud eu dewisiadau etholiadol, dylem ystyried sut y gallwn wneud y broses bleidleisio yn fwy cyfleus heb wneud y system yn llai diogel.

Hoffwn ddweud ychydig eiriau ynglŷn â chofrestru pleidleiswyr. Rhaid inni sicrhau na fydd y broses gofrestru yn atal pobl rhag pleidleisio, na gwneud iddynt benderfynu peidio â phleidleisio. Yr oedd nifer o bobl yn teimlo'n anghydradd ar 5 Mai am eu bod wedi sylweddoli'n rhy hwyr nad oeddent wedi'u cofrestru. Gall y broses flynyddol draddodiadol o ganfasio deiliaid tai beri i nifer golli cyfle i gofrestru mewn oes lle mae nifer gynyddol o bobl ifanc yn byw mewn tai amlfeddiant, a lle mae pobl yn symud tŷ yn amlach na chynt. Bydd y rhai sy'n ymwybodol o brosesau etholiadol yn sicrhau eu bod yn cofrestru, ond ni fydd y rhan fwyaf o bobl, er yr hysbysebu ychwanegol, yn ymwybodol ohonynt. Credant os yw'r adran dreth gyngor, neu Gyllid y Wlad, yn gwybod ble maent, yna bydd y swyddog cofrestru yn gwybod hynny. Mae angen inni newid i gofrestru unigolion, ond rhaid i hynny gael ei gefnogi gan ragor o bwerau a mwy o anogaeth i swyddogion cofrestru gynyddu'r niferoedd sydd ar y gofrestr.

Peter Black *a gododd*—

Christine Chapman: Yr wyf ar fin dod at y pwynt yn awr.

Peter Black: Good, I am glad. When you go to acting school, you are taught the methods of acting. However, when you go to perform a play, your first question is, 'What is my motivation?'. You talk about the technical aspects of voting, but what is the motivation for people to go to vote if, when they vote, their vote is meaningless?

Christine Chapman: This is a complex argument, Peter, and I wanted to ensure that all these issues were included.

5.20 p.m.

I will now say a few things about proportional representation. There has been an increase in the debate over the case for more proportional voting systems in recent years. The National Assembly for Wales is itself an innovation in electoral systems. The case for PR is usually made on the ground that an Assembly or Parliament should, in its composition, closely reflect the party preferences of the population. This is a sound argument and I do not or dismiss it lightly or totally. However, equally, and I noted Mike German's point, I do not agree with the comment that the first-past-the-post system cheats the voter. This is a complex argument, and there are two sides to it. When we cast our votes, we are not just electing a Parliament or an Assembly—and I, too, saw the survey carried out on behalf of *The Independent*—we are also electing a person to represent our constituency. One advantage of the present system is the strong personal link between constituents and their elected member. A great deal of an elected representative's work is constituency business, and is about resolving constituents' problems and raising the particular concerns of the area with the Government. There is an argument that a PR system could either abolish or weaken this link. I know, from his comments, that Peter Black does not agree with that, but that is the argument made. However, it is also the case that, when we cast our votes, we are seeking to elect not only our individual representative, and not only a Parliament, but a Government.

Helen Mary Jones: Do you accept that the Richard commission examined those issues,

Peter Black: Da iawn, yr wyf yn falch clywed. Pan ewch i ysgol ddrama, mae'n dysgu dulliau actio ichi. Fodd bynnag, pan ewch ati i berfformio drama, eich cwestiwn cyntaf yw, 'Beth yw fy nghymhelliant?'. Yr ydych yn sôn am yr agweddau technegol ar bleidleisio, ond beth yw'r cymhelliant i bobl fynd i bleidleisio os yw eu pleidlais yn ddiystyr ar ôl iddynt bleidleisio?

Christine Chapman: Mae hon yn ddadl gymhleth, Peter, ac yr oeddwn am sicrhau bod pob un o'r materion hyn wedi'i gynnwys.

Soniaf ychydig yn awr am gynrychiolaeth gyfrannol. Yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf cafwyd dadl gynyddol ynglŷn â systemau pleidleisio mwy cyfrannol. Mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ei hun yn arloesi gyda systemau etholiadol. Cyflwynir yr achos dros gynrychiolaeth gyfrannol fel arfer ar y sail y dylai Cynulliad neu Senedd, o ran aelodaeth, adlewyrchu'n agos ddewis pobl o bleidiau. Mae hon yn ddadl gadarn ac nid wyf yn ei diystyru'n llwyr na heb feddwl. Fodd bynnag, yn ogystal, ac yr wyf wedi nodi pwynt Mike German, ni chytunaf â'r sylw fod system y cyntaf i'r felin yn twyllo'r pleidleisiwr. Mae hon yn ddadl gymhleth, ac mae dwy ochr iddi. Pan fyddwn yn bwrw ein pleidlais, nid dim ond Senedd neu Gynulliad yr ydym yn ei ethol— a gwelais innau hefyd yr arolwg a wnaed ar ran *The Independent*—yr ydym hefyd yn ethol unigolyn i gynrychioli ein hetholaeth. Un o fanteision y system bresennol yw'r cysylltiad personol cryf rhwng etholwyr a'u haelod etholedig. Materion etholaethol yw llawer o waith cynrychiolydd etholedig, ac mae a wnelo â datrys problemau etholwyr a chodi pryderon penodol yr ardal gyda'r Llywodraeth. Dadleuir y gallai system cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol ddileu neu wanhau'r cysylltiad hwn. Gwn, o'i sylwadau, nad yw Peter Black yn cytuno â hynny, ond dyna'r ddadl a roddir. Fodd bynnag, mae'n wir dweud hefyd, pan fyddwn yn bwrw ein pleidlais, ein bod nid yn unig yn ceisio ethol ein cynrychiolydd unigol, a Senedd, ond Llywodraeth hefyd.

Helen Mary Jones: A dderbyniwch fod comisiwn Richard wedi ystyried y materion

and that that was one of its reasons for stating that the current system for electing Assembly Members has inadequacies? That is why it suggested the single transferable vote, which retains the local link—and I agree with you that that is important—but also inserts the element of proportionality. It depends upon the system, does it not?

Christine Chapman: We have all discussed the Richard commission's recommendations, and the single transferable vote is probably the fairest system. It is not without its merits, but it is about getting consensus on that, which is important.

The inherent advantage of the first-past-the-post system is that it translates our vote for a constituency representative into a vote for a Government. The United Kingdom has a Labour Government because more people voted for Labour than for any other party. There is clarity of choice and clarity of political leadership in Government that we should not discard lightly. To return to the report in *The Independent*, although it said that many people are in favour of PR, they still want that clarity of Government and leadership. A PR system does not allow any direct translation from votes cast to the formation of a Government.

Denise Idris Jones: Do you agree that, when first-past-the-post Members are elected, it gives the people of the country a firm Government to which they can relate? There is confusion with coalitions; it may have worked during the war, but it does not work outside of war.

Christine Chapman: That goes back to the point that there is clarity of Government under this system, and, ultimately, voters want firm leadership and policies that they can identify with. Almost inevitably, if you talk about a PR system—

Eleanor Burnham: Will you take an intervention?

Christine Chapman: I will not take any

hynny, ac mai dyna un o'r rhesymau iddo ddweud bod y system gyfredol o ethol Aelodau Cynulliad yn ddiffygiol? Dyna pam yr awgrymodd y bleidlais sengl drosglwyddadwy, sy'n cadw'r cysylltiad lleol—a chytunaf â chi fod hynny'n bwysig—ond mae hefyd yn cynnwys elfen o gyfrannedd. Mae'n dibynnu ar y system, onid yw?

Christine Chapman: Yr ydym bob un wedi trafod argymhellion comisiwn Richard, ac mae'n debyg mai'r bleidlais sengl drosglwyddadwy yw'r system decaf. Mae iddi rinweddau, ond yr hyn sydd ei angen yw cael consensws ar hynny, sy'n bwysig.

Mantais gynhenid system y cyntaf i'r felin yw ei bod yn troi ein pleidlais dros gynrychiolydd etholaethol yn bleidlais dros Lywodraeth. Mae gan y Deyrnas Unedig Lywodraeth Lafur am fod mwy o bobl wedi pleidleisio dros Lafur na thros unrhyw blaid arall. Mae yna eglurder o ran dewis ac eglurder o ran arweinyddiaeth wleidyddol y Llywodraeth ac ni ddylem ddileu hynny'n ddifeddwl. I ddychwelyd at yr adroddiad yn *The Independent*, er iddo ddweud bod nifer o bobl o blaid cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol, maent yn dal yn awyddus i gael eglurder o ran Llywodraeth ac arweinyddiaeth. Nid yw system cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol yn caniatáu trosglwyddo unrhyw bleidleisiau a fwriwyd i ffurfio Llywodraeth.

Denise Idris Jones: A gytunwch, pan gaiff Aelodau'r cyntaf i'r felin eu hethol, ei bod yn rhoi Llywodraeth gadarn i bobl y wlad y gallant uniaethu â hi? Mae clymbleidiau yn peri dryswch; efallai iddynt weithio yn ystod y rhyfel, ond nid ydynt yn gweithio mewn cyfnodau o heddwch.

Christine Chapman: Mae hynny'n mynd yn ôl at y pwynt fod eglurder Llywodraeth o dan y system hon, ac yn y pen draw mae pleidleiswyr am gael arweinyddiaeth a pholisïau cadarn y gallant uniaethu â hwy. Mae bron yn anochel, os ydych yn sôn am system cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol—

Eleanor Burnham: A dderbyniwch ymyriad?

Christine Chapman: Ni dderbyniaf ragor,

more, Eleanor, as I need to get on.

A PR system, almost inevitably, requires a coalition. Under PR, the formation of a Government is undertaken through the choices of elected politicians: it is they who choose to form that coalition, rather than the Government being directly chosen by the electorate. Coalition Governments can be unfair, as small parties with only a small percentage of support nationally can hold the balance of power and force through unpopular or narrow policies with no meaningful mandate other than their solidarity with the ruling party. I am pleased that Nick Bourne mentioned the dangers of small parties such as the BNP. It is a complex argument, and there are issues on either side.

There are various models of PR, and some aspects of our additional member system here may have discredited PR by allowing some candidates to have two bites at the cherry. Candidates can be defeated in a constituency and then proceed to the Assembly via the list system. If we are talking about engaging with people, this has caused great confusion for voters.

Eleanor Burnham: The system here was a sort of ad hoc sop to PR that we did not call for. It was invented, probably, by your Labour Government. The issue now is the engagement of people in elections, and all the polls show that people feel totally disengaged. That is the point that we are trying to make. You are talking about strong or weak Governments, but, quite frankly, the Labour Government is a very weak Government, and it has been for some time. It has pushed through an awful lot of legislation that is deemed to be quite unpopular, and that has weakened its stance.

Christine Chapman: I do not agree with that, Eleanor. The Labour Government has delivered on a lot of issues that matter to the people of Wales. However, I am glad that we agree that the system here has many flaws.

Eleanor. Mae angen imi fwrw ymlaen.

Mae system cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol, bron yn anochel, yn arwain at glymblaid. O dan y system hon, caiff Llywodraeth ei ffurfio drwy ddewisiadau gwleidyddion etholedig; hwy sy'n dewis ffurfio'r glymblaid honno, yn hytrach na bod yr etholwyr yn dewis y Llywodraeth yn uniongyrchol. Gall Llywodraethau clymblaid fod yn annheg, oherwydd gall pleidiau bach gyda chanran fach o gefnogaeth yn unig yn genedlaethol droi'r fantol a gorfodi polisiau amhoblogaidd neu gul heb fandad ystyrllon heblaw eu hundod â'r blaid lywodraethol. Yr wyf yn falch fod Nick Bourne wedi sôn am beryglon pleidiau bach megis y BNP. Mae'n ddadl gymhleth, a chyfyd materion ar y ddwy ochr.

Mae yna fodelau amrywiol o gynrychiolaeth gyfrannol, ac efallai fod rhai agweddau ar ein system o aelodau ychwanegol yma wedi dwyn anfri ar gynrychiolaeth gyfrannol drwy roi cyfle i rai ymgeiswyr gael ail gynnig arni. Gall ymgeiswyr gael eu trechu mewn etholaeth ac yna fynd yn aelod o'r Cynulliad drwy system y rhestr. Os ydym yn sôn am ymgysylltu â'r bobl, mae hyn wedi peri dryswch mawr i etholwyr.

Eleanor Burnham: Rhyw ymgais ad hoc i fodloni cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol oedd y system yma ac nid oeddem wedi galw amdani. Fe'i dyfeisiwyd, mae'n debyg, gan eich Llywodraeth Lafur chi. Y mater a gyfyd yn awr yw'r angen i ennyn diddordeb pobl mewn etholiadau, a dengys yr holl arolygon barn fod pobl yn teimlo'u bod wedi ymddieithrio'n llwyr. Dyna'r pwynt yr ydym yn ceisio'i wneud. Yr ydych yn sôn am Lywodraethau cryf neu wan, ond a dweud y gwir, mae'r Llywodraeth Lafur yn Llywodraeth wan iawn, ac wedi bod ers cryn amser. Mae wedi mynnu pasio llawer iawn o ddeddfwriaeth a ystyrir yn ddigon amhoblogaidd, ac mae hynny wedi gwanhau ei safiad.

Christine Chapman: Ni chytunaf â hynny, Eleanor, Mae'r Llywodraeth Lafur wedi llwyddo mewn nifer o faterion sy'n bwysig i bobl Cymru. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn falch ein bod yn cytuno bod i'r system yma nifer o ddiffygion.

It is entirely appropriate that the Assembly debates this important topic, but we should recognise that it is complex and that many issues here will be resolved across the United Kingdom. Nevertheless, we need to keep the dialogue open here. Sue Essex is consulting on the proposed elections planning group in Wales, proposed by the Electoral Commission to promote good practice. The Queen's Speech yesterday announced an election Bill, and we look forward to seeing what that will contain and what implications it will have for Wales.

In conclusion, we have to look at ways to increase voter turn-out, which, although slightly up for the general election at 61 per cent, is still relatively low. This process will include consideration of the electoral system, and no model should be lightly discounted. However, what people want most after they have voted are stability and clear policies. That goes back to the comment that I made to Eleanor. People want a Government, at whatever level, that says what it intends to do and then does it. We want elected representatives who continue to work closely with their constituents and we want Assemblies and Parliaments that reflect the range of political opinions in the nation, but we also want Governments that reflect the popular vote and offer clear leadership. The debate on how we achieve these different objectives will continue. I regard this short debate as a useful contribution to that. I thank Peter Black and the other Members who contributed to the debate.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That concludes today's business.

Mae'n hollol briodol i'r Cynulliad drafod y pwnc pwysig hwn, ond dylem gydnabod ei fod yn un cymhleth ac y caiff llawer o faterion yma eu datrys ar draws y Deyrnas Unedig. Eto i gyd, mae angen inni barhau'r deialog yma. Mae Sue Essex yn ymgynghori ynglŷn â'r grŵp cynllunio etholiadau arfaethedig yng Nghymru sydd wedi ei gynnig gan y Comisiwn Etholiadol i hyrwyddo arferion da. Yn Araith y Frenhines ddoe cyhoeddwyd Mesur ar etholiadau, ac edrychwn ymlaen at weld beth fydd ynddo a'i oblygiadau i Gymru.

I gloi, rhaid inni edrych ar ffyrdd i annog mwy o bobl i bleidleisio. Er bod y nifer ychydig yn uwch ar gyfer yr etholiad cyffredinol, sef 61 y cant, erys yn gymharol isel. Bydd y broses hon yn cynnwys ystyried y system etholiadol, ac ni ddylid diystyru unrhyw batrwm yn ddifeddwl. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn y mae pobl yn ei chwennych fwyaf ar ôl pleidleisio yw sefydlogrwydd a pholisïau clir. Mae hynny'n mynd yn ôl at y sylw a wneuthum wrth ateb Eleanor. Mae pobl am gael Llywodraeth, ar ba lefel bynnag, sy'n dweud beth y mae'n bwriadu ei wneud ac yna'n gwneud hynny. Yr ydym am gael cynrychiolwyr etholedig sy'n parhau i weithio'n agos gyda'u hetholwyr, ac yr ydym am gael Cynulliadau a Seneddau sy'n adlewyrchu'r amrywiol safbwyntiau gwleidyddol yn y genedl. Ond yr ydym hefyd am gael Llywodraethau sy'n adlewyrchu pleidlais y bobl ac yn rhoi arweiniad clir. Bydd y ddadl yn parhau ynghylch sut y cyflawnwn y gwahanol amcanion hyn. Yr wyf ystyried bod y math hwn o ddadl fer yn gyfraniad pwysig at hynny. Diolch i Peter Black a'r Aelodau eraill a gyfrannodd i'r ddadl.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Daw hynny â busnes heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.27 p.m.
The meeting ended at 5.27 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)

Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Law, Peter (Annibynnol – Independent)
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
 Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)