



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru**  
**(Cofnod y Trafodion)**

**The National Assembly for Wales**  
**(The Record of Proceedings)**

**Dydd Mawrth, 12 Ebrill 2005**  
**Tuesday, 12 April 2005**

**Cynnwys  
Contents**

Datganiad gan y Llywydd Statement by the Presiding Officer.....	3
Teyrnedau i'r Arglwydd Callaghan Tributes to Lord Callaghan.....	3
Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister .....	8
Cwestiwn Brys Urgent Question .....	36
Datganiad Busnes Business Statement.....	43
Datganiad am MG Rover Statement on MG Rover.....	47
Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion Composite Motion: Approval of Orders.....	57
Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Y Blaid Geidwadol) Minority Party Debate (The Conservative Party).....	61
Adroddiad Blynnyddol Arolygiaeth Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru The Annual Report of the Social Services Inspectorate for Wales .....	84

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y Siambra. Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.*  
*The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

### **Datganiad gan y Llywydd** **Statement by the Presiding Officer**

**Y Llywydd:** Ers inni gyfarfod y tro diwethaf, bu farw'r Arglwydd Callaghan. Gwahoddaf y Prif Weinidog i gychwyn y teyrngedau.

**The Presiding Officer:** Since our last meeting, Lord Callaghan has passed away. I invite the First Minister to commence the tributes.

### **Teyrnedau i'r Arglwydd Callaghan** **Tributes to Lord Callaghan**

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** I have nothing but the fondest memories of Jim Callaghan, Lord Callaghan of Cardiff, the former Prime Minister, who, sadly, died during the recess. His beloved wife, Audrey, predeceased him by some 10 or 11 days. It is appropriate for us to pay tribute to his extraordinary service not only to the city of Cardiff, but also to Wales and to democratic politics in Britain and across the world.

To understand Jim, you have to understand his formative influences. He was the son of a widow at the time of the notorious widows' earnings rule, which he got rid of as soon as he came into office as Chancellor of the Exchequer in 1964. That move very much improved the lives of the children of widows, such as my wife, Julie. You must also remember that he was a trade union official. As the son of a widow, he had not been able to afford to stay on at school after the age of 15. He did not go to university, or, as he would put it in his Hampshire burr, 'univursty'. He rose through the ranks of the trade union movement in the Inland Revenue. Finally, he was a petty officer in the navy when he was selected, more than 60 years ago, before he started his career in 1945 as Member of Parliament for Cardiff South-East. As junior Minister for transport in the 1945-51 Government, he was responsible for introducing cats' eyes on our roads, which was one of those practical measures that junior Ministers sometimes have the privilege of introducing, which, although not dramatic, have an enormous impact.

**Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan):** Nid oes gennyl ond yr atgofion anwylaf am Jim Callaghan, yr Arglwydd Callaghan o Gaerdydd, y cyn-Brif Weinidog, a fu farw, gwaetha'r modd, yn ystod y toriad. Bu farw ei annwyl wraig, Audrey, ryw 10 neu 11 diwrnod o'i flaen. Mae'n briodol inni dalu teyrned i'w wasanaeth rhyfeddol, nid yn unig i ddinas Caerdydd, ond hefyd i Gymru ac i wleidyddiaeth ddemocratiaidd ym Mhrydain a ledled y byd.

Er mwyn gallu deall Jim, rhaid deall y dylanwadau ffurfiannol a fu arno. Yr oedd yn fab i weddw yng nghyfnod y rheol bondigrybwyl ynghylch enillion gweddwon, y cafodd wared arni cyn gynted ag y daeth i'w swydd yn Ganghellor y Trysorlys yn 1964. Mae'r newid hwnnw wedi gwneud llawer i wella bywydau plant gweddwon, fel fy ngwraig, Julie. Rhaid cofio hefyd ei fod yn swyddog undeb llafur. Ac yntau'n fab i weddw, ni allasai fforddio aros ymlaen yn yr ysgol wedi iddo droi'r 15 oed. Nid aeth i brifysgol, neu, i 'university', fel y byddai'n dweud yn ei acen fwyn swydd Hants. Cododd o reng i reng ym mudiad yr undebau llafur pan oedd yn gweithio i Gyllid y Wlad. Yn y diwedd, yr oedd yn is-swyddog yn y llynges pan gafodd ei ddewis, fwy na 60 mlynedd yn ôl, cyn dechrau ar ei yrfa yn 1945 yn Aelod Seneddol dros Dde-Ddwyrain Caerdydd. Ac yntau'n Is-Weinidog dros drafnidiaeth yn Llywodraeth 1945-51, ef fu'n gyfrifol am gyflwyno'r llygaid cathod ar ein ffyrdd, ac yr oedd hwnnw'n un o'r mesurau ymarferol hynny y mae Is-weinidogion weithiau'n cael y faint o'u cyflwyno, nad ydynt yn rhai trawiadol, ond sydd eto'n cael effaith

aruthrol.

I first came across Jim during the 1964 election campaign. After the late Michael Roberts, future Member for Cardiff North, had run him very close in the 1959 election, many people and additional resources were put into Cardiff South-East Labour Party in the run-up to the 1964 election. That is where I first met him and his wife, Audrey, my own wife, Julie, Neil Kinnock and his wife—Glenys Parry as she was then, Glenys Kinnock MEP as she is now—and Ted Dexter, the England cricket captain, who was the Conservative candidate at the time. The 12 months leading up to the 1964 election was a campaign and a half.

I remember the stress and strain upon him when he became Chancellor—within a month of taking office, his hair had turned white—because of the run on the pound caused by the Labour determination to increase old-age pensions. As a Home Office Minister, he brought British troops into Northern Ireland, and that at the request of the Catholic community, not the Protestant community, as you may have thought. He was also an extremely successful Foreign Secretary, and then had three years as Prime Minister. He is the only person ever to have held all four major offices of state.

I believe that Wales owes a great debt to this son of Hampshire, and adopted son of Cardiff and of Wales.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Gwerthfawrogaf y cyfle i ddweud gair o deyrnged, ac i ategu'r sylwadau a wnaed gan y Prif Weinidog ynglŷn â gyrfa Jim Callaghan. Rhaid cydnabod ei bod yn deyrnged sylweddol ynddi'i hun i fod yn Aelod Seneddol am gyfnod mor hir â Jim Callaghan; bu'n cynrychioli rhan o ddinas Caerdydd am dros 40 mlynedd. Ond gwnaeth Jim lawer yn fwy na hynny, fel y cyfeiriodd y Prif Weinidog ato. Bu iddo ddal pedair prif swydd y wlad fel Prif Weinidog, Canghellor y Trysorlys, Ysgrifennydd Cartref ac Ysgrifennydd Tramor, gan gyflawni llawer yn y swyddi hynny.

Er i Jim Callaghan ymddeol cyn i mi a'r Prif Weinidog fynd i'r Senedd yn 1987, yr wyf yn

Deuthum ar draws Jim yn gyntaf yn ystod ymgyrch etholiadol 1964. Wedi i'r diweddar Michael Roberts, a fu wedyn yn Aelod dros Ogledd Caerdydd, ddod yn agos iawn ato yn etholiad 1959, neilltuwyd llawer o bobl ac adnoddau ychwanegol i'r Blaid Lafur yn Neddwyrain Caerdydd wrth ddynesu at etholiad 1964. Yn y fan honno y cyfarfum yn gyntaf ag ef a'i wraig, Audrey, fy ngwraig fy hun, Julie, Neil Kinnock a'i wraig—Glenys Parry fel yr oedd bryd hynny, Glenys Kinnock ASE fel y mae'n awr—a Ted Dexter, capten tîm criced Lloegr, sef yr ymgeisydd Ceidwadol ar y pryd. Bu'r 12 mis cyn etholiad 1964 yn ymgyrch a hanner.

Cofiaf y straen a'r pwysau a fu arno pan ddaeth yn Ganghellor—cyn pen mis wedi iddo ymgymryd â'i swydd, yr oedd ei wallt wedi troi'n wyn—oyerwydd y gwerthu a fu ar y bunt am fod Llafur yn benderfynol o godi gwerth pensiwn yr henoed. Ac yntau'n Weinidog yn y Swyddfa Gartref, aeth â milwyr Prydain i Ogledd Iwerddon, a hynny ar gais y Catholigion, nid y Protestaniaid, fel y gallasech dybio. Bu hefyd yn Ysgrifennydd Tramor tra llwyddiannus, a chafodd dair blynedd wedyn yn Brif Weinidog. Ef yw'r unig un erioed a ddaliodd bob un o bedair prif swydd y wladwriaeth.

Credaf fod ar Gymru ddyled fawr i'r gŵr hwn a hanoedd o swydd Hants, ac a fabwysiadwyd gan Gaerdydd a chan Gymru.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** I appreciate the opportunity to say a few words in tribute, and to endorse the First Minister's comments on the career of Jim Callaghan. One must acknowledge that it is a tribute in itself to be a Member of Parliament for the length of time that Jim Callaghan was an MP; he spent more than 40 years representing part of the city of Cardiff. However, Jim did far more than that, as the First Minister noted. He held all four major offices of state, as Prime Minister, Chancellor of the Exchequer, Home Secretary and Foreign Secretary, and achieved a great deal in all those offices.

Although Jim Callaghan had retired by the time the First Minister and I went to

ymwybodol eich bod chithau, Lywydd, a Dafydd Wigley wedi bod yn Aelodau pan oedd Jim Callaghan yn Brif Weinidog. Wrth gwrs, yr oeddech yn dal y fantol yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw, ond gwn y bu cyfnod o gydweithio ar nifer o faterion a ddaeth â nifer o lwyddiannau i Gymru. Tua diwedd y cyfnod hwnnw, bu cryn dipyn o drafodaeth ar faterion o bwys. Er na lwyddodd y Mesur datganoli a gyflwynwyd gan Lywodraeth Jim Callaghan yn yr 1970au, yr oedd yn llwyfan ar gyfer y datblygiadau a ddaeth 18 mlynedd yn ddiweddarach.

Yr ydym yn falch o'r cyfle i fynegi teyrnged i yrfa hir Jim Callaghan. Mae gyrfaoedd gwleidyddol yn gallu bod yn gymysg o lwyddiannau a phethau eraill, ond sylweddolwn fod Jim Callaghan wedi gwneud diwrnod da o waith. Anfonwn ein cofion a'n dymuniadau gorau i'w deulu ar yr adeg hon.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** The passing of Lord Callaghan—Jim Callaghan, as he will always be remembered—came at the end of a life very much fulfilled not just in political terms, but in family terms. He had every reason to be a very happy man. He was a towering political figure, as the First Minister said, as the only person to hold the four great offices of state—Prime Minister, Foreign Secretary, Chancellor of the Exchequer and Home Secretary. As Prime Minister, he seemed to move above the party-political fray to become a national leader moved by great patriotism rather than by party concern.

His passing so soon after that of his beloved wife, Audrey, has moved and saddened people throughout Wales, the United Kingdom and beyond. We should also remember the sadness that must be felt by his family and close friends at this double loss within such a short period of time. I have written to Baroness Jay to convey my own sadness and that of my party, and I wish very much to be associated with the tribute of the First Minister.

Parliament in 1987, I am aware that you, Presiding Officer, and Dafydd Wigley were both Members when Jim Callaghan was Prime Minister. Of course, you held the balance of power during that time, but I know that there was a time of collaboration on several issues, which brought a great deal of success to Wales. Towards the end of that period, many discussions were held on important matters. Although the devolution Bill introduced by Jim Callaghan's Government in the 1970s did not succeed, it provided a platform for the developments that occurred 18 years later.

We welcome the opportunity to pay tribute to Jim Callaghan's long career. Political careers are mostly made up of successes and other aspects, but we all appreciate that Jim Callaghan did a good day's work. We send our regards and best wishes to his family at this time.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Daeth marwolaeth yr Arglwydd Callaghan—Jim Callaghan, fel y'i cofir bob amser—ar ddiwedd oes a roddodd fodhad mawr iddo, nid yn unig o ran gwleidyddiaeth, ond o ran ei fywyd teuluol hefyd. Yr oedd ganddo bob rheswm i fod yn ddyn tra bodlon. Yr oedd yn gawr o ffigwr gwleidyddol, fel y dywedodd y Prif Weinidog, gan mai ef yw'r unig un a ddaliodd bedair prif swydd y wladwriaeth—y Prif Weinidog, yr Ysgrifennydd Tramor, Canghellor y Trysorlys a'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref. Fel Prif Weinidog, ymddangosai ei fod yn symud uwchlaw'r ymryson gwleidyddol gan ddod yn arweinydd cenedlaethol a ysgogid gan wladgarwch mawr yn hytrach na gofal am ei blaidd.

Mae'r ffaith ei fod wedi marw cyn gynted ar ôl ei annwyl wraig, Audrey, wedi cyffwrdd a thristâu pobl ledled Cymru, y Deyrnas Unedig a'r tu hwnt. Dylem hefyd gofio'r tristwch y mae ei deulu a'i ffrindiau agos yn sier o'i deimlo ynghylch colli'r ddau o fewn cyfnod mor fyr. Yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at y Farwnes Jay gan gyfleo fy nhristwch i a thristwch fy mhlaid, a mawr ddymunaf gael fy nghysylltu â theyrnged y Prif Weinidog.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** I join the tributes to Jim Callaghan. My knowledge of Jim was as a candidate in the neighbouring constituency in two general elections. Perhaps one of the early lessons to be learnt in politics is how to be dignified in defeat. When the 1979 general election was lost, I was present in City Hall when the news was conveyed to him, as was the world's media. He behaved in a manner that those who knew him would describe as typical of a man of great fortitude and strength. Interestingly enough, during his period as Prime Minister for just over three years, his party had no real majority in Parliament. This caused difficulties, which he later shared in the book that he wrote after leaving the House of Commons. When you have someone who served the capital city of Wales and who reached the high office of Prime Minister, it is important that we all bow our heads in the sense of dignity, purpose and strength that politicians such as Jim displayed. He represented the whole of the United Kingdom well and had his roots in Welsh politics.

Jim Callaghan was a man of amazing turn of phrase. He was perhaps caught out, as the First Minister mentioned, with the run on the pound. Coming off a plane once, he made the quip about a lie being conjured up in a few moments and that it could be halfway around the world before truth got its boots on. However, the remark that I will cherish is this:

‘The sky turned black with the flapping wings of chickens coming home to roost’.

This will always remind me of a man who served his country and city, and the people of Wales, well.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Thank you for the opportunity to say a few words about Lord Callaghan, who represented Cardiff South and Penarth with its various boundary changes from 1945 to 1987. I got to know Jim very well from 1981, when Penarth was brought back into the constituency. I soon realised how fond constituents were of Jim, and of Audrey, who really was his soul mate.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Ymunaf â'r teyrnedau i Jim Callaghan. Yr wyf fi'n cofio Jim fel ymgeisydd yn yr etholaeth nesaf mewn dau etholiad cyffredinol. Efallai mai un o'r gwersi cyntaf y dylid eu dysgu mewn gwleidyddiaeth yw sut i golli'n urddasol. Pan gollwyd etholiad cyffredinol 1979, yr oeddwn yn bresennol yn Neuadd y Ddinas pan roddwyd y newydd iddo, ac yr oedd cyfryngau'r byd yno hefyd. Yr oedd yn ymddwyn mewn modd y dywedai'r rhai a'i hadwaenai ei fod yn nodwediadol o ddyn dewr a chadarn iawn. Yn ddigon diddorol, yn ystod y cyfnod o ychydig dros dair blynedd a hanner y bu'n Brif Weinidog, nid oedd gan ei blaid fwyafri gwirioneddol yn y Senedd. Parodd hynny anawsterau, y soniodd amdanyst wedyn yn y llyfr a ysgrifennodd wedi iddo adael Tŷ'r Cyffredin. Pan geir rhywun a wasanaethodd brifddinas Cymru ac a gyrhaeddodd uchel swydd y Prif Weinidog, mae'n bwysig inni oll grymu pen gan gofio'r urddas, y penderfyniad a'r cadernid a amlygodd gwleidyddion fel Jim. Cynrychiolodd y Deyrnas Unedig gyfan ac yr oedd ei wreiddiau yng ngwleidyddiaeth Cymru.

Yr oedd Jim Callaghan yn ddyn a chanddo ddawn dweud ryfeddol. Fe'i daliwyd ar ei fai efallai, fel y dywedodd y Prif Weinidog, pan gafwyd y gwerthu ar y bunt. Wrth ddod oddi ar awyren unwaith, gwnaeth y sylw bachog am lunio celwydd mewn ychydig eiliadau a fyddai hanner ffordd o gwmpas y byd cyn i'r gwirionedd godi o'i wely. Fodd bynnag, yr un sylw a gofiaf yn annwyl yw hwn:

Trodd yr wybren yn ddu gan adenydd cywion yn dod adref i glwydo.

Bydd hynny'n fy atgoffa bob amser am ddyn a wasanaethodd ei wlad a'i ddinas, a phobl Cymru, yn dda.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Diolch i chi am y cyfle i ddweud gair neu ddau am yr Arglwydd Callaghan, a gynrychiolodd Dde Caerdydd a Phenarth, gyda'r gwahanol newidiadau i'w ffiniau, o 1945 hyd 1987. Deuthum i adnabod Jim yn dda iawn er 1981, pan gynhwyswyd Penarth yn yr etholaeth eto. Buan y sylweddolais mor hoff ydoedd yr etholwyr o Jim, ac o Audrey, a hwythau'n dda enaid

Jim will always be held in high regard, and many people in the constituency remember him from 1945 and are still proud to say that they worked for Jim Callaghan. I have met many people who remember the glorious election of 1945, and it holds a particularly warm place in the memories of people in Penarth and Cogan. Jim arrived to be greeted by crowds who cheered him on and followed him as he travelled up to the town centre in Penarth. One of those people was Mrs Maria Eley, now aged 105, who is known to everyone in the area as 'Nan'. Her home is still in Cogan, and she received her regular Christmas card from Jim and Audrey last year, as she had done for many decades. Jim never forgot Mrs Eley, from 1945 right through to 2005, and I know that he would want me to send Nan our best wishes today, particularly as she may be the oldest resident in my constituency. Few of us here, I guess, will notch up 60 years in active politics, as Jim Callaghan did, and it is a shame that he will not be with us in person when we take our seats in the new Assembly debating Chamber; Jim was proud to play his part as chairman of the committee that chose the design for our new building.

2.10 p.m.

It is nice to know that his links with Cardiff South and Penarth have been unbroken from 1945, when he was first elected as our Member of Parliament, to the present day, as we see our new building taking shape in the heart of Cardiff South and Penarth. Thank you, Jim, Lord Callaghan of Cardiff.

**The Presiding Officer:** I associate myself with all that has been said. As the leader of the opposition mentioned, I had the privilege of serving in both Houses with Jim Callaghan, and was able to express my personal sympathy to Margaret, Baroness Jay, last week, when we commemorated him in the House of Lords. I am grateful in particular that Lorraine referred to his last will and testament, if you like, for us in our new democracy in Wales, which was to act as chair of the panel that selected the design of our new building. I am sure that the democratic spirit that so informed Jim's life will continue to inform our politics in Wales

hoff gytûn. Cofir am Jim gyda pharch mawr bob amser, ac mae llawer o etholwyr yn ei gofio er 1945 ac yn dal i fod yn falch o ddweud eu bod wedi gweithio dros Jim Callaghan. Cyfarfum â llawer sy'n cofio etholiad gogoneddus 1945, ac mae lle annwyl iawn iddo yn atgofion pobl ym Mhenarth a Chogan. Cyrhaeddodd Jim a chael ei gyfarch gan dorfeydd a'i dilynodd gan ei annog yn ei flaen wrth iddo deithio tua chanol tref Penarth. Un o'r bobl hynny oedd Mrs Maria Eley, sy'n 105 oed bellach, a elwir yn 'Nan' gan bawb yn yr ardal. Mae'n dal i fyw yng Nghogan, a chafodd gerdyn Nadolig yn ôl yr arfer gan Jim ac Audrey y llynedd, fel y cafodd ers degawdau lawer. Ni wnaeth Jim erioed anghofio Mrs Eley, o 1945 hyd 2005, a gwn y byddai am imi anfon ein dymuniadau gorau at Nan heddiw, yn enwedig gan mai hi o bosibl yw'r un hynaf yn fy etholaeth. Ychydig ohonom sydd yma, yr wyf yn tybio, a wnaiff gymryd rhan weithredol mewn gwleidyddiaeth am 60 mlynedd, fel y gwnaeth Jim Callaghan, ac mae'n drueni na fydd gyda ni pan gymerwn ein seddau yn Siambrau ddadlau newydd y Cynulliad; bu Jim yn falch o chwarae ei ran fel cadeirydd y pwylgor a ddewisodd gynllun ein hadeilad newydd.

Braf yw gwybod bod ei gysylltiadau â De Caerdydd a Phenarth wedi parhau o 1945, pan etholwyd ef yn Aelod Seneddol drosom yn gyntaf, hyd heddiw, wrth inni weld ein hadeilad newydd yn ymffurfio yng nghanol De Caerdydd a Phenarth. Diolch i chi, Jim, yr Arglwydd Callaghan o Gaerdydd.

**Y Llywydd:** Cysylltaf fy hun â phopeth a ddywedwyd. Fel y dywedodd arweinydd yr wrthblaid, cefais y faint o wasanaethu yn y ddu Dŷ gyda Jim Callaghan, a gellais estyn fy nghydymdeimlad yn bersonol i Margaret, y Farwnes Jay, yr wythnos diwethaf, pan wnaethom ei goffâu yn Nhŷ'r Arglwyddi. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar yn benodol fod Lorraine wedi cyfeirio at ei ewyllys olaf, os caf ei roi felly, i ni yn ein democraeth newydd yng Nghymru, sef bod yn gadeirydd ar y panel a ddewisodd gynllun ein hadeilad newydd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y meddylfryd democraidd a fu'n gymaint o ysbrydoliaeth i Jim yn ystod ei fywyd yn dal i ysbrydoli ein

for many years to come.

gwleidyddiaeth yng Nghymru am flynyddoedd lawer i ddod.

## Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister

### Effaith Costau Presgripsiynau'r NHS The Effect of NHS Prescription Costs

**Q1 William Graham:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the effect of NHS prescription costs on the level of unemployment along the England and Wales border of south-east Wales? OAQ0310(FM)

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** NHS prescription costs came down from £5 to £4 per item on 1 April this year. That makes moving from welfare to work marginally more attractive for those who are on welfare now, and who have a high number of prescription items required because of chronic conditions such as asthma. Therefore, I believe it does have some benefit in reducing unemployment and in helping people to fill jobs.

**William Graham:** How are you going to prevent health tourism? It is said that in Chepstow the demand for retail premises has grown substantially.

**The First Minister:** There are new regulations that will be considered soon in the Assembly—on 28 June, I believe—which will make it much more difficult for health tourism to take place across the England and Wales border. If approved by the Assembly, those regulations will come into force on 15 July.

**C1 William Graham:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am effaith costau presgripsiynau'r GIG ar lefel diweithdra ar hyd ffin Cymru a Lloegr yn y De-ddwyrain? OAQ0310(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan):** Gostyngodd costau presgripsiynau'r GIG o £5 i £4 yr eitem ar 1 Ebrill eleni. Oherwydd hynny, mae troi oddi wrth fudd-daliadau a dechrau gweithio ychydig yn fwy deniadol yn awr i'r rhai sy'n derbyn budd-daliadau y mae arnynt angen nifer mawr o eitemau ar bresgripsiwn oherwydd anhwylderau cronig fel asthma. Gan hynny, credaf fod hyn yn dod â rhywfaint o fudd o ran lleihau diweithdra a helpu pobl i ymgymryd â swyddi.

**William Graham:** Sut yr ydych yn mynd i atal twristiaeth iechyd? Dywedir bod y galw am adeiladau ar gyfer siopau yng Nghas-gwent wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ceir rheoliadau newydd a ystyrrir cyn hir yn y Cynulliad—ar 28 Mehefin, yr wyf yn credu—a'i gwnaiff yn llawer anos i dwristiaeth iechyd ddigwydd ar draws y ffin rhwng Cymru a Lloegr. Os cymeradwyir y rheoliadau hynny gan y Cynulliad, deuant i rym ar 15 Gorffennaf.

### Gwasanaethau Ysbytai Hospital Services

**Q2 David Melding:** Will the First Minister make a statement on hospital services in Wales? OAQ0332(FM)

**The First Minister:** Hospital services will be much improved by the increase in capital investment in hospitals as our budget rises from £100 million this year to £300 million a year at the end of the present budget period, in 2007-08. That will enable new hospitals at

**C2 David Melding:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am wasanaethau ysbytai yng Nghymru? OAQ0332(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Bydd gwasanaethau ysbytai'n well o lawer gan y bydd mwy o gyfalaf yn cael ei fuddsoddi mewn ysbytai wrth i'n cyllideb godi o £100 miliwn eleni i £300 miliwn y flwyddyn ar ddiwedd y cyfnod cyllideb presennol, yn 2007-08. Drwy

Ebbw Vale, Cynon Valley, Holywell, Porthmadog, Rhondda and Tenby to proceed, as well as the new Children's Hospital for Wales and the big new Caerphilly district hospital.

**David Melding:** Will you take this opportunity to apologise to the people of Wales for the fact that your promise in 1999 is still unfulfilled? You have now had to come out with another promise in terms of waiting lists, which is set for several years hence. Why should the people of Wales believe you now, when you have failed so badly in the past?

**The First Minister:** Anyone who compares the hospital waiting list position now to what it was some 18 months ago will see a massive improvement. Therefore it is easy for us to say that we know how to do the job, and that is how we can indicate an interim target of a joint in-patient and out-patient wait of 16 months for some two years hence, by 1 April 2007. Then there is a final all-up wait, including waits for diagnoses, of six months by the end of 2009.

**Christine Chapman:** I also welcome your reference to the new hospital for the Cynon valley. My constituents are looking forward to that. Are you aware of a recent study, endorsed by the Royal College of Physicians, which found that a Parkinson's disease nurse specialist at Glan Clwyd Hospital saved the NHS trust around £50,000 over a six-month period? There are currently only nine Parkinson's disease nurse specialists in Wales; a number of local health boards do not have such nurses. This means that large numbers of sufferers do not have access to this service. Will you welcome this week's Parkinson's disease awareness week, and give an assurance that the inequity of service for Parkinson's disease sufferers will be addressed?

**The First Minister:** As the number of nurses goes up sharply—as has already taken place—you can start thinking about the provision of more specialist nurses. These are

hynny, bydd modd bwrw ymlaen â'r ysbytai newydd yng Nglynebw, Cwm Cynon, Treffynnon, Porthmadog, Rhondda a Dinbych-y-pysgod, yn ogystal â'r Ysbyty Plant newydd i Gymru a'r ysbyty dosbarth mawr newydd yng Nghaerffili.

**David Melding:** A wnewch achub ar y cyfle hwn i ymddiheuro i bobl Cymru am y ffaith bod yr addewid a wnaethoch yn 1999 heb ei chyflawni byth? Bellach yr ydych wedi gorfod cyhoeddi addewid arall gyda golwg ar restrau aros, sydd i'w chyflawni ymhengrai blynnyddoedd. Pam y dylai pobl Cymru eich credu'n awr, a chithau wedi methu cymaint yn y gorffennol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Bydd unrhyw un sy'n cymharu'r sefyllfa o ran rhestrau aros ysbytai'n awr â'r hyn ydoedd tua 18 mis yn ôl yn gweld gwelliant aruthrol. Felly mae'n hawdd inni ddweud ein bod yn gwybod sut i wneud y gwaith, a thrwy hynny y gallwn bennu targed dros dro o arhosiad o 16 mis ar y rhestr i gleifion mewnol a'r rhestr i gleifion allanol gyda'i gilydd i'w gyrraedd ymhengrai tua dwy flynedd, erbyn 1 Ebrill 2007. Wedyn, yn y diwedd, ceir arhosiad hollgynhwysol, gan gynnwys aros am ddiagnosis, o chwe mis erbyn diwedd 2009.

**Christine Chapman:** Yr wyf hefyd yn croesawu eich cyfeiriad at yr ysbytai newydd i Gwm Cynon. Mae fy etholwyr yn edrych ymlaen at hynny. A ydych yn ymwybodol o astudiaeth ddiweddar, wedi'i chefnogi gan Goleg Brenhinol y Meddygon, a ddarganfu fod nyrs arbenigol clefyd Parkinson yn Ysbyty Glan Clwyd wedi arbed tua £50,000 dros chwe mis i'r Ymddiriedolaeth GIG? Ar hyn o bryd, dim ond naw o nyrsys arbenigol clefyd Parkinson sydd yng Nghymru; nid oes gan nifer o fyrrdau iechyd lleol nyrsys o'r fath. Mae hyn yn golygu nad yw'r gwasanaeth hwn ar gael i nifer fawr o ddioddefwyr. A wnewch groesawu wythnos ymwybyddiaeth clefyd Parkinson yr wythnos hon, a rhoi sicrwydd y bydd annhegwynn y gwasanaeth i ddioddefwyr Parkinson yn derbyn sylw?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Wrth i nifer y nyrsys godi'n sydyn—fel sydd eisoes wedi digwydd—gallwch ddechrau meddwl am ddarparu rhagor o nyrsys arbenigol. Mae'r

often nurses who acquire mid-career additional specialisms. We have seen this in terms of GPs with a special interest in orthopaedic cases, and we have also seen it with nurses. We have indicated that there will be about 6,000 additional nurses, and we are well on target. If you have that additional totality of nurses, you can allocate more nurses to the specific tasks and extra qualifications that can make so much difference to the lives of people with chronic conditions like Parkinson's disease.

rhain yn aml yn nyrssys sy'n ennill arbenigeddau ychwanegol yn ystod eu gyrfaoedd. Yr ydym wedi gweld hyn gyda Meddygon Teulu sydd â diddordeb arbennig mewn achosion orthopedig, a hefyd wedi ei weld gyda nyrssys. Yr ydym wedi nodi y bydd tua 6,000 o nyrssys ychwanegol, a'n bod yn gyfforddus o fewn ein targed. Os yw'r cyfanswm nyrssys ychwanegol hwn gennych, gallwch ddyrannu mwy o nyrssys i'r tasgau penodol a'r cymwysterau ychwanegol sy'n gallu gwneud cymaint o wahaniaeth i fywydau pobl gyda chyflyrau cronic fel clefyd Parkinson.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Y drafferth i chi, Brif Weinidog, yw, er eich bod yn cyfeirio at ffigurau'r 18 mis diwethaf, mai realiti'r sefyllfa yw eich bod wedi bod mewn Llywodraeth yma ers 1999. Yr oedd 160,000 o bobl ar y rhestrau aros yn 1999, ond erbyn hyn mae'r ffigur bron yn 300,000. Y targed y mae'n rhaid i chi edrych arno yw ffigur 1999. Fe gofiwch imi eich holi am y materion hyn ar 15 Mawrth, sef dau ddiwrnod cyn toriad y Pasg. Eich ateb bryd hynny oedd nad oeddech yn gwybod pryd y byddech yn gwneud datganiad ar restrau aros, ond, o fewn dau ddiwrnod—hynny yw, y diwrnod wedi i'r Cynulliad dorri—cawsom y datganiad hwn gan Brian Gibbons. Yr oeddech yn gwybod bod y datganiad hwnnw ar ddod, ond, ar y pryd, yr oeddech yn gwadu fod gan hynny unrhyw beth i'w wneud ag etholiad cyffredinol. Yr oedd Tony Blair yn iawn; yr oedd yn gwybod eich bod am wneud y datganiad hwn. Cafodd Tony Blair rybudd ymlaen llaw am hynny, ond nid oeddech yn fodlon dweud wrth y Cynulliad. Onid yw'n wir mai'r cwbl yr ydych yn ei wneud, Brif Weinidog, yw chwarae yn wleidyddol â bywydau pobl? Yr hyn yr ydym am ei weld yw rhaglen i dynnu'r rhestrau aros i lawr, yn hytrach na chwarae ar yr ymylon cyn etholiad.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r ffigurau yn dod i lawr. Dyna'r pwyt. Bu'r ffigurau yn dod i lawr yn gyson dros y 18 mis diwethaf. Mae'r sefyllfa wedi'i thrawsnewid dros y 18 mis diwethaf, ac mae'n dal i wella yn gyson bob mis. Yr ydym bellach wedi magu'r hyder i ddweud fod cynllun gwarant yr ail gynnig, a ddechreuwyd gan Jane Hutt ac sydd bellach dan ofal Brian Gibbons, yn gweithio.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** The difficulty for you, First Minister, is that, even though you refer to the figures for the last 18 months, the fact of the matter is that you have been in Government here since 1999. There were 160,000 people on waiting lists in 1999, but that figure is now nearly 300,000. The target that you must look at is the 1999 figure. You will recall that I asked you about these matters on 15 March, two days before the Easter recess. Your response at that time was that you did not know when you would make a statement about waiting lists, but, within two days—on the first day of the recess—Brian Gibbons made this statement. You knew that that statement was imminent, but, at the time, you denied that it had anything to do with the general election. Tony Blair was right; he knew that you would be making this statement. Tony Blair was given prior notice, but you were not willing to tell the Assembly. Is it not true, First Minister, that all you are doing is playing politics with people's lives? What we want to see is a programme designed to bring waiting lists down, rather than this pre-election window dressing.

**The First Minister:** The figures are coming down. That is the point. The figures have been coming down constantly for the last 18 months. The situation has been transformed over the last 18 months, and it continues to improve month on month. We can now say with confidence that the second-offer guarantee scheme, introduced by Jane Hutt and now in Brian Gibbons's hands, is

Gallwch weld o'r ffigurau misol fod y system yn gweithio. O ganlyniad, a chan fod y gostyngiad yn y rhestrau aros wedi'i sefydlu mor gadarn, gallwn weld beth i'w wneud i gyrraedd y nod a osodwyd gerbron y cyhoedd ychydig wythnosau yn ôl. O ran eich cyhuddiad ein bod yn gwybod yn union beth yr oeddem am ei ddweud cyn toriad y Pasg, gallaf eich sicrhau nad oedd y gwaith wedi'i gwblhau. Gwnaethom y cyhoeddiad cyn gynted ag yr oedd y gwaith wedi'i gwblhau. Nid oedd wedi'i gwblhau cyn y toriad. Nid oedd wedi'i gwblhau tan ddiwrnod y cyhoeddiad.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Dowch yn eich blaen, Brif Weinidog. A ydych yn disgwyl inni gredu hynny? Gadewch imi eich atgoffa am yr hyn a ddywedodd Tony Blair.

Three days before the First Minister was to make his announcement, Tony Blair said that he thought that he was right in saying that Rhodri would be making a statement on health within the next few days.

Gofynnais gwestiwn i chi ar 15 Mawrth, ond gwadu'r geiriau hynny a wnaethoch, gan ddweud nad oedd yn wir. Sut yr oedd Tony Blair yn gwybod eich bod am wneud y datganiad hwnnw? Yr oedd pawb yn gwybod eich bod am wneud y datganiad hwnnw. Yr oedd y wasg yn gwybod, ond yr oeddech yn gwrrhod dod i'r Cynulliad i wneud datganiad ar y mater.

2.20 p.m.

Codaf achos un o'm hetholwyr a oedd yn dioddef o *ulcers* ar ei goes ac a arhosodd naw mis am sgan. Bu'n rhaid iddo geisio triniaeth breifat, a chwblhawyd hynny o fewn ychydig wythnosau. A wyddoch chi, Brif Weinidog, fod 25 y cant yn fwy o bobl yn cael eu gorfodi i fynd yn breifat o dan y Llywodraeth Lafur hon nag a oedd o dan y Llywodraeth Doriidd ddiwethaf, ac onid yw hynny yn sgandal?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Os ydych am wadu fy integriti personol i, mae arnaf ofn mai gwell fyddai ichi wneud hynny y tu allan i'r Siambraffon. Mae'n gywilyddus nad ydych yn derbyn yr hyn a ddywedais wrthych fel y gwirionedd. Mae'n flin iawn gennyl eich bod

working. You can see from the monthly figures that the system is working. As a result, and as the downward trend has been so firmly established, we can see what needs to be done to achieve the target that we set before the public a few weeks ago. As regards your accusation that we knew exactly what we were going to say before the Easter recess, I can assure you that the work had not been completed. We made the announcement as soon as the work was completed. It had not been completed before the recess. It was only completed on the day that the announcement was made.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Come on, First Minister. Do you expect us to believe that? Let me remind you about what Tony Blair said.

Dri diwrnod cyn bod Prif Weinidog Cymru i wneud ei gyhoeddiad, dywedodd Tony Blair ei fod yn credu ei fod yn iawn wrth ddweud y byddai Rhodri yn gwneud datganiad ar iechyd yn ystod y dyddiau nesaf.

I asked you a question on 15 March, but you denied the statement, saying that it was not true. How did Tony Blair know that you were about to make this statement? Everyone knew that you were going to make this statement. The press knew about it, but you refused to make a statement to the Assembly.

I will mention the case of one of my constituents, who had ulcers on his leg and had to wait nine months for a scan. He was forced to seek private treatment that was completed within a few weeks. Are you aware, First Minister, that 25 per cent more people are forced to go private under this Labour Government than was the case during the last Tory Government, and is this not a scandal?

**The First Minister:** If you wish to question my personal integrity, then I am afraid that you had better do so outside this Chamber. It is disgraceful that you do not accept what I told you as being the truth. I am sorry that you take that viewpoint, and you should look

yn cymryd y safbwyt hwnnw, a chredaf y dylech edrych i'ch cydwytod eich hunan pan wadwch wirionedd yr hyn a ddywedaf wrthych yma. Ni allaf ond ei ail-ddweud: gwnaethom y cyhoeddiad pan gwblhawyd y gwaith. Pe bai'r gwaith wedi ei gwblhau mewn pryd i wneud cyhoeddiad cyn y toriad, dyna a fyddai wedi digwydd.

O ran yr achos arbennig y bu ichi gyfeirio ato ynglŷn ag achos eich etholwr oedd ag *ulcers* ar ei goes, nid wyf i'n ymwybodol o'r amgylchiadau penodol hynny. Os hoffech roi'r manylion mewn llythyr naill ai at Brian neu ataf fi, yn arbennig yngylch y gŵyn bod y person wedi bod yn aros yn rhy hir, fe wnawn ni eich ateb.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** All I can say to you, First Minister, is that it was very convenient for you, was it not, that the statement was made on the day after the Assembly broke for the recess? It then gave you three weeks without any scrutiny on one of the most important announcements that we were expecting you to make on health. All you tell us in this statement of 17 March is that waiting times will come down. You do not, however, tell us how they will come down. There has been no change of policy, and there have been no new initiatives. What about diagnostic treatment centres and walk-in centres? What about putting up residential fees? [*Interruption.*] I thought that the First Minister was answering questions, Brian, not you. Your time will come.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The First Minister is answering questions.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I will return to the issue, First Minister. Where are the diagnostic treatment centres and the walk-in centres? What about increasing the fees for residential homes? What about improving the conditions of homecare workers? These are the kinds of initiatives that we expect from the Government. People out there are sceptical of this statement, and they believe that it is only window dressing to save the skins of Labour Members of Parliament. We have thousands of patients in Wales who desperately need treatment and who must wait.

to your own conscience when you question the integrity of my statements here. I can only repeat that we made that statement when the work had been completed. Had that work been completed in time to make an announcement before the recess, then that is what would have happened.

With regard to the case that you highlighted concerning your constituent with leg ulcers, I am not aware of those particular circumstances. If you wish to supply the details in writing to me or to Brian, referring particularly to the complaint about the waiting time, we will respond accordingly.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Y cyfan y gallaf ei ddweud wrthych, Brif Weinidog, yw ei fod yn gyfleus iawn i chi, onid oedd, fod y datganiad wedi'i wneud y diwrnod ar ôl i'r Cynulliad dorri? Yr oedd hyn wedyn yn rhoi tair wythnos i chi heb unrhyw graffu ar un o'r cyhoeddiadau pwysicaf yr oeddym yn disgwyl i chi ei wneud ar iechyd. Y cyfan yr ydych yn ei ddweud wrthym yn y datganiad hwn ar 17 Mawrth yw y bydd amseroedd aros yn dod i lawr. Fodd bynnag, nid ydych yn dweud wrthym sut y dônt i lawr. Ni fu unrhyw newid polisi, a dim mentrau newydd. Beth am ganolfannau triniaeth diagnostig a chanolfannau camu-i-mewn? Beth am godi ffioedd preswyl? [*Torri ar draws.*] Yr oeddwn yn meddwl mai Prif Weinidog Cymru oedd yn ateb cwestiynau, Brian, nid chi. Fe ddaw eich tro chi.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn ateb cwestiynau.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Dof yn ôl at y mater dan sylw, Brif Weinidog. Ym mhle mae'r canolfannau triniaeth diagnostig a'r canolfannau camu-i-mewn? Beth am godi ffioedd ar gyfer cartrefi preswyl? Beth am wella amodau i weithwyr gofal cartref? Dyma'r mathau o fentrau yr ydym yn eu disgwyl gan y Llywodraeth. Mae pobl yn amheus o'r datganiad hwn, ac yn credu mai sioe yw hyn i gyd i arbed crwyn Aelodau Seneddol Llafur. Mae gennym filoedd o gleifion yng Nghymru sydd â gwir angen triniaeth arnynt ac sy'n gorfod aros.

**The First Minister:** What we have is an extremely successful second-offer guarantee scheme, which has transformed the situation since it was introduced, when Jane Hutt was Minister for Health and Social Services. The scheme has ensured a major reduction in long waits, and will continue to do so. In terms of your reference to policy changes, it is not so much a matter of policy change but of making the resource allocations. That is why Brian Gibbons announced an additional £32 million to be applied specifically to the reduction of the out-patient waiting lists. There is a big push on these, and the trigger date for the second offer will be brought down from 18 months to 12 months by the end of March 2006.

With regard to other new policy initiatives, the capital allocation for the purchase of diagnostic equipment will be on a massive scale compared with what has gone before. You are right to emphasise diagnostics as it is very important. Diagnostic waits are the hidden ones; they are not counted now. They were not counted under the Conservatives, or hitherto under Labour. They are not counted in Wales, Scotland or England. The way to put this right is to include them as part of waiting lists, and this will happen in 2008 in England and in 2009 in Wales. Money must also be ploughed into buying the diagnostic equipment that will ensure that these waits come down. So, in terms of what is happening, diagnostic equipment is being bought and installed in Welsh hospitals in order to bring down this hidden waiting list for diagnostics.

**Nick Bourne:** I do not know how the First Minister has the brass neck to claim credit for the reduction in figures from 18 months ago, without saying who was at fault for the historically high level of those figures. If you look at the figures—and this is not questioning your integrity—they show that there are more people waiting every year, including the present one, for treatment. There were 167,000 people waiting at the end of 1999, 219,000 in March 2004, and the current figure is 290,000 plus. It is as though you have started a massive forest fire and expect credit for coming along with a bucket of water to stop it spreading to a couple of

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr hyn sydd gennym yw cynllun gwarantu ail gynnig hynod lwyddiannus, sydd wedi gweddnewid y sefyllfa ers ei gyflwyno, pan oedd Jane Hutt yn Weinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Mae'r cynllun wedi sicrhau bod arosiadau maith yn cael eu lleihau'n sylwedol, a bydd yn parhau i wneud hynny. O ran eich cyfeiriad at newid polisi, nid mater o newid polisi ydyw ond o ddyrannu adnoddau. Dyna pam y cyhoeddodd Brian Gibbons £32 miliwn ychwanegol i'w wario'n benodol ar leihau rhestrau aros i gleifion allanol. Mae gwthio mawr ar y rhain, a bydd y dyddiad sbarduno ail gynnig yn dod i lawr o 18 mis i 12 mis erbyn diwedd Mawrth 2006.

Yng nghyswllt mentrau polisi newydd eraill, bydd y dyraniad cyfalaf i brynu cyfarpar diagnostig ar raddfa anferth o'i gymharu â'r hyn sydd wedi digwydd yn flaenorol. Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle wrth bwysleisio diagnosteg gan ei fod yn bwysig dros ben. Arosiadau i dderbyn diagnosis yw'r rhai cudd; nid ydynt yn cael eu cyfrif ar hyn o bryd. Ni chawsant eu cyfrif o dan y Ceidwadwyr, nac ychwaith o dan Lafur hyd yma. Nid ydynt yn cael eu cyfrif yng Nghymru, Lloegr na'r Alban. Y ffordd i gywiros hyn yw eu cynnwys ar restrau aros, a bydd hyn yn digwydd yn 2008 yn Lloegr ac yn 2009 yng Nghymru. Rhaid buddsoddi hefyd mewn prynu'r cyfarpar diagnostig a fydd yn sicrhau y bydd yr arosiadau hyn yn lleihau. Felly, o ran yr hyn sy'n digwydd, mae cyfarpar diagnostig yn cael ei brynu a'i osod yn ysbytai Cymru i leihau'r rhestr aros gudd hon ar gyfer derbyn diagnosis.

**Nick Bourne:** Ni wn sut y mae gan y Prif Weinidog yr wyneb i hawlio'r clod am y gostyngiad mewn ffigurau o gymharu â 18 mis yn ôl, heb ddweud pwy oedd ar fai am lefel hanesyddol uchel y ffigurau hynny. Os edrychwch ar y ffigurau—ac nid cwestiynu eich didwylledd yw hyn—maent yn dangos bod mwy o bobl yn aros bob blwyddyn, gan gynnwys yr un bresennol, am driniaeth. Yr oedd 167,000 o bobl yn aros ar ddiwedd 1999, 219,000 ym Mawrth 2004, ac mae'r ffigur presennol yn fwy na 290,000. Yr ydych fel pe baech wedi cynnau Tân anferth mewn coedwig ac yn disgwyl clod am ddod â bwcedaid o ddŵr i'w atal rhag lledu i goeden

trees on the outside of the forest. Is that not the truth?

**The First Minister:** I mentioned earlier that we have been advised that the figures that we now use in relation to the waiting list, which you have quoted, are not comparable with the waiting-list figures that we inherited in 1999, which were in a chaotic state. The figures are now far more comprehensive. It was never clear what the true waiting-list figures were, especially for out-patients. What is clear is that the second-offer guarantee scheme is successful. Likewise, we are ploughing money into training medical students, which the Conservatives never did, Nick, and I am sure that you would have to agree with that. We are almost doubling the intake into our medical schools in Wales; it is up by 89 per cent. Likewise in terms of nurse training, because you have to have the staff. That is the strategy: train more doctors, nurses, physiotherapists and all of the other professions allied to medicine. It takes a while—three or four years—before you see the benefit. You do not do it for electoral reasons. In the case of nurses, it takes about four years to see any benefit, in the case of a family doctor it takes six or seven years and, for a consultant, it takes maybe 10 or 15 years, but you have to do it to be able to treat more patients with more of your own doctors and nurses and all of the professions that are essential to the healthcare system. We are making that investment and are trebling the capital budget in 2005-06, 2006-07 and 2007-08 to £300 million, and we will also go beyond that. That will result in the building of all of these additional hospitals in Wales and in the creation of hospital capacity in terms of buildings, diagnostic equipment and the training of professional staff, which is required to meet demand.

**Nick Bourne:** You are now questioning the integrity of your own figures. Everybody knows, including Labour Members of Parliament, that the position is far worse than it was when you came into power in 1999. Irrespective of how much is being spent, you are not making the best use of that resource. I

neu ddwy ar gyrrion y goedwig. Onid hynny yw'r gwir?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Sonais yn gynharach y cawsom ein hysbysu nad oes modd cymharu'r ffigurau a ddefnyddir gennym yn awr yng nghyswllt y rhestr aros, ac a ddyfynnwyd gennych chi, â ffigurau'r rhestr aros a etifeddwyd gennym yn 1999, a oedd yn llanastr holol. Mae'r ffigurau erbyn hyn yn llawer mwy cynhwysfawr. Ni fu'n glir erioed beth oedd gwir ffigurau'r rhestr aros, yn enwedig o ran cleifion allanol. Yr hyn sy'n glir yw bod y cynllun gwarantu ail gynnig yn llwyddiannus. Yn yr un modd, yr ydym yn buddsoddi arian mewn hyfforddi myfyrwyr meddygol, rhywbeth na wnaeth y Ceidwadwyr erioed, Nick, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'n rhaid i chi gytuno â hynny. Yr ydym bron â dyblu'r nifer sy'n cofrestru gyda'n hysgolion meddygol yng Nghymru; mae wedi codi 89 y cant. Felly hefyd gyda hyfforddi nyrssys, am fod yn rhaid i chi gael y staff. Dyna'r strategaeth: hyfforddi mwy o feddygon, nyrssys, ffisiotherapyddion a'r holl broffesiynau eraill sy'n gysylltiedig â meddygaeth. Mae'n cymryd amser—tair neu bedair blynedd—cyn y gwelir y manteision. Nid am resymau etholiadol y mae rhywun yn gwneud hyn. Yn achos nyrssys, mae'n cymryd tua phedair blynedd i weld unrhyw fudd, yn achos meddyg teulu mae'n cymryd chwech neu saith mlynedd ac, o ran ymgynghorydd, mae'n cymryd efallai 10 neu 15 mlynedd, ond rhaid i rywun ei wneud er mwyn gallu trin mwy o gleifion gyda mwy o'ch meddygon a'ch nyrssys eich hun a'r holl broffesiynau sy'n hanfodol i'r system gofal iechyd. Yr ydym yn gwneud y buddsoddiad hwn ac yn treblu'r gyllideb gyfalaf yn 2005-06, 2006-07 a 2007-08 i £300 miliwn, a byddwn hefyd yn mynd y tu hwnt i hynny. Bydd hyn yn arwain at adeiladu'r holl ysbytai ychwanegol hyn yng Nghymru ac at greu capaciti ysbyty o ran adeiladau, cyfarpar diagnostig a hyfforddi staff proffesiynol, sy'n angenrheidiol i gwrdd â'r galw.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr ydych yn awr yn cwestiynu diliusrwydd eich ffigurau eich hun. Mae pawb yn gwybod, gan gynnwys Aelodau Seneddol Llafur, fod y sefyllfa yn llawer gwaeth nag a oedd pan ddaethoch i rym yn 1999. Faint bynnag sy'n cael ei wario, nid ydych yn gwneud y defnydd gorau o'r adnodd hwnnw.

wrote to the Minister for Health and Social Services asking, under the Freedom of Information Act 2000, for copies of correspondence from Labour MPs expressing concern about the waiting list. The response that I received asked me to be more specific because the answer would involve far too much information. What do you say to that?

**The First Minister:** I am advised that the waiting-list figures that we inherited in 1999 did not have statistical integrity. That was a problem. The figures were stuffed in drawers here, there and everywhere and they were not properly collected. We have ensured that they are properly collected so we know what the true waiting list position is, and the figures are now coming down sharply. Staff in the health service—not I, and I accept that there will always be political knockabout on this issue—deserve a massive pat on the back from all of us in politics for the efforts that they have made to reduce the long waits, which have come down sharply. We know exactly how to operate the second offer guarantee scheme and we will continue to operate it. We have put in the additional £32 million for next year to bring the waiting list second-offer trigger date down from 18 months to 12 months, and that will also transform the out-patient waits.

**Nick Bourne:** This is far more than political knockabout; this is about people in pain, on long waiting lists that have got worse under you. I received a letter yesterday from a constituent who mentioned having to wait five hours before being seen by a doctor in Carmarthen. I have had a letter today from somebody in Lampeter who last saw a consultant two and a half years ago and who still has not had their operation, despite their being advised that it was necessary. These are real people who have suffered under your stewardship, on your watch, and it has got worse every year under you. That is the plain fact. You might not like it and you might now question the statistics, but I have never heard these statistics being questioned before the last few months in the run-up to a general election. These people are suffering on your watch, First Minister, and it is time that you put that right.

Ysgrifennais at y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i ofyn, o dan Ddeddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000, am gopiau o ohebiaeth gan AS Llafur a oedd wedi lleisio pryder ynghylch y rhestr aros. Yr oedd yr ymateb a gefais i mi fod yn fwy penodol gan y byddai'r ateb yn golygu darparu llawer gormod o wybodaeth. Beth yw eich ymateb i hynny?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dywedwyd wrthyf nad oedd y ffigurau a etifeddasom ynghylch y rhestr aros yn 1999 yn ystadegol ddilys. Dyna oedd y broblem. Yr oedd y ffigurau wedi eu gwthio mewn droriau yma ac acw a heb gael eu casglu'n iawn. Yr ydym wedi sicrhau eu bod yn cael eu casglu'n iawn fel y gwyddom beth yw'r sefyllfa wirioneddol o ran y rhestr aros, ac mae'r ffigurau bellach yn dod i lawr yn sydyn. Mae staff y gwasanaeth iechyd—nid myfi, a derbyniaf y bydd rhywfaint o ymrafael gwleidyddol ynghylch hyn drwy'r amser—yn haeddu clod aruthrol gan bawb mewn gwleidyddiaeth am eu hymdreichion i leihau'r rhestrau aros, sydd wedi dod i lawr yn sydyn. Gwyddom yn union sut i weithredu'r cynllun gwarantu ail gynnig a byddwn yn parhau i'w weithredu. Yr ydym wedi darparu £32 miliwn ychwanegol at y flwyddyn nesaf i ddod â dyddiad sbarduno ail gynnig y rhestr aros i lawr o 18 mis i 12 mis, a bydd hyn hefyd yn gweddnewid arosiadau i gleifion allanol.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae hyn yn llawer mwy nag ymrafael gwleidyddol; mae'n ymwneud â phobl mewn poen, ar restrau aros hir sydd wedi gwaethyg tra buoch mewn grym. Derbyniais lythyr ddoe gan etholwr a soniodd ei fod wedi gorfod aros am bum awr cyn gweld meddyg yng Nghaerfyrddin. Cefais lythyr heddiw gan rywun yn Llanbedr Pont Steffan a welodd ymgynghorydd y tro diwethaf ddwy flynedd a hanner yn ôl ac sydd heb gael ei lawdriniaeth byth, er iddo gael ei hysbysu ei bod yn angenrheidiol. Pobl go iawn yw'r rhain sydd wedi dioddef o dan eich stiwardiaeth, ers i chi ddod i rym, ac mae wedi gwaethyg bob blwyddyn ers hynny. Dyna'r gwir amdani. Efallai nad ydych yn hoffi clywed hyn a byddwch efallai'n cwestiynu'r ystadegau yn awr, ond nid wyf erioed wedi clywed yr ystadegau hyn yn cael eu cwestiynu cyn y misoedd diwethaf hyn wrth agosáu at etholiad cyffredinol.

Mae'r bobl hyn yn dioddef tra ydych chi mewn grym, Brif Weinidog, ac mae'n bryd i chi unioni'r sefyllfa.

**The First Minister:** I am sorry that you question the advice that I have received about this. If you write to me, I will ensure that you receive an official reply about the problems that were there. I am sorry that that spoils your case, but this is why I am saying that this is a political knockabout issue. It is not I who says that there is something wrong with these figures; it is the people responsible for the statistics in relation to the health service. You trail individual cases, as you nearly always do, but you never give me notice about them so that I can give you a prepared answer, and you expect me to somehow answer a case without giving me the name of the person or town concerned. That cannot be done if I am not given notice. If you had done that, I would have responded. The issue is that you will not accept that there has been a transformation in the position in the last 18 months as regards people waiting a long time for in-patient treatment.

2.30 p.m.

We will now have a big push on reducing the long waits—those waiting more than 18 months and 12 months—and also on the out-patient waits by a year from now. Finally, as I have said, diagnostics is the hidden waiting list across the board and throughout the United Kingdom, on which you must spend money big time. We will do exactly that by trebling the capital investment programme.

**Michael German:** Let us try another part of our hospital care service. In January, if you recall, I received an e-mail, which had already been sent to Brian Gibbons. As a result of the fuss about the accident and emergency units, raised by staff, you paid a mystery-shopper visit to the accident and emergency unit at the University Hospital of Wales. Brian Gibbons then went scooting around, took off his jacket and also visited accident and emergency units. You promised us action then, and, at the time, after much argument, you said that it was not

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n flin gennyf eich bod yn cwestiynu'r wybodaeth a gefais ynghylch hyn. Os ysgrifennwch ataf, byddaf yn sicrhau y cewch ymateb swyddogol i'r problemau a oedd yno. Mae'n flin gennyf fod hyn yn difetha eich dadl, ond dyna pam y dywedais fod hwn yn fater o golbio gwleidyddol. Nid myf sy'n dweud bod rhywbeth o'i le gyda'r ffigurau hyn; y bobl sy'n gyfrifol am yr ystadegau yng nghyswllt y gwasanaeth ieched sy'n gwneud hynny. Yr ydych yn cyfeirio at achosion unigol, fel y gnewch o hyd bron, ond nid ydych byth yn rhoi rhybudd i mi yn eu cylch fel y gallaf roi ateb wedi'i baratoi i chi, ac yr ydych yn disgwyl i mi rywsut roi ateb i chi heb roi enw'r person neu'r dref dan sylw i mi. Ni allaf wneud hynny os na roddir rhybudd i mi. Pe byddech wedi gwneud hynny, byddwn wedi ymateb. Y ffaith yw na wnewch dderbyn bod y sefyllfa wedi ei gweddnewid yn y 18 mis diwethaf ar gyfer pobl sy'n aros am amser maith am driniaeth fel cleifion mewnol.

Yn awr bydd yn rhaid inni fwrw iddi o ddifrif i gwtogi'r amseroedd aros hir—y rhai sy'n aros mwy na 18 mis a 12 mis—a hefyd y cyfnodau aros i gleifion allanol erbyn blwyddyn i nawr. Yn olaf, fel yr wyf wedi dweud, diagnosteg yw'r rhestr aros gudd ym mhob maes a ledled y Deyrnas Unedig, a rhaid gwario arian mawr arni. Gwnawn hynny drwy dreblu'r rhaglen buddsoddi cyfalaf.

**Michael German:** Gadewch inni roi cynnig ar ran arall o'n gwasanaeth gofal ysbyty. Ym mis Ionawr, os cofiwch, derbyniais e-bost, oedd eisoes wedi'i anfon at Brian Gibbons. Yn sgîl yr helynt am yr unedau damweiniau ac achosion brys, a godwyd gan staff, aethoch ar ymweliad fel siopwr dirgel ag uned ddamweiniau ac achosion brys Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru. Yna aeth Brian Gibbons hwnt ac yma, tynnodd ei siaced ac ymwebdd yntau ag unedau damweiniau ac achosion brys. Addawsoch bryd hynny y byddid yn gweithredu, ac, ar yr un pryd, ar ôl llawer o

experiencing the pressures of a typical January. What has happened and changed since January?

**The First Minister:** I am not sure whether you are saying that you approve or disapprove of the half a dozen visits that I have made to the accident and emergency department at the University Hospital of Wales. It was the right thing to do, as it was a particular pressure point. The UHW, like the Royal Gwent Hospital and other hospitals, was learning, perhaps for the first time, how to run a hospital during a period of maximum pressure on accident and emergency services without cancelling waiting lists. So, we were putting pressure on staff to keep going on waiting lists and to learn how to do what English hospitals learned to do a year or so ago, by carrying on with the waiting list work and dealing with the winter pressure. They found it very hard, and I apologise fully to those people who had to wait a long time in the accident and emergency department. However, during one year or another, Welsh hospitals must break through the pain barrier and learn how to deal with maximum pressure in accident and emergency departments without cancelling the waiting list work in January, February and March.

With regard to what has happened at the accident and emergency unit of UHW, I have seen recent figures indicating that the staffing of ward A1, the key unstaffed ward, with which you are probably familiar, is now being partially staffed and is partially open. That has released some of the pressure on the accident and emergency unit, because it can release patients to the ward. The situation can still go from feast to famine in the space of hours—that is the nature of accident and emergency departments. However, my understanding now is that, if people come into accident and emergency departments as a result of a 999 call and they are not walking wounded, they are in a bed within half an hour. I saw that correspondence very recently, but I will ensure that you get a detailed reply about what has happened in the past four weeks.

ddadlau, dywedasoch nad oeddid yn wynebu pwysau mis Ionawr nodwediadol. Beth sydd wedi digwydd ac wedi newid ers mis Ionawr?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn siŵr a ydych yn dweud eich bod yn cymeradwyo ynteu'n anghymeradwyo fy hanner dwsin o ymweliadau ag adran ddamweiniau ac achosion brys Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru. Dyna'r peth iawn i'w wneud, gan fod pwysau neilltuol yno. Yr oedd yr ysbyty, megis Ysbyty Brenhinol Gwent ac ysbytai eraill, yn dysgu, am y tro cyntaf efallai, sut y mae rhedeg ysbyty dros gyfnod pan geir y pwysau eithaf ar wasanaethau damweiniau ac achosion brys heb ganslo rhestrau aros. Felly, yr oedd yn rhoi pwysau ar y staff i ddal i weithio ar y rhestrau aros a dysgu sut y mae gwneud yr hyn y dysgodd ysbytai Lloegr ei wneud ryw flwyddyn yn ôl, drwy barhau â gwaith y rhestrau aros ac ymdopi â phwysau'r gaeaf. Yr oedd hynny'n galed iawn arnynt, ac ymddiheuraf yn llwyr i'r bobl hynny y bu'n rhaid iddynt aros yn hir yn yr adran ddamweiniau ac achosion brys. Fodd bynnag, ryw flwyddyn neu'i gilydd, rhaid i ysbytai Cymru dorri drwy'r boen a dysgu sut y mae delio â'r pwysau eithaf mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys heb ganslo gwaith y rhestrau aros ym misoedd Ionawr, Chwefror a Mawrth.

O ran yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd yn uned ddamweiniau ac ysbyty brys Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru, yr wyf wedi gweld ffigurau diweddar sy'n dangos bod y staffio yn ward A1, y ward allweddol heb ei staffio, yr ydych yn gyfarwydd â hi yn ôl pob tebyg, yn cael ei staffio'n rhannol erbyn hyn a'i bod ar agor yn rhannol. Mae hynny wedi lliniaru peth o'r pwysau ar yr uned ddamweiniau ac achosion brys, oherwydd gall ryddhau cleifion i'r ward. Mae modd o hyd i'r sefyllfa ddirywio o fewn oriau—dyna natur adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys. Fodd bynnag, yn ôl a ddeallaf yn awr, os daw pobl i adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys o ganlyniad i alwad 999 ac nad ydynt yn gallu cerdded, maent mewn gwely ymhen hanner awr. Gwelais yr ohebiaeth honno yn ddiweddar iawn, ond byddaf yn sicrhau eich bod yn cael ateb manwl am yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd yn ystod y pedair wythnos ddiwethaf.

**Michael German:** During the Easter recess, I visited the accident and emergency unit at the Heath hospital, but not as a mystery shopper: I gave them notice that I would be attending. I spoke to managers, staff and the hardworking nurses and doctors about their safety figure. A safety figure exists in every accident and emergency unit around Wales, and the top safety figure is 25. The UHW unit had been on 25 day and night for the whole of the previous week. When I asked the staff what had changed since your visit in January, they told me that nothing had changed and that the pressures were the same.

You have talked about this issue, but we want to see action. Apart from the ward that you mentioned, which is getting more doctors and nurses to staff it up—though you are, at the same time, cutting nurse and physiotherapist training places in Wales, so it will be interesting to see how you can manage to staff additional wards—nothing has changed at the University Hospital of Wales. Staff still feel under the same pressure as they were under in January.

**The First Minister:** You are making a statement rather than asking a question, but, if I deem it to be a question, I have given you the answer with regard to the opening of ward A1. That is the key to providing more beds and a quicker throughput into a proper hospital bed for those who were waiting on trolleys a month or two ago.

The other changes that have been made involve a diversion mechanism, which was introduced soon after my first visit. If there is huge pressure on the UHW, there is now an ambulance divert system—it is amazing that that had been scrapped some five or six years ago—to the Royal Glamorgan Hospital, or other hospitals nearby. That has been used on several occasions.

You are right that the situation can still go from feast to famine quickly, but the latest information, as of yesterday, is that the situation has eased considerably. However, that does not mean, if there were a sudden outbreak of diarrhoea and vomiting or

**Michael German:** Yn ystod toriad y Pasg, ymwelais â'r adran ddamweiniau ac achosion brys yn ysbyty'r Haeth, ond nid fel siopwr dirgel. Rhoddais rybudd iddynt y byddwn yn ymweld. Siaredais â'r rheolwyr, y staff a'r nyrssy a'r meddygon sy'n gweithio galed, am eu ffigur diogelwch. Mae ffigur diogelwch yn bodoli ym mhob uned ddamweiniau ac achosion brys yng Nghymru, a 25 yw'r ffigur diogelwch uchaf. Bu uned yr Ysbyty Athrofaol ar 25 ddydd a nos drwy gydol yr wythnos flaenorol. Pan ofynnais i'r staff beth oedd wedi newid ers eich ymweliad ym mis Ionawr, dywedasant nad oedd dim wedi newid ac mai'r un yw'r pwysau.

Yr ydych wedi siarad am y mater hwn, ond yr ydym am weld gweithredu. Ar wahân i'r ward y soniasoch amdani, sy'n cael rhagor o feddygon a nyrssy i'w staffio—er eich bod, ar yr un pryd, yn torri nifer y lleoedd hyfforddi i nyrssy a ffisiotherapyddion yng Nghymru, felly bydd yn ddiddorol gweld sut y llwyddwch i staffio wardiau ychwanegol—nid oes dim wedi newid yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru. Mae'r staff yn dal i deimlo o dan yr un pwysau ag yr oeddent oddi tano ym mis Ionawr.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych yn gwneud datganiad yn hytrach na gofyn cwestiwn, ond, os wyf yn barnu ei fod yn gwestiwn, yr wyf wedi rhoi ateb ichi o ran agor ward A1. Dyna'r allwedd i ddarparu rhagor o welyau a symud yn gyflymach i wely ysbyty iawn i'r rhai oedd yn aros ar droliau fis neu ddau yn ôl.

Mae'r newidiadau eraill a wnaethpwyd yn golygu mecanwaith dargyfeirio, a gyflwynwyd yn fuan ar ôl fy ymweliad cyntaf. Os oes pwysau enfawr ar yr Ysbyty Athrofaol, erbyn hyn mae system i ddargyfeirio ambiwlansys—mae'n anhygoel bod hynny wedi ei roi heibio bump neu chwe mlynedd yn ôl—i Ysbyty Brenhinol Morgannwg, neu ysbytai eraill cyfagos. Defnyddiwyd hynny ar sawl achlysur.

Yr ydych yn iawn bod modd o hyd i'r sefyllfa ddirywio yn gyflym, ond y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf, ddoe, yw bod y sefyllfa wedi gwella'n sylweddol. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n golygu, pe ceid yn sydyn nifer o achosion o ddolur rhydd a

whatever and wards were closed, that that situation would not return. However, provided that there is no such external factor, the situation has improved due to staffing the empty, un-staffed ward and setting up the diversion mechanism between the main hospitals that suffer the greatest pressures—the Royal Gwent Hospital and the University Hospital of Wales.

**Michael German:** I saw five ambulance crews with their patients waiting on trolleys for the entire time that I was visiting that unit. If staff were bold enough to go on television again, they would tell you that nothing had changed though they expected to see some action. These are very skilled people, who are putting up with the misery not only of working under enormous pressure, but of having to keep their patients under unacceptable conditions. Will you guarantee that patients will be back in beds under the care of nurses, instead of having to wait on those trolleys in corridors with ambulance crews alongside them?

**The First Minister:** As I said, you cannot guarantee anything, because there could be an outbreak of infection in a ward, such as diarrhoea and vomiting, which could spoil any guarantee that one gives.

chwydu neu beth bynnag y bo, a bod wardiau'n cael eu cau, na fyddai'r sefyllfa honno yn dychwelyd. Fodd bynnag, oni bai fod rhyw ffactor allanol o'r fath, mae'r sefyllfa wedi gwella yn sgil staffio'r ward wag, ddi-staff a sefydlu'r mecanwaith dargyfeirio rhwng y prif ysbrytai sy'n wynebu'r pwysau mwyaf—Ysbyty Brenhinol Gwent ac Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru.

**Michael German:** Gwelais bum criw ambiwlans gyda'u cleifion yn aros ar droliau gydol yr amser yr oeddwn yn ymweld â'r uned honno. Pe bai'r staff yn ddigon efn i fynd ar y teledu eto, byddent yn dweud wrthych nad oes dim wedi newid er eu bod yn disgwyl gweld gweithredu. Mae'r rhain yn bobl fedrus iawn, sy'n dioddef y gofid nid yn unig o weithio o dan bwysau enfawr, ond o orfod cadw eu cleifion o dan amodau annerbyniol. A wnewch warantu y bydd cleifion yn ôl mewn gwelyau o dan ofal nyrsys, yn lle gorfod aros ar y troliau hynny mewn corridorau gyda chriwiau ambiwlans wrth eu hochr?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Fel y dywedais, ni allwch warantu dim, oherwydd gellid cael haint ar ward, megis dolur rhydd a chwydu, a fyddai'n difetha unrhyw warant a gâi ei rhoi.

You keep saying that nothing has changed, but I have mentioned two major changes. Diversion mechanisms are now in place to ensure that ambulances do not take patients to UHW if there is a major hold-up there. They are now diverted—which has not been the case for five or six years—to the Royal Glamorgan Hospital or any other hospital that is nearby, where there are fewer pressures. That has had a major beneficial impact on the Royal Gwent Hospital and on UHW.

Secondly, ward A1, as I understand it, will be fully staffed over the next three years, but it is now staffed adequately for 10 or 12 beds. When it becomes a full ward with 40 beds, it will have a massive impact on the ability of UHW to cope with much higher flows of emergency patients admitted on trolleys.

Yr ydych yn dweud o hyd nad oes dim wedi newid, ond yr wyf wedi sôn am ddau newid mawr. Mae mecanweithiau dargyfeirio ar waith erbyn hyn i sicrhau nad yw ambiwlansys yn mynd â chleifion i'r Ysbyty Athrofaol os oes oedi mawr yno. Bellach caint eu dargyfeirio—rhywbeth na fu'n digwydd ers pump neu chwe mlynedd—i Ysbyty Brenhinol Morgannwg neu unrhyw ysbyty arall cyfagos, lle mae llai o bwysau. Mae hynny wedi cael effaith lesol fawr ar Ysbyty Brenhinol Gwent a'r Ysbyty Athrofaol.

Yn ail, bydd ward A1, yn ôl fel y deallaf, yn cael ei staffio'n llawn dros y tair blynedd nesaf, ond mae'n cael ei staffio'n ddigonol ar gyfer 10 neu 12 gwely ar hyn o bryd. Pan ddaw'n ward lawn gyda 40 gwely, caiff effaith enfawr ar allu'r Ysbyty Athrofaol i ymdopi â llawer rhagor o gleifion brys sy'n cael eu derbyn ar droliau.

### **Datblygu Cynaliadwy Sustainable Development**

**Q3 Lynne Neagle:** Will the First Minister make a statement on what the Assembly Government is doing to promote sustainable development? OAQ0313(FM)

**The First Minister:** You will be aware that we published our sustainable development action plan last November, which contained over 100 actions to achieve a step change in delivering sustainable development in Wales by 2007. The annual report on sustainable development will come to Plenary before the summer recess, which will report on progress with implementation.

**Lynne Neagle:** In that action plan, commitment is given to working with local education authorities and school governors so that, when school meal contracts come up for renewal, issues of health, nutrition and food seasonality are included in the tendering process. You will be aware of the UK Government's recent announcement to allocate £280 million to improve school meals in England with a commitment to introduce mandatory nutritional standards. Given the importance that the Assembly Government places on healthy living, what further action will it take to ensure that the

**C3 Lynne Neagle:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am yr hyn y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei wneud i hyrwyddo datblygu cynaliadwy? OAQ0313(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol ein bod wedi cyhoeddi ein cynllun gweithredu ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy fis Tachwedd diwethaf, oedd yn cynnwys dros 100 o gamau gweithredu i wireddu newid sylweddol o ran sicrhau datblygu cynaliadwy yng Nghymru erbyn 2007. Bydd yr adroddiad blynnyddol ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy yn dod gerbron Cyfarfod Llawn cyn toriad yr haf, a bydd yn adroddiad ar hynt y gweithredu.

**Lynne Neagle:** Yn y cynllun gweithredu hwnnw, rhoddir ymrwymiad i weithio gyda'r awdurdodau addysg lleol a llywodraethwyr ysgolion fel y bydd materion iechyd, maeth a bwydydd tymhorol yn cael eu cynnwys yn y broses dendro pan fydd contractau prydau ysgol yn dod gerbron i gael eu hadnewyddu. Byddwch yn ymwybodol o gyhoeddiad Llywodraeth y DU yn ddiweddar i ddyrannu £280 miliwn i wella prydau ysgol yn Lloegr gydag ymrwymiad i gyflwyno safonau maeth gorfodol. O ystyried y pwysigrwydd y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei roi ar fyw yn iach, pa gamau pellach y bydd yn eu cymryd

children of Wales are not subjected to a postcode lottery in school meal provision?

**The First Minister:** Nutritional standards in Welsh school meals were praised by Jamie Oliver. I was extremely pleased to hear him say that the standard of school meals in some local authority areas in Wales—he may not have meant all parts of Wales—was good. He picked out for particular praise the two west Wales authorities of Carmarthenshire and Pembrokeshire.

Scotland has gone down the route of regulating what you can include in school meals, such as reducing salt, fat, monosodium glutamate and sugar. We have tended to concentrate on adopting an holistic approach to the provision of school meals by trying to persuade schools not only to serve healthy food, but to do so in such a way that means the children will eat it. We all know the problem with teenagers—if you tell them to eat a raw carrot, they will want greasy hamburgers. However, getting them to eat well is not as easy as telling them to eat greasy hamburgers, because they will still not necessarily want a raw carrot. Somehow, we must induce teenagers, in particular, to accept what is on offer as a healthy diet that they want to eat; Wales is leading on such an approach.

England is now setting minimum nutritional and spending standards on meal contents, but we will all learn from each other. We may need to look at what the Scots and the English are doing in terms of school meal take-up and vice versa. Getting kids to take up the healthy diet on offer is as important as what you set in front of them. There is nothing worse than them not eating the food, and it getting thrown in the bin.

**Janet Davies:** You referred to the sustainable development plan in your answer to Lynne's first question, but there was a failure to publish and implement a clean energy action plan by last December, even though that was

i sicrhau nad yw plant Cymru yn ddarostyngedig i loteri cod post o ran y ddarpariaeth prydau ysgol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cafodd safonau maeth prydau ysgol yng Nghymru eu canmol gan Jamie Oliver. Yr oeddwn yn hynod falch o'i glywed yn dweud bod safon prydau ysgol yn ardaloedd rhai awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru—efallai nad oedd yn golygu pob rhan o Gymru—yn dda. Tynnodd sylw at y ddau awdurdod yng ngorllewin Cymru, Sir Gaerfyrddin a Sir Benfro, i'w canmol yn arbennig.

Mae'r Alban wedi gweithredu drwy reoleiddio'r hyn y ceir ei gynnwys mewn prydau ysgol, megis cwtogi ar halen, braster, monosodiwm glwtamad a siwgr. Yr ydym ni'n tueddu i ganolbwytio ar fabwysiadu dull cyfannol o ymdrin â darparu prydau ysgol drwy geisio perswadio ysgolion nid yn unig i weini bwyd iach, ond i wneud hynny mewn ffordd sy'n golygu y bydd y plant yn ei fwyta. Gwyddom i gyd am y broblem gyda phobl ifanc—os dywedwch wrthynt am fwyta moron amrwd, byddant am fwyta hambyrgyrs seimllyd. Fodd bynnag, nid yw cael ganddynt fwyta'n iach mor hawdd â dweud wrthynt am fwyta hambyrgyrs seimllyd, oherwydd ni fyddant o reidrwydd am fwyta moron amrwd wedyn. Weithiau, rhaid inni berswadio pobl ifanc, yn arbennig, i dderbyn yr hyn sy'n cael ei gynnig fel deiet iach y maent am ei fwyta; mae Cymru'n arwain y ffordd yn hynny o beth.

Erbyn hyn mae Lloegr yn gosod safonau gofynnol o ran maeth a gwariant ynglŷn â chynnwys prydau, ond byddwn yn dysgu oddi wrth ein gilydd. Efallai y bydd angen inni edrych ar yr hyn y mae'r Albanwyr a'r Saeson yn ei wneud o ran y niferoedd sy'n cymryd prydau ysgol ac i'r gwrthwyneb. Mae cael gan blant fanteisio ar y deiet iach a gynigir yr un mor bwysig â'r hyn a roddwch o'u blaenau. Nid oes dim yn waeth na'u bod yn peidio â bwyta'r bwyd, a'i fod yn cael ei daflu i'r bin.

**Janet Davies:** Cyfeiriasoch at y cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy yn eich ateb i gwestiwn cyntaf Lynne, ond methwyd cyhoeddi a gweithredu cynllun gweithredu ynni glân erbyn mis Rhagfyr diwethaf, er bod hynny

promised. There has been slow progress to develop a full suite of sustainable development indicators. So, could you outline why we are seeing a slippage in the implementation of this plan?

2.40 p.m.

**The First Minister:** I do not have any details on that. However, you will be aware that, in some areas of energy saving, we are investing large sums of money on a win-win basis. We are trying to reduce energy wastage in order to reduce poverty and carbon dioxide emissions by families in less well-off homes, who need to have their heating bills reduced, but who do not currently have draft excluders or insulation around their water tanks, or whatever. Therefore, it creates employment, it reduces carbon dioxide emissions and it cuts the fuel bills for those who are most at risk of fuel poverty. The home energy efficiency scheme is a major plank in achieving all three objectives.

**Laura Anne Jones:** I agree with your comments about making school meals more attractive to young people. However, most school meals are still full of junk food. Following the outstanding efforts of chef Jamie Oliver to highlight the appalling state of school meals across Britain, what action are you taking to vastly improve the quality of school meals in Wales, using local produce?

**The First Minister:** Using local produce is certainly part of the answer, as is getting more schools to sign up to the healthy meals network—around 1,000 schools in Wales have already signed up. It involves teaching kids through domestic science, as it used to be called, as well as through what is served at breakfast and dinner time. It applies to those who pay for school meals and those who receive free meals, and applies to the contents of sandwiches or other food contained in the school lunch box.

The network covers a range of issues to promote good practice. If one school in Wales finds a way to get stroppy teenagers to

wedi'i addo. Araf fu'r cynnydd o ran datblygu cyfres lawn o ddangosyddion datblygu cynaliadwy. Felly, a allech amlinellu pam yr ydym yn gweld nad yw'r cynllun hwn yn cael ei weithredu fel y dylai?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid oes gennyd fanylion ar hynny. Fodd bynnag, byddwch yn ymwybodol ein bod, mewn rhai meysydd arbed ynni, yn buddsoddi symiau mawr o arian fel bod pawb ar ei ennill. Yr ydym yn ceisio lleihau gwastraff ynni er mwyn lleihau tlodi a gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid gan deuluoedd mewn cartrefi llai cefnog, y mae angen gostyngiad arnynt yn eu biliau gwresogi, ond nad oes ganddynt ar hyn o bryd rimynnau drafftau nac insiwleiddiad am eu tanciau dŵr, neu beth bynnag y bo. Felly, mae'n creu cyflogaeth, mae'n lleihau gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid ac yn gostwng biliau tanwydd y rhai sydd fwyaf tebygol o fod yn dlawd o ran ynni. Mae'r cynllun effeithlonwyd ynni cartref yn elfen o bwys er mwyn cyflawni pob un o'r tri amcan.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Cytunaf â'ch sylwadau am wneud prydau ysgol yn fwy deniadol i bobl ifanc. Fodd bynnag, mae'r rhan fwyaf o brydau ysgol yn dal yn llawn bwyd sothach. Yn sgîl ymdrechion aruthrol y cogydd Jamie Oliver i dynnu sylw at gyflwr brawychus prydau ysgol ledled Prydain, pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd i wella ansawdd prydau ysgol yng Nghymru yn ddirfawr, gan ddefnyddio cynnyrch lleol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae defnyddio cynnyrch lleol yn sicr yn rhan o'r ateb, yn ogystal â chael gan ragor o ysgolion ymuno â'r rhwydwaith prydau iach—mae tua 1,000 o ysgolion yng Nghymru eisoes wedi gwneud hynny. Mae'n golygu addysgu plant drwy wyddor cartref, fel yr arferai gael ei galw, yn ogystal â thrwy'r hyn sy'n cael ei weini adeg brecwast a chinio. Mae'n berthnasol i'r rhai sy'n talu am brydau ysgol a'r rhai sy'n cael prydau am ddim, ac yn berthnasol i gynnwys brechdanau neu fwyd arall a gynhwysir mewn pecynnau bwyd ysgol.

Mae'r rhwydwaith yn cwmpasu ystod o faterion i hyrwyddo arferion da. Os oes un ysgol yng Nghymru yn canfod ffordd o gael

follow a healthy diet when they want to eat chips five days a week—if not eight days a week—then we want all the other schools in Wales to pick up on that quickly, rather than reinventing the wheel. Networking and spreading good practice on any aspect of purchasing, cooking and presenting food and getting kids' consent to eating a healthy diet is vital to ward off the obesity time bomb that we face in 20 or 30 years' time if we do not crack this issue.

**Kirsty Williams:** Dealing with waste should be a key part of your Government's aims in promoting and establishing sustainable development. Therefore, is it particularly sustainable for the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside to suggest that farm plastic is put into landfill, following the Welsh Assembly Government's failure to back a recycling scheme in west Wales? Is it more sustainable to go down the route of the Scottish Executive, which has invested £150,000 to establish a national farm plastic scheme?

**The First Minister:** I am not aware of the individual circumstances of national farm plastic schemes in Wales or Scotland, for which I apologise, but I will ensure that Carwyn writes to you about the matter. However, in general, it is fair to say that our record on improving the situation regarding increasing the percentage of municipal waste recycled from 12 to 17 per cent over the past five years is quite remarkable. We must go a lot further to reach the target of 40 per cent by 2010, so I hope that we can continue that drive. Eventually, that may cover elements such as farm waste, but it would not be classified as municipal waste, because it would be trade waste.

gan bobl ifanc ystyfnig ddilyn deiet iach a hwythau am fwyta sglodion bum diwrnod yr wythnos—yna yr ydym am i holl ysgolion eraill Cymru fanteisio ar hynny yn gyflym, yn hytrach nag ailddyfeisio'r olwyn. Mae rhwydweithio a lledaenu arferion da ar unrhyw agwedd ar brynu, coginio a chyflwyno bwyd a chael gan blant gydsynio i fwyta deiet iach yn hanfodol er mwyn atal y bom amser o ran gordewdra sy'n ein hwynebu ymhen 20 neu 30 mlynedd onid ydym yn datrys y broblem hon.

**Kirsty Williams:** Dylai delio â gwastraff fod yn rhan allweddol o nodau eich Llywodraeth wrth hyrwyddo a sefydlu datblygu cynaliadwy. Felly, a yw'n gynaliadwy i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad awgrymu bod plastig oddi ar ffermydd yn mynd i safleoedd tirlenwi, yn sgil methiant Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gefnogi cynllun ailgylchu yn y Gorllewin? A yw'n fwy cynaliadwy gwneud fel y gwnaeth Gweithrediaeth yr Alban, sydd wedi buddsoddi £150,000 i sefydlu cynllun cenedlaethol ar gyfer plastig oddi ar ffermydd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o amgylchiadau unigol cynlluniau cenedlaethol ar gyfer plastig fferm yng Nghymru na'r Alban, ac ymddiheuraf am hynny, ond byddaf yn sicrhau bod Carwyn yn ysgrifennu atoch ar y mater. Fodd bynnag, yn gyffredinol, mae'n deg dweud bod ein record ar wella'r seyllfa o ran cynyddu canran y gwastraff trefol a ailgylchir, o 12 i 17 y cant dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf, yn bur hynod. Rhaid mynd ymhellach o lawer i gyrraedd y targed o 40 y cant erbyn 2010, felly gobeithiaf y gallwn barhau â'r ymgyrch honno. Maes o law, efallai y bydd yn cwmpasu elfennau megis gwastraff ffermydd, ond ni châi ei ystyried yn wastraff trefol, gan mai gwastraff masnachol fyddai.

### Cau Tafarnau mewn Ardaloedd Gwledig The Closure of Pubs in Rural Areas

**Q4 Mick Bates:** What assessment has the Welsh Assembly Government made of the impact of the closure of pubs in rural areas on sustaining viable communities in those areas? OAQ0327(FM)

**C4 Mick Bates:** Pa asesiad a wnaeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o effaith cau tafarnau mewn ardaloedd gwledig ar gynnal cymunedau hyfyw yn yr ardaloedd hynny? OAQ0327(FM)

**The First Minister:** The Wales Rural Observatory conducted a survey of community councils in Wales, asking whether they felt relatively well served by pubs in rural areas. Of the councils that responded, 92 per cent reported having access to one pub or more, which represented a fall of 1 per cent over the past eight years.

**Mick Bates:** I am grateful for that information. However, the Campaign for Real Ale has said that more than 100 pubs have closed in Wales in the last two years. I am sure that you will agree that that is a sad loss for those communities. On the basis of your answer, I am uncertain what action you are taking to reverse the effects of the loss of these important facilities. Do you support the call of my colleague, Roger Williams, for public authorities to undertake a social and environmental impact assessment before closing premises such as the Old Barn Inn in Three Cocks, Powys?

**The First Minister:** I am familiar with many hosteries in rural Wales, and I look forward to trying that one out. There is nothing I enjoy better than an evening in a rural alehouse. However, it is important that we recognise that there is a planning permission procedure to follow when buildings undergo a change in use.

The housing boom has meant that some rural pubs with marginal profits have been turned into houses over the past two years. The restrictions on drinking and driving have scared those who cannot limit themselves to a pint or two in the evening off from travelling long distances to pubs by car. That is an inevitable consequence of much tighter controls on drink-driving.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cynhaliodd Arsyllfa Wledig Cymru arolwg o gynghorau cymuned yng Nghymru, yn gofyn a oeddent yn teimlo eu bod yn cael eu gwasanaethu'n gymharol dda gan dafarnau mewn ardaloedd gwledig. O'r cynghorau a ymatebodd, dywedodd 92 y cant fod un neu fwy o dafarnau o fewn cyrraedd iddynt, sy'n golygu gostyngiad o 1 y cant dros yr wyth mlynedd diwethaf.

**Mick Bates:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y wybodaeth honno. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Campaign for Real Ale wedi dweud bod mwy na 100 o dafarnau wedi cau yng Nghymru yn ystod y ddwy flynedd ddiwethaf. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn cytuno bod hynny'n golled drist i'r cymunedau hynny. Ar sail eich ateb, yr wyf yn ansicr pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd i wrthdroi effeithiau colli'r cyfleusterau pwysig hyn. A ydych yn cefnogi galwad fy nghyd-aelod, Roger Williams, ar yr awdurdodau cyhoeddus i gynnwl asesiad o'r effaith gymdeithasol ac amgylcheddol cyn cau tafarnau megis yr Old Barn Inn yn Aberllynfi, Powys?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn gyfarwydd â llawer o dafarnau yng nghefn gwlad Cymru, ac edrychaf ymlaen at fynd i honno. Nid oes dim yr wyf yn ei fwynhau'n well na min nos mewn tafarn wledig. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cydnabod bod gweithdrefn caniatâd cynllunio i'w dilyn pan fydd defnydd adeladau yn cael ei newid.

O ganlyniad i ffyniant y farchnad dai cafodd rhai tafarnau gwledig nad oeddent yn gwneud llawer o elw eu troi'n dai yn ystod y ddwy flynedd ddiwethaf. Mae'r cyfyngiadau ar yfed a gyrru wedi gwneud i'r rhai na allant gyfyngu eu hunain i beint neu ddau gyda'r nos beidio â theithio'n bell mewn car i dafarn. Mae hynny'n ganlyniad anorfod i gamau llawer llymach i reoli yfed a gyrru.

Publicans have to consider the extent to which they can make their pub the hub of the community. Those who have travelled in rural Ireland will realise that a pub there is not only the rural pub, but is also the post office, the petrol station, the cafe, the shop—it is everything rolled into one, because there is only enough trade to justify one family business, but it covers every need in a remote, sparsely-populated area. As a result of the temperance movement in Wales, the pub has always been separate from every other form of business activity. However, we may need to find a way of adapting the requirements of the nineteenth century temperance movement to the realities of twenty-first century commercial life in rural Wales.

Rhaid i dafarnwyr ystyried i ba raddau y gallant wneud eu tafarn yn ganolbwyt y gymuned. Bydd y rhai sydd wedi teithio yng nghefn gwlaid Iwerddon yn sylweddoli bod tafarn yno nid yn unig yn dafarn wledig, ond hefyd yn swyddfa'r post, gorsaf betrol, caffi, siop—i gyd gyda'i gilydd, gan nad oes digon o fasnach i gyflawnhau mwy nag un busnes teuluol, ond mae'n diwallu pob angen mewn ardal anghysbell sydd â phoblogaeth wasgaredig. O ganlyniad i'r mudiad dirwest yng Nghymru, mae'r dafarn bob amser wedi bod ar wahân i bob gweithgaredd busnes arall. Fodd bynnag, efallai fod angen inni ganfod dull o addasu gofynion mudiad dirwest y bedwaredd ganrif ar bymtheg ar gyfer realiti bywyd masnachol yr unfed ganrif ar hugain yng nghefn gwlaid Cymru.

### Prydau Ysgol School Meals

**Q5 Sandy Mewies:** Will the First Minister make a statement on nutritional guidelines for school meals? OAQ0330(FM)

**C5 Sandy Mewies:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ganllawiau maeth ar gyfer prydau ysgol? OAQ0330(FM)

**Q9 Lorraine Barrett:** What action is the Welsh Assembly Government taking to improve the nutritional content of school dinners in Wales? OAQ0308(FM)

**C9 Lorraine Barrett:** Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n eu cymryd i wella cynnwys maeth ciniawau ysgol yng Nghymru? OAQ0308(FM)

**The First Minister:** Guidance was issued in March 2003 on ways of meeting or exceeding the standards set in regulations. It covers healthy diets, ways of improving the school meal service and encouraging pupils to eat the food served. As part of our whole-school approach to food and nutrition, we are jointly funding a study with the Food Standards Agency to help to determine the best way forward on providing more nutritious food that pupils will eat.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cyhoeddwyd canllawiau ym Mawrth 2003 yn nodi ffyrdd o gydymffurfio â'r safonau a bennwyd mewn rheoliadau neu ragori arnynt. Maent yn ymwneud â bwytan iach, ffyrdd o wella'r gwasanaeth prydau ysgol ac annog disgyblion i fwytan i bwyd a weinir. Fel rhan o'n hagwedd ysgol-gyfan tuag at fwyd a maethiad, yr ydym yn ariannu astudiaeth ar y cyd â'r Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd er mwyn helpu i benderfynu beth yw'r ffordd orau o ddarparu bwyd mwy maethlon y bydd disgyblion yn ei fwytan.

**Sandy Mewies:** We all accept that sensible nutrition and drinking water in schools has an important and effective impact on standards of achievement. I have recently visited many primary schools in my constituency, Delyn, where headteachers have welcomed the joint initiative between the Welsh Assembly Government and Dŵr Cymru on water coolers. It is important that everyone plays their part, and schools are doing this. Will you join me in congratulating Ysgol Maes Garmon in Mold, which has recently won a healthy eating competition for schools? This school, as do many others in my constituency, makes a real effort when feeding pupils.

**The First Minister:** I am glad to hear about what is happening in Ysgol Maes Garmon. It is important that, through the initiative of the healthy schools network, the good ideas that it has piloted and which have proved successful should spread to other schools. The success of the water cooler initiative, along with fruit tuck shops, the healthy school breakfasts now being provided in Communities First areas, and the healthy vending machines piloted successfully in Pembrokeshire, needs to be spread into other areas of Wales. There are areas of success, but it is patchy. We have to share good practice between local authorities, school meal services and schools. We also have to learn from Scotland and England, as they will learn from us.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I am sure that you welcome the improvements made by Cardiff County Council's school meal service over recent years. Will you join me in calling on the Liberal Democrat administration in Cardiff to ensure that the 5p increase on school meals, taking them to £1.45, goes directly into the school meal itself, to continue improving the quality of that food?

**Sandy Mewies:** Mae pob un ohonom yn derbyn bod maethiad synhwyrol ac yfed dŵr mewn ysgolion yn cael dylanwad pwysig ac effeithiol ar safonau cyrhaeddiad. Bûm yn ddiweddar mewn nifer o ysgolion cynradd yn fy etholaeth, Delyn, lle mae penaethiaid wedi croesawu'r fenter ar y cyd rhwng Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a Dŵr Cymru i gyflwyno cyfarpar oeri dŵr. Mae'n bwysig bod pawb yn chwarae ei ran, ac mae ysgolion yn gwneud hyn. A wnewch chi ymuno â mi i longyfarch Ysgol Maes Garmon yn yr Wyddgrug, a enillodd gystadleuaeth bwyta'n iach ar gyfer ysgolion yn ddiweddar? Mae'r ysgol hon, fel sawl un arall yn fy etholaeth, yn edrych o ddifrif ar fater bwydo disgylion.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn falch o glywed am yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn Ysgol Maes Garmon. Mae'n bwysig bod y syniadau da a dreialwyd ac a fu'n llwyddiannus yn cael eu lledaenu i ysgolion eraill drwy'r rhwydwaith ysgolion iach. Mae angen lledaenu llwyddiant y cyfarpar oeri dŵr, ynghyd â siopau ffrwythau, y brecwast iach a ddarperir yn awr mewn ysgolion yn ardaloedd y rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, a'r peiriannau gwerthu bwydydd iach a dreialwyd yn llwyddiannus yn Sir Benfro, i rannau eraill o Gymru. Gwelwyd llwyddiant, ond tameidiog ydyw. Rhaid inni rannu arferion da rhwng awdurdodau lleol, gwasanaethau prydau ysgol ac ysgolion. Rhaid inni ddysgu hefyd o'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn Lloegr a'r Alban, a byddant hwythau'n dysgu o'r hyn sy'n digwydd yma.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn croesawu'r gwelliannau a sicrhawyd gan wasanaeth prydau ysgol Cyngor Sir Caerdydd yn ystod y blynnyddoedd diwethaf. A wnewch chi ymuno â mi i alw ar weinyddiaeth y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yng Nghaerdydd i sicrhau bod y cynnydd o 5c ym mhris prydau ysgol, i £1.45, yn mynd yn uniongyrchol tuag at y pryd ei hun, er mwyn parhau i wella ansawdd y bwyd hwnnw?

**The First Minister:** I understand that Cardiff's school meal service is good in the sense that it encourages the supply of organic food, but that it is not good in the sense that the average school meal content expenditure is only 40p per meal. It could be a lot higher than that. That applies to the free school meal service in particular. It is important that it looks at the content, the amount that it is willing to spend, what the children get for that amount, and whether the best ideas available in Wales—like the initiatives in Carmarthenshire and Pembrokeshire that I mentioned earlier—can be followed in our capital city.

**Janet Ryder:** The proportion of food that a child consumes at school is relatively small compared with the total amount of food that a child consumes. Do you agree with the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning when she says that the nutrition of children is too important to be left to parents? If so, what is your Government doing to help and support those parents, rather than take that responsibility away from them?

2.50 p.m.

**The First Minister:** It is clearly a shared responsibility, but the important thing is the psychology of the children. Do you tell them, 'You can have chips once a week, or you can bring in chocolate in your lunch-box once a week, but for the other four days that is off the menu'? All of these ideas have been tried, and some were very successful. You have to make a bargain with children and persuade them that in return for having something that they like, but which is a bit sugary and so forth occasionally, they will eat a healthy diet the rest of the time. Having tried that healthy diet, they frequently then find that it is just as tasty and nice as their previous diet, once their taste buds adapt to the removal of the excess salt and sugar loads. It roughly takes a fortnight for taste buds to change. How to persuade kids to go for the healthy options, and have the so-called 'treat' occasionally, is very much a part of the way that we look holistically at what happens at home and in school.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Deallaf fod gwasanaeth prydau ysgol Caerdydd yn un da o ran ei fod yn annog cyflenwi bwyd organig ond, ar y llaw arall, dim ond 40c y pryd ar gyfartaledd sy'n cael ei wario ar gynnwys y pryd. Gallai fod yn llawer uwch na hyn. Mae hyn yn berthnasol i'r gwasanaeth cinio ysgol am ddim yn fwyaf arbennig. Mae'n bwysig ei fod yn edrych ar y cynnwys, faint y mae'n barod i'w wario, beth y mae'r plant yn ei gael am y swm hwn, ac a oes modd gweithredu'r syniadau gorau sydd yng Nghymru—fel y cynlluniau yn Siroedd Caerfyrddin a Phenfro y cyfeiriais atynt yn gynharach—yn ein prifddinas.

**Janet Ryder:** Mae cyfran y bwyd y mae plentyn yn ei fwyta yn yr ysgol yn gymharol fach o'i gymharu â'r holl fwyd y mae plentyn yn ei fwyta. A ydych yn cytuno â'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes pan fo'n dweud bod maethiad plant yn fater rhy bwysig i'w adael i rieni? Os ydych, beth y mae eich Llywodraeth yn ei wneud er mwyn helpu a chefnogi'r rhieni hynny, yn hytrach na mynd â'r cyfrifoldeb hwnnw oddi arnynt?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hwn yn amlwg yn gyfrifoldeb i'w rannu, ond y peth pwysig yw seicoleg y plant. A ydych yn dweud wrthynt, 'Gallwch gael sglodion unwaith yr wythnos, neu gallwch ddod â siocled yn eich bocs bwyd unwaith yr wythnos, ond am y pedwar diwrnod arall nid yw ar y fwydlen'? Treialwyd pob un o'r syniadau hyn, a bu rhai'n llwyddiannus iawn. Rhaid ichi daro bargin gyda phlant a'u perswadio y byddant, yn gyfnewid am gael rhywbeth y maent yn ei hoffi, ond sy'n cynnwys ychydig bach gormod o siwgr ac ati o bryd i'w gilydd, yn bwyta deiet iach weddill yr amser. Ar ôl rhoi cynnig ar y deiet iach hwn, maent yn aml yn canfod ei fod yr un mor flasus â'u deiet blaenorol, ar ôl i'w blasbwytiau addasu i fwydydd heb gymaint o halen a siwgr. Mae'n cymryd pythefnos yn fras i flasbwytiau newid. Mae sut i berswadio plant i fynd am y dewis iach, a chael 'trêt' bach yn achlysurol, yn rhan allweddol o'n hagwedd gyfannol at yr hyn sy'n digwydd gartref ac yn yr ysgol.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** I agree, First Minister, that considerable progress has been made in terms of the provision of nutritious meals, and the free school breakfast scheme is also an excellent example of this. However, do you share my grave concern at how we will be able to fund this, should the Conservatives, in the nightmare scenario, ever be elected, as we would have to face our share of the £35 billion-worth of cuts, which is bound to affect initiatives such as this?

**The First Minister:** I do not think that there is any chance of initiatives like this being able to go ahead if that ‘nightmare scenario’ took place. However, I believe that the common sense of the people of Wales and the people of Britain will prevent that from happening.

**Mark Isherwood:** I am pleased to confirm that there will be a multi-billion pound increase in school funding under the Tories. However, unfortunately—[*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I was hoping that it would not come to this so early. I will make the statement I have made the previous time that I was here: there is no election in this Chamber.

**Mark Isherwood:** I completely share your sentiments.

How much of the Jamie Oliver money pledged in England will be coming to Wales, and how will you use this to address the issue raised in a letter that I received from a north Wales parent last week, who wrote to tell me that the six-week rolling menu in her county was still full of junk food?

**The First Minister:** You should talk to your local authority about that, whichever of the local authorities it happens to be. Perhaps you could tell us and we could bring some pressure to bear to see whether the authority is a member of the healthy schools network and what it is doing about the situation.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Cytunaf, Brif Weinidog, fod cynnydd sylweddol wedi ei wneud o ran darparu prydau maethlon, ac mae'r cynllun brecwast am ddim mewn ysgolion hefyd yn enghraift ragorol o hyn. Fodd bynnag, a ydych yn rhannu fy mhryder mawr ynglŷn â sut y gellid ariannu hyn, pe bai'r Ceidwadwyr, mewn senario hunllefus, yn cael eu hethol rywbryd, gan y byddai'n rhaid inni wynebu'n cyfran o'r cwtogiadau o £35 biliwn, sy'n siŵr o effeithio ar gynlluniau fel hyn?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn credu bod dim gobaith i gynlluniau fel hyn barhau pe baem yn wynebu'r ‘senario hunllefus’ honno. Fodd bynnag, credaf y bydd synnwyr cyffredin pobl Cymru a phobl Phrydain yn sicrhau na fydd hynny'n digwydd.

**Mark Isherwood:** Yr wyf yn falch o gadarnhau y bydd biliynau yn rhagor o bunnoedd yn mynd i ysgolion dan y Torïaid. Fodd bynnag, yn anffodus—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr oeddwn yn gobeithio na fyddai hyn yn digwydd mor fuan. Gwnaf y datganiad yr wyf wedi ei wneud yma o'r blaen: nid oes etholiad yn y Siambr hon.

**Mark Isherwood:** Yr wyf yn cytuno'n llwyr â chi.

Faint o arian Jamie Oliver a addawyd yn Lloegr fydd yn dod i Gymru, a sut y byddwch yn defnyddio'r arian hwn i roi sylw i'r mater a godwyd mewn llythyr a dderbyniais gan riant yn y Gogledd yr wythnos diwethaf, a ysgrifennodd ataf i ddweud bod y fwydlen dreigl chwe wythnos yn ei sir hi yn dal i fod yn llawn bwyd sothach?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dylech drafod hynny gyda'ch awdurdod lleol, pa un bynnag ydyw. Efallai y gallech roi gwybod inni a gallem roi rhywfaint o bwysau er mwyn gweld a yw'r awdurdod yn aelod o'r rhwydwaith ysgolion iach a beth y mae'n ei wneud ynglŷn â'r sefyllfa.

You asked about the ‘Jamie Oliver money’, which was a slightly odd description of it, but I think that you will be aware, with your famed erudition on matters financial, that when the Department for Education and Skills decides to reduce expenditure on something in order to increase expenditure on school meals, it has no bearing on funding in Wales. In Wales, we proceed through our budget procedures to persuade local authorities to continue to use the good guidance that was given at the end of 2003.

As it was good news about Wales, I suppose that you blanked it out of your mind, but Jamie Oliver said that Wales was ahead of England in producing healthy school meals. I accept that that is probably not true for every school and every local authority. If a particular local authority that it is your honour to represent is falling down on the job, please tell it that it is doing so, and please tell Jane Davidson about it and we will see what we can do to pressure it to come up to the standards of the best in Wales.

**Eleanor Burnham:** What exactly are the nutritional guidelines, and are they any better than those the Tories got rid of in the 1980s under Margaret Thatcher? How can you ensure that the funding will allow schools to produce good meals, because, after all, as I understand it, France spends at least £1.50 per school lunch?

**The First Minister:** What is spent on school dinners will depend in the first place on whether we are talking about free school dinners or those that are paid for. We are trying to persuade authorities in Wales to increase their expenditure on the content, and make sure that it is healthy content, but also to present the food in such a way that kids will eat it. Merely serving healthy food does not ensure that kids, especially teenagers, will accept it and realise that it is important for them to eat it, because teenagers go through a phase where they want to do the exact opposite of what those in authority wish them and tell them to do. It is not as easy as reversing the situation and forcing greasy hamburgers on them to make them choose to

Holasoch ynglŷn ag ‘arian Jamie Oliver’, a oedd yn ddisgrifiad braidd yn od ohono, ond credaf y byddwch yn ymwybodol, a chithau’n enwog am eich gwybodaeth helaeth am faterion ariannol, pan fo’r Adran Addysg a Sgiliau’n penderfynu lleihau gwariant ar rywbeith er mwyn cynyddu gwariant ar brydau ysgol, nad yw’n cael dim effaith ar gyllid yng Nghymru. Yng Nghymru, yr ydym yn mynd ati drwy ein gweithdrefnau cyllidebol i berswadio awdurdodau lleol i ddal i ddefnyddio’r canllawiau da a roddwyd ar ddiwedd 2003.

Gan ei fod yn newyddion da am Gymru, tybiaf eich bod wedi ei gau allan o’ch meddwl, ond dywedodd Jamie Oliver fod Cymru ar y blaen i Loegr o ran cynhyrchu prydau ysgol iach. Derbyniaf nad yw hyn yn wir mae’n debyg am bob ysgol a phob awdurdod lleol. Os nad yw awdurdod lleol penodol y mae’n faint ichi ei gynrychioli yn gwneud ei waith yn iawn, dylech roi gwybod iddo. Dylech hefyd roi gwybod i Jane Davidson a chawn weld beth y gallwn ei wneud er mwyn rhoi pwysau arno i gyrraedd safonau’r goreuon yng Nghymru.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Beth yn union yw’r canllawiau maeth, ac a ydynt rywfaint gwell na’r rhai a ddiddymwyd gan y Torïaid yn y 1980au dan Margaret Thatcher? Sut y gallwch sicrhau y bydd yr arian yn caniatáu i ysgolion gynhyrchu prydau da, oherwydd, wedi’r cyfan, os wyf yn deall yn iawn, mae Ffrainc yn gwario o leiaf £1.50 ar bob cinio ysgol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Bydd y swm sy’n cael ei wario ar ginio ysgol yn amrywio gan ddibynnau i ddechrau a ydym yn siarad am ginio ysgol am ddim neu am ginio y telir amdano. Yr ydym yn ceisio perswadio awdurdodau yng Nghymru i wario mwy ar y cynnwys, a gwneud yn siŵr bod y cynnwys yn iach, ond hefyd i gyflwyno’r bwyd yn y fath fodd fel y bydd plant yn ei fwyta. Nid yw gweini bwyd iach yn unig yn mynd i sicrhau y bydd plant, a phobl ifanc yn eu harddegau yn enwedig, yn ei dderbyn ac yn sylweddoli ei bod yn bwysig iddynt ei fwyta, oherwydd y mae pobl ifanc yn mynd drwy gyfnod o weithredu’n gwbl groes i’r hyn y mae pobl mewn awdurdod eisiau iddynt ei wneud ac yn dweud wrthynt am ei wneud.

eat a raw carrot instead. It is not as easy as that, and we know it. We have to try to persuade people to try the healthy options, because it will be good for them.

In terms of what we have done, we have the healthy schools initiative trying out and establishing best practice. As I mentioned earlier, Carmarthenshire and Pembrokeshire have been particularly good at this. We must get schools to take out the vending machines that serve fizzy drinks with a high sugar content, and food with a high fat and salt content, thereby releasing children's taste buds to the taste of real food.

Nid yw mor hawdd â gwirthdroi'r sefyllfa a gwthio hambyrgyrs llawn saim o'u blaen er mwyn gwneud iddynt ddewis bwyta moron amrwd yn eu lle. Nid yw mor hawdd â hynny, a gwyddom hynny. Rhaid inni geisio perswadio pobl i roi cynnig ar y dewisiadau iach, oherwydd y bydd hynny'n dda iddynt.

O ran yr hyn yr ydym wedi ei wneud, mae ein menter ysgolion iach yn treialu ac yn sefydlu'r arferion gorau. Fel y crybwylais yn gynharach, mae Siroedd Caerfyrddin a Phenfro wedi gwneud hyn yn dda iawn. Rhaid inni gael ysgolion i gael gwared ar beiriannau sy'n gwerthu diodydd byrlymog llawn siwgr, a bwydydd llawn braster a halen, a rhyddhau blaswyntiau plant i flas bwyd go iawn.

### Hybu Prynu'n Lleol Promoting Local Purchasing

**Q6 Helen Mary Jones:** Will the First Minister make a statement on what plans he has to promote local purchasing?  
OAQ0322(FM)

**The First Minister:** We have encouraged greater links between public procurement and the local supply base in Wales, subject always to the competition rules and the compulsory advertisement rules of the *Official Journal of the European Communities*. However, on the supply and procurement of local food in the public sector, we are recognised as leading the rest of the UK, and I want us to maintain that lead. In order to get around the European rules, you can specify 'fresh' food, but you cannot specify 'Welsh' food.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I am sure that you would agree that one major potential market for local produce is local schools. As you have mentioned several times today, Carmarthenshire is a good example of where competition rules issues have been overcome. I was interested in some of your earlier responses, and your forays into child psychology have been fascinating. However, I press you again to commit to match the increased funding for school meals promised to schools in England by the Westminster

**C6 Helen Mary Jones:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ba gynlluniau sydd ganddo ar gyfer hybu prynu'n lleol?  
OAQ0322(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym wedi annog mwy o gysylltiadau rhwng caffael cyhoeddus a chyflenwyr lleol yng Nghymru, yn amodol bob amser ar y rheolau ynghylch cystadleuaeth a rheolau hysbysebu gorfodol y cyfnodolyn swyddogol, *Official Journal of the European Communities*. Fodd bynnag, yng nghyd-destun cyflenwi a chaffael bwyd lleol yn y sector cyhoeddus, dywedir ein bod ar y blaen i weddill y DU, a hoffwn ein gweld yn aros ar y blaen. Er mwyn ochr gamu'r rheolau Ewropeaidd, gallwch nodi bwyd 'ffres', ond ni allwch nodi bwyd 'Cymreig'.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunech fod ysgolion lleol yn farchnad bosibl, sylweddol ei maint, ar gyfer cynnyrch lleol. Mae Sir Gaerfyrddin, fel yr ydych wedi nodi sawl gwaith heddiw, yn engraifft dda o oresgyrn problemau rheolau cystadleuaeth. Yr oedd gennyl ddiddordeb mewn ambell ymateb cynharach a wnaethoch, ac yr oedd eich sylwadau ar seicoleg plant yn ddiddorol iawn. Fodd bynnag, pwysaf arnoch unwaith eto i ymrwymo i efelychu Lloegr, o ran y cynydd mewn arian ar gyfer prydau ysgol a

Government—and I will not credit that to Jamie Oliver, or anyone else necessarily—to enable schools across Wales to provide more locally sourced food. Such food may be a little more expensive, but it is often of much better quality. That would end the postcode lottery in the provision of school meals in Wales, which has been rightly referred to by Lynne Neagle and others.

addawyd i ysgolion yn Lloegr gan Lywodraeth San Steffan—ac nid wyf am roi'r clod am hyn i Jamie Oliver, na neb arall o reidrwydd—fel bod pob ysgol yng Nghymru'n gallu darparu rhagor o brydau â bwydydd lleol. Efallai bod bwyd o'r fath ychydig yn ddrutach, ond mae'r ansawdd yn aml yn llawer gwell. Byddai hyn yn rhoi terfyn ar y loteri cod post o ran darparu prydau ysgol yng Nghymru, rhywbeth y cyfeiriwyd ato'n gwbl briodol gan Lynne Neagle ac eraill.

**The First Minister:** It is a question of whether England can match us, as I understand from Jamie Oliver. Again, you have an aversion to anything that indicates that Wales is ahead of England. That might be surprising for a Welsh nationalist, but there we are, we live with these things. Jamie Oliver said that Wales was ahead of England. Therefore, the question is whether England will match us, not whether we will match England. There is a wide disparity in Wales in expenditure on the content of school meals. However, it is not all about the cost of the content—it is how clever you are with what you do with it, and whether the kids eat it. We must ensure that the food is presented in such a way that people consume it, otherwise we are investing a lot of effort for nothing.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Y cwestiwn yw a all Lloegr ein hefelychu ni, yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf gan Jamie Oliver. Unwaith eto, yr ydych yn anwybyddu unrhyw beth sy'n awgrymu bod Cymru ar y blaen i Loegr. Efallai fod hynny'n beth rhyfedd i genedlaetholwraig, ond dyna ni, yr ydym yn byw gyda'r pethau hyn. Dywedodd Jamie Oliver fod Cymru ar y blaen i Loegr. Felly, y cwestiwn yw a fydd Lloegr yn ein hefelychu ni, nid a fyddwn ni'n efelychu Lloegr. Mae gwariant ar gynnwys prydau ysgol yn amrywio'n fawr yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, nid cost y cynnwys yw'r unig beth i'w ystyried, ond pa mor glyfar ydych wrth gyflwyno'r cynnwys, ac a yw'r plant yn ei fwyta. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod y bwyd yn cael ei gyflwyno'n dda er mwyn i bobl ei fwyta neu bydd ein holl ymdrechion yn ofer.

### **Effaith Cynyddu Ardrethi Busnes The Impact of Business Rate Increases**

**Q7 Jenny Randerson:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the impact of business rate increases on small businesses? OAQ0334(FM)

**The First Minister:** The Local Government Act 2003 gave us powers to introduce a small business rate relief scheme. Research has begun into all the rate relief schemes to establish their effectiveness in targeting help to those that need it most. We hope that that will be concluded by July 2005, so that there is time to prepare any regulations that may be needed, and to consult on them, before bringing in the changes by 1 April 2006.

**C7 Jenny Randerson:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am effaith cynyddu'r trethi busnes ar fusnesau bach? OAQ0334(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Rhoddodd Deddf Llywodraeth Leol 2003 bwerau inni gyflwyno cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi ar gyfer busnesau bach. Dechreuwyd ymchwilio i'r holl gynlluniau rhyddhad ardrethi er mwyn canfod pa mor effeithiol ydynt wrth dargeddu cymorth tuag at y rhai sydd ei angen fwyaf. Gobeithiwn gwblhau'r ymchwil erbyn Gorffennaf 2005, er mwyn cael amser i baratoi unrhyw reoliadau angenheidol, ac i ymgynghori ynglŷn â hwy, cyn cyflwyno'r newidiadau erbyn 1 Ebrill 2006.

**Jenny Randerson:** A group of my constituents who own businesses and live in Cardiff Central came to my surgery last Friday. They face an actual increase of 64 per cent in their business rates for this year. These are small retail businesses, struggling to make a living against the big chains and supermarkets. Do you recognise that an increase of this proportion will make a ghost town of some of our local shopping centres in Cardiff, and do you agree that a small business rate relief scheme in Wales, along the lines of that for England, needs to be introduced urgently? Do you also agree that there should be a permanent lower level of business rates for small businesses, which pay a higher proportion of their turnover in business rates than large companies do?

**The First Minister:** You will remember that, when we last considered this, there was ferocious opposition from big business in Wales to the idea that they would cross-subsidise small business as regards rates. Given the parlous position of the finances of large businesses at the time—such as Corus—we all went along with that. We should not have a cross-subsidisation scheme from the large to the small, although the general point about the rates being bigger for small businesses as a total proportion of turnover is accepted. On your point about individual groups and businesses in Cardiff, I have no way of knowing what the particular situation is. In general, business rates are still considerably lower in Wales than in England, but there may be individual areas of Wales where business rates may be high, and much higher because of the revaluation. However, if shop owners in Cardiff city centre are of the opinion that the 2005 rateable value of their shops is excessive, they should have further discussions with the Valuation Office Agency and, if necessary, appeal against the valuations.

3.00 p.m.

### Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Abertawe Swansea NHS Trust

**C8 David Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am y pwysau sydd ar Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Abertawe?

**Jenny Randerson:** Daeth grŵp o berchnogion busnes sy'n byw ac yn gweithio yn etholaeth Canol Caerdydd i'm gweld ddydd Gwener diwethaf. Maent yn wynebu cynnydd gwirioneddol o 64 y cant yn eu hardrethi busnes eleni. Busnesau manwerthu bychain yw'r rhain, yn brwydro i wneud bywoliaeth yn erbyn yr archfarchnadoedd a'r siopau cadwyn mawr. A ydych yn cydnabod y bydd cynnydd fel hwn yn arwain at siopau gweigion yn rhai o'n canolfannau siopa lleol yng Nghaerdydd, ac a gytunwch fod angen cyflwyno cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi ar gyfer busnesau bach yng Nghymru, fel yr un sydd yn Lloegr, a hynny ar fylder? A gytunwch hefyd y dylid cael ardrethi busnes sy'n barhaol is ar gyfer busnesau bach, sy'n talu cyfran uwch o'u trosiant mewn ardrethi busnes na chwmnïau mawr?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Byddwch yn cofio, y tro diwethaf inni ystyried hyn, fod busnesau mawr yng Nghymru wedi gwrthwynebu'n chwyrn y syniad o draws-gymorthdaliadau i fusnesau bach mewn perthynas ag ardrethi. O ystyried sefyllfa ariannol ddifrifol y busnesau mawr ar y pryd—fel Corus—cytunasom i gyd-fynd â hynny. Derbynir y pwynt cyffredinol bod yr ardrethi'n fwy i fusnesau bach, fel cyfran o'r trosiant, ond ni ddylem gael cynllun traws-gymorthdaliadau o'r mawr i'r bach. O ran eich pwynt ynglŷn â grwpiau a busnesau unigol yng Nghaerdydd, ni wn beth yw'r sefyllfa benodol. Yn gyffredinol, mae ardrethi busnes yn dal i fod yn llawer is yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr, ond mae'n bosibl bod ardaloedd unigol yng Nghymru lle y mae ardrethi busnes yn uchel, ac yn llawer uwch oherwydd yr ailbrisio. Fodd bynnag, os yw perchnogion siopau yng nghanol dinas Caerdydd yn credu bod gwerth ardrethol eu siopau yn 2005 yn rhy uchel, dylent gael rhagor o drafodaethau gydag Asiantaeth y Swyddfa Brisio ac apelio yn erbyn y prisio yn ôl yr angen.

**Q8 David Lloyd:** Will the First Minister make a statement on pressures faced by Swansea NHS Trust? OAQ0326(FM)

OAQ0326(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae pawb, gan fy nghynnwys i, yn cydnabod y pwysau sydd ar holl ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG, gan gynnwys ymddiriedolaeth Abertawe. Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i fynd i'r afael â'r pwysau sydd ar ein hysbytai a'r gwasanaethau iechyd yn gyffredinol. Dyna pam ein bod wedi sicrhau bod arian ychwanegol ar gael, fel y £32 miliwn ar gyfer delio â rhestrau aros hir sydd i'w wario yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol sydd newydd ddechrau. Caiff Abertawe, wrth gwrs, gyfran go fawr o'r arian hwn gan fod rhestrau aros yno yn fwy nag mewn ardaloedd eraill.

**David Lloyd:** Mae adroddiad annibynnol diweddar yn darogan y bydd lefelau peryglus o isel o nyrssys ar 31 o 74 ward dau brif ysbyty Abertawe, sef Singleton a Threforys. Beth a wnewch chi am hyn?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn gyfarwyddwr ar bob ysbyty yng Nghymru. Nid mater i mi ydyw ond mater i'r ymddiriedolaeth leol ymwneud ag ef. Fel y dywedais yn fy ateb i Mike German, yr oedd yr ymddiriedolaeth a'r ysbyty yng Nghaerdydd yn dweud eu bod yn gwario gormod ar nyrssys asiantaeth a nyrssys banc, ac felly nad oedd ganddynt arian ar ôl i staffio ward wag yn Ysbyty Prifysgol Cymru. Maent bellach wedi cyflwyno cyfarwyddwr nyrssio newydd, sydd wedi gwneud gwahaniaeth mawr. Felly, mater o gyfarwyddo'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn y man a'r lle yw hwn.

### Twyll Etholiadol Electoral Fraud

**Q10 Jocelyn Davies:** Will the First Minister make a statement on what discussions he has held with the UK Government on measures that should be introduced to prevent electoral fraud? OAQ0318(FM)

**The First Minister:** Any fraud, including electoral fraud, is a serious matter that should be dealt with by the relevant authorities, which may include the police. The penalties for fraud are extremely heavy. We have all read about the recent cases in the English

**The First Minister:** Everyone, including me, acknowledges the pressures faced by all NHS trusts, including the Swansea trust. We are committed to tackling the pressures that all our hospitals, and our health services generally, are under. That is why additional funding has been made available, such as the £32 million for dealing with waiting lists which is to be spent in this financial year. Swansea will, of course, receive a considerable share of this money as its waiting lists are longer than those of other areas.

**David Lloyd:** A recent independent report predicts that there will be dangerously low levels of nurses in 31 of the 74 wards of Swansea's two main hospitals, Singleton and Morriston. What are you going to do about it?

**The First Minister:** I am not the director of every hospital in Wales. This is not a matter for me but for the local trust to deal with. As I said in my answer to Mike German, the trust and hospital in Cardiff used to say that they were spending too much on agency and bank nurses, and that they did not therefore have the money to staff an empty ward at the University of Wales Hospital. They have now introduced a new nursing director, who has made a great difference. Therefore, this is a matter of directing the health service in local areas.

**C10 Jocelyn Davies:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ba drafodaethau a fu rhyngddo a Llywodraeth y DU ynghylch y camau y dylid eu cyflwyno i rwystro twyll etholiadol? OAQ0318(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae unrhyw dwyll, gan gynnwys twyll etholiadol, yn fater difrifol y dylid delio ag ef gan yr awdurdodau perthnasol, a all gynnwys yr heddlu. Mae'r cosbau am dwyll yn eithriadol o drwm. Mae pawb ohonom wedi darllen am yr achosion

Midlands and the north of England. I believe that postal votes on demand remain an important right, especially during periods of high employment, as we have now. When people are in work, it is a major incentive to their being able to participate in elections, compared to the situation 10 to 15 years ago. Postal voting on demand is still an important right, but the Government has mentioned that further action to prevent systematic postal-vote fraud will be introduced, if Labour is re-elected, this summer.

**Jocelyn Davies:** There are reports this week that Peter Hain blocked legislation that would assist in combating electoral fraud. Of course, those reports are, as yet, unproven, but we know as fact that there have been recent convictions for rigging the postal-vote system. Do you therefore agree that this news will increase the public's cynicism towards elections and might decrease turnout? Do you agree with the trial judge who said that the UK Government is in denial about the failings of the postal-vote system? Finally, what will you do to stop fraudsters from stealing votes in Wales?

**The First Minister:** We have no evidence of systematic fraud, either under the traditional system of voting, from the risk of impersonation, or under postal voting. If fraud does occur, then it is probably in tiny numbers, and it is present in the conventional system as well. If you are absolutely determined, you can impersonate someone, just as you can fiddle the postal votes if you know how to bribe the postman and so on. However, there is no evidence that that is taking place on a large scale in Wales. You should not create any scares about the corruption of a system when there is no evidence of that in Wales. You are right to say that it is an important issue, but you should not create scares for which there is no evidence in Wales.

diweddar yng nghanoldir a gogledd Lloegr. Credaf fod pleidlais bost i rai sydd yn galw amdani yn parhau i fod yn hawl bwysig, yn enwedig yn ystod cyfnodau o gyflogaeth uchel, fel sydd gennym yn awr. Pan fydd pobl mewn gwaith, mae'n gymhelliant mawr iddynt allu cyfranogi mewn etholiadau, o gymharu â'r sefyllfa 10 i 15 mlynedd yn ôl. Mae pleidlais bost i'r sawl sy'n gofyn amdani yn dal i fod yn hawl bwysig, ond mae'r Llywodraeth wedi sôn y cyflwynir camau pellach i atal twyll systematig gyda phleidleisiau post, os ailetholir Llafur, yr haf hwn.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Yn ôl adroddiadau yr wythnos hon rhwystrodd Peter Hain ddeddfwriaeth a fyddai'n gymorth i weithio yn erbyn twyll etholiadol. Wrth gwrs, nid yw'r adroddiadau hynny wedi'u profi eto, ond gwyddom ei bod yn ffaith bod pobl wedi eu cael yn euog yn ddiweddar am rigo'r system bleidleisio drwy'r post. A gytunwch felly y bydd y newyddion hyn yn cynyddu sinigiaeth y cyhoedd tuag at etholiadau ac y gallai'r nifer a aiff allan i bleidleisio ostwng o ganlyniad? A gytunwch â barnwr y treial a ddywedodd fod Llywodraeth y DU yn gwrthod derbyn y gwir ynghylch diffygion y system bleidleisio drwy'r post? Yn olaf, beth a wnewch i atal twyllwyr rhag dwyn pleidleisiau yng Nghymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid oes gennym ddim tystiolaeth o dwyll systematig, boed hynny dan y drefn bleidleisio draddodiadol, yn sgîl risg ffugio, nac o dan y drefn bleidleisio drwy'r post. Os digwydd twyll, yna mae'n debyg mai mewn niferoedd bach iawn y mae hynny, ac mae'n bresennol yn y drefn gonfensiynol hefyd. Os ydych yn gwbl benderfynol, gallwch ffugio eich bod yn rhywun arall, yn union fel y gallwch ffidlo'r bleidlais bost os gwyddoch sut i lwgrwobrwyd postmon ac yn y blaen. Fodd bynnag, nid oes dim tystiolaeth bod hynny'n digwydd ar raddfa fawr yng Nghymru. Ni ddylech godi bwganod am lygru system pan nad oes tystiolaeth o hynny yng Nghymru. Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle wrth ddweud ei fod yn fater pwysig, ond ni ddylech godi bwganod nad oes tystiolaeth yn eu cylch yng Nghymru.

**William Graham:** First Minister, the judge said that the fraud was massive, systematic and organised. He compared it to the situation in a banana republic. It is appalling that, in our democracy, the vote is not absolutely secure. Will you be bidding for part of the £10 million announced by the Blair Government to ensure that voting is entirely secret in Wales?

**The First Minister:** William, you have been in democratic politics for as long as I have, on a tiny scale. You cannot give guarantees against no-one impersonating under the convention of attendance at the polling station, any more than you can over postal voting. All democratic systems depend on an element of trust. There will always be one or two people who will betray that trust under both the old and the new system.

You seem to have some difficulty in realising that I was responding to Jocelyn's question on how I would deal with this in Wales. I think that your indignation was because you seem to think that I was forgetting about the recent cases which are not in Wales. I emphasise that when I say 'in Wales', I do not include Birmingham or any of the northern boroughs where recent prosecutions have taken place. If prosecution leads to heavy fines or imprisonment, it will have a suitable deterrent effect. There is no evidence of this taking place in Wales, either by way of impersonation in the polling station in the conventional way, or by means of postal voting.

Jocelyn put forward the idea that, in some way, access to universal postal voting will reduce electoral participation. However, all the evidence shows that participating by post will only increase participation, especially in periods of high employment when people cannot get home from work in time on the Thursday to be able to vote. Participating by post without having to demonstrate that they are ill, in the way that they had to when your political career—and mine—started will increase participation. Do not make a mountain out of a molehill when there is no

**William Graham:** Brif Weinidog, dywedodd y barnwr fod y twyll yn enfawr, yn systematig ac yn drefnus. Fe'i cymharodd â'r sefyllfa mewn gweriniaeth fananas. Mae'n arswydus nad yw'r bleidlais, yn ein democratiaeth ni, yn gwbl ddiogel. A fyddwch yn gwneud cais am ran o'r £10 miliwn a gyhoeddwyd gan Lywodraeth Blair i sicrhau bod y bleidlais yn gwbl gyfrinachol yng Nghymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** William, yr ydych wedi bod mewn gwleidyddiaeth ddemocrataidd ers cyhyd â mi, ar raddfa fechan iawn. Ni allwch roi sicrydd na wnaiff neb ffugio eu bod yn rhywun arall dan gonfensiwn mynchy'u'r orsaf bleidleisio, ddim mwy nag y gallwch yn achos pleidleisio drwy'r post. Mae pob system ddemocrataidd yn dibynnu ar elfen o ymddiriedaeth. Ceir wastad un neu ddau o bobl a wnaiff fradychu'r ymddiriedaeth honno dan yr hen system a'r newydd fel ei gilydd.

Ymddengys eich bod yn ei chael braidd yn anodd sylweddoli mai ymateb yr oeddwn i gwestiwn Jocelyn yng hylch sut y byddwn yn delio â hyn yng Nghymru. Credaf mai'r rheswm dros eich dicter oedd eich bod fel pe baech yn meddwl fy mod yn anghofio am yr achosion diweddar na ddigwyddasant yng Nghymru. Pwysleisiaf pan ddywedaf 'yng Nghymru', nad wyf yn cynnwys Birmingham na'r un o'r bwrdeistrefi gogleddol lle y digwyddodd yr erlyniadau yn ddiweddar. Os arweinia erlyniad at ddirwyon trwm neu garchar, caiff hynny effaith ataliol addas. Nid oes dim tystiolaeth bod hyn yn digwydd yng Nghymru, boed ar ffurf ffugio yn yr orsaf bleidleisio yn y modd confensiynol, neu drwy gyfrwng y bleidlais bost.

Cynigiodd Jocelyn y syniad y bydd rhoi hawl i bawb bleidleisio drwy'r post, ryw fodd, yn lleihau cyfranogiad mewn etholiadau. Fodd bynnag, dengys pob tystiolaeth mai dim ond cynyddu cyfranogiad a wna caniatáu cyfranogi drwy'r post, yn enwedig mewn cyfnodau o gyflogaeth uchel pryd na all pobl gyrraedd adref o'r gwaith mewn pryd ar y dydd Iau i allu pleidleisio. Bydd cyfranogi drwy'r post heb orfod dangos eu bod yn sâl, fel yr oedd yn rhaid iddynt pan ddechreuodd eich gyrrfa wleidyddol chi—a f'un innau—yn cynyddu cyfranogiad. Peidiwch â gwneud

evidence of this happening in Wales on a systematic scale.

môr a mynydd o hyn pan nad oes dim tystiolaeth ei fod yn digwydd yng Nghymru ar raddfa systematig.

## Cwestiwn Brys Urgent Question

### Hufenfa Llangadog Llangadog Creamery

**Lisa Francis:** Will the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside make a statement on the closure of Llangadog Creamery in Carmarthenshire and the loss of 180 jobs? EAQ00184(EPC)

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** On Wednesday 6 April, Dairy Farmers of Britain announced plans to close its processing facility in Llangadog with a loss of around 200 jobs, much to my regret and to many others in the area. We are working with a range of partners to explore possible options for the future.

**Lisa Francis:** On behalf of the Welsh Conservative group and my fellow Mid and West Wales Assembly Members, I extend my sympathies to the people affected by this closure and their families. The news was all the more devastating last week as it arrived as a bolt from the blue. It was generally felt that Llangadog's future was secure, as of last August, when it was taken over by Dairy Farmers of Britain.

It is even more concerning that this closure decision has been based on financial performance. Will you give more detail on the work being done by Carmarthenshire County Council, the Welsh Development Agency, Jobcentre Plus and Education and Learning Wales, in finding the workforce alternative employment? Can you tell us anything, without compromising the interests of commercial confidentiality, about the prospect of finding a potential buyer for the Llangadog site, and considerations for financial assistance for that prospective buyer? How closely are your officials, the WDA, and others working to secure alternative employment for the persons

**Lisa Francis:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad ddatganiad ynghylch cau Hufenfa Llangadog yn Sir Gaerfyrddin gan golli 180 o swyddi? EAQ00184(EPC)

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Ddydd Mercher 6 Ebrill, cyhoeddodd Dairy Farmers of Britain gynlluniau i gau eu gwaith prosesu yn Llangadog gan golli oddeutu 200 o swyddi, er mawr ofid i mi ac i sawl un arall yn yr ardal. Yr ydym yn gweithio gydag amryw o bartneriaid i ymchwilio i opsiynau posibl ar gyfer y dyfodol.

**Lisa Francis:** Ar ran grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru a'm cyd-Aelodau Cynulliad yn y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin, mynegaf fy nghydymdeimlad â'r bobl yr effeithir arnynt gan y cau hwn ac â'u teuluedd. Yr oedd y newydd yn fwy o ergyd o'r hanner gan iddo ddod yn hollol annisgwyl. Y teimlad cyffredinol oedd bod dyfodol Llangadog yn ddiogel, ers mis Awst diwethaf, pan gymerwyd yr awenau gan Dairy Farmers of Britain.

Testun pryder mwy fyth yw bod y penderfyniad hwn i gau wedi ei seilio ar berfformiad ariannol. A rowch ragor o fanylion am y gwaith a wneir gan Gyngor Sir Caerfyrddin, Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, Canolfan Byd Gwaith a Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru i ganfod gwaith arall i'r gweithlu? A allwch ddweud unrhyw beth wrthym, heb beryglu buddiannau cyfrinachedd masnachol, ynghylch y rhagolygon o ran canfod darpar brynnwr i safle Llangadog, a'r ystyriaethau ar gyfer cymorth ariannol i'r darpar brynnwr hwnnw? Pa mor agos y mae eich swyddogion, yr Awdurdod Datblygu ac eraill yn cydweithio i sicrhau gwaith arall i'r bobl yr effeithir arnynt? Awgrymwyd y gallai fod

affected? Alternative employment has been hinted at Dawn Pac in Crosshands where 230 food industry jobs have been forecast. Do you have any information on that?

There have been press reports of another Welsh company looking to expand its operation, creating a further 130 jobs. Can you give us your assurance, Minister, that production facilities associated with Llangadog, at Llandyrnog in Denbighshire and in Cardiff, will not be affected by this closure?

**Carwyn Jones:** You have asked a number of questions. First, I can say that following my meeting with Dairy Farmers of Britain, Llandyrnog and Cardiff are not under threat. Llangadog, specifically, had its difficulties and as a result, the announcement was made.

In terms of what is happening on the side of the Government and its partners, a meeting was held yesterday between the Assembly Government, the WDA, ELWa, Jobcentre Plus and Carmarthenshire County Council. A number of options are currently being considered. I do not want to raise false hopes but it is not the case that nothing can be done. It is the case that there is interest in terms of looking at the future of the site and seeing what can be done to find jobs for those who may lose their jobs. That may sound slightly cryptic but you will understand why I have to put it that way. Many options are currently being examined. Like you, I have heard that other companies are looking to create jobs near Llangadog—Dawn Pac was mentioned this morning—which indicates the robustness of the economy.

3.10 p.m.

**Christine Gwyther:** I thank Lisa for her question and the Minister for his answers thus far. I ask for some reassurance on the way in which some of the negotiations are going to date. I understand that negotiations are ongoing with Dairy Farmers of Britain about the potential sale of the plant. This is not a scenario such as that seen in Whitland where Dairy Crest kept the plant there mothballed for years to ensure that no other company could come into the west Wales

gwaith arall yn Dawn Pac yn Crosshands lle y rhagwelwyd y gall fod 230 o swyddi yn y diwydiant bwyd. A oes gennych unrhyw wybodaeth am hynny?

Bu adroddiadau yn y wasg am gwmni Cymreig arall yn ystyried ehangu ei weithgareddau, gan greu 130 o swyddi eraill. A allwch roi sicrwydd inni, Weinidog, na fydd y cau hwn yn effeithio ar gyfleusterau cynhyrchu cysylltiedig â Llangadog, yn Llandyrnog yn Sir Ddinbych ac yng Nghaerdydd?

**Carwyn Jones:** Gofynasoch sawl cwestiwn. Yn gyntaf, gallaf ddweud yn sgil fy nghyfarfod â Dairy Farmers of Britain, nad yw Llandyrnog a Chaerdydd dan fygithiad. Cafodd Llangadog, yn benodol, gryn anawsterau ac, yn sgil hynny, gwnaethpwyd y cyhoeddiad.

O ran yr hyn sydd yn digwydd o du'r Llywodraeth a'i phartneriaid, cynhaliwyd cyfarfod ddoe rhwng Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, y WDA, ELWa, Canolfan Byd Gwaith a Chyngor Sir Caerfyrddin. Mae nifer o opsiynau'n cael eu hystyried ar hyn o bryd. Nid oes arnof eisiau codi gobeithion di-sail ond nid yw'n wir na ellir gwneud dim. Y gwir yw bod diddordeb o ran edrych ar ddyfodol y safle a gweld beth y gellir ei wneud i ganfod swyddi i'r rhai a allai golli eu gwaith. Efallai fod hynny'n swnio ychydig yn gryptig ond fe ddeallwch pam y mae'n rhaid i mi ei roi felly. Mae sawl opsiwn yn cael eu harchwilio ar hyn o bryd. Fel chi, clywais innau fod cwmnïau eraill yn ystyried creu swyddi ger Llangadog—crybwyllyd Dawn Pac y bore yma—sydd yn arwydd o gadernid yr economi.

**Christine Gwyther:** Diolch i Lisa am ei chwestiwn ac i'r Gweinidog am ei atebion hyd yma. Gofynnaf am ryw sicrwydd yngylch y ffordd y mae rhai o'r trafodaethau yn mynd hyd yn hyn. Deallaf fod trafodaethau ar droed gyda Dairy Farmers of Britain yngylch y posiblwydd o werthu'r gwaith. Nid sefyllfa fel honno a welwyd yn Hendy-gwyn ar Daf yw hon, lle y cadwodd Dairy Crest y ffatri yno'n segur am flynyddoedd er mwyn sicrhau na allai'r un

milk sector and take its place in the market. That is not the case here. Can you assure me that the Welsh Assembly Government and the WDA are pressing Dairy Farmers of Britain to at least release the site and the plant should a buyer become available? There is a reasonably new dryer and modern warehouses on the site, and, as we know, there is a skilled workforce waiting to have its contract renewed. It is correct that several companies in Carmarthenshire, including Dawn Pac, have expressed an interest in the workforce because it is skilled in food processing. Can you assure me that there will be ongoing retraining for those workers if needed? Finally, I have been told that the 20 or so hauliers working at Llangadog will be retained by the company so that they can pick up from local farms and deliver to alternative processing sites. Can you give me some assurance that those jobs, at least, will be retained? That means that we are potentially looking at a loss of around 160 jobs rather than 200. That is still a grave situation for Carmarthenshire, and it is made worse by the fact that many of the workers are part-time farmers. I have lobbied you on this issue, Minister, but can you assure me today that Farming Connect will stand ready to give business support to those farmers who are losing their part-time income?

**Carwyn Jones:** Farming Connect will always be available to provide advice to farmers—that is the intention of the scheme and it will be available on this occasion. Training will be a matter for Team Wales and will be considered if needed. You are quite right to point out that the situation is different to that in Whitland. Dairy Crest closed the plant in Whitland, and it was mothballed for many years until it became obsolete and it never reopened. Dairy Farmers of Britain has made it clear to me that that is not its intention with regard to Llangadog, and it is actively looking for a potential buyer for the plant. It wants to ensure that the site has a future and it is not afraid of it being sold to a company that may be seen as a competitor. It is conscious of the fact that it sees itself as a farmers' organisation, and it is co-operating closely with us to ensure that we ensure a future for the site and, importantly, for those

cwmni arall ddod i mewn i sector llaeth y Gorllewin a chymryd ei le yn y farchnad. Nid hynny sydd yn digwydd yma. A allwch roi sicrwydd imi fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a'r WDA yn pwysu ar Dairy Farmers of Britain i ryddhau'r safle a'r ffatri, o leiaf, os daw prynwr i'r fei? Mae sychwr gweddol newydd a warysau modern ar y safle ac, fel y gwyddom, mae gweithlu medrus yn aros i gael adnewyddu ei gontact. Mae'n wir bod sawl cwmni yn sir Gaerfyddin, gan gynnwys Dawn Pac, wedi mynegi diddordeb yn y gweithlu am ei fod yn fedrus ym maes prosesu bwyd. A allwch fy sicrhau y bydd ailhyfforddi parhaus ar gael i'r gweithwyr hynny os bydd ei angen? Yn olaf, dywedwyd wrthyf y caiff yr 20, fwy na heb, o gludwyr sydd yn gweithio yn Llangadog eu cadw gan y cwmni fel y gallant godi cynnyrch o ffermydd lleol a'i ddanfon i safleoedd prosesu eraill. A allwch roi rhyw sicrwydd imi y cedwir y swyddi hynny, o leiaf? Golyga hynny ein bod yn edrych o bosibl ar golli rhyw 160 o swyddi yn hytrach na 200. Mae hynny'n dal i fod yn sefyllfa ddifrifol i Sir Gaerfyddin, ac fe'i gwaethygir gan yffaith mai ffermwyr rhan-amser yw llawer o'r gweithwyr. Yr wyf wedi'ch lobio chi ar y mater hwn, Weinidog, ond a allwch roi sicrwydd imi heddiw y bydd Cyswllt Ffermio wrth law yn barod i roi cymorth busnes i'r ffermwyr hynny a fydd yn colli eu hincwm rhan-amser?

**Carwyn Jones:** Bydd Cyswllt Ffermio wrth law bob amser i roi cyngor i ffermwyr—dyna ddiben y cynllun a bydd wrth law y tro hwn. Mater i Dîm Cymru fydd hyfforddi, ac fe'i hystyrir os bydd angen. Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle pan nodwch fod y sefyllfa'n wahanol i honno yn Hendy-gwyn ar Daf. Caeodd Dairy Crest y gwaith yn Hendy-gwyn ar Daf, ac fe'i cadwyd yn segur am flynyddoedd lawer nes iddo gyrraedd diwedd ei oes, ac ni chafodd fyth ei agor eto. Mae Dairy Farmers of Britain wedi dweud yn glir wrthyf nad hynny yw ei fwriad gyda Llangadog, ac mae wrthi'n chwilio am ddarpar brynnwr i'r gwaith. Mae arno eisiau sicrhau bod dyfodol gan y safle ac nid oes arno ofn ei werthu i gwmni y gellid ei ystyried yn gystadleuydd. Mae'n ymwybodol o'r ffaith ei fod yn ei ystyried ei hun yn gorff ffermwyr, ac mae'n cydwethredu'n agos â ni i sicrhau ein bod yn sicrhau dyfodol i'r safle ac, yn bwysig, i'r

who work there.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** O ystyried yr hyn a ddywedasoch, sef bod Dairy Farmers of Britain yn chwilio am brynwr ar gyfer yr hufenfa yn Llangadog, ac o ystyried y nwyddau a werthir o dan frand Cadog drwy'r hufenfa, a ydych wedi ystyried gosod gorchymyn pryniant gorfodol ar yr hufenfa i sicrhau bod modd cadw'r brand hwnnw o fewn sir Gaerfyrddin? Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod Menyn Shir Gâr yn cael ei gynhyrchu yn sir Amwythig ar hyn o bryd. Mae'r math hwn o frand Cymreig yn fod o sicrhau gwerth ychwanegol i laeth, a byddai hynny o gryn gymorth i'r sector llaeth yn y De-orllewin. Yr ydym oll yn gobeithio y daw prynwr i'r fei ar gyfer yr hufenfa. Fodd bynnag, os na fydd hynny'n digwydd, a wnewch ystyried sicrhau bod gorchymyn pryniant gorfodol yn cael ei roi ar y safle i sicrhau nad yw'r brand Cadog hefyd yn gadael sir Gaerfyrddin neu'n mynd y tu hwnt i'r ffin?

**Carwyn Jones:** Ni chredaf y byddai gorchymyn yn cael effaith o'r fath, gan ein bod yn trafod prynu safle er mwyn ei ddefnyddio ar gyfer pwrrpas cyhoeddus. Nid wyf yn credu y byddai hynny'n helpu.

O ran y brand ei hun, ar hyn o bryd, nid yw'r cwmni wedi penderfynu ble y bydd yn cael ei ddefnyddio yn y dyfodol, ond gobeithia y bydd yn cael ei ddefnyddio yng Nghymru oherwydd y mae'n bwysig i'r cwmni ei fod yn frand Cymreig. Rhaid inni gofio hefyd y bydd gan y cwmni ddwy ffatri yng Nghymru o hyd, ar ôl cau Llangadog fel ffatri Dairy Farmers of Britain. Deallaf y pwnt oherwydd y mae'r brand Cadog yn enwog y tu hwnt i Gymru—yr ydym oll wedi gweld y menyn a rhai o'r cynhyrchion eraill ar werth ledled Prydain Fawr ac yn rhyngwladol. Mae ychydig yn gynnar ar hyn o bryd i wybod beth yn union fydd yn digwydd i'r brand. Rhaid inni ystyried yn gyntaf beth fydd yn digwydd i'r safle a gweld beth a ddaw yn y dyfodol. Yr ydym yn obeithiol y bydd gennym fwy o fanylion yn ystod y mis nesaf. Mae'n amhosibl rhoi unrhyw fath o amserlen ynglŷn â beth fydd yn digwydd ond mae'n wir bod diddordeb yn y safle ei hun, a bydd yn rhaid gweld a fydd y diddordeb hwnnw yn troi yn rhywbeth cadarn.

rhai sydd yn gweithio yno.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Given what you have just said, namely that Dairy Farmers of Britain is looking for a buyer for the creamery in Llangadog, and bearing in mind the products sold under the Cadog brand through the creamery, have you considered imposing a compulsory purchase order on the creamery to ensure that that brand can be kept within Carmarthenshire? You will be aware that Menyn Shir Gâr is currently produced in Shropshire. This type of Welsh brand is a means of adding value to milk, and this would be of great assistance to the dairy sector in south-west Wales. We all hope that a buyer will be found for the creamery. However, if that does not happen, will you consider ensuring that a compulsory purchase order is placed on the site to ensure that the Cadog brand is kept within Carmarthenshire and does not go over the border?

**Carwyn Jones:** I do not believe that an order would have that effect, because we are talking about acquiring a site in order to use it for a public purpose. I do not think that that would help.

On the brand itself, the company has not yet decided where it will be used in future, but it hopes that it will be used in Wales because it is important to the company that it is a Welsh brand. We must also remember that the company will still have two factories in Wales, after the closure of Llangadog as a Dairy Farmers of Britain factory. I understand the point because the Cadog brand is well known beyond Wales—we have all seen the butter and some of the other products on sale throughout Great Britain and in other countries. It is a little early at present to know exactly what will happen to the brand. We must first consider what happens to the site and wait to see what will happen in future. We hope to have more details in the coming month. It is impossible to give a timetable in terms of what will happen, but it is true that there is interest in the site itself, and we must wait to see whether that interest will turn into something more concrete.

**Mick Bates:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats would also like to extend sympathy to the workers who have lost their jobs, and to their families, because we all know what the economic impact will be on those individuals and on the local economy. Minister, I was pleased to hear you say that the other two dairies, in Cardiff Central and Denbigh, will not be threatened or affected in the near future, or so we hope. I ask you to reaffirm that point and to confirm that you have met the company, that that was part of the agenda, and that the company gave an assurance that the other dairies are safe.

There are two major issues that we must address. One is the loss of this plant that adds so much value to the milk industry, and the lack of Government initiatives to increase the uptake of marketing and processing monies in these areas to ensure that we boost the local economy. I am aware of the good work that the Welsh Development Agency does and the retraining that will be provided, but will you not admit that there is also a role to be played in ensuring that marketing and processing monies are available so that this important facility can be retained to add value in the area?

The second issue concerns the overall profitability of producers and processors. Yet again, your Government has failed to understand that the power of the supermarkets must be curbed in some way. I believe strongly that part of this concerns the failure to address the issue properly through the Office of Fair Trading in order to restrict the power of the supermarkets. I am grateful to Lisa for asking this urgent question and, in answering it, some of your comments should address the future of the whole industry and any attempts that you will make to lobby for control over the power of the supermarkets, which are ultimately responsible for the demise of our dairy industry in Wales.

**Carwyn Jones:** To deal with your first point, it is right to say that when I met the DFB we discussed Llandyrnog and Cardiff, and I was told that those two sites were not under threat. The company has received a

**Mick Bates:** Carai Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru hwythau estyn eu cydymdeimlad i'r gweithwyr a gollodd eu swyddi, ac i'w teuluoedd, gan ein bod oll yn gwybod beth fydd yr effaith economaidd ar yr unigolion hynny ac ar yr economi leol. Weinidog, yr oeddwn yn falch o'ch clywed yn dweud na fydd y ddwy hufenfa arall, yng Nghanol Caerdydd ac yn Ninbych, yn cael eu bygwth ac na fydd effeithio arnynt yn y dyfodol agos, neu felly yr ydym yn gobeithio. Gofynnaf ichi ailddatgan y pwynt hwnnw a chadarnhau eich bod wedi cwrdd â'r cwmni, fod hynny wedi'i drafod, a bod y cwmni wedi rhoi sicrwydd bod yr hufenfeydd eraill yn ddiogel.

Mae dau bwnc pwysig y mae'n rhaid inni ymdrin â hwy. Un ohonynt yw collî'r gwaith hwn sy'n ychwanegu cymaint o werth at y diwydiant llaeth, a diffyg mentrau o eiddo'r Llywodraeth i gynyddu'r defnydd o arian ar gyfer marchnata a phrosesu yn yr ardaloedd hynny er mwyn sicrhau y byddwn yn hybu'r economi leol. Gwn am y gwaith da a wnaiff Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru ac am yr ailhyfforddi a ddarperir, ond oni dderbynwch fod rôl i'w chwarae hefyd o ran sicrhau bod arian ar gael ar gyfer marchnata a phrosesu fel y gellir cadw'r cyfleuster pwysig hwn i ychwanegu gwerth yn yr ardal?

Mae'r ail bwnc yn ymwneud â phroffidioldeb cynhyrchwyr a phroseswyr yn gyffredinol. Eto fyth, mae eich Llywodraeth wedi methu â deall bod rhaid cyfyngu ar bŵer yr archfarchnadoedd mewn rhyw fodd. Credaf yn gryf fod hyn yn ymwneud yn rhannol â methu ag ymdrin â'r mater hwn yn briodol drwy'r Swyddfa Masnachu Teg er mwyn cyfyngu ar bŵer yr archfarchnadoedd. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Lisa am ofyn y cwestiwn brys hwn ac, wrth ei ateb, dylech ymdrin rhywfaint â dyfodol y diwydiant cyfan ac unrhyw ymdrechion a wnewch i lobio dros reoli pŵer yr archfarchnadoedd, sy'n gyfrifol yn y pen draw am dranc ein diwydiant llaeth yng Nghymru.

**Carwyn Jones:** Er mwyn delio â'r pwynt cyntaf a wnaethoch, mae'n wir dweud ein bod wedi trafod gweithfeydd Llandyrnog a Chaerdydd pan gyfarfum â DFB, ac fy mod wedi cael ar ddeall nad oedd y ddau safle

substantial amount of processing and marketing grant money, nearly £1 million over the last five years, certainly in 1999 and 2000. This time, it made it clear that the processing and marketing grant would not change its mind about closing the facility. We must remember that Dairy Farmers of Britain is a company that wanted the plant to be successful, more than anything else. It made that clear. It is a farmers' organisation, and if it cannot make a go of it, others may find it difficult to make a go of it, given its present circumstances. The nature of the site may change and others may look at changing how the plant operates, and they may then be able to provide investment in order to make the plant more viable. That is what we are exploring at the moment. However, it was made clear—we were told specifically—that no amount of Government help would change the situation in Llangadog. We must make that clear.

I also specifically discussed the supermarket question with Dairy Farmers of Britain, and the company told me that the situation had nothing to do with the supermarkets. The problem in Llangadog had been with supply from the company's end; it had difficulties maintaining supply over a number of months and it lost contracts as a result, which caused some of the problems. The company also made it clear that the major problem was that it was producing canned materials in Llangadog and, as consumer preferences changed, those products were not in demand at the same level as before.

3.20 p.m.

Inevitably, there has been a decline over the years in terms of demand for what Llangadog was producing. This does not mean that, as far as the site is concerned, it does not have a future. It should be emphasised that there is interest in continuing the use of the site for a number of possible uses, including dairy. However, given its current situation and product line, Dairy Farmers of Britain felt that it could not continue to operate at the site. As far as it was concerned, no amount of Government money, via a processing and marketing grant, would have made a difference in the long term.

hynny o dan fgyythiad. Mae'r cwmni wedi cael swm sylweddol o arian ar gyfer prosesu a marchnata, sef bron £1 filiwn dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf, yn sicr yn 1999 a 2000. Y tro hwn, eglurodd na fyddai'r grant prosesu a marchnata'n peri iddo newid ei feddwl ynghylch cau'r cyfleuster. Rhaid inni gofio bod Dairy Farmers of Britain yn gwmni a oedd yn dymuno i'r gwaith lwyddo, yn fwy na dim byd arall. Gwnaeth hynny'n glir. Corff sy'n eiddo i'r ffermwyr ydyw, ac os na all ef beri iddo lwyddo, mae'n bosibl y bydd eraill yn ei chael yn anodd peri iddo lwyddo, o ystyried ei amgylchiadau presennol. Gallai natur y safle newid a gallai eraill ystyried newid dull gweithredu'r gwaith, ac effalai y byddant wedyn yn gallu buddsoddi er mwyn peri i'r gwaith fod yn fwy dichonadwy. I hynny yr ydym yn ymchwilio ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, eglurwyd i ni—dywedwyd hyn wrthym yn benodol—nad oes dim cymorth gan y Llywodraeth a newidiai'r sefyllfa yn Llangadog. Rhaid inni ddweud hynny'n glir.

Trafodais y cwestiwn am archfarchnadoedd gyda Dairy Farmers of Britain hefyd, a dywedodd y cwmni wrthyf nad oedd a wnelo'r sefyllfa ddim â'r archfarchnadoedd. Roedd y broblem yn Llangadog yn ymwnaed â'r cyflenwad o du'r cwmni; fe'i cafodd yn anodd parhau â'r cyflenwad dros nifer o fisioedd a cholloedd gontactau o'r herwydd, a hynny a barodd rai o'r problemau. Mae'r cwmni wedi egluro hefyd mai'r broblem fwyaf oedd mai bwydydd tun yr oedd yn eu cynhyrchu yn Llangadog ac, wrth i chwaeth y defnyddwyr newid, nid oedd cymaint o alw am y cynhyrchion hynny ag o'r blaen.

Bu dirywiad anochel dros y blynyddoedd yn y galw am yr hyn yr oedd gwaith Llangadog yn ei gynhyrchu. Nid yw hynny'n golygu nad oes dyfodol i'r safle. Dylid pwysleisio bod diddordeb mewn parhau i ddefnyddio'r safle ar gyfer nifer o ddibenion possibl, gan gynnwys rhai'n ymwnaed â llaeth. Fodd bynnag, o ystyried ei sefyllfa bresennol a'r math o gynhyrchion a geir ar hyn o bryd, teimlai Dairy Farmers of Britain na allai ddal i weithredu ar y safle. Yn ei farn ef, ni fyddai unrhyw swm o arian y Llywodraeth, ar ffurf grant prosesu a marchnata, yn ddigon i wneud gwahaniaeth yn yr hirdymor.

**Bryngle Williams:** Like everyone else, I am pleased to hear that the creamery in my constituency is safe—at least I hope that it is, because, 12 months ago, I, too, led a delegation to meet with the Associated Co-operative Creameries. Regarding Llangadog, my concern relates to the downward pressure on milk producers. I believe that the Towy valley is one of the largest milk fields in Europe, and none of its milk will be processed there. This will add to costs, and, regrettably, we will not be able to sell this as a Welsh product—it will be processed over the border. It will also cause problems in terms of milk supply, and I have been told by Dairy Farmers of Britain that it will process this milk in north Wales. We do not even have a decent road on which to move millions of litres of milk to north Wales. What I would ask you now is—and I have not discussed this with the DFB or anyone else—can we have some guarantee from you, Minister, that DFB and First Milk, if they ever got together as a farmers' co-operative—would not be taken apart by Mr Stephen Byers, as he did with First Milk before. This is important. You are telling us to co-operate, and we have an opportunity to do so here. I hope that you will give this marriage your blessing, should it go ahead.

**Carwyn Jones:** I can give a categoric assurance that Stephen Byers would not break up these two organisations, if they came together, as he is no longer in office. Do I think that co-operatives are a good idea? The answer is 'yes'. I have said that many times, and I would look with interest on a possible merger, but I have not yet heard whether or not that will happen.

Regarding Llangadog, all we currently know is that the creamery will no longer continue to be owned by Dairy Farmers of Britain. We do not know what the future of the site holds, and that is what current discussions intend to establish. That is why we are taking the Team Wales approach and investigating a number of options as to the possible future of the site. It is a little early to say that the milk will

**Bryngle Williams:** Fel pawb arall, yr wyf yn falch o glywed bod yr hufenfa sydd yn fy etholaeth yn ddiogel—yr wyf yn gobeithio ei bod, beth bynnag, oherwydd, 12 mis yn ôl, arweiniai innau ddirprwyaeth i gwrdd ag Associated Co-operative Creameries. Gyda golwg ar waith Llangadog, yr hyn sy'n peri pryder i mi yw'r pwysau sydd ar gynhyrchwyr llaeth. Credaf mai dyffryn Tywi yw un o'r ardaloedd cynhyrchu llaeth mwyaf yn Ewrop, ac ni fydd dim o'i laeth yn cael ei brosesu yno. Bydd hynny'n ychwanegu at y costau, a, gwaetha'r modd, ni fyddwn yn gallu ei werthu fel cynnrych o Gymru—fe'i prosesir yr ochr draw i'r ffin. Bydd yn peri problemau hefyd o ran y cyflenwad llaeth, ac mae Dairy Farmers of Britain wedi dweud wrthyf y bydd yn prosesu'r llaeth hwn yn y Gogledd. Nid oes gennym ffordd iawn hyd yn oed i gludo miliynau o litrau o laeth i'r Gogledd. Yr hyn a ofynnaf i chi'n awr yw—ac nid wyf wedi trafod hyn gyda DFB na neb arall—a gawn ryw warant gennych, Weinidog, na fyddai DFB a First Milk, pe deuent at ei gilydd ryw dro fel menter gydweithredol sy'n eiddo i'r ffermwyr—yn cael eu tynnu oddi wrth ei gilydd gan Mr Stephen Byers, fel y gwnaeth yn achos First Milk o'r blaen. Mae hyn yn bwysig. Dywedwch wrthym y dylem gydweithredu, ac mae gennym gyfle i wneud hynny yma. Gobeithiaf y byddwch yn rhoi'ch bendith ar y briodas hon, os aiff yn ei blaen.

**Carwyn Jones:** Gallaf roi sicrwydd llwyr na wnâi Stephen Byers dynnu'r ddau gorff hyn oddi wrth ei gilydd, pe deuent ynghyd, gan nad yw yn y swydd honno bellach. A ydwyt yn credu bod mentrau cydweithredol yn syniad da? Yr ateb yw 'ydwyf'. Dywedais hynny lawer gwaith, ac edrychwn ar unrhyw uno a allai ddigwydd gyda diddordeb, ond nid wyf wedi clywed eto a fydd hynny'n digwydd.

Gyda golwg ar waith Llangadog, y cwbl a wyddom ar hyn o bryd yw na fydd yr hufenfa'n parhau'n eiddo i Dairy Farmers of Britain. Ni wyddom beth a ddaw o'r safle yn y dyfodol, a darganfod hynny yw pwrrpas y trafodaethau presennol. Dyna pam yr ydym yn gweithredu yn null Tîm Cymru ac yn ymchwilio i sawl dewis o ran dyfodol y safle hwn. Mae braidd yn rhy gynnar i ddweud y

have to go elsewhere. We have to assess the potential future of the site, and, as far as Dairy Farmers of Britain is concerned, it has been very co-operative in terms of looking at future uses for that site.

bydd yn rhaid mynd â'r llaeth i rywle arall. Rhaid inni asesu potensial y safle ar gyfer y dyfodol, a bu Dairy Farmers of Britain yn fodlon iawn cydweithredu wrth ystyried dulliau o ddefnyddio'r safle hwnnw yn y dyfodol.

## Datganiad Busnes Business Statement

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I have two changes to the report on this week's business. The Minister for Economic Development and Transport will make a statement this afternoon on the possible effects on the Welsh automotive industry in the event of the closure of the MG Rover plant at Longbridge. Also, today's motions to delegate the functions under the Data Protection Act 1998 and the Environmental Information Regulations to the First Minister have been postponed until later in this session. Business for the next three weeks is as set out in the draft statement, which can be found on the Chamberweb under supporting documents. Further to this morning's deliberations in the Business Committee, it has been determined that the following items of subordinate legislation should not be referred to a subject committee for extended consideration:

the Anti-Social Behaviour Act 2003 (Commencement No.4) (Wales) Order 2005; the Demoted Tenancies (Review of Decisions) (Wales) Regulations 2005; the Secure Tenancies (Notices) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2005; the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000 (Commencement No.7) (Wales) Order 2005; the Countryside Access (Means of Access, Appeals Etc.) (Wales) Regulations 2005; and the Tir Mynydd (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2005.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes gwrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes drafft? Mae'n ymddangos nad oes. A oes unrhyw sylwadau?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Ar ateb y Gweinidog i'r cwestiwn brys ar Hufenfa Llangadog, a wnaiff y Trefnydd ofyn i'r Gweinidog perthnasol sicrhau bod adroddiadau ar

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Mae gennyd ddau newid i'w hadrodd i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Bydd y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth yn gwneud datganiad y prynhawn yma ar yr effeithiau posibl ar ddiwydiant modurol Cymru os bydd gwaith MG Rover yn Longbridge yn cau. Hefyd, mae'r cynigion ar gyfer heddiw i ddirprwyo swyddogaethau o dan Ddeddf Diogelu Data 1998 a'r Rheoliadau Gwybodaeth Amgylcheddol i'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u gohirio hyd yn ddiweddarach yn y sesiwn hwn. Mae'r busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y mae wedi'i nodi yn y datganiad drafft, y gellir ei weld ar we'r Siambrau o dan ddogfennau ategol. Ymhellach i'r trafodion y bore yma yn y Pwyllgor Busnes, penderfynwyd na ddylid cyfeirio'r eitemau is-ddeddfwriaeth a ganlyn at bwyllgor pwnc i'w hystyried yn helaethach:

Gorchymyn Deddf Ymddygiad Gwrthgymdeithasol 2003 (Cychwyn Rhif 4) (Cymru) 2005; Rheoliadau Tenantiaethau Isradd (Adolygu Penderfyniadau) (Cymru) 2005; Rheoliadau Tenantiaethau Diogel (Hysbysiadau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2005; Gorchymyn Deddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000 (Cychwyn Rhif 7) (Cymru) 2005; Rheoliadau Mynediad i Gefn Gwlad (Mynedfeydd, Apelau Etc.) (Cymru) 2005; a Rheoliadau Tir Mynydd (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2005.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there any objections to the draft business statement? It appears that there are none. Are there any comments?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** On the Minister's response to the urgent question on the Llangadog Creamery, would the Business Minister ask the relevant Minister to ensure

unrhyw drafodaethau ynglŷn â dyfodol y safle yn dod yn ôl i'r Cynulliad ac i'r Aelodau a effeithir yn bennaf fel y cawn wybod yn union beth sydd yn mynd ymlaen?

Hoffwn ddiolch i'r Trefnydd am drefnu datganiad ar effaith penderfyniadau MG Rover o ran y posibilrwydd y collir swyddi yng Nghymru. Yr ydym yn croesawu hynny.

Yr ydym wedi gweld y datganiad ysgrifenedig ar stoc marw, a gyhoeddwyd yn ystod y toriad. Mae pryder difrifol yn y Gogledd ynglŷn â'r ffordd y mae'r cynllun hwn yn gweithio, ac, er ein bod yn croesawu'r datganiad ysgrifenedig, hoffem gael y cyfle i gwestiynu'r Gweinidog yn y Siambra. A wnaiff y Trefnydd drefnu bod datganiad buan yn cael ei wneud ar y mater hwn i sicrhau ein bod yn cael cyfle i godi cwestiynau a mynegi pryerdon ein hetholwyr?

A fyddai modd inni gael dadl ar reolaeth lleoedd ysgolion? Gwyddoch fod bygythiad i ddyfodol ysgolion llai mewn nifer o awdurdodau lleol, nid yn unig yn sir Gaerfyrddin a sir Ddinbych. Mae nifer o awdurdodau lleol yn edrych ar eu cynlluniau. Byddwn yn croesawu dadl ar y mater hwn. Fel yr ydym wedi clywed yn ddiweddar, mae bygythiad nid yn unig i ddyfodol ysgolion cynradd, ond, o bosibl, i rai o'n hysgolion uwchradd llai. Mae hwn yn fater o bryder cyhoeddus, a byddem yn croesawu dadl arno.

**David Melding:** I thank the Business Minister for persuading her colleague to make a statement on the situation in Wales as a result of MG Rover's difficulties. All parties agreed that this was of genuine importance and that it was the opposite of gesture politics to call for a statement on it.

I hope that the Minister can review her decision in relation to a debate on fallen stock, because that is not about gesture politics either. There are real concerns, and this is a matter of great interest in Wales. This could be profitably debated here with a view to improving the system. I hope that, in the spirit of co-operation that descended on this morning's meeting of the Business Committee, the Minister will be able to

that reports on any discussions on the future of the site are brought back to the Assembly and to the Members most affected so that we know exactly what is going on?

I am grateful for the Minister's scheduling of a statement on the impact of MG Rover's decisions in terms of possible job losses in Wales. We welcome that.

We have seen the written statement on fallen stock, which was published during the recess. There is serious concern in north Wales about the operation of this scheme, and, although we welcome the written statement, we would like the opportunity to question the Minister in the Chamber. Will the Minister arrange for an early statement to be made on this issue to ensure that we have an opportunity to raise questions and to express our constituents' concerns?

Would it be possible to have a debate on the management of school places? You will know that smaller schools in several local authorities, not only in Carmarthenshire and Denbighshire, are under threat. Several local authorities are looking at their plans. We would welcome a debate on this issue. As we have recently heard, the future of some of our smaller secondary schools is under threat along with that of primary schools. This is an issue of public concern and we would welcome a debate on it.

**David Melding:** Diolchaf i'r Trefnydd am berswadio ei chyd-Weinidog i roi datganiad ar y sefyllfa yng Nghymru o ganlyniad i drafferthion MG Rover. Yr oedd yr holl bleidiau'n cytuno bod hyn yn wirioneddol bwysig ac mai'r gwrthwyneb i gogio gwleidyddol yw galw am ddatganiad ar hynny.

Gobeithiaf y bydd modd i'r Trefnydd ailystyried ei phenderfyniad mewn cysylltiad â dadl ar stoc trig, gan nad yw hynny'n ymwneud â chogio gwleidyddol ychwaith. Ceir pryerdon diliys, ac mae hyn yn fater sydd o ddiddordeb mawr yng Nghymru. Buddiol fyddai ei drafod yma gyda golwg ar wella'r system. Yr wyf yn gobeithio, yn unol â'r nawr gydwethredol a gafwyd yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, y

review that and agree that a debate is necessary.

bydd y Trefnydd yn gallu ailystyried hynny ac y bydd yn cytuno bod angen cael dadl o'r fath.

**Kirsty Williams:** I echo the call for a discussion and debate in the Chamber about fallen stock. Anybody who represents a rural constituency knows what huge concerns there are in the countryside at this time of year, during lambing.

**Kirsty Williams:** Ategaf yr alwad am gael trafodaeth a dadl yn y Siambwr am stoc trig. Gŵyr unrhyw un sy'n cynrychioli etholaeth wledig gymaint yw'r pryderon yng ngefn gwlaid yr adeg hon o'r flwyddyn, yn ystod y tymor wynia.

On behalf of the Liberal Democrats, I welcome the statement that the Minister for Economic Development and Transport is about to make on car component manufacturing in Wales; his being prepared to do that is welcome. However, we regret that the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning will not make a statement on school meals following a recent announcement in England, although this is not surprising given that the coming election is not an election for the National Assembly for Wales, Jamie Oliver has not been to see her recently and that, as Rhodri Morgan made clear in his answers to questions this afternoon, the Government does not intend to do anything about improving the quality in Wales.

Ar ran y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, croesawaf y datganiad y mae'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth ar fin ei wneud ar weithgynhyrchu partiau ceir yng Nghymru; mae'r ffaith ei fod yn barod i wneud hynny i'w groesawu. Fodd bynnag, mae'n ofid i ni na wnaiff y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes roi datganiad ar brydau bwyd mewn ysgolion yn sgil cyhoeddadiad diweddar yn Lloegr, er nad yw hynny'n syndod o gofio nad yw'r etholiad sydd i ddod yn etholiad ar gyfer Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, nad aeth Jamie Oliver i'w gweld yn ddiweddar ac, fel yr eglurodd Rhodri Morgan yn ei atebion i gwestiynau y prynhawn yma, nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn bwriadu gwneud dim ynghylch gwella'r ansawdd yng Nghymru.

**Carl Sargeant:** I welcome the business statement, as do all my colleagues on this side of the Chamber. I also welcome the statement on MG Rover at Longbridge, which the Minister will make shortly. My colleague, Catherine Thomas, has been working hard in her constituency of Llanelli to try to resolve related problems.

**Carl Sargeant:** Croesawaf y datganiad busnes, fel y gwnaiff fy holl gyd-Aelodau ar yr ochr hon i'r Siambwr. Yr wyf hefyd yn croesawu'r datganiad ar waith MG Rover yn Longbridge, y bydd y Gweinidog yn ei roi cyn hir. Bu fy nghyd-Aelod, Catherine Thomas, yn gweithio'n galed yn ei hetholaeth, sef Llanelli, i geisio datrys problemau sy'n ymwneud â hyn.

Would it be possible for Plenary time to be given for the discussion of the sports portfolio, particularly given Wrexham Football Club's win at the Millennium Stadium last Saturday? Given the situation at the Racecourse, and in terms of having a national stadium in north Wales, would the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport revisit the potential aspects of a north Wales regional centre?

A fyddai modd neilltuo amser yn y Cyfarfod Llawn i gael trafodaeth ar y portffolio chwaraeon, yn enwedig o ystyried buddugoliaeth Clwb Pêl-droed Wrecsam yn Stadiwm y Mileniwm ddydd Sadwrn diwethaf? O gofio'r sefyllfa yn y Cae Ras, ac yng nghyd-destun cael stadiwm cenedlaethol yn y Gogledd, a wnaiff y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon ailystyried y posiblwydd o gael canolfan ranbarthol yn y Gogledd?

3.30 p.m.

Finally, perhaps we could have a debate on

Yn olaf, efallai y gallem gael dadl ar y

the transport industry, particularly in Wales. You will know that representatives of Airbus, Raytheon Systems Limited and Thales are in the Assembly Neuadd today holding an event. We must remember that unemployment is at its lowest for 29 years, but I would like to talk in particular about the development of the flight industry and the proposed cuts in services in Wales. I know that Air Wales is doing a terrific job at present in providing services within Wales, but I am concerned about the cuts promised by Howard Flight in Wales. [Laughter.]

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** Ieuan, David and Kirsty all raised the issue of fallen stock. As you know, the written statement of 8 April gave the latest position, and I have been assured that there is nothing to add to it. However, the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside will give his monthly report to committee tomorrow, which will give Members an opportunity to raise this issue with him again. Clearly, we will have to return to this issue, but that is the position as it stands, as highlighted in the written statement. Equally, with regard to updates on the creamery statement, the Minister will update the committee as the situation develops. We must also take the consultation period into account.

Ieuan and Kirsty raised the issue of school places, but I do not intend to schedule time for a debate on this, because it is for local education authorities to decide on the pattern of provision for school places. As you know, this issue was considered on 8 March, when the Assembly approved the special grant report, which dealt with assistance to small schools. That was an opportunity to air this issue, and there have also been plenty of opportunities to raise this with the Minister in committee. I am delighted that David, Kirsty and Ieuan were positive about the fact that the Minister for Economic Development and Transport will make a statement on MG Rover.

diwydiant trafnidiaeth, yn enwedig yng Nghymru. Gwyddoch fod cynrychiolwyr cwmnïau Airbus, Raytheon Systems Limited a Thales yn Neuadd y Cynulliad heddiw yn cynnal digwyddiad. Rhaid inni gofio bod diweithdra ar ei isaf ers 29 mlynedd, ond hoffwn siarad yn benodol am ddatblygiad y diwydiant awyr a'r toriadau arfaethedig mewn gwasanaethau yng Nghymru. Gwn fod Air Wales yn gwneud gwaith ardderchog ar hyn o bryd yn darparu gwasanaethau o fewn Cymru, ond yr wyf yn bryderus ynghylch y toriadau a addawyd gan Howard Flight yng Nghymru. [Chwerthin.]

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Bu i Ieuan, David a Kirsty oll godi cwestiwn stoc trig. Fel y gwyddoch, cyflwynodd y datganiad ysgrifenedig ar 8 Ebrill y sefyllfa ddiweddaraf, a chefais fy sicrhau nad oedd dim i'w ychwanegu ato. Fodd bynnag, bydd y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad yn rhoi ei adroddiad misol gerbron y pwylgor yfory, a rhydd hyn gyfle i'r aelodau godi'r mater hwn gydag ef eto. Yn bendant, bydd rhaid inni ddychwelyd at y mater hwn, ond dyma'r sefyllfa fel ag y mae, fel y'i hamlygwyd yn y datganiad ysgrifenedig. Yn yr un modd, o safbwyt diweddarau'r datganiad am yr hufenfa, bydd y Gweinidog yn rhoi'r newyddion diweddaraf i'r pwylgor wrth i'r sefyllfa ddatblygu. Rhaid inni hefyd roi ystyriaeth i'r cyfnod ymgynghori.

Cododd Ieuan a Kirsty gwestiwn lleoedd mewn ysgolion, ond ni fwriadaf neilltuo amser i gael dadl ar hyn, oherwydd mai mater i'r awdurdodau addysg lleol yw penderfynu ar batrwm y ddarpariaeth ar gyfer lleoedd mewn ysgolion. Fel y gwyddoch, rhoddwyd ystyriaeth i'r mater hwn ar 8 Mawrth, pan gymeradwyodd y Cynulliad yr adroddiad grant arbennig, adroddiad a ymdriniai â'r cymorth i ysgolion bychain. Yr oedd hyn yn gyfle i drafod y mater hwn, a chafwyd hefyd ddigon o gylleoedd i godi'r mater hwn gyda'r Gweinidog mewn pwylgorau. Yr wyf yn falch dros ben bod David, Kirsty a Ieuan yn gadarnhaol ynghylch y ffaith y bydd y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth yn gwneud datganiad ar MG Rover.

As I have already said, we will consider the issue of fallen stock. Sweetness and light then left us when Kirsty raised issues about school meals. We had a good airing on that with the First Minister this afternoon and some lengthy questioning in relation to it. It is disappointing that people do not acknowledge how good it is that Jamie Oliver, who was not asked to do so, offered his praise to Wales in terms of this important issue. However, Members will have the opportunity to discuss this matter next week in Plenary, on 19 April, when we debate the School Lunches (Prescribed Requirement) (Wales) Order 2005 under the standard rather than the accelerated procedure. That will be an important opportunity.

Carl has suggested a great deal for discussion and business in the coming weeks. I hope that many Members will take the opportunity to meet our Airbus colleagues and attend the reception this afternoon. On sport, I knew that the Wrexham win would have to be mentioned twice this afternoon, and it may come up again later. On transport-led initiatives, we must all celebrate and endorse the Airbus achievement as a European project.

*Derbyniwyd y datganiad busnes.  
Business statement adopted.*

### **Datganiad am MG Rover Statement on MG Rover**

**The Minister for Economic Development and Transport (Andrew Davies):** The announcement that MG Rover has gone into receivership is a blow to the automotive sector in Wales. The sector is of considerable importance to the Welsh economy, employing around 24,000 people. Five years ago, we received similar news from Rover, and we were extremely concerned about the potential impact on the Welsh economy and on the job prospects for those employed in the sector at that time.

Fel yr wyf eisoes wedi dweud, byddwn yn rhoi ystyriaeth i gwestiwn stoc trig. Yna collwyd yr ysbryd hyfryd a braf pan gododd Kirsty gwestiynau ynghylch prydau bwyd mewn ysgolion. Cawsom drafodaeth dda ar hyn gyda'r Prif Weinidog y prynhawn yma ynghyd â chwestiynau hirfaith mewn perthynas â hynny. Mae'n siomedig nad yw pobl yn cydnabod pa mor dda ydyw bod Jamie Oliver, na ofynnwyd iddo wneud hynny, yn cynnig ei ganmliaeth i Gymru ynghylch y mater pwysig hwn. Fodd bynnag, bydd gan yr Aelodau gyfle i drafod y mater hwn yr wythnos nesaf yn y Cyfarfod Llawn, ar 19 Ebrill, pan fyddwn yn trafod Gorchymyn Ciniawau Ysgol (Gofyniad Rhagnodedig) (Cymru) 2005 dan y weithdrefn safonol yn hytrach na'r weithdrefn garlam. Bydd hynny'n gyfle pwysig.

Mae Carl wedi awgrymu llawer iawn ar gyfer trafodaethau a busnes yn ystod yr wythnosau nesaf. Gobeithiaf y bydd llawer o'r Aelodau yn achub ar y cyfle i gwrdd â'n cyfeillion yn Airbus ac yn mynychu'r derbyniant y prynhawn yma. O ran chwaraeon, gwyddwn y byddai'n rhaid i fuddugoliaeth Wrecsam gael ei chrybwyllddwywaith y prynhawn hwn, ac mae'n bosibl y cyfyd eto yn ddiweddarach. O ran cynlluniau trafnidiaeth, rhaid inni oll ddathlu a chymeradwyo llwyddiant Airbus fel prosiect Ewropeaidd.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth (Andrew Davies):** Mae'r cyhoeddiad bod MG Rover wedi mynd i law'r derbynnydd yn ergyd i'r sector modurol yng Nghymru. Mae'r sector yn hynod bwysig i'r economi Gymreig, gan gyflogi oddeutu 24,000 o bobl. Bum mlynedd yn ôl, cawsom newyddion tebyg gan Rover, ac yr oeddem yn hynod bryderus am yr effaith bosibl ar economi Cymru ac ar y rhagolygon o ran swyddi i'r rhai a gyflogid yn y sector bryd hynny.

Following that earlier announcement, we set up the Welsh automotive taskforce, which brought together all of those with a key role to play in the sector. The taskforce determined the short-term support needed by those companies affected, and plotted a way forward through which those companies could seek to improve their business prospects and, crucially, could diversify their customer bases. The work of the taskforce led to the creation of the Accelerate Wales programme, which has been extremely successful in achieving these objectives for participant companies.

Therefore, at the macro level, the good news is that, today, the number of companies in Wales with a high proportion of their business linked to MG Rover is much more limited than was the case five years ago. Trades union industrial leaders said publicly last week that it was due to the proactive work initiated by the Welsh Assembly Government and the Welsh Development Agency that we are now in a better position to deal with the situation than we would have been had this happened five years ago. That is of some comfort from the perspective of the impact on the Welsh economy. However, it is of little comfort to those businesses affected by recent developments and much less to those workers, and their families, who may stand to lose their jobs as a result.

At this stage, initial estimates put the number of jobs potentially affected in Wales at about 600 in the manufacturing sector. However, a significant number of people are engaged in the retail and service side of the MG Rover network, and so the total may be higher. The Welsh automotive forum has undertaken a survey of those companies affected, and the Welsh automotive taskforce has been recalled and meets today at 2 p.m. at the Waterton business park to discuss the survey findings and to consider the next steps.

I am pleased that MG Rover suppliers based in Wales are eligible to access the £40

Yn sgîl y cyhoeddiad cynharach hwnnw, bu inni sefydlu tasglu modurol Cymru, tasglu a ddygai ynghyd bob un o'r rhai a oedd â rôl allweddol i'w chwarae yn y sector. Penderfynodd y tasglu ar y cymorth tymor byr yr oedd ar y cwmnïau hynny yr effeithiwyd arnynt ei hangen, a bu iddo gynllunio ffordd ymlaen y gallai'r cwmnïau hynny ei defnyddio i geisio gwella eu rhagolygon busnes ac, yn hollbwysig, ffordd y gallent ei defnyddio i amrywio eu sylfaen cwsmeriaid. Arweiniodd gwaith y tasglu at greu rhaglen Accelerate Cymru, rhaglen a fu'n hynod lwyddiannus wrth gyflawni'r amcanion hyn i'r cwmnïau a gymerodd ran ynndi.

Felly, ar y lefel facro, y newyddion da, heddiw, yw bod nifer y cwmnïau yng Nghymru sydd â chyfran uchel o'u busnes yn gysylltiedig ag MG Rover yn llawer mwy cyfyng o'i gymharu â phum mlynedd yn ôl. Dywedodd arweinwyr yr undebau llafur diwydiannol yn gyhoeddus yr wythnos diwethaf mai'r gwaith rhagweithiol a ddechreuwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ac Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru oedd y rheswm pam yr ydym bellach yn gallu delio â'r sefyllfa yn well nag y byddem wedi gallu gwneud pe byddai hyn wedi digwydd bum mlynedd yn ôl. Mae hyn o ryw gysur o safbwyt yr effaith ar yr economi Gymreig. Fodd bynnag, ychydig o gysur ydyw i'r busnesau hynny y mae'r datblygiadau diweddar wedi effeithio arnynt ac mae'n llai fyth o gysur i'r gweithwyr hynny, a'u teuluoedd, a fydd o bosibl yn colli eu swyddi o'r herwydd.

Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r amcangyfrifon cyntaf yn dynodi y bydd nifer y swyddi yr effeithir arnynt o bosibl yng Nghymru oddeutu 600 yn y sector gweithgynhyrchu. Fodd bynnag, mae nifer sylweddol o bobl yn gysylltiedig ag elfen adwerthu a gwasanaethu rhwydwaith MG Rover, ac felly fe all y cyfanswm fod yn uwch. Mae fforwm modurol Cymru wedi cynnal arolwg o'r cwmnïau hynny yr effeithir arnynt, a chafodd tasglu modurol Cymru ei ailgynnnull i gyfarfod heddiw am 2 p.m. ym mharc busnes Waterton i drafod casgliadau'r arolwg ac ystyried y camau nesaf.

Yr wyf yn falch bod cyflenwyr MG Rover a leolir yng Nghymru yn gymwys i gael y

million support package announced by the UK Government, through which aid is available to enable companies to understand the effect of the loss of sales on their businesses, and to help to create a revised strategy and business plan. The fund will also provide short-term financial assistance towards retaining employees with the objective of providing some breathing space for companies to consider all the options available to them. Suppliers with more than 15 per cent of their turnover with MG Rover are eligible to participate in the scheme.

The Welsh automotive taskforce will ensure that eligible companies in Wales access and maximise the support available through this national scheme. In addition, the taskforce will take steps to identify other companies that are affected but are not eligible for this support and, working through the forum, the WDA and ELWa, will take steps to put in place the support needed by those companies.

There is much work to be done to ensure that the impact of these latest announcements in Wales is mitigated and that the companies and individuals affected have the support necessary to help them through this latest transition.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I thank the Minister for his statement. I express my sympathy and concern, and that of Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales, for all those workers affected by the potential closure and for their families, both in Birmingham and, predominantly in our thoughts today, in Wales.

The Minister's statement rightly stresses the importance of the automotive sector to Wales, which is particularly true in Llanelli, in my Mid and West Wales region. Major employers in the town are affected by this potential closure and, as I am sure the Minister is aware, those directly employed in the manufacturing sector are deeply concerned, as are those in support industries such as transport, where major redundancies

pecyn cymorth gwerth £40 miliwn a gyhoeddodd Llywodraeth y DU, pecyn sy'n cynnig cymorth er mwyn galluogi cwmniâu i ddeall effaith colli gwerthiannau ar eu busnesau, ac a fydd yn help iddynt greu strategaeth a chynllun busnes diwygiedig. Bydd y gronfa hefyd yn cynnig cymorth ariannol tymor byr er mwyn eu galluogi i gadw gweithwyr gyda'r amcan o roi cyfle i'r cwmniâu gael eu gwynt atynt i ystyried yr holl opsiynau sydd ar gael iddynt. Mae cyflenwyr sydd â thros 15 y cant o'u trosiant gydag MG Rover yn gymwys i gyfranogi yn y cynllun.

Bydd tasglu modurol Cymru yn sicrhau bod cwmniâu cymwys yng Nghymru yn cael gafaol ar y cymorth sydd ar gael drwy'r cynllun cenedlaethol hwn ac yn defnyddio'r cymorth hwnnw i'r eithaf. Hefyd, bydd y tasglu yn cymryd camau i ganfod pa gwmniâu eraill y mae'r cyhoeddiad yn effeithio arnynt ond nad ydynt yn gymwys i gael y gefnogaeth hon a, chan weithio drwy gyfrwng y fforwm hwn, Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru ac ELWa, bydd yn cymryd camau i sefydlu'r cymorth y mae ar y cwmniâu hynny ei angen.

Mae llawer o waith i'w wneud i sicrhau bod effaith y cyhoeddiadau diweddaraf hyn yng Nghymru yn cael eu lliniaru a bod y cwmniâu a'r unigolion yr effeithir arnynt yn cael y cymorth angenheidol i'w helpu drwy'r trawsnewid diweddaraf hwn.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei ddatganiad. Mynegaf fy nghydymdeimlad a'm pryder, a chydymdeimlad a phryder Plaid Cymru, wrth yr holl weithwyr hynny y bydd y cau a allai ddigwydd yn effeithio arnynt, ac wrth eu teuluoedd, ym Mirmingham ac, yn bennaf yn ein meddyliau heddiw, yng Nghymru.

Mae datganiad y Gweinidog yn pwysleisio, yn briodol, bwysigrwydd y sector modurol i Gymru, rhywbeth sy'n arbennig o wir yn Llanelli, yn fy rhanbarth sef Canolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru. Mae'r cau possibl hwn yn effeithio ar gyflogwyr blaenllaw yn y dref ac, fel y gwyr y Gweinidog, yr wyl yn sicr, mae'r rhai hynny a gyflogir yn uniongyrchol yn y sector gweithgynhyrchu yn bryderus dros ben, yn ogystal â'r rhai yn y

have been announced today—around 60 were predicted by one transport firm in the Llanelli area.

Does the Minister acknowledge that, although it is good news that the dependency on MG Rover orders has reduced, that is still a major factor for some businesses, and we should not be complacent in the face of what amounts to a crisis? I welcome the fact that suppliers will be eligible to access the £40 million, but can the Minister tell us more about how those companies can access that funding? Do you have an estimate yet of how many of those resources are likely to come into companies in Wales?

3.40 p.m.

You made reference to those suppliers likely to fall below 15 per cent turnover, but which, nevertheless, are likely to be affected significantly. Under which existing Assembly budget will funding be found for those companies that are not eligible but are still affected? Will you commit to ensuring that all the funding will be necessary, even the funding that cannot come from the £40 million budget, and which must be found from within the block? Will you also give an assurance that all companies affected—including those outside the direct manufacturing sector, such as the transport companies, which I have already mentioned—will be eligible for support?

Finally, your statement makes reference to the automotive taskforce being recalled but, given the ongoing insecurity in this industry, I am slightly surprised that it was ever called to stand down. Will the Minister acknowledge that a more strategic approach on his part to the future of this key industry over the past five years, such as ensuring the proper and timely development of the automotive technium in Llanelli, might have avoided the necessity for today's firefighting response? That said, I ask the Minister to commit to reporting regularly to the Assembly on progress. As you rightly said, Minister, there is a lot of work to be done, and you have outlined some steps as to how

diwydiannau cefnogi megis trafnidiaeth, lle y cyhoeddwyd diswyddiadau mawr heddiw—rhagwelai un cwmni trafnidiaeth yn ardal Llanelli oddeutu 60 o ddiswyddiadau.

A yw'r Gweinidog yn cydnabod, er ei fod yn newyddion da bod y ddibyniaeth ar archebion MG Rover wedi gostwng, fod hyn yn dal yn ffactor pwysig i rai busnesau, ac na ddylem fod yn hunanfodlon yn wyneb yr hyn sy'n gyfystyr ag argyfwng? Croesawaf y ffaith y bydd cyflenwyr yn gymwys i gael y £40 miliwn, ond a all y Gweinidog ddweud rhagor wrthym ynghylch sut y gall y cwmniau hynny gael gafaol ar y cyllid hwnnw? A oes gennych amcangyfrif eto o faint o'r adnoddau hynny sy'n debygol o ddod i gwmniau yng Nghymru?

Cyfeiriasoch at y cyflenwyr hynny a oedd yn debygol o syrthio o dan drosiant o 15 y cant, ond cwmniau y bydd y cyhoeddiad hwn, er hynny, yn debygol o effeithio'n sylweddol arnynt. O dan ba un o gyllidebau'r Cynulliad y bydd cyllid ar gael i'r cwmniau hynny nad ydynt yn gymwys ond y mae'r cyhoeddiad yn effeithio arnynt er hynny? A wnewch ymrwymo i sicrhau y bydd yr holl gyllid yn angenrheidiol, hyd yn oed y cyllid na all ddod o'r gyllideb £40 miliwn, ac y bydd yn rhaid dod o hyd iddo oddi mewn i'r bloc? A wnewch hefyd roi sicrwydd y bydd pob cwmni yr effeithir arno—gan gynnwys y rhai sydd y tu allan i'r sector gweithgynhyrchu uniongyrchol, megis y cwmniau trafnidiaeth, yr wyf eisoes wedi eu crybwyllyn—yn gymwys i gael cymorth?

Yn olaf, mae eich datganiad yn cyfeirio at y tasglu modurol yn cael ei ailgynnll ond, ac ystyried yr ansicrwydd parhaus yn y diwydiant, yr wyf yn synnu braidd ei fod wedi rhoi'r gorau iddi o gwbl. A wnaiff y Gweinidog gydnabod y byddai dull gweithredu mwy strategol ar ei ran o safbwyt dyfodol y diwydiant allweddol hwn dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf, megis sicrhau datblygiad priodol ac amserol y tecniwm modurol yn Llanelli, o bosibl wedi atal yr angen am yr ymateb diffodd-tân heddiw? Ar ôl dweud hynny, gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ymrwymo i adrodd yn rheolaidd wrth y Cynulliad am y cynydd. Fel y dywedasoch, yn holol iawn, Weinidog, mae llawer o waith

that work will be delivered, for which I am grateful. Will you undertake to report regularly to the Assembly on progress in protecting this key industry in Wales?

i'w wneud, ac yr ydych wedi amlinellu rhai camau ynghylch sut y cyflawnir y gwaith hwnnw, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am hynny. A wnewch addo adrodd yn rheolaidd wrth y Cynulliad am y cynnydd wrth warchod y diwydiant allweddol hwn yng Nghymru?

**Andrew Davies:** It is too soon to say what the impact will be on companies in Wales, which is why the taskforce is being convened by the automotive forum this afternoon. The taskforce consists of representatives from the public sector, the industry and trade unions, and I will receive a report of the meeting from my officials later this afternoon. Therefore, it is too soon to say how many companies will be affected by the MG Rover announcement, and how many will be eligible for funding from the Department of Trade and Industry. If they are not affected or are below the 15 per cent threshold, it is too soon to know the scale of the demand for any necessary or additional support for companies, but that will be key to the work that the automotive taskforce will undertake. As industry leaders, members of the taskforce are in the best position to report to my colleagues and I about the necessary work and support.

On how the fund will operate, my officials are in touch with the DTI and with colleagues in the west Midlands, for example, but it is too soon to say in any detail. As ever, I commit to reporting regularly to the Economic Development and Transport Committee. I can give Members an updated report at its meeting next Wednesday.

**Andrew Davies:** Mae'n rhy fuan i ddweud pa effaith a geir ar gwmniâu yng Nghymru, a dyna pam y mae'r tasglu yn cael ei gynnllun gan y fforwm modurol y prynhawn yma. Mae'r tasglu yn cynnwys cynrychiolwyr o'r sector cyhoeddus, y diwydiant ac undebau llafur, a byddaf yn cael adroddiad o'r cyfarfod gan fy swyddogion yn ddiweddarach y prynhawn yma. Felly, mae'n rhy fuan i ddweud faint o gwmniâu y bydd cyhoeddiad MG Rover yn effeithio arnynt, a faint a fydd yn gymwys i gael cyllid oddi wrth yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant. Os nad effeithir arnynt neu os ydynt o dan y trothwy 15 y cant, mae'n rhy fuan i wybod maint y galw am unrhyw gymorth angenrheidiol neu ychwanegol i'r cwmniâu, ond byddant yn allweddol i'r gwaith y bydd y tasglu modurol yn ei wneud. Fel arweinwyr y diwydiant, mae aelodau'r tasglu yn y sefyllfa orau i adrodd wrth fy nghydweithwyr a minnau am y cymorth a'r gwaith angenrheidiol.

O safbwyt sut y bydd y gronfa yn gweithredu, mae fy swyddogion mewn cysylltiad â'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant ac â chydweithwyr yng ngorllewin Canoldir Lloegr, er enghraifft, ond mae'n rhy fuan i ddweud yn fanwl. Yn ôl fy arfer, yr wyf yn ymrwymo i adrodd yn rheolaidd wrth y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth. Gallaf roi adroddiad wedi ei ddiweddu i'r Aelodau yn ei gyfarfod ddydd Mercher nesaf.

**Catherine Thomas:** Thank you, Minister, for your statement, and your response to Helen Mary Jones, on an issue of immense importance to the people of Wales and my constituents. I also thank the Minister for the meeting that I had with him and the First Minister to discuss many of the points that have just been raised. I look forward to continuing to have regular one-to-one meetings with you as we follow developments over the coming months, which will undoubtedly be crucial.

**Catherine Thomas:** Diolch ichi, Weinidog, am eich datganiad, ac am eich ymateb i Helen Mary Jones, ar fater o bwysigrwydd eithriadol i bobl Cymru ac i'm hetholwyr. Diolchaf hefyd i'r Gweinidog am y cyfarfod a gefais gydag ef a'r Prif Weinidog i drafod llawer o'r pwyntiau sydd newydd gael eu codi. Edrychaf ymlaen at barhau i gael cyfarfodydd un i un rheolaidd gyda chi wrth inni ddilyn y datblygiadau dros y misoedd nesaf, misoedd a fydd heb os yn dyngedfennol.

I refer especially to Krupp Camford Pressings Ltd and Calsonic Kansei, which are based in Felinfoel in my constituency, as Helen Mary Jones referred. Between them, these two companies employ approximately 1,500 people, which are jobs that we cannot afford to lose. As you know, Calsonic Kansei recently announced difficulties prior to the developments at MG Rover. On speaking with local management, trade unions and the workforce, I was glad to hear that they are determined to overcome these problems. They have congratulated and applauded the support that the Minister has given them, as well as that received from the Welsh Assembly Government and the WDA. I know that this support will continue, and that it will be given to all of those companies in Wales that will be affected by the developments at MG Rover.

I would like more details, at the appropriate time, about the support that will be given to companies—especially those in my constituency—to ensure that we receive our fair share of the £40 million that has been provided by central Government. I also look forward to hearing what support will, undoubtedly, be given by the Welsh Assembly Government to those companies that are not eligible for a share of that £40 million allocation. I would also appreciate feedback, at the earliest opportunity, on today's important meeting of the Welsh automotive taskforce, as its work will be of paramount importance.

Finally, I am sure that you will agree, Minister, that it is vital, at this sensitive and very important time, that we unite and work together to reduce the impact on workers in Wales and their families. That is the clear message that I have received from management, trade unions, and from the workforce and their families in my constituency, whom I meet regularly. I look forward to working closely with you and the First Minister in coming months to ensure that everything possible is done to support all of those affected by the recent developments.

**Andrew Davies:** I can certainly give a commitment that we stand ready, as ever, to support these companies. As you kindly

Cyfeiriaf yn arbennig at Krupp Camford Pressings Ltd a Calsonic Kansei, a leolir yn Felin-foel yn fy etholaeth, fel y cyfeiriodd Helen Mary Jones. Rhyngddynt, mae'r ddau gwmni hwn yn cyflogi oddeutu 1,500 o bobl, mae'r rhain yn swyddi na allwn fforddio eu colli. Fel y gwyddoch, cyhoeddodd Calsonic Kansei fod anawsterau cyn y datblygiadau yn MG Rover. Wrth siarad gyda'r rheolwyr lleol, yr undebau llafur a'r gweithlu, yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed eu bod yn benderfynol o oresgyn y problemau hyn. Maent wedi llonyfarch a chymeradwyo'r cymorth y mae'r Gweinidog wedi ei roi iddynt, yn ogystal â'r cymorth a gafwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ac Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru. Gwn y bydd y cymorth hwn yn parhau, ac y bydd yn cael ei roi i'r holl gwmnïau yng Nghymru y bydd y datblygiadau yn MG Rover yn effeithio arnynt.

Hoffwn gael ychydig rhagor o fanylion, ar yr adeg briodol, ynghylch y cymorth a roddir i gwmnïau – yn enwedig rhai yn fy etholaeth i – i sicrhau ein bod yn derbyn ein cyfran deg o'r £40 miliwn sydd wedi'i ddarparu gan y Llywodraeth ganolog. Edrychaf ymlaen hefyd at glywed pa gymorth a fydd, yn ddi- a, yn cael ei roi gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i'r cwmnïau hynny nad ydynt yn gymwys i dderbyn cyfran o'r £40 miliwn hwnnw. Byddwn hefyd yn gwerthfawrogi adborth, mor fuan â phosibl, ar gyfarfod pwysig tasglu modurol Cymru, a gynhalwyd heddiw, gan y bydd ei waith yn hollbwysig.

Yn olaf, rwy'n siŵr y byddwch yn cytuno, Weinidog, ei bod yn hanfodol, ar yr adeg sensitif a hollbwysig yma, ein bod yn dod at ein gilydd ac yn cydweithio i leihau'r effaith ar weithwyr yng Nghymru a'u teuluoedd. Dyna'r neges glir a gefais gan y rheolwyr, yr undebau llafur a chan y gweithlu a'u teuluoedd yn fy etholaeth, a byddaf yn eu cyfarfod yn rheolaidd. Edrychaf ymlaen at weithio'n agos gyda chi a Phrif Weinidog Cymru yn y misoedd i ddod i sicrhau y gwneir popeth sy'n bosibl i gynorthwyo pawb y mae'r datblygiadau diweddar yn effeithio arnynt.

**Andrew Davies:** Gallaf yn sicr roi ymrwymiad ein bod yn barod, fel yr ydym o hyd, i gynorthwyo'r cwmnïau hyn. Fel y

pointed out, both Calsonic Kansei Europe and Krupps Camford have received financial and other assistance from the Assembly Government over many years. When Calsonic made its announcement about restructuring only a few weeks ago, it went out of its way to thank Team Wales for the support that it had received. It is too early to say what the impact will be, not only on the sector, but on individual companies. Provided that it does not breach the commercial confidence of a company or impact on that company's economic or commercial performance, I will make as much information available as possible. That also applies to details of the support package.

I would like to repeat the point that I made earlier in my statement: both union and industry leaders have said publicly that had it not been for the proactive initiative of the Assembly Government and the Welsh Development Agency five years ago, we would be in a far worse position following this announcement. By the proactive action of the Government and the public sector we have helped companies go through a diversification and upskilling programme. That has helped them weather not just this announcement by Rover, but similar difficulties faced by the sector.

The First Minister and I had a meeting earlier today with Digby Jones, the director general of the Confederation of British Industry. He said that in six years of visiting Wales, he has never known the Welsh economy to be in as robust good health as it is currently. We need to bear that in mind, but we also need to bear in mind the needs of the individual companies and the sector affected by this announcement. We will do all that we can to help the individual companies and workers affected.

**William Graham:** I join previous speakers in sympathising with MG Rover's employees and their families, and particularly its pensioners—we gather that was one of the problems that persuaded Shanghai Automotive not to pursue its previous offer. We are aware that this is a major difficulty—and we pay tribute to the Welsh Assembly Government for having enabled firms to

soniasoch yn garedig, mae Calsonic Kansei Europe a Krupps Camford wedi derbyn cymorth ariannol a chymorth arall gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad dros flynyddoedd lawer. Pan wnaeth Calsonic ei gyhoeddiad ynghylch ad-drefnu rai wythnosau yn ôl, aeth allan o'i ffordd i ddiolch i Dîm Cymru am y cymorth a dderbyniodd. Mae'n rhy fuan i ddweud beth fydd yr effaith, nid yn unig ar y sector, ond ar gwmnïau unigol. Ar yr amod nad yw'n torri cyfrinachedd masnachol cwmni neu'n effeithio ar berfformiad economaidd neu fasnachol y cwmni hwnnw, byddaf yn darparu cymaint o wybodaeth â phosibl. Mae hyn hefyd yn berthnasol i fanylion am y pecyn cymorth.

Hoffwn ailadrodd y pwyt a wnaed gennyst yn gynharach yn fy natganiad: mae arweinwyr diwydiant a'r undebau wedi dweud yn gyhoeddus, oni bai am y fenter ragweithiol gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r Awdurdod Datblygu bum mlynedd yn ôl, y byddem mewn sefyllfa waeth o lawer yn sgil y cyhoeddiad hwn. O ganlyniad i'r gweithredu rhagweithiol gan y Llywodraeth a'r sector cyhoeddus, yr ydym wedi helpu cwmnïau drwy raglen arallgyfeirio a gwella sgiliau. Mae hyn wedi eu helpu i ddod drwy nid yn unig y cyhoeddiad hwn gan Rover, ond anawsterau tebyg a wynebir gan y sector.

Cefais i a Phrif Weinidog Cymru gyfarfod yn gynharach heddiw gyda Digby Jones, cyfarwyddwr cyffredinol Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain. Dywedodd, mewn chw mlynedd o ymweld â Chymru, na welodd economi Cymru erioed mewn cystal cyflwr ag y mae ynddo ar hyn o bryd. Rhaid inni gofio hynny, ond gan gofio hefyd beth yw anghenion y cwmnïau unigol a'r sector yr effeithiwyd arnynt gan y cyhoeddiad hwn. Byddwn yn gwneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i helpu'r cwmnïau a'r gweithwyr unigol yr effeithiwyd arnynt.

**William Graham:** Ymunaf â'r siaradwyr blaenorol wrth gydymdeimlo â gweithwyr MG Rover a'u teuluoedd, ac yn enwedig â'i bensiynwyr – deallwn mai dyma oedd un o'r problemau a berswadiodd Shanghai Automotive i beidio â chadarnhau ei gynnig blaenorol. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol bod hyn yn anhawster sylweddol – a thalwn deyrnged i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru am alluogi

diversify to other markets and other suppliers. However, is this money actually new or will it come out of your budget, and does it comply with European Union district competition rules? There must be funds that actually get to people. You also referred to other companies that are dependent on MG Rover. Does this include dealer franchises throughout Wales, which will face major difficulties as time goes on?

You will be aware that TRW Automotive is letting go 42 staff at Resolven, and there is concern about its termination of short-term contracts at the Pontypool works.

3.50 p.m.

This has not come about quickly, and there is such a plethora of statistics now supplied by so many firms to the Government that there surely must have been some earlier indication that things were not right at Rover. In your statement, Andrew, you used the term 'receivership', the same term that was used by Mrs Hewitt, and one of gross pessimism in business. As I understand it, the company is in administration. The Enterprise Act 2002 defines 'administration' simply as running the company to find a buyer to continue production, whereas 'receivership' is using the assets of the company in order to realise them to pay creditors. There is a distinct difference there, which I trust that you will now amplify.

**Andrew Davies:** On your first question, William, about financial support, clearly, the £40 million that was announced was DTI money, and the fact that it has been made available for companies in Wales would indicate that it is new money, and because it has been provided on an UK-basis. It is obviously from a DTI fund and not a Welsh Assembly fund. As I said, that will apply to companies for which 15 per cent of their turnover is in supplying MG Rover.

In terms of the European Union rules, there are clear guidelines and rules as to what

cwmnïau i arallgyfeirio i farchnadoedd eraill a chyflenwyr eraill. Fodd bynnag, ai arian newydd yw hwn mewn gwirionedd neu a fydd yn dod o'ch cyllideb, ac a ydyw'n cydymffurfio â rheolau cystadlu dosbarth yr Undeb Ewropeaidd? Rhaid cael cyllid sy'n cyrraedd pobl. Cyfeiriwyd hefyd gennych at gwmnïau eraill sy'n dibynnu ar MG Rover. A ydyw hyn yn cynnwys masnachfreintiau delwyr modur ledled Cymru, a fydd yn wynebu anawsterau mawr wrth i amser fynd yn ei flaen?

Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod TRW Automotive yn rhyddhau 42 o staff yn Resolven, a bod pryder ei fod wedi terfynu contractau tymor byr yng ngwaith Pont-y-pwl.

Nid yw hyn wedi digwydd dros nos, ac mae cymaint o ystadegau a roir bellach gan gymaint o gwmnïau i'r Llywodraeth fel bod yn rhaid bod arwydd blaenorol o ryw fath nad oedd pethau'n iawn yn Rover. Yn eich datganiad, Andrew, defnyddiwr y term 'yn llaw'r derbynnydd', yr un term ag a ddefnyddiwyd gan Mrs Hewitt, ac un o besimistiaeth garw mewn busnes. Fel y deallaf, mae'r cwmni yn llaw'r gweinyddwr. Mae Deddf Menter 2002 yn diffinio 'yn llaw'r gweinyddwr' fel rhedeg y cwmni er mwyn dod o hyd i brynnwr er mwyn gallu parhau i gynhyrchu, tra bod 'yn llaw'r derbynnydd' yn golygu defnyddio asedau'r cwmni i'w troi yn arian i dalu i'r credydwyr. Mae gwahaniaeth amlwg rhwng y ddaau, a hyderaf y byddwch yn awr yn ymhelaethu ar hyn.

**Andrew Davies:** Yng nghyswilt eich cwestiwn cyntaf, William, am gymorth ariannol, yn amlwg yr oedd y £40 miliwn a gyhoeddwyd yn arian DTI, ac mae'r ffaith ei fod ar gael i gwmnïau yng Nghymru yn awgrymu mai arian newydd ydyw, ac am ei fod wedi'i ddarparu ar sail y DU. Mae'n amlwg yn dod o gyllid y DTI ac nid o gyllid gan Gynulliad Cymru. Fel y dywedais, bydd yn mynd i gwmnïau lle y mae 15 y cant o'u trostant yn cyflenwi MG Rover.

O ran rheolau'r Undeb Ewropeaidd, mae canllawiau a rheolau clir ynghylch pa

public support can be provided to companies. In this case, the money would be for helping companies in terms of training. From the information that we have, this is eligible under European rules. The additional part of the package that the DTI is offering to MG Rover employees, the £6.5 million, is, as I understand it, a loan to help bridge the gap in those employees' wages. That is specifically for MG Rover employees. Clearly, we have to operate within European rules and we are always cognisant of the need to do that.

MG Rover dealerships could be affected by this announcement, particularly if they only deal with MG Rover cars and do not have a wider franchise. Clearly, dealerships in Wales may be affected by this announcement.

On the issue of the distinction between receivership and administration, I will clarify the point for you and write to you on that.

**Jenny Randerson:** I place on record the sympathy of the Welsh Liberal Democrats for those companies and workers who face a period of great uncertainty as a result of MG Rover's announcement. The news today that the Chinese company concerned says that it is unlikely to reopen negotiations given the company's current technical situation makes the outlook even gloomier.

Minister, I welcome the fact that you have recognised that among those most directly affected will be the dealerships and those involved in the service sector, servicing MG Rover cars, because some of those companies do 100 per cent of their business with MG Rover. Although it is very good news that the suppliers have diversified, that is not the case for dealerships and in the service sector.

I ask you for clarification on some specific points—you have clarified many points already, and I welcome that, Minister, but there are some further questions that I wanted to ask you. You referred to the additional

gymorth cyhoeddus y mae modd ei ddarparu i gwmnïau. Yn yr achos hwn, byddai'r arian ar gyfer helpu cwmnïau yng nghyswllt hyfforddiant. Yn ôl y wybodaeth sydd gennym, mae hyn yn gymwys o dan reolau Ewropeaidd. Mae rhan ychwanegol y pecyn y mae'r DTI yn ei gynnig i weithwyr MG Rover, fel y deallaf, yn fenthyciad i helpu i bontio'r bwlc yng nghyflogau'r gweithwyr hynny. Mae hynny'n benodol i weithwyr MG Rover. Yn amlwg, mae'n rhaid i ni weithredu o fewn rheolau Ewropeaidd ac yr ydym bob amser yn ymwybodol o hynny.

Gallai'r cyhoeddiad hwn effeithio ar ddelwyr modur MG Rover, yn enwedig os mai ond mewn ceir MG Rover y maent yn delio ac nad oes ganddynt fasnachfraint ehangach. Yn amlwg, gallai'r cyhoeddiad hwn effeithio ar ddelwyr modur yng Nghymru.

O ran y gwahaniaeth rhwng bod yn llaw'r derbynnydd a llaw'r gweinyddwr, mi egluraf y pwnt hwn i chi ac ysgrifennaf atoch ynghyllch hynny.

**Jenny Randerson:** Hoffwn gofnodi cydymdeimlad y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymreig â'r cwmnïau a'r gweithwyr hynny sy'n wynebu cyfnod o ansicrwydd mawr o ganlyniad i gyhoeddiad MG Rover. Mae'r newyddion heddiw bod y cwmni Tsieineaid dan sylw yn dweud ei fod yn annhebygol o ailagor trafodaethau o ystyried sefyllfa dechnegol bresennol y cwmni yn argoeli'n waeth fyth o ran y dyfodol.

Weinidog, yr wyf yn croesawu'r ffaith eich bod wedi cydnabod y bydd y delwyr modur a'r rhai sy'n ymwneud â'r sector gwasanaeth, sy'n gwasanaethu ceir MG Rover, ymysg y rhai y bydd hyn yn effeithio'n fwyaf uniongyrchol arnynt, achos mae rhai o'r cwmnïau hyn yn cyflawni 100 y cant o'u busnes gyda MG Rover. Er ei fod yn newyddion da iawn fod y cyflenwyr wedi arallgyfeirio, nid yw hynny wedi digwydd gyda delwyr modur ac yn y sector gwasanaeth.

Gofynnaf i chi am eglurhad ynghyllch rhai pwntiau penodol – yr ydych eisoes wedi egluro nifer o bwyntiau, ac yr wyf yn croesawu hynny, Weinidog, ond mae rhai cwestiynau pellach yr oeddwn am eu gofyn i

support that you are considering for those firms that do less than 15 per cent of their business with MG Rover; can you give us further details on the form of that support? Will it be practical financial help, or just tea and sympathy, that is, simply advice to them? In terms of the companies that do more than 15 per cent of their business with MG Rover and qualify for DTI support, although you have clarified that this money comes from the DTI and is new money, which I strongly welcome, I am still unclear as to whether or not it will be channelled via the Welsh Assembly Government, so that a solution can be found that fits our situation in Wales? What other conditions must those companies meet to qualify for that help, in addition to the 15 per cent of their turnover that has been referred to?

Finally, what meetings have you had with your UK counterparts on this issue, and when were you first alerted to the problems, which were widely trailed long before the final announcement? I appreciate that you cannot be precise about the number of people who will be affected in Wales in the retail and service sector, but can you assure me that we will have an early figure from you once your officials have finished their research on this issue?

**Andrew Davies:** Once again, it is still too early to say what the level of demand would be for any particular type of help. We will offer any help that we can—as I said in response to William Graham—within European Union rules. It may be, for example, that a company decides to make new capital investment, or to invest new products or new lines, in which case we will deal with that through the normal procedures. However, until we can identify the need, it is too soon to say what our response will be to individual companies or to the sector itself. That is why the taskforce's work will be so important. We have responded to such situations in the past, and I am sure that we will be able to respond just as imaginatively, proactively and energetically this time.

chi. Yr ydych wedi cyfeirio at y cymorth ychwanegol yr ydych yn ei ystyried ar gyfer y cwmnïau hynny sy'n gwneud llai na 15 y cant o'u busnes gyda MG Rover; a allwch roi rhagor o fanylion i ni ynghylch ffurf y cymorth hwnnw? A fydd yn gymorth ariannol ymarferol, neu'n ddim ond te a chydymdeimlad, hynny yw, cyngor yn unig? O ran y cwmnïau sy'n gwneud mwy na 15 y cant o'u busnes gyda MG Rover ac sy'n gymwys i dderbyn cymorth gan y DTI, er eich bod wedi egluro mai arian newydd yw'r arian hwn gan y DTI, sydd i'w groesawu'n frwd iawn, yr wyf yn aneglur o hyd ynghylch a fydd yn cael ei sianelu drwy Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, fel y gellir dod o hyd i ateb sy'n cyd-fynd â'n sefyllfa ni yng Nghymru? Pa amodau eraill sy'n rhaid i'r cwmnïau hynny eu bodloni i fod yn gymwys ar gyfer y cymorth hwnnw, yn ychwanegol at y 15 y cant o'u trostant y cyfeiriwyd ato eisoes?

Yn olaf, pa gyfarfodydd yr ydych wedi eu cael gyda'ch swyddogion cyfatebol yn y DU ar y mater hwn, a phryd y soniwyd wrthych gyntaf am y problemau, gan fod cryn sôn wedi bod amdanyst ymhell cyn y cyhoeddiad terfynol? Sylweddolaf na allwch fod yn fanwl ynghylch faint o bobl y bydd hyn yn effeithio arnynt yng Nghymru yn y sector adwerthu a gwasanaeth, ond a allwch fy sicrhau y cawn ffigur yn fuan gennych wedi i'ch swyddogion orffen eu hymchwil i'r mater hwn?

**Andrew Davies:** Unwaith eto, mae'n rhy fuan o hyd i ddweud faint o alw a fydd am unrhyw fath neilltuol o gymorth. Byddwn yn cynnig unrhyw gymorth y gallwn ei roi—fel y dywedais yn fy ymateb i William Graham—o fewn rheolau'r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Efallai, er enghraifft, y bydd cwmni yn penderfynu gwneud buddsoddiad cyfalaf newydd, neu fuddsoddi mewn cynhyrchion newydd neu linellau newydd ac, os bydd hynny'n digwydd, byddwn yn delio â hynny drwy'r gweithdrefnau arferol. Fodd bynnag, hyd nes y byddwn yn gwybod beth yw'r angen, mae'n rhy fuan i ddweud beth fydd ein hymateb i gwmnïau unigol nac i'r sector ei hun. Dyna pam y bydd gwaith y tasglu mor bwysig. Yr ydym wedi ymateb i sefyllfaoedd o'r fath yn y gorffennol, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwn yn gallu ymateb yr un mor ddychmygus, rhagweithiol ac egnol y tro hwn.

On the DTI fund, it is still too early to say how that will operate. The companies affected will want a solution, and whether it comes from the DTI or the Assembly Government will be of little interest to them. They will want a rapid response—whether it is a Welsh solution or not is immaterial; it is a matter of ensuring that they get the response that they need. There have been regular meetings at official level with DTI on manufacturing in general. I have had meetings with Patricia Hewitt, the Secretary of State—I had one last year—on a range of issues affecting my portfolio, including manufacturing. The manufacturing task and finish group that I set up last year, which was chaired by Colin Johnson, the former manager of Ford's engine plant at Bridgend, looked at the needs of the manufacturing sector in general, but, importantly, also at those of the automotive sector.

On your final point about the retail and service sector, the structures that we have in place, such as the automotive forum, essentially look at the manufacturing element of the automotive industry. At present, on the retail and service sector, apart from the Sector Skills Council on the training side, we do not have a specific sector dealing with the industry. Therefore, we do not currently have the mechanisms in place to identify the needs on the retail and service side. However, my officials will be working with all the stakeholders and the key players to identify the impact across Wales, whether it is in manufacturing or on the service and retail side.

Ynghylch cyllid y DTI, mae'n rhy fuan o hyd i ddweud sut y bydd yn gweithredu. Bydd y cwmnïau yr effeithir arnynt eisiau ateb, ac ni fydd o fawr ddim diddordeb iddynt ai gan y DTI neu Lywodraeth y Cynulliad y daw'r ateb. Byddant eisiau ymateb yn ddiymdroi – mae'n amherthnasol a yw'n ateb Cymreig ai peidio; mater ydyw o sicrhau eu bod yn cael yr ymateb y maent ei angen. Cynhalwyd cyfarfodydd rheolaidd ar lefel swyddogion gyda'r DTI ynghylch gweithgynhyrchu yn gyffredinol. Cefais innau gyfarfodydd Gwladol – cefais un y llynedd – i drafod ystod o faterion sy'n ymwneud â fy mhorthffolio, gan gynnwys gweithgynhyrchu. Bu'r grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar weithgynhyrchu a sefydlais y llynedd, wedi'i gadeirio gan Colin Johnson, cyn reolwr y ffatri peiriannau ceir gan Ford ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, yn edrych ar anghenion y sector gweithgynhyrchu yn gyffredinol, ond, yn bwysicach, edrychodd hefyd ar rai'r sector modurol.

Ynghylch eich pwynt olaf yng nghyswllt y sector adwerthu a gwasanaeth, mae'r cyriff sydd wedi eu sefydlu, fel y fforwm modurol, yn y bôn yn edrych ar elfen weithgynhyrchu y diwydiant modurol. Ar hyn o bryd, yng nghyswllt y sector adwerthu a gwasanaeth, ar wahân i'r Cyngor Sgiliau Sector ar yr ochr hyfforddi, nid oes gennym sector penodol yn delio â'r diwydiant. Felly, nid yw'r mechanweithiau ar waith gennym i ganfod beth yw'r anghenion ar yr ochr adwerthu a gwasanaeth. Fodd bynnag, bydd fy swyddogion yn gweithio gyda'r holl randdeiliaid a'r prif chwaraewyr i nodi beth fydd yr effaith ar draws Cymru, boed hynny ar weithgynhyrchu neu ar yr ochr gwasanaeth ac adwerthu.

### **Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion Composite Motion: Approval of Orders**

**Y Llywydd:** O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiaf fod

**The Presiding Officer:** Under Standing Order No. 24.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan the National Assembly for Wales, acting*

weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif under Standing Order No. 24.25:  
24.25:

- 1.a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 15 Mawrth 2005 ynghylch y Rheoliadau drafft Rheoliadau Mynediad i Gefn Gwlad (Gweithdrefnau Apelau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2005; a
- b) yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Mynediad i Gefn Gwlad (Gweithdrefnau Apelau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:
- i) y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 9 Mawrth 2005;
  - ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 9 Mawrth 2005;
  - iii) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Ebrill 2005;
2. a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 15 Mawrth 2005 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft Rheoliadau Anifeiliaid a Chynhyrchion Anifeiliaid (Mewnforio ac Allforio) (Cymru) 2005; a
- b) yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Anifeiliaid a Chynhyrchion Anifeiliaid (Mewnforio ac Allforio) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:
- i) y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Mawrth 2005;
  - ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Mawrth 2005;
  - iii) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Ebrill 2005;
3. a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 8 Mawrth 2005 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft Rheoliadau Marchnata Deunydd Planhigion Ffrwythau (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2005; a
- b) yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Marchnata Deunydd Planhigion Ffrwythau (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael eu gwneud
1. a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 15 March 2005 on the draft Regulations the Countryside Access (Appeals Procedures) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2005; and
- b) approves the Countryside Access (Appeals Procedures) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2005 is made in accordance with:
- i) the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 9 March 2005;
  - ii) regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 9 March 2005;
  - iii) the memorandum of correction laid in the Table Office on 4 April 2005;
2. a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 15 March 2005 on the draft regulations the Animals and Animal Products (Import and Export) (Wales) Regulations 2005; and
- b) approves the Animals and Animal Products (Import and Export) (Wales) Regulations 2005 is made in accordance with:
- i) the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 2 March 2005;
  - ii) regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 2 March 2005;
  - iii) the memorandum of correction laid in the Table Office on 4 April 2005;
3. a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 8 March 2005 on the draft regulations the Marketing of Fruit Plant Material (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2005; and
- b) approves the Marketing of Fruit Plant Material (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2005 is made in accordance with:

*yn unol ag:*

- i) *y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Mawrth 2005;* i) *the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 2 March 2005;*
  - ii) *yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 5 Ebrill 2005;* ii) *regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 5 April 2005;*
4. a) *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 15 Mawrth 2005 ynghylch y Rheoliadau drafft Rheoliadau Gwerthoedd Terfyn Ansawdd Aer (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2005; a* 4. a) *considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 15 March 2005 on the draft Regulations The Air Quality Limit Values (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2005; and*
- b) *yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Gwerthoedd Terfyn Ansawdd Aer (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2005 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:* b) *approves the Air Quality Limit Values (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2005 is made in accordance with:*
- i) *y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Mawrth 2005;* i) *the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 2 March 2005;*
  - ii) *yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 5 Ebrill 2005;* ii) *regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 5 April 2005;*
5. a) *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 15 Mawrth 2005 ynghylch y Gorchymyn drafft Gorchymyn Deddf Gofalwyr (Cyfleoedd Cyfartal) 2004 (Cychwyn) (Cymru) 2005; a* 5. a) *considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 15 March 2005 on the draft Order the Carers (Equal Opportunities) Act 2004 (Commencement) (Wales) Order 2005; and*
- b) *yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Deddf Gofalwyr (Cyfleoedd Cyfartal) 2004 (Cychwyn) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Mawrth 2005;* b) *approves the Carers (Equal Opportunities) Act 2004 (Commencement) (Wales) Order 2005 is made in accordance with the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 2 March 2005;*
6. a) *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 15 Mawrth 2005 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft Rheoliadau Melysyddion mewn Bwyd (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2005; a* 6. a) *considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 15 March 2005 on the draft regulations the Sweeteners in Food (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2005; and*
- b) *yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Melysyddion mewn Bwyd (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:* b) *approves the Sweeteners in Food (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2005 is made in accordance with:*
- i) *y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Mawrth 2005;* i) *the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 2 March 2005;*
  - ii) *yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-* ii) *regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office, and e-mailed to Assembly Members*

*bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 5 Ebrill 2005; on 5 April 2005;*

*iii) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno, ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 5 Ebrill 2005. (NDM2377)*

*iii) the memorandum of correction laid in the Table Office, and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 5 April 2005. (NDM2377)*

*Cynnig (NDM2377): O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM2377): For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

**Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Y Blaid Geidwadol)**  
**Minority Party Debate (The Conservative Party)**

**Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus**  
**Public Services**

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2, 4 a 5 yn enw Jocelyn Davies a gwelliant 3 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

Gosodaf gyfyngiad ar hyd areithiau o dan y Rheol Sefydlog berthnasol i sicrhau ein bod yn rhoi cyfle i bawb ac yn delio â'r busnes. Felly, ar wahân i'r cynigydd, y sawl sy'n cynnig gwelliannau, a'r Gweinidog ar ran y Llywodraeth, fe gyfyngir hyd areithiau i dair munud.

4.00 p.m.

**David Melding:** I propose that

*the National Assembly believes that the people of Wales have a right to expect more effective and efficient public services and regrets the failure of the Welsh Assembly Government's policies to secure such an outcome despite the best efforts of nurses, doctors, teachers and other staff.* (NDM2375)

It is an important point to say that we need effective and efficient public services. Quite simply, unless we deliver that, we are cheating the public in Wales by not giving them the quality of care that they could get for a large investment in terms of the tax that they pay and other charges that might apply. We must be highly responsible in the way in which we use public funds, and we must be innovative and set ambitious standards so that people receive the best in education, health, social services, and many other services.

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1, 2, 4 and 5 in the name of Jocelyn Davies and amendment 3 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

I set a time limit on speeches under the relevant Standing Order to ensure that we give everyone an opportunity and complete our business. Therefore, apart from the proposing Member, those who propose amendments, and the Minister on behalf of the Government, the length of speeches will be confined to three minutes.

**David Melding:** Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn credu bod gan bobl Cymru'r hawl i ddisgwyd gwasanaethau cyhoeddus mwy effeithiol ac effeithlon ac mae'n gresynu at fethiant polisiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau canlyniad o'r fath er bod nyrsys, meddygon, athrawon a staff eraill yn ymdrechu hyd eithaf eu gallu.* (NDM2375)

Mae'n bwynt pwysig dweud bod angen gwasanaethau cyhoeddus effeithiol ac effeithlon arnom. A dweud y gwir, os na allwn gyflawni hynny, yr ydym yn twyllo'r cyhoedd yng Nghymru trwy beidio â rhoi iddynt y gofal o'r ansawdd y gallent ei gael am fuddsoddiad mawr o ran y dreth y maent yn ei thalu a'r costau eraill y gallant eu hwynebu. Rhaid inni fod yn gyfrifol dros ben yn y ffordd yr ydym yn defnyddio arian cyhoeddus, a rhaid inni fod yn arloesol a phennu safonau uchelgeisiol fel bod pobl yn derbyn y gorau mewn addysg, iechyd, gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, a llawer o wasanaethau eraill.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadaïr am 4.02 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.02 p.m.*

Devolution is tested most in the area of public services. Comparisons are made commonly with England and Scotland, and we can check whether we are outperforming England, or vice versa. Also, more fundamentally, perhaps, the Assembly is judged on its performance with regard to public services in a more general way, in that it somehow affects the constitutional settlement. Indeed, many Labour backbench Members of Parliament made that point with regard to the health service, asking why anyone should call for more powers for the Assembly while it delivers such a poor standard in comparison with England.

Public services must be comprehensive and universal if they are to prosper, otherwise we will see drift out of services, and there will be pressure to change the tax system. What makes the NHS really effective is that nearly everyone uses it. That is certainly the case with primary and accident and emergency care, but with hospital services in the elective sphere having difficulty in meeting demand, one already sees the consequences of more and more people calling for a fundamental change in the system so that they can receive their care elsewhere or have freedom of choice.

With regard to dentistry—which, to be fair to the Labour Party, is a problem that it more or less inherited—we moved to a new contract in the mid 1990s which has resulted in a move away from a universal service. That is pretty much what happens all over Europe, and we are perhaps too ambitious in trying to convince dentists to be a part of the NHS. However, that is an indication of what can happen, and now, 50 per cent of people do not receive NHS treatment. I am sure that we do not want to see that repeated in education and other areas of health care.

Comprehensive and universal does not necessarily mean monopoly state provision, however, and this is where I criticise the First Minister most of all. He has tended to speak about clear red water and that, somehow,

Mae datganoli'n cael ei brofi fwyaf ym maes gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Mae cymariaethau'n cael eu gwneud yn aml â Lloegr a'r Alban, a gallwn weld a ydym yn perfformio'n well na Lloegr, neu i'r gwrthwyneb. Hefyd, ac yn fwy sylfaenol, efallai, mae'r Cynulliad yn cael ei farnu mewn modd mwy cyffredinol yn ôl ei berfformiad o safbwyt gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, yn yr ystyr ei fod rywsut yn effeithio ar y setliad cyfansoddiadol. Yn wir, mae llawer o Aelodau Seneddol Llafur ar y meinciau cefn wedi gwneud y pwyt hwnnw parthed y gwasanaeth iechyd, gan ofyn pam y byddai unrhyw un am alw am ragor o bwerau i'r Cynulliad ac yntau'n cyrraedd safon mor isel o'i gymharu â Lloegr.

Rhaid i wasanaethau cyhoeddus fod yn gynhwysfawr ac ar gael i bawb os ydynt am ffynnu, neu byddwn yn gweld pobl yn gadael gwasanaethau, a bydd pwysau'n dilyn i newid y system dreth. Yr hyn sy'n gwneud y GIG yn wirioneddol effeithiol yw'r ffaith bod bron pawb yn ei ddefnyddio. Mae hynny'n sier yn wir am ofal sylfaenol a damweiniau ac achosion brys, ond gyda gwasanaethau ysbyty yn y maes dewisol yn cael anhawster i gwrdd â'r galw, mae rhywun eisoes yn gweld y canlyniadau wrth i fwy a mwy o bobl alw am newid sylfaenol i'r system er mwyn iddynt allu derbyn eu gofal yn rhywle arall neu gael y rhyddid i ddewis.

O safbwyt deintyddiaeth - sydd, a bod yn deg â'r Blaid Lafur, yn broblem y mae fwy neu lai wedi'i hetifeddu - symudasom ymlaen i gontract newydd yng nghanol y 1990au sydd wedi arwain at symud i ffwrdd oddi wrth wasanaeth cyffredinol. Dyna fwy neu lai beth sy'n digwydd ar draws Ewrop, ac efallai ein bod yn rhy uchelgeisiol wrth geisio argyhoeddi deintyddion i fod yn rhan o'r GIG. Fodd bynnag, mae hyn yn arwydd o'r hyn a all ddigwydd, ac yn awr, nid yw 50 y cant o'r bobl yn derbyn triniaeth gan y GIG. Yr wyf yn siŵr nad ydym am weld hynny'n digwydd yn achos addysg a meysydd eraill o fewn gofal iechyd.

Nid yw cynhwysfawr a chyffredinol o reidrwydd yn golygu monopol o ran darpariaeth y wladwriaeth, fodd bynnag, a dyma lle yr wyf fwyaf beirniadol o'r Prif Weinidog. Mae wedi tueddu i siarad am ddŵr

there is a community spirit in Wales that prevents the use of the private and independent sector to deliver health services and social care. We have paid a high price for this stubborn commitment to an old, stateist form of socialism.

Effective public services also require politicians to be accountable. When we make mistakes, we should say, ‘We made a mistake there. That didn’t work and it needs to be revisited’. We should set realistic standards and targets if we are going to set them, and few of them. They should be measured, and we should accept that we have either performed well or that we have not. We witnessed a particularly miserable episode this afternoon when the First Minister started to question the very strength of the waiting-list data and suggested that they could not be compared to 1999 as we have moved away and comparison is no longer possible. Those in Government chose this figure in 1999: they knew the strength of the data and freely chose that as the measure for success in NHS performance. It was their choice to be measured on waiting lists as they stood at the time. Now, however, Rhodri Morgan is moving away and saying that it is a different world, and one simply cannot have a dialogue as the figures cannot be measured and you cannot therefore do anything. It is no wonder that politicians sometimes get a bad name when they are slippery and casual about being held accountable for their promises.

The lie is given, if you look at the way that these targets are treated, in that the Labour Party still thinks that waiting lists are important and has now set another target for 2009, which is correct because they are important.

**Leighton Andrews:** Speaking of lies, and politicians giving politics a bad name, will you comment on the behaviour of the Conservative candidate in Dorset who doctored pictures on his leaflets to suggest that he was supporting Conservative immigration policy with Ann Widdecombe, when he was not?

coch clir a rhywsut, fod ysbryd cymunedol yng Nghymru sy'n rhwystr rhag defnyddio'r sector preifat ac annibynnol i ddarparu gwasanaethau iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Yr ydym wedi talu'n ddrud am y fath ymrwymiad ystyfnig i hen fath o sosialaeth, a honno'n sosialaeth wladwriaethol.

Mae gwasanaethau cyhoeddus effeithiol hefyd yn mynnu bod rhaid i wleidyddion fod yn atebol. Pan fyddwn yn gwneud camgymeriadau, dylem ddweud, ‘Yr ydym wedi gwneud camgymeriad yma. Nid oedd hyn yn llwyddiannus a rhaid edrych arno eto.’ Dylem osod safonau a thargedau realistig os ydym am eu gosod, a dim ond ychydig ohonynt. Dylent gael eu mesur, a dylem dderbyn ein bod un ai wedi perfformio'n dda neu nad ydym wedi gwneud hynny. Yr ydym wedi gweld pennod arbennig o drist y prynhawn yma pan ddechreuodd y Prif Weinidog amau cryfder y data ar restrau aros ac awgrymodd na ellid eu cymharu ag 1999 gan ein bod wedi symud ymlaen ac nad oes modd eu cymharu bellach. Y rhai a oedd yn y Llywodraeth a ddewisodd y ffigur hwn yn 1999: yr oeddent yn ymwybodol o gryfder y data gan ei ddewis o'u gwirfodd fel y mesur ar gyfer llwyddiant perfformiad y GIG. Eu dewis hwy oedd cael eu mesur ar sail rhestrau aros fel yr oeddent ar y pryd. Bellach, foddy bynnag, mae Rhodri Morgan yn symud i ffwrdd ac yn dweud ei fod yn fyd gwahanol, ac nad oes modd cael deialog gan nad oes modd mesur y ffigurau ac felly nad oes modd gwneud dim. Nid yw'n syndod bod gwleidyddion weithiau'n cael enw drwg pan fônt yn amwys ac yn ddifater ynglŷn â bod yn atebol am eu haddewidion.

Mae'r celwydd yn amlwg, os edrychwch ar y modd yr ymdrinnir â'r targedau hyn, yn yr ystyr bod y Blaid Lafur yn parhau i gredu bod rhestrau aros yn bwysig ac mae'n awr wedi pennu targed arall ar gyfer 2009, sy'n iawn gan eu bod yn bwysig.

**Leighton Andrews:** A sôn am gelwyddau, a gwleidyddion yn rhoi enw drwg i wleidyddiaeth, a wnewch gynnig sylw ar ymddygiad yr ymgeisydd Ceidwadol yn Dorset sydd wedi ffugio lluniau ar ei daflenni i awgrymu ei fod yn cefnogi polisi'r Ceidwadwyr ar fewnfudo gydag Ann Widdecombe, pryd nad oedd yn gwneud

hynny mewn gwirionedd?

**David Melding:** I will answer for my actions. When I think that I have done something wrong, or when a policy has not been as successful as it should have been, I say so. I have no idea to what you refer.

Labour now has another target for 2009, which is 10 years after the first target set in 1999 for the end of the last Assembly. Labour, therefore, still accepts that waiting lists are a valid measure—and so it should. This is not a particularly ambitious target. It starts at the point of a GP referral, which was one of the first things that I called for in the Assembly. The clock should start when a patient sees the GP. The Labour Party has only recently accepted this, and that was only because it had moved to that target in England. It is only because the English are now measuring from the point of GP referral that we have had a change of policy.

It is quite simple: if you want effective public services, you have to make them innovative, hardworking, fuelled by effective policies, and freed from dogma. You must ensure that nearly every citizen is happy to pay their tax to see it invested, to enjoy those services when they are needed. In the last five or six years, we have seen many public services being called into question because of the approach of the Labour Party in the Chamber in adopting a socialist position and striving ideologically just to have clear red water between it and the rest of the country and, indeed, the rest of Europe. It is time for a change.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 1: yn llinell 1 rhoi ‘yn gryf’ ar ôl ‘Cynulliad Cenedlaethol’

Cynigiaf welliant 2. Ar ôl ‘polisiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru’ rhoi:

**David Melding:** Yr wyf yn fodlon bod yn atebol am fy ngweithredoedd. Os byddaf yn credu fy mod wedi gwneud camgymeriad, neu os nad yw polisi wedi bod mor llwyddiannus ag y dylai fod, yr wyf yn dweud hynny. Nid oes gennyl syniad at beth yr ydych yn cyfeirio.

Mae gan Lafur bellach darged arall ar gyfer 2009, sydd 10 mlynedd ar ôl y targed cyntaf a bennwyd yn 1999 ar gyfer diwedd y Cynulliad diwethaf. Mae Llafur, felly, yn parhau i dderbyn bod rhestrau aros yn fesur diliys—ac yn wir fe ddylai. Nid yw hwn yn darged arbennig o uchelgeisiol. Y man cychwyn yw pan fo rhywun yn cael ei atgyfeirio gan feddyg teulu, a dyna oedd un o'r pethau cyntaf y gofynnais amdano yn y Cynulliad. Dylai'r cloc gychwyn pan fydd claf yn gweld y meddyg teulu. Yn ddiweddar y mae'r Blaid Lafur wedi derbyn hyn, a'r unig reswm pam y digwyddodd hynny oedd eu bod wedi symud at y targed hwnnw yn Lloegr. Dim ond oherwydd bod y Saeson yn awr yn dechrau mesur pan gaiff rhywun ei atgyfeirio gan y meddyg teulu yr ydym ni wedi newid y polisi.

Mae'n ddigon syml: os ydych am gael gwasanaethau cyhoeddus effeithiol, rhaid ichi eu gwneud yn arloesol, yn rhai sy'n gweithio'n galed, sydd â pholisiau effeithiol yn gefn iddynt ac sydd yn rhydd rhag dogma. Rhaid ichi sicrhau bod bron pob dinesydd yn fodlon talu ei dreth er mwyn ei gweld yn cael ei buddsoddi a chael budd o'r gwasanaethau hynny pan fyddant eu hangen. Yn y pump neu chwe mlynedd diwethaf, yr ydym wedi gweld llawer o wasanaethau cyhoeddus yn dod o dan amheuaeth oherwydd awydd y Blaid Lafur yn y Siambra i fabwysiadu agwedd sosialaidd ac ymdrechu'n ideolegol i gael dŵr coch clir rhyngddi a gweddill y wlad ac, yn wir, gweddill Ewrop. Mae'n bryd cael newid.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 1: in line 1 insert ‘strongly’ before ‘believes’.

I propose amendment 2. After ‘policies’ insert:

*'er 1999, a Llywodraethau olynol y DU,'*

*'since 1999, and consecutive UK Governments,'*

Cynigiaf welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*noda ddadfrithiad cyffredinol gweithwyr y sector cyhoeddus fel sy'n amlwg yn y bleidlais ysgubol ddiweddar o blaid gweithredu diwydiannol gan aelodau undeb llafur y Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus a Masnachol.*

Cynigiaf welliant 5. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*cred y bydd gwasanaethau cyhoeddus Cymru'n darparu gwasanaeth o'r safonau uchaf os c'ant eu seilio ar egwyddorion sosialaidd.*

Yr wyf yn croesawu'r cyfle i gyfrannu at y drafodaeth. Cytunwn â David Melding ei bod yn bwysig ein bod yn bwrw golwg ar lwyddiannau neu fethiannau'r Llywodraeth yn y maes hwn gan fod gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn un o nifer o feisydd sydd wedi'u datganoli yng Nghymru. Un o'r meisydd polisi y dylai'r Llywodraeth fod wedi llwyddo ynddo, er 1999, yw iechyd—fel y clywsom. Cawsom gyfle, ar ôl datganoli, i siapio'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol i ymdrin ag anghenion penodol Cymru. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol bod yr anghenion hynny yn wahanol i'r hyn a geir yn Lloegr ac yn yr Alban.

Mae'n wir dweud bod Llafur yn San Steffan, yn y blynnyddoedd cynnar, wedi cadw at gynllun gwario'r Ceidwadwyr, ond bod gwariant ers hynny wedi codi'n sylweddol. Erbyn 2007, bydd y gwariant ar iechyd wedi dyblu yng Nghymru ers datganoli. Mae gwariant wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol ond nid yw'r rhestrau aros wedi gostwng, i gyfateb â hynny. Fel y clywsom yn ystod cwestiynau'r Prif Weinidog yn gynharach, yr oedd rhestrau aros—gan gynnwys y rhai ar gyfer cleifion allanol a'r rheini sy'n disgwyli am driniaeth mewn ysbyty—yn cynnwys tua 160,000 o enwau pan ddaeth Llafur i rym yn y Cynulliad yn 1999. Erbyn hyn, mae 292,000 o bobl ar y rhestrau aros. Synnais yn fawr glywed y Prif Weinidog yn cyfeirio at

I propose amendment 4. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*notes the widespread demoralisation of public sector workers as illustrated by the recent overwhelming vote in favour of industrial action by members of the Public and Commercial Services trade union.*

I propose amendment 5. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*believes that Welsh public services will deliver to the highest standards if based on socialist principles.*

I welcome the opportunity to contribute to this discussion. We can agree with David Melding that it is important that we study the Government's successes or failures in this area because public services is one of many areas that have been devolved in Wales. One of the policy areas in which the Government should have succeeded, since 1999, is health—as we have heard. We had an opportunity, following devolution, to shape the national health service to deal with the specific needs of Wales. We are aware that those needs are different to the needs of England and Scotland.

It is true to say that in the early years, Labour in Westminster kept to the spending plans of the Conservative Party but that expenditure has increased considerably since then. By 2007, expenditure on health will have doubled in Wales since devolution. Expenditure has increased substantially but waiting lists have not decreased in line with our spending. As we heard earlier in the First Minister's questions, waiting lists—including the out-patients' and in-patients' lists—stood at around 160,000 people when Labour came to power in the Assembly in 1999. The figure is now 292,000 people. I was surprised to hear the First Minister referring to the figures for 18 months ago, as the Government has been in power for six years. It is right that we

ffigurau 18 mis yn ôl, gan fod y Llywodraeth wedi bod mewn grym ers chwe blynedd. Mae'n iawn i ni edrych ar ei record yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw.

Nid y rhestrau aros eu hunain yn unig sy'n cynyddu; mae nifer y bobl sy'n gorfod aros yn hir iawn am driniaeth yn cynyddu'n sylweddol hefyd. Yr oeddwon yn gallu cyfeirio, yn fy nghwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog heddiw—

**Leighton Andrews:** While you are on the subject of waiting lists, do you still believe that use should be made of the private sector to help bring down waiting lists?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Ni chredaf fod angen gwneud hynny, ac egluraf hynny yn y drafodaeth. Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhaid i Leighton Andrews ac Aelodau Llafur eraill ystyried eu polisiau eu hunain yn hytrach na phoeni am bolisiau'r gwrthbleidiau.

4.10 p.m.

Leighton Andrews regularly asks silly questions, such as the one about somebody with a leaflet in Dorset. What has that got to do with the health service in Wales? Let us have some serious debate about the future of the health service in Wales, Leighton, rather than these silly questions.

**Leighton Andrews:** Do you still believe in using the private sector?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I have told you 'no'.

Let us talk about what happened before the Easter recess, when the First Minister was challenged about waiting times and lists. He had been ordered by Tony Blair to introduce these new targets because Welsh Labour MPs were fearful of losing their seats. He denied, in effect, that it was likely that anything would happen. However, two days later, we had a statement. What was remarkable about that statement was the lack of clarity about changes in policy, which would have delivered shorter waiting times. What about these essential changes in policy? What about the new diagnostic treatment centres and the

look at its record for that period.

It is not only the waiting lists themselves that are increasing; the number of people who have to wait a long time for treatment is also increasing substantially. I could refer, in my questions to the First Minister today—

**Leighton Andrews:** Tra ydych yn sôn am restrau aros, a ydych yn dal i gredu y dylid defnyddio'r sector preifat i helpu i leihau'r rhestrau aros?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I do not believe that there is a need to do so, which I will explain during the debate. However, Leighton Andrews and other Labour Members must consider their own policies instead of worrying about the policies of opposition parties.

Mae Leighton Andrews yn gofyn cwestiynau gwirion yn rheolaidd, megis yr un am rywun gyda thaflen yn Dorset. Beth sydd a wnelo hynny â'r gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru? Gadewch i ni gael dadl ddifrifol am ddyfodol y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru, Leighton, yn hytrach na'r cwestiynau gwirion hyn.

**Leighton Andrews:** A ydych yn dal i gredu mewn defnyddio'r sector preifat?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr wyf wedi dweud wrthych 'nac ydwyf'.

Gadewch i ni drafod yr hyn a ddigwyddodd cyn toriad y Pasg, pan heriwyd y Prif Weinidog ar amseroedd a rhestrau aros. Cafodd ei orchymyn gan Tony Blair i gyflwyno'r targedau newydd hyn gan fod Aelodau Seneddol Llafur Cymru'n poeni y byddent yn colli eu seddau. Gwaddodd, i bob pwrrpas, ei bod yn debygol y byddai unrhyw beth yn digwydd. Fodd bynnag, ddeuddydd yn ddiweddarach, cawsom ddatganiad. Yr hyn a oedd yn hynod am y datganiad hwnnw oedd y diffyg eglurder am y newidiadau mewn polisi, a fyddai wedi arwain at amseroedd aros byrrach. Beth yw'r

walk-in centres that we need? We have heard nothing about those from the Government. What about protecting elective surgery, the increasing residential home fees, improving the working conditions of home carers and providing alternatives to acute hospital treatment? I say to the Conservatives that I do not think that patient passports are the answer either. We must remember that the NHS provides a comprehensive dedicated service that is free at the point of delivery. That is the only way to maintain fairness and the integrity of the service, and to support and value the work of NHS staff.

Cyfeiriaf yn fyr at ddau faes pwysig arall o'n gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Y cyntaf yw addysg, ac yr ydym yn gwybod, oherwydd problemau difrifol o ran cylldio addysg uwch ac addysg bellach, fod y Llywodraeth wedi gohirio'r penderfyniad i gyflwyno ffioedd dysgu tan ar ôl 2007. Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhaid inni gael ateb yngylch yr hyn fydd yn digwydd wedi hynny. Teimlwn fod hwn yn fater pwysig iawn. Cyfeiriaf hefyd at drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus. Mae'r rhai hynny ohonom sy'n gorfol teithio o'r De i'r Gogledd yn gwybod pa mor ddifrifol wan yw'r system drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Byddwn wedi gobeithio y byddai'r Llywodraeth wedi gwella trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus erbyn hyn.

With Labour, you get underinvestment and the neglect of public services. With the Conservatives, you get plans to undermine public services. It is only Plaid Cymru, therefore, that believes passionately in the integrity of public services, proper investment, support for staff and better services for the people of Wales. That is why we have tabled these amendments today.

**Kirsty Williams:** I propose amendment 3 in my name: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*believes that targets to improve healthcare should be realistic and should not distort clinical priorities.*

The Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome this

newidiadau sylfaenol hyn mewn polisi? Beth am y canolfannau triniaeth diagnostig newydd a'r canolfannau taro i mewn sydd eu hangen arnom? Nid ydym wedi clywed dim gan y Llywodraeth am y rhain. Beth am ddiogelu llawdriniaethau dewisol, y cynnydd mewn ffioedd cartrefi preswyl, gwella amodau gweithio gofalwyr cartref a darparu dewisiadau heblaw triniaethau ysbty aciwt? Dywedaf wrth y Ceidwadwyr nad pasportau i gleifion yw'r ateb ychwaith. Rhaid cofio bod y GIG yn darparu gwasanaeth cynhwysfawr ymroddedig sydd am ddim yn y man lle'i darperir. Dyna'r unig ffordd i gadw tegwch a diliysrwydd y gwasanaeth, ac i gefnogi a gwerthfawrogi gwaith staff y GIG.

I will refer briefly to two other important areas of our public services. The first is education, and we know, because of serious problems in terms of funding higher and further education, that the Government has deferred the decision to introduce top-up fees until after 2007. However, we must have an answer about what will happen after that. We feel that this is an extremely important issue. I will also refer to public transport. Those of us who have to travel from south to north Wales know how terribly poor the public transport system is in Wales. I would have hoped that the Government would have improved public transport by now.

Gyda Llafur, mae'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn profi buddsoddi annigonol ac esgeulustod. Gyda'r Ceidwadwyr, yr ydych yn cael cynlluniau i danseilio gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Dim ond Plaid Cymru, felly, sy'n credu'n angerddol yn nilysrwydd gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, buddsoddi priodol, cefnogaeth i'r staff a gwasanaethau gwell i bobl Cymru. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi cyflwyno'r gwelliannau hyn heddiw.

**Kirsty Williams:** Cynigiaf welliant 3 yn fy enw i: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiweddu y cynnig:

*credu y dylai targedau i wella gofal iechyd fod yn realistig ac na ddylent ystumio blaenorriaethau clinigol.*

Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n

debate's focus on efficient and effective public services in Wales. We all know from our work and from repeated surveys conducted across the country that services, such as those provided by the NHS and in schools, consistently top the list of the main concerns expressed by the public. The providers of those services also contribute hugely to the economic welfare of the country as they are huge employers. Therefore, we must get them right, for the employees, and for those who receive the services that they deliver. David Melding was right to say that the efficacy of this institution has been called into question, and will continue to be called into question if the public feels that we are not getting it right. Unfortunately, the Labour Welsh Assembly Government continues to get it wrong. Labour's greatest failing in terms of the public service sector has been waiting lists. Too many people in Wales are still waiting too long for treatment. However, we believe that Labour's obsession with waiting-list targets makes the situation worse. How long a person waits for their treatment is just one part of their experience in the NHS as a whole.

The fixation with how long somebody waits for treatment takes the focus away from successful clinical outcomes and the patients' experience of treatment when they reach hospital. The Welsh Liberal Democrats believe that if we are to have efficient and effective public services, we must move to a smarter way of managing performance in the NHS that takes time into consideration and looks at other factors in developing a good national health service for the people of Wales. It should put clinicians in control and allow them to decide who they treat and when they should be treated without having to constantly look over their shoulders and worry about breaching waiting time targets. They should be allowed to decide not to treat patients who they feel could be treated at a later stage rather than clinical priorities, some of whom must currently wait because they are not in danger of breaching Labour Assembly targets.

croesawu pwyslais y ddadl ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus effeithlon ac effeithiol yng Nghymru. Yr ydym i gyd yn gwybod drwy ein gwaith a thrwy nifer o arolygon a gynhaliwyd ar draws y wlad fod gwasanaethau, megis y rhai a ddarperir gan y GIG ac mewn ysgolion, yn gyson ar frig rhestr prif bryderon y cyhoedd. Mae darparwyr y gwasanaethau hyn hefyd yn gwneud cyfraniad mawr at les economaidd y wlad gan eu bod yn gyflogwyr enfawr. Felly, rhaid i ni sicrhau ein bod yn gwneud popeth yn iawn, er mwyn y cyflogeion, ac er mwyn y sawl sy'n derbyn y gwasanaethau a ddarperir ganddynt. Roedd David Melding yn iawn wrth ddweud bod amheuaeth wedi'i bwrw yngylch effeithiolrwydd y sefydliad, ac y bydd yr amheuaeth honno'n parhau os bydd y cyhoedd yn teimlo nad ydym yn llwyddo i gael gwasanaeth effeithlon. Yn anffodus, mae Llywodraeth Lafur Cynulliad Cymru'n parhau i wneud pethau'n anghywir. Methiant mwyaf Llafur o ran y sector gwasanaethau cyhoeddus fu rhestrau aros. Mae gormod o bobl yng Nghymru'n aros yn rhy hir am driniaeth. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym o'r farn bod obsesiwn Llafur gyda thargedau rhestrau aros yn gwneud y sefyllfa'n waeth. Un rhan yn unig o brofiad rhywun o'r GIG yw am ba hyd y mae'n aros am driniaeth.

Mae'r obsesiwn gyda pha mor hir y mae rhywun yn aros am driniaeth yn tynnu'r sylw oddi ar ganlyniadau clinigol llwyddiannus a phrofiad y cleifion o driniaeth pan fyddant yn cyrraedd yr ysbty. Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n credu os ydym am gael gwasanaethau cyhoeddus effeithlon ac effeithiol, fod rhaid inni ddod o hyd i ffordd well i reoli perfformiad yn y GIG sy'n ystyried amser ac sy'n edrych ar ffactorau eraill i ddatblygu gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol da i bobl Cymru. Dylai roi rheolaeth yn nwyo clinicwyr a gadael iddynt hwy benderfynu pwy sy'n cael eu trin ganddynt a phryd y dylent gael eu trin heb orfod edrych dros eu hysgwydd yn barhaus a phoeni am fethu â chyflawni targedau amser aros. Dylid gadael iddynt benderfynu peidio â thrin cleifion os ydynt yn credu y gellid eu trin yn ddiweddarach yn hytrach na blaenoriaethau clinigol, mae rhai ohonynt yn gorfol aros ar hyn o bryd oherwydd nad oes perygl iddynt dorri targedau Llafur y Cynulliad.

In schools, Labour has failed to reap the maximum benefits from smaller class sizes. It has turned its back on the promise made during the partnership Government to reduce class sizes further. As Welsh Liberal Democrats, we remain committed to smaller class sizes and to giving teachers greater scope to spend more time with individuals, making it easier for them to avoid the disruption that can easily be caused by indiscipline.

**Peter Black:** At the weekend, the Prime Minister reiterated his pledge of ‘education, education, education’, but in Wales, as you said, Labour has backtracked on the class-size pledges made during the partnership Government. It has failed to meet its own targets for capital investment and it is also considering fees for students. Do you share my concern that if the Tories were to win and were to cut public spending, we would have less money in Wales to spend on education and more schools would close, especially in rural areas such as yours?

**Kirsty Williams:** Absolutely. The destruction that a Tory Government in Westminster might wreak on schools is a huge worry for constituents in Brecon and Radnorshire. Michael Howard keeps asking whether we are thinking what he is thinking. I will tell him what I am thinking, and what the Welsh Liberal Democrats are thinking: the last time that he and his colleagues were in Government, they caused enormous damage to public service efficiency and effectiveness in Wales.

**Mark Isherwood:** Here was I thinking that the Liberal Democrats shared our commitment to tackling waste in this discredited Government. The reality of Conservative policy is to increase spending on education by £15 billion. We should never resort to using unacceptable words such as ‘liar’ in the Assembly, but, equally, across the Chamber, we must avoid indulging in the politics of smear, innuendo and distortion.

O ran ysgolion, nid yw Llafur wedi llwyddo i fanteisio i'r eithaf ar ddosbarthiadau llai. Maent wedi troi eu cefn ar yr addewid a wnaethpwyd yn ystod y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth i leihau maint dosbarthiadau ymhellach. Fel Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, yr ydym wedi ymrwymo o hyd i ddosbarthiadau llai ac i roi mwy o gyfle i athrawon dreulio mwy o amser gydag unigolion, gan ei gwneud yn haws iddynt osgoi'r aflonyddwch sy'n cael ei achosi mor hawdd gan ddiffyg disgylblaeth.

**Peter Black:** Dros y Sul, ailadroddodd y Prif Weinidog ei addewid ‘addysg, addysg, addysg’, ond yng Nghymru, fel y dywedwyd gennych, mae Llafur wedi troi yn eu carn o ran eu haddewidion ar faint dosbarthiadau a wnaethpwyd yn ystod y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth. Mae wedi methu â chwrdd â'i thargedau ei hun ar gyfer buddsoddi cyfalaf ac mae hefyd yn ystyried ffioedd i fyfyrwyr. A ydych yn rhannu fy mhryderon pe bai'r Torïaid yn ennill ac yn torri ar wariant cyhoeddus, y byddai gennym lai o arian yng Nghymru i'w wario ar addysg ac y byddai mwy o ysgolion yn cau, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd gwledig fel eich un chi?

**Kirsty Williams:** Yn holol. Mae'r distryw y gallai Llywodraeth Dorïaid yn San Steffan ei achosi yn bryder mawr i etholwyr Brycheiniog a Maesyfed. Mae Michael Howard yn dal i ofyn a ydym ni'n meddwl yr hyn y mae ef yn ei feddwl. Dywedaf wrtho'r hyn yr wyf fi yn ei feddwl, a'r hyn y mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn ei feddwl: y tro diwethaf yr oedd ef a'i gydaelodau mewn grym, gwnaethpwyd difrod enfawr ganddynt i effeithlonrwydd ac effeithiolrwydd gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.

**Mark Isherwood:** A minnau yn credu bod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn rhannu ein hymrwymiad i fynd i'r afael â gwastraff yn y Llywodraeth hon sydd dan gwmwl. Y gwirionedd ynglŷn â pholisi'r Ceidwadwyr yw cynnydd o £15 biliwn yn y gwariant ar addysg. Ni ddylem fyth ymostwng i ddefnyddio geiriau annerbynol fel 'celwyddgi' yn y Cynulliad, ond, yn yr un modd, ar draws y Siambwr, rhaid inni osgoi cymryd rhan mewn gwleidyddiaeth sy'n pardduo, yn ensynio ac yn ystumio.

**Kirsty Williams:** I am sorry, I did not realise that anything that I said was a smear or an innuendo. However, I fear that in terms of tackling waste, perhaps you also regard small rural schools as a waste of public resources. That is certainly not what we in the Welsh Liberal Democrats believe.

The Conservatives in Wales have signed up to the three points of a campaign being run by a newspaper to cut waiting times to the same levels as those in England by 2006. I believe that that is equally as damaging to the trust that people have in politicians as the failure of the Labour Government to deliver. This is shameless populism when the facts suggest that Labour's mismanagement will not be sorted out that quickly. This will lead to further damage to people's trust in politicians. Wishing and hoping should not be the tools of responsible politicians in any party in Wales. David is the first in the Conservative Party to admit to previous failings of Tory policy, but I am afraid that, in the Conservative Assembly group, he is the first and the last. That reflects my continuing fear about what would happen if the Conservative Party got its hands on public services in Wales.

**William Graham:** I assure all previous speakers that the Conservatives do not intend to cut public services. Our clear manifesto commitments are to match all of Labour's existing promises and to save money. Anyone who has been involved, at any time, with a large organisation will know that there is always significant waste that can be correctly identified and cut, with money saved as a result.

4.30 p.m.

My remarks today concern how I should answer a constituent who went to hospital to have an examination of the ulcers on his foot. However, I have time to highlight only one

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, nid oeddwn wedi sylweddoli bod unrhyw beth a ddywedais yn pardduo nac yn ensynio mewn unrhyw fod. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn ofni o ran mynd i'r afael â gwastraff, efallai eich bod chithau hefyd yn gweld ysgolion bach gwledig yn wastraff ar adnoddau cyhoeddus. Yn sicr nid dyna mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n ei gredu.

Mae'r Ceidwadwyr yng Nghymru wedi cytuno â thri phwynt ymgyrch sy'n cael ei rhedeg gan bapur newydd i ostwng amseroedd aros i'r un lefel â'r rhai yn Lloegr erbyn 2006. Yr wyf yn credu bod hyn yr un mor niweidiol i'r ymddiriedaeth sydd gan bobl mewn gwleidyddion ag yw methiant y Llywodraeth Lafur i gyflawni. Ymgais ddigywilydd yw hyn i fod yn boblogaidd pan fo'r feithiau'n awgrymu na fydd camreoli Llafur yn cael ei ddatrys mor gyflym â hynny. Bydd hyn yn arwain at ddifrod pellach i ymddiriedaeth pobl mewn gwleidyddion. Ni ddylai dymuno a gobeithio fod ymhlih arfau unrhyw wleidyddion cyfrifol mewn unrhyw blaid yng Nghymru. David yw'r cyntaf yn y Blaid Geidwadol i gyfaddef methiannau blaenorol polisiau Torïaidd, ond mae arnaf ofn, yng ngrŵp Ceidwadwyr y Cynulliad, mai ef yw'r cyntaf a'r olaf. Mae hynny'nadlewyrchu'r ofn cyson sydd gennyf ynglŷn â'r hyn a fyddai'n digwydd pe bai'r Blaid Geidwadol yn cael ei dwylo ar y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.

**William Graham:** Gallaf sicrhau pob un o'r siaradwyr blaenorol nad yw'r Ceidwadwyr yn bwriadu cwtogi ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus. Yr ymrwymiadau eglur yn ein maniffesto yw gwireddu holl addewidion presennol Llafur ac arbed arian. Bydd unrhyw un sydd wedi bod yn gysylltiedig, ar ryw adeg neu'i gilydd, â sefydliad mawr yn gwybod bod yno wastraff sylweddol bob amser y gellir ei ganfod yn iawn a'i dorri, gydag arian yn cael ei arbed o ganlyniad.

Mae fy sylwadau heddiw yn ymwneud â sut y dylwn ateb etholwr a aeth i'r ysbyty i gael archwilio wlserau ar ei droed. Fodd bynnag, amser i dynnu sylw at un mater yn unig sydd

issue, namely an e-mail that I received a couple of weeks ago from nurses in Swansea. I quote directly from it.

'We are working under atrocious conditions at the present time, i.e. low numbers of nurses, high ratio of highly dependent patients, increasing workloads, being unable to take meal breaks and never finishing on time at the end of a shift. Morale is at an all time low, vacancies are not being filled and staff are looking for work elsewhere....Due to the low number of nurses working on the ward, patients' lives are increasingly being put at risk and the nursing staff are becoming increasingly frustrated at not being able to provide the high standard of care that they are trained to deliver. Sickness levels are rising due to nurses working long hours and working extra shifts (without being able to take time back). When help is asked from the management to try to alleviate the situation, they appear to be totally unconcerned about the situation and are only concerned with waiting lists and increasing the throughput of patients.'

That is directly from the horse's mouth; those are the words of our hardworking nurses. A recent, independent NHS management review in Swansea also concluded that 31 out of 74 of the wards in Swansea's two main hospitals, Singleton and Morriston, have dangerously low staffing levels. That backs up the comments made by the nursing staff in that e-mail.

I conclude by saying that we have had all the talk about nursing, recruitment and retention, pay and conditions and flexible working and, despite spending over £50 million on private agency nurses, our hospital wards remain chronically understaffed and our nurses demoralised, stressed and exhausted. Despite the talk and various initiatives over the life of the Assembly, our nurses are at breaking point. That was the subject of that e-mail that I received just two weeks ago: 'Nurses reaching breaking point'. So, what are we doing about it, Minister?

**Lisa Francis:** To pick up where my colleague, David Melding, left off, public services must be comprehensive and

gennyf, sef e-bost a dderbyniais wythnos neu ddwy yn ôl oddi wrth nyrssyn Abertawe. Dyfynnaf ohono'n uniongyrchol.

Yr ydym yn gweithio dan amodau ofnadwy ar hyn o bryd, h.y. niferoedd isel o nyrssys, cymhareb uchel o gleifion dibynnol iawn, beichiau gwaith cynyddol, methu cymryd egwyl i fwyta a byth yn gorffen ar amser ar ddiwedd shifft. Mae'r ys�ryd yn is nag a fu erioed, nid yw swyddi gwag yn cael eu llenwi ac mae'r staff yn chwilio am waith yn rhywle arall... Oherwydd nifer isel y nyrssys sydd yn gweithio ar y ward, peryglir bywydau cleifion fwyfwy ac mae'r staff nyrssio'n mynd yn fwyfwy rhwystredig o fethu darparu'r safon uchel o ofal y maent wedi'u hyfforddi i'w darparu. Mae lefelau salwch yn codi wrth i nyrssys weithio oriau maith a gweithio shifftiau ychwanegol (heb allu hawlio amser yn ôl). Pan ofynnir am help gan y rheolwyr i geisio lliniaru'r sefyllfa, ymddangosant yn gwbl ddifater ynglŷn â'r sefyllfa a'u hunig bryder yw rhestrau aros a symud cleifion drwodd yn gyflymach.

Daw hynny'n syth o lygad y ffynnon; dyna eiriau ein nyrssys diwyd. Daeth adolygiad annibynnol diweddar ar reolaeth y GIG yn Abertawe hefyd i'r casgliad bod lefelau staffio peryglus o isel mewn 31 allan o 74 o'r wardiau yn nau brif ysbty Abertawe, Singleton a Threforys. Mae hynny'n ategu'r sylwadau a wnaethpwyd gan y staff nyrssio yn yr e-bost hwnnw.

I gloi, dywedaf ein bod wedi cael yr holl sôn am nyrssio, reciwtio a chadw staff, tâl ac amodau gwaith a gweithio hyblyg, ac, er gwario dros £50 miliwn ar nyrssys o asiantaethau preifat, mae wardiau ein hysbytai'n dal i fod yn ddifrifol brin o staff ac mae ein nyrssys wedi digalonni, dan straen ac wedi ymlâdd. Er gwaethaf y siarad a'r amryfal fentrau yn ystod oes y Cynulliad, mae ein nyrssys wedi cyrraedd pen eu tennyn. Dyna oedd testun yr e-bost hwnnw a gefais bythefnos yn ôl: Nyrssys yn cyrraedd pen eu tennyn. Felly, beth yr ydym yn ei wneud ynghylch hyn, Weinidog?

**Lisa Francis:** A dal ati ar yr un trywydd â'm cyd-Aelod, David Melding, rhaid i wasanaethau cyhoeddus fod yn gynhwysfawr

universal if they are to prosper in Wales. I will talk specifically about the lack of 24-hour ambulance cover in my region of Mid and West Wales. Four standby stations in Llanfyllin, Knighton, Bala and Tywyn, are still without 24-hour cover. So, what does standby mean? It means that response times to emergency night calls are delayed by 10 minutes or more. Paramedics on night-call duty have to drive to the ambulance station that they serve before they can respond to an emergency call. Cardiac arrests and road traffic accidents at night take longer to answer, especially coupled with the inadequacies that we are experiencing with GPs' out-of-hours cover. In winter, response times may be delayed even longer should staff need to de-ice frozen car windscreens in order to get to the ambulance station, where they then have to de-ice the windscreens of the ambulances. It is hardly what one would expect in the twenty-first century, is it?

The fact that the population in tourism areas trebles at certain times of year, and the impact of that, has not been taken into account. In a geographically isolated rural area, such as Tywyn, with its nearest district general hospital 30 miles away in Aberystwyth, the public has a basic right to an NHS service that provides an immediate response from an ambulance and a qualified crew. Those are not my words, but those of Dr Bishton, who lives in Tywyn in my region.

**Kirsty Williams:** Do you also agree that not only is it inequitable for the people living in those areas—and I am particularly concerned about Knighton—that they do not have access to 24-hour ambulance cover, but it is also inequitable for the staff who must work standby shifts, and who suffer discrimination with regard to their pay and conditions compared with other ambulance workers? Are you as concerned about that as I am?

**Lisa Francis:** Absolutely. They are a sterling force doing a job in terrible conditions.

Last week, I received a letter from Health

ac ar gael i bawb os ydynt am ffynnu yng Nghymru. Yr wyf am sôn yn benodol am y diffyg darpariaeth ambiwlans 24 awr yn fy rhanbarth sef Canolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru. Mae pedair Gorsaf wrth gefn yn Llanfyllin, Trefyclo, y Bala a Thywyn yn dal heb ddarpariaeth 24 awr. Felly, beth yw ystyr wrth gefn? Mae'n golygu oedi o 10 munud neu fwy mewn amserau ymateb i alwadau brys yn y nos. Rhaid i barafeddygon ar ddyletswydd galwad nos yruru i'r orsaif ambiwlans lle y gwasanaethant cyn gallu ymateb i alwad frys. Cymerir mwy o amser i ateb trawiadau ar y galon a damweiniau traffig yn y nos, yn enwedig o gyplysu hynny â'r diffygion yr ydym yn eu profi gyda darpariaeth meddygon teulu y tu allan i oriau gwaith. Yn y gaeaf, gall fod mwy byth o oedi wrth ymateb os bydd angen i'r staff glirio rhew oddi ar ffenestri eu ceir er mwyn cyrraedd yr orsaif ambiwlans, lle y bydd rhaid iddynt wedyn glirio rhew oddi ar ffenestri'r ambiwlansiau. Go brin mai dyma a ddisgwylied yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain, ai e?

Ni roddwyd ystyriaeth i'r ffaith bod y boblogaeth mewn ardaloedd twristiaeth yn treblu ar rai adegau o'r flwyddyn, ac effaith hynny. Mewn ardal wledig ddaearyddol anghysbell, fel Tywyn, y mae ei hysbyty cyffredinol agosaf 30 milltir i ffwrdd yn Aberystwyth, mae gan y cyhoedd hawl sylfaenol i wasanaeth GIG sydd yn darparu ymateb yn syth gan ambiwlans a chriw cymwys. Nid fy ngeiriau i yw'r rheini, ond geiriau Dr Bishton, sydd yn byw yn Nhywyn yn fy ardal i.

**Kirsty Williams:** A gytunwch hefyd ei bod nid yn unig yn annheg i'r bobl sydd yn byw yn yr ardaloedd hynny—ac yr wyf yn pryderu'n arbennig am Drefyclo—na allant gael darpariaeth ambiwlans 24 awr, ond ei bod hefyd yn annheg i'r staff sydd yn gorfol gweithio shifftiau aros galwad, ac sydd yn dioddef camwahaniaethu o ran eu cyflog a'u hamodau gwaith o'u cymharu â gweithwyr ambiwlans eraill? A ydych mor bryderus ynghylch hynny ag yr wyf fi?

**Lisa Francis:** Yn bendant. Maent yn weithlu rhagorol yn gwneud eu gwaith dan amodau ofnadwy.

Yr wythnos diwethaf, cefais lythyr oddi wrth

Commission Wales, informing me that research carried out in 2001 revealed that upgrading a number of standby stations would not really improve response times. I must ask myself where the author of that letter lives. More importantly, what planet is he on? Funding for the provision of ambulance cover comes from the Welsh Labour administration in the Assembly, so why does the buck not stop with the Minister? I cannot understand that. Why does the buck get passed down the line to Health Commission Wales? People in my region are desperate. They are lobbying their MPs and raising petitions. Local newspapers are running campaigns, but the somnambulists who run this Government in Wales still stumble on. Wake up!

Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru, yn dweud wrthyf fod ymchwil a gyflawnwyd yn 2001 yn dangos na fyddai uwchraddio nifer o orsafoedd wrth gefn yn gwella amserau ymateb mewn gwirionedd. Rhaid imi ofyn I mi fy hun ym mhle y mae awdur y llythyr hwnnw'n byw. Yn bwysicach, ar ba blaned y mae'n byw? Daw'r cyllid ar gyfer darparu gwasanaeth ambiwlans oddi wrth weinyddiaeth Llafur Cymru yn y Cynulliad, felly pam nad yw'r cyfrifoldeb gan y Gweinidog? Ni allaf ddeall hynny. Pam y caiff y cyfrifoldeb ei drosglwyddo i Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru? Mae pobl yn fy rhanbarth ar ben eu tennyn. Maent yn lobio eu Haelodau Seneddol ac yn trefnu deisebau. Mae papurau newydd lleol yn rhedeg ymgrychoedd, ond mae'r cysgaduriaid sydd yn rhedeg y Llywodraeth hon yng Nghymru'n dal i faglu ymlaen. Deffrowch!

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** David Melding opened this debate with the voice of the compassionate Conservative, but I wish to go beyond that voice and take our collective memory back to 1997 and the last Tory Government. In all honesty, public services in Wales at that time were demoralised and depressed; they had been dragged down by 18 years of denigration and underinvestment. That was our legacy. In 2005, what you see, in contrast to that, is not a perfect picture—and you have all provided examples of that—but, nevertheless, it is one of progressive investment in public services, delivering better public services across Wales.

There is no doubt that, as a nation, we are becoming more prosperous, sustainable, healthier and better educated. For our Government, public services are at the centre of that change. As Minister with responsibility for public services, I do not want to see those services marginalised and mocked, as they were on occasion under the Tories.

Let us look at the NHS, because there have been many references to it this afternoon. Cast your minds back, if you can bear it, to 1997. The NHS was increasingly two-tier. Undermined by the internal market, it was

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Agorodd David Melding y ddadl hon gyda llais y Ceidwadwr tosturiol, ond hoffwn fynd y tu hwnt i'r llais hwnnw ac inni i gyd gofio'n ôl i 1997 a'r Llywodraeth Doriaidd ddiwethaf. A dweud y gwir, yr oedd gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru bryd hynny'n wangalon a digalon; yr oeddent wedi'u llusgo i lawr gan 18 mlynedd o bardduo a thanfuddsoddi. Dyna a etifeddwyd gennym. Yn 2005, beth a welwch, yn wahanol i hynny, yw nid darlun perffaith—ac yr ydych i gyd wedi cynnig engrheiftiau o hynny—ond, serch hynny, mae'n ddarlun o fuddsoddi cynyddol mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, gan ddarparu gwell gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ledled Cymru.

Nid oes amheuaeth nad ydym, fel cenedl, yn mynd yn fwy llewyrchus, yn fwy cynaliadwy, yn iachach ac yn cael addysg well. I'n Llywodraeth ni, mae gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn ganolog yn y newid hwnnw. Fel y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am wasanaethau cyhoeddus, nid oes arnaf eisiau gweld y gwasanaethau hynny'n cael eu gwthio i'r ymylon a'u gwawdio, fel a ddigwyddodd ar brydiau dan y Torïaid.

Edrychwn ar y GIG, oherwydd bu sawl cyfeiriad ato y prynhawn yma. Meddyliwch yn ôl, os gallwch ddioddef hynny, i 1997. Yr oedd y GIG yn gynyddol ddwy-haen. Wedi'i danseilio gan y farchnad fewnol, yr oedd

cash-starved, under-staffed and completely ill-equipped to meet the huge increase in demand that we have seen since. Therefore, with such a legacy, turning the NHS around has been, and continues to be, a great challenge. No-one on this side of the Chamber is denying that. However, we are meeting that challenge and succeeding. One of the first critical moves required to meeting that challenge was to intervene on the training deficit that we inherited from the Tories. Unless we have good staff employed in numbers within the NHS and social care in Wales, we will not make a difference.

**Kirsty Williams rose—**

**Sue Essex:** No, I will not take an intervention, Kirsty, as I do not have much time.

Let us say now that we are employing record numbers of doctors and nurses. The number of NHS staff in Wales has risen by 19 per cent since 1997, with more than 350 hospital doctors and over 5,200 more qualified nurses in Wales over that same period. Those are important statistics. Waiting times, which you have banged on about as much as anyone else, Kirsty, are decreasing dramatically. For example, between February 2004 and 2005, the figure for 18-month waiting times for in-patient and day-case treatment had decreased by 90 per cent. That is a huge fall, showing how we are moving on this, and is a clear sign that the investment drive is paying off.

Nine out of 10 people come into contact with the NHS through the primary healthcare system. That is why it is important to commit ourselves to a policy of ensuring 24-hour access to a member of the primary healthcare team, and we are on track to deliver that by April 2006. We care passionately about health inequalities in Wales, which is why we are making dramatic interventions to try to remove those inequalities. Critically, death rates are declining and life expectancy in Wales is increasing.

Education is a huge success story, and

wedi'i amddifadu o arian, nid oedd wedi'i staffio'n ddigonol ac yr oedd yn gwbl amharod i ateb y cynnydd enfawr yn y galw a welwyd oddi ar hynny. Felly, gyda'r fath etifeddiaeth, bu gwrthdroi ffawd y GIG yn her fawr, ac mae'n dal i fod. Nid oes neb ar yr ochr hon i'r Siambra yn gwadu hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn ateb yr her honno ac yn llwyddo. Un o'r camau allweddol cyntaf a oedd yn angenrehiol i ateb yr her honno oedd gweithredu ar y diffyg hyfforddi a etifeddasom oddi wrth y Torïaid. Oni fydd gennym niferoedd o staff da yn gyflogedig o fewn y GIG ac ym maes gofal cymdeithasol yng Nghymru, ni wnawn wahaniaeth.

**Kirsty Williams a gododd—**

**Sue Essex:** Na, ni dderbyniaf ymyriad, Kirsty, gan nad oes gennyf lawer o amser.

Gadewch inni ddweud yn awr ein bod yn cyflogi mwy o feddygon a nyrssyng erioed. Mae nifer staff y GIG yng Nghymru wedi codi 19 y cant ers 1997, gyda mwy na 350 o feddygon ysbytai a thros 5,200 yn fwy o nyrssyng cymwysedig yng Nghymru yn ystod yr un cyfnod. Mae'r rhain yn ystadegau pwysig. Mae amserau aros, yr ydych wedi rhygnu ymlaen amdanynt gymaint â neb arall, Kirsty, yn lleihau'n ddramatig. Er enghraifft, rhwng Chwefror 2004 a 2005, bu gostyngiad o 90 y cant yn y niferoedd y gorfu iddynt aros 18 mis am driniaeth cleifion mewnol a chleifion dydd. Mae hynny'n ostyngiad enfawr, sydd yn dangos y modd yr ydym yn symud ar hyn, ac mae'n arwydd clir bod yr ymgrych fuddsoddi'n talu.

Daw naw o bob 10 o bobl i gysylltiad â'r GIG drwy'r system gofal iechyd sylfaenol. Dyna pam y mae'n bwysig ymrwymo i bolisi o sicrhau mynediad 24 awr at aelod o'r tîm gofal iechyd sylfaenol, ac yr ydym ar y ffordd i gyflawni hynny erbyn Ebrill 2006. Yr ydym yn teimlo'n angerddol ynghylch anghydraddoldebau iechyd yng Nghymru, a dyna pam yr ydym yn ymyrryd mewn modd dramatig i geisio dileu'r anghydraddoldebau hynny. Yn allweddol, mae cyfraddau marwolaeth ar i lawr a gall pobl ddisgwyl byw'n hwy yng Nghymru.

Mae addysg yn stori lwyddiannus dros ben,

nothing that has been said this afternoon can knock that success. Those are not only our words, but also those of the chief inspector of education, who has recognised the achievements and great improvements made in education. Class sizes have dropped to an historic low, and there are more teachers than ever before with the best early training in the UK. Only in Wales have class sizes reduced in the primary sector. There is a new curriculum for three to seven-year-olds, which is considered a world beater. These are massive improvements in the public education system in Wales. It would be a lie to say otherwise, and would be an offence to the improvements witnessed in the health sector. Further education is critical to making improvements in Wales. There has been a 72 per cent increase in the number of students in full-time education over three years in Wales.

4.40 p.m.

I noticed that none of you mentioned the economy. You do not want to do so, because it is doing so well; it is a tremendous success story. [Interruption.] We mention Digby Jones, because he is complimentary about what we are doing in Wales. Employment has risen by 122,000 since the beginning of the Assembly. Claimant count unemployment has fallen 41 per cent since 1999 to levels not seen in 30 years.

**Helen Mary Jones rose—**

**Sue Essex:** I do not have much time left in which to speak, Helen Mary.

William mentioned crime, but crime rates in Wales continue to fall. The chances of being a victim in England and Wales are at their lowest level for 20 years, so let us get the facts right.

On the difficult issue of waste management, over the last two years, we have doubled our recycling and composting rates in Wales. Carwyn Jones announced a further £93 million for local authorities this afternoon.

ac ni all dim a ddywedwyd y prynhawn yma fychanu'r llwyddiant hwnnw. Nid ein geiriau ni yn unig yw'r rheini, ond geiriau'r prif arolygydd addysg yntau, sydd wedi cydnabod yr hyn a gyflawnwyd a'r gwelliannau mawr a wnaethwyd ym myd addysg. Mae maint dosbarthiadau wedi cwympo i lefel hanesyddol isel, ac mae mwy o athrawon nag erioed o'r blaen, gyda'r hyfforddiant cynnar gorau yn y DU. Dim ond yng Nghymru y mae maint dosbarthiadau wedi lleihau yn y sector cynradd. Mae cwricwlwm newydd i blant tair i saith mlwydd oed, a ystyrir y gorau yn y byd. Mae'r rhain yn welliannau aruthrol yn y system addysg gyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Celwydd fyddai dweud fel arall, a thramgydd i'r gwelliannau a welwyd yn y sector iechyd. Mae addysg bellach yn allweddol i wneud gwelliannau yng Nghymru. Bu cynnydd o 72 y cant yn nifer y myfyrwyr mewn addysg lawnamsor dros dair blynedd yng Nghymru.

Sylwaf na chrybwylodd neb ohonoch yr economi. Nid oes arnoch eisai gwneud hynny, oherwydd y mae'n gwneud mor dda; mae'n llwyddiant ysgubol. [Torri ar draws.] Soniwn am Digby Jones, am ei fod yn llawn clod i'r hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud yng Nghymru. Mae cyflogaeth wedi codi 122,000 ers dechrau'r Cynulliad. Mae nifer y rhai sydd yn hawlio budd-dal diweithdra wedi disgyn 41 y cant ers 1999 i lefelau nas gwelwyd ers 30 mlynedd.

**Helen Mary Jones a gododd—**

**Sue Essex:** Nid oes gennyf lawer o amser ar ôl i siarad, Helen Mary.

Soniodd William am droseddu, ond mae cyfraddau troseddu yng Nghymru'n dal i gwympo. Mae'r tebygrwydd o ddioddef trosedd yng Nghymru a Lloegr ar ei isaf ers 20 mlynedd, felly gadewch inni gael y ffeithiau'n iawn.

Ynglŷn â chwestiwn anodd rheoli gwastraff, dros y ddwy flynedd ddiwethaf yr ydym wedi dyblu ein cyfraddau ailgylchu a chompostio yng Nghymru. Cyhoeddodd Carwyn Jones £93 miliwn arall i'r awdurdodau lleol y prynhawn yma.

Ieuan mentioned public transport, and I am delighted and proud that we will reopen the Vale of Glamorgan railway line in June.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I share the Minister's delight about the Ebbw Vale railway line, but what about the connections between north and south Wales, which you always fail to mention? When did you last travel on that service? It is no better than it was in 1999 when you assumed office.

**Sue Essex:** I was referring to the Vale of Glamorgan line, which will reopen in June, but the Ebbw Vale line will also be reopening. We have invested money in the north-south Wales line, and no-one is saying that it is perfect, but the frequency of the service has improved.

I will give a snapshot of how things are going in the Carmarthenshire local authority area: less than 1 per cent of infant school classes have more than 30 pupils; almost 70 per cent of those eligible have received a concessionary fare pass; 99 per cent of the streets are free of litter; nearly 80 per cent of children in care leave school with qualifications; more than 250 local businesses receive council support and have seen productivity increase; street lighting is working, and the authority has reduced its energy bills. These are real, tangible improvements in public services, which people in Wales appreciate and care about, but all the opposition parties can do is denigrate what is happening. I have a long list of things to mention, but I will not read it out, because Lorraine did a wonderful job of reminding us about the practical changes.

To return to the core point, I remind you that this is a Conservative Party nominated debate. In case anyone thinks that it will all be nicey-nicey under the Tories, behind the compassionate face of David Melding lies the real Tory face of Michael Howard. Beware the promise of £35 billion of cuts. For us, value for money is an essential part of developing public services; I am afraid that,

Soniodd Ieuan am gludiant cyhoeddus, ac yr wyl wrth fy modd ac yn falch y byddwn yn ailagor rheilffordd Bro Morgannwg ym Mehefin.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Rhannaf lawenydd y Gweinidog ynghylch rheilffordd Glyn Ebwy, ond beth am y cysylltiadau rhwng y Gogledd a'r De, nad ydych byth yn sôn amdanynt? Pa bryd y teithiasoch ddiwethaf ar y gwasanaeth hwnnw? Nid yw'n ddim gwell nag a oedd yn 1999 pan ddaethoch i rym.

**Sue Essex:** Cyfeirio at reilffordd Bro Morgannwg yr oeddwn, a fydd yn ailagor ym Mehefin, ond bydd lein Glyn Ebwy'n ailagor hefyd. Yr ydym wedi buddsoddi arian yn y rheilffordd rhwng y Gogledd a'r De, ac nid oes neb yn dweud ei bod yn berffaith, ond mae'r gwasanaeth ar gael yn amlach.

Rhoddaf ddarlun sydyn o'r ffordd y mae pethau'n mynd yn ardal awdurdod lleol Sir Gaerfyrddin: mae gan lai nag 1 y cant o ddisbarthiadau ysgolion babanod fwy na 30 o ddisgyblion; mae bron 70 y cant o'r rhai sydd yn gymwys wedi cael tocynnau teithio rhad; mae 99 y cant o'r strydoedd yn ddisbriel; mae bron 80 y cant o'r plant mewn gofal yn gadael yr ysgol gyda chymwysterau; mae dros 250 o fusnesau lleol yn cael cymorth gan y cyngor ac wedi cynyddu eu cynhyrchiant; mae goleuadau'r strydoedd yn gweithio, ac mae'r awdurdod wedi cwtogi ei filiau ynni. Mae'r rhain yn welliannau go iawn, sylweddol mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, y mae pobl yng Nghymru'n eu gwerthfawrogi ac yn malio amdanynt, ond y cwbl y gall y gwrthbleidiau ei wneud yw difrifio'r hyn sydd yn digwydd. Mae gennyl restr faith o bethau i'w crybwyl, ond ni wnaf ei darllen, oherwydd gwnaeth Lorraine waith gwych yn ein hatgoffa am y newidiadau ymarferol.

A dychwelyd at y pwyt craidd, fe'ch atgoffaf mai dadl a enwebwyd gan y Blaid Geidwadol yw hon. Rhag ofn bod neb yn tybio y bydd popeth yn neis-neis dan y Torfaid, y tu ôl i wyneb tosturiol David Melding mae wyneb Torfaidd go iawn Michael Howard. Gocheler rhag yr addewid o £35 biliwn o doriadau. I ni, mae gwerth am arian yn rhan hanfodol o ddatblygu

for the Conservatives, there is another agenda. Their sums do not add up; it is a choice between maintaining services and making tax cuts for the better off. Which side will the Conservatives be on? Are you thinking what I am thinking?

We now see that the Conservatives are offering a very dangerous change of direction for public services in Wales. We will see the most right-wing, ideological, class-based approach to public services since the welfare state was established.

I am proud of the direction in which we are moving in terms of public services. I never want to be complacent and say that everything is right, but the public knows and trusts us, as a Labour administration, to deliver public services.

**Nick Bourne:** That was a robust performance, but unfortunately not one bogged down by the facts. The Welsh Labour website asks ‘What makes you proud of Wales?’ I thought to myself ‘I have plenty of time and love a great mystery’ but, unsurprisingly, I found nothing whatsoever on health or public services. There is nothing on there on public services at all, despite Lorraine Barrett’s best efforts to convince us that everything is brilliant, and that Labour is proud of public services. I am surprised that that did not feature on the Labour website—I expect that it will now that I have drawn attention to it.

The people of Wales are proud of our nurses, doctors and teachers, but are ashamed of the conditions that they have to put up with. What about the state of the health service and the state of waiting lists? The Minister did not make any great play of that, although she had the brass neck to suggest that the figures are now reducing dramatically. Of course they are dramatically down—they are down from the high that they went up to under a Welsh Labour Government. The Welsh Labour Government sent those figures up to a dramatic high. Let us move away from the idea that spending money is a good in itself.

gwasanaethau cyhoeddus; mae arnaf ofn mai agenda arall sydd gan y Ceidwadwyr. Nid yw eu symiau'n gwneud synnwyr; mae'n ddewis rhwng cynnal gwasanaethau a rhoi toriadau treth i'r rhai sydd yn well eu byd. Ar ba ochr y bydd y Ceidwadwyr? A ydych chi'n meddwl yr hyn yr wyf fi'n ei feddwl?

Gwelwn yn awr fod y Ceidwadwyr yn cynnig newid cyfeiriad peryglus iawn i wasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Cawn weld yr agwedd fwyaf adain dde, ideolegol, a seiliedig ar ddosbarth, at wasanaethau cyhoeddus ers sefydlu'r wladwriaeth les.

Yr wyf yn falch o'r cyfeiriad yr ydym yn symud iddo o ran y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Nid ddymunwn fyfod yn hunanfodlon a dweud bod popeth yn dda, ond mae'r cyhoedd yn ein hadnabod ac yn ymddiried ynom, fel gweinyddiaeth Lafur, i ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr oedd hynny'n berfformiad grymus, ond ysywaeth, nid oedd yn un yn amharwyd arno'n ormodol gan y ffeithiau. Gofynnna gwefan Plaid Lafur Cymru 'Beth sydd yn eich gwneud yn falch o Gymru?'. Meddyliais wrthyf fy hun, 'Mae gennyl ddigonedd o amser ac yr wyf wrth fy modd gyda stori ddirgelwch dda', ond nid yw'n syndod na welais ddim byd o gwbl am iechyd na gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Nid oes dim arni am wasanaethau cyhoeddus o gwbl, er gwaethaf holl ymdrechion Lorraine Barrett i'n darbwyllo i gyd fod popeth yn wych, a bod Llafur yn falch o'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Yr wyf yn synnu nad oedd hynny ar wefan Llafur—mae'n debyg y bydd yno yn awr, gan fy mod wedi tynnu sylw ato.

Mae pobl Cymru yn falch o'n nysys, ein meddygon a'n hathrawon, ond mae arnynt gywilydd o'r amodau y mae'n rhaid iddynt ymdopi â hwyl. Beth am gyflwr y gwasanaeth iechyd a chyflwr y rhestrau aros? Ni soniodd y Gweinidog lawer am hynny, er bod ganddi'r wyneb i awgrymu bod y ffigurau erbyn hyn yn dod i lawr yn ddramatig. Wrth gwrs eu bod i lawr yn ddramatig—maent yn is na'r lefel uchel a gyraeddasant dan Lywodraeth Llafur Cymru. Llywodraeth Llafur Cymru oedd yn gyfrifol am godi'r ffigurau i'r lefel uchel ddramatig honno. Gadewch inni gefnu ar y syniad bod gwario

It is not. We are interested in outcomes, not inputs. If you look at it on that basis, you have failed the people of Wales on the health service. Ask Kim Howells, Jon Owen Jones, or indeed Brian Gibbons why I have to specify dates when requesting correspondence in relation to Labour MPs complaining about the state of the health service: it is because there is so much of it. [Interruption.] Well, issue the correspondence then. There are file loads. Why did you have to ask for the request to be confined to a particular date? The answer is that there is so much of it. We all know that that is the case.

The socialist centralist system that you believe in has not delivered for the people of Wales. Red tape, bureaucracy and Government interference is stifling progress. The truth is that in Wales, the standard of our national health service has deteriorated at an alarming rate. That is nothing to do with the people who work in it, they do a fantastic job whatever their level within that service. However, in Wales, one person in 10 is on a hospital waiting list. That was not the case in 1997 or even in 1999, but it is the case now.

**Peter Black:** We have heard a lot about waste in speeches made by Conservative Members. Do you think that one waste of public money that we could do away with straight away is paying three Assembly Members to campaign for the general election, when they should be in this Plenary meeting?

**Nick Bourne:** We have already heard from the Liberal Democrats regarding the need—[ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘Answer the question.’] I am about to. We have already heard from the Liberal Democrats on the need to prevent shameless populism, and I am all in favour of that. However, if you do not believe that there is a general election going on, then I am surprised that we have heard mention of Sedgefield and Dorset South, which, when I last looked in my atlas, were not parts of Wales.

arian yn beth da ynddo’i hun. Nid yw’n beth da. Mae gennym ddiddordeb yn y canlyniad, nid yn y mewnbwn. Os edrychwch arno o’r safbwyt hwnnw, yr ydych wedi siomi pobl Cymru yng nghyswllt y gwasanaeth iechyd. Gofynnwch i Kim Howells, Jon Owen Jones, neu yn wir i Brian Gibbons pam y mae’n rhaid i mi nodi’r dyddiadau’n benodol wrth ofyn am ohebiaeth yngylch AS Llafur yn cwyno am gyflwr y gwasanaeth iechyd: oherwydd bod cymaint ohoni, dyna pam. [Torri ar draws.] Wel, rhyddewch yr ohebiaeth ynteu. Mae llond y ffeiliau. Pam y mae’n rhaid i chi ofyn am i’r cais gael ei gyfyngu i ddyddiad penodol? Yr ateb yw oherwydd bod cymaint ohoni. Yr ydym i gyd yn gwybod mai felly y mae.

Nid yw'r system ganoliaethol sosialaidd yr ydych yn credu ynddi wedi cyflawni dros bobl Cymru. Mae tâp coch, biwrocratiaeth ac ymyrraeth gan y Llywodraeth yn tagu unrhyw gynnydd. Y gwir yw bod safon y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol, yng Nghymru, wedi dirywio yn ddychrynllyd o gyflym. Nid oes a wnelo hyn ddim â’r bobl sy’n gweithio ynddo, maent hwy’n gwneud gwaith ardderchog ar bob lefel o fewn y gwasanaeth. Fodd bynnag, yng Nghymru, mae un o bob deg ar restr aros ysbty. Nid oedd hynny’n wir yn 1997 na hyd yn oed yn 1999, ond mae’n digwydd heddiw.

**Peter Black:** Yr ydym wedi clywed llawer am wastraff mewn areithiau a wneir gan Aelodau Ceidwadol. Oni allem wneud i ffwrdd ag un ffordd o wastraffu arian cyhoeddus, a hynny’n ddi-oed, drwy beidio â thalu i dri Aelod o’r Cynulliad am ymgyrchu ar gyfer yr etholiad cyffredinol, pryd y dylent fod yn y Cyfarfod Llawn hwn?

**Nick Bourne:** Yr ydym eisoes wedi clywed gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yngylch yr angen—[AELODAU’R CYNULLIAD: ‘Atebwch y cwestiwn.’] Yr wyf ar fin gwneud hynny. Yr ydym eisoes wedi clywed gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yngylch yr angen i atal poblyddiaeth digywilydd, ac yr wyf o blaid hynny’n llwyr. Fodd bynnag, os nad ydych yn credu bod etholiad cyffredinol yn digwydd, yna yr wyf yn synnu ein bod wedi clywed am Sedgefield a De Dorset a oedd, pan edrychais yn fy atlas y tro diwethaf, y tu allan i Gymru.

**Leighton Andrews:** Let us talk about Monmouth then. [Interruption.]

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You need to refer to the motion.

**Leighton Andrews:** If you allow me to proceed, Deputy Presiding Officer, you will see that I am. Do you agree with your candidate for Monmouth, who said that we need a world-class health service, but that if you look around the world at the better health services, they are not provided using an NHS—type model?

**Nick Bourne:** What I agree with, which he has said, is that the NHS model that you are following in Wales is failing the people of Wales. I hope that you also agree with that. You will know from your postbag, as we know from ours, that the system that we have is failing the people of Wales, and you are responsible for it. Anything that we can do to improve it, certainly through the use of private sector with private money—which is what David was referring to—is worth doing.

**Kirsty Williams:** Can you guarantee that David Davies will be fighting tooth and nail to ensure that we have a vibrant NHS hospital in Abergavenny, or will David be arguing for the privatisation of services on those premises?

**Nick Bourne:** David Davies uses state healthcare just as he used the state education system. If you look at the levels of public spending under Conservative Governments, you will find that the level was just as high as it is now under Labour. You mentioned cuts; let me come to your so-called cuts. What we are proposing is to look at the level of public spending as it was in 2002, under a Labour Government, and keep it at that level. There is nothing unrealistic about that; you did it yourselves. It is just that you do not know how to operate the system.

**Leighton Andrews:** Gadewch inni siarad am Fynwy ynteu. [Torri ar draws.]

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae angen ichi gyfeirio at y cynnig.

**Leighton Andrews:** Os gadewch i mi fynd yn fy mlaen, Ddirprwy Lywydd, fe welwch fy mod yn gwneud hynny. A ydych yn cytuno â'ch ymgeisydd dros Fynwy, a ddywedodd fod arnom angen gwasanaeth iechyd o'r radd flaenaf ond, o edrych yn fydeang ar y gwasanaethau iechyd gorau, nad ydynt yn cael eu darparu drwy ddefnyddio model fel un y GIG?

**Nick Bourne:** Yr hyn yr wyf yn cytuno ag ef, fel y dywedodd, yw bod y model GIG yr ydych yn ei ddilyn yng Nghymru yn siomi pobl Cymru. Gobeithio eich bod chithau hefyd yn cytuno â hynny. Fe wyddoch yn ôl y llythyrau a gewch, fel y gwyddom yn ôl ein llythyrau ni, fod y system sydd gennym yn siomi pobl Cymru, a chi sy'n gyfrifol am hynny. Mae unrhyw beth y gallwn ei wneud i'w gwella, yn sicr drwy ddefnyddio'r sector preifat gydag arian preifat—sef yr hyn yr oedd David yn cyfeirio ato—yn werth ei wneud.

**Kirsty Williams:** A allwch roi sicrwydd y bydd David Davies yn gwneud ei orau glas i sicrhau bod gennym ysbyty GIG llwyddiannus yn y Fenni, neu a fydd David yn dadlau dros breifateiddio gwasanaethau yn yr adeilad hwnnw?

**Nick Bourne:** Mae David Davies yn defnyddio gofal iechyd y wladwriaeth fel y defnyddiodd system addysg y wladwriaeth. Os edrychwch ar lefelau gwariant cyhoeddus o dan Lywodraethau Ceidwadol, gwelwch fod y lefel yr un mor uchel ag y mae heddiw o dan Lafur. Cyfeiriasoch at doriadau; gadewch i mi ddod at y toriadau hynny fel y cyfeiriwch atynt. Yr hyn yr ydym yn ei gynnig yw edrych ar lefel y gwario fel yr oedd yn 2002, o dan Lywodraeth Lafur, a'i gadw ar y lefel honno. Nid oes dim afrealistig yngylch hynny; gwnaethoch chithau yr un fath. Y ffaith yw na wyddoch sut i weithredu'r system.

Let us look at Wales under Welsh Labour. What has happened to student debt? It is up. What has happened to student fees? They are up. What has happened to council tax? It has gone up. What has happened to small school closures? They have gone up. What has happened to violent crime? It has gone up. What has happened to taxes? They have gone up. There has been more and more waste; this could pass for complacency.

Gadewch i ni edrych ar Gymru o dan Lafur Cymru. Beth sydd wedi digwydd i ddyledion myfyrwyr? Maent wedi cynyddu. Beth sydd wedi digwydd i ffioedd myfyrwyr? Maent wedi cynyddu. Beth sydd wedi digwydd i'r dreth gyngor? Mae wedi cynyddu. Beth sydd wedi digwydd i gau ysgolion bach? Mae mwy yn cau. Beth sydd wedi digwydd i droseddu treisgar? Mae wedi cynyddu. Beth sydd wedi digwydd i drethi? Maent wedi cynyddu. Cafwyd mwy a mwy o wastraff; gallai'n hawdd awgrymu hunanfodlonrwydd.

**Jenny Randerson:** I am entertained, Nick, by your repetition of Michael Howard's stunt at the Prime Minister's question time. Do you agree that it would be more effective if you had more than a couple of Conservative Assembly Members present to shout out?

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae'n ddifyr eich clywed, Nick, yn ailadrodd stŷnt Michael Howard yn ystod sesiwn holi'r Prif Weinidog. A ydych yn cytuno y byddai'n fwy effeithiol pe bai gennych un neu ddau o Aelodau Ceidwadol o'r Cynulliad yn bresennol i weiddi hefyd?

**Nick Bourne:** I think that if you do a head-count, you will find that even with some of our Members missing we still have more than you have.

**Nick Bourne:** Os ewch ati i gyfrif pennau, er bod rhai o'n Haelodau yn absennol, credaf y gwelwch fod gennym fwy na chi serch hynny.

Government accountability is absent; we have more and more waste, broken promises and spin. On 5 May we will see Labour MPs from your constituencies losing their seats to Members from this side of the Chamber, and we will then see judgment passed on your shabby record.

Mae atebolrwydd y Llywodraeth yn absennol; mae gennym fwy a mwy o wastraff, addewidion wedi eu torri, a sbin. Ar 5 Mai byddwn yn gweld ASau Llafur o'ch etholaethau chi yn colli eu seddi i Aelodau ar yr ochr yma i'r Siambwr, a bydd yn Ddydd y Farn ar eich perfformiad gwael.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 1: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

- Black, Peter
- Bourne, Nick
- Burnham, Eleanor
- Davies, Glyn
- Davies, Janet
- Davies, Jocelyn
- Francis, Lisa
- German, Michael
- Graham, William
- Isherwood, Mark
- Jones, Alun Ffred
- Jones, Helen Mary
- Jones, Jeuan Wyn
- Jones, Laura Anne
- Lloyd, David
- Melding, David
- Randerson, Jenny
- Ryder, Janet

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

- Andrews, Leighton
- Barrett, Lorraine
- Bates, Mick
- Butler, Rosemary
- Chapman, Christine
- Cuthbert, Jeff
- Davidson, Jane
- Davies, Andrew
- Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
- Essex, Sue
- Gibbons, Brian
- Gregory, Janice
- Griffiths, John
- Gwyther, Christine
- Hart, Edwina
- Hutt, Jane
- Idris Jones, Denise
- James, Irene

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 35.*  
*Amendment 2: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 35.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.*  
*Amendment 3: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:

The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
 Amendment 4: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun

Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 8, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 43.*  
*Amendment 5: For 8, Abstain 0, Against 43.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM2375): O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.*  
*Motion (NDM2375): For 22, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:

The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion defeated.*

## **Adroddiad Blynnyddol Arolygiaeth Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru** **The Annual Report of the Social Services Inspectorate for Wales**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Dewisais welliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales notes the report of the Chief Inspector of Social Services ‘Social Services in Wales 2003—04’.* (NDM2376)

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn nodi adroddiad Prif Arolygydd y Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ‘Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yng Nghymru 2003—04’.* (NDM2376)

The report was published in December 2004 and has already been discussed by the Health and Social Services Committee at its meeting on 2 February. That provided an opportunity to consider the performance of social services authorities across Wales and the important contribution that these services make to the lives of vulnerable people. It is important that

Cyhoeddwyd yr adroddiad yn Rhagfyr 2004 ac mae eisoes wedi'i draffod gan y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn ei gyfarfod ar 2 Chwefror. Yr oedd hynny'n gyfle i ystyried perfformiad yr awdurdodau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ledled Cymru a'r cyfraniad pwysig a wneir gan y gwasanaethau hyn i fywydau pobl sy'n agored i niwed.

the whole Assembly has the opportunity today to share in this wider picture of care provided by social services.

I will set out the background to the chief inspector's report. The chief inspector plays a vital role in the Assembly in providing an authoritative and independent view of the state of social services in Wales. In doing so, he is able to draw together information provided by all the inspectorate's work, particularly its programmes of inspections, joint reviews—which from this year will be undertaken in partnership with the Wales Audit Office—and its annual performance evaluation of each social services authority. He also draws upon this knowledge in his key role of supporting improvement action and providing the Assembly with professional advice on all social services matters. His involvement in setting targets for and monitoring progress in children's services, for example, in Cardiff and Blaenau Gwent, shows that this direct action can result in direct improvement.

The chief inspector's role underlines the important commitment by the Assembly to high-quality services for users and carers. It is also crucial to the work of the Health and Social Care Department and to me as Minister. There must be a strong, professional voice for social care, and the chief inspector provides this. I am sure that we all recognise the importance of these services. Over 140,000 people a year receive support from social services. Some 120,000 of these recipients are adults, 97,000 of whom receive services in the community, while the remainder are in residential or nursing care. Net expenditure on these services is £850 million—just over 20 per cent of all local government expenditure. Some £212 million, or 25 per cent, of this expenditure is spent on children's social services.

Social services are important local government services in their own right and often work in close partnership with other services, within and outside local

Mae'n bwysig bod gan y Cynulliad cyfan gyfle heddiw i weld y darlun mwy hwn o'r gofal a ddarperir gan y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol.

Cyflwynaf y cefndir i adroddiad y prif arolygydd. Mae'r prif arolygydd yn chwarae'r rôl hanfodol yn y Cynulliad drwy roi barn awdurdodol ac annibynnol am gyflwr y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yng Nghymru. Wrth wneud hynny, mae'n gallu dwyn ynghyd y wybodaeth a ddarperir gan holl waith yr arolygiaeth, yn enwedig ei rhaglenni arolygu, adolygiadau ar y cyd—a fydd yn cael eu cyflawni mewn partneriaeth â Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru o eleni ymlaen—a'i gwerthusiad perfformiad blynnyddol o bob awdurdod gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Mae hefyd yn defnyddio'r wybodaeth hon yn ei rôl allweddol o gefnogi gwelliannau a rhoi cyngor proffesiynol i'r Cynulliad ar bob mater yn ymwneud â'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Mae ei ran yn y gwaith o osod targedau ar gyfer gwasanaethau plant a monitro'r cynnydd, er enghraift, yng Nghaerdydd a Blaenau Gwent, yn dangos bod y gweithredu uniongyrchol hwn yn gallu arwain at welliannau uniongyrchol.

Mae'r rôl y prif arolygydd yn pwysleisio'r ymrwymiad pwysig gan y Cynulliad i ddarparu gwasanaethau o ansawdd uchel i ddefnyddwyr a gofalwyr. Mae hefyd yn greiddiol i waith yr Adran Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol ac i mi fel Gweinidog. Rhaid cael llais proffesiynol cryf dros ofal cymdeithasol, ac mae'r prif arolygydd yn rhoi hyn. Ryw'n siŵr ein bod i gyd yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd y gwasanaethau hyn. Mae dros 140,000 o bobl y flwyddyn yn derbyn cymorth gan y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Mae tua 120,000 o'r rhain yn oedolion, 97,000 ohonynt yn derbyn gwasanaethau yn y gymuned, a'r gweddill yn derbyn gofal preswyl neu nrysio. Mae'r gwariant net ar y gwasanaethau hyn yn £850 miliwn—ychydig dros 20 y cant o holl wariant llywodraeth leol. Mae tua £212 miliwn, neu 25 y cant, o'r gwariant hwn yn cael ei wario ar wasanaethau cymdeithasol i blant.

Mae'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn wasanaethau llywodraeth leol pwysig ynddynt eu hunain ac yn aml yn gweithio mewn partneriaeth agos gyda gwasanaethau

government. One important partnership is the work with the health service. Social services and local government in general play a vital role in bringing about a new configuration of health and social care to support and maintain people in the community, or to return them quickly and safely to the community wherever possible. The role of local health boards, where health, local authority and voluntary sector partners come together, will also be crucial in bringing this about.

Social services also often act as an important champion and service provider for those who have the weakest voices in our community—children at risk, frail and vulnerable adults, and those with a disability. These groups are often least able to speak for themselves and, even though they do not always shout the loudest, it is vital that we ensure that their needs do not go unheard.

A major objective for me as Minister, for which I am sure I will receive your general support, is to see that social services' performance in Wales continues to improve. The chief inspector in his report delivers a forthright and critical message, but seeks to do so in a way that will encourage this process of improvement. He recognises the efforts that local authorities are making to improve services, and their progress in doing so. However, he also states clearly that the pace of improvement must quicken.

The report identifies examples of good practice that others can learn from in achieving the improvement that we all want to see. It acknowledges the considerable efforts made by authorities to improve performance and develop their systems of performance management. Such improvement, through these important building blocks, is now being put in place, and the focus of work must now turn this into an effective service in which outcomes for people become the most important priority.

Progress is to be seen with the improvement in performance in such regards as the

eraill, oddi mewn ac oddi allan i lywodraeth leol. Un bartneriaeth bwysig yw'r gwaith gyda'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a llywodraeth leol, yn gyffredinol, yn chwarae rôl hanfodol wrth gyflwyno datblygiadau newydd ym maes iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol i gynnal a darparu cymorth i bobl yn y gymuned, neu i'w dychwelyd yn ddiymdroi ac yn ddiogel i'r gymuned pryd bynnag y bo hynny'n bosibl. Bydd rôl y byrddau iechyd lleol, lle y daw'r partneriaid ym meysydd iechyd, yr awdurdod lleol a'r sector gwirfoddol at ei gilydd, hefyd yn greiddiol i sicrhau hyn.

Mae'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol hefyd yn gweithredu fel eiriolwyr a darparwyr gwasanaeth pwysig i'r rhai sydd â'r lleisiau gwannaf yn ein cymdeithas—plant mewn perygl, oedolion bregus ac agored i niwed, a phobl sydd ag anabledd. Y grwpiau hyn yn aml yw'r rhai lleiaf abl i siarad drostynt eu hunain ac, er nad ydynt yn gweiddi uchaf o hyd, mae'n hollbwysig ein bod yn sicrhau bod eu hanghenion yn cael llais.

Un o'r prif amcanion gennyf fel Gweinidog, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn cefnogi hyn, yw gweld perfformiad y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yng Nghymru yn parhau i wella. Mae'r prif arolygydd yn ei adroddiad yn cyflwyno neges glir a hollbwysig, ond yn ceisio gwneud hynny mewn modd a fydd yn hybu'r broses hon o wella. Mae'n cydnabod yr ymdrechion a wneir gan awdurdodau lleol i wella'r gwasanaethau, a'u cynnydd wrth wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae hefyd yn nodi'n glir fod yn rhaid symud yn gynt o ran y gwelliannau hyn.

Mae'r adroddiad yn nodi enghreifftiau o arferion da y gall eraill ddysgu oddi wrthynt i gyflawni'r gwelliannau yr ydym oll am eu gweld. Mae'n cydnabod yr ymdrechion glew a wneir gan awdurdodau i wella perfformiad a datblygu eu systemau o reoli perfformiad. Mae'r gwelliannau hyn, drwy'r blociau adeiladu pwysig hyn, bellach yn cael eu rhoi ar waith, a rhaid i ffocws y gwaith droi hyn yn awr yn wasanaeth effeithiol lle y mae'r canlyniadau i bobl yn dod yn brif flauenoriaeth.

Gellir gweld cynnydd gyda gwella perfformiad mewn meysydd megis canran y

percentage of first placements for looked-after children that begin with a care plan, the drop in the rates of delayed transfers of care for people over 75, and the rate of older people being helped to live at home. However, the impetus needs to increase, and there are areas of concern that need to be tackled. The Health and Social Services Committee was particularly concerned that work is needed to understand the reasons behind the increase, from 3,000 to nearly 4,500, in the number of looked-after children in Wales between 1998 and 2004. The committee also expressed its view on the need to reshape services and develop preventative strategies to reduce the need to take children into care in the first place.

5.00 p.m.

The Social Services Inspectorate for Wales is leading in this work to enable local authorities to deliver these objectives and to continue to improve their practice. The chief inspector sets out themes for improvement that he has identified before, and considers the need to make progress at a faster rate. We need better assessment and care management so that people receive timely service. We need to listen to users and carers more consistently. We need a greater focus on helping people to maximise their independence. Services need to be more reliable, responsive and consistent, and of a consistently high quality, and we need to have enhanced and robust commissioning systems in place with a focus on delivering these high-quality services. It is for this reason that I cannot support the Liberal Democrat amendment, as it does not fully acknowledge the key work that is taking place in these areas, even though I fully understand the reason for the concern expressed in the amendment.

I pay tribute to social services staff at all levels. The chief inspector recognises their dedication and commitment to the delivery of good services, often under difficult circumstances. Quality staff are a prerequisite to the delivery of quality services. Over 70,000 staff work in the social care sector, with some 54 per cent of those working in the private or voluntary sector. There is an

lleoliadau cyntaf i blant sy'n derbyn gofal sy'n dechrau gyda chynllun gofal, y gosyngiad yn nifer y bobl dros 75 oed sy'n profi oedi gyda throsglwyddo eu gofal, a nifer y bobl hŷn sy'n cael eu helpu i fyw yn eu cartrefi eu hunain. Fodd bynnag, mae angen i'r impetws gynyddu, ac mae angen rhoi sylw i rai meysydd sy'n achosi pryder. Yr oedd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn arbennig o bryderus bod angen ymgymryd â gwaith er mwyn gallu deall y rhesymau dros y cynnydd a fu, o 3,000 i bron 4,500, yn nifer y plant sy'n derbyn gofal yng Nghymru rhwng 1998 a 2004. Bu i'r pwyllgor fynegi barn hefyd am yr angen i aildrefnu gwasanaethau a datblygu strategaethau ataliol i leihau'r angen i roi plant o dan ofal yn y lle cyntaf.

Mae Arolygiaeth Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru yn arwain y gwaith hwn er mwyn galluogi'r awdurdodau lleol i gyflawni'r amcanion hyn a dal i wella eu harferion. Mae'r prif arolygydd yn nodi themâu ar gyfer gwella y mae wedi eu dynodi o'r blaen, ac yn ystyried yr angen i wneud cynnydd yn gynt. Mae arnom angen gwell asesu a rheoli ar ofal fel y caiff pobl wasanaeth amserol. Rhaid inni wrando'n fwy cyson ar ddefnyddwyr a gofaluwyr. Rhaid inni ganolbwytio mwy ar helpu pobl i fod mor annibynnol â phosibl. Rhaid i wasanaethau fod yn fwy dibynadwy, ymatebol a chyson, a bod yn rhagorol bob amser, a rhaid inni roi systemau comisiynu ar waith sy'n well ac yn gadarnach ac yn canolbwytio ar ddarparu'r gwasanaethau rhagorol hynny. Oherwydd hynny, ni allaf gefnogi gwelliant y Democraidaid Rhyddfrydol, gan nad yw'n llawn gydnabod y gwaith allweddol sy'n digwydd yn y meysydd hynny, er fy mod yn llwyr ddeall y rheswm dros y pryder a fynegir yn y gwelliant.

Talaf deyrnged i staff gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ar bob lefel. Mae'r prif arolygydd yn cydnabod eu hymroddiad a'u hymrwymiad i'r gwaith o ddarparu gwasanaethau da, a hynny'n aml o dan amgylchiadau anodd. Rhaid wrth staff rhagorol er mwyn darparu gwasanaethau rhagorol. Mae mwy na 70,000 o staff yn gweithio yn y sector gofal cymdeithasol, ac

increase in the percentage of local authority staff who hold appropriate qualifications, and the social care workforce development programme grant scheme is being used to support this work and to build stronger partnerships in the independent sector. The increasing number of people entering social-work training, from 287 to 372 between 2002-03 and 2003-04, is a welcome and positive improvement. Over 200 of those in training were supported by their employers. We know that there are recruitment and retention problems, and we are working to develop the necessary partnerships between employers, training organisations and others to address this issue. This work must continue to receive priority, and we welcome the work that the Care Council for Wales is doing in seeing that this takes place.

In conclusion, I reinforce the chief inspector's call for an increase in the pace of improvement in social services. Each local authority must give priority to bringing this about, and develop new ways of working together to share, and learn from, good practice and to increase momentum for improvement. I am particularly pleased that this initiative is also being taken forward by the Welsh Local Government Association, and I look forward to working with its officials to see these improvements continued. I welcome, therefore, the opportunity to present this report to the Assembly, and I look forward to hearing Members' views and contributions.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** This is an important debate, and I do not want to impose a three-minute time limit on speakers. Members who wish to speak for five minutes may do so, but I have seven speakers and there is less than half an hour to go, so I would be obliged if Members who can limit their speeches to about three minutes would do so, as that would greatly help the Chair.

**Kirsty Williams:** I propose amendment 1. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

mae tua 54 y cant o'r rheini'n gweithio yn y sector preifat neu wirfoddol. Ceir canran uwch o staff awdurdodau lleol sydd â'r cymwysterau priodol, ac mae cynllun grant rhaglen datblygu'r gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol yn cael ei ddefnyddio i hybu'r gwaith hwn a chreu partneriaethau cadarnach yn y sector annibynnol. Mae'r cynnydd yn y nifer sy'n ymgymryd â hyfforddiant mewn gwaith cymdeithasol, o 287 i 372 rhwng 2002-03 a 2003-04, yn welliant pendant sydd i'w groesawu. Yr oedd mwy na 200 o'r rhai a hyfforddwyd wedi cael cymorth gan eu cyflogwyr. Gwyddom fod problemau o ran recriwtio a chadw staff, ac yr ydym yn ceisio datblygu'r partneriaethau y mae eu hangen rhwng cyflogwyr, cyrff hyfforddi ac eraill er mwyn ymdrin â'r mater hwn. Rhaid i'r gwaith hwn gael blaenoriaeth o hyd, a chroesawn y gwaith a wnaiff Cyngor Gofal Cymru i sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd.

I gloi, ategaf alwad y prif arolygydd am gael gwelliannau'n gynt mewn gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Rhaid i bob awdurdod lleol roi blaenoriaeth i sicrhau hynny, a datblygu dulliau newydd o gydweithio er mwyn rhannu arferion da, a dysgu oddi wrthynt, a chael gwelliannau ynghynt. Yr wyf yn arbennig o falch bod y fenter hon yn cael ei hyrwyddo hefyd gan Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, ac edrychaf ymlaen at weithio gyda'i swyddogion i sicrhau bod y gwelliannau hyn yn parhau. Gan hynny, croesawaf y cyfle i gyflwyno'r adroddiad hwn i'r Cynulliad, ac edrychaf ymlaen at glywed barn a chyfraniadau Aelodau.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae hon yn ddadl bwysig, ac ni ddymunaf osod cyfyngiad amser o dri munud ar siaradwyr. Bydd Aelodau sy'n dymuno siarad am bum munud yn cael gwneud hynny, ond mae gennyl saith siaradwr ac mae llai na hanner awr yn weddill, felly byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe byddai Aelodau'n cyfyngu eu hareithiau i tua thri munud os gallant wneud hynny, gan y byddai hynny o gymorth mawr i'r Cadeirydd.

**Kirsty Williams:** Cynigiaf welliant 1. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*notes with regret the disappointing outcome to the first round of joint reviews with no authorities judged to be in the top two service categories of serving people well overall or of serving most people well and calls on the Minister for Health and Social Services to provide greater leadership and direction.*

This document is important, and it touches on many serious matters, the first being the work that the inspectorate has done with regard to the impact of the Victoria Climbié case. The publication of the report into the death of Victoria has led to the inspectorate reviewing whether local authorities' practice responds to potential failures outlined in that report. I welcome the work that the inspectorate has done in this regard, making local authorities aware of possible failures in systems and services so that they can account for that and ensure that, wherever possible, improvements can be made.

Another important strand running through the report, as was also clearly shown by the Wanless review, is that joint working is crucial. Social services do not work in isolation, and effective partnerships with other sectors are key.

There are many challenges ahead. The reconfiguration of services in the health sector will prove to be challenging. We need to ensure that we strengthen community provision wherever possible, which is difficult in terms of out-of-county placements, for example. It can be difficult for a local authority to disinvest in specialist services that it has had to use out of county to try to create better support for families within the county. It can be difficult to do that with the current expenditure system. This is an area of concern.

As the amendment states, we—as Welsh Liberal Democrats—are particularly concerned with the picture painted of social services departments by the first round of joint reviews. I stress those findings. No local authority in Wales was judged to be in the

*nodi gyda gofid ganlyniad siomedig rownd gyntaf y cydadolgiadau, gan na chafodd yr un awdurdod ei osod yn y ddau categori gwasanaethu uchaf, sef gwasanaethu pobl yn dda yn gyffredinol neu wasanaethu'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yn dda a geilw ar y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i ddarparu mwy o arweiniad a chyfeiriad.*

Mae'r ddogfen hon yn un bwysig, ac mae'n cyffwrdd â sawl mater pwysig, a'r cyntaf yw'r gwaith a wnaeth yr arolygiaeth mewn cysylltiad ag effaith achos Victoria Climbié. Mae cyhoeddi'r adroddiad ar yr ymchwiliad i farwolaeth Victoria wedi arwain at adolygiad gan yr arolygiaeth i ganfod a yw arferion awdurdodau lleol yn ymateb i'r diffygion posibl a ddisgrifiwyd yn yr adroddiad hwnnw. Croesawaf y gwaith a wnaeth yr arolygiaeth yn hyn o beth, gan ei fod wedi peri i awdurdodau lleol fod yn ymwybodol o ddiffygion posibl mewn systemau a gwasanaethau fel y gallant roi sylw i hynny a sicrhau y gellir gwneud gwelliannau, lle bynnag y bo modd.

Thema bwysig arall sy'n rhedeg drwy'r adroddiad, fel y dangoswyd yn glir gan adolygiad Wanless, yw bod gweithio ar y cyd yn hollbwysig. Nid yw gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn gweithio ar eu pennau eu hunain, ac mae'n hollbwysig cael partneriaethau effeithiol â sectorau eraill.

Mae llawer o heriau o'n blaen. Bydd yr ad-drefnu ar wasanaethau yn y sector iechyd yn cynnig heriau. Rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn cryfhau'r darpariaethau cymunedol lle bynnag y bo modd, ac mae hynny'n anodd yng nghyd-destun lleoliadau allsirol, er enghraifft. Gall fod yn anodd i awdurdod lleol roi'r gorau i fuddsoddi mewn gwasanaethau arbenigol y tu allan i'r sir y mae wedi'u defnyddio er mwyn ceisio datblygu gwell cymorth i deuluoedd yn y sir. Gall fod yn anodd gwneud hynny o dan y system wariant bresennol. Mae hwn yn faes sy'n peri pryder.

Fel y dywed y gwelliant, yr ydym ni—fel Democraidaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru—yn arbennig o bryderus ynghylch y darlun a gyflewyd o adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yng nghylch cyntaf y cydadolgiadau. Yr wyf yn pwysleisio'r

top two service categories of serving people well, overall, or serving most people well. No authority was judged to be in the top category of excellent prospects for improvement. Eight local authorities were given promising prospects for improvement and judged to serve some people well. Nine authorities were given uncertain prospects for improvement and judged to serve people well. Three authorities had uncertain prospects for improvement and were not serving people well, and two authorities had poor prospects for improvement and were not serving people well.

I am pleased that the social services inspector has given us regular reports on improvements in those two local authorities. However, it must be stressed that—both in Blaenau Gwent and Cardiff—those local authorities are working hard to improve the situation, although we cannot be complacent. The inspector needs to continue to keep a close eye on those local authorities to ensure that the improvements being made to date continue. I suspect that if those services were reinspected now, they would still not be where we would like them to be.

The joint reviews also reveal that, across Wales, there is a need for better assessment and care management to ensure that people receive services which give a timely response to their needs. Service users and carers must be listened to more consistently by those who seek to provide services for them. Services need to focus more on helping people to maximise their independence rather than on promoting dependence. Services must be more reliable, responsive and of a constant high quality. The workforce must be engaged in contributing evidence to inform the authority's decision-making, which is fundamental if we are to drive up standards, by asking those people who deliver the service to input into policy and practice.

Commissioning arrangements must focus on achieving high-quality services. We cannot

casgliadau hynny. Barnwyd nad oedd yr un awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru yn y ddau categori gwasanaethu uchaf o wasanaethu pobl yn dda, yn gyffredinol, neu o wasanaethu'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yn dda. Barnwyd nad oedd yr un awdurdod yn y categori uchaf o ragolygon rhagorol am welliant. Barnwyd bod gan wyth awdurdod lleol ragolygon addawol am welliant a'u bod yn gwasanaethu rhai pobl yn dda. Barnwyd bod gan naw awdurdod ragolygon ansier am welliant a'u bod yn gwasanaethu pobl yn dda. Barnwyd bod gan dri awdurdod ragolygon ansier am welliant ac nad oeddent yn gwasanaethu pobl yn dda, a barnwyd bod gan ddau awdurdod ragolygon gwael am welliant ac nad oeddent yn gwasanaethu pobl yn dda.

Yr wyf yn falch bod yr arolygydd gwasanaethau cymdeithasol wedi rhoi adroddiadau rheolaidd i ni ar welliannau yn y ddau awdurdod hynny. Er hynny, rhaid pwysleisio—yn achos Blaenau Gwent ac yn achos Caerdydd—fod yr awdurdodau lleol hynny'n ymdrechu'n galed i wella'r sefyllfa, er na allwn fod yn hunanfodlon. Rhaid i'r arolygydd barhau i gadw golwg ar yr awdurdodau lleol hynny er mwyn sicrhau y bydd y gwelliannau a wnaed hyd yma'n parhau. Yr wyf yn amau, pe cynhelid ail adolygiad o'r gwasanaethau hynny'n awr, y gwelid nad ydynt eto wedi gwella i'r graddau a ddymunem.

Mae'r cydadolyiadau'n dangos hefyd fod angen gwell asesu a rheoli ar ofal, ledled Cymru, i sicrhau y bydd pobl yn cael gwasanaethau sy'n diwallu eu hanghenion yn amserol. Rhaid i ddefnyddwyr gwasanaethau a gofalwyr gael gwrandawiad mwy cyson gan y rhai sy'n ceisio cynnig gwasanaethau iddynt. Rhaid i wasanaethau ganolbwytio mwy ar helpu pobl i fod mor annibynnol ag y bo modd yn hytrach nag ar hyrwyddo dibyniaeth. Rhaid i wasanaethau fod yn fwy dibynadwy ac ymatebol a bod yn rhagorol bob amser. Rhaid i'r gweithlu gymryd rhan yn y gwaith o gyfrannu tystiolaeth i lywio penderfyniadau'r awdurdod, gan fod hynny'n hanfodol os ydym i wella safonau, drwy ofyn i ddarparwyr y gwasanaeth gyfrannu i'r gwaith o gynllunio polisi ac arferion.

Rhaid i'r trefniadau o ran comisiynu ganolbwytio ar sicrhau gwasanaethau

escape from the fact that local authorities need to look at their role as both the commissioner and the service provider. There are non-profit and voluntary organisations in which local authorities, as commissioners, need to engage more fully, if we are to provide the range of services that clients need.

As I said, there is universal need for improvement which must be a priority. It is interesting that even as we, here in the Assembly, spent the last hour debating public services, not one of us mentioned social services in that debate. As parties and as individuals, collectively, we need to place a much higher emphasis on the performance of social services in the same way as we spend much of our time knocking chunks out of each other with regard to the national health service.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Cefnogwn welliant y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ategaf sylwadau olaf Kirsty yn ei chyfraniad. Mae'n gyfrifoldeb ar bob un ohonom fel Aelodau i osod y pwyslais cywir ar wasanaethau cymdeithasol, sy'n rhywbeth yr anghofir amdanio yn aml iawn oherwydd ein bod yn gosod y fath bwyslais ar y problemau sy'n wynebu'r gwasanaeth iechyd, yn enwedig o ran rhestrau ac amseroedd aros. Er mor bwysig yw ystyried y materion hynny, mae'n bwysig nad ydym yn colli golwg ar wasanaethau cymdeithasol sydd, wedi'r cyfan, yn gwasanaethu rhai o'r bobl fwyaf bregus yn ein cymdeithas, yn enwedig yng nghyd-destun plant a phobl ifanc sydd mewn sefyllfa oedd bregus ac yn aml o dan fygythiad.

5.10 p.m.

O ran yr adroddiad hwn, mae'n wir dweud, fel y soniodd y Gweinidog, y gwelwyd gwelliannau. Mae'n deg dweud hefyd bod pob awdurdod yn ymdrechu i wella safon y gwasanaethau a ddarperir ganddo. Mae'n werth nodi bod yr awdurdodau, erbyn hyn, wedi gosod systemau i fesur eu perfformiad, a chroesawn hynny'n fawr. Fodd bynnag, er bod camau sylweddol wedi'u cymryd i wella'r sefyllfa, mae'n rhaid inni dderbyn

rhagorol. Ni allwn osgoi'r ffaith bod angen i'r awdurdodau lleol ystyried eu rôl fel y comisiynydd a'r darparwr gwasanaethau. Ceir cyrff gwirfoddol a rhai nad ydynt yn bod er mwyn gwneud elw, y mae angen i'r awdurdodau lleol, fel comisiynwyr, ymwneud yn helaethach â hwy, os ydym i gynnig y dewis o wasanaethau y mae ar y cleientiaid ei angen.

Fel y dywedais, mae angen cyffredinol am welliant a rhaid rhoi blaenoriaeth i hynny. Diddorol yw nodi, er i ni yn y Cynulliad dreulio'r awr ddiwethaf yn trafod gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, na wnaeth yr un ohonom sôn am wasanaethau cymdeithasol yn y ddadl honno. Fel pleidiau ac fel unigolion, ar y cyd, rhaid inni roi mwy o bwyslais o lawer ar berfformiad gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn yr un modd ag y treulwn lawer o'n hamser yn colbio ein gilydd wrth drafod y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** We will support the Liberal Democrat amendment in the name of Kirsty Williams. I endorse Kirsty's final comments in her contribution. It is a responsibility on all of us as Members to put the proper emphasis on social services, which is something that is often forgotten because we place so much emphasis on the problems facing the health service, particularly in terms of waiting times and lists. Although those issues are important, we should not lose sight of social services which, after all, serve some of the most vulnerable people in our society, particularly in the context of children and young people who are in vulnerable states and often under threat.

In terms of this report, it is true to say, as the Minister said, that there have been improvements. It is also fair to say that every authority is making an effort to improve the quality of the services that it provides. It is worth noting that authorities have now put in place systems to monitor their performance, which we warmly welcome. However, despite the significant steps that have been taken to improve the situation, we must

bod llawer o waith i'w wneud eto. Difynnaf yn uniongyrchol o'r adroddiad, lle nodir:

'Services overall, however, are not currently of a standard with which we can be satisfied. They must improve, and do so at a pace greater than that seen over recent years. This is a priority for us all'.

O dderbyn hynny, mae'n anodd deall pam y gwrthododd y Gweinidog welliant y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol gan mai dyna y mae'n cyfeirio ato.

Gwnaeth y rhai a gymerodd ran yn y rhaglen o adolygiadau ar y cyd eu penderfyniad ar sail y gwasanaethau a gynigir gan bob awdurdod a chan ddefnyddio dau faen prawf a oedd yn cyfeirio at ba mor dda oedd y gwasanaethau a ddarparwyd gan wasanaethau cymdeithasol a beth oedd y rhagolygon o ran gwella'r gwasanaethau hynny. Soniodd Kirsty Williams eisoes am y darlun terfynol a ymddangosodd yn yr adolygiad, ac mae'n deg dweud nad yw'n ddigon da ac na ellid derbyn bod yr un awdurdod yn perfformio yn ddigon da ar hyn o bryd. Ni wnaf restru safleoedd yr awdurdodau, gan fod Kirsty Williams eisoes wedi gwneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'n ganlyniad siomedig ar y cyfan. Mae'n bwysig bod yr ail raglen, sydd ar waith ar hyn o bryd, yn parhau i sicrhau bod pob awdurdod yn gwella ei wasanaethau.

Os ystyriwn wasanaethau i blant a phobl ifanc, mae'r sefyllfa yng Nghaerdydd a Blaenau Gwent yn parhau i'n poeni. Codais y mater hwn gyda'ch rhagflaenydd, Weinidog. Faint o adnoddau dynol a ddefnyddir gan yr arolygiaeth a faint o amser a dreulir ganddi yn gweithio ar y sefyllfa yn y lleoedd hynny a sut y mae hynny'n effeithio ar ei chyfrifoldebau eraill? A ydych wedi ystyried sicrhau mwy o adnoddau ar gyfer yr arolygiaeth fel y gall roi sylw dyladwy i awdurdodau eraill?

O ran gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, nododd Comisiynydd Plant Cymru yn ei adroddiad blynnyddol fod sefyllfa argyfngus yn bodoli bellach oherwydd y gostyngiad yn nifer y gweithwyr cymdeithasol. Soniodd hefyd am y problemau o ran cadw gweithwyr

accept that there is a great deal of work yet to be done. I will quote directly from the report, which states that

At ei gilydd, fodd bynnag, nid yw'r gwasanaethau ar hyn o bryd yn cyrraedd safon sy'n ein bodloni. Rhaid iddynt wella, a hynny'n gynt nag a wnaethant dros y blynnyddoedd diwethaf. Mae hyn yn flaenoriaeth i ni i gyd.

In accepting that, it is difficult to understand why the Minister rejected the Liberal Democrat amendment, as that is what it refers to.

Those who took part in the programme of joint reviews came to their decision on the basis of the services offered by every authority and by using two criteria, which referred to how effectively people were served by social services and what the prospects for improving those services were. Kirsty Williams has already mentioned the final picture that emerged in the review, and it is fair to say that it is not good enough and that we cannot accept that any authorities are performing satisfactorily at present. I will not list where the authorities stand, as Kirsty Williams has already done so. However, it is a disappointing outcome on the whole. It is important that the second programme, currently being implemented, continues to ensure that every authority improves its services.

If we consider services for children and young people, the situation in Cardiff and Blaenau Gwent continues to cause concern. I raised this issue with your predecessor, Minister. How much human resource does the inspectorate use and how much time does it spend working on the situation in those places and how does that affect its other responsibilities? Have you considered ensuring further resources for the inspectorate so that it can give proper attention to other authorities?

In terms of social services, the Children's Commissioner for Wales noted in his annual report that there is a crisis as a result of the reduction in the number of social workers. He also referred to the problems in terms of retaining social workers within the service

cymdeithasol o fewn y gwasanaeth ac o ran eu denu i weithio gyda phlant a phobl ifanc.

O ran lleoliadau gofal, mae'n rhaid inni gofio bod 76 o gartrefi wedi eu cau yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, a bod hynny wedi arwain at golli 377 o leoliadau. Collwyd cyfanswm o 1,296 o leoliadau er 1999. Er bod y Llywodraeth yn gosod pwyslais mawr ar ofal yn y cartref, mae'r ganran o'r gyllideb a werir ar hynny wedi gostwng. Felly, er ein bod yn nodi'r gwelliant a fu, yr ydym yn pryderu ynghylch y gwaith mawr sydd eto i'w gyflawni gan bron pob awdurdod yng Nghymru a'r anghysondeb rhwng y gwasanaethau a ddarperir gan awdurdodau.

**Karen Sinclair:** I welcome this report, and I have the highest regard for the inspectorate and for the work that it has carried out over the years. The report deals head-on with many of the most cogent issues that the social care sector in Wales faces, and it has made a significant contribution towards the debate on social care in Wales. I will focus on respite care and the massive contribution that it makes to the family unit. The provision of short-term temporary respite for carers is crucial to those who receive it, as I have seen from my time working in the social care sector. By allowing carers, family members and others to take a break from the daily routine of care giving for a single night or an extended period goes a long way towards relieving the stress that inevitably builds up when caring for an individual with complex needs. Respite care acts as a pressure valve, lessening the potential for stress and all that flows from it.

In order to ensure that respite can be accessed when it is most needed, I would like to see the issue of block booking beds brought to the fore as we discuss the reconfiguration of the social care field. Social services need to have more scope in which they can guarantee a supply of care beds for respite and short-term care, in contrast with the rather expensive spot purchasing of beds by local authorities that currently occurs. Spot purchasing can also fall down because if there are not any beds, there is no care. As

and in terms of attracting them to work with children and young people.

In terms of care placements, we must bear in mind that 76 homes have closed over the past year, and that that has led to the loss of 377 placements. A total of 1,296 placements have been lost since 1999. Although the Government places a great deal of emphasis on care in the home, the percentage of the budget spent on that has been reduced. Therefore, although we note the improvement that has been achieved, we are concerned about the considerable amount of work to be carried out by nearly every authority in Wales and the inconsistency between the services provided by authorities.

**Karen Sinclair:** Croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn, ac mae gennyl barch mawr tuag at yr arolygiaeth a thuag at y gwaith y mae wedi ei gyflawni dros y blynnyddoedd. Mae'r adroddiad yn ymdrin yn uniongyrchol â llawer o'r materion pwysicaf y mae'r sector gofal cymdeithasol yng Nghymru'n eu hwynебу, a chyfrannodd yn helaeth at y ddadl ar ofal cymdeithasol yng Nghymru. Canolbwytiaf ar ofal seibiant a'r cyfraniad aruthrol a wnaiff hynny at yr uned deuluol. Mae darparu seibiant dros dro a thymor byr ar gyfer gofalwyr yn hollbwysig i'r rhai sy'n cael hynny, fel y gwelais yn ystod y cyfnod y bûm yn gweithio yn y sector gofal cymdeithasol. Mae gadael i ofalwyr, aelodau o'r teulu ac eraill gael seibiant oddi wrth y drefn feunyddiol o ofalu am un noson neu am gyfnod hwy'n cyfrannu'n helaeth at leddfu'r straen sydd yn datblygu'n anochel wrth ofalu am unigolyn sydd ag anghenion cymhleth. Mae gofal seibiant yn gweithredu fel falf bwysedd, gan leihau'r potensial ar gyfer straen a phopeth sydd yn deillio o hynny.

Er mwyn sicrhau y gellir cael seibiant pan fo'i angen fwyaf, hoffwn weld cwestiwn archebu gwelyau mewn bloc yn cael lle amlwg wrth inni drafod ad-drefnu maes gofal cymdeithasol. Mae angen i'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol gael mwy o gyfle i allu gwarantu cyflenwad o welyau gofal ar gyfer gofal seibiant a thymor byr, yn hytrach na'r broses gostus braidd o brynu gwelyau ar y pryd a ddilynir ar hyn o bryd gan yr awdurdodau lleol. Gall prynu ar y pryd fethu hefyd oherwydd nad oes gofal os nad oes

the report points out, the figure highlighting the number of nights of respite care provided or funded by local authorities went up in 2003-04 to 119 per 1,000, from 103 per 1,000 in 2002-03. However, that is not enough.

Better planning would not only lead to the better planning of services for healthcare providers by giving advance information of need, it would provide better value for local authorities as the price per bed would inevitably come down if a guaranteed number of beds were block booked. It would also help to avoid the need for crisis intervention, a need brought on by exhaustion and illness. I realise that there are issues to be overcome in block booking. For example, a bed for someone who has learning disabilities is different to that needed for someone who has dementia, and this cannot always be foreseen in forward planning of this nature. However, it is too often said to me by the directors of social services that their resources are too tight to plan in this way, and patients and their carers are often left without the support that they need. Families and main carers need the help of social services in their area, and social services must be fully equipped and funded to be able to provide that help. We must ensure that respite care is available when needed and that carers feel that they are valued for the enormous task that they undertake not only for their loved ones, but for society as a whole.

gwelyau ar gael. Fel y noda'r adroddiad, cododd y ffigur sydd yn dangos sawl noson o ofal seibiant a ddarparwyd neu a ariannwyd gan yr awdurdodau lleol yn 2003-04 i 119 y 1,000, o 103 y 1,000 yn 2002-03. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n ddigon.

Byddai gwell cynllunio nid yn unig yn arwain at gynllunio gwasanaethau i ddarparwyr gofal iechyd yn well drwy roi gwybodaeth ymlaen llaw am yr angen, byddai hefyd yn rhoi gwell gwerth i awdurdodau lleol gan y byddai pris y gwely'n anochel yn gostwng pe byddai nifer warantedig o welyau wedi'u harchebu mewn bloc. Byddai hefyd yn gymorth i osgoi'r angen am ymyriad mewn argyfwng, angen a achosir gan orflinder a gwaeledd. Sylweddolaf fod problemau i'w goresgyn ynglŷn ag archebu mewn bloc. Er enghraifft, mae gwely i rywun sydd ag anableddau dysgu'n wahanol i'r hyn sydd ei angen ar gyfer rhywun sydd yn dioddef o ddementia, ac ni ellir rhagweld hyn bob amser wrth flaengynllunio fel hyn. Fodd bynnag, dywedir yn rhy aml wrthyf gan gyfarwyddwyr gwasanaethau cymdeithasol fod eu hadnoddau'n rhy fain i gynllunio yn y modd hwn, ac yn aml gadewir cleifion a'u gofalwyr heb y cymorth y mae arnynt ei angen. Mae ar deuluoedd a phrif ofalwyr angen help y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn eu hardal, a rhaid i'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol gael eu harfogi a'u hariannu'n iawn i allu cynnig yr help hwnnw. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod gofal seibiant ar gael pan fo angen a bod gofalwyr yn teimlo eu bod yn cael eu gwerthfawrogi am y dasg aruthrol a gyflawnant nid yn unig ar ran eu hanwyliaid, ond ar ran y gymdeithas yn gyffredinol.

**David Melding:** I will start by saying, as the Chair of the Health and Social Services Committee, that the committee had a good session looking at this report—it attracted high-quality debate and discussion. The information in the chief inspector's report is an honest, candid snapshot of the state of social services in Wales. It is accessible, and I commend it to Members who have not read it fully and to those who are not here, because this is an important area. Kirsty Williams was correct to observe that in the previous debate on public services, there was no substantive discussion on social services—I mentioned

**David Melding:** Dechreuaaf drwy ddweud, fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, fod y pwylgor wedi cael cyfarfod da wrth edrych ar yr adroddiad hwn—cafwyd dadl a thrafodaeth o ansawdd da. Ciplun gonest, di-flewyn-ar-dafod, yw'r wybodaeth yn adroddiad y prif arolygydd o gyflwr y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yng Nghymru. Mae'n hawdd ei ddarllen, ac fe'i hargymhellaf i Aelodau sydd heb ei ddarllen i gyd ac i'r rhai nad ydynt yma, oherwydd mae hwn yn faes pwysig. Yr oedd Kirsty Williams yn gywir pan ddywedodd na chafwyd yn y ddadl flaenorol

social services in a list, but I accept that that was not a major contribution. The Liberal Democrat amendment is appropriate because social services need leadership of the highest quality. I do not think that our support of that amendment reflects on the present Minister; it emphasises the point, which goes right across all parties in control in the various local authorities in Wales, that social services should be put at the top of the political agenda.

The chief inspector is correct to observe that the joint review process highlighted areas of major concern. We are doing worse than England. I fear that if this review had been conducted 10 or 15 years ago, we could have had a similar situation, therefore I do not think that this matter can be laid calmly and simply at the door of one particular party. There is real cause for concern. The quotation that Rhodri Glyn Thomas read out was absolutely right as regards the need for improvements at a greater pace than we have seen over recent years. There have been some improvements—I felt that that was the conclusion of the committee—but they are still modest given the scale of transformation required. For instance, the chief inspector spent some time on assessment and care management procedures, and if we do not get assessment and care management right, what chance have we of improving the lives of those who are most vulnerable?

5.20 p.m.

There are other important observations, such as the fact that local authorities overrate their performance. This is a consistent finding. They believe that their services are better than what is shown when we use objective methods. The political climate needs to change. We need to acknowledge the fact that there are deficiencies, and identify areas where we need to improve, and to do this openly, rather than in a dull, partisan way where we simply look for people to blame.

ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus drafodaeth sylweddol ar wasanaethau cymdeithasol—crybwyllais y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol mewn rhestr, ond derbyniaf nad oedd hynny'n gyfraniad o bwys. Mae gwelliant y Democraidiad Rhyddfrydol yn briodol oherwydd y mae angen arweinyddiaeth o'r ansawdd gorau ar y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Nid wyf yn meddwl bod ein cefnogaeth i'r gwelliant hwnnw'n adlewyrchu ar y Gweinidog presennol; mae'n pwysleisio'r pwynt, sydd yn berthnasol i bob plaid sydd yn rheoli'r gwahanol awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru, y dylid rhoi'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ar ben yr agenda wleidyddol.

Mae'r prif arolygydd yn gywir pan noda fod proses y cydadolygiad wedi tynnu sylw at feysydd sy'n peri pryer mawr. Yr ydym yn gwneud yn waeth na Lloegr. Ofnaf pe bai'r adolygiad hwn wedi ei gynnal 10 neu 15 mlynedd yn ôl, y gallem fod wedi cael sefyllfa debyg, felly nid wyf yn meddwl y gellir rhoi'r bai am y mater hwn ar un blaidd benodol yn unig. Mae lle i bryderu o ddifrif. Yr oedd y dyfyniad a ddarllenwyd gan Rhodri Glyn Thomas yn llygad ei le o ran yr angen am welliannau, a hynny'n gynt nag a welsom dros y blynyddoedd diweddar. Cafwyd rhai gwelliannau—teimlwn mai dyna gasgliad y pwylgor—ond bychan ydynt o hyd, ac ystyried maint y trawsnewidiad sydd ei angen. Er enghraift, treuliodd y prif arolygwr beth amser ar weithdrefnau asesu a rheoli gofal, ac os nadawn ati'n iawn i asesu a rheoli gofal, pa obaith sydd gennym i wella bywydau'r rhai sydd fwyaf bregus?

Ceir sylwadau pwysig eraill, megis y ffaith bod awdurdodau lleol yn gorbrisio'u perfformiad. Mae hyn yn ganfyddiad cyson. Credant fod eu gwasanaethau'n well na'r hyn a welir pan ddefnyddiwn ddulliau gwrthrychol. Mae angen i'r hinsawdd wleidyddol newid. Mae angen inni gydnabod y ffaith bod diffygion, a nodi mannau lle y mae angen gwella, a gwneud hyn yn agored, yn hytrach nag mewn modd dallbleidiol, dilem, lle na wnaeon ddim ond edrych am bobl i'w beio.

It is a sad fact that, while social services are not of a safe and effective standard throughout Wales, they are worse with respect to children's services. This is a consistent finding of joint reviews. This is a daunting fact and something on which we should reflect very sombrely. I believe that we need to be much more ambitious with regard to looked-after children. They are very often a damaged and challenging group of people who have had some of the most unfortunate early-life experiences, and I believe that they deserve our fullest compassion, time and attention. For instance, the standards that we set in educational attainment for looked-after children are much lower than for the general population. We measure success for looked-after children as being one pass at GCSE, whereas it would be five for the rest of the population. We need to use the same measures of success so that we can be more ambitious. Fifty per cent of looked-after children have some form of mental illness. We need to reflect on this, so that our child and adolescent mental health services are improved and targeted at looked-after children. There is pressure on foster carers as the pattern of care has very much gone to these carers. Therefore, we will have to work harder in that respect.

Finally, the great variation in practice between authorities is something that the Minister needs to spend time examining.

**Gwenda Thomas:** I will concentrate my remarks on children's services. Notwithstanding some of the contributions that have been made this afternoon, it should be remembered that children's services suffered particularly badly in the late 1980s and early 1990s, when public-sector services generally were being eroded and undervalued by the previous Conservative Government. This was made worse by press vilification—most of it unfair and ill-informed—which undermined morale, and caused a haemorrhage of skilled and experienced workers from children's services into less exposed areas of social services.

Mae'n ffaith drist, er nad yw gwasanaethau cymdeithasol o safon ddiogel ac effeithiol drwy Gymru gyfan, eu bod yn waeth o safbwyt gwasanaethau plant. Mae hyn yn ganfyddiad cyson mewn cydadolygiadau. Mae hyn yn ffaith frwydchus ac yn rhywbeth y dylem ei ystyried yn ddwys iawn. Credaf fod angen inni fod yn fwy uchelgeisiol gyda phlant sy'n derbyn gofal. Maent yn aml yn grŵp drylliedig ac anodd o bobl a gafodd rai o'r profiadau mwyaf anffortunus yn gynnar yn eu bywydau, a chredaf eu bod yn haeddu ein tosturi, ein hamser a'n sylw llawnaf. Er enghraifft, mae'r safonau a osodwn ar gyfer cyrhaeddiad addysgol i blant sy'n derbyn gofal yn llawer is nag i'r boblogaeth yn gyffredinol. Ystyriwn fod plant sy'n derbyn gofal wedi llwyddo os llwyddant i basio un pwnc TGAU, er mai pum pwnc fyddai'r llinyn mesur i weddill y boblogaeth. Mae angen inni ddefnyddio'r un mesurau llwyddiant er mwyn inni allu bod yn fwy uchelgeisiol. Mae gan hanner cant y cant o blant sy'n derbyn gofal ryw ffurf ar salwch meddwl. Mae angen inni ystyried hyn, er mwyn gwella ein gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl i blant a'r glasoed a'u targedu tuag at blant sy'n derbyn gofal. Mae pwysau ar rieni maeth gan fod patrwm y gofal wedi mynd i'r gofalwyr hyn i raddau helaeth. Felly, bydd yn rhaid inni weithio'n galetach yn hynny o beth.

Yn olaf, mae'r amrywiaeth mawr yn y modd y mae gwahanol awdurdodau yn gweithredu yn rhywbeth y mae angen i'r Gweinidog dreulio amser yn ei archwilio.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Canolbwytiaf fy sylwadau ar wasanaethau plant. Er gwaethaf rhai o'r cyfraniadau sydd wedi'u gwneud y prynhawn yma, dylid cofio bod gwasanaethau plant wedi dioddef yn arw yn niwed y 1980au a dechrau'r 1990au, pan oedd gwasanaethau'r sector cyhoeddus yn gyffredinol yn cael eu herydu a'u dibrisio gan y Llywodraeth Geidwadol ddiwethaf. Gwaethygwyd hyn gan sylwadau difrifol yn y wasg—y rhan fwyaf ohonynt yn annheg ac anwybodus—a danseiliodd ysbryd, ac a achosodd golli llu o weithwyr medrus a phrofiadol o wasanaethau plant i feysydd gwasanaethau cymdeithasol llai agored i ymosodiad.

I welcome the chief inspector's authoritative report, and I am sure that the Minister and the Health and Social Services Committee will find that this report will bring together all the strands of the social services remit. There is a growing awareness of the importance of local authorities' annual performance evaluation undertaken by the Social Services Inspectorate Wales, and of the contribution that this makes to improving social services across Wales. The Welsh Assembly Government has given, and I am sure will continue to give, due importance to supporting local government to enable it to improve social services. It must be remembered that these services are vital to the most vulnerable children and young people in our communities. It is essential that there is responsive, high-quality social care in place locally if we are to achieve the necessary changes across health and social care in Wales.

My own authority of Neath Port Talbot, which is the only Welsh authority piloting integrated children's services, appears to have done well in establishing this principle in comparison to other pilot areas in the UK, this being due to the fact that it took an interagency approach from the outset. I congratulate the authority on the work undertaken during the pilot. The work of the Safeguarding Vulnerable Children review to date would fully endorse the chief inspector's view that safeguarding and promoting the welfare of children in need is demanding and complex and needs a whole-systems approach.

In evidence already received, it is apparent that there are many skilled and committed professionals in all of the services and that some excellent work is going on. Core social work practice of a high standard is key to the system. The services need to develop most the ability of personnel and organisational structure. The Welsh Assembly Government's initiatives have been seen as positive and have been enthusiastically welcomed, but more time is needed in terms of planning and implementation.

I welcome the importance that the Minister and his predecessor, Jane Hutt, have placed

Croesawaf adroddiad awdurdodol y prif arolygydd, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y gwêl y Gweinidog a'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol y daw'r adroddiad hwn â holl feysydd cylch gwaith y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ynghyd. Ceir ymwybyddiaeth gynyddol o bwysigrwydd y gwerthusiad blynnyddol o berfformiad awdurdodau lleol a wneir gan Arolygiaeth Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru, ac o'r cyfraniad a wna hyn at wella gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ledled Cymru. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol wedi rhoi, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yn parhau i roi, pwysigrwydd dyledus i gynorthwyo llywodraeth leol i'w galluogi i wella gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Rhaid cofio bod y gwasanaethau hyn yn hanfodol i'r plant a'r bobl ifanc fwyaf bregus yn ein cymunedau. Rhaid wrth ofal cymdeithasol ymatebol, o ansawdd da, yn lleol os am sicrhau'r newidiadau angenrheidiol ar draws iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yng Nghymru.

Ymddengys fod fy awdurdod i, Castell-nedd Port Talbot, sef yr unig awdurdod yng Nghymru sydd yn treialu gwasanaethau plant integredig, wedi gwneud yn dda o ran sefydlu'r egwyddor hon o'i gymharu ag ardaloedd peilot eraill yn y DU, a hynny oherwydd iddo weithredu mewn dull rhynghasiataethol o'r cychwyn. Llongyfarchaf yr awdurdod ar y gwaith a wnaethpwyd yn ystod y cynllun peilot. Mae gwaith yr adolygiad Diogelu Plant sy'n Agored i Niwed hyd yma'n ategu'n llwyr farn y prif arolygydd fod diogelu a hyrwyddo lles plant mewn angen yn waith caled a chymhleth a bod angen mynd ati ar sail system gyfan.

Yn y dystiolaeth a ddaeth i law yn barod, mae'n amlwg bod llawer o weithwyr proffesiynol medrus ac ymroddgar yn y gwasanaethau i gyd a bod gwaith rhagorol yn digwydd. Mae arferion gwaith cymdeithasol craidd o safon uchel yn allweddol i'r system. Mae angen yn bennaf i'r gwasanaethau ddatblygu gallu personél a'r strwythur trefniadol. Gwelwyd cynlluniau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol fel rhai cadarnhaol ac fe'u croesawyd yn frwd, ond mae angen rhagor o amser o ran cynllunio a gweithredu.

Croesawaf y pwys y mae'r Gweinidog a'i ragflaenydd, Jane Hutt, wedi ei roi ar y

on the social care workforce throughout Wales, which is making a big difference to people's lives every day, and we must continue to invest in the development and training of the workforce. We also need to make social work in children's services an attractive career once again.

**Laura Anne Jones:** I echo a particularly significant point made in the chief inspector's overview of this important report. Social services are vital to the fabric of the communities in which we live. Good social services enable people to live full, independent lives, be they families who need support, children who need protection, people with disabilities or those in need of long-term care. Social services make an important contribution to enabling communities to prosper and to care better for their fellow citizens. For many across south-east Wales and in every community, they can be a godsend, allowing people to lead a relatively normal existence.

I was recently concerned by reports that some of Gwent's most vulnerable residents are set to receive a blow when funding for their community support scheme is slashed by the Labour Welsh Assembly Government. Supporting People schemes provide care and support for the elderly, homeless, mentally ill and drug users, to name a few. It was thought that Newport Housing Trust, which provides support for around 145 elderly city tenants, would take the brunt of the cuts. That means that pensioners who rely on the scheme for help with their shopping, attending medical appointments and healthy eating, could be left to fend for themselves.

What about bedblocking? The scheme has helped with the delayed transfer of care to care homes and sheltered housing and has enabled hospital stays to be as short as possible, freeing up badly needed hospital beds. Any cuts can therefore only affect bedblocking. This news came on top of an earlier warning from the social services chief that Newport City Council is running short of cash to fund care-home places and support

gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol ledled Cymru, sydd yn gwneud gwahaniaeth mawr i fywydau pobl bob dydd, a rhaid inni barhau i fuddsoddi mewn datblygu a hyfforddi'r gweithlu. Mae angen sicrhau bod gwaith cymdeithasol mewn gwasanaethau plant yn yrfa ddeniadol unwaith eto, hefyd.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Hoffwn adleisio pwynt arbennig o arwyddocaol a wnaethpwyd yn nhrosolwg y prif arolygydd ar yr adroddiad pwysig hwn. Mae gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn hanfodol i wead y cymunedau lle'r ydym yn byw. Mae gwasanaethau cymdeithasol da yn galluogi pobl i fyw bywydau llawn, annibynnol, boed hwy'n deuluoedd sydd angen cymorth, yn blant sydd angen gwarchodaeth, yn bobl ag anableddau neu'n rhai sydd angen gofal hirdymor. Mae'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn gwneud cyfraniad pwysig at alluogi cymunedau i ffynnu ac i ofalu'n well am eu cyd-ddinas syddion. I lawer ar draws y Deedwyrain ac ym mhob cymuned, gallant fod yn fendiff, yn caniatáu i bobl fyw bywyd cymharol normal.

Achos pryder imi'n ddiweddar oedd adroddiadau y bydd rhai o drigolion mwyaf agored i niwed Gwent yn dioddef ergyd pan gaiff y cyllid ar gyfer eu cynllun cymorth cymunedol ei gwtogi gan Lywodraeth Lafur Cynulliad Cymru. Mae cynlluniau Cefnogi Pobl yn darparu gofal a chymorth i'r henoed, y digartref, pobl â salwch meddwl a defnyddwyr cyffuriau, ymhlið eraill. Credid mai Ymddiriedolaeth Dai Casnewydd, sydd yn darparu cymorth i ryw 145 o denantiaid oedrannus y ddinas, fyddai'n dioddef y gwaethaf o'r toriadau. Golyga hynny y gallai pensiynwyr sydd yn dibynnu ar y cynllun am help gyda'u siopa, mynchu apwyntiadau meddygol a bwyta'n iach, gael eu gadael i ymdopi drostynt eu hunain.

Beth am flocio gwelyau? Mae'r cynllun wedi helpu gydag oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal i gartrefi gofal a thai gwarchod ac wedi ei gwneud yn bosibl i arosiadau yn yr ysbtyt fod cyn fyrred ag sydd yn bosibl, gan ryddhau gwelyau ysbtyt y mae mawr angen amdanyst. Felly mae'n anochel y bydd unrhyw doriadau'n effeithio ar flocio gwelyau. Daeth y newyddion hyn yn ychwanegol at rybudd cynharach gan

packages. A one-in, one-out system for care home placements has been in operation, fuelling predictions that this can only adversely affect bedblocking.

bennaeth y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol fod Cyngor Dinas Casnewydd yn mynd yn brin o arian i dalu am leoedd mewn cartrefi gofal a phecynnau cymorth. Mae system lleoliadau cartref gofal ‘un i mewn, un allan’ wedi bod ar waith, sydd yn hybu’r proffwydo na all hyn ond effeithio’n andwyol ar sefyllfa blocio gwelyau.

I am concerned that vulnerable people in south-east Wales are sometimes facing inadequate social service provision and, although I am sure that there are many examples of good practice, there is scope for improvement. The chief inspector has stated that there was a disappointing outcome to the first round of joint reviews on each authority’s social services, in which nine were given uncertain prospects for improvement, three were given uncertain prospects and were said to not be serving people well, and two had poor prospects. This did not make for inspired reading, and I hope that we shall see strong, clear political leadership that focuses on the areas that need attention.

Yr wyf yn bryderus bod pobl agored i niwed yn y De-ddwyrain weithiau’n wynebu darpariaeth gwasanaethau cymdeithasol annigonol ac, er fy mod yn siŵr fod llawer o enghreifftiau o arferion da, mae lle i wella. Dywedodd y prif arolygydd mai canlyniad siomedig a gafwyd i’r rownd gyntaf o gydadolygiadau ar wasanaethau cymdeithasol pob awdurdod, lle y rhoddyd rhagolygon gwella ansicr i naw, cafodd tri ragolygon ansicr a dywedwyd nad oeddent yn gwasanaethu pobl yn dda, ac yr oedd gan ddaug ragolygon gwael. Nid oedd hyn yn ysbrydoli rhywun, a gobeithiaf y gwelwn arweiniad gwleidyddol cryf a chlir sydd yn canolbwytio ar y mannau sydd angen sylw.

I agree with the recommendations set out in this report in that social services must improve at, as Rhodri Glyn Thomas said, a pace greater than we have seen over recent years. Local authorities must not lose sight of this task in the light of the extensive agenda that they face. I call upon the Assembly to ensure that these improvements are implemented. Let us see the provision of decent social services that allow people from all walks of life to lead full, independent lives and which contribute to our society as a whole.

Cytunaf â’r argymhellion a amlinellir yn yr adroddiad hwn sef bod yn rhaid i wasanaethau cymdeithasol wella, fel y dywedodd Rhodri Glyn Thomas, yn gynt nag a welsom yn y blynnyddoedd diweddar. Rhaid i’r awdurdodau lleol beidio â cholli golwg ar y dasg hon yn wyneb yr agenda eang a wynebant. Galwaf ar y Cynulliad i sicrhau y gweithredir y gwelliannau hyn. Gadewch inni weld darparu gwasanaethau cymdeithasol da sydd yn caniatáu i bobl o bob cefndir fyw bywydau llawn, annibynnol ac sydd yn cyfrannu at ein cymdeithas yn gyffredinol.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I would normally call the Minister at this time, but I ask Val Lloyd whether she wants to speak for a couple of minutes only.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Byddwn fel arfer yn galw’r Gweinidog yn y fan hon, ond gofynnaf i Val Lloyd a oes arni eisaiu siarad am funud neu ddau yn unig.

**Val Lloyd:** I will just pick out my main theme, which is the common theme that the chief inspector highlighted, namely the need to develop effective methods of joint working with a range of partners. That has been achieved to some extent in health and social services, but it now needs to be widened.

**Val Lloyd:** Ni wnaf ond tynnu sylw at fy mhrif thema, sef y thema gyffredin a bwysleisiwyd gan y prif arolygydd, sef yr angen i ddatblygu dulliau effeithiol o gydweithio ag amrediad o bartneriaid. Cyflawnwyd hynny i ryw raddau ym maes iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, ond bellach mae angen ei ehangu.

5.30 p.m.

I am conscious of the time, but I will concentrate on education, which I see as a key area for social services and education departments. They should work together to ensure that care leavers and children in foster homes receive adequate access to learning pathways, as well as focusing on their community and social environments. The school nurse has an important role to play in this arena, and, in many areas, the potential of the school nurse is not being used to full advantage, to the possible detriment of service users, who are children. I want to see more use made of those skills, as that would be of great benefit.

Yr wyf yn ymwybodol faint o'r gloch yw hi, ond canolbwytiaf ar addysg sydd, yn fy marn i, yn faes allweddol i adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ac addysg. Dylent weithio gyda'i gilydd i sicrhau bod pobl ifanc sydd yn gadael gofal a phlant sydd mewn cartrefi maeth yn cael mynediad digonol at lwybrau dysgu, yn ogystal â chanolbwytio ar eu cymuned a'u hamgylchedd cymdeithasol. Mae gan y nyrs ysgol rôl bwysig i'w chwarae yn hyn o beth ac, mewn llawer ardal, nid yw potensial y nyrs ysgol yn cael ei ddefnyddio i'r eithaf, gan roi defnyddwyr y gwasanaeth, o bosibl, dan anfantais, sef plant yn yr achos hwn. Yr wyf eisiau gweld rhagor o ddefnyddio ar y sgiliau hynny, gan y byddai hynny'n hynod fuddiol.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you very much for being so succinct. I call the Minister to wind up.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** Many important points have been raised. We began with the Victoria Climbié case and its repercussions. As we know, the Children Act 2004 followed on from that. There are many opportunities for the Assembly and the Assembly Government to learn the lessons of the Climbié inquiry and to make full use of the opportunities afforded under the new Act. If we look at the chief inspector's report, we will see a significant increase in the amount of money given to children's services. It is outstripping the amount of money being invested in adult services, for example. That is in addition to the general increase that I mentioned in my introductory remarks.

A number of Members highlighted issues that might be useful to consider under the commissioning framework. Karen Sinclair, in her contribution on carers, mentioned the importance of block-booking versus spot-purchasing social care. David Melding and Kirsty Williams were among those who highlighted the issue of commissioning for out-of-county and, indeed, out-of-country placements, which occurs across Wales. The Welsh Local Government Association recognises the need to strengthen the

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Diolch yn fawr iawn am fod mor gryno. Galwaf ar y Gweinidog i gau pen y mwdwl.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Codwyd sawl pwynt pwysig. Dechreusom gydag achos Victoria Climbié a'i sgil-effeithiau. Fel y gwyddom, esgorodd hynny ar Ddeddf Plant 2004. Mae sawl cyfreith i'r Cynulliad a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ddysgu'r gwersi a ddeilliodd o ymchwiliad Climbié a gwneud defnydd llawn o'r cyfleoedd a ddaw yn sgil y Ddeddf newydd. O edrych ar adroddiad y prif arolygydd, gwelwn gynnydd sylweddol yn yr arian a roddir i wasanaethau plant. Mae'n fwy na'r arian a fuddsoddir mewn gwasanaethau oedolion, er enghraifft. Mae hynny'n ychwanegol at y cynnydd cyffredinol y cyfeiriad ato yn fy sylwadau agoriadol.

Tynnodd nifer o Aelodau sylw at faterion y gallai fod yn fuddiol eu hystyried dan y fframwaith comisiynu. Yn ei chyfraniad am ofalwyr, cyfeiriodd Karen Sinclair at bwysigrwydd archebu gofal cymdeithasol mewn bloc yn hytrach na'i brynu ar y pryd. Roedd David Melding a Kirsty Williams ymhli y rhai a dynnodd sylw at gomisiynu lleoliadau o siroedd eraill, neu yn wir o wledydd eraill, sydd yn digwydd ym mhob rhan o Gymru. Mae Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru yn cydnabod bod angen

commissioning process, so that that sort of thing does not happen. However, there is also a need not only to strengthen the commissioning process at this level, but also to consider issues in terms of looked-after children. Many children with special needs who are involved in the social services sector could equally be included in the child and adolescent mental health services sector. There is a need for improved processes and co-operation in the commissioning process.

On the amendment, while I accept the need for better performance and prospects—there is no argument about the first part of it—the second part does not pay due attention to what the chief inspector said in his report. I therefore reject the amendment. It does not acknowledge the lead that the WLGA is taking in addressing performance issues, particularly following its December summit on this matter. The WLGA is to be commended on its proactive approach to improving the performance of social services departments. When I was appointed Minister for Health and Social Services, one of my chief priorities was to see that best performance was spread across Wales. Leadership exists at all levels, but the amendment does not acknowledge that.

Karen's point on respite care is important, and the passing of the Carers (Equal Opportunities) Act 2004 by my constituency colleague, Hywel Francis, the former MP for Aberavon, has been an important step forward. A conference will be held later this week on carers' issues, and Carers' Week will be held in June or July, which will fully exploit the opportunities afforded by that Act. There is a real need to fully recognise the service that carers are providing, but also to expand upon the support that they receive, support provided by the Carers (Equal Opportunities) Act 2004. It is important to acknowledge that.

To be slightly partisan, I wish to say that some of the Conservatives' contributions to this debate were a little hard to stomach. If one looks at the Conservative manifesto on

cryfhau'r broses gomisiynu er mwyn sierhau nad yw'r math hwnnw o beth yn digwydd eto. Fodd bynnag, mae angen hefyd nid yn unig gryfhau'r broses gomisiynu ar y lefel hon, ond hefyd ystyried cwestiynau yng nghyd-destun plant sydd yn derbyn gofal. Gallai llawer o blant ag anghenion arbennig sydd yn ymwneud â'r sector gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yr un modd gael eu cynnwys yn y sector gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl i'r glasoed. Mae angen gwell prosesau a chydweithredu yn y broses gomisiynu.

O ran y gwelliant, er fy mod yn derbyn bod angen gwella perfformiad a rhagolygon—nid oes dim dadl ynglŷn â'r cyntaf—nid yw'r ail yn rhoi sylw dyledus i'r hyn a ddywedodd y prif arolygydd yn ei adroddiad. Yr wyf felly'n gwrthod y gwelliant. Nid yw'n cydnabod yr arweiniad y mae CLILC yn ei roi wrth fynd i'r afael â materion yn ymwneud â pherfformiad, yn enwedig yn sgil ei chynhadledd ym mis Rhagfyr i drafod y mater hwn. Mae lle i longyfarch CLILC ar ei hagwedd ragweithiol tuag at wella perfformiad adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Pan gefais fy mhenodi yn Weinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, un o'm prif flaenorriaethau oedd sierhau bod y perfformiad gorau'n cael ei daenu ar draws Cymru. Mae arweiniad yn bodoli ar bob lefel, ond nid yw'r gwelliant yn cydnabod hynny.

Mae pwynt Karen am ofal seibiant yn bwysig, a bu pasio Deddf Gofalwyr (Cyfle Cyfartal) 2004 gan fy nghyd-aelod yn yr etholaeth, Hywel Francis, cyn AS Aberafan, yn gam pwysig ymlaen. Cynhelir cynhadledd yn ddiweddarach yr Wythnos hon am faterion yn ymwneud â gofalwyr, a chynhelir Wythnos Gofalwyr ym mis Mehefin neu fis Gorffennaf er mwyn manteisio i'r eithaf ar y cyfleoedd y bydd y Ddeddf honno yn eu cynnig. Mae gwir angen rhoi cydnabyddiaeth lawn i'r gwasanaeth y mae gofalwyr yn ei roi, a hefyd ymestyn y cymorth a dderbyniant, cymorth a ddarperir gan Ddeddf Gofalwyr (Cyfle Cyfartal) 2004. Mae'n bwysig cydnabod hynny.

A bod braidd yn blwyfol, carwn ddweud bod cyfraniadau rhai o'r Ceidwadwyr yn y drafodaeth hon braidd yn anodd eu stumogi. O edrych ar fanifesto'r Ceidwadwyr ar

health, either in Wales or the UK, not a single reference to social care is to be found. It is not easy to digest some of the comments made by the Conservative Party on social care, when that issue does not merit a single sentence in its manifesto. The Conservatives should either put up, or shut up on this issue.

**David Melding:** I am surprised by this outburst. We were calmly—

**Mark Isherwood** *rose—*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Mark, it is not in order for you to stand behind David while he makes his intervention. You must sit down.

**David Melding:** That has taken the wind out of my sails, slightly.

This has been a constructive debate. The Conservative Party has published its policies comprehensively and at length, and the manifesto focuses on our 10 key pledges. It is wrong for you to manipulate that, Minister.

**Brian Gibbons:** There probably are 10 commitments in your manifesto, but social care does not merit a single mention. The record will be judged on the basis of what is written for people to read and to see. Michael Howard said that he wanted people to read the Conservative manifesto, and that is fine for anyone desperate enough to do so, but I am sorry to say that they will not find much in it on social care.

Contributions today, even from the Conservative Party, have been constructive and, if the Conservatives were to come to power, I hope that it would be the priorities outlined in their contributions this afternoon that would be acted upon, rather than those outlined in their manifesto.

Finally, Gwenda Thomas mentioned the importance of the workforce, and the need to improve the skills of those entering that workforce. It seems that a corner has been

iechyd, boed hynny yng Nghymru neu yn y DU, ni cheir cyfeiriad o gwbl at ofal cymdeithasol. Mae'n anodd derbyn rhai o'r sylwadau a wnaed gan y Blaid Geidwadol am ofal cymdeithasol, pan nad yw'r mater yn cael ei ystyried yn ddigon pwysig i gael hyd yn oed un frawddeg yn ei maniffesto. Dylai'r Ceidwadwyr ddweud beth y maent yn ei gynnig, neu dewi am y mater hwn.

**David Melding:** Mae'r geiriau ymosodol hyn wedi fy synnu. Yr oeddem yn trafod yn dawel—

**Mark Isherwood** *a gododd—*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mark, nid yw'r drefn yn caniatáu ichi sefyll y tu ôl i David pan fydd yn ymyrryd. Rhaid ichi eistedd i lawr.

**David Melding:** Tynnodd hynny'r gwynt o'm hwyliau, braidd.

Bu hon yn drafodaeth adeiladol. Mae'r Blaid Geidwadol wedi cyhoeddi ei pholisiau'n gynhwysfawr ac yn helaeth, ac mae'r maniffesto'n canolbwytio ar ein 10 addewid allweddol. Yr ydych yn cyfeiliorni wrth ystumio hynny, Weinidog.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae'n siŵr bod 10 ymrwymiad yn eich maniffesto, ond nid yw gofal cymdeithasol yn teilyngu un cyfeiriad, hyd yn oed. Bernir y llwyddiant ar sail yr hyn a ysgrifennir i bobl ei ddarllen a'i weld. Dywedodd Michael Howard ei fod eisiau i bobl ddarllen y maniffesto Ceidwadol, a rhwydd hynt i unrhyw un sydd yn ddigon gwirion i wneud hynny, ond mae'n ddrwg gennyl ddweud na welant lawer am ofal cymdeithasol ynddo.

Mae'r cyfraniadau heddiw, hyd yn oed gan y Blaid Geidwadol, wedi bod yn rhai adeiladol a, phe bai'r Ceidwadwyr yn dod i rym, yr wyf yn gobeithio mai ar y blaenoriaethau a amlinellwyd yn eu cyfraniadau y prynhawn yma y byddent yn gweithredu, yn hytrach na'r rhai a amlinellir yn eu maniffesto.

Yn olaf, cyfeiriodd Gwenda Thomas at bwysigrwydd y gweithlu, a'r angen i wella sgiliau'r bobl hynny sydd yn ymuno â'r gweithlu. Ymddengys fod cynnydd wedi ei

turned at last in terms of the number of people undertaking training in social work through the initiatives that we have taken. The number of people in the social care workforce with basic and higher qualifications continues to increase, which is important to underpin the quality of services that people can expect.

wneud o'r diwedd o ran nifer y bobl sydd yn ymgymryd â hyfforddiant mewn gwaith cymdeithasol drwy'r camau yr ydym wedi eu cymryd. Mae nifer y bobl yn y gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol sydd â chymwysterau sylfaenol ac uwch yn parhau i gynyddu, sydd yn bwysig o ran cynnal ansawdd y gwasanaethau y gall pobl eu disgwyl.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.*

*Amendment 1: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*

*Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM2376): O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM2376): For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff

Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.38 p.m.  
 The meeting ended at 5.38 p.m.*

#### **Aelodau a'u Pleidiau**

##### **Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur—Labour)  
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur—Labour)  
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru—Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru—Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru—Welsh Conservatives)  
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru—Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur—Labour)  
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru—Welsh Conservatives)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur—Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur—Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur—Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur—Labour)  
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru—Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru—Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales)

Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales)  
 Essex, Sue (Llafur—Labour)  
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru—Welsh Conservatives)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru—Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru—Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur—Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur—Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur—Labour)  
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur—Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur—Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur—Labour)  
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur—Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru—Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur—Labour)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur—Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur—Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru—Welsh Conservatives)  
 Law, Peter (Llafur—Labour)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur—Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur—Labour)  
 Marek, John (Annibynnol—Independent)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru—Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur—Labour)  
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru—Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur—Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur—Labour)  
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur—Labour)  
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru—Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales)  
 Sergeant, Carl (Llafur—Labour)  
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur—Labour)  
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur—Labour)  
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur—Labour)  
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales)  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales)  
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru—Welsh Conservatives)  
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru—Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales)