



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mercher, 24 Tachwedd 2004**

**Wednesday, 24 November 2004**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio Questions to the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration .....	3
Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth Questions to the Minister for Economic Development and Transport .....	20
Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order .....	35
Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau Deddf Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru) 2004 i'r Prif Weinidog Delegating Functions of the Public Audit (Wales) Act 2004 to the First Minister .....	36
Adroddiad Adolygiad Polisi'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ar Addysg Arbennig The Education and Lifelong Learning Committee's Policy Review Report on Special Education .....	46
Yr Amserlen Gyfnodol The Periodic Timetable .....	72
Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order .....	90
Dadl Fer: <a href="http://www.impeachblair.org">www.impeachblair.org</a> Short Debate: <a href="http://www.impeachblair.org">www.impeachblair.org</a> .....	90
	90

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio Questions to the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration**

### **Ymwybyddiaeth o Gamddefnyddio Cyffuriau Drug Abuse Awareness**

**Q1 Janet Ryder:** Can the Minister make a statement on funding to support drug abuse awareness among young people? (OAQ39685)

**C1 Janet Ryder:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar gyllid i gefnogi'r gwaith o godi ymwybyddiaeth pobl ifanc o gamddefnyddio cyffuriau? (OAQ39685)

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** For the period 1999-2000 up to, and including, 2004-05, over £30 million has been provided to tackle substance misuse in Wales. This includes £3 million for the all-Wales schools programme and various local initiatives that we fund through the community safety partnerships.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** Ar gyfer y cyfnod 1999-2000 hyd at, a chan gynnwys, 2004-05, darparwyd dros £30 miliwn i fynd i'r afael â chamddefnyddio sylweddau yng Nghymru. Mae'r swm hwn yn cynnwys £3 miliwn ar gyfer rhaglen ysgolion Cymru gyfan a gwahanol fentrau lleol a ariennir gennym drwy'r partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol.

**Janet Ryder:** I am sure that you are aware that Walton prison in Liverpool houses the highest number of inmates jailed for drug-related crime. Wardens at that prison run a unique programme, called 'Choose Life'. A small number of inmates have opted to take part in that programme, and if they are able to stay on the programme long enough, they are given day-passes to visit schools to talk directly to young people. I visited that programme, along with other north Wales Members, and found it to be the most effective anti-drugs programme that I have seen. Would you consider providing funding to support such school visits? Those responsible for the programme need to produce pamphlets, and would like to arrange a conference in north Wales to raise awareness. Funding is needed to enable prisoners to tell their tale, and to explain why they have chosen life instead of drugs.

**Janet Ryder:** Fe wyddoch, mae'n siŵr, fod carchar Walton yn Lerpwl yn dal y nifer fwyaf o garcharorion a ddedfrydwyd i garchar am droseddau yn ymwneud â chyffuriau. Mae'r wardeiniaid yn y carchar hwnnw yn cynnal rhaglen unigryw, o'r enw 'Choose Life'. Mae nifer fach o garcharorion wedi dewis cymryd rhan yn y rhaglen honno, ac os llwyddant i barhau â'r rhaglen yn ddigon hir, cânt bäs diwrnod i ymweld ag ysgolion i siarad â phobl ifanc yn uniongyrchol. Euthum i weld y rhaglen honno, yng nghwmni Aelodau eraill o'r Gogledd, a chredaf mai hon yw'r rhaglen wrth-gyffuriau fwyaf effeithiol a welais erioed. A ystyriech ddarparu cyllid ar gyfer ymweliadau o'r fath ag ysgolion? Mae angen i'r rhai sy'n gyfrifol am y rhaglen baratoi taflenni, a hoffent drefnu cynhadledd yn y Gogledd i godi ymwybyddiaeth. Mae angen cyllid er mwyn galluogi carcharorion i ddweud eu hanes, ac esbonio pam y maent wedi cefnu ar gyffuriau.

**Edwina Hart:** My colleague, Ann Jones, has told me about her visit to Walton and about this initiative. I will ask officials for further advice.

**Edwina Hart:** Mae fy nghyd-Aelod, Ann Jones, wedi sôn wrthyf am ei hymweliad â Walton ac am y fenter hon. Gofynnaf i'r swyddogion am gyngor pellach.

**John Griffiths:** Alcohol is a drug, and alcohol abuse among young people, and others, is the cause of a great deal of violence in society, as well as other societal problems. Binge drinking is a problem, and a great deal of irresponsibility exists within the drinks industry. Will you ensure that we continue to raise awareness among young people of the dangers involved?

**Edwina Hart:** Members will recall that we had an excellent short debate a few weeks ago on this issue, proposed by Janet Davies. My views—and the views of the Government—are clear: we are not keen on alcohol advertising, and we believe that the drinks industry has a responsibility to take these matters more seriously. I have recently raised these issues with the Wales Office, so that we can keep up the necessary pressure.

**Lisa Francis:** The Rhosserchan home for substance misusers in Aberystwyth has already been dealt various blows because the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales's standards are too prescriptive to allow it to operate. This is not the case across the border in England, where such standards are more flexible. You have mentioned changing the way in which funding for homes such as this is considered, saying that it may be paid through community safety partnerships. This would result in a reduction in the funds channelled directly to homes like Rhosserchan, and would make access to such homes more difficult. That would hinder your aim of easy access to treatment for drug abusers and of providing rehabilitation places in Wales. How would this impact upon drugs awareness?

**Edwina Hart:** In respect of Rhosserchan, deregistration does not mean that the facility will close. There is no reason why deregistration would impact upon the number of referrals. Thirty-six admissions to Rhosserchan were from Wales, and 33 were from England. The Assembly provides between £40,000 and £50,000 in section 64 funding to the Rhosserchan home.

On the issue of community safety partnership

**John Griffiths:** Mae alcohol yn gyffur, ac mae camddefnyddio alcohol ymhlith pobl ifanc, ac eraill, yn achosi llawer iawn o drais mewn cymdeithas, yn ogystal â phroblemau cymdeithasol eraill. Mae pyliau o oryfed yn broblem, ac mae cryn anghyfrifoldeb yn y diwydiant diodydd. A sicrhewch ein bod yn parhau i godi ymwybyddiaeth ymhlith pobl ifanc o'r peryglon dan sylw?

**Edwina Hart:** Bydd Aelodau yn cofio inni gael dadl fer ardderchog ychydig wythnosau yn ôl ar y mater hwn, a gynigiwyd gan Janet Davies. Mae fy marn i—a barn y Llywodraeth—yn glir: nid ydym o blaid hysbysebion alcohol, a chredwn fod cyfrifoldeb ar y diwydiant diodydd i gymryd y materion hyn yn fwy o ddifrif. Yr wyf wedi codi'r materion hyn yn ddiweddar gyda Swyddfa Cymru, fel y gallwn barhau i ddwyn y pwysau angenrheidiol.

**Lisa Francis:** Mae cartref Rhosserchan ar gyfer pobl sy'n camddefnyddio sylweddau yn Aberystwyth eisoes wedi cael sawl ergyd am fod safonau Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru yn rhy gaeth i ganiatáu iddo weithredu. Nid yw hynny yn wir dros y ffin yn Lloegr, lle y mae safonau o'r fath yn fwy hyblyg. Bu ichi sôn am newid y ffordd yr ystyrir cyllid ar gyfer cartrefi o'r fath, gan ddweud y gellid talu amdanynt drwy bartneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol. O ganlyniad i hyn byddai llai o arian yn cael ei roi'n uniongyrchol i gartrefi fel Rhosserchan, a byddai'n ei gwneud yn anos cael lleoedd mewn cartrefi o'r fath. Byddai hynny'n rhwystro eich nod o fynediad hawdd i driniaeth i'r rhai sy'n camddefnyddio cyffuriau a'ch nod o ddarparu lleoedd adsefydlu yng Nghymru. Sut y byddai hyn yn effeithio ar ymwybyddiaeth o gyffuriau?

**Edwina Hart:** O ran Rhosserchan, nid yw dadgofrestru yn golygu y bydd y cyfleuster yn cau. Nid oes dim rheswm pam y byddai dadgofrestru yn effeithio ar nifer yr achosion a gyfeirir yno. Derbyniodd Rhosserchan 36 o bobl o Gymru a 33 o Loegr. Mae'r Cynulliad yn darparu rhwng £40,000 a £50,000 o arian adran 64 i gartref Rhosserchan.

O ran dyraniadau i bartneriaethau diogelwch

allocations, which we discussed at the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee meeting on 17 November, as a result of the concerns raised with me by Members, I am considering the situation with regard to incorporating the funding stream into community safety partnership allocations in the future.

**Peter Black:** The supporting people funding stream, which is important for people recovering from drug addiction, is facing a potential cut of 10 per cent in UK Government funds. If that transpires, or if there is any cut in this money, will you undertake to talk to the Finance Minister about transitional funding to ease the burden on organisations which rely on this, so that they do not face that cut all at once?

**Edwina Hart:** There is a 9.7 per cent cut across the board. I very much support the views expressed by the committee last week. The committee will be writing to the Finance Minister, as will I.

cymunedol, a drafodwyd gennym yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ar 17 Tachwedd, o ganlyniad i'r pryderon a gododd Aelodau gyda mi, yr wyf yn ystyried y sefyllfa o ran cynnwys y ffrwd ariannu mewn dyraniadau i bartneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol yn y dyfodol.

**Peter Black:** Mae'n bosibl y caiff arian Llywodraeth y DU ar gyfer ffrwd ariannu cefnogi pobl, sy'n bwysig i bobl sy'n cael triniaeth ar gyfer dibyniaeth ar gyffuriau, ei gwtogi 10 y cant. Os digwydd hynny, neu os caiff yr arian hwn ei gwtogi o gwbl, a wnewch chi addo siarad â'r Gweinidog Cyllid ynglŷn ag arian trosiannol i leihau'r baich ar fudiadau sy'n dibynnu ar yr arian hwn, fel na fyddant yn wynebu cwtogiad o'r fath ar unwaith?

**Edwina Hart:** Mae cwtogiad o 9.7 y cant yn gyffredinol. Llwyf gefnogaf y safbwyntiau a fynegwyd gan y pwyllgor yr wythnos diwethaf. Bydd y pwyllgor yn ysgrifennu at y Gweinidog Cyllid, a byddaf innau hefyd.

### **Lleihau Trais yn y Cartref Reducing Domestic Violence**

**Q2 Lorraine Barrett:** What action is the Welsh Assembly Government taking to reduce domestic violence? (OAQ39714)

**Edwina Hart:** The Welsh Assembly Government regards action to reduce domestic abuse in Wales as a major priority. We are developing an all-Wales national strategy, which will be published next year. There has been a positive response to consultation on this strategy. To assist with the development and implementation of the strategy, an additional £1.1 million has been allocated in the draft budget for 2005 to 2008.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Thank you for your answer and support. We all support the Welsh Assembly Government's commitment to tackling domestic violence, but you will be aware of the Wales Trades Union Congress's commitment to tackle domestic violence by promoting work-based policies. Domestic violence is an issue in the workplace and many employers employ someone who has

**C2 Lorraine Barrett:** Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n eu cymryd i leihau trais yn y cartref? (OAQ39714)

**Edwina Hart:** Mae camau gweithredu i leihau achosion o gam-drin yn y cartref yng Nghymru yn flaenoriaeth bwysig i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Yr ydym yn datblygu strategaeth genedlaethol i Gymru gyfan, a gaiff ei chyhoeddi y flwyddyn nesaf. Cafwyd ymateb cadarnhaol i'r ymgynghoriad ar y strategaeth hon. Er mwyn helpu i ddatblygu'r strategaeth a'i rhoi ar waith, dyrannwyd £1.1 miliwn yn ychwanegol yn y gyllideb ddrafft ar gyfer 2005 i 2008.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Diolch am eich ateb a'ch cefnogaeth. Mae pob un ohonom yn cefnogi ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i fynd i'r afael â thrais yn y cartref, ond fe wyddoch am ymrwymiad Cyngres Undebau Llafur Cymru i fynd i'r afael â thrais yn y cartref drwy hyrwyddo polisïau yn y gweithle. Mae effeithau trais yn y cartref i'w gweld yn y gweithle ac mae llawer o

either direct or indirect experience of domestic violence. Will you therefore offer your support, Minister, to the TUC's campaign to raise awareness of domestic violence through the workplace?

**Edwina Hart:** I very much support the Wales TUC campaign. For many years the trade union movement was prominent in this field, because it did a tremendous amount of work on domestic abuse. Before it became a more popular issue in other circles, the TUC was already aware of the impact that it had on the workforce. The work performance of a woman who has suffered domestic abuse will be affected, and there were a lot of disciplinary issues around that. The trade unions dealt with this at an early stage by using counsellors.

**Leanne Wood:** We in Plaid Cymru support the domestic abuse strategy and it should be commended. That there is a majority in the Chamber in favour of ending violence against children—that is, a smacking ban—should also be commended. Minister, I know that you support such a ban, but can you tell us what steps you and your colleagues will take to ensure that the Assembly is given the powers that we need to ensure that, when there is cross-party support for such an issue, we are given the clout and the teeth that we need to implement such measures?

**Edwina Hart:** I am not sure about the word 'clout' in this context, Leanne, but you are right that there is a consensus on these issues across the Assembly. I will raise this issue with my colleague Jane Hutt, who is responsible for children's matters.

**Carl Sargeant:** Lorraine Barrett's question is timely and welcome given that tomorrow will be the United Nations' international day to end violence against women. Would you agree that domestic violence against anyone, male or female, young or old, is totally unacceptable and will the Welsh Assembly Government examine what support could be offered to male victims of domestic abuse?

gyflogwyr yn cyflogi rhywun â phrofiad uniongyrchol neu anuniongyrchol o drais yn y cartref. Felly, Weinidog, a rowch eich cefnogaeth i ymgyrch y TUC i godi ymwybyddiaeth o drais yn y cartref drwy'r gweithle?

**Edwina Hart:** Cefnogaf ymgyrch TUC Cymru yn fawr iawn. Yr oedd mudiad yr undebau llafur yn amlwg yn y maes hwn am flynyddoedd lawer, am iddo wneud llawer o waith ar gam-drin yn y cartref. Cyn iddo ddod yn fater mwy poblogaidd mewn cylchoedd eraill, yr oedd y TUC eisoes yn ymwybodol o effaith cam-drin yn y cartref ar y gweithlu. Effeithir ar berfformiad gwaith menyw sydd wedi cael ei cham-drin yn y cartref, ac yr oedd llawer o faterion disgyblu yn gysylltiedig â hynny. Ymdriniodd yr undebau llafur â hyn yn gynnar drwy ddefnyddio cynghorwyr.

**Leanne Wood:** Yr ydym ni ym Mhlaid Cymru yn cefnogi'r strategaeth cam-drin yn y cartref a dylid ei chymeradwyo. Dylid cymeradwyo hefyd y ffaith bod mwyafrif yn y Siambr o blaid rhoi terfyn ar drais yn erbyn plant—hynny yw, gwaharddiad ar daro. Weinidog, gwn eich bod yn cefnogi gwaharddiad o'r fath, ond, a allwch ddweud wrthym pa gamau y byddwch chi a'ch cyd-Weinidogion yn eu cymryd i sicrhau y caiff y Cynulliad y pwerau sydd eu hangen arnom i sicrhau bod gennym ddigon o rym i weithredu mesurau o'r fath, gan fod cefnogaeth drawsbleidiol i'r mater?

**Edwina Hart:** Nid wyf yn siŵr ynglŷn â'r gair 'grym' yn y cyd-destun hwn, Leanne, ond mae'n gywir ichi ddweud fod consensws ar y materion hyn ar draws y Cynulliad. Codaf y mater hwn gyda'm cyd-Weinidog, Jane Hutt, sy'n gyfrifol am faterion plant.

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae cwestiwn Lorraine Barrett yn amserol ac yn un i'w groesawu o gofio mai yfory fydd diwrnod rhyngwladol y Cenhedloedd Unedig i roi terfyn ar drais yn erbyn menywod. A gytunech fod trais yn y cartref yn erbyn unrhyw un, boed yn ddyn, neu'n fenyw, yn hen neu ifanc, yn gwbl annerbyniol ac a wnaiff Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ystyried pa gymorth y gellid ei gynnig i ddynion sy'n cael eu cam-drin yn y cartref?

**Edwina Hart:** Domestic abuse covers the whole range of issues. We have looked at that issue because points were raised in committee some time ago, and we are developing the strategy.

**Mark Isherwood:** Reports of domestic violence are increasing and the introduction of the Wales domestic abuse helpline and the Domestic Violence Bill are likely to see this trend continue. What action are you therefore taking to help those such as the 183 callers to Delyn's Women's Aid reported in the *Flintshire Evening Leader* last Friday, who could not be given a safe haven in Flintshire?

**Edwina Hart:** We will have to review that. I cannot answer why 183 women did not have access to accommodation, as I do not know the nature of the calls. Welsh Women's Aid tells me that there is pressure across Wales in trying to obtain facilities. We are looking at that issue.

**Edwina Hart:** Mae cam-drin yn y cartref yn rhychwantu yr ystod o faterion. Yr ydym wedi ystyried y mater hwnnw am i bwyntiau gael eu codi yn y pwyllgor beth amser yn ôl, ac yr ydym yn datblygu'r strategaeth.

**Mark Isherwood:** Mae nifer yr achosion o drais yn y cartref yr hysbysir yr awdurdodau ohonynt yn cynyddu ac mae'n debygol y bydd y duedd hon yn parhau ar ôl cyflwyno'r llinell gymorth cam-drin yn y cartref i Gymru a'r Mesur Trais yn y Cartref. Felly, pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd i helpu'r rhai megis y 183 o bobl a ffoniodd Cymorth i Fenywod yn Nelyn, yn ôl adroddiad yn y *Flintshire Evening Leader* ddydd Gwener diwethaf, na ellid rhoi lloches iddynt yn sir y Fflint?

**Edwina Hart:** Bydd yn rhaid inni adolygu hynny. Ni allaf roi ateb pam yr oedd 183 o fenywod wedi methu â chael llety, gan na wn beth oedd natur y galwadau. Dywed Cymorth i Fenywod Cymru wrthyf fod pwysau ledled Cymru o ran ceisio cael hyd i gyfleusterau. Yr ydym yn ystyried y mater hwnnw.

### **Lleihau Tlodi Reducing Poverty**

**Q3 The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** Will the Minister make a statement on how her policies are reducing poverty? (OAQ39715)

**Edwina Hart:** Tackling poverty across Wales lies at the heart of the Assembly Government's agenda. All our policies—for the economy, health, education, transport, and housing—are focused on building stronger and more sustainable communities.

**Nick Bourne:** I know that the Minister has taken an interest in the withdrawal of BT payphones and we have corresponded on this. It is a serious issue, as some people do not have phones, and mobile coverage can be a problem. Could the Minister give us an update as to what has happened since 2 November, when she confirmed that she had been in contact with the Department of Trade and Industry?

**Edwina Hart:** We have had some

**C3 Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar sut y mae ei pholisïau yn lleihau tlodi? (OAQ39715)

**Edwina Hart:** Mae mynd i'r afael â thlodi ledled Cymru wrth wraidd agenda Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae pob un o'n polisïau—ar gyfer yr economi, iechyd, addysg, trafnidiaeth a thai—yn canolbwyntio ar adeiladu cymunedau cryfach a mwy cynaliadwy.

**Nick Bourne:** Gwn fod y Gweinidog wedi cymryd diddordeb yn y penderfyniad i dynnu ffonau talu BT yn ôl ac yr ydym wedi gohebu ar y mater hwn. Mae'n fater difrifol, am nad oes ffonau gan rai pobl, ac mae'n gallu bod yn anodd defnyddio ffôn symudol mewn rhai ardaloedd. A allai'r Gweinidog ddweud wrthym beth sydd wedi digwydd ers 2 Tachwedd, pan gadarnhaodd iddi fod mewn cysylltiad â'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr ydym wedi cael peth

correspondence, possibly from the DTI, but certainly from BT, which I will make available in précis form for Members in the Library.

**Nick Bourne:** Since the issue of domestic violence is currently topical because of the international day to end violence against women tomorrow, could I stress the importance of the use of the payphone by victims of domestic violence and children? Childline confirms that most of its calls are made from payphones. That underlines the importance of this, Minister. If there is a 50:50 situation with regard to a payphone, we should ask BT to keep it for those reasons.

gohebiaeth, o bosibl oddi wrth yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant, ond yn sicr oddi wrth BT, a byddaf yn rhoi crynodeb ohoni yn y Llyfrgell i Aelodau.

**Nick Bourne:** Gan fod trais yn y cartref yn fater sy'n cael sylw ar hyn o bryd oherwydd y diwrnod rhyngwladol i roi terfyn ar drais yn erbyn menywod yfory, a gaf bwysleisio pwysigrwydd y defnydd o ffonau talu gan y rhai sy'n dioddef trais yn y cartref a phlant? Mae Childline yn cadarnhau bod y rhan fwyaf o'r galwadau i'r llinell yn dod o ffonau talu. Mae hynny yn tanlinellu pwysigrwydd y mater hwn, Weinidog. Pan fo dadl dros ac yn erbyn cadw ffôn talu, dylem ofyn i BT ei gadw am y rhesymau hynny.

2.10 p.m.

**Edwina Hart:** I thank you for comments on this, Nick, because it is true that women fleeing domestic violence use phone boxes, because they do not want their calls monitored, or anyone looking at their mobile phone bills to see whom they have been ringing. In the case of children, sometimes a child who is perhaps going back to a difficult situation will see a payphone on the way home from school and decide to use it. I will certainly make those points fully.

**Edwina Hart:** Diolchaf ichi am y sylwadau ar hyn, Nick, oherwydd mae'n wir bod menywod sy'n ffoi rhag trais yn y cartref yn defnyddio blychau ffôn, am nad ydynt am i'w galwadau gael eu monitro, neu i unrhyw un edrych ar eu biliau ffôn symudol i weld pwy y maent wedi ei ffonio. Yn achos plant, weithiau efallai y bydd plentyn sy'n dychwelyd i sefyllfa anodd yn gweld ffôn talu ar y ffordd adref o'r ysgol ac yn penderfynu ei ddefnyddio. Yn sicr, byddaf yn gwneud y pwyntiau hynny yn llawn.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Gwn fod y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol bod digartrefedd yn effeithio ar dlodi, a bod ffigurau digartrefedd wedi codi yn eithaf sylweddol yn ystod y tair blynedd diwethaf. Mae hefyd yn gwybod bod y stoc dai yn y sector cyhoeddus yn lleihau yn sylweddol. Er enghraifft, ers 1997, mae 686 o dai yn y sector wedi'u gwerthu ym Môn, a 133 o dai wedi cymryd eu lle. Felly, mae 500 yn llai o dai ar gael i'w rhentu. A yw'r Gweinidog yn ymwybodol—fel yr wyf yn siŵr ei bod hi—bod prinder difrifol o dai i'w rhentu mewn ardaloedd gwledig a threfol? A yw'n hyderus y bydd polisiau'r Llywodraeth yn gallu newid y sefyllfa druenus hon?

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** I know that the Minister is aware that homelessness has an impact on poverty, and that homelessness figures have risen quite dramatically during the past three years. She also knows that the housing stock in the public sector is decreasing significantly. For example, since 1997, 686 houses in the sector have been sold in Anglesey, and 133 houses have taken their place. Therefore there are 500 fewer houses available for rent. Is the Minister aware—as I am sure she is—that there is a serious shortage of houses for rent in rural and urban areas? Is she confident that the Government's policies can change this appalling situation?

**Edwina Hart:** I concur that there have been enormous difficulties in finding affordable housing and housing for rent across Wales. I am currently discussing with officials a range of measures, including legislation on bed and

**Edwina Hart:** Cytunaf fod pobl wedi wynebu anawsterau dybryd i ddod o hyd i dai fforddiadwy a thai i'w rhentu ledled Cymru. Yr wyf yn trafod nifer o fesurau gyda'r swyddogion ar hyn o bryd, gan gynnwys



breakfast accommodation, and what more we need to do in terms of community land trusts. Do we need to look again at whether grants should be available? What if, for example, someone wants to build an extension to the family home for the family? There are also issues around planning. I hope, by the end of January, to have a substantial package on this whole issue to go to the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee for discussion. I am also concerned about the issues around the right to buy, but I do not have control over those.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr wyf yn cydnabod consŷrn y Gweinidog, ac yn diolch iddi am ei hymateb positif. Yn ogystal â'r prinder o dai i'w rhentu, hoffwn dynnu sylw at y ffaith bod arolwg diweddar yn dangos bod y nifer o bobl ifanc sydd yn gallu prynu tŷ wedi gostwng ar gyfartaledd. Yn y 1990au yr oedd tri chwarter cyplau ifanc yn gallu prynu tŷ; erbyn hyn y ffigur yw tri allan o bump. Felly, mae cwmp yn nifer y tai i'w rhentu ac mae llai o bobl ifanc yn gallu prynu tŷ. A yw'r Gweinidog yn ymwybodol bod rhaid i ni edrych eto ar yr hawl i brynu a chynlluniau eraill er mwyn sicrhau bod gan bobl y dewisiadau cywir yn y sector?

**Edwina Hart:** People have to have the right choices, and we must make them as easy as possible. We also need to do much more work on shared equity arrangements; we need to be more positive about people perhaps buying only 30 or 50 per cent of a house, and make that facility available. Also, I think that when people in the community are good enough to make land available for low-cost housing, we should keep that housing within the community, because it can be low-cost housing in terms of affordability. All these issues are currently being addressed and I hope that I will have something substantive, in terms of all the points that Members have raised on the issue, by the end of January.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** One context in which poverty will increase in Wales is the unseen context of the revaluation of properties for council tax. Its random nature will mean that people who are

deddfwriaeth ynglŷn â llety gwely a brecwast, a beth arall y mae angen inni ei wneud o ran ymddiriedolaethau tir cymunedol. A oes angen inni ailystyried pa un a ddylai grantiau fod ar gael? Beth os bydd rhywun am adeiladu estyniad i'r cartref teuluol i'r teulu, er enghraifft? Cyfyd materion hefyd o ran cynllunio. Gobeithiaf, erbyn diwedd mis Ionawr, y bydd pecyn sylweddol ar y mater hwn yn barod i'w gyflwyno gerbron y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio i'w drafod. Pryderaf hefyd am y problemau o ran yr hawl i brynu, ond nid wyf yn gallu rheoli'r rhain.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I acknowledge the Minister's concern, and thank her for her positive response. In addition to the shortage of houses for rent, I draw attention to the fact that a recent survey shows that, on average, the number of young people who are able to buy a house has fallen. In the 1990s three quarters of young couples could afford to buy a house; now the figure is three in five. Therefore, there is a decline in the number of houses for rent and fewer young people are able to buy a house. Is the Minister aware that we must look again at the right to buy and other schemes in order to ensure that people have the right choices in the sector?

**Edwina Hart:** Rhaid bod gan bobl y dewisiadau cywir, a rhaid inni eu gwneud mor hawdd â phosibl. Mae angen inni hefyd wneud llawer mwy o waith ar drefniadau ar gyfer rhannu ecwiti; mae angen inni fod yn fwy cadarnhaol ynglŷn â'r syniad o bobl yn prynu dim ond 30 neu 50 y cant o dŷ efallai, a sicrhau bod y cyfleuster hwnnw ar gael. Hefyd, pan fo pobl yn y gymuned yn barod i ryddhau tir ar gyfer tai cost isel, credaf y dylem gadw'r tai hynny ar gyfer y gymuned, oherwydd gallant fod yn dai cost isel o ran fforddiadwyedd. Eir i'r afael â phob un o'r materion hyn ar hyn o bryd gobeithiaf y bydd gennyf rywbeth o sylwedd, o ran yr holl bwyntiau a godwyd gan Aelodau ar y mater, erbyn diwedd mis Ionawr.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Un cyd-destun lle y bydd tlodi yn cynyddu yng Nghymru yw cyd-destun anweladwy ailbrisio eiddo at ddiben y dreth gyngor. Bydd ei natur ddigyswllt yn golygu yr

poor in Wales, particularly if they are pensioners, may be harder hit. What do you think ought to be done to relieve that level of poverty, and, if it is about council tax benefit, when the take-up of council tax benefit among those who are eligible for it is declining, how can you make it more readily available to them?

**Edwina Hart:** These are issues that my colleague, Sue Essex, is already aware of. She has matters in hand in terms of looking at how we can promote to people who live on their own what they are entitled to. These are issues that have already been discussed and well-aired in the Assembly in the context of questions to my colleague.

**Michael German:** Will there be a Welsh Assembly Government initiative to promote benefit take-up? We have the experience of the pension credit, for which the promotion campaign has now been withdrawn, and probably a third of pensioners in Wales who are eligible for these benefits are not getting them. If that is the likely pattern, is it not time for the Welsh Assembly Government to act in place of the UK Government, which seems to have abandoned its liabilities in this matter?

**Edwina Hart:** My colleague, Sue Essex, has matters in hand regarding a campaign on council tax issues. I will take on board the other issues that you raised, as I am keen on benefits rights and advice work being upped in Wales so that people can have their full entitlements to benefits across the board.

effeithir ar bobl dlawd yng Nghymru, yn enwedig os mai pensiynwyr ydynt, yn fwy nag eraill o bosibl. Beth y dylid ei wneud, yn eich barn chi, i leddfu tloidi o'r fath, ac, os oes a wnelo â budd-dal y dreth gyngor, pan fo nifer y bobl sy'n hawlio budd-dal y dreth gyngor o blith y rhai sy'n gymwys i'w hawlio yn lleihau, sut y gallwch sicrhau ei fod yn haws ei hawlio?

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'r rhain yn faterion y mae fy nghyd-Weinidog, Sue Essex, eisoes yn ymwybodol ohonynt. Mae wrthi yn ystyried sut y gallwn fynd ati i ddweud wrth bobl sy'n byw ar eu pennau eu hunain am y budd-daliadau y gallant eu hawlio. Mae'r rhain yn faterion a drafodwyd sawl gwaith eisoes yn y Cynulliad yng nghyd-destun cwestiynau i'm cyd-Weinidog.

**Michael German:** A fydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ymgymryd â menter i annog pobl i hawlio budd-daliadau? Mae profiad gennym o'r credyd pensiwn, y mae'r ymgyrch hyrwyddo drosto wedi'i dynnu'n ôl erbyn hyn, ac mae tua un o bob tri phensiynwr yng Nghymru sy'n gymwys i gael y budd-daliadau hyn siŵr o fod heb eu hawlio. Os mai dyna'r patrwm tebygol, onid yw'n bryd i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru weithredu yn lle Llywodraeth y DU, yr ymddengys ei bod wedi cefnu ar ei rhwymedigaethau yn hyn o beth?

**Edwina Hart:** Mae materion ar y gweill gan fy nghyd-Weinidog, Sue Essex, o ran ymgyrch ynglŷn â materion yn ymwneud â'r dreth gyngor. Byddaf yn ystyried y materion eraill a godwyd gennych, gan fy mod yn awyddus i weld mwy o waith ar hawliau a chyngor ar fudd-daliadau yn cael ei wneud yng Nghymru fel y gall pobl gael pob budd-dal y mae ganddynt hawl iddo.

### **Effaith y Mesur Hapchwarae The Effect of the Gambling Bill**

**Q4 Leanne Wood:** What assessment has the Minister made of the effect of the Gambling Bill on the regeneration of communities? (OAQ39702)

**Edwina Hart:** The Assembly Government is closely monitoring the passage of the Gambling Bill through the UK Parliament.

**C4 Leanne Wood:** Pa asesiad y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i wneud o effaith y Mesur Hapchwarae ar adfywio cymunedau? (OAQ39702)

**Edwina Hart:** Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn monitro'n fanwl hynt y Mesur Hapchwarae drwy Senedd y DU. Yn fy

Within my portfolio, there are implications ranging from the possible impact on crime and disorder to the amount of personal debt being accrued by the poorest members of our society. I will seek to ensure that any changes to the law on gambling do not exacerbate these problems and are not detrimental to those living in our most disadvantaged communities.

**Leanne Wood:** I suppose that you would agree that addiction to gambling is as serious as any other addiction. When I worked as a probation officer, I saw at first hand how families can be ruined by gambling addiction. When gamblers run out of money, they can turn to crime to feed their habit. This problem has a greater impact in deprived communities than anywhere else. What concrete steps will you take to protect those people—gamblers, their families and the community at large—who will be affected by the inevitable increase in gambling as a result of this Gambling Bill?

**Edwina Hart:** I understand that one of this Bill's three licensing objectives is to prevent gambling from being a source of crime and disorder; it will be interesting to see how that is implemented. The Bill should ensure either a reduction or no increase in the criminal activity associated with gambling, and one of the key principles behind the Bill is a crime-free gambling industry. Therefore, we will have to look at how all this pans out. On debt and people turning to crime, my Deputy Minister, Huw Lewis, is considering the issue of debt in Wales. I do not know whether he has come across any issues regarding gambling in any proposals that he might include in his report, but I will ask him to look at that.

**David Melding:** Is it not the case, Minister, that many people get much enjoyment out of the occasional gamble, and that it adds to life's rich pageant in many ways? However, we need to distinguish between that and those people who get addicted and lose control. In a world where many addicts are gambling on

mhorthffolio, bydd goblygiadau yn amrywio o'r effaith bosibl ar droseddau ac anhrefn i'r dyledion personol y bydd y tlotaf yn ein cymdeithas yn eu cronni. Ceisiaf sicrhau na fydd unrhyw newidiadau i'r gyfraith ar hapchwarae yn gwaethygu'r problemau hyn ac na fyddant yn andwyol i'r rhai sy'n byw yn ein cymunedau mwyaf diffreintiedig.

**Leanne Wood:** Tybiaf y byddech yn cytuno bod problem o ran bod yn gaeth i hapchwarae yr un mor ddifrifol ag unrhyw fath arall o ddibyniaeth. Pan oeddwn yn gweithio fel swyddog prawf, gwelais fy hun sut y gallai bod yn gaeth i hapchwarae ddinistrio teuluoedd. Pan fydd hapchwaraewyr yn mynd yn brin o arian, weithiau maent yn dechrau cyflawni troseddau er mwyn cael arian i barhau i hapchwarae. Mae'r broblem hon yn cael mwy o effaith mewn cymunedau diffreintiedig nag mewn mannau eraill. Pa gamau pendant y byddwch yn eu cymryd i ddiogelu'r bobl hynny—hapchwaraewyr, eu teuluoedd a'r gymuned yn gyffredinol—yr effeithir arnynt gan y cynnydd anochel mewn hapchwarae o ganlyniad i'r Mesur Hapchwarae hwn?

**Edwina Hart:** Deallaf mai un o dri amcan y Mesur hwn o ran trwyddedu yw atal hapchwarae rhag peri troseddau ac anhrefn; bydd yn ddiddorol gweld sut y caiff hynny ei weithredu. Dylai'r Mesur sicrhau naill ai lleihad neu ddim cynnydd mewn troseddau sy'n gysylltiedig â hapchwarae, ac un o brif egwyddorion y Mesur yw diwydiant hapchwarae sy'n rhydd o droseddu. Felly, cawn weld sut y bydd pethau yn datblygu. O ran dyled a phobl yn dechrau troseddu, mae fy Niprwy Weinidog, Huw Lewis, yn ystyried y broblem o ddyled yng Nghymru. Ni wn a yw wedi dod ar draws unrhyw faterion o ran hapchwarae mewn unrhyw gynigion y gallai eu cynnwys yn ei adroddiad, ond byddaf yn gofyn iddo ystyried hynny.

**David Melding:** Onid yw'n wir, Weinidog, fod llawer o bobl yn cael cryn bleser o hapchware o bryd i'w gilydd, a bod hynny'n ychwanegu at gyfoeth bywyd mewn sawl ffordd? Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni wahaniaethu rhwng hynny a'r bobl sy'n mynd yn gaeth ac yn colli rheolaeth. Mewn

the internet, for instance, which is sometimes uncontrolled, we need to be mature about this. There will be certain opportunities for grand casinos—and anyone who has travelled on the Riviera, for instance, knows that it adds an element to the dignity of their life. We should not simply dismiss this aspect of culture offhand.

**Edwina Hart:** We must look at everything that can be addictive. The occasional drink is all right, as is the occasional flutter. However, there can be serious implications if people take up gambling in a big way, especially if they cannot afford to gamble. We must keep a balance, but we must also be aware of our responsibilities, so that we do not encourage and allow habits to get out of hand.

byd lle y mae llawer o bobl sy'n gaeth i hapchwarae yn hapchwarae ar y rhyngrywyd, er enghraifft, sydd heb ei reoli weithiau, mae angen inni fod yn aeddfed ynglŷn â hyn. Bydd rhai cyfleoedd i gasinos mawr—a bydd unrhyw un sydd wedi teithio ar hyd y Rifiera, er enghraifft, yn gwybod bod hyn yn ychwanegu rhyw ychydig at urddas ei fywyd. Ni ddylem wfftio'r agwedd hon ar ddiwylliant.

**Edwina Hart:** Rhaid inni ystyried popeth a all peri i bobl fynd yn gaeth. Mae diod fach nawr ac yn y man yn iawn, ac mae'r un peth yn wir am hapchwarae. Fodd bynnag, efallai y bydd goblygiadau difrifol os bydd pobl yn dechrau hapchwarae ar raddfa fawr, yn enwedig os na allant fforddio hapchwarae. Rhaid inni gael cydbwysedd, ond rhaid inni hefyd fod yn ymwybodol o'n cyfrifoldebau, fel na fyddwn yn annog pobl i fynd dros ben llestri a cholli rheolaeth.

### Teen Challenge

**Q5 William Graham:** Will the Minister make a statement on the future funding and the contribution of Teen Challenge in combating substance abuse in Wales? (OAQ39704)

**Edwina Hart:** The decision regarding Teen Challenge as a supporting people provider has been made. I have circulated the decision to members of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee, and, if members agree, I will circulate it to all Assembly Members today, in case they wish to ask me any further questions on it.

**William Graham:** You enjoy great respect in the Assembly, Minister, for the way in which you have tackled substance abuse. Will you join me and Gwent Police, Drugaid, Caring Hands, and the Probation Service's arrest referral scheme to acknowledge the wonderful work that Teen Challenge has done in Newport, Blaenau Gwent and Carmarthenshire? It has a proven track record of helping people to rebuild their lives, integrating them and making a positive contribution to society. If the supporting people revenue grant is to be withheld, how will this work continue, and how will you

**C5 William Graham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar drefniadau ariannu Teen Challenge yn y dyfodol a'i gyfraniad i'r gwaith o fynd i'r afael â chamdefnyddio sylweddau yng Nghymru? (OAQ39704)

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'r penderfyniad o ran Teen Challenge fel un o ddarparwyr cefnogi pobl wedi'i wneud. Yr wyf wedi dosbarthu'r penderfyniad i aelodau'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, ac, os bydd yr aelodau yn cytuno, byddaf yn ei ddosbarthu i bob Aelod o'r Cynulliad heddiw, rhag ofn eu bod am fy holi yn ei gylch ymhellach.

**William Graham:** Yr ydych yn cael eich parchu'n fawr iawn yn y Cynulliad, Weinidog, am y ffordd yr ydych wedi mynd i'r afael â chamdefnyddio sylweddau. A ymunwch â mi a Heddlu Gwent, Drugaid, Caring Hands, a chynllun atgyfeirio ar ôl arestio y Gwasanaeth Prawf i gydnabod y gwaith rhagorol y mae Teen Challenge wedi'i wneud yng Nghasnewydd, Blaenau Gwent a sir Gaerfyrddin? Mae ganddo record dda o helpu pobl i ailadeiladu eu bywydau, eu hintegreiddio â chymdeithas a gwneud cyfraniad cadarnhaol i gymdeithas. Os caiff grant refeniw cefnogi pobl ei dynnu'n ôl, sut

help the people who desperately need your aid?

**Edwina Hart:** Teen Challenge has been invited to make a fresh application, without prejudice, in respect of the four move-on units. I am pleased that its work is held in high regard by the organisations that you listed.

2.20 p.m.

**Leighton Andrews:** I am also aware of beneficial work that has been done in the past by Teen Challenge in the Rhondda, as I remember having to point out to the former Plaid-controlled Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council. Will you take it from me that this organisation has enjoyed wide support from many organisations and individuals?

**Edwina Hart:** Yes. I, too, have received a great deal of correspondence on this particular issue.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Tackling individuals' drug addiction is highly complex, and I am sure that you accept that the same approach would not suit all addicts. Is there not, therefore, room for an approach with a Christian ethos?

**Edwina Hart:** There is always room in this issue for any approach on any basis, providing the funding application criteria are met.

y bydd y gwaith hwn yn parhau, a sut y byddwch yn helpu pobl y mae angen eich cymorth arnynt yn ddybryd?

**Edwina Hart:** Gwahoddwyd Teen Challenge i wneud cais newydd, heb ragfarn, mewn perthynas â'r pedair uned symud ymlaen. Yr wyf yn falch o glywed bod ei waith yn cael ei barchu gan y sefydliadau a restrwyd gennych.

**Leighton Andrews:** Yr wyf innau hefyd yn ymwybodol o'r gwaith da a wnaed gan Teen Challenge yn y Rhondda yn y gorffennol, oherwydd cofiaf fy mod yn gorfod ei ddwyn i sylw Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf pan oedd o dan arweiniad Plaid Cymru. A dderbyniwch fy ngair fod y mudiad hwn wedi cael cefnogaeth eang gan lawer o fudiadau ac unigolion?

**Edwina Hart:** Gwnaf. Yr wyf innau hefyd wedi cael llawer o ohebiaeth ynglŷn â'r mater penodol hwn.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Mae mynd i'r afael â dibyniaeth unigolion ar gyffuriau yn fater cymhleth iawn, ac yr ydych yn derbyn, mae'n siŵr, na fyddai un ffordd o weithredu yn gweddu i bawb. Felly, onid oes lle i ffordd o weithredu ac iddi ethos Cristnogol?

**Edwina Hart:** Yn hyn o beth mae lle bob amser i unrhyw ffordd o weithredu ar unrhyw sail, ar yr amod y caiff y meini prawf ariannu eu bodloni.

### **Y Cynllun Datblygu Swyddfeydd Post The Post Office Development Scheme**

**Q6 Glyn Davies:** Has the Minister been approached by sub-post offices about conditions attached to grants under the post office development scheme? (OAQ39696)

**Edwina Hart:** I have not been approached directly by sub-postmasters or sub-postmistresses about the terms and conditions of grant under the Welsh Assembly Government's post office development fund. My officials have had correspondence with a number of sub-postmasters and sub-postmistresses, and have been working with

**C6 Glyn Davies:** A yw is-swyddfeydd post wedi cysylltu â hi ynghylch amodau'n gysylltiedig â grantiau o dan y cynllun datblygu swyddfeydd post? (OAQ39696)

**Edwina Hart:** Nid yw is-bostfeistri neu is-bostfeistresi wedi cysylltu â mi yn uniongyrchol ynglŷn â thelerau ac amodau grantiau o dan gronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Mae fy swyddogion wedi bod yn gohebu â nifer o is-bostfeistri ac is-bostfeistresi, ac maent wedi bod yn gweithio gyda chyfreithwyr i sicrhau

lawyers to ensure that the terms and conditions achieve the objectives intended for the fund, but do not represent a heavy imposition for sub-postmasters and sub-postmistresses.

**Glyn Davies:** I do not agree with one point, Minister. Some sub-post offices that have been awarded a grant are deeply concerned about the condition that allows for recovery of grant with interest if the business closes within five years. That would be fair enough, except that the Post Office will not guarantee not to close down a sub-post office beyond three and a half years. The consequence is that good projects, making good use of the grant scheme, cannot go ahead unless the person accessing the grant scheme is to some extent a gambler. Public money is not being used to best effect. Why will you not resolve this problem by bringing the two timeframes of five years and three and a half years into line?

**Edwina Hart:** Public money is being used well. Without the charge, there would be little to stop sub-postmasters or sub-postmistresses from selling on their business after two years, for example, with the new owners deciding to change the business completely or close it. The purpose of the Assembly investment is to maintain a post office, and not to allow something else to take its place. With regard to issues concerning Post Office decisions about further closures, I have discretion in this matter.

**Peter Law:** In your work to further develop our sub-post offices, will you support the Communication Workers Union's 'Banking on You' campaign, to encourage more high street banks to enable customers to withdraw cash from sub-post offices, thereby improving the viability of those post offices?

**Edwina Hart:** I have regular meetings with the CWU's regional secretary, Ken Hanbury, and this is one of the issues that have been discussed. I support the union's campaign; in fact, I met representatives of HSBC some time ago to press the case and to ask, if it is not prepared to do that nationally, why can it

bod y telerau a'r amodau yn cyflawni'r amcanion a fwriadwyd ar gyfer y gronfa, ond nad ydynt yn faich trwm ar is-bostfeistri ac is-bostfeistresi.

**Glyn Davies:** Ni chytunaf ag un pwynt, Weinidog. Mae rhai is-swyddfeydd post sydd wedi cael grant yn pryderu'n fawr am yr amod sy'n caniatáu i'r grant gael ei adennill gyda llog os bydd y busnes yn cau ymhen pum mlynedd. Byddai hynny yn ddigon teg, oni bai am y ffaith nad yw Swyddfa'r Post yn gwarantu peidio â chau is-swyddfa bost y tu hwnt i dair blynedd a hanner. O ganlyniad i hyn, ni all prosiectau da, sy'n gwneud defnydd da o'r cynllun grant, fynd rhagddynt oni bai fod yr unigolyn sy'n gwneud cais am grant o dan y cynllun yn fodlon mentro i ryw raddau. Ni chaiff arian cyhoeddus ei ddefnyddio'n fwyaf effeithiol. Pam na wnewch chi ddatrys y broblem hon drwy gysoni'r ddau derfyn amser o bum mlynedd a thair blynedd a hanner?

**Edwina Hart:** Defnyddir arian cyhoeddus yn dda. Heb yr arwystl, ni fyddai fawr ddim i atal is-bostfeistri neu is-bostfeistresi rhag gwerthu eu busnes ar ôl dwy flynedd, er enghraifft, gyda'r perchnogion newydd yn penderfynu newid y busnes yn gyfan gwbl neu ei gau. Diben buddsoddiad y Cynulliad yw cadw swyddfa bost, a pheidio â chaniatáu i ddim byd arall gymryd ei lle. O ran y materion ynglŷn â phenderfyniadau Swyddfa'r Post ar gau rhagor o swyddfeydd post, mae gennyf ddisgresiwn yn hyn o beth.

**Peter Law:** Yn eich gwaith i ddatblygu ein his-swyddfeydd post ymhellach, a wnewch chi gefnogi ymgyrch 'Banking on You' Undeb y Gweithwyr Cyfathrebu, i annog mwy o fanciau'r stryd fawr i'w gwneud yn bosibl i gwsmeriaid godi arian mewn is-swyddfeydd post, a thrwy hynny wneud y swyddfeydd post hynny yn fwy dichonadwy?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf yn cyfarfod yn rheolaidd ag ysgrifennydd rhanbarthol yr Undeb, Ken Hanbury, ac mae hwn yn un o'r materion a drafodwyd. Cefnogaf ymgyrch yr undeb; yn wir, cyfarfûm â chynrychiolwyr HSBC beth amser yn ôl i ddadlau dros hynny a gofyn pam na ellir gwneud hynny yng

not be done in Wales.

Nghymru, hyd yn oed os nad yw'n barod i wneud hynny yn genedlaethol.

**Elin Jones:** Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi'u cael, neu'n bwriadu eu cael, gyda'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant i sicrhau bod y gefnogaeth ariannol bresennol i gynnal swyddfeydd post gwledig yn para y tu hwnt i 2006?

**Elin Jones:** What discussions have you had, or do you intend to have, with the Department of Trade and Industry to ensure that current financial support to retain rural post offices continues beyond 2006?

**Edwina Hart:** I have had extensive correspondence with the DTI on this matter. If Members want more detail, I am happy to provide a précis of all correspondence on this matter and place it in the Members' Library.

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf wedi cael llawer o ohebiaeth â'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant ynglŷn â'r mater hwn. Os yw Aelodau am gael rhagor o fanylion, yr wyf yn barod i baratoi crynodeb o'r holl ohebiaeth ynglŷn â'r mater hwn a'i osod yn Llyfrgell yr Aelodau.

**Kirsty Williams:** You may not have been approached directly by sub-postmasters or sub-postmistresses, but I have written to you twice since October about two applications in Brecon and Radnorshire. One constituent has received no fewer than three different sets of terms and conditions since she was offered the grant. This is extremely difficult for my constituents, who want to keep post offices open in Brecon and Radnorshire and do not feel that the grant is being handled in the way envisaged by the Assembly, to keep these vital services in communities. The terms and conditions now being attached simply do not allow some business people in my community to take them up confidently.

**Kirsty Williams:** Efallai nad yw is-bostfeistri neu is-bostfeistresi wedi cysylltu â chi yn uniongyrchol, ond yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu atoch ddwywaith ers mis Hydref ynglŷn â dau gais ym Mrycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed. Mae un o'm hetholwyr wedi cael tair set wahanol o delerau ac amodau i gyd ers i'r grant gael ei gynnig iddi. Mae hyn yn hynod anodd i'm hetholwyr, sydd am gadw swyddfeydd post ar agor ym Mrycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed ac sy'n teimlo na thrafodir y grant yn y ffordd a ragwelwyd gan y Cynulliad, er mwyn cadw'r gwasanaethau hollbwysig hyn mewn cymunedau. Mae'r telerau a'r amodau sy'n gysylltiedig â'r grant bellach yn atal rhai pobl fusnes yn fy nghymuned rhag eu derbyn gyda hyder.

**Edwina Hart:** I am afraid that I do not accept your points. This fund did not need to be established, but was established by the Welsh Assembly Government to help post offices. It is helping them, and we receive many applications, with the majority of applicants happy with the terms and conditions that apply.

**Edwina Hart:** Ni dderbyniaf eich pwyntiau, mae arnaf ofn. Nid oedd dyletswydd arnom i sefydlu'r gronfa hon, ond fe'i sefydlwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i helpu swyddfeydd post. Mae'n eu helpu, ac mae llawer o geisiadau yn dod i law, ac mae'r rhan fwyaf o ymgeiswyr yn fodlon ar y telerau a'r amodau sy'n gymwys.

### **Y Rhaglen Cyfleusterau a Gweithgareddau Cymunedol Community Facilities and Activities Programme**

**Q7 Janice Gregory:** Would the Minister give an update on the community facilities and activities programme? (OAQ39722)

**C7 Janice Gregory:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi gwybod am hynt y rhaglen cyfleusterau a gweithgareddau cymunedol? (OAQ39722)

**Edwina Hart:** The communities facilities and activities programme is a competitive scheme to help community and voluntary

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'r rhaglen cyfleusterau a gweithgareddau cymunedol yn gynllun cystadleuol i helpu mudiadau cymunedol a

organisations throughout Wales. Some £5.15 million has been committed to 75 projects since the scheme was re-opened in February 2004. Some 112 applications are under consideration in the current quarterly round, to be announced in December.

**Janice Gregory:** On behalf of the friends of Maesteg town hall and Saint David's church hall in Pencoed, I thank you for your continued support for this programme. However, I am becoming increasingly concerned about the level of charges that appear to be levied by professional bodies against small voluntary groups. Will you consider having discussions with professional organisations such as the Royal Society of Architects in Wales with a view to them reducing the charges or eliminating them altogether?

**Edwina Hart:** I will ask my officials to look at the percentage and the number of projects with regard to consultants' charges. This issue has previously been raised with me, informally. There is scope for us to discuss with professional bodies whether or not there is a possibility for some pro bono work to help within communities. I will provide a report on this to the committee.

gwirfoddol ledled Cymru. Mae tua £5.15 miliwn wedi'i neilltuo ar gyfer 75 o brosiectau ers i'r cynllun ailagor ym mis Chwefror 2004. Mae tua 112 o geisiadau yn cael eu hystyried yn y cylch chwarterol cyfredol, i'w gyhoeddi ym mis Rhagfyr.

**Janice Gregory:** O ran cyfeillion neuadd y dref Maesteg a neuadd eglwys Dewi Sant ym Mhencoed, diolchaf ichi am barhau i roi cymorth i'r rhaglen hon. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn pryderu'n fwyfwy am y ffioedd a godir gan gyrff proffesiynol ar grwpiau gwirfoddol bach, yn ôl y sôn. A wnewch chi ystyried cael trafodaethau gyda sefydliadau proffesiynol megis Cymdeithas Frenhinol y Penseiri yng Nghymru gyda'r bwriad o'u darbwyllo i ostwng y ffioedd neu i beidio â'u codi o gwbl?

**Edwina Hart:** Gofynnaf i'm swyddogion ystyried canran a nifer y prosiectau o ran ffioedd ymgynghorwyr. Codwyd y mater hwn gyda mi o'r blaen, yn anffurfiol. Mae lle inni drafod gyda chyrff proffesiynol pa un a oes posibilrwydd o rywfaent o waith pro bono i helpu mewn cymunedau. Rhoddaf adroddiad ar hyn i'r pwyllgor.

### **Mynediad at Dai Access to Housing**

**Q8 Peter Black:** What action is the Minister taking to improve accessibility to housing in Wales? (OAQ39736)

**Edwina Hart:** Our national housing strategy, 'Better Homes for People in Wales', sets out measures that we are taking to ensure that homes of all tenures and the general environment in which they are situated are accessible by everyone. We are also undertaking a wide-ranging review of housing adaptations for disabled people.

**Peter Black:** The review of housing adaptations is welcome. Do you accept that the fact that the money for disabled facilities grants has been cut, and continues to be paid at a reduced level, will hinder access for many people to their homes because they will be unable to access those grants as readily?

**C8 Peter Black:** Pa gamau y mae'n eu cymryd i'w gwneud hi'n haws i bobl gael tai yng Nghymru? (OAQ39736)

**Edwina Hart:** Mae ein strategaeth dai genedlaethol, 'Cartrefi Gwell i Bobl Cymru', yn nodi'r camau yr ydym yn eu cymryd i sicrhau bod cartrefi â phob math o ddeiliadaeth a'r amgylchedd cyffredinol lle y safant ar gael i bawb. Yr ydym hefyd yn cynnal adolygiad eang ei gwmpas o addasiadau tai ar gyfer pobl anabl.

**Peter Black:** Mae'r adolygiad o addasiadau tai i'w groesawu. A dderbyniwch fod y ffaith i'r arian ar gyfer grantiau cyfleusterau i'r anabl gael ei gwtogi, a'i fod yn parhau i gael ei dalu ar lefel is, yn rhwystro mynediad i lawer o bobl i'w cartrefi oherwydd byddant yn methu cael y grantiau hynny mor hawdd?



**Edwina Hart:** Disabled facilities grants approved expenditure has increased steadily year on year, and rose from some £19 million in 1997-98 to over £35 million in 2002-03. However, I am concerned about maximising the use and value of disabled facilities grants. This will be encompassed in the report's recommendations.

**David Davies:** Do you agree that local authorities should be given more flexibility to enable them to give priority to local people in allocating affordable housing spaces?

**Edwina Hart:** Funnily enough, this is an issue that we are considering—along with community links, childcare needs and family links—in terms of housing allocation issues and affordable housing. All these are issues that have been raised with me consistently over the last few months. I am currently exploring, with officials, whether we can introduce further regulations or secondary legislation, and what we might do to assist local authorities.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Mae'r Gweinidog wedi cyhoeddi cynnydd yn y grant tai cymdeithasol ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf. A fydd hawl gan awdurdodau lleol i ddefnyddio'r arian ar gyfer cynlluniau tai fforddiadwy, megis ymddiriedolaethau tir cymunedol, fel y crybwyllwyd ynghynt?

**Edwina Hart:** I am open to all suggestions from local government about the use of the social housing grant. As you know, I also have a review of the grant in progress. We will make decisions about that in due course. I certainly take on board your points about how local authorities can use this money.

**Edwina Hart:** Mae gwariant ar grantiau cyfleusterau i'r anabl sydd wedi'u cymeradwyo wedi cynyddu'n gyson flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn, a chododd o oddeutu £19 miliwn yn 1997-98 i fwy na £35 miliwn yn 2002-03. Fodd bynnag, mae sicrhau'r defnydd mwyaf o'r grantiau cyfleusterau i'r anabl a'r gwerth mwyaf yn fater o bwys imi. Caiff hyn ei gwmpasu yn argymhellion yr adroddiad.

**David Davies:** A gytunwch y dylai awdurdodau lleol gael mwy o hyblygrwydd i'w galluogi i roi blaenoriaeth i bobl leol wrth ddyrannu tai fforddiadwy?

**Edwina Hart:** Fel y mae'n digwydd, mae hwn yn fater yr ydym yn ei ystyried—ynghyd â chysylltiadau cymunedol, anghenion gofal plant a chysylltiadau teuluol—o ran dyrannu tai a thai fforddiadwy. Mae'r holl faterion hyn wedi cael eu codi gyda mi yn rheolaidd dros yr ychydig fisoedd diwethaf. Yr wyf wrthi'n ystyried, gyda swyddogion, i weld a allwn gyflwyno rheoliadau eraill neu is-ddeddfwriaeth, a'r hyn y gallem ei wneud i helpu awdurdodau lleol.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The Minister has announced an increase in the social housing grant for next year. Will local authorities be able to spend the money on affordable housing schemes such as community land trusts, as the Minister mentioned earlier?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf yn barod i ystyried unrhyw awgrymiadau gan lywodraeth leol ynglŷn â'r defnydd o'r grant tai cymdeithasol. Fel y gwyddoch, yr wyf hefyd yn cynnal adolygiad o'r grant. Byddwn yn gwneud penderfyniadau ynglŷn â hynny maes o law. Byddaf yn sicr yn ystyried eich pwyntiau ynghylch sut y gall awdurdodau lleol ddefnyddio'r arian hwn.

### **Mynd i'r Afael â Throseddu ac Aildroseddu Combating Offending and Re-offending**

**Q9 Ann Jones:** Would the Minister make a statement on what the Welsh Assembly Government is doing to assist efforts to combat offending and re-offending by young people in north Wales? (OAQ39706)

**C9 Ann Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar yr hyn y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n ei wneud i helpu'r gwaith o fynd i'r afael â phobl ifanc sy'n troseddu ac aildroseddu yng Ngogledd Cymru? (OAQ39706)

**Edwina Hart:** As you are aware, Ann, the Assembly Government published an all-Wales youth offending strategy in July, jointly with the Youth Justice Board for England and Wales. The strategy aims to identify children and young people at risk of offending and to provide appropriate programmes to re-engage and divert these children away from offending behaviour. Youth offending teams working with community safety partnerships in north Wales are making good progress in tackling youth offending and providing diversionary projects.

**Ann Jones:** A young offender who was part of the Choose Life project, which was mentioned earlier, which you and I have discussed, graphically told us how—within weeks of being released—he had re-offended and was returned to prison. He talked about the disastrous effects on his family, and about his lack of self-esteem and the guilt that he felt because he had let down himself and his family. Will you comment on the need for specific programmes and the Youth Justice Board to look at accommodation issues and how this, along with family ties, can be integrated so that young offenders know that there are programmes to assist them in their rehabilitation?

2.30 p.m.

**Edwina Hart:** You make a key point that many young offenders are taken into institutions across the border where their families do not have immediate ties to them, and where they have no ties to return to. There is an issue regarding integrating them into the villages that they come from. I have discussed with the Youth Justice Board the provision of more localised facilities, and, with the Assembly's support, I will continue to do so, as I think that it is important that people are not removed from their communities, that they do their time, perhaps, within their communities and that their links with their families and their communities are maintained.

**Edwina Hart:** Fel y gwyddoch, Ann, cyhoeddodd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad strategaeth troseddwr ifanc i Gymru gyfan ym mis Gorffennaf ar y cyd â'r Bwrdd Cyfiawnder Ieuencid dros Gymru a Lloegr. Nod y strategaeth yw nodi plant a phobl ifanc sy'n debygol o droseddu a darparu rhaglenni priodol i ymgysylltu â'r plant hyn eto a'u troi oddi wrth ymddygiad troseddol. Mae timau troseddau ieuencid sy'n gweithio gyda'r partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol yn y Gogledd yn gwneud cynnydd da wrth fynd i'r afael â throseddau ieuencid a darparu prosiectau i dynnu sylw ieuencid oddi wrth droseddu.

**Ann Jones:** Disgrifiodd troseddwr ifanc a oedd yn rhan o brosiect Choose Life, a grybwyllwyd yn gynharach, yr ydym ni'n dwy wedi'i drafod, yn fyw inni sut—o fewn wythnosau ar ôl cael ei ryddhau—yr oedd wedi aildroseddu ac wedi dychwelyd i'r carchar. Soniodd am yr effeithiau trychinebus ar ei deulu, ac am ei ddiffyg hunan-barch a'r euogrywydd a deimlodd am ei fod wedi siomi ei hun a'i deulu. A wnewch chi sylwadau ar yr angen am i raglenni penodol a'r Bwrdd Cyfiawnder Ieuencid edrych ar faterion llety a sut y gall hyn, ynghyd â chysylltiadau teuluol, gael ei integreiddio fel y gŵyr troseddwr ifanc fod rhaglenni ar gael i'w helpu gyda'r broses adsefydlu?

**Edwina Hart:** Fe wnewch chi bwyt allweddol fod llawer o droseddwr ifanc yn cael eu rhoi mewn sefydliadau dros y ffin lle y mae'n anodd i'w teuluoedd gadw mewn cysylltiad â hwy yn uniongyrchol a lle nad oes ganddynt hwythau gartref i ddychwelyd ato. Cyfyd problem o ran eu hintegreiddio â'u pentrefi lle y maent yn hanu ohonynt. Yr wyf wedi trafod y ddarpariaeth o gyfleusterau mwy lleol gyda'r Bwrdd Cyfiawnder Ieuencid, a, chydachefnogaeth y Cynulliad, byddaf yn parhau i wneud hynny, gan y credaf ei bod yn bwysig na chaiff pobl eu symud o'u cymunedau, eu bod yn bwrw eu tymor yn y carchar, efallai, yn eu cymunedau eu hunain, a bod eu cysylltiadau â'u teuluoedd a'u cymunedau yn parhau.

## Un Corff Cydraddoldeb A Single Equality Body

**Q10 Helen Mary Jones:** Can the Minister make a statement on proposals for a single equality body? (OAQ39690)

**Edwina Hart:** You will be aware that issues around a single equality body have recently been discussed by the Committee on Equality of Opportunity. The body aims to promote an inclusive agenda, underlining the importance of equality for all in society, as well as working to combat discrimination affecting specific groups. I hope that it will promote equal opportunities for all and tackle barriers to participation.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Do you agree that this new body will operate under huge difficulties in the absence of a single equalities Act, which could provide equal rights for all historically excluded groups? What steps are you taking to persuade Westminster of the need for such an Act and would you consider lobbying for such an Act to devolve responsibilities for equality entirely to Wales, where, frankly, I am sure that we would make a much better job of it?

**Edwina Hart:** I concur that a single body needs to be underpinned by an integrated legal framework and that a single equality Act is the best way to achieve that. There are some significant differences between the equality strands, reflecting different experiences of discrimination, and the concept of reasonable adjustment in terms of disability is a good example. Legislation will need to reflect this and I believe that such differences are best accommodated within a single legal framework, which I will continue to campaign for. The Westminster Government is now showing an understanding regarding the need for legislation in that regard. If that is introduced, I will then consider our position regarding the devolution of any powers to Wales.

**Laura Anne Jones:** I am concerned that bodies that support minority groups should not be allowed to disappear under another banner that provides another tier, which would lead them to lose their individual

**C10 Helen Mary Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y cynigion am un corff cydraddoldeb? (OAQ39690)

**Edwina Hart:** Fe wyddoch fod y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal wedi trafod materion ynglŷn ag un corff cydraddoldeb yn ddiweddar. Mae'r corff yn anelu at hyrwyddo agenda gynhwysol, gan danlinellu pwysigrwydd cydraddoldeb i bawb mewn cymdeithas, yn ogystal ag ymdrechu i ymladd gwahaniaethu sy'n effeithio ar grwpiau penodol. Gobeithiaf y bydd yn hyrwyddo cyfle cyfartal i bawb ac yn dileu rhwystrau i gyfranogiad.

**Helen Mary Jones:** A gytunwch y bydd y corff newydd hwn yn wynebu anawsterau mawr yn weithredol gan nad oes un Ddeddf cydraddoldebau, a allai roi'r un hawliau i bob grŵp sydd wedi cael ei allgáu'n hanesyddol? Pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd i ddarbwyllo San Steffan bod angen Deddf o'r fath ac a ystyriech lobio dros Ddeddf o'r fath i ddatganoli cyfrifoldebau dros gydraddoldeb yn gyfan gwbl i Gymru, lle, a dweud y gwir, y byddem yn ymgymryd â'r gwaith yn llawer gwell, mae'n siŵr?

**Edwina Hart:** Cytunaf fod angen i un corff gael ei danategu gan fframwaith cyfreithiol integredig ac mai un Ddeddf cydraddoldeb yw'r ffordd orau o gyflawni hynny. Ceir gwahaniaethau sylweddol rhwng llinynnau cydraddoldeb, gan adlewyrchu profiadau gwahanol o wahaniaethu, ac mae'r cysyniad o addasu rhesymol o ran anabledd yn enghraifft dda. Bydd angen i ddeddfwriaeth adlewyrchu hyn a chredaf mai o fewn un fframwaith cyfreithiol yw'r ffordd orau o ddarparu ar gyfer gwahaniaethau o'r fath. Parhaf i ymgyrchu dros hynny. Mae Llywodraeth San Steffan yn dechrau dangos ei bod yn deall bod angen deddfwriaeth yn hynny o beth. Os caiff ei chyflwyno, yna byddaf yn ystyried ein safbwynt o ran datganoli unrhyw bwerau i Gymru.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Mae'n bwysig imi na ddylai cyrff sy'n cefnogi grwpiau lleiafrifol gael eu cynnwys o dan faner arall sy'n rhoi haen arall, a fyddai'n peri iddynt golli eu lleisiau unigol. Y ddau gwestiwn cyffredin a

voices. Two common questions that are asked regarding the single equality body are: who will be best placed to head it, and can one person cover the issues relating to disability, race, gender, human rights, age, religion and sexual orientation?

**Edwina Hart:** The Committee on Equality of Opportunity benefited from a discussion with the Northern Ireland equality body, which covers all issues apart from human rights. It thought that it successfully managed to deal with all those issues, although it recognised that some groups felt that they had not been prioritised following the merger of equality bodies. It is a decision of the UK Government to establish one body, and I hope that whoever the chief executive is, he or she will bring all the strands together effectively. We have a duty in the Assembly to closely monitor what happens with regard to the new body and its relationship with groups within Wales.

ofynnir o ran un corff cydraddoldeb yw: pwy fyddai orau i fod yn bennaeth arno, ac a all un person ymdrin â'r materion o ran anabledd, hil, rhyw, hawliau dynol, oedran, crefydd a thueddfryd rhywiol?

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal wedi cael trafodaeth fuddiol gyda chorff cydraddoldeb Gogledd Iwerddon, sy'n ymdrin â phob mater ar wahân i hawliau dynol. Credodd ei fod wedi llwyddo i ymdrin â phob un o'r materion hynny, er iddo gydnabod bod rhai grwpiau yn teimlo nad ydynt wedi cael blaenoriaeth ar ôl uno'r cyrff cydraddoldeb. Penderfyniad Llywodraeth y DU yw sefydlu un corff, a gobeithiaf y bydd y prif weithredwr, pwy bynnag a fo, yn dwyn pob llinyn ynghyd yn effeithiol. Mae dyletswydd arnom yn y Cynulliad i fonitro'n agos yr hyn sy'n digwydd o ran y corff newydd a'i berthynas â grwpiau yng Nghymru.

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth Questions to the Minister for Economic Development and Transport**

### **Colli Swyddi ym Mhowys Job Losses in Powys**

**Q1 Mick Bates:** Will the Minister make a statement on recent job losses in Powys? (OAQ39794)

**C1 Mick Bates:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y swyddi a gollwyd yn ddiweddar ym Mhowys? (OAQ39794)

**The Minister for Economic Development and Transport (Andrew Davies):** Various companies have recently announced redundancies in mid Wales. Team Wales provides co-ordinated support to help safeguard business concerns where that proves possible. When attempts fail, Team Wales assists workers to identify and secure alternative employment.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth (Andrew Davies):** Mae amryw gwmni wedi cyhoeddi'n ddiweddar bod swyddi yn cael eu colli yn y Canolbarth. Mae Tîm Cymru yn rhoi cymorth cydgysylltiedig i helpu i ddiogelu busnesau lle y bo modd gwneud hynny. Pan fo hynny yn amhosibl, mae Tîm Cymru yn helpu gweithwyr i nodi a sicrhau gwaith arall.

**Mick Bates:** There is currently a feeling of uncertainty and vulnerability in Powys regarding future economic development and job security. Previously, when a large company closed its operation in Powys, you came to the area to discuss the issue with key stakeholders and to instil confidence about the future, and a large investment was made in the area. Would you undertake to visit Powys to discuss economic development

**Mick Bates:** Mae pobl ym Mhowys yn teimlo ansicrwydd ar hyn o bryd ynghylch datblygu economaidd a diogelwch swyddi yn y dyfodol. Yn y gorffennol, pan gaeodd cwmni mawr ei waith ym Mhowys, daethoch i'r ardal i drafod y mater gyda rhanddeiliaid allweddol ac i roi hyder ynglŷn â'r dyfodol, a gwnaed buddsoddiad mawr yn yr ardal. A wnewch chi addo ymweld â Phowys i drafod datblygu economaidd gyda rhanddeiliaid

with key stakeholders as soon as possible?

**Andrew Davies:** I am more than happy to do that. As you know, when KTH Wales Ltd closed its operation in Llanidloes, the local community said that broadband was a priority for it, and I contacted BT, which brought forward its investment programme. Now, Llanidloes is ADSL enabled. I would be more than happy to visit Llanidloes. Manufacturing in Powys and in mid Wales is important, as it is in most areas of Wales. A higher proportion of the population in Powys is employed in manufacturing than in most parts of Wales. Unemployment levels in Powys are at a historic low, as they are in most parts of Wales, and employers, particularly those in manufacturing, tell me that they are experiencing recruitment difficulties because of the type of civil labour market in the area.

**Glyn Davies:** Despite recent job losses and the closure of its important site at Carno, Laura Ashley remains a huge and important employer in mid Wales. The recent announcement seemed to come out of the blue as far as everyone involved with the company was concerned. Will you hold meetings with the company now, because there are all sorts of rumours and discussions, before it is too late and job losses are announced, rather than waiting until bad news is announced and then putting Team Wales into action to do its best? The time for you to get involved is now, so that you are aware of any important issues that might need to be discussed.

**Andrew Davies:** Laura Ashley recently announced a rationalisation and a relocation of its business. The mid Wales division of the Welsh Development Agency, ably led by Dr Geraint Davies, has been involved in those discussions. The WDA is our delivering agency, and it is its direct responsibility to lead on this matter. If, however, the company feels that it would be useful to have a meeting with me, I stand prepared to attend such a meeting.

**Helen Mary Jones:** You will be aware that the Labour Force Survey for the year ending August 2004 showed that the number of

allweddol mor fuan â phosibl?

**Andrew Davies:** Yr wyf yn fwy na pharod i wneud hynny. Fel y gwyddoch, pan gaeodd KTH Wales Cyf ei waith yn Llanidloes, dywedodd y gymuned leol fod band eang yn flaenoriaeth iddi, a chysylltais â BT, a drefnodd gyflwyno ei raglen fuddsoddiad yn gynt. Bellach, mae ADSL ar gael yn Llanidloes. Byddwn yn fwy na pharod i ymweld â Llanidloes. Mae gweithgynhyrchu ym Mhowys ac yn y Canolbarth yn bwysig, fel y mae yn y rhan fwyaf o Gymru. Caiff cyfran uwch o boblogaeth Powys ei chyflogi ym maes gweithgynhyrchu nag yn y rhan fwyaf o Gymru. Mae diweithdra ym Mhowys ar ei isaf erioed, fel y mae yn y rhan fwyaf o Gymru, a dywed cyflogwyr, yn enwedig gweithgynhyrchwyr, eu bod yn cael anawsterau i recriwtio staff oherwydd y math o farchnad lafur sifil yn yr ardal.

**Glyn Davies:** Er gwaethaf y swyddi a gollwyd yn ddiweddar a'r penderfyniad i gau ei safle pwysig yng Ngharno, erys Laura Ashley yn gyflogwr mawr a phwysig yn y Canolbarth. Yr oedd y cyhoeddiad diweddar fel petai'n hollol annisgwyl i bawb dan sylw yn y cwmni. A wnewch gynnal cyfarfodydd gyda'r cwmni yn awr, oherwydd mae pob math o sïon a thrafodaethau ar led, cyn ei bod yn rhy hwyr a bod y cwmni yn cyhoeddi ei fod yn cael gwared ar ragor o swyddi, yn hytrach nag aros i'r newyddion drwg gael eu cyhoeddi ac yna gofyn i Dîm Cymru weithredu a gwneud ei orau? Mae'n bryd ichi weithredu yn awr, er mwyn ichi ddod i wybod am unrhyw faterion pwysig y bydd angen eu trafod o bosibl.

**Andrew Davies:** Cyhoeddodd Laura Ashley yn ddiweddar fod y cwmni yn ad-drefnu ac yn adleoli ei fusnes. Bu is-adran Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru yn y Canolbarth, o dan arweiniad medrus Dr Geraint Davies, yn rhan o'r trafodaethau hynny. Y WDA yw ein hawdurdod cyflawni, ac ef sy'n gyfrifol yn uniongyrchol am arwain ar y mater hwn. Fodd bynnag, os teimla'r cwmni y byddai'n ddefnyddiol cyfarfod â mi, yr wyf yn barod i fynd i gyfarfod o'r fath.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Fe wyddoch fod yr Arolwg o'r Llafurlu ar gyfer y flwyddyn a ddaeth i ben ym mis Awst 2004 wedi dangos

economically active women in Wales fell by 17,000. That must be of great concern. Given that some of the recent job losses in Powys—particularly the relocation of the Laura Ashley factory from Carno to Newtown—will have a serious impact on the ability of women in the most rural parts of the county to secure employment, will you tell us what specific action you or Team Wales, or whoever is responsible, will take to improve access to work for women in Powys, especially those from more remote communities?

**Andrew Davies:** As I said in response to Mick Bates, the labour market, particularly in Powys, is extremely tight. Many employers are finding it difficult to recruit workers, particularly in manufacturing. Where there have been redundancies, especially in the textile industry, many of those workers have found alternative employment quickly, because there is a demand for their skills. Some caution must be used when dealing with the Labour Force Survey figures. You are right about the level of economic activity during the last year, but in the year before there was a remarkable rise in the number of women moving out economic inactivity. Therefore, over time, the balance between men and women has evened out, but we must urge caution when analysing the figures.

bod nifer y menywod sy'n economaidd weithgar yng Nghymru wedi gostwng 17,000. Rhaid bod hynny o bryder mawr. O gofio y bydd y swyddi a gollwyd yn ddiweddar ym Mhowys—yn enwedig yn sgîl y penderfyniad i symud ffatri Laura Ashley o Garno i'r Drenewydd—yn cael effaith ddybryd ar allu menywod yn y rhannau mwyaf gwledig o'r sir i gael swyddi, a wnewch chi ddweud wrthym pa gamau penodol yr ydych chi, neu Dîm Cymru, neu bwy bynnag sy'n gyfrifol, yn eu cymryd i'w gwneud yn haws i fenywod ym Mhowys ddod o hyd i waith, yn enwedig menywod o'r cymunedau mwyaf anghysbell?

**Andrew Davies:** Fel y dywedais mewn ymateb i Mick Bates, mae'r farchnad lafur, yn enwedig ym Mhowys, yn dynn iawn. Mae llawer o gyflogwyr yn ei chael hi'n anodd i recriwtio gweithwyr, yn enwedig ym maes gweithgynhyrchu. Lle y collwyd swyddi, yn enwedig yn y diwydiant tecstilau, mae llawer o'r gweithwyr hynny wedi cael gwaith arall yn gyflym, oherwydd mae galw am eu sgiliau. Rhaid bod yn ofalus wrth ystyried ffigurau'r Arolwg o'r Llafurlu. Yr ydych yn iawn ynglŷn â'r lefel o weithgarwch economaidd yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, ond yn y flwyddyn cyn hynny bu cynnydd hynod yn nifer y menywod a beidiodd â bod yn economaidd anweithgar. Felly, dros amser, cafwyd cydbwysedd rhwng dynion a menywod, ond rhaid inni fod yn ofalus wrth ddadansoddi'r ffigurau.

### **Cyfyngu ar Docynnau Bysiau am Ddim Restrictions on Free Bus Passes**

**Q2 David Davies:** Is it Welsh Assembly Government policy to restrict free bus passes to residents of Wales? (OAQ39805)

**Andrew Davies:** Yes.

**David Davies:** I appreciate that you have already answered a written question on this matter. You say, 'Yes, it is', yet a local councillor tells me, 'No, it is not'. I am reliably informed that a number of residents in the Tutshill area of Chepstow, who live across the border in England, are getting free bus passes from the Welsh Assembly because of confusion over postcodes, despite the fact

**C2 David Davies:** A yw'n bolisi gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gyfyngu ar docynnau am ddim ar fysiau i drigolion Cymru yn unig? (OAQ39805)

**Andrew Davies:** Ydyw.

**David Davies:** Gwerthfawrogaf eich bod eisoes wedi ateb cwestiwn ysgrifenedig ar y mater hwn. Fe ddywedwch, 'Ydyw', ac eto dywed cynghorydd lleol wrthyf, 'Nac ydyw'. Yr wyf wedi cael gwybod drwy ffynhonnell ddibynadwy fod nifer o drigolion yn ardal Tutshill o Gas-gwent, sy'n byw dros y ffin yn Lloegr, yn cael tocynnau i deithio ar fysiau am ddim oddi wrth Gynulliad Cymru am fod

that they ought to be getting their bus passes from the Forest of Dean or Gloucestershire. I do not want to see them lose their bus passes, because the Conservative Party in the Assembly has always supported the principle of free bus passes. I would, however, question whether the Welsh Assembly Government should pay for bus passes in England, and perhaps we should reclaim the money from Gloucestershire if this is the case. Will you investigate this matter?

**Andrew Davies:** Yes, of course I will, David. Thank you for bringing this matter to my attention. We fund the concessionary fare scheme for older people and the disabled, but the scheme is managed by local authorities. It is up to them to ensure that residents who qualify are able to get bus passes, and therefore avail themselves of the concessionary scheme. If, however, there is evidence, as you said, that people who are not resident in Wales are getting concessionary fares that are paid for by the Assembly Government, I would be grateful if you could give me the details and I will take the matter up with my officials and the local authority concerned.

### **Lledaenu Ffyniant i Gymoedd Uchaf y De Spreading Prosperity to the Upper South Wales Valleys**

**Q3 Huw Lewis:** What action has the Assembly Government taken to spread prosperity to the upper south Wales Valleys? (OAQ39801)

**Andrew Davies:** As the last meeting of the Economic Development and Transport Committee was advised, I am making £12 million of extra funding available for regeneration in the Heads of the Valleys area. I announced this week, on Monday 22 November, that I am establishing a major new partnership, involving all stakeholders, to take forward the ongoing regeneration of the Heads of the Valleys in the context of the Wales spatial plan. I have commissioned work on establishing priorities for action, which I will receive before the end of the year. By spring 2005, I expect to have in place an agreed development strategy for the Heads of the Valleys, with a dedicated and functioning programme team with the

dryswch ynglŷn â chodau post, er mai oddi wrth y Forest of Dean neu swydd Gaerloyw y dylent eu cael. Nid wyf am iddynt golli eu tocynnau i deithio ar fysiau am ddim oherwydd mae'r Blaid Geidwadol yn y Cynulliad wedi cefnogi'r egwyddor hon o'r dechrau. Fodd bynnag, mae amheuan gennyf a ddylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru dalu am docynnau bysiau yn Lloegr, ac efallai y dylem hawlio'r arian yn ôl oddi wrth swydd Gaerloyw os yw hyn yn wir. A wnewch chi ymchwilio i'r mater hwn?

**Andrew Davies:** Gwnaf, wrth gwrs, David. Diolch am dynnu'r mater hwn i'm sylw. Yr ydym yn ariannu'r cynllun tocyn mantais i bobl hŷn a'r anabl, ond yr awdurdodau lleol sy'n rheoli'r cynllun. Hwy ddylai sicrhau bod y trigolion sy'n gymwys yn cael tocynnau ar fysiau, ac felly'n manteisio ar y cynllun hwn. Fodd bynnag, os oes tystiolaeth, fel y dywedwch, fod pobl nad ydynt yn preswyllo yng Nghymru yn cael tocynnau mantais y telir amdanynt gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech roi'r manylion imi a byddaf yn codi'r mater gyda'm swyddogion a'r awdurdod lleol dan sylw.

**C3 Huw Lewis:** Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi'u cymryd i ledaenu ffyniant i gymoedd uchaf y De? (OAQ39801)

**Andrew Davies:** Fel y dywedwyd yng nghyfarfod diwethaf y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Trafnidiaeth, yr wyf yn darparu £12 miliwn o arian ychwanegol ar gyfer adfywio ardal Blaenau'r Cymoedd. Cyhoeddais yr wythnos hon, ddydd Llun 22 Tachwedd, fy mod yn sefydlu partneriaeth bwysig newydd, gan gynnwys yr holl randdeiliaid, i ddatblygu ymhellach y broses o adfywio Blaenau'r Cymoedd sy'n mynd rhagddi yng nghyd-destun cynllun gofodol Cymru. Yr wyf wedi comisiynu gwaith ar sefydlu blaenoriaethau ar gyfer gweithredu, y byddaf yn eu cael cyn diwedd y flwyddyn. Erbyn gwanwyn 2005, disgwyliaf i strategaeth ddatblygu y cytunwyd arni fod ar waith ar gyfer Blaenau'r Cymoedd, gyda

capacity to deliver across the area.

thîm rhaglen penodol a gweithredol a chanddynt y gallu i gyflawni dros yr ardal.

2.40 p.m.

**Huw Lewis:** I welcome the Minister's comments, and I am well aware of the hard work behind the scenes to make this possible. As the Minister will be aware from his successful visit to Dowlais on Monday, the completion of the A465 upgrade will have an enormous impact on the upper Valleys and provide a catalyst for the economic and social regeneration of the region, which we are working towards. I place on record my support for the Minister's efforts to ensure a more joined-up approach among private and public partners towards the future economic regeneration of the upper Valleys. Could the Minister outline what steps we must now take to ensure that co-ordination and joined-up working takes place between various departments of the Assembly Government, so that the hopes of so many people, following the announcement of your strategy, are fulfilled?

**Andrew Davies:** This is about partnership, including external partnership. In making the announcement on Monday, I was delighted that the five local authorities were represented at leader or senior executive level, along with the ASPBs and the private and voluntary sectors. You are right that we need to ensure that we bring to bear the concerted focus of the Assembly Government across all portfolios. We are investing just under £1 billion a year, across the Assembly Government, in Heads of the Valleys communities. This is why the initiative was announced in the context of the Wales spatial plan, led by Sue Essex. This includes an undertaking to treat the Heads of the Valleys corridor as a major priority. Therefore, it is the subject of cross-Government action.

**Jocelyn Davies:** The Heads of the Valleys has been acknowledged for decades as an area in desperate need of regeneration. Therefore, why have you not set regional job targets for the area?

**Andrew Davies:** We have always said that

**Huw Lewis:** Croesawaf sylwadau'r Gweinidog, ac wyf yn ymwybodol iawn o'r gwaith caled a wnaed yn y cefndir i sicrhau bod hyn yn bosibl. Fel y gŵyr y Gweinidog ar ôl ei ymweliad llwyddiannus â Dowlais ddydd Llun, bydd cwblhau'r gwaith o uwchraddio'r A465 yn cael effaith fawr ar y cymoedd uchaf ac yn ysgogi adfywio economaidd a chymdeithasol y rhanbarth, sef y nod yr ydym yn anelu ato. Hoffwn gofnodi fy nghefnogaeth i ymdrechion y Gweinidog i sicrhau ymagwedd fwy cydgysylltiedig ymhlith partneriaid preifat a chyhoeddus tuag at adfywio economi y Cymoedd uchaf yn y dyfodol. A allai'r Gweinidog nodi pa gamau y mae'n rhaid inni eu cymryd yn awr i sicrhau bod cydlynw a gwaith cysylltiedig rhwng y gwahanol adrannau o Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, fel y caiff gobeithion cymaint o bobl, ar ôl cyhoeddi eich strategaeth, eu gwireddu?

**Andrew Davies:** Mae a wnelo hyn â phartneriaeth, gan gynnwys partneriaeth allanol. Wrth wneud y cyhoeddiad ddydd Llun, yr oeddwn yn falch o nodi bod y pum awdurdod lleol wedi'u cynrychioli naill ai gan yr arweinydd neu gan uwch swyddog gweithredol, ynghyd â'r CCNC a'r sector preifat a'r sector gwirfoddol. Yr ydych yn iawn i nodi bod angen inni sicrhau bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn canolbwyntio ar y cyd ar draws pob un o'r portffolios. Yr ydym yn buddsoddi ychydig o dan £1 biliwn y flwyddyn, ar draws Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yng nghymunedau Blaenau'r Cymoedd. Dyna pam y cyhoeddwyd y fenter yng nghyd-destun cynllun gofodol Cymru, o dan arweiniad Sue Essex. Mae'n cynnwys ymrwymiad i roi blaenoriaeth fawr i goridor Blaenau'r Cymoedd. Felly, cymerir camau ar hyn ar draws y Llywodraeth.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Cydnabuwyd ers degawdau fod Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn ardal yr oedd angen ei hadfywio'n ddybryd. Felly pam nad ydych wedi pennu targedau swyddi rhanbarthol i'r ardal?

**Andrew Davies:** Yr ydym bob amser wedi



we felt that regional job targets were a distraction. In the south-east Wales region, which includes the Heads of the Valleys, the M4 corridor and the cities of Cardiff and Newport, job targets would be a distraction. Rather than acknowledging the differences and issues within each region, as I said in response to Huw Lewis, dealing with it in this way, in the context of the Wales spatial plan, is a more fruitful way forward.

dweud ein bod yn teimlo y byddai targedau swyddi rhanbarthol yn tynnu ein sylw oddi wrth bethau eraill. Yn rhanbarth y Ddedwyrain, sy'n cynnwys Blaenau'r Cymoedd, coridor ffordd yr M4 a dinas Caerdydd a dinas Casnewydd, byddai targedau swyddi yn tynnu ein sylw oddi wrth bethau eraill. Yn hytrach na chydabod y gwahaniaethau a'r problemau ym mhob rhanbarth, fel y dywedais mewn ymateb i Huw Lewis, mae ymdrin â'r mater yn y ffordd hon, yng nghydestun cynllun gofodol Cymru, yn ffordd fwy buddiol ymlaen.

### **Diogelwch Trafnidiaeth Gyhoeddus The Safety of Public Transport**

**Q4 Janet Davies:** Will the Minister make a statement on the safety of public transport in Wales? (OAQ39772)

**C4 Janet Davies:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ddiogelwch trafniadaeth gyhoeddus yng Nghymru? (OAQ39772)

**Andrew Davies:** Our objective is to ensure a safe and secure transport system. The safety of public transport is regulated by the UK Government, and we contribute primarily through the funding of infrastructure and development of good practice.

**Andrew Davies:** Ein hamcan yw sicrhau system drafniadaeth ddiogel. Rheoleiddir diogelwch trafniadaeth gyhoeddus gan Lywodraeth y DU, a chyfrannwn yn bennaf drwy ariannu seilwaith a datblygu arferion da.

**Janet Davies:** Unlicensed taxis are a problem in some areas, and it is quite often the case that local authorities react slowly to transgressions. This means that passengers are not insured. Do you find this situation acceptable and, if not, what are you doing about it?

**Janet Davies:** Mae tacsis annhrwyddedig yn broblem mewn rhai ardaloedd, ac yn eithaf aml, araf yw ymateb awdurdodau lleol i achosion o dorri'r rheoliadau. Golyga hyn fod teithwyr heb eu hyswiro. A yw'r sefyllfa hon yn dderbyniol yn eich barn, ac, os nad ydyw, beth ydych yn ei wneud yn ei chylch?

**Andrew Davies:** I regularly meet the Welsh Local Government Association spokesperson on transport issues, Councillor Harry Andrews, who is the leader of Caerphilly County Borough Council. I will include this as an agenda item in my next meeting and raise the issue with him.

**Andrew Davies:** Yr wyf yn cyfarfod yn rheolaidd â llefarydd Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru dros faterion trafniadaeth, y Cynghorydd Harry Andrews, sy'n arweinydd Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili. Gwnaf gynnwys y mater hwn fel eitem ar yr agenda yn fy nghyfarfod nesaf a chodi'r mater gydag ef.

**Eleanor Burnham:** In England, additional money is being made available for rural railways adopted as community lines. What money will be available in your budget next year to support similar developments in Wales?

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yn Lloegr, darperir arian ychwanegol ar gyfer rheilffyrdd gwledig sydd wedi'u mabwysiadu'n llinellau cymunedol. Pa gyllid fydd ar gael yn eich cyllideb y flwyddyn nesaf i gefnogi datblygiadau tebyg yng Nghymru?

**Andrew Davies:** The Wales and borders franchise run by Arriva Trains Wales is directly funded through the Strategic Rail

**Andrew Davies:** Mae masnachfaint Cymru a'r gororau a weinyddir gan Trenau Arriva Cymru wedi'i hariannu'n uniongyrchol gan

Authority. When the Transport (Wales) Bill and the Railways Bill, included in yesterday's Queen's Speech, reach the statute book, responsibility will be transferred to the Assembly Government, and we will receive funding for the franchise. Therefore, we were consulted on the community rail development strategy, announced by the Strategic Rail Authority, and it will then be our responsibility to take forward initiatives.

**Laura Anne Jones:** There has been a 4.4 per cent rise in reported crime on Wales's railways this year under this Labour Government, and a 16.1 per cent rise in violent crime. Crime on Wales's railways is on the increase. What are you doing to ensure the safety of rail passengers the length and breadth of the country?

**Andrew Davies:** As I said, rail safety is not a devolved matter; it is matter for the British Transport Police. You quote the increase in crime, but there has been a significant increase in the use of our rail system. Last year, for the first time in 20 years, the number of passengers using the UK rail system exceeded 1 billion, so that is a real success. That big increase in rail use is due to this Government's commitment and to the investment that it is making in rail infrastructure and services

yr Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol. Pan gaiff Mesur Trafnidiaeth (Cymru) a'r Mesur Rheilffyrdd, a gynhwyswyd yn Araith y Frenhines ddoe, eu deddfu, caiff cyfrifoldeb ei drosglwyddo i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, a chawn gyllid ar gyfer y fasnachfaint. Felly, ymgynghorwyd â ni ynglŷn â'r strategaeth datblygu rheilffyrdd cymunedol, a gyhoeddwyd gan yr Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol, ac ni wedyn fydd yn gyfrifol am ddatblygu mentrau.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Bu cynnydd o 4.4 y cant yn nifer y troseddau a gofnodwyd ar reilffyrdd yng Nghymru eleni o dan y Llywodraeth Lafur hon, a chynnydd o 16.1 y cant yn nifer y troseddau treisgar. Mae troseddu ar reilffyrdd yng Nghymru ar gynnydd. Beth ydych yn ei wneud i sicrhau diogelwch teithwyr ar y rheilffyrdd ledled Cymru?

**Andrew Davies:** Fel y dywedais, nid mater datganoledig yw diogelwch ar y rheilffyrdd; mae'n fater i Heddlu Trafnidiaeth Prydain. Fe gyfeiriwch at gynnydd mewn troseddu, ond bu cynnydd sylweddol yn y defnydd a wneir o'n system reilffyrdd. Y llynedd, am y tro cyntaf ers 20 mlynedd, yr oedd nifer y teithwyr a ddefnyddiodd system reilffyrdd y DU yn fwy nag 1 biliwn, felly mae hynny yn llwyddiant gwirioneddol. Y rheswm dros y cynnydd mawr hwnnw yn y defnydd o'r rheilffyrdd yw ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth hon a'r buddsoddiad a wna mewn seilwaith a gwasanaethau'r rheilffyrdd.

### **Cynghrair Twristiaeth Cymru The Wales Tourism Alliance**

**Q5 Lisa Francis:** Will the Minister make a statement on the Wales Tourism Alliance? (OAQ39807)

**Andrew Davies:** The Wales Tourism Alliance plays a valuable role in bringing the voice of the tourism industry together across Wales.

**Lisa Francis:** Like you, I attended the alliance's conference at the beginning of the month, and many tourism operators expressed their concerns to me about the proposal to bring the Wales Tourist Board in-house with this Government. There is an

**C5 Lisa Francis:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar rôl Cynghrair Twristiaeth Cymru? (OAQ39807)

**Andrew Davies:** Mae Cynghrair Twristiaeth Cymru yn chwarae rhan werthfawr wrth dynnu ynghyd safbwyntiau'r diwydiant twristiaeth ledled Cymru.

**Lisa Francis:** Fel chithau, mynychais gynhadledd y gynghrair ddechrau'r mis, a mynegodd llawer o weithredwyr twristiaeth eu pryderon imi ynglŷn â'r cynnig i ddod â Bwrdd Croeso Cymru o dan adain y Llywodraeth hon. Ofnant yn fawr mai

overwhelming fear that a bunker mentality will prevail, which will not be conducive to a business environment. It is particularly concerned about the future of marketing Wales. How will you ensure that you retain experienced marketing staff, post-merger, and what contingency plans do you have for a situation where a barrage of experienced marketing personnel decide that working for the Welsh Assembly Government is not particularly dynamic and want to leave?

**Andrew Davies:** The fears expressed by some people at the conference and elsewhere are fundamentally misplaced. Following the conference, I had discussions with the chair of the Wales Tourism Alliance to consider the merger process and to ensure that the voice of the industry is heard strongly, and I have committed to that. There is no indication that people with expertise in the Wales Tourist Board are anything other than committed to carrying this agenda forward. We are now investing unprecedented levels of money in the industry to help it in Wales, particularly in marketing, and we want to ensure that we make the most of that expertise and resource.

**Christine Chapman:** The recent Wales spatial plan rightly identified that the south-east region has some, 'some strikingly beautiful countryside', which includes the 'former coalfield industrial area'. Will you ensure that the Wales Tourism Alliance takes this on board so that tourism opportunities are seriously developed in the Valleys and so that my constituents can enjoy benefits similar to those enjoyed by people living in more traditionally tourism areas?

**Andrew Davies:** There is huge potential in the Valleys, particularly in terms of our industrial heritage and the natural beauty of the area. It is a case of how green are my Valleys. The HERIAN project, led by the Wales Tourist Board—and one of its senior executives, Jeff Pride, is seconded to run HERIAN—is taking a lead on this. Big Pit: National Mining Museum of Wales and the surrounding Blaenavon area, which is a world heritage site, is a unique attraction that we can offer in terms of tourism, and the

meddylfryd amddiffynnol fydd yn y dyfodol, na fydd yn gweddu i'r amgylchedd busnes. Mae'n pryderu'n arbennig ynglŷn â dyfodol marchnata Cymru. Sut y byddwch yn sicrhau eich bod yn cadw staff marchnata profiadol, wedi'r uno, a pha gynlluniau sydd gennych wrth gefn os bydd nifer fawr o staff marchnata profiadol yn penderfynu nad yw gweithio i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gyffrous iawn a'u bod am adael?

**Andrew Davies:** Mae'r ofnau a fynegwyd gan rai pobl yn y gynhadledd ac mewn mannau eraill yn ddi-sail yn y bôn. Ar ôl y gynhadledd, cefais drafodaethau gyda chadeirydd Cynghrair Twristiaeth Cymru i ystyried y broses uno a sicrhau y caiff llais y diwydiant ei glywed yn uchel, ac yr wyf wedi ymrwmo i hynny. Nid oes unrhyw awgrym na fydd pobl sy'n meddu ar arbenigedd ym Mwrdd Croeso Cymru ond yn hollol ymrwymedig i ddatblygu'r agenda hon. Yr ydym wrthi'n buddsoddi'r symiau mwyaf erioed yn y diwydiant i'w helpu yng Nghymru, yn enwedig ym maes marchnata, ac yr ydym am sicrhau ein bod yn manteisio i'r eithaf ar yr arbenigedd a'r adnoddau hynny.

**Christine Chapman:** Nododd cynllun gofodol Cymru a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar fod ardal y De-ddwyrain 'yn hynod o brydferth', gan gynnwys 'yr ardal ddiwydiannol hefyd lle y cloddiwyd am lo yn y gorffennol'. A wnewch chi sicrhau bod Cynghrair Twristiaeth Cymru yn ystyried hyn er mwyn sicrhau yr eir ati i ddatblygu cyfleoedd twristiaeth o ddifrif yn y Cymoedd ac fel y gall fy etholwyr gael yr un manteision â phobl sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd twristiaeth mwy traddodiadol?

**Andrew Davies:** Mae potensial enfawr yn y Cymoedd, yn enwedig o ran ein treftadaeth ddiwydiannol a harddwch naturiol yr ardal. Pa mor wyrdd yw'r Cymoedd y dylid ei ddweud bellach. Mae prosiect HERIAN o dan arweiniad Bwrdd Croeso Cymru—ac mae un o'i uwch swyddogion gweithredol, Jeff Pride, wedi'i secondio i redeg HERIAN—yn arwain yn hyn o beth. Mae Pwll Mawr: Amgueddfa Lofaol Genedlaethol Cymru ac ardal Blaenafon o'i amgylch, sy'n safle treftadaeth y byd, yn atyniad unigryw y

issue of our industrial heritage and tourism in the Valleys was raised at the launch of my Heads of the Valley initiative on Monday.

gallwn ei gynnig o ran twristiaeth, a chodwyd ein treftadaeth ddiwydiannol a thwristiaeth yn y Cymoedd ar adeg lansio fy menter ar gyfer Blaenau'r Cymoedd ddydd Llun.

**Elin Jones:** Byddwch yn gwybod bod gan rai Aelodau o Gynghrair Twristiaeth Cymru amheuron ynglŷn â diddymu Bwrdd Croeso Cymru. Mae'n debyg bod adroddiad Llywodraeth yn nodi y bydd diddymu Bwrdd Croeso Cymru, yr Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru yn costio rhyw £35 miliwn. A ydych yn barod i wneud yr adroddiad hwnnw'n gyhoeddus?

**Elin Jones:** You will be aware that some members of the Wales Tourism Alliance have doubts about abolishing the Wales Tourist Board. It seems that a Government report notes that abolishing the Wales Tourist Board, the Welsh Development Agency and Education and Learning Wales will cost about £35 million. Are you willing to make that report public?

**Andrew Davies:** As I have said in response to questions from Alun Cairns, you should not believe everything that you read in the paper.

**Andrew Davies:** Fel y dywedais mewn ymateb i gwestiynau Alun Cairns, ni ddylech gredu popeth a ddarllenwch yn y papur newydd.

### **Y Diwydiant Gweithgynhyrchu The Manufacturing Industry**

**C6 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru? (OAQ39777)

**Q6 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Will the Minister make a statement on the manufacturing industry in Wales? (OAQ39777)

**Andrew Davies:** Manufacturing continues to be of significant importance to the Welsh economy, although it is subject to increasing global competitive pressures. 'A Winning Wales' sets out our priorities to be addressed and includes measures to help the manufacturing sector maintain and develop its competitive edge.

**Andrew Davies:** Mae'r diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu yn parhau i fod o bwys mawr i economi Cymru, er ei fod yn wynebu pwysau cystadleuol byd-eang cynyddol. Noda 'Cymru'n Ennill' ein blaenoriaethau y mae angen mynd i'r afael â hwy ac mae'n cynnwys mesurau i helpu'r sector gweithgynhyrchu i gadw a datblygu ei allu cystadleuol.

2.50 p.m.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae'r cwestiwn yn y Saesneg yn eich cyfarch fel 'Minister', ond yn y Gymraeg mae'n eich cyfarch fel 'Prif Weinidog'. Nid wyf yn awgrymu'r dyrchafiad hwnnw—mae pethau'n ddigon gwael eisoes.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** The question in English addresses you as 'Minister', but in Welsh it addresses you as 'First Minister'. I am not suggesting a promotion—things are bad enough as they are.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Byddai'n ddefnyddiol pe baech yn gofyn cwestiwn.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. It would be helpful if you asked a question.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Nid oedd hynny'n gwestiwn. Pan ddaeth y Blaid Lafur i rym yn 1997, yr oedd gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru yn cynrychioli dros 28 y cant o gynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth. Erbyn

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** That was not a question. When the Labour Party came into power in 1997, manufacturing in Wales represented over 28 per cent of gross domestic product. By 2001, it had fallen to 22

2001, yr oedd wedi gostwng i 22 y cant. Yr oedd arolwg diweddar gan Gydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain yn nodi bod y sefyllfa'n gwaethygu—bydd 22,000 o swyddi gweithgynhyrchu yn diflannu ym Mhrydain ac mae canran archebion cwmnïau hefyd wedi gostwng. Soniodd yr adroddiad hefyd fod hyder cwmnïau gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru ar ei isafbwynt ers blwyddyn. A yw hynny'n eich poeni, fel y Gweinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb dros ddatblygu'r economi yng Nghymru, o ystyried y modd y mae'r economi yng Nghymru yn draddodiadol wedi bod yn ddibynnol ar weithgynhyrchu?

**Andrew Davies:** Manufacturing continues to be a major priority for the Government, but as you said, the competitive pressures are not just experienced by companies in the industrial sectors in Wales. These pressures are being felt across the UK and the western world. There are big concerns in the United States, which I saw at first hand only a few weeks ago, about the loss of manufacturing jobs overseas. However, our measures are aimed at supporting industry in Wales. For example, in terms of financial assistance, 72 per cent of regional selective assistance offers made last year, and just over 60 per cent of Assembly investment grant offers, were made to manufacturing projects. The purchasing managing index, which is a reliable index of business activity in Wales and across the UK, shows that the majority of private sector firms reported that business activity had increased, rising for the nineteenth consecutive month. There is an increase in confidence, despite those intense global pressures, among many manufacturing companies in Wales.

**John Griffiths:** The steel industry has been through difficult times, as we all know, but recently, we have seen a strengthening of that industry with Corus, for example, returning to profit. Given that it has done so, and that it is high-tech and highly skilled, do you agree that it is still a significant player in many parts of Wales, including in Newport East?

per cent. A recent review by the Confederation of British Industry noted that the situation was deteriorating—22,000 manufacturing jobs will be lost in Britain and the percentage of company orders has also fallen. The report also mentioned that confidence among companies is at its lowest for a year. Does that concern you, as the Minister responsible for developing the economy in Wales, bearing in mind the way in which the economy in Wales has traditionally been dependent on manufacturing?

**Andrew Davies:** Mae gweithgynhyrchu yn parhau i fod yn flaenoriaeth bwysig i'r Llywodraeth, ond fel y dywedaso, nid dim ond cwmnïau yn y sectorau diwydiannol yng Nghymru sy'n wynebu pwysau cystadleuol. Teimlir y pwysau hyn ledled y DU a'r gorllewin. Mae pryderon mawr yn yr Unol Daleithiau, a welais fy hun ddim ond ychydig wythnosau yn ôl, ynglŷn â'r swyddi gweithgynhyrchu sy'n mynd dramor. Fodd bynnag, mae ein mesurau wedi'u hanelu at gynorthwyo diwydiant yng Nghymru. Er enghraifft, o ran cymorth ariannol, yr oedd 72 y cant o'r cynigion o gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol a wnaed y llynedd, ac ychydig dros 60 y cant o'r cynigion a wnaed o dan grant buddsoddi'r Cynulliad, wedi'u gwneud i brosiectau gweithgynhyrchu. Dengys y mynegai rheoli prynu, sy'n fynegai dibynadwy o weithgarwch busnes yng Nghymru ac ar draws y DU, fod y rhan fwyaf o gwmnïau yn y sector preifat wedi nodi bod gweithgarwch busnes wedi cynyddu, gan godi am y pedwerydd mis ar bymtheg yn olynol. Mae mwy o hyder, er gwaethaf y pwysau byd-eang mawr hynny, ymhlith llawer o gwmnïau gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru.

**John Griffiths:** Mae'r diwydiant dur wedi mynd drwy gyfnod anodd, fel y gwyddom oll, ond yn ddiweddar, mae'r diwydiant hwnnw wedi cryfhau gyda Corus, er enghraifft, yn dechrau gwneud elw eto. O gofio ei fod wedi llwyddo i wneud hynny, a'i fod yn ddiwydiant uwchdechnoleg sy'n gofyn am weithwyr hyfedr, a gytunwch ei fod yn dal i fod yn bwysig mewn sawl rhan o Gymru, gan gynnwys Dwyrain Casnewydd?

**Andrew Davies:** Yes. The last two years have seen a remarkable transformation. Corus, as we know, experienced real difficulties only a few years ago. In the last two years, there has been a global transformation, but particularly in Wales, with Corus, Celsa, Alpha Steel and many others. I was delighted last week to open the new steel waste recycling plant in Newport, run by Sims Recycling Solutions, which will provide steel scrap for many other local companies, and for Celsa and Alpha Steel in particular. There has been a real revival, and we are delighted that we have been able to work with companies to take forward that expansion.

**Jonathan Morgan:** How many manufacturing job losses have there been in Cardiff since you became Minister for Economic Development and Transport?

**Andrew Davies:** I cannot give you precise figures, but I remind you that from 1979 to 1997, 20,000 manufacturing jobs a year were lost in Wales. That is a total of 360,000 manufacturing jobs lost under the previous Tory Government from 1979 to 1997. I will however get you the figures for Cardiff.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Thank you—  
[ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘He swore.’]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I did not hear anyone swearing. If Jonathan Morgan swore, I would be grateful if he withdrew it.

**Jonathan Morgan:** If Members of the opposition believe that I did, I withdraw it, but I do not recall swearing at the Minister.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Do you agree that the skills agenda for manufacturing industry is a crucial issue and that it is right that we continue with our efforts to ensure that the key players, such as ELWa, the Welsh Development Agency, the CBI and the Wales Trades Union Congress work together to ensure that we have the best skills programme that we can in Wales and that bringing in ELWa and the WDA will assist

**Andrew Davies:** Cytunaf. Yn ystod y ddwy flynedd diwethaf bu trawsnewidiad hynod. Dim ond ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl yr oedd Corus yn cael anawsterau gwirioneddol, fel y gwyddom. Yn y ddwy flynedd diwethaf, trawsnewidiwyd y diwydiant ledled y byd, ond yn enwedig yng Nghymru, gyda Corus, Celsa, Alpha Steel a llawer o gwmnïau eraill. Yr oedd yn bleser gennyf agor y gwaith ailgylchu gwastraff dur newydd yng Nghasnewydd yr wythnos diwethaf. Caiff ei redeg gan Sims Recycling Solutions, a bydd yn darparu gwastraff dur ar gyfer llawer o gwmnïau lleol eraill, ac ar gyfer Celsa ac Alpha Steel yn arbennig. Bu adfywiad gwirioneddol, ac yr ydym yn falch ein bod wedi gallu gweithio gyda chwmnïau i’w helpu i ehangu yn y fath fodd.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Faint o swyddi gweithgynhyrchu a gollwyd yng Nghaerdydd ers ichi fod yn Weinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth?

**Andrew Davies:** Ni allaf roi’r union ffigurau ichi, ond hoffwn eich atgoffa fod 20,000 o swyddi gweithgynhyrchu yn cael eu colli bob blwyddyn yng Nghymru o 1979 i 1997, sef cyfanswm o 360,000 o swyddi gweithgynhyrchu a gollwyd o dan y Llywodraeth Doriadaidd flaenorol rhwng 1979 a 1997. Fodd bynnag, gofynnaf am y ffigurau ar gyfer Caerdydd ichi.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Diolch yn fawr—  
[AELODAU’R CYNULLIAD: ‘Rhegodd.’]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni chlywais neb yn rhegi. Os rhegodd Jonathan Morgan, byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe bai’n tynnu’r sylw yn ôl.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Os cred Aelodau’r gwrthbleidiau imi regi, tynnaf y sylw yn ôl, ond ni chofiaf regi’r Gweinidog.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** A gytnwch fod yr agenda sgiliau i’r diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu yn fater hollbwysig a’i bod yn briodol inni barhau i ymdrechu i sicrhau bod cyrff allweddol, megis ELWa, Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, y CBI a Chyngres Undebau Llafur Cymru yn cydweithio i sicrhau bod gennym y rhaglen sgiliau orau bosibl yng Nghymru a bod y penderfyniad i ddod ag ELWa a’r WDA o dan adain y Cynulliad yn

us in that process?

**Andrew Davies:** Yes, of course. When I talk to companies, particularly inward investors, about why they locate in Wales, they say that it is largely because of the quality of the workforce. We need to ensure that the current workforce, and anyone entering the manufacturing sector, has the appropriate skills. Through working closely with my ministerial colleague, Jane Davidson, we are addressing those skills issues, particularly with the establishment of the various sector skills councils, which we jointly participated in launching. We will take that forward, demonstrating our commitment to the sector.

**Jenny Randerson:** You rightly point out that jobs in manufacturing are under strain throughout western Europe, but what is most worrying about the recent Office for National Statistics figures is the drop in over 28,000, namely 15 per cent, of the self-employed in Wales in the last year. Why do you think that that is happening? Do you now admit that your policies to promote entrepreneurship are not working and what do you intend to do to deal with that?

**Andrew Davies:** I do not accept that the entrepreneurship action plan is failing. Many of the entrepreneurship measures, whether measured in the global enterprise monitor or in terms of wider entrepreneurial activity measures, are increasing in Wales. We are doing as well as, if not better, than many other areas in the UK and in the world, according to the global monitor. However, figures do reflect a downturn of, as you said, around 20,000. My statisticians and economists are trying to find possible explanations for that decline. Perhaps, we could ask the question again in committee next week, when we may be able to answer it.

ein helpu yn y broses honno?

**Andrew Davies:** Cytunaf, yn sicr. Pan siaradaf â chwmmniau, yn enwedig mewnfuddsoddwyr, ynghylch pam y maent yn dod i Gymru, dywedant mai'r rheswm pennaf yw ansawdd y gweithlu. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod y gweithlu presennol, ac unrhyw un sy'n dechrau gweithio yn y sector gweithgynhyrchu, yn meddu ar y sgiliau priodol. Drwy weithio'n agos gyda'm cyd-Weinidog, Jane Davidson, yr ydym yn mynd i'r afael â'r materion hynny yn ymwneud â sgiliau, yn enwedig drwy sefydlu'r gwahanol gynghorau sgiliau sector, a lansiwyd ar y cyd gennym. Byddwn yn bwrw ymlaen â hynny, gan ddangos ein hymrwymiad i'r sector.

**Jenny Randerson:** Fe nodwch fod swyddi gweithgynhyrchu o dan bwysau mawr ar draws gorllewin Ewrop, a hynny'n gywir, ond yr hyn sy'n achosi'r pryder mwyaf ynglŷn â ffigurau diweddar y Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol yw'r gostyngiad o fwy na 28,000 yn nifer y bobl hunan-gyflogedig yng Nghymru, sef 15 y cant, yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Pam y mae hynny'n digwydd, yn eich barn chi? A ydych yn fodlon cyfaddef yn awr nad yw eich polisiau i hyrwyddo entrepreneuriaeth yn llwyddo a beth ydych yn bwriadu ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â hynny?

**Andrew Davies:** Ni dderbyniaf fod y cynllun gweithredu entrepreneuriaeth yn methu. Mae llawer o'r mesurau entrepreneuriaeth, pa un a gânt eu mesur yn y monitor mentergarwch byd-eang neu o ran mesurau gweithgarwch entrepreneuriaidd mwy cyffredinol, ar gynydd yng Nghymru. Yr ydym yn gwneud llawn cystal â llawer ardal arall yn y DU a'r byd, os nad yn well, yn ôl y monitor byd-eang. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ffigurau yn adlewyrchu gostyngiad o 20,000, fel y dywedasoch. Mae fy ystadegwyr a'm heconomegwyr yn ceisio dod o hyd i esboniadau posibl am y gostyngiad hwnnw. Efallai y gallem ofyn y cwestiwn eto yn y pwyllgor yr wythnos nesaf, pan fyddwn yn gallu ei ateb o bosibl.

### **Y Sector Ymchwil a Datblygu The Research and Development Sector**

**C7 David Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog **Q7 David Lloyd:** Will the Minister outline

amlinellu ei strategaethau i ddatblygu'r sector ymchwil a datblygu yng Nghymru? (OAQ39765)

**Andrew Davies:** 'Wales for Innovation', the action plan for innovation, and the March 2004 'Knowledge Economy' Nexus report show how we are encouraging research and development and the knowledge economy in Wales that it supports.

**David Lloyd:** A gytunwch mai rhan o'r ateb yn unig yw canolfannau technium?

**Andrew Davies:** We have always made it clear that the technium programme is part of our innovation action plan, and plays a significant role. It is a multi-million pound investment and all the signs are that it is proving successful. During the first two years of the Swansea technium—the first technium—there was significant employment growth. Roughly three-quarters of the jobs were provided for graduates and around three-quarters of the companies were undertaking research and development. However, as I said in my initial answer, the Nexus report is identifying not only the significant progress, but the key issues that we need to address. We have made significant progress on this crucial agenda and over the next weeks, I will make announcements on major knowledge economy investments that we are making as a Government.

**Leighton Andrews:** Do you agree that one sector that is dependent on research and development is the creative industries in Wales? I welcome yesterday's announcement on the creative industries strategy, particularly the creative industries intellectual property fund. I draw your attention to the Welsh music awards taking place in the Pop Factory in my constituency in December, which will be an important, excellent vehicle, for the promotion of one part of the Welsh creative sector?

**Andrew Davies:** The music industry has huge potential for wealth generation and job creation in Wales. What has been significant is that over the last 10 or 20 years, Wales has

his strategies to develop the research and development sector in Wales? (OAQ39765)

**Andrew Davies:** Dengys 'Cymru o Blaid Arloesi', sef y cynllun gweithredu ar gyfer arloesi, ac adroddiad Nexus 'Knowledge Economy' ym mis Mawrth 2004 sut yr ydym yn annog gwaith ymchwil a datblygu a'r economi wybodaeth yng Nghymru y mae'n ei chynnal.

**David Lloyd:** Do you agree that techniums are only part of the solution?

**Andrew Davies:** Yr ydym bob amser wedi'i gwneud yn glir bod y rhaglen technium yn rhan o'n cynllun gweithredu ar gyfer arloesi, a'i bod yn chwarae rhan bwysig. Mae'n fuddsoddiad gwerth sawl miliwn o bunnau ac yn ôl yr arwyddion mae'n llwyddo. Yn ystod dwy flynedd gyntaf technium Abertawe—y technium cyntaf—bu twf sylweddol mewn cyflogaeth. Mae tua thri chwarter y swyddi wedi'u darparu ar gyfer graddedigion ac yr oedd tua thri chwarter y cwmnïau yn gwneud gwaith ymchwil a datblygu. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais yn fy ateb cychwynnol, mae adroddiad Nexus yn nodi nid yn unig y cynnydd mawr, ond y materion allweddol y mae angen inni fynd i'r afael â hwy. Yr ydym wedi gwneud cynnydd mawr o ran yr agenda hollbwysig hon a thros yr wythnosau nesaf, byddaf yn gwneud cyhoeddiadau ar fuddsoddiadau mawr yn yr economi wybodaeth yr ydym yn eu gwneud fel Llywodraeth.

**Leighton Andrews:** A gytunwch mai un o'r sectorau sy'n dibynnu ar waith ymchwil a datblygu yw'r diwydiannau creadigol yng Nghymru? Croesawaf y cyhoeddiad ddoe ar y strategaeth ar gyfer diwydiannau creadigol, yn enwedig cronfa eiddo deallusol y diwydiannau creadigol. Tynnaf eich sylw at wobrau cerddoriaeth Cymru sy'n cael eu cyflwyno yn y Ffatri Bop yn fy etholaeth i ym mis Rhagfyr, a fydd yn gyfrwng rhagorol a phwysig i hyrwyddo un rhan o'r sector creadigol yng Nghymru?

**Andrew Davies:** Mae potensial enfawr gan y diwydiant cerdd i greu cyfoeth a swyddi yng Nghymru. Yr hyn a fu'n arwyddocaol dros y 10 neu 20 mlynedd diwethaf yw bod Cymru



produced some of the leading rock bands in the world, including the Manic Street Preachers, the Stereophonics and many others. Little of that wealth generation and job creation that comes from that is retained in Wales. The creative industries strategy looks to address that issue. Therefore, rather than export all of our wealth and jobs, we are creating employment in Wales.

wedi esgor ar rai o'r grwpiau roc mwyaf blaenllaw yn y byd, gan gynnwys y Manic Street Preachers, y Stereophonics a llawer o grwpiau eraill. Ychydig iawn o'r cyfoeth a'r swyddi a grëir o ganlyniad i hynny sy'n aros yng Nghymru. Nod y strategaeth diwydiannau creadigol yw mynd i'r afael â'r mater hwnnw. Felly, yn hytrach nag allforio ein holl gyfoeth a'n swyddi, yr ydym yn creu cyflogaeth yng Nghymru.

### **Lleoliad Casino Mawr Location of a 'Super-casino'**

**Q8 Leanne Wood:** Has the Minister made any assessment of how the location of a 'super casino' can aid the economic regeneration of an area? (OAQ39769)

**C8 Leanne Wood:** A yw'r Gweinidog wedi asesu sut y gall lleoliad casino mawr hybu adfywiad economaidd ardal? (OAQ39769)

3.00 p.m.

3.00pm

**Andrew Davies:** My response is based on the answer that I gave earlier to my colleague Edwina Hart, namely that we have made no specific assessment on this issue, but that I and my colleagues are considering the implications for Wales of the Gambling Bill.

**Andrew Davies:** Mae fy ymateb yn seiliedig ar yr ateb a roddais yn gynharach i'm cyd-Weinidog Edwina Hart, sef na wnaethom asesu'r mater hwn yn benodol, ond fy mod i a'm cyd-Weinidogion yn ystyried goblygiadau'r Mesur Hapchwarae i Gymru.

**Leanne Wood:** Recent research from Sheffield Hallam University has shown that the consequences of the Gambling Bill are likely to be that the real winners will be the large international big-name companies, while small local businesses, including pubs and restaurants, are likely to lose out and possibly be forced to close. Do you agree that in order for the Welsh economy to develop successfully, we need to ensure that indigenous companies are supported and not squeezed out?

**Leanne Wood:** Dangosodd gwaith ymchwil diweddar o Brifysgol Sheffield Hallam mai'r rhai sy'n debygol o fod ar eu hennill yn sgîl y Mesur Hapchwarae mewn gwirionedd fydd y cwmnïau adnabyddus rhyngwladol mawr, ac mae'n debyg y bydd busnesau lleol bach, gan gynnwys tafarndai a bwytai, ar eu colled ac o bosibl yn gorfod cau. A gytunwch er mwyn i economi Cymru ddatblygu'n llwyddiannus, fod angen inni sicrhau y caiff cwmnïau cynhenid gefnogaeth ac na chânt eu hanwybyddu?

**Andrew Davies:** As I said in my first answer, we will be considering the implications of the Bill and any possible developments in Wales. We would not want any developments in the gambling industry or any other industry that would harm indigenous business. We want to grow the Welsh economy, not reduce employment.

**Andrew Davies:** Fel y dywedais yn fy ateb cyntaf, byddwn yn ystyried goblygiadau'r Mesur ac unrhyw ddatblygiadau posibl yng Nghymru. Ni fyddem yn croesawu unrhyw ddatblygiadau yn y diwydiant hapchwarae nac unrhyw ddiwydiant arall a fyddai'n niweidio busnesau cynhenid. Yr ydym am ddatblygu economi Cymru, nid lleihau cyflogaeth.

**Lorraine Barrett:** While we all have concerns about any increase in gambling habits, will you talk to the trade unions, as the First Minister agreed to yesterday? They

**Lorraine Barrett:** Er bod unrhyw gynnydd mewn arferion hapchwarae yn destun pryder i bob un ohonom, a siaradwch â'r undebau llafur, fel y cytunodd y Prif Weinidog i'w

are working to ensure that only the best pay and conditions apply to the employees in any future super-casinos in Wales.

**Andrew Davies:** I have already started those discussions. I met with the GMB union two weeks ago, who were meeting with American colleagues involved in the gambling industry. It was an interesting meeting, albeit quite brief. Some of the issues they raised and some of the lessons to be learnt from the American experience are ones we want to take on board.

**Nick Bourne:** In over five and a half years, no-one has come into a surgery asking for a super casino. I do not think that I am alone in having grave concerns about these proposals. I hope that you will be passing messages to Westminster about the dangers to the vulnerable and the dangers of money laundering. I do not think that this is a sensible proposal—super casinos open on Good Friday, Christmas Day, and are open 24 hours a day. I hope the Welsh Assembly Government will be telling its colleagues in Westminster to drop this crazy idea.

**Andrew Davies:** I am not sure whether that was a question.

**Nick Bourne:** Would you not agree?

**Andrew Davies:** We discuss many issues with Westminster colleagues. As I said in my reply to Leanne Wood, we are discussing the implications of the Bill with Westminster colleagues and with Assembly Cabinet colleagues .

**Nick Bourne:** I heard you say that earlier, but that was not the question. You pressed for a question, you got one, and then you did not answer it. Would you not agree that there are grave dangers that need to be passed on to Westminster? Will you pass them on?

**Andrew Davies:** We will discuss all the implications with Westminster colleagues. I repeat the answer that I gave to the previous

wneud ddoe? Maent yn gweithio i sicrhau y caiff cyflogeion unrhyw gasinos mawr yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol y cyflog a'r amodau gorau.

**Andrew Davies:** Yr wyf eisoes wedi dechrau'r trafodaethau hynny. Cyfarfûm ag undeb y GMB bythefnos yn ôl, a oedd wedi trefnu cyfarfod ag undebwyr o America a oedd yn gysylltiedig â'r diwydiant haphchwarae. Yr oedd yn gyfarfod diddorol, er yn eithaf byr. Mae rhai o'r materion a godwyd ganddynt a rhai o'r gwersi i'w dysgu o brofiad yr Americanwyr yn rhai yr ydym ni am eu hystyried.

**Nick Bourne:** Dros y pum mlynedd a hanner diwethaf, nid oes neb wedi dod i mewn i gynghorfa yn gofyn am gasino mawr. Ni chredaf mai dim ond fi sydd â phryderon dybryd ynghylch y cynigion hyn. Gobeithiaf y byddwch yn trosglwyddo negeseuon i San Steffan am y peryglon i bobl ddiameddiffyn a pheryglon gwyngalchu arian. Ni chredaf fod hwn yn gynnig call—mae casinos mawr ar agor ar Ddydd Gwener y Groglith, Dydd Nadolig, ac maent ar agor 24 awr y dydd. Gobeithiaf y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn dweud wrth ei chyd-aelodau yn San Steffan am roi'r gorau i'r syniad gwirion hwn.

**Andrew Davies:** Nid wyf yn siŵr a oedd hynny'n gwestiwn.

**Nick Bourne:** Oni chytunwch?

**Andrew Davies:** Yr ydym yn trafod llawer o faterion gyda chyd-aelodau yn San Steffan. Fel y dywedais yn fy ymateb i Leanne Wood, yr ydym yn trafod goblygiadau'r Mesur gyda'n cyd-aelodau yn San Steffan a chyd-aelodau cyd-Weinidogion yng Nghabinet y Cynulliad.

**Nick Bourne:** Fe'ch clywais yn dweud hynny'n gynharach, ond nid dyna oedd y cwestiwn. Gofynasoch am gwestiwn, a chawsoch un, ac yna ni roddasoch ateb iddo. Oni chytunwch fod peryglon difrifol y mae angen eu cyfleu i San Steffan? A wnewch chi eu cyfleu?

**Andrew Davies:** Trafodwn yr holl oblygiadau gyda chyd-aelodau yn San Steffan. Ailadroddaf yr ateb a roddais i'r

question.

cwestiwn blaenorol.

### **Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order**

**Jonathan Morgan:** Point of order. I raise this under Standing Order No. 5.3 relating to business in Plenary, and specifically in relation to indicative timings as set out by the Business Minister in her report. Yesterday, the minority party debate from Plaid Cymru, which was scheduled for 45 minutes, stretched to around an hour. That is a good use of time, considering the Government did not have any other business scheduled afterwards. However, one of the greatest constraints we face relates to the indicative timing for legislation, which, more often than not, takes around 10 minutes. This is a rather unacceptable way for us to continue conducting business, because it puts certain constraints on the Chamber. I ask you to rule whether such a restrictive indicative timing is undermining our ability to discharge our business.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am grateful to Jonathan Morgan for raising that point of order. It closely relates to the business which is to follow immediately. The amount of time allocated to any debate, as Jonathan said, is indicative. It is regularly the case that the Government business, which I am required to dispatch as effectively as possible, subject to democratic scrutiny, in each of our Plenaries, cannot be concluded in the indicative time set in the weekly business statement. I am used to working in other Parliaments, where the timing is quite clearly specified for the type of business, and is strictly adhered to. That is what I would prefer to be the system here. I have said this on many occasions over the last five years to Government Ministers, Business Ministers and business managers of the opposition parties.

It is impossible to scrutinise legislation in a 10-minute period. Under our rules and our agreed procedures, the standard time for a speech is five minutes, and so a 10-minute time slot is not a debate. I have regularly had to allow debates on legislation to continue for a longer period so that I can then discharge my duty to balance debates, to call different

**Jonathan Morgan:** Pwynt o drefn. Codaf hyn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 5.3 sy'n ymwneud â busnes mewn Cyfarfod Llawn, ac yn benodol mewn cysylltiad ag amser a neilltuir fel y nodwyd gan y Trefnydd yn ei hadroddiad. Ddoe, ymestynnodd dadl plaid leiafrifol Plaid Cymru, a drefnwyd i bara 45 munud, i bara tua awr. Mae hynny'n ddefnydd da o amser, o ystyried nad oedd gan y Llywodraeth unrhyw fusnes arall wedi'i drefnu ar ôl hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae un o'r cyfyngiadau mwyaf yr ydym yn ei wynebu yn ymwneud â'r amser a neilltuir ar gyfer deddfwriaeth, sydd fel arfer yn cymryd tua 10 munud. Mae hyn yn ffordd eithaf annerbyniol inni barhau i gynnal busnes, am ei bod yn rhoi cyfyngiadau penodol ar y Siambr. Gofynnaf ichi ddyfarnu a yw amser a neilltuir sydd mor gyfyngedig yn tansellio ein gallu i gynnal ein busnes.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Jonathan Morgan am godi'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw. Mae cysylltiad agos rhyngddo â'r busnes a fydd yn dilyn hyn yn uniongyrchol. Amcan yn unig yw'r amser a neilltuir ar gyfer unrhyw ddadl, fel y dywedodd Jonathan. Mae'n wir yn aml na ellir cwblhau busnes y Llywodraeth, y mae'n ofynnol imi ei gynnal mor effeithiol â phosibl, yn amodol ar graffu democrataidd, ym mhob un o'n Cyfarfodydd Llawn, o fewn yr amser a bennwyd yn y datganiad busnes wythnosol. Yr wyf yn gyfarwydd â gweithio mewn Seneddau eraill, lle y nodir amser penodol ar gyfer y math o fusnes, a glynir wrtho'n gaeth. Dyna'r system y byddai'n well gennyf ei gweld yma. Yr wyf wedi dweud hyn sawl gwaith yn ystod y pum mlynedd diwethaf wrth Weinidogion y Llywodraeth, Trefnyddion a threfnwyr busnes y gwrthbleidiau.

Mae'n amhosibl craffu ar ddeddfwriaeth mewn 10 munud. O dan ein rheolau a'n gweithdrefnau cytûn, yr amser safonol ar gyfer araith yw pum munud, ac felly nid yw cyfnod 10 munud yn ddadl. Bu'n rhaid imi ganiatáu i ddadleuon ar ddeddfwriaeth barhau am gyfnod hwy na hynny'n aml er mwyn imi allu cyflawni fy nyletswydd i gydbwysu

voices within and across parties, as is my role, and that of my deputy.

In the case of debates on motions proposed on behalf of political groups not represented in the Assembly Cabinet—as happened yesterday—the Deputy Presiding Officer and I try to adhere as strictly as we can to the indicative timings. However, several of these debates have gone over time. They are timed for 45 minutes, mainly to accommodate those Members who sit on my left, who are supporters of the Government, and who, in minority party debates, may often find themselves not called, although they have clearly indicated that they would wish to be called. It would be appropriate to call them to balance the debate, since, in minority party debates, representatives from the party that calls the debate are called alternately with representatives from the other parties. That is difficult; it is difficult to accommodate all parties equally in such a situation.

That is why the Deputy Presiding Officer and I—the Deputy Presiding Officer in particular, as he normally chairs these debates, which occur later in our business—have used our discretion to extend the timings to allow for a balanced debate. I hope that Members will agree that we must continue to have the discretion to manage the debates as we think appropriate, having regard to our obligation to balance, and to allow for all views to be expressed. I hope that Members will agree that, in electing us to our positions, the Assembly expects us to use our judgment and discretion in presiding over the proceedings. I address these remarks, generally, to Members and, specifically, to the Business Committee when it discusses indicative timings.

dadleuon, i alw ar bobl wahanol o fewn pleidiau ac ar draws pleidiau, yn unol â'm rôl i a rôl fy nirprwy.

Yn achos dadleuon ar gynigion a gynigir ar ran grwpiau gwleidyddol nas cynrychiolir yng Nghabinet y Cynulliad—fel y digwyddodd ddoe—byddaf fi a'r Dirprwy Lywydd yn ceisio glynu mor gaeth â phosibl wrth yr amser a neilltuir. Fodd bynnag, mae sawl un o'r dadleuon hyn wedi mynd dros amser. Fe'u hamserir i bara 45 munud, yn bennaf er mwyn cynnwys yr Aelodau hynny sy'n eistedd ar y chwith imi, sy'n cefnogi'r Llywodraeth, ac na chânt eu galw'n aml o bosibl mewn dadleuon pleidiau lleiafrifol, er eu bod wedi nodi'n glir eu bod am gael eu galw. Byddai'n briodol eu galw i gydbwysu'r ddadl, oherwydd, mewn dadleuon pleidiau lleiafrifol, gelwir ar gynrychiolwyr o'r blaidd a alwodd am y ddadl am yn ail â chynrychiolwyr o'r pleidiau eraill. Mae hynny'n anodd; mae'n anodd cynnwys pob plaid yn gyfartal mewn sefyllfa o'r fath.

Dyna pam y mae'r Dirprwy Lywydd a minnau—y Dirprwy Lywydd yn benodol, gan mai ef sydd fel arfer yn cadeirio'r dadleuon hyn, sy'n digwydd yn ddiweddarach yn ein busnes—wedi defnyddio ein disgresiwn i ymestyn yr amser er mwyn sicrhau y ceir dadl gytbwys. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr Aelodau yn cytuno bod yn rhaid inni barhau i gael y disgresiwn i reoli'r dadleuon fel y bo'n briodol yn ein barn ni, gan ystyried ein rhwymedigaeth i sicrhau cydbwysedd, ac i ganiatáu i bob barn gael ei mynegi. Gobeithiaf y bydd Aelodau yn cytuno, wrth ein hethol i'n swyddi, bod y Cynulliad yn disgwyl inni ddefnyddio ein barn a'n disgresiwn wrth lywyddu dros y trafodion. Cyfeiriaf y sylwadau hyn, yn gyffredinol, at Aelodau ac, yn benodol, at y Pwyllgor Busnes pan fydd yn trafod yr amser a neilltuir.

### **Dirprwy Swyddogaethau Deddf Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru) 2004 i'r Prif Weinidog**

#### **Delegating Functions of the Public Audit (Wales) Act 2004 to the First Minister**

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Cynigiad fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under section 62(1)(b) of the Government of Wales Act 1998:*

*1. resolves to delegate the functions of the National Assembly contained in or under the following provisions of the Public Audit (Wales) Act 2004 to the Assembly First Minister, save those which by law cannot be so delegated:*

*section 1(3)—transfer of functions of Assembly*

*section 5—studies relating to registered social landlords*

*section 13—audit of accounts of local government bodies in Wales*

*section 14—appointment of auditors*

*section 37—extraordinary audit*

*schedule 1 paragraph 9—best value audit and inspections*

*schedule 2 paragraph 4—certification of statements by Auditor General for Wales;*

*2. nothing in the motion will have the effect of reducing the pre-eminence of the authority of the full Assembly or of reducing the role of the Assembly committees in the exercise of the above functions; and*

*3. this delegation will be made in the knowledge that those functions will, as appropriate, be further delegated to the appropriate Assembly Minister and to staff. (NDM2186)*

To remind everyone of the background, you will all remember that this Wales-only legislation will bring together the audit functions to create a single audit body in Wales from 1 April next year. It has gone through pre-legislative scrutiny in the Chamber.

The purpose of this motion is to delegate to the First Minister functions conferred on the National Assembly by the Public Audit (Wales) Act 2004. The Act received Royal Assent on 16 September. The Act extends the powers of the Auditor General for Wales, primarily conferring on him the majority of the functions currently exercised by the Audit Commission in Wales. It facilitates the

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan adran 62(1)(b) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998:*

*1. yn penderfynu dirprwyo holl swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol sydd wedi eu cynnwys yn Neddf Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru) 2004, neu sy'n dod o dan y Ddeddf honno, i Brif Weinidog Cymru, heblaw am y rhai hynny na ellir eu dirprwyo yn gyfreithiol:*

*adran 1(3)—trosglwyddo swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad*

*adran 5—astudiaethau'n ymwneud â landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig*

*adran 13—archwilio cyfrifon cyrff llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru*

*adran 14—penodi archwilydd*

*adran 37—archwiliadau eithriadol*

*atodlen 1 paragraff 9—archwiliadau ac arolygiadau gwerth gorau*

*atodlen 2 paragraff 41—ardystio datganiadau gan Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru;*

*2. ni fydd unrhyw beth yn y cynnig hwn yn golygu y caiff goruchafiaeth awdurdod y Cynulliad llawn na rôl pwyllgorau'r Cynulliad o ran gweithredu'r swyddogaethau uchod eu lleihau; a*

*3. caiff y swyddogaethau hyn eu dirprwyo gan ei wneud yn hysbys y byddant yn cael eu dirprwyo ymhellach i'r Gweinidog priodol yn y Cynulliad, ac i staff pan fo hynny'n briodol. (NDM2186)*

I atgoffa pawb o'r cefndir, fe gofiwch oll y bydd y ddeddfwriaeth hon ar gyfer Cymru'n unig yn dwyn ynghyd y swyddogaethau archwilio i greu un corff archwilio yng Nghymru o 1 Ebrill y flwyddyn nesaf. Eisoës, craffwyd arni yn y Siambr cyn y broses ddeddfu.

Diben y cynnig hwn yw dirprwyo'r swyddogaethau a roddwyd i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gan Ddeddf Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru) 2004 i'r Prif Weinidog. Derbyniodd y Ddeddf Gydsyniad Brenhinol ar 16 Medi. Mae'r Ddeddf yn estyn pwerau Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru, gan roi'r mwyafrif o'r swyddogaethau a gyflawnir ar hyn o bryd gan y Comisiwn Archwilio yng

setting up of a single public audit body in Wales from 1 April 2005, as I said, to be known as the Wales Audit Office—Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru. The Public Audit (Wales) Bill was subject to extensive scrutiny by us and the UK Government.

Part 1 of the Act confers additional functions on the Auditor General for Wales. Part 2 of the Act relates primarily to arrangements for auditing local government bodies. The Act also includes several Orders and regulations conferring functions on the Assembly. It also enables the Assembly Audit Committee to designate a temporary accounting officer for the Wales Audit Office, and for the Assembly to approve a draft revised code of audit and inspection practice for local government.

3.10 p.m.

The functions that it is proposed to delegate under the motion comprise a small number of powers of direction conferred on the Assembly. These are set out in the explanatory note that has been circulated to Members. It would also enable Assembly Members to agree a programme of value-for-money studies with the Auditor General in respect of registered social landlords and to approve bodies of accountants, members of which would be eligible to be appointed by the Auditor General to audit the accounts of local government bodies. I propose to bring forward commencement Orders for Assembly approval in the new year to ensure that the provisions of the Act are in place by 1 April 2005.

Finally, we all had concerns about section 54, and we will remember those. I thank Don Touhig and Westminster colleagues who have been dealing with that particular issue. It has proved to be more complex than we had hoped. However, I reassure Members—I have had a long discussion with Janet Davies, Chair of the Audit Committee—that, in line with the Freedom of Information Act, which is intended to come into effect on 1 January, it will put in place most of those matters that

Nghymru iddo ef yn bennaf. Mae'n hwyluso'r gwaith o sefydlu un corff archwilio cyhoeddus yng Nghymru o 1 Ebrill 2005, fel y dywedais, a elwir yn Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru—Wales Audit Office. Craffwyd ar y Mesur Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru) yn helaeth gennym ni a chan Lywodraeth y DU.

Mae rhan 1 o'r Ddeddf yn rhoi swyddogaethau ychwanegol i Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru. Mae Rhan 2 o'r Ddeddf yn ymwneud yn bennaf â'r trefniadau ar gyfer archwilio cyrff llywodraeth leol. Mae'r Ddeddf hefyd yn cynnwys sawl Gorchymyn a rheoliadau yn rhoi swyddogaethau i'r Cynulliad. Mae hefyd yn galluogi Pwyllgor Archwilio'r Cynulliad i ddynodi swyddog cyfrifyddu dros dro ar gyfer Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru, ac yn galluogi'r Cynulliad i gymeradwyo cod drafft diwygiedig o arfer archwilio ac arolygu ar gyfer llywodraeth leol.

Mae'r swyddogaethau y bwriedir eu dirprwyo o dan y cynnig yn cynnwys nifer fach o bwerau cyfarwyddo a roddir i'r Cynulliad. Fe'u nodir yn y nodyn esboniadol a ddosbarthwyd i'r Aelodau. Byddai hefyd yn galluogi Aelodau'r Cynulliad i gytuno ar raglen o astudiaethau gwerth am arian gyda'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol mewn perthynas â landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig ac i gymeradwyo cyrff o gyfrifyddion, y byddai eu haelodau yn gymwys i gael eu penodi gan yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol i archwilio cyfrifon cyrff llywodraeth leol. Bwriadaf gyflwyno Gorchymynion cychwyn er mwyn i'r Cynulliad eu cymeradwyo yn y flwyddyn newydd i sicrhau bod darpariaethau'r Ddeddf ar waith erbyn 1 Ebrill 2005.

I gloi, yr oedd gan bob un ohonom bryderon ynglŷn ag adran 54, a byddwn yn eu cofio. Diolchaf i Don Touhig a chyd-aelodau yn San Steffan a fu'n delio â'r mater penodol hwnnw. Bu'n fwy cymhleth na'r disgwyl. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn sicrhau Aelodau—cefais drafodaeth hir gyda Janet Davies, Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Archwilio—y bydd, yn unol â'r Ddeddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth, y bwriedir iddi ddod i rym ar 1 Ionawr, yn rhoi ar waith y rhan fwyaf o'r materion hynny yr

we wanted. One small element in relation to auditors of local government needs to be changed by a particular piece of legislation, but I have assurances from Don Touhig and his office that they are pursuing that element diligently. Janet and I discussed that this morning, and we both feel more satisfied with the outcome of those discussions.

**Janet Davies:** Plaid Cymru supports this motion. We welcome the Act to merge the National Audit Office and the Audit Commission from 1 April, widening the responsibilities to local government, national health service trusts and local health boards, along with the previous responsibilities of the National Audit Office. As you will remember, we recently appointed a new Auditor General for Wales who will also start work on 1 April—I am sure that he is doing some work on this now, but he will start his employment on 1 April. However, it should be noted that local government and other new responsibilities will not come under the Audit Committee, which leaves a slight anomaly in that, while we do not have responsibility, we nevertheless have to accept their budgets. That is a price worth paying, however.

Looking at the Government of Wales as a whole has several advantages for the audit process. First, there is working between auditors in one organisation, and, in giving the chance for their cultures to merge, there will be better communication, which will hopefully lead to better scrutiny. Also, there is the issue of being able to undertake cross-cutting studies. Next year's programme includes services for children, and in particular child poverty issues, with the Assembly Government, the health service, local government and the voluntary sector coming together to be looked at during that value-for-money session. With regard to sustainable development, the Audit Committee will consider what has actually changed, with the difference that, now, it will be able to report to local bodies as well as to the Assembly.

oeddem am eu cael. Mae angen newid un elfen fach mewn perthynas ag archwilwyr llywodraeth leol drwy ddarn penodol o ddeddfwriaeth, ond mae Don Touhig a'i swyddfa wedi fy sicrhau eu bod yn gweithio'n ddiwyd i gyflawni hynny. Trafodwyd hynny gan Janet a minnau y bore yma, ac mae'r ddwy ohonom yn fodlon ar ganlyniad y trafodaethau hynny.

**Janet Davies:** Mae Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi'r cynnig hwn. Croesawn y Ddeddf i uno'r Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol a'r Comisiwn Archwilio o 1 Ebrill, gan ehangu'r cyfrifoldebau i lywodraeth leol, ymddiriedolaethau'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol a byrddau iechyd lleol, ynghyd â chyfrifoldebau blaenorol y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol. Fel y cofiwch, bu inni benodi Archwilydd Cyffredinol newydd i Gymru yn ddiweddar a fydd hefyd yn dechrau ar ei waith ar 1 Ebrill—yr wyf yn siŵr ei fod yn gwneud peth gwaith ar hyn yn awr, ond bydd yn dechrau yn ei swydd ar 1 Ebrill. Fodd bynnag, dylid nodi na fydd llywodraeth leol a chyfrifoldebau newydd eraill yn dod o dan reolaeth y Comisiwn Archwilio, sy'n creu mân anghysondeb yn yr ystyr bod yn rhaid inni dderbyn eu cyllidebau er nad ydym yn gyfrifol amdanynt. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny'n bris sydd yn werth ei dalu.

Mae edrych ar Lywodraeth Cymru yn ei chyfanrwydd yn fanteisiol mewn sawl ystyr i'r broses archwilio. Yn gyntaf, ceir cydweithio rhwng archwilwyr mewn un sefydliad, ac, wrth roi'r cyfle i'w diwylliannau uno, bydd gwell cyfathrebu, a fydd gobeithio yn arwain at broses graffu well. Hefyd, mae'r mater o allu cynnal astudiaethau trawsbynciol. Mae rhaglen y flwyddyn nesaf yn cynnwys gwasanaethau i blant, ac yn arbennig materion o ran tlodi plant, gyda Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, y gwasanaeth iechyd, llywodraeth leol a'r sector gwirfoddol yn dod ynghyd i gael eu hystyried yn ystod y sesiwn gwerth am arian honno. O ran datblygu cynaliadwy, bydd y Comisiwn Archwilio yn ystyried yr hyn sydd wedi newid mewn gwirionedd, gyda'r gwahaniaeth yn awr y bydd yn gallu cyflwyno adroddiadau i gyrff lleol yn ogystal â'r Cynulliad.

The Minister mentioned section 54, which has been a difficult issue. Certainly, under the Freedom of Information Act 2000, from 1 January, local government will have to provide as much public disclosure as the Assembly. Previously, it did not have to do so. The small parts left for appointed auditors will not come under that. We look forward to regulatory reform, getting to grips with this in the not-too-distant future.

Finally, we are looking forward to the increased competencies for the National Assembly from 1 April under this Act.

**Leighton Andrews:** I also welcome the Act and the transfer of functions to the First Minister and to the Assembly. The proposals covered by the Act took place in a framework of scrutiny in which the Assembly was involved last year, and that progressed on an all-party basis, with several amendments incorporated. I was glad to hear the Minister's comments about section 54, as that was an area of concern to many of us.

The Act—as I understand it, and certainly as we were briefed on it—will extend a range of additional functions to the Auditor General for Wales, including for other bodies to be audited, or to be subject to audit by the Auditor General, such as further education corporations. An advantage of being involved in the Assembly's Audit Committee is that, with the support of highly trained professional staff, it is possible to understand in more detail the effectiveness of the spending of public money in Wales, and the following through of the use of that money in pursuance of Assembly objectives.

If further education corporations are to be included in the remit in due course, one area in which I will be interested is the role of the Auditor General in relation to universities. We recently had the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales audit committee report on the failed merger between University of Wales Institute, Cardiff and the University of Glamorgan. While there are issues raised by the question of whether the Assembly should be able, through the Auditor General, to examine in more detail

Soniodd y Gweinidog am adran 54, sydd wedi bod yn fater anodd. Yn sicr, o dan Ddeddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000, bydd llywodraeth leol, o 1 Ionawr, yn gorfod datgelu cymaint i'r cyhoedd ag y gwna'r Cynulliad. Nid oedd yn gorfod gwneud hynny o'r blaen. Ni fydd y rhannau bach a adawyd ar gyfer archwilyr penodedig yn dod o dan y Ddeddf honno. Edrychwn ymlaen at ddiwygio rheoleiddio, ac at fynd i'r afael â hyn yn y dyfodol agos.

I gloi, edrychwn ymlaen at fwy o gymwyseddau ar gyfer y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol o 1 Ebrill o dan y Ddeddf hon.

**Leighton Andrews:** Croesawaf innau'r Ddeddf hefyd a'r gwaith o drosglwyddo swyddogaethau i'r Prif Weinidog a'r Cynulliad. Cyflwynwyd y cynigion a gwmpesir gan y Ddeddf mewn fframwaith craffu y bu'r Cynulliad yn gysylltiedig ag ef y llynedd, a datblygodd hynny ar sail drawsbleidiol, ac ymgorfforwyd sawl gwelliant. Yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed sylwadau'r Gweinidog am adran 54, gan y bu hynny yn bryder i lawer ohonom.

Bydd y Ddeddf—fel y'i deallaf, ac yn sicr fel y cawsom ein briffio arni—yn estyn ystod o swyddogaethau ychwanegol i Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru, gan gynnwys i gyrff eraill gael eu harchwilio, neu a allai gael eu harchwilio gan yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol, megis corfforaethau addysg bellach. Un o fanteision bod ynghlwm wrth Bwyllgor Archwilio'r Cynulliad yw ei bod yn bosibl, gyda chymorth staff proffesiynol wedi eu hyfforddi i safon uchel, ddeall yn fanylach effeithiolrwydd gwariant cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, a gweld yr arian hwnnw yn cael ei ddefnyddio i gyflawni amcanion y Cynulliad.

Os caiff corfforaethau addysg bellach eu cynnwys yn y cylch gwaith maes o law, un maes y bydd gennyf ddiddordeb ynddo fydd rôl yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol mewn perthynas â phrifysgolion. Yn ddiweddar cawsom adroddiad pwyllgor archwilio Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru ar y methiant i uno Athrofa Prifysgol Cymru, Caerdydd a Phrifysgol Morgannwg. Er bod materion yn codi ynglŷn â pha un a ddylai'r Cynulliad, drwy'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol, allu archwilio'n fanylach weithrediadau



the operations of individual institutions such as universities, the failed merger itself raised many issues. The HEFCW audit committee raised a number of those issues. I have written to the Auditor General to ask whether he feels that he has or needs the powers to consider such situations. I would welcome the Minister's observations on whether she thinks that, in future, this might be an area where the powers of the Auditor General for Wales might be extended.

**Jenny Randerson:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome this measure. There was a great deal of cross-party agreement on the amendments that we put forward to the House of Commons. There has been a general welcome for a more co-ordinated and joined-up approach to auditing in Wales which should produce greater efficiency and consistency of standards.

I thank the Minister for her assurances on section 54 because I intended to ask her about the timescale that she anticipates for this. The amendment on it was withdrawn on the basis of UK Government assurances that a uniform approach would be introduced for England and Wales in the near future. It is important to remind ourselves that local government has been the odd man out in this process. It has not been possible for auditors to insist on the publication of audit reports in relation to local government in the same way as with other organisations. Local government organisations have argued that the electorate are their judges, unlike some other organisations, but in practice the electorate needs some benchmarks on which to make a judgment. The experience in Cardiff has shown that it is possible for information to be kept from the public over many years as a result of the rights of local authorities to ensure that information is not published. That has cost a great deal of public money. It is now a matter in the public domain that this is well over £2 million to Cardiff taxpayers. It emphasises the issue that the Audit Commission is not there as an alternative to public judgment, but as the guardian of public interest. The wider the information that becomes available, the better.

I welcome the Freedom of Information Act

sefydliadau unigol megis prifysgolion, cododd y methiant i uno sawl peth ei hun. Cododd pwyllgor archwilio CCAUC nifer o'r materion hynny. Yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol i ofyn a yw'n teimlo bod ganddo'r pwerau neu a oes angen y pwerau arno i ystyried sefyllfaoedd o'r fath. Byddwn yn croesawu sylwadau'r Gweinidog ar ba un a yw'n credu y gallai hyn, yn y dyfodol, fod yn faes lle y gellid estyn pwerau Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn croesawu'r mesur hwn. Bu llawer o gytundeb trawsbleidiol ar y gwelliannau a gyflwynasom i Dŷ'r Cyffredin. Yn gyffredinol, croesawyd ymagwedd fwy cydgysylltiedig tuag at archwilio yng Nghymru a ddylai arwain at fwy o effeithlonrwydd a chysondeb o ran safonau.

Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei sicrwydd o ran adran 54 oherwydd bwriadaf ofyn iddi am yr amserlen a ragwelir ganddi ar gyfer hyn. Tynnwyd y gwelliant arni yn ôl ar sail sicrwydd gan Lywodraeth y DU y byddai ymagwedd unffurf yn cael ei chyflwyno ar gyfer Cymru a Lloegr yn y dyfodol agos. Mae'n bwysig atgoffa ein hunain mai llywodraeth leol fu'r eithriad yn y broses hon. Ni fu'n bosibl i archwilwyr fynnu bod adroddiadau archwilio yn cael eu cyhoeddi mewn perthynas â llywodraeth leol yn yr un ffordd â sefydliadau eraill. Mae sefydliadau llywodraeth leol wedi dadlau mai etholwyr sy'n eu barnu hwy, yn wahanol i rai sefydliadau eraill, ond yn ymarferol mae angen rhai meincnodau ar etholwyr er mwyn iddynt lunio barn. Dengys y profiad yng Nghaerdydd ei bod yn bosibl i wybodaeth gael ei chadw rhag y cyhoedd am flynyddoedd lawer o ganlyniad i hawliau awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau na chaiff gwybodaeth ei chyhoeddi. Mae hynny wedi costio llawer o arian cyhoeddus. Bellach mae'n hysbys bod hyn wedi costio ymhell dros £2 filiwn i drethdalwyr Caerdydd. Mae'n pwysleisio'r pwynt nad dewis amgen yn lle barn y cyhoedd yw'r Comisiwn Archwilio, ond sefydliad sy'n gwarchod budd y cyhoedd. Po ehangaf fo'r wybodaeth sydd ar gael, gorau oll.

Croesawaf y Ddeddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth a

that will come in next year as an addition to the armoury, a little late and weaker than the Liberal Democrats would have liked. Nevertheless, in conjunction with this measure that we discuss today, it is important in ensuring proper scrutiny of how public money is spent.

**Mark Isherwood:** We also welcome the establishment of the Wales Audit Office as a single public audit body for Wales. We welcome Jeremy Colman as Auditor General for Wales, and the powers and duties of cross-border co-operation conferred by this Act.

3.20 p.m.

Greater local democracy and responsibility increases the need for independent accountability. It is vital that the new body is robust and independent, that it responds to concerns regarding whether local government audit is strong and external enough to ensure that weaknesses or failures in managerial or political leadership are addressed, that it ensures that the Assembly remains alert to the risks concerning the devolution of powers to local authorities, and that it will be able to act on the knowledge and expertise of principled whistleblowers who disclose information about weaknesses or failures in local government audit, management or political leadership.

Section 54, which has been mentioned, generated concern about the fact that honest witnesses to malpractice, maladministration or malfeasance in local government could be silenced or criminalised. This concern is particularly pertinent in light of the Welsh Local Government Association's co-ordinating committee report, published in September, which proposes that allocating chairs of overview and scrutiny committees on the basis of political proportionality should be given further consideration, that the duty to consult the community on political management structures be reviewed, and that a separately constituted audit committee need not be a necessity. I fear that a charter, if implemented, would lead to local unaccountability, collusion and even

ddaw i rym y flwyddyn nesaf fel ychwanegiad at yr adnoddau sydd ar gael, ychydig yn hwyr ac yn wannach nag y byddai'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wedi ei ddymuno. Serch hynny, ar y cyd â'r mesur hwn a drafodwn heddiw, mae'n bwysig sicrhau y creffir yn briodol ar y modd y gwerir arian cyhoeddus.

**Mark Isherwood:** Croesawn ninnau hefyd y broses o sefydlu Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru fel un corff archwilio cyhoeddus i Gymru. Croesawn Jeremy Colman fel Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru, a'r pwerau a'r dyletswyddau cydweithio trawsffiniol a roddir gan y Ddeddf hon.

Mae mwy o ddemocratiaeth a chyfrifoldeb lleol yn cynyddu'r angen am atebolrwydd annibynnol. Mae'n hollbwysig bod y corff newydd yn gadarn ac annibynnol, ei fod yn ymateb i bryderon ynglŷn â pha un a yw gwaith archwilio llywodraeth leol yn ddigon cryf ac allanol i sicrhau yr ymdrinnir â gwendidau neu fethiannau mewn arweinyddiaeth rheolwyr neu arweinyddiaeth wleidyddol, ei fod yn sicrhau bod y Cynulliad yn parhau yn effro i'r risgiau o ran datganoli pwerau i awdurdodau lleol, ac y bydd yn gallu gweithredu ar wybodaeth ac arbenigedd chwythwyr chwiban egwyddorol sy'n datgelu gwybodaeth am wendidau neu fethiannau o ran archwilio llywodraeth leol, rheolwyr neu arweinyddiaeth wleidyddol.

Creodd adran 54, y soniwyd amdani, gryn bryder ynglŷn â'r ffaith y gellid tawelu tystion gonest achosion o gamarfer, camweinyddu neu gamymddwyn mewn llywodraeth leol neu eu troi yn droseddwyr. Mae'r pryder hwn yn arbennig o berthnasol yng ngoleuni adroddiad pwyllgor cydgysylltu Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Medi, sy'n cynnig y dylid rhoi mwy o ystyriaeth i'r gwaith o bennu cadeiryddion pwyllgorau trosolwg a chraffu ar sail cymesuredd gwleidyddol, y dylai'r ddyletswydd i ymgynghori â'r gymuned ar strwythurau rheolaeth wleidyddol gael ei hadolygu, ac na ddylid teimlo bod yn rhaid cael pwyllgor archwilio a gyfansoddir ar wahân. Ofnaf y byddai siarter, pe bai'n cael ei gweithredu, yn arwain at

dictatorship.

The motion to delegate functions being debated today has nothing to do with the consequent Orders needed to bring the provision of the Act into force. Section 54 does not confer any functions on the Assembly, and it is therefore not affected by this delegation motion.

Section 54 mirrors section 49 of the Audit Commission Act 1998. The main objection that we have is that there is a presumption—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I welcome the fact that you are turning to the delegation motion.

**Mark Isherwood:** I welcome the fact that you welcome that.

Our main objection is that there is a presumption against the disclosure of information that does not sit well with the principles of freedom of information. Furthermore, one of the possible sanctions is imprisonment. The UK Government refused to amend section 54 during the Bill's passage through Parliament on the grounds that it would create unacceptable inconsistency in local government law between England and Wales. However, it did say that section 49 would be reviewed using the provisions of the Freedom of Information Act 2000. It then amended the Bill to enable the Secretary of State to amend section 54 in line with any amendments made to section 49. The UK Government later stated that the amendment would include a presumption—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I believe that you have referred to two sections that do not confer powers on the Assembly and have not been delegated. Therefore, I would be grateful if the debate could return to the issues in the Act.

**Mark Isherwood:** My key point is that subsections six to eight of section 54 need to be commenced by the Assembly before the Secretary of State can amend it. We therefore call on the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure that only those three subsections of

ddiffyg atebolrwydd lleol, cydgyllwynio a hyd yn oed unbennaeth.

Nid oes a wnelo'r cynnig i ddirprwyo swyddogaethau sy'n cael ei drafod heddiw ddim â'r Gorchmynion canlyniadol sydd eu hangen i ddod â darpariaeth y Ddeddf i rym. Nid yw adran 54 yn rhoi unrhyw swyddogaethau i'r Cynulliad, ac felly nid yw'r cynnig dirprwyo hwn yn effeithio arni.

Mae adran 54 yn debyg i adran 49 Deddf Comisiwn Archwilio 1998. Y prif wrthwynebiad sydd gennym yw bod rhagdybiaeth—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Croesawaf y ffaith eich bod yn troi at y cynnig dirprwyo.

**Mark Isherwood:** Croesawaf y ffaith eich bod chi'n croesawu hynny.

Ein prif wrthwynebiad yw bod rhagdybiaeth yn erbyn datgelu gwybodaeth nad yw'n cyd-daro ag egwyddorion rhyddid gwybodaeth. At hynny, un o'r sancsiynau posibl yw mynd i'r carchar. Gwrthododd Llywodraeth y DU â diwygio adran 54 yn ystod hynt y Mesur drwy'r Senedd oherwydd byddai'n creu anghysondeb annerbyniol mewn cyfraith llywodraeth leol rhwng Cymru a Lloegr. Fodd bynnag, dywedodd y byddai adran 49 yn cael ei hadolygu gan ddefnyddio darpariaethau Deddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000. Yna diwygiodd y Mesur i alluogi'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol i ddiwygio adran 54 yn unol ag unrhyw welliannau a wnaed i adran 49. Yn ddiweddarach, dywedodd Llywodraeth y DU y byddai'r gwelliant yn cynnwys rhagdybiaeth—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Credaf ichi gyfeirio at ddwy adran nad ydynt yn rhoi pwerau i'r Cynulliad ac na chawsant eu dirprwyo. Felly, byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallai'r ddadl ddychwelyd at y materion yn y Ddeddf.

**Mark Isherwood:** Fy mhwynt allweddol yw bod angen i'r Cynulliad gychwyn is-adrannau chwech i wyth adran 54 cyn y gall yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol ei diwygio. Felly galwn ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau mai dim ond y tair is-adran hynny o

section 54 are commenced at this stage. That will allow Assembly Members, Members of Parliament and Peers to consider the amending Order and to have a say before it comes law. Let us hope that Lembit Öpik, the Liberal Democrat Member of Parliament, was not just being a soft touch when he told the UK Government:

‘Perhaps I am simply an optimist or willing to trust the Minister because he has an honest face, but I believe that he will ensure that the issues that relate to clause 54 will be resolved before the end of 2004’.

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** I will refer to the points that I think are relevant and pertinent. I thank Janet Davies for endorsing this motion. She rightly drew attention to the opportunity for cross-cutting studies, which is one of the big pluses that will come through as a result of this motion. To date, there have been difficulties in that regard, so having a single Wales audit body is extremely good news.

I thank Leighton Andrews for the points that he raised and for his contribution on the Audit Committee. I will consider those points. However, the Auditor General for Wales carried out a study recently on procurement in higher education, which shows the way forward in that regard.

Jenny referred to section 54, on which I gave assurances. If you consider the way that the Wales Office has approached this, it has fully intended to comply with the Assembly’s intentions. There was slight surprise regarding the fact that the Freedom of Information Act 2000 does not apply to local government auditors. However, that will be addressed, probably through a regulatory form of primary legislation. I cannot give you an exact timetable, but it is certainly there and we will all pursue it.

As always, it is hugely difficult to respond to anything that Mark Isherwood says, because you cannot see where it comes into the framework of the debate. However, I will pick you up on the commencement Orders, Mark: they will go through the Assembly

adran 54 a gychwynnir ar hyn o bryd. Bydd hynny’n caniatáu i Aelodau’r Cynulliad, Aelodau Seneddol ac Arglwyddi ystyried y Gorchymyn diwygio a chael cyfle i fynegi eu barn cyn iddo ddod yn gyfraith. Gadewch inni obeithio nad oedd Lembit Öpik, Aelod Seneddol y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, yn bod yn galon feddal pan ddywedodd wrth Lywodraeth y DU:

Efallai mai optimist ydwyf neu fy mod yn fodlon ymddiried yn y Gweinidog am fod ganddo wyneb gonest, ond credaf y bydd yn sicrhau y caiff y materion sy’n ymwneud â chymal 54 eu datrys cyn diwedd 2004.

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Cyfeiriaf at y pwyntiau sy’n berthnasol yn fy marn i. Diolchaf i Janet Davies am gymeradwyo’r cynnig hwn. Tynnodd sylw, a hynny’n briodol, at y cyfle ar gyfer astudiaethau trawsbynciol, sy’n un o’r manteision mwyaf a ddaw yn sgîl y cynnig hwn. Hyd yma, bu anawsterau yn hynny o beth, felly mae cael un corff archwilio i Gymru yn newyddion eithriadol o dda.

Diolchaf i Leighton Andrews am y pwyntiau a gododd ac am ei gyfraniad ar y Pwyllgor Archwilio. Ystyriaf y pwyntiau hynny. Fodd bynnag, cynhaliodd Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru astudiaeth yn ddiweddar ar gaffael mewn addysg uwch, sy’n dangos y ffordd ymlaen yn hynny o beth.

Cyfeiriodd Jenny at adran 54, y rhoddais sicrwydd arni. Os ystyriwch sut y mae Swyddfa Cymru wedi mynd i’r afael â hyn, bu’n fwriad ganddi i gydymffurfio â bwriadau’r Cynulliad yn gyfan gwbl. Bu rhywfaint o syndod o ran y ffaith nad yw Deddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000 yn gymwys i archwilwyr llywodraeth leol. Fodd bynnag, ymdrinnir â hynny, drwy ffurf reoliadol ar ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol siŵr o fod. Ni allaf roi’r union amserlen ichi, ond yn sicr mae un ar gael a bydd pob un ohonom yn ceisio cadw ati.

Fel bob amser, mae’n anodd iawn ymateb i unrhyw beth a ddywed Mark Isherwood, oherwydd ni allwch weld sut y mae’n rhan o fframwaith y ddadl. Fodd bynnag, rhaid imi ddychwelyd at eich pwynt ynglŷn â’r Gorchymynion cychwyn, Mark: byddant yn

Chamber. I take it, from what you said, that you fully support them, so I look forward to that.

mynd drwy Siambr y Cynulliad. Cymeraf yn ganiataol, o'r hyn a ddywedasoeh, eich bod yn eu cefnogi'n llawn, felly edrychaf ymlaen at hynny.

*Cynnig (NDM2183): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM2186): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Adroddiad Adolygiad Polisi'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ar Addysg  
Arbennig**  
**The Education and Lifelong Learning Committee's Policy Review Report of  
Special Education**

**Peter Black:** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Orders Nos. 6.6 and 9.9, notes the report of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee titled, 'Policy Review of Special Educational Needs—Part One: Early Identification and Intervention', which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to all Assembly Members on 17 November 2004. (NDM2184)*

I am pleased to present this first policy review report from the current Education and Lifelong Learning Committee. The report was launched this morning at Meadowbank School in Gabalfa, Cardiff. I thank the headteacher, Carolyn Arthurs, and the staff and pupils for hosting this most enjoyable event. I also thank committee members Mark Isherwood and Janet Ryder for attending the launch.

The copies of the report that you have been given today are digital versions, produced in sufficient quantities for the purpose of the launch and the Plenary debate. A more substantial print run has been arranged, and the report will then be widely distributed. The report can also be viewed on the National Assembly website.

I shall give some brief background, before outlining the main findings of the report. The review into special education needs will be carried out in three stages. The first stage is early identification and intervention; the second is the statementing process; and, finally, we will look at transition between the various phases of statutory education, through lifelong learning, and into the workplace. This report covers the first stage of that review. The committee recognises that this important policy area directly touches many families throughout Wales. To put it in context, Estyn estimates that one child in four will have a special or additional need at some time in his or her school life.

**Peter Black:** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhifau 6.6 a 9.9, yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes o'r enw 'Adolygiad Polisi o Anghenion Addysgol Arbennig—Rhan 1: Adnabod ac Ymyrryd yn Gynnar', a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 17 Tachwedd 2004. (NDM2184)*

Yr wyf yn falch o gyflwyno'r adroddiad adolygiad polisi cyntaf hwn gan y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes presennol. Lansiodd yr adroddiad y bore yma yn Ysgol Meadowbank yng Ngabalfa, Caerdydd. Diolchaf i'r pennaeth, Carolyn Arthurs, a'r staff a'r disgyblion am gynnal yr achlysur difyr hwn. Diolchaf hefyd i aelodau'r pwyllgor, Mark Isherwood a Janet Ryder, am fod yn bresennol.

Fersiynau digidol yw'r copïau o'r adroddiad a roddwyd ichi heddiw, a gynhyrchwyd mewn niferoedd digonol at ddiben yr achlysur lansio a'r ddadl yn y Cyfarfod Llawn. Mae argraffiad helaethach wedi'i drefnu, ac yna caiff yr adroddiad ei ddosbarthu'n eang. Gellir gweld yr adroddiad ar wefan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol hefyd.

Rhoddaf grynodedb o'r cefndir, cyn amlinellu prif ganfyddiadau'r adroddiad. Caiff yr adolygiad i anghenion addysgol arbennig ei gynnal mewn tri cham. Y cam cyntaf yw adnabod ac ymyrryd yn gynnar; yr ail gam yw'r broses rhoi datganiadau; ac yn olaf, byddwn yn ystyried y broses bontio rhwng camau gwahanol addysg statudol, drwy ddysgu gydol oes, ac i'r gweithle. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn cwmpasu cam cyntaf yr adolygiad hwnnw. Mae'r pwyllgor yn cydnabod bod y maes polisi pwysig hwn yn effeithio'n uniongyrchol ar lawer o deuluoedd ledled Cymru. I'w roi yn ei gyddestun, mae Estyn yn amcangyfrif y bydd gan un plentyn o bob pedwar angen arbennig neu ychwanegol rywbyrd yn ystod ei gyfnod yn

yr ysgol.

I do not intend to take you through the report page by page, but it might be helpful if I were to paraphrase the terms of reference that were agreed by the committee. We agreed to review what support is provided by local authorities and other agencies to assist parents and teachers in the early identification of special educational needs, and to review how local authorities are implementing the 'Special Educational Needs Code of Practice for Wales'. We agreed to identify good practice in early identification and intervention, including multi-agency working and the supply and training of speech and language therapists, and to take account of the review by the previous Health and Social Services Committee on children with special health needs. We also agreed to make recommendations to the Assembly Minister on how existing services might be improved, so that more children with special education needs are identified in sufficient time to receive effective support.

The committee felt that it would be almost impossible to find an expert adviser with sufficient breadth of knowledge and expertise to cover such a wide-ranging subject. Instead, we appointed an external reference group to provide specialist advice. The group assisted in preparing the programme of evidence, and also in commenting on early drafts of the report. The membership of this group is listed in annex 2 of the report.

The committee started hearing evidence last autumn and finished this summer. In addition to formal presentations to committee, we carried out an extensive written consultation with individuals and organisations; including schools, specialist SEN organisations, local authorities, health bodies, parents, children and young people. The consultation process is described at annex 4 of the report. In addition, committee members visited special schools and mainstream schools in north and south Wales. Members found these visits informative because they were able to see for themselves the good work that is carried out by teachers and pupils, sometimes in challenging circumstances. The visits included informal discussions with teachers, governors, parents and pupils, and so

Ni fwriadaf drafod yr adroddiad fesul tudalen, ond efallai y byddai'n ddefnyddiol pe bawn yn crynhoi'r cylch gorchwyl y cytunodd y pwyllgor arno. Bu inni gytuno i adolygu'r cymorth a roddir gan awdurdodau lleol ac asiantaethau eraill i helpu rhieni ac athrawon i adnabod anghenion addysgol arbennig yn gynnar, ac i adolygu sut y mae awdurdodau lleol yn gweithredu 'Cod Ymarfer Anghenion Addysgol Arbennig Cymru'. Bu inni gytuno i nodi arferion da o ran adnabod ac ymyrryd yn gynnar, gan gynnwys gwaith amlasiantaeth a darparu a hyfforddi therapyddion lleferydd ac iaith, ac i ystyried yr adolygiad gan y cyn-Bwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol o ran plant ag anghenion iechyd arbennig. Bu inni gytuno hefyd i gynnig argymhellion i Weinidog y Cynulliad ar sut y gellid gwella gwasanaethau presennol, er mwyn sicrhau y caiff mwy o blant ag anghenion addysgol arbennig eu hadnabod mewn pryd i gael cymorth effeithiol.

Yr oedd y pwyllgor o'r farn y byddai bron yn amhosibl dod o hyd i gynghorydd arbenigol a oedd yn meddu ar ddigon o wybodaeth ac arbenigedd i gwmpasu pwnc mor eang. Yn lle hynny, bu inni benodi grŵp cyfeirio allanol i roi cyngor arbenigol. Bu'r grŵp o gymorth wrth baratoi rhaglen o dystiolaeth, a drwy roi sylwadau ar fersiynau drafft cynnar yr adroddiad. Rhestrir aelodaeth y grŵp hwn yn atodiad 2 yr adroddiad.

Dechreuodd y pwyllgor wrando ar dystiolaeth yn ystod yr hydref y llynedd a daeth y broses honno i ben yn ystod yr haf eleni. Yn ogystal â'r cyflwyniadau ffurfiol i'r pwyllgor, bu inni gynnal ymgynghoriad ysgrifenedig eang gydag unigolion a sefydliadau; gan gynnwys ysgolion, sefydliadau AAA arbenigol, awdurdodau lleol, cyrff iechyd, rhieni, plant a phobl ifanc. Disgrifir y broses ymgynghori yn atodiad 4 yr adroddiad. Yn ogystal, ymwelodd aelodau'r pwyllgor ag ysgolion arbennig ac ysgolion prif ffrwd yn y Gogledd a'r De. Yr oedd yr ymweliadau hyn yn ddefnyddiol, ym marn yr Aelodau, oherwydd gallent weld drostynt eu hunain y gwaith da a wneir gan athrawon a disgyblion, mewn amgylchiadau heriol weithiau. Yr oedd yr ymweliadau yn

provided an opportunity to learn at first hand the day-to-day problems associated with teaching and caring for children and young people with special educational needs.

cynnwys trafodaethau anffurfiol gydag athrawon, llywodraethwyr, rhieni a disgyblion, ac felly yr oedd cyfle i ddysgu'n uniongyrchol am y problemau o ddydd i ddydd sy'n gysylltiedig ag addysgu plant a phobl ifanc ag anghenion addysgol arbennig a gofalu amdanynt.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.30 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.30 p.m.*

I turn to the committee's main findings. I do not intend to trawl through every recommendation in the report, but I shall highlight what I consider to be the main points. Early identification of special educational needs is crucial in ensuring that children and young people receive effective, timely support. If problems are not picked up early enough, the consequences can be severe, not just for the children, but for their parents and carers. These problems may include a failure to acquire basic literacy skills at the appropriate time, which means that the child's ability to learn will be significantly impeded throughout his or her school days, probably leading to disaffection with education and learning. Sadly, we know that some children slip through the net, and their special needs are never identified, leading to unfulfilled potential and a blight on their young lives.

Trof at brif ganfyddiadau'r pwyllgor. Ni fwriadaf drafod pob argymhelliad yn yr adroddiad, ond byddaf yn amlygu'r hyn a ystyriaf yn brif bwyntiau, yn fy marn i. Mae'n hanfodol adnabod anghenion addysgol arbennig yn gynnar er mwyn sicrhau bod plant a phobl ifanc yn cael cymorth amserol effeithiol. Os na chaiff problemau eu nodi'n ddigon cynnar, gall y canlyniadau fod yn ddifrifol, nid dim ond i'r plant, ond i'w rhieni a'u gofalwyr. Gall y problemau hyn gynnwys methiant i ddatblygu sgiliau llythrennedd sylfaenol ar yr adeg briodol, sy'n golygu y caiff gallu'r plentyn i ddysgu ei rwystro'n sylweddol drwy gydol ei gyfnod yn yr ysgol, gan beri iddynt ddadrithio ynghylch addysg a dysgu, yn ôl pob tebyg. Yn anffodus, gwyddom fod rhai plant yn llithro drwy'r rhwyd, ac ni chaiff eu hanghenion arbennig eu hadnabod byth, gan beri iddynt beidio â chyflawni eu potensial a chan effeithio'n andwyol ar eu bywydau ifanc.

However, early identification alone is not enough. In order to improve the current levels of service, two important issues must be addressed—information and training. We must provide information for parents, so that they know what support is available and how to get it. We advocate a one-stop shop run by local authorities. We also need the dissemination of best practice between health and education professionals, local authorities, schools and parents. Special educational needs training for teachers must be improved, through initial teacher training at college, induction training for newly qualified teachers and continuing professional training for classroom teachers and specialist SEN co-ordinators. Other specialist staff, including speech and language therapists, must be provided with training to hone their skills and to keep abreast of the latest techniques. There is a shortage of specialist therapists,

Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n ddigon adnabod anghenion yn gynnar yn unig. Er mwyn gwella lefelau presennol y gwasanaeth, rhaid ymdrin â dau fater pwysig—gwybodaeth a hyfforddiant. Rhaid inni roi gwybodaeth i rieni, er mwyn iddynt wybod pa gymorth sydd ar gael a sut i gael gafael arno. Cefnogwn siop un stop a redir gan awdurdodau lleol. Mae angen inni ledaenu arfer gorau rhwng gweithwyr proffesiynol iechyd ac addysg, awdurdodau lleol, ysgolion a rhieni hefyd. Rhaid gwella hyfforddiant ym maes anghenion addysgol arbennig i athrawon, drwy hyfforddiant cychwynnol athrawon yn y coleg, hyfforddiant sefydlu i athrawon sydd newydd gymhwyso a hyfforddiant proffesiynol parhaus i athrawon dosbarth a chydlynwyr AAA arbenigol. Rhaid darparu hyfforddiant i aelodau eraill o staff arbenigol, gan gynnwys therapyddion lleferydd ac iaith, er mwyn mireinio eu



particularly for children and young people with speech, language and communications difficulties. This shortage is especially acute for first-language Welsh speakers. The capacity problem will not be solved overnight due to the necessity to train professional staff. However, we hope that our report will lead to significant improvement over the next five to 10 years.

The direction and guidance offered by the SEN code of practice for Wales was broadly welcomed. However, some practitioners felt that shortages of specialist staff, time and resources, militated against effective implementation of the code. The committee advocates more multi-agency working between health, education and social service professionals, and more joint commissioning of SEN services. The committee does not propose further legislation, but rather recommends that existing legislation should be used to promote further collaboration among local authorities on a regional basis. Most of our recommendations are for the Welsh Assembly Government, as they involve issuing guidance and providing some additional funding. However, we also have recommendations for other organisations, including local authorities, local health boards, teacher training colleges, the Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales, Estyn and the General Teaching Council for Wales. To make a difference, we must all play our part, not least the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee and the Health and Social Services Committee, in holding the respective Ministers to account in delivering the report's recommendations.

I hope that the report will be read widely throughout Wales by all those affected by this important subject. More importantly, I hope that this report will be a catalyst for action. The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning has told me that she does not intend to make an initial response today. However, I look forward to hearing the Assembly Government's formal response within the next five weeks, in accordance

sgiliau a dysgu am y technegau diweddaraf. Mae prinder therapyddion arbenigol, yn arbennig i blant a phobl ifanc ag anawsterau lleferydd, iaith a chyfathrebu. Mae prinder mawr yn arbennig i'r rhai sy'n siarad Cymraeg fel iaith gyntaf. Ni chaiff y broblem o ran capasiti ei datrys dros nos oherwydd yr angen i hyfforddi staff proffesiynol. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiwn y bydd ein hadroddiad yn arwain at welliannau sylweddol dros y pump i 10 mlynedd nesaf.

Croesawyd y cyfarwyddyd a'r canllawiau a gynigwyd gan god ymarfer AAA Cymru yn gyffredinol. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd rhai ymarferwyr o'r farn fod prinder staff arbenigol, amser ac adnoddau yn milwrio yn erbyn gweithredu'r cod yn effeithiol. Mae'r pwyllgor yn cefnogi mwy o waith amlasiantaeth rhwng gweithwyr proffesiynol iechyd, addysg a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, a mwy o gomisiynu ar y cyd o wasanaethau AAA. Nid yw'r pwyllgor yn cynnig cyflwyno deddfwriaeth bellach, ond mae'n argymhell y dylid defnyddio'r ddeddfwriaeth bresennol i hyrwyddo cydweithredu pellach ymhlith awdurdodau lleol yn rhanbarthol. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'n hargymhellion ar gyfer Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, am eu bod yn cynnwys cyhoeddi canllawiau a rhoi rhywfaint o arian ychwanegol. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wedi cynnig argymhellion ar gyfer sefydliadau eraill hefyd, gan gynnwys awdurdodau lleol, byrddau iechyd lleol, colegau hyfforddi athrawon, Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru, Estyn a Chyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru. Er mwyn gwneud gwahaniaeth, rhaid i bob un ohonom chwarae ein rhan, yn bennaf y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes a'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, i ddwyn y priod Weinidogion i gyfrif o ran gweithredu argymhellion yr adroddiad.

Gobeithiaf y bydd pawb y mae'r pwnc pwysig hwn yn effeithio arnynt ledled Cymru yn darllen yr adroddiad. Yn bwysicach, gobeithiaf y bydd yr adroddiad hwn yn ysgogi camau gweithredu. Mae'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes wedi dweud wrthyf nad yw'n bwriadu gwneud ymateb cychwynnol heddiw. Fodd bynnag, edrychaf ymlaen at glywed ymateb ffurfiol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o fewn y pum

with the agreed protocol for dealing with committee reports. The Education and Lifelong Learning Committee will start stage 2 of the policy review in the spring, once we have completed our review of school transport. In the meantime, we would like to start work on the report's recommendations.

Finally, I thank everyone involved in producing this report. This includes committee members, David Melding, as Chair of the Health and Social Services Committee, who attended every evidence-gathering session and contributed significantly to our deliberations, those who presented evidence, those who responded to the consultation, members of the reference group, and the staff and pupils at the schools we visited, not forgetting the committee's secretariat and researchers. I commend the report to the Minister and to the Assembly.

**Gwenda Thomas:** I am pleased to contribute to this debate and to use the time available to me to highlight the success of a special young girl, Kirsty Hill, who is, at present, a pupil in Cefn Saeson Comprehensive School, in my constituency, where she has two support assistants, including a Braillist, who moved with Kirsty from primary to secondary school. Kirsty lives in Brian Gibbons's constituency, but she came to my attention through the deaf-blind unit at Ysgol Hendre in Neath initially. Kirsty's mother would want me to thank Brian for the support that he was able to offer.

Kirsty did not get into a mainstream school until the last years of infant school, when she joined the Gnoll Primary School in Neath. The headmistress, Mrs Jean Davies, was pleased to inform me that Kirsty achieved the highest SATs marks in the school in 2004. Kirsty, aged 10, achieved level 5 in English, mathematics and science.

Kirsty and her family know the importance of early intervention, because not only was she born blind and deaf, but without fingers. Her fingers have now been reconstructed. On a

wythnos nesaf, yn unol â'r protocol y cytunwyd arno ar gyfer ymdrin ag adroddiadau pwyllgorau. Bydd y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn dechrau cam 2 yr adolygiad polisi yn y gwanwyn, pan fyddwn wedi cwblhau ein hadolygiad o gludiant ysgol. Yn y cyfamser, hoffem ddechrau gwaith ar argymhellion yr adroddiad.

I gloi, diolchaf i bawb a fu'n gysylltiedig â chynhyrchu'r adroddiad hwn. Mae hyn yn cynnwys aelodau'r pwyllgor, David Melding, fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, a fu'n bresennol ym mhob sesiwn casglu tystiolaeth ac a wnaeth gyfraniad sylweddol i'n trafodaethau, y rhai a gyflwynodd dystiolaeth, y rhai a ymatebodd i'r ymgynghoriad, aelodau'r grŵp cyfeirio, a staff a disgyblion yr ysgolion y bu inni ymweld â hwy, heb anghofio ysgrifenyddiaeth ac ymchwilyr y pwyllgor. Cymeradwyaf yr adroddiad i'r Gweinidog ac i'r Cynulliad.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Yr wyf yn falch o allu cyfrannu at y ddaid hon a defnyddio'r amser sydd gennyf i sôn am lwyddiant merch ifanc arbennig, Kirsty Hill, sy'n ddisgybl yn Ysgol Gyfun Cefn Saeson, yn fy etholaeth i, ar hyn o bryd. Caiff ddau gynorthwy-ydd cymorth, gan gynnwys rhywun sy'n darllen Braille, a symudodd gyda Kirsty o'r ysgol gynradd i'r ysgol uwchradd. Mae Kirsty yn byw yn etholaeth Brian Gibbons, ond clywais amdani gyntaf drwy'r uned i blant byddar a dall yn Ysgol Hendre yng Nghastell-nedd. Byddai mam Kirsty am imi ddiolch i Brian am y cymorth a roddodd.

Nid aeth Kirsty i ysgol brif ffrwd tan ei blynedd olaf yn yr ysgol iau, lle yr ymunodd ag Ysgol Gynradd y Gnoll yng Nghastell-nedd. Yr oedd y brifathrawes, Mrs Jean Davies, yn falch o'm hysbysu i Kirsty gael y marciau uchaf yn y TASau yn yr ysgol yn 2004. Llwyddodd Kirsty, sy'n 10 oed, i gyrraedd lefel 5 mewn Saesneg, mathemateg a gwyddoniaeth.

Mae Kirsty a'i theulu yn gwybod am bwysigrwydd ymyrryd yn gynnar, oherwydd cafodd ei geni heb fysedd, yn ogystal â bod yn ddall ac yn fyddar. Mae ei bysedd wedi eu

personal note, I will tell you how proud I was of Kirsty when she played a piano solo at last year's Good Friday breakfast at the Neath YMCA.

I am sure that Members will agree that, during this debate on special educational needs, it is appropriate that we should celebrate Kirsty's success and acknowledge the achievements of all our special children and of their families, support workers and teachers.

**David Melding:** As chair of the governing body of Meadowbank Special School, I was delighted that the committee decided to launch this important report at the school. I only regret that my duties as chair of the Health and Social Services Committee prevented my attendance, but these cruel ironies occasionally occur. However, the main issue is that the school was taken as a beacon of excellence, and this excellent report was launched there. I know from what the chair, Peter Black, has said that the event went well. As chair of the Health and Social Services Committee, I thank members of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee for the welcome that they always gave me and the attention that they paid to my contributions, which was probably greater than I deserved, but I always felt very much part of the team. I commend Peter on his chairmanship of the committee, which contributed greatly to a clear report.

I will concentrate on a few themes that clearly come through the report and which impinge on health and social services directly. The need for multi-agency working—particularly between the health and education sectors, although it can go wider than that—is important. At our meeting of the Health and Social Services Committee today, we formally accepted the final draft of our report into our health and social services work together. That deals with many issues such as joint funding and pooled budgets, which also have a direct application in the education sphere. It struck me, throughout the evidence that we received, that there is much

hail-greu yn awr. Ar nodyn personol, hoffwn ddweud wrthyech pa mor falch yr oeddwn o Kirsty pan ganodd unawd ar y piano ym mrecwast Gwener y Groglith yn YMCA Castell-nedd y llynedd.

Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yr Aelodau yn cytuno ei bod yn briodol, yn ystod y ddadl hon ar anghenion addysgol arbennig, inni ddatlu llwyddiant Kirsty a chydabod cyflawniadau pob un o'n plant arbennig a'u teuluoedd, eu gweithwyr cymorth a'u hathrawon.

**David Melding:** Fel cadeirydd corff llywodraethu Ysgol Arbennig Meadowbank, yr oeddwn yn falch iawn i'r pwyllgor benderfynu lansio'r adroddiad pwysig hwn yn yr ysgol. Yn anffodus, oherwydd fy nyletswyddau fel cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, nid oeddwn yn gallu mynychu'r achlysur lansio hwnnw, ond fel yna y mae pethau weithiau. Fodd bynnag, y prif fater yw bod yr ysgol yn cael ei hystyried yn enghraifft o ragoriaeth, a lanswyd yr adroddiad ardderchog hwn yno. Gwn o'r hyn a ddywedodd y cadeirydd, Peter Black, i'r digwyddiad fod yn llwyddiant. Fel cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, diolchaf i aelodau'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes am y croeso a estynnwyd imi ganddynt bob amser ac am y sylw a roddwyd ganddynt i'm cyfraniadau, a oedd yn fwy na'r hyn yr oeddwn yn ei haeddu yn ôl pob tebyg, ond yr oeddwn bob amser yn teimlo'n rhan o'r tîm. Cymeradwyaf Peter ar y ffordd y mae'n cadeirio'r pwyllgor, a gyfrannodd yn sylweddol at gynhyrchu adroddiad clir.

Byddaf yn canolbwyntio ar ychydig themâu a amlygir yn yr adroddiad ac sy'n effeithio ar iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn uniongyrchol. Mae'r angen i sicrhau gwaith amlasiantaeth—yn arbennig rhwng y sector iechyd a'r sector addysg, er y gall fod yn ehangach na hynny—yn bwysig. Yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol heddiw, bu inni dderbyn yn ffurfiol ddrafft terfynol ein hadroddiad ar y cydweithio rhwng iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Mae hynny'n ymdrin â llawer o faterion megis cyd-ariannu a chyllidebau cyfunol, sy'n uniongyrchol berthnasol yn y maes addysg hefyd.

activity in special educational needs. A great deal of resources are devoted to SEN in terms of both staff and direct financial resources, and much of that is used excellently. However, we can do more with that, and work in a smarter fashion to ensure that we get the premier service that children with special educational needs deserve.

3.40 p.m.

I was heartened to hear Gwenda Thomas's contribution and the wonderful cameo about a child who has overcome great adversity and is now achieving wonderfully. From my experience as governor of a special school for over 10 years, the wonderful achievements attained by these children remain with you. That achievement is at different levels, given the various constraints that the children are under at any particular time in their development, but it constantly amazes me. The report is correct to identify the constraints upon the service because of the lack of establishment, or near establishment, figures in terms of therapist provision. That is an ongoing concern. It is not an easy issue to tackle and it affects our ability to intervene early and at the appropriate time. That will come through in the work of the Health and Social Services Committee when it considers the workforce targets. I commend the report's recommendation on the commissioning of regional services. That aspect has been weak, particularly since the reorganisation of local government. I know that the Minister was aware of that point when it was discussed, but commissioning regional services is important, particularly at the severe end, where specialist services are needed. We still need them to be as close as possible to the home community of the children and students involved.

Overall, this report is about what can be achieved. The prognosis for children with moderate or more complex special educational needs is good when the intervention is early and timely. That is important, because what they achieve in life will be determined by how well they do at school and how they develop. We must

Sylweddolais, drwy'r dystiolaeth a gawsom, fod llawer o waith yn cael ei wneud ym maes anghenion addysgol arbennig. Neilltuir llawer o adnoddau i AAA o ran staff ac adnoddau ariannol uniongyrchol, a defnyddir llawer o'r rhain mewn ffordd ardderchog. Fodd bynnag, gallwn wneud mwy, a gweithio'n fwy effeithiol i sicrhau bod gennym y gwasanaeth o'r radd flaenaf y mae plant ag anghenion addysgol arbennig yn ei haeddu.

Yr oedd yn galonogol clywed cyfraniad Gwenda Thomas a'r stori wych am ferch sydd wedi goresgyn adfyd mawr ac sy'n cael canlyniadau ardderchog yn awr. O'm profiad fel llywodraethwr ysgol arbennig am dros 10 mlynedd, nid ydych yn anghofio cyflawniadau ardderchog y plant hyn. Mae'r cyflawniad hwnnw ar lefelau gwahanol, o gofio'r rhwystrau gwahanol y mae'r plant yn eu hwynebu ar unrhyw adeg benodol yn eu datblygiad, ond mae'n fy synnu'n gyson. Mae'n briodol bod yr adroddiad yn nodi'r rhwystrau a wynebir gan y gwasanaeth oherwydd prinder therapyddion neu'r nifer fach o therapyddion sydd ar gael. Mae hynny'n peri pryder yn barhaus. Nid yw'n hawdd mynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn ac mae'n effeithio ar ein gallu i ymyrryd yn gynnar ac ar yr adeg briodol. Bydd hynny'n amlwg yng ngwaith y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol pan fydd yn ystyried targedau o ran y gweithlu. Cymeradwyaf argymhelliad yr adroddiad ar gomisiynu gwasanaethau rhanbarthol. Bu'r agwedd honno yn wan, yn arbennig ers ad-drefnu llywodraeth leol. Gwn fod y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o'r pwynt hwnnw pan y'i trafodwyd, ond mae comisiynu gwasanaethau rhanbarthol yn bwysig, yn arbennig lle y mae angen gwasanaethau arbenigol. Mae angen iddynt fod mor agos â phosibl i gymuned gartref y plant a'r myfyrwyr dan sylw o hyd.

Ar y cyfan, mae a wnelo'r adroddiad hwn â'r hyn y gellir ei gyflawni. Mae'r rhagolygon i blant ag anghenion addysgol arbennig cymedrol neu fwy cymhleth yn dda pan ymyrrir yn gynnar ac yn amserol. Mae hynny'n bwysig, oherwydd bydd pa mor dda y maent yn gwneud yn yr ysgol a sut maent yn datblygu yn effeithio ar yr hyn y maent yn

remove the artificial barriers that sometimes exist. Finally, I look forward to the Government's response in due course, and I am confident that it will be a full and enthusiastic one. It will then be the duty of the opposition and various committees to scrutinise the implementation of the recommendations that are accepted.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Not every Member will be able to contribute if everyone makes lengthy speeches, so I appeal for succinct speeches, especially, where possible, from members of the committee. However, I will not insist on a time limit which would be five minutes, plus an extra minute if there are interventions.

**Denise Idris Jones:** As a member of the committee, I welcome this report's coming to fruition. It concludes a thorough and broad review of the importance and implementation of strategies to identify and assist people in Wales with special educational needs. The depth of content contained in the final document is a tribute to the committee, officials and the stakeholders, who, through their evidence to the committee, and expertise on the external reference group, have made an invaluable contribution to the report. As well as identifying service gaps, the committee saw many examples of excellent service through the evidence-gathering period, and there are examples of excellent ideas and provision throughout Wales. In Conwy, for example, there is an innovative scheme at the healthy living centre in Bangor, which provides support and advice to help and encourage parents to assist learning in cases of special educational need.

I, too, am aware of the shortfalls in specialists, particularly speech and language therapists, from my constituency postbag. A number of my constituents have not had adequate access to trained therapists or the most effective treatment for the child's condition. Many young people with special educational needs have uncommon problems, such as combined dyspraxia and dyslexia, which requires specialist treatment. Moreover, as the report notes, therapy for pupils with speech and language difficulties is confounded by a greater shortage of

ei gyflawni mewn bywyd. Rhaid inni ddileu'r rhwystrau ffug sy'n bodoli weithiau. I gloi, edrychaf ymlaen at ymateb y Llywodraeth maes o law, ac yr wyf yn ffyddiog y bydd yn ymateb llawn a brwdfrydig. Yna dyletswydd y gwrthbleidiau a'r pwyllgorau gwahanol fydd craffu ar y gwaith o roi'r argymhellion a dderbynnir ar waith.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Ni fydd pob Aelod yn gallu cyfrannu os bydd pawb yn gwneud areithiau hir, felly apelïaf am areithiau cryno, yn enwedig, lle y bo'n bosibl, gan aelodau'r pwyllgor. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddaf yn gosod terfyn amser a fyddai'n bum munud, yn ogystal â munud ychwanegol os ceir ymyriadau.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Fel aelod o'r pwyllgor, croesawaf y ffaith bod yr adroddiad hwn wedi'i gwblhau. Mae'n cwblhau adolygiad trylwyr ac eang o bwysigrwydd strategaethau i adnabod a helpu pobl yng Nghymru ag anghenion addysgol arbennig a'r gwaith o weithredu'r strategaethau hynny. Mae'r manylion a gynhwysir yn y ddogfen derfynol yn glod i'r pwyllgor, y swyddogion a'r rhanddeiliaid, sydd, drwy eu tystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor, a'u harbenigedd ar y grŵp cyfeirio allanol, wedi gwneud cyfraniad gwerthfawr i'r adroddiad. Yn ogystal â nodi bylchau mewn gwasanaethau, gwelodd y pwyllgor sawl enghraifft o wasanaethau ardderchog drwy'r cyfnod casglu tystiolaeth, ac mae enghreifftiau o syniadau a darpariaeth ardderchog ledled Cymru. Yng Nghonwy, er enghraifft, mae cynllun arloesol yn y ganolfan byw'n iach ym Mangor, sy'n rhoi cymorth a chyngor i helpu ac annog rhieni i ategu dysgu pan fo gan eu plant angen addysgol arbennig.

Yr wyf fi, hefyd, yn ymwybodol bod prinder arbenigwyr, yn arbennig therapyddion lleferydd ac iaith, o'r llythyrau a gaf gan fy etholwyr. Nid yw nifer o'm hetholwyr wedi cael digon o gyfle i fanteisio ar wasanaeth therapyddion hyfforddedig na'r driniaeth fwyaf effeithiol ar gyfer cyflwr y plentyn. Mae gan lawer o bobl ifanc ag anghenion addysgol arbennig broblemau anghyffredin, megis dyspraxia a dyslecsia ar y cyd, sy'n gofyn am driniaeth arbenigol. Yn ogystal, fel y noda'r adroddiad, mae prinder gwaeth o arbenigwyr Cymraeg neu ieithoedd cyntaf

specialists in Welsh or first languages other than English. This raises further concerns in identifying pupils with language difficulties who are being taught through the medium of a second language. It is now essential that the report's recommendations are taken forward with the enthusiasm and in the co-operative spirit with which the review was undertaken. Joint working between special educational needs providers, therapists, the local education authorities and the voluntary sector is vital to ensure effective implementation and that models of best practice can be maximised for the benefit of those with special educational needs across Wales. I look forward to beginning part two of the process and continuing the review early next year.

**Janet Ryder:** It is gratifying to see the professionals' responses to the report. They highlighted what many of us knew were the problems in special education, namely the problems of early identification and the problems that parents have to get, as they perceive it, the right provision for their children, or even the provision that their children desperately need. It is interesting to note that 18 months ago, the Health and Social Services Committee review underlined the shortage of speech and language therapists—many shortages that we have, again, identified in this review. The Health and Social Services Committee report recommended that the respective Ministers for health and education reported on progress twice yearly to their committees. For this report to have any impact, it will depend on three issues: first, which recommendations the Minister accepts; how she reports back to committee on those recommendations and how committee can scrutinise developments in those recommendations and what kind of budget line is made available.

One of the most important recommendations is about developing an independent advocacy service. Those that are currently available do a good job, but for many parents, while an advocacy service is perceived as being funded by the local education authority, there remains a great deal of scepticism in terms of

heblaw Saesneg yn effeithio ar y therapi a gaiff ddisgyblion ag anawsterau lleferydd ac iaith. Mae hyn yn codi pryderon pellach o ran adnabod disgyblion ag anawsterau iaith a gaiff eu haddysgu drwy gyfrwng ail iaith. Mae bellach yn hanfodol y caiff argymhellion yr adroddiad eu rhoi ar waith yn yr un ffordd ag y cynhaliwyd yr adolygiad, sef gyda brwdfrydedd ac ysbryd cydweithredol. Mae cydweithio rhwng darparwyr anghenion addysgol arbennig, therapyddion, awdurdodau addysg lleol a'r sector gwirfoddol yn hanfodol er mwyn sicrhau proses weithredu effeithiol ac y gellir manteisio i'r eithaf ar fodolau arfer gorau er budd y rhai ag anghenion addysgol arbennig ledled Cymru. Edrychaf ymlaen at ddechrau rhan dau o'r broses a pharhau â'r adolygiad ar ddechrau'r flwyddyn nesaf.

**Janet Ryder:** Mae'n braf gweld ymatebion y gweithwyr proffesiynol i'r adroddiad. Bu iddynt amlygu'r hyn yr oedd llawer ohonom yn gwybod eu bod yn broblemau ym maes addysg arbennig, sef y problemau o ran adnabod anghenion yn gynnar, a'r problemau a wynebir gan rieni, yn eu barn hwy, i gael y ddarpariaeth gywir i'w plant, neu hyd yn oed y ddarpariaeth sydd ei hangen ar eu plant yn ddybryd. Mae'n ddi-ddorol nodi i adolygiad y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol 18 mis yn ôl nodi prinder therapyddion lleferydd ac iaith—prinder mawr a nodwyd gennym ni, unwaith eto, yn yr adolygiad hwn. Argymhellodd adroddiad y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol y dylai'r priod Weinidogion dros iechyd ac addysg gyflwyno adroddiad ar gynnydd ddwywaith y flwyddyn i'w pwyllgorau. Er mwyn i'r adroddiad hwn gael unrhyw effaith, bydd yn dibynnu ar dri mater: yn gyntaf, pa argymhellion y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu derbyn; sut mae'n cyflwyno adroddiad i'r pwyllgor ar yr argymhellion hynny a sut y gall pwyllgor graffu ar ddatblygiadau yn yr argymhellion hynny a pha fath o linell y gyllideb a neilltuir.

Mae a wnelo un o'r argymhellion pwysicaf â datblygu gwasanaeth eiriolaeth annibynnol. Mae'r rhai sydd ar gael ar hyn o bryd yn gwneud gwaith da, ond, er yr ystyrir y caiff gwasanaeth eiriolaeth ei ariannu gan yr awdurdod addysg lleol, mae llawer o rieni yn amheus iawn ynghylch sut y gellir

how that service can be used. For any advocacy service to be effective, people need to have full confidence in it. An advocacy service in something like SEN may often have to help the parent to take action against the local education authority, which is difficult when that service is perceived as being funded by the LEA. For that reason alone, we need to consider establishing an independent advocacy service. The other crucial recommendation is the need to keep parents informed, not only during initial diagnosis and the first signs of special needs being picked up, but throughout the child's career at school. Parents must be involved and kept informed. We know from the evidence accumulated that that is not happening throughout Wales. That needs to be looked at. We need to go back to looking at how we can encourage more people to train as speech therapists and see that feeding through into the report.

I would be interested to hear which recommendations the Minister chooses to support. I hope that she chooses them all. Although, they are not all for the Welsh Assembly Government to action, I hope that she lends her weight to them all.

The budget that is made available for this will be crucial. If you consider the draft budget, it is interesting to note that there was quite an increase in early years and pupil support moneys available. However, although there is an increase in the budget line, the final budget published yesterday, shows that the figure has dropped by around £17 million. We would like to know where that money has gone. Has it been moved to somewhere else in the education budget?

The Welsh Local Government Association has identified SEN and out-of-county placements as one of the main causes of its financial problems. It has identified a need for around £35 million for SEN throughout Wales. We need to be able to provide it with resources so that it can provide the services that families so desperately need. However, it has been interesting to sit through the

defnyddio'r gwasanaeth hwnnw. Er mwyn i unrhyw wasanaeth eiriolaeth fod yn effeithiol, mae angen i bobl ymddiried ynddo'n llwyr. Yn aml, bydd yn rhaid i wasanaeth eiriolaeth mewn maes megis AAA helpu'r rhiant efallai i gymryd camau yn erbyn yr awdurdod addysg lleol, sy'n anodd pan ystyrir y gwasanaeth hwnnw yn un a gaiff ei ariannu gan yr AALL. Am y rheswm hwnnw yn unig, mae angen inni ystyried sefydlu gwasanaeth eiriolaeth annibynnol. Yr argymhelliad allweddol arall yw'r angen i roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i rieni, nid dim ond yn ystod y diagnosis cychwynnol a phan gaiff anghenion arbennig eu nodi yn y lle cyntaf, ond drwy gydol cyfnod y plentyn yn yr ysgol. Rhaid cynnwys rhieni a rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf iddynt. Gwyddom o'r dystiolaeth a gasglwyd nad yw hynny'n digwydd ledled Cymru. Mae angen ymchwilio i hynny. Mae angen inni ailystyried sut y gallwn annog mwy o bobl i hyfforddi fel therapyddion lleferydd a chynnwys hynny yn yr adroddiad.

Byddai diddordeb gennyf glywed pa argymhellion y mae'r Gweinidog yn dewis eu cefnogi. Gobeithiaf y bydd yn dewis pob un ohonynt. Er nad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru sy'n gyfrifol am weithredu pob un ohonynt, gobeithiaf y bydd yn dangos ei chefnogaeth i bob un ohonynt.

Bydd y gyllideb a neilltuir ar gyfer hyn yn hanfodol. Os ystyriwch y gyllideb ddrafft, mae'n ddiddorol nodi bod cynnydd eithaf sylweddol yn yr arian sydd ar gael ar gyfer y blynyddoedd cynnar a chymorth i ddisgyblion. Fodd bynnag, er bod cynnydd yn llinell y gyllideb, dengys y gyllideb derfynol a gyhoeddwyd ddoe fod y ffigur wedi gostwng tua £17 miliwn. Hoffem wybod i ble mae'r arian hwnnw wedi mynd. A yw wedi'i drosglwyddo i rywle arall yn y gyllideb addysg?

Mae Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru wedi nodi AAA a lleoliadau y tu allan i'r sir fel un o'r prif resymau dros ei phroblemau ariannol. Mae wedi nodi angen am tua £35 miliwn ar gyfer AAA ledled Cymru. Mae angen inni allu rhoi adnoddau iddi fel y gall ddarparu'r gwasanaethau sydd eu hangen yn ddybryd ar deuluoedd. Fodd bynnag, bu'n ddiddorol bod yn bresennol yn ystod

committee's evidence-taking sessions. It is good to see the final report come to Plenary, but where it goes from here and how it affects the lives of those young people, children and families affected, will now depend on the Minister and the resources that she can make available.

**Irene James:** I begin by extending the comments of gratitude made by Peter Black, commending the close level of partnership, the broad and informative responses from across public and voluntary organisations, the efforts of the committee officials and everyone who made a submission to the consultation and contributed to this report.

3.50 p.m.

As a former teacher of pupils with special needs, I am particularly aware of the huge efforts and the bonds that teachers, parents and children make when working closely to support and care for SEN children. It is a difficult task to ensure all bases are covered, progress is monitored, changing needs are addressed and up-to-date advice and assistance is shared.

To continue current SEN provision with too few and inadequately trained teachers would be to perpetuate a myth that SEN teaching is teaching which occurs on the margins of mainstream responsibilities. This assumption does not fit the statistics. As noted in the report, one in four pupils will develop or have SEN at some time in their life.

Young people spend much of their time in the classroom environment, and teachers must be trained to respond with the skills and confidence, not only to support pupils with special needs, but also to identify and address their needs where they arise. To achieve better SEN services, we must acknowledge and appreciate that the sometimes transient nature of SEN, and reform provision to encourage easier movement between mainstream education and SEN teaching. We must apply greater resources to target special needs at the borders of the broad definition

sesiynau cymryd tystiolaeth y pwyllgor. Mae'n braf gweld yr adroddiad terfynol yn dod gerbron y Cyfarfod Llawn, ond bydd yr hyn sy'n digwydd o hyn ymlaen a sut y mae'n effeithio ar fywydau'r bobl ifanc, y plant a'r teuluoedd hynny dan sylw, bellach yn dibynnu ar y Gweinidog a'r adnoddau y gall eu neilltuo.

**Irene James:** Dechreuaf drwy ategu diolchiadau Peter Black, gan gymeradwyo'r gwaith partneriaeth agos, yr ymatebion eang a hyddysg gan sefydliadau cyhoeddus a gwirfoddol, ymdrechion swyddogion y pwyllgor a phawb a gyflwynodd sylwadau i'r ymgynghoriad ac a gyfrannodd at yr adroddiad hwn.

Fel cyn-athrawes disgyblion ag anghenion arbennig, yr wyf yn arbennig o ymwybodol o'r ymdrechion caled a'r cydberthnasau y gall athrawon, rhieni a phlant eu meithrin wrth weithio'n agos i gefnogi plant ag AAA a gofalu amdanynt. Mae'n anodd sicrhau y caiff popeth ei wneud, y caiff cynnydd ei fonitro, yr ymdrinnir ag anghenion sy'n newid ac y rhennir y cyngor a'r cymorth diweddaraf.

Byddai parhau â'r ddarpariaeth AAA bresennol heb ddigon o athrawon a chydag athrawon nad ydynt wedi'u hyfforddi'n ddigonol yn parhau â'r gamdybiaeth mai addysgu ar ymylon cyfrifoldebau prif ffrwd yw addysgu AAA. Nid yw'r rhagdybiaeth hon yn cyd-fynd â'r ystadegau. Fel y nodwyd yn yr adroddiad, bydd gan un disgybl o bob pedwar AAA neu byddant yn datblygu AAA rywbryd yn ystod eu bywydau.

Mae pobl ifanc yn treulio llawer o'u hamser yn yr ystafell ddosbarth, a rhaid sicrhau bod athrawon wedi'u hyfforddi i ymateb gyda'r sgiliau a'r hyder, nid dim ond i gefnogi disgyblion ag anghenion addysgol arbennig, ond hefyd i adnabod eu hanghenion ac ymdrin â hwy pan fyddant yn codi. Er mwyn sicrhau gwasanaethau AAA gwell, rhaid inni gydnabod a gwerthfawrogi natur dros dro AAA weithiau, a diwygio'r ddarpariaeth i sicrhau y gall disgyblion symud yn haws rhwng addysg brif ffrwd ac addysgu AAA. Rhaid inni neilltuo mwy o adnoddau i



the SEN label encompasses, complicating early identification and intervention.

Furthermore, we have to address the performance gap between boys and girls with SEN, identify the causes for disparity and adjust teaching methods to ensure gender equal performance by raising standards among boys.

I also pay tribute to the voluntary sector organisations, acknowledged in the report as a keystone of the support network currently available for parents. Better support and information for parents are two of the vital messages we must take from our findings. Breaking the barriers between parents and statutory SEN support must be a top priority for improving SEN services in Wales.

It is parents who feel the brunt of frustration and the children who suffer when services are not delivered as a single package. A multi-agency response to SEN across a collaborative framework of voluntary and public sector provision is vital to address the current gaps in SEN services.

I look forward to continuing our review and our work with all SEN stakeholders in Wales, teachers and parents to ensure the best education and care for all children across Wales.

**Kirsty Williams:** Like David Melding, I would also like to look at the recommendations that impinge upon the health service. The two issues are so interlinked that it is impossible to divide them. At the Health and Social Services Committee this morning, we heard from two young people who described their experiences at the Harvey Jones Centre, and the effect that regime had had on their education. This demonstrates again the need for health and education to work closely together.

Members will be aware that during the first Assembly, the Health and Social Services Committee spent a great deal of time looking

dargeddu anghenion arbennig ar ymylon y diffiniad eang y mae'r label AAA yn ei gwmpasu, sy'n gwneud proses adnabod ac ymyrraeth yn gynnar yn gymhleth.

Yn ogystal, rhaid inni ymdrin â'r bwch mewn perfformiad rhwng bechgyn a merched ag AAA, nodi'r hyn sy'n achosi'r gwahaniaeth ac addasu dulliau addysgu i sicrhau perfformiad cyfartal rhwng y rhywiau drwy godi safonau ymhlith bechgyn.

Talaf deyrnged hefyd i gyrff y sector gwirfoddol. Cydnabuwyd yn yr adroddiad mai hwy yw conglfaen y rhwydwaith cymorth sydd ar gael i rieni ar hyn o bryd. Cymorth a gwybodaeth well i rieni yw dwy o'r negeseuon allweddol y mae'n rhaid inni eu derbyn o'n canfyddiadau. Rhaid rhoi blaenoriaeth i ddileu'r rhwystrau rhwng rhieni a chymorth AAA statudol er mwyn gwella gwasanaethau AAA yng Nghymru.

Rhieni sy'n teimlo'r rhwystredigaeth fwyaf a'r plant sy'n dioddef pan na ddarperir gwasanaethau mewn un pecyn. Mae ymateb amlasiantaeth i AAA ar draws fframwaith cydweithredol o ddarpariaeth y sector gwirfoddol a'r sector cyhoeddus yn hanfodol er mwyn ymdrin â'r bylchau a geir mewn gwasanaethau AAA ar hyn o bryd.

Edrychaf ymlaen at barhau â'n hadolygiad a'n gwaith gyda phob rhanddeiliad AAA yng Nghymru, athrawon a rhieni i sicrhau'r addysg a'r gofal gorau i bob plentyn ledled Cymru.

**Kirsty Williams:** Fel David Melding, hoffwn hefyd ystyried yr argymhellion sy'n effeithio ar y gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae'r ddau fater wedi'u cydgyssylltu gymaint fel nad yw'n bosibl eu rhannu. Yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol y bore yma, clywsom gan ddau berson ifanc a ddisgrifiodd eu profiadau yng Nghanolfan Harvey Jones, a'r effaith a gafodd y gyfundrefn honno ar eu haddysg. Dengys hyn unwaith eto yr angen i gydweithio'n agos rhwng meysydd iechyd ac addysg.

Bydd Aelodau yn ymwybodol i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol dreulio llawer o amser, yn ystod y Cynulliad cyntaf,

at the special health needs of some children in Wales. I am pleased to note that this report goes back to the report of the Health and Social Services Committee, and urges that closer monitoring takes place with regard to implementing the recommendations made by the committee at that stage. In particular, regarding the local health boards nominating a senior person to have direct responsibility for children and children's services.

I am pleased that within my constituency we can look to the good practice of Powys Local Health Board and Powys County Council, which have created a joint appointment for an individual who sits within the local health board to review and develop children's services across the county council and the local health board. That is making a difference, identifying where the needs are and creating a holistic service that ensures that the impact on health and education do not negatively impact on each other.

However, we must also consider pre-school interventions. Often, services available for parents with small children with special needs are under-developed. It is only perhaps when children become old enough to enter the main stream of schooling that services are in place. Therefore, we also need to consider pre-school support for parents.

Some people, in responding to the report, talked of the need to have more on-site visits by healthcare professionals so as not to disrupt children's education. That should be done as far as possible. That takes us back to the campaign to have a school nurse available to every school in Wales. That campaign, which is currently being run by the Royal College of Nurses, is worthwhile. Every school should have access to a school nurse, and we should ensure that our special schools have that.

In my own constituency again, it is appalling to think that, for many years, Penmaes School—which the Minister has visited on several occasions and knows well—had no access to a school nurse. There were children at that school with complex health needs.

yn ystyried anghenion iechyd arbennig rhai plant yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn falch o nodi bod yr adroddiad hwn yn cyfeirio'n ôl at adroddiad y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, a'i fod yn annog gwaith monitro manylach o ran gweithredu'r argymhellion a wnaed gan y pwyllgor bryd hynny. Yn benodol o ran y byrddau iechyd lleol, mae'n annog y dylid enwebu person mewn swydd uchel i fod yn uniongyrchol gyfrifol am blant a gwasanaethau plant.

Yr wyf yn falch y gallwn, o fewn fy etholaeth i, gyfeirio at arferion da Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Powys a Chyngor Sir Powys, sydd wedi creu penodiad ar y cyd ar gyfer unigolyn sy'n aelod o'r bwrdd iechyd lleol sy'n adolygu ac yn datblygu gwasanaethau plant ledled y cyngor sir a'r bwrdd iechyd lleol. Mae hynny'n gwneud gwahaniaeth, gan nodi lle y mae'r anghenion a chan greu gwasanaeth cyfannol sy'n sicrhau nad yw'r effaith ar iechyd ac addysg yn dylanwadu'n negyddol ar ei gilydd.

Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni ystyried ymyrraeth cyn ysgol hefyd. Yn aml, nid yw gwasanaethau i rieni â phlant ifanc ag anghenion arbennig wedi'u datblygu'n ddigonol. Dim ond pan fydd y plant yn ddigon hen i fynd i ysgol brif ffrwd y bydd gwasanaethau ar gael efallai. Felly, mae angen inni ystyried cymorth cyn ysgol i rieni hefyd.

Siaradodd rhai pobl, wrth ymateb i'r adroddiad, am yr angen i gael mwy o ymweliadau ar y safle gan weithwyr proffesiynol gofal iechyd er mwyn peidio ag amharu ar addysg y plant. Dylid gwneud hyn gymaint â phosibl. Cofiw'n am yr ymgyrch i sicrhau bod nyrs ysgol ar gael i bob ysgol yng Nghymru. Mae'r ymgyrch honno, a redir ar hyn o bryd gan Goleg Brenhinol y Nyrsys, yn werthfawr. Dylai nyrs ysgol fod ar gael i bob ysgol, a dylem sicrhau bod hynny'n wir am ein hysgolion arbennig hefyd.

Yn fy etholaeth i fy hun unwaith eto, mae'n ofnadwy meddwl nad oedd nyrs ysgol ar gael, am flynyddoedd lawer, ar gyfer Ysgol Penmaes—y mae'r Gweinidog wedi ymweld â hi sawl gwaith ac yn gyfarwydd iawn â hi. Yr oedd plant yn yr ysgol honno ag

Often, their schooling was disrupted because their parents had to come in and take them home to attend to their health needs because no healthcare professional was available to that school. That is not acceptable—it is not acceptable for the children and it is not acceptable from a clinical safety point of view, as, sometimes, staff are being asked to do things that they are not qualified to do.

One problem that arises from this is the difficulty in employment terms of where school nurses are placed. Are they employed by the education authority and work to it and therefore sometimes have difficulty being taken seriously by healthcare professionals, or are they employed by the health service, and then sometimes have difficulty in getting into schools and having a room in a school to operate and work? Agenda for Change brings this to the fore. Where do school nurses fit in the Agenda for Change process? We are in danger of losing nurses who would like to work in the school environment because their terms and conditions may be that much less than those who work in an NHS setting. Therefore, when the Minister responds to this report, will she consider how we can address these needs to ensure that our schools that provide education for some of our children with special health needs have the adequate medical and nursing impact in that school?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** I am sorry that I was not at the launch of this report today in Gabalfa—I was on duty at the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee, as I notified the clerk of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee some time ago.

I add my support for the comments made about David Melding's contribution to this work. I always found his comments on the committee's work balanced, objective and constructive.

Our educational system was founded on the basis of delivering free education for all. The benefits of a comprehensive education are

anghenion iechyd cymhleth. Yn aml, amharwyd ar eu haddysg am fod yn rhaid i'w rhieni ddod i'w casglu a mynd â hwy adref er mwyn gofalu am eu hanghenion iechyd gan nad oedd unrhyw weithiwr proffesiynol gofal iechyd ar gael yn yr ysgol honno. Nid yw hynny'n dderbyniol—nid yw'n dderbyniol i'r plant ac nid yw'n dderbyniol o safbwynt diogelwch clinigol, oherwydd, weithiau, gofynnir i staff wneud pethau nad ydynt wedi'u cymhwyso i'w gwneud.

Un broblem sy'n deillio o hyn yw ei bod yn anodd gwybod ble i leoli nyrsys ysgol o ran cyflogaeth. A gânt eu cyflogi gan yr awdurdod addysg ac a ydynt yn atebol iddo ac felly mae'n anodd iddynt deimlo weithiau bod gweithwyr proffesiynol gofal iechyd yn eu cymryd o ddifrif, neu a gânt eu cyflogi gan y gwasanaeth iechyd, ac wedyn cânt anhawster weithiau i fynd i mewn i ysgolion a chael ystafell mewn ysgol lle y gallant weithio? Daw hyn yn amlwg yn sgîl yr Agenda ar gyfer Newid. Beth yw rhan nyrsys ysgol yn y broses Agenda ar gyfer Newid? Yr ydym mewn perygl o golli nyrsys a hoffai weithio mewn ysgolion oherwydd mae'n bosibl y gallai eu telerau a'u hamodau fod yn llawer gwaeth na thelerau ac amodau y rhai sy'n gweithio yn y GIG. Felly, pan fydd y Gweinidog yn ymateb i'r adroddiad hwn, a wnaiff ystyried sut y gallwn ymdrin â'r anghenion hyn er mwyn sicrhau bod gan ein hysgolion sy'n darparu addysg i rai o'n plant ag anghenion iechyd arbennig wasanaeth meddygol a nyrsio digonol?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf nad oeddwn yn bresennol pan lanswyd yr adroddiad hwn heddiw yng Ngabalfa—yr oeddwn ar ddyletswydd ym Mhwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad, a rhoddais wybod i glerc y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes am hynny beth amser yn ôl.

Ategaf innau y sylwadau a wnaed ynghylch cyfraniad David Melding i'r gwaith hwn. Yr oedd ei sylwadau ar waith y pwyllgor yn gytbwys, yn wrthrychol ac yn adeiladol bob amser, yn fy marn i.

Seiliwyd ein system addysg ar yr egwyddor o ddarparu addysg am ddim i bawb. Mae manteision addysg gyfun yn helaeth ac yn

immense and varied. Since the Education Act 1944, successive generations have taken for granted the presence of an education system that will seek to meet their needs, which, by and large, it does extremely well. It is now 2004—the challenges have moved on and the bar has been raised. It is no longer acceptable for those with special educational needs to be treated differently from their fellow pupils. I trust that we all accept this as a universal truth.

However, what has come out clearly from the committee's comprehensive review of early identification and intervention is the need to do more and to do it better. All children have the right to the best possible start in life, and it is clear that the committee's goal, and that of the Welsh Assembly Government, is to improve early identification and effective intervention and support through the educational system in Wales. It is fair to say that, in recent years, the Assembly Government has achieved a great deal in this regard. There has been positive feedback on abolishing league tables and SATs for seven-year-olds. It has been shown that these steps have helped to focus attention on the actual educational needs of children, including those with special needs.

4.00 p.m.

In September, Mark Isherwood and I attended the Special Needs Advisory Project Cymru conference in Mold on behalf of the committee to assist in this review. At the conference, we listened at first hand to the powerful and valuable testimony of young learners with disabilities. It was clear that, in this process, it was crucial that we listen to their concerns and take evidence from them directly. The people whom I met were eager participants who were keen to express their analysis of the system and to prescribe long and short-term solutions. After all, they just want what we take for granted: an education system that includes, and not excludes them, and which views the meeting of their needs as integral to meeting the minimum expectations of a twenty-first century education system. Their needs are special only in that they need additional support. They do not want a special education. Having heard and read all the evidence given to the

amrywiol. Ers Deddf Addysg 1944, mae cenedlaethau olynol wedi cymryd yn ganiataol y bydd system addysg ar gael sy'n ceisio diwallu eu hanghenion, a gwna hynny'n dda iawn, gan amlaf. Yr ydym wedi cyrraedd 2004 erbyn hyn—mae'r heriau wedi newid ac mae'r targed yn uwch. Nid yw'n dderbyniol mwyach i'r rhai ag anghenion addysgol arbennig gael eu trin yn wahanol i'w cyd-ddisgyblion. Hyderaf y bydd pob un ohonom yn derbyn bod hyn yn wir.

Fodd bynnag, yr hyn sy'n amlwg o adolygiad cynhwysfawr y pwyllgor o ran adnabod ac ymyrraeth gynnar yw'r angen i wneud mwy ac i'w wneud yn well. Mae gan bob plentyn yr hawl i'r dechrau gorau posibl mewn bywyd, ac mae'n amlwg mai nod y pwyllgor, a nod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, yw gwella'r broses o adnabod anghenion yn gynnar ac ymyrraeth a chymorth effeithiol drwy'r system addysg yng Nghymru. Mae'n deg dweud bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, wedi gwneud llawer yn hyn o beth. Bu adborth cadarnhaol ar ddileu tablau cynghrair a TASau i blant saith mlwydd oed. Dangoswyd bod y camau hyn wedi helpu i ganolbwyntio ar anghenion addysgol gwirioneddol plant, gan gynnwys y rhai ag anghenion arbennig.

Ym mis Medi, mynychodd Mark Isherwood a minnau gynhadledd Prosiect Cynghori Anghenion Arbennig Cymru yn yr Wyddgrug ar ran y pwyllgor i gynorthwyo'r adolygiad hwn. Yn y gynhadledd, bu inni wrando'n uniongyrchol ar dystiolaeth bwerus a gwerthfawr dysgwyr ifanc ag anabledau. Yr oedd yn amlwg, yn y broses hon, ei bod yn hanfodol inni wrando ar eu pryderon a chymryd tystiolaeth ganddynt yn uniongyrchol. Yr oedd y bobl y cyfarfûm â hwy yn gyfranogwyr brwdfrydig a oedd yn awyddus i gyfleu eu dadansoddiad hwy o'r system ac i roi atebion byrdymor a hirdymor penodol. Wedi'r cyfan, yr unig beth y maent am ei gael yw'r hyn y mae pob un ohonom yn ei gymryd yn ganiataol: system addysg sy'n eu cynnwys, yn hytrach na'u hallgáu, ac sy'n ystyried bod y broses o ddiwallu eu hanghenion yn rhan annatod o'r dasg o fodloni disgygliadau gofynnol system addysg yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Dim ond

committee, and having listened to the views expressed in Mold, it is clear that a collaborative approach is essential if improvements to the mainstreaming of SEN are to occur in the near future. Multi-agency working between national and local health and educational bodies, as well as charities and other groups, is vital. The views of young people and their parents must be at the heart of any reforms, and they should be involved at every stage, national and local, from draft reforms to implementation and review.

Having a children's centre in my constituency, which also gave evidence to this review, and being a governor of Trinity Fields Special School in Ystrad Mynach, I know at first hand of their many roles and the valuable assistance they provide, including an assessment nursery, medical support, therapy, family support and information services and play facilities. They give support to over 800 families living in the Caerphilly borough. The report makes it clear that the difficulties in achieving a correct identification of need as early as possible should not be underestimated. It requires highly skilled, trained and committed staff in a variety of disciplines to be mainstreamed into our early years health and education provision. Estyn has clearly shown how important staff training is in providing effective ways of treating those already identified as needing specialist assistance.

To conclude, I pay tribute to all parties involved in stage 1 of the committee's work on special educational needs for their hard work. I look forward to beginning stage 2 of the committee's work early next year.

**David Davies:** I will probably not have all sorts of compliments for the conciliatory nature of my speeches. Nevertheless, I have two main points to mention on this matter. Despite all the previous comments, the document is not entirely good news. It contains much that we must focus and act

yn yr ystyr bod angen cymorth arbennig arnynt y mae eu hanghenion yn arbennig. Nid ydynt am gael addysg arbennig. Ar ôl clywed a darllen yr holl dystiolaeth a roddwyd i'r pwyllgor, ac ar ôl gwranddo ar y sylwadau a gynigwyd yn yr Wyddgrug, mae'n amlwg bod ymagwedd gydweithredol yn hanfodol er mwyn sicrhau gwelliannau i'r broses o brif ffrydio AAA yn y dyfodol agos. Mae gwaith amlasiantaeth rhwng cyrff cenedlaethol a lleol ym meysydd iechyd ac addysg, yn ogystal ag elusennau a grwpiau eraill, yn hanfodol. Rhaid sicrhau mai barn pobl ifanc a'u rhieni sydd wrth wraidd unrhyw ddiwygiadau, a dylid eu cynnwys ar bob cam, yn genedlaethol ac yn lleol, o'r diwygiadau drafft i'r broses weithredu ac adolygu.

Am fod canolfan i blant yn fy etholaeth i, a roddodd dystiolaeth i'r adolygiad hwn hefyd, ac am fy mod yn llywodraethwr Ysgol Arbennig Trinity Fields yn Ystrad Mynach, gwn yn uniongyrchol am eu rolau niferus a'r cymorth gwerthfawr a roddant, gan gynnwys meithrinfa asesu, cymorth meddygol, therapi, gwasanaethau cymorth a gwybodaeth i deuluoedd a chyfleusterau chwarae. Rhoddant gymorth i dros 800 o deuluoedd sy'n byw ym mwrdeistref Caerffili. Mae'r adroddiad yn egluro na ddylid tanbriso'r anawsterau a geir i adnabod angen yn gywir cyn gynted â phosibl. Mae angen prif ffrydio staff medrus iawn, hyfforddedig ac ymrwymedig mewn amrywiaeth o ddisgyblaethau yn ein darpariaeth iechyd ac addysg i'r blynyddoedd cynnar. Mae Estyn wedi dangos yn glir pa mor bwysig yw hyfforddiant staff i ddarparu ffyrdd effeithiol o drin y rhai y nodwyd eisoes bod angen cymorth arbenigol arnynt.

I gloi, talaf deyrnged i bawb a fu'n gysylltiedig â cham 1 gwaith y pwyllgor ar anghenion addysgol arbennig am eu gwaith caled. Edrychaf ymlaen at ddechrau cam 2 gwaith y pwyllgor ar ddechrau'r flwyddyn nesaf.

**David Davies:** Mae'n debyg na fydd pobl yn fy nghanmol i am natur gymodol fy areithiau. Serch hynny, mae dau brif bwynt gennyf ar y mater hwn. Er gwaethaf yr holl sylwadau blaenorol, nid yw'r ddogfen yn newyddion da yn gyfan gwbl. Mae'n cynnwys llawer y mae'n rhaid inni ganolbwyntio arno a

upon. The first issue has already been mentioned, namely the dire shortage of speech and language therapists. I cannot be the only Member to have people coming to my surgery to complain about long waiting times. People are waiting up to two years because of an estimated shortage of up to 400 speech and language therapists. It is obvious that, for those in need of speech therapy, the earlier it is given, the more effective it will be, and failure to provide an adequate number of speech and language therapists could hold children back for many years. It is not me or the committee saying this; 'An Urgent Need for Speech Therapists' was the headline of a press release issued by Blaenau Gwent council. The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning would agree that Blaenau Gwent County Borough Council is not known for its anti-Labour sentiment.

It is true that speech therapists cannot be trained overnight, as the document says, but the Assembly has had nearly six years to do something about this. Instead of delivery on what many people are in desperate need of, we get expensive headline-grabbing gimmicks, such as for free school breakfasts. It is high time that the Government got to grips with this problem and realised that, although speech and language therapy does not grab headlines, for those people in need of it, it is important, and we should do something about it.

The second point is on another group of children who face difficulties in accessing the care that they need, namely those who, to use a wonderful phrase, 'display signs of challenging behaviour'. There are simpler, more straightforward phrases for that condition. It is easy to have less sympathy for this group of individuals. For the sake of those who have not been trained in civil-service speak, I am talking about those who are badly behaved.

These individuals also need help. I am not quite the right-wing extremist that people like to portray me as. I have a special referral school in my constituency, which I have visited. I am fully aware that many of the people to whom I refer have developed these patterns of behaviour because of issues in

gweithredu arno. Cyfeiriwyd at y prif fater eisoes, sef prinder mawr therapyddion lleferydd ac iaith. Mae'n siŵr nad fi yw'r unig Aelod sy'n gorfod wynebu pobl yn dod i mewn i'w gynghorfa i gwyno am amseroedd aros hir. Mae pobl yn aros hyd at ddwy flynedd oherwydd prinder amcangyfrifedig o hyd at 400 o therapyddion lleferydd ac iaith. Mae'n amlwg, i'r rhai y mae angen therapi lleferydd arnynt, po gynharaf y'i rhoddir, y mwyaf effeithiol y bydd, a gallai methiant i ddarparu nifer ddigonol o therapyddion lleferydd ac iaith atal datblygiad plant am sawl blwyddyn. Nid fi na'r pwyllgor sy'n dweud hyn; angen dybryd am therapyddion lleferydd oedd pennawd datganiad i'r wasg a gyhoeddwyd gan gyngor Blaenau Gwent. Byddai'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn cytuno nad yw Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Blaenau Gwent yn enwog am ei deimladau gwrth-Lafur.

Mae'n wir na ellir hyfforddi therapyddion lleferydd dros nos, fel y dywed y ddogfen, ond mae'r Cynulliad wedi cael bron chwe blynedd i wneud rhywbeth am hyn. Yn lle cyflawni'r hyn y mae angen dybryd ar lawer o bobl amdano, cawn gimigau costus sy'n cael llawer o sylw yn y cyfryngau, megis brechwast am ddim yn yr ysgol. Mae'n hen bryd i'r Llywodraeth fynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon a sylweddoli, er nad yw therapi lleferydd ac iaith yn cael llawer o sylw, ei fod yn bwysig i'r bobl sydd ei angen, a dylem wneud rhywbeth amdano.

Mae'r ail bwynt yn ymwneud â grŵp arall o blant sy'n cael anhawster i gael y gofal sydd ei angen arnynt, sef y rhai sydd, a defnyddio ymadrodd gwyach, 'yn dangos arwyddion o ymddygiad heriol'. Mae ymadroddion symlach i ddisgrifio'r cyflwr hwnnw. Mae'n hawdd cael llai o gydymdeimlad i'r grŵp hwn o unigolion. Er lles y rhai nad ydynt yn gyfarwydd ag iaith y gwasanaeth sifil, yr wyf yn siarad am y rhai sy'n ymddwyn yn wael.

Mae angen help ar yr unigolion hyn hefyd. Nid wyf hanner mor asgell dde ag y mae pobl yn hoffi honni. Mae ysgol gyfeirio arbennig yn fy etholaeth i, yr wyf wedi ymweld â hi. Yr wyf yn gwbl ymwybodol bod llawer o'r bobl y cyfeiriaf atynt wedi datblygu'r patrymau ymddygiad hyn oherwydd

their home lives, through no fault of their own. Be that as it may, for their own sake and for the sake of those who have to share their classrooms—both teachers and pupils—it is important that they receive the specialist care that they need. The Government tries to keep them in mainstream education as much as it possibly can. It tries to justify this on the basis of human rights and the importance of not segregating these people. The reality is that it is down to money. Places in specialist behavioural units are expensive—up to £30,000 a year, I have been told.

Instead of spending the money, the Government is making it harder to remove violent and disruptive pupils from mainstream classrooms. As a result, innocent pupils face disruption in their learning and teachers face a real risk of assault. Across the United Kingdom, a teacher is assaulted, on average, once every seven minutes. This means that by the time that this debate is finished, eight or nine teachers will have been violently assaulted by their pupils. It is not a laughing matter.

Labour claims to be the party which speaks for the disadvantaged, yet, as this report shows, it has failed to do so. The disadvantage has worsened for those with special needs, and for those without.

We need to create an education system based around the needs of the child. This is not about being child-centred; it is about giving children the type of schooling that they require, rather than basing it on the needs of the local education authority. We need to create specialist schools for those with academic and sporting abilities, as has been mentioned, as well as for those with a variety of other special needs addressed in this report. The only way to achieve that is by having a change of Government both in Westminster and in Cardiff. Next May we will have a chance to make a start.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Diolch am y cyfle i siarad ar y mater pwysig hwn.

I am not a member of this committee but take

problemau yn eu bywydau gartref, ac nid eu bai hwy yw hynny. Serch hynny, er eu lles hwy eu hunain ac er lles y rhai sy'n gorfod rhannu eu hystafelloedd dosbarth—athrawon a disgyblion—mae'n bwysig eu bod yn cael y gofal arbenigol sydd ei angen arnynt. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn ceisio eu cadw mewn addysg brif ffrwd gymaint ag y gall. Mae'n ceisio cyfiawnhau hyn ar sail hawliau dynol a phwysigrwydd peidio â gwahanu pobl. Y realiti yw bod a wnelo hyn ag arian. Mae lleoedd mewn unedau ymddygiadol arbenigol yn gostus—hyd at £30,000 y flwyddyn, yn ôl yr hyn a ddywedwyd wrthyf.

Yn lle gwario'r arian, mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei gwneud yn anos symud disgyblion treisgar ac aflonyddgar o ystafelloedd dosbarth prif ffrwd. O ganlyniad, amherir ar addysg disgyblion diniwed ac mae athrawon yn wynebu'r risg wirioneddol o ymosodiad. Ledled y Deyrnas Unedig, ymosodir ar athro, ar gyfartaledd, unwaith bob saith munud. Golyga hyn y bydd wyth neu naw disgybl wedi ymosod yn dreisgar ar eu hathrawon erbyn i'r ddadl hon ddod i ben. Mae hynny'n ddifrifol iawn.

Mae Llafur yn honni mai hi yw'r blaid sy'n siarad ar ran pobl ddifreintiedig, ond, fel y dengys yr adroddiad hwn, nid yw wedi gwneud hynny. Mae'r anfantais wedi gwaethygu i'r rhai ag anghenion arbennig, ac i'r rhai heb anghenion arbennig.

Mae angen inni greu system addysg sy'n seiliedig ar anghenion y plentyn. Nid oes a wnelo hyn â chanolbwyntio ar y plentyn; mae a wnelo â rhoi'r math o addysg sydd ei hangen ar y plentyn, yn hytrach na'i seilio ar anghenion yr awdurdod addysg lleol. Mae angen inni greu ysgolion arbenigol i'r rhai â galluoedd academaidd a galluoedd ym maes chwaraeon, fel y crybwyllwyd, yn ogystal â'r rhai ag amrywiaeth o anghenion arbennig eraill yr ymdriniwyd â hwy yn yr adroddiad hwn. Yr unig ffordd o gyflawni hynny yw drwy newid y Llywodraeth yn San Steffan ac yng Nghaerdydd. Cawn gyfle i ddechrau ar y gwaith hwnnw fis Mai nesaf.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Thank you for the opportunity to speak on this important issue.

Nid wyf yn aelod o'r pwyllgor hwn ond mae

a keen interest in these issues, following my previous challenging experience of dealing with disaffected children aged 14 to 16 across north-east Wales, many of whom had special educational needs and extreme behavioural problems.

I welcome these recommendations and the committee's positive work under Peter Black's steady chairmanship. I also take this opportunity to commend SEN staff across Wales who conscientiously struggle to cope with their heavy workloads, usually with limited resources and support. These teachers are often regarded as providing a cinderella education service. They will especially welcome recommendation 4.10 regarding the commissioning of an audit of SEN provision across Wales.

Early intervention through early identification is generally believed to be vital in addressing the special educational needs of children and young people. I also commend recommendation 4.4, which gives particular attention to the need for all newly-qualified teachers to have a better understanding of special educational needs, particularly techniques for early identification.

Recommendation 4.6, on the guidance to teacher training colleges to improve initial teacher training in the identification of children and young people with special educational needs, is also to be commended.

Hefyd, croesawaf argymhelliad 3.66 ynghylch gwell darpariaeth Gymraeg a dwyieithrwydd. Gobeithiaf, Weinidog, y bydd hyn hefyd yn cynnwys amlieithrwydd ledled Cymru. Anwastad ac amrywiol yw'r ddarpariaeth bresennol ac mae'n hen bryd i ni ei gwella. Diolchaf am gefnogaeth Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg ar yr iaith, gan fod hynny'n hanfodol.

We now look forward to the Minister's early action and sufficient funding to carry out these admirable recommendations.

**Owen John Thomas:** Yr wyf yn ymateb i'r adroddiad hwn yn bennaf yn rhinwedd fy swydd fel llefarydd fy mhlaidd ar y Gymraeg. Soniodd David am ymgyrch hir. Ddeng

diddordeb brwd gennyf yn y materion hyn, yn dilyn fy mhrofiad heriol blaenorol o ddelio â phlant wedi'u ymddieithrio rhwng 14 a 16 oed ledled y Gogledd-ddwyrain, yr oedd gan lawer ohonynt anghenion addysgol arbennig a phroblemau ymddygiad difrifol.

Croesawaf yr argymhellion hyn a gwaith cadarnhaol y pwyllgor o dan gadeiryddiaeth gadarn Peter Black. Achubaf ar y cyfle hwn hefyd i gymeradwyo staff AAA ledled Cymru sy'n ymdrechu'n galed i ymdopi â'u llwyth gwaith trwm, fel arfer heb lawer o adnoddau a chymorth. Yn aml, ystyrir bod yr athrawon hyn yn darparu gwasanaeth addysg sinderela. Byddant yn croesawu argymhelliad 4.10 yn arbennig ynghylch comisiynu archwiliad o ddarpariaeth AAA ledled Cymru.

Credir yn gyffredinol fod ymyrraeth gynnar drwy adnabod anghenion yn gynnar yn hollbwysig i ymdrin ag anghenion addysgol arbennig plant a phobl ifanc. Cymeradwyaf argymhelliad 4.4 hefyd, sy'n rhoi sylw arbennig i'r angen i athrawon newydd gymhwyso ddeall anghenion addysgol arbennig yn well, yn arbennig technegau i adnabod anghenion yn gynnar.

Dylid cymeradwyo argymhelliad 4.6 hefyd ar y canllawiau i golegau hyfforddi athrawon i wella hyfforddiant cychwynnol athrawon o ran adnabod plant a phobl ifanc ag anghenion addysgol arbennig.

I also welcome recommendation 3.66 regarding improved Welsh-medium and bilingual provision. I hope, Minister, that this will also include multilingualism across Wales. The provision is sketchy at present and it is high time we improved it. I thank the Welsh Language Board for its support on the Welsh language, as that is essential.

Edrychwn ymlaen yn awr at weld y Gweinidog yn gweithredu ar unwaith ac at gael digon o arian i roi'r argymhellion clodwiw hyn ar waith.

**Owen John Thomas:** I respond to this report mainly in my capacity as my party's spokesperson on the Welsh language. David mentioned a long campaign. Thirty years ago,



mlynedd ar hugain yn ôl, daeth gwraig o'r ysgol feithrin yn Sblot, yng Nghaerdydd ataf. Yr oedd nam ar leferydd ei phlentyn.

I remember being approached by a woman from the Welsh-medium nursery school in Splott, Cardiff. Her child had a speech impediment.

4.10 p.m.

Fodd bynnag, nid oedd therapydd lleferydd oedd yn siarad Cymraeg ar gael i helpu'r bachgen. Awgrymodd ei feddyg y dylid symud y bachgen i ysgol cyfrwng Saesneg gan bod nam ar ei leferydd. Cymraes oedd y fam a Chymraeg oedd unig iaith y bachgen, oedd yn dair oed. Yr oedd y Swyddfa Gymreig yn bodoli bryd hynny, ac yr oedd yn ymwybodol o'r broblem hon a rhai tebyg. Pa bwyslais a roddodd parc Cathays ar ddarpariaethau anghenion addysgol arbennig drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg rhwng 1975 a 2004? Y nesaf peth i ddim yn fy marn i.

However, no Welsh-speaking therapists were available to help the boy. His doctor suggested that he be moved to an English-medium school because of his speech impediment. His mother was a Welsh-speaker and her son, who was only three years old, only spoke Welsh. The Welsh Office had been established by that time, and it was aware of this problem and other similar problems. How much emphasis did Cathays park place on Welsh-medium SEN provision between 1975 and 2004? Virtually none, I would suggest.

Dyma a ddywedodd Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn ei ymateb i'r adroddiad a lansiwyd heddiw:

This is what the Chair of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee said in his response to the report launched today:

'The scarcity of speech therapists is especially acute for Welsh speakers and those whose first language is Welsh'.

Mae prinder mawr o therapyddion lleferydd i'r rhai sy'n siarad Cymraeg a'r rhai y mae Cymraeg yn iaith gyntaf iddynt.

Yn ein prifddinas, sydd â phoblogaeth o oddeutu 320,000 o bobl, 13 o ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg a dros 25 o gylchoedd meithrin a grwpiau Ti a Fi i blant ifanc, mae'r galw am wasanaethau therapi lleferydd cyfrwng Cymraeg yn amlwg. Nid yw'n anodd denu pobl broffesiynol i fyw yng Nghaerdydd. Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhaid i blant aros am flwyddyn cyn cael therapi lleferydd drwy gyfrwng y Saesneg ac nid oes darpariaeth ar gael yn Gymraeg. Mae'r broblem o ddiffyg therapyddion yn gyffredin ar draws Cymru gyfan. Dywedodd 74 y cant o ysgolion a ymatebodd i ymgynghoriad y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes bod problemau wrth geisio canfod yn gynnar a oes gan blant a phobl ifanc sy'n siarad Cymraeg neu iaith arall ar wahân i Saesneg fel eu hiaith gyntaf anghenion addysgol arbennig.

In our capital city, which has a population of around 320,000 people, and 13 Welsh-medium schools and over 25 cylchoedd meithrin and Ti a Fi groups for young children, the demand for Welsh-medium speech therapy is evident. It is not difficult to attract professional people to live in Cardiff. However, children must wait for a year before receiving speech therapy through the medium of English and there is no Welsh-medium provision. The problem of a shortage of therapists is common across Wales: 74 per cent of the schools that responded to the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee's review stated that there are problems regarding early identification of special educational needs among children and young people who speak Welsh or another language other than English as their first language.

Wrth ystyried y cynnydd sylweddol a fu yn y nifer a'r canran o blant sydd naill ai'n mynychu ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg neu'n dod o gartrefi lle siaredir ieithoedd eraill ar wahân i Gymraeg neu Saesneg, rhaid gofyn,

In considering the significant increase in the number and percentage of children who attend Welsh-medium schools or come from homes where languages other than English or Welsh are spoken, we must ask, in the years

yn y blynyddoedd cyn sefydlu'r Cynulliad ac ers hynny, beth fu'r rhai ym mharc Cathays sy'n gyfrifol am addysg yn ei wneud ynghylch y broblem hon a sawl problem arall sy'n ymwneud â'r iaith Gymraeg? Mae hon yn hen broblem. Diolch byth bod gennym Gynulliad Cenedlaethol o'r diwedd i ddechrau cywiro blynyddoedd o esgeulustod. Fodd bynnag, cefais fy siomi gan y cyhoeddiad y bydd cwtogiad o £17.6 miliwn yng nghynigion y gyllideb derfynol ar gyfer y tair blynedd nesaf. Gobeithiaf na fydd y broblem sylweddol o ddiffyg darpariaeth yn parhau.

Croesawaf yr adroddiad manwl hwn, yn arbennig argymhelliad 3.69, sy'n galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i gyhoeddi amserlen ar gyfer cyflawni argymhelliad Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg i wella gwasanaethau cyfrwng Cymraeg i blant a phobl ifanc ag anghenion addysgol arbennig. Croesawaf hefyd brif amcan yr adroddiad sef yr angen i ganfod anghenion addysgol arbennig yn gynnar ac i ymyrryd yn gynnar er mwyn eu trin yn fwy effeithiol.

**Mark Isherwood:** I am the proud father of a brilliant and gifted son with speech and language problems.

I welcome this consensual report, which proposes joint commissioning and collaborative initiatives between local health boards and local authorities. As the committee heard during its evidence-taking session in north Wales, there is currently no thorough or joined-up assessments of children's individual needs. We were also told that there is confusion regarding who has prime responsibility for speech and language therapy, and that intervention must involve multi-agency working between social services, the police, parents, and the health and education sector. As the headteacher of Meadowbank School, to whom I referred earlier, said at the Afasic Cymru inaugural conference last month:

'we have a long way to go in terms of inclusive joint working at the top'.

The working days and holidays of teachers and therapists must be synchronised as a short-term measure, as the report states. As

before the Assembly was established and since then, what did those in Cathays park responsible for education do to solve this problem and others concerning the Welsh language? This is an old problem. Thank goodness that we now have a National Assembly at last to begin to put right the years of neglect. However, I was disappointed to hear the announcement that there will be a reduction of £17.6 million in the final budget proposals for the next three years. I hope that the grave problem of lack of provision will not continue.

I welcome this detailed report, particularly recommendation 3.69, which calls on the Assembly Government to publish a timetable for fulfilling the Welsh Language Board's recommendation on improving Welsh-medium provision for children and young people with special educational needs. I also welcome the report's main aim, which is to secure early identification and intervention in terms of SEN in order to ensure effective treatment.

**Mark Isherwood:** Yr wyf yn falch o fod yn dad i fachgen disglair a dawnus sydd â phroblemau lleferydd ac iaith.

Croesawaf yr adroddiad cydsyniol hwn, sy'n cynnig gwaith comisiynu ar y cyd a mentrau cydweithredol rhwng byrddau iechyd lleol ac awdurdodau lleol. Fel y clywodd y pwyllgor yn ystod ei sesiwn cymryd tystiolaeth yn y Gogledd, nid oes asesiadau trylwyr na chydgyssylltiedig o anghenion unigol plant ar hyn o bryd. Dywedwyd wrthym hefyd bod dryswch ynghylch pwy sy'n bennaf cyfrifol am therapi lleferydd ac iaith, a bod yn rhaid i'r ymyrraeth gynnwys gwaith amlasiantaeth rhwng gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, yr heddlu, rhieni, a'r sector iechyd ac addysg. Fel y dywedodd pennaeth Ysgol Meadowbank, y cyfeiriais ati yn gynharach, yng nghynhadledd gyntaf Afasic Cymru fis diwethaf:

mae gennym lawer i'w wneud o ran cydweithio cynhwysol ar y brig.

Rhaid cydamseru dyddiau gwaith a gwyliau athrawon a therapyddion fel mesur byrdymor, fel y noda'r adroddiad. Fel y clywsom yn y

we heard in north Wales, everyone supports inclusive education, but teaching staff do not always have the skills required. Therefore, training is needed as a priority. Consequently, there has been widespread concern regarding cuts in teacher training budgets. Therefore, recommendations 4.6 and 4.18 are vital. Teacher training colleges must provide improved initial teacher training on the identification of children and young people with special education needs, and there must be more advanced courses for those who wish to specialise in special educational needs.

As we heard, there is some concern in north Wales that special educational needs is only a bolt-on to teacher training; there is no specific special educational needs training for teachers. That point was brought home to me strongly during visits to special schools, where the practical consequences are now being confronted. Equally, continuous professional development in the identification of special educational needs will be crucial, and bursaries would be a step in the right direction. However, as SNAP Cymru emphasised this morning, continuous professional development must be provided at the appropriate level for all who work in schools, be they teachers or canteen staff.

Recommendation 4.15 is crucial. The Welsh Assembly Government must change the formula that is used to allocate special educational needs funding to local education authorities, so that it is based on a local and regional audit of need, rather than merely on where a child happens to live. As we heard from the spokesmen for Flintshire and Wrexham local education authorities in north Wales, we need national standards of need and provision for the identification of special educational needs. As was asked, why does a child in one part of the country receive significantly less funding than a child with the same needs elsewhere? Equally, as the local education authorities that I have spoken to have emphasised, we must move to provide special educational needs services on an efficient and cost-effective regional basis. It must be based on regional needs and delivered through regional collaboration.

Gogledd, mae pawb yn cefnogi addysg gynhwysol, ond nid oes gan staff addysgu y sgiliau sydd eu hangen bob amser. Felly, mae angen hyfforddiant fel blaenoriaeth. O ganlyniad, bu pryder cyffredinol ynghylch toriadau yng nghyllidebau hyfforddiant athrawon. Felly, mae argymhellion 4.6 a 4.18 yn hanfodol. Rhaid i golegau hyfforddi athrawon ddarparu hyfforddiant cychwynnol gwell i athrawon ar adnabod plant a phobl ifanc sydd ag anghenion addysgol arbennig, a rhaid trefnu cyrsiau uwch i'r rhai sydd am arbenigo ym maes anghenion addysgol arbennig.

Fel y clywsom, mae rhywfaint o bryder yn y Gogledd mai dim ond rhan fach atodol o hyfforddiant athrawon yw anghenion addysgol arbennig; nid oes hyfforddiant anghenion addysgol arbennig penodol i athrawon. Fe'm gwnaed yn ymwybodol iawn o hynny yn ystod ymweliadau ag ysgolion arbennig, lle y wynebier y canlyniadau ymarferol bellach. Yn yr un modd, bydd datblygiad proffesiynol parhaus ym maes adnabod anghenion addysgol arbennig yn hanfodol, a byddai bwrsariau yn gam i'r cyfeiriad cywir. Fodd bynnag, fel y pwysleisiodd SNAP Cymru y bore yma, rhaid darparu datblygiad proffesiynol parhaus ar y lefel briodol i bawb sy'n gweithio mewn ysgolion, pa un a ydynt yn athrawon neu'n staff y ffreutur.

Mae argymhelliad 4.15 yn hollbwysig. Rhaid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru newid y fformiwla a ddefnyddir i ddyrannu cyllid anghenion addysgol arbennig i awdurdodau addysg lleol, fel ei bod yn seiliedig ar archwiliad lleol a rhanbarthol o angen, yn hytrach na ble y mae'r plentyn yn byw yn unig. Fel y clywsom gan lefarwyr awdurdodau addysg lleol sir y Fflint a Wrecsam yn y Gogledd, mae angen safonau cenedlaethol arnom o ran angen a darpariaeth ar gyfer adnabod anghenion addysgol arbennig. Fel y gofynnwyd, pam mae plentyn mewn un rhan o'r wlad yn cael llawer llai o arian na plentyn gyda'r un anghenion rywle arall? Yn yr un modd, fel y mae'r awdurdodau addysg lleol yr wyf wedi siarad â hwy wedi pwysleisio, rhaid inni symud tuag at ddarparu gwasanaethau anghenion addysgol arbennig yn rhanbarthol mewn ffordd effeithlon a chost-effeithiol. Rhaid i'r

Recommendation 4.5 is therefore welcome. Training for speech and language therapists must also be accessible regionally, if the shortage in this essential provision is to be addressed by second-career entrants, currently frustrated only by geography.

Recommendation 4.11 welcomes the move to special needs provision in a mainstream setting, but, as the headteacher of Ysgol y Drindod told me, we must remember that inclusion is not political correctness, but what is appropriate for the child. As the headteacher of St Christopher's Special School in Wrexham told me, her school takes those who do not fit in. Inclusion must be on a continuum, and we must focus on individual needs and pathways for young people with special educational needs. A special school or a mainstream school with a language centre is a school with a vital difference. In her speech at the Afasic Cymru conference, the headteacher of Meadowbank School explained that mainstream schools provide standardised approaches to teaching and learning in an inclusive setting, but have limited special educational need therapy or other input, whereas special schools have an absolute capacity to dovetail therapy, and teaching and learning, and so provide for socially vulnerable children who are unable to access them in a mainstream setting. She also promoted the role of special schools as community resources and good practice models. Her school sends specialist teams into mainstream schools to identify children with special educational needs in early years settings, provides day classes for mainstream children, and undertakes joint training with mainstream staff.

In England, Ofsted has recognised that inclusion is not working properly and that pupils with complex learning difficulties have different needs from mainstream pupils. The Welsh Assembly Government must therefore reject a system that simply relegates these individuals to years of frustration,

ddarpariaeth fod yn seiliedig ar anghenion rhanbarthol ac wedi'i chyflwyno drwy gydweithredu rhanbarthol. Felly croesewir argymhelliad 4.5. Rhaid i hyfforddiant i therapyddion lleferydd ac iaith fod ar gael yn rhanbarthol hefyd, er mwyn mynd i'r afael â'r prinder yn y ddarpariaeth hanfodol hon drwy dderbyn pobl sy'n dewis hyn fel eu hail yrfa. Dim ond daearyddiaeth sy'n llesteirio hyn ar hyn o bryd.

Mae argymhelliad 4.11 yn croesawu'r cam tuag at gyflwyno darpariaeth anghenion arbennig mewn lleoliad prif ffrwd, ond, fel y dywedodd pennaeth Ysgol y Drindod wrthyf, rhaid inni gofio nad cywirdeb gwleidyddol yw cynhwysiant, ond yr hyn sy'n briodol i'r plentyn. Fel y dywedodd pennaeth Ysgol Arbennig Sant Christopher yn Wrecsam wrthyf, mae ei hysgol yn derbyn y disgyblion hynny nad oes lle addas iddynt yn rhywle arall. Rhaid sicrhau bod cynhwysiant yn gontinwrm, a rhaid inni ganolbwyntio ar anghenion a llwybrau unigol i bobl ifanc ag anghenion addysgol arbennig. Mae ysgol arbennig neu ysgol brif ffrwd gyda chanolfan iaith yn ysgol gyda gwahaniaeth pwysig. Yn ei haraith yng nghynhadledd Afasic Cymru, eglurodd pennaeth Ysgol Meadowbank fod ysgolion prif ffrwd yn darparu dulliau safonol o addysgu a dysgu mewn lleoliad cynhwysol, ond prin yw'r therapi o ran anghenion addysgol arbennig neu unrhyw gyfraniad arall. Ar y llaw arall, gall ysgolion arbennig gydblythu therapi a'r addysgu a'r dysgu, gan ddarparu ar gyfer plant cymdeithasol ddiamddiffyn na allant fanteisio arnynt mewn lleoliad prif ffrwd. Yn ogystal, hyrwyddodd rôl ysgolion arbennig hefyd fel adnoddau cymunedol a modelau o arferion da. Mae ei hysgol yn anfon timau arbenigol i ysgolion prif ffrwd i adnabod plant ag anghenion addysgol arbennig mewn lleoliadau blynyddoedd cynnar, yn darparu dosbarthiadau dydd i blant mewn ysgolion prif ffrwd, ac yn cynnal hyfforddiant ar y cyd gyda'r staff prif ffrwd.

Yn Lloegr, mae Ofsted wedi cydnabod nad yw cynhwysiant yn gweithio'n gywir a bod gan ddisgyblion ag anawsterau dysgu cymhleth anghenion gwahanol i ddisgyblion prif ffrwd. Felly rhaid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wrthod system sy'n golygu bod yr unigolion hyn yn wynebu

anxiety and failure. It comes as no surprise that the number of individuals in England who are sent to referral units, which deal with disruptive students, jumped by 25 per cent between 2001 and 2003. Neither is it astonishing to realise that a high percentage of individuals currently languishing in prison and young offender institutions have learning difficulties. Many of these vulnerable youngsters have been let down by a system that simply did not have the expertise or the resources to meet their special needs. The failure to intervene early on can lead to the permanent exclusion of people from society. Therefore, I appeal to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to make this her priority and, on this occasion, to put preparation, planning and procedure before policy launch.

**Peter Black:** I should have dealt with apologies for this morning's launch at the beginning of the debate; I know that many committee members were unavoidably detained in other committees, and, in reading out the names of those who were present, I did not mean to spite those who were unable to attend because of other duties.

4.20 p.m.

I thank all those who contributed to the debate today. Their contributions have underlined the importance of this subject to the Assembly's education agenda. This report has attracted a great deal of media interest and, as a result, my office has already received calls from people across Wales seeking information on and assistance with SEN issues. If anything, these calls underline our emphasis on communication and interaction with parents and carers, so as to involve them directly and early in the education of their children. Many cases highlight the confusion that can sometimes exist as to whom is responsible for the delivery of care and support. Our recommendations for a one-stop shop, multi-agency working and the training of more therapists will hopefully enable the Government to tackle these problems. The funding of an independent advocacy service, as Janet Ryder mentioned, is also crucial.

blynyddoedd o rwystredigaeth, pryder a methiant. Nid yw'n syndod i nifer yr unigolion yn Lloegr a anfonir i unedau cyfeirio, sy'n ymdrin â myfyrwyr aflonyddgar, gynyddu 25 y cant rhwng 2001 a 2003. Nid yw'n syndod ychwaith fod gan ganran fawr o'r unigolion sydd mewn carchardai a sefydliadau i droseddwr ifanc ar hyn o bryd anawsterau dysgu. Mae'r system wedi siomi llawer o'r bobl ifanc ddiameddiffyn hyn am nad oedd ganddi'r arbenigedd na'r adnoddau i ddiwallu eu hanghenion arbennig. Gall methiant i ymyrryd yn gynnwys olygu y caiff pobl eu hallgáu'n barhaol o gymdeithas. Felly, apelïaf ar y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i roi blaenoriaeth i hyn, a'r tro hwn, i sicrhau bod gwaith paratoi, cynllunio a gweithdrefn yn bwysicach na'r gwaith o lansio polisi.

**Peter Black:** Dylwn fod wedi ymdrin â'r ymddiheuriadau ar gyfer lansiad y bore yma ar ddechrau'r ddadl; gwn fod llawer o aelodau'r pwyllgor yn methu bod yn bresennol am fod yn rhaid iddynt fynychu cyfarfodydd pwyllgorau eraill, ac, wrth ddarllen enwau'r rhai a oedd yn bresennol, nid fy mwriad oedd digio'r rhai na allent fod yn bresennol oherwydd dyletswyddau eraill.

Diolchaf i bawb a gyfrannodd at y ddadl heddiw. Mae eu cyfraniadau wedi tanlinellu pwysigrwydd y pwnc hwn o ran agenda addysg y Cynulliad. Mae'r adroddiad hwn wedi denu llawer o sylw yn y cyfryngau ac, o ganlyniad, mae fy swyddfa eisoes wedi cael galwadau gan bobl ledled Cymru yn gofyn am wybodaeth a chymorth ar faterion AAA. Os rhywbeth, mae'r galwadau hyn yn tanlinellu ein pwyslais ar gyfathrebu a rhyngweithio â rhieni a gofalwyr, er mwyn eu cynnwys yn uniongyrchol ac yn gynnwys yn addysg eu plant. Mae llawer o achosion yn amlygu'r dryswch a all fodoli weithiau o ran pwy sy'n gyfrifol am ddarparu gofal a chymorth. Gobeithiaf y bydd ein hargymhellion ar gyfer siop un stop, gwaith amlasiantaeth a'n hargymhelliad i hyfforddi mwy o therapyddion yn galluogi'r Llywodraeth i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau hyn. Mae'n hanfodol ariannu gwasanaeth eiriolaeth annibynnol hefyd, fel y

crybwyllodd Janet Ryder.

David Melding referred to the need for collaboration between local councils in the commissioning of regional services. We have embraced this measure enthusiastically. We have advocated greater joint commissioning of services, so as to address a number of issues faced by parents and carers. Janet Ryder referred to the SEN budget. The committee would expect the Minister, in implementing the recommendations, to ensure that adequate funding is made available, particularly where we encourage collaboration and joint working and where schemes may require pump-priming. In some cases, this may involve better targeting of existing resources. However, in general, I would expect an uplift in the money available to deliver the report's recommendations.

Kirsty Williams and David Melding referred to the close links between health and education. I was pleased to include the Chair of the Health and Social Services Committee in our deliberations and to cross-reference the report with that committee's earlier report on children with special health needs. The cross-cutting nature of this report is underlined by the fact that we want Jane Davidson and Jane Hutt to respond jointly to our recommendations.

Jeff Cuthbert referred to the long-standing efforts of local and national government to integrate children with special educational needs into mainstream education. This is recognised in the report and forms part of the premise with which we started our review. Jeff also referred to smarter working, and I am sure that the committee would endorse this sentiment.

Effective training and early identification is vital if we are to intervene at an appropriate time in providing for children with special needs. This is why the report focuses on teacher training, continuous improvement and bursaries. Several Members referred to these recommendations, which I re-emphasise for the Minister's attention.

Cyfeiriodd David Melding at yr angen am gydweithredu rhwng cynghorau lleol wrth gomisiynu gwasanaethau rhanbarthol. Yr ydym wedi croesawu'r mesur hwn gyda brwdfrydedd. Yr ydym wedi cefnogi mwy o waith comisiynu ar y cyd o wasanaethau, er mwyn ymdrin â nifer o faterion a wynebir gan rieni a gofalwyr. Cyfeiriodd Janet Ryder at y gyllideb AAA. Byddai'r pwyllgor yn disgwyl i'r Gweinidog, wrth weithredu'r argymhellion, sicrhau y neilltuir digon o arian, yn arbennig pan fyddwn yn annog cydweithredu a chydweithio a lle y gallai fod angen arian ysgogi ar gynlluniau. Mewn rhai achosion, gallai hyn gynnwys targedu adnoddau presennol yn well. Fodd bynnag, ar y cyfan, byddwn yn disgwyl cynnydd yn yr arian sydd ar gael i weithredu ar argymhellion yr adroddiad.

Cyfeiriodd Kirsty Williams a David Melding at y cysylltiadau agos rhwng iechyd ac addysg. Yr oeddwn yn falch o gynnwys Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn ein trafodaethau ac o groesgyfeirio'r adroddiad ag adroddiad cynharach y pwyllgor hwnnw ar blant ag anghenion addysgol arbennig. Tanlinellir natur drawsbynciol yr adroddiad hwn gan y ffaith ein bod am i Jane Davidson a Jane Hutt ymateb ar y cyd i'n hargymhellion.

Cyfeiriodd Jeff Cuthbert at ymdrechion llywodraeth leol a chenedlaethol ers amser maith i integreiddio plant ag anghenion addysgol arbennig ag addysg brif ffrwd. Cydnabyddir hyn yn yr adroddiad ac mae'n rhan o'r gysail ar gyfer dechrau ein hadolygiad. Cyfeiriodd Jeff at waith mwy effeithiol hefyd, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'r pwyllgor yn cymeradwyo hyn.

Mae hyfforddiant effeithiol ac adnabod anghenion yn gynnar yn hanfodol er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn ymyrryd ar adeg briodol i ddarparu ar gyfer plant ag anghenion arbennig. Dyna pam y mae'r adroddiad yn canolbwyntio ar hyfforddiant athrawon, gwelliannau parhaus a bwrsariau. Cyfeiriodd sawl Aelod at yr argymhellion hyn ac yr wyf yn eu hailbwysleisio er mwyn tynnu sylw'r Gweinidog atynt.

The recommendation on the provision of Welsh-medium services for children and young people is vital. Eleanor Burnham and Owen John Thomas referred to this issue. In her response, I hope that the Minister will bring forward a timetable for implementing the recommendations in the Welsh Language Board's report, entitled 'Acknowledging Need', and commission the audit of provision requested in our report. I commend the report to the Minister and to the Assembly.

Mae'r argymhelliad o ran darparu gwasanaethau cyfrwng Cymraeg i blant a phobl ifanc yn hanfodol. Cyfeiriodd Eleanor Burnham ac Owen John Thomas at y mater hwn. Yn ei hymateb, gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn cyflwyno amserlen ar gyfer gweithredu argymhellion adroddiad Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg, sy'n dwyn y teitl, 'Cydnabod Angen', ac yn comisiynu archwiliad o'r ddarpariaeth y gofynnir amdano yn ein hadroddiad. Cymeradwyaf yr adroddiad i'r Gweinidog ac i'r Cynulliad.

*Cynnig (NDM2184): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2184): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, David  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen

Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Yr Amserlen Gyfnodol The Periodic Timetable**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jenny Randerson and amendment 2 in the names of Kirsty Williams, David Melding and Jocelyn Davies.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Jenny Randerson a gwelliant 2 yn enwau Kirsty Williams, David Melding a Jocelyn Davies.

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I propose that

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 5.1, notes the proposed six-month timetable of Assembly business e-mailed to Assembly Members on 17 November 2004. (NDM2185)*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 5.1, yn nodi amserlen fusnes chwe mis arfaethedig y Cynulliad a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 17 Tachwedd 2004. (NDM2185)*

I said that I would undertake a review of the three-week basis of the periodic timetable prior to bringing it to Plenary this term. I have looked in detail at the current arrangements and am perfectly satisfied that, while nothing is ever perfect, they are not unsustainable. Things are not always perfect, even in Plaid Cymru's world. For the time being, the arrangements represent the best way of handling conflicting pressures. I am aware that a number of commentators have expressed the view that committees should meet on a more frequent cycle, and while I take some of the more considered expressions of this view seriously, I am also aware that much of it has come from those with axes to grind and in the mistaken belief that more is inevitably better.

Dywedais y byddwn yn cynnal adolygiad o'r amserlen gyfnodol ar sail tair wythnos cyn ei chyflwyno i'r Cyfarfod Llawn y tymor hwn. Yr wyf wedi edrych yn fanwl ar y trefniadau presennol ac yr wyf yn hollol fodlon, er nad oes dim byth yn berffaith, nad ydynt yn anghynaliadwy. Nid yw pethau bob amser yn berffaith, hyd yn oed ym myd Plaid Cymru. Am y tro, y trefniadau hyn yw'r ffordd orau o ymdrin â phwysau sy'n groes i'w gilydd. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod nifer o sylwebyddion wedi mynegi'r farn y dylai pwyllgorau gyfarfod yn amlach, ac er fy mod yn cymryd rhai o'r pethau mwy ystyriol a fynegir o ddifrif, yr wyf hefyd yn ymwybodol bod llawer ohono wedi dod oddi wrth y rhai y mae ganddynt gyllyll i'w hogi a'r rhai sy'n credu ar gam bod mwy yn anochel yn well.

It is not a simple matter to balance the various pressures on Members' time and commitments with the need for committees to reach out and engage with those who have a legitimate interest in the Assembly's work in their subject areas, and with the need for a systematic approach to the Assembly's legislative requirements, proper scrutiny of Executive decision making and Assembly policy development. This is a wide agenda. It

Nid mater syml yw cydbwysu'r pwysau amrywiol ar amser ac ymrwymadau'r Aelodau â'r angen i bwyllgorau gyrraedd a chysylltu â'r rhai sydd â diddordeb dilys yng ngwaith y Cynulliad yn eu meysydd hwy, a chyda'r angen am ymagwedd systematig tuag at ofynion deddfwriaethol y Cynulliad, craffu'n briodol ar broses gwneud penderfyniadau'r Weithrediaeth a datblygu polisi yn y Cynulliad. Mae hon yn agenda



is particularly relevant in the context of the Richard commission's remarks on the role of the Assembly's committees. However, in saying that committees need to work to a different timetable, the Richard commission report begs several questions—some explicitly, for example, on the rather large size of our subject committees in relation to the overall number of Assembly Members, and some rather less so, for example, on Ministers' relationship with their committees and their role in policy reviews, and the more flexible approach to working outside the formal committee meetings. Much of this is tied up with issues around corporate status and provisions in the Government of Wales Act 1998, which, in accordance with the resolution of this Assembly, most Members now feel place undue restrictions on our ability to make the best use of resources.

In starting a review of the three-week cycle, I initially felt that there were ways in which we could find a different balance for the membership and timing of committees that could have accommodated some of the concerns that the opposition has raised about the periodic timetable. However, the opposition showed no willingness to enter into discussions on this. In the absence of such meaningful discussions, the Government has no basis for proposing an alternative to the current arrangement. I make no particular complaint about that; I fully understand that the opposition may feel that, in the short term, political grandstanding on this matter gives far more grist to their mill than seeking a workable, long-term solution would. It will therefore come as no surprise that the Labour group will not support the opposition parties' amendments. This whingeing about process issues may attract easy headlines from the Assembly press corps, but, frankly, it has no effect outside here, and it will not address the real debate that is needed on how the role of the committees should develop, particularly as we hope to gain additional powers.

I want to address the wider discussion that needs to take place to provide a mechanism whereby the issues of the timing and structure of meetings can be considered in the

eang. Mae'n arbennig o berthnasol yng nghyd-destun sylwadau comisiwn Richard ar rôl pwyllgorau'r Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, wrth ddweud bod angen i bwyllgorau weithio yn ôl amserlen wahanol, mae adroddiad comisiwn Richard yn codi sawl cwestiwn—rhai yn benodol, er enghraifft, ar faint ychydig yn fawr ein pwyllgorau pwnc mewn perthynas â chyfanswm Aelodau'r Cynulliad, a rhai llai penodol, er enghraifft, ar berthynas y Gweinidogion â'u pwyllgorau a'u rôl mewn adolygiadau polisi, a'r ymagwedd fwy hyblyg tuag at weithio y tu allan i gyfarfodydd pwyllgor ffurfiol. Mae llawer o hyn ynghlwm wrth faterion sy'n ymwneud â statws corfforaethol a darpariaethau yn Neddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, y mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r Aelodau, yn unol â phenderfyniad y Cynulliad hwn, yn teimlo eu bod yn cyfyngu'n ddiangen ar ein gallu i wneud y defnydd gorau o adnoddau.

Wrth ddechrau adolygiad o'r cylch tair wythnos, teimlais ar y dechrau bod modd inni daro cydbwysedd gwahanol ar gyfer aelodaeth ac amseriad pwyllgorau a allai fod wedi ymdrin â rhai o'r pryderon a godwyd gan y gwrthbleidiau ynglŷn â'r amserlen gyfnodol. Fodd bynnag, ni ddangosodd y gwrthbleidiau unrhyw barodrwydd i gynnal trafodaethau ar hyn. Gan na fu unrhyw drafodaethau ystyrlon, nid oedd gan y Llywodraeth unrhyw sail dros gynnig y trefniant amgen. Nid oes gennyf unrhyw gŵyn benodol ynglŷn â hynny; deallaf yn llawn fod y gwrthbleidiau efallai, yn teimlo, yn y byrdymor, bod tynnu sylw gwleidyddol at y mater hwn yn fwy manteisiol o lawer iddynt hwy na cheisio dod o hyd i ateb ymarferol, hirdymor. Felly nid yw'n syndod na fydd y grŵp Llafur yn cefnogi gwelliannau'r gwrthbleidiau. Efallai fod y cwyno hwn am faterion proses yn denu penawdau hawdd gan newyddiadurwyr y Cynulliad, ond, a bod yn onest, nid yw'n cael unrhyw effaith y tu allan i'r Cynulliad, ac ni fydd yn mynd i'r afael â'r ddadl wirioneddol sydd ei hangen ar sut y dylai rôl pwyllgorau ddatblygu, yn arbennig o gofio ein bod yn gobeithio cael pwerau ychwanegol.

Yr wyf am sôn am y drafodaeth ehangach y mae angen ei chynnal fel y gellir ystyried amseriad a strwythur cyfarfodydd yn y cyd-destun ehangach. Ni chredaf fod ateb

broader context. I do not believe that a short-term fix is available to us. Any changes that we make in due course need to take into account the likely additional workload that is inherent in changes to powers and legislative responsibilities. This overall position should be clearer following a general election.

I therefore propose a periodic timetable on the existing basis until after the most likely timing of such an election. I invite each of the parties to consider nominating a member to a review group. The First Minister will raise this in due course with the leaders of the other party groups and with the Presiding Officer. Discussion can then take place about the way in which this review group might be formed and provided with the resources to carry out its task. We look for a genuine dialogue on this and on the more substantive issues at stake.

I commend the motion on the periodic timetable for January to July 2005 to Members and ask them to reject the amendments.

**Jenny Randerson:** I propose amendment 1. After *'the National Assembly for Wales'*, insert:

*considers the report of the Business Committee, laid in the Table Office on 18 November 2004 and,*

I point out that the opposition parties have not proposed this amendment; it concerns the Business Committee's report, and I propose the amendment as chair of the Business Committee. The committee was not unanimous on its view on the two-week cycle, and members other than the Business Minister were of the view that the two-week committee cycle should be re-introduced to replace the three-week cycle.

4.30 p.m.

This report is based on the evidence that has come before the committee this term, and, in reading the report, Members will see that the committee had notification of seven additional formal meetings of committees this term: two for the Culture, Welsh

byrdymor ar gael inni. Mae angen i unrhyw newidiadau a wnawn maes o law ystyried y llwyth gwaith ychwanegol tebygol sy'n rhan annatod o newidiadau i bwerau a chyfrifoldebau deddfwriaethol. Dylai'r sefyllfa gyffredinol hon fod yn gliriach yn dilyn etholiad cyffredinol.

Felly, cynigïaf amserlen gyfnodol yn debyg i'r hyn a geir ar hyn o bryd tan ar ôl amseriad mwyaf tebygol etholiad o'r fath. Gwahoddaf bob un o'r pleidiau i ystyried enwebu aelod i grŵp adolygu. Bydd y Prif Weinidog yn codi hyn maes o law gydag arweinwyr grwpiau'r pleidiau eraill a chyda'r Llywydd. Yna gellir cynnal trafodaethau am y ffordd y gallai'r grŵp adolygu hwn gael ei lunio a sut y gellir rhoi'r adnoddau iddo gyflawni ei dasg. Disgwyliwn gael trafodaeth wirioneddol ar hyn ac ar y materion dan sylw sydd â mwy o sylwedd.

Cymeradwyaf y cynnig ar yr amserlen gyfnodol ar gyfer Ionawr hyd at Orffennaf 2005 i Aelodau a gofynnaf iddynt wrthod y gwelliannau.

**Jenny Randerson:** Cynigïaf welliant 1. Ar ôl *'y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol'*, ychwanegu:

*yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Busnes a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Tachwedd 2004 a,*

Nodaf nad yw'r gwrthbleidiau wedi cynnig y gwelliant hwn; mae a wnelo ag adroddiad y Pwyllgor Busnes, a chynigïaf y gwelliant fel cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Busnes. Nid oedd y pwyllgor yn unfrydol ei farn ar y cylch pythefnos, ac yr oedd aelodau heblaw'r Trefnydd o'r farn y dylid ailgyflwyno'r cylch pwyllgorau o bythefnos yn lle'r cylch tair wythnos.

Seilir yr adroddiad hwn ar y dystiolaeth sydd wedi dod gerbron y pwyllgor y tymor hwn, ac, wrth ddarllen yr adroddiad, bydd yr Aelodau'n gweld i'r pwyllgor gael ei hysbysu am saith cyfarfod ffurfiol ychwanegol o'r pwyllgorau y tymor hwn: dau ar gyfer y

Language and Sport Committee, two for the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee, two for the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee and one for the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee. In view of the fact that most committees only have three or four meetings a term, and we have not yet reached the end of term, that is a large tally. In addition, I am aware that many committees are choosing to hold informal, additional sessions to cope with the volume of work. From my own experience as a member of the Economic Development and Transport Committee, we take up our additional slots, we have lengthy meetings—the last one was nearly four hours long—and we also have informal meetings. The Business Committee was also disappointed that the Business Minister has not undertaken the review that she promised in Plenary in July. The Minister gave us one review, based upon statistics that were inaccurate, but that was no fault of the Business Minister. In the review based on those statistics, she said that she was not prepared to reconsider her view. When the statistics were corrected, it might have produced a different view. We were hoping for a full view, based on statistics and factual information that would have included some options for the future that could have been the basis of discussions between the parties.

We must accept that this ongoing wrangling does this institution no good. Whichever party we belong to, we should care about the reputation of this institution. We must also accept—and the Business Minister referred to this—that the Richard commission pinpointed the lack of scrutiny in the Assembly. Each one of us, whichever viewpoint we have, must consider how we can increase that scrutiny. The Richard commission also noted comparative statistics. We work significantly shorter hours than our colleagues in Scotland. This is a serious problem, and it is one which will become critical for many committees, as many of them will be affected by the bringing in-house of the Assembly sponsored public bodies. We do not know how many will eventually come in-house, but we know that

Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon, dau ar gyfer y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, dau ar gyfer y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ac un ar gyfer Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad. O gofio'r ffaith mai dim ond tri neu bedwar cyfarfod y tymor a gaiff y rhan fwyaf o'r pwyllgorau, ac nid ydym wedi dod i ddiwedd y tymor eto, mae hynny'n ffigur mawr. Hefyd, yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod llawer o bwyllgorau yn dewis cynnal sesiynau anffurfiol, ychwanegol i ymdopi â'r holl waith. O'm profiad i fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth, yr ydym yn defnyddio ein hamser ychwanegol, cawn gyfarfodydd hirfaith—parhaodd yr un diwethaf bron bedair awr—a chawn gyfarfodydd anffurfiol hefyd. Yr oedd y Pwyllgor Busnes yn siomedig hefyd nad yw'r Trefnydd wedi cynnal yr adolygiad a addawodd yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ym mis Gorffennaf. Rhoddodd y Gweinidog un adolygiad inni, yn seiliedig ar ystadegau a oedd yn anghywir, ond nid bai'r Trefnydd oedd hynny. Yn yr adolygiad a oedd yn seiliedig ar yr ystadegau hynny, dywedodd nad oedd yn barod i ailystyried ei barn. Pan gafodd yr ystadegau eu cywiro, efallai y byddai wedi arwain at farn wahanol. Yr oeddem yn gobeithio cael barn lawn, yn seiliedig ar ystadegau a gwybodaeth ffeithiol a fyddai wedi cynnwys rhai opsiynau ar gyfer y dyfodol a allai fod wedi bod yn sail ar gyfer trafodaethau rhwng y pleidiau.

Rhaid inni dderbyn nad yw'r dadlau parhaus hyn yn gwneud lles i'r sefydliad hwn. Pa blaid bynnag yr ydym yn perthyn iddi, dylai enw da'r sefydliad hwn fod o bwys inni. Rhaid inni hefyd dderbyn—a chyfeiriodd y Trefnydd at hyn—i gomisiwn Richard nodi'r diffyg gwaith craffu yn y Cynulliad. Rhaid i bob un ohonom, pa safbwynt bynnag a arddelwn, ystyried sut y gallwn gynyddu'r gwaith craffu hwnnw. Nododd comisiwn Richard hefyd ystadegau cymharol. Yr ydym yn gweithio oriau byrrach o lawer na'n cyd-aelodau yn yr Alban. Mae hyn yn broblem ddifrifol, ac yn un a ddaw yn hollbwysig i lawer o bwyllgorau, gan y bydd dod â'r cyrff cyhoeddus a noddur gan y Cynulliad o dan adain y Cynulliad yn effeithio ar lawer ohonynt. Ni wyddom faint a fydd yn rhan o'r Cynulliad yn y pen draw, ond gwyddom y

at least three will. That will affect two committees, which will have to spend longer on scrutiny.

**Peter Law:** Is that statement not premature, as they have not come in-house yet? It is a work in progress. Is it not unreasonable to compare us with the Scottish Parliament, when we do not have a parliament, or anything like the powers it has? It is not reasonable for you to quote that.

**Jenny Randerson:** In saying that, you are saying that the Richard commission, which represented all four political parties here, and people of no political party, and which looked at this over a year, was unreasonable, as it said the same thing; I am only quoting the Richard commission's findings. The fact that we have a large budget to spend, and we are only able to allocate 60 minutes next week to discussing it, indicates that we do not deal with things in sufficient detail. The coming in-house of ASPBs will produce a crisis because the Government is taking closer control of them and is therefore inviting further scrutiny. We cannot have close Government control of ASPBs without more committee time given to scrutiny. That must be taken into account, and I strongly suggest to the Business Minister that it would be helpful if she were to reconsider and go ahead with the review that she indicated to Plenary she would undertake.

**Kirsty Williams:** I propose amendment 2 in my name and the names of David Melding and Jocelyn Davies. Add as new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Assembly Business Minister to revise the timetable to ensure that subject committees meet at least once every two weeks.*

I do not know why Karen Sinclair has axes to grind. All I know is that those of us who are on this side of the Chamber have jobs to do. Our job is to scrutinise the Welsh Assembly Government, and the ASPBs, while they exist, and it is in committee, uniquely, that we help to develop policy on behalf of the people of Wales. As has been said on

bydd o leiaf tri. Bydd hynny'n effeithio ar ddau bwyllgor a fydd yn gorfod treulio mwy o amser ar waith craffu.

**Peter Law:** Onid yw'r datganiad hwnnw yn gynamserol, gan nad ydynt wedi dod o dan adain y Cynulliad eto? Mae'n waith sy'n mynd rhagddo. Onid yw'n afresymol ein cymharu â Senedd yr Alban, pan nad oes gennym ni senedd, nac unrhyw beth yn debyg i'r pwerau sydd ganddi hi? Nid yw'n rhesymol i chi ddyfynnu hynny.

**Jenny Randerson:** Wrth ddweud hynny, yr ydych yn dweud bod comisiwn Richard, a gynrychiolodd y pedair plaid wleidyddol yma, a phobl nad oeddent yn perthyn i blaid wleidyddol o gwbl, ac a ystyriodd hyn dros gyfnod o flwyddyn, yn afresymol, gan iddo ddweud yr un peth; dim ond dyfynnu canfyddiadau comisiwn Richard a wna. Mae'r ffaith bod gennym gyllideb fawr i'w gwario, ac mai dim ond 60 munud y gallwn ei neilltuo yr wythnos nesaf i'w thrafod, yn nodi nad ydym yn ymdrin â phethau'n ddigon manwl. Bydd dod â CCNC o dan adain y Cynulliad yn creu argyfwng gan fod y Llywodraeth yn mynnu cael mwy o reolaeth drostynt ac felly yn creu rhagor o waith craffu. Ni all y Llywodraeth reoli CCNC yn fwy heb roi mwy o amser pwyllgorau i waith craffu. Rhaid ystyried hynny, ac awgrymaf yn gryf i'r Trefnydd y byddai'n ddefnyddiol pe bai'n ailystyried ac yn mynd ymlaen â'r adolygiad y nododd yn y Cyfarfod Llawn y byddai'n ei gynnal.

**Kirsty Williams:** Cynigiau welliant 2 yn fy enw i ac enwau David Melding a Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar y Trefnydd i ddiwygio'r amserlen er mwyn sicrhau bod y pwyllgorau pwnc yn cyfarfod o leiaf unwaith bob pythefnos.*

Ni wn pam mae gan Karen Sinclair gyllyll i'w hogi. Y cyfan a wn i yw bod gan y rhai hynny ohonom sydd ar yr ochr hon o'r Siambr waith i'w wneud. Ein gwaith yw craffu ar benderfyniadau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, a'r CCNC, tra eu bod yn bodoli, ac mewn pwyllgorau, yn arbennig, yr ydym yn helpu i ddatblygu polisiau ar ran

numerous occasions, some of the best work of this Assembly has emerged from the subject committees. We have seen another example of such work this afternoon.

The problems will simply not go away.

**Peter Law:** Will you accept that Karen Sinclair, as the Business Minister, has a role to protect the policy of the Labour group? Labour is the governing party in this Assembly, in case you had forgotten. Furthermore, will you accept that this public body is the most scrutinised in Wales, and that we have the privilege of being able to say that? I, along with all the Labour AMs, support the good work that Karen Sinclair is doing. Naturally, she is putting forward her party's policies, as you do, Kirsty.

**Kirsty Williams:** It is wonderful that you have laid this bare so that the people of Wales can truly understand, once and for all, where this is coming from. You are quite right; it comes from the Labour group. I remind you respectfully, Peter, that the Assembly still exists as a corporate body and, therefore, Karen Sinclair is Business Minister for the whole Assembly, and is not just here to pander to the whims of Labour politicians.

The fact is that politicians on this side of the Chamber believe that their work in committees is being hampered by the Labour Party's inability to work collectively in this Assembly. As we have seen from the repeated requests to the Business Committee for additional time slots, the three-week cycle does not offer the committees enough time in which to meet. If it did, those committees would not be returning to the Business Committee repeatedly asking for permission to take up their additional slots. They are doing so, because there is simply not enough time otherwise.

Again, this morning, debate in the Health and Social Services Committee was rushed and curtailed because of lack of time. We will not meet in committee again until well into January next year. That is simply not acceptable when the Minister has such a huge

pobl Cymru. Fel y dywedwyd ar sawl achlysur, mae rhai enghreifftiau o waith gorau'r Cynulliad hwn wedi deillio o'r pwyllgorau pwnc. Yr ydym wedi gweld enghraifft arall o waith o'r fath y prynhawn yma.

Ni fydd y problemau'n diflannu.

**Peter Law:** A dderbyniwch fod gan Karen Sinclair, fel y Trefnydd, rôl i ddiogelu polisi'r grŵp Llafur? Llafur yw'r blaid sydd mewn grym yn y Cynulliad hwn, rhag ofn eich bod wedi anghofio. At hynny, a dderbyniwch mai'r corff cyhoeddus hwn yw'r un y creffir mwyaf arno yng Nghymru, a'i bod yn ffrainn inni allu dweud hynny? Yr wyf fi, ynghyd â'r holl Aelodau Cynulliad Llafur, yn cefnogi'r gwaith da a wna Karen Sinclair. Yn naturiol, mae'n cyflwyno polisiâu ei phlaid hi, fel y gwnewch chi, Kirsty.

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae'n wych eich bod wedi datgelu hyn fel y gall pobl Cymru wir ddeall, unwaith ac am byth, beth sydd wrth wraidd hyn. Yr ydych yn eithaf cywir; y grŵp Llafur sydd wrth wraidd hyn. Gyda phob parch, hoffwn eich atgoffa, Peter, bod y Cynulliad yn parhau i fodoli fel corff corfforaethol, ac, felly, mae Karen Sinclair yn Drefnydd ar gyfer y Cynulliad cyfan, ac nid yw yma i foddio mympwyon gwleidyddion Llafur.

Y gwir yw bod gwleidyddion ar yr ochr hon o'r Siambr yn credu bod eu gwaith mewn pwyllgorau yn cael ei rwystro gan anallu'r Blaid Lafur i gydweithio yn y Cynulliad hwn. Fel y gwelsom o'r ceisiadau mynych i'r Pwyllgor Busnes am amserau ychwanegol, nid yw'r cylch tair wythnos yn cynnig digon o amser i'r pwyllgorau gyfarfod. Pe bai'n gwneud hynny, ni fyddai'r pwyllgorau hynny yn dychwelyd i'r Pwyllgor Busnes dro ar ôl tro yn gofyn am ganiatâd i ddefnyddio eu hamserau ychwanegol. Maent yn gwneud hynny, am nad oes digon o amser fel arall.

Unwaith eto, y bore yma, rhuthrwyd y ddadl yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ac fe'i cwtogwyd oherwydd prinder amser. Ni fyddwn yn cyfarfod fel pwyllgor eto tan fis Ionawr y flwyddyn nesaf. Nid yw hynny'n dderbyniol pan fo gan y

portfolio to cover and we are responsible for shadowing it. The cycle also delays the publication of committee reports: it takes longer to finalise the reports, because we are not able to have sufficient meetings.

As for this so-called review, I ask the Minister to go back to the Record for July, when she promised to carry out a review. She made that promise on the floor of the Chamber. There has been no analysis of fact, data or statistics. What there has been is an analysis of the fact that the Minister feels that she cannot get her own way, and has therefore simply reneged on her promise. If she were confident of her arguments, she would have carried out that analysis and would have come here today to win the argument, not simply to say that she has not bothered to carry out a review. It is unforgivable to turn around now and say that we cannot have a review until after the general election. What does that have to do with how this Assembly, as it is currently constituted, does its day-to-day work? Once again, the Business Minister's attitude is breathtaking.

Karen, the argument will not go away until you can produce the facts that show that our side of the Chamber is wrong. As you have demonstrated today, you cannot produce those facts or the statistics; all you can produce is the intransigence of the Members that sit behind you.

**Ann Jones:** Well, here we are: the phrase 'déjà vu' comes to mind again. Sorry, Kirsty, but the art of synthetic indignation has reached new heights, as you stand there stamping your feet. The arguments surrounding the three-week cycle for subject committee meetings are well-rehearsed and I will not revisit them, because it is clear that the three-week timetable makes more slots available for committee business, and not fewer—[ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'What?'] If you hang on a minute, I will explain. The reason for that is that overlaps in committee membership, and the fortnightly cycle that we used to operate, frustrated the inclusion of Thursday slots for committee business and activities.

Gweinidog bortffolio mor fawr ac yr ydym yn gyfrifol am ei gysgodi. Mae'r cylch hefyd yn oedi'r broses o gyhoeddi adroddiadau'r pwyllgorau; mae'n cymryd mwy o amser i gwblhau'r adroddiadau, gan na allwn gael digon o gyfarfodydd.

O ran yr adolygiad bondigrybwyll hwn, gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog edrych yn ôl ar y Cofnod ar gyfer Gorffennaf, pan addawodd gynnal adolygiad. Gwnaeth yr addewid honno yn y Siambr. Ni fu unrhyw ddadansoddiad o ffeithiau, data nac ystadegau. Yr hyn a gafwyd oedd dadansoddiad o'r ffaith bod y Gweinidog yn teimlo y gall gael ei ffordd ei hun, ac felly mae wedi torri ei haddewid. Pe bai ffydd ganddi yn ei dadleuon, byddai wedi cynnal y dadansoddiad hwnnw a byddai wedi dod yma heddiw i ennill y ddadl, nid i ddweud nad yw wedi trafferthu i gynnal adolygiad. Mae'n anfaddeuol ei bod yn dod atom yn awr i ddweud na allwn gael adolygiad tan ar ôl yr etholiad cyffredinol. Sut a wnelo hynny â'r ffordd y mae'r Cynulliad hwn, fel y mae wedi ei sefydlu ar hyn o bryd, yn gwneud ei waith o ddydd i ddydd? Unwaith eto, mae agwedd y Trefnydd yn syfrdanol.

Karen, ni fydd y ddadl yn diflannu hyd nes y gallwch roi'r ffeithiau sy'n dangos bod ein hochr ni o'r Siambr yn anghywir. Fel yr ydych wedi dangos heddiw, ni allwch gyflwyno'r ffeithiau na'r ystadegau hynny; y cyfan y gallwch ei gyflwyno yw anhyblygrwydd yr Aelodau sy'n eistedd y tu ôl ichi.

**Ann Jones:** Wel, dyma ni: daw'r ymadrodd 'déjà vu' i'r cof eto. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Kirsty, ond mae'r ddawn o esgus bod yn ddig wedi cyrraedd uchafbwynt newydd, wrth ichi sefyll yno yn gwylltio. Mae'r dadleuon ynghylch y cylch tair wythnos ar gyfer cyfarfodydd pwyllgorau pwnc yn gyfarwydd iawn ac nid wyf am eu hailystyried, oherwydd mae'n amlwg bod yr amserlen o dair wythnos yn sicrhau bod mwy o amser ar gael ar gyfer busnes pwyllgorau, ac nid llai—[AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'Beth?'] Os arhoswch am funud, fe egluraf. Y rheswm am hynny yw bod rhai yn aelodau o fwy nag un pwyllgor, ac yr oedd y cylch pythefnos yr arferem ei weithredu, yn rhwystro amserau dydd Iau rhag cael eu cynnwys ar gyfer

busnes a gweithgareddau pwyllgorau.

4.40 p.m.

The three-week cycle allows the staff—*[Interruption.]* I am not frightened to take an intervention, but I only have a few seconds to say what I want to say. The three-week cycle allows the staff who serve our committees to send out papers earlier, which is a good thing. I do not pretend that everything is rosy in this regard, but it seems clear to me that a slightly less intense cycle improves the situation for the committee secretariat. It does for my committee, at least.

We can still improve on this, but we must cast our minds back to the volumes of paperwork that we received less than 48 hours in advance of meetings during the first Assembly, when we sat fortnightly. We must agree that when papers are received much earlier, it is better for scrutiny, and better for our contribution to policy development. It is better to be able to consider those papers over the weekend, or days before the meeting, rather than speed-read past midnight the night before the meeting.

I am disappointed that the opposition will not allow the three-week cycle to bed down. We are going over the same ground again; it reminds me of the movie *Groundhog Day*. Opposition members can carry on playing these games to their heart's content—there is no-one sitting in the public gallery or the press gallery. What matters to Members on this side of the Chamber is that we have a system that works, delivers and, above all, which allows space for real scrutiny and creativity within our committee work.

**Jocelyn Davies:** I am disappointed that the Business Minister has decided to retain the three-week cycle. That will not come as a surprise to anyone. It has become evident that the committees are not able to get through all the work required in the time allotted. I am also disappointed that we are having this debate at a time when we were scheduled to

Mae'r cylch tair wythnos yn rhoi cyfle i'r staff—*[Torri ar draws.]* Nid oes ofn derbyn ymyriad arnaf, ond dim ond rai eiliadau sydd gennyf i ddweud yr hyn yr wyf am ei ddweud. Mae'r cylch tair wythnos yn rhoi cyfle i'r staff sy'n gwasanaethu ein pwyllgorau anfon papurau yn gynt, sy'n beth da. Nid wyf yn esgus bod popeth yn fêl i gyd yn hyn o beth, ond ymddengys yn glir i mi fod cylch ychydig yn llai dwys yn gwella'r sefyllfa i ysgrifenyddiaeth y pwyllgorau. Mae'n gwella pethau i'm pwyllgor i, beth bynnag.

Gallwn wneud hyd yn oed yn well ar hyn, ond rhaid inni gofio am yr holl waith papur yr oeddem yn ei gael lai na 48 awr cyn cyfarfodydd yn ystod y Cynulliad cyntaf, pan oeddem yn cyfarfod bob pythefnos. Rhaid inni gytuno, pan gaiff papurau eu derbyn yn gynt o lawer, ei bod yn well ar gyfer y broses graffu, ac yn well ar gyfer ein cyfraniad i ddatblygu polisi. Mae'n well gallu ystyried y papurau hynny dros y penwythnos, neu ddyddiau cyn y cyfarfod, yn hytrach na'u darllen yn gyflym wedi hanner nos ar y noson cyn y cyfarfod.

Yr wyf yn siomedig nad yw'r gwrthbleidiau yn rhoi cyfle i'r cylch tair wythnos ymsefydlu'n iawn. Yr ydym yn trafod yr un hen beth eto; mae'n fy atgoffa i o'r ffilm *Groundhog Day*. Gall aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau barhau i chwarae'r gemau hyn faint a fynnont—nid oes neb yn eistedd yn yr oriel gyhoeddus nac yn oriel y wasg. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig i'r Aelodau ar yr ochr hon o'r Siambr yw bod gennym system sy'n gweithio, yn cyflawni, ac yn anad dim, yn rhoi cyfle ar gyfer gwaith craffu gwirioneddol a chreadigrwydd o fewn gwaith ein pwyllgorau.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Yr wyf yn siomedig bod y Trefnydd wedi penderfynu cadw'r cylch tair wythnos. Ni fydd hynny'n syndod i neb. Daeth yn amlwg nad yw'r pwyllgorau yn gallu ymdopi â'r holl waith y mae'n ofynnol iddynt ei wneud o fewn yr amser a neilltuir. Yr wyf yn siomedig hefyd ein bod yn cynnal y ddaidl hon ar adeg pan oeddem i fod yn

be debating the second offer scheme. It is of far more importance to the Welsh public than this debate, but, unfortunately, the Business Minister has still to settle this matter.

**Janet Ryder:** Jocelyn, would you agree that Ann Jones's comments that a move to a three-week cycle is better, because it allows committees to meet on a Thursday afternoon, needs to be justified by the Labour Party in light of the fact that the additional meeting of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee last Thursday afternoon was not attended by any member of the Labour Party?

**Jocelyn Davies:** I am sure that that is evidence that the Business Minister would like to consider: not just whether those slots for meetings exist, but whether the members of the Labour group attend them. Some Labour Members have said in the Chamber and committee that they want a monthly cycle of meetings. This has been said.

The Business Minister gave a public undertaking last December to review this timetable after 12 months. The review was to be based on evidence, and she described it as an informed assessment. The Business Minister knows, as Jenny mentioned, that the statistics used last time were, unfortunately, incorrect. She also gave that undertaking a second time in July, saying,

'I told Members that I would do it, and I will.'

We did not know at the time that her informed assessment had a Government precondition that we agree to lose some of our committee places before her review could even start. She did not mention that at the time. We find that unacceptable, and I do not think that a committee of 10 is unwieldy. We have had larger committees which met more frequently without any complaint at all.

We all want increased scrutiny, or rather we all say we want it, but in scrutiny terms, less is not more. It does not add up. Perhaps the Minister would tell us if she feels that the committees are fulfilling their scrutiny role to

trafod cynllun yr ail gynnig. Mae'n llawer pwysicach i bobl Cymru na'r ddadl hon, ond yn anffodus, nid yw'r Trefnydd wedi datrys y mater hwn eto.

**Janet Ryder:** Jocelyn, a gytunech fod angen i sylwadau Ann Jones y byddai symud i gylch tair wythnos yn well, am ei bod yn golygu y gall pwyllgorau gyfarfod ar brynhawn dydd Iau, gael eu cyfiawnhau gan y Blaid Lafur yng ngoleuni'r ffaith na fynychwyd y cyfarfod ychwanegol o'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes brynhawn dydd Iau diwethaf gan unrhyw aelod o'r Blaid Lafur?

**Jocelyn Davies:** Yr wyf yn siŵr bod hynny'n dystiolaeth y byddai'r Trefnydd yn hoffi ei hystyried: nid dim ond a yw'r amserau hynny ar gyfer cyfarfodydd ar gael, ond a yw aelodau'r grŵp Llafur yn eu mynychu. Mae rhai Aelodau Llafur yn y Siambr a'r pwyllgorau wedi dweud eu bod am gael cylch misol o gyfarfodydd. Dywedwyd hynny.

Rhoddodd y Trefnydd addewid gyhoeddus fis Rhagfyr diwethaf i adolygu'r amserlen hon ar ôl 12 mis. Yr oedd yr adolygiad i fod yn seiliedig ar dystiolaeth, ac fe'i disgrifiodd fel asesiad hyddysg. Gŵyr y Trefnydd, fel y soniodd Jenny, fod yr ystadegau a ddefnyddiwyd y tro diwethaf, yn anffodus, yn anghywir. Rhoddodd yr addewid honno am yr ail waith ym mis Gorffennaf, gan ddweud

'Dywedais wrth Aelodau y gwnawn hynny, ac fe'i gwnaf.'

Ni wyddem ar y pryd fod rhagamod y Llywodraeth ynghlwm wrth ei hasesiad hyddysg sef ein bod yn cytuno i golli rhai o'n lleoedd ar bwyllgorau cyn y gallai ei hadolygiad hyd yn oed ddechrau. Ni soniodd am hynny ar y pryd. Mae hynny'n annerbyniol inni ac ni chredaf fod pwyllgor o 10 yn anhylaw. Yr ydym wedi cael pwyllgorau mwy a oedd yn cyfarfod yn amlach heb unrhyw gŵyn o gwbl.

Mae pob un ohonom am weld mwy o waith craffu'n cael ei wneud, neu'n hytrach mae pob un ohonom yn dweud ein bod am weld hynny, ond o ran craffu, nid yw llai yn golygu mwy. Nid yw'n gwneud synnwyr.



her satisfaction, and on what she bases that informed assessment. I see no evidence that subject committees can fulfil that role in a three-week cycle, and we will continue to oppose this timetable.

**Peter Law:** I am pleased to support the Minister and the common-sense approach that she has shown today, although I do not know anything about her working party, but that is another issue for another time. The Minister is right, because she has taken an appropriate and responsible approach to scrutiny. We have effective scrutiny—it is working, and it is working better in this public body than anywhere else in Wales, and we should be proud of it. This great smokescreen that regularly comes up from the opposition is just a political ploy of mischief-making every six months—we are all used to it. I never forget that this masochistic party of which I am a member put Jenny Randerson in the chair of the Business Committee, and she has beaten us to death ever since. The Business Committee, sadly, has become a focus of political negativity, to attack the Labour group, but that is fine.

**Jenny Randerson:** I only stand up, Peter, to say how much I welcome that comment, and that I was counting the seconds until you made it.

**Peter Law:** I knew that you would welcome that because Liberals take everything that they can get—we know that from the last Assembly. We all saw what the toerag approach was like then, so that is fine.

However, we are where we are. I am a realist and we must work with what we have. Scrutiny works here, and the three-week cycle has been a success. You just want to use it for propaganda purposes all the time. However, as Ann Jones pointed out, no-one is listening out there because we have other, important things to concentrate on. That is what we should be doing, not trying to score

Efallai y byddai'r Gweinidog yn dweud wrthym a yw'n credu bod y pwyllgorau yn cyflawni eu rôl graffu yn foddhaol, ac ar beth y mae'n seilio'r asesiad hyddysg hwnnw. Ni welaf dystiolaeth y gall pwyllgorau pwnc gyflawni'r rôl honno mewn cylch tair wythnos, a byddwn yn parhau i wrthwynebu'r amserlen hon.

**Peter Law:** Yr wyf yn falch o gefnogi'r Gweinidog a'r ymagwedd synhwyrol a ddangosodd heddiw, er na wn unrhyw beth am ei gweithgor, ond mae hynny'n fater ar gyfer rywbyrd eto. Mae'r Gweinidog yn iawn, oherwydd mae wedi mabwysiadu ymagwedd briodol a chyfrifol tuag at graffu. Mae gennym broses graffu effeithiol—mae'n gweithio, ac mae'n gweithio'n well yn y corff cyhoeddus hwn nag yn unman arall yng Nghymru, a dylem fod yn falch ohoni. Mae'r llen fwg sy'n codi'n rheolaidd o du'r gwrthbleidiau yn ddyfais wleidyddol i wneud drygioni bob chwe mis—mae pob un ohonom wedi arfer â hyn. Nid wyf byth yn anghofio mai'r blaid fasochistaidd hon yr wyf yn aelod ohoni a benododd Jenny Randerson yn gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Busnes, ac mae wedi ein trin yn ddirugaredd ers hynny. Yn anffodus, mae'r Pwyllgor Busnes wedi dod yn fodd i ymosod ar y grŵp Llafur, ond mae hynny'n iawn.

**Jenny Randerson:** Nid wyf ond yn sefyll, Peter, i ddweud cymaint yr oeddwn yn croesawu'r sylw hwnnw, ac yr oeddwn yn cyfrif yr eiliadau hyd nes i chi ei wneud.

**Peter Law:** Gwn y byddech yn croesawu hynny oherwydd mae'r Rhyddfrydwyr yn cymryd popeth y gallant ei gael—gwyddom hynny ar ôl y Cynulliad diwethaf. Gwelodd pob un ohonom sut beth oedd yr ymagwedd gnafaidd bryd hynny, felly mae hynny'n iawn.

Fodd bynnag, dyma'r sefyllfa yr ydym ynddi. Realydd ydwyf a rhaid inni weithio gyda'r hyn sydd gennym. Mae'r broses graffu yn gweithio yma, a bu'r cylch tair wythnos yn llwyddiant. Yr ydych chi am ei ddefnyddio at ddibenion propaganda drwy'r amser. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedodd Ann Jones, nid oes neb yn gwranddo gan fod gennym bethau eraill, pwysig i ganolbwyntio arnynt. Dyna'r

political points on this, which is an opposition hardy annual. There is no doubt about it—we know that there is no more scrutiny anywhere in this nation than in the National Assembly. When you make comparisons with Scotland, when we do not have a Parliament, and talk about bringing in future functions when they have not even arrived here yet, you pre-empt the whole situation. That is at a time when things may need to be considered.

**Eleanor Burnham:** How can we not pre-empt this? An announcement was made by the First Minister in June, which has probably upset most people who work in all these bodies that will now be soaked into the Assembly. Any decent manager would know that it unsettles and, frankly, unhinges people. It is our duty in opposition to take you to task over these important issues.

**Peter Law:** We are naive if we think that an immense amount of scrutiny of all these bodies does not happen now. If you are honest, you can answer it. I watch it every week, and what is happening in the Welsh Development Agency and the Arts Council of Wales is down to the wire all the time. The scrutiny is there now, and we are not naive in thinking any differently. We do not need to take an opportunistic approach, as you have done on this, Eleanor. We need to be realistic. Scrutiny in the Assembly works on a three-week basis—

**Helen Mary Jones:** Can you explain what is opportunistic about what we are doing? I believe that we are all agreed that it is in no-one's interest for us to have to continue to discuss in a public forum the internal workings of this place—we would infinitely prefer the Business Committee to function as it did in the first Assembly, by consensus. Therefore, if we are being opportunistic—and I am open to be persuaded that perhaps we are, given your wisdom and skill—can you explain why it is in any of our interest to have to have this discussion?

hyn y dylem fod yn ei wneud, nid ymgecr, sy'n hen ffefryn gan y gwrthbleidiau. Nid oes unrhyw amheuaeth am hyn—gwyddom nad oes unman arall yn y wlad hon lle y gwneir mwy o waith craffu nag yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Pan wnewch gymariaethau â'r Alban, pan nad oes gennym Senedd, a phan soniwch am gyflwyno swyddogaethau yn y dyfodol pan nad ydynt hyd yn oed wedi cyrraedd yma eto, yr ydych yn achub y blaen a hynny ar adeg pan fydd gofyn, o bosibl, inni ystyried pethau.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Ni allwn ond achub y blaen ar hyn. Gwnaed cyhoeddiad gan y Prif Weinidog ym mis Mehefin, sydd, mae'n siŵr, wedi cynhyrfu'r rhan fwyaf o bobl sy'n gweithio ym mhob un o'r cyrff hyn a gaiff eu hymgorffori yn awr yn y Cynulliad. Byddai unrhyw reolwr da yn gwybod ei fod yn tarfu ar bobl ac, a dweud y gwir, yn eu cynhyrfu. Ein dyletswydd ni yn y gwrthbleidiau yw eich galw i gyfrif o ran y materion pwysig hyn.

**Peter Law:** Yr ydym yn naif os credwn na wneir llawer iawn o waith craffu ar yr holl gyrff hyn yn awr. Os ydych yn onest, gallwch ei ateb. Fe'i gwelaf bob wythnos, ac mae'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a Chyngor Celfyddydau Cymru yn dynn iawn bob amser. Mae'r gwaith craffu yn mynd rhagddo yn awr, ac nid ydym ni yn naif yn credu i'r gwrthwyneb. Nid oes angen inni fabwysiadu ymagwedd oporitiwnistaidd, fel yr ydych chi wedi ei wneud ar hyn, Eleanor. Mae angen inni fod yn realistig. Mae'r broses graffu yn y Cynulliad yn gweithio ar sail tair wythnos—

**Helen Mary Jones:** A allwch egluro beth sy'n oporitiwnistaidd ynglŷn â'r hyn a wnawn? Credaf fod pob un ohonom yn cytuno nad yw gorfod parhau i drafod prosesau mewnol y lle hwn mewn fforwm cyhoeddus yn fuddiol i neb—byddai'n llawer gwell gennym pe bai'r Pwyllgor Busnes yn gweithredu fel y gwnaeth yn y Cynulliad cyntaf, ar sail consensws. Felly, os ydym yn ymddwyn mewn modd oporitiwnistaidd—ac yr wyf yn barod i gael fy narbwylllo ein bod, efallai, yn gwneud hynny, o gofio eich doethineb a'ch gallu—a allwch egluro pam mae'n fuddiol i unrhyw un ohonom gael y drafodaeth hon?

**Peter Law:** It is in the nature of politics for politicians to be opportunistic, and you are good at it over on that side of the Chamber—better than some of us over here, on many occasions—because you are in a minority.

Eleanor talks about 2006, or something, when we hear that certain bodies are coming in. We are now in 2004—that is what is opportunistic; it is anything to beat the Labour Party in the Assembly, the governing party, and it is anything to try to turn around and subvert the wishes of the democratically elected Government. That is what it is, and we understand that. That is politics. I can face it any time. However, we are not changing it—it is a three-week cycle, and that is what is going through today.

**David Melding:** I have observed three things in this rather sad spectacle over the last 20 minutes. First, a review does not have to review anything. It can just review your earlier commitment to have the review. If the review is such that you believe that the conclusions would be adverse, then you can withdraw your commitment to have a review but still have declared that you have reviewed it in the first place, in that you asked yourselves whether you needed the review.

Then, the Labour Party gave one of its stalwarts, Ann Jones—a person that I deeply respect—the task of convincing us that meeting every three weeks is more than meeting every two weeks. Let us just hope that Ann is never made Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, because we will have to redefine all the mathematics text books.

4.50 p.m.

However, the most chilling remark was made by Peter Law, whose contribution was not up to his usual witty or amusing standard. There was something deeply disturbing about his remark, made in an intervention on another Member, that we should stop criticising the Business Minister because she is there to

**Peter Law:** Yn ôl natur gwleidyddiaeth mae gwleidyddion yn oportiwnistaidd, ac yr ydych yn dda iawn yn gwneud hynny ar eich ochr chi o'r Siambr—yn well na rhai ohonom ar yr ochr hon, ar sawl achlysur—am eich bod mewn lleiafrif.

Sonia Eleanor am 2006, neu rywbeth, pan glywn y bydd rhai cyrff yn dod o dan adain y Cynulliad. Y flwyddyn 2004 ydyw ar hyn o bryd—dyna sy'n oportiwnistaidd; fe wnewch unrhyw beth i geisio curo'r Blaid Lafur yn y Cynulliad, y blaid sydd mewn grym, ac fe wnewch unrhyw beth i geisio gwyrddroi dymuniadau'r Llywodraeth a etholwyd yn ddemocrataidd. Dyna'r hyn a wnewch, a deallwn hynny. Dyna yw gwleidyddiaeth. Gallaf wynebu hyn unrhyw bryd. Fodd bynnag, nid ydym yn ei newid—cylch tair wythnos ydyw, a dyna'r hyn a gaiff ei dderbyn heddiw.

**David Melding:** Dros yr 20 munud diwethaf, yr wyf wedi sylwi ar dri pheth yn y sefyllfa eithaf trist hon. Yn gyntaf, nid oes raid i adolygiad adolygu unrhyw beth. Gall adolygu eich ymrwymiad cynharach i gael yr adolygiad. Os ydych yn credu y byddai'r casgliadau yn rhai anffafriol, yna gallwch dynnu eich ymrwymiad i gael adolygiad yn ôl ond gallwch ddatgan o hyd eich bod wedi ei adolygu yn y lle cyntaf, yn yr ystyr eich bod wedi gofyn i chi eich hun a oedd angen yr adolygiad arnoch.

Yna, gosododd y Blaid Lafur dasg i un o'i haelodau pybyr, Ann Jones—person a barchaf yn fawr iawn—i'n hargyhoeddi bod cyfarfod bob tair wythnos yn fwy na chyfarfod bob pythefnos. Gadewch inni obeithio na fydd Ann byth yn Weinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, oherwydd bydd yn rhaid inni ailddiffinio'r holl lyfrau mathemateg.

Fodd bynnag, gwnaed y sylw mwyaf brawychus gan Peter Law, nad oedd ei gyfraniad mor ffraeth neu ddifyr â'i safon arferol. Yr oedd rhywbeth am ei sylw a oedd yn peri pryder mawr, sylw a wnaed pan wnaeth ymyriad ar Aelod arall, yn dweud y dylem roi'r gorau i feirniadu'r Trefnydd gan

defend the Labour Party's business. Is that not what we have had this afternoon? Labour Members have behaved like rather vindictive members of a political party. They have behaved like members of the Labour Party instead of members of the governing party. There is a difference between the two because, if you are in the governing party, you have wider interests, the first of which is the public interest, and not the Labour Party's interest. It may be a fiction that parties that eventually get to elected office start to decay after a while and lose public trust. In not promoting the public interest, you have done great violence to the institution of the National Assembly. I ask you to review yourselves and the absurdity of saying that the scrutiny role is fine just because Labour Party Members are happy with it. I remind you that, as supporters of the governing party, you are already supporting the Government, which controls nearly all the business that comes before Plenary.

The principal means of holding you to account and of scrutinising you is through the work of the committees. If the committees do not perform their scrutiny role effectively, then the Government can go unchecked, which works against you eventually as policies remain untested and you overextend yourselves. That, eventually, will bring rewards for the opposition parties in future elections. However, to tell us that we should be satisfied with scrutiny in its current form, and should not presume to say any different because to do so would mean being nasty to the Labour Party—not holding the Government to account, but being nasty to the Labour Party—is a constitutional absurdity that you ought to repent.

**Brian Gibbons:** Your remarks would have a little credibility if, in most instances, the quality of scrutiny merited the title. It is absurd that, so often, opposition Members—for the reasons that Ann Jones offered with regard to time constraints—skim read with the best questions frequently being lifted straight from what the Members Research Service provides them with. If we had creative, intensive scrutiny within the three-

mai ei gwaith hi yw amddiffyn busnes y Blaid Lafur. Onid dyna'r hyn a gawsom y prynhawn yma? Mae Aelodau Llafur wedi ymddwyn fel aelodau eithaf mileinig o blaid wleidyddol. Maent wedi ymddwyn fel aelodau o'r Blaid Lafur yn hytrach nag aelodau o'r blaid sydd mewn grym. Mae gwahaniaeth rhwng y ddau oherwydd, os ydych yn y blaid sydd mewn grym, mae gennych fuddiannau ehangach, a'r cyntaf yw budd y cyhoedd, ac nid budd y Blaid Lafur. Efallai nad yw'n wir bod pleidiau sy'n cael eu hethol yn y pen draw yn dechrau dirywio ar ôl ychydig ac yn colli hyder y cyhoedd. Wrth beidio â hyrwyddo budd y cyhoedd, yr ydych wedi gwneud drwg mawr i sefydliad y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Gofynnaf ichi adolygu eich hunain a'ch diffyg synnwyr wrth ddweud bod y rôl graffu yn iawn am fod Aelodau'r Blaid Lafur yn fodlon arni. Hoffwn eich atgoffa eich bod chi, fel cefnogwyr y blaid sydd mewn grym, eisoes yn cefnogi'r Llywodraeth, sy'n rheoli bron yr holl fusnes a ddaw gerbron Cyfarfodydd Llawn.

Y brif ffordd o'ch dwyn i gyfrif a chraffu ar eich penderfyniadau yw drwy waith y pwyllgorau. Os nad yw'r pwyllgorau yn cyflawni eu rôl graffu yn effeithiol, yna gall y Llywodraeth barhau yn ddirwystr, sy'n gweithio yn eich erbyn yn y pen draw gan fod polisiau yn parhau heb eu profi ac yr ydych yn gorymestyn. Bydd hynny, yn y pen draw, yn gwobrwyo'r gwrthbleidiau mewn etholiadau i ddod. Fodd bynnag, mae dweud wrthym y dylem fod yn fodlon ar y broses graffu ar ei ffurf bresennol, ac na ddylem feiddio dweud yn wahanol oherwydd byddai gwneud hynny yn golygu bod yn gas i'r Blaid Lafur—nid dwyn y Llywodraeth i gyfrif, ond bod yn gas i'r Blaid Lafur—yn nonsens cyfansoddiadol a ddylai fod yn edifar gennych.

**Brian Gibbons:** Byddai eich sylwadau yn fwy credadwy pe bai ansawdd y craffu, yn y rhan fwyaf o achosion, yn haeddu'r teitl. Mae'n wirion bod Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau, mor aml—am y rhesymau a gynigodd Ann Jones o ran cyfyngiadau amser—yn darllen yn gyflym gan godi'r cwestiynau gorau yn aml yn syth o'r hyn y mae Gwasanaeth Ymchwil yr Aelodau yn ei roi iddynt. Pe bai gennym broses graffu greadigol, dwys o fewn

week cycle, then there would a case. However, the quality of scrutiny is so bad that the case has been made that more frequent meetings would add insult to injury with regard to scrutiny activities.

**David Melding:** I really do despair.

**Peter Law** *rose*—

**David Melding:** I have to answer Brian Gibbons's point, Peter, as it was so crass that, unless I answer it fully, some people will be misguided enough to think that I am convinced by the argument.

The Richard commission report contains a table that shows that the Scottish Parliament sat for half as much time again as we did. Its members hold a Government to account, and that is our only task. We cannot do that via the legislative process because it is not open to us. Are you seriously telling me that the fact that we do one third less work somehow means that we are a more distinguished institution? We do far less work than Parliament, the Northern Ireland Assembly, when it is sitting, and other comparative institutions across Europe. I find it chilling for a Member of the governing party to tell the opposition that our scrutiny is not very good and that we need a bit more time to read. We have never said that.

Also, it was disgraceful how some of your Members tried to hide behind the fear of the secretariat being overworked, and that it was its staff who wanted a three-week cycle. There may be resource implications, and the secretariat may need more support, but you produced these arguments in such a slimy and unpleasant way. What you did 18 months ago was to overturn the custom and practice of holding committee meetings on a fortnightly cycle—

**Peter Law and Jenny Randerson** *rose*—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I have pressed the red button. We cannot have Members standing in the Chamber. David has

y cylch tair wythnos, yna byddai dadl dros hyn. Fodd bynnag, mae ansawdd y craffu mor wael fel y dadleuwyd y byddai cynnal cyfarfodydd yn amlach yn rhwbio halen yn y briw o ran gweithgareddau craffu.

**David Melding:** Yn wir, yr wyf yn anobeithio.

**Peter Law** *a gododd*—

**David Melding:** Rhaid imi ateb pwynt Brian Gibbons, Peter, gan ei fod mor wirion fel y bydd rhai pobl yn ddigon annoeth i gredu fod y ddadl yn fy argyhoeddi, onid atebaf y cwestiwn yn llawn.

Mae adroddiad comisiwn Richard yn cynnwys tabl sy'n dangos i Senedd yr Alban eistedd am hanner cymaint o amser eto ag y gwnaethom ni. Mae ei haelodau yn dal Llywodraeth i gyfrif, a dyna'n hunig dasg ni. Ni allwn wneud hynny drwy'r broses ddeddfwriaethol am nad yw'n agored inni. A ydych o ddifrif yn dweud wrthyf bod y ffaith ein bod yn gwneud un rhan o dair yn llai o waith yn golygu rhywsut ein bod yn sefydliad mwy nodedig? Gwawn lawer iawn llai o waith na'r Senedd, Cynulliad Gogledd Iwerddon, pan fo'n eistedd, a sefydliadau cymharol eraill ledled Ewrop. Mae'n frawychus bod Aelod o'r blaid sydd mewn grym yn dweud wrth y gwrthbleidiau nad yw ein proses graffu yn dda iawn a bod angen ychydig mwy o amser arnom i ddarllen. Nid ydym erioed wedi dweud hynny.

Hefyd, yr oedd yn warthus bod rhai o'ch Aelodau wedi ceisio cuddio y tu ôl i'r ofn bod yr ysgrifenyddiaeth yn cael ei gorweithio, ac mai ei staff oedd yn galw am gylch tair wythnos. Efallai fod goblygiadau o ran adnoddau, ac efallai fod angen mwy o gymorth ar yr ysgrifenyddiaeth, ond cyflwynwyd y dadleuon hyn gennyh mewn ffordd mor sebonllyd ac amhleserus. Yr hyn a wnaethoch 18 mis yn ôl oedd troi'r arfer o gynnal cyfarfodydd pwyllgor bob pythefnos ar ei ben—

**Peter Law a Jenny Randerson** *a gododd*—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Yr wyf wedi gwasgu'r botwm coch. Ni allwn gael Aelodau yn sefyll yn y Siambr. Mae gan

about 10 seconds left.

**David Melding:** All negotiations should start from the point when you restore the fortnightly cycle. Our group will discuss anything, including the size of committees from that point.

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I have heard nothing surprising this afternoon. It is a good thing that my self image is not based on the comments that I hear.

I made it clear in my opening remarks that I have looked at the current arrangements and that I am perfectly satisfied that, while nothing is ever perfect, these arrangements are sustainable. They present—at least for the time being—the best way of handling conflicting pressures. Nothing that I have heard has changed this view.

Jenny said that there have been many informal meetings, which is untrue. There has been one additional informal meeting. Kirsty, I make no bones on the issue of the review. A review meant an engagement on all sides to look at how to handle the committee timetable. There was no will to engage from your leaders.

**Jenny Randerson:** I wonder who is the leader of the Chair of the Business Committee. You are addressing me in the wrong persona. Will you then take issue with Ann Jones who said that there have been many informal meetings?

**Karen Sinclair:** A great deal of additional meetings have taken place—one informal meeting, and seven visits, which are extremely valuable and appreciated by the people of Wales. I am sure that that is what Ann was referring to.

When I started this review, the only will was to return to the old timetable. This is something that the Labour group is not prepared to do without consideration of the size and structure of committees.

I hope to engage with opposition parties in a constructive dialogue about future

David tua 10 eiliad yn weddill.

**David Melding:** Dylai'r holl negodi ddechrau o pryd yr adferwch y cylch pythefnosol. Bydd ein grŵp yn fodlon trafod unrhyw beth, gan gynnwys maint pwyllgorau, bryd hynny.

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Ni chlywais unrhyw beth y prynhawn yma a berodd syndod. Mae'n beth da nad yw fy hunanddelwedd yn seiliedig ar y sylwadau a glywaf.

Eglurais yn fy sylwadau agoriadol fy mod wedi edrych eto ar y trefniadau presennol ac yr wyf yn hollol fodlon bod y trefniadau hyn yn gynaliadwy, er nad oes dim yn berffaith. Am y tro o leiaf dyma'r ffordd orau o ymdrin â phwysau sy'n groes i'w gilydd. Nid wyf wedi clywed dim i newid y farn honno.

Dywedodd Jenny fod llawer o gyfarfodydd anffurfiol wedi bod, ond nid yw hyn yn wir. Bu un cyfarfod anffurfiol ychwanegol. Kirsty, ni phetrusaf ddim ar fater yr adolygiad. Yr oedd adolygiad yn golygu ymrwymiad ar bob ochr i ystyried sut i ymdrin ag amserlen y pwyllgorau. Nid oedd unrhyw ewyllys ar ran eich arweinwyr i ymrwymo.

**Jenny Randerson:** Tybed pwy yw arweinydd Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Busnes. Yr ydych yn fy nghyfarch yn y persona anghywir. A anghytunwch felly ag Ann Jones a ddywedodd fod llawer o gyfarfodydd anffurfiol wedi bod?

**Karen Sinclair:** Cynhaliwyd llawer o gyfarfodydd ychwanegol—un cyfarfod anffurfiol, a saith ymweliad, sy'n eithriadol o werthfawr ac a werthfawrogir gan bobl Cymru. Yr wyf yn siŵr mai dyna'r hyn yr oedd Ann yn cyfeirio ato.

Pan ddechreuais yr adolygiad hwn, yr unig ewyllys oedd dychwelyd i'r hen amserlen. Mae hyn yn rhywbeth nad yw'r grŵp Llafur yn barod i'w wneud heb ystyried maint a strwythur pwyllgorau.

Gobeithiaf gynnal trafodaethau adeiladol â gwrthbleidiau ynglŷn â threfniadau'r dyfodol

arrangements when the time comes. I am not holding my breath.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Point of order. I raise this point of order in relation to Peter Law's earlier comments, and David Melding's response about the precise role of the Business Minister in relation to the business of the Assembly and in relation to committees.

If my memory serves me correctly, in reference to the Government of Wales Act 1998, the Business Minister is the only Minister named in the Act as the person responsible for the business of the Assembly. I do not think that the Government of Wales Act mentions the business of the Government. I had always understood the principle that the Business Minister for this purpose is not the business manager of the Labour Party, but the Business Minister of the whole Assembly.

Under those circumstances, the point of order for you, Deputy Presiding Officer, is that as the guardian of the rights of all Assembly Members, we must establish once and for all the precise role of the Business Minister in these negotiations. If it is now said, on behalf of the Labour Party, that she is only the business manager of the Labour Party, it turns the Assembly's constitution on its head. We are entitled—not today, perhaps, but when you have had an opportunity to reflect—to hear a ruling on this important matter.

**Peter Law:** Further to that point of order, I bow to that request and wait to hear your ruling. However, the Business Minister is not a Queen's appointment here. Democracy runs on the will of the majority. You should know that better than anyone, as leader of the opposition. The First Minister appoints a Cabinet and the Business Minister is a political appointment as far as I am concerned. This is why I made my statement and I stand by it. I will bow to the ruling but let us not be naive about this. This is a political institution and we all know the facts.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I will refer

pan ddaw'r amser. Ni chredaf fod fawr o obaith am hynny.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Pwynt o drefn. Codaf y pwynt o drefn hwn mewn perthynas â sylwadau cynharach Peter Law, ac ymateb David Melding ynglŷn ag union rôl y Trefnydd mewn perthynas â busnes y Cynulliad ac mewn perthynas â phwyllgorau.

Os da y cofiaf, o ran Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, y Trefnydd yw'r unig Weinidog a enwir yn y Ddeddf fel y person sy'n gyfrifol am fusnes y Cynulliad. Ni chredaf fod Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru yn sôn am fusnes y Llywodraeth. Yr oeddwn bob amser wedi deall yr egwyddor nad y Trefnydd at y diben hwn yw rheolwr busnes y Blaid Lafur, ond Trefnydd y Cynulliad cyfan.

O dan yr amgylchiadau hynny, y pwynt o drefn i chi, Ddirprwy Lywydd, yw bod yn rhaid ichi, fel yr un sy'n gwarchod hawliau pob Aelod Cynulliad, gadarnhau unwaith ac am byth union rôl y Trefnydd yn y negodiadau hyn. Os dywedir yn awr, ar ran y Blaid Lafur, mai dim ond rheolwr busnes y Blaid Lafur yw hi, mae'n troi cyfansoddiad y Cynulliad ar ei ben. Mae gennym yr hawl—nid heddiw, efallai, ond pan fyddwch wedi cael cyfle i ystyried—i glywed dyfarniad ar y mater pwysig hwn.

**Peter Law:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, cytunaf i'r cais hwnnw ac arhosaf i glywed eich dyfarniad. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r Trefnydd yn un o benodiadau'r Frenhines yma. Mae democratiaeth yn mynd rhagddi yn ôl ewyllys y mwyafrif. Dylech wybod hynny'n well na neb, fel arweinydd gwrthblaid. Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn penodi Cabinet ac mae'r Trefnydd yn benodiad gwleidyddol hyd y gwelaf fi. Dyna pam y gwneuthum fy natganiad a glynaf wrth yr hyn a ddywedais. Cytunaf i'r dyfarniad ond peidied neb â bod yn naïf ynglŷn â hyn. Sefydliad gwleidyddol yw hwn, ac mae'r ffeithiau yn hysbys i bob un ohonom.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Cyfeiriaf hyn at y

this to the Presiding Officer and consult the Government of Wales Act. It is true that the Business Minister is not an officer of the Assembly. She is a member of the Cabinet Executive and holds her position under the patronage of the First Minister. I will need to consult carefully and look at the Government of Wales Act and draw it to the attention of the Presiding Officer, to see whether the position of Business Minister is in parallel with the position of leader of the house in the House of Commons, whether or not there is any extra duty of the Business Minister to the house and to Plenary.

Llywydd ac edrychaf ar Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru. Mae'n wir nad yw'r Trefnydd yn un o swyddogion y Cynulliad. Mae'n aelod o Weithrediaeth y Cabinet ac yn dal ei swydd o dan nawdd y Prif Weinidog. Bydd angen imi ymgynghori'n ofalus ac edrych ar Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru a'i thynnu i sylw'r Llywydd, i weld a yw sefyllfa'r Trefnydd yn debyg i sefyllfa arweinydd y tŷ yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin, pa un a oes unrhyw ddyletswydd ychwanegol ar y Trefnydd i'r tŷ ac i'r Cyfarfod Llawn ai peidio.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 27, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 1: For 27, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

5.00 p.m.

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 27, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 2: For 27, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:



The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM2185): O blaid 30, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.  
 Motion (NDM2185): For 30, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

### **Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order**

**Ann Jones:** Point of order. I raise this point in response to Jenny Randerson's comments during the Business Minister's response to the last debate. I refer her to the Record to read what I actually said, after which I will graciously accept her apology next week.

**Ann Jones:** Pwynt o drefn. Codaf y pwynt hwn mewn ymateb i sylwadau Jenny Randerson yn ystod ymateb y Trefnydd i'r ddadl ddiwethaf. Fe'i cyfeiriai at y Cofnod i ddarllen yr hyn a ddywedais mewn gwirionedd, ac wedyn fe dderbyniaf ei hymddiheuriad yr wythnos nesaf.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That is not a point of order for me, but it will be included in the Record.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Nid yw hynny'n bwynt o drefn i mi, ond caiff ei gynnwys yn y Cofnod.

### **Dadl Fer Short Debate**

**[www.impeachblair.org](http://www.impeachblair.org)**

**Leanne Wood:** Before I put forward my arguments for the impeachment of Tony Blair, I must inform you that the title of this debate, which is the website address of the impeachment campaign, is now inaccurate. For some unknown reason—it is possibly a coincidence, or possibly not—the website has been hacked into and wiped from the internet. The new address is [www.impeachblair.net](http://www.impeachblair.net). I have agreed to allow Ieuan Wyn Jones, Mike German and David Davies to speak for a minute each at the end of my speech.

**Leanne Wood:** Cyn imi gyflwyno fy nadleuon o blaid uchelgyhuddo Tony Blair, rhaid imi eich hysbysu bod teitl y ddadl hon, sef cyfeiriad gwefan yr ymgyrch dros uchelgyhuddo, bellach yn anghywir. Am ryw reswm anhysbys—cyd-ddigwyddiad o bosibl, ond efallai ddim—haciwyd i'r wefan a'i dileu o'r rhyngwrwd. Y cyfeiriad newydd yw [www.impeachblair.net](http://www.impeachblair.net). Yr wyf wedi cytuno i ganiatáu i Ieuan Wyn Jones, Mike German a David Davies siarad am funud yr un ar ddiwedd fy araiith.

This is an interesting issue on which Frederick Forsyth and Harold Pinter can unite, and, strangely enough, on which David Davies and myself are in agreement. The decision to go to war against Iraq was made shortly following the tragic events that took place in New York on 11 September 2001. George Bush and the neo-conservatives decided that their former ally, Saddam Hussein, had to go and that it was economically important to bring Iraq under the control of the United States. The fact that Saddam Hussein had nothing to do with the attack on the twin towers or with Al Qaeda

Mae'r mater hwn yn un diddorol y gall Frederick Forsyth a Harold Pinter fod yn unedig yn ei gylch, ac, yn rhyfedd ddigon, yr wyf fi a David Davies yn cytuno arno. Gwnaed y penderfyniad i fynd i ryfel yn erbyn Irac yn fuan ar ôl y digwyddiadau trasig yn Efrog Newydd ar 11 Medi 2001. Penderfynodd George Bush a'r neo-geidwadwyr fod yn rhaid cael gwared ar eu cyn-gynghreiriad, Saddam Hussein, a'i bod yn bwysig yn economaidd i sicrhau bod Irac o dan reolaeth yr Unol Daleithiau. Yr oedd y ffaith nad oedd a wnelo Saddam Hussein ddim â'r ymosodiad ar y ddau dŵr neu ag Al

was irrelevant. He was blocking their economic aims and so regime change was essential. There is no question that we in Plaid Cymru see Saddam Hussein as a cruel dictator. We were voicing our opposition to what he was doing to the Iraqis and the Kurds while the British and American Governments were still selling him arms.

In the aftermath of 9/11, Tony Blair was keen to stand shoulder-to-shoulder with the most powerful nation in the world. He colluded with Bush in devising the reasons to attack Iraq. They made that decision and found justification for the invasion afterwards. We have since discovered that the justification provided for going to war was a pack of lies.

Since I became an Assembly Member, we have discussed the war on Iraq once, and that was when I raised the issue in a short debate on 19 May. I find it truly astounding that the biggest political issue of the day has not been debated in the National Assembly. We have not voted on the war or indicated our position in any way. The war has had a major impact on Wales—Welsh troops and civilians have been killed, and the financial costs will have a severe impact on Welsh public services. As you say, the matter is not devolved, but it is an issue for Wales, it affects the people of Wales, and we should have debated the matter in the Chamber.

The war is unjust. It has killed an estimated 100,000 Iraqi civilians—a figure that came out before the Fallujah massacre. Fallujah is a city the size of Cardiff, and the death toll is likely to be immense. Those killed are likely to be women, children, the elderly and the infirm—all those who could not leave in the 24 hours that they were given before the US troops went in.

The whole of Iraq has been devastated. The lives of those who have not been killed have been ruined. Homes, schools, hospitals, and entire sewage systems have been bombed, unemployment has soared, security has broken down, and people are without water

Qaeda yn amherthnasol. Yr oedd yn rhwystr i'w nodau economaidd ac felly yr oedd yn hanfodol newid y llywodraeth. Nid oes unrhyw amheuaeth gennym ni ym Mhlaid Cymru mai unben creulon oedd Saddam Hussein. Yr oeddem yn mynegi ein gwrthwynebiad i'r hyn yr oedd yn ei wneud i bobl Irac a'r Kurdiaid tra yr oedd Llywodraethau Prydain ac America yn dal i werthu arfau iddo.

Yn dilyn 9/11, yr oedd Tony Blair yn awyddus i sefyll ochr yn ochr â'r wlad fwyaf pwerus yn y byd. Cyd-gynllwyniodd â Bush i lunio'r rhesymau dros ymosod ar Irac. Gwnaed y penderfyniad hwnnw ganddynt gan ddod o hyd i gyfiawnhad dros yr ymosodiad wedi hynny. Ers hynny, clywsom mai celwydd llwyr oedd y cyfiawnhad dros fynd i ryfel.

Ers imi ddod yn Aelod o'r Cynulliad, bu inni drafod y rhyfel yn erbyn Irac unwaith, a hynny pan godais y mater mewn dadl fer ar 19 Mai. Mae'n syndod llwyr imi na thrafodwyd mater gwleidyddol pwysicaf y dydd yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Nid ydym wedi pleidleisio ar y rhyfel nac wedi datgan ein safbwynt mewn unrhyw ffordd. Mae'r rhyfel wedi cael effaith fawr ar Gymru—lladdwyd milwyr a sifiliaid o Gymru, a chaiff y costau ariannol effaith ddifrifol ar ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Fel y dywedwch, nid yw'r mater wedi'i ddatganoli, ond mae'n fater i Gymru, mae'n effeithio ar bobl Cymru, a dylem fod wedi trafod y mater yn y Siambr.

Mae'r rhyfel yn anghyfiawn. Mae wedi lladd tua 100,000 o sifiliaid Irac yn ôl amcangyfrif—ffigur a gyhoeddwyd cyn y lladdfa yn Fallujah. Mae dinas Fallujah yr un maint â Chaerdydd, ac mae nifer y marwolaethau yn debygol o fod yn aruthrol. Mae'n debygol mai menywod, plant, yr henoed a'r methodig fydd y rhai a laddwyd—y bobl na lwyddodd i adael yn y 24 awr a roddwyd iddynt cyn i filwyr yr UD ymosod.

Dinistriwyd Irac gyfan. Difethwyd bywydau'r rheini nas lladdwyd. Bomiwyd cartrefi, ysgolion, ysbytai, a systemau carthffosiaeth cyfan, mae diweithdra wedi cynyddu'n aruthrol, nid oes diogelwch, ac nid oes gan bobl ddŵr a thrydan. Mae Irac wedi

and electricity. Iraq has become a living nightmare. The war has resulted in a much more unsafe world; the threat of terrorism is greater now than it has ever been before.

The war is illegal under international law. It was sold to Parliament, and to the people, on the basis of lies. I was not a Member of the National Assembly when the UK invaded Iraq. If the Assembly had taken a vote and opposed the war, and if the Scottish Parliament had done the same—although I accept that it would not have been within our remit—that vote would have sent a clear message to Westminster: we would have said that the war was not being conducted in our name. Instead, many politicians in the Assembly have been silent on the issue, and that silence is cowardly. Those who have not opposed the war are as culpable as the Prime Minister. When he was asked a question by a member of the public prior to the last Assembly elections, the First Minister said that he did not know his position on the war. How on earth can you be the First Minister of Wales and not know your position on the most important political issue of the day?

An impeachment motion has been tabled today in the House of Commons by Plaid Cymru MP Adam Price for a specific reason. That reason is that Prime Minister Tony Blair misled the public in order to take the UK into war. The whole Iraq disaster brings into play all kinds of legal issues, and we must use all available legal avenues to hold him to account for his lies. In response to the impeachment action, New Labour claims that Tony Blair can be held to account through the ballot box. Its argument is that if people are not happy with what he has done, they can get rid of him in a general election. Anyone with half an ounce of intelligence knows that Michael Howard stands no chance of winning the next general election, so it is impossible for the Prime Minister to be held to account in that way. Also, the people of Sedgefield are the only ones who can vote Tony Blair out. None of us, not one person in Wales, can have a say in his re-election. We all saw how George Bush was held to account through the ballot box in the United States. He ran his election based on fear, and yesterday's Queen's Speech shows that the Prime

troi'n hunllef fyw. O ganlyniad i'r rhyfel, mae'r byd yn llawer llai diogel; mae bygythiad terfysgaeth yn fwy yn awr nag a fu erioed o'r blaen.

Mae'r rhyfel yn anghyfreithlon o dan gyfraith ryngwladol. Argyhoeddwyd Senedd, a'r bobl, ar sail celwyddau. Nid oeddwn yn Aelod o'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol pan ymosododd y DU ar Irac. Pe bai'r Cynulliad wedi cynnal pleidlais ac wedi gwrthwynebu'r rhyfel, a phe bai Senedd yr Alban wedi gwneud yr un peth—er y derbynaf na fyddai wedi bod yn rhan o'n cylch gwaith—byddai'r bleidlais honno wedi anfon neges glir i San Steffan: byddem wedi datgan nad oedd y rhyfel yn mynd rhagddo yn ein henw ni. Yn hytrach, bu llawer o wleidyddion yn y Cynulliad yn fud ar y mater, ac mae aros yn fud yn y fath fodd yn llwfr. Mae'r rheini na wrthwynebodd y rhyfel yr un mor euog â Phrif Weinidog y DU. Pan ofynnodd aelod o'r cyhoedd gwestiwn i'r Prif Weinidog cyn etholiadau diwethaf y Cynulliad, dywedodd nad oedd yn gwybod beth oedd ei farn ar y rhyfel. Sut ar y ddaear y gallwch chi fod yn Brif Weinidog Cymru heb wybod eich barn ar fater gwleidyddol pwysicaf y dydd?

Cyflwynwyd cynnig i uchelgyhuddo heddiw yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin gan AS Plaid Cymru Adam Price am reswm penodol. Y rheswm hwnnw yw i Brif Weinidog y DU Tony Blair gamarwain y cyhoedd er mwyn mynd â'r DU i ryfel. Mae argyfwng Irac yn codi pob math o faterion cyfreithiol, a rhaid inni ddefnyddio'r holl ffyrdd cyfreithiol posibl i'w ddwyn i gyfrif am ei gelwyddau. Mewn ymateb i'r camau uchelgyhuddo, mae Llafur Newydd yn honni y gellir dwyn Tony Blair i gyfrif drwy etholiad. Dadl y blaidd yw os nad yw pobl yn fodlon ar yr hyn a wnaeth, gallant gael gwared arno mewn etholiad cyffredinol. Gŵyr unrhyw un â mymryn o ddeallusrwydd nad oes gan Michael Howard unrhyw obaith o ennill yr etholiad cyffredinol nesaf, felly mae'n amhosibl i Brif Weinidog y DU gael ei ddwyn i gyfrif felly. Hefyd, dim ond pobl Sedgefield all bleidleisio yn erbyn Tony Blair. Ni all yr un ohonom, ni all neb yng Nghymru, gael dylanwad o ran ei ailethol. Gwelsom oll sut y dygwyd George Bush i gyfrif yn yr etholiad yn yr Unol Daleithiau. Seiliwyd ei ymgyrch etholiadol ar ofn, a dengys Araith y Frenhines ddoe fod Prif

Minister intends to learn lessons from him. Accountability through the ballot box is extremely unlikely.

Another New Labour response is that there have already been four inquiries. However, we know that not one of those inquiries had the remit to look at the Prime Minister's conduct in the run-up to this war. They had narrow remits and were deliberately designed not to uncover the full extent of the truth, and not to hold anyone to account. Public perception is that those inquiries were complete whitewashes. A motion of no confidence in Westminster is only available to the leader of the opposition, so that avenue is not open to us either. If there was another way of holding Tony Blair to account, the impeachment action would not be necessary. Our political system does not allow for true accountability, unfortunately, therefore, impeachment is the only way.

5.10 p.m.

There are only two legal reasons for a country to go to war under international law. First, war has to be sanctioned by the United Nations. This war has received no such sanction, which is why Bush and Blair were so keen to get a second resolution that would have unambiguously sanctioned the use of force. Blair insisted that Iraq had committed a material breach of Security Council resolution 1441 by not co-operating with UN weapons inspectors. Yet, these inspectors were not allowed to complete their work.

The second reason why a country can declare war is if it faces direct and imminent threat from a hostile nation. We were given the impression, through the spin of the infamous dodgy dossier, that the UK could have been hit within 45 minutes by one of Saddam Hussein's weapons of mass destruction. Tony Blair claimed that Saddam Hussein posed a severe threat not just to the region, but to the wider world, and that he had enough chemical and biological weapons to devastate the entire Gulf region. However, the intelligence assessment was that

Weinidog y DU yn bwriadu dysgu gwersi ganddo. Mae atebolrwydd drwy'r blwch pleidleisio yn annhebygol iawn.

Ymateb arall gan Lafur Newydd yw bod pedwar ymchwiliad eisoes wedi'u cynnal. Fodd bynnag, gwyddom nad oedd cylch gwaith yr un o'r ymchwiliadau hynny yn cynnwys edrych ar ymddygiad Prif Weinidog y DU yn y cyfnod cyn y rhyfel. Yr oedd eu cylchoedd gwaith yn gul ac wedi'u cynllunio'n fwriadol i beidio â datgelu'r gwirionedd cyfan, na dwyn neb i gyfrif. Barn y cyhoedd yw bod yr ymchwiliadau hynny wedi celu'r gwir yn llwyr. Dim ond arweinydd yr wrthblaid all gyflwyno cynnig o ddiffyg hyder yn San Steffan, felly nid yw hynny'n opsiwn inni ychwaith. Pe bai ffordd arall o ddwyn Tony Blair i gyfrif, ni fyddai angen cymryd camau i uchelgyhuddo. Yn anffodus, nid yw ein system wleidyddol yn caniatáu atebolrwydd go iawn, felly, uchelgyhuddo yw'r unig ffordd.

Dim ond dau reswm cyfreithiol sydd i wlad fynd i ryfel o dan gyfraith ryngwladol. Yn gyntaf, rhaid i'r Cenhedloedd Unedig gefnogi'r rhyfel. Ni dderbyniodd y rhyfel hwn unrhyw gefnogaeth o'r fath, a dyna pam yr oedd Bush a Blair mor awyddus i gael ail benderfyniad a fyddai wedi cefnogi'n gadarn y defnydd o rym. Mynnodd Blair fod Irac wedi mynd yn groes i benderfyniad 1441 y Cyngor Diogelwch drwy beidio â chydweithredu ag arolygwyr arfau'r Cenhedloedd Unedig. Serch hynny, ni chaniatawyd i'r arolygwyr hyn gwblhau eu gwaith.

Yr ail reswm pam y gall gwlad ddatgan rhyfel yw os bydd yn wynebu bygythiad uniongyrchol ac yn fuan gan wlad elyniaethus. Cawsom yr argraff, drwy sbin y ddogfen amheus bondigrybwyll, y gallai un o arfau dinistriol Saddam Hussein fod wedi taro'r DU o fewn 45 munud. Honnodd Tony Blair fod Saddam Hussein yn fgythiad difrifol nid yn unig i'r rhanbarth, ond i'r byd, a bod ganddo ddigon o arfau cemegol a biolegol i ddinistrio rhanbarth cyfan y Gwlff. Fodd bynnag, nododd yr asesiad cudd-wybodaeth:

'Saddam has not succeeded in seriously threatening his neighbours'.

The report, 'A Case to Answer', outlines 28 different occasions when the Prime Minister made statements about the threat posed by Saddam Hussein, which was subsequently found to be false. One slip up could perhaps be forgiven, but 28 statements show that there was a deliberate attempt to mislead. In breaking international law, Bush and Blair have made themselves war criminals. Saddam Hussein, the other war criminal, will be brought to book for his actions. When will the international community bring Bush and Blair to book for theirs?

We may not be able to influence international courts, and we cannot have any influence over the president of the United States of America, but we do and can have a say as regards our own Prime Minister. Assembly Members failed to do anything to stop the war or to have an impact on any aspect of it. This situation can be redeemed. If Assembly Members are prepared to support the impeachment motion and put pressure on their MPs to do so in the UK Parliament, there is a chance that Tony Blair could be held to account for his crimes and his lies. Members of the public can also put pressure on MPs, and I urge everyone opposed to the war to do this. However, Assembly Members, particularly Labour Members, have real power in this regard. The removal of Tony Blair as leader of the Labour Party will do a great service not just to the country, but to the Labour Party. It is in its interests for its leader to be impeached. If he is allowed to get away with this, people's trust in politics will be put at risk, as well as trust in the Labour Party.

How many more innocent civilians need to be killed before people are prepared to take action against those responsible for the war? How many troops on both sides will be killed before the powers that be decide that enough is enough? Doing nothing is not an option. If we do nothing, a precedent will be set. Blair will believe that his lies and actions were acceptable, and we will be faced with the

nid yw Saddam wedi llwyddo i beri bygythiad difrifol i'w gymdogaion.

Mae'r adroddiad, 'A Case to Answer', yn amlinellu 28 o wahanol adegau pan wnaeth Prif Weinidog y DU ddatganiadau ynghylch y bygythiad gan Saddam Hussein, y canfuwyd wedi hynny eu bod yn anghywir. Gellid maddau un camgymeriad, o bosibl, ond dengys 28 o ddatganiadau y gwnaed ymgais fwriadol i gamarwain. Wrth dorri'r gyfraith ryngwladol, mae Bush a Blair eu hunain yn droseddwr rhyfel. Caiff Saddam Hussein, y troseddwr rhyfel arall, ei ddwyn gerbron llys barn am ei weithredoedd. Pryd y caiff Bush a Blair eu dwyn gerbron llys barn gan y gymuned ryngwladol am eu gweithredoedd hwy?

Efallai na allwn ddylanwadu ar lysoedd rhyngwladol, ac ni allwn ddylanwadu ar arlywydd Unol Daleithiau America o gwbl, ond gallwn ddylanwadu ar yr hyn a fydd yn digwydd i Brif Weinidog y DU. Methodd Aelodau'r Cynulliad â gweithredu i atal y rhyfel neu i gael effaith ar unrhyw agwedd arno. Gellir unioni'r sefyllfa hon. Os bydd Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn barod i gefnogi'r cynnig i uchelgyhuddo a rhoi pwysau ar eu ASau i wneud hynny yn Senedd y DU, mae gobaith y gellir dwyn Tony Blair i gyfrif am ei droseddau a'i gelwyddau. Gall aelodau'r cyhoedd hefyd roi pwysau ar eu ASau, ac erfyniaf ar bawb sy'n gwrthwynebu'r rhyfel i wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae gan Aelodau'r Cynulliad, Aelodau Llafur yn arbennig, bŵer go iawn yn hyn o beth. Bydd cael gwared ar Tony Blair fel arweinydd y Blaid Lafur o fudd nid yn unig i'r wlad, ond i'r Blaid Lafur. Byddai'n fuddiol i'r blaid pe bai ei harweinydd yn cael ei uchelgyhuddo. Os caniateir iddo gael dihangfa, caiff ymddiriedaeth pobl mewn gwleidyddiaeth ei rhoi yn y fantol, yn ogystal â'u hymddiriedaeth yn y Blaid Lafur.

Faint yn rhagor o sifiliaid di-fai y mae angen iddynt gael eu lladd cyn y bydd pobl yn barod i gymryd camau yn erbyn y rhai sy'n gyfrifol am y rhyfel? Faint o filwyr ar y ddwy ochr a gaiff eu lladd cyn i'r llywodraeth benderfynu mai digon yw digon? Nid yw peidio â gweithredu yn opsiwn. Os na weithredwn, byddwn yn gosod cynsail. Bydd Blair yn credu bod ei gelwyddau a'i

frightening prospect of it happening again. Do not let Iran be the next Iraq. Let us ensure that we take action now to prevent more bloodbaths in the future.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I thank Leanne for the way in which she has raised this matter. We do not make enough use of the provisions of section 33 of the Government of Wales Act 1998, which allows us to debate matters of relevance to Wales. The impact of the war in Iraq is a matter of direct relevance to Wales not only in relation to security matters, but to the young people serving with the armed forces.

Plaid Cymru has been consistent in its opposition to the war. This was started 18 months ago in a different political context, and I am proud of our consistency in opposing the war. We must bear in mind that the war in Iraq and the introduction of the concept of a pre-emptive strike changed the political context and international relations. This was reinforced by the fact that Tony Blair talked about weapons of mass destruction that we now know did not exist. The United Nations has said that the war is illegal, and I believe that impeachment is a valid way of bringing the Prime Minister to account, and it is right that the Assembly lends its weight to that campaign.

**Michael German:** I also thank Leanne for bringing this topic before us today. This is probably the most important issue facing our country, and I suggest that Assembly Members do not have to look far among the people of Wales to find great mistrust of the Government and of the way in which it conducted these affairs.

My only complaint about impeachment—and this is probably the major complaint—is the length of time that the process would take, as it would take much longer than just waiting until the next general election. However, I hope that our colleagues in Westminster will find the methodology for conducting a public investigation into these important matters, because that is needed. The sense of mistrust

weithredoedd yn dderbyniol, a byddwn yn wynebu'r posibilrwydd brawychus o weld yr un sefyllfa yn codi eto. Peidiwch â gadael i Iran gael ei thrin fel Irac. Gadewch inni sicrhau ein bod yn cymryd camau yn awr i atal mwy o waed rhag cael ei dywallt yn y dyfodol.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Diolchaf i Leanne am y ffordd y bu iddi godi'r mater hwn. Ni wnawn ddefnydd digonol o ddarpariaethau adran 33 Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, sy'n caniatáu inni drafod materion sy'n berthnasol i Gymru. Mae effaith y rhyfel yn Irac yn fater sy'n uniongyrchol berthnasol i Gymru nid yn unig o ran materion sy'n ymwneud â diogelwch, ond i'r bobl ifanc sy'n gwasanaethu gyda'r lluoedd arfog.

Bu gwrthwynebiad Plaid Cymru i'r rhyfel yn gyson. Dechreuodd 18 mis yn ôl mewn cyddestun gwleidyddol gwahanol, ac ymfalchïaf yn ein cysondeb wrth wrthwynebu'r rhyfel. Rhaid inni gofio i'r rhyfel yn Irac a'r cysyniad o ragymosodiad newid y cyd-destun gwleidyddol a chysylltiadau rhyngwladol. Atgyfnerthwyd hyn gan y ffaith y bu i Tony Blair sôn am arfau dinistriol y gwyddom erbyn hyn nad oeddent yn bodoli. Mae'r Cenhedloedd Unedig wedi datgan bod y rhyfel yn anghyfreithlon, a chredaf fod uchelgyhuddo yn ffordd ddilys o ddwyn Prif Weinidog y DU i gyfrif, a'i bod yn briodol i'r Cynulliad gefnogi'r ymgyrch honno.

**Michael German:** Diolchaf hefyd i Leanne am gyflwyno'r pwnc hwn ger ein bron heddiw. Hwn, fwy na thebyg, yw'r mater pwysicaf sy'n wynebu ein gwlad, ac awgrymaf nad oes angen i Aelodau'r Cynulliad edrych yn bell i weld nad yw pobl Cymru yn ymddiried rhyw lawer yn y Llywodraeth a'r ffordd yr aeth ati i ymdrin â'r materion hyn.

Fy unig gŵyn o ran uchelgyhuddo—a dyma, fwy na thebyg, yw'r gŵyn fwyaf—yw hyd y broses, gan y byddai'n cymryd llawer hwy na'r cyfnod y byddai'n rhaid aros am yr etholiad cyffredinol nesaf. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiaf y daw ein cyd-aelodau yn San Steffan o hyd i'r fethodoleg ar gyfer cynnal ymchwiliad cyhoeddus i'r materion pwysig hyn, gan fod angen hynny. Rhaid i bobl sy'n

must be cleared up by people who understand the issues. We must clarify the Prime Minister's position to Parliament, particularly in relation to the prerogative powers that he holds, and the role of Parliament in matters of war and peace.

We need to find the answer to the question of what the Prime Minister should have done before taking us to war in Iraq. We need to satisfy ourselves that the public of Wales and of the United Kingdom know the answer to that, and the matter must be properly clarified to our understanding.

**David Davies:** We were told that there were weapons of mass destruction; there were no weapons of mass destruction. The Prime Minister told us that we were getting rid of an evil dictator; he was evil, but there are evil dictators in North Korea and Burma, and we have done nothing about them. There is an evil dictator in Zimbabwe, but we are not sending in the troops; we are sending in the cricket team.

Time after time we have seen high-profile arrests of supposed Muslim terrorists on television, and the television crews and armed police work in conjunction with each other on that. However, there have never been any court cases afterwards. What happens to these people—if indeed they are terrorists? Yesterday, by sheer coincidence on the day of the Queen's Speech, the intelligence agencies briefed the *Daily Mail* about an attack on Canary Wharf. Where are the hijackers? Where are—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I have pressed the red button.

Before I call the Deputy Minister to reply, I should say that this has been a difficult debate for me as Deputy Presiding Officer, because I could have ruled Leanne out of order on several occasions. I thank Members for listening carefully. It is difficult to preside over a debate where the subject is one such as that before us this afternoon. I have not ruled anybody out of order. I believe that the debate has been conducted properly, with careful arguments being deployed, and that is as it should be. However, it is perhaps not

deall y materion hyn geisio cael gwared ar yr ymdeimlad o ddiffyg ymddiriedaeth. Rhaid inni egluro safbwynt Prif Weinidog y DU i'r Senedd, yn arbennig o ran y pwerau braint sydd ganddo, ynghyd â rôl y Senedd o ran rhyfel a heddwch.

Mae angen inni ddod o hyd i'r ateb i'r hyn y dylai Prif Weinidog y DU fod wedi'i wneud cyn mynd â ni i ryfel yn Irac. Mae angen inni fodloni ein hunain fod y cyhoedd yng Nghymru ac yn y Deyrnas Unedig yn ymwybodol o'r ateb hwnnw, a rhaid egluro'r mater mewn ffordd briodol a dealladwy.

**David Davies:** Dywedwyd wrthym fod arfau dinistriol; nid oedd unrhyw arfau dinistr. Dywedodd Prif Weinidog y DU wrthym ein bod yn cael gwared ar unben cythreulig; yr oedd yn gythreulig, ond mae unbeniaid cythreulig yng Ngogledd Korea a Byrma, ac nid ydym wedi gweithredu yn eu herbwn hwy. Mae unben cythreulig yn Zimbabwe, ond nid ydym yn anfon milwyr yno; yn hytrach yr ydym yn anfon y tîm criced.

Dro ar ôl tro, gwelsom achosion mawr yn ymwneud â phobl yr amheuir eu bod yn derfysgwyr Moslemaidd yn cael eu harestio ar y teledu, ac mae'r criwiau teledu a'r heddlu arfog yn cydweithio â'i gilydd yn hynny o beth. Fodd bynnag, ni fu unrhyw achosion llys wedi hynny. Beth sy'n digwydd i'r bobl hyn—yn wir, ai terfysgwyr ydynt? Ddoe, drwy gyd-ddigwyddiad llwyr ar ddiwrnod Araith y Frenhines, cafodd y *Daily Mail* wybodaeth gan yr asiantaethau cudd-wybodaeth am ymosodiad ar Canary Wharf. Ble mae'r terfysgwyr? Ble mae'r—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Pwysais y botwm coch.

Cyn imi alw ar y Dirprwy Weinidog i ymateb, dylwn nodi y bu'r ddadl hon yn un anodd i mi fel Dirprwy Lywydd, oherwydd gallwn fod wedi dyfarnu bod Leanne allan o drefn ar sawl achlysur. Diolchaf i'r Aelodau am wrando'n astud. Mae'n anodd llywyddu dros ddadl ar y cyfryw bwnc ag a gyflwynwyd y prynhawn yma. Nid wyf wedi dyfarnu bod unrhyw un allan o drefn. Credaf i'r ddadl gael ei chynnal mewn ffordd briodol, gyda dadleuon gofalus yn cael eu cyflwyno, a dyna sut y dylai fod. Fodd



without criticism, and I am sure that some of you would feel that some of the phrases used should not have been used. That is as may be, but the judgment that I made at the time was that this debate was being conducted properly and carefully.

**The Deputy Minister for Communities**

**(Huw Lewis):** A wise old head once told me that it is often just as important to think about the motivation behind what is being said as it is to listen to what is actually being said, particularly by a politician. I believe that the true motivation behind this Plaid Cymru debate is not a concern for the consequences and victims of war—still less is it a concern for the victims of the fascistic, Baathist dictatorship of Saddam Hussein—but knee-jerk anti-Labourism, cloaked by the populism of knee-jerk anti-Americanism. Plaid Cymru's aim is to grab headlines through procedural irrelevancies in the House of Commons and to use Assembly procedures to attempt the same. It uses the dreadful issue of war to recruit supporters from the left, who, it feels, are disillusioned with Labour on the issue of Iraq. It does this for votes. It no doubt feels that this is a battle for the soul of the Welsh left—

**Janet Davies:** Will you give way?

**Huw Lewis:** In a moment. I will develop my argument first.

We have heard its interpretation of what the Welsh left should do on the issue of Iraq, now let it hear what Welsh Labour says in response.

Whatever one's sincerely held view on the war with Iraq, we can all agree on one thing: war is ugly. However, procedural self-indulgence and grandstanding from a position of safety, which has been bought over time with the lives of better men and women than any of us, is ugly too.

5.20 p.m.

bynag, efallai nad oedd yn gwbl ddi-fai, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai rhai ohonoch o'r farn na ddylid bod wedi defnyddio rhai o'r ymadroddion a ddefnyddiwyd. Efallai'n wir, ond, ar y pryd, yr oeddwn o'r farn bod y ddadl hon yn cael ei chynnal mewn ffordd briodol a gofalus.

**Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Gymunedau**

**(Huw Lewis):** Dywedodd hen ŵr doeth wrthyf unwaith ei bod yn aml yr un mor bwysig i ystyried y cymhelliant sy'n sail i'r hyn a ddywedir ag y mae i wrando ar yr hyn sy'n cael ei ddweud, yn enwedig gan wleidydd. Nid wyf o'r farn mai pryder ynghylch canlyniadau a dioddefwyr rhyfel yw'r gwir gymhelliant sy'n sail i'r ddadl hon gan Blaid Cymru—ac yn sicr nid pryder ynghylch dioddefwyr unbennaeth Baathaidd, ffasgaidd Saddam Hussein oedd y cymhelliant ychwaith—ond gwrth-Lafuriaeth ddifeddwl o dan gochl poblyddiaeth wrth-Americaniaeth ddifeddwl. Nod Plaid Cymru yw cael sylw yn y wasg drwy adfer gweithdrefnau amherthnasol yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin a defnyddio gweithdrefnau'r Cynulliad i'r un diben. Mae'n defnyddio mater erchyll rhyfel i recriwtio cefnogwyr o'r adain chwith, sydd, yn ei barn, wedi'u dadrithio â Llafur yng nghyd-destun Irac. Gwna hyn er mwyn ennill pleidleisiau. Mae'n siŵr o fod yn teimlo ei bod yn brwydro dros ysbryd yr adain chwith yng Nghymru—

**Janet Davies:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Huw Lewis:** Mewn munud, ar ôl imi ddatblygu'r ddadl ychydig.

Clywsom ei dehongliad o'r hyn y dylai'r adain chwith yng Nghymru ei wneud o ran Irac, yn awr gadewch i'r blaid glywed ymateb Llafur Cymru i hynny.

Beth bynnag yw'ch barn ddiffuant am y rhyfel yn Irac, gall pob un ohonom gytuno ar un peth: mae rhyfel yn beth gwrthun. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ffordd yr ydych yn defnyddio gweithdrefnau yn fympwyol ac i dynnu sylw, a chithau'n byw mewn gwlad ddiogel o ganlyniad i aberth dynion a menywod gwell nag unrhyw un ohonom, yn wrthun hefyd.

**Janet Davies:** What is your motivation, Deputy Minister?

**Huw Lewis:** My motivation is an attempt to put a sincere case to you that what you are saying, and what you are wasting time with in the House of Commons today, is not an attempt to do anything real that will affect the lives of the people of Iraq. There is no reality behind it. Your concern is not with the people of Iraq—it is with the voters of Wales. Many on the Welsh left saw all along the fascist criminality of Hussein's regime. Campaigners like Ann Clwyd pointed to the horrors of genocidal policies against the Marsh Arabs, and the use, many times over, of weapons of mass destruction against the Iraqi Kurds. However, whereas campaigners like Ann have remained true to their convictions, and, post-occupation, have supported the struggle of those who would deliver democracy to Iraq, there are those that have abandoned their natural allies on the Iraqi left to indulge themselves in Blair-bashing and the worst kind of unthinking anti-Americanism.

**David Davies:** Members from all sides of the Chamber have condemned the regimes in Burma and in Zimbabwe. What is your Government doing about them?

**Huw Lewis:** We should stick to the issue at hand here. There are many fights that all of us could be fighting and there must be, at some point, the incursion of reality in terms of the fights that we can engage in and do something constructive about.

**Brian Gibbons:** I wonder how many times David Davies has turned up to meetings in the Assembly organised by oppressed trade unionists across the world fighting for their democratic rights. I do not believe that I have seen him in one of them. If he is consistent, he should put his feet where his mouth is.

**Huw Lewis:** Let us talk about trade unionists, and people like Abdullah Mushin of the Iraqi Federation of Trade Unions—a voice of the Iraqi secular left. Abdullah Mushin now accepts the reality of today's

**Janet Davies:** Beth yw eich cymhelliant, Ddirprwy Weinidog?

**Huw Lewis:** Caf fy nghymell gan ymdrech i gyflwyno achos didwyll ichi i brofi nad yw'r hyn a ddywedwch, na'r hyn yr ydych yn gwastraffu eich amser yn ei wneud yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin heddiw, yn ymgais i wneud unrhyw beth go iawn a fydd yn effeithio ar fywydau pobl yn Irac. Nid oes unrhyw realiti yn sail iddo. Nid oes a wnelo eich pryder â phobl Irac—mae a wnelo â phleidleiswyr Cymru. Gwelodd sawl un o blith yr adain chwith yng Nghymru natur droseddol, ffasgaidd llywodraeth Hussein o'r dechrau. Nododd ymgyrchwyr fel Ann Clwyd erchyllterau'r polisïau hil-leiddiol yn erbyn Arabiaid y Corsydd, a'r defnydd, lawer gwaith, o arfau dinistr yn erbyn Kurdiad Irac. Fodd bynnag, er bod ymgyrchwyr fel Ann wedi glynu'n driw wrth eu credoau, a'u bod, ar ôl i Irac gael ei meddiannu, wedi cefnogi ymdrech y rheini a fyddai'n cyflwyno democratiaeth i'r wlad, mae rhai wedi rhoi'r gorau i'w cynghreiriaid naturiol ar adain chwith Irac er mwyn ymosod ar Blair a chymryd rhan yn yr wrth-Americaniaeth ddifeddwl waethaf.

**David Davies:** Mae aelodau o bob un o bleidiau'r Siambr wedi condemnio'r llywodraethau yn Byrma ac yn Zimbabwe. Beth a wna eich Llywodraeth yn hyn o beth?

**Huw Lewis:** Dylem gadw at y mater dan sylw. Mae sawl brwydr y gallai pob un ohonom fod yn ei hymladd ac, ar ryw adeg, bydd yn rhaid inni fod yn realistig am yr hyn y gallwn frwydro yn ei erbyn a chymryd camau adeiladol yn ei gylch.

**Brian Gibbons:** Tybed sawl gwaith y bu i David Davies fynychu cyfarfodydd yn y Cynulliad a drefnwyd gan undebwyr llafur wedi'u gormesu o bob cwr o'r byd yn ymladd dros eu hawliau democrataidd. Ni chredaf imi ei weld yn yr un ohonynt. Er mwyn bod yn gyson, dylai weithredu yn unol â'r hyn a ddyweda.

**Huw Lewis:** Gadewch inni sôn am undebwyr llafur, a phobl fel Abdullah Mushin o Ffederasiwn Undebau Llafur Irac—sef un o leisiau adain chwith seciwlar Irac. Mae Abdullah Mushin bellach yn

situation and that we have a choice. The choice is to work with progressives in Iraq for democracy, or by omission to offer succour to theocrats, hostage-takers and fascists.

**Owen John Thomas:** Do you not believe that the money being spent on bombing Iraq would be better spent ensuring the pension entitlements of the former workers of Allied Steel and Wire?

**Huw Lewis:** There are no limits, are there, Owen John, to the opportunism—

**Owen John Thomas:** I feel for my fellow Cardiffians who are out of work and losing their pensions. That is immoral, is it?

**Huw Lewis:** There are absolutely no limits to some people's comments. The Iraqi economy has already grown by 50 per cent since the occupation. The rebuilding of Iraq has begun. As you sneered at the rebuilding of Afghanistan, let us see you sneer in a few years' time at the rebuilding of Iraq. Iraqi trade unionists were executed or driven underground by Hussein. At the Labour Party conference, Mushin had this to say to the likes of Plaid Cymru:

'There are grave security problems in Iraq, but those causing them are not, as some have wrongly said, the resistance. They are a mixture of Saddam loyalists and foreign fighters, who, for the first time in Iraq's history, imported the terrible weapon of the suicide bomb'.

Baram Salih, the former Prime Minister of Kurdistan, and a graduate of Cardiff University said

'Like those who shunned us in the eighties—

'us' being the Kurds—

our former friends find the martyrdom of the Iraqi people to be an irritant. They avert their eyes from the grisly truth of our suffering while claiming concern at the human cost of

derbyn realiti'r sefyllfa sydd ohoni a'r ffaith bod gennym ddewis. Y dewis yw gweithio gyda blaengarwyr yn Irac er mwyn sicrhau democratiaeth, neu, drwy beidio â gweithredu, gynnig cymorth i theocratiaid, pobl sy'n cymryd gwystlon a ffasgwyr.

**Owen John Thomas:** Oni chredwch y byddai'n well gwario'r arian sy'n cael ei wario ar fomio Irac ar sicrhau hawliadau pensiwn cyn-weithwyr Allied Steel and Wire?

**Huw Lewis:** Nid oes modd atal, onid oes, Owen John, bobl sy'n gweld eu cyfle—

**Owen John Thomas:** Teimlaf dros fy nghyd-drigolion yng Nghaerdydd sy'n ddi-waith ac yn colli eu pensiynau. Mae hynny'n anfoesol onid yw?

**Huw Lewis:** Mae rhai pobl yn fodlon dweud rhywbeth. Mae economi Irac eisoes wedi tyfu 50 y cant ers i'r wlad gael ei meddiannu. Mae'r broses o ailadeiladu Irac wedi dechrau. Gan ichi ddirmygu'r broses o ailadeiladu Affganistan, gadewch inni eich gweld yn dirmygu'r broses o ailadeiladu Irac ymhen ychydig flynyddoedd. Cafodd undebwyr llafur yn Irac eu lladd neu eu gorfodi i guddio gan Hussein. Yng nghynhadledd y Blaid Lafur, dyma oedd ymateb Mushin i Blaid Cymru a'i bath:

Mae problemau diogelwch dybryd yn Irac, ond nid y gwrthsafwyr sy'n eu hachosi, fel yr honnir yn anghywir gan rai. Maent yn gymysgedd o deyrngarwyr Saddam a milwyr o dramor, a ddefnyddiodd, am y tro cyntaf yn hanes Irac, arf ddychrynlyd bom yr hunanleiddiad.

Dywedodd Baram Salih, cyn-Brif Weinidog Kurdistan, a raddiodd o Brifysgol Caerdydd:

Fel y rhai a'n hanwybyddodd ni yn yr wythdegau—

y'ni' yw'r Kurdiaid—

mae merthyrdod pobl Irac yn gwylltio ein ffrindiau gynt. Maent yn osgoi edrych ar wirionedd arswydus ein dioddefaint tra'n honni eu bod yn pryderu am gost ddynol

war’.

Abandon the Iraqi left now, by howling at Blair, while neglecting to face the reality of what must be done to achieve democracy and, in reality, you advocate turning that country over to the oppressors of women, racial minorities, trade unionists and democrats of any stripe. There have rarely been harder choices for the soul of the left in Welsh politics than those that face us now as fanatics crawl like maggots over the body of Iraqi civil society. However, think for a moment where the counsel of Plaid Cymru and its fellow poseurs would lead us. Between now and January, Iraqi election workers, at risk to their lives, will show great courage as they try to act as midwives to democracy and a new era for their country. They will do so in the hope of attaining freedoms for their people that we take for granted. Perhaps, one day, they will campaign for the removal of a democratically elected leader without being placed in fear of their lives—a privilege that Leanne and her party already enjoy. I just hope that they will have a better cause than the abandonment of those seeking freedom for the sake of headlines.

Plaid Cymru’s record on foreign affairs stinks to high heaven. Plaid Cymru opposed intervention in Kosovo—*[Interruption.]*

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** That is a lie.

**Huw Lewis:** We have had this conversation—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I have pressed the red button, so nothing will be recorded. Ieuan, you must withdraw your statement. It is not permissible in the Chamber to accuse someone of lying.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I was in the House of Commons and I voted in favour of intervention in Kosovo. What Huw Lewis said is not true.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order.

rhyfel.

Drwy gefnu ar adain chwith Irac yn awr, drwy floeddio ar Blair, tra’n osgoi wynebu realiti’r hyn y mae’n rhaid ei wneud er mwyn cyflawni democratiaeth, mewn gwirionedd, byddwch yn cefnogi’r broses o roi’r wlad honno o dan reolaeth pobl sy’n gormesu menywod, lleiafrifoedd hiliol, undebwyr llafur a democratiaid o unrhyw fath. Anaml y bu’n rhaid i’r adain chwith ym maes gwleidyddiaeth Cymru wneud dewisiadau anos na’r rhai sy’n ein hwynebu yn awr wrth i eithafwyr borthi ar gelain cymdeithas sifil yn Irac. Fodd bynnag, meddylwch am ennyd lle y byddai bargyfreithiwr Plaid Cymru a’i chyd-ymhonwyr yn ein tywys. Rhwng heddiw a mis Ionawr, bydd gweithwyr etholiadol yn Irac, a’u bywydau mewn perygl, yn dangos dewrder mawr wrth iddynt geisio cyflwyno democratiaeth a chreu oes newydd yn eu gwlad. Gwnânt hynny er mwyn ceisio ennill rhyddid i’w pobl, rhyddid y cymerwn ninnau yn ganiataol. Efallai, rhyw ddiwrnod, y byddant yn ymgyrchu i gael gwarded ar arweinydd a etholwyd mewn ffordd ddemocrataidd heb orfod ofni am eu bywydau—braint y mae Leanne a’i phlaid eisoes yn ei mwynhau. Gobeithio’n wir y bydd ganddynt well achos na chefnu ar y rhai sy’n ymgyrchu dros ryddid er mwyn denu sylw’r wasg.

Mae record Plaid Cymru o ran materion tramor yn gywilyddus. Gwrthwynebodd Plaid Cymru y cynnig i ymyrryd yn Kosovo—*[Torri ar draws.]*

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Mae hynny’n gelwydd.

**Huw Lewis:** Yr ydym wedi cael y sgwrs hon—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Pwysais y botwm coch, felly ni chaiff unrhyw beth ei recordio. Ieuan, rhaid ichi dynnu eich datganiad yn ôl. Ni ellir caniatáu cyhuddiadau o ddweud celwydd yn y Siambr.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr oeddwn yn Nhŷ’r Cyffredin a phleidleisiais o blaid ymyrryd yn Kosovo. Nid yw’r hyn a ddywedodd Huw Lewis yn wir.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Ieuan, yr ydych

Ieuan, you are a former parliamentarian, therefore, you know how to do these things. Please withdraw your statement and rephrase it suitably, as you know how.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I withdraw the comment, but I make it absolutely clear that what he said is not correct.

**Huw Lewis:** I referred to Plaid Cymru and its leading spokespersons, which include Ieuan Wyn Jones—he is not yet, as I understand it, the embodiment of the party as a whole.

Plaid Cymru opposed intervention in Kosovo, and it was wrong then—*[Interruption.]*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order.

**Huw Lewis:** Plaid Cymru opposed intervention in Afghanistan, and it was wrong then. Ieuan Wyn Jones previously referred to Plaid Cymru's consistency on war issues—he is right in that, because now, in Iraq, Plaid Cymru is faced with a choice between democrats and despots, and it is wrong again.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That concludes business for this afternoon.

yn gyn-Aelod Seneddol, felly, dylech wybod y drefn. A fyddech cystal â thynnu eich datganiad yn ôl a'i aralleirio mewn ffordd addas. Fe wyddoch sut i wneud hynny.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Tynnaf y sylw yn ôl, ond hoffwn ei gwneud yn gwbl glir nad yw'r hyn a ddywedodd yn gywir.

**Huw Lewis:** Cyfeiriais at Blaid Cymru a'i phrif lefarwyr, sy'n cynnwys Ieuan Wyn Jones—nid ef, fel yr wyf yn ei deall, yw'r blaid gyfan eto.

Gwrthwynebodd Plaid Cymru y cynnig i ymyrryd yn Kosovo, ac yr oedd yn anghywir bryd hynny—*[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn.

**Huw Lewis:** Gwrthwynebodd Plaid Cymru y cynnig i ymyrryd yn Affganistan, ac yr oedd yn anghywir bryd hynny. Cyfeiriodd Ieuan Wyn Jones yn flaenorol at gysondeb Plaid Cymru o ran materion yn ymwneud â rhyfel—mae'n llygad ei le yn hynny o beth, oherwydd yn awr, yn Irac, mae Plaid Cymru yn wynebu dewis rhwng democratiaid a gormeswyr, ac mae'n anghywir unwaith eto.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.26 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 5.26 p.m.*

#### **Aelodau a'u Pleidiau Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)

Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Law, Peter (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Marek, John (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)