



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mawrth, 1 Chwefror 2005**

**Tuesday, 1 February 2005**

## Cynnwys Contents

Ethol Aelodau i Bwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio Election of Members to a Planning Decision Committee .....	3
Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister .....	4
Datganiad Busnes Business Statement.....	31
Datganiad ar Ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ar Anghenion Addysgol Arbennig Statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's response to the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee's Report on Special Educational Needs .....	35
Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order.....	50
Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion Composite Motion: Approval of Orders.....	51
Cymeradwyo o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.27 (iv) Reoliadau'r Dreth Gyngor (Newid Rhestrau ac Apelau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2005 Approval under Standing Order No. 24.27 (iv) of the Council Tax (Alteration of Lists and Appeals) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2005.....	53
Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru): Newid yn yr Hinsawdd Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru): Climate Change .....	59
Dadl o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 31: Deddfwriaeth Arfaethedig o dan Ddeddf Tai 1996 Debate under Standing Order No. 31: Proposed Legislation under the Housing Act 1996 ....	86

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were  
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been  
included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

### **Ethol Aelodau i Bwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio Election of Members to a Planning Decision Committee**

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I **Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynig iaf fod  
propose that

*the National Assembly resolves:*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn penderfynu:*

*1. that a committee, to be known as Planning Decision Committee (2) 2005-2, be established in accordance with Standing Order No. 17 of the Assembly to discharge the functions in respect of the matter identified in the Schedule to this motion under section 77(4) of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990;*

*1. bod pwyllgor, i'w adnabod fel Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio (2) 2005-2, yn cael ei sefydlu yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 17 y Cynulliad i gyflawni swyddogaethau yn unol â'r mater a nodir yn yr Atodlen i'r cynnig hwn o dan adran 77(4) o Ddeddf Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref 1990;*

*2. that the members of that committee be: Carwyn Jones AM (Chair), Carl Sargeant AM, Mick Bates AM, Alun Ffred Jones AM;*

*2. mai aelodau'r pwyllgor hwnnw fydd: Carwyn Jones AC (Cadeirydd), Carl Sargeant AC, Mick Bates AC, Alun Ffred Jones AC;*

*3. that the committee shall cease to exist when the Chair of the committee signs the decision letter in accordance with Standing Order 17.16 or on 25 February 2005, whichever is the earlier;*

*3. y bydd y pwyllgor yn peidio â bod pan fydd Cadeirydd y pwyllgor yn llofnodi'r llythyr penderfynu yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 17.16 neu ar 25 Chwefror 2005, p'un bynnag sy'n dod gyntaf;*

*4. that if the committee shall cease to exist without the Chair having signed a decision letter in respect of the matter identified in the Schedule to this motion, then, in that event, the functions identified in paragraph 1 above are, in relation to such matter, delegated to the First Minister.*

*4. os bydd y pwyllgor yn peidio â bod heb i'r Cadeirydd lofnodi llythyr penderfynu mewn perthynas â'r mater a nodir yn yr Atodlen i'r cynnig hwn, y bydd y swyddogaethau a nodir ym mharagraff 1 uchod, mewn perthynas â'r cyfryw fater, yn cael eu dirprwyo i'r Prif Weinidog.*

#### *Schedule*

#### *Atodlen*

*Called-in planning application under section 77 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 by Miller Argent (South Wales) Limited for the Ffos-y-fran land reclamation scheme, incorporating the extraction of coal by opencast methods, and being the final phase of the East Merthyr reclamation scheme. (NDM2267)*

*Cais cynllunio a alwyd i mewn o dan adran 77 o Ddeddf Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref 1990 gan Miller Argent (South Wales) Cyf ar gyfer cynllun adfer tir Ffos-y-fran, sy'n cynnwys cloddio am lo brig, a hwn yw rhan olaf cynllun adfer tir Dwyrain Merthyr. (NDM2267)*

*Cynnig (NDM2267): O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM2267): For 42, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

### **Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister**

#### **Datblygu Economi De-ddwyrain Cymru Economic Development in South-east Wales**

**Q1 John Griffiths:** Will the First Minister make a statement on economic development in south-east Wales? OAQ0120(FM)

**C1 John Griffiths:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar ddatblygu economaidd yn ne-ddwyrain Cymru? OAQ0120(FM)

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** I am delighted to report positive progress on

**Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan):** Yr wyf yn falch iawn o adrodd am gynnydd da ar

economic development in south-east Wales, with 21,000 more people in employment now than in 1999, and a 30 per cent fall in unemployment over the same period.

**John Griffiths:** It is great to hear those statistics, which are so important to the people of south-east Wales. Following the Assembly Government's setting up of the urban regeneration company, Newport Unlimited, which recognises Newport as the economic engine for south-east Wales, would you agree that progress to date has been most impressive? Will you commit the Welsh Assembly Government to continuing to provide support for Newport Unlimited, especially when the Welsh Development Agency is brought into the Welsh Assembly Government, so that there is a smooth transition and no reduction in the level of support currently provided by the WDA?

**The First Minister:** The figures that I gave were, possibly, for a wider definition of south-east Wales than that which you are using. You may be using a Gwent-based definition, rather than the Gwent, Mid Glamorgan and South Glamorgan definition that I was using—which probably includes nearly 50 per cent of the population of Wales. You are right that Newport is Gwent's key urban centre, and is the hinge of much of south Wales's transport system. That is one of the reasons behind Andrew Davies's recent announcement about the relief road to complement the southern distributor road opened last month. Newport Unlimited is the only urban regeneration company in Wales, and it was set up following Corus's announcement that it intended to close the heavy-end of the Llanwern plant, with the loss of well over 1,000 jobs—there are still about 1,700 people working at the finishing end of the Llanwern plant, and doing extremely well. However, the reclamation project with regard to the old town dock and some of the spare Corus land now becoming available means that there is a huge task—and huge potential—facing Newport Unlimited.

**William Graham:** Though I welcome your remarks about new jobs, you will agree that

ddatblygu economaidd yn ne-ddwyrain Cymru, gan fod 21,000 yn fwy o bobl mewn gwaith yn awr nag yr oedd yn 1999, a bod diweithdra wedi gostwng 30 y cant yn yr un cyfnod.

**John Griffiths:** Braf yw clywed yr ystadegau hynny, gan eu bod mor bwysig i bobl y De-ddwyrain. Wedi i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad sefydlu'r cwmni adfywio trefol, Newport Unlimited, gan gydnabod mai Casnewydd yw pwerdy economaidd y De-ddwyrain, a gytunech fod y cynnydd a wnaed hyd yma'n dra chynhyrfus? A wnewch rwyddo Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i barhau i gynorthwyo Newport Unlimited, yn enwedig pan ymgorfforir Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, fel y ceir newid esmwyth ac fel na fydd lefel y cymorth a roddir gan y WDA ar hyn o bryd yn lleihau?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr oedd y ffigurau a roddais yn rhai ar gyfer diffiniad ehangach o'r De-ddwyrain nag yr oeddech chi'n ei ddefnyddio, o bosibl. Efallai fod eich diffiniad chi'n seiliedig ar Went, yn hytrach na Gwent, Morgannwg Ganol a De Morgannwg, fel y mae fy niffiniad i—sy'n cynnwys tua 50 y cant o boblogaeth Cymru, mae'n debyg. Yr ydych yn iawn wrth ddweud mai Casnewydd yw prif ganolfan drefol Gwent, a'i fod yn ganolbwynt i ran helaeth o system drafnidiaeth y De. Dyna un o'r rhesymau dros y cyhoeddiad diweddar gan Andrew Davies ynghylch y ffordd liniaru i gyd-fynd â'r ffordd ddisbarthu ddeheuol a agorwyd y mis diwethaf. Newport Unlimited yw'r unig gwmni adfywio trefol yng Nghymru, ac fe'i sefydlwyd wedi i Corus gyhoeddi ei fod yn bwriadu cau'r adran gwaith trwm yng ngwaith Llanwern, fel y collid ymhell dros 1,000 o swyddi—mae tua 1,700 o bobl yn dal i weithio yn ochr derfynu gwaith Llanwern, ac mae'n gwneud yn dda iawn. Fodd bynnag, oherwydd y prosiect adfer sy'n gysylltiedig â hen ddoc y dref a rhywfaint o'r tir o eiddo Corus a oedd dros ben ac sydd ar gael yn awr, mae tasg aruthrol—a photensial aruthrol—yn wynebu Newport Unlimited.

**William Graham:** Er fy mod yn croesawu'ch sylwadau am swyddi newydd,

we want as many jobs as possible in manufacturing industries. What influence do you have with your Westminster colleagues in order to reduce the impact of environmental taxation and other compliance requirements, which make it more difficult for manufacturing industries to be truly competitive in a global market?

**The First Minister:** Many issues impact upon the competitiveness of manufacturing. We would all accept—and all the data seems to confirm—that the biggest single adverse impact on manufacturing is when the pound reaches excessively high levels. You and I clearly remember what happened between 1979 and 1981, at the beginning of the Margaret Thatcher-Geoffrey Howe era, when the pound reached ridiculously high levels and 20 per cent of Britain's manufacturing capacity was wiped out in a two-year period. We had a similar phenomenon—although not as bad—in 2000 and 2001, but it was a steady state of growth and the kind of benign scenario that Digby Jones, the director general of the Confederation of British Industry, emphasised strongly at the CBI Wales annual dinner. At that dinner, he enjoined everyone in the room not to complain about the scenario that we are facing now, given low inflation, steady growth, and no boom and bust. His speech could almost have been written by those in politics. It was a strong endorsement. He said that business should not complain about the situation, but invest, and that this is the best climate that we will get in which to invest.

byddwch yn cytuno ein bod am gael cynifer o swyddi ag y bo modd mewn diwydiannau gweithgynhyrchu. Ym mha fodd y gallwch ddylanwadu ar eich cyd-Weinidogion yn San Steffan i leihau effaith trethu amgylcheddol a gofynion eraill o ran cydymffurfio, sy'n peri ei bod yn anos i ddiwydiannau gweithgynhyrchu fod yn wirioneddol gystadleuol yn y farchnad ryngwladol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae llawer o faterion yn effeithio ar allu diwydiannau gweithgynhyrchu i gystadlu. Byddem oll yn derbyn—ac ymddengys fod yr holl ddata yn cadarnhau hyn—y ceir yr effaith waethaf ar weithgynhyrchu pan fydd y bunt yn codi'n rhy uchel. Mae gennych chi a minnau gof byw o'r hyn a ddigwyddodd rhwng 1979 a 1981, ar ddechrau cyfnod Margaret Thatcher a Geoffrey Howe, pan gododd y bunt i lefelau anhygoel o uchel a phan ddilëwyd 20 y cant o allu gweithgynhyrchu Prydain mewn dwy flynedd. Cawsom ffenomen debyg—er nad oedd cyn waethed—yn 2000 a 2001, ond cafwyd cynnydd cyson a'r math o senario ffafriol y gwnaeth Digby Jones, cyfarwyddwr cyffredinol Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain, dynnu sylw ato yng nghinio blynyddol Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain Cymru. Yn y cinio hwnnw, siarsiodd bawb yn yr ystafell i beidio â chwyno am y senario a wynebwn yn awr, gan fod chwyddiant yn isel, a'r twf yn gyson, ac na cheir ffyniant a methiant bob yn ail. Bron y gallai ei araith fod wedi'i hysgrifennu gan wleidydd. Yr oedd yn gefnogol iawn. Dywedodd nad cwyno am y sefyllfa y dylai busnesau ei wneud, ond buddsoddi, ac mai hon yw'r hinsawdd orau a gawn i fuddsoddi.

### **Lleoli Mastiau Ffonau Symudol The Placement of Mobile Phone Masts**

**Q2 Irene James:** Will the First Minister make a statement about the placement of mobile phone masts in Wales? OAQ0125(FM)

**C2 Irene James:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar leoli mastiau ffonau symudol yng Nghymru? OAQ0125(FM)

**The First Minister:** Mobile phone masts are located in places which align with the technical and operational requirements of the network operators, subject to compliance with legislation and having regard to relevant Assembly guidance and local policies.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Lleolir mastiau ffonau symudol fel eu bod yn bodloni anghenion technegol a gweithredol y cwmnïau rhwydwaith, gan ufuddhau i ofynion deddfwriaethol a chan ystyried canllawiau'r Cynulliad a pholisïau lleol perthnasol.

**Irene James:** Do you agree that planning mobile phone mast sites is an emotive issue, particularly when there are proposals to place a mast near an area where children congregate? In order to ensure that masts are placed appropriately, and that the process of their placement is open and transparent, do you agree that the public must be kept fully informed? Developers should ensure a formal and informed consultation process with local residents and community groups that may be affected by the siting of these masts.

**The First Minister:** This can be emotive, and it is important that people realise that there is greater protection of the public interest in relation to the siting issues in Wales than elsewhere. Normally, local planning for new mobile phone masts could be sought under permitted development. That is, formal planning permission would not be needed. However, in Wales we have a prior approval scheme, whereby the person seeking to locate the mobile phone mast must ask for a determination from the local authority as to whether it would be allowed under permitted development, or whether it needs to go through the full planning application process. That means that there is greater consultation with the local authorities in Wales than is the case elsewhere.

**Elin Jones:** A dderbyniwch ei bod yn bwysig ymgynghori â chymunedau? Mae anfodlonrwydd mawr yng Ngheredigion ynglŷn â diogelwch mastiau Tetra. Yn ogystal ag ymgynghori â'r cyngor, mae angen ymgynghori'n llawn â chymunedau lleol. A wnewch chi ymrwymo i sicrhau bod cwmnïau telegyfathrebu, fel mmO2, sy'n datblygu Tetra, yn ymgynghori ag ysgolion a cholegau o fewn 500 m o fast telegyfathrebu arfaethedig? Ar hyn o bryd, nid ymgynghorir â chyrff llywodraethu ysgolion a cholegau, ac mae mastiau yn cael eu codi gerllaw ysgolion yng Ngheredigion.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid yw'n fater i mi ddweud wrth awdurdodau lleol sut i gynnal ymgynghoriad. Mae'r broses yng Nghymru yn rhoi mwy o rym i awdurdodau lleol, gan iddynt dderbyn rhybudd o flaen llaw. Mae modd iddynt fynnu cais am ganiatâd

**Irene James:** A gytunwch fod cynllunio ar gyfer safleoedd mastiau ffonau symudol yn fater sy'n ennyn teimladau cryf, yn enwedig os cynigir gosod mast yn agos at fan y bydd plant yn ymgasglu? Er mwyn sicrhau y caiff mastiau eu gosod mewn man priodol, a bod y broses ar gyfer eu gosod yn agored ac yn dryloyw, a gytunwch fod rhaid hysbysu'r cyhoedd yn drwyadl? Dylai datblygwyr ofalu bod proses ffurfiol a goleuedig i ymgynghori â thrigolion lleol a grwpiau cymunedol a allai gael eu heffeithio drwy osod mastiau o'r fath.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gall hyn ennyn teimladau cryf, ac mae'n bwysig i bobl sylweddoli bod mwy o amddiffyniad i fuddiannau'r cyhoedd o ran materion sy'n ymwneud â lleoli yng Nghymru nag mewn mannau eraill. Fel arfer, gellid ceisio caniatâd cynllunio lleol ar gyfer mastiau ffonau symudol newydd fel datblygu a ganiateir. Hynny yw, ni fyddai'n rhaid cael caniatâd cynllunio ffurfiol. Fodd bynnag, yng Nghymru mae gennym gynllun cymeradwyo o flaen llaw, fel bod rhaid i'r sawl sy'n ceisio lleoli'r mast ffonau symudol ofyn am benderfyniad gan yr awdurdod lleol ynghylch a ganiateid hynny fel datblygu a ganiateir, neu a fyddai'n rhaid mynd drwy'r broses lawn o wneud cais cynllunio. Oherwydd hynny, ceir mwy o ymgynghori ag awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru nag mewn mannau eraill.

**Elin Jones:** Do you accept that it is important that communities are consulted? There is great concern in Ceredigion about the safety of Tetra masts. In addition to consultation with the council, there needs to be full consultation with local communities. Will you give a commitment to ensuring that telecommunications companies, such as mmO2, which is developing Tetra, consult with schools and colleges sited within 500 m of a proposed telecommunications mast? At the moment, there is no consultation with the governing bodies of schools and colleges, and masts are being erected near schools in Ceredigion.

**The First Minister:** It is not for me to tell local authorities how they should carry out consultations. The process in Wales gives local authorities greater leverage, in that they have prior warning. They can insist on a full planning application, rather than allowing the

cynllunio llawn, yn hytrach na bod cynlluniau yn cael eu derbyn yn awtomatig. Mater i'r awdurdod lleol yw sut y mae'n ymgynghori â chyngorwyr neu'r cyhoedd. Mae'r broses gynllunio yn gryfach yng Nghymru nag ydyw yn Lloegr o ran y rhybudd a roddir i bawb o flaen llaw.

**Lynne Neagle:** I have received representations over some months from residents in Talywain regarding a proposed mobile phone mast there. I agree that consultation is crucial, and I understand that mobile phone companies are meant to hold consultations with local people. That has not been the case in Talywain. Do you agree that the whole issue of a voluntary code of practice for mobile phone operators needs to be looked at, so that consultation with local communities is strengthened?

**The First Minister:** I am reluctant to over-bureaucratise this process, given that we already have tighter control over this matter than England does. It is important that people realise how this works. Elsewhere, it is a little like building a small extension that is less than 10 or 15 per cent of the size of the house.

2.10 p.m.

It just goes through on the nod, and you do not require formal planning permission. Although this can only relate to the siting and appearance of a mast and not to the principle of having one, it nevertheless means that the public will be informed by the local authority, but not in a way that we prescribe. It is up to local authorities to decide how they engage with the public, given that they are part of the prior approval system under which, unlike in England, things do not go through on the nod.

schemes to go through on the nod. It is a matter for the local authority how it consults with councillors or the public. The planning process is more robust in Wales than in England, in terms of the prior notice that everyone gets.

**Lynne Neagle:** Mae sylwadau wedi'u cyflwyno i mi dros rai misoedd gan drigolion yn Nhal-y-waun ynghylch bwriad i godi mast ffonau symudol yn y fan honno. Cytunaf ei bod yn hollbwysig ymgynghori, a deallaf fod cwmnïau ffonau symudol i fod i ymgynghori â phobl leol. Ni ddigwyddodd hynny yn achos Tal-y-waun. A gytunwch fod angen edrych ar y mater cod ymarfer gwirfoddol ar gyfer cwmnïau ffonau symudol yn ei gyfanrwydd, fel y ceir gwell ymgynghori â chymunedau lleol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Byddai'n chwith gennyf beri i'r broses fod yn rhy fïwrocraidd, gan fod gennym reolaeth gadarnach eisoes dros y mater hwn nag a geir yn Lloegr. Mae'n bwysig i bobl sylweddoli sut y mae hyn yn gweithio. Mewn manau eraill, mae'n debyg braidd i godi estyniad bach sy'n llai na 10 neu 15 y cant o faint y tŷ.

Aiff drwodd heb drafodaeth, ac nid oes rhaid cael caniatâd cynllunio ffurfiol. Er nad yw hyn ond yn ymwneud â lleoliad ac ymddangosiad y mast ac nid â'r egwyddor o'i gael, mae'n golygu, er hynny, y caiff y cyhoedd eu hysbysu gan yr awdurdod lleol, ond nid mewn modd a ragnodir gennym ni. Lle awdurdodau lleol yw penderfynu sut y byddant yn ymwneud â'r cyhoedd, gan eu bod yn rhan o'r system gymeradwyo o flaen llaw lle nad aiff pethau drwodd heb drafodaeth, fel sy'n digwydd yn Lloegr.

### **Darparu Gwasanaethau'r GIG Delivering NHS Services**

**Q3 David Melding:** What measures is the Welsh Assembly Government taking to develop a diverse market to deliver NHS services? OAQ0134(FM)

**C3 David Melding:** Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn eu cymryd i ddatblygu marchnad amrywiol er mwyn darparu gwasanaethau'r GIG? OAQ0134(FM)

**The First Minister:** We take a totally

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae ein barn am



pragmatic view of provider diversity, David. We use facilities in different sectors—in the national health service and the independent sector—in meeting the health needs of the Welsh population. Indeed, the successful second offer scheme uses public-sector providers in Wales and England, and public and private-sector providers in Wales are also used. We may use BUPA or other hospitals, or use specialised NHS facilities in Weston-super-Mare, Kidderminster, Worcester, Bristol, Bath and so on. Alternatively, we may use a combination of these facilities in Wales. We must look at whatever assists the process of reducing the number of people on long waiting lists. If you compare the numbers in December 2002 with those for December 2004, you will see that this has proceeded successfully.

**David Melding:** I encourage a pragmatic, rather than an ideological, approach. This is a welcome change. The NHS in England aims to deliver 15 per cent of NHS services via the independent private sector. Do you think that a similar target—although it would take us longer to reach, given the current level of services—is a reasonable one to set?

**The First Minister:** If you read the commentary on what is happening in England, you will see that NHS providers are screaming blue murder about the fact that they will eventually have to give up 15 per cent of patients, because, having provided additional facilities, they will lose around 15 per cent of their income. This gives us an opportunity to use facilities from which the NHS must vacate patients so that they can be used by independent providers. We can, therefore, negotiate keen prices—marginal tariff prices—to use the spare capacity that emerges through the creation of over-capacity in England. This is what we intend to do.

**Val Lloyd:** Will you take this opportunity to assure me and all Members that the Labour Assembly Government will never introduce the patients' passport? Can you further assure me that the Government believes that the £114 million that this policy would take out

ddefnyddio gwahanol ddarparwyr yn gwbl bragmatig, David. Defnyddiwn gyfleusterau mewn gwahanol sectorau—yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol ac yn y sector annibynnol—wrth ddiwallu anghenion iechyd pobl Cymru. Yn wir, mae cynllun llwyddiannus yr ail gynnig yn defnyddio darparwyr yn y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru a Lloegr, a darparwyr yn y sectorau cyhoeddus a phreifat yng Nghymru hefyd. Gallem ddefnyddio ysbytai BUPA neu rai eraill, neu gyfleusterau arbenigol o eiddo'r GIG yn Weston-super-Mare, Kidderminster, Caerwrangon, Bryste, Caerfaddon ac yn y blaen. Fel arall, gallm ddefnyddio cyfuniad o'r cyfleusterau hynny yng Nghymru. Rhaid inni ystyried beth bynnag fydd o gymorth i leihau'r nifer ar restrau aros hir. Os cymharwch y ffigurau ar gyfer Rhagfyr 2002 â'r rhai ar gyfer Rhagfyr 2004, gwelwch fod hyn wedi mynd rhagddo'n llwyddiannus.

**David Melding:** Yr wyf yn argymhell dull pragmatig, yn hytrach nag un ideolegol. Mae hyn yn newid i'w groesawu. Mae'r GIG yn Lloegr yn ceisio darparu 15 y cant o wasanaethau'r GIG drwy'r sector preifat annibynnol. A gredwch ei bod yn rhesymol i ni osod targed tebyg—er y cymerai fwy o amser i'w gyrraedd, yng ngolwg lefel y gwasanaethau a geir ar hyn o bryd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Os darllenwch y sylwebaeth am yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn Lloegr, gwelwch fod darparwyr y GIG wedi cael eu cythruddo am y byddant yn gorfod rhoi'r gorau i drin 15 y cant o gleifion yn y pen draw, oherwydd, a hwythau wedi darparu cyfleusterau ychwanegol, byddant yn colli tua 15 y cant o'u hincwm. Mae hyn yn cynnig cyfle inni ddefnyddio cyfleusterau y mae'n rhaid i'r GIG symud cleifion ohonynt fel y gall darparwyr preifat eu defnyddio. Felly, gallwn negodi prisiau cystadleuol—prisiau ffiniol ar y rhestr—i ddefnyddio'r capasiti gwag a geir am fod gormod o gapasiti wedi'i greu yn Lloegr. Dyna yw ein bwriad.

**Val Lloyd:** A wnewch achub ar y cyfle hwn i'm sicrhau i a'r holl Aelodau na wnaiff Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad byth gyflwyno'r pasbort cleifion? A allwch fy sicrhau ymhellach fod y Llywodraeth yn credu mai gwell fyddai gwario'r £114 miliwn

of the NHS to fund private treatment for a few could be better spent on improving treatment and prevention for all?

**The First Minister:** I could not agree with you more, Val. The patients' passport scheme would do nothing other than to divert £60 million from front-line services to subsidise the wealthiest patients to jump the queue. I do not think that anyone in Wales would want this to happen. The sum of £60 million is equivalent to some 2,400 nurses and 660 consultants, and it would simply help a few people who can afford the money needed on top of the taxpayers' subsidy to pay for their operations.

**David Lloyd:** Pryd fyddwch yn cynyddu nifer y gwelyau yng nghyfleusterau'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn Abertawe er mwyn mynd i'r afael â rhestrau aros hir yn y fan honno?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn siŵr ai ychwanegu at nifer y gwelyau yw'r peth pwysig, ynteu gwneud gwell defnydd o'r gwelyau sydd ar gael eisoes. Mae'n siŵr eich bod wedi darllen adroddiad Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru, Syr John Bourn, sy'n annog y gwasnaeth iechyd gwladol i wneud gwell defnydd o welyau drwy gynyddu'r ganran sy'n derbyn triniaeth ddydd neu drwy aros un noson. Mae pwysau, felly, i gynyddu'r ganran hon, oherwydd yr ydym yn llusgo tu ôl i Loegr yn y meysydd hyn.

**The Leader of the Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** One of the areas where there is no shortage of diversity is the criticism of the health service by Labour MPs. Yesterday, the Minister for Health and Social Services, Dr Brian Gibbons, met Labour MPs in London. One of the MPs described Dr Gibbons as being less in denial than his predecessor. Are you less in denial now about the health service?

**The First Minister:** Those words mean nothing when you think about the real progress that we are making. I am more interested in figures and achievements than in words. If you consider the number of people who were waiting over 18 months in

a dynnid o'r GIG drwy'r polisi hwn i dalu am driniaeth breifat i'r ychydig, ar wella triniaeth a dulliau atal ar gyfer pawb?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cytunaf yn llwyr â chi, Val. Y cwbl a wnâi cynllun y pasbort cleifion fyddai troi £60 miliwn oddi wrth wasanaethau rheng flaen i sybsideiddio'r cleifion cyfoethocaf fel na fyddent yn gorfod aros. Ni chredaf fod unrhyw un yng Nghymru a garai weld hynny. Mae'r swm o £60 miliwn yn cyfateb i tua 2,400 o nyrsys a 660 o ymgynghorwyr, ac ni wnâi ddim ond helpu ychydig o bobl sy'n gallu fforddio'r arian ychwanegol ar ben cymhorthdal y trethdalwyr i dalu am eu llawdriniaethau.

**David Lloyd:** When will you increase the number of beds in NHS facilities in Swansea in order to get to grips with the long waiting lists in that area?

**The First Minister:** I am not sure whether it is more important for us to increase the number of beds or to make better use of those that we already have. You will have read the report of the Auditor General for Wales, Sir John Bourn, which urges the national health service to make better use of existing beds by increasing the percentage of people who receive ambulatory care or who stay in hospital for just one night. There is pressure, therefore, to increase this percentage, because we are lagging behind England in this regard.

**Arweinydd Grŵp y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol (Michael German):** Un o'r meysydd lle y ceir digon o amrywiaeth yw'r feirniadaeth ar y gwasanaeth iechyd gan ASau Llafur. Ddoe, cyfarfu'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, Dr Brian Gibbons, ag ASau Llafur yn Llundain. Dywedodd un o'r ASau fod Dr Gibbons yn barotach i syrthio ar ei fai nag yr oedd ei ragflaenydd. A ydych chi'n parotach i syrthio ar eich bai mewn cysylltiad â'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn awr?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r geiriau hynny'n ddiystyr yng ngolwg y cynnydd sylweddol a wnawn. Ymddiddoraf yn fwy mewn ffigurau a chyflawniadau nag mewn geiriau. Os ystyriwch y nifer a oedd yn aros yn hwy na 18 mis yn Rhagfyr 2003, yr oedd tua 5,700

December 2003, around 5,700 people were waiting for in-patient treatment. That figure is now around 600, which is a welcome reduction. The number of people waiting over 12 months has fallen sharply from around 11,000 to 6,500. Likewise, the number of those waiting over 18 months for out-patient treatment has also fallen from around 8,000 to 6,000. Those are the figures. Do not worry about the jargon, Mike; no-one is interested in that. People are interested in what the NHS is doing to bring down waiting lists. I have given you the figures, and they are pretty impressive. They confirm what I said, namely that Jane Hutt came to the end of her period as Minister for Health and Social Services and handed on the baton to Brian Gibbons from a position of strength.

**Michael German:** You must still be in denial because if you add together the figures for in-patients and out-patients the total number is more than it was previously. You visited the University Hospital of Wales accident and emergency unit on Thursday, which was a panic visit to see what was going on. Do you still stand by what you said in the Chamber last week, which was that the situation there was normal for the time of year? What action will you now take to satisfy the nurses and the other medical professionals in that unit who are concerned that you gave no response other than saying that the situation was normal?

**The First Minister:** In answer to a question that you asked, Mike, I said that we were seeing a particularly acute version of the January problem—I am sure that you will have the text in front of you. I stand by what I said. I am sure that you will agree that that is what I said because it appears in the Record. I visited the University Hospital of Wales three times last week—two visits were to the accident and emergency unit. I learnt a great deal from the nurses and doctors and from the paramedics with whom I spoke on the forecourt. If I were to change my response last week, I would place considerably less emphasis on chronic obstructive pulmonary disease, as I do not think that that is such a major factor. The figures—and I think that we are only

yn aros am driniaeth fel claf mewnol. Mae'r ffigur hwnnw wedi gostwng bellach i tua 600, ac mae hynny i'w groesawu. Mae'r nifer sy'n disgwyl yn hwy na 12 mis wedi disgyn yn sydyn o tua 11,000 i 6,500. Yn yr un modd, mae'r nifer sy'n aros yn hwy na 18 mis am driniaeth fel claf allanol hefyd wedi disgyn o tua 8,000 i 6,000. Dyna'r ffigurau. Anghofiwch am y jargon, Mike; nid oes neb yn ymddiddori yn hynny. Mae pobl yn ymddiddori yn yr hyn a wnaiff y GIG i ostwng rhestrau aros. Rhoddais y ffigurau i chi, ac maent yn eithaf trawiadol. Maent yn cadarnhau'r hyn a ddywedais, sef bod Jane Hutt wedi dod i ddiwedd ei chyfnod fel Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a bod Brian Gibbons wedi etifeddu sefyllfa gadarn ganddi.

**Michael German:** Mae'n rhaid eich bod yn dal i wrthod syrthio ar eich bai oherwydd, os adiwch y ffigurau ar gyfer cleifion mewnol a chleifion allanol, mae'r cyfanswm yn fwy nag ydoedd o'r blaen. Ymwelasoch ag uned ddamweiniau ac achosion brys Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru ddydd Iau, gan eich bod wedi rhusio ac am weld beth a oedd yn mynd ymlaen. A ydych yn dal at yr hyn a ddywedasoch yn y Siambr yr wythnos diwethaf, sef bod y sefyllfa yno'n un arferol ar yr adeg hon o'r flwyddyn? Pa gamau a gymerwch yn awr i fodloni'r nyrsys a'r gweithwyr meddygol proffesiynol eraill yn yr uned honno sy'n poeni am na wnaethoch ymateb heblaw dweud bod y sefyllfa'n un arferol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mewn ateb i gwestiwn a ofynasoch, Mike, dywedais ein bod yn gweld fersiwn arbennig o ddifrifol o'r broblem a geir ym mis Ionawr—yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y testun gennyh o'ch blaen. Daliaf at yr hyn a ddywedais. Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch mai hynny a ddywedais yr wythnos diwethaf gan ei fod i'w weld yn y Cofnod. Ymwelais ag Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru dair gwaith yr wythnos diwethaf—ymwelais ddwy waith â'r uned ddamweiniau ac achosion brys. Dysgais lawer iawn gan y nyrsys a'r meddygon a chan y parameddygon y siaredais â hwy ar y cwrw blaen. Pe byddwn am newid fy ymateb yr wythnos diwethaf, rhoddwn lawer llai o bwyslais ar afiechydon ysgyfeiniol rhwystr cronig, gan na chredaf fod hynny'n ffactor mor bwysig. Dengys y ffigurau—a chredaf

interested in figures here—indicate that peak periods, when the accident and emergency unit fills to bursting point, often happen in January as nine of the 14 such days over the past four years have occurred during that month. The facts are clear in that regard, and no amount of jargon or idiotic debating points of no interest to anyone can get you away from that. I would increase the emphasis that I placed last week on delayed transfers of care and possibly the dislocation caused by the new out-of-hours arrangements. I would also reduce the emphasis that I placed on the COPD problem.

**Michael German:** That is an interesting answer because, as you know, there were patients coming in and triaging at one end of the scale and there were delayed transfers at the other. The Assembly's Health and Social Care Department has now told me that only two people had delayed transfers of care at the University Hospital of Wales as a result of social care issues. The line that you took last week was that Cardiff County Council was to blame for everything. The figures provided by your department show that that is not the case. What steps will you take and what will the Minister for Health and Social Services be doing on the days on which he will not be dealing with waiting lists—I do not know what he will be doing for six days of the week—to improve the situation at the UHW accident and emergency unit so that patients will not be left on trolleys out in the cold?

**The First Minister:** You are obsessed with words. Look at the figures. It is true that the number of delayed transfers of care has fallen sharply in Wales but, unfortunately, has increased in the Cardiff area, as I understand it. I am told that two large nursing homes—one had 80 beds and the other had 40—were closed in Cardiff in November, which may have caused a particularly acute situation in December and January. Therefore, the issue of delayed transfers of care is more important than I thought it was last week. I have also spoken to the local health board and it takes a different view on whether or not the new out-

nad ydym ond yn ymddiddori mewn ffigurau yn hyn o beth—fod cyfnodau brig, pan fo'r uned ddamweiniau ac achosion brys yn orlawn, yn digwydd yn aml ym mis Ionawr gan fod naw o'r 14 diwrnod o'r fath dros y pedair blynedd diwethaf wedi digwydd yn ystod y mis hwnnw. Mae'r ffeithiau'n glir yn hynny o beth, ac nid oes unrhyw jargon neu bwyntiau dadlau gwirion sydd heb fod o ddiddordeb i unrhyw un a wnaiff dycio yn wyneb hynny. Rhoddwn fwy o bwyslais nag a wneuthum yr wythnos diwethaf ar oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal ac, efallai, ar y dryswch a achoswyd gan y trefniadau newydd y tu allan i oriau arferol. Rhoddwn lai o bwyslais hefyd ar broblem afiechydon ysgyfeiniol rhwystrol cronig.

**Michael German:** Mae hwnnw'n ateb diddorol oherwydd, fel y gwyddoch, yr oedd cleifion yn dod i mewn ac yn cael eu blaenoriaethu yn un pen ac yr oedd oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal yn y pen arall. Mae Adran Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol y Cynulliad wedi dweud wrthyf bellach mai dim ond dau achos o oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal a gafwyd yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru o ganlyniad i faterion sy'n ymwneud â gofal cymdeithasol. Eich dadl yr wythnos diwethaf oedd mai Cyngor Sir Caerdydd a oedd ar fai am bob dim. Mae'r ffigurau a ddarparodd eich adran yn dangos nad felly yr oedd. Pa gamau a gymerwch chi a pha beth a wnaiff y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar y diwrnodau nad yw'n delio â rhestrau aros—ni wn beth a wnaiff chwe diwrnod o'r wythnos—i wella'r sefyllfa yn uned ddamweiniau ac achosion brys Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru fel na chaiff cleifion eu gadael ar drolïau mewn lle oer?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae gennych obsesiwn â geiriau. Edrychwch ar y ffigurau. Mae'n wir bod nifer yr achosion o oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal wedi disgyn yn sydyn yng Nghymru ond, gwaetha'r modd, mae'r nifer wedi codi yn ardal Caerdydd, yn ôl yr hyn yr wyf yn ei ddeall. Dywedwyd wrthyf fod dau gartref nyrsio mawr—un ac ynddo 80 o welyau ac un ac ynddo 40—wedi'u cau yng Nghaerdydd ym mis Tachwedd, ac efallai mai hynny a barodd y sefyllfa arbennig o ddifrifol yn Rhagfyr ac Ionawr. Felly, mae mater yr oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal yn bwysicach nag a dybiais yr wythnos

of-hours system is contributing to the problem. We must bottom out the differing figures that I am receiving from the local health board and the trust. When I do that, I will ensure that I discuss with Brian what the implications will be in terms of any changes that are needed.

diwethaf. Yr wyf hefyd wedi siarad â'r bwrdd iechyd lleol ac mae ei farn ef ynghylch a yw'r system newydd y tu allan i oriau arferol yn cyfrannu at y broblem yn wahanol. Rhaid inni ddeall y gwahanol ffigurau yr wyf yn eu cael gan y bwrdd iechyd lleol a'r ymddiriedolaeth. Wedi imi wneud hynny, gofialaf drafod â Brian y goblygiadau o ran unrhyw newidiadau y mae eu hangen.

2.20 p.m.

### **Buddsoddi mewn Datblygu Gwledig Investment in Rural Development**

**Q4 Mick Bates:** Will the First Minister comment on investment in rural development? OAQ0129(FM)

**C4 Mick Bates:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog sylwadau ar fuddsoddi mewn datblygu gwledig? OAQ0129(FM)

**The First Minister:** The Assembly Government and the relevant sponsored bodies deliver a wide range of programmes, some rurally targeted, and some national, which invest in the development of rural Wales. Those strategic commitments are set out in 'A Winning Wales', our national economic development strategy, and in 'Wales: A Better Country'. They all show that the level of unemployment across rural Wales—with the possible exception of the Isle of Anglesey—is now in a healthier state than in any other comparable period during the past 30 years.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r cyrff noddedig perthnasol yn rhedeg amrywiaeth mawr o raglenni, rhai ar gyfer ardaloedd gwledig, a rhai cenedlaethol, sy'n buddsoddi yn natblygiad Cymru wledig. Nodir yr ymrwymadau strategol hynny yn 'Cymru'n Ennill', ein strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol, ac yn 'Cymru: Gwlad Well'. Maent oll yn dangos bod lefel diweithdra ledled Cymru wledig—heblaw am Ynys Môn efallai—yn iachach yn awr nag mewn unrhyw gyfnod tebyg yn ystod y 30 mlynedd diwethaf.

**Mick Bates:** I will scrutinise your statement a bit further. Last week, I asked when you would get the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside to spend the £17 million that he has in a suspense account, and you replied that

**Mick Bates:** Craffaf ymhellach ar eich datganiad. Yr wythnos diwethaf, gofynnais pa bryd y byddech yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad wario'r £17 miliwn sydd ganddo mewn cyfrif crog, ac atebasoch gan ddweud

'there is simply no basis to the allegation that you make'.

'nid oes unrhyw sail o gwbl i'r honiad a wnewch'.

I have evidence from the Minister's last report to the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee that the balance of the account is £17 million. Do you not agree that, in terms of investment in rural Wales, we should use that money to replace some of the manufacturing jobs that have been lost in mid Wales, instead of leaving it in your Minister's account?

Mae gennyf dystiolaeth o adroddiad diwethaf y Gweinidog i Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad i ddangos mai'r gweddill sydd yn y cyfrif yw £17 miliwn. Oni chytunwch, o ran buddsoddi yng Nghymru wledig, y dylem ddefnyddio'r arian hwnnw i greu swyddi gweithgynhyrchu yn lle rhai a gollwyd yn y Canolbarth, yn hytrach na'i adael yng nghyfrif eich Gweinidog?

**The First Minister:** It has not being left in

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nis gadewir yng nghyfrif

the account of this Minister, Carwyn Jones, or any other Minister. I can assure you that that money is now beginning to flow. We expect to use £3.3 million in 2005-06 and £5 million in 2006-07 for Tir Gofal alone, and, on top of that, there will be new commitments to Tir Cynnal, which is being introduced. Fifty per cent of the funding will come from modulated receipts and 50 per cent from additional matched funding from the Treasury. You cannot be certain of that level of spend because it is early days in the programme and it depends on the decision of individual farmers as to whether they want to be part of the Tir Cynnal scheme. However, there is a high level of interest in the scheme and we expect a high level of applications that will soak up all of that money.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Mae'r arian Ewropeaidd sydd ar gael ar gyfer datblygu gwledig yng Nghymru yn cael ei gyfyngu gan gytundeb Fontainebleau ar ad-daliadau i Brydain. Mae Tony Blair am gadw'r ad-daliadau hyn. A ydych chi'n cytuno ag ef?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ydw.

**Brynle Williams:** On the £17 million, we still have a lengthy waiting list of people who want to get into the Tir Gofal scheme. Why can some of this money not be used to speed up this process? We have one of the finest environmental schemes in Europe, yet we are denying farmers access and holding money back. Why can this money not be used?

**The First Minister:** We are trying to get it out through the door, Brynle. As I mentioned, we anticipate that £3.3 million will be spent on Tir Gofal in the year that will start in two months' time and £5 million the following year, for Tir Gofal payments alone. On top of that, we are introducing Tir Cynnal as quickly as we can and there is a high level of interest in that scheme. In the end, it is up to farmers themselves, but we anticipate that there will be full use of this money. As I mentioned, and this is also relevant to Alun Ffred Jones's question, there is matched funding from the Treasury, and 50 per cent of the funding will come from the modulated receipts from the changes in the common agricultural policy payments.

y Gweinidog hwn, Carwyn Jones, nac unrhyw Weinidog arall. Gallaf eich sicrhau bod yr arian hwnnw'n dechrau llifo'n awr. Rhagwelwn ddefnyddio £3.3 miliwn yn 2005-06 a £5 miliwn yn 2006-07 ar gyfer Tir Gofal yn unig, ac, ar ben hynny, bydd ymrwymadau newydd i Tir Cynnal, sy'n cael ei gyflwyno. Daw hanner y cyllid o'r derbyniadau oddi wrth fodiwleiddio a hanner o arian cyfatebol ychwanegol o'r Trysorlys. Ni ellir bod yn sicr o'r lefel gwariant hwnnw gan fod y rhaglen newydd ddechrau ac mae'n dibynnu ar benderfyniad y ffermwyr eu hunain ynghylch a ydynt am gymryd rhan yng nghynllun Tir Cynnal. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer o ddiddordeb yn y cynllun a disgwyliwn y ceir nifer mawr o geisiadau a wnaiff lyncu'r holl arian hwnnw.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The European funding available for rural development in Wales is limited by the Fontainebleau agreement on rebates for Britain. Tony Blair wants to retain these rebates. Do you agree with him?

**The First Minister:** Yes.

**Brynle Williams:** Ynghylch y swm o £17 miliwn, mae nifer fawr yn aros o hyd i ymuno â chynllun Tir Gofal. Pam na ellir defnyddio rhywfaint o'r arian hwn i gyflymu'r broses honno? Gennym ni y mae un o'r cynlluniau amgylcheddol gorau yn Ewrop, ac eto nid ydym yn gadael i ffermwyr ymuno ag ef ac yr ydym yn cadw arian yn ôl. Pam na ellir defnyddio'r arian hwn?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym yn ceisio'i wario, Brynle. Fel y dywedais, rhagwelwn y bydd £3.3 miliwn yn cael ei wario ar Tir Gofal yn y flwyddyn a fydd yn dechrau ymhen dau fis a £5 miliwn yn y flwyddyn wedyn, ar daliadau Tir Gofal yn unig. Ar ben hynny, yr ydym yn cyflwyno Tir Cynnal mor gyflym ag y gallwn ac mae llawer o ddiddordeb yn y cynllun hwnnw. Yn y diwedd, mae hyn yn fater i'r ffermwyr eu hunain, ond rhagwelwn y bydd y cyfan o'r arian yn cael ei ddefnyddio. Fel y dywedais, ac mae hyn hefyd yn berthnasol i gwestiwn Alun Ffred Jones, ceir arian cyfatebol oddi wrth y Trysorlys, a daw hanner y cyllid o'r derbyniadau oddi wrth fodiwleiddio o'r newidiadau i daliadau'r polisi amaethyddol

cyffredin.

### **Defnyddio Ffonau Symudol The Use of Mobile Phones**

**Q5 Sandy Mewies:** In the light of the recently published Stewart report on mobile phones and health, what advice, if any, does the Welsh Assembly Government provide regarding the use of mobile phones? OAQ0116(FM)

**The First Minister:** We give this advice through the chief medical officer who, in turn, works with the three other chief medical officers in the United Kingdom. The four UK chief medical officers strongly advise that, when children and young people use mobile phones, they should be encouraged to use them for essential purposes only and to keep all calls short.

**Sandy Mewies:** It is reassuring to learn that the Government responded in a positive way to the first report by the National Radiological Protection Board in 2000. However, given the contents of this recent report, will the Government examine its advice to ensure that it continues to adhere to the precautionary principle? It is particularly important where planning issues, such as the location of mobile phone masts, are concerned.

**The First Minister:** You are right. I have dealt, in a way, with the mobile phone mast issue, but although it covered mobile phone masts, this report was really trying to hammer home the issue about mobile phone use, especially by children, because their brain cells are growing and changing, and the radio waves may have a greater impact on developing brains. We are considering the NRPB recommendations in the report, and a joint UK Government response is proposed. We would be associated with that, but we would not have a separate response in Wales because the scientific expertise is for the critical mass of the UK as a whole rather than there being separate scientific expertise for the four component parts of the UK.

**C5 Sandy Mewies:** Yng ngoleuni adroddiad Stuart ar ffonau symudol ac iechyd a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar, pa gyngor y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei roi, os o gwbl, ynghylch defnyddio ffonau symudol? OAQ0116(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Rhoddwn y cyngor hwn drwy'r prif swyddog meddygol sydd, yn ei dro, yn gweithio gyda'r tri phrif swyddog meddygol arall yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae pedwar prif swyddog meddygol y DU yn taer gynghori, os yw plant a phobl ifanc yn defnyddio ffonau symudol, y dylid eu hannog i'w defnyddio i ddibenion hanfodol yn unig ac i gadw pob galwad yn fyr.

**Sandy Mewies:** Calonogol yw gwybod bod y Llywodraeth wedi ymateb yn gadarnhaol i adroddiad cyntaf y Bwrdd Cenedlaethol Diogelu Radiolegol yn 2000. Fodd bynnag, yng ngolwg cynnwys yr adroddiad diweddar hwn, a wnaiff y Llywodraeth edrych ar ei chynghor i sicrhau ei fod yn dal i lynu wrth yr egwyddor ragofalus? Mae hynny'n arbennig o bwysig mewn cysylltiad â materion sy'n ymwneud â chynllunio, fel lleoli mastiau ffonau symudol.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych yn iawn. Yr wyf wedi delio, ar un ystyr, â mater y mastiau ffonau symudol, ond er ei fod yn ymdrin â mastiau ffonau symudol, yr oedd yr adroddiad hwn yn ceisio tynnu sylw'n bennaf at fater y defnydd o ffonau symudol, gan blant yn benodol, gan fod eu celloedd ymennydd yn tyfu ac yn newid, a gallai'r tonnau radio gael mwy o effaith ar ymennydd sy'n datblygu. Yr ydym yn ystyried yr argymhellion a gafwyd gan y Bwrdd Cenedlaethol Diogelu Radiolegol yn yr adroddiad, ac mae Llywodraeth y DU yn bwriadu rhoi ymateb ar y cyd. Byddem yn gysylltiedig â hynny, ond ni fyddem yn ymateb ar wahân yng Nghymru gan fod yr arbenigedd gwyddonol yn berthnasol i'r DU gyfan yn hytrach na bod arbenigedd gwyddonol gwahanol ar gyfer pedair rhan gydrannol y DU.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 6, OAQ0127(FM), has been withdrawn.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae cwestiwn 6, OAQ0127(FM), wedi'i dynnu yn ôl.

### **Darparu Prydau Ysgol The Provision of School Meals**

**Q7 Lynne Neagle:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the provision of school meals in Wales? OAQ0105(FM)

**C7 Lynne Neagle:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar ddarparu prydau ysgol yng Nghymru? OAQ0105(FM)

**The First Minister:** Responsibility for school meals rests with local education authorities, or the function is sometimes delegated to school governing bodies. They must provide school dinners to pupils who have free entitlement and can make provision for other pupils. Lunch must comply with regulations on minimum nutritional standards. The guidance on this was last updated in March 2003.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r cyfrifoldeb dros brydau ysgol yn perthyn i awdurdodau addysg lleol, neu dirprwyir y swyddogaeth weithiau i gyrff llywodraethu ysgol. Rhaid iddynt ddarparu ciniawau ysgol i ddisgyblion sydd â hawl i'w cael am ddim a gallant ddarparu ar gyfer disgyblion eraill. Rhaid i'r bwyd gydymffurfio â rheoliadau ar safonau maethol gofynnol. Cafodd y canllawiau ar hynny eu diweddarau ddiwethaf ym mis Mawrth 2003.

**Lynne Neagle:** Cardiff University has uncovered evidence showing that the UK is lagging behind parts of Europe in terms of promoting healthy food in schools. In places such as Ferrara in Italy, the authorities are working with local suppliers to ensure that 80 per cent of school meals are organic and locally sourced, which means that they have many health benefits. The Scottish Executive has also recently published its 'Hungry for Success' guidance that stipulates the nutritional value of school meals for a full week, which is not covered in existing guidance in Wales. Do you agree that poor school meals have a detrimental effect on child health, particularly on the health of children living in poverty? Will you consider the Cardiff University study and revisit our guidance on this issue to ensure that we do as much as we can to promote health equality in terms of school meals?

**Lynne Neagle:** Mae Prifysgol Caerdydd wedi darganfod tystiolaeth sy'n dangos bod y DU ar ôl rhannau o Ewrop o ran hyrwyddo bwyd iach mewn ysgolion. Mewn mannau fel Ferrara yn yr Eidal, mae'r awdurdodau'n gweithio gyda chyflenwyr lleol i sicrhau bod 80 y cant o brydau ysgol yn organig ac yn dod o ffynonellau lleol, fel eu bod yn dod â llawer o fuddion iechyd. Mae Gweithrediaeth yr Alban hefyd wedi cyhoeddi ei chanllawiau 'Hungry for Success' yn ddiweddar sy'n rhagnodi gwerth maeth prydau ysgol am wythnos gyfan, ac nid ymdrinnir â hynny yn y canllawiau presennol yng Nghymru. A gytunwch fod prydau ysgol gwael yn cael drwg effaith ar iechyd plant, yn enwedig iechyd plant sy'n byw mewn tlodi? A wnewch ystyried astudiaeth Prifysgol Caerdydd ac ailedrych ar ein canllawiau ar y mater hwn i sicrhau y gwnawn gymaint ag a allwn i hyrwyddo cydraddoldeb iechyd yng nghyd-destun prydau ysgol?

**The First Minister:** I agree, but there is not unanimity on this point. A comment was made recently about whether there was any difference between eating organic burgers five times a week and eating non-organic burgers five times a week in terms of the health consequences for children. Dieticians say that it will not make any difference, as the fat content of an organic burger is just as high as that of a non-organic burger.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn cytuno, ond nid yw pawb o'r un farn ar y pwynt hwn. Gwnaed sylw'n ddiweddar ynghylch a oedd gwahaniaeth rhwng bwyta pum byrgyr organig bum gwaith yr wythnos a bwyta byrgyrs anorganig bum gwaith yr wythnos o ran yr effeithiau ar iechyd plant. Dywed deietegwyr na wnaiff hynny unrhyw wahaniaeth, gan fod cymaint o fraster mewn byrgyr organig ag sydd mewn un anorganig.



Therefore, we must not assume that the word 'organic' means of high nutritional value, with no obesity consequences and so on. I am familiar with the study that you mentioned and I note what you say about Ferrara, although I do not recall that example. However, we also have good examples in Wales. Carmarthenshire County Council is regarded as the lead authority in Wales on this, and I commend its efforts and the efforts that its superb school chefs have made.

Likewise in the provision of school breakfasts, there has been a big changeover since we took on the main responsibility from the New Opportunities Fund for funding free school breakfasts. It has gone from a situation where it did not matter what the breakfast was—it could be high-sugar cereals, white bread and so on—to being healthy-food breakfasts, containing slow-release carbohydrates; I had better not advertise the products, but we all know what they are. Wholemeal toast is provided rather than white toast, because you get the benefit of this bread over a two-hour period after eating instead of just half an hour.

**David Davies:** Your last manifesto said that all primary school children would receive a free school breakfast. Did you cost that manifesto commitment? Will you implement it? Will we see pupils with egg on their plates or Ministers with egg on their faces?

**The First Minister:** That is very funny and a wonderful third-form debating point. That was better than your usual efforts. Yes, that commitment was costed on the basis of the only information that was available to us. It was not costed by civil servants, as that would have been improper, but it was based on research work done by the New Policy Institute, which indicated an 11 per cent take-up rate in the existing free breakfast programmes in the NOF pilot schemes. We used the 11 per cent take-up rate and have since increased it to give us cover. We think that it is likely that, because we are promoting the scheme, the take-up rate will be in the order of 20 per cent.

Gan hynny, ni ddylem gymryd bod y gair 'organig' yn golygu gwerth maeth uchel, heb unrhyw ganlyniadau o ran gordewdra ac yn y blaen. Yr wyf yn gyfarwydd â'r astudiaeth y cyfeiriasoch ati a nodaf yr hyn a ddywedasoch am Ferrara, er na chofiaf yr enghraifft honno. Fodd bynnag, mae gennym enghreifftiau da yng Nghymru hefyd. Bernir mai Cyngor Sir Caerfyrddin yw'r awdurdod sy'n arwain ar hyn yng Nghymru, a chymeradwyaf ei ymdrechion ac ymdrechion ei gogyddion ysgol rhagorol.

Wrth ddarparu brecwastau ysgol, yn yr un modd, bu newid mawr ers inni gymryd y prif gyfrifoldeb oddi wrth y Gronfa Cyfleoedd Newydd dros ariannu brecwastau am ddim yn yr ysgol. Cafwyd newid o sefyllfa lle nad oedd o bwys beth a oedd y brecwast—gallai fod yn rawnfwyd â llawer o siwgr, bara gwyn ac yn y blaen—fel y ceir bellach frecwastau o fwyd iach, sy'n cynnwys carbohydradau sy'n rhyddhau egni'n araf; byddai'n well imi beidio â hysbysebu'r cynhyrchion, ond yr ydym i gyd yn gwybod beth ydynt. Darperir tost bara gwenith cyflawn yn hytrach na thost bara gwyn, gan y ceir daioni o'r bara hwnnw am ddwy awr ar ôl ei fwyta, yn hytrach na dim ond hanner awr.

**David Davies:** Yr oedd eich maniffesto diwethaf yn dweud y byddai'r holl blant ysgol gynradd yn cael brecwast am ddim yn yr ysgol. A wnaethoch brisio'r ymrwymiad maniffesto hwnnw? A wnewch ei gyflawni? A welwn ddisgyblion ac ŵy ar eu platiau ynteu Gweinidogion ac ŵy ar eu hwynebau?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hwnnw'n bwynt dadlau digrif ac un a fyddai'n wych gan rywun yn y trydydd dosbarth. Yr oedd yn well na'ch ymdrechion arferol. Do, prisiwyd yr ymrwymiad hwnnw ar sail yr unig wybodaeth a oedd ar gael i ni. Nis prisiwyd gan weision sifil, gan y buasai hynny'n amhriodol, ond yr oedd yn seiliedig ar waith ymchwil gan y Sefydliad Polisi Newydd, a ddangosodd fod 11 y cant yn cymryd brecwast yn y rhaglenni presennol o dan gynlluniau peilot y Gronfa Cyfleoedd Newydd. Defnyddiasom y gyfradd derbyn o 11 y cant a'i chodi ers hynny i gael bod yn sicr. Credwn ei bod yn debygol, gan ein bod yn hyrwyddo'r cynllun hwn, y bydd y

gyfradd derbyn tua 20 y cant.

You would be the first to criticise us if we made free school breakfasts compulsory. We have never said that we would do that. That would amount to force-feeding children and it would be wrong. We have always made it clear that it depends on whether the child and the parent want the breakfasts and on whether the school can provide them. We are promoting the scheme, but we think that the likeliest outcome will be about double the take-up rate that was noted in the New Policy Institute study on which we based the manifesto commitment.

Chi fyddai'r cyntaf i'n beirniadu pe gwnaem frecwastau am ddim yn yr ysgol yn rhywbeth gorfodol. Nid ydym erioed wedi dweud y gwnaem hynny. Byddai hynny'n gyfystyr â gorfodi plant i fwyta a byddai'n anghywir. Yr ydym wedi'i gwneud yn glir erioed fod hyn yn dibynnu ar ddymuniad y plentyn a'r rhiant i gael y brecwastau a gallu'r ysgol i'w darparu. Yr ydym yn hyrwyddo'r cynllun, ond credwn ei bod yn debygol y bydd y gyfradd derbyn tua dwywaith gymaint â'r hyn a nodwyd yn yr astudiaeth gan y Sefydliad Polisi Newydd y gwnaethom seilio'r ymrwymiad maniffesto arni.

### Trwyddedau 24 Awr 24-hour Licensing

**Q8 Helen Mary Jones:** What recent discussions has the First Minister held with UK Government Ministers regarding 24-hour licensing? OAQ0102(FM)

**C8 Helen Mary Jones:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cael yn ddiweddar â Gweinidogion Llywodraeth y DU ynghylch trwyddedau 24 awr? OAQ0102(FM)

**The First Minister:** None.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dim.

**Helen Mary Jones:** That is disappointing, given the level of public concern about this issue. Do you share my concern about the role that heavy drinking, not just on licensed premises but also in the home, plays in domestic violence? Current figures suggest that about 25 per cent of all cases are alcohol-related. Do you have any plans to raise concerns with UK Government Ministers about what needs to be done to deal with any potential increase in domestic violence that occurs as a result of an extension of the licensing laws?

**Helen Mary Jones:** Mae hynny'n siomedig, gan fod pryder mawr ymysg y cyhoedd am y mater hwn. A ydych yn rhannu fy mhryder ynghylch y rhan y mae yfed trwm yn ei chwarae, nid yn unig mewn adeiladau trwyddedig ond yn y cartref hefyd, mewn trais domestig? Mae'r ffigurau cyfredol yn awgrymu bod tua 25 y cant o'r holl achosion yn gysylltiedig ag alcohol. A oes gennych unrhyw fwriad i fynegi pryderon wrth Weinidogion Llywodraeth y DU am yr hyn y mae angen ei wneud i ddelio ag unrhyw gynnydd posibl mewn trais yn y cartref a geir o ganlyniad i ymestyn y Deddfau trwyddedu?

2.30 p.m.

**The First Minister:** You mentioned the possibility that drinking at home or buying alcoholic drinks from off-licences can be significant in this regard. It is not merely about converting from our traditional pub hours to being able to open and close whenever the publican wants to do so. You are right to place a heavy emphasis on alcohol as a major contributor to accident and emergency attendances. Around 40 per cent

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cyfeiriasoch at y posibilrwydd bod yfed yn y cartref neu brynu diodydd cadarn mewn siopau trwyddedig yn bwysig yn hyn o beth. Mae'n ymwneud â mwy na newid oriau agor arferol ein tafarnau fel y gall y tafarnwr agor a chau yn ôl ei ddymuniad. Yr ydych yn iawn wrth roi pwys mawr ar y ffaith bod alcohol yn cyfrannu'n helaeth at y nifer a ddaw i adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys. Mae tua 40 y

of all accident and emergency attendances are related to alcohol, and this figure rises to around 80 per cent during the peak periods of Friday and Saturday nights. This is an important issue. There are also issues around drinking from glass or plastic vessels, which can assist a great deal, but there is a need to change the binge drinking culture, which I have mentioned previously. We all accept that we must somehow re-educate the British public as to how to enjoy alcohol in a sensible and moderate way, rather than enjoying getting drunk via alcohol, which is not clever. Drinking in this way will damage people's livers and ruin their health, and I hope that we can emphasise this fact in Health Challenge Wales's big day tomorrow.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** Like Helen Mary Jones, I am surprised that you have not taken up this issue with your Westminster colleagues. I know that the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration has had discussions with the police, and that this issue has been raised as a concern. We know the views of many police officers in Wales and those of the health service. There is a concern about the impact of binge drinking and 24-hour licensing on people's health. You are aware, as we all are, of the problems that occur in Cardiff in the evenings, particularly at weekends, in St Mary Street for example and similarly in Wind Street in Swansea. This is a serious issue. Why have you not raised this with Westminster colleagues and passed on the deep concerns that many of us, including you presumably, have about this important issue?

**The First Minister:** This is an important issue—there is no downplaying of that—and it is about concentration versus dispersal. The police in Wales, and in England, were keen on the dispersal argument some three years ago. They said that it would be better to have dispersal and therefore an avoidance of the crush that occurs when everyone comes out of the pub at the same time at 11 p.m. and from the clubs at around 2.30 a.m. Dispersing was thought to prevent fights, rows over taxis, and kebab or chip shop queues and so on. My understanding is that the police have

cant o'r achosion a welir mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys yn ymwneud ag alcohol, ac mae'r ffigur hwnnw'n codi i tua 80 y cant yn ystod y cyfnodau brig ar nos Wener a nos Sadwrn. Mae hwn yn bwnc pwysig. Mae materion yn codi hefyd ynghylch yfed o lestri gwydr neu blastig, a all fod o gymorth mawr, ond rhaid newid yr arfer o oryfed dros gyfnodau byr, yr wyf wedi cyfeirio ato o'r blaen. Yr ydym oll yn derbyn bod rhaid inni rywsut ailaddysgu'r cyhoedd ym Mhrydain i fwynhau yfed alcohol yn synhwyrol ac yn gymedrol yn hytrach na mwynhau meddwi, gan nad yw hynny'n beth clyfar. Bydd yfed fel hyn yn niweidio'r iau ac yn andwyo'r iechyd, a gobeithiaf y gallwn bwysleisio'r ffaith honno ar ddiwrnod mawr Her Iechyd Cymru yfory.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Fel Helen Mary Jones, yr wyf yn synnu nad ydych wedi codi'r mater hwn gyda'ch cyd-Weinidogion yn San Steffan. Gwn fod y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio wedi cael trafodaethau gyda'r heddlu, a bod y mater hwn wedi'i godi fel testun pryder. Gwyddom am farn llawer o heddweision yng Nghymru ac am farn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae pryder ynghylch effaith y pyliau o oryfed a thrwyddedau 24 awr ar iechyd. Yr ydych yn ymwybodol, fel yr ydym ni, o'r problemau a geir yng Nghaerdydd gyda'r hwyr, yn enwedig ar benwythnosau, yn Heol Eglwys Fair, er enghraifft, ac yn Wind Street yn Abertawe yr un modd. Mae hyn yn fater difrifol. Pam nad ydych wedi codi hyn gyda'ch cyd-Weinidogion yn San Steffan ac wedi cyfleu'r pryderon dwys sydd gan lawer ohonom, gan eich cynnwys chi, mae'n debyg, ynghylch y pwnc pwysig hwn?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hwn yn bwnc pwysig—ni cheisir ei fychanu—ac mae'n ymwneud â'r ddadl o blaid crynhoi neu wasgaru. Yr oedd yr heddlu yng Nghymru, ac yn Lloegr, yn bleidiol i'r ddadl dros wasgaru ryw dair blynedd yn ôl. Dywedodd mai gwell fyddai gwasgaru ac felly osgoi cael y tyrfeydd a welir pan yw pawb yn dod allan o'r tafarnau yr un pryd am 11 p.m. ac o'r clybiau tua 2.30 a.m. Credwyd y byddai gwasgaru'n fodd i osgoi ymladd, ffræo ynghylch tacsis, a chiwiau yn y siopau sglogdion a chebabau ac yn y blaen. Yr wyf yn

changed their minds in the past three years and that they would now prefer to maintain the present concentration so that they know where the problem is, even though they know that it might be difficult to police that area for half an hour after chucking-out time, and likewise, club closing time. I would be interested to hear about the outcome of Edwina's discussions with the chief constables in Wales on the issue of concentration versus dispersal. This is one of the most fundamental issues of our time.

**Nick Bourne:** I am grateful for that response, but please do not leave it too late before you pass on these concerns. You will know of Ireland's experience, which is perhaps the closest parallel that we can use. It introduced 24-hour licensing, but it has now gone back to the old regime because it was far better. Let us not go down this route and discover that we have deep social and health problems. We must not leave it too late. This is an issue upon which you need to act speedily if we are going to head off what could be a serious problem.

**The First Minister:** The biggest change in Ireland was not so much to do with the 24-hour culture, but with how many licenses to issue. Until three years or so ago, Dublin, and the Temple Bar district in particular, were keen to be known as the hen and stag night capital of Europe. This is great for bringing in tourists, and for the drink industry in Ireland, and for balance of payments and so on. However, Ireland has gone back on that and now wants to restrict the number of pubs, clubs, restaurants and bars in downtown districts such as Temple Bar. It does not like it anymore, and new legislation has been introduced to deal with the situation. As far as I am aware, this policy is being followed by most large city authorities, including Cardiff and Swansea, which have also swung around. They have given up on the idea that we can simply move to a continental culture of everyone sipping cappuccinos or glasses of wine late at night—it just will not happen until we change the drinking culture, and the Assembly is on board with that.

deall bod yr heddlu wedi ailfeddwl yn y tair blynedd diwethaf ac y byddai'n well ganddynt gadw'r crynhoi a geir ar hyn o bryd fel y gŵyr ym mhle y mae'r broblem, er y gŵyr y gallai fod yn anodd plismona'r ardal honno am hanner awr ar ôl yr amser taflu allan, ac yn yr un modd, ar ôl cau'r clybiau. Byddai o ddiddordeb imi glywed am ganlyniad trafodaethau Edwina â'r prif gwnstabiliaid yng Nghymru ar fater y ddadl o blaid crynhoi neu wasgaru. Dyma un o bynciau pwysicaf ein hoes.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am yr ymateb hwnnw, ond peidiwch â'i gadael yn rhy hwyr i gyfleu'r pryderon hynny, os gwelwch yn dda. Gwyddoch am y profiad a gafwyd yn Iwerddon, sef y gymhariaeth agosaf y gallwn gyfeirio ati. Cyflwynodd drwyddedau 24 awr, ond bellach aeth yn ôl i'r hen drefn gan ei bod yn well o lawer. Na foed inni ddilyn y llwybr hwn a darganfod bod gennym broblemau iechyd a chymdeithasol dwys. Rhaid inni beidio â'i gadael yn rhy hwyr. Rhaid ichi gymryd camau buan ynghylch y mater hwn os ydym i osgoi'r hyn a allai fod yn broblem ddirifol.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr oedd y newid mwyaf yn Iwerddon yn ymwneud nid yn ogymaint â'r arferion yfed 24 awr, ond â nifer y trwyddedau a roddir. Hyd at ryw dair blynedd yn ôl, yr oedd Dilyn, ac ardal Temple Bar yn enwedig, yn awyddus i gael ei hadnabod fel y brif gyrchfan yn Ewrop ar gyfer partïon i griwiau o ddynion neu fenywod. Mae hynny'n beth gwych i ddenu ymwelwyr, ac i'r diwydiant diodydd yn Iwerddon, ac i'r fantol daliadau ac yn y blaen. Fodd bynnag, mae Iwerddon wedi cefnu ar hynny bellach ac yn dymuno cyfyngu ar nifer y tafarnau, y clybiau, y bwytai a'r barrau mewn ardaloedd yng nghanol y ddinas fel Temple Bar. Nid yw'n hoffi hynny bellach, a chyflwynir deddfwriaeth newydd i ddelio â'r sefyllfa. Hyd y gwn i, dilynir y polisi hwn gan y rhan fwyaf o awdurdodau'r dinasoedd mawr, gan gynnwys Caerdydd ac Abertawe, sydd hefyd wedi ailfeddwl. Maent wedi rhoi'r gorau i'r syniad y gallwn newid fel bod gennym arferion cyfandirol lle y bydd pawb yn llymeitïan coffi *cappuccino* neu win hyd yn hwyr y nos—ni ddigwydd hynny hyd nes y newidiwn arferion yfed, ac mae'r Cynulliad o blaid hynny.

**Adroddiad 'Amseroedd Aros y GIG yng Nghymru'  
The 'NHS Waiting Times in Wales' Report**

**C9 David Lloyd:** Pa bryd y daeth y Prif Weinidog i wybod gyntaf am gynnwys adroddiad 'Amseroedd Aros y GIG yng Nghymru'? OAO0103(FM)

**Q9 David Lloyd:** When did the First Minister first become aware of the contents of the 'NHS Waiting Times in Wales' report? OAO0103(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Fel gyda phob adroddiad gan yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol, cefais wybod, yn ôl yr arfer, gan yr Ysgrifennydd Parhaol ddiwedd y llynedd, fod y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol wedi paratoi adroddiad drafft ar y mater hwn. Yn ôl yr arfer, derbyniodd fy swyddfa gopi o'r adroddiad terfynol dau ddiwrnod cyn iddo gael ei gyhoeddi.

**The First Minister:** As with all of the Auditor General's reports, I was told, as a matter of course, by the Permanent Secretary towards the end of last year, that the National Audit Office had written a draft report on this issue. As is customary, my office received a copy of the final report two days before it was published.

**David Lloyd:** Felly, ai cyd-ddigwyddiad pur oedd ymddangosiad yr adroddiad hwn ychydig ddyddiau'n unig wedi penodi Gweinidog newydd dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol?

**David Lloyd:** Therefore, was it pure coincidence that this report appeared only a few days after the appointment of a new Minister for Health and Social Services?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr oedd yn gyddigwyddiad llwyr. Fel y dywedais, mae'r ffigurau'n hollol glir ynghylch y gostyngiad o bron 50 y cant yn nifer y rhai sydd wedi bod yn aros am gyfnod hir i dderbyn triniaeth. Mae'r ffigurau'n well o ran y rhai sydd wedi bod aros am dros 18 mis. Pan gyhoeddwyd y ffigurau ar gyfer y cyfnod hyd at ddiwedd 2004, dangosent fod Jane Hutt wedi pasio baton cyfrifoldebau iechyd i Brian Gibbons mewn sefyllfa o gryfder ac nid o wendid.

**The First Minister:** It was pure coincidence. As I said, the figures are quite explicit on the reduction of almost 50 per cent in the number of people who have been waiting a long time for treatment. The figures are even better for those waiting over 18 months. When the figures for the period up to the end of 2004 were published, they showed that Jane Hutt had passed the baton of responsibility for health to Brian Gibbons from a position of strength, not weakness.

**Kirsty Williams:** That report is damning in its findings on the inequality of access times between English and Welsh patients for in-patient procedures. Hereford Hospital is refusing to treat Powys patients in orthopaedic specialities until the new financial year, as a direct result of unequal access times for English and Welsh patients. It says that it cannot jeopardise its hospital by potentially missing its targets through treating patients from Wales at the expense of those from England. What will you do to readdress this inequality and ensure that Welsh patients have access times that are equal to those of their English counterparts?

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae'r adroddiad hwnnw'n ddamniol o ran yr hyn a ddarganfu am anghydraddoldeb yr amseroedd mynediad rhwng cleifion yng Nghymru a Lloegr ar gyfer triniaethau i gleifion mewnol. Mae Ysbyty Henffordd yn gwrthod rhoi triniaethau orthopedig arbenigol i gleifion o Bowys tan y flwyddyn ariannol newydd, o ganlyniad uniongyrchol i'r amseroedd mynediad anghyfartal ar gyfer cleifion o Gymru a Lloegr. Dywed na all beryglu'r ysbyty oherwydd y posibilrwydd o fethu â chyrraedd targedau drwy drin cleifion o Gymru ar draul rhai o Loegr. Pa gamau a gymerwch i gywiro'r anghydraddoldeb hwn a sicrhau y bydd amseroedd mynediad cleifion o Gymru yn gyfartal â rhai eu cymheiriaid yn Lloegr?

**The First Minister:** In some cases, access to treatment is faster than in England. On cataracts or access to primary care, there is a guarantee that you will be seen within 24 hours in Wales compared with 48 hours in England. You will also know that we are doing better than England in other areas; for example, the infant mortality rate in Wales is around 20 per cent lower than the rate in England. Similarly, the figures for outbreaks of methicillin resistant staphylococcus aureus are 50 per cent higher in England than in Wales. I thoroughly deprecate any behaviour of the kind that you mentioned by any hospital over the border. I do not know of the particular circumstances of Hereford and Powys, but I will make enquiries and ensure that Brian or I write to you.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Onid yw hi'n wir bod ysbytai yn Lloegr yn disgwyl am arian oddi wrth Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru, sy'n comisiynu triniaeth, ac mai yn y fan honno y mae'r broblem ac nid gyda'r ysbytai yn Lloegr? Mae hyn yn digwydd yn gyson i gleifion o Gymru sy'n derbyn triniaeth mewn ysbytai yn Lloegr. Maent yn aros yn hwy am eu triniaeth o ganlyniad i resymau ariannol, nid clinigol.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hyn yn dibynnu ar y cytundeb, a buom yn trafod hynny yn ystod y pedwar mis diwethaf. Yn ôl rhai cytundebau, er enghraifft, gallwn leoli cleifion sydd wedi bod yn aros dros 12 neu 18 mis am lawdriniaeth ar eu dwylo yn Weston-super-Mare. Os yw'r cytundeb yn nodi ein bod yn gallu cynnig triniaeth i'r cleifion hynny—a nid yw'r llawdriniaeth honno ond yn cymryd hyd at 10 munud—yn Weston-super-Mare, fe wnawn ni hynny, neu gallem eu hanfon i Gaerwrangon ac yn y blaen. Yr wyf wedi siarad â chleifion a gafodd driniaeth yn Nghaerwrangon, Kidderminster, a Weston-super-Mare. Nid oeddynt i gyd yn hapus, ond, yn y mwyafrif o achosion, cawsant driniaeth yn gyflymach nag a gaent yng Nghymru. Felly, yr ydym eisiau bwrw ymlaen gyda chynllun llwyddiannus yr ail gynnig.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** You have this

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mewn rhai achosion, ceir mynediad i driniaeth yn gynt nag yn Lloegr. Ynghylch triniaeth ar gyfer cataractau a mynediad i ofal sylfaenol, mae gwarant y'ch gwelir o fewn 24 awr yng Nghymru o'i gymharu â 48 awr yn Lloegr. Gwyddoch hefyd ein bod yn rhagori ar Lloegr mewn meysydd eraill; er enghraifft, mae'r gyfradd marwolaethau babanod yng Nghymru tua 20 y cant yn is na'r gyfradd yn Lloegr. Yn yr un modd, mae'r ffigurau am achosion o staffylococws awrëws sy'n gwrthsefyll methisilin yn 50 y cant yn uwch yn Lloegr nag yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn llwyr anghymeradwyo unrhyw ymddygiad o'r math y cyfeiriasoch ato gan unrhyw ysbyty yr ochr draw i'r ffin. Ni wn am yr amgylchiadau penodol a geir yn Henffordd a Phowys, ond gwnaf ymholiadau a sicrhau y gwnaiff Brian neu finnau ysgrifennu atoch.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Is it not true that hospitals in England are waiting for money from Health Commission Wales, which commissions treatment, and that that is where the problem lies and not with English hospitals? This happens all too frequently to patients from Wales who receive treatment in English hospitals. Financial, not clinical, reasons mean that they must wait longer for treatment.

**The First Minister:** This depends on the contract, which we have debated during the past four months. Under some contracts, for example, Welsh patients who have been waiting over 12 or 18 months for hand surgery will be offered treatment in Weston-super-Mare. If the contract states that we can offer treatment to these patients—and this type of surgery only takes up to 10 minutes—in Weston-super-Mare, then we will do so, or we have the option of sending them to Worcester and so on. I have talked to people who have received treatment in Worcester, Kidderminster and Weston-super-Mare. Not all of them were happy, but, in the majority of cases, treatment was provided more swiftly than would have been the case in Wales. Therefore, we want to proceed with our successful second offer scheme.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae gennych allu

wonderful ability to avoid the facts when they do not happen to suit you, and only to refer to certain specialities where Wales performs better than England. Is it not true that Sir John Bourn has clearly stated that the Welsh Assembly Government has no strategy to deal with waiting times and lists? He was highly critical of your Government's management of the NHS in Wales, and he stated that your policies had led to a situation where we were not getting good value for money. Is that not an indictment of your policies over the last five and a half years? You can refer back to 2002, but you came into power in 1999. At that time, you said that no-one would wait for more than six months for an out-patient appointment. You have raised that from six to 12 months, and you are now forcing people in Wales to access private consultations in order to avoid that 12-month waiting time for an out-patient appointment. This is before they get onto the in-patient waiting list and before they receive a second offer of treatment from your Government.

**The First Minister:** This is not the case. Everyone should consider the figures, which show that, a year ago, at the end of December 2003, 4,981 patients had been waiting over 18 months for in-patient treatment. That figure has decreased from 4,981 to 678.

2.40 p.m.

Likewise, no-one should think that this means that everyone has been waiting between 12 and 18 months, because the 12-month figures have also halved, from 11,936 to 6,293. This is a strong disincentive to use the private sector, particularly when combined with the decrease in the number waiting over 18 months for an out-patient appointment. This dropped from 9,834 to 6,270 between December 2003 and December 2004. The facts and the figures speak for themselves.

**Nick Bourne:** The report on NHS waiting times in Wales, a copy of which you coincidentally received around the time that Jane Hutt left the health portfolio, calls for urgent and concerted action to improve

rhyfeddol i osgoi'r ffeithiau pan ydynt yn digwydd bod yn anghyfleus i chi, a dim ond cyfeirio at rai arbenigeddau lle y mae Cymru'n perfformio'n well na Lloegr. Onid yw'n wir bod Syr John Bourn wedi datgan yn glir nad oes gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru unrhyw strategaeth i ddelio ag amseroedd a rhestrau aros? Bu'n dra beirniadol o ddull eich Llywodraeth o reoli'r GIG yng Nghymru, a dywedodd fod eich polisiau wedi arwain at sefyllfa lle nad oeddem yn cael gwerth da am arian. Onid yw hynny'n gerydd am y polisiau yr ydych wedi'u dilyn dros y pum mlynedd a hanner diwethaf? Gallwch gyfeirio'n ôl i 2002, ond daethoch i rym yn 1999. Bryd hynny, dywedasoch na fyddai neb yn aros yn hwy na chwe mis i gael apwyntiad fel claf allanol. Yr ydych wedi codi hynny o chwe mis i 12 mis, a bellach yr ydych yn gorfodi pobl yng Nghymru i gael ymgynghoriadau preifat er mwyn osgoi'r cyfnod aros hwnnw o 12 mis am apwyntiad fel claf allanol. Mae hynny cyn iddynt gael lle ar y rhestr aros i gleifion mewnlol a chyn iddynt gael ail gynnig o driniaeth gan eich Llywodraeth.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid felly y mae. Dylai pawb ystyried y ffigurau, a ddengys, flwyddyn yn ôl, ar ddiwedd Rhagfyr 2003, fod 4,981 o gleifion wedi bod yn aros yn hwy na 18 mis am driniaeth fel cleifion mewnlol. Mae'r ffigur hwnnw wedi gostwng o 4,981 i 678.

Yn yr un modd, ni ddylai neb dybio bod hyn yn golygu bod pawb wedi bod yn aros rhwng 12 a 18 mis, gan fod y ffigurau ar gyfer 12 mis wedi haneru hefyd, o 11,936 i 6,293. Mae hynny'n cynnig cymhelliad cryf i beidio â defnyddio'r sector preifat, yn enwedig o'i ystyried ochr yn ochr â'r gostyngiad yn y nifer sy'n aros yn hwy na 18 mis am apwyntiad fel claf allanol. Mae hwnnw wedi gostwng o 9,834 i 6,270 rhwng Rhagfyr 2003 a Rhagfyr 2004. Mae'r ffeithiau a'r ffigurau'n siarad drostynt eu hunain.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae'r adroddiad ar amseroedd aros y GIG yng Nghymru, y cawsoch gopi ohono, drwy gyd-ddigwyddiad, tua'r adeg y gwnaeth Jane Hutt adael y portffolio iechyd, yn galw am gymryd camau brys a chydlynol i

elective service performance. What action do you and your new Minister propose in order to implement this strong recommendation?

**The First Minister:** Where there is deficiency of capacity to treat in Wales, and where it is not reasonable to be shipping people about, albeit at the quite keen rates that are now possible through the creation of excess capacity just over the border in places such as Kidderminster, Worcester and Weston-super-Mare, we are creating additional capacity for Welsh patients. This is the reason for the construction of the 24-hour ambulatory care centre at Llandough Hospital, which is to be followed by a similar project in Newport's St Woolos Hospital in January or March next year. These are the tightest areas, and it will be possible to carry out orthopaedic operations on a day or 24-hour basis in south-east Wales. This is the action that we are taking, and the buildings are either under construction or soon to be started, and surgical procedures will begin within 12 months.

wella'r perfformiad o ran y gwasanaeth dewisol. Pa gamau yr ydych chi a'ch Gweinidog newydd yn bwriadu eu cymryd i weithredu ar sail yr argymhelliad cryf hwn?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Lle nad oes capasiti i drin cleifion yng Nghymru, a lle nad yw'n rhesymol cludo pobl o fan i fan, er bod modd gwneud hynny i raddau eithaf helaeth am fod capasiti ychwanegol wedi'i greu ychydig y tu draw i'r ffin mewn mannau fel Kidderminster, Caerwrangon a Weston-super-Mare, yr ydym yn creu capasiti ychwanegol ar gyfer cleifion yng Nghymru. Dyma'r rheswm dros godi'r ganolfan triniaethau dydd 24 awr yn Ysbyty Llandochoau, y ceir prosiect tebyg iddi yn Ysbyty Gwynllyw Sant yng Nghasnewydd ym mis Ionawr neu fis Mawrth y flwyddyn nesaf. Dyma'r meysydd anoddaf, a bydd modd cyflawni llawdriniaethau orthopedig o fewn diwrnod neu o fewn 24 awr yn y Ddeddwrain. Dyma'r camau yr ydym yn eu cymryd, ac mae'r adeiladau un ai'n cael eu codi neu i gael eu cychwyn cyn hir, a bydd y llawdriniaethau'n dechrau cyn pen 12 mis.

### **Dyfodol Darlledu The Future of Broadcasting**

**C10 Elin Jones:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar ddyfodol darlledu yng Nghymru? OAQ0107

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid yw darlledu ymhlith y pynciau a ddatganolwyd i'r Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi cynnal trafodaethau rheolaidd â Llywodraeth y DU ac Ofcom ar faterion darlledu sy'n effeithio ar Gymru.

**Elin Jones:** A ydych yn credu y dylid diogelu hawl ITV Cymru i gynhyrchu rhaglenni cyffredinol yn ogystal â rhaglenni newyddion yn y dyfodol? Os felly, pa drafodaethau a gawsoch gyda Tessa Jowell i'w darbwylo o'r angen i sicrhau dewis eang o raglenni Saesneg a gynhyrchir yng Nghymru, er mwyn atal y BBC rhag cael monopoli yn y maes hwn yng Nghymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hyn yn bwysig ar sawl lefel. Heblaw am raglenni newyddion a materion cyfoes, mae angen cyfran benodol o

**Q10 Elin Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on the future of broadcasting in Wales? OAQ0107

**The First Minister:** Broadcasting is not among the responsibilities devolved to the National Assembly for Wales. The Welsh Assembly Government has, however, held regular discussions with the UK Government and Ofcom on broadcasting issues that affect Wales.

**Elin Jones:** Do you believe that ITV Wales's right to produce public-interest programmes as well as news programmes in future should be protected? If so, what discussions have you had with Tessa Jowell to persuade her of the need for a variety of English-medium programming to be produced in Wales, so that the BBC does not have a monopoly in this area of broadcasting in Wales?

**The First Minister:** This is important on many levels. Apart from news and current affairs programmes, a specific proportion of



raglenni Saesneg am Gymru, wedi'u cynhyrchu yng Nghymru, ar rwydwaith masnachol ITV. Fodd bynnag, fel y pwysleisiodd Roger Lewis, pennaeth newydd ITV yng Nghymru, mae angen i'r sianel gyrraedd rhwydwaith y Deyrnas Unedig. Ni lwyddodd HTV na TWW yn hynny o beth. Dylai ITV Cymru allu dangos ambell opera sebon neu raglen *cops and robbers* er mwyn rhoi rhaglenni am Gymru ac a wnaed yng Nghymru ar y rhwydwaith, yn yr un modd ag y gwelwn raglenni o'r Alban ac o ogledd, canolbarth a de-ddwyrain Lloegr. Ni lwyddodd HTV na TWW i wneud hyn.

**Leighton Andrews:** If ITV Wales cuts its investment in non-news programming, do you agree that it is unlikely to make the breakthrough to the UK network? Therefore, will you encourage your Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport and others to continue to make representations to Ofcom that we want keep a strong ITV Wales not just in news services, but in non-news programming?

**The First Minister:** I am not sure which is the chicken and which is the egg, and I defer to your greatly superior knowledge obtained from your years in broadcasting, Leighton, but this issue can be seen from either point of view. You need to create a critical mass for producing network-breakthrough programmes, and the channel has not been successful in this regard. Programmes such as soap operas or cops-and-robbers dramas can come from having a strong line-up of other programmes, as there will be a body of producers, technicians, and so on. This is also the case for producing top-quality local football, current affairs, music and culture programmes, which could be greatly assisted by the flow of income from breaking through to the network. I do not mind which is the chicken and which is the egg, as long as we do it.

**Lisa Francis:** ITV Wales was recently branded mean by charity and community groups when it emerged that it had decided to scrap its community announcements as part of a cost-cutting exercise. ITV Wales may be forced in the future to axe programmes such

English-medium programmes about Wales and produced in Wales should be broadcast on the ITV commercial network. However, as Roger Lewis, the new head of ITV Wales, emphasised, the channel needs to reach the United Kingdom network. This is something that HTV and TWW never succeeded in doing. ITV Wales should be able to get a few soap operas or cops-and-robbers dramas on the network, so that programmes about Wales that are produced in Wales have a network audience, just like those from Scotland and from north, mid and south-east England do. Neither HTV nor TWW managed to do this.

**Leighton Andrews:** Os gwnaiff ITV Cymru fuddsoddi llai mewn rhaglenni heblaw newyddion, a ydych yn cytuno ei fod yn annhebygol o dorri drwodd i rwydwaith y DU? Gan hynny, a wnewch annog eich Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon ac eraill i barhau i gyflwyno sylwadau i Ofcom i ddangos ein bod am gadw ITV Cymru fel ei fod yn gryf, nid yn unig o ran gwasanaethau newyddion, ond o ran rhaglenni eraill hefyd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn sicr pa un yw'r iâr a pha un yw'r wy, ac ildiaf i'r wybodaeth well o lawer sydd gennych ar ôl eich blynyddoedd ym myd darlledu, Leighton, ond gellir ystyried y mater hwn o'r naill safbwynt neu'r llall. Rhaid creu màs critigol er mwyn cynhyrchu rhaglenni a fydd yn torri drwodd i'r rhwydwaith, ac ni fu'r sianel yn llwyddiannus yn hynny o beth. Gall rhaglenni fel operâu sebon neu ddramâu plismyn a lladron ddeillio o sefyllfa lle y mae dewis da o raglenni eraill, gan y bydd yno garfan o gynhyrchwyr, technegwyr, ac yn y blaen. Mae hynny'n wir hefyd am y gallu i gynhyrchu rhaglenni ar gemau pêl-droed lleol, materion cyfoes, cerddoriaeth a diwylliant, a allai gael hwb sylweddol o'r incwm a geid drwy dorri drwodd i'r rhwydwaith. Nid oes wahaniaeth gennyf pa un yw'r iâr a pha un yw'r wy, cyhyd ag y byddwn yn gwneud hynny.

**Lisa Francis:** Cafodd ITV Cymru ei alw'n grintachlyd yn ddiweddar gan grwpiau elusennol a chymunedol pan ddaeth i'r amlwg ei fod wedi penderfynu rhoi'r gorau i'w gyhoeddiadau cymunedol er mwyn torri costau. Yn y dyfodol, mae'n bosibl y bydd

as *The Ferret* or *Fishlock's Wild Tracks*. What representations have you made to Ofcom regarding the future of broadcasting in Wales in relation to ITV?

**The First Minister:** We had a dinner with Charles Allen when he made his, I suppose, annual visit to Cardiff to meet HTV staff and senior directors. We all went at it pretty well hammer and tongs on those sorts of issues. We told him that he must not abandon HTV—now ITV Wales—and shrink it back to being just the half hour news programmes and the opt-outs after the national news at 10.25 p.m., or whatever else it may be. We told him that that is not good enough, and that he must keep this as a real, live station, and keep the capability there to produce national network quality programmes, as well as a range of programmes of local origin for local consumption.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Given the myriad reviews, reports and consultations, can we have your assurance that Wales will continue to have an accessible, high-standard, multi-channelled, diverse, bilingual—even multilingual—television and radio output that is accessible to us all?

**The First Minister:** It is a savagely competitive world, and I cannot give you any guarantees about anything when it comes to the future of broadcasting. Previously, it was a matter of the commercial company, in the days when it was a licence to print money, paying money, bidding for the franchise, having to meet conditions to get the franchise, and then having to abide by those conditions during the franchise period. Those franchises, in a 100-channel world, are worthless, and they have now been negotiated downwards to small or no payments. There are so many channels available to everyone now that you cannot make people abide by conditions. It is all down to the energy of the broadcasters, and their ability to produce programmes that people want to watch. Likewise, it requires the commitment of the programmer to see the relevant audience for the kind of programmes that they want to produce, and the potential to produce programmes for consumption

ITV Cymru yn gorfod cael gwared ar raglenni fel *The Ferret* a *Fishlock's Wild Tracks*. Pa sylwadau yr ydych wedi'u cyflwyno i Ofcom ynghylch dyfodol darlledu yng Nghymru mewn cysylltiad ag ITV?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cawsom ginio gyda Charles Allen pan ddaeth ar ymweliad i Gaerdydd, fel y gwnaiff bob blwyddyn, mae'n debyg, i gwrdd â staff ac uwch gyfarwyddwyr HTV. Aethom yn benben â'n gilydd ar bynciau o'r fath. Dywedasom wrtho na chaiff roi'r gorau i HTV—ITV Cymru bellach—a'i gwtogi fel na cheir eto ond rhaglenni newyddion hanner awr a'r rhaglenni disodli ar ôl y newyddion cenedlaethol am 10.25 p.m., neu ba beth bynnag arall. Dywedasom wrtho nad yw hynny'n ddigon da, a bod rhaid iddo'i gadw fel gorsaf fyw, sylweddol a chadw'r gallu yno i gynhyrchu rhaglenni o ansawdd rhai'r rhwydwaith cenedlaethol, yn ogystal â dewis o raglenni a wneir yn lleol i'w gwyllo'n lleol.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yng ngolwg yr adolygiadau a'r adroddiadau a'r ymgynghoriadau dirifedi, a gawn sicrwydd gennych y bydd Cymru'n dal i gael cynnyrch radio a theledu hygyrch, safonol, amrywiol, dwyieithog—neu amlieithog hyd yn oed—ar sawl sianel sydd ar gael i bawb?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n fyd sy'n ffyrnig o gystadleuol, ac ni allaf roi unrhyw warant i chi am unrhyw beth o ran dyfodol darlledu. O'r blaen, yr hyn a ddigwyddai oedd bod y cwmni masnachol, yn y dyddiau pan oedd hyn yn sicr o dalu, yn talu arian, yn ymgeisio am y fasnachfaint, yn gorfod cydymffurfio ag amodau i gael y fasnachfaint, ac wedyn yn gorfod dal at yr amodau hynny yn ystod cyfnod y fasnachfaint. Mae'r masnachfreintiau hynny'n ddiwerth, mewn byd lle y ceir 100 o sianelau, a chafwyd negodi arnynt fel na thelir bron ddim amdanynt bellach. Mae cynifer o sianelau ar gael i bawb yn awr fel na ellir gorfodi pobl i ddal at amodau. Mae'n gwbl ddibynol ar egni'r darlledwyr, a'u gallu i gynhyrchu rhaglenni y mae pobl am eu gwyllo. Yn yr un modd, mae'n gofyn ymroddiad gan y cwmni darlledu i ganfod y gynulleidfa sy'n berthnasol i'r math o raglenni y mae am eu cynhyrchu, a'r posibilrwydd o gynhyrchu rhaglenni i'w gwyllo y tu allan i Gymru, fel y

outside Wales, to give themselves the critical mass of producer and technical talent that they need.

gallant feithrin digon o ddoniau o ran cynhyrchwyr a thechnegwyr.

### **Diweithdra Hirdymor ymhlith Ieuentid Long-term Youth Unemployment**

**Q11 Ann Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on the success in securing the virtual eradication of long-term youth unemployment in Wales? OAQ0114(FM)

**C11 Ann Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y llwyddiant o ran dileu bron yn gyfan gwbl ddiweithdra hirdymor ymhlith ieuentid Cymru? OAQ0114(FM)

**The First Minister:** This is one of the most important achievements of the past seven years. Measures for tackling long-term youth unemployment are delivered through the New Deal for Young People. Figures up to the end of 2004 show that over 36,000 young people have left the New Deal for employment since its introduction in January 1998. That is a huge achievement.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dyma un o gyflawniadau pwysicaf y saith mlynedd diwethaf. Cymerir camau i ymdrin â diweithdra tymor hir ymysg pobl ifanc drwy'r Fargen Newydd i Bobl Ifanc. Dengys ffigurau hyd at ddiwedd 2004 fod mwy na 36,000 o bobl ifanc wedi gadael y Fargen Newydd i gael gwaith ers ei chyflwyno yn Ionawr 1998. Mae hynny'n gyflawniad aruthrol.

**Ann Jones:** As you say, the New Deal has helped over 70,000 people in Wales—many in my constituency—back into work, as we move towards a society of full employment. Will you assure members of the Labour group, and Plaid Cymru Assembly Members that, unlike the Tories or the Liberal Democrats, the Welsh Assembly Government fully supports the New Deal, and would not want to see it scrapped?

**Ann Jones:** Fel y dywedwch, mae'r Fargen Newydd wedi helpu mwy na 70,000 o bobl yng Nghymru—lawer ohonynt yn fy etholaeth i—i aildechrau gweithio, wrth inni droi'n gymdeithas lle y ceir cyflogaeth lawn. A wnewch sicrhau aelodau'r grŵp Llafur, ac Aelodau Cynulliad Plaid Cymru fod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, yn wahanol i'r Torïaidd a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, yn llwyr gefnogi'r Fargen Newydd, ac na charai weld ei diddymu?

**The First Minister:** I have no proposals to lobby the UK Government to scrap the New Deal.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid oes gennyf unrhyw fwrriad i lobïo Llywodraeth y DU i gael gwared ar y Fargen Newydd.

**Alun Cairns:** I am amazed by Ann Jones's last question. Surely, the objective of any employment policy would be to see the end of that policy, because you end up with full employment. If that is the attitude that you are taking, then you are happy to keep some sort of employment model just to create jobs in itself—

**Alun Cairns:** Synnaf at gwestiwn olaf Ann Jones. Yn sicr, amcan unrhyw bolisi cyflogaeth yw gweld diwedd ar y polisi hwnnw, gan y ceir cyflogaeth lawn yn y diwedd. Os mai ymagwedd felly sydd gennych, yr ydych yn fodlon cadw rhyw fath o fodel cyflogaeth dim ond i greu swyddi—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. It would be helpful if Alun Cairns were to ask the First Minister a question.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Byddai o gymorth pe byddai Alun Cairns yn gofyn cwestiwn i'r Prif Weinidog.

**Alun Cairns:** Is it not the case that the Welsh Assembly Government's real policy on creating jobs is to create more jobs in the public sector, and to ensure that more people

**Alun Cairns:** Onid gwir bolisi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer creu swyddi yw creu rhagor o swyddi yn y sector cyhoeddus, a sicrhau bod mwy o bobl yn cael eu

are classified as economically inactive, because of sickness or whatever? Will you join me in condemning—[*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. When Alun Cairns asks the First Minister a question, he should be heard.

**Alun Cairns:** Will you join me in condemning any medic who would sign off a person as being sick when he or she is not sick and should be looking for work?

**The First Minister:** Today, in February 2005, we have the lowest unemployment since February 1975—that is a 30-year period. In that period, unemployment has been much higher than it is today, for young people as well for older people. Therefore, for you to be standing there as though you were an expert on the creation of full employment is a little like King Herod talking about maternity wards and infant mortality—it is not at all appropriate. It is important that we realise that we inherited astronomically high levels of dependence on incapacity and sickness benefit, but the figures have come down. I believe that they have come down in Wales from about 14.5 per cent to 12.8 per cent since the Assembly came into being. You said that they had risen—that is not correct. In Wales, they have come down significantly. Admittedly they are still too high, and are still above the national average, but they are pointing sharply in the right direction. You must not spread this calumny that the level of dependence on incapacity benefit or any other long-term sickness benefit is rising when it is falling. The facts and figures say that it is coming down, and no amount of prattling from you can turn a downwards-pointing arrow into one that is pointing upwards.

2.50 p.m.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Do you agree that many of our policies, such as improving opportunities for vocational education and the 14-19 learning pathways, will contribute to reducing youth unemployment significantly?

**The First Minister:** That is one of the major

hystyried yn economaidd anweithgar, oherwydd salwch neu ba beth bynnag? A wnewch ymuno â mi i gollfarnu—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Pan yw Alun Cairns yn gofyn cwestiwn i'r Prif Weinidog, dylid gwrandao arno.

**Alun Cairns:** A wnewch ymuno â mi i gollfarnu unrhyw feddyg a ardystiai fod rhywun yn sâl os nad yw'n sâl ac os dylai fod yn chwilio am waith?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Heddiw, yn Chwefror 2005, mae gennym y diweithdra isaf ers Chwefror 1975—dyna gyfnod o 30 mlynedd. Yn y cyfnod hwnnw, bu diweithdra'n uwch o lawer nag y mae heddiw, ymysg pobl ifanc a phobl hŷn. Felly, mae'ch gweld yn sefyll yno fel pe byddech yn arbenigwr ar greu cyflogaeth lawn yn debyg braidd i weld y Brenin Herod yn trafod wardiau mamolaeth a marwolaethau babanod—nid yw'n briodol o gwbl. Mae'n bwysig inni sylweddoli ein bod wedi etifeddu lefelau uchel ofnadwy o ddibyniaeth ar fudd-dal analluogrwydd a budd-dal salwch, ond bod y ffigurau wedi gostwng. Credaf eu bod wedi gostwng yng Nghymru o tua 14.5 y cant i 12.8 y cant ers ffurfio'r Cynulliad. Dywedasoeh eu bod wedi codi—nid yw hynny'n gywir. Yng Nghymru, maent wedi gostwng yn sylweddol. Rhaid cydnabod eu bod yn rhy uchel o hyd, a'u bod yn uwch na'r cyfartaledd cenedlaethol, ond maent yn mynd i'r cyfeiriad iawn, yn bendant. Ni ddylech gyhoeddi'r camgyhuddiad hwn bod lefel y ddibyniaeth ar fudd-dal analluogrwydd neu unrhyw fudd-dal salwch tymor hir arall ar gynnydd, a hithau'n disgyn. Mae'r ffeithiau a'r ffigurau'n dangos ei bod yn gostwng, ac ni all unrhyw glebran ar eich rhan chi newid hynny.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** A ydych yn cytuno y bydd llawer o'n polisïau, fel y cynnig o well cyfleoedd ar gyfer addysg alwedigaethol a'r llwybrau dysgu 14-19, yn cyfrannu'n sylweddol at leihau diweithdra ymysg pobl ifanc?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dyna un o'r newidiadau

changes in education and training and the transition to work that we want to bring about. It is part of trying to reclaim the full inheritance of the full employment society that started to rise in the late 1970s. We are now quite close to undoing the damage of the Thatcher period. The key to this is to try to recreate that sort of apprenticeship culture, only in a better and more modern way, without reverting to exactly how it was in the 1970s. The curriculum changes for 14 to 19-year-olds are an attempt to do that. We already have levels of apprenticeship in Wales that are twice those of England—I think that it is six per 1,000 in Wales compared to three per 1,000 in England. Nevertheless, we still have to promote that culture so that that is what people expect. Regardless of whether people are of high, medium or below academic ability, there is still a future for them, and they should go out and grasp it, and we will help them to do that.

pwysig o ran addysg a hyfforddiant a dechrau gweithio yr ydym am eu sicrhau. Mae'n rhan o'r ymgais i adfer holl fanteision y gymdeithas o gyflogaeth lawn a ddechreuodd godi ddiwedd y 1970au. Yr ydym yn eithaf agos yn awr at ddad-wneud y difrod a wnaed yng nghyfnod Thatcher. Yr allwedd i hynny yw ceisio ail-greu'r mathau hynny o arferion o ran cynnig prentisiaethau, ond yn well ac mewn modd mwy cyfoes, heb droi'n ôl at yr union un sefyllfa a gafwyd yn y 1970au. Mae'r newidiadau i'r cwricwlwm ar gyfer rhai 14 i 19 blwydd oed yn ymgais i wneud hynny. Mae gennym ddwywaith y gyfradd o brentisiaethau yng Nghymru ag a geir yn Lloegr eisoes—credaf ei bod yn chwech i bob 1,000 yng Nghymru o'i chymharu â thri i bob 1,000 yn Lloegr. Er hynny, rhaid inni ddal i hyrwyddo'r arferion hynny fel mai hynny y bydd pobl yn ei ddisgwyl. Ni waeth a yw rhywun o allu academiaidd uchel, canolig neu is, mae dyfodol iddynt o hyd, a dylent fynd allan a gafael ynddo, ac fe'u helpwn i wneud hynny.

### Treth Cyngor nas Casglwyd Uncollected Council Tax

**Q12 Jenny Randerson:** Will the First Minister comment on uncollected council tax? OAQ0122(FM)

**C12 Jenny Randerson:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog sylwadau ar dreth gyngor sydd heb ei chasglu? OAQ0122(FM)

**The First Minister:** The figure for collected council tax in 2003-04 was 96.1 per cent. This compares to 96.5 per cent in England and 91.7 per cent in Scotland.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Y ffigur ar gyfer treth gyngor a gasglwyd yn 2003-04 oedd 96.1 y cant. Mae hynny'n cymharu â 96.5 y cant yn Lloegr a 91.7 y cant yn yr Alban.

**Jenny Randerson:** The total of uncollected council tax in Wales is £65.5 million. With next year's rebanding, many of those whose homes are rebanded will face double-figure increases in their council tax, even if their council keeps the council tax at the same level. To what figure do you expect the arrears to rise next year in the light of that difficult situation? Do you recognise that many of those most affected by rebanding are among the poorest in our communities? For example, in Adamsdown ward in my constituency, 94 per cent of households have been rebanded. Also, what is your Government doing to stop this rebanding exercise from turning into a rerun of the poll tax fiasco?

**Jenny Randerson:** Cyfanswm y dreth gyngor nas casglwyd yng Nghymru yw £65.5 miliwn. Gyda'r ailfandio y flwyddyn nesaf, bydd llawer y mae eu cartrefi wedi'u hailfandio'n wynebu codiadau mewn ffigurau dwbl yn eu treth gyngor, hyd yn oed os bydd eu cyngor yn cadw'r dreth gyngor ar yr un lefel. I ba ffigur y rhagwelwch y bydd yr ôl-ddyledion yn codi y flwyddyn nesaf yng ngolwg y sefyllfa anodd honno? A ydych yn cydnabod bod llawer o'r rhai a effeithir fwyaf drwy ailfandio ymhlith y tlotaf yn ein cymunedau? Er enghraifft, yn ward Adamsdown yn fy etholaeth, mae 94 y cant o'r cartrefi wedi'u hailfandio. Hefyd, beth y mae'ch Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i sicrhau na fydd yr ailfandio hwn yn troi'n llanastr o'r math a gafwyd yn achos treth y pen?

**The First Minister:** I do not think that I will go down the particular road that you are inviting me down and speculate on whether the percentage of uncollected council tax will go up or down. It is rather an odd interpretation of your function as an Assembly Member for you to be acting as the ambassador for your former researcher, who is now the leader of Cardiff County Council. We recognise that the collection rate, as is often the case in big cities, is lower in Cardiff than in Conwy, which is the champion, having collected 97.6 per cent. Cardiff is among the lowest, at 94.6. On your point about the council tax level, it is all about how sensible Cardiff council is in deciding on how large a budget increase it will go for, and therefore how much it will have to levy. It is a matter for the council. I do not think that you should ask questions in Plenary to try to pass the blame on to somebody else if Cardiff council, now that it is under your party's control, gets itself into difficulty.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Do you agree that it is a bit rich of Jenny Randerson and her Liberal Democrat colleagues to be so critical of the rebanding, given that she was a member of the Cabinet when rebanding was agreed, as was their leader?

**The First Minister:** Selective amnesia is a common disease in politics, and that is a good example of it. I had forgotten myself that Jenny was involved, and, of course, it is part of the Conservative legislation, too. There is no way of avoiding rebanding, as it is in the council tax legislation. The legislation of the early 1990s, which John Major and Michael Heseltine brought in, makes rebanding obligatory. All you can decide upon is when it is done, and when you do it, you have this problem. I have always said that, if we have any regrets on this, it is that we did not do it earlier, so that the shock effect would not have been as great. However, the key point is that it is for every local authority to propose a sensible budget increase when they come to set their budgets over the next few weeks.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn bwriadu dilyn y trywydd yr ydych yn fy ngwahodd i'w ddilyn a dyfalu a fydd canran y dreth gyngor nas casglwyd yn codi neu'n gostwng. Dehongliad braidd yn rhyfedd o'ch swyddogaeth fel Aelod o'r Cynulliad yw bod yn llysgennad dros eich cyn-ymchwilydd, sydd bellach yn arweinydd ar Gyngor Sir Caerdydd. Derbyniwn fod y gyfradd casglu, fel y digwydd yn aml yn achos dinasoedd mawr, yn is yng Nghaerdydd nag ydyw yng Nghonwy, sef y gorau un, ac yntau wedi casglu 97.6 y cant. Mae Caerdydd ymysg yr isaf, ar 94.6 y cant. Ynghylch y pwynt a wnaethoch am lefel y dreth gyngor, mae hynny'n llwyr ddibynnu ar ddoethineb cyngor Caerdydd wrth benderfynu pa gynnydd y bydd yn ei geisio yn ei gyllideb, ac felly pa faint yn rhagor y bydd yn rhaid iddo'i godi. Mae'n fater i'r cyngor. Ni chredaf y dylech ofyn cwestiynau yn y Cyfarfod Llawn i geisio bwrw'r bai ar rywun arall os bydd cyngor Caerdydd yn mynd i drafferthion, ac yntau'n cael ei reoli gan eich plaid chi bellach.

**Lorraine Barrett:** A ydych yn cytuno mai gormod braidd, ar ran Jenny Randerson a'i chyd-Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol, yw bod mor feirniadol o'r ailfandio, gan ei bod hi'n aelod o'r Cabinet pan gytunwyd ar yr ailfandio, fel yr oedd eu harweinydd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae anghofrwydd dethol yn glefyd cyffredin mewn gwleidyddiaeth, ac mae hynny'n enghraifft dda ohono. Yr oeddwn innau wedi anghofio bod Jenny yn gysylltiedig, ac, wrth gwrs, mae'n rhan o ddeddfwriaeth y Ceidwadwyr hefyd. Nid oes modd osgoi ailfandio, gan ei fod yn neddfwriaeth y dreth gyngor. Mae'r ddeddfwriaeth a gyflwynwyd ddechrau'r 1990au gan John Major a Michael Heseltine yn peri bod ailfandio'n orfodol. Y cwbl y gellir penderfynu arno yw pa bryd y'i gwneir, a phan wneir ef, ceir y broblem hon. Yr wyf wedi dweud erioed, os yw'n edifar gennym am unrhyw beth mewn cysylltiad â hyn, hwnnw yw na wnaethom hyn yn gynharach, fel na chawsid cymaint o ysgytwad. Fodd bynnag, y pwynt allweddol yw y dylai pob awdurdod lleol gynnig cynnydd synhwyrol yn ei gyllideb pan fydd yn pennu ei gyllideb dros yr wythnosau nesaf.

**Mark Isherwood:** Speaking as the husband of a councillor in whose ward over 60 per cent of households face an increase of at least one band in their council tax, may I ask what measures the Welsh Assembly Government is putting in place to provide appropriate support for council tax payers who find themselves in financial difficulty, whether they qualify for council tax relief or not?

**The First Minister:** We have already done so by making it clear that you cannot go up more than one band in one year. Secondly, as I mentioned earlier, although you attempted to exclude it with a singularly pointless additional sub-clause to your question telling us not to mention it, it is significant that many people suffering hardship will be eligible for council tax benefit. That form of benefit has one of the lowest claim rates. We should not try to exclude it as an option, as you did, but try to include as many eligible people as possible, and ensure that they claim council tax benefit. If we could increase the percentage of eligible people who claim it from the 50 per cent that it is now to 75 per cent or 80 per cent, it would go a long way towards solving the problem.

**Mark Isherwood:** A siarad fel gŵr i gynghorydd dros ward lle y mae mwy na 60 y cant o'r cartrefi'n wynebu cynnydd o o leiaf un band yn eu treth gyngor, a gaf ofyn pa fesurau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn eu rhoi ar waith i gynnig cymorth priodol i dalwyr treth gyngor a aiff i drafferthion ariannol, pa un a ydynt yn gymwys i gael gostyngiad yn y dreth gyngor ai peidio?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym eisoes wedi gwneud hynny drwy egluro na ellir codi mwy nag un band mewn un flwyddyn. Yn ail, fel y dywedais yn gynharach, er eich bod wedi ceisio'i anwybyddu drwy is-gymal ychwanegol cwbl ddibwrpas yn eich cwestiwn yn dweud wrthym am beidio â sôn amdano, mae'n bwysig nodi y bydd llawer sy'n profi caledi yn gymwys i gael budd-dal y dreth gyngor. Y budd-dal hwnnw yw un o'r budd-daliadau y ceir y cyfraddau hawlio isaf ar eu cyfer. Ni ddylem geisio'i ddiystyried fel dewis, fel y gwnaethoch chi, ond yn hytrach ceisio cynnwys cynifer o bobl gymwys ag y bo modd, a sicrhau eu bod yn hawlio budd-dal y dreth gyngor. Os gallem godi canran y rhai cymwys sy'n ei hawlio o'r 50 y cant sy'n gwneud yn awr i 75 y cant neu 80 y cant, byddai hynny'n cyfrannu'n helaeth at ddatrys y broblem.

### **Datganiad Busnes Business Statement**

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I have two changes to report to this week's business: tomorrow's statement on the Government's response to the report of the child poverty taskforce has been transferred to a debate on 9 February, and the motion to delegate the functions of the National Assembly for Wales (Transfer of Functions) Order 2004 has been postponed until later this month, so that Members have the opportunity to consider the information paper that was circulated last week in support of that debate. Business for the next three weeks is as set out on the draft business statement, which can be found on the Chamberweb under 'supporting documents'.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Mae gennyf ddau newid i'w hadrodd i fusnes yr wythnos hon: mae'r datganiad yfory ar ymateb y Llywodraeth i adroddiad y grŵp gorchwyl tloidi plant wedi'i drosglwyddo i ddadl ar 9 Chwefror, ac mae'r cynnig i ddirprwyo swyddogaethau Gorchymyn Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau) 2004 wedi'i ohirio tan yn ddiweddarach y mis hwn, fel y caiff Aelodau gyfle i ystyried y papur gwybodaeth a ddosbarthwyd yr wythnos diwethaf ar gyfer y ddadl honno. Mae busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y mae wedi'i nodi ar y datganiad busnes drafft, y gellir ei weld ar we'r Siambr o dan 'ddogfennau ategol'.

Further to the Business Committee's deliberations this morning, it has been determined under Standing Order No. 24.6 that the following items of subordinate legislation need not be referred to a subject committee for extended consideration: the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000 (Commencement No. 6) (Wales) Order 2005, the Dairy Produce Quotas (Wales) Regulations 2005, the Education Development Plans (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2005, and the Community Health Councils (Amendment) Regulations 2005.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes gwrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes drafft? Gwelaf fod o leiaf 10 gwrthwynebiad. O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 5.4, galwaf felly ar y Trefnydd i gynnig y datganiad busnes yn ffurfiol.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales adopts the business statement.*

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf ar un Aelod o bob grŵp plaid i ymateb yn fyr.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Minister, I hope you agree that policy statements should be made in the Chamber and not elsewhere. Can you explain why the 30 most interesting minutes of the First Minister's political life did not warrant a statement or a debate here? Why can we not have a debate on the lessons that the First Minister learned about accident and emergency services in the University Hospital of Wales, Cardiff? As he is still in denial, and still suffering from selective amnesia, perhaps you could tell us why he did not, during his answers to questions today, refer to the fact that nurses told him that, following the appointment of a private company to deal with out-of-hours calls, the number of those attending the accident and emergency unit at the hospital has increased by 10 per cent?

Could we also have a statement about the new Minister for Health and Social Services' policy decision, which he shared with Labour

Ymhellach i drafodaethau'r Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, penderfynwyd o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.6 nad oes angen cyfeirio'r eitemau is-ddeddfwriaeth a ganlyn i bwyllgor pwnc i'w hystyried yn helaethach: Gorchymyn Deddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000 (Cychwyn Rhif 6) (Cymru) 2005, Rheoliadau Cwotâu Cynnyrch Llaeth (Cymru) 2005, Rheoliadau Cynlluniau Datblygu Addysg (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2005, a Rheoliadau Cynghorau Iechyd Cymuned (Diwygio) 2005.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there any objections to the business statement? I see that there are at least 10 objections. Under Standing Order No. 5.4, I therefore call the Business Minister to formally propose the business statement.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn derbyn y datganiad busnes.*

**The Presiding Officer:** I call one Member from each party group to respond briefly.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Weinidog, gobeithiaf y cytunwch y dylid gwneud datganiadau ar bolisi yn y Siambr ac nid mewn mannau eraill. A allwch egluro pam nad oedd y 30 munud mwyaf diddorol ym mywyd gwleidyddol y Prif Weinidog yn teilyngu datganiad neu ddadl yn y fan hon? Pam na allwn gael dadl ar y gwersi a ddysgodd y Prif Weinidog am wasanaethau damweiniau ac achosion brys yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru, Caerdydd? Gan ei fod yn dal i wrthod syrthio ar ei fai, ac yn dal i ddioddef gan anghofrwydd dethol, efallai y gallech ddweud wrthym pam na chyfeiriodd, yn ystod ei atebion i gwestiynau heddiw, at y ffaith bod nyrsys wedi dweud wrtho bod nifer y rhai a ddaw i'r uned ddamweiniau ac achosion brys yn yr ysbyty yn 10 y cant yn fwy, yn dilyn penodi cwmni preifat i ddelio â galwadau y tu allan i oriau arferol?

A allem gael datganiad hefyd am benderfyniad polisi'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol newydd, a



MPs in a meeting in London on Monday evening but has not yet been shared with us? He tells us that he will spend an entire day addressing waiting times and waiting lists. If that is a new policy, Business Minister, I suggest that you also allow a day for addressing those issues. Do you not believe that we should be given the opportunity to discuss those issues, whether as statements or as debates, in this Chamber?

**David Melding:** Business Minister, our group also thinks that accident and emergency services need to be debated in depth. We must start a serious political discussion on the use of accident and emergency services, and the flows between those services and elective surgery, and how resources are currently distributed. That would be a painful and difficult discussion for all political parties in the Chamber.

3.00 p.m.

We also think that Dr Gibbons should make a statement on the policy changes currently taking place. Dr Gibbons seems to be under more scrutiny from Labour Members of Parliament than Members from this Chamber. The statement should be made on the one day of the week on which Dr Gibbons intends to work on waiting lists.

**Kirsty Williams:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats echo the case put forward by the other parties. Following the concerns raised by Michael German in the Chamber this week about the state of accident and emergency services at the University Hospital of Wales, we welcome the First Minister's visit but believe that a statement should be made so that we can hear directly from the First Minister about the lessons that he has learnt, and about what he intends to do about accident and emergency services, not just at the University Hospital of Wales, but across the principality.

In respect of the Minister for Health and Social Services's revelation that he intends to spend one day a week looking at the issue of waiting lists, we would welcome a debate in this Chamber so that we can discover how he

rannodd ag ASau Llafur mewn cyfarfod yn Llundain nos Lun, er nad yw wedi'i rannu â ni eto? Dywed wrthym y bydd yn treulio diwrnod cyfan yn ymdrin ag amseroedd aros a rhestrau aros. Os yw hynny'n bolisi newydd, Drefnydd, awgrymaf y dylech chithau ganiatáu diwrnod i drafod y materion hynny. Oni chredwch y dylem gael cyfle i drafod y materion hynny, boed ar ffurf datganiad neu ddadl, yn y Siambr hon?

**David Melding:** Drefnydd, mae ein grŵp ninnau'n credu bod angen trafod gwasanaethau damweiniau ac achosion brys yn fanwl. Rhaid inni gychwyn trafodaeth wleidyddol ddifrif ar y defnydd o wasanaethau argyfwng ac achosion brys, y llifau rhwng y gwasanaethau hynny a llawdriniaeth ddewisol, a'r dull presennol o ddsbarthu adnoddau. Byddai honno'n drafodaeth boenus ac anodd i'r holl bleidiau gwleidyddol yn y Siambr.

Yr ydym ninnau'n credu y dylai Dr Gibbons wneud datganiad ar y newidiadau i bolisi a wneir ar hyn o bryd. Ymddengys fod mwy o graffu ar waith Dr Gibbons gan Aelodau Seneddol Llafur na chan Aelodau'r Siambr hon. Dylid rhoi'r datganiad ar yr un diwrnod o'r wythnos ag y mae Dr Gibbons yn bwriadu gweithio ar restrau aros.

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn ategu'r ddadl a gyflwynwyd gan y pleidiau eraill. Yn dilyn y pryderon a gododd Michael German yn y Siambr yr wythnos hon ynghylch cyflwr gwasanaethau damweiniau ac achosion brys yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru, croesawn ymweliad y Prif Weinidog ond credwn y dylid gwneud datganiad fel y gallwn glywed yn uniongyrchol gan y Prif Weinidog am y gwersi a ddysgodd, ac am yr hyn y mae'n bwriadu ei wneud ynghylch gwasanaethau damweiniau ac achosion brys, nid yn unig yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru, ond ledled y dywysogaeth.

Gyda golwg ar ddatgeliad y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ei fod yn bwriadu treulio un diwrnod yr wythnos yn ystyried mater rhestrau aros, croesawem ddadl yn y Siambr hon fel y gallwn

intends to spend the remaining six days of the week.

**Leighton Andrews:** Can we have a debate on the success of our economic development policies? That would give me—*[Interruption.]*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. These are comments on the business statement.

**Leighton Andrews:** Were we to have that debate, I could welcome the news that the United Polymers factory in my constituency has now been bought from the administrators by a new management team, and this would give me the opportunity to thank all those in the Welsh Assembly Government and its agencies who work so hard to ensure that that factory in Maerdy, in my constituency, has a future.

We could also raise the question of the future of the Department of Trade and Industry grant scheme which the Tory party—apparently—plans to abolish under its recently published James review.

**Jane Hutt:** There is a mixture of mischief, confusion and goodwill here today. There is confusion, Rhodri Glyn Thomas, in your reference to the first 30 minutes of some Minister's time. I am sure that all Assembly Members will pay great attention to tomorrow's questions to Dr Brian Gibbons. These will be the first questions to him from us, the elected Members of Wales, in this important institution. That is what we should be concerned about today.

In terms of hearing from the First Minister this afternoon about his visit to the University Hospital of Wales, where he learned—as we always do—about operational difficulties and pressures, I am sure that this will arise in the opportunities to debate, discuss and raise questions with Dr Gibbons tomorrow and in the committee meeting next week.

I am delighted to endorse Leighton Andrews' words. Team Wales has delivered again. We must congratulate the Welsh Assembly Government on delivering on that. It has not only brought in new jobs but safeguarded

ddarganfod sut y mae'n bwriadu treulio'r chwe diwrnod o'r wythnos sy'n weddill.

**Leighton Andrews:** A allwn gael dadl ar lwyddiant ein polisiau datblygu economaidd? Rhoddai hynny imi—*[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Sylwadau ar y datganiad busnes yw'r rhain.

**Leighton Andrews:** Pe caem ddadl o'r fath, gallwn groesawu'r newydd bod ffatri United Polymers yn fy etholaeth wedi'i phrynu bellach oddi wrth y gweinyddwyr gan dîm rheoli newydd, a rhoddai hyn gyfle imi ddiolch i bawb yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'i hasiantaethau sy'n gweithio mor galed i sicrhau dyfodol i'r ffatri honno ym Maerdy, yn fy etholaeth.

Gallem hefyd godi'r cwestiwn ynghylch dyfodol cynllun grant yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant y mae'r blaid Doriaidd—yn ôl y sôn—yn bwriadu ei ddileu o dan adolygiad James a gyhoeddwyd ganddi'n ddiweddar.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae cymysgedd o gynnen, dryswch ac ewyllys da yma heddiw. Mae dryswch, Rhodri Glyn Thomas, yn eich cyfeiriad at y 30 munud cyntaf o amser rhyw Weinidog. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn rhoi sylw mawr i'r cwestiynau i Dr Brian Gibbons yfory. Y rhain fydd y cwestiynau cyntaf iddo gennym ni, Aelodau etholedig Cymru, yn y sefydliad pwysig hwn. Dyna'r hyn y dylem bryderu yn ei gylch heddiw.

Ynghylch clywed gan y Prif Weinidog y prynhawn yma am ei ymweliad ag Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru, lle y cafodd wybod—fel y cawn wybod bob amser—am yr anawsterau a'r pwysau ar y gwaith, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd hynny'n codi yn y cyfleoedd i ddadlau, trafod a gofyn cwestiynau i Dr Gibbons yfory ac yng nghyfarfod y pwyllgor yr wythnos nesaf.

Yr wyf wrth fy modd yn ategu geiriau Leighton Andrews. Mae Tîm Cymru wedi mynd â'r maen i'r wal unwaith eto. Dylem longyfarch Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar hynny. Mae wedi arwain at greu swyddi

existing ones.

newydd yn ogystal â diogelu'r rhai presennol.

*Cynnig: O blaid 30, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 25.*

*Motion: For 30, Abstain 0, Against 25.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

**Datganiad ar Ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i Adroddiad y Pwyllgor  
Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ar Anghenion Addysgol Arbennig  
Statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's response to the Education and  
Lifelong Learning Committee's Report on Special Educational Needs**

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** The Education and Lifelong Learning Committee chose to undertake this review of special educational needs and I am delighted to receive its comprehensive report as part 1 of this important piece of work. I am also pleased that all Members have the opportunity today to contribute to this agenda.

All children have a right to the best possible start in life. When children and young people have special needs and disabilities, it is important that these are identified at an early

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes a ddewisodd ymgymryd â'r adolygiad hwn o anghenion addysgol arbennig ac yr wyf yn falch iawn o gael ei adroddiad cynhwysfawr fel y rhan gyntaf o'r gwaith pwysig hwn. Yr wyf hefyd yn falch y bydd yr holl Aelodau'n cael cyfle heddiw i gyfrannu at yr agenda hon.

Mae gan bob plentyn hawl i gael y cychwyniad gorau posibl mewn bywyd. Os oes gan blant a phobl ifanc anghenion arbennig ac anabledau, mae'n bwysig eu

stage and that identification leads directly to effective early intervention and support for families, children and young people.

Early identification and early intervention are key themes in 'The Learning Country', the 'Framework for the Assessment of Children in Need and their Families 2001' and the 'SEN Code of Practice for Wales', 2002. They are central to a number of other Assembly-led initiatives, including Children First and Cymorth, and they should lie at the heart of the care provided by all professionals. Effective early intervention and support can produce improvements in the health and social and cognitive development of children and young people, and can help to tackle some of the many social and physical barriers to participating fully in society that families with children and young people with special educational needs face.

This report has centred on the key issues that seek to ensure effective early identification and intervention in terms of children and young people with special educational needs. I was pleased to note that many of the recommendations contained in the report are already receiving attention. I will focus on a number of these key issues. I fully endorse the view that meeting the individual learning needs of children and young people requires all statutory agencies to take a flexible approach. They need to communicate and agree policies and protocols in order to ensure that there is a seamless service. This is in line with our policies in 'Making the Connections: Delivering Better Services for Wales'. The Children Act 2004 strengthens this position and encourages the use of joint commissioning and pooled budget arrangements across services to ensure that needs are met in a coherent way.

A highly relevant and contemporary example of this is the delivery of speech and language services for children and young people. I am conscious that there has been a steady growth in demand for such services for children and that the relevant statutory services have been unable to meet that demand.

Our latest basic skills campaign, which many

canfod yn gynnar a bod hynny'n arwain yn syth at ymyrryd yn gynnar yn effeithiol ac at roi cymorth i deuluoedd, plant a phobl ifanc.

Mae canfod yn gynnar ac ymyrryd yn gynnar yn themâu allweddol yn 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu', y 'Fframwaith ar gyfer Asesu Plant Mewn Angen a'u Teuluoedd 2001' a 'Cod Ymarfer AAA Cymru', 2002. Mae lle canolog iddynt mewn sawl menter arall a arweinir gan y Cynulliad, gan gynnwys Rhoi Plant yn Gyntaf a Cymorth, a dylent fod wrth wraidd y gofal a gynigir gan bob gweithiwr proffesiynol. Gall ymyrryd a rhoi cymorth yn gynnar yn effeithiol arwain at welliannau yn iechyd a datblygiad cymdeithasol a gwybyddol plant a phobl ifanc, a gallant fod o gymorth i drafod rhai o'r rhwystrau cymdeithasol a ffisegol lu a wynebwr gan deuluoedd sydd â phlant a phobl ifanc ag anghenion addysgol arbennig wrth iddynt geisio cymryd rhan lawn mewn cymdeithas.

Mae'r adroddiad hwn wedi canolbwyntio ar y materion allweddol sy'n ymwneud â sicrhau camau effeithiol i ganfod anghenion addysgol arbennig mewn plant a phobl ifanc ac i ymyrryd yn gynnar. Yr oeddwn yn falch o sylwi bod llawer o'r argymhellion a geir yn yr adroddiad yn derbyn sylw eisoes. Canolbwyntiaf ar nifer o'r materion allweddol hyn. Yr wyf yn llwyr ategu'r farn bod yr angen i ddiwallu anghenion dysgu unigol plant a phobl ifanc yn galw am ddull gweithredu hyblyg gan yr holl asiantaethau statudol. Rhaid iddynt gysylltu â'i gilydd a chytuno ar bolisïau a phrotocolau i sicrhau y ceir gwasanaeth di-fwlch. Mae hynny'n gyson â'n polisïau yn 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau: Gwell Gwasanaethau i Gymru'. Mae Deddf Plant 2004 yn ategu'r safbwynt hwn ac yn cymhell defnyddio trefniadau comisiynu ar y cyd a chyllidebau cyfun rhwng gwasanaethau er mwyn sicrhau y caiff anghenion eu bodloni mewn modd cydlynol.

Un enghraifft dra pherthnasol a chyfoes o hynny yw'r dull o ddarparu gwasanaethau iaith a lleferydd i blant a phobl ifanc. Gwn fod twf cyson wedi bod yn y galw am wasanaethau o'r fath ar gyfer plant ac nad yw'r gwasanaethau statudol perthnasol wedi gallu ateb y galw hwnnw.

Mae ein hymgyrch sgiliau sylfaenol

Members will have seen, and the foundation phase recognise the importance of speech and language development in forming a sound basis for future success in terms of reading, writing and accessing the curriculum so that all children reach their full potential. In that context, we have allocated £3 million over the next three years to develop pilot projects to establish joint commissioning and pooled budget arrangements to deliver these speech and language services to children and young people across health and education. We are also developing further training routes for speech and language therapists in order to meet the increase in demand for therapy provision.

I also wish to ensure that all teaching staff are equipped, on entering the classroom, to identify and support the individual needs of learners and that they continue to receive support through targeted continuous professional development in this area. We recognise that there are shortages with regard to some specialist skills, such as those gained by teachers who hold mandatory qualifications to teach children and young people with sensory impairments. We are discussing flexible training opportunities, such as e-learning and other innovative approaches, with all higher education providers across Wales in order to encourage teachers to specialise and develop their skills in working with children with special educational needs.

We need to ensure that we have the necessary systems in place to monitor the progress of individual pupils over time and that appropriate interventions and support strategies are readily available to overcome these barriers to learning. Much of this work is currently under way and some authorities have developed sophisticated approaches to monitoring pupil progress. The Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales and the Welsh advisory group for SEN are developing specific guidance for schools and LEAs on monitoring the progress of pupils with such additional learning needs.

By working supportively and in partnership with parents and the children and young people themselves, we will ensure that

diweddaraf, y bydd llawer o Aelodau wedi'i gweld, a'r cyfnod sylfaen yn cydnabod mor bwysig yw datblygu iaith a lleferydd er mwyn cynnig sail gadarn i lwyddiant yn y dyfodol o ran darllen, ysgrifennu a dysgu'r cwricwlwm fel y gall pob plentyn gyflawni ei botensial. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, yr ydym wedi dyrannu £3 miliwn dros y tair blynedd nesaf i ddatblygu prosiectau peilot i sefydlu trefniadau i gomisiynu ar y cyd ac i rannu cyllidebau fel y gellir cynnig y gwasanaethau iaith a lleferydd hyn i blant a phobl ifanc ym meysydd iechyd ac addysg. Yr ydym hefyd yn datblygu llwybrau hyfforddi pellach ar gyfer therapyddion iaith a lleferydd er mwyn ateb y galw cynyddol am therapi.

Yr wyf hefyd yn dymuno sicrhau y bydd yr holl staff dysgu yn gymwys, pan ânt i'r ystafell ddosbarth, i ganfod a diwallu anghenion dysgwyr unigol ac y byddant yn dal i gael cymorth drwy ddatblygiad proffesiynol parhaus penodol yn y maes hwn. Cydnabyddwn fod prinder o ran rhai sgiliau arbenigol, fel y rhai a ddysgwyd gan athrawon sy'n dal cymwysterau gorfodol ar gyfer dysgu plant a phobl ifanc sydd â nam ar eu synhwyrau. Yr ydym yn trafod cyfleoedd hyfforddi hyblyg, fel e-ddysgu a dulliau newydd eraill, gyda'r holl ddarparwyr addysg uwch ledled Cymru er mwyn cymell athrawon i arbenigo a meithrin eu sgiliau wrth weithio gyda phlant sydd ag anghenion addysgol arbennig.

Rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod wedi rhoi'r systemau angenrheidiol ar waith i fonitro cynnydd disgyblion unigol dros gyfnod o amser a bod ymyriadau a strategaethau cymorth priodol ar gael yn rhwydd i oresgyn rhwystrau rhag dysgu o'r math hwn. Mae llawer o'r gwaith hwn yn mynd rhagddo'n awr ac mae rhai awdurdodau wedi datblygu dulliau soffistigedig i fonitro cynnydd disgyblion. Mae Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Aseu Cymru a grŵp cynghori Cymru ar AAA yn datblygu canllawiau penodol ar gyfer ysgolion ac AALLau ar fonitro cynnydd disgyblion sydd ag anghenion ychwanegol o'r fath.

Drwy weithio'n gefnogol ac ar y cyd â rhieni a'r plant a'r bobl ifanc eu hunain, sicrhawn y bydd pawb sy'n gysylltiedig yn deall yr

everyone involved understands the responses of the professionals concerned, which will lead to a better quality of provision for the individuals concerned, which is important.

Parents have a unique knowledge and understanding of their child's needs and, therefore, they have a crucial role to play in any decision-making process. Professionals need to ensure that they communicate effectively with parents by listening to their concerns and developing appropriate strategies to support individuals and to empower parents. Parents need to be fully informed so they can make constructive decisions based on all the evidence available. We must also remember the role of the young people themselves. It is essential that they are fully involved in making decisions about their future, where appropriate, and they need adults to plan with them rather than for them.

The importance of early identification, assessment and provision for any child who may have SEN cannot be over-emphasised. The earlier action is taken, the more responsive the child is likely to be, and the more effective the intervention will be. The Assembly Government has placed social inclusion at the heart of all its policies. For me, as Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, ensuring that we deliver the best possible services for some of our most vulnerable children and young people is, and will continue to be, a key priority in the future delivery of education services in Wales. Members will remember that on 25 January I gave a detailed response to the recommendations from the committee in a written statement.

3.10 p.m.

**Janet Ryder:** The committee review highlighted a number of areas that are of concern to the young people who receive support in schools, but it mainly highlighted the areas that are of concern to parents. The need to continually communicate with parents was highlighted. You said, in your response, that professionals need to ensure that they communicate effectively with parents, yet it was clear from the evidence that the committee took that that is not currently happening. I have not heard

ymateb a geir gan y gweithwyr proffesiynol sy'n ymwneud â hyn, fel y ceir darpariaeth well i'r unigolion sydd dan sylw, ac mae hynny'n bwysig.

Mae gan rieni wybodaeth a dealltwriaeth unigryw o anghenion eu plentyn ac, felly, mae iddynt rôl hollbwysig mewn unrhyw broses penderfynu. Rhaid i weithwyr proffesiynol sicrhau eu bod yn cyfathrebu'n effeithiol â rhieni drwy wrando ar eu pryderon a datblygu strategaethau priodol i gefnogi unigolion a galluogi rhieni. Rhaid i rieni gael eu hysbysu'n llawn fel y gallant wneud penderfyniadau adeiladol ar sail yr holl dystiolaeth sydd ar gael. Rhaid inni gofio hefyd am rôl y bobl ifanc eu hunain. Mae'n hollbwysig iddynt gymryd rhan lawn wrth benderfynu ar eu dyfodol, os yw'n briodol, ac mae arnynt angen i oedolion gynllunio gyda hwy yn hytrach nag ar eu cyfer.

Ni ellir rhoi gormod o bwys ar yr angen i ganfod anghenion addysgol arbennig mewn unrhyw blentyn yn gynnar, ac i'w asesu a darparu ar ei gyfer. Po gynharaf y cymerir camau, mwyaf ymatebol y mae'r plentyn yn debygol o fod, a mwyaf effeithiol fydd yr ymyriad. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi rhoi lle canolog i gynhwysiant cymdeithasol yn ei holl bolisiâu. I mi, fel y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, bydd yr angen i sicrhau ein bod yn cynnig y gwasanaethau gorau posibl i rai o'r plant a'r bobl ifanc sy'n fwyaf agored i niwed yn parhau'n flaenoriaeth allweddol wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau addysg yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol. Bydd Aelodau'n cofio fy mod ar 25 Ionawr wedi ymateb yn fanwl i argymhellion y pwyllgor mewn datganiad ysgrifenedig.

**Janet Ryder:** Mae adolygiad y pwyllgor wedi tynnu sylw at sawl maes sy'n bwysig yng ngolwg y bobl ifanc sy'n cael cymorth mewn ysgolion, ond tynnodd sylw'n bennaf at y meysydd sydd o bwys yng ngolwg rhieni. Tynnwyd sylw at yr angen i gyfathrebu'n barhaus â rhieni. Dywedasoeh, yn eich ymateb, fod yn rhaid i weithwyr proffesiynol sicrhau eu bod yn cyfathrebu'n effeithiol â rhieni, ac eto, yr oedd yn glir o'r dystiolaeth a gymerodd y pwyllgor nad yw hynny'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd. Ni chlywais

anything in your response today, or seen anything in your written response, on how you will ensure that that practice changes so that parents can be much more involved.

You also said that you want to ensure that all teaching staff are equipped, on entering the classroom, to identify and support individual needs. However, unfortunately, you rejected the recommendation in the report that relates to that. Will you tell us exactly how you will target that ongoing support? Will that be through the better schools fund or will you go back to the General Teaching Council for Wales and make more bursaries available, targeted at releasing teachers to look at best practice in other classrooms?

Two other issues came across clearly in the report, the first of which is the need for more joint working. I understand that you are undertaking an audit of joint working, but will you be making that audit available to committee members, and, if so, when? Secondly, an issue that arose frequently was the need for an independent advocacy service. I am disappointed that you have not referred to that in your report. The money for advocacy services comes to local government from the Assembly and as long as local government is perceived by parents as the commissioning body that pays for that service, it is difficult for parents to see advocacy services as being truly independent. That issue is important to a number of parents, so I ask you to look again at how we offer independent advocacy services to parents.

**Jane Davidson:** The Education Act 1996 places a statutory duty on local education authorities to ensure that the parents of any child with special educational needs, in their area, is provided with advice and information about matters related to those needs. It is a direct responsibility of local education authorities. The committee, if you remember, made a number of recommendations to the Assembly Government, but also made recommendations to other authorities. In my

ddim yn eich ymateb heddiw, ac ni welais ddim yn eich ymateb ysgrifenedig, am y modd y byddwch yn sicrhau y ceir newid mewn arferion fel y gall rhieni gymryd rhan fwy o lawer.

Dywedasoch hefyd eich bod am sicrhau y bydd yr holl staff dysgu'n gymwys, wrth fynd i mewn i'r ystafell ddosbarth, i ganfod a diwallu anghenion penodol. Er hynny, gwaetha'r modd, gwnaethoch wrthod yr argymhelliad yn yr adroddiad sy'n ymwneud â hynny. A wnewch ddweud wrthym sut yn union y byddwch yn targedu'r cymorth parhaus hwnnw? A wneir hynny drwy'r gronfa ysgolion gwell neu a ewch yn ôl at Gyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru a darparu rhagor o fwsariaethau, gyda'r bwriad o ryddhau athrawon fel y gallant astudio'r arferion gorau mewn ystafelloedd dosbarth eraill?

Yr oedd dau fater arall wedi'u cyfleu'n glir yn yr adroddiad, a'r cyntaf yw'r angen am fwy o weithio ar y cyd. Deallaf eich bod yn cynnal archwiliad o weithio ar y cyd, ond a fyddwch yn sicrhau bod yr archwiliad hwnnw ar gael i aelodau'r pwyllgor, ac, os byddwch, pa bryd? Yn ail, un mater a gododd yn aml oedd yr angen am wasanaeth eiriolaeth annibynnol. Yr wyf yn siomedig nad ydych wedi cyfeirio at hynny yn eich adroddiad. Daw'r arian ar gyfer gwasanaethau eiriolaeth i lywodraeth leol oddi wrth y Cynulliad a chyhyd ag y bydd rhieni'n ystyried llywodraeth leol yn gorff comisiynu sy'n talu am y gwasanaeth hwnnw, bydd yn anodd i rieni dderbyn bod gwasanaethau eiriolaeth yn wirioneddol annibynnol. Mae'r mater hwnnw'n bwysig i nifer o rieni, felly gofynnaf ichi ailedrych ar y modd yr ydym yn cynnig gwasanaethau eiriolaeth annibynnol i rieni.

**Jane Davidson:** Mae Deddf Addysg 1996 yn rhoi awdurdodau addysg lleol o dan ddyletswydd statudol i sicrhau y bydd rhieni unrhyw blentyn sydd ag anghenion addysgol arbennig, yn eu hardal, yn cael cyngor a gwybodaeth am faterion sy'n ymwneud â'r anghenion hynny. Mae'n gyfrifoldeb uniongyrchol i awdurdodau addysg lleol. Os cofiwch, cyflwynodd y pwyllgor sawl argymhelliad i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ond cyflwynodd argymhellion hefyd i

written response, you will see that we have undertaken to ensure that we pass those recommendations on to other authorities, but we have given an initial view in that context. How that responsibility to parents is delivered is a matter for local authorities—it is in the report.

We do not accept the initial teacher training recommendation because we have discussed the initial teacher training review at some length in committee. That review will look at the number of teachers needed in different parts of Wales, and the needs in terms of English and Welsh, to get a far better fix on the number of teachers that we need to be training for the future. Separately, as the written statement clearly outlines, we are talking about the quality standards that every qualified teacher would need to achieve. We have said, unequivocally, that we will ensure that the understanding of SEN across the board and the ability to refer to specific professionals would come through in that other process. That is clear in the written statement.

In its review, the committee was strongly in favour of multi-agency work. We are not doing one audit of multi-agency work—you need to be more specific about which audit you have in mind, because we have done an audit in every single area in terms of special educational needs provision. We have consulted on each area and we always publish the consultation responses. If you have a particular audit in mind, perhaps you would write to me, and I would be happy to respond. That is the way that we do business—we always publish our consultation responses. The key opportunity in the multi-agency work, for example, on the back of a speech and language therapy group, is that there is an additional £3 million in place for pilot projects starting in this next financial year in terms of joint commissioning. The committee strongly endorsed that.

awdurdodau eraill. Yn fy ymateb ysgrifenedig, gwelwch ein bod wedi ymgymryd i sicrhau y trosglwyddwn yr argymhellion hynny i awdurdodau eraill, ond yr ydym wedi cynnig barn gyntaf yn y cyddestun hwnnw. Mae'r modd y cyflawnir y ddyletswydd honno at rieni yn fater i awdurdodau lleol—mae hynny yn yr adroddiad.

Nid ydym yn derbyn yr argymhelliad ar hyfforddiant cychwynnol athrawon gan ein bod wedi trafod yr adolygiad o hyfforddiant cychwynnol athrawon yn eithaf hir yn y pwyllgor. Bydd yr adolygiad hwnnw'n ystyried nifer yr athrawon y mae eu hangen mewn gwahanol rannau o Gymru, a'r angen o ran y Gymraeg a'r Saesneg, er mwyn gweld yn gliriach nifer yr athrawon y mae angen inni eu hyfforddi ar gyfer y dyfodol. Ar wahân i hynny, fel y nodir yn glir yn y datganiad ysgrifenedig, yr ydym yn sôn am y safonau ansawdd y byddai'n rhaid i bob athro cymwysedig eu cyrraedd. Yr ydym wedi dweud yn glir y byddwn yn sicrhau y bydd y ddealltwriaeth o anghenion addysgol arbennig yn gyffredinol a'r gallu i atgyfeirio i weithwyr proffesiynol penodol yn cael eu hystyried yn y broses arall honno. Mae hynny wedi'i nodi'n glir yn y datganiad ysgrifenedig.

Yn ei adolygiad, yr oedd y pwyllgor yn frwd o blaid gwaith amlasiantaethol. Nid un archwiliad yr ydym yn ei gynnal o waith amlasiantaethol—dylech egluro'n fwy penodol pa archwiliad sydd gennych dan sylw, gan ein bod wedi cynnal archwiliad o bob un maes sy'n gysylltiedig â'r ddarpariaeth ar gyfer anghenion addysgol arbennig. Yr ydym wedi ymgynghori ar bob maes a byddwn bob amser yn cyhoeddi'r ymatebion i ymgynghoriadau. Os oes gennych archwiliad penodol dan sylw, efallai y gwnewch ysgrifennu ataf, a byddwn yn falch o ymateb. Felly yr ydym yn gwneud busnes bob amser—yr ydym bob amser yn cyhoeddi ymatebion i'n hymgynghoriadau. Y cyfle allweddol a geir yn y gwaith amlasiantaethol, er enghraifft, o gael grŵp therapi iaith a lleferydd, yw bod £3 miliwn ychwanegol ar gael ar gyfer prosiectau peilot mewn cysylltiad â chomisiynu ar y cyd o'r flwyddyn ariannol nesaf ymlaen. Yr oedd y pwyllgor yn gefnogol iawn i hynny.



We have already established the advocacy unit; it came on the back of the previous report, 'Telling Concerns'. We will be looking to that advocacy unit, which, along with Cardiff University, has been reviewing advocacy delivery right across the board. That will make recommendations to us on how we can best deliver an advocacy service.

**David Davies:** I hope that we all agree that getting extra help to pupils with special educational needs is of paramount importance. I have been particularly concerned by the problems involved in getting pupils to speech and language therapists. Constituents of mine from Gwent came to see me recently, and told me that they have been almost forced to go private, such is the length of time that they will have to wait if they want to get assistance for the child concerned. It is crucial that people with special needs get the help that they need to ensure that they do not fall behind. I suppose that it is a step forward that you have decided to accept 11 of the 19 recommendations immediately, and another five in principle.

The most important step that we need to take is to ensure that the local education authorities and social services work together in identifying and helping those with special educational needs. The lack of joined-up thinking—if I may use an awful New Labourism—has caused fundamental problems for schools with pupils who have special needs, but who have not been stated by the local education authority, because the school is obliged to fund their extra learning needs from existing budgets. We need to get a standard definition of special education needs from local education authorities and get them to act upon that definition consistently. That is a priority.

You talked of allocating £3 million over the next three years for pilot projects, but I ask you to consider the existing deficiencies and how we will resolve them. They need to be resolved right away. You have spoken about

Yr ydym eisoes wedi sefydlu'r uned eiriolaeth; gwnaed hynny yn sgîl yr adroddiad blaenorol, 'Datgan Pryderon'. Byddwn yn disgwyl clywed gan yr uned eiriolaeth honno, a fu'n adolygu'r dull o gynnig eiriolaeth yn gyffredinol, ar y cyd â Phrifysgol Caerdydd. Bydd yn cyflwyno argymhellion i ni ar y modd gorau i ddarparu gwasanaeth eiriolaeth.

**David Davies:** Gobeithiaf ein bod oll yn gytûn bod cynnig cymorth ychwanegol i ddisgyblion sydd ag anghenion addysgol arbennig yn rhywbeth sydd o'r pwys mwyaf. Bûm yn arbennig o bryderus ynghylch y problemau sy'n gysylltiedig ag anfon disgyblion at therapyddion iaith a llferydd. Daeth rhai o'm hetholwyr yng Ngwent i'm gweld yn ddiweddar, a dweud wrthyf eu bod wedi'u gorfodi bron i droi at ddarpariaeth breifat, gan hwyed y cyfnod y byddant yn gorfod aros os ydynt am gael cymorth i'r plentyn dan sylw. Mae'n hollbwysig y bydd rhai sydd ag anghenion arbennig yn cael y cymorth y mae arnynt ei angen fel na fyddant ar ei hôl hi. Mae'n debyg gennyf mai cam ymlaen yw'r ffaith eich bod wedi penderfynu derbyn 11 o'r 19 o argymhellion ar unwaith, a phum arall mewn egwyddor.

Y cam pwysicaf y mae'n rhaid inni ei gymryd yw sicrhau bod yr awdurdodau addysg lleol a'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd i ganfod a helpu'r rhai sydd ag anghenion addysgol arbennig. Mae'r diffyg meddwl cydgysylltiedig—os caf ddefnyddio un o ymadroddion ofnadwy Llafur Newydd—wedi peri problemau sylfaenol i ysgolion sydd â disgyblion a chanddynt anghenion arbennig, nad ydynt wedi cael datganiad gan yr awdurdod addysg lleol, gan fod yr ysgol yn gorfod talu am eu hanghenion dysgu ychwanegol o'r cyllidebau presennol. Rhaid inni gael diffiniad swyddogol o anghenion addysg arbennig gan awdurdodau addysg lleol a pheri iddynt weithredu'n gyson ar sail y diffiniad hwnnw. Mae hynny'n flaenoriaeth.

Soniasoch am ddyrannu £3 miliwn dros y tair blynedd nesaf ar gyfer prosiectau peilot, ond gofynnaf ichi ystyried y diffygion presennol a'r modd y byddwn yn eu datrys. Rhaid eu datrys ar unwaith. Soniasoch am roi £3

£3 million over the next year, but your statement, which I have before me, states that it will be over three years, which is a long time for people to wait.

The recommendations, however, which call for closer working between the local education authorities and social services, are designed to address the fundamental problem that exists, and I accept that that is a good thing. It surprises me that you have chosen to reject the recommendations that call for more training for teachers, particularly in recognising the issues around special educational needs which they are likely to have to deal with. Your statement says:

'I ... wish to ensure that all teaching staff are equipped on entering the classroom to identify and support the individual needs of learners and that they continue to receive support through targeted continuous professional development in this area.'

That is fine, and we agree with it, but the report made two recommendations, which would have given more training to trainee teachers, namely 4.14 and 4.18, I believe, off the top of my head. Why have you chosen to reject those recommendations? You are saying all of the right things, but you are not delivering on them. Those recommendations do not appear to be controversial and they do not raise any financial implications. I would have thought that such reasonable requests would be easy to incorporate and I ask you to reconsider this.

There have been a huge number of cases of litigation over the last few years. Has the Welsh Assembly Government done an analysis of cases brought against local education authorities by parents and pupils whose needs have not been properly recognised? Do you agree that the only sure-fire way of concluding that the recommendations are having some impact is to assess whether litigation is decreasing?

**Jane Davidson:** As I said in my statement, we are providing £3 million over the next three years, from 2005 to 2007. The committee's early work in identifying the issues, plus the work that Jane Hutt and I

miliwn dros y flwyddyn sydd i ddod, ond mae'ch datganiad, sydd gennyf o'm blaen, yn dweud y bydd hynny dros dair blynedd, ac mae hwnnw'n gyfnod hir i ddisgwyl.

Fodd bynnag, mae'r argymhellion sy'n galw am weithio agosach rhwng yr awdurdodau addysg lleol a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, wedi'u llunio â'r bwriad o ddatrys y broblem sylfaenol a geir, a derbynias fod hynny'n beth da. Synnaf eich bod wedi dewis gwrthod yr argymhellion sy'n galw am fwy o hyfforddiant i athrawon, yn enwedig o ran adnabod y materion sy'n gysylltiedig ag anghenion addysgol arbennig y maent yn debygol o orfod delio â hwy. Yn eich datganiad dywedir:

Yr wyf yn dymuno sicrhau y bydd yr holl staff dysgu yn gymwys pan ânt i'r ystafell ddosbarth i ganfod a diwallu anghenion dysgwyr unigol ac y byddant yn dal i gael cymorth drwy ddatblygiad proffesiynol parhaus penodol yn y maes hwn.

Mae hynny'n iawn, a chytunwn â hynny, ond gwnaed dau argymhelliad yn yr adroddiad, a fyddai wedi rhoi mwy o hyfforddiant i athrawon dan hyfforddiant, sef 4.14 a 4.18, os cofiaf yn iawn. Pam yr ydych wedi dewis gwrthod yr argymhellion hynny? Yr ydych yn dweud y pethau iawn, ond nid ydych yn gweithredu ar sail hynny. Nid yw'n ymddangos bod yr argymhellion hynny'n ddadleuol ac nid ydynt yn codi unrhyw oblygiadau ariannol. Tybiaswn mai hawdd fyddai ymateb i geisiadau rhesymol o'r fath a gofynnaf ichi ailystyried hyn.

Bu nifer fawr o achosion o ymgyfreithio dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf. A yw Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ymgymryd ag unrhyw ddadansoddiad o achosion a dducpwyd yn erbyn awdurdodau addysg lleol gan rieni a disgyblion nad yw eu hanghenion wedi'u cydnabod yn iawn? A ydych yn cytuno mai'r unig ffordd sicr i ddod i'r casgliad bod yr argymhellion yn cael rhyw effaith yw drwy ganfod a oes llai o ymgyfreithio?

**Jane Davidson:** Fel y dywedais yn fy natganiad, yr ydym yn darparu £3 miliwn dros y tair blynedd nesaf, o 2005 i 2007. Yr oedd gwaith cynnar y pwyllgor i nodi'r materion a oedd yn codi, ynghyd â'r gwaith a

instigated together under the speech and language therapy working group's report, 'Working Together', in 2003, demonstrated the need for us to put an extra incentive investment in place to drive this collaboration.

I am pleased that the committee's report talks about multi-agency working all the way through. It also demonstrates unequivocally that we need to test the ability to get the right multi-agency working before we look at, for example, changes to legislation on issues such as the prime and ultimate responsibility. That is absolutely right. We need to test it effectively, and if it will not deliver the effective outcomes, we need to look at other legislative routes further down the line, but that is why we are providing that additional investment.

3.20 p.m.

In terms of issues around statementing, this report deals with early intervention. The second stage of the review, which we will be considering at the next committee meeting, will be looking specifically at issues around statementing, so we will be able to take that forward. It is also important to say that large amounts of funding have already been allocated to special educational needs. The total expenditure on SEN provision in 2004 was £245 million, which was an 8 per cent increase on the previous year's budget. I say again that I am not rejecting the notion that teachers should have the appropriate training; we have rejected the specific route identified by the committee because it would not be possible for us to deliver the training in that way. Since we are all focusing on outcomes, we can deliver in other ways. It would not be appropriate to look at only the delivery of initial teacher training inside higher education institutions, for example, if we want to ensure that all teachers in classrooms have a full understanding of SEN, because we also have employer routes into teaching. However, by putting this in the context of quality teacher standards, we can ensure that it is part of the standard that teachers must reach in order to achieve their registration. That is a much more attractive concept, because that works for every teacher

gychwynnwyd gan Jane Hutt a minnau ar y cyd yn dilyn adroddiad y gweithgor ar therapi iaith a lleferydd, 'Gweithio Gyda'n Gilydd', yn 2003, yn dangos bod angen inni gynnig cyllid ychwanegol i hybu'r cydweithio hwn.

Yr wyf yn falch bod adroddiad y pwyllgor yn sôn am weithio amlasiantaethol o'r dechrau i'r diwedd. Mae hefyd yn dangos yn bendant fod yn rhaid inni roi prawf ar y gallu i sicrhau gweithio priodol rhwng asiantaethau cyn inni ystyried newidiadau, er enghraifft, i ddeddfwriaeth ar faterion fel y prif gyfrifoldeb a'r cyfrifoldeb terfynol. Mae hynny'n gwbl gywir. Rhaid inni roi prawf effeithiol ar hynny, ac os na fydd yn sicrhau canlyniadau effeithiol, bydd yn rhaid inni ystyried llwybrau deddfwriaethol ymhellach i'r dyfodol, ond dyna pam yr ydym yn darparu'r buddsoddiad ychwanegol hwnnw.

Gyda golwg ar y materion sy'n ymwneud â darparu datganiadau, mae'r adroddiad hwn yn ymdrin ag ymyrryd yn gynnar. Bydd ail ran yr adolygiad, a ystyriwn yng nghyfarfod nesaf y pwyllgor, yn ymdrin yn benodol â materion sy'n ymwneud â darparu datganiadau, felly byddwn yn gallu bwrw ymlaen â hynny. Mae hefyd yn bwysig dweud bod symiau mawr o arian wedi'u dyrannu eisoes ar gyfer anghenion addysgol arbennig. Cyfanswm y gwariant ar y ddarpariaeth ar gyfer anghenion addysgol arbennig yn 2004 oedd £245 miliwn, a oedd yn 8 y cant yn fwy na'r hyn a gaed yng nghyllideb y flwyddyn flaenorol. Dywedaf eto nad wyf yn gwrthod y syniad y dylai athrawon gael hyfforddiant priodol; yr ydym wedi gwrthod y llwybr penodol a nodwyd gan y pwyllgor gan na fyddai modd inni gynnig yr hyfforddiant yn y ffordd hynny. Gan ein bod ni i gyd yn canolbwyntio ar ganlyniadau, gallwn ei gynnig drwy dulliau eraill. Amhriodol fyddai ystyried darparu hyfforddiant cychwynnol athrawon mewn sefydliadau addysg uwch yn unig, er enghraifft, gan ein bod am sicrhau y bydd yr holl athrawon mewn ystafelloedd dosbarth yn deall AAA yn drylwyr, gan fod gennym llwybrau at ddysgu drwy gyflogwyr hefyd. Fodd bynnag, drwy roi hyn yng nghyd-destun safonau ansawdd athrawon, gallwn sicrhau ei

whatever their route of access.

The same applies to the General Teaching Council for Wales. We have looked at targeted initiatives for funding, for example, we have additional funding this year in the better schools fund for multi-sensory impairment, as is entirely appropriate. We must use such mechanisms in looking at targeted funding. General Teaching Council for Wales funding is focused on continuous professional development, whereby teachers identify their own needs and apply for the funding. That has been its biggest success. There is no mandatory element to that. We would want teachers to apply for specialist support in terms of SEN, and many do apply, but we want to retain its voluntary aspects.

**Peter Black:** I welcome the Minister's response to this report. Going through the written statement in detail, it is clear that the vast majority of the recommendations have been accepted, and we look forward to seeing those being implemented over the course of the next few years to improve SEN provision throughout Wales, particularly in terms of early identification and intervention. Most of the specific questions have already been addressed, but I have one or two follow-ups on Janet's and David's questions, particularly in relation to initial teacher training. I understand the Minister's point with regard to the ITT review and the fact that she is looking for an alternative path to bring that recommendation into effect, but I am interested in an indication from the Minister as to how she envisages that being rolled out, and, in particular, when she envisages the introduction of changes to teacher training.

In relation to advocacy, I understand that a review is ongoing, and it is important that it runs its course. I note that the written statement states that availability of funding for advocacy services is dependent on the

fod yn rhan o'r safon y mae'n rhaid i athrawon ei chyrraedd er mwyn cael eu cofrestru. Mae hwnnw'n gysyniad mwy deniadol o lawer, gan y bydd yn berthnasol i bob athro, ni waeth pa lwybr y mae'n ei ddilyn.

Mae'r un peth yn wir am Gyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru. Yr ydym wedi ystyried ariannu mentrau penodol: er enghraifft, mae gennym gyllid ychwanegol eleni yn y gronfa ysgolion gwell ar gyfer nam amlsynnwyr, fel sy'n gwbl briodol. Rhaid inni ddefnyddio dulliau o'r fath wrth ystyried ariannu mentrau penodol. Mae'r arian gan Gyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru wedi ei gyfyngu i ddatblygiad proffesiynol parhaus yn bennaf, fel y bydd athrawon yn nodi eu hanghenion eu hunain ac yn ymgeisio am gyllid. Hwnnw fu ei lwyddiant mwyaf. Nid oes elfen orfodol yn hynny. Byddem am weld athrawon yn ymgeisio am gymorth arbenigol ar gyfer AAA, ac mae llawer yn gwneud hynny, ond yr ydym am gadw'r agweddau gwirfoddol arno.

**Peter Black:** Croesawaf ymateb y Gweinidog i'r adroddiad hwn. Wrth ddarllen drwy'r datganiad ysgrifenedig yn fanwl, gwelir bod y mwyafrif helaeth o'r argymhellion wedi'u derbyn, ac edrychwn ymlaen at eu gweld yn cael eu rhoi ar waith dros y blynyddoedd nesaf i wella'r ddarpariaeth AAA ledled Cymru, yn enwedig o ran canfod ac ymyrryd yn gynnar. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r cwestiynau penodol wedi'u hateb eisoes, ond mae gennyf un neu ddau o gwestiynau yn sgîl y rhai a ofynnodd Janet a David, o ran hyfforddiant cychwynnol athrawon yn benodol. Deallaf y pwynt a wnaeth y Gweinidog am yr adolygiad o hyfforddiant cychwynnol athrawon a'r ffaith ei bod yn chwilio am ddull arall o roi'r argymhelliad hwnnw ar waith, ond carwn glywed gan y Gweinidog am y modd y mae'n rhagweld y caiff hyn ei weithredu, ac, yn benodol, pa bryd y mae'n rhagweld y cyflwynir newidiadau i hyfforddiant athrawon.

O ran eiriolaeth, deallaf fod adolygiad yn mynd rhagddo, ac mae'n bwysig gadael iddo ddilyn ei hynt. Sylwaf fod y datganiad ysgrifenedig yn nodi y bydd y ddarpariaeth o gyllid ar gyfer gwasanaethau eiriolaeth yn

outcome of that review. However, I seek an assurance from the Minister that, once that review is complete, additional funding will be available to put this into effect. A number of recommendations in this report, if fully implemented, could lead to additional demands on the Assembly's budget, and the commitment of the Minister, the Assembly Government and the whole Assembly to SEN requires some monetary commitment in terms of drawing on that budget. I would like some assurances from the Minister that the strategy set out in the report, to which she responded in her written statement, will not fall down for lack of funding when it comes to be fully implemented.

Again, on bursaries, I understand that the better schools fund may be a better avenue through which to implement this, but I seek assurances from the Minister on timescales—when can this be introduced and what source of funding will be available to bring it into effect?

**Jane Davidson:** We are reviewing circular 13/98, which is the requirement for courses of initial teacher training. The proposed replacements are two pieces of subordinate legislation: one to cover the qualified teacher status standard, and the other to include the initial teacher training course requirements. We do not specify the content of the ITT courses. Therefore, we will not be offering guidance on that. However, the qualified teacher status standards are the route to take because students and ITT providers will be required to cover them in courses and demonstrate that they understand their responsibilities under the code of practice on special educational needs and know how to seek advice from specialists on less common types of special educational needs. These standards will apply not only to those trained in higher education institutions, but to those who come through the employment-based routes. Therefore, they are a catch-all, and this is about wanting to support the committee's recommendation. We will come to committee shortly with a date to bring forward the legislation, although it may already be in the current chart. We will check this at the meeting on 9 February.

dibynnu ar ganlyniad yr adolygiad hwnnw. Er hynny, ceisiaf sicrwydd gan y Gweinidog y bydd cyllid ychwanegol ar gael, ar ôl cwblhau'r adolygiad hwnnw, i roi hyn ar waith. Mae nifer o argymhellion yn yr adroddiad hwn a allai arwain, os cânt eu gweithredu'n llawn, at alwadau pellach ar gyllideb y Cynulliad, ac mae ymrwymiad y Gweinidog, Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r Cynulliad cyfan i AAA yn gofyn rhywfaint o ymrwymiad ariannol o ran defnyddio'r gyllideb honno. Carwn gael rhyw sicrwydd gan y Gweinidog na fydd y strategaeth a nodir yn yr adroddiad, yr ymatebodd iddo yn ei datganiad ysgrifenedig, yn methu oherwydd diffyg cyllid pan ddaw'r adeg i'w rhoi ar waith yn llawn.

Unwaith eto, ynghylch bwrsariaethau, deallaf y gallai'r gronfa ysgolion gwell fod yn well cyfrwng i roi hyn ar waith, ond ceisiaf sicrwydd gan y Gweinidog ynghylch yr amserlen—pa bryd y gellir cyflwyno hyn a pha ffynhonnell ariannol a fydd ar gael i'w roi ar waith?

**Jane Davidson:** Yr ydym yn adolygu cylchlythyr 13/98, sef y gofyniad i gynnal cyrsiau hyfforddiant cychwynnol athrawon. Yr hyn y bwriedir ei roi yn ei le yw dwy eitem o is-ddeddfwriaeth: un i ymdrin â safon statws yr athro cymwysedig, a'r llall i gynnwys y gofynion ar gyfer cyrsiau hyfforddiant cychwynnol athrawon. Nid ydym yn pennu cynnwys y cyrsiau hynny. Felly, ni fyddwn yn cynnig canllawiau ar hynny. Fodd bynnag, safonau statws yr athro cymwysedig yw'r llwybr y dylid ei ddilyn gan y bydd yn ofynnol i fyfyrwyr a darparwyr hyfforddiant cychwynnol athrawon ymdrin â hwy mewn cyrsiau a dangos eu bod yn deall eu cyfrifoldebau o dan y cod ymarfer ar anghenion addysgol arbennig ac yn gwybod sut i geisio cyngor gan arbenigwyr ar fathau llai cyffredin o anghenion addysgol arbennig. Bydd y safonau hynny'n berthnasol i'r rhai a hyfforddir mewn sefydliadau addysg uwch, a hefyd i'r rhai sy'n dilyn llwybrau sy'n seiliedig ar gyflogaeth. Gan hynny, maent yn cynnwys pawb, a'r amcan wrth wneud hyn yw cefnogi argymhelliad y pwyllgor. Deuwn at y pwyllgor cyn hir gyda dyddiad i roi'r ddeddfwriaeth gerbron, er y gallai fod ar y siart bresennol eisoes. Cadarnhawn hynny yn

y cyfarfod ar 9 Chwefror.

The report noted that current funding levels are unlikely to be increased significantly in the near future, therefore could this funding be used more effectively? That is the first challenge to us all. We have managed to find some additional funding. We are undertaking a review of the formula used to allocate SEN funding to local authorities, which the committee was keen to do, so that issues such as low birth-weight, for example, are considered. It currently takes pupils from the ages of five to 16 into account, but we want it to include children from birth to 19-years-old in terms of SEN funding.

We have established a task group that represents all the higher education institutions to consider issues related to continuous professional development among SEN teachers. Therefore, we undertook an audit of teacher education and SEN training late last year, and we hope to provide guidance on continuous professional development for teachers, learning support assistants, school governors and senior managers. I will bring the guidance to committee. As you will see, the majority of recommendations have timescales attached to them, because work on them was initiated when the committee started its reviews so that we would have, and could engender, a positive response both from ourselves and our partners on the outcome of this report.

**Karen Sinclair:** I welcome the introduction of universal neonatal hearing screening for babies in Wales. This much-needed practice is now operational across the whole of Wales, which I applaud. The screening process, as you know, will help provide specialist help at an earlier stage for those who suffer from deafness and for their families. To best take advantage of the opportunities for language development offered by early identification, services must be delivered using a co-ordinated family-friendly approach to agreed standards. This could be achieved by introducing a national service framework for intervention services that will guarantee a minimum standard of intervention support for the family regardless of their location or the time of year when the support is required.

Nododd yr adroddiad ei bod yn annhebygol y bydd y lefelau ariannu'n cynyddu'n sylweddol yn y dyfodol agos, felly a ellid defnyddio'r cyllid hwn yn fwy effeithiol? Dyna'r her bwysicaf i ni i gyd. Yr ydym wedi llwyddo i ganfod rhywfaint o gyllid ychwanegol. Yr ydym yn cynnal adolygiad o'r fformiwla a ddefnyddir i ddyrannu cyllid ar gyfer AAA i awdurdodau lleol, yr oedd y pwyllgor yn awyddus iddo gael ei wneud, fel y gellir ystyried materion fel pwysau geni isel, er enghraifft. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'n ystyried disgyblion o bump i 16 oed, ond yr ydym am iddi gynnwys plant o'u geni hyd at 19 blwydd oed o ran ariannu AAA.

Yr ydym wedi sefydlu grŵp gorchwyl sy'n cynrychioli'r holl sefydliadau addysg uwch i ystyried materion sy'n ymwneud â datblygiad proffesiynol parhaus ymysg athrawon AAA. Felly, ymgymerasom ag archwiliad o addysg athrawon a hyfforddiant AAA ddiwedd y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, a gobeithiwn gynnig canllawiau ar ddatblygiad proffesiynol parhaus ar gyfer athrawon, cynorthwywyr cymorth dysgu, llywodraethwyr ysgol ac uwch reolwyr. Rhoddaf y canllawiau gerbron y pwyllgor. Fel y gwelwch, mae amserlen ynghlwm wrth y rhan fwyaf o'r argymhellion, gan fod y gwaith arnynt wedi dechrau pan gychwynnodd y pwyllgor ar ei adolygiadau fel y caem, ac y gallem ennyn, ymateb cadarnhaol ar ein rhan ni a'n partneriaid i ganlyniad yr adroddiad hwn.

**Karen Sinclair:** Croesawaf y penderfyniad i gyflwyno sgrinio clyw i bob plentyn newydd-anedig yng Nghymru. Mae'r arfer hwn, y mae taer angen amdano, wedi'i roi ar waith bellach ledled Cymru, a chymeradwyaf hynny. Fel y gwyddoch, bydd y broses sgrinio yn helpu i roi cymorth arbenigol yn gynt i blant byddar ac i'w teuluoedd. Er mwyn manteisio i'r eithaf ar y cyfleoedd a geir ar gyfer datblygu iaith drwy ganfod yr anghenion yn gynnar, rhaid darparu gwasanaethau ymyrryd yn gynnar drwy ddull cydynol sy'n ystyriol o deuluoedd yn unol â'r safonau a gytunwyd. Gellid cyflawni hyn drwy gyflwyno fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer gwasanaethau ymyrryd a fydd yn gwarantu safon ofynnol ar gyfer cymorth ymyrryd i'r teulu ni waeth ym mhle

Could you outline what targeted resources you will make available to support the development and delivery of specialist family-friendly support services in Wales? Will you also agree to set clear, national minimum standards for the delivery of services to families whose babies have been identified as having a hearing loss through the Welsh Assembly Government's newborn hearing screening process?

**Jane Davidson:** There was greater demand than anticipated for newborn hearing screening, and, if you remember, we immediately held a consultation on issues relating to hearing impairment. We have undertaken a similar consultation on visual and multi-sensory impairments, so that these are also taken into account. We are committed to establishing uniform standards of excellence to ensure equality of access to high-quality provision for all hearing-impaired children and young people across Wales. With regard to the specifically targeted strategies, we have consulted on the principles, and there is strong support for our strategy on hearing impairment, which is being put into practice.

3.30 p.m.

A task and finish group has looked at issues around sign language. There is a shortage of sign language interpreters in Wales. I have been interested to see that a number of schools, particularly those which have hearing-impaired pupils, have wanted to offer qualifications for those pupils, and I was pleased to agree to the certificate in British sign language level 1, level 2 and level 2, stage 2 for the use of learners under the age of 16. This is an opportunity that schools can take up, and it leads to qualifications for pupils at key stage 4. We have also ensured that additional money is provided—we have given a one-off grant to local education authorities of £500,000 this year—to assist in the purchase of specialist equipment and resources. We need to ensure that hearing aid analysers are available to all support services for hearing impairment across Wales, because there has been disparity of provision.

y mae'n byw nac ar ba adeg o'r flwyddyn y mae angen y cymorth. A allwch nodi pa adnoddau penodol y byddech yn eu darparu i hybu'r gwaith o ddatblygu a rhedeg gwasanaethau cymorth arbenigol sy'n ystyriol o deuluoedd yng Nghymru? A wnewch gytuno hefyd i bennu safonau gofynnol cenedlaethol clir ar gyfer y gwasanaethau a gynigir i deuluoedd y canfuwyd bod diffyg ar glyw eu babanod drwy broses sgrinio'r clyw Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer plant newydd-anedig?

**Jane Davidson:** Yr oedd mwy o alw nag a ragwelwyd am sgrinio clyw plant newydd-anedig, ac, os cofiwch, gwnaethom ymgynghori ar unwaith ar faterion a oedd yn ymwneud â nam ar y clyw. Bu inni gynnal ymgynghoriad tebyg ar namau ar y golwg a namau amlsynnwyr, fel y caiff y rhain eu hystyried hefyd. Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i sefydlu safonau rhagoriaeth unffurf i sicrhau mynediad cyfartal i ddarpariaeth o ansawdd da i'r holl blant a phobl ifanc sydd â nam ar eu clyw ledled Cymru. Gyda golwg ar y strategaethau penodol, yr ydym wedi ymgynghori ar yr egwyddorion, ac mae cefnogaeth gryf i'r strategaeth ar nam ar y clyw, sy'n cael ei rhoi ar waith.

Mae grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen wedi ystyried materion sy'n ymwneud ag iaith arwyddion. Mae prinder cyfieithwyr iaith arwyddion yng Nghymru. Bu o ddiddordeb imi weld bod nifer o ysgolion, yn enwedig y rhai lle y mae disgyblion sydd â nam ar eu clyw, wedi dymuno cynnig cymwysterau ar gyfer y disgyblion hynny, ac yr oeddwn yn falch o gytuno ar y dystysgrif yn iaith arwyddion Prydain lefel 1, lefel 2 a lefel 2, cam 2 i'w defnyddio gan ddysgwyr o dan 16 oed. Mae'r cyfle hwn ar gael i ysgolion, ac mae'n arwain at gymwysterau i ddisgyblion yng nghyfnod allweddol 4. Yr ydym wedi sicrhau bod arian ychwanegol wedi'i ddarparu hefyd—rhesom grant unigol o £500,000 i awdurdodau addysg lleol eleni—i'w helpu i brynu offer ac adnoddau arbenigol. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod dadansoddwyr cymhorthion clywed ar gael i'r holl wasanaethau cymorth ar gyfer nam ar y clyw ledled Cymru, gan y

Disparity of provision has affected services across Wales, and not just in the hearing impairment sector. There are many examples of good practice, and we want to raise the standards of the practice of all to the standards of the best.

**Y Llywydd:** Dim ond dau funud sydd gennym ar ôl i drafod y datganiad hwn. Felly, hoffwn gael cwestiynau ac atebion byr.

**Owen John Thomas:** Gofynnaf i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad gyhoeddi amserlen ar gyfer gweithredu argymhellion adroddiad Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg, 'Cydnabod Angen', er mwyn gwella gwasanaethau cyfrwng Cymraeg a dwyieithog ar gyfer plant a phobl ifanc sydd ag anghenion addysgol arbennig. Yr oeddech yn sôn y byddai'r grŵp llywio cenedlaethol, Prifysgol Cymru, Bangor a Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg yn cydweithio i hwyluso newid yn y maes hwn. Yn sgîl hynny, adroddwch y bydd gweithgor arall yn cyfarfod cyn bo hir—

**Y Llywydd:** Gofynnais am gwestiynau byr, er mor hapus yr wyf i glywed unrhyw gyhoeddusrwydd am Brifysgol Cymru, Bangor. Carwn glywed y cwestiwn, os gwelwch yn dda.

**Owen John Thomas:** Gan fod yr ateb i'r broblem yn amlwg, pam yr ydych yn parhau i oedi ac yn bwriadu sefydlu gweithgor arall yn hytrach na gweithredu'n uniongyrchol drwy greu mwy o gyfleoedd i bobl ddilyn cyrsiau ar anghenion addysgol arbennig a therapi lleferydd a fyddai'n eu galluogi i weithio drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg?

**Jane Davidson:** It is almost extraordinary that you should use the words 'further delay', when we have recommendations that are being acted upon in the budget period between 2005 and 2008, a period which has not yet started. On the point about taking forward the commendable 'Acknowledging Need' report, at the time of its publication, we did not have the full range of audit reports on the other areas that required additional specialist support. We have now undertaken all the work, and a task and finish group has

bu'r ddarpariaeth yn anghyson. Mae diffyg cysondeb yn y ddarpariaeth wedi effeithio ar wasanaethau ledled Cymru, ac nid yn y sector nam ar y clyw'n unig. Mae sawl enghraifft o arferion da, ac yr ydym am godi safonau ymarfer pawb fel eu bod gyda'r gorau.

**The Presiding Officer:** There are only two minutes left in which to discuss this statement. Therefore, brief questions and answers would be appreciated.

**Owen John Thomas:** I call on the Assembly Government to publish a timetable for implementing the recommendations contained in the Welsh Language Board's report, 'Acknowledging Need', to improve Welsh-medium and bilingual services for children and young people with special educational needs. You mentioned that the national steering group, the University of Wales, Bangor and the Welsh Language Board would work together to facilitate change in this area. As a consequence, you report that another working group is to meet soon—

**The Presiding Officer:** I asked for brief questions, although I am always happy to hear the work of the University of Wales, Bangor promoted. I would like to hear your question please.

**Owen John Thomas:** Given that the solution to the problem is obvious, why has there been further delay and why do you intend to establish another working group, rather than take direct action by creating more opportunities for people to study courses on special educational needs and speech therapy that would enable them to work through the medium of Welsh?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'n eithaf rhyfedd eich bod yn defnyddio'r geiriau 'parhau i oedi', gan y cymerir camau ynghylch argymhellion yn y cyfnod cyllideb rhwng 2005 a 2008, sy'n gyfnod nad yw wedi dechrau eto. Ynghylch y pwynt am hyrwyddo'r adroddiad cymeradwy 'Cydnabod Angen', ar adeg ei gyhoeddi, nid oedd gennym adroddiadau archwilio ar yr holl feysydd eraill a oedd yn gofyn cymorth arbenigol ychwanegol. Yr ydym wedi cyflawni'r holl waith bellach, a sefydlwyd grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen i



been established to develop an action plan and implement the recommendations of the 'Acknowledging Need' report. It was a good report, and we want to take it forward. I would point out—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Thank you, Minister. The time is up for the statement, but I will take two quick questions.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Do you agree that parents should have greater access to information and informed support, such as the one-stop shop that you mention in paragraph 4.20?

**Jane Davidson:** We are keen to work with local authorities on the delivery of this support. On a national basis, the post of a national liaison officer to support the Welsh language is currently being advertised, which was a key recommendation of the 'Working Together' report.

**Mark Isherwood:** What assurance can the Minister provide that her acceptance of recommendation 4.15 will address the need identified during the committee's visit to north Wales for national standards of SEN provision delivered on a regional basis?

**Jane Davidson:** We took specific powers under the Education Act 2002, and we were the only part of the United Kingdom to look at regional collaboration. I am pleased that the Welsh Local Government Association will focus on this in its work this year, and we have already made extra investment, for example, in Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn in north Wales, to demonstrate that commitment.

**Irene James:** You said in your statement that understanding and early identification of special educational needs are not included in the review of initial teacher training. I therefore ask for your assurance that the committee's recommendations, and the evidence and emphasis placed on the importance of early intervention throughout this review, will be met with the appropriate level of Government action, to ensure that we go on improving special needs education.

ddatblygu cynllun gweithredu a rhoi ar waith argymhellion yr adroddiad 'Cydnabod Angen'. Yr oedd yn adroddiad da, ac yr ydym am ei hyrwyddo. Carwn nodi—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Diolch i chi, Weinidog. Mae'r amser ar gyfer y datganiad wedi dod i ben, ond cymeraf ddau gwestiwn byr.

**Denise Idris Jones:** A ydych yn cytuno y dylai mwy o wybodaeth a chymorth goleuedig fod ar gael i rieni, fel y siop un stop y cyfeiriwch ati ym mharagraff 4.20?

**Jane Davidson:** Yr ydym yn awyddus i weithio gydag awdurdodau lleol i gynnig y cymorth hwn. Ar lefel genedlaethol, mae swydd swyddog cyswllt cenedlaethol i hybu'r Gymraeg yn cael ei hysbysebu ar hyn o bryd, ac yr oedd hynny'n un o brif argymhellion yr adroddiad 'Gweithio Gyda'n Gilydd'.

**Mark Isherwood:** Pa sicrwydd y gall y Gweinidog ei gynnig y bydd y ffaith ei bod wedi derbyn argymhelliad 4.15 yn fodd i ddiwallu'r angen a nodwyd yn ystod ymweliad y pwyllgor â'r Gogledd am safonau cenedlaethol ar gyfer darpariaeth anghenion addysgol arbennig a gynigir yn rhanbarthol?

**Jane Davidson:** Cymerasom bwerau penodol o dan Ddeddf Addysg 2002, a ni oedd yr unig ran o'r Deyrnas Unedig a ystyriodd gydweithio rhanbarthol. Yr wyf yn falch y bydd Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru yn canolbwyntio ar hyn yn ei gwaith eleni, ac yr ydym eisoes wedi buddsoddi rhagor, er enghraifft, yn Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn yn y Gogledd, i ddangos yr ymrwymiad hwnnw.

**Irene James:** Dywedasoeh yn eich datganiad nad yw deall anghenion addysgol arbennig a'u canfod yn gynnar wedi'u cynnwys yn yr adolygiad o hyfforddiant cychwynnol athrawon. Gan hynny, gofynnaf am sicrwydd gennych y bydd y Llywodraeth yn cymryd camau priodol ar argymhellion y pwyllgor, a'r dystiolaeth a'r pwys a roddir ar ymyrryd yn gynnar drwy'r adolygiad hwn, i sicrhau y parhawn i wella addysg anghenion arbennig.

**Jane Davidson:** That is absolutely right. We have done all our research work so that we can get early identification and intervention right.

**Alun Cairns:** There are many warm words in your statement, which Members will recognise and will be grateful for. However, it is lacking in specifics, particularly in relation to the numbers of speech, language and occupational therapists. Will you write to me, and make the information available to all Members, regarding your specific plans to grow their numbers in order to overcome the difficulties in schools?

**Jane Davidson:** I am happy to do that. This is part of NHS workforce planning, and we have addressed this over the last three years.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Will you ask the Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales to keep the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee informed of its further review on the assessment material that it is preparing for monitoring the progress and performance of a child with special educational needs?

**Jane Davidson:** It is crucial that we get the right kind of process in terms of methods of measuring the performance of children and young people with additional educational needs. I have put this into ACCAC's remit for 2005-06.

**Jane Davidson:** Mae hynny'n hollol gywir. Yr ydym wedi gwneud ein holl waith ymchwil fel y gallwn gymryd y camau cywir ynghylch canfod yr anghenion ac ymyrryd yn gynnar.

**Alun Cairns:** Mae llawer o eiriau cysurus yn eich datganiad, y bydd Aelodau'n eu hadnabod ac yn diolch amdanynt. Fodd bynnag, mae diffyg manylion ynddo, yn enwedig o ran nifer y therapyddion iaith, lleferydd a galwedigaethol. A wnewch ysgrifennu ataf, a darparu'r wybodaeth i'r holl Aelodau, ynghylch y cynlluniau penodol sydd gennych i gynyddu eu nifer er mwyn goresgyn yr anawsterau mewn ysgolion?

**Jane Davidson:** Yr wyf yn fodlon gwneud hynny. Mae hyn yn rhan o'r cynllunio ar gyfer gweithlu'r GIG, ac yr ydym wedi ymdrin â hyn dros y tair blynedd diwethaf.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** A wnewch ofyn i Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru roi gwybod i'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes am ei adolygiad pellach o'r deunydd asesu y mae'n ei baratoi i fonitro cynnydd a pherfformiad plant sydd ag anghenion addysgol arbennig?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'n hollbwysig inni sicrhau'r broses briodol o ran dulliau o fesur perfformiad plant a phobl ifanc sydd ag anghenion addysgol ychwanegol. Yr wyf wedi cynnwys hyn yng nghylch gwaith ACCAC ar gyfer 2005-06.

### **Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order**

**Jenny Randerson:** I raise a point of order under Standing Order No. 6.3, in relation to my earlier question to the First Minister. He was probably disappointed that I did not ask a question on Cardiff's council tax increase, because he clearly had a written answer ready. I instead asked a general question on council tax levels. I ask you to confirm, Presiding Officer that, as a constituency Assembly Member—and I use that term to apply to all Assembly Members, who are of equal validity—I have the right to refer to my constituency as an example in questions, and

**Jenny Randerson:** Codaf bwynt o drefn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.3, mewn cysylltiad â'm cwestiwn yn gynharach i'r Prif Weinidog. Mae'n debyg ei fod yn siomedig nad oeddwn wedi gofyn cwestiwn am y cynnydd yn y dreth gyngor yng Nghaerdydd, gan ei bod yn amlwg bod ganddo ateb ysgrifenedig wrth law. Yn hytrach na hynny, gofynnais gwestiwn cyffredinol am lefelau'r dreth gyngor. Gofynnaf ichi gadarnhau, Lywydd, fod gennyf hawl, fel Aelod Cynulliad dros etholaeth—a defnyddiaf y term hwnnw i gyfeirio at holl Aelodau'r

that all Members have the right to raise constituency issues in their questions. I raise this point because the First Minister said that he felt that it was a strange tactic that I should ask such a question.

Cynulliad, sydd cyn ddilysed â'i gilydd—i gyfeirio at fy etholaeth fel enghraifft mewn cwestiynau, a bod gan bob Aelod yr hawl i godi materion sy'n ymwneud â'u hetholaeth yn eu cwestiynau. Codaf y pwynt hwn gan fod y Prif Weinidog wedi dweud ei fod yn teimlo mai tacteg ryfedd ydoedd imi ofyn cwestiwn o'r fath.

**The Presiding Officer:** Members are responsible for the content of their questions. The original form of the Assembly question is placed in the Table Office, and will therefore be in order. For an answer to a further supplementary question to be in order, it must relate to the previous question, and, if it were not so, I assure you that we on this presiding bench would have taken some action. The same applies to the First Minister. Ministers, including the First Minister, are answerable for the content of their answers. Again, provided that those answers are in order, they will be allowed. Members may at any time make reference to their constituencies, or to any region, or to any other part of Wales, if it is relevant.

**Y Llywydd:** Aelodau sy'n gyfrifol am gynnwys eu cwestiynau. Caiff ffurf wreiddiol y cwestiwn Cynulliad ei gosod yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno, ac felly bydd mewn trefn. Os yw ateb i gwestiwn atodol pellach i fod mewn trefn, rhaid iddo ymwneud â'r cwestiwn blaenorol, a, pe na fuasai felly, yr wyf yn eich sicrhau y byddem ni ar y fainc lywyddu hon wedi cymryd camau o ryw fath. Mae'r un peth yn berthnasol i'r Prif Weinidog. Mae'r Gweinidogion, gan gynnwys y Prif Weinidog, yn atebol dros gynnwys eu hatebion. Unwaith eto, ar yr amod bod yr atebion hynny mewn trefn, fe'u caniateir. Caiff Aelodau gyfeirio at eu hetholaeth, neu at unrhyw ranbarth, neu at unrhyw ran arall o Gymru, os yw'n berthnasol.

### **Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion Composite Motion: Approval of Orders**

**Y Llywydd:** O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

**The Presiding Officer:** Under Standing Order No. 24.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiaf fod

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25:*

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 24.25:*

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 25 Ionawr 2005 ar y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Deunyddiau ac Eitemau Plastig mewn Cysylltiad â Bwyd (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2005, a

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office, and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 25 January 2005, on the draft regulations, the Plastic Materials and Articles in Contact with Food (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2005, and

2. yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Deunyddiau ac Eitemau Plastig mewn Cysylltiad â Bwyd (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â:

2. approves the Plastic Materials and Articles in Contact with Food (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2005 is made in accordance with:

i) y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y

i) the draft regulations laid in the Table

*Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 12 Ionawr 2005,*

*Office on 12 January 2005,*

*ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 12 Ionawr 2005, a*

*ii) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 12 January 2005, and*

*iii) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 25 Ionawr 2005. (NDM2268)*

*iii) the memorandum of correction laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 25 January 2005. (NDM2268)*

*Cynnig (NDM2268): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2268): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

3.40 p.m.

**Cymeradwyo o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.27 (iv) Reoliadau'r Dreth Gyngor  
(Newid Rhestrau ac Apelau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2005  
Approval under Standing Order No. 24.27 (iv) of the Council Tax (Alteration of  
Lists and Appeals) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2005**

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Council Tax (Alteration of Lists and Appeals) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2005, a copy of which was laid in Table Office and emailed to Assembly Members on 25 January 2005. (NDM2269)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales approves that the Council Tax (Alteration of Lists and Appeals) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2005 is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 25 January 2005. (NDM2270)*

Section 24 of the Local Government (Finance) Act 1992 permits the National Assembly for Wales to make regulations on the alteration by listing officers of valuation lists. These amending regulations are required to provide billing authorities or any interested persons, such as council tax payers, with a right to make proposals to alter and appeal against the valuation of their property in the new lists that will come into force on 1 April 2005. Without any amendment to the Council Tax (Alteration of Lists and Appeals) Regulations 1993, there will be no such right to make proposals of repeal. The proposed amendments will introduce a deadline of 31 December 2005 for proposals to alter the 1993 valuation list, allow proposals to alter the 2000 valuation list to be made as of 1 April 2005, and create a new deadline of 30 September 2006 for proposals in respect of the 2005 list where a proposer

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau'r Dreth Gyngor (Newid Rhestrau ac Apelau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2005, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 25 Ionawr 2005. (NDM2269)*

Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau'r Dreth Gyngor (Newid Rhestrau ac Apelau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 25 Ionawr 2005. (NDM2270)*

Mae adran 24 Deddf Llywodraeth Leol (Cyllid) 1992 yn caniatáu i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru wneud rheoliadau ar newid rhestrau prisio gan swyddogion rhestru. Mae angen y rheoliadau diwygio hyn er mwyn rhoi hawl i awdurdodau bilio neu unrhyw rai cysylltiedig, fel talwyr y dreth gyngor, gael cynnig newid neu apelio yn erbyn y prisiad o'u heiddo yn y rhestrau newydd a ddaw i rym ar 1 Ebrill 2005. Os na newidir Rheoliadau'r Dreth Gyngor (Newid Rhestrau ac Apelau) 1993, ni fydd unrhyw hawl o'r fath i gynnig diddymu. Bydd y newidiadau a gynigir yn cyflwyno terfyn amser ar 31 Rhagfyr 2005 ar gyfer cynigion i newid rhestr brisio 1993, yn caniatáu gwneud cynigion i newid rhestr brisio 2000 o 1 Ebrill 2005 ymlaen, ac yn creu terfyn amser newydd ar 30 Medi 2006 ar gyfer cynigion sy'n gysylltiedig â rhestr 2005 os yw cynigydd o'r farn bod y swyddog rhestru

considers that the listing officer has made an error in the valuation list as at compilation and in terms of the valuation list that came into force on 1 April 1993. It is essential that this legislation is introduced to allow sufficient time for councils, the Valuation Office Agency and the valuation tribunals to include the new dates on their literature explaining their proposals and the appeal process.

**David Lloyd:** Mae hwn yn fater technegol sydd, ym marn Plaid Cymru, yn rhan o gyfundrefn annheg y dreth gyngor ac ailfandio. Fel y gwyddoch, yr ydym fel plaid yn gwrthwynebu'r dreth gyngor gan y credwn yn gryf y dylai treth fod yn seiliedig ar y gallu i dalu. Fodd bynnag, dadl ar gyfer diwrnod arall yw honno. Mae'r hyn sydd ger ein bron yn fater technegol ynghylch sut i ddelio ag ailfandio, ac, oherwydd ei natur cul a thechnegol, ni fyddwn yn ei wrthwynebu.

**Brynle Williams:** I do not like to say this, but the motion is quite devious. Let us go back to basics. One of our problems in north Wales, which came to my attention only yesterday, is that, in Ruthin, we have to dispose of treated sewage. Now, you ask, 'What has this got to do with the council tax?'. It has an awful lot to do with the council tax. The treated sewage is carried out by agricultural machines, but HM Customs and Excise has decided, in its infinite wisdom, that these tractors must run on white diesel. There is a 63p difference in the cost of fuel.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. It would be helpful if you were to indicate how your contribution is relevant to the regulations before us.

**Brynle Williams:** It is relevant to the collection of council tax.

Dywedais yr hyn oedd gennyf i'w ddweud, diolch.

**Kirsty Williams:** I hope that what I have to say concerns the appeals mechanism being proposed.

wedi gwneud camgymeriad yn y rhestr brisio wrth ei llunio ac yng nghyd-destun y rhestr brisio a ddaeth i rym ar 1 Ebrill 1993. Mae'n hollbwysig y cyflwynir y ddeddfwriaeth hon er mwyn rhoi digon o amser i gynghorau, i Asiantaeth y Swyddfa Brisio ac i'r tribiwnlysoedd prisio gael cynnwys y dyddiadau newydd mewn deunydd darllen o'u heiddo sy'n egluro eu cynigion a'r broses apelio.

**David Lloyd:** This is a technical instrument that forms part of what Plaid Cymru considers to be the inequitable rebanding and council tax system. As everyone knows, we as a party are opposed to the council tax as we are firmly of the opinion that taxation should be based on ability to pay. However, that is a debate for another day. What is before us is a technical instrument on how rebanding should be dealt with, and, given its strictly technical nature, we will not oppose it.

**Brynle Williams:** Mae'n chwith gennyf ddweud hyn, ond mae'r cynnig hwn yn un eithaf dichellgar. Gadewch inni fynd yn ôl at wraidd y mater. Un o'r problemau sydd gennym yn y Gogledd, a ddaeth i'm sylw ddoe ddiwethaf, yw ein bod, yn Rhuthun, yn gorfod gwaredu carthion a driniwyd. Yn awr, gofynnwch, 'Beth sydd a wnelo hyn â'r dreth gyngor?'. Mae'n berthnasol iawn i'r dreth gyngor. Cludir y carthion a driniwyd oddi yno mewn peiriannau amaethyddol, ond mae Tollau Tramor a Chartref EM wedi penderfynu, yn ei fawr ddoethineb, fod rhaid i'r tractorau hyn redeg ar ddiesel gwyn. Mae 63c o wahaniaeth yng nghost tanwydd.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Byddai o gymorth os dywedech ym mha fodd y mae'ch cyfraniad yn berthnasol i'r rheoliadau sydd ger ein bron.

**Brynle Williams:** Mae'n berthnasol i gasglu'r dreth gyngor.

I have said what I wanted to say, thank you.

**Kirsty Williams:** Gobeithiaf fod yr hyn sydd gennyf i'w ddweud yn berthnasol i'r dull apelio a gynigir.

I hold a letter from the Valuation Office Agency to a constituent of mine who has been told that his listing will jump from band A to D. That is surprising when you consider that this constituent lives in a mobile home. As you can imagine, this has come as a great shock to him. He has been informed that he cannot appeal against the decision until April of this year when, of course, he will be liable to pay his council tax. My concern, Minister, is that, while these appeals are ongoing, people will still be liable to pay the council tax according to the band in which their properties have been placed.

**Alun Cairns:** Do you not recognise that many of the people who will suffer from this rebanding policy will be pensioners who may be intimidated when red letters come through letterboxes?

**Kirsty Williams:** Absolutely. It is our concern for pensioners and our desire to protect them that has led the Welsh Liberal Democrats to call for the scrapping of rebanding and, indeed, of council tax altogether. My concern is that this gentleman, and many more like him, will be liable to pay council tax at the level at which he was assessed in the rebanding exercise. Given the widespread concern about rebanding, I suspect that valuation officers will be inundated with appeals. Therefore, what capacity is there to handle these appeals when they come through? If my constituents' intentions are anything to go by, most of those who were rebanded intend to appeal against the decision. What can be done to ensure a timely response to appeals? Will the Minister rethink the possibility of hearing appeals now, rather than telling people that they cannot appeal until 1 April? The floodgates that will open then will cause huge problems, not only for constituents but also for the valuation and listing officers who must consider these decisions.

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** I will do my best to respond to that range of varied points. Dai spent a long time telling us that these were technical changes. I think that he mentioned that three times and, at the end, had no objections. Thank you for your

Yn fy llaw, mae gennyf lythyr oddi wrth Asiantaeth y Swyddfa Brisió at un o'm hetholwyr y dywedwyd wrtho y bydd ei restriad yn codi o fand A i D. Mae hynny'n peri syndod o ystyried bod yr etholwr hwn yn byw mewn cartref symudol. Fel y gallwch ddychmygu, mae hyn wedi achosi cryn ysgytwad iddo. Fe'i hysbyswyd na chaiff apelio yn erbyn y penderfyniad tan fis Ebrill eleni, pan fydd yn atebol i dalu ei dreth gyngor, wrth gwrs. Yr hyn sy'n peri pryder i mi, Weinidog, yw, tra bo'r apelau hyn yn mynd ymlaen, y bydd pobl yn dal yn atebol i dalu'r dreth gyngor yn ôl y band y rhoddyd eu heiddo ynddo.

**Alun Cairns:** A ydych yn cydnabod mai pensïynwyr yw llawer o'r rhai a wnaiff ddiodef oherwydd y polisi ailfandio hwn ac y gallent gael eu dychryn pan ddaw llythyrau rhybudd drwy'r twll llythyrau?

**Kirsty Williams:** Yn hollol. Ein pryder dros bensïynwyr a'n hawydd i'w hamddiffyn sydd wedi arwain Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru i alw am roi'r gorau i'r ailfandio ac, yn wir, am gael gwared â'r dreth gyngor yn gyfan gwbl. Yr hyn sy'n peri pryder i mi yw y bydd y gŵr bonheddig hwn, a llawer un tebyg iddo, yn atebol i dalu'r dreth gyngor ar y lefel a bennwyd ar ei gyfer yn yr ymarferiad ailfandio. Yng ngolwg y pryder cyffredinol ynghylch ailfandio, yr wyf yn amau y bydd swyddogion prisio'n cael eu boddi gan apelau. Felly, pa gapasiti a geir i drafod yr apelau hynny pan ddeuant drwodd? Os gellir barnu yn ôl bwriad fy etholwyr, mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r rhai a gafodd eu hailfandio'n bwriadu apelio yn erbyn y penderfyniad. Beth y gellir ei wneud i sicrhau ymateb amserol i apelau? A wnaiff y Gweinidog ailystyried y posibilrwydd o wrando apelau'n awr, yn hytrach na dweud wrth bobl na chânt apelio tan 1 Ebrill? Bydd y llif a geir bryd hynny'n peri problemau aruthrol, nid yn unig i etholwyr ond hefyd i swyddogion prisio a rhestru sy'n gorfod ystyried y penderfyniadau hyn.

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Gwnaf fy ngorau i ymateb i'r gwahanol bwyntiau. Treuliodd Dai lawer o amser yn dweud wrthym mai newidiadau technegol oedd y rhain. Credaf ei fod wedi sôn am hynny dair gwaith ac, yn y diwedd, nid oedd ganddo

brevity, and for saying that you had no objections, Dai.

I do not know whether Brynle's comments were devious or dubious or both, but I could not see any connection between them and the matter in hand, and I think that the Llywydd endorsed that view.

On Kirsty's points and the issue of appeals, no-one can make a formal appeal until 1 April, as that is when the formal lists come through. However, since the draft lists were published on 1 September, we have been encouraging everyone who thinks that they have an issue to raise it so that it can be considered. That has been successful, and many people's queries have been resolved.

**Alun Cairns:** Will you give way?

**Sue Essex:** I will just deal with this point, Alun. If an issue has not been resolved, and I assume that that process is ongoing, an appeal can be lodged on 1 April. The agency will prioritise appeals according to need. If this appeal is urgent, as Kirsty indicated, I would be prepared to forward the correspondence to the Valuation Office Agency.

There has been much effort to ensure that other resources from beyond Wales's borders can be used to support the Valuation Office Agency, and I have held detailed discussions to ensure that tribunals will be up and running by then. I have great confidence in that system. Therefore, that is the process. If your constituent wins his or her case, payment can be reclaimed.

Finally, I thought that Alun Cairns's intervention was unbelievable, considering that Glyn Davies has stood up and supported the rebanding process.

**Alun Cairns** *rose—*

**Sue Essex:** Before you start jumping up, Alun, you would do well to remember that it was your Government that introduced council tax legislation, your Government that left us in this mess by failing to include proper

unrhyw wrthwynebiad. Diolch i chi am fod mor gryno, ac am ddweud nad oedd gennyh unrhyw wrthwynebiad, Dai.

Ni wn a oedd sylwadau Brynle yn ddichellgar neu'n amheus, neu'r ddau, ond ni allwn weld unrhyw gysylltiad rhyngddynt a'r mater dan sylw, a chredaf fod y Llywydd wedi ategu'r farn honno.

Ynghylch y pwyntiau a wnaeth Kirsty a mater yr apelau, ni all neb gyflwyno apêl ffurfiol tan 1 Ebrill, gan mai'r pryd hwnnw y daw'r rhestrau ffurfiol drwodd. Er hynny, gan fod y rhestrau drafft wedi'u cyhoeddi ar 1 Medi, buom yn annog pawb sydd o'r farn bod ganddynt fater i'w godi i wneud hynny fel y gellir ei ystyried. Bu hynny'n llwyddiannus, ac atebwyd llawer o'r ymholiadau a gafwyd gan bobl.

**Alun Cairns:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Sue Essex:** Ni wnaf ond ymdrin â'r pwynt hwn, Alun. Os oes rhyw fater nad yw wedi'i ddatrys, a chymeraf fod y broses honno'n mynd rhagddi, gellir cyflwyno apêl ar 1 Ebrill. Bydd yr asiantaeth yn blaenoriaethu apelau yn ôl yr angen. Os yw'r apêl hon yn un frys, fel y nododd Kirsty, byddwn yn barod i anfon yr ohebiaeth ymlaen i Asiantaeth y Swyddfa Brisio.

Gwnaed llawer o ymdrech i sicrhau y gellir defnyddio adnoddau eraill y tu allan i Gymru i gynorthwyo Asiantaeth y Swyddfa Brisio, ac yr wyf wedi cynnal trafodaethau manwl i sicrhau y bydd tribiwnlysoedd yn weithredol erbyn hynny. Mae gennyf bob ffydd yn y system honno. Felly, dyna'r broses. Os bydd yr etholwr hwnnw'n ennill ei achos, gellir hawlio'r tâl yn ôl.

Yn olaf, credais fod ymyriad Alun Cairns yn anhygoel, yng ngolwg y ffaith bod Glyn Davies wedi codi ar ei draed ac wedi cefnogi'r broses ailfandio.

**Alun Cairns** *a gododd—*

**Sue Essex:** Cyn ichi neidio ar eich traed, Alun, byddai'n beth da ichi gofio mai'ch Llywodraeth chi a gyflwynodd ddeddfwriaeth y dreth gyngor, mai'ch Llywodraeth chi a adawodd y llanastr hwn i ni drwy fethu â



rebanding arrangements, and your party that endorsed this in committee, along with Plaid Cymru and the Liberal Democrats. You would be well advised to sit down, put your head down and take what is coming to you.

chynnwys trefniadau ailfandio priodol, a bod eich plaid chi wedi cymeradwyo hyn yn y pwyllgor yn yr un modd â Phlaid Cymru a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Byddai'n ddoeth ichi eistedd, plygu'ch pen a derbyn y feirniadaeth.

*Cynnig (NDM2269): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2269): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2270): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2270): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.49 p.m.*

*The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.49 p.m.*

**Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru)  
Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru)**

**Newid yn yr Hinsawdd  
Climate Change**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies and amendments 2 and 3 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies a gwelliannau 2 a 3 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

**Janet Davies:** I propose that

**Janet Davies:** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*recognises that climate change already has serious consequences for communities across Wales and globally and calls on the Labour Assembly Government to accelerate those aspects of its policy which can lead to a reduction in carbon emissions. (NDM2271)*

*yn cydnabod bod newid yn yr hinsawdd eisoes yn cael effaith ddifrifol ar gymunedau ledled Cymru a thros y byd ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad i fwrw ymlaen yn gyflymach â'r agweddau hynny ar ei bolisi a all arwain at leihau gollyngiadau carbon. (NDM2271)*

I propose amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. After 'National Assembly for Wales', insert as a new point 1:

Cynigiau welliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ar ôl 'Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru', rhoi pwynt 1 newydd:

*regrets the failure of New Labour Governments to act effectively in meeting internationally agreed targets for the reduction of carbon emissions.*

*yn gresynu at fethiant Llywodraethau Llafur Newydd i weithredu'n effeithiol wrth fodloni targedau y cytunwyd arnynt yn rhyngwladol ar gyfer lleihau gollyngiadau carbon.*

Is climate change real? Probably all Members in this Chamber have received hosts of e-mails disputing that it is anything more than a cycle of nature, yet the vast majority of scientists, many quite sceptical until recently, are now convinced that a worrying rise in temperature above any from natural causes is happening. It is extremely unlikely that the number of people and Governments convinced by them are all wrong. The intergovernmental panel on climate change was set up in the late 1980s by Ronald Reagan—hardly a leading left-wing or green politician—and is now supported by many Governments.

A oes newid yn yr hinsawdd mewn gwirionedd? Mae'n debyg bod yr holl Aelodau yn y Siambr hon wedi cael toreth o negeseuon drwy'r e-bost yn dadlau nad yw hyn yn fawr mwy nag effaith cylch natur, ac eto mae'r mwyafrif llethol o wyddonwyr, yr oedd llawer ohonynt yn eithaf amheugar hyd yn ddiweddar, wedi'u hargyhoeddi bellach bod y tymheredd yn codi'n fwy nag a ddigwyddai oherwydd achosion naturiol, a bod hynny'n peri pryder. Mae'n dra annhebygol bod nifer y bobl a'r Llywodraethau a ddarbwyllwyd ganddynt i gyd yn anghywir. Sefydlwyd y panel rhynglywodraethol ar newid yn yr hinsawdd ddiwedd y 1980au gan Ronald Reagan—a oedd ymhell o fod yn wleidydd adain chwith neu wyrdd blaenllaw—ac fe'i cefnogir yn awr gan lawer o Lywodraethau.

'The Climate Change Challenge' published

Mae 'The Climate Change Challenge' a

by the Carbon Trust in March last year, and 'Meeting the Climate Challenge', published by the international climate change taskforce last month, have to ring alarm bells. Both state that while understanding is still incomplete, there is enough evidence to show fundamental change in the pattern of surface warming and stratosphere cooling over recent decades. However, while the Carbon Trust talked about reaching a crucial point in 20 to 30 years' time, the more recent report, with more recent evidence, talks about reaching a point of no return in 10 years' time.

Greenhouse gases are raising global temperatures. Some climate change is bound to happen and we are already seeing adverse impacts in low-lying islands and in the Arctic and Antarctic. We must avert a sudden sharp increase in temperature, which would result in agricultural losses, water shortages for many people and bad impacts on health. There is a consensus that we have to prevent an increase of 2 degrees centigrade or more in the global temperature above that at the beginning of the industrial revolution. At this point, according to 'Meeting the Climate Challenge', the possible risks increase: loss of the West Antarctic and Greenland ice sheets could eventually raise sea levels by 10m, thermohaline ocean currents, including the gulf stream, could shutdown, and the planet's forests and soils could be transformed from net carbon sinks to net carbon sources.

Were that to happen, it would be unstoppable. We must also remember that in the developed world, we have been living off the backs of less-developed countries environmentally, as well as in other ways. There are ways to minimise these effects. To do so while maintaining and developing good lifestyles will cost money. Governments of all complexions must show leadership and determination while being committed to real democracy and freedom.

Therefore, what can the National Assembly do, and what should we expect from the Assembly Government? It should act responsibly as part of the global village,

gyhoeddwyd gan yr Ymddiriedolaeth Garbon ym mis Mawrth y llynedd, a 'Meeting the Climate Challenge', a gyhoeddwyd gan y tasglu rhyngwladol ar newid yn yr hinsawdd, yn sicr o seinio rhybudd. Dywed y ddau, er na ddeallir pob dim eto, fod digon o dystiolaeth i ddangos newid sylfaenol ym mhattrwm y cynhesu ar wyneb y Ddaear a'r oeri yn y stratosffer dros y degawdau diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, tra oedd yr Ymddiriedolaeth Garbon yn sôn am gyrraedd pwynt critigol ymhen 20 i 30 mlynedd, mae'r adroddiad diweddarach, sydd â thystiolaeth ddiweddarach, yn sôn am gyrraedd bwynt di-droi'n-ôl ymhen 10 mlynedd.

Mae nwyon tŷ gwydr yn peri cynnydd yn nhymereddau'r byd. Mae'n anorod y ceir rhywfaint o newid yn yr hinsawdd ac yr ydym eisoes yn gweld drwg effeithiau mewn ynysoedd isel ac yn yr Arctig a'r Antarcig. Rhaid inni osgoi cynnydd sydyn mewn tymheredd, a arweiniai at golledion amaethyddol, prinder dŵr i lawer o bobl a drwg effeithiau ar iechyd. Ceir consensws bod rhaid inni atal cynnydd o 2 radd ganradd neu fwy yn nhymeredd y byd uwchlaw'r hyn a geid ar ddechrau'r chwyldro diwydiannol. Ar y pwynt hwnnw, yn ôl 'Meeting the Climate Challenge', ceir mwy o risgiau posibl: os collid haenau rhew Gorllewin yr Antarcig a'r Ynys Las, gallai lefelau'r môr godi 10 metr yn y pen draw, gallai cerhyntau cefnforol thermohalinaidd ddod i ben, gan gynnwys llif y gwllff, a gallai coedwigoedd a phriddoedd y blaned gael eu troi o fod yn llyncdyllau carbon net i fod yn ffynonellau carbon net.

Pe digwyddai hynny, ni fyddai atal arno. Rhaid inni gofio hefyd ein bod ni yn y byd datblygedig wedi bod yn byw ar draul gwledydd llai datblygedig o ran yr amgylchedd, yn ogystal â phethau eraill. Mae moddau i leihau'r effeithiau hyn. Bydd gwneud hynny, gan gadw a datblygu ffyrdd o fyw da, yn costio arian. Rhaid i lywodraethau o bob lliw ddangos arweiniad a phenderfyniad gan ymrwymo i wir ddemocratiaeth a rhyddid.

Felly, pa beth y gall y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ei wneud, a pha beth y dylem ei ddisgwyl gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad? Dylai weithredu'n gyfrifol fel rhan o'r pentref byd-

putting pressure on the European Union and the UK Government to take needed action. Our own house needs to be in order first, so that we can play our part in world action and be taken seriously when we lobby others. The National Assembly has a statutory responsibility for sustainable development, but no distinct policy on climate change. Government actions do not match Government rhetoric.

Where is a distinct plan to tackle the issue of carbon emissions on our doorstep? Although greenhouse gas emissions fell by 8.6 per cent between 1990 and 2002, much of this is driven by the temporary closure of a blast furnace at the Margam steelworks, which is an unfortunate closure. Other emissions have been more or less stable.

Last November, the Assembly Government announced plans to spend £8 billion on transport over 15 years. The main focus is on building new roads, which will fuel further traffic growth and feed climate change. Switching from private to public transport to reduce traffic should be the priority. Plaid Cymru wants significant investment in a modern and efficient public transport system. We have seen a little progress, but the Government has failed to understand the needs. Even the Assembly's own walking and cycling strategy has insufficient investment to ensure that it is achieved.

Plaid Cymru supports the Assembly Government's policy of ensuring that we produce at least 4 TWh of electricity every year from renewable sources by 2010. We welcome the Department of Trade and Industry's announcement yesterday on the progress made on generating electricity using tidal power. However, everything is happening too slowly, and, when that happens, it means that investment is going elsewhere. We must remember that community involvement is essential for success.

The UK as a whole is likely to achieve only half of the intended increase in renewable

eang, gan roi pwysau ar yr Undeb Ewropeaidd a Llywodraeth y DU i gymryd y camau angenrheidiol. Rhaid inni roi trefn ar ein pethau ein hunain yn gyntaf, fel y gallwn chwarae ein rhan yn y byd a chael ein cymryd o ddifrif pan ydym yn lobïo eraill. Mae cyfrifoldeb statudol gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol dros ddatblygu cynaliadwy, ond nid oes ganddo bolisi penodol ar newid yn yr hinsawdd. Nid yw gweithredoedd y Llywodraeth yn cyfateb i'w rhethreg.

Ymhle y ceir cynllun penodol i ymdrin â mater y gollyngiadau carbon ar garreg ein drws? Er bod gollyngiadau nwyon tŷ gwydr wedi gostwng 8.6 y cant rhwng 1990 a 2002, yr oedd hynny'n ganlyniad i raddau helaeth i'r ffaith anffodus bod ffwrnais chwyth yng ngwaith dur Margam wedi'i chau dros dro. Mae gollyngiadau eraill wedi aros yr un fath fwy neu lai.

Fis Tachwedd diwethaf, cyhoeddodd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ei bwriad i wario £8 biliwn ar drafndiaeth dros 15 mlynedd. Canolbwyntir yn bennaf ar adeiladu ffyrdd newydd, a fydd yn peri i draffig gynyddu ymhellach ac yn cyfrannu at y newid yn yr hinsawdd. Dylid rhoi blaenoriaeth i droi oddi wrth drafndiaeth breifat at drafndiaeth gyhoeddus er mwyn lleihau traffig. Mae Plaid Cymru am weld buddsoddi sylweddol mewn system drafndiaeth gyhoeddus fodern ac effeithlon. Gwelsom ychydig o gynnydd, ond mae'r Llywodraeth wedi methu â deall yr anghenion. Ni chafwyd digon o fuddsoddi yn strategaeth cerdded a seiclo'r Cynulliad ei hun i sicrhau y caiff ei chyflawni.

Mae Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi polisi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o sicrhau y cynhyrchwn o leiaf 4 awr terawatt o drydan bob blwyddyn o ffynonellau adnewyddadwy erbyn 2010. Croesawn gyhoeddiad yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant ddoe ar y cynnydd a wnaed ar gynhyrchu trydan gan ddefnyddio ynni'r llanw. Er hynny, mae popeth yn digwydd yn rhy araf, a dengys hynny fod y buddsoddi'n digwydd mewn pethau eraill. Rhaid inni gofio bod rhaid cynnwys y gymuned os yw hyn i lwyddo.

Nid yw'r DU gyfan ond yn debygol o sicrhau hanner y cynnydd arfaethedig mewn capasiti

energy capacity by 2010. Plaid Cymru proposes council tax rebates for those who install small renewable energy mechanisms, and calls on the Government to make the technology affordable and to train installers quickly. We do not believe that nuclear energy is environmentally or economically sustainable, although it is a non-carbon source. British Energy has received a bail-out of £610 million from the Treasury, and the taxpayer is expected to cover possible liabilities of £3 billion. There are also more costs associated with British Energy. We need instead diverse sources of electricity generation from renewable sources, with a core back-up using the cleanest coal technology available. Windfarms are only a part of the solution. They are effective in producing 10 per cent of the total electricity needed, but they obviously have their limitations.

I fear that the Assembly will spin on this issue while being completely laid back and apathetic about taking action. This issue must move up the Government's agenda and be taken seriously.

**Mick Bates:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 2: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*urges the Welsh Assembly Government to encourage small-scale solutions as an integral part of its strategy to reduce carbon emissions.*

I propose amendment 3. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to undertake a communications and information programme on reducing carbon emissions and combating climate change.*

I congratulate Plaid Cymru on its choice of topic, which is topical as Tony Blair has been talking about it. I heard him say that he wants to place climate change higher up the agenda. That is like me saying that I want to be slimmer of the year: there are great intentions, but the evidence shows that this is

ynni adnewyddadwy erbyn 2010. Mae Plaid Cymru yn cynnig y dylid rhoi gostyngiad yn y dreth gyngor i'r rhai sy'n gosod peirianweithiau ynni adnewyddadwy bach, ac yn galw ar y Llywodraeth i beri i'r dechnoleg fod yn fforddiadwy ac i hyfforddi gosodwyr rhag blaen. Ni chredwn fod ynni niwclear yn amgylcheddol nac yn economaidd gynaliadwy, er ei fod yn ffynhonnell ddi-garbon. Mae'r Trysorlys wedi rhoi £610 miliwn i British Energy i'w achub, a disgwylir i'r trethdalwr fod yn atebol am ymrwymadau posibl o £3 biliwn. Mae rhagor o gostau'n gysylltiedig â British Energy hefyd. Yn lle hynny, rhaid inni gael dulliau amrywiol i gynhyrchu trydan o ffynonellau adnewyddadwy, gyda darpariaeth graidd wrth gefn sy'n defnyddio'r dechnoleg llosgi glo lanaf sydd ar gael. Nid yw ffermydd gwynt ond yn un rhan o'r ateb. Maent yn effeithiol o ran cynhyrchu 10 y cant o'r holl drydan y mae ei angen, ond mae'n amlwg bod cyfyngiadau arnynt.

Ofnaf y bydd y Cynulliad yn gogr-droi ynghylch y pwnc hwn gan fod yn gwbl ddifater ynghylch cymryd camau. Rhaid rhoi lle amlycach i'r pwnc hwn ar agenda'r Llywodraeth a'i gymryd o ddifrif.

**Mick Bates:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn pwysu ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i annog atebion ar raddfa fach fel rhan annatod o'i strategaeth i leihau gollyngiadau carbon.*

Cynigiau welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ymgymryd â rhaglen gyfathrebu a gwybodaeth ar leihau gollyngiadau carbon a mynd i'r afael â newid yn yr hinsawdd.*

Llongyfarchaf Plaid Cymru ar ei dewis o bwnc, sy'n un amserol gan fod Tony Blair wedi bod yn sôn amdano. Fe'i clywais yn dweud ei fod am roi lle amlycach ar yr agenda i newid yn yr hinsawdd. Mae hynny yr un fath â phe dywedwn i fy mod am fod yn bencampwr ar golli pwysau: ceir bwriadau

not the case. Gordon James from Friends of the Earth Cymru summed up the situation precisely when he said that many of the Welsh Assembly Government's policies on climate change are little more than business as usual with a few green edges added. The report produced by the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside also shows that. Only two years ago, he showed that there had been an increase in the amount of carbon dioxide in the atmosphere. I and other Members have urged him many times to make Wales an environmental exemplar to the world, on the same level as upper Austria and Navarra, which I know some Ministers have visited.

We need to lead in the production of clean energy technologies and ensure that we have the best energy efficiency policies. What could be better than promoting clean energy and good energy efficiency policies to meet our sustainable development duties? I hope that the Minister who responds—two Ministers may respond—will give us a lead on that, because, thus far, there has been little action to suggest that they really believe in the principles of sustainable development.

In terms of the principle of climate change, there can be little doubt that the increase in the amount of carbon dioxide in the atmosphere following industrialisation is largely responsible for the climate change that we see today. We have all received the briefing paper from the Royal Society for the Protection of Birds, which highlights the changes that have taken place and the dangers that exist as a result of the increase in the amount of carbon dioxide in the atmosphere. There must be two main thrusts to combat the climate change that we are witnessing: we must use less energy and produce clean energy.

4.00 p.m.

Admirable efforts have been made by the Carbon Trust and the Energy Saving Trust to meet that goal, but more needs to be done. The Government's main planning policy on renewable energy, technical advice note 8, is

gwyb, ond mae'r dystiolaeth yn dangos nad felly y mae. Gwnaeth Gordon James o Gyfeillion y Ddaear Cymru grynhoi'r sefyllfa'n berffaith pan ddywedodd fod llawer o bolisiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar newid yn yr hinsawdd nad ydynt yn golygu fawr mwy na chario ymlaen fel arfer gydag ychydig o ychwanegion gwyrdd. Mae'r adroddiad a luniodd y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad yn dangos hynny hefyd. Brin ddwy flynedd yn ôl, dangosodd fod maint y carbon deuocsid yn yr atmosffer wedi cynyddu. Gwneuthum i ac Aelodau eraill bwysu arno lawer gwaith i beri i Gymru fod yn esiampl amgylcheddol i'r byd, ar yr un lefel ag Awstria uchaf a Navarra, y gwn fod rhai Gweinidogion wedi ymweld â hi.

Rhaid inni arwain ar gynhyrchu technolegau ynni glân a sicrhau y cawn y polisiau gorau ar effeithlonrwydd ynni. Pa beth gwell i gyflawni ein dyletswyddau ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy na hyrwyddo ynni glân a pholisiau da ar effeithlonrwydd ynni? Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog sy'n ymateb—gall dau Weinidog ymateb—yn rhoi arweiniad i ni ar hynny, oherwydd, hyd yma, ychydig o gamau a gafwyd sy'n awgrymu eu bod yn credu o ddifrif yn egwyddorion datblygu cynaliadwy.

Gyda golwg ar egwyddor newid yn yr hinsawdd, nid oes fawr o le i amau nad y cynnydd ym maint y carbon deuocsid yn yr atmosffer yn sgîl diwydiannu sy'n bennaf cyfrifol am y newid yn yr hinsawdd a welwn heddiw. Yr ydym oll wedi cael y papur briffio gan y Gymdeithas Frenhinol er Gwarchod Adar, sy'n tynnu sylw at y newidiadau a gafwyd a'r peryglon a geir o ganlyniad i'r cynnydd ym maint y carbon deuocsid yn yr atmosffer. Rhaid rhoi pwys ar ddau beth i wrthweithio'r newid a welwn yn yr hinsawdd: rhaid inni ddefnyddio llai o ynni a chynhyrchu ynni glân.

Cafwyd ymdrechion clodwiw gan yr Ymddiriedolaeth Garbon a'r Ymddiriedolaeth Arbed Ynni i gyrraedd y nod honno, ond rhaid gwneud ychwaneg. Mae prif bolisi cynllunio'r Llywodraeth ar

as yet unpublished. I am sure that one of the Ministers will tell us when they will publish it. The main emphasis of TAN 8, as we have seen from the consultation paper, will be wind power. If you are to reach your target by 2010, Ministers, a few things must happen. We must ensure that you publish TAN 8, so that the planning for turbines can take place, whether they are in strategic search areas or not. That process will take two to five years and then you will have to build them, which will take another couple of years. That will take us beyond 2010. Will you tell us, today, how TAN 8 will help to meet that target? You must also transmit the electricity from where it is produced. I have discussed how that will happen with Scottish Power and Western Power Distribution. As yet, I have not had a satisfactory answer about your encouragement for embedded generation to ensure that the energy will be transmitted. Gordon James of Friends of the Earth Cymru was pretty much right.

If you want some more encouragement, you would do well to turn to the World Wildlife Fund's 15-point climate change challenge, and look at some of the things on which we are failing in Wales, in order to achieve that. It is possible, and I turn to the amendments, to use a whole portfolio of projects, such as wind turbines on a small-community scale, hydro power, and wood fuel, such as the scheme at Llanwddyn that has been developed by the Mid Wales Energy Agency in Ecodefy. There are also photovoltaic technologies, and we have PV manufacturers in the Valleys. I am told by a company based in Cardiff that, with as little as £160,000 extra in grants, we could increase carbon dioxide savings by 28,000 kg every year. Germany, as you will remember, has done that. We must ensure that there is a thorough communications programme, such as that proposed by the Department of Trade and Industry, in order to educate people on the need to use less energy and for us to use clean energy.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Without a doubt, climate change is the most important issue that faces

ynni adnewyddadwy, nodyn cyngor technegol 8, heb ei gyhoeddi eto. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnaiff un o'r Gweinidogion ddweud wrthym pa bryd y byddant yn ei gyhoeddi. Bydd y prif bwyslais yn TAN 8, fel y gwelsom o'r papur ymgynghori, ar ynni gwynt. Os ydych i gyrraedd eich targed erbyn 2010, Weinidogion, rhaid gwneud ychydig o bethau. Rhaid ichi sicrhau y cyhoeddwch TAN 8, fel y gellir cynllunio ar gyfer tyrbinau, pa un a ydynt mewn ardaloedd chwilio strategol ai peidio. Gwnaiff y broses honno gymryd rhwng dwy a phum mlynedd ac wedyn bydd yn rhaid eu codi, a gymer flwyddyn neu ddwy arall. Aiff hynny â ni ymhellach na 2010. A wnewch ddweud wrthym, heddiw, ym mha fodd y bydd TAN 8 o gymorth i gyrraedd y targed hwnnw? Rhaid trosglwyddo'r trydan o'r man y'i cynhyrchir hefyd. Yr wyf wedi trafod sut y digwydd hynny gyda Scottish Power a Western Power Distribution. Hyd yma, ni chefais ateb boddhaol am y modd yr ydych yn hyrwyddo cynhyrchwyr dosbarthu lleol fel y gellir trosglwyddo'r trydan hwnnw. Yr oedd Gordon James o Gyfeillion y Ddaear Cymru yn eithaf cywir ei fam.

Os ydych am gael mwy o anogaeth, byddai'n beth da ichi droi at her newid yn yr hinsawdd 15 pwynt Cronfa Bywyd Gwyllt y Byd, ac ystyried rhai o'r pethau yr ydym yn methu â'u gwneud yng Nghymru, er mwyn cyflawni hynny. Gan droi at y gwelliannau, mae'n bosibl defnyddio amryw o brosiectau, fel tyrbinau gwynt ar raddfa gymunedol fach, ynni dŵr, a thanwydd coed, fel y cynllun yn Llanwddyn a ddatblygwyd gan Asiantaeth Ynni Canolbarth Cymru yn Ecodefy. Ceir technolegau ffotofoltäig hefyd, ac mae gennym gynhyrchwyr yn y maes hwnnw yn y Cymoedd. Dywed cwmni sydd â'i ganolfan yng Nghaerdydd wrthyf y gallem arbed 28,000 cilogram yn fwy o garbon deuocsid y flwyddyn gyda chyn lleied â £160,000 o grantiau ychwanegol. Fel y cofiwch, mae'r Almaen wedi gwneud hynny. Rhaid inni sicrhau y ceir rhaglen gyfathrebu bellgyrhaeddol, fel yr un a gynigir gan yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant, i addysgu pobl ynghylch yr angen i ddefnyddio llai o ynni ac inni ddefnyddio ynni glân.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Yn ddi-os, newid yn yr hinsawdd yw'r mater pwysicaf sy'n ein



us, and the response to its threat and consequences is currently totally inadequate. Without an adequate response, the future is grim: rising sea levels, changing rain patterns, flooding and drought. No-one can doubt that we are already seeing the first stages of climate change.

One of the main greenhouse gases that we emit is carbon dioxide from energy use. The gases that we emit today will remain in the earth's atmosphere for hundreds of years. Ignore those who say that climate change is not happening—the evidence is there. Do not take seriously those who argue that improvements in technology, by themselves, will save the day. We must also make savings in carbon dioxide emissions across society. Our primary problem is the use of fossil fuels that produce carbon dioxide, which adds up to more than two thirds of the warming and, here in the UK, accounts for five sixths of our greenhouse gas emissions.

Even though UK emissions have been falling, they are still over 2 per cent of the world's total. Per capita, our contribution to global warming is massive in comparison with that of other countries: two-and-a-half times the global average. Of course, we do not feel the effects of global warming here two-and-a-half times greater than elsewhere, but the evidence is there to be seen: sea levels around the UK are rising, waves on some coasts measure 1m higher now than 100 years ago, there is increased and accelerating coastal erosion, more frequent flooding, a longer growing season—spring was officially three weeks early in 2002 and winters are wetter and shorter—cod stocks are affected, and new fish species from warmer waters are regularly caught off our coasts.

The effects are more dramatic abroad. The World Health Organisation estimates that 150,000 people die in developing countries, each year, from the effects of global warming and, by 2020, that total will be 300,000 each year. The Kyoto protocol was never meant to

hwynebu, ac mae'r ymateb i'r bygythiadau oddi wrtho a'i ganlyniadau'n gwbl annigonol ar hyn o bryd. Os na cheir ymateb digonol, bydd y dyfodol yn ddu: lefelau môr uwch, patrymau glaw newidiol, llifogydd a sychder. Ni all neb amau nad ydym eisoes yn gweld y newidiadau cyntaf yn yr hinsawdd.

Un o'r prif nwyon tŷ gwydr yr ydym yn ei ollwng yw carbon deuocsid drwy ddefnyddio ynni. Bydd y nwyon a ollyngwn heddiw'n aros yn atmosffer y ddaear am gannoedd o flynyddoedd. Anwybyddwch y rhai a ddywed na cheir newid yn yr hinsawdd—mae'r dystiolaeth i'w gweld. Peidiwch â chymryd o ddifrif y rhai sy'n dadlau y bydd gwelliannau technolegol yn ddigon, ohonynt eu hunain, i achub y dydd. Rhaid inni leihau gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid hefyd ym mhob rhan o gymdeithas. Y brif broblem yw'r defnydd o danwyddau ffosil sy'n cynhyrchu carbon deuocsid, sy'n peri mwy na dwy ran o dair o'r cynhesu ac sydd, yma yn y DU, yn gyfrifol am bum rhan o chwech o'n gollyngiadau nwy.

Er bod y gollyngiadau yn y DU wedi bod yn gostwng, maent yn dal i fod yn fwy na 2 y cant o'r cyfanswm yn y byd. Mae ein cyfraniad, fesul pen, i gynhesu byd-eang yn anferth o'i gymharu â gwledydd eraill: dwywaith a hanner yn fwy na'r cyfartaledd rhyngwladol. Wrth gwrs, ni themlwn effeithiau cynhesu byd-eang ddwywaith a hanner yn fwy yma nag mewn mannau eraill, ond mae'r dystiolaeth i'w gweld: mae lefelau'r môr o gwmpas y DU yn codi, mae tonnau ar rai arfordiroedd yn 1 medr yn uwch nag yr oeddent 100 mlynedd yn ôl, ceir erydu cynyddol a chyflymach ar yr arfordir, llifogydd amlach, tymor tyfu hwy—datganwyd yn swyddogol fod y gwanwyn wedi dechrau dair wythnos yn gynt yn 2002 ac mae'r gaeafau'n mynd yn wlypach ac yn fyrrach—effeithir ar y cyflenwadau o benfreision, ac mae rhywogaethau pysgod newydd o ddyfroedd cynhesach yn cael eu dal yn aml oddi ar ein glannau.

Ceir effeithiau mwy trawiadol mewn gwledydd tramor. Mae Sefydliad Iechyd y Byd yn amcangyfrif bod 150,000 o bobl yn marw mewn gwledydd datblygol, bob blwyddyn, oherwydd effeithiau'r cynhesu byd-eang ac, erbyn 2020, ceir cyfanswm o

be the last word in responding to climate change, but a first step. However, without the world's biggest polluter, the United States of America, the protocol is doomed. We cannot wait for the USA to face up to its responsibilities; we must act now, as individuals, as Governments and globally. I strongly recommend that the Government here undertake a public education campaign that leads individuals to question their lifestyle choices in terms of carbon dioxide emissions. Let us not allow people to continue to believe that scientists will magic up an answer. Technology, as I have already said, will not halt climate change. Research and development is vital, but we cannot rely on that alone, however tempting it is to do so.

The development of renewable energy is also vital, as is a strong energy-efficiency policy, but you cannot get away from the need to reduce greenhouse gases, and, in particular, carbon dioxide emissions. The Government, therefore, needs to audit all of its policies and decisions to assess their impact on global warming and actively discourage energy use that is carbon based.

Air travel is a prime example of this. It is not discouraged but promoted by the tax system. There is no VAT on new aircraft or tickets, and airlines do not pay duty on their fuel use. The taxation system encourages air travel, and, along with cheap tickets, that is sending out the wrong message, especially to the 5 per cent of travellers who undertake half of all air miles. The UK Government has already admitted that the increase in our air travel by 2010 is likely to wipe out half the carbon savings that it expects to make under the Kyoto protocol. While aircraft emissions are excluded from those calculations, it is highly unlikely that the UK Government will be motivated to act.

300,000 bob blwyddyn. Nid oedd erioed fwrriad i brotocol Kyoto gael ei ystyried yn air olaf o ran ymateb i newid yn yr hinsawdd ond, yn hytrach, yn gam cyntaf. Fodd bynnag, gan nad yw'n cynnwys y llygrwr mwyaf yn y byd, Unol Daleithiau America, mae'r protocol wedi'i dynghedu i fethu. Ni allwn aros i UDA dderbyn ei chyfrifoldebau; rhaid inni weithredu'n awr, fel unigolion, fel Llywodraethau ac yn rhyngwladol. Yr wyf yn taer argymhell y dylai'r Llywodraeth yma ymgymryd ag ymgyrch addysg gyhoeddus a fydd yn peri i unigolion ymholi ynghylch eu dewisiadau am ffyrdd o fyw yng nghydestun gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid. Ni ddylem adael i bobl ddal i gredu y bydd gwyddonwyr yn dyfeisio rhyw ateb. Fel y dywedais eisoes, ni wnaiff technoleg atal newid yn yr hinsawdd. Mae ymchwil a datblygu'n hollbwysig, ond ni allwn ddibynnu ar hynny'n unig, er mor ddengar yw credu y gallwn.

Mae hefyd yn hollbwysig datblygu ynni adnewyddadwy, a pholisi cadarn ar effeithlonrwydd ynni, ond ni ellir osgoi'r angen i leihau nwyon tŷ gwydr, ac, yn benodol, gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid. Gan hynny, rhaid i'r Llywodraeth archwilio ei holl bolisiâu a phenderfyniadau i asesu eu heffaith ar gynhesu byd-eang ac i anghefnogi'r defnydd o ynni sy'n seiliedig ar garbon.

Mae teithio mewn awyrennau'n enghraifft ragorol o hynny. Ni chaiff ei anghefnogi drwy'r system drethu, ond ei hyrwyddo. Ni chodir TAW ar awyrennau newydd neu docynnau, ac nid yw cwmnïau awyrennau'n talu treth ar y tanwydd a ddefnyddiant. Mae'r system drethu'n hybu teithio mewn awyrennau, ac mae hynny, ynghyd â thocynnau rhad, yn cyfleu'r neges anghywir, yn enwedig i'r 5 y cant o deithwyr sy'n ymgymryd â hanner yr holl deithiau awyr. Mae Llywodraeth y DU eisoes wedi cydnabod y bydd y cynnydd mewn teithio mewn awyrennau erbyn 2010 yn debygol o ddileu hanner yr arbedion carbon y mae'n disgwyl eu cael o dan brotocol Kyoto. Cyhyd ag y bydd gollyngiadau o awyrennau heb eu cynnwys yn y cyfrifiadau hynny, mae'n dra annhebygol y caiff Llywodraeth y DU ei chymhell i weithredu.

We need a good public education programme about climate change and a full audit of Government decisions to assess their impact on carbon emissions. We need to encourage research and development, and develop a strong energy policy that moves away from carbon. Perhaps the Minister, in responding, would say whether he agrees that half of the UK's emission savings under the Kyoto agreement should be allowed to be negated by increased air travel.

**Christine Gwyther:** The whole thrust of this debate is that we need to ask ourselves whether the Welsh Assembly Government is performing on its carbon emission policies and targets. We should recognise that we are adhering to our Kyoto commitments. We are contributing fully to the UK-wide target of reducing carbon emissions by 60 per cent by 2050, and we must ensure that we keep on that track.

We are currently doing this via a variety of measures. Reference has already been made to technical advice note 8, which presents a more coherent planning framework for renewable energy, among other things. The renewables energy industry has been crying out for this for a long time, and we should welcome the fact that it is now here.

In 2001, power stations in Wales emitted over 12 million tonnes of carbon dioxide—almost 30 per cent of all emissions in Wales. Attention must be focused by the Welsh Assembly Government and by the UK Government on modernising our power stations and associated good practice, and on creating less wasted energy overall. The other 70 per cent of carbon emissions must be addressed by our making commercial and domestic improvements in our energy use. We should keep in mind at all times that we need to learn not only to live differently but also to work differently.

Yesterday, two schools from my constituency visited the Assembly. The children visiting were aged between 10 and 12. Apart from the usual searching questions, which always include, 'How much do you earn, then, Miss?', they also asked more challenging questions about recycling and energy

Rhaid inni gael rhaglen addysg gyhoeddus dda ar newid yn yr hinsawdd ac archwiliad trwyadl o benderfyniadau'r Llywodraeth i asesu eu heffaith ar ollyngiadau carbon. Rhaid inni hyrwyddo ymchwil a datblygu, a datblygu polisi ynni cadarn sy'n symud oddi wrth garbon. Efallai y gwnaiff y Gweinidog ddweud, wrth ymateb, a yw'n cytuno y dylid caniatáu i hanner y gollyngiadau a arbedir gan y DU o dan gytundeb Kyoto gael ei ddad-wneud drwy ragor o deithio mewn awyrennau.

**Christine Gwyther:** Holl fyrdwn y ddadl hon yw bod rhaid inni ymholi a yw Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn llwyddo yn ei pholisïau a'i thargedau ar ollyngiadau carbon. Dylem gydnabod ein bod yn dal at ein hymrwymiaadau o dan gytundeb Kyoto. Yr ydym yn cyfrannu'n llawn at y targed i'r DU gyfan o leihau gollyngiadau carbon o 60 y cant erbyn 2050, a rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn cadw at y llwybr hwnnw.

Gwnawn hynny ar hyn o bryd drwy amryw o fesurau. Cyfeiriwyd eisoes at nodyn cyngor technegol 8, sy'n cyflwyno fframwaith cynllunio mwy cydlynol ar gyfer ynni adnewyddadwy, ymysg pethau eraill. Mae'r diwydiant ynni adnewyddadwy wedi bod yn galw am hyn ers amser hir, a dylem groesawu'r ffaith ei fod gennym yn awr.

Yn 2001, yr oedd gorsafoedd trydan yng Nghymru'n gollwng mwy na 12 miliwn o dunelli metrig o garbon deuocsid—bron 30 y cant o'r holl ollyngiadau yng Nghymru. Rhaid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a Llywodraeth y DU ganolbwyntio ar foderneiddio ein gorsafoedd trydan a'r arferion da sy'n gysylltiedig â hwy, ac ar wastraffu llai o ynni'n gyffredinol. Rhaid ymdrin â'r 70 y cant arall o ollyngiadau carbon drwy ddefnyddio ynni'n well yn ein cartrefi ac mewn busnesau. Dylem gofio bob amser fod rhaid inni ddysgu i fyw'n wahanol a hefyd i weithio'n wahanol.

Ddoe, daeth dwy ysgol yn fy etholaeth i ymweld â'r Cynulliad. Yr oedd y plant a ymwelodd rhwng 10 a 12 oed. Ar wahân i'r cwestiynau ymchwilgar arferol, sydd bob amser yn cynnwys, 'Pa faint yr ydych yn ei ennill, felly, Miss?', gwnaethant hefyd ofyn cwestiynau mwy ymestynnol am ailgylchu ac

efficiency. A huge number of questions came from those kids on those issues. We can put that partly down to the Carbon Trust's and the Welsh Assembly Government's current advertisements on the television. They highlight green issues, and when children say, 'It is our future; do not throw it away', whether that is scripted or comes naturally, as it did with my constituents, it is up to us, as adults, to listen to them.

4.10 p.m.

Government is scrutinised closely these days, not just by backbenchers and non-governmental organisations but more than ever by the general public, and that is a good thing. Examples of good practice, for that reason, are becoming even more important. Ensuring that public buildings have the best possible standards of energy efficiency is crucial in terms of new substantial building projects—our new building will be built to the highest environmental standards. However, we must also concentrate on smaller, exemplar projects. I pay tribute to the newly formed Carmarthenshire Energy Agency, which will provide energy advice to individuals and businesses across Carmarthenshire. It has also embarked on a project to advise and help with funding for solar panels on village halls and other community buildings across the county. The take-up has been quite remarkable. I am particularly proud of the enthusiasm shown by community groups in west Carmarthenshire and there is much good work to build on there. The energy agency has achieved this level of engagement by working with groups, and not by imposing a top-down ideology. This approach works and the Welsh Assembly Government's sponsored agencies understand how it works, but they must make it work even better. For this reason, the Liberal Democrat amendment 2 is superfluous and I will not support it. We are already doing good work in that respect.

Finally, the Welsh Assembly Government's 'Energy Saving Wales' document talks about developing training programmes that support,

effeithlonrwydd ynni. Gofynnodd y plant hynny nifer fawr o gwestiynau ar y pynciau hynny. Gallwn briodoli hynny'n rhannol i hysbysebion presennol yr Ymddiriedolaeth Garbon a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar y teledu. Maent yn tynnu sylw at faterion gwyrdd, a phan ddywed plant, 'Ein dyfodol ni ydyw; peidiwch â'i daflu', pa un a yw hynny'n cael ei ddarllen o sgript neu'n codi'n naturiol, fel y gwnaeth yn achos fy etholwyr, ein lle ni, fel oedolion, yw gwrando arnynt.

Craffir yn fanwl ar waith y Llywodraeth y dyddiau hyn, nid yn unig gan feincwyr cefn a chyrrff anllywodraethol ond yn fwy nag erioed o'r blaen gan y cyhoedd, a da o beth yw hynny. Oherwydd hynny, mae enghreifftiau o arferion da yn dod yn bwysicach byth. Rhaid sicrhau'r safonau gorau posibl o ran effeithlonrwydd ynni mewn adeiladau cyhoeddus yng nghydestun prosiectau adeiladu sylweddol newydd—codir ein hadeilad newydd ni'n unol â'r safonau amgylcheddol uchaf. Er hynny, rhaid inni ganolbwyntio hefyd ar brosiectau enghreifftiol llai. Talaf deyrnged i Asiantaeth Ynni Sir Gâr, sydd newydd gael ei ffurfio, a fydd yn cynnig cyngor ar ynni i unigolion a busnesau ledled sir Gaerfyrddin. Mae hefyd wedi cychwyn prosiect i gynghori a helpu i sicrhau cyllid ar gyfer paneli solar ar neuaddau pentref ac adeiladau cymunedol eraill ledled y sir. Cafwyd derbyniad eithaf rhyfeddol i hyn. Yr wyf yn arbennig o falch o'r brwdfrydedd a amlygwyd gan grwpiau cymunedol yng ngorllewin sir Gaerfyrddin ac mae llawer o waith da y gellir manteisio arno yn y fan honno. Mae'r asiantaeth ynni wedi llwyddo i feithrin cysylltiadau fel hyn drwy weithio gyda grwpiau, ac nid drwy orfodi ideoleg oddi uchod. Mae'r dull gweithredu hwn yn llwyddiannus ac mae asiantaethau a noddir gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn deall sut y mae'n gweithio, ond rhaid iddynt beri iddo weithio'n well byth. Oherwydd hynny, mae gwelliant 2 o eiddo'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn ddiangen ac nis cefnogaf. Yr ydym eisoes yn gwneud gwaith da yn hynny o beth.

Yn olaf, mae dogfen Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru 'Arbed Ynni Cymru' yn sôn am ddatblygu rhaglenni hyfforddi sy'n cynnal,

or focus on, sustainability, including energy efficiency. I fully support this move. Moreover, I look forward to seeing the results of this policy coming through. Only by creating a virtuous circle of a low-carbon, high-skill and high-employment society, will carbon reduction become a reality in our lifetime. We are winning the public debate on carbon emissions and we now need to further support that with investment in training, the manufacture of renewable energy, energy-efficiency kits and machinery and a commitment to financial sanctions should businesses not meet their targets.

**Brynle Williams:** I too, like many other speakers, am gravely concerned about changing weather patterns, such as those that we have experienced recently. There are a few options that we should be considering to reduce carbon emissions. For example, Minister, should we be looking at new barrage schemes and research into hydro electricity and, returning to my own field of agriculture, should we consider biomass technology? There is much scope for this in agriculture as, regrettably, we no longer need the land for food production as there is an abundance of food. Can we not use this land? We must keep people living in rural communities and those people need work. We can utilise much agricultural land which is suitable for biodiesel or biomass production, and wood-burning power stations, and so on.

I will talk in detail about combined heat and power. You will be aware, Minister, that the Combined Heat and Power Association welcomed Michael Howard's recent speech regarding the carbon saving benefits of CHP. However, your Government is allowing stagnation in the growth of this key sustainable energy technology, and that must not be allowed to continue. We want to make full use of a shamefully underused technology, which is more than twice as efficient as centrally-generated energy sources. If we used CHP properly, we could greatly expand the possibility of energy efficient households. In real terms, for every 1,000 MW of CHP energy operating in the UK, there is a reduction of nearly 1 million tonnes in carbon emissions every year.

neu'n canolbwyntio ar, gynaliadwyedd, gan gynnwys effeithlonrwydd ynni. Llwyf gefnogaf y cam gweithredu hwn. At hynny, edrychaf ymlaen at weld canlyniadau'r polisi hwn. Dim ond drwy greu cylch rhinweddol o gymdeithas carbon isel, hyfedr â chyflogaeth uchel, y ceir llai o ddefnydd o garbon yn ein hoes ni. Yr ydym yn ennill y ddadl gyhoeddus ar ollyngiadau carbon a rhaid inni hyrwyddo hynny ymhellach drwy fuddsoddi mewn hyfforddiant, drwy gynhyrchu pecynnau a pheiriannau ynni adnewyddadwy ac ynni-effeithlon a thrwy ymrwymo i osod sancsiynau ariannol os bydd busnesau'n methu â chyrraedd eu targedau.

**Brynle Williams:** Yr wyf finnau, fe sawl siaradwr arall, yn dra phryderus ynghylch patrymau tywydd cyfnewidiol, fel y rhai a welsom yn ddiweddar. Mae rhai dewisiadau y dylem eu hystyried i leihau gollyngiadau carbon. Er enghraifft, Weinidog, a ddylem ystyried cynlluniau i godi morgloddiau ac ymchwil i drydan dŵr a, gan droi at amaethyddiaeth, sef fy maes i, a ddylem ystyried technoleg biomas? Mae llawer o gyfleoedd i wneud hynny mewn amaethyddiaeth oherwydd, gwaetha'r modd, nid oes arnom angen tir i gynhyrchu bwyd bellach gan fod digonedd ohono. Oni allwn ddefnyddio'r tir hwn? Rhaid inni gadw pobl mewn cymunedau gwledig ac mae arnynt angen gwaith. Gallwn ddefnyddio llawer o'r tir amaethyddol sy'n addas i gynhyrchu biodiesel neu biomas, ac i godi gorsafoddd trydan sy'n llosgi coed, ac yn y blaen.

Siaradaf yn fanwl am wres a phŵer cyfunedig. Fel y gwyddoch, Weinidog, gwnaeth y Gymdeithas Gwres a Phŵer Cyfunedig groesawu'r araith gan Michael Howard yn ddiweddar am y buddion o ran arbed carbon a geir o gynlluniau gwres a phŵer cyfunedig. Er hynny, mae'ch Llywodraeth yn gadael i'r dechnoleg ynni adnewyddadwy bwysig hon gael aros yn ei hunfan, ac ni ellir gadael i hynny barhau. Yr ydym am wneud defnydd llawn o dechnoleg sy'n cael ei thandefnyddio i raddau cywilyddus, sy'n fwy na dwywaith yn fwy effeithlon na ffynonellau ynni a gynhyrchir yn ganolog. Pe defnyddiem systemau gwres a phŵer cyfunedig yn iawn, byddai llawer mwy o gyfle i gael cartrefi ynni-effeithlon. Yn ymarferol, am bob 1,000 megawatt o ynni

Labour has consistently—and I emphasise that—missed the CHP target for years and the cold, stark reality is that CHP capacity is now in decline as Ministers invent excuses for inaction or even actively discourage it. Take a trip to Woking, colleagues, and see at first hand a town centre which is now largely operating on CHP.

The efficiency of CHP secures significant environmental benefits through lower carbon emissions and, in turn, contributes to the sustainability of power generation from fossil fuels, as well as from other renewable energy sources. I thank you for allowing me to contribute.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yn gyntaf, cytunaf yn llwyr â sylwadau Christine Gwyther ar Asiantaeth Ynni Sir Gâr. Y mae'r asiantaeth honno'n cynnig cyngor arbennig o dda i gymunedau yn sir Gaerfyrddin, ac yn cefnogi nifer o brosiectau eithriadol o bwysig yn y modd y mae'n hybu'r defnydd o baneli solar mewn neuaddau. Y mae nifer o grwpiau lleol yn ceisio gweithredu yn sir Gaerfyrddin er mwyn sicrhau bod yr arfer orau o ran effeithiolrwydd ynni yn cael ei hybu'n lleol. Yn ôl sylwadau Christine, mae'n edrych yn debyg bod y Blaid Lafur yn cefnogi ein cynnig, sydd i'w groesawu, hyd yn oed os bydd Aelodau Llafur yn pleidleisio yn erbyn gwelliant y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol.

Er bod nifer o fentrau da i'w gweld yn lleol, ac er i'r Llywodraethau yng Nghaerdydd a Llundain wneud nifer o addewidion, mae'r dystiolaeth yn awgrymu bod y sefyllfa'n wael. Yn gyntaf, rhaid inni gydnabod y sefyllfa ryngwladol. Yr un person sy'n atal unrhyw fath o ddatblygiad rhyngwladol o ran arbed ynni a'i ddefnyddio'n effeithiol yw George Bush. Mae ei bolisi ef yn yr Unol Daleithiau yn golygu fod y wlad fwyaf pwerus yn y byd yn parhau i lygru'r amgylchedd gan greu problemau ar gyfer gweddill y byd. Mae George Bush yn ymddangos fel pe bai'n fwy brwdfrydig yn ei

a geir o'r systemau gwres a phŵer cyfunedig sy'n rhedeg yn y DU, ceir gostyngiad o bron 1 filiwn o dunelli metrig mewn gollyngiadau carbon bob bwyddyn. Mae Llafur wedi methu'n gyson—a phwysleisiaf hynny—â chyrraedd y targed ar gyfer gwres a phŵer cyfunedig ers blynyddoedd a'r gwir plaen amdani yw bod capasiti gwres a phŵer cyfunedig yn lleihau wrth i Weinidogion feddwl am esgusion i beidio â gweithredu neu hyd yn oed i'w anghefnogi. Ewch am dro i Woking, gyd-Aelodau, i weld â'ch llygaid eich hun ganol tref sydd bellach yn rhedeg i raddau helaeth ar wres a phŵer cyfunedig.

Am fod gwres a phŵer cyfunedig mor effeithlon, daw â buddion sylweddol i'r amgylchedd drwy greu llai o ollyngiadau carbon ac mae'n cyfrannu, yn ei dro, at y gallu i gynhyrchu ynni o danwyddau ffosil mewn modd cynaliadwy, a hefyd o ffynonellau ynni adnewyddadwy eraill. Diolchaf ichi am adael imi gyfrannu.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** First, I endorse Christine Gwyther's comments on the Carmarthenshire Energy Agency. The agency offers particularly good advice to communities in Carmarthenshire, and supports several exceptionally important projects in promoting the use of solar panels in community halls. Many local groups in Carmarthenshire are trying to ensure that good practice in terms of energy efficiency is promoted locally. If Christine's comments are anything to go by, it seems that the Labour Party will support our motion, which I welcome, even if Labour Members vote against the Liberal Democrat amendment.

Notwithstanding the numerous good local initiatives, and the pledges made by Governments in Cardiff and London, the evidence suggests that the situation is bleak. First, we must be conscious of the global situation. The one person preventing any kind of international development on energy conservation and efficiency is George Bush. His policies in the United States mean that the most powerful nation on earth continues to pollute our environment, creating problems for the rest of the world. He seems more enthusiastic in his efforts to ensure that America's large multinationals support him

ymdrechion i geisio sicrhau bod cwmnïau mawr masnachol America yn ei gefnogi nag i ddangos unrhyw fath o ymwybyddiaeth ynghylch y math o broblemau sy'n cael eu creu gan y defnydd o ynni ac ynni ffosil yno.

Nid yw'n ymddangos bod gan Tony Blair lawer o ddylanwad ar George Bush, er ei fod yn awgrymu eu bod yn rhannu perthynas arbennig. Hyd nes ei fod yn gallu defnyddio ei ddylanwad, bydd ein problemau ar raddfa ryngwladol yn parhau.

What of the promises that have been made by the Labour Government in Westminster? Its promises do not amount to much in action. It has reduced its target for improving energy efficiency in people's homes, and it has failed to stick to the target for cutting carbon emissions, which it set in 1997. In four out of the last five years, UK carbon emissions have risen. Output from combined heat and power schemes—an efficient way to heat homes—has fallen. Installation standards in social housing have been reduced and the House of Commons all-party Environmental Audit Committee reported in July 2004 that the climate change strategy was seriously off course.

Y mae'n rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad gydnabod, er ei bod yn sôn gryn lawer am ddatblygu cynaliadwy, nad oes llawer yn digwydd, er bod rhyw gynlluniau i'w gweld yma a thraw. Mae datblygu cynaliadwy yn golygu datblygu cyfannol a datblygu cymunedau cynaliadwy. Tra bo'r Llywodraeth hon yn parhau i gefnogi canoli gwasanaethau a'u symud o'n cymunedau, bydd yn tanseilio ei hymdrechion i ddatblygu ein cymunedau a'n bywydau yn gynaliadwy.

Cyfeiriaf at rai o'r pethau y gellid eu gwneud o fewn y Cynulliad. Rhaid sicrhau bod rheoliadau adeiladu yn cael eu datganoli i Gymru er mwyn sicrhau bod canllawiau ar arbed ynni yn cael eu gosod yn y rheoliadau hynny. Galwaf ar y Gweinidogion priodol i gynnal trafodaethau brys gyda Llywodraeth San Steffan er mwyn sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd. Hefyd, rhaid sicrhau bod gan bobl yn ein cymunedau gyfle i gael mynediad at dai gan fod hynny eto yn rhywbeth sy'n hawl

than in showing any kind of awareness of the problems being created by America's energy and fossil fuel consumption.

It seems that Tony Blair cannot bring any influence to bear on George Bush, although he suggests that they share a special relationship. Until he can use his influence, our problems on a global scale will continue.

Beth am yr addewidion a wnaed gan y Llywodraeth Lafur yn San Steffan? Nid yw ei haddewidion yn arwain at lawer o weithredu. Mae wedi gostwng ei tharged ar gyfer gwella effeithlonrwydd ynni mewn cartrefi, a methodd â dal at y targed ar gyfer lleihau gollyngiadau carbon, a bennodd yn 1997. Mewn pedair o'r pum mlynedd diwethaf, mae gollyngiadau carbon y DU wedi cynyddu. Mae cynnyrch cynlluniau gwres a phŵer cyfunedig—dull effeithlon o wresogi cartrefi—wedi gostwng. Mae safonau gosod mewn tai cymdeithasol wedi'u gostwng a gwnaeth Pwyllgor Archwilio Amgylcheddol trawsbleidiol Tŷ'r Cyffredin adrodd yng Ngorffennaf 2004 fod y strategaeth ar newid yn yr hinsawdd wedi mynd ar gyfeiliorn.

The Assembly Government must recognise that, although it mentions sustainable development regularly, not much is being done, despite a few schemes here and there. Sustainable development means holistic development and developing sustainable communities. While this Government continues to support the centralisation of services, moving them from our communities, it will undermine its own efforts to develop our communities and lives in a sustainable way.

I will refer to some things that could be done in the Assembly. We must ensure that building regulations are devolved to Wales so that we can ensure that guidance on energy efficiency is incorporated into those regulations. I call on the relevant Ministers to hold urgent discussions with the Westminster Government to ensure that that happens. We must also ensure that people in our communities have the opportunity to access housing, which is again a basic right, and also

sylyfaenol, a'u bod yn cael tai sy'n ei galluogi i weithredu yn gyfrifol tuag at yr amgylchedd.

4.20 p.m.

**Mark Isherwood:** We will support amendment 1, but we will abstain on amendments 2 and 3, because they continue to place too much emphasis on the red herring of wind power.

Wind turbines are part of the problem, not the solution—based on a policy of hot air, not clean air. They are a quick-fix option on the cheap by a Labour Government that cannot deliver on carbon emission targets, and which, with Welsh Assembly Government collusion, therefore spun a smoke-screen of renewable energy targets which require an increase in overall generation capacity, without cutting carbon emissions.

A submission by one of my constituents, who is an adviser to an overseas Government, states that Technical Advice Note 8 on renewable energy presents the ugly face of political expedience and commercial greed, with no respect for environmental consideration. A damning independent report for the German Government has now been shelved because it was such an embarrassment for German Ministers. It was embarrassing because it warned that windfarm programmes will greatly increase energy costs and that greenhouse gases can be easily reduced by alternative methods. Germany already has more than 15,000 turbines, and the report warns that if it presses ahead with its plan to double that number, annual energy costs for consumers will rise nearly four-fold to £3.7 billion. Almost 600 miles of new cabling will have to be laid, and power plants will have to be replaced or adapted to cope with the inherently large fluctuations in wind-derived energy. The research also casts doubt on the claim that wind power cuts greenhouse gas pollution, and states that almost the same effect can be achieved at a far lower cost by installing modern filters at existing fossil fuel power plants. It is even more worrying that the UK Government has made it clear that it wants to follow Germany's example.

that they have houses that enable them to act in an environmentally responsible way.

**Mark Isherwood:** Cefnogwn welliant 1, ond ymataliwn ar welliannau 2 a 3, gan eu bod yn dal i roi gormod o bwyslais ar ynni'r gwynt, ac felly'n codi sgwarnogod.

Mae tyrbinau gwynt yn rhan o'r broblem, yn hytrach na bod yn ateb iddi—maent yn seiliedig ar bolisi o falu awyr, yn hytrach nag awyr lân. Maent yn ddewis rhad a hawdd i Lywodraeth Lafur nad yw'n gallu cyrraedd ei thargedau ar ollyngiadau carbon ac sydd, felly, drwy gynllwynio â Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, wedi cuddio y tu ôl i dargedau dryslyd ar ynni adnewyddadwy sy'n gofyn mwy o gapsaiti cynhyrchu'n gyffredinol, heb dorri ar ollyngiadau carbon.

Mewn sylwadau a ddaeth i law oddi wrth un o'm hetholwyr, sy'n gynghorydd i Lywodraeth dramor, dywedir bod nodyn cyngor technegol 8 ar ynni adnewyddadwy yn amlygu ystrywiau gwleidyddol a thrachwant masnachol o'r math gwaethaf, heb unrhyw barch at ystyriaethau amgylcheddol. Mae adroddiad annibynnol damniol ar gyfer Llywodraeth yr Almaen wedi'i roi o'r neilltu'n awr gan ei fod yn gymaint o destun cywilydd i Weinidogion yr Almaen. Yr oedd yn codi cywilydd arnynt gan ei fod yn rhybuddio y bydd rhaglenni ffermydd gwynt yn peri cynnydd mawr yng nghostau ynni a bod modd lleihau nwyon tŷ gwydr yn rhwydd drwy ddulliau eraill. Mae mwy na 15,000 o dyrbinau yn yr Almaen eisoes, ac mae'r adroddiad yn rhybuddio, os gwnaiff ddal ymlaen â'i bwriad i ddyblu'r nifer hwnnw, y bydd y costau ynni blyneddol i ddefnyddwyr yn codi bron bedair gwaith i £3.7 biliwn. Bydd yn rhaid gosod bron 600 milltir o geblau newydd, a bydd yn rhaid codi gorsafoedd trydan newydd neu addasu'r rhai presennol i ddygymod â'r amrywiadau mawr sydd ynghlwm wrth ynni a geir o'r gwynt. Mae'r ymchwil yn bwrw amheuaeth hefyd ar yr honiad bod ynni'r gwynt yn lleihau llygredd gan nwyon tŷ gwydr, a dywed y gellir sicrhau'r un effaith bron yn rhatach o lawer drwy osod hidlwyr modern yn y



gorsafoedd trydan presennol sy'n llosgi tanwydd ffosil. Yr hyn sy'n peri mwy byth o bryder yw bod Llywodraeth y DU wedi datgan ei bod yn dymuno dilyn esiampl yr Almaen.

**Carwyn Jones:** What is this research and who funded it?

**Carwyn Jones:** Beth yw'r ymchwil hon a phwy a dalodd amdani?

**Mark Isherwood:** I have the details, and, as time is limited, I will make it available to you afterwards.

**Mark Isherwood:** Mae'r manylion gennyf a, gan fod amser yn brin, fe'u rhoddaf i chi wedyn.

A former reader in ecology at the University of Wales has told me of his increasing concern and certainty that the pursuit of renewable energy targets based on windpower is at the expense of genuine savings of fossil fuels, that is carbon targets, and that this will cause a serious problem in Wales and across the UK. He also told me that, in May 2004, the generating company of west Denmark, Elsam, admitted in a presentation to the Danish Government that

Mae cyn-ddarllenydd mewn ecoleg ym Mhrifysgol Cymru wedi dweud wrthyf ei fod yn fwyfwy pryderus a sicr bod yr ymgais i gyrraedd targedau ar ynni adnewyddadwy drwy ddefnyddio ynni'r gwynt yn digwydd ar draul sicrhau gwir arbedion ar danwyddau ffosil, hynny yw, targedau carbon, ac y bydd hyn yn peri problem ddifrifol yng Nghymru a ledled y DU. Dywedodd wrthyf hefyd fod y cwmni cynhyrchu yng ngorllewin Denmarc, Elsam, wedi cyfaddef, ym Mai 2004, mewn cyflwyniad i Lywodraeth Denmarc

'increased development of wind turbines does not reduce Danish carbon dioxide emissions'.

nad yw'r datblygu cynyddol ar dyrbinau gwynt yn lleihau gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid Denmarc.

He also told me that the 2004 wind report from German power giant E.ON Netz states that

Dywedodd wrthyf hefyd fod yr adroddiad ar ynni'r gwynt gan y cwmni cynhyrchu enfawr yn yr Almaen E.ON Netz yn datgan bod

'the increased use of wind power in Germany has resulted in uncontrollable fluctuations which are now also occurring on the generation side due to the random character of wind power infeed, thereby increasing the demands placed on control and bringing about rising grid costs.'

y defnydd cynyddol o ynni'r gwynt yn yr Almaen wedi arwain at amrywiadau afreolus sy'n digwydd hefyd yn awr ar yr ochr cynhyrchu oherwydd natur anghyson y mewnbwn o ynni'r gwynt, fel y ceir mwy o alwadau ar y rheolwyr a chynnydd yng nghostau'r grid.

**Janet Davies:** Are you aware that 40 per cent of Denmark's energy comes from wind power, and that that is its problem—it no longer has flexibility? In Wales, however, we are aiming for obtaining 10 per cent energy from wind power, which retains flexibility.

**Janet Davies:** A wyddoch fod 40 y cant o bŵer Denmarc yn dod o ynni'r gwynt, ac mai hynny yw achos ei phroblem—nid oes digon o hyblygrwydd bellach? Yng Nghymru, fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn ceisio cael 10 y cant o'n pŵer o ynni'r gwynt, fel y cedwir hyblygrwydd.

**Mark Isherwood:** I will come to that point in a moment, specifically on the Danish situation.

**Mark Isherwood:** Deuaf at y pwynt hwnnw mewn eiliad, gyda golwg ar y sefyllfa yn Nenmarc yn benodol.

The German company E.ON Netz has

Mae'r cwmni E.ON Netz o'r Almaen wedi

admitted to a huge need for conventional spare generation to cover such oscillations. Heaven alone knows how much carbon dioxide emission will be saved by wind power burdened by this kind of insurance policy against grid failure. As for Denmark, my constituent said that it was the enormous resource of external electricity, particularly instantly dispatchable hydropower from Scandinavian countries, that allowed the achievement of 20 per cent wind power generation. Those countries have now expanded their power consumption, and can no longer provide a buffer for Danish wind power. The reason why Denmark is now failing to save carbon dioxide emission by deploying more turbines is that it is forced to provide fossil-fuel balance power itself.

This has serious implications for the future of wind energy in Wales and the United Kingdom. To provide us with 10 per cent of realised wind generation, we would have to deploy about three times that installed capacity, because the wind-imposed load factor onshore in the United Kingdom is about 30 per cent. Even if the full capacity of the UK's rather elderly cross-channel link to France were available to buffer wind variation, this would be nowhere near sufficient, and neither would reliance on the spinning-spare reserve of our conventional generating system, which is, in any case, maintained to secure the grid supply. The only resort would be to provide dedicated fossil fuel standby, in which case, much of the carbon dioxide saving would be negated and we would need yet more wind power to reach the target saving.

While supporting renewable energy and targets, it is critical that we look at all forms of renewable energy technology—

**Ann Jones:** Will you take an intervention?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** You have half a minute left, Mark.

**Mark Isherwood:** On that basis, I had better not, Ann. However, I will check my

cyfaddef bod angen cryn allu cynhyrchu confensiynol wrth gefn i ymdrin ag amrywiadau o'r fath. Y nefoedd a wŷr pa faint o garbon deuocsid a arbedir o gael cynlluniau ynni'r gwynt sydd wedi'u llethu gan y fath yswiriant rhag i'r grid fethu. Gyda golwg ar Ddenmarc, dywedodd fy etholwr mai'r adnoddau trydan anferth y tu allan i'r wlad, yn enwedig y trydan dŵr y gellid ei drosglwyddo'n syth o wledydd Llychlyn, a oedd yn ei galluogi i gynhyrchu 20 y cant o'i drydan o ynni'r gwynt. Mae'r gwledydd hynny'n defnyddio mwy o drydan bellach, ac ni allant gynnig clustog yn awr ar gyfer y trydan a gynhyrchir o wynt yn Nenmarc. Mae Denmarc yn methu â lleihau gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid yn awr drwy ddefnyddio mwy o dyrbinau am ei bod yn gorfod darparu trydan o danwyddau ffosil ei hun i gadw cydbwysedd.

Mae goblygiadau difrifol yn hyn i ddyfodol ynni'r gwynt yng Nghymru ac yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Er mwyn gallu cynhyrchu 10 y cant o'n trydan o ynni'r gwynt, byddem yn gorfod meddu ar y gallu i gynhyrchu tua thair gwaith yn fwy na hynny, gan mai tua 30 y cant yw'r ffactor llwyth oherwydd y gwynt ar y tir yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Hyd yn oed pe bai modd defnyddio holl gapasiti'r cyswllt sy'n eithaf hen rhwng y DU a Ffrainc ar draws y sianel fel clustog rhag amrywiadau yn y gwynt, ni fyddai hynny'n agos at fod yn ddigon, ac ni allem ddibynnu ychwaith ar y gallu sydd dros ben yn ein system gynhyrchu gonfensiynol, a gedwir i sicrhau'r cyflenwad i'r grid, beth bynnag. Yr unig ddewis arall fyddai darpariaeth bwrpasol wrth gefn a ddefnyddiai danwyddau ffosil, a fyddai'n dad-wneud llawer o'r arbedion ar garbon deuocsid, a byddai arnom angen mwy byth o ynni'r gwynt i gyrraedd y targed ar gyfer arbedion.

Er ein bod o blaid ynni adnewyddadwy a thargedau, mae'n hollbwysig inni ystyried pob math o dechnoleg ynni adnewyddadwy—

**Ann Jones:** A wnewch chi dderbyn ymyriad?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae gennych hanner munud ar ôl, Mark.

**Mark Isherwood:** Os felly, byddai'n well imi beidio, Ann. Fodd bynnag, cadarnhaf y

information with Carwyn afterwards.

I will leave the last word to a constituent, whose TAN 8 submission concluded by stating that

‘our own Welsh Assembly Government is facilitating the waste of consumers’ and taxpayers’ money on destroying our tourism, wildlife and quality of life, by pouring money into...wind power...instead of encouraging the development of alternative renewable technologies’.

**The Minister for Economic Development and Transport (Andrew Davies):** I thank Janet and her party for raising this issue. You are right that there is probably no more pressing issue facing not just politicians, but humanity, and that has been acknowledged by the Assembly Government.

There is a big challenge to be met. You rightly said that there is consensus among the scientific community, particularly the international conference on climate change. John Houghton, the UK Government’s adviser on climate change, made a presentation to the Cabinet last Friday. He presented a stark position. However, we all have a responsibility. For many of our electorate—the people who send us here—climate change is either irrelevant or, as they see it, does not impact on their lives. Furthermore, many of you will have had several e-mails, as I have, where the weasel words ‘so-called climate change’ are used. Collectively, we must challenge that belief and assumption.

Some of today’s contributions illustrate the problems that we have. It is almost as if we are all against sin, but please not yet, Lord, not just yet. Hence Mark’s comments about wind power.

The Assembly Government is committed to playing its part in addressing the causes of climate change. I therefore welcome the opportunity to highlight some of the actions that we are already taking. As has been said, climate change is one of the most fundamental issues that we face as a species,

wybodaeth sydd gennyf gyda Carwyn wedyn.

Gadawaf y gair olaf i un o’r hetholwyr, a ddywedodd wrth gloi’r sylwadau a gyflwynodd ar TAN 8 fod

Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn creu modd i wastraffu arian defnyddwyr a threthdalwyr ar ddinistrio ein twristiaeth, ein bywyd gwyllt a’n hansawdd bywyd, drwy arllwys arian i mewn i...ynni’r gwynt...yn hytrach na hyrwyddo’r gwaith o ddatblygu technolegau ynni adnewyddadwy eraill.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth (Andrew Davies):** Diolchaf i Janet ac i’w phlaid am godi’r mater hwn. Yr ydych yn iawn wrth ddweud nad oes yr un pwnc pwysicach, mae’n debyg, yn wynebu nid yn unig gwleidyddion, ond dynol ryw, ac mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cydnabod hynny.

Mae her fawr i’w hwynebu. Yr oeddech yn iawn wrth ddweud bod consensws ymysg gwyddonwyr, yn enwedig yn y gynhadledd ryngwladol ar newid yn yr hinsawdd. Rhoddodd John Houghton, cynghorydd Llywodraeth y DU ar newid yn yr hinsawdd, gyflwyniad i’r Cabinet ddydd Gwener diwethaf. Disgrifiodd y sefyllfa’n blaen. Fodd bynnag, mae cyfrifoldeb gan bob un ohonom. Yng ngolwg llawer o’r hetholwyr—y rhai sy’n ein hanfon yma—mae newid yn yr hinsawdd un ai’n amherthnasol neu, yn eu barn hwy, nid yw’n effeithio ar eu bywyd. At hynny, bydd llawer ohonoch wedi cael sawl neges drwy’r e-bost, lle y defnyddir y geiriau osgoilyd ‘y newid honedig yn yr hinsawdd’. Gyda’n gilydd, rhaid inni herio’r gred a’r rhagdybiaeth honno.

Mae rhai o’r cyfraniadau a gafwyd heddiw’n amlygu’r problemau sydd gennym. Mae bron fel petaem i gyd yn erbyn pechod, ond nid eto, Arglwydd, nid eto. Felly yr oedd sylwadau Mark am ynni’r gwynt.

Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ymrwmo i chwarae ei rhan wrth ymdrin â’r hyn sy’n achosi newid yn yr hinsawdd. Gan hynny, croesawaf y cyfle i dynnu sylw at rai o’r camau yr ydym yn eu cymryd eisoes. Fel y dywedwyd, y newid yn yr hinsawdd yw un o’r materion sylfaenol a wynebwn fel

and, as a Government, we are fully committed to playing our part in addressing its causes. We have clear targets, and positive progress has been made on many fronts.

However, as a Government we must be responsible, and we must balance the environmental with the economic and the social. Wales's industrial heritage means that we disproportionately contribute towards carbon dioxide emissions because of our heavy industrial and energy generation bases. I say to many opposition Members who contributed to the debate that, as an opposition, it is easy to say that we should be doing X or that we should be doing Y. However, will you say to people who work in the steel industry and other heavy industries, and who depend for their livelihoods on those jobs, that we should cast them aside to reduce carbon dioxide emissions? As the Minister for Economic Development and Transport, I am not prepared to deprive people of their livelihoods. Yes, we will work with industry to reduce carbon dioxide emissions, but it is not an easy thing to do, Mark, despite what you said. Reducing carbon dioxide emissions is not an easy challenge.

**Mark Isherwood:** Will you accept that all those comments came from independent sources, not from me? I was quoting other people. I have just passed to Carwyn the details of that report by a German group of independent advisers to the German Government. My concern, to quote again from one of the people who contacted me, is that your policy is more of a case of saying, 'There is a hole in my bucket, dear Liza'.

**Andrew Davies:** That is quite a silly comment. Janet Davies answered your point about wind power, which also answers the point about Denmark. Once you get above about 20 per cent in terms of wind power generation, you introduce inefficiencies into the system, and you are then open to variability. Janet answered that point well.

rhywogaeth, ac, fel Llywodraeth, yr ydym wedi llwyr ymrwymo i chwarae ein rhan wrth ymdrin â'i achosion. Mae gennym dargedau clir, a gwnaed cynnydd pendant mewn sawl maes.

Fodd bynnag, fel Llywodraeth, rhaid inni fod yn gyfrifol, a rhaid inni ddal y ddysgl yn wastad rhwng agweddau amgylcheddol, economaidd, a chymdeithasol. Oherwydd natur ddiwydiannol Cymru yn y gorffennol, ac oherwydd ein diwydiannau trwm a'n dulliau o gynhyrchu trydan yr ydym yn cyfrannu mwy tuag at ollyngiadau carbon deuocsid ar gyfartaledd. Dywedaf wrth lawer o Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau a gyfrannodd i'r ddadl mai peth hawdd yw i wrthbleidiau ddweud y dylem wneud hyn a'r llall. Fodd bynnag, a wnewch chi ddweud wrth weithwyr yn y diwydiant dur a diwydiannau trwm eraill, sy'n dibynnu ar y swyddi hynny am eu bywoliaeth, y dylem eu bwrw o'r neilltu er mwyn lleihau gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid? Fel y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth, nid wyf yn barod i ddwyn bywoliaeth pobl oddi arnynt. Ie, gwnawn weithio gyda diwydiant i leihau gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid, ond nid yw hynny'n beth hawdd, Mark, er gwaethaf yr hyn a ddywedasoch. Nid gwaith hawdd yw lleihau gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid.

**Mark Isherwood:** A wnewch chi dderbyn bod yr holl sylwadau hynny wedi dod o ffynonellau annibynnol, nid oddi wrthyf fi? Yr oeddwn yn dyfynnu geiriau pobl eraill. Yr wyf newydd roi i Carwyn fanylion yr adroddiad hwnnw gan grŵp annibynnol yn yr Almaen sy'n cynnig cyngor i Lywodraeth yr Almaen. Yr hyn sy'n peri pryder i mi, gan ddyfynnu eto o eiriau un o'r rhai a gysylltodd â mi, yw bod eich polisi yn datgan bod problem, heb gynnig ateb.

**Andrew Davies:** Yr oedd hwnnw'n sylw eithaf gwirion. Gwnaeth Janet Davies ateb y pwynt a wnaethoch am ynni'r gwynt, gan ateb y pwynt ynghylch Denmarc hefyd. Os cynhyrchwch fwy na thua 20 y cant o drydan drwy ddefnyddio ynni'r gwynt, mae'r system yn mynd yn aneffeithlon, ac yr ydych yn agored i effaith amrywiadau. Gwnaeth Janet ateb y pwynt hwnnw'n dda.

4.30 p.m.

On TAN 8 and our renewable energy production strategy, our energy route map states that we will take a balanced approach. Wind power has a significant role to play and it is the only commercially exploitable technology for renewable energy that can make a significant contribution to reducing carbon dioxide emissions, but it is only part of a balanced approach. I say to some opposition Members, some of whom are not here today, that this issue is about leadership. If we are to reduce carbon dioxide emissions and embrace renewable energy, it is okay to say one thing here, but to vote against and lead campaigns against renewable energy projects that come up against planning issues is an abdication of responsibility and leadership.

**Mick Bates:** I am sure that many Members agree with the main thrust of your argument about TAN 8 and targets, but will you address the vital point of how you will reach the target through TAN 8? The delay in the planning process and the construction of the transmission lines will take you far beyond the target, especially on the proportion of wind power.

**Andrew Davies:** The final document will not hold up existing plans. I have spoken to renewable energy companies that are already looking at developments and taking that issue forward. I have also spoken to supply industries and electricity companies such as SP Manweb plc and ScottishPower, which want the assurance of TAN 8 in order to invest in the grid in mid and north Wales in particular.

On some of the major points, I have said that we are tackling the issue of energy efficiency and the reduction of carbon dioxide emissions seriously. Our energy efficiency action plan, 'Energy Saving Wales', highlights the activities of the many agencies engaged in efficiency work in Wales. Our guidelines for sustainable development and design encourage energy efficiency in buildings. Local authorities are playing a key

Ynghylch TAN 8 a'n strategaeth ar gynhyrchu gan ddefnyddio ynni adnewyddadwy, mae ein map ffyrdd ar ynni'n datgan y byddwn yn ymdrin â hyn mewn modd cytbwys. Mae rôl bwysig i ynni'r gwynt, a honno yw'r unig dechnoleg ynni adnewyddadwy y gellir ei defnyddio'n fasnachol i gyfrannu'n helaeth at leihau gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid, ond nid yw ond yn un rhan o ddull gweithredu cytbwys. Dywedaf wrth rai o Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau, y mae rhai ohonynt heb fod yma heddiw, fod y mater hwn yn ymwneud ag arweinyddiaeth. Os ydym i leihau gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid a chroesawu ynni adnewyddadwy, mae'n iawn dweud un peth yma, ond mae pleidleisio yn erbyn ac arwain ymgyrchoedd yn erbyn prosiectau ynni adnewyddadwy sy'n wynebu rhwystrau o ran cynllunio yn golygu ymwrthod â chyfrifoldeb ac arweinyddiaeth.

**Mick Bates:** Yr wyf yn siŵr bod llawer o Aelodau'n cytuno â phrif bwyslais eich dadl ynghylch TAN 8 a thargedau, ond a wnewch chi ymdrin â'r pwynt hollbwysig ynghylch y modd y byddwch yn cyrraedd y targed drwy TAN 8? Bydd yr oedi yn y broses gynllunio ac yn y gwaith o godi'r ceblau trosglwyddo yn golygu y byddwch ymhell o gyrraedd y targed, yn enwedig hwnnw ar y gyfran o ynni'r gwynt.

**Andrew Davies:** Ni fydd y ddogfen derfynol yn rhwystro'r cynlluniau presennol. Yr wyf wedi siarad â chwmnïau ynni adnewyddadwy sydd eisoes yn ystyried datblygiadau ac yn hyrwyddo hynny. Yr wyf hefyd wedi siarad â diwydiannau cyflenwi a chwmnïau trydan fel SP Manweb ccc a ScottishPower, sydd am gael sicrwydd drwy TAN 8 er mwyn buddsoddi yn y grid yn y Canolbarth a'r Gogledd yn benodol.

Ynghylch rhai o'r prif bwyntiau, dywedais ein bod yn mynd i'r afael o ddirif ag effeithlonrwydd ynni a lleihau gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid. Mae ein cynllun gweithredu ar effeithlonrwydd ynni, 'Arbed Ynni Cymru', yn tynnu sylw at weithgareddau'r nifer mawr o asiantaethau sy'n ymwneud â gwaith ar effeithlonrwydd yng Nghymru. Mae ein canllawiau ar gyfer datblygu cynaliadwy a dylunio yn hyrwyddo

role, and our policy agreements with them set out clearly the action that they will take to improve energy efficiency by 2007.

Christine Gwyther made the point that the UK's greenhouse gas emissions are already below our Kyoto protocol target, which is to reduce emissions by 12.5 per cent below base-year levels over the mid period up to 2012. I therefore urge Members to oppose amendment 1. However, we recognise that more needs to be done to achieve the longer-term reductions that we are striving for, and work has already begun on the development of micro-renewable energy. We are actively looking for ways to facilitate the adoption of small-scale energy sources by householders, businesses, public bodies and communities, and that is why I was delighted to launch the Mid Wales Energy Agency late last year. I therefore ask Members to oppose amendment 2.

Of course, the biggest issue is the need to raise public awareness, as I said earlier. Not only do we need to raise awareness, but to bring about cultural change. In raising this issue publicly, therefore, we have a responsibility as politicians and as a Government.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** You referred to the need to lead on this issue and engage the public. Will you hold discussions with Cabinet colleagues in Westminster on the possibility of offering tax benefits to people who try to make changes in their lifestyles and in their homes to conserve energy?

**Andrew Davies:** Yes. We regularly take up such issues where we can use financial and fiscal incentives to encourage energy efficiency and reduce carbon dioxide emissions. However, I pay tribute to the Prime Minister who, with Gordon Brown, is taking a lead on climate change, and for the contribution made at the recent Davos G8 summit. Also, there is the Exeter scientific conference, which starts today. However, we will use any opportunity that we can to take forward this agenda.

effeithlonrwydd ynni mewn adeiladau. Mae awdurdodau lleol yn chwarae rhan allweddol, ac mae ein cytundebau polisi â hwy'n nodi'n glir y camau a gymerant i wella effeithlonrwydd ynni erbyn 2007.

Dywedodd Christine Gwyther fod gollyngiadau nwyon tŷ gwydr y DU eisoes yn is na'n targed o dan brotocol Kyoto, sy'n gofyn am ostwng gollyngiadau fel eu bod yn 12.5 y cant yn is na lefelau'r flwyddyn sylfaen dros y cyfnod canolig hyd at 2012. Gan hynny, anogaf Aelodau i wrthwynebu gwelliant 1. Er hynny, derbyniwn fod rhaid gwneud rhagor i sicrhau'r gostyngiadau tymor hwy yr ydym yn eu ceisio, ac mae gwaith wedi dechrau eisoes i ddatblygu ynni meicro-adnewyddadwy. Yr ydym yn chwilio am ddulliau i hwyluso mabwysiadu ffynonellau ynni ar raddfa fach gan ddeiliaid tai, busnesau, cyrff cyhoeddus a chymunedau, a dyna pam yr oeddwn yn falch iawn o lansio Asiantaeth Ynni Canolbarth Cymru y llynedd. Felly, gofynnaf i Aelodau wrthwynebu gwelliant 2.

Wrth gwrs, y pwnc pwysicaf yw'r angen i hybu ymwybyddiaeth y cyhoedd, fel y dywedais yn gynharach. Yn ogystal â hybu ymwybyddiaeth, rhaid inni hefyd beri newid mewn arferion. Wrth godi'r pwnc hwn yn gyhoeddus, felly, mae gennym gyfrifoldeb fel gwleidyddion ac fel Llywodraeth.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Cyfeiriasoch at yr angen i arwain ar y mater hwn ac i gynnwys y cyhoedd. A wnewch chi gynnal trafodaethau gyda'ch cyd-Weinidogion yn San Steffan ynghylch y posibilrwydd o gynnig manteision treth i rai sy'n ceisio newid eu ffordd o fyw a gwneud newidiadau yn eu cartrefi i arbed ynni?

**Andrew Davies:** Gwnawn. Yr ydym yn codi materion yn rheolaidd lle y gallwn ddefnyddio anogaethau ariannol a chyllidol i hyrwyddo effeithlonrwydd ynni a lleihau gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid. Fodd bynnag, talaf deyrnged i'r Prif Weinidog sydd, gyda Gordon Brown, yn cynnig arweiniad ar newid yn yr hinsawdd, ac am y cyfraniad a wnaed yn yr uwchgynhadledd G8 yn Davos yn ddiweddar. Hefyd, cynhelir y gynhadledd wyddonol yng Nghaerwysg, sy'n dechrau heddiw. Fodd bynnag, achubwn ar bob cyfle i

hyrwyddo'r agenda hon.

Climate change is a fundamental, global issue, and, to be most effective, we need people to think about how it can impact on them individually. We have several initiatives to raise the profile of climate change. We accept that much more needs to be done, and at Friday's Cabinet meeting, we discussed how we might take this forward as a concerted communication strategy. Therefore, I see no need to support amendment 3.

As I said, we remain committed to this agenda. However, we have problems with Plaid Cymru's motion. It talks about acceleration, but, as a Government, we must be responsible. You must be far more specific in what you ask of us as a Government. Asking us merely to accelerate our policies is not meaningful. However, I accept the spirit in which Plaid Cymru proposed this motion, and we hope to engage in this agenda and take it forward over the coming months and years.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I thank all those who have participated in this debate. The level of concern felt across the Assembly about the most important long-term issue facing Wales and the world is obviously genuine. I particularly welcome Brynle Williams's positive contribution, although it is a shame that his views are not universally shared by his party.

We are not saying that the Wales and Westminster Governments are not doing anything to tackle these issues, but rather that we want them to do more and to do it faster in a more coherent and consistent way. The Minister refuses to support this motion, saying that we have not been specific enough but, when we are specific, he tells us that we are being too specific, so it is difficult to see how we can win. As the opposition, it is our function to draw attention to weaknesses in the Government's performance, but I am happy to submit a lengthy paper to the Minister if he wants the specifics.

Before responding to the points made, I will make one suggestion that the Minister may

Mae newid yn yr hinsawdd yn fater sylfaenol, byd-eang, ac, er mwyn bod yn fwyaf effeithiol, rhaid inni beri i bobl ystyried sut y gall effeithio arnynt yn unigol. Mae gennym sawl menter i dynnu sylw at newid yn yr hinsawdd. Yr ydym yn derbyn bod angen gwneud llawer mwy ac, yng nghyfarfod y Cabinet ddydd Gwener, trafodwyd sut y gallem hyrwyddo hyn drwy strategaeth gyfathrebu gyfunedig. Felly, ni welaf fod angen cefnogi gwelliant 3.

Fel y dywedais, yr ydym wedi ymrwymo o hyd i'r agenda hon. Er hynny, yr ydym yn anfodlon ar gynnig Plaid Cymru. Mae'n sôn am gyflymu, ond, fel Llywodraeth, rhaid inni fod yn gyfrifol. Rhaid ichi fod yn fwy penodol o lawer o ran yr hyn a ofynnwch gennym fel Llywodraeth. Nid yw gofyn inni gyflymu ein polisiau yn ystyrlon ar ei ben ei hun. Er hynny, derbyniaf fwriad Plaid Cymru wrth gynnig y cynnig hwn, a gobeithiwn ymwneud â'r agenda hon a'i hyrwyddo dros y misoedd a'r blynyddoedd i ddod.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Diolchaf i bawb a gymerodd ran yn y ddadl hon. Mae'n amlwg bod pryder gwirioneddol drwy'r Cynulliad ynghylch y mater pwysicaf sy'n wynebu Cymru a'r byd yn y tymor hir. Croesawaf gyfraniad cadarnhaol Brynle Williams yn enwedig, er ei bod yn drueni nad yw pawb yn ei blaid o'r un farn ag ef.

Nid ydym yn dweud nad yw Llywodraethau Cymru a San Steffan yn gwneud dim i ymdrin â'r materion hyn, ond yn hytrach ein bod am iddynt wneud rhagor a hynny'n gyflymach ac mewn modd mwy cyson a chydlynol. Mae'r Gweinidog yn gwrthod cefnogi'r cynnig hwn, gan ddweud na fuom yn ddigon penodol ond, pan fyddwn yn benodol, dywed wrthym ein bod yn rhy benodol, felly anodd yw gweld sut y gallwn ennill. Fel gwrthbleidiau, ein swyddogaeth yw tynnu sylw at wendidau ym mherfformiad y Llywodraeth, ond yr wyf yn fodlon cyflwyno papur hirfaith i'r Gweinidog os yw am gael y manylion.

Cyn ymateb i'r pwyntiau a wnaed, cynigiaf un awgrym y gallai'r Gweinidog ddymuno ei

want to take on board. The Welsh Assembly Government must develop a clear emissions reduction plan as part of the sustainable development action plan. We support the emissions reduction target of 20 per cent but, ideally, we would like to see the target becoming higher in practice. However, as it stands, the target risks being ambitious and unachievable because, without a clear plan with definite targets, it is difficult to see how action can proceed to delivery. The energy efficiency action plan also needs an urgent and complete overhaul with some solid targets for energy reduction, and much more in the way of resources. Those are just a few practical suggestions for you, Minister, and I am sure that we could give you more.

It is clear that we cannot ignore this issue. As Jocelyn Davies said, climate change already affects us in Wales, with communities experiencing flooding for the first time. The international impact is even more serious.

I turn to some of the comments made during the debate. I welcome Mick Bates's support of the motion and share some of his concerns about the depth of the Government's understanding and commitment. I remember asking the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside a question recently about a subsidy regime for fuel crops, which has already been introduced in England, but the Minister did not even understand the question, let alone answer it. Therefore, when the Minister for Economic Development and Transport tells us how we must take these issues seriously, he must remember that the Government also has work that it must do.

I endorse much of what Christine Gwyther said, particularly about young people's concerns. After all, it is their future. Whenever I meet young people to discuss these issues, I find that I am often the one who is learning, rather than telling them things that they do not know. I also endorse Christine's comments about the best practice developments in Carmarthenshire. However, we cannot wait for more exemplars. We know what we must do on many of these points, and we must act on what we already

ystyried. Rhaid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ddatblygu cynllun pendant ar gyfer lleihau gollyngiadau fel rhan o'r cynllun gweithredu ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Cefnogwn y targed o leihau gollyngiadau o 20 y cant ond, yn ddelfrydol, caredd weld targed uwch. Fodd bynnag, fel y mae, mae perygl i'r targed fod yn uchelgeisiol ac yn anghyraeddadwy oherwydd, os na cheir cynllun clir â thargedau penodol, anodd yw gweld sut y gellir cyflawni hynny. Hefyd, rhaid ailwampio'r cynllun gweithredu ar effeithlonrwydd ynni'n drylwyr ac ar fyrder gan bennu rhai targedau pendant ar gyfer arbed ynni, a darparu llawer mwy o adnoddau ar ei gyfer. Ychydig o awgrymiadau ymarferol i chi yw'r rhain, Weinidog, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y gallem gynnig rhagor i chi.

Mae'n amlwg na allwn anwybyddu'r mater hwn. Fel y dywedodd Jocelyn Davies, mae newid yn yr hinsawdd yn effeithio arnom eisoes yng Nghymru, gan y bu llifogydd mewn rhai cymunedau am y tro cyntaf. Mae'r effaith ryngwladol yn fwy difrifol byth.

Trof at rai o'r sylwadau a wnaed yn ystod y ddatblygu. Croesawaf y ffaith bod Mick Bates yn cefnogi'r cynnig a rhannaf rai o'i bryderon ynghylch dealltwriaeth ac ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth. Cofiaf imi ofyn cwestiwn i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad yn ddiweddar am gyfundrefn gymorthdaliadau ar gyfer cynyddau tanwydd, a gyflwynwyd eisoes yn Lloegr, ond ni ddeallodd y Gweinidog y cwestiwn hyd yn oed, heb sôn am ei ateb. Felly, pan ddywed y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth wrthym fod rhaid inni gymryd y materion hyn o ddiffrif, rhaid iddo yntau gofio bod gwaith i'w wneud gan y Llywodraeth hefyd.

Ategef lawer o'r hyn a ddywedodd Christine Gwyther, yn enwedig ynghylch pryderon pobl ifanc. Wedi'r cyfan, eu dyfodol hwy ydyw. Pryd bynnag y cyfarfyddaf â phobl ifanc i drafod y materion hyn, sylweddolaf yn aml mai myfi yw'r un sy'n dysgu, yn hytrach na fy mod i'n dweud pethau newydd wrthynt hwy. Yr wyf hefyd yn ategu'r sylwadau a wnaeth Christine am y datblygiadau o ran yr arferion gorau yn sir Gaerfyrddin. Er hynny, ni allwn ddisgwyl am ragor o esiamplau. Gwyddom beth y mae'n rhaid inni ei wneud i



know, as well as develop good practice for the future. We must make the Government's performance better and, after what Christine said, I am disappointed that the Government will not support our motion, though I can understand that some of the amendments may have been difficult to accept.

I am glad that Brynle is taking a constructive approach, and endorse much of what he said. Turning to Mark Isherwood, however—

**Andrew Davies:** Do we have to?

**Helen Mary Jones:** The Minister asks from his seated position 'Do we have to?' but, in responding to the debate, it would be negligent of me not to do so. As the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside said in his earlier intervention, I want Mark Isherwood to tell us where this research has come from and, importantly, who funded it.

**Mark Isherwood:** First, I support everything that Brynle Williams said, which was in line with my comments. Secondly, this report was mentioned in the weekend press, but came originally from *Der Spiegel* owing to a leak in Germany. The report was compiled by the Government's energy research agency and two other independent bodies, though they are not named in the report.

4.40 p.m.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I urge Mark Isherwood to be careful about believing all that he reads in the press. I would like to know who those independent bodies were and who was funding them. Perhaps Mark would be kind enough to share the actual research rather than the press report with us as other opposition parties, and with the Minister, so that we can all be enlightened.

If you will dismiss wind power, it is incumbent upon you to tell us what you propose as the short-term solution for reducing emissions.

ymateb i lawer o'r pwyntiau hyn, a rhaid inni weithredu ar sail yr hyn a wyddom eisoes, yn ogystal â datblygu arferion gorau ar gyfer y dyfodol. Rhaid inni wella perfformiad y Llywodraeth ac, yn dilyn yr hyn ddywedodd Christine, yr wyf yn siomedig na wnaiff y Llywodraeth gefnogi ein cynnig, er y gallaf ddeall y gallasai fod yn anodd iddi dderbyn rhai o'r gwelliannau.

Yr wyf yn falch bod Brynle yn ymdrin â hyn yn adeiladol, ac ategaf lawer o'r hyn a ddywedodd. Gan droi at Mark Isherwood, fodd bynnag—

**Andrew Davies:** A oes rhaid i ni?

**Helen Mary Jones:** Gofynna'r Gweinidog o'i sedd 'A oes rhaid i ni?' ond, wrth ymateb i'r ddadl hon, byddwn yn esgeulus pe na bawn yn gwneud hynny. Fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad yn ei ymyriad yn gynharach, yr wyf am i Mark Isherwood ddweud wrthym o ble y daeth yr ymchwil hon ac, yn bwysig, pwy a dalodd amdani.

**Mark Isherwood:** Yn gyntaf, cefnogaf bopeth a ddywedodd Brynle Williams, a oedd yn gyson â'm sylwadau i. Yn ail, cyfeiriwyd at yr adroddiad hwn yn y wasg dros y penwythnos, ond daeth o *Der Spiegel* yn wreiddiol, ar ôl ei ddatgelu yn yr Almaen. Lluniwyd yr adroddiad gan asiantaeth ymchwil ynni'r Llywodraeth a chan ddau gorff annibynnol arall, er na chânt eu henwi yn yr adroddiad.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Anogaf Mark Isherwood i fod yn ofalus ynghylch credu popeth y mae'n ei ddarllen yn y wasg. Carwn wybod pwy oedd y cyrff annibynnol hynny a phwy a oedd yn eu hariannu. Efallai y byddai Mark mor garedig â rhannu'r ymchwil ei hun yn hytrach na'r adroddiad yn y wasg gyda ni'r gwrthbleidiau eraill, a chyda'r Gweinidog, fel y gallwn oll gael ein goleuo.

Os ydych yn barod i wfftio ynni'r gwynt, rhaid ichi ddweud wrthym beth a gynigiwch fel ateb tymor byr i leihau gollyngiadau.

Our party does not believe that the approach in TAN 8 is perfect. We have made a reasoned response to it. We would agree that there needs to be much more emphasis on other renewables. I tell Mark Isherwood and anyone else in this Chamber and throughout Wales that wind power is much preferable to the nuclear alternative.

I welcome the Minister's repeated verbal commitment to these serious issues. Although they are welcome, none of the actions that the Minister outlined are new. We acknowledge that some progress has been made, but it needs to be more coherent and faster. Our party is not saying to workers in heavy industry that they should lose their jobs now, but, in the long term, emission issues will need to be addressed by the use of better technology, as the Minister said.

We are not saying that tackling this issue is easy. Our party, for one, needs no lessons from the Minister in supporting difficult decisions. Plaid Cymru Members have, for example, supported controversial windfarm developments in our constituencies, which was more than the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside was able to do over Scarweather sands. Please let there be no lessons about consistency from the Labour Party.

Finally, I am an optimist about these issues, and I believe that change is possible. We need to raise people's awareness, but we need to strike a balance between raising awareness and terrifying people, thereby causing them to turn away from the scale of the issue. It is important to highlight to people that many of the actions that need to be taken now to deal with climate change can be of immediate benefit to them. One such benefit could be a council tax rebate for homeowners who install renewable energy sources, and a coherent approach to home energy savings can cut bills as well as emissions.

The Members who do not support this motion

Nid yw ein plaid yn credu bod y dull gweithredu yn TAN 8 yn un perffaith. Yr ydym wedi cynnig ymateb rhesymedig iddo. Cytunem fod angen rhoi llawer mwy o bwyslais ar dechnolegau ynni adnewyddadwy eraill. Dywedaf wrth Mark Isherwood ac unrhyw un arall yn y Siambr hon a ledled Cymru fod ynni'r gwynt yn well nag ynni niwclear.

Croesawaf yr ymrwymiad a roddodd y Gweinidog sawl gwaith ar lafar i'r materion difrifol hyn. Er bod hynny i'w groesawu, nid yw'r Gweinidog wedi disgrifio unrhyw gamau gweithredu newydd. Cydnabyddwn fod peth cynnydd wedi'i wneud, ond rhaid ei gael yn gynt ac yn fwy cydlynol. Nid yw ein plaid yn dweud wrth weithwyr mewn diwydiannau trwm y dylent gollu eu swyddi'n awr, ond, yn y tymor hir, bydd yn rhaid ymdrin â materion sy'n ymwneud â gollyngiadau drwy ddefnyddio gwell technoleg, fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog.

Nid ydym yn dweud mai gwaith hawdd yw delio â'r mater hwn. Nid oes ar ein plaid ni angen unrhyw wersi gan y Gweinidog ar gefnogi penderfyniadau anodd. Er enghraifft, mae Aelodau Plaid Cymru wedi cefnogi cynigion dadleuol i ddatblygu ffermydd gwynt yn ein hetholaethau, sy'n fwy nag y gwnaeth y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad ynghylch cefnenni tywod Scarweather. Na foed i'r Blaid Lafur gynnig unrhyw wersi am gysondeb, os gweler yn dda.

Yn olaf, yr wyf yn obeithiol ynghylch y materion hyn, a chredaf fod newid yn bosibl. Rhaid inni hybu ymwybyddiaeth pobl, ond rhaid inni ddal y ddysgl yn wastad rhwng hybu ymwybyddiaeth a dychryn pobl, gan beri iddynt droi oddi wrth y mater hwn oherwydd ei ddifrifoldeb. Mae'n bwysig egluro i bobl y bydd llawer o'r camau y mae'n rhaid eu cymryd yn awr i ddelio â newid yn yr hinsawdd yn gallu dod â budd uniongyrchol iddynt hwy. Un budd posibl fyddai gostyngiad yn y dreth gyngor i berchnogion tai sy'n defnyddio ffynonellau ynni adnewyddadwy, a gall dull cydlynol o arbed ynni yn y cartref leihau biliau yn ogystal â gollyngiadau.

Mae'r Aelodau nad ydynt yn cefnogi'r

are, at best, at risk of being accused of complacency but, at worst, they might be seen to be siding with Bush and the oil industry and as ignoring the long-term threat for short-term gain. Having heard the Minister's response, I do not think that that accusation would be fair, however, we must take more action and do so faster. Future generations will not thank us if we fail to do so. I urge the Assembly to support the motion and amendment 1.

cynnig hwn mewn perygl, ar y gorau, o gael eu cyhuddo o fod yn ddifater ond, ar y gwaethaf, gellid barnu eu bod yn cymryd ochr Bush a'r diwydiant olew ac yn anwybyddu'r bygythiad tymor hir er mwyn ennill mantais yn y tymor byr. Wedi clywed ymateb y Gweinidog, ni chredaf y byddai cyhuddiad o'r fath yn deg. Er hynny, rhaid inni weithredu ymhellach ac yn gynt. Ni wnaiff cenedlaethau'r dyfodol ddiolch i ni os methwn â gwneud hynny. Anogaf y Cynulliad i gefnogi'r cynnig a gwelliant 1.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 25, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 1: For 25, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 15, Ymatal 10, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 2: For 15, Abstain 10, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary

Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 German, Michael  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Lloyd, David  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty

Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Francis, Lisa  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 15, Ymatal 10, Yn erbyn 30.  
 Amendment 3: For 15, Abstain 10, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 German, Michael  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Lloyd, David  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane

Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Francis, Lisa  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM2271): O blaid 15, Ymatal 10, Yn erbyn 30.*  
*Motion (NDM2271): For 15, Abstain 10, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 German, Michael  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Lloyd, David  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl

Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Francis, Lisa  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion defeated.*

**Dadl o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 31: Deddfwriaeth Arfaethedig o dan Ddeddf Tai  
 1996**  
**Debate under Standing Order No. 31: Proposed Legislation under the Housing  
 Act 1996**

**Gwenda Thomas:** Cynigiaf fod

**Gwenda Thomas:** I propose that

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 31.2:*

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 31.2:*

*1. yn cyfarwyddo'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio i gyflwyno is-ddeddfwriaeth ddrafft o dan adrannau 210(2)(b) a 215(2) Deddf Tai 1996 i ddarparu y bydd y materion canlynol yn cael eu hystyried wrth benderfynu a fyddai'n rhesymol i berson sy'n agored i niwed gael lle mewn llety, ac wrth benderfynu a yw llety yn addas i berson sy'n agored i niwed:*

*1. instructs the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration to bring forward draft subordinate legislation under sections 210(2)(b) and 215(2) of the Housing Act 1996 to provide that, in determining whether it would be reasonable for a vulnerable person to occupy accommodation and in determining whether accommodation is suitable for a vulnerable person, there shall be taken into account the following matters:*

*a) anghenion iechyd penodol y person sy'n agored i niwed;*

*a) the specific health needs of the vulnerable person;*

*b) pa mor agos a hygyrch yw'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol;*

*b) the proximity and accessibility of social services;*

*c) pa mor agos a hygyrch yw'r gwasanaethau cefnogi teuluoedd a'r gwasanaethau cefnogi eraill;*

*c) the proximity and accessibility of family support and other support services;*

*ch) anabledd penodol y person sy'n agored i niwed; a*

*d) the particular disability of the vulnerable person; and*

*2. yn cytuno y bydd y diffiniad o 'person sy'n agored i niwed' yn cynnwys:*

*2. agrees that the definition of a 'vulnerable person' shall include:*

- |  |   |
|--|---|
| a) menywod beichiog;                               | a) pregnant women;                              |
| b) rhieni sengl (boed yn wryw neu fenyw);          | b) single parents (whether male or female);     |
| c) pobl ifanc sy'n gadael gofal;                   | c) young persons leaving care;                  |
| ch) oedolion ifanc anabl;                          | d) disabled young adults;                       |
| d) plant ag anabledau;                             | e) children with disabilities;                  |
| ynghyd â ffactorau perthnasol eraill.<br>(NDM2225) | along with other relevant factors.<br>(NDM2225) |

Yr wyf yn falch o gael y cyfle i gynnig y cynnig hwn gerbron Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Yr wyf yn hyderus y caiff ei dderbyn gan Aelodau ar draws y pleidiau gwleidyddol. A derbyn y bydd digon o gefnogaeth, yr wyf yn ffyddiog y bydd y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio yn ymateb yn bositif i ewyllys Aelodau'r meinciau cefn.

I am pleased to have been given the opportunity to propose this motion before the National Assembly for Wales. I am confident that it will be adopted by Members from all political parties. Assuming that the motion gains sufficient support, I am confident that the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration will respond positively to the will of backbench Members.

Mae gennym gyfle heddiw i geisio sicrhau y caiff deddfwriaeth ei chyflwyno a fydd yn gorfodi awdurdodau lleol i wneud cynnig rhesymol o gartrefi i bobl fregus. Mae rhai awdurdodau eisoes, o'u gwirfodd, yn darparu hyn, a hynny o fewn yr adnoddau ariannol sydd ganddynt. Mae pob un o'r ffactorau sydd i'w hystyried eisoes wedi eu cynnwys o fewn adran berthnasol y Cod Cyfarwyddyd i Awdurdodau Lleol ar Ddyrannu Llety a Digartrefedd. Felly, maent yn faterion y dylai awdurdodau fod yn casglu gwybodaeth yn eu cylch ac yn eu prisio eisoes.

We have an opportunity today to try to ensure the introduction of legislation that will compel local authorities to make a reasonable offer of housing to vulnerable people. Some authorities already do this voluntarily within the financial resources that they currently have. All the factors for consideration have already been included within the relevant section of the Code of Guidance for Local Authorities on Allocation of Accommodation and Homelessness. Therefore, they are issues that local authorities should be gathering information about and should already be costing.

Fel cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal a'r grŵp adolygu ar ddiogelu plant bregus, teimlaf fod testun y cynnig hwn yn amserol, yn angenrheidiol ac yn gwireddu egwyddorion 'Gwell Cymru'.

As chair of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity and the review group on protecting vulnerable children, I feel that the topic of this motion is timely, necessary and realises the principles of 'Better Wales'.

Mae'r erthyglau diweddar yn y *South Wales Evening Post* ynglŷn â phrofiad pobl ifanc ddigartref a digymorth wedi dylanwadu'n fawr ar fy newis o ddeddfwriaeth. Yr oedd llawer o'r bobl ifanc hyn newydd adael gofal llywodraeth leol. Mawr oedd yr angen am gartref addas a chymorth yn eu bywydau beunyddiol.

Recent articles in the *South Wales Evening Post* on the experiences of unsupported homeless young people have had a great influence on my choice of legislation. Many of these young people had just left local authority care. Their need for an appropriate home and appropriate support in their daily lives was great.

In preparing for today's debate, I consulted Wrth baratoi ar gyfer y ddadl heddiw,

with various organisations, and I will use the remaining time available to me to highlight some of the concerns expressed. The Equal Opportunities Commission expressed concern regarding the availability and affordability of childcare provision. The lack of available childcare in some of our most deprived communities is likely to mean that women with new babies and lone parents will rely more heavily on family support in order to return to, or remain in, work. The proximity and accessibility of family support should be an important consideration when offering accommodation.

In 2003, the Welsh Assembly Government commissioned a review of the implementation of homelessness legislation. The resulting report revealed widespread concern about the nature and use of temporary accommodation in particular. There were concerns about the lack of facilities and the inappropriate mixed use by clients with different support needs, with increasing numbers of households placed in bed-and-breakfast establishments outside their local authority area.

Shelter Cymru has offered vivid and harrowing examples of the experiences of young people, including lone parents, placed in bed-and-breakfast accommodation. Jackie and her two sons, aged 10 and four, became homeless as a result of having to flee violence. The family was placed in bed-and-breakfast accommodation while awaiting review. Most of the people in the bed-and-breakfast establishment at that time were either ex-offenders or drug users, and Jackie had to share one room with her two sons. The family was in that accommodation for around four months, and the pressure of living in this environment for this length of time caused the family increasing stress and, ultimately, to split. In 1989, the Audit Commission report, 'Housing the Homeless: the Local Authority Role' stated that bed-and-breakfast accommodation was unsuitable for family life.

4.50 p.m.

The Disability Rights Commission, in its response to 'Better Homes for People in

ymgynghorais ag amryw o gyrff, a defnyddiaf weddill yr amser sydd ar gael i mi i dynnu sylw at rai o'r pryderon a fynegwyd. Gwnaeth y Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal fynegi pryder ynghylch y gallu i gael ac i fforddio gofal plant. Am nad yw gofal plant ar gael yn rhai o'n cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig, mae'n debygol y bydd menywod â babanod newydd a rhieni senl yn dibynnu'n fwy ar gymorth eu teulu er mwyn gallu aildechrau gweithio neu aros mewn gwaith. Dylai agosrwydd a hygyrchedd cymorth teuluol fod yn ystyriaeth bwysig wrth gynnig llety.

Yn 2003, gwnaeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gomisiynu adolygiad o'r modd yr oedd deddfwriaeth ar ddigartrefedd yn cael ei rhoi ar waith. Yr oedd yr adroddiad a gafwyd yn sgîl hynny'n dangos bod pryder cyffredinol ynghylch natur y llety dros dro yn benodol, a'r defnydd ohono. Mynegwyd pryderon ynghylch diffyg cyfleusterau a defnydd cymysg amhriodol gan gleientiaid a oedd â gwahanol anghenion o ran cymorth, gan fod mwyfwy o deuluoedd yn cael eu lleoli mewn llety gwely a brecwast y tu allan i ardal eu hawdurdod lleol.

Mae Shelter Cymru wedi cynnig enghreifftiau byw a dirdynol o brofiadau pobl ifanc, gan gynnwys rhieni senl, a roddwyd mewn llety gwely a brecwast. Yr oedd Jackie a'i dau fab, a oedd yn bedair ac yn 10 oed, wedi dod yn ddigartref ar ôl gorfod ffoi rhag trais. Rhoddwyd y teulu mewn llety gwely a brecwast wrth ddisgwyl adolygiad. Yr oedd y rhan fwyaf o'r bobl yn y llety gwely a brecwast ar y pryd un ai'n gyn-droseddwyr neu'n defnyddio cyffuriau, a bu'n rhaid i Jackie rannu un ystafell â'i dau fab. Bu'r teulu yn y llety hwnnw am tua phedwar mis, ac yr oedd y pwysau o fyw o dan yr amgylchiadau hyn gyhyd wedi achosi straen cynyddol i'r teulu gan beri iddynt wahanu yn y pen draw. Yn 1989, yn adroddiad y Comisiwn Archwilio, 'Housing the Homeless: the Local Authority Role' dywedwyd bod llety gwely a brecwast yn anaddas i deulu fyw ynddo.

Dywedodd y Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd, yn ei ymateb i 'Cartrefi Gwell i Bobl



Wales', stated that suitable accessible housing is a fundamental right of disabled people if they are to be able to live independently and participate fully in society. Disabled people commonly face many barriers related to housing, including an inaccessible built environment, inaccessible public transport, and discriminatory or patronising attitudes. The Disability Rights Commission makes the point that many disabled people who live in rural areas face additional barriers in terms of even lower numbers of accessible housing than in urban areas. Disabled young adults face severe difficulties during the transition to adulthood, and the proximity and accessibility of family support, or other support services, is crucial to their wellbeing.

The adapted housing project in Rhondda Cynon Taf, funded by a Welsh Assembly Government grant, is an excellent example of what can be achieved through partnership working. The project is helping to transform recommendations in the Assembly's housing strategy, 'Better Homes for People in Wales', into practice, by promoting equality of access to social housing, understanding the difficulties faced by disabled people with physical impairments, and developing and promoting the benefits of locally based accessibility and adaptation registers.

The Commission for Racial Equality makes the point that the particular needs of black and ethnic minorities should be recognised. Care should be taken when offers of accommodation are made, because, in some circumstances, there is a particular form of vulnerability that can be imposed on those who are from ethnic minorities. The specific health needs of vulnerable people should also be a consideration, as substandard and unsuitable housing can worsen mental health difficulties.

The needs of older people with varying levels of dependency have been recognised. I am pleased to mention the Ysbryd y Môr extra-care housing development, which has been provided in partnership between Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council, Dewi Sant Housing Association and the National Assembly, through the social housing grant. The development, built on Aberavon sea

Cymru', fod gan bobl anabl hawl sylfaenol i fyw mewn tai hygyrch ac addas os ydynt i allu byw'n annibynnol a chymryd rhan lawn mewn cymdeithas. Mae'n arferol i bobl anabl wynebu llawer o rwystrau mewn cysylltiad â thai, gan gynnwys amgylchedd adeiledig anhygyrch, trafndiaeth gyhoeddus anhygyrch, ac ymagweddu gwahaniaethol neu nawddoglyd. Mae'r Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd yn nodi bod llawer o bobl anabl sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn wynebu rhwystrau ychwanegol am fod llai byth o dai hygyrch yno nag mewn ardaloedd trefol. Mae oedolion ifanc anabl yn wynebu anawsterau dybryd wrth ddod i oed, ac mae agosrwydd a hygyrchedd cymorth teuluol, neu wasanaethau cymorth eraill, yn hollbwysig er eu lles.

Mae'r prosiect tai addasedig yn Rhondda Cynon Taf, a ariannwyd drwy grant gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, yn enghraifft ragorol o'r hyn y gellir ei gyflawni drwy weithio ar y cyd. Mae'r prosiect hwnnw'n helpu i roi ar waith yr argymhellion yn strategaeth tai'r Cynulliad, 'Cartrefi Gwell i Bobl Cymru', drwy hybu mynediad cyfartal i dai cymdeithasol, drwy ddeall yr anawsterau a wynebir gan bobl anabl sydd â nam corfforol, a thrwy ddatblygu a hyrwyddo manteision cofrestrau hygyrchedd ac addasiadau sydd ar gael yn lleol.

Mae'r Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb Hiliol yn nodi y dylid ystyried anghenion penodol lleiafrifoedd pobl dduon a lleiafrifoedd ethnig. Dylid bod yn ofalus wrth gynnig llety, oherwydd, mewn rhai amgylchiadau, gellir peri i rai o leiafrifoedd ethnig fod yn agored i niwed o fath penodol. Dylid hefyd ystyried anghenion iechyd penodol y rhai sy'n agored i niwed, gan fod tai israddol ac anaddas yn gallu gwaethygu anawsterau o ran iechyd meddwl.

Cydnabuwyd anghenion pobl hŷn sydd â gwahanol lefelau o ddibyniaeth. Yr wyf yn falch o grybwyll Ysbryd y Môr, y datblygiad tai â gofal ychwanegol a ddarparwyd drwy bartneriaeth rhwng Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Castell-nedd Port Talbot, Cymdeithas Dai Dewi Sant a'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, drwy'r grant tai cymdeithasol. Mae'r datblygiad hwn, a godwyd ar lan y môr yn

front, has 50 units, 25 of which provide sheltered accommodation and 25, extra care. The development allows all the tenants to feel safe and secure, with 24-hour support, but also allows them to maintain their independence and privacy, and to keep in touch with their family and friends. The facilities that are available include a shop, which is run by the tenants, a hairdressing salon, a restaurant, and a library with full access to the internet. There is also one room available for visitors to stay overnight, for a nominal fee. This is an exemplar of suitable housing.

The rights of children and young people are best summed up in the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child. Article 3 states that, when adults or organisations make decisions that affect children, they must always think first what would be in the best interests of the child. This principle extends to the offer of suitable housing, when a child is assessed as vulnerable. The children's national service framework for health highlights the devastating effect that homelessness can have on children and young people, and calls on local authorities to place homeless families in bed-and-breakfast accommodation only in emergencies, and then for not more than two weeks. The report of the task group on child poverty highlighted the need to reduce the use of bed-and-breakfast accommodation for families.

It should be added that, although the Welsh Assembly Government was groundbreaking in extending the categories of homeless people for whom local authorities have a requirement to provide accommodation, there are concerns over the form of housing that is sometimes offered. For vulnerable people, the wrong type of housing in the wrong location can have serious consequences for long-term independent living, social disadvantage and general wellbeing. There is widespread concern regarding the cut in the Supporting People programme for 2005-06, although your representations to the Westminster Government on this issue, Minister, are to be commended.

Aberafan, yn cynnwys 50 o unedau, y mae 25 ohonynt yn cynnig llety cysgodol, a 25 yn cynnig gofal ychwanegol. Mae'r datblygiad hwn yn caniatáu i'r holl denantiaid deimlo'n ddiogel a sicr, gyda gofal 24 awr, ond mae hefyd yn caniatáu iddynt gadw eu hannibyniaeth a'u preifatrwydd, a chadw mewn cysylltiad â'u teulu a'u ffrindiau. Ymysg y cyfleusterau sydd ar gael y mae siop, sy'n cael ei rhedeg gan y tenantiaid, siop drin gwallt, bwyty, a llyfrgell sydd â chyswllt â'r rhyngwyd. Mae un ystafell ar gael hefyd i ymwelwyr gael aros dros nos, am dâl bach. Mae hwn yn batrwm o ran darparu tai addas.

Gellir deall hawliau plant a phobl ifanc orau drwy gyfeirio at Gytundeb y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar Hawliau'r Plentyn. Yn ôl erthygl 3, pan fydd oedolion neu gyrff yn gwneud penderfyniadau sy'n effeithio ar blant, rhaid iddynt ystyried yn gyntaf bob amser beth a fyddai orau er budd y plentyn. Mae'r egwyddor hon yn berthnasol pan gynigir llety, os bernir bod y plentyn yn agored i niwed. Mae'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer iechyd plant yn tynnu sylw at yr effaith ddinistriol y gall digartrefedd ei chael ar blant a phobl ifanc, ac yn galw ar awdurdodau lleol i roi teuluoedd digartref mewn llety gwely a breswast mewn achosion o argyfwng yn unig, ac wedyn am ddim mwy na phythefnos. Yn adroddiad y grŵp gorchwyl ar dlodi plant, tynnwyd sylw at yr angen i wneud llai o ddefnydd o lety gwely a breswast ar gyfer teuluoedd.

Dylid ychwanegu, er bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn torri tir newydd drwy ymestyn y categorïau o bobl ddigartref y mae'n ofynnol i awdurdodau lleol gynnig llety iddynt, fod pryderon weithiau ynghylch y math o dai a gynigir. Yn achos pobl sy'n agored i niwed, mae eu rhoi yn y math anghywir o dai yn y lle anghywir yn gallu amharu'n ddirfawr ar eu gallu i fyw'n annibynnol yn y tymor hir ac ar eu lles cyffredinol, gan beri anfantais gymdeithasol. Mae pryder cyffredinol ynghylch y torri ar raglen Cefnogi Pobl ar gyfer 2005-06, er bod y sylwadau a gyflwynasoch i'r Llywodraeth yn San Steffan ar y mater hwn i'w cymeradwyo, Weinidog.

The principle of mainstreaming equality underlined my intention when tabling this motion. The Assembly's statutory duty to promote equality is unique in the UK.

In accepting the recommendations of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity's report on mainstreaming equality, the Assembly has accepted the challenge to embed equality principles fully and effectively in every part of the Assembly's work. The motion before you is the embodiment of that ideal. It calls for the specific needs of vulnerable people, including all those represented by the various equality strands, to be taken into account in determining whether or not accommodation is suitable for their needs.

There are examples of good practice on the part of local authorities and the social housing sector. The voluntary sector also plays an important role in providing support services. I therefore believe that, if draft subordinate legislation is brought forward as a result of this motion, we will be making the connection in the delivery of housing services.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Yr ydym yn cefnogi ysbryd y cynnig hwn, a byddwn yn cefnogi'r cynnig ei hun. Y Llywodraeth Doriaidd, credaf, a wnaeth y penderfyniad i dynnu'r hawl oddi wrth gynghorwyr i gymryd rhan yn y broses o osod tai, a chefnogwyd hynny gan y Llywodraeth Lafur. Yr oedd manteision i hyn, ac yr oeddwn i o'i blaid, ond diflannodd gryn dipyn o hyblygrwydd o'r system wrth i gynghorau lleol, yn arbennig, orfod gweithredu yn ôl fformiwla arbennig yn union. Mae hynny hefyd yn wir, i raddau, am gymdeithasau tai. Yr oedd yr hyblygrwydd hwnnw yn bwysig a defnyddiwyd ef yn aml er lles, er bod anfanteision hefyd.

Ai drwy is-ddeddfwriaeth y mae cael y maen i'r wal yn hyn o beth? Nid wyf yn anghytuno â'ch dadleuon a'r rhesymeg dros wneud hyn, ond a fyddai cyfarwyddyd gan y Gweinidog, y gellid ei gyhoeddi yn syth, yn ffordd well o wneud hyn? Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn agored i gael fy mherswadio ar hynny. Pan oeddwn i mewn llywodraeth leol, yr wyf yn cofio

Yr oedd yr egwyddor o brif ffrydio cydraddoldeb yn ategu fy mwriad wrth gyflwyno'r cynnig hwn. Mae dyletswydd statudol y Cynulliad i hyrwyddo cydraddoldeb yn unigryw yn y DU.

Drwy dderbyn yr argymhellion yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal ar brif ffrydio cydraddoldeb, mae'r Cynulliad wedi derbyn yr her i ymgorffori egwyddorion cydraddoldeb yn llawn ac yn effeithiol ym mhob rhan o waith y Cynulliad. Mae'r cynnig sydd ger eich bron yn ymgorffori'r egwyddor honno. Mae'n galw am ystyried anghenion penodol y rhai sy'n agored i niwed, sy'n cynnwys pawb a gynrychiolir gan y gwahanol elfennau cydraddoldeb, wrth bennu a yw llety'n addas i'w hanghenion ai peidio.

Ceir enghreifftiau o ymarfer da ar ran awdurdodau lleol a'r sector tai cymdeithasol. Mae'r sector gwirfoddol yn chwarae rhan bwysig hefyd wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau cymorth. Credaf, felly, os rhoddir is-ddeddfwriaeth ddrafft gerbron o ganlyniad i'r cynnig hwn, y byddwn yn ymestyn hyn i'r gwaith o ddarparu gwasanaethau tai.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** We support the spirit of this motion, and we will support the motion itself. I believe that it was the Tory Government that made the decision to remove councillors' rights to participate in the process of letting houses, and the Labour Government supported that. There were advantages to this, and I was in favour of it, but a great deal of flexibility disappeared from the system as local councils, especially, had to act exactly in accordance with a particular formula. That is also true, to a certain extent, of housing associations. That flexibility was important and it was often used to advantage, although there were also disadvantages.

Is subordinate legislation the best way to get to grips with this issue? I do not disagree with your arguments and rationale for doing this, but would guidance from the Minister, which could be issued immediately, be a better way of doing this? However, I am open to persuasion on that. When I was in local government, I remember arguing with

dadlau gyda swyddogion y dylai'r bobl hyn—mamau a rhieni sengl a merched ifanc yn arbennig—gael eu gosod, lle'n bosibl, yn ymyl i'w teuluoedd er mwyn iddynt gael cefnogaeth. Peth syml oedd hynny, ond yr oedd swyddogion yn aml yn dweud ei fod yn amhosibl oherwydd bod y fformiwla yn golygu mai rhywun arall oedd ar ben y rhestr.

Cytunaf y dylai hyn fod yn ystyriaeth hollbwysig o ran lles teuluoedd ifanc. Mae'r un peth yn wir am bobl yn y categorïau eraill yr ydych yn eu henwi.

Yr wyf yn amau ein bod yn rhoi gormod o ddeddfwriaeth ar lywodraeth leol weithiau. Dyna fy unig amheuaeth ynglŷn â'ch cynnig, a tybed a fyddai modd gweithredu hwn yn well drwy gyfarwyddyd gan y Gweinidog. Fodd bynnag, fel yr wyf wedi'i ddweud, yr wyf yn agored i gael fy mherswadio ar hyn.

**Catherine Thomas:** I thank Gwenda for providing us with an opportunity to debate this important issue. Several of the concerns that Gwenda raised described many cases that I have encountered in my own constituency and situations that I came across when I worked for a Cardiff-based Member of Parliament. Consequently, much of my contribution is based on anecdotal evidence.

Like many other Assembly Members, I come into regular contact with a significant number of individuals who are housed in accommodation that is neither appropriate nor adequate to meet their needs. These individuals, due to a wide range of often complex reasons, are also extremely vulnerable. The Social Justice and Regeneration Committee has discussed the housing needs of vulnerable people at length. Much of the committee's work has a housing dimension, and that can be in the form of a review into housing for older people, housing for ex-offenders, or housing for those fleeing domestic abuse.

5.00 p.m.

The committee understands the vital importance of housing and that it is not just about bricks and mortar but about somewhere that can become a real home, where an

officials that these people—single mothers, single parents and young women in particular—should be placed, where possible, close to their families so that they had support. It was a simple matter, but officials often said that it was impossible because the formula meant that somebody else was at the top of the list.

I agree that this should be a vital consideration in terms of the welfare of young families. The same is true of people in the other categories that you name.

I suspect that we sometimes impose too much legislation on local government. That is my only concern with your motion, and I wonder whether this could be better implemented by means of guidance from the Minister. However, as I have said, I am open to persuasion on this.

**Catherine Thomas:** Diolchaf i Gwenda am roi cyfle inni drafod y pwnc pwysig hwn. Mae nifer o'r pryderon y cyfeiriodd Gwenda atynt yn berthnasol i lawer o'r achosion a welais yn fy etholaeth fy hun ac mewn sefyllfaoedd y deuthum ar eu traws pan fŵm yn gweithio i Aelod Seneddol yng Nghaerdydd. Oherwydd hynny, mae llawer o'm cyfraniad yn seiliedig ar dystiolaeth anecdotaidd.

Fel llawer o Aelodau Cynulliad eraill, deuaif i gysylltiad yn rheolaidd â nifer fawr o unigolion sydd wedi cael eu cartrefu mewn llety nad yw'n briodol nac yn ddigonol i ddiwallu eu hanghenion. Mae'r unigolion hynny, am amryw o resymau cymhleth yn aml, yn agored iawn i niwed hefyd. Mae'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio wedi trafod anghenion tai y rhai sy'n agored i niwed yn hirfaith. Mae llawer o waith y pwyllgor yn ymwneud â thai, a gall hynny fod drwy gynnal adolygiad o dai ar gyfer pobl hŷn, tai ar gyfer cyn-droseddwr, neu dai ar gyfer rhai sy'n ffoi rhag eu camdrin yn y cartref.

Mae'r pwyllgor yn deall bod tai'n fater hollbwysig a'i fod yn ymwneud â mwy na'r adeiladau eu hunain ac yn golygu rhywle a all fod yn gartref go iawn, lle y mae unigolyn yn

individual feels safe and secure and where they look forward to spending time. Sadly, too many of our most vulnerable citizens, who are often trying to rebuild their lives, do not feel that they have a real home. Instead, they feel extremely unsafe in their accommodation and, rather than viewing it as a place that they enjoy returning to, they consider it to be a place where they dread spending time.

**Janet Ryder:** I know that it is at the opposite end of the country, but in Flintshire there is an excellent example of a Save the Family project, which offers support and accommodation for homeless families. I know that an offer has been made to the Minister and to the committee on a number of occasions to visit it. Will you support me in asking the Minister and the committee again to visit that excellent project in Flintshire? It is worth seeing and its work is outstanding.

**Catherine Thomas:** I know that we had an opportunity to visit a number of projects in the last year as members of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee, and that the Minister is always willing, if she can, to visit projects and for the committee to do so also. I am sure that the Minister will address that issue in her response to you. If someone is to rebuild his or her life, it is vital that a holistic approach is taken in assisting with that rebuilding, especially by the services involved. If that approach is not taken, no real progress is made, and, more often than not, a great deal of damage can be done. Every aspect of the individual's life must be considered, and housing is fundamental. Take, for example, individuals who are mentally ill. Securing appropriate and adequate housing is of paramount importance if they are to overcome their illness and rebuild their lives. It is vital, therefore, that housing officers dealing with their cases are aware of their illness and understand the importance of appropriate housing.

teimlo'n ddiogel ac yn sicr a lle yr edrycha ymlaen at dreulio amser. Gwaetha'r modd, mae gormod o lawer o ddinasyddion sy'n agored i niwed, sydd yn aml yn ceisio ailddechrau byw, nad ydynt yn teimlo bod ganddynt gartref go iawn. Yn lle hynny, teimlant yn anniogel iawn yn eu llety ac, yn hytrach na'i ystyried yn fan y maent yn hoffi dychwelyd iddo, fe'i gwelant yn lle y maent yn arswydo rhag treulio amser ynddo.

**Janet Ryder:** Gwn fod hyn ym mhen arall y wlad, ond, yn sir y Fflint, ceir enghraifft ragorol ym mhrosiect Save the Family, sy'n cynnig cymorth a llety i deuluoedd digartref. Gwn fod y Gweinidog a'r pwyllgor wedi cael cynnig i ddod i'w weld ar sawl achlysur. A wnewch fy nghefnogi wrth ofyn eto i'r Gweinidog a'r pwyllgor ymweld â'r prosiect rhagorol hwnnw yn sir y Fflint? Mae'n werth ei weld ac mae'n gwneud gwaith rhagorol.

**Catherine Thomas:** Gwn ein bod wedi cael cyfle i ymweld â sawl prosiect yn y flwyddyn a aeth heibio fel aelodau'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, a bod y Gweinidog bob amser yn barod i ymweld â phrosiectau, os gall wneud hynny, ac i'r pwyllgor wneud hynny hefyd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Gweinidog yn trafod y mater hwnnw wrth ymateb i chi. Os yw rhywun i ailymsefydlu, mae'n hollbwysig ymgymryd â dull gweithredu cyfannol wrth ei helpu i wneud hynny, yn enwedig ar ran y gwasanaethau sy'n gysylltiedig. Os na weithredir mewn modd felly, ni wneir cynnydd gwirioneddol, ac, yn amlach na pheidio, gellir gwneud llawer o niwed. Rhaid ystyried pob agwedd ar fywyd yr unigolyn, ac mae tai'n hollbwysig. Ystyrier, er enghraifft, unigolion sydd â salwch meddwl. Mae'n hollbwysig sicrhau tai addas a digonol ar eu cyfer os ydynt i drechu eu salwch ac ailymsefydlu. Mae'n hanfodol, felly, fod swyddogion tai sy'n delio â'u hachosion yn gwybod am eu salwch ac yn deall mor bwysig yw darparu tai addas.

During the past 15 years, I have dealt with a substantial number of housing cases and have been amazed by the housing solutions offered by some social housing providers to those with a mental illness. When will it be understood that you do not offer accommodation on the tenth floor of a tower block to someone suffering from acute depression? Neither do you offer accommodation in a block of flats to someone suffering from post traumatic stress disorder, who cannot, due to their illness, cope with a property that has shared access. When individuals explain that they cannot accept the accommodation being offered, they are often classed as being too choosy and difficult, and it is deemed therefore that they cannot be helped. However, these individuals have made it clear from the outset what is suitable and what is not, based not on being difficult, but on their illness. Those with a mental health illness should not be placed on a general housing list, because they could remain on the list for far too long, during which time their condition usually worsens. In addition, the list often fails to take into account their specific housing needs.

I am also concerned about the lack of social housing provision for victims of domestic abuse. In the most recent Social Justice and Regeneration Committee meeting, I raised my concern at the number of local authorities that have failed to deliver any kind of housing strategy to support victims of abuse. As a result, many women and children, as Gwenda has already mentioned, are housed in bed-and-breakfast accommodation that is often cold and damp, and are forced to use shared bathroom and toilet facilities. Sometimes, these facilities are also shared by those who are misusing drugs and alcohol. Often, women and children are far removed from friends and family and the vital emotional support that they can give, and far removed from the child's school, resulting in one vital element of continuity in the child's life being removed. Furthermore, many bed and breakfasts have strict rules that mean that occupants are not permitted to remain in their rooms for most of the day and are only allowed to return during the early evening. Putting women and children in such situations is unacceptable, and I am glad that

Yn ystod y 15 mlynedd diwethaf, yr wyf wedi delio â nifer sylweddol o achosion tai ac wedi rhyfeddu at rai o'r atebion o ran tai a gynigiwyd gan rai darparwyr tai cymdeithasol i'r rhai sydd â salwch meddwl. Pa bryd y deallir na ddylid cynnig llety ar y degfed llawr mewn blocdwr i rywun sy'n dioddef gan iselder ysbryd difrifol? Ni ddylid ychwaith gynnig llety mewn bloc fflatiau i rywun sy'n dioddef gan glefyd straen ôl-drawmatig, na all ddygymod, oherwydd ei salwch, ag adeilad lle y ceir mynedfa ar y cyd. Pan yw unigolion yn egluro na allant dderbyn y llety a gynnigir, bernir yn aml eu bod yn rhy anodd eu plesio a'u trin, ac ystyrir felly na ellir eu cynorthwyo. Fodd bynnag, mae'r unigolion hyn wedi egluro o'r cychwyn yr hyn sy'n addas a'r hyn nad yw'n addas, nid am eu bod yn anodd eu trin, ond oherwydd eu salwch. Ni ddylid rhoi'r rhai sydd â salwch meddwl ar restr tai gyffredinol, gan y gallent aros ar y rhestr yn rhy hir o lawer, a bydd eu salwch yn gwaethygu fel arfer yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw. Yn ogystal â hynny, mae'r rhestr yn aml yn methu â darparu ar gyfer eu hanghenion tai penodol.

Yr wyf finnau'n bryderus ynghylch y diffyg yn y ddarpariaeth o dai cymdeithasol ar gyfer y rhai sy'n dioddef gan drais yn y cartref. Yng nghyfarfod diwethaf y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, mynegais bryder ynghylch nifer yr awdurdodau lleol sydd wedi methu â chynnig unrhyw fath o strategaeth tai i gynorthwyo rhai sy'n cael eu cam-drin. O ganlyniad i hynny, mae llawer o fenywod a phlant, fel y mae Gwenda wedi nodi eisoes, yn cael eu cartrefu mewn llety gwely a brechwast sy'n aml yn oer ac yn llaith, ac yn cael eu gorfodi i rannu ystafell ymolchi a thoiled. Weithiau, mae'r cyfleusterau hynny'n cael eu rhannu hefyd â rhai sy'n camddefnyddio cyffuriau ac alcohol. Yn aml, mae menywod a phlant yn bell o'u ffrindiau a'u teulu a'r gefnogaeth emosiynol hanfodol y gallant ei chynnig, ac yn bell o ysgol y plentyn, fel bod un elfen gyson a phwysig ym mywyd y plentyn yn cael ei dileu. At hynny, ceir rheolau caeth mewn sawl llety gwely a brechwast sy'n golygu na chaiff deiliaid aros yn eu hystafelloedd y rhan fwyaf o'r diwrnod ac na chânt ond dychwelyd gyda'r hwyr.

this situation has already been highlighted by the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee, and by Gwenda today.

To conclude, there are many other areas that I would like to address, including the lack of refuges for male victims of abuse and the lack of housing for women asylum seekers who are also fleeing domestic abuse from a partner who has also secured asylum in this country. I hope that, after today's debate, some of these issues of great importance can be addressed and fewer citizens will have to endure housing that none of us would want to call 'home'.

**William Graham:** I have a great deal of sympathy with Gwenda Thomas's proposals today and I understand many of the important points that she has already raised. It is important to consider the challenges that each individual faces when determining suitable accommodation. Elderly individuals, as well as those with a history of substance abuse, are often left off the list of vulnerable persons. Substance abusers are often overlooked because of the social stigma associated with being an abuser. It is important to realise that someone recovering from substance abuse is at as great a risk as others of being the victims of crime as well as of physical and mental abuse.

The risks associated with the elderly are more obvious. We should attempt to make health treatment as easy and as convenient as possible for the elderly. We might call into question the current status of the out-of-hours contract for general practitioners. On other key points, it is reasonable for pregnant women, disabled young adults and children with learning difficulties to have easy access to social services. Disabled individuals should not be grouped into one large category. Many people with disabilities require specific care, which should be addressed when determining the most suitable and accessible accommodation.

To take the definition of reasonable

Annerbyniol yw rhoi menywod a phlant mewn sefyllfaoedd o'r fath, ac yr wyf yn falch bod y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio wedi tynnu sylw at y sefyllfa hon eisoes, fel y gwnaeth Gwenda heddiw.

I gloi, mae llawer o feysydd eraill y carwn ymdrin â hwy, gan gynnwys prinder llochesi i ddynion sy'n cael eu cam-drin a diffyg tai ar gyfer menywod sy'n ceisio lloches sy'n ffoi rhag camdriniaeth yn y cartref gan gymar sydd hefyd wedi cael lloches yn y wlad hon. Yr wyf yn gobeithio, ar ôl y ddaidl heddiw, y gellir ymdrin â rhai o'r materion tra phwysig hyn ac y bydd llai o ddinasyddion yn gorfod dioddef byw mewn tai na fyddai'r un ohonom am ei alw'n 'gartref'.

**William Graham:** Cydymdeimlaf yn fawr â'r hyn y mae Gwenda Thomas yn ei gynnig heddiw a deallaf lawer o'r pwyntiau pwysig y mae wedi'u codi eisoes. Mae'n bwysig ystyried yr heriau y mae pob unigolyn yn eu hwynebu wrth benderfynu ar lety addas. Yn aml, bydd pobl oedrannus, yn ogystal â rhai sydd â hanes o gamddefnyddio sylweddau, yn cael eu gadael allan o'r rhestr o rai sy'n agored i niwed. Anwybyddir yn aml y rhai sy'n camddefnyddio sylweddau oherwydd y gwarth cymdeithasol sydd ynglŷn â hynny. Mae'n bwysig sylweddoli bod rhywun sy'n ymadfer ar ôl camddefnyddio sylweddau mewn cymaint o berygl ag eraill o ddioddef gan droseddu a chan gamdriniaeth gorfforol a meddyliol.

Mae'r risgiau sy'n gysylltiedig â'r henoed yn amlwg. Dylem geisio ei gwneud mor hawdd a chyfleus ag y bo modd i bobl oedrannus gael triniaeth iechyd. Gallem fwrw amheuaeth ar statws presennol y contract ar gyfer gwasanaethau y tu allan i oriau arferol ar gyfer ymarferwyr cyffredinol. Ynghylch pwyntiau pwysig eraill, mae'n rhesymol i fenywod beichiog, oedolion ifanc anabl a phlant ag anawsterau dysgu gael mynediad rhwydd i wasanaethau cymdeithasol. Ni ddylai pobl anabl gael eu cynnwys mewn un categori mawr. Mae ar lawer sydd ag anabledau angen gofal penodol, a dylid ystyried hynny wrth benderfynu ar y llety mwyaf addas a hygyrch.

Er mwyn mynd â'r diffiniad o lety rhesymol

accommodation one step further, vulnerable people should have the option to live in safe communities, free from intimidation as well as anti-social behaviour. They should be able to live in a place where they feel part of a real community, if they so choose. There should be a combination of all these aspects with the best method of determining suitability of accommodation. It is also important that regulation must not be seen to impede local circumstance, particularly in areas of high student population, and a need to attract workers for economic development. In offering qualified support, it is now for the Welsh Assembly Government to identify and try to solve the problem of adequately supplying accommodation that is called for in this measure.

**Sandy Mewies:** I will make a short contribution to this debate. I am glad to be able to support Gwenda in this, as it introduces an important principle to the issue of housing people. There is more to housing people than simply providing a building for them to live in. People in the categories outlined by Gwenda are vulnerable and their needs must be taken into account. Services have to be provided for them in a way that allows easy access, which does not mean having to travel miles because people are often unable to do so.

With regard to disabled young adults, and children with disabilities in particular, who already have problems, mobility problems and lack of suitable transport mean that they are often isolated. Parents cannot always take children long distances to specialist services. Those issues need to be addressed. Again, those with mental health difficulties need support that is close to them. Unfortunately, as is the nature of mental health problems, you do not know when they will arise, so care must be provided on the doorstep.

Finally, I turn to young people leaving care, which I have mentioned before because I know a great deal about it. I recall speaking to young people who had come out of care. One young man asked me if I would allow my 16-year-old son to live alone on a particular housing estate without any support. I answered that I would not, and I am sure

un cam ymhellach, dylai rhai sy'n agored i niwed gael y dewis i fyw mewn cymunedau diogel, yn rhydd oddi wrth fygythion ac ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol. Dylent gael byw mewn man y teimlant eu bod yn rhan o gymuned go iawn, os dewisant hynny. Dylid cyfuno'r holl agweddau hyn â'r dull gorau o benderfynu ar lety addas. Mae hefyd yn bwysig sicrhau na fydd rheoliadau'n cyfyngu ar amgylchiadau lleol, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd lle y mae llawer o fyfyrwyr yn byw, a'r angen i ddenu gweithwyr ar gyfer datblygu economaidd. Wrth gynnig cefnogaeth amodol, lle Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn awr yw deall y broblem o gyflenwi digon o lety a'i datrys, fel y mae'r mesur hwn yn galw arni i wneud.

**Sandy Mewies:** Gwnaf gyfraniad byr i'r ddaid hon. Yr wyf yn falch o allu cefnogi Gwenda yn hyn o beth, gan ei fod yn cyflwyno egwyddor bwysig i'r mater o gartrefu pobl. Mae mwy i gartrefu pobl na dim ond darparu adeilad iddynt fyw ynddo. Mae'r bobl yn y categorïau a nododd Gwenda yn agored i niwed a rhaid ystyried eu hanghenion. Rhaid darparu gwasanaethau ar eu cyfer mewn modd sy'n caniatáu mynediad rhwydd, fel nad oes rhaid teithio'n bell gan fod pobl yn aml yn analluog i wneud hynny.

Gyda golwg ar oedolion ifanc anabl, a phlant sydd ag anableddau'n benodol, a hwythau'n profi problemau eisoes, cânt eu hynysu'n aml oherwydd problemau wrth symud o gwmpas a diffyg trafnidiaeth addas. Nid yw bob amser yn bosibl i rieni fynd â phlant at wasanaethau arbenigol sy'n bell i ffwrdd. Rhaid ymdrin â'r materion hynny. Hefyd, mae ar rai sydd ag anawsterau iechyd meddwl angen cymorth sy'n agos atynt. Gwaetha'r modd, gan mai dyna natur problemau iechyd meddwl, ni wyddys pa bryd y byddant yn codi, felly rhaid darparu gofal ar garreg y drws.

Yn olaf, trof at fater pobl ifanc sy'n gadael gofal, yr wyf wedi cyfeirio ato o'r blaen gan y gwn lawer iawn amdano. Cofiaf siarad â phobl ifanc a oedd wedi gadael gofal. Gofynnodd un dyn ifanc i mi a fyddwn yn gadael i'm mab 16 blwydd oed fyw ar ei ben ei hun ar ystâd dai neilltuol heb unrhyw gymorth. Atebais na fyddwn, ac yr wyf yn



that we would all feel the same. These young people often have to be shown how to manage a budget because they have not done so before. They often have to be shown how to go shopping every week and to do things that some of us would take for granted—some of our teenagers take these things for granted, but that is not always the case. They need that type of support; sadly, all too often, young people leave care, go into accommodation and cannot cope because the support has not been in place. These issues will be addressed by this draft subordinate legislation and I would like to see all Members support it today.

**Peter Black:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats support this legislation in principle. It is worth noting that, under Standing Order No. 31, under which we are debating this issue, there are proposals to amend this to introduce a more deliberative process whereby legislation will go to committee to be considered over a longer period of time. This proposal would benefit from that process, and I will explain why.

5.10 p.m.

What we have before us is the germ of a good idea, but it requires careful consultation and consideration. It would also probably benefit from being discussed by the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee. Although there are clear proposals here in terms of protecting vulnerable people, we also need a practical way forward to deliver those proposals on the ground, and to help local authorities to do that.

I have a number of issues with the proposals which need to be addressed as part of the Minister's considerations before the final legislation comes before us. One of the issues is the definition of 'a vulnerable person'. After listening to Catherine Thomas's contribution, I was disappointed that people fleeing domestic violence were not included in the definition of 'a vulnerable person'. There needs to be more flexibility for local authorities in the way they define vulnerability in this regard. In homelessness legislation, there is flexibility whereby local authorities, in addition to a number of

siŵr y byddem oll yn teimlo'r un peth. Yn aml, rhaid dangos i'r bobl ifanc hyn sut i gadw trefn ar eu harian gan na wnaethant hynny cynt. Yn aml, rhaid dangos iddynt sut i siopa bob wythnos a gwneud y pethau y byddai rhai ohonom yn eu cymryd yn ganiataol—mae rhai yn eu harddegau'n cymryd y pethau hyn yn ganiataol, ond nid yw hynny'n wir bob amser. Mae arnynt angen cymorth o'r fath; gwaetha'r modd, yn rhy aml o lawer, mae pobl ifanc yn gadael gofal, yn mynd i fyw mewn llety ac yn methu ag ymdopi gan nad oedd cymorth ar gael. Ymdrinnir â'r materion hyn drwy'r is-ddeddfwriaeth ddrafft hon a charwn weld yr holl Aelodau'n ei chefnogi heddiw.

**Peter Black:** Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n cefnogi'r ddeddfwriaeth hon mewn egwyddor. Mae'n werth nodi bod cynigion i newid Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 31, yr ydym yn trafod y mater hwn oddi tani, fel y ceir proses fwy cydgyngorol lle y bydd deddfwriaeth yn mynd gerbron pwyllgor i'w hystyried dros gyfnod hwy. Byddai'r broses honno'n llesol i'r cynnig hwn, ac egluraf y rheswm am hynny.

Yr hyn sydd gennym o'n blaen yw egin syniad da, ond mae'n gofyn ymgynghori ac ystyried manwl. Mae'n debyg y byddai ar ei ennill hefyd o gael ei drafod gan y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio. Er bod cynigion pendant yma o ran amddiffyn pobl sy'n agored i niwed, rhaid inni hefyd gael dull ymarferol o gyflawni'r cynigion hyn ar lawr gwlad, ac o helpu awdurdodau lleol i wneud hynny.

Mae sawl mater ynghylch y cynigion y dymunaf eu codi ac y bydd yn rhaid ymdrin â hwy fel rhan o ystyriaethau'r Gweinidog cyn i'r ddeddfwriaeth derfynol ddod ger ein bron. Un o'r materion hynny yw'r diffiniad o 'berson sy'n agored i niwed'. Ar ôl gwrandao ar gyfraniad Catherine Thomas, yr oeddwn yn siomedig nad oedd rhai sy'n ffoi rhag trais yn y cartref wedi'u cynnwys yn y diffiniad o 'berson sy'n agored i niwed'. Rhaid wrth fwy o hyblygrwydd i awdurdodau lleol o ran y modd y diffiniant hyglwyfedd yn hyn o beth. Mewn deddfwriaeth ar ddigartrefedd, ceir hyblygrwydd fel bod awdurdodau lleol, yn

categories, can also declare that someone is vulnerable for other reasons. This legislation would benefit from adopting a similar approach.

The biggest problem that this legislation will face is the supply of suitable accommodation, especially if local authorities are required to take account of the proximity and accessibility of social services, family support and other support services. I live in the Manselton area of Swansea where you would be lucky if half a dozen homes became available in a single year. A number of elderly people live there, as well as young families who have elderly relatives, and many people have approached me and other elected members seeking to be housed in the area because of family proximity, so that they can offer support. However, housing association accommodation, local authority accommodation and even private rented accommodation, is not available there. If a vulnerable person wanted to be re-housed in that area, it would present a particular problem which the local authority would have to overcome.

It would also be a problem in rural areas; it is not just a case of accommodation not being available, but services would tend to be located some distance from where people would be housed. That is a problem in terms of supply, and it could lead to a vulnerable person being in temporary accommodation for a longer period of time while the local authority looked for accommodation in the rural area. That is something which must be addressed and, if that is the case, there are clear dangers of introducing this legislation at the same time as telling local authorities that they must do away with bed-and-breakfast accommodation, which must also be considered.

The Welsh Assembly Government is also currently advocating that local authorities should move to a choice-based lettings means of allocating houses. The problem with that is that you are asking people to apply for housing as if the local authority were an estate agent—there is no assessment of cumulative need as part of the process. If the legislation were introduced, the choice-based

ychwanegol at sawl categori, yn gallu datgan bod rhywun yn agored i niwed am resymau eraill hefyd. Byddai'n fuddiol i'r ddeddfwriaeth hon fabwysiadu dull gweithredu tebyg.

Y broblem fwyaf y bydd y ddeddfwriaeth hon yn ei hwynebu yw'r cyflenwad o lety addas, yn enwedig os yw'n ofynnol i awdurdodau lleol ystyried agosrwydd a hygyrchedd gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, cymorth teuluol a gwasanaethau cymorth eraill. Yr wyf yn byw yn ardal Trefansel yn Abertawe lle y byddech yn ffodus pe bai hanner dwsin o gartrefi ar gael mewn un flwyddyn. Mae nifer o bobl oedrannus yn byw yno, yn ogystal â theuluoedd ifanc sydd â pherthnasau oedrannus, ac mae llawer o bobl wedi dod ataf fi ac at aelodau etholedig eraill i geisio cael eu cartrefu yn yr ardal gan fod eu teulu'n agos, fel y gallant gynnig cymorth. Fodd bynnag, nid oes llety ar gael yno gan gymdeithasau tai na'r awdurdod lleol, na hyd yn oed lety preifat i'w rentu. Pe bai rhywun sy'n agored i niwed yn dymuno cael ei ailgartrefu yn yr ardal honno, byddai hynny'n peri problem benodol i'w datrys gan yr awdurdod lleol.

Byddai'n broblem hefyd mewn ardaloedd gwledig; nid y ffaith nad oes llety ar gael yw'r unig broblem, gan y byddai gwasanaethau'n tueddu i fod yn eithaf pell o'r man y câi pobl eu cartrefu. Problem o ran cyflenwi yw honno, a gallai beri y byddai rhywun sy'n agored i niwed yn byw mewn llety dros dro am gyfnod hwy tra oedd yr awdurdod lleol yn chwilio am lety yn yr ardal wledig. Rhaid ymdrin â hyn ac, os gwneir hynny, mae'n amlwg bod perygl o gyflwyno deddfwriaeth o'r fath gan ddweud wrth awdurdodau lleol, yr un pryd, fod rhaid iddynt gael gwared â llety gwely a brecwast, a rhaid ystyried hynny hefyd.

Ar hyn o bryd, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n dadlau hefyd y dylai awdurdodau lleol droi at osod tai ar sail dewis. Y broblem yw eich bod yn gofyn i bobl ymgeisio am dai fel pe bai'r awdurdod lleol yn werthwr tai—nid asesir angen cronol fel rhan o'r broses. Pe cyflwynid y ddeddfwriaeth hon, byddai'r syniad o osod ar sail dewis yn gwbl groes i'r asesiad o anghenion ar gyfer pobl sy'n

lettings idea would be in direct conflict with the assessment of needs in terms of vulnerable people. That must be reconciled in the legislation and in the guidance that the Minister offers to local authorities.

Sandy Mewies and other Members talked about the support available to vulnerable people.

**Mark Isherwood:** I agree with what you are saying. Therefore, where housing is in short supply, should the wishes of vulnerable people not also be a consideration? Developing on Janet's comments on families, should not the definition of vulnerable include whole families who would cease to be whole families without appropriate support?

**Peter Black:** I am not sure what a whole family is, but I was making the point that the wishes and needs of the vulnerable person must be taken into account; a choice-based lettings system does not always accommodate that option.

We also need to address the deficiencies in the support for vulnerable people. The 10 per cent cut in the Supporting People fund has not helped. The issue of temporary accommodation, bed and breakfast and the lack of support for multi-agency working such as youth offending teams, and so on, and occasionally the lack of co-ordination within local authorities in housing, education and social services, and the lack of co-ordination between the local authority and the health department, tend to mitigate against the support that can be offered for young people. That will also have to be put right as part of this.

On the quality of the housing that is available, high-quality housing is important. Many vulnerable people may have a disability, and I am particularly concerned about the availability of resources to adapt properties. For example, the £40 million cut in disabled facilities grant money from the Assembly Government will have an impact on that. The £3 billion backlog in council house improvements will also be a problem.

agored i niwed. Rhaid cysoni hynny yn y ddeddfwriaeth a'r canllawiau y bydd y Gweinidog yn eu cynnig i awdurdodau lleol.

Mae Sandy Mewies ac Aelodau eraill wedi sôn am y cymorth sydd ar gael i bobl sy'n agored i niwed.

**Mark Isherwood:** Cytunaf â'r hyn a ddywedwch. Felly, mewn manau lle y mae tai'n brin, oni ddylid ystyried dymuniadau pobl sy'n agored i niwed hefyd? Gan ymhelaethu ar sylwadau Janet am deuluoedd, oni ddylai'r diffiniad o rai sy'n agored i niwed gynnwys teuluoedd cyfan a fyddai'n peidio â bod yn deuluoedd cyfan heb gael cymorth priodol?

**Peter Black:** Nid wyf yn sicr beth yw teulu cyfan, ond y pwynt yr oeddwn yn ei wneud oedd bod rhaid ystyried dymuniadau ac anghenion rhywun sy'n agored i niwed; nid yw system osod sy'n seiliedig ar ddewis yn darparu ar gyfer hynny bob amser.

Rhaid inni hefyd ymdrin â'r diffygion yn y cymorth a roddir i bobl sy'n agored i niwed. Nid yw'r 10 y cant o doriad yng nghronfa Cefnogi Pobl wedi bod o gymorth. Mae mater llety dros dro, llety gwely a brecwast a diffyg cymorth ar gyfer gwaith amlasiantaethol fel timau troseddau ieuentid, ac yn y blaen, a'r diffyg cyd-drefnu a geir weithiau rhwng tai, addysg a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol mewn awdurdodau lleol, a'r diffyg cyd-drefnu rhwng yr awdurdod lleol a'r adran iechyd, yn tueddu i wrthweithio'r gallu i gynnig cymorth i bobl ifanc. Bydd yn rhaid cywiro hynny hefyd wrth ymdrin â hyn.

Ynghylch ansawdd y tai sydd ar gael, mae'n bwysig cael tai o ansawdd da. Mae llawer o bobl sy'n agored i niwed yn rhai sydd ag anabledd, ac yr wyf yn dra phryderus ynghylch y ddarpariaeth o adnoddau i addasu tai. Er enghraifft, bydd y toriad o £40 miliwn yn yr arian y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei roi at y grant cyfleusterau i'r anabl yn effeithio ar hynny. Bydd yr ôl-groniad o £3 biliwn mewn gwelliannau i dai cyngor yn peri problem hefyd.

To conclude, this is a good idea in principle, but there are huge practical problems that must be overcome and they must be dealt with as part of the consultation. I look forward to the Minister coming back to us on that and on how she will be able to deal with those issues.

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** I am delighted that Gwenda Thomas has tabled this motion. It is about taking a principled decision on how we deal with vulnerable people and their housing needs. Everyone has illustrated what problems there are, but it is up to me, in Government, to bring forward proposals, which will be discussed with committee, to take this forward.

As Gwenda indicated, some local authorities are already trying to do this quite successfully, cross-cutting across various strands. On your rather cheap points on budgets, Peter, it is up to local authorities how they allocate certain funds. Let us hope that, when we discuss these further issues, they will allocate funds appropriately.

We all know that, as an Assembly Government, we are determined to tackle the problem of homelessness in Wales. That is why I set up the Homelessness Commission in 2001, to set our course in this difficult area, as Peter will be well aware. Gwenda played a crucial role in this commission's work and the direction of its report, which focused on the need for prevention and joined-up solutions, particularly for young people. From that report came the National Homelessness Strategy, which provides our policy framework in this area. I believe that we all agree that we are taking this strategy forward with our various reviews, and are moving the agenda forward.

Gwenda's concern for the disadvantaged is renowned in the Chamber. She is a resolute advocate for young people and families in particular, which is also reflected in today's motion. Losing your home, whatever the

I gloi, mae hwn yn syniad da mewn egwyddor, ond mae problemau ymarferol aruthrol y mae'n rhaid eu datrys a rhaid delio â hwy fel rhan o'r ymgynghori. Edrychaf ymlaen at weld y Gweinidog yn dod yn ôl atom i sôn am hynny ac am y modd y bydd yn delio â'r materion hynny.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** Yr wyf wrth fy modd bod Gwenda Thomas wedi cyflwyno'r cynnig hwn. Mae'n ymwneud â gwneud penderfyniad egwyddorol ar y modd yr ydym yn delio â phobl sy'n agored i niwed a'u hanghenion tai. Mae pawb wedi disgrifio'r problemau, ond fy lle i, yn y Llywodraeth, yw rhoi cynigion gerbron, a drafodir yn y pwyllgor, i hyrwyddo hyn.

Fel y nododd Gwenda, mae rhai awdurdodau lleol eisoes yn gwneud hyn yn eithaf llwyddiannus, gan dorri ar draws gwahanol elfennau. Ynghylch y pwyntiau diwerth braidd a wnaethoch am gyllidebau, Peter, lle awdurdodau lleol yw penderfynu sut y maent yn dyrannu rhai mathau o gyllid. Gadewch inni obeithio, pan drafodwn y materion ychwanegol hyn, y dyrannant gyllid fel y bo'n briodol.

Yr ydym oll yn gwybod ein bod, fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn benderfynol o fynd i'r afael â phroblem digartrefedd yng Nghymru. Dyna pam y sefydlais y Comisiwn Digartrefedd yn 2001, i bennu ein dull o weithredu yn y maes anodd hwn, fel y gŵyr Peter yn iawn. Chwaraeodd Gwenda ran hollbwysig yng ngwaith y comisiwn hwnnw ac wrth bennu pwyslais ei adroddiad, a ganolbwyntiodd ar yr angen am atal ac am atebion cydgysylltiedig, yn enwedig ar gyfer pobl ifanc. Yn sgîl yr adroddiad hwnnw y cafwyd y Strategaeth Genedlaethol ar Ddigartrefedd, sy'n gosod ein fframwaith polisi yn y maes hwn. Credaf ein bod oll yn gytûn ein bod yn hyrwyddo'r strategaeth hon drwy ein gwahanol adolygiadau, a'n bod yn bwrw ymlaen â'r agenda.

Mae pryder Gwenda dros y rhai difreintiedig yn adnabyddus yn y Siambr. Mae'n ddadleuwr penderfynol dros bobl ifanc a theuluoedd yn benodol, ac adlewyrchir hynny yn y cynnig heddiw. Colli'ch cartref, beth

circumstances, is one of the most traumatic experiences that people can face. We must protect our most vulnerable homeless people from the worst consequences of homelessness when it cannot be prevented. The motion will provide legislative force to standards that are already expected of local authorities in many areas. I praise Gwenda's initiative in proposing this motion. It will help to ensure that all the personal and welfare needs of the individual and their family are taken into account when the local authority offers them accommodation. That is important.

In 2003, I commissioned a study of how local authorities were meeting their statutory responsibilities for homeless people. That revealed that many vulnerable people are being placed outside their home area, away from family and support networks, in bed-and-breakfast hotels. In March, I will bring forward proposals for legislation to restrict the use of bed-and-breakfast accommodation for vulnerable people. These measures will further strengthen our protection for those most at risk from unsuitable placements. The measures that I will propose will be complemented by today's motion. As they use the same legislative powers, I propose, should this motion be passed, to bring forward the appropriate measure as one Order following consultation on proposals regarding bed and breakfasts. That will give the necessary timescale for this matter to go thoroughly through committee and be discussed before we take it forward.

Some good points have been made about the availability of accommodation. However, this legislation is an opportunity to look at innovation. If you have good private providers, and you want to house people in their areas, local authorities should engage in discussions with them, as well as with housing associations, and look at the range that is available to house vulnerable people. We need to consider progress in this area.

These measures will also give greater protection to some of our most vulnerable people. That is our job, and that is why I support the motion and commend it to you

bynnag fo'r amgylchiadau, yw un o'r profiadau mwyaf ysgytwol y gall pobl eu hwynebu. Rhaid inni amddiffyn y bobl ddigartref sy'n fwyaf agored i niwed rhag effeithiau gwaethaf digartrefedd pan na ellir atal hynny. Bydd y cynnig yn rhoi grym deddfwriaethol i safonau a ddisgwylir eisoes gan awdurdodau lleol mewn llawer o feysydd. Canmolaf Gwenda am ei menter wrth gynnig y cynnig hwn. Bydd o gymorth i sicrhau ystyriaeth i holl anghenion personol a lles yr unigolyn a'i deulu pan fydd yr awdurdod lleol yn cynnig llety iddo. Mae hynny'n bwysig.

Yn 2003, comisiynais astudiaeth o'r modd yr oedd awdurdodau lleol yn cyflawni eu cyfrifoldebau statudol mewn cysylltiad â phobl ddigartref. Dangosodd fod llawer o bobl sy'n agored i niwed yn cael eu lleoli y tu allan i ardal eu cartref, oddi wrth eu teulu a'u rhwydweithiau cymorth, mewn llety gwely a brecwast. Ym mis Mawrth, byddaf yn dwyn cynigion gerbron ar gyfer deddfwriaeth i gyfyngu ar y defnydd o lety gwely a brecwast ar gyfer pobl sy'n agored i niwed. Bydd y mesurau hyn yn fodd inni gynnig mwy o amddiffyniad i'r rhai sydd yn y perygl mwyaf o gael eu rhoi mewn llety anaddas. Bydd y mesurau a gynigiau yn cael eu hategu gan y cynnig heddiw. Gan eu bod yn defnyddio'r un pwerau deddfwriaethol, os derbynnir y cynnig hwn, yr wyf yn bwriadu rhoi'r mesur gerbron ar ffurf un Gorchymyn ar ôl ymgynghori ar gynigion ynghylch llety gwely a brecwast. Bydd hynny'n rhoi digon o amser i'r mater hwn gael mynd drwy'r pwyllgor a chael ei drafod cyn inni fwrw ymlaen ag ef.

Gwnaed rhai pwyntiau da am argaeledd llety. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ddeddfwriaeth hon yn gyfle i ystyried arloesi. Os oes gennych ddarparwyr preifat da a chithau am gartrefu pobl yn eu hardal, dylai awdurdodau lleol gynnal trafodaethau â hwy, yn ogystal â chymdeithasau tai, ac ystyried y dewis o lety sydd ar gael i gartrefu pobl sy'n agored i niwed. Rhaid inni ystyried gwneud cynnydd yn y maes hwn.

Bydd y mesurau hyn hefyd yn cynnig mwy o amddiffyniad i'r rhai sy'n fwyaf agored i niwed. Dyna yw ein gwaith, a dyna pam yr wyf yn cefnogi'r cynnig ac yn ei

today. It will not be easy to implement, Mrs Gwenda Thomas, but we will have a good stab at it and see what we can do, considering all the issues as they arise. However, it is important that we are taking a principled stance on vulnerable people; there should be principles in politics, and we should legislate accordingly.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Diolch, Alun Ffred, am eich cefnogaeth. Mae cyfarwyddyd yn bodoli yn y cod canllawiau y soniais amdano, ond mae'n amlwg nad yw hynny wedi bod yn ddigon i sicrhau ein bod yn edrych ar anghenion y bobl fwyaf bregus. Fodd bynnag, mae rhai awdurdodau yn gweithredu yn effeithiol o fewn y cod hwnnw.

5.20 p.m.

Catherine, thank you for your support. You referred to mental illness and the work of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee, and I appreciate that support, as I appreciate Janet Ryder's intervention. I am sure that the project in Flintshire to which she referred is an excellent example, as are the many that I heard about while researching for this debate. William Graham, thank you for your support—however qualified, I think that it was constructive. We can find a way to move forward so that all our opinions are taken into account. You mentioned drug abusers and services for the elderly, and you mentioned the specific needs of individuals and safe environments to which I referred in my speech.

Thank you, Sandy, for your comments on transport and mobility problems, which are crucial, and your contribution on the particular needs of young disabled people. The report on the year of the young disabled was circulated today, and it was topical for it to come to hand now. Peter Black, thank you for your support. I acknowledge your knowledge on the housing issue. You talked about scrutiny by the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee, and I would support and welcome that. Also, the Minister's remarks clearly showed that the process of scrutiny by the committee can be effective, and I take the point on the lack of

gymeradwyo i chi heddiw. Ni fydd yn hawdd ei roi ar waith, Mrs Gwenda Thomas, ond gwnawn ein gorau glas a gweld beth y gallwn ei gyflawni, gan ystyried yr holl faterion fel y maent yn codi. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn gwneud safiad egwyddorol dros bobl sy'n agored i niwed; dylid cael egwyddorion mewn gwleidyddiaeth, a dylem ddeddfu'n unol â hynny.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Thank you, Alun Ffred, for your support. Guidance exists in the code of guidance to which I referred, but it is obvious that that has not been sufficient to ensure that we consider the needs of the most vulnerable people. However, some authorities operate effectively within that code.

Catherine, diolch i chi am eich cefnogaeth. Cyfeiriasoch at salwch meddwl a gwaith y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, a gwerthfawrogaf y gefnogaeth honno, fel y gwerthfawrogaf ymyriad Janet Ryder. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod y prosiect yn sir y Fflint y cyfeiriodd ato'n esiampl ardderchog, fel y mae'r nifer mawr y clywais amdanynt wrth ymchwilio ar gyfer y ddadl hon. William Graham, diolch i chi am eich cefnogaeth—beth bynnag fo'r amodau arni, credaf ei bod yn adeiladol. Gallwn ganfod modd i symud ymlaen fel yr ystyrir pob barn o'n heiddo. Cyfeiriasoch at rai sy'n camddefnyddio cyffuriau a gwasanaethau i'r henoed, a chyfeiriasoch at anghenion penodol unigolion ac at amgylcheddau diogel y cyfeiriais atynt yn fy araith.

Diolch i chi, Sandy, am eich sylwadau am drafnidiaeth a phroblemau wrth symud o gwmpas, sydd o'r pwys mwyaf, ac am eich cyfraniad ar anghenion penodol pobl anabl ifanc. Cafodd yr adroddiad ar flwyddyn pobl anabl ifanc ei ddsbarthu heddiw, ac yr oedd hynny'n amserol. Peter Black, diolch i chi am eich cefnogaeth. Cydnabyddaf eich gwybodaeth ar bwnc tai. Soniasoch am graffu gan y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, a byddwn yn bleidiol i hynny ac yn ei groesawu. Hefyd, yr oedd sylwadau'r Gweinidog yn dangos yn glir y gall y broses craffu gan y pwyllgor fod yn effeithiol, a derbyniaf y pwynt am brinder llety. Wrth

available accommodation. Transport issues, of course, must be an issue here for local authorities, and a co-ordinated approach, in offering accommodation and in policy development, would be helpful.

In conclusion, I thank you, Minister, for your positive response. I know that you will take the matter forward in a way that the whole Assembly can understand and that you will take it before the committee. You have given the assurance that the needs of vulnerable individuals will become paramount.

gwrs, rhaid i awdurdodau lleol ystyried materion sy'n ymwneud â thrafnidiaeth yn hyn o beth, a byddai dull cydlynol, wrth gynnig llety a datblygu polisi, yn beth buddiol.

I derfynu, diolchaf i chi, Weinidog, am eich ymateb cadarnhaol. Gwn y byddwch yn hyrwyddo'r mater hwn mewn modd y gall y Cynulliad cyfan ei ddeall ac y byddwch yn ei ddwyn gerbron y pwyllgor. Rhoesoch sicrwydd y bydd anghenion unigolion sy'n agored i niwed yn dod yn brif ystyriaeth.

*Cynnig (NDM2225): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2225): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny

Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â  
 today's proceedings to a close. chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.22 p.m.  
 The meeting ended at 5.22 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau  
 Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Law, Peter (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Marek, John (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)



Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)