



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru**  
**(Cofnod y Trafodion)**

**The National Assembly for Wales**  
**(The Record of Proceedings)**

**Dydd Mawrth, 26 Ebrill 2005**

**Tuesday, 26 April 2005**

## Cynnwys Contents

Datganiad gan y Llywydd Statement by the Presiding Officer.....	3
Teyrngedau i Gwynfor Evans Tributes to Gwynfor Evans .....	3
Datganiad Personol gan Peter Law Personal Statement by Peter Law .....	10
Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister .....	11
Datganiad Busnes Business Statement.....	38
Datganiad ar yr Amgylchedd Hanesyddol Statement on the Historic Environment .....	41
Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Bwyd a Ffytosterolau neu Ffytostanolau Ychwanegol (Labelu) (Cymru) 2005 Approval of The Food with Added Phytosterols or Phytostanols (Labelling) (Wales) Regulations 2005 .....	54
Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Cynllunio a Phrynu Gorfodol 2004 (Cychwyn Rhif 3 a Darpariaethau Canlyniadol a Throsiannol) (Cymru) 2005 Approval of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 (Commencement No. 3 and Consequential and Transitional Provisions (Wales) Order 2005 .....	55
Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cymwysterau a Chofrestru Prifathrawon (Cymru) 2005 Approval of the Head Teachers' Qualifications and Registration (Wales) Regulations 2005	60
Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Ymddygiad Gwrthgymdeithasol 2003 (Cychwyn Rhif 4) (Cymru) 2005, Rheoliadau Tenantiaethau Isradd (Adolygu Penderfyniadau) (Cymru) 2005, Rheoliadau Tenantiaethau Diogel (Hysbysiadau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2005 Approval of the Anti Social Behaviour Act 2003 (Commencement No. 4) (Wales) Order 2005, the Demoted Tenancies (Review of Decisions) (Wales) Regulations 2005, and the Secure Tenancies (Notices) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2005 .....	71
Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon ar Gyfraniad y Celfyddydau a Chwaraeon at Adfywio Cymunedol The Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee's Report on the Contribution of Arts and Sports to Community Regeneration .....	87

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were  
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been  
included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

### **Datganiad gan y Llywydd Statement by the Presiding Officer**

**Y Llywydd:** Mae'n gwbl addas ein bod yn cychwyn ein gweithgareddau heddiw drwy goffâu Gwynfor Evans. Gwahoddaf y Prif Weinidog i arwain y teyrngedau.

**The Presiding Officer:** It is entirely seemly for us to commence our proceedings today by paying tribute to Gwynfor Evans. I invite the First Minister to lead the tributes.

### **Teyrngedau i Gwynfor Evans Tributes to Gwynfor Evans**

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Diolch i'r Llywydd am roi'r cyfle imi ddechrau'r teyrngedau i Gwynfor Evans a'i gyfraniad enfawr i fywyd cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Mae tudalennau ein bywyd cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn cael eu troi ar hyn o bryd—collwyd Jim Callaghan bythefnos yn ôl ac, yn awr, Gwynfor Evans yn ddiweddar iawn.

**The First Minister:** I thank the Presiding Officer for giving me the opportunity to lead the tributes to Gwynfor Evans and his vast contribution to public life in Wales. The pages of our public life in Wales are turning at the present time—we lost Jim Callaghan a fortnight ago and, now, Gwynfor Evans very recently.

Cefais y pleser o gwrdd â Gwynfor mewn cinio coleg ymhell dros 40 mlynedd yn ôl. Aeth ef, fel fi a Tony Blair a nifer o rai eraill, i Goleg Sant Ioan yn Rhydychen. Yr oedd yn adrodd ei hanes imi fel mab y siop yn y Barri. Mae siop Dan Evans yn enwog ac yn parhau yn dda iawn ym mherchenogaeth ei deulu. Daeth Gwynfor i Rydychen er mwyn bod yn gyfreithiwr yn y 1930au, ond bu i wleidyddiaeth gymryd drosodd.

I had the pleasure of meeting Gwynfor at a college dinner well over 40 years ago. He, like Tony Blair and me among many others, attended St John's College Oxford. He told me of his background as the son of a shopkeeper in Barry. Dan Evans's shop is famous, and continues to do very well under the ownership of his family. Gwynfor came to Oxford to pursue a career in law in the 1930s, but politics took over.

Bu am ddegawdau yn llywydd Plaid Cymru. Gwelodd yr enw yn troi—os cofiaf yn iawn—o 'Plaid Genedlaethol Cymru', i 'Plaid Cymru'. Ef hefyd oedd yr aelod cyntaf o blaid genedlaethol i'w ethol i Dŷ'r Cyffredin.

He was president of Plaid Cymru for decades. He saw the name change—if I recall correctly—from 'the National Party of Wales', to 'Plaid Cymru'. He was also the first nationalist party member to be elected to the House of Commons.

Nid oes diben ceisio rhoi'r argraff bod y berthynas rhyngddo ef ac Aelodau Seneddol Llafur o Gymru yn un dda; nid oedd, a hynny oherwydd ei etholaeth, Caerfyrddin, o bosibl. Yr oedd hanner ei etholaeth yn y Gymru wledig a hanner yn y Gymru ddiwydiannol. Efallai fod hynny'n rhan o'r ffræ, nid wyf yn siŵr, ond nid oedd y berthynas yn un iachus o gwbl.

There is little point in trying to give the impression that the relationship between him and Labour Members of Parliament from Wales was a good one; it was not, possibly because of his constituency in Carmarthen. Half of his constituency was in rural Wales and half in industrial Wales. Perhaps that contributed to the fray, I do not know, but the relationship was not at all healthy.

Gwynfor Evans served for around nine years in the House of Commons, as well as serving for decades as the president of Plaid Cymru. I

Gwasanaethodd Gwynfor Evans am tua naw mlynedd yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin, yn ogystal â gwasanaethu am ddegawdau fel llywydd

know of no other party leader who has served for longer than that—Ho Chi Minh, possibly. The by-election in 1966, and the two elections of 1974 were incredibly bitterly and hard fought. Indeed, on an amusing note, I was discussing this with one of my senior staff just recently, and it was his father who found the missing bundle of 50 Labour votes under a table in the election of 1974, which Labour won by just three votes. A distinguished servant in local government, he had to be given a police escort home that night. That is how desperately bitterly fought the elections of 1974 were.

No-one who met Gwynfor Evans would ever describe him as anything other than one of the ultimate gentlemen of politics. He was always courteous, gentlemanly and interested in others' points of view.

Dyna paham y mae'n bleser ac yn fraint imi dalu teyrnged bersonol a gwleidyddol i Gwynfor Evans ar ran y Blaid Lafur, ac ar ran y Llywodraeth. Hoffwn gyfleu ein cydymdeimlad â'i deulu, ei blant, a'i wyrion a'i wyresau di-rif yn sir Gaerfyrddin ac mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Y tro cyntaf i mi weld Gwynfor oedd yn neuadd bentref Garnswllt, ger Rhydaman, yn y 1960au cynnar. Testun ei araith bryd hynny oedd bod angen plaid genedlaethol gref ar Gymru i ymladd ei hachos. Cafodd yr araith gymaint o ddylanwad arnaf yn fachgen ifanc hyd nes imi ymuno â Phlaid Cymru rai misoedd yn ddiweddarach. O'r diwrnod hwnnw hyd heddiw, bu Gwynfor yn arwr i mi, ac i filoedd o rai tebyg imi.

Beth oedd apêl Gwynfor? Yr oedd yn wŷr bonheddig, cadarn ei argyhoeddiad, yr oedd yn arweinydd praff, ac yn wleidydd cwbl ymarferol. Cofiaf Gwynfor yn dweud wrthyf ryw dro fod athro coleg wedi dweud wrtho

'The trouble with you, Gwynfor, is that you are too much of a dreamer'.

Mae angen breuddwyd fawr, fel y dywedodd

Plaid Cymru. Ni wn am yr un arweinydd plaid arall a wasanaethodd yn hwy na hynny—Ho Chi Minh, o bosibl. Bu'r ymladd yn is-etholiad 1966, a'r ddau etholiad yn 1974 yn anhygoel o chwerw a chaled. Yn wir, ar nodyn doniol, bŷm yn trafod hyn gydag un o'r aelodau hŷn o'm staff yn ddiweddar, a'i dad ef a ddarganfu'r bwndel coll o 50 o bleidleisiau Llafur dan fwrdd yn etholiad 1974, a enillwyd gan Lafur o dair pleidlais yn unig. Ac yntau'n was llywodraeth leol adnabyddus, bu'n rhaid i'r heddlu ei hebrwng adref y noson honno. Bu'r ymladd yn etholiadau 1974 mor chwerw â hynny.

Ni fyddai neb a gyfarfu â Gwynfor Evans byth yn ei alw'n ddim heblaw un o'r gwŷr bonheddig mwyaf mewn gwleidyddiaeth. Yr oedd bob amser yn gwrtais ac yn foneddigaidd ac yn un a amlygai ddiddordeb yn safbwyntiau pobl eraill.

That is why it is both a pleasure and a privilege for me to pay a personal and political tribute to Gwynfor Evans, on behalf of the Labour Party and the Government. I also wish to convey our sympathies to his family, his children, and his numerous grandchildren in Carmarthenshire and in other parts of Wales.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** The first time I saw Gwynfor was in Garnswllt village hall, near Ammanford, in the early 1960s. The topic of his speech at that time was that Wales needed a strong national party to fight its cause. That speech had such an influence on me as a young boy that I joined Plaid Cymru some months later. From that day onwards, Gwynfor has been a hero of mine, and a hero to thousands like me.

What was Gwynfor's appeal? He was a gentleman and a man of conviction, a strong leader and a wholly practical politician. I remember Gwynfor telling me on one occasion that a university lecturer had told him that

Y drafferth gyda chi, Gwynfor, yw eich bod yn ormod o freuddwydiwr.

We need great dreams, as Martin Luther King

Martin Luther King unwaith. Ond nid breuddwydiwr â'i ben yn y cymylau oedd Gwynfor. Yr oedd yn sylweddoli o'r dechrau fod angen perswadio mwyafrif pobl Cymru o'r achos o blaid hunanlywodraeth. Gwnaeth hynny drwy ymladd etholiadau a bod yn barod i lunio rhaglen o bolisïau ymarferol.

Mae'r diolch i Gwynfor yn anad neb arall fod Plaid Cymru yn blaid wleidyddol sy'n rym ym mywyd Cymru. Fel y dywedodd y Prif Weinidog, yr oedd Gwynfor yn arweinydd Plaid Cymru am 36 o flynyddoedd. Nid wyf yn gwybod a oes neb arall wedi bod yn arweinydd plaid yn hwy nag ef, ond ni fydd neb yn y dyfodol yn arweinydd am gyhyd nac yn gallu torri'r record honno.

Pan etholwyd Gwynfor yn arweinydd yn 1945, yr oedd Plaid Cymru yn blaid gymharol fach, ond, erbyn iddo ymddeol yn 1981, yr oedd yn blaid a oedd wedi tyfu ac aeddfedu yn sylweddol. Serch hynny, ni fu arweinyddiaeth Gwynfor yn fêl i gyd. Mesur ei fawredd oedd y ffordd y bu iddo ddelio â'r anawsterau a gododd yn ystod y 1950au a'r 1960au, ac yna yn y 1970au a'r 1980au. Ni wrodd Gwynfor erioed oddi wrth ei gred ddiysgog mai amcan Plaid Cymru oedd gweithredu fel plaid wleidyddol gyfansoddiadol a pherswadio pobl i'w chefnogi, ac na ddeuai hunanlywodraeth heb fod pobl Cymru yn pleidleisio o'i phlaid. Er y gwyntoedd croes a'r dadlau ffyrnig ar gyfeiriad Plaid Cymru ar adegau, diolch i Gwynfor, glynwyd at y llwybr cywir.

Er mai achos Cymru a'r Gymraeg oedd prif faes gweithgarwch Gwynfor, yr oedd yn heddychwyr o argyhoeddiad a gwnaeth gyfraniad sylweddol i achos heddwch a diarfogi ar hyd y blynyddoedd. Heb os, caiff Gwynfor ei ystyried yn un o Gymry mwyaf yr ugeinfed ganrif, a bu ei gyfraniad i achos Cymru yn amhrisiadwy.

I ategu geiriau'r Prif Weinidog, anfonwn ein cydymdeimlad llwyraf at Rhiannon, y plant a'r teulu i gyd yn eu profedigaeth.

Gwynfor was a great Welshman. He was a statesman who championed the cause of

once said. However, Gwynfor did not dream with his head in the clouds. He understood from the outset that the majority of the people of Wales needed to be persuaded of the case for self-government. He attempted to do this by fighting elections and by being prepared to form a programme of practical policies.

It is Gwynfor, more than anyone else, who is to be thanked for the fact that Plaid Cymru is a political party of influence in Welsh life. As the First Minister said, Gwynfor led the party for 36 years. I do not know whether anyone else has served as a party leader for longer, but I do know that no-one's leadership in future will last as long and no-one will break his record.

When Gwynfor was elected leader in 1945, Plaid Cymru was a relatively small party, but, by the time he retired in 1981, the party had grown and matured considerably. However, Gwynfor's leadership was not all plain sailing. The measure of his greatness was the way in which he dealt with the difficulties that arose during the 1950s and 1960s, and then in the 1970s and 1980s. Gwynfor never swerved from his unflinching belief that Plaid Cymru's aim was to operate as a constitutional political party and to persuade people to lend their support, and that self-government would never be achieved unless the people of Wales voted in favour of it. Despite the crosswinds and fierce arguments on the direction taken by Plaid Cymru at times, the party kept on the right path, thanks to Gwynfor.

Although Gwynfor's focus was predominantly on Wales and the Welsh language, he was a committed pacifist who made a huge contribution to the case for peace and disarmament over the years. Without doubt, Gwynfor will be considered one of the greatest Welshmen of the twentieth century, and his contribution to the life of Wales has been immeasurable.

I echo the First Minister's comments by sending our deepest condolences to Rhiannon, the children and the whole family at this sad time.

Yr oedd Gwynfor yn Gymro mawr. Yr oedd yn wladweinydd a hyrwyddodd achos Cymru

Wales and the Welsh language. He is one of the twentieth century's great figures, and his contribution was immense. Even in his obituaries, some people have described him as a gentle visionary and an unworldly-type figure who was somewhat above the cut and thrust of political life. Nothing could be further from the truth. No-one could remain a party leader for 36 years unless they were a very shrewd politician. Gwynfor was shrewd. Almost single-handedly, he turned the party I belonged to from being a pressure group to being a fully fledged political party. He was also a very determined individual, and it was that single-minded determination that won so many admirers. He simply would not give up, and he would not take 'no' for an answer. Gwynfor was a man of great personal courage and led by example. He was, after all, my political hero and an inspirational leader. After the difficult elections for Plaid Cymru in 1964 and 1966, it was the stunning by-election victory in 1966 that changed the party's fortunes.

Gwynfor was a great supporter of the Welsh language. He did not speak the language as a boy, but learnt to do so as a young man. He would always tell me that one of the greatest thrills he had experienced was seeing Welsh-medium schools opening in the former counties of Glamorgan and Gwent. The campaign to establish S4C was also a thrill. This campaign typified his passion for the language. He had recognised the influence of the powerful medium of television on Welsh.

2.10 p.m.

In that, of course, events have proved him right. I want to end on a personal note, because Gwynfor gave me great support throughout my political career. I will never forget those many acts of unselfish personal kindness to me, and, doubtless, to many others beyond my party. Wales is a better place today because Gwynfor dedicated his life to the nation. We pay our respects to a great man. We salute him today both as a leader and a friend, and we send our condolences to Rhiannon, Gwynfor's children and the whole family, and extend our sympathy to them. They are all in our thoughts and prayers.

a'r Gymraeg. Ef yw un o ffigyrau mwyaf yr ugeinfed ganrif, a bu ei gyfraniad yn un anferth. Hyd yn oed yn y teyrngedau iddo, mae rhai pobl wedi ei alw'n weledydd mwyn ac yn ffigwr o natur arallfydol a oedd uwchlaw taro a gwrthdaro'r bywyd gwleidyddol i ryw raddau. Dim o'r fath beth. Ni allai neb barhau'n arweinydd plaid am 36 mlynedd heb fod yn wleidydd hirben iawn. Yr oedd Gwynfor yn un hirben. Ar ei liwt ei hun bron, trodd y blaid yr oeddwn yn aelod ohoni o fod yn grŵp pwysu i fod yn blaid wleidyddol gyflawn. Yr oedd hefyd yn ddyn tra phenderfynol, a'r penderfyniad unplyg hwnnw a enillodd iddo gynifer o edmygwyr. Nid ildiai o gwbl, ac ni chymerai 'na' yn ateb. Yr oedd Gwynfor yn ddyn dewr iawn ac arweiniodd drwy esiampl. Ef, wedi'r cyfan, oedd fy arwr gwleidyddol ac yr oedd yn arweinydd ysbrydoledig. Wedi'r etholiadau anodd a gafodd Plaid Cymru yn 1964 a 1966, y fuddugoliaeth syfrdanol yn yr is-etholiad yn 1966 a newidiodd ffawd y blaid.

Bu Gwynfor yn gefnogwr mawr i'r Gymraeg. Ni fedrai'r iaith pan oedd yn fachgen, ond fe'i dysgodd pan oedd yn ddyn ifanc. Dywedai wrthyf bob amser mai un o'r profiadau a barodd fwyaf o wefr iddo erioed oedd gweld ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg yn agor yn hen siroedd Morgannwg a Gwent. Bu'r ymgyrch i sefydlu S4C yn wefreiddiol hefyd. Yr oedd yr ymgyrch honno yn enghraifft nodweddiadol o'i sêl dros yr iaith. Yr oedd wedi sylweddoli beth oedd dylanwad cyfrwng pwerus y teledu ar y Gymraeg.

Yn hynny o beth, wrth gwrs, mae digwyddiadau wedi profi ei fod yn iawn. Dymunaf orffen ar nodyn personol, oherwydd rhoddodd Gwynfor gefnogaeth fawr i mi drwy gydol fy ngyrfa wleidyddol. Nid anghofiaf byth y nifer fawr o gymwynasau anhunanol a wnaeth â mi, ac, yn sicr, â llawer o rai eraill y tu allan i'm plaid. Mae Cymru'n well lle heddiw am fod Gwynfor wedi cysegru ei fywyd i'r genedl. Talwn ein teyrnged i ddyn mawr. Cofiwn amdano heddiw fel arweinydd ac fel ffrind, ac estynnwn ein cydymdeimlad i Rhiannon, i blant Gwynfor ac i'r teulu cyfan. Maent oll yn ein meddyliau a'n gweddïau.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** I offer my condolences to the family, friends and political colleagues of Gwynfor Evans. On behalf of the Welsh Conservative group, I pay tribute to the life of Gwynfor Evans. He was a highly respected figure, who made a major contribution to Welsh politics and Welsh life. As a Plaid Cymru Member of Parliament, his voice was heard not only in Wales, but beyond, and certainly at a UK level. Much has been written over the past few days on his passing. Indeed, it is a sign of his immense stature that all of the national—that is, United Kingdom—newspapers have dedicated pages to his life and achievements. He was a Welshman who made the rest of the UK sit up and take notice. As a councillor and in the House of Commons he took on the Labour machines, as the First Minister has mentioned, often single-handed, and his commitment to independence through the ballot box rather than by violent means, is to be commended—the means, that is, not the end. He was influential in the first steps towards devolution, and his campaigning on the Welsh language is of particular note. Given that he came from an English-speaking home, as Ieuan has said, his devotion to the language was an inspiration. He will certainly be remembered by most for his dedication to the delivery of a Welsh-language broadcasting channel.

More recently, that devotion to the language took root in a devotion to the culture and history of Wales through his writing. At the time of the twentieth anniversary of S4C, he warned of the declining number of Welsh speakers, and one of the finest tributes to his life must be our continuing to work to ensure the survival and, indeed, the flourishing of the Welsh language.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** The Welsh Liberal Democrats join in the tributes that have been paid to Gwynfor Evans today. Politics is a funny old business. Here we are, at a time when political parties are engaged in battle in a general election campaign, yet we can stop and pause for a moment to pay tribute to a person who gave so much to the

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Estynnaf fy nghydeimlad i deulu, ffrindiau a chydweidyddion Gwynfor Evans. Ar ran grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru, talaf deyrnged i fywyd Gwynfor Evans. Yr oedd yn ffigwr mawr ei barch, a gyfrannodd yn helaeth i wleidyddiaeth Cymru ac i fywyd Cymru. Ac yntau'n Aelod Seneddol dros Blaid Cymru, clywid ei lais nid yn unig yng Nghymru, ond y tu hwnt, ac yn sicr ar lefel y DU. Ysgrifennwyd llawer dros y dyddiau diwethaf am ei ymadawiad. Yn wir, un arwydd o'i statws aruthrol yw bod yr holl bapurau newydd cenedlaethol—hynny yw, rhai'r Deyrnas Unedig—wedi neilltuo tudalennau i drafod ei fywyd a'r hyn y llwyddodd i'w gyflawni. Yr oedd yn Gymro a barodd i weddill y DU ddechrau cymryd sylw. Fel cynghorydd ac yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin aeth i'r afael â grym Llafur, fel y nododd y Prif Weinidog, a hynny ar ei liwt ei hun yn aml, ac mae ei ymrwymiad i ennill annibyniaeth drwy'r blwch pleidleisio yn hytrach na thrwy ddulliau trais, i'w ganmol—y dull, hynny yw, nid y diben. Cafodd ddylanwad ar y camau cyntaf tuag at ddatganoli, a bu ei ymgyrchu dros y Gymraeg yn arbennig o bwysig. Ac yntau wedi ei fagu ar aelwyd Saesneg, fel y dywedodd Ieuan, yr oedd ei ymroddiad i'r iaith yn ysbrydoliaeth. Fe'i cofir yn sicr gan y mwyafrif am ei ymroddiad i sicrhau sianel ddarlledu Gymraeg.

Yn fwy diweddar, ymwreiddiodd yr ymroddiad hwnnw i'r iaith ar ffurf ymroddiad i ddiwylliant a hanes Cymru drwy'r hyn a ysgrifennodd. Ar adeg ugeinfed pen blwydd S4C, rhybuddiodd am y gostyngiad yn nifer siaradwyr y Gymraeg, ac un o'r teyrngedau gorau i'w fywyd, yn sicr, fydd ein bod yn parhau i weithio i sicrhau y bydd y Gymraeg yn goroesi ac, yn wir, yn ffynnu.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn ymuno â'r teyrngedau a dalwyd i Gwynfor Evans heddiw. Mae gwleidyddiaeth yn hen fusnes rhyfedd. Dyma ni, ar adeg y mae pleidiau gwleidyddol benben â'i gilydd mewn ymgyrch etholiad cyffredinol, ac eto gallwn aros am eiliad i dalu teyrnged i rywun

political life of Wales, and who, in doing so, enriched it. Ieuan Wyn Jones is right to say that he will be remembered by the party that he served for transforming it from a sect into a political party, and he made that impact in a way that other parties found more difficult to handle at times. Gwynfor was a persistent man. He stood for Parliament seven times before being elected—I think that he was elected on the seventh occasion, on Bastille Day, of all days, in 1966. To stand that number of times means that you are determined, despite the circumstances, to find your way forward. All of us have our own heroes—for me, that hero is Joe Grimmond—and I know that many in Plaid Cymru and across Wales have Gwynfor Evans as their hero.

He was a vigorous Member of Parliament, and asked questions at a rate of four a day. I am told that between 1966 and 1970, he was the most expensive Member of Parliament in Britain because £14 a question in old money made him, at four questions a day, the most vigorous of questioners but also the most expensive. As Ieuan has said, he was not above the cut and thrust of politics.

I have looked up one of his leaflets for Carmarthenshire from the 1966 election. I am sure that many Members have copies. This leaflet was aimed at farmers, at a time when farmers were in difficulty with regard to the supply of food at the right price; you might say that nothing has changed. When farmers threatened to withhold supplies, the UK Minister for agriculture at the time said that he would buy from abroad. Gwynfor, in his leaflet, asked 'Who knows and who cares?'. He went on to say that Mr Callaghan—who was Chancellor of the Exchequer, and to whom we have recently paid tribute—said that many farmers spent as much in an afternoon at Ascot as they did on helping the country supply itself with food. In fighting the Carmarthenshire seat it was important to target the farming community, and Gwynfor went on to say that when you would ask for help today, you were given promises for tomorrow. The language of that cut and thrust may be different to today's language, but it

a roddodd gymaint i fywyd gwleidyddol Cymru, ac a'i cyfoethogodd wrth wneud. Mae Ieuan Wyn Jones yn iawn wrth ddweud y cofir amdano gan y blaid a wasanaethodd am ei thrawsnewid o fod yn sect i fod yn blaid wleidyddol, a chafodd effaith o'r fath mewn modd yr oedd pleidiau eraill yn ei gael yn anodd ei drafod ar adegau. Yr oedd Gwynfor yn ddyn dyfalbarhaus. Safodd ar gyfer y Senedd saith gwaith cyn cael ei ethol—credaf iddo gael ei ethol y seithfed tro, ar Ddiwrnod y Bastille, o bob diwrnod, yn 1966. Mae sefyll gynifer o weithiau'n golygu eich bod yn benderfynol, er gwaethaf yr amgylchiadau, o ganfod ffordd ymlaen. Mae gan bob un ohonom ein harwyr—yn fy achos i, yr arwr hwnnw yw Joe Grimmond—a gwn fod llawer ym Mhlaid Cymru a ledled Cymru y mae Gwynfor Evans yn arwr iddynt.

Bu'n Aelod Seneddol diwyd, a gofynnai gynifer â phedwar cwestiwn y diwrnod. Dywedir wrthyf mai ef, rhwng 1966 a 1970, oedd yr Aelod Seneddol mwyaf costus ym Mhrydain oherwydd, gan fod pob cwestiwn yn costio £14 yn yr hen arian, yr oedd y pedwar cwestiwn a ofynnai bob diwrnod yn golygu mai ef oedd yr holwr mwyaf diwyd a'r mwyaf costus hefyd. Fel y dywedodd Ieuan, nid oedd uwchlaw'r taro a'r gwrthdaro mewn gwleidyddiaeth.

Yr wyf wedi cael gafael ar un o'i daflenni ar gyfer sir Gaerfyrddin o'r etholiad yn 1996. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod gan nifer o Aelodau gopïau. Yr oedd y daflen hon wedi'i hanelu at ffermwyr, ar adeg pan oedd ffermwyr yn cael anhawster yng nghyswllt cyflenwi bwyd am y pris iawn; gallech ddweud nad oes dim wedi newid. Pan wnaeth y ffermwyr fygwth dal eu cyflenwadau yn ôl, dywedodd Gweinidog Amaeth y DU ar y pryd y byddai'n prynu o wledydd tramor. Yn ei daflen, gofynnodd Gwynfor "Pwy a wŷr a phwy sy'n malio?". Ychwanegodd wedyn fod Mr Callaghan—a oedd yn Ganghellor y Trysorlys, ac yr ydym wedi talu teyrnged iddo'n ddiweddar—wedi dweud bod nifer o ffermwyr yn gwario yr un faint mewn prynhawn yn Ascot ag ar helpu'r wlad i gyflenwi bwyd iddi ei hun. Wrth ymladd y sedd yn sir Gaerfyrddin, yr oedd yn bwysig targedu'r gymuned ffermio, ac aeth Gwynfor yn ei flaen i ddweud, pan oeddech yn gofyn am gymorth heddiw y byddech yn derbyn



did exist.

The most important memorial must be in terms of the Welsh language and the commitment that led to the formation of S4C. Wales recognises that a chapter in our political life has come to an end, and we recognise the greatness of a man who served his party well and who will be recognised in the political history of this country.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Ar ran Mrs Rhiannon Evans a'r teulu, diolchaf i arweinwyr y pleidiau am eu teyrngedau cwbl haeddiannol i Gwynfor, y cenedlaetholwr rhyngwladol, yr heddychwyr o Gristion, a'r gwleidydd o argyhoeddiad a gweledigaeth.

Yr wyf am gyfeirio'n fyr at yr hyn a wnaeth Gwynfor wedi iddo ymddeol o fod yn llywydd Plaid Cymru yn 1981. Wedi iddo ymladd ei etholiad cyffredinol olaf yn 1983 yng Nghaerfyrddin, ymgymerodd â swydd ysgrifennydd cangen Bro Deifi yn sir Gaerfyrddin. Bu i chi, Brif Weinidog, gyfeirio at Ho Chi Minh; yr oedd Gwynfor yn ysgrifennydd cangen Bro Deifi pan oedd yn ei 80au hwyr, ac yr oedd y Parchedig Glenville Jones, y cadeirydd, rhyw ddwy flynedd yn hŷn na hynny—dyna swyddogion hynaf unrhyw blaid wleidyddol y tu allan i Tsieina.

Yr oedd Gwynfor yn parhau i fod yn ymroddedig i'r dasg o drefnu'r raffl blynyddol a'r rasmus hwyaid. Yr oedd y rhain yn ddigwyddiadau eithriadol o bwysig, gan mai'r digwyddiadau hynny a arweiniodd at sefydlu'r 'Teifi Branch', sef cangen i gefnogwyr Plaid Cymru nad oeddent yn aelodau. Gyda'r bobl hynny a symudodd i Gymru a sir Gaerfyrddin y dechreuodd mudiad Pont—mudiad eithriadol o bwysig a welodd Gwynfor yn ceisio pontio rhwng pobl a oedd wedi byw yng Nghymru ar hyd eu hoes a rhai a ddaeth i fyw yma.

Yn ogystal â hynny, ni ddylem anghofio synnwyr digrifwech a direidi Gwynfor. Bydd Aelodau Plaid Cymru yn cofio mynd o Eisteddfod Genedlaethol yr Urdd yn Llanbedr Pont Steffan i gartref Gwynfor a

addewidion ar gyfer yfory. Efallai fod iaith y dadlau yn wahanol i'r iaith a ddefnyddir heddiw, ond yr oedd yn bodoli.

Diau mai'r goffadwriaeth bwysicaf yw'r un yng nghyswllt yr iaith Gymraeg a'r ymrwymiad a arweiniodd at sefydlu S4C. Mae Cymru yn cydnabod bod pennod yn hanes ein gwleidyddiaeth wedi dod i ben, ac yr ydym ninnau'n cydnabod mawredd dyn a wasanaethodd ei blaid yn dda ac a fydd yn cael ei gofio yn hanes gwleidyddol y wlad hon.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** On behalf of Mrs Rhiannon Evans and the family, I thank party leaders for their fitting tributes to Gwynfor, the international nationalist, the Christian pacifist, and the politician of conviction and vision.

I will refer briefly to what Gwynfor did after his retirement as Plaid Cymru president in 1981. After fighting his last general election in 1983 in Carmarthen, he undertook the role of branch secretary in Bro Deifi, Carmarthenshire. You referred to Ho Chi Minh, First Minister; Gwynfor was in his late 80s when he was branch secretary at Bro Deifi, and the Reverend Glenville Jones, the chairman, was some two years older—they were the oldest officials of any political party outside China.

Gwynfor remained committed to the task of organising the annual raffle and duck race. These were extremely important events, as it was these that led to the creation of the 'Teifi Branch' for Plaid Cymru supporters who were not party members. It was with those people who moved into Wales and Carmarthenshire that the 'Pont' movement began—an extremely important movement, in which Gwynfor tried to bridge the gap between people who had lived in Wales all their lives and those who moved here.

In addition, we should not forget Gwynfor's sense of humour and mischief. Plaid Cymru Members will remember leaving the Urdd National Eisteddfod at Lampeter to go to Gwynfor and Rhiannon's home after the

Rhiannon ar ôl etholiad 1999. Dywedodd Gwynfor ei bod yn anrhydedd iddo ef a Rhiannon ein croesawu i'w cartref, er ein bod yn ceisio dweud wrtho mai anrhydedd i ni oedd cael bod yno. I rai Aelodau nad oeddent wedi cwrdd â Gwynfor cyn hynny, yr oedd hwn yn ddigwyddiad eithriadol o bwysig, ac yr oedd o leiaf un Aelod yn ei ddagrau wrth ddweud wrtho faint o anrhydedd oedd cael cwrdd ag ef. Yn ddiweddarach y prynhawn hwnnw, wrth i bobl fwyta'r bwyd a baratowyd ar ein cyfer, daeth Gwynfor ataf a dweud, 'Rhodri, mae gen i broblem'. Gofynnais beth oedd y broblem honno, a dywedodd fod y batri yn ei gymorth clywed wedi mynd yn fflat ac nad oedd yn gallu clywed beth yr oedd pobl yn ei ddweud wrtho. Ond meddai, 'Yr wyf wedi trio gwenu a nodio'n ddeallus'. Llwyddodd i wneud hynny ac i gynnal digwyddiad a oedd mor bwysig i lawer ohonom a etholwyd i'r sefydliad hwn, sefydliad na fyddai wedi'i greu heb gyfraniad unigryw Gwynfor Evans a'r digwyddiad hanesyddol hwnnw yn 1966.

Cofiw'n amdano gyda diolchgarwch, parch ac anwylydeb.

2.20 p.m.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch yn fawr i bob un o'r Aelodau a gyfrannodd. Ategfaf yr hyn a ddywedwyd, a bydd cyfle pellach i gyfrannu yfory pan ffarweliwn ag ef.

1999 election. Gwynfor told us that it was an honour for him and Rhiannon to welcome us to their home, even though we tried to tell him that it was our privilege to be there. For some Members who had not met Gwynfor before then, it was an extremely important occasion, and in telling him how much of an honour it was to meet him, at least one Member was in tears. Later that afternoon, as people ate the food that had been prepared for us, Gwynfor came to me and said, 'Rhodri, I have a problem'. I asked him what the problem was, and he said that the battery in his hearing aid was flat, and that he could not hear what these people were telling him. But he then said, 'I have tried to smile and nod intelligently'. He succeeded in doing that and in hosting what was an important occasion to those of us elected to this institution, an institution that would not have been established without Gwynfor Evans's unique contribution and that historical event in 1966.

We remember him with thanks, respect and fondness.

**The Presiding Officer:** Thank you very much to each Member who contributed. I endorse what has been said, and there will be a further opportunity to contribute tomorrow when we bid him farewell.

### **Datganiad Personol gan Peter Law Personal Statement by Peter Law**

**Peter Law:** Thank you very much for the opportunity to make this personal statement. I express to you and your deputy, Dr John Marek, my grateful thanks for the support and help shown to me since I was taken ill. I also thank Assembly Members for their kind messages and the many members of staff in the Assembly who have sent messages of goodwill. Some will notice that this statement may not be in my usual style, and I wanted to tone it appropriately, Llywydd, in deference and respect to your important role as Presiding Officer, particularly at this time. It may, therefore, be an abridged version.

**Peter Law:** Diolch yn fawr iawn am y cyfle i wneud y datganiad personol hwn. Hoffwn ddatgan i chi ac i'ch dirprwy, Dr John Marek, fy niolch am y gefnogaeth a'r cymorth a gefais ers pan euthum yn sâl. Diolchaf hefyd i Aelodau'r Cynulliad am eu negeseuon caredig ac i'r amryw aelodau o staff yn y Cynulliad sydd wedi anfon negeseuon ewyllys da. Bydd rhai yn sylwi nad yw'r datganiad hwn yn fy arddull arferol, ac yr oeddwn am roi goslef briodol iddo, Lywydd, fel arwydd o wrogaeth a pharch at eich rôl bwysig fel Llywydd, yn enwedig ar yr adeg hon. Y fersiwn wedi'i gwtogi, mae'n debyg, yw hwn felly.

I am here today because of the wonderful work of the medical, nursing and support staff of the University Hospital of Wales, which is a centre of excellence, of which the National Assembly can be proud. I also acknowledge the wonderful support of the people of Blaenau Gwent to myself and my family throughout all of this, which I found very humbling. I now sit here representing the people of Blaenau Gwent as an independent Member and a socialist, because the Labour Party has expelled me after 40 years of membership. Since I am now making a personal statement, it would not be appropriate for me to mention the reasons that I have already put on record publicly, neither will I here, in this Plenary, seek to attach blame to other Assembly Members, or members of another place, because I respect the protocols. I will have other opportunities to do that, hopefully when I have left this session this afternoon. That is probably the unabridged version.

I will place my trust, as always, in the good people of Blaenau Gwent. For the future, therefore, I will be sitting here as an independent Member, proud to represent the people of that great constituency, where we still have the traditional values that others have sadly forgotten. I will judge Government policies that come before us on the benefit that they would offer to my constituents, and then on the wider benefits to the people of Wales. I am very grateful to the people of Blaenau Gwent for their support, encouragement and belief, and I am proud to represent them as their National Assembly Member.

Diolch yn fawr iawn.

Yr wyf yma heddiw o ganlyniad i waith ardderchog y staff meddygol, nyrsio a chynnal ym Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru, sy'n ganolfan rhagoriaeth y gall y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol fod yn falch ohoni. Yr wyf hefyd yn cydnabod y gefnogaeth wych a gefais i a fy nheulu gan bobl Blaenau Gwent drwy gydol hyn oll, a wnaeth imi deimlo'n wylaidd iawn. Eisteddaf yma yn awr yn cynrychioli pobl Blaenau Gwent fel Aelod annibynnol a sosialydd, oherwydd bod y Blaid Lafur wedi fy niarddel ar ôl 40 mlynedd o aelodaeth. Gan fy mod yn awr yn gwneud datganiad personol, ni fyddai'n briodol imi sôn am y rhesymau yr wyf eisoes wedi eu cofnodi'n gyhoeddus, ac ni wnaif ychwaith, yn y Cyfarfod Llawn hwn, geisio beio Aelodau eraill o'r Cynulliad, neu aelodau yn rhywle arall, gan fy mod yn parchu'r protocolau. Daw cyfle arall imi gael gwneud hynny, pan fyddaf wedi gadael y cyfarfod hwn y prynhawn yma gobeithio. Hwnnw yw'r fersiwn fydd heb ei gwtogi mae'n debyg.

Rhoddaf fy ymddiriedaeth, fel bob amser, ym mhobl dda Blaenau Gwent. O ran y dyfodol, felly, byddaf yn eistedd yma fel Aelod annibynnol, yn falch o gynrychioli pobl yr etholaeth radorol honno lle y mae'r gwerthoedd traddodiadol a aeth, ysywaeth, yn angof gan rai, yn fyw o hyd. Byddaf yn barnu polisïau'r Llywodraeth a ddaw ger ein bron ar sail y fantais y byddent yn ei rhoi i fy etholwyr, ac yna ar sail y manteision ehangach i bobl Cymru. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar dros ben i bobl Blaenau Gwent am eu cefnogaeth, eu hanogaeth a'u ffydd, ac yn falch o'u cynrychioli fel Aelod o'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

Thank you very much.

## **Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister**

### **The Fallen Stock Scheme Cynllun Stoc Trig**

**Q1 Mick Bates:** Will the First Minister make a statement on improving the fallen stock scheme? OAQ0397(FM)

**C1 Mick Bates:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar wella'r cynllun stoc trig? OAQ0397(FM)

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** Carwyn Jones, the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside, issued a statement on Friday, 8 April, setting out the short and medium-term actions being taken forward to address the problems currently being experienced and to improve the service offered by the National Fallen Stock Company.

**Mick Bates:** I am glad that you believe in the improvement agenda, just like the numbers on this side of the Chamber. Welcome back, Peter.

**Peter Law:** Thank you, Mick.

**Mick Bates:** First Minister, all the pressure was on the collection of stock during lambing. It may come as a surprise to you that lambing is an annual event, so it will occur again next year. Will you assure farmers and the public that the improved scheme, announced by your Minister, will mean that there will not be piles of dead stock on farms for three weeks, that local solutions, such as incinerators, better collection and digesters, will be found, and that the costs of the scheme will not bankrupt the Welsh sheep farmer? At present, the scheme, in the words of the President of the National Farmers Union, is a 'dead loss'.

**The First Minister:** Due to the high uptake of membership of the scheme and the heavy demands of the lambing season, there have been some short-term problems relating to collection, especially in north Wales. Our officials are working closely with the industry, local authorities, the National Fallen Stock Company and the Welsh Development Agency to alleviate that situation and prevent a recurrence in the next lambing season.

**Brynle Williams:** I raised this issue on 13 April in an urgent question. I ask you to urge your Minister to use his powers as head of animal health in Wales to allow an urgent derogation for burial until mid June. I have it on good authority that there are around 5,000 carcasses in a yard in Wrexham that cannot be moved. I beg you once again, First Minister, to ask Carwyn Jones to invoke his

**Prif Weinidog Cymru (Rhodri Morgan):** Ddydd Gwener, 8 Ebrill, cyhoeddodd Carwyn Jones, y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad, ddatganiad yn nodi'r gweithredu tymor canolig a thymor byr sydd ar y gweill i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau a brofir ar hyn o bryd ac i wella'r gwasanaeth a gynigir gan y Cwmni Stoc Trig Cenedlaethol.

**Mick Bates:** Yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn credu yn yr agenda wella, yn union fel y niferoedd ar yr ochr yma i'r Siambr. Croeso'n ôl, Peter.

**Peter Law:** Diolch yn fawr, Mick.

**Mick Bates:** Brif Weinidog, yr oedd y pwysau i gyd ar gasglu stoc yn ystod y cyfnod wyna. Efallai y bydd yn syndod i chi ddeall bod wyna yn ddigwyddiad blynyddol, ac y bydd felly'n digwydd eto y flwyddyn nesaf. A wnewch roi sicrwydd i ffermwyr a'r cyhoedd y bydd y cynllun wedi iddo gael ei wella, a gyhoeddwyd gan eich Gweinidog, yn golygu na fydd pentyrtau o stoc marw yn aros ar ein ffermydd am dair wythnos, y bydd atebion lleol fel llosgyddion, trefniadau casglu gwell a threulwyr, yn cael eu canfod, ac na fydd costau'r cynllun yn gwneud ffermwyr defaid Cymru yn fethdalwyr? Mae'r cynllun ar hyn o bryd, yng ngeiriau Llywydd Undeb Cenedlaethol yr Amaethwyr, yn 'dead loss'.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Oherwydd y nifer fawr sydd wedi ymaelodi â'r cynllun a'r galwadau trwm dros y cyfnod wyna, cafwyd rhai problemau tymor byr gyda'r casglu, yn enwedig yn y Gogledd. Mae ein swyddogion yn gweithio'n agos gyda'r diwydiant, yr awdurdodau lleol, y Cwmni Stoc Trig Cenedlaethol a'r awdurdod datblygu i wella'r sefyllfa ac i atal hyn rhag digwydd eto yn ystod tymor wyna y flwyddyn nesaf.

**Brynle Williams:** Codais y mater hwn ar 13 Ebrill mewn cwestiwn brys. Gofynnaf i chi bwyso ar eich Gweinidog i ddefnyddio ei bwerau fel pennaeth y gwasanaeth iechyd anifeiliaid yng Nghymru i ganiatáu, fel mater o frys, randdirymu er mwyn cael claddu tan ganol mis Mehefin. Cefais le sicr i gredu bod tua 5,000 o garcasau mewn iard yn Wrexham nad oes modd eu symud. Erfyniaf arnoch

powers. He has those powers, therefore he should use them.

**The First Minister:** I am not aware of the situation in Wrexham that you describe, but, clearly, Carwyn Jones, although he is not in the Chamber at the moment, will be aware of your point about 5,000 carcasses. We are aware of the problems with the collection system in north Wales and of the National Fallen Stock Company's resourcing problems, particularly in that part of Wales, although there are sporadic issues elsewhere.

Carwyn made the point in his response to your question that the EU regulations prohibit the burial and burning of fallen stock. To get legislation through to permit derogation would mean an even worse problem of the kind that Mick Bates described, namely it would not happen until after the end of the lambing season. We understand the problems of disease caused by lambs being born near dead sheep. That was not our intention in setting up the National Fallen Stock Company with Government funding for the first three years to get it up and running. However, derogation is fool's gold; it is more important to get the system up and running properly and ensure that we do not have the regional deficit that has caused such serious problems in north Wales.

unwaith eto, Brif Weinidog, ofyn i Carwyn Jones ddefnyddio ei bwerau. Mae'r pwerau hynny ganddo, felly dylai eu defnyddio.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni wn i am y sefyllfa yn Wrecsam a ddisgrifir gennych, ond, yn amlwg, bydd Carwyn Jones – er nad yw yn y Siambr ar hyn o bryd – yn ymwybodol o'ch pwynt ynghylch 5,000 o garcasau. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol o'r problemau gyda'r trefniadau casglu yn y Gogledd a phroblemau adnoddau'r Cwmni Stoc Trig Cenedlaethol, yn enwedig yn y rhan honno o Gymru, er bod gan rai ardaloedd eraill hefyd broblemau.

Gwnaeth Carwyn y pwynt yn ei ymateb i'ch cwestiwn bod rheoliadau'r Undeb Ewropeaidd yn gwahardd claddu a llosgi stoc marw. Byddai pasio deddfwriaeth i ganiatáu rhanddirymu'n gwneud y sefyllfa'n waeth fyth, yn debyg i'r sefyllfa a ddisgrifwyd gan Mick Bates; hynny yw, ni fyddai'n digwydd tan ar ôl y tymor wyna. Deallwn y problemau o ran afiechydon sy'n digwydd wrth i wŷn gael eu geni yn agos at ddefaid wedi marw. Nid hynny oedd ein bwriad wrth sefydlu'r Cwmni Stoc Trig Cenedlaethol, gyda chyllid gan y Llywodraeth ar gyfer y tair blynedd cyntaf i'w roi ar ben ffordd. Fodd bynnag, ffolineb fyddai rhanddirymu; mae'n bwysicach bod y system yn cael ei sefydlu ac yn gweithio'n iawn a sicrhau na fyddwn yn cael y diffygion rhanbarthol sydd wedi achosi problemau mor ddifrifol yn y Gogledd.

### **The Current Devolution Settlement Y Setliad Datganoli Presennol**

**Q2 Michael German:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the current devolution settlement? OAQ0387(FM)

**The First Minister:** The current settlement needs substantial amendment. Many agree with that proposition, although not everyone does. I have pursued this with the Secretary of State of Wales in line with the Assembly resolution of 6 October 2004, and a White Paper is now being prepared.

**Michael German:** There has been a great deal of discussion recently about your stance on the future of devolution. However, I am not very clear about what you stand for in this matter. Could you enlighten the people of

**C2 Michael German:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar y setliad datganoli presennol? OAQ0387(Y Prif Weinidog)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae angen diwygio'r setliad presennol yn sylweddol. Mae llawer, er nad pawb, yn cytuno â'r cynigiad. Yr wyf wedi trafod hyn gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru yn unol â phenderfyniad y Cynulliad ar 6 Hydref 2004, ac mae Papur Gwyn bellach yn cael ei baratoi.

**Michael German:** Cafwyd llawer iawn o drafod yn ddiweddar ynghylch eich safiad ar ddyfodol datganoli. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn glir iawn ynghylch yr hyn y sefwch drosto yn y mater hwn. A allech oleuo pobl Cymru

Wales by telling us where you stand on the future of devolution?

**The First Minister:** I would like to see major improvements through enhanced legislative powers that would be available to the third Assembly, starting in early May 2007.

**Michael German:** I would be most grateful if you could tell me precisely what you mean by 'enhanced legislative powers'. What will the Assembly be able to do under your proposal that it cannot currently do?

**The First Minister:** In the event of Labour being re-elected and the White Paper, currently in preparation, receiving the approval of the incoming Cabinet, we would expect to see a consultation period on the publication of a White Paper in early summer. Following consultation on the White Paper, we would expect to see a Bill to put into effect the best way of moving and enhancing our legislative powers.

There will always be an argument between those who would prefer to have a full-scale change to primary legislative powers, subject to a referendum, even though such powers may not be available by 2007, and those, like me, who would prefer to have something that may not be the full shilling, but that would be available to us by May 2007. That would involve a parliamentary release mechanism, if you like, without getting over-fussed between whether or not they are primary or secondary legislative powers—I do not think that the people of Wales are interested in titles, but they are interested in whether the Assembly has the tools with which to do the job. The title-attaching to legislation is much less important than whether it gives us the tools with which to do the job and whether we can start at the third Assembly or wait until the fourth Assembly to reap the benefit of that enhancement. I prefer the earlier version, in which we might not get the full shilling, but we do get it by the time the third Assembly starts in two years' time.

**Michael German:** That is a little clearer. You see it as a two-stage process, but the Richard commission has already proposed a two-stage process. The only difference is that

drwy ddweud wrthym beth yw eich safiad ar ddyfodol datganoli?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Hoffwn weld gwelliannau sylweddol ar ffurf pwerau deddfu gwella a fyddai ar gael i'r trydydd Cynulliad, gan ddechrau yn fuan ym mis Mai 2007.

**Michael German:** Byddwn yn dra diolchgar pe gallech ddweud wrthyf beth yn union a olygwch wrth "bwerau deddfu gwella". Beth fydd y Cynulliad yn gallu ei wneud o dan eich cynnig nad yw'n gallu ei wneud ar hyn o bryd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Pe bai'r Blaid Lafur yn cael ei hailethol a'r Papur Gwyn, sy'n cael ei baratoi ar hyn o bryd, yn cael sêl bendith y Cabinet newydd, byddem yn disgwyl gweld cyfnod o ymgynghori ar ôl cyhoeddi Papur Gwyn ddechrau'r haf. Wedi'r ymgynghori ar y Papur Gwyn, byddem yn disgwyl gweld Mesur a fyddai'n cyflwyno'r dull gorau o gynnig a gwella ein pwerau deddfu.

Bydd dadlau o hyd rhwng y rhai y byddai'n well ganddynt weld newid llwyr i bwerau deddfu sylfaenol, yn amodol ar refferendwm, er na fydd pwerau o'r fath efallai ar gael erbyn 2007, a rhai, fel fi, y byddai'n well ganddynt gael pwerau heb fod mor llawn, ond a fyddai ar gael erbyn Mai 2007. Byddai hynny'n golygu mecanwaith rhyddhau seneddol, os mynnwch, heb ymboeni gormod ynghylch ai pwerau deddfu sylfaenol ynteu is-ddeddfwriaeth ydynt—nid wyf yn credu bod gan bobl Cymru ddiddordeb mewn teitlau, ond maent yn poeni mwy ynghylch a oes gan y Cynulliad yr arfau iawn i wneud y gwaith ai peidio. Mae teitlau'r ddeddfwriaeth yn llawer llai pwysig na'r cwestiwn a ydyw'n rhoi'r arfau iawn inni wneud y gwaith, ac a allwn ddechrau gyda'r trydydd Cynulliad neu aros tan y pedwerydd Cynulliad i elwa ar y gwelliant yn y pwerau. Byddai'n well gennyf fi weld yr opsiwn cyntaf, lle na fyddem efallai yn cael y pwerau llawn, ond ein bod yn eu cael erbyn y bydd y trydydd Cynulliad yn dechrau ymhen dwy flynedd.

**Michael German:** Mae hynny ychydig yn gliriach. Yr ydych yn ei weld fel proses dau gam, ond mae comisiwn Richard eisoes wedi cynnig proses dau gam. Yr unig wahaniaeth

your timetable is a great deal longer than that proposed by the Richard commission. That is clear—under your proposals, we will have to wait until 2011 for full legislative powers.

Could you tell me, in the context of the Bill that you will propose, whether there are any other elected bodies in the United Kingdom that have that split between the executive and the legislature and which do not have full lawmaking powers? If that is the case, we will be on our own.

2.30 p.m.

**The First Minister:** I did not say anything about a two-stage approach. I expect that the Government White Paper—although I do not know as I have not seen it—will consult on a choice for the people of Wales. After the consultation period is over, clearly, there cannot be two choices in a Bill, so it will have to be one choice. I do not think that there is any question of two stages in the Bill, but it will propose enhanced legislative powers. I contest your comparison with what is proposed in the Richard commission report and what is proposed even under the more advanced ‘full shilling’ model that we have discussed here. I do not think that you are correct in your assumption of a comparison between timing and the Richard commission, and what I was talking about.

On the comparison with other legislatures, we would all agree that the corporate body status of the Assembly is unique in the United Kingdom, and needs to be brought to an end as quickly as possible.

**David Melding:** From the day of the Labour Party’s victory in the 1997 general election, it took just two years to establish parliaments in Northern Ireland and Scotland. Is there not a lack of the necessary political will in Wales? If you got moving, the next Assembly elections in 2007 could be elections to a full lawmaking parliament.

**The First Minister:** That is a view that you hold, but I do not know how many other

yw bod eich amserlen chi yn llawer hwy na’r un a gynigir gan gomisiwn Richard. Mae hynny’n glir—o dan eich cynigion chi, bydd yn rhaid inni aros tan 2011 am bwerau deddfu llawn.

A allwch ddweud wrthyf, yng nghyd-destun y Mesur y byddwch yn ei gynnig, a oes unrhyw gyrff etholedig eraill yn y Deyrnas Unedig sydd â’r rhaniad hwnnw rhwng y weithrediaeth a’r corff deddfwriaethol ac sydd heb bwerau deddfu llawn? Os yw hynny’n wir, byddwn ar ein pennau ein hunain.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni ddywedais ddim ynghylch dull dau gam. Disgwyliaf y bydd Papur Gwyn y Llywodraeth—er nad wyf yn gwybod gan nad wyf wedi ei weld—yn ymgynghori ynghylch dewis ar gyfer pobl Cymru. Pan ddaw’r cyfnod ymgynghori i ben, yn amlwg, ni ellir cael dau ddewis mewn Mesur, felly bydd yn rhaid cael un dewis. Ni chredaf fod amheuaeth y bydd dau gam yn y Mesur, ond bydd yn cynnig pwerau deddfwriaethol gwell. Yr wyf yn anghydweld â’ch cymhariaeth â’r hyn a gynigir yn adroddiad comisiwn Richard a’r hyn a gynigir hyd yn oed dan y model ‘swllt llawn’ sydd yn fwy blaengar ac a drafodwyd gennym yma. Ni chredaf eich bod yn gywir wrth dybio bod cymhariaeth rhwng yr amseriad a chomisiwn Richard, a’r hyn yr oeddwn i yn sôn amdano.

O ran cymharu â chyrrff deddfu eraill, byddem i gyd yn cytuno bod statws corff corfforaethol y Cynulliad yn unigryw yn y Deyrnas Unedig, a bod angen rhoi diwedd ar hynny cyn gynted ag sydd yn bosibl.

**David Melding:** Ers diwrnod buddugoliaeth y Blaid Lafur yn etholiad cyffredinol 1997, dim ond dwy flynedd a gymerwyd i sefydlu senedd yng Ngogledd Iwerddon a senedd yn yr Alban. Onid yw’r ewyllys wleidyddol angenrheidiol yn ddiffygiol yng Nghymru? Petaech yn gafael ynddi, gallai etholiadau nesaf y Cynulliad yn 2007 fod yn etholiadau i senedd lawn â’r grym i greu deddfwriaeth.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Eich barn chi yw hynny, ond ni wn faint o bobl eraill yn eich plaid

people in your party hold that same view. That is not a proposal being offered by your party to the people of Wales; it is probably a unique way that you have as a very small minority. It is absolutely clear that only a re-elected Labour Government can deliver a White Paper and a Bill, and it is a Labour Government that has currently authorised the preparation of a White Paper in response to the request that the Assembly Government made after a good debate in Plenary and vote taken on 6 October 2004. It therefore has a mandate from the Assembly, as the body representing the people of Wales, as well as the Government's support.

We can never presume what will happen on election day, but we hope that the result will enable us to move forward in a way that will enhance the Assembly's legislative powers in a way that will give us the tools to do the job, and without any complications that would prevent the power being available to us in 2007. However, others will take a different view, and that will emerge during the consultation period in the summer. However, everything depends on Labour being re-elected.

sydd yn arddel yr un farn. Nid yw eich plaid yn cynnig hynny i bobl Cymru; mae'n debyg fod hwn yn ddull unigryw sydd gennych oherwydd eich bod yn lleiafrif bach iawn. Mae'n gwbl amlwg mai dim ond Llywodraeth Lafur wedi'i hailethol a all ddarparu Papur Gwyn a Mesur, a Llywodraeth Lafur sydd wedi awdurdodi paratoi Papur Gwyn ar hyn o bryd i ymateb i gais a wnaethpwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ar ôl dadl dda yn y Cyfarfod Llawn a'r bleidlais a gynhaliwyd ar 6 Hydref 2004. Mae ganddi fandad gan y Cynulliad felly, fel y corff sy'n cynrychioli pobl Cymru, yn ogystal â chefnogaeth y Llywodraeth.

Ni allwn fyth gymryd yn ganiataol beth a fydd yn digwydd ar ddiwrnod etholiad, ond gobeithiwn y bydd y canlyniad yn ein galluogi i symud ymlaen mewn modd a fydd yn gwella pwerau deddfwriaethol y Cynulliad mewn modd a fydd yn ein harfogi i wneud y gwaith, a heb gymhlethdodau a fyddai'n golygu na fyddai'r pŵer gennym yn 2007. Fodd bynnag, bydd gan eraill farn wahanol, a daw hynny'n amlwg yn ystod y cyfnod ymgynghori dros yr haf. Fodd bynnag, mae popeth yn dibynnu ar ailethol Llafur.

### **Treth Incwm Leol A Local Income Tax**

**Q3 Eleanor Burnham:** What assessment has the Welsh Assembly Government made of the viability of introducing a local income tax to replace the current council tax system? OAQ0395(FM)

**The First Minister:** While last year's consultation on the balance of local authority funding in Wales concluded that local income tax was not a viable source of local revenue in the short term as the core basis of local authority revenue, that does not exclude a side-by-side local income tax plus council tax as a possible way forward.

**Eleanor Burnham:** After using Wales as a guinea pig for council tax rebanding, do you not agree that Labour has dodged the issue, and that the Liberal Democrat local income tax would be much fairer and of much more benefit to the majority of people in Wales, many of whom cannot cope with Labour's

**C3 Eleanor Burnham:** Pa asesiad y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi'i wneud o ymarferoldeb cyflwyno treth incwm leol i ddisodli'r system treth gyngor bresennol? OAQ0395(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Er i'r ymgynghoriad a gynhaliwyd y llynedd ynghylch cydbwysedd cyllid awdurdodau lleol Cymru gasglu nad oedd treth incwm leol yn ffynhonnell ymarferol o refeniw lleol yn y tymor byr fel sylfaen graidd refeniw awdurdod lleol, nid yw hynny'n golygu na fyddai'n bosibl ystyried gweithredu system o dreth incwm leol ochr yn ochr â'r dreth gyngor.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Ar ôl defnyddio Cymru fel arbrawf ar gyfer ailfandio'r dreth gyngor, onid ydych yn cytuno bod Llafur wedi osgoi'r mater, ac y byddai treth incwm leol y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn llawer tecach ac yn llawer mwy manteisiol i'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yng Nghymru, a nifer ohonynt yn methu



unfair and ever-increasing council tax?

**The First Minister:** I do not know how much you listened to my reply; it may have come as a bit of a shock, but not in such a way that you could not adapt the response to your question. When the Lyons review comes to an end, it may well recommend a new system. From our assessment of the balance of local authority funding, which we undertook in 2004, there was not massive support for a complete shift from council tax to local income tax. There are many losers if you switch to local income tax, and that begs the question of whether property should be taxed at all, which is what the Liberal Democrats' proposals would mean. However, that does not exclude introducing a hybrid system, but we must all await the outcome of the Lyons review.

**Leighton Andrews:** The question asks what assessment the Assembly Government has made of local income tax. Are you aware of an assessment made by the BBC's *Newsnight* programme of some proposals that would result in, for example, a fireman and a nurse in a constituency in Wales, like Cardiff Central, being £500 worse off? Will you give me an assurance that the Welsh Assembly Government will not introduce proposals for local taxation that would penalise hard-working public servants in that way?

**The First Minister:** Two people on average earnings would certainly be worse off; everyone accepts that. In fact, I have heard the leader of the Liberal Democrats say that two people on average earnings living in the same house would be worse off. Anyone earning above the average income would be considerably worse off. That could certainly include a nurse and a police officer.

The important thing is that people want buoyancy; they want tax revenue to rise naturally, and income tax gives you that. On the other hand, people also want the ease of collection of council tax, because houses do not move, but people do, and it is a very cheap tax to collect. Do you really want to

ag ymdopi â threth gyngor annheg Llafur sydd yn codi'n rheolaidd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni wn i ba raddau y gwnaethoch wrando ar fy ateb; efallai iddo eich synnu, ond nid i'r fath raddau nes eich bod yn methu ag addasu'r ymateb i'ch cwestiwn. Pan ddaw adolygiad Lyons i ben, efallai y bydd yn argymhell system newydd. Yn ôl ein hasesiad o gydbwysedd cyllid awdurdodau lleol, a gynhaliwyd gennym yn ystod 2004, ni chafwyd cefnogaeth frwd i newid yn gyfan gwbl o'r dreth gyngor i dreth incwm leol. Byddai llawer o bobl ar eu colled petaech yn newid i dreth incwm leol, ac mae hynny'n codi'r cwestiwn a ddylid trethu eiddo o gwbl, sef yr hyn y byddai cynnig y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn ei olygu. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n golygu na fyddai modd cyflwyno system gymysg, ond bydd yn rhaid i ni i gyd ddisgwyl am ganlyniad adolygiad Lyons.

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae'r cwestiwn yn gofyn pa asesiad y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi'i gynnal o dreth incwm leol. A ydych yn ymwybodol o asesiad a gynhaliwyd gan raglen *Newsnight* y BBC o rai cynigion a fyddai'n golygu, er enghraifft, fod dyn tân a nyrs mewn etholaeth yng Nghymru, fel Caerdydd, £500 ar eu colled? A wnewch fy sicrhau na fydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cyflwyno cynigion ar gyfer treth leol fel hyn a fyddai'n cosbi gweithwyr cyhoeddus sydd yn gweithio'n galed?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Byddai dau o bobl sy'n ennill cyflog cyfartalog yn siŵr o fod ar eu colled; mae pawb yn derbyn hynny. Mewn gwirionedd, yr wyf wedi clywed arweinydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn dweud y byddai dau ar gyflog cyfartalog sy'n byw yn yr un tŷ ar eu colled. Byddai unrhyw un sydd yn ennill mwy na'r incwm cyfartalog ar ei golled yn sylweddol. Gallai hynny gynnwys nyrs a heddwys yn sicr.

Y peth pwysig yw bod pobl eisiau economi fywiog; maent am weld refeniw treth yn codi'n naturiol, ac mae treth incwm yn rhoi hynny i chi. Ar y llaw arall, mae pobl eisiau'r hwylustod sydd ynglŷn â chasglu'r dreth gyngor, gan nad yw tai yn symud, yn wahanol i bobl, ac mae'n rhad iawn i'w

say that property will no longer be taxed? Most people believe that property, income and capital should be taxed, either by local or central Government. The problem has always been that council tax is not buoyant. The Lyons review will determine whether or not a hybrid system can be run.

**David Lloyd:** A ydych yn barod i edrych o ddifrif ar argymhellion i drethu pobl yn lleol yn seiliedig ar eu gallu i dalu?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** A ydych yn honni na ddylid codi unrhyw dreth ar eiddo? Mae pawb yn deall beth yw sail treth incwm, sef eich bod yn talu canran sy'n seiliedig ar eich incwm, ac mae pawb yn derbyn bod hynny'n deg. Fodd bynnag, a yw hynny'n golygu na ddylid byth godi unrhyw fath o dreth ar eiddo? Ni chredaf ei bod hi'n gwneud synnwyr i beidio â chodi treth ar gyfalaf nac ar eiddo. A yw'n gwneud synnwyr i lywodraeth leol beidio â chodi ei hincwm o'r un pwell, na physgota o'r un pwell â Llywodraeth ganolog sy'n codi treth ar incwm a chyfalaf, tra bod llywodraeth leol yn ei godi ar eiddo? Dyna sy'n dda am y system bresennol.

Yr hyn sy'n wan am y system bresennol yw'r ffaith nad yw eiddo yn codi. Felly, nid oes ganddo'r un *buoyancy* â threth incwm. Nid oes unrhyw un wedi gwadu bod posibilrwydd o gael system gymysg gyda llywodraeth leol yn rhannu elfen o dreth incwm leol gan barhau i godi treth ar eiddo.

**Glyn Davies:** The main problem with the council tax system is that your Government has driven up council tax to unaffordable levels. A written answer informs us that, last year, £924 million was raised through council tax. This year, following revaluation, the amount has increased by £92 million—an increase of 10 per cent. Can you explain why that is the case, when you and your Ministers promised us faithfully and regularly that the revaluation process would be revenue neutral?

**The First Minister:** You are wrong to say that we have driven up council tax. The only administration in recent memory to have

chasglu. A ydych mewn gwirionedd am ddweud na chaiff eiddo ei drethu mwyach? Cred y rhan fwyaf o bobl y dylid trethu eiddo, incwm a chyfalaf, naill ai drwy lywodraeth leol neu ganolog. Y broblem erioed yw nad yw'r dreth gyngor yn gyfrwng bywiog. Bydd adolygiad Lyons yn pennu a oes modd cael system gymysg ai peidio.

**David Lloyd:** Are you willing to seriously consider recommendations to tax people locally based on their ability to pay?

**The First Minister:** Are you claiming that property should not be taxed? Everyone understands the basis for income tax, namely that you pay a percentage based on your earnings; everyone accepts that that is fair. However, does that mean that property should never be taxed? I do not think that it makes sense not to tax capital or property. Does it make sense for local government not to derive its income from the same pool, or to fish from the same pool as central Government, which taxes income and capital, while local government taxes property? That is what is good about the current system.

What is weak about the current system is that property does not increase. It does not, therefore, have the same buoyancy as income tax. No-one has denied the possibility of having a hybrid system with local government sharing an element of a local income tax while continuing to tax property.

**Glyn Davies:** Y brif broblem gyda system y dreth gyngor yw bod eich Llywodraeth chi wedi codi'r dreth gyngor nes bod pobl yn methu fforddio'i thalu. Mewn ateb ysgrifenedig cawsom wybod bod £924 miliwn wedi cael ei godi y llynedd drwy'r dreth gyngor. Eleni, ar ôl ailbrisiu, mae'r swm wedi codi £92 miliwn—cynnydd o 10 y cant. A allwch egluro pam mae hyn wedi digwydd, pan oeddech chi a'ch Gweinidogion wedi addo'n daer ac yn rheolaidd y byddai'r broses ailbrisiu'n niwtral o ran refeniw?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych yn anghywir pan ddywedwch ein bod wedi codi'r dreth gyngor. Yr unig weinyddiaeth ddiweddar i

deliberately, openly and transparently driven up council tax was that of William Hague, when he was Secretary of State for Wales. In the first year following local government reorganisation, the last year that the Tories were in power, it was, to use your phrase, deliberately driven up. It went up by 18 per cent in Wales—twice the level of the rise in England. William Hague was then able to use that as a platform to say ‘Bye bye, Wales, I am now going to become leader of the Tory Party’. That is the process; that is how Tories use Wales. John Redwood handed £100 million back to the Treasury, and then ran for the leadership of the Tory Party. William Hague drove up council tax in Wales at twice the rate of the rise in England, and then ran for the leadership of the Tory Party. Wales is used as a springboard for people to launch their careers in the Tory Party in London. That is what Redwood did with his £100 million, and what William Hague also did when he deliberately put up the tax by 18 per cent in one year in Wales, twice as fast as in England.

godi'r dreth gyngor yn fwriadol, yn agored ac yn dryloyw oedd gweinyddiaeth William Hague, pan oedd yn Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Gymru. Yn ystod y flwyddyn gyntaf ar ôl ad-drefnu llywodraeth leol, sef y flwyddyn olaf pan oedd y Torïaid mewn grym, cafodd y dreth gyngor, gan ddefnyddio eich geiriau chi, ei gwthio i fyny yn fwriadol. Cododd 18 y cant yng Nghymru—cymaint ddwywaith â lefel y codiad yn Lloegr. Yr oedd William Hague wedyn yn gallu defnyddio hynny'n llwyfan i ddatgan 'Ffarwél Gymru, yr wyf yn awr am fod yn arweinydd y Blaid Doriáidd'. Dyna'r broses; dyna'r modd y mae'r Torïaid yn defnyddio Cymru. Rhoddodd John Redwood £100 miliwn yn ôl i'r Trysorlys, ac yna ymgeisio am arweinyddiaeth y Blaid Doriáidd. Cododd William Hague y dreth gyngor yng Nghymru gymaint ddwywaith ag a wnaed yn Lloegr, ac yna ymgeisio am arweinyddiaeth y Blaid Doriáidd. Defnyddir Cymru yn sbringfwrdd ganddynt i lansio eu gyrfa yn y Blaid Doriáidd yn Llundain. Dyna a wnaeth Redwood gyda'i £100 miliwn, a dyna a wnaeth William Hague pan aeth ati'n fwriadol i godi 18 y cant ar y dreth gyngor mewn blwyddyn, ddwywaith yn gynt nag yn Lloegr.

### Targedau Iechyd Health Targets

**C4 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am dargedau'r Llywodraeth ar gyfer iechyd? (WAQ0380)

**Q4 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Will the Minister make a statement on the Government's targets for health? (WAQ0380)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae ein targedau i wella iechyd yn seiliedig ar Her Iechyd Cymru. Dyna ein targedau strategol i leihau anghyfartaledd iechyd gyda'r gwialennau mesur hyn, fel gwella iechyd y galon, canser, iechyd meddwl a phlant.

**The First Minister:** Our targets to improve health are based on Health Challenge Wales. Those are our strategic targets to reduce health inequalities with these measuring-sticks, such as improving cardiac health, cancer, mental health and children's health.

2.40 p.m.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Brif Weinidog, yn ddiweddar, bu ichi osod targedau newydd i fynd i'r afael â rhestri aros, i'w cyrraedd erbyn 2009. Yn eich maniffesto yn 1999, rhoddwyd ymrwymiad na fyddai neb yn aros mwy na chwe mis ar restr allanol am apwyntiad i weld arbenigwr. Methwyd â chyflawni'r ymrwymiad hwnnw—yn wir, gwnaethoch ddyblu'r targed, ond yr ydych yn dal i fethu â'i gyflawni. Onid y gwir yw, Brif

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** First Minister, you recently set new targets to tackle waiting lists, to be achieved by 2009. In your manifesto in 1999, it was pledged that no-one would wait for more than six months for an out-patient appointment with a specialist. You have failed to fulfil that pledge—indeed, you have doubled the target, but you are still failing to meet it. Is it not true to say, First Minister, that you have failed the people of

Weinidog, eich bod wedi methu pobl Cymru o ran iechyd? Pam ddylai etholwyr gredu unrhyw darged a osodwyd gennych?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych wedi gweld y ffigurau a gyhoeddwyd mis diwethaf am y gwelliannau o ran pobl yn aros yn rhy hir i weld ymgynghorydd yn y lle cyntaf, ac yna i gael triniaeth. Mae nifer y bobl sy'n aros dros 18 mis i gael triniaeth wedi mynd i lawr 7 y cant o'r hyn oedd ddwy flynedd yn ôl. Felly, mae sicrwydd bod y 'supertanker' wedi troi o ran rhestrau aros yng Nghymru. Mae'r ffigurau yn dangos hynny yn glir.

Targedau 2009 fydd y cyntaf i gynnwys targedau ynghylch aros oherwydd diagnosteg neu am unrhyw therapïau. Wrth gwrs, mae targed hanner ffordd drwy'r broses honno, ar gyfer yr adeg hon yn 2007, sef targed o aros dim ond 16 mis fel claf allanol a chlaf mewnol.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** One target that greatly interests my constituents is that which states that, by the end of 2009, there will be a brand new, state-of-the-art hospital for Caerphilly. Do you understand the worries and fears of many of my constituents that, should the Conservatives be elected and cut back on public expenditure, that hospital may not come to pass?

**The First Minister:** By trebling the capital investment programme over the next two years, from £100 million this year to £300 million in the year starting 1 April 2007, we will be able to afford not only the big new hospital in Caerphilly—though that is the jewel in the crown of the hospital capital improvement programme in Wales—but many other hospitals as well. All of these would be prejudiced by any cut in public expenditure, such as is on offer from one party standing in the general election.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I ddychwelyd at y cwestiwn o faint o bobl sydd ar y rhestr aros, mae 51,000 o bobl yn fwy arnynt heddiw nag a oedd arnynt pan ddaethoch chi yn Brif Weinidog. A ydych chi'n falch o'r record honno?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Y peth pwysig yw ein bod

Wales on health? Why should voters believe any target that you set?

**The First Minister:** You have seen the figures published last month regarding the improvements made in terms of people waiting too long to see a consultant in the first place, and then for their treatment. The number of people waiting more than 18 months for treatment is down 7 per cent on what it was two years ago. Therefore, rest assured that the supertanker has turned in terms of waiting lists in Wales. The figures show that clearly.

The targets that we are aiming for in 2009 will be the first to include targets in relation to waiting for diagnostics or for any therapies. Of course, there is a target halfway through that process, for this time in 2007, namely for both in-patients and out-patients to wait no more than 16 months.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Un targed sydd o gryn ddiddordeb i'm hetholwyr yw'r un sydd yn datgan y bydd gennym ysbyty newydd hollol fodern yng Nghaerffili erbyn diwedd 2009. A ydych yn deall pryderon ac ofnau nifer o'm hetholwyr, sef, petai'r Ceidwadwyr yn cael eu hethol ac yn torri ar wariant, na welid lliw na llun yr ysbyty hwnnw?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Drwy dreblu'r rhaglen buddsoddiad cyfalaf yn ystod y ddwy flynedd nesaf, o £100 miliwn eleni i £300 miliwn yn y flwyddyn sydd yn dechrau 1 Ebrill 2007, gallwn fforddio yn ogystal â'r ysbyty newydd mawr yng Nghaerffili—er mai hwnnw fydd canolbwynt rhaglen buddsoddiad cyfalaf ysbytai Cymru—nifer o ysbytai eraill hefyd. Byddai unrhyw dorri ar wariant cyhoeddus yn rhoi'r rhain yn y fantol, fel y cynigir gan un blaid sydd yn sefyll yn yr etholiad cyffredinol.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** To return to the question of how many people are on the waiting list, 51,000 more people are on them today than there were when you became First Minister. Are you proud of that record?

**The First Minister:** The important thing is

wedi cymryd camau ymlaen yn ystod y ddwy flynedd ddiwethaf o ran lleihau'r rhestrau aros hir. Credaf fod cytundeb ar draws y pedair plaid a gynrychiolir yn y Cynulliad ynglŷn â'r angen i newid y pwyslais o nifer y bobl a oedd ar y rhestrau aros i'r amser yr oedd pobl yn parhau i fod arnynt. Felly, cymerwyd camau ymlaen dros y ddwy flynedd ddiwethaf. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, dim ond 7 y cant sydd yn awr yn aros dros 18 mis am driniaeth fewnol o'i gymharu â'r nifer ddwy flynedd yn ôl. Mae hynny'n gam enfawr ymlaen, ac yn dangos yn glir fod *supertanker* y rhestrau aros yng Nghymru wedi troi.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** You carry on answering questions that you were not asked, First Minister. I remind you of the figures: we have 51,000 more people on the waiting list than when you became First Minister. When you were elected First Minister, 239,000 people were on the waiting list. In the following year, that number went up to 247,000. In 2002, it went up to 283,000. In 2003, it went up to 300,813. In 2004, it went up to 302,000. It has now gone down to 291,000.

The numbers on waiting lists have increased for four out of the five years that you have been First Minister. Do you realise that, if that downward trend continues in exactly the same way, it will take 10 years—until 2009—for us to be back where we were in 1999? How can you, as First Minister, possibly be proud of that record?

**The First Minister:** I am proud of our record in bringing down waiting lists since the second offer guarantee scheme came in. On the long waits, we all agreed, across the four parties when we came in, that the key issue was not the numbers on the waiting lists, but how long people waited on the waiting lists. We all agreed with that. There was never any dissent from that proposition. It is important that we realise how much progress has been made.

The proportion now waiting over 18 months for in-patient treatment is 7 per cent of what it was two years ago. That is a massive achievement for the staff of the national

that we have made strides forward over the past two years in reducing long waiting lists. I believe that there was support across all four parties represented in the Assembly regarding the need to switch the emphasis from the number of people on the waiting lists to the amount of time that people remained on them. Therefore, progress has been made over the past two years. As I said earlier, only 7 per cent are now waiting over 18 months on an in-patient waiting list compared with the figure two years ago. That is another huge stride forward and clearly shows that the supertanker of waiting lists in Wales has turned.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr ydych yn parhau i ateb cwestiynau nas gofynnwyd, Brif Weinidog. Yr wyf yn eich atgoffa o'r ffigurau: mae gennym 51,000 yn fwy o bobl ar restrau aros na phan ddaethoch yn Brif Weinidog. Pan gawsoch eich ethol yn Brif Weinidog, yr oedd 239,000 o bobl ar restrau aros. Yn y flwyddyn ganlynol, yr oedd y nifer wedi codi i 247,000. Yn 2002, cododd i 283,000. Yn 2003, cododd i 300,813. Yn 2004, cododd i 302,000. Erbyn hyn mae wedi disgyn i 291,000.

Mae'r niferoedd ar restrau aros wedi codi yn ystod pedair o'r pum mlynedd yr ydych wedi bod yn Brif Weinidog. A ydych yn sylweddoli, os bydd y duedd honno ar i lawr yn parhau yn yr un modd yn union, y bydd angen 10 mlynedd—hyd at 2009—i ni ddychwelyd i'r sefyllfa yr oeddem ynddi yn 1999? Sut y gallwch chi, fel Prif Weinidog, fod yn falch o'r record honno?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn falch o'n record ar leihau rhestrau aros ers cyflwyno cynllun gwarant yr ail gynnig. O ran yr arosiadau hir, cytunodd pawb ohonom, yn y pedair plaid pan ddaethom i mewn, nad y niferoedd ar y rhestrau aros oedd y mater allweddol, ond pa mor hir yr oedd pobl yn aros ar y rhestrau aros. Bu inni oll gytuno ar hynny. Ni fu dim anghytundeb erioed â'r gosodiad hwnnw. Mae'n bwysig inni sylweddoli cymaint o gynnydd a wnaethpwyd.

Mae'r gyfran sydd yn aros yn hwy na 18 mis yn awr am driniaeth fel cleifion mewnol yn 7 y cant o'r hyn ydoedd ddwy flynedd yn ôl. Mae hynny'n gamp aruthrol ar ran staff y

health service, and I would like, one day, to hear the leader of the opposition praise the staff of the NHS. I am happy for him to try to knock six bells out of me—that is what I am here for, that is politics, and we all accept that. However, just occasionally, a pat on the back for the fantastic efforts of the NHS staff in achieving the huge cuts in long in-patient waiting lists that we have seen over the past two years would be appropriate. That gives you confidence that, if we can achieve that since the second offer guarantee scheme came in, we can achieve the 16-month combined waiting lists target for April 2007, as well as those for the all-up waiting lists. The all-up lists include the waits that were never counted before—they were never counted under the Conservatives, in England or Wales—namely those for diagnostics and therapies. The all-up waiting list target of six months by the end of 2009 can be achieved, in the same way as we have achieved the targets that we have set for this current period.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Again, First Minister, you do not answer my question. I will repeat it. When you became First Minister, the total number of people on waiting lists was 239,000; now it is 291,014. That is an additional 51,000 people on waiting lists. Surely you cannot be proud of that record?

On your excuses for those increases, first, you blame opposition politicians. I put on record that I have great respect for everyone working in the health service, and I have always said that. You should not claim that we do not respect people who work in the health service. What we have criticised is your health policy, so you blame opposition politicians. You go on to say that the statistics have changed. Then, on 12 April, you said that waiting lists—these data—had been stuffed in drawers in some office in Cardiff bay or Cathays park. [*Interruption.*] On 12 April, you said that they had been stuffed in drawers—those were your exact words. You now have an opportunity to deny whether that is the case. [*Interruption.*] I will finish my question when I have finished, First Minister, not when you tell me that I

gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol a, ryw diwrnod, carwn glywed arweinydd yr wrthblaid yn canmol staff y GIG. Yr wyf yn fodlon iddo geisio fy nharo nes y byddaf yn bwrw fy mhedolau—dyna pam yr wyf yma, peth felly yw gwleidyddiaeth, ac yr ydym oll yn derbyn hynny. Er hynny, ambell waith, priodol fyddai rhoi ychydig o glod i staff y GIG am eu hymdrechion gwych i sicrhau'r gostyngiadau anferth yn y rhestrau aros i gleifion mewnol a welsom yn ystod y ddwy flynedd ddiwethaf. Mae'r ffaith ein bod wedi sicrhau hynny ers cyflwyno cynllun gwarant yr ail gynnig yn ennyn hyder y gallwn gyrraedd y targed o 16 mis ar gyfer y rhestrau aros cyfunol erbyn Ebrill 2007, yn ogystal â'r rhai ar gyfer y rhestrau aros cyfan. Mae'r rhestrau cyfan yn cynnwys yr arosiadau nas cyfrifwyd o'r blaen—nis cyfrifwyd erioed o dan y Ceidwadwyr, yng Nghymru na Lloegr—sef y rhai ar gyfer diagnosteg a therapïau. Gellir cyrraedd y targed o chwe mis ar gyfer y rhestrau aros cyfan erbyn diwedd 2009, yn yr un modd ag y cyraeddasom y targedau a osodasom ar gyfer y cyfnod cyfredol.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Unwaith eto, Brif Weinidog, nid ydych yn ateb fy nghwestiwn. Fe'i hailadroddaf. Pan ddaethoch yn Brif Weinidog, cyfanswm y rhai a oedd ar restrau aros oedd 239,000; mae bellach yn 291,014. Dyna 51,000 yn rhagor o bobl ar restrau aros. Nid oes bosibl y gallwch fod yn falch o'r record honno?

Ynghylch eich esgusion dros y cynnydd hwnnw, yn gyntaf, rhowch y bai ar wleidyddion y gwrthbleidiau. Dywedaf ar goedd fod gennyf barch mawr at bawb sydd yn gweithio yn y gwasanaeth iechyd, ac yr wyf wedi dweud hynny erioed. Ni ddylech honni nad ydym yn parchu'r rhai sydd yn gweithio yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Yr hyn yr ydym wedi ei feirniadu yw eich polisi iechyd, felly yr ydych yn rhoi'r bai ar wleidyddion y gwrthbleidiau. Ewch ymlaen i ddweud bod yr ystadegau wedi newid. Yna, ar 12 Ebrill, dywedasoch fod rhestrau aros—y data hwn—wedi eu gwthio i ddroriau mewn rhyw swyddfa ym mae Caerdydd neu ym mharc Cathays. [*Torri ar draws.*] Ar 12 Ebrill, dywedasoch eu bod wedi eu gwthio i ddroriau—dyna oedd eich union eiriau. [*Torri ar draws.*] Gorffennaf fy nghwestiwn

have.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I did not think that it was going to get this bad today—I thought that that would happen next Tuesday.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Let us come back to these excuses, First Minister. These are pathetic little excuses from a Minister who has a miserable record on the health service in Wales. Your responsibility to the 51,000 people on waiting lists is to apologise for the way that you have run the NHS in the last five years.

**The First Minister:** That little peroration was not worth waiting for—it would have been much better had you sat down when I suggested that you should. You brought out your worst Dolgellau quarter-sessions manner there.

Let us be clear. You said that you offered congratulations to NHS staff. However, I would have liked to hear you say it. What is it that stops you from saying ‘congratulations’ to NHS staff? Kick the First Minister as much as you like—I do not mind that, I am quite happy about it because that is why I am here. However, just occasionally, NHS staff would like to hear you say ‘congratulations’ to them—here, in the Chamber, on a Tuesday—on their fantastic achievements in bringing down long waits in the NHS.

You then asked whether the figures are comparable—this 51,000 increase. You mentioned that I have said that the figures are not comparable. That is what I have been told. You then invented something that you had to withdraw when I challenged you, saying ‘no’ and shaking my head. You said that these figures have been stuffed in drawers in Cathays park or Cardiff bay. I have never said that, and I noticed that, after Dr Gibbons made a few remarks to you, you withdrew it, quite rightly, because we have never said that they were stuffed in drawers in Cardiff bay or in Cathays park. I have never said that, and we have never said that.

pan fyddaf wedi ei orffen, Brif Weinidog, nid pan ddywedwch chi fy mod wedi ei orffen.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni thybiwn y byddai’n mynd cyn waethed â hyn heddiw—credwn y digwyddai hynny ddydd Mawrth nesaf.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Gadewch inni ddod yn ôl at yr esgusion hyn, Brif Weinidog. Esgusion bach tila yw’r rhain gan Weinidog sydd â record druenus o ran y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru. Eich cyfrifoldeb chi i’r 51,000 o bobl sydd ar restrau aros yw ymddiheuro am y modd yr ydych wedi rhedeg y GIG yn y pum mlynedd diwethaf.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid oedd y diwedd glo bach hwnnw’n werth disgwyl amdano—llawer gwell fuasai ichi eistedd pan awgrymais y dylech wneud hynny. Bu ichi annerch yn eich arddull llys chwarter Dolgellau ar ei gwaethaf.

Gadewch inni ddeall hyn. Dywedasoeh eich bod yn llongyfarch staff y GIG. Fodd bynnag, byddwn wedi hoffi’ch clywed yn dweud hynny. Beth sydd yn eich rhwystro rhag dweud ‘llongyfarchiadau’ wrth staff y GIG? Bwriwch y Prif Weinidog gymaint ag y mynnoch—nid oes gwahaniaeth gennyf am hynny, yr wyf yn eithaf bodlon ar hynny oherwydd dyna pam yr wyf yma. Er hynny, ambell waith, carai staff y GIG eich clywed yn dweud ‘llongyfarchiadau’ wrthynt—yma, yn y Siambr, ar ddydd Mawrth—ar eu llwyddiannau gwych wrth leihau’r arosiadau hir yn y GIG.

Gofynasoch wedyn a ellir cymharu’r ffigurau—y cynnydd hwn o 51,000. Soniasoch fy mod wedi dweud na ellir cymharu’r ffigurau. Felly y dywedwyd wrthyf. Yna bu ichi ddyfeisio rhywbeth y bu’n rhaid ichi ei dynnu’n ôl pan heriais chi, gan ddweud ‘na’ ac ysgwyd fy mhen. Dywedasoeh fod y ffigurau hyn wedi eu gwthio i ddroriau ym mharc Cathays neu ym mae Caerdydd. Ni ddywedais hynny erioed, a sylwais eich bod wedi tynnu hynny’n ôl, wedi i Dr Gibbons wneud ychydig o sylwadau wrthyf, a hynny’n gwbl briodol, oherwydd ni ddywedasoeh erioed eu bod wedi eu gwthio i ddroriau ym mae Caerdydd neu ym mharc Cathays. Ni ddywedais i hynny erioed, ac ni ddywedasoeh ni hynny

erioed.

2.50 p.m.

We have never said that they were stuffed in drawers in Cathays park or Cardiff bay. On no occasion have we ever said that, and I am pleased that you withdrew that remark when Dr Gibbons made a sedentary comment. I hope that you will apologise for attributing to me comments that I have never made. They were, we are told, stuffed in drawers in an untidy manner here, there and everywhere throughout Wales. The figures that we now have are proper figures, and the previous figures are not comparable with them. What is most important now is the fact that we have a massive reduction in long waits on waiting lists, and we know how to do the job. The second offer guarantee scheme is working superbly. The NHS supertanker of long waits on waiting lists has been turned around, and progress will continue, provided that we do not have the kind of public expenditure cutbacks referred to earlier over the next three or four years.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Let me remind you of exactly what you did say. Perhaps you can tell us where these drawers are. You told Plenary on 12 April 2005:

‘The figures were stuffed in drawers here, there and everywhere’.

Where is ‘here’, where is ‘there’, and where is ‘everywhere’?

**The First Minister:** If you do not know that that does not mean in Cathays park or Cardiff bay, then I am very sorry for you. That is a pathetic excuse. You are now withdrawing your claim that I said it was in Cathays park or Cardiff bay because you cannot find the quotation, and you will not find it, because I never said it. ‘Here, there and everywhere’ means in offices of the national health service anywhere. That is what we have been told. I was not around then, but that is what we are told.

Ni ddywedasom erioed eu bod wedi eu gwthio i ddroriau ym mharc Cathays neu ym mae Caerdydd. Ni ddywedasom hynny ar dim un achlysur, ac yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi tynnu’r sylw hwnnw’n ôl pan wnaeth Dr Gibbons sylw ar ei eistedd. Gobeithiaf y byddwch yn ymddiheuro am briodoli sylwadau i mi nas gwneuthum erioed. Dywedir wrthym eu bod wedi eu gwthio’n flêr i ddroriau ym mhob man ledled Cymru. Mae’r ffigurau sydd gennym yn awr yn ffigurau iawn, ac ni ellir cymharu’r ffigurau blaenorol â hwy. Y peth pwysicaf yn awr yw’r ffaith bod yr arosiadau hir ar restrau aros wedi gostwng yn aruthrol, a’n bod yn gwybod sut i wneud y gwaith. Mae cynllun gwarant yr ail gynnig yn gweithio’n rhagorol. Mae llong fawr y GIG o ran arosiadau hir ar restrau aros wedi cael ei throi yn ei chylch, a bydd y cynnydd yn parhau, ar yr amod na chawn y math o doriadau ar wariant cyhoeddus y cyfeiriwyd atynt yn gynharach dros y tair neu bedair blynedd nesaf.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Gadewch imi eich atgoffa beth yn union a ddywedasoch. Efallai y gallwch ddweud wrthym ym mhle y mae’r droriau hyn. Dywedasoch yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 12 Ebrill 2005:

‘Yr oedd y ffigurau wedi eu gwthio mewn droriau yma ac acw’.

Ym mhle y mae ‘yma ac acw’?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Os na wyddoch nad yw hynny’n golygu parc Cathays neu fae Caerdydd, mae’n drueni gennyf drosoch. Esgus gwael iawn yw hwnnw. Yr ydych bellach yn tynnu’n ôl eich honiad i’r perwyl fy mod wedi dweud mai ym mharc Cathays neu ym mae Caerdydd yr oedd hynny gan na allwch ddod o hyd i’r dyfyniad, ac ni ddewch o hyd iddo, gan na ddywedais hynny erioed. Mae ‘yma ac acw’ yn golygu swyddfeydd y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol mewn unrhyw fan. Dyna a ddywedwyd wrthym. Nid oeddwn yno ar y pryd, ond dyna a ddywedir wrthym.



The big improvement is that we now have the proper collection of data, for the first time, on out-patient waiting list figures. That is a fact, and that is what I am told by those running the national health service in Wales. The important issue is that, for the third time, I have asked you whether you would please congratulate national health service staff on their fantastic efforts. Once again, you have failed to do so.

**Nick Bourne:** Obviously, your advisers have told you to stick to two lines resolutely, which are to blame the statistics—which you did say were stuffed in drawers, as we have now established—and to suggest that opposition politicians are attacking the dedicated staff who work in the health service. I challenge you to find in any record in the last five years a comment attacking the health service professionals, who are uniformly excellent. They have attacked you, of course, but that is a little different.

Let us return to your record, because this is less of a supertanker and more an *RMS Titanic*. It is not about those working in the service, but who is on the bridge. You are on the bridge, and it is on your watch that a record number of people are on waiting lists in Wales. That is your fault—will you now apologise for that?

**The First Minister:** You are rearranging what I said, again rather conveniently. You perhaps ought to revise your remarks. I never said that you had attacked NHS staff. I said that there was a singular failure to congratulate NHS staff. Again, you had the opportunity to do that. What is it that prevents you from doing that? Why do you not congratulate them on the excellence of their efforts in bringing down the waiting lists? You said that I said that you had attacked them. I never did—you rearranged my words. What I said was that it would be a good idea if, on just one occasion, you were to congratulate them on their success in bringing down the waiting lists. I do not mind your attacking me, but I do regret that you

Y gwelliant mawr a gafwyd yw ein bod bellach yn casglu data mewn modd priodol, am y tro cyntaf, ar ffigurau'r rhestrau aros i gleifion allanol. Mae hynny'n ffaith, a dyna a ddywedir wrthyf gan y rhai sy'n rhedeg y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru. Y peth pwysig yw fy mod wedi gofyn i chi, am y trydydd tro, a fyddech cystal â llongyfarch staff y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol ar eu hymdrechion gwych. Unwaith eto, yr ydych heb wneud hynny.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae'n amlwg bod eich cynghorwyr wedi dweud wrthyf am ddal yn dynn at ddau safbwynt, sef rhoi'r bai ar yr ystadegau—y dywedasoed eu bod wedi eu gwrthio i ddroriau, fel y cawsom gadarnhad bellach—ac awgrymu bod gwleidyddion y gwrthbleidiau'n ymosod ar y staff ymroddedig sydd yn gweithio yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Fe'ch heriaf i ddod o hyd i unrhyw sylw mewn unrhyw gofnod yn y pum mlynedd diwethaf sydd yn ymosod ar weithwyr proffesiynol y gwasanaeth iechyd, sydd oll yn rhagorol. Maent hwy wedi ymosod arnoch chi, wrth gwrs, ond mae hynny braidd yn wahanol.

Gadewch inni droi'n ôl at eich record, gan mai *RMS Titanic* yw hon yn hytrach na llong fawr. Nid oes a wnelo hyn â'r rhai sydd yn gweithio yn y gwasanaeth, ond â'r sawl sydd ar y bont. Chi sydd ar y bont, ac o dan eich goruchwyliaeth chi y ceir y nifer fwyaf erioed ar restrau aros yng Nghymru. Chi sydd ar fai am hynny—a wnewch ymddiheuro am hynny'n awr?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych yn newid yr hyn a ddywedais, a hynny eto'n eithaf cyfleus. Efallai y dylech ailystyried eich sylwadau. Ni ddywedais erioed eich bod wedi ymosod ar staff y GIG. Dweud a wneuthum fod anallu eithriadol i longyfarch staff y GIG. Unwaith eto, cawsoch gyfle i wneud hynny. Pa beth sydd yn eich atal rhag gwneud hynny? Pam na wnewch eu llongyfarch ar eu hymdrechion rhagorol wrth leihau'r rhestrau aros? Dywedasoed fy mod wedi dweud eich bod wedi ymosod arnynt. Ni ddywedais hynny erioed—newidiasoch fy ngeiriau. Yr hyn a ddywedais oedd mai syniad da, am unwaith, fyddai ichi eu llongyfarch ar eu llwyddiant wrth leihau'r rhestrau aros. Nid oes gwahaniaeth gennyf os byddwch yn ymosod

cannot bring yourself—even today—to congratulate NHS staff on their success in bringing down waiting lists.

Finally, you are right; I did use the expression, and I continue to use it. I believe that, based on the advice that I have received, out-patient waiting list figures were stuffed in drawers here, there and everywhere.

**Nick Bourne:** If you consult the record—and you are obviously not listening to what I am saying—you will see that I said that the staff are uniformly excellent. If that is not congratulating them, then I would like to know what is. Of course they are excellent, as I have just said and I now repeat. The person who is not excellent is the First Minister on the bridge, whose fault it is that the waiting list position is as dire as it is. I asked in a direct question, which you avoided as you always do, whether you would apologise to the people of Wales and to the health service professionals—all of whom are excellent and provide a first-class service to us—for what has gone wrong on your watch. You promised to eliminate those waiting list delays, and you have not done so—the situation has worsened. Will you apologise?

**The First Minister:** I ask you clearly, in words of one syllable—except for ‘congratulate’—can you congratulate the staff of the national health service in Wales on bringing down the national health service waiting lists? You just will not do it, will you? It does not matter that you have the opportunity to say to the people out there, ‘I congratulate national health service staff in Wales on what they have done to bring down waiting lists in Wales’. I can do it, but you and Ieuan cannot. Why is that? What is the difficulty that you have with congratulating them on bringing down waiting lists in Wales? Kick me as much as you like, Nick; I do not mind. When it comes to what you refer to as a dire situation, I tell you that the supertanker has turned around, because long waits for in-patient treatment now stand at 7 per cent of what they were two years ago. You think that that is not a success and that

arnaf fi, ond mae’n ofid imi nad ydych yn barod—hyd yn oed heddiw—i longyfarch staff y GIG ar eu llwyddiant wrth leihau’r rhestrau aros.

Yn olaf, yr ydych yn iawn; defnyddiais yr ymadrodd hwnnw, ac yr wyf yn dal i’w ddefnyddio. Yr wyf yn credu, yn ôl yr hyn a ddywedwyd wrthyf, fod ffigurau’r rhestrau aros i gleifion allanol wedi eu gwthio i ddroriau yma ac acw.

**Nick Bourne:** Os darllenwch y cofnod—ac mae’n amlwg nad ydych yn gwranddo ar yr hyn yr wyf yn ei ddweud—gwelwch fy mod wedi dweud bod yr holl staff yn rhagorol. Os nad eu llongyfarch yw peth felly, carwn wybod beth yw. Maent yn rhagorol, wrth gwrs, fel yr wyf newydd ddweud ac fel yr wyf yn ailadrodd yn awr. Yr un nad yw’n rhagorol yw’r Prif Weinidog ar y bont, sydd ar fai am y sefyllfa druenus o ran y rhestrau aros. Gofynnais mewn cwestiwn uniongyrchol, y gwnaethoch ei osgoi fel y gwnewch bob amser, a wnaech ymddiheuro i bobl Cymru ac i weithwyr proffesiynol y gwasanaeth iechyd—y maent oll yn rhagorol ac yn darparu gwasanaeth o’r radd flaenaf ar ein cyfer—am yr hyn a aeth o’i le dan eich goruchwyliaeth. Bu ichi addo dileu’r oedi ar restrau aros, ac ni wnaethoch hynny—mae’r sefyllfa wedi gwaethygu. A wnewch ymddiheuro?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gofynnais i chi’n glir, mewn geiriau un sillaf—heblaw ‘llongyfarch’—a allwch longyfarch staff y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru ar leihau rhestrau aros y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Ni wnewch hynny, na wnewch? Nid yw o bwys bod gennych gyfle i ddweud wrthynt, ‘Llongyfarchaf staff y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru ar yr hyn a wnaethant i leihau’r rhestrau aros yng Nghymru’. Gallaf fi wneud hynny, ond ni allwch chi nac Ieuan. Pam y mae hynny? Pam y’i cewch yn anodd eu llongyfarch ar leihau’r rhestrau aros yng Nghymru? Cewch fy mwrw gymaint ag y mynnoch, Nick; nid oes gwahaniaeth gennyf. O ran yr hyn yr ydych yn ei alw’n sefyllfa druenus, dywedaf wrthyf fod y llong fawr wedi troi yn ei chylch, gan fod yr arosiadau hir am driniaeth i gleifion mewnol bellach yn 7 y cant o’r hyn oeddent ddwy flynedd yn ôl. Credwch nad

no-one deserves congratulations on that; I say that national health service staff deserve congratulations on their effort in doing that. Can you join me in congratulating NHS staff on their success in bringing down long waits on waiting lists in the NHS in Wales?

**Nick Bourne:** Any success that we have had in the health service has been despite you, not because of you. I have congratulated the NHS twice now, and I look forward to the time when you are able to ask me questions. I am here to ask you questions. Will you apologise for the dire situation of the health service in Wales on your watch, with the implementation of policies that are running the health service into the ground? The situation here is far worse than that in England. By 2009, people in England will be treated within 18 weeks. In Wales, even if your aspirations are met, there will be a second-class service: it will be 26 weeks, and it is far worse now. Is it not about time that you apologised, resigned and let someone else take over who can do a better job? It would not be difficult.

**The First Minister:** That is not a question; that is simply using the NHS as a political football. That is all that you want to do. Long waits on waiting lists are now down to 7 per cent of what they were two years ago, and someone must deserve congratulations on that. I know that that is probably not me as far as you are concerned—it never could be. The second offer guarantee scheme was brought in by Jane Hutt and has been pursued by Brian Gibbons to an extraordinary degree of success. That is why the supertanker on long waits has turned around in Wales and why NHS staff deserve a huge amount of congratulations on their success. I have managed to get you to say congratulations, but you will not say the second part, because you are using the issue as a political football. You will not say that you congratulate them on their success in bringing NHS waiting lists down.

You mentioned 2008 and 2009 and said that there will be a second-class service. There is

llwyddiant yw hynny ac nad oes neb sydd yn haeddu cael ei longyfarch ar hynny; dywedaf finnau fod staff y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yn haeddu eu llongyfarch ar eu hymdrechion wrth wneud hynny. A allwch ymuno â mi i longyfarch staff y GIG ar eu llwyddiant wrth leihau arosiadau hir ar restrau aros yn y GIG yng Nghymru?

**Nick Bourne:** Mae unrhyw lwyddiant a gawsom yn y gwasanaeth iechyd wedi digwydd er eich gwaethaf chi, nid o'ch herwydd. Yr wyf wedi llongyfarch y GIG ddwywaith bellach, ac edrychaf ymlaen at yr adeg y gallwch chi ofyn cwestiynau i mi. Yr wyf yma i ofyn cwestiynau i chi. A wnewch ymddiheuro am sefyllfa druenus y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru dan eich goruchwyliaeth chi, pan roddir polisïau ar waith sydd yn difetha'r gwasanaeth iechyd? Mae'r sefyllfa yma'n waeth o lawer nag ydyw yn Lloegr. Erbyn 2009, caiff pobl yn Lloegr eu trin cyn pen 18 wythnos. Yng Nghymru, hyd yn oed os gwiredir eich dyheadau, ceir gwasanaeth eilradd: bydd yn 26 wythnos, ac mae'n waeth o lawer yn awr. Onid yw'n bryd ichi ymddiheuro, ymddiswyddo a gadael i rywun arall gymryd drosodd a all wneud y gwaith yn well? Ni fyddai hynny'n beth anodd.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid cwestiwn yw hwnnw; defnyddio'r GIG fel pêl wleidyddol yw hynny. Dyna'r cwbl y dymunwch ei wneud. Mae arosiadau hir ar restrau aros wedi gostwng bellach i 7 y cant o'r hyn oeddent ddwy flynedd yn ôl, ac mae rhywun yn sicr o haeddu cael ei longyfarch ar hynny. Gwn nad myfi fyddai hwnnw, yn ôl pob tebyg, o'ch rhan chi—ni allai hynny fod byth. Cyflwynwyd cynllun gwarant yr ail gynnig gan Jane Hutt ac fe'i dilynwyd gan Brian Gibbons gyda llwyddiant rhyfeddol. Dyna pam y mae llong fawr yr arosiadau hir wedi troi yn ei chylch yng Nghymru a dyna pam y mae staff y GIG yn haeddu eu llongyfarch yn fawr ar eu llwyddiant. Yr wyf wedi llwyddo i gael gennych ddweud llongyfarchiadau, ond ni ddywedwch yr ail ran, gan eich bod yn defnyddio'r pwnc hwn fel pêl wleidyddol. Ni ddywedwch eich bod yn eu llongyfarch ar eu llwyddiant wrth leihau rhestrau aros y GIG.

Cyfeiriasoch at 2008 a 2009 a dweud y bydd gwasanaeth eilradd. Nid oes gwahaniaeth o

no significant difference between our offer in 2009 and the offer in England in 2008, because we collect out-patient waiting list statistics on a different basis and swell them by anything up to 40 or 50 per cent as we include consultant-to-consultant referrals, which England does not. I do not think that there will be a significant difference between access to consultation or treatment in the NHS in England and in Wales in 2008 and 2009. However, you have to continue to tell lies about the health service, as your leader has on MRSA, and I think that—

**Nick Bourne:** I do not tell lies; I ask you to withdraw that.

**The First Minister:** Your party does, and, therefore, yes, I do withdraw that—  
[*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. You will not be heard, as I have switched off your microphones. We do not behave in that way in the National Assembly for Wales, and we will not, regardless of what is happening elsewhere.

**The First Minister:** My concern is about the claims made in the advertisement on MRSA, which has appeared in different places in Wales and which I think that you would have to agree, Nick, comprises nothing but lies. It should have been withdrawn, and I understand that your leader has apologised for the fact that it did include lies.

bwys rhwng yr hyn a gynigiwn ni yn 2009 a'r hyn a gynigir yn Lloegr yn 2008, gan ein bod yn casglu ystadegau'r rhestrau aros i gleifon allanol drwy ddull gwahanol ac yn eu chwyddo hyd at 40 neu 50 y cant gan ein bod yn cynnwys atgyfeiriadau rhwng ymgynghorwyr a'i gilydd, a Lloegr heb fod yn gwneud hynny. Ni chredaf y bydd gwahaniaeth o bwys rhwng mynediad at ymgynghoriad neu driniaeth yn y GIG yn Lloegr ac yng Nghymru yn 2008 ac yn 2009. Er hynny, yr ydych yn mynnu dweud celwyddau o hyd am y gwasanaeth iechyd, fel y mae eich arweinydd wedi gwneud am MRSA, a chredaf fod—

**Nick Bourne:** Ni fyddaf yn dweud celwyddau; gofynnaf ichi dynnu hynny'n ôl.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae eich plaid yn gwneud hynny, ac, felly, gwnaf, tynnaf hynny'n ôl—  
[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni'ch clywir, gan fy mod wedi diffodd eich meicroffonau. Nid ydym yn ymddwyn felly yng Nghynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, ac ni wnawn ymddwyn felly, beth bynnag fo'n digwydd mewn manau eraill.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr hyn sydd yn peri pryder i mi yw'r honiadau a wnaethpwyd yn yr hysbyseb am MRSA, a ymddangosodd mewn gwahanol fannau yng Nghymru ac y credaf y byddai'n rhaid ichi gytuno, Nick, nad yw'n cynnwys dim ond celwyddau. Dylai fod wedi'i thynnu'n ôl, a deallaf fod eich arweinydd wedi ymddiheuro am y ffaith ei bod yn cynnwys celwyddau.

### Targedau Amgylcheddol Environmental Targets

**Q5 Janet Davies:** Will the First Minister make a statement on environmental targets?  
OAQ0383(FM)

**The First Minister:** We are already delivering against a wide range of environmental objectives and targets. The environment strategy for Wales, which will be published for consultation in the summer, will scope future challenges and propose a range of outcomes to be developed into actions and targets through the consultation.

**C5 Janet Davies:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar dargedau amgylcheddol?  
OAQ0383(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym eisoes yn llwyddo i gyrraedd amrywiaeth mawr o amcanion a thargedau amgylcheddol. Bydd y strategaeth amgylchedd i Gymru, a gyhoeddir ar gyfer ymgynghori yn yr haf, yn cwmpasu heriau a geir yn y dyfodol ac yn cynnig amryw o ganlyniadau i'w datblygu'n gamau gweithredu ac yn dargedau drwy'r

ymgyngoriad.

**Janet Davies:** You will be aware that the latest published figures on Welsh greenhouse gas and carbon dioxide emissions are for 2002. However, last month, the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs published the final emission figures for 2003 and provisional figures for 2004, which show that UK carbon dioxide emissions for 2004 were only 4 per cent below the 1990 baseline level, although the UK Government's target is to ensure a 20 per cent reduction within five years. In order to tackle these emissions in Wales, will you publish these figures in the summer, as you mentioned in your answer to my previous question, or will we not see these figures at all?

**Janet Davies:** Gwyddoch mai ffigurau ar gyfer 2002 yw'r rhai diwethaf a gyhoeddwyd ar ollyngiadau nwyon tŷ gwydr a charbon deuocsid yng Nghymru. Er hynny, y mis diwethaf, cyhoeddodd Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig y ffigurau terfynol ar ollyngiadau ar gyfer 2003 a'r ffigurau dros dro ar gyfer 2004, a ddengys nad oedd y gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid yn y DU yn 2004 ond 4 y cant yn is na lefel y llinell sylfaen yn 1990, er mai targed Llywodraeth y DU yw sicrhau 20 y cant o ostyngiad cyn pen pum mlynedd. Er mwyn mynd i'r afael â'r gollyngiadau hyn yng Nghymru, a wnewch chi gyhoeddi'r ffigurau hyn yn yr haf, fel y crybwyllasoch yn eich ateb i'm cwestiwn blaenorol, ynteu ni welwn y ffigurau hyn o gwbl?

3.00 p.m.

**The First Minister:** I do not have any information on carbon dioxide emission figures for Wales. You cannot cut up carbon dioxide emissions; that is like trying to cut up a bowl of soup. It is the UK that has to cover the carbon dioxide emission targets. We clearly play our part when it comes to the energy side of it, although that, again, is led by the UK Government. There are considerable challenges in meeting the carbon dioxide target because if you have a relatively successful period for heavy industry, you tend to get an increase in industrial production. There has been a considerable increase in steel production in the period since the dire point around 2002 and that may increase carbon dioxide emissions for the best, rather than the worst, of reasons. However, in the end, you must handle that as part of the UK cake. I do not know of any Welsh figures. You may know of some, but I am not sure that they would be particularly relevant because it is a global issue in which the UK must play its part.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid oes gennyf ddim gwybodaeth am ffigurau gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid yng Nghymru. Ni ellir torri gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid yn ddarnau; mae hynny fel ceisio torri powlaid o gawl yn ddarnau. Y DU sydd yn gorfod cyrraedd y targedau ar gyfer gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid. Yn amlwg, yr ydym yn chwarae ein rhan o safbwynt yr ochr ynni, er mai Llywodraeth y DU eto sydd yn arwain yn hynny o beth. Mae sawl her sylweddol ynghlwm wrth gyrraedd y targed o ran carbon deuocsid oherwydd os ceir cyfnod cymharol lwyddiannus i ddiwydiant trwm, tueddir i gael cynnydd yn yr hyn a gynhyrchir gan ddiwydiant. Bu cynnydd sylweddol yn y dur a gynhyrchwyd yn y cyfnod oddi ar yr adeg enbyd tua 2002 a gallai hynny gynyddu gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid am y rhesymau gorau, yn hytrach na'r gwaethaf. Fodd bynnag, yn y diwedd, rhaid trin hynny fel rhan o deisen y DU. Ni wn am ffigurau ar gyfer Cymru. Efallai y gwyddoch chi am rai, ond nid wyf yn siŵr a fyddent yn arbennig o berthnasol gan mai mater byd-eang yw hwn y mae'n rhaid i'r DU chwarae ei rhan ynddo.

**Peter Black:** One of the issues on environmental targets relates to recycling, particularly in terms of plastics. Currently, when plastic is collected by local authorities for recycling, it is often sent to China for

**Peter Black:** Mae a wnelo un o'r materion o ran targedau amgylcheddol ag ailgylchu, yn enwedig yn nhermau plastigau. Ar hyn o bryd, pan gesglir plastig gan awdurdodau lleol i'w ailgylchu, yn aml fe'i hanfonir i

processing, but there is a need for some sort of regional facilities to recycle plastics, if we are to meet our targets. Those facilities would also, of course, create jobs. What action is your Government taking to deal with this demand?

**The First Minister:** I do not have any information here on plastics recycling, but recycling in general has been enormously benefited by the close co-operation between us, the local authorities and the voluntary bodies in Wales, in increasing our percentage of household or municipal refuse that goes into recycling. It has gone from about 12 to 17 per cent over the past five years. I understand that we have overtaken England; we needed to do that. We must reach 40 per cent before long—I believe that the target date is 2010. We still have a long way to go on that. I do not have figures on plastics today, but I will ask Carwyn to write to you on that matter.

**William Graham:** You will know that Newport has a splendid facility for recycling scrap metal, particularly for the disposal of redundant vehicles. That facility has been helped by your Government. Would you consider making more funds available for other similar plants in Wales?

**The First Minister:** With regard to refrigerators and scrap metal, what you must have is an energetic company that is willing to invest in the latest technology. Sims Metals is an Australian company that took over the old Bird's operation, which had received some big investments, but nothing on the scale that Sims Metals has received. It means that you can process many more cars and refrigerators to the latest modern standards. Normally you would do that in a place where there are docks so that you can export to China, if demand is low in the UK, or you can feed it to the local steel works. There are two scrap-based steel works within 10 miles of Newport, and there are scrap requirements, a little further away, in Port Talbot. We would certainly like to see others going down that route, but I am not sure how much demand there is elsewhere in Wales or

Tsieina i'w brosesu, ond mae angen rhyw fath o gyfleusterau rhanbarthol i ailgylchu plastigau, os ydym am gyrraedd ein targedau. Byddai'r cyfleusterau hynny'n creu swyddi hefyd, wrth gwrs. Beth y mae eich Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i ddelio â'r galw hwn?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid oes gennyf ddim gwybodaeth yma am ailgylchu plastigau, ond mae ailgylchu yn gyffredinol wedi elwa yn aruthrol ar y cydweithredu agos rhyngom ni, yr awdurdodau lleol a'r cyrff gwirfoddol yng Nghymru, o ran cynyddu ein canran o sbwriel cartrefi neu drefol sy'n mynd i gael ei ailgylchu. Mae wedi codi o ryw 12 i 17 y cant yn ystod y pum mlynedd diwethaf. Deallaf ein bod wedi goddiweddyd Lloegr; yr oedd angen inni wneud hynny. Rhaid inni gyrraedd 40 y cant cyn bo hir—credaf mai 2010 yw'r dyddiad targed. Mae gennym ffordd bell i fynd o hyd ar hynny. Nid oes gennyf ffigurau ar blastigau heddiw, ond gofynnaf i Carwyn ysgrifennu atoch ar y mater hwnnw.

**William Graham:** Gwyddoch fod gan Gasnewydd gyfleuster ardderchog ar gyfer ailgylchu metel sgrap, yn enwedig ar gyfer gwaredu cerbydau diangen. Rhoddwyd cynhorthwy i'r cyfleuster hwnnw gan eich Llywodraeth. A fydddech yn ystyried darparu rhagor o gyllid i weithfeydd tebyg yng Nghymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** O ran oergelloedd a metel sgrap, yr hyn y mae'n rhaid ei gael yw cwmni egniol sydd yn fodlon buddsoddi yn y dechnoleg ddiweddaraf. Cwmni o Awstralia yw Sims Metals a gymerodd reolaeth dros hen waith Bird's, a gawsai fuddsoddiadau mawr ei hun, ond dim byd ar y raddfa a gafodd Sims Metals. Mae'n golygu y gellir prosesu llawer mwy o geir ac oergelloedd yn unol â'r safonau modern diweddaraf. Fel rheol fe wneid hynny mewn man lle y ceir dociau er mwyn gallu allforio i Tsieina, os yw'r galw'n isel yn y DU, neu gellir ei fwydo i'r gwaith dur lleol. Mae dau waith dur sydd yn defnyddio sgrap o fewn 10 milltir i Gasnewydd, ac mae gofynion o ran sgrap ychydig ymhellach i ffwrdd ym Mhort Talbot. Yn sicr, hoffem weld eraill yn dilyn y llwybr hwnnw, ond nid wyf yn siŵr faint o alw sydd mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru na

where you could concentrate enough cars and fridges to justify a similar investment. You could probably justify only one in the Swansea or Port Talbot area, I would imagine.

ble y gellid crynhoi digon o geir ac oergelloedd i gyfiawnhau buddsoddiad tebyg. Mae'n debyg mai dim ond un y gellid ei gyfiawnhau yn ardal Abertawe neu Bort Talbot, fe dybiwn i.

### **Gwasanaethau Rheilffyrdd yn Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy Rail Services in Alyn and Deeside**

**Q6 Carl Sargeant:** Will the First Minister make a statement on rail services in Alyn and Deeside? OAQ0391(FM)

**C6 Carl Sargeant:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar wasanaethau rheilffyrdd yn Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy? OAQ0391(FM)

**The First Minister:** The north Wales mainline and the Wrexham—Bidston line run through Alyn and Deeside. Passenger services are run under franchise agreements between the Strategic Rail Authority and the train operating companies. The railway infrastructure is the responsibility of Network Rail. The Minister for Economic Development and Transport, Andrew Davies, is funding station improvements across north Wales.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae prif lein gogledd Cymru a lein Wrecsam—Bidston yn rhedeg drwy Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy. Rhedir gwasanaethau teithwyr dan gytundebau masnachfrait rhwng yr Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol a'r cwmnïau trenau. Cyfrifoldeb Network Rail yw'r seilwaith rheilffyrdd. Mae'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth, Andrew Davies, yn ariannu gwelliannau i orsafoedd ledled y Gogledd.

**Carl Sargeant:** As the only directly elected constituency Member for Alyn and Deeside, working in partnership with Flintshire County Borough Council and my colleague, Councillor Aaron Shotton, and Network Rail, do you agree with me that we should celebrate the proposals for the Shotton station in my constituency? Do you also agree that an ongoing study could bring the Wrexham—Bidston line through electrification, giving new opportunities for the Deeside industrial park and the proposed gateway project?

**Carl Sargeant:** Fel yr unig Aelod a etholwyd yn uniongyrchol i gynrychioli etholaeth Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy, sydd yn cydweithio â Chyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Sir y Fflint a'm cyd-aelod, y Cynghorydd Aaron Shotton, a Network Rail, a gytunwch â mi y dylem glodfori'r cynigion ar gyfer gorsaf Shotton yn fy etholaeth? A gytunwch hefyd y gallai astudiaeth sy'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd beri i lein Wrecsam—Bidston gael ei thrydaneiddio, gan roi cyfleoedd newydd i barc diwydiannol Glannau Dyfrdwy a'r prosiect porth arfaethedig?

**The First Minister:** Having been on the Deeside industrial park at the end of last week, I appreciate its sheer scale as Britain's most successful business park. Public transport needs to be provided. I was told that the shuttle bus service is going well and railway improvements, bringing in new stations there and at Broughton, are possibilities. It will be interesting to see how the exercise currently being carried out bears fruit. There are now probably 8,000, if not more, people working in Broughton and Deeside. Both are successful places of employment, and it would be good if we could reduce the flow of cars and increase the number of people travelling there by public

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Wedi bod ym mharc diwydiannol Glannau Dyfrdwy ddiwedd yr wythnos diwethaf, gwerthfawrogaf faint y lle fel parc busnes mwyaf llwyddiannus Prydain. Mae angen darparu trafndiaeth gyhoeddus. Dywedwyd wrthyf fod y gwasanaeth bws gwennol yn mynd yn dda a bod gwelliannau ar y rheilffordd, gan gyflwyno gorsafedd newydd yn y fan honno ac ym Mrychdyn, yn bosibiliadau. Diddorol fydd gweld sut y bydd yr ymarferiad sy'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd yn dwyn ffrwyth. Mae'n debyg bod 8,000 o bobl, os nad mwy, yn gweithio ym Mrychdyn a Glannau Dyfrdwy erbyn hyn. Mae'r ddau'n fannau cyflogaeth llwyddiannus, a byddai'n dda pe gallem leihau llif y ceir a chynyddu

transport.

**Mark Isherwood:** As we have heard, although a study looking into the electrification of the Wrexham—Bidston rail was proposed by the north Wales Taith consortium, the £20,000 funding has been provided, not in Wales, but by Merseytravel, which has also agreed to provide £56,000 annually for improved evening and Sunday services on the line. It has also called for a new railway station at Deeside industrial park, to serve the 10,000 employees who reside on both sides of the border, who are there as a result of record inward investment in the 1980s and early 1990s. Merseytravel has agreed to provide this funding despite part of the line being outside its area, in north Wales. What input will Wales have to a project which was initiated in Wales, but which is being delivered by a Merseyside company?

**The First Minister:** The Taith public transport strategy is a package scheme which involves the consortium in north Wales, and which is incorporated in the regional public transport strategy. It includes major infrastructure works, costing, as I understand it, over £12 million. This will involve bus and rail interchanges linking into the Deeside shuttle-bus service, in an attempt to ensure co-ordinated bus, rail and private transport services for the huge concentrations of employment in Broughton and on Deeside industrial park. I was complimented on the shuttle-bus service last week when I was on Deeside celebrating the tenth anniversary of developments at Almedica Europe Ltd.

nifer y bobl a fydd yn teithio yno ar drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus.

**Mark Isherwood:** Fel y clywsom, er i astudiaeth i ymchwilio i drydaneiddio rheilffordd Wrecsam—Bidston gael ei chynnig gan gonsortiw Taith gogledd Cymru, rhoddwyd yr £20,000 o gyllid, nid yng Nghymru, ond gan Merseytravel, sydd hefyd wedi cytuno i roi £56,000 bob blwyddyn ar gyfer gwell gwasanaethau gyda'r nos ac ar y Sul ar y lein. Galwodd hefyd am orsaf drenau newydd ym mharc diwydiannol Glannau Dyfrdwy, i wasanaethu'r 10,000 o weithwyr sydd yn byw ar y naill ochr a'r llall i'r ffin, sydd yno o ganlyniad i'r mewnfuddsoddiad uchaf erioed yn y 1980au a dechrau'r 1990au. Mae Merseytravel wedi cytuno i roi'r arian hwn er bod rhan o'r lein y tu allan i'w ardal, yng ngogledd Cymru. Pa gyfraniad fydd gan Gymru at brosiect a gychwynwyd yng Nghymru, ond a gyflawnir gan gwmni o lannau Mersi?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae strategaeth trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus Taith yn gynllun pecyn sydd yn cynnwys y consortiw yn y Gogledd, ac sydd wedi'i ymgorffori yn y strategaeth trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus ranbarthol. Mae'n cynnwys gwaith mawr ar y seilwaith, sydd yn costio, yn ôl a ddeallaf, dros £12 miliwn. Bydd hyn yn golygu cyfnewidfeydd bws a thrên yn cysylltu â gwasanaeth bysus gwennol Glannau Dyfrdwy, mewn ymgais i sicrhau gwasanaethau bws, trên a chludiant preifat cydlynol i'r crynodiadau mawr o gyflogaeth ym Mrychdyn ac ar barc diwydiannol Glannau Dyfrdwy. Cefais fy nghanmol am y gwasanaeth bws gwennol yr wythnos diwethaf pan oeddwn ar Lannau Dyfrdwy'n dathlu degfed flwyddyn y datblygiadau yn Almedica Europe Cyf.

#### **Gwasanaethau Ambiwylans yng Nghanolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru Ambulance Cover in Mid and West Wales**

**Q7 Lisa Francis:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the future of ambulance cover in mid and west Wales? OAQ0389(FM)

**The First Minister:** Ambulance cover is now far more effective because, in mid and west Wales, all 250 paramedics have now

**C7 Lisa Francis:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar ddyfodol gwasanaethau ambiwlans yng nghanolbarth a gorllewin Cymru? OAQ0389(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae gwasanaethau ambiwlans yn llawer mwy effeithiol erbyn hyn oherwydd, yn y Canolbarth a'r



had the training required to deliver thrombolysis to reduce call-to-needle time, thereby saving many lives.

**Lisa Francis:** I, and other colleagues in the Chamber, were stunned last week, when you inferred that it was difficult to justify 24-hour ambulance cover in sparsely populated areas, as there were not enough calls to justify paying staff. As a result of what you said, someone e-mailed me from Tywyn, to tell me about a case where it took 90 minutes to transport a seriously ill baby to Ysbyty Bronglais, because the nearest available ambulance crew was at Penrhyndeudraeth. That baby's life was saved, with minutes to spare, but people in that situation do not understand arguments about sparsity or rurality. I am charging you, First Minister, to use your influence to ensure that money is made available for this essential service. It is not a luxury, it is not an add-on; it is what most people expect as their basic human right, wherever they live.

**The First Minister:** It is just a matter of the number of calls. You do not want staff sitting around at night, which was the point that I made last week, with days and days going by without receiving a single night call. That is the problem in sparsely populated areas. That is why developing the thrombolytic skills of paramedics is a better investment, and why mid and west Wales was serviced first with that training. You seem to have a problem with mentioning the word 'congratulations' in the context of the national health service, as does your party leader in Wales—I have to drag it out of you. Surely, you can congratulate all 250 paramedics in mid and west Wales, who have been through thrombolytic training ahead of paramedics anywhere else in Wales. Think of how that saves lives. There have been 38 cases where the thrombolytic service has been used, with paramedics able to give the shock when they get to the door, so people do not have to wait until they get to the hospital. You may say, 'yes, but what about this baby in Penrhyndeudraeth': I do not know of that

Gorllewin, mae'r 250 o barafeddygon i gyd bellach wedi cael yr hyfforddiant gofynnol i roi thrombolysis i leihau'r amser o'r alwad i'r nodwydd, gan achub llawer o fywydau.

**Lisa Francis:** Fe'm syfrdanwyd i, a chyd-Aelodau eraill yn y Siambr, yr wythnos diwethaf pan awgrymasoch ei bod yn anodd cyfiawnhau gwasanaethau ambiwlans 24 awr mewn ardaloedd tenau eu poblogaeth, gan nad oedd digon o alwadau i gyfiawnhau talu i'r staff. Yn sgîl yr hyn a ddywedasoch, cefais e-bost oddi wrth rywun yn Nhywyn, i ddweud wrthyf am achos lle y cymerodd 90 munud i gludo baban difrifol wael i Ysbyty Bronglais, am fod y criw ambiwlans agosaf a oedd ar gael ym Mhenrhyndeudraeth. Achubwyd bywyd y baban hwnnw, ac ychydig funudau wrth gefn, ond nid yw pobl yn y sefyllfa honno'n deall dadleuon am deneurwydd poblogaeth na gwledigrwydd. Yr wyf yn eich siarsio, Brif Weinidog, i ddefnyddio'ch dylanwad i sicrhau y darperir arian ar gyfer y gwasanaeth hanfodol hwn. Nid moethusrwydd mohono, nid rhywbeth ychwanegol ydyw; mae'n rhywbeth y mae'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yn disgwyl ei gael fel eu hawl ddynol sylfaenol, lle bynnag y bônt yn byw.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mater o nifer y galwadau ydyw. Nid oes arnoch eisiau i'r staff fod yn eistedd o gwmpas yn y nos, sef y pwynt a wneuthum yr wythnos diwethaf, a dyddiau lawer yn mynd heibio heb iddynt dderbyn yr un alwad. Dyna'r broblem mewn ardaloedd tenau eu poblogaeth. Dyna pam y mae datblygu sgiliau thrombolytig parafeddygon yn well buddsoddiad, a pham y rhoddwyd yr hyfforddiant hwnnw i'r Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin yn gyntaf. Mae'n ymddangos bod yngan y gair 'llongyfarchiadau' yng nghydestun y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yn peri anhawster i chi, yn ogystal ag i arweinydd eich plaid yng Nghymru—mae'n rhaid imi ei lusgo allan ohonoch chi. Siawns na allwch longyfarch pob un o'r 250 o barafeddygon yn y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin, a aeth drwy'r hyfforddiant thrombolytig o flaen parafeddygon yn unman arall yng Nghymru. Meddyliwch sut y mae hynny'n achub bywydau. Cafwyd 38 o achosion lle y defnyddiwyd y gwasanaeth thrombolytig, gyda pharafeddygon yn gallu rhoi'r sioc pan gyrrhaeddant y drws, fel nad oes raid i bobl

individual case, but this is about the number of calls that you need, on average, to justify night cover, when you also have to consider other investments. The other investment in this case is thrombolytic training for paramedics. Mid and west Wales went first on that; we do not have it yet in south east Wales, and north Wales is going through it now. That is a better investment in terms of life saving.

**Elin Jones:** Cyn gofyn fy nghwestiwn, llongyfarchaf bawb sy'n gweithio yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yng Ngheredigion ac yng Nghymru gyfan. Yn fy etholaeth i, mae diffyg o ran nifer y ceir ambiwlans sydd yn cael eu rhedeg gan yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans, i gario unigolion o Geredigion i ysbytai fel Ysbyty Treforys ac Ysbyty Singleton am apwyntiad neu driniaeth fel claf allanol. Mae hynny'n golygu bod unigolion sydd yn mynychu apwyntiad yn Nhreforys, er enghraifft, yn gorfod aros drwy'r dydd wrth i unigolion eraill fynychu apwyntiadau. Mae'r system hon yn greulon i unigolion sydd yn sâl neu'n hen. A wnewch ymrwymo i adolygu'r gyfundrefn ceir ambiwlans sydd yn gwasanaethu ardaloedd gwledig a buddsoddi mewn cyfundrefn sy'n llawer mwy effeithiol?

3.10 p.m.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni wn y manylion ynglŷn ag unrhyw brinder ambiwlansys yn y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin. Fodd bynnag, fe ymchwiliad i'r sefyllfa, gyda Brian Gibbons, a gofynnaf i Brian roi ateb ichi. Fodd bynnag, pe bai argyfwng, byddai hofrennydd y gwasanaeth ambiwlans awyr yn mynd â chlaf o rywle yng Ngheredigion i, dywedwch, Ysbyty Treforys.

**Kirsty Williams:** You seem to excuse your Government's lack of action in ensuring that all ambulance stations in mid Wales, such as that in Knighton in my constituency, are put onto a full 24-hour cover rota by saying that it is fine because the paramedics have had thrombolytic training. Are you aware that the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust

aros nes cyrraedd yr ysbyty. Efallai eich bod yn dweud, 'ie, ond beth am y baban hwn ym Mhenrhyndeudraeth': ni wn am yr achos unigol hwnnw, ond mae a wnelo hyn â nifer y galwadau y mae eu hangen, ar gyfartaledd, i gyfiawnhau gwasanaeth nos, pan fo'n rhaid ystyried buddsoddiadau eraill hefyd. Hyfforddiant thrombolytig i barafeddygon yw'r buddsoddiad arall yn yr achos hwn. Mae'r Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin wedi cael hynny yn gyntaf; nid ydym wedi ei gael eto yn y De-ddwyrain, ac mae'r Gogledd yn mynd drwyddo ar hyn o bryd. Mae hynny'n well buddsoddiad o ran achub bywydau.

**Elin Jones:** I preface my question by congratulating everyone who works in the ambulance service in Ceredigion and throughout the whole of Wales. In my constituency, there is a lack of ambulance cars, run by the ambulance trust, that take individuals from Ceredigion to hospitals such as Morriston Hospital and Singleton Hospital for appointments or out-patient treatment. That means that individuals attending an appointment in Morriston, for example, have to hang around all day while they wait for other individuals to attend appointments. This system is cruel to those who are ill or elderly. Will you give a commitment to review the ambulance car system that serves rural areas and invest in a system that is much more effective?

**The First Minister:** I do not know the details of any shortage of ambulances in mid and west Wales. However, I will look into the situation, with Brian Gibbons, and I will ask Brian to reply to you. However, in an emergency, the the air ambulance service helicopter would take a patient from anywhere in Ceredigion to, say, Morriston Hospital.

**Kirsty Williams:** Yr ydych fel pe baech yn esgusodi diffyg gweithredu eich llywodraeth i sicrhau y caiff pob gorsaf ambiwlans yn y Canolbarth, fel honno yn Nhrefyclo yn fy etholaeth i, ei gosod ar rota gwasanaeth 24 awr drwy ddweud bod popeth yn iawn gan fod y parafeddygon wedi cael hyfforddiant thrombolytig. A ydych yn ymwybodol na all

cannot guarantee a paramedic on each vehicle in mid and west Wales? If you do not care about the patients in mid Wales, do you care about the ambulance staff who are paid the princely sum of £9 for an on-call shift from midnight until 8 a.m.? Would you be on call for £9?

**The First Minister:** Perhaps we can put that to one side because first ministers are on call, I can tell you, but not in the same way of course. I do not like the way that you say,

‘If you do not care about the patients’.

Of course I care about patients. The point that I was making was that, if you were the mid and west Wales ambulance service and had to make a choice, what would your top priority be this year? Would it be to have 24-hour cover in Knighton or would it be to introduce universal, 100 per cent paramedic thrombolytic upgrade training in mid and west Wales? You might well conclude that that would save more lives. That is why the mid and west Wales service has gone first in that. The north Wales service is going second—it is right in the middle of it now—and the south-east Wales service will go third and last because there is easier access to hospitals here. To describe that as not caring about patients seems to me to be using highly coloured language that is not called for in these circumstances. Of course I care about patients: that is why I can see the logic in what the ambulance service in mid and west Wales has done in choosing to give thrombolytic training over bringing in night cover in areas of sparse population.

Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwylans Cymru warantu bod parafeddyg ar bob cerbyd yn y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin? Os nad ydych yn malio am y cleifion yn y Canolbarth, a ydych yn malio am y gweithwyr ambiwlans a gaiff y swm tywysogaidd o £9 am fod ar alwad o hanner nos tan 8 y bore? A fyddech chi'n fodlon bod ar alwad am £9?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Hwyrach y gallwn roi hynny o'r neilltu oherwydd y mae prif weinidogion ar alwad, gallaf ddweud wrthyech, ond nid yn yr un modd wrth reswm. Nid wyf yn hoffi'r ffordd y dywedwch,

‘Os nad ydych yn malio am y cleifion’.

Wrth gwrs fy mod yn malio am y cleifion. Y pwynt yr oeddwn yn ei wneud oedd, pe baech chi'n wasanaeth ambiwlans y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin ac yn gorfod dewis, beth fyddai eich blaenoriaeth uchaf eleni? Ai cael gwasanaeth 24 awr yn Nhrefyclo, ynteu cyflwyno hyfforddiant uwchraddio thrombolytig cyffredinol, 100 y cant, i bob parafeddyg yn y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin? Gallech yn wir ddod i'r casgliad y byddai hynny'n achub mwy o fywydau. Dyna pam y mae gwasanaeth y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin wedi cael hynny yn gyntaf. Mae gwasanaeth y Gogledd yn ei gael yn ail—mae yn ei chanol hi ar hyn o bryd—a bydd gwasanaeth y De-ddwyrain yn ei gael yn drydydd ac yn olaf gan ei bod yn haws cyrraedd ysbytai yn y fan honno. Mae disgrifio hynny drwy ddweud nad wyf yn malio am y cleifion, i'm tyb i, yn ddefnydd lliwgar iawn o iaith, sydd yn ddi-alw-amdano yn yr amgylchiadau hyn. Wrth gwrs fy mod yn malio am y cleifion: dyna pam y gallaf weld y rhesymeg yn yr hyn y mae'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin wedi'i wneud wrth ddewis rhoi hyfforddiant thrombolytig yn hytrach na chyflwyno gwasanaeth nos mewn ardaloedd tenau eu poblogaeth.

### Cymorth i Fusnesau yng Nghymru Support for Welsh Businesses

**Q8 Janet Ryder:** Will the First Minister make a statement on support for Welsh businesses? OAQ0379(FM)

**C8 Janet Ryder:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar gymorth i fusnesau yng Nghymru? OAQ0379(FM)

**The First Minister:** The present success of

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae llwyddiant presennol

the Welsh economy is, by and large, down to the activity of the private sector in Wales, supported by a strong suite of services, regional selective assistance, Assembly investment grant, section 4 grants for tourism, SMART Cymru grants for products and processes and the Finance Wales availability of investment capital.

**Janet Ryder:** It is a common perception among businesses that there is a lot of financial support available for companies seeking to relocate from outside Wales into Wales to help them to locate buildings, and, in some cases, to build special buildings, but that there is little support for companies that have grown up within Wales which need to relocate to expand their business. One such company is Gaia Technologies plc, in Bangor, which exists in cramped circumstances on Bangor High Street. Our Minister for Economic Development and Transport has visited it and praised it, it has brought multi-million-pound contracts into Wales and yet it is finding it hard to get support from the Welsh Development Agency or from your regional assistance programme to help it to relocate into more suitable premises. What kind of financial support can you offer such local companies?

**The First Minister:** I do not know the individual circumstances of Gaia Technologies plc, but the general principle on this is well known. I have heard you allege that local companies receive different treatment to that received by companies moving into Wales. That is balderdash. There is no such different treatment; there is absolute parity of treatment between the expansion plans of local home-grown companies and those coming in from outside. There is a difference in treatment depending on where you are, in that, for instance, section 4 assistance is available everywhere, some Objective 1 programmes are available everywhere, Assembly investment grants are available everywhere, but, by and large, you get better treatment and higher grants if you are in the Objective 1 area. However, there is no distinction in treatment between home-grown companies and those moving in from outside.

economi Cymru, i raddau helaeth, yn deillio o weithgaredd y sector preifat yng Nghymru, gyda chefnogaeth set gref o wasanaethau, cymorth dewisol rhanbarthol, grant buddsoddi'r Cynulliad, grantiau adran 4 ar gyfer twristiaeth, grantiau SMART Cymru ar gyfer cynhyrchion a phrosesau a darpariaeth cyfalaf buddsoddi Cyllid Cymru.

**Janet Ryder:** Mae'n ganfyddiad cyffredin ymysg busnesau fod llawer o gymorth ariannol ar gael i gwmnïau o'r tu allan i Gymru sy'n ceisio adleoli yng Nghymru i'w helpu i ganfod adeiladau ac, mewn ambell achos, i godi adeiladau arbennig, ond nad oes llawer o gymorth i gwmnïau sydd wedi tyfu o fewn Cymru ac sydd angen adleoli er mwyn ehangu eu busnes. Un cwmni o'r fath yw Technolegau Gaia ccc, ym Mangor, sydd yn bodoli mewn amgylchiadau cyfyng yn Stryd Fawr Bangor. Mae ein Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth wedi ymweld â'r cwmni a'i ganmol, daeth â chytundebau gwerth miliynau o bunnau i mewn i Gymru ac eto mae'n ei chael hi'n anodd cael cymorth gan Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru na chan eich rhaglen cymorth rhanbarthol i'w helpu i symud i adeilad mwy addas. Pa fath o gymorth ariannol y gallwch ei gynnig i gwmnïau lleol o'r fath?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni wn am amgylchiadau unigol Technolegau Gaia ccc, ond mae'r egwyddor gyffredinol ynghylch hyn yn hysbys iawn. Fe'ch clywais yn honni bod cwmnïau lleol yn cael eu trin yn wahanol i gwmnïau sydd yn symud i Gymru. Lol botes maip yw hynny. Nid oes triniaeth wahanol o'r fath; mae triniaeth hollol gyfartal rhwng cynlluniau ehangu cwmnïau cartref lleol a rhai a ddaw i mewn o'r tu allan. Mae'r driniaeth yn wahanol, ac yn dibynnu ar eich lleoliad, yn yr ystyr, er enghraifft, fod cymorth adran 4 ar gael ym mhobman, fod rhai rhaglenni Amcan 1 ar gael ym mhobman, a bod grantiau buddsoddi'r Cynulliad ar gael ym mhobman, ond, yn gyffredinol, yr ydych yn cael gwell triniaeth a grantiau uwch os ydych yn ardal Amcan 1. Fodd bynnag, nid yw cwmnïau cartref yn cael eu trin yn wahanol i rai sy'n symud i mewn o'r tu allan.

## **Ymrwymadau Maniffesto'r Llywodraeth The Government's Manifesto Commitments**

**C9 Ieuan Wyn Jones:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar gost ymrwymadau maniffesto'r Llywodraeth? OAQ0408(FM)

**Q9 Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the cost of the Government's manifesto commitments? OAQ0408(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym wedi cyllido yn ofalus. Felly, nid oes arwydd na fyddwn yn gallu cyflawni ein hymrwymadau maniffesto erbyn diwedd y Cynulliad hwn.

**The First Minister:** We have gone through the budgetary process carefully. Therefore, there is no sign that we will not be able to deliver our manifesto commitments by the end of this Assembly.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Mae un o'ch ymrwymadau maniffesto yn dweud na fyddwch yn cyflwyno ffioedd ychwanegol i fyfyrwyr cyn 2007. Bydd rhai myfyrwyr yn dechrau ar eu cyrsiau yn 2006 ac yn eu cwblhau ar ôl 2007. A allwch chi ein sicrhau na fydd y myfyrwyr hynny, beth bynnag arall a fydd yn digwydd, yn wynebu ffioedd ychwanegol o dan y Llywodraeth hon?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** One of your manifesto commitments states that you will not introduce top-up fees for students before 2007. Some students will be starting their courses in 2006 and completing them after 2007. Can you assure us that those students, whatever else happens, will not face top-up fees under this Government?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf am ddweud dim ar y pwnc hwn gan y bydd adroddiad comisiwn Rees ger ein bron o fewn ychydig wythnosau. Bydd gan bob rhan o'r Cynulliad ryddid i drafod ei argymhellion, a bydd rhaid inni benderfynu beth i'w wneud yn dilyn hynny.

**The First Minister:** I do not wish to say anything on this issue as we will have the Rees commission report in a couple of weeks' time. All parts of the Assembly will be free to discuss its recommendations, and it is then that we must decide what to do.

### **Prinder Staff mewn Ysbytai Staff Shortages at Hospitals**

**C10 David Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar brinder staff mewn ysbytai? OAQ0382(FM)

**Q10 David Lloyd:** Will the Minister make a statement on staff shortages at hospitals? OAQ0382(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cyfanswm nifer y staff cyfwerth ag amser llawn sy'n cael eu cyflogi'n uniongyrchol gan GIG Cymru yw 66,003.5. Fodd bynnag, drwy gyfri'r staff i gyd, cawn gyfanswm o 90,708, sy'n godiad o 32.2 y cant ers 30 Medi 1997.

**The First Minister:** The total number of whole-time equivalent staff directly employed by NHS Wales is 66,003.5. However, if we count the total number of staff, the figure stands at 90,708, which is an increase of 32.3 per cent since 30 September 1997.

**David Lloyd:** Yr wyf fi hefyd am longyfarch perfformiad staff yn y gwasanaeth iechyd, ac nid yn unig am fy mod i yn dal yn un ohonynt. Fodd bynnag, mae nifer y nyrsys ar 31 o 74 o wardiau ysbytai Abertawe yn beryglus o fach ar hyn o bryd. Beth wnewch chi ynghylch hynny?

**David Lloyd:** I also congratulate the performance of NHS staff, and not just because I am still one of them. However, the number of nurses in 31 out of 74 wards in hospitals in Swansea is dangerously low at present. What are you going to do about that?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae cyfanswm y nyrsys a gyflogir gan y GIG wedi cynyddu dros draean ers diwedd mis Medi 1997. Gwnaed llawer o fuddsoddiad mewn hyfforddi nyrsys a'u cadw wedi iddynt ddechrau gweithio yn y proffesiwn. Yr ydym yn cadw nyrsys yn y GIG yn llawer gwell yn awr, gyda chyfradd is o 'attrition', fel y'i gelwir, sef nyrsys yn ymadael. Nid wyf yn gwybod am yr amgylchiadau mewn rhai rhannau o'r proffesiwn, os ydych am ddechrau sôn am dri neu bedwar o gategoriâu gwahanol. Yr wyf yn awyddus i chi roi'r manylion i Brian neu i mi, ac fe gewch chi ateb ysgrifenedig.

**The First Minister:** The total number of nurses employed by the NHS has increased by over a third since the end of September 1997. A great deal of investment has been made in training nurses and in retaining them after joining the profession. We now have a better record on retaining nurses in the NHS, with a lower rate of attrition, as it is called, which means nurses leaving. I am not aware of the circumstances in specific parts of the profession, if you are going to talk about three or four different categories. I would be grateful if you could pass on the details to Brian or to me, and you will receive a written answer.

### **Datganiad Busnes Business Statement**

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** There are a few changes to report to this week's business. I informed you last week that the Minister for Health and Social Services would be making a statement on health issues tomorrow. In order to accommodate that statement, Alun Pugh has agreed to bring forward his statement on the historic environment to today, and tomorrow's motions to establish an additional Audit Committee and to elect its membership will be rescheduled for Wednesday, 4 May.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Mae ychydig o newidiadau i fusnes yr wythnos hon i'w hadrodd. Dywedais wrthy ch yr wythnos diwethaf y byddai'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn gwneud datganiad ar faterion iechyd yfory. Er mwyn cael y datganiad hwnnw, mae Alun Pugh wedi cytuno i wneud ei ddatganiad ar yr amgylchedd hanesyddol heddiw yn lle yfory, a bydd cynigion yfory i sefydlu Pwyllgor Archwilio ychwanegol ac ethol aelodau iddo yn cael eu haildrefnu ar gyfer dydd Mercher, 4 Mai.

Business for the next three weeks is as set out on the draft statement, which can be found on the Chamberweb under supporting documents. Further to this morning's deliberations in the Business Committee, it has been determined that the following items of subordinate legislation need not be referred to a subject committee for extended consideration: the Production of Bovine Collagen Intended for Human Consumption in the United Kingdom (Wales) Regulations 2005; the Adoption Agencies (Wales) Regulations 2005; the Business Improvement Districts (Wales) Regulations 2005; the Smoke Flavours (Wales) Regulations 2005; the Feeding Stuffs (Establishments and Intermediaries) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2005; and the TSE (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2005.

Mae'r busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf yn unol â'r datganiad drafft, sydd i'w weld ar we'r Siambr dan y pennawd dogfennau ategol. Yn sgîl y trafodaethau y bore yma yn y Pwyllgor Busnes, penderfynwyd nad oes angen cyfeirio'r is-ddeddfwriaethau a ganlyn at bwyllgor pwnc ar gyfer ystyriaeth estynedig: Rheoliadau Cynhyrchu Collagen Buchol a Fwriadwyd ar gyfer ei Fwyta gan Bobl yn y Deyrnas Unedig (Cymru) 2005; Rheoliadau Asiantaethau Mabwysiadu (Cymru) 2005; Rheoliadau Ardaloedd Gwella Busnes (Cymru) 2005; Rheoliadau Cyflasynnau Mwg (Cymru) 2005; Rheoliadau Porthiant (Sefydliadau a Chyfyngwyr) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2005; a Rheoliadau TSE (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2005.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiadau

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there any

i'r datganiad busnes drafft? Gwelaf nad oes. A oes unrhyw sylwadau?

objections to the business statement? I see that there are none. Are there any comments?

3.20 p.m.

**Janet Ryder:** I am disappointed, Minister, that you have not agreed to our request for a debate on the situation regarding small schools in Wales. We have been asking for this for some time and for the Assembly Government to take the same presumption as has been taken in England against the closure of small schools. We have also been asking for a debate to clear up the fog that still surrounds the funding of schools. Something must be done to clarify that funding situation in terms of what finance streams are being submitted. Large sums of money are announced in the Assembly, having passed through the Government, but it is hard to see how they are then transmitted to schools. That needs to be clarified. Plaid Cymru has asked for the establishment of a cross-party group to consider school funding. Everyone, including headteachers, parents and governors, wants this situation clarified. Your Government has had six years in which to act on this. So far, you have failed to deliver for schools in Wales.

**Janet Ryder:** Yr wyf yn siomedig, Weinidog, nad ydych wedi caniatáu ein cais am ddadl ar y sefyllfa ynglŷn ag ysgolion bychain yng Nghymru. Buom yn gofyn am ddadl ers tro, ac yn gofyn i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad fabwysiadu rhagdybiaeth fel sydd yn Lloegr yn erbyn cau ysgolion bychain. Buom hefyd yn gofyn am ddadl er mwyn clirio'r dryswch sy'n dal i fodoli ynglŷn â threfniadau ariannu ysgolion. Rhaid gwneud rhywbeth er mwyn gwneud y sefyllfa honno'n glir, o ran y ffrydiau ariannu sy'n cael eu cyflwyno. Cyhoeddir symiau mawr o arian yn y Cynulliad, wedi eu pasio gan y Llywodraeth, ond mae'n anodd gweld sut y trosglwyddir y symiau hyn wedyn i ysgolion. Mae angen eglurhad. Mae Plaid Cymru wedi galw am sefydlu grŵp trawsbleidiol i ystyried cyllid ysgolion. Mae ar bawb, yn benaethiaid, rhieni a llywodraethwyr, eisiau gweld y sefyllfa hon yn cael ei hegluro. Cafodd eich Llywodraeth chwe mlynedd i wneud rhywbeth ynglŷn â hyn. Hyd yn hyn, yr ydych wedi methu â chyflawni dros ysgolion yng Nghymru.

**David Melding:** I note that you have conceded that the council tax debacle needs to be discussed at some point, but perhaps in the distant future when you have received the necessary report. However, the large number of people who face much higher council tax charges this year, despite being assured that the exercise would be cost-neutral, have a right to have this issue discussed fairly soon in the Assembly.

**David Melding:** Sylwaf eich bod yn cyfaddef bod angen trafod llanastr y dreth gyngor rywbryd, ond efallai yn y dyfodol pell pan fyddwch wedi cael yr adroddiad angenrheidiol. Fodd bynnag, mae gan y nifer sylweddol o bobl sy'n wynebu treth gyngor lawer uwch eleni, er iddynt gael eu sicrhau y byddai'r ymarferiad yn un niwtral o ran cost, hawl i glywed y mater hwn yn cael ei drafod yn weddol fuan yn y Cynulliad.

**Kirsty Williams:** I echo David Melding's comments. I am sure that 65 per cent of the residents in Merthyr Cynog or Painscastle whose properties will have gone up by more than one band, would welcome an explanation as to how they will pay their bills this year. Can you also comment on whether the Minister for Health and Social Services will be making an oral statement on the dental initiative that he announced this morning? Will he outline how many extra dentists the initiative will provide for the people of Wales and how many extra patients

**Kirsty Williams:** Hoffwn ategu sylwadau David Melding. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai 65 y cant o drigolion Merthyr Cynog neu Gastell-paen, sydd â'u heiddo wedi codi fwy nag un band, yn hoffi clywed sut y maent i fod i dalu eu biliau eleni. A allwch hefyd ddweud a fydd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn gwneud datganiad llafar ar y fenter ddeintyddol a gyhoeddodd y bore yma? A wnaiff amlinellu faint yn rhagor o ddeintyddion a ddarperir gan y fenter ar gyfer pobl Cymru a faint yn rhagor o gleifion a fydd yn gallu cael

will have access to NHS treatment through the money that he has now made available? I suspect that it will not be many.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** Janet, I have addressed the issue that you raised on a number of occasions. We do not have any plans to schedule time for a debate on this because it is essentially a matter for local education authorities. I have already stated that the guidance on planning school places, including the position of small schools, has previously been agreed by the Assembly as a whole and is in the public domain. There is no fog on funding. Authorities are responsible for funding schools, determining their budgets in accordance with the LEA schools' budgets and school budget regulations. The latter allows an authority to include a small-school factor in its local formula, determining individual schools' delegated budgets. Authorities must discuss that issue with their school budget forum and take account of its views.

David and Kirsty raised points about council tax and local government funding. We have already given this issue a good airing in the First Minister's questions. The Finance Minister and I agree that the place to discuss this is in committee. I am also pleased that Sir Michael Lyons is coming to the committee. The Office of the Deputy Prime Minister's review on the balance of funding will lead to a report on this and an opportunity for good discussion and debate in committee and for Members to put their views. The review is likely to be completed at the end of the year, and it will then be appropriate, as I have said, to debate it in the Assembly.

On the other point that Kirsty raised, Brian Gibbons will make a statement tomorrow on health issues. I am sure that all Members, and the people of Wales, will be pleased about the £5 million that he announced today for personal dental services, which will give dentists the flexibility that they need to deliver services. It will also improve access to NHS dentistry in Wales.

triniaeth dan y GIG drwy'r arian y mae wedi ei ryddhau yn awr? Tybiaf na fydd y nifer yn fawr iawn.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Janet, yr wyf wedi rhoi sylw i'r mater a godwyd gennych sawl gwaith. Nid oes gennym gynlluniau i drefnu amser ar gyfer dadl ar hyn oherwydd mater i'r awdurdodau addysg lleol yw hwn yn y bôn. Yr wyf wedi dweud yn barod fod y canllawiau ar gynllunio lleoedd ysgolion, gan gynnwys y sefyllfa gydag ysgolion bychain, wedi eu cytuno eisoes gan y Cynulliad cyfan a bod y mater yn nwylo'r cyhoedd. Nid oes dim dryswch ynghylch ariannu ysgolion. Mae'r awdurdodau'n gyfrifol am ariannu ysgolion, pennu eu cyllidebau yn unol â chyllidebau ysgolion yr AALL a rheoliadau cyllidebau ysgolion. Mae'r rheoliadau'n caniatáu i awdurdod gynnwys ffactor ysgolion bychain yn ei fformiwla leol, er mwyn pennu cyllidebau dirprwyedig ysgolion unigol. Rhaid i'r awdurdodau drafod y mater hwn gyda'u fforwm cyllidebau ysgolion ac ystyried ei sylwadau.

Cododd David a Kirsty bwyntiau yn ymwneud â'r dreth gyngor ac arian llywodraeth leol. Yr ydym wedi gwyntyllu'r mater hwn yn bur dda yn barod yng nghwestiynau'r Prif Weinidog. Mae'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid a minnau'n cytuno mai'r pwyllgor yw'r lle i drafod y mater hwn. Yr wyf hefyd yn falch bod Syr Michael Lyons yn dod i'r pwyllgor. Bydd adolygiad Swyddfa'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ar gydbwysedd cyllid yn arwain at adroddiad ar hyn ynghyd â chyfle i gael trafodaeth a dadl dda yn y pwyllgor ac i'r Aelodau gael mynegi eu barn. Mae'r adolygiad yn debygol o gael ei gwblhau erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn, a bydd yn briodol wedyn, fel y dywedais, inni gael dadl arno yn y Cynulliad.

O ran y pwynt arall a godwyd gan Kirsty, bydd Brian Gibbons yn gwneud datganiad yfory ar faterion iechyd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd pob Aelod, a phawb yng Nghymru, yn falch o glywed am y £5 miliwn a gyhoeddodd heddiw ar gyfer gwasanaethau deintyddol personol, a fydd yn rhoi i ddeintyddion yr hyblygrwydd sydd arnynt ei angen er mwyn darparu gwasanaethau. Bydd hefyd yn ei gwneud yn haws i bobl gael deintydd dan y GIG yng Nghymru.



*Derbyniwyd y datganiad busnes.  
Business statement adopted.*

### **Datganiad ar yr Amgylchedd Hanesyddol Statement on the Historic Environment**

**The Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport (Alun Pugh):** Members will recall that I made a statement on the historic environment review last year. At that time, I outlined the measures to be implemented at a national and local level to ensure the continued protection of the rich heritage that we enjoy in Wales, and how we might ensure the closer involvement of communities. Subsequently, we have set a number of key issues in train.

In order to ensure proper linkages between key organisations, an historic environment group has been set up, chaired by Cadw officials. In its early meetings, one of its first tasks was to look at guidance being prepared by the Assembly for local authorities and their partners in developing community strategies and, particularly, the contribution of the historic environment to the economic, social and environmental wellbeing of their areas. I was glad to have the opportunity last week in Builth Wells to consider this guidance further, in a meeting with Sue Essex and local authority chief officers.

The historic environment group is also considering the potential for an integrated approach by key organisations in raising the profile of the historic environment as an educational tool, initially in schools. Much good work is already being done. For example, Cadw provides free visits for school children and organisations such as the National Trust and the Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Wales are also very active in this area. However, the group has identified the need for a more strategic approach. As a start, it will identify specific needs and priorities with a view to developing web materials and linkages with resources such as the national

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon (Alun Pugh):** Bydd yr Aelodau'n cofio fy mod wedi gwneud datganiad ar yr adolygiad o'r amgylchedd hanesyddol y llynedd. Bryd hynny, amlinellais y camau, yn genedlaethol a lleol, er mwyn sicrhau bod y dreftadaeth fendigedig sydd gennym yng Nghymru yn dal i gael ei gwarchod, ynghyd â dulliau o sicrhau bod cymunedau'n ymwneud mwy â'r gwaith. Wedi hynny, mae nifer o faterion allweddol wedi cael eu rhoi ar y gweill gennym.

Er mwyn sicrhau cyswllt priodol rhwng y prif sefydliadau, sefydlwyd grŵp amgylchedd hanesyddol, dan gadeiryddiaeth swyddogion Cadw. Yn ei gyfarfodydd cyntaf, un o'i dasgau cyntaf oedd edrych ar y canllawiau a oedd yn cael eu paratoi gan y Cynulliad ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol a'u partneriaid er mwyn datblygu strategaethau cymunedol ac, yn fwyaf arbennig, ar gyfraniad yr amgylchedd hanesyddol i les economaidd, cymdeithasol ac amgylcheddol eu hardaloedd. Yr oeddwn yn falch o gael cyfle yr wythnos diwethaf yn Llanfair-ym-Muallt i ystyried y canllawiau hyn ymhellach, mewn cyfarfod gyda Sue Essex a phrif swyddogion yr awdurdodau lleol.

Mae'r grŵp amgylchedd hanesyddol hefyd yn ystyried y posibilrwydd o gael y prif sefydliadau i weithio gyda'i gilydd er mwyn rhoi mwy o sylw i'r amgylchedd hanesyddol fel cyfrwng addysgol, mewn ysgolion i ddechrau. Mae llawer o waith da wedi ei wneud yn barod. Er enghraifft, mae Cadw yn cynnig ymweliadau di-dâl i blant ysgol, ac mae sefydliadau fel yr Ymddiriedolaeth Genedlaethol a Chomisiwn Brenhinol Henebion Cymru hefyd yn gweithio'n galed yn y maes hwn. Fodd bynnag, mae'r grŵp wedi gweld bod angen dull mwy strategol o weithredu. I ddechrau, bydd yn nodi anghenion a blaenoriaethau penodol gyda'r bwriad o ddatblygu deunyddiau ar y we a

grid for learning. This will be taken forward in future meetings of the group. Encouraging schoolchildren to take an active interest in local and national history will help develop an informed appreciation of the importance of the historic monuments, buildings and landscapes that are a part of our lives. This is something that schoolchildren will hopefully take into their adult lives.

Labour's careful management of the economy, in Wales and across the UK, has ensured high levels of employment, in stark contrast to the Tory years of mass unemployment. However, one of the by-products of near full employment is the presence of skills shortages. The group therefore has been tasked so that there is a suitably skilled and equipped workforce to support our agenda. In particular, I want to ensure that we have the specialist craft skills in place.

It is important that ownership, in its widest sense, of the historic environment is not left exclusively to statutory bodies. In my statement last year, I focused on community initiatives. Cadw is developing its civic grants scheme and, together with the Civic Trust for Wales, I am pleased to announce today a new design award. The trust's design awards scheme seeks to reward excellence in design for new build and for historic building conservation. This will now include a new Assembly Government award that will recognise good design in allowing access for disabled people to historic buildings. The Assembly Government has published guidance on access in 'Overcoming the Barriers', and the new award will reflect the priorities of that guidance and will celebrate excellence in the field. I am pleased that the Assembly is able to participate in this way, and I hope that civic societies and local access groups will join forces to ensure a high level of applications.

I am keen that locally important buildings that are derelict or at risk are brought back into active community use, particularly to encourage more healthy and active lifestyles. Through our partners—the Sports Council for

chysylltiadau gydag adnoddau fel y grid cenedlaethol ar gyfer dysgu. Trafodir hyn yng nghyfarfodydd y grŵp yn y dyfodol. Bydd annog plant ysgol i ymddiddori mewn hanes lleol a chenedlaethol yn help i ddatblygu gwerthfawrogiad deallus o bwysigrwydd yr henebion, yr adeiladau a'r tirweddau hanesyddol hyn sy'n rhan o'n bywydau. Bydd plant ysgol, gobeithio, yn dal i gofio hyn pan fyddant yn oedolion.

Mae rheolaeth ofalus Llafur dros yr economi, yng Nghymru a thwy'r DU, wedi sicrhau lefelau cyflogaeth uchel, yn wahanol iawn i'r diweithdra mawr a gafwyd dan y Toriaid. Fodd bynnag, un o sgîl-gynhyrchion cyflogaeth lawn bron yw prinder sgiliau. Y dasg a osodwyd i'r grŵp felly oedd sicrhau gweithlu medrus a chymwys i gefnogi'n haganda. Yn fwyaf arbennig, yr wyf yn awyddus i sicrhau bod gennym bobl sy'n meddu ar sgiliau crefft arbenigol.

Mae'n bwysig nad yw perchnogaeth, yn ei ystyr ehangaf, o'r amgylchedd hanesyddol yn cael ei adael i gyrff statudol yn unig. Yn fy natganiad y llynedd, canolbwyntiais ar fentrau cymunedol. Mae Cadw'n datblygu ei gynllun grantiau dinesig ac mae'n bleser gennyf heddiw, ar y cyd ag Ymddiriedolaeth Ddinesig Cymru, gyhoeddi gwobr ddylunio newydd. Nod cynllun gwobrau dylunio'r ymddiriedolaeth yw gwobrwyo rhagoriaeth mewn dylunio, mewn adeiladau newydd ac adeiladau hanesyddol sy'n cael eu gwarchod. Cyflwynir gwobr newydd yn awr gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i gydnabod gwaith dylunio da sy'n caniatáu i bobl anabl fynd i adeiladau hanesyddol. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cyhoeddi canllawiau ar fynediad yn 'Goresgyn y Rhwystrau', a bydd y wobr newydd yn rhoi sylw i flaenoriaethau'r canllawiau hyn ac yn rhoi clod i ragoriaeth yn y maes. Yr wyf yn falch bod y Cynulliad yn gallu cyfranogi fel hyn, a hyderaf y bydd cymdeithasau dinesig a grwpiau mynediad lleol yn dod at ei gilydd er mwyn sicrhau nifer dda o geisiadau.

Yr wyf yn awyddus i weld adeiladau o bwysigrwydd lleol sy'n wag neu sydd mewn perygl yn cael eu defnyddio unwaith eto gan y gymuned, yn enwedig er mwyn annog ffyrdd iachach o fyw. Drwy ein partneriaid—

Wales and the Heritage Lottery Fund—we have been working closely with local communities and statutory bodies to identify potential buildings. I anticipate being able to announce some pilot schemes shortly.

Voluntary organisations such as local building preservation trusts, have proved successful in turning important historic buildings from derelict shells to restored buildings once again with a long and viable use. When I addressed the national conference of the Association of Preservation Trusts a year or so ago, I learned much of the value of the movement. I am delighted that, with the appointment of a dedicated worker for Wales, part funded by the Assembly, the number of trusts in Wales is increasing.

There is a great need to raise awareness of our historic environment and of its importance and value in social and economic terms. The Assembly is doing much, and we plan to do more by strengthening the organisation of our built heritage resource. Cadw has always been an integral part of the Welsh Assembly Government, reporting directly to me, but its status as an executive agency has created some confusion about this. Therefore, I announce that, from 1 July, its status will change to a directorate, similar to the culture directorate and Cymal, which are similarly within my portfolio. Next year, it will become part of the new and integrated culture department which is to be established.

There are three other publicly sponsored bodies working in this area—the Historic Buildings Council, the Ancient Monuments Board, and the Royal Commission on Ancient and Historical Monuments. Although Cadw will retain its name for trading and operational purposes, we intend to unify the published outputs and presentation work of the four bodies under the title Historic Wales/Cymru Hanesyddol, so that common themes and objectives are better understood. Of course, most of the historical assets in Wales are not in public ownership. While the

Cyngor Chwaraeon Cymru a Chronfa Dreftadaeth y Loteri—yr ydym wedi bod yn gweithio mewn cysylltiad agos â chymunedau lleol a chyrff statudol er mwyn canfod adeiladau a allai fod yn addas. Gobeithiaf gyhoeddi rhai cynlluniau peilot cyn bo hir.

Mae mudiadau gwirfoddol fel ymddiriedolaethau cadw adeiladau lleol, wedi llwyddo i drawsnewid adeiladau hanesyddol pwysig o fod yn sgerbydau gweigion i fod yn adeiladau defnyddiol a fydd yn hyfyw am flynyddoedd eto. Wrth annerch cynhadledd genedlaethol Cymdeithas yr Ymddiriedolaethau Cadw tua blwyddyn yn ôl, dysgais lawer am werth y mudiad. Yr wyf yn falch, o ganlyniad i benodi gweithiwr dynodedig ar gyfer Cymru, sy'n cael ei ariannu'n rhannol gan y Cynulliad, fod nifer yr ymddiriedolaethau sydd yng Nghymru ar gynydd.

Mae gwir angen cynyddu ymwybyddiaeth o'n hamgylchedd hanesyddol ynghyd â'i bwysigrwydd a'i werth cymdeithasol ac economaidd. Mae'r Cynulliad yn gwneud llawer, ac yn bwriadu gwneud mwy, drwy roi fframwaith cryfach i drefniadaeth ein treftadaeth adeiledig. Mae Cadw wedi bod yn rhan annatod o Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru drwy'r adeg, gan adrodd yn uniongyrchol i mi, ond mae ei statws fel asiantaeth weithredol wedi creu rhywfaint o ddrysych yn y cyswllt hwn. Felly, cyhoeddaf y bydd ei statws yn newid, o 1 Gorffennaf ymlaen, ac y bydd yn dod yn gyfarwyddiaeth, fel Cymal a'r gyfarwyddiaeth ddiwylliant, sydd hefyd yn rhan o'm portffolio. Y flwyddyn nesaf, bydd yn dod yn rhan o'r adran ddiwylliant newydd, integredig a fydd yn cael ei sefydlu.

Mae tri chorff arall sy'n cael eu hariannu ag arian cyhoeddus yn gweithio yn y maes hwn—y Cyngor Adeiladau Hanesyddol, y Bwrdd Henebion, a'r Comisiwn Brenhinol Henebion. Er y bydd Cadw yn cadw ei enw at ddibenion masnachol a gweithredol, bwriadwn uno cyhoeddiadau a gwaith cyflwyno'r pedwar corff dan y teitl Historic Wales/Cymru Hanesyddol, fel y ceir gwell dealltwriaeth o themâu ac amcanion cyffredin. Wrth gwrs, nid yw'r rhan fwyaf o'r asedau hanesyddol yng Nghymru yn eiddo i'r cyhoedd. Er bod y Cynulliad a'n

Assembly and our colleagues in local authorities own considerable numbers of these assets, more are held by trusts, by faith-based groups and by private individuals. We can provide statutory protection for the most significant parts of them, and financial and technical advice for their preservation for future generations to enjoy, but the management of our historic environment must be a joint effort involving all of the people of Wales. It is with the intention of creating greater public awareness and knowledge that we have embarked upon the initiatives that I have described.

3.30 p.m.

**Owen John Thomas:** Gwerthfawrogaf yn fawr bwysigrwydd yr amgylchedd hanesyddol, ond teimlaf fod y cylch gwaith a roddwyd inni braidd yn gul. Mae twristiaeth ddiwylliannol yn addawol iawn i economi Cymru ym mhob ran o'r wlad, ond mae angen cynnwys yn yr amgylchedd hanesyddol dirlun Cymru, yr amgylchedd adeiledig, y Gymraeg, diwylliant neilltuol Cymru, crefftwaith Cymru a sawl agwedd arall o'n diwylliant.

Teimlaf eich bod yn awgrymu mai Cadw a'r grŵp amgylchedd hanesyddol fydd y peiriant i yrru ymlaen y broses o hyrwyddo'r amgylchedd hanesyddol. Yr wyf yn siomedig gyda'ch cynnig, oherwydd credaf mai grŵp ceidwadol fu Cadw eisoes. Gyda dyfodiad pennaeth newydd yn yr haf, mae hi'n amser i ddatblygu dulliau newydd a fyddai'n fwy addas i hyrwyddo'r potensial sydd yn ein hamgylchedd hanesyddol ac, yn wir, yn ein diwylliant cyfan.

Mae agwedd Cadw tuag at adeiladau lleol yn negyddol iawn. Nid ydynt yn fodlon rhoi statws i adeiladau lleol oni bai ei fod o bwysigrwydd cenedlaethol. Dyna'r term a ddefnyddir ganddynt. Ni chânt eu cofrestru os nad ydynt o bwysigrwydd cenedlaethol. Agwedd negyddol yw honno, sy'n golygu na fydd nifer o leoedd yng Nghymru yn cael y gefnogaeth y maent yn ei haeddu.

Mae angen corff a fydd yn hyrwyddo'r syniad o gael llwybrau hanesyddol. Dywedasoeh fod angen mwy o wybodaeth ar

cydweithwyr mewn awdurdodau lleol yn berchen ar nifer sylweddol o'r asedau hyn, mae mwy ohonynt ym meddiant ymddiriedolaethau, grwpiau crefyddol ac unigolion preifat. Gallwn ddarparu amddiffyniad statudol ar gyfer y rhannau pwysicaf ohonynt, a chyingor ariannol a thechnegol ar gyfer eu cadw er mwynhad cenedlaethau'r dyfodol, ond rhaid i'r gwaith o reoli ein hamgylchedd hanesyddol fod yn gydymdrech sydd yn cynnwys holl bobl Cymru. Er mwyn meithrin mwy o ymwybyddiaeth a gwybodaeth ymysg y cyhoedd y dechreuasom ar y mentrau a ddisgrifiais.

**Owen John Thomas:** I greatly appreciate the importance of the historic environment, but I feel that the remit presented to us is slightly constrained. Cultural tourism is promising for the Welsh economy in all parts of the country, but we need to include the Welsh landscape, the built environment, the Welsh language, the unique culture of Wales, Welsh craftsmanship and many other aspects of our culture in the historic environment.

I feel that you are suggesting that Cadw and the historic environment group will be the engine to drive forward the process of promoting the historic environment. I am disappointed by your proposal, as I feel that Cadw has always been a conservative group. With the appointment of a new head in the summer, here is an opportunity to develop new methods more relevant to boosting the potential in our historic environment and, indeed, in our culture as a whole.

Cadw's attitude towards local buildings is very negative. It is not willing to give local buildings any status unless they are of national significance. That is the term that they use. Buildings are not registered unless they are of national significance. That is a negative attitude that means that many places in Wales will not receive the support that they deserve.

We need a body that supports the idea of having historic routes. You said that the public needs more information about our

y cyhoedd am ein hanes a'n lleoedd prydferth, ond ni welaf Cadw fel corff addas i wneud hynny am y rhesymau a fynegais yn barod. Nid wyf ychwaith yn ei weld fel corff addas i fod yn gyfrifol am gael cronfa goffâu—un o'm breuddwydion personol—i goffâu enwogion a digwyddiadau o bwys yn hanes Cymru. Byddai hynny hefyd yn ffordd o helpu pobl i ddod i adnabod manau prydferth sy'n haeddu rhyw fath o blac i gofnodi hynny.

Hoffwn weld corff mwy mentrus, rhagweithiol, sydd yn cydweithio gyda'r bwrdd croeso a chyrrff eraill i hyrwyddo twristiaeth ddiwylliannol ledled y wlad. Rhaid i'r grŵp ymgynghorol gael statws go iawn, yn hytrach na'i fod yn seinfwrdd yn unig, fel ei fod yn rhoi cyngor i Cadw, neu ba gorff bynnag fydd yn gyfrifol am hyn oll, a fydd yn cael ei dderbyn a'i weithredu. Fel arall, ni fyddwn yn manteisio ar y cyfle a'r potensial enfawr sydd gennym yn y maes hwn.

**Alun Pugh:** There were lots of points there, Owen John. First of all, I thank you for trying to massively increase the size of my portfolio; as you know, tourism is the responsibility of the Minister for Economic Development and Transport. I think that you are trying to move some work from Carwyn's area into mine. We all have a role to play in developing the historic environment of Wales, which was a key theme of my statement.

You made reference to the appointment of a new head of Cadw, because Tom Cassidy is retiring. I pay tribute this afternoon to the huge effort that he has made. Many Members will have seen the job advertisement in the national press recently. As a civil service appointment, it is not a matter for me. However, if you look carefully at the job description, you will see that it asks both for expertise in the field of the historic environment, important though that is, but also for an ability to connect with the wider policy objectives of the Assembly Government, which is also an important part of that new job.

As far as your remarks on the listing criteria

history and our beautiful locations, but I do not see Cadw as the appropriate body to achieve that, for the reasons that I have already outlined. Nor do I see Cadw as the appropriate body to be responsible for administering a memorial fund—one of my personal dreams—to commemorate famous individuals and important events in Welsh history. That would also be a means of helping people to get to know the beautiful sites that deserve some kind of commemorative plaque.

I want to see a more daring and proactive body, collaborating with the tourist board and other organisations to promote cultural tourism throughout Wales. The consultative group must have real status rather than being only a sounding board, so that it can advise Cadw, or whichever organisation is responsible for all of this, and so that its advice can be adopted and implemented. Otherwise, we will not be making the most of the opportunity and the enormous potential that we have in this area.

**Alun Pugh:** Cudasoch lawer o bwyntiau, Owen John. Yn gyntaf oll, diolchaf i chi am geisio ehangu cwmpas fy mhortffolio yn aruthrol; fel y gwyddoch, cyfrifoldeb y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth yw twristiaeth. Credaf eich bod yn ceisio symud rhywfaint o waith o faes Carwyn i'm maes i. Mae gennym oll ran i'w chwarae wrth ddatblygu amgylchedd hanesyddol Cymru, a oedd yn thema allweddol yn fy natganiad.

Cyfeiriasoch at benodi pennaeth newydd ar Cadw, gan fod Tom Cassidy yn ymddeol. Talaf deyrnged y prynhawn yma i'r ymdrech fawr a wnaeth. Bydd llawer o Aelodau wedi gweld yr hysbyseb ar gyfer y swydd yn y wasg genedlaethol yn ddiweddar. Gan mai penodiad i'r gwasanaeth sifil ydyw, nid yw'n fater i mi. Fodd bynnag, os edrychwch yn ofalus ar y swydd-ddisgrifiad, gwelwch ei fod yn ogystal â mynnu arbenigedd ym maes yr amgylchedd hanesyddol, er pwysiced yw hynny, yn gofyn hefyd am allu i gysylltu ag amcanion polisi ehangach Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ac mae hynny hefyd yn agwedd bwysig ar y swydd newydd honno.

Gyda golwg ar eich sylwadau am y meini

are concerned, many people in many constituencies feel very strongly about particular buildings, and threats of demolition or substantial alteration to them. All that I can say to you this afternoon is that the listing criteria are published and they will cover a large number of buildings in Wales. I anticipate that, when the all-Wales survey is completed by the end of 2005, that very long list will extend to some 30,000 buildings, but many people will obviously want that list to be even bigger.

**Lisa Francis:** Minister, we all know that, when we talk about the historic environment, we are not just talking about castles and stately homes, but other historic assets, which are important in helping local people to define their communities, are under constant threat of demolition or neglect. The statement that you issued uses words like 'considering', 'potential' and 'guidance', but will an overall strategy emerge from all this? Do you have a plan of action for the future, or is your Labour administration all talk?

In the past, Cadw has been focused completely on protection. It has ignored many other things; for example, it has not recognised the valuable Welsh battlefield sites. The historic environment and Wales's cultural heritage are vital to tourism, as Owen John just said. I think that they are much of the reason why people visit Wales in the first place. What will your administration do to ensure that Cadw now plays this wider role?

You say that Cadw will now become a directorate, and will sit on the new culture board. In respect of the historic environment group, currently chaired by Cadw, do you plan to change that? The advice that is given to you now from Cadw effectively comes from your own people; that cannot be right. How will you ensure transparency in the future? Can we have the terms of reference for the historic environment group, which you promised at the beginning of the year? I do not think that we have received that yet.

prawf ar gyfer rhestru, mae llawer o bobl mewn llawer o etholaethau'n teimlo'n gryf iawn ynghylch adeiladau penodol, a bygythiadau i'w dymchwel neu eu newid yn sylweddol. Y cwbl y gallaf ei ddweud wrthyfch y prynhawn yma yw bod y meini prawf ar gyfer rhestru wedi eu cyhoeddi ac y byddant yn berthnasol i nifer mawr o adeiladau yng Nghymru. Rhagwelaf, ar ôl cwblhau'r arolwg o Gymru gyfan erbyn diwedd 2005, y bydd y rhestr hir honno'n cynnwys tua 30,000 o adeiladau, ond mae'n amlwg y bydd llawer o bobl yn dymuno i'r rhestr fod yn hwy byth.

**Lisa Francis:** Weinidog, yr ydym oll yn gwybod, wrth sôn am yr amgylchedd hanesyddol, nad ydym yn cyfeirio at gestyll a phlatai'n unig, ond at asedau hanesyddol eraill, sydd yn bwysig o ran helpu pobl leol i ddiffinio eu cymunedau, ac sydd dan fygythiad parhaus oherwydd esgeulustod neu fwriad i'w dymchwel. Yn y datganiad a gyhoeddasoch ceir geiriau fel 'ystyried', 'potensial' a 'chanllawiau', ond a fydd strategaeth gyffredinol yn codi o hyn? A oes gennych gynllun gweithredu ar gyfer y dyfodol, ynteu ai siarad yn unig a wnaiff eich gweinyddiaeth Lafur?

Yn y gorffennol, bu Cadw yn canolbwyntio'n llwyr ar ddiogelu. Anwybyddodd llawer o bethau eraill; er enghraifft, ni chydabu werth y safleoedd brwydro gwerthfawr yng Nghymru. Mae'r amgylchedd hanesyddol a threftadaeth ddiwylliannol Cymru'n hollbwysig i dwristiaeth, fel y mae Owen John newydd ddweud. Credaf mai hwy sydd yn denu pobl i ymweld â Chymru yn y lle cyntaf i raddau helaeth. Beth a wnaiff eich gweinyddiaeth i sicrhau y bydd Cadw yn chwarae'r rhan ehangach hon yn awr?

Dywedwch y bydd Cadw yn troi'n gyfarwyddiaeth yn awr, ac y bydd yn eistedd ar y bwrdd diwylliant newydd. Ynglŷn â'r grŵp amgylchedd hanesyddol, sy'n cael ei gadeirio gan Cadw ar hyn o bryd, a ydych yn bwriadu newid hynny? Mae'r cyngor a gewch gan Cadw ar hyn o bryd yn dod oddi wrth eich pobl eich hun i bob pwrpas; ni all hynny fod yn iawn. Sut y byddwch yn sicrhau tryloywder yn y dyfodol? A gawn weld y cylch gorchwyl ar gyfer y grŵp amgylchedd hanesyddol, yr addawsoch ei roi

ar ddechrau'r flwyddyn? Ni chredaf ein bod wedi cael hwnnw eto.

**Alun Pugh:** You started by talking about castles, and the castles of Wales are icons, especially the Edwardian castles of north Wales, which are recognised not only as being important nationally, but as a world heritage site. However, the list of protected buildings is far wider than that. Our anticipated number is 30,000 buildings and they cover a whole variety of structures; the vast majority of those are, of course, not castles.

**Alun Pugh:** Dechreuasoch drwy sôn am gestyll, ac eiconau yw cestyll Cymru, yn enwedig cestyll Edwardaidd y Gogledd, y cydnabyddir eu bod nid yn unig yn bwysig yn genedlaethol, ond hefyd fel safle treftadaeth y byd. Fodd bynnag, mae rhestr yr adeiladau a warchodir yn ehangach o lawer na hynny. Rhagwelwn y bydd 30,000 o adeiladau arni ac y byddant yn cynnwys amrywiaeth mawr o adeiladweithiau; nid yw'r mwyafrif helaeth ohonynt yn gestyll, wrth gwrs.

Our overall policy falls into two areas. A whole range of statutory protection is available, as well as advice and guidance, and a considerable grant scheme. I believe that around £13 million has been allocated through various Cadw grants in recent years.

Mae ein polisi cyffredinol yn perthyn i ddau faes. Mae amrywiaeth mawr o amddiffyniadau statudol ar gael, yn ogystal â chynghor a chanllawiau, a chynllun grant sylweddol. Credaf fod tua £13 miliwn wedi ei ddyrannu drwy wahanol grantiau gan Cadw yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf.

You mentioned battlefield sites, which is something to which I am sympathetic. You may know that the Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Wales is currently undertaking work that will allow an assessment to be made on whether the production of a comprehensive battlefields register for Wales is a realistic proposition. If so, I will certainly give careful consideration to publishing that in a popular format, possibly a map of the battlefields of Wales.

Cyfeiriasoch at safleoedd brwydrau, ac mae hynny'n rhywbeth sydd yn apelio ataf. Efallai y gwyddoch fod Comisiwn Brenhinol Henebion Cymru yn ymgymryd â gwaith ar hyn o bryd a fydd yn fodd i asesu a ellir llunio cofrestr gynhwysfawr o safleoedd brwydrau ar gyfer Cymru. Os gellir, byddaf yn sicr o roi ystyriaeth ofalus i gyhoeddi hynny ar ffurf boblogaidd, fel map o safleoedd brwydrau yng Nghymru o bosibl.

Finally, on the change of Cadw's status from an executive agency to a full directorate, it will not involve a change of legal personality, as with some of our Assembly sponsored public bodies under the reform agenda, but it makes things simpler.

Yn olaf, ynghylch newid statws Cadw o fod yn asiantaeth weithredol i fod yn gyfarwyddiaeth lawn, ni fydd hynny'n golygu newid ei natur gyfreithiol, fel y bydd yn achos rhai o'r cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad o dan yr agenda ar ddiwygio, ond mae hyn yn symleiddio pethau.

3.40 p.m.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Diolch, Weinidog, am eich datganiad am amgylchedd hanesyddol Cymru, a sut yr ydych am fanteisio ar y cyfle cyffrous sydd o'ch blaen.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Thank you, Minister, for your statement on the historic environment of Wales, and how you intend to take advantage of this exciting opportunity.

However, why has it taken since last July to make your announcement regarding beefing up Cadw's previously passive and overly protective role? I say that quite charitably,

Er hynny, pam y cymerodd ers mis Gorffennaf diwethaf ichi wneud eich cyhoeddiad ynghylch cryfhau'r rôl oddefol a goramddiffynnol a oedd gan Cadw cynt?

because, across the parties, we have not all been happy with its passively protective role. How will you ensure that it engages positively with other Assembly portfolios and outside bodies, such as the National Trust, and fully engage—I am using positive words here—with education, community regeneration, and so on?

How will your Labour Assembly Government fully champion and sing the praises of Welsh heritage, as English Heritage and Historic Scotland have done for so long, to increase awareness not only of our treasures but of Welsh tourism and the economy in general? What will your Labour Assembly Government do to ensure that Cadw plays a proactive and enhanced role, and will that be fully funded? Can you reassure us that you are working productively with Education and Learning Wales, for instance, because I notice, from your statement, that you have some skills shortages? Will it investigate and rectify these skills shortages, so that appropriate training will be readily available to deliver the required employment, so that the true value of Welsh heritage can be fully enjoyed by people not just throughout Wales but beyond, so that we can achieve the full potential for which we have waited so long?

**Alun Pugh:** You talk about Cadw having an overly protective role, and I do hear criticisms about that. Cadw has important statutory obligations to protect the historic environment. Had we been a bit sharper on protecting the environment in the 1960s and 1970s, I am sure that many ill-thought-out developments could have been avoided. They seemed like a good idea at the time, but, with the benefit of hindsight and in looking back at some of the damage done in towns and cities—not just in Wales but across the UK—and the destruction of a sense of place, they are seen as town planning disasters.

You mentioned a skills shortage, but that is an inevitable out-working of having just about full employment. I will not apologise

Dywedaf hynny'n eithaf caredig, oherwydd bu rhai ohonom, yn yr holl bleidiau, nad oeddem yn fodlon ar ei rôl oddefol amddiffynnol. Sut y gwnewch sicrhau y bydd yn ymwneud yn gadarnhaol â phortffolios eraill y Cynulliad a chyrrff allanol, fel yr Ymddiriedolaeth Genedlaethol, ac yn ymwneud yn llawn—yr wyf yn defnyddio geiriau cadarnhaol yma—ag addysg, adfywio cymunedol, ac yn y blaen?

Sut y bydd Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad yn hyrwyddo ac yn canu clodydd treftadaeth Cymru i'r eithaf, fel y mae English Heritage a Historic Scotland wedi gwneud ers tro byd, er mwyn hybu ymwybyddiaeth nid yn unig o'n trysorau ond o dwristiaeth yng Nghymru a'r economi'n gyffredinol? Beth a wnaiff Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad i sicrhau y bydd Cadw yn chwarae rhan ragweithiol a mwy helaeth, ac y caiff ei ariannu'n llawn? A allwch ein sicrhau eich bod yn cydweithio'n fuddiol â Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru, er enghraifft, oherwydd sylwaf, wrth edrych ar eich datganiad, fod rhai sgiliau'n brin gennych? A wnaiff ymchwilio i'r prinder sgiliau hwnnw a'i gywiro, fel y bydd hyfforddiant priodol ar gael yn rhwydd i ddarparu ar gyfer y swyddi hynny, fel y gall gwir werth treftadaeth Cymru gael ei fwynhau'n llawn gan bobl, nid yn unig ledled Cymru ond y tu hwnt, fel y gallwn gyflawni holl botensial yr hyn y buom yn disgwyl amdano gyhyd?

**Alun Pugh:** Dywedwch fod rôl Cadw yn oramddiffynnol, a byddaf yn clywed beirniadu ynghylch hynny. Mae gan Cadw ymrwymadau statudol pwysig i ddiogelu'r amgylchedd hanesyddol. Pe byddem wedi mynd ati'n gynt i amddiffyn yr amgylchedd yn y 1960au a'r 1970au, yr wyf yn siŵr y gellid bod wedi osgoi llawer o ddatblygiadau annoeth. Yr oeddent yn ymddangos yn syniad da ar y pryd, ond, gydag ôl-ddoethineb ac wrth edrych yn ôl ar beth o'r difrod a wnaethpwyd mewn trefi a dinasoedd—nid yn unig yng Nghymru ond ledled y DU—a'r modd y difethwyd yr ymdeimlad â chymeriad lle, fe'u gwelir yn drychinebau o ran cynllunio trefol.

Cyfeiriasoch at brinder sgiliau, ond mae hynny'n ganlyniad anorfod wrth gael cyflogaeth sydd bron yn llawn. Nid



for that; it is a by-product. That is something that we are doing in terms of ELWa's agenda, through the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning. However, Cadw takes its own responsibility seriously in these areas. I was proud to be at Castell Coch last week to present in-service training awards to several Cadw manual staff members. They had joined the organisation many years ago, but had fully embraced the lifelong learning agenda, and now have much higher levels of skills.

On what you see as Cadw's narrow and overly protective remit, it has statutory responsibilities. However, if you go back to the press and look at the job specification for the new head of Cadw, you will see that articulation, with a wider policy strategy and the wider policy aims of the Assembly Government, coming into play.

**Denise Idris Jones:** I am sure that you would agree, Minister, that, in a constituency such as mine, which is rich in hysterical, sorry, historical heritage—

**Owen John Thomas:** That is a Freudian slip.

**Denise Idris Jones:** You do not have Conwy castle in your area, do you, Owen John?

The Conwy roundhouse—the old cockpit—York Place, Conwy, which is one of the only significant surviving cockpits in Wales, is an interesting building that had fallen into a sad state of disrepair. However, £3,400 of Cadw money has been allocated to improve it, and, once it is refurbished, it will add to the visitor attractions in Conwy.

**Alun Pugh:** You are right to draw attention to some of the outstanding historical structures that your constituency enjoys. We are all aware of that fantastic castle in Conwy, but, within the town walls and in the immediate environs, there is also a huge variety of structures dating from a variety of historical periods, which add enormously to the tourist appeal of that town.

ymddiheuraf am hynny; sgîl-effaith ydyw. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth yr ydym yn ei wneud yng nghyd-destun agenda ELWa, drwy'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Fodd bynnag, mae Cadw yn cymryd ei gyfrifoldeb ei hun o ddifrif yn y meysydd hyn. Yr oeddwn yn falch o fod yng Nghastell Coch yr wythnos diwethaf i gyflwyno gwobrau am hyfforddiant mewn swydd i nifer o aelodau staff gwaith llaw Cadw. Ymunasant â'r corff flynyddoedd lawer yn ôl, ond maent wedi llwyr groesawu'r agenda ar ddysgu gydol oes, a bellach mae ganddynt lefelau sgiliau uwch o lawer.

Ynghylch yr hyn a welwch yn gylch gwaith cyfyng a goramddiffynnol Cadw, mae ganddo gyfrifoldebau statudol. Fodd bynnag, os edrychwch eto ar y papurau newydd a'r fanyleb swydd ar gyfer pennaeth newydd Cadw, gwelwch fod y cysylltiad â strategaeth polisi ehangach a nodau polisi ehangach Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn dechrau datblygu.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunech, Weinidog, mewn etholaeth fel fy un i, sydd â threftadaeth hysteraidd, mae'n ddrwg gennyf, hanesyddol, mor gyfoethog—

**Owen John Thomas:** Llithriad Freudaidd yw hwnnw.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Nid yw castell Conwy yn eich ardal chi, ydyw, Owen John?

Mae'r tŷ crwn yng Nghonwy—yr hen dalwrn—yn York Place, Conwy, sef yr unig dalwrn o bwys sydd ar ôl yng Nghymru, yn adeilad diddorol a oedd wedi dadfeilio'n ddifrifol. Fodd bynnag, mae £3,400 o arian wedi ei ddyrannu gan Cadw i'w wella, ac, ar ôl ei adnewyddu, bydd yn atyniad ychwanegol i ymwelwyr yng Nghonwy.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae'n briodol ichi dynnu sylw at rai o'r adeiladweithiau hanesyddol eithriadol a geir yn eich etholaeth. Yr ydym oll yn gwybod am y castell hynod hwnnw yng Nghonwy, ond, o fewn muriau'r dref ac yn y cyffiniau, ceir hefyd amrywiaeth mawr o adeiladweithiau sydd yn dyddio o wahanol gyfnodau hanesyddol, sydd yn ychwanegu'n aruthrol at apêl y dref honno i ymwelwyr.

The grant for the cockpit is a practical example of a relatively small grant that is making a big difference and a major contribution in terms of bringing older buildings to a new and fresh audience.

**Huw Lewis:** I congratulate you, Minister, on your stewardship of this aspect of your portfolio. It shows continuous movement in the right direction, given limited resources, and a great deal of imagination in the handling of the portfolio.

I ask you to continue that vigilance, Alun, and ensure that the agencies that will come under your portfolio will shift from their historic, and, in my view, mistaken, position of valuing some types of Welsh heritage over others. I am thinking in particular of Wales's pre-industrial heritage, which has always been, rightly, cherished, preserved and looked after, as compared to the relatively recent interest and investment in our post-industrial heritage. My constituency, as you know, is brimming with examples of that heritage—key buildings, for instance—that have a great historical tale to tell about Wales's industrial life. Almost all of those buildings are in some degree of disuse, disrepair and decay. I welcome your proposals for recreational use to bring new life to such buildings; that has resonance in my constituency. I also welcome your announcement on training in craft skills, which was a subject that I expounded upon in a short debate that I was lucky to have a few months ago. I am pleased that an aspect of that is coming through in your words today.

Finally, a difficulty that I have run up against in arguing for this kind of priority to be given to these buildings—not just at an Assembly, but at local government level—is the need for the Assembly to give a greater degree of reassurance to local authorities about taking the risk of bringing key historic buildings back into use. There is a fear of revenue implications, and we must move to lessen

Mae'r grant ar gyfer y talwrn yn esiampl ymarferol o grant cymharol fychan sydd yn gwneud gwahaniaeth mawr a chyfraniad pwysig i ddod ag adeiladau hŷn i sylw cynulleidfa newydd a ffres.

**Huw Lewis:** Llongyfarchiadau ichi, Weinidog, ar eich stiwardiaeth dros y wedd hon ar eich portffolio. Mae'n dangos symudiad parhaus i'r cyfeiriad cywir, o gofio'r adnoddau prin, ynghyd â llawer iawn o ddychymyg yn y modd yr ymdrinnir â'r portffolio.

Gofynnaf ichi barhau â'r wyliadwriaeth honno, Alun, a sicrhau y bydd yr asiantaethau a ddaw dan eich portffolio yn symud oddi wrth eu safbwynt hanesyddol, safbwynt sydd, yn fy marn i, yn gamsyniad, gan werthfawrogi rhai mathau o dreftadaeth Gymreig ar draul rhai eraill. Yr wyf yn meddwl yn benodol am dreftadaeth gyn-ddiwydiannol Cymru, treftadaeth sydd bob amser wedi cael ei choleddu, ei chadw a'i gwarchod, fel y dylai, o'i chymharu â'r diddordeb a'r buddsoddiad eithaf diweddar yn ein treftadaeth ôl-ddiwydiannol. Mae fy etholaeth, fel y gwyddoch, yn frith o esiamplau o'r dreftadaeth honno—adeiladau allweddol, er enghraifft—sydd â stori hanesyddol ardderchog i'w hadrodd am fywyd diwydiannol Cymru. Mae bron pob un o'r adeiladau hyn yn dioddef o ddiffyg defnydd, diffyg atgyweirio a phydredd i wahanol raddau. Croesawaf eich cynigion i'w defnyddio at ddibenion hamdden er mwyn dwyn bywyd o'r newydd i adeiladau o'r fath; mae hyn yn bwysig yn fy etholaeth. Croesawaf hefyd eich cyhoeddiad ynghylch hyfforddiant mewn sgiliau yn ymwneud â chreffftau, pwnc yr ymhelaethais arno mewn dadl fer yr oeddwn yn ddigon ffodus i'w chael rai misoedd yn ôl. Yr wyf yn falch bod elfen o hynny yn dod i'r amlwg yn eich geiriau heddiw.

Yn olaf, un anhawster yr wyf wedi ei wynebu wrth ddadlau dros roi'r math hwn o flaenoriaeth i'r adeiladau hyn—nid ar lefel y Cynulliad yn unig, ond ar lefel llywodraeth leol—yw'r angen i'r Cynulliad roi mwy o sicrwydd i awdurdodau lleol wrth iddynt fentro dechrau defnyddio adeiladau hanesyddol allweddol unwaith eto. Mae arnynt ofn y goblygiadau refeniw, a rhaid

that fear.

**Alun Pugh:** You are right to draw the Assembly's attention to Merthyr Tydfil's outstanding industrial heritage. I worked in Merthyr Tydfil for a few years, and I am familiar with its outstanding buildings, some of which, as you rightly say, are in a poor state of repair. We have been innovative in our deployment of resources, and the figure I quoted was, I think, some £13 million. We could always spend more, but I certainly give you an assurance that we will not value one part of Wales's industrial heritage above others.

With regard to bringing these buildings back into use, that is a key theme of community strategies. When Sue Essex and I met local authority leaders and national park leaders last week, getting such buildings properly valued and integrated in terms of development schemes was a key theme of that discussion. We want to encourage local authorities to do that. Many of those buildings are listed. However, while other buildings, although they are fine buildings, do not quite make the cut for listing, they can make a major contribution to the redevelopment of town centres.

**Karen Sinclair:** I welcome Cadw's becoming a directorate—it is not before time. We need to take a careful and critical look at Cadw's work in protecting buildings or, in some cases, in not protecting buildings. I made it clear, when I was a member of the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee, that the listing of buildings without there being a grant available has allowed many buildings to degenerate dreadfully. I have evidence and case files to back that up. I have seen buildings literally fall down because their owners could not afford to do anything with them, because the buildings could not be touched unless it was as per the listing. Therefore, the buildings were ignored. Local authorities do not pick them up, even though they have a responsibility to do so, because they have other priorities for their budgets. Therefore,

inni symud i leddfu'r ofn hwnnw.

**Alun Pugh:** Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle wrth dynnu sylw'r Cynulliad at dreftadaeth ddiwydiannol eithriadol Merthyr Tudful. Bûm yn gweithio ym Merthyr Tudful am ychydig flynyddoedd, ac yr wyf yn gyfarwydd â'i hadeiladau eithriadol; ac yr ydych yn iawn wrth ddweud bod rhai ohonynt mewn cyflwr gwael. Yr ydym wedi bod yn ddyfeisgar wrth ledaenu ein hadnoddau, a chredaf mai rhyw £13 miliwn oedd y ffigur a ddyfynnais. Gallem wastad wario rhagor, ond rhoddaf sicrwydd ichi yn bendant na fyddwn yn rhoi mwy o werth ar un rhan o dreftadaeth ddiwydiannol Cymru ar draul rhannau eraill.

O safbwynt ailddechrau defnyddio'r adeiladau hyn unwaith eto, mae hyn yn un o themâu allweddol strategaethau cymunedol. Pan gyfarfu Sue Essex a minnau ag arweinwyr awdurdodau lleol ac arweinwyr parciau cenedlaethol yr wythnos diwethaf, yr oedd prisio ac integreiddio'r adeiladau hyn yn briodol o safbwynt cynlluniau datblygu yn thema allweddol yn y drafodaeth honno. Yr ydym eisiau annog awdurdodau lleol i wneud hynny. Mae llawer o'r adeiladau hyn yn rhestredig. Fodd bynnag, er bod adeiladau eraill, serch eu bod yn adeiladau gwych, heb fod yn hollol gymwys i gael eu rhestru, gallant wneud cyfraniad pwysig at ailddatblygu canol trefi.

**Karen Sinclair:** Croesawaf weld Cadw'n dod yn gyfarwyddiaeth—a hen bryd hefyd. Rhaid inni gymryd golwg fanwl a beirniadol ar y gwaith y mae Cadw yn ei wneud wrth warchod adeiladau neu, mewn rhai achosion, heb fod yn ei wneud. Dywedais yn bendant, pan oeddwn yn aelod o Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth, fod rhestru adeiladau heb fod grant ar gael wedi gadael i lawer o adeiladau ddirywio yn echrydus. Mae gennyf dystiolaeth a ffeiliau achos i gefnogi hyn. Yr wyf wedi gweld adeiladau yn syrthio yn llythrennol oherwydd na allai eu perchnogion fforddio gwneud dim gyda hwy, oherwydd ni chaniateid iddynt gyffwrdd â'r adeiladau oni bai fod hynny yn unol â'r rhestru. O'r herwydd, yr oedd yr adeiladau yn cael eu hanwybyddu. Nid yw'r awdurdodau lleol yn eu hachub, er bod ganddynt gyfrifoldeb i wneud hynny,

often, what Cadw has achieved for the buildings of Wales is the exact opposite of what we want to achieve for those buildings. I make no apologies for saying that, because I have been saying it for a long time. I hope that this change will allow a fresh look at how we go about protecting buildings in Wales.

3.50 p.m.

**Alun Pugh:** We have a fairly comprehensive set of statutory controls, which have protected many buildings. However, you are right to say that the scheme is not perfect. I will be parochial for a minute and mention the case of Hafodunnos Hall in my constituency, Clwyd West. It is a building of importance across north Wales. We all saw how an arson attack reduced that building to rubble, and a huge part of the architectural heritage of north Wales and an outstanding Gilbert Scott Grade I building was lost. Gwrych castle on the coast, which is owned by an absentee foreign owner, is another example. These changes in administrative arrangements will improve the situation. However, I cannot offer an absolute guarantee that this will right all the wrongs. In the longer term, we need to look more strategically at the whole web of statutory controls to see what changes can be made for the better.

**Rosemary Butler:** We must remember that historic monuments and listed buildings owned by the Government belong to the citizens of Wales, and we must ensure that they become more accessible to everyone. I would also like to see as much help and assistance given to those who own historic buildings or monuments to ensure that they are accessible to the public. I know that the announcement of this new award will be welcome.

The idea of a new directorate is interesting. I hope that it will be a little more people friendly than Cadw, particularly to those living in listed houses—I am not talking about big buildings, but smaller houses. I hope that it will give more help in terms of how applications for financial assistance to

oherwydd bod ganddynt flaenoriaethau eraill ar gyfer eu cyllidebau. Felly, yn aml, mae'r hyn y mae Cadw wedi ei gyflawni gydag adeiladau Cymru yn gwbl groes i'r hyn yr ydym am ei gyflawni ar gyfer yr adeiladau hyn. Ni wnaf ymddiheuro am ddweud hyn, oherwydd yr wyf wedi bod yn ei ddweud ers tro. Gobeithiaf y bydd y newid hwn yn caniatáu inni gymryd golwg ffres ar sut yr awn ati i warchod adeiladau yng Nghymru.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae gennym set o reolaethau statudol cymharol gynhwysfawr, rheolaethau sydd wedi gwarchod sawl adeilad. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych yn llygad eich lle wrth ddweud nad yw'r cynllun yn berffaith. Byddaf yn blwyfol am funud a chrybwyll Plas Hafodunnos yn fy etholaeth, Gorrlewin Clwyd. Mae'n adeilad pwysig ar gyfer y Gogledd i gyd. Gwelsom oll sut y bu i achos o gynnuau tân yn fwriadol droi'r adeilad hwn yn llwch, a chollwyd rhan anferthol o dreftadaeth y Gogledd ynghyd ag adeilad Gradd I eithriadol gan Gilbert Scott. Mae castell Gwrych ar yr arfordir, sydd yn eiddo i berchennog tramor absennol, yn esiampl arall. Bydd y newidiadau hyn yn y trefniadau gweinyddol yn gwella'r sefyllfa. Serch hynny, ni allaf gynnig sicrwydd cwbl bendant y bydd hyn yn unioni'r holl gamweddau. Yn y tymor hir, rhaid inni edrych yn fwy strategol ar rwydwaith y rheolaethau statudol yn ei gyfanrwydd i weld pa newidiadau y gellir eu gwneud er gwell.

**Rosemary Butler:** Rhaid inni gofio bod henebion ac adeiladau rhestredig sydd yn eiddo i'r Llywodraeth yn eiddo i ddinasyddion Cymru, a rhaid inni sicrhau ei bod yn dod yn haws i bawb gael mynediad atynt. Hoffwn hefyd weld cymaint o help a chymorth yn cael ei roi i'r rhai sydd yn berchen ar henebion neu adeiladau rhestredig er mwyn sicrhau ei bod yn hawdd i'r cyhoedd gael mynediad atynt. Gwn y bydd cyhoeddi'r dyfarniad newydd hwn yn cael ei groesawu.

Mae'r syniad o gyfarwyddiaeth newydd yn un diddorol. Gobeithiaf y bydd ychydig yn fwy cyfeillgar tuag at bobl na Cadw, yn enwedig tuag y rhai sydd yn byw mewn tai rhestredig—nid am adeiladau mawr yr wyf yn sôn, ond am dai llai. Gobeithiaf y bydd yn rhoi rhagor o help o safbwynt sut y caiff

upgrade these properties are processed.

Disability Wales launched its new website today. This highlights the need to make more of Wales's historic monuments and listed buildings accessible to those with visual and hearing impairments as well as to those with other physical disabilities. Minister, I hope that you will ensure that the new directorate participates fully in the European Union's APPEAR project on opening urban archaeological sites to the public. This research project proposes to deliver practical solutions and advice to those involved in site accessibility projects. We would benefit greatly from that in Wales, and we also have a lot to offer. I hope that we will take full part in this project. I know that members of the Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee will be delighted with this new move, and we look forward to having progress reports during the coming year.

**Alun Pugh:** We certainly want to open up the admissions process. In terms of financial disincentives, the admission charges to monuments are pretty competitive. You can pay in pounds or in euros, and the euro initiative has been reasonably successful. You can get season tickets, school parties have free admission, and I think that the top price is around £4.50.

I thank you for your comments on access arrangements; we want to encourage that in terms of physical access to these buildings. However, many of the castles were carefully designed with access in mind, of course, and the original architects tried to make access as difficult as they possibly could. Trying to ensure access for the disabled in the twenty-first century while maintaining the integrity of those ancient structures gives architects a considerable headache. However, we need to pursue that issue.

ceisiadau am gymorth ariannol i uwchraddio'r adeiladau hyn eu prosesu.

Lansiodd Anabledd Cymru ei wefan newydd heddiw. Mae hon yn tynnu sylw at y ffaith bod angen gwneud rhagor o adeiladau rhestredig a henebion Cymru yn hygyrch i bobl â nam ar eu golwg ac ar eu clyw, yn ogystal ag i'r rhai sydd ag anableddau corfforol eraill. Weinidog, gobeithiaf y byddwch yn sicrhau bod y gyfarwyddiaeth newydd yn cyfranogi'n llwyr ym mhrosiect APPEAR yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ar agor safleoedd archeolegol trefol i'r cyhoedd. Mae'r prosiect ymchwil hwn yn bwriadu cyflwyno cyngor ac atebion ymarferol i'r rhai sydd yn gysylltiedig â phrosiectau hygyrchedd. Byddai hyn o fantais fawr i ni yng Nghymru, ac mae gennym hefyd lawer i'w gynnig. Gobeithiaf y byddwn yn chwarae rhan lawn yn y prosiect hwn. Gwn y bydd aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon yn falch iawn o'r symudiad newydd hwn, ac edrychwn ymlaen at gael adroddiadau blaengar yn ystod y flwyddyn nesaf.

**Alun Pugh:** Yr ydym yn bendant eisiau ymestyn y broses o ran mynediad. O safbwynt rhwystrau ariannol, mae'r taliadau mynediad i henebion yn eithaf cystadleuol. Gallwch dalu mewn punnoedd neu mewn ewros, a bu'r cynllun ewro yn eithaf llwyddiannus. Gallwch brynu tocynnau tymor, mae partïon ysgol yn cael mynediad am ddim, a chredaf mai tua £4.50 yw'r pris uchaf.

Diolchaf ichi am eich sylwadau am drefniadau mynediad; yr ydym eisiau annog hynny o safbwynt mynediad corfforol i'r adeiladau hyn. Fodd bynnag, cynlluniwyd llawer o'r cestyll gan gadw mynediad mewn cof, wrth gwrs, a cheisiodd y penseiri gwreiddiol wneud mynediad mor anodd ag y gallent. Mae ceisio sicrhau mynediad i bobl anabl yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain gan gynnal dilysrwydd yr adeiladau hynafol hyn yn peri cryn benbleth i benseiri. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni fynd ar drywydd y mater hwnnw.

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Bwyd a Ffytosterolau neu Ffytostanolau Ychwanegol  
(Labelu) (Cymru) 2005**  
**Approval of The Food with Added Phytosterols or Phytosterols (Labelling)  
(Wales) Regulations 2005**

**Y Llywydd:** O dan Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn.  
**The Presiding Officer:** Under Standing Order No. 24.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod  
**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25:*  
*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 24.25:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 12 Ebrill 2005 ynghylch y Rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Bwyd a Ffytosterolau neu Ffytostanolau Ychwanegol (Labelu) (Cymru) 2005; a*  
*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 12 April 2005 on the draft Regulations, the Food with Added Phytosterols or Phytosterols (Labelling) (Wales) Regulations 2005; and*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Bwyd a Ffytosterolau neu Ffytostanolau Ychwanegol (Labelu) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:*  
*2. approves that the Food with Added Phytosterols or Phytosterols (Labelling) (Wales) Regulations 2005 is made in accordance with:*

*a) y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 16 Mawrth 2005; a*  
*a) the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 16 March 2005; and*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Ebrill 2005. (NDM2391)*  
*b) regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 4 April 2005. (NDM2391)*

*Cynnig (NDM2391): O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2391): For 42, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice

Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Cynllunio a Phrynu Gorfodol 2004 (Cychwyn Rhif 3 a Darpariaethau Canlyniadol a Throsiannol) (Cymru) 2005**  
**Approval of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 (Commencement No. 3 and Consequential and Transitional Provisions (Wales) Order 2005**

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):**  
 Cynigiad fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Deddf Cynllunio a Phrynu Gorfodol 2004 (Cychwyn Rhif 3 a Darpariaethau Canlyniadol a Throsiannol) (Cymru) 2005 y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 16 Mawrth 2005. (NDM2392)*

Cynigiad fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 12 Ebrill 2005 ynghylch y Gorchymyn drafft Gorchymyn Deddf Cynllunio a Phrynu Gorfodol 2004 (Cychwyn Rhif 3 a Darpariaethau Canlyniadol a Throsiannol) (Cymru) 2005; a*

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):**  
 I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 (Commencement No. 3 and Consequential and Transitional Provisions) (Wales) Order 2005 a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 16 March 2005. (NDM2392)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 12 April 2005 in relation to the draft Order the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 (Commencement No. 3 and Consequential and Transitional Provisions) (Wales) Order 2005; and*

2) yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Deddf Cynllunio a Phrynu Gorfodol 2004 (Cychwyn Rhif 3 a Darpariaethau Canlyniadol a Throsiannol) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:

a) y Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 16 Mawrth 2005;

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Ebrill 2005;

c) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Ebrill 2005. (NDM2393)

2) approves that the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 (Commencement No. 3 and Consequential and Transitional Provisions) (Wales) Order 2005 is made in accordance with:

a) the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 16 March 2005;

b) regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 4 April 2005;

c) the memorandum of correction laid in the Table Office on 13 April 2005. (NDM2393)

**David Lloyd:** This Order brings into force further provisions of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 and part 6 of that Act establishes a system of local development plans, which will replace the unitary development plans. The provisions will allow certain local planning authorities to commence work on their local development plans. Planning, as we all know, can make a substantial contribution to sustainable development and, as such, we must ensure that we develop and maintain a planning system that is fair, transparent, accountable, and encourages greater public participation. What steps has the Minister taken to address the concerns voiced in the Local Government and Public Services Committee last week by One Voice Wales that the views of the community councils on planning matters should gain a statutory foothold so that the community is not always ignored on planning issues? How do the local development plans in this Order fit in with the overall vision of the Wales spatial plan? On the Welsh Assembly Government's plan rationalisation strategy—in other words, the attempt to reduce the bewildering number of plans and strategies that currently burden local authorities—what discussions has the Minister had to ensure that the provisions of this Order chime with the aim of rationalisation? With those provisos, Plaid Cymru will support this Order.

**David Lloyd:** Mae'r Gorchymyn hwn yn peri bod darpariaethau pellach Deddf Cynllunio a Phrynu Gorfodol 2004 yn dod i rym ac mae rhan 6 y Ddeddf hon yn sefydlu system o gynlluniau datblygu lleol, system a fydd yn disodli'r cynlluniau datblygu unedol. Bydd y darpariaethau yn caniatáu i awdurdodau cynllunio lleol penodol ddechrau gwaith ar eu cynlluniau datblygu lleol. Gall cynllunio, fel y gwyddom oll, wneud cyfraniad pwysig at ddatblygu cynaliadwy ac, o'r herwydd, rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn llunio ac yn cynnal system gynllunio sydd yn deg, yn dryloyw, yn atebol, ac yn annog mwy o gyfranogaeth gan y cyhoedd. Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cymryd i roi sylw i'r pryderon a leisiodd Un Llais i Gymru yn y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus yr wythnos diwethaf y dylai safbwyntiau'r cynghorau cymuned ar faterion cynllunio gael lle statudol fel na chaiff y gymuned ei hanwybyddu bob amser ynghylch materion cynllunio? Sut y mae'r cynlluniau datblygu lleol yn y Gorchymyn hwn yn cyd-fynd â gweledigaeth gyffredinol cynllun gofodol Cymru? O safbwynt strategaeth ad-drefnu cynlluniau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru—mewn geiriau eraill, yr ymgais i ostwng y nifer ddryslyd o gynlluniau a strategaethau sydd yn faich ar awdurdodau lleol ar hyn o bryd—pa drafodaethau a gafodd y Gweinidog i sicrhau bod darpariaethau'r Gorchymyn hwn yn cyddaro â nod yr ad-drefnu? Gyda'r amodau hyn, bydd Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi'r Gorchymyn hwn.

**Mick Bates:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome the principle of empowerment that

**Mick Bates:** Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn croesawu'r egwyddor a



is embodied in most of this process. We hope that it will lead to greater participation and transparency, and to the ability of local communities to be part of the planning process. As part of that, it is incumbent upon the Minister to give us a little more information on how the community involvement schemes, which are part of the local development plan, will be implemented. I raise that point because it is said that there will not be a significant increase in costs. However, as you must be aware, Minister, informing all community groups and arranging public meetings about parts of the planning process will incur large costs, and I do not see any provision for these additional costs as the local plans are implemented.

The delay in preparing these plans will have a large impact on the EU requirement for strategic environmental assessments. I would like to hear what the Minister is doing to ensure that the local authorities that have not yet started on this process will meet the 2006 deadline, because, if they do not, they will have a significant amount of work to undertake with regard to strategic environmental assessments.

Those questions aside, we welcome the whole process, but we look forward to further details on how it will happen. Dai Lloyd asked about the Wales spatial plan and how the demand for a more predictable planning system, which is at the heart of this process, will be met in terms of the interface between planning guidance such as technical advice note 8—which will appear one day, Minister—and the local plans. Many authorities are waiting to see the interface between the local plans and the Wales spatial plan, and how this drive for predictability in planning will come out of that mix. Could you offer us some guidance on how you see that predictability engaging with the local democratic structures?

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** I will deal with the points individually. One Voice Wales has raised this matter with me and I

ymgorfforir yn y rhan fwyaf o'r broses hon, sef galluogi. Gobeithiwn y bydd yn arwain at ragor o gyfranogaeth a thryloywder, ac at allu cymunedau lleol i fod yn rhan o'r broses gynllunio. Fel rhan o hyn, mae'n ddyletswydd ar y Gweinidog roi inni ychydig yn rhagor o wybodaeth am sut y gweithredir y cynlluniau cynnwys-y-gymuned, sydd yn rhan o'r cynllun datblygu lleol. Codaf y pwynt hwn oherwydd y dywedir na fydd cynnydd sylweddol mewn costau. Fodd bynnag, fel y gwyddoch yn sicr, Weinidog, bydd hysbysu pob grŵp cymunedol a threfnu cyfarfodydd cyhoeddus ynghylch rhannau o'r broses gynllunio yn costio'n sylweddol, ac ni welaf ddarpariaeth ar gyfer y costau ychwanegol hyn wrth i'r cynlluniau lleol gael eu gweithredu.

Bydd yr oedi wrth baratoi'r cynlluniau hyn yn cael effaith fawr ar ofyniad yr UE am asesiadau amgylcheddol strategol. Hoffwn glywed beth y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud i sicrhau y bydd yr awdurdodau lleol sydd heb gychwyn eto ar y broses hon yn glynu wrth y terfyn amser yn 2006, oherwydd, os na wnânt, bydd ganddynt lawer iawn o waith i'w wneud gyda'r asesiadau amgylcheddol strategol.

Gan roi'r cwestiynau hynny o'r neilltu, croesawn yr holl broses, ond edrychwn ymlaen at gael manylion pellach ynghylch sut y bydd yn digwydd. Holodd Dai Lloyd ynghylch cynllun gofodol Cymru a sut y bydd y galw am system gynllunio fwy rhagweladwy, rhywbeth sydd wrth wraidd y broses hon, yn cael ei fodloni o safbwynt y rhyngwyneb rhwng canllawiau cynlluniau megis nodyn cyngor technegol 8—a fydd yn ymddangos ryw ddiwrnod, Weinidog—a'r cynlluniau lleol. Mae llawer o awdurdodau yn aros i weld y rhyngwyneb rhwng y cynlluniau lleol a chynllun gofodol Cymru, a sut y bydd yr ymgyrch hwn i gael rhagweladwyedd ym maes cynllunio yn dod allan o'r cymysgedd hwnnw. A allech gynnig inni ryw arweiniad ynghylch pa fath o gysylltiad a fydd rhwng y rhagweladwyedd hwn a'r strwythurau democrataidd lleol?

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Ymdriniaf â'r pwyntiau fesul un. Mae Un Llais i Gymru wedi codi'r mater hwn gyda

would hope that its voice will be heard in the community involvement scheme process, which is being worked on. It is important that the community councils are heard. Practice varies across Wales as to how community councils are involved in planning decisions and the community involvement scheme will be important in terms of making this clearer.

The Wales spatial plan is statutory and local authorities will need to take it into account when developing their local development plans.

4.00 p.m.

The matter of plan rationalisation—which is not to do with the planning system, but with the structure of local government—is being dealt with by my colleague, Sue Essex. In terms of the implementation and timescale of LDPs and the interface with strategic environmental assessments, it is up to individual local authorities to decide whether to prepare a UDP first, and then move on to an LDP, or whether to move straight to an LDP. Local authorities will be aware of all the timescales that would have to be met when they take that decision. That said, the Order before the National Assembly is a technical one, which Dai Lloyd has, more than competently, introduced.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch i'r Gweinidog am ei ddioreidi arferol.

mi a byddwn yn gobeithio y gwrandewir ar ei lais ym mhroses y cynllun cynnwys-y-gymuned, proses sydd yn cael ei thrin a'i thrafod yn awr. Mae'n bwysig gwrande ar y cynghorau cymuned. Mae'r arfer yn amrywio ledled Cymru o ran sut y caiff cynghorau cymuned eu cynnwys mewn penderfyniadau cynllunio a bydd y cynllun cynnwys-y-gymuned yn bwysig o ran gwneud hyn yn gliriach.

Mae cynllun gofodol Cymru yn statudol a bydd yn rhaid i'r awdurdodau lleol roi ystyriaeth iddo wrth lunio eu cynlluniau datblygu lleol.

Fy nghyd-Weinidog, Sue Essex, sy'n ymdrin â rhesymoli cynlluniau—nad oes a wnelo â'r system gynllunio, ond â strwythur llywodraeth leol. O ran gweithredu'r cynlluniau datblygu lleol a'u hamserlen a'r cysylltiad rhyngddynt ac asesiadau amgylcheddol strategol, mater i'r awdurdodau lleol unigol yw penderfynu a ydynt yn paratoi cynllun datblygu unedol yn gyntaf, ac yna symud ymlaen at gynllun datblygu lleol, ynteu mynd yn syth at gynllun datblygu lleol. Bydd yr awdurdodau lleol yn ymwybodol o'r holl amserlenni y byddai'n rhaid cadw atynt pan fyddant yn gwneud y penderfyniad hwnnw. Wedi dweud hynny, mae'r Gorchymyn gerbron y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn un technegol, y mae Dai Lloyd wedi ei gyflwyno yn hynod o fedrus.

**The Presiding Officer:** I thank the Minister for his customary mischievousness.

*Cynnig (NDM2392): O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2392): For 44, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn

Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2393): O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2393): For 44, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise

Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cymwysterau a Chofrestru Prifathrawon (Cymru)  
 2005  
 Approval of the Head Teachers' Qualifications and Registration (Wales)  
 Regulations 2005**

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 i NDM2394 yn enw David Melding.

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 to NDM2394 in the name of David Melding.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of Head Teachers' Qualifications and Registration (Wales) Regulations 2005 a copy of which was laid in Table on 16 March 2005. (NDM2394)*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Cymwysterau a Chofrestru Prifathrawon (Cymru) 2005 y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 16 Mawrth 2005. (NDM2394)*

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 12 April 2005 in relation to the draft regulations Head Teachers' Qualifications and Registration (Wales) Regulations 2005; and*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 12 Ebrill 2005 ynghylch y Rheoliadau drafft Rheoliadau Cymwysterau a Chofrestru Prifathrawon (Cymru) 2005; a*

*2. approves that Head Teachers' Qualifications and Registration (Wales) Regulations 2005 is made in accordance with:*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Cymwysterau a Chofrestru Prifathrawon (Cymru) 2005 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:*

a) *the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 16 March 2005;*

b) *regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 4 April 2005. (NDM2395)*

Proposals requiring all first-time headteachers to hold the professional qualification have been considered as part of the strategy for raising the quality of school leadership in Wales since 1999. The proposal to make the National Professional Qualification for Headship mandatory in Wales by 2005 was first set out in the 1999 Green Paper, 'The Best for Teaching and Learning'. Two national consultation exercises were conducted, in September 2002 and September 2004, which provided an opportunity to seek the views of the teaching profession and key stakeholders in response to the proposals. Eighty-one per cent of respondents to the consultation conducted in 2002 were in favour of the implementation of the mandatory NPQH qualification in Wales from 1 September 2005. Therefore, in light of that consultation response we announced our intention to introduce that qualification. In response to the more recent consultation, in September 2004, 91 per cent of respondents supported the introduction of the mandatory NPQH, and 96 per cent of people supported the introduction from September 2005. Over 70 per cent of the responses were from deputy headteachers and school leaders—those with most interest in this—and the regulations before you today will introduce a nationally recognised qualification to ensure the provision of consistent professional development of aspiring headteachers. Over 650 teachers currently hold the NPQH; approximately 197 have already secured headship appointments. On the basis of current throughput on the NPQH programme, it is predicted that there will be up to 1,500 NPQH graduates by 2010, which will ensure a sufficient pool of NPQH-holders to meet future recruitment demands. The NPQH became a mandatory requirement in England in April last year, and we now have regulations that also recognise the equivalence of the NPQH in Wales.

a) *y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 16 Mawrth 2005;*

b) *yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Ebrill 2005. (NDM2395)*

Mae cynigion sy'n ei gwneud yn ofynnol i bob prifathro sy'n cael ei benodi am y tro cyntaf feddu ar y cymhwyster proffesiynol wedi cael eu hystyried fel rhan o'r strategaeth i godi ansawdd arweinyddiaeth ysgolion yng Nghymru ers 1999. Cafodd y cynnig i wneud y Cymhwyster Proffesiynol Cenedlaethol ar gyfer Prifathrawiaeth yn orfodol yng Nghymru erbyn 2005 ei nodi gyntaf ym Mhapur Gwyrdd 1999, 'The Best for Teaching and Learning'. Cynhaliwyd dau ymarferiad ymgynghori cenedlaethol, ym mis Medi 2002 a mis Medi 2004, a roddodd gyfle i gael barn y proffesiwn dysgu a rhanddeiliaid allweddol mewn ymateb i'r cynigion. Yr oedd 81 y cant o'r rhai a ymatebodd i'r ymgynghoriad a gynhaliwyd yn 2002 o blaid gweithredu'r cymhwyster CPCP gorfodol yng Nghymru o 1 Medi 2005. Felly, yng ngoleuni'r ymateb i'r ymgynghoriad hwnnw cyhoeddassom ein bwriad i gyflwyno'r cymhwyster hwnnw. Mewn ymateb i'r ymgynghoriad mwy diweddar, ym mis Medi 2004, yr oedd 91 y cant o'r rhai a ymatebodd o blaid cyflwyno'r CPCP gorfodol, ac yr oedd 96 y cant o blaid ei gyflwyno o fis Medi 2005. Daeth dros 70 y cant o'r ymatebion oddi wrth ddirprwy brifathrawon ac arweinwyr ysgolion—y rhai sydd â'r diddordeb mwyaf yn hyn—a bydd y rheoliadau sydd ger eich bron heddiw yn cyflwyno cymhwyster a gydnabyddir yn genedlaethol i sicrhau bod datblygiad proffesiynol cyson yn cael ei ddarparu i'r rhai sy'n awyddus i ddod yn brifathrawon. Mae gan dros 650 o athrawon y CPCP ar hyn o bryd, ac mae tua 197 eisoes wedi cael eu penodi i brifathrawiaeth. Ar sail faint sy'n mynd drwy raglen CPCP ar hyn o bryd, rhagwelir y bydd hyd at 1,500 o raddedigion CPCP erbyn 2010, a fydd yn sicrhau cronfa ddigonol o ddeiliaid CPCP i ateb galwadau recriwtio'r dyfodol. Daeth y CPCP yn ofyniad gorfodol yn Lloegr fis Ebrill y llynedd, ac yn awr mae gennym reoliadau sydd hefyd yn cydnabod bod y CPCP yn gyfwerth yng Nghymru.

In light of the move towards the mandatory NPQH, in January this year I announced an additional £1.55 million to support the national headship development programme during 2005-06. This includes £750,000 to fully support the next NPQH cohort from January 2006. The amendment tabled to this motion is unnecessary, in light of the detailed consultation with professional associations in the move towards the mandatory NPQH. You can see from the figures that were presented to committee, that there is overwhelming support for this move.

In conclusion, these regulations will clearly define the standard entry requirements for all future headship appointments in Wales. They will build upon the positive impact of the NPQH on the standard of school leadership in Wales.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call Janet Ryder.

**Janet Ryder:** I appreciate what you say about a lot of consultation being carried out and there being a lot support for this, and this has—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I am sorry; I was preoccupied with the electronics. I call Mark Isherwood to propose amendment 1 in the name of David Melding.

**Mark Isherwood:** I propose amendment 1 to NDM2394 in the name of David Melding. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*recommends a delay in the implementation of the National Professional Qualification for Headship until it has carried out further consultation with headteachers' organisations.*

As always, I defer to your preoccupations, Presiding Officer.

I propose this amendment not for party political purposes, but to reflect concerns expressed to me by the Secondary Heads Association Cymru.

Yng ngoleuni'r symudiad tuag at y CPCP gorfodol, ym mis Ionawr eleni cyhoeddais £1.55 miliwn ychwanegol i roi cymorth i'r rhaglen genedlaethol datblygu prifathrawiaeth yn ystod 2005-06. Mae hyn yn cynnwys £750,000 i roi cymorth llawn i'r garfan CPCP nesaf o fis Ionawr 2006. Mae'r gwelliant a gyflwynwyd i'r cynnig hwn yn ddianghenraid, yng ngoleuni'r ymgynghori manwl gyda chymdeithasau proffesiynol yn y symudiad tuag at y CPCP gorfodol. Gallwch weld oddi wrth y ffigurau a gyflwynwyd i'r pwyllgor fod cefnogaeth gref iawn i'r symudiad hwn.

I gloi, bydd y rheoliadau hyn yn diffinio'n glir y gofynion derbyn safonol ar gyfer pob penodiad i brifathrawiaeth yng Nghymru i'r dyfodol. Byddant yn adeiladu ar yr effaith gadarnhaol y mae'r CPCP wedi ei chael ar safon arweinyddiaeth ysgolion yng Nghymru.

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf ar Janet Ryder.

**Janet Ryder:** Yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi'r hyn a ddywedwch fod llawer o ymgynghori wedi digwydd a bod llawer o gefnogaeth i hyn, a bod i hyn—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, yr oedd yr electroneg wedi mynd â'm sylw. Galwaf ar Mark Isherwood i gynnig gwelliant 1 yn enw David Melding.

**Mark Isherwood:** Cynigiaf welliant 1 i NDM2394 yn enw David Melding. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn argymhell gohirio gweithredu'r Cymhwyster Proffesiynol Cenedlaethol ar gyfer Prifathrawiaeth hyd nes y bydd wedi ymgynghori ymhellach gyda chymdeithasau penaethiaid ysgol.*

Fel y byddaf yn gwneud bob amser, ildiaf i'r hyn sy'n mynd â'ch sylw, Lywydd.

Cynigiaf y gwelliant hwn nid yn unig at ddibenion gwleidyddol o safbwynt plaid, ond i adlewyrchu pryderon a fynegwyd wrthyf gan Gymdeithas Prifathrawon Uwchradd Cymru.

As many Members will no doubt highlight if I do not mention this myself, many Conservatives in England have proposed the abolition of the freestanding National College for School Leadership, which is the sole provider of the National Professional Qualification for Headship there, but I stress that all the savings would then be invested straight back into the education front line. However, Wales has developed its own provision, via Cardiff University, working in partnership with the University of Wales, Bangor and the University of Glamorgan, which we consider to be a cost effective and practical solution for Wales.

Contrary to statements made by the First Minister, I emphasise that a future UK Conservative Government will increase the Welsh block grant received from the UK Treasury year on year, ensuring that Wales receives its full share of the increased spending that the Conservative Party promises for education and other key public services. There would not be a penny of cuts in the education budget and there would be 4 per cent budget increases year on year.

Of course, thousands of highly capable and effective headteachers will have been appointed prior to this headship qualification becoming mandatory for new headteachers and, clearly, having the qualification does not mean that someone should be appointed as a headteacher if he or she does not also have practical management experience. The secondary heads association has raised several important questions with me on this. It highlights that there were only 74 responses to the Welsh Assembly Government's consultation exercise on this qualification, which included just one governing body, a tiny sample of 28 headteachers, and hardly any local education authorities. There is, therefore, virtually no response from the people who employ headteachers.

As we heard, the consultation reports an 81 per cent response in favour of the mandatory qualification. However, only 10 per cent of schools were consulted, representing just 22 secondary schools. Can the Minister tell us

Fel y bydd llawer o Aelodau yn sicr o bwysleisio oni chyfeiriaf at hyn fy hun, mae llawer o Geidwadwyr yn Lloegr wedi cynnig dileu'r National College for School Leadership, coleg ar ei ben ei hun a'r unig un sy'n darparu'r Cymhwyster Proffesiynol Cenedlaethol ar gyfer Prifathrawiaeth yno, ond pwysleisiaf y byddai'r holl arbedion yn cael eu buddsoddi'n ôl ar unwaith mewn addysg rheng flaen. Fodd bynnag, mae Cymru wedi datblygu ei darpariaeth ei hun, drwy Brifysgol Caerdydd, yn gweithio mewn partneriaeth â Phrifysgol Cymru, Bangor a Phrifysgol Morgannwg, sydd yn ein barn ni yn ateb cost effeithiol ac ymarferol i Gymru.

Yn groes i'r datganiadau a wnaethpwyd gan y Prif Weinidog, pwysleisiaf y bydd Llywodraeth Geidwadol ar y DU i'r dyfodol yn cynyddu'r grant bloc i Gymru a dderbynnir oddi wrth Drysorlys y DU o flwyddyn i flwyddyn, gan sicrhau bod Cymru'n cael ei chyfran lawn o'r gwariant uwch y mae'r Blaid Geidwadol yn ei addo ar gyfer addysg a gwasanaethau cyhoeddus allweddol eraill. Ni fyddai ceiniog yn cael ei chwtdogi oddi ar y gyllideb addysg a byddai'r gyllideb yn cynyddu 4 y cant o flwyddyn i flwyddyn.

Wrth gwrs, bydd miloedd o brifathrawon hynod alluog ac effeithiol wedi cael eu penodi cyn i'r cymhwyster prifathrawiaeth hwn ddod yn orfodol i brifathrawon newydd ac, yn amlwg, nid yw meddu ar y cymhwyster yn golygu y dylai rhywun gael ei benodi'n brifathro os nad oes ganddo ef neu ganddi hi brofiad rheoli ymarferol hefyd. Mae cymdeithas y prifathrawon uwchradd wedi codi sawl cwestiwn pwysig gyda mi am hyn. Mae'n tynnu sylw at y ffaith mai dim ond 74 o ymatebion a gafwyd i ymarferiad ymgynghori Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru am y cymhwyster hwn, yn cynnwys dim ond un corff llywodraethu, sampl bach iawn o 28 o brifathrawon, a dim awdurdodau addysg lleol bron iawn. Felly, prin bod dim ymateb wedi dod i law oddi wrth y bobl sy'n cyflogi prifathrawon.

Fel y clywsom, mae'r ymgynghoriad yn adrodd bod 81 y cant wedi ymateb o blaid y cymhwyster gorfodol. Fodd bynnag, dim ond â 10 y cant o'r ysgolion yr ymgynghorwyd, sef dim ond 22 o ysgolion uwchradd. A all y

what the response level from headteachers in that sector was? Other consultees include National Professional Qualification for Headship trainers and candidates and representatives of the Wales National Professional Qualification for Headship Centre, all of whom have a perfectly legitimate interest in the qualification's being developed but who are not involved in headship selection. However, I am told that many of the candidates who have recently begun or completed the course are nowhere near ready for headship. They would not be shortlisted in a current field because they have not even reached deputy headship and do not possess the essential senior leadership experience needed to tackle such a post.

It is a real cause for concern that many of the participants in this training are only heads of department or equivalent, and, according to the secondary heads association, the criteria for admission onto the course needs to be changed. One secondary headteacher told me that he had recently witnessed this first-hand when processing applications for an assistant headship post, which is two levels below headship. A significant number of the candidates who were not even shortlisted for this post were on the National Professional Qualification for Headship course or had completed the qualification, but they had no senior management experience. That makes no sense. Making difficult judgments about a whole host of issues is a key task faced by headteachers every day. It is impossible to do that without a wide spectrum of experience to draw upon.

The secondary heads association tells me that schools report real difficulties in attracting a strong field for headship appointments and it believes that it would be sensible to wait for another year until there are enough plausible candidates who have this qualification. The phased implementation model is a sensible way forward and the association suggests that the 7 per cent who were in favour of this may

Gweinidog ddweud wrthym beth oedd lefel yr ymateb oddi wrth brifathrawon yn y sector hwnnw? Mae'r ymgynghoreion eraill yn cynnwys hyfforddwyr ac ymgeiswyr y Cymhwyster Proffesiynol Cenedlaethol ar gyfer Prifathrawiaeth a chynrychiolwyr y Ganolfan Cymhwyster Proffesiynol Cenedlaethol ar gyfer Prifathrawiaeth yng Nghymru, sydd i gyd â diddordeb cwbl ddilys mewn gweld y cymhwyster yn cael ei ddatblygu ond nad oes a wnelont â dethol prifathrawon. Fodd bynnag, dywedir wrthyf fod llawer o'r ymgeiswyr sydd wedi dechrau ar y cwrs neu wedi'i gwblhau yn ddiweddar ymhell iawn o fod yn barod ar gyfer prifathrawiaeth. Ni chaent eu rhoi ar restr fer ar hyn o bryd gan nad ydynt hyd yn oed wedi cyrraedd dirprwy brifathrawiaeth ac nad ydynt yn meddu ar y profiad hanfodol fel uwch arweinwyr sy'n ofynnol i fynd i'r afael â swydd o'r fath.

Mae'n peri pryder gwirioneddol nad yw llawer o'r rhai sy'n cymryd rhan yn yr hyfforddiant hwn ond yn benaethiaid adran neu gyfwerth, ac, yn ôl cymdeithas y prifathrawon uwchradd, mae angen newid y meini prawf ar gyfer derbyn ymgeiswyr ar y cwrs. Dywedodd un prifathro uwchradd wrthyf ei fod wedi bod yn dyst i hyn ei hun yn ddiweddar wrth brosesu ceisiadau am swydd pennaeth cynorthwyol, sydd ddwy lefel yn is na phrifathrawiaeth. Yr oedd nifer arwyddocaol o'r rhai na chawsant hyd yn oed eu rhoi ar y rhestr fer ar gyfer y swydd ar y cwrs Cymhwyster Proffesiynol Cenedlaethol ar gyfer Prifathrawiaeth neu wedi cwblhau'r cymhwyster, ond nid oedd ganddynt ddim profiad fel uwch reolwyr. Nid yw hynny'n gwneud synnwyr. Mae gwneud penderfyniadau anodd am amrywiaeth eang o faterion yn dasg allweddol a wynebwr gan brifathrawon bob dydd. Mae'n amhosibl gwneud hynny heb rychwant eang o brofiad i ddibynnu arno.

Dywed cymdeithas y prifathrawon uwchradd wrthyf fod ysgolion yn cael anawsterau gwirioneddol wrth ddenu ymgeiswyr cryf ar gyfer penodiadau prifathrawiaeth ac mae'n credu mai doeth fyddai disgwyl am flwyddyn arall hyd nes bod digon o ymgeiswyr credadwy â'r cymhwyster hwn. Mae'r model gweithredu fesul cam yn ffordd synhwyrol ymlaen ac mae'r gymdeithas yn awgrymu ei



well have been the heads and governors who responded to the consultation—and who were among the minority to be asked. In the longer term, the secondary heads association is strongly in favour of a mandatory qualification, but it must be emphasised that it believes that, before it is implemented, the deeply flawed selection procedures need to be sorted out.

4.10 p.m.

In supporting this request from our front-line professionals, we would also gain the opportunity to consider concerns expressed to me by the National Association of Headteachers Cymru on different matters, that applications to enrol on this course have been refused due to a lack of funding, despite pledges of more funding by the Minister, and that current headteachers who do not have the qualification for headship may be wrongly excluded from shortlists for new positions because of confusion among school governors who sometimes list this as an essential qualification nonetheless.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. We are out of time. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘Hear, hear’.]

Order. It is discourteous to respond in that way. I was merely reminding Mark Isherwood that his five minutes were up. If you would like to bring your remarks to a tidy close, Mark, that is fine.

**Mark Isherwood:** Let us therefore put aside party-political point scoring on this issue in the week before a general election and listen to the front-line professionals; I was speaking their words, not my own.

**Janet Ryder:** Mark’s points were, in some respects, well-made, in that you must, when introducing a new professional qualification, get the balance right between those who apply for a job with the new qualification alone and those who have a great deal of experience of doing that job and managing schools, which is now a complex issue.

bod yn bosibl mai’r prifathrawon a’r llywodraethwyr a ymatebodd i’r ymgynghoriad oedd y 7 y cant a oedd o blaid hyn—ac a oedd ymysg y lleiafrif a gafodd eu holi. Yn y tymor hwy, mae cymdeithas y prifathrawon uwchradd yn gryf o blaid cymhwyster gorfodol, ond rhaid pwysleisio ei bod yn credu bod angen rhoi trefn ar y gweithdrefnau dethol hynod ddiffygiol cyn iddo gael ei weithredu.

Wrth gefnogi’r cais hwn gan ein gweithwyr proffesiynol yn y rheng flaen, byddem hefyd yn cael y cyfle i ystyried pryderon a fynegwyd wrthyf gan Gymdeithas Genedlaethol Prifathrawon Cymru ar faterion gwahanol, fod ceisiadau i gofrestru ar y cwrs hwn wedi cael eu gwrthod oherwydd diffyg cyllid, er gwaethaf addewidion o ragor o gyllid gan y Gweinidog, ac y gallai rhai sy’n brifathrawon ar hyn o bryd nad ydynt yn meddu ar y cymhwyster ar gyfer prifathrawiaeth gael eu gadael oddi ar restrau byr am swyddi newydd yn annheg oherwydd dryswch ymysg llywodraethwyr ysgolion sydd weithiau’n rhestru’r cymhwyster hwn fel un hanfodol.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Daeth eich amser i ben. [AELODAU’R CYNULLIAD: ‘Clywch, clywch’.]

Trefn. Mae’n anghwrtais ymateb felly. Nid oeddwn ond yn atgoffa Mark Isherwood fod ei bum munud wedi gorffen. Os hoffech ddod â’ch sylwadau i ben yn daclus, Mark, mae hynny’n iawn.

**Mark Isherwood:** Gadewch inni felly roi heibio sgorio pwyntiau gwleidyddol pleidiol ar y mater hwn yn yr wythnos cyn etholiad cyffredinol a gwranddo ar y gweithwyr proffesiynol yn y rheng flaen; eu geiriau hwy yr oeddwn yn eu llefaru, nid fy rhai i.

**Janet Ryder:** Yr oedd pwyntiau Mark, mewn rhai ffyrdd, wedi eu gwneud yn dda, yn yr ystyr bod yn rhaid ichi, wrth gyflwyno cymhwyster proffesiynol newydd, gael y cydbwysedd yn iawn rhwng y rhai sy’n ymgeisio am swydd gyda dim ond y cymhwyster newydd a’r rhai sydd â llawer iawn o brofiad o wneud y swydd honno a

rheoli ysgolion, sydd yn awr yn fater cymhleth.

I will highlight an aspect upon which Mark touched briefly at the end, which is the problem of funding. The Minister said that she made additional funding available towards the back end of the financial year to enable a few more people to enrol on this course, but, in some areas, many teachers who were found to be eligible for the course received letters stating that they could not enrol because the funding was not available. While that funding is distributed among the counties according to a formula, that problem will still exist. I would like some clarification from the Minister as to whether the money that she made available in the last financial year, and money that will be made available in the next financial year, will be distributed according to the number of teachers who are found eligible to enrol on this course. If not, we could find ourselves with a shortage of teachers. If you look at the demography of the profession, in the next five to 10 years, we will lose many well-qualified staff. We need a large pool of highly qualified staff to apply for the posts that will become available, and, therefore, funding must be attached to those who apply for the course and who are found to be eligible, rather than being distributed among the counties according to a formula.

**Peter Black:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats are happy to support these regulations. It is important, as Janet Ryder said, that the funding is available, and the Minister has given assurances on the additional money. However, it is important that funding is available to enable people who are eligible to enrol on this course, and who meet the criteria, to do so. I do not share Mark Isherwood's reservations about this. Clearly, the secondary heads association has some valid points, but when a couple of consultations result in an overwhelming response in favour of regulations, you cannot keep consulting until you get the result that Mark Isherwood wants. In this particular instance, the case has been made, not just for the mandatory qualification, but for its introduction at this stage. It should be introduced so that the teachers who are eligible to apply for headships are in place,

Tynnaf sylw at agwedd y cyfeiriodd Mark ati'n fyr ar y diwedd, sef problem cyllid. Dywedodd y Gweinidog ei bod wedi darparu cyllid ychwanegol tua diwedd y flwyddyn ariannol i alluogi ychydig rhagor o bobl i gofrestru ar y cwrs hwn, ond, mewn rhai ardaloedd, derbyniodd llawer o athrawon y canfuwyd eu bod yn gymwys ar gyfer y cwrs lythron yn datgan na allent gofrestru am nad oedd y cyllid ar gael. Tra bydd y cyllid hwnnw yn cael ei ddsbarthu ymysg y siroedd ar sail fformiwlâ, bydd y broblem honno yn dal i fodoli. Hoffwn gael eglurhad gan y Gweinidog pa un a fydd yr arian a ddarparodd yn y flwyddyn ariannol ddiwethaf, a'r arian a gaiff ei ddarparu yn y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf, yn cael ei ddsbarthu yn ôl nifer yr athrawon y canfyddir eu bod yn gymwys i gofrestru ar y cwrs hwn. Os na fydd, gallem ganfod bod gennym brinder athrawon. Os edrychwch ar ddemograffeg y proffesiwn, yn ystod y pump i 10 mlynedd nesaf, byddwn yn colli llawer o staff sydd â chymwysterau da. Mae angen cronfa fawr o staff â chymwysterau uchel arnom i ymgeisio am y swyddi fydd ar gael, ac, felly, rhaid darparu'r cyllid i'r rhai sy'n gwneud cais am y cwrs ac y canfyddir eu bod yn gymwys, yn hytrach na'i ddsbarthu rhwng y siroedd ar sail fformiwlâ.

**Peter Black:** Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn falch o gefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn. Mae'n bwysig, fel y dywedodd Janet Ryder, fod y cyllid ar gael, ac mae'r Gweinidog wedi rhoi sicrwydd ynghylch yr arian ychwanegol. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig bod cyllid ar gael i alluogi pobl sy'n gymwys i gofrestru ar y cwrs hwn, ac sy'n bodloni'r meini prawf, i wneud hynny. Nid wyf yn rhannu amheuan Mark Isherwood am hyn. Yn amlwg, mae gan gymdeithas y prifathrawon uwchradd rai pwyntiau dilys, ond pan fydd dau ymgynghoriad yn arwain at ymateb cryf iawn o blaid rheoliadau, ni allwch ddal ati i ymgynghori nes cael y canlyniad y mae Mark Isherwood yn dymuno ei gael. Yn yr enghraifft neilltuoel hon, mae'r ddadl wedi cael ei rhoi, nid dim ond o blaid y cymhwyster gorfodol, ond i'w gyflwyno ar hyn o bryd. Dylai gael ei gyflwyno fel bod yr athrawon sy'n gymwys i wneud cais am

and so that they can add to the qualification that they will gain from this course the experience that they need, as Mark also mentioned, to undertake the job of being a headteacher.

Mark is right that it is about experience, but it is also about training and qualifications—the two must go hand in hand. You cannot say, ‘well, we have to wait until experienced people become available’. Clearly, experience can only be built up, and we must make opportunities available for people who have the experience to receive the training, and for people who have the training to gain the experience to become headteachers. For that reason, we will not support the amendment, but we will support the regulations. I look forward to the Minister’s response to the issues that Janet Ryder raised in relation to funding to ensure that we do not only have a formulaic distribution, but that money will be made available so that people who are eligible for this course will be able to enrol on it, regardless of where they are presently situated.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** It is worth re-emphasising that the agreement to consult with 10 per cent of those eligible was supported by all Assembly parties in terms of reducing the workload on stakeholders. That has been strongly supported by the school workload advisory panel. We publish all consultation responses, therefore, you can see who responded to that. The list of respondents to consultation published in March includes a large number of headteachers. That contributed to the high percentage of people who supported the mandatory qualification.

I was involved in the ceremonies to issue the National Professional Qualification for Headship certificates, where I met those who had participated. Almost all of them said that it was the hardest thing that they had done. However, they found it extremely beneficial and the evaluation suggests that it is extremely effective in terms of contributing to the school leadership and school improvement agenda. This is why the

brifathrawiaeth yn yr ysgolion yn barod, ac er mwyn iddynt allu ychwanegu at y cymhwyster y byddant yn ei ennill drwy’r cwrs hwn y profiad y mae ei angen arnynt, fel y crybwyllodd Mark hefyd, i ymgymryd â’r gwaith o fod yn brifathro.

Mae Mark yn iawn bod profiad yn bwysig, ond mae hyfforddiant a chymwysterau hefyd yn bwysig—mae’r ddau beth yn mynd law yn llaw. Ni allwch ddweud, ‘wel, rhaid inni ddisgwyl nes bydd pobl brofiadol ar gael’. Yn amlwg, mae’n rhaid magu profiad, a rhaid inni ddarparu cyfleoedd i bobl sydd â’r profiad i gael yr hyfforddiant, ac i’r bobl sydd â’r hyfforddiant i fagu’r profiad i ddod yn brifathrawon. Am y rheswm hwnnw, ni fyddwn yn cefnogi’r gwelliant, ond byddwn yn cefnogi’r rheoliadau. Edrychaf ymlaen at ymateb y Gweinidog i’r materion a godwyd gan Janet Ryder mewn perthynas â chyllid i sicrhau nad ydym yn cael dosbarthiad ar sail fformiwla yn unig, ond y bydd arian yn cael ei ddarparu fel bod y bobl sy’n gymwys ar gyfer y cwrs hwn yn gallu cofrestru arno, ni waith ymhle y maent wedi’u lleoli ar hyn o bryd.

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Mae’n werth ailbwyseisio bod y cytundeb i ymgynghori gyda 10 y cant o’r rhai a oedd yn gymwys wedi’i gefnogi gan bob un o bleidiau’r Cynulliad o ran ysgafnhau’r llwyth gwaith ar randdeiliaid. Mae hynny wedi’i gefnogi’n gryf gan y panel cynghori ar lwyth gwaith ysgolion. Yr ydym yn cyhoeddi’r holl ymatebion i’r ymgynghoriad, felly, gallwch weld pwy a ymatebodd i hynny. Mae rhestr o’r rhai a ymatebodd i’r ymgynghoriad a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Mawrth yn cynnwys nifer fawr o benaethiaid. Cyfrannodd hynny at y ganran uchel o bobl a oedd o blaid y cymhwyster gorfodol.

Yr oeddwn yn rhan o’r seremonïau i rannu tystysgrifau’r Cymhwyster Proffesiynol Cenedlaethol ar gyfer Prifathrawiaeth, lle y cyfarfûm â’r rhai a oedd wedi cymryd rhan. Dywedodd bron pob un mai hyn oedd y peth anhawsaf iddynt ei wneud. Fodd bynnag, yr oeddent wedi’i gael yn hynod fuddiol ac mae’r gwerthusiad yn awgrymu ei fod yn eithriadol effeithiol o ran cyfrannu at arweinyddiaeth yr ysgol a’r agenda i wella

committee supported the proposal in the first place. I point out that I gave the guarantee to the committee at the time that funding would be available for all eligible applicants. For Janet Ryder's benefit, so that she can hear me state for the third time, I repeat that funding is available for all eligible applicants. She can check this record, just as she can check committee records now that we have a full record of committee proceedings, and I am pleased that that is the case.

I agree with Peter Black's contribution. We must ensure that we provide the right opportunities for teachers in the future. We are looking at standardising entry requirements to ensure equity during the NPQH recruitment process. In light of current practice in Northern Ireland and Scotland, we intend to consult on the possibility of requiring all candidates to have either reached the threshold or have at least five years' teaching experience before they can undertake an NPQH.

Again, I found it difficult to listen to some of Mark Isherwood's remarks that implied that the teachers of Wales were not able to deliver effectively on this agenda. The teachers of Wales undertake their jobs effectively. The NPQH gives them a chance to demonstrate to all future governing bodies that they are utterly professional and are ready to take on the leadership task, which is why I ask all Members to reject amendment 1 and support the regulations.

ysgolion. Dyna pam y cefnogodd y pwyllgor y cynnig yn y lle cyntaf. Hoffwn sôn fy mod wedi gwarantu i'r pwyllgor ar y pryd y byddai cyllid ar gael i bob ymgeisydd cymwys. Er mwyn Janet Ryder, fel y gall fy nghlywed yn dweud hyn am y trydydd tro, ailadroddaf fod cyllid ar gael i bob ymgeisydd cymwys. Gall gadarnhau'r cofnod hwn, fel y gall hefyd gadarnhau cofnodion y pwyllgor gan fod gennym bellach gofnod llawn o drafodion pwyllgorau, ac yr wyf yn falch bod hynny'n digwydd.

Cytunaf â chyfraniad Peter Black. Rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn darparu'r cyfleoedd iawn i athrawon yn y dyfodol. Yr ydym yn ystyried safoni'r gofynion derbyn i sicrhau tegwch yn ystod y broses o recriwtio ar gyfer y Cymhwyster Proffesiynol Cenedlaethol ar gyfer Prifathrawiaeth. Yng ngoleuni'r arfer presennol yng Ngogledd Iwerddon a'r Alban, bwriadwn ymgynghori ar y posibilrwydd o'i gwneud yn ofynnol i bob ymgeisydd naill ai fod wedi cyrraedd y trothwy neu fod ganddynt bum mlynedd o brofiad dysgu o leiaf cyn ymgeisio am y Cymhwyster Proffesiynol Cenedlaethol mewn Prifathrawiaeth.

Eto, yr oeddwn yn ei chael yn anodd gwrandao ar rai o sylwadau Mark Isherwood a awgrymai nad oedd athrawon Cymru yn gallu cyflawni'n effeithiol yng nghyswllt yr agenda hon. Mae athrawon Cymru yn gwneud eu gwaith yn effeithiol. Mae'r cymhwyster hwn yn rhoi cyfle iddynt ddangos i bob corff llywodraethu yn y dyfodol eu bod yn gwbl broffesiynol ac yn barod i ysgwyddo'r gwaith o arwain, a dyna pam y gofynnaf i bob Aelod wrthod gwelliant 1 a chefnogi'r rheoliadau.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 12, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 33.*

*Amendment 1: For 12, Abstain 0, Against 33.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM2394): O blaid 40, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.*  
*Motion (NDM2394): For 40, Abstain 5, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny

Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Melding, David  
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2395): O blaid 39, Ymatal 6, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2395): For 39, Abstain 6, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Melding, David  
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

4.20 p.m.

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Ymddygiad Gwrthgymdeithasol 2003  
(Cychwyn Rhif 4) (Cymru) 2005, Rheoliadau Tenantiaethau Isradd (Adolygu  
Penderfyniadau) (Cymru) 2005, Rheoliadau Tenantiaethau Diogel  
(Hysbysiadau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2005**

**Approval of the Anti Social Behaviour Act 2003 (Commencement No. 4) (Wales)  
Order 2005, the Demoted Tenancies (Review of Decisions) (Wales) Regulations  
2005, and the Secure Tenancies (Notices) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations  
2005**

**Y Llywydd:** Cynigir trafod y tair eitem nesaf o fusnes ynghyd, gyda phleidleisiau ar wahân. A oes gwrthwynebiad? Gwelaf nad oes neb yn gwrthwynebu.

**The Presiding Officer:** It has been proposed that the next three items of business be debated together, with votes taken separately. Do Members object to this? I see that no-one objects.

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Anti-social Behaviour Act 2003 (Commencement No.4) (Wales) Order 2005, a copy of which was laid in Table on 12 April 2005. (NDM2396)*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Deddf Ymddygiad Gwrthgymdeithasol 2003 (Cychwyn Rhif 4) (Cymru) 2005, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 12 Ebrill 2005. (NDM2396)*

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 19 April, 2005 in relation to the draft Order the Anti-social Behaviour Act 2003 (Commencement No.4) (Wales) Order 2005; and*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 19 Ebrill, 2005 mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft Gorchymyn Deddf Ymddygiad Gwrthgymdeithasol 2003 (Cychwyn Rhif 4) (Cymru) 2005; a*

*2. approves that the Anti-social Behaviour Act 2003 (Commencement No. 4) (Wales) Order 2005 is made in accordance with the*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Deddf Ymddygiad Gwrthgymdeithasol 2003 (Cychwyn Rhif 4) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael ei*

*draft Order laid in the Table Office on 12 April 2005. (NDM2397)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Demoted Tenancies (Review of Decisions) (Wales) Regulations 2005, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 12 April 2005. (NDM2398)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 19 April 2005 in relation to the draft regulations the Demoted Tenancies (Review of Decisions) (Wales) Regulations 2005; and*

*2. approves that the Demoted Tenancies (Review of Decisions) (Wales) Regulations 2005 is made in accordance with:*

*a) the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 12 April 2005;*

*b) regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 12 April 2005;*

*c) the memorandum of correction laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 19 April 2005. (NDM2399)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Secure Tenancies (Notices) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2005, a copy of which was laid in Table on 12 April 2005. (NDM2400)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 19 April, 2005 in relation to the draft regulations the*

*wneud yn unol â'r Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 12 Ebrill 2005. (NDM2397)*

Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Tenantiaethau Isradd (Adolygu Penderfyniadau) (Cymru) 2005, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 12 Ebrill 2005. (NDM2398)*

Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 19 Ebrill 2005 mewn perthynas â'r rheoliadau drafft Rheoliadau Tenantiaethau Isradd (Adolygu Penderfyniadau) (Cymru) 2005; a*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Tenantiaethau Isradd (Adolygu Penderfyniadau) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:*

*a) y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 12 Ebrill 2005;*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 12 Ebrill 2005;*

*c) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 19 Ebrill 2005. (NDM2399)*

Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Tenantiaethau Diogel (Hysbysiadau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2005, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 12 Ebrill 2005. (NDM2400)*

Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 19 Ebrill, 2005 mewn perthynas â'r rheoliadau drafft*



*Secure Tenancies (Notices) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2005; and*

2. *approves that the Secure Tenancies (Notices) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2005 is made in accordance with:*

a) *the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 12 April 2005;*

b) *regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 12 April 2005. (NDM2401)*

Items 6, 7 and 8 bring in the remaining housing provisions of the Anti-social Behaviour Act 2003. The Orders, and the guidance which will be considered separately in Plenary on 10 May, have been before the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee. I thank the Business Committee for its help and assistance, particularly regarding the guidance which we will be taking later on. The current order will bring into force section 12, the remainder of section 14 and schedule 1, section 15. I commend the motions to Members.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Fel y gwyddoch, mae gennym gryn bryderon am y rheoliadau hyn. Gwnaethom godi rhai ohonynt yn y pwyllgor. Er ein bod yn deall pam maent yn cael eu cyflwyno, cyfyd nifer o gwestiynau ynghylch y ffordd y byddant yn cael eu gweithredu a'u defnyddio. Yr ydym am gael sicrwydd gennych y caiff y rheoliadau eu gweithredu mewn ffordd gyfrifol heb ormod o frwdfrydedd ac ymdrech, os gallaf ddefnyddio'r geiriau hynny.

Mae gan rai grwpiau, megis Liberty, Undeb y Swyddogion Prawf a'r Howard League for Penal Reform, bryderon mawr ynghylch y ffordd y caiff y gorchmynion hyn eu defnyddio. Teimlant eu bod yn cael eu defnyddio i ymdrin â chanlyniadau'r broblem yn hytrach na'r broblem ei hun, a bod perygl y cânt eu defnyddio i gael gwared ar deuluoedd sy'n creu problemau, yn hytrach na'u bod yn mynd i'r afael â'r problemau sy'n arwain at yr ymddygiad hwnnw yn y lle cyntaf.

*Rheoliadau Tenantiaethau Diogel (Hysbysiadau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2005; a*

2. *yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Tenantiaethau Diogel (Hysbysiadau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:*

a) *y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 12 Ebrill 2005;*

b) *yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 12 Ebrill 2005. (NDM2401)*

Mae eitemau 6, 7 ac 8 yn cyflwyno gweddill y darpariaethau tai o dan Ddeddf Ymddygiad Gwrthgymdeithasol 2003. Mae'r Gorchmynion, a'r canllawiau a ystyrir ar wahân mewn Cyfarfod Llawn ar 10 Mai, wedi bod gerbron y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio. Diolchaf i'r Pwyllgor Busnes am ei gymorth a'i gynhorthwy, yn enwedig ynghylch y canllawiau a gyflwynir yn nes ymlaen. O dan y gorchymyn presennol bydd adran 12, gweddill adran 14 ac atodlen 1, adran 15 yn dod i rym. Cymeradwyaf y cynigion i'r Aelodau.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** As you are aware, we have grave concerns about these regulations. We raised some of them with you in committee. Although we understand why they are to be implemented, there are a number of questions surrounding how they will be implemented and utilised. We seek assurance from you that they will be implemented in a responsible manner and not too enthusiastically or rigorously, if I can put it that way.

A number of groups, such as Liberty, the National Association for Probation Officers and the Howard League for Penal Reform, have serious concerns about the way in which these orders are used. They feel that they are being used to deal with the outcomes of the problem rather than the problem itself, and that there is a danger that they will be used to remove families that cause problems rather than dealing with the problems that give rise to the behaviour.

Mae pryder hefyd y gallai pobl gael eu carcharu o ganlyniad i'r gorchmynion hyn, a hynny heb wynebu cyhuddiadau arbennig o ddifrifol a fyddai yn arwain at garcharu fel arfer.

Mae'r diffiniad o ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol—os diffiniad—yn ymestyn o ollwng sbwriel i droseddu, ac felly gallai pobl sy'n cyflawni gweithredoedd digon diniwed ar y cyfan wynebu canlyniadau llym iawn oherwydd bod y diffiniad mor llac.

Mae pryder hefyd, fel y dywedodd Jocelyn Davies yn y pwyllgor, ynghylch y syniad o ddemoneiddio pobl ifanc a'u hystyried yn broblem. Nid yw'r rhelyw o bobl ifanc yn broblem—mae'r mwyafrif yn cyfrannu at gymdeithas mewn ffordd gadarnhaol ac adeiladol. Mae nifer gyfyngedig yn achosi problemau, ond nid yw ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol wedi ei gyfyngu i bobl ifanc gan fod llawer o bobl yn eu hoed a'u hamser yn ymddwyn yn wrthgymdeithasol. Ni wn a yw'r Llywydd am ddatgan buddiant—ymddengys yn frwdfrydig i ymyrryd ar y pwynt hwn.

Mae perygl, felly, o greu hinsawdd o ofn a gwrthdaro, lle mae pobl ifanc ar gorneli strydoedd yn cael eu gweld fel rhai sy'n ymddwyn yn wrthgymdeithasol. Rhaid inni osgoi hynny.

Mae perygl y gallai llwyddiant awdurdodau lleol gael ei fesur yn ôl nifer y gorchmynion a osodant. Ni ddylai hynny fod yn brawf o'u llwyddiant—dylent ymdrin â'r sefyllfaoedd hyn mewn ffordd llawer mwy cynhwysfawr.

Yr wyf am sôn am denantiaid. Dengys y rheoliadau nad ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol gan y tenant yn unig a allai beri iddo golli ei dŷ; gallai ymwelydd â'r ty gyflawni gweithred a allai beri i denant golli tenantiaeth. Beth yw'r diffiniad o ymwelydd? A yw ymwelydd yn mynd i gartref tenant ar wahoddiad y tenant bob amser? Nid dyna sy'n digwydd bob amser.

Mae gennym nifer o bryderon, ac yr ydym am dderbyn sicrwydd na fydd ein hofnau yn cael eu gwireddu wrth weithredu'r gorchmynion. Fel arall, bydd yn rhaid i ni

There is also concern that people could be imprisoned as a result of these orders, even when accusations are not particularly serious and would not normally lead to imprisonment.

The definition of anti-social behaviour—if it can be called a definition—ranges from littering to criminal activity, therefore individuals who carry out relatively harmless acts could face very serious consequences because the definition is so loose.

There is a concern, as Jocelyn Davies mentioned in committee, about the idea of demonising young people and viewing them as a problem. Most young people are not a problem—the majority make a positive and constructive contribution to society. A limited number cause problems, but anti-social behaviour is not restricted to young people, as many older people behave in an anti-social way. I do not know whether the Presiding Officer wants to declare an interest—he seems eager to intervene on this particular point.

Therefore, there is a danger that we could create a climate of fear and conflict, where young people on street corners will be perceived as behaving in an anti-social way. We must avoid doing that.

There is a danger that local authorities' success will be measured according to the number of orders issued. That should not be a measure of their success—they should be dealing with these situations in a far more comprehensive way.

I wish to raise a point about tenants. The regulations make it clear that anti-social behaviour by tenants could lead to eviction and that such behaviour by a visitor to a tenant's property could lead to the same outcome. What is the definition of a visitor? Is a visitor always invited by the tenant? That is not always the case.

We have several concerns, and we seek assurance that our fears will not be substantiated when these orders are implemented, otherwise we will have to

atal ein pleidlais ar y rheoliadau.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I welcome these orders. We all have families and individuals in our communities who make other people's lives a misery. Many of these people are tenants of councils or housing associations, and it is often the case that social landlords either find it difficult to take action or are reluctant to do so. That is often because there are children living in the household, and landlords are rightly concerned for their wellbeing if the family were to be evicted. We would all be concerned for the children's welfare if they were evicted. However, in some areas of my constituency, the situation is very bad, and these offending families and tenants have to take responsibility for their behaviour and that of their children. With rights come responsibility; if you are a tenant, you have no right to make other people's lives a misery.

Social landlords will now have stronger powers to deal with offending families and tenants. However, those tenants will also be given a second chance to improve their behaviour. After that second chance, they must realise that they could be evicted. I am sure that the social landlords that I know would not do that lightly. I hope that these measures make people wake up to the fact that everyone should be able to live in their home and community without fear of abuse and harassment from neighbours.

**William Graham:** The Welsh Conservatives welcome this Order and the supplementary regulations. They provide an integrated approach to addressing the problem of anti-social behaviour among tenants, while providing adequate protection for retaining accommodation for those determined to demonstrate an improvement in their behaviour. It is right that social landlords should prepare and publish policies and procedures on anti-social behaviour. These should, of course, be in line with guidance issued by the Minister. It is also right that a tenant behaving anti-socially should be penalised by a demotion order that ends the tenant's existing security of tenure or assured

abstain in the vote on the regulations.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Yr wyf yn croesawu'r gorchymynion hyn. Mae gennym oll deuluoedd ac unigolion yn ein cymunedau sy'n gwneud bywydau pobl eraill yn boen. Mae llawer o'r bobl hyn yn denantiaid cynghorau neu gymdeithasau tai, ac yn aml iawn mae'r landlordiaid cymdeithasol yn ei chael yn anodd gweithredu neu'n gyndyn o wneud hynny. Y rheswm am hyn yn aml yw bod plant yn byw yn y cartref, ac mae'r landlordiaid yn poeni, fel y dylent, am eu lles pe bai'r teulu yn cael ei droi allan. Byddem i gyd yn poeni am les y plant pe byddent yn cael eu troi allan. Fodd bynnag, mewn rhai ardaloedd yn fy etholaeth, mae'r sefyllfa yn ddrwg iawn, a rhaid i'r teuluoedd a'r tenantiaid sy'n camymddwyn fod yn gyfrifol am eu hymddygiad, ac ymddygiad eu plant. Gyda hawliau, daw cyfrifoldeb hefyd; os ydych yn denant, nid oes gennych hawl i wneud bywydau pobl eraill yn boen.

Bydd gan landlordiaid cymdeithasol bellach bwerau cryfach i ddelio â theuluoedd a thenantiaid sy'n camymddwyn. Fodd bynnag, bydd y tenantiaid hyn hefyd yn cael ail gyfle i wella eu hymddygiad. Ar ôl yr ail gyfle hwnnw, rhaid iddynt sylweddoli y gallent gael eu troi allan. Yr wyf yn siŵr na fyddai'r landlordiaid cymdeithasol y gwn i amdanynt yn gwneud hynny ar chwarae bach. Gobeithio y bydd y mesurau hyn yn deffro pobl i'r ffaith y dylai fod gan bawb hawl i fyw yn eu cartrefi a'u cymunedau heb fod ofn arnynt y bydd cymdogion yn eu sarhau ac yn aflonyddu arnynt.

**William Graham:** Mae Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn croesawu'r Gorchymyn hwn a'r rheoliadau atodol. Maent yn cynnig dull integredig o ddelio â phroblem ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol ymhlith tenantiaid, gan ddarparu digon o amddiffyniad i gadw rhai sy'n benderfynol o wella eu hymddygiad yn eu cartrefi. Mae'n beth priodol bod landlordiaid cymdeithasol yn paratoi ac yn cyhoeddi polisiau a gweithdrefnau ar ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol. Dylai'r rhain, wrth gwrs, fod yn unol â'r canllawiau a gyhoeddir gan y Gweinidog. Priodol hefyd yw cosbi tenant sy'n ymddwyn yn wrthgymdeithasol gyda gorchymyn israddio sy'n dod â diogelwch deiliadaeth neu

tenancy and replaces it with a new form of demoted tenancy with less security of tenure.

The majority of tenants require protection from a disruptive few. Housing policies published by social landlords recognise that there is a necessary mix of tenancies. The welfare issues already remarked upon form part of those policies, published by existing social landlords.

It is fair that demoted tenants who continue to behave anti-socially during this time are at risk of losing their homes, and that social landlords can end a demoted tenancy by following the requisite procedure. A social landlord may be required to undertake a review of any decision to end a demoted tenancy, with the procedures for review being statutory for secure tenants and a regular requirement for assured tenants. Before seeking a demotion order, the landlord must serve the tenant with a notice in the prescribed form, and the notice will ensure that the tenants receive full, clear and timely information about the implications of demotion, about where they can get advice and about what they should do to rectify the situation. The Minister will no doubt ensure that this measure does not impede the previous suspended possession notices effectively used by some councils.

We need to determine what will happen to these people once their tenancies are terminated. I know that the Minister has this in mind, and we welcome further explanation on this issue in discussions in committee.

The Minister must, therefore, ensure that there is adequate funding within the homes programme to support these people who have intentionally made themselves homeless. That is part of the reason behind this type of legislation; it is a reaction to public concern.

**Peter Black:** Before some Members put out premature press releases as they did when we discussed this in September, I would like to

denantiaeth sicr y tenant i ben ac yn cyflwyno tenantiaeth isradd newydd, gyda llai o ddiogelwch deiliadaeth, yn ei lle.

Mae gofyn gwarchod y rhan fwyaf o denantiaid rhag yr ychydig rai sy'n tarfu ar bobl eraill. Mae'r polisïau tai a gyhoeddir gan landlordiaid cymdeithasol yn cydnabod bod cymysgedd angenrheidiol o denantiaethau yn bodoli. Mae'r materion yn ymwneud â lles y cyfeiriwyd atynt eisoes yn rhan o'r polisïau hynny, sy'n cael eu cyhoeddi gan landlordiaid cymdeithasol presennol.

Mae'n deg bod tenantiaid sy'n cael eu hisraddio ac sy'n parhau i ymddwyn yn wrthgymdeithasol yn ystod y cyfnod hwn yn wynebu colli eu cartrefi, ac y gall landlordiaid cymdeithasol ddod â thenantiaeth isradd i ben drwy ddilyn y weithdrefn angenrheidiol. Efallai y gofynnir i landlord cymdeithasol adolygu unrhyw benderfyniad i ddod â thenantiaeth isradd i ben, ac mae'r adolygiad hwn yn statudol ar gyfer tenantiaid diogel ac yn ofyniad rheolaidd ar gyfer tenantiaid sicr. Cyn gwneud cais am orchymyn israddio, rhaid i'r landlord gyflwyno rhybudd i'r tenant ar y ffurf sydd wedi'i phennu, gan sicrhau bod y tenant yn derbyn gwybodaeth lawn, glir a phrydlon am oblygiadau'r israddio, ac ynghylch pwy i droi atynt i gael cyngor ynghylch sut i unioni'r sefyllfa. Diau y bydd y Gweinidog yn sicrhau nad yw'r mesur hwn yn tarfu ar y rhybuddion meddiannu gohiriedig blaenorol a ddefnyddir yn effeithiol gan rai cynghorau.

Rhaid inni benderfynu beth fydd yn digwydd i'r bobl hyn wedi i'w tenantiaethau i ben. Gwn fod y Gweinidog yn ystyried hyn, a byddem yn croesawu eglurhad pellach ar y mater hwn mewn trafodaethau yn y pwyllgor.

Rhaid i'r Gweinidog, felly, sicrhau bod digon o gyllid ar gael o fewn y rhaglen gartrefi i roi cymorth i'r bobl hyn sydd wedi gwneud eu hunain yn ddigartref yn fwriadol. Mae hynny'n rhan o'r rheswm y tu ôl i'r math hwn o ddeddfwriaeth; ymateb y mae i bryderon y cyhoedd.

**Peter Black:** Cyn i rai Aelodau wneud datganiadau cynamserol i'r wasg, fel y gwnaethant pan drafodwyd hyn ym mis

make it clear that the Liberal Democrats support the orders. Lorraine Barrett is absolutely right in what she said about the problems that can be caused by anti-social tenants. A small number of tenants acting in an anti-social way can cause a major problem for their neighbours and can disrupt an entire community. People will often live in fear of the behaviour perpetrated on a particular estate or street. Tools have to be made available to local authorities and landlords to deal with that issue.

4.30 p.m.

I will concentrate on a demoted tenancy as opposed to the anti-social behaviour orders, which are another issue. Our concern with these demoted tenancy orders is that, sometimes, they effectively result in moving the problem around. If someone is evicted from a social tenancy because of their anti-social behaviour, they will often end up in the private sector, in private rented accommodation, with a landlord who does not have the same tools at his or her disposal as a local authority or housing association has. The neighbours in that particular community would then be subjected to the same types of behaviour as the former neighbours were before them. I know that, when the licensing proposals will come in, there will possibly be some way out for such landlords and for local authorities to deal with that issue.

However, for the very reason that we do not want to move this behaviour from a social housing setting to a private housing setting, we need to exercise these demoted tenancies with some caution. We have to use them as part of a raft of measures to deal with the anti-social behaviour of a particular tenant.

One particular concern voiced when we last discussed this, in September 2004, was that of new tenancies being created once a demoted tenancy order is made and, effectively, a demoted tenant then being much more vulnerable to eviction for reasons other than for anti-social behaviour. At the

Medi, hoffwn ddatgan yn glir fod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn cefnogi'r gorchmynion. Mae Lorraine Barrett yn hollol iawn o ran yr hyn a ddywedodd am y problemau y mae tenantiaid gwrthgymdeithasol yn gallu eu hachosi. Mae nifer fach o denantiaid sy'n ymddwyn yn wrthgymdeithasol yn gallu achosi problem fawr i'w cymdogion, ac aflonyddu ar gymuned gyfan. Yn aml bydd ar bobl ofn oherwydd yr ymddygiad sy'n digwydd ar stad neu stryd neilltuol. Rhaid rhoi'r arfau i awdurdodau lleol a landlordiaid er mwyn iddynt ddelio â'r mater hwnnw.

Canolbwyntiaf ar denantiaeth isradd yn hytrach na'r gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol, sydd yn fater arall. Ein pryder ni gyda'r gorchmynion tenantiaeth isradd hyn yw mai eu canlyniad i bob pwrpas, weithiau, yw symud y broblem o gwmpas. Os caiff rhywun eu troi allan o denantiaeth gymdeithasol oherwydd eu hymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol, byddant yn aml yn mynd i'r sector preifat yn y diwedd, mewn llety rhent preifat, gyda landlord nad yw'r un arfau ar gael iddo neu iddi ag sydd ar gael i awdurdod lleol neu gymdeithas dai. Yna byddai'r cymdogion yn y gymuned arbennig honno'n gorfod dioddef yr un mathau o ymddygiad â'u cymdogion blaenorol o'u blaen. Gwn, pan ddaw'r cynigion trwyddedu i mewn, y bydd rhyw lwybr ymwarded efallai i landlordiaid o'r fath ac i awdurdodau lleol ddelio â'r broblem honno.

Fodd bynnag, am yr union reswm nad oes arnom eisiau symud yr ymddygiad hwn o leoliad tai cymdeithasol i leoliad tai preifat, mae angen defnyddio'r tenantiaethau isradd hyn gyda chryn bwyll. Rhaid inni eu defnyddio fel rhan o amrediad o fesurau i ddelio ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol tenant arbennig.

Un pryder arbennig a leisiwyd pan drafodasom hyn ddiwethaf, ym Medi 2004, oedd hwnnw ynghylch creu tenantiaethau newydd wedi i orchymyn tenantiaeth isradd gael ei wneud, a bod tenant isradd wedyn, i bob pwrpas, yn llawer mwy agored i gael ei droi allan am resymau ar wahân i ymddygiad

time, we raised the issue of having checks and balances in place, so there should be some form of appeal or review of that procedure. I welcome the fact that, as part of these regulations, the Minister has provided a mechanism by which there can be an independent comprehensive review of the decision.

I am interested in the mechanics of that, particularly at what stage that review can be triggered—whether a tenant who has a demoted tenancy can ask, after a period of good behaviour, for a review to have that demoted tenancy lifted, or whether it has to be done within a set period. However, the fact that a review is available is very much to be welcomed. It will provide some form of redress for a tenant who is subject to an order. After a period of good behaviour, the tenant can return to the authority and ask for that order to be lifted. That can certainly be done where circumstances change. For instance, where a member of a household whose anti-social behaviour was the cause of an order has moved out of a property, the tenant should be able to tell the authority that the circumstances have changed and request that the order be lifted.

With those reservations, and questions that I hope the Minister can address in her reply, we will support these orders. However, I hope that local authorities and housing associations are able to exercise this new power with discretion and caution when the regulations are put forward on their behalf. I hope that they do not make the situation worse by moving someone who is acting in an anti-social way to another community where the same powers of redress are not available to the new neighbours.

**Carl Sargeant:** I also welcome these orders. I recently attended a seminar held by Bill Pitt from the Home Office on anti-social behaviour orders. It was most enlightening to see what excruciating pain some reasonable and good citizens of our communities face daily. I met a young lady and her family from an estate in Manchester who had been verbally and physically assaulted by people who were just not behaving as good citizens.

Ar y pryd, codasom y cwestiwn ynglŷn â chael rhwystrau a gwrthbwsiau ar waith, felly dylai fod rhyw fath o apêl neu adolygiad o'r weithdrefn honno. Croesawaf y ffaith bod y Gweinidog, fel rhan o'r rheoliadau hyn, wedi darparu mecanwaith sydd yn caniatáu adolygiad cynhwysfawr annibynnol o'r penderfyniad.

Mae gennyf ddiddordeb yn y modd y bydd hynny'n gweithio, yn enwedig ar ba gam y gellir cychwyn yr adolygiad hwnnw—a all tenant a gafodd denantiaeth isradd ofyn, wedi cyfnod o ymddygiad da, am adolygiad i gael codi'r denantiaeth isradd honno, ynteu a oes raid ei wneud o fewn cyfnod penodol. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ffaith bod adolygiad ar gael i'w groesawu'n fawr. Bydd yn darparu rhyw fodd o unioni'r sefyllfa i denant sydd yn destun gorchymyn. Wedi cyfnod o ymddygiad da, gall y tenant ddychwelyd at yr awdurdod a gofyn am godi'r gorchymyn hwnnw. Yn sicr gellir gwneud hynny lle y bo amgylchiadau'n newid. Er enghraifft, lle y bo aelod o deulu yr oedd ei ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yn achos gorchymyn wedi symud allan o dŷ, dylai'r tenant gael dweud wrth yr awdurdod fod yr amgylchiadau wedi newid a gofyn am gael codi'r gorchymyn.

Gyda'r eithriadau hynny, a chwestiynau y gall y Gweinidog roi sylw iddynt yn ei hateb, gobeithio, cefnogwn y gorchmynion hyn. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiaf y gall awdurdodau lleol a chymdeithasau tai ddefnyddio'r pŵer newydd hwn yn ddoeth a phwyllog pan gyflwynir y rheoliadau ar eu rhan. Gobeithiaf na wnânt y sefyllfa'n waeth drwy symud rhywun sydd yn ymddwyn mewn modd gwrthgymdeithasol i gymuned arall lle nad yw'r un pwerau i unioni'r sefyllfa ar gael i'r cymdogion newydd.

**Carl Sargeant:** Croesawaf finnau'r gorchmynion hyn. Yn ddiweddar mynychais seminar a gynhaliwyd gan Bill Pitt o'r Swyddfa Gartref ar orchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol. Agoriad llygad oedd gweld y boen ddirdynol a wyneba rhai dinasyddion rhesymol a da yn ein cymunedau bob dydd. Cyfarfûm â menyw ifanc a'i theulu o stad ym Manceinion yr ymosodwyd arni'n eiriol ac yn gorfforol gan bobl nad oeddent yn ymddwyn fel dinasyddion da.

I believe that these orders will help us to raise awareness and take action on these criminals and their criminal behaviour. As some other Members have alluded to, anti-social behavioural orders are not lightly made; other steps are always taken first, such as acceptable behaviour contracts and housing orders. Those are always the first actions taken to make the point to those people who find it acceptable to behave unacceptably in our communities. Minister, I hope that we use these anti-social behaviour orders and other commencement Orders with vigour, because I am sick of our communities being wrecked by certain individuals who behave anti-socially in some very good areas of Wales.

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** No-one has the right to make anyone's life a misery, whether you are a tenant or a private householder. The numbers of complaints across the board are rising. It is interesting that we can do stuff in relation to registered social landlords, but in whole parts of the community, people's lives are still being made a misery, and we must tackle those problems head on.

Carl talked about an interesting seminar that he attended. We must recognise that measuring anti-social behaviour and the effectiveness of remedies is problematic. However, I am keen to emphasise that the work of the community safety partnerships should not be judged by the number of anti-social behaviour orders issued; ASBO numbers alone cannot possibly assess the success of a policy in dealing with anti-social behaviour. I am not saying that that is just a housing issue; that is across the board. Effective partnership working is essential. Some of the problems that relate to housing are that people have not intervened soon enough in some of the families and individuals concerned to teach them about their responsibilities to their neighbours and, sometimes, how to keep their houses in order and what constitutes acceptable behaviour.

Credaf y gwnaiff y gorchmynion hyn ein helpu i godi ymwybyddiaeth a gweithredu ynglŷn â'r troseddwyr hyn a'u hymddygiad troseddol. Fel y soniodd rhai Aelodau eraill, nid ar chwarae bach y gwneir gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol; cymerir camau eraill yn gyntaf bob amser, fel contractau ymddygiad derbynol a gorchmynion tai. Dyna'r camau gweithredu cyntaf bob tro i wneud y pwynt i'r bobl hynny sydd yn gweld bod ymddwyn yn annerbynol yn ein cymunedau yn beth derbynol. Weinidog, gobeithiaf y defnyddiwn y gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol hyn a Gorchmynion cychwyn eraill yn egnïol, oherwydd yr wyf wedi cael llond bol ar weld ein cymunedau'n cael eu difetha gan rai unigolion sydd yn ymddwyn yn wrthgymdeithasol mewn rhai rhannau da iawn o Gymru.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** Nid oes gan neb yr hawl i wneud bywyd neb arall yn boen, boed denant neu ddeiliad tŷ preifat. Mae nifer y cwynion yn gyffredinol ar i fyny. Mae'n ddiddorol ein bod yn gallu gwneud pethau mewn perthynas â landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig, ond mewn rhannau cyfain o'r gymuned, mae bywydau pobl yn dal i gael eu gwneud yn boen, a rhaid inni fynd i'r afael yn uniongyrchol â'r problemau hynny.

Soniodd Carl am seminar diddorol a fynychodd. Rhaid inni gydnabod bod problemau ynghlwm wrth fesur ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol ac effeithiolrwydd camau i'w atal. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn bwysleisio na ddylid barnu gwaith y partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol yn ôl nifer y gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol a roddir; nid oes modd barnu llwyddiant polisi wrth ddelio ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yn ôl niferoedd ASBO yn unig. Nid wyf yn dweud mai mater yn gysylltiedig â thai yn unig yw hynny; mae'n gyffredinol. Rhaid wrth gydweithio effeithiol mewn partneriaeth. Rhai o'r problemau sy'n gysylltiedig â thai yw nad yw pobl wedi ymyrryd yn ddigon buan â rhai o'r teuluoedd a'r unigolion dan sylw i'w dysgu am eu cyfrifoldebau tuag at eu cymdogion ac, weithiau, sut i gadw eu tai mewn trefn a beth

Therefore, there are many issues to consider in those areas.

The benefits of discussing these issues in committee have come across clearly today; all these issues have already been raised in committee, and I have tried to address them in many ways. William's points were well made. As he knows, a key theme of our social housing management grant funding has been to work for the last two years to help landlords develop innovative methods and good practice to prevent and combat anti-social behaviour. We must take a holistic approach to some of the housing issues, rather than an approach that can be dealt with just by the commencement of this legislation, in certain regards.

To take the points that Peter and William raised head on, I am also concerned about those points, the tenancy positions, moving problems on, and how to deal with them. In looking at the guidance and at how things will work in the future, perhaps, in 12 months' time when we have undertaken work in this particular area, we could review the effectiveness of how we have dealt with these issues, how people have been able to get their tenancy back, the different stages, and so on, and see what good practice has developed.

It is important for us to recognise, and I think that Rhodri Glyn recognises this, that anti-social behaviour is not about the demonisation of youth; we have all agreed that across the parties. Anti-social behaviour comes from people in any age group and any age bracket.

**Peter Black:** If you do not have the answer now, is it possible for you to come back to committee with how this review mechanism will work, and what the timing of that will be, and whether it is possible to have a review some period after the Order has been made?

**Edwina Hart:** I would be happy to do so, because how the review mechanism will work is not explicit in anything that we have

a gyfrifir yn ymddygiad derbynol. Felly, mae llawer o faterion i'w hystyried yn y meysydd hynny.

Mae manteision trafod y materion hyn mewn pwyllgor wedi dod drosodd yn glir heddiw; codwyd y materion hyn i gyd mewn pwyllgor eisoes, ac yr wyf wedi ceisio eu hateb mewn sawl ffordd. Gwnaeth William ei bwyntiau'n dda. Fel y gŵyr, mae gweithio ers dwy flynedd bellach i helpu landlordiaid i ddatblygu dulliau arloesol ac arferion da i atal a gwrthweithio ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol wedi bod yn un o themâu allweddol ein trefn ariannu grantiau rheoli tai cymdeithasol. Rhaid cymryd agwedd gyfannol at rai o'r problemau sydd ynglŷn â thai, yn hytrach nag agwedd y gellir delio â hi dim ond drwy roi cychwyn ar y ddeddfwriaeth hon, mewn ffordd.

A mynd i'r afael yn uniongyrchol â'r pwyntiau a gododd Peter a William, yr wyf finnau'n bryderus am y pwyntiau hynny, y sefyllfaoedd o ran tenantiaeth, symud problemau i rywle arall, a sut i ddelio â hwy. O edrych ar y canllawiau ac ar y modd y bydd pethau'n gweithio yn y dyfodol, efallai, ymhen 12 mis pan fyddwn wedi gwneud gwaith yn y maes arbennig hwn, y gallem adolygu effeithiolrwydd y modd y deliwyd â'r materion hyn, sut y mae pobl wedi cael eu tenantiaeth yn ôl, y gwahanol gamau, ac yn y blaen, a gweld pa arferion da a ddatblygodd.

Mae'n bwysig inni gydnabod, ac yr wyf yn meddwl bod Rhodri Glyn yn cydnabod hyn, nad mater o wneud bwgan o ieuenctid yw ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol; yr ydym i gyd wedi cytuno ar hynny ar draws y pleidiau. Ceir ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol gan bobl o unrhyw grŵp oedran ac unrhyw ystod oed.

**Peter Black:** Os nad yw'r ateb gennych yn awr, a oes modd ichi ddod yn ôl i'r pwyllgor i ddweud sut y bydd y mecanwaith adolygu hwn yn gweithio, a beth fydd amserlen hynny, ac a fydd modd cael adolygiad ymhen hyn a hyn o amser wedi i'r Gorchymyn gael ei wneud?

**Edwina Hart:** Byddwn yn fodlon gwneud hynny, oherwydd nid yw'r modd y bydd y mecanwaith adolygu'n gweithio wedi'i



discussed. I think that we would have to have an idea of how it will work, and review it in 12 months' time to see how effective it has been. I am perfectly happy to give that guarantee.

Rhodri Glyn talked about how people had to be dealt with responsibly, and that is the key. We must recognise that anti-social behaviour orders have a role and a function. However, when we are dealing with wider issues, particularly youth annoyance, we must look at how to engage much earlier with young people, what we do in terms of youth provision, and how we integrate them and make them feel part of our communities, rather than ostracising them. It is clear that the definition of anti-social behaviour is rather wide, and I have made approaches, as I advised the committee, to the UK Government, because we need to narrow it. If you think about it, it covers so many areas, including dropping litter, dogs fouling, speeding cars, and inconsiderate parking; all of those are regarded as anti-social behaviour. Therefore, we must tackle these issues.

It is important to recognise that, in some areas, many people live in fear of anti-social behaviour and what happens across the board, and we need to deal effectively and efficiently with that. However, you cannot move a problem on. At the end of the day, a lot of counselling is required and a lot of work must be done with families. When you move the problem on, you probably move it into areas where we do not have any legislative power to deal with issues unless we get some selective licensing arrangements.

Therefore, I commend the Orders to you as they stand, and thank all Members for their helpful contributions, which I will take into account when I review the matter. However, I undertake that I will review how this works in terms of what we do 12 months from the commencement of all Orders.

4.40 p.m.

esbonio yn unrhyw beth y buom yn ei drafod. Credaf y byddai'n rhaid inni gael rhyw syniad sut y bydd yn gweithio, a'i adolygu ymhen 12 mis i weld pa mor effeithiol y bu. Yr wyf yn berffaith fodlon rhoi'r warant honno.

Soniodd Rhodri Glyn am yr angen i drafod pobl yn gyfrifol, a dyna'r allwedd. Rhaid inni gydnabod bod rôl a swyddogaeth i orchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol. Fodd bynnag, pan fyddwn yn delio â materion ehangach, yn enwedig annifyrrwch gan ieuencid, rhaid inni edrych ar sut i greu perthynas yn llawer cynharach gyda phobl ifanc, beth a wnawn o ran darpariaeth i'r ifanc, a sut y byddwn yn eu hintegreiddio ac yn gwneud iddynt deimlo'n rhan o'n cymunedau, yn hytrach na'u gwrthod. Mae'n glir bod y diffiniad o ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol braidd yn eang, ac yr wyf wedi cysylltu, fel y dywedais wrth y pwyllgor, â Llywodraeth y DU, oherwydd y mae angen ei gulhau. Os meddylwch amdano, mae'n cynnwys cymaint o agweddau, gan gynnwys gollwng sbwriel, cŵn yn bawa, goryrru, a pharcio anystyriol; cyfrifir pob un o'r rheini'n ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol. Felly, rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn.

Mae'n bwysig sylweddoli bod ar lawer o bobl, mewn rhai ardaloedd, ofn ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol a'r hyn sydd yn digwydd yn gyffredinol, ac mae angen inni ddelio â hynny'n effeithiol ac yn effeithlon. Fodd bynnag, ni ellir symud problem i rywle arall. Yn y pen draw, mae angen llawer o gwnsela ac mae'n rhaid gwneud llawer o waith gyda theuluoedd. Pan symudwch y broblem i rywle arall, mae'n debyg y byddwch yn ei symud i ardaloedd lle nad oes gennym bŵer deddfwriaethol i ddelio â materion oni chawn drefniadau trwyddedu dewisol.

Felly, cymeradwyaf y Gorchmynion ichi fel y maent, a diolchaf i'r holl Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau buddiol, y byddaf yn eu hystyried pan adolygaf y mater. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn addo yr adolygaf y modd y mae hyn yn gweithio yn nhermau'r hyn a wnawn ymhen 12 mis wedi i'r holl Orchmynion gychwyn.

*Cynnig (NDM2396): O blaid 39, Ymatal 6, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2396): For 39, Abstain 6, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Jocelyn  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2397): O blaid 39, Ymatal 6, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2397): For 39, Abstain 6, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Jocelyn  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2398): O blaid 39, Ymatal 4, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2398): For 39, Abstain 4, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2399): O blaid 38, Ymatal 6, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2399): For 38, Abstain 6, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Jocelyn  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2400): O blaid 39, Ymatal 6, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2400): For 39, Abstain 6, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Jocelyn  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2401): O blaid 39, Ymatal 6, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2401): For 39, Abstain 6, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Brynle

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Davies, Jocelyn  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.42 p.m.  
 The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.42 p.m.*

**Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon ar Gyfraniad y  
 Celfyddydau a Chwaraeon at Adfywio Cymunedol  
 The Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee's Report on the  
 Contribution of Arts and Sports to Community Regeneration**

**Rosemary Butler:** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Orders Nos. 6.6 and 9.9, notes the Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee report 'Arts, Sport and Community Regeneration', which was laid in the Table Office on 18 April 2005. (NDM2390)*

I have pleasure in presenting the committee's report on its review of the contribution of arts and sport to community regeneration. I want to say at the outset how grateful the committee is to everyone who contributed, not only to those who shared their thoughts and expertise with us on this important subject, but also particularly to the secretariat and researchers who put the report together: Julia Annand, Vaughan Watkin, Anne Thomas and Ruth Hughes. I would also like to thank Gareth Woodhead for his work before he moved from the department. The committee also thanks Huw Lewis, Deputy Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration,

**Rosemary Butler:** Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 6.6 a 9.9, yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon, 'Celfyddydau, Chwaraeon ac Adfywio Cymunedol', a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Ebrill 2005. (NDM2390)*

Mae'n bleser gennyf gyflwyno adroddiad y pwyllgor ar ei adolygiad o gyfraniad y celfyddydau a chwaraeon at adfywio cymunedol. Hoffwn ddweud ar y dechrau mor ddiolchgar yw'r pwyllgor i bawb a gyfrannodd, nid yn unig i'r rhai a rannodd eu meddyliau a'u harbenigedd gyda ni ar y pwnc pwysig hwn, ond hefyd yn arbennig i'r ysgrifenyddiaeth a'r ymchwilwyr a luniodd yr adroddiad: Julia Annand, Vaughan Watkin, Anne Thomas a Ruth Hughes. Hoffwn ddiolch hefyd i Gareth Woodhead am ei waith cyn iddo symud o'r adran. Mae'r pwyllgor yn diolch hefyd i Huw Lewis, y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Gyfiawnder

for his presentation to the committee. I personally thank the members of the committee for their valued advice and support during the preparation of this important report.

Art and sport play a vital role in regenerating deprived communities. We believe that art and sport must be available to everyone, whatever their circumstances and wherever they live. Sport, which includes all physical activity whether dance or rock climbing, and arts can be a real force for regeneration, as well as opening up new horizons for individuals, developing their self-worth and giving them, perhaps for the first time in their lives, a sense of fulfilment and achievement.

Surprisingly, this is the first time that arts and sport have been looked at in a review of community regeneration. We looked at both policy development and the potential collective impact of grass-roots provision on communities. We specifically set out to consider the links between arts policy, sport policy and community regeneration policy, how local arts and sport projects can contribute to community regeneration, the support mechanisms for community regeneration-related arts and sports projects, and best practice in such projects.

Twenty-five people, representing 16 organisations, presented evidence directly to the committee, and they and a further 40 groups and individuals took the time to write to us with their views. Those representations came from a wide spectrum of interests, not just those directly involved in the arts and sports, but also local authorities, community and voluntary organisations, broadcasters, youth movements and academics.

**Janet Ryder:** What involvement has the Wales Rugby League had in the development of this strategy? As I am sure you are aware, in England, the Rugby Football League sits on the Downing Street working party on

Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, am ei gyflwyniad i'r pwyllgor. Diolchaf yn bersonol i aelodau'r pwyllgor am eu cyngor a'u cefnogaeth werthfawr yn ystod y gwaith o baratoi'r adroddiad pwysig hwn.

Mae'r celfyddydau a chwaraeon yn chwarae rhan allweddol wrth adfywio cymunedau difreintiedig. Credwn fod yn rhaid i'r celfyddydau a chwaraeon fod ar gael i bawb, beth bynnag fo'u hamgylchiadau a lle bynnag y bôn yn byw. Gall chwaraeon, sydd yn cynnwys pob gweithgaredd corfforol, boed ddawns neu ddringo creigiau, a'r celfyddydau fod yn rym gwirioneddol dros adfywio, yn ogystal ag agor gorwelion newydd i unigolion, gan ddatblygu eu hunan-werth a rhoi iddynt, efallai am y tro cyntaf yn eu bywydau, ymdeimlad o foddhad a chyflawniad.

Yn rhyfedd iawn, dyma'r tro cyntaf inni edrych ar y celfyddydau a chwaraeon mewn adolygiad o adfywio cymunedol. Edrychasom ar ddatblygu polisi a'r modd y gallai darparu'r hanfodion gyda'i gilydd gael effaith ar gymunedau. Aethom ati'n benodol i ystyried y cysylltiadau rhwng polisiâu ym meysydd y celfyddydau, chwaraeon ac adfywio cymunedol, sut y gall prosiectau celfyddydau a chwaraeon lleol gyfrannu at adfywio cymunedol, y mecanweithiau cefnogol ar gyfer prosiectau celfyddydau a chwaraeon cysylltiedig ag adfywio cymunedol, a'r arferion gorau mewn prosiectau o'r fath.

Cyflwynodd pump ar hugain o bobl, yn cynrychioli 16 o sefydliadau, dystiolaeth yn uniongyrchol i'r pwyllgor, a bu iddynt hwy a 40 o grwpiau ac unigolion eraill fynd ati i ysgrifennu atom gyda'u sylwadau. Daeth y sylwadau hynny gan sbectwm eang o ddiddordebau, nid dim ond y rhai sydd yn ymwneud yn uniongyrchol â'r celfyddydau a chwaraeon, ond hefyd awdurdodau lleol, sefydliadau cymunedol a gwirfoddol, darlledwyr, mudiadau ieuencid ac academyddion.

**Janet Ryder:** Pa ran fu gan Gynghrair Rygbi Cymru yn natblygiad y strategaeth hon? Fel y gwyddoch, mae'n siŵr, yn Lloegr mae'r Gynghrair Rygbi'n eistedd ar weithgor Stryd Downing ar adfywio cymunedol ac mae'n



community regeneration and is quite heavily involved in community regeneration projects. Have you approached the Wales Rugby League about becoming involved in this strategy?

**Rosemary Butler:** We advertised far and wide for people who wished to contribute; it was not an exclusive list. We did not have any representations from the Wales Rugby League.

Committee members undertook several study visits, in groups and individually, to look at what is happening across Wales. We also visited Ballymun in Dublin, which has seen the largest regeneration project of its kind in Europe. The report highlights this and three other developments that we visited, namely Community Arts Rhayader and District in Rhayader, which is promoting participation in local arts and heritage in a rural area, Valleys Kids in the Rhondda, which is working with disadvantaged children and families, and the Phoenix Centre in Townhill, Swansea, which is the first community economic development centre of its kind in Wales. I thank everyone at the projects that we visited for being so generous with their time and for sharing their experiences—both good and not so good—with us.

I stress that these are only examples of the marvellous work that is being undertaken throughout the country. Baneswell, Gaer, Bettws, Dyffryn and Pillgwenlly are Communities First areas in my constituency, all of which are different and finding different solutions to the challenges that they face. However, in each area, it is the sport and arts projects that bring the communities together and help to kick-start the regeneration process.

Despite the excellent work being carried out across Wales, there are still problems in terms of delivery and sustainability. We believe that these issues can be resolved through better co-ordination and co-operation, and better recognition of what the various interests, working together, can bring forward to reinvigorate our less-well-off communities. We came to the conclusion that, in order to secure long-term investment,

weithgar iawn mewn prosiectau adfywio cymunedol. A ydych wedi cysylltu â Chynghrair Rygbi Cymru ynglŷn â chymryd rhan yn y strategaeth hon?

**Rosemary Butler:** Hysbysebwyd yn helaeth am bobl a ddymunai gyfrannu; nid oedd yn rhestr gyfyngedig. Ni chawsom sylwadau oddi wrth Gynghrair Rygbi Cymru.

Ymgwymerodd aelodau'r pwyllgor ag amryw o ymweliadau astudio, yn grwpiau ac yn unigol, i edrych ar yr hyn sydd yn digwydd ledled Cymru. Ymwelsom â Ballymun yn Nulyn hefyd, lle y gwelwyd y prosiect adfywio mwyaf o'i fath yn Ewrop. Mae'r adroddiad yn rhoi lle blaenllaw i hwn a thri datblygiad arall a welsom, sef Celfyddydau Cymunedol Rhaeadr a'r Cylch yn Rhaeadr Gwy, sydd yn hybu cyfranogiad mewn celfyddydau a threftadaeth leol mewn ardal wledig, Valleys Kids yn y Rhondda, sydd yn gweithio gyda phlant a theuluoedd difreintiedig, a Chanolfan y Ffenics yn Townhill, Abertawe, sef y ganolfan datblygu economaidd gymunedol gyntaf o'i bath yng Nghymru. Diolch i bawb yn y prosiectau yr ymwelsom â hwy am fod mor hael gyda'u hamser ac am rannu eu profiadau—y rhai da a'r rhai heb fod cystal—gyda ni.

Pwysleisiaf mai dim ond enghreifftiau yw'r rhain o'r gwaith gwych sydd yn cael ei wneud ledled y wlad. Mae Baneswell, Gaer, Bettws, Dyffryn a Philgwenlly yn ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn fy etholaeth, pob un yn wahanol ac yn canfod atebion gwahanol i'r her a wynebant. Fodd bynnag, ymhob ardal, y prosiectau chwaraeon a chelfyddydau sydd yn dod â'r cymunedau ynghyd ac yn helpu i roi hwb cychwynnol i'r broses adfywio.

Er gwaethaf y gwaith rhagorol a wneir ledled Cymru, mae problemau o hyd o ran cyflawni a chynaliadwyedd. Credwn y gellir datrys y problemau hyn drwy well cydlynid a chydweithrediad, a gwell cydnabyddiaeth o'r hyn y gall y gwahanol fuddiannau, drwy gydweithio, ei gyflawni i ailfywiocáu ein cymunedau llai ffyniannus. Daethom i'r casgliad bod angen archwiliad cynhwysfawr, er mwyn sicrhau buddsoddiad hirdymor, i

a comprehensive audit is needed to establish what is happening and what the short, medium and long-term effects on local community regeneration are. However, we recognise that it is often difficult to quantify the less tangible benefits that arts and sport can bring to individuals and to community spirit.

We looked in particular at links between Government policies, and there are clear messages in the Assembly's strategies on sport and culture in relation to community regeneration. These are quite specific, with the arts and sports councils in particular being asked to engage with Communities First partnerships and local authority community developments. We are pleased that this recognition has been carried through into the arts and sports councils' own plans. Despite this, and despite the Government's good intentions, the perception is that

'the role of arts and sport in regeneration is still neglected, undervalued, under funded and marginalised (if at all present) in economic and regeneration policy.'

This concern was widely reflected in many of the responses to the review. However, I need to emphasise that these views on Assembly policies go beyond our brief, both in terms of the review and the committee's own portfolio. People told us that the Assembly Government needs to look at all the policies that impact on regeneration, whether in relation to health, education, employment or the environment, in which arts and sport could, and should, play a significant part.

4.50 p.m.

While the committee acknowledges its limited role in this regard, we nonetheless recommend that consideration be given to the integration of arts and sport across the spectrum of Welsh Assembly Government policies. We do so on the basis that we have been convinced by the evidence given to the committee that

ganfod beth sydd yn digwydd a beth yw'r effeithiau tymor byr, tymor canolig a hirdymor ar adfywiad y gymuned leol. Fodd bynnag, sylweddolwn ei bod yn aml yn anodd mesur y manteision llai amlwg y gall y celfyddydau a chwaraeon eu rhoi i unigolion ac i ysbryd y gymuned.

Edrychasom yn arbennig ar gysylltiadau rhwng polisiau'r Llywodraeth, a cheir negeseuon clir yn strategaethau'r Cynulliad ar chwaraeon a diwylliant mewn perthynas ag adfywio cymunedol. Mae'r rhain yn benodol iawn, a gofynnir i'r cynghorau celfyddydau a chwaraeon yn enwedig weithio gyda phartneriaethau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf a datblygiadau cymunedol yr awdurdodau lleol. Yr ydym yn falch bod y gydnabyddiaeth hon wedi'i chario drwodd i gynlluniau'r cynghorau celfyddydau a chwaraeon eu hunain. Er gwaethaf hyn, ac er gwaethaf bwriadau da'r Llywodraeth, y canfyddiad yw bod

'rôl y celfyddydau a chwaraeon mewn adfywio yn dal wedi'i hesgeuluso, ei dibrisio, ei thanariannu a'i gwthio i'r ymylon (os yw'n bresennol o gwbl) mewn polisi economaidd ac adfywio.'

Adlewyrchwyd y pryder hwn yn eang yn llawer o'r ymatebion i'r adolygiad. Fodd bynnag, rhaid imi bwysleisio bod y sylwadau hyn ar bolisiau'r Cynulliad yn mynd y tu hwnt i'n briff, o ran yr adolygiad ac o ran portffolio'r pwyllgor ei hun hefyd. Dywedodd pobl wrthym fod angen i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad edrych ar yr holl bolisiau sydd yn effeithio ar adfywio, boed mewn perthynas ag iechyd, addysg, cyflogaeth neu'r amgylchedd, lle y gallai ac y dylai'r celfyddydau a chwaraeon chwarae rhan arwyddocaol.

Er bod y pwyllgor yn cydnabod ei rôl gyfyngedig yn hyn o beth, serch hynny argymhellwn y dylid ystyried integreiddio'r celfyddydau a chwaraeon ar draws sbectrum polisiau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Gwnawn hynny ar y sail ein bod wedi'n darbwyllo gan y dystiolaeth a roddwyd i'r pwyllgor fod

‘arts and sport are integral to the long term success of community regeneration’.

‘celfyddydau a chwaraeon yn hanfodol i lwyddiant tymor hir adfywiad cymunedol’.

You will see from the report that we add:

Fe welwch o’r adroddiad ein bod yn ychwanegu:

‘not only in Community First areas but throughout Wales’.

‘nid yn unig mewn ardaloedd Cymunedau’n Gyntaf ond ledled Cymru’.

That is important. That the Assembly Government needs to look beyond the boundaries of Communities First areas was well illustrated by the many examples that we had of developments throughout Wales. We asked about the contribution of local arts and sports projects to community regeneration and about best practice. The response was impressive and served to underline our view, neatly encapsulated by Groundwork Wales, that

Mae hynny’n bwysig. Roedd yr enghreifftiau lu a gawsom o ddatblygiadau ledled Cymru yn dangos yn glir fod angen i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad edrych ymhellach na ffiniau ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Holasom am gyfraniad prosiectau celfyddydau a chwaraeon lleol at adfywio cymunedol ac ynghylch yr arferion gorau. Yr oedd yr ymateb yn un gwerth chweil, a danlinellai ein barn, a grynhowyd yn dwt gan Groundwork Cymru, fod

‘arts and sport are...powerful tools for effecting positive change, having a significant impact on places, people and communities.’

‘celfyddydau a chwaraeon... yn arfau grymus i greu newid cadarnhaol, gan gael effaith arwyddocaol ar leoedd, pobl a chymunedau.’

There is a great deal of activity on the ground, and at many levels, but there is no clear overall picture. We do not recommend that there should be a detailed survey, but there should be an audit, which would help to better inform policies and would also provide the basis for guidance on best practice. We asked what best practice might be, and we were given many examples of projects and developments that had been successful. What we could not establish, however, was why they had been successful. The short answer is that there is no specific blueprint, and we are not suggesting that the Government should attempt to define one. However, a better informed picture of what is happening throughout Wales should help to co-ordinate and enhance the Government’s various programmes. We have suggested ways in which examples of best practice could be shared among all the relevant agencies in the field.

Ceir llawer iawn o weithgaredd ar lawr gwlad, ac ar sawl lefel, ond nid oes darlun cyffredinol clir. Nid argymhellwn y dylid cael arolwg manwl, ond dylid cael archwiliad, a fyddai’n helpu i roi gwell gwybodaeth i seilio polisiau arni a hefyd yn darparu’r sail ar gyfer arweiniad ar arferion gorau. Holasom beth allai’r arferion gorau fod, a rhoddwyd sawl enghraifft inni o brosiectau a datblygiadau a fu’n llwyddiannus. Yr hyn na allem ei gadarnhau, serch hynny, oedd pam yr oeddent wedi bod yn llwyddiannus. Yr ateb byr yw nad oes glasbrint penodol, ac nid ydym yn awgrymu y dylai’r Llywodraeth geisio diffinio un. Fodd bynnag, dylai darlun cywirach o’r hyn sydd yn digwydd ledled Cymru fod yn gymorth i gydlynu a gwella amryfal raglenni’r Llywodraeth. Yr ydym wedi awgrymu ffyrdd y gellid rhannu enghreifftiau o’r arferion gorau ymysg yr holl asiantaethau perthnasol yn y maes.

The other key aspect of the review was funding. Of course, we could all make a case for more money, but this, we believe, is an area in which, by providing relatively small increases in support, we could reap great

Yr agwedd allweddol arall ar yr adolygiad oedd cyllid. Wrth gwrs, gallai pawb ohonom roi dadl dros gael rhagor o arian, ond mae hwn, fe gredwn, yn faes lle y gallem, drwy gynyddu ychydig ar y cymorth, fedi

benefits. One piece of evidence stated:

‘arts and sports are still viewed as the icing on the cake something to have if you have spare money they are not recognised as a core element to any regeneration process.’

This was not an isolated view. One main concern was the difficulty of accessing funds, particularly for smaller groups. There are several examples of this in the report. This is not a new criticism; we have all heard this cry before, and it is disturbing that the same message should continue to come through time and again. We have recommended that access to Welsh Assembly Government funding should be made simpler and more flexible. The committee will keep this recommendation in view as the report progresses through Government. During the coming budget round the committee will be looking for greater support for this area. One respondent said to us that they were

‘hopeful that the review will consolidate the role of voluntary and community arts in Wales as key partners in achieving social cohesion and community regeneration’,

and so are we. I hope that the report will go some way towards achieving this, and that the Members of the Assembly will welcome its recommendations.

**Owen John Thomas:** Daw gwreiddiau ardaloedd trefol Cymru yn bennaf o anheddau Eingl-Normanaid neu ddatblygiadau yn ystod y chwyldro diwydiannol. Adeiladwyd y mwyafrif o’n trefi nid gyda lles y bobl mewn golwg, ond er mwyn meddiannu a rheoli ein tir ac, yn hwyrach, i wneud elw o’n hadnoddau naturiol. Cymharol brin felly yw’r adeiladau braf a cherfluniau a phlaciau i’n atgoffa o hanes ein henwogion a digwyddiadau o bwys. Hyd yn oed heddiw, serch bodolaeth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i warchod ein buddiannau, peth rhy gyffredin yw gweld adeiladau ag apêl bensaernïol, neu adeiladau o arwyddocâd hanesyddol lleol, yn cael eu dymchwel er mwyn i flociau petryal di-nod cael eu gosod yn eu lle. Er bod rhai o’n trefi a’n dinasoedd yn dod allan yn araf deg o’u

manteision mawr. Yn ôl un dystiolaeth:

‘gwelir celfyddydau a chwaraeon o hyd fel yr eisin ar y deisen; rhywbeth i’w gael os oes arian yn sbâr gennych. Nid edrychir arnynt fel elfen graidd o unrhyw broses adfywio.’

Nid barn un unigolyn yn unig oedd hon. Un pryder mawr oedd yr anhawster wrth gael arian, yn enwedig i grwpiau llai. Mae sawl enghraifft o hyn yn yr adroddiad. Nid beirniadaeth newydd yw hon; yr ydym i gyd wedi clywed y gri hon o’r blaen, ac mae’n peri pryder bod yr un neges yn dal i ddod drwodd dro ar ôl tro. Yr ydym wedi argymhell y dylai’r drefn o gael mynediad at arian Llywodraeth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gael ei symleiddio a’i hystwytho. Bydd y pwyllgor yn cadw’r argymhelliad hwn mewn cof wrth i’r adroddiad fynd drwy’r Llywodraeth. Yn ystod y cylch cyllideb sydd i ddod bydd y pwyllgor yn disgwyl gweld mwy o gefnogaeth i hyn. Dywedodd un ymatebwr wrthym eu bod

‘yn obeithiol y gwnaiff yr adolygiad gydgyfnerthu rôl celfyddydau gwirfoddol a chymunedol yng Nghymru fel partneriaid allweddol yn y gwaith o sicrhau cydlynad cymdeithasol ac adfywiad cymunedol’,

ac ninnau yr un modd. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr adroddiad yn cyflawni hyn i raddau helaeth, ac y bydd Aelodau’r Cynulliad yn croesawu ei argymhellion.

**Owen John Thomas:** The roots of the urban areas in Wales mainly come from Anglo-Norman settlements or developments during the industrial revolution. Most of our towns were built not with the welfare of the people in mind, but in order to occupy and control our land and, later on, to make a profit from our natural resources. Therefore, fine buildings, statues and plaques to remind us of our historical figures and important historical events are relatively scarce. Even today, despite the fact that we have the National Assembly to protect our interests, it is all too common for buildings of architectural interest, or of local historical significance, to be demolished in order for featureless oblong blocks to be put in their place. Although some of our towns and cities are slowly emerging from their materialistic or

gorffennol materol, neu ymylol a thaeogaidd, nid yw ystyriaethau diwylliannol eto wedi ennill lle canolog yn y broses o adfywio cymunedol. Nid yw'n syndod bod adroddiad y pwyllgor diwylliant yn datgan nad yw cyfraniad celfyddydau a chwaraeon yn cael ei gydnabod yn llawn ym mholisïau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer cyllido gwaith adfywio.

Er yr anfanteision a wyneba cymunedau Cymru drwy fod yn rhan o genedl heb hunanlywodraeth lawn na pholisi adfywio blaengar, mae ganddynt botensial enfawr i gyfrannu at adfywio cymunedol: mae ein hamgylchedd hanesyddol yn unigryw ac yn ased gwerthfawr, ac mae'n cynnwys ein hiaith frodorol yn ogystal â'r tirluniau amrywiol ac atyniadol.

Felly, yn fy marn i, yr oedd penderfyniad y Pwyllgor Diwylliant, yr Iaith Gymraeg a Chwaraeon i gyfyngu'r adolygiad i ystyried cyfraniad celfyddydau a chwaraeon yn unig yn gamgymeriad. O ganlyniad, collwyd cyfle yn yr adolygiad i greu cylch gwaith ehangach a fyddai wedi agor y drws i weledigaeth gyffrous a fyddai'n dod â gwir adfywiad i'n cymunedau. Mae'n haws bob tro gweld diffygion yn fersiwn derfynol adroddiad, yn arbennig gyda phellter amser, sydd yn helpu dyn i weld materion mewn modd mwy gwrthrychol. Wrth wneud hynny, gwelwch nad yw'r adroddiad yn dod â'r holl adnoddau diwylliannol sydd ar gael at ei gilydd. Mae'r diffyg synergedd hwn yn ein gadael ag adroddiad nad yw'n hanner mor gryf ag y gallasai fod pe baem wedi penderfynu hyrwyddo adfywio cymunedol yn llawn.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Why, on the many occasions that we had the draft report brought before us in committee, did you not raise these issues? You were invited by the Chair to contribute anything that you felt was needed in the report.

**Owen John Thomas:** Yr wyf yn clywed yr hyn a ddywedwch, ond cofiwch nad oeddwn yn hapus gyda'r dehongliad cul o'r celfyddydau, ac nad oeddech yn fodlon ei ehangu. Nid oedd gennyf ddewis ond derbyn yr hyn yr oeddech chi am ei wneud. O safbwynt amser, yr wyf wedi dweud ei bod yn haws gweld rhywbeth mewn modd

marginalised and servile past, cultural considerations have yet to gain a central part in the community regeneration process. It is not surprising that the culture committee's report states that the contribution made by the arts and sport is not fully recognised in the Assembly Government's policies on regeneration funding.

Despite the fact that Welsh communities are disadvantaged by being part of a nation without full self-government or a progressive regeneration policy, they have great potential to contribute to community regeneration: our historical environment is unique and a valuable asset, and it includes our native tongue as well as varied and attractive landscapes.

Therefore, in my view, the decision of the Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee to restrict the review to the consideration of the contribution of arts and sport alone was a mistake. As a result, an opportunity to create a wider remit, which would have opened the door to an exciting vision that would bring true regeneration to our communities, was lost in the review. It is always easier to see the deficiencies in the final version of a report, especially with the benefit of hindsight, which helps one to see things more objectively. In so doing, you will see that the report does not bring together all of the available cultural resources. This lack of synergy leaves us with a report that is not half as strong as it could have been, had we decided to promote community regeneration in full.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Pam, ar yr achlysuron niferus y cawsom yr adroddiad drafft ger ein bron yn y pwyllgor, na wnaethoch godi'r materion hyn? Cawsoch wahoddiad gan y Cadeirydd i gyfrannu unrhyw beth y teimlech fod ei angen yn yr adroddiad.

**Owen John Thomas:** I hear what you are saying, but you will remember that I was not happy with the narrow interpretation of the arts, and that you were not willing to expand upon it. I had no choice but to accept what you wanted to do. From the point of view of time, I have said that it is easier to look at something objectively after some time. There

gwrthrychol wedi peth amser. Yr oedd cyfle i wneud hynny wedi i'r pwyllgor orffen trafod.

Nid wyf yn teimlo bod hynny yn cyfyngu ar fy hawl yn awr i ddweud sut yr wyf yn teimlo am hyn. Byddai wedi bod yn well pe baem wedi cynnal yr adolygiad o fewn cyd-destun ehangach, megis twristiaeth ddiwylliannol—cyd-destun sy'n dod ag elfennau economaidd, diwylliannol a chymdeithasol ynghyd. Byddwn yn dadlau bod hynny'n angenrheidiol wrth ymdrin ag adfywio cymunedol. Ni allwch ymdrin ag adfywio cymunedol heb edrych ar y ffactorau hynny, ac ar effaith gweithgarwch diwylliannol ar y broses honno. Fy ngweledigaeth i ar gyfer adfywio cymunedol yw defnyddio pob elfen ddiwylliannol fanteisiol sydd ar gael er lles y trigolion. Mae hynny yn cynnwys y topograffi, yr amgylchedd adeiledig, ysgolion, tafarndai, addoldai, hanes lleol, yr iaith Gymraeg ac addysg gydol oes ynghyd â'r celfyddydau a chwaraeon. Dim ond yn y ffordd hon y gallwn gyffwrdd â phob rhan o gymdeithas. Byddai'r cydadweithio rhwng y gwahanol elfennau hyn yn creu momentwm yn y broses adfywio, wrth iddynt fwydo ei gilydd a ffynnu mewn perthynas symbiotig. Gan fod y gweithgareddau hyn yn cyffwrdd â phob rhan o'r gymuned, mae'n osgoi'r tebygolrwydd o ynysu adfywiad mewn rhannau bach yn unig.

Fel y dangosir gan lawer o astudiaethau o feysydd yn y Cynulliad, mae angen mabwysiadu ffordd gyfannol er mwyn gweithredu yn y ffordd fwyaf effeithiol. Yn sicr, wrth ymwneud ag adfywio cymunedol, defnyddio'r dull cyfannol yw'r modd mwyaf effeithiol o gyrraedd y nod. Yn y pen draw byddai'n rhatach, ac yn fwy effeithiol, ystyried y cyfraniad diwylliannol yn ei gyfanrwydd yn hytrach na buddsoddi arian annigonol fan hyn a fan draw mewn ychydig o fentrau celfyddydol a chwaraeon, gyda'r bwriad, mae'n debyg, o roi'r argraff bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn bwrw ymlaen ag adfywio cymunedol. Nid yw'n gwneud hynny.

Mae'n arwyddocaol nad oes gan yr adroddiad dargedau na chyllideb ar gyfer datblygiadau i'r dyfodol. Rhaid dod i'r casgliad, felly, fod hwn yn esgus gwag i wneud ychydig o addurno ffenestri ar drothwy etholiad

was an opportunity to do that after the committee had finished its deliberations.

I do not feel that that restricts my right now to say how I feel about this. It would have been better had we conducted the review in a wider context, such as cultural tourism—a context that brings economic, cultural and social elements together. I would argue that that is essential in dealing with community regeneration. You cannot deal with community regeneration without considering those factors, and the effect of cultural activity on that process. My vision for community regeneration is of using every available advantageous cultural element for the good of the community. That includes the topography, the built environment, schools, public houses, places of worship, local history, the Welsh language and lifelong learning, along with the arts and sport. Only in that way can we touch all parts of society. The interaction between these different elements would create momentum within the regeneration process, as they feed each other, and thrive in a symbiotic relationship. As these activities touch all parts of the community, the likelihood of regeneration being isolated in small areas alone is avoided.

As has been shown in many studies of subjects in the Assembly, we need to adopt a holistic approach in order to operate most effectively. Certainly, in dealing with community regeneration, a holistic approach is the most effective means of achieving our aims. In the long run it would be cheaper, and more effective, to consider the cultural contribution in its entirety rather than to invest insufficient money here and there in a few arts and sports ventures, with the intention, it seems to me, of giving the impression that the Assembly Government is instigating community regeneration. It is not.

It is significant that the report has neither targets nor a budget for future developments. It must be concluded, therefore, that this is a feeble excuse for a bit of window dressing on the eve of a general election.

cyffredinol.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I remind Members that another 12 Members wish to speak. I do not think that they will all be able to do so. Therefore where Members can make succinct speeches, I ask them to please do so.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Atgoffaf yr Aelodau fod 12 Aelod arall yn dymuno siarad. Nid wyf yn meddwl y bydd pob un ohonynt yn gallu gwneud hynny. Felly pan all Aelodau wneud areithiau cryno, gofynnaf iddynt fod garediced â gwneud hynny.

5.00 p.m.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Much is being done at the various levels of governance in this country to improve economic activity, but Labour will never say that it cannot do more and cannot push further. That is why we recognise that the creative industries have a great deal to offer in our war on want and on the poverty of aspiration. That is why this Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee report is so welcome.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Mae llawer yn cael ei wneud ar wahanol lefelau llywodraeth yn y wlad hon i wella gweithgarwch economaidd, ond ni fydd Llafur byth yn dweud na all wneud mwy ac na all wthio ymhellach. Dyna pam yr ydym yn cydnabod bod gan y diwydiannau creadigol lawer i'w gynnig yn ein brwydr yn erbyn angen a diffyg dyheadau. Dyna pam mae'r adroddiad hwn gan y Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon yn rhywbeth i'w groesawu.

We can best understand the impact that sports and culture can have on economic regeneration if we take a worldwide view. Global economics have focused advanced industrialised nations, such as Wales, away from low-skill, low-tech products and processes to technology-driven and high-value-added products and processes. The key challenge for Wales is to recognise that there is no escape from an uncompetitive position without skills and enterprise being driven up, and we must work harder and faster if we are to secure a winning position in this global race. If we are striving to be the best, we must use every tool at our disposal to deliver that economic advantage; sports and cultural regeneration are essential tools in our fight against social deprivation and economic inactivity. Once we accept that, we will be in an even better position to deliver the best future for our citizens.

Y ffordd orau i ddeall yr effaith a gaiff chwaraeon a diwylliant ar adfywiad economaidd yw drwy gymryd golwg fyd-eang. Mae economeg yn fyd-eang wedi arwain at dynnu pwyslais gwledydd diwydiannol datblygedig, megis Cymru, oddi ar gynnyrch a phrosesau sgiliau isel a thechnolegau isel gan ganolbwyntio ar gynnyrch a phrosesau sy'n seiliedig ar dechnoleg ac sy'n ychwanegu gwerth sylweddol. Yr her fawr i Gymru yw cydnabod nad oes modd dianc rhag sefyllfa anghystadluel oni bai fod sgiliau a mentergarwch yn cael eu datblygu, a bod rhaid inni weithio'n galetach ac yn gyflymach os ydym am sicrhau ein bod ar y blaen yn y ras fyd-eang hon. Os ydym yn ymdrechu i fod gyda'r gorau, mae'n rhaid inni ddefnyddio popeth sydd o fewn ein cyrraedd i sicrhau mantais economaidd; mae adfywiad ym maes chwaraeon ac adfywiad diwylliannol yn arfau hanfodol yn ein brwydr yn erbyn amddifadedd cymdeithasol ac anweithgarwch economaidd. Wedi inni dderbyn hynny, byddwn mewn sefyllfa well byth i sicrhau'r dyfodol gorau i'n dinasyddion.

The economic and social benefits of arts and cultural initiatives are tangible. They deliver better jobs and skills and drive money into deprived communities. These initiatives can

Mae manteision economaidd a chymdeithasol cynlluniau celfyddydol a diwylliannol yn amlwg. Maent yn arwain at swyddi a sgiliau gwell ac yn peri bod arian yn mynd i

also deliver a profit. There are, of course, a variety of cultural and sports enterprises that are naturally tailored to local needs, and those illustrated in the committee's report are an excellent example of that.

Community-based arts and sports projects have a great track record in up-skilling those who are returning to work. Valleys Kids provides a whole range of family support packages, such as a creche and summer and after-school clubs. It provides life skills and job-searching, health and housing surgeries. It is an excellent resource operating on the ground and is responsive to local needs. It has secured Arts Council of Wales funding because it is a cultural resource that recognises and interweaves arts and activity into its service packages.

Community-based arts and sports enterprises have a critical role to play in the economic and cultural regeneration of an area. They fully capitalise on the cultural currency of a local connection and empathy, twinned with deeper fulfilment, experienced through art and sport, which other projects may miss.

Community projects are most effective when they are accompanied and complemented by national projects with larger goals and better strategic, long-term planning. I support one initiative in particular, which has a radical, but essential, cultural and social drive at its heart, namely a people's history museum of Wales. Huw Lewis has been leading on, and championing, that museum in the Assembly for some time. If carefully implemented, the museum will deliver a cultural regeneration project that delivers in the hard economic terms of jobs, skills, inward investment and opportunity but also delivers on the cultural side by enriching Wales for the first time with a showcase for its people on their collective past. That will show how the modern history of the people of Wales is intertwined with the development of the trade union and Labour movement. This national

gymunedau difreintiedig. Gall y mentrau hyn hefyd gynhyrchu elw. Ceir amrywiaeth o fentrau ym maes diwylliant a chwaraeon sydd, wrth gwrs, wedi eu teilwrio yn naturiol i gwrdd ag anghenion lleol, ac mae'r rhai sydd wedi eu cynnwys yn adroddiad y pwyllgor yn enghreifftiau rhagorol o hynny.

Mae gan brosiectau celfyddydol a chwaraeon yn y gymuned enw da am uwchsgilio'r rhai sy'n dychwelyd i weithio. Mae Valleys Kids yn darparu amrywiaeth eang o becynnau cymorth i deuluoedd, megis meithrinfa a chlybiau haf ac ar ôl ysgol. Mae'n darparu sgiliau bywyd a chymorthfeydd chwilio am waith, iechyd a thai. Mae'n adnodd ardderchog sy'n gweithio yn y gymuned ac mae'n ymateb i anghenion lleol. Mae wedi sicrhau cyllid gan Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru am ei fod yn adnodd diwylliannol sy'n cydnabod ac yn plethu'r celfyddydau a gweithgarwch i fod yn rhan o'i becynnau gwasanaeth.

Mae mentrau celfyddydol a chwaraeon yn y gymuned wedi gwneud cyfraniad hollbwysig at adfywiad economaidd a diwylliannol ardaloedd. Maent yn manteisio i'r eithaf ar werth diwylliannol cysylltiad a chydymdeimlad lleol, ynghyd ag ymdeimlad dyfnach o foddhad, a brofir drwy'r celfyddydau a chwaraeon, rhywbeth nad yw'n digwydd mewn prosiectau eraill o bosibl.

Mae prosiectau cymunedol ar eu mwyaf effeithiol pan fyddant yn cyd-fynd â phrosiectau cenedlaethol sydd ag amcanion ehangach a chynllunio strategol, hirdymor gwell ac yn cael eu hategu gan brosiectau o'r fath. Yr wyf yn cefnogi un cynllun yn arbennig, sydd â bwriad diwylliannol a chymdeithasol sydd yn radical, ond yn hanfodol, yn ganolog iddo, sef amgueddfa hanes pobl i Gymru. Mae Huw Lewis wedi bod yn arwain y gwaith, ac yn hyrwyddo'r amgueddfa honno yn y Cynulliad ers tro. Os caiff ei gweithredu'n ofalus, bydd yr amgueddfa'n arwain at brosiect adfywio diwylliannol a fydd yn llwyddo yn economaidd o safbwynt swyddi, sgiliau, mewnfuddsoddi a chyfleoedd ond yn cyflawni ar yr ochr ddiwylliannol hefyd drwy gyfoethogi Cymru am y tro cyntaf drwy gyfrwng arddangosfa a fydd yn cyflwyno eu



museum will interact with the people on a deeper level than any static display would and will show how the achievements and struggles of the people of Wales can best prepare the next generations for the challenges ahead.

**Owen John Thomas:** From where in the report do you get the idea that concepts like this museum of the people will be financed or even supported and that the remit is wide enough to encompass it? That was the point that I made. Those concepts are not there to be developed. This is too narrow and there is no money.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** I do not accept your analysis. I believe that the museum has been properly thought through and will be financed accordingly. [*Interruption.*] I am sorry that you find that amusing.

The museum will have too many benefits for me to list in the short time that I have today.

To show how all-party I am, I will end with Churchill's words that it is only by building the present upon the image of the past that we can hope to face up to the challenges of the future.

Culture and sport have a great deal to contribute to the regeneration of our communities and we must ensure that that opportunity is not missed. I welcome this report and commend it to the Assembly.

**Lisa Francis:** I thank the committee Chair, secretariat, and everyone who contributed to this report. The evidence that emerged showed that very little data has been collected over the years which analyses, or gives accurate pictures of, how art and sport can contribute to regenerating and revitalising a community. I hope that the production of this report will reverse that trend. It is of paramount importance that the Welsh Assembly Government takes a holistic approach to the regeneration of communities,

cyd-orffennol i'r bobl. Bydd yn dangos sut y mae datblygu'r undebau llafur a'r mudiad Llafur wedi bod yn rhan annatod o hanes modern pobl Cymru. Bydd yr amgueddfa genedlaethol hon yn rhyngweithio â'r bobl ar lefel ddyfnach nag a wnâi unrhyw arddangosfa statig a bydd yn dangos sut y gall llwyddiannau ac ymdrechion pobl Cymru helpu i baratoi'r cenedlaethau nesaf ar gyfer heriau'r dyfodol.

**Owen John Thomas:** Ym mha ran o'r adroddiad y cewch y syniad y bydd cysyniadau fel yr amgueddfa hon yn cael eu hariannu neu hyd yn oed eu cefnogi a bod y cylch gwaith yn ddigon eang i'w chwmpasu? Dyna'r pwynt a wneuthum. Nid yw'r cysyniadau yno i gael eu datblygu. Mae hyn yn rhy gyfyng ac nid oes arian ar gael.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Nid wyf yn derbyn eich dadansoddiad. Yr wyf yn credu bod yr amgueddfa wedi cael ei hystyried yn drylwyr ac y bydd yn cael ei hariannu'n briodol. [*Torri ar draws.*] Mae'n ddrwg gennyf eich bod yn gweld hyn yn ddoniol.

Bydd manteision yr amgueddfa'n rhy niferus imi eu rhestru yn yr amser byr sydd gennyf heddiw.

Er mwyn dangos pa mor ambleidiol yr wyf, diweddaf gyda geiriau Churchill mai dim ond drwy adeiladu'r presennol ar lun y gorffennol y gallwn obeithio wynebu heriau'r dyfodol.

Mae gan ddiwylliant a chwaraeon lawer i'w gyfrannu at adfywiad ein cymunedau ac mae'n rhaid inni sicrhau nad yw'r cyfle'n cael ei golli. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r adroddiad hwn ac yn ei gymeradwyo i'r Cynulliad.

**Lisa Francis:** Diolchaf i Gadeirydd y pwyllgor, yr ysgrifenyddiaeth, a phawb a gyfrannodd at yr adroddiad hwn. Dangosodd y dystiolaeth a gafwyd mai ychydig iawn o ddata sydd wedi ei gasglu dros y blynyddoedd sy'n dadansoddi, neu sy'n cyfleu darlun cywir o'r modd y gall y celfyddydau a chwaraeon gyfrannu at adfywio a bywiogi cymunedau. Gobeithiaf y bydd cynhyrchu'r adroddiad hwn yn gwrthdroi'r duedd honno. Mae'n hanfodol bwysig bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n

arts and sports. To do this, guidance needs to be issued, based on advice from real people in the field. In future, it is essential that we have an audit of what is being supported through public funds for art and sports activity in community regeneration.

In the course of this review, I was pleased to visit Community Arts Rhayader and District. This showed the need for long-term projects that give communities and their localities a real sense of ownership. For example, the local history and heritage element has become an enormous part of what CARAD represents to Rhayader, especially since the closure of the town's museum. History, old photos and memorabilia are all shared in educational talks and visits through CARAD. People developed a sense of real pride in their heritage and groups of people who might never otherwise have even thought to speak to each other are brought together through opportunities like this. The very young are interacting with the very old. We see education and exchange; for example, Dai Jones shows little Johnny Evans how a sheep was shorn when he was an agricultural labourer back in the 1950s, and little Johnny shows Dai in return how to surf the net. CARAD showed us all kinds of things, such as senior citizens doing have-a-go Shakespeare, an army of volunteers helping to set up arts exhibitions, attracting coach tours to the area, disaffected youths, whose school teachers had given up on them, doing drama, going on to win competitions, and, in some cases, even rewriting drama. These are all positive benefits to social inclusion. Overall, there was a real sense that whatever else went wrong in a person's life, somebody out there in the community recognised their worth, believed that they had a worthwhile contribution to make, and, in short, cared about them and their future. How do you begin to measure that or put a price on it?

mabwysiadu ymagwedd gyfannol tuag at adfywio cymunedau, y celfyddydau a chwaraeon. Er mwyn gwneud hyn, dylid cyhoeddi canllawiau, yn seiliedig ar gyngor pobl go iawn yn y maes. Yn y dyfodol, mae'n hollbwysig bod archwiliad yn cael ei gynnal o'r hyn sy'n cael ei gefnogi drwy arian cyhoeddus ar gyfer gweithgareddau celfyddydol a chwaraeon mewn adfywio cymunedol.

Yn ystod yr adolygiad hwn, yr oeddwn yn falch o gael ymweld â Chelfyddydau Cymunedol Rhaeadr Gwy a'r Cylch. Dangosodd hyn fod angen prosiectau tymor hir sy'n rhoi ymdeimlad gwirioneddol o berchnogaeth i gymunedau a'u cymdogaethau. Er enghraifft, mae'r elfen hanes lleol a threftadaeth wedi datblygu'n rhan bwysig dros ben o'r hyn y mae CARAD yn ei olygu i Raeadr Gwy, yn enwedig ers cau amgueddfa'r dref. Mae hanes, hen luniau a chreiriau i gyd yn cael eu rhannu mewn anerchiadau ac ymweliadau addysgiadol drwy CARAD. Datblygodd ymhlith pobl ymdeimlad o wir falchder yn eu treftadaeth ac mae grwpiau o bobl na fyddent o bosibl wedi hyd yn oed ystyried siarad â'i gilydd fel arall yn cael eu dwyn ynghyd drwy gyfleoedd fel hyn. Mae'r ifanc iawn yn dod i gysylltiad â'r hen iawn. Gwelwn addysg a chyfnewid profiadau; er enghraifft, mae Dai Jones yn dangos i Johnny Evans bach sut yr oedd defaid yn cael eu cneifio pan oedd yn was fferm yn y 1950au, ac mae Johnny yn ei dro yn dangos i Dai sut y mae syrffio'r rhyngurwyd. Dangosodd CARAD bob math o bethau i ni, megis pensiynwyr yn rhoi cynnig ar Shakespeare, byddin o wirfoddolwyr yn helpu i sefydlu arddangosfeydd celf a denu teithiau bws i'r ardal, pobl ifanc wedi eu dadrithio, a'u hathrawon ysgol wedi digalonni â hwy, yn dechrau ymddiddori mewn drama, ac yn mynd yn eu blaen i ennill cystadlaethau ac, mewn rhai achosion, yn ailysgrifennu dramâu hyd yn oed. Mae'r rhain i gyd yn fanteision positif sy'n deillio o gynhwysiant cymdeithasol. Drwyddi draw, beth bynnag arall a oedd wedi mynd o'i le ym mywyd rhywun, yr oedd gwir ymdeimlad bod rhywun yn y gymuned yn sylweddoli eu gwerth, yn credu bod ganddynt gyfraniad gwerth chweil i'w wneud ac, yn syml, yn meddwl amdanynt hwy a'u dyfodol. Sut y mae dechrau mesur neu brisio hynny?

CARAD showed that it was interested in economic diversification and was commercially aware, offering local bed and breakfast establishments the chance to purchase brochures and leaflets through its photography and printing section. Its evolution over 20 years from a small enthusiastic drama group to what it is today, showed that it had become an essential and integral part of Rhayader itself, and, in many ways, putting Rhayader on the map. There is no longer a perception that this town is only famous for sheep, dams, a good chip shop or a good stopping-off point between north and south Wales. It is long term projects such as CARAD which demonstrate how the success of each scheme is truly determined by the needs and wishes of the local community.

Apart from problems attracting sponsorship—unfortunately, for some reason, community arts and sports projects are never seen as particularly sexy, compared with ballet or motor racing—there is obviously the problem of lottery funding. When applying for grants, all community groups which gave evidence complained about how they are continually distracted and blown off course by that. Many donated a lot of time and energy to tapping into, and applying for, funding, only to be disappointed. The insecurity of this destabilises organisations and places huge stresses on staff as they wonder if keeping their own job is dependent on attracting funding. When that funding was not forthcoming, participants somehow felt as if it was their fault—that they had done something wrong. We saw confidence, aspirations and expectations being raised and then falling short. Accessing funding is important to support these projects. The funding system is far too complex at present, and funding policies must be more flexible.

As far as local authorities were concerned, there seemed to be a distinct lack of recognition of the importance of the arts. As Rosemary said, if a council thinks that cuts have to be made, arts projects are often the

Dangosodd CARAD fod ganddo ddiddordeb mewn arallgyfeirio economaidd a bod ganddo feddwl masnachol hefyd, drwy roi cyfle i letyau gwely a brecwast brynu llyfrynau a thafenni drwy ei adran ffotograffiaeth ac argraffu. Wrth iddo esblygu dros 20 mlynedd o fod yn grŵp drama bach ond brwdfrydig i'r hyn ydyw heddiw, mae wedi dangos ei fod bellach yn rhan hanfodol ac anhepgor o Raeadr Gwy ac, mewn sawl ffordd, mae'n rhoi Rhaeadr Gwy ar y map. Nid yw pobl bellach yn credu mai'r unig beth sy'n dod ag enwogrwydd i'r dref yw ei defaid, ei hargaeau, ei siop sglodion dda a rhywle da i orffwys ar daith rhwng y Gogledd a'r De. Prosiectau hirdymor fel CARAD sy'n dangos sut y mae llwyddiant pob cynllun yn cael ei fesur yn ôl anghenion a dymuniadau'r gymuned leol.

Ar wahân i'r problemau o geisio denu nawdd—yn anffodus, am ryw reswm, nid yw prosiectau celfyddydau a chwaraeon yn y gymuned yn cael eu gweld yn rhai apelgar iawn, o'u cymharu â bale neu rasio ceir—mae cyllid y loteri yn broblem amlwg. Wrth wneud cais am grantiau, yr oedd pob grŵp cymunedol a gyflwynodd dystiolaeth yn cwyno bod hynny yn mynd â'u sylw ac yn eu gyrru oddi ar y trywydd. Yr oedd llawer wedi rhoi llawer o amser ac ymdrech i chwilio am nawdd a gwneud cais amdano, ac yr oeddent yn cael eu siomi yn y diwedd. Mae'r ansicrwydd sy'n deillio o hyn yn cael effaith andwyol ar sefydlogrwydd mudiadau ac yn rhoi straen mawr ar y staff wrth iddynt ddyfalu a yw cadw eu swyddi yn ddibynnol ar ddenu cyllid. A phan ddaeth yn amlwg nad oeddent am gael yr arian, yr oedd y cyfranogwyr yn teimlo mai hwy oedd ar fai—eu bod wedi gwneud rhywbeth o'i le. Yr oeddem yn gweld hyder, dyheadau a disgwyliadau'n cael eu codi ac yna'n eu gweld yn cael eu dryllio yn y diwedd. Mae cael gafael ar gyllid yn bwysig i gefnogi'r prosiectau hyn. Mae'r system gyllido yn llawer rhy gymhleth ar hyn o bryd, ac mae'n rhaid i bolisiau cyllido fod yn fwy hyblyg.

O safbwynt yr awdurdodau lleol, mae'n ymddangos nad ydynt yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd y celfyddydau. Fel y dywedodd Rosemary, os yw cyngor yn teimlo bod rhaid cwotgi, prosiectau celfyddydol yw'r cyntaf i

first to go. I do not know why, but arts projects are somehow considered wussy in the general scheme of things. Therefore, it is important that that does not happen.

5.10 p.m.

Finally, the overwhelming principle of arts and sports regeneration, which I learned from this review, is that little attention is paid to the value-for-money factor. Investing in people through projects such as these is long-term investment. The truth is that you do not need to spend shed-loads of money to get major benefits.

**Denise Idris Jones:** I too thank all of those who contributed to this report and will concentrate on local examples, as I am sure we all have, of how arts and sports contribute to regeneration.

Although, as the report notes, the contribution of arts and sports to regeneration is not fully recognised by the Welsh Assembly Government, there is strong, implicit recognition of the link in our local communities. In Llandudno, for example, an area that is perceived to be extremely prosperous, there are two Communities First areas. However, the new John Bright School has a large community and sports extension, which accommodates the wider community.

Tŷ Llywelyn community centre is financed by the Welsh Assembly Government and was opened by Edwina Hart. It brings the community together through art and drama. Conwy's health strategy is being introduced to the community through a rap opera, highlighting issues such as drug abuse, anti-social behaviour, obesity and domestic violence. The cast includes excluded pupils, and involves all age groups in the community from 10 to 60 years of age, bridging a divide and breaking down stereotypes. It is also an example of how art can bring together the community with real unity. Although the rap opera was written by a professional and

fynd yn aml. Nid wyf yn gwybod pam, ond mae prosiectau celfyddydol rywsut yn cael eu hystyried yn bethau gwantan o'u cymharu â'r darlun mawr. Mae'n bwysig, felly, nad yw hynny'n digwydd.

Yn olaf, egwyddor sylfaenol adfywio celfyddydol a chwaraeon, rhywbeth a ddysgais o'r adolygiad hwn, yw mai ychydig o sylw sy'n cael ei roi i'r ffactor gwerth am arian. Mae buddsoddi mewn pobl drwy brosiectau fel y rhain yn fuddsoddiad hirdymor. Y gwir yw nad oes rhaid i chi wario llond lle o arian i sicrhau manteision mawr.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Diolchaf finnau hefyd i bawb sydd wedi cyfrannu at yr adroddiad hwn a byddaf yn canolbwyntio ar enghreifftiau lleol, fel y mae pob un ohonom wedi gwneud, yr wyf yn siŵr, o sut y mae'r celfyddydau a chwaraeon yn cyfrannu at adfywio.

Er nad yw cyfraniad y celfyddydau a chwaraeon at adfywio, fel y mae'r adroddiad yn nodi, yn cael ei gydnabod yn llawn gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, ceir cydnabyddiaeth gref, ddigwestiwn, o'r cysylltiad yn ein cymunedau lleol. Yn Llandudno, er enghraifft, ardal sy'n cael ei hystyried gan lawer yn un eithriadol o ffyniannus, mae dwy ardal Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Fodd bynnag, cafwyd estyniad cymunedol a chwaraeon mawr yn yr Ysgol John Bright newydd, sy'n cael ei ddefnyddio gan y gymuned ehangach.

Mae canolfan gymuned Tŷ Llywelyn yn cael ei hariannu gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ac fe'i hagorwyd gan Edwina Hart. Mae'n dod â'r gymuned at ei gilydd drwy gyfrwng y celfyddydau a drama. Mae strategaeth iechyd Conwy'n cael ei chyflwyno i'r gymuned drwy opera rap, gan dynnu sylw at bynciau pwysig megis camddefnyddio cyffuriau, ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol, gordewdra a thrais yn y cartref. Mae'r cast yn cynnwys disgyblion sydd wedi eu gwahardd o'r ysgol, ac mae'n cynnwys pob grŵp oedran yn y gymuned o 10 i 60 oed, gan bontio gagendor a chwalu stereoteipiau. Mae hefyd yn enghraifft o sut y

experienced poet, the lyrics were put together by young people in the community. The whole project highlights how drama can be used as a new tool to tackle anti-social issues.

The use of sport in the Tudno ward has also proved hugely effective, with the Llandudno Football Club located in the middle of the ward, bringing a diverse profile of the community together—men and women, young and old. I regularly discuss the deprived Communities First area of Maesgeirchen in Bangor in my constituency. That estate has had a new lease of life through a healthy living centre, initiated by the Welsh Assembly Government. For many years, the community has been drawn together by its boxing club. Until now, club members have had to do all of their practising in an old garage, but the Minister and I are working on this along with the Sports Council for Wales and soon, funding will be available to provide the club with proper premises.

I, therefore, look forward to the strengthening of such community programmes, which educate, integrate, entertain, contribute to health and wellbeing and uncover talent in the community under the additional support of Welsh Assembly Government measures; I endorse the recommendations of the report.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn, a diolchaf i'r Cadeirydd a'r staff ac i'r holl grwpiau a thystion fu gerbron y pwyllgor. Bu'n brofiad personol, unigryw, diddorol ac addysgol, yn enwedig ein hymweliad â Ballymoon yn Nulyn a chanolfan Phoenix yn Abertawe, heb sôn am y canolfannau yn fy ardal i, ym Mhlas Madog a Pharc Caia. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn gwrandao ar ein pryderon ac yn buddsoddi i weithredu argymhellion y pwyllgor er mwyn sicrhau bod grwpiau celfyddydol a chwaraeon lleol yn gallu datblygu a bwrw ymlaen â'u gwaith cymunedol effeithiol

Community regeneration is a vital ingredient of improving the quality of life of many

gall celfyddyd ddod â chymuned at ei gilydd. Er bod yr opera rap wedi ei hysgrifennu gan fardd proffesiynol a phrofiadol, crewyd y geiriau gan bobl ifanc yn y gymuned. Mae'r prosiect yn ei gyfanrwydd yn dangos sut y gellir defnyddio drama fel cyfrwng newydd i fynd i'r afael â phroblemau ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol.

Mae'r defnydd o chwaraeon yn ward Tudno hefyd wedi bod yn effeithiol dros ben, a Chlwb Pêl-Droed Llandudno wedi ei leoli yng nghanol y ward, gan dynnu proffil amrywiol y gymuned at ei gilydd—yn ddyinion a merched, yn hen ac ifanc. Byddaf yn sôn am ardal ddifreintiedig Cymunedau yn Gyntaf Maesgeirchen, Bangor yn fy etholaeth yn aml. Mae'r stad hon wedi cael ei hadfywio yn sgîl y ganolfan byw'n iach, a sefydlwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Ers blyneddau lawer, mae'r clwb paffio wedi dod â'r gymuned at ei gilydd. Tan yn ddiweddar, yr oedd yr aelodau'n gorfod ymarfer mewn hen garej, ond mae'r Gweinidog a minnau'n gweithio ar y mater hwn gyda Chyngor Chwaraeon Cymru a chyn hir, bydd arian ar gael i sicrhau adeilad addas i'r clwb.

Yr wyf, felly, yn edrych ymlaen at gryfhau rhaglenni cymunedol o'r fath, sy'n addysgu, yn integreiddio, yn diddanu, yn cyfrannu at iechyd a lles ac yn darganfod talent yn y gymuned gyda chefnogaeth ychwanegol mesurau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru; yr wyf yn cefnogi argymhellion yr adroddiad.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I welcome the report and thank the Chair and the staff and all the groups and witnesses that came before the committee. It has been a personal, unique, interesting and educational experience, particularly our visit to Ballymoon in Dublin and to the Phoenix centre in Swansea, not to mention centres in my area, in Plas Madog and Caia Park. I hope that the Minister will listen to our concerns and will invest in order to implement the recommendations of the committee to ensure that arts and sports groups on a local level can develop and continue with their effective and efficient community work

Mae adfywio cymunedol yn elfen hanfodol er mwyn gwella ansawdd bywyd llawer o

communities throughout Wales. I have mentioned Plas Madoc and Caia Park, but I probably do not have time to eulogise as some other Assembly Members have so admirably eulogised.

From the evidence given, we have some wonderful community activities and programmes throughout Welsh communities, and I salute them all for their huge commitment and dedication to their local communities. However, Minister, neither you nor the Welsh Assembly Government can duck the funding issue. When will you close the gap between rhetoric and reality? Short-term initiatives and constant bidding invariably saps energy from these wonderful groups, and often removes key staff from managing many worthwhile programmes. The plea to the Assembly Government is for at least five-year funding for the recommendations in our report, with appropriate exit strategies drawn up to maintain the original development. Another plea is for WAG funding to be simplified and to be more flexible to fit in with local initiatives and developments.

Proper recognition should be given by the Assembly Government to community art in Wales through additional funding and support. The committee chair, Rosemary Butler, quoted Denbighshire County Council, which I was also going to quote. Therefore, to quote another organisation, the Audit Commission in Wales asserts that regeneration work to date has identified a lack of linkages between regeneration and key community initiatives, resulting in a lost opportunity to strengthen regeneration initiatives and the potential to maximise external funding opportunities.

The Welsh Association of Community Arts also asserts that the future of many community artists is under threat because of the current reduction in funding available from the national lottery.

Gobeithio eich bod yn gwrando ar y pryderon, Weinidog, ac y cawn eich sicrwydd y byddwch chi a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cynorthwyo ac yn cefnogi grwpiau lleol i gael gafael ar arian i ddatblygu ac i ddal ati

gymunedau ledled Cymru. Yr wyf wedi crybwyll Plas Madog a Pharc Caia, ond mae'n debyg nad oes gennyf amser i ganmol yn yr un ffordd ag y mae rhai o Aelodau eraill y Cynulliad wedi gwneud mor gampus.

Yn ôl y dystiolaeth a roddwyd, mae gennym weithgareddau a rhaglenni cymunedol rhagorol mewn cymunedau ym mhob cwr o Gymru, ac yr wyf yn edmygu pob un ohonynt am eu hymrwymiad a'u hymroddiad i'w cymunedau lleol. Fodd bynnag, Weinidog, ni allwch chi na Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru osgoi mater cyllido. Pa bryd y caewch y bwlch rhwng rhethreg a realaeth? Mae'n anochel bod cynlluniau tymor byr a bidio parhaus yn llethu'r grwpiau ardderchog hyn, ac mae'n aml yn tynnu staff allweddol oddi wrth eu gwaith o reoli llawer o raglenni gwerth chweil. Ymbilir ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad am gyllid am o leiaf bum mlynedd ar gyfer yr argymhellion yn ein hadroddiad, gyda strategaethau ymadael priodol yn cael eu llunio i gynnal y datblygiad gwreiddiol. Erfynnir hefyd am symleiddio cyllid Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'i wneud yn fwy hyblyg er mwyn iddo weddu'n well i gynlluniau a datblygiadau lleol.

Dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad roi cydnabyddiaeth briodol i gelfyddydau cymunedol yng Nghymru trwy gyllid a chymorth ychwanegol. Dyfynnodd cadeirydd y pwyllgor, Rosemary Butler, Gyngor Sir Ddinbych, ac yr oeddwn innau hefyd am ei ddyfynnu. Felly, a dyfynnu sefydliad arall, mae'r Comisiwn Archwilio yng Nghymru yn haeru bod y gwaith adfywio a wnaethpwyd hyd yn hyn wedi dangos diffyg cysylltiadau rhwng adfywio a chynlluniau cymunedol allweddol, sydd wedi arwain at gollu cyfle i gryfhau cynlluniau adfywio a'r potensial i fanteisio ar gyfleoedd cyllido allanol.

Mae Cymdeithas Celfyddydau Cymunedol Cymru hefyd yn honni bod dyfodol llawer o artistiaid cymunedol yn y fantol oherwydd y gostyngiad presennol yn yr arian sydd ar gael oddi wrth y loteri genedlaethol.

I hope that you are listening to these concerns, Minister, and that you will give an assurance that you and the Assembly Government will assist and support local groups in accessing funding for development

gyda'r gwaith hanfodol a chadarnhaol sy'n digwydd yn ein cymunedau. Mae'r gwaith hwn yn haeddu eich cefnogaeth.

In a co-operative spirit, I urge you to enact these positive recommendations, and to secure a more long-term and viable future for as many as possible of the deserving communities in Wales that promote community arts and sport.

**Val Lloyd:** In view of the time and the number of Members wishing to contribute, I will concentrate on a few facts. I am not a member of the committee, and I thank it for its report, which made interesting reading. The opportunity must now be taken to translate advice into action within our local communities.

A key issue is the participation of women in sport. To forge ahead with community regeneration, we must ensure that inclusivity is at the core of the policies. The Assembly is rightly taking the lead in tackling the gender inequality embedded in sport, especially in disadvantaged communities. Traditionally, funding has been geared towards male sports such as football, rugby and cricket. Even though I am very fond of cricket, I still recognise the inequalities. Many women's sports teams find themselves unable to access funding because they do not have permanent facilities. This can stunt development and leave clubs facing an uncertain future. For example, women's netball clubs often rely on facilities belonging to others, which can lead to uncertainty and underdevelopment. This issue is currently prominent in my constituency and in other Swansea constituencies, where over 600 women members of the Swansea netball league are facing an uncertain future, at a time when we are encouraging females to become and remain more active.

Sports development has the potential to deliver significant economic, social and health benefits. We must work to embed

and in continuing with the essential and positive work being undertaken in our communities. This work deserves your support.

Mewn ysbryd o gydweithrediad, yr wyf yn pwysu arnoch i weithredu'r argymhellion adeiladol hyn, ac i sicrhau dyfodol mwy hirdymor a dichonadwy i gynifer â phosibl o'r cymunedau haeddiannol yng Nghymru sy'n hyrwyddo celfyddydau a chwaraeon yn y gymuned.

**Val Lloyd:** Gan gadw mewn cof fod amser yn brin a nifer o Aelodau am gyfrannu, yr wyf am ganolbwyntio ar ychydig o ffeithiau. Nid wyf yn aelod o'r pwyllgor, a diolchaf iddo am ei adroddiad, a oedd yn ddiddorol i'w ddarllen. Rhaid inni yn awr achub ar y cyfle i roi'r cyngor a geir ynddo ar waith yn ein cymunedau lleol.

Un pwnc pwysig yw cyfranogiad merched mewn chwaraeon. Er mwyn bwrw ymlaen ag adfywiad cymunedol, rhaid inni sicrhau bod cynhwysiant yn ganolog i'r polisiau. Mae'r Cynulliad, fel y dylai, yn cymryd yr awenau wrth fynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldeb rhwng y rhywiau mewn chwaraeon, yn enwedig mewn cymunedau difreintiedig. Yn draddodiadol, mae'r cyllid wedi canolbwyntio ar chwaraeon dynion megis pêl-droed, rygbi a chriced. Er fy mod yn hoff iawn o griced, yr wyf, er hynny, yn dal i weld yr anghydraddoldebau hyn. Mae llawer o dimau chwaraeon merched yn ei chael yn anodd cael gafael ar arian oherwydd nad oes ganddynt gyfleusterau parhaol. Gall hyn gael effaith andwyol ar ddatblygiad clybiau sy'n golygu bod eu dyfodol yn ansicr. Er enghraifft, mae clybiau pêl-rwyd merched yn aml yn dibynnu ar gyfleusterau sy'n eiddo i eraill, sy'n gallu arwain at ansicrwydd yn ogystal ag amharu ar eu datblygiad. Ceir enghreifftiau o hyn yn fy etholaeth ac mewn etholaethau eraill yn Abertawe, lle mae dros 600 o aelodau cynghrair pêl-rwyd Abertawe'n wynebu dyfodol ansicr, a ninnau ar yr un pryd yn annog merched i gymryd rhan a pharhau i gymryd rhan mewn gweithgareddau corfforol.

Gall datblygu chwaraeon arwain at fanteision sylweddol yn economaidd, yn gymdeithasol ac o ran iechyd. Rhaid inni weithio i wreiddio

sport in our communities, removing the barriers deterring women from engaging in sport. I hope that the committee's report will act as a catalyst for change—change that uses the arts and sports as a foundation for community regeneration, and as a driver for integration. We must use the report's findings to promote equity in the uneven playing field of opportunity in this sphere that has developed between women and men.

**Glyn Davies:** I also welcome the report, and particularly welcome its focus on the importance of art and sport as an engine for regeneration. Between 1989 and 1994, I served as chairman of a body called the Development Board for Rural Wales. I have, on several occasions, criticised the decision in 1998 to abolish that board, principally because of its effect on the mid Wales economy. Some of the consequences of its abolition are now being seen in mid Wales. Another reason for my criticism was the loss of a specific approach to development, namely the importance attached to social development as part of the development of the whole area. It was a unique approach that has not been replicated.

5.20 p.m.

Art and sport are hugely important in their own right. However, the reason that I wanted to contribute to this debate was to speak about the importance of the broad, holistic approach to development as a whole. A commitment to social development is fundamental to economic development. The Welsh Office did not support this approach at the time, as it preferred to count the number of square feet that had been developed in a year. It did not appreciate the consequences of investment in economic development. However, the development board was abolished, and we lost that approach. This discussion brings that to the fore, and I hope that it is acted upon.

The broad approach to economic development makes it more acceptable to locals. I was in Pwllheli last week, where

chwaraeon yn ddwfn yn ein cymunedau gan ddileu'r rhwystrau sy'n cadw merched rhag cymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon. Gobeithiaf y bydd adroddiad y pwyllgor yn sbarduno newid—newid sy'n defnyddio'r celfyddydau a chwaraeon yn sylfaen ar gyfer adfywio cymunedol, ac yn sbarduno integreiddio. Rhaid inni ddefnyddio canfyddiadau'r adroddiad i hybu cydraddoldeb mewn maes lle nad yw merched a dynion yn cael yr un cyfle i gymryd rhan ar hyn o bryd.

**Glyn Davies:** Yr wyf finnau hefyd yn croesawu'r adroddiad, yn enwedig ei bwyslais ar bwysigrwydd y celfyddydau a chwaraeon wrth arwain adfywiad. Rhwng 1989 ac 1994, yr oeddwn yn gadeirydd corff o'r enw Bwrdd Datblygu Cymru Wledig. Yr wyf, ar sawl achlysur, wedi beirniadu'r penderfyniad a wnaethpwyd yn 1998 i ddiddymu'r bwrdd hwnnw, yn bennaf oherwydd effaith y penderfyniad ar economi'r Canolbarth. Mae rhai o ganlyniadau'r cam hwnnw i'w gweld yn y Canolbarth yn awr. Rheswm arall dros fy meirniadaeth oedd bod ymagwedd benodol tuag at ddatblygu wedi'i cholli, sef y pwysigrwydd a roddid ar ddatblygu cymdeithasol fel rhan o ddatblygu'r ardal gyfan. Yr oedd hon yn ymagwedd unigryw nad yw wedi ei hefelychu ers hynny.

Mae'r celfyddydau a chwaraeon yn bwysig ynddynt eu hunain. Fodd bynnag, fy rheswm dros gyfrannu at y ddatl hon oedd er mwyn sôn am bwysigrwydd yr ymagwedd eang, gyfannol tuag at ddatblygu yn ei gyfanrwydd. Mae ymrwymiad i ddatblygu cymdeithasol yn elfen hanfodol mewn datblygu economaidd. Nid oedd y Swyddfa Gymreig yn cefnogi'r ymagwedd hon ar y pryd, gan fod yn well ganddi gyfrif nifer y troedfeddi sgwâr a oedd wedi cael eu datblygu mewn blwyddyn. Nid oedd yn sylweddoli beth oedd canlyniadau buddsoddi mewn datblygu economaidd. Fodd bynnag, diddymwyd y bwrdd datblygu, a chollwyd yr ymagwedd honno. Mae'r drafodaeth hon yn dod â hynny i'r amlwg, a gobeithiaf y gweithredir arno.

Mae'r ymagwedd eang tuag at ddatblygu economaidd yn ei wneud yn fwy derbyniol i bobl leol. Yr oeddwn ym Mhwllheli yr



there has been huge opposition to an economic development project—a marina—with which some Members will be familiar. I understand this resistance from the point of view of it just being an economic development project, and, without corresponding investment in the community in recognition of the impact of this development, principally on the Welsh language, that resistance will remain. The only way of making economic development acceptable to all is to recognise that simply creating jobs is not enough; the social community must also be developed.

Another beneficial effect of sport is the impact that it has on racism, which continues to be a problem in Britain. Strangely, racism is most obvious in Britain on the terraces of football grounds. It is something that we do not want to see.

**John Griffiths** *rose*—

**Glyn Davies:** No, I will not take an intervention, I know what you are going to say and it is inappropriate. Would you sit down? [*Interruption.*] In case I am wrong, I will take an intervention.

**John Griffiths:** Do you agree, Glyn, that having the Show Racism the Red Card scheme in Wales would be a welcome move? This scheme was outlined at a football match for asylum seekers and residents of Butetown, which was held in Cardiff to launch the Assembly's race equality scheme.

**Glyn Davies:** Thank you, John, and I would welcome the scheme. I very much enjoyed the day that we shared with you. I know that you appreciate the way in which sport can help.

My first experience of genuine racism was on the sporting field. I was in a communal bath—which is unheard of today—at a rugby club in the midlands, and all the players in the bath were white. When a black man got into the bath, around half of the players got out. That is appalling and would not happen today. In sport, the participants do not recognise racism. Sport has a huge role to play in that.

wythnos diwethaf, lle y mae gwrthwynebiad chwyrn wedi bod i brosiect datblygu economaidd—marina—prosiect y bydd rhai Aelodau'n gyfarwydd ag ef. Gallaf ddeall y gwrthwynebiad hwn o ran y safbwynt mai prosiect datblygu economaidd yn unig ydyw, ac oni cheir buddsoddiad cyfatebol yn y gymuned i gydnabod effaith y datblygiad, ar y Gymraeg yn bennaf, bydd y gwrthwynebiad yn parhau. Yr unig ffordd o wneud datblygu economaidd yn dderbyniol i bawb yw cydnabod nad yw creu swyddi ynddo'i hun yn ddigon; rhaid datblygu'r gymuned gymdeithasol hefyd.

Un arall o effeithiau adeiladol chwaraeon yw'r effaith y mae'n ei gael ar hiliaeth, sy'n dal yn broblem ym Mhrydain. Yn rhyfedd, mae hiliaeth ar ei mwyaf amlwg ym Mhrydain ar derasau'r meysydd pêl-droed. Mae'n rhywbeth nad ydym am ei weld.

**John Griffiths** *a gododd*—

**Glyn Davies:** Na, ni dderbyniaf ymyriad. Gwn beth yr ydych am ei ddweud ac mae'n amhriodol. A wnewch eistedd? [*Torri ar draws.*] Rhag ofn fy mod yn anghywir, derbyniaf ymyriad.

**John Griffiths:** A ydych yn cytuno, Glyn, y byddai cael y cynllun Dangos y Cerdyn Coch i Hiliaeth yng Nghymru yn ddatblygiad i'w groesawu? Amlinellwyd y cynllun hwn mewn gêm bêl-droed ar gyfer ceiswyr lloches a thrigolion yn Butetown, Caerdydd, ac a gynhaliwyd yng Nghaerdydd i lansio cynllun cydraddoldeb hiliol y Cynulliad.

**Glyn Davies:** Diolch, John, a byddwn yn croesawu'r cynllun. Mwynheais y diwrnod y buom yn ei rannu gyda chi. Gwn eich bod yn gwerthfawrogi sut y gall chwaraeon helpu.

Cefais fy mhrofiad cyntaf o wir hiliaeth ar faes chwaraeon. Yr oeddwn yn y baddon cymunedol—rhywbeth dieithr iawn erbyn hyn—mewn clwb rygbi yng nghanolbarth Lloegr, ac yr oedd yr holl chwaraewyr yn y baddon yn ddynion gwyn. Pan ddaeth chwaraewr du i'r baddon, cododd tua hanner y chwaraewyr eraill a gadael. Yr oedd hynny'n ofnadwy ac ni fyddai'n digwydd heddiw. Mewn chwaraeon, nid yw'r

chwaraewyr yn cydnabod hiliaeth. Mae gan chwaraeon rôl enfawr i'w chwarae yn hynny o beth.

My final point arises from Lisa Francis's speech and her comments about the sheep shearer, an elderly man called Dai, linking in with a young computer whiz kid called Johnny. Dai was obviously a sheep shearer in the 1950s. I did not know that this was a cultural activity. I was a sheep shearer in the 1960s, and became a fairly competent shearer. Many Members will recall guessing how long it would take me to shear three sheep at the Royal Welsh Show a few years ago and offering sponsorship for me to do that. I was very pleased that I sheared three sheep in four minutes and 20 seconds. I had no idea that it was giving me the opportunity to become a cultural icon. I may concentrate on that, as it is what I might well have achieved.

Mae fy mhwynt olaf yn deillio o araith Lisa Francis a'i sylwadau am y cneifiwr defaid, hen ŵr o'r enw Dai, yn dod i gysylltiad ag athrylith ifanc ym maes cyfrifiaduron o'r enw Johnny. Yr oedd Dai yn amlwg yn gneifiwr yn y 1950au. Nid oeddwn yn sylweddoli bod hyn yn weithgarwch diwylliannol. Yr oeddwn i'n cneifio defaid yn y 1960au, a deuthum yn gneifiwr eithaf medrus. Bydd llawer o Aelodau yn cofio dyfalu faint o amser a gymerai imi gneifio tair dafad yn Sioe Amaethyddol Frenhinol Cymru ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl ac yn cynnig fy nodd i wneud y gwaith. Yr oeddwn yn falch imi lwyddo i gneifio tair dafad mewn pedwar munud ac 20 eiliad. Nid oedd gennyf syniad ei fod yn rhoi cyfle imi gael bod yn eicon diwylliadol. Efallai y canolbwyntiaf ar hynny, gan ei bod yn eithaf posibl mai dyna'r hyn y byddwn wedi ei gyflawni.

The point that I want to make is that culture is an art that covers a huge range, and almost anything can be dealt with under that title. It is clear that virtually anyone, no matter how humble their background, can aspire to real achievement in this field. All power to the Government and to the committee to the extent that they are promoting art and sport and culture in general.

Y pwynt yr wyf am ei wneud yw bod diwylliant yn gelfyddyd sy'n cynnwys pob math o bethau, a gellir ymdrin ag unrhyw beth bron o dan y teitl hwnnw. Mae'n amlwg y gall unrhyw un fwy neu lai, pa mor dlodaidd bynnag fo eu cefndir, gyflawni pethau mawr yn y maes hwn. Pob clod i'r Llywodraeth ac i'r pwyllgor am yr hyn maent wedi ei wneud i hyrwyddo'r celfyddydau a chwaraeon a diwylliant yn gyffredinol.

**John Griffiths:** I congratulate the committee on this important, welcome and timely report. Many times in Plenary, I and many others have made the point that art and sport have great potential to link with the Assembly's cross-cutting priorities and wider strategies. This report makes that point very effectively.

**John Griffiths:** Yr wyf yn llongyfarch y pwyllgor ar yr adroddiad pwysig ac amserol hwn sydd yn rhywbeth i'w groesawu. Lawer gwaith yn y Cyfarfod Llawn yr wyf fi a llawer o rai eraill wedi dweud bod posibilïadau gwych i gysylltu'r celfyddydau a chwaraeon â blaenoriaethau trawsbynciol a strategaethau ehangach y Cynulliad. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn datgan hynny mewn ffordd effeithiol iawn.

I recently visited Townhill in Swansea and was very impressed by the work undertaken there. The statistics in the report on the jobs created, the training and skills engendered there, and the advice given, show that with a sustained, long-term approach, a lot can be done and great economic and regenerative benefits can be delivered. Hopefully, a

Bûm yn ymweld â Townhill yn Abertawe yn ddiweddar a gwnaeth y gwaith sy'n cael ei wneud yno gryn argraff arnaf. Mae'r ystadegau yn yr adroddiad ynghylch y swyddi a grewyd, yr hyfforddiant a'r sgiliau sy'n cael eu meithrin yno, a'r cyngor a roddir, yn dangos sut y gellir gwneud llawer o waith da a sicrhau manteision sylweddol yn

Phoenix Centre will be established in the Communities First area of Ringland, in my constituency of Newport East, through objective 2 funding and other funding streams. It has been a long-cherished ambition to create that sort of centre in Ringland, and it would help community regeneration, partly through the arts and sports. This development will be very much in line with this report.

A lot of the struggle involved in creating this project and taking it forward is mirrored in the contents of the report, particularly as regards the difficulties around long-term funding and the necessity for more flexibility and simpler funding streams. I think that a lot of this rings bells with people who have been engaged in the Ringland project.

I wish to raise the subject of facilities, which are very important, and how communities feel threatened when there is a possible withdrawal of those facilities. Underwood Leisure Centre in Newport East is under threat because of structural problems and a requirement for major expenditure. When these threats come about, communities quickly realise the benefit that these facilities offer in terms of sport, art, general communal activity, economic benefits and so on. A threat concentrates the mind wonderfully, and it makes you think about the importance of the facility and how cross-cutting it is.

Having given the background of current developments in Newport East, I end as I began by congratulating the committee on its report and saying that there is obviously great potential for sport and art to play a big role in community regeneration. This is especially true in terms of tackling social exclusion and promoting social inclusion in areas like Ringland and Underwood in Newport East.

economaidd ac o ran adfywio drwy fabwysiadu ymagwedd hirdymor sy'n cael ei chynnal dros amser. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd Canolfan Phoenix yn cael ei sefydlu yn ardal Cymunedau yn Gyntaf Ringland, yn fy etholaeth yn Nwyrain Casnewydd, drwy gyllid amcan 2 a ffynonellau cyllid eraill. Mae wedi bod yn uchelgais ers tro sefydlu canolfan o'r fath yn Ringland, a byddai'n rhoi hwb i adfywiad cymunedol yr ardal, a hynny'n rhannol drwy'r celfyddydau a chwaraeon. Bydd y datblygiad hwn yn cydfynd â chynnwys yr adroddiad hwn.

Mae llawer o'r ymdrech a fu'n gysylltiedig â chreu a datblygu'r prosiect hwn yn cael ei hadlewyrchu yng nghynnwys yr adroddiad, yn enwedig o safbwynt yr anawsterau a wynebir wrth geisio sicrhau cyllid hirdymor a'r angen i fod yn fwy hyblyg a chael ffrydiau cyllido symlach. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd hyn yn swnio'n gyfarwydd iawn i'r bobl sydd wedi bod ynghlwm â phrosiect Ringland.

Hoffwn drafod cyfleusterau, sy'n bwysig dros ben, a sut y mae cymunedau'n teimlo o dan fygythiad os oes perygl y bydd y cyfleusterau hyn yn cael eu colli. Mae Canolfan Hamdden Underwood yn Nwyrain Casnewydd o dan fygythiad oherwydd problemau gyda'r adeiladwaith a'r angen i wario swm sylweddol ar yr adeilad. Pan ddaw'r bygythiadau hyn i'r amlwg, mae cymunedau'n fuan iawn yn gwerthfawrogi'r manteision y mae'r cyfleusterau hyn yn eu cynnig o safbwynt chwaraeon, y celfyddydau, gweithgareddau cymunedol cyffredinol, y manteision economaidd ac yn y blaen. Mae bygythiad yn sbarduno pobl i feddwl o ddifrif, ac mae'n gwneud i chi feddwl am bwysigrwydd y cyfleuster a pha mor drawsbynciol ydyw.

Ar ôl rhoi cefndir y datblygiadau presennol yn Nwyrain Casnewydd, diweddaf fel y dechreuais drwy longyfarch y pwyllgor ar ei adroddiad a dweud ei bod yn amlwg bod potensial enfawr i chwaraeon a'r celfyddydau chwarae rôl flaenllaw mewn adfywio cymunedol. Mae hyn yn arbennig o wir o ran mynd i'r afael ag allgáu cymdeithasol a hyrwyddo cynhwysiant cymdeithasol mewn ardaloedd fel Ringland ac Underwood yn Nwyrain Casnewydd.

**Jenny Randerson:** I very much welcome this report, but I was concerned, though not surprised, at some of the committee's conclusions. My concern relates to the lack of co-ordination between the Government's regeneration policies and its sports and culture policy, the lack of recognition of the role of community arts in regeneration, and the complexity of the funding situation for most organisations involved.

Sport, at least in terms of rhetoric, is now achieving its deserved position of importance, certainly in relation to the health agenda. However, the role of the arts is constantly undervalued, not even the rhetoric exists, let alone the funding that it needs to have in community regeneration terms. The committee rightly points out that 'Creative Future' and 'Climbing Higher' recognise the role of arts and sport respectively, but the Communities First strategy does not do that.

In practice, in terms of sport and the arts, a great deal is funded and initiated by local authorities. We are heavily dependant on them, though there is a variable picture across authorities. In sport, in general, local authorities are doing their best. However, in the arts, the commitment of some local authorities is minimal. I am not surprised by that, and, in a cash-strapped situation, it is always the arts funding that is most at risk—because local authorities have no legal obligation to provide it, it is an easy area to cut in bad years. Therefore, the Government should do more to provide guidance to local authorities on the role of sports and the arts in community regeneration.

5.30 p.m.

On funding, I have concerns that there have been great problems, for example, associated with the spending of European Union structural funds designated for community regeneration in general. There is an issue of a lack of capacity. These funds should be a rich source of funding for such projects. However,

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr wyf yn croesawu'r adroddiad hwn, ond yr oeddwn yn bryderus, er nad oeddwn yn synnu, o weld rhai o gasgliadau'r pwyllgor. Mae fy mhryderon yn deillio o'r diffyg cydlynad rhwng polisiau adfywio'r Llywodraeth a'i pholisi chwaraeon a diwylliant, y diffyg cydnabyddiaeth i rôl y celfyddydau cymunedol mewn adfywio, a chymhlethdod y sefyllfa o ran cyllid i'r rhan fwyaf o fudiadau sy'n gweithio yn y maes.

Mae chwaraeon, o ran y rhethreg o leiaf, bellach yn derbyn sylw haeddiannol, yn sicr o ran yr agenda iechyd. Fodd bynnag, nid yw rôl y celfyddydau'n derbyn y gydnabyddiaeth y mae'n ei haeddu, nid oes rhethreg yn bodoli hyd yn oed, heb sôn am yr arian sydd ei angen arnynt ar gyfer adfywio cymunedol. Mae'r pwyllgor yn iawn wrth ddatgan bod 'Cymru Greadigol' a 'Dringo'n Uwch' yn cydnabod rôl y celfyddydau a chwaraeon yn y drefn honno, ond nid yw strategaeth Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn gwneud hynny.

Yn ymarferol, o ran chwaraeon a'r celfyddydau, mae llawer o weithgareddau'n cael eu hariannu a'u sefydlu gan awdurdodau lleol. Yr ydym yn ddibynnol iawn arnynt, er bod y sefyllfa'n amrywio llawer o awdurdod i awdurdod. Mewn chwaraeon, yn gyffredinol, mae'r awdurdodau lleol yn gwneud eu gorau. Fodd bynnag, yn y celfyddydau, mae ymrwymiad rhai awdurdodau lleol yn bur isel. Nid yw hynny'n fy synnu, ac, mewn sefyllfa lle y mae arian yn brin, cyllid i'r celfyddydau sydd yn y fantol o hyd—am nad oes gan yr awdurdodau lleol ddyletswydd statudol i'w ddarparu, mae'n faes hawdd ei gwtogi mewn blynyddoedd main. Felly, dylai'r Llywodraeth wneud mwy i roi canllawiau i'r awdurdodau lleol ar rôl chwaraeon a'r celfyddydau yng nghyswllt adfywio cymunedol.

O ran cyllid, yr wyf yn bryderus bod problemau mawr wedi bod, er enghraifft, ynghylch gwario cronfeydd strwythurol yr Undeb Ewropeaidd a ddynodwyd ar gyfer adfywio cymunedol yn gyffredinol. Cyfyd problem diffyg capasiti. Dylai'r cyllid hwn fod yn ffynhonnell gyfoethog o gyllid i

the key point on funding is the over-reliance, out of necessity, on lottery funding, which inevitably means that, at the end of three years, just when a project has got going and is geared up and is achieving, it has to wind down again, because it has come to the end of its time. In areas that need such community regeneration, it is not possible for many of these projects to be self-sustaining.

I will end on a local note. It has been fashionable here over the years to paint a picture of Cardiff as a thriving city that does not suffer the problems of the Valleys, for example, and does not need the community regeneration work done there. There has been a cry of 'No more money for Cardiff', but there are two misconceptions here. The first is because all the calculations of money going to Cardiff are based on the fact that the money goes to the central office of a project, which is often based in Cardiff. That money is spent throughout Wales, although the postal address is in Cardiff. Secondly, and I hope that my colleague, Lorraine Barrett, will agree with me on this, Cardiff gets very little community-based arts and sports money per head of the population as a result of that first misconception, yet Cardiff has Communities First wards and considerable social and economic problems in some areas, intensified in many ways by being a big city. I, therefore, welcome the committee's recommendation of a concept of an audit of what is really going on, rather than what appears to be going on. Many areas of Cardiff have had a poor deal in terms of community regeneration money for arts and sport.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Finally, I call Huw Lewis, but on the condition that I call Rosemary to wind up at 5.35 p.m..

**Huw Lewis:** It is quite remarkable how often I am offered the two-minute fag-end of a debate. On the basis that I feel that I should be treated in exactly the same way as every other contributor, I give my time to somebody else.

brosiectau o'r fath. Fodd bynnag, y prif bwynt ynghylch cyllid yw'r gorddibynnu, o reidrwydd, ar gyllid y loteri sy'n golygu, yn anochel, ar ddiwedd y tair blynedd pan fo'r prosiect newydd gael ei gefn ato ac yn dechrau ennill ei blwyf, fod yn rhaid iddo ddirwyn i ben eto, am ei fod yn dod at ddiwedd ei oes. Mewn ardaloedd lle y mae angen adfywio cymunedol o'r fath, nid yw'n bosibl i lawer o'r prosiectau hyn gynnal eu hunain wedyn.

Gorffennaf ar nodyn lleol. Bu'n ffasiynol yma dros y blynyddoedd greu darlun o Gaerdydd fel dinas lewyrchus nad yw'n dioddef o'r un problemau â'r Cymoedd, er enghraifft, ac nad oes arni angen y gwaith adfywio cymunedol a wneir yno. Clywyd y gri "Dim mwy o arian i Gaerdydd", ond mae dwy gamdybiaeth yn hyn oll. Y gyntaf yw bod yr holl gyfrifo a wneir ynghylch arian i Gaerdydd yn seiliedig ar y ffaith bod yr arian yn mynd i swyddfa ganolog prosiect, sy'n aml wedi'i lleoli yng Nghaerdydd. Mae'r arian hwn yn cael ei wario ledled Cymru, er bod y cyfeiriad post yng Nghaerdydd. Yn ail, a gobeithio y bydd fy nghyd-Aelod, Lorraine Barrett, yn cytuno â mi ynghylch hyn, ychydig iawn o arian chwaraeon a chelfyddydau yn y gymuned am bob pen o'r boblogaeth a roddir i Gaerdydd o ganlyniad i'r gamdybiaeth honno, eto mae gan Gaerdydd wardiau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf a chryn broblemau cymdeithasol ac economaidd mewn rhai ardaloedd, sy'n waeth ar sawl ystyr am ei bod yn ddinas fawr. Yr wyf, felly, yn croesawu argymhelliad y pwyllgor i gynnal archwiliad o'r hyn sy'n digwydd mewn gwirionedd, yn hytrach na'r hyn sydd i bob golwg yn digwydd. Mae nifer o ardaloedd eraill yng Nghaerdydd sydd heb gael eu haeddiant o ran arian adfywio cymunedol i'r celfyddydau a chwaraeon.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yn olaf, galwaf ar Huw Lewis, ond ar yr amod fy mod yn galw ar Rosemary i ddirwyn i ben am 5.35pm.

**Huw Lewis:** Mae'n anhygoel pa mor aml y cynigir cynffon dau funud y ddadl imi. Ar y sail fy mod yn teimlo y dylwn gael fy nhrin yn union yr un fath â phob cyfrannwr arall, rhoddaf fy amser i rywun arall.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. There was no need for that; you have ministerial responsibilities. I would have been quite in order not to have called you at all.

**Rosemary Butler:** I thank Members for that thoughtful debate. It is obvious that we could have spent the whole afternoon talking on this subject. What has come across is that the funding must be simplified; that came across in the report, and it has come across in this afternoon's debate. It has also come across that sports and arts must be considered when all Government strategies are being developed, because sports and arts must be at the heart of Government, and not just an add-on. We do not ask for specific sums of money, but we do ask for the redirection of existing resources and a bit of creative thinking to ensure that we have a cross-cutting strategy right across the board.

Sports facilities—whether for men or for women but particularly for women as they are not as comfortable as men when it comes to taking part in sport—must be accessible and affordable. We really need to look at what is happening in Swansea at the moment, where 600 women are keen to take part in sport. The most successful regeneration projects have been arts and sports led, and that should be remembered.

I thank Members for their support. I thought that we had unanimity in the committee, and I am disappointed that Owen John has chosen not to support this report. We spent a long time discussing how broad this remit should be. If it were as broad as was suggested, we would not be finishing it within five years, never mind five months. I thank Members for their support, and I look forward to the Government taking on board some, if not all, of the recommendations that we have made. I ask Members to support the motion.

*Cynnig (NDM2390): O blaid 34, Ymatal 6, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2390): For 34, Abstain 6, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Nid oedd angen dweud hynny. Mae gennych gyfrifoldebau gweinidogol. Byddwn wedi bod yn hollol mewn trefn pe na bawn wedi eich galw o gwbl.

**Rosemary Butler:** Diolchaf i'r Aelodau am y ddadl feddylgar a gawsom. Mae'n amlwg y gallem fod wedi treulio'r prynhawn cyfan yn siarad am y pwnc. Yr hyn sy'n glir yw bod yn rhaid symleiddio'r cyllid; yr oedd hynny'n glir yn yr adroddiad, ac yn glir eto yn y ddadl y prynhawn yma. Yr hyn sydd hefyd yn amlwg yw bod yn rhaid ystyried chwaraeon a'r celfyddydau wrth ddatblygu pob strategaeth gan y Llywodraeth, gan fod angen i chwaraeon a'r celfyddydau fod wrth wraidd y Llywodraeth, ac nid yn rhyw ychwanegiad. Nid gofyn am arian penodol yr ydym, ond am ailgyfeirio'r adnoddau presennol ynghyd ag ychydig o feddwl yn greadigol i sicrhau bod gennym strategaeth drawsbynciol ym mhob maes yn gyffredinol.

Rhaid i gyfleusterau chwaraeon—boed ar gyfer dynion neu ferched, ond yn enwedig ar gyfer merched am nad ydynt mor gyffyrddus â dynion pan ddaw'n fater o gymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon—fod yn hwylus i bawb ac yn fforddiadwy. Rhaid inni edrych ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn Abertawe ar hyn o bryd, lle y mae 600 o ferched yn awyddus i gymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon. Mae'r prosiectau adfywio mwyaf llwyddiannus wedi bod yn seiliedig ar chwaraeon a'r celfyddydau, a dylid cofio hynny.

Diolchaf i'r Aelodau am eu cefnogaeth. Yr oeddwn yn meddwl bod y pwyllgor yn unfryd ar y mater hwn, a siom yw gweld bod Owen John wedi dewis peidio â chefnogi'r adroddiad hwn. Treuliwyd amser maith yn trafod pa mor eang y dylai'r cylch gwaith hwn fod. Pe bai mor eang ag a awgrymwyd, ni fyddem yn ei orffen ymhen pum mlynedd, heb sôn am bum mis. Diolchaf i'r Aelodau am eu cefnogaeth, ac edrychaf ymlaen at weld y Llywodraeth yn derbyn rhai, os nad y cwbl, o'r argymhellion a wnaed gennym. Gofynnaf i'r Aelodau gefnogi'r cynnig.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:

The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

The following Members voted against:

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â completes business for this afternoon. chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.35 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 5.35 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau  
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)

Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Law, Peter (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Marek, John (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)