



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)**

Dydd Mawrth, 8 Mawrth 2005

Tuesday, 8 March 2005

Cynnwys Contents

Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister	3
Datganiad Busnes Business Statement.....	28
Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion Composite Motion: Approval of Orders.....	34
Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Asesu Adnoddau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2005 a Rheoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Symiau at Anghenion Personol) (Cymru) 2005 Approval of the National Assistance (Assessment of Resources) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2005 and the National Assistance (Sums for Personal Requirement) (Wales) Regulations 2005	37
Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Symiau at Anghenion Personol) (Cymru) 2005 Approval of the National Assistance (Sums for Personal Requirement) (Wales) Regulations 2005	51
Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Llywodraeth Leol (Dangosyddion Perfformiad Gwerth Gorau) (Cymru) 2005 a Gorchymyn Llywodraeth Leol (Dangosyddion Perfformiad Gwerth Gorau) (Cymru) (Dirymu) 2005 Approval of the Local Government (Best Value Performance Indicators) (Wales) Order 2005 and the Local Government (Best Value Performance Indicators) (Wales) Order 2002 (Revocation) Order 2005	54
Cymeradwyo Cyfarwyddiadau Sylweddau Ymbelydrol (Diogelwch Cenedlaethol) (Cymru) 2005 Approval of the Radioactive Substances (National Security) (Wales) Directions 2005	65
Cymeradwyo'r Gyllideb Atodol Approval of the Supplementary Budget.....	75
Cymeradwyo Newidiadau Diwedd Blwyddyn i Brif Grwpiau Gwariant Approval of End-year Changes to Main Expenditure Groups	84
Cymeradwyo Adroddiad Grant Arbennig Rhif 6 (Cymru) 2004: Refeniw Ysgol Ychwanegol Approval of Special Grant Report No. 6 (Wales) 2004: Additional School Revenue	90

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been
included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister

Cyflwyno Brecwastau am Ddim mewn Ysgolion The Roll-out of Free School Breakfasts

Q1 Helen Mary Jones: Will the First Minister make a statement on the roll-out of free school breakfasts? OAQ0237(FM)

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): Some 44 schools in the Communities First areas of nine local education authorities provided such breakfasts last term. Two additional local education authorities are participating this term. Primary schools in Communities First areas in all remaining local education authorities will be offered participation from September 2005. New schools will be added incrementally until the full roll-out, by January 2007.

Helen Mary Jones: I would like to thank the First Minister for his reply, but I would find it rather difficult to do so. We are tired of this nonsense, First Minister. Is it not the truth that you have neither the funds in the budget nor the legal powers to implement your election pledge on free breakfasts? It was not a pledge about Communities First areas, and was not about schools opting in; it was about a free breakfast for all children in Wales. You do not have the money and you do not have the legal powers, so is it any wonder that, according to the *Times Educational Supplement*, your electoral support among teachers in Wales is haemorrhaging to Plaid Cymru?

The First Minister: None of that is true, I fear. We have made it clear from the beginning, in April 2003, when we published the manifesto commitment, that such schemes depend, in the end, on headteachers and governors wanting to take part. It is not a compulsory scheme, and we made that clear

C1 Helen Mary Jones: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar gyflwyno brecwastau am ddim mewn ysgolion? OAQ0237(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan): Gwnaeth rhyw 44 o ysgolion yn ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf naw awdurdod addysg lleol ddarparu brecwastau o'r fath y tymor diwethaf. Mae dau awdurdod addysg lleol ychwanegol yn cymryd rhan y tymor hwn. Bydd ysgolion cynradd mewn ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn yr holl awdurdodau addysg lleol sy'n weddill yn cael cynnig i gymryd rhan o fis Medi 2005. Ychwanegir ysgolion newydd fesul tipyn, hyd nes y byddant wedi'u cyflwyno ym mhob man, erbyn Ionawr 2007.

Helen Mary Jones: Byddai'n dda gennyf allu diolch i'r Prif Weinidog, ond fe'i cawn braidd yn anodd gwneud hynny. Yr ydym wedi blino ar y lol hwn, Brif Weinidog. Onid y gwir yw nad oes gennych na'r arian yn y gyllideb na'r pwerau cyfreithiol y mae eu hangen i gyflawni'r addewid etholiadol a wnaethoch ar frecwastau am ddim? Nid addewid ynghylch ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ydoedd, ac nid oedd yn ymwneud â dewis gan ysgolion i gymryd rhan; yr oedd yn ymwneud â brecwastau am ddim i holl blant Cymru. Nid oes gennych na'r arian na'r pwerau cyfreithiol angenrheidiol, felly a oes ryfedd, fel y dywed y *Times Educational Supplement*, fod y gefnogaeth etholiadol sydd gennych ymysg athrawon yng Nghymru yn mynd at Blaid Cymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oes dim o hynny'n wir, mae arnaf ofn. Eglurasom ar y dechrau, yn Ebrill 2003, pan gyhoeddasom yr ymrwymiad yn y maniffesto, fod cynlluniau o'r fath yn dibynnu, yn y pen draw, ar ddymuniad penaethiaid a llywodraethwyr ysgol i gymryd rhan. Nid cynllun gorfodol

over two years ago. We said that we would provide the funding for any school willing to participate, but we cannot make schools participate. Likewise, we cannot make children eat free breakfasts. That has been made clear from the beginning, in April 2003. All allegations to the contrary are myth-making by Plaid Cymru.

Jeff Cuthbert: Do you agree that this constant carping about the alleged underfunding or under-resourcing of this scheme will only cause confusion and worry in the minds of teaching staff, school workers and parents? The truth is that the benefits of this scheme, in terms of improved learning, attendance and performance, far outweigh the criticism of opposition parties.

The First Minister: That is what it is about: better behaviour and concentration. We know that the scheme brings major benefits to less well-off areas. We introduced it because of the evidence from its early versions, provided under lottery funding. Headteachers were happy to say that this scheme brought greater benefits in improving kids' ability to learn than any other single educational initiative that they had seen in 30 years of teaching. That is why we thought that it was a good idea to spread the scheme and roll it out across Wales, based on proper funding rather than on lottery money. That is what we are doing.

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): When this policy was put forward as part of your pre-election platform for the last Assembly elections, this was promised to every primary schoolchild in Wales. We now know that that promise was not true. What would happen if parents, or children, wanted breakfast provided at a school that had not opted in to this system? What would you say to them?

The First Minister: I would say exactly what we said in April 2003. In our manifesto launch document, we said that such schemes depended on headteachers and governors wanting to take part, that a new Labour Welsh Assembly Government—which was

ydyw, ac esglurasom hynny fwy na dwy flynedd yn ôl. Dywedasom y darparem yr arian i unrhyw ysgol sy'n barod i gymryd rhan, ond ni allwn orfodi ysgolion i gymryd rhan. Yn yr un modd, ni allwn orfodi plant i fwyta brecwast a gynigir am ddim. Eglurwyd hynny ar y dechrau, yn Ebrill 2003. Mae'r holl honiadau i'r gwrthwyneb wedi'u dyfeisio gan Blaid Cymru.

Jeff Cuthbert: A ydych yn cytuno mai'r cwbl a wnaiff y cwyno parhaus i'r perwyl nad oes digon o arian neu adnoddau ar gyfer y cynllun fydd peri dryswch a gofid ym meddyliau athrawon, gweithwyr mewn ysgolion a rhieni? Y gwir amdani yw bod manteision y cynllun hwn, o ran gwell dysgu, presenoldeb a pherfformiad, yn troi'r fantol yn erbyn beirmiadaeth y gwrthbleidiau.

Y Prif Weinidog: Dyna'r amcan: sicrhau gwell ymddygiad a gallu i ganolbwyntio. Gwyddom fod y cynllun yn dod â buddion mawr i ardaloedd llai cefnog. Fe'i cyflwynasom oherwydd y dystiolaeth a gafwyd o'r fersiynau cynharach ohono, a ddarparwyd o dan nawdd y loteri. Yr oedd penaethiaid ysgol yn fodlon dweud bod y cynllun hwn yn dod â mwy o fuddion o ran gwella gallu plant i ddysgu na'r un fenter addysgol arall a welsant mewn 30 mlynedd o ddysgu. Dyna pam y credasom mai syniad da oedd ehangu'r cynllun a'i gyflwyno ledled Cymru, ar sail cyllid iawn yn hytrach nag arian y loteri. Dyna'r hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud.

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): Pan gyflwynwyd y polisi hwn fel rhan o'ch ymgyrch gynetholiadol ar gyfer etholiadau diwethaf y Cynulliad, addawyd hyn i'r holl blant mewn ysgolion cynradd yng Nghymru. Gwyddom bellach nad oedd honno'n addewid ddilys. Beth a ddigwyddai pe byddai rhieni, neu blant, yn dymuno cael brecwastau mewn ysgol nad oedd wedi dewis cymryd rhan yn y system hon? Beth a ddywedech wrthynt?

Y Prif Weinidog: Dywedwn yr union beth a ddywedasom yn Ebrill 2003. Yn ein dogfen ar gyfer lansio'r manifesto, dywedasom fod cynlluniau o'r fath yn dibynnu ar ddymuniad penaethiaid a llywodraethwyr ysgol i gymryd rhan, y byddai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru

elected—would provide the funding to any school willing to participate, but that we could not make them do so. The situation could not be clearer. There is no problem with this. We have always made it clear that this is not a compulsory scheme. You are trying to pretend that we claimed that it would be, and that every school would have to take part. However, our manifesto launch document from April 2003 makes it clear that your allegations—and those made by Helen Mary Jones—are absolute balderdash.

Nick Bourne: Every parent in Wales listening to you will be stunned, because your campaign was clear—you campaigned for every schoolchild to have this flying start. That is not the case. Take another point: initially, you said that a breakfast would cost £1.50, which is a credible figure, but that has now come down to 30p. What has been left out of the breakfast that could have been bought for £1.50?

The First Minister: I am pleased that you are now conceding that what you said earlier was balderdash, because it was in the April 2003 Welsh Labour briefing paper. To demolish the other part of your allegation, we believe that the money put aside for nutritious breakfasts—and there has been a major change since the time of the lottery-funded programmes towards having a nutritious breakfast, rather than merely providing a breakfast—will provide a nutritious meal for all the children in schools that wish to take this up.

Nick Bourne: That is interesting. The difference, therefore, is between offering a breakfast—which is what you did initially—at a cost of £1.50, and offering a nutritious breakfast at a cost of 30p. That is a most extraordinary statement. Is not the reality that your school breakfast policy is toast, and that toast is just about all 30p will buy, First Minister?

The First Minister: If you were to visit a school offering free school breakfasts, Nick, you would find out the truth, which is that the school breakfasts provided under lottery funding—good and useful though they

Lafur—a etholwyd—yn darparu'r arian i unrhyw ysgol a oedd yn barod i gymryd rhan, ond na allem eu gorfodi i wneud hynny. Mae'r sefyllfa'n hollol glir. Nid oes unrhyw anhawster ynghylch hyn. Yr ydym wedi egluro erioed nad yw'n gynllun gorfodol. Yr ydych yn ceisio cymryd arnoch ein bod wedi honni mai felly y byddai, ac y byddai pob ysgol yn gorfod cymryd rhan. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ddogfen ar gyfer lansio ein maniffesto yn Ebrill 2003 yn dangos bod eich honiadau chi—a'r rhai a wnaeth Helen Mary Jones—yn nonsens pur.

Nick Bourne: Bydd pob rhiant yng Nghymru sy'n gwranddo arnoch wedi'i syfrdanu, gan fod eich ymgyrch yn glir—gwnaethoch ymgyrchu dros roi hwb ymlaen yn y modd hwn i bob plentyn ysgol. Nid felly y mae. Cymerwch bwynt arall: ar y dechrau, dywedasoch y byddai brechwast yn costio £1.50, sy'n ffigur credadwy, ond mae wedi gostwng bellach i 30c. Beth sydd wedi'i hepgor o'r brechwast y gallesid ei brynu am £1.50?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn derbyn yn awr mai nonsens oedd yr hyn a ddywedasoch yn gynharach, gan fod hyn ym mhapur briffio Llafur Cymru yn Ebrill 2003. Er mwyn gwrthbrofi'r rhan arall o'ch honiad, credwn y bydd yr arian a neilltuwyd ar gyfer brechwastau maethlon—a bu newid mawr ers adeg y rhaglenni a noddwyd gan y loteri er mwyn cael brechwast maethlon, yn hytrach na dim ond darparu brechwast—yn darparu pryd bwyd maethlon i'r holl blant mewn ysgolion sy'n dymuno cymryd rhan yn hyn.

Nick Bourne: Mae hynny'n ddiddorol. Y gwahaniaeth, felly, yw hwnnw rhwng cynnig brechwast—sef yr hyn a wnaethoch ar y dechrau—ar gost o £1.50, a chynnig brechwast maethlon ar gost o 30c. Mae hwnnw'n ddatganiad rhyfeddol. Onid y gwir amdani yw mai'ch polisi ar frechwastau am ddim yw tost, ac mai tost yw'r cwbl bron y gellir ei brynu â 30c, Brif Weinidog?

Y Prif Weinidog: Pe byddech yn ymweld ag ysgol sy'n cynnig brechwastau am ddim yn yr ysgol, Nick, caech wybod y gwir, sef nad oedd y brechwastau yn yr ysgol a ddarperid o dan nawdd y loteri—er eu bod yn dda ac yn

were—were not based on a take-up of nutritious breakfast elements, namely slow-release carbohydrates, as distinct from fast-release carbohydrates, such as toast, which you mentioned. Kids are taking this up, because they find that it tastes better. The funding available for the scheme is adequate to provide a nutritious school breakfast.

Jenny Randerson: First Minister, I am interested in your answer that the free school breakfast initiative will be rolled out to all those schools that want it in September. In light of that statement, you have clearly done your maths and have given yourself a best guess on the global figure required for its full implementation. Why then are the costs still hidden in the reserve? I have looked with concern at the supplementary budget and there is no reference in it to the cost of the free school breakfast scheme. Are you keeping this information from us so that you can hold another big launch prior to the general election, or are you intending to put this forward next year? Please confirm your timetable for this.

The First Minister: Had you listened a little more carefully, you would have heard that I did not say September this year; I said that the full roll-out would be in January 2007. The figures for 2007-08 will be revisited once we have considered the evidence from the pilot scheme and the independent evaluation.

Hyfforddi Wardeiniaid Diogelwch Cymunedol The Training of Community Safety Wardens

Q2 William Graham: Will the First Minister make a statement on the training of community safety wardens? OAQ0261(FM)

The First Minister: As community safety wardens are not directly part of the extended police family, it is for their employing organisation to ensure that they are adequately trained both to meet the reasonable expectations of their local community and to protect their personal safety.

William Graham: Do you agree that the

fuddiol—yn rhai a oedd wedi'u seilio ar yr elfennau a geir mewn brecwast maethlon, sef carbohydradau sy'n rhyddhau egni'n araf, yn hytrach na'r rhai sy'n ei ryddhau'n gyflym, fel tost, y cyfeiriasoch ato. Mae plant yn manteisio ar y cynnig, gan eu bod yn cael gwell blas arno. Mae'r arian sydd ar gael ar gyfer y cynllun yn ddigon i ddarparu brecwast maethlon yn yr ysgol.

Jenny Randerson: Brif Weinidog, ymddiddoraf yn eich ateb i'r perwyl y bydd y fenter brecwastau am ddim yn cael ei chyflwyno yn yr holl ysgolion sy'n dymuno cymryd rhan ym mis Medi. Yng ngoleuni'r datganiad hwnnw, mae'n amlwg eich bod wedi gwneud eich symiau ac wedi gwneud amcangyfrif da o'r cyfanswm y mae ei angen i'w rhoi ar waith yn llawn. Pam, felly, y mae'r costau hynny wedi'u cuddio o hyd yn y cronfeydd wrth gefn? Edrychais yn bryderus ar y gyllideb atodol ac nid oes sôn ynddi am gost y cynllun brecwastau am ddim mewn ysgolion. A ydych yn cadw'r wybodaeth hon oddi wrthym fel y gallwch gynnal cyfarfod lansio mawr arall cyn yr etholiad cyffredinol, neu a ydych yn bwriadu cyflwyno hyn y flwyddyn nesaf? Cadarnhewch eich amserlen ar gyfer hyn, os gwelwch yn dda.

Y Prif Weinidog: Pe byddech wedi gwrandao ychydig yn fwy gofalus, clywsech na chyfeiriais at fis Medi eleni; dywedais y câi ei roi ar waith yn llawn ym mis Ionawr 2007. Adolygir y ffigurau ar gyfer 2007-08 wedi inni ystyried y dystiolaeth a ddaw o'r cynllun peilot a'r gwerthusiad annibynnol.

C2 William Graham: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar hyfforddi wardeniaid diogelwch cymunedol? OAQ0261(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Gan nad oes cysylltiad uniongychol rhwng wardeiniaid diogelwch cymunedol a'r heddlu fel cyfangorff, mater i'r corff sy'n eu cyflogi yw sicrhau eu bod wedi'u hyfforddi'n ddigonol i gwrdd â disgwyliadau rhesymol eu cymuned leol ac i'w hamddiffyn eu hunain.

William Graham: A ydych yn cytuno y

priority must be for police officers and, although community safety wardens have their own role to play, they must be fully trained and should not be a substitute for the police?

The First Minister: I certainly agree that community safety wardens are not a substitute for the police. However, we must recognise that we have a variegated pattern: we have voluntary special constables, who are unpaid but have the power of arrest; we also have police community safety officers now, whom, I understand, have very modest powers of detention; and then we have community safety wardens, who do not. However, they can be accredited, as is currently happening in Gwent.

Community safety wardens can be trained by the local police force, but they are not employed by the police. They may be employed by community safety partnerships, by registered social landlords or by the local authority, but they are not members of the extended police family. They can be trained by the police in order to meet certain standards to protect their own safety and so forth.

dylid rhoi blaenoriaeth i gael heddweision ac, er bod rôl briodol i'w chwarae gan wardeiniaid diogelwch cymunedol, fod rhaid eu hyfforddi'n drylwyr ac na ddylent gymryd lle'r heddlu?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn sicr yn cytuno na allant gymryd lle'r heddlu. Er hynny, rhaid inni gydnabod bod gennym batrwm cymysg: mae gennym gwnstabiliaid arbennig gwirfoddol, nad ydynt yn derbyn cyflog ond sydd â'r hawl i arestio; mae gennym swyddogion diogelwch cymunedol yr heddlu'n awr hefyd, sydd ag ychydig o hawliau i arestio, yr wyf yn deall; ac wedyn mae gennym wardeiniaid diogelwch cymunedol, sydd heb unrhyw hawliau o'r fath. Er hynny, gellir eu hachredu, fel y gwneir ar hyn o bryd yng Ngwent.

Mae modd i wardeiniaid diogelwch cymunedol gael eu hyfforddi gan yr heddlu lleol, ond ni chânt eu cyflogi gan yr heddlu. Gallant gael eu cyflogi gan bartneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol, gan landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig neu gan yr awdurdod lleol, ond nid ydynt yn rhan o gyfangorff yr heddlu. Gallant gael eu hyfforddi gan yr heddlu i gyrraedd safonau penodol er mwyn eu hamddiffyn eu hunain ac yn y blaen

Plismona Lleol Local Policing

Q3 Peter Black: Will the First Minister make a statement on his Government's support for local policing? OAQ0260(FM)

The First Minister: All four Welsh police forces are committed to local policing, and have designated community beat officers in place. These officers get to know the communities that they serve, and get a feel for crime trends. They are also a point of contact for local people, they are approachable and build relationships of trust, thus reducing people's fear of crime.

Peter Black: Thank you for that, First Minister; that is a very good description of the value of a community constable. Do you agree, given the funding crisis facing police

C3 Peter Black: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar y cymorth gan ei Lywodraeth i blismona lleol? OAQ0260(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae pob un o'r pedwar heddlu yng Nghymru wedi ymrwymo i blismona lleol, ac mae ganddynt swyddogion rhawd y gymuned penodol. Mae'r heddweision hyn yn dod i adnabod y cymunedau a wasanaethant, a gallant sylwi ar dueddiadau o ran trosedd. Maent hefyd yn bwynt cyswllt ar gyfer pobl leol, maent yn hawdd mynd atynt ac maent yn meithrin cysylltiadau sy'n ennyn ymddiriedaeth, fel bod gan bobl lai o ofn trosedd.

Peter Black: Diolch i chi am hynny, Brif Weinidog; mae hwnnw'n ddisgrifiad da iawn o werth cwnstabl cymunedol. A ydych yn cytuno, yng ngolwg yr argyfwng ariannu sy'n

authorities, which have some of the lowest grant settlements from the Home Office as well as the Assembly Government capping them, that many chief constables are concerned that they will not be able to afford to place enough constables on the beat around Wales? Do you not think that that contrasts starkly with your Government's and the UK Government's commitment to tackling anti-social behaviour in particular?

The First Minister: I am not sure that you are right about us capping any police authorities. As I understood it, their budgets came in within the capping limit, so the question does not arise. Some of them may not have completed their budget procedures as yet, but I am certainly not aware of any capping.

On the question of how police authorities use their resources, I think that they have enabled the resources to be brought in which have caused the reduction in recorded crime in Wales. I think that recorded crime is up by 1 per cent in England, and down by 2 per cent in Wales, or maybe it is the other way around and up by 2 per cent in England, and down by 1 per cent in Wales. Clearly, they have been successful in that respect.

Lorraine Barrett: First Minister, do you agree that community support officers play a crucial role in helping the police to deal with anti-social behaviour problems in our communities, and that it is disappointing that the Liberal Democrats in Cardiff propose to cut their plans for five such officers in the city?

2.10 p.m.

The First Minister: I am not sure whether we are talking about community support officers as members of the police family, or community support wardens, who are not within the police family, but who may be employed by the local authority either directly or through the community safety partnerships. What is important is that we have this variety of different types of

wynebu awdurdodau heddlu, a gafodd rai o'r setliadau grant isaf gan y Swyddfa Gartref, a chael eu capio gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, fod llawer o brif gwnstabiliaid yn poeni na fyddant yn gallu fforddio cael digon o gwnstabiliaid ar rawd yng Nghymru? Oni chredwch fod hynny'n mynd yn gwbl groes i ymrwymiad eich Llywodraeth chi a Llywodraeth y DU i fynd i'r afael ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yn benodol?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni chredaf eich bod yn iawn wrth ddweud ein bod wedi capio awdurdodau heddlu. Yn ôl a ddeallaf i, yr oedd eu cyllidebau o dan y terfyn ar gyfer capio, felly nid yw'r cwestiwn hwnnw'n codi. Efallai fod rhai ohonynt nad ydynt wedi cwblhau eu prosesau cyllidebu eto ond, yn sicr, ni wn am unrhyw gapio.

Ynghylch y cwestiwn am y modd y mae awdurdodau heddlu wedi defnyddio eu hadnoddau, credaf eu bod wedi hwyluso'r defnydd o adnoddau gan beri gostyngiad yn nifer y troseddau a gofnodwyd yng Nghymru. Credaf fod nifer y troseddau a gofnodwyd wedi codi 1 y cant yn Lloegr, a'i fod wedi gostwng 2 y cant yng Nghymru, neu efallai mai fel arall y mae a'i fod wedi codi 2 y cant yn Lloegr, ac wedi gostwng 1 y cant yng Nghymru. Mae'n amlwg iddynt lwyddo yn hynny o beth.

Lorraine Barrett: Brif Weinidog, a ydych yn cytuno bod swyddogion cefnogi cymunedau'n chwarae rhan hollbwysig wrth helpu'r heddlu i ddelio â phroblemau sy'n ymwneud ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yn ein cymunedau, ac mai testun siom yw bod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yng Nghaerdydd yn bwriadu rhoi'r gorau i'w cynllun i gael pum swyddog o'r fath yn y ddinas?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn sicr ai swyddogion cefnogi cymunedau sy'n rhan o gyfangorff yr heddlu sydd dan sylw, ynteu wardeiniaid cefnogi cymunedau, nad ydynt yn rhan o'r heddlu, ond y gall yr awdurdod lleol eu cyflogi'n uniongyrchol neu drwy'r partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw bod amryw o wahanol fathau o staff plismona cymunedol ar gael i roi sylw

community police personnel available to cover anti-social behaviour, low-level crime as well as high-level crime, and that they should be fully trained, properly protected in terms of their own safety and ability to do the job, and that, when they wear a uniform, they do so with pride, because they know that their presence is helping to ensure safety and reclaim the streets for respectable citizens throughout Wales.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Ymhlith yr ystod o wasanaethau cymunedol sy'n cynorthwyo'r heddlu yn ei waith mae'r cynllun gwarchod cymdogaeth. Mae cyllid Cymdeithas Gwarchod y Gymdogaeth yn cael ei fygwth ar hyn o bryd. A allwch chi warantu y bydd cyllid y gwasanaeth pwysig hwn yn cael ei sicrhau?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oes gennyf fanylion am gyllid Cymdeithas Gwarchod y Gymdogaeth. Gofynnaf i Edwina Hart ysgrifennu atoch gyda'r manylion.

Leighton Andrews: First Minister, do you recall visiting the very successful community policing scheme in Tylorstown in my constituency, which has been well supported? Do you think that we would get more community policing schemes if prisoners were allowed to vote in elections, as one political party appears to desire?

The First Minister: I do not want to comment on matters that are more properly the province of the Home Office, but I certainly recall the visit to Tylorstown. It was extremely persuasive. The community support officers and neighbourhood police were able to show how pensioners would approach them, and give them the registration numbers of cars that they were convinced were passing along the same route at the same time every day, probably in order to sell, or to attempt to sell, drugs to teenagers in local secondary schools and even to children in some primary schools. The pensioners had the confidence to do that, because they wanted to drive out unlawful and criminal behaviour from their community. That was rebuilding trust in the police in the community, and a good sign for the future. What Tylorstown is doing today, I am sure other communities will want to

i ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol, mân droseddu yn ogystal â throseddu difrifol, ac y dylent fod wedi'u hyfforddi'n drylwyr, wedi'u hamddiffyn yn briodol o ran eu diogelwch eu hunain a'u gallu i wneud y gwaith, ac, os ydynt mewn gwisg swyddogol, eu bod yn falch o hynny, gan y gwyddant fod eu presenoldeb yn fodd i sicrhau diogelwch ac i adennill y strydoedd i ddinasyddion parchus ledled Cymru.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: The neighbourhood watch scheme is one of the range of community services that assist the police in its work. The Neighbourhood Watch Association's funding is currently under threat. Can you guarantee that funding for this important service will be secured?

The First Minister: I do not have details about the Neighbourhood Watch Association's funding with me. I will ask Edwina Hart to write to you with the details.

Leighton Andrews: Brif Weinidog, a ydych yn cofio ymweld â'r cynllun plismona cymunedol tra llwyddiannus ym Mhendyrus yn fy etholaeth, a gafodd gefnogaeth dda? A gredwch y caem ragor o gynlluniau plismona cymunedol pe caniateid i garcharorion bleidleisio mewn etholiadau, fel y mae un blaid wleidyddol yn dymuno, i bob golwg?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf am wneud sylw ar faterion sy'n perthyn yn agosach i gyfrifoldebau'r Swyddfa Gartref, ond yr wyf yn sicr yn cofio'r ymweliad â Phendyrus, a oedd yn dra pherswadiol. Yr oedd y swyddogion cefnogi cymunedau a heddlu'r gymdogaeth yn gallu dangos sut y deuai pensiynwyr atynt, gan roi iddynt rifau cofrestru ceir yr oeddent yn sicr eu bod yn dilyn yr un llwybr ar yr un adeg bob dydd a hynny, yn ôl pob tebyg, er mwyn gwerthu, neu geisio gwerthu, cyffuriau i rai yn eu harddegau mewn ysgolion uwchradd lleol neu hyd yn oed i blant mewn rhai ysgolion cynradd. Yr oedd y pensiynwyr yn ddigon hyderus i wneud hynny, gan eu bod yn dymuno cael gwared ar yr ymddygiad anghyfreithlon a throseddol yn eu cymuned. Yr oedd hynny'n fodd i ailennyn ymddiriedaeth yn yr heddlu yn y gymuned, ac mae'n argoeli'n dda ar gyfer y dyfodol. Yr

follow tomorrow.

wyf yn siŵr y bydd cymunedau eraill am ddilyn yr hyn y mae Pendyrus yn ei wneud.

Glyn Davies: I met the Glantwymyn Community Council last week. In that very rural area, the main concern was with the shortage of policing. Do you agree that, when taking initiatives in urban areas, and dealing with the sort of initiatives that William Graham mentioned in the previous question, Government must not forget that rural areas also require an adequate level of policing?

Glyn Davies: Cyfarfûm â Chyngor Cymuned Glantwymyn yr wythnos diwethaf. Prif bryder yr ardal dra gwledig honno yw prinder plismona. A ydych yn cytuno ei bod yn bwysig, wrth gymryd camau mewn ardaloedd trefol, ac wrth ddelio â mentrau o'r math y cyfeiriodd William Graham ato yn y cwestiwn blaenorol, nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn anghofio bod ar ardaloedd gwledig angen lefel ddigonol o blismona hefyd?

The First Minister: That is true. As there is not a concentration of population, you will not see police as often as you would in an urban area. However, the proof of the pudding is in the eating, and Dyfed-Powys Police has a phenomenally successful arrest-and-conviction record. I think that it is the best of all 44 police forces in England and Wales. The other notable feature about our four Welsh police forces is that Dyfed-Powys, probably for the reason that it already has this phenomenal arrest-and-conviction record, has not yet made as much use of the ability to apply for community support officers as the other forces have. Of the 300 such officers that are now in place, or scheduled to be in place soon, Dyfed-Powys has only asked for about 10 per cent. That is because it has been so successful as a police force.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae hynny'n wir. Gan fod y boblogaeth yn denau, ni welir swyddogion yr heddlu gyn amled ag y'i gwelid mewn ardal drefol. Er hynny, wrth ei flas y mae profi pwddin, a bu Heddlu Dyfed-Powys yn eithriadol o lwyddiannus o ran arestio troseddwy'r a chael euogfarn Credaf mai ef yw'r gorau o'r 44 o heddluoedd yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Y nodwedd arall sy'n tynnu sylw ynghylch y pedwar heddlu yng Nghymru yw nad ydyw Heddlu Dyfed-Powys, am iddo fod mor llwyddiannus wrth arestio troseddwy'r a chael euogfarn, yn ôl pob tebyg, wedi ymgeisio i'r un graddau â'r heddluoedd eraill am swyddogion cefnogi cymunedau. O'r 300 o swyddogion o'r fath sydd bellach wrth eu gwaith, neu a fydd wrth eu gwaith cyn hir, nid yw Heddlu Dyfed-Powys ond wedi gofyn am tua 10 y cant. Mae hynny am iddo fod mor llwyddiannus fel heddlu.

Adfywio Ardaloedd Trefol The Regeneration of Urban Areas

Q4 David Melding: Will the First Minister make a statement on the importance of public art in the regeneration of urban areas? OAQ0253(FM)

C4 David Melding: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar bwysigrwydd celfyddyd gyhoeddus i adfywio ardaloedd trefol? OAQ0253(FM)

The First Minister: I am sure that we would all agree that public art can deliver an immediate cultural return on public expenditure in urban regeneration areas.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn sicr y byddem oll yn cytuno y gall celfyddyd gyhoeddus ddod ag elw diwylliannol uniongyrchol mewn ardaloedd trefol lle y defnyddir arian cyhoeddus i'w hadfywio.

David Melding: First Minister, would you not go further and confirm that Wales has a wonderful tradition of community involvement in art? Look at the work of the late great sculptor, Jonah Jones, for instance,

David Melding: Brif Weinidog, onid aech ymhellach a chadarnhau bod gan Gymru draddodiad gwych o'r gymuned yn cymryd rhan mewn gweithgarwch celfyddydol? Ystyriwch gerflunwaith gwych y diweddar

being representative of many of the artists that the nation has produced over the years. When we are talking about substantial regeneration, and the moneys involved, we ought to have, as part of an integral commissioning process, public art being encouraged and developed by the community.

The First Minister: I am not familiar with the work of Jonah Jones, I am sorry to say. However, I have seen the name of John Mills pop up time and again as a successful artist whose work is used in public art projects in the context of urban regeneration. You are right that enabling art to come into the community as sculptures and in other forms will allow people to see it and to begin to appreciate what art can do for a community in terms of changing its image and encouraging appreciation of the good things in life. Art has a great part to play.

John Griffiths: You are right to say that public art is important. Will you join me in congratulating local authorities such as Newport City Council, which, in the face of much criticism, has developed a range of public artwork, including the bold and imaginative huge red steel wave by the riverside near Newport bridge?

The First Minister: I commend Newport and all of the other local authorities that have gone in for public art projects, because it takes a lot of courage. Every time you commission a piece of public artwork, it seems to bring out in droves the local papers' green-ink letter writers, who always say, 'This is a blankety-blank waste of time'. This can go on for weeks and months. People then come to accept and appreciate the artwork. This applies to art that becomes world famous, such as the Angel of the North, and to local works that we do not think twice about. However, when the decision is made, there is usually an enormous wave of temporary unpopularity.

Jonah Jones, er enghraifft, ac yntau'n un a oedd yn nodweddiadol o'r llu mawr o artistiaid a gynhyrnodd y genedl dros y blynyddoedd. Yr ydym yn sôn am adfywiad sylweddol, a'r arian y dylem ei gael mewn cysylltiad â hynny, fel rhan o broses gomisiynu gyfannol, fel y caiff celfyddyd gyhoeddus ei hyrwyddo a'i datblygu gan y gymuned.

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn gyfarwydd â gwaith Jonah Jones, mae arnaf ofn. Fodd bynnag, gwelais enw John Mills yn codi dro ar ôl tro fel artist llwyddiannus y defnyddir ei waith mewn prosiectau celfyddyd gyhoeddus yng nghyd-destun adfywio trefol. Yr ydych yn iawn wrth ddweud y bydd pobl yn gallu gweld celfyddyd drwy sicrhau lle iddi yn y gymuned ar ffurf cerfluniau ac mewn ffurfiau eraill, ac y byddant yn dechrau gwerthfawrogi'r hyn y gall celfyddyd ei wneud dros y gymuned o ran newid ei delwedd ac annog pobl i werthfawrogi'r pethau da mewn bywyd. Mae gan gelfyddyd ran bwysig i'w chwarae.

John Griffiths: Yr ydych yn iawn wrth ddweud bod celfyddyd gyhoeddus yn bwysig. A wnewch chi ymuno â mi i longyfarch awdurdodau lleol fel Cyngor Dinas Casnewydd, sydd wedi datblygu amryw o gelfweithiau cyhoeddus, yn wyneb llawer o feirniadaeth, gan gynnwys y don ddu goch enfawr, sy'n feiddgar ac yn llawn dychymyg, sy'n sefyll ar lan yr afon ger pont Casnewydd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Canmolaf Gyngor Dinas Casnewydd a'r holl awdurdodau lleol eraill a ymgymerodd â phrosiectau celfyddyd gyhoeddus, gan fod hynny'n gofyn llawer o ddewrder. Bob tro y comisiynir celfwaith cyhoeddus, ymddengys fod hynny'n denu awduron y llythyrau inc gwyrdd i ysgrifennu at y papurau lleol yn eu lluoedd, gan ddweud bob tro, 'Mae hyn yn wastraff amser o'r mwyaf'. Gall hynny barhau am wythnosau a misoedd. Wedyn daw pobl i dderbyn a gwerthfawrogi'r celfwaith. Mae hynny'n wir am gelfweithiau sy'n dod yn enwog drwy'r byd, fel yr *Angel of the North*, ac am weithiau lleol nad ydym yn meddwl ddwywaith yn eu cylch. Er hynny, pan wneir y penderfyniad, daw ymchwydd o amhoblogrwydd dros dro, fel arfer.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): Public art is obviously important in urban regeneration, as is European funding. At a recent meeting of the Committee on European and External Affairs, you said that you felt that the decision on the future of European structural funds in Wales would not be made this year. If this does not happen until next year, what will happen within the next 12 months to all the expertise and jobs that have been built up in trying to manage the European projects and programmes?

The Presiding Officer: Order. It would be helpful if this question were related to public art, as it would then be in order.

Michael German: One of the programmes that will be affected is the culture programme, which has an enormous impact on art across the European Union. The commission is proposing a huge increase in the programme's budget, which would help Wales. If a decision is not made until next year, the jobs of those who currently operate our Objective 1 programme will be under threat, because, at that time, we will be halfway through the new programmes.

The First Minister: If it is not completed this year, which effectively means in the next three months—on 19 June—there will be a late start, as happened in 2000. That would be regrettable. We would hope that it can be completed during the Luxembourg presidency. That would bring a whole range of benefits, including continuity and an ability to switch easily to areas that may be emphasised more between 2007 and 2013, which may or may not include the funding of public art under Objective 1. I do not know whether this can be done, but I will write to you on that point.

Michael German: The issue is whether this will be decided before June, and before the UK presidency. Could you tell us why you do not think that this matter can be resolved by that time? Is it because there is a different attitude towards what is obviously in Wales's

Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): Mae'n amlwg bod celfyddyd gyhoeddus yn bwysig yng nghyd-destun adfywio trefol, fel y mae arian Ewropeaidd. Yn un o gyfarfodydd y Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd ac Allanol yn ddiweddar, dywedasoeh eich bod yn rhagweld na fyddid yn penderfynu ar ddyfodol cronfeydd strwythrol Ewropeaidd yng Nghymru eleni. Os na ddigwydd hynny tan y flwyddyn nesaf, beth a ddigwydd o fewn y 12 mis nesaf i'r holl arbenigedd a swyddi a grëwyd wrth geisio rheoli'r prosiectau a'r rhaglenni Ewropeaidd?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Byddai o gymorth pe byddai'r cwestiwn hwn yn ymwneud â chelfyddyd gyhoeddus, gan y byddai mewn trefn wedyn.

Michael German: Un o'r rhaglenni a effeithir yw'r rhaglen ddiwylliant, a gaiff effaith aruthrol ar gelfyddyd ledled yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Mae'r comisiwn yn cynnig cynnydd enfawr yng nghyllideb y rhaglen honno, a byddai hynny o gymorth i Gymru. Os na phenderfynir tan y flwyddyn nesaf, bydd swyddi'r rhai sy'n rhedeg ein rhaglen Amcan 1 ar hyn o bryd o dan fygythiad, oherwydd, bryd hynny, byddwn hanner ffordd drwy'r rhaglenni newydd.

Y Prif Weinidog: Os na chwblheir hyn eleni, sef yn y tri mis nesaf, i bob pwrpas—ar 19 Mehefin—bydd y gwaith yn dechrau'n hwyr, fel a ddigwyddodd yn 2000. Byddai hynny'n destun gofid. Gobeithiwn y gellir ei gwblhau yn ystod llywyddiaeth Lwsembwrg. Deuai amryw o fanteision yn sgîl hynny, gan gynnwys dilyniant a'r gallu i droi'n rhwydd at feysydd y gellid rhoi mwy o bwyslais arnynt rhwng 2007 a 2013, ac mae'n bosibl bod hynny'n cynnwys ariannu celfyddyd gyhoeddus o dan Amcan 1. Ni wn a ellir gwneud hynny, ond ysgrifennaf atoch ynghylch y pwynt hwnnw.

Michael German: Y pwnc dan sylw yw a benderfynir ar hyn cyn mis Mehefin, a chyn cyfnod llywyddiaeth y DU. A allwch ddweud wrthym pam y credwch na ellir datrys y mater hwn erbyn hynny? Ai am fod agwedd wahanol at yr hyn sy'n amlwg yn fwyaf

best interests, which is to try to secure a good Objective 1 programme from 2007 onwards?

The First Minister: No, not at all. Any country that has a major interest in an issue, as the UK has in Objective 1 between 2007 and 2013, does not normally push it forward for solution during its presidency because it cannot chair a meeting and argue the case at the same time. While the UK can argue the case strongly during the Luxembourg presidency and, in theory, during the Austrian presidency, it will not be able to both chair meetings and debate issues in the second half of this year. Let us all hope that the Luxembourgers can pull it off and that this matter can be settled in the final summit meeting, which I think is to be held in three months' time, on 19 June.

manteisiol i Gymru, sef ceisio sicrhau rhaglen dda o dan Amcan 1 o 2007 ymlaen?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nage, ddim o gwbl. Os oes buddiant pwysig gan wlad mewn rhyw fater, fel y mae gan y DU yn Amcan 1 rhwng 2007 a 2013, ni fydd fel arfer yn ceisio cael penderfyniad arno yn ystod ei llywyddiaeth gan na all gadeirio cyfarfod a dadlau'r achos ar yr un pryd. Er y gall y DU ddadlau'r achos yn gryf yn ystod llywyddiaeth Lwcsembwrg ac, mewn egwyddor, yn ystod llywyddiaeth Awstria, ni fydd yn gallu cadeirio cyfarfodydd a dadlau ynghylch materion sy'n codi yn ail hanner y flwyddyn hon. Gadewch inni oll obeithio y gall y Lwcsembwrgiaid fynd â'r maen i'r wal ac y gellir datrys y mater hwn yn yr uwchgynhadledd derfynol, sydd i'w chynnal ymhen tri mis, yr wyf yn credu, ar 19 Mehefin.

Iechyd Rhywiol Sexual Health

Q5 Val Lloyd: Will the First Minister make a statement on sexual health in Wales?
OAQ0245(FM)

The First Minister: The Assembly Government's review of HIV and sexual health services has been completed, and its recommendations are being implemented. The need for such services is made all the more urgent by the continuing increase in the rate of sexually transmitted infections in Wales, including chlamydia. We welcome the progress made on the review, but we still have much to do to provide and modernise accessible services throughout Wales.

Val Lloyd: It is important that local services such as those provided at the Swish centre in Swansea, which is the only centre in Wales to provide social care for those living with HIV, are supported by the Assembly and the local administration. Do you share my concerns about reducing funding for such a vital resource?

2.20 p.m.

The First Minister: Yes, of course. The only issue at stake, or difference of opinion,

C5 Val Lloyd: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar iechyd rhywiol yng Nghymru?
OAQ0245(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae adolygiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o HIV a gwasanaethau iechyd rhywiol wedi'i gwblhau, ac mae ei argymhellion yn cael eu rhoi ar waith. Mae'r angen am wasanaethau o'r fath yn dwysáu oherwydd y cynnydd parhaus yng nghyfradd yr heintiau a drosglwyddir yn rhywiol yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys clamydia. Croesawn y cynnydd a wnaed ar yr adolygiad, ond mae gennym lawer i'w wneud o hyd i ddarparu a moderneiddio gwasanaethau hygyrch ledled Cymru.

Val Lloyd: Mae'n bwysig bod gwasanaethau lleol fel y rhai a gynigir yng nghanolfan Swish yn Abertawe, sef yr unig ganolfan yng Nghymru sy'n cynnig gofal cymdeithasol i'r rhai sydd â HIV, yn cael eu cefnogi gan y Cynulliad a'r weinyddiaeth leol. A ydych yn rhannu fy mhryderon ynghylch lleihau'r arian ar gyfer adnodd hollbwysig o'r fath?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ydwyf, wrth gwrs. Yr unig fater sydd yn y fantol, neu'r unig

between Swansea Local Health Board and Swish is the extent to which Swish concentrates almost entirely on caring for people with HIV. I think that Swansea Local Health Board wants the centre to continue to do that, while extending its services to HIV prevention activities. I think that that is the only difference of view that may be causing the problems to which you alluded in your question.

Jonathan Morgan: One of the Royal College of Nursing's top priorities is for there to be a school nurse in every school in Wales. A reason that the royal college gives for supporting and pushing this aim is that sexual health, as a priority alongside mental and physical health, can be promoted among young people by school nurses. Does your Government support that top priority of the royal college?

The First Minister: We are in the middle of considering exactly what to do in response to the December 2004 completion of the review of primary care and community nursing, which was submitted to Jane Hutt in December 2004, and which Brian Gibbons is now carrying forward. The review examines the role of school nurses in Wales, including their role in promoting the health of young people, which includes their sexual health. The findings of the review are under consideration, and its recommendations will be subject to public consultation in the near future.

Kirsty Williams: Sexual health services have often been called cinderella services. However, in the field of sexual health, the provision of psychosexual counselling has received no attention at all. Do you agree that individuals who have problems associated with their sex life and their sexuality should have access to a comprehensive, Wales-wide psychosexual counselling service? What is your Government's approach to this?

The First Minister: I will write to you on that because, as you will be aware, we have Dr Marion Lyons in post now—the consultant in communicable disease control—in the national public health service, and she has been seconded to us as director of

wahaniaeth barn, rhwng Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Abertawe a Swish yw'r graddau y mae Swish yn canolbwyntio'n gyfan gwbl bron ar ofalu am rai sydd â HIV. Credaf fod Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Abertawe am i'r ganolfan barhau i wneud hynny, gan ymestyn ei gwasanaethau i gynnwys gweithgareddau atal HIV. Credaf mai hwnnw yw'r unig wahaniaeth barn a allai fod yn peri'r anawsterau y cyfeiriasoch atynt yn eich cwestiwn.

Jonathan Morgan: Un o brif flaenoriaethau Coleg Brenhinol y Nyrsys yw cael nyrs ysgol ym mhob ysgol yng Nghymru. Un rheswm y mae'r coleg brenhinol yn ei gynnig dros gefnogi a hyrwyddo'r amcan hwnnw yw y gall nyrsys ysgol hybu iechyd rhywiol ymysg pobl ifanc, gan roi iddo'r un flaenoriaeth ag iechyd corfforol a meddyliol. A yw'ch Llywodraeth yn cefnogi'r brif flaenoriaeth honno o eiddo'r coleg brenhinol?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym wrthi'n ystyried yr hyn y dylid ei wneud yn union mewn ymateb i'r adolygiad o ofal sylfaenol a nyrsio cymunedol, a gwblhawyd yn Rhagfyr 2004, a gyflwynwyd i Jane Hutt yn Rhagfyr 2004, ac y mae Brian Gibbons yn bwrw ymlaen â'r gwaith yn awr. Mae'r adolygiad yn ystyried rôl nyrsys ysgol yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys eu rôl wrth hybu iechyd pobl ifanc, sy'n cynnwys iechyd rhywiol. Mae casgliadau'r adolygiad yn cael eu hystyried, a chynhelir ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus ar ei argymhellion yn y dyfodol agos.

Kirsty Williams: Dywedwyd yn aml mai gwasanaethau iechyd rhywiol yw'r gwasanaethau anghofiedig. Fodd bynnag, ym maes iechyd rhywiol, ni roddwyd unrhyw sylw o gwbl i ddarparu cynghori seicorywiol. A ydych yn cytuno y dylai gwasanaeth cynghori seicorywiol cynhwysfawr fod ar gael ledled Cymru i'r rhai sy'n profi problemau sy'n gysylltiedig â'u bywyd rhywiol a'u rhywioldeb? Beth yw barn eich Llywodraeth am hynny?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ysgrifennaf atoch ynghylch hynny oherwydd, fel y gwyddoch, mae Dr Marion Lyons—yr ymgynghorydd ar reoli clefydau trosglwyddadwy—wrth ei gwaith yn awr yn y gwasanaeth iechyd cyhoeddus cenedlaethol, ac mae wedi'i

the HIV and sexual health services modernisation project. We believe that, among the many services, it could be that the particular service that you referred to is underfunded or not given sufficient priority. However, we have carried out a thorough review of services, so we think that we know what is required to modernise services, but the particular point you raised is a matter on which Brian Gibbons or I will write to you.

secondio i weithio gyda ni fel cyfarwyddwr y prosiect ar foderneiddio gwasanaethau iechyd rhywiol a HIV. Credwn ei bod yn bosibl bod y gwasanaeth penodol y cyfeiriasoch ato, ymysg y nifer mawr o wasanaethau, wedi'i danariannu neu heb gael digon o flaenoriaeth. Fodd bynnag, cynaliasom adolygiad trwyadl o'r gwasanaethau, felly credwn ein bod yn gwybod yr hyn y mae ei angen i foderneiddio gwasanaethau, ond gwnaiff Brian Gibbons neu finnau ysgrifennu atoch ynghylch y pwynt penodol a godasoch.

Gweithgareddau Hamdden Recreational Activities

Q6 Catherine Thomas: Will the First Minister make a statement on what the Welsh Assembly Government is doing to support recreational activities across Wales? OAQ0232(FM)

C6 Catherine Thomas: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar yr hyn y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i gefnogi gweithgareddau hamdden ledled Cymru? OAQ0232(FM)

The First Minister: We support recreational activities across the board. That is described in the 'Climbing Higher' strategy, which sets out our strategic direction in relation to encouraging greater participation in sport and physical activity. Health Challenge Wales also provides Assembly-wide encouragement to individuals and organisations to take part more widely in recreational activities that have a health benefit.

Y Prif Weinidog: Rhoddwn gefnogaeth i weithgareddau adloniadol yn gyffredinol. Disgrifir hynny yn y strategaeth 'Dringo'n Uwch', sy'n nodi ein dull strategol o gymell mwy o gyfranogiad mewn chwaraeon a gweithgareddau corfforol. Mae Her Iechyd Cymru hefyd yn cynnig anogaeth gan y Cynulliad cyfan i unigolion a chyrrff gymryd rhan yn fwy cyffredinol mewn gweithgareddau adloniadol sydd o les i iechyd.

Catherine Thomas: As you will know from your many visits to the area, one of the recreational activities most popular in Llanelli is swimming. Will you join me, therefore, in welcoming the news that the people of Hendy, along with Carmarthenshire County Council and other local partners, are exploring ways of reopening the open-air pool in that community? The pool has proved to be a greatly loved and well-utilised facility by local people since it was built in the 1930s. Will you join me in wishing local campaigners and the council well as they work together to find ways to reopen the pool?

Catherine Thomas: Fel y gwyddoch o'ch ymweliadau aml â'r ardal, un o'r gweithgareddau adloniadol mwyaf poblogaidd yn Llanelli yw nofio. A wnewch chi ymuno â mi, felly, i groesawu'r newydd bod pobl yr Hendy, ynghyd â Chyngor Sir Caerfyrddin a phartneriaid lleol eraill, yn ymchwilio i ganfod modd i ailagor y pwll nofio awyr agored yn y gymuned honno? Bu gan bobl leol feddwl mawr o'r pwll a gwnaethant ddefnydd helaeth ohono ers ei adeiladu yn y 1930au. A wnewch chi ymuno â mi i ddymuno'n dda i ymgyrchwyr lleol a'r cyngor wrth iddynt gydweithio i ganfod modd i ailagor y pwll?

The First Minister: I do not know whether that includes keeping it open in winter, or whether it is a summer-only facility. Many of my generation will remember open-air pools, which were common in Wales in the 1940s

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni wn a yw hynny'n cynnwys ei gadw'n agored yn y gaeaf, ynteu a yw'n gyfleuster ar gyfer yr haf yn unig. Bydd llawer o'm cenedlaeth i'n cofio pyllau awyr agored, a oedd yn gyffredin yng

and 1950s, but which were, by and large, enclosed or closed altogether during the leisure centre building boom in the 1960s and 1970s. As to whether they have a future, it will be interesting to see the result of the Hendy experiment. If it works well, other authorities may think about refurbishing or reopening open-air pools. This could be done for four months of the summer, for the school holidays, or all year round for those people who are really tough.

Laura Anne Jones: I have, for some time, been extremely concerned by reports that schools across Wales take pupils on school trips less often for fear of litigation. Recreational activities and trips form a vital part of a child's school experience. I understand that Ruth Kelly MP has recently promised to protect teachers in England from unwanted, unwarranted litigation. Will the Assembly Government make a similar commitment to teachers in Wales?

The First Minister: We have no evidence that there has been a reduction in the number of school trips. However, if you have such evidence, I would be grateful if you could supply it to me or to Jane Davidson.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Mae'n debyg eich bod yn ymwybodol, Brif Weinidog, fod adroddiad wedi'i gyhoeddi gan Aelodau Seneddol yn San Steffan heddiw sy'n tynnu sylw at y ffaith bod 25,000 o bobl yn Lloegr yn marw'n ddianghenraid o thrombosis gwythiennau dwfn. A oes gennych ffigurau sy'n dangos faint o bobl sy'n dioddef ohono yng Nghymru? A allwch chi gadarnhau bod gweithgareddau hamdden egniol yn ffordd o atal cyflyrau megis thrombosis? Gan fod hyn mor bwysig, pa gamau a allwch chi eu cymryd i sicrhau bod pobl ym mhob cymuned yn gwybod pa weithgareddau a gefnogir gan y Llywodraeth ac sydd ar gael iddynt?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych yn gywir i gyfeirio at bwysigrwydd y broblem hon. Mae fy Aelod Seneddol i ym Mro Morgannwg, John Smith, wedi bod yn ymgyrchu ynghylch

Nghymru yn y 1940au a'r 1950au, ond a roddwyd dan do neu eu cau'n gyfan gwbl, gan mwyaf, pan godwyd nifer mawr o ganolfannau hamdden yn y 1960au a'r 1970au. Gyda golwg ar eu dyfodol, bydd yn ddiddorol gweld canlyniad yr arbrawf yn yr Hendy. Os llwydda, efallai y gwnaiff awdurdodau eraill ystyried adnewyddu neu ailagor pyllau awyr agored. Gellid gwneud hynny ar gyfer pedwar mis yr haf, ar gyfer y gwyliau ysgol, neu drwy'r flwyddyn ar gyfer y rhai sy'n wydn iawn.

Laura Anne Jones: Bûm yn bryderus iawn ers cryn amser ynghylch adroddiadau bod ysgolion ledled Cymru'n mynd â disgyblion ar deithiau ysgol yn llai aml gan fod arnynt ofn yr eir â hwy i gyfraith. Mae gweithgareddau adloniadol a theithiau'n rhan hollbwysig o brofiad y plentyn yn yr ysgol. Deallaf fod Ruth Kelly AS wedi addo'n ddiweddar y bydd yn amddiffyn athrawon yn Lloegr rhag cyfreithio diangen a di-alw-amdano. A wnaiff Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ymrwymiad tebyg er mwyn athrawon yng Nghymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oes gennym unrhyw dystiolaeth i ddangos bod llai o deithiau ysgol. Fodd bynnag, os oes gennych dystiolaeth o'r fath, byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech ei rhoi i mi neu i Jane Davidson.

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): I am sure that you are aware, First Minister, that a report has been published today by Members of the Westminster Parliament, drawing attention to the fact that 25,000 people in England die unnecessarily from deep vein thrombosis. Do you have figures showing the number of sufferers in Wales? Can you confirm that vigorous leisure activities are a way of preventing the onset of conditions such as thrombosis? This is an important issue, therefore what steps can you take to ensure that people in every community are aware of which Government-supported activities are available to them?

The First Minister: You are right to refer to the importance of this issue. My Member of Parliament in the Vale of Glamorgan, John Smith, has been campaigning on the effect of

effaith teithiau hir mewn awyrennau i fannau megis y dwyrain pell, ac eistedd am 12 awr neu fwy mewn seddi sy'n rhy fach heb godi a cherdded. Mae hyn yn gallu achosi thrombosis gwythiennau dwfn.

long-haul flights to the far east and so on, during which people sit for 12 hours or more in cramped seats without getting up and walking about. This can lead to deep vein thrombosis.

O ran y ffigurau y cyfeiriasoch atynt o safbwynt marwolaethau yn Lloegr, nid oes gennyf ffigurau, ond gofynnaf i Brian Gibbons i ddarganfod pa ffigurau sydd gennym ynghylch faint o bobl yng Nghymru sy'n dioddef neu'n marw o ganlyniad i'r cyflwr hwn.

In respect of the mortality rate in England, I do not have similar figures for Wales, but I will ask Brian Gibbons to make inquiries about the number of people in Wales who experience this condition, or who die as a result of it.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Un o'r problemau mawr sy'n wynebu pobl Cymru, os cânt eu taro'n sâl, yw bod ein rhestrau aros yn sylweddol uwch nag yn Lloegr. Nid oes neb yn disgwyl dros chwe mis yn Lloegr am driniaeth fel cleifion allanol neu gleifion mewnol, tra bod nifer fawr o bobl yng Nghymru yn gwneud hynny. Sut y gallwch chi, Brif Weinidog, gyfiawnhau sefyllfa lle mae 140,000 o bobl yn ychwanegol ar restrau aros ers ichi ddod i rym yn 1999?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: One of the major problems that faces people in Wales, is that, if they are taken ill, our waiting lists are significantly longer than those in England. No-one in England has to wait longer than six months for out-patient or in-patient treatment, while a significant number of people in Wales have to do just that. How can you, First Minister, justify a situation whereby an additional 140,000 people have been added to waiting lists since you came to power in 1999?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn siŵr a allwch gymharu'r ffigurau cyfredol â ffigurau 1999. Yn ôl y bobl sy'n rhedeg y gwasanaeth iechyd, ni fyddai cymharu ffigurau 1999 â'r ffigurau presennol yn adlewyrchu'r sefyllfa yn gywir, oherwydd yr oedd ffigurau rhestrau aros yn cael eu cofnodi mewn modd gwahanol bryd hynny. Mae'n bwysig bod y cyfeiriad bellach yn amlwg yn mynd tuag i lawr ac y bydd y bobl sydd wedi bod yn aros yn rhy hir am driniaeth—sef dros 18 mis a, chyn hir, dros 12 mis—yn cael gwarant o driniaeth drwy gynllun yr ail gynnig. Yr ydym yn llwyddo, drwy'r cynllun hwn, i ostwng y nifer ar restrau aros. Flwyddyn nesaf, byddwn yn rhoi pwyslais ar ostwng nifer y bobl sy'n aros yn rhy hir nid am driniaeth yn unig, ond am apwyntiad cyntaf gydag ymgynghorydd.

The First Minister: I am not sure that you can compare current figures with the 1999 figures. According to those running the health service, comparing 1999 figures with current figures would not give an accurate picture, as waiting list information was not collated in the same way at that time. The important point is that there is now a clear downward trajectory and that those who have been waiting too long for treatment—over 18 months and, before long, over 12 months—will be guaranteed treatment through the second-offer scheme. We have succeeded, with the implementation of this scheme, in reducing waiting list numbers. Next year, we will focus on reducing the number of people waiting too long not only for treatment, but for their first consultation.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: This is the first time that I have heard you say that there has been a change in the way that figures are calculated. You have not used that excuse before. It has been remarkable to hear recently that it is Peter Hain, not Rhodri Morgan, who is in charge of the health service in Wales. Who is in charge—Hain or Morgan? How

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Dyma'r tro cyntaf imi eich clywed yn dweud bod y dull o gyfrifo'r ffigurau wedi newid. Ni ddefnyddiasoch yr esgus hwnnw o'r blaen. Peth rhyfedd oedd clywed yn ddiweddar mai Peter Hain, ac nid Rhodri Morgan, sy'n rheoli'r gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru. Pwy sy'n rheoli—Hain ynteu Morgan? Pa faint o gysur yr ydych yn

comfortable are you with the view that it is not the interests of patients that is uppermost in Labour minds, but the interests of a few Labour Members of Parliament who might lose their seats in the general election? How humiliating is it for you to be told by Peter Hain to pull your socks up on health?

The First Minister: None of that is true. The number of times I have told you not to believe all that you read in the *Western Mail* makes me wonder who runs Plaid Cymru's health policy. Is it Ieuan Wyn Jones or the *Western Mail*? I strongly suspect, on the evidence of all your questions, that it is the *Western Mail*. You are a sandwich-board man hoping to sell papers, rather unsuccessfully, I fear. [*Laughter.*]

I did not say that there has been a change in the way that the figures are collected. This does not come from me, but from the director of NHS Wales, who has told me that there was no systematic method of collecting out-patient waiting list figures in 1999. They were kept in drawers and in sheaves by consultants' secretaries and so forth. We now have proper figures for the first time. Now that we have proper figures, it is important to ask whether they are pointing in a downward direction. Yes, that is clearly the case. We can all be proud of the fact that the number waiting over 18 months for in-patient treatment in Wales has gone from 6,500 to 600 people over the past 12 months. That is why we are confidently able to push forward to reducing the 18-month wait to 12 months. We can then do the same with waiting lists for out-patients before they are given a second offer in 2005-06. We have firmly pointed the waiting-list figures for long waits in a downward direction.

2.30 p.m.

Gorchmynion Ymddygiad Gwrthgymdeithasol Anti-social Behaviour Orders

Q7 Gwenda Thomas: Will the First Minister make a statement on anti-social behaviour orders that are issued to young people in Wales? OAQ0248(FM)

ei gymryd o'r farn nad buddiannau cleifion sy'n flaenaf ym meddwl Llafur, ond buddiannau ychydig o Aelodau Seneddol Llafur a allai gollu eu seddau yn yr etholiad cyffredinol? Pa faint o gywilydd a deimlwch wrth i Peter Hain ddweud wrthy ch am dorchi'ch llewys ar iechyd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oes dim o hynny'n wir. A minnau wedi dweud wrthy ch gynifer o weithiau am beidio â chredu popeth a ddarllenwch yn y *Western Mail*, byddaf yn meddwl tybed pwy sy'n rhedeg polisi iechyd Plaid Cymru. Ai Ieuan Wyn Jones ynteu'r *Western Mail*? Yr wyf yn amau'n gryf, ar sail eich holl gwestiynau, mai'r *Western Mail* ydyw. Dyn deufwrdd ydych sy'n ceisio gwerthu papurau newydd, a hynny braidd yn aflwyddiannus, mae arnaf ofn. [*Chwerthin.*]

Ni ddywedais fod y dull o gasglu'r ffigurau wedi newid. Nid myfi sy'n dweud hynny, ond cyfarwyddwr GIG Cymru, a ddywedodd wrthyf nad oedd dull systematig o gasglu ffigurau rhestrau aros cleifion allanol yn 1999. Fe'u cedwid mewn droriau ac mewn sypiau gan ysgrifenyddion ymgynghorwyr ac yn y blaen. Mae gennym ffigurau iawn am y tro cyntaf yn awr. Gan fod gennym ffigurau iawn, mae'n bwysig gofyn a ydynt yn gostwng. Ydynt, mae'n amlwg eu bod. Gallwn oll ymfalchïo yn y ffaith bod y nifer sy'n aros yn hwy na 18 mis am driniaeth fel claf mewnol yng Nghymru wedi gostwng o 6,500 i 600 dros y 12 mis diwethaf. Dyna pam y gallwn fwrw ymlaen yn ffyddiog i leihau'r arhosiad o 18 mis i 12 mis. Gallwn wneud yr un peth wedyn yn achos rhestrau aros ar gyfer cleifion allanol cyn rhoddi ail gynnig iddynt yn 2005-06. Yr ydym wedi sicrhau bod y ffigurau ar gyfer y rhai a fu'n aros yn hir ar restrau aros yn gostwng.

C7 Gwenda Thomas: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar orchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol sy'n cael eu rhoi i bobl ifanc yng Nghymru? OAQ0248(FM)

The First Minister: Anti-social behaviour orders are among a wide range of tools available to tackle anti-social behaviour caused by a minority of young people in Wales. They are only issued when all other means of curbing nuisance behaviour have been tried.

Gwenda Thomas: Will you join me in congratulating the innovative work of Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council, which has employed a person based in the youth service who is trying to deliver parenting and youth intervention? It is intended that this person will visit every young person served with an anti-social behaviour warning letter and offer support to parents and the young person in question in the hope that this will prevent individuals from becoming involved in further anti-social behaviour.

The First Minister: I think that the four chief constables in Wales all take the same view—I certainly know that this is the view of the chief constable of South Wales Police—that anti-social behaviour orders should be used as a last resort. Therefore, warning letters must be issued, which should not just be plopped onto the doormat and forgotten but followed up by a visit from a member of the youth offending team or the youth service. I would be interested to see how well that works. I think that we all, in the interests of evidence-based Government, must wait to see whether this works. If so, it should be spread throughout the rest of Wales.

Alun Cairns: Does the First Minister accept that either the Home Office or the police should consider introducing an anti-social behaviour order against some Labour backbench Members, such as Carl Sargeant, who make inflammatory statements in the Chamber, which particularly alienate a small minority of people—

The Presiding Officer: Order. The First Minister has no responsibility for Carl Sargeant, as far as I am aware. However, I ask Alun Cairns to reconsider his statement. Members must not be accused of making inflammatory statements, particularly in the

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yn un o blith amrywiaeth mawr o ddulliau sydd ar gael i ymdrin â'r ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol a achosir gan leiafrif o bobl ifanc yng Nghymru. Nis rhoddir ond ar ôl rhoi cynnig ar bob dull arall o gyfyngu ar ymddygiad sy'n peri niwsans.

Gwenda Thomas: A wnewch chi ymuno â mi i ganmol gwaith arloesol Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Castell-nedd Port Talbot, a gyflogodd rywun i weithio yn y gwasanaeth ieuencid sy'n ceisio sicrhau ymyriadau ymysg rhieni a phobl ifanc? Y bwriad yw y bydd y person hwn yn ymweld â phob person ifanc a gafodd lythyr rhybudd oherwydd ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol ac yn cynnig cymorth i'r rhieni ac i'r person ifanc dan sylw gan obeithio y bydd hynny'n atal unigolion rhag cael eu tynnu i ymddwyn yn wrthgymdeithasol eto.

Y Prif Weinidog: Credaf fod y pedwar prif gwnstabl yng Nghymru o'r un farn—gwn mai hyn yw barn prif gwnstabl Heddlu De Cymru, yn sicr—na ddylid ond defnyddio gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol pan fo popeth arall wedi methu. Felly, rhaid rhoi llythyrau rhybudd, ac nid eu rhoi drwy'r twll llythyrau'n unig, ond eu dilyn ag ymweliad gan aelod o'r tîm troseddau ieuencid neu'r gwasanaeth ieuencid. Byddai o ddiddordeb imi weld pa mor llwyddiannus y bydd hynny. Credaf fod rhaid inni i gyd ddisgwyl, er budd Llywodraeth sy'n seiliedig ar dystiolaeth, i weld a fydd hyn yn llwyddo. Os bydd, dylid ei roi ar waith yng ngweddill Cymru.

Alun Cairns: A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn derbyn y dylai'r Swyddfa Gartref neu'r heddlu ystyried cyflwyno gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol i rai Aelodau Llafur ar y meinciau cefn, fel Carl Sargeant, sy'n gwneud datganiadau ymfflamychol yn y Siambr, sy'n tramgwyddo lleiafrif bach yn benodol—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid oes gan y Prif Weinidog unrhyw gyfrifoldeb dros Carl Sargeant, hyd y gwn i. Fodd bynnag, gofynnaf i Alun Cairns ailystyried ei ddatganiad. Ni ddylid cyhuddo Aelodau o wneud datganiadau ymfflamychol, yn

Chamber.

enwedig yn y Siambr.

Alun Cairns: Out of respect for you, Llywydd, I am more than happy to reconsider that statement, and I will withdraw it if that would make you happy, in the same way as I had hoped that Carl Sargeant would withdraw his statement about gun-slinging landowners.

Alun Cairns: O ran parch atoch chi, Lywydd, yr wyf yn fwy na bodlon ailystyried y datganiad hwnnw, ac fe'i tynnaf yn ôl os gwnaiff hynny ryngu'ch bodd, yn yr un modd ag y gobeithiais y byddai Carl Sargeant yn tynnu'n ôl ei ddatganiad am berchnogion tir sy'n bygwth â dryll.

The Presiding Officer: Order. I am grateful for the withdrawal. They always make me happy.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ei fod wedi'i dynnu'n ôl. Mae hynny bob amser yn rhyngu fy modd.

Swyddfeydd Newydd y Llywodraeth yn Llandudno New Government Offices in Llandudno

C8 Alun Ffred Jones: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar ba adrannau fydd yn cael eu lleoli yn swyddfeydd newydd y Llywodraeth yn Llandudno? OAQ0238(FM)

Q8 Alun Ffred Jones: Will the First Minister make a statement on which departments will be located in the Government's new offices in Llandudno? OAQ0238(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Cyhoeddodd y Gweinidog Cyllid, Sue Essex, y rhannau o'r adrannau a gaiff eu lleoli yn y swyddfa newydd yn Llandudno yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 23 Chwefror. Mae rhestr y swyddogaethau sydd wedi'u nodi ar gyfer swyddfa Cyffordd Llandudno i'w gweld yng Nghofnod y Trafodion.

The First Minister: The Finance Minister, Sue Essex, announced in Plenary on 23 February, which sections are to be located in the new office in Llandudno. The list of functions identified for the Llandudno Junction office can be found in the Record of Proceedings.

Alun Ffred Jones: Holl bwynt y strategaeth hon oedd gwasgaru swyddi'r Llywodraeth i bob rhan o Gymru. Mae'r 130 o swyddi newydd sy'n dod i Gyffordd Llandudno i'w croesawu. Fodd bynnag, nid pwrpas y strategaeth oedd symud swyddi o leoedd fel Bangor a Chaernarfon a'u canoli yng Nghyffordd Llandudno. A allwch roi sicrwydd na fydd rhagor o swyddi yn cael eu symud o Wynedd ac Ynys Môn i'r adeilad newydd yn Llandudno?

Alun Ffred Jones: The whole point of this strategy was to disseminate Government jobs to all parts of Wales. The 130 new jobs to be located at Llandudno Junction are to be welcomed. However, the purpose of the strategy was not to relocate jobs from places such as Bangor and Caernarfon and to centralise them in Llandudno Junction. Can you give an assurance that no more jobs will be moved from Gwynedd and Anglesey to the new building in Llandudno?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni wn a fyddwn yn cytuno â'r defnydd o'r gair 'gwasgaru'; nid oes pwyslais mawr ar hynny. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw bod presenoldeb sylweddol y tu hwnt i Gaerdydd yn y Cymoedd, y Canolbarth a'r Gogledd, ond ar y sail y gall un swyddfa gynnal llawer o gydweithio ar draws adrannau gwahanol. Y prif bwrpas, fel y disgrifiodd Sue Essex wythnos neu bythefnos yn ôl, yw y gallwn gael llawer o gydweithio rhwng yr adrannau sy'n berthnasol i waith

Y Prif Weinidog: I do not know whether I agree with the use of the word 'disseminate'; there is no great emphasis on that. What is important is that a major presence is felt outside Cardiff in the Valleys, in mid Wales and north Wales, but on the basis whereby one office can support a great deal of collaboration across different departments. The main purpose, as Sue Essex described a week or two ago, is for us to have a good deal of collaboration between those departments

Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru, Bwrdd Croeso Cymru ac Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru.

that are relevant to the work of Education and Learning Wales, the Wales Tourist Board and the Welsh Development Agency.

Nid yw hynny'n golygu na fydd rhai adrannau bach o swyddfeydd bach byth yn symud pan fyddai'n fwy cyfleus iddynt symud i Gyffordd Llandudno, er enghraifft, pan fo'r brydles ar y swyddfeydd hynny ar fin dod i ben, neu rywbeth tebyg. Yr hyn sy'n fwyaf godidog am leoliad y swyddfa yng Nghyffordd Llandudno yw y gall bron pawb deithio i weithio yno, o bron bob rhan o ogledd Cymru, gan ei fod ar y groesffordd bwysicaf y Gogledd, sef yr A470 a'r A55.

That does not mean that some small departments in small offices will never be moved when it would be more convenient for them to move to Llandudno Junction, for example, when the lease on those offices is about to expire, for example. What is most wonderful about the office's location in Llandudno Junction is that most people can commute there from almost any part of north Wales, as it is on the North's most important crossroad between the A470 and the A55.

Brynle Williams: What discussions have been undertaken with affected staff and their trade unions, and can you advise whether the relocations are mandatory or whether staff will have the option to stay where they are currently based?

Brynle Williams: Pa drafodaethau a gafwyd â'r staff dan sylw a'u hundebau llafur, ac a allwch roi gwybod a yw'r ail-leoli'n orfodol neu a gaiff staff ddewis aros yn y man y maent ar hyn o bryd?

The First Minister: It is difficult to give an advance undertaking on either of those matters. The fewer people there are who wish to transfer from Cardiff or other offices—it could be from St Asaph for instance, but I would be surprised about that—the more local recruitment there will be. The more transfers there are, the less local recruitment there will be. That is the way with any office relocation, be that from the south-east of England to Wales or from one part of Wales to another. The more successful that you are in encouraging voluntary transfers, the less opportunity there will be for local recruitment, and vice versa.

Y Prif Weinidog: Anodd yw cynnig ymrwymiad o flaen llaw ar y naill neu'r llall o'r materion hynny. Po leiaf y nifer sy'n dymuno cael eu trosglwyddo o Gaerdydd neu swyddfeydd eraill—gallai fod o Lanelwy, er enghraifft, ond synnwn pe digwyddai hynny—mwyaf y recriwtio a geir yn lleol. Po fwyaf y rhai sy'n cael eu trosglwyddo, lleiaf y recriwtio a geir yn lleol. Felly y digwydd wrth ail-leoli unrhyw swyddfa, boed hynny o dde-ddwyrain Lloegr i Gymru neu o un rhan o Gymru i un arall. Po fwyaf o lwyddiant a geir wrth annog rhai i symud yn wirfoddol, lleiaf o gyfle a geir i recriwtio'n lleol, ac fel arall.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 9, OAQ0239(FM), yn ôl.

The Presiding Officer: Question 9, OAQ0239(FM), has been withdrawn.

Cynlluniau i Gau Ysgolion yn y Gogledd Proposals to Close Schools in North Wales

Q10 Janet Ryder: Will the First Minister make a statement on proposals to close schools in north Wales? OAQ0236(FM)

C10 Janet Ryder: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar gynlluniau i gau ysgolion yn y Gogledd? OAQ0236(FM)

The First Minister: The planning and provision of school places, including school closures, is the responsibility of local education authorities. LEAs should ensure that the pattern of provision is suitable to meet need and deliver high-quality education

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae cynllunio a darparu lleoedd ysgol, gan gynnwys cau ysgolion, yn gyfrifoldeb i awdurdodau addysg lleol. Dylai AALLau sicrhau bod patrwm y ddarpariaeth yn addas i ddiwallu anghenion ac i roi addysg o safon dda mewn adeiladau sy'n addas i'w

in buildings that are fit for purpose. If the number of children of school age falls, that may involve closure proposals.

Janet Ryder: You will be aware that many Members have grave concerns about the proposals to close schools in rural areas. School closures must be seen as the last resort. Yesterday, on *Taro'r Post*, one of your Members led listeners to believe that they would personally intervene to stop any such proposals that might come forward from Denbighshire County Council to the Assembly. First Minister, can any of your Members give such a personal guarantee?

The First Minister: I am completely unsighted as to the reference that you made to words used by someone you referred to as 'one of my Members'. I do not know who you are talking about or the context of such comments.

Where there are objections to school closures, they come, in an appellate quasi-judicial sense, before the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning for her to determine. We cannot give any undertakings about what will happen when such an appeal is made. About 40 per cent of school closures in Wales over the past 10 years have not been objected to; they go through automatically, on the say-so of the local education authority. Where there are objections, the appeal comes to the Minister for her to determine in a quasi-judicial manner. She will consider whether the education authority has consulted properly, whether the decision has been taken on purely financial grounds—that is a no-no—or whether the decision has been taken properly, on the basis of improved education provision, in which case, she would not intervene in the local authority's decision. If the decision has been taken on purely financial grounds, or without consultation, she will probably uphold the objections. However, I cannot refer to any individual case.

Mark Isherwood: The number of school closures in Wales has doubled over the last year and has risen six times since Labour came to power. Councils in north Wales, such

diben. Os yw nifer y plant o oedran ysgol yn disgyn, gallai hynny olygu y ceir cynigion i gau ysgolion.

Janet Ryder: Gwyddoch fod llawer o Aelodau'n pryderu'n ddirfawr ynghylch y cynigion i gau ysgolion mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Ni ddylid ond ystyried cau ysgolion fel y dewis olaf. Ddoe, ar *Taro'r Post*, gwnaeth un o'ch Aelodau arwain gwrandawyr i gredu y byddai'n ymyrryd yn bersonol i atal unrhyw gynigion o'r fath a allai gael eu cyflwyno gan Gyngor Sir Ddinbych i'r Cynulliad. Brif Weinidog, a all unrhyw un o'ch Aelodau gynnig gwarant bersonol o'r fath?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni welais ddim mewn cysylltiad â'r cyfeiriad a wnaethoch at eiriau a ddefnyddiwyd gan rywun a alwasoch yn 'un o'm Haelodau'. Ni wn am bwy yr ydych yn sôn nac am gyd-destun y sylwadau hynny.

Pan ddaw gwrthwynebiad i gynigion i gau ysgolion, deuant gerbron y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, yn yr ystyr apeliadol a lled-farnwrol, i'w penderfynu ganddi hi. Ni allwn roi unrhyw ymgymeriadau ynghylch yr hyn a ddigwydd pan gyflwynir apêl o'r fath. Ni chafwyd gwrthwynebiad yn achos tua 40 y cant o'r cynigion i gau ysgolion yng Nghymru dros y 10 mlynedd diwethaf; ânt drwodd yn awtomatig, ar orchymyn yr awdurdod addysg lleol. Pan gyflwynir gwrthwynebiadau, daw'r apêl gerbron y Gweinidog i'w phenderfynu ganddi hi mewn modd lled-farnwrol. Bydd yn ystyried a yw'r awdurdod addysg wedi ymgynghori'n briodol, a wnaed y penderfyniad ar sail ariannol yn unig—mae hynny'n annerbyniol—neu a wnaed y penderfyniad yn iawn, ar y sail y bydd y ddarpariaeth addysg yn well, ac, os felly, ni fyddai'n ymyrryd â phenderfyniad yr awdurdod lleol. Os gwnaed y penderfyniad ar sail ariannol yn unig, neu heb ymgynghori, mae'n debyg y bydd yn ategu'r gwrthwynebiadau. Fodd bynnag, ni allaf gyfeirio at unrhyw achos neilltuol.

Mark Isherwood: Mae nifer yr ysgolion a gaewyd yng Nghymru wedi dyblu dros y flwyddyn a aeth heibio ac wedi codi chwe gwaith ers i Lafur ddod i rym. Mae

as that in Denbighshire, tell me that your education Minister's policies have forced them to consider primary school closures and teacher redundancies. Headteachers of secondary schools in north Wales tell me that your education Minister's policies will force them to push up class sizes in lower schools and reduce sixth-form options. When will you stop the damage that your Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning is causing education in Wales?

The First Minister: That was a classic example of Tory blame-shifting—everything must be the fault of the Labour Welsh Assembly Government, especially in the run-up to an election. It is all rubbish. A local authority must make its decisions in the best interests of the education of children. We have told authorities that they cannot make these decisions on financial grounds; they must consider the delivery of the national curriculum and educational grounds. Frequently, with regard to rural schools, I am told that closures are proposed, and parents will then object, for the obvious reason that the school is regarded, quite rightly, as the heart of the community. However, sometimes the school is falling down and, sometimes, there are not enough children in the area to sustain a school. If there are not enough children being born in Wales, then the school stock has to be adapted to the falling number. It is not us that cause fewer children to be born in Wales, but we are living with the fact that there is a falling number of children of school age; everyone has to face up to that. When that happens, the local authority puts it to the local parents, and, if the local parents cannot be persuaded, they object. The matter then comes to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, as I have described.

2.40 p.m.

Denise Idris Jones: Er nad wyf yn credu bod achos i unrhyw un gymryd y bai, yr wyf yn fodlon dweud mai fi oedd ar y rhaglen *Taro'r Post*. Cefais wahoddiad i ymddangos ar y rhaglen er mwyn inni gael sgwrsio am ysgolion bach ac ysgolion cefn gwlad.

cyngorau yn y Gogledd, fel yr un yn sir Ddinbych, yn dweud wrthyf fod polisiau'ch Gweinidog dros addysg wedi'u gorfodi i ystyried cau ysgolion cynradd a diswyddo athrawon. Mae penaethiaid ysgolion uwchradd yn y Gogledd yn dweud wrthyf y bydd polisiau'ch Gweinidog dros addysg yn eu gorfodi i gynyddu maint y dosbarthiadau yn yr ysgolion isaf a lleihau'r dewisiadau sydd ar gael mewn cyfleusterau chweched dosbarth. Pa bryd y rhowch ben ar y niwed y mae'ch Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn ei beri i addysg yng Nghymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr oedd hynny'n enghraifft glasurol o ymgais i osgoi bai gan y Toriaid—mae'r Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru Lafur yn sicr o fod ar fai am bopeth, yn enwedig yn y cyfnod cyn etholiad. Nonsens ydyw i gyd. Rhaid i awdurdod lleol wneud ei benderfyniadau er budd addysg plant. Dywedasom wrth awdurdodau na chânt wneud y penderfyniadau hyn ar sail ariannol; rhaid iddynt ystyried y dull o ddarparu'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol a'r sail addysgol. Dywedir wrthyf mai'r hyn a ddigwydd yn aml, mewn cysylltiad ag ysgolion gwledig, yw bod cynigion i'w cau'n cael eu gwneud, ac y bydd rhieni'n gwrthwynebu wedyn, am y rheswm amlwg bod yr ysgol yn cael ei hystyried, yn gwbl briodol, yn galon i'r gymuned. Fodd bynnag, bydd rhai o'r ysgolion hynny'n dadfeilio ac, weithiau, nid oes digon o blant yn yr ardal i gynnal ysgol. Os na enir digon o blant yng Nghymru, rhaid addasu'r stoc ysgolion i'r nifer is. Nid nyni sy'n peri bod llai o blant yn cael eu geni yng Nghymru, ond yr ydym yn dygymod â'r ffaith bod nifer y plant o oedran ysgol yn lleihau; rhaid i bawb wynebu hynny. Pan ddigwydd hynny, mae'r awdurdod lleol yn rhoi'r cynnig gerbron y rhieni lleol, ac, os na ellir dwyn perswâd ar y rhieni lleol, maent yn gwrthwynebu. Wedyn daw'r mater gerbron y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, fel y nodais.

schools and small schools.

Wedi dweud hynny, ac i ddychwelyd at y cwestiwn, yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch â mi, Brif Weinidog, ein bod wedi penderfynu cadw ysgolion bach ar agor lle bo hynny'n bosibl. Mae'r sefyllfa yn wahanol yn sir Ddinbych—a dyma beth yr oedd sôn yn ei gylch—ond dywedais fy mod yn sicr nad oedd un ysgol yng nghefn gwlad Conwy yn cau, ac yr oeddwn yn dweud y gwir. Cyfweiliad dros y ffôn ydoedd, a dyna'r drefn arferol, fel y gŵyr llawer o'r Aelodau. Gofynnodd rhywun—*[Torri ar draws.]*

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid yw o gymorth inni glywed y cwestiwn os yw pobl yn torri ar draws.

Denise Idris Jones: Yr hyn a ofynnwyd oedd a fyddai'n bosibl—*[Torri ar draws.]*

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Gadewch inni gael y cwestiwn.

Denise Idris Jones: Yr hyn a ofynnodd y dyn ar y ffôn oedd a fyddai'n bosibl i ysgolion gael yr arian yn uniongyrchol yn hytrach na thrwy awdurdodau lleol. Dywedais y byddwn yn gofyn y cwestiwn hwnnw i'r Prif Weinidog yn y Cynulliad. A ydych yn cytuno â mi ar hynny, Brif Weinidog?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oes newid ar y gweill o ran y modd yr ariennir ysgolion. Yr ydym wedi rhoi darlun clir i bob rhiant a phob aelod o'r cyngor fel y gallant weld faint o arian a glustnodwyd ar gyfer addysg yn ôl ein fformiwla ni, ac o fewn y symiau unigol o arian a gaiff awdurdodau lleol. Mae pawb yn gwybod faint sydd wedi ei glustnodi ar gyfer addysg. Pe baem yn gwario llai o arian ar addysg na'r swm sydd wedi ei nodi yn y fformiwla, gallai pawb, gan gynnwys Aelodau'r Cynulliad, brotestio yn erbyn hynny.

Having said that, and to return to the question, I am sure that you would agree with me, First Minister, that we have agreed to keep small schools open wherever possible. The situation is different in Denbighshire—and this was the topic of discussion—but I said that I was sure that no school in rural Conwy was closing, and I was telling the truth. The interview was conducted over the phone, which is usual practice, as many Members know. Someone asked—*[Interruption.]*

The Presiding Officer: Order. It does not help us to hear the question if people keep interrupting.

Denise Idris Jones: What was asked was whether it would be possible—*[Interruption.]*

The Presiding Officer: Order. Let us hear the question.

Denise Idris Jones: What the gentleman on the phone asked was whether it would be possible for schools to receive the funding directly rather than through local authorities. I replied that I would put the very same question to the First Minister in Plenary. Do you agree with me on that, First Minister?

The First Minister: There are no changes afoot in terms of how schools are funded. We have given every parent and councillor the full picture so that they can see how much funding has been allocated for education according to our formula, and within the individual sums that local authorities receive. Everyone knows how much is earmarked for education. If we spent less on education than the amount identified in the formula, then anyone, including Assembly Members, could protest against that.

Cynllun Lliniaru ar Lifogydd yn Stryd Mwrog The Mwrog Street Flood Alleviation Scheme

Q11 Brynle Williams: Will the First Minister provide an update on the Mwrog street flood alleviation scheme in Ruthin? OAQ0256(FM)

C11 Brynle Williams: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog roi'r diweddaraf ar y cynllun i liniaru ar lifogydd yn Mwrog Street, Rhuthun? OAQ0256(FM)

That is my old chestnut again. [*Laughter.*]

Dyma fi'n sôn am yr un hen beth eto. [*Chwerthin.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order. I do not recall any reference to a chestnut in the question as tabled.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Ni chofiaf weld unrhyw gyfeiriad at hynny yn y cwestiwn fel y'i cyflwynwyd.

The First Minister: This is no chestnut; this is a £3.7 million scheme, which was originally supposed to cost £1.5 million. You will be aware that Denbighshire County Council, in principle, is entitled to an 85 per cent grant. However, because the cost of the scheme has risen to £3.7 million, Denbighshire council also wants us to provide the 85 per cent overshoot on the cost. However, we are asking the council to justify that very sharp increase in costs, which includes staffing.

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid hen beth yw hyn; cynllun gwerth £3.7 miliwn ydyw, a oedd i fod i gostio £1.5 miliwn yn wreiddiol. Gwyddoch fod hawl gan Gyngor Sir Ddinbych, mewn egwyddor, i gael grant o 85 y cant. Fodd bynnag, gan fod cost y cynllun wedi codi i £3.7 miliwn, mae Cyngor Sir Ddinbych yn dymuno inni hefyd dalu am 85 y cant o'r gost ychwanegol. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn gofyn i'r cyngor gyfiawnhau'r cynnydd sydyn hwnnw yn y costau, sy'n cynnwys costau staff.

Brynle Williams: I point out that, at the moment, Denbighshire County Council will not consult with several businesses and landowners; it will not even reply to their letters. Much money is outstanding, very nearly as much as the value of the scheme itself, I believe. Is it not time that we were given transparent government? We should know what is going on. Will you set up an inquiry into this blatant waste of public money?

Brynle Williams: Tynnaf sylw at y ffaith bod sawl busnes a pherchennog tir na wnaiff Cyngor Sir Ddinbych ymgynghori â hwy ar hyn o bryd; ni wnaiff ateb eu llythyrau hyd yn oed. Mae llawer o arian yn ddyledus, bron gymaint â gwerth y cynllun ei hun, yr wyf yn credu. Onid yw'n bryd inni gael llywodraethu tryloyw? Dylem gael gwybod beth sy'n mynd ymlaen. A wnewch sefydlu ymchwiliad i'r gwastraff amlwg hwn ar arian cyhoeddus?

The First Minister: It is a Denbighshire County Council scheme. I do not want you, Brynle, to follow Mark Isherwood's very bad example, although I am sure that you would not want to, of always pointing the finger of blame at us. This is clearly a council scheme, and we are being asked to pay 85 per cent of the cost overshoot on it, as well as the original estimated cost of £1.5 million. The scheme is now costing £3.7 million. If the council can justify that as costs, it will get 85 per cent of that too.

Y Prif Weinidog: Cynllun o eiddo Cyngor Sir Ddinbych ydyw. Nid wyf am eich gweld chi, Brynle, yn dilyn yr esiampl wael iawn a osododd Mark Isherwood, er fy mod yn siŵr na ddimwnech wneud, o fwrw'r bai arnom ni bob tro. Mae'n amlwg mai cynllun o eiddo'r cyngor yw hwn, a gofynnir inni dalu 85 y cant o'r gost ychwanegol, yn ogystal â'r gost amcangyfrifedig gwreiddiol o £1.5 miliwn. Mae'r cynllun yn costio £3.7 miliwn bellach. Os gall y cyngor gyfiawnhau'r costau hynny, caiff 85 y cant o hynny hefyd.

I understand that the council has commissioned an independent contract review report into how the scheme contract was handled. It is for the council to decide whether to place this report in the public domain, and you may wish to inquire Denbighshire County Council about that.

Deallaf fod y cyngor wedi comisiynu adroddiad annibynnol i adolygu'r modd y trafodwyd y contract. Lle'r cyngor yw penderfynu a fydd yn cyhoeddi'r adroddiad hwnnw, ac efallai y byddwch yn dymuno holi Cyngor Sir Ddinbych am hynny.

**Deintyddion y GIG
NHS Dentists**

Q12 Eleanor Burnham: What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to increase the number of NHS dentists in Wales? OAQ0250(FM)

The First Minister: We are increasing the number of training places. From October last year, the number of dental students in Wales increased by 17 per cent. We encourage dentists to establish or expand practices through the Welsh dental initiative and I understand that the number of dentists in Wales has gone up from 975 to 1,025, which is an increase of 50, over the past four to five years.

Eleanor Burnham: According to a recent report, only one dental practice in north Wales, in Ruthin, is accepting new NHS patients. What is your Welsh Assembly Government doing to stem this crisis, and do you agree that the situation will not improve while your Labour Government here and in Westminster support tuition fees? At present, a dental student will incur at least £45,000 of debt during training. That is not to mention any future debt that will be incurred following top-up fees and associated costs.

The First Minister: If there is one category of university place that I would have no fears about expanding further, and where there is no question of people not being willing to apply for the courses because of the fear of debt, it is places in the excellent school of dentistry in Cardiff. All the figures that I have show that there has been hardly any drop—I think that it is about a 1 per cent drop over the past four years—in the percentage of the Welsh population who are registered with an NHS dentist. I understand the point that is being made, especially concerning north Wales, although it will also affect other parts of Wales. If your local dentist withdraws from taking NHS patients, it is difficult to get onto another dentist's list. However, the last available figures that we have show that, as of September 2004, 49 per cent of the population of Wales are still registered with an NHS dentist—the figure for children is much higher than that—and that figure has dropped by about 1 per cent in the past three

C12 Eleanor Burnham: Beth mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei wneud i gynyddu nifer y deintyddion GIG yng Nghymru? OAQ0250(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym yn cynyddu nifer y lleoedd hyfforddi. Ers mis Hydref y llynedd, mae nifer y myfyrwyr deintyddol yng Nghymru wedi codi 17 y cant. Yr ydym yn annog deintyddion i sefydlu neu ehangu practisiau drwy fenter ddeintyddol Cymru a deallaf fod nifer y deintyddion yng Nghymru wedi codi o 975 i 1,025, sy'n gynydd o 50, dros y pedair i bum mlynedd diwethaf.

Eleanor Burnham: Yn ôl adroddiad diweddar, dim ond un practis deintyddol yn y Gogledd, yn Rhuthun, sy'n derbyn cleifion GIG newydd. Beth y mae'ch Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n ei wneud i roi pen ar yr argyfwng hwn, ac a gytunwch na wnaiff y sefyllfa wella tra bo'ch Llywodraeth Lafur yma ac yn San Steffan yn cefnogi ffioedd dysgu? Fel y mae ar hyn o bryd, bydd myfyriwr deintyddol yn mynd i o leiaf £45,000 o ddyled wrth gael ei hyfforddi. Mae hynny heb grybwyll unrhyw ddyledion a geir yn y dyfodol yn sgîl ffioedd ychwanegol a chostau cysylltiedig.

Y Prif Weinidog: Os oes un math o leoedd mewn prifysgol na fyddai gennyf unrhyw bryderon ynghylch cynyddu eu nifer ymhellach, a lle nad oes lle i gredu bod pobl yn amharod i ymgeisio ar gyfer cyrsiau am fod arnynt ofn mynd i ddyled, lleoedd yn yr ysgol ddeintyddol ragorol yng Nghaerdydd yw'r rheini. Mae'r holl ffigurau sydd gennyf yn dangos na fu unrhyw ostyngiad bron—credaf y bu tua 1 y cant o ostyngiad dros y pedair blynedd diwethaf—yng nghanran y boblogaeth yng Nghymru sydd wedi cofrestru gydag un o ddeintyddion y GIG. Deallaf y pwynt a wneir, yn enwedig mewn cysylltiad â'r Gogledd, er ei fod yn berthnasol i rannau eraill o Gymru hefyd. Os yw'ch deintydd lleol yn rhoi'r gorau i dderbyn cleifion y GIG, mae'n anodd cael lle ar restr deintydd arall. Serch hynny, mae'r ffigurau diweddaraf sydd ar gael i ni'n dangos, ym mis Medi 2004, fod 49 y cant o boblogaeth Cymru wedi'i gofrestru o hyd gydag un o ddeintyddion y GIG—mae'r ffigur ar gyfer plant yn uwch o

or four years.

lawer na hynny—a bod y ffigur wedi gostwng tua 1 y cant yn y tair neu bedair blynedd diwethaf.

Lisa Francis: You will be aware that, last year, Ian Lucas MP was critical of the Assembly grant scheme for dentists, saying that it enabled dentists to take on NHS patients and then dump them 12 months later if they were not happy to take part in Denplan or a similar scheme. What is happening in relation to that with regard to the negotiations that are currently under way for the new dental contract in Wales? Is it for that reason that the dental contract negotiations may have broken down?

Lisa Francis: Gwyddoch fod Ian Lucas AS wedi bod yn feirniadol, y llynedd, o gynllun grantiau'r Cynulliad ar gyfer deintyddion, gan ddweud ei fod yn galluogi deintyddion i dderbyn cleifion y GIG a chael gwared â hwy wedyn ymhen 12 mis os nad oeddent yn fodlon cymryd rhan yn Denplan neu gynllun tebyg. Beth sy'n digwydd mewn cysylltiad â hynny gyda golwg ar y negodiadau sy'n mynd ymlaen ar hyn o bryd ar gyfer y contract deintyddol newydd yng Nghymru? Ai hynny yw'r rheswm y mae'r negodiadau ar y contract deintyddol wedi methu?

The First Minister: The dental contract negotiations are a little beyond our purview. I think that they are led by the Department of Health and they cover Great Britain, if not the United Kingdom as a whole, so, clearly, we are junior partners in that. I was not as aware as you of the innermost thoughts of Ian Lucas MP on this question of whether, under the Welsh dental initiative, dentists could drop patients after 12 months, if indeed that is the case. I believe that the Welsh dental initiative is one of the answers, but I also saw an interesting story about a dentist in Pembrokeshire who is now directly employed by the local health board, which is a completely new initiative. If that is successful, it may also be needed elsewhere to get the pattern of dentistry more varied and able to cover areas where existing practitioner dentists are withdrawing from the NHS. We could backfill using that method, as well as the Welsh dental initiative.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r negodiadau ar y contract deintyddol ychydig y tu allan i'n maes. Credaf eu bod yn cael eu harwain gan yr Adran Iechyd ac maent yn cynnwys Prydain Fawr, os nad y Deyrnas Unedig gyfan, felly, mae'n amlwg mai partner iau ydym yn hynny o beth. Nid oeddwn mor ymwybodol â chi o ddwys fyfyrddau Ian Lucas AS ynghylch a all deintyddion gael gwared â chleifion ar ôl 12 mis, o dan fenter ddeintyddol Cymru, os felly y mae. Credaf mai menter ddeintyddol Cymru yw un o'r atebion, ond gwelais stori ddiddorol hefyd am ddeintydd yn sir Benfro sy'n cael ei gyflogi'n uniongyrchol yn awr gan y bwrdd iechyd lleol, ac mae honno'n fenter gwbl newydd. Os bydd yn llwyddo, mae'n bosibl y bydd ei angen hefyd mewn mannau eraill i amrywio patrwm deintyddiaeth a chynnwys ardaloedd lle y mae ymarferwyr deintyddol yn tynnu allan o'r GIG yn awr. Gallem lenwi bwlch drwy'r dull hwnnw, yn ogystal â menter ddeintyddol Cymru.

Carl Sargeant: Do you share my disappointment at the recent loss of an NHS dentist service in Buckley, in my constituency? Will you encourage, through your good offices and those of Brian Gibbons, Flintshire Local Health Board to find a replacement dentist as soon as possible for my constituents who directly elected me to the Assembly in May 2003?

Carl Sargeant: A ydych yn siomedig, fel yr wyf fi, ynghylch colli gwasanaeth deintyddol GIG ym Mwcle, yn fy etholaeth, yn ddiweddar? A wnewch annog Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Sir y Fflint, drwy'ch caredigrwydd chi a Brian Gibbons, i ddod o hyd i ddeintydd i gymryd ei le cyn gynted ag y bo modd er mwyn fy etholwyr a'm hetholodd yn uniongyrchol i'r Cynulliad ym mis Mai 2003?

The First Minister: I am looking through the list of those who have used the Welsh dental

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn edrych drwy'r rhestr o'r rhai a ddefnyddiodd fenter

initiative in the last two years. There is one in Wrexham, there is an extension of a practice at Prestatyn and Rhyl and, again, in Wrexham, but not in Flintshire, I am afraid. Perhaps that is now a matter to which the local health board should pay close attention. We are also in contact with certain countries abroad that have a surplus of dentists—Poland and Italy in particular—to see whether, with suitable language training, they could also backfill to make up some of the loss as NHS dentists decide to stop taking NHS patients and to convert to Denplan or another form of private practice.

ddeintyddol Cymru yn y ddwy flynedd diwethaf. Mae un yn Wrecsam, mae practis wedi'i ehangu ym Mhrestatyn ac yn y Rhyl ac, unwaith eto, yn Wrecsam, ond nid yn sir y Fflint, mae arnaf ofn. Efallai y dylai'r bwrdd iechyd lleol roi sylw manwl i'r mater hwn yn awr. Yr ydym mewn cysylltiad hefyd â rhai gwledydd tramor sydd â gormod o ddeintyddion—Gwlad Pwyl a'r Eidal yn benodol—i weld a allent hwythau lenwi bylchau, o gael hyfforddiant iaith addas, i wneud iawn am rywfaint o'r golled wrth i ddeintyddion y GIG benderfynu rhoi'r gorau i dderbyn cleifion y GIG a throi at Denplan neu ryw fath arall o ymarfer preifat.

2.50 p.m.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Bu ichi ochrgamu mor gelfydd â Shane Williams ar fater y contract deintyddol. Pam nad ydych yn barod i roi dyddiad inni ar gyfer hynny, Brif Weinidog? Onid ydych yn cydnabod bod y cytundeb hwn yn hanfodol er mwyn achub deintyddiaeth y GIG?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: You were as adept as Shane Williams in sidestepping the issue of the dental contract. Why are you not prepared to give us a date for that, First Minister? Do you not acknowledge that this contract is essential in order to save NHS dentistry?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr hyn sy'n bwysig am y cytundeb newydd yw ei fod yn trosglwyddo'r egwyddor sylfaenol o fod yn feddyg teulu i fod yn ddeintydd, sef nad ydych yn cael eich talu am ymyriad meddygol, ond yn hytrach am ofal. Gall y gofal hwnnw gynnwys cyngor, yn hytrach na dim ond gwneud rhywbeth gyda dril ac yn blaen. Dyna mae deintyddion ei eisiau, a dyna yr ydym ni eisiau, ond, yn anffodus, mae'r trafodaethau wedi torri lawr.

The First Minister: The important thing about this new contract is that it transfers the fundamental principle currently adopted by GPs to dentists, namely that you are not paid for a medical intervention, but rather for care. That care can include advice, rather than only doing something with a drill and so on. That is what dentists want, and that is what we want, but negotiations have, unfortunately, broken down.

Datganiad Busnes Business Statement

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): There is one change to report to this week's business. Tomorrow's motion to delegate functions under the Children Act 2004 to the First Minister has been postponed until Tuesday 15 March. Business for the next three weeks is as set out in the draft statement, which can be found on the Chamberweb under supporting documents. Further to this morning's deliberations in the Business Committee, it has been determined that the following items of subordinate legislation need not be referred to a Subject

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Mae un newid i'w adrodd i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Mae'r cynnig ar gyfer yfory i ddirprwyo swyddogaethau o dan Ddeddf Plant 2004 i'r Prif Weinidog wedi'i ohirio tan ddydd Mawrth 15 Mawrth. Mae busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y mae wedi'i nodi yn y datganiad drafft, y gellir ei weld ar we'r Siambr o dan ddogfennau ategol. Ymhellach i'r trafodaethau y bore yma yn y Pwyllgor Busnes, penderfynwyd nad oes angen cyfeirio'r eitemau is-ddeddfwriaeth a ganlyn i Bwyllgor Pwnc i'w hystyried yn helaethach:

Committee for extended consideration: the Countryside Access (Appeals Procedures) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2005, the Adoption Agencies (Wales) Regulations 2005, the Adoption and Children Act 2002 (Commencement No. 8) (Wales) Order 2005 and the School Lunches (Prescribed Requirement) (Wales) Order 2005.

Y Llywydd: A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes drafft? Gwelaf fod o leiaf 10 gwrthwynebiad. Felly, gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog gynnig y datganiad busnes yn ffurfiol.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales adopts the business statement.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yr wyf am godi dau bwynt meddygol gyda chi. Gwnaf hynny gyda pheth anesmwythder oherwydd ofnaf y byddwch yn dychwelyd i'ch hen arfer a thraethu'n hir ar y materion hyn. Yr ydym eisiau datganiad ar y broblem sydd wedi codi yn y Gogledd o ran y gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau arferol. Yr oedd sôn dros y Nadolig am hyd at 10,000 o alwadau heb eu hateb. Mae hynny'n haeddu datganiad yma yn y Cynulliad. Mae problem hefyd o ran y contract i ymgynghorwyr. Soniasoch bod y contract hwn yn hollbwysig i'r GIG yng Nghymru, ond erbyn hyn clywn bod ymgynghorwyr yng Nghymru yn bygwth pleidlais o ddiffyg hyder yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru oherwydd nad ydynt wedi cael eu talu am yr oriau ychwanegol y maent wedi'u gweithio. A gawn ni ddatganiad ar y ddau bwynt hwnnw?

Cefnogwn hefyd gais y Plaid Geidwadol am ddiffiniad o anabled er mwyn i bobl dderbyn y cymorth a'r gynhafiaeth y maent yn eu haeddu.

David Melding: We support Plaid Cymru's call for a statement on the consultants' contract, which is an issue of national concern at present. You know, Minister, that in this morning's Business Committee I called for a statement on the policy for free home care for disabled people, particularly on the issue of the definition of disability, as it

Rheoliadau Mynediad i Gefn Gwlad (Gweithdrefnau Apelau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2005, Rheoliadau Asiantaethau Mabwysiadu (Cymru) 2005, Gorchymyn Deddf Mabwysiadu a Phlant 2002 (Cychwyn Rhif 8) (Cymru) 2005 a Gorchymyn Ciniawau Ysgol (Gofyniad Rhagnodedig) (Cymru) 2005.

The Presiding Officer: Are there any objections to the draft business statement? I see that there are at least 10 objections. Therefore, I ask the Minister to formally propose the business statement.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cynigaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn derbyn y datganiad busnes.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I will raise two medical issues with you. I do so with some trepidation because I am afraid that you will return to your old ways and speak at length on these issues. We want a statement on the problem that has arisen in north Wales with regard to the out-of-hours service. There was talk over the Christmas period of up to 10,000 unanswered calls. That merits a statement here in the Assembly. There is also a problem with regard to the consultants' contract. You said that this contract was vital to the NHS in Wales, but now we hear that consultants in Wales are threatening a vote of no confidence in the Welsh Assembly Government because they have not been paid for the additional hours worked. Can we have a statement on both those points?

I would also support the Conservative Party's request for a definition of disability, so that people can receive the assistance and support that they deserve.

David Melding: Cefnogwn alwad Plaid Cymru am ddatganiad ar gontract yr ymgynghorwyr, sy'n destun pryder drwy'r wlad ar hyn o bryd. Weinidog, gwyddoch fy mod wedi galw, yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, am ddatganiad ar y polisi ar gyfer gofal am ddim yn y cartref i bobl anabl, yn enwedig ar fater y diffiniad o

appears that the Government is in some disarray on this matter, given that established definitions exist all over the UK, apart from in Wales, apparently. You have conceded a written statement from the Minister for Health and Social Services since this morning, which is a little ungallant, because we need to be able to question him in the Chamber.

There should also be a debate in Government time on the school curriculum and general discipline in schools, and a statement on school closures, given the acceleration of closures that has occurred in the last couple of years.

Kirsty Williams: The Welsh Liberal Democrat group would support a statement in the Chamber on out-of-hours services. The problems are not only in north Wales, but were well recorded in Cardiff and south Wales over the weekend, and in my constituency. A small child and his family had to travel from Ystradgynlais to Brecon to see a GP, and were then told that they had to travel back from Brecon to Singleton Hospital to be admitted to a district general hospital. That cannot be acceptable. On the consultants' contract, it must be of concern to every Member when consultants in Wales threaten to take industrial action because the Assembly has not paid their wages. It is an outrageous situation, which is, once again, in danger of turning all of us—despite the fact that 30 of us have nothing to do with the policy that you are pursuing—into a laughing stock and making consultants leave the principality in droves to work in England, where they are paid.

2.55 p.m.

Leighton Andrews: Could we have a debate at some point on the state of Welsh club football? This is a serious issue, and of concern to fans across Wales. There was a situation with Swansea City Football Club in the not-too-distant past, which I am pleased to say seems to have recovered. We have also had a situation in Wrexham, which my colleagues Karen Sinclair and Carl Sergeant raised, and we now have a situation with

anabledd, gan ei bod yn ymddangos bod cryn anhrefn yn y llywodraeth ar y mater hwn, gan fod diffiniadau pendant i'w cael ym mhob man yn y DU, heblaw am Gymru, yn ôl pob golwg. Yr ydych wedi caniatáu datganiad ysgrifenedig gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ers y bore yma, ac mae hynny braidd yn anfoneddigaidd, oherwydd rhaid inni allu ei holi yn y Siambr.

Dylid cael dadl hefyd yn amser y Llywodraeth ar y cwricwlwm ysgol a disgyblaeth gyffredinol mewn ysgolion, a datganiad ar gau ysgolion, yng ngolwg y cynnydd yn nifer yr ysgolion a gaewyd yn y flwyddyn neu ddwy ddiwethaf.

Kirsty Williams: Byddai grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru o blaid cael datganiad yn y Siambr ar wasanaethau y tu allan i oriau arferol. Nid yn y Gogledd yn unig y ceir problemau, gan fod llawer wedi'u cofnodi yng Nghaerdydd ac yn y De dros y penwythnos, ac yn fy etholaeth i. Bu'n rhaid i blentyn bach a'i deulu fynd o Ystradgynlais i Aberhonddu i weld meddyg teulu, a dywedwyd wrthynt wedyn fod rhaid iddynt fynd yn ôl o Aberhonddu i Ysbyty Singleton er mwyn iddo gael ei dderbyn i ysbyty dosbarth cyffredinol. Nid yw hynny'n dderbyniol. Ynghylch contract yr ymgynghorwyr, mae pob Aelod yn sicr o fod yn bryderus pan yw ymgynghorwyr yng Nghymru'n bygwth gweithredu'n ddiwydiannol am nad yw'r Cynulliad wedi talu eu cyflog. Mae'n sefyllfa warthus, y mae perygl iddi, unwaith eto, wneud pob un ohonom—er nad oes a wnelo 30 ohonom ddim â'r polisi yr ydych yn ei ddilyn—yn gyff gwawd a pheri i ymgynghorwyr adael y dywysogaeth yn eu lluoedd i weithio yn Lloegr, lle y cânt eu talu.

Leighton Andrews: A allem gael dadl rywdro ar gyflwr clybiau pêl-droed Cymru? Mater difrifol yw hwn sy'n peri pryder i gefnogwyr ledled Cymru. Cafwyd sefyllfa mewn cysylltiad â Chlwb Pêl-droed Dinas Abertawe yn eithaf diweddar, yr ymddengys ei bod wedi'i hadfer, yr wyf yn falch o ddweud. Cawsom sefyllfa yn Wrecsam hefyd, y mae fy nghyd-Aelodau Karen Sinclair a Carl Sergeant wedi'i chodi, ac mae gennym

Cardiff City Football Club.

In these situations, fans of the clubs concerned feel almost powerless to influence the decisions that are made. The Assembly can provide a vehicle for the expression of the fans' frustrations. Speaking as a Cardiff City season-ticket holder, I know that many fans are angry, and, above all, concerned about what has been going on. They are worried about the prospect of administration and relegation. Those issues could justifiably be explored in the Assembly. We want strong football clubs in Wales.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): First, on the out-of-hours service, you know that it is the local health boards' responsibility to make out-of-hours arrangements. Clearly, they are also encouraging a press campaign to make people more aware of the out-of-hours arrangements and to encourage them to come forward with complaints. It is interesting that, as at a few weeks ago, of 150,000 calls received, only 67 complaints had been made. However, it is important to encourage people to make complaints and we can assure people that they will be investigated thoroughly, including complaints about the telephone systems—there have been some problems at peak times in some areas.

Rhodri Glyn, Kirsty and David Melding all raised issues about the consultants' contract. We are proud of the consultants' contract in Wales, which has been well-supported. The issues now relate to implementation, not policy. The Government's position is clear—we have negotiated a new contract, and consultants in Wales continue to support it and are anxious for it to be implemented. Substantial sums of public money are involved. Therefore, we have an obligation that you, I am sure, would respect, to ensure that that money is spent to the best effect for our patients. As we move through the process of implementation, nothing can be added at this point in terms of a statement. However, the Minister for Health and Social Services will ensure that you are updated on progress

sefyllfa'n awr mewn cysylltiad â Chlwb Pêl-droed Dinas Caerdydd.

Mewn sefyllfaoedd o'r fath, mae cefnogwyr y clybiau'n teimlo'n analluog bron i ddylanwadu ar y penderfyniadau a wneir. Gall y Cynulliad fod yn gyfrwng i fynegi rhwystredigaeth y cefnogwyr. A siarad fel un sy'n dal un o docynnau tymor clwb Dinas Caerdydd, gwn fod llawer o gefnogwyr yn ddig, ac, yn fwy na dim, yn bryderus ynghylch yr hyn a fu'n mynd ymlaen. Pryderant ynghylch y posibilrwydd o'i weld yn mynd i law'r gweinyddwr a'i anfon i'r adran nesaf i lawr. Gellid cyfiawnhau ystyried y materion hynny yn y Cynulliad. Yr ydym am gael clybiau pêl-droed cryf yng Nghymru.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Yn gyntaf, ynghylch y gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau arferol, gwyddoch mai'r byrddau iechyd lleol sy'n gyfrifol am wneud trefniadau y tu allan i oriau arferol. Mae'n amlwg eu bod hefyd yn hyrwyddo ymgyrch yn y wasg i beri i bobl fod yn fwy ymwybodol o'r trefniadau y tu allan i oriau arferol ac i'w hannog i gyflwyno cwynion. Diddorol yw nodi, fel yr oedd ychydig wythnosau'n ôl, o'r 150,000 o alwadau a gafwyd, mai dim ond 67 o gwynion a wnaed. Er hynny, mae'n bwysig annog pobl i wneud cwynion a gallwn eu sicrhau yr ymchwilir iddynt yn drylwyr, ac mae hynny'n cynnwys cwynion am y systemau ffôn—bu rhai problemau mewn cyfnodau brig mewn rhai ardaloedd.

Gwnaeth Rhodri Glyn, Kirsty a David Melding oll godi materion sy'n ymwneud â chontract yr ymgynghorwyr. Ymfalchïwn yng nghontract yr ymgynghorwyr yng Nghymru, a gafodd gefnogaeth dda. Mae'r materion dan sylw'n ymwneud â'r dull o'i roi ar waith, nid â pholisi. Mae safbwynt y Llywodraeth yn eglur—yr ydym wedi negodi contract newydd, ac mae ymgynghorwyr yng Nghymru'n dal i'w gefnogi ac yn awyddus iddo gael ei roi ar waith. Mae symiau sylweddol o arian cyhoeddus dan sylw. Felly, yr ydym o dan orfodaeth, y byddech yn ei pharchu, yr wyf yn siŵr, i sicrhau y caiff yr arian ei wario yn y modd mwyaf effeithiol er mwyn ein cleifion. Wrth inni ei roi ar waith, nid oes dim y gellir ei ychwanegu ar hyn o bryd drwy wneud datganiad. Fodd bynnag,

at the next committee meeting.

bydd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn sicrhau y cewch wybod y diweddaraf am y cynnydd yng nghyfarfod nesaf y pwyllgor.

David raised a point about free home care for the disabled, to which Rhodri Glyn, I think, also alluded, although he spoke before David. Wales is the only part of the UK that is delivering free home care for the disabled, according to our manifesto commitment. I assure you that the Welsh Assembly Government is introducing this from the autumn and Brian Gibbons has agreed to make a written statement on work in progress before the Easter recess.

Gwnaeth David godi pwynt am ofal am ddim yn y cartref i bobl anabl, y credaf fod Rhodri Glyn wedi cyfeirio ato hefyd, er iddo siarad o flaen David. Cymru yw'r unig ran o'r DU sy'n cynnig gofal am ddim yn y cartref i bobl anabl, yn unol â'r ymrwymiad yn ein maniffesto. Yr wyf yn eich sicrhau y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n ei gyflwyno o'r hydref nesaf ymlaen ac mae Brian Gibbons wedi cytuno i wneud datganiad ysgifenedig ar y gwaith sy'n mynd rhagddo cyn toriad y Pasg.

Two weeks ago, we had a re-run of the Plaid Cymru conference, and we are now having a similar re-run of last weekend's Welsh Conservative Party conference. The Welsh Conservatives are clearly under instructions from their leader, given the issues that you are raising here. Although Michael Howard did go to the Wales Millennium Centre—

Bythefnos yn ôl, gwelsom ailadrodd cynhadledd Plaid Cymru, ac yr ydym yn gweld ailadrodd tebyg yn awr ar gynhadledd Plaid Geidwadol Cymru y penwythnos diwethaf. Mae'n amlwg bod Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn dilyn cyfarwyddiadau eu harweinydd, yng ngolwg y materion yr ydych yn eu codi yma. Er bod Michael Howard wedi mynd i Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru—

Nick Bourne: It was the Wales Millennium Stadium.

Nick Bourne: Stadiwm Mileniwm Cymru ydoedd.

Jane Hutt: Thank you, Nick, for correcting me on that point. He did come to Wales, and you are following your leader, raising issues that are very much in the *Daily Mail*'s neck of the woods.

Jane Hutt: Diolch i chi, Nick, am fy nghywiros i ar y pwynt hwnnw. Daeth i Gymru, ac yr ydych yn dilyn eich arweinydd, gan godi materion sy'n debyg iawn i'r rhai a welir yn y *Daily Mail*.

On school discipline, the most recent report of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Schools for Wales noted that behaviour in all our primary schools, and 90 per cent of our secondary schools, is at least very good. We should be proud of that fact and of our children in Wales, while recognising that the local education authority and schools are taking these issues forward.

Ynghylch disgyblaeth mewn ysgolion, nodwyd yn adroddiad diweddaraf Prif Arolygydd Ysgolion Ei Mawrhydi yng Nghymru fod yr ymddygiad yn ein holl ysgolion cynradd, ac yn 90 y cant o'n hysgolion uwchradd, yn dda iawn o leiaf. Dylem ymfalchïo yn hynny ac ym mhlant Cymru, gan gydnabod bod awdurdodau addysg lleol ac ysgolion yn ymdrin â'r materion hyn.

3.00 p.m.

On school closures, an issue which was covered extensively in questions to the First Minister, we do not see the need for a statement. There is no overall pattern of an escalation in the number of school closures. It

Ynghylch cau ysgolion, sy'n fater yr ymdriniwyd yn helaeth ag ef mewn cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog, ni welwn fod angen datganiad. Nid oes patrwm cyffredinol o gynnydd yn nifer yr ysgolion a gaeir. Lle

is for local education authorities to bring forward school reorganisation proposals, where necessary, in the light of local circumstances. As the First Minister said earlier, local education authorities are in the lead, not the Assembly. The Welsh Assembly Government only becomes involved if there are objections to LEA proposals. As many as a third of such proposals are unopposed by local people, because the LEAs have handled the issue carefully, and have dealt with difficult situations, as the First Minister said, in relation to falling pupil numbers.

On Leighton's point, passion is running high and we have heard of your passion in relation to Cardiff City Football Club. There are issues around the Welsh club football scene. They are independent organisations, but I am sure that you will raise this matter with the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport.

I will end by acknowledging that today is international women's day, and we should celebrate the fact that we have equal representation of women in the Assembly. I hope that people will take the opportunity to view the Womens Arts Association's paintings in the neuadd.

awdurdodau addysg lleol yw cyflwyno cynigion i ad-drefnu ysgolion, os oes angen, yng ngoleuni amgylchiadau lleol. Fel y dywedodd y Prif Weinidog yn gynharach, awdurdodau addysg lleol sy'n arwain ar hyn, nid y Cynulliad. Ni fydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ond yn ymwneud â hyn os ceir gwrthwynebiad i gynigion gan awdurdodau. Mae cymaint â thraean o'r cyfryw gynigion nad oes gwrthwiniad iddynt o du pobl leol, gan fod yr awdurdodau wedi trafod y mater yn ofalus, ac wedi delio â sefyllfaoedd anodd sy'n gysylltiedig â'r gostyngiad yn nifer y disgyblion, fel y dywedodd y Prif Weinidog.

Ynghylch y pwynt a wnaeth Leighton, ceir teimladau cryf am hyn ar hyn o bryd a chlywsom am eich teimladau chi mewn cysylltiad â Chlwb Pêl-droed Dinas Caerdydd. Mae materion yn codi mewn cysylltiad â byd y clybiau pêl-droed yng Nghymru. Cyrff annibynnol ydynt, ond yr wyf yn siŵr y codwch y mater hwn gyda'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon.

Terfynaf drwy gydnabod ei bod heddiw yn ddiwrnod rhyngwladol menywod, a dylem ddatlu'r ffaith bod gennym gynrychiolaeth gyfartal o fenywod yn y Cynulliad. Gobeithiaf y manteisiwch ar y cyfle hwn i gael golwg ar beintiadau Cymdeithas Celfyddydau Menywod yn y neuadd.

Cynnig: O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 25.

Motion: For 29, Abstain 0, Against 25.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne

Jones, Ann
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion Composite Motion: Approval of Orders

Y Llywydd: O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

The Presiding Officer: Under Standing Order No. 24.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cynigiaf fod

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I propose that

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25:

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 24.25:

1. a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 1 Mawrth 2005 ar y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Deddf Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru) 2004 (Cychwyn Rhif 2 a Darpariaethau Trosiannol ac Arbedion) 2005; a

1. a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office, and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 1 March 2005 on the draft Order, the Public Audit (Wales) Act 2004 (Commencement No. 2 and Transitional Provisions and Savings) Order 2005; and

b) yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Deddf Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru) 2004 (Cychwyn Rhif 2 a Darpariaethau Trosiannol ac Arbedion) 2005 yn cael ei wneud yn unol â:

b) approves the Public Audit (Wales) Act 2004 (Commencement No. 2 and Transitional Provisions and Savings) Order 2005 is made in accordance with:

i) y Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 23 Chwefror 2005;

i) the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 23 February 2005;

ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 1 Mawrth 2005;

ii) regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 1 March 2005;

2. a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 1 Mawrth 2005 ar y Rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Cynhyrchion sy'n Dod o

2. a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office, and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 1 March 2005 on the draft regulations, the Products of Animal Origin (Third Country Imports)

- Anifeiliaid (Mewnforion Trydydd Gwledydd) (Wales) Regulations 2005; and (Cymru) 2005; a*
- b) yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Cynhyrchion sy'n Dod o Anifeiliaid (Mewnforion Trydydd Gwledydd) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael ei wneud yn unol â:*
- b) approves the Products of Animal Origin (Third Country Imports) (Wales) Regulations 2005 is made in accordance with:*
- i) y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Chwefror 2005;* *i) the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 22 February 2005;*
- ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 1 Mawrth 2005;* *ii) regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 1 March 2005;*
- 3. a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 8 Chwefror 2005 ar y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Clefydau Anifeiliaid (Diheintyddion a Gymeradwywyd) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2005; a*
- 3. a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office, on 8 February 2005 on the draft Order, the Diseases of Animals (Approved Disinfectants) (Amendment) (Wales) Order 2005; and*
- b) yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Clefydau Anifeiliaid (Diheintyddion a Gymeradwywyd) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael ei wneud yn unol â:*
- b) approves the Diseases of Animals (Approved Disinfectants) (Amendment) (Wales) Order 2005 is made in accordance with:*
- i) y Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 26 Ionawr 2005;* *i) the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 26 January 2005;*
- ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Chwefror 2005;* *ii) regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 2 February 2005;*
- iii) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Chwefror 2005;* *iii) the memorandum of correction laid in the Table Office on 14 February 2005;*
- 4. a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 8 Chwefror 2005 ar y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Salmonella mewn Heidiau Dodwy (Pwerau Arolygu) (Cymru) 2005; a*
- 4. a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office, on 8 February 2005 on the draft regulations, the Salmonella in Laying Flocks (Survey Powers) (Wales) Regulations 2005; and*
- b) yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Salmonella mewn Heidiau Dodwy (Pwerau Arolygu) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â:*
- b) approves the Salmonella in Laying Flocks (Survey Powers) (Wales) Regulations 2005 is made in accordance with:*
- i) y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 26 Ionawr 2005;* *i) the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 26 January 2005;*
- ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Chwefror 2005;* *ii) regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 2 February 2005;*
- iii) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn* *iii) the memorandum of correction laid in the*

- y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Chwefror 2005;* *Table Office on 14 February 2005;*
5. a) *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Chwefror 2005 ar y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Cynghorau Iechyd Cymuned (Diwygio) 2005; a* 5. a) *considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office, on 22 February 2005 on the draft regulations, Community Health Councils (Amendment) Regulations 2005; and*
- b) *yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Cynghorau Iechyd Cymuned (Diwygio) 2005 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â:* b) *approves Community Health Councils (Amendment) Regulations 2005 is made in accordance with:*
- i) *y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Chwefror 2005;* i) *the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 2 February 2005;*
- ii) *yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Chwefror 2005;* ii) *regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 2 February 2005;*
- iii) *y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Chwefror 2005;* iii) *the memorandum of correction laid in the Table Office on 22 February 2005;*
6. a) *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Chwefror 2005 ar y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Cwotâu Cynnyrch Llaeth (Cymru) 2005;* 6. a) *considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office, on 22 February 2005 on the draft regulations, the Dairy Produce Quotas (Wales) Regulations 2005; and*
- b) *yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Cwotâu Cynnyrch Llaeth (Cymru) 2005 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â:* b) *approves the Dairy Produce Quotas (Wales) Regulations 2005 is made in accordance with:*
- i) *y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Chwefror 2005* i) *the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 2 February 2005;*
- ii) *yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Chwefror 2005;* ii) *regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 2 February 2005;*
- iii) *y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd mewn e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 1 Mawrth 2005. (NDM2335)* iii) *the memorandum of correction laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 1 March 2005. (NDM2335)*

*Cynnig (NDM2335): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2335): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff

Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Asesu Adnoddau) (Diwygio)
(Cymru) 2005 a Rheoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Symiau at Anghenion Personol)
(Cymru) 2005**

**Approval of the National Assistance (Assessment of Resources) (Amendment)
(Wales) Regulations 2005 and the National Assistance (Sums for Personal
Requirement) (Wales) Regulations 2005**

The Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 to NDM2336 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, and amendment 1 to NDM2326 in the name of Kirsty Williams, Michael German and Mick Bates.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 i NDM2336 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, a gwelliant 1 i NDM2326 yn enw Kirsty Williams, Michael German a Mick Bates.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the National Assistance

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Cymorth Gwladol

(Assessment of Resources) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2005, a copy of which was laid in Table on 10 February 2005. (NDM2336)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 22 February, 2005 in relation to the draft regulations, the National Assistance (Assessment of Resources) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2005; and

2. approves that the National Assistance (Assessment of Resources) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2005 is made in accordance with:

a) the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 10 February 2005;

b) regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 10 February 2005. (NDM2326)

Local authorities must charge for residential care under a means-tested system set by the Assembly in accordance with section 22 of the National Assistance Act 1948. Whether the residential care is directly provided or arranged in an independent home, authorities must aim to recover as much as possible of the costs.

With these regulations, I am proposing to up-rate the upper and lower limits of the capital element of the test of resources for residential care from their present levels of £13,500 and £20,500 to £14,750 and £21,000 respectively. For ease of administration, changes in these limits are traditionally rounded up to the nearest £250. The Assembly Government is committed to reviewing the capital limits each year to ensure they remain roughly in line with inflation. The proposed uplift in the lower limit represents an increase of 9.2 per cent, which is well above inflation and the rise in average earnings.

The increase in the upper limit of 2.5 per cent fulfils the commitment to maintain, as far as

(Asesu Adnoddau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2005, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Chwefror 2005. (NDM2336)

Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Chwefror 2005 mewn perthynas â'r Rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Asesu Adnoddau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2005; a

2. yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Asesu Adnoddau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â:

a) y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Chwefror 2005;

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Chwefror 2005. (NDM2326)

Rhaid i awdurdodau lleol godi tâl am ofal preswyl o dan system prawf moddion a sefydlwyd gan y Cynulliad yn unol ag adran 22 Deddf Cymorth Gwladol 1948. Pa un a gaiff y gofal preswyl ei ddarparu'n uniongyrchol neu ei drefnu mewn cartref annibynnol, rhaid i awdurdodau geisio adennill cymaint o'r costau ag y bo modd.

Drwy'r rheoliadau hyn, cynigiaf godi terfynau uchaf ac isaf yr elfen cyfalaf yn y prawf adnoddau ar gyfer gofal preswyl o'u lefelau presennol o £13,500 a £20,500 i £14,750 a £21,000 yn y drefn honno. Er mwyn hwyluso gwaith gweinyddol, bydd newidiadau i'r terfynau hyn yn cael eu talgrynnu i'r £250 agosaf. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ymrwmo i adolygu'r terfynau ar gyfer cyfalaf bob blwyddyn i sicrhau eu bod yn aros yn weddol gyson â chwyddiant. Cynigir codi'r terfyn isaf 9.2 y cant, ac mae hynny ymhell uwchlaw chwyddiant a'r cynnydd yng ngwerth enillion cyfartalog.

Mae'r cynnydd o 2.5 y cant yn y terfyn uchaf yn cyflawni'r ymrwymiad i gadw codiadau'n

possible, increases in line with inflation. Implementation is affordable for local authorities within the overall uplift for pay and prices in the agreed local government revenue settlement. The significant increase in the lower limit to £14,750 will benefit those who are least well-off and will take more people out of the charging regime altogether, rather than just reducing the burden at the top end. It will also shorten the length over which the tariff operates.

The tariff is assumed on income and capital assets between the upper and lower limits of what the council assumes that residents can generate in income from those capital assets. This tariff income is then added to the assessed income so that residents are asked to contribute to their care costs. The resulting capital limits will again be higher than those enforced in England for 2005-06. For the coming year, as in previous years, we have deliberately targeted the biggest increase at those who are in most need and have ensured that the limited resources directed towards this target go towards easing the burden on the least well-off. This is consistent with our social justice agenda.

The draft regulations will include changes to increases in savings disregard for those in residential care to £4.85 for single people and £7.20 for couples. We also aim to reduce the disregard in the assessment of income for residential charging purposes for special guardians and prospective special guardians, and for recipients of the armed forces compensation scheme. I look forward to the debate on the opposition amendments, to which I will respond in due course.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Cynigiaf welliant 1 i NDM2336 yn enw Jocelyn Davies:

yn credu y byddai darparu gofal personol am ddim ar gyfer yr henoed yn diogelu eu hurddas ac yn osgoi sarhad prawf modd.

gyson â chwyddiant, hyd y gellir. Bydd awdurdodau lleol yn gallu fforddio rhoi hyn ar waith yng ngolwg y cynnydd cyffredinol a gafwyd ar gyfer cyflogau a phrisiau yn y setliad llywodraeth leol y cytunwyd arno. Bydd y codiad sylweddol yn y terfyn isaf i £14,750 yn dod â budd i'r rhai lleiaf cefnog ac yn tynnu mwy o bobl o'r system codi tâl yn gyfan gwbl, yn hytrach na dim ond ysgafnhau'r baich yn y pen uchaf. Bydd hefyd yn lleihau'r amrediad y mae'r tariff yn berthnasol iddo.

Codir y tariff ar incwm ac ar asedau cyfalaf rhwng terfynau uchaf ac isaf yr hyn y mae'r cyngor yn cymryd y gall preswylwyr ei greu ar ffurf incwm o'r asedau cyfalaf hynny. Bydd yr incwm o'r tariff yn cael ei ychwanegu wedyn at yr incwm a aseswyd fel y gofynnir i breswylwyr gyfrannu at eu costau gofal. Bydd y terfynau cyfalaf a geir o hynny'n uwch, unwaith eto, na'r rhai a orfodir yn Lloegr ar gyfer 2005-06. Ar gyfer y flwyddyn sydd i ddod, yn yr un modd ag mewn blynyddoedd blaenorol, yr ydym wedi targedu'r cynnydd mwyaf o fwriad ar y rhai mwyaf anghenus ac wedi sicrhau y bydd yr adnoddau cyfyngedig ar gyfer y targed hwn yn gymorth i ysgafnhau'r baich ar y rhai lleiaf cefnog. Mae hyn yn gyson â'n agenda ar gyfiawnder cymdeithasol.

Bydd y rheoliadau drafft yn codi terfyn y swm o gynilion a ddiystyrir ar gyfer y rhai mewn gofal preswyl i £4.85 yn achos pobl sengl ac i £7.20 ar gyfer cyplau. Yr ydym hefyd yn bwriadu gostwng terfyn yr hyn a ddiystyrir yn yr asesiad o incwm i ddibenion codi tâl am ofal preswyl ar gyfer gwarcheidwaid arbennig a darpar warcheidwaid arbennig, ac ar gyfer rhai sy'n derbyn tâl o dan gynllun iawndal y lluoedd arfog. Edrychaf ymlaen at y ddatl ar welliannau'r gwrthbleidiau, yr ymatebaf iddynt gyda hyn.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I propose amendment 1 to NDM2336 in the name of Jocelyn Davies:

believes that making provision for free personal care for the elderly would ensure their dignity and avoid the humiliation of means testing.

Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am beidio ag ymateb i'r gwelliannau ymlaen llaw ac am aros i wrando ar ein dadleuon cyn penderfynu a fydd yn eu cefnogi neu beidio. Yn y gwelliant a gyflwynwyd yn enw Joeclyn Davies, yr ydym yn sôn am urddas pobl hŷn yn ein cymdeithas—pobl sydd ag arnynt angen ein cynhaliaeth a'n cefnogaeth ni. Yr ydym yn gwrthwynbeu'r syniad o brawf modd.

Byddwn yn tybio fod y ddau beth hynny yn gwbl unol â thraddodiad ac egwyddorion y mudiad Llafur yng Nghymru a byddwn yn gobeithio y byddai hyd yn oed Llafur Newydd yn fodlon cadw at yr egwyddor o geisio sicrhau bywyd o urddas i bobl hŷn. Gobeithiwn y byddem oll yn cytuno fod prawf modd yn sarhau ac yn iselhau pobl ac os oes unrhyw fodd i'w ddileu neu i leihau ei effaith ar bobl, hoffwn weld hynny'n cael ei weithredu.

It is clear from the report of the Royal Commission on Long Term Care, 'With Respect to Old Age: Long Term Care—Rights and Responsibilities', that it feels that arrangements for the means test are too punitive. It says that in paragraph 6.12. In particular, it says that people with relatively modest means might lose all their assets when they go into care and live for the average length of stay of three years. We can all support that statement in the royal commission report, because we all know of stories where people have lost their possessions after entering care and nursing homes. Minister, do you think that the increases in the threshold, which you have announced today, deal with the issue raised by the royal commission? I would be surprised if you could argue that they did, because they are fairly modest increases while the report is making a substantive point.

As you will know, Minister, the royal commission supported the concept of free personal care and argued that the need for care in old age was an unpredictable contingency, affecting a minority of people aged over 65, which should be funded from general taxation. It offered a number of reasons for that argument, with which I know you are well-versed, Minister. Therefore I ask

I thank the Minister for not dismissing the amendments out of hand, and for listening to our arguments before deciding whether or not to support them. In the amendment tabled in the name of Jocelyn Davies, we refer to the dignity of older people in our society—people who need our support. We object to the idea of a means test.

I believe that those two ideas are in keeping with the traditions and principles of the Labour movement in Wales, and I would hope that even New Labour would try to act according to the principle of safeguarding the dignity of older people. I would have hoped that we would all agree that means testing insults and degrades people and if it is possible to remove it or diminish its effect on people, I would like to see that happen.

Mae'n amlwg o adroddiad y Comisiwn Brenhinol ar Ofal Hirdymor, 'With Respect to Old Age: Long Term Care—Rights and Responsibilities', ei fod yn teimlo bod trefniadau ar gyfer y prawf moddion yn rhy gosbol. Dywed hynny ym mharagraff 6.12. Yn benodol, dywed y gallai rhai a chanddynt fodd cymharol fach gollu eu holl asedau os ydynt yn cael eu derbyn i ofal ac yn byw am gyfnod cyfartalog yr arhosiad o dair blynedd. Gallwn oll gefnogi'r datganiad hwnnw yn adroddiad y comisiwn brenhinol, gan fod pob un ohonom wedi clywed hanesion am rai sydd wedi colli eu heiddo ar ôl cael eu derbyn i gartrefi gofal a nyrsio. Weinidog, a ydych yn credu bod y codiadau yn y trothwy, a gyhoeddasoeh heddiw, yn delio â'r mater a godwyd gan y comisiwn brenhinol? Synnwn pe gallech ddadlau eu bod, gan mai codiadau eithaf bach ydynt yng ngolwg y pwynt pwysig a wneir yn yr adroddiad.

Fel y gwyddoch, Weinidog, yr oedd y comisiwn brenhinol o blaid y syniad o ofal personol am ddim a dadleuodd fod yr angen am ofal ymysg yr henoed yn rhywbeth na ellid ei ragweld, sy'n effeithio ar leiafrif sydd dros 65 oed, y dylid talu amdano drwy drethiant cyffredinol. Cynigiodd sawl rheswm dros y ddadl honno, y gwn eich bod yn dra chyfarwydd â hwy, Weinidog. Felly,

you to support our amendment, to address the issue of dignity of life for older people in society and to remove the means test which, hopefully, all Members abhor.

Kirsty Williams: I propose amendment 1 to NDM2326 in my name and in the names of Michael German and Mick Bates:

that the National Assembly for Wales resolves to make the following amendments to the National Assistance (Assessment of Resources) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2005 laid in the Table Office on 10 February 2005:

in regulation '20A Capital limit – Wales' delete '£21,000' and replace with '£60,000' and in regulation '28A Calculation of tariff income from capital – Wales' delete '£21,000' and replace with '£60,000'.

3.10 p.m.

This is an annual debate, and at each opportunity, we, as Welsh Liberal Democrats, have expressed our desire to promote the cause of free personal care. We do so as a result of the findings of the royal commission on free personal care, which clearly stated that the current system is flawed and unfair. For many people, that means that, should they need to move into a nursing or residential home to be cared for, to end their days, the likelihood is that their family home, should they own one, will be sold to fund that care. The Minister often makes much of the fact that the home does not have to be sold until that person dies, and that a charge can be placed on the local authority, but for the surviving relatives, that is a dire blow. I fully accept that the National Assembly has limitations with regard to implementing free personal care—there are issues around the need to have primary legislative powers to turn that into reality—but adjusting the limits would be one way by which we could negate the effects of charging our older people.

I am glad that, for the first time, we have a Minister for Health and Social Services who acknowledges that this is not a question of

gofynnaf ichi gefnogi ein gwelliant, er mwyn diogelu urddas pobl hŷn mewn cymdeithas a dileu'r prawf moddion, y mae'r holl Aelodau, yr wyf yn gobeithio, yn ei ffeiddio.

Kirsty Williams: Cynigiaf welliant 1 i NDM2326 yn fy enw i ac enwau Michael German a Mick Bates:

cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn penderfynu gwneud y gwelliannau canlynol i Reoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Aseu Adnoddau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2005 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Chwefror 2005:

yn rheoliad '20A Capital limit – Wales' dileu '£21,000' a rhoi '£60,000' yn ei le ac yn rheoliad '28A Calculation of tariff income from capital – Wales' dileu '£21,000' a rhoi '£60,000' yn ei le.

Dadl flynyddol yw hon, ac ar bob cyfle a gafwyd, yr ydym ni, fel Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, wedi datgan ein dymuniad i hyrwyddo achos gofal personol am ddim. Gwnawn hynny o ganlyniad i ddarganfyddiadau'r comisiwn brenhinol ar ofal personol am ddim, a ddatganodd yn glir fod y system bresennol yn ddiffygiol ac yn annheg. Yn achos llawer o bobl, mae hynny'n golygu, os bydd yn rhaid iddynt fynd i gartref nyrsio neu breswyl i dderbyn gofal, hyd ddiwedd eu hoes, ei bod yn debygol y bydd cartref eu teulu, os ydynt yn berchen ar un, yn cael ei werthu i dalu am y gofal hwnnw. Mae'r Gweinidog yn aml yn gwneud yn fawr o'r ffaith nad oes raid gwerthu'r cartref hyd nes y bydd farw'r person hwnnw, ac y gellir gosod arwystl ar yr awdurdod lleol, ond mae hynny'n ergyd fawr i'r perthnasau sy'n ei oroesi. Llwyf dderbyniaf fod cyfyngiadau ar y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol o ran cynnig gofal personol am ddim—mae materion yn codi ynghylch yr angen am bwerau deddfu sylfaenol i wireddu hynny—ond byddai newid y terfynau'n un modd i wrthweithio'r effaith o godi tâl ar ein pobl hŷn.

Yr wyf yn falch bod gennym, am y tro cyntaf, Weinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol sy'n derbyn nad

priorities, as this is obviously not a priority for Welsh Labour, or for its investment in our old people. I respect the fact that Brian has today acknowledged that meagre resources are being channelled into this policy area by the Welsh Labour Government. I welcome that frankness. I argue that this matter should be a priority, and that we should be looking at ways by which we can assist older people who find themselves in this situation.

The figure of £60,000 contained in the Welsh Liberal Democrats' amendment comes from the findings of the royal commission, which stated that this would be a more realistic figure at which to set capital limits. That is the basis for proposing that figure. Indeed, I suggest that new work is needed in this area, as property prices have increased significantly since the royal commission did its work. We need to consider its appropriateness and look at new data to reassess this figure.

However, this is a fundamental point of principle, and the Assembly voted in favour of pursuing the goals of long-term personal care. As a result of the Freedom of Information Act 2000, we are now aware of the efforts that Welsh Labour made—one letter to the Secretary of State for Wales, saying that it was 'passing on the views' of the Assembly. It did not argue the case and it did not advocate on behalf of older people in Wales. It simply said that it was required to let the Secretary of State know that this is what the Assembly did. If that is Labour battling for the older people of Wales, then goodness help us. If that is what you do when you make an effort, I would hate to know what you do when you do not make the effort. This is a point of principle, and older people—who have contributed so much to society—deserve better in their old age than to be means tested and stripped of whatever assets they have worked hard for in order to pay for the care that many of them thought, having contributed to National Insurance and the taxation system all their lives, was their right.

Jonathan Morgan: Minister, if you take any message from this debate, it should be that the opposition parties are not particularly

mater o flaenoriaethau yw hyn, gan ei bod yn amlwg nad yw hyn yn flaenoriaeth gan Lafur Cymru, nac ar gyfer ei fuddsoddiad yn ein henoed. Parchaf y ffaith bod Brian wedi cydnabod heddiw mai pitw yw'r adnoddau a sianelir i'r maes polisi hwn gan Lywodraeth Lafur Cymru. Croesawaf y gonestrwydd hwnnw. Dadleuaf y dylai'r mater hwn fod yn flaenoriaeth, ac y dylem ystyried dulliau o gynorthwyo pobl hŷn sy'n eu cael eu hunain yn y sefyllfa hon.

Mae'r ffigur o £60,000 sydd yng ngwelliant Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn codi o ddarganfyddiadau'r comisiwn brenhinol, a ddywedodd mai mwy realistig fyddai gosod y terfynau cyfalaf ar y ffigur hwn. Dyna'r rheswm dros gynnig y ffigur hwnnw. Yn wir, awgrymaf fod angen gwaith newydd yn y maes hwn, gan fod prisiau tai wedi codi'n sylweddol ers i'r comisiwn brenhinol wneud ei waith. Rhaid inni ystyried a yw'n briodol ac edrych ar ddata newydd er mwyn ailasesu'r ffigur hwn.

Fodd bynnag, mater o egwyddor sylfaenol yw hwn, a phleidleisiodd y Cynulliad o blaid ceisio'r nod o ofal personol tymor hir. O ganlyniad i Ddeddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000, gwyddom bellach am ymdrechion Llafur Cymru—un llythyr at Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, yn dweud ei fod yn cyfleu barn y Cynulliad. Ni phlediodd yr achos ac nid eiriolodd ar ran pobl hŷn yng Nghymru. Y cwbl a ddywedodd oedd ei fod yn ofynnol iddo roi gwybod i'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol mai hynny a wnaeth y Cynulliad. Os mai peth felly yw ymgyrch Llafur dros bobl hŷn yng Nghymru, druan ohonom. Os mai hynny a wnewch wrth wneud ymdrech, byddai'n gas gennyf feddwl beth a wnaech wrth beidio â gwneud ymdrech. Mater o egwyddor yw hwn, ac mae pobl hŷn—a gyfrannodd gymaint i gymdeithas—yn haeddu gwell yn eu henaint na chael prawf moddion a chael eu hamddifadu o ba bynnag asedau y gweithiasant yn galed i'w cael er mwyn talu am y gofal yr oedd llawer ohonynt yn credu bod ganddynt hawl iddo, a hwythau wedi cyfrannu i'r system Yswiriant Gwladol a threthi gydol eu hoes.

Jonathan Morgan: Weinidog, os oes unrhyw neges y dylech wrando arni yn y ddadl hon, honno yw nad yw'r

happy that the Assembly—or more particularly, the Government—has not prioritised this work for consideration. We in Wales now face huge problems, not least in the falling number of residential care-home places and the falling number of residential care homes. I happily admit that much of that has been due to the additional regulation that your London colleagues have introduced, which has had a damaging impact on the number of care-home places and care homes in Wales. I also happily admit that larger numbers of people wish to be cared for in their own homes, but for those who need residential, long-term care, the future is quite bleak. In response to this debate, you need to give an assurance that this matter will become more of a priority for you as Minister. I accept and understand that you spend each Thursday looking at waiting lists and waiting times, but might I suggest that you allocate another day to examine this pressing issue? We have larger and increasing numbers of elderly people in Wales who will require longer-term care in the future. This is not an issue that can be put on the lower rung of the priority ladder. I hope that you will assure us that more time, effort and resource will be invested in this area.

Looking at Plaid Cymru's amendment, I am broadly sympathetic to its notion. My concern—and you might want to reflect on this, Minister—is that when free personal care was introduced in Scotland, the costs rocketed and were over 50 per cent higher than the original estimate. If this were to be achieved in Wales, we would need to have concrete figures. As the Minister in charge of the health budget, what is your view on the cost of introducing this in Wales, and is it something that the Assembly could sustain? It would be difficult for the Assembly to register its support for such an objective without being absolutely concrete about what we would be expected to spend in terms of the budget. I think that the Government should reflect carefully—as should we—on the costs that have been incurred in Scotland.

gwrthbleidiau'n arbennig o fodlon am nad yw'r Cynulliad—neu, yn fwy penodol, y Llywodraeth—wedi rhoi blaenoriaeth i ystyried y gwaith hwn. Yr ydym ni yng Nghymru'n wynebu problemau aruthrol yn awr, a hynny'n anad dim oherwydd y gostyngiad yn nifer y lleoedd mewn cartrefi gofal preswyl ac yn nifer y cartrefi gofal preswyl. Yr wyf yn barod iawn i dderbyn bod llawer o hynny'n ganlyniad i'r rheoleiddio ychwanegol a gyflwynwyd gan eich cymheiriaid yn Llundain, sydd wedi amharu ar nifer y lleoedd mewn cartrefi gofal ac ar nifer y cartrefi gofal yng Nghymru. Yr wyf hefyd yn barod iawn i dderbyn bod mwy o bobl yn dymuno derbyn gofal yn eu cartrefi eu hunain, ond eithaf tywyll yw'r rhagolygon i'r rhai y mae arnynt angen gofal preswyl tymor hir. Mewn ymateb i'r ddadl hon, rhaid ichi gynnig sicrwydd y rhowch fwy o flaenoriaeth i'r mater hwn fel Gweinidog. Yr wyf yn derbyn ac yn deall eich bod yn treulio pob dydd Iau yn ystyried rhestrau aros ac amseroedd aros, ond a gaf awgrymu y dylech neilltuo diwrnod arall i ystyried y mater brys hwn? Mae gennym niferoedd mwy a chynyddol o bobl oedrannus yng Nghymru y bydd arnynt angen gofal tymor hwy yn y dyfodol. Ni ellir rhoi blaenoriaeth lai i'r mater hwn. Gobeithiaf y byddwch yn ein sicrhau y rhoddir mwy o amser, ymdrech ac adnoddau tuag at y maes hwn.

Gyda golwg ar welliant Plaid Cymru, cydymdeimlaf yn gyffredinol â'r syniad sydd ynddo. Y pryder sydd gennyf fi—ac efallai y byddwch am fyfyrion ynghylch hyn, Weinidog—yw bod y costau o ddarparu gofal personol am ddim, pan gyflwynwyd hynny yn yr Alban, wedi codi i'r entrychion a'u bod yn fwy na 50 y cant yn uwch na'r amcangyfrif gwreiddiol. Os oedd hyn i'w gyflawni yng Nghymru, byddai'n rhaid inni gael ffigurau pendant. Fel y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am y gyllideb iechyd, beth yw'ch barn am y gost o gyflwyno hyn yng Nghymru, ac a yw'n rhywbeth y gallai'r Cynulliad ei gynnal? Byddai'n anodd i'r Cynulliad ddangos ei gefnogaeth i amcan o'r fath heb fod yn gwbl sicr o'r hyn y byddai disgwyl inni ei wario yn y gyllideb. Credaf y dylai'r Llywodraeth fyfyrion ddwys—fel y dylem ni—ynghylch y costau a gafwyd yn yr Alban.

In respect of the Liberal Democrat amendment, I have been supportive of increasing the capital limits. We should, as an Assembly, consider what these limits should be, whether £60,000 is realistic, or whether the suggestions made by the royal commission and those put forward by Rhodri Glyn Thomas and others are realistic. As an Assembly we should be doing a considerable amount of work on this. I would like you, as Minister, in responding to Kirsty Williams, to say whether this extra £23.4 million is realistic in terms of our budget, and what you regard as the source of that money. I do not wish to challenge my Liberal Democrat friends, but I have noticed that the source of £23.4 million has not been indicated. Perhaps the Minister who holds the reins of the budget could indicate where he thinks it may come from.

Kirsty Williams: You are right, Jonathan, to challenge the Liberal Democrats on where they would find the additional resources. It is a question of priorities. We feel that there are many areas in which the Assembly spends money that should not be a priority and that this should be the priority instead. As an example, the Labour Party proposes to establish an older people's commissioner for Wales. This will lead to the appointment of a person to whom older people can complain about the lack of care available to them. The Welsh Liberal Democrats would rather see this money used to provide the care. That is just one example.

Jonathan Morgan: You might have helped the Minister out of a hole, but I doubt it. Will the Minister for Health and Social Services say whether this is a sustainable additional resource, and, if so, where will it come from within the health budget?

To finish, we all recognise that this area needs additional priority. The Assembly's Health and Social Services Committee should also devote a significant amount of time to the subject, if we had the time to devote. This is one of the important reasons why the committee should meet every other week, not every three weeks, as is supported by you and your colleagues. Unless the Assembly is

Gan droi at welliant y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, bûm yn gefnogol i'r amcan o godi'r terfynau cyfalaf. Fel Cynulliad, dylem ystyried pa derfynau y dylid eu gosod, a yw £60,000 yn swm ymarferol, neu a yw'r awgrymiadau a wnaeth y comisiwn brenhinol a'r rhai a gyflwynwyd gan Rhodri Glyn Thomas ac eraill yn rhai ymarferol. Fel Cynulliad, dylem wneud gwaith sylweddol ar hyn. Byddai'n dda gennyf pe byddech, fel Gweinidog, wrth ymateb i Kirsty Williams, yn dweud a yw'r swm ychwanegol hwn o £23.4 miliwn yn ymarferol yng nghyd-destun ein cyllideb, ac o ba ffynhonnell y deuai'r arian hwnnw, yn eich barn chi. Ni ddymunaf herio fy ffrindiau o blith y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, ond yr wyf wedi sylwi na nodwyd ffynhonnell y swm o £23.4 miliwn. Efallai y gall y Gweinidog sy'n dal awenau'r gyllideb nodi o lle y gallai ddod, yn ei farn ef.

Kirsty Williams: Mae'n briodol ichi herio'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, Jonathan, ynglŷn â dod o hyd i'r adnoddau ychwanegol. Mater o flaenoriaethau ydyw. Teimlwn fod llawer o feysydd y mae'r Cynulliad yn gwario arian arnynt na ddylent fod yn flaenoriaeth ac y dylai hyn fod yn flaenoriaeth yn eu lle. Er mwyn cynnig enghraifft, mae'r Blaid Lafur yn bwriadu sefydlu comisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn i Gymru. Bydd hynny'n arwain at benodi rhywun y gall pobl hŷn gwyno wrtho am brinder y gofal sydd ar gael iddynt. Byddai'n well gan Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru weld defnyddio'r arian hwn i ddarparu'r gofal. Dim ond un enghraifft yw honno.

Jonathan Morgan: Mae'n bosibl eich bod wedi tynnu'r Gweinidog allan o dwll, ond yr wyf yn amau hynny. A wnaiff y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ddweud a yw hyn yn adnodd ychwanegol cynaliadwy, ac, os ydyw, o ble y daw yn y gyllideb iechyd?

I gloi, yr ydym oll yn cydnabod bod angen rhoi mwy o flaenoriaeth i'r maes hwn. Dylai Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol y Cynulliad hefyd neilltuo amser sylweddol i ystyried y pwnc hwn, os oedd gennym amser i'w roi. Dyma un o'r rhesymau pwysig y dylai'r pwyllgor gwrdd bob yn ail wythnos, yn hytrach na phob tair wythnos, sef yr hyn yr ydych chi a'ch cyd-

willing to devote more time to this, for the sake of a generation of people to whom we owe so much, I believe that we will let down many people. In his response this afternoon, the Minister could do the Government a huge favour by making a commitment to put this at the top of the priority list.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): To start with the points made by Rhodri Glyn Thomas on behalf of Plaid Cymru, people who know the history of industrial Wales will know of the problems arising from means testing. Anyone who has looked at the royal commission report will know that it does not recommend getting rid of all means testing. The only aspect of means testing that the report recommends should be abolished is the testing for personal care. The means test for hotel care will continue, as is the case in Scotland.

3.20 p.m.

Therefore, the point made in relation to the means test is not consistent because he did not argue for getting rid of the test; he argued the point on the basis of what the royal commission report stated. Rhodri Glyn must go back and think this through. Obviously, in an ideal world, we would not have means testing, but, if we are going to have it, we must ensure that the money is targeted at those with the greatest need. I do not think that Rhodri Glyn made the case, particularly as he based his point on the royal commission's report.

Kirsty mentioned that her proposals would cost £23.4 million, and the best that she came up with was the £1 million for the older people's commissioner. I am not particularly good at mathematics, but I can work out that that would leave over £20 million to be found.

Jonathan mentioned setting priorities, which we have done. We want the funding that we are providing for services for older people, insofar as it is possible to make choices in this regard, to be spent on promoting care for people in domiciliary care settings. That is

Weinidogion yn ei gefnogi. Os nad yw'r Cynulliad yn barod i roi mwy o'i amser at hyn, er mwyn cenhedlaeth o bobl y mae arnom gymaint o ddyled iddynt, credaf y byddwn yn gwneud cam â llawer o bobl. Yn ei ymateb y prynhawn yma, gallai'r Gweinidog wneud tro da iawn â'r Llywodraeth drwy ymrwymo i roi'r flaenoriaeth fwyaf i hyn.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Gan ddechrau â'r pwyntiau a wnaeth Rhodri Glyn Thomas ar ran Plaid Cymru, bydd y rhai a wŷr hanes Cymru ddiwydiannol yn gwybod am y problemau sy'n codi o'r prawf moddion. Bydd unrhyw un a welodd adroddiad y comisiwn brenhinol yn gwybod nad yw'n argymhell cael gwared â phob prawf moddion. Yr unig brawf moddion y mae'r adroddiad yn argymhell cael gwared ag ef yw'r un ar gyfer gofal personol. Bydd y prawf moddion ar gyfer gofal mewn gwesty yn parhau, fel y gwnaiff yn yr Alban.

Gan hynny, nid yw'r pwynt a wnaed mewn cysylltiad â'r prawf moddion yn gyson gan na ddadleuodd dros gael gwared â'r prawf; dadleuodd yr achos ar sail yr hyn a ddywedwyd yn adroddiad y comisiwn brenhinol. Rhaid i Rhodri Glyn fynd yn ôl ac ystyried hyn i'r pen. Wrth gwrs, mewn byd delfrydol, ni chaem brawf moddion, ond, os ydym i'w gael, rhaid inni sicrhau y targedir yr arian ar y rhai mwyaf anghenus. Ni chredaf fod Rhodri Glyn wedi pledio'r achos, yn enwedig gan ei fod wedi seilio ei ddadl ar adroddiad y comisiwn brenhinol.

Dywedodd Kirsty y byddai ei chynigion yn costio £23.4 miliwn, a'r mwyaf y gallai ddod o hyd iddo oedd yr £1 miliwn ar gyfer y comisiynydd i bobl hŷn. Nid wyf yn arbennig o dda wrth wneud symiau, ond gallaf weld y byddai angen dod o hyd i fwy na £20 miliwn ar ben hynny.

Soniodd Jonathan am bennu blaenoriaethau, a dyna a wnaethom. Yr ydym am weld gwario'r arian a ddarparwn ar gyfer gwasanaethau i bobl hŷn, hyd y gellir dewis yn hyn o beth, ar hyrwyddo gofal yn y cartref. At hynny yr aiff ein harian, a hynny y

where our money will be going, and it is what older people want, particularly those on lower incomes. Therefore, that is where our priorities lie. It is not true that we do not have priorities in this area. It is our priority to keep people in the care setting that the overwhelming majority of them want to be in.

Jonathan Morgan: Can you confirm whether, in the past six years, the total number of hours of domiciliary care delivered has fallen or increased?

Brian Gibbons: I cannot give you an answer to that question today. However, I have asked that question myself, because there is no doubt that the amount of money that has gone into promoting care for people in a domiciliary care setting has increased quite dramatically. It is proving difficult to break that down according to individual packages of care for X number of people, and I do not think that we have that information to hand in the form of robust figures. However, I have asked the question that you asked, and, hopefully, we will be able to get that information, if it is available, centrally or through the Social Services Inspectorate for Wales. Therefore, as soon as it is available, I will try to make it available to you.

Although people in certain circumstances may have to sell their property to meet the cost of residential care, this is not a mandatory requirement. A person may take a charge against his or her property, and, therefore, it will not have to be sold. If that person passes on, the family members who will benefit from the property will have a choice to make. They may be able to inherit the property and meet the charge from their own resources, thereby keeping the inheritance within the family. Alternatively, if the most important thing is to have the financial assets, they are in a position to sell the property. However, there is a range of choices for people, and a mandatory requirement for them to sell their property is not one of them.

Kirsty Williams: Would you concede that the decision in terms of making a charge on a property is a discretionary one for local authorities? Each local authority makes that

mae pobl hŷn yn ei ddymuno, yn enwedig y rhai sydd ag incwm is. Felly, dyna ein blaenoriaethau. Nid yw'n wir nad oes gennym flaenoriaethau yn y maes hwn. Ein blaenoriaeth yw cadw pobl yn y lleoliad gofal y mae'r mwyafrif llethol ohonynt am fod ynddo.

Jonathan Morgan: A allwch gadarnhau a yw cyfanswm yr oriau o ofal yn y cartref a ddarparwyd, yn y chwe blynedd diwethaf, wedi gostwng neu wedi codi?

Brian Gibbons: Ni allaf roi ateb i'r cwestiwn hwnnw heddiw. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf wedi gofyn y cwestiwn hwnnw fy hun, gan nad oes amheuaeth na fu cynnydd sylweddol yn swm yr arian a aeth tuag at hyrwyddo gofal yn y cartref. Fe'i ceir yn anodd rhannu hynny yn ôl pecynnau gofal unigol ar gyfer nifer penodol o bobl, ac ni chredaf fod y wybodaeth honno gennym wrth law ar ffurf ffigurau pendant. Er hynny, yr wyf wedi gofyn y cwestiwn a ofynasoch chi, ac yr wyf yn gobeithio y gallwn gael y wybodaeth honno, os yw ar gael, yn ganolog neu drwy Arolygiaeth Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru. Felly, cyn gynted ag y bydd ar gael, ceisiaf ei darparu i chi.

Er ei bod yn bosibl y bydd pobl mewn rhai amgylchiadau'n gorfod gwerthu eu tai er mwyn talu am gostau gofal preswyl, nid yw hynny'n orfodol. Gall rhywun gymryd arwystl ar ei eiddo, ac, felly, ni fydd yn rhaid ei werthu. Os yw'r person hwnnw'n marw, bydd dewis ar gael i aelodau'r teulu a gaiff fudd o'r eiddo. Efallai y byddant yn gallu talu am yr arwystl o'u coffrau eu hunain, gan gadw'r etifeddiaeth yn y teulu. Fel arall, os mai'r peth pwysicaf ganddynt yw cael yr asedau ariannol, gallant werthu'r eiddo. Fodd bynnag, mae amryw o ddewisiadau ar gael i bobl, ac nid yw gorfodaeth i werthu eu heiddo yn un ohonynt.

Kirsty Williams: A fydddech yn derbyn bod y penderfyniad i roi arwystl ar eiddo yn un dewisol i awdurdodau lleol? Gwneir y penderfyniad hwnnw gan bob awdurdod

decision. Do you have figures that show how many times local authorities have refused to allow a charge to be set on a property and have insisted on refunding the money? We can only request that local authorities make a charge; they do not have to accede to that request.

Brian Gibbons: Following your comments in a previous debate, I made inquiries to clarify the position. My understanding is that local authorities must offer the option of a charge to a person moving to a residential home. Each local authority will exercise the making of that offer in a slightly different way. Therefore, there is not necessarily a uniform system across Wales. However, the offer of the charge must be made to the person who is trying to meet his or her own care needs, if that is the path that they wish to follow. That is an option that local authorities must offer as part of the assessment process.

In conclusion, we are investing money in trying to support people in a community setting, and one of the big areas includes the £20 million capacity grant. Initially, this money was announced in a pre-budget statement made by the Chancellor of the Exchequer a few years ago. The Assembly Government has made the funding recurrent. Our record in this area withstands scrutiny. We may have slightly different priorities to those mentioned by opposition parties, but our priorities are in line with the wishes of the overwhelming majority of older people and our principles of social justice.

David Melding: I request that the bell be rung.

The Presiding Officer: Under Standing Order No. 6.21, at least three Members must request that the bell be rung. Do three Members support the request? I see that they do.

Glerc, canwch y gloch.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 14, Ymatal 11, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 1: For 14, Abstain 11, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

lleol. A oes gennych ffigurau sy'n dangos pa sawl gwaith y mae awdurdodau lleol wedi gwrthod caniatáu rhoddi arwystl ar eiddo ac wedi mynnu bod yr arian yn cael ei ad-dalu? Ni allwn ond gofyn i awdurdodau lleol roi arwystl; nid oes raid iddynt dderbyn y cais hwnnw.

Brian Gibbons: Yn dilyn eich sylwadau mewn dadl flaenorol, gwneuthum ymholiadau i egluro'r sefyllfa. Yn ôl yr hyn yr wyf yn ei ddeall, rhaid i awdurdodau lleol gynnig y dewis o osod arwystl i rywun sy'n symud i gartref preswyl. Bydd pob awdurdod yn cynnig hynny mewn modd ychydig yn wahanol. Felly, nid oes system gyson ledled Cymru, o reidrwydd. Er hynny, rhaid rhoi cynnig i osod arwystl i'r sawl sy'n ceisio talu am ei anghenion gofal ei hun, os yw'n dymuno dilyn y llwybr hwnnw. Rhaid i awdurdodau lleol gynnig y dewis hwnnw fel rhan o'r broses asesu.

I derfynu, yr ydym yn buddsoddi arian i geisio cynnal pobl yn y gymuned, ac mae un o'r meysydd pwysig yn cynnwys y grant adnoddau ymarferol o £20 miliwn. Cyhoeddwyd yr arian hwn, yn gyntaf, mewn datganiad rhag-gyllidebol gan Ganghellor y Trysorlys ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi troi'r cyllid hwnnw'n arian rheolaidd. Mae ein record yn y maes hwn yn dal ei harchwilio. Efallai fod ein blaenoriaethau ychydig yn wahanol i'r rhai a grybwyllodd y gwrthbleidiau, ond mae ein blaenoriaethau'n unol â dymuniadau'r mwyafrif llethol o bobl hŷn a'n hegwyddorion o ran cyfiawnder cymdeithasol.

David Melding: Galwaf am i'r gloch gael ei chanu.

Y Llywydd: O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.21, rhaid i o leiaf dri Aelod alw am ganu'r gloch. A oes tri Aelod sy'n cefnogi'r cais? Gwelaf fod.

Clerk, please ring the bell.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:

The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, Janet
German, Michael
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty

The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Francis, Lisa
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Laura Anne
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM2336): O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2336): For 54, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff

Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 14, Ymatal 11, Yn erbyn 29.
 Amendment 1: For 14, Abstain 11, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Davies, Janet
 German, Michael
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty

Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Francis, Lisa
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Laura Anne
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM2326): O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2326): For 54, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine

Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Symiau at Anghenion Personol)
 (Cymru) 2005
 Approval of the National Assistance (Sums for Personal Requirement) (Wales)
 Regulations 2005**

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): I propose that
Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Cynigïaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the National Assistance (Sums for Personal Requirements) (Wales) Regulations 2005, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 10 February 2005. (NDM2327)
Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Symiau at Anghenion Personol) (Cymru) 2005, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Chwefror 2005. (NDM2327)

I propose that

Cynigïaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 22 February 2005 in relation to the draft regulations, the National Assistance (Sums for Personal Requirements) (Wales) Regulations 2005; and
1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Chwefror 2005 mewn perthynas â'r rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Symiau at Anghenion Personol) (Cymru) 2005; a

2. *approves that the National Assistance (Sums for Personal Requirements) (Wales) Regulations 2005 is made in accordance with:*

a) *the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 10 February 2005;*

b) *regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 10 February 2005. (NDM2328)*

2. *yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Symiau at Anghenion Personol) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â:*

a) *y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Chwefror 2005*

b) *yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Chwefror 2005. (NDM2328)*

*Cynnig (NDM2327): O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2327): For 54, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun

Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2328): O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2328): For 54, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet

Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Llywodraeth Leol (Dangosyddion Perfformiad Gwerth Gorau) (Cymru) 2005 a Gorchymyn Llywodraeth Leol (Dangosyddion Perfformiad Gwerth Gorau) (Cymru) (Dirymu) 2005
Approval of the Local Government (Best Value Performance Indicators) (Wales) Order 2005 and the Local Government (Best Value Performance Indicators) (Wales) Order 2002 (Revocation) Order 2005

Y Llywydd: Cynigir trafod y ddwy eitem nesaf gyda'i gilydd, oni bai bod Aelodau'n gwrthwynebu. Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad.

The Presiding Officer: It is proposed that the next two items be debated together, unless Members object. I see that there are no objections.

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): I propose that

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Local Government (Best Value Performance Indicators) (Wales) Order 2005, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 16 February 2005. (NDM2329)

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Llywodraeth Leol (Dangosyddion Perfformiad Gwerth Gorau) (Cymru) 2005, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 16 Chwefror 2005. (NDM2329)

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 22 February 2005 in relation to the draft Order, the Local Government (Best Value Performance Indicators) (Wales) Order 2005; and

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Chwefror 2005 mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Llywodraeth Leol (Dangosyddion Perfformiad Gwerth Gorau) (Cymru) 2005; a

2. approves that the Local Government (Best Value Performance Indicators) (Wales) Order 2005 is made in accordance with:

2. yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Llywodraeth Leol (Dangosyddion Perfformiad Gwerth Gorau) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael ei wneud yn unol â:

a) the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 16 February 2005;

a) y Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 16 Chwefror 2005;

b) regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 10 February 2005. (NDM2330)

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Chwefror 2005. (NDM2330)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Local Government (Best Value Performance Indicators) (Wales) (Revocation) Order 2005, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 11 February 2005. (NDM2331)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 22 February 2005 in relation to the draft Order, the Local Government (Best Value Performance Indicators) (Wales) (Revocation) Order 2005; and

2. approves that the Local Government (Best Value Performance Indicators) (Wales) (Revocation) Order 2005 is made in accordance with:

a) the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 11 February 2005;

b) regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 10 February 2005. (NDM2332)

The two Orders that are before the Assembly today constitute a small part of the fundamental review of how local authorities assess, monitor and compare their performance. These Orders relate only to the statutory indicator sets, and not to the other elements of the framework. The Welsh Assembly Government recognised the need for a fundamental review of the national performance measurement framework and, in 2002, committed to do this in the document, 'Freedom and Responsibility in Local Government'. The local government data unit was commissioned to carry out the review in 2003, and has worked in close collaboration with local authorities and all other stakeholders in developing the new framework.

This framework will establish a smaller set of 22 statutory indicators, a larger and more balanced suite of core set indicators, shared

Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Llywodraeth Leol (Dangosyddion Perfformiad Gwerth Gorau) (Cymru) (Dirymu) 2005, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Chwefror 2005. (NDM2331)

Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Chwefror 2005 mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Llywodraeth Leol (Dangosyddion Perfformiad Gwerth Gorau) (Cymru) (Dirymu) 2005; a

2. yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Llywodraeth Leol (Dangosyddion Perfformiad Gwerth Gorau) (Cymru) (Dirymu) 2005 yn cael ei wneud yn unol â:

a) y gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Chwefror 2005;

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Chwefror 2005. (NDM2332)

Mae'r ddau Orchymyn sydd gerbron y Cynulliad heddiw'n cynrychioli rhan fach o'r adolygiad sylfaenol o'r modd y mae awdurdodau lleol yn asesu, yn monitro ac yn cymharu eu perfformiad. Mae'r Gorchymynion hyn yn ymwneud â'r setiau dangosyddion statudol yn unig, ac nid ag elfennau eraill y fframwaith. Cydnabu Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'r angen am adolygiad sylfaenol o'r fframwaith mesur perfformiad cenedlaethol ac, yn 2002, ymrwymodd i ymgymryd â hynny yn y ddogfen, 'Rhyddid a Chyfrifoldeb mewn Llywodraeth Leol'. Comisiynwyd uned ddata llywodraeth leol i gynnal yr adolygiad yn 2003, a chydweithiodd yn agos ag awdurdodau lleol a'r holl randdeiliaid eraill wrth ddatblygu'r fframwaith newydd.

Bydd y fframwaith hwn yn sefydlu set lai o 22 o ddangosyddion statudol, cyfres ehangach a mwy cytbwys o ddangosyddion

outcome indicators, and survey measures that local authorities can use to gain citizens' views on how they are performing. The new framework will enable the Assembly, the public, local authorities, and other interested persons and stakeholders to monitor progress against important national strategic objectives. It will also provide a more rounded and balanced picture of local authorities' performance, and will enable them to compare their performance with each other's over time.

Lastly, the framework will provide better information that can feed into the Wales programme for improvement assessments, and will strengthen councils' ability to provide effective scrutiny. It is important to remember that 2005-06 will be a transitional year for the new framework, and this is accepted by the regulators. We will continue to develop the core indicator sets in 2005, in partnership with local government practitioners, Assembly policy directorates and other stakeholders. The fully balanced sets should be in place by April 2006. I thank all those involved in developing these indicators, and the Local Government and Public Services Committee for its support and interest in this development.

Alun Ffred Jones: Yr ydym yn croesawu'r cynnig hwn i symleiddio'r drefn; mae'n hen bryd i Lywodraeth ganolog beidio â chreu systemau sydd yn ychwanegu at fiwrocratiaeth ddiangen. Mae dywediad Cymraeg i'r perwyl nad yw mochyn yn pesgi wrth ei bwysu bob diwrnod. Dyna'r perygl wrth gasglu gwybodaeth ddiddiwedd, os nad ydyw'n bwrpasol ac yn ystyrlon.

Yr ydym yn croesawu'r ffaith bod y Llywodraeth wedi cynnwys dangosydd sydd yn ymwneud â'r Gymraeg, wedi dadlau'n flaenorol nad oedd ei angen. Ni allaf gredu bod Llywodraeth sy'n brolio 'Iaith Pawb' yn ystyried peidio â chynnwys dangosydd i fonitro cynnydd y Gymraeg ym myd addysg. Edrychaf ymlaen at weld dangosyddion eraill sy'n ymwneud â'r Gymraeg o blith y dangosyddion craidd y cyfeiriwyd atynt gan y Gweinidog yn ei chyflwyniad. Y broblem gyda rhai o'r dangosyddion hyn yw bod

set graidd, dangosyddion canlyniadau a rennir, a ffyn mesur ar gyfer arolygon y gall awdurdodau lleol eu defnyddio i gael barn dinasyddion am eu perfformiad. Bydd y fframwaith newydd yn galluogi'r Cynulliad, y cyhoedd, awdurdodau lleol, a phobl a rhanddeiliaid eraill sy'n gysylltiedig i arolygu cynnydd yn ôl amcanion strategol cenedlaethol pwysig. Bydd hefyd yn cynnig darlun mwy cyflawn a chytbwys o berfformiad awdurdodau lleol, a bydd yn eu galluogi i gymharu eu perfformiad â'i gilydd dros amser.

Yn olaf, bydd y fframwaith yn rhoi gwell gwybodaeth y gellir ei phorthi i asesiadau rhaglen Cymru ar gyfer gwella, a bydd yn gwella gallu cynghorau i graffu'n effeithiol. Mae'n bwysig cofio y bydd 2005-06 yn flwyddyn drosiannol i'r fframwaith newydd, ac mae'r cyrff rheoleiddio'n derbyn hynny. Parhawn i ddatblygu'r setiau dangosyddion craidd yn 2005, ar y cyd ag ymarferwyr mewn llywodraeth leol, cyfarwyddiaethau polisi'r Cynulliad a rhanddeiliaid eraill. Mae'n debyg y bydd y setiau cwbl gytbwys ar waith erbyn Ebrill 2006. Diolchaf i bawb a fu'n gysylltiedig â datblygu'r dangosyddion hyn, ac i Bwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus am ei gefnogaeth a'i ddiddordeb yn y datblygiad hwn.

Alun Ffred Jones: We welcome this motion to streamline the arrangements; it is about time that central Government stopped inventing systems that increase the bureaucratic burden unnecessarily. There is a saying in Welsh that a pig gets no fatter for being weighed every day. That is the danger with the endless gathering of information, especially if it does not serve any purpose and is not meaningful.

We also welcome the fact that the Government has included an indicator on the Welsh language, despite having argued previously that that was not required. I cannot believe that a Government that so proudly vaunts 'Iaith Pawb' would consider omitting an indicator to monitor the increase in the use of the language in education. I look forward to seeing additional indicators relating to the language amid the core indicators to which the Minister referred in her opening remarks. The problem with some of these indicators is

bwlch rhwng rhethreg y Llywodraeth a'r realiti sydd yn wynebu cynghorau.

This gap is obvious in many fields, such as care home provision, for example. Last year, 76 care homes were closed, with a loss of 370 places. As the Welsh Local Government Association has pointed out, the demographics are moving against us in this field, putting an added strain on the system. It suggests that, without an increase in the fee levels, the situation will get worse. Another indicator refers to the people who receive home care, to offer greater choice to the elderly. Again, the Wanless report states that there is a disconnection between policy and implementation, and refers to the percentage fall in the expenditure for older people who are supported at home.

Therefore, let us welcome this slimming down of indicators, while also acknowledging that driving up standards without adequate funding is a fallacy and creates cynicism among the public and local authorities alike.

Glyn Davies: I, too, believe that we all welcome greater clarity and a reduction in the current bureaucratic workload of our local authorities. One of the major complaints that I receive from local authorities is with regard to their paperwork. As for weighing pigs, Alun Ffred is right in that, while it is necessary to weigh them once in a while, daily weigh-ins produce no benefit. Every discussion that I have had with local government recently has been about how to reduce the number of partnerships and the amount of forms that have to be filled in. If we are going down the road of indicators, which might reduce that load, we would welcome it.

3.40 p.m.

It is crucial that we have housing benefit and council-tax benefit indicators, because this is one area where there has been a serious failure over recent years. As a result of the current Labour Government's enthusiasm to push council tax up—which is treated as a stealth tax—a huge number of people are extremely dependent upon accessing the

that there is a gap between the Government's rhetoric and the reality facing councils.

Mae'r bwlch hwn yn amlwg mewn sawl maes, fel y ddarpariaeth cartrefi gofal, er enghraifft. Y llynedd, caewyd 76 o gartrefi gofal, gan golli 370 o leoedd. Fel y mae Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru wedi nodi, mae demograffeg yn gweithio yn ein herbryn yn y maes hwn, gan roi straen ychwanegol ar y system. Mae'n awgrymu, os na cheir ffioedd uwch, y bydd y sefyllfa'n gwaethygu. Mae dangosydd arall yn cyfeirio at y rhai sy'n cael gofal yn eu cartref, fel y caiff yr henoed fwy o ddewis. Unwaith eto, mae adroddiad Wanless yn nodi bod diffyg cysylltiad rhwng polisi a'r dull o'i weithredu, ac yn cyfeirio at y gostyngiad yng nghanran y gwariant ar gyfer pobl hŷn a gaiff gymorth yn eu cartrefi.

Felly, gadewch inni groesawu'r symleiddio hwn ar ddangosyddion, gan gydnabod hefyd mai camsyniad yw credu y gellir codi safonau heb roi arian digonol a bod hynny'n meithrin sinigiaeth ymysg y cyhoedd ac awdurdodau lleol fel ei gilydd.

Glyn Davies: Yr wyf finnau'n credu ein bod ni i gyd yn falch o gael mwy o eglurder a llai o faich biwrocraidaidd ar ein hawdurdodau lleol. Mae un o'r prif gwynion a gaf gan awdurdodau lleol yn ymwneud â'u gwaith papur. O ran pwyso moch, mae Alun Ffred yn iawn wrth ddweud, er bod angen eu pwyso o bryd i'w gilydd, nad yw eu pwyso bob dydd yn dod ag unrhyw fantais. Yr oedd pob trafodaeth a gefais â llywodraeth leol yn ddiweddar yn ymwneud â'r modd i leihau nifer y partneriaethau a nifer y ffurflenni y mae'n rhaid eu llenwi. Os ydym am ddewis cyflwyno dangosyddion, a allai ysgafnhau'r baich hwnnw, byddem yn croesawu hynny.

Mae'n hollbwysig inni gael dangosyddion ar fudd-dal tai a budd-dal y dreth gyngor, gan mai hwn yw un maes lle y cafwyd methiant difrifol dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf. O ganlyniad i sêl y Llywodraeth Lafur bresennol dros yrru'r dreth gyngor i fyny—gan ei bod yn cael ei thrin fel treth lechwraidd—mae nifer fawr iawn o bobl yn

benefits that reduce that burden. We have seen that the percentage of people who successfully access these benefits has decreased, and a huge number of vulnerable people are now being hit hard by the unacceptably high level of council tax. Therefore, with regard to this measure, every local authority should be required to do everything that it can do to ensure that vulnerable people can access those benefits to which they are entitled.

In general, the purpose of the Government here and the regulations is to simplify and to clarify councils' objectives, and we approve of that.

Michael German: I welcome the opportunity to reduce the bureaucratic burden on local authorities, and I hope that the Minister will also view the subsequent change to the inspection regime on local authorities as an area where local authorities can be given more freedom.

Obviously, some of the measures relate to funding concerns. In her response, will the Minister indicate to what level she anticipates funding to follow the performance measures? At present, most of the funding that we provide is based on historic performance, whereas these measures are an attempt to improve performance, which will have some benefits in Wales and should be rewarded in terms of funding.

You might expect several of the measures to outline how improvement could take place. Will the Minister tell us whether the measure expressed in terms of the number of 16-year-olds leaving school 'without a qualification' is what is meant? I suppose that she really means the number of 16-year-olds who leave school with a qualification, which would provide a means of assessing an authority performing well. Expressing that in the negative is not helpful.

I am grateful for the measure indicating some movement on measuring pupils' performance during primary school education, and I raised this matter in committee. The measure that

dra dibynnol ar eu gallu i gael y budd-daliadau sy'n lleihau'r baich hwnnw. Gwelsom fod canran y rhai sy'n llwyddo i gael y budd-daliadau hyn wedi gostwng, ac mae nifer mawr iawn o'r rhai sy'n agored i niwed yn cael eu taro'n galed yn awr oherwydd lefel annerbyniol o uchel y dreth gyngor. Felly, gyda golwg ar y ffon fesur hon, dylid mynnu bod pob awdurdod lleol yn gwneud popeth yn ei allu i sicrhau y bydd rhai sy'n agored i niwed yn gallu cael y budd-daliadau hynny y mae ganddynt hawl i'w cael.

Yn gyffredinol, amcan y Llywodraeth a'r rheoliadau yn hyn o beth yw symleiddio ac egluro amcanion cynghorau, a chymeradwywn hynny.

Michael German: Croesawaf y cyfle i ysgafnhau'r baich biwrocataidd ar awdurdodau lleol, a gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog hefyd yn ystyried y newid i'r gyfundrefn arolygu a geir o ganlyniad i hyn yn gyfle i roi mwy o ryddid i awdurdodau lleol.

Wrth gwrs, mae rhai o'r ffyn mesur yn ymwneud â phryderon ynghylch ariannu. Yn ei hymateb, a wnaiff y Gweinidog nodi i ba raddau y mae'n disgwyl y bydd arian yn dilyn y ffyn mesur ar berfformiad? Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r cyllid a ddarparwn yn seiliedig ar berfformiad hanesyddol, tra bo'r ffyn mesur hyn yn ymgais i wella perfformiad, a ddaw â rhai manteision yng Nghymru ac y dylid rhoi gwobr amdanynt ar ffurf cyllid.

Gellid disgwyl y byddai nifer o'r ffyn mesur yn dangos sut y gellid gwella. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym a yw'r ffon fesur a fynegir yn nhermau'r nifer o rai 16 flwydd oed sy'n gadael ysgol 'heb gymhwyster' yn fwiadol? Mae'n debyg gennyf ei bod yn golygu nifer y rhai 16 flwydd oed sy'n gadael ysgol a chanddynt gymhwyster, a gynigiai fodd i asesu bod awdurdod yn perfformio'n dda. Nid yw mynegi hynny'n negyddol yn beth buddiol.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y ffon fesur sy'n dangos y cymerir camau i fesur perfformiad disgyblion yn ystod eu haddysg ysgol gynradd, a chodais y mater hwn yn y

the Minister has indicated will kick in only with regard to children aged 11. As many of us recognise, early-years education is a crucial start for young people and, if we cannot measure performance at ages 5 and 6, then this work may fall away, as children who have a bad start continue to have a bad start. That measure is at key stage 2, not at key stage 1.

I notice that the measure on older people being helped to live at home is a key factor, which I support, although I wish that previous amendments had been carried under previous regulations, which would have enabled local authorities to do even more of that work.

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): There has been general support across the parties for this significant movement. A great deal of preparatory work has been done to get us to this stage, and I am pleased that it is now up and running for its transitional year.

Alun Ffred Jones made a point about the Welsh language. There is no need to be begrudging; I am not. That is the added value of putting things to committee. I accept that the committee made a valuable point on this, and I take it on board. I, for one, have always been prepared to acknowledge that. Therefore, that indicator on the Welsh language is an important component of this.

On the gulf between rhetoric and reality, you particularly mentioned care home places, Alun Ffred. Many of the policy agreements that we sign with local authorities are about giving much greater emphasis to domiciliary support, and removing the dependency on care homes, if that is the direction in which local authorities wish to go. You quoted the Wanless report, but that is a couple of years old now and things have moved on dramatically. Every local health board has received additional funding to achieve some of the Wanless recommendations. You said that local authorities could be cynical about this, and some of them might be, but when I looked at the consultation responses across the piece, I saw that local authorities are

pwyllogor. Ni fydd y ffon fesur a nododd y Gweinidog ond yn dechrau â phlant 11 oed. Fel y mae llawer ohonom yn cydnabod, mae addysg y blynyddoedd cynnar yn fan cychwyn hollbwysig i bobl ifanc ac, os na allwn fesur perfformiad rhai 5 a 6 oed, gallai'r gwaith hwn fynd yn ofer, gan fod plant a gafodd gychwyniad gwael yn dal i gael cychwyniad gwael. Mae'r ffon fesur honno ar gyfer cyfnod allweddol 2, nid cyfnod allweddol 1.

Sylwaf fod y ffon fesur ar helpu pobl hŷn i fyw gartref yn ffactor allweddol, a chefnogaf hynny, er y byddai'n dda gennyf pe byddai gwelliannau blaenorol wedi'u derbyn o dan reoliadau blaenorol, a fyddai wedi galluogi awdurdodau lleol i wneud mwy byth o'r gwaith hwnnw.

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex): Cafwyd cefnogaeth gyffredinol gan y pleidiau i'r newid pwysig hwn. Gwnaed llawer iawn o waith paratoadol ar gyfer hyn, ac yr wyf yn falch ei fod bellach ar waith yn ei flwyddyn drosiannol.

Gwnaeth Alun Ffred Jones bwynt am y Gymraeg. Nid oes angen bod yn grintachlyd; nid ydwyf fi felly. Dyna'r gwerth ychwanegol a geir o roi pethau gerbron pwyllogor. Derbyniaf fod y pwyllogor wedi gwneud pwynt gwerthfawr ar hyn, ac yr wyf yn ei ystyried. Bŷm i, o'm rhan fy hun, yn barod erioed i gydnabod hynny. Felly, mae'r dangosydd hwnnw ar y Gymraeg yn elfen bwysig yn hyn.

Ynghylch y bwloch rhwng rhethreg a realiti, cyfeiriasoch yn benodol at leoedd mewn cartrefi gofal, Alun Ffred. Mae llawer o'r cytundebau polisi a lofnodwn gydag awdurdodau lleol yn ymwneud â rhoi mwy o bwyslais ar gymorth yn y cartref, a chael gwared ar y ddibyniaeth ar gartrefi gofal, os yw awdurdodau lleol yn dymuno mynd i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw. Dyfynasoch o adroddiad Wanless, ond mae hwnnw'n rhyw ddwyflwydd oed bellach ac mae pethau wedi newid yn sylweddol. Mae pob bwrdd iechyd lleol wedi cael arian ychwanegol i gyflawni rhai o argymhellion Wanless. Dywedasoch y gallai awdurdodau lleol fod yn sinigaidd am hyn, ac efallai fod rhai ohonynt felly, ond pan wneuthum fwrw golwg ar yr ymatebion a

positive because these indicators are about core areas of delivery that every local authority—both officers and members—is signed up to. Some of these indicators are basic. They are what local government is about, and the money has been in the budget for many years.

Glyn's point about welcoming the reduction in workload is important. We respect that, and it has been the subject of dialogue between us and local government. There has been a building up of pressures and burdens on local government to account for this and that and to produce a number of plans, perhaps more than we would ideally want. We are trying, therefore, to reduce unnecessary bureaucracy and workload. I agree with you on the important issue of housing benefit and council tax benefit. The delivery of a good, integrated housing benefit system is one of local authorities' most important responsibilities, because the people who claim it are those most in need of help. However, you lost it somewhat with regard to council-tax benefit, because you said that the percentage of people receiving benefits has been decreasing, but the statistics that I have show that the percentage is increasing. I have always said that we must work to ensure that those people who are eligible for, and need, council-tax benefit, receive it.

On Mike's point, I await the committee's comments and look forward to its findings in the report on inspection and regulation. In terms of funding, the core funding within the revenue settlement grant covers many of these performance indicators, but I draw your attention to the policy agreements that we have signed, and will sign, with every local authority in Wales. That is additional money to enable local authorities to achieve those top performance targets. That will be linked in with the Wales programme for improvement, so this is part of that overall framework of growth.

On school-leaver qualifications, much of that is reflected in our policy agreements, and I think that it is one of the standard ones across the board. It is put in those negative terms

gafwyd i'r ymgynghoriad yn gyffredinol, gwelais mai cadarnhaol oedd ymateb yr awdurdodau lleol gan fod y dangosyddion hyn yn ymwneud â meysydd darparu craidd y mae pob awdurdod lleol—yn swyddogion ac yn aelodau—wedi cytuno arnynt. Mae rhai o'r dangosyddion yn syml. Maent yn ymwneud â phwrpas llywodraeth leol, a bu'r arian yn y gyllideb ers blynnyddoedd lawer.

Mae'r pwynt a wnaeth Glyn ynghylch croesawu'r ffaith bod y llwyth gwaith yn mynd yn llai yn un pwysig. Parchwn hynny, a bu hynny'n destun deialog rhyngom ni a llywodraeth leol. Bu mwy a mwy o feichiau a phwysau ar lywodraeth leol i roi cyfrif am yr hyn a'r llall ac i lunio nifer o gynlluniau, a hynny i fwy o raddau nag y dymunem, efallai. Gan hynny, yr ydym yn ceisio lleihau biwrocratiaeth ddiangen a'r llwyth gwaith. Cytunaf â chi ynghylch mater pwysig y budd-dal tai a budd-dal y dreth gyngor. Rhedeg system budd-dal tai dda ac integredig yw un o gyfrifoldebau pwysicaf yr awdurdodau lleol, gan mai'r rhai sy'n ei hawlio yw'r rhai mwyaf anghenus. Er hynny, aethoch ar gyfeiliorn braidd wrth sôn am fudd-dal y dreth gyngor, oherwydd dywedasoed fod canran y rhai sy'n cael budd-daliadau wedi gostwng, ond mae'r ystadegau sydd gennyf yn dangos bod y ganran yn codi. Dywedais erioed fod rhaid inni ymdrechu i sicrhau bod y rhai sy'n gymwys i gael budd-dal y dreth gyngor, a hwythau â'i angen, yn ei gael.

Ynghylch y pwynt a wnaeth Mike, disgwyliaf sylwadau'r pwyllgor ac edrychaf ymlaen at weld ei ddarganfyddiadau yn yr adroddiad ar arolygu a rheoleiddio. Gyda golwg ar gyllid, mae'r cyllid craidd yn y grant setliad refeniw yn cynnwys llawer o'r dangosyddion perfformiad hyn, ond tynnaf eich sylw at y cytundebau polisi a lofnodasom, ac a lofnodwn, gyda phob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru. Arian ychwanegol yw hwnnw a fydd yn galluogi awdurdodau lleol i gyrraedd y targedau perfformiad uchaf hynny. Cysylltir hynny â rhaglen Cymru ar gyfer gwella, felly mae hyn yn rhan o'r fframwaith cyffredinol hwnnw ar gyfer twf.

Ynghylch cymwysterau'r rhai sy'n gadael ysgol, adlewyrchir llawer o hynny yn ein cytundebau polisi, a chredaf mai hwnnw yw un o'r rhai a gytunwyd gan bawb. Fe'i

because it is about trying to reduce the number of young people who leave school without a qualification. Some interesting points were raised about early-years provision and primary schools, and I know that Jane Davidson is keen for me to point out that baseline assessments are made of children as they progress through the school system, so we must recognise that. However, this is transitional and we must always be alert to the fact that other things in which we could be interested may be coming on stream, without putting an undue burden, as I said, on local authorities. I look forward to this transitional year and what it can achieve.

mynegir yn y geiriau negyddol hynny gan mai ei amcan yw lleihau nifer y bobl ifanc sy'n gadael yr ysgol heb gymhwyster. Codwyd rhai pwyntiau diddorol ynghylch darpariaeth y blynyddoedd cynnar ac ysgolion cynradd, a gwn fod Jane Davidson yn awyddus imi dynnu sylw at y ffaith bod asesiadau llinell sylfaen o blant yn cael eu gwneud wrth iddynt fynd drwy'r system ysgolion, felly dylem gydnabod hynny. Fodd bynnag, trefniant dros dro yw hwn a rhaid inni fod yn effro o hyd i'r posibilrwydd o gynnwys pethau eraill y gallem ymddiddori ynddynt, heb roi baich gormodol, fel y dywedais, ar ysgwyddau awdurdodau lleol. Edrychaf ymlaen at y flwyddyn drosiannol hon ac at weld yr hyn y gall ei gyflawni.

3.50 p.m.

*Cynnig (NDM2329): O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2329): For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw

Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2330): O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2330): For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy

Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2331): O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2331): For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun

Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2332): O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2332): For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl

Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Cyfarwyddiadau Sylweddau Ymbelydrol (Diogelwch
 Cenedlaethol) (Cymru) 2005
 Approval of the Radioactive Substances (National Security) (Wales) Directions
 2005**

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I **Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigaf fod
 propose that

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 29.3 (iii), considers the principle of the Radioactive Substances (National Security) (Wales) Directions 2005, a copy of which was laid in Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 1 March 2005. (NDM2333)

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3 (iii) yn ystyried egwyddor Cyfarwyddiadau Sylweddau Ymbelydrol (Diogelwch Cenedlaethol) (Cymru) 2005, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd mewn e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 1 Mawrth 2005. (NDM2333)

I propose that

Cynigaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales acting under Standing Order No. 29.3(iii), approves that the Radioactive Substances (National Security) (Wales) Directions 2005 is made in accordance with the draft directions laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 1 March 2005. (NDM2334)

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3(iii) yn cymeradwyo bod Cyfarwyddiadau Sylweddau Ymbelydrol (Diogelwch Cenedlaethol) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â'r Cyfarwyddiadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 1 Mawrth 2005. (NDM2334)

Helen Mary Jones: After much careful consideration, I rise to oppose this Order on behalf of Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales. I regret the Government's decision to use this hasty procedure to bring this measure into being, although I acknowledge that our party has changed its view since we first considered this Order in committee and had a further opportunity to consider its implications. On the face of it, it seems a fairly straightforward and uncontroversial measure, but, looked at in more depth, we believe that it has serious implications and should be opposed. I therefore request that the Government considers withdrawing this motion to allow further consideration. If it is

Helen Mary Jones: Ar ôl ystyried hyn yn hir ac yn ofalus, codaf i wrthwynebu'r Gorchymyn hwn ar ran Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales. Gresynaf at benderfyniad y Llywodraeth i ddefnyddio'r weithdrefn frysiog hon i roi'r mesur hwn ar waith, er fy mod yn cydnabod bod ein plaid wedi newid ei barn ers inni ystyried y Gorchymyn hwn yn gyntaf yn y pwyllgor a chael cyfle i ystyried y goblygiadau sydd ynddo. Ar yr olwg gyntaf, mae'n ymddangos yn fesur eithaf syml ac annadleuol, ond, o'i ystyried yn fanylach, credwn fod iddo oblygiadau difrifol ac y dylid ei wrthwynebu. Gofynnaf, felly, i'r Llywodraeth ystyried tynnu'n ôl y cynnig hwn er mwyn caniatáu ystyriaeth

unable to do that, we will have to oppose it.

We have, as I said, thought hard about the implications of this opposition. We all know that the security threat faced by the civilised and democratic nations of the world is a very real one. However, governments must never be allowed to use such security threats to undermine the very democratic nature of our society and the openness that the terrorists seek to destroy.

Let us look at the realities here: the existing nuclear sites in Wales are well known and I should think that a quick reference to any website would enable our potential enemies to identify them—the power stations, certain hospitals and commercial sites. Surely we do not believe that it would be beyond the wit of well-organised terrorist organisations to infiltrate, for example, commercial companies—or, heaven forbid, the Environment Agency—if they wished to discover where new sites were to be proposed or when material was going to be moved.

This legislation would not make those sites less vulnerable, but it would make it difficult for local communities and authorities to know where such material was, when it was to be moved and to know about proposals to put it into a new site. Some time ago, we passed planning legislation, proposed by Christine Gwyther, to facilitate local communities to have a voice and to know what was going on in terms of the disposing of nuclear material. I am concerned that if we pass this measure as it stands today, we would be contradicting that important step forward, which was a great source of reassurance to many communities across Wales.

The only potential beneficiaries of this legislation are not the whole of us as a community and our safety, but companies that wish to move or store nuclear materials without proper public scrutiny. The Government has not made a case for this. It is simply following Whitehall's lead; it has not tested the advice and, frankly, it would be much better off encouraging a more proactive

bellach. Os na all wneud hynny, bydd yn rhaid inni ei wrthwynebu.

Fel y dywedais, yr ydym wedi dwys ystyried goblygiadau'r gwrthwynebiad hwn. Gwyddom oll fod y bygythiad i ddiogelwch a wynebwr gan genhedloedd gwareiddiedig a democrataidd y byd yn un sylweddol iawn. Er hynny, ni ddylid byth ganiatáu i lywodraethau ddefnyddio bygythiadau i ddiogelwch i danseilio'r union natur ddemocrataidd ac agored yn ein cymdeithas y mae'r terfysgwyr yn ceisio ei dinistrio.

Gadewch inni ystyried y wir sefyllfa yn hyn o beth: mae'r safleoedd niwclear presennol yng Nghymru'n adnabyddus a gallwn feddwl y byddai ein gelynion dichonol yn gallu eu hadnabod drwy edrych yn sydyn ar wefan—y gorsafedd trydan, rhai ysbytai a safleoedd masnachol. Nid oes bosibl ein bod yn credu ei bod y tu hwnt i allu cyrff terfysgol trefnus i ymdreiddio i gwmnïau masnachol, er enghraifft—neu, y nefoedd a'n gwaredo, Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd—os oeddent am gael gwybod am safleoedd newydd arfaethedig neu am yr adegau yr oedd deunydd i gael ei symud.

Ni fyddai'r ddeddfwriaeth hon yn peri i'r safleoedd hynny fod yn llai agored i ymosodiad, ond fe'i gwnâi'n anodd i gymunedau ac awdurdodau lleol gael gwybod ym mhle'r oedd deunydd o'r fath, pa bryd yr oedd i gael ei symud ac am gynigion i'w gadw ar safle newydd. Beth amser yn ôl, gwnaethom dderbyn deddfwriaeth gynllunio, a gynigiwyd gan Christine Gwyther, a ganiatâi i gymunedau lleol gael datgan eu barn a chael gwybod beth a oedd yn mynd ymlaen o ran gwaredu deunydd niwclear. Pryderaf, os derbyniwn y mesur hwn fel y mae heddiw, y byddem yn mynd yn groes i'r datblygiad pwysig hwnnw, a gynigiodd lawer o gysur i sawl cymuned ledled Cymru.

Nid nyni fel cymuned, er mwyn ein diogelwch, yw'r rhai a allai gael budd o'r ddeddfwriaeth hon, ond cwmnïau sy'n dymuno symud neu storio deunyddiau niwclear heb graffu priodol gan y cyhoedd. Nid yw'r Llywodraeth wedi dadlau'r achos dros hyn. Nid yw ond yn dilyn arweiniad Whitehall; nid yw wedi rhoi prawf ar y dystiolaeth ac, mewn gwirionedd, byddai'n

approach towards the protection of existing sites where we know there may be a threat, like the nuclear power stations.

The Assembly and the Assembly Government, with the support of the whole Assembly, seek to be exemplars of openness and transparency. We must not allow threats, however real, to panic us out of this position of openness or out of any other commitment to a democratic way of proceeding. Should we do so, we risk allowing the terrorists to win, for it is, after all, our democratic way of life that they seek to undermine.

Once again, I urge the Government to withdraw this motion to allow further consideration. If it does not do that, we will, with some trepidation, oppose it.

Glyn Davies: I, too, have concerns about this legislation. Its introduction is extremely significant in itself, and in the sense that is part of the overall reaction, both here and in Westminster, to the greater threat that we face. We face a greater threat today—that is not open to challenge. I accept that there have always been threats, but, since the 11 September 2001 attack on New York, all of us in the western world are much more aware of the sheer scale of the threat that we face.

I understand that the Government's first priority must always be the security of its people. Clearly, the Government is seeking to deal with the issue of security, and I am always reluctant to criticise any step aimed at securing the safety of the public and the nation. However, I am nervous about some of the actions that are being taken. Recently, we have seen the degree of nervousness with regard to the response to the greater threat at Westminster. Great debates have been held on this, focusing on matters of principle. Before going down this road, you must be careful to ensure that there is adequate discussion. In the same way as there has been serious discussion in Westminster, there must also be serious discussion between the party

llawer gwell iddi hybu dull mwy rhagweithiol o warchod y safleoedd presennol lle y gwyddom y gellid cael bygythiad, fel y gorsafodd trydan niwclear.

Mae'r Cynlluniad a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, gyda chefnogaeth y Cynulliad cyfan, yn ceisio gosod esiampyl o ran gweithredu agored a thryloyw. Ni ddylem adael i fygythiadau, ni waeth pa mor ddifrifol y maent, gael ein dychryn fel ein bod yn rhoi'r gorau i'r safbwynt agored hwn neu i unrhyw ymrwymiad arall i ddilyn dull gweithredu democrataidd. Os gwnawn hynny, mae perygl y byddwn yn gadael i'r terfysgwyr ennill, oherwydd, wedi'r cwbl, ein ffordd o fyw ddemocrataidd yw'r hyn y maent yn ceisio ei danseilio.

Unwaith eto, anogaf y Llywodraeth i dynnu'n ôl y cynnig hwn i ganiatáu ystyriaeth bellach. Os na wnaiff hynny, byddwn yn ei wrthwynebu, gyda pheth anesmwythder.

Glyn Davies: Mae gennyf finnau bryderon ynghylch y ddeddfwriaeth hon. Mae'r ffaith ei bod yn cael ei chyflwyno'n dra arwyddocaol ohoni'i hun, ac yn yr ystyr ei bod yn rhan o'r gorymateb cyffredinol, yn y fan hon ac yn San Steffan, i'r bygythiad mwy a wynebwn. Wynebwn fygythiad mwy heddiw—nid oes amheuaeth am hynny. Derbyniaf fod bygythiadau wedi bod erioed, ond, ers yr ymosodiad ar Efrog Newydd ar 11 Medi 2001, mae pawb yn y byd gorllewinol yn llawer mwy effro i faint y bygythiad a wynebwn.

Gwerthfawrogaf fod rhaid i'r Llywodraeth roi'r lle blaenaf bob amser i ddiogelwch ei phobl. Mae'n amlwg bod y Llywodraeth yn ceisio delio â mater diogelwch, ac yr wyf bob amser yn amharod i feirniadu unrhyw gam gweithredu sydd â'r amcan o sicrhau diogelwch y cyhoedd a'r genedl. Er hynny, yr wyf yn bryderus ynghylch rhai o'r camau a gymerir. Yn ddiweddar, gwelsom rywfaint o anniddigrwydd gyda golwg ar yr ymateb i'r bygythiad mwy yn San Steffan. Cynhaliwyd dadleuon gwych ar hyn, a oedd yn canolbwyntio ar faterion o egwyddor. Cyn dilyn y llwybr hwn, rhaid ichi sicrhau y ceir trafodaeth ddigonol. Yn yr un modd ag y cafwyd trafodaeth ddifrif yn San Steffan, rhaid cael trafodaeth ddifrif hefyd rhwng

leaders in the Assembly and within the Assembly.

I agree that a list of vulnerable sites should not be available to anyone who wants to see it. Having said that, I cannot believe it would not be possible to introduce a verification process that gave the right to those who could satisfy authorities that they had a legitimate interest in seeing the list of sites in Wales. That would alleviate a great deal of the concern that I have that we do not introduce systems that give terrorists exactly what they want: to destroy the long-held freedoms and system of government that we have in our country.

Jenny Randerson: As a member of the Welsh Liberal Democrats, I have three issues with this legislation. The first is to do with the process and the fact that the legislation is being brought before the Assembly under Standing Order No. 29.3. You will recall that the Standing Order indicates that a Minister should choose a path of legislation with regard to the general character and importance of the Order. This issue has been raised before in relation to education maintenance allowances. The Presiding Officer made it clear at the time that the interpretation of that Standing Order was that it should not be used for items of great importance. Although it could be argued that there is some urgency regarding this issue, I do not believe that it is so urgent that the legislation should not go through the normal channels.

My second concern is whether the legislation is enforceable. There are counter-rights under the Freedom of Information Act 2004 that could well negate the legislation. The explanatory memorandum that accompanies this legislation points out that there are 269 such sites in Wales, and it provides some details regarding their location.

However, the Welsh Liberal Democrats' main reason for opposing the legislation is on a point of principle. It is a matter of balance, and we must balance the availability of information that is important for our health and wellbeing—which is why these registers

arweinwyr y pleidiau yn y Cynulliad a'r tu mewn i'r Cynulliad.

Cytunaf na ddylai rhestr o safleoedd sy'n agored i ymosodiad fod ar gael i unrhyw un sydd am ei gweld. Wedi dweud hynny, ni allaf gredu na fyddai modd cyflwyno proses ddilysu a roddai hawl i'r rhai a all sicrhau'r awdurdodau bod ganddynt ddiddordeb dilys mewn gweld y rhestr o'r safleoedd yng Nghymru. Byddai hynny'n lleddfu llawer iawn o'r pryder sydd gennyf dros sicrhau na fyddwn yn cyflwyno systemau sy'n rhoi i derfysgwyr yr union beth y maent yn ei geisio, sef dinistrio'r breintiau a'r system lywodraeth a fu gennym yn y wlad hon ers amser maith.

Jenny Randerson: Fel aelod o Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, anghytunaf â'r ddeddfwriaeth hon ar dri chyfrif. Mae'r cyntaf yn ymwneud â'r broses a'r ffaith y dygir y ddeddfwriaeth gerbron y Cynulliad o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3. Cofiwch fod y Rheol Sefydlog yn nodi y dylai Gweinidog ddewis llwybr deddfu yng ngoleuni natur gyffredinol a phwysigrwydd y Gorchymyn. Codwyd y mater hwn o'r blaen mewn cysylltiad â lwfansau cynhalieth addysg. Eglurodd y Llywydd bryd hynny mai'r dehongliad o'r Rheol Sefydlog honno oedd na ddylid ei defnyddio ar gyfer eitemau o bwys mawr. Er y gellid dadlau bod peth brys mewn cysylltiad â'r mater hwn, ni chredaf fod cymaint o frys fel na ddylai'r ddeddfwriaeth ddilyn y cwrs arferol.

Yr ail fater sy'n peri pryder i mi yw a ellir gorfodi'r ddeddfwriaeth. Ceir gwrth-hawliau o dan Ddeddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2004 y byddai'n ddigon posibl iddynt ddirymu'r ddeddfwriaeth hon. Mae'r memorandwm esboniadol sydd gyda'r ddeddfwriaeth hon yn nodi bod 269 o safleoedd o'r fath yng Nghymru, ac mae'n cynnig rhai manylion am eu lleoliad.

Fodd bynnag, mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn gwrthwynebu'r ddeddfwriaeth hon yn bennaf ar sail egwyddor. Mater o gydbwysedd ydyw, a rhaid inni ddal y ddysgl yn wastad rhwng yr angen i sicrhau bod gwybodaeth ar gael er

have been set up—against the fear of terrorism and the fear that this information will get into the hands of terrorists. The registers exist so that people can be made aware of potentially damaging substances that surround them. In Cardiff, we have a commercial organisation known as Amersham, although it changes its name from time to time. Those of us who represent this area will know that there have been numerous campaigns relating to radioactive discharges from this site, based on information that was publicly available, as it had to be. Some of the concerns raised were found to be without merit, but, as someone who was part of those campaigns, I am certain that they led to Amersham reducing its radioactive discharges. That was an example of using public information for all our benefit, ensuring that a commercial company abided by the regulations and took everyone's health into account.

4.00 p.m.

The Government is saying that because terrorists may want to use this information, no-one can have it. The explanatory memorandum says that the registers can be accessed by anyone, unsupervised and anonymously. There is a sane and sensible solution to the problem. You could ensure that public access to this information is allowed under supervised conditions, and that people had to provide verified identification. We provide that kind of information all the time, when we go into a bank or when we buy a small item in a supermarket. Any legitimate, concerned local resident would find that kind of control acceptable. Instead, we have yet more evidence of the UK Government's heavy-handed response to the terrorist threat, which is gradually eroding our civil liberties.

At lunchtime today I had a meeting with leaders of the Muslim community in south Wales—one of whom had served for two and a half years in a Welsh regiment—who came to me to express their profound concern about the anti-terrorist legislation that is currently going through the House of Commons and the House of Lords, and about the comments of Hazel Blears in that respect. They are deeply offended and concerned that

mwyn ein hiechyd a'n lles—a dyma pam y sefydlwyd y cofrestrau hyn—ac ofn terfysgaeth a'r ofn yr aiff y wybodaeth hon i ddwylo terfysgwyr. Mae'r cofrestrau'n bod fel y gellir rhoi gwybod i bobl am y sylweddau sydd o'u cwmpas a allai beri niwed iddynt. Yng Nghaerdydd, ceir corff masnachol o'r enw Amersham, er ei fod yn newid ei enw o bryd i'w gilydd. Gŵyr y rhai ohonom sy'n cynrychioli'r ardal hon fod sawl ymgyrch wedi bod mewn cysylltiad â gollwng sylweddau ymbelydrol o'r safle hwn, ar sail gwybodaeth a oedd ar gael i'r cyhoedd, fel yr oedd i fod. Cafwyd nad oedd sail i rai o'r pryderon a godwyd, ond, fel un a fu â rhan yn yr ymgyrchoedd hynny, yr wyf yn sicr eu bod wedi peri i Amersham leihau ei ollyngiadau ymbelydrol. Yr oedd hynny'n enghraifft o'r defnydd o wybodaeth gyhoeddus er budd pawb, er mwyn sicrhau bod cwmni masnachol yn ufuddhau i'r rheoliadau ac yn ystyried iechyd pawb.

Yr hyn a ddywed y Llywodraeth yw, am y gallai terfysgwyr fod am ddefnyddio'r wybodaeth hon, na ddylai neb ei chael. Yn ôl y memorandwm esboniadol, mae modd i unrhyw un weld y cofrestrau, heb ei arolygu a heb roi ei enw. Mae ateb call a synhwyrol i'r broblem hon. Gallech sicrhau bod y cyhoedd yn cael gweld y wybodaeth hon o dan oruchwyliaeth, a bod pobl yn gorfod profi pwy a oeddent. Rhoddwn wybodaeth o'r fath drwy'r amser, pan awn i mewn i fanc neu pan brynwn eitem fach mewn archfarchnad. Byddai unrhyw breswlydd lleol dilys a phryderus yn fodlon derbyn rheolaeth o'r fath. Yn lle hynny, cawn ragor o dystiolaeth eto i ymateb llawdrwm Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i'r bygythiad gan derfysgwyr, sy'n graddol erydu ein hawliau sifil.

Amser cinio heddiw, cyfarfûm ag arweinwyr y gymuned Foslemaidd yn y De—y mae un ohonynt wedi gwasanaethu am ddwy flynedd a hanner yn un o gatrodau Cymru—a ddaeth ataf i fynegi pryder dirfawr ynghylch y ddeddfwriaeth wrth-derfysgol sy'n mynd drwy Dŷ'r Cyffredin a Thŷ'r Arglwyddi ar hyn o bryd, ac am sylwadau Hazel Blears ar hynny. Maent wedi'u tramgwyddo'n fawr ac yn dra phryderus am eu bod yn cael eu trin

they are being treated in this way. This is yet another step up the ladder of escalating overreaction on this issue. Terrorism is a serious issue and, of course, it has to be taken seriously, but the response needs to be measured, and not panicked.

I am much more concerned about the uranium that has gone missing from Sellafield than the registers under discussion today. This measure is not being debated in the House of Commons and House of Lords; it is being slipped out while they are dealing with what is, undoubtedly, the bigger issue. However, we should have given ourselves the opportunity to debate this in a different and more measured way.

Kirsty Williams: I am grateful to be able to contribute to what I believe is a very important debate. I acknowledge that the Minister, and the Business Minister, have made some attempt to give the Assembly time to debate the subject, but I have concerns that we have not used the usual processes to scrutinise legislation, giving opposition parties the fullest opportunity to recommend potential changes to the legislation before us.

To balance the argument, this is a question of risk assessment—of looking at which set of measures poses the most risk. I am being asked to give up my rights and those of my constituents to access this information, on the grounds that we will be safer for doing so. However, that seems ridiculous under these circumstances. The information contained in these registers is already well known. The fact that a potential terrorist can look at a register today, and see where material of this kind is being held, but may not do so tomorrow, if we pass this legislation, means that it is unworkable. It is not going to make us any safer. The only additional safety that the legislation might afford us is that new sites and transfers of radioactive material will not have to be recorded. In the balance of risk, my constituents and I are more at risk from not knowing where that material is held and how it is being used than from the possibility of someone, who is determined enough, accessing this material and using it against us. The fact is that these sites will not disappear overnight just because the register

fel hyn. Dyma un cam arall yn y gorymateb cynyddol ar y mater hwn. Mae terfysgaeth yn fater difrifol ac, wrth gwrs, rhaid ei gymryd o ddifrif, ond rhaid i'r ymateb fod yn un pwyllog yn hytrach nag un gwyllt.

Yr wyf yn llawer mwy pryderus ynghylch yr wraniwm a gollwyd yn Sellafield nag am y cofrestrau a drafodir heddiw. Ni cheir dadl ar y mesur hwn yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin a Thŷ'r Arglwyddi; mae'n cael ei sleifio allan tra byddant hwy'n delio â'r hyn sydd, yn sicr, yn bwnc mwy. Er hynny, dylem fod wedi rhoi cyfle i ni'n hunain gael trafod hyn mewn modd gwahanol a mwy pwyllog.

Kirsty Williams: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am gael cyfrannu i ddadl sy'n un bwysig iawn, yn fy marn i. Derbyniaf fod y Gweinidog, a'r Trefnydd, wedi gwneud rhyw ymdrech i neilltuo amser i'r Cynulliad gael dadl ar y pwnc hwn, ond pryderaf nad ydym wedi defnyddio'r prosesau arferol i graffu ar y ddeddfwriaeth, gan roi pob cyfle i'r gwrthbleidiau gael argymell newidiadau posibl i'r ddeddfwriaeth sydd ger ein bron.

Er mwyn rhoi ochr arall y ddadl, mae hyn yn fater o asesu risg—ystyried pa set o fesurau sy'n peri'r perygl mwyaf. Gofynnir imi ildio fy hawliau a hawliau fy etholwyr i weld y wybodaeth hon, ar y sail y byddwn yn fwy diogel drwy wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny'n ymddangos yn hurt o dan yr amgylchiadau hyn. Mae'r wybodaeth a geir yn y cofrestrau hyn yn hysbys eisoes. Mae'r ffaith y gall terfysgwr dichonol edrych ar gofrestr heddiw, a gweld lle y cedwir deunydd o'r math hwn, ond na chaiff wneud yfory, os derbyniwn y ddeddfwriaeth hon, yn golygu ei bod yn anymarferol. Ni fydd yn peri inni fod yr un mymryn yn ddiogelach. Yr unig ddiogelwch ychwanegol y gallai'r ddeddfwriaeth ei gynnig i ni yw na fydd rhaid cofnodi safleoedd newydd a champau i drosglwyddo deunydd ymbelydrol. Wrth bwysu a mesur y perygl, gwelid bod fy etholwyr a minnau mewn mwy o berygl o fod heb wybod lle y cedwir y deunydd hwnnw a pha ddefnydd a wneir ohono nag oddi wrth y posibilrwydd y bydd rhywun, sy'n ddigon penderfynol, yn cael y deunydd hwn ac yn ei

has; the information is already well within the public domain. This is like shutting the stable door long after the horse has bolted. This information is already in the public arena, and to suddenly introduce this legislation now will do nothing to afford greater security to those of us who live in Wales. It does, however, afford the opportunity to people who do not take this issue seriously to play fast and loose with what are potentially dangerous substances. I believe that all our communities have the right to know where this stuff is being held and the ability to access that information.

As we have already heard from previous speakers, there are other ways, if the Government is serious about reducing risks, in which this matter could be addressed. At the moment, there is open access to this information, and no-one has to tell anyone who they are or give a reason for wanting to see such information. Surely, if we are concerned with information and intelligence gathering, it would be much more effective, in terms of security and the monitoring of security, to record who is looking at this information rather than to stop access altogether.

I am fearful that, once again, this Government is eroding our civil liberties by holding the threat of terrorism over us. As other speakers have said, we are in danger of achieving just what those who would threaten our democracy would want, by undermining the basic rights on which this country stands and the basic rights of individuals to access information of this kind. Members must weigh up whether the risk to us and to our constituents would be made greater by passing this legislation—and I argue that it would—than the risk from terrorists, who already know where this stuff is kept.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I will clear up the issue about the intent behind these directions. You acknowledged, Kirsty, that Carwyn and I, as the Business Minister, wanted to bring this item before Plenary so that it would be subject to scrutiny and debate. However, the aim of the legislation is

ddefnyddio yn ein herbyn. Y gwir yw na fydd y safleoedd hyn yn diflannu dros nos dim ond am fod y gofrestr wedi diflannu; mae'r wybodaeth yn hysbys iawn eisoes. Mae hyn yn debyg i godi pais ar ôl piso. Mae'r wybodaeth hon yn wybyddus i'r cyhoedd eisoes, ac ni fydd cyflwyno'r ddeddfwriaeth hon yn fwyaf sydyn yn awr yn gwneud dim i gynnig mwy o ddiogelwch i ni sy'n byw yng Nghymru. Mae, er hynny, yn rhoi cyfle i rai nad ydynt yn cymryd y mater hwn o ddifrif gael trafod sylweddau a allai fod yn beryglus mewn modd diofal. Credaf fod hawl gan bob un o'n cymunedau i gael gwybod ym mhle y cedwir y pethau hyn a chael gweld y wybodaeth honno.

Fel y clywsom eisoes gan siaradwyr blaenorol, gellid ymdrin â'r mater hwn drwy ddulliau eraill, os yw'r Llywodraeth o ddifrif ynghylch lleihau risg. Ar hyn o bryd, gall pawb weld y wybodaeth hon, ac nid oes raid iddynt ddweud wrth neb pwy ydynt na rhoi rheswm dros ddymuno gweld gwybodaeth o'r fath. Yn sicr, os ydym yn bryderus ynghylch casglu dysg a gwybodaeth, llawer mwy effeithiol, o ran diogelwch a monitro diogelwch, fyddai cofnodi pwy sy'n gweld y wybodaeth hon yn hytrach nag atal yr hawl i'w gweld yn gyfan gwbl.

Pryderaf fod y Llywodraeth hon, unwaith eto, yn erydu ein hawliau sifil drwy ddal bygythiad terfysgaeth uwch ein pen. Fel y dywedodd siaradwyr eraill, mae pergl y byddwn yn cyflawni'r union beth y mae'r rhai a garai fygwth ein democratiaeth yn ei ddymuno, drwy danseilio hawliau sylfaenol yn y wlad hon a'r hawliau sylfaenol sydd gan unigolion i weld gwybodaeth o'r math hwn. Rhaid i Aelodau bwysu a mesur a fyddai'r perygl i ni ac i'n hetholwyr o dderbyn y ddeddfwriaeth hon yn fwy—ac yr wyf fi'n dadlau y byddai—na'r perygl o du terfysgwyr, sydd eisoes yn gwybod ym mhle y cedwir y pethau hyn.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Egluraf y mater sy'n ymwneud ag amcan y cyfarwyddiadau hyn. Gwnaethoch gydnabod, Kirsty, fod Carwyn a minnau, fel Trefnydd, am ddwyn yr eitem hon gerbron y Cyfarfod Llawn fel y gellid craffu a chael dadl arni. Fodd bynnag, amcan y ddeddfwriaeth hon yw gwahardd, ar

to prohibit, on the grounds of national security, the inclusion of any information associated with the registration of sealed radioactive sources or mobile radioactive apparatus in any registers of information held by the Environment Agency that are accessible to the public. This mainly relates to hospitals, university research departments, and certain companies, amounting to approximately 269 facilities. The powers to make this direction are contained in the Radioactive Substances Act 1993, and they have been transferred to the National Assembly for Wales and delegated to the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside. As Helen Mary acknowledged, it was not raised for detailed scrutiny when it appeared on the schedule of the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee. This direction does, however, mirror the one issued to the Environment Agency in respect of its duties in England, where the Secretary of State for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs—

Helen Mary Jones: I am grateful to you for taking this intervention; it may be difficult for you to respond to it. However, to what extent did your Government submit the evidence on which the English direction is made to any kind of scrutiny? Are you simply relying on being told by Whitehall that this is a good thing to do? I ask this question in the context that we have made different provision previously, in relation to nuclear materials, as a result of Christine Gwyther's request on the involvement of communities in planning. Has your Government scrutinised the evidence, because we have reason, of course, not to be terribly sure about British secret service evidence in other regards?

Jane Hutt: Clearly, we have collaborated with the UK Government in looking at these issues, and Glyn voiced his concerns about this. In April 2004, a UK Government ministerial security committee concluded that DEFRA should direct the Environment Agency to remove such information from its public registers. As Kirsty said, members of the public have been given largely unsupervised access to these public registers during normal office hours, and they are also

sail diogelwch cenedlaethol, cynnwys unrhyw wybodaeth sy'n ymwneud â chofrestru ffynonellau ymbelydrol seliedig neu gyfarpar ymbelydrol symudol mewn unrhyw gofrestrau gwybodaeth a ddelir gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd sydd ar gael i'w gweld gan y cyhoedd. Mae hyn yn ymwneud yn bennaf ag ysbytai, adrannau ymchwil mewn prifysgolion, a rhai cwmnïau, sef tua 269 o gyfleusterau i gyd. Ceir y pwerau i wneud y cyfarwyddyd hwn yn Neddf Sylweddau Ymbelydrol 1993, ac maent wedi'u trosglwyddo i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a'u dirprwyo i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad. Fel y cydnabu Helen Mary, ni chodwyd ef er mwyn craffu'n fanwl arno pan ymddangosodd ar amserlen Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad. Fodd bynnag, mae'r cyfarwyddyd hwn yn adlewyrchu'r un a roddwyd i Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd mewn cysylltiad â'i dyletswyddau yn Lloegr, lle y mae'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig—

Helen Mary Jones: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i chi am dderbyn yr ymyriad hwn; gallai fod yn anodd ichi ymateb iddo. Fodd bynnag, i ba raddau y gwnaeth eich Llywodraeth graffu mewn unrhyw fodd ar y dystiolaeth sy'n sail i'r cyfarwyddyd ar gyfer Lloegr? A ydych yn dibynnu'n llwyr ar y ffaith bod Whitehall wedi dweud wrthy ch y dylid gwneud hyn? Gofynnaf y cwestiwn hwn yng ngolwg y ffaith ein bod wedi gwneud darpariaeth wahanol o'r blaen, mewn cysylltiad â deunyddiau niwclear, o ganlyniad i gais gan Christine Gwyther am gynnwys cymunedau mewn cynllunio. A yw'ch Llywodraeth wedi craffu ar y dystiolaeth, gan fod gennym le i amau tystiolaeth a geir gan wasanaeth cudd Prydain mewn cysylltiad â materion eraill?

Jane Hutt: Wrth gwrs, yr ydym wedi cydweithio â Llywodraeth y DU wrth ystyried y materion hyn, a lleisiodd Glyn ei bryderon am hyn. Yn Ebrill 2004, daeth un o bwyllgorau diogelwch gweinidogol Llywodraeth y DU i'r casgliad y dylai Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig gyfarwyddo Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd i dynnu gwybodaeth o'r fath o'i chofrestrau cyhoeddus. Fel y dywedodd Kirsty, mae aelodau'r cyhoedd wedi cael gweld y

able to retain their anonymity. The agency also copies documents to local authorities. In July 2004, ahead of a direction from the Government, the Environment Agency took action to remove public access to such information. The Environment Agency has already taken that step.

cofrestrau cyhoeddus hynny, heb oruchwyliaeth gan mwyaf, yn ystod oriau swyddfa arferol, a chânt aros yn ddi-enw hefyd. Mae'r asiantaeth hefyd yn anfon copïau o ddogfennau i awdurdodau lleol. Yng Ngorffennaf 2004, cyn i'r Llywodraeth roi cyfarwyddyd, gwnaeth Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd gymryd camau i sicrhau na fyddai'r wybodaeth honno ar gael i'w gweld gan y cyhoedd. Mae'r asiantaeth wedi cymryd y cam hwnnw eisoes.

4.10 p.m.

Peter Black: I understand that you are doing what DEFRA tells you to do, but do you think that the people who might be interested in using this material will not know where it is? Have you ever used Google on the internet to search for 'radioactive material'? Do you not think that some of these sites might show up on that? How effective will this legislation be?

Peter Black: Deallaf eich bod yn dilyn cyfarwyddiadau DEFRA, ond a ydych yn tybio nad yw'r rhai a allai ymddiddori mewn defnyddio'r deunydd hwn yn gwybod ym mhle y mae? A ydych erioed wedi defnyddio Google ar y rhyngwrdd i chwilio am 'ddeunydd ymbelydrol'? Oni chredwch y gallai rhai o'r safleoedd hyn ddod i'r golwg drwy wneud hynny? Pa mor effeithiol fydd y ddeddfwriaeth hon?

Jane Hutt: I am concerned about the attitude of Members on opposition benches. If you look at perceived vulnerability, it is related to information on non-nuclear premises, not nuclear sites. This is about being sensible, and recognising issues of national security. Helen Mary Jones said in her opening remarks that she was concerned about opposing this legislation and direction today. I urge everyone to think again about opposing this measure. In collaboration with the UK Government, of course, we will keep this matter under review.

Jane Hutt: Pryderaf ynghylch agwedd Aelodau ar feinciau'r gwrthbleidiau. Os ystyriwch y gwendid a ganfuwyd, gwelwch ei fod yn ymwneud â gwybodaeth am fangreoeedd nad ydynt yn rhai niwclear. Mae hyn yn fater o fod yn synhwyrol, a chydabod y materion sy'n ymwneud â diogelwch cenedlaethol. Dywedodd Helen Mary Jones yn ei sylwadau agoriadol ei bod yn bryderus ynghylch gwrthwynebu'r ddeddfwriaeth a'r cyfarwyddyd hwn heddiw. Anogaf bawb i ailfeddwl ynghylch gwrthwynebu'r mesur hwn. Drwy gydweithio â Llywodraeth y DU, wrth gwrs, byddwn yn dal y mater hwn dan sylw.

Cynnig (NDM2333): O blaid 30, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 24.

Motion (NDM2333): For 30, Abstain 0, Against 24.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William

Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Marek, John
 Melding, David
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2334): O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 25.
 Motion (NDM2334): For 28, Abstain 0, Against 25.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Marek, John
 Melding, David
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

Cymeradwyo'r Gyllideb Atodol Approval of the Supplementary Budget

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): I propose that

the National Assembly, in accordance with Standing Order No. 21.5, adopts the supplementary budget for the financial years 2005-06, 2006-07 and 2007-08, laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 1 March. (NDM2325)

This revised budget sets out some further changes to the figures for the next three financial years, since the final budget was agreed. I circulated tables and explanatory notes to Assembly Members detailing these changes over a week ago.

The Chancellor's pre-budget report gave some welcome additional resources on top of the significant additional resources received in the UK Government's spending review last summer. The changes that I propose in the supplementary budget relate to changes in the final budget arising from the pre-budget report, together with some other budgetary changes of a technical nature.

The main external transfers are as follows. A sum of £7.4 million will be given to local government in 2005-06 from the pre-budget report, bringing the total increase in the local government settlement to over 5 per cent. A total of £5.1 million will be given to local government from the Office of the Deputy Prime Minister for police funding, and a transfer out of £21.5 million to the Home Office for the police grant. We receive UK services for the money. A sum of £5 million will be given to the social justice and regeneration portfolio from the Home Office in 2005-06 for throughcare and aftercare. A further £1.465 million has been allocated to the reserve and will be transferred in-year.

A total of £3.7 million per annum will be transferred from ODPM to devolve fire services. The budget tables show that only £2

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex): Cynigiau fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 21.5, yn mabwysiadu'r gyllideb atodol ar gyfer y blynyddoedd ariannol 2005-06, 2006-07 a 2007-08, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 1 Mawrth. (NDM2325)

Mae'r gyllideb ddiwygiedig hon yn nodi rhai newidiadau pellach a wnaed i'r ffigurau ar gyfer y tair blwyddyn ariannol nesaf, ers cytuno ar y gyllideb derfynol. Dosbarthais dablau a nodiadau eglurhaol i Aelodau'r Cynulliad a oedd yn rhestru'r newidiadau hyn dros wythnos yn ôl.

Yn adroddiad rhag-gyllidebol y Canghellor, rhoddwyd rhai adnoddau ychwanegol derbyniol ar ben yr adnoddau ychwanegol sylweddol a gafwyd yn adolygiad o wariant Llywodraeth y DU yr haf diwethaf. Mae'r newidiadau a gynigiau yn y gyllideb atodol yn ymwneud â newidiadau yn y gyllideb derfynol yn sgîl yr adroddiad rhag-gyllidebol, ynghyd â rhai newidiadau cyllidebol eraill sydd o natur dechnegol.

Mae'r prif drosglwyddiadau allanol fel a ganlyn. Rhoddir swm o £7.4 miliwn i lywodraeth leol yn 2005-06 o'r adroddiad rhag-gyllidebol, a fydd yn dod â'r cynnydd yn y setliad llywodraeth leol i gyfanswm o fwy na 5 y cant. Rhoddir cyfanswm o £5.1 miliwn i lywodraeth leol oddi wrth Swyddfa'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog i ariannu'r heddlu, a throsglwyddiad o'r swm o £21.5 miliwn i'r Swyddfa Gartref ar gyfer grant yr heddlu. Cawn wasanaethau ar gyfer y DU am yr arian hwnnw. Rhoddir swm o £5 miliwn yn y portffolio cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac adfywio oddi wrth y Swyddfa Gartref yn 2005-06 ar gyfer gofal pellach ac ôl-ofal. Dyrannwyd swm pellach o £1.465 miliwn i'r cronfeydd wrth gefn ac fe'i trosglwyddir yn ystod y flwyddyn.

Trosglwyddir cyfanswm o £3.7 miliwn y flwyddyn o Swyddfa'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog i ddatganoli gwasanaethau tân.

million will be transferred in 2006-07, which reflects the repayment of £1.7 million to ODPM in that year. I will provide that from the reserve so that the fire and rescue services budget expenditure line will be increased to £3.7 million in 2006-07 in my draft budget in the autumn. There will be an initial transfer of £6 million per annum from the Department for Education and Skills in respect of the transfer of responsibility to the Assembly of the Children and Family Court Advisory and Support Service from 1 April 2005.

Other transfers include £58,000 in 2005-06 from the Home Office for prison health services, and £32,000 from the Department of Health for health publicity material. A total of £375,000 in 2005-06 and £475,000 in 2006-07 and 2007-08 will be transferred from the Department of Trade and Industry for the manufacturing advisory service. A total of £500,000 will also be transferred to the Department for Education and Skills for the fee waiver scheme.

Technical budgetary changes include overall changes to annually managed expenditure forecasts and the final settlement to cover moving Supporting People from annually managed expenditure into the departmental expenditure limit.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.15 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.15 p.m.*

Finally, I am proposing other technical changes either arising from changes to ministerial responsibilities or to ensure that allocations are properly represented on the face of the budget. The most significant change in this category is the transfer of responsibility for children services from the health and social services portfolio to education and lifelong learning, which was announced on 24 January. This covers the Children's Commissioner for Wales, Cymorth, grants in support of child and family services, and services for children. Among other technical changes, I am proposing to transfer £10.6 million in 2005-06, £24 million in 2006-07 and £28 million in 2007-08 from family health services to LHBS

Dengys tablau'r gyllideb mai dim ond £2 filiwn a drosglwyddir yn 2006-07, ac mae hynny'n adlewyrchu ad-daliad o £1.7 miliwn i Swyddfa'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn y flwyddyn honno. Darparaf hynny o'r cronfeydd wrth gefn fel y bydd llinell wariant cyllideb y gwasanaethau tân ac achub yn codi i £3.7 miliwn yn 2006-07 yn fy nghyllideb ddrafft yn yr hydref. Ceir trosglwyddiad cychwynnol o £6 miliwn y flwyddyn o'r Adran Addysg a Sgiliau mewn perthynas â throsglwyddo cyfrifoldeb i'r Cynulliad dros y Gwasanaeth Cynghori a Chynorthwyo Llys i Blant a Theuluoedd o 1 Ebrill 2005.

Ymhlith y trosglwyddiadau eraill y mae £58,000 yn 2005-06 oddi wrth y Swyddfa Gartref ar gyfer gwasanaethau iechyd carcharau, a £32,000 oddi wrth yr Adran Iechyd ar gyfer deunydd cyhoeddusrwydd ar iechyd. Trosglwyddir cyfanswm o £375,000 yn 2005-06 a £475,000 yn 2006-07 a 2007-08 oddi wrth yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant ar gyfer y gwasanaeth cynghori ar weithgynhyrchu. Trosglwyddir cyfanswm o £500,000 hefyd i'r Adran Addysg a Sgiliau ar gyfer y cynllun hepgor ffioedd.

Ymhlith y newidiadau technegol i'r gyllideb y mae newidiadau cyffredinol i ragolygon o wariant a reolir yn flynyddol a'r setliad terfynol i dalu am symud Cefnogi Pobl o wariant a reolir yn flynyddol i'r terfyn gwariant adrannol.

Yn olaf, cynigiau newidiadau technegol eraill sydd naill ai'n codi o newidiadau i gyfrifoldebau gweinidogol neu i sicrhau y caiff dyraniadau eu dangos yn y modd priodol yn y gyllideb. Y newid pwysicaf o'r fath yw trosglwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb dros wasanaethau plant o'r portffolio iechyd a gwasanaethau cyhoeddus i'r portffolio addysg a dysgu gydol oes, a gyhoeddwyd ar 24 Ionawr. Mae hyn yn cynnwys Comisiynydd Plant Cymru, Cymorth, grantiau i gynnal gwasanaethau i blant a theuluoedd, a gwasanaethau i blant. Ymysg y newidiadau technegol eraill, yr wyf yn cynnig trosglwyddo'r symiau o £10.6 miliwn yn 2005-06, £24 miliwn yn 2006-07 a £28 miliwn yn 2007-08 oddi wrth wasanaethau

and trusts and central budget receipts to reflect an expected fall in hospital and community health services income as a result of the implementation of free prescriptions. This delivers one of our commitments in 'Wales: A Better Country'.

This supplementary budget makes a number of final technical adjustments to the figures approved by the Assembly last November. I commend it to the Assembly.

Alun Ffred Jones: I am advised that this is largely a technical motion that corrects some mistakes and so on. That is all well and good. However, all of us who are here to represent the people of Wales must surely ask whether the amount of money in the system is sufficient to respond to the needs of Wales. The answer to that is patently 'no'. If we consider the appalling health statistics and the decidedly unhealthy waiting lists, it is obvious that we have a system that is creaking at the seams. If you consider the depressing gross value added figures for west Wales and the Valleys, the Government must surely recognise that Wales should be funded according to its needs. That is the only way to stabilise communities and ensure that they are not left to weaken any further, be they post-industrial, urban or rural communities that are becoming unsustainable in the true sense of the word.

The Barnett formula is outdated and must be reformed. The current situation means that we are robbing Peter to pay Paul. Nowhere is this more obvious than with Objective 1 funding. To deny that the Government has to take money from current spending to provide match funding for Objective 1 flies in the face of the facts and in the face of that honourable man, Alun Michael, who put the argument so eloquently to the Treasury only to be met by a prudent Scottish 'no'.

While noting that higher taxes have resulted in a huge investment in health, the returns seem to be extremely patchy. The Wanless report notes that the widespread use of waiting time initiatives using non-recurring

iechyd teuluol i BILlau ac ymddiriedolaethau a derbyniadau i'r gyllideb ganolog i adlewyrchu'r gostyngiad a ragwelir yn yr incwm o wasanaethau ysbytai ac iechyd cymunedol yn sgîl darparu presgripsiynau am ddim. Mae hyn yn cyflawni un o'n hymrwymiaidau yn 'Cymru: Gwlad Well'.

Mae'r gyllideb atodol hon yn gwneud sawl newid technegol terfynol i'r ffigurau a gymeradwywyd gan y Cynulliad fis Tachwedd diwethaf. Fe'i cymeradwyaf i'r Cynulliad.

Alun Ffred Jones: Dywedir wrthyf mai cynnig technegol yw hwn gan mwyaf sy'n cywiro rhai camgymeriadau ac yn y blaen. Mae hynny i gyd yn iawn. Fodd bynnag, mae'r rhai ohonom sydd yma i gynrychioli pobl Cymru'n sicr o ofyn a yw'r swm o arian sydd yn y system yn ddigon i ddiwallu anghenion Cymru. Yr ateb amlwg i hynny yw 'nac ydyw'. Os ystyriwn yr ystadegau iechyd gwarthus a'r rhestrau aros, sy'n dra symbol, mae'n amlwg bod gennym system sy'n gwegian. Os ystyriwch y ffigurau gwerth ychwanegol crynswth digalon ar gyfer gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd, mae'n amlwg bod yn rhaid i'r Llywodraeth gydnabod y dylid ariannu Cymru yn ôl ei hanghenion. Dyna'r unig fodd i sefydlogi cymunedau a sicrhau na adewir iddynt fynd yn wannach, boed hwy'n gymunedau ôl-ddiwydiannol, trefol neu wledig sy'n mynd yn anghynaliadwy yng ngwir ystyr y gair.

Mae fformiwla Barnett yn hen ffasiwn a rhaid ei diwygio. Oherwydd fod y sefyllfa fel y mae, yr ydym yn dwyn o'r naill law i dalu'r llall. Gwelir hynny yn achos arian Amcan 1 yn anad dim arall. Mae gwadu bod y Llywodraeth yn gorfod tynnu arian o'r gwariant presennol i ddarparu arian cyfatebol ar gyfer Amcan 1 yn mynd yn groes i'r ffeithiau ac i'r hyn a wnaeth y dyn anrhydeddus hwnnw, Alun Michael, a gyflwynodd y ddadl mor huawdl i'r Trysorlys, ond iddo gael ei wrthod yn ddarbodus gan yr Albanwr.

Tra'n nodi bod trethi uwch wedi arwain at fuddsoddiad anferth mewn iechyd, ymddengys fod yr enillion yn anghyson iawn. Mae adroddiad Wanless yn nodi bod y defnydd helaeth a wnaed o fentrau ar

funding has provided neither good value for money nor sustainable reductions in waiting times. However, we seem to be going down the same route again with this budget.

Finally, I will concentrate on funding for the Supporting People programme, which has been slashed by the Government this year and will face further cost cuts next year. Every week, the Government regales us with references to measures taken to tackle cycles of deprivation, economic inactivity and family breakdown. However, voluntary groups are facing a 25 per cent cut in their funding, only a couple of years after the new support arrangements for vulnerable young people were introduced. The same standard of support is expected, but the funding is being eroded and slashed. This is the worst possible practice, which has left workers and clients in a terrible position. I would like the Minister to give some assurance to these groups that their future funding will stabilise and that no further cuts will be made.

4.20 p.m.

Mark Isherwood: I congratulate the Welsh Assembly Government on yet another budget statement that makes up in waste for what it lacks in clarity. We must recall that huge increases in devolved public spending have produced declining public services, despite the dedication and expertise of front-line professionals, because the evidence that they put forward is ignored by these dogmatic, centralising Welsh ministerial commissars.

With Gordon Brown's black hole hovering over Wales, threatening post-election cuts or unsustainable tax increases if Labour were to be re-elected, we must recall that Brown the Imprudent has consistently got his borrowing, tax and spend forecasts wrong, and that all forecasters tell us that his current spending plans will breach his much-vaunted golden rule. We must take note of the statement in *The Economist* that Labour's claims of economic success, which are at the

amseroedd aros drwy ddefnyddio cyllid achlysurol heb roi gwerth da am arian na gostyngiadau cynhaliadwy yn yr amseroedd aros. Er hynny, ymddengys ein bod yn dilyn yr un llwybr eto gyda'r gyllideb hon.

Yn olaf, canolbwyntiaf ar yr arian ar gyfer rhaglen Cefnogi Pobl, a dorrwyd gan y Llywodraeth eleni ac a fydd yn wynebu rhagor o doriadau ar gostau y flwyddyn nesaf. Bob wythnos, mae'r Llywodraeth yn ein diddanu â chyfeiriadau at gamau a gymerwyd i fynd i'r afael â chylchoedd amddifadedd, anweithgarwch economaidd a chwalfa deuluol. Er hynny, mae grwpiau gwirfoddol yn wynebu toriad o 25 y cant yn eu cyllid, dim ond dwy flynedd ar ôl cyflwyno'r trefniadau cymorth newydd ar gyfer pobl ifanc sy'n agored i niwed. Disgwylir cymorth o'r un safon, ond mae'r cyllid yn cael ei leihau a'i dorri. Dyma'r arfer gwaethaf posibl, a adawodd weithwyr a chleientiaid mewn sefyllfa ofnadwy. Carwn glywed y Gweinidog yn cynnig rhyw sicrwydd i'r grwpiau hyn y bydd eu cyllid yn y dyfodol yn sefydlog ac na wneir toriadau pellach.

Mark Isherwood: Llongyfarchaf Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar ddatganiad cyllideb arall eto sy'n gwneud iawn ar ffurf gwastraff am ei ddiffyg eglurdeb. Rhaid inni gofio bod cynnydd anferth mewn gwariant cyhoeddus datganoledig wedi arwain at ddirywiad mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, er gwaethaf ymroddiad ac arbenigedd gweithwyr proffesiynol yn y rheng flaen, gan fod y dystiolaeth a gyflwynant yn cael ei diystyru gan y comisariaid gweinidogol dogmatig hyn yng Nghymru, sydd mor hoff o ganoli.

Gan fod bwyell Gordon Brown yn cael ei dal uwchben Cymru, yn bygwth toriadau ar ôl yr etholiad neu godiadau anghynaliadwy mewn trethi os caiff Llafur ei ailethol, rhaid inni gofio bod Brown yr Annoeth wedi camgymryd yn gyson yn ei ragolygon ar fenthyca, trethu a gwario, a bod yr holl broffwydi'n dweud wrthym y bydd ei gynlluniau gwariant presennol yn torri ei reol euraid, y ceir cymaint o frolio yn ei chylech. Rhaid inni gymryd sylw o'r datganiad yn *The*

heart of its campaign for the coming general election, are 'dodgy', and that Labour is claiming all the credit for reforms introduced by the Conservatives.

After eight years of hard Labour in London, and six years in Cardiff, Wales is now the least prosperous region or nation in the UK, it has the poorest basic literacy and numeracy skills of any nation or region in the United Kingdom, and it has seen hospital waiting lists rise to more than one in 10 of the population. The bottom line of this supplementary budget is an increase of £30 million, but, after allowing for a £45 million increase in market support scheme funding for farmers in demand-led funding from the UK Government, it is a cut in real terms, largely because of cross-budget transfers and refunds.

We welcome the fact that the £7 million pre-election bribe to keep council tax levels down was forwarded to local authorities. We congratulate the Welsh Assembly Government on that. However, we note that with the unfunded burdens that have been imposed on local government, with capping and rebanding, this will mean big council tax increases for many, and cuts in services for all, after the general election.

We note the £49 million transfer from health to education, due to changes in ministerial responsibility, but we can have no confidence in ability of the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to deliver improvements accordingly. This is the Minister for whom increased spending means cuts in our schools and colleges, and the Minister who, perhaps more than any other, represents the problems with numeracy in Wales.

We note with particular concern that, yet again, there has been no recognition of the growing housing crisis in Wales, which has been caused by the Welsh Assembly

Economist i'r perwyl bod honiadau Llafur ynghylch llwyddiant economaidd, sydd wrth wraidd ei ymgyrch ar gyfer yr etholiad cyffredinol sydd ar ddod, yn 'amheus', a bod Llafur yn hawlio'r holl glod am ddiwygiadau a gyflwynwyd gan y Ceidwadwyr.

Ar ôl wyth mlynedd o Lafur caled yn Llundain, a chwe blynedd yng Nghaerdydd, Cymru bellach yw'r rhanbarth neu genedl leiaf ffyniannus yn y Deyrnas Unedig, ganddi hi y mae'r sgiliau llythrennedd a rhifedd sylfaenol gwaelaf o holl genhedloedd a rhanbarthau'r DU, a gwelodd restrau aros ysbytai'n codi fel eu bod yn cynnwys mwy nag un ym mhob 10 o'r boblogaeth. Ceir cynnydd o £30 miliwn o ganlyniad i'r gyllideb atodol hon, ond, ar ôl ystyried y cynnydd o £45 miliwn yn y cyllid oddi wrth Lywodraeth y DU ar gyfer y cynllun cynnal marchnadoedd i ffermwyr, sy'n cael ei arwain gan y galw, mae'n golygu y ceir toriad mewn gwirionedd, yn bennaf oherwydd trosglwyddiadau rhwng cyllidebau ac ad-daliadau.

Croesawn y ffaith bod y cil-dwrn cynetholiadol o £7 miliwn i gadw lefelau'r dreth gyngor i lawr wedi'i drosglwyddo i awdurdodau lleol. Llongyfarchwn Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar hynny. Er hynny, nodwn y bydd llawer yn gweld codiadau mawr yn eu treth gyngor, oherwydd y beichiau a roddwyd ar ysgwyddau llywodraeth leol, heb eu hariannu, a'r capio a'r ailfandio, ac y bydd toriadau mewn gwasanaethau i bawb, ar ôl yr etholiad cyffredinol.

Nodwn y trosglwyddiad o £49 miliwn o iechyd i addysg, yn sgîl newidiadau i gyfrifoldebau gweinidogol, ond ni allwn ymddiried yng ngallu'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i sicrhau gwelliannau yn sgîl hynny. Hon yw'r Gweinidog y mae gwariant uwch yn peri iddi wneud toriadau yn ein hysgolion a'n colegau, a'r Gweinidog sydd, yn anad yr un arall o bosibl, yn cynrychioli'r problemau a geir o ran rhifedd yng Nghymru.

Nodwn gyda phryder neilltuol na chafwyd unrhyw gydnabyddiaeth, eto byth, i'r argyfwng tai sy'n tyfu yng Nghymru, a achoswyd gan doriadau enfawr a gwarthus

Government's disgraceful and massive cuts in affordable housing. No amount of spin can conceal the fact that affordable housing budgets in 2007 will still be less than they were when Labour came to power 10 years previously, despite the house-price inflation of the intervening years. Although the notion of a bottom line is alien to this profligate and discredited Government, the bottom line of this supplementary budget is that Wales remains trapped between a borrow-now, tax-later Chancellor and a spend-more, deliver-less Welsh Assembly Government.

Mae Cymru wedi ei dal rhwng Canghellor sy'n benthycu yn awr ac yn codi trethi yn ddiweddarach, a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru sy'n gwario mwy ac yn cyflawni llai.

Jenny Randerson: While agreeing with Plaid Cymru on the inadequacy of the Barnett formula, the Welsh Liberal Democrats realise that this debate is about how we live within our current means. Having said that, this budget leaves a great deal to be desired.

The big issue concerns the level of the reserves, which are about twice the size that they were last year and which have increased by another £0.5 million since the final budget. There is still no clarity as to where the money in the reserves will be spent. We have been told that various Government projects and promises must be rolled out on a pilot basis and that we will know the results in time. For example, how much will free school breakfasts cost? We have a little clue in the MEG to MEG transfers—£135,000 has been transferred this year to pay for them. Therefore, we have a stepping stone, but we are not given the final answer, and not even a ballpark figure. We know that you can put a ballpark figure into the budget. For example, this was done when the Assembly learning grants were introduced under the partnership Government. It proved, according to the Minister, to have been too much, but at least the money was there and earmarked for a specific project. Therefore, the Welsh Liberal Democrats would like to know how much of that reserve will be spent on the free school breakfasts, on the pensioners' swimming initiative and on free travel for 16 to 18-year-

Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ym maes tai fforddiadwy. Ni all unrhyw faint o sbinio gelu'r ffaith y bydd cyllidebau ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy yn 2007 yn dal i fod yn llai nag yr oeddent pan ddaeth Llafur i rym 10 mlynedd yn gynharach, er gwaethaf y chwyddiant ym mhrisiau tai yn y cyfamser. Er bod y syniad o fantoli'r gyllideb yn un dieithr i'r Llywodraeth afradlon ac anhygred hon, canlyniad y gyllideb atodol hon yw bod Cymru wedi'i dal o hyd rhwng Canghellor sy'n benthycu'n awr ac yn codi trethi'n ddiweddarach, a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru sy'n gwario mwy ac yn cyflawni llai.

Wales is trapped between a Chancellor who borrows now only to tax later, and a Welsh Assembly Government that spends more and delivers less.

Jenny Randerson: Er ein bod yn cytuno â Phlaid Cymru bod fformiwla Barnett yn annigonol, mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn sylweddoli bod y ddadl hon yn ymwneud â'r modd yr ydym yn byw ar yr incwm sydd gennym. Wedi dweud hynny, mae'r gyllideb hon ymhell o fod yn foddhaol.

Y pwnc pwysicaf yw lefel y cronfeydd wrth gefn, sydd tua dwywaith yn fwy nag yr oeddent y llynedd ac sydd wedi cynyddu £0.5 miliwn yn ychwanegol ers y gyllideb derfynol. Nid oes unrhyw eglurhad byth ynghylch lle y caiff yr arian yn y cronfeydd wrth gefn ei wario. Dywedwyd wrthym fod rhaid cyflwyno sawl prosiect a chyflawni sawl addewid o eiddo'r Llywodraeth ar ffurf cynlluniau peilot ac y cawn wybod beth yw'r canlyniadau ymhen amser. Er enghraifft, beth fydd cost brechwastau am ddim mewn ysgolion? Mae gennym awgrym bach yn y trosglwyddiadau rhwng y naill brif grŵp gwariant a'r llall—trosglwyddwyd £135,000 eleni i dalu amdanynt. Felly, gallwn weld y cam cyntaf, ond ni roddir yr ateb terfynol i ni, nac amcangyfrif bras hyd yn oed. Gwyddom y gallwch gynnwys amcangyfrif yn y gyllideb. Gwnaed hynny, er enghraifft, pan gyflwynwyd grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad o dan y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth. Cafwyd ei fod yn ormod, yn ôl y Gweinidog, ond o leiaf bod yr arian ar gael ac wedi'i glustnodi ar gyfer prosiect penodol. Felly, carai Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru gael gwybod pa faint o'r cronfeydd wrth gefn a

olds, and how much the Welsh Assembly Government is putting into future years—not including next year—to cover the costs of additional higher education funding, if it decides not to proceed with top-up fees. That is, after all, one of the options in the interim Rees report that is available to the Government. The suspicion, of course, is that this information is being kept from us at this time in order for the Labour Assembly Government to be able to unveil, with a dramatic flourish, a fresh set of promises just before the general election. Watch this space.

gaiff ei wario ar frecwastau am ddim mewn ysgolion, ar y fenter nofio i bensynwyr ac ar deithio am ddim i rai 16 i 18 mlwydd oed, a pha faint y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei neilltuo ym mlynnyddoedd y dyfodol—heb gynnwys y flwyddyn nesaf—i dalu am gostau arian ychwanegol ar gyfer addysg uwch, os penderfyna beidio â mynd ymlaen â ffioedd ychwanegol. Dyna un o'r dewisiadau sydd ar gael i'r Llywodraeth yn adroddiad dros dro Rees, wedi'r cwbl. Yr hyn a amheuir, wrth gwrs, yw bod y wybodaeth hon yn cael ei chadw oddi wrthym ar yr adeg hon fel y gall Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad wneud cyhoeddiad dramatig am set newydd o addewidion ychydig cyn yr etholiad cyffredinol. Daliwch sylw.

4.25 p.m.

Another issue is the number of corrections in this supplementary budget resulting from previous errors. It may seem a minor issue, but we had a fundamental breakdown, review and rebuilding of the budget. We would have expected the numerous errors in the budgets for health and social services, and environment, planning and countryside to have been detected before the final budget in November. This does not create confidence in the budget process.

Mater arall yw nifer y cywiriadau sydd yn y gyllideb atodol hon o ganlyniad i wallau blaenorol. Gallai ymddangos yn fater dibwys, ond mae'r gyllideb wedi'i dadansoddi, ei hadolygu a'i hailwampio'n sylfaenol. Byddem wedi disgwyl i'r gwallau niferus yn y cyllidebau ar gyfer iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, ac amgylchedd, cynllunio a chefn gwlad fod wedi'u darganfod cyn y gyllideb derfynol ym mis Tachwedd. Nid yw hyn yn ennyn hyder ym mhroses y gyllideb.

We also have concerns regarding specific issues such as the level of local government funding. I reiterate my colleague's comments on the Supporting People budget, previously called the supported housing revenue grant. We realise that these cuts were initiated by the Treasury, but a £12 million cut next year appears to be falling disproportionately on local authorities in Wales. This appears to be affecting Wales more than England. It could well be argued that we need this money more in Wales, and it is disappointing that the only increase in the supplementary budget to deal with this specific issue is £600,000. There will be further cuts and a further decline next year, despite the fact that this money is very badly needed.

Mae gennym bryderon hefyd ynghylch materion penodol fel lefel yr arian ar gyfer llywodraeth leol. Ailddatganaf sylwadau fy nghyd-Aelod ar gyllideb Cefnogi Pobl, a elwid yn flaenorol yn grant refeniw tai â chymorth. Sylweddolwn mai'r Trysorlys a wnaeth y toriadau hyn, ond ymddengys fod y toriad o £12 miliwn y flwyddyn nesaf yn effeithio'n anghyfartal ar awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru. Ymddengys ei fod yn cael mwy o effaith ar Gymru nag ar Loegr. Gellid dadlau bod arnom fwy o angen yr arian hwn yng Nghymru, a thestun siom yw mai dim ond £600,000 yn fwy a geir yn y gyllideb atodol i ymdrin â'r mater hwn. Ceir toriadau pellach a dirywiad pellach y flwyddyn nesaf, er bod taer angen yr arian hwn.

The final issue I want to raise is the way in which health money is spent on a series of sticking-plaster measures. Members have had many opportunities to criticise the Government time and again, but it never

Y mater olaf y dymunaf ei godi yw'r modd y caiff arian ar gyfer iechyd ei wario ar gyfres o fesurau dros dro. Mae Aelodau wedi cael sawl cyfle i feirniadu'r Llywodraeth dro ar ôl tro, ond ni wnaiff byth wrando, felly nid

listens, so I will not repeat the criticisms. However, we have seen a series of sticking-plaster measures, rather than the fundamental surgery that the NHS in Wales needs. This is not money well spent. We spend an awful lot of money on health in Wales, but we do not spend it wisely.

As Welsh Liberal Democrats, we cannot support this budget. It does not reflect our priorities, and, because of the shadowy figure of the reserves, it does not even reflect the Labour Assembly Government's priorities as set out in its last manifesto.

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): As usual, people find it very difficult to confine themselves to the matter in hand. Much of what has been said this afternoon relates to the final budget that was put through and not the budget before us today. The principles of the budget were approved by the Assembly at the end of November last year. The supplementary budget before you contains a technical adjustment, as many Members acknowledged. It has been made for several reasons, one of the main ones being to make sure that we represent accurately the additional £7.4 million that Gordon Brown gave us in his pre-budget report before Christmas. It is there to be used by local government.

With regard to Alun Ffred and Mark's points, they may hold them dear in their hearts, but they were nevertheless irrelevant to this debate. The vote was taken in November and the budget approved. They may have different views, but I found that the budget was warmly welcomed by the private sector, the voluntary sector and the groups that will benefit.

4.30 p.m.

I will move on to Jenny's points, which, in fairness, were more related to the supplementary budget. The issue of reserves, and the way in which we show new initiatives, is an important principle. You rightly pointed out, Jenny, that we put the old Assembly learning grants in the budget but we learned that that was the wrong thing to

ailadroddaf y beirniadaethau. Er hynny, gwelsom gyfres o fesurau dros dro, yn hytrach na'r llawdriniaeth sylfaenol y mae ar y GIG yng Nghymru ei hangen. Nid felly y dylid gwario'r arian. Gwariwn lawer iawn o arian ar iechyd yng Nghymru, ond nid ydym yn ei wario'n ddoeth.

Fel Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, ni allwn gefnogi'r gyllideb hon. Nid yw'n adlewyrchu ein blaenoriaethau, ac, oherwydd ffigur annelwig y cronfeydd wrth gefn, nid yw hyn yn oed yn adlewyrchu blaenoriaethau Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad fel y'u nodwyd yn ei manifesto diwethaf.

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex): Yn ôl yr arfer, mae pobl yn ei chael yn anodd iawn eu cyfyngu eu hunain i'r mater dan sylw. Mae llawer o'r hyn a ddywedwyd y prynhawn yma'n ymwneud â'r gyllideb derfynol a dderbyniwyd ac nid â'r gyllideb sydd ger ein bron heddiw. Cymeradwywyd egwyddorion y gyllideb gan y Cynulliad ddiwedd Tachwedd y llynedd. Mae'r gyllideb atodol sydd ger eich bron yn cynnwys newid technegol, fel y mae sawl Aelod wedi cydnabod. Fe'i gwnaed am nifer o resymau, ac un o'r rhai pwysicaf yw sicrhau ein bod yn dangos yn gywir y swm ychwanegol o £7.4 miliwn a roddodd Gordon Brown i ni yn ei adroddiad rhag-gyllidebol cyn y Nadolig. Mae yno i'w ddefnyddio gan lywodraeth leol.

Gyda golwg ar y pwyntiau a wnaeth Alun Ffred a Mark, efallai eu bod yn agos at eu calon, ond yr oeddent, er hynny, yn amherthnasol i'r ddadl hon. Cynhaliwyd y bleidlais ym mis Tachwedd a chymeradwywyd y gyllideb. Efallai fod eu barn yn wahanol, ond cefais fod y gyllideb wedi'i chroesawu'n wresog gan y sector preifat, y sector gwirfoddol a'r grwpiau a gaiff fudd ohoni.

Symudaf ymlaen at y pwyntiau a wnaeth Jenny, a oedd, er tegwch, yn fwy perthnasol i'r gyllideb atodol. Mae mater y cronfeydd wrth gefn, a'r modd y dangoswn fentrau newydd, yn egwyddor bwysig. Yr oeddech yn iawn wrth ddweud, Jenny, ein bod wedi cynnwys hen grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad yn y gyllideb a gwelsom mai camgymeriad oedd

do, because we did not estimate them correctly and that line was staying there with money that would not be spent. You will remember that, when I first got the job of Finance Minister, I said that I would not take that approach, because I did not want to see lines in budgets where money was accumulating and not being spent. It is much more sensible to do the pilot work beforehand, to keep that money back in reserves and be certain of your figures, and then to put them on the face of the budget. That is what we are doing with school breakfasts and other initiatives. I can give you more details of where the reserves will go but I am sure that, in your heart, you know that initiatives such as student support, and many others, exist and that it is there.

I am not happy that there were some errors. I think that this is largely down to the change in Assembly sub-accounting mechanisms, and I will do my best to ensure that errors are not repeated. They are minor errors in the course of the work, but we do not want to see them repeated.

You will know that Edwina and I have made strong representations on the Supporting People initiative, and we will continue to keep our eye on the needs of those groups that have benefited from it. We will keep reviewing the money that is being spent.

I will end by responding to Mark's comments—I was going to say that I would end on a high note, but it is a low note. Amid your diatribe of prejudice against us and your lack of understanding of the reality of what is happening on the ground, Mark, your comments on education shone out in blazing glory. You criticised us enormously. I refer you to Estyn, the organisation that is there to do the job of inspecting and reviewing standards. Estyn has made it clear that it believes that education has improved every year in the last five years. You do not have to believe me or Jane Davidson, but please believe Estyn. If you do not think that Estyn is any good, I wonder where you are going.

hynny, gan na wnaethom eu hamcangyfrif yn gywir ac yr oedd yr arian hwnnw'n sefyll heb ei wario. Cofiwch imi ddweud, pan gefais swydd y Gweinidog Cyllid yn gyntaf, na ddilynwn ddull gweithredu o'r fath, gan nad oeddwn am weld arian yn cronni mewn llinellau cyllidebau na châi ei wario. Llawer doethach yw gwneud y gwaith rhagbrofol o flaen llaw, gan gadw'r arian hwnnw yn y cronfeydd wrth gefn a bod yn sicr o'r ffigurau, ac wedyn eu cynnwys yn y gyllideb. Dyna yr ydym yn ei wneud yn achos brecwastau mewn ysgolion a mentrau eraill. Gallaf roi rhagor o fanylion i chi ynghylch lle y gwarir yr arian yn y cronfeydd wrth gefn ond yr wyf yn sicr y gwyddoch yn eich calon fod mentrau fel cymorth i fyfyrwyr, a llawer un arall, yn bod a bod arian ar gael ar eu cyfer.

Nid wyf yn fodlon y cafwyd rhai gwallau. Credaf fod hynny'n ganlyniad yn bennaf i newid a fu yn nulliau is-gyfrifyddu'r Cynulliad, a gwnaf fy ngorau i sicrhau na cheir y gwallau hynny eto. Mân wallau ydynt a gafwyd yng nghwrs y gwaith, ond nid ydym am eu gweld yn digwydd eto.

Gwyddoch fod Edwina a minnau wedi cyflwyno sylwadau cryf ar fenter Cefnogi Pobl, a pharhawn i gadw golwg ar anghenion y grwpiau hynny a gafodd fudd ohoni. Byddwn yn dal i adolygu'r arian a warir.

Terfynaf drwy ymateb i'r sylwadau a wnaeth Mark—yr oeddwn am ddweud fy mod am orffen ar nodyn uchel, ond nodyn isel ydyw. Yng nghanol eich ymosodiad rhagfarnllyd arnom a'ch diffyg dealltwriaeth am yr hyn sy'n digwydd mewn gwirionedd ar lawr gwlad, Mark, yr oedd eich sylwadau am addysg yn disgleirio. Gwnaethoch ladd arnom yn ofnadwy. Fe'ch cyfeiriaf at Estyn, y corff sydd â'r cyfrifoldeb dros arolygu ac adolygu safonau. Eglurodd Estyn ei fod yn credu bod addysg wedi gwella bob blwyddyn yn y pum mlynedd diwethaf. Nid oes raid ichi fy nghredu i neu Jane Davidson, ond credwch Estyn, os gwelwch yn dda. Os na chredwch fod Estyn yn dda i rywbeth, yr wyf yn meddwl tybed beth yw'ch amcan.

*Cynnig (NDM2325): O blaid 29, Ymatal 9, Yn erbyn 9.
Motion (NDM2325): For 29, Abstain 9, Against 9.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Davies, David
Davies, Janet
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Cymeradwyo Newidiadau Diwedd Blwyddyn i Brif Grwpiau Gwariant Approval of End-year Changes to Main Expenditure Groups

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): I propose that

the National Assembly, in accordance with Standing Order No. 21.6, approves the changes to main expenditure groups for the financial year 2004-05. (NDM2324)

I think that I should have proposed this

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Laura Anne
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex): Cynigiad fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 21.6, yn cymeradwyo'r newidiadau i'r prif grwpiau gwariant ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol 2004-05. (NDM2324)

Credaf y dylwn fod wedi cynnig y cynnig

motion before proposing the last one. We need to look at that next year. This is, if you like, a kind of tidying up of the in-year budget. Most of the changes shown in the tables between the main expenditure groups would have been reported to committees over the course of months, so you will be familiar with them. This is the last of a series of motions that I bring to the Assembly each financial year to explain the changes that are required to be made in-year. This motion is for the current financial year.

There are 12 transfers of existing provision between the main expenditure groups, all of which are routine. A description of each is given in the notes to table 1, which is attached to the motion. The motion adds almost £250 million to the Assembly's budget for the current financial year. That increase is as a result of three things: the take-up of carry-forward provision, which is commonly known as end-year flexibility; transfers to and from Government departments; and increases in the annually managed expenditure, which comes from the Westminster Government. Details of these changes are set out in the tables attached to the motion and the accompanying notes that have been sent to all Members. The additional end-year flexibility provision will be drawn down via a spring supplementary estimate and will be used to cover the costs of activities that were unfunded pressures, the steel regeneration package and other in-year pressures.

A fully updated list of revised budgets for this financial year will appear on the management information systems as soon as possible.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: On some points of clarity, such as the transfers within the health and social services budget, the Minister for Health and Social Services announced a package of £32 million, specifically towards targeting waiting times and waiting lists, some time ago. Is that included in these particular changes, or is it over and above them? In addition, are the costs for changes in

hwn cyn y diwethaf. Rhaid inni ystyried hynny y flwyddyn nesaf. Rhyw fath o waith tacluso yw hwn ar y gyllideb yn ystod y flwyddyn, os caf ei roi felly. Bydd y rhan fwyaf o'r newidiadau a ddangosir yn y tablau rhwng y prif grwpiau gwariant wedi'u hadrodd i bwyllgorau dros y misoedd diwethaf, felly byddwch yn gyfarwydd â hwy. Hwn yw'r olaf mewn cyfres o gynigion a ddygaf gerbron y Cynulliad ym mhob blwyddyn ariannol i egluro'r newidiadau y mae'n rhaid eu gwneud yn ystod y flwyddyn. Mae'r cynnig hwn yn un ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol gyfredol.

Trosglwyddir 12 swm yn y ddarpariaeth bresennol rhwng y prif grwpiau gwariant, ac mae pob un ohonynt yn arferol. Rhoddir disgrifiad o bob un yn y nodiadau ar gyfer tabl 1, sydd wedi'i atodi i'r cynnig. Mae'r cynnig yn ychwanegu bron £250 miliwn at gyllideb y Cynulliad ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol gyfredol. Mae'r cynnydd hwnnw'n ganlyniad i dri pheth: y defnydd o ddarpariaeth a gariwyd ymlaen, a elwir fel arfer yn hyblygrwydd diwedd blwyddyn; trosglwyddo i adrannau Llywodraeth ac oddi wrthynt; a chynnydd ym maint y gwariant a reolir yn flynyddol, a ddaw oddi wrth Lywodraeth San Steffan. Nodir manylion y newidiadau hyn yn y tablau a atodwyd i'r cynnig ac yn y nodiadau a oedd gyda hwy a anfonwyd at bob Aelod. Bydd y ddarpariaeth ychwanegol a geir oherwydd hyblygrwydd diwedd blwyddyn yn cael ei defnyddio drwy amcangyfrif atodol yn y gwanwyn ac fe'i defnyddir i dalu am gostau gweithgareddau a gafwyd oherwydd pwysau nas ariannwyd, y pecyn adfywio ar gyfer y gweithfeydd dur a phwysau eraill yn ystod y flwyddyn.

Bydd rhestr o'r cyllidebau diwygiedig, wedi'i diweddarau'n llawn, ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol hon i'w gweld ar y systemau gwybodaeth rheoli cyn gynted ag y bo modd.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Er mwyn cael eglurhad ar rai pwyntiau, fel y trosglwyddiadau o fewn y gyllideb iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, cyhoeddodd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol becyn o £32 miliwn, i dargedu amseroedd aros a rhestrau aros yn benodol, beth amser yn ôl. A yw hynny wedi'i gynnwys yn y newidiadau hyn, neu a yw'n

prescription charges and the cost of building new hospitals in Rhondda and Porthmadog included in these particular main expenditure groups? I also refer you to last week's Audit Committee meeting, at which the chief executives of three NHS trusts—Swansea, Bro Morgannwg and Cardiff and the Vale—said that they were facing substantial shortfalls in the next financial year, even though they had met the targets that you had set for them. Have you made any arrangements within these transfers, Minister, to ensure that those trusts will get the amount of money that they need to carry out their services?

Mark Isherwood: This is largely a procedural, demand-led measure, and we will therefore be supporting it. The issue is not how much money the Welsh Assembly Government spends, but how well it spends it. As I said earlier, we can have no confidence in a Welsh Assembly Government with such a woeful record, financial illiteracy and a sub-standard service to its customers, the people of Wales.

Jenny Randerson: The Welsh Liberal Democrats wish to raise some questions about these figures and the issues that arise from them. First, on the transfer of £135,000 for piloting the school breakfasts scheme from the educational and lifelong learning MEG to the central administration MEG, can we have a breakdown of that figure? Is this the total figure for the cost of the pilot to date, or is it the administrative cost of school breakfasts, as opposed to the cost of the food that the children eat? Alternatively, is this the cost for the Assembly's central administration to run the scheme, as opposed to the front-line costs of the scheme in schools? We would be grateful for some clarification on that.

The Welsh Liberal Democrats are concerned about some issues within the individual budgets. One is the £1.374 million for the restructuring Education and Learning Wales.

ychwanegol atynt? Hefyd, a yw'r costau ar gyfer newidiadau i daliadau presgripsiwn a chost codi ysbytai newydd yn y Rhondda a Phorthmadog wedi'u cynnwys yn y prif grwpiau gwariant hyn? Fe'ch cyfeirïaf hefyd at gyfarfod y Pwyllgor Archwilio yr wythnos diwethaf, lle y dywedodd prif weithredwyr tair ymddiriedolaeth GIG—Abertawe, Bro Morgannwg a Chaerdydd a'r Fro—eu bod yn wynebu diffygion sylweddol yn y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf, er eu bod wedi cyrraedd y targedau yr oeddech wedi'u gosod iddynt. A wnaethoch unrhyw drefniadau o fewn y trosglwyddiadau hyn, Weinidog, i sicrhau y bydd yr ymddiriedolaethau hynny'n cael y swm o arian y mae arnynt ei angen i ddarparu eu gwasanaethau?

Mark Isherwood: Mesur trefniadol sy'n cael ei arwain gan y galw yw hwn, at ei gilydd, ac, oherwydd hynny, byddwn yn ei gefnogi. Y mater dan sylw yw nid pa faint o arian y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wario, ond pa mor ddoeth y mae wrth ei wario. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, ni allwn ymddiried mewn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru sydd â'r fath record druenus, sy'n ariannol anllythrennog ac yn cynnig gwasanaeth eilradd i'w chwsmeriaid, sef pobl Cymru.

Jenny Randerson: Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn dymuno codi rhai cwestiynau ynghylch y ffigurau hyn a'r materion sy'n codi yn eu sgîl. Yn gyntaf, ynghylch trosglwyddo'r swm o £135,000 i roi prawf ar y cynllun brechwastau am ddim o'r prif grŵp gwariant addysg a dysgu gydol oes i'r prif grŵp gwariant gweinyddiaeth ganolog, a allwn gael dadansoddiad o'r ffigur hwnnw? Ai hwn yw'r ffigur ar gyfer cyfanswm cost y cynllun peilot hyd yma, ynteu cost weinyddol brechwastau am ddim, yn hytrach na chost yr hyn y mae'r plant yn ei fwyta? Neu fel arall, ai hon yw'r gost i weinyddiaeth ganolog y Cynulliad ar gyfer rhedeg y cynllun, yn hytrach na'r gost o redeg y cynllun mewn ysgolion? Byddem yn ddiolchgar o gael ychydig o eglurhad ar hynny.

Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn bryderus ynghylch rhai materion yn y gwahanol gyllidebau. Un ohonynt yw'r swm o £1.374 miliwn ar gyfer ad-drefnu Dysgu ac

It would be useful to know whether that is the Assembly Government's estimate of how much restructuring ELWa will cost. We would also be interested to know why there is yet another cut of £7.7 million in the money for Assembly learning grants. Why has this opportunity not been used to change the rules of eligibility for those grants, to ensure that more people, both generally and from different income categories, can benefit from them?

Finally, on the economic development and transport portfolio, it is a matter of great concern that less than half the money available for the knowledge exploitation fund has been spent. That was transferred last year in a MEG-to-MEG transfer from education and lifelong learning to economic development and transport, with the express aim of ensuring that the money was spent more effectively, and that the link between universities and the commercial world was made more explicit and proactive. However, less than half the money has been spent following last year's transfer. It is a great pity that that money is not being used in the way in which it was intended. We will not be supporting this as a budget measure, because we do not support the overall framework. We do, however, appreciate that this is a technical measure, which ensures that the maximum amount of money is spent at the end of the year, but we do not share the priorities of the Labour Assembly Government in terms of how that money is spent.

4.40 p.m.

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): On Rhodri Glyn's points, the £32 million that Brian Gibbons announced the week before last is to be spent in the next financial year, therefore, it would not be seen in this year's budget.

Free prescriptions are being phased in, and so there was an element from last year's budget and there will be further phasing in over the next couple of years. On the two hospitals that you mentioned, in Porthmadog and Rhondda, work has started in this financial year to be continued through capital expenditure in the subsequent financial year.

Addysgu Cymru. Buddiol fyddai cael gwybod ai amcangyfrif Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yw hynny o gost ad-drefnu ELWa. Byddai hefyd o ddiddordeb inni gael gwybod pam y ceir toriad arall eto o £7.7 miliwn yn yr arian ar gyfer grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad. Pam nad achubwyd ar y cyfle hwn i newid y rheolau cymhwyster ar gyfer y grantiau hynny, i sicrhau bod mwy o bobl, yn gyffredinol ac o wahanol gategoriâu incwm, yn gallu cael budd ohonynt?

Yn olaf, ynghylch portffolio datblygu economaidd a thrafnidiaeth, testun pryder mawr yw mai llai na hanner yr arian sydd ar gael ar gyfer y gronfa datblygu gwybodaeth sydd wedi'i wario. Fe'i trosglwyddwyd y llynedd o brif grŵp gwariant addysg a dysgu gydol oes i brif grŵp gwariant datblygu economaidd a thrafnidiaeth, gyda'r bwriad clir o sicrhau y câi'r arian ei wario'n fwy effeithiol, ac y byddai'r cyswllt rhwng prifysgolion a byd masnach yn fwy amlwg a rhagweithiol. Er hynny, llai na hanner yr arian a wariwyd ar ôl ei drosglwyddo y llynedd. Mae'n drueni mawr na ddefnyddir yr arian hwnnw yn unol â'r bwriad. Ni chefnogwn hyn fel mesur cyllideb, gan nad ydym o blaid y fframwaith cyffredinol. Gwerthfawrogwn, er hynny, mai mesur technegol yw hwn, sy'n sicrhau y caiff y swm mwyaf posibl o arian ei wario ar ddiwedd y flwyddyn, ond nid ydym yn rhannu blaenoriaethau Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad o ran y modd y caiff yr arian hwnnw ei wario.

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex): Ynghylch y pwyntiau a wnaeth Rhodri Glyn, gwarir y swm o £32 miliwn a gyhoeddodd Brian Gibbons yr wythnos cyn y ddiwethaf yn y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf, felly nis gwelid yng nghyllideb y flwyddyn hon.

Cyflwynir presgripsiynau am ddim yn raddol, ac felly yr oedd elfen o gyllideb y flwyddyn ddiwethaf a chymerir rhagor o gamau tuag at hynny dros y ddwy flynedd nesaf. Ynghylch y ddau ysbyty a grybwyllasoch, ym Mhorthmadog a'r Rhondda, mae gwaith wedi dechrau yn y flwyddyn ariannol hon a barheir drwy wariant cyfalaf yn y flwyddyn ariannol

ddilynol.

On Jenny's point, the money referred to has been transferred from the education and lifelong learning budget to the central administration fund. Therefore, that refers to the unit being set up to deliver school breakfasts. If you are embarking upon a huge and significant programme such as this, you need to keep some central control.

On the ELWa restructuring costs, you need to raise that point with Jane Davidson, because that is not part of this budget. There has not been a cut of £7.7 million in Assembly learning grant money; the budget for that is demand led. Jenny, you are still finding it hard to understand the nature of a demand-led budget. If the demand is not there, we do not spend the money. Clearly, the terms of reference for ALGs are as they were agreed initially. Your view is that the terms of reference should be changed, but Jane Davidson has a contrary view.

Jenny Randerson: You keep telling me that I do not understand the concept of a demand-led budget; I assure you that I do understand that concept.

The point that I keep making to you is that, given that you have a set amount of money, and given the Assembly learning grant allowance made available for every student, if the number of students does not reach the number that was estimated, why not take the opportunity of using that additional funding to increase the number of students who are eligible, in other words, by changing the criteria, or why not increase the amount of money allocated to each student?

Sue Essex: A demand-led budget is demand led for a particular product, whether for prescriptions or ALGs. The product was defined and you cannot submit a set budget until you know the likely demand for a product. I explained earlier that we had learned many lessons on that principle. You extolled the virtues of the partnership Government's approach, but we learned that we did not submit accurate estimates for the scheme's costs. We put money into the budget line and, for a couple of years, we did

Ynghylch y pwynt a wnaeth Jenny, mae'r arian dan sylw wedi'i drosglwyddo o gyllideb addysg a dysgu gydol oes i'r gronfa gweinyddiaeth ganolog. Felly, mae hynny'n cyfeirio at yr uned a sefydlir i roi'r cynllun brechwastau am ddim ar waith. Wrth gychwyn ar raglen anferth a phwysig o'r fath, rhaid cadw rhywfaint o reolaeth ganolog.

Ynghylch costau ad-drefnu ELWa, rhaid ichi godi'r pwynt hwnnw gyda Jane Davidson, gan nad yw hynny'n rhan o'r gyllideb hon. Ni fu toriad o £7.7 miliwn yn yr arian ar gyfer grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad; mae'r gyllideb ar gyfer hynny'n cael ei arwain gan y galw. Jenny, yr ydych yn dal i'w gael yn anodd deall natur cyllideb a arweinir gan y galw. Os nad oes galw, ni wariwn yr arian. Wrth gwrs, mae'r amodau ar gyfer grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad fel y'u cytunwyd ar y dechrau. Yr ydych chi o'r farn y dylid newid yr amodau, ond barn i'r gwrthwyneb sydd gan Jane Davidson.

Jenny Randerson: Yr ydych yn dweud wrthyf o hyd nad wyf yn deall cysyniad cyllideb a arweinir gan y galw; yr wyf yn eich sicrhau fy mod yn ei ddeall.

Y pwynt y daliaf i'w godi gyda chi yw, gan fod gennyh swm penodol o arian, ac yng ngolwg y ffaith bod lwfans grant dysgu'r Cynulliad ar gael i bob myfyriwr, os nad yw nifer y myfyrwyr yn cyrraedd yr amcangyfrif, pam na ddylid achub ar y cyfle i ddefnyddio'r arian ychwanegol hwnnw i gynyddu nifer y myfyrwyr sy'n gymwys, mewn geiriau eraill, drwy newid y meini prawf, neu pam na ddylid neilltuo swm mwy o arian ar gyfer pob myfyriwr?

Sue Essex: Mae cyllideb a arweinir gan y galw yn un sy'n ateb y galw am gynnyrch penodol, boed yn bresgripsiynau neu'r grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad. Diffiniwyd y cynnyrch ac ni ellir cyflwyno cyllideb benodol hyd nes y gwyddys y galw tebygol am gynnyrch. Eglurais yn gynharach ein bod wedi dysgu llawer o wersi am yr egwyddor honno. Gwnaethoch ganmol dull gweithredu'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth, ond gwelsom nad oeddem wedi cyflwyno amcangyfrifon cywir ar gyfer costau'r

not reach the required level. You keep saying that this represents a cut in the budget, but it is not a cut because that was the nature of the product defined. You may wish to redefine the ALG product, but Jane Davidson has stated that she does not wish to do so; that is a difference of opinion.

On the knowledge exploitation fund, when it was transferred to the economic development and transport budget, Andrew Davies undertook a review and part of the reason for transferring it from education to economic development was to make the link with the commercial world more explicit. I understand that the review has been undertaken and, when Andrew reports on that, we will all share the fruits and results of that review. I commend the motion to Members.

cynllun. Gwnaethom ddyrannu arian i'r llinell gyllideb honno ac, am flwyddyn neu ddwy, ni chyraeddasom y lefel ofynnol. Daliwch i ddweud mai toriad yn y gyllideb yw hwn, ond nid felly y mae oherwydd dyna oedd natur y cynnyrch a ddiffiniwyd. Efallai'ch bod yn dymuno ailddiffinio grant dysgu'r Cynulliad, ond mae Jane Davidson wedi dweud nad yw'n dymuno gwneud hynny; gwahaniaeth barn yw hwnnw.

Ynghylch y gronfa datblygu gwybodaeth, pan drosglwyddwyd honno i gyllideb datblygu economaidd a thrafnidiaeth, ymgwymerodd Andrew Davies ag adolygiad ohoni a rhan o'r rheswm dros ei throsglwyddo o gyllideb addysg a dysgu gydol oes oedd peri i'r cyswllt â byd masnach fod yn fwy amlwg. Deallaf fod yr adolygiad wedi'i gwblhau, a phan wnaiff Andrew adrodd ar hynny, byddwn oll yn rhannu ffrwyth a chanlyniadau'r adolygiad hwnnw. Cymeradwyaf y cynnig i Aelodau.

*Cynnig (NDM2324): O blaid 39, Ymatal 7, Yn erbyn 6.
Motion (NDM2324): For 39, Abstain 7, Against 6.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
German, Michael
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Williams, Brynle

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
 The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Adroddiad Grant Arbennig Rhif 6 (Cymru) 2004: Refeniw Ysgol
 Ychwanegol
 Approval of Special Grant Report No. 6 (Wales) 2004: Additional School
 Revenue**

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I propose that **Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly, under section 88B of the Local Government Finance Act 1988, and in accordance with Standing Order No. 21.11, approves the Local Government Finance (Wales) Special Grant Report No. 6 (Wales) 2004, which was laid in the Table Office on 28 February 2005. (NDM2323)

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol o dan adran 88B o Ddeddf Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol 1988, ac yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 21.11, yn cymeradwyo Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) Adroddiad Grant Arbennig Rhif 6 (Cymru) 2004, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Chwefror 2005. (NDM2323)

I am pleased to bring this special grant report before the Assembly for approval. It distributes an additional £23 million to local education authorities in Wales in 2005-06 for improving standards in schools. We want authorities to use this significant amount of additional revenue funding to drive up standards in three ways: by reducing or maintaining the size of junior classes at no more than 30 pupils per teacher, by supporting low-performing schools, and by providing support to smaller rural schools where the headteacher has a significant timetabled teaching commitment.

Yr wyf yn falch o ddwyn yr adroddiad grant arbennig hwn gerbron y Cynulliad i'w gymeradwyo. Mae'n dosbarthu swm ychwanegol o £23 miliwn i awdurdodau addysg lleol yng Nghymru yn 2005-06 i wella safonau mewn ysgolion. Yr ydym am weld awdurdodau'n defnyddio'r swm sylweddol hwn o gyllid refeniw ychwanegol i godi safonau mewn tri modd: drwy leihau neu gadw maint dosbarthiadau iau fel na fyddant yn fwy na 30 disgybl yr athro, drwy gynorthwyo ysgolion isel eu perfformiad, a thrwy gynnig cymorth i ysgolion gwledig llai os yw'r pennaeth wedi ymrwymo i ddysgu am gyfran sylweddol o'r amserlen.

The money provided to authorities for the reduction of junior class sizes over the last four years has resulted in the proportion of

O ganlyniad i ddarparu arian i awdurdodau i leihau maint dosbarthiadau iau dros y pedair blynedd diwethaf, mae cyfran y disgyblion

junior pupils in classes of over 30 falling from 29 per cent in September 2000 to 0.6 per cent in September 2004, once exemptions are included as outlined in annex D. I am delighted that we have achieved this 'Wales: A Better Country' target. It has been achieved thanks to tighter grant conditions, determined effort by local education authorities, and the co-operation of heads and governors throughout Wales. I intend to maintain support at the same level in 2005-06 in order to ensure that this improvement is embedded, and that all pupils in Wales can expect to be in classes of no more than 30 pupils per teacher during their entire time in primary school.

I want all our schools to provide a high standard of education for their pupils. For this reason, the grant report ring-fences £3 million to tackle low performance. Authorities are required to give priority to low-performing schools in the most deprived communities in distributing this element of the grant. This will be the third year of funding specifically earmarked for low-performing schools. I will be looking closely at the outcomes later this year, to decide whether the grant has resulted in a narrowing of the gap in performance between schools.

The remaining £1 million of grant funding is provided to continue specific support to headteachers in small and rural schools. This was formerly distributed as part of the small and rural schools additional revenue funding. Members will be aware that funding for small and rural schools is continuing in 2005-06, through the better schools fund for innovative and collaborative working between schools and the grant for community focused schools and this grant report, rather than through a special grant report for small and rural schools.

I commend this report to Members. It supports the Assembly's key priority of improving school standards. Schools and their pupils will benefit directly from the increased funding.

Janet Ryder: The release of any extra money to schools is welcome, but the use of specific grants poses a specific problem for

iau mewn dosbarthiadau o fwy na 30 wedi disgyn o 29 y cant ym Medi 2000 i 0.6 y cant ym Medi 2004, ar ôl cynnwys eithriadau fel y nodir yn atodiad D. Yr wyf wrth fy modd ein bod wedi cyrraedd y targed hwn sydd yn 'Cymru: Gwlad Well'. Cyflawnwyd hynny drwy osod amodau caethach ar grantiau, drwy ymdrech benderfynol gan awdurdodau addysg lleol, a thrwy gydweithrediad penaethiaid a llywodraethwyr ledled Cymru. Bwriadaf gadw'r cymorth ar yr un lefel yn 2005-06 i sicrhau y bydd y gwelliant hwn yn parhau, ac y gall pob disgybl yng Nghymru ddisgwyl bod mewn dosbarth o ddim mwy na 30 disgybl yr athro drwy gydol ei amser yn yr ysgol gynradd.

Yr wyf am weld ein holl ysgolion yn cynnig addysg o safon uchel i'w disgyblion. Oherwydd hynny, mae'r adroddiad grant yn clustnodi £3 miliwn i fynd i'r afael â pherfformiad isel. Mae'n ofynnol i awdurdodau roi blaenoriaeth i ysgolion sydd â pherfformiad isel yn y cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig wrth ddsbarthu'r elfen hon yn y grant. Hon fydd y drydedd flwyddyn y clustnodwyd arian ar gyfer ysgolion sydd â pherfformiad isel. Byddaf yn edrych yn fanwl ar y canlyniadau yn ddiweddarach eleni, i benderfynu a yw'r grant wedi arwain at gau'r bwch rhwng perfformiad ysgolion.

Darperir y swm o £1 filiwn o gyllid grant sy'n weddill i barhau â chymorth penodol ar gyfer penaethiaid mewn ysgolion bach a gwledig. Dosbarthwyd hwn o'r blaen fel rhan o'r cyllid refeniw ychwanegol i ysgolion bach a gwledig. Gŵyr Aelodau y bydd cyllid ar gyfer ysgolion bach a gwledig yn parhau yn 2005-06, drwy'r gronfa ysgolion gwell ar gyfer gwaith arloesol a chydweithrediadol rhwng ysgolion a'r grant ar gyfer ysgolion bro a'r adroddiad grant hwn, yn hytrach na thrwy'r adroddiad grant arbennig ar gyfer ysgolion bach a gwledig.

Cymeradwyaf yr adroddiad hwn i Aelodau. Mae'n ategu blaenoriaeth allweddol y Cynulliad o wella safonau ysgolion. Bydd ysgolion a'u disgyblion yn cael budd uniongyrchol o'r cynnydd yn y cyllid.

Janet Ryder: Mae unrhyw arian ychwanegol a roddir i ysgolion i'w groesawu, ond mae'r defnydd o grant penodol yn peri problem

schools. It does not help them to plan their finances holistically. It would be much better for schools to receive their funding in one block on a three-year basis, which would allow them to fund and plan on a long-term basis, giving them security and stability, rather than their having to respond to short-term timetables.

For this report, I presume that the LEAs must report back by June. Schools and LEAs probably have an idea as to what they will do with this money. However, if the aim of this money is to reduce class numbers, to support headteachers and support low-performing schools, on what grounds does the Minister justify an LEA retaining this money for its own use? Will the Minister be specific, and tell me why this money should not go straight to schools, and how an LEA can use the money specifically for itself? There have been incidences in the past when this money has been used by LEAs.

On Welsh-medium schools, paragraph e of annex D, states that for

‘children for whom education at a school which is Welsh speaking or of a particular religious denomination is desired, where the school concerned is the only such school within a reasonable distance of their home’

such schools are allowed to exceed a class size of 30 pupils. Will the Minister consider the situation at Ysgol Pen Barras in Ruthin, the only Welsh-medium school in that area? It has been instructed by the LEA that it will not be allowed to have classes of over 30 pupils, thus causing the school to have to look at its classes again and to group them vertically, that is, to have mixed-age classes in certain years in order to accommodate having fewer than 30 pupils in a class. While the aim of having fewer than 30 pupils in a class is desirable, it has severe implications for a school such as Ysgol Pen Barras when it hits one or two years in particular. What work is the Minister undertaking with the LEA, when it is telling the school that it cannot exceed the limit of 30 pupils in a class?

benodol i ysgolion. Nid yw'n eu helpu i drafod eu harian yn gyfannol. Byddai'n well o lawer pe bai ysgolion yn derbyn eu cyllid yn un bloc bob tair blynedd, fel y gallent ariannu a chynllunio ar sail hirdymor, gyda sicrwydd a sefydlogrwydd, yn hytrach na gorfod ymateb i amserlenni tymor byr.

Gyda golwg ar yr adroddiad hwn, cymeraf fod rhaid i'r AALLau adrodd yn ôl erbyn mis Mehefin. Mae'n debyg bod gan ysgolion ac AALLau ryw syniad ynghylch yr hyn a wnânt â'r arian hwn. Er hynny, os mai bwriad yr arian hwn yw lleihau maint dosbarthiadau, cynorthwyo penaethiaid a rhoi cymorth i ysgolion isel eu perfformiad, ar ba sail y mae'r Gweinidog yn cyfiawnhau bod AALL yn cadw'r arian hwn at ei ddibenion ei hun? A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi ateb manwl, a dweud wrthyf pam na ddylai'r arian hwn fynd yn syth at ysgolion, a sut y gall AALL ddefnyddio'r arian hwn er ei fwyn ei hun? Cafwyd achosion yn y gorffennol pan ddefnyddiwyd yr arian hwn gan AALLau.

Ynghylch ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg, dywedir ym mharagraff e o atodiad D, yn achos

‘plant y dymunir iddynt gael addysg mewn ysgol Gymraeg neu ysgol sy'n perthyn i enwad crefyddol penodol, lle mai'r ysgol dan sylw yw'r unig ysgol o'r fath o fewn pellter rhesymol i'w cartref’

caniateir i ysgolion o'r fath fod â dosbarthiadau o fwy na 30 o ddisgyblion. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ystyried y sefyllfa yn Ysgol Pen Barras yn Rhuthun, sef yr unig ysgol cyfrwng Cymraeg yn yr ardal honno? Mae'r AALL wedi cyfarwyddo na chaniateir iddi fod â dosbarthiadau o fwy na 30 o ddisgyblion, fel bod yr ysgol wedi gorfod ailedrych ar ei dosbarthiadau a'u grwpio'n fertigol, hynny yw, cael dosbarthiadau cymysg o ran oedran mewn rhai blynyddoedd er mwyn gallu cael llai na 30 o ddisgyblion mewn dosbarth. Er bod yr amcan o gael llai na 30 o ddisgyblion mewn dosbarth yn ddymunol, mae iddo oblygiadau difrifol i ysgol fel Ysgol Pen Barras pan yw'n effeithio ar un neu ddwy flwyddyn yn benodol. Pa waith y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud gyda'r AALL, gan ei fod yn dweud wrth yr ysgol na

chaiff fynd dros y terfyn o 30 disgybl mewn dosbarth?

Also, if a Welsh-medium school such as Ysgol Pen y Barras has over 30 children in a class, surely it shows that more Welsh-medium education is needed in that area.

Hefyd, os oes mwy na 30 o blant mewn dosbarth mewn ysgol cyfrwng Cymraeg fel Ysgol Pen Barras, mae'n sicr bod hynny'n dangos bod angen mwy o addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg yn yr ardal honno.

4.50 p.m.

Ann Jones: Following on from Janet's contribution, I echo some of the sentiments expressed. I agree with regard to delegated schools budgets that schools should receive this money directly. I have held that view for a long time, because, as Janet and I know, the LEA that we are talking about has a tendency to find other ways of spending the money intended for schools, specifically that for schools in deprived areas and the larger primary schools on the coastal belt. I feel that that needs to be attended to in terms of the amount of spend per pupil. I ask you to look vigorously at how Denbighshire, in particular, spends this special grant money and how it will ensure that schools in the Communities First and deprived areas benefit most. Can you ensure that the large primary schools get the money that is intended for them? Let us make no bones about it, this special grant is required. It is about our commitment to having classes of fewer than 30 children, to giving extra support to low-performing schools and to giving headteachers the support that they need. All this is good work. The problem arises when this money disappears into an LEA's black hole, such as Denbighshire's, and I am concerned that the Assembly's good work could be marred by this LEA's inability to passport that money down.

Ann Jones: Gan ddilyn cyfraniad Janet, ategaf rai o'r teimladau a fynegwyd. Cytunaf, mewn cysylltiad â chyllidebau a ddirprwyir i ysgolion, y dylai ysgolion gael yr arian hwn yn uniongyrchol. Bûm yn arddel y farn honno ers amser maith, oherwydd, fel y gŵyr Janet a minnau, mae'r AALI sydd dan sylw gennym yn tueddu i ddod o hyd i dulliau eraill o wario'r arian a fwriadwyd ar gyfer ysgolion, yn enwedig hwnnw ar gyfer ysgolion mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig a'r ysgolion cynradd mwy ar yr arfordir. Teimlaf fod angen rhoi sylw i hynny o ran y swm a warir fesul disgybl. Gofynnaf ichi edrych yn fanwl ar y modd y mae sir Ddinbych, yn enwedig, yn gwario'r arian grant arbennig hwn a sut y gwnaiff sicrhau y bydd ysgolion mewn ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ac mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig yn cael y budd mwyaf ohono. A allwch sicrhau y bydd yr ysgolion cynradd mawr yn cael yr arian a fwriadwyd ar eu cyfer? Gadewch inni ddweud yn glir, mae angen y grant arbennig hwn. Mae'n ymwneud â'n hymrwymiad i gael dosbarthiadau o lai na 30 o blant, i gynorthwyo ysgolion isel eu perfformiad ac i roi i benaethiaid y cymorth y mae arnynt ei angen. Gwaith da yw hyn i gyd. Mae'r broblem yn codi pan yw'r arian hwn yn diflannu i grombil AALI, fel un sir Ddinbych, a phryderaf y gallai gwaith da'r Cynulliad gael ei ddifetha oherwydd anallu'r AALI hwn i drosglwyddo'r arian hwnnw.

David Davies: You will have to forgive me for saying that there is a little cynicism on this side of the Chamber. Whenever we hear an announcement about extra money for schools, I get a strange sense of *déjà vu*. First of all, we get the Minister announcing a few extra million pounds for schools, then we get some favourable press headlines describing how this money will save this or that school. Then, those of us who work on behalf of

David Davies: Rhaid ichi faddau imi am ddweud bod ychydig o sinigiaeth ar yr ochr hon i'r Siambr. Pryd bynnag y clywn gyhoeddiad am arian ychwanegol i ysgolion, caf deimlad rhyfedd o *déjà vu*. Yn gyntaf oll, gwelwn y Gweinidog yn cyhoeddi ychydig o filiynau o bunnoedd ychwanegol i ysgolion, wedyn cawn ychydig o benawdau ffafriol yn y wasg am y modd y bydd yr arian yn achub y naill ysgol neu'r llall. Yna, mae'r rhai

parents in our constituencies have them coming to us, asking where the money is. Finally, a little further down the road, we discover that, because the local education authorities have not been properly funded for all of the other obligations that the same Minister has told them to meet, none of that money is left. We saw that happen only a few years ago, when extra money was promised for rural schools. Most of the money was hived off to pay for the teachers' workload agreement, along with money from grants for education support and training. That is what will happen to this money.

We all know that schools have all sorts of obligations at the moment. They have obligations to improve their buildings, and for disability access, which are all good things that we agree with. They also have obligations to top up teachers' pensions funds and to continue to fund the teachers' workload agreement, which still has not been properly funded according to most of the teaching unions. I suspect that that is where we will see this money go.

Perhaps the Minister could put my mind at rest, as someone who is working with parents in my constituency to save one rural village school, that of Llanover, by telling me how much money she thinks will go into a school like that. She talks about £1 million. I appreciate that Wales is a diverse area, but divided by 22, that is about £45,000 for each local education authority area. In Monmouthshire alone there are about 40 primary schools. Not all of them are rural, but when you start dividing the £1 million up like that you end up with not much more than £1,000 for each school.

The Minister talks about extra money for low-performing schools, but what about extra money for high-performing schools? In the neighbouring local authority area to Monmouthshire, Torfaen, the LEA wants to shut down Ponthir village school, which is not just a good school, but is the best school in the area according to its standard assessment test results. The only thing wrong with this school is that it has the misfortune

ohonom sy'n gweithio ar ran rhieni yn ein hetholaethau'n eu gweld yn dod atom, gan ofyn ym mhle y mae'r arian. Yn olaf, ychydig yn ddiweddarach, darganfyddwn nad oes dim o'r arian hwnnw ar ôl gan nad yw'r awdurdodau addysg lleol wedi'u hariannu'n briodol fel y gallant gyflawni'r holl ymrwymadau eraill y mae'r un Gweinidog wedi dweud wrthynt am eu cyflawni. Gwelsom hynny'n digwydd ond ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl, pan addawyd arian ychwanegol ar gyfer ysgolion gwledig. Dosrannwyd y rhan fwyaf o'r arian hwnnw i dalu am y cytundeb ynghylch llwyth gwaith athrawon, ynghyd ag arian o grantiau cynnal addysg a hyfforddiant. Gwnaiff hynny ddigwydd yn achos yr arian hwn.

Gwyddom oll fod ysgolion o dan bob math o rwymedigaethau ar hyn o bryd. Maent yn gorfod gwella eu hadeiladau, a darparu mynediad i bobl anabl, sydd oll yn bethau da y cytunwn â hwy. Maent o dan rwymedigaeth hefyd i gyfrannu at gronfeydd pensiwn athrawon ac i barhau i ariannu'r cytundeb ynghylch llwyth gwaith athrawon, nad yw wedi'i ariannu'n iawn eto yn ôl y rhan fwyaf o undebau'r athrawon. Yr wyf yn amau mai at hynny yr aiff yr arian hwn.

Efallai y gallai'r Gweinidog dawelu fy meddwl, fel un sy'n gweithio gyda rhieni yn fy etholaeth i achub un ysgol bentref wledig, sef yr un yn Llanofar, drwy ddweud wrthyf pa faint o arian a aiff at ysgol fel honno, yn ei barn hi. Mae'n sôn am £1 filiwn. Sylweddolaf fod Cymru'n ardal amrywiol, ond o'i rannu â 22, mae hynny'n rhoi tua £45,000 ar gyfer pob ardal awdurdod addysg lleol. Yn sir Fynwy, ceir tua 40 o ysgolion cynradd. Nid yw pob un ohonynt yn ysgol wledig, ond pan ddechreuwch rannu'r £1 filiwn felly, ni fydd gennyh fawr mwy na £1,000 ar gyfer pob ysgol yn y diwedd.

Mae'r Gweinidog yn sôn am arian ychwanegol ar gyfer ysgolion isel eu perfformiad, ond beth am arian ychwanegol ar gyfer ysgolion uchel eu perfformiad? Yn ardal yr awdurdod lleol sydd nesaf at sir Fynwy, Tor-faen, mae'r AALL yn dymuno cau ysgol bentref Pont-hir, sy'n ysgol dda ond sydd hefyd yr ysgol orau yn yr ardal yn ôl ei chanlyniadau o'r profion asesu safonol. Yr unig beth sydd o'i le ar yr ysgol hon yw ei

to be sited on an area of ground that the council—which appears to have run out of money, despite being able to spend thousands of pounds, by the way, on things such as gender-mapping—presumably wants to sell off for housing. What are you going to do, Minister, to save not just the low-performing schools, but the high-performing schools in Wales, which offer such a good service to Welsh parents?

We will, of course, vote for this, because the Conservative Party would never vote against anything that delivered more money to schools. However we are cynical, because we have seen it all before. [*Laughter.*] They may laugh on that side of the Chamber. The reality is—

Ann Jones *rose*—

David Davies: I will give way, but let me tell you something: for all that you talked about cuts, I managed to get figures from the Assembly Library that show that in every year of Conservative Government the amount of money that went into schools and into Wales increased. I believe that the only year when there was ever a decrease over the last four decades was during the disgraceful era of the 1970s under a Labour Government which nearly brought us to the brink of bankruptcy in this country. Try to defend that.

Ann Jones: I was going to ask how you defend the fact that it is a Conservative councillor that has led the calls in Denbighshire. He is the lead member for education on Denbighshire council. That flies in the face of what you are doing.

David Davies: I have no problem in defending that at all, because, even though I do not represent that constituency, I know that it was the Labour Party's plan. I know that the council has to carry out a policy— [*Interruption.*] Labour Members ought to listen to this. Every local authority in Wales has been told to calculate surplus places based on a fixed formula—set by your Minister—which no headteacher thinks is particularly good, and to put forward proposals to close schools that do not fit in or

bod yn ddigon anffodus i fod yn sefyll ar dir y mae'r cyngor—yr ymddengys ei fod wedi mynd yn brin o arian, er ei fod yn gallu gwario miloedd o bunnoedd, gyda llaw, ar bethau fel mapio ar sail rhyw—yn dymuno ei werthu ar gyfer codi tai, gellir cymryd. Beth a wnewch, Weinidog, nid yn unig i achub ysgolion isel eu perfformiad, ond i achub ysgolion uchel eu perfformiad yng Nghymru, sy'n cynnig crystal gwasanaeth i rieni Cymru?

Byddwn yn pleidleisio o blaid hyn, wrth gwrs, gan na wnâi'r Blaid Geidwadol byth bleidleisio yn erbyn dim a roddai fwy o arian i ysgolion. Yr ydym yn sinigaidd, er hynny, gan ein bod wedi gweld hyn i gyd o'r blaen. [*Chwerthin.*] Gallent chwerthin ar yr ochr honno i'r Siambr. Y gwir yw—

Ann Jones *a gododd*—

David Davies: Gwnaf ildio, ond gadewch imi ddweud rhywbeth wrthyhch: er gwaethaf eich holl sôn am doriadau, llwyddais i gael ffigurau gan Lyfrgell y Cynulliad sy'n dangos bod y swm o arian a aeth at ysgolion ac i Gymru wedi codi bob blwyddyn pan fu'r Ceidwadwyr mewn grym. Credaf mai'r unig flwyddyn y cafwyd gostyngiad byth dros y pedwar degawd diwethaf oedd yn ystod y cyfnod cywilyddus yn y 1970au o dan Lywodraeth Lafur y bu bron i'r wlad hon fethdalau o'i herwydd. Ceisiwch amddiffyn hynny.

Ann Jones: Yr oeddwn am ofyn i chi sut yr ydych yn cyfiawnhau'r ffaith mai cynghorydd Ceidwadol a arweiniodd y galwadau yn sir Ddinbych. Ef yw'r aelod arweiniol dros addysg ar Gyngor Sir Ddinbych. Mae hynny'n mynd yn groes i'r hyn a ddywedwch.

David Davies: Nid wyf yn ei chael yn anodd cyfiawnhau hynny o gwbl, oherwydd, er nad wyf yn cynrychioli'r etholaeth honno, gwn mai cynllun o eiddo'r Blaid Lafur ydoedd. Gwn fod y cyngor yn gorfod cyflawni polisi— [*Torri ar draws.*] Dylai Aelodau Llafur wrando ar hyn. Dywedwyd wrth bob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru am gyfrifo nifer y lleoedd sydd dros ben yn ôl fformiwla benodol—a osodwyd gan eich Gweinidog—nad yw'r un pennaeth ysgol yn ei hystyried yn un arbennig o dda, ac am gyflwyno

that appear to have surplus spaces. If you in Labour do not want to see your small village schools close, all you have to do is to ask the Minister to withdraw the guidance. We do not believe that this money will help small schools, but we will vote for it in the hope that it might do something. However, it remains the reality that small schools are being shut across Wales, and you and your Government are the people responsible.

Peter Black: I welcome the special grant report before us. It is the latest in a series of special grant reports that were started under the partnership Government to reduce class sizes in key stage 2 and to provide additional support for key stage 3. I am pleased that the Minister continues to bring forward grants. However, I raise several connected issues. I noticed that, when we debated the special grant report in March 2003, the total grant available was £32 million, but when we debated it in March 2004, there was £31.5 million. We are now distributing a total of £23 million, which, even according to my rudimentary mathematics, is a cut in the money available for this scheme. The Minister should explain why that money has been cut. I am sure that there is a rational explanation, but, we deserve to hear why less money is available this year than in previous years.

I am also interested to know how this scheme will fit in, in future years, with the Minister's undertaking to the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee to bring in three-year funding for schools. It is important that, if we are to have a three-year funding regime that will be accountable, we look at how these grants will fit into that regime.

Another issue is with regard to capital expenditure. We can spend money to a certain extent in schools to reduce class sizes, but, ultimately, the time will come when a school can only reduce class sizes by carrying out adaptations to the school to make provision for additional classes to be

cynigion i gau ysgolion nad ydynt yn ffitio neu yr ymddengys fod ynddynt leoedd dros ben. Os nad ydych chi yn Llafur am weld eich ysgolion pentref bach yn cau, y cwbl y mae'n rhaid ichi ei wneud yw gofyn i'r Gweinidog dynnu'r canllawiau'n ôl. Ni chredwn y bydd yr arian hwn yn helpu ysgolion bach, ond pleidleisiwn o'i blaid gan obeithio y gwnaiff gyflawni rhywbeth. Er hynny, y gwir yw bod ysgolion bach yn cael eu cau ledled Cymru o hyd, ac mai chi a'ch Llywodraeth sy'n gyfrifol.

Peter Black: Croesawaf yr adroddiad grant arbennig sydd ger ein bron. Hwn yw'r diweddaraf mewn cyfres o adroddiadau grant arbennig a ddechreuwyd o dan y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth i leihau maint dosbarthiadau yng nghyfnod allweddol 2 ac i gynnig cymorth ychwanegol ar gyfer cyfnod allweddol 3. Yr wyf yn falch bod y Gweinidog yn dal i gyflwyno grantiau. Fodd bynnag, codaf nifer o faterion cysylltiedig. Sylwais, pan gawsom ddadl ar yr adroddiad grant arbennig ym Mawrth 2003, mai cyfanswm y grant a oedd ar gael oedd £32 miliwn, ond pan gawsom ddadl arno ym Mawrth 2004, mai £31.5 miliwn a oedd ar gael. Yn awr yr ydym yn dosbarthu cyfanswm o £23 miliwn, sydd, hyd yn oed ar sail fy symiau elfennol i, yn doriad ar yr arian sydd ar gael i'r cynllun hwn. Dylai'r Gweinidog egluro pam y torrwyd yr arian hwnnw. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod eglurhad rhesymegol, ond dylem gael gwybod pam y mae llai o arian ar gael eleni nag mewn blynyddoedd blaenorol.

Mae hefyd o ddiddordeb imi gael gwybod sut y bydd y cynllun hwn yn cyd-fynd, ym mlynnyddoedd y dyfodol, ag ymrwymiad y Gweinidog i'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i gyflwyno cyllido dros dair blynedd ar gyfer ysgolion. Mae'n bwysig, os ydym i gael cyfundrefn gyllido tair blynedd a fydd yn atebol, inni ystyried sut y bydd y grantiau hyn yn cyd-fynd â'r gyfundrefn honno.

Mae mater arall yn codi mewn cysylltiad â gwariant cyfalaf. Gallwn wario arian mewn ysgolion i leihau maint dosbarthiadau i ryw raddau, ond, yn y pen draw, daw adeg pan na fydd yr ysgol ond yn gallu lleihau dosbarthiadau drwy addasu adeiladau'r ysgol fel y gellir darparu ar gyfer dosbarthiadau

installed. That time has come for several schools, and I would be interested, Minister, in how you will address that.

Finally, with regard to the grant for small and rural schools, I welcome that fact that £1 million has been provided to support teaching headteachers. However, I point out that previous grants under this heading were £3 million a year at least, and that money was available for several other measures, too. It strikes us on this side of the Chamber that the amount of money being made available to support small and rural schools has been reduced significantly, and they are, effectively, being left to fend for themselves in what is a difficult financial climate for local government. If we are to maintain our commitment to small and rural schools, a reduction in the funding to a third of what was previously available is not the way forward. Many small and rural schools will find it difficult to continue in that climate. I hope that you reconsider this, Minister. It is all very well to say that the money has been dissipated among several particular headings, but we all know that that money will not find its way to small and rural schools, but will be spent by local education authorities in various ways. The outcome of this will be that small and rural schools will find themselves with less money for federation and other measures to support teaching on several sites, for IT and so on. That is regrettable, and it could well lead to further closures. I hope, therefore, Minister, that you can address that and give an assurance that the extra £2 million that is no longer directly available to small and rural schools will be made available to them in other ways, and that that can be monitored and accounted for, so that we can clearly see that the money is being spent on those schools.

5.00 p.m.

Mark Isherwood: As if Brown's black hole was not enough, Wales is now also saddled with Davidson's disappearing dosh. If this special education grant is intended to help local authorities and schools drive up standards, as stated, why does it appear to

ychwanegol. Daeth yr adeg honno yn achos llawer o ysgolion, a byddai o ddiddordeb imi gael gwybod, Weinidog, sut y byddwch yn ymdrin â hynny.

Yn olaf, gyda golwg ar y grant ar gyfer ysgolion bach a gwledig, croesawaf y ffaith bod £1 filiwn wedi'i darparu i gynorthwyo penaethiaid sy'n dysgu. Er hynny, tynnaf sylw at y ffaith bod grantiau o £3 miliwn y flwyddyn o leiaf o dan y pennawd hwn cynt, a bod arian ar gael ar gyfer sawl mesur arall hefyd. Yr argraff a gawn ni ar yr ochr hon i'r Siambr yw bod y swm o arian a ddarperir i gynorthwyo ysgolion bach a gwledig wedi'i leihau'n sylweddol, a'u bod, i bob pwrpas, yn cael eu gadael i ofalu amdanynt eu hunain mewn hinsawdd ariannol sy'n anodd i lywodraeth leol. Os ydym i barhau â'n hymrwymiad i ysgolion bach a gwledig, ni wneir hynny drwy leihau'r cyllid sydd ar gael o un rhan o dair o'r hyn ydoedd o'r blaen. Bydd llawer o ysgolion bach a gwledig yn ei chael yn anodd parhau mewn hinsawdd o'r fath. Gobeithiaf y gwnewch ailystyried hyn, Weinidog. Digon hawdd yw dweud bod yr arian wedi'i wasgaru rhwng sawl pennawd penodol, ond gwyddom oll na fydd yr arian hwnnw'n cyrraedd ysgolion bach a gwledig, ac y caiff ei wario gan awduroddau addysg lleol mewn sawl modd. O ganlyniad i hyn, bydd ysgolion bach a gwledig yn cael bod ganddynt lai o arian ar gyfer ffurfio ffederasiynau a mesurau eraill i gynnal dysgu ar sawl safle, ar gyfer TG ac yn y blaen. Mae hynny'n destun gofid, ac mae'n ddigon posibl y bydd yn arwain at gau rhagor o ysgolion. Gobeithiaf, felly, Weinidog, y gallwch ymdrin â hynny a chynnig sicrwydd y bydd y £2 filiwn ychwanegol nad yw ar gael bellach yn uniongyrchol i ysgolion bach a gwledig yn cael ei darparu iddynt drwy ddulliau eraill, ac y gellir ei harolygu a rhoi cyfrif amdani, fel y gallwn weld yn glir fod yr arian yn cael ei wario ar yr ysgolion hynny.

Mark Isherwood: Os nad oedd Brown a'i byded yn ddigon, mae Cymru bellach yn gorfod dygymod â Davidson gyda'i harian sy'n diflannu. Os mai bwriad y grant addysg arbennig hwn yw helpu awduroddau lleol ac ysgolion i godi safonau, fel y dywedwyd,

have been cut, as my Liberal Democrat colleague previously mentioned?

Last year's special grant report approved £3.5 million in funding to support both innovation in small and rural schools and headteachers with significant classroom teaching commitments. This year's support for teaching headteachers is just £1 million. Last year, the special grant included £28.5 million to provide support at key stages 2 and 3, but this report only refers to £19 million of key stage 2 funding. Last year, the special education grant included £3 million in funding for low-performance schemes, but it remains unchanged this year, which is a cut in real terms. In other words, the comparable grant last year was £12 million higher. However, the components were slightly different so it is impossible to tell whether the funding this year is up, down or sideways. What is going on?

Why is the Welsh Assembly Government missing its targets on GCSE results and truancy? Why do so many learners lack the qualifications needed for employment? Why is bullying rampant in too many schools? Why do the best-funded schools in England receive £300 more per pupil than the worst-funded schools in England? Why do the best-funded primary schools in Wales receive £941 more per pupil than the worst-funded primary schools in Wales?

Why did a group of primary school teachers and headteachers in north-west Wales recently tell me that they were not being included in any real consultation? If they had been included, they would tell this Minister that falling school rolls should be used to keep teachers rather than fund free school breakfasts. Those were their words, not mine. *[Interruption.]*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. There is far too much gossiping going on in the Chamber.

pam y mae wedi'i dorri, i bob golwg, fel y dywedodd fy nghyd-Aelod o Ddemocrat Rhyddfrydol o'r blaen?

Yn yr adroddiad grant arbennig y llynedd cymeradwywyd £3.5 miliwn o gyllid i hybu arloesi mewn ysgolion bach a gwledig ac i helpu penaethiaid sydd ag ymrwymadau helaeth i ddysgu yn yr ystafell ddosbarth. Dim ond swm o £1 filiwn o gymorth a roddir i benaethiaid sy'n dysgu eleni. Y llynedd, yr oedd y grant arbennig yn cynnwys £28.5 miliwn i gynnig cymorth yng nghyfnodau allweddol 2 a 3, ond nid yw'r adroddiad hwn ond yn cyfeirio at gyllid o £19 miliwn ar gyfer cyfnod allweddol 2. Y llynedd, yr oedd y grant addysg arbennig yn cynnwys £3 miliwn o gyllid ar gyfer cynlluniau perfformiad isel, ond mae'n aros yr un fath eleni, fel mai toriad ydyw yn ôl ei wir werth. Mewn geiriau eraill, yr oedd y grant cyfatebol y llynedd £12 miliwn yn fwy. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd yr elfennau ychydig yn wahanol, felly ni ellir canfod a yw'r cyllid ar gyfer eleni yn fwy, yn llai neu yr un fath. Beth sy'n mynd ymlaen?

Pam y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn methu ei thargedau ar ganlyniadau TGAU a thriwantiaeth? Pam y ceir cynifer o ddysgwyr sydd heb y cymwysterau angenrheidiol i gael gwaith? Pam y mae bwlio'n rhemp mewn gormod o ysgolion? Pam y mae'r ysgolion a ariennir orau yn Lloegr yn cael £300 yn fwy fesul disgybl na'r ysgolion a ariennir waethaf yn Lloegr? Pam y mae'r ysgolion cynradd a ariennir orau yng Nghymru yn cael £941 yn fwy fesul disgybl na'r ysgolion cynradd a ariennir waethaf yng Nghymru?

Pam y gwnaeth grŵp o athrawon a phenaethiaid ysgol gynradd yn y Gogledd-orllewin ddweud wrthyf yn ddiweddar nad oeddent yn cael eu cynnwys mewn unrhyw ymgynghori dilys? Pe byddent wedi'u cynnwys, dywedent wrth y Gweinidog hwn y dylid defnyddio'r gostyngiad yn nifer y disgyblion i gadw athrawon yn hytrach nag ariannu brecwastau am ddim yn yr ysgol. Hwy a ddywedodd hynny, nid myfi. *[Torri ar draws.]*

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae gormod o lawer o fân siarad yn y Siambr.

Mark Isherwood: Why has Wrexham's chief education officer described changes to sixth-form funding as catastrophic, with no funding for increased school numbers? Why have sixth-form headteachers across north Wales told me that budget cuts will push up lower school class sizes and reduce sixth-form options? Those were their words, not mine.

Mark Isherwood: Pam y mae prif swyddog addysg Wrecsam wedi dweud mai trychinebus yw'r newidiadau i'r dull o ariannu cyfleusterau chweched dosbarth, gan nad oes arian ar gyfer y cynnydd yn nifer y disgyblion? Pam y mae penaethiaid cyfleusterau chweched dosbarth ledled y Gogledd wedi dweud wrthyf y bydd toriadau yn y gyllideb yn peri cynnydd ym maint y dosbarthiadau yn yr ysgolion is ac yn peri bod llai o ddewis ar gael mewn cyfleusterau chweched dosbarth? Hwya a ddywedodd hynny, nid myfi.

Why has Denbighshire's lead member for lifelong learning told me that cuts in its delegated schools' budgets have been forced on it by Welsh Assembly Government policy, and why has Denbighshire's independent leader—not Conservative, but ex-Labour, and a principled person—stated that the county's consultation on school closures, now thankfully stalled, was in response to the Welsh Assembly Government's initiative to 'refocus schools'? The bottom line is that Mr Blair promised us education, education, education, but Rhodri Morgan saddled us with Davidson, dogma and distortion.

Pam y dywedodd yr aelod arweiniol dros ddysgu gydol oes yn sir Ddinbych wrthyf ei bod wedi gorfod torri cyllidebau dirprwyedig i ysgolion oherwydd polisi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, a pham y dywedodd arweinydd annibynnol sir Ddinbych—nid Ceidwadwr ydyw, ond cyn-aelod Llafur, ac un egwyddorol—fod ymgynghoriad y sir ar gau ysgolion, sydd wedi'i atal bellach, diolch byth, yn ymateb i fenter Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i 'ailffocysu ysgolion'? Y gwir yw bod Mr Blair wedi addo addysg, addysg, addysg i ni, ond bod Rhodri Morgan wedi gorfodi Davidson, dogma a chamliwio arnom.

This meddling Minister's mission to do everything differently in Welsh education is denying our schools and colleges the freedom and resources to deliver for all the young people of Wales. Under this Welsh Assembly Government, the skills and prosperity gap between Wales and the rest of the UK is widening and we now have poorer basic literacy and numeracy than any other nation or region in Britain. We must now replace political correctness with pupil knowledge, and bureaucracy with basic skills. We must teach this Welsh Assembly Government a lesson.

Mae bwriad y Gweinidog busneslyd hwn i wneud popeth yn wahanol mewn addysg yng Nghymru yn gwadu i'n hysgolion a'n colegau y rhyddid a'r adnoddau y mae arnynt eu hangen i fynd â'r maen i'r wal er mwyn holl bobl ifanc Cymru. O dan y Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru hon, mae'r bwlch o ran sgiliau a ffyniant rhwng Cymru a gweddill y DU yn mynd yn fwy, a bellach mae gennym lythrennedd a rhifedd sylfaenol sy'n waeth nag unrhyw genedl neu ranbarth ym Mhrydain. Rhaid inni roi dysg disgyblion yn lle cywirdeb gwleidyddol yn awr, a sgiliau sylfaenol yn lle biwrocratiaeth. Rhaid inni ddysgu gwers i'r Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru hon.

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I will respond to some of the points made by Members in the debate. Janet rightly asked whether or not we check how each local authority spends this funding. We have to check that, in terms of ensuring that we have a proper audit trail on

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Ymatebaf i rai o'r pwyntiau a wnaeth Aelodau yn y ddadl. Yr oedd yn briodol i Janet ofyn a ydym yn gwirio sut y mae pob awdurdod lleol yn gwario'r arian hwn. Rhaid inni wneud hynny, er mwyn sicrhau bod gennym drywydd

these issues. I said in my opening speech that we were particularly interested in looking at whether the funding that we put into low-performing schools—which was welcomed by the previous Education and Lifelong Learning Committee—was working as effectively as we want it to work. This came through under the ‘Narrowing the Gap’ agenda.

In terms of the money allocated for keeping class-numbers down at key stage 2—and we broadly met our targets on this in the September 2004 class count—if you had read to the end of the report from which you quoted, you would find that exemptions can only be for one year in any exempt categories from A to E. Certainly, in terms of Welsh-medium education, authorities are required to keep under review the need for Welsh-medium places. We expect local authorities to actively work with their local communities on planning.

The important factor is that we agreed on a clawback approach to tighten up the grant conditions to ensure that class sizes were kept down. That was effective. However, I am sure that Janet would want to maintain her commitment and dialogue with Denbighshire County Council, to which Ann referred, and notify it that any authority in breach of conditions will be subject to clawback if it does not deliver. Clearly, Denbighshire needs to hear that message.

David, you talked about *déjà vu* on this issue. You are right, because I make this announcement every year—it is an annual special grant report. In terms of the small and rural schools agenda it is important to say that we have allocated £9 million over the last three years. The funding for such schools has increased to £3.5 million this year. However, as I said in my opening contribution, where that sits in the budget has changed to reflect different priorities. Therefore, there is £1 million in this budget that reflects issues around teaching headteachers in small and rural schools. A total of £1 million is being added to the community-focused schools pilot project grant, which will lift it from £2 million to £3

archwilio priodol ar y materion hyn. Dywedais yn fy araith agoriadol ein bod yn ymddiddori’n benodol mewn gweld a oedd yr arian a roddwn tuag at ysgolion isel eu perfformiad—a groesawyd gan y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes blaenorol—yn gweithio mor effeithiol ag y dymunem. Gwelwyd hyn o dan agenda ‘Cau’r Bwlch’.

Gyda golwg ar yr arian a ddyrennir i gadw maint dosbarthiadau’n isel yng nghyfnod allweddol 2—a gwnaethom gyrraedd ein targedau ar hyn yn fras yn y cyfrif dosbarthiadau ym Medi 2004—pe byddech wedi darllen hyd ddiwedd yr adroddiad y dyfynasoch ohono, gwelech na ellir ond eithrio am un flwyddyn mewn unrhyw gategori eithriedig o A i E. Yn sicr, o ran addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg, mae’n ofynnol i awdurdodau barhau i adolygu yr angen am leoedd cyfrwng Cymraeg. Disgwylwn i awdurdodau lleol fynd ati i weithio gyda’u cymunedau lleol ar gynllunio.

Y ffactor pwysig yw ein bod wedi cytuno ar ddull adfachu er mwyn tynhau amodau’r grant i sicrhau y cedwir maint dosbarthiadau’n isel. Bu hynny’n effeithiol. Er hynny, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Janet am barhau â’i hymrwymiad a’i deialog â Chyngor Sir Ddinbych, y cyfeiriodd Ann ato, a’i hysbysu y bydd arian yn cael ei adfachu oddi wrth unrhyw gyngor sy’n torri’r amodau, os nad yw’n mynd â’r maen i’r wal. Mae’n amlwg y dylai sir Ddinbych wrando ar y neges honno.

David, gwnaethoch sôn am *déjà vu* mewn cysylltiad â’r mater hwn. Yr ydych yn iawn, oherwydd gwnaf y cyhoeddiad hwn bob blwyddyn—adroddiad grant arbennig blynyddol ydyw. Gyda golwg ar yr agenda ar ysgolion bach a gwledig, mae’n bwysig dweud ein bod wedi dyrannu £9 miliwn dros y tair blynedd diwethaf. Mae’r cyllid ar gyfer ysgolion o’r fath wedi codi i £3.5 miliwn eleni. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais yn fy nghyfraniad agoriadol, mae mewn lle gwahanol yn y gyllideb er mwyn adlewyrchu blaenoriaethau gwahanol. Felly, ceir £1 filiwn yn y gyllideb hon sy’n adlewyrchu materion sy’n ymwneud â phenaethiaid sy’n dysgu mewn ysgolion bach a gwledig. Ychwanegir cyfanswm o £1 filiwn at grant y

million. Part of that budget will be specifically focused on small and rural schools and their community support. A total of £1.5 million has been moved into the better schools fund for innovation. Therefore, after considering the small and rural schools grant and the fact that it covered a wide range of issues, we have now ensured that the £3.5 million is sitting in more appropriate budgets to reflect the areas that were categorised.

As Estyn's report demonstrates, we have an increasing number of high-performing schools, which we will continue to support. It is worth noting that Monmouthshire council had the highest percentage increase in its revenue support grant—over 7 per cent this year. You may also wish to have personal dialogue with that authority, David, to ensure that it keeps its class sizes down. It is not doing that adequately at the moment.

David Davies: Is it the case, Minister, that in your generosity towards Monmouthshire you are awarding it around £40,000 for rural schools?

Jane Davidson: There is a formula allocation for small and rural schools in this budget. There is also the additional money that I have just outlined for those schools that will be in the community-focused schools budget and the better schools fund.

Lynne Neagle: You will be aware of my concerns that Torfaen County Borough Council last year spent below its standard spending assessment for education on education, and that I am deeply concerned that the proposed budget for this year involves it spending around £2 million less on education than the Assembly has allocated for that sector in Torfaen. Do you share my concern about the impact that this will have on provision in my constituency, and what steps will you take to ensure that that provision is not disadvantaged?

Jane Davidson: We have made the process much more transparent by ensuring that the amount of money broadly allocated by the

prosiect ar ysgolion bro, i'w godi o £2 filiwn i £3 miliwn. Bydd rhan o'r gyllideb honno yn ymwneud yn benodol ag ysgolion bach a gwledig a'u cefnogaeth gymunedol. Symudwyd cyfanswm o £1.5 miliwn i'r gronfa ysgolion gwell ar gyfer arloesi. Felly, ar ôl ystyried y grant i ysgolion bach a gwledig a'r ffaith ei fod yn cynnwys amrywiaeth mawr o faterion, yr ydym wedi sicrhau bellach fod £3.5 miliwn wedi ei gynnwys mewn cyllidebau mwy priodol i adlewyrchu'r meysydd a ddyndwyd.

Fel y dengys adroddiad Estyn, mae gennym nifer cynyddol o ysgolion uchel eu perfformiad, y parhawn i'w cefnogi. Mae'n werth nodi mai Cyngor Sir Fynwy a gafodd y cynnydd canrannol mwyaf yn ei grant cynnal refeniw—mwy na 7 y cant. Efallai y byddwch chithau am siarad â'r awdurdod hwnnw, David, i sicrhau y bydd yn cadw maint ei ddsbarthiadau'n isel. Nid yw'n gwneud hynny'n iawn ar hyn o bryd.

David Davies: A yw'n wir, Weinidog, oherwydd eich haelioni at sir Fynwy, eich bod yn rhoi tua £40,000 iddi ar gyfer ysgolion gwledig?

Jane Davidson: Ceir dyraniad yn ôl fformiwla ar gyfer ysgolion bach a gwledig yn y gyllideb hon. Yn ogystal â hynny, ceir yr arian ychwanegol yr wyf newydd ei ddisgrifio ar gyfer yr ysgolion hynny a fydd yn y gyllideb i ysgolion bro a'r gronfa ysgolion gwell.

Lynne Neagle: Gwyddoch fy mod yn pryderu gan fod y swm a wariodd Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Tor-faen ar addysg y llynedd yn llai na'i asesiad o wariant safonol ar gyfer addysg, ac fy mod yn dra phryderus y bydd ei gyllideb arfaethedig ar gyfer eleni yn peri iddo wario tua £2 filiwn yn llai ar addysg nag y mae'r Cynulliad wedi'i ddyrannu ar gyfer y sector hwnnw yn Nhorfaen. A ydych yn rhannu fy mhryder ynghylch yr effaith a gaiff hynny ar y ddarpariaeth yn fy etholaeth, a pha gamau a gymerwch i sicrhau na fydd y ddarpariaeth honno o dan anfantais?

Jane Davidson: Yr ydym wedi peri i'r broses fod yn llawer mwy tryloyw drwy sicrhau bod y swm bras a ddyrannwyd gan y

Assembly for education was published before local authorities set their budgets. As a result, local authorities will be able to see that when they set their budgets. They will be answerable to their local communities in terms of any budget variation from the standard spending assessment that we have outlined. However, because of the statutory obligation to deliver on workforce remodelling in our schools, and the fact that we have allocated substantial additional funds to make that happen, local authorities must be absolutely confident that they are able to deliver that outcome with the education budgets that they set.

5.10 p.m.

Peter Black, I hope that I have answered some of your points on small and rural schools. You quite rightly identified that the £9.5 million for improvement at key stage 3 has been taken out of this special grant and moved into the better schools fund. That money remains there; it has just moved to another budget. We maintain the commitment that I made to you previously to consider ways of using the new legislation currently going through Parliament to set three-year budgets. I will work with my colleague, Sue Essex, and the Welsh Local Government Association on that. There will be other ways in which small and rural schools can access money, but we want to ensure that it is most appropriate to the area outlined in the report.

Eleanor Burnham: If you are so very generous, why are all local authorities and schools complaining bitterly that they do not have enough money? Is this not the right time to reduce class sizes to give people the best education?

Jane Davidson: I am glad that you understand what we are debating today—the reduction of class sizes.

Mark, I will respond to you in the same way as Sue Essex responded. You may put forward any dogmatic argument that you choose, but you must get the facts behind you. Estyn clearly states that education has improved during the last five years, and

Cynulliad ar gyfer addysg wedi'i gyhoeddi cyn i'r awdurdodau lleol bennu eu cyllidebau. O ganlyniad i hynny, bydd awdurdodau lleol yn gallu gweld hynny wrth bennu eu cyllidebau. Byddant yn atebol i'w cymunedau lleol am unrhyw wahaniaeth rhwng y gyllideb a'r asesiad o wariant safonol yr ydym wedi'i nodi. Er hynny, oherwydd y rhwymedigaeth statudol i newid patrwm y gweithlu yn ein hysgolion, a'r ffaith ein bod wedi dyrannu symiau ychwanegol sylweddol i sicrhau hynny, rhaid i awdurdodau lleol fod yn gwbl sicr y gallant sicrhau'r canlyniad hwnnw gyda'r cyllidebau addysg y maent wedi'u pennu.

Peter Black, gobeithiaf fy mod wedi ateb rhai o'r pwyntiau a wnaethoch ar ysgolion bach a gwledig. Yr oeddech yn gywir wrth ddweud bod y swm o £9.5 miliwn ar gyfer gwelliant yng nghyfnod allweddol 3 wedi ei dynnu o'r grant arbennig hwn a'i symud i'r gronfa ysgolion gwell. Mae'r arian hwnnw yn parhau i fod ar gael, ond ei fod wedi'i symud i gyllideb arall. Parhawn â'r ymrwymiad a roddais i chi o'r blaen i ystyried dulliau o ddefnyddio'r ddeddfwriaeth newydd sy'n mynd drwy'r Senedd ar hyn o bryd i osod cyllidebau tair blynedd. Gweithiaf gyda'm cyd-Weinidog, Sue Essex, a Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ar hynny. Bydd ysgolion bach a gwledig yn gallu cael arian drwy ddulliau eraill, ond yr ydym am sicrhau mai hwy fydd y rhai mwyaf addas i'r maes a ddisgrifir yn yr adroddiad.

Eleanor Burnham: Os ydych mor hael, pam y mae'r holl awdurdodau addysg ac ysgolion yn cwyno'n arw nad oes ganddynt ddigon o arian? Onid hon yw'r adeg briodol i leihau maint dosbarthiadau er mwyn cynnig yr addysg orau?

Jane Davidson: Yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn deall yr hyn yr ydym yn ei drafod heddiw—lleihau maint dosbarthiadau.

Mark, ymatebaf i chi yn yr un modd ag a wnaeth Sue Essex. Cewch gyflwyno pa bynnag ddadl ddogmatig ag y dewiswch, ond rhaid ichi gael y ffeithiau i'w hategu. Dywed Estyn yn glir fod addysg wedi gwella yn ystod y pum mlynedd diwethaf, a'i bod wedi

improved more in the last year than in all other years put together. gwella'n fwy yn y flwyddyn ddiwethaf nag a wnaeth yn yr holl flynyddoedd eraill gyda'i gilydd.

*Cynnig (NDM2323): O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2323): For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion carried.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â today's proceedings to a close. chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.13 p.m.
The meeting ended at 5.13 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)
Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)
Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)
Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Law, Peter (Llafur – Labour)
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
Marek, John (Annibynnol – Independent)
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)

Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)