



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Cofnod y Trafodion)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Record of Proceedings)**

**Dydd Mercher, 4 Mai 2005**

**Wednesday, 4 May 2005**

## Cynnwys Contents

Sefydlu Pwyllgor Ychwanegol o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 8.1 i Ystyried Cychwyn Adran 54 ac Adran 54A Deddf Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru) 2004 Establishment of an Additional Committee under Standing Order No. 8.1 to Consider the Commencement of Section 54 and Section 54A of the Public Audit (Wales) Act 2004 .....	4
Atal Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 5.4 Suspension of Standing Order No. 5.4 .....	5
Ethol i Bwyllgor Deddf Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru) (Gorchymyn Cychwyn Rhif 3) 2005 Election to the Public Audit (Wales) Act (Commencement Order No.3) 2005 Committee .....	6
Cwestiynau ar Lywodraeth Leol i'r Gweinidog Cyllid Questions on Local Government to the Finance Minister .....	7
Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes Questions to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning .....	22
Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Tir Mynydd (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2005 Approval of the Tir Mynydd (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2005 .....	38
Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Mynediad i Gefn Gwlad (Dull Mynediad, Apelau etc) (Cymru) 2005 Approval of the Countryside Access (Means of Access, Appeals Etc) (Wales) Regulations 2005 .....	40
Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn yr Awdurdod Ydau Cartref (Cyfradd Ardollau) 2005 Approval of the Home-Grown Cereals Authority (Rate of Levy) Order 2005 .....	47
Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order .....	48
Approval of the Regulatory Reform (Fire Safety) Order 2005 Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Diwygio Rheoleiddio (Diogelwch Tân) 2005 .....	49
Cymeradwyo Cyfarwyddiadau'r Gwasanaethau Fferyllol (Gwasanaethau Uwch a Gwell) (Cymru) 2005 Approval of the Pharmaceutical Services (Advanced and Enhanced Services) (Wales) Directions 2005 .....	52
Adroddiad Blynyddol 2003-04 Prif Arolygydd Ei Mawrhydi dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant yng Nghymru The Annual Report of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education and Training in Wales for 2003-04 .....	61
Dadl Fer: Damweiniau yn y Cartref—Y Broblem Gudd Short Debate: Accidents in the home—The Hidden Epidemic .....	91

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

**Sefydlu Pwyllgor Ychwanegol o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 8.1 i Ystyried Cychwyn  
Adran 54 ac Adran 54A Deddf Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru) 2004  
Establishment of an Additional Committee under Standing Order No. 8.1 to  
Consider the Commencement of Section 54 and Section 54A of the Public Audit  
(Wales) Act 2004**

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiaf fod

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. yn sefydlu pwyllgor yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 8.1 i'w adnabod fel 'Pwyllgor Deddf Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru) (Gorchymyn Cychwyn Rhif 3) 2005'.*

*1. establish a committee in accordance with Standing Order No. 8.1 to be known as the 'Public Audit (Wales) Act (Commencement Order No.3) 2005 Committee'.*

*2. Bydd aelodau'r pwyllgor yn cynnwys pum Aelod o'r Cynulliad, dau o'r Blaid Lafur, un o Blaid Cymru, un o Blaid Geidwadol Cymru ac un o Blaid Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru.*

*2. Membership of the committee shall comprise five Assembly Members, two from the Labour Party, and one each from Plaid Cymru, the Welsh Conservative Party and the Welsh Liberal Democrats Party.*

*3. Y cylch gorchwyl ar gyfer y pwyllgor fydd:*

*3. The terms of reference for the committee will be:*

*a) ystyried cychwyn adran 54 (1) i (5) fel y'i diwygiwyd, ac adran 54A Deddf Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru);*

*a) to consider the commencement of section 54 (1) to (5) as amended, and section 54A of the Public Audit (Wales) Act;*

*b) adrodd i'r Cynulliad erbyn 10 Mehefin 2005 ar ei gasgliadau.*

*b) to report to the Assembly by 10 June 2005 on its conclusions.*

*4. Bydd y pwyllgor yn peidio â bod ar 30 Mehefin. (NDM2414)*

*4. The committee shall cease to exist on 30 June. (NDM2414)*

**Y Llywydd:** Nid oes siaradwyr, felly awn i bleidlais.

**The Presiding Officer:** There are no speakers, therefore we will move to the vote.

*Cynnig (NDM2414): O blaid 27, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2414): For 27, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin

Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Griffiths, John  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

### **Atal Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 5.4 Suspension of Standing Order No. 5.4**

**Y Llywydd:** Atgoffaf Aelodau bod angen mwyafrif o ddwy ran o dair i bleidleiso o blaid er mwyn cymeradwyo'r cynnig hwn.

**The Presiding Officer:** I remind Members that a two-thirds majority vote in favour is required to carry this motion.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiad fod

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 37.5:*

*the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order No. 37.5:*

*yn atal y rhan honno o Reol Sefydlog Rhif 5.4 sy'n mynnu bod y datganiad busnes wythnosol yn glynu wrth yr amserlen y cytunwyd arni ar gyfer busnes y Cynulliad yn yr wythnos ganlynol, er mwyn gallu ystyried NNDM2413, fel y gellir ethol Aelodau i Bwyllgor Deddf Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru) (Gorchymyn Cychwyn Rhif 3) 2005, yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ddydd Mercher 4 Mai 2005. (NDM2423)*

*suspend that part of Standing Order No. 5.4 that requires the weekly business statement to constitute the agreed timetable for Assembly business for the following week, to allow NNDM2413, for the election of Members to the Public Audit (Wales) Act (Commencement Order No.3) 2005 Committee, to be considered in Plenary on Wednesday 4 May 2005. (NDM2423)*

*Cynnig (NDM2423): O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2423): For 28, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin

Essex, Sue  
 Francis, Lisa  
 Graham, William  
 Griffiths, John  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

**Ethol i Bwyllgor Deddf Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru) (Gorchymyn Cychwyn Rhif 3) 2005**  
**Election to the Public Audit (Wales) Act (Commencement Order No.3) 2005 Committee**

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiaf fod

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 8.3, yn ethol yr Aelodau canlynol i Bwyllgor Deddf Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru) (Gorchymyn Cychwyn Rhif 3) 2005:*

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 8.3, elects the following Members to the Public Audit (Wales) Act (Commencement Order No. 3) 2005 Committee:*

*Ann Jones, Irene James, Janet Davies, Mark Isherwood, Mick Bates,*

*Ann Jones, Irene James, Janet Davies, Mark Isherwood, Mick Bates,*

*ac yn ethol Janet Davies, i fod yn Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor. (NNDM2413)*

*and elects Janet Davies to be the Chair of the Committee. (NNDM2413)*

*Cynnig (NNDM2413): O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
 Motion (NNDM2413): For 29, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Francis, Lisa

Graham, William  
Griffiths, John  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

### **Cwestiynau ar Lywodraeth Leol i'r Gweinidog Cyllid Questions on Local Government to the Finance Minister**

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 1, **The Presiding Officer:** Question 1, OAQ0187 (LGP), yn ôl. OAQ0187 (LGP), has been withdrawn.

### **Ymgynghori Cyhoeddus Awdurdodau Lleol Local Authority Public Consultation**

**Mark Isherwood:** Despite the presence of a gang of Labour councillors outside the Chamber— [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'That is not the question.']

**Mark Isherwood:** Er gwaethaf presenoldeb grŵp o gynghorwyr y blaidd Lafur y tu allan i'r Siambr— [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'Nid dyna'r cwestiwn']

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. It is our custom and practice, which I have always enforced, that Members should begin by reading their tabled question. They should not add or subtract any information. Otherwise, their question is in the guise of an additional supplementary question.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ein harfer, a orfodwyd gennyf o'r cychwyn, yw y dylai Aelodau ddechrau drwy ddarllen y cwestiwn a gyflwynwyd ganddynt. Ni ddylent ychwanegu na hepgor unrhyw wybodaeth, neu bydd eu cwestiwn dan gochl cwestiwn atodol ychwanegol.

**Q2 Mark Isherwood:** Would the Minister make a statement on local authority public consultation? OAQ0232 (LGP)

**C2 Mark Isherwood:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ymgynghori cyhoeddus gan awdurdodau lleol? OAQ0232 (LGP)

I apologise, Presiding Officer.

Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Lywydd.

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** That is not the question that I have before me, but local authorities are required by legislation and Assembly guidance to consult the public on aspects of their service responsibilities. Public participation is, obviously, a key element of developing community strategies.

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Nid dyna'r cwestiwn sydd ger fy mron, ond mae'n ofynnol i awdurdodau lleol, yn ôl deddfwriaeth a chanllawiau'r Cynulliad, ymgynghori â'r cyhoedd ynglŷn ag agweddau ar eu cyfrifoldebau o ran gwasanaethau. Mae cyfranogiad y cyhoedd,

yn amlwg, yn elfen allweddol mewn datblygu strategaethau cymunedol.

**Mark Isherwood:** A large number of local residents attended my surgery at Broughton, Flintshire in January to complain that planned developments would saturate their village. They asked me to undertake the local consultation that they said had been denied to them. What action can the Minister take, given that Flintshire County Council chief executive stated in a letter to me that extensive consultation had been undertaken and that community council minutes record that Labour councillors voted down a proposal to discuss a key planning application with local residents? Seventy-eight per cent of respondents to our survey stated that they do not feel that they have been properly consulted, and 84 per cent stated that they knew nothing about some or all of these developments.

**Mark Isherwood:** Yr oedd nifer fawr o drigolion lleol yn bresennol yn fy nghynghorfa ym Mrychdwn, Sir y Fflint, ym mis Ionawr i gwyno y byddai eu pentref yn cael ei foddi gan y datblygiadau arfaethedig. Gofynnent imi gynnal yr ymgynghoriad lleol y dywedent iddynt gael eu hamddifadu ohono. Pa gamau y gall y Gweinidog eu cymryd, o gofio bod prif weithredwr Cyngor Sir y Fflint wedi nodi mewn llythyr ataf bod ymgynghori helaeth wedi digwydd a bod cofnodion y cyngor cymuned yn nodi i gynghorwyr Llafur wrthod cynnig i drafod cais cynllunio allweddol gyda phreswylwyr lleol? Dywedodd 78 y cant o'r rhai a atebodd ein harolwg na theimlant bod y cyngor wedi ymgynghori â hwy'n briodol, a dywedodd 84 y cant na wyddent ddim byd am rai o'r datblygiadau hyn neu bob un ohonynt.

**Sue Essex:** You clearly have a local issue there, but I will answer to the best of my ability and knowledge. I think that you are talking about the Warren Hall business park.

**Sue Essex:** Mae hynny'n amlwg yn broblem lleol, ond atebaf hyd eithaf fy ngallu a'm gwybodaeth. Credaf eich bod yn sôn am barc busnes Neuadd Warren.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. That was a matter for the local authority and not for the Minister. Within our codes of practice—*[Interruption.]* Of course you may ask what action Ministers can take.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mater i'r awdurdod lleol ac nid i'r Gweinidog oedd hynny. O fewn ein codau ymarfer—*[Torri ar draws.]* Wrth gwrs, gallwch ofyn pa gamau y gall Gweinidogion eu cymryd.

**Sue Essex:** I think that you are referring to planning applications, Mark, in which case there are requirements for local authorities to notify local residents and adjoining owners. In my experience and knowledge, local authorities make a considerable attempt, when it is a major issue, to reach a wider audience using community councils and other groups. However, having dealt with planning for many years across the length and breadth of Wales, I can tell you that, despite extensive consultation, you will always find people who would have liked more or who feel that they would have liked to be notified.

**Sue Essex:** Credaf eich bod yn cyfeirio at geisiadau cynllunio, Mark, ac os felly mae'n ofynnol i awdurdodau lleol hysbysu trigolion lleol a pherchenogion cyfagos. Yn fy mhrofiad i, a hyd y gwn i, mae awdurdodau lleol yn gwneud cryn ymdrech, pan fydd yn fater pwysig, i gyrraedd cynulleidfau ehangach gan ddefnyddio cynghorau cymuned a grwpiau eraill. Fodd bynnag, ar ôl ymdrin â chynllunio am flynyddoedd lawer ar hyd a lled Cymru, gallaf ddweud wrthy, er gwaethaf ymgynghori helaeth, y byddwch bob amser yn dod o hyd i bobl a fyddai wedi hoffi cael mwy neu sy'n teimlo y byddent wedi hoffi cael gwybod.

**Carl Sargeant:** Following on from that question, do you agree that it is the duty of the local authority and the Planning Inspectorate of the Assembly to enact any

**Carl Sargeant:** Yn dilyn y cwestiwn hwnnw, a gytunwch mai dyletswydd yr awdurdod lleol ac Arolygiaeth Gynllunio'r Cynulliad yw deddfu ar unrhyw geisiadau



planning applications, should it go that far? The hundreds of people who went to see Mark Isherwood at his surgery in Broughton were probably the same hundreds of people who came to see me at my surgery, and who wrote 200 letters to me, which I forwarded to Flintshire County Council as it is the planning authority that deals with such applications.

**Sue Essex:** As I said, and as the Presiding Officer confirmed, it is the responsibility of the local authority to do this, but I understand that, in this case, the Welsh Development Agency, as the applicant, held public exhibitions, and gave presentations to community councils. Therefore, in many areas, applicants will engage in public consultation alongside anything that a local authority may want to do, particularly if it is a big scheme.

cynllunio, pe bae'n mynd mor bell â hynny? Mae'n siŵr mai'r un bobl oedd y cannoedd a aeth i weld Mark Isherwood yn ei gynghorfa ym Mrychdwn ag a ddaeth i'm gweld i yn fy nghynghorfa i, ac a ysgrifennodd 200 o lythyrau ataf. Anfonais y rheini at Gyngor Sir y Fflint, gan mai'r awdurdod cynllunio sy'n ymdrin â cheisiadau o'r fath.

**Sue Essex:** Fel y dywedais, ac fel y cadarnhaodd y Llywydd, cyfrifoldeb yr awdurdod lleol yw gwneud hyn, ond deallaf, yn yr achos hwn, i Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, fel yr ymgeisydd, gynnal arddangosfeydd cyhoeddus, a rhoi cyflwyniadau i gynghorau cymuned. Felly, mewn llawer ardal, bydd ymgeiswyr yn cymryd rhan mewn ymgynghori cyhoeddus ynghyd ag unrhyw beth y bydd awdurdod lleol am ei wneud, yn arbennig os yw'n gynllun mawr.

### **Dinas a Sir Abertawe The City and County of Swansea**

**Q3 Val Lloyd:** How has the Welsh Assembly Government supported the City and County of Swansea in improving the local services it delivers, since 2003? OAQ0215 (LGP)

**Sue Essex:** I concluded a policy agreement with the City and County of Swansea in December 2004. Under this, the authority will make significant improvements in service delivery by 2007. That agreement reflects both ours and Swansea's needs. In addition, the unhypothecated financial settlement of £250 million underpins the service delivery for the council.

**Val Lloyd:** I am pleased that the increase in local government funding for elderly people provided by the Assembly Government has opened the way to improved services. I am therefore very concerned that the increase in personal care charges—by up to 11 per cent in some cases—imposed by the Liberal-Democrat-led Swansea administration may affect the most vulnerable people, in spite of the Liberal Democrats' manifesto commitment to scrap such charges. What action can you take to ensure that elderly

**C3 Val Lloyd:** Sut mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi cefnogi Dinas a Sir Abertawe yn y gwaith o wella'r gwasanaethau lleol a ddarperir ganddynt er 2003? OAQ0215 (LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Cytunais ar gytundeb polisi gyda Dinas a Thref Abertawe ym mis Tachwedd 2004. Ar sail hyn, bydd yr awdurdod yn gwneud gwelliannau sylweddol o ran darparu gwasanaethau erbyn 2007. Mae'r cytundeb hwnnw'n adlewyrchu ein hanghenion ni ac anghenion Abertawe. Yn ogystal, mae'r setliad ariannol o £250 miliwn na neilltuwyd yn ategu'r broses o ddarparu gwasanaethau ar gyfer y cyngor.

**Val Lloyd:** Yr wyf yn falch bod y cynnydd yn yr arian a ddarperir gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i lywodraeth leol ar gyfer pobl hŷn wedi arwain y ffordd tuag at wasanaethau gwell. Yr wyf felly yn pryderu'n fawr y gall y cynnydd yn y taliadau gofal personol—hyd at 11 y cant mewn rhai achosion—sydd wedi ei ofodi gan weinyddiaeth Abertawe, sydd o dan reolaeth y Democratiaid-Rhyddfrydol, effeithio ar y bobl fwyaf diamddiffyn, er gwaethaf yr ymrwymiad ym maniffesto'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol i gael gwared ar

people benefit from the additional resources and commitment given by the Welsh Assembly Government?

**Sue Essex:** I may have to defer to Brian Gibbons, as Minister with responsibility for social services, on this matter, but my memory tells me that guidance on care charges is given to local authorities, and charges are expected to be fair and reasonable. I also believe that threshold limits are set within those areas. I will certainly reflect on what you have said, speak to Brian, and look at it further.

In terms of what we are doing, I remind Members of the capacity grant specifically aimed at supporting the elderly. Sometimes that is through additional support to deliver domiciliary care packages, or it might be about improved housing, but that grant has been well received and has certainly made a significant difference to delayed transfers of care.

**David Lloyd:** Faint o arian ychwanegol fyddwch chi'n ei ddarparu i Abertawe ar gyfer gwella cyflwr y stoc dai yno, gan gofio bod y sir yn wynebu bwlch enfawr o ryw £170 miliwn er mwyn gwella'r tai i gyrraedd safon genedlaethol erbyn 2012?

**Sue Essex:** That falls within Edwina Hart's budget line. The quality of housing stock is a particularly important issue and is discussed frequently in committee. That question would be best directed to her, if you do not mind.

2.10 p.m.

### Ailbrisió'r Dreth Gyngor Council Tax Revaluation

**Q4 Mark Isherwood:** Would the Minister make a statement on council tax revaluation? OAQ0229 (LGP)

**Sue Essex:** The first revaluation since 1993 has been completed, and four revised lists have been in place since 1 April.

**Mark Isherwood:** Why has Labour claimed

daliadau o'r fath. Pa gamau y gallwch eu cymryd i sicrhau bod pobl hŷn yn elwa o'r adnoddau ychwanegol a'r ymrwymiad a wnaed gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru?

**Sue Essex:** Efallai y bydd yn rhaid imi ildio i wybodaeth Brian Gibbons, fel y Gweinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb dros wasanaethau cymdeithasol, ar y mater hwn. Ond hyd y cofiaf, rhoddir canllaw i awdurdodau lleol ar daliadau gofal, a disgwylir i daliadau fod yn deg ac yn rhesymol. Credaf hefyd y pennir terfynau trothwy o fewn y meysydd hynny. Yn sicr, byddaf yn ystyried yr hyn a ddywedwch, byddaf yn siarad â Brian ac edrychaf ar hyn ymhellach.

O ran yr hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud, atgoffaf Aelodau o'r grant adnoddau sy'n anelu'n benodol at gynorthwyo'r henoed. Weithiau bydd hynny drwy gymorth ychwanegol i ddarparu pecynnau gofal cartref, neu gall ymwneud â thai gwell. Ond mae'r grant hwnnw wedi ei groesawu, ac yn sicr mae wedi gwneud gwahaniaeth mawr yn yr oedi cyn trosglwyddo gofal.

**David Lloyd:** How much additional funding will you provide for Swansea to improve the quality of its housing stock, bearing in mind that the county faces a huge shortfall of some £170 million for improving its stock to reach the national standard by 2012?

**Sue Essex:** Edwina Hart sy'n gyfrifol am y llinell gyllideb honno. Mae ansawdd y stoc tai yn fater pwysig iawn a chaiff ei drafod yn aml yn y pwyllgor. Byddai'n well gofyn y cwestiwn hwnnw iddi hi, os nad oes gwahaniaeth gennyh.

**C4 Mark Isherwood:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ailbrisió'r dreth gyngor? OAQ0229 (LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Cwblhawyd yr ailbrisiad cyntaf ers 1993, ac mae pedair rhestr ddiwygiedig ar waith er 1 Ebrill.

**Mark Isherwood:** Pam mae Llafur wedi

that its council tax revaluation was based on regular rebanding set up by the Conservative Government in 1993, when the truth is that the Conservatives voted against the Local Government Act 2003, which was supported by Labour and the Liberal Democrats and which used Wales as a guinea pig to introduce the council tax revaluation and higher council tax bands in England and Wales? With this taxation by stealth hurting so many households, can we have any more faith in Mr Blair's claims that revaluation in England will be revenue neutral, given that you made similar claims before the cruel reality hit home here?

**Sue Essex:** If that was the case, Mark, why did the Conservative MP for Cotswold, Geoffrey Clifton-Brown, propose an amendment to the Bill suggesting that revaluation should be held every five years, not every 10 years? Why did your local government spokesperson, Glyn Davies, publicly support the idea of revaluation? Furthermore, why did the Conservative Member on the committee—whom I suspect was William Graham at that time—endorse the revaluation? The public deserves a little more honesty from its politicians than that. The truth is that when you introduced the council tax system, you were in such a rush to replace the wretched poll tax that you forgot to include revaluation, although you understood the need for it at the time, as demonstrated by the amendment proposed by Geoffrey Clifton-Brown. I wish that you would be a bit more consistent.

**Jenny Randerson:** When questioned last week, the First Minister, while defending council tax revaluation, did not close the door on at least an element of local income tax. In the long-distant past, you have also suggested that you were open to persuasion. After your experiences in the last couple of months, particularly in Cardiff, where two thirds of homes have been rebanded, are you prepared to admit that local income tax has its merits and is the fairest form of local taxation?

**Sue Essex:** My opinion has not changed since the revaluation. As I said last year,

honni bod ei hailbrisiad o'r dreth gyngor yn seiliedig ar ailfandio rheolaidd, a sefydlwyd gan y Llywodraeth Geidwadol yn 1993? Y gwirionedd yw i'r Ceidwadwyr bleidleisio yn erbyn Deddf Llywodraeth Leol 2003, a gefnogwyd gan y Blaid Lafur a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ac a ddefnyddiodd Gymru fel arbrawf i gyflwyno ailbrisiad o'r dreth gyngor a bandiau treth gyngor uwch yng Nghymru a Lloegr? Gan fod y trethiant llechwraidd hwn yn effeithio ar gynifer o gartrefi, a allwn ddal yn ffyddiog yn honiadau Mr Blair y bydd ailbrisiad yn Lloegr yn niwtral o ran refeniw, o gofio i chi wneud honiadau tebyg cyn i'r gwirionedd creulon ddod yn amlwg yma?

**Sue Essex:** Os oedd hynny'n wir, Mark, pam y cynigiodd Geoffrey Clifton-Brown, yr AS Ceidwadol dros Cotswold, welliant i'r Mesur yn awgrymu y dylid cynnal ailbrisiad bob pum mlynedd, ac nid bob 10 mlynedd? Pam y cefnogodd Glyn Davies, eich llefarydd ar lywodraeth leol, yn gyhoeddus y syniad o ailbrisiad? Yn ogystal, pam y cymeradwyodd yr Aelod Ceidwadol ar y pwyllgor—credaf mai William Graham ydoedd ar y pryd—yr ailbrisiad? Mae'r cyhoedd yn haeddu ychydig mwy o onestrwydd na hynny gan eu gwleidyddion. Y gwir yw, pan fu ichi gyflwyno'r system treth gyngor, eich bod ar gymaint o frys i ddisodli'r dreth y pen felltith nes ichi anghofio cynnwys ailbrisiad, er eich bod yn deall yr angen amdano ar y pryd, fel y dengys y gwelliant a gynigiwyd gan Geoffrey Clifton-Brown. Hoffwn pe gallech fod ychydig yn fwy cyson.

**Jenny Randerson:** Pan gafodd ei holi yr wythnos diwethaf, ni chaeodd y Prif weinidog y drws ar o leiaf un elfen o dreth incwm lleol wrth amddiffyn ailbrisiad treth gyngor. Yn y gorffennol pell, yr ydych hefyd wedi awgrymu y gallech gael eich darbwyllo. Ar ôl eich profiadau yn ystod yr ychydig fisoedd diwethaf, yn arbennig yng Nghaerdydd, lle y mae dwy ran o dair o gartrefi wedi eu hailfandio, a ydych yn barod i gyfaddef bod rhinweddau'n perthyn i dreth incwm leol, ac mai hon yw'r ffurf decaf o drethiant lleol?

**Sue Essex:** Nid yw fy marn wedi newid ers yr ailbrisiad. Fel y dywedais y llynedd, mae'n

property tax must be levied on up-to-date values. The Chartered Institute of Public Finance and Accountancy—and Sir Michael Lyons will come to committee next week—came up with the idea of a local income tax supplementing a property tax. One of the things that worries me about local income tax is the fact that the CIPFA report showed that the cost of running it would be substantial, with £330 million needed to set it up followed by ongoing revenue costs. I have said quite frequently that I am worried that, in time, it would cease to be a local tax and would be absorbed within general taxation. That is a weakness. I hope that we will have discussions rather than arguments about this, because it is clear to me, from talking to people on the ground, that there is no easy answer to this. Many people whom I have spoken to in the last couple of weeks have said that they would be worse off under with a local income tax. People have come to realise that there is no magic solution that can be pulled out of a hat. There are benefits and disbenefits to the whole scheme.

I emphasise again that the revaluation reflects rises in property prices. It was obvious that Cardiff would see the biggest rises in Wales; there was no mystery about that.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 5, OAQ0230 (LGP), has been withdrawn.

rhaid trethu eiddo ar werthoedd diweddar. Cynigiodd y Sefydliad Siartredig Cyllid Cyhoeddus a Chyfrifyddiaeth—a bydd Syr Michael Lyons yn dod i gyfarfod y pwyllgor yr wythnos nesaf—y syniad o dreth incwm leol i ategu treth eiddo. Un o'r pethau sy'n achosi pryder imi o ran treth incwm leol yw'r ffaith fod adroddiad CIPFA wedi dangos y byddai'r gost o'i rhedeg yn sylweddol, a bod angen £330 miliwn i'w sefydlu, gyda chostau refeniw parhaus ar ben hynny. Yr wyf wedi dweud yn eithaf aml fy mod yn pryderu y byddai, gydag amser, yn peidio â bod yn dreth leol ac yn cael ei chynnwys o fewn y dreth gyffredinol. Mae hynny'n wendid. Gobeithio y cawn drafodaethau yn hytrach na dadleuon ynghylch hyn, oherwydd mae'n amlwg i mi, o siarad â phobl ar lawr gwlad, nad oes ateb syml i hyn. Mae nifer o bobl y bûm yn siarad â hwy yn ystod yr ychydig wythnosau diwethaf wedi dweud y byddent yn waeth eu byd gyda threth incwm leol. Mae pobl wedi dod i sylweddoli nad oes ateb hud y gellir ei dynnu allan o het. Mae manteision ac anfanteision i'r cynllun cyfan.

Pwysleisiaf unwaith eto fod yr ailbriso'n adlewyrchu cynnydd ym mhrisiau eiddo. Yr oedd yn amlwg mai yng Nghaerdydd y byddai'r cynnydd mwyaf yng Nghymru; nid oedd hynny'n ddirgelwch.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 5, OAQ0230 (LGP), yn ôl.

### **Y Dreth Gyngor Council Taxes**

**Q6 Peter Black:** What plans does the Minister have to reduce the council taxes of people over the age of 65? OAQ0192 (LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Responsibility for introducing such measures rests with the UK Government. Assistance available to people over 65 includes pension credit, council tax benefit and the payments to pensioners announced in the March budget by the Chancellor of the Exchequer, which will apply to people in Wales.

**Peter Black:** We have heard lots of schemes being mooted in the last few weeks as to how pensioners are going to be helped with their

**C6 Peter Black:** Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Gweinidog i ostwng y dreth gyngor a delir gan bobl dros 65 oed? CAQ0192 (LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Cyfrifoldeb Llywodraeth y DU yw cyflwyno mesurau o'r fath. Mae cymorth sydd ar gael i bobl dros 65 oed yn cynnwys credyd pensiwn, budd-dal treth gyngor a'r taliadau i bensynwyr a gyhoeddwyd yng nghyllideb mis Mawrth gan Ganghellor y Trysorlys, a fydd yn berthnasol i bobl Cymru.

**Peter Black:** Yr ydym wedi clywed crybwyll nifer o gynlluniau yn ystod yr ychydig wythnosau diwethaf o ran sut y

council tax, both from your own party and from the Conservatives. However, is it not the reality that this is just tinkering with an unfair tax, and the only way to really help pensioners is to introduce a local income tax, based on the ability to pay, under which pensioners would pay the bill appropriate to their means?

**Sue Essex:** That goes back to the last discussion. You will remember that when we did our balance of funding review, we undertook a considerable consultation, and I talked to many groups of people. A key element that came out of that was that, if you have a property tax, you have to include some protection for people at the lower end of the income scale. I made it clear in my response to Nick Raynsford that I thought that the council tax benefit system needed to be looked at seriously to ensure that more people were eligible for benefit. In effect, the term 'benefit' should be changed to a term whereby people would think that they were automatically eligible for a discount. The term 'benefit' deters people from following it up.

**Elin Jones:** A fydd cynllun eich Llywodraeth i leihau'r dreth gyngor i bensiynwyr dros 65 oed yn gynllun parhaol, neu a fydd yn para am flwyddyn yn unig?

**Sue Essex:** At the moment, we have the extra money from Gordon Brown, which can be applied to everyone, including people in Wales. We will have to wait and see what comes out of the Michael Lyons review. I am sure that these questions will be asked of him when he comes to committee. I believe that if we retain a property tax in some form, whether it forms a part or all of the local taxation base, major changes need to be made to the benefit system. I think that that will take place.

**Glyn Davies:** If an incoming Government at Westminster were to give all pensioner households in England a 50 per cent discount on their council tax bills, up to a maximum of £500, would you give the same discount in Wales, or would you leave all pensioner households in Wales to meet the full cost,

bydd pensiynwyr yn cael help i dalu eu treth gyngor, gan eich plaid chi a chan y Ceidwadwyr. Fodd bynnag, onid y gwir yw mai dim ond potsian â threth annheg yw hyn, ac mai'r unig ffordd i helpu pensiynwyr mewn gwirionedd yw cyflwyno treth incwm leol, yn seiliedig ar y gallu i dalu, lle y byddai pensiynwyr yn talu'r bil sy'n addas i'w gallu?

**Sue Essex:** Mae hynny'n mynd yn ôl at y drafodaeth ddiwethaf. Fe gofiwch, pan wnaed ein hadolygiad o gydbwysedd cyllid, ein bod wedi ymgynghori'n helaeth, a siaradais â nifer o grwpiau o bobl. Un o'r elfennau allweddol a gododd yn sgil hynny oedd bod yn rhaid ichi gynnwys rhywfaint o ddiogelwch i bobl ar waelod y raddfa incwm, os oes gennych dreth eiddo. Yn fy ymateb i Nick Raynsford, dywedais yn glir fy mod o'r farn fod angen edrych ar y system budd-daliadau treth gyngor o ddiffrif, er mwyn sicrhau bod mwy o bobl yn gymwys i gael budd-daliadau. Mewn gwirionedd, dylid newid y gair 'budd-dal' a defnyddio gair lle y byddai pobl yn credu eu bod yn awtomatig yn gymwys i gael gostyngiad. Mae'r term 'budd-dal' yn rhwystro pobl rhag gwneud cais amdano.

**Elin Jones:** Will your Government's plan to reduce council tax for pensioners aged over 65 be a permanent scheme, or will it only last for a year?

**Sue Essex:** Ar hyn o bryd, mae gennym yr arian ychwanegol gan Gordon Brown, sy'n berthnasol i bawb, gan gynnwys pobl yng Nghymru. Bydd yn rhaid inni aros i weld canlyniad adolygiad Michael Lyons. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y cwestiynau hyn yn cael eu gofyn pan ddaw i gyfarfod y pwyllgor. Credaf, os cadwn dreth eiddo o ryw fath, boed fel rhan o'r sylfaen trethi lleol neu'r sylfaen gyfan, fod angen gwneud newidiadau mawr yn y system budd-daliadau. Credaf y bydd hynny'n digwydd.

**Glyn Davies:** Pe byddai Llywodraeth newydd yn San Steffan yn rhoi gostyngiad o 50 y cant ar filiau treth gyngor i bob teulu yn yn Lloegr sy'n bensiynwyr, hyd at uchafswm o £500, a fyddech yn rhoi'r un gostyngiad yng Nghymru? Neu a fyddech yn gadael i bensiynwyr yng Nghymru dalu'r gost lawn,

while watching their neighbours immediately across the border having a great benefit?

**Sue Essex:** That hypothetical question is based on the idea that we will get a Tory Government tomorrow, which, of course, we will not. It is whistling in the wind, but it does enable me to point out the huge hole in your manifesto and in your pledge to the people of Wales. In Scotland, that pledge was given to the people; in Wales, it was strangely omitted from the Tory manifesto. So I do not think that the public has much confidence in that.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 7, OAQ0226 (LGP), has been transferred for written answer.

a gweld gweld eu cymdogion dros y ffin yn elwa'n fawr?

**Sue Essex:** Mae'r cwestiwn damcaniaethol hwnnw'n seiliedig ar y syniad y bydd Llywodraeth Doriaidd yn cael ei hethol yfory. Wrth gwrs, ni fydd hynny'n digwydd. Nid oes gobaith i hynny ddigwydd, ond mae'n fy ngalluogi i amlygu'r bwlch enfawr yn eich manifffesto ac yn eich addewid i bobl Cymru. Yn yr Alban, rhoddwyd yr addewid hwnnw i'r bobl; yng Nghymru, yn rhyfedd ddigon, cafodd ei hepgor o faniffesto'r Toriaid. Felly, ni chredaf fod gan y cyhoedd lawer o hyder yn hynny.

**Y Llywydd:** Trosglwyddwyd Cwestiwn 7, OAQ0226 (LGP), ar gyfer ateb ysgrifenedig.

### **Codiadau yn y Dreth Gyngor Council Tax Increases**

**Q8 David Melding:** Will the Minister make a statement on council tax increases in South Wales Central? OAQ0189 (LGP)

**Sue Essex:** The average increase in band D council tax in the three authorities comprising South Wales Central is 2.1 per cent, compared with a Wales average of 3.8 per cent. This is the lowest increase since the introduction of unitary authorities in Wales in 1996-97.

**David Melding:** Do you agree that what has undermined public confidence in rebanding is the fact that it has not proven to be revenue neutral? Had it been, then the need to reband properties would have been accepted.

**Sue Essex:** I am not quite sure what you mean by 'revenue neutral'. I have looked at the figures carefully, and it was because, I think, I introduced the principle of capping that we saw realistic rates of council tax. I did not get much support from the opposition side of the Chamber for that, but it was very important. I have reviewed past figures to reassure myself about this, and the figure for the increase in council tax yield for this coming year is virtually the same as the average during our administration, at just over 9 per cent. That is much lower than it

**C8 David Melding:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar godiadau yn y dreth gyngor yng Nghanol De Cymru? OAQ0189 (LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Dau pwynt un y cant yw'r cynnydd cyfartalog yn nhreth gyngor band D yn y tri awdurdod yng Nghanol De Cymru, o'i gymharu â chyfartaledd o 3.8 y cant ar gyfer Cymru. Dyma'r cynnydd isaf ers cyflwyno awdurdodau unedol yng Nghymru yn 1996-97.

**David Melding:** A gytunwch mai'r hyn sydd wedi tanseilio hyder y cyhoedd mewn ailfandio yw'r ffaith nad yw wedi profi ei fod yn niwtral o ran refeniw? Pe byddai, yna byddai'r angen am ailfandio eiddo wedi'i dderbyn.

**Sue Essex:** Nid wyf yn hollol siŵr beth yr ydych yn ei olygu pan ddywedwch 'niwtral o ran refeniw'. Yr wyf wedi edrych ar y ffigurau'n ofalus, a chredaf mai'r rheswm inni weld cyfraddau treth gyngor realistig oedd oherwydd imi gyflwyno'r egwyddor o gapio. Ni chefais lawer o gefnogaeth gan y gwrthbleidiau yn hynny o beth, ond yr oedd yn bwysig iawn. Yr wyf wedi adolygu ffigurau'r gorffennol er mwyn tawelu fy meddwl yn hyn o beth, ac mae ffigur y cynnydd mewn incwm o'r dreth gyngor am y flwyddyn i ddod bron yn union yr un fath â'r

was in the Tory years, when it came in at 12 per cent.

**Owen John Thomas:** The burden of your Government's council tax rebanding scheme is being felt most by those who can least afford to pay. Some of the most deprived areas in Cardiff have been hit hard by this unjust scheme and pensioners who have worked hard for their retirement are particularly feeling the pinch. Such is rebanding's unpopularity in Wales, the Westminster Government decided to scrap any such proposals in England. Why did you agree to use the people of Wales as guinea pigs for this unjust and ill-thought-out scheme?

2.20 p.m.

**Sue Essex:** That was well read out, but wrong. The Government has not made any—*[Interruption.]*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Many Members read contributions, as do many Ministers. If it is the view that I should enforce a no-reading rule, then I would be the most happy of presiding officers.

**Sue Essex:** In order to make you happy, I will not read this.

There has been no announcement in England on scrapping the revaluation. In fact, the opposite is true: Nick Raynsford has made it clear that a revaluation will take place at a regional level in England. There is a wide disparity of property prices in England. I am unsure about your first statement, about the burden being felt mostly by those on lower incomes, as rebanding has been a reflection of the way in which property prices have increased. You will remember, Owen John, that last September, when we saw the results of the revaluation, I introduced the moderation scheme, which has been very important in making sure that no-one pays more than the equivalent of one band rise in one year. In terms of the local government formula, which is important, we introduced

cyfartaledd yn ystod ein gweinyddiaeth ni, sef ychydig dros 9 y cant. Mae hynny lawer yn is nag yr oedd yn ystod y blynyddoedd pan oedd y Toriaid mewn grym, pan oedd yn 12 y cant.

**Owen John Thomas:** Mae baich cynllun ailfandio treth gyngor eich Llywodraeth yn effeithio fwyaf ar y rhai na allant fforddio ei dalu. Effeithiwyd yn fawr ar rai o'r ardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig yng Nghaerdydd gan y cynllun anghyfiawn hwn, ac mae pensiynwyr sydd wedi gweithio'n galed ar gyfer eu hymddeoliad yn ei chael yn anodd iawn. Mae ailfandio mor amhoblogaidd yng Nghymru nes i Lywodraeth San Steffan benderfynu dileu unrhyw gynigion o'r fath yn Lloegr. Pam y bu ichi gytuno i ddefnyddio pobl Cymru i arbrofi gyda'r cynllun anghyfiawn hwn nad yw wedi ei ystyried yn drwyadl?

**Sue Essex:** Darllenwyd hynny'n dda, ond yn anghywir. Nid yw'r Llywodraeth wedi gwneud unrhyw—*[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae nifer o'r Aelodau yn darllen cyfraniadau, a hefyd nifer o Weinidogion. Os credir y dylwn orfodi rheol dim darllen, yna byddwn yn llywydd hapus iawn.

**Sue Essex:** I'ch gwneud yn hapus, ni ddarllenaf hwn.

Ni wnaed unrhyw gyhoeddiad yn Lloegr ar ddileu'r system ailbriso. Yn wir, mae'r gwrthwyneb yn wir: mae Nick Raynsford wedi'i gwneud yn glir y bydd eiddo'n cael ei ailbriso ar lefel ranbarthol yn Lloegr. Mae gwahaniaeth mawr ym mhrisiau eiddo yn Lloegr. Nid wyf yn siŵr ynghylch eich datganiad cyntaf, sef bod y baich mwyaf ar y rhai sydd ar incwm is, gan fod ailfandio wedi adlewyrchu'r ffordd y mae prisiau tai wedi codi. Fe gofiwch, Owen John, fis Medi y llynedd, pan welsom ganlyniadau ailbriso, imi gyflwyno'r cynllun safoni, sydd wedi bod yn bwysig iawn i sicrhau nad oes neb yn talu mwy na'r hyn sy'n gyfystyr ag un cynnydd band mewn blwyddyn. O ran y fformiwla llywodraeth leol, sy'n bwysig, cyflwynwyd y trothwy o 3.5 y cant i

the threshold at 3.5 per cent to influence the allocation of finance. ddyllanwadu ar y broses o ddyrannu cyllid.

### **Datblygu Cydweithredu rhwng Awdurdodau Lleol Developing Co-operation between Local Authorities**

**Q9 John Griffiths:** Will the Minister make a statement on developing co-operation between local authorities in Wales? OAQ0205 (LGP)

**Sue Essex:** This is an important issue, as we are wholly committed to local authorities working in co-operation, both in developing policy and delivering services. That is clearly set out in 'Making the Connections', and I am pleased to see that local government in Wales is also committed to that agenda.

**John Griffiths:** It is very important, Sue. Do you agree that, in discharging some functions, co-operation between local authorities—that is, the smaller authorities as opposed to the large county councils that previously had some of those functions—would bring great benefits in terms of sharing staff with particular expertise? For example, one authority might have an officer with particular expertise in a certain area, such as social services, and a neighbouring authority might have someone with expertise in another area. By co-operating, they could avoid reinventing the wheel, and take services forward locally with greater efficiency and to greater effect.

**Sue Essex:** I was incensed at the way that the last local government reorganisation was carried out by John Redwood, as it did not allow those discussions to take place; there was no commission in Wales. Had they been allowed, those discussions would have formed many strategic arrangements in the way that you describe. What reorganisation did was to blast asunder all of the strategic arrangements that had existed and which had worked very well in Wales. Over the years, we have been pulling that back. The kind of situations that you describe, such as joint appointments and joint service delivery contracts, are important. Local authorities see this as a way of reducing costs, and also of delivering a better service to the people they

**C9 John Griffiths:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ddatblygu cydweithredu rhwng awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru? OAQ0205 (LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Mae hwn yn fater pwysig, am ein bod wedi ymrwymo'n llwyr i weld awdurdodau lleol yn cydweithio, wrth ddatblygu polisiau a darparu gwasanaethau. Nodir hynny'n glir yn 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau', ac yr wyf yn falch o weld bod llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru hefyd wedi ymrwymo i'r agenda honno.

**John Griffiths:** Mae'n bwysig iawn, Sue. A gytunwch, wrth gyflawni rhai swyddogaethau, y byddai cydweithredu rhwng awdurdodau lleol—hynny yw, yr awdurdodau llai yn hytrach na'r cynghorau sir mawr a oedd gynt yn gyfrifol am rai o'r swyddogaethau hynny—yn fuddiol iawn o ran rhannu staff sydd ag arbenigedd penodol? Er enghraifft, efallai y byddai gan un awdurdod swyddog ag arbenigedd penodol mewn maes arbennig, megis gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, ac efallai y byddai gan awdurdod cyfagos swyddog ag arbenigedd mewn maes arall. Drwy gydweithredu, gallent osgoi dyblygu gwaith, a gallent ddatblygu gwasanaethau yn lleol yn fwy effeithlon ac yn fwy effeithiol.

**Sue Essex:** Fe'm cythruddwyd gan y ffordd yr ad-drefnwyd llywodraeth leol y tro diwethaf gan John Redwood, oherwydd ni chaniatawyd cynnal y trafodaethau hynny; nid oedd unrhyw gomisiwn yng Nghymru. Pe byddent wedi eu caniatáu, byddai'r trafodaethau hynny wedi ffurfio nifer o drefniadau strategol yn y ffordd a ddisgrifiwyd gennych. Yr hyn a wnaeth yr ad-drefnu oedd cael gwared ar yr holl drefniadau strategol a oedd wedi bodoli, ac a oedd wedi gweithio'n dda iawn yng Nghymru. Dros y blynyddoedd, yr ydym wedi bod yn ailgyflwyno'r rheini. Mae'r math o sefyllfaoedd a ddisgrifir gennych, megis penodiadau ar y cyd a chontractau ar y cyd ar gyfer darparu gwasanaethau, yn



represent.

bwysig. Gwêl awdurdodau lleol hyn fel modd i leihau costau, a hefyd fel modd i ddarparu gwasanaeth gwell i'r bobl maent yn eu cynrychioli.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol, Weinidog, bod awdurdodau lleol yn ei chael yn anodd iawn i ddarparu gwasanaethau cymdeithasol cynhwysfawr, yn arbennig gwasanaethau i blant a phobl ifanc. Mynegodd Comisiynydd Plant Cymru bryder mawr ynglŷn ag ansawdd y gwasanaethau hyn, a'r ffaith ei bod yn anodd denu a chadw gweithwyr cymdeithasol. Dywedodd fod tuedd i weithwyr symud o un awdurdod i'r llall wrth i awdurdodau geisio eu denu drwy gynnig mwy o arian iddynt. A wnewch chi sicrhau bod gan awdurdodau lleol ddigon o arian i gynnal y gwasanaethau hyn ac i gadw eu gweithwyr cymdeithasol, yn enwedig yn y gwasanaeth hollbwysig i blant a phobl ifanc?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** You will be aware, Minister, that local authorities are finding it very difficult to provide comprehensive social services, particularly for children and young people. The Children's Commissioner for Wales has expressed grave concern over the quality of these services, and the fact that it is difficult to recruit and retain social workers. He said that workers tend to move from one authority to another as authorities try to attract them by offering them more money. Will you ensure that local authorities have sufficient funding to sustain these services and to retain their social workers, particularly in the vital services for children and young people?

**Sue Essex:** Those points are supported by the findings of the Social Service Inspectorate for Wales from their visits to and checks on local authorities. I do not think that this is about money. It would be very easy to say that this was about money, but it is not. There is a problem of a lack of capacity, a lack of social workers and a lack of respect for a job that I think is very important.

**Sue Essex:** Ategir y pwyntiau hynny gan ddarganfyddiadau Arolygiaeth Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru yn sgîl ei hymweliadau ag awdurdodau lleol a'r gwaith o'u harchwilio. Ni chredaf fod a wnelo hyn ag arian. Byddai'n hawdd iawn dweud bod hyn yn ymwneud ag arian, ond nid yw hynny'n wir. Mae yna broblem ynghylch prinder adnoddau, prinder gweithwyr cymdeithasol a diffyg parch at swydd sy'n bwysig iawn yn fy marn i.

Going back to John Griffiths's point, local authorities find that it is much better to work together than to compete in chasing a few social workers. As you say, the price goes up, and that leads to insufficient stability within local authorities. A lot of this joint working, and setting together teams—particularly across the medical field—is the way to the future. However, it will take a couple of years to put those arrangements in place and to ensure that that is the case across Wales.

I ddychwelyd at bwynt John Griffiths, gwêl awdurdodau lleol ei bod lawer yn well cydweithio na chystadlu am ychydig weithwyr cymdeithasol. Fel y dywedwch, mae'r pris yn codi, ac mae hynny'n arwain at sefydlogrwydd annigonol mewn awdurdodau lleol. Y math hwn o gydweithio, a chydsefydlu timau—yn enwedig ar draws y maes meddygol—yw'r ffordd ymlaen. Fodd bynnag, bydd yn cymryd rhai blynyddoedd i roi'r trefniadau hynny ar waith a sicrhau mai dyma sy'n digwydd ledled Cymru.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 10, OAQ0231 (LGP), yn ôl.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 10, OAQ0231 (LGP) has been withdrawn.

### **Casglu'r Dreth Gyngor Collection of Council Tax**

**Q11 Lisa Francis:** Will the Minister make a statement on how council tax is collected by

**C11 Lisa Francis:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y ffordd mae'r dreth gyngor yn

local authorities in Wales? OAQ0203 (LGP)

cael ei chasglu gan awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru? OAQ0203 (LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Local authorities have responsibility for billing and collection of council tax. Local authorities in Wales have a good track record for council tax collection and in 2003-04, over 96 per cent of all council tax bills were collected.

**Sue Essex:** Mae awdurdodau lleol yn gyfrifol am anfon biliau a chasglu treth gyngor. Mae gan awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru record dda o gasglu treth gyngor, ac yn 2003-04 casglwyd dros 96 y cant o'r holl filiau treth gyngor.

**Lisa Francis:** In the 2003-04 collection of council tax, the amount not collected—and this is a UK-wide figure—was almost £30 million. We will see that figure increase due to rebanding. What assessment has your Government made of how the council tax rebanding will affect the non-payment figure, and what consequences will there be of non-collection of payments for local authorities and the services that they provide?

**Lisa Francis:** Yn ystod y broses o gasglu'r dreth gyngor yn 2003-04, yr oedd y swm na chasglwyd—ac mae hwn yn ffigur ar gyfer y DU gyfan—bron yn £30 miliwn. Byddwn yn gweld y ffigur hwnnw'n codi oherwydd ailfandio. Pa asesiad y mae eich Llywodraeth wedi'i wneud o'r ffordd y bydd y broses o ailfandio treth gyngor yn effeithio ar swm y dreth gyngor nad yw'n cael ei chasglu, a beth fydd y canlyniadau o beidio â chasglu taliadau i awdurdodau lleol a'r gwasanaethau y maent yn eu darparu?

**Sue Essex:** I am glad to say that your pessimistic view of collection is not shared by local authorities, because they anticipate that their collection rates will go up slightly. This year, I specifically asked local authorities about their expectations. One message that I get is that local authorities feel that the moderation scheme, which I mentioned previously to Dai—where no-one goes up more than one band in one year—has been significant in ensuring that collection rates are kept at a high level. We will not know if this is the case until the end of the year, but that is not my view: it is the view of local authorities.

**Sue Essex:** Yr wyf yn falch o ddweud nad yw awdurdodau lleol yn rhannu eich safbwynt pesimistaidd, oherwydd maent yn disgwyl i'w cyfraddau casglu gynyddu ychydig. Eleni, holais awdurdodau lleol yn benodol am eu disgwyliadau. Un o'r negeseuon a gaf yw bod awdurdodau lleol o'r farn fod y cynllun safoni, a grybwyllais wrth Dai yn gynharach—lle na fydd treth gyngor neb yn cynyddu mwy nag un band mewn blwyddyn—wedi bod yn arwyddocaol i sicrhau bod cyfraddau casglu yn parhau'n uchel. Ni fyddwn yn gwybod a yw hyn yn wir tan ddiwedd y flwyddyn, ond nid fy marn i yw hynny: barn awdurdodau lleol ydyw.

### Systemau Trethu Heblaw'r Dreth Gyngor Alternative Taxation Systems

**Q12 Helen Mary Jones:** Has the Minister made any assessments of alternative taxation systems to the council tax? OAQ0213 (LGP)

**C12 Helen Mary Jones:** A yw'r Gweinidog wedi gwneud unrhyw asesiadau o systemau trethu heblaw'r dreth gyngor? OAQ0213 (LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Assessment was made in last year's balance of funding review. We produced a draft paper, we went out to consultation and I held a few meetings on this. You will see the results of that in our

**Sue Essex:** Gwnaed asesiad yn ystod yr adolygiad o gydbwysedd cyllid y llynedd. Lluniwyd papur drafft gennym, cafwyd ymgynghori a chynhaliats ychydig gyfarfodydd ar hyn. Fe welwch ganlyniadau

submission to the Office of the Deputy Prime Minister.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Minister, in earlier answers this afternoon, and in the past, you have acknowledged that the council tax is essentially a regressive tax, because it is based on the value of a property that is not an asset unless you sell it. It is a home for most people, not an asset. Are you prepared to review your position on a local income tax, taking into account what you have said about the possibility that that then gets merged into a national taxation system? Would it not be true to say that there was a time when all local services were provided directly by the rates? Central support is now essential. Rebanding has demonstrated the extent to which this is a regressive tax and I ask you to keep this under review, Minister.

**Sue Essex:** Clearly, it will be kept under review, because of the work that Michael Lyons is doing. We are considering making a further statement to Michael Lyons. Again, I do not share your pessimism in quite the same way as regards property tax, because all the research shows that there is a close correlation, albeit imperfect, between income and the value of property, so I would say that it is used as a surrogate.

To return to the balance of funding, we looked carefully at other alternatives. I spent a lot of time on this, and had a meeting on it with the Chartered Institute of Public Finance and Accountancy. All schemes have strengths and weaknesses. My worry, as I have said before, is that we must have a clear view of what should be collected centrally and what should be collected locally. I do not want to see the local democratic base undermined in all this. You are right to say that the balance of funding has changed—we now contribute a large percentage to local government funding and services; that has changed over the years, and moving back from that would cause pretty big traumas—but we have to take account of the effectiveness of collection alongside maintaining democratic accountability. Michael Lyons will look at that carefully. I am sure that we will discuss this in committee and in Plenary in future

hynny yn ein cyflwyniad i Swyddfa'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Weinidog, yn eich atebion cynharach y prynhawn yma, ac yn y gorffennol, yr ydych wedi cydnabod mai ôl-dreth yw'r dreth gyngor yn ei hanfod, am ei bod yn seiliedig ar werth eiddo nad yw'n ased oni bai eich bod yn ei werthu. Cartref ydyw i'r rhan fwyaf o bobl, nid ased. A ydych yn barod i adolygu eich safbwynt ar dreth incwm leol, gan ystyried yr hyn yr ydych wedi'i ddweud am y posibilrwydd y caiff hynny ei uno wedyn â'r system drethu genedlaethol? A fyddai'n wir dweud bod yna amser pan ddarparwyd pob gwasanaeth lleol yn uniongyrchol drwy ardrethi? Mae cymorth canolog yn hanfodol bellach. Mae ailfandio wedi dangos y graddau y mae hyn yn ôl-dreth, a gofynnaf ichi barhau i'w hadolygu, Weinidog.

**Sue Essex:** Yn amlwg, bydd yn parhau i gael ei hadolygu, oherwydd y gwaith y mae Michael Lyons yn ei wneud. Yr ydym yn ystyried gwneud datganiad pellach i Michael Lyons. Unwaith eto, nid wyf yn rhannu eich pesimistiaeth o ran treth eiddo, oherwydd dengys yr holl ymchwil fod cysylltiad agos, er gwaethaf y ffaith ei fod yn amherffaith, rhwng incwm a gwerth eiddo, felly byddwn yn dweud ei bod yn cael ei defnyddio fel dirprwy.

I ddychwelyd at gydbwysedd cyllid, buom yn edrych yn ofalus ar ddewisiadau eraill. Treuliais lawer o amser ar hyn, a chefais gyfarfod ynglŷn ag ef gyda'r Sefydliad Siartredig Cyllid Cyhoeddus a Chyfrifyddiaeth. Mae gan bob cynllun gryfderau a gwendidau. Fy mhryder, fel yr wyf wedi ei grybwyll o'r blaen, yw bod yn rhaid inni fod yn bendant ynghylch yr hyn y dylid ei gasglu'n ganolog a'r hyn y dylid ei gasglu'n lleol. Nid wyf am weld y sylfaen ddemocrataidd leol yn cael ei thanseilio yn hyn oll. Yr ydych yn gywir pan ddwedwch fod y cydbwysedd cyllid wedi newid—erbyn hyn yr ydym yn cyfrannu canran fawr at gyllid a gwasanaethau llywodraeth leol; mae hynny wedi newid dros y blynyddoedd, a byddai camu'n ôl yn arwain at drafferthion mawr—ond rhaid inni ystyried effeithiolrwydd systemau casglu ochr yn ochr â chynnal atebolrwydd democrataidd.

months.

Bydd Michael Lyons yn edrych ar hynny'n ofalus. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwn yn trafod hyn yn ystod cyfarfod y pwyllgor ac yn y Cyfarfod Llawn yn y misoedd i ddod.

### **Gweinyddu Effeithiol Efficient Administration**

**Q13 William Graham:** Will the Minister indicate how many examples of best practice, identified within our local authorities since May 2003, she has published to promote efficient administration? OAQ0184 (LGP)

**C13 William Graham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog nodi sawl enghraifft o arferion gorau, a nodwyd o fewn ein hawdurdodau lleol ers Mai 2003, y mae hi wedi eu cyhoeddi, er mwyn hyrwyddo gweinyddu effeithiol? OAQ0184 (LGP)

2.30 p.m.

**Sue Essex:** There are several examples of local authority best practice in 'Making the Connections'. They have been highlighted and boxed in that. We are encouraging Welsh local government, particularly through the Excellent Wales scheme, to pull those best practice examples to the fore.

**Sue Essex:** Ceir sawl enghraifft o arferion gorau awdurdodau lleol yn 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau'. Tynnwyd sylw atynt yn y ddogfen honno a'u gosod mewn blychau. Yr ydym yn annog llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru, yn arbennig drwy'r cynllun Cymru Ardderchog, i roi'r enghreifftiau hynny o arferion gorau ar y blaen.

**William Graham:** Would you consider publishing not only the best practice, but the savings gained from many of those, which are illustrative for many authorities?

**William Graham:** A fydddech yn ystyried cyhoeddi nid yn unig yr enghreifftiau o arferion gorau, ond yr arbedion sy'n gysylltiedig â nifer ohonynt, sy'n fuddiol i lawer awdurdod allu eu gweld?

**Sue Essex:** Part of 'Making the Connections' is to get better delivery of services, with the more efficient use of resources. Therefore, we are looking to local authorities to make those cost reductions and provide a better quality of services. You are right that we need to ensure that, where they are there, we disseminate those to as many people as possible, so that they can either work together or learn from one another.

**Sue Essex:** Mae a wnelo rhan o 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau' â sicrhau gwell ffyrdd i ddarparu gwasanaethau, ac adnoddau'n cael eu defnyddio'n fwy effeithlon. Felly, gobeithiwn y bydd awdurdodau lleol yn sicrhau'r gostyngiadau cost hynny ac yn darparu gwasanaethau o ansawdd gwell. Yr ydych yn iawn bod angen inni sicrhau, lle maent i'w cael, eu rhannu gyda chynifer â phosibl o bobl, er mwyn iddynt allu naill ai cydweithio neu ddysgu oddi wrth ei gilydd.

### **Codiadau yn y Dreth Gyngor Council Tax Increases**

**Q14 David Melding:** Will the Minister make a statement on council tax increases in Wales? OAQ0190 (LGP)

**C14 David Melding:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar godiadau yn y dreth gyngor yng Nghymru? OAQ0190 (LGP)

**Sue Essex:** You have moved from South Wales Central to the whole of Wales, David.

**Sue Essex:** Yr ydych wedi symud o Ganol De Cymru i Gymru gyfan, David.

The level of council tax is a matter for each

Mae pob awdurdod unigol yn gyfrifol am

individual authority. The average increase in band D council tax in Wales is 3.8 per cent. As I said, this is the lowest increase since the introduction of unitary authorities in 1996-97.

**David Melding:** Since 1997, council tax in Wales has gone up by an average of 86 per cent. This makes it a much more burdensome tax than it was previously, and it is a relatively regressive tax, as Members have mentioned this afternoon. Do you not believe that it is incumbent on you to ensure that those on fixed incomes are helped to the maximum possible extent?

**Sue Essex:** Exactly. That is why we have been so keen to increase council tax benefit take-up to a much higher level than it is at present. However, as I have explained in answer to earlier questions, I would like to see that scheme changed so that it includes many more people, picking up those people that you are talking about. If we have a property tax, I am hopeful that that will happen. However, in the meantime, I have been working with local authorities. We have a working group set up to see how we can encourage the take-up of council tax benefit. The Vale of Glamorgan County Borough Council has done some innovative work on this, as has Caerphilly County Borough Council, and many authorities in Wales are pressing hard to ensure that those people who are eligible and deserve that benefit get it.

lefel y dreth gyngor. Ar gyfartaledd, 3.8 y cant yw'r codiad yn y dreth gyngor band D yng Nghymru. Fel y dywedais, dyma'r codiad lleiaf ers cyflwyno'r awdurdodau unedol yn 1996-97.

**David Melding:** Ers 1997, mae'r dreth gyngor yng Nghymru wedi codi 86 y cant ar gyfartaledd. Mae hyn yn golygu ei bod yn dreth lawer mwy beichus nag oedd yn y gorffennol, a'i bod yn dreth gymharol atchwel, fel y nodwyd gan Aelodau y prynhawn yma. Oni chredwch ei bod yn ddyletswydd arnoch i sicrhau y caiff y rheini sydd ar incwm sefydlog gymaint o gymorth â phosibl?

**Sue Essex:** Yn union. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi bod mor awyddus i gynyddu nifer y bobl sy'n hawlio budd-dal treth gyngor i lefel lawer uwch na'r lefel bresennol. Fodd bynnag, fel yr eglurais wrth ymateb i gwestiynau cynharach, hoffwn weld y cynllun hwnnw'n newid er mwyn iddo gynnwys llawer mwy o bobl, gan gynnwys y bobl hynny yr ydych yn sôn amdanynt. Os cyflwynir treth eiddo, yr wyf yn obeithiol y bydd hynny'n digwydd. Fodd bynnag, yn y cyfamser, yr wyf wedi bod yn gweithio gydag awdurdodau lleol. Sefydlwyd gweithgor gennym i weld sut y gallwn annog pobl i hawlio budd-dal treth gyngor. Mae Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Bro Morgannwg wedi gwneud gwaith arloesol yn hyn o beth, felly hefyd Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili, ac mae nifer o awdurdodau yng Nghymru yn ymdrechu'n ddiwyd i sicrhau bod y bobl hynny sy'n gymwys ac sy'n haeddu'r budd-dal hwnnw yn ei gael.

### **Llywodraeth Leol Fwy Agored ac Atebol Open and Accountable Local Government**

**Q15 Brynle Williams:** How is the Welsh Assembly Government aiding local government to be more open and accountable? OAQ0191 (LGP)

**Sue Essex:** In terms of the legislation introduced—the Local Government Act 2000—its prime aim was to make government more efficient, accountable and transparent. However, the work of authorities in developing community strategies has also been a major way forward in opening up

**C15 Brynle Williams:** Sut mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cynorthwyo llywodraeth leol i fod yn fwy agored ac atebol? OAQ0191 (LGP)

**Sue Essex:** O ran y ddeddfwriaeth a gyflwynwyd—Deddf Llywodraeth Leol 2000—ei phrif nod oedd sicrhau llywodraeth fwy effeithlon, atebol ac eglur. Fodd bynnag, mae gwaith awdurdodau wrth ddatblygu strategaethau cymunedol hefyd wedi bod yn gam mawr ymlaen wrth sicrhau bod

local government to the people in their areas.

llywodraeth leol yn fwy agored i'r bobl yn eu hardaloedd.

**Brynle Williams:** Last year, the director general of the Audit Commission published a report on the first year of the Wales Programme for Improvement. One of the key problems relates to poor performance information and the performance of management arrangements. What support have you given to local authorities in Wales to improve the position in order for councils to become more open and accountable to the electorate?

**Brynle Williams:** Y llynedd, cyhoeddodd cyfarwyddwr cyffredinol y Comisiwn Archwilio adroddiad ar flwyddyn gyntaf Rhaglen Cymru ar gyfer Gwella. Mae un o'r problemau allweddol yn ymwneud â gwybodaeth wael am berfformiad a pherfformiad trefniadau rheoli. Pa gymorth a roddwyd gennych i awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru i wella'r sefyllfa er mwyn i gynghorau fod yn fwy agored ac atebol i'r etholwyr?

**Sue Essex:** As I have said, this is done both in terms of how the legislation works and how our guidance is followed. We are very much linked in with the Wales Programme for Improvement. The other major thing that will change things is the expression of performance indicators. A performance framework is being put in place, and we have discussed this in our committee. This will be in place. The policy agreements to which I referred in response to Val Lloyd's question are in place with 22 local authorities, and they will be published for everyone to see.

**Sue Essex:** Fel y dywedais, gwneir hyn o ran y ffordd y mae'r ddeddfwriaeth yn gweithio a'r ffordd y caiff ein canllawiau eu dilyn. Mae cyswllt agos rhyngom a Rhaglen Cymru ar gyfer Gwella. Y ffactor pwysig arall a fydd yn newid y sefyllfa fydd y ffordd y caiff dangosyddion perfformiad eu mynegi. Mae fframwaith perfformiad yn cael ei roi ar waith, ac fe'i trafodwyd yn ein pwyllgor. Bydd hwn ar waith. Mae'r cytundebau polisi y cyfeiriais atynt wrth ymateb i gwestiwn Val Lloyd eisoes ar waith gyda 22 o awdurdodau lleol, a chânt eu cyhoeddi i bawb eu gweld.

**The Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Minister. You seem to have answered all the questions.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch, Weinidog. Ymddengys eich bod wedi ateb yr holl gwestiynau.

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes Questions to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning**

### **Hyfforddiant Cychwynnol i Athrawon Initial Teacher Training**

**C1 Owen John Thomas:** Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cymryd i sicrhau bod hyfforddiant cychwynnol i athrawon yn paratoi mwy o athrawon â'r gallu i ddysgu Cymraeg naill ai fel ail iaith neu fel iaith gyntaf? OAQ0230(ELL)

**Q1 Owen John Thomas:** What steps has the Minister taken to ensure that initial teacher training gives more teachers the ability to teach Welsh as either a second or a first language? OAQ0230(ELL)

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Mae adolygiadau ar y gweill sy'n edrych ar ofynion cyrsiau hyfforddi cychwynnol i athrawon a darpariaeth hyfforddiant cychwynnol i athrawon yng Nghymru. Mae dysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg a dysgu'r Gymraeg fel ail iaith yn rhan o ystyriaethau'r adolygiadau

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** There are reviews in progress looking at initial teacher training course requirements and initial teacher training provision in Wales. Teaching through the medium of Welsh and teaching Welsh as a second language will be considered as part of those reviews. In

hynny. Hefyd, mae cymorth ariannol ar gael eisoes i'r rhai sy'n dilyn cyrsiau hyfforddiant cychwynnol i athrawon yn y meysydd hyn.

**Owen John Thomas:** Yng nghyfarfod diweddar y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, dywedodd Estyn fod diffyg athrawon Cymraeg iaith gyntaf yn arafu twf addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg ac yn effeithio ar effeithiolrwydd dysgu Cymraeg fel ail iaith mewn ysgolion cyfrwng Saesneg. A oes gennych fwriad i gynnal trafodaethau manwl â phrif sefydliadau hyfforddi athrawon Cymru i gryfhau'r cyrsiau ar gyfer athrawon Cymraeg a denu mwy o fyfyrwyr Cymraeg?

**Jane Davidson:** Yr ydym yn annog y lleoedd sy'n rhoi hyfforddiant i athrawon i gymryd mwy o bobl Cymraeg eu hiaith. Hefyd, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn annog mwy o bobl yn y proffesiwn ar hyn o bryd i ddysgu'r iaith. Felly, y mae £2 filiwn ar gael i greu cyfnodau sabothol yn y sector cymunedol i bobl dros eu 16 oed.

**John Griffiths:** In those areas where comparatively little Welsh is spoken—by perhaps 2 per cent of the population, for example—there are particular difficulties in providing adequate Welsh-language tuition, and there is little Welsh in the community to support that teaching in any event. Do you consider it necessary to take special steps in those areas if we are to make Welsh-language tuition what it needs to be?

**Jane Davidson:** A commitment that we made in 'Iaith Pawb' in this sense is to encourage the increase of Welsh-language and bilingual provision. We are doing this in some ways through a set of initiatives that includes teaching more people at the youngest age to learn Welsh. The foundation phase strongly encourages Welsh and bilingualism. Our immersion projects in the primary sector do the same. Putting sabbaticals in place for teachers, encouraging more children to stay on in Welsh-medium or bilingual secondary schools, and encouraging English-medium secondary schools to be more bilingual are all part of the agenda of ensuring that we increase the number of people who will then be able to contribute to our education system through the medium of

addition, financial assistance is already available to those who undertake initial teacher training courses in these subjects.

**Owen John Thomas:** In a recent meeting of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee, Estyn said that the lack of first-language Welsh teachers is slowing down the growth of Welsh-medium education, and affecting the efficacy teaching Welsh as a second language in English-medium schools. Do you propose to hold detailed discussions with the main teacher training institutions in Wales to strengthen the courses for Welsh teachers and to attract more students of Welsh?

**Jane Davidson:** We encourage the institutions that provide teacher training to take more Welsh-speaking people. It is also important that we encourage more people in the profession to learn the language. Therefore, £2 million is available to create sabbaticals in the community sector for those over 16 years old.

**John Griffiths:** Yn yr ardaloedd hynny lle mae'r nifer sy'n siarad Cymraeg yn gymharol fach—efallai 2 y cant o'r boblogaeth, er enghraifft—mae anawsterau penodol i ddarparu hyfforddiant Cymraeg digonol, a phrin yw'r Gymraeg yn y gymuned i ategu'r addysgu hwnnw beth bynnag. A ydych o'r farn bod angen cymryd camau arbennig yn yr ardaloedd hynny er mwyn i hyfforddiant Cymraeg gyrraedd y safon briodol?

**Jane Davidson:** Un o'r ymrwymadau a wnaed gennym yn 'Iaith Pawb' yn yr ystyr hwn yw annog y broses o gynyddu darpariaeth Gymraeg a dwyieithog. Yr ydym yn gwneud hyn i ryw raddau drwy gyfres o fentrau, sy'n cynnwys addysgu mwy o bobl mor ifanc â phosibl i ddysgu Cymraeg. Mae'r cyfnod sylfaen yn rhoi anogaeth gadarn i'r Gymraeg a dwyieithrwydd. Felly hefyd ein prosiectau trochi yn y sector cynradd. Mae trefnu cyfnodau sabothol i athrawon, annog mwy o blant i barhau â'u haddysg mewn ysgolion uwchradd Cymraeg neu ddwyieithog, ac annog ysgolion uwchradd Saesneg i fod yn fwy dwyieithog oll yn rhan o'r agenda ar gyfer sicrhau ein bod yn cynyddu nifer y bobl a fydd wedyn yn gallu cyfrannu at ein system addysg drwy

Welsh.

gyfrwng y Gymraeg.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Felly, Weinidog, a gawn ni adroddiad ar y cynnydd a wnaed gan y grŵp sy'n astudio datblygiad hyfforddiant cychwynnol athrawon inni gael gweld yn union beth sy'n cael ei yrru ymlaen?

**Eleanor Burnham:** Will we, therefore, Minister, receive a report on progress made by the group studying the development of initial teacher training, so that we can see exactly what is being driven forward?

**Jane Davidson:** Cewch. Yr wyf wedi rhoi adroddiad i'r pwyllgor ar y cylch gorchwyl ac ati i'r arbenigwr sy'n edrych ar faterion fel hyfforddiant athrawon cychwynnol, ac, ar ôl iddo orffen, daw adroddiad arall i'r pwyllgor.

**Jane Davidson:** Yes. I have given a report to the committee on the terms of reference and so on of the specialist looking at issues such as initial teacher training, and when he has finished another report will be brought before committee.

### **Y Rheol 38 Awr (AALlau) The 38-hour Rule (LEAs)**

**Q2 Janet Davies:** Will the Minister make a statement on the funding of the 38-hour rule for local education authorities in south-west Wales? OAQ0212(ELL)

**C2 Janet Davies:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar gyllido'r rheol 38 awr i awdurdodau addysg lleol yn ne-orllewin Cymru? OAQ0212(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** The teachers' workload agreement means that no teacher can be asked to cover for absent colleagues for more than 38 hours per year. We have made £58 million available through the revenue support grant this year in recognition of the costs of the agreement, with LEAs in south-west Wales receiving a proportionate share.

**Jane Davidson:** Mae cytundeb llwyth gwaith athrawon yn golygu na ellir gofyn i unrhyw athro gyflenwi am fwy na 38 awr y flwyddyn ar ran cydweithwyr sy'n absennol. Rhyddhawyd £58 miliwn gennym drwy'r grant cynnal refeniw eleni i gydnabod costau'r cytundeb, a chafodd AALl y De-orllewin gyfran gymesur ohono.

**Janet Davies:** Despite that money, many schools are still experiencing difficulties in covering staff who are absent. I understand that the 38 hours will be reduced to zero from September. Some schools say that they are cancelling field trips as they cannot afford to have staff out of school for more than three days. Do you share your Westminster colleagues' desire to see more field trips taking place, and, if so, how will you ensure that Welsh schools can achieve them?

**Janet Davies:** Er gwaethaf yr arian hwnnw, mae nifer o ysgolion yn dal i'w chael hi'n anodd trefnu athrawon eraill i gyflenwi ar ran aelodau o'r staff sy'n absennol. Yr wyf ar ddeall y caiff y 38 awr ei gostwng i sero o fis Medi. Dywed rhai ysgolion eu bod yn canslo teithiau maes am na allant fforddio bod staff allan o'r ysgol am fwy na thri diwrnod. A ydych mor awyddus â'ch cyd-aelodau yn San Steffan i weld mwy o deithiau maes yn cael eu cynnal, ac os felly, sut y byddwch yn sicrhau y gall ysgolion yng Nghymru wneud hynny?

**Jane Davidson:** As far as I am aware, I have received no representations on not being able to deliver on the cover issues. I would therefore be interested in any hard evidence that you want to put to me on that front. There are broad discussions about the funding of the teachers' workload agreement, but the majority of it is in relation to the delivery of the planning, preparation and

**Jane Davidson:** Hyd y gwn i, nid wyf wedi cael unrhyw sylwadau ynglŷn â methu cyflawni trefniadau cyflenwi. Felly, byddai diddordeb gennyf weld unrhyw dystiolaeth gadarn yr hoffech ei chyflwyno imi am hynny. Mae trafodaethau cyffredinol yn mynd rhagddynt ar gyllido cytundeb llwyth gwaith athrawon. Ond mae a wnelo'r rhan fwyaf ohonynt â darparu'r rhwymedigaethau



assessment obligations that will come into force in September this year.

As always, I maintain my absolute commitment to young people having the opportunity to go outside school to enhance their educational experience.

2.40 p.m.

**Peter Black:** I have a copy of a letter sent to you by the Swansea primary headteacher group on the workload agreement, in which it refers to lack of finance, shortage of training places for higher level teaching assistants, recruitment problems associated with adequate access to training opportunities, and appropriate pay and professional structures. The letter concludes that the financial position is not sustainable. How do you answer those criticisms, and what will you do about them?

**Jane Davidson:** With my colleagues in local government finance, some detailed assessment work has been done in terms of looking at the amount of money that is put in place for the workload agreement between 2004 and 2007. It is a large amount of money. By 2007, it will be £161 million. Each year that we have put in additional money, it has then been consolidated for the further year. As I said in answer to the original question, it is £58 million this year—£33 million from last year, and a further £25 million—and then the funding increases each year. It is a substantial amount of money. We need to ensure that the change co-ordinators, which are in place in every single local authority, are able to work with the primary sector, in particular, which has never operated in this way before, to ensure that we deliver the obligation. We want to improve teachers' workloads, and, as a Government, we want to play our part in contributing towards that.

cynllunio, paratoi ac asesu a ddaw i rym ym mis Medi eleni.

Fel bob amser, mae fy ymrwymiad yn llwyr i sicrhau y caiff pobl ifanc y cyfle i fynd allan o'r ysgol i gyfoethogi eu profiad addysgol.

**Peter Black:** Mae gennyf gopi o lythyr a anfonwyd atoch gan grŵp penaethiaid cynradd Abertawe ynghylch y cytundeb llwyth gwaith. Mae'n cyfeirio at ddiffyg cyllid, prinder lleoedd hyfforddi ar gyfer cynorthwyr dysgu lefel uwch, problemau recriwtio'n gysylltiedig â mynediad digonol i gyfleoedd hyfforddi, a strwythurau cyflog a strwythurau proffesiynol priodol. Daw'r llythyr i ben drwy ddweud na ellir cynnal y sefyllfa ariannol Beth yw eich ymateb i'r beiriadaethau hynny, a beth fyddwch yn ei wneud yn eu cylch?

**Jane Davidson:** Gyda fy nghyd-Aelodau ym maes cyllid llywodraeth leol, gwnaed rhywfaint o waith asesu manwl o ran edrych ar faint o arian a gaiff ei neilltuo ar gyfer y cytundeb llwyth gwaith rhwng 2004 a 2007. Mae'n swm mawr o arian. Erbyn 2007, bydd yn £161 miliwn. Bob blwyddyn pan ydym wedi neilltuo arian ychwanegol, mae wedi ei gydgrynhoi wedyn ar gyfer y flwyddyn ychwanegol. Fel y dywedais wrth ymateb i'r cwestiwn gwreiddiol, mae'n £58 miliwn eleni—£33 miliwn o'r llynedd, a £25 miliwn ychwanegol—ac yna mae'r cyllid yn cynyddu bob blwyddyn. Mae'n swm sylweddol o arian. Mae angen inni sicrhau y gall y cydlynwyr newid, sydd wedi'u penodi ymhob awdurdod lleol unigol, weithio gyda'r sector cynradd, yn arbennig, nad yw wedi gweithredu fel hyn o'r blaen, er mwyn sicrhau y gallwn gyflawni'r rhwymedigaeth. Yr ydym am wella llwythi gwaith athrawon, ac fel Llywodraeth yr ydym am chwarae ein rhan wrth gyfrannu at y broses honno.

### **Cyflwyno Ffioedd Ychwanegol yn Lloegr The Introduction of Top-up Fees in England**

**Q3 Glyn Davies:** What discussions has the Minister had with the UK Government about the effect on Welsh universities of the introduction of top-up fees in England?

**C3 Glyn Davies:** Pa drafodaethau a fu rhwng y Gweinidog a Llywodraeth y DU ynghylch effaith cyflwyno ffioedd ychwanegol yn Lloegr ar brifysgolion

OAQ0217(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** I remained in regular contact with UK Government Ministers during the passage of the Higher Education Act 2004. Officials are working closely with colleagues across the UK on the practical implementations of the devolution of student support and tuition fee changes, and will continue to do so.

**Glyn Davies:** What will be the position of students enrolling in Welsh universities in 2006? Students and their families are now preparing for that. Can you give any guarantees that those who enter higher education in 2006 will not be paying top-up fees?

**Jane Davidson:** We have made it absolutely clear that there will be no top-up fees during the lifetime of this Assembly, which takes us to May 2007. Students enrolling in Welsh universities in 2006 will be paying in line with current arrangements.

**Janet Ryder:** The Universities and Colleges Admissions Service has said that it has seen a 12 per cent increase in the number of English students applying to Welsh universities for the coming year. Unfortunately, there is a growing number of anecdotal stories of Welsh students applying to Welsh universities, particularly to follow medical courses, and being refused places and therefore having to study in England. What is your Government doing to ensure that Welsh domiciled students will be able to study in Welsh universities if they qualify for those courses?

**Jane Davidson:** The UCAS figures also show that a larger number of Welsh domiciled students has chosen to stay in Wales. I do not work on the basis of anecdotes. If you have real evidence about people who have the right qualifications being turned down, I would be happy to take that up with our medical school.

Cymru? OAQ0217(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Yr oeddwn mewn cysylltiad yn rheolaidd â Gweinidogion Llywodraeth y DU wrth i Ddeddf Addysg Uwch 2004 gael ei phasio. Mae swyddogion yn cydweithio'n agos â chydweithwyr ledled y DU ar weithredu'n ymarferol y broses o ddatganoli cymorth i fyfyrwyr, a'r newidiadau mewn ffioedd dysgu, a byddant yn parhau i wneud hynny.

**Glyn Davies:** Beth fydd y sefyllfa i fyfyrwyr a fydd yn cofrestru mewn prifysgolion yng Nghymru yn 2006? Mae myfyrwyr a'u teuluoedd yn paratoi ar gyfer hynny yn awr. A allwch roi unrhyw sicrwydd na fydd y rheini a fydd yn cofrestru ar gyfer addysg uwch yn 2006 yn talu ffioedd ychwanegol?

**Jane Davidson:** Yr ydym wedi egluro'n bendant na fydd unrhyw ffioedd ychwanegol yn ystod oes y Cynulliad hwn, sef hyd at fis Mai 2007. Bydd myfyrwyr sy'n cofrestru mewn prifysgolion yng Nghymru yn 2006 yn talu yn unol â'r trefniadau presennol.

**Janet Ryder:** Mae'r Gwasanaeth Derbyn i Brifysgolion a Cholegau wedi dweud iddo weld cynnydd o 12 y cant yn nifer y myfyrwyr o Loegr sy'n gwneud cais i brifysgolion yng Nghymru ar gyfer y flwyddyn i ddod. Yn anffodus, mae nifer gynyddol o straeon anecdotaidd am fyfyrwyr o Gymru sy'n gwneud cais i brifysgolion yng Nghymru, yn enwedig i astudio cyrsiau meddygol, ac yn cael eu gwrthod ac felly'n gorfod mynd i Loegr i astudio. Beth mae eich Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i sicrhau y bydd myfyrwyr sy'n byw yng Nghymru yn gallu astudio mewn prifysgolion yng Nghymru os ydynt yn gymwys ar gyfer y cyrsiau hynny?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae ffigurau UCAS hefyd yn dangos bod nifer uwch o fyfyrwyr sy'n byw yng Nghymru wedi dewis aros yng Nghymru. Nid wyf yn gweithio ar sail anecdotau. Os oes gennych unrhyw dystiolaeth gadarn am bobl sydd â'r cymwysterau priodol yn cael eu gwrthod, byddwn yn fwy na pharod i drafod hynny gyda'n hysgol feddygol.

## Dysgu Gydol Oes Lifelong Learning

**Q4 Rosemary Butler:** What initiatives is the Minister promoting to encourage older people to engage in lifelong learning? OAQ0259(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** The Assembly Government promotes learning for all ages and we support a range of programmes, such as the successful 'Meet the Mouse' course, aimed specifically at older learners. Last year, provisional data from ELWa indicates almost 89,000 enrolments from the over-50 age group, which is some 25 per cent of total enrolments.

**Rosemary Butler:** I am sure that you would agree that older people benefit greatly from taking part in education classes, whether they be on history, dressmaking, computer studies, or drawing. Unfortunately, because of the requirement to achieve qualification credits, many older people no longer take part in such courses. Have you any plans to remove the requirement to accumulate credits for older people, or to create a parallel credits-free lifelong programme for the thousands of older people who, at present, feel excluded from education classes?

**Jane Davidson:** We are continually looking at the balance between learning for accreditation and learning for learning's sake, which improves the quality of life experience. A range of people are involved in community learning, and 34,700 people aged 50 and over enrolled in that in 2003-04, which is almost half the total number of enrolments during the year, and many of those courses do not require any accreditation. I continually keep this matter under review.

**David Davies:** Would you agree that encouraging older people who wish to do so to go back to university or to engage in the learning process is probably a better use of our precious resources than encouraging younger people who do not particularly wish to go to university to do so and to undertake

**C4 Rosemary Butler:** Pa fentrau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu hyrwyddo i annog pobl hŷn i ymgymryd â dysgu gydol oes? OAQ0259(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn hyrwyddo dysgu i bob oed, ac yr ydym yn cefnogi amrywiaeth o raglenni, megis y cwrs llwyddiannus, 'Llywio'r Llygoden', sydd wedi'i anelu'n benodol at ddysgwyr hŷn. Y llynedd, dengys data dros dro gan ELWa i bron i 89,000 o bobl dros 50 oed gofrestru, sy'n cyfateb i tua 25 y cant o'r cyfanswm a gofrestrodd.

**Rosemary Butler:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddech yn cytuno bod pobl hŷn yn elwa'n sylweddol o gymryd rhan mewn dosbarthiadau addysg, boed ar hanes, gwneud dillad, astudiaethau cyfrifiadurol, neu dynnu lluniau. Yn anffodus, oherwydd y gofyniad i sicrhau credydau cymhwyster, mae nifer o bobl hŷn wedi rhoi'r gorau i gymryd rhan mewn cyrsiau o'r fath. A oes gennych unrhyw gynlluniau i ddiddymu'r gofyniad i bobl hŷn gasglu credydau, neu i greu rhaglen gydol oes debyg nad yw'n cynnwys credydau i'r miloedd o bobl hŷn sydd, ar hyn o bryd, yn teimlo eu bod yn cael eu rhwystro rhag mynychu dosbarthiadau addysg?

**Jane Davidson:** Yr ydym yn gyson yn edrych ar y cydbwysedd rhwng dysgu ar gyfer achredu a dysgu er ei fwyn ei hun, sy'n gwella ansawdd bywyd. Mae amrywiaeth o bobl yn ymwneud â dysgu yn y gymuned, a chofrestrodd 34,700 o bobl 50 oed a hŷn yn hynny yn 2003-04, sef bron i hanner y cyfanswm a gofrestrodd yn ystod y flwyddyn, ac nid oes angen achredu llawer o'r cyrsiau hynny. Yr wyf yn adolygu hyn yn barhaus.

**David Davies:** A fyddech yn cytuno bod annog pobl hŷn, sydd am wneud hynny, i fynd yn ôl i'r brifysgol neu i gymryd rhan yn y broses ddysgu hwyrach yn ffordd well o ddefnyddio'n hadnoddau prin nag annog pobl iau nad ydynt yn awyddus i fynd i brifysgol i wneud hynny a dilyn cyrsiau

inappropriate courses that often do not lead to any sort of job?

amhriodol nad ydynt yn aml yn arwain at unrhyw fath o swydd?

**Jane Davidson:** Your absence from this Chamber has clearly not ensured that you have learned any more about Assembly Government policy. We have always encouraged—

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'n amlwg nad yw eich absenoldeb o'r Siambr hon wedi sicrhau eich bod wedi dysgu mwy am bolisi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Yr ydym wedi annog o'r cychwyn—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I have not noticed any absences from the Chamber.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid wyf wedi sylwi ar unrhyw absenoldeb o'r Siambr.

**Jane Davidson:** I was referring to David's absence in your absence, Presiding Officer.

**Jane Davidson:** Yr oeddwn yn cyfeirio at absenoldeb David yn eich absenoldeb chi, Lywydd.

We were the first part of the UK to lift the limit on modern apprenticeships to encourage older people. We were the part of the UK that put no upper age limits when introducing Assembly learning grants. The individual learning accounts that we retained in Wales are also available to older learners. Therefore, I hope that you will endorse the strategy that we have followed so far. You will fully recognise that we have never had a target in terms of the number of younger people in Wales who go on to university; we have always encouraged people of all ages to go and fulfil their ambition in the right vehicle for them, whether at college, at university or in the workplace.

Ni oedd y rhan gyntaf o'r DU i godi'r terfyn ar brentisiaethau modern i annog pobl hŷn. Ni oedd y rhan honno o'r DU na phennodd uchafswm oedran pan gyflwynwyd grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad. Mae'r cyfrifon dysgu unigol sydd wedi eu cadw yng Nghymru hefyd ar gael i ddysgwyr hŷn. Felly, gobeithio y byddwch yn cymeradwyo'r strategaeth yr ydym wedi ei dilyn hyd yma. Byddwch yn cydnabod yn llwyr na fu gennym darged erioed o ran nifer y bobl iau yng Nghymru sy'n mynd i'r brifysgol; yr ydym bob amser wedi annog pobl o bob oed i gyflawni eu huchelgais drwy ddefnyddio'r cyfrwng sydd orau iddynt, boed yn y coleg, yn y brifysgol neu yn y gweithle.

**David Lloyd:** How will you guarantee funding for community outreach educational courses that, in the main, attract older people?

**David Lloyd:** Sut y byddwch yn gwarantu arian ar gyfer cyrsiau addysgol allgymorth yn y gymuned sydd, yn bennaf, yn denu pobl hŷn?

**Jane Davidson:** ELWa has undertaken a review of adult and community learning, and my officials are still discussing the next stages with their colleagues at ELWa. It is important that this overall area of learning reflects local needs and demands, as well as the overall skills agenda.

**Jane Davidson:** Mae ELWa wedi cynnal adolygiad o ddysgu i oedolion a dysgu yn y gymuned, ac mae fy swyddogion yn dal i drafod y camau nesaf gyda'u cydweithwyr yn ELWa. Mae'n bwysig i'r maes dysgu cyffredinol hwn adlewyrchu anghenion a galw lleol, yn ogystal â'r agenda sgiliau gyffredinol.

### **Maes Llafur Hanes i Ysgolion Uwchradd The History Syllabus for Secondary Schools**

**Q5 David Melding:** Will the Minister make a statement on the place of the reformation on the history syllabus for secondary schools? OAQ0241(ELL)

**C5 David Melding:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar le y diwygiad ym maes llafur hanes ysgolion uwchradd? OAQ0241(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** The national curriculum in Wales requires all pupils in the first three years of secondary education to be taught about the major political and religious changes, including the reformation, which shaped the history of Wales and Britain from 1500 to 1760. It is for schools to determine how that requirement is met.

**David Melding:** I think that one of the principal reasons why I am a Conservative is that I have never really got over the shock of the reformation after being taught about it at school. [*Laughter.*] Do you agree that it is essential that all children at some point should be taught about the significance of this event, and that, if this does not happen, it is rather like the children of ancient Greece or Rome not knowing anything about the significance of the battle of Thermopylae?

**Jane Davidson:** It is true to say that the reformation was a cataclysmic event in early modern Europe. Although Protestantism originally emerged as a critique of medieval Catholicism, for the two centuries subsequent to the beginning of the reformation, it generated a different map of Europe for the future. It is important that people understand that and the pressures that the debate between Catholicism and the range of Protestantism that came forward places on the modern day.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 6, OAQ0250(ELL), has been withdrawn.

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol yng Nghymru yn mynnu bod pob disgybl yn cael ei ddysgu, yn ystod tair blynedd cyntaf addysg uwchradd, am y prif newidiadau gwleidyddol a chrefyddol, gan gynnwys y Diwygiad Protestannaidd, a luniodd hanes Cymru a Phrydain o 1500 i 1760. Yr ysgolion sydd i benderfynu sut y bodlonir y gofyniad hwnnw.

**David Melding:** Credaf mai un o'r prif resymau pam fy mod yn Geidwadwr yw nad wyf erioed wedi dod dros sioc y Diwygiad Protestannaidd ar ôl dysgu amdano yn yr ysgol. [*Chwerthin.*] A gytunwch ei bod yn hanfodol y dylai pob plentyn gael ei addysgu am arwyddocâd y digwyddiad hwn ar ryw adeg, ac os na ddigwydd hynny, ei fod yn gyfystyr â bod plant Groeg neu Rufain yn yr henfyd yn gwybod dim am arwyddocâd brwydr Thermopylae?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'n wir dweud bod y Diwygiad Protestannaidd yn ddigwyddiad cataclysmig yn hanes Ewrop fodern gynnar. Er i Brotestaniaeth ddeillio'n wreiddiol o feirniadaeth o Babyddiaeth y Canol Oesoedd, am y ddwy ganrif cyn dechrau'r diwygiad, creodd fap gwahanol iawn o Ewrop ar gyfer y dyfodol. Mae'n bwysig i bobl ddeall hynny, a'r pwysau y mae'r ddadl rhwng Pabyddiaeth a'r ystod o Brotestaniaeth a ddaeth i'r amlwg yn eu rhoi ar yr oes sydd ohoni.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 6, OAQ0250(ELL), yn ôl.

### Polisiâu Addysg Education Policies

**Q7 William Graham:** Further to her answers to OAQ0192(ELL) and WAQ42441, will the Minister confirm which aspects of education policies are influenced by the number of pupils being taught in Welsh schools? OAQ0252(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Pupil numbers in Wales are falling. At September 2003, there were an estimated 68,000 net surplus places across Wales, and forecasts suggest that numbers will fall by a further 45,000 by 2013. Our

**C7 William Graham:** Yn dilyn ei hatebion i OAQ0192(ELL) a WAQ42441, a wnaiff y Gweinidog gadarnhau pa agweddau ar bolisiâu addysg sy'n cael eu dylanwadu gan nifer y disgyblion sy'n cael eu dysgu yn ysgolion Cymru? OAQ0252(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Mae nifer y disgyblion yng Nghymru yn gostwng. Fis Medi 2003, amcangyfrifwyd bod 68,000 o leoedd gwag net ledled Cymru, ac awgryma rhagolygon y bydd y niferoedd yn gostwng 45,000 yn

policy is set out in circular 23/02, and local education authorities must ensure that all pupils receive a broad and balanced curriculum.

**William Graham:** Will you therefore publish a strategy linked to the timescale for the training of teachers and lecturers, so that the number of schools will be known as early as possible? The educational needs of individual pupils and the curriculum could then be properly examined and altered where possible.

2.50 p.m.

**Jane Davidson:** Our strategy remains, as I said in my previous answer, that LEAs must ensure that all pupils have a broad and balanced curriculum. The curriculum is already laid out in Orders delivered by the Assembly, and I am sure that you would want to ensure that every child in Wales has access to that curriculum. LEAs must therefore look at ensuring that that is deliverable in their area.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr ydych yn sôn am strategaeth sydd wedi ei seilio ar sicrhau bod pob disgybl yn derbyn y cwricwlwm mewn ffordd gynhwysfawr ond, yn aml, gwelwn fod agenda awdurdodau lleol ar gyfer ad-drefnu addysg, yn enwedig addysg gynradd, yn cael ei gyrru gan leoedd gwag. A fydddech yn cytuno bod presenoldeb lleoedd gwag a'r ffaith bod niferoedd disgyblion yn disgyn yn gyfle i leihau'r niferoedd sydd yn ein dosbarthiadau? O ran ardaloedd gwledig a'u hen adeiladau, a fydddech hefyd yn derbyn nad gweithio allan nifer y lleoedd gwag ar sail y metr sgwâr yw'r ffordd orau o wneud hynny bob amser, oherwydd golyga natur yr adeiladau nad yw'r lleoedd gwag bob amser yn gyfystyr â'r cyfle i ddysgu plant?

**Jane Davidson:** Lower pupil numbers can, in some instances, make it easier for classes to be organised so as to comply with, for example, the primary class-size policy, and for schools to comply with the greater space per pupil policy that we are asking for in terms of the foundation phase. Given that we want the foundation phase to operate across

rhagor erbyn 2013. Nodir ein polisi yng nghylchlythyr 23/02, a rhaid i awdurdodau addysg lleol sicrhau y caiff pob disgybl gwricwlwm eang a chytbwys.

**William Graham:** A wnewch felly gyhoeddi strategaeth sy'n gysylltiedig â'r amserlen ar gyfer hyfforddi athrawon a darlithwyr, er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn gwybod cyn gynted â phosibl beth fydd nifer yr ysgolion Gallai anghenion addysgol disgyblion unigol a'r cwricwlwm wedyn gael eu harchwilio'n briodol a'u newid lle mae'n bosibl.

**Jane Davidson:** Fel y dywedais yn fy ateb blaenorol, erys ein strategaeth fel a ganlyn, sef bod yn rhaid i AALLau sicrhau y caiff pob disgybl gwricwlwm eang a chytbwys. Mae'r cwricwlwm eisoes wedi'i nodi yn y Gorchmynion a gyflwynwyd gan y Cynulliad, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddech am sicrhau bod pob plentyn yng Nghymru yn gallu cael y cwricwlwm hwnnw. Rhaid i AALLau felly geisio sicrhau y gellir cyflawni hynny yn eu hardal.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** You talk of a strategy that is based on ensuring that the curriculum is delivered to each pupil in a comprehensive manner. But we see frequently that local authorities' agenda for the reorganisation of education, especially primary education, is driven by vacancies. Would you agree that the existence of vacancies, together with our falling school rolls, are an opportunity to reduce the number of pupils in our classes? In terms of rural areas and their old buildings, would you also accept that calculating the number of vacant places on a square-metre basis is not always the best way of operating, because the nature of those buildings means that the vacancies do not always equate to the opportunity to teach children?

**Jane Davidson:** Gall niferoedd llai o ddisgyblion, mewn rhai achosion, ei gwneud yn haws trefnu dosbarthiadau er mwyn iddynt gydymffurfio â'r polisi ar faint dosbarthiadau cynradd, er enghraifft, ac er mwyn i ysgolion gydymffurfio â'r polisi ar ragor o le fesul disgybl, fel yr ydym yn gofyn amdano yn y cyfnod sylfaen. O gofio

the primary sector in time, greater space per pupil is clearly a real opportunity—I absolutely agree with that. However, I am sure that you will agree that, as we had 68,000 net surplus places in September 2003—projected to fall by a further 45,000 places by 2013—local authorities need to ensure that children have a broad and balanced curriculum in buildings that are fit for purpose. That is their job.

ein bod am i'r cyfnod sylfaen weithredu ar draws y sector cynradd maes o law, mae rhagor o le fesul disgybl yn gyfle gwirioneddol—cytunaf yn llwyr â hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch, gan fod gennym 68,000 o leoedd gwag net ym mis Medi 2003—amcangyfrifir y bydd y nifer hwnnw'n gostwng 45,000 o leoedd yn rhagor erbyn 2013—mae angen i awdurdodau lleol sicrhau y caiff plant gwricwlwm eang a chytbwys mewn adeiladau sy'n addas at y pwrpas. Dyna yw eu gwaith.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 8, OAQ0265(ELL), yn ôl.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 8, OAQ0265(ELL), has been withdrawn.

### **Ariannu Cytundeb Baich Gwaith Athrawon The Funding of the Teachers' Workload Agreement**

**C9 David Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ariannu cytundeb baich gwaith athrawon? OAQ0226(ELL)

**Q9 David Lloyd:** Will the Minister make a statement on the funding of the teachers' workload agreement? OAQ0226(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Yn ôl y cynlluniau presennol, rhwng mis Ebrill 2004 a mis Mawrth 2007, byddwn wedi sicrhau bod £161 miliwn ychwanegol ar gael i ysgolion drwy'r grant cynnal refeniw i gydnabod y gost o ariannu'r cytundeb baich gwaith athrawon.

**Jane Davidson:** According to the current plans, between April 2004 and March 2007, we will have secured an additional £161 million for schools through the revenue support grant, in recognition of the cost of funding the teachers' workload agreement.

**David Lloyd:** Can you confirm therefore that the money now available for the teachers' workload agreement is a permanent part of school budgets that will continue year on year, and rise accordingly?

**David Lloyd:** A allwch gadarnhau, felly, fod yr arian sydd ar gael nawr ar gyfer y cytundeb llwyth gwaith athrawon yn rhan barhaol o gyllidebau ysgolion a fydd yn parhau o flwyddyn i flwyddyn, ac a fydd yn cynyddu yn unol â hynny?

**Jane Davidson:** Yes.

**Jane Davidson:** Gallaf.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Will you join me in congratulating the Ysgol Gyfun Cwm Rhymni cluster, which comprises eight Welsh-medium primary schools, that is developing teacher assistant qualifications for sixth formers who undertake the general national vocational qualification in public service? The cluster is remodelling the qualification to provide fully qualified Welsh-medium classroom assistants, who will then be employed within the cluster. Do you agree that this is an excellent example of collaboration under the teachers' workload

**Jeff Cuthbert:** A ymunwch â mi i longyfarch clwstwr Ysgol Gyfun Cwm Rhymni, sy'n cynnwys wyth ysgol gynradd Gymraeg, sy'n datblygu cymwysterau cynorthwywyr athrawon i ddisgyblion chweched dosbarth sy'n dilyn y cwrs cymhwyster galwedigaethol cenedlaethol cyffredinol mewn gwasanaeth cyhoeddus? Mae'r clwstwr yn ail-lunio'r cymhwyster i ddarparu cynorthwywyr ystafell ddosbarth cwbl gymwys drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, a gaiff wedyn eu cyflogi o fewn y clwstwr. A gytunwch fod hyn yn enghraifft wych o

agreement and that it is not a surprise therefore that Unison has praised the Labour-led Caerphilly County Borough Council as a beacon authority in how it has implemented the agreement?

**Jane Davidson:** It is important to say that a great deal of innovative work is going on. The majority of schools are taking their obligation seriously to deliver the 10 per cent planning, preparation and marking time for teachers. It is important that we address that. This is not only a teacher workload agenda; it is an opportunity to remodel the school workforce to deliver better education and wider opportunities, and to deal with the needs of teachers. That sounds like an innovative way of doing it and I would be happy to visit them and talk to them about it.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Headteachers in Wales are concerned that they have not been given enough money to pay qualified teachers to cover lessons. Would you comment on claims made by the Secondary Heads Association earlier this year that schools in Wales receive £150 to £200 less per pupil than schools in England? How would you respond to claims by the SHA that the Welsh Assembly Government has misled Assembly Members on this issue?

**Jane Davidson:** I would comment in two ways. First, my officials were concerned about the quality of the research used: it was questionnaire-based research with individual responses, which never makes something completely statistically valid. I produced statistically valid evidence to the committee at its last meeting, which said that, on balance, if you exclude London, which the Secondary Heads Association did in terms of its work, there is a funding difference of around £22 between the Welsh and English averages. My colleague, the Finance Minister, and I have already undertaken to look at that issue of variation, with the Welsh Local Government Association and the Wales Audit Office. That is very important, because there are large variations in Wales,

gydweithio o dan y cytundeb llwyth gwaith athrawon, ac nad yw'n syndod, felly, fod Unsain wedi canmol Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili, sydd dan arweiniad y Blaid Lafur, fel awdurdod disglair am y ffordd y mae wedi gweithredu'r cytundeb?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'n bwysig dweud bod llawer o waith arloesol yn cael ei wneud. Mae mwyafrif yr ysgolion yn cymryd o ddifrif eu cyfrifoldeb dros gyflawni'r 10 y cant o amser cynlluni o, paratoi a marcio ar gyfer eu hathrawon. Mae'n bwysig inni fynd i'r afael â hynny. Nid agenda am lwyth gwaith athrawon yn unig yw hon; mae'n gyfle i ailwampio gweithlu'r ysgol i ddarparu addysg well a chyfleoedd ehangach, ac i ymdrin ag anghenion athrawon. Mae hynny'n ymddangos yn ffordd arloesol o wneud hynny, a byddwn yn fwy na pharod i ymweld â hwy a siarad â hwy amdano.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Mae penaethiaid yng Nghymru yn pryderu na roddwyd digon o arian iddynt dalu am athrawon cyflenwi cymwys ar gyfer eu gwersi. A wnewch sylwadau ar honiadau a wnaed gan Gymdeithas y Prifathrawon Uwchradd yn gynharach eleni fod ysgolion yng Nghymru yn cael rhwng £150 a £200 yn llai fesul disgybl nag ysgolion yn Lloegr? Sut y byddech yn ymateb i honiadau gan y gymdeithas honno fod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi camarwain Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar y mater hwn?

**Jane Davidson:** Hoffwn wneud dau sylw. Yn gyntaf, yr oedd fy swyddogion yn pryderu ynghylch ansawdd yr ymchwil a ddefnyddiwyd. Yr oedd yn ymchwil yn seiliedig ar holiadur gydag ymatebion unigol, ac nid yw hynny byth yn gwneud rhywbeth yn gwbl ddilys yn ystadegol. Cyflwynais dystiolaeth ystadegol ddilys i'r pwyllgor yn ei gyfarfod diwethaf. Dywedai'r dystiolaeth honno, yn gyffredinol, os diystyrir Llundain, sef rhywbeth a wnaed gan Gymdeithas y Prifathrawon Uwchradd o ran ei gwaith hi, fod gwahaniaeth o ran ariannu o ryw £22 rhwng y cyfartaledd yng Nghymru ac yn Lloegr. Mae fy nghyd-Weinidog, y Gweinidog Cyllid, a minnau eisoes wedi addo edrych ar yr amrywiad hwnnw, gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth



and we need to get underneath the issue.

Leol Cymru a Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru. Mae hynny'n bwysig iawn, oherwydd mae amrywiadau mawr yng Nghymru, ac mae angen inni fynd i wraidd y broblem.

We reject any claims that officials or the Minister misled the committee in terms of any aspect of this work. We, as a Government, are always clear in terms of what can be statistically proven. Sometimes it does not appeal to people to know that what they would like to have statistically proven cannot be in the form in which they would like. A statistician came to the last committee meeting and explained this very clearly. As you were not at that meeting, you can read the verbatim evidence that was given.

Gwrthodwn unrhyw honiadau i swyddogion neu'r Gweinidog gamarwain y pwyllgor ar unrhyw agwedd ar y gwaith hwn. Yr ydym ni, fel Llywodraeth, bob amser yn glir ynghylch yr hyn y gellir ei brofi'n ystadegol. Weithiau nid yw'n bosibl i'r hyn y mae pobl am iddo gael ei brofi'n ystadegol ymddangos ar ffurf sy'n eu bodloni, ac nid yw hynny'n apelio atynt. Daeth ystadegydd i gyfarfod diwethaf y pwyllgor ac egluro hyn yn glir iawn. Gan nad oeddech yn y cyfarfod hwnnw, gallwch ddarllen y dystiolaeth a roddwyd gair am air.

**Karen Sinclair:** Do you agree that the introduction of the new workload agreement has freed up significant portions of time for teachers to concentrate on teaching our children? Would you also welcome the news that, at Dinas Bran comprehensive school, which is in my constituency, posts to manage staff absences are carrying out pastoral roles, and five new administrative support staff are relieving teachers of these time-consuming tasks, allowing them to focus on teaching and raising standards in schools, which is why they are there?

**Karen Sinclair:** A gytunwch fod cyflwyno'r cytundeb llwyth gwaith newydd wedi rhyddhau cryn dipyn o amser i athrawon ganolbwyntio ar addysgu ein plant? A fydddech hefyd yn croesawu'r newyddion, yn ysgol gyfun Dinas Brân, sydd yn fy etholaeth i, fod swyddi i reoli absenoldeb ymhlith staff yn cyflawni dyletswyddau bugeiliol, a bod pum aelod o staff cymorth gweinyddol newydd yn rhyddhau athrawon o'r gorchwylion llafurus hyn, gan ganiatáu iddynt ganolbwyntio ar addysgu a chodi safonau mewn ysgolion, sef y rheswm pam maent yno?

**Jane Davidson:** This demonstrates that schools are doing different things, according to their local circumstances, with the additional funding available. Dinas Bran is doing some very interesting work, where there is a new assistant head of year, who is a learning support assistant, in a part-time post, whose responsibilities include monitoring attendance, contracts, meeting with parents, and pupil behaviour issues. These are very important in terms of ensuring that teachers can get on with the job of teaching. I know that it is working well there, and I am grateful for that imaginative work.

**Jane Davidson:** Dengys hyn fod ysgolion yn gwneud gwahanol bethau, yn unol â'u hamgylchiadau lleol, â'r arian ychwanegol sydd ar gael. Mae Dinas Brân yn gwneud gwaith diddorol iawn, lle mae pennaeth blwyddyn cynorthwyol newydd, sy'n gynorthwy-ydd cymorth dysgu, mewn swydd ran amser. Mae ei chyfrifoldebau hefyd yn cynnwys monitro presenoldeb, contractau, cyfarfod rhieni, a materion yn ymwneud ag ymddygiad disgyblion. Mae'r rhain yn bwysig iawn o ran sicrhau y gall athrawon fwrw ymlaen â'r gwaith o addysgu. Gwn ei fod yn gweithio'n dda yno, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y gwaith llawn dychmyg.

### **Cyllid i Brifysgolion Cymru Funding for Welsh Universities**

**Q10 Brynle Williams:** Does the Minister

**C10 Brynle Williams:** A oes gan y

have any plans to increase funding for Welsh universities? OAQ0232(ELL)

Gweinidog unrhyw gynlluniau i gynyddu'r cyllid a roddir i brifysgolion Cymru? OAQ0232(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** The Higher Education Funding Council for Wales recently announced detailed allocations for universities in 2005-06. We have increased core funding, the funds for reconfiguration and collaboration, and our support for third mission activities above the rate of inflation.

**Jane Davidson:** Mae Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru yn ddiweddar wedi cyhoeddi dyraniadau manwl ar gyfer prifysgolion yn 2005-06. Yr ydym wedi cynyddu'r arian craidd, y cronfeydd ar gyfer ail-gyflunio a chydweithredu, a'n cymorth ar gyfer gweithgareddau trydedd genhadaeth yn fwy na chyfradd chwyddiant.

**Brynle Williams:** You will be aware from my recent correspondence, Minister, of my grave concerns relating to the proposed staffing cuts in the University of Wales, Bangor's library service. Will you give a firm commitment this afternoon to develop plans to ring-fence sections of funding to universities to ensure that staffing levels and key frontline services, such as library services, are protected for the benefit of students, staff and the local community?

**Brynle Williams:** Byddwch yn gwybod o'm gohebiaeth yn ddiweddar, Weinidog, am fy mhryderon dybryd ynghylch y toriadau arfaethedig yn nifer y staff yng ngwasanaeth llyfrgell Prifysgol Cymru, Bangor. A wnewch ymrwymiad cadarn y prynhawn yma i ddatblygu cynlluniau i neilltuo cyllid i brifysgolion i sicrhau y caiff lefelau staffio a gwasanaethau rheng flaen allweddol, fel gwasanaethau llyfrgell, eu diogelu er budd myfyrwyr, staff a'r gymuned leol?

**Jane Davidson:** I can make no such undertaking because funding for universities, where it is not, for example, explicitly linked to the agreed Assembly policy, 'Reaching Higher'—which came out of the committee work supported by all parties in the Assembly—is unhypothecated, and is a matter for individual institutions.

**Jane Davidson:** Ni allaf wneud unrhyw addewid o'r fath oherwydd nid yw'r cyllid ar gyfer prifysgolion, oni bai ei fod, er enghraifft, wedi'i gysylltu'n benodol â pholisi cytûn y Cynulliad, 'Ymgynraedd yn Uwch'—a ddeilliodd o waith y pwyllgor a gefnogwyd gan bob plaid yn y Cynulliad—wedi'i glustnodi. Mater i sefydliadau unigol ydyw.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Teresa Rees, in her initial response, highlighted a £50 million shortfall in funding for higher education in Wales, but made no suggestions as to how this might be addressed. How will you ensure that HE is properly funded?

**Jocelyn Davies:** Yr oedd Teresa Rees, yn ei hymateb cychwynol, yn tynnu sylw at ddiffyg o £50 miliwn yn y cyllid ar gyfer addysg uwch yng Nghymru. Ond ni wnaeth unrhyw awgrym ynghylch sut y gellid mynd i'r afael â hyn. Sut y byddwch yn sicrhau y caiff addysg uwch ei hariannu'n briodol?

**Jane Davidson:** The figures that she used were extrapolated from Universities UK. As far as we are aware, that does not include the £20 million or so that is in Assembly learning grants. We do not have accurate data that explore funding issues in the higher education sector in Wales, compared with elsewhere. We have, however, on many occasions, made a commitment to ensure that, in 2006-07, which is the last year of the Assembly, our institutions are given money to reflect the additional money that will go

**Jane Davidson:** Daeth y ffigurau a ddefnyddiwyd ganddi o Brifysgolion y DU. Hyd y gwyddom, nid yw hynny'n cynnwys yr £20 miliwn neu fwy o grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad. Nid oes gennym ddata cywir sy'n mynd i'r afael â phroblemau cyllido yn y sector addysg uwch yng Nghymru, o'u cymharu â manau eraill. Yr ydym, fodd bynnag, wedi ymrwymo droeon i sicrhau, yn 2006-07, sef blwyddyn olaf y Cynulliad, y rhoddir arian i'n sefydliadau i adlewyrchu'r arian ychwanegol a gaiff ei roi i sefydliadau

into institutions in England. This has been much welcomed by the sector, and we intend to maintain our pole position in terms of offering good, imaginative and large student-support mechanisms.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call William Graham.

**William Graham:** I apologise; I do not have a question.

3.00 p.m.

**The Presiding Officer:** In which case, we will move on.

yn Lloegr. Cafwyd croeso mawr i hyn yn y sector, a bwriadwn gynnal ein sefyllfa o ran cynnig dulliau da, dychmygus a sylweddol i gynorthwyo myfyrwyr.

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf ar William Graham.

**William Graham:** Ymddiheuraf; nid oes gennyf gwestiwn.

**Y Llywydd:** Os felly, symudwn ymlaen.

### Costau Gofal Plant Childcare Costs

**Q11 Lorraine Barrett:** What plans does the Assembly have to help with childcare costs for those in full-time education? OAQ0266(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** The Assembly makes learning grants available to students and £12 million a year in financial contingency funds available to further and higher education institutions to provide discretionary support to students. Students who need help with childcare costs are one of the priority categories for support from those financial contingency funds.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Thank you for that positive response, Minister. Do you agree that we need to do all that we can to support and encourage young mothers to stay on in full-time education so that they and their children have the best opportunities for the future and that, in some ways, because of the age of the mothers, this childcare provision should be more of a priority than other childcare provision?

**Jane Davidson:** Local authorities have an obligation to ensure that young people under the age of 16 can access full-time education. Jane Hutt and I have previously done substantial work on looking at supporting young girls who have become pregnant as teenagers. However, it is also important to ensure that additional childcare funds are made available to those who want to stay on in post-16 education. That issue was also

**C11 Lorraine Barrett:** Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Cynulliad i gyfrannu at gostau gofal plant y bobl hynny sy'n derbyn addysg lawn amser? OAQ0266(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'r Cynulliad yn sicrhau bod grantiau dysgu ar gael i fyfyrwyr a bod £12 miliwn y flwyddyn ar gael mewn cronfeydd wrth gefn i sefydliadau addysg bellach ac addysg uwch i ddarparu cymorth dewisol i fyfyrwyr. Mae myfyrwyr sydd ag angen cymorth arnynt gyda chostau gofal plant yn un o'r categorïau blaenoriaeth i gael cymorth o'r cronfeydd hynny wrth gefn.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Diolch am eich ymateb cadarnhaol, Weinidog. A gytunwch fod angen inni wneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i gefnogi ac i annog mamau ifanc i aros mewn addysg lawn amser, er mwyn iddynt hwy a'u plant gael y cyfleoedd gorau ar gyfer y dyfodol, ac oherwydd oedran y mamau y dylai'r ddarpariaeth hon ar gyfer gofal plant, mewn rhai ffyrdd, fod yn fwy o flaenoriaeth na darpariaeth arall ar gyfer gofal plant?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae cyfrifoldeb ar awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau y gall pobl ifanc o dan 16 oed gael mynediad i addysg lawn amser. Mae Jane Hutt a minnau eisoes wedi gwneud gwaith sylweddol ar geisio rhoi cymorth i ferched ifanc sydd wedi beichiogi yn eu harddegau. Fodd bynnag, mae hefyd yn bwysig sicrhau bod cronfeydd gofal plant ychwanegol ar gael i'r rhai sy'n dymuno aros mewn addysg ar ôl 16 oed. Aethpwyd

addressed in the childcare action plan, whose group was chaired by Dr Brian Gibbons, and we will respond with the Assembly's plan later this term.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Clybiau Plant Cymru Kid's Clubs helps to set up, develop and support out-of-school childcare clubs, enabling parents to return to work, education or training. You will be aware that the Welsh Assembly Government intends to reduce support levels for the organisation after 2005-06. In the current climate, when childcare is at the forefront of the political agenda, would you explain how you came to this decision?

**Jane Davidson:** If you remember from discussion that we have had previously, the decision was taken that funding for Clybiau Plant Cymru Kid's Clubs, which was initially a one-off contract, should go into the same range of funding as that of all the other child and family organisations. That seems to me to be the right decision, because it is not the only organisation providing childcare; there are many organisations providing childcare in Wales. We were recently successful in a big European Union bid to extend, for example, the Genesis project throughout Wales. We need to look at childcare across the board, in terms of the economic, social and educational imperatives, and, therefore, we need to look at all parts of the organisation as one piece, and that is what has been done by bringing it into the normal grant-funding mechanism.

i'r afael â'r mater hwnnw hefyd yn y cynllun gweithredu gofal plant. Cadeiriwyd y grŵp gan Dr Brian Gibbons, a byddwn yn ymateb gyda chynllun y Cynulliad yn ddiweddarach yn y tymor hwn.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Mae Clybiau Plant Cymru Kid's Clubs yn helpu gosod, datblygu a chefnogi clybiau gofal plant y tu allan i oriau ysgol, gan alluogi rhieni i ddychwelyd i waith, addysg neu hyfforddiant. Gwyddoch fod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn bwriadu gostwng lefelau cymorth ar gyfer y sefydliad ar ôl 2005-06. Yn yr hinsawdd bresennol, a gofal plant yn flaenllaw yn yr agenda wleidyddol, a fyddech cystal ag esbonio sut y daethoch i'r penderfyniad hwn?

**Jane Davidson:** Os cofiwch drafodaeth a gawsom yn flaenorol, penderfynwyd y dylai arian ar gyfer Clybiau Plant Cymru Kid's Clubs, a oedd yn gontract untro yn wreiddiol, fod yn rhan o'r un cyllid â'r holl sefydliadau eraill i blant a theuluoedd. Credaf fod hynny'n benderfyniad cywir, oherwydd nid hwn yw'r unig sefydliad sy'n darparu gofal plant; mae nifer o sefydliadau'n darparu gofal plant yng Nghymru. Buom yn llwyddiannus yn ddiweddar gyda chynnig mawr yn gysylltiedig â'r Undeb Ewropeaidd i ymestyn, er enghraifft, y prosiect Genesis ledled Cymru. Mae angen inni edrych ar ofal plant yn gyffredinol, o ran yr hanfodion economaidd, cymdeithasol ac addysgol, ac felly mae angen inni edrych ar bob rhan o'r sefydliad yn ei gyfanrwydd. Dyna a wnaed drwy ei gynnwys yn y mecanwaith arian grant arferol.

### Sgiliau Llythrennedd a Rhifedd Literacy and Numeracy Skills

**Q12 Lisa Francis:** Will the Minister make a statement on the literacy and numeracy skills of school leavers in Wales? OAQ0267(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Standards of literacy and numeracy continue to rise. The percentage of 16-year-olds leaving school without a recognised qualification fell from 3.7 per cent in 1999 to 2.8 per cent in 2004. Nevertheless, we continue to invest in basic skills, with a

**C12 Lisa Francis:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar sgiliau llythrennedd a rhifedd pobl ifanc sy'n gadael ysgol yng Nghymru? OAQ0267(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Mae safonau llythrennedd a rhifedd yn parhau i godi. Gostyngodd canran y bobl ifanc 16 oed sy'n gadael yr ysgol heb gymhwyster cydnabyddedig o 3.7 y cant yn 1999 i 2.8 y cant yn 2004. Serch hyn, yr ydym yn parhau i fuddsoddi mewn sgiliau

further £40 million provided to support our strategy to improve literacy and numeracy.

**Lisa Francis:** I understand that it is your administration's aim to slash the number of people who leave school without qualifications, which is currently 1,000 people a year, by 2010. What is the specific target figure that you are aiming for here? How much of a drop from 1,000 a year do you anticipate that you will achieve?

**Jane Davidson:** In terms of the second basic skills strategy, we are looking for a substantial drop and we are getting a small drop year on year at the moment. We are also looking at providing new opportunities for 14 to 19-year-olds, which will influence that agenda. I am sure that you will be pleased that the chief inspector's most recent report, which we will discuss in a moment, confirms that the greatest improvements in secondary and special schools have been in numeracy and literacy.

sylfaenol, gan ddarparu £40 miliwn arall i gefnogi ein strategaeth i wella llythrennedd a rhifedd.

**Lisa Francis:** Deallaf mai nod eich gweinyddiaeth yw gostwng yn sylweddol nifer y bobl sy'n gadael yr ysgol heb gymwysterau, sef 1,000 y flwyddyn ar hyn o bryd, erbyn 2010. Beth yw'r ffigur targed penodol yr ydych yn anelu ato yma? Faint o ostyngiad o'r ffigur 1,000 y flwyddyn yr ydych yn rhagweld y byddwch yn ei gyflawni?

**Jane Davidson:** O ran yr ail strategaeth sgiliau sylfaenol, yr ydym yn gobeithio sicrhau gostyngiad sylweddol, ac ar hyn o bryd yr ydym yn gweld gostyngiad bach bob blwyddyn. Yr ydym hefyd yn gobeithio darparu cyfleoedd newydd i bobl 14 i 19 oed, a fydd yn dylanwadu ar yr agenda honno. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn falch fod adroddiad diweddaraf y prif arolygydd - a byddwn yn ei drafod maes o law - yn cadarnhau mai ym meysydd rhifedd a llythrennedd y gwelwyd y gwelliannau mwyaf mewn ysgolion uwchradd ac ysgolion arbennig.

### **Darparu Addysg Dinasyddiaeth a Chyllid Personol The Provision of Citizenship and Personal Finance Education**

**Q13 Gwenda Thomas:** Will the Minister make a statement on the provision of citizenship and personal finance education in schools in Wales? OAQ0244(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** The provision of citizenship and personal finance education in schools in Wales is delivered through the personal and social education framework. The Welsh Assembly Government made PSE a statutory part of the basic curriculum from September 2003 to reflect its importance.

**Gwenda Thomas:** I agree that consideration should be given to making citizenship and personal finance education a mandatory component of the national curriculum because—and I am sure you agree—young people can then leave school at the age of 16 with the confidence, skills and knowledge that they need in political, social, ethical and financial matters in order to participate fully

**C13 Gwenda Thomas:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ddarparu addysg dinasyddiaeth a chyllid personol mewn ysgolion yng Nghymru? OAQ0244(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Caiff y gwaith o ddarparu addysg dinasyddiaeth a chyllid personol mewn ysgolion ei gyflawni drwy'r fframwaith addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol. Gwnaeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ABCh yn rhan statudol o'r cwricwlwm sylfaenol o fis Medi 2003 ymlaen i adlewyrchu pwysigrwydd y pwnc.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Cytunaf y dylid rhoi ystyriaeth i wneud addysg dinasyddiaeth a chyllid personol yn elfen orfodol o'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol oherwydd, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch y gall pobl ifanc wedyn adael yr ysgol yn 16 oed gyda'r hyder, y sgiliau a'r wybodaeth sydd eu hangen arnynt mewn materion gwleidyddol, cymdeithasol, moesegol ac ariannol er mwyn

in society.

**Jane Davidson:** There are 10 aspects of delivery for PSE, and, under the vocational aspect, personal and financial education is encompassed. It helps pupils to develop an understanding of the role and importance of money, because they need help to understand their role and responsibilities as consumers and to cultivate financial literacy. We have been working with other partners recently in terms of looking at this agenda.

cyfranogi'n llawn mewn cymdeithas.

**Jane Davidson:** Mae yna 10 agwedd ar gyflawni ABCh, ac mae'r agwedd alwedigaethol yn cwmpasu addysg bersonol ac ariannol. Mae'n helpu disgyblion i ddatblygu dealltwriaeth o rôl a phwysigrwydd arian, oherwydd mae angen cymorth arnynt i ddeall eu rôl a'u cyfrifoldebau fel defnyddwyr, ac i feithrin llythrennedd ariannol. Yr ydym wedi bod yn gweithio gyda phartneriaid eraill yn ddiweddar i edrych ar yr agenda hon.

### **Cyflwyno'r Cytundeb Baich Gwaith Athrawon The Introduction of the Teachers' Workload Agreement**

**C14 David Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y cynnydd a wnaed o ran cyflwyno cytundeb baich gwaith athrawon? OAQ0227(ELL)

**Q14 David Lloyd:** Will the Minister make a statement on progress on the introduction of the teachers' workload agreement? OAQ0227(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Dylai'r cam olaf o newidiadau cytundebol sy'n deillio o'r cytundeb baich gwaith athrawon fod ar waith ym mhob ysgol yng Nghymru erbyn mis Medi 2005. Yr ydym yn gweithio gydag awdurodau addysg lleol i sicrhau bod gan ysgolion y cymorth sydd ei angen arnynt er mwyn gallu cyflawni hyn.

**Jane Davidson:** The final phase of contractual changes resulting from the teachers' workload agreement should be in place in all schools in Wales by September 2005. We are working with local education authorities to ensure that schools have the support they need to achieve this.

**David Lloyd:** Given that the funding for the teachers' workload agreement, as you said earlier, is now permanent, what assessment has been made of the additional costs to schools to cover examination invigilation?

**David Lloyd:** O ystyried bod yr arian ar gyfer y cytundeb llwyth gwaith athrawon, fel yr oeddech yn sôn yn gynharach, bellach yn barhaol, pa asesiad a wnaed o'r costau ychwanegol i ysgolion i dalu am oruchwylio arholiadau?

**Jane Davidson:** That assessment was included in the amount of money that was allocated by the local government division to the teachers' workload agreement.

**Jane Davidson:** Cynhwyswyd yr asesiad hwnnw yn y swm o arian a ddyrannwyd gan yr is-adran llywodraeth leol i'r cytundeb llwyth gwaith athrawon.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 15, OAQ0256(ELL) has been transferred for written answer. You have come to the end of questions, Minister.

**Y Llywydd:** Trosglwyddwyd Cwestiwn 15, OAQ0256(ELL) i gael ateb ysgrifenedig. Yr ydych wedi dod i ddiwedd y cwestiynau, Weinidog.

### **Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Tir Mynydd (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2005 Approval of the Tir Mynydd (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2005**

**Y Llywydd:** O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

**The Presiding Officer:** Under Standing Order No. 24.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25:*

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 24.25:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 26 Ebrill 2005 ar Reoliadau Tir Mynydd (Cymru) (Diwygio) drafft 2005; ac*

*1. consider the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 26 April 2005 on the draft Tir Mynydd (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2005; and*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Tir Mynydd (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2005 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag*

*2. approve that the Tir Mynydd (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2005 are made in accordance with:*

*a) y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Ebrill 2005.*

*. a) the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 13 April 2005.*

*b) arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Ebrill 2005. (NDM2417)*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 13 April 2005. (NDM2417)*

*Cynnig (NDM2417): O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM2417): For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary

Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Peter  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Mynediad i Gefn Gwlad (Dull Mynediad, Apelau etc)  
 (Cymru) 2005**  
**Approval of the Countryside Access (Means of Access, Appeals Etc) (Wales)  
 Regulations 2005**

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 i NDM2416 yn enw David Melding.

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 to NDM2416 in the name of David Melding.

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales consider the principle of the Countryside Access (Means of Access, Appeals etc.) (Wales) Regulations 2005 a copy of which was laid in Table Office on 13 April 2005. (NDM2416)*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Mynediad i Gefn Gwlad (Dull Mynediad, Apelau etc) (Cymru) 2005 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Ebrill 2005. (NDM2416)*

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. consider the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 26 April 2005 in relation to the draft Countryside Access (Means of Access, Appeals etc.) (Wales) Regulations 2005; and*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 26 Ebrill 2005 mewn perthynas â'r drafft o Reoliadau Mynediad i Gefn Gwlad (Dull Mynediad, Apelau etc) (Cymru) 2005 ac*

*2. approve that the Countryside Access (Means of Access, Appeals etc.) (Wales) Regulations 2005 is made in accordance with:*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Mynediad i Gefn Gwlad (Dull Mynediad, Apelau etc) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 13 April 2005; and*

*a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Ebrill 2005; a*



*b) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 26 April 2005; and*

*c) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 13 April 2005. (NDM2415)*

With regard to the amendment, an extensive publicity campaign is already underway to promote the new right of access, but also to ensure that people are aware of their responsibilities when they visit the countryside. The new countryside code, for example, was launched last summer. The Ordnance Survey explorer maps will clearly show the areas of the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000 access land, as will the Countryside Council for Wales's website. The Assembly Government is also working closely with its partners to ensure that key messages, such as finding out where those areas of land where access is allowed under the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000 are situated in Wales, form part of the publicity campaign. With regard to the amendment, therefore, the Government's response is that it is superfluous because much of this work is already being done.

**Brynle Williams:** I propose amendment 1 in the name of David Melding: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to instigate a high profile campaign in conjunction with the media, to advise the general public that not all areas of agricultural land come under Countryside and Rights of Way Act.*

I declare an interest as a farmer and landowner. I am surprised that I am the only Member proposing an amendment to this motion this afternoon. This is an important issue, which needs further debate. I have discussed this issue in recent months, and it is crucial that resources are given to local authorities to deal with this issue. If we vote to implement Acts here, then we, as an Assembly body, need to ensure that those Acts can be adhered to. It is imperative that landowners and walkers alike are treated in a sensible manner in relation to this Act. We

*b) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 26 Ebrill 2005; a*

*c) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Ebrill 2005. (NDM2415)*

O ran y gwelliant, mae ymgyrch gyhoeddusrwydd fawr eisoes yn mynd rhagddi i hyrwyddo hawl mynediad newydd, ond hefyd i sicrhau bod pobl yn ymwybodol o'u cyfrifoldebau pan fyddant yn ymweld â chefn gwlad. Lansiodd y cod cefn gwlad newydd, er enghraifft, yr haf diwethaf. Bydd mapiau explorer Arolwg Ordnans yn dangos yr ardaloedd o dir mynediad Deddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000 yn glir, felly hefyd wefan Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru hefyd yn gweithio'n agos gyda'i phartneriaid i sicrhau bod negeseuon allweddol, megis canfod lleoliad yr ardaloedd o dir hynny, y caniateir mynediad iddynt o dan Ddeddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000, yng Nghymru, yn rhan o'r ymgyrch gyhoeddusrwydd. O ran y gwelliant, felly, ymateb y Llywodraeth yw nad oes ei angen oherwydd bod llawer o'r gwaith hwn eisoes yn mynd rhagddo.

**Brynle Williams:** Cynigiau welliant 1 yn enw David Melding: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ysgogi ymgyrch proffil uchel ar y cyd â'r cyfryngau, i hysbysu'r cyhoedd nad yw pob ardal o dir amaethyddol yn dod o dan y Ddeddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy.*

Datganaf fuddiant fel ffermwr a thirfeddiannwr. Synnaf mai fi yw'r unig Aelod sy'n cynnig gwelliant i'r cynnig hwn y prynhawn yma. Mae hwn yn fater pwysig ac mae angen ei drafod ymhellach. Yr wyf wedi trafod y mater hwn yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf, ac mae'n hollbwysig rhoi adnoddau i awdurdodau lleol i fynd i'r afael ag ef. Os pleidleisiwn i roi Deddfau ar waith yma, mae angen inni, fel corff, sicrhau y gellir cadw at y Deddfau hynny. Mae'n hollbwysig sicrhau y caiff tîrfeddiannwyr a cherddwyr, fel ei gilydd, eu trin mewn modd

need to ensure that adequate, ring-fenced funding is given directly to local authorities so that they can carry out their duties in relation to this. Without the political will and the funding arrangements in place, the Act will not be as successful as it could be. I call again for a high-profile campaign, which should be run in co-operation with the media. I understand what the Minister is saying, but I am afraid that the message is not getting through. In order to get the message out as widely as possible, detailed talks must be entered into with the press and TV outlets. The Assembly regularly asserts that it has prevented unnecessary expenditure from the public purse. This is a perfect opportunity to work with the media and get the message across.

3.10 p.m.

Local highways authorities and national park authorities must be given support by the Assembly in order for them to share with residents and visitors key information on what they are able to do in relation to this Act. Work has been done in this area, as the Minister mentioned, but more needs to be done, and fast, as the clock is ticking. As a farmer, I welcome the opportunity to attract additional visitors to the countryside. Agricultural land can be used as a vehicle to move towards a better understanding of where food originates. By welcoming visitors, we will be bringing badly needed income into our localities, which in turn will boost tourism.

The countryside of Wales is breathtaking and it is important that as many people as possible enjoy it. However, enforceable rules must be in place to protect farmers' and landowners' property from possible damage and trespassers. The amount of work and the cost implications of the Act for landowners are potentially large so the issue must be dealt with sympathetically to make access safe and to ensure that landowners are not unduly financially disadvantaged. If landowners fail to comply with the legislation, local authorities should serve notices instructing work to be carried out.

synhwyrol mewn cysylltiad â'r Ddeddf hon. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod arian digonol wedi'i neilltuo yn cael ei roi'n uniongyrchol i awdurdodau lleol er mwyn iddynt allu cyflawni eu dyletswyddau yn hyn o beth. Heb yr ewyllys wleidyddol a'r trefniadau ariannu, ni fydd y Ddeddf mor llwyddiannus ag y gallai fod. Galwaf eto am ymgyrch proffil uchel, y gellid ei chynnal mewn cydweithrediad â'r cyfryngau. Deallaf yr hyn a ddywed y Gweinidog, ond ofnaf nad yw'r neges yn cyrraedd ei nod. Er mwyn cyfleu'r neges mor eang â phosibl, rhaid cael trafodaethau manwl â'r wasg a'r sianeli teledu. Mae'r Cynulliad yn haeru'n rheolaidd ei fod wedi atal gwario arian cyhoeddus yn ddiangen. Mae hwn yn gyfle delfrydol i weithio gyda'r cyfryngau a chyfleu'r neges.

Rhaid i'r Cynulliad roi cymorth i awdurdodau priffyrdd lleol ac awdurdodau parciau cenedlaethol er mwyn iddynt rannu gwybodaeth allweddol â thrigolion ac ymwelwyr am yr hyn y gallant ei wneud mewn perthynas â'r Ddeddf hon. Mae gwaith wedi ei wneud yn y maes hwn, fel y soniodd y Gweinidog, ond mae angen gwneud mwy, a hynny'n gyflym, gan fod yr amser yn brin. Fel ffermwr, croesawaf y cyfle i ddenu rhagor o ymwelwyr i gefn gwlad. Gellir defnyddio tir amaethyddol fel cyfrwng i symud tuag at well dealltwriaeth o'r lle y mae bwyd yn tarddu ohono. Drwy groesawu ymwelwyr, byddwn yn denu incwm y mae ei angen yn ddifrifawr i mewn i'n hardaloedd, a hynny yn ei dro yn hybu twristiaeth.

Mae cefn gwlad Cymru yn eithriadol o brydferth ac mae'n bwysig bod cynifer o bobl â phosibl yn ei fwynhau. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i reolau y gellir eu gorfodi fod ar waith i ddiogelu eiddo ffermwyr a thirfeddianwyr rhag difrod a thresmaswyr posibl. Galla'r gwaith a goblygiadau'r Ddeddf o ran cost i dirfeddianwyr fod yn fawr, felly, rhaid ymdrin â'r mater yn ystyriol i sicrhau mynediad diogel ac i sicrhau na fydd tirfeddianwyr o dan ormod o anfantais yn ariannol. Os bydd tirfeddianwyr yn methu â chydymffurfio â'r ddeddfwriaeth, dylai awdurdodau lleol gyflwyno rhybuddion yn gorchymyn gwneud gwaith.

I hope that the Government will support my amendment, which I proposed in good faith. It does not call on the Government to change policy. It merely asks it to work in conjunction with the media to ensure that as many people as possible are fully aware of the implications of the Act.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I will refer specifically to the legislation before us, which is to do with access and appeals. Plaid Cymru will support the regulations, and we are grateful to the Government for having taken note of some of the representations that were made during the consultation. It is estimated that the cost of appeals to the Planning Inspectorate and individuals will be extremely low, and therefore there is no additional requirement for funding for the Planning Inspectorate. However, will the Minister undertake to keep the funding levels under review and to see whether considerable costs are incurred by landowners or the Planning Inspectorate, so that, if necessary, additional funding can be considered?

Finally, with regard to the Conservative amendment—on which Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales, will abstain—we accept that the Government is taking steps to ensure that people know what their rights are with regard to access, although we would like to see more done. However, we cannot support the Conservative amendment because it speaks about making people aware of land to which they do not have access, rather than a more general and positive campaign that would ensure that people knew which land they could access as well as making clear which land was not open for access. We will not support the Conservative amendment because its wording is so negative. We hope that the Minister will continue to make efforts to ensure that the situation is absolutely clear for the benefit of those who wish to access the countryside and of farmers and landowners.

**Mick Bates:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome the appeals structure, which gives the right to a farmer or landowner to appeal against access under section 38.

Gobeithio y bydd y Llywodraeth yn cefnogi fy ngwelliant, a gynigiwyd gennyf yn ddidwyll. Nid yw'n gofyn i'r Llywodraeth newid ei pholisi. Y cyfan a wna yw gofyn iddi weithio ar y cyd â'r cyfryngau i sicrhau bod cynifer o bobl â phosibl yn hollol ymwybodol o oblygiadau'r Ddeddf.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Cyfeiriai yn benodol at y ddeddfwriaeth ger ein bron, sy'n ymwneud â mynediad ac apeliadau. Bydd Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau, ac yr ydym yn ddiolchgar i'r Llywodraeth am roi sylw i rai o'r sylwadau a wnaed yn ystod yr ymgynghoriad. Amcangyfrifir y bydd cost apeliadau i'r Arolygiaeth Gynllunio ac unigolion yn isel iawn, ac felly nid oes gofyniad ychwanegol am arian ar gyfer yr Arolygiaeth Gynllunio. Fodd bynnag, a wnaiff y Gweinidog addewid i adolygu'r lefelau cyllido yn barhaus, a gweld a fydd tirlfeddianwyr neu'r Arolygiaeth Gynllunio yn tynnu costau sylweddol, er mwyn gallu ystyried rhoi arian ychwanegol, os bydd angen?

Yn olaf, o ran gwelliant y Ceidwadwyr—a bydd Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales, yn ymatal ei phleidlais arno—derbyniwn fod y Llywodraeth yn cymryd camau i sicrhau bod pobl yn ymwybodol o'u hawliau o ran mynediad, er y byddem yn dymuno gweld mwy yn cael ei wneud. Fodd bynnag, ni allwn gefnogi gwelliant y Ceidwadwyr oherwydd ei fod yn sôn am wneud pobl yn fwy ymwybodol o dir nad oes ganddynt hawl i fynd arno, yn hytrach nag ymgyrch fwy cyffredinol a chadarnhaol, a fyddai'n sicrhau bod pobl yn gwybod pa dir y gallent fynd arno yn ogystal ag egluro pa dir nad oes ganddynt hawl i fynd arno. Ni fyddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant y Ceidwadwyr oherwydd bod y ffordd y caiff ei eirio mor negyddol. Gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn parhau i ymdrechu i sicrhau bod y sefyllfa'n gwbl glir er lles y rhai sy'n dymuno cael mynediad i gefn gwlad, yn ogystal ag er lles ffermwyr a thirfeddianwyr.

**Mick Bates:** Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn croesawu'r strwythur apelio, sy'n rhoi'r hawl i ffermwr neu dirfeddiannwr apelio yn erbyn mynediad o dan adran 38.

We also support the Conservative amendment. I noticed that many Members on the Labour benches were not paying attention at all during Brynle's fine speech. I am most certain that they would pay attention if the legislation affected access to their back gardens or front yards. The local access fora have been successful at bringing parties together on this. Amendment 1, by pointing out the need for good communications, can only enhance the appeals process and how the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000 is implemented.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I assure you, Mick, that I hang onto every word that Brynle Williams says.

**Mick Bates:** I am sure that you do, as I do. However, I noticed that many Members were not taking much notice, unlike you, Lorraine.

The Minister raised two issues. First, on the ordinance survey maps, I will clarify the position on forestry commission land. The Minister stated that such land would be designated as open access land. How does he propose to ensure that, when industrial work is undertaken on that land, such as felling, planting and so on, the exclusion zones are clearly identified? Furthermore, would he repeat the procedures seen in many national parks, such as employing extra wardens to protect ground-nesting birds by ensuring that the public know that, at certain times of the year, they are not to walk across that land?

Finally, on costs, would he undertake to complete a robust monitoring of the £2.4 million that he has given local authorities to ensure that it is spent effectively on the process of appeal and advertising?

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and the Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** Costs will be kept under review, which makes perfect sense. It is a matter for the Forestry Commission to decide how to deal with the situation when felling is in progress. It will be guided by the health and safety requirements placed upon it by law.

Yr ydym hefyd yn cefnogi gwelliant y Ceidwadwyr. Sylwais fod nifer o Aelodau ar y meinciau Llafur yn methu talu sylw o gwbl yn ystod araith wych Brynle. Yr wyf yn sicr y byddent yn talu sylw pe byddai'r ddeddfwriaeth yn effeithio ar fynediad i'w gerddi cefn neu eu hiardiau ffrynt hwy. Mae'r ffora mynediad lleol wedi bod yn llwyddiannus yn dwyn partiön ynghyd ar hyn. Ni all gwelliant 1, drwy nodi'r angen am gyfathrebu da, ond gwella'r broses apelïadau a sut y caiff Deddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000 ei rhoi ar waith.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Hoffwn eich sicrhau, Mick, fy mod yn dal ar bob gair a ddywed Brynle Williams.

**Mick Bates:** Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod, fel finnau. Fodd bynnag, sylwais fod nifer o Aelodau heb fod yn talu fawr ddim sylw, yn wahanol i chi, Lorraine.

Cododd y Gweinidog ddau fater. Yn gyntaf, o ran mapiau arolwg ordnans, fe egluraf y sefyllfa o ran tir y comisiwn coedwigaeth. Dywedodd y Gweinidog y byddai tir felly yn cael ei ddynodi'n dir mynediad agored. Sut y mae'n bwriadu sicrhau, pan wneir gwaith diwydiannol ar y tir hwnnw, megis torri neu blannu coed, ac yn y blaen, y nodir yn glir yr ardaloedd lle mae gwaharddiad? At hynny, a fyddai'n ailadrodd y gweithdrefnau a welir mewn nifer o barciau cenedlaethol, megis cyflogi wardeiniaid ychwanegol i ddiogelu adar sy'n nythu ar y ddaear, drwy sicrhau bod y cyhoedd yn gwybod, ar adegau penodol o'r flwyddyn, na chânt gerdded ar draws y tir hwnnw?

Yn olaf, o ran costau, a fyddai'n addo cwblhau proses fonitro gadarn o'r £2.4 miliwn y mae wedi ei roi i awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau y caiff ei wario'n effeithiol ar y broses apelïo a hysbysebu?

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Caiff costau eu hadolygu'n gyson, sy'n gwneud synnwyr perffaith. Y Comisiwn Coedwigaeth fydd yn penderfynu sut i ddelio â'r sefyllfa pan fydd coed yn cael eu torri. Caiff y comisiwn ei arwain gan y gofynion iechyd a diogelwch a osodir arno o dan y

However, it is up to the commission to ensure that the public is aware of what land has been designated for such work and has been closed.

gyfraith. Fodd bynnag, penderfyniad y comisiwn yw sicrhau bod y cyhoedd yn gwybod pa dir sydd wedi ei ddynodi ar gyfer gwaith o'r fath ac wedi ei gau.

On Mick's comment about back gardens, I would not particularly like to have people walking through my back garden, but, on the other hand, I do not get paid to garden.

O ran sylw Mick am erddi cefn, ni fyddwn yn hoffi cael pobl yn cerdded drwy fy ngardd gefn i, ond, ar y llaw arall, ni chaf fy nhalu am arddio.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 11, Ymatal 7, Yn erbyn 29.*

*Amendment 1: For 11, Abstain 7, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Melding, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM2416): O blaid 41, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 7.*

*Motion (NDM2416): For 41, Abstain 0, Against 7.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2415): O blaid 40, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 7.  
Motion (NDM2415): For 40, Abstain 0, Against 7.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Melding, David  
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Melding, David  
Williams, Brynle

Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

### **Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn yr Awdurdod Ydau Cartref (Cyfradd Ardollau) 2005 Approval of the Home-Grown Cereals Authority (Rate of Levy) Order 2005**

**Y Llywydd:** Ymddiheuraf i Aelodau am beidio â chynnwys yr eitem hon cyn yr eitem ddiwethaf.

**The Presiding Officer:** I apologise to Members for not having included this item before that last item.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Orders Nos. 24.25, 25.13 & 25.14:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reolau Sefydlog Rhifau 24.25, 25.13 a 25.14:*

*1. approves the draft Home Grown Cereals Authority (Rate of Levy) Order 2005, a copy of which was laid in Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 26 April 2005; and*

*1. yn cymeradwyo Gorchymyn yr Awdurdod Ydau Cartref (Cyfradd Ardollau) 2005 y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 26 Ebrill 2005; a*

*2. notes the explanatory memorandum for this Order laid in Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 26 April 2005. (NDM2421)*

*2. yn nodi'r memorandwm esboniadol ar gyfer y Gorchymyn hwn a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 26 Ebrill 2005. (NDM2421)*

*Cynnig (NDM2421): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM2421): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Pwynt o Drefn  
Point of Order**

**David Melding:** Thank you for the opportunity to raise this point of order. Those of us who were listening to proceedings realised that item 7 had inadvertently been passed over. It is clear that the Minister

**David Melding:** Diolch ichi am y cyfle i godi'r pwynt o drefn hwn. Yr oedd y rhai ohonom a oedd yn gwrando ar y trafodion yn sylweddoli bod eitem 7 wedi ei hanwybyddu'n anfwriadol. Mae'n glir bod y



introduced item 8, but not all Members were paying as much attention as perhaps they should have. During the speech made by my colleague, Brynle Williams, I heard several Members on the other side of the Chamber laugh at him for proposing his amendment on the cereals regulations, which you asked him to do. I ask Members to show proper courtesy. If Members think that a mistake has been made, they must be on firm ground before they create that kind of hubbub, and ridicule a Member who is doing his public duty in the Chamber.

**The Presiding Officer:** All blame should be attributable to the Chair.

3.20 p.m.

### **Approval of the Regulatory Reform (Fire Safety) Order 2005 Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Diwygio Rheoleiddio (Diogelwch Tân) 2005**

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration Committee (Edwina Hart):** I propose that

*The National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 26, agrees that the Secretary of State makes The Regulatory Reform (Fire Safety) Order 2005, which was laid in Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 26 April 2005. (NDM2420)*

Members will recall that this Order was due to come before the Assembly in early March. However, delays in the parliamentary scrutiny meant that the process could not be completed before we were due to consider it. This was resolved before the Prime Minister called a general election, and the Regulatory Reform (Fire Safety) Order 2005, which has cross-party support in Parliament, will be voted on by both Houses following the election, prior to becoming law.

The main thrust of our discussions took place under the framework discussions on 16 March. There are currently over 100 pieces of legislation which place fire safety

Gweinidog wedi cyflwyno eitem 8, ond nid oedd yr holl Aelodau yn rhoi cymaint o sylw ag a ddylent, efallai. Yn ystod yr araith a draddodwyd gan fy nghyd-Aelod, Brynle Williams, clywais lawer Aelod ar ochr arall y Siambr yn chwerrthin am ei ben am gynnig ei welliant yn y rheoliadau grawnfwydydd, fel yr oeddech wedi gofyn iddo wneud. Gofynnaf i Aelodau ddangos cwrteisi priodol. Os cred Aelodau fod camgymeriad wedi ei wneud, rhaid fod ganddynt reswm cadarn cyn creu'r math hwnnw o dwrw, a gwneud hwyl am ben Aelod sy'n gwneud ei ddyletswydd gyhoeddus yn y Siambr.

**Y Llywydd:** Dylai'r bai i gyd fod ar y Cadeirydd.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** Cynigiad fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 26, yn cytuno bod yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yn gwneud Gorchymyn Diwygio Rheoleiddio (Diogelwch Tân) 2005, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 26 Ebrill 2005. (NDM2420)*

Bydd Aelodau'n cofio bod disgwyl i'r Gorchymyn hwn ddod gerbron y Cynulliad ddechrau Mawrth. Fodd bynnag, oherwydd oedi yn y broses graffu seneddol, ni ellid cwblhau'r broses cyn bod disgwyl inni ei ystyried. Cafodd hyn ei benderfynu cyn i Brif Weinidog y DU alw etholiad cyffredinol, a bydd Tŷ'r Cyffredin a Thŷ'r Arglwyddi yn pleidleisio ar Orchymyn Diwygio Rheoleiddio (Diogelwch Tân) 2005, sy'n cael cefnogaeth ar draws y pleidiau yn y Senedd, yn dilyn yr etholiad, cyn dod yn gyfraith.

Ymdriniwyd â phrif fyrdwn ein trafodaethau o dan y trafodaethau fframwaith ar 16 Mawrth. Ar hyn o bryd mae mwy na 100 o ddarnau o ddeddfwriaeth sy'n gosod

requirements on owners and occupiers of premises. These legislative overlaps cause confusion to many businesses and, therefore, the Regulatory Reform (Fire Safety) Order 2005 presents an opportunity to reduce that confusion by bringing together as many fire safety laws as possible into a single piece of legislation.

On the detail of the Regulatory Reform (Fire Safety) Order 2005, it will place a duty on businesses to take responsibility for their premises by undertaking risk assessments, and it will place a duty on fire and rescue authorities to enforce its provisions by inspection and appropriate action where shortcomings are found. Fire certificates issued under the Fire Precautions Act 1971 will cease to have any effect, and will no longer be required to be issued by a fire authority.

The flexibility of the new regime will allow for fire safety solutions to be tailored to the circumstances of each business. It enables us to reduce red tape and costs, particularly for small and medium-sized businesses. It reduces the cost of fire and the number of deaths, injuries and damage caused. I ask Members to support the Order.

**Mark Isherwood:** This Order reforms the law relating to fire safety in non-domestic premises, as we have heard. In the main, this reform specifies the requirement to ensure the safety of employees and visitors to premises, including fire fighters, to take such fire precautions as may reasonably be required to ensure that premises are safe, and a duty to carry out a risk assessment, together with identifying the requirement for the safe storage and use of hazardous substances. It defines a 'responsible person', and their duties in relation to fire safety in the premises, together with inspection programmes required to be undertaken by local authorities. We welcome these measures, particularly the inclusion of individual schedules to specify requirements for young persons and the awareness training that they need.

gofynion diogelwch tân ar berchnogion a deiliaid safleoedd. Mae'r achosion deddfwriaethol hyn o orgyffwrdd yn creu dryswch i nifer o fusnesau, ac felly mae Gorchymyn Diwygio Rheoleiddio (Diogelwch Tân) 2005 yn gyfle i leihau'r dryswch hwnnw, drwy ddwyn ynghyd gynifer o gyfreithiau diogelwch tân â phosibl mewn un darn o ddeddfwriaeth.

O ran manylion Gorchymyn Diwygio Rheoleiddio (Diogelwch Tân) 2005, bydd yn gosod dyletswydd ar fusnesau i fod yn gyfrifol am eu safleoedd drwy wneud asesiadau risg. A bydd yn gosod dyletswydd ar awdurdodau tân ac achub i orfodi eu darpariaethau drwy archwilio a gweithredu'n briodol lle gwelir bod diffygion. Bydd tystysgrifau tân a ddyroddwyd o dan Ddeddf Gochelion rhag Tân 1971 yn ddi-rym, ac ni fydd angen mwyach iddynt gael eu dyroddi gan awdurdod tân.

Bydd hyblygrwydd y gyfundrefn newydd yn golygu y gall atebion diogelwch tân gael eu teilwra yn ôl amgylchiadau pob busnes. Mae'n ein galluogi i leihau biwrocraetiaeth a chostau, yn arbennig i fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint. Mae'n lleihau cost tanau a nifer y marwolaethau, yr anafiadau a'r difrod a achosir. Gofynnaf i Aelodau gefnogi'r Gorchymyn.

**Mark Isherwood:** Mae'r Gorchymyn hwn yn diwygio'r gyfraith sy'n ymwneud â diogelwch tân mewn safleoedd annomestig, fel y clywsom. Ar y cyfan, mae'r diwygiad hwn yn pennu ei bod yn ofynnol sicrhau diogelwch cyflogeion ac ymwelwyr â safleoedd, gan gynnwys diffoddwyr tân, i gymryd y rhagofalon tân sy'n ofynnol i sicrhau bod safle'n ddiogel, a dyletswydd i wneud asesiad risg, ynghyd â nodi ei bod yn ofynnol storio a defnyddio sylweddau peryglus yn ddiogel. Mae'n diffinio 'person cyfrifol', a'i ddyletswyddau mewn perthynas â diogelwch tân ar y safle, ynghyd â rhaglenni archwilio y mae'n ofynnol i awdurdodau lleol eu cynnal. Croesawn y mesurau hyn, yn arbennig y penderfyniad i gynnwys atodlenni unigol i bennu gofynion ar gyfer pobl ifanc a'r hyfforddiant ymwybyddiaeth y mae ei angen arnynt.

It is worth noting the necessity to safeguard employees in their place of work. Every year in Britain, over 220 people—more than four each week—are fatally injured at work, and a further 28,000 are seriously injured. This Order covers the application of these rules in respect of the Crown and the Houses of Parliament, in light of the fatal accident—although not a fire safety-related accident—at the Royal Mint. Will the Minister confirm whether immunity from prosecution is retained within this Order?

The Order also covers the fire safety requirements for care homes, where again we have experienced fatalities in such premises in Wales because of fire. We ask for the Minister's assurances on these matters within the Order.

We note that, in addition to the Acts that refer to the whole of the UK, such as the Buildings Act 1984 and the Food Act 1984, a number of Acts specific to Wales are amended or have sections repealed, such as the County of South Glamorgan Act 1976, the Clwyd County Council Act 1985, the West Glamorgan Act 1987 and the Dyfed Act 1987.

Otherwise, we welcome the Order and support the measure to ensure enhanced fire safety in all premises.

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** I will write to the Member regarding the two points he raised, and place a copy of the letter in the Library.

Mae'n werth nodi bod angen diogelu cyflogaion yn eu gweithle. Bob blwyddyn ym Mhrydain bydd mwy na 220 o bobl—mwy na phedwar bob wythnos—yn cael eu hanafu'n angheuol yn y gwaith, a chaiff 28,000 arall eu hanafu'n ddifrifol. Mae'r Gorchymyn hwn yn cynnwys ymarfer y rheolau hyn mewn perthynas â'r Goron a'r Senedd, yng ngoleuni'r ddamwain angheuol—er nad oedd yn ddamwain yn gysylltiedig â diogelwch tân—yn y Bathdy Brenhinol. A wnaiff y Gweinidog gadarnhau a fydd imiwnedd rhag erlyniad yn cael ei gadw yn y Gorchymyn hwn?

Mae'r Gorchymyn hefyd yn cynnwys y gofynion diogelwch tân ar gyfer cartrefi gofal, lle yr ydym, unwaith eto, wedi cael marwolaethau ar safleoedd felly yng Nghymru oherwydd tân. Gofynnir am sicrwydd y Gweinidog ar y materion hyn yn y Gorchymyn.

Sylwn fod nifer o Ddeddfau sy'n benodol i Gymru, yn ogystal â'r Deddfau sy'n cyfeirio at y DU gyfan, megis Deddf Adeiladau 1984 a Deddf Bwyd 1984, wedi cael eu diwygio neu bod adrannau ynddynt yn cael eu diddymu, megis Deddf Sir De Morgannwg 1976, Deddf Cyngor Sir Clwyd 1985, Deddf Gorllewin Morgannwg 1987 a Deddf Dyfed 1987.

Fel arall, yr ydym yn croesawu'r Gorchymyn ac yn cefnogi'r mesur i sicrhau gwell diogelwch tân ar bob safle.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** Ysgrifennaf at yr Aelod o ran y ddau bwynt a gododd, a rhoddaf gopi o'r llythyr yn y Llyfrgell.

*Cynnig (NDM2420): O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2420): For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine

Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Cyfarwyddiadau'r Gwasanaethau Fferyllol (Gwasanaethau Uwch a Gwell) (Cymru) 2005**  
**Approval of the Pharmaceutical Services (Advanced and Enhanced Services) (Wales) Directions 2005**

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cyndeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of The Pharmaceutical Services (Advanced and Enhanced Services) (Wales) Directions 2005 a copy of which was laid in Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 26 April 2005. (NDM2418)*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Cyfarwyddiadau'r Gwasanaethau Fferyllol (Gwasanaethau Uwch a Gwell) (Cymru) 2005 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 26 Ebrill 2005. (NDM2418)*

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

*that the National Assembly for Wales acting under Standing Order No. 29.3 (iii) approves the Pharmaceutical Services (Advanced and Enhanced Services) (Wales) Directions 2005 which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 26 April 2005. (NDM2419)*

I am pleased to commend this motion to the Assembly, to approve directions that will require local health boards to make arrangements for advanced and enhanced services, which forms the next stage in the creation of the new pharmacy contract. The directions address the concerns previously expressed by members of the Health and Social Services Committee and by Members in Plenary regarding details on advanced and enhanced services within the enabling regulations for the new contract.

The NHS pharmaceutical services regulations set out the requirements for essential services, but advanced and enhanced services were not specified in the regulations, as they are directed services. Instead, these directions will require local health boards to make arrangements for advanced services and authorise them to make arrangements for enhanced services. The requirement for enhanced services are specified in detail in the directions.

Each enhanced service is briefly described. Further guidance in the form of model service specifications and benchmark prices will follow in due course, to help LHBs in their commissioning of enhanced services. As you are aware, the new contract is a jointly negotiated settlement, and these directions mirror those already enacted in England. In this context, I remind Members that there is no scope to amend or modify directions in relation to advanced or enhanced services. This would be interpreted as an attempt to withdraw from the agreed settlement, and could prejudice implementation of services that have already been initiated in England and are already a part of an England-Wales agreement.

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3 (iii) yn cymeradwyo Cyfarwyddiadau'r Gwasanaethau Fferyllol (Gwasanaethau Uwch a Gwell) (Cymru) 2005 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 26 Ebrill 2005. (NDM2419)*

Yr wyf yn falch o gymeradwyo'r cynnig hwn i'r Cynulliad, i gymeradwyo cyfarwyddiadau a fydd yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i fyrddau iechyd lleol wneud trefniadau ar gyfer gwasanaethau uwch a gwell. Hyn fydd y cam nesaf yn y contract fferyllol newydd. Mae'r cyfarwyddiadau'n ymdrin â'r pryderon a fynegwyd yn flaenorol gan aelodau'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, a chan Aelodau yn y Cyfarfod Llawn am fanylion am wasanaethau uwch a gwell o fewn y rheoliadau galluogi ar gyfer y contract newydd.

Mae rheoliadau gwasanaethau fferyllol y GIG yn nodi'r gofynion ar gyfer gwasanaethau hanfodol, ond ni nodwyd gwasanaethau uwch a gwell yn y rheoliadau, gan eu bod yn wasanaethau cyfeiriedig. Yn hytrach, bydd y cyfarwyddiadau hyn yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i fyrddau iechyd lleol wneud trefniadau ar gyfer gwasanaethau uwch, a byddant yn eu hawdurdodi i wneud trefniadau ar gyfer gwasanaethau gwell. Mae'r gofyniad ar gyfer gwasanaethau gwell yn cael ei nodi'n fanwl yn y cyfarwyddiadau.

Rhoddir disgrifiad byr o bob gwasanaeth gwell. Bydd canllawiau pellach ar ffurf manylebau gwasanaeth enghreifftiol a phrisiau meincnod yn dilyn maes o law, er mwyn helpu byrddau iechyd lleol wrth iddynt gomisiynu gwasanaethau gwell. Fel y gwyddoch, mae'r contract newydd yn setliad sydd wedi ei negodi ar y cyd, ac mae'r cyfarwyddiadau hyn yn adlewyrchu'r rheini sydd wedi eu gweithredu eisoes yn Lloegr. Yn y cyd-destun hwn, hoffwn atgoffa Aelodau nad oes cyfle i ddiwygio nac addasu cyfarwyddiadau mewn perthynas â gwasanaethau uwch neu well. Byddai hyn yn cael ei ddehongli fel ymgais i dynnu'n ôl o'r setliad cytûn, a gallai beryglu'r broses o roi gwasanaethau ar waith sydd wedi eu

cychwyn eisoes yn Lloegr ac sydd eisoes yn rhan o gytundeb i Gymru a Lloegr.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Cytunaf â'r hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog wrth ddod â'i sylwadau i ben, ei bod yn bwysig cyflwyno'r mesurau hyn yng Nghymru. A wnaiff y Gweinidog dderbyn fod consŷrn cyffredinol o fewn y proffesiwn bod oedi heb reswm wrth gyflwyno'r rheoliadau hyn yng Nghymru?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I agree with what the Minister said when he concluded his comments, that it is important to introduce these measures in Wales. Will the Minister accept that there is general concern among the profession that there has been unnecessary delay in introducing these regulations in Wales?

Yr wyf am ofyn cwestiwn penodol am wasanaethau estynedig. Pam na cheir cyfeiriad at ddarpariaeth lawn y gwasanaethau hyn ar wyneb y rheoliadau?

I wish to ask a specific question about enhanced services. Why is there no reference to the full provision of these services on the face of the regulations?

I will also ask some other questions about these regulations. How will the directed enhanced minor ailments scheme will be introduced across Wales? Also, in terms of the introduction of these regulations in Wales, why they are not being moved on a par with developments in England? This seems to be moving at a slower pace in Wales, and there is genuine concern within the profession, and more generally within Wales, about that. When will the regulations on dispensing in rural areas be moved? You previously said that they will be moved in mid summer, in July. Can you give us further information on that?

Gofynnaf rai cwestiynau eraill hefyd am y rheoliadau hyn. Sut y caiff y cynllun cyfeiriedig gwell o ran mân anhwylderau ei gyflwyno ledled Cymru? Hefyd, o ran cyflwyno'r rheoliadau hyn yng Nghymru, pam na chânt eu cyflwyno yr un pryd â datblygiadau yn Lloegr? Ymddengys eu bod yn cael eu cyflwyno'n arafach yng Nghymru, ac mae pryder gwirioneddol yn y proffesiwn, ac yn fwy cyffredinol yng Nghymru, ynglŷn â hynny. Pryd y caiff y rheoliadau ar ddsbarthu mewn ardaloedd gwledig eu cyflwyno? Dywedsoch yn flaenorol y cânt eu cyflwyno ganol yr haf, ym mis Gorffennaf. A allwch roi rhagor o wybodaeth inni am hynny?

We welcome the movement that we have had on these regulations, but we have concerns that they are moving slowly and that information is also being communicated very slowly.

Croesawn y datblygiadau a wnaed o ran y rheoliadau hyn, ond yr ydym yn pryderu eu bod yn cael eu cyflwyno'n araf a bod gwybodaeth hefyd yn cael ei chyfleu'n araf iawn.

**David Melding:** The Minister alluded to the fact that this is a new contract, and that it is being negotiated on a UK-basis, or at least on an England and Wales basis. I understand why that was done initially, but I will bring to the attention of the Assembly my concern that the contracts—not just the pharmaceutical contract, but also the medical and the proposed dental contract—are not a retained matter; this issue has been devolved. If it is crucial that this should proceed on a UK-basis, those powers should be retained at Westminster. However, as we have the authority to amend or redesign the contract, we have to be clear that we have the right to

**David Melding:** Cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog at y ffaith bod hwn yn gontract newydd, a'i fod yn cael ei negodi ar sail y DU, neu o leiaf ar sail Cymru a Lloegr. Deallaf pam y gwnaed hyn i ddechrau, ond hoffwn ddwyn i sylw'r Cynulliad fy mhryder nad yw'r contractau—nid y contract fferyllol yn unig, ond hefyd y contract meddygol a'r contract deintyddol arfaethedig—yn fater a gadwyd yn ôl; mae'r mater hwn wedi ei ddatganoli. Os yw'n hollbwysig y dylai hyn ddatblygu ar sail y DU, dylid cadw'r pwerau hynny yn San Steffan. Fodd bynnag, gan mai gennym ni y mae'r awdurdod i ddiwygio neu ail-lunio'r contract, rhaid inni fod yn glir fod gennym

do that in the future. The assumption is that this issue has been devolved to us because, in the light of experience and future practice, we will need to make amendments. We have been lobbied hard by various organisations that represent pharmacists. I understand their position, but they believe that this should be retained on a UK basis. However, as far as the Assembly is concerned, it remains with us. At some point, it will be our public duty to hold a real review of this, and perhaps to modify things. That message has to go out to them clearly. I think that that is important.

3.30 p.m.

The second point is that because this was, in the end, somewhat rushed through—it was not the Minister's fault, because it was a UK negotiation—the Health and Social Services Committee did not look at the regulations in their proper legal form. We had to look at draft regulations; they were substantially the same as what is now in front of us, and I commend the Minister's predecessor for her attitude in that she was keen to have a full discussion. This was not at all her fault, but, if things are lead on a UK basis, then it should not then try to trump our procedures and say that there is no time for Assembly input and that it would delay implementation and lead to us having to face the opprobrium of pharmacists or other bodies. That is most unsatisfactory as far as the way that the Assembly is run.

**Eleanor Burnham:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats believe that these directions represent a step towards a more tailored and personal approach to the provision of healthcare. It brings pharmacists into the heart of the healthcare family, which is somewhere that they should have always been. However, while the directions are positive in their thrust, they are characteristically deficient in the detail. We believe that the Labour Government could have done better.

The advanced service of a medicine use review and a prescription intervention service

yr hawl i wneud hynny yn y dyfodol. Y dybiaeth yw bod y mater hwn wedi ei ddatganoli i ni oherwydd, yng ngoleuni profiad ac arfer yn y dyfodol, bydd angen inni wneud newidiadau. Cawsom ein lobio'n galed gan y gwahanol sefydliadau sy'n cynrychioli fferyllwyr. Deallaf eu safbwynt, ond credant y dylid cadw hyn ar sail y DU. Fodd bynnag, o ran y Cynulliad, erys gyda ni. Rywbryd yn y dyfodol, bydd dyletswydd gyhoeddus arnom i wneud adolygiad gwirioneddol o hyn, ac i newid pethau, o bosibl. Rhaid i'r neges honno gael ei chyfleu'n glir iddynt. Credaf fod hynny yn bwysig.

Yr ail bwynt yw hyn: oherwydd bod hyn, yn y pen draw, wedi ei wneud ar frys i ryw raddau—nid y Gweinidog oedd ar fai, oherwydd trafodaethau ar lefel y DU oeddent—nid ystyriodd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus y rheoliadau yn eu ffurf gyfreithiol gywir. Bu'n rhaid inni ystyried rheoliadau drafft; yr un fwy neu lai yw'r rheoliadau sydd ger ein bron heddiw, a chanmolaf ragflaenydd y Gweinidog am ei hagwedd, am ei bod yn awyddus i gael trafodaeth lawn. Nid oedd hi ar fai o gwbl, ond os caiff pethau eu harwain ar sail y DU, yna ni ddylai geisio trechu ein gweithdrefnau a dweud nad oes amser i'r Cynulliad gyfrannu, ac y byddai hynny'n gohirio rhoi'r cyfan ar waith ac yn golygu y byddem yn wynebu dicter y fferyllwyr neu gyrff eraill. Mae hynny'n anfoddfaol iawn o ran y ffordd y caiff y Cynulliad ei redeg.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Cred Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru fod y cyfarwyddiadau hyn yn gam tuag at agwedd fwy personol wedi'i theilwra'n well tuag at ddarparu gofal iechyd. Mae'n sicrhau bod i fferyllwyr le canolog ym maes gofal iechyd, rhywbeth y dylid bod wedi ei roi iddynt o'r dechrau. Fodd bynnag, er bod byrdwn y cyfarwyddiadau yn gadarnhaol, yn ôl yr arfer, nid oes ynddynt ddigon o fanylion. Credwn y gallai'r Llywodraeth Lafur fod wedi gwneud yn well.

Mae'r gwasanaeth uwch o adolygu defnyddio meddyginiaethau a gwasanaeth

provides for a more intelligent use of resources and recognises the role that patients play in their own healthcare. Giving patients a knowledge and understanding about their course of treatment enables them to take a greater degree of ownership of their health and wellbeing. It is a more mature approach to the provision of healthcare and is to be welcomed and encouraged.

However, the qualifications required to provide these additional services must be based on a single accreditation system that is recognised by all 22 local health boards, rather than on a different system or scheme in each LHB area. The enhanced provision of services outlined in the directions will enable local health boards to broaden the range of pharmaceutical services that they deliver. These small specialist services make a tangible difference to the lives of patients, and the more such services that pharmacies provide the better.

The fact remains, Minister, that local health boards do not have the funds to make the directions work fully. Coupled with this, will local health boards be able to commission enhanced services? If some can and others cannot, the provision of these enhanced services risks becoming the latest victim of the postcode lottery, and does nothing more than corrode people's faith in the NHS.

The Labour Welsh Assembly Government must provide adequate funding and make clear exactly how this will be done. A point to note is that some of the services are categorised as enhanced, but they should be universal services, an example of which is smoking cessation. This should be a core service. Can the Minister name one community in Wales that does not need this service?

Finally, despite the issues that I have raised, the Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome the directions and the aspirations, and hope that some of the positive steps will, contrary to past performance, be matched by an equally

ymyrryd ar gyfer presgripsiynau yn ddefnydd mwy deallus o adnoddau, ac mae'n cydnabod y rhan y mae cleifion yn ei chwarae yn eu gofal iechyd eu hunain. Drwy roi gwybodaeth i gleifion am eu triniaeth a'u helpu i'w deall, yr ydym yn eu galluogi i fod yn fwy cyfrifol am eu hiechyd a'u lles. Mae'n agwedd fwy aeddfed tuag at ddarparu gofal iechyd, ac y mae i'w chroesawu a'i hannog.

Fodd bynnag, rhaid i'r cymwysterau sy'n angenrheidiol i ddarparu'r gwasanaethau ychwanegol hyn fod yn seiliedig ar un system achredu a gydnabyddir gan bob un o'r 22 o fyrddau iechyd lleol, yn hytrach nag ar system neu gynllun gwahanol ym mhob ardal BIL1. Bydd y ddarpariaeth well o wasanaethau, a amlinellir yn y cyfarwyddiadau, yn galluogi byrddau iechyd lleol i ddarparu amrywiaeth ehangach o wasanaethau fferyllol. Mae'r gwasanaethau arbenigol bach hyn yn gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol i fywydau cleifion, a gorau po fwyaf o wasanaethau o'r fath a ddarperir gan fferyllfeydd.

Erys yn ffaith, Weinidog, nad oes gan fyrddau iechyd lleol ddigon o gyllid i weithredu'r cyfarwyddiadau'n llawn. Ochr yn ochr â hyn, a fydd byrddau iechyd lleol yn gallu comisiynu gwasanaethau gwell? Os gall rhai wneud hynny, ond nid eraill, mae perygl mai'r gwasanaethau gwell hyn fydd yn dioddef nesaf oherwydd loteri'r cod post, ac nid yw hynny'n gwneud dim ond gwanhau ffydd pobl yn y GIG.

Rhaid i Lywodraeth Lafur Cynulliad Cymru roi cyllid digonol ac egluro sut yn union y caiff hyn ei wneud. Un pwynt i'w nodi yw bod rhai o'r gwasanaethau wedi'u categorioeddio'n rhai gwell, ond dylent fod yn wasanaethau sydd ar gael i bawb. Un enghraifft o hynny yw rhoi'r gorau i ysmegu. Dylai hwn fod yn wasanaeth craidd. A all y Gweinidog enwi un gymuned yng Nghymru lle nad oes angen y gwasanaeth hwn?

Yn olaf, er gwaethaf y materion a godwyd gennyf, mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn croesawu'r cyfarwyddiadau a'r dyheadau. Gobeithiwn y bydd rhai o'r camau cadarnhaol, yn wahanol i berfformiad



realistic approach to funding from the Labour Welsh Assembly Government.

**Karen Sinclair:** Minister, I raise this question in the hope that you can give me some comfort in your response. In many pharmacies, certainly in my constituency, a lot of the pharmacists that work as locums are from England. They are cross-border locums. If we did not have these locums, we would have severe problems in some of our smaller rural pharmacies. Can you assure me that the training needed to meet the criteria to be able to deliver at the level provided by the village chemist will be recognised when an English locum comes to Wales and a Welsh locum goes to England?

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** These are directions rather than regulations, so I think that there is a slight difference in the legal status of the two types of document. These directions need to be viewed in that light.

In relation to the minor ailments scheme, as I understand it, members of the pharmacy profession, Assembly officials and so forth are working to draw up the necessary protocols to achieve that. Once the protocols are in place, they will be available for dissemination, which will allow people to have the opportunity to avail of them as enhanced services. However, many of these require some sort of minimum standards to allow implementation, and that groundwork is ongoing, rather than completed. I believe that we would all accept that there is a ragged edge of devolution and that there are some untidy elements around that edge. The way that we have to deal with directions, Orders and regulations, compared with the streamlined way in which they are done in Westminster, inevitably produces an element of delay, which is intrinsic to the system, but not a particular virtue. However, that is the settlement that we have to work with, and we have to make the best of it.

David Melding's point comes within this context. However, I am not making the

y gorffennol, yn denu agwedd yr un mor realisting tuag at gyllid gan Lywodraeth Lafur Cynulliad Cymru.

**Karen Sinclair:** Weinidog, codaf y cwestiwn hwn yn y gobaith y gallwch roi rhyw gysur imi yn eich ymateb. Mewn llawer fferyllfa, yn sicr yn fy etholaeth i, mae nifer o'r fferyllwyr sy'n gweithio yno yn fferyllwyr locwm o Loegr. Fferyllwyr locwm ar draws ffiniau ydynt. Pe na bai'r rhain gennym, byddem yn wynebu problemau mawr yn rhai o'n fferyllfeydd gwledig llai. A allwch roi sicrwydd imi y caiff yr hyfforddiant sy'n angenrheidiol i fodloni'r meini prawf i allu darparu gwasanaeth ar y lefel a ddarperir gan fferyllwyr pentref ei gydnabod pan fydd fferylllydd locwm o Loegr yn dod i Gymru, a phan fydd un o Gymru yn mynd i Loegr?

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Cyfarwyddiadau yw'r rhain, yn hytrach na rheoliadau. Felly, credaf fod gwahaniaeth bach o ran statws cyfreithiol yn y ddau fath o ddogfen. Bydd angen ystyried y cyfarwyddiadau hyn yn y goleuni hwnnw.

O ran y cynllun mân anhwylderau, fel y'i deallaf, mae aelodau o'r proffesiwn fferyllol, swyddogion y Cynulliad, ac yn y blaen, yn mynd ati i lunio'r protocolau angenrheidiol i gyflawni hynny. Cyn gynted ag y bydd y protocolau ar waith, byddant ar gael i'w lledaenu, a bydd hynny'n gyfle i bobl all eu cael fel gwasanaethau gwell. Fodd bynnag, mae nifer o'r rhain yn gofyn am ryw fath o safonau gofynnol er mwyn eu gweithredu, ac mae'r gwaith caib a rhaw hwnnw yn parhau. Nid yw wedi cael ei orffen eto. Credaf y byddem oll yn derbyn nad yw datganoli bob amser yn broses lefn a bod ynddi rai elfennau anniben. Mae'r ffordd y mae'n rhaid inni ymdrin â chyfarwyddiadau, Gorchmynion a rheoliadau, o'i chymharu â'r ffordd symlach o wneud hynny yn San Steffan, yn anochel yn arwain at ychydig oedi, sy'n rhan annatod o'r system, ond nid yw'n rhinwedd. Fodd bynnag, dyna'r setliad y mae'n rhaid inni ei weithredu, a rhaid inni ddygymod ag ef orau y gallwn.

Mae pwynt David Melding yn berthnasol yn hyn o beth. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn dadlau

argument that this cannot be changed in legal terms. We can take a different view legally, but this is part of an England-Wales agreement to which we are party. Therefore, if we decide to take a unilateral decision in relation to these directions, that could effectively be seen as our unilaterally opting out from an England-Wales agreement with the profession. Therefore, it is on that basis that I say that we have little scope. If we decided to take a different view, we could be seen as tearing up the agreement, albeit a little corner of the agreement. Nonetheless, we will be taking a different position compared with that which was agreed on an England-Wales basis.

**David Melding:** You are accountable for taking it forward on an England and Wales basis when the powers currently reside in England or in Wales—in the Assembly and Westminster. This is fine, and there is logic in the way that you proceeded in the first instance. However, I would expect practice to change, as the years go by, between Wales and England. We will then have to use these powers more effectively.

**Brian Gibbons:** I do not disagree with that. We were party to the London negotiations on this. Your point is legitimate and correct, and I do not dissent from that point of view.

As Eleanor said, there is a budgetary cost to implementing these proposals, and this will be included in our budget proposals as they emerge. If you look at the format of this contract, you will see that there are what are called essential services, advanced services, and enhanced services. There are nine or 10 items included in the essential services. To say that everyone should be obliged to provide the enhanced services or that the enhanced services should be part of the essential services is to undermine the philosophy of this contract. In any event, there are specific requirements in place to be able to deliver these enhanced services. Often, these enhanced services, for example, will require an additional room in a pharmacy to provide the necessary confidentiality to the pharmacist and the client. That may not be

nad oes modd newid hyn yn gyfreithiol. Gallwn arddel barn wahanol yn gyfreithiol, ond mae hyn yn rhan o gytundeb i Gymru a Lloegr a ninnau'n barti ynddo. Felly, os penderfynwn wneud penderfyniad unochrog mewn cysylltiad â'r cyfarwyddiadau hyn, gellid ystyried ein bod yn ymeithrio'n unochrog i bob diben o gytundeb Cymru a Lloegr gyda'r proffesiwn. Felly, ar y sail honno y dywedaf nad oes gennym fawr o hyblygrwydd. Pe baem yn penderfynu ar safbwynt gwahanol, byddai rhai o bosibl yn ystyried ein bod yn chwalu'r cytundeb, er mai rhan fach ohono ydyw. Serch hynny, fe fyddwn yn arddel safbwynt gwahanol o'i gymharu â'r hyn y cytunwyd arno ar sail Cymru a Lloegr.

**David Melding:** Yr ydych yn atebol am weithredu hyn ar sail Cymru a Lloegr pan fydd y pwerau ar hyn o bryd yn Lloegr neu yng Nghymru—yn y Cynulliad neu yn San Steffan. Mae hyn yn dderbyniol, ac mae'r ffordd yr ydych wedi mynd ati yn y lle cyntaf yn eithaf rhesymegol. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn disgwyl i arfer newid, wrth i'r blynyddoedd fynd heibio, rhwng Cymru a Lloegr. Yna bydd yn rhaid inni ddefnyddio'r pwerau hyn yn fwy effeithiol.

**Brian Gibbons:** Nid wyf yn anghytuno â hynny. Yr oeddem yn rhan o'r negodiadau yn Llundain ar hyn. Mae eich pwynt yn un dilys a chywir, ac nid wyf yn anghytuno â'r farn honno.

Fel y dywedodd Eleanor, mae cost gyllidebol ynghlwm wrth weithredu'r cynigion hyn, a chaiff hyn ei gynnwys yn ein cynigion cyllidebol wrth iddynt ddatblygu. Os edrychwch ar fformat y contract hwn, fe welwch ei fod yn cynnwys yr hyn a elwir yn wasanaethau hanfodol, gwasanaethau uwch a gwasanaethau gwell. Mae naw neu 10 o eitemau wedi'u cynnwys yn y gwasanaethau hanfodol. Os dywedwch y dylai fod yn ddyletswydd ar bawb i ddarparu'r gwasanaethau gwell, neu y dylai'r gwasanaethau gwell fod yn rhan o'r gwasanaethau hanfodol, yna byddwch yn tanseilio athroniaeth y contract hwn. Sut bynnag, mae gofynion penodol ar waith i allu darparu'r gwasanaethau gwell hyn. Yn aml, bydd y gwasanaethau gwell hyn, er enghraifft, yn gofyn am ystafell ychwanegol

readily provided, and may not be affordable in certain contexts. Therefore, while it may be heavily desirable, this should not be prescriptive in the way that you would like it to be.

On Karen's point, the key qualifications will be transferable across the border. Some of the courses that might be available to allow the necessary training may only be available in England at present, and may not be readily available in Wales. However, we need to ensure that they will be available in Wales. It may be difficult, however, to insist on the English-Welsh requirement, particularly if we are bringing in people. I am not sure whether I have understood your question, Karen.

**Karen Sinclair:** I was thinking of the Wales-England interaction, as opposed to Welsh-English. It has been raised with me that people were worried that, when they had to bring in people from England and if they did not have a qualification that was acknowledged in Wales, there could be a problem. That is what I was pertaining to.

**Brian Gibbons:** As I understand it, when a pharmacist wants to provide these services, this has to be agreed with the local health board. As regards advanced services, pharmacists will have to complete an assessment. If pharmacists complete that assessment, it is my understanding that they will be permitted to work either side of the border. If that is not the case, I will write to you.

3.40 p.m.

*Cynnig (NDM2418): O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2418): For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary

mewn fferyllfa, er mwyn sicrhau'r cyfrinachedd sydd ei angen ar y fferylllydd a'r cleient. Efallai na fydd hynny ar gael yn hawdd, ac efallai na ellir ei fforddio mewn rhai sefyllfaoedd. Felly, er y gall fod yn ddymunol tu hwnt, ni ddylai hyn fod yn rhagnodol yn y ffordd y byddech yn dymuno iddo fod.

O ran pwynt Karen, bydd modd trosglwyddo'r cymwysterau allweddol dros y ffin. Efallai mai yn Lloegr yn unig ar hyn o bryd y darperir rhai o'r cyrsiau a allai fod ar gael i ganiatau'r hyfforddiant angenrheidiol, ac efallai nad ydynt ar gael yn hawdd yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni sicrhau y byddant ar gael yng Nghymru. Gall fod yn anodd, fodd bynnag, mynnu'r gofyniad Seisnig-Cymreig, yn enwedig os ydym yn dod â phobl i mewn. Nid wyf yn siŵr a ddeallais eich cwestiwn, Karen.

**Karen Sinclair:** Yr hyn a oedd gennyf mewn golwg oedd trosglwyddo rhwng Cymru a Lloegr, yn hytrach na throsglwyddo Cymreig-Seisnig. Codwyd y mater gyda mi fod pobl yn poeni, pan oedd yn rhaid iddynt gyflogi pobl o Loegr, ac os na fyddai ganddynt gymhwyster a oedd yn cael ei gydnabod yng Nghymru, fe allai problem godi. Dyna yr oeddwn yn cyfeirio ato.

**Brian Gibbons:** Fel y deallaf, pan fydd fferylllydd am ddarparu'r gwasanaethau hyn, rhaid cael cytundeb y bwrdd iechyd lleol. O ran gwasanaethau uwch, bydd yn rhaid i fferyllwyr gwblhau asesiad. Os bydd fferyllwyr yn cwblhau'r asesiad hwnnw, deallaf y byddant yn cael caniatâd i weithio yng Nghymru ac yn Lloegr. Fe ysgrifennaf atoch os nad yw hynny'n wir.

Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2419): O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2419): For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William

Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.41 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.41 p.m.*

**Adroddiad Blynyddol 2003-04 Prif Arolygydd Ei Mawrhydi dros Addysg a  
Hyfforddiant yng Nghymru  
The Annual Report of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education and Training  
in Wales for 2003-04**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1, 2 and 3 in the name of David Melding and amendment 4 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2, a 3 yn enw David Melding a gwelliant 4 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. welcomes the Annual Report of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education and Training for 2003-04;*

*1. yn croesawu Adroddiad Blynyddol Prif Arolygydd Ei Mawrhydi dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant yng Nghymru ar gyfer 2003-04;*

*2. welcomes the chief inspector's conclusion that standards have risen over the past five years with some of the biggest improvements coming in 2003-04;*

*2. yn croesawu casgliad y prif arolygydd fod safonau wedi codi dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf a rhai o'r gwelliannau mwyaf yn cael eu cyflawni yn 2003-04;*

3. recognises that the programme of work set out in 'The Learning Country' is on track, with year on year improvements in standards and the quality of provision. (NDM2422)

In proposing this motion, I draw Members' attention to the 2003-04 Annual Report of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education and Training in Wales published on 31 January 2005. Devolution provided an opportunity to put in place an education system that is made in Wales and reflects the aspirations and values of the people of Wales. The Assembly Government has taken the opportunity to set a challenging agenda outlined in 'The Learning Country'. By the end of this Assembly, we will have backed 'The Learning Country' programme by doubling the education and lifelong learning budget since 1999. Our investment last year, including local authority provision, was over £3 billion. This year, my budget, excluding local authority provision, has increased by more than 8 per cent from the previous year to over £1.3 billion.

The chief inspector's report is based on evidence gathered from the inspection of just about every aspect of education and training in Wales. It provides a detailed overview of the quality of education and training in Wales and the standards achieved by learners. I am delighted, therefore, with the chief inspector's conclusion that

'There has been much to celebrate over the five-year period from 1999 to 2004. In many areas of education and training, standards have improved a lot, with some of the biggest improvements coming this year'.

The message is clear—the programme of work set out in 'The Learning Country' is very much on track with year on year improvements in standards and the quality of provision.

Turning to the detail of the report, at the heart of our strategy lies a commitment to providing the best start in life for every child. It is particularly pleasing, therefore, to note that the standards that children under five achieve are improving year on year. In

3. yn cydnabod bod y rhaglen waith a nodwyd yn 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu' ar y trywydd cywir, gyda gwelliannau o flwyddyn i flwyddyn o ran safonau ac ansawdd y ddarpariaeth. (NDM2422)

Wrth gynnig y cynnig hwn, tynnaf sylw Aelodau at Adroddiad Blynyddol 2003-04 gan Brif Arolygydd Ei Mawrhydi dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant yng Nghymru, a gyhoeddwyd ar 31 Ionawr 2005. Yr oedd datganoli yn gyfle i roi ar waith system addysg wedi ei llunio yng Nghymru ac sy'n adlewyrchu dyheadau a gwerthoedd pobl Cymru. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi achub ar y cyfle i osod agenda heriol, sydd wedi ei hamlinellu yn 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu'. Erbyn diwedd y Cynulliad hwn, byddwn wedi cefnogi rhaglen 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu' drwy ddyblu'r gyllideb addysg a dysgu gydol oes er 1999. Yr oedd ein buddsoddiad y llynedd, gan gynnwys darpariaeth awdurdodau lleol, dros £3 biliwn. Eleni, mae fy nghyllideb, heb gynnwys darpariaeth awdurdodau lleol, wedi cynyddu dros 8 y cant o'i chymharu â'r flwyddyn flaenorol i fwy na £1.3 biliwn.

Mae adroddiad y prif arolygydd yn seiliedig ar dystiolaeth a gasglwyd o arolygu brob pob agwedd ar addysg a hyfforddiant yng Nghymru. Mae'r rhoi trosolwg manwl o ansawdd addysg a hyfforddiant yng Nghymru, a'r safonau a gyflawnir gan ddysgwyr. Felly, yr wyf yn falch iawn o nodi casgliad y prif arolygydd

'Bu llawer i'w ddathlu dros y cyfnod o bum mlynedd rhwng 1999 a 2004. Mewn nifer o feysydd addysg a hyfforddiant, mae safonau wedi gwella'n fawr, a daeth rhai o'r gwelliannau mwyaf eleni'.

Mae'r neges yn glir—mae'r rhaglen sydd wedi'i gosod allan yn 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu' yn sicr ar y trywydd cywir gyda gwelliannau o flwyddyn i flwyddyn o ran safonau ac ansawdd y ddarpariaeth.

I droi at fanylion yr adroddiad, wrth wraidd ein strategaeth y mae ymrwymiad i roi'r cychwyn gorau mewn bywyd i bob plentyn. Felly, mae'n galonogol iawn sylwi bod y safonau y mae plant o dan bump oed yn eu cyflawni yn gwella o flwyddyn i flwyddyn.

primary and secondary schools, the standards that pupils achieve have improved greatly in the last five years, with pupils achieving good or very good standards in three quarters of classes, which is up from around 50 per cent in 1999, and there are now very few classes with unsatisfactory standards. In the first phase of secondary education, standards were higher than last year's in almost every subject. Overall, the report confirms that the standard of teaching in Wales has never been higher—now 'very good' or 'good' in 75 per cent of lessons—and that this is translating into better pupil performance across the board. However, the improvements in the examination achievement of 16-year-olds have been slower, despite encouraging results in 2004.

That is one of the main reasons for our taking action to transform opportunities for 14 to 19-year-olds through our learning pathways programme. We have already set out our plans for the Welsh baccalaureate, which is now being piloted in 24 schools and colleges, with seven more joining in September. We have set up Careers Wales, the first all-age advice and guidance service in the UK, including Careers Wales Online, the world's first interactive, all-age, bilingual careers information, advice and guidance service. We have also established a network of young people's partnerships across Wales. This is an ambitious and groundbreaking programme of work to extend choice and flexibility and equip young people with the skills needed for life and work. Over the next three years, £43 million will be made available for the learning pathways programme, which has been developed in partnership with local networks and informed at every stage by the views of young people.

With regard to further education, the bedrock for the learning pathway programme lies in effective partnerships between schools, colleges and training providers. It is, therefore, encouraging to see that the standards achieved by learners in further education institutions have improved this

Mewn ysgolion cynradd ac uwchradd, mae'r safonau y mae disgyblion yn eu cyflawni wedi gwella'n sylweddol yn ystod y pum mlynedd diwethaf, a disgyblion yn cyrraedd safonau da neu dda iawn mewn tri dosbarth o bob pedwar. Mae hyn wedi codi o oddeutu 50 y cant yn 1999, ac erbyn hyn ychydig iawn o ddsbarthiadau sydd â safonau anfoddhaol. Yn y cyfnod cyntaf mewn addysg uwchradd, yr oedd safonau yn uwch na'r llynedd ym mhob pwnc bron. Yn gyffredinol, mae'r adroddiad yn cadarnhau bod safon yr addysgu yng Nghymru yn well nag erioed—'da iawn' neu 'da' mewn 75 y cant o wersi erbyn hyn—a bod hynny'n arwain at berfformiad gwell ymhlith disgyblion yn gyffredinol. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd y gwelliannau yng nghyflawniad arholiadau disgyblion 16 oed yn arafach, er y canlyniadau calonogol yn 2004.

Dyna un o'r prif resymau pam yr ydym wedi gweithredu i drawsnewid cyfleoedd ar gyfer pobl ifanc 14 i 19 oed drwy ein rhaglen llwybrau dysgu. Yr ydym eisoes wedi gosod allan ein cynlluniau ar gyfer bagloriaeth Cymru, sydd ar brawf mewn 24 o ysgolion a cholegau, a bydd saith o rai eraill yn ymuno â hwy ym mis Medi. Yr ydym wedi sefydlu Gyrfa Cymru, y gwasanaeth cyngor a chyfarwyddyd cyntaf i bob oed yn y DU, gan gynnwys Gyrfa Cymru Ar-lein, sef gwasanaeth gwybodaeth, cyngor a chyfarwyddyd dwyieithog a rhagweithiol ar yrfaedd i bob oedran. Dyma'r gwasanaeth cyntaf o'i fath yn y byd. Yr ydym hefyd wedi sefydlu rhwydwaith o bartneriaethau pobl ifanc ledled Cymru. Mae hon yn rhaglen waith uchelgeisiol ac arloesol i roi i bobl fanc fwy o ddewis a hyblygrwydd, a'r sgiliau angenrheidiol ar gyfer bywyd a gwaith. Dros y tair blynedd nesaf, darperir £43 miliwn ar gyfer y rhaglen llwybrau dysgu, sydd wedi ei datblygu mewn partneriaeth â rhwydweithiau lleol ac wedi cael ei llywio bob cam o'r ffordd gan sylwadau pobl ifanc.

O ran addysg bellach, conglfaen y rhaglen llwybrau dysgu yw partneriaethau effeithiol rhwng ysgolion, colegau a darparwyr hyfforddiant. Felly, mae'n galonogol gweld bod y safonau a gyflawnwyd gan ddysgwyr mewn sefydliadau addysg bellach wedi gwella eleni, a bod cyrhaeddiad myfyrwyr

year, with student attainment assessed as good or very good in close to two thirds of the programme areas inspected. Similarly, teaching in further education institutions has improved in the last five years and there is now much more good teaching.

Turning to amendment 1 in the name of David Melding, it is by no means an accurate and fair reflection of the overall conclusions reached in the chief inspector's report. I am in full agreement with the chief inspector that we must aim for all young people to be equipped with the skills and knowledge needed in the modern economy. I am also pleased that her report sets out the real progress being made in this sector.

The chief inspector confirms that, in further education institutions, more students now finish their courses and gain qualifications than was the case five years ago. The numbers of part-time students, adult learners on basic education courses, and students supported by employers have all increased a great deal. Similarly, the young people's partnerships have made good progress in co-ordinating the work of different providers of services to young people. As a result, there has been a steady increase in the numbers drawn back into learning through youth service networks. In addition, the percentage of the 16-year-old cohort that leaves without qualifications has fallen again this year. There is still much to do, and I will be looking to our 14-19 programme to continue to drive this figure down. The overall message is one of improvement and progress over the last five years.

David's amendment 2 simply does not square with either the detail or the overall tone of the report. Looking at the detail, at key stage 2, the report notes that the targets for 2002 were met, and sets out the good progress being made towards achieving the targets for 2004-07. The report also goes on to acknowledge that the target for 2007—that class standards be satisfactory or better in 98 per cent of classes—has already been met for primary schools, and is only a fraction short for secondary schools at 97 per cent.

yn dda neu'n dda iawn mewn bron i ddwy ran o dair o'r meysydd rhaglen a arolygwyd. Yn yr un modd, mae addysg mewn sefydliadau addysg bellach wedi gwella yn ystod y pum mlynedd diwethaf, ac mae llawer mwy o addysgu da erbyn hyn.

I droi at welliant 1 yn enw David Melding, nid yw'n adlewyrchu'n gywir ac yn deg o bell ffordd y casgliadau cyffredinol a gafwyd yn adroddiad y prif arolygydd. Cytunaf yn llwyr â'r prif arolygydd bod yn rhaid inni anelu at sicrhau bod gan bob person ifanc y sgiliau a'r wybodaeth angenrheidiol yn yr economi fodern. Yr wyf yn falch hefyd fod ei hadroddiad yn gosod allan y cynnydd gwirioneddol a wneir yn y sector hwn.

Mae'r prif arolygydd yn cadarnhau bod mwy o fyfyrwyr mewn sefydliadau addysg bellach yn gorffen eu cyrsiau ac yn ennill cymwysterau yn awr nag a welwyd bum mlynedd yn ôl. Mae niferoedd y myfyrwyr rhan amser, yr oedolion sy'n dilyn cyrsiau addysg sylfaenol, a'r myfyrwyr a gefnogir gan gyflogwyr i gyd wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol. Yn yr un modd, mae'r partneriaethau pobl ifanc wedi gwneud cynnydd da wrth gydlynu gwaith y bobl wahanol sy'n darparu gwasanaethau i bobl ifanc. O ganlyniad, bu cynnydd cyson yn y niferoedd sy'n dychwelyd i ddysgu drwy rwydweithiau gwasanaethau ieuenctid. Yn ogystal, mae canran y bobl ifanc 16 oed sy'n gadael heb gymwysterau wedi gostwng eto eleni. Mae llawer i'w wneud o hyd, a gobeithio y bydd ein rhaglen i bobl ifanc 14-19 oed yn parhau i leihau'r ffigur hwn. Gwelliant a chynnydd yw'r neges gyffredinol dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf.

Nid yw gwelliant 2 gan David yn gyson â manylion na naws gyffredinol yr adroddiad. O ystyried y manylion, yng nghyfnod allweddol 2, mae'r adroddiad yn nodi bod y targedau ar gyfer 2002 wedi eu cyrraedd, ac mae'n gosod allan y cynnydd da a wneir tuag at gyrraedd y targedau ar gyfer 2004-07. Â'r adroddiad yn ei flaen i gydnabod bod y targed ar gyfer 2007—bod safonau dosbarthiadau yn foddhaol neu'n well mewn 98 y cant o ddosbarthiadau—wedi'i gyrraedd ar gyfer ysgolion cynradd, a'i fod bron wedi'i gyrraedd ar gyfer ysgolion uwchradd ar 97 y cant.



There are, of course, areas of improvement that have been slow, with evidence that results have reached a plateau, for example, the examinations achievements of 16-year-olds. Even here, the report acknowledges the progress being made at key stage 3 and the good work being undertaken as part of the learning pathways programme to extend choice and flexibility for 14 to 19-year-olds. Again, it is clear that there have been year-on-year improvements in the quality of education and the standards achieved by learners. This amendment is a very much at odds with that.

In response to David's amendment 3, I am not aware of any data that, on a consistent basis—that is, comparing like with like—substantiate the statement made in the amendment. The results of recent literacy and numeracy surveys show that adults in Wales have broadly the same skills levels as those in north-east England; this is to be expected in view of the similar socio-economic characteristics and industrial history of the two regions. Indeed, Wales has a slightly higher percentage, with numeracy skills at level 2 and above, than north-east England, and a slightly lower percentage, with literacy skills at level 1 and below, than London, for example. However, there is no suggestion, as implied in this amendment, that the levels of basic skills in Wales have declined relative to other regions.

This Assembly Government recognises the importance of basic skills and the challenge that we face. Our new basic skills strategy, 'Words Talk—Numbers Count', fully acknowledges the position and sets out a comprehensive, long-term and fully funded £40 million programme to address our basic skills problems. This amendment is not supported, therefore, by either the chief inspector's report or wider research.

On amendment 4 in the name of Kirsty Williams, this is a real area of concern. The chief inspector has concluded that the quality of work-based learning has improved in the last five years. Nevertheless, it is simply not

Mae yna feysydd lle gwnaed gwelliannau yn araf, wrth gwrs, a cheir tystiolaeth bod canlyniadau wedi sefydlogi, er enghraifft, yng nghyflawniadau pobl ifanc 16 oed mewn arholiadau. Hyd yn oed yma, mae'r adroddiad yn cydnabod y cynnydd a wneir yng nghyfnod allweddol 3, a'r gwaith da a wneir fel rhan o'r rhaglen llwybrau dysgu i ehangu dewis a hyblygrwydd i bobl ifanc 14 i 19 oed. Unwaith eto, mae'n amlwg bod gwelliannau wedi'u gwneud o flwyddyn i flwyddyn o ran ansawdd addysg a'r safonau a gyflawnir gan ddysgwyr. Mae'r gwelliant hwn yn gwrth-ddweud hynny.

I ymateb i welliant 3 gan David, nid wyf yn ymwybodol o unrhyw ddata sydd, yn gyson, yn cadarnhau'r datganiad a wneir yn y gwelliant—sef cymharu tebyg â'i debyg. Dengys canlyniadau'r arolygon diweddar o lythrennedd a rhifedd fod gan oedolion yng Nghymru yr un lefelau sgiliau â phobl yng ngogledd-ddwyrain Lloegr ar y cyfan; mae hyn i'w ddisgwyl o gofio nodweddion economaidd-gymdeithasol a hanes diwydiannol tebyg y ddau ranbarth. Yn wir, mae yng Nghymru ganran ychydig yn fwy, o ran sgiliau rhifedd lefel 2 ac uwch, na gogledd-ddwyrain Lloegr, a chanran ychydig yn llai, o ran sgiliau llythrennedd lefel 1 ac is, na Llundain, er enghraifft. Fodd bynnag, nid oes unrhyw awgrym, fel y mae'r gwelliant hwn yn ei awgrymu, fod lefelau sgiliau sylfaenol yng Nghymru wedi gostwng o'u cymharu â rhanbarthau eraill.

Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd sgiliau sylfaenol a'r her a wynebwn. Mae ein strategaeth sgiliau sylfaenol newydd, 'Geiriau'n Galw—Rhifau'n Cyfri', yn cydnabod y sefyllfa'n llawn ac yn gosod allan raglen hirdymor gynhwysfawr gwerth £40 miliwn sy'n cael ei hariannu'n llawn i ymdrin â'n problemau o ran sgiliau sylfaenol. Felly, nid yw adroddiad y prif arolygydd na gwaith ymchwil ehangach yn cefnogi'r gwelliant hwn.

O ran gwelliant 4 yn enw Kirsty Williams, mae hyn yn peri pryder gwirioneddol. Mae'r prif arolygydd wedi dod i'r casgliad bod ansawdd dysgu sy'n seiliedig ar waith wedi gwella yn ystod y pum mlynedd diwethaf.

acceptable that only a third of training is graded by Estyn as being 'good' or 'very good' and that only 80 per cent is seen as being 'satisfactory' or better. I agree that there can be no compromise on standards, which is why we will accept this amendment.

It is for that reason that ELWa has already—at my request—conducted a review of workplace learning and is now taking action to implement the recommendations flowing from the review. In particular, the council is working with the Assembly and Estyn to ensure that there are systematic approaches, at all levels, to quality management. This includes packages of targeted support to help providers to raise quality and improve standards. However, over an agreed timescale, funding will be withdrawn from providers that fail to show improvement and fall short of a minimum Estyn inspection grade 3. This is one element of the second 'Skills and Employment Action Plan for Wales 2005' that we published in January.

It is a tribute to the commitment and hard work of practitioners and managers across Wales that, yet again, we have seen improvements in the quality of teaching, with significant gains in school and college settings. Allied with year-on-year improvements in standards and the quality of provision, there is much to celebrate in this report.

3.50 p.m.

However, the report also underlines that there is still much to do and, in particular, to realise the improvements that will flow from our plans, the new foundation stage, the recasting of the 14-19 curriculum, and action to drive up skills levels. It is clear that our 'Made in Wales' agenda is making a real difference to the opportunities provided for learners at all levels. Therefore, while there is still much to do, the report shows that we are firmly on track to realise our ambition to make Wales a learning country.

**Mark Isherwood:** I propose the following

Serch hynny, nid yw'n dderbyniol mai dim ond traean o hyfforddiant sy'n cael gradd 'da' neu 'da iawn' gan Estyn, ac mai dim ond 80 y cant a ystyrir yn 'boddhaol' neu'n well. Cytunaf na ellir cyfaddawdu o ran safonau, a dyna pam y byddwn yn derbyn y gwelliant hwn.

Am y rheswm hwnnw, mae ELWa eisoes wedi cynnal adolygiad o ddysgu yn y gweithle—yn dilyn cais gennyf fi—ac mae bellach yn cymryd camau i weithredu'r argymhellion sy'n deillio o'r adolygiad. Yn benodol, mae'r cyngor yn gweithio gyda'r Cynulliad ac Estyn i sicrhau bod dulliau systematig, ar bob lefel, i reoli ansawdd. Mae hyn yn cynnwys pecynnau cymorth penodol i helpu darparwyr i wella ansawdd a safonau. Fodd bynnag, yn unol ag amserlen y cytunwyd arni, caiff arian ei dynnu'n ôl oddi wrth y darparwyr hynny nad ydynt yn gwella ac nad ydynt yn cyrraedd gradd arolygu 3, sy'n ofynnol gan Estyn. Dyma un elfen yn yr ail 'Gynllun Gweithredu Sgiliau a Chyflogaeth Cymru 2005' a gyhoeddwyd gennym ym mis Ionawr.

Mae'n deyrnged i ymrwymiad a gwaith caled ymarferwyr a rheolwyr ledled Cymru ein bod, unwaith eto, wedi gweld gwelliannau yn ansawdd yr addysgu, a gwelliannau sylweddol mewn ysgolion a cholegau. Ar y cyd â gwelliannau o flwyddyn i flwyddyn o ran safonau ac ansawdd y ddarpariaeth, mae llawer i'w ddatlu yn yr adroddiad hwn.

Fodd bynnag, mae'r adroddiad hefyd yn pwysleisio'r ffaith fod llawer i'w wneud o hyd, ac yn benodol, er mwyn gwireddu'r gwelliannau a fydd yn deillio o'n cynlluniau, y cyfnod sylfaen newydd, ail-lunio'r cwricwlwm 14-19, a'r camau i wella sgiliau. Mae'n amlwg bod ein hagenda 'Gwnaed yng Nghymru' yn gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol i'r cyfleoedd a ddarperir ar gyfer dysgwyr ar bob lefel. Felly, er bod llawer i'w wneud o hyd, dengys yr adroddiad ein bod ar y trywydd cywir i wireddu ein huchelgais o sicrhau bod Cymru yn wlad sy'n dysgu.

**Mark Isherwood:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau

amendments in the name of David Melding. Amendment 1: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*the National Assembly for Wales notes with concern that too many learners over the age of 16 do not have the qualifications that they need.*

I propose amendment 2: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*the National Assembly for Wales notes with concern that the national targets are not being met.*

I propose amendment 3: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*the National Assembly for Wales notes with concern that Wales now has poorer basic skills than any other nation or region in the UK.*

I thank Susan Lewis, Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education and Training in Wales, for a thorough and comprehensive report. We congratulate the learners and teachers of Wales on the encouraging achievements highlighted in this report, and note that these would not have been possible without their hard work and the hard work of the trainers and leaders in our schools and further education institutions. These achievements are all the more creditable given the difficult education environment created by this Labour Welsh Assembly Government and its Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, who is guided by utopian visions of a shiny, state-controlled, virtual-reality world in which success is measured according to the amount of taxpayers' money squandered rather than the amount of resources in schools and colleges in the front line of education.

The shocking truth is that, after six years of having a spend-more deliver-less Labour Government in Cardiff, and eight years of having such a Government in London, the people of Wales now have poorer basic skills and lower prosperity than the people of any other nation or region in the United Kingdom.

canlynol yn enw David Melding. Gwelliant 1: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn nodi gyda phryder bod gormod o ddysgwyr dros 16 oed nad oes ganddynt y cymwysterau y mae eu hangen arnynt.*

Cynigiad welliant 2: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn nodi gyda phryder nad yw'r targedau cenedlaethol yn cael eu cyrraedd.*

Cynigiad welliant 3: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn nodi gyda phryder bod sgiliau sylfaenol yng Nghymru bellach yn waeth nag ydynt mewn unrhyw wlad neu ranbarth arall yn y DU.*

Diolch i Susan Lewis, Prif Arolygydd Ei Mawrhydi dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant yng Nghymru, am adroddiad trylwyr a chynhwysfawr. Llongyfarchwn ddysgwyr ac athrawon Cymru ar y cyflawniadau calonogol sydd i'w gweld yn yr adroddiad hwn. Sylwn na fyddai'r rhain wedi bod yn bosibl heb eu gwaith caled hwy a gwaith caled hyfforddwyr ac arweinwyr ein hysgolion a'n sefydliadau addysg bellach. Mae'r cyflawniadau hyn yn fwy clodwiw byth o gofio'r amgylchedd addysg anodd a grëwyd gan Lywodraeth Lafur Cynulliad Cymru a'i Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, sy'n cael ei harwain gan weledigaethau iwtopaidd o realiti rhithwir braf yn cael eu rheoli gan y wladwriaeth a lle caiff llwyddiant ei fesur yn unol â faint o arian trethdalwyr a wastreffir, yn hytrach na'r adnoddau sydd mewn ysgolion a cholegau yn llinell flaen addysg.

Y gwir amdani, ar ôl chwe mlynedd o Lywodraeth Lafur yng Nghaerdydd sy'n gwario mwy ac yn cyflawni llai, ac wyth mlynedd o Lywodraeth debyg yn Llundain, yw fod gan bobl Cymru bellach sgiliau sylfaenol gwaeth a llai o ffyniant na thrigolion unrhyw wlad neu ranbarth arall yn y Deyrnas Unedig.

As this report states, national targets at key stage 4 and in further education institutions are being missed, too many learners aged over 16 do not have the qualifications that they need for good job prospects, and not enough of them have gained key skills qualifications. The failure of the Welsh Assembly Government to listen to, and work with, its front-line professionals was highlighted last month in a meeting that I had with a secondary school headteacher and chair of governors. This school has achieved the Wales secondary schools award for the transitional stage between primary school and high school, but the chair of governors told me that it was wrong that he should have to manage the school with a budget that is almost £0.25 million less than that of an equivalent school across the border in England. They stated that every headteacher will say that there are significant differences between schools in Wales and those in England, even in terms of the worst-funded areas in England. The poor condition of the school buildings was illustrated by the fact that water was collected in buckets from leaks in the computer room ceiling while students were working on electrical equipment.

The seriousness of the situation was highlighted by the Secondary Heads Association survey, which showed that schools in Wales, on average, lose out to the tune of £150 to £200 per pupil. Attempts to conceal this by including non-school education expenditure and claiming that comparative figures were unavailable has led the Secondary Heads Association Cymru to accuse the Welsh Assembly Government of misleading Assembly Members. This was reported in *The Times Educational Supplement* last Friday. A letter from an officer from the National Association of Headteachers states that the new money in the education system is wholly insufficient to fund this education Minister's major initiatives, and that the Welsh Assembly Government is simply propping up the underfunding with sums that were removed from other areas of education provision.

Fel y dywed yr adroddiad hwn, ni chaiff targedau cenedlaethol yng nghyfnod allweddol 4 ac mewn sefydliadau addysg bellach eu cyrraedd, mae gormod o ddysgwyr dros 16 oed nad oes ganddynt y cymwysterau angenrheidiol i gael swyddi da, ac nid oes digon ohonynt wedi ennill cymwysterau sgiliau sylfaenol. Tynnwyd sylw at fethiant Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wrando ar ei gweithwyr proffesiynol rheng flaen a gweithio gyda hwy mewn cyfarfod a gefais fis diwethaf gyda phennaeth ysgol uwchradd a chadeirydd llywodraethwyr. Mae'r ysgol hon wedi ennill gwobr ysgolion uwchradd Cymru am y cyfnod pontio rhwng yr ysgol gynradd a'r ysgol uwchradd. Ond dywedodd cadeirydd y llywodraethwyr wrthyf na ddylai orfod rheoli'r ysgol gyda chyllideb sydd bron £0.25 miliwn yn llai na chyllideb ysgol gyfatebol dros y ffin yn Lloegr. Maent yn dweud y bydd pob pennaeth yn dweud bod gwahaniaethau sylweddol rhwng ysgolion yng Nghymru ac ysgolion yn Lloegr, hyd yn oed o'u cymharu â'r ardaloedd a gaiff eu cyllido waethaf yn Lloegr. Amlygwyd cyflwr gwael adeiladau'r ysgol gan y ffaith fod dŵr a oedd yn gollwng drwy do'r ystafell gyfrifiaduron yn cael ei gasglu mewn bwcedi tra byddai myfyrwyr yn defnyddio offer trydan.

Tynnwyd sylw at ddifrifoldeb y sefyllfa gan arolwg Cymdeithas y Prifathrawon Uwchradd, a ddangosai fod ysgolion yng Nghymru, ar gyfartaledd, ar eu colled o rhwng £150 a £200 y disgybl. Mae ymdrechion i gelu hyn drwy gynnwys gwariant addysg nad yw'n wariant ar ysgolion, a thrwy honni nad oedd ffigurau tebyg ar gael, wedi arwain Cymdeithas y Prifathrawon Uwchradd, Cymru i gyhuddo Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o gamarwain Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Cafwyd adroddiad ar hyn yn *The Times Educational Supplement* ddydd Gwener diwethaf. Dywed llythyr gan un o swyddogion Cymdeithas Genedlaethol y Prifathrawon fod yr arian newydd yn y system addysg yn hollol annigonol i ariannu prif fentrau'r Gweinidog addysg hwn, ac mai dim ond cynnal y tanwariant gan symiau a dynnwyd o feysydd eraill mewn darpariaeth addysg y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Meanwhile, sixth-form headteachers have written to me to state that cuts in their budgets will push up class sizes in the lower schools further and reduce sixth-form options for students. As they say, they are rightly proud of the achievements of their post-16 learners, but are increasingly anxious about the cuts that they now face.

Welsh further education colleges have been suffering cuts in core funding, the widening participation agenda introduced by the Conservatives has come to a stop, staff are being made redundant, certainly in both the local colleges in my area, and most colleges are now in deficit.

The situation is best summed up in a letter sent to me by a Brecon resident, who stated that the claim made by Jane Davidson at the Welsh Labour Conference that Wales is a leading country for education and social justice is really 'gilding the lily', and that the claim is rendered untenable by the recent introduction of the second phase of the national basic skills strategy for Wales. In reality, compared with England and Scotland, Wales has a higher proportion of adults at working age without qualifications. The latest basic skills strategy consultation document shows that 24 per cent of Welsh adults have literacy skills below level 1 and that 53 per cent have numeracy skills below that level, which is measured as the standard of functional competence. In fact, 54,000 young people who have left school in Wales under Labour are now jobless, are not in training or education, and are hidden from the official unemployment figures.

As the 'Lost Children of Wales' report identified, as many as half the children in Wales are leaving education disappointed and ill prepared for employment. The report states that school inadvertently trains them in absenteeism as they devise ways to escape what they see as a raw deal. This mirrors the statement in an Estyn report, which notes that secondary schools with the lowest examination results are in poorer areas, where absenteeism also tends to be at its

Yn y cyfamser, mae penaethiaid chweched dosbarth wedi ysgrifennu ataf i ddweud y bydd toriadau yn eu cyllidebau yn cynyddu ymhellach faint dosbarthiadau yn yr ysgolion isaf, ac yn lleihau dewisiadau chweched dosbarth i fyfyrwyr. Fel y dywedant, maent yn ymfalchïo yng nghyflawniadau eu dysgwyr ar ôl 16 oed, a hynny'n briodol, ond maent yn gynyddol bryderus ynghylch y toriadau a wynebant yn awr.

Mae colegau addysg bellach Cymru wedi wynebu toriadau mewn cyllid craidd, mae'r broses o ehangu'r agenda gyfranogi a gyflwynwyd gan y Ceidwadwyr wedi dod i ben, mae staff yn colli swyddi, yn sicr yn y ddau goleg lleol yn fy ardal i, ac mae'r rhan fwyaf o golegau bellach mewn dyled.

Cryhoir y sefyllfa orau mewn llythyr a anfonwyd ataf gan un o drigolion Aberhonddu, a ddywedai mai gormodiaith yw'r honiad a wnaed gan Jane Davidson yng Nghynhadledd Lafur Cymru bod Cymru yn wlad flaenllaw o ran addysg a chyfiawnder cymdeithasol, ac na ellir cynnal yr honiad hwnnw yn sgîl cyflwyno ail gam y strategaeth genedlaethol sgiliau sylfaenol i Gymru yn ddiweddar. Mewn gwirionedd, o'i chymharu â Lloegr a'r Alban, mae yng Nghymru gyfran uwch o oedolion o oed gweithio sydd heb gymwysterau. Dengys dogfen ymgynghori ddiweddaraf y strategaeth sgiliau sylfaenol fod gan 24 y cant o oedolion Cymru sgiliau llythrennedd sy'n is na lefel 1, a bod gan 53 y cant sgiliau rhifedd o dan y lefel honno, a gaiff ei mesur fel safon cymhwysedd gweithredol. Yn wir, mae 54,000 o bobl ifanc sydd wedi gadael yr ysgol o dan Lafur bellach yn ddi-waith, ac nid ydynt yn cael hyfforddiant nac addysg na'u cynnwys yn y ffigurau diweithdra swyddogol.

Fel y dywedai'r adroddiad 'Lost Children of Wales', mae cynifer â hanner y plant yng Nghymru yn gadael addysg yn siomedig a heb gael eu paratoi ar gyfer swydd. Dywed yr adroddiad fod yr ysgol yn eu hyfforddi drwy amryfusedd i fod yn absennol wrth ddyfeisio ffyrdd i ddianc oddi wrth yr hyn sydd, yn eu barn hwn, yn fargen wael. Mae hyn yn adlewyrchu'r datganiad yn un o adroddiadau Estyn, sy'n dweud bod ysgolion uwchradd sydd â'r canlyniadau arholiadau

worst. This is the betrayal of a generation by this Government.

At the Welsh Labour conference, Jane Davidson was also euphoric about schools being the centre of the community with local schools for local people. However, she obviously gives those sentiments little credence when she has confirmed the closure of all 15 rural schools on which she was the final arbiter, and when Professor David Reynolds now reports that a further 200 small Welsh schools face closure because of Labour's 'short-sighted' and 'damaging' policy.

Contrary to Labour's cavalier way with facts, scorn for the process of Government and poor planning, a Conservative UK Government will provide an additional £15 billion for education, and increase the money received by Wales year on year—contrary to statements made by the First Minister. Just as Labour tried to blame its devastating—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Mark, you need to wind up in the next 10 to 15 seconds.

**Mark Isherwood:** I will conclude with the words of former Secretary of State, Lord Hunt, who stated that, since devolution, the size of the state in Wales has grown and grown and never, in the history of British politics, can so much have been spent, by so few, to so little effect.

**Peter Black:** I propose amendment 4 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*Notes that standards in work-based training remain a cause for concern and that the leadership and management of too many work-based training providers are unsatisfactory and calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to work with ELWA to review work-based training with the aim of dealing with the problems identified in this report.*

gwaethaf mewn ardaloedd tlotach, lle mae absenoldeb hefyd yn tueddu i fod ar ei waethaf. Mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn bradychu cenhedlaeth.

Yng nghynhadledd Llafur Cymru, yr oedd Jane Davidson yn frwd iawn hefyd am y ffaith bod ysgolion wrth wraidd y gymuned gan sicrhau bod ysgolion lleol i bobl leol. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg nad yw'n rhoi llawer o goel ar y safbwyntiau hynny, o gofio ei bod wedi cadarnhau y bydd pob un o'r 15 o ysgolion gwledig lle yr oedd hi'n gwneud y penderfyniad terfynol yn cau, ac o gofio bod yr Athro David Reynolds bellach yn nodi bod 200 o ysgolion bach eraill yng Nghymru yn wynebu eu cau oherwydd polisi anystyriol a niweidiol Llafur.

Yn groes i ffordd ddi-hid Llafur o drin ffeithiau, dirmyg tuag at broses Llywodraeth a chynllunio gwael, bydd Llywodraeth Geidwadol y DU yn rhoi £15 biliwn ychwanegol i addysg, ac yn cynyddu'r arian a gaiff Cymru o flwyddyn i flwyddyn—yn groes i ddatganiadau a wnaed gan y Prif Weinidog. Yn yr un modd ag y ceisiodd Llafur roi'r bai am ei—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mark, mae angen ichi ddirwyn i ben ymhen 10 neu 15 eiliad.

**Mark Isherwood:** Byddaf yn cloi gyda geiriau'r cyn Ysgrifennydd Gwladol, yr Arglwydd Hunt, a ddywedodd fod maint y wladwriaeth yng Nghymru, ers datganoli, wedi tyfu'n gynyddol, ac nad oes cymaint wedi'i wario erioed, yn holl hanes gwleidyddiaeth Prydain, gan gan lleied, gyda chyn lleied o effaith.

**Peter Black:** Cynigiaf welliant 4 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*Yn nodi bod safonau hyfforddiant yn seiliedig ar waith yn parhau i achosi pryder, a bod arweiniad a rheolaeth gormod o ddarparwyr hyfforddiant yn seiliedig ar waith yn anfodddhaol, ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i weithio gydag ELWA i adolygu hyfforddiant yn seiliedig ar waith gyda'r nod o fynd i'r afael â'r problemau a nodwyd yn yr adroddiad*

As Mark Isherwood did, I congratulate Susan Lewis and Estyn for another excellent report. I will not aim for the levels of hyperbole that Mark managed to achieve, but there are issues in the report that need to be addressed, and the Minister has acknowledged that in accepting amendment 4. I welcome the fact that she has accepted the amendment.

Work-based learning is an issue that must be tackled and we need to give the Government some credit for accepting that that is the case and that we need to work with ELWa to put that right. Work-based learning is a key element of the Government's agenda, particularly in post-16 education. If we are to have a level playing field in terms of academic and vocational qualifications, we have to get work-based learning right, and that type of learning must reach the highest possible standards. My one concern is that this improvement needs to be driven forward over the next year or so, and to what extent will ELWa's staff be distracted by the ongoing talks of a merger? I hope that the Minister is able to give us an assurance that the merger will not be a distraction for them, and that this will be one of their highest priorities, along with the many other issues in terms of getting this aspect right.

It would be churlish not to acknowledge that there are good things in the report, and the Minister has outlined some of those, including the improvement in standards. All of us, as Assembly Members, get the school reports for our areas on our desks and we can see that the number of schools that get 'good' or 'very good' ratings in their Estyn assessments has certainly improved since I have been receiving those reports. That must be acknowledged.

We must also put this matter in perspective. Mark raised a number of issues and reeled off a load of statistics, but I have been a councillor in Swansea since 1984 and I remember the mid 1990s when schools were struggling with the level of resources made available to them. I remember the new unitary authority council in Swansea

*hwn.*

Fel Mark Isherwood, yr wyf yn llongyfarch Susan Lewis ac Estyn ar adroddiad ardderchog arall. Ni cheisiaf adleisio'r ormodiaith y llwyddodd Mark i'w chyfleu, ond mae materion yn yr adroddiad y mae angen ymdrin â hwy, ac mae'r Gweinidog wedi cydnabod hynny wrth dderbyn gwelliant 4. Croesawaf y ffaith ei bod wedi derbyn y gwelliant.

Mae dysgu sy'n seiliedig ar waith yn fater y mae'n rhaid mynd i'r afael ag ef, ac mae angen inni roi rhywfaint o glod i'r Llywodraeth am dderbyn bod hynny'n wir, a bod angen inni gydweithio ag ELWa i unioni hynny. Mae dysgu sy'n seiliedig ar waith yn un o elfennau allweddol agenda'r Llywodraeth, yn arbennig o ran addysg ar ôl 16 oed. Er mwyn sicrhau bod gennym sylfaen gyfartal o ran cymwysterau academiaidd a galwedigaethol, rhaid inni ddarparu dysgu'n seiliedig ar waith priodol, a rhaid i'r math hwnnw o ddysgu gyrraedd y safonau uchaf posibl. Fy mhryder i yw bod angen hybu'r gwelliant hwn yn ystod y flwyddyn nesaf, ac i ba raddau y bydd y trafodaethau sy'n mynd mynd ymlaen ynglŷn ag uno yn tynnu sylw staff ELWa? Gobeithio y gall y Gweinidog sicrhau na fydd yr uno yn tynnu eu sylw, ac y bydd hyn yn un o'u prif flaenoriaethau, ynghyd â'r materion niferus eraill o ran sicrhau bod yr agwedd hon yn gywir.

Byddai'n anfoesgar peidio â chydabod bod pethau da yn yr adroddiad, ac mae'r Gweinidog wedi amlinellu rhai o'r rhain, gan gynnwys y safonau gwell. Mae pob un ohonom, fel Aelodau Cynulliad, yn cael adroddiadau'r ysgolion yn ein hardaloedd, a gallwn weld bod nifer yr ysgolion sy'n cael graddau 'da' neu 'da iawn' yn eu hasesiadau Estyn yn sicr wedi gwella ers imi ddechrau cael yr adroddiadau hynny. Rhaid cydnabod hynny.

Rhaid inni roi'r mater hwn yn ei gyd-destun hefyd. Cododd Mark nifer o faterion a rhestrodd nifer o ystadegau, ond yr wyf wedi bod yn gynghorydd yn Abertawe er 1984, a chofiaf ganol yr 1990au pan oedd ysgolion yn cael anawsterau oherwydd yr adnoddau a neilltuwyd iddynt. Cofiaf gyngor yr awdurdod unedol newydd yn Abertawe yn

effectively telling schools that it could not afford to fully fund the teachers' pay rise one year, and that schools would have to find that money from their own resources. Things are not that bad now. It may well be that we all want to see more money going into schools and better investment in school buildings—many things could be better—but the situation has never been as bad as it was in 1994, 1995, 1996 and 1997, before the funding stream started to be turned around. We need to acknowledge that and give credit where credit is due.

Having said that, the report does highlight some issues. Apart from work-based learning, pupil examination results at key stage 4 are a long way short of national targets. That has been highlighted in the report and it gives cause for concern. Too many learners over the age of 16 do not have the qualifications that they need for good job prospects and not enough of them have gained key skills qualifications. That is of concern, particularly in relation to the vocational agenda that the Assembly Government is pursuing. Also included are the old chestnuts that boys are not doing as well as girls at any stage of their education, and schools are not doing enough to improve boys' performance. I am not sure whether we will ever overcome that obstacle, but the issue is highlighted year-in year-out in Estyn reports. We must be aware of that in terms of how we plan the education of children in the future.

4.00 p.m.

On further education institutions, standards are 'good' or 'very good' in 60 per cent of programme areas, which, again, is below the national target of 70 per cent. There are a number of targets that the Government has set itself that are not being met, and which this Estyn report highlights. I would hope that the Minister, in response to this debate, and in the course of the next year, would put investment and work into trying to put that right. Things are improving, but they are not quite as we would like them to be. We need

dweud wrth ysgolion, fwy neu lai, na allai fforddio ariannu'r codiad cyflog i athrawon yn llawn un flwyddyn, ac y byddai'n rhaid i ysgolion ddod o hyd i'r arian hwnnw o'u hadnoddau eu hunain. Nid yw pethau cynddrwg â hynny yn awr. Efallai fod pob un ohonom am weld mwy o arian yn mynd i ysgolion a mwy o fuddsoddiad mewn adeiladau ysgolion—gallai llawer o bethau fod yn well—ond nid yw'r sefyllfa erioed wedi bod cynddrwg ag oedd yn 1994, 1995, 1996 a 1997, cyn dechrau newid y ffrwd ariannu. Mae angen inni gydnabod hynny a rhoi clod lle mae'n ddyledus.

Wedi dweud hynny, mae'r adroddiad yn tynnu sylw at rai materion. Ar wahân i ddysgu'n seiliedig ar waith, nid yw canlyniadau arholiadau disgyblion yng nghyfnod allweddol 4 yn cyrraedd y targedau cenedlaethol o bell ffordd. Tynnwyd sylw at hynny yn yr adroddiad ac mae'n peri pryder. Mae gormod o ddysgwyr dros 16 oed nad oes ganddynt y cymwysterau angenrheidiol i gael swydd dda, ac nid oes digon ohonynt wedi ennill cymwysterau sgiliau allweddol. Mae hynny'n peri pryder, yn arbennig mewn perthynas â'r agenda alwedigaethol a ddilynir gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae yna'r hen ddadleuon hefyd nad yw bechgyn yn gwneud cystal â merched ar unrhyw adeg yn eu haddysg, ac nad yw ysgolion yn gwneud digon i wella perfformiad bechgyn. Nid wyf yn siŵr a fyddwn byth yn goresgyn y rhwystr hwnnw, ond tynnir sylw at y mater bob blwyddyn yn adroddiadau Estyn. Rhaid inni fod yn ymwybodol o hynny o ran y ffordd y cynlluniwn addysg plant yn y dyfodol.

O ran sefydliadau addysg bellach, mae safonau 'da' neu 'da iawn' mewn 60 y cant o feysydd rhaglenni, sydd, unwaith eto, yn is na'r targed cenedlaethol o 70 y cant. Mae yna nifer o dargedau y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi gosod nifer o dargedau iddi'i hun ac nad ydynt yn cael eu cyflawni, ac mae'r adroddiad hwn gan Estyn yn tynnu sylw at hyn. Byddwn yn gobeithio y byddai'r Gweinidog, wrth ymateb i'r ddadl hon, ac yn ystod y flwyddyn nesaf, yn neilltuo arian ac ymdrech i geisio i unioni hynny. Mae



to have that investment in terms of finance and in commitment on the part of all partners to get these issues right in the future.

**Denise Idris Jones:** I also welcome this good report from the chief inspector and commend all teachers and pupils across Wales on their hard work, which has led to such strides forward in learning. In contrast to Mark's negative attitude, there is much to celebrate about the last five years, as the report states. Some of the biggest improvements have been made in the last 12 months, and the Labour Assembly Government must share in the credit for those improving standards, which have been achieved in partnership with education stakeholders across Wales, under the direction of our vision for Wales, 'The Learning Country'. While the chief inspector describes the standard achieved by pupils in primary and secondary schools as a big improvement, the standard achieved by special educational needs pupils as much higher than it was five years ago, and test results in key stages 2 and 3 as greatly improved, the praise is not limited to school-based learning. However, as a mother of two sons, one of whom is still at school, it is a concern for me—and as a former teacher I was always aware of this—that boys continue to underachieve.

The chief inspector also states that there are clear signs that other areas of education and training in Wales have moved on too, stating in particular that the New Deal programme is succeeding in helping many of its clients to find work each year, and that the quality of training under the New Deal is good. Looking forward, not back, with the roll-out of the 14-19 learning pathways, and a champion to bridge education and the business sector, the second skills and employment action plan and the extra investment in early years education, I am confident that we have already put in place measures to move beyond the plateau reached in some examination results, and improve

pethau'n gwella, ond nid ydynt cystal ag yr hoffem iddynt fod. Mae angen y buddsoddiad hwnnw o ran cyllid ac ymrwymiad gan yr holl bartneriaid, er mwyn sicrhau bod y materion hyn yn iawn yn y dyfodol.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Yr wyf fi hefyd yn croesawu'r adroddiad da hwn gan y prif arolygydd, ac yr wyf yn cymeradwyo'r holl athrawon a'r disgyblion ledled Cymru am eu gwaith caled, sydd wedi arwain at y camau breision mewn dysgu. Yn wahanol i agwedd negyddol Mark, mae llawer i'w ddatlu ynghylch y pum mlynedd diwethaf, fel y dywed yr adroddiad. Gwnaed rhai o'r gwelliannau mwyaf yn ystod y 12 mis diwethaf, a rhaid i Lywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad gael rhywfaint o'r clod am y safonau hynny sy'n gwella ac a sicrhawyd mewn partneriaeth â rhanddeiliaid addysg ledled Cymru, o dan gyfarwyddyd ein gweledigaeth ar gyfer Cymru, 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu'. Er bod y prif arolygydd yn disgrifio'r safon a gyflawnwyd gan ddisgyblion mewn ysgolion cynradd ac uwchradd fel gwelliant mawr, y safon a gyflawnwyd gan ddisgyblion anghenion addysgol arbennig fel safon lawer uwch nag yr oedd bum mlynedd yn ôl, a chanlyniadau profion cyfnodau allweddol 2 a 3 fel canlyniadau gwell o lawer, nid yw'r ganmoliaeth yn gyfyngedig i ddysgu mewn ysgolion. Fodd bynnag, fel mam i ddau fab, ac un ohonynt yn dal yn yr ysgol, mae'n bryder imi—ac fel cyn-athrawes yr oeddwn bob amser yn ymwybodol o hyn—fod bechgyn yn parhau i dangyflawni.

Dywed y prif arolygydd hefyd fod arwyddion clir o ddatblygiad mewn meysydd eraill mewn addysg a hyfforddiant yng Nghymru yn ogystal, gan nodi'n arbennig fod rhaglen y Fargen Newydd yn llwyddo i helpu nifer o'i chleientiaid i ddod o hyd i waith bob blwyddyn. Sonia hefyd fod ansawdd yr hyfforddiant o dan y Fargen Newydd yn dda. I edrych ymlaen, ac nid yn ôl, gyda dyfodiad y rhaglen llwybrau dysgu 14-19, a hyrwyddwr i bontio'r sector addysg a'r sector busnes, yr ail gynllun gweithredu sgiliau a chyflogaeth, a'r buddsoddiad ychwanegol mewn addysg blynyddoedd cynnar, yr wyf yn hyderus ein bod eisoes wedi sefydlu mesurau i symud y tu hwnt i'r

work-based learning.

While we can be proud that our vision for Wales, the learning country, is ever nearer, we—learners, teachers and Government—must continue to press forward and grasp it.

**Janet Ryder:** I add Plaid Cymru's congratulations to those of the other two parties to Susan Lewis on a very wide-ranging report. Given its wide-ranging nature, I will highlight one or two issues only.

It does show a very impressive and encouraging set of achievements, made within a relatively short space of time, but it also makes it very clear that, those improvements would not have happened without the hard work and dedication of the teaching and training staff in Wales. That is in contrast to Denise, who said that these were Government achievements. The quality of teaching in schools has improved greatly over the last five years, and it continues to improve. I pay tribute to our teachers, who have delivered these improvements. It is the quality of teaching that, above all else, makes a real difference to how children learn. Yet I would question whether a continued rise in quality can be maintained if a child is not taught by a qualified, registered teacher for part of the week. The Assembly should put on record its thanks and gratitude to our teaching staff, and congratulate them on delivering the improvements noted in this report.

While these improvements have been achieved as a result of the goodwill of the teaching staff, that goodwill is a finite pot, and the Government must not test it too hard. I believe that those improvements are being jeopardised by a number of issues that impact on staff. While I do not doubt that there has been an increase in the amount of money going into schools, schools themselves have had to face the introduction of several new initiatives that have not been fully funded. That underfunding puts jobs at risk and leads to insecurity for teachers. There has been an

lefel wastad a gyrhaeddwyd mewn rhai canlyniadau arholiadau, ac i wella dysgu sy'n seiliedig ar waith.

Er y gallwn ymfalchïo yn y ffaith fod ein gweledigaeth ar gyfer Cymru, y wlad sy'n dysgu, gam yn nes, rhaid inni—yn ddysgwyr, athrawon a'r Llywodraeth—barhau i ddwyn y maen i'r wal.

**Janet Ryder:** Hoffwn ychwanegu llongyfarchion Plaid Cymru at longyfarchion y ddwy blaid arall i Susan Lewis am adroddiad sy'n eang iawn ei gwmpas. O ystyried ei natur gynhwysfawr, tynnaf sylw at un neu ddau fater yn unig.

Mae'n dangos cyfres drawiadol a chalonogol o gyflawniadau, a hynny mewn cyfnod cymharol fyr. Ond mae hefyd yn nodi'n glir iawn na fyddai'r gwelliannau hynny wedi digwydd heb waith caled ac ymrwymiad y staff addysgu a hyfforddi yng Nghymru. Mae hynny'n groes i'r hyn a ddywedodd Denise, sef mai cyflawniadau'r Llywodraeth oedd y rhain. Mae ansawdd yr addysgu mewn ysgolion wedi gwella'n sylweddol dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf, ac mae'n parhau i wella. Rhof deyrnged i'n hathrawon, sydd wedi sicrhau'r gwelliannau hyn. Ansawdd y dysgu, yn anad dim arall, sy'n gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol yn y ffordd y bydd plant yn dysgu. Er hynny, byddwn yn amau a ellir cynnal cynnydd parhaus mewn ansawdd os na chaiff plentyn ei addysgu gan athro cymwys cofrestredig am ran o'r wythnos. Dylai'r Cynulliad gofnodi ei ddiolch i'n staff addysgu, a'u llongyfarch am sicrhau'r gwelliannau a nodwyd yn yr adroddiad hwn.

Er i'r gwelliannau hyn gael eu sicrhau o ganlyniad i ewyllys da'r staff addysgu, nid pwll diwaelod mo'r ewyllys da hwnnw, ac ni ddylai'r Llywodraeth fynd ar eu gofyn yn ormodol. Credaf fod nifer o faterion sy'n effeithio ar staff yn peryglu'r gwelliannau hynny. Er nad oes gennyf amheuaeth bod cynnydd wedi bod yn yr arian sy'n mynd i ysgolion, mae'r ysgolion eu hunain wedi gorfod wynebu nifer o fentrau newydd nad ydynt wedi'u hariannu'n llawn. Mae'r diffyg ariannu hwnnw'n peryglu swyddi ac yn arwain at ansicrwydd ymhlith athrawon. Bu

increase in the number of short-term contracts awarded, which again creates insecurity.

From September, the introduction of the teachers' workload agreement could, perversely, lead to teacher redundancies and to classes being taken by non-qualified support staff on their own. Many headteachers and teachers' unions share this concern but, apparently, the First Minister and the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning do not. Only yesterday in this Chamber, the First Minister said that many classes did very well with classroom assistants and even advocated a massive increase in class sizes as a way around the problem of implementing the workload agreement. So much for trying to raise the standards of the teaching profession and, through that, the educational achievements of our children. No wonder then that, in the remit letter for 2005-06, the Minister asks for advice on the impact of the national workload agreement upon rising standards. The workload agreement, if properly funded to allow qualified, registered teachers to provide cover, will raise standards; if it is underfunded, it will not. For classroom assistants and higher-level classroom assistants, there is no national pay code nor a national level set for training, and that will have implications for continued improvement.

The report also draws the link between underachievement and economic and social disadvantage, stating that the secondary schools with the poorest examination results are, as we all know, in the poorest areas. For the last five years, the percentage of pupils who gain at least five grade A\* to C GCSEs or equivalent have not risen a great deal. Yet inspectors judged that almost all of the lowest performing schools are providing an acceptable standard of education and that many are doing well in particularly difficult circumstances. Most of the 20 or so schools with the poorest examination performances are in disadvantaged areas. In these circumstances, factors other than the school and the quality of teachers impact upon the learner. Many pupils have encouragement and support from home, but some grow up

cynnydd yn nifer y contractau byrdymor a ddyfarnwyd, sydd, unwaith eto, yn creu ansicrwydd.

O fis Medi, yn groes i'r disgwyl, gallai cyflwyno cytundeb llwyth gwaith athrawon arwain at ddiswyddo athrawon ac at weld staff cymorth anghymwys yn cymryd dosbarthiadau ar eu pen eu hunain. Mae nifer o benaethiaid ac undebau athrawon hefyd yn pryderu am hyn, ond mae'n amlwg nad yw'r Prif Weinidog na'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn pryderu. Ddoe yn unig y dywedodd y Prif Weinidog fod nifer o ddsbarthiadau yn gwneud yn dda iawn gyda chynorthwywyr ystafell ddsbarth, gan ddadlau dros gynnydd enfawr ym maint y dosbarthiadau fel modd i ddatrys y broblem o weithredu'r cytundeb llwyth gwaith. Digon hawdd sôn am geisio codi safonau'r proffesiwn addysg, a thrwy hynny gyflawniadau addysgol ein plant. Nid oes ryfedd felly fod y Gweinidog yn gofyn yn y llythyr cylch gwaith ar gyfer 2005-06 am gyngor ar effaith y cytundeb llwyth gwaith ar safonau sy'n codi. Os ariennir y cytundeb llwyth gwaith yn iawn i ganiatáu ar gyfer athrawon cyflenwi cymwys, cofrestredig, bydd yn codi safonau; os na cheir ariannu digonol, ni fydd yn codi safonau. Nid oes cod cyflog cenedlaethol na lefel genedlaethol ar gyfer hyfforddiant i gynorthwywyr ystafell ddsbarth a chynorthwywyr ystafell ddsbarth uwch, a bydd gan hynny oblygiadau ar gyfer gwelliannau parhaus.

Mae'r adroddiad hefyd yn nodi'r cysylltiad rhwng tangyflawni ac anfantais economaidd a chymdeithasol, gan ddweud mai'r ysgolion uwchradd sydd â'r canlyniadau arholiadau gwaethaf yw'r rheini, fel y gwyddom, sydd yn yr ardaloedd tlotaf. Am y pum mlynedd diwethaf, nid yw canran y disgyblion sy'n ennill o leiaf bum gradd TGAU A\* i C neu lefel gyfatebol wedi codi ryw lawer. Ac eto, barn yr arolygwyr yw bod ymron i bob un o'r ysgolion sy'n perfformio waethaf yn darparu safon dderbyniol o addysg a bod nifer yn gwneud yn dda o dan amgylchiadau arbennig o anodd. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r 20 ysgol neu fwy hynny sydd â'r perfformiad gwaethaf o ran canlyniadau arholiadau mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig. O dan yr amgylchiadau hyn, mae ffactorau y tu hwnt i'r ysgol ac ansawdd yr athrawon yn

with a negative attitude about the value of education, which is reinforced by family members and others who influence them. If we are to produce true equality of opportunity, that negative attitude in society needs to be changed.

It has been recognised that additional financial support also needs to be given to those schools. That support needs to go to the school, and not necessarily to be attached to the pupil. The new funding formula from ELWa attaches the deprivation weighting to the pupil. That is, any extra money to compensate and to provide extra facilities for that pupil are attached to the pupil. That is fine until the pupil, for whatever reason, moves school or college. He or she may then take up a place in an institution that is well funded, is not in an area of deprivation, and which is able to develop those extra support services. While that institution may benefit as a result, it is dubious how much more the individual pupil will benefit, and it also takes away funding from the schools or colleges that really need it. We need to look again at this issue and consider whether or not some or all of that funding should be attached to the institutions in the areas of most need.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Meeting the needs of pupils and giving them choice and support, as well as filling local skills gaps, are all goals set out in 'The Learning Country', and the chief inspector has said that Wales has seen five years of successive improvements in our standard indicators.

The standards that children under the age of five achieve, the standards in primary and secondary schools, special educational needs achievements, and results in key stages 2 and 3 are all up, and the trend is for continued improvement for the foreseeable future. However, there is clearly more to do. Driving up skills in line with the skills gap, making work-based learning work for more pupils,

effeithio ar y dysgwr. Mae nifer o ddisgyblion yn cael anogaeth a chymorth gartref. Ond mae rhai yn cael eu magu gydag agwedd negyddol at werth addysg, ac atgyfnerthir hynny gan aelodau'r teulu ac eraill sy'n dylanwadu arnynt. Er mwyn creu cyfle cyfartal gwirioneddol, mae angen inni newid yr agwedd negyddol honno mewn cymdeithas.

Cydnabuwyd bod angen rhoi cymorth ariannol ychwanegol i'r ysgolion hynny. Mae angen i'r cymorth hwnnw gael ei roi i'r ysgol heb fod yn gysylltiedig â'r disgybl o reidrwydd. Mae'r fformiwla ariannu newydd gan ELWa yn cysylltu'r pwysoliad amddifadedd â'r disgybl. Hynny yw, mae unrhyw arian ychwanegol i wneud iawn i'r disgybl hwnnw ac i ddarparu cyfleusterau ychwanegol ar ei gyfer yn gysylltiedig â'r disgybl. Mae hynny'n iawn, nes bydd y disgybl, am ba reswm bynnag, yn symud ysgol neu goleg. Gall ef neu hi fynd i sefydliad sydd wedi'i ariannu'n dda, nad yw mewn ardal o amddifadedd, ac sy'n gallu datblygu'r gwasanaethau cymorth ychwanegol hynny. Er y gall y sefydliad hwnnw elwa o ganlyniad, mae amheuaeth ynghylch faint yn fwy y bydd y disgybl unigol yn elwa, ac mae hefyd yn amddifadu'r ysgolion neu'r colegau hynny o'r arian y mae arnynt ei angen yn wirioneddol. Mae angen inni ailedrych ar y mater hwn ac ystyried a ddylid cysylltu rhan o'r arian hwnnw neu'r cyfan â'r sefydliadau yn yr ardaloedd mwyaf anghenus.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Mae diwallu anghenion disgyblion a rhoi dewis a chymorth iddynt, yn ogystal â llenwi'r bylchau sgiliau lleol, i gyd yn nodau amlinellir yn 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu', ac mae'r prif arolygydd wedi dweud bod Cymru wedi gweld pum mlynedd o welliannau yn olynol yn ein dangosyddion safonau.

Bu cynnydd yn y safonau a gyflawnir gan blant o dan bump oed, y safonau mewn ysgolion cynradd ac uwchradd, cyflawniadau anghenion addysgol arbennig a chanlyniadau cyfnodau allweddol 2 a 3, ac mai'r duedd yw gweld gwelliannau parhaus am y dyfodol. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg bod mwy i'w wneud. Mae cynyddu sgiliau yn unol â'r bwllch sgiliau, sicrhau bod dysgu sy'n

and ensuring that barriers are lifted to enable schools to fully capitalise on the benefits of the 14-19 learning pathways, are all areas where there is work still to be done.

The Conservatives have proposed three wholly negative amendments, and have made no attempt to suggest constructive solutions to the problems that they claim exist.

As many in the Chamber will know, I have a special interest in vocational education. That includes work-based learning, and driving up skills to meet the needs of employers. Estyn's view that standards in work-based training are a cause for concern is deeply worrying for us all. That is why I will support the Liberal Democrat amendment on work-based learning, and I urge employers and sector skills councils to take far greater interest in the provision and delivery of work-based learning.

4.10 p.m.

Providing a relevant and engaging programme of vocational education is essential if we are to meet the needs of our young people. The 14-19 learning pathways are clearly a good way forward. Partnership working by local networks, engaged with young people, will deliver a system of education that aims to provide real choice and opportunity, and greater take-up of vocational education will improve achievement in key skills. After all, key skills are the link between education and the workplace, and the more vocational education is available to young people, the more relevant to them and achievable the key skills will be. Collaboration and partnerships within and between schools and colleges will harness the benefits of the 14-19 learning pathways and drive up standards still further. Securing choice for our pupils requires closer working by schools to reduce duplication and enable the synchronisation of timetables, which is a major barrier to pupil choice.

seiliedig ar waith yn gweithio i fwy o ddisgyblion, a sicrhau dileu rhwystrau i alluogi ysgolion i elwa'n llawn ar fanteision llwybrau dysgu 14-19, oll yn feysydd lle mae angen gwaith pellach.

Mae'r Ceidwadwyr wedi cynnig tri gwelliant cwbl negyddol heb unrhyw ymgais i awgrymu atebion adeiladol i'r problemau y maent yn honni eu bod yn bodoli.

Fel y gŵyr nifer yn y Siambr, mae gennyf ddi-ddordeb arbennig mewn addysg alwedigaethol. Mae hynny'n cynnwys dysgu sy'n seiliedig ar waith, a chynyddu sgiliau i ddiwallu anghenion cyflogwyr. Mae barn Estyn fod safonau ym maes hyfforddiant sy'n seiliedig ar waith yn achosi pryder yn achosi bryder mawr inni oll. Dyna pam y byddaf yn cefnogi gwelliant y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ar ddysgu'n seiliedig ar waith, ac anogaf gyflogwyr a chynghorau sgiliau sector i gymryd mwy o ddi-ddordeb yn narpariaeth dysgu'n seiliedig ar waith a'r broses o'i gyflwyno.

Mae darparu rhaglen berthnasol ac ysgogol o addysg alwedigaethol yn hanfodol os ydym i ddiwallu anghenion ein pobl ifanc. Mae llwybrau dysgu 14-19 yn amlwg yn ffordd dda ymlaen. Bydd gwaith partneriaeth gan rwydweithiau lleol, sy'n ymwneud â phobl ifanc, yn cyflwyno system addysg sy'n anelu at roi dewis a chyfle gwirioneddol, a bydd cynnydd yn niferoedd y rheini sy'n dewis dilyn addysg alwedigaethol yn gwella cyflawniadau mewn sgiliau allweddol. Wedi'r cyfan, sgiliau allweddol yw'r cyswllt rhwng addysg a'r gweithle, a pho fwyaf o addysg alwedigaethol sydd ar gael i bobl ifanc, y mwyaf perthnasol fydd y sgiliau allweddol iddynt a bydd y sgiliau allweddol hynny yn fwy cyflawnadwy. Bydd cydweithredu a phartneriaethau rhwng ysgolion a cholegau ac mewn ysgolion a cholegau yn harneisio buddiannau llwybrau dysgu 14-19, gan wella safonau hyd yn oed ymhellach. Er mwyn sicrhau dewis i'n disgyblion, mae angen mwy o gydweithio rhwng ysgolion i leihau achosion o ddyblygu ac i alluogi'r broses o gydamseru amserlenni, sef rhwystr mawr i ddewisiadau disgyblion.

The Caerphilly basin in my constituency is the site of collaboration between four schools—Bedwas Comprehensive School, St Cennydd Comprehensive School, St Ilans Comprehensive School and St Martins Comprehensive School. Former competitors are now joint stakeholders and former rivals are now partners in a shared goal, and there have been clear improvements. Pupils now have much more choice about the type of classes they take, attendance is up and resources are better channelled. They are working towards many of the aims of the 14-19 learning pathways. However, it is essential that, during this change, things are not lost. If we want to secure rising standards and greater choice, businesses, both locally and nationally, must fully engage with us in identifying the skills gap. Local businesses must be active partners within community consortia for education and training. Business representatives must work with the sector skills councils, and all must pull together to package these skills shortages into courses that pupils will want to take up. There is no point identifying a skills gap if pupils do not want to take up the skills choices presented to them. This is why engaging with local networks is so important in implementing the changes for 14 to 19-year-olds.

Vocational and academic education have equal status among employers, and, in many cases, vocational education has greater status. However, convincing students and their parents of this is a difficult challenge. We must continue to hit home that vocational pathways are as valid as academic qualifications. A route that combines both academic and vocational education is clearly an ideal stepping stone to achieving parity of esteem. The Welsh baccalaureate fits this task perfectly. The baccalaureate delivers an excellent balance of modern skills to pupils in a relevant way and its roll-out throughout Wales must be welcomed. As we move further, and as ELWa and the WDA move in-house, we will have additional opportunities to ensure that the changes that we make deliver real educational benefits. I welcome this report, and I look forward to further progress in delivering reforms to work-based learning provision in Wales.

Mae basn Caerffili yn fy etholaeth i yn dyst i gydweithredu rhwng pedair ysgol - Ysgol Gyfun Bedwas, Ysgol Gyfun Sant Cennydd, Ysgol Gyfun Sant Ilan ac Ysgol Gyfun Sant Martin. Mae ysgolion a fu unwaith yn cystadlu bellach yn gyd-randdeiliaid ac yn bartneriaid gyda nod cyffredin, a gwelwyd gwelliannau amlwg o'r herwydd. Bellach mae gan ddisgyblion lawer mwy o ddewis o ran y math o ddosbarthiadau y maent yn eu cymryd, mae presenoldeb yn well a'r adnoddau'n cael eu cyfeirio'n well. Maent yn gweithio tuag at nifer o nodau'r llwybrau dysgu 14-19. Fodd bynnag, mae'n hanfodol i bethau beidio â mynd ar goll yn ystod y newid hwn. Os ydym i sicrhau safonau gwell a mwy o ddewis, rhaid i fusnesau, yn lleol ac yn genedlaethol, ymgysylltu'n llwyr â ni wrth nodi'r bwlch sgiliau. Rhaid i fusnesau lleol fod yn bartneriaid gweithredol o fewn consortia cymunedol ar gyfer addysg a hyfforddiant. Rhaid i gynrychiolwyr busnes weithio gyda'r cynghorau sgiliau sector, a rhaid i bawb uno i grynhoi'r prinder sgiliau hwn yn gyrsiau a fydd yn denu disgyblion. Nid oes diben nodi bwlch sgiliau os nad yw'r disgyblion am ymgymryd â'r dewisiadau sgiliau a gyflwynir iddynt. Dyna pam mae mor bwysig ymgysylltu â rhwydweithiau lleol wrth weithredu'r dewisiadau ar gyfer pobl ifanc 14-19 oed.

Mae statws cyfartal i addysg alwedigaethol ac academiaidd ymhlith cyflogwyr, ac mewn llawer achos mae statws uwch i addysg alwedigaethol. Fodd bynnag, mae'n anodd argyhoeddi myfyrwyr a'u rheini o hyn. Rhaid inni barhau i bwysleisio bod llwybrau galwedigaethol mor ddilys â chymwysterau academiaidd. Mae llwybr sy'n cyfuno addysg academiaidd a galwedigaethol yn amlwg yn gam delfrydol tuag at sicrhau parch cyfartal. Mae Bagloriaeth Cymru yn gweddu'n berffaith i'r dasg hon. Mae'r fagloriaeth yn cynnig cydbwysedd ardderchog o sgiliau modern i ddisgyblion mewn modd perthnasol, a rhaid croesawu'r rhaglen a'i chyflwyno ledled Cymru. Wrth inni symud ymhellach, ac wrth i ELWa a WDA ddod o dan yr un to, bydd cyfleoedd pellach inni sicrhau y bydd y newidiadau a wnawn yn sicrhau buddiannau addysgol gwirioneddol. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r adroddiad hwn, ac edrychaf ymlaen at gynnydd pellach wrth

wireddu'r diwygiadau yn y ddarpariaeth ddysgu sy'n seiliedig ar waith yng Nghymru.

**Lisa Francis:** This report is both revelatory and interesting. There has been much talk lately about NIEETs, which is nothing to do with head lice, but a newly-identified group of jobless young people. NIEETs stands for 'not in education, employment or training', and Wales has more of these young people than England—12 per cent of 16 to 18-year-olds in Wales are unemployed and not in any form of education, compared to 9 per cent in England. Seventeen per cent of the working-age population here do not have any qualifications, and, as has been said by other colleagues, basic skills are far more scarce here than in England. I am particularly interested to know how many people who fall into the category of NIEET have been identified by the keeping in touch initiative since last year, and what is being done at present to help those people. It would also be particularly helpful to know the numbers of 16 to 18-year-olds not in education or training in each year since 1996-97 to 2002-03. I believe that that number has increased from 26,500 to 31,200.

**Lisa Francis:** Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn ddi-ddorol ac yn datgelu llawer. Bu cryn siarad yn ddiweddar am grŵp sydd newydd ei nodi, sef pobl nad ydynt mewn addysg, cyflogaeth na hyfforddiant. Mae gan Gymru mwy o'r bobl ifanc hyn na Lloegr—mae 12 y cant o bobl ifanc rhwng 16 a 18 oed yng Nghymru yn ddi-waith ac nid ydynt yn dilyn unrhyw fath o addysg, o'u cymharu â 9 y cant yn Lloegr. Nid oes gan 17 y cant o'r boblogaeth oed gweithio yng Nghymru unrhyw gymwysterau, ac fel y dywedwyd gan gyd-Aelodau eraill, mae sgiliau sylfaenol yn brinnach o lawer yma nag yn Lloegr. Yr wyf yn arbennig o awyddus i wybod faint o bobl yn y categori hwn o bobl nad ydynt mewn addysg, cyflogaeth na hyfforddiant sydd wedi'u nodi gan y fenter cadw mewn cysylltiad ers y llynedd, a'r hyn sy'n cael ei wneud ar hyn o bryd i helpu'r bobl hynny. Byddai hefyd yn arbennig o ddefnyddiol gwybod niferoedd y bobl ifanc rhwng 16 a 18 oed nad ydynt mewn addysg na hyfforddiant am bob blwyddyn er 1996-97 i 2002-03. Credaf fod y nifer hwnnw wedi cynyddu o 26,500 i 31,200.

The report states that the New Deal programme is succeeding in helping many of its clients to find work each year. It says that the quality of programmes has improved, and that it is now good. How is the quality of the New Deal being benchmarked? How many people in Wales have found sustainable employment as a result of the New Deal? UK-wide, the New Deal has cost £5 billion, but my figures say that only 37 per cent of young people, and just 23 per cent of people aged over 25, have found sustained work through the scheme. Do we know what the scheme is achieving in Wales?

Dywed yr adroddiad fod rhaglen y Fargen Newydd yn llwyddo i helpu nifer o'i chleientiaid i ddod o hyd i waith bob blwyddyn. Dywed fod ansawdd y rhaglenni wedi gwella a'u bod bellach yn dda. Sut y meincnodir ansawdd y Fargen Newydd? Faint o bobl yng Nghymru sydd wedi dod o hyd i gyflogaeth gynaliadwy o ganlyniad i'r Fargen Newydd? Ledled y DU mae'r Fargen Newydd wedi costio £5 biliwn, ond yn ôl fy ffigurau i, dim ond 37 y cant o bobl ifanc a 23 y cant o bobl dros 25 oed sydd wedi dod o hyd i waith cynaliadwy drwy'r cynllun. A wyddom beth y mae'r cynllun yn ei gyflawni yng Nghymru?

The report tells us that standards in work-based learning are still a cause for concern, and, as Jeff Cuthbert has just outlined, leadership and management of work-based learning providers is criticised. Like Peter Black, I want to express my concerns about the effects of the ASPB merger on work-based learning. I disagree with him on another point, however. I think that he may

Dywed yr adroddiad fod safonau mewn dysgu'n seiliedig ar waith yn parhau i achosi pryder, ac fel yr amlinellwyd gan Jeff Cuthbert, caiff arweinyddiaeth a rheolaeth y darparwyr dysgu sy'n seiliedig ar waith eu beirniadu. Fel Peter Black yntau, yr wyf am fynegi fy mhryder ynghylch effeithiau uno'r CCNCau ar ddysgu'n seiliedig ar waith. Anghytunaf ag ef ar bwynt arall, fodd

have forgotten that public spending on education increased under Ken Clarke.

The Minister referred to 'Making the Connections' in her remit letter to Estyn last month. However, that does not allocate responsibility for skills learning. It does not state that skills learning should be in the economic development section of the document, for example. The Minister may be aware that, in its recent response to the merger proposals, the Confederation of British Industry stated that it felt that there would have been merit in doing that, especially in respect of manufacturing and tourism work-based learning.

**Peter Black:** Perhaps I have waited too long, but I wanted to respond to the Member's comment that public spending on education increased under Ken Clarke. Even in pre-devolution days, public spending on education in Wales was the responsibility of the Secretary of State for Wales, and it did not increase in local authorities in Wales at that time.

**Lisa Francis:** Thank you, Peter, but what I remember is a UK Government that achieved the best job creation and the second highest level of inward investment in the world.

However, I will move on to the question of the mergers and what the CBI said, because the Minister should take it on board. It is clear that while the merger of the ASPBs into the Government remains so ill-defined and lacking in commercial focus, let alone vision, it will lead to complications for the future development of skills learning outlined in Estyn's operational plan. It seems very much to be policy on the hoof, so we need clarity on that for the future.

The issue of protecting the Welsh language during secondary education is mentioned in the report. It states that it is not only difficult to access Welsh-medium education or bilingual education at post-16 level, but that many Welsh-speaking children drop the language at the age of 12 when they move on to secondary education.

bynag. Credaf efallai iddo anghofio bod gwariant cyhoeddus ar addysg wedi cynyddu o dan Ken Clarke.

Cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog at 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau' yn ei llythyr cylch gwaith i Estyn fis diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hyn yn dyrannu cyfrifoldeb dros ddysgu sgiliau. Nid yw'n dweud y dylai dysgu sgiliau fod yn yr adran datblygu economaidd yn y ddogfen, er enghraifft. Efallai fod y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol fod Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain, yn ei ymateb yn ddiweddar i'r cynigion uno, wedi dweud ei fod o'r farn y byddai wedi bod yn fuddiol gwneud hynny, yn enwedig o ran dysgu'n seiliedig ar waith ym maes gweithgynhyrchu a thwristiaeth.

**Peter Black:** Hwyrach imi aros yn rhy hir, ond yr oeddwn am ymateb i sylw'r Aelod fod gwariant cyhoeddus wedi cynyddu o dan Ken Clarke. Hyd yn oed yn ystod y dyddiau cyn datganoli, cyfrifoldeb Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru oedd gwariant cyhoeddus ar addysg yng Nghymru, ac ni chynyddodd mewn awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru bryd hynny.

**Lisa Francis:** Diolch, Peter, ond yr hyn a gofiau yw Llywodraeth y DU a sicrhodd y lefel orau yn y byd o swyddi newydd a'r lefel orau ond un o fewnfuddsoddi.

Fodd bynnag, symudaf ymlaen i gwestiwn uno a'r hyn a ddywedodd Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain, oherwydd mae angen i'r Gweinidog ei ystyried. Mae'n amlwg, tra bydd uno'r CCNCau â'r Llywodraeth yn parhau'n broses mor annelwig heb ffocws masnachol, heb sôn am weledigaeth, bydd yn arwain at gymhlethdodau ar gyfer datblygu'r maes dysgu sgiliau yn y dyfodol a amlinellir yng nghynllun gweithredol Estyn. Ymddengys yn bolisi ffwrdd â hi, felly, mae angen eglurder arnom ar gyfer y dyfodol.

Yn yr adroddiad, crybwyllir mater diogelu'r iaith Gymraeg yn ystod addysg uwchradd. Dywed ei bod nid yn unig yn anodd cael mynediad i addysg Gymraeg neu addysg ddwyieithog ar lefel ôl-16, ond bod nifer o blant sy'n siarad Cymraeg yn rhoi'r gorau i'r iaith yn 12 oed wrth symud ymlaen i addysg uwchradd.



ELWa's creation of one funding system with one common funding formula has created winners and losers in the post-16 sector. I am talking specifically about schools with sixth forms that now have to compete with further education colleges for funding. At the end of the day, the losers are the sixth-form pupils. In my area, in the county of Ceredigion, six out of seven schools with sixth forms provide a Welsh-medium or bilingual curriculum. These schools, as Members know, consistently secure excellent results year in, year out. In mid Wales, bilingual provision outside the school sector is very limited, and in some areas it is non-existent. It is ELWa's unsatisfactory funding formula that is the real barrier to providing teachers for Welsh-medium and bilingual education. We must support the provision of those at secondary school level, because if we do not we will see a further loss of the Welsh language from our heartlands.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I also welcome the Estyn report and the chief inspector's conclusion that standards have risen over the past five years. I commend leaders, trainers, teachers and learners on their hard work. Apparently there is still much to be done to improve elements of school provision, and obviously school buildings need to be of the highest possible standard. I was thrilled to be at Rhosnesni High School last week. That school is very lucky to have the most wonderful facilities.

Although it is important to have up-to-date statistics, they do not always illuminate the full picture. There is a vagueness surrounding some of the assertions in the report. It states that standards are good or better in 80 per cent of classes in schools; good or better than what?

4.20 p.m.

The quality of education that pupils received is said to be good or very good in 80 per cent of primary and secondary schools. For a more meaningful view, we need to know the percentage of good and very good results. I

Mae rhai sydd ar eu hennill a rhai sydd ar eu colled yn y sector ar ôl 16 wrth i ELWa greu un system ariannu gydag un fformiwla ariannu gyffredin. Yr wyf yn sôn yn benodol am ysgolion gyda dosbarth chwech sydd bellach yn gorfod cystadlu â cholegau addysg bellach am arian. Yn y pen draw, disgyblion chweched dosbarth sydd ar eu colled. Yn fy ardal i, yng Ngheredigion, mae chwech o'r saith ysgol sydd â dosbarth chwech yn darparu cwricwlwm cyfrwng Cymraeg neu ddwyieithog. Fel y gŵyr yr Aelodau, mae'r ysgolion hyn yn cynhyrchu canlyniadau rhagorol flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn. Yn y Canolbarth, prin yw'r ddarpariaeth ddwyieithog y tu allan i'r sector ysgolion, ac mewn rhai ardaloedd nid yw ar gael o gwbl. Fformiwla ariannu anfodddhaol ELWa yw'r rhwystr gwirioneddol i ddarparu athrawon ar gyfer addysg Gymraeg a dwyieithog. Rhaid inni gefnogi'r darparu'r rheiny ar lefel ysgol uwchradd, oherwydd os na wnawn hynny, byddwn yn gweld colli'r Gymraeg ymhellach yn ein broydd.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yr wyf fi hefyd yn croesawu adroddiad Estyn a chasgliad y prif arolygydd fod safonau wedi codi dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf. Cymeradwyaf yr arweinwyr, yr hyfforddwyr, yr athrawon a'r dysgwyr am eu gwaith caled. Mae'n amlwg bod llawer i'w wneud eto i wella elfennau mewn darpariaeth ysgolion, ac yn amlwg mae angen i adeiladau ysgolion fod o'r safon uchaf posibl. Yr oedd yn bleser gennyf fod yn Ysgol Uwchradd Rhosnesni yr wythnos diwethaf. Mae'r ysgol honno yn ffodus i feddu ar gyfleusterau ardderchog.

Er ei bod yn bwysig cael ystadegau cyfredol, nid ydynt yn cyfleu'r darlun llawn bob amser. Mae yna amwysedd yn perthyn i rai o'r haeriadau yn yr adroddiad. Dywed fod safonau yn dda neu'n well mewn 80 y cant o'r dosbarthiadau mewn ysgolion; da neu'n well na beth?

Dywedir bod ansawdd addysg a gafodd disgyblion yn dda neu'n dda iawn mewn 80 y cant o ysgolion cynradd ac uwchradd. Er mwyn cael darlun mwy ystyrlon o'r sefyllfa, mae angen inni wybod canran y canlyniadau

am asking as a lay person. In this instance, there is obviously a technical reason as to why we do not have those, but I am giving you my opinion of what I consider to be quite vague.

The report states that there are very few classes with unsatisfactory standards. What does 'very few' mean? How many are there? The environment in which teaching takes place and school buildings are important and need to be greatly improved. Learners' attitudes and behaviour, in my humble experience, have a meaningful effect on teaching. It is important that teachers are given the best tools with which to work and they have an important bearing on the ability of teachers to teach. As we know, teachers work hard now under difficult circumstances, which are well-documented.

According to the report, too many learners who are over 16 do not have qualifications. They need those qualifications for good job prospects. Why do they not have them? I thought that the Basic Skills Agency was addressing those issues. Boys, as mentioned by colleagues, still do not do as well as girls at any stage. Why not? What is being done to address that? What research is being undertaken to crack this unacceptable situation and give disaffected, underachieving boys a more positive education?

On the Welsh baccalaureate, I took part in a successful cross-party election session at Deeside College last week with the baccalaureate class, which was brilliant. I was told that, for example, Welsh baccalaureate students do a great deal of work on citizenship and politics, as compared with other students; that work is said to be very positive. However, the report states that learners on level 2 of the first-year Welsh baccalaureate course have too much work to do in the time available and most have not gained the full qualifications. What are you doing about that, Minister? Tutors give too little attention to the language module, which has been mentioned before. Few learners are choosing Welsh as an option. Students do not have enough high-quality course material in Welsh.

da a da iawn. Gofynnaf fel person llewg. Yn yr achos hwn, mae'n amlwg bod rheswm technegol pam nad yw'r canlyniadau hynny gennym, ond yr wyf yn rhoi fy marn i chi am yr hyn sy'n eithaf aneglur o'm safbwynt i.

Dywed yr adroddiad mai prin iawn yw'r dosbarthiadau sydd â safonau anfoddhaol. Beth yw ystyr nifer 'prin iawn'? Faint ohonynt sydd? Mae'r amgylchedd addysgu ac adeiladau ysgol yn bwysig ac mae angen eu gwella'n sylweddol. Caiff ymagweddau ac ymddygiad dysgwyr, o'm profiad gostyngedig i, effaith ystyrllon ar addysgu. Mae'n bwysig i athrawon gael yr offer gorau ar gyfer eu gwaith, a chânt effaith bwysig ar allu athrawon i addysgu. Fel y gwyddom, mae athrawon yn gweithio'n galed yn awr o dan amgylchiadau anodd sy'n cael cryn sylw.

Yn ôl yr adroddiad, mae gormod o ddysgwyr sydd dros 16 oed heb gymwysterau. Mae angen y cymwysterau hynny arnynt i gael swydd dda. Pam nad yw'r sgiliau hynny ganddynt? Yr oeddwn yn credu bod yr Asiantaeth Sgiliau Sylfaenol yn mynd i'r afael â'r materion hynny. Nid yw bechgyn, fel y crybwyllwyd gan gyd-Aelodau, yn gwneud cystal â merched o hyd, ar unrhyw adeg. Pam, felly? Beth a wneir i fynd i'r afael â hynny? Pa ymchwil a wneir i gael gwared ar y sefyllfa annerbyniol hon a rhoi addysg fwy cadarnhaol i fechgyn sydd wedi dadrithio, ac sy'n tangyflawni?

O ran Bagloriaeth Cymru, cymerais ran mewn sesiwn etholiadol drawsbleidiol lwyddiannus yng Ngholeg Glannau Dyfrdwy yr wythnos diwethaf gyda'r dosbarth bagloriaeth, a oedd yn ardderchog. Dywedwyd wrthyf, er enghraifft, fod myfyrwyr Bagloriaeth Cymru yn gwneud cryn dipyn o waith ar ddinasyddiaeth a gwleidyddiaeth, o'u cymharu â myfyrwyr eraill; dywedir bod y gwaith hwnnw'n gadarnhaol iawn. Fodd bynnag, dywed yr adroddiad fod gan ddysgwyr ar lefel 2 yng nghwrs blwyddyn gyntaf Bagloriaeth Cymru ormod o waith i'w wneud yn yr amser sydd ar gael, ac mae'r rhan fwyaf heb gael y cymwysterau llawn. Beth ydych chi'n ei wneud am hynny, Weinidog? Nid yw tiwtoriaid yn rhoi digon o sylw i'r modiwl iaith, a grybwyllwyd o'r blaen. Ychydig iawn o ddysgwyr sy'n dewis Cymraeg fel

opsiwn. Nid oes gan fyfyrwyr ddigon o ddeunydd cwrs o safon uchel yn Gymraeg.

Adults cannot find enough support for their basic skills, which I have mentioned before—you can see that I have written this in quite a hurry—and apparently there is no choice of courses for adults in Welsh, which is a big concern. The fact that there is an insufficient range of courses and proper facilities is regrettable. So what are you doing to improve that, Minister?

Nid oes digon o gymorth ar gael i oedolion ddatblygu eu sgiliau sylfaenol, fel yr wyf wedi crybwyll o'r blaen—gallwch weld fy mod wedi ysgrifennu hwn ar dipyn o frys—ac mae'n debyg nad oes unrhyw ddewis o gyrsiau ar gyfer oedolion yn Gymraeg, sy'n bryder mawr. Mae'r ffaith fod yna ystod annigonol o gyrsiau a chyfleusterau priodol yn peri gofid. Felly, beth fyddwch yn ei wneud i wella hynny, Weinidog?

We could be here forever and a day discussing ELWa funding, as it is such a big issue, which it is not sufficiently addressed in the report. What are you doing, Minister, to address the frustrations of many schools, colleges and learners with this funding issue and the loss of considerable and crucial funding in many schools?

Gallem fod yma am byth yn trafod cyllid ELWa, am ei fod yn fater mor bwysig nad eir i'r afael ag ef yn ddigonol yn yr adroddiad. Beth ydych yn ei wneud, Weinidog, i fynd i'r afael â rhwystredigaethau nifer o ysgolion, colegau a dysgwyr o ran y cyllid hwn a'r ffaith fod nifer o ysgolion yn colli cyllid sylweddol a hollbwysig?

Finally, I turn to Community Consortia for Education and Training. This is a well-meaning, well-intended and interesting partnership, but I am not sure that it has achieved its full potential. No blame is attached to the employers, education sector or trainers. From what I know and have read in the report, CCETs have insufficient resources and staff and, therefore, find it impossible to fulfil their obligations as we would have wished. How are you addressing that, Minister?

Yn olaf, trof at y Consortia Cymunedol dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant. Mae hon yn bartneriaeth ystyrlon, da ei bwriad a diddorol, ond ni wn a yw wedi cyflawni ei photensial llawn. Nid oes unrhyw fai ar y cyflogwyr, y sector addysg na'r hyfforddwyr. O'r hyn a wn ac o'r hyn a ddarllenais yn yr adroddiad, mae gan CCET adnoddau a staff annigonol, ac felly maent yn ei chael yn amhosibl cyflawni eu rhwymedigaethau fel y byddem wedi dymuno. Sut yr ydych yn mynd i'r afael â hynny, Weinidog?

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** Thank you for your contributions. I am glad that the majority of Members started their speeches by recognising the superb contribution that has been made by those who are delivering the education and lifelong learning agenda in Wales. When we celebrate the quality of delivery, that is what we are celebrating.

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Diolch am eich cyfraniadau. Yr wyf yn falch bod y mwyafrif o'r Aelodau wedi dechrau eu hareithiau drwy gydnabod cyfraniad gwych y rhai sy'n darparu'r agenda addysg a dysgu gydol oes yng Nghymru. Pan ddathlwn ansawdd hynny, dyna'r hyn a ddathlwn.

From the Assembly Government perspective, when we published 'The Learning Country' in 2001, it was about setting a direction for Wales, which had tremendous support in terms of taking forward the agenda for Wales, building on devolution, making sure

O safbwynt Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, pan gyhoeddwyd 'Y Wlad Sy'n Dysgu' gennym yn 2001, yr oedd a wnelo â gosod cyfeiriad ar gyfer Cymru, a chafodd gefnogaeth aruthrol o ran gweithredu'r agenda ar gyfer Cymru, datblygu datganoli, sicrhau y gallem

that we could respond to Welsh needs, but also ensuring that we could be imaginative and innovative. One of the elements that I enjoyed in the report is that it demonstrates the Welsh agenda most unequivocally for the first time, in terms of the way it is moving forward. Compared with previous years, it demonstrates that education and lifelong learning is broadly moving on the right track in Wales, which is what the chief inspector says, and I am grateful to those who fully acknowledge that.

We are aware that it takes a tremendous amount of time and money to tackle issues around school buildings. Eleanor mentioned her visit to Rhosnesni High School in Wrexham last week, where I formally opened the school building. It was wonderful to see a good environment, and I have opened school buildings across Wales which now demonstrate effective learning environments. We acknowledge, as does the chief inspector, that there are still too many school buildings which are not in a good condition, and we maintain our commitment to buildings being fit for purpose by 2010.

In policy terms, the idea of an agenda which ensured collaboration between providers and more opportunities for learners post-16, was supported by all parties in the Assembly. When people talk of changes in post-16 funding from ELWa, and do not acknowledge the additional £6 million that has been included to offer new courses by collaboration between schools or between schools and colleges, it undersells what is available. That is important; the chief inspector identifies that more opportunities are available, but notes that even further opportunities need to be available. We are aiming to address that issue.

A key aspect of the report—and this is why we are so grateful to the chief inspector—has been the focus on quality improvement year on year in the services delivered. We must focus on quality, which is why I was happy to accept the Liberal Democrats' amendment on workplace learning, because we know that that is not of sufficient quality, overall, to deliver the agenda we have set ourselves.

ymateb i anghenion Cymru, ond hefyd sicrhau y gallem fod yn greadigol ac yn arloesol. Un o'r elfennau a fwynheais yn yr adroddiad yw'r ffaith ei fod yn dangos agenda Cymru mewn ffordd gwbl glir am y tro cyntaf, o ran y ffordd y caiff ei ddatblygu. O'i gymharu â blynyddoedd blaenorol, dengys fod addysg a dysgu gydol oes, yn gyffredinol, yn mynd i'r cyfeiriad cywir yng Nghymru, sef yr hyn a ddywed y prif arolygydd, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r rhai sy'n cydnabod hynny'n llawn.

Yr ydym yn ymwybodol ei bod yn cymryd llawer iawn o amser ac arian i fynd i'r afael â materion yn ymwneud ag adeiladau ysgol. Crybwyllodd Eleanor ei hymweliad ag Ysgol Uwchradd Rhosnesni yn Wrexham yr wythnos diwethaf, lle bûm i'n agor adeilad yr ysgol yn ffurfiol. Yr oedd yn braf gweld amgylchedd da, ac yr wyf wedi agor adeiladau ysgol ledled Cymru sydd bellach yn dangos amgylcheddau dysgu effeithiol. Cydnabyddwn, fel y gwna'r prif arolygydd, fod gormod o adeiladau ysgol o hyd nad ydynt mewn cyflwr da, ac yr ydym yn parhau ein hymrwymiad i sicrhau y bydd adeiladau yn addas at y diben erbyn 2010.

O ran polisi, cefnogwyd y syniad o agenda sy'n sicrhau cydweithrediad rhwng darparwyr a mwy o gyfleoedd i ddysgwyr ôl-16 gan yr holl bleidliau yn y Cynulliad. Pan fydd pobl yn siarad am newidiadau mewn cyllid ôl-16 gan ELWa, heb gydnabod y £6 miliwn ychwanegol a gynhwyswyd i gynnig cyrsiau newydd drwy gydweithrediad rhwng ysgolion neu rhwng ysgolion a cholegau, maent yn tanbrisiu'r hyn sydd ar gael. Mae hynny'n bwysig; dywed y prif arolygydd fod mwy o gyfleoedd ar gael, ond dywed fod angen sicrhau bod hyd yn oed mwy o gyfleoedd ar gael. Yr ydym yn anelu at fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwnnw.

Un agwedd allweddol ar yr adroddiad—a dyma pam yr ydym mor ddiolchgar i'r prif arolygydd—oedd y ffocws ar wella'r ansawdd bob blwyddyn yn y gwasanaethau a ddarperir. Rhaid inni ganolbwyntio ar ansawdd, a dyna pam yr oeddwn yn fodlon derbyn gwelliant y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ar ddysgu yn y gweithle, oherwydd gwyddom nad yw hwnnw o ansawdd digonol, ar y cyfan, i gyflawni'r

agenda a bennwyd gennym i ni ein hunain.

Jeff Cuthbert talked about his particular interest in vocational learning. I reported to committee at the last meeting that we intend to appoint a vocational skills champion, and I will present a detailed proposal about the way in which we intend to take that forward to the committee in June. We must convince students and parents of the value of vocational learning. When businesses talk to us about the importance of vocational learning, we must ensure that they translate that into requiring vocational learning routes when they recruit into their businesses.

Soniai Jeff Cuthbert am ei ddiddordeb arbennig mewn dysgu galwedigaethol. Cyflwynais adroddiad i'r pwyllgor yn y cyfarfod diwethaf yn nodi ein bod yn bwriadu penodi hyrwyddwr sgiliau galwedigaethol, a chyflwynaf gynnig manwl i'r pwyllgor ym mis Mehefin ynglŷn â'r ffordd y bwriadwn wneud hynny. Rhaid inni argyhoeddi myfyrwyr a rhieni o werth dysgu galwedigaethol. Pan fydd busnesau'n siarad â ni am bwysigrwydd dysgu galwedigaethol, rhaid inni sicrhau eu bod yn troi hynny'n ofyniad i gael llwybrau dysgu galwedigaethol pan fyddant yn recriwtio ar gyfer eu busnesau.

The issue of extra financial support for schools in areas of deprivation, for example, is not just about the ELWa formula. The ELWa formula is deliberately based on the learner; learners may use their entitlement to learning in more than one school or college or for workplace learning, to ensure that they have wider learning pathways. We do not try to replicate what colleges do best in a school setting, or vice versa. This is about having collaboration between partners, and not about schools competing with colleges. We are explicitly implementing a collaboration agenda. Colleges and schools have told me that the old Conservative agenda was about schools competing with colleges. We are trying, with the Assembly's support, to secure better provision for the individual learner, and wider learning routes. There is an extra £3 million in the budget allocated to support schools which do not perform as well as others, in recognition of the additional challenges that they face.

Nid yw mater cymorth ariannol ychwanegol ar gyfer ysgolion mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig, er enghraifft, yn ymwneud â fformiwla ELWa yn unig. Mae fformiwla ELWa wedi ei seilio'n fwriadol ar y dysgwr; gall dysgwyr ddefnyddio eu hawl i ddysgu mewn mwy nag un ysgol neu goleg, neu i ddysgu yn y gweithle, i sicrhau bod ganddynt lwybrau dysgu ehangach. Ni cheisiwn ailadrodd mewn lleoliad ysgol yr hyn y mae colegau'n ei wneud orau, nac i'r gwrthwyneb. Mae a wnelo hyn â chael cydweithrediad rhwng partneriaid, ac nid yw a wnelo ag ysgolion yn cystadlu â cholegau. Yr ydym yn gweithredu agenda o gydweithredu yn benodol. Mae colegau ac ysgolion wedi dweud wrthyf fod a wnelo hen agenda'r Ceidwadwyr ag ysgolion yn cystadlu â cholegau. Yr ydym, gyda chymorth y Cynulliad, yn ceisio sicrhau gwell darpariaeth ar gyfer y dysgwr unigol, a llwybrau dysgu ehangach. Mae £3 miliwn ychwanegol yn y gyllideb wedi'i neilltuo i gynnal ysgolion nad ydynt yn cyflawni cystal ag eraill, er mwyn cydnabod yr heriau ychwanegol a wynebir ganddynt.

An important aspect of Estyn's work is that it gives us evidence, and a basis on which to take future decisions. I want Estyn's advice on the impact of the workload agreement, in the same way as I always want advice in terms of new Assembly initiatives. In that way, we can determine the way forward in the knowledge that we are doing it on the basis of solid evidence.

Un agwedd bwysig ar waith Estyn yw ei bod yn rhoi tystiolaeth inni, a sylfaen ar gyfer gwneud penderfyniadau yn y dyfodol. Yr wyf am gael cyngor Estyn ar effaith y cytundeb llwyth gwaith, yn yr un ffordd ag y byddaf bob amser am gael cyngor o ran mentrau newydd y Cynulliad. Fel hynny, gallwn bennu'r ffordd ymlaen gan wybod ein bod yn gwneud hynny ar sail tystiolaeth gadarn.

4.30 p.m.

Lisa, you asked specific questions in relation to those not in education, employment or training. This is a very important group, but is not one that has been newly identified; it has existed as long as I have been Minister, and has been part of targets set previously. It is important that we know who these people are, where they are and how we can re-engage them in education. The latest New Deal figures will go before the committee next month, and will be available to you then.

You, and a number of other Members, made an important point regarding Welsh-medium provision. We are mindful of that in the *Iaith Pawb* agenda, and that is why part of the sabbaticals money will be used to ensure that a wider range of people can teach through the medium of Welsh, in both pre-16 and post-16 education. We have to put special provision in place— [Interruption.]

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You need to wind up now.

**Jane Davidson:** To close, the designations in the report, Eleanor, have been agreed by Estyn in terms of the way that they recognise achievement. This is measured across the whole of the education and training system in the same way, in a common inspection framework, so that we can utilise that in the most effective way possible, whether or not you are in a work-based learning environment, a school, a college or a careers company.

Lisa, yr oeddech yn gofyn cwestiynau penodol mewn perthynas â'r rheini nad ydynt mewn addysg, cyflogaeth na hyfforddiant. Mae hwn yn grŵp pwysig iawn, ond nid un newydd ei nodi ydyw; mae mewn bodolaeth ers i mi fod yn Weinidog, a bu'n rhan o'r targedau a bennwyd yn flaenorol. Mae'n bwysig inni wybod pwy yw'r bobl hyn, ble y maent a sut y gallwn eu hailgynnwys mewn addysg. Caiff ffigurau diweddaraf y Fargen Newydd eu cyflwyno gerbron y pwyllgor fis nesaf, a byddant ar gael i chi bryd hynny.

Gwnaethoch chi, a nifer o Aelodau eraill, bwynt pwysig ynglŷn â darpariaeth drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Yr ydym yn ystyried hynny yn agenda *Iaith Pawb*, a dyna pam y caiff rhan o'r arian sabothol ei defnyddio i sicrhau y gall ystod ehangach o bobl addysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, mewn addysg cyn16 ac ar ôl 16. Rhaid inni roi darpariaeth arbennig ar waith—[Torri ar draws.]

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Rhaid ichi ddirwyn i ben yn awr.

**Jane Davidson:** I gloi, mae'r dynodiadau yn yr adroddiad, Eleanor, wedi eu cytuno gan Estyn o ran y ffordd y maent yn cydnabod cyflawniad. Caiff hyn ei fesur ar draws y system addysg a hyfforddiant yn gyfan yn yr un ffordd, mewn fframwaith arolygu cyffredin, fel y gallwn ddefnyddio hynny yn y ffordd fwyaf effeithiol posibl, p'un a ydych mewn amgylchedd dysgu'n seiliedig ar waith, mewn ysgol, coleg neu gwmni gyrfaoedd.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 12, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 1: For 12, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin

Melding, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 8, Ymatal 2, Yn erbyn 31.  
Amendment 2: For 8, Abstain 2, Against 31.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Melding, David  
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Jocelyn  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 8, Ymatal 2, Yn erbyn 31.*

*Amendment 3: For 8, Abstain 2, Against 31.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Melding, David  
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Jocelyn  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 41, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Amendment 4: For 41, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary



Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Francis, Lisa  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment carried.*

Motion NDM2422 as amended:

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. welcomes the Annual Report of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education and Training for 2003-04;*

*2. welcomes the chief inspector's conclusion that standards have risen over the past five years with some of the biggest improvements coming in 2003-04;*

*3. recognises that the programme of work set out in 'The Learning Country' is on track, with year on year improvements in standards and the quality of provision;*

*4. notes that standards in work-based*

Cynnig NDM2422 wedi'i ddiwygio:

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn croesawu Adroddiad Blynyddol Prif Arolygydd Ei Mawrhydi dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant yng Nghymru ar gyfer 2003-04;*

*2. yn croesawu casgliad y prif arolygydd bod safonau wedi codi dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf gyda rhai o'r gwelliannau mwyaf yn cael eu cyflawni yn 2003-04;*

*3. yn cydnabod bod y rhaglen waith a nodwyd yn 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu' ar y trywydd cywir, gyda gwelliannau o flwyddyn i flwyddyn o ran safonau ac ansawdd y ddarpariaeth;*

*4. yn nodi bod safonau hyfforddiant yn*

*training remain a cause for concern and that the leadership and management of too many work-based training providers are unsatisfactory and calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to work with ELWa to review work based training with the aim of dealing with the problems identified in this report.*

*seiliedig ar waith yn parhau i achosi pryder a bod arweiniad a rheolaeth gormod o ddarparwyr hyfforddiant sy'n seiliedig ar waith yn anfoddhaol, ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i weithio gydag ELWa i adolygu hyfforddiant yn seiliedig ar waith gyda'r nod o ddelio â'r problemau a nodwyd yn yr adroddiad hwn.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 40, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 1.*

*Amended motion: For 40, Abstain 0, Against 1.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelod canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Member voted against:

Neagle, Lynne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
Amended motion carried.*

**Dadl Fer  
Short Debate**

## **Damweiniau yn y Cartref—Y Broblem Gudd Accidents in the home—The Hidden Epidemic**

**Rosemary Butler:** I have the honour of being the president of the Wales Home Safety Council, which is why I have chosen to highlight the issue of safety in the home this afternoon. I pay tribute to the hard work of the members of the Wales Home Safety Council and its officers.

Lorraine Barrett has said that she would like to contribute. It is a little odd looking at an empty Chamber on the opposition side.

The good news is that the number of unintentional injury deaths has been declining steadily. In England and Wales in 1979, almost 1,100 children died as a result of unintentional injury, compared with 261 in 2002. The bad news is that every year in the UK, 3,900 people die as a result of a home accident, and our accident and emergency centres will have 2.7 million visits from those who have suffered from an accident in the place where they think that they are very safe, namely their own home. The four main causes of death from accidents in the home are falling, poisoning, drowning, suffocation or choking, and fire.

For the elderly, hip fractures are a significant problem, and in Wales alone there are around 4,200 hip fractures each year, many as a result of accidents in the home. About one quarter of people who suffer hip fractures die within six months of the injury, and half of the survivors fail to gain their previous independence.

The recent trend in buying trampolines for use in the garden has led to a fourfold increase in the number of under-15s needing hospital treatment. According to the latest figures available from the Royal Society for the Prevention of Accidents, 4,200 under-15s needed hospital treatment in 2002 for injuries sustained while trampolining at home. In 1997, the figure was 1,100. These latest

**Rosemary Butler:** Braint i mi yw bod yn llywydd Cyngor Diogelwch yn y Cartref Cymru, a dyna pam yr wyf wedi dewis rhoi sylw i fater diogelwch yn y cartref y prynhawn yma. Yr wyf yn rhoi teyrnged i waith caled aelodau Cyngor Diogelwch yn y Cartref Cymru a'i swyddogion.

Dywedodd Lorraine Barrett yr hoffai gyfrannu. Mae'n rhyfedd edrych ar Siambr wag ar ochr y gwrthbleidiau.

Y newyddion da yw bod nifer y marwolaethau o ganlyniad i anafiadau anfwriadol wedi bod yn gostwng yn raddol. Yng Nghymru a Lloegr yn 1979, bu farw bron 1,100 o blant o ganlyniad i anaf anfwriadol, o gymharu â 261 yn 2002. Y newyddion drwg yw bod 3,900 o bobl yn y DU yn marw bob blwyddyn o ganlyniad i ddamwain yn y cartref, a chaiff ein canolfannau damweiniau ac achosion brys 2.7 miliwn o ymweliadau gan bobl sydd wedi dioddef damwain yn eu cartref eu hunain, sef rhywle y maent yn ddiogel iawn yn eu barn hwy. Y pedwar prif achos o farwolaeth o ganlyniad i ddamwain yn y cartref yw cwmpo, gwenwyno, boddi, mygu neu dagu, a than.

O ran yr henoed, mae torri clun yn broblem fawr, ac yng Nghymru yn unig, bydd tua 4,200 o bobl y flwyddyn yn torri clun, nifer ohonynt o ganlyniad i ddamweiniau yn y cartref. Bydd tua chwarter y bobl sy'n torri clun yn marw cyn pen chwe mis ar ôl yr anaf, ac ni fydd hanner y rhai sy'n gwella o'r anaf mor annibynnol ag oeddynt gynt, a bydd hanner y rhai sy'n gwella o'r anaf yn methu adennill eu hannibyniaeth flaenorol.

Mae'r duedd ddiweddar o brynu trampolîn i'w ddefnyddio yn yr ardd wedi arwain at gynydd o bedair gwaith yn nifer y plant o dan 15 oed sydd ag angen triniaeth yn yr ysbyty. Yn ôl y ffigurau diweddaraf sydd ar gael gan y Gymdeithas Frenhinol er Atal Damweiniau, yr oedd angen triniaeth yn yr ysbyty ar 4,200 o blant o dan 15 oed yn 2002 am anafiadau wrth ddefnyddio trampolîn yn

figures do not take into account the sudden upsurge in the buying of trampolines. Even if you buy a national lottery ticket every week, you are 20 times more likely to suffer a fatal home accident than you are to win the lottery—it is more a case of ‘it will happen to you’, rather than ‘it could happen to you’.

While many of the trends throughout the UK are similar, devolved government gives us a unique opportunity to look at, and respond to, the different needs of our particular nations. Northern Ireland’s home accident prevention strategy has just been launched, Scotland is doing excellent work on developing injury prevention in children and, in England, there is the Health Development Agency’s evidence and guidance collaborating centre on unintentional injury. I am pleased to say that, here, in Wales, accident and injury prevention has been included as one of the five priorities in the Assembly’s Health Challenge Wales campaign.

Last September, 80 delegates from 18 countries across Europe participated in a workshop focused on safer environments for children. The conclusion of this event was the drafting of the Stockholm manifesto, which is a call for action to reduce the leading cause of death for children in Europe—injury. I repeat that injury is the leading cause of death among children in Europe and occurs at twice the rate of deaths from cancer and at eight times the rate of respiratory-related deaths. In *The Lancet* in 2004, the World Health Organisation stated that childhood injury is the largest disease burden for children compared to any other disease. For every child that dies from injuries, another 160 children are admitted to hospital as a result of severe traumatic injury. The childhood injury death rate in the EU member state of Latvia is eight times higher than the rate in the leading EU member state of Sweden, which has the lowest rate. The estimate of the overall socio-economic burden of all injuries among all ages in Europe is almost €400 billion annually.

y cartref. Yn 1979, y ffigur oedd 1,100. Nid yw'r ffigurau diweddaraf hyn yn cymryd i ystyriaeth y cynnydd cyflym yn nifer y bobl sy'n prynu trampolinau. Hyd yn oed os ydych yn prynu tocyn loteri bob wythnos, yr ydych 20 gwaith yn fwy tebygol o gael damwain angheuol yn y cartref nag o ennill y loteri—mae'n fwy tebygol dweud y bydd yn digwydd i chi yn hytrach nag y gallai ddigwydd i chi.

Er bod llawer o'r tueddiadau ledled y DU yn debyg, mae llywodraeth wedi ei datganoli yn gyfle unigryw inni edrych ar wahanol anghenion ein gwledydd arbennig, ac ymateb iddynt. Mae strategaeth Gogledd Iwerddon ar gyfer atal damweiniau yn y cartref newydd gael ei lansio; mae'r Alban yn gwneud gwaith ardderchog ar atal anafiadau plant; ac yn Lloegr, mae canolfan cydweithredu tystiolaeth ac arweiniad yr Asiantaeth Datblygu Iechyd ar anafiadau anfwriadol. Yr wyf yn falch o ddweud bod atal damweiniau ac anafiadau yma yng Nghymru wedi ei gynnwys fel un o bum blaenoriaeth ymgyrch Her Iechyd Cymru'r Cynulliad.

Fis Medi diwethaf, bu 80 o gyfranogwyr o 18 o wledydd ar draws Ewrop yn cymryd rhan mewn gweithdy a oedd yn canolbwyntio ar amgylcheddau diogelach i blant. O ganlyniad i'r digwyddiad hwn, cafodd maniffesto Stockholm ei lunio, sy'n galw am weithredu i leihau prif achos marwolaethau plant yn Ewrop—sef anafiadau. Dywedaf eto mai anafiadau yw prif achos marwolaethau plant yn Ewrop, ac mae'r nifer ddwywaith cymaint â marwolaethau o ganser ac wyth gwaith y gyfradd marwolaethau o ganlyniad i broblemau anadlu. Yn *The Lancet* yn 2004, dywedodd Sefydliad Iechyd y Byd mai anafiadau mewn plentynod yw'r baich mwyaf o ran afiechyd i blant o'u cymharu ag unrhyw glefyd arall. Am bob plentyn sy'n marw o anafiadau, caiff 160 o rai eraill driniaeth ysbyty oherwydd anaf trawmatig difrifol. Mae'r gyfradd marwolaethau o anafiadau mewn plentynod yn Latfia, un o aelod wladwriaethau'r UE, wyth gwaith yn uwch na'r gyfradd yn Sweden, yr aelod wladwriaeth yn yr UE sydd â'r gyfradd isaf. Amcangyfrifir bod y baich economaidd-gymdeithasol cyffredinol am bob anaf

ymysg pob oed yn Ewrop bron yn €400 biliwn y flwyddyn.

Yet injury is predictable and preventable. Research has validated proven best practices that reduce injury deaths and disability, most often through a combined approach of education, engineering and enforcement measures. Injuries from road accidents have been more than halved, for example, by reduced speed limits, traffic calming, safer car fronts for pedestrians and cyclists, child passenger restraints, and bicycle helmets, where these measures have been enforced. Drowning deaths have been reduced by the use of pool fencing and personal flotation devices such as armbands. Burns and scalds have been more than halved by the use of smoke detectors, water temperature regulators, child-resistant cigarette lighters, and clothing that does not easily catch fire or burns more slowly.

Ond gellir rhagweld anafiadau a'u hatal. Mae gwaith ymchwil wedi cadarnhau arferion gorau, sydd wedi profi eu bod yn lleihau nifer y marwolaethau ac achosion o anabledd o ganlyniad i anafiadau, gan amlaf drwy ymagwedd gyfunol o fesurau addysg, cynllunio a gorfodi. Lle mae'r mesurau hyn wedi eu gorfodi, mae anafiadau o ganlyniad i ddamweiniau ffordd wedi mwy na haneru, er enghraifft, drwy ostwng terfynau cyflymder, gostegu traffig, blaenau ceir diogelach ar gyfer cerddwyr a beicwyr, seddi diogel i blant mewn ceir, a helmedau beic. Mae marwolaethau o ganlyniad i foddï wedi lleihau drwy osod ffens o amgylch pyllau a dyfeisiadau arnofio personol, megis rhwymynnau breichiau. Mae llosgiadau a sgaldiadau wedi mwy na haneru drwy ddefnyddio synwryddion mwg, rheolyddion tymheredd dŵr, tanwyr sigarêts na all plant eu defnyddio, a dillad nad ydynt yn llosgi'n hawdd neu sy'n llosgi'n arafach.

Fall injuries and deaths have been reduced by the use of window and balcony guards and stair gates. In addition, but to a lesser extent, there has been a reduction of serious head injuries in playgrounds through the relationship between height of equipment and impact-absorbing surfaces. Poisoning has also been reduced by one third through the use of child-resistant packaging, safe storage units and educational programmes. Choking, suffocation and strangulation have been reduced by product and environment modification or redesign.

Mae anafiadau a marwolaethau a gaiff eu hachosi oherwydd cwympto wedi gostwng drwy ddefnyddio gardiau ar ffenestri a balconïau a gatiau grisiau. Hefyd, ond i raddau llai, bu gostyngiad yn nifer yr anafiadau difrifol i'r pen mewn parciau chwarae, oherwydd y cysylltiad rhwng uchder y cyfarpar ac arwynebeddau sy'n gwrthsefyll trawiad. Bu gostyngiad o draean yn nifer yr achosion o wenwyno hefyd, drwy ddefnyddio pecynnau na all plant eu hagar, unedau storio diogel a rhaglenni addysgu. Mae achosion o dagu, mygu a chrogi wedi lleihau drwy addasu neu ail-ddylunio cynnyrch a'r amgylchedd.

A lot of excellent work has been done to make social housing in Wales safer, but this has not yet crossed over into the private sector. There are simple and cheap measures that can be incorporated at the design-and-build stage of houses to make them safer for all ages for the long term, and to save on adaptations that may be needed down the line. Recently, one of my constituents—the owner of a brand-new, four-bedroomed house—was at his wits' end when he was unable to fit a safety gate to any of his stairs.

Gwnaed llawer o waith ardderchog i wneud tai cymdeithasol yng Nghymru yn fwy diogel, ond nid yw hyn wedi treiddio i'r sector preifat eto. Mae rhai mesurau syml a rhad y gellir eu hymgorffori wrth gynllunio ac adeiladu tai i'w gwneud yn fwy diogel ar gyfer pawb o bob oed yn yr hirdymor, ac i arbed costau addasu y bydd eu hangen, efallai, yn ddiweddarach. Yn ddiweddar, yr oedd un o'm hetholwyr—sy'n berchen ar dŷ newydd sbon gyda phedair ystafell wely—wedi cyrraedd pen ei dennyn am nad oedd yn gallu gosod giât ddiogelwch ar unrhyw un

o'r grisiau.

4.40 p.m.

The recently published Royal Society for the Prevention of Accidents' report, 'Can The Home Ever Be Safe?', gives a 10-point action plan advocating improvements to home safety over and above current building regulations. The implementation of the report at the design-and-build stage of new buildings would make the kind of problems that I have mentioned a thing of the past. Hopefully, the Minister will be able to give us an update on the implementation of this 10-point action plan in Wales.

Every year, over 2 million children are taken to hospital as a result of an injury, and around half of those injuries happen in the home. Unfortunately, the data are based on hospital admissions only, and many more children who are injured may not show up as statistics. For example, a pre-school child with a mild head injury may be admitted to hospital, while an older child may not. Similarly, a child from a disadvantaged background may be admitted to hospital, while a child from a more affluent background with a similar injury may not.

The Welsh Assembly Government has introduced the all-Wales injury surveillance system. Unfortunately, there is no mandate for all hospitals to contribute to this system, which would give overall details of the number and types of home accidents in Wales. If all hospitals contributed to the system we would have a detailed overall picture of what is happening across Wales in terms of all types of accidents in a domestic, sporting or leisure context.

Unfortunately, many accidents never become a statistic. Some accidents may have been treated by a GP, and many may not be serious enough to report. Sometimes, a fall by an elderly person leads to a death from other complications, and some people, especially the elderly, are frightened to admit that they

Mae'r adroddiad 'Can the Home Ever Be Safe', a gyhoeddwyd gan y Gymdeithas Frenhinol er Atal Damweiniau yn ddiweddar, yn nodi cynllun gweithredu 10 pwynt sy'n argymhell gwella diogelwch yn y cartref yn ychwanegol at y rheoliadau adeiladu presennol. Byddai gweithredu'r adroddiad wrth gynllunio a chodi adeiladau newydd yn cael gwared â'r problemau y cyfeiriais atynt yn llwyr. Gobeithio y gall y Gweinidog roi'r newyddion diweddaraf inni am weithredu'r cynllun gweithredu 10 pwynt hwn yng Nghymru.

Bob blwyddyn, caiff dros 2 filiwn o blant eu cludo i'r ysbyty o ganlyniad i anaf, a bydd tua hanner yr anafiadau hyn yn digwydd yn y cartref. Yn anffodus, dim ond ar nifer y plant a gaiff eu derbyn i'r ysbyty y mae'r data yn seiliedig, ac efallai na chaiff nifer o blant eraill sy'n cael eu hanafu eu cynnwys yn yr ystadegau. Er enghraifft, efallai y caiff plentyn cyn oed ysgol ei dderbyn i'r ysbyty ar ôl cael mân anaf ar ei ben. Ond efallai na fydd hynny'n wir am blentyn hyn sy'n cael yr un math o anaf. Yn yr un modd, efallai y caiff plentyn o gefndir difreintiedig ei dderbyn i'r ysbyty, ond efallai na fydd plentyn o gefndir mwy cefnog sydd ag anaf tebyg yn cael ei dderbyn.

Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi cyflwyno system arolygu anafiadau i Gymru gyfan. Yn anffodus, nid oes mandad i bob ysbyty gyfrannu i'r system hon, a fyddai'n rhoi manylion cyffredinol am y niferoedd a'r mathau o ddamweiniau yn y cartref sy'n digwydd yng Nghymru. Pe bai pob ysbyty'n cyfrannu i'r system, byddai gennym well darlun cyffredinol o'r hyn sy'n digwydd ar draws Cymru, o ran pob math o ddamweiniau sy'n digwydd yng nghydestun y cartref, chwaraeon neu hamdden.

Yn anffodus, ni fydd llawer o ddamweiniau byth yn troi'n ystadegau. Efallai y caiff rhai damweiniau eu trin gan Feddyg Teulu, ac efallai na fydd rhai yn ddigon difrifol i gael eu cofnodi. Weithiau, efallai y bydd person hyn yn marw o ganlyniad i gymhlethdodau eraill ar ôl cwmpo, ac mae ar rai pobl, yn

may have fallen because they are worried about the consequences of being considered as not being able to cope.

The Health Development Agency's report, which has just been published, states that children from poor families are five times more likely to die from unintentional injuries. That is a sobering thought. Unintentional injury is the biggest single killer of children in the UK. By this time next year, 10,000 children in the UK will have been permanently disabled because of an accident. Three children in the UK have died today as a result of an unintentional injury. Nearly all of these injuries are preventable.

These facts should spur on the Welsh Assembly Government to see what more action can be taken to promote the development of home safety, especially among the more vulnerable around us. Accidents happen to real people, and every statistic is someone's child, mother, father or loved one. I hope that the Minister will tell us how the Welsh Assembly Government will implement action to stop the hidden epidemic of the needless numbers of accidents that occur in the place where we should all feel the safest—our home.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Thank you, Rose. Your speech took me back some years to a project that was set up in Penarth by Professor Jo Sibert, a consultant paediatrician, called Safe Child Penarth. While part of the message from the project was to ensure that children were kept safe outside the home—in the streets and on the roads—the other part of the project's message was how to keep children safe in the home and in the garden. Jo Sibert is an expert on the dangers of ponds and pools. It was worrying to learn of the numbers of children who drown in their own backyards, when some simple precautions are all that are needed. I hope that today's short debate helps to put this issue on the political agenda, and that we can do much more work to take it forward.

arbennig yr henoed, ofn cyfaddef eu bod wedi cwmpo, am eu bod yn pryderu am y canlyniadau pe bae pobl yn ystyried eu bod yn methu ymdopi.

Mae adroddiad yr Asiantaeth Datblygu Iechyd, sydd newydd gael ei gyhoeddi, yn dweud bod plant o deuluoedd tlawd bum gwaith yn fwy tebygol o farw o anafiadau anfwriadol. Mae hynny'n ystyriaeth ddifrifol. Anafiadau anfwriadol yw'r prif reswm dros farwolaethau plant yn y DU. Erbyn yr adeg hon y flwyddyn nesaf, bydd 10,000 o blant yn y DU yn anblu yn barhaol oherwydd damwain. Mae tri o blant yn y DU wedi marw heddiw o ganlyniad i anaf anfwriadol. Gellir rhwystro bron pob un o'r anafiadau hyn.

Dylai'r ffeithiau hyn ysgogi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ystyried pa gamau eraill y gellir eu cymryd i hybu datblygu diogelwch yn y cartref, yn arbennig ymysg y rheini yn ein plith sydd fwyaf agored i niwed. Mae damweiniau'n digwydd i bobl go iawn, ac mae pob ystadegyn yn blentyn, yn fam, yn dad neu'n berthynas i rywun. Fy ngobaith yw y bydd y Gweinidog yn dweud wrthym sut y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cymryd camau i rwystro problem gudd y niferoedd diangen o ddamweiniau sy'n digwydd yn y man lle dylem i gyd deimlo'n fwyaf diogel—ein cartref.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Diolch ichi, Rose. Yr oedd eich araith yn fy atgoffa o brosiect a sefydlwyd ym Mhenarth gan yr Athro Jo Sibert, pediatregydd ymgynghorol, a elwid yn Safe Child Penarth. Er bod rhan o'r neges a'r prosiect yn gysylltiedig â sicrhau diogelwch plant y tu allan i'r cartref—yn y strydoedd ac ar y ffyrdd—yr oedd rhan arall y neges yn gysylltiedig â sut i ddiogelu plant yn y cartref ac yn yr ardd. Mae Jo Sibert yn arbenigwr ar beryglon llynnoedd a phyllau. Roedd clywed am nifer y plant sy'n boddi yn eu gerddi eu hunain yn peri pryder, pan fyddai rhai rhagofalon syml yn atal hyn. Fy ngobaith yw y bydd y ddadl fer heddiw yn helpu rhoi'r mater hwn ar yr agenda wleidyddol, ac y gallwn wneud llawer mwy o waith i'w ddatblygu ymhellach.

**The Deputy Minister with Responsibility** **Y Dirprwy Weinidog sydd â Chyfrifoldeb**

**for Older People (John Griffiths):** I congratulate Rosemary on using this short debate to highlight these important issues, and on her presidency of the Home Safety Council. I join her in commending the hard-working commitment of the council's members and officers.

It was sobering to listen to Rosemary outlining the statistics and the problems related to accidents in the home, and to Lorraine's contribution regarding garden ponds and pools. It is clearly the case that much work needs to be done to address these issues and concerns. The British Medical Association reported in 2003 that more accident-related deaths occur in the home than on the roads, and that, every year, more than 1 million in the UK are injured at home. We also know, from provisional figures from the Welsh health survey, that the majority of accidents among over-65s needing hospital or casualty visits happen in the home. For children, the proportion is a third, making the home one of the four main environments in which young people are most at risk from injury. It is also thought that poverty places young people at a higher risk of injury.

With that sort of background, Rosemary rightly asked what the Assembly Government is doing to tackle home safety. It is, of course, a fundamental consideration for the Welsh Assembly Government, and many of the proposals in the RoSPA report, 'Can The Home Ever Be Safe?', are already enshrined in our development quality requirements, which set standards for homes built by housing associations in Wales. In fact, revised standards will be published later this month. These will require thermostatic water control on all taps, excluding those in the kitchen, and will incorporate the requirements of 'Housing Sight', the Royal National Institute for the Blind's guide to make homes safer for people with poor vision.

**dros Bobl Hŷn (John Griffiths):** Llongyfarchiadau i Rosemary ar ddefnyddio'r ddadl fer hon i dynnu sylw at y materion pwysig hyn, ac ar gael ei phenodi'n llywydd y Cyngor Diogelwch yn y Cartref. Ymunaf â hi i ganmol ymrwymiad gweithgar aelodau a swyddogion y cyngor.

Yr oedd gwrandio ar Rosemary yn amlinellu'r ystadegau a'r problemau sy'n gysylltiedig â damweiniau yn y cartref, a chyfraniad Lorraine o ran llynnoedd a phyllau yn yr ardd, yn ddigon i'ch sobri. Mae'n amlwg bod angen gwneud llawer o waith i fynd i'r afael â'r materion a'r pryderon hyn. Yn 2003, dywedodd Cymdeithas Feddygol Prydain fod mwy o farwolaethau sy'n gysylltiedig â damweiniau yn digwydd yn y cartref nag ar y ffyrdd, a bod dros filiwn o bobl yn y DU bob blwyddyn yn cael eu hanafu yn y cartref. Gwyddom hefyd, o'r ffigurau dros dro o'r arolwg o iechyd Cymru, fod y rhan fwyaf o'r damweiniau sy'n digwydd i bobl dros 65 oed ac sy'n golygu bod angen triniaeth ysbyty neu ymweliad â'r uned ddamweiniau ac achosion brys yn digwydd yn y cartref. O ran plant, mae'r gyfran yn draean, gan wneud y cartref yn un o'r pedwar prif amgylchedd lle mae pobl ifanc yn wynebu'r risg fwyaf o gael eu hanafu. Credir hefyd bod pobl ifanc yn wynebu mwy o risg o gael eu hanafu os dynt yn byw mewn tlodi .

Gyda chefnidir felly, yr oedd Rosemary yn iawn i ofyn beth y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â diogelwch yn y cartref. Wrth gwrs, mae'n un o ystyriaethau sylfaenol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, ac mae nifer o'r cynigion yn adroddiad RoSPA, 'Can The Home Ever Be Safe?' eisoes wedi eu cynnwys yn ein gofynion ansawdd datblygu, sy'n gosod y safonau ar gyfer cartrefi a gaiff eu hadeiladu gan gymdeithasau tai yng Nghymru. Yn wir, caiff safonau diwygiedig eu cyhoeddi yn ddiweddarach y mis hwn. Bydd y rhain yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i offer rheoli dŵr thermostatig gael ei osod ar bob tap dŵr, ac eithrio'r rhai yn y gegin, a bydd yn ymgorffori gofynion 'Housing Sight', sef canllaw Sefydliad Cenedlaethol Brenhinol y Deillion ar gyfer gwneud tai yn fwy diogel i bobl sydd â nam ar eu golwg.



We are also addressing other proposals from RoSPA's report through other activities. For example, the prevention of injuries and accidents to children at home is addressed in the national service framework for children, young people and maternity services. In this, promotion of home safety is a key action outlined for health and local government organisations, including safety equipment loan schemes in deprived areas and the safe storage and disposal of medicines. The national service framework also encourages local authorities to use their housing strategies and related powers to facilitate the implementation of the housing health and safety rating system to ensure that children, young people and their families live in safe and healthy homes.

The Fire and Rescue Services Act 2004 places a statutory responsibility on the service to promote fire safety. This builds on work on community fire safety undertaken by the Assembly Government and the fire and rescue service prior to devolution of the service to the Assembly in November 2004. A community fire safety working group was established to consider fire safety issues in Wales and report its findings. Following the publication of its first report, 'Wired for Safety', various initiatives in social and vulnerable households have been taken forward by the Assembly using funding from the community fire safety budget. The Assembly has also provided funding to raise safety awareness through publicity.

The Assembly Government has been developing a national service framework for older people, and this is due to go out to consultation this summer. This includes a standard on preventing falls and fractures in the home and elsewhere. Also, our annual Keep Well this Winter campaign is targeted at older people to help them to stay healthy during the winter months. This is part of the Assembly Government's response to Health Challenge Wales, the national focus for

Yr ydym hefyd yn mynd i'r afael â chynigion eraill o adroddiad RoSPA drwy weithgareddau eraill. Er enghraifft, ymdrinnir ag atal anafiadau a damweiniau i blant yn y cartref yn y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol i blant, pobl ifanc a gwasanaethau mamolaeth. Yn hwn, mae hybu diogelwch yn y cartref yn gam allweddol a gaiff ei amlinellu ar gyfer sefydliadau iechyd a llywodraeth leol, gan gynnwys cynlluniau benthyca offer diogelwch mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig, a storio a chael gwared â meddyginiaethau yn ddiogel. Mae'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol hefyd yn annog awdurdodau lleol i ddefnyddio'u strategaethau tai a phwerau cysylltiedig i hwyluso'r gwaith o weithredu'r system graddio iechyd a diogelwch mewn tai, er mwyn sicrhau bod plant, pobl ifanc a'u teuluoedd yn byw mewn cartrefi diogel ac iach.

Mae'r Deddf Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub 2004 yn ei gwneud yn gyfrifoldeb statudol ar y gwasanaeth i hybu diogelwch tân. Mae hyn yn adeiladu ar waith diogelwch tân cymunedol a wnaed gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r gwasanaeth tân ac achub cyn i'r gwasanaeth gael ei ddatganoli i'r Cynulliad ym mis Tachwedd 2004. Sefydlwyd gweithgor diogelwch tân cymunedol i ystyried materion yn ymwneud â diogelwch tân yng Nghymru ac i roi adroddiad am ei ddarganfyddiadau. Yn dilyn cyhoeddi ei adroddiad cyntaf, 'Wired for Safety', datblygodd y Cynulliad amrywiol fentrau mewn cartrefi cymdeithasol a chartrefi sy'n agored i ddiodef, gan ddefnyddio cyllid o'r gyllideb diogelwch tân cymunedol. Mae'r Cynulliad hefyd wedi darparu cyllid i wneud pobl yn fwy ymwybodol o ddiogelwch drwy gyhoeddusrwydd.

Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi bod yn datblygu fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer pobl hŷn, a bwriedir ymgynghori amdano yr haf hwn. Mae hwn yn cynnwys safonau ar gyfer atal syrthio a thorri esgyrn yn y cartref ac mewn mannau eraill. Hefyd, mae ein hymgyrch Gofal Piau Hi y Gaeaf Hwn yn targedu pobl hŷn i'w helpu i gadw'n iach yn ystod misoedd y gaeaf. Mae hon yn rhan o ymateb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i Her Iechyd

action to improve health and wellbeing. Keep Well this Winter has 'keep safe' as one of its themes. Through this campaign, home safety is promoted in partnership with organisations such as Age Concern Cymru, Care and Repair Cymru, the fire services, and RoSPA.

4.50 p.m.

Last winter, Care and Repair distributed 5,000 'Top Tips—A safe home this winter' booklets on home safety, and 10,000 home safety checklists in the campaign packs. Care and Repair's work shows that quite small changes, such as better lighting, safety rails and the removal of frayed carpets can make the home a much safer place.

Another campaign partner, the Pension Service, through its home-visits programme, can identify risks to the health of older people, including the potential for accidents and refer them to the appropriate agency for action or advice.

As part of the Keep Well This Winter campaign, the Royal National Institute for the Blind, Cymru included home-safety messages on compact disks and audio tapes, in both English and Welsh. Many local events were held across Wales, including Safe and Sound road shows organised by fire services. In addition to advice about fire safety in the home at these events, the fire services and trading standards officers carried out electric-blanket testing. This found that as many as 65 per cent of electric blankets were unsafe—a major potential hazard in the home.

The importance of the theme of keeping safe is further highlighted in the healthy ageing action plan for Wales, which draws attention to the need to ensure that the elements of the campaign not specific to winter are embedded in mainstream activity and continued throughout the year in other

Cymru, y ffocws cenedlaethol ar gyfer gweithredu i wella iechyd a lles. Mae 'cadw'n ddiogel' yn un o'r themâu yn 'Gofal Piau Hi y Gaeaf Hwn'. Drwy'r ymgyrch hon, caiff diogelwch yn y cartref ei hybu mewn partneriaeth â sefydliadau megis Age Concern Cymru, Care and Repair Cymru, y gwasanaethau tân, a RoSPA.

Y gaeaf diwethaf, dosbarthodd Gofal a Thrwsio 5,000 o lyfrynnau 'Awgrymiadau i Ddiogelu Cartrefi dros y Gaeaf!' ar ddiogelwch yn y cartref, a 10,000 o restrau gwirio diogelwch yn y cartref ym mhecynnau'r ymgyrch. Dengys gwaith Gofal a Thrwsio y gall newidiadau eithaf bach, megis goleuadau gwell, canllawiau diogelwch a chael gwared ar garpedi sydd wedi treulio wneud y cartref yn lle llawer mwy diogel.

Gall partner arall yn yr ymgyrch, sef y Gwasanaeth Pensiynau, drwy ei raglen ymweliadau â'r cartref, nodi pethau sy'n peryglu iechyd pobl hŷn, gan gynnwys y potensial ar gyfer damweiniau, a'u cyfeirio at yr asiantaeth briodol ar gyfer gweithredu neu i gael cyngor.

Fel rhan o'r ymgyrch Gofal Piau Hi y Gaeaf Hwn, cynhwysodd Sefydliad Cenedlaethol Brenhinol y Deillion, Cymru negeseuon am ddiogelwch yn y cartref ar gryno ddisgiau a thapiau sain, yn Gymraeg ac yn Saesneg. Cynhaliwyd nifer o ddigwyddiadau lleol ledled Cymru, gan gynnwys sioeau teithio Safe and Sound wedi eu trefnu gan wasanaethau tân. Yn ogystal â chyngor am ddiogelwch tân yn y cartref yn y digwyddiadau hyn, cynhaliodd y gwasanaethau tân a swyddogion safonau masnach brofion ar flancedi trydan. Dangosodd hyn bod cynifer â 65 y cant o flancedi trydan yn anniogel—perygl posibl mawr yn y cartref.

Tynnir sylw pellach at bwysigrwydd y thema o gadw'n ddiogel yng nghynllun gweithredu Cymru ar gyfer heneiddio'n iach, sy'n tynnu sylw at yr angen i sicrhau bod yr elfennau yn yr ymgyrch nad ydynt yn gyfyngedig i'r gaeaf yn cael eu hymgorffori mewn gweithgarwch prif ffrwd, ac yn parhau drwy

programmes. Accidents and injuries are key themes of Health Challenge Wales, which will work to encourage more action to create safe environments. Much good work is already being done in Wales by both the statutory and voluntary sectors, but more needs to be done.

The Health Challenge Wales database of local action, which will be developed later this year, will be an important means of spreading good practice in this and other areas. The Welsh Assembly Government sponsors the All Wales Injury Surveillance System to support research into the prevention of injuries, and the targeting and evaluation of injury-prevention initiatives across Wales. I assure Rosemary that steps are being taken to ensure that a flow of data is submitted to AWISS by all hospitals.

Information from AWISS not only provides support to injury prevention but also helps the planning and development of emergency care services. AWISS is led by academic staff from the new school of medicine at the University of Wales Swansea, and supported by analysts from the national public health service for Wales and Health Solutions Wales.

AWISS is unique within the UK and has supported a large amount of world-quality injury-prevention research. It has been used to evaluate the Wales vitamin D fracture-prevention trial—the world's largest trial—attempting to reduce hip fractures in residents of nursing and care homes, which is funded by the Wales Office of Research and Development for Health and Social Care, and is due to report this summer. It has also been used to carry out leading research into injuries suffered by residents of different types of homes. A study of injuries among residents of 54,000 homes in Neath Port Talbot, carried out by Cardiff University in collaboration with the local authority, is also due to report soon. Over two years, 12.5 per cent of residents attended an accident and emergency department as a result of a home injury.

gydol y flwyddyn mewn rhaglenni eraill. Mae damweiniau ac anafiadau yn themâu allweddol yn Her Iechyd Cymru, a fydd yn gweithio i annog mwy o weithredu i greu amgylcheddau diogel. Mae llawer o waith da yn cael ei wneud eisoes yng Nghymru gan y sector statudol a'r sector gwirfoddol, ond mae angen gwneud mwy.

Bydd cronfa ddata Her Iechyd Cymru o gamau gweithredu lleol, a fydd yn cael ei datblygu yn ddiweddarach eleni, yn fodd pwysig i ledaenu arferion da yn y maes hwn a meysydd eraill. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn noddi System Arolygu Anafiadau Cymru Gyfan (AWISS) i gefnogi gwaith ymchwil ar atal anafiadau, ac i dargedu a gwerthuso mentrau atal anafiadau ledled Cymru. Gallaf sicrhau Rosemary fod camau yn cael eu cymryd i sicrhau bod llif data yn cael ei gyflwyno i AWISS gan bob ysbyty.

Mae gwybodaeth o AWISS nid yn unig o gymorth wrth atal anafiadau, ond mae hefyd yn helpu'r broses o gynllunio a datblygu gwasanaethau gofal brys. Arweinir AWISS gan staff academaidd o'r ysgol feddygol newydd ym Mhrifysgol Cymru Abertawe, ac fe'i cefnogir gan ddadansoddwyr o wasanaeth iechyd cyhoeddus cenedlaethol Cymru ac Atebion Iechyd Cymru.

Mae AWISS yn unigryw yn y DU ac wedi cynorthwyo llawer o waith ymchwil o'r radd flaenaf ar atal anafiadau. Fe'i defnyddiwyd i werthuso'r treial atal toriadau esgyrn fitamin D yng Nghymru—y treial mwyaf yn y byd—i geisio lleihau toriadau yn esgyrn y glun ymhlith trigolion cartrefi nyrsio a chartrefi gofal. Caiff y treial ei ariannu gan Swyddfa Cymru ar gyfer Ymchwil a Datblygu Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol, a fydd yn cyhoeddi adroddiad yr haf hwn. Fe'i defnyddiwyd hefyd i wneud gwaith ymchwil blaenllaw ar anafiadau ymhlith trigolion mathau gwahanol o gartrefi. Bwriedir cyflwyno adroddiad yn fuan hefyd ar astudiaeth o anafiadau ymhlith trigolion 54,000 o gartrefi yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot, a wnaed gan Brifysgol Caerdydd mewn cydweithrediad â'r awdurdod lleol. Yn ystod dwy flynedd, anfonwyd 12.5 y cant o drigolion i adran ddamweiniau ac achosion brys oherwydd anaf yn y cartref.

The Welsh Assembly Government also supports the Collaboration for Accident Prevention and Injury Control, a multi-disciplinary, multi-agency group that supports injury-prevention initiatives across Wales. In the last year, this organisation has produced three reviews of all the evidence on injury prevention and these have been published and disseminated by the Assembly.

CAPIC has also taken a leading role in developing a practical home-safety assessment tool called Safe Home 2, which is derived from research carried out in Neath Port Talbot and Caerphilly. Safe Home 2 is an instrument suitable to be used by anyone over the age of nine, which not only identifies hazards and safety features within homes, but provides advice on remediation and compares the hazard and safety scores in the home with those in similar homes. A Safe Home 2 website is being developed at the University of Wales Swansea and will be available to the public at the end of June.

Through the Health Challenge Wales voluntary-sector grant scheme, the Assembly Government is supporting the Wales Home Safety Council by funding the post of the Royal Society for the Prevention of Accidents Wales's home safety manager—an investment of £165,000 over three years. There is also a similar grant of £120,000 over three years to support the work of Child Safe Wales. Other bodies supported by the Assembly also play a vital role in terms of home safety.

In conclusion, it should be clear from what I have said that the Assembly Government recognises what has been called 'the silent epidemic' in this debate, and has a number of strategic and practical prevention activities in place to improve safety in the home. I thank Rosemary and congratulate her on bringing forward this important debate in taking forward these policies and strategies in Wales.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings today's proceedings to a close.

Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru hefyd yn cefnogi Cydweithredu er mwyn Lleihau Damweiniau a Rheoli Anafiadau (CAPIC), grŵp aml-ddisgyblaeth, aml-asiantaeth sy'n cefnogi mentrau i atal anafiadau ledled Cymru. Yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, mae'r sefydliad hwn wedi gwneud tri adolygiad o'r holl dystiolaeth ar atal anafiadau, ac mae'r rhain wedi'u cyhoeddi a'u dosbarthu gan y Cynulliad.

Mae CAPIC hefyd wedi chwarae rhan flaenllaw wrth ddatblygu offeryn ymarferol i asesu diogelwch yn y cartref a elwir Safe Home 2. Mae'n deillio o waith ymchwil a wnaed yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot a Chaerffili. Mae Safe Home 2 yn offeryn sy'n addas i bawb dros naw oed, ac mae nid yn unig yn nodi peryglon a nodweddion diogelwch mewn cartrefi, ond hefyd mae'n darparu cyngor ar waith adferol ac yn cymharu sgoriau peryglon a diogelwch yn y cartref â'r rheini mewn cartrefi tebyg. Mae gwefan Safe Home 2 yn cael ei datblygu gan Brifysgol Cymru Abertawe, a bydd ar gael i'r cyhoedd ddiwedd mis Mehefin.

Drwy gynllun grant y sector gwirfoddol gan Her Iechyd Cymru, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cefnogi Cyngor Diogelwch Cartref Cymru drwy ariannu swydd rheolwr diogelwch yn y cartref gan Gymdeithas Frenhinol Atal Damweiniau Cymru—buddsoddiad o £165,000 dros dair blynedd. Hefyd mae grant tebyg o £120,000 dros dair blynedd i gefnogi gwaith Child Safe Wales. Mae cyrff eraill a gefnogir gan y Cynulliad hefyd yn chwarae rhan hanfodol o ran diogelwch yn y cartref.

I gloi, dylai fod yn glir o'r hyn yr wyf wedi'i ddweud fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cydnabod yr hyn sydd wedi ei alw'n 'epidemig tawel' yn y ddadl hon, ac mae wedi rhoi nifer o weithgareddau atal strategol ac ymarferol ar waith i wella diogelwch yn y cartref. Hoffwn ddiolch i Rosemary a'i llongyfarch ar gyflwyno'r ddadl bwysig hon i ddatblygu'r polisiau a'r strategaethau hyn yng Nghymru.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.03 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 5.03 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau  
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Law, Peter (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Marek, John (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)

