



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mercher, 2 Mawrth 2005**

**Wednesday, 2 March 2005**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

Cwestiynau ar Gyllid i'r Gweinidog Cyllid Questions on Finance to the Finance Minister .....	3
Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad Questions to the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside.....	18
Y Swyddfa Gyfathrebu The Office of Communications .....	33
Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order .....	65
Adroddiad Blynyddol y Pwyllgor Safonau a Diwygio Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 16 The Annual Report of the Standards Committee and Amendments to Standing Order No. 16.....	66
Dadl Fer: Y Ddarpariaeth Gofal Plant yng Nghymru Short Debate: Childcare Provision in Wales .....	75

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Dirprwy Lywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Deputy Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## **Cwestiynau ar Gyllid i'r Gweinidog Cyllid Questions on Finance to the Finance Minister**

### **Gwasanaethau Rheilffyrdd i Deithwyr Passenger Rail Services**

**C1 Owen John Thomas:** A oes rhywrai wedi cysylltu â'r Gweinidog Cyllid ynghylch sicrhau arian ychwanegol ar gyfer gwasanaethau rheilffyrdd i deithwyr yng Nghymru? OAQ0067(FIN)

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** No. Subject to the Railways Bill being enacted, we will agree with the Secretary of State for Transport a transfer of funding that will cover the full range of responsibilities that we will take on for the railways. Discussions are already taking place between officials to that effect.

**Owen John Thomas:** Eight out of nine plans for improving rail services on the Cardiff, Valleys and Vale lines are either way behind schedule or at a standstill. Likewise, we still await the establishment of a reasonable service providing twenty-first century links between the north and south of our country. Do you not consider that transport warrants much greater funding than it currently receives, or are you waiting for Peter Hain to tell you what to do? [*Interruption.*]

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Janet, you must sit down; you cannot stand in the Chamber. You can stand outside in the corridor if you wish. I do not mind that at all.

**Sue Essex:** As you know, Owen John, transport used to be my portfolio, so I have been interested in it since that time; I am still interested in it. There has been an enormous increase in spending on transport, particularly, I am pleased to say, on public transport. A large amount of that funding goes into railways: something like £25 million to £30 million a year is going into

**Q1 Owen John Thomas:** Has the Finance Minister been approached to secure additional funding for passenger rail services in Wales? OAQ0067(FIN)

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Nac oes. Ar yr amod y caiff y Mesur Rheilffyrdd ei ddeddfu, byddwn yn cytuno â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Drafnidiaeth ar drosglwyddo cyllid a fydd yn cwmpasu'r ystod lawn o gyfrifoldebau y bydd yn rhaid inni eu hysgwyddo ar gyfer y rheilffyrdd. Mae trafodaethau eisoes yn cael eu cynnal rhwng swyddogion i'r perwyl hwnnw.

**Owen John Thomas:** Mae wyth allan o naw cynllun ar gyfer gwella gwasanaethau rheilffyrdd ar reilffyrdd Caerdydd, y Cymoedd a'r Fro ymhell ar ei hôl hi neu yn aros yn eu hunfan. Yn yr un modd, yr ydym yn dal i aros i wasanaeth rhesymol gael ei sefydlu i ddarparu cysylltiadau addas i'r unfed ganrif ar hugain rhwng y Gogledd a'r De. Oni chredwch fod trafnidiaeth yn haeddu cael ei hariannu'n llawer gwell nag a wneir ar hyn o bryd, ynteu a ydych yn aros i Peter Hain ddweud wrthy ch beth i'w wneud? [*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Janet, rhaid ichi eistedd; ni allwch sefyll yn y Siambr. Gallwch sefyll y tu allan yn y coridor os dymunwch. Nid oes ots gennyf am hynny o gwbl.

**Sue Essex:** Fel y gwyddoch, Owen John, yr oedd trafnidiaeth yn arfer cael ei chynnwys yn fy mhortffolio, felly bu gennyf ddiddordeb yn y maes ers yr adeg honno; ac mae gennyf ddiddordeb ynddo o hyd. Bu cynnydd enfawr yn y gwariant ar drafnidiaeth, yn arbennig, yr wyf yn falch o ddweud, ar drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus. Mae cyfran fawr o'r arian hwnnw'n cael ei gwario ar reilffyrdd: caiff

capital infrastructure. The Vale of Glamorgan line is soon to be reopened, and I am pleased about that. Other sums of money, which Andrew Davies recently announced, are also available to ensure that we lease rolling stock to improve the frequency and capacity of services on the Valleys network.

**Alun Cairns:** During the scrutiny session on the Transport (Wales) Bill, which has been succeeded, the costing of the joint transport authority proposed by the Welsh Assembly and Westminster Governments was almost laughed at by the experts giving evidence. What further investigations have you carried out into the costing of the joint transport authority proposed?

**Sue Essex:** As you say, the Transport (Wales) Bill is not currently going forward. I was not party to any discussions on the joint transport authority, but I guess that that work would have been done by Andrew Davies's division. It has been an aim for a long time for us to have those powers; it was certainly an aim when I was responsible for transport. I am confident that our transport officials made a sensible cost estimate. Several years ago we looked at the cost of that development, but I was not party to those discussions. If you write to me, I will answer your query.

**Eleanor Burnham:** We know that there has been increased investment, but north-south rail links are still a thorny issue. I could bore everyone to death on this issue. Recently, I suffered an hour and a half's forced wait in Shrewsbury in the freezing cold, and at the last minute had to change platform. For disabled and elderly people, this is not on. In Scotland—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Please ask a question, Eleanor.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Are you hoping that Wales will have better control, and possibly even more funding, in order to secure the much more effective public transport that we

rhwng £25 miliwn a £30 miliwn y flwyddyn ei wario ar seilwaith cyfalaf. Bydd rheilffordd Bro Morgannwg yn cael ei hailagor yn fuan, ac yr wyf yn falch ynglŷn â hynny. Mae symiau eraill o arian, y bu i Andrew Davies eu cyhoeddi yn ddiweddar, hefyd ar gael i sicrhau ein bod yn prydlesu cerbydau er mwyn gwella amllder a chapasiti gwasanaethau ar rwydwaith y Cymoedd.

**Alun Cairns:** Yn ystod y sesiwn graffu ar Fesur Trafnidiaeth (Cymru), a olynwyd, bu bron i'r arbenigwyr oedd yn rhoi tystiolaeth chwerthin pan glywsant beth oedd yr asesiad o gost y cyd-awdurdod trafndiaeth a gynigwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a Llywodraeth San Steffan. Pa ymchwiliadau pellach yr ydych wedi'u cynnal i gost y cyd-awdurdod trafndiaeth a gynigir?

**Sue Essex:** Fel y dywedwch, nid yw Mesur Trafnidiaeth (Cymru) yn mynd rhagddo ar hyn o bryd. Nid oeddwn yn rhan o unrhyw drafodaethau ar y cyd-awdurdod trafndiaeth, ond dyfalaf mai is-adran Andrew Davies fyddai wedi ymgymryd â'r gwaith hwnnw. Mae wedi bod yn nod gennym ers amser maith i gael y pwerau hynny; yr oedd yn sicr yn nod pan oeddwn yn gyfrifol am drafndiaeth. Yr wyf yn hyderus i'n swyddogion trafndiaeth wneud amcangyfrif synhwyrol o'r gost. Sawl blwyddyn yn ôl bu inni edrych ar gost y datblygiad hwnnw, ond nid oeddwn yn rhan o'r trafodaethau hynny. Os ysgrifennwch ataf, fe atebaf eich cwestiwn.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Gwyddom y bu cynnydd o ran buddsoddiad, ond mae'r cysylltiadau rheilffordd rhwng y Gogledd a'r De yn parhau i fod yn fater cynhennus. Gallem ddiflasu pawb wrth siarad am y mater hwn. Yn ddiweddar, gorfu imi aros am awr a hanner yn yr Amwythig yn yr oerfel, ac ar y munud olaf bu'n rhaid imi newid plattform. I bobl anabl a phobl hŷn, nid yw hyn yn dderbyniol. Yn yr Alban—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Gofynnwch gwestiwn, Eleanor.

**Eleanor Burnham:** A ydych yn gobeithio y bydd gan Gymru well rheolaeth, ac o bosibl y caiff ragor o arian, i sicrhau'r drafndiaeth gyhoeddus llawer mwy effeithiol yr ydym yn

deserve?

**Sue Essex:** The Railways Bill—which will hopefully become an Act in the not too distant future—transfers those powers to the Welsh Assembly Government in terms of the Wales and the border franchise. That includes responsibility for all trains that travel through any part of Wales, even those which travel on into England. It is important that we get the appropriate money as part and parcel of that franchise, which is what I referred to in answer to the original question. Discussions on that are ongoing, and I am hopeful. As you know, we have always wanted to achieve control over that franchise, and it will happen.

ei haeddu?

**Sue Essex:** Mae'r Mesur Rheilffyrdd—a fydd, gobeithio, yn dod yn Ddeddf yn y dyfodol agos—yn trosglwyddo'r pwerau hynny i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o ran masnachfrait Cymru a'r gororau. Mae hynny'n cynnwys y cyfrifoldeb dros bob trên sy'n teithio drwy unrhyw ran o Gymru, hyd yn oed y rhai sy'n teithio ymlaen i Loegr. Mae'n bwysig inni gael yr arian priodol fel rhan o'r fasnachfrait honno, sef yr hyn y cyfeiriais ato yn fy ateb i'r cwestiwn gwreiddiol. Mae trafodaethau ar hynny'n parhau, ac yr wyf yn obeithiol. Fel y gwyddoch, yr ydym wedi bod yn awyddus i gael rheolaeth dros y fasnachfrait honno o'r cychwyn, a bydd hynny'n digwydd.

### **Eglurder Cyllideb y Cynulliad The Clarity of the Assembly Budget**

**C2 David Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar eglurder cyllideb y Cynulliad? OAQ0062(FIN)

**Q2 David Lloyd:** Will the Minister make a statement on the clarity of the Assembly budget? OAQ0062(FIN)

**Sue Essex:** The final and supplementary budgets present the Assembly Government's spending plans in considerable detail. I also distribute annotated tables to Assembly Members in advance of Plenary debates explaining the budget in even greater detail. These tables are also published on the internet. This year, I will be distributing further public information on the budget process and content. It is likely that we will begin sending out that information tomorrow.

**Sue Essex:** Mae'r cyllidebau terfynol ac atodol yn nodi cynlluniau gwario Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn fanwl iawn. Yr wyf hefyd yn dosbarthu tablau arnodedig i Aelodau'r Cynulliad cyn y dadleuon yn y Cyfarfodydd Llawn yn esbonio'r gyllideb yn fanylach eto. Caiff y tablau hyn eu cyhoeddi ar y rhyngrwyd hefyd. Eleni, byddaf yn dosbarthu rhagor o wybodaeth i'r cyhoedd ar y broses a chynnwys y gyllideb. Mae'n debygol y byddwn yn dechrau anfon y wybodaeth honno allan yfory.

**David Lloyd:** Ble mae arian cyfatebol Amcan 1 yn ymddangos?

**David Lloyd:** Where does Objective 1 match funding appear?

**Sue Essex:** Objective 1 match funding appears in Andrew Davies's budget under Pathway to Prosperity and, I think, the local regeneration fund lines.

**Sue Essex:** Mae arian cyfatebol Amcan 1 yn ymddangos yng nghyllideb Andrew Davies o dan Ffordd i Ffyniant ac, fe gredaf, yn llinellau'r gronfa adfywio leol.

**Irene James:** Does the Minister agree that it is ironic for a Plaid Cymru Assembly Member to ask for clarity on the Assembly's budget? Is it not the case that Plaid Cymru refuses to offer us clarity over the cost of an independent Wales, as well as the wish list of proposals with which it regularly presents us?

**Irene James:** A gytuna'r Gweinidog ei bod yn eironig i un o Aelodau Plaid Cymru'r Cynulliad ofyn am eglurder ar gyllideb y Cynulliad? Onid yw'n wir fod Plaid Cymru yn gwrthod bod yn eglur ynghylch cost Cymru annibynnol, yn ogystal â chost y rhestr ddymuniadau o gynigion y mae'n ei chyflwyno inni'n rheolaidd?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. We will proceed to the next supplementary question.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Awn ymlaen i'r cwestiwn atodol nesaf.

**Jenny Randerson:** Minister, when you announced your final budget in November, you made great play of the excellent settlement for local government. However, I notice that, in the supplementary budget that you have now published, you have reduced the amount available to local government by over £9 million. Will you explain to us why you have made that decision and why you made comments in November that misled us into believing that local government was being better funded?

**Jenny Randerson:** Weinidog, pan fu ichi gyhoeddi eich cyllideb derfynol ym mis Tachwedd, rhoesoch bwys mawr ar y setliad ardderchog i lywodraeth leol. Fodd bynnag, sylwaf, yn y gyllideb atodol yr ydych bellach wedi'i chyhoeddi, eich bod wedi cwtdogi dros £9 miliwn oddi ar y swm sydd ar gael i lywodraeth leol. A eglurwch inni pam eich bod wedi gwneud y penderfyniad hwnnw a pham eich bod wedi gwneud sylwadau ym mis Tachwedd a wnaeth ein camarwain i gredu bod llywodraeth leol yn cael ei chyllido'n well?

**Sue Essex:** We will hold a debate on this next week, but I will go back and check the line that you are talking about. What happens to the local government budget is that, throughout the course of a year, transfers take place from the UK Government budget and from here, but they are for when local government needs counter-funding to buy goods and services. Housing benefit and council-tax benefit are obvious examples.

**Sue Essex:** Byddwn yn cynnal dadl ar hyn yr wythnos nesaf, ond af yn ôl i edrych ar y llinell yr ydych yn sôn amdani. Yr hyn sy'n digwydd i'r gyllideb llywodraeth leol yw y caiff trosglwyddiadau eu gwneud o gyllideb Llywodraeth y DU ac oddi yma drwy gydol y flwyddyn, ond maent ar gyfer yr adegau pan fydd angen cyllid cyfatebol ar lywodraeth leol i brynu nwyddau a gwasanaethau. Mae budd-dal tai a budd-dal treth gyngor yn enghreifftiau amlwg.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** Minister, the clarity of the budget is vital, not least in terms of top-up tuition fees for prospective students and our universities in 2007-08. What are your indicative proposals for the budget with regard to those matters?

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Weinidog, mae eglurder y gyllideb yn hollbwysig, yn anad dim o ran ffioedd dysgu ychwanegol i ddarpar fyfyrwyr a'n prifysgolion yn 2007-08. Beth yw eich cynigion dangosol ar gyfer y gyllideb yn hynny o beth?

**Sue Essex:** There are no indicative proposals, because the Assembly Government has not made decisions on those matters. We cannot pre-empt the outcomes of the Rees commission and report, but those decisions will be made within a few months.

**Sue Essex:** Nid oes cynigion dangosol, oherwydd nid yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi gwneud penderfyniadau ar y materion hynny. Ni allwn ragweld canlyniadau comisiwn ac adroddiad Rees, ond caiff y penderfyniadau hynny eu gwneud ymhen ychydig fisoedd.

### **Y Portffolio Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes The Education and Lifelong Learning Portfolio**

**Q3 Janet Ryder:** Will the Minister make a statement on the overall funding allocation to the education and lifelong learning portfolio? OAQ0058(FIN)

**C3 Janet Ryder:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y dyraniad arian cyffredinol i'r portffolio addysg a dysgu gydol oes? OAQ0058(FIN)

**Q8 Val Lloyd:** Will the Minister make a statement on the considerations that she took into account in allocating the overall budget to the education and lifelong learning portfolio? OAQ0079(FIN)

**Sue Essex:** In preparing the budget, I had numerous discussions with Cabinet colleagues and considered subject committees' views. The overall funding allocated to the education and lifelong learning portfolio represents an increase of more than 20 per cent between 2004-05 and 2007-08. This investment reflects the importance of education and lifelong learning in delivering our strategic agenda.

**Janet Ryder:** In total, around 11 per cent more money per head of the population comes to Wales, in comparison with England, as a spend in the budget. Yet, in 2003-04, 1 per cent less was spent on education in Wales than was spent in England. Professor David Reynolds has already stated that, if all the money that comes into Wales that was intended to be spent on education were spent on it, we would have a very well-funded higher education sector. How much of that money has had to be diverted to provide match funding, Minister?

**Sue Essex:** I really do not understand the nature of your question; it is as though you do not believe in devolution. You know the process—blocks come to us according to the Barnett allocations and it is then up to us, as a Government, to make the decisions. If we are to have spending that is completely comparable and straight down the line with England, what is the point of the public paying for an Assembly Government? You know that we do not do it that way for very good reasons. We spend our money differently.

However, 1 per cent is not a great divergence between comparable budgets, but I still stick by the principle that, when the money comes across to us under a range of headings, and we get the consequentials, we should spend it according to our priorities. If you do not believe in that, I honestly do not know why you are sitting in this Chamber.

**Val Lloyd:** Unlike the previous speaker, I

**C8 Val Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y ffactorau y rhoddodd ystyriaeth iddynt wrth ddyrannu holl gyllideb y portffolio addysg a dysgu gydol oes? OAQ0079(FIN)

**Sue Essex:** Wrth baratoi'r gyllideb, cefais nifer o drafodaethau gyda'm cyd-Weinidogion yn y Cabinet ac ystyriais farn y pwyllgorau pwnc. Mae'r gyllideb gyffredinol a ddyrannwyd i'r portffolio addysg a dysgu gydol oes yn gynydd o fwy nag 20 y cant rhwng 2004-05 a 2007-08. Mae'r buddsoddiad hwn yn adlewyrchu pwysigrwydd addysg a dysgu gydol oes o ran cyflawni ein hagenda strategol.

**Janet Ryder:** Daw cyfanswm o tua 11 y cant o arian ychwanegol y pen i Gymru, o gymharu â Lloegr, fel gwariant yn y gyllideb. Serch hynny, yn 2003-04, gwariwyd 1 y cant yn llai ar addysg yng Nghymru nag a wariwyd yn Lloegr. Mae'r athro David Reynolds eisoes wedi nodi, pe câi'r holl arian a ddaw i mewn i Gymru y bwriadwyd ei wario ar addysg ei wario ar hynny, byddai gennym sector addysg uwch fyddai wedi'i ariannu'n dda. Faint o'r arian hwnnw y bu'n rhaid ei arallgyfeirio i ddarparu arian cyfatebol, Weinidog?

**Sue Essex:** Nid wyf yn deall natur eich cwestiwn; mae fel pe na baech yn credu mewn datganoli. Gwyddoch beth yw'r broses—cawn flocliau yn unol â dyraniadau Barnett ac yna ein cyfrifoldeb ni, fel Llywodraeth, yw gwneud y penderfyniadau. Os ydym am gael gwariant sy'n gwbl gymaradwy ac yn unol â Lloegr, pa ddiben sydd i'r cyhoedd dalu am Lywodraeth y Cynulliad? Gwyddoch nad ydym yn gwneud pethau yn y ffordd honno am resymau da iawn. Gwariwn ein harian yn wahanol.

Fodd bynnag, nid yw 1 y cant yn wahanuaeth mawr rhwng cyllidebau cymaradwy, ond glynaf wrth yr egwyddor, pan gawn arian o dan ystod o benawdau, a'r symiau canlyniadol, dylem wario'r arian yn unol â'n blaenoriaethau. Os na chredwch yn hynny, ni wn pam ar y ddaear yr ydych yn eistedd yn y Siambr hon.

**Val Lloyd:** Yn wahanol i'r siaradwr

welcome the additional investment in early years education in this budget. Do you agree, Minister, that it is important to give our children the very best start in life, and that, with that investment, we can make excellent progress with integrated centres and the foundation phase curriculum?

**Sue Essex:** Yes. You are talking about the roll-forward of the three-year budgets, while Janet's question referred to the budget for 2004-05. Quite rightly, you said that the spend on early years' education was an important priority for us, which has generally been appreciated across Wales.

2.10 p.m.

The development of integrated centres is a very exciting idea; I know that you have such a centre in your constituency, in Clwyd Primary School. Much of our budget operation is about looking at the experience of people, whether young or old, across the board and ensuring that our budget spend complements that. If we are to get youngsters to really engage with education, and feel it is for them, we know how important those early years are, and nursery provision and parental support is crucial.

**William Graham:** Minister, can you give us an assurance that the budget for the education portfolio will adequately cover the payscales recently agreed between college lecturers and the Association of Colleges?

**Sue Essex:** The money is there. Jane Davidson leads on this, and I will ask her about it, but she has not made any representations to say that she considers there to be a shortfall in the budget.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Do you agree that it is important that money follows the learner, and that it does so in such a way that learners can pursue a vocational or academic education as suits them best, such as the 14-19 learning pathway?

blaenorol, croesawaf y buddsoddiad ychwanegol mewn addysg blynyddoedd cynnar yn y gyllideb hon. A gytunwch, Weinidog, ei bod yn bwysig rhoi'r cychwyn gorau mewn bywyd i'n plant, a chyda'r buddsoddiad hwnnw, y gallwn wneud cynnydd rhagorol gyda chanolfannau integredig a'r cwricwlwm cyfnod sylfaen?

**Sue Essex:** Cytunaf. Yr ydych yn sôn am gario'r cyllidebau tair blynedd ymlaen, tra bo cwestiwn Janet yn cyfeirio at y gyllideb ar gyfer 2004-05. Dywedasoch, a hynny'n briodol, fod y gwariant ar addysg blynyddoedd cynnar yn flaenoriaeth bwysig inni, sydd wedi cael ei gwerthfawrogi yn gyffredinol ledled Cymru.

Mae datblygu canolfannau integredig yn syniad cyffrous iawn; gwn fod gennych ganolfan o'r fath yn eich etholaeth chi, yn Ysgol Gynradd Clwyd. Mae rhan fawr o'r ffordd y gweithredwn ein cyllideb yn ymwneud ag edrych ar brofiad pobl, hen ac ifanc, ym mhob maes a sicrhau bod gwariant ein cyllideb yn ategu hynny. Os ydym am ennyn diddordeb pobl ifanc mewn addysg yn wirioneddol, a gwneud iddynt deimlo ei bod yn rhywbeth sy'n berthnasol iddynt hwy, gwyddom pa mor bwysig yw'r blynyddoedd cynnar hynny, ac mae darpariaeth feithrin a chefnogaeth rhieni yn hollbwysig.

**William Graham:** Weinidog, a allwch roi sicrwydd inni y bydd y gyllideb ar gyfer y portffolio addysg yn ddigon i gwmpasu'r graddfeydd cyflog y cytunwyd arnynt yn ddiweddar rhwng darlithwyr colegau a Chymdeithas y Colegau?

**Sue Essex:** Mae'r arian ar gael. Jane Davidson sy'n arwain ar hyn, ac fe'i holaf ynglŷn â hyn, ond nid yw wedi gwneud unrhyw sylwadau i ddweud ei bod yn ystyried bod y gyllideb yn annigonol.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** A gytunwch ei bod yn bwysig bod arian yn dilyn y dysgwr, a'i fod yn gwneud hynny mewn ffordd sy'n galluogi dysgwyr i fynd ar drywydd addysg alwedigaethol neu academaidd yn unol â'r hyn sydd fwyaf addas iddynt, fel y llwybr dysgu 14-19?



**Sue Essex:** What we did in the budget, and it was very much informed by your experience and the experience of others, is to reflect the fact that if we are really to make education/training meaningful for people it has to be person-centred. The 14-19 learning pathway, which was prioritised in the budget, is one of the innovative measures that we have introduced, and I hope that it will be successful.

**Sue Essex:** Yr hyn a wnaethom yn y gyllideb, a chafodd ei lywio'n sylweddol gan eich profiad chi a phrofiad eraill, yw adlewyrchu'r ffaith os ydym am wneud addysg/hyfforddiant yn rhywbeth ystyrlon i bobl bod yn rhaid iddynt ganolbwyntio ar y person. Mae'r llwybr dysgu 14-19, y rhoddwyd blaenoriaeth iddo yn y gyllideb, yn un o'r mesurau arloesol yr ydym wedi'i gyflwyno, a gobeithiaf y bydd yn llwyddiannus.

### **Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Local Government and Public Services**

**Q4 Peter Black:** Will the Minister make a statement on the money allocated in the budget for local government and public services? OAQ0064(FIN)

**C4 Peter Black:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar yr arian a ddyrennir yn y gyllideb ar gyfer Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus? OAQ0064(FIN)

**Sue Essex:** The overall funding allocated to the local government main expenditure group—and I will stick with that, as public services cover a whole sweep of issues—for the next three years represents an increase of more than 16 per cent between 2004-05 and 2007-08.

**Sue Essex:** Mae'r arian cyffredinol a ddyrannwyd i brif grŵp gwariant llywodraeth leol—a chadwaf at hynny, gan fod gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn cwmpasu ystod gyfan o faterion—am y tair blynedd nesaf yn cynrychioli cynnydd o fwy nag 16 y cant rhwng 2004-05 a 2007-08.

**Peter Black:** In setting their budgets this year, local councils have faced a cap from you on their spending, a 1 per budget cut or saving due to the Gershon or Trickey reports, and, because of rebanding, no matter what they did, council tax bills were going to increase massively, and far in excess of whatever councils set them at. For example, Cardiff County Council cut its council tax by 0.56 per cent, but, on average, most council tax payers will see their bills go up by between 12 and 20 per cent. Do you think that you have done enough to protect council tax payers from the effects of rebanding?

**Peter Black:** Wrth bennu eu cyllidebau eleni, mae cynghorau lleol wedi wynebu cap gennyh ar eu gwariant, gostyngiad neu arbediad o 1 y cant yn y gyllideb o ganlyniad i adroddiadau Gershon neu Trickey, ac, oherwydd yr ailfandio, waeth beth y byddent yn ei wneud, byddai biliau'r dreth gyngor yn cynyddu'n sylweddol, ac ymhell uwchlaw'r lefelau a bennwyd gan y cynghorau. Er enghraifft, bu i Gyngor Sir Caerdydd ostwng ei dreth cyngor 0.56 y cant, ond, ar gyfartaledd, bydd y rhan fwyaf o dalwyr y dreth gyngor yn canfod bod eu biliau'n cynyddu rhwng 12 ac 20 y cant. A gredwch eich bod wedi gwneud digon i ddiogelu talwyr y dreth gyngor rhag effeithiau ailfandio?

**Sue Essex:** We all signed up to revaluation—and when I say 'all' I mean everyone in the Chamber. I have considered the impact of rebanding on people, and have taken that issue seriously. When the response from the revaluation was announced at the beginning of September, we put extra money into the budget to ensure that no-one will go up more

**Sue Essex:** Bu i bawb ohonom ymrwymo i ailbriso—a phan ddywedaf 'pawb ohonom' golygaf bawb yn y Siambr hon. Yr wyf wedi ystyried effaith ailfandio ar bobl, ac wedi cymryd y mater hwnnw o ddifrif. Pan gyhoeddwyd yr ymateb yn sgîl yr ailbriso ddechrau mis Medi, rhesom ragor o arian yn y gyllideb i sicrhau na fydd treth gyngor neb

than one band in any one year. That is an important step that we took. It was not in the original scheme, but when we saw the impact, we brought that in. The overall council budget increase varies between local authorities, depending on the formula and on what the council tax take will be. However, our budget was substantial and augmented by money from Gordon Brown—the £7.4 million that came out of the pre-budget report, and the injection of money into the business grant. That has had a major impact this year. Cardiff's council tax take will go up, and that has been protected to a certain extent by the threshold of 3.5 per cent. I have consistently said to all local authorities in Wales that, in this particularly difficult year, they should not increase council tax any more than they need to do. That is crucial. We have to see things from the public's point of view.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** A fyddech yn cytuno y dylid dyrannu arian i lywodraeth leol ar sail ystadegol ffeithiol a chost wirioneddol cynnig gwasanaeth i'r bobl?

**Sue Essex:** That is what the distribution subgroup, in particular, and the expenditure subgroup, try to do with regard to allocations. All the political parties are represented on the consultative forum on finance, and that is your chance to make your points. I am open to ideas in those meetings. At our last meeting, everyone agreed with what we were doing. If you do not take your chance and make the changes, that is up to you. We strive within that group to get the best data possible. This is why some changes are made from one year to the next in the calculations and the formula distribution.

**Glyn Davies:** I have a question on the money allocated to local authorities to deal with keeping open the public footpath network. Far too many public footpaths are closed or difficult to use. I am not in favour of hypothecation, but have you made a calculation of the cost of keeping public footpaths open, and how much of the cost is built into the settlement, so that paths can be kept open where people want to use them?

yn cynyddu mwy nag un band mewn un flwyddyn. Mae hwnnw'n gam pwysig inni ei gymryd. Nid oedd yn y cynllun gwreiddiol, ond pan welsom yr effaith, bu inni gyflwyno hynny. Mae'r cynnydd cyffredinol yng nghyllideb cynghorau yn amrywio rhwng awdurdodau lleol, yn dibynnu ar y fformiwla ac ar dderbyniadau'r dreth gyngor. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd ein cyllideb yn sylweddol ac fe'i hategwyd gan arian gan Gordon Brown—y £7.4 miliwn a ddeilliodd o'r adroddiad cyn y gyllideb, a'r chwistrelliad o arian i'r grant busnes. Cafodd hynny effaith fawr eleni. Bydd derbyniadau'r dreth gyngor yng Nghaerdydd yn cynyddu, a diogelwyd hynny i raddau gan y trothwy o 3.5 y cant. Yr wyf wedi dweud yn gyson wrth bob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru na ddylent gynyddu'r dreth gyngor yn fwy nag sydd raid yn y flwyddyn anodd iawn hon. Mae hynny'n hollbwysig. Rhaid inni weld pethau o safbwynt y cyhoedd.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Do you agree that local government funding should be allocated on the basis of statistical fact and the true cost of providing services to people?

**Sue Essex:** Dyna'r hyn y mae'r is-grŵp dosbarthu, yn arbennig, a'r is-grŵp gwariant, yn ceisio ei wneud o ran y dyraniadau. Caiff pob un o'r pleidiau gwleidyddol eu cynrychioli ar y fforwm ymgynghorol ar gyllid, a dyna eich cyfle i wneud eich pwyntiau. Yr wyf yn agored i syniadau yn y cyfarfodydd hynny. Yn ein cyfarfod diwethaf, yr oedd pawb yn cytuno â'r hyn yr oeddem yn ei wneud. Os na fanteisiwch ar y cyfle a gwneud y newidiadau, eich penderfyniad chi yw hynny. Yr ydym yn ymdrechu o fewn y grŵp hwnnw i gael y data gorau posibl. Dyna pam y caiff rhai newidiadau eu gwneud o un flwyddyn i'r llall yn y cyfrifiadau a'r dosbarthiad fformiwla.

**Glyn Davies:** Mae gennyf gwestiwn ar yr arian a ddyrannwyd i awdurdodau lleol er mwyn sicrhau bod y rhwydwaith llwybrau cyhoeddus yn parhau ar agor. Caiff llawer gormod o lwybrau cyhoeddus eu cau neu maent yn anodd eu defnyddio. Nid wyf o blaid clustnodi, ond a ydych wedi cyfrifo cost cadw llwybrau cyhoeddus ar agor, a faint o'r gost hon a gaiff ei chynnwys yn y setliad, er mwyn sicrhau y caiff llwybrau eu cadw ar

agor lle mae pobl am eu defnyddio?

**Sue Essex:** In the early stages, when the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000 was enacted, a regulatory appraisal was made. In terms of taking this forward in Wales, an estimate was made of the legislation's impact on each local authority, and money was provided on a non-hypothecated basis in the revenue support grant. Provision for the existing footpath network and public rights of way is, I think, included in the original calculation of the spending needs of local authorities. The funding comes under the highways budgets of local authorities; it comes through in highways legislation. The public rights of way estimates are found in the original allocation, which is non-hypothecated.

**Sue Essex:** Yn y camau cynnar, pan weithredwyd Deddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000, gwnaed arfarniad rheoliadol. O ran datblygu hyn yng Nghymru, gwnaed amcangyfrif o effaith y ddeddfwriaeth ar bob awdurdod lleol, a darparwyd arian heb ei glustnodi yn y grant cynnal refeniw. Mae'r ddarpariaeth ar gyfer y rhwydwaith llwybrau troed presennol a hawliau tramwy cyhoeddus, fe gredaf, wedi'i chynnwys yn y cyfrifiad gwreiddiol o anghenion gwario awdurdodau lleol. Daw'r arian o dan gyllidebau priffyrdd awdurdodau lleol; daw i'r amlwg mewn deddfwriaeth priffyrdd. Gellir gweld yr amcangyfrifon hawliau tramwy cyhoeddus yn y dyraniad gwreiddiol, sydd heb ei glustnodi.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Question 5, OAQ0054(FIN), has been withdrawn.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae cwestiwn 5, OAQ0054(FIN), wedi'i dynnu yn ôl.

### Cynlluniau Cyllidebau Tair Blynedd Three-year Budget Plans

**Q6 Mark Isherwood:** Will the Minister make a statement on her three-year budget plans? OAQ0069(FIN)

**C6 Mark Isherwood:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ei chynlluniau ar gyfer cyllidebau tair blynedd? OAQ0069(FIN)

**Sue Essex:** The Welsh Assembly Government's three-year budget plans provide more than 22 per cent growth in the Assembly departmental expenditure limit between 2004-05 and 2007-08, from £11.3 billion in 2004-05 to £13.8 billion in 2007-08. This is a significant increase that will enable us to spend an additional £2.5 billion per year by 2007-08.

**Sue Essex:** Mae cynlluniau cyllidebau tair blynedd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn darparu twf o fwy na 22 y cant yn nherfyn gwariant adrannol y Cynulliad rhwng 2004-05 a 2007-08, o £11.3 biliwn yn 2004-05 i £13.8 biliwn yn 2007-08. Mae hwn yn gynnydd sylweddol a fydd yn ein galluogi i wario £2.5 biliwn ychwanegol y flwyddyn erbyn 2007-08.

**Mark Isherwood:** The chair of the north Wales committee of the Confederation of British Industry has stated that there is a massive black hole to fill when it comes to promises regarding tax levels and that Gordon Brown has to store up any real nasties for the future. How would the lucky Chancellor's black hole affect the people of Wales?

**Mark Isherwood:** Mae cadeirydd pwyllgor y Gogledd o Gydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain wedi nodi bod twll du enfawr i'w lenwi o ran addewidion am lefelau treth a bod Gordon Brown yn gorfod cadw unrhyw godiadau annymunol ar gyfer y dyfodol. Sut y byddai twll du y Canghellor ffodus yn effeithio ar bobl Cymru?

**Sue Essex:** You have a vivid imagination, or perhaps this comes from the imagination of the person whom you quoted. We do not see a black hole. We have discussions with the Treasury, and I can say that there is not a

**Sue Essex:** Mae gennych ddychymyg byw, neu efallai y daw hyn o ddychymyg y person a ddyfynnwyd gennych. Ni welwn dwll du. Cawn drafodaethau gyda'r Trysorlys, a gallaf ddweud nad oes twll du. Yr wyf newydd

black hole. I have just said that we have a massive year-on-year increase in expenditure from Gordon Brown, and that is what we are dealing with in the budget.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** On 23 February, Brian Gibbons announced—we have been having a conversation—that an additional £23 million would be made available to local health boards and health trusts to meet the waiting-time targets next year. Is this amount in addition to the £4.8 billion allocated for next year and, if so, where has it been taken from? If it is already within the budget, it cannot be new money. Is this a one-off payment, or will it recur annually?

**Sue Essex:** Are you referring to the £32 million?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yes.

**Sue Essex:** The £32 million is additional money. As Brian announced last week, it is aimed at responding to waiting times in the NHS in Wales, expanding the second offer scheme where necessary, and trying to encourage innovation in terms of solutions for reducing waiting times.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** You have said that this is a one-off, non-recurring payment. This is precisely the kind of measure that the Auditor General for Wales said that you should not take, as it amounts to a short-term initiative as part of a firefighting exercise. Are you not providing this money to save the seats of Welsh Labour MPs? Given that Peter Hain is now running the health service in Wales, it is humiliating for you to question Janet Ryder's belief in devolution when your Government is being run from Westminster.

**Sue Essex:** Excuse me, but is it now the stated policy of Plaid Cymru not to reduce waiting times and lists?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Answer the question.

**Sue Essex:** I am answering the question. This money is being provided to fund operations and to respond to other medical needs. If you

ddweud ein bod yn cael cynnydd enfawr flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn mewn gwariant gan Gordon Brown, a dyna'r hyn yr ydym yn ymdrin ag ef yn y gyllideb.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Ar 23 Chwefror, cyhoeddodd Brian Gibbons—yr ydym wedi bod yn trafod—y byddai £23 miliwn ychwanegol yn cael ei roi i fyrddau iechyd lleol ac ymddiriedolaethau iechyd i gyrraedd y targedau o ran amseroedd aros y flwyddyn nesaf. A yw'r swm hwn yn ychwanegol at y £4.8 biliwn a ddyrannwyd ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf, ac, os felly, o ble y daeth? Os yw eisoes o fewn y gyllideb, ni all fod yn arian newydd. Ai taliad unigol yw hyn, neu a fydd yn cael ei roi bob blwyddyn?

**Sue Essex:** A ydych yn cyfeirio at y £32 miliwn?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Ydwyf.

**Sue Essex:** Mae'r £32 miliwn yn arian ychwanegol. Fel y cyhoeddodd Brian yr wythnos diwethaf, ei nod yw ymateb i amseroedd aros yn y GIG yng Nghymru, gan ehangu cynllun yr ail gynnig lle y bo angen, a cheisio annog arloesedd o ran atebion i leihau amseroedd aros.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr ydych wedi dweud bod hyn yn daliad unigol, na chaiff ei roi eto. Dyna'r union fath o fesur y dywedodd Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru na ddylech ei gymryd, gan ei fod yn gyfystyr â menter tymor byr fel rhan o ymgais i ddelio â phroblemau wrth iddynt godi. Onid ydych yn darparu'r arian hwn i arbed seddau ASau Llafur Cymru? O gofio mai Peter Hain sy'n rhedeg y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru yn awr, mae'n waradwyddus ichi amau ffydd Janet Ryder mewn datganoli pan fo eich Llywodraeth chi yn cael ei rhedeg o San Steffan.

**Sue Essex:** Esgusodwch fi, ond ai polisi datganedig Plaid Cymru yn awr yw peidio â lleihau amseroedd a rhestrï aros?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Atebwch y cwestiwn.

**Sue Essex:** Yr wyf yn ateb y cwestiwn. Mae'r arian hwn yn cael ei ddarparu i ariannu llawdriniaethau ac i ymateb i anghenion

do not think that that money should be spent in that way, then you need to tell the people of Wales so. I look at Brian and see that he is in charge of the health service. He is doing a good job of it.

2.20 p.m.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):**

Perhaps I can search for the answer to the question. You have admitted that this money is only for one year; I am of the opinion, as are the Auditor General and the Assembly, that we should not be putting money into short-term one-off initiatives. Is the £32 million an investment in the future and, if so, how long do you anticipate it proceeding? How long do you expect it to be in your budget, and will it appear in your three-year budget profile or, given that some correspondents are now saying that it will take us until 2011 to achieve the same waiting-list targets as England, will it keep magically appearing year after year?

**Sue Essex:** You may be searching for the answer, Mike, but you have not quite found it. We are putting this additional money in to support the waiting-times initiative, but, next year, the budget will roll forward, in which case we will consider any further developments in health. I do not know why that should be a mystery or a surprise to you—that is how budgets work, as we roll through budgets, we make decisions on spending.

**Michael German:** I am not referring to what you or I may think, Minister, but to what the Auditor General says about the health service in Wales. He has said that one-off budget investments giving the health service a financial boost, without allowing it to plan and develop for the future, is the wrong approach. The fundamental question is this: have you taken this one-off investment approach this year while keeping in mind that you will do it again in years two and three? People who work in the health service would like an answer to that question so that they can plan changes, or else this will be yet

meddygol eraill. Os na chredwch y dylid gwario'r arian hwnnw yn y ffordd honno, yna mae angen ichi ddweud hynny wrth bobl Cymru. Edrychaf ar Brian a gweld mai ef sy'n gyfrifol am y gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae'n gwneud gwaith da.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):**

Efallai y gallaf chwilio am yr ateb i'r cwestiwn. Yr ydych wedi cyfaddef mai dim ond am flwyddyn y mae'r arian hwn ar gael; yr wyf o'r farn, fel y mae'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol a'r Cynulliad, na ddylem fod yn gwario arian ar fentrau tymor byr unigol. Ai buddsoddiad yn y dyfodol yw'r £32 miliwn ac, os felly, am ba hyd yr ydych yn rhagweld y bydd yn parhau? Am ba hyd yr ydych yn disgwyl iddo fod yn eich cyllideb, ac a fydd yn ymddangos yn eich proffil cyllideb tair blynedd neu, o gofio bod rhai gohebwy'r yn dweud yn awr y bydd yn rhaid aros tan 2011 i gyrraedd yr un targedau o ran rhestri aros â Lloegr, a fydd yn parhau i ymddangos yn hudol flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn?

**Sue Essex:** Efallai eich bod yn chwilio am yr ateb, Mike, ond nid ydych wedi dod o hyd iddo yn hollol. Yr ydym yn rhoi'r arian ychwanegol hwn i gynnal y fenter amseroedd aros, ond, y flwyddyn nesaf, bydd y gyllideb yn cael ei chario ymlaen, a byddwn felly yn ystyried unrhyw ddatblygiadau pellach ym maes iechyd. Ni wn pam y dylai hynny fod yn ddirgelwch neu'n syndod i chi—dyna'r ffordd y mae cyllidebau'n gweithio, wrth inni gario cyllidebau ymlaen, gwnawn benderfyniadau gwario.

**Michael German:** Nid wyf yn cyfeirio at yr hyn yr wyf fi neu yr ydych chi, Weinidog, yn ei gredu efallai, ond at yr hyn y dywed yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol am y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru. Mae wedi dweud mai buddsoddiadau cyllidebol unigol sy'n rhoi hwb ariannol i'r gwasanaeth iechyd, heb adael iddo gynllunio a datblygu ar gyfer y dyfodol, yw'r ffordd anghywir o fynd ati. Y cwestiwn sylfaenol yw hwn: a ydych wedi gwneud y buddsoddiad unigol hwn eleni tra'n cadw mewn cof y gwnewch hynny eto ymhen dwy neu dair blynedd? Byddai pobl sy'n gweithio yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yn hoffi

another one-off measure that you will trumpet before a general election, but which will disappear when you come to next year's budget.

**Sue Essex:** I do not understand why you are labouring so much on this. The issue is that within that spending there will be some pilot schemes which might be one-off schemes or which might be recurring. You continually criticise the length of waiting times. We have found what is currently a successful way of responding to that. A lot of your comments referred to past practice. I am surprised that you should be negative about successful initiatives that reduce waiting times, and Brian will bear that in mind.

I have said that when we get to the budget planning round—when all Members will have an opportunity to make an input in committee—the sustainability of some of those programmes within the health service will come into play. However, Brian is in charge of that spend, with Ann Lloyd in charge of the NHS, and I know that it will be used sensibly.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Question 7, OAQ0065(FIN), has been withdrawn.

cael ateb i'r cwestiwn hwnnw fel y gallant gynllunio ar gyfer newidiadau, neu fel arall mesur unigol arall y byddwch yn ei gyhoeddi ar gyrn a phiban cyn etholiad cyffredinol fydd hwn, a fydd yn diflannu pan ddaw'r adeg i bennu cyllideb y flwyddyn nesaf.

**Sue Essex:** Ni ddeallaf pam eich bod yn rhygnu ymlaen gymaint ar hyn. Y broblem yw y bydd rhai cynlluniau peilot, o fewn y gwariant hwnnw, a allai fod yn gynlluniau unigol neu'n rhai rheolaidd. Yr ydych yn parhau i feirniadu hyd yr amseroedd aros. Yr ydym wedi canfod ffordd lwyddiannus o ymateb i hynny ar hyn o bryd. Cyfeiriodd sawl un o'ch sylwadau at arferion y gorffennol. Yr wyf yn synnu eich bod yn negyddol ynglŷn â mentrau llwyddiannus sy'n lleihau amseroedd aros, a bydd Brian yn cadw hynny mewn cof.

Yr wyf wedi dweud, pan gyrhaeddwn gylch cynllunio'r gyllideb—pan gaiff pob Aelod gyfle i gyfrannu yn y pwyllgor—y caiff cynaliadwyedd rhai o'r rhaglenni hynny o fewn y gwasanaeth iechyd ei bwysu a'i fesur. Fodd bynnag, Brian sy'n gyfrifol am y gwariant hwnnw, gydag Ann Lloyd yn gyfrifol am y GIG, a gwn y caiff ei ddefnyddio'n synhwyrol.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae cwestiwn 7, OAQ0065(FIN), wedi'i dynnu yn ôl.

### **Prosiectau Menter Cyllid Preifat yn y Gogledd Private Finance Initiative Projects in North Wales**

**Q9 Brynle Williams:** Will the Minister make a statement on private finance initiative projects in north Wales? OAQ0075(FIN)

**Sue Essex:** PFI schemes in operation are for the A55 dual carriageway across Anglesey, a three-school building approach in Conwy County Borough Council, council offices in Denbighshire and a renal and diabetes unit and energy management scheme in Conwy and Denbighshire NHS Trust.

**Brynle Williams:** I am pleased to hear that there is a PFI project in at least one school, but why can we not use these initiatives to update more schools? It would do a lot of

**C9 Brynle Williams:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar brosiectau menter cyllid preifat yng ngogledd Cymru? OAQ0075(FIN)

**Sue Essex:** Mae'r cynlluniau menter cyllid preifat sydd ar waith yn cynnwys ffordd ddeuol yr A55 ar draws Ynys Môn, prosiect adeiladu tair ysgol yng Nghyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy, swyddfydd y cyngor yn sir Ddinbych ac uned gwasanaeth arenol a diabetes a chynllun rheoli ynni yn Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Siroedd Conwy a Dinbych.

**Brynle Williams:** Yr wyf yn falch o glywed bod prosiect PFI mewn un ysgol o leiaf, ond pam na allwn ddefnyddio'r mentrau hyn i ddiweddarau rhagor o ysgolion? Byddai'n

good to use PFI much more in north Wales where we have companies prepared to take part.

**Sue Essex:** I specifically said three schools in Conwy.

As you do not sit on the Local Government and Public Service Committee, Brynle, you may not be aware that we have introduced a new prudential borrowing scheme. It enables local authorities to take forward their own PFI schemes if they want to. I know that many local authorities are looking at making comprehensive improvements in schools using the capital money that we have given them and the freedom of the prudential borrowing scheme to advance in whatever way they see fit.

**Janet Ryder:** I agree that the prudential borrowing scheme allows local authorities to use public money in their own way. The PFI scheme for the A55 across Anglesey has shown that such an initiative eats up tens of millions of pounds of public money which should have gone into public services. It is much better to use public money to build public services than to use PFI schemes.

**Sue Essex:** This is about different methods of securing capital development. In most cases, it is about borrowing. PFI was a different form of borrowing and, as you say, it has revenue implications throughout. You will have noticed in this year's budget, and in the forward-looking budget that I announced in November, that we have increased the capital allocations incredibly, both in general capital to local authorities and specifically around schools—going up to 16 per cent. Therefore, local authorities may feel that that increased capital allocation reduces the need for them to consider PFI schemes, but it is up to local authorities to decide that for themselves.

fuddiol iawn defnyddio PFI yn fwy yn y Gogledd lle y mae gennym gwmmiau sy'n barod i gymryd rhan.

**Sue Essex:** Cyfeiriais at dair ysgol yng Nghonwy yn benodol.

Gan nad ydych yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus, Brynle, efallai na wyddoch ein bod wedi cyflwyno cynllun benthyca darbodus newydd. Mae'n galluogi awdurdodau lleol i ddatblygu eu cynlluniau PFI eu hunain os dymunant. Gwn fod llawer o awdurdodau lleol yn ystyried gwneud gwelliannau cynhwysfawr mewn ysgolion gan ddefnyddio'r arian cyfalaf yr ydym wedi ei roi iddynt a rhyddid y cynllun benthyca darbodus i ddatblygu ym mha ffordd bynnag y gwelant orau.

**Janet Ryder:** Cytunaf fod y cynllun benthyca darbodus yn caniatáu i awdurdodau lleol ddefnyddio arian cyhoeddus yn eu ffordd hwy eu hunain. Mae'r cynllun PFI ar gyfer ffordd yr A55 ar draws Ynys Môn wedi dangos bod menter o'r fath yn defnyddio degau ar filiynau o bunnoedd o arian cyhoeddus a ddylai fod wedi cael ei wario ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus. Mae'n llawer gwell defnyddio arian cyhoeddus i ddatblygu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn hytrach na defnyddio cynlluniau PFI.

**Sue Essex:** Mae a wnelo hyn â dulliau gwahanol o sicrhau datblygiad cyfalaf. Yn y rhan fwyaf o achosion, mae a wnelo â benthyca. Yr oedd PFI yn ffordd wahanol o fenthyca ac, fel y dywedwch, mae iddi oblygiadau refeniw drwyddi draw. Byddwch wedi sylwi yng nghyllideb eleni, ac yn y gyllideb flaengar a gyhoeddais ym mis Tachwedd, ein bod wedi cynyddu'r dyraniadau cyfalaf yn aruthrol, o ran cyfalaf cyffredinol i awdurdodau lleol ac yn benodol o ran ysgolion—yn codi i 16 y cant. Felly, efallai y bydd awdurdodau lleol yn teimlo bod dyraniad cyfalaf cynyddol yn lleihau'r angen iddynt ystyried cynlluniau PFI, ond rhaid i awdurdodau lleol benderfynu ar hynny drostynt hwy eu hunain.

**Y Portffolio Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol**  
**The Health and Social Services Portfolio**

**Q10 Nick Bourne:** What discussions has the Minister had with the Minister for Health and Social Services regarding any increases to the overall budget allocation for his portfolio?  
 OAQ0044(FIN)

**Sue Essex:** I will give the usual response, which I am sure you are aware of, Nick. I have had numerous discussions with Cabinet colleagues. Overall funding for health and social services will increase by 20 per cent between 2004-05 and 2007-08. This year, I have provided an additional £56.3 million for capital schemes as well as the £32 million that we have just talked about to reduce waiting times.

**Nick Bourne:** Have you had any discussions with the Assembly Minister for Health and Social Services, rather than the health Minister at Westminster, Peter Hain, since his announcement that the First Minister—another health Minister, it seems—will make an announcement about an 18-week waiting list period in Wales in the next three weeks? Has there been any attempt to cost that, or are we disregarding that because it is an initiative from Westminster and not from the place where power properly resides on health, which is the National Assembly?

**Sue Essex:** I have little to add to what I said yesterday when I answered questions on behalf of the First Minister. We have used funding to reduce waiting times as quickly as we can, ensuring that people get the best-quality treatment. We are going down to a 12/12 target for out-patients and in-patients, and, as time goes on, I hope that we can reduce that further. However, we will do that in the light of experience.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** O wrando ar eich ateb i Nick Bourne, a ydych yn dweud wrthym y bydd y polisi iechyd yn bolisi o ddelio â chanlyniadau rhestrau aros, yn hytrach na cheisio delio â'r rhestrau aros eu

**C10 Nick Bourne:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael â'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ynghylch unrhyw gynnydd yng nghyfanswm y gyllideb a ddyrennir i'w bortffolio?  
 OAQ0044(FIN)

**Sue Essex:** Rhoddaf yr ymateb arferol, yr ydych yn ymwybodol ohono, Nick, mae'n siŵr. Cefais nifer o drafodaethau gyda chyd-Weinidogion yn y Cabinet. Bydd cyfanswm yr arian cyffredinol ar gyfer iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn cynyddu 20 y cant rhwng 2004-05 a 2007-08. Eleni, yr wyf wedi darparu £56.3 miliwn ychwanegol ar gyfer cynlluniau cyfalaf yn ogystal â'r £32 miliwn yr ydym newydd sôn amdano i leihau amseroedd aros.

**Nick Bourne:** A gawsoch unrhyw drafodaethau gyda Gweinidog y Cynulliad dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, yn hytrach na'r Gweinidog iechyd yn San Steffan, Peter Hain, ers ei gyhoeddiad y bydd y Prif Weinidog—Gweinidog iechyd arall, mae'n debyg—yn gwneud cyhoeddiad ynglŷn â chyfnod rhestr aros o 18 wythnos yng Nghymru yn y tair wythnos nesaf? A fu unrhyw ymgais i gostio hynny, neu a ydym yn ei anwybyddu am mai menter o San Steffan ydyw ac nid menter o'r lle sydd â'r pŵer priodol dros iechyd, sef y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol?

**Sue Essex:** Nid oes gennyf lawer i'w ychwanegu at yr hyn a ddywedais ddoe pan atebais gwestiynau ar ran y Prif Weinidog. Yr ydym wedi defnyddio cyllid i leihau amseroedd aros mor gyflym ag y gallwn, gan sicrhau bod pobl yn cael y driniaeth orau. Yr ydym yn gostwng i darged 12/12 ar gyfer cleifion allanol a chleifion mewnol, ac, wrth i amser fynd yn ei flaen, gobeithiaf y gallwn ostwng hynny ymhellach. Fodd bynnag, gwnawn hynny yn ôl profiad.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Having listened to your response to Nick Bourne, are you telling us that the health policy will be a policy of dealing with the outcomes of waiting lists, rather than of trying to deal with the waiting



hunain? A ydych wedi gwneud unrhyw werthusiad o'r arian a werir ar gynllun yr ail gynnig, oherwydd, i raddau helaeth, yr ydych yn gorfod ceisio cael gwasanaeth y tu allan i'r system wrth wneud hynny, a fydd yn fwy costus na defnyddio'r GIG i drin pobl?

**Sue Essex:** I am not sure about the cost, because we have entered a phase of block contracts. Therefore, the second offer scheme is pretty good value for money. It is important to note that all this is working to the Wanless agenda. Therefore, as we move ahead with the initiative for waiting times, we have to put in place those other elements of restructuring that Wanless was clear about. One of those issues is looking at demand management. One scheme that I was keen to see a few weeks ago was that in Barry Hospital, where there is a screening process on orthopaedic symptoms. 'Screening' is the right word, because those who go through to surgery would enter the waiting times process. Others go on to receive physiotherapy and other treatments, which are more pertinent to their particular medical problems. We must have this twin tracking, if you like. We have initiatives to reduce waiting times, but it is also important that we act on those other key elements of the Wanless agenda, to turn the tanker around, over time, on Welsh health.

lists themselves? Have you carried out any evaluation of the money spent on the second offer scheme, because, to a great extent, you must attempt to find provision outside the system, which will be more costly than using the NHS to treat patients?

**Sue Essex:** Nid wyf yn siŵr o'r gost, gan ein bod wedi dechrau ar gyfnod o gontractau bloc. Felly, mae cynllun yr ail gynnig yn werth eithaf da am arian. Mae'n bwysig nodi bod hyn oll yn gweithio yn ôl agenda Wanless. Felly, wrth inni symud ymlaen gyda'r fenter ar gyfer amseroedd aros, rhaid inni roi'r elfennau eraill hynny o ailstrwythuro ar waith yr oedd Wanless mor bendant yn eu cylch. Un o'r materion hynny yw edrych ar reoli'r galw. Un cynllun yr oeddwn yn awyddus i'w weld rai wythnosau yn ôl oedd yr un yn Ysbyty'r Barri, lle mae proses sgrinio ar gyfer symptomau orthopedig. 'Sgrinio' yw'r gair cywir, oherwydd byddai'r rhai sy'n mynd ymlaen i gael llawdriniaeth yn ymuno â'r broses amseroedd aros. Mae eraill yn mynd ymlaen i gael ffisiotherapi a thriniaethau eraill, sydd yn fwy perthnasol i'w problemau meddygol penodol hwy. Mae'n rhaid wrth y system ddeuol hon, fel petai. Mae gennym fentrau i leihau amseroedd aros, ond mae'n bwysig hefyd ein bod yn gweithredu ar yr elfennau allweddol eraill hynny o agenda Wanless, i newid cyfeiriad, dros amser, o ran iechyd Cymru.

### **Cyllid Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol The Health and Social Services Budget**

**Q11 Lisa Francis:** Will the Minister make a statement on any additional funding that she is considering giving to the health and social services budget? OAQ0073(FIN)

**C11 Lisa Francis:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar unrhyw arian ychwanegol y mae'n ystyried ei roi i gyllideb y portffolio iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol? OAQ0073(FIN)

**Sue Essex:** As I have just said, we recently announced an extra £32 million for the forthcoming year.

**Sue Essex:** Fel yr wyf newydd ei ddweud, bu inni gyhoeddi £32 miliwn ychwanegol yn ddiweddar ar gyfer y flwyddyn i ddod.

**Lisa Francis:** I have received many letters from constituents who are concerned about the inequality of ambulance cover at night, particularly in rural areas. In such areas, ambulance technicians and paramedics are called out of their beds at home in response to an emergency call, and, as a result,

**Lisa Francis:** Yr wyf wedi cael sawl llythyr gan etholwyr sy'n pryderu ynghylch darpariaeth anghyfartal y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn ystod y nos, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Mewn ardaloedd o'r fath, caiff technegwyr ambiwlans a pharafeddygon eu dihuno yn eu cartrefi mewn ymateb i

category A calls are often not answered within the regulatory 8 minutes. Do you have any plans to invest more money into this service to ensure that people in remote areas are not relegated to receiving a second-class health service and are able to have 24-hour ambulance-station provision?

**Sue Essex:** I cannot comment in detail on those cases. However, I understand your concern. It is for the Minister for Health and Social Services to make detailed allocations within his expenditure group—that is how the system works. The Minister is present in the Chamber, and I am sure that he will have heard your comments and will get back to you.

2.30 p.m.

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad Questions to the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside**

### **Y Taliad Sengl The Single Farm Payment**

**Q1 Mick Bates:** Will the Minister make a statement on the single farm payment? OAQ0101(EPC)

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** The single payment scheme came into effect on 1 January.

**Mick Bates:** Thank you for that brief answer. As you are aware, there have been many issues with regard to the reference years, and I place on record how well your staff, particularly in divisional offices, are working to resolve those issues. However, there is a particular issue that I find disturbing, which is cross-border payments. You recently wrote to me saying that it may take slightly longer to pay cross-border farmers than other farmers. Why should they, when we have computer systems and integrated administration and control system designations of land, have to wait longer than other farmers because they live on the border?

**Carwyn Jones:** You understand the situation

alwad frys, ac, o ganlyniad, ni chaiff galwadau categori A eu hateb yn aml o fewn yr 8 munud rheoliadol. A oes gennych unrhyw gynlluniau i fuddsoddi rhagor o arian yn y gwasanaeth hwn i sicrhau nad yw pobl mewn ardaloedd anghysbell yn cael gwasanaeth iechyd eilradd a'u bod yn gallu cael darpariaeth gorsaf ambiwlans 24 awr?

**Sue Essex:** Ni allaf roi sylwadau manwl ar yr achosion hynny. Fodd bynnag, deallaf eich pryder. Cyfrifoldeb y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yw gwneud dyraniadau manwl o fewn ei grŵp gwariant—dyna'r ffordd y mae'r system yn gweithio. Mae'r Gweinidog yn y Siambr, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd wedi clywed eich sylwadau ac y bydd yn cysylltu â chi.

**C1 Mick Bates:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y taliad sengl? OAQ0101(EPC)

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Daeth cynllun y taliad sengl i rym ar 1 Ionawr.

**Mick Bates:** Diolch ichi am yr ateb byr hwnnw. Fel y gwyddoch, bu sawl problem o ran y blynyddoedd cyfeirio, a hoffwn gofnodi pa mor dda y mae eich staff, yn arbennig mewn swyddfeydd rhanbarthol, yn gweithio i ddatrys y problemau hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae un broblem benodol sy'n fy mhoeni, sef taliadau trawsffiniol. Bu ichi ysgrifennu ataf yn ddiweddar i ddweud y gall gymryd ychydig mwy o amser i dalu ffermwyr trawsffiniol na ffermwyr eraill. Pam y dylent hwy, pan fo gennym systemau cyfrifiadurol a dynodiadau tir o dan y system weinyddu a rheoli integredig, orfod aros mwy o amser na ffermwyr eraill am eu bod yn byw ar y ffin?

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr ydych yn deall y sefyllfa

with regard to the Rural Payments Agency in England, and there are some 500 farmers in Wales who also farm in England. There will be one payment, of course, but officials have held meetings with many of the farmers involved, and we are liaising with the RPA on the matter and hope to get the payments out as quickly as possible. However, occasionally, where we have to deal with a different subsidy regime, things may take slightly longer, but we are hopeful that we can get the payments out as quickly as possible.

**Brynle Williams:** At the recent Oxford farming conference, Lord Whitty hinted that Wales and Scotland would have to review the historic payment as early as 2007. Do you have any plans to change the historic model in Wales?

**Carwyn Jones:** No; the model is designed to last until 2013.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Question 2, OAQ0082(EPC), has been withdrawn.

o ran yr Asiantaeth Taliadau Gwledig yn Lloegr, ac mae tua 500 o ffermwyr yng Nghymru yn ffermio yn Lloegr hefyd. Bydd un taliad, wrth gwrs, ond mae swyddogion wedi cynnal cyfarfodydd gyda llawer o'r ffermwyr dan sylw, ac yr ydym yn cydlynu â'r RPA ar y mater ac yn gobeithio y gallwn ddsbarthu'r taliadau cyn gynted â phosibl. Fodd bynnag, yn achlysurol, pan fydd yn rhaid inni ymdrin â chyfundrefn cymorthdaliadau wahanol, gall pethau gymryd mwy o amser, ond yr ydym yn obeithiol y gallwn ddsbarthu'r taliadau cyn gynted â phosibl.

**Brynle Williams:** Yng nghynhadledd ffermio Rhydychen yn ddiweddar, awgrymodd yr Arglwydd Whitty y byddai'n rhaid i Gymru a'r Alban adolygu'r taliad hanesyddol mor gynnar â 2007. A oes gennych unrhyw gynlluniau i newid y model hanesyddol yng Nghymru?

**Carwyn Jones:** Nac oes; bwriedir i'r model barhau tan 2013.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae cwestiwn 2, OAQ0082(EPC), wedi'i dynnu yn ôl.

### **'Cynllunio: Cyflawni dros Gymru' 'Planning: Delivering for Wales'**

**Q3 Karen Sinclair:** Will the Minister make a statement on the progress of the 'Planning: Delivering for Wales' programme? OAQ0074(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** My written statement issued on 23 November 2004 reported on progress with the 'Planning: Delivering for Wales' programme, and set out the key priorities for the year ahead.

**Karen Sinclair:** You may be aware that Wrexham Association Football Club has, for the last year, been under the threat of losing its famous Racecourse ground. The current owner has threatened to sell the ground for property development, which goes firmly against the wishes of everyone in the local community. Will you make a statement on the actions that you have taken to protect such leisure facilities from property developers, to ensure that the land that they occupy remains for community and leisure

**C3 Karen Sinclair:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar hynt rhaglen 'Cynllunio: Cyflawni dros Gymru'? OAQ0074(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** Cyfeiriodd fy natganiad ysgrifenedig a gyhoeddwyd ar 23 Tachwedd 2004 at hynt y rhaglen 'Cynllunio: Cyflawni dros Gymru', a nododd y blaenoriaethau allweddol ar gyfer y flwyddyn i ddod.

**Karen Sinclair:** Efallai y gwyddoch fod Clwb Pêl-droed Wrecsam, dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, wedi gorfod wynebu'r perygl o golli ei gae enwog, y Cae Ras. Mae'r perchennog presennol wedi bygwth gwerthu'r tir er mwyn datblygu eiddo, sy'n mynd yn hollol groes i ddymuniadau pawb yn y gymuned leol. A wnewch ddatganiad ar y camau a gymerwyd gennych i ddiogelu cyfleusterau hamdden o'r fath rhag datblygwyr eiddo, er mwyn sicrhau bod y tir lle y safant yn parhau i fod at ddefnydd y

use only?

**Carwyn Jones:** I know that, as a lifelong supporter of Wrexham football club, you have been concerned with the situation there. It is, of course, a matter for the local planning authority to, first, outline how land is to be used in the development plan, local or unitary, depending on which process the council wants to use in Wrexham. It is not possible for someone to simply sell land and build houses on it, because planning permission is needed, and it is for the local authority to decide how it wishes to move forward and to give an indication of what its view might be.

**Helen Mary Jones:** You will be aware that I have previously asked questions about the relationship between the spatial plan and the other planning documents that provide planning guidance. Have you had an opportunity to give further thought to how Assembly Members can effectively scrutinise the interface between the national spatial plan and the rest of the planning documents and how effectively that is working under the circumstances whereby one Minister has responsibility for the national spatial plan while another has responsibility for overall planning policy? Do you have any concerns about how effectively the policies are working together, and do you have any practical suggestions on how Members can effectively scrutinise that interface when the responsibility falls between you and Sue Essex?

**Carwyn Jones:** The planning aspects of the spatial plan can be scrutinised in the committee. There are no difficulties in terms of meshing the spatial plan with planning guidance, and if the committee wishes to see how the planning system is taking the spatial plan into account, then it can do that.

**Glyn Davies:** With regard to how the planning system delivers affordable housing, I have previously raised the issue of how local councils use planning gain and transfer it, almost wholly, onto the price of affordable housing. The situation is getting worse. In Powys, any development of over five houses has probably about £1,000 per house attached to it. Are you keeping a degree of control

gymuned a hamdden yn unig?

**Carwyn Jones:** Gwn eich bod, fel rhywun sydd wedi cefnogi clwb pêl-droed Wrecsam ar hyd ei hoes, wedi ymddiddori yn y sefyllfa yno. Wrth gwrs, cyfrifoldeb yr awdurdod cynllunio lleol, yn gyntaf, yw amlinellu sut y caiff y tir ei ddefnyddio yn y cynllun datblygu, lleol neu unedol, yn dibynnu ar ba broses y mae'r cyngor am ei defnyddio yn Wrecsam. Nid yw'n bosibl i rywun fynd ati i werthu tir ac adeiladu tai arno, gan fod angen caniatâd cynllunio, a chyfrifoldeb yr awdurdod lleol yw penderfynu sut y mae am weld pethau yn datblygu, ac i nodi ei farn.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Fe wyddoch fy mod wedi gofyn cwestiynau o'r blaen ynglŷn â'r berthynas rhwng y cynllun gofodol a'r dogfennau cynllunio eraill sy'n rhoi canllawiau cynllunio. A gawsoch gyfle i feddwl ymhellach am sut y gall Aelodau Cynulliad graffu'n effeithiol ar y rhyngwyneb rhwng y cynllun gofodol cenedlaethol a gweddill y dogfennau cynllunio a pha mor effeithiol y mae hynny'n gweithio o dan yr amgylchiadau lle y mae gan un Gweinidog gyfrifoldeb dros y cynllun gofodol cenedlaethol ac un arall gyfrifoldeb dros bolisi cynllunio cyffredinol? A oes gennych unrhyw bryderon ynglŷn â pha mor effeithiol y mae'r polisiau yn cydweithio, ac a oes gennych unrhyw awgrymiadau ymarferol ar sut y gall Aelodau graffu'n effeithiol ar y rhyngwynebu hynny pan fydd y cyfrifoldeb arnoch chi a Sue Essex?

**Carwyn Jones:** Gellir craffu ar yr agweddau cynllunio ar y cynllun gofodol yn y pwyllgor. Nid oes unrhyw anawsterau o ran uno'r cynllun gofodol â'r canllawiau cynllunio, ac os yw'r pwyllgor yn dymuno gweld sut y mae'r system gynllunio yn ystyried y cynllun gofodol, yna gall wneud hynny.

**Glyn Davies:** O ran sut y mae'r system gynllunio yn darparu tai fforddiadwy, yr wyf wedi codi o'r blaen sut y mae cynghorau lleol yn defnyddio lles cynllunio ac yn ei drosglwyddo, bron yn gyfan gwbl, i bris tai fforddiadwy. Mae'r sefyllfa yn gwaethygu. Ym Mhowys, mae gan unrhyw ddatblygiad o fwy na phum tŷ tua £1,000 fesul tŷ ynghlwm wrtho. A ydych yn cadw rhywfaint o reolaeth

over this, or at least telling local authorities that you think that just going ever upwards in terms of planning gain, piling more on the prices of affordable housing, is making an already bad situation much worse and that they should not be doing it?

**Carwyn Jones:** Local authorities should be encouraging affordable housing where appropriate. Where it is discouraged, whether deliberately or unwittingly, we would all be concerned about it. Technical Advice Note 2, which deals with affordable housing, is being revised and will provide guidance for the future when it is published in draft form.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I am also concerned about Wrexham football club. Is there any guidance, indication or assistance for local authorities regarding where waste sites should go?

**Carwyn Jones:** There are numerous pieces of guidance on that. We have regional waste plans, and planning guidance will give direction as to where waste sites should be considered, as is the case with other planning issues included in the guidance.

ar hyn, neu o leiaf yn dweud wrth awdurdodau lleol eich bod o'r farn bod cynyddu lles cynllunio'n gyson, gan roi mwy ar brisiau tai fforddiadwy, yn gwneud sefyllfa sydd eisoes yn wael yn waeth o lawer a na ddylent fod yn ei wneud?

**Carwyn Jones:** Dylai awdurdodau lleol fod yn annog tai fforddiadwy lle y bo'n briodol. Lle na chaiff hynny ei annog, yn fwriadol neu'n anfwriadol, byddai'n achos pryder i bob un ohonom. Mae Nodyn Cyngor Technegol 2, sy'n ymdrin â thai fforddiadwy, yn cael ei ddiwygio a bydd yn rhoi canllawiau ar gyfer y dyfodol pan gaiff ei gyhoeddi ar ffurf ddrafft.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yr wyf hefyd yn pryderu ynghylch clwb pêl-droed Wrecsam. A oes unrhyw ganllawiau, awgrymiadau neu gymorth ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol o ran ble y dylid lleoli safleoedd gwastraff?

**Carwyn Jones:** Ceir nifer o ganllawiau ar hynny. Mae gennym gynlluniau gwastraff rhanbarthol, a bydd canllawiau cynllunio yn rhoi cyfarwyddyd ynghylch ble y dylid ystyried lleoli safleoedd gwastraff, fel sy'n wir gyda materion cynllunio eraill a gynhwysir yn y canllawiau.

### **TB mewn Gwartheg TB in Cattle**

**C4 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Pa drafodaethau diweddar y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cynnal parthed twbercwlosis mewn gwartheg? OAQ0077(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr wyf yn cael trafodaethau parhaus gydag amrywiaeth o unigolion a sefydliadau ynghylch TB mewn gwartheg.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A ydych wedi rhoi unrhyw ystyriaeth i gasgliadau'r adroddiad Gwyddelig ar y pedair ardal, a beth yw eich ymateb i'r sylwadau a wnaed gan 350 o filfeddygon mewn llythyr at Margaret Beckett ynghylch yr angen i reoli moch daear, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd lle mae TB yn broblem fawr?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae TB mewn gwartheg yn gyfrifoldeb sydd wedi'i ddatganoli i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Bydd y

**Q4 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** What recent discussions has the Minister held about tuberculosis in cattle? OAQ0077(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** I am in continual discussion with a range of individuals and organisations about bovine TB.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Have you given any consideration to the findings of the Irish four-area report, and what is your response to the comments made by 350 veterinarians in a letter to Margaret Beckett about the need to control badgers, especially in bovine TB hotspots?

**Carwyn Jones:** Responsibility for bovine TB has been devolved to the National Assembly for Wales. The Irish results will form part of

canlyniadau yn Iwerddon yn rhan o'r dystiolaeth a ystyrir gan y grŵp gweithredu a gadeirir gan Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey. Edrychaf ymlaen at weld casgliadau'r grŵp.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Do you agree that the Welsh initiative of having intensive treatment areas to control bovine TB gives Wales the unique opportunity to be ahead of the United Kingdom in tackling all major vectors of bovine TB—including badger to badger, and badger to cattle transfer—thus protecting both badgers and cattle?

**Carwyn Jones:** That is why I look forward to the group's advice on the measures that it will put forward, including advice on intensive treatment areas.

**Kirsty Williams:** I know that you pride yourself, Carwyn, on taking seriously the advice of veterinarians in developing the policies that you pursue. I invite you again to answer the question asked by Rhodri Glyn Thomas. What are your comments regarding the 350 veterinarians who recently wrote to the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs outlining the fact that they believe that, if we are to get to grips with TB in cattle in Wales, we have to consider culling badgers?

**Carwyn Jones:** The veterinarians' views will, of course, form part of the evidence presented to the Wales TB action group. The group has been set up as a cross-interest group of people, including those with wildlife interests and farmers. I look forward to hearing its recommendations in due course, and I do not want to prejudge its good work.

the evidence to be considered by the action group chaired by Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey. I look forward to seeing the group's findings.

**Laura Anne Jones:** A gytunwch fod y fenter Gymreig o gael ardaloedd triniaeth ddwys i reoli TB mewn gwartheg yn rhoi cyfle unigryw i Gymru fod ar y blaen i'r Deyrnas Unedig wrth fynd i'r afael â phob prif gyfrwng sy'n cludo TB mewn gwartheg—gan gynnwys trosglwyddo o foch daear i foch daear, ac o foch daear i wartheg—a thrwy hynny ddiogelu moch daear a gwartheg?

**Carwyn Jones:** Dyna pam yr wyf yn edrych ymlaen at gael cyngor y grŵp ar y mesurau y bydd yn eu cyflwyno, gan gynnwys cyngor ar ardaloedd triniaeth ddwys.

**Kirsty Williams:** Gwn eich bod yn ymfalchïo, Carwyn, yn y ffordd yr ydych yn cymryd cyngor milfeddygon o ddifrif wrth ddatblygu'r polisïau sydd gennych. Fe'ch gwahoddaf eto i ateb y cwestiwn a ofynnwyd gan Rhodri Glyn Thomas. Beth yw eich sylwadau o ran y 350 o filfeddygon a ysgrifennodd at Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig yn ddiweddar, yn amlinellu'r ffaith eu bod yn credu, er mwyn inni fynd i'r afael â TB mewn gwartheg yng Nghymru, fod yn rhaid inni ystyried difa moch daear?

**Carwyn Jones:** Bydd safbwyntiau'r milfeddygon, wrth gwrs, yn rhan o'r dystiolaeth a gyflwynir i grŵp gweithredu TB Cymru. Sefydlwyd y grŵp fel grŵp o bobl â buddiannau gwahanol, gan gynnwys ffermwyr a rhai sydd â buddiannau bywyd gwyllt. Edrychaf ymlaen at glywed ei argymhellion maes o law, ac nid wyf am ragfarnu ei waith da.

### **Ardaloedd Cadwraeth Arbennig Newydd New Special Areas of Conservation**

**Q5 Irene James:** Will the Minister make a statement about new special areas of conservation in Wales? OAQ0113(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** The current network of sites in Wales is largely complete. The Countryside Council for Wales has

**C5 Irene James:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ardaloedd cadwraeth arbennig newydd yng Nghymru? OAQ0113(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** I raddau helaeth, mae'r rhwydwaith presennol o safleoedd yng Nghymru wedi ei gwblhau. Mae Cyngor

concluded its consultation with interested parties on two further sites, which are the Severn and the Dee estuaries.

**Irene James:** I welcome your comments and the fact that new areas of conservation have been recognised, particularly the Aberbargoed grasslands in Caerphilly. Do you agree that, as part of this process, which takes up to 10 years from consultation to implementation, the planning process for new developments must consider sites that could potentially be designated special areas of conservation or sites of special scientific interest, and should consider areas within the former industrial regions that could form part of environmental tourism in Wales in the future?

**Carwyn Jones:** It is essential that we preserve and enhance all the areas of Wales that make the country special in terms of environment and biodiversity. There is great scope for environmental tourism in the future, as you rightly said. Countryside Council for Wales's recent announcement on special areas of conservation will go some way towards moving the process onwards.

**Owen John Thomas:** Dwy agwedd eithriadol o'n prifddinas yw'r ddwy lain hir, di-dor o dir parciau a thir coediog sy'n ymestyn o ddau leoliad ar yr A48 hyd at ffiniau'r ddinas. A ydych yn cytuno bod y fath nodweddion eithriadol yn haeddu cael eu dynodi fel ardaloedd cadwraeth arbennig?

2.40 p.m.

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae hwn yn fater i Gyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru ei ystyried. Mae croeso i chi ysgrifennu ataf a gofyn i CCGC ystyried y mater, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yn fodlon gwneud hynny.

Cefn Gwlad Cymru wedi gorffen ymgynghori â phartion â diddordeb ar ddau safle arall, sef moryd Hafren a moryd Dyfrdwy.

**Irene James:** Croesawaf eich sylwadau a'r ffaith bod ardaloedd cadwraeth newydd wedi cael eu cydnabod, yn arbennig glaswelltiroedd Aberbargoed yng Nghaerffili. A gytunwch, fel rhan o'r broses hon, sy'n cymryd hyd at 10 mlynedd o'r cyfnod ymgynghori hyd at ei gweithredu, fod yn rhaid i'r broses gynllunio ar gyfer dabtygiadau newydd ystyried safleoedd a allai gael eu dynodi yn ardaloedd cadwraeth arbennig neu'n safleoedd o ddiddordeb gwyddonol arbennig yn y dyfodol, ac y dylai ystyried ardaloedd o fewn yr hen ranbarthau diwydiannol a allai fod yn rhan o dwristiaeth amgylcheddol yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn diogelu ac yn gwella pob ardal yng Nghymru sy'n gwneud y wlad yn arbennig o ran amgylchedd a bioamrywiaeth. Mae posibiliadau mawr ar gyfer twristiaeth amgylcheddol yn y dyfodol, fel y dywedasoeh a hynny'n iawn. Bydd cyhoeddiad diweddar Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru ar ardaloedd cadwraeth arbennig yn gwneud rhywfaint i ddatblygu'r broses.

**Owen John Thomas:** Two exceptional features of our capital city are the long, unbroken strips of parkland and woodland that stretch from two sites on the A48 to the city's boundaries. Do you agree that such exceptional features deserve to be designated as special areas of conservation?

**Carwyn Jones:** This is an issue for the Countryside Council for Wales to consider. You are welcome to write to me to ask CCW to consider the matter, and I am sure that it would be happy to do so.

### Ailgylchu Gwastraff Recycled Waste

**Q6 Michael German:** What percentage of Wales's waste is recycled? OAQ0086(EPC)

**C6 Michael German:** Pa ganran o wastraff Cymru sy'n cael ei ailgylchu? OAQ0086(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** A total of 54 per cent of waste is recycled.

**Carwyn Jones:** Caiff 54 y cant o wastraff ei ailgylchu.

**Michael German:** The most difficult fraction is the industrial or non-domestic fraction. Can you indicate what percentage of industrial waste in Wales is now recycled? What measures do you have—including sticks and carrots—to ensure that that percentage is increased? What target have you set yourself for industrial waste recycling by 2010?

**Michael German:** Y ffraciwn anoddaf yw'r ffraciwn diwydiannol neu annomestig. A allwch nodi pa ganran o wastraff diwydiannol yng Nghymru sy'n cael ei hailgylchu yn awr? Pa fesurau sydd gennych—gan gynnwys gwobrau a chosbau—i sicrhau bod y ganran honno'n cynyddu? Pa darged yr ydych wedi ei osod i chi eich hun i ailgylchu gwastraff diwydiannol erbyn 2010?

**Carwyn Jones:** A total of 61 per cent of industrial waste and 18 per cent of commercial waste is recycled or reused. The figure for industrial waste is already high, and we want to ensure that it remains high and goes up. Inevitably, our drive in terms of developing alternative uses for municipal waste will impact on other waste streams.

**Carwyn Jones:** Caiff 61 y cant o wastraff diwydiannol a 18 y cant o wastraff masnachol ei ailgylchu neu ei aildefnyddio. Mae'r ffigur ar gyfer gwastraff diwydiannol eisoes yn uchel, ac yr ydym am sicrhau ei fod yn parhau yn uchel ac yn codi. Yn anochel, bydd ein gwaith o ddatblygu defnyddiau amgen ar gyfer gwastraff trefol yn effeithio ar ffrydiau gwastraff eraill.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Waeth pa mor llwyddiannus fydd y strategaeth ailgylchu, bydd angen safleoedd tirlenwi. Clywsom y bore yma fod perygl y bydd y rhan fwyaf o safleoedd ledled Cymru yn llawn erbyn 2007. Pa gamau y byddwch yn eu cymryd i sicrhau y bydd digon o safleoedd tirlenwi ar gael erbyn diwedd y degawd hwn?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** However successful the recycling strategy may be, we will still need landfill sites. We heard this morning that there is a danger that most sites across Wales will be full by 2007. What steps will you be taking to ensure that sufficient landfill capacity will be available by the end of this decade?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae hynny'n rhan o'r strategaeth wastraff. Mae'n bwysig bod awdurdodau lleol yn ystyried safleoedd sy'n addas ar gyfer tirlenwi. Yr ydym am sicrhau ein bod yn symud oddi wrth dirlenwi fel y prif ffordd o gael gwared ar wastraff ac y caiff swm cynyddol o wastraff ei ailgylchu neu ei aildefnyddio yn y dyfodol. Yr ydym yn derbyn cyngor gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd ac felly yr ydym yn gwybod beth yw'r sefyllfa ar hyn o bryd o ran safleoedd tirlenwi. Yr ydym yn cynllunio yn unol â'r strategaeth wastraff er mwyn sicrhau bod manau ar gael i waredu gwastraff yn y dyfodol.

**Carwyn Jones:** This is part of the waste strategy. It is important that local authorities consider suitable locations for landfill sites. We want to ensure that we move away from landfill as the main waste disposal method and that an increasing amount of waste is recycled or reused in the future. We are advised by the Environment Agency and are therefore aware of the current situation regarding landfill sites. We are making plans, in line with the waste strategy, to ensure that waste disposal sites will be available in the future.

**Jonathan Morgan:** What funding is available for local authorities to promote household recycling, in particular the collection of green bags from outside people's houses? I am aware that in Cardiff, for example, the provision of this service is incredibly patchy. Unless we get a more

**Jonathan Morgan:** Pa arian sydd ar gael i awdurdodau lleol hyrwyddo ailgylchu gwastraff cartrefi, yn arbennig casglu bagiau gwyrdd o'r tu allan i dai pobl? Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod y gwasanaeth a ddarperir yng Nghaerdydd, er enghraifft, yn eithriadol o anghyson. Oni chawn wasanaeth mwy



uniform service, the aims and objectives of the Government's environmental strategy will not be met.

**Carwyn Jones:** In 2004-05, £29.5 million was made available through the waste strategy for the recycling and reuse of waste. Of this, £21 million goes directly to local authorities. We have not prescribed a particular method of collection because we want to see which is the best. In some parts of Wales, black bags are still used and waste is sorted at the transfer point. In others, collections of recyclable materials are being made to varying degrees. In one part of Wales, the collection of recyclable materials is more frequent than the collection of non-recyclable materials. We want to see which method is the most effective, and then other people can learn from good practice. The money is there, and it is important that there is a consistent approach to collection within local authority areas.

**Rosemary Butler:** Will you join me in congratulating Newport City Council on the excellent recycling service that it now provides? As you know, having visited the facility yourself, the amount of waste being recycled has shot up. What it is doing to ensure that the public is educated about recycling is quite exceptional, and perhaps we can extend that across Wales.

**Carwyn Jones:** Newport has a good record and a regular doorstep collection of recyclables. Within the city there are organisations such as Newport Wastesavers, which has a good track record and is a good example to others across the whole of Wales. I certainly join you in congratulating Newport on its fine effort.

cyson, ni chaiff nodau ac amcanion strategaeth amgylcheddol y Llywodraeth eu bodloni.

**Carwyn Jones:** Yn 2004-05, rhyddhawyd £29.5 miliwn drwy'r strategaeth wastraff i ailgylchu ac ailddefnyddio gwastraff. O'r swm hwn, mae £21 miliwn yn mynd yn uniongyrchol at awdurdodau lleol. Nid ydym wedi dynodi dull penodol o gasglu gan ein bod am weld pa un sydd orau. Mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru, defnyddir bagiau du o hyd a chaiff y gwastraff ei ddioli yn y man trosglwyddo. Mewn rhannau eraill, mae'r graddau y caiff deunyddiau ailgylchadwy eu casglu yn amrywio. Mewn un rhan o Gymru, caiff deunyddiau ailgylchadwy eu casglu'n amlach na deunyddiau na ellir eu hailgylchu. Yr ydym am weld pa ddull yw'r un mwyaf effeithiol, ac yna gall pobl ddysgu o arferion da. Mae'r arian yno, ac mae'n bwysig sicrhau ymagwedd gyson tuag at gasglu o fewn ardaloedd awdurdodau lleol.

**Rosemary Butler:** A ymunwch â mi i longyfarch Cyngor Dinas Casnewydd ar y gwasanaeth ailgylchu rhagorol a ddarperir ganddo yn awr? Fel y gwyddoch, ar ôl ymweld â'r cyfleuster eich hun, mae llawer mwy o wastraff yn cael ei ailgylchu yn awr. Mae'r hyn y mae'n ei wneud i sicrhau bod y cyhoedd yn cael ei addysgu ynglŷn ag ailgylchu yn eithaf eithriadol, ac efallai y gallwn ymestyn hynny ledled Cymru.

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae gan Gasnewydd record dda a chesglir deunyddiau ailgylchadwy yn rheolaidd o dai pobl. Yn y ddinas ceir sefydliadau megis Newport Wastesavers, sydd â record dda ac sy'n esiampl dda i eraill ledled Cymru. Yn sicr, ymunaf â chi i longyfarch Casnewydd ar ei hymdrech wych.

### Gollyngiadau Nwyon Tŷ Gwydr Greenhouse Gas Emissions

**Q7 Janet Davies:** Will the Minister make a statement on greenhouse gas emissions? OAQ0092(EPC)

**Q9 Jocelyn Davies:** Will the Minister make a statement on targets for greenhouse gas emissions? OAQ0090(EPC)

**C7 Janet Davies:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ollyngiadau nwyon tŷ gwydr? OAQ0092(EPC)

**C9 Jocelyn Davies:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar dargedau ar gyfer gollyngiadau nwyon tŷ gwydr? OAQ0090(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** We are committed to making an equitable contribution towards the UK's Kyoto obligation of a 12.5 per cent reduction in greenhouse gas emissions by 2012. The regional inventories published in December report that Welsh greenhouse gas emissions decreased by an estimated 8.6 per cent between 1990 and 2002.

**Janet Davies:** You will be aware that there is mounting evidence of the real global dangers of greenhouse gas emissions. Do you think it is right that air travel is excluded from the Kyoto targets, and that aviation spirit is free from tax?

**Carwyn Jones:** Aviation fuel is not a devolved matter, and neither is the tax on such fuel. On the work that the Assembly can do, much is going on in terms of developing renewable energy sources and encouraging their use. More broadly, on sustainability, we look carefully at how public money is spent on new buildings and so on, and at the sustainability of those buildings. There are good examples in Wales, including the Environment Agency building in Llandarcy and the new Pembrokeshire Coast National Park headquarters at Pembroke Dock, where sustainability was a real and tangible element in the buildings' development.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Do you agree that the UK Government is sending out mixed messages on greenhouse gas emissions? On the one hand, the Prime Minister says that climate change is one of our biggest threats, yet, on the other, in the Council of Ministers, the UK representative resisted the setting of a target to reduce greenhouse gas emissions in developed countries.

**Carwyn Jones:** I do not think that the UK Government can be accused of running away from commitment, because the Kyoto agreement committed the UK to a 12.5 per cent reduction, as I have said. The UK Government is committed to achieving that reduction.

**Alun Cairns:** It seems that the Welsh Assembly Government's prime strategy for

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr ydym yn ymrwymedig i wneud cyfraniad teg tuag at rwymedigaeth y DU o dan gytundeb Kyoto i leihau gollyngiadau nwyon tŷ gwydr 12.5 y cant erbyn 2012. Mae'r rhestr rhanbarthol a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Rhagfyr yn nodi i ollyngiadau nwyon tŷ gwydr ostwng tua 8.6 y cant yng Nghymru rhwng 1990 a 2002.

**Janet Davies:** Fe wyddoch fod tystiolaeth gynyddol o beryglon gwirioneddol gollyngiadau nwyon tŷ gwydr yn fyd-eang. A gredwch ei bod yn gywir eithrio teithiau awyr o dargedau Kyoto, a bod tanwydd awyrennau yn rhydd o dreth?

**Carwyn Jones:** Nid yw tanwydd awyrennau, na threth ar danwydd o'r fath, yn fater datganoledig. O ran y gwaith y gall y Cynulliad ei wneud, gwneir llawer i ddatblygu ffynonellau ynni adnewyddadwy ac i annog y defnydd ohonynt. Yn fwy cyffredinol, o ran cynaliadwyedd, edrychwn yn ofalus ar y ffordd y caiff arian cyhoeddus ei wario ar adeiladau newydd ac ati, ac ar gynaliadwyedd yr adeiladau hynny. Mae enghreifftiau da yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys adeilad Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn Llandarcy a phencadlys newydd Parc Cenedlaethol Arfordir Sir Benfro yn Noc Penfro, lle yr oedd cynaliadwyedd yn elfen wirioneddol a diriaethol wrth ddatblygu'r adeiladau.

**Jocelyn Davies:** A gytunwch fod Llywodraeth y DU yn cyfleu negeseuon cymysg o ran gollyngiadau nwyon tŷ gwydr? Ar y naill law, dywed Prif Weinidog y DU fod newid yn yr hinsawdd yn un o'r bygythiadau mwyaf a wynebwn, ond, ar y llaw arall, yng Nghyngor y Gweinidogion, gwrthwynebodd cynrychiolydd y DU bennu targed i leihau gollyngiadau nwyon tŷ gwydr mewn gwledydd datblygedig.

**Carwyn Jones:** Ni chredaf y gellir cyhuddo Llywodraeth y DU o gefnu ar ymrwymiad, oherwydd ymrwymwyd y DU gan gytundeb Kyoto i sicrhau gostyngiad o 12.5 y cant, fel y dywedais. Mae Llywodraeth y DU yn ymrwymedig i sicrhau'r gostyngiad hwnnw.

**Alun Cairns:** Ymddengys mai prif strategaeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i

reducing greenhouse gas emissions is through the use of wind energy. The latest scientific evidence suggests that wind energy is nowhere near as efficient or as effective in reducing greenhouse gases as was previously thought, and this has now been recognised by some pro-wind-energy campaigners. What consideration has the Minister given to reviewing his policy in light of this new evidence?

**Carwyn Jones:** I am not responsible for energy policy; it is the responsibility of Andrew Davies. However, I noted the report from Germany that seemed to indicate that the reason for many of the expenses associated with wind turbines in Germany was that they had been placed a long way from the national grid. The cost of connecting them to the grid was prohibitively expensive, something that the draft Technical Advice Note 8 seeks to avoid. Also, on wind power, I did not note, from the Conservative Party's website this morning, that offshore windfarms were a priority for the party.

leihau gollyngiadau nwyon tŷ gwydr yw drwy ddefnyddio ynni gwynt. Awgryma'r dystiolaeth wyddonol ddiweddaraf nad yw ynni gwynt mor effeithlon nac mor effeithiol wrth leihau nwyon tŷ gwydr o bell ffordd ag a gredid o'r blaen, ac mae rhai ymgyrchwyr o blaid ynni gwynt bellach wedi cydnabod hyn. Pa ystyriaeth a roddodd y Gweinidog i adolygu ei bolisi yng ngoleuni'r dystiolaeth newydd hon?

**Carwyn Jones:** Nid wyf yn gyfrifol am bolisi ynni; cyfrifoldeb Andrew Davies ydyw. Fodd bynnag, nodais fod yr adroddiad o'r Almaen fel petai'n awgrymu mai'r rheswm dros lawer o'r costau sy'n gysylltiedig â thyrbinau gwynt yn yr Almaen oedd eu bod wedi'u gosod yn bell o'r grid cenedlaethol. Yr oedd y gost o'u cysylltu â'r grid yn rhy uchel o lawer, ac mae'r fersiwn drafft o Nodyn Cyngor Technegol 8 yn ceisio osgoi hynny. Yn ogystal, o ran ynni gwynt, ni nodais, o wefan y Blaid Geidwadol y bore yma, fod ffermydd gwynt ar y môr yn flaenoriaeth i'r blaid.

### **Grantiau Amddiffyn Rhag Llifogydd Flood Protection Grants**

**Q8 Lisa Francis:** Will the Minister make a statement on flood protection grants? OAQ0100(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** We are piloting a scheme aimed at supporting owners of private properties to protect their homes against flooding. Local authorities undertake work on the owners' behalf and at their expense, though the Assembly Government can contribute towards the cost of the works. If work is carried out by a local authority, the local authority pays 15 per cent of the costs and the Assembly Government pays 85 per cent.

**Lisa Francis:** In respect of the devastating floods seen in the Conwy valley, you will know, having visited her, that my constituent, Mrs Elizabeth Aylward, was invited to apply for a grant for flood protection products, as were her neighbours. When you wrote to me on that, Minister, you stated that the local authority and the Environment Agency needed to work together to ensure a long-term cost-effective solution for the area, and

**C8 Lisa Francis:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar grantiau amddiffyn rhag llifogydd? OAQ0100(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr ydym yn cynnal cynllun peilot sydd â'r nod o helpu perchnogion eiddo preifat i amddiffyn eu cartrefi rhag llifogydd. Mae awdurdodau lleol yn gwneud gwaith ar ran y perchnogion ac ar eu traul hwy, er y gall Llywodraeth y Cynulliad gyfrannu at gost y gwaith. Os gwneir gwaith gan awdurdodau lleol, mae'r awdurdod lleol yn talu 15 y cant o'r costau ac mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn talu 85 y cant.

**Lisa Francis:** O ran y llifogydd ofnadwy a welwyd yn nyffryn Conwy, fe wyddoch, gan eich bod wedi ymweld â hi, i'm hetholwr, Mrs Elizabeth Aylward, gael ei gwahodd i wneud cais am grant am gynhyrchion amddiffyn rhag llifogydd, ac felly ei chymdogion. Pan ysgrifenasoch ataf ar hynny, Weinidog, bu ichi nodi bod angen i'r awdurdod lleol ac Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd gydweithio i sicrhau ateb cost effeithiol

to ensure that they avoided the duplication of flood defence measures. How will you ensure that that is the case and that the risk of a repeat performance for those people affected by those devastating floods in the Conwy valley is reduced? Residents are happy to work together in the way that you suggested but, having been flooded twice, they have already spent a great deal of money and they are cautious about doing so again when they feel that civil defences are not yet up to scratch.

**Carwyn Jones:** First, I should have said that 15 per cent of the cost is met by the individual, not the council, and 85 per cent is met by the Assembly Government. The local authority facilitates the grant scheme.

I visited the Conwy valley, and the Environment Agency is looking at various schemes to provide increased protection for the people of Trefriw and Llanrwst. I await the agency's findings with interest.

**Huw Lewis:** Minister, you will be aware from my previous representations that the residents of Taff Street and Crescent Street in Merthyr Vale face the proposed demolition of their homes by the council, due to the flood risk posed by the river Taff. I recognise the work that you have done to alter flood protection regulations, so that they no longer prioritise the homes of the better off, thus correcting a social injustice. However, there has still not been any word from the Environment Agency as to whether Taff Street and Crescent Street now qualify. Will you expedite matters in that regard?

**Carwyn Jones:** I will certainly do so. You have raised this matter many times, Huw, and the criteria have now changed in terms of determining which areas get flood protection, but I will certainly follow that up.

2.50 p.m.

**Janet Ryder:** Taking action to prevent water from coming into the house is one thing, but many houses are affected by internal

hirdymor i'r ardal, ac i sicrhau na chaiff mesurau amddiffyn rhag llifogydd eu dyblygu. Sut y byddwch yn sicrhau bod hynny'n wir a bod y risg y bydd y rhai yr effeithiodd y llifogydd ofnadwy hynny yn nyffryn Conwy arnynt yn wynebu'r un peth eto yn gostwng? Mae'r trigolion yn fodlon gweithio gyda'i gilydd yn y ffordd a awgrymwyd gennych, ond ar ôl wynebu llifogydd ddwywaith, maent eisoes wedi gwario llawer iawn o arian ac nid ydynt yn awyddus i wneud hynny eto pan deimlant nad yw'r mesurau atal llifogydd sifil yn ddigonol eto.

**Carwyn Jones:** Yn gyntaf, dylwn fod wedi dweud mai'r unigolyn, nid y cyngor, sy'n talu 15 y cant o'r gost, a bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn talu 85 y cant. Mae'r awdurdod lleol yn hwyluso'r cynllun grantiau.

Ymwelais â dyffryn Conwy, ac mae Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn ystyried cynlluniau gwahanol i ddiogelu pobl Trefriw a Llanrwst yn well. Edrychaf ymlaen yn eiddgar at weld canfyddiadau'r asiantaeth.

**Huw Lewis:** Weinidog, fe wyddoch o'm sylwadau blaenorol fod trigolion Taff Street a Crescent Street yn Ynysowen yn wynebu'r ffaith bod y cyngor yn bwriadu dymchwel eu cartrefi, oherwydd y risg y bydd yr afon Taf yn gorlifo. Cydnabyddaf y gwaith a wnaethoch i newid rheoliadau amddiffyn rhag llifogydd, fel nad ydynt yn blaenoriaethu cartrefi'r rhai sy'n well eu byd mwyach, gan unioni anghyfiawnder cymdeithasol. Fodd bynnag, ni chlywyd dim byd eto oddi wrth Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd o ran a fydd Taff Street a Crescent Street yn gymwys bellach. A wnewch gyflymu materion yn hynny o beth?

**Carwyn Jones:** Gwnaf yn sicr. Yr ydych wedi codi'r mater hwn sawl gwaith, Huw, ac mae'r meini prawf wedi newid erbyn hyn o ran pennu pa ardaloedd sy'n cael mesurau amddiffyn rhag llifogydd, ond yn sicr, byddaf yn mynd ar drywydd hynny.

flooding. The Office of Water Services has identified hundreds of houses in Wales that are susceptible to this, because the drain structure near them has perhaps become overloaded as a result of recent developments. Yet, the money that has been allocated to addressing that problem will allow only about 60 households in Wales to be treated in 2005. Will you give an assurance that you will do all in your power to put pressure on Ofwat to increase that budget and to help those people who must regularly suffer the internal flooding of their homes because of deficient drain structures nearby?

**Carwyn Jones:** This matter was included in the guidance that we gave to Ofwat when the price increases were being considered. We wanted to see that the price rise reflected 'minimum plus' in terms of the capital works that would be required. There is no doubt that problems with drains persist across Wales, and that will remain true for a number of years, because of the length of time that the problem has existed.

When I was in Llanrwst, it was noticeable that many of the properties were affected not by water coming in from the river Conwy but by water coming up through the floor, against which there is no effective protection, in terms of sandbags and so on. One option considered at the time was to study the effect that the raised level of the river Conwy had on the drains, to see whether it was the river or the rainwater causing the problem. The Environment Agency is also looking at that. If we can reduce the potential flooding level of the Conwy river, that should also have an effect on the level of groundwater, so scientists tell me.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Question 10, OAQ0081(EPC), has been withdrawn.

Mae'r Swyddfa Gwasanaethau Dŵr wedi nodi cannoedd o gartrefi yng Nghymru sy'n debygol o wynebu hyn, gan fod y strwythur draenio ger y cartrefi wedi'i orlwytho o bosibl o ganlyniad i ddatblygiadau diweddar. Serch hynny, ni fydd yr arian a ddyrannwyd i ymdrin â'r broblem honno ond yn caniatáu i tua 60 o gartrefi yng Nghymru gael eu trin yn 2005. A roddwch sicrwydd y gwnewch bopeth yn eich pŵer i roi pwysau ar Ofwat i gynyddu'r gyllideb honno ac i helpu'r rhai y ceir llifogydd mewnol yn eu cartrefi yn rheolaidd oherwydd strwythurau draenio diffygiol gerllaw?

**Carwyn Jones:** Cynhwyswyd y mater hwn yn y canllawiau a roesom i Ofwat pan ystyriwyd y codiadau mewn prisiau. Yr oeddem am sicrhau bod y codiad mewn prisiau yn adlewyrchu 'yr hyn sy'n ofynnol a mwy' o ran y gwaith cyfalaf y byddai ei angen. Yn ddi-au, mae problemau o ran draeniau yn parhau ledled Cymru, a bydd hynny'n wir am sawl blwyddyn, oherwydd bod y broblem wedi bodoli ers cymaint o amser.

Pan oeddwn yn Llanrwst, sylwais nad y dŵr a oedd yn dod i mewn o afon Conwy a oedd yn effeithio ar lawer o'r cartrefi ond dŵr a oedd yn dod drwy'r llawr, ac nid oes camau effeithiol i amddiffyn rhag hynny, o ran bagiau tywod ac ati. Un opsiwn a ystyriwyd ar y pryd oedd astudio effaith lefel uwch afon Conwy ar y draeniau, i weld ai'r afon neu'r dŵr glaw a oedd yn achosi'r broblem. Mae Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn ystyried hynny hefyd. Os gallwn leihau lefel gorlifo posibl afon Conwy, dylai hynny hefyd effeithio ar lefel y dŵr daear, yn ôl yr hyn y dywed gwyddonwyr wrthyf.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae cwestiwn 10, OAQ0081(EPC), wedi'i dynnu yn ôl.

### **Cyfyngu ar Symud Anifeiliaid The Restriction on Animal Movement**

**Q11 Janet Ryder:** What consideration has the Minister given towards ending the six-day restriction on animal movement?  
OAQ0091(EPC)

**C11 Janet Ryder:** Pa ystyriaeth y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i rhoi i ddod â'r cyfyngiad 6 diwrnod ar symud anifeiliaid i ben?  
OAQ0091(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** Given the fact that the six-day rule is in place because of veterinary advice, I have given no immediate consideration to lifting it. I will, of course, regularly review the situation and take advice from veterinarians.

**Janet Ryder:** I take it that you will guarantee that, in light of the soon-to-be-devolved animal health powers, you will keep that measure under review, always assuming that public health considerations must come first?

**Carwyn Jones:** I do not want to give the impression that the six-day rule is about to be changed; it is not. However, it will be looked at regularly in the future to see whether there are alternatives, though it is difficult to see any at present.

**Glyn Davies:** Where you can be satisfied that the use of isolation pens, or other isolating systems, is appropriate within any type of business, are you prepared to extend the use of such a system to limit the occasions on which the six-day rule is currently used?

**Carwyn Jones:** There are currently situations where isolation pens are appropriate. However, the veterinary advice that I have been given states that the six-day rule is the most effective way of reducing the risk of spreading disease, taking into account the need for farmers to be able to operate commercially.

**Carwyn Jones:** O gofio'r ffaith bod y rheol chwe diwrnod ar waith oherwydd cyngor milfeddygol, nid wyf wedi ystyried ei dileu ar hyn o bryd. Byddaf yn adolygu'r sefyllfa yn rheolaidd, wrth gwrs, ac yn ceisio cyngor gan filfeddygon.

**Janet Ryder:** Cymeraf y byddwch yn sicrhau, yng ngoleuni'r pwerau iechyd anifeiliaid a gaiff eu datganoli'n fuan, y byddwch yn adolygu'r mesur hwnnw, gan gymryd yn ganiataol bob amser bod yn rhaid i ystyriaethau iechyd y cyhoedd ddod yn gyntaf?

**Carwyn Jones:** Nid wyf am roi'r argraff bod y rheol chwe diwrnod ar fin cael ei newid; nid yw hynny'n wir. Fodd bynnag, byddaf yn ei hystyried yn rheolaidd yn y dyfodol i weld a oes mesurau amgen, er ei bod yn anodd gweld unrhyw rai ar hyn o bryd.

**Glyn Davies:** Lle y gallwch fod yn fodlon bod y defnydd o lociau ynysu, neu systemau ynysu eraill, yn briodol mewn unrhyw fath o fusnes, a ydych yn fodlon ymestyn y defnydd o system o'r fath i gyfyngu'r adegau y defnyddir y rheol chwe diwrnod ar hyn o bryd?

**Carwyn Jones:** Ar hyn o bryd, mae sefyllfaoedd lle y mae lociau ynysu yn briodol. Fodd bynnag, noda'r cyngor milfeddygol a gefais mai'r rheol chwe diwrnod yw'r ffordd fwyaf effeithiol o leihau'r risg o ledaenu clefyd, gan ystyried angen y ffermwyr i allu gweithredu'n fasnachol.

### **Y Cynllun Anifeiliaid Trig The Fallen Stock Scheme**

**C12 Alun Ffred Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y cynnydd parthed y cynllun anifeiliaid trig? OAQ0080(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** Ers iddo gael ei lawnsio ar 22 Tachwedd 2004, mae dros 4,000 o bobl wedi ymuno â'r cynllun. Bu problemau ynglŷn â gweithredu'r cynllun, ac ystyrir y problemau hynny ar hyn o bryd.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Gan gyfeirio at y problemau hynny, pa wybodaeth y mae'r Gweinidog wedi ei derbyn parthed unrhyw

**Q12 Alun Ffred Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on progress on the fallen stock scheme? OAQ0080(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** Since its launch on 22 November 2004, over 4,000 people have joined the scheme. There have been some operational problems, and they are currently under consideration.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** In reference to those problems, what evidence has the Minister received regarding any failure on behalf of

fethiannau gan y cwmni casglu anifeiliaid i'w casglu o fewn y 48 awr sy'n ofynnol, a sut y mae'n bwriadu cywiro'r rhain?

**Carwyn Jones:** Bu problemau yn y Gogledd, oherwydd dim ond un cwmni casglu sydd yno. Deallaf fod y cwmni hwnnw'n ceisio sicrhau bod ganddo fwy o lorïau a phobl. Yn y cyfamser, bu fy swyddogion yn siarad ag Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru ynglŷn â hybu'r cyfleoedd busnes sydd ar gael i gwmnïau yng Nghymru a Lloegr i ddatblygu busnesau i gludo cyrff anifeiliaid oddi ar ffermydd. Cawsom broblem, oherwydd y bu cymaint o alw am y gwasanaeth. Methodd y gwasanaeth ag ymdopi am gyfnod byr, ond bydd modd datrys y broblem honno yn fuan.

**Brynle Williams:** As you are aware, Minister, and as my colleagues have said, there is a problem in north Wales, but it is not unique to north Wales. The 48-hour deadline is a farce, particularly the further west you go. It is more like seven, eight or 10 days, and it is not nice. You mentioned adhering to biosecurity earlier, but that is not happening and stock is left lying about. Will you carefully monitor the situation and provide us with a regular update? This is a serious problem. We are now going into the lambing season, when the problem will be exacerbated a hundredfold.

**Carwyn Jones:** I will, of course, provide the committee with regular updates on the situation.

**Mick Bates:** We are all aware of the disastrous implementation of this fallen-stock collection system. I hate to say it, but many people warned you of the proposal's pitfalls and asked you to investigate other business opportunities, such as on-farm incineration, anaerobic digestion and storage, but that was not done. When will you come forward with practical solutions for those of us who live in remote areas when we have dead stock?

**Carwyn Jones:** Other sectors of industry are expected to find their own solutions. That has not been the case with farming and the

the collection company in collecting fallen stock within the requisite 48 hours, and how does he intend to deal with these problems?

**Carwyn Jones:** There have been problems in north Wales because there is only one collection company. I understand that that company is trying to secure more personnel and lorries. In the meantime, my officials have been in discussion with the Welsh Development Agency regarding the promotion of business opportunities available to companies in Wales and England to develop businesses to carry fallen stock from farms. There has been a problem, because of the great demand for the service. The service could not cope for a short period, but those problems will soon be resolved.

**Brynle Williams:** Fel y gwyddoch, Weinidog, ac fel y dywedodd fy nghyd-Aelodau, mae problem yn y Gogledd, ond nid dim ond yn y Gogledd y'i gwelir. Mae'r terfyn 48 awr yn ffars, yn arbennig os ewch fwyfwy i gyfeiriad y gorllewin. Mae'n fwy fel saith, wyth neu 10 diwrnod, ac nid yw hynny'n ddymunol. Bu ichi gyfeirio at lynu wrth fioggiogelwch yn gynharach, ond nid yw hynny'n digwydd ac mae'r anifeiliaid yn aros i gael eu casglu. A wnewch fonitro'r sefyllfa yn ofalus a rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf inni yn rheolaidd? Mae hon yn broblem ddifrifol. Mae'r tymor wyna ar fin dechrau, pan fydd y broblem ganwaith yn waeth.

**Carwyn Jones:** Byddaf, wrth gwrs, yn rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y sefyllfa i'r pwyllgor yn rheolaidd.

**Mick Bates:** Gwyddom oll am y ffordd ofnadwy y mae'r system casglu anifeiliaid trig hon wedi'i rhoi ar waith. Mae'n gas gennyf ei ddweud, ond bu i lawer o bobl eich rhybuddio am y problemau posibl gan ofyn ichi ymchwilio i gyfleoedd busnes eraill, megis llosgi anifeiliaid ar y fferm, treulio anerobig a storio, ond ni wnaed hynny. Pryd y byddwch yn cyflwyno atebion ymarferol i'r rhai ohonom sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd anghysbell pan fydd anifeiliaid trig gennym?

**Carwyn Jones:** Disgwylir i sectorau diwydiant eraill ddod o hyd i'w hatebion eu hunain. Ni fu hynny'n wir yn achos ffermio

national fallen stock scheme because the scheme has been partly financed from public money in order to provide a service to farmers should they wish to use it. However, if farmers want to group together and have on-farm incineration as an option, that is a matter for them. The fallen stock scheme is not the only option available to farmers in terms of disposing of fallen stock.

a'r cynllun anifeiliaid trig cenedlaethol oherwydd ariannwyd y cynllun yn rhannol gan arian cyhoeddus er mwyn darparu gwasanaeth i ffermwyr pe baent am ei ddefnyddio. Fodd bynnag, os bydd ffermwyr am ddod ynghyd a chreu llosgi ar y fferm yn opsiwn, mater iddynt hwy yw hynny. Nid y cynllun anifeiliaid trig yw'r unig opsiwn sydd ar gael i ffermwyr o ran gwaredu anifeiliaid trig.

### **Polisiau Cynllunio Cyfredol Current Planning Policies**

**Q13 Brynle Williams:** Will the Minister provide an update on current planning policies in Wales? OAQ0107(EPC)

**C13 Brynle Williams:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r diweddaraf am y polisiau cynllunio cyfredol yng Nghymru? OAQ0107(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** Policies are set out in 'Planning Policy Wales', 'Minerals Planning Policy Wales' and the technical advice notes.

**Carwyn Jones:** Nodir polisiau yn 'Polisi Cynllunio Cymru', 'Polisi Cynllunio Mwynau Cymru' a'r nodiadau cyngor technegol.

**Brynle Williams:** Will you ensure that planning proposals are subject to strict controls and that additional consultation guidelines are issued to local authorities, to ensure that consultation with residents is carried out fully and in a proper manner, allowing everyone concerned to voice an opinion?

**Brynle Williams:** A wnewch sicrhau bod cynigion cynllunio yn destun rheolaethau llym ac y cyhoeddir canllawiau ymgynghori ychwanegol i awdurdodau lleol, er mwyn sicrhau y cynhelir ymgynghoriad llawn a phriodol â thrigolion, gan ganiatáu i bawb sy'n gysylltiedig â hyn leisio barn?

**Carwyn Jones:** Local authorities have a statutory obligation to do that and, when the local development plans come into being, local authorities will be required to put together and implement a community involvement scheme in the drawing up of those plans.

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae gan awdurdodau lleol rwymedigaeth statudol i wneud hynny a, phan ddaw'r cynlluniau datblygu lleol i rym, bydd yn ofynnol i awdurdodau lleol lunio a gweithredu cynllun cynnwys y gymuned wrth lunio'r cynlluniau hynny.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Question 14, OAQ0111(EPC), is transferred for written answer.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae cwestiwn 14, OAQ0111(EPC), wedi'i drosglwyddo i'w ateb yn ysgrifenedig.

### **Gwastraff Peryglus Hazardous Waste**

**Q15 Mark Isherwood:** Will the Minister make a statement on hazardous waste? OAQ0120(EPC)

**C15 Mark Isherwood:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar wastraff peryglus? OAQ0120(EPC)

**Carwyn Jones:** The regulations passed last year have an effect in terms of disposing of hazardous waste, and the new regulations, if

**Carwyn Jones:** Caiff y rheoliadau a basiwyd y llynedd effaith o ran gwaredu gwastraff peryglus, a bydd y rheoliadau newydd, os a



and when they are passed this summer, will change the nature of the substances and how they are classified.

**Mark Isherwood:** That is exactly right, Minister, so how do you respond to the statement issued by the Institute of Civil Engineers that problems with managing hazardous waste in Wales have now reached epic proportions because measures were not put in place to deal with the legislation that we knew was coming in last July?

**Carwyn Jones:** There are no difficulties that I can see in terms of hazardous waste disposal. I have received no representations on this issue. Hazardous waste disposal sites are available across the border—the nearest one to here is in Swindon—but we hope to see more such facilities available in Wales. Indeed, an Objective 1 project has been proposed to do just that.

phryd y cânt eu pasio yn yr haf, yn newid natur y sylweddau a sut y cânt eu categoreiddio.

**Mark Isherwood:** Mae hynny'n fanwl gywir, Weinidog, felly sut yr ymatebwch i'r datganiad a gyhoeddwyd gan Sefydliad y Peirianwyr Sifil yn nodi ein bod bellach yn wynebu problemau anferth o ran rheoli gwastraff peryglus yng Nghymru am na roddwyd mesurau ar waith i ymdrin â'r ddeddfwriaeth a gyflwynwyd fis Gorffennaf diwethaf, a hynny'n hysbys inni?

**Carwyn Jones:** Nid oes unrhyw anawsterau y gallaf eu gweld o ran gwaredu gwastraff peryglus. Ni chefais unrhyw sylwadau ar y mater hwn. Mae safleoedd gwaredu gwastraff peryglus ar gael ar draws y ffin—mae'r un agosaf yn Swindon—ond gobeithiwn weld mwy o gyfleusterau o'r fath yng Nghymru. Yn wir, mae prosiect Amcan 1 wedi'i gynnig i wneud hynny'n union.

### **Y Swyddfa Gyfathrebu The Office of Communications**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1 and 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams, and amendments 3, 4, 5, 6 and 7 in the name of David Melding.

**The Minister for Economic Development and Transport (Andrew Davies):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales believes that public-service broadcasting in Welsh and English plays a vital role in Wales today and needs to be maintained and strengthened into the digital future. (NNDM2321)*

Public-service broadcasting has a crucial role to play in Wales, and this debate has been tabled in recognition of that. This is an exciting time of change for broadcasting, and much activity is under way. First, we are moving towards all-digital television, secondly, the Office of Communications is consulting on phase 3 of its public-service broadcasting review and, today, the UK Government published its Green Paper on the review of the BBC's royal charter, which is

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams, a gwelliannau 3, 4, 5, 6 a 7 yn enw David Melding.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth (Andrew Davies):** Cynigiad fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn credu bod gan ddarlledu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yn Gymraeg ac yn Saesneg rôl allweddol yng Nghymru heddiw a bod angen ei gynnal a'i gryfhau ar gyfer y dyfodol digidol. (NNDM2321)*

Mae gan ddarlledu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus ran allweddol i'w chwarae yng Nghymru, a chyflwynwyd y ddadl hon er mwyn cydnabod hynny. Mae darlledu yn wynebu cyfnod cyffrous o newid, ac mae llawer o weithgarwch ar droed. Yn gyntaf, yr ydym yn symud tuag at deledu cwbl ddigidol, yn ail, mae'r Swyddfa Gyfathrebu yn ymgynghori ynglŷn â cham 3 o'i hadolygiad o ddarlledu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus a, heddiw, cyhoeddodd Llywodraeth y DU ei Phapur

now being published for consultation. All of these significant developments will help to shape broadcasting in Wales for many years to come.

3.00 p.m.

Although broadcasting, in policy terms, is technically a non-devolved matter, it is, as the motion suggests, a vital issue, not only to everyone in the Chamber, but to everyone in Wales. Broadcasting is one of our most fast-changing sectors, and that change is driven not just by the adaptation of new technologies, but by the convergence of those very technologies. It is change that will affect us here in Wales, as it will people globally. It is also a change that we seek to influence, because broadcasting and the wider creative industry sector is of fundamental importance to us. It is important not only socially and culturally, but economically, which is why, in the true spirit of joined-up government, both Alun Pugh and I are participating in today's debate. Alun will cover the amendments and respond to the debate in his summing up. In opening this debate, I will focus primarily on the economic and creative industries aspect.

Broadcasting, alongside the development of our creative industries, has a vital role to play in an economically prosperous, as well as a culturally and socially confident and diverse, Wales. It is a sector whose development and growth can be a key factor in our continued transformation to a high-value economy, driven by knowledge, innovation, and, above all, creativity, for which the Welsh people are famous. The big broadcasting organisations, BBC Wales, ITV Wales and S4C have a role to play, as do the smaller independent, innovative producers, such as Tinopolis, Green Bay Media Ltd and Boomerang, and I was delighted to see the merger between Boomerang, Ffilmiau Fflic and Alfresco recently, into a new £10 million independent production company. These companies are all part and parcel of a strong sector, capable of competing and winning for Wales. However, if we are to punch above our weight as a country and as an economy, then our

Gwyrdd ar yr adolygiad o siarter frenhinol y BBC, a gyhoeddir yn awr ar gyfer ymgynghoriad. Bydd pob un o'r datblygiadau arwyddocaol hyn yn helpu i lunio darlledu yng Nghymru am flynyddoedd lawer i ddod.

Er nad yw darlledu, o ran polisi, yn fater a ddatganolwyd yn dechnegol, fel yr awgryma'r cynnig, mae'n fater allweddol, nid yn unig i bawb yn y Siambr, ond i bawb yng Nghymru. Mae darlledu yn un o'r sectorau sy'n newid gyflymaf, ac mae'r newid hwnnw yn cael ei ysgogi nid yn unig gan addasu technolegau newydd, ond gan gydyfeirio'r union dechnolegau hynny. Mae'n newid a fydd yn effeithio arnom ni yma yng Nghymru, fel y bydd yn effeithio ar bobl ledled y byd. Mae'n newid hefyd yr ydym yn ceisio dylanwadu arno, oherwydd mae darlledu a sector y diwydiannau creadigol ehangach yn hollbwysig inni. Mae'n bwysig nid yn unig yn gymdeithasol ac yn ddiwylliannol, ond yn economaidd, a dyna pam, yng ngwir ysbryd llywodraeth gydgysylltiedig, y mae Alun Pugh a minnau yn cymryd rhan yn y ddadl heddiw. Bydd Alun yn trafod y gwelliannau ac yn ymateb i'r ddadl wrth grynhoi. Wrth agor y ddadl hon, canolbwyntiaf innau ar y diwydiannau economaidd a chreadigol yn bennaf.

Mae gan ddarlledu, ochr yn ochr â datblygiad ein diwydiannau creadigol, ran hollbwysig i'w chwarae mewn gwlad sy'n llewyrchus yn economaidd, yn ogystal ag yn ddiwylliannol ac yn gymdeithasol hyderus ac amrywiol. Mae'n sector y gall ei ddatblygiad a'i dwf fod yn ffactor allweddol yn y broses o barhau i drawsnewid ein heconomi yn economi â gwerth uchel wedi'i hysgogi gan wybodaeth, arloesedd, ac, yn anad dim, creadigrwydd, y mae pobl Cymru yn enwog amdano. Mae gan y sefydliadau darlledu mawr, BBC Cymru, ITV Wales a S4C ran i'w chwarae, fel sydd gan y cynhyrchwyr arloesol, annibynnol llai, megis Tinopolis, Green Bay Media Cyf a Boomerang, ac yr oeddwn yn falch o weld bod Boomerang, Ffilmiau Fflic ac Alfresco wedi uno'n gwmmi cynhyrchu annibynnol newydd gwerth £10 miliwn yn ddiweddar. Mae'r cwmmiau hyn oll yn rhan o sector cadarn, sy'n gallu cystadlu ac ennill dros Gymru. Fodd bynnag, os ydym yn mynd i

independent production companies in particular need the chance to take full advantage of the commercial opportunities available from UK broadcasting companies.

Currently, we provide just 1 per cent of UK television network production, yet we make up 5 per cent of the UK population. There is a strong case for us to have a share of network production commensurate with our population share, if not greater than it. That is why I recently called upon the broadcasting industry to urgently consider introducing a system of quotas for independent production companies in Wales, and it is also why I so warmly welcomed Ofcom's recent announcement on its public-service broadcasting consultation. This is a sector that we must take seriously, and, in many ways, it is the focal point of our creative industry strategy. That strategy was developed in close consultation with the industry, and it was designed to help our creative industries to create, retain and exploit their intellectual property. The strategy was the subject of a Plenary debate only a few weeks ago, so I will not go into detail, other than to say that our approach is four-pronged. First, we will introduce a £7 million creative intellectual property fund. Secondly, we will deliver more strategic investments in Wales based on our creative industries. Thirdly, we will adopt a new strategic approach to providing business support to the creative industries sector—one is currently being taken forward by the Welsh Development Agency—and, fourthly, we will refocus training and education for those in the industry itself. This approach has been well received by the industry, and I am encouraged by what I have heard at the meetings that I have held with BBC Wales, S4C, ITV Wales and last, but by no means least, Ofcom.

Our starting point is that we have always been, and continue to be, a creative country and a creative people. We must make more of that creative talent for our economic benefit; we must retain that talent in Wales and make the most of its potential for further job and

fod yn ddylanwadol fel gwlad ac fel economi, yna mae angen i'n cwmnïau cynhyrchu annibynnol yn arbennig gael y cyfle i fanteisio i'r eithaf ar y cyfleoedd masnachol sydd ar gael gan gwmnïau darlledu'r DU.

Ar hyn o bryd, dim ond 1 y cant o raglenni rhwydwaith teledu'r DU a ddarparwn, ac eto yr ydym yn cyfrif am 5 y cant o boblogaeth y DU. Mae dadl gref dros ddweud y dylem gael cyfran o raglenni rhwydwaith sy'n gymesur â'n cyfran o'r boblogaeth, os nad mwy na hynny. Dyna pam y gelwais ar y diwydiant darlledu yn ddiweddar i ystyried ar fyrder gyflwyno system o gwotâu ar gyfer cwmnïau cynhyrchu annibynnol yng Nghymru, a dyna pam hefyd y croesewais yn gynnes gyhoeddiad diweddar Ofcom ar ei hymgyngoriad ar ddarlledu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus. Mae hwn yn sector y mae'n rhaid inni ei gymryd o ddifrif, ac mewn sawl ffordd, mae'n ganolbwynt i'n strategaeth ar gyfer y diwydiannau creadigol. Datblygwyd y strategaeth honno mewn ymgyngoriad agos â'r diwydiant, a'i nod oedd helpu ein diwydiannau creadigol i greu, cadw ac ymwela ar eu heiddo deallusol. Cynhaliwyd dadl mewn Cyfarfod Llawn ar y strategaeth dim ond ychydig wythnosau yn ôl, felly ni fanylaf arni, heblaw am ddweud bod pedair elfen iddi. Yn gyntaf, byddwn yn cyflwyno cronfa eiddo deallusol creadigol gwerth £7 miliwn. Yn ail, byddwn yn sicrhau mwy o fuddsoddiadau strategol yng Nghymru yn seiliedig ar ein diwydiannau creadigol. Yn drydydd, byddwn yn mabwysiadu ymagwedd strategol newydd tuag at roi cymorth busnes i sector y diwydiannau creadigol—mae Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru yn datblygu menter ar hyn o bryd—ac, yn bedwerydd, byddwn yn rhoi ffocws newydd i hyfforddiant ac addysg i'r rhai yn y diwydiant ei hun. Mae'r diwydiant wedi croesawu'r ymagwedd hon, ac fe'm calonogir gan yr hyn yr wyf wedi'i glywed yn y cyfarfodydd a gynhelias â BBC Cymru, S4C, ITV Wales ac yn olaf, ond yn llawn cyn bwysiced, Ofcom.

Ein man cychwyn yw ein bod erioed wedi bod yn wlad greadigol ac yn bobl greadigol, fel yr ydym o hyd. Rhaid inni wneud mwy o ddefnydd o'r dalent greadigol honno er ein lles economaidd; rhaid inni gadw'r dalent honno yng Nghymru a gwneud y defnydd

wealth creation. Our creative industry strategy will equip us to do just that. The strategy is targeted at the sector, but it complements our activities across the economic development and transport portfolio, in building an environment where high-skill, knowledge-driven, innovative sectors, such as broadcasting and the wider creative industries, can grow, prosper and win for Wales.

Broadcasting plays a vital role in modern Wales, but we should continue to strengthen and exploit its contribution to the economy. That is precisely what I believe we are doing and why I ask you to support the motion this afternoon.

*Daeth Christine Gwyther i'r Gadair am 3.05 p.m.  
Christine Gwyther took the Chair at 3.05 p.m.*

**Eleanor Burnham:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 1: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure that there is comprehensive digital coverage throughout the whole of Wales when the analogue signal is switched off and that no-one is socially excluded by prohibitive cost.*

I propose amendment 2. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls for a Welsh representative on the Ofcom executive committee to help ensure the very best digital future for Wales.*

The switch-over from analogue to digital will radically alter the landscape of broadcasting. It will change delivery, content and how people access and use the services available to them. Wales has not always been best served by analogue, with certain areas unable to receive analogue signals, and others, such as my region of north-east Wales, receiving English regional TV signals. It is important to secure the very best digital future for Wales.

The Liberal Democrats' amendment 1

mwyaf ohoni er mwyn creu mwy o swyddi a chyfoeth. Bydd strategaeth y diwydiannau creadigol yn ein helpu i wneud hynny. Mae'r strategaeth wedi'i thargedu at y sector, ond mae'n ategu ein gweithgareddau ar draws y portffolio datblygu economaidd a thrafnidiaeth, gan greu amgylchedd lle y gall sectorau arloesol lle y ceir sgiliau uwch ac sydd wedi'u hysgogi gan wybodaeth, megis darlledu, a'r diwydiannau creadigol ehangach, dyfu, ffynnu ac ennill dros Gymru.

Mae darlledu yn chwarae rhan hollbwysig yn y Gymru gyfoes, ond dylem barhau i atgyfnerthu ac ymelwa ar ei gyfraniad i'r economi. Dyna'n union yr ydym yn ei wneud yn fy marn i, a dyna pam y gofynnaf ichi gefnogi'r cynnig y prynhawn yma.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 1: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau bod gwasanaeth digidol cynhwysfawr ledled Cymru gyfan pan fydd yr signal analog yn cael ei ddiffodd ac nad oes neb yn cael ei gau allan yn gymdeithasol oherwydd y gost uchel.*

Cynigiau welliant 2. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw am gynrychiolydd o Gymru ar bwyllgor gweithredol Ofcom i helpu i sicrhau'r dyfodol digidol gorau i Gymru.*

Bydd y newid o analog i ddigidol yn trawsnewid byd darlledu. Bydd yn newid y ffordd y darperir gwasanaethau, cynnwys gwasanaethau a'r ffordd y mae pobl yn cael ac yn defnyddio'r gwasanaethau sydd ar gael iddynt. Nid yw Cymru bob amser wedi cael gwasanaeth da drwy analog, gyda rhai ardaloedd yn methu â derbyn signalau analog, ac eraill, megis fy rhanbarth i, sef y Gogledd-ddwyrain, yn cael signalau teledu o ranbarthau Lloegr. Mae'n bwysig sicrhau'r dyfodol digidol gorau i Gymru.

Mae gwelliant 1 y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol

highlights social exclusion. The switch-over from analogue to digital raises two major concerns—geographical and financial accessibility. It is essential that the switch-over does not exclude anyone on the grounds of where they live, or on the grounds of cost, and coverage must be comprehensive—and I mean ‘comprehensive’. It must be 100 per cent coverage, rather than the 90-whatever per cent that is talked about, because that would mean that there would still be pockets of people unable to get access.

Digital satellite technology offers the ability to ensure that people in geographically remote areas are able to access digital television. Digital terrestrial television currently reaches only 50 per cent of the population in Wales, as the topography does not lend itself easily to transmission of digital terrestrial television. Digital satellite technology, however, offers near complete coverage. A free satellite service is a realistic alternative option: digital satellite transmission can reach 98 per cent the population of Wales, and it could provide an ideal substitute for Freeview, as it would allow almost complete coverage without viewers having to pay a subscription fee.

Our amendment 2 calls for a Welsh representative on the Ofcom executive committee to help ensure the very best digital future for Wales. I believe that this is a key part of achieving an effective voice for Wales in the future of broadcasting, taking into account Wales’s particular interests, especially the Welsh language. After all, Wales has specific linguistic and cultural needs, which require greater advocacy and representation than I believe they currently receive. The digital age offers an opportunity to achieve greater choice and to deliver a system that takes into account people’s needs and preferences.

Welsh news and current affairs are an important aspect of keeping people informed of what is happening in Wales, in the Assembly, and in Welsh politics, particularly given the absence of an all-Wales daily newspaper. Together with Welsh non-news programmes, they are a vital part of Welsh cultural identity for many people. Welsh-content programming must be maintained.

yn amlygu allgáu cymdeithasol. Mae’r newid o analog i ddigidol yn codi dau bryder mawr—hygyrchedd yn ddaeryddol ac yn ariannol. Mae’n hanfodol na fydd neb yn methu â chael gwasanaeth ar sail lle y maent yn byw, neu ar sail cost, yn sgîl y newid, a rhaid i’r darlledu gyrraedd pawb—a golygaf ‘bawb’. Rhaid iddo gyrraedd pawb, yn hytrach na’r 90 y cant a rhywbeth y soniwyd amdani, oherwydd golygai hynny y byddai ardaloedd o hyd lle na all pobl gael gwasanaeth.

Mae technoleg lloeren ddigidol yn ei gwneud yn bosibl i sicrhau bod pobl mewn ardaloedd anghysbell yn gallu cael teledu digidol. Dim ond 50 y cant o boblogaeth Cymru sy’n gallu derbyn teledu daearol digidol ar hyn o bryd, gan nad yw’n hawdd darlledu teledu daearol digidol oherwydd y topograffi. Fodd bynnag, gyda thechnoleg lloeren ddigidol, bydd modd cyrraedd bron pawb. Mae gwasanaeth lloeren am ddim yn ddewis amgen realistig: bydd yn bosibl i ddarllediadau lloeren digidol gyrraedd 98 y cant o boblogaeth Cymru, a gallai fod yn ddewis amgen delfrydol yn lle Freeview, gan y byddai’n bosibl darlledu i bron pawb heb i wylwyr orfod talu ffi danysgrifio.

Mae ein gwelliant 2 yn galw am gynrychiolydd o Gymru ar bwyllgor gweithredol Ofcom er mwyn helpu i sicrhau’r dyfodol digidol gorau i Gymru. Credaf fod hyn yn rhan allweddol o sicrhau llais effeithiol dros Gymru ar ddyfodol darlledu, gan ystyried buddiannau penodol Cymru, yn enwedig y Gymraeg. Wedi’r cyfan, mae gan Gymru anghenion ieithyddol a diwylliannol penodol, sy’n gofyn am fwy o eiriolaeth a chynrychiolaeth nag a gânt ar hyn o bryd, yn fy marn i. Mae’r oes ddigidol yn gyfle i roi mwy o ddewis a chyflwyno system sy’n ystyried anghenion a dymuniadau pobl.

Mae rhaglenni newyddion a materion cyfoes Cymreig yn agwedd bwysig ar roi gwybod i bobl beth sy’n digwydd yng Nghymru, yn y Cynulliad, ac yng ngwleidyddiaeth Cymru, yn enwedig gan nad oes papur newydd dyddiol i Gymru gyfan. Ynghyd â’r rhaglenni Cymreig eraill, maent yn rhan hollbwysig o hunaniaeth ddiwylliannol Cymru i lawer o bobl. Rhaid cadw rhaglenni ag iddynt

gynnwys Cymreig.

There is continued public support for public-service broadcasting. The BBC remains the cornerstone of public-service broadcasting. It is widely recognised to be of a consistently high quality, and is much admired throughout the world. Its news coverage is regarded as being reliable, responsible, trustworthy and independent. It is essential to maintain that in the face of the digital future, which will bring with it greater choice and plurality. As part of this, the needs of Wales as a nation, and the need for a vibrant public-service broadcasting service for the people of Wales, must be recognised and taken into account by Ofcom.

Having said that, I agree with Tessa Jowell in today's Green Paper that we want to keep the BBC strong, while ensuring that it does not become over-mighty in its dealing with the wider market. Consequently, S4C should have editorial management to reduce any monopolistic tendencies, and to counter the lack of an all-Wales newspaper.

Credaf hefyd y dylai'r BBC sicrhau gwell darpariaeth yng ngogledd-ddwyrain Cymru drwy stiwdio mwy addas na'r un sydd ar gael ar hyn o bryd yn yr Wyddgrug. Dylai'r BBC hefyd ddatrys y problemau technegol yn ardal Wrecsam, sydd yn golygu, ac efallai fydd yn golygu, nad yw bobl yr ardal yn derbyn rhaglenni am Gymru ac yn y Gymraeg fel eu bod yn ymwybodol o faterion Cymreig, ac yn gwybod am y Cynulliad a sut y mae'n dylanwadu ar eu bywydau.

In this complex and constantly changing arena, it is vital that the Welsh Assembly Government continues to lobby Westminster to ensure that Welsh needs are fully catered for. ITV Wales's continued programming commitment should be part of this bigger picture, particularly as it might retreat even further, which is of great concern to us, as well as to the smaller, independent producers that are so important to the Welsh economy in Gwynedd, in my region, and other parts of Wales.

3.10 p.m.

Can the Minister give an assurance that the

Mae cefnogaeth o hyd ymhlith y cyhoedd i ddarlledu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus. Erys y BBC yn gonglfaen darlledu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus. Cydnabyddir yn gyffredinol ei fod o safon gyson dda, ac fe'i hedmygir yn fawr ledled y byd. Credir bod ei raglenni newyddion yn ddibynadwy, yn gyfrifol, yn gywir ac yn annibynnol. Mae'n hanfodol cadw hynny yn wyneb y dyfodol digidol, a fydd yn dod â mwy o ddewis ac amrywiaeth. Fel rhan o hyn, rhaid i Ofcom gydnabod ac ystyried anghenion Cymru fel cenedl, a'r angen am wasanaeth darlledu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus bywiog i bobl Cymru.

Wedi dweud hynny, cytunaf â Tessa Jowell yn y Papur Gwyrdd heddiw ein bod am gadw'r BBC yn gryf, tra'n sicrhau nad yw'n mynd yn rhy bwerus yn ei ymwneud â'r farchnad ehangach. O ganlyniad, dylai fod gan S4C reolaeth olygyddol er mwyn lleihau unrhyw dueddiadau monopolistaidd, ac i wrthbwysu'r ffaith nad oes papur newydd i Gymru gyfan.

I also believe that the BBC should ensure improved provision in north-east Wales, by providing a more appropriate studio than that currently available in Mold. The BBC should also solve the technical problems in the Wrexham area, which mean, and may continue to mean, that people there do not receive programmes about Wales and in Welsh that would keep them abreast of Welsh affairs, and proceedings in the Assembly and how they influence their lives.

Yn y maes cymhleth hwn sy'n newid o hyd, mae'n hollbwysig bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn parhau i lobio San Steffan er mwyn sicrhau y caiff anghenion Cymru eu diwallu'n llawn. Dylai ymrwymiad parhaus ITV Wales o ran rhaglenni fod yn rhan o'r darlun ehangach hwn, yn enwedig am y gallai gilio eto, sydd o bryder mawr i ni, yn ogystal ag i'r cynhyrchwyr annibynnol llai sydd mor bwysig i economi Cymru yng Ngwynedd, yn fy rhanbarth i, ac mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru.

A all y Gweinidog roi sicrwydd y bydd

Welsh Assembly Government will do its utmost to keep the public fully informed of broadcasting options? In this complex arena, that is vital. I also ask the Minister to ensure that the poorer and the disadvantaged are helped to afford access to this exciting broadcasting future.

**Lisa Francis:** I propose the following amendments in the name of David Melding. Amendment 3: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*the National Assembly believes that Ofcom's phase 3 recommendations will need careful review and amendment if they are not to compromise aspects of public-service broadcasting in Wales.*

I propose amendment 4. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*the National Assembly notes the contribution made by TV and film production to the development of the Welsh economy and believes that reforms to public-service broadcasting must seek to build on this success.*

I propose amendment 5. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*the National Assembly for Wales acknowledges the vital role S4C has played in Welsh language television in Wales and recognises the need to safeguard, protect and enhance Welsh language broadcasting.*

I propose amendment 6. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*the National Assembly for Wales recognises the need to make strong representations to Ofcom to maintain a vibrant ITV Wales which is capable of delivering comprehensive news services and non-news programming.*

I propose amendment 7. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*the National Assembly believes that a*

Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gwneud ei gorau glas i roi'r holl wybodaeth ddiweddaraf ynghylch opsiynau darlledu i'r cyhoedd? Yn y maes cymhleth hwn, mae hynny yn hollbwysig. Gofynnaf hefyd i'r Gweinidog sicrhau y caiff pobl dlawd a difreintiedig gymorth i allu fforddio bod yn rhan o'r dyfodol darlledu cyffrous hwn.

**Lisa Francis:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw David Melding. Gwelliant 3: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn credu y bydd angen edrych yn ofalus ar argymhellion Cam 3 Ofcom a'u diwygio yn ofalus os na fwriedir iddynt gyfaddawdu agweddau ar ddarlledu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.*

Cynigiau welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn nodi'r cyfraniad sydd wedi'i wneud gan gynhyrchu ym maes y teledu a ffilmiau at economi Cymru ac yn credu bod rhaid i ddiwygiadau i ddarlledu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus adeiladu ar y llwyddiant hwn.*

Cynigiau welliant 5. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn cydnabod y rôl allweddol y mae S4C wedi'i chwarae o ran teledu cyfrwng Cymraeg yng Nghymru ac yn cydnabod yr angen i ddiogelu, amddiffyn a gwella darlledu trwy'r Gymraeg.*

Cynigiau welliant 6. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn cydnabod yr angen i gyflwyno sylwadau cryf i Ofcom er mwyn cadw ITV Cymru fywiog sy'n gallu cynhyrchu gwasanaethau newyddion cynhwysfawr a hefyd raglenni nad ydynt yn rhaglenni newyddion.*

Cynigiau welliant 7. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn credu y*

*designated public-service publisher in Wales would be beneficial given the devolved nature of much of Welsh public life.*

The only thing that we can guarantee about the future of broadcasting is that things will change, especially in Wales, where viewers have gone digital in droves, compared to the rest of the UK, and well before the anticipated big switch-over of 2012.

The motion being put forward by the Government today will not brook any opposition, I am sure. It is broad in its call for support for broadcasting in Wales, and is both innocuous and benign. However, the painting of such a rosy picture in today's broadcasting garden does not mean that we should not continue to keep a careful and close eye on potential future developments in Wales.

In respect of amendment 4, Ofcom's recommendations for ITV Wales may well recognise Wales's nationhood, and that ITV Wales is a provider of national broadcasting, as we have seen Ofcom call for a £9 million fund for out-of-London production, which, hopefully, means that ITV will produce more quality programmes for the nations and regions. However, it cannot be denied that the cut suggested by Ofcom in relation to ITV Wales's non-news output—albeit that it is a small cut at the moment—to four hours and later to three hours per week, represents a real threat to the wealth of broadcasting talent in Wales, which Andrew Davies outlined earlier. There is a fear that this pruning represents the thin end of the wedge, and may result in job losses at ITV Wales, which, in turn, could affect the economic viability of that company and impact upon what it produces for other companies in the future.

After digital switch-over, I am concerned that the fact that a core regional news service will only be maintained if it is 'financially sustainable'—whatever that means—could be interpreted as its potential long-term demise. Ofcom has yet to define what it means by 'financially sustainable'. In a country where there is an absence of widely-read Welsh daily newspapers, we cannot

*byddai Cyhoeddwr Gwasanaeth Cyhoeddus dynodedig yng Nghymru o fudd o gofio natur ddatganoledig rhannau helaeth o fywyd cyhoeddus Cymru.*

Yr unig beth sy'n sicr ynglŷn â dyfodol darlledu yw y bydd pethau'n newid, yn enwedig yng Nghymru, lle y mae gwylwyr wedi mynd yn ddigidol wrth eu miloedd, o gymharu â gweddill y DU, ac ymhell cyn y newid mawr a ddisgwyllir yn 2012.

Ni wiw gwrthwynebu'r cynnig a gyflwynwyd gan y Llywodraeth heddiw, mae'n siŵr gennyf. Cyffredinol ydyw o ran galw am gefnogaeth i ddarlledu yng Nghymru, mae'n ffafriol ac ni fydd yn digio neb. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r ffaith ei bod yn gweld popeth yn hyfryd yn mynd darlledu heddiw yn golygu na ddylem ddal i gadw llygad barcud ar ddatblygiadau posibl yn y dyfodol yng Nghymru.

O ran gwelliant 4, mae'n ddigon posibl bod argymhellion Ofcom ar gyfer ITV Wales yn cydnabod bod Cymru yn genedl, a bod ITV Wales yn darparu rhaglenni cenedlaethol, gan eu bod wedi gweld Ofcom yn galw am gronfa o £9 miliwn ar gyfer cynhyrchu rhaglenni y tu allan i Lundain, a olyga, gobeithio, y bydd ITV yn cynhyrchu mwy o raglenni o safon i'r cenhedloedd a'r rhanbarthau. Fodd bynnag, ni ellir gwadu bod y toriad a awgrymir gan Ofcom o ran rhaglenni ITV Wales nad ydynt yn rhaglenni newyddion—er un bach ydyw ar hyn o bryd—i bedair awr ac yna i dair awr yr wythnos, yn fygythiad gwirioneddol i'r cyfoeth o dalent ddarlledu sydd yng Nghymru, fel y nododd Andrew Davies yn gynharach. Ofnir mai dim ond dechreuad yw'r toriadau hyn, ac mae'n bosibl y caiff swyddi eu colli yn ITV Wales, a allai, yn ei dro, effeithio ar hyfywedd economaidd y cwmni hwnnw a'r hyn a gynhyrcha i gwmnïau eraill yn y dyfodol.

Ar ôl y newid i ddigidol, pryderaf y gellid dehongli'r ffaith mai dim ond os yw gwasanaeth newyddion rhanbarthol craidd yn 'ariannol gynaliadwy'—beth bynnag yw ystyr hynny—y bydd yn parhau bod posibilrwydd y gall ddod i ben yn yr hirdymor. Nid yw Ofcom wedi pennu beth yw 'ariannol gynaliadwy' eto. Mewn gwlad lle nad oes papurau newydd dyddiol Cymreig



afford to lose that news service.

In the course of this debate, we must not lose sight of the implications for the future of Welsh-language broadcasting. During the past 20 years, S4C has helped to create a diverse production base, with some 80 per cent of its programmes coming from independent companies, for which a new £1 million development fund was set up by S4C. This coincided with the Assembly administration's £7 million creative industries fund. Therefore, it could not be a more timely reaction to S4C's vision of a future where strong creative industries compete in Wales and the wider marketplace.

Central to the vision for its development as a powerhouse for creative excellence is the need to realise the potential of the independent sector. In order to retain its strength and diversity, S4C will probably need to have greater editorial control, in terms of its relationship with the BBC, over what is commissioned, and how it is commissioned. The 'modernisation', as it has been called, of the relationship between S4C and the BBC should also include explicit service agreements and financial arrangements for S4C. That in no way means that S4C should be taken over by the BBC, but, because the two organisations share a common history, it is common sense that there are worthwhile aspects that can be built upon in that regard.

While decisions on the future of S4C will be taken by Whitehall, we cannot ignore the fact that Ofcom's recommendations are likely to be highly influential. We also cannot ignore the fact that the regulator will consult on its ideas until 19 April, and that the situation is ever-changing. That is why this debate is important as a vehicle for those of us who feel that we need to continue to voice our concerns over the future of broadcasting in Wales.

**Rosemary Butler:** I agree with Andrew Davies that this is an important time for the broadcasting industry, particularly with the publication today of the Green Paper on the

a ddarllenir yn eang, ni allwn fforddio colli'r gwasanaeth newyddion hwnnw.

Yn ystod y ddadl hon, rhaid inni beidio â cholli golwg o'r goblygiadau i ddyfodol darlledu cyfrwng Cymraeg. Dros y 20 mlynedd diwethaf, mae S4C wedi helpu i greu sylfaen gynhyrchu amrywiol, gyda thua 80 y cant o'i raglenni yn dod o gwmnïau annibynnol, y sefydlodd S4C gronfa ddatblygu newydd gwerth £1 filiwn ar eu cyfer. Cyd-darodd hyn â chronfa gweinyddiaeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer y diwydiannau creadigol gwerth £7 miliwn. Felly, ni allai fod yn ymateb mwy amserol i weledigaeth S4C o ddyfodol lle y mae diwydiannau creadigol cryf yn cystadlu yng Nghymru ac yn y farchnad ehangach.

Wrth wraidd y weledigaeth ar gyfer ei ddatblygiad fel pwerdy ar gyfer rhagoriaeth greadigol mae'r angen i wireddu potensial y sector annibynnol. Er mwyn cadw ei gryfder a'i amrywiaeth, bydd angen i S4C gael mwy o reolaeth olygyddol yn fwy na thebyg, o ran ei berthynas â'r BBC, ynghylch beth a gomisiynir, a sut y'i comisiynir. Dylai'r broses o 'foderneiddio' y berthynas rhwng S4C a'r BBC, fel y cyfeiriwyd ati, hefyd gynnwys cytundebau gwasanaeth a threfniadau ariannol penodol i S4C. Nid yw hynny'n golygu ar unrhyw gyfrif y dylai BBC feddiannu S4C, ond, gan fod hanes cyffredin i'r ddau sefydliad, mae'n synnwyr cyffredin bod agweddau buddiol y gellir adeiladu arnynt yn hynny o beth.

Er mai yn Whitehall y caiff penderfyniadau ar ddyfodol S4C eu gwneud, ni allwn anwybyddu'r ffaith bod argymhellion Ofcom yn debygol o fod yn ddylanwadol iawn. Ni allwn anwybyddu'r ffaith ychwaith y bydd y rheoleiddiwr yn ymgynghori ynglŷn â'i syniadau tan 19 Ebrill, a bod y sefyllfa yn newid o hyd. Dyna pam y mae'r ddadl hon yn bwysig fel cyfrwng i'r rhai ohonom sy'n teimlo bod angen inni barhau i fynegi ein pryderon ynglŷn â dyfodol darlledu yng Nghymru.

**Rosemary Butler:** Cytunaf ag Andrew Davies fod hwn yn gyfnod pwysig i'r diwydiant darlledu, yn enwedig yn sgîl cyhoeddi'r Papur Gwyrdd heddiw ar

future of the BBC. It is worth reminding ourselves of the importance of public-service broadcasting in Wales, and, indeed, across the world.

I was reminded of this recently when I saw the Welsh-language website BBC Cymru'r Byd. There is a new, and very clever, piece of software on this site that enables people like me, at the click of a button, to get an English translation. The name of the site is also important: it means 'Wales of the world'. It makes a connection between the people of Wales and international events and issues, all at the click of a button. The same button will also give the television viewers of the future access to hundreds of channels and interactive services that no-one could have imagined a few years ago.

Nearly 23 years ago—and there are a number of us here who will remember this event—[*Interruption.*] Janice Gregory is too young. Nearly 23 years ago, S4C was established as a single channel for television programmes in Welsh. Since then, it has established itself as a successful analogue broadcaster, with a brand name that is recognised across the world. One reason for this success has been the guaranteed supply of high-quality programmes from the BBC, around which S4C has been able to build its programme schedule. Like S4C, the BBC has an obligation, as a public-service broadcaster, to provide programmes in Welsh. Radio Cymru seems to go from strength to strength, and is attracting younger listeners. The BBC's programmes on S4C are among its most popular. *Pobol y Cwm* is the most popular Welsh programme, dare I say, in the whole world. Another benefit of this relationship is that S4C gets its news service from the BBC—a benefit that many broadcasters around the world would envy I am sure.

The recent Ofcom discussion about the future of S4C has raised questions about the future of BBC programmes on the channel. There is a danger that taking the wrong decision at this crucial time could threaten this successful model of collaboration, and weaken Wales's position in digital broadcasting in both languages. I agree that the unique partnership between the BBC and

ddyfodol y BBC. Mae'n werth atgoffa ein hunain o bwysigrwydd darlledu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, ac, yn wir, ledled y byd.

Fe'm hatgoffwyd o hynny yn ddiweddar pan welais wefan Gymraeg y BBC, sef Cymru'r Byd. Ar y wefan hon mae darn o feddalwedd newydd, a chlyfar iawn, sy'n galluogi pobl fel minnau, o wasgu botwm, i gael cyfieithiad Saesneg. Mae enw'r wefan yn bwysig hefyd: Cymru'r byd. Mae'n cysylltu pobl Cymru â digwyddiadau a materion rhyngwladol, dim ond drwy wasgu botwm. Bydd yr un botwm hefyd yn ei gwneud yn bosibl i wylwyr teledu y dyfodol weld cannoedd o sianeli a gwasanaethau rhyngweithiol na allai neb fod wedi'u dychmygu ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl.

Bron 23 mlynedd yn ôl—a bydd sawl un ohonom yma yn cofio'r digwyddiad hwn—[*Torri ar draws.*] Mae Janice Gregory yn rhy ifanc. Bron 23 mlynedd yn ôl, sefydlwyd S4C fel un sianel ar gyfer rhaglenni teledu yn Gymraeg. Ers hynny, mae wedi ymsefydlu i fod yn ddarlledwr analog llwyddiannus, gydag enw brand a adnabyddir ledled y byd. Un rheswm dros y llwyddiant hwn fu'r cyflenwad gwarantedig o raglenni o safon uchel gan y BBC, y mae'r S4C wedi gallu creu ei amserlen o raglenni o'u hamgylch. Fel S4C, mae dyletswydd ar y BBC, fel ddarlledwr gwasanaeth cyhoeddus, i ddarparu rhaglenni yn Gymraeg. Ymddengys bod Radio Cymru yn mynd o nerth i nerth, ac mae'n denu gwrandawyr iau. Mae rhaglenni'r BBC ar S4C ymhlith ei raglenni mwyaf poblogaidd. *Pobol y Cwm* yw'r rhaglen Gymraeg fwyaf poblogaidd, yn y byd i gyd, os mentraf ddweud. Un o fanteision eraill y berthynas hon yw bod S4C yn cael ei wasanaeth newyddion oddi wrth y BBC—mantais y byddai llawer o ddarlledwyr ledled y byd yn genfigenus ohoni, mae'n siŵr.

Mae trafodaeth ddiweddar Ofcom ynglŷn â dyfodol S4C wedi codi amheuon ynghylch dyfodol rhaglenni'r BBC ar y sianel. Mae perygl y gallai'r penderfyniad anghywir ar yr adeg dyngedfennol hon danseilio'r model llwyddiannus hwn o gydweithredu, a gwanhau sefyllfa Cymru ym maes darlledu digidol yn y ddwy iaith. Cytunaf y dylid adolygu'r berthynas unigryw rhwng y BBC a

S4C should be reviewed, and I am heartened that discussions between the two broadcasters have already started. However, it seems that the benefits of building on this partnership far outweigh the dangers of pushing the two organisations apart. I strongly believe that it would be wrong for the BBC to take over the running of S4C, and I am pleased that the BBC Wales controller, Menna Richards, has made it quite clear that she is not in favour of that. However, I believe that it is important that the BBC continues to fund and produce television programmes in Welsh. As a public-service broadcaster in Wales, it has an obligation to do so, along with its obligation to inform, educate and entertain its audiences in English.

The BBC's responsibilities were not diminished when S4C was established; indeed, at that time, it considerably increased its output. At this time of difficult challenges for broadcasters in the digital era, it makes sense for Wales's two key broadcasting organisations—S4C and the BBC—to work together to produce the best programmes for their audiences. It is a sign of strength that the two broadcasters are willing to work together. In the current climate of great global competition, it is not the right time to end that co-operation.

The proposals in the Ofcom phase 3 report on broadcasting in the nations provide an opportunity for securing a proper public service on ITV Wales, at least until digital switch-over, which, as we all know, could be as early as 2008. Though Ofcom cannot dictate budget levels, it does require high-quality programming, and the connection between quality and budgets must be established quickly.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.19 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.19 p.m.*

ITV has already imposed a £2 million cut on ITV Wales's programme budgets, representing a reduction of around 20 per cent. ITV's system of budget tariffs related to slots in the schedule already penalises Wales for occupying slots that carry network programmes in England. One effect of this is

S4C, ac fe'm calonogir gan y ffaith bod trafodaethau rhwng y ddau ddarledwr wedi dechrau eisoes. Fodd bynnag, ymddengys bod y manteision a ddaw yn sgîl adeiladu ar y bartneriaeth hon yn llawer pwysicach na pheryglon gwahanu'r ddau sefydliad oddi wrth ei gilydd. Credaf yn gryf y byddai'n anghywir i'r BBC ddod yn gyfrifol am redeg S4C, ac yr wyf yn falch bod rheolwr BBC Cymru, Menna Richards, wedi'i gwneud yn hollol glir nad yw o blaid hynny. Fodd bynnag, credaf ei bod yn bwysig bod y BBC yn parhau i ariannu a chynhyrchu rhaglenni teledu yn Gymraeg. Fel darledwr gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, mae'n ddyletswydd arno i wneud hynny, ynghyd â'i ddyletswydd i addysgu, hysbysu a diddanu ei gynulleidfa oedd yn Saesneg.

Ni leihawyd cyfrifoldebau'r BBC pan sefydlwyd S4C; yn wir, ar y pryd, cynyddodd ei gynrychiadau gryn dipyn. Yn ystod y cyfnod hwn sy'n llawn heriau anodd i ddarledwyr yn yr oes ddigidol, mae'n gwneud synnwyr i ddau sefydliad darlledu allweddol Cymru—S4C a'r BBC—weithio gyda'i gilydd i gynhyrchu'r rhaglenni gorau i'w cynulleidfa oedd. Mae'n arwydd o nerth bod y ddau ddarledwr yn barod i weithio gyda'i gilydd. Yn y sefyllfa sydd ohoni lle mae cystadlu byd-eang mawr, nid dyma'r amser priodol i roi terfyn ar y cydweithredu hwnnw.

Mae'r cynigion yn adroddiad cam 3 Ofcom ar ddarlledu yn y cenhedloedd yn gyfle i sicrhau gwasanaeth cyhoeddus priodol ar ITV Wales, o leiaf tan y newid i ddigidol, a allai ddigwydd mor gynnar â 2008, fel y gŵyr pob un ohonom. Er nad yw Ofcom yn gallu pennu cyllidebau, un o'i gofynion yw rhaglenni o ansawdd da, a rhaid dwyn y cysylltiad rhwng ansawdd a chyllidebau yn gyflym.

Mae ITV eisoes wedi torri £2 filiwn o gyllidebau rhaglenni ITV Wales, sef gostyngiad o tua 20 y cant. Mae system ITV o dariffau cyllidebol mewn cysylltiad ag amseroedd yn yr amserlen eisoes yn cosbi Cymru am lenwi amseroedd pryd y darlledir rhaglenni rhwydwaith yn Lloegr. Un effaith

to make it impossible to continue the production of a quality countryside or rural programme from Wales, which, as we all know, is geographically a predominantly rural country.

3.20 p.m.

It is vital that the principle that all national programming for Wales should be properly funded be established. There are several ways in which this funding could be secured. ITV plc could be persuaded to give Wales a dowry in order to properly fund the station's public-service remit. On the other hand, negotiations with Ofcom on the reduction of ITV's licence fees could provide a ring-fenced reduction for ITV Wales to fund its public-service broadcasting remit. As and when the public-service publisher comes into existence, funds could be provided from this source to fund ITV Wales's public-service programming up to and beyond the digital switch-over.

Slots for ITV Wales programmes need to be protected. At present, programme runs are regularly disrupted to make way for network specials. I am sorry, Deputy Presiding Officer, did you say I should wind up?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I have not said anything yet, but I was about to. You have had five minutes and 45 seconds. You need to wind up.

**Rosemary Butler:** May I have another 15 seconds?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Yes.

**Rosemary Butler:** The proposal for a greater amount of network productions to be set outside London may give ITV Wales welcome opportunities, but the first priority must be to secure public-service programming made in Wales for Welsh viewers.

**Owen John Thomas:** Ar achlysur fel hwn, mae angen i ni ddod ynghyd ac atgoffa ein

hyn yw ei bod yn ei gwneud yn amhosibl i barhau i gynhyrchu rhaglen o safon am gefn gwlad neu faterion gwledig o Gymru, sydd, fel y gwyddom oll, yn wlad wledig yn bennaf.

Mae'n hollbwysig sefydlu'r egwyddor y dylai'r holl raglenni cenedlaethol i Gymru gael eu hariannu'n briodol. Mae sawl ffordd o sicrhau'r arian hwn. Gellid darbwyllo ITV ccc i roi gwaddol i Gymru er mwyn ariannu cylch gwaith gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yr orsaf yn briodol. Ar y llaw arall, gallai negodiadau gydag Ofcom ar leihau ffoedd trwydded ITV arwain at ostyngiad wedi'i glustnodi er mwyn i ITV Wales ariannu ei gylch gwaith darlledu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus. Os a phryd y daw'r cyhoeddwr gwasanaeth cyhoeddus i fodolaeth, gellid darparu arian oddi wrth y ffynhonnell hon i ariannu rhaglenni gwasanaeth cyhoeddus ITV Wales hyd at y newid i ddigidol a thu hwnt.

Mae angen diogelu amseroedd ar gyfer rhaglenni ITV Wales. Ar hyn o bryd, caiff amseroedd darlledu cyfresi o raglenni eu newid yn rheolaidd er mwyn rhoi lle i raglenni rhwydwaith arbennig. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Ddirprwy Lywydd, a ddywedasoeh y dylwn ddirwyn i ben?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Nid wyf wedi dweud dim byd eto, ond yr oeddwn ar fin gwneud hynny. Yr ydych wedi cael pum munud a 45 eiliad. Mae angen ichi ddirwyn i ben.

**Rosemary Butler:** A gaf 15 eiliad arall?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Cewch.

**Rosemary Butler:** Efallai y bydd y cynnig o fwy o gynyrchiadau rhwydwaith y tu allan i Lundain yn rhoi cyfleoedd da i ITV Wales, ond y flaenoriaeth gyntaf yw sicrhau rhaglenni gwasanaeth cyhoeddus a wnaed yng Nghymru i wylwyr Cymru.

**Owen John Thomas:** On an occasion like this, we need to come together, and remind

hunain mai cenedl yw Cymru gyda dwy iaith swyddogol a'i sefydliadau a'i hetifeddiaeth neilltuol ei hun. Mae angen i ni uno tu ôl i'r amcan cyffredin o sicrhau'r canlyniad gorau er budd pobl Cymru. Bu inni fethu ar faterion megis Dydd Gŵyl Dewi, cyfrifiad 2001 a chadw enwau'r catrodau Cymreig. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer mwy yn y fantol wrth i ni drafod dyfodol darlledu cyhoeddus.

Felly, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cofio'r manteision economaidd a diwylliannol sy'n deillio o'r diwydiant hwn—nid yn unig yng Nghaerdydd a'r cylch ond mewn sawl rhan arall o Gymru. Dylai darlledu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus ddarparu ar gyfer ein dwy iaith, ar gyfer dewis rhesymol o sianeli, ar gyfer cyfran deg o raglenni i'r rhwydwaith, ar gyfer rhaglenni o safon dda ac ar gyfer derbyniad da ym mhob man.

Mae adroddiad Ofcom yn cydnabod cyfraniad anferth S4C i'r iaith Gymraeg ac i ddiwylliant ar draws Cymru a thu hwnt, tra'n pwysleisio'r angen am newidiadau er mwyn ymdopi â'r her ddigidol.

Cynigia Ofcom dri opsiwn ar gyfer dyfodol S4C ac, wrth eu trafod, mae'r corff rheoleiddio yn gwrthod ei ail gynnig, lle byddai S4C yn cael ei lyncu yn llwyr gan y BBC. Dan yr opsiwn cyntaf, byddai S4C yn parhau i fod yn gyfrifol am ddarparu'r gwasanaeth teledu Cymraeg, ond byddai adolygiad o'i threfniadau gyda'r BBC. Amcan yr adolygiad fyddai gwneud y berthynas rhyngddynt yn gliriach, gan gynnwys newid y cytundebau ar gyfer rhaglenni, a chael ymrwymiad cyllido gan y BBC yn hytrach nag addewid yn seiliedig ar nifer yr oriau o raglenni wythnosol mae S4C yn eu cael gan y BBC.

Model datblygu yw hyn, nid model chwyldroadol, ond mae'n hanfodol nad yw'n gwanhau'r berthynas symbiotig a llwyddiannus sydd wedi bodoli rhwng y BBC ac S4C ers 1982. Mae'r BBC wedi mynegi ansicrwydd am y cynnig lle byddai'n paratoi rhaglenni i S4C ond byddai gan S4C hawl i ddylanwadu ar y broses gynhyrchu. Mae'n bwysig fod trafodaethau rhwng y ddau gorff yn parhau, er mwyn sicrhau bod unrhyw

ourselves that Wales is a nation with two official languages and its own distinctive institutions and heritage. We need to unite behind the common goal of ensuring the best outcome for the people of Wales. We failed to do this on issues such as St David's Day, the 2001 census and retaining the names of the Welsh regiments. However, there is much more at stake as we discuss the future of public broadcasting.

Therefore, it is important that we bear in mind the economic and cultural advantages which this industry brings—not only to the Cardiff area but to many other parts of Wales. Public-service broadcasting should provide for both our languages, and also provide a reasonable choice of channels, a fair proportion of network programming, high-quality programming and good reception in all areas.

The Ofcom report acknowledges S4C's huge contribution to the Welsh language and to culture in all parts of Wales and beyond, while emphasising the need for changes to deal with the challenges of the digital age.

Ofcom proposes three options for the future of S4C and, in discussing these, the regulatory body rejects the second option whereby S4C would be wholly consumed by the BBC. Under the first option, S4C would continue to be responsible for providing Welsh-language television, but there would be a review of its arrangements with the BBC. The review's aim would be to bring greater transparency to the relationship between the two organisations, including changes to programming contracts, and to bring about a financial commitment from the BBC rather than a pledge based on the weekly number of hours of programming provided by the BBC to S4C.

This is a developmental rather than revolutionary model, but it is vital that it should not weaken the symbiotic and successful relationship that has existed between the BBC and S4C since 1982. The BBC has expressed its uncertainty about the proposal whereby it would produce programming for S4C, with the latter given the right to influence on the production process. It is important that discussions

drefniant newydd o les i'r ddau gorff ac, yn bennaf oll, yn canolbwyntio ar roi gwell gwasanaeth i'r gwylwyr.

Mae'r trydydd opsiwn yn fwy radical eto, ac yn beryglus am ei fod yn awgrymu cystadleuaeth am ryddfrait bob 10 mlynedd. Dan yr opsiwn hwn, gallai'r Gymraeg wynebu dyfodol ansicr yn nwylo cwmni preifat sy'n poeni mwy am ei gyfranddalwyr nag am anghenion gwylwyr Cymraeg. Os edrychwn ar Radio Sir Gâr, sydd hefyd yn atebol i Ofcom, gwelwn y peryglon i'r iaith dan amgylchiadau tebyg.

Siom enfawr yw'r newyddion heddiw bod Papur Gwyrdd Llywodraeth San Steffan yn cynnwys y posibilrwydd y bydd rhan o swyddogaethau'r BBC yn cael eu preifateiddio. Yr oeddwn yn credu mai pwrpas y sector darlledu cyhoeddus oedd cynnal gwasanaeth sy'n rhoi lles y gwylwyr uwchben diddordebau cwmnïau, sydd yn atebol i'w cyfranddalwyr. Gallai hyn ychwanegu at y bygythiad presennol i gwtogi 15 y cant oddi ar gostau'r BBC.

Ar yr angen am ddewis o raglenni, mae'r sefyllfa ychydig yn gliriach, er bod Cymru yn colli hanner awr o ddarlledu gan ITV Wales yn y tymor byr, ac awr arall ar ôl y newid digidol. Nid oes gwybodaeth ar gael eto am sut y bydd hyn yn effeithio ar y 200 o swyddi yng Nghroes Cwrlwys, ond gobeithir y bydd y cynnydd arfaethedig yn nifer y rhaglenni a wneir yn ITV Wales ar gyfer y rhyngwryd yn arwain at warchod y gweithlu yn erbyn mwy o golli swyddi. Mae'n rhaid i ni fel Cynulliad fod yn wyliadwrus bod ITV Wales yn dal ei dir ac yn parhau i ddarparu rhaglenni o safon a rhoi dewis i bobl Cymru.

I gloi, ar sicrhau derbyniad da ar gyfer pob un o sianeli Cymru ym mhob rhan o'n gwlad, yn awr yw'r amser i fynnu hyn, cyn i'r oes analog ddod i ben.

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae'n bwysig cydnabod bod gennym system gwasanaeth darlledu cyhoeddus gref yng Nghymru. Mae'n system gryfach nag mewn rhannau

continue between the organisations to ensure that any new arrangement is of mutual benefit and, most importantly, concentrates on providing a better service for viewers.

The third option is yet more radical, and also dangerous as it suggests a 10-year franchise, which would be open to tender. Under this option, the Welsh language could face an uncertain future in the hands of a private company concerned more about its shareholders than the needs of Welsh viewers. We need only look at Radio Carmarthenshire, which is also accountable to Ofcom, to see the dangers that the language could face under such circumstances.

Today's news that the Westminster Government's Green Paper includes the possibility that some of the BBC's functions may be privatised is a great disappointment. I thought that the purpose of the public broadcasting sector was to provide a service that puts viewers' interests before those of companies, which are accountable to their shareholders. This could add to the current threat to reduce the BBC's costs by 15 per cent.

On the need for a choice of programmes, the situation is a little clearer, although Wales will lose half an hour's broadcasting from ITV Wales in the short term, and another hour after digital switch-over. Information is not yet available on how this will affect the 200 jobs in Culverhouse Cross, but it is hoped that the proposed increase in the number of programmes made by ITV Wales for the internet will lead to safeguarding the workforce against more job losses. We as an Assembly must be vigilant that ITV Wales stands its ground and continues to provide quality programming and a choice for the people of Wales.

Finally, on ensuring a good-quality reception for all Welsh channels in all parts of the country, now is the time to insist on this, before the end of the analogue age.

**Leighton Andrews:** It is important to acknowledge that we have a strong public broadcasting system in Wales. It is stronger than in other parts of the United Kingdom,

eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig, oherwydd yr iaith Gymraeg. Mae gennym ddau ddarlledwr cyhoeddus.

A gawn ni ddadl go iawn ar S4C? Nid oes neb eisiau cau S4C, ac nid wyf yn adnabod unrhyw un sydd eisiau torri ei chyllideb na'i horiau. Fodd bynnag, mae sialens fawr i S4C yn y byd digidol. Mae'n sialens i wneud rhaglenni y mae pobl eisiau eu gwyllo, ac mae'n anodd gwneud hynny. Mae'n sialens anodd ar gyfer y BBC hefyd. Dyna pam yr wyf wedi dweud bod yn rhaid i S4C a'r BBC ymuno.

Y BBC sy'n gwneud holl raglenni newyddion S4C, a 50 y cant o'i rhaglenni materion cyfoes. Y BBC sy'n gwneud rhaglen fwyaf poblogaidd S4C—*Pobol y Cwm*—ac mae'n darlledu Radio Cymru, yn ogystal â Chymru'r Byd ar y we.

Dyma gyfle i ddatblygu S4C mewn hinsawdd greadigol yn y BBC. Mae'n bosibl cadw cyllideb, brand a sianel S4C. Mae'n syml—mae angen inni gael cytundeb rhwng yr Adran dros Ddiwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon yn Llundain a'r BBC i wario'r gyllideb ar gyfer rhaglenni Cymraeg i gyd ar S4C. Dyma gyfle i greu darlledwr gwasanaeth cyhoeddus cryf yng Nghymru. Byddai BBC Cymru, gydag S4C, yn gallu sefyll yn gryf yn erbyn y BBC yn ganolog. Nid wyf eisiau colli'r cyfle.

**Lisa Francis:** In your vision of this merger between S4C and the BBC, where do you put S4C's right to editorial control? How do you see that happening?

**Leighton Andrews:** If the BBC and S4C merge, editorial control would remain in one organisation. Therefore, under the option that I propose, that would not be a matter for debate.

Fodd bynnag, ar y llaw arall, nid wyf yn teimlo'n gryf am y pwynt.

**Eleanor Burnham** *rose*—

**Leighton Andrews:** Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw bod S4C a'r BBC yn cydweithio. Yr wyf yn erbyn un o gynlluniau Ofcom. Mae Ofcom yn awgrymu, yn y diwedd, y gellid

because of the Welsh language. We have two public-service broadcasters.

Can we have a proper debate on S4C? No-one wants to close S4C down, and I do not know anyone who wants to cut its budget or its hours. However, S4C faces a great challenge in the digital world. It is a challenge to make programmes that people want to watch, and that is difficult to do. It is also a difficult challenge for the BBC. That is why I have said that S4C and the BBC must merge.

The BBC makes all of S4C's news programmes, and 50 per cent of its current affairs programmes. The BBC makes S4C's most popular programme—*Pobol y Cwm*—and it is responsible for Radio Cymru, as well as Cymru'r Byd on the internet.

This is an opportunity to develop S4C in a creative climate within the BBC. It is possible to retain S4C's budget, brand, and channel. It is simple—we need an agreement between the Department for Culture, Media and Sport in London and the BBC to spend the entire budget for Welsh programming on S4C. This is an opportunity to create a strong public-service broadcaster in Wales. BBC Wales and S4C would be able to stand firm against the BBC centrally. I do not want to miss this opportunity.

**Lisa Francis:** Yn eich gweledigaeth ar gyfer yr uno hwn rhwng S4C a'r BBC, ble y mae hawl S4C i gael rheolaeth olygyddol? Sut y bydd hynny'n digwydd yn eich barn chi?

**Leighton Andrews:** Pe bai'r BBC a S4C yn uno, byddai rheolaeth olygyddol yn aros mewn un sefydliad. Felly, o dan yr opsiwn yr wyf yn ei gynnig, ni fyddai hwnnw yn fater i'w drafod.

However, on the other hand, I do not feel strongly on the point.

**Eleanor Burnham** *a gododd*—

**Leighton Andrews:** What is important is that S4C and the BBC work together. I am opposed to one of Ofcom's proposals. Ofcom suggests that, eventually, the share of the

trosglwyddo'r cyfran o'r ffi trwydded—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. It is clear that Leighton is not giving way, Eleanor. Simply standing up holds the debate up and bores everyone.

**Leighton Andrews:** Yn y diwedd, gellid trosglwyddo'r cyfran o'r ffi trwydded a ddefnyddir i gyllido'r cynnyrch Cymraeg i S4C.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Will you take an intervention?

**Leighton Andrews:** No.

Dyma rysáit ar gyfer apartheid ieithyddol. Mae'n bwysig bod un o'r darlledwyr hyn yn darlledu yn y ddwy iaith.

Is Welsh to be the only language in these islands in which the BBC does not broadcast? It will broadcast in English, Scots Gaelic, Irish, and ethnic minority languages, but not in Welsh. Ofcom is crazy if it thinks that that idea can fly.

On ITV Wales, it is important—

**Eleanor Burnham:** Are you brave enough to take an intervention, Leighton?

**Leighton Andrews:** I will not take an intervention from Eleanor because of the way that she is behaving.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. He is not taking any interventions.

3.30 p.m.

**Leighton Andrews:** Turning to ITV Wales, it is important to acknowledge the success of the campaign supported by all parties to protect the hours of non-news and news programming for ITV Wales. We should congratulate the unions, including the Broadcasting Entertainment Cinematograph and Theatre Union, Equity and the National Union of Journalists, on the 'Save Welsh TV' campaign. We have definitely come a long way since the autumn, when we faced significant reductions in non-news

licence fee could be transferred—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae'n amlwg nad yw Leighton am ildio, Eleanor. Dim ond gohirio'r ddadl a diflasu pawb a wnewch os safwch ar eich traed.

**Leighton Andrews:** Eventually, the share of the licence fee used to fund Welsh provision could be transferred to S4C.

**Eleanor Burnham:** A wnewch chi dderbyn ymyriad?

**Leighton Andrews:** Na wnaif.

This is a recipe for linguistic apartheid. It is important that one of these broadcasters broadcasts in both languages.

Ai Cymraeg fydd yr unig iaith yn yr ynysoedd hyn na fydd y BBC yn darlledu ynddi? Bydd yn darlledu yn Saesneg, yn yr Aeleg, yn Wyddeleg ac mewn ieithoedd lleiafrifoedd ethnig, ond nid yn y Gymraeg. Mae Ofcom yn hurt os cred y caiff y syniad hwnnw ei dderbyn.

O ran ITV Wales, mae'n bwysig—

**Eleanor Burnham:** A ydych yn ddigon dewr i dderbyn ymyriad, Leighton?

**Leighton Andrews:** Ni dderbyniaf ymyriad gan Eleanor oherwydd y ffordd y mae'n ymddwyn.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw'n derbyn ymyriadau.

**Leighton Andrews:** Gan droi at ITV Wales, mae'n bwysig cydnabod llwyddiant yr ymgyrch a gefnogwyd gan bob plaid i ddiogelu oriau rhaglenni newyddion a rhaglenni eraill i ITV Wales. Dylem longyfarch yr undebau, gan gynnwys yr Undeb Darlledu, Adloniant, Sinematograffeg a Theatr, Equity ac Undeb Cenedlaethol y Newyddiadurwyr, ar yr ymgyrch 'Save Welsh TV'. Yr ydym yn sicr wedi cyflawni cryn dipyn ers yr hydref pan oeddem yn wynebu gostyngiadau sylweddol mewn



programming that were far more extreme than current proposals, and we now have support for regional production funds. We must say that we expect the leadership of ITV Wales to respond and to bid into the production fund that ITV announced. Today, the Government published its Green Paper on the future of the BBC. I state my support for the BBC, and for the continuation of the licence fee into the foreseeable future. I will consider the proposal for a trust to replace the BBC governors, although I am sceptical about that proposal. Michael Grade made progress in reforming the governance of the BBC. It is not clear whether there will be a Welsh trustee in this proposed new trust.

I also express my concern about the level of financial cuts that BBC Wales is expected to take as a result of the current budget savings being made in the corporation. Also, it is important that, in the approach to the future of digital broadcasting, BBC proposals for a free satellite service are brought forward with urgency so that constituents such as mine, who cannot currently receive Freeview, have the option of a digital future.

In conclusion, the UK is one of the countries in which a high proportion of people already downloads programmes that they want to watch from the internet across broadband. We have the growth of DVD sales and an expansion of hard-disk based personal video recorders, such as SKY+ and TiVo. To succeed in that world, you need high-quality programmes, and that is the challenge before all of our broadcasters.

**Glyn Davies:** In opening this debate, the Minister described it as an exciting time, and it is a time of great opportunity. However, I also think that it is a time of great threat, and it is important that we engage fully with this matter, even though broadcasting is not devolved to the National Assembly. It is important for us to retain diversity in programme delivery. Also, we must ensure that we take full advantage of the contribution to economic development that changes and the Welsh language can make. I

rhaglenni nad oeddent yn rhaglenni newyddion a oedd yn llawer mwy eithafol na'r cynigion presennol, ac erbyn hyn mae gennym gefnogaeth i gronfeydd cynhyrchu rhanbarthol. Rhaid inni ddweud ein bod yn disgwyl i arweinyddiaeth ITV Wales ymateb a gwneud ceisiadau i'r gronfa gynhyrchu a gyhoeddwyd gan ITV. Heddiw, cyhoeddodd y Llywodraeth ei Phapur Gwyrdd ar ddyfodol y BBC. Datganaf fy nghefnogaeth i'r BBC, ac i barhad ffi'r drwydded yn y dyfodol. Ystyriaf y cynnig ar gyfer sefydlu ymddiriedolaeth yn lle llywodraethwyr y BBC, er bod gennyf amheuon ynglŷn â'r cynnig hwnnw. Gwnaeth Michael Grade gynydd o ran diwygio trefn lywodraethol y BBC. Nid yw'n amlwg a fydd ymddiriedolwr o Gymru yn yr ymddiriedolaeth newydd hon a gynigir.

Mynegaf fy mhryder hefyd ynghylch lefel y toriadau ariannol y disgwylir i BBC Cymru eu gwneud o ganlyniad i'r arbedion yn y gyllideb a wneir gan y gorfforaeth ar hyn o bryd. Hefyd, mae'n bwysig, wrth ddynesu at ddarlledu digidol y dyfodol, y caiff cynigion y BBC ar gyfer gwasanaeth lloeren am ddim eu cyflwyno ar fyrder fel y bydd etholwyr, megis fy etholwyr i, na allant dderbyn Freeview ar hyn o bryd, yn gallu dewis dyfodol digidol.

I gloi, mae'r DU yn un o'r gwledydd lle y mae cyfran fawr o bobl eisoes yn lawrlwytho rhaglenni y maent am eu gwyllo o'r rhyngrwyd drwy gyfrwng band eang. Mae gwerthiannau DVD yn tyfu ac mae peiriannau fideo recordio personol disg galed, megis SKY+ a TiVo ar gynydd. Er mwyn llwyddo yn y byd hwnnw, mae angen rhaglenni o ansawdd uchel, a dyna'r her i bob un o'n darlledwyr.

**Glyn Davies:** Wrth agor y ddatl hon, dywedodd y Gweinidog ein bod yn wynebu cyfnod cyffrous, ac mae'n gyfnod o gyfleoedd mawr. Fodd bynnag, credaf hefyd ei fod yn gyfnod o fygythiad mawr, ac mae'n bwysig inni ymdrin yn llawn â'r mater hwn, er nad yw darlledu wedi'i ddatganoli i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Mae'n bwysig inni gadw amrywiaeth y rhaglenni a ddarperir. Hefyd, rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn manteisio i'r eithaf ar y cyfraniad y gall newidiadau a'r iaith Gymraeg ei wneud at

have referred to that issue previously and will discuss it more fully later.

With regard to the ITV position, to which other speakers have referred, generally, we all agree, and I broadly welcome Ofcom's conclusion, as it was at least as good as I expected it to be. As Lisa Francis said in her contribution, there are several possible downsides, and we must be vigilant as some of the generalisations become explicit, so that we are certain that what we think is fairly good news ultimately turns out to be good news.

There are several issues, of which money is a crucial one. There is no point in making a commitment to so many hours of Welsh programming unless there are sufficient funds to ensure that the quality of those programmes meets our expectation. It cannot be a matter of simply providing hours—it must be backed by sufficient finance, and Ofcom will have to keep a wary eye on the matter. Furthermore, the number of hours means nothing unless the programmes that they fill are broadcast at a sensible time and that the programming is consistent. People need to be able to watch the programmes. Recently, an edition of the political programme, *Waterfront*, was switched at the last minute to 11.30 p.m.. Not only did few people watch it, but the change was made so late that there was no opportunity for it to be published in newspapers so that people knew that it had been moved. Those sorts of things, based on the figures so far, need to be followed up more explicitly by Ofcom to ensure delivery.

Of course, the big question is the future of S4C. This is a hugely complex issue, and I am not at all certain what the right way forward will turn out to be. I will be interested to hear the Minister with responsibility for culture respond to the debate, because his views on this aspect will be particularly interesting. We know, however, that matters cannot carry on as they are at present. The number of programme providers has increased hugely, and S4C cannot expect anything like the audience that it had in its early days. The challenges are coming from all over, and something will

ddatblygu economaidd. Cyfeiriais at y mater hwnnw o'r blaen a byddaf yn ei drafod yn fanylach yn nes ymlaen.

O ran sefyllfa ITV, y cyfeiriodd siaradwyr eraill ati, yn gyffredinol, yr ydym oll yn gytûn, a chroesawaf gasgliad Ofcom yn gyffredinol, gan ei fod o leiaf crystal ag yr oeddwn yn ei ddisgwyl. Fel y dywedodd Lisa Francis yn ei chyfraniad, mae sawl anfantais bosibl, a rhaid inni fod yn wylidwrus wrth i rai o'r gosodiadau cyffredinol ddod yn fwy eglur, fel ein bod yn sicr bod yr hyn sy'n newyddion eithaf da, yn ein barn ni, yn aros yn newyddion da yn y pen draw.

Cyfyd sawl mater, ac mae arian yn un allweddol. Nid oes diben mewn ymrwymo i hyn a hyn o oriau o raglenni Cymreig oni bai bod digon o arian i sicrhau bod ansawdd y rhaglenni hynny yn bodloni ein disgwyliadau. Nid mater o ddarparu oriau mo hwn—rhaid bod digon o arian yn sail iddo, a bydd yn rhaid i Ofcom gadw llygad barcud ar y mater. At hynny, nid yw nifer yr oriau yn golygu dim oni chaiff y rhaglenni y maent yn eu llenwi eu darlledu ar amser call a bod amseroedd rhaglenni yn gyson. Mae angen i bobl allu gwyllo'r rhaglenni. Yn ddiweddar, newidiwyd rhifyn o'r rhaglen wleidyddol *Waterfront* ar y funud olaf i 11.30 pm.. Nid yn unig bod nifer y bobl a'i gwylid yn fach, ond newidiwyd yr amser mor hwyr fel nad oedd cyfle i'w gyhoeddi yn y papurau newydd fel bod pobl yn gwybod bod y rhaglen wedi cael ei symud. Mae angen i Ofcom ymdrin â'r math hynny o bethau, yn seiliedig ar y ffigurau hyd yma, yn fanylach er mwyn sicrhau darpariaeth.

Wrth gwrs, y cwestiwn mawr yw dyfodol S4C. Mae hwn yn fater hynod gymhleth, ac nid wyf yn sicr o gwbl beth fydd y ffordd gywir ymlaen yn y pen draw. Bydd diddordeb gennyf glywed y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am ddiwylliant yn ymateb i'r ddadl, oherwydd bydd ei farn ar yr agwedd hon yn ddiddorol iawn. Fodd bynnag, gwyddom na all y sefyllfa bresennol barhau fel y mae. Mae nifer y darparwyr rhaglenni wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol, ac ni all S4C ddisgwyl dim byd tebyg i'r gynulleidfa a gafodd yn ystod y dyddiau cynnar. Daw'r heriau o bob cyfeiriad, a bydd yn rhaid i rywbeth newid.

have to change.

There is, however, the merger possibility that Leighton Andrews raised. I am suspicious of that, as I think that it would threaten the sort of diversity of provision that I would like to see. However, we are at the consultation stage, and there are several matters that we may have to grasp. Owen John Thomas mentioned a great fear of what is perhaps the ultimate radical solution. Let us wait and see. I do not have the inherent antipathy to the private sector that some people have. Often, in some areas, the private sector can deliver a good-quality product. I think that we should wait until the end of this consultation period before we come to a final conclusion.

**Owen John Thomas:** Do you not agree, Glyn, that a private company running S4C would focus mainly on its shareholders and on keeping them happy rather than ensuring that the Welsh language was given a good airing, as is currently done by S4C?

**Glyn Davies:** I will respond to that point, although there is a specific nature to it to which I do not want to respond. In general, every private-sector operation has to be run in a way that delivers profit. That is how all private-sector organisations work. The end-product is often an important part of the main objective of private-sector companies across Britain. This is not my favoured option, but I would not want to rule it out at this stage and follow that sort of anti-private-sector instinct.

My final point is about the Welsh language's potential contribution to the creative industries. It is important that the Minister for Economic Development opened this debate. He made one or two points, with which I agreed, about the economic development potential. We are incredibly lucky in Wales, because having more ways in which we can develop the language, particularly through broadcasting—whether through television, film, music or whatever—means that almost all of the creative element has to be delivered in Welsh and created in Wales. This is a fantastic economic development opportunity. I sometimes think that the cultural argument for the Welsh language, strong as it is,

Fodd bynnag, mae'r posibilrwydd o uno a godwyd gan Leighton Andrews. Mae amheumon gennyf ynglŷn â hynny, gan y credaf y byddai'n peryglu'r math o amrywiaeth o ddarpariaeth yr hoffwn ei weld. Fodd bynnag, ar y cam ymgynghori yr ydym, ac mae sawl mater y bydd yn rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â hwy o bosibl. Soniodd Owen John Thomas am ofn mawr o ran yr hyn a fydd yr ateb mwyaf radical efallai. Gadewch inni aros i weld beth a ddigwydd. Ni theimlaf yr elyniaeth fawr tuag at y sector preifat fel y gwna rhai pobl. Yn aml, mewn rhai meysydd, gall y sector preifat ddarparu cynnyrch o ansawdd da. Credaf y dylem aros tan ddiwedd y cyfnod ymgynghori hwn cyn dod i gasgliad terfynol.

**Owen John Thomas:** Oni chytunwch, Glyn, pe bai cwmni preifat yn rhedeg S4C y byddai'n canolbwyntio'n bennaf ar ei gyfranddalwyr a'u cadw'n hapus yn hytrach na sicrhau bod cyfran dda o Gymraeg ar yr awyr, fel y gwna S4C ar hyn o bryd?

**Glyn Davies:** Ymatebaf i'r pwynt hwnnw, er bod agwedd arno nad wyf am ymateb iddi. Yn gyffredinol, rhaid i bob cwmni yn y sector preifat gael ei redeg mewn ffordd sy'n gwneud elw. Dyna sut y mae pob sefydliad yn y sector preifat yn gweithio. Mae'r cynnyrch yn aml yn rhan bwysig o brif amcan cwmnïau'r sector preifat ledled Prydain. Nid dyna fy hoff ddewis, ond ni fyddwn am ei ddiystyru ar hyn o bryd ac arddel rhyw fath o reddf wrth-sector preifat.

Mae fy mhwynt olaf yn ymwneud â chyfraniad posibl y Gymraeg tuag y diwydiannau creadigol. Mae'n bwysig i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd agor y ddadl hon. Gwnaeth un neu ddau o bwyntiau, y cytunais â hwy, ynglŷn â'r potensial o ran datblygu economaidd. Yr ydym yn hynod ffodus yng Nghymru, oherwydd mae'r ffaith bod mwy o ffyrdd o ddatblygu'r iaith, yn enwedig drwy ddarlledu—boed hynny drwy gyfrwng teledu, ffilm, cerddoriaeth neu beth bynnag—yn golygu bod yn rhaid i bron bob elfen creadigol gael ei chyflawni yn Gymraeg a'i chreu yng Nghymru. Mae hwn yn gyfle gwych o ran datblygu economaidd. Credaf

sometimes prevents us from recognising the huge economic opportunities offered by the development of the Welsh language.

**Jenny Randerson:** It is interesting that the Government used the opposition parties' call for a debate on Ofcom to table a motion that did not refer to Ofcom. The reason for this became clear this morning, when the UK Government announced the publication of its Green Paper on the future of the BBC.

The Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome the UK Government's decision to maintain the BBC as we know it and the licence fee for at least the next 10 years. Britain's reputation throughout the world is in no small part due to the integrity and quality of BBC programming. We welcome the concept of replacing the board of governors with trustees, an idea first put forward by the Liberal Democrats a few years ago. In addition, we would have preferred to see the establishment of a new tough, independent regulator for all public-sector broadcasters. We have a BBC governor for Wales, but no representative on the Ofcom board. Will you, Minister—or whichever Minister feels that it is his or her place to do so—argue for a representative for Wales on the new board of trustees? I sincerely hope that you will do that.

Analogue switch-off must not lead to social exclusion. The 98 per cent coverage by satellite that is possible comes at a price. We must think of the remaining 2 per cent, even in that situation. This is a complex issue. I would call on the Welsh Assembly Government to provide a full Government-funded and ongoing public-information campaign on the digital television options. This campaign should be undertaken on a written-media basis and on analogue television. Those who have remained with analogue television are less likely to have access to a computer and to the web, therefore web addresses are of little use to them. Can we have a commitment to an unbiased view of all the options available to people, accompanied by technical advice?

weithiau fod y ddadl ddiwylliannol dros y Gymraeg, er mor gryf, yn ein hatal weithiau rhag cydnabod y cyfleoedd economaidd enfawr a gynigir gan ddatblygiad y Gymraeg.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae'n ddi-ddorol i'r Llywodraeth ddefnyddio cais y gwrthbleidiau am ddadl ar Ofcom i gyflwyno cynnig na chyfeiriodd at Ofcom. Daeth y rheswm dros hyn yn amlwg y bore yma, pan gyhoeddodd y DU ei Phapur Gwyrdd ar ddyfodol y BBC.

Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn croesawu penderfyniad Llywodraeth y DU i gadw'r BBC fel y mae ar hyn o bryd ac i gadw ffi'r drwydded am o leiaf y deng mlynedd nesaf. Un rheswm pwysig dros enw da Prydain ledled y byd yw uniondeb ac ansawdd rhaglenni'r BBC. Croesawn y cysyniad o gael ymddiriedolwyr yn lle bwrdd y llywodraethwyr, syniad a gyflwynwyd gyntaf gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl. Yn ogystal, byddai wedi bod yn well gennym weld rheoleiddiwr annibynnol, cadarn newydd yn cael ei sefydlu ar gyfer pob darlledwr yn y sector cyhoeddus. Mae gennym lywodraethwr i Gymru ar fwrdd y BBC, ond dim cynrychiolydd ar fwrdd Ofcom. A wnewch chi, Weinidog—neu ba Weinidog bynnag a deimla mai ef neu hi sy'n gyfrifol am hyn—roi dadl dros gynrychiolydd dros Gymru ar y bwrdd newydd o ymddiriedolwyr? Mawr obeithiaf y gwnewch hynny.

Rhaid sicrhau na fydd diffodd y signal analog yn arwain at allgáu cymdeithasol. Mae pris i'w dalu o bosibl am y 98 y cant o bobl a fydd yn gallu derbyn gwasanaeth lloeren. Rhaid inni feddwl am y 2 y cant sy'n weddill, hyd yn oed yn y sefyllfa honno. Mae hwn yn fater cymhleth. Galwaf ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gynnal ymgyrch gwybodaeth i'r cyhoedd ar yr opsiynau sydd ar gael o ran teledu digidol, ymgyrch barhaus a gaiff eu hariannu'n llawn gan y Llywodraeth. Dylid cynnal yr ymgyrch hon yn y cyfryngau ysgrifenedig ac ar deledu analog. Mae'r rhai sydd wedi aros gyda theledu analog yn llai tebygol o gael mynediad i gyfrifiadur ac i'r we, felly go brin fod cyfeiriadau ar y we o ddefnydd iddynt. A allwn gael ymrwymiad i roi barn ddiuedd ar

For example, the Freeview satellite option exists, but it is a closely guarded secret, which means that few people are aware of it.

bob opsiwn sydd ar gael i bobl, ynghyd â chyngor technegol? Er enghraifft, mae gwasanaeth lloeren Freeview ar gael, ond ni chaiff fawr o gyhoeddusrwydd, sy'n golygu nad oes ond ychydig o bobl yn ymwybodol ohono.

3.40 p.m.

Wales has to move on in broadcasting terms. However, many of us have not yet come fully to terms with digital technology. Even if we can manage the basics of controlling a digital television, we probably do not use it to its fullest extent. Ofcom is already opening our minds to the next phase, which will arrive in the next couple of years.

Rhaid i Gymru symud ymlaen o ran darlledu. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer ohonom heb ddygymod yn llwyr â thechnoleg ddigidol eto. Hyd yn oed os gallwn wneud yr hanfodion i reoli teledu digidol, go brin ein bod yn ei ddefnyddio i'r eithaf. Mae Ofcom eisoes yn agor ein meddyliau i'r cam nesaf, a fydd yn cyrraedd o fewn yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf.

Ofcom faces difficult issues. There is considerable public support for public-sector broadcasting, in terms of quality and quantity. However, this is juxtaposed with the global impact of digital television with all its facets and channels. Whatever happens in the UK, we must not end up with our own version of the Fox News channel. The unique aspect of broadcasting in Wales is the issue of the language. S4C's key role is to ensure that the language thrives, but, to do that, the organisation must also thrive and modernise. In particular, it must attract more teenage viewers. However, in terms of the three models proposed by Ofcom, I believe that merging the first model with the third model is the right choice, and not linking the S4C permanently with the BBC. I believe that S4C needs more independence from the BBC.

Mae Ofcom yn wynebu problemau anodd. Mae cryn gefnogaeth ymhlith y cyhoedd i ddarlledu'r sector cyhoeddus o ran ansawdd a maint. Fodd bynnag, rhaid ystyried hyn ochr yn ochr ag effaith fyd-eang teledu digidol gyda'i holl agweddau a sianeli. Beth bynnag a ddigwydd yn y DU, rhaid inni beidio â bod mewn sefyllfa lle y mae gennym ein fersiwn ein hunain o sianel Newyddion Fox. Yr agwedd unigryw ar ddarlledu yng Nghymru yw'r iaith. Rôl allweddol S4C yw sicrhau bod yr iaith yn ffynnu, ond, er mwyn gwneud hynny, rhaid i'r sefydliad ffynnu a moderneiddio hefyd. Yn arbennig, rhaid iddo ddenu mwy o wylwyr yn eu harddegau. Fodd bynnag, o ran y tri model a gynigiwyd gan Ofcom, credaf mai uno'r model cyntaf â'r trydydd model yw'r dewis iawn, a phaidio â chysylltu S4C yn barhaol â'r BBC. Credaf fod angen i S4C gael mwy o annibyniaeth oddi ar y BBC.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Do you believe it to be predictable, but rather sad, that a former BBC employee should be so tame in his comments about the BBC swallowing up S4C?

**Eleanor Burnham:** A gredwch y gellid bod wedi disgwyl, gwaetha'r modd, y byddai rhywun a oedd yn arfer gweithio i'r BBC mor wan ei sylwadau ynglŷn â'r cynnig y dylai'r BBC feddiannu S4C?

**Jenny Randerson:** I strongly believe that there is strength in having a multiplicity of options for public-sector broadcasting. I do not think that closer links with the BBC is the right option.

**Jenny Randerson:** Credaf yn gryf fod mantais o gael dewis lluosog ar gyfer darlledu'r sector cyhoeddus. Ni chredaf mai cysylltiadau agosach â'r BBC yw'r dewis cywir.

**Leighton Andrews:** Do you accept that

**Leighton Andrews:** A dderbyniwch fod gan

every Assembly Member, be they former BBC employees or former S4C consultants, as I am, has a right to express his or her views in debates on the basis of their own intellectual judgment regarding the issues being discussed?

**Jenny Randerson:** I do not understand how that comment can be addressed to me, Leighton.

If we adopt the third model, there must be guarantees of quality, funding and regulation for S4C. All commercial channels have problems with selling their advertising; S4C has more than most. I am pleased that it is grasping that nettle.

In terms of ITV, Ofcom's proposal to increase the quota for out-of-London public-sector broadcasting is important. There is a great opportunity here for Wales. We have a greater cluster of media specialists with the appropriate skills in Wales than in any other part of the UK. However, that opportunity could slip past us because the rest of the UK will become our competitors. We need more than the skeletal outline in the creative industries strategy if we are going to seize those opportunities. We must not be complacent about Ofcom's recommendations in relation to ITV either. The reduction to four hours of output could be reduced to three and a half hours, and then to three hours or less. Those hours must be at peak time and not shoved away at 11.30 p.m., as Glyn said.

Finally, we cannot be the luddites of the twenty-first century. We must embrace change, but we must ensure that the new garment is of sufficient quality to serve all the people of Wales well.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Mae'n bwysig nad ydym yn rhuthro i gymryd safbwyntiau rhy haearnaidd ynglŷn â'r awgrymiadau ym mhapur Ofcom. Mae angen inni ystyried y sefyllfa er mwyn ceisio canfod yr atebion cywir. Mae gennyf bedwar pwynt i'w gwneud. Mae'r cyntaf yn ymwneud ag ITN, a'r tri arall yn ymwneud ag S4C. Mae argymhelliad diddorol sy'n cyfeirio at awgrym o'r Alban ynghylch creu fersiwn

bob Aelod Cynulliad, boed yn gyn-gyflogeion y BBC neu'n gyn-ymgynghorwyr i S4C, fel minnau, yr hawl i fynegi ei farn neu ei barn mewn dadleuon ar sail barn ddeallusol ynglŷn â'r materion dan sylw?

**Jenny Randerson:** Ni ddeallaf sut y gall y sylw hwnnw fod yn berthnasol i mi, Leighton.

Os mabwysiadwn y trydydd model, rhaid gwarantu ansawdd, cyllid a rheoleiddio i S4C. Mae pob sianel fasnachol yn cael problemau o ran gwerthu eu hysbysebion; mae S4C yn cael mwy o broblemau na'r rhan fwyaf ohonynt. Yr wyf yn falch ei fod yn mynd i'r afael â hynny.

O ran ITV, mae cynnig Ofcom i gynyddu'r cwota ar gyfer darlledu'r sector cyhoeddus y tu allan i Lundain yn bwysig. Dyma gyfle gwych i Gymru. Mae gennym fwy o arbenigwyr ym myd y cyfryngau gyda'r sgiliau priodol wedi ymgasglu yng Nghymru nag mewn unrhyw ran arall o'r DU. Fodd bynnag, galleu gollu'r cyfle hwnnw oherwydd bydd gweddill y DU yn dechrau cystadlu â ni. Mae angen mwy na'r braslun yn strategaeth y diwydiannu creadigol er mwyn inni fachu ar y cyfleoedd hynny. Rhaid inni beidio â bod yn hunanfodlon ynglŷn ag argymhellion Ofcom o ran ITV ychwaith. Gallai'r toriad i bedair awr o ddarlledu gael ei leihau i dair awr a hanner, ac yna i dair awr, neu lai. Rhaid i'r oriau hynny fod yn ystod oriau brig ac nid yn hwyr yn y nos, fel y dywedodd Glyn.

Yn olaf, ni allwn beidio â symud gyda'r oes. Rhaid inni groesawu newid, ond rhaid inni sicrhau bod y ddarpariaeth newydd o safon ddigon da i roi gwasanaeth da i holl bobl Cymru.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** We must guard against being too hasty in formulating views that are too inflexible on the recommendations in Ofcom's paper. We need to consider the situation in order to come to the right conclusions. I have four points. The first refers to ITN, and the other three refer to S4C. There is an interesting recommendation that refers to a suggestion from Scotland about creating a Scottish version of the ITN

Albanaidd o fwletin newyddion ITN am 10.30 p.m.. Gan fod llawer o'r newyddion hyn yn cynnwys eitemau cenedlaethol a rhyngwladol, mae'n amherthnasol i'r Alban, ac i Gymru. Awgrymir felly y dylid cael bwletin sy'n addasu'r eitemau sy'n berthnasol i Loegr yn unig. Nid wyf yn siŵr sut y byddai hyn yn cael ei gyflawni gan y byddai'n arwain at broblemau logistaidd sylweddol. Fodd bynnag, os ystyrir y syniad yn yr Alban, dylid ystyried trefn debyg yng Nghymru gan fod llawer o'r newyddion Prydeinig yn camarwain y gwylwyr ar hyn o bryd.

O ran S4C, yr wyf am wneud dau bwynt sylfaenol. Yn gyntaf, rhaid inni sicrhau adnoddau ariannol digonol i gwrdd â gofynion gwasanaeth teilwng yn y Gymraeg. Mae dylanwad teledu ar ein plant a'n pobl ifanc yn anferthol a, heb wasanaeth safonol, bydd gobeithion 'Iaith Pawb' yn ddim byd ond geiriau gwag. Pa drefn bynnag y bydd y Llywodraeth yn ei chefnogi yn y pen draw, rhaid cadw'r pwynt hwnnw yn ganolog i'r ddadl. Mae'r ail bwynt am y trefniant fydd yn cael ei greu i reoli S4C, os bydd newid, ac mae Leighton Andrews wedi dweud heddiw ei fod yn ffafrio un drefn. Pa drefn bynnag a fabwysiedir, rhaid i'r corff hwnnw fod yn annibynnol, a chyfrifoldeb am y gwasanaeth neu'r gwasanaethau Cymraeg yn brif swyddogaeth iddo.

O ran y berthynas rhwng S4C a'r BBC, gan gyfeirio eto at sylwadau a wnaed cynt, mae gennyf bryderon ynglŷn â chreu un corff cenedlaethol o'r BBC ac S4C, yn enwedig mewn gwlad lle mae gwasanaeth ITV mor wan, sef yr un corff arall hwnnw a fyddai'n cyflenwi ein hanghenion darlledu. Mae angen rhoi mwy o bwerau golygyddol i S4C a sicrhau, yn y dyfodol, fod perthynas rhwng gwerth ariannol y rhaglenni Cymraeg y mae'r BBC yn eu cyflenwi a nifer yr oriau. Mae'n werth atgoffa ein hunain o hyn: yn 1982, pan ddechreuodd S4C, yr oedd y 10 awr o raglenni yr oedd y BBC i fod i gyflenwi yn gyfran sylweddol o'r 25 awr o raglenni yr oedd S4C yn gyfrifol amdanynt. Erbyn hyn, mae S4C yn gyfrifol am tua 80 awr o raglenni, ac mae gwerth 10 awr y BBC wedi gostwng yn sylweddol. Rhaid diogelu hwnnw i'r dyfodol.

news bulletin at 10.30 p.m.. As much of this news covers national and international stories, it is irrelevant to Scotland, and to Wales. It is therefore recommended that there should be a bulletin that focuses on items that are only relevant to England. I am not sure how this could be achieved as it would lead to significant logistical problems. However, if the recommendation is considered in Scotland, a similar format should be considered for Wales, as much of the current British news coverage misleads viewers.

On S4C, I want to make two fundamental points. First, we must ensure that sufficient financial resources are in place to meet the requirements of a creditable service through the medium of Welsh. Television has a huge influence on our children and young people and, without a quality service, the aims of 'Iaith Pawb' will be nothing but empty rhetoric. Whichever system the Government supports at the end of the day, that point must be central to the debate. The second issue concerns the structure created to manage S4C, if changes are to be made, and Leighton Andrews has stated his favoured option. Whichever structure is adopted, that body must be independent, and assuming responsibility for the Welsh-language service or services should be its main function.

On the relationship between S4C and the BBC, again referring to previous comments, I am concerned about creating one national body comprising both the BBC and S4C, especially in a country where the ITV service, which is the one other body that would provide for our broadcasting demands, is so weak. We must give S4C more editorial control and ensure, in future, that there is parity between the financial value of the BBC's Welsh-language programmes and the number of hours it produces. It is worth reminding ourselves that, in 1982, when S4C was established, the 10 hours of programming provided by the BBC were a significant proportion of the 25 hours of programming that S4C was responsible for. S4C is now responsible for about 80 hours of programming per week, and the value of the BBC's 10 hours has decreased significantly. That must be safeguarded for the future.

Rhaid inni warchod rhag bod yn rhy haearnidd yn rhy gynnar a chadw meddwl agored ynglŷn â rhai o'r dadleuon a gynigiwyd, er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn cyflenwi gwasanaeth darlledu teilwng yn y Gymraeg a'r Saesneg ar gyfer Cymru.

**The Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport (Alun Pugh):** My colleague, Andrew Davies, was absolutely right when he said at the start of this debate that broadcasting is not a devolved matter, but it has a huge impact on society in Wales. Today's debate is particularly well timed against the background of Ofcom's phase 3 consultation on public-service broadcasting, Tessa Jowell's statement to Parliament earlier today on the future of the BBC, and the particularly rapid technological change that encompasses everything from the switch to digital broadcasting to alternative delivery systems, ranging from mobile phones to broadband internet connections. However, this is not a debate about technology, but about public-service broadcasting and how we ensure its development against the background of technological change.

How do we ensure that the opportunities afforded by technology improve public-service broadcasting in Wales? Rose Butler drew our attention to some clever use of technology that assists with learning the Welsh language, and I congratulate the BBC on its innovative use of world-class technology. The Welsh Assembly Government will respond formally to these processes in due course, but I want to inform Members this afternoon of the principles that will guide that response.

Public-service broadcasting matters. Broadcasting is too important to leave to the tender mercies of the free market. It was good to see the Conservatives, this afternoon, railing against the use of the free market, because we certainly do not want 57 channels and nothing to watch. In Wales, public-service broadcasting is an essential counter to the structural weaknesses of the Welsh newspaper market. In Wales, unlike Scotland, which has a variety of broadsheet and tabloid offers, only 15 per cent of the newspapers

We must guard against taking too inflexible a stance too soon and we must keep an open mind about some of the proposals to ensure that we provide a quality broadcasting service for Wales in Welsh and English.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon (Alun Pugh):** Yr oedd fy nghyd-Weinidog, Andrew Davies, yn llygad ei le pan ddywedodd ar ddechrau'r ddadl hon nad mater datganoledig yw darlledu, ond ei fod yn cael effaith sylweddol ar gymdeithas yng Nghymru. Mae amseriad y ddadl heddiw yn arbennig o dda o gofio ymgynghoriad cam 3 Ofcom ar ddarlledu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus, datganiad Tessa Jowell ar ddyfodol y BBC gerbron y Senedd yn gynharach heddiw, a'r newid technolegol cyflym iawn sy'n cwmpasu popeth o'r newid i ddarlledu digidol i systemau darparu amgen, gan amrywio o ffonau symudol i gysylltiadau band eang dros y rhyngwrdd. Fodd bynnag, nid dadl ynglŷn â thechnoleg mo hon, ond dadl ynglŷn â darlledu sector cyhoeddus a'r ffordd yr ydym yn sicrhau ei ddatblygiad yn erbyn cefndir o newid technolegol.

Sut yr ydym yn sicrhau bod y cyfleoedd a rydd technoleg yn gwella darlledu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yng Nghymru? Tynnodd Rose Butler ein sylw at rai defnyddiau clyfar a wneir o dechnoleg sy'n helpu pobl i ddysgu Cymraeg, a llongyfarchaf y BBC ar ei ddefnydd arloesol o dechnoleg o'r radd flaenaf. Bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ymateb yn ffurfiol i'r prosesau hyn maes o law, ond hoffwn hysbysu Aelodau y prynhawn yma o'r egwyddorion a fydd yn llywio'r ymateb hwnnw.

Mae darlledu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yn bwysig. Mae darlledu yn rhy bwysig i'w adael i'r farchnad rydd. Yr oedd yn braf gweld y Ceidwadwyr, y prynhawn yma, yn cwyno am y defnydd o'r farchnad rydd, oherwydd yn sicr nid ydym am gael 57 o sianeli a dim byd i'w wyllo. Yng Nghymru, mae darlledu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yn hanfodol i wrthbwysio gwendidau strwythurol y farchnad bapurau newydd yng Nghymru. Yng Nghymru, yn wahanol i'r Alban, lle y mae amrywiaeth o bapurau newydd dalen



read here are written here. Without a vigorous public-service broadcasting sector, there will be a huge vacuum in reporting on life in Wales.

Alun Ffred made some important points about the nature of UK national news broadcasting in a devolved UK, and we will certainly be taking that up.

3.50 p.m.

We welcome the positive proposals by Tessa Jowell in respect of the future of the BBC. In our response, we will reaffirm our view that the increase in the proportion of network production should come from Wales, and that Welsh content has a prominent place on British screens. We will make further representations about licence fee affordability and the need to ensure, as far as is possible, within technical limitations, that the BBC's full output is available to licence payers.

Eleanor Burnham talked about the challenging topography of Wales—with 5 per cent of the population having 20 per cent of the transmitters; there are still blank spots. Satellite possibilities are, of course, available to many people, but not everyone is fully aware of that option. I know that some people, who cannot get Freeview at the moment, are concerned that they will not have terrestrial television after the switch-over. That is not the case. Analogue transmitters can be converted to transmit digital signals, but many of them cannot transmit both at the same time. However, for many people, when the analogue signal goes off, the digital will come on.

Reception difficulties are not confined to television. Digital radios have been sold in Wales in ever-increasing numbers—indeed, in more numbers than analogue radios at the moment. Yet, in many parts of Wales, we cannot receive Radio Wales or Radio Cymru on these new sets. Leighton Andrews referred to the new governance arrangements announced today. We think that it is very important that Welsh interests are fully represented in any new arrangements for the

lydan a thabloid ar gael, dim ond 15 y cant o'r papurau newydd a ddarllenir yma sy'n cael eu hysgrifennu yma. Heb sector darlledu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus egniol, bydd gwacter enfawr o ran croniclo bywyd yng Nghymru.

Gwnaeth Alun Ffred bwyntiau pwysig ynglŷn â natur darlledu newyddion cenedlaethol y DU wedi datganoli, a byddwn yn sicr am godi'r mater hwnnw.

Croesawn y cynigion cadarnhaol gan Tessa Jowell o ran dyfodol y BBC. Yn ein hymateb, byddwn yn cadarnhau eto ein barn y dylai'r cynnydd yn y gyfran o gynrychiadau rhwydwaith ddod o Gymru ac y dylai cynnwys Cymreig gael lle blaenllaw ar sgriniau ledled Prydain. Byddwn yn cyflwyno rhagor o sylwadau ynglŷn â fforddiadwyedd ffi'r drwydded a'r angen am sicrhau, cyn gynted ag y bo modd, o fewn terfynau technegol, bod holl raglenni'r BBC ar gael i dalwyr y drwydded.

Soniodd Eleanor Burnham am dopograffi anodd Cymru—gyda 5 y cant o'r boblogaeth ag 20 y cant o'r trosglwyddyddion; mae mannau o hyd lle na ellir derbyn llun. Wrth gwrs, mae posibiliadau o ran gwasanaeth lloeren ar gael i lawer o bobl, ond nid yw pawb yn hollol ymwybodol o'r opsiwn hwnnw. Gwn fod rhai pobl, na allant dderbyn Freeview ar hyn o bryd, yn poeni na chânt raglenni teledu daearol ar ôl y newid i ddigidol. Nid yw hynny'n wir. Mae'n bosibl newid trosglwyddyddion analog fel eu bod yn trosglwyddo signalau digidol, ond nid oes modd i lawer ohonynt drosglwyddo'r ddau ar yr un pryd. Fodd bynnag, i lawer o bobl, pan gaiff y signal analog ei ddiffodd, daw'r signal digidol yn weithredol.

Nid dim ond o ran teledu y mae anhawster i dderbyn gwasanaeth. Mae nifer gynyddol o radios digidol wedi cael eu gwerthu yng Nghymru—yn wir, mae mwy o radios digidol yn cael eu gwerthu na radios analog ar hyn o bryd. Ac eto, mewn sawl rhan o Gymru, ni allwn dderbyn Radio Wales na Radio Cymru ar y setiau newydd hyn. Cyfeiriodd Leighton Andrews at y trefniadau llywodraethu newydd a gyhoeddwyd heddiw. Credwn ei bod yn bwysig iawn bod buddiannau Cymru

governance of the BBC.

yn cael eu cynrychioli'n llawn mewn unrhyw drefniadau newydd ar gyfer llywodraethu'r BBC.

Turning to S4C, we have a very clear aim of a bilingual Wales.

Gan droi at S4C, mae nod eglur iawn gennym o gael Cymru ddwyieithog.

**Lisa Francis:** It was also floated past us today that there ought to be a merger between the BBC and S4C. There is a world of difference between working in partnership and conducting a merger, as you will know. If that were to occur, which organisation's culture do you think would override, and what would that do for Welsh-language production in Wales?

**Lisa Francis:** Awgrymwyd inni heddiw hefyd y dylai'r BBC a S4C uno. Mae byd o wahaniaeth rhwng gweithio mewn partneriaeth ac uno, fel y gwyddoch. Pe bai hynny'n digwydd, diwylliant pa sefydliad fyddai drechaf yn eich barn chi, a beth fyddai hynny yn ei olygu i gynyrchiadau Cymraeg yng Nghymru?

**Alun Pugh:** A full merger between the BBC and S4C is not likely to arise. We have a very clear aim of a bilingual Welsh nation, and we are certainly aware of the need to have high-quality public-service broadcasting in Welsh to support that.

**Alun Pugh:** Nid yw uno llawn rhwng y BBC a S4C yn debygol o godi. Mae gennym nod eglur iawn o greu cenedl ddwyieithog, ac yr ydym yn sicr yn ymwybodol o'r angen am ddarlledu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus o safon dda yn Gymraeg i ategu hynny.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Are you therefore of the opinion that this is the way that you will go, and that the BBC will swallow S4C?

**Eleanor Burnham:** Felly a gredwch mai dyna'r trywydd y byddwch yn ei ddilyn, ac y bydd y BBC yn meddiannu S4C?

**Alun Pugh:** I certainly did not say that. I said that we need high-quality public-service broadcasting in the Welsh language to support that clear, long-term policy aim. I recognise that S4C is under pressure at the moment: it is under financial pressure and pressure to maintain its audience share. It also needs to develop a new audience. It needs to develop programmes that appeal—*[Interruption.]*

**Alun Pugh:** Yn sicr, ni ddywedais hynny. Dywedais fod angen darlledu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus o safon dda yn y Gymraeg er mwyn ategu'r nod polisi hirdymor, eglur hwnnw. Cydnabyddaf fod S4C o dan bwysau ar hyn o bryd: mae o dan bwysau ariannol ac o dan bwysau i gadw ei chyfran o'r gynulleidfa. Mae angen iddi ddatblygu cynulleidfa newydd hefyd. Mae angen iddi ddatblygu rhaglenni sy'n apelio—*[Torri ar draws.]*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. This happens more and more often. It is out of order for two people to be standing in the Chamber at the same time. At the moment, the Minister has the floor. No-one else should be standing up. Many Members want to hear what the Minister has to say.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae hyn yn digwydd yn fwyfwy aml. Mae allan o drefn i ddau o bobl fod ar eu traed yn y Siambr ar yr un pryd. Ar hyn o bryd, y Gweinidog sy'n siarad. Ni ddylai neb arall fod ar ei draed. Mae llawer o Aelodau am glywed yr hyn sydd gan y Gweinidog i'w ddweud.

**Alun Pugh:** The costs of Welsh-language broadcasting are met by British budgets at the moment, not by Welsh ones, which is one of the many benefits of being an integral part of the United Kingdom. I have never seen any explanation of how that £100 million would be raised in an independent Wales, and I am

**Alun Pugh:** Telir costau darlledu cyfrwng Cymraeg o gyllidebau Prydeinig ar hyn o bryd, nid cyllidebau Cymreig, sef un o'r manteision lawer o fod yn rhan annatod o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Nid wyf erioed wedi gweld unrhyw esboniad sut y byddai'r swm hwnnw o £100 miliwn yn cael ei godi pe bai

not in the least bit surprised that we have had no suggestion or clarification on that this afternoon. I know that Owen John Thomas wanted to talk about Welsh regiments and St David's Day, but some clarification on that point may have been in order.

The relationship between S4C and the BBC is indeed evolving. The Assembly Government meets both organisations regularly, and today's Green Paper suggests that this relationship will continue to evolve. We will be keeping a very close eye on developments.

Turning to ITV, the Ofcom report has received a cautious welcome in many parts of Wales. The Assembly Government certainly welcomes the clear distinction between the proposals for Wales and the English regions. It is a clear recognition of responsibilities in a devolved UK, and, while we regret the loss of any Welsh programming, we recognise that digital switch-over causes a fall in the value of analogue licences—indeed, Ofcom's proposals may be contested with a view to reduction. However, the Assembly Government will contest any move to further reduce Welsh content. When that content is transmitted is also important; we do not want graveyard hours with graveyard budgets.

A helpful suggestion in Ofcom's proposals was the need to develop further in terms of the network. We would welcome a further development of network support for ITV outside the M25; we want to get more production here in Wales.

The amendments are the usual opposition *cawl*. They are a mixture of the unclear and the unnecessary tabled by the unelectable. They add nothing to the debate, and I ask the Assembly to reject them.

Cymru'n annibynnol, ac ni synnaf o gwbl nad ydym wedi cael nac awgrym nac eglurhad ynglŷn â hynny y prynhawn yma. Gwn fod Owen John Thomas am sôn am gatrodau Cymreig a Dydd Gŵyl Dewi, ond efallai y byddai ychydig o eglurhad ynglŷn â'r pwyt hwnnw wedi bod yn briodol.

Mae'r berthynas rhwng S4C a'r BBC yn wir yn datblygu. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cyfarfod â'r ddau sefydliad yn rheolaidd, ac mae Papur Gwyrdd heddiw yn awgrymu y bydd y berthynas hon yn parhau i ddatblygu. Byddwn yn cadw llygad barcud ar ddatblygiadau.

Gan droi at ITV, mae adroddiad Ofcom wedi cael ei led-groesawu mewn sawl rhan o Gymru. Yn sicr, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn croesawu'r gwahaniaeth clir rhwng y cynigion ar gyfer Cymru a rhanbarthau Lloegr. Mae'n gydnabyddiaeth glir o gyfrifoldebau yn y DU wedi datganoli, ac, er y byddem yn gresynu pe bai unrhyw raglenni Cymreig yn cael eu colli, cydnabyddwn fod y newid i ddigidol yn peri i werth trwyddedau analog leihau—yn wir, gellir herio cynigion Ofcom gyda'r nod o sicrhau gostyngiad. Fodd bynnag, bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwrthwynebu unrhyw ymgais i leihau cynnwys Cymreig ymhellach. Mae amseroedd darlledu'r cynnwys hwnnw hefyd yn bwysig; nid ydym am gael oriau yn hwyr yn y nos na chyllidebau sy'n adlewyrchiad o hynny.

Un awgrym defnyddiol yng nghynigion Ofcom oedd yr angen i ddatblygu ymhellach o ran y rhwydwaith. Byddem yn croesawu datblygiad pellach o gymorth rhwydwaith i ITV y tu allan i'r M25; yr ydym am gael mwy o gynrychiadau yma yng Nghymru.

Cawlach arferol y gwrthbleidiau yw'r gwelliannau. Maent yn gymysgedd o welliannau aneglur a diangen a gyflwynwyd gan rai na chânt eu hethol byth. Nid ydynt yn ychwanegu dim i'r ddadl, a gofynnaf i'r Cynulliad eu gwrthod.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 1: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 25, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
 Amendment 2: For 25, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne

Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 25, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 3: For 25, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 4: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
German, Michael  
Graham, William

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian

Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 25, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
 Amendment 5: For 25, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 25, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.*

*Amendment 6: For 25, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 16, Ymatal 9, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 7: For 16, Abstain 9, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter

Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment defeated.*

4.00 p.m.

*Cynnig (NNDM2321): O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 1.*  
*Motion (NNDM2321): For 54, Abstain 0, Against 1.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelod canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Member voted against:

Jones, Helen Mary



Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order**

**Jenny Randerson:** I raise a point of order under Standing Order No. 7.5. Will you clarify, Deputy Presiding Officer, that it is the procedure in the Chamber, when a Member is speaking and another Member wishes to intervene, for that Member to stand up, and, if the Member concerned has not noticed that someone wishes to make an intervention, by custom and practice, the Presiding Officer, or whoever is in the Chair, draws the attention of the Member who is speaking to the Member wishing to make an intervention? I make this point as my colleague, Eleanor Burnham, stood up, but failed to make any noise, and therefore was not noticed by Leighton Andrews.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Leighton Andrews may correct me, but I am fairly confident that he knew that Eleanor was trying to intervene.

**Leighton Andrews:** Further to that point of order, I confirm that I saw that Eleanor was trying to catch my eye, but I did not want to take her intervention.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That was

**Jenny Randerson:** Codaf bwynt o drefn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 7.5. A wnewch egluro, Ddirprwy Lywydd, mai gweithdrefn y Siambr yw, pan fydd Aelod yn siarad a bod Aelod arall am ymyrryd, y dylai'r Aelod hwnnw sefyll, ac, os nad yw'r Aelod dan sylw wedi sylwi bod rhywun am ymyrryd, yn ôl yr arfer, mae'r Llywydd, neu bwy bynnag sydd yn y Gadair, yn tynnu sylw'r Aelod sy'n siarad at yr Aelod sydd am ymyrryd? Gwnaf y pwynt hwn oherwydd safodd fy nghyd-Aelod, Eleanor Burnham, ond ni wnaeth unrhyw sŵn, ac felly ni sylwodd Leighton Andrews arni.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Efallai y bydd Leighton Andrews yn fy nghywiro, ond yr wyf yn weddol ffyddiog ei fod yn gwybod bod Eleanor yn ceisio ymyrryd.

**Leighton Andrews:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, cadarnhaf imi weld bod Eleanor yn ceisio dal fy sylw, ond nid oeddwn am dderbyn ei hymyriad.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Dyna'r hyn a ddeallais

clearly my understanding. The tactic, when Members do not give way, and other Members feel that they should, is to stand up more than once. However, if it is clear that the Member who is speaking is not going to give way, it is discourteous to keep standing, and, eventually, disrupt the debate. These things are never perfect, and we should move on.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I raise a point of order under Standing Order No. 7.7(iv), on discourteous behaviour. Without being patronising to Leighton Andrews, he was making a speech in Welsh, which is his second language. I was sitting next to him, and he was having difficulty with another Member trying to intervene continually. He wanted to finish his speech in Welsh, and I do not think it was fair. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.']

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. We obviously encourage Members whose first language is not Welsh to make speeches in the language, but the primary purpose of the Chamber is for debate, and to be the nation's forum for political argument. I think that we are all sufficiently grown up by now to understand how these matters should be carried out.

### **Adroddiad Blynyddol y Pwyllgor Safonau a Diwygio Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 16 The Annual Report of the Standards Committee and Amendments to Standing Order No. 16**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** It is proposed that these items be debated together, unless any Member objects. I see that there are no objections.

**Kirsty Williams:** I propose that

*the National Assembly, in accordance with Standing Order Nos. 6.6 and 16.1, notes the annual report of the Committee on Standards of Conduct for 2003-04, which was laid in the Table Office on 22 February 2005. (NDM2318)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly, acting under section 46(6) of the Government of Wales Act 1998*

yn sicr. Y dacteg, pan nad yw Aelodau yn ildio, a phan deimla Aelodau eraill y dylent wneud, yw sefyll mwy nag unwaith. Fodd bynnag, os yw'n glir nad yw'r Aelod sy'n siarad yn mynd i ildio, mae'n anghwrtais i barhau i sefyll, gan amharu ar y ddadl yn y pen draw. Nid yw'r pethau hyn byth yn berffaith, a dylem symud ymlaen.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Codaf bwynt o drefn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 7.7(iv), ar ymddygiad anghwrtais. Heb fod yn nawddoglyd i Leighton Andrews, yr oedd yn gwneud araith yn Gymraeg, sef ei ail iaith. Yr oeddwn yn eistedd ar ei bwys, ac yr oedd yn cael anhawster am fod Aelod arall yn ceisio ymyrryd drwy'r amser. Yr oedd am orffen ei araith yn Gymraeg, ac ni chredaf ei bod yn deg. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.']

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Yr ydym yn amlwg yn annog Aelodau nad ydynt yn siarad Cymraeg fel iaith gyntaf i wneud areithiau yn yr iaith, ond prif ddiben y Siambr yw cynnal dadleuon, a bod yn fforwm y wlad ar gyfer trafodaeth wleidyddol. Credaf ein bod oll yn ddigon aeddfed erbyn hyn i ddeall sut y dylid gwneud y pethau hyn.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Cynigir y dylid trafod yr eitemau hyn gyda'i gilydd, oni bai bod unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu hynny. Gwelaf nad oes unrhyw wrthwynebiadau.

**Kirsty Williams:** Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn unol â Rheolau Sefydlog Rhif 6.6 a Rhif 16.1, yn nodi Adroddiad Blynyddol y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad ar gyfer 2003-04, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Chwefror 2005. (NDM2318)*

Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan adran 46(6) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth*

and Standing Order No. 37,

1. considers the report of the Business Committee, which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 23 February; and

2. approves the amendments to Standing Orders set out in the report. (NDM2319)

I propose the motion on behalf of the Committee on Standards of Conduct—*[Interruption.]*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I do not know what the matter is today. I ask Members who wish to leave the Chamber to please do so quietly.

**Kirsty Williams:** Thank you, Deputy Presiding Officer. The Committee on Standards of Conduct is required to present an annual report to the Assembly on complaints against Members that have been referred to it, on the action it has taken on those complaints, and on its conclusions in respect of ethical standards in the conduct of the Assembly's business. This debate also allows the Committee to present its conclusions on these matters, as well as providing an opportunity for a more general debate on standards of conduct in the National Assembly for Wales. On this occasion, it also provides an opportunity to debate a number of important changes to Standing Orders, which will help to implement some of the recommendations of the Woodhouse report on our procedures for dealing with complaints against Assembly Members and for providing the Assembly with impartial advice on Members' conduct.

During the period covered by this report, from August to December 2004, only two complaints were referred to the committee. The committee has already provided comprehensive reports to the Assembly on the outcome of these complaints, both of which were unanimously dismissed by the committee. In addition, a number of complaints were made that did not come before the committee. In one case, the complaint was withdrawn by the complainant, and the remainder were

*Cymru 1998 a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 37:*

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Busnes, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd mewn e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 23 Chwefror; a

2. yn cymeradwyo'r diwygiadau i'r Rheolau Sefydlog a nodir yn yr Adroddiad. (NDM2319)

Cynigiau y cynnig ar ran y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad—*[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Ni wn beth sy'n bod heddiw. Gofynnaf i Aelodau sy'n dymuno gadael y Siambr wneud hynny'n dawel.

**Kirsty Williams:** Diolch, Ddirprwy Lywydd. Mae'n ofynnol i'r Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad gyflwyno adroddiad blynyddol i'r Cynulliad ar y cwynion yn erbyn Aelodau a gyfeiriwyd iddo, ar y camau a gymerwyd ganddo i ymdrin â'r cwynion hynny, ac ar ei gasgliadau mewn perthynas â safonau moesegol wrth gynnal busnes y Cynulliad. Mae'r ddadl hon hefyd yn galluogi'r Pwyllgor i gyflwyno ei gasgliadau ar y materion hyn, yn ogystal â rhoi cyfle i gynnal trafodaeth fwy cyffredinol ar safonau ymddygiad yng Nghynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Heddiw, mae hefyd yn rhoi cyfle i drafod nifer o newidiadau pwysig i'r Rheolau Sefydlog, a fydd yn helpu i weithredu rhai o argymhellion adroddiad Woodhouse ar ein gweithdrefnau ar gyfer ymdrin â chwynion yn erbyn Aelodau'r Cynulliad ac ar gyfer rhoi cyngor diduedd i'r Cynulliad ar ymddygiad Aelodau.

Yn ystod y cyfnod a gwmpesir gan yr adroddiad hwn, o fis Awst i fis Rhagfyr 2004, dim ond dwy gŵyn a gyfeiriwyd i'r pwyllgor. Mae'r pwyllgor eisoes wedi rhoi adroddiadau cynhwysfawr i'r Cynulliad ar ganlyniad y cwynion hyn, a gwrthodwyd ill dwy gan y pwyllgor yn unfrydol. Yn ogystal, gwnaed nifer o gwynion na ddaethant gerbron y pwyllgor. Mewn un achos, tynnwyd y gŵyn yn ôl gan yr achwynydd, ac ymchwiliwyd y gweddill gan y cynghorydd annibynnol, a argymhellodd y dylid eu

investigated by the independent adviser, who recommended that they should be dismissed. I am pleased that, for the first time, a breakdown of all these complaints, including those that did not reach the committee, has been included in our report.

From the evidence of the number of complaints made against Members, and the outcome of these complaints, particularly those that the committee itself considered, the committee has concluded that there seem to be few grounds for concern about the ethical standards of Members of the National Assembly for Wales. However, the committee report makes the important point—and it has become something of a tradition to remind Members of this on these occasions—that we must guard against complacency. Good standards in the past are no guarantee of good standards in the future. Maintaining high ethical standards is not just the responsibility of the Committee on Standards of Conduct and of those Members who sit on that committee, but the responsibility of each and every Assembly Member. The committee can advise, but the primary responsibility for honouring the trust that the public has placed in Assembly Members rests with every individual.

The fact that relatively few complaints have come before the committee does not mean that those that have been considered have been straightforward. Prompted by extensive media coverage of one particular complaint, the committee has considered whether steps could be taken to protect the complaints process from intrusive media coverage. The committee concluded that, while media coverage is not always helpful, there is little, realistically, that could be done to prevent it. The committee also felt that the dangers of trying to fetter media coverage would outweigh any possible benefits. However, we will keep the matter under review in the light of developing experience.

To turn to other aspects of the committee's work programme, although the committee's consideration of complaints is often what attracts most interest, its work programme is not primarily to deal with complaints. For instance, part of its remit is to supervise

gwrthod. Yr wyf yn falch bod dadansoddiad o'r holl gwynion hyn, gan gynnwys y rhai na ddaethant gerbron y pwyllgor, wedi'i gynnwys am y tro cyntaf yn ein hadroddiad.

O'r dystiolaeth o nifer y cwynion a wnaed yn erbyn Aelodau, a chanlyniadau'r cwynion hyn, yn arbennig y rhai a ystyriwyd gan y pwyllgor ei hun, mae'r pwyllgor wedi dod i'r casgliad nad oes fawr o reswm dros bryderu ynghylch safonau moesegol Aelodau Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn ôl pob golwg. Fodd bynnag, mae adroddiad y pwyllgor yn gwneud pwynt pwysig—ac mae wedi datblygu yn rhyw fath o draddodiad erbyn hyn i atgoffa Aelodau o hyn ar yr adegau hyn—bod yn rhaid inni ochel rhag bod yn hunanfodlon. Nid yw safonau da yn y gorffennol yn sicrhau safonau da yn y dyfodol. Nid dim ond y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad a'r Aelodau hynny sy'n aelod o'r pwyllgor hwnnw sy'n gyfrifol am gynnal safonau moesegol uchel, ond pob un o Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Gall y pwyllgor gynghori, ond mae pob unigolyn yn gyfrifol am anrhydeddu'r ymddiriedaeth sydd gan y cyhoedd yn Aelodau'r Cynulliad.

Nid yw'r ffaith mai nifer gymharol fach o gwynion sydd wedi dod gerbron y pwyllgor yn golygu bod y rhai a ystyriwyd wedi bod yn syml. Wedi'i ysgogi gan y sylw sylweddol a roddwyd yn y cyfryngau i gŵyn benodol, mae'r pwyllgor wedi ystyried a ellid cymryd camau i ddiogelu'r broses gwyno rhag gormod o sylw yn y cyfryngau. Daeth y pwyllgor i'r casgliad, er nad yw sylw yn y cyfryngau bob amser yn ddefnyddiol, nad oes llawer y gellid ei wneud, yn realistig, i'w atal. Yr oedd y pwyllgor hefyd o'r farn y byddai peryglon ceisio cyfyngu ar sylw yn y cyfryngau yn gorbwyso unrhyw fanteision posibl. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn parhau i adolygu'r mater yng ngoleuni'r profiad a feithrinir.

I droi at agweddau eraill ar raglen waith y pwyllgor, er mai gwaith y pwyllgor o ystyried cwynion sy'n denu'r sylw mwyaf yn aml, nid delio â chwynion yw ei raglen waith yn bennaf. Er enghraifft, rhan o'i gylch gwaith yw goruchwyllo trefniadau mewn

arrangements in respect of the register of Members' interests. During the last year, the committee approved new arrangements for registering interests, which we hope will make it easier for Members to identify the key information that they need to provide when registering interests. Staff in the Table Office are always available to provide guidance to Members on specific issues, and I know that many Members appreciate the advice that they have received. The committee has also agreed a number of clarifications to current guidance: for instance, in relation to residential properties.

The committee has also made good progress on implementing a number of recommendations that arose out of the Woodhouse report on standards procedures. In particular, after thorough consideration, it has been agreed to revise the complaints procedure, based on the recommendations of the Woodhouse review. The procedure is set out in the committee's report to Plenary, which was laid in the Table Office on 23 February.

The committee believes that the new procedure will be clearer and more consistent, while providing for complaints to be dealt with sensitively. It will allow complaints on relatively minor matters, where the facts are not disputed, to be dealt with more quickly and without the need for a formal investigation. It sets out clear procedures in the event of the commissioner for standards being unable to carry out an investigation, provides a mechanism for dealing with disputed facts, includes an appeals procedure for Members in cases where factual inaccuracies have arisen, or where procedural irregularities have prejudiced the Member's right to a fair hearing, and it would allow the Assembly to propose a motion of censure where a Member is found to be in breach of procedures, but where the exclusion of the Member under Standing Order No. 4 is not appropriate.

4.10 p.m.

Some of these changes require enabling amendments to Standing Orders, and the necessary changes are set out in named day motion NDM2319, which you will be asked

perthynas â chofrestr buddiannau'r Aelodau. Yn ystod y llynedd, cymeradwyodd y pwyllgor drefniadau newydd ar gyfer cofrestru buddiannau, a gobeithiwn y bydd y rhain yn ei gwneud yn haws i Aelodau nodi'r wybodaeth allweddol y mae'n rhaid iddynt ei rhoi wrth gofrestru buddiannau. Mae staff y Swyddfa Gyflwyno bob amser ar gael i roi cyfarwyddyd i Aelodau ar faterion penodol, a gwn fod llawer o Aelodau yn gwerthfawrogi'r cyngor a gawsant. Mae'r pwyllgor hefyd wedi cytuno ar sawl esboniad o ran y canllawiau presennol: er enghraifft, mewn perthynas ag eiddo preswyl.

Mae'r pwyllgor wedi gwneud cynnydd da hefyd ar weithredu nifer o argymhellion a ddeilliodd o adroddiad Woodhouse ar weithdrefnau safonau. Yn arbennig, ar ôl ystyriaeth drylwyr, cytunwyd i ddiwygio'r weithdrefn gwyno, yn seiliedig ar argymhellion adolygiad Woodhouse. Nodir y weithdrefn yn adroddiad y pwyllgor i'r Cyfarfod Llawn, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 23 Chwefror.

Cred y pwyllgor y bydd y weithdrefn newydd yn gliriach ac yn fwy cyson, tra'n sicrhau y gellir ymdrin â chwynion mewn ffordd sensitif. Bydd yn caniatáu ymdrin â chwynion ar faterion nad ydynt yn rhy ddifrifol, lle na cheir anghydfod ynghylch y ffeithiau, yn gyflymach a heb orfod cynnal ymchwiliad ffurfiol. Mae'n nodi gweithdrefnau clir os na all y comisiynydd safonau gynnal ymchwiliad, yn darparu dull ar gyfer ymdrin â ffeithiau y mae anghydfod yn eu cylch, yn cynnwys gweithdrefn apelio ar gyfer Aelodau lle y ceir anghywirdeb ffeithiol, neu lle y mae afreoleidd-dra gweithdrefnol wedi amharu ar hawl yr Aelod i gael gwrandawriad teg, a byddai'n caniatáu i'r Cynulliad gynnig cynnig o gerydd lle y canfyddir bod Aelod wedi torri'r gweithdrefnau, ond lle nad yw'n briodol gwahardd yr Aelod o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 4.

Mae rhai o'r newidiadau hyn yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol cyflwyno diwygiadau galluogi i'r Rheolau Sefydlog, a nodir y newidiadau angenrheidiol yn y cynnig â dyddiad trafod

to vote on immediately after voting on the motion that we are currently debating.

Although the new procedure represents a significant step towards implementing the Woodhouse recommendations, further work remains to be done, and this will be taken forward by the committee over the coming months.

Over the last five years, the Assembly has been well served by Richard Penn as the independent adviser on standards of conduct. In addition to his role in investigating complaints, he advises the committee more generally on standards issues, and I am sure that the Assembly will join me in thanking him for his work on our behalf.

However, the Woodhouse review recommended that the Assembly should consider creating a statutory commissioner for standards, in line with practice in other legislatures. This would demonstrate how seriously we take standards of conduct and further embed independence from political interference into our procedures. The committee accepted this recommendation, but recognised that the change would require primary legislation. As an interim measure, the committee agreed that a non-statutory commissioner for standards should be created through our Standing Orders. As I mentioned earlier, the necessary changes to Standing Orders to achieve this are set out in the motion NDM2319, and I commend these changes to you. The new post will emphasise the importance that the Assembly attaches to high ethical standards, and will provide greater independence in the investigation of complaints.

I thank the other members of the committee for their work in often difficult circumstances. The members of the committee have continued to work together in a spirit of co-operation, which sets aside party politics. It is a tribute to the committee that the two most recent complaints that it has considered, which involved Members from two different political parties, have been decided upon unanimously by the committee. This non-partisan approach is evident not

NDM2319. Gofynnir ichi bleidleisio ar hynny yn syth ar ôl pleidleisio ar y cynnig a drafodwn ar hyn o bryd.

Er bod y weithdrefn newydd yn gam sylweddol tuag at weithredu argymhellion Woodhouse, erys mwy o waith i'w wneud, a bydd y pwyllgor yn ymdrin â hyn dros y misoedd nesaf.

Yn ystod y pum mlynedd diwethaf, mae Richard Penn, y cynghorydd annibynnol ar safonau ymddygiad, wedi gwasanaethu'r Cynulliad yn dda. Yn ogystal â'i rôl yn ymchwilio i gwynion, mae'n cynghori'r pwyllgor yn fwy cyffredinol ar faterion o ran safonau, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Cynulliad yn ymuno â mi i ddiolch iddo am ei waith ar ein rhan.

Fodd bynnag, argymhellodd adolygiad Woodhouse y dylai'r Cynulliad ystyried creu comisiynydd statudol ar gyfer safonau, yn unol ag arfer deddfwrfeydd eraill. Byddai hyn yn dangos ein bod yn cymryd safonau ymddygiad o ddirif a byddai'n gwneud ein gweithdrefnau yn fwy annibynnol ar ymyrraeth wleidyddol. Derbyniodd y pwyllgor yr argymhelliad hwn, ond cydnabu y byddai angen deddfwriaeth sylfaenol i gyflwyno'r newid. Fel mesur dros dro, cytunodd y pwyllgor y dylid creu comisiynydd anstatudol ar gyfer safonau drwy ein Rheolau Sefydlog. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, nodir y newidiadau y bydd angen eu gwneud i'r Rheolau Sefydlog i sicrhau hyn yng nghynnig NDM2319, a chymeradwyaf y newidiadau hyn ichi. Bydd y swydd newydd yn pwysleisio'r pwys a roddir gan y Cynulliad i safonau moesegol uchel, a bydd yn sicrhau mwy o annibyniaeth wrth ymchwilio i gwynion.

Diolchaf i aelodau eraill y pwyllgor am eu gwaith o dan amgylchiadau oedd yn aml yn anodd. Mae aelodau'r pwyllgor wedi parhau i gydweithio mewn ysbryd o gydweithredu, sy'n rhoi gwleidyddiaeth blaid o'r neilltu. Mae'n deyrnged i'r pwyllgor ei fod wedi gwneud penderfyniad unfrydol ar y ddwy gŵyn ddiweddaf a ystyriodd, a oedd ynghylch Aelodau o ddwy blaid wahanol. Mae'r ymagwedd amhleidiol hon yn amlwg wrth ymdrin â chwynion, ond hefyd yng

only when dealing with complaints, but also in the committee's more general work. It is important that this approach continues in the future, and I am confident that it will.

I also thank my colleague, Mick Bates, who chaired the committee during my maternity leave last year. I also thank the small secretariat for its support during a difficult year. I have already mentioned Richard Penn's contribution to the committee's work, and, again, I offer him and the officials my heartfelt thanks for the support that they have offered me as Chair.

In this context, I also thank Tom Frawley, the Northern Ireland Ombudsman, who, at short notice, agreed to investigate a complaint on our behalf when Richard Penn was unable to do so. This was due in no small part to the excellent relations that the secretariat for the Committee on Standards of Conduct have established with their colleagues in the UK Parliament, the Irish Dáil, the Scottish Parliament and the Northern Ireland Assembly.

On behalf of the Committee on Standards of Conduct, I commend the committee's annual report to Members. I also commend to you the proposed changes to Standing Orders set out in the Business Committee's report of 23 February.

**Brynle Williams:** The fifth annual report of the Committee on Standards of Conduct, which is laid before Members today, is balanced and accurately reflects the work that the committee has done over the last year.

The committee works in a productive manner, with politics removed. All complaints which have been presented to Members have been thoroughly investigated and reported upon in a balanced and sensible manner. As I stated last year, we must remember that the code of conduct is an ever-changing document, and Members must be fully conversant with it in order to know the rules and regulations that we must adhere to at all times. The Assembly as a body has a duty to support Members in their role and to provide support and training as and when necessary.

ngwaith mwy cyffredinol y pwyllgor. Mae'n bwysig bod yr ymagwedd hon yn parhau yn y dyfodol, ac yr wyf yn ffyddiog o hynny.

Diolchaf hefyd i'm cyd-Aelod, Mick Bates, a gadeiriodd y pwyllgor yn ystod fy absenoldeb mamolaeth y llynedd. Diolchaf hefyd i'r ysgrifenyddiaeth fach am ei chefnogaeth yn ystod blwyddyn anodd. Yr wyf eisoes wedi cyfeirio at gyfraniad Richard Penn i waith y pwyllgor ac, unwaith eto, diolchaf o'm calon iddo ef a'r swyddogion am y gefnogaeth y maent wedi'i rhoi imi fel Cadeirydd.

Yn y cyd-destun hwn, diolchaf hefyd i Tom Frawley, Ombwdsmon Gogledd Iwerddon, a gytunodd, ar fyr rybudd, i ymchwilio i gŵyn ar ein rhan pan na allai Richard Penn wneud hynny. Rhan bwysig o'r rheswm dros hyn yw'r gydbertynas ardderchog y mae ysgrifenyddiaeth y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad wedi'i meithrin â'i chyd-aelodau yn Senedd y DU, Dáil yr Iwerddon, Senedd yr Alban a Chynulliad Gogledd Iwerddon.

Ar ran y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad, cymeradwyaf adroddiad blynyddol y pwyllgor i'r Aelodau. Cymeradwyaf ichi hefyd y newidiadau arfaethedig i'r Rheolau Sefydlog a nodir yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor Busnes a gyhoeddwyd ar 23 Chwefror.

**Brynle Williams:** Mae pumed adroddiad blynyddol y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad, a osodir gerbron yr Aelodau heddiw, yn gytbwys ac yn adlewyrchu'r gwaith y mae'r pwyllgor wedi'i wneud yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf yn gywir.

Mae'r pwyllgor yn gweithio mewn ffordd gynhyrchiol, heb ystyried gwleidyddiaeth. Ymchwiliwyd yn drylwyr i bob cwyn a gyflwynwyd i Aelodau a chyflwynwyd adroddiad cytbwys a synhwyrol arnynt. Fel y dywedais y llynedd, rhaid inni gofio bod y côd ymddygiad yn newid drwy'r amser, a rhaid i Aelodau fod yn gwbl gyfarwydd ag ef er mwyn gwybod y rheolau a'r rheoliadau y mae'n rhaid inni lynu wrthynt bob amser. Mae gan y Cynulliad fel corff ddyletswydd i gefnogi Aelodau yn eu rôl a rhoi cymorth a hyfforddiant iddynt fel y bo'n briodol.

The committee has a wide and varied remit, and the workload has been great. It is perhaps one of the most important committees, because it oversees the conduct of Members and the establishment as a whole. Not all issues have been straightforward, but a compromise has generally been reached. The ability to complain must remain straightforward but must not be used as a vehicle for party-political complaints or, as Kirsty said, for trivial matters. In order for the Assembly to be judged as an establishment that is working for, and is properly accountable to, the people of Wales, all complaints raised need to be fully heard. The support of the independent adviser has been invaluable to Members.

Perhaps the most important sentence in the report relates to there being no grounds for complacency if the highest levels of ethical standards are to be maintained. It is essential that the committee revisits this particular strand on many occasions, to ensure the highest possible standards in public office at all times.

**Peter Law:** I compliment the Chair and the members of the committee on their work; there is no doubt that it is important, and is appreciated by all Members. Looking through the report, I notice that they still spend a considerable amount of time talking about freemasonry, though they have said that they see no reason to change the advice that they gave in Plenary in 2002. However, the more that this issue is referred to, the more it is publicised. How can we define these closed organisations referred to in the report? What is the definition of a closed organisation? Is it an organisation that is registered with the registrar of friendly societies? I do not believe that those who are in the buffalo or moose lodge have the same level of influence as Freemasons. That is not a fair comparison. I am interested to know how these matters are considered by the Committee on Standards of Conduct, and would like to hear more from the Chair on that point, please. Some old and worthy organisations, which are traditional in many areas, would find it unfair to be put on a register of closed organisations because they happen to ballot their members to allow someone to join—a traditional activity. I do

Mae gan y pwyllgor gylch gwaith eang ac amrywiol, a bu'r llwyth gwaith yn fawr. Efallai ei fod yn un o'r pwyllgorau pwysicaf, am ei fod yn goruchwyllo ymddygiad Aelodau a'r sefydliad cyfan. Ni fu pob mater yn syml, ond cafwyd cyfaddawd fel arfer. Rhaid bod y gallu i gwyno yn syml o hyd ac ni ddylid ei ddefnyddio fel cyfrwng i gyflwyno cwynion pleidiol neu, fel y dywedodd Kirsty, am faterion dibwys. Er mwyn i'r Cynulliad gael ei ystyried yn sefydliad sy'n gweithio dros bobl Cymru, ac sy'n atebol iddynt yn briodol, mae angen gwrandod llawn ar bob cwyn a godir. Bu cymorth y cynghorydd annibynnol yn hynod werthfawr i Aelodau.

Efallai fod a wnelo'r frawddeg bwysicaf yn yr adroddiad â'r ffaith nad oes lle i fod yn hunanfodlon er mwyn cynnal y safonau moesegol uchaf. Mae'n hanfodol bod y pwyllgor yn ailystyried yr elfen benodol hon ar sawl achlysur, er mwyn sicrhau'r safonau uchaf posibl mewn swydd gyhoeddus bob amser.

**Peter Law:** Canmolaf y Cadeirydd ac aelodau'r pwyllgor am eu gwaith; mae'n bwysig yn ddi-au, ac fe'i gwerthfawrogir gan bob Aelod. Wrth edrych drwy'r adroddiad, sylwaf eu bod yn dal i dreulio llawer iawn o amser o hyd yn siarad am y Seiri Rhyddion, er eu bod wedi dweud na welant unrhyw reswm dros newid y cyngor a roesant yn y Cyfarfod Llawn yn 2002. Fodd bynnag, po fwyaf y cyfeirir at y mater, y mwyaf o gyhoeddusrwydd a roddir iddo. Sut y gallwn ddiffinio'r sefydliadau caeedig hyn y cyfeirir atynt yn yr adroddiad? Beth yw'r diffiniad o sefydliad caeedig? Ai sefydliad sydd wedi'i gofrestru gyda chofrestrydd cymdeithasau budd ydyw? Ni chredaf fod gan y rhai sydd yn aelodau o urdd y byfflo neu'r elc yr un dylanwad â Seiri Rhyddion. Nid yw hynny'n gymhariaeth deg. Mae diddordeb gennyf wybod sut y caiff y materion hyn eu hystyried gan y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad, a hoffwn glywed mwy gan y Cadeirydd ar y pwynt hwnnw, os gwelwch yn dda. Byddai rhai sefydliadau hen a theilwng, sy'n draddodiadol mewn sawl ardal, yn ei chael yn annheg cael eu rhoi ar gofrestr o sefydliadau caeedig oherwydd eu bod yn



not see any similarity with freemasonry.

digwydd cynnal pleidlais o'u haelodau i ganiatáu i rywun ymuno—gweithgaredd traddodiadol. Ni welaf unrhyw debygolrwydd â'r Seiri Rhyddion.

**Kirsty Williams:** I thank Brynle for his contribution and comments, and for the active and constructive role that he has played as a member of the committee since his election. I am grateful for his efforts. Peter Law is right to say that the committee has, again, spent a considerable amount of time looking in depth at the issues that arise from the Standing Order requirement to record members of the Freemasons. We have done so as we believe that this is a serious issue that raises serious considerations for the entire Assembly. We took that time to explore all possible options and to consider the various ways that these issues could be looked at. You are quite right to say that, following these discussions, the Committee on Standards of Conduct is not minded to change its advice to Plenary regarding this requirement under Standing Orders. The committee has asked the Business Minister to find a slot during Plenary time for a full debate on the issue of freemasonry, in which I am sure that you will want to participate. We await an available date, so that Members can once again consider the argument and the lengthy consideration of the committee on this issue. Members will then be free to come to their own conclusions on that. I am sure, Peter, that you will wait for that opportunity.

**Kirsty Williams:** Diolchaf i Brynle am ei gyfraniad a'i sylwadau, ac am y rhan weithgar ac adeiladol y mae wedi'i chwarae fel aelod o'r pwyllgor ers iddo gael ei ethol. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am ei ymdrechion. Mae Peter Law yn gywir i ddweud bod y pwyllgor, unwaith eto, wedi treulio llawer o amser yn ystyried yn fanwl y materion sy'n deillio o ofyniad y Rheolau Sefydlog i gofnodi aelodau o'r Seiri Rhyddion. Yr ydym wedi gwneud hynny am ein bod yn credu bod hwn yn fater difrifol sy'n codi ystyriaethau difrifol i'r Cynulliad cyfan. Bu inni dreulio'r amser hwnnw yn archwilio'r holl opsiynau posibl ac yn ystyried y ffyrdd gwahanol y gellir ystyried y materion hyn. Yr ydych yn gywir i ddweud nad yw'r Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad, yn dilyn y trafodaethau hyn, am newid ei gyngor i'r Cyfarfod Llawn o ran y gofyniad hwn o dan y Rheolau Sefydlog. Mae'r pwyllgor wedi gofyn i'r Trefnydd bennu amser mewn Cyfarfod Llawn i gynnal dadl lawn ar y Seiri Rhyddion, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch am gymryd rhan yn hynny. Arhoswn am ddyddiad, fel y gall Aelodau ystyried y ddadl ac ystyriaeth hirfaith y pwyllgor ar y mater hwn unwaith eto. Wedyn gall Aelodau ddod i'w casgliadau eu hunain ar y mater. Yr wyf yn siŵr, Peter, y byddwch yn aros am y cyfle hwnnw.

In the absence of any further speakers, I once again commend the annual report to Assembly Members and trust that they will feel able to support it.

Yn absenoldeb unrhyw siaradwyr eraill, cymeradwyaf yr adroddiad blynyddol i Aelodau'r Cynulliad unwaith eto a hyderaf y byddant yn gallu ei gefnogi.

4.20 p.m.

*Cynnig (NDM2318): O blaid 36, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2318): For 36, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Janet

Davies, Jocelyn  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2319): O blaid 40, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2319): For 40, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val

Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

## **Dadl Fer Short Debate**

### **Y Ddarpariaeth Gofal Plant yng Nghymru Childcare Provision in Wales**

**Jonathan Morgan:** I was surprised to discover that I had once again won the ballot for the short debate; it seems to be becoming a regular slot for me. However, I am delighted to raise the subject of childcare and the funding of childcare in Wales. The timing of this debate is useful, not least because the final report of the Welsh Assembly Government's childcare working group landed on our desks this morning. It is a useful document and has helped to inform the remarks that I will be making this afternoon.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yr oedd yn syndod gennyf glywed fy mod wedi ennill y bleidlais unwaith eto ar gyfer y ddadl fer; ymddengys ei fod yn dod yn slot rheolaidd imi. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bleser gennyf drafod gofal plant a'r broses o ariannu gofal plant yng Nghymru. Mae amseriad y ddadl hon yn ddefnyddiol, yn arbennig gan fod copïau o adroddiad terfynol gweithgor gofal plant Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi glanio ar ein desgiau y bore yma. Mae'n ddogfen ddefnyddiol ac mae wedi helpu i lywio'r sylwadau y byddaf yn eu gwneud y prynhawn yma.

I have agreed to allow contributions from Jenny Randerson, Helen Mary Jones and Lynne Neagle, but I am not sure whether Jenny will be returning to take part in the debate.

Yr wyf wedi cytuno i ganiatáu cyfraniadau gan Jenny Randerson, Helen Mary Jones a Lynne Neagle, ond nid wyf yn siŵr pa un a fydd Jenny yn dychwelyd i gymryd rhan yn y dadl.

The subject of this debate is the funding of childcare because of the concerns expressed by one group in particular, namely Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs. This organisation was established in 2001 to set up kids' clubs the length and breadth of Wales and was supported by the Government via a substantial grant. I am focusing on this group as an important contributor to childcare in Wales because it has been informed that its work is threatened by a substantial cut in funding.

Pwnc y ddadl hon yw'r broses o ariannu gofal plant ac mae'n deillio o'r pryderon a fynegwyd gan un grŵp yn arbennig, sef Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs. Sefydlwyd y mudiad hwn yn 2001 i sefydlu clybiau plant ar hyd a lled Cymru a chafodd gefnogaeth gan y Llywodraeth ar ffurf grant sylweddol. Yr wyf yn canolbwyntio ar y grŵp hwn fel un sy'n gwneud cyfraniad pwysig i ofal plant yng Nghymru am iddo gael ei hysbysu bod toriadau ariannol sylweddol yn peryglu ei waith.

This organisation was set up with a substantial £1 million funding package, as a

Sefydlwyd y mudiad hwn gyda phecyn ariannu sylweddol gwerth £1 filiwn, fel

three-year project to develop out-of-school childcare clubs. The aim was to contribute to the WAG strategy of expanding childcare provision in imaginative ways by including people from the voluntary sector in various parts of Wales, and it enjoyed a huge degree of success. In October 2001, there were 589 out-of-school clubs in Wales; by December 2004, that had risen to 1,166, which I think people will agree is a dramatic achievement. It is an achievement of which Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs and the Government should be proud, considering the funding resource that had been allocated to achieve that substantial increase.

When you look at where these clubs have been established, you will see that there have been substantial percentage increases all over Wales. There was an increase of some 102 per cent in Denbighshire; an increase of 152 per cent in Carmarthenshire; and a 129 per cent increase in Neath Port Talbot. This has also happened in some of the most deprived communities in Wales, where the Government has been keen to encourage the establishment of out-of-school clubs. In Caerphilly, there has been an increase of some 380 per cent; Merthyr Tydfil has had an increase of 650 per cent; and in Rhondda Cynon Taf there has been a 217 per cent increase. There has been some very imaginative work and excellent increases in the number of clubs available for children in those communities. We should pay tribute to the work of the organisation, and to the Government for allocating that resource in the first instance. However, with a funding cut, of which the organisation has been notified, what is the future of these clubs, and of those planned increases in the number of clubs, particularly in those deprived areas where I know the Government has taken a particular interest?

Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs has been told that it will receive a 60 per cent funding cut. I understand that the organisation was told of this cut without warning and without explanation—maybe the Minister can take that back to her officials. For a Government that prides itself on partnership and building relations with the voluntary sector and with

prosiect tair blynedd i ddatblygu clybiau gofal plant y tu allan i oriau ysgol. Y nod oedd cyfrannu at strategaeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ehangu'r ddarpariaeth gofal plant mewn ffyrdd creadigol drwy gynnwys pobl o'r sector gwirfoddol mewn amrywiol rannau o Gymru, a bu'n llwyddiannus iawn. Ym mis Hydref 2001, yr oedd 589 o glybiau y tu allan i oriau ysgol yng Nghymru; erbyn mis Rhagfyr 2004, yr oedd y nifer hwnnw wedi codi i 1,166, a chredaf y bydd pobl yn cytuno bod hynny'n gyflawniad dramatig. Mae'n gyflawniad y dylai Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs a'r Llywodraeth ymfalchïo ynddo, o ystyried y cyllid a ddyrannwyd i gyflawni'r cynnydd sylweddol hwnnw.

Os edrychwch ar leoliadau'r clybiau hyn, fe welwch gynnydd canrannol sylweddol ledled Cymru. Bu cynnydd o tua 102 y cant yn sir Ddinbych; cynnydd o 152 y cant yn sir Gaerfyrddin; a chynnydd o 129 y cant yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot. Gwelwyd cynnydd o'r fath hefyd yn rhai o'r cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig yng Nghymru, lle y bu'r Llywodraeth yn awyddus i annog y broses o sefydlu clybiau y tu allan i oriau ysgol. Yng Nghaerffili, bu cynnydd o tua 380 y cant; bu cynnydd o 650 y cant ym Merthyr Tudful; ac yn Rhondda Cynon Taf bu cynnydd o 217 y cant. Gwelwyd gwaith llawn dychymyg a chynnydd ardderchog yn nifer y clybiau sydd ar gael i blant yn y cymunedau hynny. Dylem dalu teyrnged i waith y mudiad, ac i'r Llywodraeth am ddyrannu'r adnodd hwnnw yn y lle cyntaf. Fodd bynnag, gyda thoriad ariannol, y mae'r mudiad wedi ei hysbysu yn ei gylch, pa ddyfodol sydd i'r clybiau hyn, ac i'r cynnydd arfaethedig yn nifer y clybiau, yn arbennig yn yr ardaloedd difreintiedig hynny y gwn i'r Llywodraeth gymryd diddordeb arbennig ynddynt?

Hysbyswyd Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs y bydd toriad o 60 y cant yn yr arian a ddyrennir iddo. Deallaf i'r mudiad gael ei hysbysu am y toriad hwn heb unrhyw rybudd nac esboniad—efallai y gall y Gweinidog godi hynny gyda'i swyddogion. O ran Llywodraeth sy'n ymfalchïo mewn partneriaeth a meithrin cysylltiadau â'r sector

those outside Government, it does not help the building of that relationship if such a dramatic funding cut can be announced without prior warning and explanation. In the spirit of goodwill, an apology should be forthcoming, because this has put the organisation in a difficult position.

Suggesting a cut of some 60 per cent flies in the face of Government rhetoric in terms of its strategic point of view regarding the provision of childcare places in Wales. This funding cut throws into doubt the envisaged planned increase of 576 clubs between 2005 and 2008. How on earth could we expect it to pursue that exciting and rapid increase in the number of kids' clubs when the budget will be severely cut? This increase of 576 new clubs between now and 2008 would have ensured an additional 14,763 childcare places. That in itself would be a wonderful achievement, if only the funding of this organisation could be guaranteed.

The Government may say today that it will expand the amount of resource available for the overall levels of childcare provision in Wales and that, as a result of this strategy, more money will be forthcoming. However, that still does not solve the problem faced by Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs and the impending budget cut. Therefore, the prospects for the future of this organisation are quite bleak, and the threats are quite significant, when you consider the achievements to date and what the organisation wanted to achieve in the next three years.

I understand that the organisation would have to reduce the number of its staff from 37 to 12 and that there would be a damaging impact on the planned number of childcare places. It is only fair that Assembly Members call on the Government to match previous funding. A sum of £1 million is not a lot of money—it is beer money when you consider the amount of money that we spend in the Assembly. When you consider what has been achieved with that quite small resource, it makes perfect sense to try to find that money somewhere in the budget to help this organisation grow so that it can continue its

gwirfoddol a sefydliadau y tu allan i'r Llywodraeth, nid yw'r ffaith y gellir cyhoeddi toriad dramatig o'r fath heb unrhyw rybudd nac esboniad ymlaen llaw o gymorth wrth feithrin y gydberthynas honno. Mewn ysbryd o ewyllys da, dylid ymddiheuro am hynny, gan iddo roi'r mudiad mewn sefyllfa anodd.

Mae awgrymu toriad o tua 60 y cant yn mynd yn gwbl groes i rethreg y Llywodraeth o ran ei safbwynt strategol mewn perthynas â darparu lleoedd gofal plant yng Nghymru. Mae'r toriad ariannol hwn yn bwrw amheion dros y cynnydd arfaethedig o 576 o glybiau a ragwelwyd rhwng 2005 a 2008. Sut ar y ddaear y gallwn ddisgwyl iddo anelu at y cynnydd cyffrous a chyflym hwnnw yn nifer y clybiau plant pan gaiff y gyllideb ei chwtoegi yn sylweddol? Byddai'r cynnydd hwn o 576 o glybiau newydd rhwng yn awr a 2008 wedi sicrhau 14,763 o leoedd gofal plant ychwanegol. Byddai hynny ynddo'i hun yn gyflawniad gwych, pe gellid gwarantu y câr'r mudiad hwn ei ariannu.

Mae'n bosibl y bydd y Llywodraeth yn datgan heddiw y bydd yn cynyddu'r adnoddau sydd ar gael ar gyfer lefelau cyffredinol darpariaeth gofal plant yng Nghymru ac, o ganlyniad i'r strategaeth hon, y caiff mwy o arian ei ryddhau. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n datrys y broblem sy'n wynebu Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs a'r toriad arfaethedig yn ei gyllideb. Felly, mae'r rhagolygon ar gyfer y dyfodol y mudiad hwn yn eithaf du, ac mae'r bygythiadau yn eithaf arwyddocaol, o ystyried y cyflawniadau hyd yma a'r hyn yr oedd y mudiad yn awyddus i'w gyflawni yn ystod y tair blynedd nesaf.

Deallaf y byddai'n rhaid i'r mudiad leihau nifer ei staff o 37 i 12 ac y byddai hynny'n arwain at effaith andwyol ar nifer arfaethedig y lleoedd gofal plant. Mae'n ddigon teg bod Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn galw ar y Llywodraeth i roi'r un lefel o gyllid ag a roddwyd o'r blaen. Nid yw swm o £1 filiwn yn swm sylweddol o arian—swm bach ydyw o ystyried yr holl arian a wariwn yn y Cynulliad. Os ystyriwch yr hyn a gyflawnwyd gyda'r adnodd cymharol fach hwnnw, mae'n gwneud synnwyr perffaith y dylid ceisio dod o hyd i'r arian hwnnw rywle yn y gyllideb er mwyn helpu'r mudiad hwn i

work.

It demonstrates a poor understanding on the part of Assembly officials, who believe that forcing Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs to use its reserves provides for a sustainable future. This does not provide for a sustainable future. It is dangerous to request that the organisation use its reserves. The Charity Commission recognises that it is good practice for reserves to be maintained by such organisations to preserve assets for employees, and to continue programmes of work. Therefore, it is wrong for the Assembly Government to force it into using its reserves, particularly when these reserves have not been built up through the contract maintained via the Assembly Government. They have been built up elsewhere, through other contracts with other organisations. It does not provide a real, sustainable future if you expect an organisation to use its reserves to continue its programme of work.

4.30 p.m.

Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs has been telling officials that, if it is forced into accepting that substantial 60 per cent cut, there will be a real threat to the continued support that it can offer to existing clubs, such as the monitoring of the new opportunities fund and other grants, assistance with registration to meet Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales requirements, and ongoing support for voluntary management committees. That is the hub of the problem: these clubs, throughout Wales, are run by volunteers—they are not run by professionals in how they are organised—and the Assembly wishes to see that aspect expand because we believe in the voluntary sector. If we do believe in that, then this is a funny way of demonstrating it. Such organisations provide a range of advice and support, including appropriate training, funding application advice, sustainable marketing advice and so on. Their impact and reach are quite substantial, so, not only will they be unable to expand the number of clubs in the next three years, they will find it extremely difficult to provide and sustain the level of support to the kids' clubs that have been established thus far.

dyfu er mwyn iddo allu parhau â'i waith.

Mae'n dangos dealltwriaeth wael ar ran swyddogion y Cynulliad, sydd o'r farn bod gorfodi Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs i ddefnyddio ei gronfeydd wrth gefn yn ffordd o sicrhau dyfodol cynaliadwy. Nid yw hyn yn ffordd o sicrhau dyfodol cynaliadwy. Mae'n beryglus gofyn i'r mudiad ddefnyddio ei gronfeydd wrth gefn. Mae'r Comisiwn Elusennau yn cydnabod ei bod yn arfer da i fudiadau o'r fath gadw cronfeydd wrth gefn er mwyn diogelu asedau ar gyfer cyflogeion, ac i barhau â rhaglenni gwaith. Felly, mae'n amhriodol i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ei orfodi i ddefnyddio ei gronfeydd wrth gefn, yn arbennig pan na chronnwyd y cronfeydd hynny drwy gyfrwng y contract a gynhelir drwy Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Fe'u cronnwyd drwy ddulliau eraill, drwy gontractau eraill gyda mudiadau eraill. Nid yw disgwyl i fudiad ddefnyddio ei gronfeydd wrth gefn i barhau â'i raglen waith mewn gwirionedd yn cynnig dyfodol cynaliadwy.

Bu Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs yn dweud wrth swyddogion, os caiff ei orfodi i dderbyn y toriad sylweddol hwnnw o 60 y cant, y bydd bygythiad gwirioneddol i'r cymorth parhaus y gall ei gynnig i glybiau sy'n bodoli eisoes, megis y gwaith o fonitro'r gronfa cyfleoedd newydd a grantiau eraill, cymorth gyda chofrestru er mwyn bodloni gofynion Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru, a chymorth parhaus i bwyllgorau rheoli gwirfoddol. Dyna fyrdwn y broblem: caiff y clybiau hyn, ledled Cymru, eu rhedeg gan wirfoddolwyr—nid pobl broffesiynol sy'n eu rhedeg o ran eu trefniadaeth—ac mae'r Cynulliad yn awyddus i weld yr agwedd honno'n ehangu am ein bod yn credu yn y sector gwirfoddol. Os ydym yn credu yn hynny, mae hyn yn ffordd ryfedd o ddangos hynny. Mae mudiadau o'r fath yn darparu amrywiaeth o gyngor a chymorth, gan gynnwys hyfforddiant priodol, cyngor ar wneud cais am gyllid, cyngor marchnata cynaliadwy ac ati. Mae eu heffaith a'u cyrhaeddiad yn eithaf sylweddol, felly, yn ogystal â methu â chynyddu nifer y clybiau yn ystod y tair blynedd nesaf, byddant hefyd yn ei chael yn anodd iawn darparu a chynnal lefel y cymorth y buont yn ei darparu i

glybiau plant a sefydlwyd hyd yma.

I find it particularly disturbing that this commendable report, which contains some terrific aims and objectives, is being contradicted, in a sense, as a result of the proposed funding cut for this particular organisation. With regard to the core aim 1 of the report, to provide a flying start to children, I fail to see how we will sustain that if this funding cut is made because many of these clubs will die off and many planned clubs will not be established. Core aim 7 of the report, which is commendable, states that children should not be disadvantaged by poverty. We all agree with that, and we commend the rapid expansion of childcare places in deprived areas. However, how on earth can that be sustained to look after children in deprived areas unless the funding exists to do so? The report contains a suggestion that the Government wants to develop publicly funded childcare. This provision is a classic example of publicly funded childcare, and, I suspect, good value for money as well.

Point 6.2 of the report is a reference to the work of Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs in developing business support and training, which it was decided at the outset would be needed to provide support to the clubs established, and not just to get them up and running, but to help them with all the various projects and programmes on which they would embark. While this report is timely, being published this morning, I fear that the example of Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs' treatment directly contradicts many of the aims and objectives stated in the report. There is, therefore, a clear example of the difference between rhetoric and glossy reports, and the reality on the ground.

Today presents the Government with an ideal opportunity not just to commend and support this report, as I am sure the Minister will do, but to reaffirm its commitment to the work of Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs in the past four years, and what that organisation has yet to achieve. It is also an opportunity to tell us

Mae'n achosi gofid mawr imi ein bod fel pe baem yn gweithredu'n groes i'r adroddiad clodwiw hwn, sy'n cynnwys nodau ac amcanion ardderchog, o ganlyniad i'r toriad arfaethedig hwn yng nghyllid y mudiad penodol hwn. O ran nod craidd 1 yr adroddiad, sef rhoi'r cychwyn gorau i blant, ni allaf weld sut y gallwn gynnal hynny os gwneir y toriad ariannol hwn gan y bydd llawer o'r clybiau hyn yn dirwyn i ben ac ni chaiff llawer o'r clybiau arfaethedig eu sefydlu. Mae nod craidd 7 yr adroddiad, sydd i'w ganmol, yn datgan na ddylai plant fod o dan anfantais o ganlyniad i dlodi. Mae pob un ohonom yn cytuno â hynny, a chymeradwywn y cynnydd cyflym mewn lleoedd gofal plant mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig. Fodd bynnag, sut ar y ddaear y gellir parhau â hynny er mwyn gofalu am blant mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig oni fydd yr arian ar gael i wneud hynny? Mae'r adroddiad yn cynnwys awgrym bod y Llywodraeth yn awyddus i ddatblygu gofal plant a ariennir yn gyhoeddus. Mae'r ddarpariaeth hon yn enghraifft ardderchog o ofal plant a ariennir yn gyhoeddus, ac, fe gredaf, o werth da am arian hefyd.

Mae pwynt 6.2 yr adroddiad yn cyfeirio at waith Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs o ran datblygu cymorth busnes a hyfforddiant, y penderfynwyd o'r cychwyn cyntaf y byddai eu hangen er mwyn rhoi cymorth i'r clybiau a sefydlwyd, ac nid dim ond i'w sefydlu, ond i'w helpu gyda'r holl amrywiol brosiectau a rhaglenni y byddent yn ymgymryd â hwy. Er bod yr adroddiad hwn yn amserol, gan iddo gael ei gyhoeddi y bore yma, ofnaf fod yr enghraifft o'r ffordd y cafodd Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs ei drin yn mynd yn gwbl groes i lawer o'r nodau a'r amcanion a ddatganwyd yn yr adroddiad. Felly, ceir enghraifft glir o'r gwahaniaeth rhwng rhethreg ac adroddiadau swmpus, a'r realiti ar lawr gwlad.

Mae heddiw yn rhoi cyfle delfrydol i'r Llywodraeth nid yn unig gymeradwyo a chefnogi'r adroddiad hwn, fel yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnaiff y Gweinidog, ond ail-bwysleisio ei hymrwymiad i waith Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs yn ystod y pedair blynedd diwethaf, a'r hyn y gall y mudiad ei gyflawni

that the Government will reverse the funding cut, because I am sure that, with the sizeable budget that the Minister has at her disposal, it cannot be too difficult to reconfirm the level of resource that this organisation has benefited from in the past. It is a classic example of how Government money—that is, taxpayers' money—has been used to very good effect, and I urge the Minister to outline how the future of this organisation will be preserved.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I remind the other speakers that they have a little under a minute each.

**Jenny Randerson:** Thank you, Jonathan, for raising this important issue. Two clubs funded by Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs in my constituency contacted me as they are highly concerned: they believe that their future has been thrown into doubt by the proposals. If, as part of its tactic, the Government believes that local authorities will step into the breach and pick up the tab, it will not work in Cardiff because the threat of capping, which led to a negative council tax increase in Cardiff, means that services will not be enhanced in any way, and, if the Government steps back, the council is not in a position to step forward on this one.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I am also grateful to Jonathan Morgan for placing this item on today's agenda. We would all acknowledge that, five or six years ago, Wales was starting from a low base in terms of childcare provision. Some concrete progress has been made, and an awful lot of that, particularly with regard to before and after-school work, has been successfully undertaken by Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs. Faced with the proposed 60 per cent cut, I have received representations from across my region in Mid and West Wales. On the back of those, I took the opportunity to visit the club in Llangennech Junior School—not by any means the first club that I have visited. It is an excellent facility that caters for disabled pupils as well as other pupils from the junior and infant schools. The club stressed to me—

yn y dyfodol. Mae hefyd yn gyfle i ddweud wrthym na fydd y Llywodraeth yn gweithredu'r toriad mewn cyllid, gan fy mod yn siŵr, o ystyried y gyllideb sylweddol sydd gan y Gweinidog i'w defnyddio, na all fod yn rhy anodd ail-gadarnhau lefel yr adnoddau y mae'r mudiad hwn wedi ei chael yn y gorffennol. Mae'n enghraifft ardderchog o sut y defnyddiwyd arian y Llywodraeth—hynny yw, arian trethdalwyr—mewn ffordd effeithiol iawn, ac erfyniaf ar y Gweinidog i amlinellu sut y caiff dyfodol y mudiad hwn ei ddiogelu.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Hoffwn atgoffa'r siaradwyr eraill bod ganddynt ychydig yn llai na munud yr un.

**Jenny Randerson:** Diolch, Jonathan, am godi'r mater pwysig hwn. Cysylltodd dau glwb a ariennir gan Glybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs yn fy etholaeth â mi gan eu bod yn pryderu'n ofnadwy: mae'r cynigion, yn eu barn hwy, yn bwrw amheuaeth dros eu dyfodol. Os cred y Llywodraeth, fel rhan o'i thacteg, y bydd awdurdodau lleol yn camu i'r adwy ac yn talu'r costau, ni fydd hynny'n gweithio yng Nghaerdydd gan fod y bygythiad sy'n deillio o gapio, a arweiniodd at gynnydd negyddol yn y dreth gyngor yng Nghaerdydd, yn golygu na chaiff gwasanaethau eu gwella mewn unrhyw ffordd, ac, os bydd y Llywodraeth yn camu yn ôl, nid yw'r cyngor mewn sefyllfa i gamu ymlaen yn hyn o beth.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yr wyf fi hefyd yn ddiolchgar i Jonathan Morgan am osod yr eitem hon ar yr agenda heddiw. Byddai pob un ohonom yn cydnabod, bump neu chwe blynedd yn ôl, fod Cymru yn dechrau o fan cychwyn isel o ran darpariaeth gofal plant. Gwnaed cynnydd pendant, ac i Glybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs y mae'r diolch am lawer o'r cynnydd hwnnw, yn arbennig o ran gwaith cyn oriau ysgol ac ar ôl oriau ysgol. Yn wyneb toriad arfaethedig o 60 y cant, yr wyf wedi cael sylwadau o bob rhan o'r rhanbarth, Canolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru. Yn seiliedig ar y sylwadau hynny, manteisiais ar y cyfle i ymweld â'r clwb yn Ysgol Iau Llangennech—ac nid dyna'r clwb cyntaf imi ymweld ag ef o bell ffordd. Mae'n gyfleuster ardderchog sy'n darparu ar gyfer disgyblion anabl yn ogystal â disgyblion



and it is important for Ministers to understand—that it needed not only the support of Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs to establish itself, but also the ongoing support and advice about other sources of funding. As we have heard, the Government speaks warmly about the role of the voluntary sector, and I believe that there is a real commitment to supporting voluntary organisations. I hope that the Minister will take this opportunity to reconsider the proposed cut, or at least to set out the source of funding, if it is not directly from Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs.

**Lynne Neagle:** I thank Jonathan for giving me some time to contribute, and I associate myself with his remarks on the importance of the work of the kids' clubs network. My points will be brief and general. It is a fact that our worst childcare provision is in our poorest communities. Some of the very worst provision is in the south Wales Valleys. I believe that we will not address the problems caused by that without major public-sector investment in childcare from the Welsh Assembly Government. A key part of that is a commitment to expand children centres in Wales. We have had a commitment from the UK Government for a children centre in every community. The report that we have—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Sadly, time has run out.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I am pleased that this topic was put on the agenda for debate today. We had intended to issue our report tomorrow, but it seemed that it would be useful to issue the report this morning so that Members could see the intentions and recommendations of the independent report which, as you know, has been co-ordinated by the Daycare Trust. We will formally respond to the report in due course, but I will refer to some of the principles in response to this debate.

I fully appreciate the fact that Members have expressed concern about funding for Clybiau

eraill o'r ysgol iau a'r ysgol fabanod. Pwysleisiodd y clwb—ac mae'n bwysig i Weinidogion ddeall—yn ogystal â chefnogaeth Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs, fod angen cymorth a chyngor parhaus arno gan ffynonellau cyllido eraill, er mwyn sefydlu ei hun. Fel y clywsom, mae'r Llywodraeth yn gadarn o blaid rôl y sector gwirfoddol, a chredaf fod ymrwymiad gwirioneddol i gefnogi mudiadau gwirfoddol. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn manteisio ar y cyfle hwn i ailystyried y toriad arfaethedig, neu o leiaf i nodi ffynhonnell y cyllid, os nad Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs fydd y ffynhonnell uniongyrchol honno.

**Lynne Neagle:** Diolchaf i Jonathan am roi rhywfaint o amser imi gyfrannu, ac ategaf ei sylwadau o ran pwysigrwydd gwaith y rhwydwaith clybiau plant. Cyflwynaf bwyntiau cryno a chyffredinol. Mae'n ffaith mai yn ein cymunedau tlotaf y gwelir ein darpariaeth gofal plant waethaf. Mae enghreifftiau o'r ddarpariaeth waethaf un i'w gweld yng Nghymoedd y De. Yn fy marn i, ni ymdriniwn â'r problemau sy'n deillio o hynny heb fuddsoddiad sector cyhoeddus sylweddol mewn gofal plant gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Mae ymrwymiad i ehangu canolfannau plant yng Nghymru yn rhan allweddol o hynny. Cawsom ymrwymiad gan Lywodraeth y DU i agor canolfan blant ym mhob cymuned. Mae'r adroddiad ger ein bron—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Yn anffodus, mae eich amser ar ben.

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Yr wyf yn falch i'r pwnc hwn gael ei roi ar yr agenda i'w drafod heddiw. Yr oeddem wedi bwriadu cyhoeddi ein hadroddiad yfory, ond teimlwyd y byddai'n ddefnyddiol cyhoeddi'r adroddiad y bore yma, er mwyn i Aelodau weld bwriadau ac argymhellion yr adroddiad annibynnol a gydlynwyd, fel y gwyddoch, gan yr Ymddiriedolaeth Gofal Dydd. Byddwn yn ymateb yn ffurfiol i'r adroddiad maes o law, ond cyfeiriaf at rai o'r egwyddorion mewn ymateb i'r ddadl hon.

Yr wyf yn llawn werthfawrogi'r ffaith bod Aelodau wedi mynegi pryder ynghylch

Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs. I am delighted to be able to put on record the warm recognition from this Government on the wonderful work that Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs has done in developing school childcare clubs across the country. We originally had a target of developing 22,000 clubs and, with the organisation's assistance, Wales was the first place in the UK to meet its target. The programme delivered more than 24,000 childcare places.

It is important to put on record some issues relating to accuracy. It is not correct to say, in a sense, that there has been a 60 per cent cut in funding. Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs was given a three-year contract up to May 2005. Last year, Jane Hutt, as the relevant Minister, commissioned a review undertaken by Mike Jarman, which reported last spring, to look at whether or not a contract basis should be continued for any organisation, or whether all the organisations receiving children and family organisation grants should apply for funding on a similar basis. The review was agreed last year, and Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs was invited to apply on the same basis as other organisations such as Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin, and the National Childminding Association. The grant provided an award of £275,000 in 2005-06, £396,000 in 2006-07, and £435,600 in 2007-08. It then became clear that the large reserves held by Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs could not be used effectively in assisting the transition from the previous contract arrangement. It was a discrete contract that was related to the old Training and Enterprise Council out-of-school childcare funding, and could not be used in transition to a change of arrangements planned by Government in relation to Cymorth in the future. The idea is that by 2006-07—and I understand that this has been supported by the committee—the funding of childcare organisations should operate within the Cymorth framework, and that, therefore, there should be transitional moves to achieve the greatest partnership outcomes.

4.40 p.m.

Officials have also received correspondence

ariannu Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs. Mae'n bleser gennyf allu cofnodi cydnabyddiaeth wresog y Llywodraeth hon i'r gwaith ardderchog y mae Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs wedi'i wneud i ddatblygu clybiau gofal plant mewn ysgolion ledled y wlad. Yn wreiddiol, ein targed oedd datblygu 22,000 o glybiau a, chyda chymorth y mudiad, Cymru oedd y wlad gyntaf yn y DU i gwrdd â'i tharged. Darparodd y rhaglen fwy na 24,000 o leoedd gofal plant.

Mae'n bwysig cofnodi rhai materion sy'n ymwneud â chywirdeb. Nid yw'n gywir dweud, ar un ystyr, y bu toriad o 60 y cant yn y cyllid. Rhoddwyd contract tair blynedd i Glybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs hyd at fis Mai 2005. Y llynedd, comisiynodd Jane Hutt, fel y Gweinidog perthnasol, adolygiad a gynhaliwyd gan Mike Jarman, y cyflwynwyd adroddiad arno yn ystod gwanwyn y llynedd, i ystyried pa un a ddylid parhau ar sail contract ar gyfer unrhyw fudiad, neu pa un a ddylai'r holl fudiadau sy'n cael grantiau mudiadau plant a theuluoedd wneud cais am arian mewn ffordd debyg. Cytunwyd ar yr adolygiad y llynedd, a gwahoddwyd Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs i wneud cais yn yr un ffordd â mudiadau eraill megis y Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin, a'r Gymdeithas Genedlaethol Gwarchod Plant. Rhoddodd y grant ddyfarndal o £275,000 yn 2005-06, £396,000 yn 2006-07, a £435,600 yn 2007-08. Yna daeth yn amlwg na ellid defnyddio'r cronfeydd wrth gefn sylweddol a ddaliwyd gan Glybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs yn effeithiol i gefnogi'r broses o drosi o'r trefniant contract blaenorol. Yr oedd yn gontract ar wahân a oedd yn berthnasol i gyllid gofal plant y tu allan i oriau ysgol yr hen Gyngor Hyfforddiant a Menter, ac ni ellid ei ddefnyddio fel rhan o'r broses o drosi i'r trefniadau newydd a gynlluniwyd gan y Llywodraeth o ran Cymorth yn y dyfodol. Erbyn 2006-07, y syniad yw—a deallaf fod y pwyllgor o blaid y cynnig—y dylai'r broses o ariannu mudiadau gofal plant weithredu o fewn fframwaith Cymorth, ac, felly, y dylid rhoi trefniadau trosiannol ar waith er mwyn sicrhau'r canlyniadau gorau o ran partneriaeth.

Mae swyddogion hefyd wedi cael gohebiaeth

from AWARE, the All-Wales Association of Early Years Development and Childcare Partnerships, which indicates its support for the move to fund the Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs network primarily via Cymorth through local partnerships to strengthen accountability, in the same way as has been done with others. When we became aware of the nature of the problem, Jane Hutt, Brian Gibbons and I had separate meetings with Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs. The funding remains in the health and social care portfolio until it is moved at the appropriate time into my portfolio.

We support the original decision that childcare should be delivered and driven through local partnerships so that proper partnerships can be in place that do not just take account of the work carried out by Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs, but integrate it into other network arrangements, and that we should focus on a grant to cover only the organisation's core costs using the same approach that we have used with other national organisations. We have addressed with the organisation the kind of additional grant that would be needed this year to move it from its current position and to sustain its transfer to the Cymorth arrangements in 2006. Brian Gibbons has decided that there will be an additional grant of £310,000, which will enable the organisation to manage its transition without there being a significant impact on the operations and staff. I understand that the organisation is now satisfied with the grant being offered.

I am pleased that childcare has been transferred to my portfolio, not least because we had a situation, in terms of early years provision, whereby childcare and pre-school education is often provided in the same setting and by the same staff. Previously, the portfolio responsibilities were split. It is important that although not all childcare has an educational objective, in developing the foundation phase and in terms of wanting to ensure that that can operate in the voluntary sector effectively, we must develop the foundation phase and childcare provision together in a co-ordinated way. I think that Jonathan and Helen Mary, as Education and

gan AWARE, sef Cymdeithas Partneriaethau Datblygu'r Blynyddoedd Cynnar a Gofal Plant Cymru Gyfan, sy'n datgan ei chefnogaeth i'r newid i ariannu rhwydwaith Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs yn bennaf drwy Cymorth drwy bartneriaethau lleol er mwyn atgyfnerthu atebolrwydd, yn yr un ffordd ag a wnaed gydag eraill. Pan ddaethom yn ymwybodol o natur y broblem, cynhaliodd Jane Hutt, Brian Gibbons a minnau gyfarfodydd ar wahân gyda Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs. Bydd yr arian yn aros yn y portffolio iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol hyd nes y caiff ei symud ar yr adeg briodol i'm portffolio i.

Yr ydym yn cefnogi'r penderfyniad gwreiddiol y dylai gofal plant gael ei gyflwyno a'i hyrwyddo drwy bartneriaethau lleol er mwyn sicrhau bod partneriaethau priodol ar waith sydd nid yn unig yn ystyried y gwaith a wneir gan Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs, ond sydd hefyd yn ei integreiddio â threfniadau rhwydwaith eraill, ac y dylem ganolbwyntio ar grant i dalu costau craidd y mudiad yn unig gan ddefnyddio'r un ymagwedd ag a ddefnyddiwyd gennym gyda mudiadau cenedlaethol eraill. Buom yn trafod gyda'r mudiad y math o grant ychwanegol y byddai ei angen eleni i'w symud o'i sefyllfa bresennol ac i gefnogi'r broses o drosi i drefniadau Cymorth yn 2006. Mae Brian Gibbons wedi penderfynu y rhoddir grant ychwanegol o £310,000, a fydd yn galluogi'r mudiad i reoli'r broses drosi heb unrhyw effaith sylweddol ar y gweithrediadau a'r staff. Deallaf fod y mudiad bellach yn fodlon ar y grant a gynigir.

Yr wyf yn falch bod gofal plant wedi cael ei drosglwyddo i'm portffolio, yn arbennig am fod gennym sefyllfa, o ran darpariaeth y blynyddoedd cynnar, lle y caiff gofal plant ac addysg cyn ysgol yn aml eu darparu yn yr un lleoliad a chan yr un aelodau o staff. Yn y gorffennol, rhannwyd cyfrifoldebau'r portffolio. Er nad oes gan bob math o ofal plant amcan addysgol, wrth ddatblygu'r cyfnod sylfaen ac o ran bod yn awyddus i sicrhau y gall y cyfnod hwnnw weithredu'n effeithiol yn y sector gwirfoddol, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn datblygu'r cyfnod sylfaen a'r ddarpariaeth gofal plant gyda'i gilydd mewn ffordd gydgyssylltiedig. Credaf y

Lifelong Learning Committee members, would want to address that.

Community-focused schools will provide new opportunities for childcare as settings can now be run by school governing bodies.

**Lynne Neagle:** I know that you are committed to supporting early years education. However, the provision for children aged three and under is also vital. The report published today supports my view that one integrated children's centre per authority is not enough and calls for a centre to be established in each deprived community. I hope that that will also be rolled out universally. When will you be in a position to make an announcement on that?

**Jane Davidson:** I agree that all the early years of children's lives contribute to their being given the best possible chance. The portfolio responsibility was also transferred to me so that we can put the agenda for children aged five and under in place and not just have what we had previously, namely the three-to-five agenda, which needed to take full account of childcare and early years provision and which often irritated the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee.

You will know that in the Assembly's budget last year we announced substantial new funding of £50 million by 2008 for early years provision for children aged five and under. We expect to use that funding to deliver and invest in quality childcare alongside new Sure-Start-type activities and more integrated centres. I will bring forward detailed proposals soon.

It is also important to highlight some other initiatives that are taking forward this agenda. As a result of the partnership with Jobcentre Plus, childcare partnership managers in each district are building relationships between local authorities, the Assembly Government and Jobcentre Plus officials, which are crucial. There is also the exciting Genesis

byddai Jonathan a Helen Mary, fel aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, am ymdrin â hynny.

Bydd ysgolion sy'n canolbwyntio ar y gymuned yn rhoi cyfleoedd newydd ym maes gofal plant oherwydd gall cyrff llywodraethu ysgolion redeg lleoliadau yn awr.

**Lynne Neagle:** Gwn eich bod yn ymrwymedig i gefnogi addysg y blynyddoedd cynnar. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ddarpariaeth ar gyfer plant hyd at dair oed yn hanfodol hefyd. Mae'r adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd heddiw yn ategu fy marn nad yw un ganolfan blant integredig fesul awdurdod yn ddigon ac mae'n galw am i ganolfan gael ei sefydlu ym mhob cymuned ddifreintiedig. Gobeithiaf y caiff hynny ei gyflwyno'n gyffredinol hefyd. Pryd y byddwch mewn sefyllfa i wneud cyhoeddiad am hynny?

**Jane Davidson:** Cytunaf fod holl flynyddoedd cynnar bywydau plant yn cyfrannu at roi'r cyfle gorau posibl iddynt. Trosglwyddwyd cyfrifoldeb y portffolio imi hefyd er mwyn inni allu rhoi'r agenda i blant hyd at bump oed ar waith yn hytrach na'r hyn a oedd gennym yn flaenorol, sef yr agenda tri i bump, yr oedd angen iddi roi ystyriaeth lawn i ofal plant a darpariaeth y blynyddoedd cynnar ac a oedd yn aml yn codi gwrychyn y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes.

Gwyddoch yng nghyllideb y Cynulliad y llynedd inni gyhoeddi cyllid newydd sylweddol gwerth £50 miliwn erbyn 2008 ar gyfer darpariaeth y blynyddoedd cynnar i blant hyd at bump oed. Disgwyliwn ddefnyddio'r cyllid hwnnw i gyflwyno a buddsoddi mewn gofal plant o safon ochr yn ochr â gweithgareddau newydd tebyg i Cychwyn Cadarn a mwy o ganolfannau integredig. Byddaf yn cyflwyno cynigion manwl maes o law.

Mae hefyd yn bwysig amlygu rhai mentrau eraill sy'n rhan o'r agenda hon. O ganlyniad i'r bartneriaeth gyda'r Ganolfan Byd Gwaith, mae rheolwyr partneriaethau gofal plant ym mhob ardal yn meithrin cydberthnasau rhwng awdurdodau lleol, Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a swyddogion y Ganolfan Byd Gwaith, sy'n hollbwysig. Ceir hefyd y prosiect cyffrous o'r

project, under which we have secured £12.5 million over three years under Objectives 1 and 3 to increase the contribution of European structural funds for childcare provision across Wales. This project will help to provide advice, guidance, support and childcare for people wishing to access work, training or learning opportunities.

This is an opportunity, unique to Wales, to bring new childcare provision into disadvantaged areas specifically. That is important in your context, Lynne. The all-Wales project was formally launched yesterday. I am particularly keen for this project to focus not only on disadvantaged areas, but also on those people who are hardest to reach. It is entirely appropriate for me to mention that I had a visit this morning from representatives of the Llanelli young mums' project. They came to talk about the difficulties of accessing jobs, education or training when you have childcare responsibilities, and do not feel that you are adequately supported to meet the costs of childcare. There are a number of projects in Wales, and Genesis is one of them, which will enable people in the most disadvantaged areas, the most hard-to-reach individuals, to access education, training and jobs without having to bear the costs of childcare.

A similar project, in which you might be interested, operates in the Torfaen area—I know that Lynne, particularly, is aware of it. It is called the community-focused schools childcare project. It is testing the assertion that the lack of affordable, accessible childcare is a significant barrier to work by providing the childcare that lone parents need to enter into employment. It is provided in the school setting, so that children do not have to be moved around. The Department for Work and Pensions has made funding of around £529,000 available for this 18-month project. We see good-quality childcare as a key factor in helping to reduce worklessness, in tackling poverty and in promoting growth.

Alongside the launch of the final report, 'A Flying Start: Childcare for Children, Parents and Communities', which, as you know, contains a hefty 77 recommendations, I pay

enw Genesis, a ddefnyddiwyd gennym i sicrhau £12.5 miliwn dros dair blynedd o dan Amcanion 1 a 3 i gynyddu cyfraniad cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd i'r ddarpariaeth gofal plant ledled Cymru. Bydd y prosiect hwn yn helpu i ddarparu cyngor, arweiniad, cymorth a gofal plant i bobl sy'n awyddus i weithio, i ymgymryd â hyfforddiant neu i fanteisio ar gyfleoedd dysgu.

Dyma gyfle, sy'n unigryw i Gymru, i gyflwyno darpariaeth gofal plant newydd mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig yn benodol. Mae hynny'n bwysig yn eich cyd-destun chi, Lynne. Lansiodd y prosiect Cymru-gyfan yn ffurfiol ddoe. Yr wyf yn hynod awyddus i'r prosiect hwn ganolbwyntio nid yn unig ar ardaloedd difreintiedig, ond hefyd ar y bobl hynny sydd fwyaf anodd i'w cyrraedd. Mae'n gwbl briodol imi sôn bod cynrychiolwyr prosiect mamau ifanc Llanelli wedi ymweld â mi y bore yma. Daethant i sôn am anawsterau manteisio ar gyfleoedd swyddi, addysg neu hyfforddiant pan fydd cyfrifoldebau gofal plant gennyh, a phan nad ydych yn teimlo eich bod yn cael digon o gymorth i dalu costau gofal plant. Mae nifer o brosiectau yng Nghymru, ac mae Genesis yn un ohonynt, a fydd yn galluogi pobl yn yr ardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig, yr unigolion mwyaf anodd i'w cyrraedd, i fanteisio ar addysg, hyfforddiant a swyddi heb orfod talu costau gofal plant.

Mae prosiect tebyg, a all fod o ddiddordeb ichi, ar waith yn ardal Tor-faen—gwn fod Lynne, yn arbennig, yn ymwybodol ohono. Ei enw yw prosiect gofal plant yr ysgolion bro. Mae'n profi'r honiad bod diffyg gofal plant fforddiadwy a hygyrch yn rhwystr sylweddol i waith drwy ddarparu'r gofal plant sydd ei angen ar rieni unigol er mwyn iddynt fentro i fyd cyflogaeth. Fe'i darperir mewn ysgolion, fel nad oes rhaid symud y plant. Mae'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau wedi dyfarnu cyllid gwerth tua £529,000 i'r prosiect 18 mis hwn. Yr ydym o'r farn bod gofal plant o ansawdd da yn ffactor allweddol wrth helpu i leihau diweithdra, wrth fynd i'r afael â thlodi ac wrth hyrwyddo twf.

Ochr yn ochr â lansio'r adroddiad terfynol, 'Y Cychwyn Gorau: Gofal Plant i Blant, Rhieni a Chymunedau', sydd, fel y gwyddoch, yn cynnwys 77 o argymhellion i

tribute to the work of Dr Brian Gibbons in chairing that group, in his previous role as Deputy Minister with responsibility for economic development. The report builds on the childcare action plan that the Assembly Government published back in 2002. We will provide an updated strategy for childcare later this spring.

It is also important to consider the UK Government context because, while most of the actions in the 10-year childcare plan that was announced recently apply only to England, people in Wales will benefit from its commitment to increasing maternity leave to 12 months by the end of the next Parliament, as well as the increase in help with childcare costs in the working tax credit, from 70 to 80 per cent, and higher maximum levels. It is clear that finance is the greatest barrier in terms of this issue. We must look at this, as always, with regard to our UK Government colleagues, as well as considering what can be delivered through the Assembly Government and local government.

On childcare provision through the medium of Welsh, we know that there are currently approximately 10,000 places in Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin settings. We commissioned a report from Coleg y Drindod, Carmarthen, which was published in March last year, looking at the availability of Welsh-medium places and identifying issues relating to their development. I approved that report and an action plan is currently under way to implement those recommendations. I will report on that to the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee. You will see further recommendations for us to consider in the report that was published this morning, which will be taken up in our plan later this year. We made a big commitment in the foundation phase to ensuring that parents can choose the language used as the instruction medium of their children, and we have expanded Welsh-medium provision in the foundation phase more generally. We want to ensure that sufficient people are trained to be able to take forward that agenda and that there are

gyd, talaf deyrnged i waith Dr Brian Gibbons wrth gadeirio'r grŵp hwnnw, yn ei rôl flaenorol fel y Dirprwy Weinidog â chyfrifoldeb dros ddatblygu economaidd. Mae'r adroddiad yn seiliedig ar y cynllun gweithredu gofal plant a gyhoeddwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn 2002. Byddwn yn darparu strategaeth gofal plant wedi'i diweddarau yn ddiweddarach yn ystod y gwanwyn.

Mae hefyd yn bwysig ystyried cyd-destun Llywodraeth y DU oherwydd, er mai dim ond i Loegr y mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r camau gweithredu yn y cynllun gofal plant 10 mlynedd a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar yn berthnasol, bydd pobl yng Nghymru yn elwa ar ei ymrwymiad i gynyddu absenoldeb mamolaeth i 12 mis erbyn diwedd y Senedd nesaf, yn ogystal â'r cynnydd o ran help gyda chostau gofal plant yn y credyd treth gwaith, o 70 i 80 y cant, a'r cynnydd yn y lefelau uchafswm. Mae'n amlwg mai cyllid yw'r rhwystr mwyaf yn y cyd-destun hwn. Rhaid inni edrych ar y mater, fel gyda phob mater, gan ystyried ein cyd-aelodau yn Llywodraeth y DU, yn ogystal ag ystyried yr hyn y gellir ei gyflawni drwy Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a llywodraeth leol.

O ran darpariaeth gofal plant drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, gwyddom ar hyn o bryd fod tua 10,000 o leoedd mewn lleoliadau Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin. Bu inni gomisiynu adroddiad gan Goleg y Drindod, Caerfyrddin, a gyhoeddwyd fis Mawrth y llynedd, yn edrych ar argaeledd lleoedd drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg ac yn nodi'r materion a oedd yn gysylltiedig â'u datblygu. Cymeradwyais yr adroddiad hwnnw ac mae cynllun gweithredu yn mynd rhagddo ar hyn o bryd i weithredu'r argymhellion hynny. Cyflwynaf adroddiad ar y cynllun hwnnw i'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Fe welwch argymhellion pellach inni eu hystyried yn yr adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd y bore yma, a gaiff eu hystyried yn ein cynllun yn ddiweddarach eleni. Rhoddwyd ymrwymiad sylweddol gennym yn y cyfnod sylfaen i sicrhau y gall rhieni ddewis yr iaith a ddefnyddir i addysgu eu plant, ac yr ydym wedi ehangu'r ddarpariaeth Gymraeg yn y cyfnod sylfaen yn fwy cyffredinol. Yr ydym am sicrhau y caiff digon o bobl eu hyfforddi i allu gweithredu'r agenda honno a bod cyfleoedd addas ar gael

suitable opportunities locally.

yn lleol.

We are currently dealing with a range of issues. I retain our commitment to the work of Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs. We will continue to work with that organisation and look at how it can contribute to partnership work in terms of the foundation phase and other childcare settings. One of the key features of the integrated children's centres in Wales is that we also provide out-of-hours play. That is unique to Wales and it has been very popular. I look forward to responding to the challenge in the report that was published today, working with Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs with its new budget, which will be transferred to my portfolio when the physical financial transfer takes place, and to working with Assembly Members to ensure that childcare places are enhanced and that they are targeted at those who are most in need.

Yr ydym wrthi ar hyn o bryd yn ymdrin ag amrywiaeth o faterion. Mae ein hymrwymiad i waith Clybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs yn parhau. Byddwn yn parhau i weithio gyda'r mudiad hwnnw, gan edrych ar sut y gall gyfrannu at waith partneriaeth o ran y cyfnod sylfaen a lleoliadau gofal plant eraill. Un o nodweddion allweddol y canolfannau plant integredig yng Nghymru yw ein bod hefyd yn darparu cyfleoedd chwarae y tu allan i oriau. Mae hynny'n unigryw i Gymru a bu'n boblogaidd iawn. Edrychaf ymlaen at ymateb i'r her yn yr adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd heddiw, at gydweithio gyda Chlybiau Plant Cymru Kids' Clubs a'i gyllideb newydd, a gaiff ei drosglwyddo i'm portffolio ar yr adeg y caiff yr arian ei drosglwyddo, ac at gydweithio ag Aelodau'r Cynulliad i sicrhau y caiff lleoedd gofal plant eu gwella ac y cânt eu targedu at y bobl hynny sydd eu hangen fwyaf.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings today's proceedings to a close.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 4.51 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 4.51 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau  
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)

Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Law, Peter (Llafur – Labour)  
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
Marek, John (Annibynnol – Independent)  
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)