



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mawrth, 9 Tachwedd 2004**

**Tuesday, 9 November 2004**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 4 Ethol i'r Pwyllgor Busnes  
Election to the Business Committee
- 5 Ethol Cynrychiolydd o Awdurdod yr Heddlu i Gyngor Partneriaeth Llywodraeth Leol  
Election of a Police Authority Representative to the Local Government Partnership Council
- 6 Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog  
Questions to the First Minister
- 31 Datganiad Busnes  
Business Statement
- 36 Datganiad ar Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru  
Statement on the Wales Millennium Centre
- 49 Pwynt o Drefn  
Point of Order
- 52 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Hadau (Rhestrau Cenedlaethol o Amrywogaethau) (Diwygio)  
2004  
Approval of the Seeds (National Lists of Varieties) (Amendment) Regulations 2004
- 53 Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion  
Composite Motion: Approval of Orders
- 56 Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf y Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub (Cynllun Pensiwn y Dynion Tân) (Cymru) 2004 a Rheoliadau Deddf y Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub (Cychwyn) (Cymru) 2004  
Approval of the Fire Rescue Services Act 2004 (Firefighters' Pension Scheme) (Wales) Order 2004 and the Fire and Rescue Services Act 2004 (Commencement) (Wales) Order 2004
- 81 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cynllun y Taliad Sengl ac Amrywiol Gynlluniau Cymorth Uniongyrchol (Apelau) (Cymru) 2004  
Approval of the Single Payment Scheme and Miscellaneous Direct Support Schemes (Appeals) (Wales) Regulations 2004
- 87 Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn y Cwricwlwm Cenedlaethol (Trefniadau Asesu ar gyfer Cyfnod Allweddol 2) (Cymru) 2004 a Rheoliadau y Cwricwlwm Cenedlaethol (Diwygiadau) Canlyniadol (Trefniadau Asesu ar gyfer Cyfnod Allweddol 2) 2004  
Approval of the National Curriculum (Key Stage 2 Assessment Arrangements)(Wales) Order 2004 and the National Curriculum (Key Stage 2 Assessment Arrangements) (Consequential Amendments) (Wales) Regulations 2004
- 99 Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Y Blaid Geidwadol): Y Gwasanaeth y Tu Allan i Oriau Arferol a Gynigir gan Feddygon Teulu  
Minority Party Debate (The Conservative Party): General Practitioner Out-of-Hours Provision

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y lfarwyd hwy ynddi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

**Ethol i'r Pwyllgor Busnes  
Election to the Business Committee**

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I **Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Cynigiau fod  
propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order No. 13.2, elects David Melding (Conservative) to its Business Committee in place of Jonathan Morgan (Conservative). (NDM2146)* *Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 13.2, yn ethol David Melding (Ceidwadwr) i'r Pwyllgor Busnes yn lle Jonathan Morgan (Ceidwadwr). (NDM2146)*

*Cynnig (NDM2146): O blaid 34, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2146): For 34, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Ethol Cynrychiolydd o Awdurdod yr Heddlu i Gyngor Partneriaeth  
Llywodraeth Leol  
Election of a Police Authority Representative to the Local Government  
Partnership Council**

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I **Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Cynigaf fod propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with paragraphs 1(1) and 3 of Schedule 11 to the Government of Wales Act 1998, appoints Cllr Haydn Lewis (Dyfed-Powys Police Authority), representative for the police authorities in Wales, to the Local Government Partnership Council for Wales. (NDM2147)*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â pharagraffau 1(1) a 3 o Atodlen 11 i Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn penodi'r Cynghorydd Haydn Lewis (Awdurdod Heddlu Dyfed-Powys), cynrychiolydd yr awdurdodau heddlu yng Nghymru, yn aelod o Gyngor Partneriaeth Llywodraeth Leol Cymru. (NDM2147)*

*Cynnig (NDM2147): O blaid 35, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2147): For 35, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

## Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister

### Cynigion yn y Gyllideb Ddrafft Draft Budget Proposals

**Q1 The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** Will the First Minister make a statement on the draft budget proposals? (OAQ39041)

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** The draft budget increases our spending power by 21 per cent, from £11.8 billion in 2004-05 to £14.3 billion in 2007-08. This budget will make a real difference to the people of Wales. It is not as big a rate of increase as in the first few years of the Assembly, when the average rate of increase was some 10 per cent a year in cash terms, whereas now it is about 6.5 per cent.

**Nick Bourne:** I am grateful for that response from the First Minister. I wonder whether he could confirm that there is enough funding in the draft budget proposals to cover the disclosure of MRSA cases? In 1996, there were 152 cases and last year there were 481. We are specifically interested in knowing—as are patients and all the people of Wales—the precise figures, trust by trust, for the number of MRSA cases. Will he confirm that?

**The First Minister:** If you were to write to the trusts, I would have thought that they would respond by giving you the figures.

**Nick Bourne:** That is a cop-out. You know very well that the disclosure of the figures is being blocked and that trusts are unable to give the figures, whereas trusts in England are doing so. The Minister made it clear last week that it was not the policy of your Government to disclose the figures. Why is that? When you came to power—and we all remember those heady days four and a half years ago of Morgan's open government pledge—you pledged to make all Assembly information publicly available unless there was an overwhelming reason not to do so. Is the overwhelming reason the fact that it will embarrass the Government to make those

**C1 Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y cynigion ar gyfer y gyllideb ddrafft? (OAQ39041)

**Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan):** Mae'r gyllideb ddrafft yn cynyddu ein gallu o ran gwariant o 21 y cant, o £11.8 biliwn yn 2004-05 i £14.3 biliwn yn 2007-08. Gwnaiff y gyllideb hon wahaniaeth gwirioneddol i bobl Cymru. Nid yw'r cynnydd hwn ar gyfradd mor uchel â'r hyn a gafwyd ym mlynnyddoedd cyntaf y Cynulliad, pan oedd cyfradd y cynnydd ariannol tua 10 y cant y flwyddyn ar gyfartaledd, tra bo bellach tua 6.5 y cant.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am yr ymateb hwnnw gan y Prif Weinidog. Yr wyf yn meddwl tybed a all gadarnhau bod digon o gyllid yn y cynigion yn y gyllideb ddrafft i dalu am ddatgelu achosion o MRSA? Yn 1996, bu 152 o achosion a'r llynedd yr oedd 481. Ymddiddorwn yn benodol mewn cael gwybod—fel y mae cleifion a holl bobl Cymru—yr union ffigurau, fesul ymddiriedolaeth, ar nifer yr achosion o MRSA. A wnaiff gadarnhau hynny?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Pe byddech yn ysgrifennu at yr ymddiriedolaethau, mae'n debyg gennyf y byddent yn ymateb gan roi'r ffigurau i chi.

**Nick Bourne:** Esgus dros beidio â gwneud dim yw hynny. Gwyddoch yn iawn fod camau wedi'u cymryd i atal datgelu'r ffigurau ac na all ymddiriedolaethau roi'r ffigurau, tra bo ymddiriedolaethau yn Lloegr yn gwneud hynny. Eglurodd y Gweinidog yr wythnos diwethaf nad oedd yn bolisi gan eich Llywodraeth ddatgelu'r ffigurau. Pam y mae hynny? Pan ddaethoch i rym—ac yr ydym oll yn cofio'r dyddiau llesmeiriol hynny bedair blynedd a hanner yn ôl pan gafwyd addewid o lywodraeth agored gan Morgan—gwnaethoch addo darparu holl wybodaeth y Cynulliad i'r cyhoedd oni bai fod rheswm hollbwysig dros beidio â gwneud hynny. Ai'r

figures available?

**The First Minister:** There is no cop-out. Provided you do not make it sound complacent, the fact that our MRSA rates are some 35 per cent below those in England, and maybe 25 per cent below those in Scotland, could mean that the figures are rather good. On the other hand you do not want to be complacent, because we think that they could be decreased further. There is no issue about this, no cop-out or change in policy. It has always been the case that anybody who writes to the trusts and asks what the MRSA infection rates are in that trust should expect to receive an accurate answer.

**Nick Bourne:** The First Minister must know that that represents a volte face on what the Minister said last week and is totally at odds with Jon Owen Jones asking for this information to be made available in relation to the University Hospital of Wales because of the case a young lady who lost her toe last week. Are you saying that you are not creating a barrier to this information being made freely available by hospitals throughout Wales? We are finding resistance, and the reason for that is that the Minister for Health and Social Services will not allow those figures to be published.

**The First Minister:** There never was resistance, and there is no justification for resistance. Each trust can supply the figures and the explanation for them. That has always been the case. There has never been any question of a block.

**John Griffiths:** Wales is part of the prosperous world, and there is great need in the developing world. Will you take a close look at the decision of the Scottish Executive to establish an international development fund, and establish a similar fund in Wales to see how we can add value to international development in the UK?

**The First Minister:** I am trying to find out more about what the Scots are proposing,

rheswm hollbwysig hwnnw yw'r ffaith y byddai cyhoeddi'r ffigurau hynny'n peri annifyrrwch i'r Llywodraeth?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni cheisir gwneud esgus. Ar yr amod nad yw rhywun yn swnio'n ddifater am hyn, mae'r ffaith bod ein cyfraddau MRSA tua 35 y cant yn is na'r rhai yn Lloegr, ac efallai'n 25 y cant yn is na'r rhai yn yr Alban, yn golygu bod lle i gredu bod y ffigurau'n eithaf da. Ar y llaw arall, nid yw rhywun am fod yn ddifater, gan ein bod yn credu y gellir eu gostwng ymhellach. Nid oes unrhyw ddadlau ynghylch hynny, nac ymgais i wneud esgus na newid i bolisi. Fel y bu erioed, dylai unrhyw un sy'n ysgrifennu at ymddiriedolaeth gan ofyn beth yw'r ffigurau am heintio ag MRSA yn yr ymddiriedolaeth honno, gael ateb cywir.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn sicr o wybod bod hynny'n newid llwyr i'r hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog yr wythnos diwethaf ac yn gwbl groes i'r hyn a ddigwyddodd i Jon Owen Jones pan ofynnodd am ddarparu'r wybodaeth hon mewn cysylltiad ag Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru oherwydd achos menyw ifanc a gollodd un o fysedd ei thraed yr wythnos diwethaf. A ydych yn dweud nad ydych yn codi rhwystr rhag datgelu'r wybodaeth hon gan ysbytai ledled Cymru? Yr ydym yn cael bod gwrthwynebiad hynny, a'r rheswm yw na wnaiff y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ganiatáu cyhoeddi'r ffigurau hynny.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni fu erioed unrhyw wrthwynebiad, ac nid oes cyfiawnhad dros wrthwynebu. Gall pob ymddiriedolaeth roi'r ffigurau hynny a'u hegluro. Felly y bu erioed. Ni fu erioed unrhyw fath o rwystr.

**John Griffiths:** Mae Cymru'n rhan o'r byd cyfoethog, ac mae angen mawr yn y byd sy'n datblygu. A wnewch edrych yn fanwl ar benderfyniad Gweithrediaeth yr Alban i sefydlu cronfa datblygu rhyngwladol, a sefydlu cronfa debyg yng Nghymru i weld sut y gallwn ychwanegu gwerth at ddatblygu rhyngwladol yn y DU?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn ceisio cael gwybod mwy am yr hyn y mae'r Albanwyr

because, clearly, we do not want to do anything—and neither do the Scots, I am sure—that might be an inefficient way of delivering overseas aid. It is difficult to determine whether aid should be delivered by one central body, and whether that body should be Europe or at the member state level, or whether it should be delivered through the funding of non-governmental organisations and so on. There are non-governmental organisations in Wales that would like us to get involved in projects in areas such as Lesotho or Sylhet. However, we would not want to consider that if we were not absolutely certain that it was done with the full support of the overseas development ministry and all the other bodies involved in overseas aid. We must have regard to efficiency and what is a good method of delivery, while trying to encourage as much volunteerism in this area as possible.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** A wnewch ailystyried eich ateb i Nick Bourne ar ffigurau MRSA? Nid wyf yn gwybod am enghraifft arall o arbenigedd neu salwch lle mae'n rhaid i'r ymddiriedolaethau benderfynu ar ryddhau ffigurau neu beidio: mae'r wybodaeth yn cael ei chasglu gan y Llywodraeth, a'i chyhoeddi ar safle we'r Llywodraeth. A wnewch nodi'n glir nad *cop-out* yw hyn, ac y byddwch chi, fel Prif Weinidog, a'r Gweinidog, yn rhyddhau ffigurau ar gyfer pob ymddiriedolaeth yng Nghymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n fater i'r ymddiriedolaethau ateb y cwestiynau a ofynnir iddynt. Mae gwahaniaeth rhwng yr hyn a ofynnodd Nick Bourne a'r hyn yr ydych chi yn ei ofyn. Mae perygl o gamarwain yma. Os ydych yn siarad am dabl cynghrair ar gyfer MRSA, mae'n amlwg y bydd un ysbyty ar y brig ac un arall ar y gwaelod. Y cwestiwn wedyn yw: faint o ystyriaeth a roddir yn y ffigurau i'r cymysgedd o achosion a geir? Hynny yw, faint o berygl sydd i'r cleifion fydd yn cael eu trin yn yr ysbyty o gael MRSA? Os oes modd creu tabl cynghrair sydd yn hollol deg, ac sydd yn ystyried y cymysgedd gwahanol o achosion a geir, byddem yn barod i'w greu, ond gall fod yn gamarweiniol. Gall yr ysbyty sydd ar y brig fod â record eithaf gwael, ond gall edrych yn dda, oherwydd bod y

yn ei gynnig, gan nad ydym am wneud dim, wrth gwrs—na'r Albanwyr ychwaith, yr wyf yn siŵr—a allai fod yn ddull aneffeithlon o roi cymorth i wledydd tramor. Mae'n anodd penderfynu ai un corff canolog a ddylai roi cymorth, ac a ddylai'r corff hwnnw fod ar lefel Ewrop neu'r aelod wladwriaethau, neu a ddylid ei roi drwy gyllido cyrff anllwydraethol ac yn y blaen. Mae cyrff anllwydraethol yng Nghymru a garai inni ymwneud â phrosiectau mewn ardaloedd fel Lesotho a Sylhet. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddem am ystyried hynny oni bai ein bod yn gwbl sicr bod y weinyddiaeth ddatblygu tramor a'r holl gyrff eraill sy'n gysylltiedig â rhoi cymorth i wledydd tramor yn gwbl gefnogol i hynny. Rhaid inni ystyried yr hyn sy'n fwyaf effeithlon ac yn ddull da o gynnig cymorth, gan geisio hyrwyddo cymaint o wirfoddoli ag y bod modd yn y maes hwn yr un pryd.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Will you reconsider your answer to Nick Bourne on the MRSA figures? I do not know of any other area of expertise or illness for which the trusts have to decide whether or not to release figures: the information is collected by the Government, and published on the Government's website. Will you make it clear that this is not a cop-out, and that you as First Minister, and the Minister, will release figures for every trust in Wales?

**The First Minister:** It is for the trusts to answer the questions asked of them. There is a difference between what Nick Bourne asked and what you are asking. You are in danger of misleading us here. If you are talking about an MRSA league table, it is obvious that one hospital will be at the top, and another at the bottom. The question then is: how much consideration is given in the figures to the case mix? That is, what danger is there of the patients that are to be treated in the hospital getting MRSA? If a league table can be created that is completely fair, and which considers the different case mixes, we would be willing to create one, but it could be misleading. The hospital at the top could have a quite poor record, but appear to be good, because its case mix means that there is no danger of patients contracting MRSA.



cymysgedd o achosion a geir yno yn golygu nad oes perygl i gleifion gael MRSA. Ar y llaw arall, gall yr ysbyty ar y gwaelod fod yn gwneud yn dda, ond ei fod yn edrych yn gamarweiniol o wael.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Onid ydych yn derbyn bod pobl yn ddigon synhwyrol i sylweddoli bod yn rhaid iddynt ystyried y ffigurau mewn ffordd arbennig? Mae pobl yn poeni am hyn ac am wybod beth yw'r gyfradd MRSA yn eu hysbyty lleol. Mae'r ymddiriedolaethau yn gwrthod rhyddhau'r ffigurau gan nad yw'r Llywodraeth wedi gofyn iddynt wneud hynny. Dyfynnaf yr hyn a ddywedodd llefarydd ar ran Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Abertawe:

'The Assembly should not leave the decision to individual trusts, but should stipulate that all trusts should provide figures.'

A wnewch addo gwneud hynny?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r dyfyniad hwnnw yn cadarnhau gwirionedd yr hyn a ddywedais wrth ateb Nick Bourne. Nid oes volte face. Nid ydym wedi creu rhwystr, nac wedi ymyrryd na rhoi terfyn ar unrhyw lythyr gan unrhyw glaf, Aelod Cynulliad neu Aelod Seneddol yn gofyn am wybodaeth ac eglurhad gan unrhyw ysbyty neu ymddiriedolaeth, ac mae'r polisi hwnnw yn parhau.

2.10 p.m.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** You are digging hard. Why do you not realise that you will eventually have to provide these figures? Patients are fed up with your Government's complacent and arrogant attitude. You simply refuse to give a simple answer to a simple question. You have lost credibility on your health policy in general—whether it is MRSA figures, waiting lists or spending too much on bureaucracy. Your credibility on health is in tatters. Unless you are prepared to restore it, it is time to change your policy and Minister.

**The First Minister:** There was no question there; you seemed to run out of steam. I am

Conversely, the hospital at the bottom could be doing well, while appearing to be poor.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Do you not accept that people are sensible enough to realise that they must consider the figures in a certain way? People are worried about this, and want to know the incidence of MRSA in their local hospital. The trusts are refusing to release the figures because the Government has not asked them to do so. I quote what a spokesman has said on behalf of Swansea NHS Trust:

Ni ddylai'r Cynulliad adael i'r ymddiriedolaethau benderfynu ar hyn ar eu pennau eu hunain, a dylai fynnu, yn hytrach, y byddant oll yn rhoi ffigurau.

Will you promise to do that?

**The First Minister:** That quotation confirms what I said in response to Nick Bourne. There is no volte face. We have not created a barrier, interfered or put a stop to any letter from any patient, Assembly Member or Member of Parliament asking for information and an explanation from any hospital or trust, and that policy remains in place.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr ydych yn gwneud eich gorau glas i ddod allan ohoni. Pam na sylweddolwch y byddwch yn gorfod rhoi'r ffigurau hyn yn y pen draw? Mae cleifion wedi diflasu ar ymagwedd ddifater a thrahaus eich Llywodraeth. Yr ydych yn gwrthod rhoi ateb syml i gwestiwn syml. Yr ydych wedi colli hygredded mewn cysylltiad â'ch polisi iechyd yn gyffredinol—boed yn ymwneud â ffigurau ar MRSA, rhestrau aros neu orwario ar fïwrocratiaeth. Mae'ch hygredded o ran iechyd wedi'i dorri'n deilchion. Os nad ydych yn barod i'w adfer, mae'n bryd ichi newid eich polisi a'ch Gweinidog.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni ofynasoch unrhyw gwestiwn; yr oedd yn ymddangos eich bod

wondering what I should do. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Publish the figures.'] Perhaps you should have asked that, rather than believing that a lot of flim-flam is a substitute for an argument or a question. Let us be clear. I recognise one point that you made: I recognise the danger of complacency. It appears that we have the best MRSA figures in Great Britain. We have published the figures; they were given—despite the fact that you are shaking your head—by Dr Tony Howard to the *South Wales Argus*, and Jane Hutt and I have repeated them here. As I said a few minutes ago, the figures are—without wishing to sound complacent—11 cases per 10,000 patient bed days in Wales compared with 15 in Scotland and 17 in England. However, I do not celebrate that, and I do not want to sound complacent, because we want to reduce those figures even further.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** I will turn to another aspect of your budget, First Minister. One of your top 10 manifesto pledges—and a central plank, I assume, of your budget—was to invest £560 million in school buildings. My colleague, Peter Black, has repeatedly questioned the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning on this, but it has taken months to get the answers. It now appears, from the final answer provided by your Minister, that she has confessed that the actual Government investment would fall far short of this amount, with over £90 million of that budget coming from the private funding initiative to fill that gap. Why have you been so reluctant to tell the people of Wales that you are using PFI for what is, I suppose, your flagship policy and promise? Is it because you fear misleading people about the money, which is not all coming from the Assembly purse? Or is it because you know that many of your supporters on the Labour side of the Chamber do not like PFI?

**The First Minister:** I do not think that it is any of those; it is simply a matter of giving the comprehensive figure for investment in school modernisation over the relevant period. If local authorities choose to use PFI, as many have done, for school modernisation,

yn colli stêm. Yr wyf yn meddwl tybed beth a ddyln ei wneud. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'Cyhoeddwch y ffigurau.'] Efallai y dylech fod wedi gofyn hynny, yn hytrach na chredu y gwnâi dwli'r tro yn lle dadl neu gwestiwn. Gadewch inni ddeall hyn. Derbyniaf un pwynt a wnaethoch: derbyniaf fod perygl o fod yn ddifater. Ymddengys mai ein ffigurau ni ar MRSA yw'r rhai gorau ym Mhrydain Fawr. Yr ydym wedi cyhoeddi'r ffigurau; fe'u rhoddwyd—er eich bod yn ysgwyd eich pen—gan Dr Tony Howard i'r *South Wales Argus*, ac mae Jane Hutt a minnau wedi'u hailadrodd yma. Fel y dywedais ychydig funudau'n ôl—11 achos fesul 10,000 o ddyddiau gwely claf yng Nghymru o'i gymharu â 15 yn yr Alban a 17 yn Lloegr. Fodd bynnag, ni farnaf fod hynny'n destun dathlu, ac nid wyf am swnio'n ddifater, gan ein bod yn dymuno gostwng y ffigurau hynny ymhellach byth.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Trof at agwedd arall ar eich cyllideb, Brif Weinidog. Un o'r 10 addewid pennaf yn eich maniffesto—ac elfen ganolog yn eich cyllideb, yr wyf yn cymryd—oedd buddsoddi £560 miliwn mewn adeiladau ysgol. Mae fy nghyd-Aelod, Peter Black, wedi holi'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes am hyn dro ar ôl tro, ond bu'n rhaid aros misoedd i gael yr atebion. Ymddengys bellach, yn ôl yr ateb olaf a roddodd eich Gweinidog, ei bod wedi cyfaddef y bydd y swm a fuddsoddir gan y Llywodraeth mewn gwirionedd yn llai o lawer, ac y daw £90 miliwn o'r gyllideb honno o'r fenter cyllid preifat i lenwi'r bwch hwnnw. Pam y buoch mor amharod i ddweud wrth bobl Cymru eich bod yn defnyddio PFI ar gyfer yr hyn sydd, mae'n debyg gennyf, yn bolisi ac yn addewid pwysig o'ch eiddo? Ai am eich bod yn ofni camarwain pobl ynghylch yr arian, gan na ddaw'r cwbl ohono o bwrs y Cynulliad? Neu ai am y gwyddoch fod llawer o'ch cefnogwyr ar ochr Llafur i'r Siambr nad ydynt yn hoff o PFI?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni chredaf fod yr un o'r rhesymau hynny'n wir; nid yw ond yn fater o roi'r ffigur cyffredinol ar gyfer buddsoddi i foderneiddio ysgolion dros y cyfnod dan sylw. Os yw awdurdodau'n dewis defnyddio PFI i foderneiddio ysgolion, fel y gwnaeth

although at a lower level than in England, that is part of the picture. There are expenditure implications of doing that, but they are spread out over a longer period of years than if you pay in good old-fashioned ratepayers' money, as it were, for your new school. However, both involve school modernisation.

**Michael German:** I do not find that to be satisfactory. This is a matter of trust. You set before the electorate a promise to invest £590 million from the National Assembly in a second term. You now find yourself short of £90 million, and private sector money is filling that gap. How can that be a promise to the people of Wales? You promised to spend the money on school buildings; there was no mention of PFI in your manifesto, just as there was no mention of quangos and their abolition. It has taken repeated questioning of your Minister before you have admitted that PFI is being used to fill the gap. How do you expect people to trust any of your other promises? Should we trust your promise on hospital improvement payments and the hospital building pledge? Is that being funded by PFI? What other promises in your manifesto are not what they seem to be?

**The First Minister:** We do not control how local authorities choose to spend their school improvement money. If they choose to do it via PFI, the money still has to be spent. They are agents, if you like, who make their own decisions as to whether they go for a PFI scheme or the loosely called old-fashioned-ratepayers'-money way of building new schools. We do not control that, so we cannot say that no local authorities, or all local authorities, use PFI. Rhondda Cynon Taf and Caerphilly leapt in and said that they would have some big PFI schemes, but it is important to remember that we cannot control that. It is not a big issue, as I believe you indicated in the preamble to your question. The use of PFI in Wales is modest in comparison with England and Scotland, but it is not a matter that is under our control. If two or three local authorities in Wales go down the PFI route, the money is still spent, but it is spread over a much longer period through the repayment to the PFI consortium.

llawer, er bod y lefel yn is nag yn Lloegr, mae hynny'n rhan o'r darlun. Mae goblygiadau yn hynny i wariant, ond maent yn ymestyn dros fwy o flynyddoedd nag os telir ag arian y trethdalwyr, yn y modd hen ffasiwn, fel petai, am ysgol newydd. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ddau fodd yn arwain at foderneiddio ysgolion.

**Michael German:** Nid yw hynny'n foddhaol yn fy ngolwg i. Mater o ymddiriedaeth yw hyn. Rhoesoch addewid i'r etholwyr i fuddsoddi £590 miliwn o arian y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol mewn ail dymor. Yr ydych bellach yn cael eich bod yn brin o £90 miliwn, ac mae arian y sector preifat yn llenwi'r bwlch hwnnw. Pa fath o addewid yw hynny i bobl Cymru? Addawoch wario'r arian ar adeiladau ysgol; nid oedd unrhyw sôn am PFI yn eich maniffesto, yn union fel nad oedd sôn am ddiddymu cwangos. Bu'n rhaid holi'ch Gweinidog dro ar ôl tro cyn ichi gyfaddef y defnyddir PFI i lenwi'r bwlch. Sut yr ydych yn disgwyl i bobl gredu yn unrhyw un o'ch addewidion eraill? A ddylem gredu yn eich addewid ar daliadau i wella ysbytai a'r addewid ar adeiladau ysbyty? A gaiff hynny ei gyllido drwy PFI? Pa addewidion eraill yn eich maniffesto sy'n gamarweiniol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid ydym yn rheoli'r modd y mae awdurdodau lleol yn dewis gwario eu harian ar wella ysgolion. Os dewisant wneud hynny drwy PFI, rhaid gwario'r arian, er hynny. Asiantiaid ydynt, os caf ei roi felly, sy'n penderfynu drostynt eu hunain ynghylch a ydynt am ddewis cynllun PFI neu'r hyn y gellid ei alw'n ddull hen ffasiwn o godi ysgolion newydd drwy ddefnyddio arian y trethdalwyr. Nid ydym yn rheoli hynny, felly ni allwn ddweud na fydd unrhyw awdurdodau lleol, neu bob un o'r awdurdodau lleol, yn defnyddio PFI. Neidiodd Rhondda Cynon Taf a Chaerffili at y cyfle a dweud y caent rai cynlluniau PFI mawr, ond mae'n bwysig cofio na allwn reoli hynny. Nid yw hyn yn fater o bwys, fel y dywedasoeh yn y rhagymadrodd i'ch cwestiwn, yr wyf yn credu. Ychydig o ddefnydd o PFI a geir yng Nghymru o'i chymharu â Lloegr a'r Alban, ond nid yw'n fater sydd o dan ein rheolaeth. Os yw dau neu dri awdurdod yng Nghymru yn dewis defnyddio PFI, caiff yr arian ei wario, er hynny, ond caiff ei ymestyn dros gyfnod hwy

o lawer drwy ei ad-dalu i'r consortiwm PFI.

**Michael German:** This is not just about PFI: if we accepted that PFI is the way of doing things, we would use it. This is about your promise. Local authorities are not given a choice; they are given the money. There will not be the £590 million that you promised in your manifesto, because of a £90 million shortfall. That £90 million is being made up by the private sector. That is not the promise that you made—you made a promise that £590 million would be put into the pot by the Welsh Assembly Government. The money is not being put in. This reflects a lack of trust in the people of Wales and shows that your promise was a sham.

**The First Minister:** You are becoming over-hysterical about this. The money still has to be spent, be that via PFI or in another way. It is just that the spend is over a long period. You also overestimate the extent to which this affects the whole issue. As I said, PFI is used extensively for school improvements in England, and it is used to a modest degree in Wales. However, it is still part of school improvement expenditure and has to be paid for out of Assembly funding.

**Michael German:** Mae a wnelo hyn â mwy na PFI: pe baem yn derbyn mai PFI yw'r dull gweithredu cywir, byddem yn ei ddefnyddio. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â'ch addewid chi. Ni roddir dewis i awdurdodau lleol; rhoddir arian iddynt. Ni cheir y £590 miliwn a addawoch yn eich maniffesto, gan y bydd yn £90 miliwn yn brin. Gwneir iawn am y diffyg hwnnw o £90 miliwn gan y sector preifat. Nid dyna'r addewid a wnaethoch—addawoch y byddai £590 miliwn yn cael ei roi yn y coffrau gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Ni roddir yr arian. Mae hyn yn arwydd o ddiffyg ymddiriedaeth ym mhobl Cymru ac yn dangos mai twyll oedd eich addewid.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych yn gorgynhyrfu am hyn. Rhaid gwario'r arian ym mha fodd bynnag, boed hynny drwy PFI neu ryw ddull arall. Yr unig wahaniaeth yw y bydd y gwariant dros gyfnod hwy. Yr ydych hefyd yn tybio bod ei effaith ar yr holl fater yn fwy nag y mae. Fel y dywedais, gwneir defnydd helaeth o PFI i wella ysgolion yn Lloegr, a gwneir ychydig o ddefnydd ohono yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhan, er hynny, o'r gwariant ar wella ysgolion a rhaid talu amdano o gyllid y Cynulliad.

### **Mynediad at Wasanaethau Damweiniau ac Achosion Brys Access to Accident and Emergency Services**

**Q2 Catherine Thomas:** Will the First Minister make a statement on what his Government is doing to support access to accident and emergency services in Wales? (OAQ39038)

**The First Minister:** Since 2000, the Assembly has supported trusts' increase of accident and emergency capacity with developments such as the introduction of assessment units. This was reinforced when the Welsh emergency care access collaborative was launched in April. This improvement programme looks at the whole system of emergency care, while focusing on accident and emergency to ensure the timely provision of co-ordinated services.

**Catherine Thomas:** As you know, the 24/7 accident and emergency provision at Llanelli

**C2 Catherine Thomas:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar yr hyn y mae ei lywodraeth yn ei wneud i gefnogi'r mynediad at wasanaethau damweiniau ac achosion brys yng Nghymru? (OAQ39038)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Er 2000, mae'r Cynulliad wedi helpu'r ymddiriedolaethau i gynyddu eu darpariaeth ar gyfer damweiniau ac achosion brys a chafwyd datblygiadau fel cyflwyno unedau asesu. Ategwyd hyn drwy lansio rhaglen gydweithredol Cymru ar gyfer mynediad i ofal brys ym mis Ebrill. Mae'r rhaglen wella hon yn ymwneud â'r system gofal brys yn ei chyfanrwydd, ac yn canolbwyntio ar ddamweiniau ac achosion brys er mwyn sicrhau y caiff gwasanaethau cydlynol eu darparu'n brydlon.

**Catherine Thomas:** Fel y gwyddoch, mae'r ddarpariaeth nos a dydd saith diwrnod yr

hospital was recently restored due to effective partnership working between key bodies and individuals and due to the sheer determination of Llanelli citizens. Do you agree that it is important to acknowledge the role of the Minister for Health and Social Services, who kept in constant touch with the situation, met the local action committee on numerous occasions, and met me many times to discuss the issue? Without her backing and complete support, we would not have achieved our objective and we would not have the 24/7 service that my constituents so desperately need.

**The First Minister:** The difficult situation at Prince Philip Hospital and the action first proposed by the trust gave the people of Llanelli and the surrounding area a huge shock. I am pleased that, after long and tortuous negotiations, in which you, as the local Assembly Member, were involved, and which were led by Jane Hutt and also involved the trust and local GPs, 24/7 cover has now been restored under the leadership of GPs. The service appears to have been well received by the local community, and we should all be happy about that.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Gallech fod wedi cydnabod mai pobl Llanelli a sicrhodd fod y gwasanaeth ar gael, a hynny o ganlyniad i'w hystyfnigrwydd yn wyneb polisiau'r Llywodraeth a'r ymddiriedolaeth. Oni fydddech yn cytuno y bydd methiant llwyr eich Llywodraeth i sicrhau darpariaeth iechyd gynhwysfawr y tu allan i oriau yn arwain at bob uned ddamweiniau ac achosion brys yn derbyn cleifion na ddylent fod yno? Dyma fydd yn digwydd am nad ydych yn darparu'r gwasanaeth priodol y tu allan i oriau.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Na, dim o gwbl. Mae ambell broblem gymharol fach wedi codi, sy'n ddealladwy o ystyried maint y trawsnewid a ddigwyddodd gyda'r contract newydd. Wrth i feddygon teulu ddweud nad oeddent am barhau i gynnig gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau, gwnaed darpariaeth newydd a throsglwyddwyd cyfrifoldeb i'r byrddau

wythnos ar gyfer damweiniau ac achosion brys yn ysbyty Llanelli wedi'i hadfer yn ddiweddar o ganlyniad i gydweithio effeithiol rhwng cyrff ac unigolion allweddol ac oherwydd dyfalbarhad dinasyddion Llanelli. A ydych yn cytuno ei bod yn bwysig cydnabod y rhan a gymerodd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, a gadwodd mewn cysylltiad â'r sefyllfa, a gyfarfu â'r pwyllgor gweithredu lleol ar sawl achlysur, ac a gyfarfu â mi lawer gwaith i drafod y mater? Heb gael cefnogaeth llwyr ganddi hi, ni fyddem wedi cyflawni ein hamcan ac ni fyddai gennym y gwasanaeth dydd a nos saith diwrnod yr wythnos y mae ar fy etholwyr ei daer angen.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr oedd y sefyllfa anodd yn Ysbyty'r Tywysog Philip a'r camau y cynigiwyd eu cymryd gyntaf gan yr ymddiriedolaeth wedi peri braw mawr i bobl Llanelli a'r cylch. Yr wyf yn falch o weld, ar ôl negodiadau hir a throfaus, yr oeddech chi, fel yr Aelod Cynulliad lleol yn ymwneud â hwy, ac a arweiniwyd gan Jane Hutt ac a oedd hefyd yn cynnwys yr ymddiriedolaeth a meddygon teulu lleol, fod y gwasanaeth dydd a nos saith diwrnod yr wythnos wedi'i adfer bellach o dan arweiniad meddygon teulu. Ymddengys fod y gwasanaeth wedi cael croeso mawr gan y gymuned leol, a dylem oll fod yn falch o hynny.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** You could have acknowledged that it was the people of Llanelli who secured the restoration of the service, through their tenacity in the face of the policies of the Government and the trust. Would you not agree that your Government's abject failure to provide a comprehensive out-of-hours service will mean that every accident and emergency unit will be treating patients who should not be there? This will be the consequence of your failure to provide an adequate out-of-hours service.

**The First Minister:** No, not at all. Some minor problems have occurred, but they were to be expected given the extent of the changes under the new contract. As GPs stated that they no longer wished to provide an out-of-hours service, alternative provision was made and responsibility was transferred to the local health boards. Given the extent of

iechyd lleol. O ystyried maint y newid, credaf fod y problemau yn y cyfnod ers dechrau mis Medi, pan ymgymerodd y bwrdd iechyd lleol cyntaf â'i gyfrifoldeb newydd, hyd at ddiwedd yr wythnos hon, pan fydd yr ardal olaf yn dechrau gweithredu'r system newydd, i'w disgwyl wrth sefydlu gwasanaeth enfawr newydd.

**Jonathan Morgan:** How many patients have referred themselves to accident and emergency departments in Wales as a result of problems in accessing the GP out-of-hours service?

2.20 p.m.

**The First Minister:** I cannot tell you now, Jonathan, but I have recently seen a paper that tries to consider the issue statistically—you cannot do it by considering individual motivation, because, as Queen Elizabeth I said when she was told to kill some Catholics, you cannot read into men's minds. I cannot tell you the motivation, but we can make statistical comparisons. There is much less worry about this in the health profession than there is among certain politicians and journalists, and I put that in the nicest possible way. There was a massive increase in the numbers of people using the out-of-hours service just when there was maximum press coverage of the issue. I think that the numbers more than doubled in the second week of October this year, compared with the second week of October last year, and there was massive coverage in the newspapers about the problems, including the case of the lady from Bridgend who was referred to Sheffield and so on. The number of cases went up from 450 to 1,100, I think, in the Cardiff area for about a week. However, that is not the same as what you are asking. I will try to give you the statistical information that I was given, which shows that this is not as big a problem as is being made out, and that the system now appears to be settling down.

the changes, I believe that the problems that will have occurred between the beginning of September, when the first local health board assumed responsibility for the service, and the end of this week, when the last region will have started to operate the new system, were to be expected in putting in place such a major new service.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Faint o gleifion sydd wedi mynd i adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys yng Nghymru o ganlyniad i drafferthion wrth geisio cael y gwasanaeth a gynigir gan feddygon teulu y tu allan i oriau arferol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni allaf ddweud wrthyhch yn awr, Jonathan, ond gwelais bapur yn ddiweddar sy'n ceisio ymdrin â'r mater hwn ar sail ystadegol—ni ellir gwneud hynny drwy ystyried cymhelliant yr unigolyn, oherwydd, fel y dywedodd y Frenhines Elisabeth I pan ddywedwyd wrthi am ladd nifer o Gatholigion, ni ellir darllen meddyliau dynion. Ni allaf ddweud wrthyhch beth yw'r cymhelliant, ond gallwn gymharu ystadegau. Nid oes cymaint o bryder am hyn yn y proffesiwn iechyd ag a geir ymysg rhai gwleidyddion a newyddiadurwyr, a dywedaf hynny yn y modd mwyaf dymunol posibl. Bu cynnydd enfawr yn y nifer a ddefnyddiai'r gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau arferol ar yr union adeg y rhoddwyd sylw mawr i'r mater hwn yn y wasg. Credaf fod y ffigurau wedi mwy na dyblu yn ail wythnos mis Hydref eleni, o'i chymharu ag ail wythnos mis Hydref y llynedd, a chafwyd sylw mawr yn y wasg i'r problemau, gan gynnwys achos y fenyw o Ben-y-bont ar Ogwr a atgyfeiriwyd i Sheffield ac yn y blaen. Cododd nifer yr achosion o 450 i 1,100, yr wyf yn credu, yn ardal Caerdydd am tuag wythnos. Fodd bynnag, nid am hynny yr ydych yn holi. Ceisiaf roi ichi'r wybodaeth ystadegol a roddwyd i mi, sy'n dangos nad yw hon yn gymaint o broblem ag a honnir, a bod y system bellach yn dod i drefn, i bob golwg.

### Digartrefedd yn y Gogledd Homelessness in North Wales

**Q3 Brynle Williams:** Will the First Minister make a statement on homelessness in north

**C3 Brynle Williams:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar ddigartrefedd yn y

Wales? (OAQ39034)

**Q11 Carl Sargeant:** Will the First Minister make a statement on homelessness in Alyn and Deeside? (OAQ39029)

**The First Minister:** Local authorities have responsibility for tackling homelessness within their areas. I am concerned about rising levels of homelessness in north Wales, and we will continue to support the authorities and their partners in addressing this problem.

**Brynle Williams:** I am told on good authority that some homeless people are being housed in 5-star hotels, costing in excess of £100 a night. Will you agree to look into this directly? I am sure that you will agree that immediate, radical action is needed to address this ever-growing problem.

**The First Minister:** I have not heard of homeless people being housed in 5-star hotels, and I am faintly amused at the prospect of it. However, I would not want it to get around on the jungle telegraph, and I would be extremely surprised if it were true. We have significantly increased the social housing grant in the budget for the next three years. That will enable local authorities to meet all of their social housing needs, including housing the homeless. The grant is going up from £59.4 million this year to £96.4 million by the third year, 2007-08. That is a 62 per cent increase. We recognise that there seems to have been an upsurge in homelessness in north Wales, bringing the level of homeless per head of population up to that already prevailing in south Wales. We do not know what the reason for that is, but we believe that the increase in the social housing grant should cover the problem.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I am not usually unable to hear the First Minister, but there seems to be a lot of hubbub, if that is the right word, going on in the right of the Chamber.

**Peter Law:** It is Tory hubbub.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. It sometimes comes from the other side of the Chamber too.

Gogledd? (OAQ39034)

**C11 Carl Sargeant:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar ddigartrefedd yn Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy? (OAQ39029)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae awdurdodau lleol yn gyfrifol am ymdrin â digartrefedd yn eu hardaloedd. Pryderaf ynghylch y cynnydd mewn digartrefedd yn y Gogledd, a pharhawn i helpu'r awdurdodau a'u partneriaid i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon.

**Brynle Williams:** Cefais wybod o le da fod rhai pobl ddigartref yn cael eu cartrefu mewn gwestai pum seren, sy'n costio mwy na £100 y noson. A wnewch gytuno i ymchwilio i hyn ar unwaith? Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch fod angen cymryd camau radical ar unwaith i ymdrin â'r broblem gynyddol hon.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni chlywais am gartrefu pobl ddigartref mewn gwestai pum seren, a chaf fy nghosi braidd gan y syniad hwnnw. Er hynny, ni fyddwn yn dymuno i sion o'r fath fynd ar led, a synwn yn fawr pe bai'n wir. Yr ydym wedi cynyddu'r grant tai cymdeithasol yn sylweddol yn y gyllideb ar gyfer y tair blynedd nesaf. Bydd hynny'n galluogi awdurdodau lleol i fodloni eu holl anghenion o ran tai cymdeithasol, gan gynnwys cartrefu'r digartref. Mae'r grant yn codi o £59.4 miliwn eleni i £96.4 miliwn erbyn y drydedd flwyddyn, 2007-08. Mae hynny'n gynydd o 62 y cant. Derbyniwn fod cynnydd wedi bod mewn digartrefedd yn y Gogledd, i bob golwg, fel bod nifer y digartref fesul pen o'r boblogaeth wedi codi i'r hyn a geir eisoes yn y De. Ni wyddom y rheswm am hynny, ond credwn fod y cynnydd ym maint y grant tai cymdeithasol yn debyg o ddatrys y broblem.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni fyddaf yn methu â chlywed y Prif Weinidog fel arfer, ond ymddengys fod llawer o dwrw, os mai hwnnw yw'r gair iawn, ar ochr dde'r Siambr.

**Peter Law:** Twrw Toriaidd ydyw.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Daw o ochr arall y Siambr hefyd weithiau.

**Carl Sargeant:** Unfortunately, we are working with the council housing legacy left to us by the past Conservative administration, which had one eye on the ballot box. However, despite this unfortunate inheritance, we are working hard to improve our council housing stock. Will you work with the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration to provide grant aid to take forward further programmes for refurbishment and development? That funding would enable local authorities such as Flintshire County Council to provide some of the most needy in society with reasonable accommodation.

**The First Minister:** Indeed, and we are supporting a wide range of front-line projects to prevent and tackle homelessness in north Wales through the homelessness grants programme. Examples include funding for bond schemes in Conwy, Denbighshire and Flintshire, a drop-in and outreach service for young homeless people in Anglesey and direct-access hostels for rough sleepers in Rhyl and Bangor. The increase of 62 per cent in funding for the social housing grant as a whole, which I mentioned earlier, should enable the authorities in north Wales to meet this sudden increase of 45 per cent between 2002-03 and 2003-04 in the numbers of households assessed as being statutory homeless in the six north Wales authorities.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Cefais neges y bore yma am ferch ifanc o ardal Caernarfon sydd wedi'i thaflu allan o'i chartref gan ei phartner ac sydd yn chwilio am lety gan y cyngor. Ni all fynd adref gan fod ei rhieni hefyd yn ddigartref ac yn byw mewn llety gwely a brechwast. Yn wyneb y cynnydd anferth mewn prisiau tai, beth y mae'ch Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i ateb problem pobl fel y ferch ifanc hon a chyplau eraill sydd yn cael eu cau allan o'r farchnad dai?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ateb yw'r cynlluniau a restrais yn gynharach wrth ateb Carl Sargeant. Fodd bynnag, yn y gyllideb ddrafft y mae'r Cynulliad yn parhau i'w ystyried,

**Carl Sargeant:** Gwaetha'r modd, yr ydym yn dygymod â'r sefyllfa o ran tai cyngor a adawyd i ni gan y weinyddiaeth Geidwadol flaenorol, a oedd yn cadw un llygad ar y blwch pleidleisio. Fodd bynnag, er gwaethaf yr ein hetifeddiaeth drist, yr ydym yn gweithio'n galed i wella ein stoc tai cyngor. A wnewch weithio gyda'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio i roi cymorth grant i hyrwyddo rhaglenni ychwanegol ar gyfer adnewyddu a datblygu? Byddai cyllid o'r fath yn galluogi awdurdodau lleol fel Cyngor Sir y Fflint i roi llety derbyniol i rai o'r bobl fwyaf anghenus mewn cymdeithas.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn wir, ac yr ydym yn rhoi cymorth i amryw o brosiectau blaengar i atal a mynd i'r afael â digartrefedd yn y Gogledd drwy'r rhaglen grantiau digartrefedd. Rhai enghreifftiau o hynny yw cyllid ar gyfer cynlluniau bondiau yng Nghonwy, sir Ddinbych a sir y Fflint, a gwasanaeth galw heibio ac estyn allan ar gyfer pobl ifanc ddigartref yn Ynys Môn a hostelau â mynediad uniongyrchol i rai sydd heb do uwch eu pennau yn y Rhyl a Bangor. Mae'r 62 y cant o gynnydd yng nghyllid y grant tai cymdeithasol yn ei gyfanrwydd, a grybwyllais yn gynharach, yn debygol o alluogi'r awdurdodau yn y Gogledd i ymateb i'r cynnydd sydyn hwn o 45 y cant rhwng 2002-03 a 2003-04 yn nifer y teuluoedd yr asesir eu bod yn statudol ddigartref yn y chwe awdurdod yn y Gogledd.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I received a message this morning about a young woman from the Caernarfon area who has been thrown out of her home by her partner and is looking for council accommodation. She cannot return home because her parents are also homeless and are living in bed and breakfast accommodation. Given the massive increase in house prices, what is your Government doing to solve the problems facing people such as this young woman and other couples who are being closed out of the housing market?

**The First Minister:** The solution lies in the schemes that I listed earlier in response to Carl Sargeant. However, in the draft budget, which the Assembly is still considering, the



dylai'r codiad o 62 y cant yn y grant tai cymdeithasol fod yn ddigon i'r chwe awdurdod lleol yn ngogledd Cymru i ymdrin â'r cynnydd uchel hwn o dros 40 y cant yn nifer y bobl ddigartref yn y rhanbarth.

**Denise Idris Jones:** When Brynle Williams highlighted the issue of homelessness, he may have been aiming his comments—and I do not say that he was—at my constituency, and, in particular, Llandudno, where there are 5-star hotels. Homeless people move into that area during the summer months. However, I am sure that you would agree that, working in partnership with the local authority, the local housing association, the chair of the North Wales Hoteliers Association and Mostyn estates, the Assembly has addressed that issue. Will you give me your assurance that you will continue to work with local authorities to ensure that homelessness is given sufficient priority across that area?

**The First Minister:** Perhaps you have the answer, therefore, as to where these 5-star hotels are, if they exist. I will make further inquiries in response to your comment, as well as in response to Brynle's remarks. A high proportion of the hotel stock in Wales is in Llandudno, and, therefore, that may well be where those hotels are situated. I still believe that the increase in the social housing grant will be adequate, despite this sudden surge in homelessness in north Wales. The increase of 44 per cent in north Wales is massive. However, we must be aware that what that does is to bring the level of homelessness per head of population in north Wales up to the level already prevailing in south Wales. Therefore, we now have a problem at a common level throughout Wales.

**Mark Isherwood:** Let us get back to the evidence and the facts from the external housing professionals. Homelessness in Wales rose from 4,297 in 1997 to 9,100 last year. Meanwhile, as house prices have increased, the number of new build affordable houses in Wales has fallen by 78 per cent. The backlog in urgent housing repairs has risen to £4.1 billion and the number of Welsh homes unfit for human habitation has risen to 98,000. What is the connection, First Minister?

increase of 62 per cent in the social housing grant should be sufficient for the six local authorities in north Wales to handle the considerable increase of over 40 per cent in the number of homeless people in the region.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Pan dynnodd Brynle Williams sylw at fater digartrefedd, mae'n bosibl ei fod yn cyfeirio yn ei sylwadau—ac nid wyf yn dweud ei fod—at fy etholaeth i, ac at Landudno yn benodol, lle y ceir gwestai pum seren. Mae pobl ddigartref yn symud i'r ardal honno yn ystod misoedd yr haf. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunech fod y Cynulliad wedi rhoi sylw i'r mater hwn drwy weithio ar y cyd â'r awdurdod lleol, y gymdeithas dai leol, cadeirydd Cymdeithas Gwestywyr Gogledd Cymru ac ystadau Mostyn. A wnewch roi sicrwydd i mi y parhewch i weithio gydag awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau y rhoddir digon o flaenoriaeth i ddigartrefedd yn yr ardal honno?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Efallai mai gennych chi y mae'r ateb, felly, ynghylch pa le y mae'r gwestai pum seren hynny, os oes rhai. Gwnaf ymholiadau pellach mewn ymateb i'ch sylw, ac mewn ymateb i sylwadau Brynle. Mae cyfran helaeth o'r gwestai yng Nghymru yn Llandudno, ac, felly, mae'n ddigon posibl mai yn y fan honno y mae'r gwestai hyn. Daliat i gredu y bydd y cynnydd ym maint y grant tai cymdeithasol yn ddigon, er gwaethaf yr ymchwydd sydyn hwn mewn digartrefedd yn y Gogledd. Mae'r cynnydd o 44 y cant yn y Gogledd yn anferth. Er hynny, rhaid inni gofio mai'r hyn a ddigwydd yw bod lefel y digartrefedd fesul pen o'r boblogaeth yn y Gogledd yn codi i'r lefel a geir eisoes yn y De. Felly, mae gennym broblem sydd ar yr un lefel ledled Cymru'n awr.

**Mark Isherwood:** Gadewch inni fynd yn ôl at y dystiolaeth a'r ffeithiau a gafwyd gan weithwyr proffesiynol allanol ym maes tai. Cododd digartrefedd yng Nghymru o 4,297 yn 1997 i 9,100 y llynedd. Yn y cyfamser, wrth i brisiau tai fynd yn uwch, mae nifer y tai fforddiadwy a godir o'r newydd yng Nghymru wedi gostwng o 78 y cant. Mae cost yr ôl-groniad o atgyweiriadau brys i dai wedi codi i £4.1 biliwn ac mae nifer y cartrefi yng Nghymru sy'n anaddas i bobl fyw ynddynt wedi codi i 98,000. Beth yw'r

cysylltiad, Brif Weinidog?

**The First Minister:** There has been one change in the definition of homelessness in the 2001 Order, which was before your time in the Assembly, but you will probably be aware of it. Therefore it is not quite comparing like with like, but I do not doubt the broad thrust of what you are saying. Obviously, that is one reason why the increase in the social housing grant in the draft budget is so high, taking it from just under £60 million to £96 million in 2007-08. That covers a range of activities, such as the homebuy scheme, for local authorities to cover the problems created by the sudden surge in house prices—which is continuing in Wales, although it is beginning to slack off now—and, similarly, to tackle homelessness, which is what this question was originally about, and a range of other social housing issues. That is a big increase, and it will need to be used in partnership with the stakeholders, as Denise Idris Jones said, to ensure that it copes with the four or five types of social housing needs problems across north Wales.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Bu un newid i'r diffiniad o ddigartrefedd yng Ngorchymyn 2001, a wnaed cyn ichi ddod i'r Cynulliad, ond mae'n debyg y gwyddoch amdano. Felly ni chymherir tebyg â'i debyg, ond nid wyf yn amau nad yw swm a sylwedd yr hyn a ddywedwch yn wir. Wrth gwrs, dyna un rheswm y ceir cymaint o gynnydd yn y grant tai cymdeithasol yn y gyllideb ddrafft, gan ei fod yn codi o ychydig o dan £60 miliwn i £96 miliwn yn 2007-08. Mae hwnnw'n cynnwys amryw o weithgareddau, fel y cynllun cymorth prynu, fel y gall awdurdodau lleol ymateb i'r problemau a greir gan gynnydd sydyn ym mhrisiau tai—sy'n parhau yng Nghymru, er ei fod yn dechrau arafu'n awr—ac, yn yr un modd, i fynd i'r afael â digartrefedd, sef testun gwreiddiol y cwestiwn hwn, ac amryw o faterion eraill sy'n ymwneud â thai cymdeithasol. Mae hwnnw'n gynnydd mawr, a bydd yn rhaid ei ddefnyddio mewn partneriaeth â'r rhanddeiliaid, fel y dywedodd Denise Idris Jones, i sicrhau y bydd yn delio â'r pedwar neu bum math o broblem o ran anghenion sy'n ymwneud â thai cymdeithasol ledled y Gogledd.

#### **Cleifion â Chanser Cancer Patients**

**Q4 Lynne Neagle:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the support provided to cancer patients in Wales? (OAQ39035)

**C4 Lynne Neagle:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar y cymorth a roddir i gleifion cancer yng Nghymru? (OAQ39035)

**The First Minister:** Tackling cancer remains one of the Welsh Assembly Government's top priorities for the NHS in Wales. Our strategy for improving services and access to a wide range of treatments is through the progressive implementation of our national standards of cancer care and the advice of the National Institute for Clinical Excellence, known as NICE.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ymdrin â chanser yw un o brif flaenoriaethau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer y GIG yng Nghymru o hyd. Dilynwn ein strategaeth ar gyfer gwella gwasanaethau a mynediad at amrywiaeth mawr o driniaethau drwy roi ar waith yn raddol ein safonau gofal cancer cenedlaethol a chyngor y Sefydliad Rhagoriaeth Glinigol Genedlaethol, a elwir yn NICE.

**Lynne Neagle:** As you may be aware, Macmillan Cancer Relief is visiting the Assembly this week to raise awareness of its campaign for improvements to the benefit system for people with cancer. Macmillan's research reveals that nearly a third of patients with terminal cancer in Wales do not claim their benefit entitlement, with more than £4

**Lynne Neagle:** Fel y gwyddoch efallai, mae Macmillan Cancer Relief yn ymweld â'r Cynulliad yr wythnos hon i hybu ymwybyddiaeth o'i ymgyrch dros welliannau i'r system fudd-daliadau ar gyfer pobl sydd â chanser. Mae ymchwil Macmillan yn dangos nad yw bron i draean y cleifion â chanser angheuol yn hawlio'r budd-daliadau y maent

million in benefits left unclaimed. While responsibility for the benefits system remains with the UK Government, there are steps that the Assembly can take to address this problem. Will you agree to examine the case for closer collaboration between the NHS in Wales and the Department for Work and Pensions, so that every cancer patient is offered swift access to advice following diagnosis? Will you join me in supporting Macmillan Cancer Relief's call on the UK Government to ensure that the benefits system is more accessible and responsive to the needs of people with cancer?

2.30 p.m.

**The First Minister:** I agree, and that point was made clearly by Jane Hutt in February 2004 when she announced the results of the review of the advice programme, which we paid for, that general practitioners, practice nurses and others in the primary care setting provide to people with cancer as well as those with other health-related benefit needs. For the year up to February 2004, Jane Hutt stated that there were around 10,732 new enquiries, £3.5 million in confirmed benefits and that 6,455 clients had been seen in that health setting to acquire better access without stigma. The GP or another health professional in the primary care setting refers the individual to the citizens advice bureau, which takes away much of the stigma attached to applying for benefits, and that is the key to trying to get this going. She also pointed out that schemes are up and running in all 22 local authorities in Wales.

**Kirsty Williams:** Cancer patients awaiting surgical treatment at hospitals have a right to know the MRSA rate for each hospital that they are about to enter. I have written to every trust in Wales requesting those figures and I can assure you that they will not provide them on demand as you suggested earlier. They are waiting for a lead from the Minister for Health and Social Services on developing a framework by which different methods of collection can be brought into one

yn gymwys i'w derbyn, a bod gwerth mwy na £4 miliwn o fudd-daliadau heb ei hawlio. Er mai Llywodraeth y DU sy'n gyfrifol o hyd am y system fudd-daliadau, mae camau y gall y Cynulliad eu cymryd i ymdrin â'r broblem hon. A wnewch gytuno i ystyried yr achos dros gael cydweithio agosach rhwng y GIG yng Nghymru a'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau, fel y caiff pob claf sydd â chanser gynnig cyfle i gael cyngor ar ôl cael diagnosis? A wnewch ymuno â mi i gefnogi galwad Macmillan Cancer Relief ar i Lywodraeth y DU sicrhau bod y system fudd-daliadau'n fwy hygyrch ac ymatebol i anghenion pobl sydd â chanser?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cytunaf, a gwnaed y pwynt hwnnw'n glir gan Jane Hutt yn Chwefror 2004 pan gyhoeddodd ganlyniadau'r adolygiad o'r rhaglen gynghori, y talwyd amdani gennym ni, y mae meddygon teulu, nyrsys practis ac eraill ym maes gofal sylfaenol yn ei darparu i bobl sydd â chanser yn ogystal ag eraill sydd ag anghenion o ran budd-daliadau sy'n gysylltiedig ag iechyd. Ar gyfer y flwyddyn hyd at Chwefror 2004, dywedodd Jane Hutt fod tua 10,732 o ymholiadau newydd, bod gwerth £3.5 miliwn o fudd-daliadau wedi'u cadarnhau a bod 6,455 o gleientiaid wedi'u gweld yn y maes iechyd hwnnw fel y gallant gael gwell mynediad heb unrhyw waradwydd. Mae meddyg teulu neu weithiwr iechyd proffesiynol arall ym maes gofal sylfaenol yn atgyfeirio'r unigolyn i'r ganolfan cyngor ar bopeth, ac mae hynny'n fodd i ddileu llawer o'r gwaradwydd o ran ymgeisio am fudd-daliadau, a dyna'r modd i geisio rhoi hyn ar waith. Nododd hefyd fod cynlluniau'n rhedeg ym mhob un o'r 22 o awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru.

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae hawl gan gleifion sydd â chanser sy'n disgwyl am lawdriniaeth mewn ysbytai gael gwybod am y gyfradd MRSA ar gyfer pob ysbyty y maent ar fin mynd iddo. Yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at bob ymddiriedolaeth yng Nghymru gan ofyn am y ffigurau hynny a gallaf eich sicrhau na wnânt eu darparu ar gais fel yr awgrymasoch yn gynharach. Maent yn disgwyl am arweiniad gan y Gweinidog dros iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar ddatblygu

so that similar figures can be compared fairly. Will you ask Jane Hutt to provide that fiscal lead and the framework, as I have done, so that patients, cancer or otherwise, can access these figures?

**The First Minister:** We cannot have different versions of the same question asked by the Liberal Democrats, Plaid Cymru and the Conservatives. They all disagree with each other while pretending to ask the same question. Ieuan Wyn Jones accepts that trusts can provide the figures, while Nick Bourne thinks that they cannot, and now Kirsty says that she has written to all the trusts. As far as I am aware, there is no block on or discouragement regarding the provision of figures on MRSA by trusts. If you have a constructive suggestion on how an adjusted-for, case-mix set of figures could be published, then I would be interested if you could write to me on that. All of the people in the field state that it cannot be done, which is why it is important that the individual concerned, or his or her political representative, writes to the trust concerned, requesting the figures on MRSA.

**Kirsty Williams:** I have written to them.

**The First Minister:** Therefore, the trusts should supply those figures. There is no reason why they should not.

**David Melding:** Do you agree that we have a long way to go before we have the most modern possible diagnostic services, which means far longer waiting lists than is appropriate for people with cancer?

**The First Minister:** Yes, of course. We would always like to have a greater range of MRI and CAT scanners and all manner of such equipment. I believe that that is not the case with linear accelerator machines, but we could do with more scanners of both kinds.

fframwaith i gyfuno gwahanol ddulliau casglu fel y gellir cymharu ffigurau tebyg yn deg. A wnewch ofyn i Jane Hutt roi'r arweiniad cyllidol hwnnw a'r fframwaith hwnnw, fel y gwneuthum i, fel y bydd cleifion â chanser, a chleifion eraill, yn gallu cael y ffigurau hynny?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni allwn gael gwahanol fersiynau o'r un cwestiwn gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, Plaid Cymru a'r Ceidwadwyr. Maent i gyd yn anghytuno â'i gilydd gan gymryd arnynt ofyn yr un cwestwn. Mae Ieuan Wyn Jones yn derbyn y gall ymddiriedolaethau ddarparu'r ffigurau, tra cred Nick Bourne na allant, a dywed Kirsty yn awr ei bod wedi ysgrifennu at yr holl ymddiriedolaethau. Hyd y gwn i, nid oes rhwystr neu wrthanogaeth ynghylch darparu ffigurau ar MRSA gan ymddiriedolaethau. Os oes gennych awgrym adeiladol ynghylch y modd y gellid cyhoeddi set o ffigurau cymwysedig sy'n seiliedig ar gymysgedd o achosion, byddai o ddiddordeb i mi os gallech ysgrifennu ataf yn ei gylch. Dywed pawb yn y maes na ellir gwneud hynny, a dyna pam y mae'n bwysig i'r unigolyn dan sylw, neu ei gynrychiolydd gwleidyddol, ysgrifennu at yr ymddiriedolaeth dan sylw, gan ofyn am y ffigurau ar MRSA.

**Kirsty Williams:** Yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu atynt.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Felly, dylai'r ymddiriedolaethau roi'r ffigurau hynny. Nid oes reswm iddynt beidio.

**David Melding:** A ydych yn cytuno bod gennym lawer i'w wneud eto cyn y cawn y gwasanaethau diagnostig mwyaf modern posibl ac, oherwydd hynny, fod y rhestrau aros yn llawer hwy na'r hyn sy'n briodol i bobl sydd â chanser?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ydwyf, wrth gwrs. Carem gael mwy o ddewis o sganwyr MRI a CAT a phob math o offer o'r fath. Ni chredaf fod hynny'n wir am beiriannau cyflymu llinol, ond byddai'n dda inni wrth fwy o sganwyr o'r ddau fath.

### **Indrawn a Addaswyd yn Enynnol Genetically Modified Maize**

**Q5 Mick Bates:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the implications for Wales of the European Commission decision to make 17 types of genetically modified maize available for planting throughout the EU? (OAQ39055)

**The First Minister:** Implications are unlikely because the GM maize varieties recently approved for use in the EU are unsuited to our growing conditions.

**Mick Bates:** Thank you for another complacent answer regarding GM developments in Europe. The only Welsh farmer ever to grow GM in Wales has announced today that he would grow GM again. The Commission's decision was endorsed by David Byrne, the EU Health and Consumer Protection Commissioner, who said that it was a logical step. This is another step towards bringing GM maize to Wales, whatever you say about the resistance to insects of these 17 varieties. Why are you so reluctant to admit that and introduce protection for Welsh farmers and, in particular, Welsh organic growers?

**The First Minister:** The 17 varieties of GM maize all derive from Monsanto's MON810 line, which has been grown extensively in Spain since 1998, because it makes it resistant to the crop borer. The crop borer is not a pest in this country, therefore there are no reasons why any farmer here would derive any agricultural benefit from growing MON810 rather than other forms of maize which ripen earlier. We do not have the crop borer, or at least the pest levels in this country.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Surely you must agree that the political message sent by the listing of these maize types, along with the apparent willingness of a tiny minority of farmers in Wales to grow GM crops, puts the Assembly Government's policy on taking the most restrictive approach possible to GM, under some kind of a threat? Do you agree that it is time for the Assembly cross-party GM strategy group to be reconvened, so that all parties in the Assembly can support the Government in the work that you are trying to do to keep Wales as GM-free as possible?

**C5 Mick Bates:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar y goblygiadau i Gymru yn sgîl penderfyniad y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd i ddarparu 17 gwahanol fath o indrawn GM i'w plannu ledled yr UE? (OAQ39055)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid yw'n debyg bod goblygiadau yn hynny gan fod yr amrywogaethau o indrawn GM sydd wedi'u cymeradwyo'n ddiweddar i'w defnyddio yn yr UE yn anaddas i'r amodau tyfu a geir yma.

**Mick Bates:** Diolch i chi am ateb difater arall arall ynghylch datblygiadau GM yn Ewrop. Mae'r unig ffermwr yng Nghymru a dyfodd gnydau GM yng Nghymru erioed wedi cyhoeddi heddiw y byddai'n barod i dyfu cnydau GM eto. Cadarnhawyd penderfyniad y Comisiwn gan David Byrne, Comisiynydd Iechyd a Gwarchod Defnyddwyr yr UE, a ddywedodd ei fod yn gam rhesymegol. Dyma gam arall tuag at ddod ag indrawn GM i Gymru, beth bynnag a ddywedwch am allu'r 17 awrywogaeth hyn i wrthsefyll pryfed. Pam yr ydych mor amharod i dderbyn hynny ac i gyflwyno amddiffyniad i ffermwyr Cymru ac, yn benodol, i dyfwyr organig yng Nghymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r 17 amrywogaeth o indrawn GM i gyd yn deillio o linach MON810 Monsanto, sydd wedi'i dyfu'n helaeth yn Sbaen er 1998, gan ei fod yn gwrthsefyll tyllbryfed. Nid yw'r tyllbryf yn bla yn wlad hon, felly nid oes lle i greu y câi unrhyw ffermwr yma unrhyw fudd amaethyddol o dyfu MON810 yn hytrach nag unrhyw fath arall o indrawn sy'n aeddfedu'n gynt. Nid oes gennym dyllbryfed, neu'r un lefelau o blâu o leiaf, yn y wlad hon.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yr ydych yn sicr o gytuno bod y neges wleidyddol a gyfleir drwy restru'r mathau hyn o indrawn, a'r parodrwydd amlwg ar ran lleiafrif bach o ffermwyr yng Nghymru i dyfu cnydau GM, yn rhyw fath o fygythiad i bolisi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o ymdrin ag addasu genynnol yn y modd mwyaf cyfyngiadol posibl. A ydych yn cytuno ei bod yn bryd ailgynull grŵp trawsbleidiol y Cynulliad ar y strategaeth addasu genynnol, fel y gall yr holl bleidiau yn y Cynulliad gefnogi'r Llywodraeth yn y gwaith yr ydych yn ceisio'i wneud i gadw

Cymru mor rhydd oddi wrth addasu genynnol ag y bo modd?

**The First Minister:** We do not have plans to reconvene the all-party GM strategy group. We agree with the spirit that lies behind it, in terms of a consensual approach, despite the odd flurry of disagreement over the nature of the political message. In general, there has been complete cross-party support for adopting the most restrictive possible policy within the law in terms of licensing, or rather not licensing GM crops to be grown in Wales. I hope that we can continue with that consensual cross-party approach. At the moment, we do not see a threat from the development in September, when the 17 varieties, all virtually based on MON 810 GM maize, were approved on a pan-European basis. I am advised that they are only valuable in areas where the corn borer is a pest, where maize ripens late in the season, which cannot happen in Wales.

**Glyn Davies:** The biggest concern about GM crops is the impact that they have on the environment. It does not make much difference, in terms of the impact on Wales, whether the crop is grown in England or Wales. What steps have you taken in your discussions with Ministers in England to ensure that the same kind of restrictive approach is adopted in England as in Wales?

**The First Minister:** We have ploughed this particular furrow on several occasions. I do not want to take my erudition on matters relating to these cross-contamination cordon sanitaires well beyond where it is, so it is better if I ask Carwyn to write to you to explain our current understanding. My understanding is that before anyone could grow this crop, should they choose to do so to make a political point in the way that Helen Mary referred to earlier, all four UK agriculture Ministers would still have to agree on the issue of cross-contamination distances and so forth. I will ask Carwyn to write to you further on that point.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid oes gennym fwriad i ailgynnull y grŵp trawsbleidiol ar y strategaeth addasu genynnol. Cytunwn â'r meddylfryd sy'n sail iddo, o ran cael dull gweithredu cytûn, er gwaethaf yr anghytuno a geir weithiau ar natur y neges wleidyddol. Yn gyffredinol, cafwyd cefnogaeth lwyr gan yr holl bleidiau i fabwysiadu'r polisi mwyaf cyfyng posibl o dan y gyfraith o ran trwyddedu, neu, yn hytrach, peidio â thrwyddedu cynydau GM i'w tyfu yng Nghymru. Gobeithiaf y gallwn barhau â'r dull gweithredu trawsbleidiol cytûn hwnnw. Ar hyn o bryd, ni welwn fygythiad o'r datblygiad ym mis Medi, pan gymeradwywyd y 17 o amrywogaethau, a bron bob un ohonynt yn deillio o indrawn GM MON810, ledled Ewrop. Yr wyf wedi fy hysbysu nad ydynt ond yn werthfawr mewn ardaloedd lle y mae tyllwr yr ŷd yn bla, lle y mae indrawn yn aeddfedu'n hwyr yn y tymor, ac ni all hynny ddigwydd yng Nghymru.

**Glyn Davies:** Y pryder mwyaf ynghylch cynydau GM yw eu heffaith ar yr amgylchedd. Ni wnaiff fawr o wahaniaeth, o ran yr effaith ar Gymru, pa un a dyfir y cnwd yn Lloegr neu yng Nghymru. Pa gamau a gymerasoch yn eich trafodaethau â Gweinidogion yn Lloegr i sicrhau mabwysiadu'r un math o ddull gweithredu cyfyngiadol yn Lloegr ag a geir yng Nghymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym wedi trafod y mater penodol hwn ar sawl achlysur. Nid wyf am draethu lawer mwy am fy ngwybodaeth am faterion sy'n ymwneud â chadwynau iechydol i atal croes-halogi, felly mae'n well imi ofyn i Carwyn ysgrifennu atoch i egluro'n dealltwriaeth bresennol. Yn ôl yr hyn yr wyf yn ei ddeall, cyn y gall unrhyw un dyfu'r cnwd hwn, os yw'n dewis gwneud hynny i wneud pwynt gwleidyddol yn y modd y cyfeiriodd Helen Mary ato'n gynharach, byddai gofyn o hyd i bob un o bedwar Gweinidog amaethyddiaeth y DU gytuno ar fater pellteroedd croes-halogi ac yn y blaen. Gofynnaf i Carwyn ysgrifennu atoch i ymdrin ymhellach â'r pwynt hwnnw.

## **Digartrefedd Homelessness**

**Q6 Peter Black:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the level of homelessness in Wales? (OAQ39042)

**The First Minister:** I am concerned about the rising level of homelessness recorded in Wales. This is partly due to the change in housing market conditions. We are working to tackle this problem through guidance, our capital and revenue funding programmes, and the national homelessness strategy, which is currently under review.

**Peter Black:** The Land Registry figures show that prices continue to rise faster in Wales than elsewhere. Your Government, through one of the Bills it is seeking to get from the Westminster Government, is seeking to vary the right to buy scheme. Will you press the Westminster Government hard so that the Welsh Assembly Government is given the powers to vary the right to buy scheme, so that it can suspend it where there are high demand areas?

**The First Minister:** We have already adjusted the scheme, as you know. That has been in response to increasing levels of homelessness. You are right to say that the latest figures, published yesterday, indicate that house price rises, at a rate of 28 per cent, were greater in Wales over the 12 months to October than in any other part of the United Kingdom. Prices in some areas, such as Ynys Môn, have risen by 44 per cent. House price rises come in waves—they have probably stopped in Cardiff, but prices are still rising in areas where they did not previously rise rapidly in 2002-03. Prices in areas such as Blaenau Gwent and Merthyr catch up perhaps two years after Ynys Môn; likewise the price wave hit Cardiff a year after the great wave of house prices hit London. It has stopped in Cardiff and will presumably cool off in other areas, because there is a considerable change in the mood of the housing market in general in the United Kingdom, due to recent interest rate increases.

**C6 Peter Black:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar lefel digartrefedd yng Nghymru? (OAQ39042)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Pryderaf ynghylch y cynnydd yn lefel digartrefedd a gofnodwyd yng Nghymru. Mae hyn yn ganlyniad yn rhannol i'r newid yn amodau'r farchnad dai. Yr ydym yn ceisio delio â'r broblem hon drwy roi canllawiau, drwy ein rhaglenni cyllid cyfalaf a refeniw, a'r strategaeth digartrefedd genedlaethol, sy'n cael ei hadolygu ar hyn o bryd.

**Peter Black:** Dengys ffigurau'r Gofrestrfa Dir fod prisiau'n dal i godi'n gynt yng Nghymru nag mewn mannau eraill. Mae'ch Llywodraeth, drwy un o'r Mesurau y mae'n ceisio'u cael gan Lywodraeth San Steffan, yn ceisio newid cynllun yr hawl i brynu. A wnewch bwysio'n galed ar Lywodraeth San Steffan fel y rhoddir pwerau i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i newid cynllun yr hawl i brynu, fel y gall ei atal mewn ardaloedd lle y mae galw mawr?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym eisoes wedi addasu'r cynllun, fel y gwyddoch. Gwnaed hynny mewn ymateb i lefelau digartrefedd cynyddol. Yr ydych yn iawn wrth ddweud bod y ffigurau diweddaraf, a gyhoeddwyd ddoe, yn dangos bod y cynnydd ym mhrisiau tai, ar gyfradd o 28 y cant, yn fwy yng Nghymru dros y 12 mis hyd fis Hydref nag mewn unrhyw ran arall o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Mae prisiau mewn rhai ardaloedd, megis Ynys Môn, wedi codi o 44 y cant. Ceir tonnau o godiadau ym mhrisiau tai—mae'n debyg eu bod wedi dod i ben yng Nghaerdydd, ond mae prisiau'n dal i godi mewn ardaloedd lle na wnaethant godi'n gyflym o'r blaen yn 2002-03. Bydd prisiau mewn ardaloedd fel Blaenau Gwent a Merthyr Tudful yn codi ddwy flynedd ar ôl rhai Ynys Môn o bosibl; yn yr un modd, daeth y don o godiadau prisiau i Gaerdydd flwyddyn ar ôl y don fawr o godiadau ym mhrisiau tai yn Llundain. Daeth i ben yng Nghaerdydd ac mae'n debyg y bydd yn arafu mewn ardaloedd eraill, gan fod cryn newid yn hwyliau'r farchnad dai yn gyffredinol yn y DU, oherwydd y codiadau diweddar yn y

cyfraddau llog.

2.40 p.m.

**Leanne Wood:** While I accept that the changes in definitions and in market conditions will add to the homeless figures, you must also accept that another major reason for this increase is the reduction of the social housing available. In England, £450 million of public money has been announced for social housing, in addition to the money that will be made available from the private finance initiative and savings from sacking all those civil servants. Your budget increase for social housing goes nowhere near towards solving this homelessness problem. How will you match England's spending?

**Leanne Wood:** Er fy mod yn derbyn y bydd newid diffiniadau ac amodau'r farchnad yn peri cynnydd yn y ffigurau digartrefedd, rhaid ichi dderbyn hefyd mai un o'r prif resymau eraill dros y cynnydd hwn yw'r gostyngiad yn nifer y tai cymdeithasol sydd ar gael. Yn Lloegr, cyhoeddwyd y bydd £450 miliwn o arian cyhoeddus ar gael ar gyfer tai cymdeithasol, yn ogystal â'r arian a fydd ar gael o'r fenter cyllid preifat ac arbedion ar ôl diswyddo nifer fawr o weision sifil. Mae'r cynnydd yn eich cyllideb ar gyfer tai cymdeithasol ymhell o fod yn ddigon i ddatrys y broblem hon o ddigartrefedd. Sut y byddwch yn gallu gwario cymaint ag y mae Lloegr?

**The First Minister:** It is not a matter of matching England's spending, it is a matter of meeting Wales's housing needs. That is how we always allocate our budgets, otherwise there is not much point in our turning up here. The 62 per cent increase, from £59 million to £96 million, over the next three years is adequate to do the job. That will cover social housing grants, and will therefore cover homelessness and homebuy, and all the other definitions of social housing grant. It is then up to local authorities to decide exactly how they will apply that in their local area. However, it is a whacking 62 per cent increase, and, working with local authorities and registered social landlords, that will do the job.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid yw'n fater o wario cymaint â Lloegr, ond, yn hytrach, o ddiwallu anghenion tai Cymru. Dyna'r modd y byddwn yn dyrannu ein cyllidebau bob amser neu, fel arall, ni fyddai fawr o ddiben inni ddod yma. Mae'r 62 y cant o gynnydd, o £59 miliwn i £96 miliwn, dros y tair blynedd nesaf yn ddigon i fynd â'r maen i'r wal. Bydd hynny'n ddigon ar gyfer grantiau tai cymdeithasol, ac felly'n ddigon ar gyfer digartrefedd a'r cynllun cymorth prynu, a'r holl bethau eraill y defnyddir y grant tai cymdeithasol ar eu cyfer. Lle'r awdurdodau lleol wedyn yw penderfynu sut yn union y defnyddiant hynny yn eu hardal leol. Fodd bynnag, mae'n gynnydd anferth o 62 y cant, a, drwy weithio gydag awdurdodau lleol a landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig, bydd hynny'n ddigon i fynd â'r maen i'r wal.

### **Effaith Dyledion ar Ddatblygu Economaidd The Effect of Debt on Economic Development**

**Q7 Jenny Randerson:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the effect of growing debt on economic development in Wales? (OAQ39040)

**C7 Jenny Randerson:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar effaith dyledion cynyddol ar ddatblygu economaidd yng Nghymru? (OAQ39040)

**The First Minister:** We want to see the growing level of debt stabilise as the emphasis in the economy and the drivers of growth in the economy switch from the expansion of consumer credit and house price rises towards business investment, the

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym am weld sefydlogi ar y lefel gynyddol o ddyledion wrth i'r pwyslais yn yr economi ac ysgogwyr cynnydd yn yr economi droi oddi wrth gynyddu credyd defnyddwyr a chodiadau ym mhrosiaid tai tuag at fuddsoddi mewn busnes,



manufacturing industry, and closing the trade gap. The economic conditions that prevailed during the period of the high pound in 2000, 2001 and 2002 started to switch in 2003, and business investment, from all the evidence that we have in Wales, is now rebalancing the economy away from growth driven by debt to growth driven by investment and exports.

**Jenny Randerson:** In response to my colleague, Peter Black, just now, you referred to higher interest rates in relation to the damping of the housing market. However, higher interest rates mean that debt repayments are higher. If you take the 25 per cent increase in house prices in Wales in the last year, together with higher levels of student debt, you are in a situation where the level of debt is cranking up. While I appreciate that many of the remedies lie in the hands of your UK colleagues, what is your Government doing in Wales to assist people facing debt problems? Do you accept that there are not enough organisations offering advice on debt in Wales, will you give us an undertaking today to review the availability of advice on debt, and will you undertake to provide additional funding for debt advice centres?

**The First Minister:** We have done that through credit unions in terms of a specific type of debt, namely loan-shark-related debt. If Citizens Advice was to approach us and say that it was being overwhelmed by debt-related inquiries, we would look into that, although it comes under the Department of Trade and Industry rather than us. It is important that we remember at what stage of the housing cycle we are. If you compare this present stage of the housing cycle, where it is just beginning to top-out and flatten out, with the last time that that happened in 1988, 1989 and 1990, the affordability of mortgages is much greater now than it was then, because interest rates are much lower, although they are higher than they were a year ago. Then, I believe, 28 per cent of people's monthly earnings were going on repaying their mortgages, compared with 14 per cent now.

y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu, a chau'r bwlch masnach. Yr oedd yr amodau economaidd a geid yn ystod y cyfnod yr oedd gwerth y bunt yn uchel yn 2000, 2001 a 2002 wedi dechrau newid yn 2003, ac mae'r buddsoddi mewn busnes, yn ôl yr holl dystiolaeth sydd gennym yng Nghymru, yn troi'r economi oddi wrth dwf a ysgogir gan ddyledion a thuag at dwf a osgogir gan fuddsoddi ac allforion.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mewn ymateb i'm cyd-Aelod, Peter Black, funud yn ôl, cyfeiriasoch at gyfraddau llog uchel mewn cysylltiad â thawelu'r farchnad dai. Fodd bynnag, oherwydd cyfraddau llog uwch, mae ad-daliadau ar ddyledion yn uwch. O ystyried y cynnydd o 25 y cant ym mhrisiau tai yng Nghymru yn y flwyddyn a aeth heibio, ynghyd â lefelau uwch y dyledion ymysg myfyrwyr, ceir sefyllfa lle y mae lefel dyledion yn codi'n raddol. Er fy mod yn derbyn bod llawer o'r dulliau i gywiro hyn yn nwylo'ch cymheiriaid yn y DU, beth y mae'ch Llywodraeth yn ei wneud yng Nghymru i helpu pobl sy'n wynebu problemau oherwydd dyledion? A ydych yn derbyn nad oes digon o gyrff sy'n cynnig cyngor ar ddyledion yng Nghymru, a wnewch ymgymryd heddiw i adolygu'r ddarpariaeth o gyngor ar ddyledion, ac a wnewch ymgymryd i ddarparu rhagor o gyllid ar gyfer canolfannau cynghori ar ddyledion?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gwnaethom hynny drwy undebau credyd gyda golwg ar fath penodol o ddyled, sef dyledion sy'n ymwneud ag usurwyr. Pe deuai Cyngor ar Bopeth atom a dweud ei fod yn cael ei fodd gan ymholiadau sy'n ymwneud â dyledion, byddem yn ymchwilio i hynny, er ei fod yn dod o dan yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant ac nid o danom ni. Mae'n bwysig inni gofio ym mha gam yn y cylch tai yr ydym. Os cymharwch y cam presennol yn y cylch tai, lle y mae'n dechrau cyrraedd y brig a sefydlogi, â'r tro diwethaf y digwyddodd hynny yn 1988, 1989 a 1990, mae morgeisiau'n fwy fforddiadwy'n awr nag yr oeddent bryd hynny, gan fod cyfraddau llog yn is o lawer, er eu bod yn uwch nag yr oeddent flwyddyn yn ôl. Bryd hynny, yr wyf yn credu, âi 28 y cant o enillion misol tuag at ad-dalu morgeisiau, o'i gymharu â 14 y cant yn awr. Gan hynny, mae

Therefore, the burden of average mortgages in terms of affordability is now half of what it was the last time that this stage in the housing cycle occurred 15 years ago.

**Elin Jones:** A gytunwch y dylid rhoi cap ar y gyfradd llog y mae cwmnïau credyd yn ei gynnig?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae dewis ymhlith y gwahanol fathau o gardiau credyd sydd ar gael—mae siŵr o fod gannoedd ohonynt yn awr—ac maent yn codi tâl os nad ydych yn talu eich dyled yn llwyr ddiwedd y mis. Gallwch gael eich pigo yn eithaf garw gan faint o log y maent yn ei godi, ond mae gennych hawl wedyn i beidio â pharhau â'r cwmni sy'n berchen ar y cerdyn credyd hwnnw a newid i un arall. A dweud y gwir, maent yn cwyno bod pobl yn newid drwy'r amser o un cerdyn i'r llall, felly mae'n fater rhwng y cwsmer a chwmni'r cerdyn credyd. Mae gan yr Awdurdod Gwasanaethau Ariannol ac, os cofiaf, y Trysorlys hefyd reolau a rheolaeth dros faint y gallant ei godi. Credaf fod pwyllgor dethol Tŷ'r Cyffredin ar y Trysorlys wedi cynnal ymgynghoriad ar y pwnc hwn yn ddiweddar, ond nid wyf yn siŵr a yw wedi dod i ben hyd yn hyn.

**Alun Cairns:** Given that 15,000 more people are economically inactive this year than last, and given that the figure for England is falling, what contribution has that made to debt?

**The First Minister:** I do not know that it has made a contribution to debt, strictly speaking, because the jobless situation in Wales is the best it has been for 30 years. Anybody representing your party would give his or her right arm, left arm, and several other limbs to have experienced the levels of unemployment that we currently have. Averaging out each of the 18 Tory years in Government, unemployment was three times higher than it is today. That is therefore part of the affordability issue. The last time the housing market was in this state, people experienced negative equity, but we do not see that problem now, except for a few cases. Then, people were repaying 28 per cent of their income in repayments, because interest rates went so high in 1989-90, compared to the 14 per cent in current repayments, which is half

baich y morgais cyffredin o ran ei fforddiadwyedd yn hanner yr hyd ydoedd y tro diwethaf y cafwyd y cam hwn yn y cylch tai 15 mlynedd yn ôl.

**Elin Jones:** Do you agree that the interest rates charged by credit companies should be capped?

**The First Minister:** There is a choice between the different types of credit cards available—there must be hundreds of them by now—and they charge unless you pay off your debt in full at the end of the month. You can be stung quite severely by how much interest they charge, but you have a right then not to continue with that credit card company and to switch to another one. In fact, they complain that people switch time and again from one card to another, so it is a matter for the consumer and the credit card company. The Financial Services Authority and, as I recall, the Treasury also have rules and regulations on what they can charge. I think that the House of Commons Treasury select committee has undertaken consultation on this subject recently, although I am not certain whether it has completed the work as yet.

**Alun Cairns:** Gan fod 15,000 yn fwy o bobl yn economaidd anweithgar eleni nag yr oedd y llynedd, a chan fod y ffigur ar gyfer Lloegr yn gostwng, pa gyfraniad a wnaeth hynny at ddyledion?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni chredaf fod hynny wedi cyfrannu at ddyledion, a bod yn fanwl, gan fod y sefyllfa o ran swyddi yng Nghymru ar ei gorau er 30 mlynedd. Byddai unrhyw un sy'n cynrychioli'ch plaid wedi rhoi ei fraich dde, ei fraich chwith, a sawl aelod arall, i gael profi'r lefelau diweithdra sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd. Ar gyfartaledd, yr oedd diweithdra yn y 18 mlynedd o Lywodraeth y Toriaid yn dair gwaith yn uwch nag y mae heddiw. Felly, mae hynny'n un agwedd ar fater fforddiadwyedd. Y tro diwethaf yr oedd y farchnad dai yn y cyflwr hwn, yr oedd pobl yn dioddef gan ecwiti negyddol, ond ni welwn y broblem honno'n awr, heblaw am rai achosion. Bryd hynny, yr oedd pobl yn rhoi 28 y cant o'u hincwm ar ffurf ad-daliadau, gan fod cyfraddau llog mor uchel yn 1989-90, o'i gymharu â 14 y cant yn achos

as much. Also, the jobless figure is totally different from that of 1989.

ad-daliadau ar hyn o bryd, ac mae hynny'n hanner cymaint. Hefyd, mae nifer y di-waith yn gwbl wahanol i'r hyn ydoedd yn 1989.

**Ariannu'r Addewidion yn 'Cymru: Gwlad Well'  
Funding the Pledges in 'Wales: A Better Country'**

**C8 David Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar y cyllid sydd wedi'i neilltuo i gyflawni'r addewidion yn 'Cymru: Gwlad Well'? (OAQ39049)

**Q8 David Lloyd:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the funding that has been committed towards delivering pledges contained within 'Wales: A Better Country'? (OAQ39049)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r gyllideb ddrafft yn darparu cyllid digonol i gyflawni'r amcanion a osodwyd yn 'Cymru: Gwlad Well', naill ai yn y llinellau gwariant penodol, neu o'n cronfeydd wrth gefn.

**The First Minister:** The draft budget contains sufficient financial provision to deliver the commitments in 'Wales: A Better Country', either in specific budget expenditure lines or from reserves.

**David Lloyd:** Beth fydd cost ariannu ein prifysgolion yn absenoldeb ffioedd wedi 2006?

**David Lloyd:** How much will it cost to fund our universities in the absence of fees after 2006?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hynny yn dibynnu yn hollol ar y manylion yn y prospectysau a gyhoeddir cyn hir i'w danfon at ddarparu fyfyrwyr tua mis Mawrth y flwyddyn nesaf. Gallwn wedyn weld, yn dilyn adroddiad y comisiwn a gadeiriwyd gan Teresa Rees, beth fydd y gystadleuaeth yn y farchnad newydd yn 2006-07.

**The First Minister:** That depends entirely on the details contained in the prospectuses that will be published shortly and sent to prospective students around March next year. Then we can see, following the report of the commission chaired by Teresa Rees, the state of competition in the new market in 2006-07.

**Lisa Francis:** With regard to the aim of a truly bilingual Wales set out in 'Wales: A Better Country', what steps is your Government taking to ensure the expansion of Welsh-language training places for adults, and to specifically address the Education and Learning Wales and National Foundation for Educational Research report, which recommended doubling the funding for Welsh for adults?

**Lisa Francis:** Gyda golwg ar y nod o greu Cymru wirioneddol ddwyieithog a nodir yn 'Cymru: Gwlad Well', pa gamau y mae'ch Llywodraeth yn eu cymryd i sicrhau cynnydd yn nifer y lleoedd hyfforddi Cymraeg i oedolion, ac i ymateb yn benodol i adroddiad Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru a Sefydliad Cenedlaethol Ymchwil Addysgol, a argymhellodd ddyblu'r cyllid ar gyfer Cymraeg i oedolion?

**The First Minister:** I do not have a specific figure on that, so I will ask Sue Essex to write to you, because we recognise this issue, as there is a demand, although you cannot always meet it, and it applies to ELWa, vocational education, adult education and the supply of teachers competent to teach in those different settings. In the light of the complexity of that issue, I will ask Sue Essex or the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to write to you.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid oes gennyf ffigur penodol am hynny, felly gofynnaf i Sue Essex ysgrifennu atoch, gan ein bod yn cydnabod y mater hwn, gan fod galw, er na ellir ei ateb bob amser, mewn cysylltiad ag ELWa, addysg alwedigaethol, addysg oedolion a'r cyflenwad o athrawon i ddysgu yn y gwahanol feysydd hynny. Gan fod y pwnc hwnnw'n un cymhleth, gofynnaf i Sue Essex neu'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ysgrifennu atoch.

**Eleanor Burnham:** One of your pledges was to attract to major sporting and cultural events, and sport is important for participants and fans. In north Wales, the only venue capable of hosting international football or rugby matches is Wrexham Racecourse. Do you not agree that your Government should be trying to financially support Wrexham County Borough Council, which is pulling out all the stops to secure a sound future for the Racecourse as our only, vital north Wales regional multi-function and international venue?

**The First Minister:** That is an interesting point, but I am not sure that it is relevant to the preamble about the major events that we like to attract, because that does not involve the purchase of venues. I commend the members of Wrexham council and others, including Karen Sinclair, who has been heavily involved in trying to see what can be done to avoid the Racecourse ceasing to be a major international venue. However, I have not previously heard a suggestion that our programme to attract major events should also involve buying football grounds for that purpose.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Un o'ch addewidion oedd y byddech yn denu digwyddiadau diwylliannol a chwaraeon o bwys, ac mae chwaraeon yn bwysig i'r rhai sy'n cymryd rhan ac i'r cefnogwyr. Yn y Gogledd, yr unig fan y gellir cynnal gemau pêl-droed a rygbi rhyngwladol yw'r Cae Ras yn Wrecsam. Oni chytunwch y dylai'ch Llywodraeth geisio rhoi cymorth ariannol i Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Wrecsam, sy'n gwneud ei orau glas i sicrhau dyfodol cadarn i'r Cae Ras, gan mai ef yw'r unig fan yn rhanbarth y Gogledd y gellir cynnal gemau rhyngwladol a gwahanol fathau o ddigwyddiadau?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr oedd hwnnw'n bwynt diddorol, ond nid wyf yn sicr a yw'n berthnasol i'r rhagymadrodd am y digwyddiadau mawr y carem eu denu, gan nad yw hynny'n ymwneud â phrynu canolfannau. Canmolaf aelodau cyngor Wrecsam ac eraill, gan gynnwys Karen Sinclair, a fu'n ymwneud yn helaeth â'r ymgais i weld beth y gellir ei wneud i sicrhau na fydd y Cae Ras yn peidio â bod yn fan i gynnal gemau rhyngwladol o bwys. Er hynny, ni chlywais unrhyw awgrym o'r blaen y dylai ein rhaglen i ddenu digwyddiadau o bwys gynnwys prynu caeau pêl-droed i'r diben hwnnw hefyd.

### **Rheoleiddio'r Broses o Reoli Gwastraff The Regulation of Waste Management**

**Q9 Janet Davies:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the regulation of waste management? (OAQ39051)

**The First Minister:** That is primarily the responsibility of Environment Agency Wales. However, as with MRSA, infant mortality rates and GCSE passes, it has been a major success story since devolution in 1999. The percentage of municipal waste recycled prior to devolution was only some 60 per cent of the level in England—it was some 7 per cent in Wales and 12 per cent in England. Although the figure in Wales for 2003-04 is 17.6 per cent, which is almost three times higher—we do not have the English figures as they have not yet been published—I do not think that we will have overtaken England but we will be close, and may overtake England next year. It is a major success for us and for the 22 local authorities that have

**C9 Janet Davies:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar reoleiddio'r broses o reoli gwastraff? (OAQ39051)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cyfrifoldeb i Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd Cymru yw hynny'n bennaf. Fodd bynnag, yn yr un modd ag MRSA, cyfraddau marwolaethau babanod a llwyddiant mewn TGAU, cafwyd llwyddiant mawr yn hyn o beth ers datganoli yn 1999. Nid oedd canran y gwastraff a gesglid gan awdurdodau lleol a gâi ei ailgylchu cyn datganoli ond tua 60 y cant o'r lefel yn Lloegr—yr oedd tua 7 y cant yng Nghymru ac yn 12 y cant yn Lloegr. Er bod y ffigur yng Nghymru ar gyfer 2003-04 yn 17.6 y cant, sydd bron dair gwaith yn uwch—nid yw'r ffigurau ar gyfer Lloegr gennym gan nad ydynt wedi'u cyhoeddi eto—ni chredaf y byddwn wedi rhagori ar Loegr ond byddwn yn agos at wneud, a gallem ragori ar Loegr y

enthusiastically participated in this.

flwyddyn nesaf. Mae hyn yn llwyddiant mawr i ni ac i'r 22 awdurdod lleol sydd wedi cymryd rhan frwdfrydig yn hyn.

2.50 p.m.

**Janet Davies:** Nevertheless, First Minister, you will have read the Auditor General for Wales's report, published last week, which pointed out that the lack of Assembly powers is causing confusion in developing waste management regulations. Do you agree that it causes confusion, and, if so, why do you not fight for extra powers?

**Janet Davies:** Er hynny, Brif Weinidog, byddwch wedi darllen adroddiad Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru, a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos diwethaf, a nododd fod diffyg pwerau'r Cynulliad yn peri dryswch wrth ddatblygu rheoliadau ar reoli gwastraff. A ydych yn cytuno bod hyn yn peri dryswch, ac, os ydych, pam na wnewch ymladd i gael pwerau ychwanegol?

**The First Minister:** If you are an auditor, or the Chair of the Audit Committee, there is always a tendency to go for the approach whereby the glass is half or three-quarters empty. If you like, Janet, the consequence of the observations which you have made or repeated, would be that, despite any problems in the field to which you have referred, Welsh local authorities have dramatically increased the percentage of municipal waste which is recycled from 7 per cent to almost 18 per cent during the last four or five years that we have been in existence as a devolved administration, and we have caught up with England from a position of being well behind, or possibly overtaken by England, although we will not know that for another 18 months.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Os ydych yn archwilydd, neu'n Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Archwilio, mae tuedd bob amser i farnu bod y gwydr yn hanner neu'n dri chwarter gwag. Os caf ei roi fel hyn, Janet, y casgliad y deuir iddo ar sail y sylwadau yr ydych wedi'u gwneud neu'u hailadrodd yw, er gwaethaf unrhyw broblemau yn y maes y cyfeiriasoch atynt, fod awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru wedi sicrhau cynnydd sylweddol o 7 y cant i bron 18 y cant yng nghanran y gwastraff a gesglir ganddynt sy'n cael ei ailgylchu yn ystod y pedair neu bum mlynedd o'n bodolaeth fel gweinyddiaeth ddatganoledig, a'n bod wedi goddiweddyd Lloegr ar ôl bod ymhell ar ei hôl, ac wedi rhagori arni o bosibl, er na chawn wybod hynny am 18 mis arall.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Last week I asked the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside about his plans to combat the increasing problem of fly-tipping and illegal dumping. He replied that he was unaware that there was a problem. I have also been troubled after hearing that four of the 22 local authorities have failed to collect statistics on fly-tipping despite a legal obligation on them to do so. Recent reports state that instances of fly-tipping and illegal dumping have risen by 80 per cent in three years. First Minister, do you deny that these reports are true? How are you combating what I believe is a serious issue?

**Laura Anne Jones:** Yr wythnos diwethaf, holais y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad am ei gynlluniau i ymdrin â'r broblem gynyddol o arllwys ysbwriel a gollwng gwastraff yn anghyfreithlon. Atebodd nad oedd yn ymwybodol bod problem. Yr oedd hefyd yn ofid imi glywed bod pedwar o'r 22 awdurdod lleol wedi methu â chasglu ystadegau ar arllwys ysbwriel er bod gofyniad cyfreithiol iddynt wneud hynny. Mae adroddiadau diweddar yn nodi bod nifer yr achosion o arllwys ysbwriel a gollwng gwastraff yn anghyfreithlon wedi codi o 80 y cant mewn tair blynedd. Brif Weinidog, a ydych yn gwadu bod yr adroddiadau hyn yn wir? Sut yr ydych yn ymdrin â'r hyn sy'n fater difrifol, yn fy marn i?

**The First Minister:** You do not accurately

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid ydych wedi adrodd yn

report what Carwyn Jones said last week. Perhaps I should ask Carwyn to repeat his words in writing. We are all aware of this, as the evidence is there for all to see on country lanes. Examples can be seen of builders' rubble that has clearly been illegally tipped on the way home from a job of work, rather than taken to an approved tip. Therefore, we know that it happens. The important issue is how quickly the local authority tackles the problem by catching those who do it or by removing the offending material, and recycling or disposing of it in an appropriate place.

gywir yr hyn a ddywedodd Carwyn Jones yr wythnos diwethaf. Efallai y dylwn ofyn i Carwyn ailadrodd ei eiriau drwy lythyr. Yr ydym oll yn ymwybodol o hyn, gan fod y dystiolaeth yno i bawb ei gweld ar lonydd yng nghefn gwlad. Gellir gweld enghreifftiau o rwbel adeiladwyr sy'n amlwg wedi'i ollwng yn anghyfreithlon ar y ffordd adref ar ôl gwneud gwaith, yn hytrach na'i gludo i domen gymeradwyedig. Felly, gwyddom fod hynny'n digwydd. Y pwnc pwysig yw pa mor fuan y bydd yr awdurdod lleol yn mynd i'r afael â'r broblem drwy ddal y rhai sy'n gwneud hyn neu drwy symud y pethau sy'n peri tramgwydd, a'u hailgylchu neu'u gwaredu mewn man priodol.

### **Gwasanaethau Gofal Sylfaenol yn y Gogledd Primary Care Services in North Wales**

**Q10 Janet Ryder:** Will the First Minister make a statement on primary care services in north Wales? (OAQ39048)

**C10 Janet Ryder:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar y gwasanaethau gofal sylfaenol yn y Gogledd? (OAQ39048)

**The First Minister:** We have negotiated and implemented important reforms to the general medical services contract and are investing an additional £100 million across Wales over three years. This will extend the range and quality of local services available to the people of north Wales. To complete our agenda of reform of primary care, we are negotiating new contracts for dentists and pharmacists.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym wedi negodi a chyflwyno newidiadau pwysig i'r contract ar gyfer gwasanaethau meddygol cyffredinol ac yr ydym yn buddsoddi £100 miliwn ychwanegol ledled Cymru dros dair blynedd. Bydd hyn yn ymestyn amrediad ac ansawdd y gwasanaethau lleol sydd ar gael i bobl y Gogledd. Er mwyn cwblhau ein hagenda ar ddiwygio gofal sylfaenol, yr ydym yn negodi contractau newydd ar gyfer deintyddion a fferyllwyr.

**Janet Ryder:** As you will be aware, Parkinson's disease is a progressively debilitating disease which has a devastating effect on sufferers and on their families. Sufferers can be greatly helped by specialist nurses who can provide support in the community. Unfortunately, not all trusts in Wales have developed this post. Will you give a commitment that your Government will develop the post of a Parkinson's specialist nurse and ensure that one exists in every trust in Wales?

**Janet Ryder:** Fel y gwyddoch, mae clefyd Parkinson yn afiechyd sy'n peri gwendid cynyddol a gaiff effaith andwyol ar ddiodefwyr a'u teuluoedd. Gall diodefwyr gael llawer o gymorth gan nyrsys arbenigol sy'n gallu cynnig cefnogaeth yn y gymuned. Gwaetha'r modd, nid yw'r holl ymddiriedolaethau yng Nghymru wedi datblygu swyddi o'r fath. A wnewch ymrwymo y bydd eich Llywodraeth yn datblygu swydd y nyrs sy'n arbenigo ar glefyd Parkinson ac yn sicrhau y ceir un ym mhob ymddiriedolaeth yng Nghymru?

**The First Minister:** I cannot give that undertaking in the Chamber, as I am sure that you will understand, Janet. However, I will make suitable inquiries as to the availability of specialist nurses in this area and the

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni allaf roi ymgymeriad o'r fath yn y Siambr, fel y byddwch yn deall, Janet, yr wyf yn siŵr. Er hynny, gwnaf ymholiadau priodol ynghylch y nyrsys arbenigol sydd ar gael yn y maes hwn a'r

reasons why some trusts may have decided not to develop the post. Jane Hutt will supply you with a detailed written explanation.

**Brynle Williams:** You will be aware, First Minister, that the all-party parliamentary group on cancer stated that the new funding system was exacerbating the postcode lottery. Claims were made that general practitioners were not referring patients in need of urgent treatment quickly enough and that primary care trusts should not be responsible for funding. What are your views on that?

**The First Minister:** I have not heard that particular version of events on the adequacy of the diagnosis of cancer by GPs, who should be making that diagnosis and whether or not it should come from local health boards—I think that you said primary care trusts, but we do not have them in Wales, so I assume that you mean local health boards. There is an issue regarding what level of specialist you need to see in order to know to whom you should be referred. The argument is that GPs do not see enough cancer patients to know to whom they should be referred. Somehow, patients need to see an intermediate consultant so that he can tell them which consultant they should see and in which centre. That is a difficult area because you rely on a GP's ability to act as more than a gatekeeper and to make the initial diagnosis and say, 'I am not sure what you have, but I suspect that it might be cancer, in which case I think that you better see so and so at such and such hospital'. Some GPs are better at that than others. I do not know how you could get rid of the human variation in skill at a GP level.

rhesymau y gallai rhai ymddiriedolaethau fod wedi penderfynu peidio â datblygu swydd o'r fath. Bydd Jane Hutt yn egluro hynny'n fanwl i chi mewn llythyr.

**Brynle Williams:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol, Brif Weinidog, fod y grŵp seneddol o'r holl bleidiau ar ganser wedi datgan bod y system gyllido newydd yn gwaethgu'r loteri cod post. Gwnaed honiadau i'r perwyl nad oedd ymarferwyr cyffredinol yn atgyfeirio cleifion mewn angen i gael triniaeth frys yn ddigon cyflym ac na ddylai ymddiriedolaethau gofal sylfaenol fod yn gyfrifol am ariannu. Beth yw'ch barn am hynny?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni chlywais y fersiwn honno o'r digwyddiadau mewn cysylltiad â gallu meddygon teulu i ganfod canser, pwy ddylai wneud y diagnosis hwnnw ac ai byrddau iechyd lleol a ddylai wneud hynny—credaf eich bod wedi dweud ymddiriedolaethau gofal sylfaenol, ond ni cheir hwy yng Nghymru, felly cymeraf eich bod yn golygu byrddau iechyd lleol. Mae mater yn codi ynghylch lefel yr arbenigwr y mae'n rhaid ichi ei weld er mwyn cael gwybod at bwy y dylech gael eich atgyfeirio. Y ddadl yw nad yw meddygon teulu'n gweld digon o gleifion sydd â chanser fel y gallant wybod at bwy y dylent eu hatgyfeirio. Rywsut neu'i gilydd, rhaid i gleifion gael gweld ymgynghorydd rhyngol fel y gall ddweud wrthynt pa ymgynghorydd y dylent ei weld ac ym mha ganolfan. Mae hynny'n faes anodd oherwydd rhaid dibynnu ar allu meddyg teulu i fod yn fwy na phorthor yn unig ac i wneud y diagnosis cyntaf a dweud, 'Nid wyf yn sicr beth sydd arnoch, ond yr wyf yn amau y gallai fod yn ganser ac, os felly, credaf y byddai'n well ichi weld hwn a hwn yn yr ysbyty a'r ysbyty'. Mae rhai meddygon teulu'n well na'i gilydd. Ni wn sut y gellid dileu'r gwahaniaeth rhwng sgiliau ymysg meddygon teulu.

### **Datganiad Busnes Business Statement**

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I have just one change to report to this week's business. Tomorrow's motion to delegate the functions of the Public Order Bill has been withdrawn. It will be moved to next

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Nid oes gennyf ond un newid i'w adrodd i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Mae'r cynnig ar gyfer yfory i ddirprwyo swyddogaethau'r Mesur Trefn Gyhoeddus wedi'i dynnu'n ôl. Fe'i cynigir

Wednesday, 17 November.

Business for the next three weeks is as set out in the draft business statement, which can be found on the Chamberweb under supporting documents. Further to this morning's deliberations in the Business Committee, the Deputy Presiding Officer has determined, under Standing Order No. 24.6, that the following items of subordinate legislation need not be referred to a subject committee for extended consideration: the Higher Education Act 2004 (Commencement No.1 and Transitional Provision) (Wales) Order 2004, the Local Authorities (Changing Executive Arrangements and Alternative Arrangements) (Wales) Regulations 2004, the Town and Country Planning (Electronic Communications) (Wales) (No.1) Order 2004, and the Town and Country Planning (Electronic Communications) (Wales) (No.2) Order 2004.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes gwrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes? Gwelaf fod mwy na 10 Aelod yn gwrthwynebu. Felly, gofynnaf i'r Trefnydd gynnig y datganiad busnes yn ffurfiol.

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales adopts the business statement.*

**Y Llywydd:** Gwahoddaf un Aelod o bob grŵp i wneud sylwadau byr ar y datganiad busnes.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I do not need to remind you that we are here to represent the people of Wales. They have certain expectations, and they do not expect the Government of Wales to be completely evasive and irresponsible in the way that it carries out its actions. I refer you to two specific issues. The people of Wales expect to be able to have access to the figures on MRSA per hospital. The First Minister said that there is no justification for withholding them. Will he write to each trust to ensure that those figures are made available? Will the Minister for Health and Social Services make a statement, be it written or oral, to that end? We will even accept a copy of a letter

ddydd Mercher nesaf, 17 Tachwedd.

Mae busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y mae wedi'i nodi yn y datganiad busnes drafft, y gellir ei weld ar we'r Siambr o dan ddogfennau ategol. Ymhellach i'r trafodion y bore yma yn y Pwyllgor Busnes, mae'r Dirprwy Lywydd wedi penderfynu, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.6, nad oes angen cyfeirio'r eitemau is-ddeddfwriaeth a ganlyn i bwyllgor pwnc i'w hystyried yn helaethach: Gorchymyn Deddf Addysg Uwch 2004 (Cychwyn Rhif 1 a Darpariaeth Drosiannol) (Cymru) 2004, Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Newid Trefniadau Gweithrediaeth a Threfniadau Amgen) (Cymru) 2004, Gorchymyn Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Cyfathrebu Electronig) (Cymru) (Rhif 1) 2004, a Gorchymyn Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Cyfathrebu Electronig) (Cymru) (Rhif 2) 2004.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there any objections to the business statement? I see that more than 10 Members object. I therefore ask the Business Minister to formally propose the business statement.

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Cynigaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn derbyn y datganiad busnes.*

**The Presiding Officer:** I invite one Member from each group to comment briefly on the business statement.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Nid oes angen imi'ch atgoffa ein bod yma i gynrychioli pobl Cymru. Mae ganddynt rai disgwyliadau, ac nid ydynt yn disgwyl i Lywodraeth Cymru fod yn gwbl ochelgar ac anghyfrifol yn ei dull o weithredu. Fe'ch cyfeiraf at ddau fater penodol. Mae pobl Cymru'n disgwyl cael gweld y ffigurau ar MRSA ym mhob ysbyty. Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi dweud nad oes cyfiawnhad dros wrthod eu rhoi. A wnaiff ysgrifennu at bob ymddiriedolaeth i sicrhau y bydd y ffigurau hynny ar gael? A wnaiff y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ddatganiad i'r perwyl hwnnw, boed yn un ysgrifenedig neu lafar? Gwnawn hyd yn oed dderbyn copi o lythyr a anfonir



sent by the First Minister and the Minister for Health and Social Services to the trusts instructing them to release those figures in order to ensure that the people of Wales can access them.

On safety on railway crossings in Wales, it is not good enough for the Minister for Economic Development and Transport to say that that is not his responsibility. It may be Network Rail's responsibility, but the people of Wales will expect the Minister to speak to Network Rail and make a statement in the Chamber on an important issue in terms of the safety of the people of Wales.

**David Melding:** I thank the Minister for indicating that the Executive will schedule time early in the new year for a debate on affordable housing. We would have wished that to be held even sooner, but I accept the positive response. She also heard my request for a debate on fire services. Many people are concerned that the various reviews taking place around Wales and the reassessment of risks to services are leading to a dramatically different service being delivered to the public. This is a matter of real concern and we maintain that it should be debated in the Assembly.

3.00 p.m.

**Kirsty Williams:** Minister, given the somewhat contradictory answers that we have from the Minister for Health and Social Services and the First Minister on the publication of MRSA figures, it is now imperative that the health Minister comes before the Assembly to make a statement on this issue. I have written to every trust in Wales and they have refused to make those figures available to me. Each trust collects those figures in a different way, and they are awaiting a political lead from the Minister to devise a system via which those figures could be made comparable and meaningful to patients. I have written to the Minister, asking her to make such a system available, but, if she is not willing to do so, she must explain that decision to the Assembly and explain to the people of Wales why they are unable to access this vital piece of information regarding their healthcare.

gan y Prif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol at yr ymddiriedolaethau i'w cyfarwyddo i gyhoeddi'r ffigurau hynny er mwyn sicrhau y gall pobl Cymru eu gweld.

Ynghylch diogelwch ar groesfannau rheilffordd yng Nghymru, nid yw'n ddigon da i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth ddweud nad ef sy'n gyfrifol am hyn. Efallai ei fod yn gyfrifoldeb i Network Rail, ond bydd pobl Cymru'n disgwyl i'r Gweinidog siarad â Network Rail a gwneud datganiad yn y Siambr ar fater sy'n bwysig i ddiogelwch pobl Cymru.

**David Melding:** Diolchaf i'r Trefnydd am nodi y bydd y Weithrediaeth yn amserlennu dadl ar ddechrau'r flwyddyn newydd ar dai fforddiadwy. Byddai'n dda gennym ei gweld yn cael ei chynnal yn gynharach byth, ond derbyniaf yr ymateb cadarnhaol. Clywodd fy nghais hefyd am ddadl ar wasanaethau tân. Mae llawer o bobl yn bryderus bod y gwahanol adolygiadau a geir o gwmpas Cymru a'r ailasesu ar risgiau i wasanaethau'n arwain at ddarparu gwasanaeth tra gwahanol i'r cyhoedd. Mae hyn yn destun pryder gwirioneddol a daliwn y dylid cael dadl arno yn y Cynulliad.

**Kirsty Williams:** Drefnydd, yng ngolwg yr atebion anghyson braidd a gawsom gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a'r Prif Weinidog ar gyhoeddi ffigurau ar MRSA, mae'n hollbwysig yn awr i'r Gweinidog iechyd ddod gerbron y Cynulliad i wneud datganiad ar y mater hwn. Yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at bob ymddiriedolaeth yng Nghymru ac maent wedi gwrthod rhoi'r ffigurau hynny i mi. Mae pob ymddiriedolaeth yn casglu'r ffigurau hynny mewn modd gwahanol, ac maent yn disgwyl cael arweiniad gwleidyddol gan y Gweinidog i ddyfeisio system fel y gellir cymharu'r ffigurau hynny a pheri iddynt fod yn ystyrlon i gleifion. Ysgrifennais at y Gweinidog, gan ofyn iddi gynnig system o'r fath, ond, os nad yw'n barod i wneud hynny, rhaid iddi egluro'r penderfyniad hwnnw i'r Cynulliad ac egluro i bobl Cymru pam na allant weld y wybodaeth hollbwysig hon sy'n

ymwneud â'u gofal iechyd.

**Carl Sargeant:** Business Minister, as always, we welcome the business statement, but, in the future, perhaps you could find time to consider the wonderful issue of the older people's free swimming pilot scheme that was launched yesterday across 22 authorities. It will be a resounding success not only in improving the social aspects of older people's lives, but in bringing clear health benefits. Also, perhaps you could find time to discuss the bus pass scheme, and I reference that to a recent article in *The Guardian* that gave good recognition to the Welsh Assembly Government for this massively successful scheme. It gives people an opportunity to get from Connah's Quay to Cardiff and from Buckley to Builth Wells using a free bus ticket from the Welsh Assembly Government. Finally, perhaps you could find time to consider Assembly subsidies for public and private bodies. I say this in reference, in particular, to a request from the Conservatives with regard to subsidised tickets for major sporting events—*[Interruption.]*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Members must listen in relative quiet to speakers from other party groups. The Assembly wants to hear Carl Sargeant.

**Carl Sargeant:** I will make that reference again in case the Minister did not quite hear me. I was referring to Assembly subsidies to public or private bodies, in particular because of a request from the Conservative Party for cheaper tickets or subsidies for tickets for major sporting events. It is astounding that a party that believes in a free market should want the Government to set ticket prices for a private company.

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I will pick up on Rhodri's amazing comments about representing the people of Wales—you do not need to remind us that we are here for the people of Wales; the people acknowledged that clearly at the last election. The Assembly Government has no plans to reconfigure the fire service in Wales, therefore the answer is 'no'.

**Carl Sargeant:** Drefnydd, croesawn y datganiad busnes, fel y gwnawn bob amser, ond, yn y dyfodol, efallai y gallech neilltuo amser i ystyried mater gwych y cynllun peilot ar gyfer nofio am ddim i bobl hŷn a lansiwyd ddoe mewn 22 o awdurdodau. Bydd yn llwyddiant ysgubol, nid yn unig o ran gwella'r agwedd gymdeithasol ar fywyd pobl hŷn, ond hefyd o ran dod â buddion pendant i iechyd. Hefyd, efallai y gallech neilltuo amser i drafod cynllun y tocynnau bws, a chysylltaf hynny ag erthygl ddiweddar yn *The Guardian* a oedd yn fawr ei chanmoliaeth i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru am y cynllun tra llwyddiannus hwn. Mae'n rhoi cyfle i bobl fynd o Gei Connah i Gaerdydd ac o Fwcle i Lanfair ym Muallt gan ddefnyddio tocyn bws am ddim oddi wrth Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Yn olaf, efallai y gallech neilltuo amser i ystyried cymorthdaliadau'r Cynulliad i gyrff cyhoeddus a phreifat. Dywedaf hyn gan gyfeirio'n benodol at gais gan y Ceidwadwyr mewn cysylltiad â thocynnau cymorthdaledig ar gyfer digwyddiadau chwaraeon mawr—*[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Rhaid i Aelodau wrando mewn distawrwydd cymharol ar siaradwyr o grwpiau plaid eraill. Mae'r Cynulliad am gael clywed geiriau Carl Sargeant.

**Carl Sargeant:** Cyfeiriaf at hynny eto rhag ofn na chlywodd y Trefnydd fi'n iawn. Yr oeddwn yn cyfeirio at gymorthdaliadau gan y Cynulliad i gyrff cyhoeddus neu breifat a hynny'n benodol oherwydd cais a wnaed gan y Blaid Geidwadol am docynnau rhatach neu gymorthdaliadau ar gyfer digwyddiadau chwaraeon mawr. Mae'n gwbl ryfeddol bod plaid sy'n credu mewn marchnad rydd yn dymuno i'r Llywodraeth bennu prisiau tocynnau ar ran cwmni preifat.

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Ymdriniaf â'r sylwadau rhyfeddol a wnaeth Rhodri am gynrychioli pobl Cymru—nid oes raid ichi ein hatgoffa ein bod yma er mwyn pobl Cymru; cydnabu'r bobl hynny'n glir yn yr etholiad diwethaf. Nid oes gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad unrhyw fwriad i ad-drefnu'r gwasanaeth tân yng Nghymru, felly 'na' yw'r ateb.

Many of you asked about MRSA. Jane will answer questions tabled on this matter tomorrow afternoon and Members will have an opportunity to question her then. We all acknowledge Saturday's tragic rail accident as being absolutely horrendous, and our thoughts go out to the people involved. However, the Minister for Economic Development and Transport does not intend to schedule time to discuss this, as he has no specific responsibility for safety on rail crossings. That responsibility rests with Network Rail.

Carl, on free bus passes and free swimming, there is no need to debate those schemes because they are happening on the ground. On rugby tickets, that is a matter for the Welsh Rugby Union despite the Conservatives' stance.

Holodd llawer ohonoch am MRSA. Bydd Jane yn ateb cwestiynau a gyflwynwyd ar y mater hwn prynhawn yfory a chaiff Aelodau gyfle i'w holi bryd hynny. Yr ydym oll yn cydnabod bod y ddamwain rheilffordd drychinebus ddydd Sadwrn yn un gwbl erchyll, ac estynnwn ein cydymdeimlad at y rhai sy'n gysylltiedig. Er hynny, nid yw'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth yn bwriadu neilltuo amser i drafod hyn, gan nad oes ganddo unrhyw gyfrifoldeb penodol dros ddiogelwch ar groesfannau rheilffordd. Network Rail sy'n gyfrifol am hynny.

Carl, ynghylch tocynnau bws am ddim a nofio am ddim, nid oes angen cael dadl ar y cynlluniau hynny gan eu bod eisoes ar waith. Ynghylch tocynnau rygbi, mae hynny'n fater i Undeb Rygbi Cymru er gwaethaf safbwynt y Ceidwadwyr.

*Cynnig: O blaid 31, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.*

*Motion: For 31, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

### **Datganiad ar Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru Statement on the Wales Millennium Centre**

**The Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport (Alun Pugh):** Much has happened since the Assembly voted on 22 January 2002 by 47 to two to permit the building of the Wales Millennium Centre. As Assembly Members, we have all watched the vast building take shape on the other side of the street, and we look forward to the official opening weekend when the centre opens its doors on Friday 26 November. Practical completion of the building was achieved on 15 October, and, four days earlier, on 11 October, the WMC company took possession of the building for an acoustics test in the main auditorium, the Donald Gordon Theatre. The test involved a live performance before a full audience. The test was a vital way point, as acoustics can change significantly under the conditions of a full house. I certainly enjoyed the sound of the performance, but I know that acoustics are highly subjective. The audio technicians who measured the hall under these test conditions have been able to confirm from the readings of their electronic instruments that they are very good. I understand that, with some fine-tuning, they will be even better on the opening night.

The WMC company has had the most astonishing amount of work to do between 15 October and 26 November. In particular, the catering and retail fit-outs are well under way. Members will have seen the publicity about this already. The main catering outlet, the Tiger Bay Jazz Cafe, will be run by a company called Brazz, and there will be other retail and catering opportunities as well.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon (Alun Pugh):** Mae llawer wedi digwydd ers i'r Cynulliad bleidleisio ar 22 Ionawr 2002 o 47 i ddau i ganiatáu adeiladu Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru. Fel Aelodau o'r Cynulliad, yr ydym oll wedi gwyllo'r adeilad anferth yn ymffurfio ar ochr arall y stryd, ac edrychwn ymlaen at benwythnos yr agoriad swyddogol pan fydd y ganolfan yn agor ei drysau ar ddydd Gwener 26 Tachwedd. Cwblhawyd y gwaith ar yr adeilad ar 15 Hydref, a, bedwar diwrnod cyn hynny, ar 11 Hydref, cymerodd cwmni CMC feddiant o'r adeilad i roi prawf ar acwsteg y brif neuadd, Theatr Donald Gordon. Yr oedd y prawf yn cynnwys perfformiad byw gerbron cynulleidfa lawn. Yr oedd y prawf yn garreg filltir hollbwysig, gan fod acwsteg yn gallu newid yn sylweddol pan geir tŷ llawn. Gwneuthum i fwynhau sain y perfformiad, yn sicr, ond gwn fod acwsteg yn fater goddrychol iawn. Mae'r technegwyr sain a fesurodd y neuadd o dan amodau'r prawf hwn wedi gallu cadarnhau ar sail darlleniadau eu hoffer electronig ei bod yn dda iawn. Yr wyf yn deall, o gael ychydig o fanwl gyweirio, y bydd yn well byth ar y noson agoriadol.

Mae cwmni CMC yn gorfod cyflawni cryn waith rhwng 15 Hydref a 26 Tachwedd. Yn benodol, mae'r gwaith o osod y manau arlwyo ac adwerthu'n mynd rhagddo'n dda. Bydd Aelodau wedi gweld y cyhoeddusrwydd am hynny eisoes. Bydd y brif ystafell arlwyo, y Tiger Bay Jazz Cafe, yn cael ei rhedeg gan gwmni o'r enw Brazz, a bydd cyfleoedd eraill ar gyfer adwerthu ac arlwyo hefyd.

The opening night will belong to the people of Wales. The majority of the audience will have received their free tickets via a public ballot organised by the Electoral Reform Society. This ensures that the ballot will be fair and transparent. The ballot closed on November 1, and I can tell the Assembly that about 8,000 requests for a pair of tickets were received. On the Saturday, there will be an open-air hymns and arias concert, with some 4,000 voices from 70 choirs, followed by a major fireworks display. The weekend will conclude on the Sunday with a second major concert—a royal gala performance.

Of course, preparation for the opening will go right to the wire. That is the nature of a major iconic project like this. The WMC has made progress on a number of fronts. It has been vital, for example, to ensure that public transport and car parking are adequate, both for the opening weekend and thereafter. Members will know that work on a dedicated multi-storey car park has not yet started and that it will not be available for some time, but detailed interim parking arrangements are in place. For the opening weekend, the WMC has worked closely with the highly experienced Cardiff county events team and with the police to ensure a quality experience for the thousands expected. Indeed, I must thank Cardiff County Council for its support and practical help in bringing all this to fruition.

The building—and this is a real achievement—came in on time and on budget. I recently received the company's final business plan, and I am pleased to report that this shows a balanced operation for the first three years. The capital fundraising deficit is now below £2 million, and the company is determined to close this gap completely by the end of the calendar year.

Notwithstanding this, the timing of cash flow remains an issue, largely as a result of the timing of capital allowances. Members will recall that, last year, I informed you of a notifiable transaction under Standing Order

Bydd y noson agoriadol yn eiddo i bobl Cymru. Bydd y rhan fwyaf o'r gynulleidfa wedi cael eu tocynnau am ddim drwy broses o dynnu tocynnau'n gyhoeddus a drefnwyd gan y Gymdeithas Diwygio Etholiadol. Sicrheir drwy hynny y bydd y broses yn un deg a thryloyw. Daeth y broses i ben ar 1 Tachwedd, a gallaf ddweud wrth y Cynulliad fod tua 8,000 o geisiadau am barau o docynnau wedi dod i law. Ar y dydd Sadwrn, cynhelir cyngerdd o emynau ac unawdau yn yr awyr agored, gyda thua 4,000 o leisiau o 70 o gorau, ac arddangosfa tân gwyllt fawr ar ôl hynny. Daw'r penwythnos i ben ar y dydd Sul gydag ail gyngerdd mawr—perfformiad mawreddog brenhinol.

Wrth gwrs, bydd y paratoi ar gyfer yr agoriad yn parhau tan y funud olaf. Mae hynny i'w ddisgwyl yn achos prosiect eiconig mawr fel hwn. Mae CMC wedi gwneud cynnydd mewn sawl maes. Bu'n hollbwysig, er enghraifft, sicrhau bod digon o gludiant cyhoeddus a manau parcio ceir ar gael, ar gyfer y penwythnos agoriadol a wedi hynny. Gŵyr Aelodau na ddechreuwyd eto ar y gwaith ar faes parcio aml-lawr pwrpasol ac na fydd ar gael am gryn amser, ond mae trefniadau parcio dros dro manwl wedi'u gwneud. Ar gyfer y penwythnos agoriadol, mae CMC wedi cydweithio'n agos â thîm digwyddiadau sirol Caerdydd, sy'n dra phrofiadol, a chyda'r heddlu i sicrhau y bydd y miloedd a ddisgwylir yn mwynhau'r penwythnos. Yn wir, rhaid imi ddiolch i Gyngor Sir Caerdydd am ei gefnogaeth a'i gymorth ymarferol wrth gyflawni hyn oll.

Mae'r adeilad—ac mae hyn yn gryn gyflawniad—wedi'i gwblhau'n brydlon ac yn unol â'r gyllideb. Cefais gynllun busnes terfynol y cwmni'n ddiweddar, ac yr wyf yn falch o adrodd bod hwnnw'n dangos iddo fod yn rhedeg yn fantoledig dros y tair blynedd cyntaf. Mae'r diffyg o ran codi arian cyfalaf yn llai na £2 filiwn bellach, ac mae'r cwmni'n benderfynol o gau'r bwll hwnnw'n llwyr erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn galendr hon.

Er gwaethaf hynny, mae amseriad y llif arian yn mynnu sylw o hyd, yn bennaf o ganlyniad i amseriad y lwfansau cyfalaf. Bydd Aelodau'n cofio imi'ch hysbysu, y llynedd, am drafodiad hysbysadwy o dan Reol

No. 21.16, involving a transaction falling within Standing Order No. 21.19, namely the guarantee of a loan to Wales Millennium Centre Ltd. The loan, which covers the cash-flow deficit, was provided by HSBC and, at that stage, I set the period of the loan to the end of November 2004. Today, I announce my intention to extend the period of the loan guarantee for a further six months to the end of May 2005. I do not propose to extend the amount of the guarantee, simply its timescale.

Sefydlog Rhif 21.16, sy'n cynnwys trafodiad sy'n ddarostyngedig i Reol Sefydlog Rhif 21.19, sef gwarant o fenthyciad i Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru Cyf. Rhoddwyd y benthyciad hwn, ar gyfer y diffyg yn y llif arian gan HSBC ac, ar y pryd, gosodais derfyn cyfnod y benthyciad ar ddiwedd Tachwedd 2004. Heddiw, cyhoeddaf fy mwriad i ymestyn cyfnod gwarant y benthyciad am chwe mis pellach hyd ddiwedd Mai 2005. Ni fwriadaf gynyddu maint y warant, dim ond yr amserlen ar ei chyfer.

3.10 p.m.

The WMC company and the resident organisations are all busy occupying the centre, and preparations are well under way for the Urdd festival, which will take place in and around the centre in June next year. I am sure that I speak for the entire Assembly when I say that I am looking forward to the oval basin and the WMC being transformed into the Urdd maes.

Mae cwmni CMC a'r cyrff preswyl oll yn brysur yn llenwi'r ganolfan, ac mae'r gwaith paratoi'n mynd rhagddo'n dda ar gyfer gŵyl yr Urdd, a gynhelir yn y ganolfan a'i chyffiniau ym mis Mehefin y flwyddyn nesaf. Yr wyf yn siŵr fy mod yn siarad ar ran y Cynulliad cyfan pan ddywedaf fy mod yn edrych ymlaen at weld trawsnewid y basn hirgrwn a Chanolfan Mileniwm Cymru yn faes i'r Urdd.

I cannot guarantee perfect November weather for the opening weekend in two weeks' time, but I can guarantee world-class performances in a world-class venue that every political party in our National Assembly has voted to bring about.

Ni allaf warantu tywydd perffaith ym mis Tachwedd ar gyfer y penwythnos agoriadol ymhen pythefnos, ond gallaf warantu perfformiadau o'r radd flaenaf mewn canolfan o'r radd flaenaf y pleidleisiodd pob plaid wleidyddol yn ein Cynulliad Cenedlaethol o blaid ei chreu.

**Owen John Thomas:** Mae'n saith mlynedd ers lansio'r weledigaeth i greu Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru, ac, fel yn achos pob syniad newydd, yr oedd angen rhoi cnawd ar yr esgryn. Yr oedd yn rhaid cadarnhau'r costau arfaethedig fel rhan o gynllun busnes cryfach, ac uno safbwynt Aelodau'r Cynulliad a oedd yn mynnu pwyll cyllidol gyda safbwynt y rhai a oedd yn caniatáu i blwyfoldeb amharu ar eu gweledigaeth wrth ystyried cynigion o blaid sefydliad cenedlaethol newydd.

**Owen John Thomas:** It is seven years since the vision of establishing the Wales Millennium Centre was first put forward, and, as is the case with every new idea, we needed to put flesh on the bones. The proposed costs needed to be confirmed within a more robust business plan, and the views of Assembly Members insisting on budgetary caution needed to be reconciled with the views of those who allowed parochialism to cloud their vision in considering proposals for a new national institution.

Canmolaf y rhai a oedd â'r weledigaeth i lansio'r prosiect yn 1997 a'r Gweinidogion a'i gefnogodd ar adeg pan oedd dyfodol y cynllun yn y fantol. Yr wyf yn hoff o feddwl mai un o'r ffactorau a drodd y fantol o blaid y prosiect oedd yr awgrym a wnaed yn y Siambr gan Blaid Cymru ar 5 Ebrill 2001 i

I praise those who had the vision to launch the project in 1997 and the Ministers who supported it at a time when its future hung in the balance. I like to think that one factor that tipped the scales in favour of the project was the suggestion made in the Chamber by Plaid Cymru on 5 April 2001 that Cardiff County

Gyngor Sir Caerdydd roi pryddles hir ar safle'r ganolfan am bris pupren, a, chwarae teg, Arglwydd Faer Caerdydd ar y pryd, Russell Goodway, oedd yn gyfrifol am roi sêl bendith ar y cynnig pwysig hwnnw.

The National Assembly's £37 million investment in the Wales Millennium Centre, its £2 million annual revenue subsidy, and the newness and proximity of the two institutions will cause observers to associate the centre's success or failure with the National Assembly. If properly used, the centre will provide Wales with a shop window to the world and a stage on which to develop the talents of our young people. It should provide a huge boost to Wales's image. It is therefore vital that the National Assembly and other agencies co-operate to create the right conditions for success.

The centre is a novel and distinct structure with state-of-the-art facilities and is situated in surroundings where our rich, maritime tradition and our new political status are clearly present. The institution is thus an attraction in itself, and it should prove to be a huge success and nurture a new generation of talented performers.

However, one dark cloud hovers ominously overhead: the accessibility of the centre, not only to those living in other parts of Wales and in neighbouring areas of England, but for those in Cardiff's populous hinterland. To date, transport arrangements have been made for the opening week only, with rail services to Cardiff bay temporarily extended to operate after the shows finish. The single entrance and exit car park and the on-road, makeshift coach parking could easily cause gridlock. The transport arrangements were cobbled together late in the day, despite a score of pleas from myself and others over the last two years for the Welsh Assembly Government to bring the relevant agencies around the table to create a sound, integrated system, worthy of a capital city and a new national institution. Is the Minister satisfied with the location of 20 car parking spaces on the road, which will reduce the three roads serving the centre to single-lane usage? Will

Council provide a long lease on the site for a peppercorn rent, and, to give him his due, the then Lord Mayor of Cardiff, Russell Goodway, was responsible for giving that important proposal the seal of approval.

Bydd buddsoddiad y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol o £37 miliwn yng Nghanolfan Mileniwm Cymru, ei gymhorthdal refeniw blynyddol o £2 filiwn, a newydd-deb ac agosrwydd y ddau sefydliad yn peri i sylwebyddion gysylltu llwyddiant neu fethiant y ganolfan â'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Drwy wneud defnydd priodol ohoni, bydd y ganolfan yn ffenestr siop i ddangos Cymru i'r byd ac yn llwyfan i feithrin doniau ein pobl ifanc. Dylai roi hwb anferthol i ddelwedd Cymru. Mae'n hollbwysig, felly, bod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ac asiantaethau eraill yn cydweithredu i greu'r amodau iawn ar gyfer llwyddiant.

Mae'r ganolfan yn adeilad gwreiddiol a gwahanol ac ynddo gyfleusterau sydd gyda'r mwyaf modern, ac mae ein traddodiad morwrol cyfoethog a'n statws gwleidyddol newydd i'w gweld yn amlwg o'i chwmpas. Gan hynny, mae'r sefydliad yn atyniad ohono'i hun, a dylai fod yn llwyddiant mawr ac yn fodd i feithrin cenedlaeth newydd o berfformwyr talentog.

Fodd bynnag, mae un cwmwl du bygythiol uwchben: hygyrchedd y ganolfan, nid yn unig ar gyfer y rhai sy'n byw mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru ac mewn ardaloedd cyfagos yn Lloegr, ond ar gyfer y niferoedd mawr sy'n byw yng nghyffiniau Caerdydd. Hyd yma, gwnaed trefniadau trafniadaeth ar gyfer yr wythnos agoriadol yn unig, ac mae gwasanaethau rheilffordd i fae Caerdydd wedi'u hystyngi dros dro fel y byddant yn rhedeg ar ôl i'r sioeau ddod i ben. Mae'n ddigon posibl y bydd y maes parcio sydd ag un ffordd i mewn ac allan a'r manau parcio dros dro i goetshis ar y ffordd yn achosi tagfeydd. Gwnaed y trefniadau trafniadaeth ar frys ac ar y funud olaf, er gwaethaf deisyfiadau lu gennyf fi ac eraill dros y ddwy flynedd diwethaf ar i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ddod â'r asiantaethau perthnasol at ei gilydd o gylch y bwrdd i greu system integredig, gadarn, a fyddai'n deilwng o brifddinas a sefydliad cenedlaethol newydd.

the new car park be ready to serve the Urdd Eisteddfod in June 2005, when daytime parking will be needed in a car park that is already full every day? If not, how will the centre cope?

When is it envisaged that an integrated ticketing service will be provided to facilitate the use of trains and buses? I understand that that has been done in part, but when will it be done fully? Will the Minister give us his assurance that the Welsh Assembly Government will be represented at future meetings of the relevant agencies in order to provide a permanent and holistic solution to the important matter of access to the Wales Millennium Centre? It is crucial that accessing the Wales Millennium Centre by train, coach, bus or car is not an unpleasant experience—it must be a pleasant experience. People must be encouraged to become regular visitors. Let us hope that it will be all right on the night and ever after.

**Alun Pugh:** You are right to say that, in the early stages, this project was anything but certain. However, with cross-party support in the Assembly, and excellent leadership from the local authority and colleagues in the Arts Council of Wales, the Assembly voted overwhelmingly to permit the project to proceed. You are also right to say that it will be an iconic building and a platform to show the best of Wales and Welsh culture to the whole world. I know that most Members have not yet been inside the building, but that will be remedied soon. When they do go inside, I am sure that they will be as impressed as I was.

You must raise transport issues with the Minister for Economic Development and Transport, but a series of detailed actions have been undertaken, both in terms of the opening weekend and the detailed arrangements for the normal—

A yw'r Gweinidog yn fodlon ar leoliad 20 o fannau parcio ceir ar y ffordd, a fydd yn cyfyngu'r tair ffordd sy'n gwasanaethu'r ganolfan i un lôn? A fydd y maes parcio newydd yn barod at wasanaeth Eisteddfod yr Urdd ym Mehefin 2005, pan fydd angen parcio ceir yn ystod y dydd mewn maes parcio sydd eisoes yn llawn bob dydd? Os na fydd, sut y bydd y ganolfan yn ymdopi?

Erbyn pa bryd y rhagwelir y bydd gwasanaeth tocynnau integredig ar gael i hwyluso'r defnydd o drenau a bysiau? Deallaf fod hynny wedi'i wneud yn rhannol, ond pa bryd y cwblheir hynny? A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi sicrwydd i ni y caiff Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ei chynrychioli yng nghyfarfodydd yr asiantaethau perthnasol yn y dyfodol i sicrhau ateb parhaol a chyfannol i fater pwysig hygrychedd Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru? Mae'n hollbwysig sicrhau na fydd cyrraedd Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru ar y trê neu mewn coetsh, bws neu gar yn brofiad annymunol—rhaid iddo fod yn brofiad dymunol. Rhaid cymell pobl i ymweld yn rheolaidd. Gadewch inni obeithio y bydd popeth yn iawn ar y noson ac yn dragwyddol wedi hynny.

**Alun Pugh:** Yr ydych yn iawn wrth ddweud bod y prosiect hwn ymhell o fod yn sicr ar y dechrau. Fodd bynnag, gyda chefnogaeth drawsbleidiol yn y Cynulliad, ac arweiniad rhagorol gan yr awdurdod lleol a chymheiriaid yng Nghyngor Celfyddydau Cymru, pleidleisiodd y Cynulliad o fwyafrif llethol i ganiatáu i'r prosiect fynd rhagddo. Yr ydych hefyd yn iawn wrth ddweud y bydd yn adeilad eiconig ac yn llwyfan i ddangos y gorau o Gymru a diwylliant Cymru i'r holl fyd. Gwn nad yw'r rhan fwyaf o Aelodau wedi bod yn yr adeilad eto, ond gwneir iawn am hynny cyn hir. Pan ânt i mewn, yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnaiff gymaint o argraff arnynt hwy ag a wnaeth arnaf fi.

Rhaid ichi godi materion sy'n ymwneud â thrafnidiaeth gyda'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth, ond mae cyfres o gamau manwl wedi'u cymryd, ar gyfer y penwythnos agoriadol a'r trefniadau manwl—



**Rhodri Glyn Thomas** *rose*—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This is a statement, not a debate.

**Alun Pugh:** Work is in hand on issues ranging from car parking to coach parking, and detailed discussions have taken place between train companies and the WMC. You mentioned integrated ticketing and there are all kinds of ongoing explorations around being able to buy a joint ticket for both the performance and the transport. That kind of marketing package work is under way. I can confirm that my officials, and Andrew Davies's officials, will play a key part as transport links are developed.

**Lisa Francis:** The Welsh Conservative group welcomes the opening of Wales's new cultural icon and looks forward to the opening celebration of our country's contribution to the arts, 'Cymry for the World', on 26 November. Given that the grand opening is just 15 days away, and you said yourself that arrangements are to the wire, will you tell us what is happening with regard to cleaning up the building site mess outside the north-west side of this building, which runs alongside the back of the millennium centre? I note from the draft culture budget proposals that a major part of this comes under the heading of 'culture fund', but we do not have any information on that, and neither does the Members' Research and Committee Services. In relation to the Wales Millennium Centre, have any further costs for this project been identified, and will that information be available to us before the next committee meeting on 17 November, when we will be discussing the culture budget?

You referred to the Wales Millennium Centre Company's final business plan in your statement. Will you tell us what is happening with regard to ongoing market research for the WMC, and what financial provisions are being made for that? How confident are you that the WMC company will close the capital fundraising deficit gap of £2 million by the end of the calendar year, and are you in a

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas** *a gododd*—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Datganiad yw hwn, nid dadl.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae gwaith yn mynd rhagddo ar faterion sy'n amrywio o barcio ceir i barcio coetshis, a bu trafodaethau manwl rhwng cwmnïau trenau a Chanolfan Mileniwm Cymru. Cyfeiriasoch at docynnau integredig ac mae pob math o ymchwil yn mynd rhagddi ynghylch y posibilrwydd o allu prynu tocyn ar y cyd ar gyfer y perfformiad a'r cludiant. Mae gwaith ar becynnau marchnata'n mynd rhagddo. Gallaf gadarnhau y bydd fy swyddogion i, a swyddogion Andrew Davies, yn chwarae rhan allweddol wrth ddatblygu cysylltiadau trafniadaeth.

**Lisa Francis:** Mae grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru'n croesawu agor eicon diwylliannol newydd Cymru ac yn edrych ymlaen at y dathliad agoriadol o gyfraniad ein gwlad i'r celfyddydau, 'Cymry i'r Byd', ar 26 Tachwedd. Gan nad yw'r agoriad mawreddog hwnnw ond 15 niwrnod i ffwrdd, a dywedasoch eich hun y bydd y trefniadau'n parhau tan y funud olaf, a wnewch chi ddweud wrthym beth sy'n cael ei wneud er mwyn glanhau'r llanestr ar y safle adeiladu y tu allan i ochr ogledd-orllewinol yr adeilad hwn, sy'n rhedeg ochr yn ochr â chefn canolfan y mileniwm? Nodaf o'r cynigion yn y gyllideb ddrafft ar gyfer diwylliant fod y rhan fwyaf o hyn yn dod o dan bennawd y 'gronfa ddiwylliant', ond nid oes gennym ni, na Gwasanaethau Pwyllgorau ac Ymchwil yr Aelodau, unrhyw wybodaeth am hynny. Mewn cysylltiad â Chanolfan Mileniwm Cymru, a ganfuwyd unrhyw gostau pellach ynghlwm wrth y prosiect hwn, ac a fydd y wybodaeth honno ar gael i ni cyn cyfarfod nesaf y pwyllgor ar 17 Tachwedd, pan fyddwn yn trafod y gyllideb ar gyfer diwylliant?

Cyfeiriasoch yn eich datganiad at gynllun busnes terfynol Cwmni Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru. A wnewch chi ddweud wrthym beth sy'n digwydd mewn cysylltiad ag ymchwil farchnata sy'n mynd rhagddi ar gyfer CMC, a pha ddarpariaethau ariannol a wneir ar gyfer hynny? Pa mor ffyddiog yr ydych y bydd cwmni CMC yn cau'r bwlch o £2 filiwn yn y diffyg ar godi arian cyfalaf erbyn diwedd y

position to give us further details on that? In relation to the loan, you say that you propose to extend the amount of guarantee on it for a further six months, until the end of May 2005. While we support this project, we are cautiously supportive of extending the guarantee of the loan for a longer period.

3.20 p.m.

There are huge concerns about transport, and you say that we must refer our questions to Andrew Davies, which is astonishing. Arriva Trains will be providing several additional train services from Cardiff Queen Street station to Cardiff bay over the opening weekend, and you will be aware that the provision of this service is outside its franchise contract. There will be free shuttle services between Cardiff Central station and Cardiff bay station, as well as from Lloyd George Avenue, but what work has been done by your Government and Arriva Trains to identify funding for an enhanced train service to Cardiff bay station, as per its letter of 22 September, after the opening weekend, and can you provide a timetable for that? You must have information on that. What agreements have so far been reached between Arriva and Cardiff County Council on a series of upgrades to Cardiff bay station, which is also important, and passenger access to the station?

Finally, I am sure that we would all thank Judith Isherwood, the chief executive, and Sir David Rowe-Beddoe, the chairman of Wales Millennium Centre, and everyone involved in this project for all of their hard work. I, and many others, sincerely hope that the Wales Millennium Centre's success will not be at the cost of the arts outside Cardiff, because while we have a wonderful flagship cultural centre in our capital city, it is important that we continue to nurture the talent that may one day be showcased there. We need to realise that. Only then will the monumental words of the poet Gwyneth Lewis, which act as windows in the building: '*Creu gwir fel*—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I do not think that we need to recite poetry; this should be questions following a statement.

flwyddyn galendr hon, ac a allwch chi roi manylion pellach i ni am hynny? Ynghylch y benthyciad, dywedwch eich bod yn bwriadu ymestyn y warant am chwe mis pellach, hyd ddiwedd Mai 2005. Er ein bod yn cefnogi'r prosiect hwn, yr ydym yn ochelgar yn ein cefnogaeth i ymestyn cyfnod y benthyciad.

Mae pryderon mawr ynghylch trafndiaeth, ac mae dweud bod rhaid inni holi Andrew Davies yn ymateb syfrdanol. Bydd Arriva Trains yn darparu sawl gwasanaeth trên ychwanegol o orsaf Stryd y Frenhines yng Nghaerdydd i fae Caerdydd dros y penwythnos agoriadol, a gwyddoch ei fod yn darparu'r gwasanaeth hwn yn ychwanegol at ei gontract masnachfaint. Bydd gwasanaeth bws gwennol am ddim rhwng gorsaf ganolog Caerdydd a gorsaf bae Caerdydd, ac o Rodfa Lloyd George hefyd, ond pa waith a wnaeth eich Llywodraeth ac Arriva Trains i ddod o hyd i arian i gael gwell gwasanaeth trenau i orsaf bae Caerdydd, yn unol â'i lythyr dyddiedig 22 Medi, ar ôl y penwythnos agoriadol, ac a allwch ddweud pa bryd y digwydd hynny? Mae'n sicr bod gennych wybodaeth am hynny. Pa gytundebau a wnaed hyd yma rhwng Arriva a Chyngor Sir Caerdydd i wella gorsaf bae Caerdydd, gan fod hynny'n bwysig hefyd, ac ar fynediad i deithwyr i'r orsaf?

Yn olaf, yr wyf yn siŵr y carem oll ddiolch i Judith Isherwood, y prif weithredwr, ac i Syr David Rowe-Beddoe, cadeirydd Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru, a phawb sy'n gysylltiedig â'r prosiect hwn am eu holl waith caled. Yr wyf fi, a llawer un arall, yn gwir obeithio na fydd Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru yn llwyddo ar draul y celfyddydau y tu allan i Gaerdydd oherwydd, er bod gennym ganolfan ddiwylliannol bwysig wych yn ein prifddinas, mae'n bwysig inni barhau i feithrin y ddawn y gellid ei harddangos yno ryw ddydd. Rhaid inni sylweddoli hynny. Dim ond wedyn y bydd geiriau aruthrol y bardd Gwyneth Lewis, sy'n ffurfio ffenestri yn yr adeilad: '*Creu gwir fel*—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni chredaf fod angen inni adrodd barddoniaeth; cwestiynau ar ôl datganiad yw hyn i fod.

**Alun Pugh:** Work is continuing, as you can see, to ensure that the site and the surrounding area look their best when the television cameras and the eyes of the world are on Cardiff bay in a few days' time. I will be happy to discuss in committee the detailed workings-out of the culture fund, but I can confirm that £2 million will be made available to the WMC in revenue subsidy. However, if you have any urgent concerns I would be happy to enter into correspondence before the committee meeting.

On the questions concerning transport, Arriva and WMC meet regularly. Work is in hand to upgrade the Cardiff bay station, and the railway will be an appropriate means of getting to some of those concerts. Finally, I assure you that this icon will not be at the expense of arts in other parts of Wales, because we have announced a £2 million package for the arts outside of Cardiff and our commitment to that will be evident in next week's budget.

**Eleanor Burnham:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome the forthcoming opening as a further manifestation of our growing confidence and stature on the world's cultural stage. It will be a springboard onto the international stage for many young artists. I am also delighted that Urdd Gobaith Cymru will be an integral part of the centre, as it is vital to our Welsh youth and culture. I also take this opportunity to commend Jenny Randerson, our former Liberal Democrat Minister for Culture, who worked hard on this important world-class venue.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I do not think that we need to recite poetry or commend one another. I would like to hear a few questions please.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yes, indeed. I am concerned about the cash-flow problem. I am glad that the period of the loan guarantee has been extended to May 2005, but I want assurances that sufficient funds will be available for the centre's continued success. Have you thought of making grants available

**Alun Pugh:** Mae gwaith yn parhau, fel y gallwch weld, i sicrhau y bydd y safle a'i gyffiniau ar eu gorau pan fydd y camerâu teledu a llygaid y byd yn troi at fae Caerdydd ymhen rhai dyddiau. Byddaf yn falch o drafod manylion y gronfa ddiwylliant yn y pwyllgor, ond gallaf gadarnhau y bydd cymhorthdal refeniw o £2 filiwn ar gael i Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru. Fodd bynnag, os oes gennych unrhyw bryderon dybryd, byddwn yn fodlon ymateb yn ysgrifenedig yn eu cylch cyn cyfarfod y pwyllgor.

Ynghylch y cwestiynau am drafnidiaeth, mae Arriva a Chanolfan Mileniwm Cymru yn cwrdd yn rheolaidd. Mae gwaith yn mynd rhagddo i wella gorsaf bae Caerdydd, a bydd y rheilffordd yn ddull addas o deithio i gyrraedd rhai o'r cyngherddau hynny. Yn olaf, yr wyf yn eich sicrhau na fydd yr eicon hwn yn bod ar draul y celfyddydau mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru, gan ein bod wedi cyhoeddi pecyn o £2 filiwn ar gyfer y celfyddydau y tu allan i Gaerdydd a bydd ein hymrwymiad i hynny'n amlwg yn y gyllideb yr wythnos nesaf.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn croesawu'r agoriad fel amlygiad pellach o'n hyder a'n statws cynyddol ar lwyfan diwylliannol y byd. Bydd y ganolfan yn cynnig cyfle i lawer o artistiaid ifanc gyrraedd y llwyfan rhyngwladol. Yr wyf hefyd yn falch iawn y bydd Urdd Gobaith Cymru yn rhan annatod o'r ganolfan, gan fod hynny'n hollbwysig i ieuencid a diwylliant Cymru. Achubaf ar y cyfle hwn hefyd i ganmol Jenny Randerson, cyn-Weinidog y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol dros ddiwylliant, a weithiodd yn galed ar y ganolfan bwysig hon sydd gyda'r gorau yn y byd.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni chredaf fod angen inni adrodd barddoniaeth na chanmol ein gilydd. Carwn glywed ychydig o gwestiynau, os gwelwch yn dda.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Ie, yn sicr. Pryderaf ynghylch y broblem sy'n ymwneud â llif arian. Yr wyf yn falch bod cyfnod gwarant y benthyciad wedi'i ymestyn i Fai 2005, ond yr wyf am gael sicrwydd y bydd digon o gyllid ar gael i sicrhau llwyddiant y ganolfan at y dyfodol. A ydych wedi ystyried darparu

to underprivileged youths from other parts of Wales so that they can take part in this wonderful experience, which is far afield for many of them?

Like other Members, I am concerned about transport, particularly the unco-ordinated public transport. Should we not have a little vision and strive to be similar to other European capitals in this regard in trying to raise our standards, particularly with regard to properly organised parking, which has already been alluded to? Surely we should raise our expectations and aim for an integrated, all-embracing experience that will not put people off after the first go. Also, when will integrated ticketing be available?

Finally, I commend this building because it will give a well-deserved boost to Wales and I wish Judith Isherwood, David Rowe-Beddoe and all the WMC's staff the very best.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Wishing people well is not a question.

**Alun Pugh:** I agree with you about the Urdd, Eleanor. Everyone is looking forward to seeing the transformation of the WMC and the precinct and oval basin into the maes. I am sure that that will be a highly successful affair and a major boost for the Urdd. The Urdd will be major partner in the centre—there is a lot of residential accommodation there, which is one of the features that makes it particularly exciting. It will provide an opportunity for young people from all over Wales to experience the WMC.

Turning to the specifics of the loan guarantee, the WMC has achieved significant funding commitments from the private sector, in the form of donations and through a leasing arrangement. However, not all of these amounts will be received by the end of November. For example, the major and hugely generous donation of £10 million from Donald Gordon will be phased over several years. We are not upping the loan guarantee by one penny—we are merely extending it in terms of timing so that the centre can manage those cash flow issues.

grantiau ar gyfer pobl ifanc ddifreintiedig o rannau eraill o Gymru fel y gallant gyfranogi o'r profiad gwyh hwn, sydd yn bell i ffwrdd oddi wrth lawer ohonynt?

Yn yr un modd ag Aelodau eraill, pryderaf ynghylch trafndiaeth, yn enwedig y drafndiaeth gyhoeddus sydd heb ei chyd-drefnu. Oni ddylem gael ychydig o weledigaeth a cheisio ymdebygu i brifddinasoedd eraill yn Ewrop yn hyn o beth wrth geisio codi ein safonau, yn enwedig gyda golwg ar drefniadau parcio priodol, sy'n fater y cyfeiriwyd ato eisoes? Oni ddylem ddisgwyl mwy ac anelu at gael profiad hollgynhwysol integredig na fydd yn siomi pobl y tro cyntaf yr ymwelant â'r ganolfan. Hefyd, pa bryd y bydd tocynnau integredig ar gael?

Yn olaf, canmolaf yr adeilad hwn gan y bydd yn rhoi hwb haeddiannol i Gymru a dymunaf yn dda i Judith Isherwood, David Rowe-Beddoe a holl staff y ganolfan.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw dymuno'n dda i bobl yn gwestiwn.

**Alun Pugh:** Cytunaf â chi ynghylch yr Urdd, Eleanor. Mae pawb yn edrych ymlaen at weld trawsnewid y ganolfan a'r man cerddwyr a'r basn hirgrwn i wneud y maes. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd hynny'n llwyddiant mawr ac yn hwb mawr i'r Urdd. Bydd yr Urdd yn bartner o bwys yn y ganolfan—mae llawer o lety yno, a dyna un o'r nodweddion sy'n peri ei bod yn arbennig o gyffrous. Bydd yn rhoi cyfle i bobl ifanc o bob rhan o Gymru gael profiad o'r ganolfan.

Gan droi at fanylion gwarant y benthyciad, mae CMC wedi sicrhau ymrwymadau sylweddol o ran cyllido gan y sector preifat, ar ffurf rhoddion a thrwy drefniant prydlesu. Fodd bynnag, ni fydd yr holl symiau hynny wedi dod i law erbyn diwedd Tachwedd. Er enghraifft, bydd y rhodd fawr a thra hael o £10 miliwn gan Donald Gordon yn cael ei throsglwyddo'n raddol dros sawl blwyddyn. Nid ydym yn ychwanegu'r un geiniog at warant y benthyciad—nid ydym ond yn ymestyn ei chyfnod fel y gall y ganolfan ymdrin â'r materion sy'n codi mewn

cysylltiad â llif arian.

**Lorraine Barrett:** There is a lot of excitement building towards the opening of the WMC, which is a wonderful building and will be a great opportunity for people from Wales and the wider world to enjoy the varied performances, to perform there themselves, or to work there. Will you do all you can, in conjunction with the WMC management, to ensure that local people in particular have the opportunity to access jobs, to perform there or to go there as theatre-goers to see opera, dance or community performances by some of the excellent companies we have in Wales, some of which work with people with learning difficulties. Will you come along in December with some of us, to see 'The Good, The Bad and the Cuddly'— which is not a Plenary debate—by Odyssey Theatre, which undertakes excellent work as a community theatre. Do you have any geographical breakdown of the balloted tickets for the opening weekend? Work was to be undertaken to ensure that people from all parts of Wales were able to get these tickets. Has that been achieved?

**Alun Pugh:** You are right in saying that a great deal of excitement is building towards the opening. There will be a huge range of different performances taking place in the WMC, from Wozzeck to Winnie the Pooh. It will be open for all, because you can go to the world class Welsh National Opera for a fiver. That says a lot about openness and accessibility to the arts. Eight thousand applications have been received to date for a pair of tickets. I do not have a postcode analysis, but I understand that the applications are from all parts of Wales, and a few from over the border. The centre is open to all, but it was only promoted in Wales. When we receive the detailed postcode analysis, I shall make it available to members of the Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee and anyone else who wishes to receive a copy.

**Jenny Randerson:** I share your sense of delight that this building is about to open. I have to admit to a slight sense of relief, because when I first became culture Minister, all bets were off on whether it would ever be built. After months of difficult negotiations, a

**Lorraine Barrett:** Mae llawer o gyffro ynghylch agor y ganolfan, sy'n adeilad gwych a fydd yn cynnig cyfle rhagorol i bobl o Gymru a'r tu hwnt gael mwynhau'r gwahanol berfformiadau, perfformio eu hunain, neu weithio yno. A wnewch chi bopeth yn eich gallu, ar y cyd â rheolwyr CMC, i sicrhau y bydd pobl leol yn benodol yn cael cyfle i gael swyddi, i berfformio yno neu i fynd i'r theatr yno i weld operâu, dawns neu berfformiadau cymunedol gan rai o'r cwmnïau rhagorol sydd gennym yng Nghymru, y mae rhai ohonynt yn gweithio â phobl sydd ag anawsterau dysgu. A ddewch chi gyda rhai ohonom ym mis Rhagfyr, i weld 'The Good, The Bad and the Cuddly'— ac nid dadl yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ydyw—gan Odyssey Theatre, sy'n gwneud gwaith rhagorol fel theatr gymunedol. A oes gennych ddadansoddiad daearyddol o'r tocynnau sydd i'w tynnu ar gyfer y penwythnos agoriadol? Yr oedd gwaith i fod i gael ei wneud i sicrhau y gallai pobl o bob rhan o Gymru gael y tocynnau hynny. A gyflawnwyd hynny?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr ydych yn iawn wrth ddweud bod llawer o gyffro ynghylch yr agoriad. Bydd amrywiaeth mawr o berfformiadau yng Nghanolfan Mileniwm Cymru, o Wozzeck i Winnie the Pooh. Bydd ar gael i bawb, gan y gellir gweld Opera Cenedlaethol Cymru, sydd gyda'r gorau yn y byd, am bumpunt. Mae hynny'n dangos bod y celfyddydau'n hygyrch ac ar gael i bawb. Cafwyd 8,000 o geisiadau am barau o docynnau hyd yma. Nid oes gennyf ddadansoddiad o'r codau post, ond deallaf fod y ceisiadau wedi dod o bob rhan o Gymru, a rhai o'r ochr draw i'r ffin. Mae'r ganolfan yn agored i bawb, ond dim ond yng Nghymru y caiff ei hyrwyddo. Pan gawn ddadansoddiad manwl o'r codau post, fe'i rhoddaf i aelodau Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon ac i unrhyw un arall sy'n dymuno cael copi.

**Jenny Randerson:** Fel chithau, yr wyf wrth fy modd bod yr adeilad hwn ar fin agor. Rhaid imi gyfaddef fy mod yn teimlo ychydig o ryddhad, oherwydd pan ddeuthum yn Weinidog diwylliant, yr oedd amheuaeth fawr ynghylch a gâi byth ei chodi. Ar ôl

fixed-price contract was clearly the right decision.

With the Presiding Officer's indulgence, I wish to thank my colleague at that time, Edwina Hart, for her assistance with the project. She put a great deal of work into this, and had the courage and foresight to support it. I also thank Sir David Rowe-Beddoe, Judith Isherwood and the board of the WMC, as well as Assembly officials, who have been involved in this long saga.

Turning to the programme, it is a wonderful picture of something for all tastes, giving the lie to those who said it would in reality only be an opera house. Can you give your assurance that a similar range of programming and entertainment will be available in the future?

I was delighted to hear your comments on the co-operation of Cardiff County Council on issues associated with the opening weekend. There are still strong concerns about transport and parking which have already been referred to in the Chamber. Can I press you further on the particular issue of late evening trains, as that would make this centre particularly accessible? Are there firmer plans for late evening trains?

3.30 p.m.

I was also delighted to see the range of ticket prices—it is much cheaper to go to the Wales Millennium Centre than to a rugby match. Can we have your guarantee that that range of ticket prices and, particularly, the number of cheaper tickets, will continue in the future? Finally, on the money for the performing arts outside Cardiff, will you reconsider your decision to bring in the full £2 million that was promised at a slower rate than was originally intended? It was intended that the money would come in pro rata from the day that the WMC opened, but it will come in more slowly under your plan. Will you reconsider that?

**Alun Pugh:** You are right that it is far more

misoedd o negodi anodd, mae'n amlwg mai contract â phris penodol oedd y penderfyniad cywir.

Os gwnaiff y Llywydd faddau hyn i mi, dymunaf ddiolch i'm cyd-Weinidog ar y pryd, Edwina Hart, am ei chymorth gyda'r prosiect. Gwnaeth lawer iawn o waith ar hyn, ac yr oedd yn meddu ar y dewrder a'r craffter i'w gefnogi. Diolchaf hefyd i Syr David Rowe-Beddoe, Judith Isherwood a bwrdd y ganolfan, yn ogystal â swyddogion y Cynulliad, a fu'n ymwneud â hyn dros gyfnod mor hir.

Gan droi at y rhaglen, mae'n ddarlun hyfryd o bethau at bob dant, sy'n gwrthbrofi honiadau'r rhai a ddywedodd na fyddai'n ddim amgen na thŷ opera. A allwch roi sicrwydd y bydd amrediad tebyg o raglennu ac adloniant ar gael yn y dyfodol?

Yr oeddwn wrth fy modd o glywed eich sylwadau am gydweithrediad Cyngor Sir Caerdydd mewn materion sy'n gysylltiedig â'r penwythnos agoriadol. Mae pryderon mawr o hyd ynghylch trafnidiaeth a pharcio, y cyfeiriwyd atynt eisoes yn y Siambr. A gaf bwysu arnoch ymhellach ar fater penodol trenau sy'n rhedeg ar ddiwedd y noson, gan y byddai hynny'n peri i'r ganolfan hon fod yn arbennig o hygyrch? A oes cynlluniau mwy pendant ar gyfer trenau ar ddiwedd y noson?

Yr oeddwn hefyd yn falch o weld yr amrediad o brisiau tocynnau—mae'n rhatach o lawer mynd i Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru nag i weld gêm rygbi. A allwch warantu y bydd amrediad y prisiau tocynnau ac, yn benodol, nifer y tocynnau rhatach, yn parhau yn y dyfodol? Yn olaf, ynghylch yr arian ar gyfer y celfyddydau perfformiadol y tu allan i Gaerdydd, a wnewch chi ailystyried eich penderfyniad i gyflwyno'r £2 filiwn gyfan a addawyd yn arafach nag a fwriadwyd yn wreiddiol? Y bwriad oedd cyflwyno'r arian hwnnw yn ôl cyfran oddi ar ddiwrnod agor y ganolfan, ond caiff ei gyflwyno'n arafach o dan eich cynllun. A wnewch chi ailystyried hynny?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr ydych yn iawn wrth ddweud

than just an opera house. The economics of the whole operation are critical and depend entirely on having that wide appeal. The first year's programme is now settled, the second year's programme is almost complete, and there is much detailed advanced planning under way for the third year. For example, in the first year you have everything from Cirque Eloize, Sleeping Beauty on Ice, Winnie the Pooh, which you mentioned, the Kirov Ballet, Miss Saigon, Swan Lake—The Australian Ballet, the Urdd National Eisteddfod, Bugs Bunny on Broadway, My Fair Lady, and three or four operas, including a favourite of mine—Die Zauberflöte. So there really is something for everyone.

On late-night trains, you will be able to get to many destinations in Wales on a late-night train after a performance, but not all. Accessibility to all areas is important, and we want to develop that. You are right that ticket prices at £5 for an opera are, literally, available to all. That is cheaper, effectively, than the price of a cinema ticket—let alone a major international sporting event—so price will not be a barrier to getting in to see a world-class Welsh National Opera performance. On your final point about the £2 million for the arts outside Cardiff, we are committed to delivering that and we have announced our timetable and will stick to it.

**The Presiding Officer:** We have just over three minutes left for this statement. I do not propose to extend it, because we have important legislation to follow. I therefore invite Members to ask one question, if that is possible, and for the Minister to answer briefly, which I am sure is possible.

**Peter Law:** Minister, the have-nots outside Cardiff in the rest of Wales, living in deprived areas, as many do, ask how they can enjoy what others will take for granted. They look to us, and particularly to you, for a lead and ask what can be done for them. It is a stark contrast that, after £55 million has gone into this opera house—and you have extended the loan today—only £2 million is

ei bod yn llawer amgenach na thŷ opera. Mae economeg y ganolfan gyfan yn hollbwysig ac mae'n dibynnu'n llwyr ar yr apêl eang honno. Mae rhaglen y flwyddyn gyntaf wedi'i phennu bellach, ac mae rhaglen yr ail flwyddyn bron yn gyflawn, ac mae llawer o flaengynllunio manwl ar y gweill ar gyfer y drydedd flwyddyn. Er enghraifft, yn y flwyddyn gyntaf ceir popeth o Cirque Eloize, Sleeping Beauty on Ice, Winnie the Pooh, y cyfeiriasoch ato, bale Kirov, Miss Saigon, Swan Lake—The Australian Ballet, Eisteddfod Genedlaethol yr Urdd, Bugs Bunny on Broadway, My Fair Lady, a thair neu bedair o operâu, gan gynnwys un o'm ffefrynau—Die Zauberflöte. Felly mae rhywbeth i bawb.

Ynghylch trenau sy'n rhedeg ar ddiwedd y noson, byddwch yn gallu cyrraedd llawer o gyrchfannau yng Nghymru ar drên ar ddiwedd y noson ar ôl perfformiad, ond nid pob un. Mae'r gallu i gyrraedd pob ardal yn bwysig, ac yr ydym am ddatblygu hynny. Yr ydych yn iawn wrth ddweud bod tocynnau am £5 i weld opera yn golygu y bydd ar gael i bawb, yn llythrennol. Mae hynny'n rhatach, i bob pwrpas, na phris tocyn sinema—heb sôn am ddigwyddiad chwaraeon mawr rhyngwladol—felly ni fydd cost yn rhwystr rhag mynd i weld perfformiad o'r radd flaenaf gan Opera Cenedlaethol Cymru. Ynghylch y pwynt olaf a wnaethoch am y £2 filiwn ar gyfer y celfyddydau y tu allan i Gaerdydd, yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i roi'r swm hwnnw ac wedi cyhoeddi ein hamserlen, a bwriadwn gadw at honno.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae gennym ychydig dros dri munud yn weddill ar gyfer y datganiad hwn. Ni fwriadaf ei ymestyn, gan fod deddfwriaeth bwysig i ddilyn. Felly, gwahoddaf Aelodau i ofyn un cwestiwn, os oes modd, ac i'r Gweinidog ateb yn fyr, sy'n bosibl, yr wyf yn siŵr.

**Peter Law:** Weinidog, mae'r rhai sydd heb ddim y tu allan i Gaerdydd yng ngweddill Cymru, y mae llawer ohonynt yn byw mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig, yn gofyn sut y gallant fwynhau'r hyn y mae eraill yn ei gymryd yn ganiataol. Maent yn disgwyl i ni, a chi'n enwedig, roi arweiniad a gofynnant beth y gellir ei wneud drostynt. Gwelir gwrthgyferbyniad llwyr yn y ffaith bod £55

made available for the rest of Wales, while there is to be an annual £2 million revenue contribution to this building. Will you now agree, therefore, to increase the funding for the rest of Wales, in a move to give an opportunity to all the people in Wales to improve their artistic opportunities?

**Alun Pugh:** I have not increased the loan this afternoon—I have merely announced my intention to adjust the timing. The £2 million for the arts outside Cardiff is a big allocation, and that is as far as we can go in the current budget. We could always spend more on worthwhile projects, which we will have to consider in future budget planning rounds.

**Elin Jones:** Mae'r tocynnau yr wyf wedi eu prynu ar gyfer perfformiadau yng nghanolfan y mileniwm yn uniaith Saesneg—yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu atoch ynglŷn â hyn. A gredwch ei bod yn annerbyniol bod tocynnau ar gyfer perfformiadau yn y ganolfan genedlaethol bwysig hon ond ar gael yn Saesneg, ac a wnewch ddwyn perswâd ar awdurdodau canolfan y mileniwm i gynhyrchu tocynnau yn y Gymraeg a'r Saesneg yn y dyfodol?

**Alun Pugh:** Cytunaf ei bod yn bwysig argraffu tocynnau yn y ddwy iaith.

**John Griffiths:** What are your current expectations of the building being a no smoking building in terms of the health of staff and visitors?

**Alun Pugh:** You are right that environmental tobacco smoke is a serious health hazard to children and non-smoking adults. Trade unions are also rightly concerned about health and safety at work issues in respect of cancer and, particularly, coronary heart disease caused by passive smoking. It is a matter for the management of the WMC, but I hope that it will take its responsibilities to visitors and employees seriously.

miliwn wedi mynd tuag at y tŷ opera hwn—ac yr ydych wedi ymestyn y benthyciad heddiw—ac mai dim ond £2 filiwn a ddarperir ar gyfer gweddill Cymru, tra ceir cyfraniad refeniw o £2 filiwn y flwyddyn tuag at yr adeilad hwn. A gytunwch yn awr, felly, i roi mwy o gyllid ar gyfer gweddill Cymru, er mwyn galluogi holl bobl Cymru i gael gwell cyfleoedd o ran y celfyddydau?

**Alun Pugh:** Nid wyf wedi cynyddu'r benthyciad y prynhawn yma—nid wyf ond wedi cyhoeddi fy mwriad i newid yr amseriad. Mae'r £2 filiwn ar gyfer y celfyddydau y tu allan i Gaerdydd yn ddyraniad mawr, a dyna'r mwyaf y gallwn ei roi o dan y gyllideb bresennol. Mae bob amser yn bosibl y gallem wario rhagor ar brosiectau buddiol, y bydd yn rhaid inni eu hystyried mewn cylchoedd cynllunio cyllideb yn y dyfodol.

**Elin Jones:** The tickets that I have purchased for performances at the millennium centre are in English only—I have written to you about this. Do you believe that it is unacceptable that tickets for performances at this important national centre are only available in English, and will you persuade the authorities at the millennium centre to produce tickets in Welsh and English in future?

**Alun Pugh:** I agree that it is important to print tickets in both languages.

**John Griffiths:** Pa obeithion sydd gennych ar hyn o bryd o ran atal ysmegu yn yr adeilad yng nghyd-destun iechyd y staff a'r ymwelwyr?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr ydych yn iawn wrth ddweud bod mwg tybaco yn yr amgylchedd yn berygl difrifol i iechyd plant ac oedolion nad ydynt yn ysmegu. Mae undebau llafur hefyd yn poeni, a hynny'n briodol, ynghylch materion sy'n ymwneud ag iechyd a diogelwch yn y gweithle mewn cysylltiad â chanser ac, yn benodol, clefyd coronaidd y galon a achosir gan ysmegu goddefol. Mae'n fater i reolwyr y ganolfan, ond gobeithiaf y byddant yn cymryd eu cyfrifoldebau at ymwelwyr a gweithwyr o ddifrif.



**Laura Anne Jones:** I am obviously excited by the opening of the centre, but, as you know, it is not just a matter of how good the centre is, or how wonderful the performances staged there are, but of the whole experience that people take away with them. Your utter failure to recognise the importance of a decent transport infrastructure could be a grave mistake. Where will visitors park their cars? You say that there will be a multi-storey car park, but not for some time yet. Where will coaches park? Where will taxis drop off fares? I do not see a designated taxi rank. What will disabled and elderly visitors do? I do not see an adequate area for them. What about—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I have heard at least one question.

**Alun Pugh:** I have already said that detailed arrangements are in place for interim parking. Drop-off areas have been organised and there are special arrangements for Arriva for the opening weekend. The transport arrangements are not perfect, but substantial preparations have been made.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Do you agree that it is vital that the Wales Millennium Centre, as a focal point for the whole of Wales, represents our cultural diversity and inspires ambition in talented young people across our nation?

**Alun Pugh:** I agree entirely. I regard the whole nation as important, as you represent a north Wales seat. I hope, when we have an opportunity, to examine the purchasing pattern of tickets, and I will take a keen interest in how tickets are sold, not just across socio-economic groups, but also in terms of geographic distribution and to have a detailed discussion on this matter in the Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Yr wyf yn llawn cyffro, wrth gwrs, ynghylch y ffaith y bydd y ganolfan yn agor, ond, fel y gwyddoch, nid mater o ba mor dda y mae'r ganolfan, neu ba mor wych y mae'r perfformiadau a lwyfennir yno, yn unig ydyw hyn, ond y profiad cyfan a gaiff pobl. Gallai'ch methiant llwyr i weld pwysigrwydd seilwaith trafndiaeth addas fod yn gamgymeriad mawr. Ym mhle y bydd ymwelwyr yn parcio eu ceir? Dywedwch y ceir maes parcio aml-lawr, ond nid am gryn amser. Ym mhle y bydd coetshis yn parcio? Ym mhle y bydd tacsis yn gollwng eu teithwyr? Ni welaf safle tacsis penodedig. Beth a wnaiff ymwelwyr anabl ac oedrannus? Ni welaf fan addas iddynt hwy. Beth am—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Clywais o leiaf un cwestiwn.

**Alun Pugh:** Yr wyf eisoes wedi dweud bod trefniadau manwl wedi'u gwneud ar gyfer parcio dros dro. Trefnwyd manau i ollwng teithwyr ac mae trefniadau arbennig i Arriva ar gyfer y penwythnos agoriadol. Nid yw'r trefniadau trafndiaeth yn berffaith, ond gwnaed paratodau sylweddol.

**Denise Idris Jones:** A gytunwch ei bod yn hollbwysig y bydd Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru, fel canolbwynt i Gymru gyfan, yn cynrychioli ein hamrywiaeth diwylliannol ac yn deffro uchelgais mewn pobl ifanc dalentog ledled ein gwlad?

**Alun Pugh:** Cytunaf yn llwyr. Ystyriaf fod y genedl gyfan yn bwysig, gan eich bod yn cynrychioli sedd yn y Gogledd. Yr wyf yn gobeithio cael edrych ar y patrwm prynu tocynnau, pan gawn gyfle i wneud hynny, ac ymddiddoraf yn fawr yn y modd y gwerthir tocynnau, nid yn unig ar draws grwpiau cymdeithasol-economaidd, ond hefyd o ran eu dosbarthiad daearyddol a gobeithiaf y cawn drafodaeth fanwl ar y mater hwn ym Mhwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon.

### **Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order**

**Peter Black:** Point of order. I raise this point of order with regard to the education maintenance allowance scheme for Wales.

**Peter Black:** Pwynt o drefn. Codaf y pwynt o drefn hwn mewn cysylltiad â'r cynllun lwfans cynhaliath addysg i Gymru. Mae'r

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning has told Members that she intends to approve this scheme under Standing Order No. 29.4 on 11 November 2004 unless a notice of dissatisfaction was tabled within five working days of the date of notification. In doing so, she stated that she believed it inappropriate for this item to come before the subject committee, the Legislation Committee or Plenary. A motion of dissatisfaction has been tabled for debate next week, I believe. However, it has been drawn to my attention that the scheme is already being advertised in schools before its approval, and certainly before the Assembly has determined how it will be dealt with. I have a copy of the booklet here. I seek your ruling, Presiding Officer, as to whether a gross discourtesy has been shown to Members on this issue and ask whether the Minister has breached the Assembly's protocols in taking this action.

**Leighton Andrews:** Further to this point of order, I seek your ruling, Presiding Officer, on the possible impact should the motion on the notice of dissatisfaction be passed. Am I right in thinking that, were it passed, the EMAs could not be paid and that my constituents, and those of every Member, would not therefore receive the education maintenance allowances?

**The Presiding Officer:** It is not for me to rule on the consequence of Assembly debates that are within order. If there is an issue of timing with regard to Assembly legislation, then it is for that legislation to come before the Assembly in a timely manner so that, if necessary, all the processes that Members may require for that legislation may be followed.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** Further to this point of order, having secured financial support from the Treasury, so that this new scheme will not cost the Assembly budget, I issued a detailed written statement on the operation of the scheme to the Assembly in April. The statement made it clear that the scheme would be in place by this academic year. Schools and colleges were informed of the outline of the scheme, and all potential recipients were given information with their

Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes wedi dweud wrth Aelodau ei bod yn bwriadu cymeradwyo'r cynllun hwn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29.4 ar 11 Tachwedd 2004 oni chyflwynid hysbysiad o anfonlonrwydd o fewn pum niwrnod gwaith i'r dyddiad hysbysu. Wrth wneud hynny, datganodd ei bod yn credu ei bod yn amhriodol i'r eitem hon ddod gerbron y pwyllgor pwnc, y Pwyllgor Deddfau neu'r Cyfarfod Llawn. Cyflwynwyd cynnig o anfonlonrwydd i'w drafod yr wythnos nesaf, yr wyf yn credu. Fodd bynnag, tynnwyd i'm sylw bod y cynllun yn cael ei hysbysebu eisoes mewn ysgolion cyn ei gymeradwyo, ac yn sicr cyn i'r Cynulliad benderfynu sut y mae i'w drafod. Mae gennyf gopi o'r llyfryn yma. Ceisiaf ddyfarniad gennyh, Lywydd, ynghylch a fuwyd yn dra anghwrtais wrth Aelodau yn y mater hwn a gofynnaf a yw'r Gweinidog wedi torri protocolau'r Cynulliad wrth gymryd y camau hyn.

**Leighton Andrews:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwn, ceisiaf ddyfarniad gennyh, Lywydd, ynghylch yr effaith bosibl os derbynnir y cynnig ar yr hysbysiad o anfonlonrwydd. A wyf yn iawn wrth feddwl, os câi ei dderbyn, na ellid talu'r lwfansau cynhaliaeth addysg ac, felly, na fyddai fy etholwyr i, a rhai pob Aelod arall, yn derbyn y lwfansau cynhaliaeth addysg?

**Y Llywydd:** Nid fy lle i yw dyfarnu ynghylch y canlyniad i ddadleuon yn y Cynulliad sydd mewn trefn. Os oes mater yn codi o ran amseru mewn cysylltiad â deddfwriaeth y Cynulliad, dylai'r ddeddfwriaeth honno ddod gerbron y Cynulliad yn brydlon fel y gellir dilyn, os oes angen, yr holl brosesau y gall Aelodau eu mynnu ar gyfer y ddeddfwriaeth honno.

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwn, a minnau wedi sicrhau cymorth ariannol gan y Trysorlys, fel na fydd y cynllun newydd hwn yn bod ar draul cyllideb y Cynulliad, rhoddais ddatganiad ysgrifenedig manwl ar weithrediad y cynllun i'r Cynulliad ym mis Ebrill. Eglurwyd yn y datganiad y byddai'r cynllun ar waith erbyn y flwyddyn academaidd hon. Rhoddwyd braslun o'r cynllun i ysgolion a cholegau, a rhoddwyd gwybodaeth i'r holl dderbynwyr

GCSE results. I informed members of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee on the detail of the policy as item 1 in my report to last month's committee meeting. The UK Government's substantial contribution to fund this scheme is dependent on the scheme running in the same way across the United Kingdom. Powers to deliver the scheme are contained in primary legislation. No regulations are required. The purpose of formally making the scheme under Standing Order No. 29 is to confirm the respective roles of the scheme provider, the Student Loans Company Ltd, and the other stakeholders, the schools and colleges, which have to record and monitor students' attendance.

Timing was a major consideration. We did not believe it wise to put forward the scheme until we were satisfied that we had the right split—[ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Speech.']

3.40 p.m.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The Minister is raising a matter further to a point of order.

**Jane Davidson:** We did not believe it was wise to put forward the scheme until we were satisfied that we had the right split between details contained in the scheme and those contained in the guidance. Following the familiarisation conferences with stakeholders in September, and the review by the EMA learning centre consultation group in October, we were satisfied. Therefore, under Standing Order No. 29.3 (iv) we disappplied further detailed consideration to ensure that the scheme was made by early December. We are committed, as a party, to expanding opportunities for young people of 16 years to stay at school or college. Payments will be made from early December unless the actions of the opposition Members put the scheme under threat. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.']

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The Minister is in danger of making a speech which she will be able to make at a later stage of the proceedings under Standing Order No. 29. I have nothing further to add to the point which

dichonol gyda'u canlyniadau TGAU. Hysbysais aelodau'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes am fanylion y polisi yn eitem 1 yn fy adroddiad yng nghyfarfod y pwyllgor y mis diwethaf. Rhoddir cyfraniad sylweddol gan Lywodraeth y DU i gyllido'r cynllun hwn ar yr amod y caiff ei redeg yn yr un modd ledled y Deyrnas Unedig. Ceir pwerau i redeg y cynllun mewn deddfwriaeth sylfaenol. Nid oes angen rheoliadau. Yr amcan wrth wneud y cynllun yn ffurfiol o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29 yw cadarnhau priod rolau darparwr y cynllun, sef y Cwmni Benthyciadau Myfyrwyr Cyf, a'r rhanddeiliaid eraill, yr ysgolion a'r colegau, sy'n gorfod cofnodi a monitro presenoldeb myfyrwyr.

Yr oedd yr amseru'n ystyriaeth o bwys. Nid oeddem yn credu mai doeth fyddai cyflwyno'r cynllun hyd nes y byddem yn fodlon ein bod wedi gwahanu'n briodol—[AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'Araith.']

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r Gweinidog yn codi mater ymhellach i bwynt o drefn.

**Jane Davidson:** Nid oeddem yn credu mai doeth fyddai cyflwyno'r cynllun hyd nes y byddem yn fodlon ein bod wedi gwahanu'n briodol rhwng manylion a geir yn y cynllun a'r rhai a geir yn y canllawiau. Ar ôl cynnal cynadleddau ymgyfarwyddo gyda rhanddeiliaid ym mis Medi, a'r adolygiad gan grŵp ymgyngori'r ganolfan dysgu ar lwfansau cynhaliath addysg ym mis Hydref, yr oeddem yn fodlon. Gan hynny, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3 (iv) gwnaethom ddatgymhwysu ystyriaeth fanwl bellach er mwyn sicrhau y gwneid y cynllun erbyn dechrau Rhagfyr. Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo, fel plaid, i roi mwy o gyfleoedd i bobl ifanc 16 flwydd oed gael aros yn yr ysgol neu mewn coleg. Gwneir taliadau o ddechrau Rhagfyr oni fydd gweithredoedd Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau'n peri bygythiad i'r cynllun. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.']

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r Gweinidog mewn perygl o wneud araith y bydd yn gallu ei gwneud yn ddiweddarach yn y trafodion o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29. Nid oes gennyf ddim i'w ychwanegu at y pwynt a wneuthum

I made earlier. The timing of the executive action required by Ministers of the Government of Wales must always include the issue of whether or not such executive action is to be scrutinised before this Assembly. If Assembly Members choose to exercise their rights under Standing Orders, I will not try to dissuade them and neither should the Minister.

yn gynharach. Rhaid i amseriad y camau gweithredol sy'n ofynnol gan Weinidogion Llywodraeth Cymru bob amser cynnwys y mater o ba un a geir craffu ar gamau gweithredol o'r fath gerbron y Cynulliad hwn. Os yw Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn dewis arfer eu hawliau o dan Reolau Sefydlog, ni cheisiaf eu cymell i beidio ac ni ddylai'r Gweinidog ychwaith.

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Hadau (Rhestrau Cenedlaethol o Amrywogaethau)  
(Diwygio) 2004**  
**Approval of the Seeds (National Lists of Varieties) (Amendment) Regulations  
2004**

**Y Llywydd:** O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

**The Presiding Officer:** Under Standing Order No. 24.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I propose that

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order Nos. 24.25, 25.13 and 25.14 approves the draft the Seeds (National Lists of Varieties) (Amendment) Regulations 2004, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 2 November 2004; and notes the explanatory memorandum for the above regulations laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 2 November 2004. (NDM2150)*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog rhifau 24.25, 25.13 a 25.14 yn cymeradwyo fersiwn drafft Rheoliadau Hadau (Rhestrau Cenedlaethol o Amrywogaethau) (Diwygio) 2004, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac yr anfonwyd copi ohonynt at Aelodau'r Cynulliad drwy'r e-bost ar 2 Tachwedd 2004; ac yn nodi'r memorandwm esboniadol ar gyfer y rheoliadau uchod y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac yr anfonwyd copi ohono at Aelodau'r Cynulliad drwy'r e-bost ar 2 Tachwedd 2004. (NDM2150)*

*Cynnig (NDM2150): O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2150): For 54, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin

Essex, Sue  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion Composite Motion: Approval of Orders**

**Y Llywydd:** O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

**The Presiding Officer:** Under Standing Order No. 24.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I propose that

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Cynigiad fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 24.25:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25:*

*1. a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 2 November 2004 on the draft Order, the Water Act 2003 (Commencement No. 2) (Wales) Order 2004;*

*1. a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno, ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 2 Tachwedd 2004 mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn*

and

*Deddf Dŵr 2003 (Cychwyn Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2004; ac*

*b) approves the Water Act 2003 (Commencement No. 2) (Wales) Order 2004 is made in accordance with the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 20 October 2004;*

*b) yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Deddf Dŵr 2003 (Cychwyn Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2004 yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Hydref 2004;*

*2. a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 2 November 2004 on the draft regulations, the Council Tax (Liability for Owners) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004; and*

*2. a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno, ac a anfonwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad drwy'r e-bost ar 2 Tachwedd 2004, mewn perthynas â Rheoliadau'r Dreth Gyngor (Atebolrwydd Perchnogion) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004; ac*

*b) approves the Council Tax (Liability for Owners) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004 is made in accordance with:*

*b) yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau'r Dreth Gyngor (Atebolrwydd Perchnogion) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*i) the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 20 October 2004;*

*i) y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Hydref 2004;*

*ii) regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 2 November 2004;*

*ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad drwy'r e-bost ar 2 Tachwedd 2004;*

*3. a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 2 November 2004 on the draft Order, the Council Tax (Chargeable Dwellings, Exempt Dwellings and Discount Disregards) (Amendment) (Wales) Order 2004; and*

*3. a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno, ac a anfonwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad drwy'r e-bost ar 2 Tachwedd 2004, mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn y Dreth Gyngor (Anheddau Taladwy, Anheddau Esempt a Diystyru Gostyngiadau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004; ac*

*b) approves the Council Tax (Chargeable Dwellings, Exempt Dwellings and Discount Disregards) (Amendment) (Wales) Order 2004 is made in accordance with:*

*b) yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn y Dreth Gyngor (Anheddau Taladwy, Anheddau Esempt a Diystyru Gostyngiadau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:*

*i) the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 20 October 2004;*

*i) y Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Hydref 2004;*

*ii) regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 2 November 2004;*

*ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd at yr Aelodau drwy'r e-bost ar 2 Tachwedd 2004;*

*iii) the memorandum of correction laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 2 November 2004. (NDM2151)*

*ii) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd at yr Aelodau drwy'r e-bost ar 2 Tachwedd 2004. (NDM2151)*

*Cynnig (NDM2151): O blaid 55, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2151): For 55, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf y Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub (Cynllun Pensiwn y Dynion Tân) (Cymru) 2004 a Rheoliadau Deddf y Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub (Cychwyn) (Cymru) 2004**  
**Approval of the Fire Rescue Services Act 2004 (Firefighters' Pension Scheme) (Wales) Order 2004 and the Fire and Rescue Services Act 2004 (Commencement) (Wales) Order 2004**

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1, 2 and 3 to NDM2152 in the name of David Melding, and amendments 1, 2 and 3 to NDM2154 in the name of David Melding.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2 a 3 i NDM2152 yn enw David Melding a gwelliannau 1, 2 a 3 i NDM2154 yn enw David Melding.

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** Cynigiad fod

*the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Fire and Rescue Services Act 2004 (Firefighters' Pension Scheme) (Wales) Order 2004, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 26 October 2004. (NDM2152)*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Deddf y Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub (Cynllun Pensiwn y Dynion Tân) (Cymru) 2004, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 26 Hydref 2004. (NDM2152)*

I propose that

Cynigiad fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 2 November 2004 in relation to the draft Order, the Fire and Rescue Services Act 2004 (Firefighters' Pension Scheme) (Wales) Order 2004; and*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno, ac a anfonwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad drwy'r e-bost ar 2 Tachwedd 2004, mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Deddf y Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub (Cynllun Pensiwn y Dynion Tân) (Cymru) 2004; ac*

*2. approves that the Fire and Rescue Services Act 2004 (Firefighters' Pension Scheme) (Wales) Order 2004 is made in accordance with:*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Deddf y Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub (Cynllun Pensiwn y Dynion Tân) (Cymru) 2004 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:*

*a) the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 26 October 2004;*

*a) y Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 26 Hydref 2004;*

*b) regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 26 October 2004. (NDM2153)*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 26 Hydref 2004. (NDM2153)*

I propose that

Cynigiad fod

*the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Fire and Rescue Services Act 2004 (Commencement) (Wales) Order 2004, a copy of which was laid in the Table*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Deddf y Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub (Cychwyn) (Cymru) 2004, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y*



Office on 26 October 2004. (NDM2154)

Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 26 Hydref 2004. (NDM2154)

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 2 November 2004 in relation to the draft Order, the Fire and Rescue Services Act 2004 (Commencement) (Wales) Order 2004; and*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno, ac a anfonwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad drwy'r e-bost ar 2 Tachwedd 2004, mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Deddf y Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub (Cychwyn) (Cymru) 2004; ac*

*2. approves that the Fire and Rescue Services Act 2004 (Commencement) (Wales) Order 2004 is made in accordance with:*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Deddf y Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub (Cychwyn) (Cymru) 2004 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:*

*a) the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 26 October 2004;*

*i) y Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 26 Hydref 2004;*

*b) the memorandum of correction laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 2 November 2004. (NDM2155)*

*ii) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd at yr Aelodau drwy'r e-bost ar 2 Tachwedd 2004. (NDM2155)*

Today is an auspicious occasion as we see the Fire and Rescue Services Act 2004 (Commencement) (Wales) Order 2004 coming into force. It will formalise the devolution of the service in Wales to the Assembly. It is historic that we are now taking over the fire service from the Westminster Government.

Mae heddiw'n achlysur pwysig a ninnau'n gweld Gorchymyn Deddf y Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub 2004 (Cychwyn) (Cymru) 2004 yn dod i rym. Bydd yn ffurfioli'r datganoli ar y gwasanaeth yng Nghymru i'r Cynulliad. Achlysur hanesyddol yw cymryd drosodd y gwasanaeth tân yn awr oddi wrth Llywodraeth San Steffan.

Much work has already been done both in developing the relationships and policies of the service over the course of many years, as demonstrated by our successful community fire safety activity; and in the preparation for devolution, such as the consultation on a national draft framework for the service. However, much work is still to be done. During the coming year, we will need to introduce a raft of secondary legislation on defining emergency and on charging policy; and guidance in relation to workforce development and risk management. Where appropriate, this will be done in discussion and in consultation with all the service's stakeholders.

Gwnaed llawer o waith eisoes wrth ddatblygu cysylltiadau a pholisïau'r gwasanaeth dros flynyddoedd lawer, fel yr amlygir yn ein gweithgarwch llwyddiannus ar ddiogelwch tân cymunedol; a hefyd wrth baratoi ar gyfer datganoli, fel yr ymgynghori a fu ar fframwaith drafft cenedlaethol i'r gwasanaeth. Er hynny, mae llawer o waith i'w wneud eto. Yn ystod y flwyddyn i ddod, bydd yn rhaid inni gyflwyno llawer o is-ddeddfwriaeth ar ddiffinio achosion brys ac ar bolisi taliadau; a chanllawiau mewn cysylltiad â datblygu'r gweithlu a rheoli risg. Os yw'n briodol, gwneir hynny drwy drafod ac ymgynghori â holl randdeiliaid y gwasanaeth.

We have already consulted widely on our draft framework for the service which will

Yr ydym eisoes wedi ymgynghori'n eang ar ein fframwaith drafft ar gyfer y gwasanaeth a

form the contract between the Assembly Government and the service early in the year. Responses received endorsed our proposals during the process of our developing policies.

The Act requires us to make an Order to give effect to the framework and we will be looking to bring this legislation forward early in the new year, when we will publish our final framework. That will enable David Melding to take up the points that he raised with the Business Minister at the appropriate time, when it is debated in Plenary.

On pensions, the pensions preservation Order merely allows the continuation of the existing firefighter pension scheme established by the Fire Service Act 1947. That Act has been repealed by the new Act, which allows the continuation of the pension scheme through the Order. It is always difficult to take on devolved responsibilities—we have had our moments in our negotiations with the Office of the Deputy Prime Minister—but I welcome the devolution of fire issues to Wales.

**William Graham:** I propose the following amendments to NDM2152 in the name of David Melding. Amendment 1: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*commits to ensuring existing members will continue to receive their full entitlement under the revised scheme.*

I propose amendment 2. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*commits to ensure that there will be no employer/employee 'contributions holiday' from this scheme.*

I propose amendment 3. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*commits to ensuring this scheme is fully funded and pensions provision is fully protected.*

I propose the following amendments to

fydd yn ffurfio'r contract rhwng Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r gwasanaeth ar ddechrau'r flwyddyn. Yr oedd yr ymatebion a gafwyd yn gefnogol i'r cynigion a wnaethom wrth ddatblygu ein polisiau.

Mae'r Ddeddf yn mynnu y byddwn yn gwneud Gorchymyn i roi'r fframwaith ar waith ac mae'n fwriad gennym ddwyn y ddeddfwriaeth honno gerbron ar ddechrau'r flwyddyn newydd, pan gyhoeddwn ein fframwaith terfynol. Bydd hynny'n cynnig cyfle i David Melding ymdrin â'r pwyntiau a gododd gyda'r Trefnydd ar yr adeg briodol, pan geir dadl arno yn y Cyfarfod Llawn.

Ynghylch pensiynau, nid yw'r Gorchymyn i gadw pensiynau ond yn caniatáu parhau â'r cynllun presennol ar gyfer pensiynau diffoddwyr tân a sefydlwyd drwy Ddeddf y Gwasanaeth Tân 1947. Diddymwyd y Ddeddf honno drwy'r Ddeddf newydd, sy'n caniatáu parhau â'r cynllun pensiwn drwy wneud y Gorchymyn. Mae bob amser yn anodd ymgymryd â chyfrifoldebau datganoledig—cawsom ambell anhawster yn ein negodiadau â Swyddfa'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog—ond croesawaf ddatganoli materion sy'n ymwneud â thân i Gymru.

**William Graham:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol i NDM2152 yn enw David Melding. Gwelliant 1: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn ymrwymo i sicrhau y bydd yr aelodau presennol yn parhau i dderbyn y swm llawn sy'n ddyledus iddynt o dan y cynllun newydd.*

Cynigiau welliant 2. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn ymrwymo i sicrhau na fydd modd i'r cyflogwyr na'r gweithwyr gael cyfnod o beidio â thalu cyfraniadau o dan y cynllun hwn.*

Cynigiau welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn ymrwymo i sicrhau bod y cynllun hwn yn cael ei ariannu'n llawn a bod y ddarpariaeth bensynau'n cael ei hamddiffyn yn llwyr.*

Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol i NDM2154

NDM2154 in the name of David Melding. Amendment 1: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*agrees that wide ranging and meaningful consultations with the Fire Brigades Union and the Retained Firefighters Union must be undertaken before any decision to combine the fire and rescue authorities in Wales.*

I propose amendment 2. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*commits to ensuring full funding for the provision of all necessary equipment, to meet the increased responsibilities of the fire and rescue service.*

I propose amendment 3. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*commits to ensuring full funding for the provision of all necessary training, to meet the increased responsibilities of the fire and rescue service.*

We support the implementation of both aspects of the Fire Rescue Services Act 2004 proposed today. In doing so, we emphasise the need to ensure that firefighters in Wales are given specific assurance on how these Orders will be implemented in practice. That is why we have proposed our amendments. As the Minister outlined, the first motion considers the firefighters' pension scheme. We need to clearly indicate that all firefighters, full time or retained, must receive full and equitable entitlement within the existing and proposed schemes. The Minister should consider widening pensions provision by opening consultations with the Retained Firefighters Union on a flexible and appropriate scheme that specifically addresses the needs of our retained firefighters. The new scheme should incorporate continuous contributions from employers and employees in order to ensure that all employees receive the fullest possible pension provision. Existing firefighters should be protected under the former fully funded scheme.

Amendment 3 to the first motion offers

yn enw David Melding. Gwelliant 1: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn cytuno y bydd yn rhaid ymgynghori'n eang ac yn ystyrllon ag Undeb y Brigadau Tân ac Undeb y Diffoddwyr Tân Wrth Gefn cyn gwneud unrhyw benderfyniad i gyfuno'r awdurdodau tân ac achub yng Nghymru.*

Cynigiaf welliant 2. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn ymrwymo i sicrhau bod arian llawn yn cael ei roi i ddarparu'r holl gyfarpar y bydd ei angen i ymdrin â chyfrifoldebau ychwanegol y gwasanaeth tân ac achub.*

Cynigiaf welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn ymrwymo i sicrhau bod arian llawn yn cael ei roi i ddarparu'r holl hyfforddiant y bydd ei angen i ymdrin â chyfrifoldebau ychwanegol y gwasanaeth tân ac achub.*

Yr ydym o blaid gweithredu'r ddwy agwedd ar Ddeddf y Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub 2004 a gynigir heddiw. Wrth eu cefnogi, rhoddwn bwys ar yr angen i sicrhau y caiff diffoddwyr tân yng Nghymru sicrwydd penodol ynghylch y modd y rhoddir y Gorchmynion hyn ar waith yn ymarferol. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi cynnig ein gwelliannau. Fel y nododd y Gweinidog, mae'r cynnig cyntaf yn ymwneud â chynllun pensiwn y diffoddwyr tân. Rhaid inni nodi'n bendant y bydd yr holl ddiffoddwyr tân, yn rhai llawn amser ac yn rhai wrth gefn, yn cael hawliau llawn a chyfartal o dan y cynllun presennol a'r un arfaethedig. Dylai'r Gweinidog ystyried ehangu'r ddarpariaeth pensiynau drwy ddechrau ymgynghori ag Undeb y Diffoddwyr Tân Wrth Gefn ar gynllun hyblyg a phriodol sy'n ymateb yn benodol i anghenion ein diffoddwyr tân wrth gefn. Dylai'r cynllun newydd gynnwys cyfraniadau parhaus gan y cyflogwyr a'r gweithwyr er mwyn sicrhau y bydd yr holl weithwyr yn cael y ddarpariaeth bensiwn lawnaf posibl. Dylid gofalu am y diffoddwyr tân presennol o dan y cynllun blaenorol a gâi ei ariannu'n llawn.

Mae gwelliant 3 i'r cynnig cyntaf yn cynnig

reassurance to members of this scheme that we are fully committed to protecting their pensions, drawing from the lessons learnt from the problems faced by other employees with regard to their pension schemes. It is worth noting that this Act acknowledges the change in emphasis from firefighting to protecting local communities, not only property.

The Act also recognises that, under previous fire service Acts, firefighting crews had no legal responsibility to undertake the range of rescues that we have come to expect from them, and there was no moral expectation for them to undertake their many community fire safety duties. The Fire Rescue Service Act 2004 defines four core functions for the service, namely fire safety, firefighting, road traffic accidents and emergencies. For the first time, we have regulated for the wider rescues and emergencies that our firefighting crews are called upon to tackle, often with courage and always with professionalism and skill.

The Welsh Conservative group supports this commencement Order and, as with the motion on pensions, we seek to ensure that the in-practice implementation meets the promises already made. It is vital that these wide-ranging and meaningful consultations are guaranteed, and they must include the Retained Firefighters Union. We recognise that 1,700 retained personnel provide fire and emergency cover to 67 per cent of fire stations in Wales. Retained firefighters must be treated equally, and I seek the Minister's assurance that the Retained Firefighters Union will be given equal status and advocacy within brigades and by the Assembly Government in terms of all issues affecting the fire and rescue services in Wales.

Through this Act, we commit our fire and rescue services personnel to respond to incidents of major fires, accidents, and, perhaps, terrorism. We need to ensure they are able to meet every eventuality in executing the duties that we ask them to

sicrwydd i aelodau'r cynllun hwn ein bod wedi ymrwymo'n llwyr i ddiogelu eu pensiynau, yn sgîl y gwersi a ddysgwyd o'r problemau a wynebodd gweithwyr eraill mewn cysylltiad â'u cynlluniau pensiwn. Mae'n werth nodi bod y Ddeddf hon yn cydnabod y newid pwyslais o ddiffodd tanau i ddiogelu cymunedau lleol, nid eiddo'n unig.

Mae'r Ddeddf hefyd yn cydnabod nad oedd unrhyw gyfrifoldeb cyfreithiol gan griwiau diffodd tân, o dan Ddeddfau blaenorol y gwasanaeth tân, i ymgymryd â'r amrediad o gamau achub y daethom i'w disgwyl ganddynt, ac nad oedd unrhyw ddisgwyliad moesol iddynt ymgymryd â'u dyletswyddau niferus mewn cysylltiad â diogelwch tân cymunedol. Mae Deddf y Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub 2004 yn diffinio pedair swyddogaeth graidd ar gyfer y gwasanaeth, sef diogelwch tân, diffodd tân, damweiniau traffig ffyrdd ac argyfyngau. Am y tro cyntaf, yr ydym wedi rheoleiddio ar gyfer y gwaith achub ac argyfwng mwy cyffredinol y gelwir ar ein criwiau diffodd tân i ddelio ag ef, ac a gyflawnir ganddynt yn ddewr yn aml ac yn broffesiynol ac yn fedrus bob amser.

Mae grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru'n cefnogi'r Gorchymyn cychwyn hwn ac, yn yr un modd â'r cynnig ar bensiynau, ceisiwn sicrhau y bydd y modd y'i rhoddir ar waith yn cyflawni'r addewidion a wnaed eisoes. Mae'n hollbwysig gwarantu'r ymgynghoriadau eang ac ystyrlon hyn, a rhaid iddynt gynnwys Undeb y Diffoddwyr Tân Wrth Gefn. Cydnabyddwn fod 1,700 o staff wrth gefn yn darparu gwasanaeth tân ac argyfwng i 67 y cant o'r gorsafoedd tân yng Nghymru. Rhaid trin diffoddwyr tân wrth gefn yn gyfartal, a cheisiaf sicrwydd gan y Gweinidog y rhoddir yr un statws a chyfle i eiriol i Undeb y Diffoddwyr Tân Wrth Gefn yn y brigadau a chan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yng nghyd-destun yr holl faterion sy'n effeithio ar wasanaethau tân ac achub yng Nghymru.

Drwy'r Ddeddf hon, rhwymwn staff ein gwasanaethau tân ac achub i ateb galwadau i ddigwyddiadau ar ffurf tanau mawr, damweiniau, ac, efallai, terfysgaeth. Rhaid inni sicrhau y gallant ymateb i bob posibilrwydd wrth gyflawni'r dyletswyddau a

undertake. We must recognise and support their professionalism and skill by fully funding the provision of additional training and equipment.

In accepting the responsibility for our fire and rescue services, we need to ensure that we retain an integrated UK structure. That is paramount, as services from England and Wales will be required to undertake joint action, for example, if there is an accident in the Severn rail tunnel, on one of the Severn road bridges or along the Wales/England border. Fire crews must have compatible firefighting, rescue and communication equipment.

We welcome these Orders and will continue to support all measures that seek to save lives and increase the safety of our communities in Wales.

**Peter Law:** I am pleased to contribute to this auspicious occasion. I pay tribute to my friend, the Minister, on the way that she has negotiated this power down to us. This is devolution in action. I get fed up of hearing people say that the Assembly has no additional powers. This is only one of many, and it is an important power because we have asked for it for some time. It will be warmly welcomed not only by the personnel who work in the fire and rescue service—to whom I pay great tribute today—but by the fire authorities and the local authorities that implement the good work of the service on a daily basis.

3.50 p.m.

I will refer briefly to the greatest example that I have seen of the heroic work of the fire and rescue service. In my constituency, we had a terribly tragic accident when four people in a car plunged over the side of a quarry at the little village of Swffryd near Abertillery on 20 October. I spent two hours on the scene that night. It was a terrible example of how they have to try to recover bodies—as it sadly turned out, because no-one survived—in the worst weather conditions. I was greatly impressed by the work of the police, the ambulance service and our fire and rescue service who all worked so terrifically together. The fire and rescue

ofynnwn ganddynt. Rhaid inni gydnabod a hyrwyddo eu proffesiynoldeb a'u medrau drwy lawn ariannu'r ddarpariaeth o hyfforddiant ac offer ychwanegol.

Wrth dderbyn y cyfrifoldeb dros ein gwasanaethau tân ac achub, rhaid sicrhau y cedwir strwythur integredig yn y DU. Mae hynny o'r pwys mwyaf, gan y bydd yn ofynnol i wasanaethau o Gymru a Lloegr weithredu ar y cyd, er enghraifft, os ceir damwain yn nhwnnel rheilffordd Hafren, ar un o bontydd ffyrdd Hafren neu ar hyd y ffin rhwng Cymru a Lloegr. Rhaid i griwiau tân gael offer diffodd tân, achub a chyfathrebu sy'n gyfaddas.

Croesawn y Gorchmynion hyn a pharhawn i gefnogi'r holl fesurau sy'n ceisio achub bywydau a gwella diogelwch ein cymunedau yng Nghymru.

**Peter Law:** Yr wyf yn falch o gyfrannu i'r achlysur pwysig hwn. Talaf deyrnged i'm ffrind, y Gweinidog, am y modd y negododd i drosglwyddo'r pŵer hwn i ni. Dyma ddatganoli ar waith. Byddaf yn blino ar glywed rhai'n dweud nad oes gan y Cynulliad bwerau ychwanegol. Nid yw hwn ond yn un o blith llawer, ac mae'n bŵer pwysig gan ein bod wedi gofyn amdano ers cryn amser. Fe'i croesewir yn fawr nid yn unig gan y staff sy'n gweithio yn y gwasanaeth tân ac achub—y talaf deyrnged fawr iddynt heddiw—ond gan yr awdurdodau tân a'r awdurdodau lleol sy'n cyflawni gwaith da'r gwasanaeth o ddydd i ddydd.

Cyfeiriaf yn fyr at yr enghraifft orau a welais o waith arwrol y gwasanaeth tân ac achub. Yn fy etholaeth, bu damwain ofnadwy o drist pan blymiodd pedwar o bobl mewn car dros ymyl chwarel ger pentref bach Swffryd ger Abertylleri ar 20 Hydref. Treuliais ddwy awr yn y fan y noson honno. Yr oedd yn enghraifft ofnadwy o'r modd y maent yn gorfod dod o hyd i gyrff—gan mai felly y bu, gwaetha'r modd, oherwydd nid oedd neb yn fyw—yn y tywydd gwaethaf. Gwnaed argraff fawr arnaf gan waith yr heddlu, y gwasanaeth ambiwlans a'n gwasanaeth tân ac achub a gydweithiodd yn wych. Gwnaeth y gwasanaeth tân ac achub ddefnyddio offer

service employed mountaineering equipment to get down into the quarry to get the bodies back up, and that in torrential rain. The weather was so bad that they were supported by the Women's Royal Voluntary Service, to which I also pay tribute as its volunteers were on site to provide sustenance for the workers. It brought it home to me just how much we owe to the fire and rescue service. That was an unusual occurrence, but on so many days those crews are out there fighting fires. It is particularly delightful to note today that the Fire Brigades Union is in this building, holding a special reception for Assembly Members this afternoon, which will help us to concentrate on, and pay tribute to, them.

**Rosemary Butler:** It is tomorrow.

**Peter Law:** I mean tomorrow, not today. We will concentrate on that tomorrow, and I look forward to that, to thank them.

The union wants to commemorate these powers coming over to the National Assembly. This is a special and important day for us, because we are now able to say that the future of the fire service in Wales comes under the control of the National Assembly. That is devolution in action; that is the co-operation of a Labour UK Government working with a Labour Government in the Assembly. I commend that, and I am sure that the people of Wales welcome it.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales will support these regulations and the amendments that have been tabled. We welcome the devolution of responsibility for the fire service to the Assembly and, in fairness, we must congratulate the Minister on how she handled what were not always the easiest of negotiations, as she has acknowledged, on behalf of the Assembly and the Government.

The Minister will be well aware of the problems—and potential problems—that are being caused, and the concerns that are being raised, in communities across Wales by some of the proposed risk management plans of some fire authorities. I take this opportunity to draw her attention to three specific

mynydda i fynd i lawr i'r chwarel i godi'r cyrff tra oedd yn arllwys y glaw. Yr oedd y tywydd mor wael fel eu bod wedi cael cymorth gan Wasanaeth Gwirfoddol Brenhinol y Merched, y talaf deyrnged iddo gan fod ei wirfoddolwyr yn y fan i roi lluniaeth i'r gweithwyr. Parodd hynny imi sylweddoli maint ein dyled i'r gwasanaeth tân ac achub. Yr oedd hwnnw'n ddigwyddiad anarferol, ond ar ddiwrnodiau lawer mae'r criwiau hynny allan yn diffodd tanau. Mae'n arbennig o braf nodi heddiw fod Undeb y Brigadau Tân yn yr adeilad, yn cynnal derbyniad arbennig i Aelodau'r Cynulliad y prynhawn yma, a fydd yn fodd inni ganolbwyntio arnynt a thalu teyrnged iddynt.

**Rosemary Butler:** Yfory y bydd hynny.

**Peter Law:** Yfory, nid heddiw, yr wyf yn ei olygu. Canolbwyntiwn ar hynny yfory, ac edrychaf ymlaen at hynny, i gael diolch iddynt.

Mae'r undeb yn dymuno dathlu trosglwyddo'r pwerau hyn i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Mae heddiw'n ddiwrnod arbennig a phwysig i ni, gan y gallwn ddweud yn awr fod dyfodol y gwasanaeth tân yng Nghymru'n dod o dan reolaeth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Dyna ddatganoli ar waith; dyna'r cydweithrediad a geir rhwng Llywodraeth Lafur yn y DU a Llywodraeth Lafur yn y Cynulliad. Cymeradwyaf hynny, ac yr wyf yn siŵr bod pobl Cymru'n ei groesawu.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Bydd Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn a'r gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd. Croesawn ddatganoli'r cyfrifoldeb dros y gwasanaeth tân i'r Cynulliad ac, er tegwch, rhaid inni longyfarch y Gweinidog ar y modd y trafododd negodiadau nad oeddent bob amser gyda'r hawsaf, fel y cydnabu, ar ran y Cynulliad a'r Llywodraeth.

Gŵyr y Gweinidog yn iawn am y problemau—a'r problemau posibl—a achosir, a'r pryderon a godir, mewn cymunedau ledled Cymru oherwydd rhai cynlluniau rheoli risg arfaethedig o eiddo rhai awdurdodau tân. Achubaf ar y cyfle hwn i dynnu ei sylw at dair enghraifft benodol yn y

examples from across the region that I represent.

The first is the removal of the specialist emergency tender from the Llanelli fire station as part of an overall relocation of equipment in mid and west Wales, in preparation for the implementation of the risk management plan. I am sure that the Minister is aware that this relocation has left the people of Llanelli feeling that their service is being put under threat in order to improve the service for other communities. I am sure that that is not the intention but, surely, what is needed is more specialised equipment, and more equipment in general, as William Graham has already said. It appears that this particular relocation is being forced on the fire service in question by resource constraints, and it is difficult to see how that contributes to effective risk management.

The Minister will also be aware of the grave concerns in the Newtown area of Montgomeryshire about the implications of proposed shift changes. The Fire Brigades Union in the Newtown station is to be congratulated on making an effective case addressing its concerns. Newtown is the only fire station in Montgomeryshire that is staffed by full-time staff, and the nearest station with full-time staff in mid Wales is in Aberystwyth. One does not have to be an expert in mid-Wales geography to understand the potential implications of one of those tenders being engaged in dealing with an emergency when another emergency call comes in. Fire Brigades Union members at the Newtown station believe that a combination of staff shortages and the proposed shift changes could pose a real threat to the effective management of risk at particular times of the week. The community as a whole, across Montgomeryshire, is becoming concerned.

Finally, I will refer to the situation in Haverfordwest, where we face a potential 40 per cent reduction in full-time staff, and this at a time when it is becoming harder to recruit retained firefighters to make up the gap. We must acknowledge the incredible work that is done by retained firefighters but an awful lot is asked of them, and many employers are not prepared to release them.

rhanbarth a gynrychiolaf.

Y gyntaf yw symud y cerbyd argyfwng arbenigol o orsaf dân Llanelli fel rhan o'r ail-leoli cyffredinol ar offer yn y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin, wrth baratoi ar gyfer rhoi'r cynllun rheoli risg ar waith. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gŵyr y Gweinidog fod yr ail-leoli hwn wedi peri i bobl Llanelli deimlo bod eu gwasanaeth yn cael ei fygwth er mwyn gwella'r gwasanaeth ar gyfer cymunedau eraill. Yr wyf yn sicr nad hynny yw'r bwriad ond onid oes angen mwy o offer arbenigol, a mwy o offer yn gyffredinol, fel y mae William Graham wedi dweud eisoes? Ymddengys fod y gwasanaeth tân dan sylw yn cael ei orfodi i ail-leoli yn yr achos hwn oherwydd cyfyngiadau ar adnoddau, ac anodd yw gweld sut y mae hynny'n cyfrannu at reoli risg yn effeithiol.

Gŵyr y Gweinidog hefyd am y pryderon dirfawr yn ardal y Drenewydd yn sir Drefaldwyn ynghylch goblygiadau newidiadau arfaethedig i shifftiau. Mae Undeb y Brigadau Tân yng ngorsaf y Drenewydd i'w longyfarch ar gyflwyno dadl effeithiol ynghylch ei bryderon. Gorsaf dân y Drenewydd yw'r unig un yn sir Drefaldwyn sydd â staff llawn amser, a'r orsaf agosaf sydd â staff llawn amser yn y Canolbarth yw un Aberystwyth. Nid oes raid gwybod llawer am ddaearyddiaeth y Canolbarth i ddeall y goblygiadau sydd yn hynny pe byddai un o'r injans tân hynny'n delio ag argyfwng a galwad brys arall yn cael ei derbyn. Mae aelodau Undeb y Brigadau Tân yng ngorsaf y Drenewydd yn credu y gallai prinder staff ynghyd â'r newidiadau arfaethedig i shifftiau amharu'n sylweddol ar y gallu i reoli risg yn effeithiol ar adegau penodol yn yr wythnos. Mae'r gymuned gyfan, ledled sir Drefaldwyn, yn dechrau pryderu.

Yn olaf, cyfeiriai at y sefyllfa yn Hwlfordd, lle y wynebwn ostyngiad o 40 y cant yn nifer y staff llawn amser, a hynny ar adeg y mae'n dod yn anos recriwtio diffoddwyr tân wrth gefn i lenwi'r bwlch. Rhaid inni gydnabod y gwaith aruthrol a wnaiff diffoddwyr tân wrth gefn ond gofynnir llawer iawn ganddynt, ac mae llawer o gyflogwyr nad ydynt yn barod i'w rhyddhau. Gan hynny, anodd yw gweld

Therefore, it is hard to see how a 40 per cent cut in full-time staff will contribute to effective risk management. These are just some specifics; the Minister will be aware of other examples across Wales.

I trust that the Minister will acknowledge that the criteria used as the basis for risk management plans are based on presumptions about service provision in urban areas in England, where alternative tenders and teams will be relatively nearby. I trust that she will also acknowledge that this is not necessarily appropriate provision either for rural Wales or for some of our poorest communities that remain at highest risk.

I hope that the Minister, as she takes control of the fire service in Wales, will review the plans with all fire authorities under the new policy framework to which she referred. I also hope that she will ensure full consultation with unions and local communities to address these specific concerns as well as all the other concerns of which I hope she is aware.

I am sure that this devolution of powers will provide the opportunity to ensure that effective, properly resourced services are available across Wales, particularly for our most deprived and rural communities. The Minister will know that there are high hopes within the service and the communities that they serve that the devolution of power over the fire service to the Assembly will enable effective development of fire and rescue services that truly meet the needs of our communities. I trust that we can rely on the Minister to develop made-in-Wales policies to address the challenges that face the service today.

**Peter Black:** I welcome the delegation of these powers to the Assembly. Peter Law was right to say that this is a historic occasion, because this is one of the first substantive powers acquired from Westminster, and I hope that it will not be the last. A number of issues arise from the delegation, which will need to be taken on board when we consider the agenda over the next few months. The Minister will return to committee and to

sut y bydd gostyngiad o 40 y cant yn nifer y staff llawn amser yn cyfrannu at y gwaith o reoli risg yn effeithiol. Enghreifftiau neilltuol yw'r rhain; gŵyr y Gweinidog am enghreifftiau eraill ledled Cymru.

Hyderaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn cydnabod bod y meini prawf a ddefnyddir i wneud y cynlluniau rheoli risg yn seiliedig ar ragdybiaethau am y gwasanaeth a ddarperir mewn ardaloedd trefol yn Lloegr, lle y bydd injans a thimau eraill yn gymharol agos. Hyderaf y gwnaiff gydnabod hefyd nad yw hyn o reidrwydd yn ddarpariaeth addas i Gymru wledig neu rai o'n cymunedau tlotaf sy'n wynebu'r perygl mwyaf o hyd.

Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog, wrth ymgymryd â rheolaeth dros y gwasanaeth tân yng Nghymru, yn adolygu'r cynlluniau gyda'r holl awdurdodau tân o dan y fframwaith polisi newydd y cyfeiriodd ato. Gobeithiaf hefyd y bydd yn sicrhau y ceir ymgynghori llawn ag undebau a chymunedau lleol i ymateb i'r pryderon penodol hyn yn ogystal â'r holl bryderon eraill yr wyf yn gobeithio ei bod yn gwybod amdanynt.

Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y datganoli hwn ar bwerau yn cynnig cyfle i sicrhau y bydd gwasanaethau effeithiol, a chanddynt adnoddau digonol, ar gael ledled Cymru, yn enwedig ar gyfer ein cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig a gwledig. Gŵyr y Gweinidog fod y gwasanaeth a'r cymunedau a wasanaetha'n gobeithio'n fawr y bydd y datganoli ar bŵer dros y gwasanaeth tân i'r Cynulliad yn hwyluso'r gwaith o ddatblygu gwasanaethau tân ac achub sy'n gwir fodloni anghenion ein cymunedau. Hyderaf y gallwn ddibynnu ar y Gweinidog i ddatblygu polisïau a wnaed yng Nghymru i ymateb i'r heriau y mae'r gwasanaeth yn eu hwynebu heddiw.

**Peter Black:** Croesawaf ddirprwyo'r pwerau hyn i'r Cynulliad. Yr oedd Peter Law yn iawn wrth ddweud mai achlysur hanesyddol yw hwn, gan mai hwn yw un o'r pwerau pwysig cyntaf a gafwyd gan San Steffan, a gobeithiaf nad hwn fydd yr olaf. Mae sawl mater yn codi yn sgîl y dirprwyo, y bydd angen eu hystyried wrth drafod yr agenda dros y misoedd nesaf. Daw'r Gweinidog yn ôl i'r pyllgor ac i'r Cyfarfod Llawn â



Plenary with further proposals on how she wishes to develop a distinctly Welsh agenda on the fire service. This agenda is already being developed via the work undertaken on risk management in terms of prevention. For example, the Minister has put in place separate budgets for hard-wired smoke alarms and related issues.

Pay, conditions and pensions will concern most firefighters, and it is inappropriate that we take a separate Welsh view on them. Therefore, we should remain part of a UK-wide approach to these issues. It is essential that the new pension scheme under development is fit for purpose and fully funded. In the meantime, there is a need to ensure that the costs of the existing scheme do not put an unnecessary burden on council tax payers, and on councils, which are levied for contributions towards the cost of running fire authorities. I hope that the Minister will talk to fire authorities, local councils and the WLGA to try to get the balance right.

Reference has been made to the integrated risk management plan. In my region, there is huge concern about the Pontardawe fire station and the changes taking place there. I have had two meetings with the chief fire officer about the issues. He stressed that risk is dynamic and that we need to make adjustments for this. We need to take account of an area's individual circumstances and ensure that, in making changes, it is properly protected. This involves taking account of response times and local safety issues.

We need to bear in mind that fire authorities are part of local government and need to be treated as such. In England, the relevant Minister has withdrawn from the process of dealing with the integrated risk management plans. I am not advocating that the Assembly Minister do the same, but we must get the balance right in terms of how we deal with fire authorities. We must also bear in mind that fire authorities act as part of local government, and the WLGA will no doubt want to ensure a proper consultation process so that there is dialogue between the fire

chynigion pellach ar y modd y mae'n dymuno datblygu agenda Gymreig neilltuol ar y gwasanaeth tân. Mae'r agenda hon yn cael ei datblygu eisoes drwy'r gwaith a wnaed ar reoli risg yng nghyd-destun atal. Er enghraifft, mae'r Gweinidog wedi creu cyllidebau ar wahân ar gyfer larymau mwg gwifredig a materion sy'n gysylltiedig â hynny.

Bydd cyflog, amodau a phensiynau'n faterion o bwys gan y rhan fwyaf o ddiffoddwyr tân, ac nid yw'n briodol inni eu trin yn wahanol yng Nghymru. Gan hynny, dylem ddal i ymdrin â'r materion hyn mewn modd sy'n cynnwys y DU gyfan. Mae'n hollbwysig y bydd y cynllun pensiwn newydd sy'n cael ei ddatblygu'n addas i'w ddiben ac wedi'i ariannu'n llawn. Yn y cyfamser, rhaid sicrhau na fydd costau'r cynllun presennol yn faich diangen ar dalwyr y dreth gyngor, ac ar gynghorau, y codir ardoll arnynt am gyfraniadau tuag at gostau rhedeg awdurdodau tân. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn siarad ag awdurdodau tân, cynghorau lleol a CLILC i geisio sicrhau'r cydbwysedd priodol.

Cyfeiriwyd at y cynllun rheoli risg integredig. Yn fy rhanbarth i, ceir pryderon mawr ynghylch gorsaf dân Pontardawe a'r newidiadau sy'n digwydd yno. Cefais ddau gyfarfod gyda'r prif swyddog tân ynghylch y materion sy'n codi. Pwysleisiodd mai peth deinamig yw risg a bod rhaid inni ymaddasu ar gyfer hynny. Rhaid inni ystyried yr amgylchiadau neilltuol a geir mewn ardal a sicrhau, wrth wneud newidiadau, y caiff ei diogelu'n iawn. Mae hynny'n golygu ystyried amseroedd ymateb a materion sy'n ymwneud â diogelwch lleol.

Rhaid inni gofio bod awdurdodau tân yn rhan o lywodraeth leol a bod rhaid eu trin felly. Yn Lloegr, mae'r Gweinidog perthnasol wedi tynnu'n ôl o'r broses o ddelio â'r cynlluniau rheoli risg integredig. Nid wyf yn dadlau y dylai Gweinidog y Cynulliad wneud yr un peth, ond rhaid inni ddal y ddysgl yn wastad o ran y modd yr ydym yn delio ag awdurdodau tân. Rhaid inni gofio hefyd fod awdurdodau tân yn gweithredu fel rhan o lywodraeth leol, ac mae CLILC yn sicr o ofalu y ceir proses ymgynghori briodol fel y ceir deialog rhwng yr awdurdodau tân, y

authorities, the Minister and the Assembly.

Gweinidog a'r Cynulliad.

Funding will always be an issue. There is no hypothecated funding for fire authorities, and this makes it difficult for them to plan on a three-year basis. However, local government can do this in some circumstances. This will have to be addressed and considered alongside the other issues. The whole rationale behind the integrated risk management plan is to try to bring funding issues under control, and that is one of the reasons why the fire authorities are pursuing that.

Bydd cyllido'n fater pwysig bob amser. Nid yw cyllid yn cael ei glustnodi ar gyfer awdurdodau tân, ac mae hynny'n peri ei bod yn anodd iddynt gynllunio dros dair blynedd. Fodd bynnag, gall llywodraeth leol wneud hynny o dan rai amgylchiadau. Bydd yn rhaid ymdrin â hyn a'i ystyried ochr yn ochr â'r materion eraill. Sail resymegol y cynllun rheoli risg integredig yw'r ymgais i ddwyn materion sy'n ymwneud â chyllido o dan reolaeth, a dyna un o'r rhesymau y mae awdurdodau tân yn ceisio hynny.

4.00 p.m.

I support some of what they have done, for example in terms of control rooms. Mid and West Wales Fire Authority does not have one combined control room, but three—for fire, ambulance and the police—in one building, and it, therefore, can make savings from that. That could be taken forward for the other two fire authorities. However, will the Minister assure us that we will continue to proceed on the basis of three control centres and that we are not going down the line of a single regional centre for the whole of Wales, as has happened in England? Three centres are able to support each other in the way that the regional centres in England support each other.

Cefnogaf beth o'r hyn a gyflawnasant, yng nghyd-destun ystafelloedd rheoli, er enghraifft. Nid un ystafell reoli ar y cyd sydd gan Awdurdod Tân Canolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru, ond tair—ar gyfer y gwasanaeth tân, ambiwlans a'r heddlu—mewn un adeilad ac, felly, gall sicrhau arbedion drwy hynny. Gellid hyrwyddo hynny yn y ddau awdurdod tân arall. Fodd bynnag, a wnaiff y Gweinidog ein sicrhau y byddwn yn dal i gymryd y bydd tair canolfan reoli ac na fyddwn yn dilyn y llwybr o gael un ganolfan ranbarthol ar gyfer Cymru gyfan, fel a ddigwyddodd yn Lloegr? Gall tair canolfan gynorthwyo'i gilydd yn yr un modd ag y mae'r canolfannau rhanbarthol yn Lloegr yn ei wneud.

The most important part of the reform in terms of the legislation is the move to a fire and rescue service. Viable work is being done in terms of prevention, specifically home fire-safety audits and community safety work, and I pay tribute to the work of firefighters in doing this. However, a problem regarding funding has been highlighted to me, especially where an area only has retained firefighters who have to be paid separately to carry out this work. If we are to have home fire-safety audits, they must be done consistently across Wales. Therefore, we must consider some form of dedicated funding along the lines of that for hard-wired smoke detectors, so that this can be carried forward in areas which have retained fire stations only, such as Gorseinon and Cardigan. I ask the Minister to consider that.

Yr agwedd bwysicaf ar y diwygiadau yn y ddeddfwriaeth yw'r cam a gymerir tuag at gael gwasanaeth tân ac achub. Gwneir gwaith buddiol o ran atal, yn enwedig drwy archwiliadau o ddiogelwch tân yn y cartref a gwaith diogelwch cymunedol, a thalaf deyrnged i waith y diffoddwyr tân wrth wneud hyn. Fodd bynnag, tynnwyd un broblem i'm sylw sy'n ymwneud â chyllido, sy'n codi'n benodol mewn ardaloedd lle nad oes ond diffoddwyr tân wrth gefn y mae'n rhaid talu ar wahân iddynt am wneud y gwaith hwn. Os ydym i gael archwiliadau o ddiogelwch tân yn y cartref, rhaid eu cynnal yn gyson ledled Cymru. Felly, rhaid inni ystyried cael rhyw fath o gyllid neilltuoel yn debyg i hynny ar gyfer synwryddion mwg gwifredig, fel y gellir hyrwyddo hyn mewn ardaloedd lle nad oes ond gorsafodded tân â diffoddwyr tân wrth gefn, fel Gorseinon ac Aberteifi. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ystyried

hynny.

**Ann Jones:** I welcome this move today. I raised the role of the fire service in my first short debate back in 2000, when we were first set up, and I pointed out the integration of the fire service in many areas and how we should look to maintain the fire service from within Wales.

The devolution of these regulations means a step change for the fire service. This is a historic day, and I know that my former colleagues in the Fire Brigades Union and in fire authorities across Wales and those serving today will welcome this. Some issues do arise, such as those in the amendments, and many more, such as precepting for fire authorities, but they are not for today's debate, which is about the transfer of these Orders and about having these functions. As the Minister has rightly pointed out, we will be able to consider many areas when we look at secondary legislation and so on, and we will wait for the framework to come forward to discuss that at the appropriate time.

This is a historic day, and I never thought, through all my years of service in the fire service, that I would see the fire service devolved from Whitehall and the Home Office. I know that the Minister has done much work on this, as have all her Cabinet colleagues. I welcome today as a day when the people of Wales will know that we have their best interests, in terms of stronger, safer communities, at heart.

**Elin Jones:** Fel Ann Jones a phawb arall, cefnogaf ddatganoli'r pwerau hyn i'r Cynulliad, ac yr wyf hefyd yn cydnabod gwaith y Gweinidog i sicrhau'r datganoli hwn ac i roi cyfle i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol drafod dyfodol y gwasanaeth tân am y tro cyntaf o ddiffrif.

Mae eraill wedi sôn am y ffaith bod yr awdurdodau tân yn datblygu'u cynlluniau rheoli risg ar hyn o bryd, ac yr oedd cyfarfod yr wythnos diwethaf rhwng Aelodau etholedig y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin a'r awdurdod tân yn yr ardal honno. Mae gennyf

**Ann Jones:** Croesawaf y cam a gymerir heddiw. Trafodais rôl y gwasanaeth tân yn fy nadl fer gyntaf yn ôl yn 2000, yn fuan ar ôl ein sefydlu, a thynnais sylw at yr integreiddio ar y gwasanaeth tân mewn sawl ardal a'r modd y dylem geisio cynnal y gwasanaeth tân yng Nghymru.

Mae datganoli'r rheoliadau hyn yn peri newid sylweddol i'r gwasanaeth tân. Mae heddiw'n ddiwrnod hanesyddol, a gwn y bydd fy nghyn-gydweithwyr yn Undeb y Brigadau Tân ac mewn awdurdodau tân ledled Cymru a'r rhai sy'n gwasanaethu heddiw'n croesawu hyn. Mae rhai materion yn codi, fel y rhai y cyfeirir atynt yn y gwelliannau, a llawer o rai eraill, fel praeseptu ar gyfer awdurdodau tân, ond nid materion i'w trafod yn y ddatl heddiw ydynt, gan fod hon yn ymwneud â throsglwyddo'r Gorchmynion hyn a chael y swyddogaethau hyn. Fel y nododd y Gweinidog, gallwn ystyried sawl maes wrth edrych ar is-ddeddfwriaeth ac yn y blaen, a byddwn yn disgwyl i'r fframwaith gael ei ddwyn gerbron i'w drafod ar yr adeg briodol.

Mae heddiw'n ddiwrnod hanesyddol, ac ni chredais erioed, yn yr holl flynyddoedd y gwasanaethais yn y gwasanaeth tân, y gwelwn ddatganoli'r gwasanaeth tân o Whitehall a'r Swyddfa Gartref. Gwn i'r Gweinidog wneud llawer o waith ar hyn, fel y gwnaeth ei chyd-Weinidogion. Croesawaf heddiw fel diwrnod y caiff pobl Cymru wybod ein bod yn gofalu am eu buddiannau o ran sicrhau cymunedau cadarnach a mwy diogel.

**Elin Jones:** Like Ann Jones and everyone else, I support the devolution of these powers to the Assembly, and I also recognise the Minister's work in bringing about this devolution and in giving the National Assembly the opportunity to seriously discuss the future of the fire service for the first time.

Others have mentioned the fact that the fire authorities are currently developing their risk management plans, and there was a meeting last week between the elected Members of Mid and West Wales and the fire authority in that area. I, like others, have doubts about

fi, fel eraill, amheuon ynglŷn â rhai agweddau ar y cynllun rheoli risg hwn, yn enwedig ynglŷn â'r amodau gwaith y bydd rhai o'r gweithwyr tân yn eu hwynebu o dan yr opsiynau a gynigir gan Awdurdod Tân Canolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru. Er enghraifft, mae'r awdurdod tân ar hyn o bryd yn cynnig newid y patrwm shift i weithwyr amser llawn, a fydd yn golygu mai dim ond un penwythnos rhydd allan o bump fydd ganddynt.

Cymeradwyaf ymateb gweithwyr tân Aberystwyth i'r ymgynghoriad ar y cynllun rheoli risg hwn a'u gwrthwynebiad i'r patrwm shift newydd, gan gofio bod yr holl drafodaeth, a ddechreuodd gydag adolygiad Bain, wedi canolbwyntio i raddau helaeth ar greu amodau gwaith a fyddai'n ystyriol i deuluoedd. Ni all un ohonom ddweud heddiw bod cynnig sy'n cynnig un penwythnos rhydd allan o bump yn ystyriol i deuluoedd ac y bydd yn denu gweithwyr ychwanegol o feysydd a chefnidiroedd gwahanol i'r gwasanaeth tân yng Nghymru.

Mae pryderon sylweddol hefyd ynglŷn â'r dull talu sy'n cael ei awgrymu ar gyfer y gweithwyr tân wrth gefn rhan amser, ac yr oeddwn yn falch o gael ymateb gan yr awdurdod tân yr wythnos diwethaf yn dweud y byddai'n edrych eto ar y cynllun presennol o bosibl. Nid wyf yn disgwyl ymateb gan y Gweinidog y prynhawn yma ar rai o'r materion manwl hyn, ond gobeithiaf y bydd yn derbyn galwad Helen Mary Jones i adolygu'r meini prawf y mae'r cylluniau risg hyn yn seiliedig arnynt, gan fod y meini prawf yn rhai dinesig, ac felly nad ydynt yn gwbl addas ar gyfer gwasanaethau tân mewn ardaloedd gwledig neu lled-wledig. Gobeithiaf y bydd hynny'n gallu digwydd yn awr yn dilyn datganoli.

Gofynnaf hefyd i'r Gweinidog roi eglurhad am y rôl y mae'n ei ragweld ar ei chyfer fel Gweinidog o ran trafod y cynlluniau risg hyn gyda'r awdurdodau tân, ac a fydd ganddi rôl, o dan y fframwaith newydd, wrth gytuno ar y cynlluniau risg hyn, neu a fydd y mater wedi'i lwyr ddatganoli i'r awdurdodau tân?

**Carl Sargeant:** As a former industrial

some aspects of this risk management plan, particularly with regard to the conditions of service that some firefighters will face under the options proposed by the Mid and West Wales Fire Authority. For example, the fire authority is currently proposing changing the shift pattern for full-time workers, which will mean that they will only have one free weekend in every five.

I commend the response of Aberystwyth firefighters to the consultation on this risk management plan and their objection to the new shift pattern, bearing in mind that the whole discussion, which began with the Bain review, concentrated to a great extent on creating conditions of service that would be family friendly. Not one of us could say today that a proposal which offers workers one free weekend in five is family friendly and will attract additional recruits from different fields and backgrounds into the fire service in Wales.

There are also grave concerns regarding the method of payment that is being suggested for part-time retained firefighters, and I was pleased to receive a response from the fire authority last week saying that it may revisit its current plan. I do not expect a response from the Minister this afternoon on some of these detailed matters, but I hope that she accepts Helen Mary Jones's call to review the criteria upon which these risk management plans are based, because some of the criteria are urban in nature and are therefore not entirely appropriate for fire services in rural or semi-rural areas. I hope that that will now happen following devolution.

I ask the Minister to also give an explanation of the role that she envisages for herself as Minister with regard to discussing these risk management plans with the fire authorities, and whether she will have a role, under the new framework, in agreeing upon these risk management plans, or whether that issue will be completely devolved to the fire authorities.

**Carl Sargeant:** A minnau'n gyn-ddiffoddwr

firefighter, I welcome the implementation of these regulations today, which will lead to the devolution of the fire service to Wales. The Labour UK Government and the Welsh Assembly Government must be commended on their swift implementation of the recommendations of the Bain report, relating to the devolution of the service. The speed at which that was achieved provides evidence, if any was needed, of our commitment to the future of the service and the communities that it serves in Wales.

Given that last week was the busiest week of the year, culminating in bonfire night on Friday, today's regulations have added significance. Working together in partnership with the fire and rescue services, other emergency services and local authorities, we should be able to make November a safer month for everyone. I pay particular tribute to firefighters in north Wales, and to those across the whole of Wales, who gave of their time beyond the call of duty on bonfire night to ensure secure and safe displays for all communities. I also pay tribute to the North Wales Fire and Rescue Service, which works continually with Cheshire and Merseyside on a cross-border basis to ensure the safety of all communities. I will not support David's Melding's amendments 1, 2 and 3, because they suggest that we are not providing good training and equipment at present. That is wrong.

Finally, I note that the unions support this development. The authorities look forward to the future, and local communities are happy that this devolution is taking place.

**Alun Cairns:** I support William Graham's comments and the amendments tabled in David Melding's name. I welcome the transfer of functions that enable the Assembly Government to have powers over the fire and rescue service. In anticipation of these new powers, I discussed with senior fire officers how the Assembly and devolution could make a difference to the fire service. The unanimous response was, through the fitting of sprinklers in school buildings. Bearing in mind that Jane Davidson, the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, has previously announced, and re-

tân diwydiannol, croesawaf weithredu'r rheoliadau hyn heddiw, gan y byddant yn arwain at ddatganoli'r gwasanaeth tân i Gymru. Dylid canmol Llywodraeth Lafur y DU a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru am roi ar waith yn gyflym yr argymhellion a geir yn adroddiad Bain ar ddatganoli'r gwasanaeth. Mae'r ffaith bod hynny wedi'i gyflawni mor gyflym yn ddigon o dystiolaeth, os oedd ei hangen, i'n hymrwymiad i ddyfodol y gwasanaeth a'r cymunedau y mae'n eu gwasanaethu yng Nghymru.

Gan mai'r wythnos diwethaf oedd y brysurafl yn y flwyddyn, gan arwain at noson tân gwyllt ar ddydd Gwener, mae arwyddocâd ychwanegol i'r rheoliadau a ddaeth gerbron heddiw. Drwy weithio ar y cyd â'r gwasanaethau tân ac achub, gwasanaethau brys eraill ac awdurdodau lleol, dylem allu peri i fis Tachwedd fod yn fis diogelach i bawb. Talaf deyrnged yn benodol i ddiffoddwyr tân yn y Gogledd, a'r rhai ledled Cymru, a roddodd o'u hamser y tu hwnt i alwad dyletswydd ar noson tân gwyllt i sicrhau y byddai arddangosfeydd ym mhob cymuned yn ddiogel. Talaf deyrnged hefyd i Wasanaeth Tân ac Achub Gogledd Cymru, sy'n gweithio drwy'r amser gyda swydd Gaer a Glannau Mersi ar draws y ffin i sicrhau diogelwch pob cymuned. Ni chefnogaf welliannau 1, 2 a 3 o eiddo David Melding, gan eu bod yn awgrymu nad ydym yn darparu hyfforddiant ac offer da ar hyn o bryd. Mae hynny'n anghywir.

Yn olaf, nodaf fod yr undebau o blaid y datblygiad hwn. Mae'r awdurdodau'n edrych ymlaen i'r dyfodol, ac mae cymunedau lleol yn fodlon ar y datganoli hwn.

**Alun Cairns:** Ategaf y sylwadau a wnaeth William Graham a chefnogaf y gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd yn enw David Melding. Croesawaf drosglwyddo swyddogaethau sy'n galluogi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i feddu ar bwerau dros y gwasanaeth tân ac achub. Gan ddisgwyl y ceid y pwerau newydd hyn, trafodais gydag uwch swyddogion tân sut y gallai'r Cynulliad a datganoli wneud gwahaniaeth i'r gwasanaeth tân. Eu hateb unfrydol oedd, drwy osod taenellwyr mewn adeiladau ysgol. Gan gofio bod Jane Davidson, y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, wedi cyhoeddi o'r blaen,

announced, £9 million per local authority over the coming years for capital investment in school buildings, the fitting of sprinklers must surely be a condition of that investment. I am reliably informed that fitting sprinklers in school buildings amounts to a cost similar to carpeting a new school building. Given that there are frequent incidents of arson against schools, and that even building a small primary school costs several million pounds, fitting effective sprinklers in schools would not only prevent fire and improve safety, but would also substantially reduce the cost to the local education authority and, in turn, to the Welsh Assembly Government.

ac wedi ailgyhoeddi, y rhoddir £9 miliwn i bob awdurdod lleol dros y blynyddoedd nesaf ar gyfer buddsoddiad cyfalaf mewn adeiladau ysgol, siawns y bydd y buddsoddiad hwnnw'n amodol ar osod taenellwyr. Cefais wybod o le da bod y gost o osod taenellwyr mewn adeiladau ysgol yn debyg i'r gost o osod carpedi mewn adeiad ysgol newydd. Gan fod achosion o losgi bwriadol yn digwydd yn aml mewn ysgolion, a bod codi ysgol gynradd fach hyd yn oed y costio rhai miliynau o bunnoedd, byddai gosod taenellwyr effeithiol mewn ysgolion nid yn unig yn atal tân ac yn gwella diogelwch, ond hefyd yn lleihau'n sylweddol y gost i'r awdurdod addysg lleol ac, yn ei thro, i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

4.10 p.m.

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** I am delighted that we have the support of all parties here for the devolution of the fire and rescue service. I am particularly pleased to hear Members' comments on fire and rescue service personnel, whom we all admire. Peter Law gave a vivid illustration of the work that the fire and rescue service undertakes.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** Yr wyf wrth fy modd bod yr holl bleidiau sydd yma'n bleidiol i ddatganoli'r gwasanaeth tân ac achub. Yr wyf yn arbennig o falch o glywed sylwadau Aelodau am staff y gwasanaeth tân ac achub, yr ydym oll yn eu hedmygu. Rhoddodd Peter Law ddisgrifiad byw o'r gwaith y mae'r gwasanaeth tân ac achub yn ei gyflawni.

Even though today marked the launch of the devolution of the service, I was saddened, when I visited a fire station in Cardiff, to learn that it was having to install CCTV cameras on fire engines because firefighters are being attacked when attending fires. Some young people set fire to rubbish and so on deliberately and then attack firefighters when they are called out. We must condemn such behaviour across the Assembly. Firefighters are wasting their time attending these incidents, when other people could be in urgent need of their help to deal with a house fire, for example. We do not want to have no-go areas for fire engines in Wales because of the difficulties that the service is encountering in terms of attacks. We must be united on this front in supporting firefighters. This is worse than anti-social behaviour; it is criminal behaviour.

Er mai heddiw y dechreuir datganoli'r gwasanaeth, fe'm tristawyd, pan ymwelais â gorsaf dân yng Nghaerdydd, o gael gwybod ei bod yn gorfod gosod camerau cylch cyfyng ar injans tân oherwydd ymosodiadau ar ddiffoddwyr tân pan ydynt yn ateb galwadau i ddiffodd tanau. Mae rhai pobl ifanc yn cynnau ysbwriel a phethau felly'n fwriadol ac wedyn yn ymosod ar ddiffoddwyr tân pan gânt eu galw allan. Rhaid i bawb yn y Cynulliad gondemnio ymddygiad o'r fath. Mae diffoddwyr tân yn gwastraffu eu hamser wrth fynd i ddigwyddiadau o'r fath, tra gallai eraill fod â thaer angen eu cymorth i ddelio â tân mewn tŷ, er enghraifft. Nid ydym am gael ardaloedd yng Nghymru na all injans tân fynd iddynt oherwydd y trafferthion y mae'r gwasanaeth yn eu profi ar ffurf ymosodiadau. Rhaid inni fod yn unfryd yn ein cefnogaeth i ddiffoddwyr tân yn y mater hwn. Mae hyn yn waeth nag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol; mae'n ymddygiad troseddol.

I can understand why the amendments were

Gallaf ddeall pam y cyflwynwyd y

tabled today, but I will not support them. I assure William Graham that this is not a revised scheme—it remains unchanged. The Order allows the existing scheme to remain until we consult on any new arrangements from 2006 onwards. Therefore, there is the necessary protection for existing personnel. On the other issues raised in the amendments, there are no plans to change the structures in Wales. We have already gone from eight fire authorities to three, and we have three control rooms. Therefore, we will not be considering those issues, because we want stability in the fire and rescue service. I will oppose the other amendments, because I fully support all training needs and initiatives in the fire service.

Other Members raised particular points. Many concerns were expressed about the integrated risk management plan for the mid and west Wales brigade. Those plans are currently being prepared under guidance from the Office of the Deputy Prime Minister. That applies to all of the plans for 2005-06. However, we will consult on new guidance during 2005 for the preparation of future plans. I therefore ask Members to provide me with specifics on the issues raised. I have already received considerable correspondence on this from Members in my own group, including Catherine Thomas and Gwenda Thomas. All of these issues have been discussed. However, I need to get a feel of the issues being raised on the integrated risk management plans before I consider the guidance for future plans.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I am sure that you understand that the problem is that the current integrated risk management plans may bring about changes that will be difficult to reverse. Is it possible for you to speak to the fire authorities and suggest that they take a limited approach to what they do now, for fear that things could be done that could not be put right under any new guidance that you may issue for the following year?

**Edwina Hart:** Integrated risk management plans are a matter for the fire authorities, but if Members so wish—and I receive

gwelliannau heddiw, ond nis cefnogaf. Yr wyf yn sicrhau William Graham nad cynllun diwygiedig yw hwn—mae'n aros yn ddigyfnewid. Mae'r Gorchymyn yn caniatáu i'r cynllun presennol barhau hyd nes yr ymgynghorwn ar unrhyw drefniadau newydd o 2006 ymlaen. Gan hynny, ceir y sicrwydd y mae ei angen ar gyfer y staff presennol. Ynghylch y materion eraill a godwyd yn y gwelliannau, nid oes bwriad i newid y strwythurau yng Nghymru. Yr ydym eisoes wedi sefydlu tri awdurdod tân yn lle wyth, ac mae gennym dair ystafell reoli. Felly, ni fyddwn yn ystyried y materion hynny, gan ein bod am sicrhau sefydlogrwydd yn y gwasanaeth tân ac achub. Gwrthwynebam y gwelliannau eraill, gan fy mod yn rhoi cymorth ar gyfer yr holl fentrau ac anghenion o ran hyfforddi yn y gwasanaeth tân.

Cododd Aelodau eraill bwyntiau penodol. Mynegwyd llawer o bryder ynghylch y cynllun rheoli risg integredig ar gyfer brigâd y Canolbarth a'r Gornllewin. Mae'r cynlluniau hynny'n cael eu paratoi ar hyn o bryd o dan gyfarwyddyd Swyddfa'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog. Mae hynny'n wir am yr holl gynlluniau ar gyfer 2005-06. Fodd bynnag, ymgynghorwn ar ganllawiau newydd yn ystod 2005 ar gyfer paratoi cynlluniau yn y dyfodol. Gan hynny, gofynnaf i Aelodau roi manylion i mi am y materion a godwyd. Yr wyf eisoes wedi cael cryn nifer o lythrau ar hyn oddi wrth Aelodau yn fy ngrŵp fy hun, gan gynnwys Catherine Thomas a Gwenda Thomas. Trafodwyd pob un o'r materion hynny. Er hynny, rhaid imi ymgyfarwyddo â'r materion a godir ynghylch y cynlluniau rheoli risg integredig cyn imi ystyried y canllawiau ar gyfer cynlluniau yn y dyfodol.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn deall mai'r hyn sy'n peri'r broblem yw y gallai'r cynlluniau rheoli risg integredig presennol beri newidiadau y bydd yn anodd eu dadwneud. A oes modd ichi siarad â'r awdurdodau tân ac awgrymu y dylent gyfyngu ar yr hyn a wnânt yn awr, rhag ofn y gwneir rhywbeth na ellid ei gywiro o dan unrhyw ganllawiau newydd y gallech eu cyhoeddi ar gyfer y flwyddyn ddilynol?

**Edwina Hart:** Mater i'r awdurdodau tân yw cynlluniau rheoli risg integredig, ond os yw Aelodau'n dymuno hynny—a byddaf yn cael

correspondence from Members to this effect—I will formally raise these matters with the chief fire officer for mid and west Wales and the chair of the authority. I am mindful of what Peter Black said about roles and responsibility. However, as an Assembly Minister, I feel that I would not be taking my responsibility seriously if I did not respond to the concerns of the public and Members about the implications for the service in that regard. Therefore, you have my guarantee on that. I would be grateful if Members would write to me, because this is a consultation, and there is always room to take on board the views of consultees.

I regularly meet the fire authorities and will continue to do so. I am particularly concerned about response times and such issues, because the public needs to be satisfied about safety. Now that we have devolved responsibility for the service, I need to consider what issues are pertinent in order to deliver a service that is fit for purpose. I am mindful of Elin Jones's comments on rural Wales. We want a system that is designed for the whole of Wales, and not one built on the needs of urban England. That is important for us.

Regarding Peter's contribution, my intention is to remain with national pay bargaining. I have always been a fan, as a trade unionist, of national pay bargaining. I hope that that will be possible and that we will get the agreement of the other administrations to continue with it. I would not like to see regional pay develop in the fire and rescue service.

I thank Ann Jones for her consistent support on fire and rescue service issues, and on the devolution of the service. As you know, Ann has a great interest in this area, and I have been grateful for her advice, given that she not only worked in the fire service, but was also an official in the Fire Brigades Union.

I say to Carl that I value the work undertaken by fire brigades across the board. We are talking about personnel who took up the challenges before they were even envisaged

llythyrau gan Aelodau i'r perwyl hwn—codaf y materion hyn yn ffurfiol gyda'r prif swyddog tân dros ganolbarth a gorllewin Cymru a chadeirydd yr awdurdod. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r hyn a ddywedodd Peter Black am rolau a chyfrifoldeb. Er hynny, fel Gweinidog Cynulliad, teimlaf na fyddwn yn cymryd fy nghyfrifoldeb o ddifrif pe nad ymatebwn i bryderon y cyhoedd ac Aelodau ynghylch y goblygiadau i'r gwasanaeth yn hynny o beth. Felly, rhoddaf sicrwydd i chi ar hynny. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe byddai Aelodau'n ysgrifennu ataf, oherwydd ymgynghoriad yw hwn, ac mae cyfle bob amser i ystyried barn yr ymgynghoreion.

Byddaf yn cwrdd â'r awdurdodau tân yn rheolaidd a byddaf yn parhau i wneud hynny. Yr wyf yn arbennig o bryderus hefyd ynghylch amseroedd ymateb a materion o'r fath, oherwydd rhaid i'r cyhoedd gael sicrwydd ynghylch diogelwch. Gan fod cyfrifoldeb dros y gwasanaeth wedi'i ddatganoli i ni bellach, rhaid imi ystyried pa faterion sy'n berthnasol er mwyn sicrhau y ceir gwasanaeth sy'n addas i'w ddiben. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r sylwadau a wnaeth Elin Jones am Gymru wledig. Yr ydym am gael gwasanaeth sy'n addas i Gymru gyfan, ac nid un sy'n seiliedig ar anghenion Lloegr drefol. Mae hynny'n bwysig yn ein golwg ni.

Ynghylch cyfraniad Peter, yr wyf yn bwriadu parhau â'r broses o fargeinio cyflogau cenedlaethol. Bùm yn gefnogol erioed, fel undebwr llafur, i fargeinio cyflogau cenedlaethol. Gobeithiaf y bydd hynny'n bosibl ac y cawn gytundeb gan y gweinyddiaethau eraill i barhau ag ef. Ni charwn weld cyflog rhanbarthol yn datblygu yn y gwasanaeth tân ac achub.

Diolchaf i Ann Jones am ei chymorth parhaus ar faterion sy'n ymwneud â'r gwasanaeth tan ac achub, ac ar ddatganoli'r gwasanaeth. Fel y gwyddoch, mae Ann yn ymddiddori'n fawr yn y maes hwn, a bùm yn ddiolchgar am ei chynghor, gan ei bod wedi gweithio yn y gwasanaeth tân a hefyd wedi bod yn swyddog yn Undeb y Brigadau Tân.

Dywedaf wrth Carl fy mod yn trysori'r gwaith a wnaiff brigadau tân yn gyffredinol. Yr ydym yn trafod staff a ymatebodd i'r heriau cyn eu rhagweld hyd yn oed yn



in Government legislation. They have done everything that is required in terms of fire safety, and they are highly proactive.

Alun Cairns spoke about community fire safety aspects. We have a budget of £5 million and a pilot sprinkler system has been installed at the new Welsh-medium comprehensive school at Penlan to see what could be done in an old school. I have had discussions with my colleagues Jane Davidson and the Finance Minister about ensuring that, where new schools are built with money from us, we can specify that sprinkler systems should be installed. We need to look to the future and consider what more we can do.

**Alun Cairns:** I am grateful for the Minister's positive response. However, does she recognise that it is completely unacceptable to erect new school buildings without sprinkler systems?

**Edwina Hart:** Erecting school buildings is a matter for local authorities. I would have thought that the fire authority members might have something to say in discussions on the wider issue. The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, the Finance Minister and I have been fully alerted to this, and we will consider the issues regarding giving money in the future for new buildings.

Today is a historic day. It will be good when these regulations are passed. I ask Members to oppose the amendments, although I understand why they have been tabled. It is important to understand that we have an excellent fire and rescue service, with excellent personnel, which now needs to be moulded into what Wales requires, and which can then be an example to the rest of the United Kingdom.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 1: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor

neddfwriaeth Llywodraeth. Gwnaethant bopeth sy'n ofynnol o ran diogelwch tân, ac maent yn dra rhagweithiol.

Soniodd Alun Cairns am agweddau sy'n ymwneud â diogelwch tân cymunedol. Mae gennym gyllideb o £5 miliwn ac mae system taenellwyr ragbrofol wedi'i gosod yn yr ysgol gyfun cyfrwng Cymraeg newydd ym Mhenlan i weld beth y gellir ei wneud mewn hen ysgol. Cefais drafodaethau â'm cyd-Weinidogion Jane Davidson a'r Gweinidog Cyllid ynghylch sicrhau, pan godir ysgolion newydd gan ddefnyddio arian a roddwyd gennym ni, y gallwn fynnu y gosodir system taenellwyr. Rhaid inni edrych tua'r dyfodol ac ystyried beth arall y gallwn ei wneud.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am ymateb cadarnhaol y Gweinidog. Fodd bynnag, a yw'n cydabod ei bod yn gwbl annerbyniol codi adeiladau ysgol newydd heb osod systemau taenellwyr ynddynt?

**Edwina Hart:** Mater i awdurdodau lleol yw codi adeiladau ysgol. Mae'n debyg gennyf y byddai gan aelodau'r awdurdodau tân rywbeth i'w ddweud efallai mewn trafodaethau ar y mater yn gyffredinol. Mae'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, y Gweinidog Cyllid a minnau wedi ein rhybuddio rhag hyn, ac ystyriwn y materion sy'n codi mewn cysylltiad â rhoi arian yn y dyfodol ar gyfer adeiladau newydd.

Mae heddiw'n ddiwrnod hanesyddol. Peth braf fydd derbyn y rheoliadau hyn. Gofynnaf i Aelodau wrthwynebu'r gwelliannau, er fy mod yn deall pam y'u cyflwynwyd. Mae'n bwysig deall bod gennym wasanaeth tân ac achub rhagorol, a chanddo staff gwyech, y mae angen ei addasu'n awr i ddiwallu anghenion Cymru, ac a all fod yn esiampl wedyn i weddill y Deyrnas Unedig.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine

Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
 Amendment 2: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 3: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM2152): O blaid 56, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2152): For 56, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet

Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2153): O blaid 56, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2153): For 56, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet

Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

4.20 p.m.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 1: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John

Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
 Amendment 2: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
 Amendment 3: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM2154): O blaid 56, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*  
*Motion (NDM2154): For 56, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice

Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2155): O blaid 56, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2155): For 56, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice



Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cynllun y Taliad Sengl ac Amrywiol Gynlluniau  
 Cymorth Uniongyrchol (Apelau) (Cymru) 2004  
 Approval of the Single Payment Scheme and Miscellaneous Direct Support  
 Schemes (Appeals) (Wales) Regulations 2004**

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Cynigiaf fod  
**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** I propose that

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Cynllun y Taliad Sengl ac Amrywiol Gynlluniau Cymorth Uniongyrchol (Apelau) (Cymru) 2004 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Hydref 2004. (NDM2156)*  
*the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Single Payment Scheme and Miscellaneous Direct Support Schemes (Appeals) (Wales) Regulations 2004, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 20 October 2004. (NDM2156)*

Cynigiaf fod

I propose that

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno, ac a anfonwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad drwy'r*  
*a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 2 November*

*e-bost ar 2 Tachwedd 2004, mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Cynllun y Taliad Sengl ac Amrywiol Gynlluniau Cymorth Uniongyrchol (Apelau) (Cymru) 2004; a*

*b) yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Cynllun y Taliad Sengl ac Amrywiol Gynlluniau Cymorth Uniongyrchol (Apelau) (Cymru) 2004 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*i) y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Hydref 2004; a*

*ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd at yr Aelodau drwy'r e-bost ar 2 Tachwedd 2004. (NDM2157)*

**Helen Mary Jones:** Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales will support these regulations, as it is important that we have a proper appeals procedure in place as soon as possible. However, in supporting the Minister on this matter, we would like him to respond to some questions, preferably today, but, if that is not possible, either in committee or in writing.

Can the Minister tell us when farmers will learn what their payment entitlement is, so that they can see whether or not they need to appeal? When will the Minister know what will be the average payment calculated, that is, that which is relevant to those seeking entitlement through the national reserve? Can he assure us that those who feel the need to appeal will not experience any prolonged delay in receiving payments?

We would also like to know when farm inspections will begin and how any failed inspections will affect the payment of entitlement to all farmers, if it will have any effect at all. Can the Minister tell us today whether he is confident that the 3 per cent ceiling is sufficient to fund entitlements under the national reserve, and will he also tell us what discussions he has had—and this is important—with colleagues at Westminster on the effect of differing cross-compliance measures in Wales and England on those farms that straddle the border?

*2004 in relation to the draft Order, the Single Payment Scheme and Miscellaneous Direct Support Schemes (Appeals) (Wales) Regulations 2004; and*

*b) approves that the Single Payment Scheme and Miscellaneous Direct Support Schemes (Appeals) (Wales) Regulations 2004 is made in accordance with:*

*i) the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 20 October 2004; and*

*ii) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 2 November 2004. (NDM2157)*

**Helen Mary Jones:** Bydd Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn, gan ei bod yn bwysig inni sefydlu gweithdrefn apelau briodol cyn gynted ag y bo modd. Er hynny, wrth gefnogi'r Gweinidog ar y mater hwn, caredd iddo ymateb i rai cwestiynau, heddiw os oes modd, neu, os nad yw hynny'n bosibl, naill ai yn y pwyllgor neu mewn llythyr.

A all y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym pa bryd y caiff ffermwyr wybod am y taliad y mae ganddynt hawl iddo, fel y gallant weld a oes angen iddynt apelio? Pa bryd y caiff y Gweinidog wybod beth yw'r taliad cyfartalog cyfrifedig, hynny yw, yr hyn sy'n berthnasol i'r rhai sy'n ceisio hawl i daliad drwy'r gronfa genedlaethol? A all ein sicrhau na fydd y rhai sy'n teimlo bod angen iddynt apelio yn profi oedi hir cyn iddynt gael eu talu?

Caredd gael gwybod hefyd pa bryd y bydd yr archwiliadau o ffermydd yn dechrau a beth fydd effaith unrhyw archwiliadau a fethir ar y taliadau i'r holl ffermwyr yn ôl eu hawl, os caiff hynny effaith o gwbl. A all y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym heddiw a yw'n ffyddiog bod y terfyn uchaf o 3 y cant yn ddigon i ariannu taliadau o dan y gronfa genedlaethol, ac a ddywed wrthym hefyd ba drafodaethau a gafodd—ac mae hyn yn bwysig—gyda'i gymheiriaid yn San Steffan ar effaith y gwahanol fesurau croesgydymffurfio yng Nghymru a Lloegr ar y ffermydd hynny sydd o boptu i'r ffin?

Finally, I want the Minister to explain to the Assembly today why he failed to include new entrants as part of the automatic entitlement, as opposed to the discretionary element, of the national reserve. If there was no way for those new entrants to be included, why did he ask, in his consultation paper, whether they should receive automatic entitlement or be part of a discretionary element? We are, therefore, happy to support these regulations, but we seek the Minister's response on some of the crucial issues of implementation.

**Brynle Williams:** I, too, support the regulations before us and understand that the farming community will benefit from the appeals procedure for farmers who dispute decisions taken in connection with the administration of the single farm payment and various other direct support schemes. However, I have grave concerns about the cross-border issue. You will be aware that there are many anomalies relating to people living in Wales who rent land in England and Wales. The farming community wants and deserves clarification. At the moment, each country has made different decisions on how it will implement the single farm payment, and the funding is not easy to work out.

We must treat everyone fairly and equally. Some people have land in England and in Wales, and we cannot simply put a line through it, as we need to ensure that payments are accurate and in line with procedure. This matter must be sorted out, and quickly. Farmers and the unions are still waiting for information. They are concerned that farmers have filled in forms when schemes have not even been finalised. This includes the cross-border issues and the national reserves. You will be aware, Minister, that this will be a tight year for farmers, and they need to plan ahead. At present, there are already serious cash flow problems. I appreciate that you cannot address all my points in detail now, but I would be grateful for an oral update this afternoon, with additional information to be made available to me in writing as a matter of urgency.

Yn olaf, yr wyf am i'r Gweinidog egluro i'r Cynulliad heddiw pam y methodd â chynnwys ffermwyr newydd gyda'r rhai sydd â hawl awtomatig i gael eu talu o'r gronfa genedlaethol, yn hytrach na chyda'r elfen ddewisol. Os nad oedd modd cynnwys y ffermwyr newydd hynny, pam y gofynnodd, yn ei bapur ymgynghori, a ddylent gael hawl awtomatig neu fod yn rhan o'r elfen ddewisol? Felly, yr ydym yn fodlon cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn, ond ceisiwn ymateb gan y Gweinidog ar rai o'r materion hollbwysig sy'n codi wrth eu rhoi ar waith.

**Brynle Williams:** Yr wyf finnau'n cefnogi'r rheoliadau sydd ger ein bron a deallaf y caiff y gymuned ffermio fudd o'r weithdrefn apelau ar gyfer y rhai sy'n herio penderfyniadau a wnaed mewn cysylltiad â gweinyddu'r taliad fferm sengl ac amrywiol gynlluniau cymorth uniongyrchol eraill. Fodd bynnag, mae gennyf bryderon mawr ynghylch y mater sy'n ymwneud â ffermydd sydd o boptu i'r ffin. Gwyddoch fod sawl anghysondeb mewn cysylltiad â rhai sy'n byw yng Nghymru ac yn talu rhent am dir yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Mae ffermwyr am gael eglurhad ar hyn ac maent yn haeddu hynny. Fel y mae, mae'r ddwy wlad wedi gwneud penderfyniadau gwahanol ynghylch sut y byddant yn gweithredu'r taliad fferm sengl, ac nid yw'n hawdd cyfrifo'r cyllid.

Rhaid inni drin pawb yn deg ac yn gyfartal. Mae gan rai pobl dir yn Lloegr ac yng Nghymru, ac ni allwn dynnu llinell drwyddo, gan fod rhaid inni sicrhau bod y taliadau'n gywir ac yn unol â'r weithdrefn. Rhaid datrys y mater hwn, a hynny'n ddiymdroi. Mae ffermwyr a'r undebau'n dal i ddisgwyl am wybodaeth. Maent yn pryderu bod ffermwyr wedi llenwi ffurflenni pan nad oedd y cynlluniau wedi'u cwblhau. Mae hyn yn cynnwys y materion trawsffiniol a'r cronfeydd cenedlaethol. Gwyddoch, Weinidog, y bydd y flwyddyn hon yn un anodd i ffermwyr, a rhaid iddynt gynllunio ar gyfer y dyfodol. Ar hyn o bryd, ceir problemau difrifol eisoes o ran llif arian. Deallaf na allwch ymdrin yn fanwl â'r holl bwyntiau a godais yn awr, ond byddwn yn ddiolchgar o gael gwybodaeth ar lafar am y datblygiadau diweddaraf y prynhawn yma, ac o gael gwybodaeth ychwanegol mewn llythyr

fel mater o frys.

**Mick Bates:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome the principle of an independent appeal, as outlined in this legislation. I was a little surprised, however, that there was no consultation with the industry. The Minister should explain why none was undertaken and whether he has considered any views from the industry, as I have several questions, particularly on section 4, paragraph 3, which talks about a panel. Who will be responsible for the formation of that panel? Also, will the panel include, in the Minister's view, somebody who is familiar with and has knowledge of the industry, such as a farming union representative?

I, too, emphasise the issue of how appeals will be heard with regard to cross-border holdings given that payments will possibly be received under different payment regimes. Many people would like to hear about that. Finally, in the event of an appeal being successful and extra funding being provided, the document simply states that the money comes from European funding. Does that actually come from a CAP budget, or is it some other European funding?

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** Several, quite detailed questions were asked, but in terms of the legislation before the Assembly, and in terms of the appeals system, the reason why we have this appeals system is simply to ensure that farmers have an appeals mechanism. In the case of appeals that are unresolved by the time payments are due to be issued, it will not be possible to fully calculate individual entitlement values across Wales, which is an important point. That is why it is so important that appeals be dealt with as expeditiously as possible and why we have a two-stage process rather than a three-stage process, as in the case of the integrated administration and control system. It is important to remember that the option and opportunity for farmers to have a full hearing remains. The panels will be constituted in the same way as the IACS appeals panels, and I anticipate that the system will be broadly similar, which means that it will be possible for farmers to have a hearing before a panel, and the membership is well known to many

**Mick Bates:** Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n croesawu egwyddor yr apêl annibynnol, fel y'i nodir yn y ddeddfwriaeth hon. Fe'm synwyd braidd, fodd bynnag, na fu unrhyw ymgynghori â'r diwydiant. Dylai'r Gweinidog egluro pam na wnaed hynny ac a yw wedi ystyried unrhyw sylwadau gan y diwydiant, gan fod gennyf sawl cwestiwn, yn enwedig mewn cysylltiad ag adran 4, paragraff 3, sy'n cyfeirio at banel. Pwy fydd yn gyfrifol am ffurfio'r panel hwnnw? Hefyd, a fydd y panel yn cynnwys, ym marn y Gweinidog, rywun sy'n gyfarwydd â'r diwydiant ac yn gwybod amdano, fel cynrychiolydd undeb ffermio?

Rhoddaf finnau bwys ar y modd y gwrandewir ar apelau sy'n ymwneud â ffermydd sydd o boptu i'r ffin gan y gellid derbyn taliadau o dan wahanol gyfundrefnau talu. Mae llawer a garai glywed am hynny. Yn olaf, os bydd apêl yn llwyddo ac os darperir cyllid ychwanegol, yn ôl y ddogfen daw'r arian o gronfeydd Ewropeaidd. A ddaw o gyllideb y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin, neu o ryw gronfa Ewropeaidd arall?

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Gofynnwyd sawl cwestiwn eithaf manwl ond, yng nghyd-destun y ddeddfwriaeth sydd gerbron y Cynulliad, ac yng nghyd-destun y system apelau, y rheswm syml dros gael y system apelau hon yw sicrhau bod dull apelio ar gael i ffermwyr. Os ceir apelau a fydd heb eu datrys erbyn yr adeg y dylai'r taliadau gael eu dosbarthu, ni fydd modd cyfrifo holl werthoedd y gwahanol hawliau ledled Cymru, ac mae hwnnw'n bwynt pwysig. Dyna pam y mae mor bwysig ymdrin ag apelau cyn gyflymed ag y bo modd a dyna pam y mae gennym broses dau gam yn hytrach na phroses tri cham, fel a geir yn achos y system gweinyddu a rheoli integredig. Mae'n bwysig cofio bod dewis a chyfle ar gael o hyd i ffermwyr gael gwrandawriad llawn. Ffurfir y paneli yn yr un modd â phaneli apelau'r system gweinyddu a rheoli integredig, a rhagwelaf y bydd y system yn eithaf tebyg, fel y bydd modd i ffermwyr gael gwrandawriad gerbron panel, ac mae'r aelodaeth yn dra adnabyddus i sawl

Members.

With regard to cross-border holdings, I am not yet in a position to clarify the exact position as there is still the need to clarify finally the issues, not just between Wales and England, but between the three different areas in England itself. We must ensure that that is clear, but I stress that it is the final stage in ensuring that farmers have clarity in the new system's operation.

4.30 p.m.

With regard to the 3 per cent ceiling, I am confident that that will be sufficient. In terms of young entrants, they have the automatic entitlement. Members ought to bear in mind that there is provision for a review of this issue in 2005, which is important. There are a number of other detailed matters which Members raised, which deserve a written response. With regard to this process, it is important that there is a viable appeals system in which farmers have confidence. The fact that they have confidence in the IACS appeals regulations will mean that they will also have confidence in the appeals system proposed today.

Aelod.

Gyda golwg ar ffermydd sydd o boptu i'r ffin, nid wyf mewn lle eto i egluro'r union sefyllfa gan fod angen egluro'r materion hyn yn derfynol o hyd, nid yn unig rhwng Cymru a Lloegr, ond rhwng y tair ardal wahanol yn Lloegr ei hun. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod hynny'n glir, ond pwysleisiaf mai hwnnw yw'r cam olaf wrth sicrhau y caiff ffermwyr weld sut y bydd y system newydd yn gweithio.

Gyda golwg ar y terfyn uchaf o 3 y cant, yr wyf yn ffyddiog y bydd hynny'n ddigon. Ynghylch ffermwyr newydd, mae hawl awtomatig ganddynt. Dylai Aelodau gofio bod darpariaeth ar gyfer cynnal adolygiad o'r mater hwn yn 2005, ac mae hynny'n bwysig. Mae sawl mater manwl arall a godwyd gan Aelodau, sy'n teilyngu ateb ysgrifenedig. Gyda golwg ar y broses hon, mae'n bwysig y ceir system apelau ddichonol y bydd ffermwyr yn ymddiried ynddi. Gan eu bod yn ymddiried yn rheoliadau apelau'r system gweinyddu a rheoli integredig, byddant hefyd yn ymddiried yn y system apelau a gynigir heddiw.

*Cynnig (NDM2156): O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM2156): For 54, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice

Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2157): O blaid 55, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2157): For 55, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine

Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn y Cwricwlwm Cenedlaethol (Trefniadau Asesu ar gyfer Cyfnod Allweddol 2) (Cymru) 2004 a Rheoliadau y Cwricwlwm Cenedlaethol (Diwygiadau) Canlyniadol (Trefniadau Asesu ar gyfer Cyfnod Allweddol 2) 2004**

**Approval of the National Curriculum (Key Stage 2 Assessment Arrangements)(Wales) Order 2004 and the National Curriculum (Key Stage 2 Assessment Arrangements) (Consequential Amendments) (Wales) Regulations 2004**

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the National Curriculum (Key Stage 2 Assessment Arrangements) (Wales) Order 2004, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Member on 2 November 2004. (NDM2158)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales approves that the National Curriculum (Key Stage 2 Assessment Arrangements) (Wales) Order*

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn y Cwricwlwm Cenedlaethol (Trefniadau Asesu ar gyfer Cyfnod Allweddol 2) (Cymru) 2004 y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Tachwedd 2004. (NDM2158)*

Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn y Cwricwlwm Cenedlaethol (Trefniadau Asesu ar gyfer*

2004 is made in accordance with the draft Order laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 2 November 2004. (NDM2159)

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the National Curriculum (Key Stage 2 Assessment Arrangements) (Consequential Amendments) (Wales) Regulations 2004, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 2 November 2004. (NDM2160)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales approves that the National Curriculum (Key Stage 2 Assessment Arrangements) (Consequential Amendments) (Wales) Regulations 2004 are made in accordance with the draft regulations laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 2 November 2004. (NDM2161)*

In my statement to Plenary on 13 July, I outlined my response to the recommendations contained in the Daugherty assessment review group's final report and the Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales's report, 'The Review of the School Curriculum and Assessment Arrangements 5-16'. Following the statement, I issued a consultation paper on 1 September, which set out the proposed new assessment package and the changes needed for 2005. Consultation ended on 22 October and the regulations before you today amend the key stage 2 arrangements to reflect the overwhelmingly positive response to my proposals. The regulations are made under Standing Order No. 24.27 and deal only with the changes for key stage 2. I shall, in due course, bring forward similar ones covering the key stage 3 arrangements, but as these will not impact until 2006, they will follow standard procedure.

*Cyfnod Allweddol 2) (Cymru) 2004 yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad drwy'r e-bost ar 2 Tachwedd 2004. (NDM2159)*

Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau y Cwricwlwm Cenedlaethol (Trefniadau Asesu ar gyfer Cyfnod Allweddol 2) (Diwygiadau Canlyniadol) (Cymru) 2004 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac yr anfonwyd copi ohonynt at Aelodau'r Cynulliad drwy'r e-bost ar 2 Tachwedd 2004. (NDM2160)*

Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau y Cwricwlwm Cenedlaethol (Trefniadau Asesu ar gyfer Cyfnod Allweddol 2) (Diwygiadau Canlyniadol) (Cymru) 2004 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â'r rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad drwy'r e-bost ar 2 Tachwedd 2004. (NDM2161)*

Yn fy natganiad yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 13 Gorffennaf, nodais fy ymateb i'r argymhellion a geir yn adroddiad terfynol grŵp adolygu asesiadau Daugherty ac adroddiad Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru, 'Adolygiad o'r Cwricwlwm Ysgol a Threfniadau Asesu 5-16'. Ar ôl gwneud y datganiad, cyhoeddais bapur ymgynghori ar 1 Medi, a nododd y pecyn asesu newydd arfaethedig a'r newidiadau y mae angen eu gwneud ar gyfer 2005. Daeth yr ymgynghoriad i ben ar 22 Hydref ac mae'r rheoliadau sydd ger eich bron heddiw'n newid y trefniadau ar gyfer cyfnod allweddol 2 fel y byddant yn adlewyrchu'r ymatebion i'm cynigion, yr oedd y mwyafrif llethol ohonynt yn gadarnhaol. Gwneir y rheoliadau o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.27 ac nid ydynt ond yn ymwneud â'r newidiadau ar gyfer cyfnod allweddol 2. Byddaf yn dwyn rhai tebyg gerbron, gyda hyn, a fydd yn ymwneud â'r trefniadau ar gyfer cyfnod allweddol 3, ond gan na ddeuant i rym tan 2006, byddant yn dilyn y weithdrefn arferol.



It has been necessary to use Standing Order No. 24.27 today to ensure that the legislative base is in place in time for next year's assessment round, and this was reported to the committee. ACCAC can now contact schools with details of how the 2005 arrangements will operate.

I was pleased with the response I received to the proposed assessment package, and a full analysis of, and report on, the consultation exercise will be published shortly on the internet. I am, however, able to provide a brief summary of the responses in respect of key stage 2.

A total of 414 responses were received. Of those commenting on the key stage 2 arrangements, 80 per cent wanted the tests made optional in 2005, with 72 per cent supporting the option of external marking. There was also support—86 per cent—for optional tests being available in 2006, and 90 per cent supported optional materials being provided in 2007.

Such a response reinforces our opinion that the advice that we received both from Professor Richard Daugherty and his group, and ACCAC, was well founded. The removal of the statutory tests for 11-year-olds will set us on a path to developing an effective and robust assessment system for Wales.

**Janet Ryder:** The scrapping of key stage testing at key stage 2 is to be welcomed, as is the replacement of those tests with teacher assessment. However, two major questions arise from these regulations. First, how will equity of assessment throughout Wales be ensured? Secondly, how will these regulations affect the new teachers' workload arrangement?

With regard to ensuring equity of assessment, the Minister has talked about marking exams externally. Secondary schools need to know that children who arrive from different primary schools have been assessed against common criteria and have been assessed equitably. No indication has been given as to how you will ensure equity in that assessment. Setting standards against which a

Bu'n rhaid defnyddio Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 24.27 heddiw i sicrhau y bydd y sylfaen ddeddfwriaethol yn barod ar gyfer cylch asesu'r flwyddyn nesaf, a rhoddwyd gwybod am hyn i'r pwyllgor. Yn awr, bydd modd i ACCAC gysylltu ag ysgolion a rhoi manylion am y trefniadau ar gyfer 2005.

Yr oeddwn yn fodlon ar yr ymateb a gefais i'r pecyn asesu arfaethedig, a chyhoeddir dadansoddiad llawn o'r ymgynghoriad, ac adroddiad arno, cyn hir ar y rhyngrwyd. Fodd bynnag, gallaf roi crynodeb byr o'r ymatebion mewn cysylltiad â chyfnod allweddol 2.

Cafwyd 414 o ymatebion i gyd. O blith y rhai a wnaeth sylwadau am y trefniadau ar gyfer cyfnod allweddol 2, yr oedd 80 y cant am i'r profion gael eu gwneud yn ddewisol yn 2005, ac yr oedd 72 y cant o blaid y dewis o farcio allanol. Yr oedd cefnogaeth hefyd—86 y cant—i ddarparu profion dewisol yn 2006, ac yr oedd 90 y cant o blaid darparu deunyddiau dewisol yn 2007.

Mae ymateb o'r fath yn cadarnhau ein barn bod y cyngor a gawsom gan yr Athro Richard Daugherty a'i grŵp, a chan ACCAC, yn rhesymol. Bydd dileu'r profion statudol i rai 11 mlwydd oed yn ein rhoi ar ben ffordd i ddatblygu system asesu effeithiol a chadarn i Gymru.

**Janet Ryder:** Rhywbeth i'w groesawu yw diddymu profion cyfnod allweddol yng nghyfnod allweddol 2 a chael asesu gan athrawon yn lle'r profion hynny. Er hynny, mae dau gwestiwn pwysig yn codi yn sgîl y rheoliadau hyn. Yn gyntaf, sut y sicrhau tegwch wrth asesu ledled Cymru? Yn ail, beth fydd effaith y rheoliadau hyn ar y trefniant newydd ar gyfer llwyth gwaith athrawon?

Gyda golwg ar sicrhau tegwch wrth asesu, mae'r Gweinidog wedi sôn am farcio arholiadau'n allanol. Rhaid i ysgolion uwchradd gael gwybod bod plant a dderbynnir o wahanol ysgolion cynradd wedi'u hasesu yn ôl meini prawf cyffredin a'u bod wedi'u hasesu'n deg. Ni nodwyd sut y byddwch yn sicrhau bod yr asesu hwnnw'n deg. Nid yr un peth yw pennu safonau yr

pupil will be assessed is not the same as ensuring equity of assessment; they are two separate issues. It has been suggested that a new role be developed within the teaching profession, namely that of a teacher assessor. A person in that role could be trained against a national standard to ensure equity across all areas and would be responsible for moderating and ensuring equity in terms of the standard of testing among his or her fellow professionals. This could be achieved on an authority-wide basis with a group of teachers coming forward in each area, and would avoid the need to bring in outside assessors to ensure equity. Such a scheme should be considered, particularly when we move to key stage 3 teacher-based assessments.

The second major issue is the impact on the teachers' workload agreement. What discussions has the Minister had with her advisory group on this issue? Teachers will now be expected to make arrangements for the assessment of every child in each relevant subject during the summer term. The results must be recorded and a statement must be produced for each child no later than two weeks before the end of the summer term. That will have a significant impact on teachers' workload unless the Minister intends that that will be done externally. It will be interesting to hear how that will work out. What discussions has she had with the workload advisory group on that and what impact will it have on teachers' workload?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** The Daugherty report and ACCAC's advice on national curriculum assessment arrangements pointed towards a clear need for change if Wales is to get the best from its pupils, the curriculum and its teachers. While the current test system has provided a clear focus and a structured means by which to measure pupil attainment, it was putting too much pressure on teachers to teach to the tests and was narrowing the scope of the curriculum. The transition from primary to secondary school is key and both Professor Daugherty and ACCAC have shown that a system of skills-based assessments would manage this better.

The move from tests to wider teacher-based

asesir disgybl yn eu herbyn a sicrhau asesu teg; maent yn ddau fater gwahanol. Awgrymwyd y dylid datblygu rôl newydd ymysg athrawon, sef un yr athro asesydd. Gellir hyfforddi rhywun yn y rôl honno yn ôl safon genedlaethol i sicrhau tegwch ym mhob ardal a byddai'n gyfrifol am safoni a sicrhau tegwch o ran safon y profi ymysg ei gyd-athrawon. Gellid cyflawni hyn o fewn awdurdod drwy gael grŵp o athrawon yn ymgynnig ym mhob ardal, fel na fyddai'n rhaid dod ag aseswyr o'r tu allan i sicrhau tegwch. Dylid ystyried cynllun o'r fath, yn enwedig pan symudwn ymlaen at asesiadau yng nghyfnod allweddol 3 gan athrawon.

Yr ail fater pwysig yw'r effaith ar gytundeb llwyth gwaith yr athrawon. Pa drafodaethau a gafodd y Gweinidog â'i grŵp ymgynghorol ynghylch y mater hwn? Yn awr, disgwylir i athrawon drefnu ar gyfer asesu pob plentyn ym mhob pwnc perthnasol yn ystod tymor yr haf. Rhaid cofnodi'r canlyniadau a chynhyrchu datganiad ar gyfer pob plentyn cyn pen pythefnos i ddiwedd tymor yr haf. Caiff hynny gryn effaith ar lwyth gwaith athrawon oni bai fod y Gweinidog yn bwriadu i hynny gael ei wneud yn allanol. Bydd yn ddiddorol clywed sut y bydd hynny'n gweithio. Pa drafodaethau a gafodd â'r grŵp ymgynghorol ar y llwyth gwaith am hynny a pha effaith a gaiff ar lwyth gwaith athrawon?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Yr oedd adroddiad Daugherty a chyngor ACCAC ynghylch y trefniadau ar gyfer asesu'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol yn dangos yn glir fod angen newid os yw Cymru i gael y gorau gan ei disgyblion, y cwricwlwm a'i hathrawon. Er bod y system brofion bresennol wedi cynnig dull eglur a threfnus o fesur cyrhaeddiad disgyblion, yr oedd yn rhoi gormod o bwysau ar athrawon i ddysgu ar gyfer y profion ac yn cyfyngu ar gwmpas y cwricwlwm. Mae'r newid o'r ysgol gynradd i'r ysgol uwchradd yn allweddol ac mae'r Athro Daugherty ac ACCAC wedi dangos y byddai system o asesiadau sy'n seiliedig ar sgiliau'n well modd i drefnu hynny.

Fodd bynnag, dim ond ar ôl ymgynghori'n

assessments was made, however, only after wide-ranging consultation and expert guidance from two independent bodies. There was a great need for a review. Standard assessment tests were introduced a decade ago and, because we met all our key stage 2 targets, the Assembly Government is implementing change from a clear position of strength.

The Minister has achieved the right balance by neither moving to abolish the current tests immediately nor insisting on the early use of the new skills assessments. The individual implementation timetables produced by ACCAC and Daugherty also emphasise that. This will be a managed change, and the assessments will be fully operational by 2007-08. This will allow a phased approach, with flexibility for individual schools to ensure successful introduction. Nevertheless, today we will guarantee that our 11-year-olds will not be required to sit statutory tests next May. Optional tests will be available and support will be given, allowing individual schools to make their own judgments on how to progress during this transitional stage. Replacing tests with flexible skills assessments will again reposition pupils at the heart of our educational system and build on the professional judgment of teachers. The assessments will focus on skills development and an assessment for learning programme. They will relieve burdens and there will be more profitable and effective use of teaching time.

Prior to these changes, there was some concern as to why the performance of pupils declines during the first years of secondary school; these changes will enable schools to target that. The new assessment at key stage 2 will be skills focused, and the skills tests, although not covered by this Order, will provide teachers with more help in identifying key individual strengths and weaknesses than the old tests did. They will also help to bridge the difficult change phase experienced by many pupils. I look forward to hearing more about the outcome of the trial period next year.

eang a chael cyfarwyddyd arbenigol gan ddau gorff annibynnol y newidiwyd o brofion i asesiadau mwy cyffredinol gan athrawon. Yr oedd mawr angen adolygu hyn. Cyflwynwyd profion asesu safonol ddegawd yn ôl a, gan ein bod wedi cyrraedd ein holl dargedau ar gyfer cyfnod allweddol 2, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cyflwyno newid o fan cryf.

Mae'r Gweinidog wedi dal y ddysgl yn wastad drwy beidio â diddymu'r profion presennol ar unwaith a pheidio â mynnu ychwaith y bydd yr asesiadau sgiliau newydd yn cael eu defnyddio'n fuan. Mae'r amserlenni penodol ar gyfer gweithredu a gynhyrchwyd gan ACCAC a Daugherty yn pwysleisio hynny hefyd. Newid dan reolaeth fydd hwn, a bydd yr asesiadau'n llawn weithredol erbyn 2007-08. Bydd hyn yn cynnig modd i weithredu'n raddol, gan roi hyblygrwydd i bob ysgol gael eu cyflwyno'n llwyddiannus. Er hynny, byddwn heddiw'n gwarantu na fydd rhai 11 mlwydd oed yn gorfod sefyll profion statudol fis Mai nesaf. Bydd profion dewisol ar gael a rhoddir cymorth, fel y gall pob ysgol farnu drosti i hun ynghylch y modd i symud ymlaen yn ystod y cyfnod trosiannol hwn. Drwy roi asesiadau sgiliau hyblyg yn lle profion, rhoddir lle canolog eto i ddisgyblion yn ein system addysgol gan fanteisio ar farn broffesiynol athrawon. Bydd yr asesiadau'n canolbwyntio ar feithrin sgiliau ac ar asesu ar gyfer rhaglen dysgu. Byddant yn ysgafnhau'r beichiau a gwneir defnydd mwy buddiol ac effeithiol o'r amser ar gyfer dysgu.

Cyn gwneud y newidiadau hyn, yr oedd peth pryder ynghylch y rheswm dros y dirywiad ym mherfformiad disgyblion yn ystod y blynyddoedd cyntaf yn yr ysgol uwchradd; bydd y newidiadau hyn yn galluogi ysgolion i roi sylw i hynny. Bydd yr asesiad newydd yng nghyfnod allweddol 2 yn canolbwyntio ar sgiliau, a bydd y profion sgiliau, er nad yw'r Gorchymyn hwn yn ymdrin â hwy, yn rhoi mwy o gymorth i athrawon ganfod cryfderau a gwendidau penodol allweddol nag yr oedd yr hen brofion. Byddant hefyd yn helpu i bontio'r cyfnod anodd o newid a brofir gan lawer o ddisgyblion. Edrychaf ymlaen at glywed mwy am ganlyniad y cyfnod prawf y flwyddyn nesaf.

4.40 p.m.

I hope that most people are able to hear me, given all the noise that is coming from the other side.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I must apologise on behalf of the opposition parties that are making such noise again.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Thank you, Presiding Officer. To conclude, it is clear from the press coverage alone that these changes put Wales ahead of the game. In education, we are getting used to envious glances from educationists and parents in England. Today's changes give us another reason why many wish that they too could take advantage of the Welsh Assembly Government's policies, which are meeting the needs of the people of Wales.

**David Davies:** I point out to the previous speaker that there is a big difference between envious glances and glances of relief—parents in schools across England know full well that their schools are much better funded than schools in Wales. Any headteacher or teacher who has experience of teaching in schools both sides of the border will confirm that. They will also confirm another matter, and on that I will give the Government a small amount of credit, because I am always balanced, and pay it a small compliment, because it has got something right—it is an unusual event, and when it happens it is only right that we should acknowledge that. The Government's consultation on the testing regime showed that teachers were overwhelmingly against it, and that is absolutely correct. I am yet to meet a teacher, from any side of the political divide, who has a good word to say about the previous testing regime—I am sure that there are some, but I have never come across them. The testing regime that is now being replaced was obviously unpopular and, to some extent, there was a lack of confidence in it across the education system.

We should not lose sight of the fact that the regime was brought in for a good reason, along with the national curriculum, because a

Gobeithiaf fod y rhan fwyaf o bobl yn gallu fy nghlywed, o ystyried yr holl dwrw sy'n dod o'r ochr arall.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Rhaid imi ymddiheuro dros y gwrthbleidiau sy'n gwneud y fath dwrw eto.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Diolch i chi, Lywydd. I derfynu, mae'n amlwg o'r sylw yn y wasg yn unig fod y newidiadau hyn yn rhoi Cymru ar y blaen. Ym myd addysg, yr ydym yn arfer â gweld addysgwyr a rhieni yn Lloegr yn edrych yn genfigennus arnom. Mae'r newidiadau heddiw'n cynnig rheswm arall i lawer ddymuno y gallent hwythau gael mantais o bolisiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, sy'n diwallu anghenion pobl Cymru.

**David Davies:** Tynnaf sylw'r siaradwr blaenorol at y ffaith bod gwahaniaeth mawr rhwng golwg genfigennus a golwg o ryddhad—mae rhieni mewn ysgolion ledled Lloegr yn gwybod yn iawn fod eu hysgolion hwy'n cael eu hariannu'n well o lawer nag ysgolion yng Nghymru. Bydd unrhyw athro neu bennaeth ysgol a gafodd brofiad o ddysgu mewn ysgolion ar ddwy ochr y ffin yn cadarnhau hynny. Byddant hefyd yn cadarnhau mater arall, a rhoddaf ychydig o glod i'r Llywodraeth ar hynny, gan fy mod bob amser yn deg, a rhoddaf ychydig o ganmoliaeth iddi, gan ei bod wedi cael rhywbeth yn iawn—mae'n ddigwyddiad anarferol, a phan ddigwydd hynny nid yw ond yn iawn inni ei gydnabod. Mae ymgynghoriad y Llywodraeth ar y gyfundrefn profion wedi dangos bod y mwyafrif llethol o athrawon yn ei gwrthwynebu, ac mae hynny'n hollol iawn. Nid wyf eto wedi cwrdd â'r un athro, o unrhyw liw gwleidyddol, sydd â gair da am y gyfundrefn profion flaenorol—yr wyf yn siŵr bod rhai, ond ni ddeuthum ar eu traws erioed. Yr oedd yn amlwg bod y gyfundrefn profion a ddisodlir yn un amhoblogaidd ac, i ryw raddau, yr oedd diffyg hyder ynddi yn y system addysg drwyddi draw.

Ni ddylem golli golwg ar y ffaith bod rheswm da dros gyflwyno'r gyfundrefn, ynghyd â'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol, sef bod

number of teachers across the United Kingdom—a minority admittedly—seemed more interested in trying to imbue a socialist ethos into their charges than teaching them about the basics of reading, writing and arithmetic. Be that as it may, we have moved on from that I am glad to say, and that sort of behaviour does not seem to be as widespread.

I would like to see a system that would allow us to give more freedom to schools so that they can get away from the national curriculum and the testing regime, but only where the headteachers show that they can deliver high standards of education. That would mean allowing them to break free not only from rules set by the National Assembly, but from the local education authorities.

This may be a small step in that direction, but it remains vital is that parents can continue to be confident that their children are getting a good standard of education. The testing regime is not disappearing, it is simply changing in a way that means that teachers will not only teach to the test. They will teach, and the tests will pick up where mistakes are being made and where standards are not being delivered adequately. The jury is still out on one thing, Minister: we need to ensure that the outside moderation, or whatever method you use to ensure that schools are not failing their pupils, works effectively. On that basis, we give our support, but it is qualified. We must ensure that standards are delivered in schools across Wales and we expect you to come up with a means, as mentioned in the report, to ensure that that happens.

**Peter Black:** It always gladdens my heart when a Conservative spokesman changes his mind on testing. Given the support that the Conservatives have for introducing testing, it is right now that David should welcome the fact that tests are being abolished. Wales is once again leading the way.

**David Davies:** Does Peter actually think that testing is being abolished or does he accept that what is happening is that the way of assessing how well pupils are doing is simply

nifer o athrawon ledled y Deyrnas Unedig—lleiafrif ohonynt, rhaid cyfaddef—a ymddiddorai'n fwy i bob golwg mewn ceisio meithrin ethos sosialaidd yn y rhai a oedd dan eu gofal nag yn eu dysgu am hanfodion darllen, ysgrifennu a rhifydddeg. Boed hynny fel y bo, yr ydym wedi symuud ymlaen ers hynny, mae'n dda gennyf ddweud, ac nid yw'n ymddangos bod ymddygiad o'r fath mor gyffredin.

Carwn weld system a ganiatâi inni roi mwy o ryddid i ysgolion fel y gallant droi oddi wrth y cwricwlwm cenedlaethol a'r gyfundrefn profion, ond dim ond os yw'r penaethiaid ysgol yn profi y gallant sicrhau safonau addysg uchel. Byddai hynny'n golygu gadael iddynt dorri'n rhydd, nid yn unig o reolau a osodir gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ond o'r awdurdodau addysg lleol.

Efallai fod hwn yn gam bach i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw, ond mae'n hollbwysig o hyd y gall rhieni fod yn sicr bod eu plant yn derbyn addysg o safon dda. Nid yw'r gyfundrefn profion yn diflannu, nid yw ond yn newid fel na fydd athrawon yn dysgu ar gyfer y prawf yn unig. Byddant yn dysgu, a bydd y profion yn dangos unrhyw gamgymeriadau a wneir ac unrhyw fethiant i gyrraedd safonau. Mae un peth heb ei benderfynu, Weinidog: rhaid inni sicrhau y bydd y safoni allanol, neu ba bynnag ddull a ddefnyddiwyd i sicrhau nad yw ysgolion yn gwneud cam â'u disgyblion, yn gweithio'n effeithiol. Ar y sail honno, rhoddwn ein cefnogaeth, ond hynny o dan amod. Rhaid inni sicrhau y cyrhaeddir safonau mewn ysgolion ledled Cymru a disgwyliwn ichi ddyfeisio modd, fel y sonnir yn yr adroddiad, i sicrhau y digwydd hynny.

**Peter Black:** Mae bob amser yn eli i'r galon pan newidia llefarydd i'r Ceidwadwyr ei feddwl ar brofion. Yng ngolwg y gefnogaeth gan y Ceidwadwyr i gyflwyno profion, mae'n briodol yn awr i David groesawu'r ffaith bod profion yn cael eu diddymu. Mae Cymru ar y blaen unwaith eto.

**David Davies:** A yw Peter yn credu o ddifrif fod profi'n cael ei ddiddymu neu a yw'n derbyn mai'r cwbl sy'n digwydd yw bod y dull o asesu perfformiad disgyblion yn cael ei

being changed?

**Peter Black:** I am perfectly well aware of what is going on, David, as are you. Certainly, the previous regime was unpopular among teachers, parents and pupils. I went around a large number of schools, and teachers told me over and over again that, strictly in terms of key stage 2 tests, they were teaching towards the test, not teaching pupils the skills that they needed. They thought, and they passed it on to us as Assembly Members and the Government, that the old regime was wrong. It has been changed and due credit must be given to the Government for that, and to the Assembly, once again, for leading the way—Wales is showing England the way forward in terms of the testing regime. Key stage 1 tests have gone, key stage 2 tests are being reformed, and changes are due to come in at key stage 3. I welcome that because it shows that we are setting an agenda that is distinctly Welsh and which will be in the best interests of schoolchildren. I happily support the measures.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I am grateful for Members' contributions. Accepting these regulations will make this a historic day, as there will no longer be old-format key stage 2 tests in Wales. This is a day that all parties have worked towards, and I pay tribute to the members of the previous Education and Lifelong Learning Committee in the first Assembly. This committee was the first to consider assessment issues and, therefore, to contribute towards the establishment of the independent review. I also pay tribute to the members of the current Education and Lifelong Learning Committee for supporting this agenda.

It is important to reaffirm that we looked hard at issues related to teacher burdens in developing this agenda. Two teachers and two headteachers were members of the Daugherty group, therefore it was mindful of teacher burdens in its deliberations. ACCAC's report drew on evidence gathered from questionnaire surveys of schools, interviews of teachers and seminars attended by practitioners. We do not see the proposed

newid?

**Peter Black:** Yr wyf yn gwybod yn iawn beth sy'n digwydd, David, fel yr ydych chi. Yn sicr, yr oedd y gyfundrefn flaenorol yn amhoblogaidd ymysg athrawon, rhieni a disgyblion. Ymwelais â nifer mawr o ysgolion, a dywedodd athrawon wrthyf dro ar ôl tro eu bod, yn achos y profion yng nghyfnod allweddol 2 yn unig, yn dysgu ar gyfer y prawf, ac nid yn dysgu i'r disgyblion y sgiliau yr oedd arnynt eu hangen. Eu barn hwy oedd bod yr hen gyfundrefn yn anghywir, a rhoesant wybod am hynny i ni fel Aelodau'r Cynulliad ac i'r Llywodraeth. Mae wedi'i newid a dylid rhoi clod dyledus i'r Llywodraeth am hynny, ac i'r Cynulliad, unwaith eto, am arwain y ffordd—mae Cymru'n dangos y ffordd ymlaen i Loegr o ran y gyfundrefn profion. Mae profion cyfnod allweddol 1 wedi mynd, mae profion cyfnod allweddol 2 yn cael eu diwygio, ac mae newidiadau i ddod yng nghyfnod allweddol 3. Croesawaf hynny gan ei fod yn dangos ein bod yn gosod agenda Gymreig neilltuol a ddaw â'r budd mwyaf i blant ysgol. Cefnogaf y mesurau'n llawen.

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am gyfraniadau Aelodau. O dderbyn y rheoliadau hyn, bydd heddiw'n ddiwrnod hanesyddol, gan na fydd profion cyfnod allweddol 2 o'r hen fath yng Nghymru rhagor. Mae heddiw'n ddiwrnod y mae'r holl bleidiau wedi gweithio ar ei gyfer, a thalaf deyrnged i aelodau'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes blaenorol yn y Cynulliad cyntaf. Y pwyllgor hwnnw oedd y cyntaf i ystyried materion a oedd yn ymwneud ag asesu gan gyfrannu, drwy hynny, at sefydlu'r adolygiad annibynnol. Talaf deyrnged hefyd i aelodau'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes presennol am gefnogi'r agenda hon.

Mae'n bwysig ailddatgan ein bod wedi ymdrin yn fanwl â materion sy'n ymwneud â'r beichiau sydd ar athrawon wrth ddatblygu'r agenda hon. Yr oedd dau athro a dau bennaeth ysgol yn aelodau o grŵp Daugherty, felly yr oedd yn ymwybodol o'r beichiau ar athrawon yn ystod ei drafodion. Gwnaed defnydd yn adroddiad ACCAC o dystiolaeth a gasglwyd o arolygon mewn ysgolion drwy holiadur, cyfweliadau ag

teacher-assessment moderation arrangements as an additional burden, because they will build on and develop existing good practice and, therefore, provide bespoke opportunities for teachers to hone their assessment skills. During the development phase of the moderation arrangements, we will moderate and evaluate the impact on teachers' workloads and engage with the school workload advisory panel to allow it to evaluate and comment on the impact of the new arrangements while they are still in the pilot stage.

athrawon a seminarau lle'r oedd ymarferwyr yn bresennol. Ni chredwn y bydd y trefniadau arfaethedig ar gyfer safoni asesiadau athrawon yn faich ychwanegol, gan y byddant yn seiliedig ar arferion da a geir eisoes, ac yn eu datblygu a byddant, felly, yn cynnig cyfleoedd pwrpasol i athrawon gael gwella eu sgiliau asesu. Yn ystod cyfnod datblygu'r trefniadau safoni, byddwn yn safoni ac yn gwerthuso'r effaith ar lwythi gwaith athrawon ac yn cynnwys y panel ymgynghorol ar lwyth gwaith ysgolion fel y gall werthuso a gwneud sylwadau am effaith y trefniadau newydd tra ydynt yn y cyfnod rhagbrofol.

On this historic day, I pay tribute to Professor Richard Daugherty and his group. The work of this group and of ACCAC has ensured that, as Peter Black said, Wales is leading the way. We will be able to continue to lead the way with this quality of independent advice.

Ar y diwrnod hanesyddol hwn, talaf deyrnged i'r Athro Richard Daugherty a'i grŵp. Mae'r gwaith a wnaeth y grŵp hwn ac ACCAC wedi sicrhau, fel y dywedodd Peter Black, fod Cymru'n arwain y ffordd. Byddwn yn gallu parhau i arwain y ffordd o gael cyngor annibynnol o'r ansawdd hwn.

*Cynnig (NDM2158): O blaid 56, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2158): For 56, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn

Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2159): O blaid 56, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2159): For 56, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn



Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2160): O blaid 56, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2160): For 56, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn

Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2161): O blaid 57, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2161): For 57, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann

Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.49 p.m.  
 The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.49 p.m.*

### **Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Y Blaid Geidwadol) Minority Party Debate (The Conservative Party)**

#### **Y Gwasanaeth y Tu Allan i Oriau Arferol a Gynigir gan Feddygon Teulu General Practitioner Out-of-Hours Provision**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1, 2 and 3 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2 a 3 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I propose that

**Jonathan Morgan:** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales notes with concern the postcode lottery of the GP out-of-hours provision. (NDM2148)*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn nodi â phryder bod y gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau arferol a gynigir gan feddygon teulu yn loteri cod post. (NDM2148)*

As the Minister will know, as a party, we have been supportive of the new general medical services contract, and, in particular, of allowing general practitioners to opt out of providing out-of-hours cover in the twenty-first century. We think that that is sensible. However, the arrangements that have been put in place so far do not demonstrate uniformity and equity in the service provided. We want to highlight the sporadic and patchy

Fel y gŵyr y Gweinidog, fel plaid, buom yn gefnogol i'r contract newydd ar gyfer gwasanaethau meddygol cyffredinol, ac yn benodol, i'r bwriad i ganiatáu i ymarferwyr cyffredinol gael dewis peidio â chynnig gwasanaethau y tu allan i oriau arferol yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Credwn fod hynny'n beth synhwyrol. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r trefniadau a roddwyd ar waith hyd yma'n cynnig gwasanaeth teg a chyfartal. Yr ydym

nature of GP out-of-hours provision across Wales.

The Liberal Democrat group has tabled three amendments, and I am happy to support all of them. They add quality to our motion.

I did not want to condemn in its entirety the out-of-hours provision that is now on offer in Wales, because we know that, in certain parts, it has been working relatively well. However, it has not been working well in others. To condemn the system outright would have been incorrect, and it would not have been a useful way of conducting this debate.

With the creation of 22 local health boards came an obvious expectation, from the Conservatives at least, that there would be inequality in service provision across a broad range of healthcare services. We see today that, in terms of the provision of an out-of-hours service, as a result of the new GMS contract, there is a struggle to gain any sense of uniformity where patient experience is concerned. In Bridgend, for example, where Primecare has been contracted to provide out-of-hours cover, a mother with a seriously ill daughter was told that the nearest available doctor was in Sheffield. At this juncture, I point to perhaps one of the most high-profile criticisms at the time, levied by one of our own Ministers and a colleague of the Minister for Health and Social Services, who said that, in terms of his experience in his area:

‘It is just not acceptable to be told there are no GPs available at all. That’s not an out-of-hours-service.’

Even if you do not take account of any other patient’s experience, Minister, please listen to the experiences of your own colleagues with regard to the out-of-hours service.

In my own city, Cardiff, the Clinical Solutions Group has faced many criticisms

am dynnu sylw at natur fylchog ac ysbeidiol y gwasanaeth a gynigir gan feddygon teulu y tu allan i oriau arferol ledled Cymru.

Mae grŵp y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wedi cyflwyno tri gwelliant, ac yr wyf yn falch o gefnogi pob un ohonynt. Maent yn gwella ein cynnig.

Nid oeddwn am gollfarnu'r gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau arferol a gynigir yn awr yng Nghymru yn ei gyfanrwydd, gan y gwyddom iddo fod yn gymharol lwyddiannus mewn rhai ardaloedd. Fodd bynnag, ni fu'n llwyddiannus mewn ardaloedd eraill. Anghywir fuasai collfarnu'r system yn llwyr, ac ni fuasai'n ddull buddiol o gynnal y ddadl hon.

Pan grëwyd 22 o fyrddau iechyd lleol, yr oedd disgwyliad pendant, ymysg y Ceidwadwyr o leiaf, y byddai'r gwasanaeth a gynigir mewn amrediad eang o wasanaethau gofal iechyd yn anghyfartal. Gwelwn heddiw, yng nghyd-destun y gwasanaeth a gynigir y tu allan i oriau arferol, o ganlyniad i'r contract newydd ar gyfer gwasanaethau meddygol cyffredinol, ei bod yn anodd canfod unrhyw unffurfwydd o ran y profiad a gaiff y claf. Ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, er enghraifft, lle y gosodwyd y gwaith o ddarparu gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau arferol o dan gontract i Primecare, dywedwyd wrth fam yr oedd ei merch yn ddifrifol wael mai yn Sheffield yr oedd y meddyg agosaf a oedd ar gael. Yn y cyswllt hwn, cyfeiriai at un o'r beirmiadaethau amlycaf a gafwyd ar y pryd, gan un o'ch Gweinidogion eich hun a chyd-Weinidog i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, a ddywedodd, wrth sôn am ei brofiad yn ei ardal:

Cwbl annerbyniol yw cael eich hysbysu nad oes unrhyw feddygon teulu ar gael. Nid gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau arferol yw peth felly.

Hyd yn oed os na chymerwch sylw o brofiad unrhyw glaf arall, Weinidog, gwrandewch ar brofiadau un o'ch cyd-Weinidogion am y gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau arferol, os gwelwch yn dda.

Yn y ddinas lle'r wyf yn byw, Caerdydd, mae'r Clinical Solutions Group wedi wynebu

from senior figures in the medical profession over its provision of out-of-hours services. Glenys Stimpson contacted the Clinical Solutions Group complaining of unbearable pain, but no-one bothered to call her back. An elderly grandmother died in the back of an ambulance after a six-hour wait after calling for an out-of-hours service. A Carmarthenshire pensioner from St Clears, who complained of severe chest pains, was told to travel 40 miles to Neath Port Talbot. In Rhondda Cynon Taf, an 84-year-old lady from Pen-y-graig had to wait two hours for a response. Eventually a doctor called, but he was based in Cleveland in the north-east of England. These examples are incredible, and, if nothing else, they serve to demonstrate the extent of the difficulties that have occurred in the first few months of the out-of-hours service.

We have a hit-and-miss service for out-of-hours treatment. The Minister for Health and Social Services has so far failed in her duty of leadership to ensure that these services operate adequately and smoothly, and, sadly, has allowed a vital component of health-service delivery to fall by the wayside to such an extent that what you can expect from the out-of-hours service will depend on the area in which you live.

One problem has been confusion. Patients and their families simply do not know to whom to turn in the event of illness. Do they try to ring their GP, do they go straight to the accident and emergency department, or do they ring some other health professional? The lack of information has left many patients and their families confused. The Minister needs to take charge to prevent this pot-luck system from continuing in the future. The Government needs to review the current level of provision and the time that it takes for patients to get hold of a GP.

Many local health boards have faced budget deficits and particular financial constraints. We need to know whether the money is

sawl beirniadaeth gan rai amlwg yn y proffesiwn meddygol ynghylch y gwasanaethau y tu allan i oriau arferol a gynigir ganddo. Cysylltodd Glenys Stimpson â'r Clinical Solutions Group gan gwyno am boen annioddefol, ond ni thrafferthodd neb ei galw'n ôl. Bu farw mam-gu oeddrannus yng nghefn ambiwlans ar ôl disgwyl am chwe awr wedi iddi alw am wasanaeth y tu allan i oriau arferol. Dywedwyd wrth bensynwr o Sanclêr yn sir Gaerfyrddin, a oedd yn cwyno am boenau difrifol yn ei frest, am deithio 40 milltir i Gastell-nedd Port Talbot. Yn Rhondda Cynon Taf, bu'n rhaid i fenyw 84 blwydd oed o Ben-y-graig ddisgwyl dwy awr am ateb. Galwodd meddyg yn y diwedd, ond yr oedd yn Cleveland yng ngogledd-ddwyrain Lloegr. Mae'r enghreifftiau hyn yn anhygoel, ac, yn anad un dim arall, maent yn dangos maint yr anawsterau a gafwyd ym misoedd cyntaf y gwasanaeth a gynigir y tu allan i oriau arferol.

Mae'r gwasanaeth ar gyfer triniaeth y tu allan i oriau arferol yn ddi-drefn. Mae'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wedi methu hyd yma o ran ei dyletswydd i arwain er mwyn sicrhau y bydd y gwasanaethau hyn yn ddigonol ac yn rhedeg yn llyfn, a, gwaetha'r modd, mae wedi caniatáu i elfen hollbwysig o'r gwasanaeth iechyd a gynigir syrthio ar fin y ffordd i'r fath raddau fel y bydd yr hyn y gallwch ei ddisgwyl gan y gwasanaeth a gynigir y tu allan i oriau arferol yn amrywio'n ôl yr ardal yr ydych yn byw.

Dryswch yw un o'r problemau a gafwyd. Nid yw cleifion a'u teuluoedd yn gwybod at bwy y dylent droi os ceir salwch. A ddylent geisio ffonio eu meddyg teulu, a ddylent fynd yn syth i'r adran ddamweiniau ac achosion brys, neu a ddylent ffonio rhyw weithiwr iechyd proffesiynol arall? Mae'r diffyg gwybodaeth wedi peri dryswch i lawer o gleifion a'u teuluoedd. Rhaid i'r Gweinidog gymryd yr awenau a sicrhau na fydd y system ddi-drefn hon yn parhau. Rhaid i'r Llywodraeth adolygu lefel y gwasanaeth a gynigir ar hyn o bryd a'r amser a gymer i gleifion gael gafael ar feddyg teulu.

Mae sawl bwrdd iechyd lleol wedi wynebu diffygion yn ei gyllideb a chyfyngiadau ariannol penodol. Rhaid inni gael gwybod a

sufficient and whether health boards are facing particular financial difficulties in providing the services. We also need to know that local health boards can cope in the future. Simply allowing the out-of-hours service to drift along in the wake of the GMS contract is the worst approach possible. Unfortunately, until now, the Minister has chosen that approach. Colleagues in the health profession have suggested expanding the range of professionals who are able to provide out-of-hours cover. Clearly, we may not be able to continue to allow only GPs to provide the service in the future. Professionals also work in social services and in the mental health professions, so why not include their services as part of the out-of-hours cover?

If the Minister does not take firm action soon to correct the inequalities in out-of-hours cover across Wales, there will be more horror stories, for families and patients, and for other Assembly Members' families. There will be more misery for patients who are being forced to travel huge distances or wait for ridiculous lengths of time, and that will lead to more difficult questions for the Minister for Health and Social Services to answer.

**Kirsty Williams:** I propose the following amendments. Amendment 1: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*expresses its concern that members of the public are confused about the differing situations in which they should access out-of-hours services, NHS Direct or accident and emergency services and calls on the Assembly Government to lead a Wales-wide national information campaign to increase user-awareness of the most effective ways of accessing services.*

I propose amendment 2. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

oes digon o arian ganddynt ac a yw byrddau iechyd yn wynebu anawsterau ariannol penodol wrth ddarparu'r gwasanaethau. Rhaid inni gael sicrwydd hefyd y bydd byrddau iechyd lleol yn gallu ymdopi yn y dyfodol. Y peth gwaethaf y gellid ei wneud yw gadael i'r gwasanaeth a gynigir y tu allan i oriau arferol fynd gyda'r llif yn sgîl y contract ar gyfer gwasanaethau meddygol cyffredinol. Gwaetha'r modd, hyd yma, dyna'r dull gweithredu a ddewisodd y Gweinidog. Mae rhai o'm cydnabod yn y proffesiwn iechyd wedi awgrymu y dylid ehangu'r amrediad o weithwyr proffesiynol sy'n gallu cynnig gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau arferol. Mae'n amlwg ei bod yn bosibl na fyddwn yn gallu parhau i adael i neb ond meddygon teulu gynnig y gwasanaeth hwn yn y dyfodol. Ceir gweithwyr proffesiynol hefyd mewn gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ac ym maes iechyd meddwl, felly pam na ellir cynnwys eu gwasanaethau hwy yn y ddarpariaeth a gynigir y tu allan i oriau arferol?

Os na chymer y Gweinidog gamau pendant i gywiro'r anghydraddoldebau yn y gwasanaeth a gynigir y tu allan i oriau arferol ledled Cymru, ceir rhagor o hanesion arswydus, yn achos teuluoedd a chleifion, a theuluoedd Aelodau eraill o'r Cynulliad. Daw mwy o ofid i ran cleifion a orfodir i deithio'n bell iawn neu aros am gyfnodau afresymol o hir, a bydd hynny'n arwain at ofyn am atebion i gwestiynau anos gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol.

**Kirsty Williams:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol. Gwelliant 1: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn mynegi ei bryder nad yw'r cyhoedd yn siwr o dan ba amgylchiadau y dylent gysylltu â'r gwasanaethau y tu allan i oriau, Galw Iechyd Cymru neu'r gwasanaethau damweiniau ac achosion brys ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i arwain ymgyrch wybodaeth genedlaethol ledled Cymru i godi ymwybyddiaeth y defnyddwyr o'r ffyrdd mwyaf effeithiol o gael gafael ar wasanaethau.*

Cynigiaf welliant 2. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*calls on the Minister to ensure that where GP practices opt out of out-of-hours services that local health boards are adequately funded to secure alternative arrangements for Welsh patients.*

I propose amendment 3. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*recognises the need for a holistic approach and that as part of this out-of-hours services should include not just general practitioners but also patient access to a multi-disciplinary team of healthcare professionals.*

I thank Jonathan for his indication that he is willing to support the Welsh Liberal Democrats' amendments. GP out-of-hours services is a hugely challenging agenda. As a society, we have become a little too complacent. We always knew that if we rang a GP outside of surgery hours that he or she had the responsibility to respond and provide care to us. The changes that the new contract has brought have come as a shock to us. In some ways, the new contract offers us an opportunity to provide better services for patients. There can be no doubt that many GPs work incredibly long hours—some are on call all night and they must then go into surgery the following day and do another full day's work. That cannot be in the best interest of patients. However, the benefits that the new system can bring for patients will only be realised if they have access to good quality out-of-hours services and if professionals are available to see to their needs. Patients must also have a way of getting to see those professionals. Transport, particularly in my constituency, is a huge issue when treatment centres are few and far between. Luckily, my local health board has put in place transport provision for individuals who cannot travel to a treatment centre. That is great if you live in Powys, but in the neighbouring constituency there is no provision and people must find their own way to a treatment centre, if they are deemed fit enough to travel. That illustrates the huge postcode lottery that currently exists.

*yn galw ar y Gweinidog i sicrhau, mewn achosion pan fydd practis meddyg teulu yn eithrio o'r gwasanaethau y tu allan i oriau, bod y byrddau iechyd lleol yn cael digon o arian i wneud trefniadau eraill ar gyfer cleifion yng Nghymru.*

Cynigiaf welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn cydnabod bod angen agwedd gyfannol ac, fel rhan o hynny, y dylai'r gwasanaethau y tu allan i oriau gynnwys nid yn unig feddygon teulu ond hefyd gyfle i gleifion gael sylw gan dim amlddisgyblaethol o weithiwr proffesiynol gofal iechyd.*

Diolchaf i Jonathan am nodi ei fod yn barod i gefnogi gwelliannau Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru. Mae gwasanaethau meddygon teulu a gynigir y tu allan i oriau arferol yn agenda ymestynnol dros ben. Fel cymdeithas, aethom ychydig yn rhy ddifater. Gwyddem bob amser os byddem yn ffonio meddyg teulu y tu allan i oriau'r feddygfa fod ganddo gyfrifoldeb i ymateb a rhoi gofal i ni. Mae'r newidiadau a ddaeth yn sgîl y contract newydd wedi rhoi ysgytwad i ni. Ar sawl ystyr, mae'r contract newydd yn cynnig cyfle inni ddarparu gwell gwasanaethau i gleifion. Nid oes amheuaeth nad yw llawer o feddygon teulu'n gweithio oriau anhygoel o hir—mae rhai ar alwad drwy'r nos ac yn gorfod mynd i'r feddygfa drannoeth a gwneud diwrnod llawn o waith eto. Nid yw hynny er y budd gorau i gleifion. Fodd bynnag, ni fydd cleifion ond yn cael mwynhau buddion y system newydd os oes gwasanaethau o ansawdd da ar gael iddynt y tu allan i oriau arferol ac os yw gweithwyr proffesiynol ar gael i ofalu am eu hanghenion. Rhaid i gleifion gael modd hefyd i weld y gweithwyr proffesiynol hynny. Mae trafndiaeth yn fater o bwys aruthrol, yn enwedig yn fy etholaeth i, gan fod y canolfannau triniaeth yn wasgarog iawn. Yn ffodus, mae'r bwrdd iechyd lleol yno yn cynnig cludiant i rai nad ydynt yn gallu teithio i ganolfan driniaeth. Mae hynny'n beth gwych os ydych yn byw ym Mhowys, ond yn yr etholaeth gyfagos nid oes unrhyw ddarpariaeth o'r fath a rhaid i bobl gael modd i fynd i ganolfan driniaeth eu hunain, os bernir eu bod yn ddigon iach i deithio. Mae hynny'n dangos y fath loteri cod post a geir ar hyn o bryd.

It is, unfortunately, typical of the Minister in her column in the *Western Mail* to try to persuade the people of Wales that everything is all right, when, for many, it is not. We cannot simply say that this is the responsibility of local health boards. The Minister is the political leadership of the NHS in Wales, and, once again, she must lead. The first area in which she could lead is to ensure the development of an all-Wales publicity strategy to overcome some of the confusion that patients genuinely feel about the availability of services and when it is appropriate to access them. I have a great deal of difficulty convincing my constituents that, if they are suffering from chest pain, it is appropriate for them to ring 999. Some of them believe that they must ring Shropdoc. If somebody breaks their leg, it is appropriate for them to attend their local accident and emergency department. They do not need an appointment from Shropdoc to go to Morryston Hospital or Singleton Hospital. Patients do not know when it is appropriate to access NHS Direct, what the GP out-of-hours service is capable of providing, when they should go to accident and emergency and when they should call 999. Local health boards cannot work on their own—there should be an all-Wales effort, led by the Minister in the Assembly. We must ensure that the resources that are made available, not just in this financial year, but in subsequent financial years, are sufficient to provide the level of cover that is needed in each community.

5.00 p.m.

Finally, on the Welsh Liberal Democrats' amendment 3, there is a need to ensure that all out-of-hours services work holistically. It is appropriate for an individual to see a GP in many cases, but GPs sometimes see other patients whom they do not need to see, in the absence of any other available professional. General practitioners need access to social services departments to put in place social care packages on an out-of-hours basis.

Mae'n nodweddiadol o'r Gweinidog, gwaetha'r modd, ei bod, yn ei cholofn yn y *Western Mail*, wedi ceisio darbwylllo pobl Cymru bod popeth yn iawn, gan nad ydyw, yn achos llawer o bobl. Ni allwn ddweud mai cyfrifoldeb i fyrddau iechyd lleol yn unig yw hwn. Y Gweinidog yw arweinydd gwleidyddol y GIG yng Nghymru, ac, unwaith eto, rhaid iddi arwain. Y modd cyntaf y gallai arwain yw drwy sicrhau y datblygir strategaeth gyhoeddusrwydd i Gymru gyfan i chwalu rhywfaint o'r dryswch y mae cleifion yn ei deimlo ynghylch y gwasanaethau sydd ar gael a pha bryd y mae'n briodol eu defnyddio. Fe'i caf yn anodd iawn darbwylllo fy etholwyr ei bod yn briodol iddynt ddeialu 999 os ydynt yn dioddef gan boenau yn y frest. Mae rhai ohonynt yn credu bod rhaid iddynt ffonio Shropdoc. Os yw rhywun yn torri ei goes, mae'n briodol iddo fynd i'r adran ddamweiniau ac achosion brys lleol. Nid oes raid iddo gael apwyntiad gan Shropdoc i fynd i Ysbyty Treforys neu Ysbyty Singleton. Ni wŷr cleifion pa bryd y mae'n briodol defnyddio Galw Iechyd Cymru, beth y gall gwasanaeth y meddygon teulu y tu allan i oriau arferol ei gynnig, pa bryd y dylent fynd i adran ddamweiniau ac achosion brys a pha bryd y dylent alw 999. Ni all byrddau iechyd lleol weithio ar eu pennau eu hunain—dylid cael ymgyrch ledled Cymru, o dan arweiniad y Gweinidog yn y Cynulliad. Rhaid inni sicrhau y darperir digon o adnoddau, nid yn unig yn y flwyddyn ariannol hon, ond yn y blynyddoedd ariannol dilynol hefyd, i gynnig y lefel gwasanaeth y mae ei hangen ym mhob cymuned.

Yn olaf, ynghylch gwelliant 3 o eiddo Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, rhaid sicrhau y bydd yr holl wasanaethau a gynnigir y tu allan i oriau arferol yn gweithio'n gyfannol. Mae'n briodol i rywun weld meddyg teulu mewn llawer achos, ond weithiau bydd meddygon teulu'n gweld cleifion eraill heb fod angen hynny, gan nad oes unrhyw weithiwr proffesiynol arall ar gael. Rhaid i ymarferwyr cyffredinol gael cysylltu ag adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol er mwyn gallu trefnu pecynnau gofal cymdeithasol y tu allan i oriau arferol.



Sometimes, GPs can be held up for a long time when dealing with mental health cases, which are difficult and cannot be dealt with in a five or 10-minute appointment. GPs should have access to community psychiatric nurses and the mental health team to ensure that those patients with mental health needs out of hours are adequately addressed. It is insufficient to put in place a system with GPs alone; we need an out-of-hours system that covers the entire range of health and social care professionals.

Without doubt, a change was needed in the contract. The provision of GP services was under threat without it. However, people in Wales need to be confident that, should their children become sick with a temperature on a Sunday in Bridgend, they have a GP to turn to.

**David Melding:** In the delivery of this new and important service, which, in fairness to the Minister and Government, is a much-needed one that responds to a fundamental desire among doctors and other health staff, we are seeing the consequences of having 22 commissioners. The Minister was told what sort of chaos could follow such a procedure. There is now a suspicion that the management of this service has not been as effective as it would have been had there been fewer commissioners and more uniform standards.

However, we should mark the fact that this is an important advance in terms of allowing GPs to contract out of providing out-of-hours services. Otherwise, fewer potential doctors would train and, once trained, those who were in the NHS would possibly retire earlier if they were worn down constantly by excessive out-of-hours working. An over-worked doctor is also unlikely to provide the best and safest service to his or her patients. Therefore, I would give at least one and a half cheers—if you can split a cheer—or perhaps even two cheers to the Minister, were she to respond with some grace and acknowledge people's genuine concerns.

Weithiau, bydd meddygon teulu'n cael eu dal yn hir wrth ddelio ag achosion iechyd meddwl, gan eu bod yn anodd ac am na ellir delio â hwy mewn apwyntiad pump neu 10 munud o hyd. Dylai meddygon teulu feddu ar y gallu i gysylltu â nyrsys seiciatrïg cymunedol a'r tîm iechyd meddwl i sicrhau sylw digonol i gleifion sydd ag anghenion o ran iechyd meddwl y tu allan i oriau arferol. Nid digon yw sefydlu system sy'n cynnwys meddygon teulu'n unig; mae arnom angen system y tu allan i oriau arferol sy'n cynnwys pob math o weithiwr proffesiynol ym maes iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol.

Heb os, yr oedd angen newid y contract. Pe na wneid hynny, byddai'r gwasanaethau a gynigir gan feddygon teulu o dan fygythiad. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i bobl Cymru gael sicrwydd, os bydd eu plant yn mynd yn sâl â gwres mawr arnynt ar ddydd Sul ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, y bydd yno feddyg teulu y gallant droi ato.

**David Melding:** Wrth redeg y gwasanaeth newydd a phwysig hwn, sydd, er tegwch i'r Gweinidog a'r Llywodraeth, yn un y mae mawr angen amdano sy'n ymateb i awydd sylfaenol ymysg meddygon a staff iechyd eraill, gwelwn y canlyniadau o gael 22 o gomisiynwyr. Dywedwyd wrth y Gweinidog am yr anhrefn a allai ddilyn yn sgîl dull gweithredu o'r fath. Ceir amheuaeth yn awr na fu'r rheoli ar y gwasanaeth hwn mor effeithiol ag y buasai pe ceid llai o gomisiynwyr a safonau mwy unffurf.

Er hynny, dylem nodi'r ffaith bod hyn yn gam mawr ymlaen o ran caniatáu i feddygon teulu ddewis peidio â chynnig gwasanaethau y tu allan i oriau arferol. Fel arall, byddai llai o ddarpar feddygon yn cael eu hyfforddi ac, ar ôl eu hyfforddi, mae'n bosibl y byddai'r rhai a oedd yn y GIG yn ymddeol yn gynharach os byddent yn gorweithio'n barhaus drwy wneud gormod o waith y tu allan i oriau arferol. Nid yw'n debygol ychwaith mai meddyg sy'n gorweithio a fyddai'n cynnig y gwasanaeth gorau a mwyaf diogel i'w gleifion. Felly, rhoddwn o leiaf floedd a hanner—os gellir rhannu bloedd—neu efallai hyd yn oed ddwy floedd i'r Gweinidog, pe byddai'n ymateb yn weddol

osgeiddig ac yn cydnabod y pryderon dilys sydd gan bobl.

I agree with Kirsty that a comprehensive information campaign is required. It should focus not only on out-of-hours services, but on a range of NHS services, as well as social care services, because people can become confused and anxious at the point of need, particularly at night, and are not sure what is appropriate. Some are very timid, have an acute need and hold off when they should not. That could have a negative impact on their health. There are also those who are likely to pick up the phone and demand an inappropriate service. Therefore, a good, solid information campaign is important.

Cytunaf â Kirsty fod angen ymgyrch hysbysrwydd gynhwysfawr. Dylai ganolbwyntio nid yn unig ar y gwasanaethau a gynigir y tu allan i oriau arferol, ond ar amryw o wasanaethau'r GIG, yn ogystal â gwasanaethau gofal cymdeithasol, oherwydd gall pobl fynd yn ddryslyd a phryderus ar yr adeg y mae arnynt angen gofal, yn enwedig yn y nos, ac nid ydynt yn sicr beth sy'n briodol. Mae rhai'n ofnus iawn, yn profi angen dybryd ac yn ymatal rhag galw pan na ddylent wneud hynny. Gallai hynny amharu ar eu hiechyd. Ceir rhai hefyd sy'n debygol o godi'r ffôn a mynnu cael gwasanaeth sy'n amhriodol. Felly, mae'n bwysig cael ymgyrch hysbysrwydd dda a thrylwyr.

Given the problems to date, there is a need for effective ongoing review and monitoring. The Minister will be held responsible for the robustness of the system as it settles down. There is concern that the teething problems indicate something more substantial, and that will be the test. We cannot draw that conclusion yet, but there is that danger.

Yng ngolwg y problemau a gafwyd hyd yma, rhaid wrth broses adolygu a monitro effeithiol a pharhaus. Delir y Gweinidog yn gyfrifol am gadernid y system wrth iddi ymsefydlogi. Mae pryder bod y problemau dechreuol yn arwydd o rywbeth mwy sylweddol, a hwnnw fydd y prawf. Ni allwn ddod i'r casgliad hwnnw eto, ond mae perygl o hynny.

There are already a range of providers, and, in principle I welcome that, because different models to deliver a service can lead to greater innovation and a more competitive marketplace, in which services and standards are driven up. However, there is also the danger, for example if the private sector tries to apply for as many contracts as possible, that it may get over-extended and too successful. There may be some evidence of that happening, and perhaps we need to build into the commissioning process something that takes an all-Wales view of what is going on and who is trying to provide what services. Ultimately, we must remember the patient or the parent. I thought that Carwyn Jones's comments were endearing. I am glad that we live in a society in which a Minister expresses such a concern, and I thought that it was an appropriate concern and that it did not in any way undermine what the Minister for Health and Social Services has been doing. It raised a problem that he had at that time, and I am sure that every parent would sympathise with him—I am not a parent

Ceir amryw o ddarparwyr eisoes, ac yr wyf yn croesawu hynny, mewn egwyddor, oherwydd gall gwahanol fodelau ar gyfer darparu gwasanaeth arwain at fwy o arloesi a marchnad fwy cystadleuol, lle y bydd gwasanaethau a safonau'n gwella. Er hynny, mae perygl hefyd, er enghraifft, os yw'r sector preifat yn ymgeisio am gynifer o gontractau ag y bo modd, y gall orymestyn a mynd yn rhy lwyddiannus. Mae'n bosibl bod tystiolaeth sy'n dangos bod hynny'n digwydd, ac efallai y dylem gynnwys rhywbeth yn y broses gomisiynu sy'n ystyried yr hyn sy'n mynd ymlaen ledled Cymru a phwy sy'n ceisio darparu gwasanaethau penodol. Yn y pen draw, rhaid inni gofio'r claf neu'r rhiant. Credais fod sylwadau Carwyn Jones yn ennyn hoffter. Yr wyf yn falch ein bod yn byw mewn cymdeithas lle y mae Gweinidog yn mynegi pryder o'r fath, a chredais ei fod yn bryder dilys ac nad oedd mewn unrhyw fodd yn tanseilio'r hyn a wnaeth y Gweinidog dros lechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Cododd broblem yr oedd yn ei phrofi ar y

myself, so I do not have direct experience. We need to learn the lessons from that, and ensure that we are providing a robust model. We are going in the right direction, but effective review and all-Wales monitoring of this system, even if it continues to be delivered by 22 local health boards, is important. We should not just dismiss the difficulties as teething problems. They may not be systematic problems, but they should still be taken seriously.

**Irene James:** I thank the Tories for raising this debate and giving us all the opportunity to commend the local health boards and the Welsh Assembly Government, which have both been working hard to ensure a smooth transition to deliver a more effective and efficient out-of-hours service for patients in Wales.

The new local health boards are best placed to develop, maintain and improve local standards of service, including out-of-hours services, which, combined with other key developments in the Welsh NHS, bring a one-stop shop to deliver tailored services, acting in the best interests of local patients, a step closer.

**Janet Ryder:** Do you think it is to be congratulated that, in the first few months of this scheme's operation, some people, unfortunately, could be said to have died as a consequence of the lack of treatment that they received? Or do you think that the mistakes, even as early as today with Shropdoc, where no doctors are available to attend, mean that it needs to be reviewed to ensure that it offers the quality of care that people need?

**Irene James:** There are always good examples, as well as bad ones. Every system has teething troubles. The extra investment in out-of-hours services, the overhaul of the GMS contract in Wales, and the huge levels of extra investment in reform in health and social services are vital reforms to raise standards and improve the delivery of healthcare in Wales.

pryd, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai pob rhiant yn cydymdeimlo ag ef—nid wyf yn rhiant fy hun, felly nid oes gennyf brofiad uniongyrchol o hyn. Rhaid inni ddysgu'r gwersi o hynny, a sicrhau ein bod yn cynnig model dibynadwy. Yr ydym yn mynd i'r cyfeiriad iawn, ond mae'n bwysig cynnal adolygiad effeithiol a monitro'r system hon ledled Cymru, hyd yn oed os bydd 22 o fyrddau iechyd lleol yn dal i'w rhedeg. Ni ddylem ddiystyru'r anawsterau a thybio mai problemau dechreuol ydynt. Efallai nad ydynt yn broblemau systematig, ond dylid eu cymryd o ddifrif, er hynny.

**Irene James:** Diolchaf i'r Toriaid am gyflwyno'r ddatl hon a rhoi cyfle i bob un ohonom ganmol y byrddau iechyd lleol a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, sydd ill dau wedi bod yn gweithio'n galed i sicrhau newid llyfn er mwyn cynnig gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau arferol i gleifion yng Nghymru sy'n fwy effeithiol ac effeithlon.

Y byrddau iechyd lleol newydd sydd yn y sefyllfa orau i ddatblygu, cynnal a gwella safonau gwasanaeth lleol, gan gynnwys gwasanaethau y tu allan i oriau arferol, sydd, ynghyd â'r datblygiadau eraill yn y GIG yng Nghymru, yn gam tuag at gynnig siop un stop er mwyn darparu gwasanaethau pwrpasol yn unol â buddiannau cleifion lleol.

**Janet Ryder:** A ydych yn credu mai testun llongyfarch yw bod rhai pobl, gwaetha'r modd, yn ystod y misoedd cyntaf y bu'r cynllun hwn ar waith, y gellid dweud eu bod wedi marw o ganlyniad i ddiffyg triniaeth? Ynteu a gredwch fod angen ei adolygu yng ngolwg y camgymeriadau a gafwyd, fel y rhai a gafwyd yn gynnar heddiw yn achos Shropdoc, lle nad oes unrhyw feddygon ar gael i weld cleifion, er mwyn sicrhau y bydd yn cynnig gofal o'r ansawdd y mae ar bobl ei angen?

**Irene James:** Ceir enghreifftiau da, yn ogystal â rhai gwael, bob amser. Mae pob system yn profi problemau ar y dechrau. Mae'r buddsoddiad ychwanegol mewn gwasanaethau a gynigir y tu allan i oriau arferol, yr ailwampio ar y contract ar gyfer gwasanaethau meddygol cyffredinol yng Nghymru, a'r buddsoddiad ychwanegol anferth ar gyfer diwygio ym maes iechyd a

gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn ddiwygiadau hollbwysig i godi safonau a gwella'r dull o ddarparu gofal iechyd yng Nghymru.

Some of my constituents have already said that there are problems. They have made me aware of concerns about the new system which I have already referred to the local health board. I expect these concerns to be resolved and I ask the Minister for her assurance that she will ensure that the standards of the new service meet patients' expectations of it, although some of these teething problems are to be expected.

Mae rhai o'm hetholwyr wedi dweud eisoes fod problemau. Rhoesant wybod imi am bryderon ynghylch y system newydd yr wyf eisoes wedi'u cyfeirio i'r bwrdd iechyd lleol. Disgwyliaf y ceir ateb i'r pryderon a gofynnaf am sicrwydd gan y Gweinidog y bydd yn sicrhau bod safonau'r gwasanaeth newydd yn cyflawni disgwyliadau cleifion, er bod rhai o'r problemau dechreuol hynny i'w disgwyl.

Labour continues to fund and deliver enhanced health services, taking the first steps to ensure 24-hour access to a member of a primary care team, as set out in our manifesto, bringing together healthcare providers to ensure a tailored service designed to meet the needs of patients. The Tories persist with a policy which will see spending on health drastically cut in Wales, returning the NHS to the cinderella service of a Tory Government. They have not put any constructive new measures in this motion, choosing instead to whinge at a policy agenda which is driving forward change, investment and improvement for people across Wales; a policy agenda that is for the many, and not for the few.

Mae Llafur yn dal i ariannu a chynnig gwell gwasanaeth iechyd, gan gymryd y camau cyntaf i sicrhau y bydd aelod o dîm gofal sylfaenol ar gael ddydd a nos, fel y nodir yn ein maniffesto, gan ddod â darparwyr gofal iechyd at ei gilydd i sicrhau y ceir gwasanaeth pwrpasol i ddiwallu anghenion cleifion. Mae'r Toriaid yn glynu wrth bolisi a fydd yn peri toriadau sylweddol yn y gwariant ar iechyd yng Nghymru, fel y bydd y GIG unwaith eto'n wasanaeth anghofiedig o dan Lywodraeth Doriaidd. Nid ydynt wedi cynnwys unrhyw fesurau newydd adeiladol yn y cynnig hwn, gan ddewis cwyno yn lle hynny am agenda bolisi sy'n hyrwyddo newid, buddsoddiad a gwelliannau i bobl ledled Cymru; agenda bolisi sydd ar gyfer trwch y boblogaeth ac nid yr ychydig rai.

5.10 p.m.

**Lisa Francis:** I brought up the GP out-of-hours cover for the southern Meirionnydd area as the topic of a short debate just over a year ago. You told me then that the new GP contract would enable local health boards to ensure high-quality out-of-hours services for all patients across Wales. However, the GP out-of-hours system that operates in that area now means that patients in Tywyn and Aberdovey must drive 25 miles to see a doctor. That is 25 miles, Minister, when they do not know whether what they are suffering from is indigestion, hiatus hernia, or the beginning of a heart attack. These are not teething problems, and these people are not whingeing—it has been going on since the pilot system started two years ago.

**Lisa Francis:** Codais fater y gwasanaeth a gynigir gan feddygon teulu y tu allan i oriau arferol yn ardal de Meirionnydd yn bwnc mewn dadl fer ychydig dros flwyddyn yn ôl. Dywedasoeh wrthyf bryd hynny y byddai'r contract newydd i feddygon teulu'n galluogi byrddau iechyd lleol i sicrhau gwasanaethau y tu allan i oriau arferol o ansawdd da i bob claf ledled Cymru. Er hynny, mae'r system a gaiff ei rhedeg gan feddygon teulu y tu allan i oriau arferol yn yr ardal honno'n awr yn peri bod cleifion yn Nhywyn ac Aberdyfi yn gorfod mynd 25 milltir yn eu ceir i weld meddyg. Dyna 25 milltir, Weinidog, a hwythau heb wybod a ydynt yn dioddef gan gamdreuliad, gan dorgest fylchog, neu'r hyn a allai droi'n drawiad ar y galon. Nid problemau dechreuol yw'r rhain, ac nid cwyno y mae'r bobl hyn—mae hyn yn

digwydd ers dechrau'r system beilot ddwy flynedd yn ôl.

At a Mid Wales Regional Committee meeting in Aberdovey last February, which discussed out-of hours cover, we heard from the chief executive of Gwynedd Local Health Board that patients need to be travelling towards a local district hospital. However, where is the common sense in referring patients to a local district hospital, and for them to go from Tywyn to Dolgellau, when they could then be referred to Aberystwyth, which is in the opposite direction? Where is the linear development in that? That is not a travelling-towards situation. Not surprisingly, many elderly patients are now being advised by their relatives and loved ones not to shilly-shally and mess about using the telephone triage system, but, if they wake up feeling ill in the night, to dial 999 and get an ambulance. In similar circumstances, what would you advise your family to do?

Mewn cyfarfod o Bwyllgor Rhanbarth y Canolbarth yn Aberdyfi fis Chwefror diwethaf, lle y trafodwyd y gwasanaeth a gynigir y tu allan i oriau arferol, clywsom gan brif weithredwr Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Gwynedd fod rhaid i gleifion deithio tuag at ysbyty dosbarth lleol. Fodd bynnag, pa synnwyr cyffredin sydd mewn atgyfeirio cleifion i ysbyty dosbarth lleol, ac iddynt fynd o Dywyn i Ddolgellau, gan y gallent gael eu hatgyfeirio wedyn i Aberystwyth, sydd yn y cyfeiriad arall? Pa fath o ddatblygu llinol yw hynny? Nid sefyllfa o deithio tuag at rywle yw hynny. Nid yw'n peri syndod bod llawer o gleifion oedrannus yn cael eu cynghori gan eu perthnasau a'u hanwyliaid yn awr i beidio â phetruso ac anwladu ynghylch defnyddio'r system flaenoriaethu dros y teleffon, ond yn hytrach, os byddant yn deffro yn y nos gan deimlo'n sâl, i ddeialu 999 a chael ambiwlans. Mewn amgylchiadau tebyg, beth fyddai'ch cyngor chi i'ch teulu?

Many people in rural mid and west Wales have already started doing this, and Ceredigion Community Health Council wrote to me last week to ask what impact this would have on rural ambulance services. Minister, your Finance Minister informed me two weeks ago that there are thus far no intentions to put more money into the ambulance service in respect of GP out-of-hours cover, but that your policy is, 'let us wait and see what happens'—well, wait and see will be just too damned late for many people.

Mae llawer yng nghanolbarth a gorllewin Cymru wledig wedi dechrau gwneud hynny eisoes, ac ysgrifennodd Cyngor Iechyd Cymuned Ceredigion ataf yr wythnos diwethaf gan ofyn pa effaith a gâi hynny ar wasanaethau ambiwlans gwledig. Weinidog, rhoddodd eich Gweinidog Cyllid wybod imi bythefnos yn ôl nad oes unrhyw fwriad hyd yma i roi mwy o arian tuag at y gwasanaeth ambiwlans mewn cysylltiad â'r gwasanaeth a gynigir gan feddygon teulu y tu allan i oriau arferol, ac mai'ch polisi yw, 'gadewch inni ddisgwyl a gweld beth a ddigwydd'—wel, bydd disgwyl a gweld yn rhy hwyr o lawer i nifer mawr o bobl.

We know that providing a rural out-of-hours service will prove more costly than providing one in urban areas because of the geography. The Welsh ambulance service has seen a 9 per cent increase in emergency calls in the last year, and ambulances are frequently unable to offload patients at hospitals, resulting in further delays. Out-of-hours proposals need to address those issues, and local health boards need to consider the reliability of sending patient information via telecommunications in rural areas, which experience poor radio and mobile phone

Gwyddom mai drutach fydd darparu gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau arferol mewn ardaloedd gwledig nag mewn ardaloedd trefol oherwydd ffactorau daearyddol. Mae gwasanaeth ambiwlans Cymru wedi gweld cynnydd o 9 y cant yn nifer y galwadau brys yn y flwyddyn a aeth heibio, ac yn aml ni fydd ambiwlansiau'n gallu gollwng cleifion mewn ysbytai, fel y ceir oedi pellach. Rhaid ymdrin â'r materion hynny yn y cynigion ar gyfer y gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau arferol, a rhaid i fyrddau iechyd lleol ystyried pa mor ddibynadwy yw anfon gwybodaeth am

reception.

Last May, I told you that I was extremely concerned that your Government had handed over to LHBs complete responsibility for identifying preferred out-of-hours service providers, and that some had not been able to do so. Many of them were not geared up to do that and had not had sufficient time to put your new health policies in position. Now, in November, it seems that they are still playing catch-up. Sadly, it is abundantly clear that, as gaps appear in rural out-of-hours health service provision, the local health boards will carry the can for that, and not your Government. The buck-stops-at-the-top-culture is not Welsh Labour culture.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae'n gwbl annerbyniol bod gwrthblaid wedi gorfod cyflwyno'r ddadl hon. Mae consŷrn cyffredinol ymysg y boblogaeth ynglŷn â'r ddarpariaeth hon o wasanaeth y tu allan i oriau gwaith, ac mae hawl gan bobl Cymru ddisgwyl y byddai Llywodraeth Cymru yn barod i gyflwyno'r ddadl hon ac esbonio'r hyn sy'n digwydd ac yr hyn y mae'n ei wneud am y sefyllfa. Yn lle hynny, unwaith yn rhagor mae'n rhaid i wrthblaid gyflwyno'r ddadl hon.

Yn anffodus, yr ydym unwaith eto yn wynebu'r sefyllfa a godais gyda'r Trefnydd yn gynharach y prynhawn yma—mae gennym Lywodraeth sy'n ceisio osgoi ei chyfrifoldebau. Cyfrifoldeb y Llywodraeth yw esbonio i bobl Cymru pam bod diffygion yn y gwasanaeth hwn. Dywedodd Irene James yn gynharach fod y problemau cychwynnol hyn i'w disgwyl. Os felly, buasech yn disgwyl i Lywodraeth gyfrifol sicrhau bod prosesau ar waith i ymateb iddynt.

Yr oedd Irene James yn awyddus i ddweud bod rhywfaint o arfer da i'w gael, ond byddai dyn yn rhyfeddu pe na bai i'w gael. Er hynny, yng nghanol yr arfer da—ac nid ydym yn condemno'r holl wasanaeth—mae

gleifion drwy delathrebu mewn ardaloedd gwledig, lle y mae'r derbyniad ar gyfer radio a ffonau symudol yn wael.

Fis Mai diwethaf, dywedais wrthyfch fy mod yn dra phryderus am fod eich Llywodraeth wedi rhoi'r holl gyfrifoldeb dros nodi'r darparwyr gwasanaethau y tu allan i oriau arferol a oedd orau ganddynt i'r byrddau iechyd lledol, a bod rhai heb allu gwneud hynny. Yr oedd llawer ohonynt nad oeddent wedi ymgymhwysu i wneud hynny a heb gael digon o amser i roi'ch polisiau iechyd newydd ar waith. Yn awr, ym mis Tachwedd, ymddengys eu bod yn dal i geisio ymgodymu. Gwaetha'r modd, mae'n gwbl amlwg, wrth i fylchau ymddangos yn y gwasanaeth iechyd a gynigir y tu allan i oriau arferol mewn ardaloedd gwledig, mai'r byrddau iechyd lleol a fydd yn cymryd y bai am hynny, ac nid eich Llywodraeth. Nid yw'n rhan o ddiwylliant Llafur Cymru i dderbyn cyfrifoldeb.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** It is totally unacceptable that an opposition party has had to table this debate. There is general concern among the population regarding this provision of out-of-hours service, and the people of Wales have the right to expect the Government of Wales to be willing to table this debate and explain what is happening and what it is doing about the situation. Instead, once again an opposition party has to table this debate.

Unfortunately, we are once again facing the situation that I raised with the Business Minister earlier this afternoon—we have a Government that is trying to avoid its responsibility. It is the Government's responsibility to explain to the people of Wales why there are deficiencies in this service. Irene James said earlier that these teething problems were to be expected. If so, you would expect a responsible Government to ensure that procedures were in place to respond to them.

Irene James was keen to say that there is good practice to be found, but it would be amazing if there were not some good practice. However, in the midst of that good practice—and we do not condemn the service

problemau wedi datblygu. Weinidog, a wnewch dderbyn mai'r broblem sylfaenol yw na fu cyfnod pontio? Wrth symud o'r naill wasanaeth i'r llall, oni ddylai fod cyfnod pontio i sicrhau bod yr holl strwythurau yn eu lle fel y caiff unrhyw broblemau eu canfod a bod ffordd i ymateb iddynt? Yr ydym wedi gweld achosion o bobl mewn oedran sy'n dioddef afiechyd yn cael eu rhoi mewn sefyllfa gwbl annerbyniol. Mae plant ifanc hefyd wedi'u rhoi yn yr un sefyllfa.

Mae pwynt Kirsty Williams yn hollbwysig. Mae'n gwbl annerbyniol nad yw pobl, pan fo rhywun yn mynd yn sâl yn sydyn gartref, yn gwybod â phwy i gysylltu. Os na wnewch ddim byd arall y prynhawn yma, gobeithio y gnewch ymateb yn gadarnhaol i welliant y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ar yr angen am ymgyrch ymwybyddiaeth o'r rhifau y mae'n rhaid i bobl gysylltu â hwy.

Gobeithio, Weinidog, na cheisiwch ddweud wrthym yn eich ymateb fod popeth yn iawn—mae'n amlwg nad yw. Mae gwasanaeth ar gael ymhob ardal, ond mae'n amrywio yn fawr o ardal i ardal, ac mae enghreifftiau o ddarpariaeth hollol annerbyniol. A wnewch gysylltu â'r byrddau iechyd lleol i sicrhau y caiff y problemau hyn eu datrys, neu a ddywedwch wrthym unwaith yn rhagor mai mater i'r byrddau iechyd lleol ydyw? Onid eich cyfrifoldeb, fel Gweinidog, yw sicrhau y caiff y problemau hyn eu datrys? A wnewch hefyd dderbyn, os nad ewch i'r afael â'r problemau hyn, y bydd mwy a mwy o bobl yn mynd yn syth i adrannau damweiniau a brys? Mae hynny'n digwydd yn awr, a deallaf pam. Bydd hynny'n creu problemau enfawr mewn ysbytai, gan effeithio ar eu gallu i gynnal triniaethau, a fydd yn ychwanegu eto at y rhestrau aros.

Weinidog, fe'ch cyfeiriaf at y problemau sy'n parhau mewn ysbytai cymunedol wrth sicrhau goruchwyliaeth gyda'r nos. Cafwyd y broblem honno hyd yn ddiweddar yn Llanymddyfri, yn fy etholaeth, ac mae'n parhau mewn ysbytai cymunedol eraill. Beth ydych yn ei wneud i ddatrys y broblem honno? Yn olaf, dylasech fod wedi rhagweld hyn; cawsoch ddigon o rybuddion. Pam na

in its entirety—problems have developed. Minister, do you accept that the fundamental problem is that there was no transition period? In moving from one service to another, should there not be a transition period to ensure that all the structures are in place and that any problems have been discovered and that there is a means of addressing them? We have seen cases of elderly people suffering from illness being put in completely unacceptable situations. Young children have also been placed in the same situation.

Kirsty Williams's point is crucial. It is completely unacceptable that people do not know who to contact when someone suddenly falls ill at home. If you do nothing else this afternoon, I hope that you will respond positively to the Liberal Democrats' amendment on the need for an awareness campaign to publicise the telephone numbers that people need to contact.

I hope, Minister, that you do not attempt to tell us in your response that everything is just fine—it is obvious that it is not. A service is available in every region, but it varies greatly from region to region, and there are examples of totally unacceptable provision. Will you contact the local health boards to ensure that these problems are solved, or will you tell us yet again that this is a matter for the local health boards? Is it not your responsibility, as the Minister, to ensure that these problems are resolved? Will you also accept that, if you do not tackle these problems, increasing numbers of people will go straight to accident and emergency departments? That happens now, and I understand why. That will create massive problems in hospitals and impact on their ability to provide treatment, which, in turn, will further add to the waiting lists.

Minister, I refer you to the ongoing problems faced by community hospitals in securing night-time supervision. That problem occurred until recently at Llandovery, in my constituency, and it continues in other community hospitals. What are you doing to resolve that problem? Finally, you should have foreseen this; you had sufficient warnings. Why did you not ensure that

wnaethoch sicrhau bod mesurau yn eu lle i ymateb i'r problemau hyn?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Before I call Alun Cairns, I remind Members that I need to call the Minister at 5.22 p.m..

**Alun Cairns:** I want to note, at the outset, how surprised I was, when I learned about this structure some time ago, that such a good socialist administration should choose to privatise the out-of-hours call service in this way. That is what it really amounts to: private companies now run the out-of-hours call service under a policy introduced by a Minister in the Welsh Assembly Government. In fact, it is actually a franchise agreement, and there is no purer form of the privatisation of services than a franchise agreement such as this.

**Janet Davies:** Do you really consider this Government to be a socialist government?

**Alun Cairns:** It would be far from me to say, but I can highlight the inconsistency of its claiming to be a socialist administration and then privatising the health service in such a way.

5.20 p.m.

The problems and difficulties have been well aired: Jonathan Morgan listed a whole range of them. The most notable, because of the credibility of the source, are the problems highlighted by a Minister, and a frontbench spokesman for the Welsh Assembly Government. The headlines in the *Glamorgan Gazette* read 'AM slams GP cover'. Irene James said earlier that there were some teething problems, but, from a credible source, we know that the reality of the teething problems is that an AM slams GP cover.

**David Davies:** I had the same problem with my daughter. Do you not find it surprising that of a total membership of 60, two of us have already had problems with the out-of-hours service? If that is repeated across Wales, it will be a disaster.

measures were in place to respond to these problems?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Cyn imi alw Alun Cairns, yr wyf yn atgoffa Aelodau bod rhaid imi alw'r Gweinidog am 5.22 p.m..

**Alun Cairns:** Dymunaf nodi, ar y dechrau, gymaint o syndod yr oedd i mi, pan gefais wybod am y strwythur hwn beth amser yn ôl, y byddai gweinyddiaeth sosialaidd mor driw yn dewis preifateiddio'r gwasanaeth ar gyfer galwadau y tu allan i oriau arferol fel hyn. Dyna ydyw i bob pwrpas: cwmnïau preifat sydd bellach yn rhedeg y gwasanaeth ar gyfer galwadau y tu allan i oriau arferol o dan bolisi a gyflwynwyd gan Weinidog yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. A dweud y gwir, cytundeb masnachfrait ydyw, ac ni cheir ffurf burach ar breifateiddio gwasanaethau na chytundeb masnachfrait fel hwn.

**Janet Davies:** A ydych yn credu o ddifrif mai llywodraeth sosialaidd yw hon?

**Alun Cairns:** Nid fy lle i yw dweud hynny, ond gallaf dynnu sylw at yr anghysondeb rhwng yr honiad ei bod yn weinyddiaeth sosialaidd ac wedyn preifateiddio'r gwasanaeth iechyd fel hyn.

Mae'r problemau a'r anawsterau wedi'u gwyntyllu'n helaeth: gwnaeth Jonathan Morgan restru nifer mawr ohonynt. Y rhai mwyaf hynod, gan fod y ffynhonnell yn un mor gredadwy, yw'r problemau y tynnwyd sylw atynt gan Weinidog, a llefarydd mainc flaen dros Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Y pennawd yn y *Glamorgan Gazette* oedd 'AM slams GP cover'. Dywedodd Irene James fod rhai problemau dechreuol, ond, yn ôl ffynhonnell gredadwy, gwyddom mai'r gwir am y problemau dechreuol yw bod AC yn collfarnu gwasanaeth gan feddygon teulu.

**David Davies:** Cefais yr un broblem yn achos fy merch i. Onid ydych yn synnu bod dau ohonom, o blith aelodaeth o 60, wedi cael problemau eisoes gyda'r gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau arferol? Os adlewyrchir hynny ledled Cymru, bydd yn drychinebus.



**Alun Cairns:** It merely underlines and adds further credibility to the argument that criticisms can legitimately be made about the level of services provided.

I have no doubt that the Minister will say that these are matters for the local health boards, and that they are nothing to do with her. Whenever there is bad news in the offing, the Minister does not accept any responsibility. As with MRSA, we know that there is some bad news in relation to some hospitals, and the Minister will not accept any responsibility, even in terms of publicising the information.

It was highlighted earlier that there had been some good and bad examples, but the issue here, Minister, is that a bad example can lead to the loss of life. The natural consequence of the complicated structure that you have set up is remote call centres, which can be in Sheffield or anywhere else, and which do not have a local understanding and cannot even pronounce the names. Call centres were developed by banks and insurance companies, and when you were transferred from one department to another, the worst that could possibly happen was that your cheque might bounce. In this instance, Minister, when you are transferred from one department to another, it can mean the difference between life and death.

**Val Lloyd:** Alun, how do you reconcile your negative comments with those made by the BMA, which has recognised the progress to date and said that, in the main, the new systems are working well?

**Alun Cairns:** I am grateful to the Minister for making those comments—sorry, to the Member; she would certainly do a far better job than the Minister who is in place at the moment. My negative comments reflect the negative comments that your frontbencher, the Minister for the Environment, Planning and Countryside, Carwyn Jones, made, which were reported as ‘AM slams GP cover’. That is the foundation of my negative comments; I am pleased that it did not lead to tragic circumstances.

**Alun Cairns:** Nid yw hynny ond yn ategu ac yn cadarnhau bod lle i wneud beirniadaethau dilys am lefel y gwasanaethau a ddarperir.

Nid wyf yn amau na fydd y Gweinidog yn dweud mai materion i'r byrddau iechyd lleol yw'r rhain, ac nad oes a wnelo hi ddim â hwy. Pryd bynnag y ceir newyddion drwg, nid yw'r Gweinidog yn derbyn unrhyw gyfrifoldeb. Yn yr un modd ag MRSA, gwyddom fod newyddion drwg mewn cysylltiad â rhai ysbytai, ac ni wnaiff y Gweinidog dderbyn unrhyw gyfrifoldeb, hyd yn oed o ran rhoi cyhoeddusrwydd i'r wybodaeth.

Tynnwyd sylw'n gynharach at y ffaith bod rhai enghreifftiau da yn ogystal â rhai gwael, ond yr hyn y mae'n bwysig ei nodi yma, Weinidog, yw y gall enghraifft wael arwain at golli einioes. Canlyniad anochel y strwythur cymhleth yr ydych wedi'i sefydlu yw y ceir canolfannau galwadau pell, a all fod yn Sheffield neu yn rhywle arall, nad ydynt yn gwybod am yr ardal leol na hyd yn oed yn gallu ynganu'r enwau. Datblygwyd canolfannau galwadau gan fanciau a chwmnïau yswiriant, a phan gaech eich trosglwyddo o'r naill adran i'r llall, y gwaethaf a allai ddigwydd oedd y gallai'ch siec gael ei gwrthod am ei bod yn ddiwerth. Yn yr achos hwn, Weinidog, pan drosgwyddir chi o'r naill adran i'r llall, gall olygu'r gwahaniaeth rhwng byw a marw.

**Val Lloyd:** Alun, sut y gallwch gysoni'ch sylwadau negyddol â'r rhai a wnaed gan Gymdeithas Feddygol Prydain, a gydnabu'r cynnydd a wnaed hyd yma gan ddweud bod y systemau newydd yn llwyddo, at ei gilydd?

**Alun Cairns:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am wneud y sylwadau hynny—mae'n ddrwg gennyf, yr Aelod; byddai'n sicr o wneud y gwaith yn well o lawer na'r Gweinidog sydd yn y swydd ar hyn o bryd. Mae'r sylwadau negyddol a wneuthum yn adlewyrchu'r sylwadau negyddol a wnaeth eich meinciwr blaen, y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad, Carwyn Jones, a adroddwyd o dan y pennawd ‘AM slams GP cover’. Dyna'r sail i'm sylwadau negyddol; yr wyf yn falch na wnaeth hynny arwain at amgylchiadau trist.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I had hoped that we could have a constructive debate. Unfortunately, the opposition parties have sought not only to undermine, but to frighten people. Let us try to put the record straight.

When I met with the chairs of local health boards and NHS trusts a few weeks ago—

**David Davies:** Will you give way?

**Jane Hutt:** No; I am putting the record straight. When I met the chairs, I received a report on the first few weeks of the new out-of-hours services arrangements, as I should as Minister. We have to remember that, as Minister, I ensured that, for the first time ever in terms of out-of-hours services, we have had standard specifications for the new arrangements that were to be implemented from 1 September. We have never had standard specifications from the Government that relate to what we expect from our out-of-hours services in terms of service responses, patient care and access. That is what I have charged the local health boards to deliver in terms of the new out-of-hours services. I congratulate the local health boards on the work that they have done with their providers, which include many of the GP co-operatives across Wales, as well as other contractors.

**Val Lloyd:** Could we also recognise the excellent service provided by the local health board in Swansea? The GP co-operative has developed a one-number, one-call approach, which has taken over from the plethora that we had previously. It has had a whole month without any complaints. Even our local evening paper, which is not known for being positive on health matters, has said that it has been a seamless service that has moved forward without a glitch.

**Jane Hutt:** That is precisely what we discussed when I met the chairs of the local

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Yr oeddwn wedi gobeithio y caem ddadl adeiladol. Gwaetha'r modd, mae'r gwrthbleidiau wedi ceisio tanseilio hyn, yn ogystal â dychryn pobl. Gadewch inni geisio egluro'r sefyllfa.

Pan gyfarfûm â chadeiryddion byrddau iechyd lleol ac ymddiriedolaethau GIG ychydig wythnosau'n ôl—

**David Davies:** A wnewch ildio?

**Jane Hutt:** Na wna; yr wyf yn egluro'r sefyllfa. Pan gyfarfûm â'r cadeiryddion, cefais adroddiad ar wythnosau cyntaf y trefniadau newydd ar gyfer y gwasanaethau a gynigir y tu allan i oriau arferol, fel y dylwn fel Gweinidog. Dylem gofio fy mod i, fel Gweinidog, wedi sicrhau am y tro cyntaf erioed y caem fanylebau cyffredin ar gyfer gwasanaethau a gynigir y tu allan i oriau arferol o dan y trefniadau newydd a oedd i'w rhoi ar waith o 1 Medi. Ni chawsom erioed fanylebau cyffredin gan y Llywodraeth cyn hyn ar gyfer yr hyn a ddisgwyliwn gan y gwasanaethau a gynigir y tu allan i oriau arferol o ran ymateb y gwasanaeth, gofal am gleifion a mynediad. Yr wyf wedi rhoi'r gofal am hynny i'r byrddau iechyd lleol mewn cysylltiad â'r gwasanaethau newydd a gynigir y tu allan i oriau arferol. Llongyfarchaf y byrddau iechyd lleol ar y gwaith a wnaethant gyda'u darparwyr, sy'n cynnwys llawer o fentrau cydweithredol gan feddygon teulu ledled Cymru, yn ogystal â chontractwyr eraill.

**Val Lloyd:** A allwn hefyd gydnabod y gwasanaeth rhagorol a gynigir gan y bwrdd iechyd lleol yn Abertawe? Mae menter gydweithredol y meddygon teulu wedi dyfeisio dull gweithredu sy'n seiliedig ar un rhif ac un alwad ac mae hwnnw wedi disodli'r nifer mawr a oedd gennym o'r blaen. Ni chafodd unrhyw gwynion yn ystod y mis diwethaf. Mae hyd yn oed ein papur hwyrol lleol, nad yw'n adnabyddus fel un sy'n gadarnhaol ynghylch materion iechyd, wedi dweud ei fod yn wasanaeth di-fwlch sydd wedi symud yn ei flaen yn ddidrafferth.

**Jane Hutt:** Dyna'r union beth a drafodasom pan gyfarfûm â chadeiryddion y byrddau

health boards and trusts. It was about the new opportunities here, as well as the challenges. We knew that a service cannot be changed overnight without there being challenges and difficulties. The issue is how you address those challenges and difficulties and promote the opportunities of this new service.

Therefore, we have moved from having over 30 providers providing different levels of service across Wales, with no standard specifications, to now only having 10 providers. As Val Lloyd said, many of those are the GP co-operatives that have gone forward to provide the new service.

**Christine Chapman:** Do you also welcome the development in Cynon Valley? Until now, we did not have an out-of-hours service; patients had to go to Prince Charles Hospital. Since last month, people have a new unit in Cynon Valley as a result of this new contract.

**Jane Hutt:** That is the issue in terms of improving access to out-of-hours services, and I hope that opposition Members will take the time to find out about those improvements. I visited the call centre in Rhondda Cynon Taf and the new treatment centre in Aberdare Hospital. People had never had access to a primary care treatment centre in Cynon Valley before—in the past, they had to go to Prince Charles Hospital. Now they have a new centre and staff and patients there were welcoming the fact that they now have a service on their doorstep.

**David Davies:** You said that those who raised concerns were scaremongering. Do you think that Carwyn Jones, a Minister of high standing, is scaremongering when he slams the out-of-hours healthcare that is on offer from your department?

**Jane Hutt:** I responded to you when you raised a personal problem, as I respond to anybody, be they Assembly Members, my own constituents or others. If there is an

iechyd lleol a'r ymddiriedolaethau. Trafodwyd y cyfleoedd newydd sy'n codi yn hyn o beth, yn ogystal â'r heriau. Gwyddem na ellir newid gwasanaeth dros nos heb brofi heriau ac anawsterau. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw'r modd yr ymatebir i'r heriau a'r anawsterau hynny gan hyrwyddo'r cyfleoedd a geir yn y gwasanaeth newydd hwn.

Felly, yr ydym wedi newid o fod â mwy na 30 o ddarparwyr yn cynnig gwahanol lefelau gwasanaeth ledled Cymru, heb unrhyw fanylebau cyffredin, fel nad oes gennym bellach ond 10 o ddarparwyr. Fel y dywedodd Val Lloyd, mentrau cydweithredol o eiddo meddygon teulu yw llawer ohonynt sydd wedi mynd ymlaen i gynnig y gwasanaeth newydd.

**Christine Chapman:** A ydych hefyd yn croesawu'r datblygiad yng Nghwm Cynon? Hyd yma, nid oedd gennym wasanaeth y tu allan i oriau arferol; bu'n rhaid i gleifion fynd i Ysbyty'r Tywysog Siarl. Ers y mis diwethaf, ceir uned newydd yng Nghwm Cynon o ganlyniad i'r contract newydd hwn.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae hynny'n berthnasol i wella mynediad i wasanaethau y tu allan i oriau arferol, a gobeithiaf y bydd Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau'n mynd i'r drafferth i ddysgu am y gwelliannau hynny. Ymwelais â'r ganolfan alwadau yn Rhondda Cynon Taf a'r ganolfan driniaeth newydd yn Ysbyty Aberdâr. Nid yw pobl erioed wedi cael canolfan driniaeth gofal sylfaenol at eu galw yng Nghwm Cynon o'r blaen—yn y gorffennol, bu'n rhaid iddynt fynd i Ysbyty'r Tywysog Siarl. Bellach mae ganddynt ganolfan newydd ac yr oedd staff a chleifion yno'n falch bod ganddynt wasanaeth wrth garreg eu drws yn awr.

**David Davies:** Dywedasoch mai codi bwganod yr oedd y rhai a fynegodd bryderon. A ydych yn credu bod Carwyn Jones, ac yntau'n Weinidog mawr ei barch, yn codi bwganod wrth feirniadu'r gofal iechyd a gynigir y tu allan i oriau arferol gan eich adran?

**Jane Hutt:** Ymatebais i chi pan godasoch broblem bersonol, fel yr ymatebaf i unrhyw un, boed hwy'n Aelodau o'r Cynulliad, yn etholwyr i mi neu eraill. Os bydd mater yn

issue, particularly at a time of change, you go through the routes. That is how we will manage this together.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I ask the Members who are standing in the Chamber to please sit down.

**Jane Hutt:** We must ensure that we learn the lessons of the early days. That is what the local health boards are doing, with the contractors, such as Primecare, which are now responsible for providing a service for 850,000 people under the contracts that it has across Wales. It is already providing those services in areas such as Merthyr Tydfil and in other parts of Wales.

We have new opportunities to co-locate out-of-hours provision alongside our accident and emergency departments. We know that that is an important step forward and, therefore, we now have out-of-hours treatment centres alongside the Royal Glamorgan Hospital, the Princess of Wales Hospital, Prince Charles Hospital, the University Hospital of Wales, Withybush Hospital, West Wales General Hospital, Prince Philip Hospital, Bronglais General Hospital and Glan Clwyd District General Hospital. That is a strategic way of providing out-of-hours care. In terms of access to care, it is quite clear from the specifications that we laid down that we must ensure that people have access. I cannot support Kirsty's amendments, but I am happy to clarify the points that she raised. A total of £28 million is going to fund this new service. That is £13 million more than was provided for previous out-of-hours services. That is a step forward for the people of Wales. That funding is provided through the Cahill formula, as is all general medical services funding. Issues relating to rural areas are being considered in terms of out-of-hours local health board allocations.

Amendment 3 refers to opportunities for new professionals to come in. Doctors and nurses are coming in and we have links with the

codi, yn enwedig ar adeg o newid, dilynir y llwybrau arferol. Felly y byddwn yn gofalu am hyn gyda'n gilydd.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Gofynnaf i'r Aelodau sy'n sefyll yn y Siambr eistedd, os gwelwch yn dda.

**Jane Hutt:** Rhaid inni sicrhau y dysgwn y gwersi o'r dyddiau cynnar. Dyna y mae'r byrddau iechyd lleol yn ei wneud, gyda'r contractwyr, fel Primecare, sydd bellach yn gyfrifol am ddarparu gwasanaeth ar gyfer 850,000 o dan y contractau sydd ganddo ledled Cymru. Mae eisoes yn cynnig y gwasanaethau hynny mewn ardaloedd fel Merthyr Tudful a rhannau eraill o Gymru.

Mae gennym gyfleoedd newydd i gydleoli gwasanaethau a gynigir y tu allan i oriau arferol ochr yn ochr â'n hadrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys. Gwyddom fod hynny'n gam pwysig ymlaen ac, felly, yn awr mae gennym ganolfannau triniaeth y tu allan i oriau arferol ochr yn ochr ag Ysbyty Brenhinol Morgannwg, Ysbyty Tywysoges Cymru, Ysbyty'r Tywysog Siarl, Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru, Ysbyty Llwynhelyg, Ysbyty Cyffredinol Gorllewin Cymru, Ysbyty'r Tywysog Philip, Ysbyty Cyffredinol Bronglais ac Ysbyty Dosbarth Cyffredinol Glan Clwyd. Mae hynny'n ddull strategol o gynnig gofal y tu allan i oriau arferol. Gyda golwg ar fynediad i ofal, mae'n gwbl amlwg o'r manylebau yr ydym wedi'u gosod fod rhaid inni sicrhau mynediad i bobl. Ni allaf gefnogi gwelliannau Kirsty, ond yr wyf yn falch o egluro'r pwyntiau a gododd. Rhoddir cyfanswm o £28 miliwn i ariannu'r gwasanaeth newydd hwn. Mae hynny'n £13 miliwn yn fwy nag a ddarparwyd ar gyfer y gwasanaethau blaenorol a gynigir y tu allan i oriau arferol. Mae hynny'n gam ymlaen er mwyn pobl Cymru. Rhoddir y cyllid hwnnw drwy fformiwla Cahill, yn yr un modd â phob cyllid arall ar gyfer gwasanaethau meddygol cyffredinol. Ystyrir materion sy'n ymwneud ag ardaloedd gwledig yng nghyd-destun y dyraniadau i fyrddau iechyd lleol ar gyfer gwasanaethau a gynigir y tu allan i oriau arferol.

Mae gwelliant 3 yn cyfeirio at roi cyfleoedd i weithwyr proffesiynol newydd gymryd rhan. Mae meddygon a nyrsys yn cymryd rhan ac

ambulance service. In Cardiff, services are linking up with social services. This is the start of an extended out-of-hours service. Let us walk before we run. We are looking to a wider strategy in relation to establishing links, particularly with social services. However, let us get our out-of-hours healthcare services right first, which is what we are aiming to do.

On the issues that were raised regarding publicity, our local health boards have produced leaflets, which many of you will have seen. There has also been publicity on local radio stations. We are addressing this as a national exercise as well as a local imperative. Most people will not find any difference in their service because they will continue to call their GP practice, which will direct them to the out-of-hours trained call handlers. That will allow the most urgent cases to be dealt with first. Patients will then be given the support and the advice that they want. That may involve visiting a treatment centre or receiving advice over the telephone by a doctor or a nurse. As I found out last night when visiting the services provided in Rhondda Cynon Taf, where patient transport is needed, it is provided. People carriers are available at treatment centres.

5.30 p.m.

**Kirsty Williams:** You would do well to reconsider your attitude towards our amendment 1. The Welsh Liberal Democrats have not plucked this matter out of thin air for something to say today: it results from what professionals say that their patients need. People need clarification, reassurance and advice on what to do, and on what service to access. This is the advice of doctors up and down Wales; it does not only come from these benches. This is what professionals feel that their patients need and you are ignoring that.

mae gennym gysylltiadau â'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Yng Nghaerdydd, mae gwasanaethau'n cysylltu â gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Dyma ddechrau gwasanaeth estynedig y tu allan i oriau arferol. Rhaid cropian cyn cerdded. Yr ydym yn ystyried strategaeth fwy cyffredinol i greu cysylltiadau, yn enwedig gyda gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Fodd bynnag, gadewch inni roi ein gwasanaethau gofal iechyd y tu allan i oriau arferol ar waith yn iawn yn gyntaf, fel yr ydym yn ceisio ei wneud.

Ynghylch y materion a godwyd o ran cyhoeddusrwydd, mae ein byrddau iechyd lleol wedi cynhyrchu taflenni, y bydd llawer ohonoch wedi'u gweld. Cafwyd cyhoeddusrwydd hefyd ar orsafoedd radio lleol. Yr ydym yn ymdrin â hyn fel ymarferiad cenedlaethol yn ogystal ag fel angen lleol. Ni fydd y rhan fwyaf o bobl yn gweld unrhyw wahaniaeth yn eu gwasanaeth gan y byddant yn dal i alw practis eu meddyg teulu, a fydd yn eu cyfeirio i'r rhai sydd wedi'u hyfforddi i drafod galwadau a wneir y tu allan i oriau arferol. Bydd hynny'n cynnig modd i drafod yr achosion mwyaf brys yn gyntaf. Bydd cleifion wedyn yn cael y cymorth a'r cyngor y mae arnynt eu hangen. Gallai hynny olygu mynd i ganolfan driniaeth neu gael cyngor dros y teleffon gan feddyg neu nyrs. Fel y cefais wybod neithiwr wrth ymweld â'r gwasanaethau a gynigir yn Rhondda Cynon Taf, os oes angen cludiant ar gyfer cleifion, fe'i darperir. Mae ceir mawr ar gael mewn canolfannau triniaeth.

**Kirsty Williams:** Byddai'n beth doeth ichi ailystyried eich agwedd at welliant 1 o'n heiddo. Nid yw Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru wedi codi'r mater hwn dim ond i gael rhywbeth i sôn amdano heddiw: mae'n ganlyniad i'r hyn a ddywed gweithwyr proffesiynol am anghenion eu cleifion. Mae ar bobl angen eglurhad, tawelwch meddwl a chyngor ynghylch yr hyn i'w wneud, a pha wasanaeth i'w ddefnyddio. Dyma'r cyngor a geir gan feddygon ar hyd a lled Cymru; nid o'r meinciau hyn yn unig y daw. Dyna y mae gweithwyr proffesiynol yn teimlo y mae ar eu cleifion ei angen ac yr ydych yn anwybyddu hynny.

**Jane Hutt:** I have already said that we plan to reinforce the local information that is provided by local health boards. It is essential that members of the public understand when to contact the ambulance service, the GP out-of-hours service, and when it would be more appropriate to contact NHS Direct. We are backing local information with national information. You also have a responsibility, as does the media, in terms of promoting, understanding and steering people to the information. Community health councils, which you all backed, are playing their role as independent voices for patients by visiting primary care centres, such as the centre that I went to last night at Aberdare Hospital. They are being responsible and ensuring that people have the information that they need. I must assure people that complaints and issues related to this change of service are being addressed directly. Where there are issues and particular pressure points, my officials are meeting the local health boards and contractors, which may include a GP provider or another contractor. Let us move forward positively in terms of development.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You must wind up now.

**Jane Hutt:** There has been an increase in the rate of calls across the board, in terms of the out-of-hours service. Be positive. Over and above the political noise that you have heard, I hope that I have given you the facts about the new service that is provided by dedicated people. Doctors, nurses, and those at the sharp end who work all night, all weekend, and on bank holidays are delivering real opportunities for improved access to out-of-hours services for the people of Wales. I hope that people will take that forward constructively.

**Nick Bourne:** Let us be clear, Minister: if this had been the great success that you are painting, your party would not have refused us a debate on this issue last week. The Minister is in denial, an unfortunate characteristic that she has in common with the First Minister—there is no problem with

**Jane Hutt:** Yr wyf eisoes wedi dweud ein bod yn bwriadu ategu'r wybodaeth a roddir yn lleol gan fyrddau iechyd lleol. Mae'n hollbwysig y bydd aelodau'r cyhoedd yn deall pa bryd y dylent gysylltu â'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans, y gwasanaeth a gynigir gan feddygon teulu y tu allan i oriau, a pha bryd y byddai'n fwy priodol cysylltu â Galw Iechyd Cymru. Yr ydym yn ategu gwybodaeth leol drwy gynnig gwybodaeth yn genedlaethol. Mae cyfrifoldeb gennych chi hefyd, a'r cyfryngau yr un modd, o ran meithrin dealltwriaeth a chyfeirio pobl at y wybodaeth. Mae cynghorau iechyd cymuned, y gwnaethoch oll eu cefnogi, yn chwarae eu rhan fel llais annibynnol dros gleifion drwy ymweld â chanolfannau gofal sylfaenol, fel y ganolfan yr ymwelais â hi neithiwr yn Ysbyty Aberdâr. Maent yn ymddwyn yn gyfrifol ac yn sicrhau y caiff pobl y wybodaeth y mae arnynt ei hangen. Rhaid imi sicrhau pobl yr ymdrinnir ar unwaith â chwynion a materion sy'n codi mewn cysylltiad â'r newid hwn i'r gwasanaeth. Os yw materion yn codi ac os ceir pwysau mewn man penodol, bydd fy swyddogion yn cwrdd â'r byrddau iechyd lleol a'r contractwyr, a allai gynnwys darparwyr o feddygon teulu neu gontractwr arall. Gadewch inni symud ymlaen yn gadarnhaol i ddatblygu hyn.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Rhaid ichi derfynu'n awr.

**Jane Hutt:** Bu cynnydd cyffredinol yn nifer y galwadau i'r gwasanaeth a gynigir y tu allan i oriau arferol. Byddwch yn gadarnhaol. Drwy'r twrw gwleidyddol a glywsoch, gobeithiaf fy mod wedi rhoi'r ffeithiau i chi am y gwasanaeth newydd a gynigir gan bobl ymroddedig. Mae meddygon, nyrsys, a'r rhai yn y rheng flaen sy'n gweithio drwy'r nos, drwy'r penwythnos, ac ar ylliau banc yn cynnig cyfleoedd i gael gwell mynediad i wasanaethau y tu allan i oriau arferol i bobl Cymru. Gobeithiaf y bydd pobl yn trafod hynny'n gadarnhaol.

**Nick Bourne:** Gadewch inni ddeall hyn, Weinidog: os oedd hyn yn llwyddiant mawr fel yr ydych yn honni, ni fyddai'ch plaid wedi gwrthod dadl i ni ar y pwnc hwn yr wythnos diwethaf. Mae'r Gweinidog yn gwrthod wynebu'r gwir, ac mae hynny'n nodwedd anffodus y mae'n ei rhannu gyda'r

the waiting lists, MRSA, or with the out-of-hours service. On the front bench of this side of the Chamber we were all wondering who would be the sorcerer's apprentice, sent in to defend the indefensible, today. Would it be Jeff Cuthbert, Leighton Andrews, or Carl Sargeant? No, poor Irene was sent in today to bat, with an absolutely impossible task. To be fair, she made a fairly good hand of it, considering the difficulty of defending this situation.

Minister, it has been a balanced debate—the out-of-hours service is a serious issue. It has been made clear by speakers from all opposition parties that we support the new contract, but it behoves you to recognise that there is a problem and to respond constructively. It is not a new problem; it has existed for some time. Concerns have been raised before about responsibility for the out-of-hours service, which has now shifted from doctors' surgeries to the local health boards. Doctors feared that more patients would be sent to accident and emergency departments and that they could potentially receive poor quality care. The warnings were there and you, the Minister, not us as Members, should have ensured that there were safeguards so that patients were not put at risk. A lead should have been given by you, not by Assembly Members. Now that the new system is in place, the evidence clearly shows that GP out-of-hours provision is patchy. There are areas, as Jonathan Morgan and David Melding said, where the system is working reasonably well, but also areas where the service is, frankly, second rate. It is to that that you should have responded. The Assembly Government simply refuses to acknowledge that there is a problem—perhaps I should correct myself and say, the Assembly Government barring one Minister.

The Minister for Health and Social Services says that she is optimistic that the out-of-hours service will be robust, that there are teething problems, but the system is basically well prepared and well managed. However, it does not look like that to many patients throughout Wales. For example, the system is

Prif Weinidog—nid oes unrhw broblem ynghylch y rhestrau aros, MRSA, neu'r gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau arferol. Ar y fainc flaen ar yr ochr hon i'r Siambr yr oeddem oll yn meddwl pwy tybed a fyddai'n brentis i'r dewin, a anfonid heddiw i gyfiawnhau'r hyn na ellir ei gyfiawnhau. Ai Jeff Cuthbert fyddai, neu Leighton Andrews, neu Carl Sargeant? Nace, Irene druan a anfonwyd heddiw i gyflawni tasg gwbl amhosibl. A bod yn deg, cafodd hwyl eithaf da arni, o ystyried mor anodd yw cyfiawnhau'r sefyllfa hon.

Weinidog, bu hon yn ddadl gytbwys—mae'r gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau arferol yn fater difrifol. Mae siaradwyr o bob un o'r gwrthbleidiau wedi egluro ein bod yn cefnogi'r contract newydd, ond rhaid ichi gydnabod bod problem ac ymateb yn gadarnhaol i hynny. Nid problem newydd ydyw; mae'n bod ers cryn amser. Mynegwyd pryderon o'r blaen am y cyfrifoldeb dros y gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau arferol, sydd bellach wedi symud o feddygfeydd i'r byrddau iechyd lleol. Yr oedd meddygon yn ofni yr anfonid mwy o gleifion i adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys ac y gallent gael gofal o ansawdd gwael. Cafwyd rhybuddion a chi, y Gweinidog, nid ni fel Aelodau, a ddylai fod wedi gofalu na fyddai cleifion mewn perygl. Chi a ddylasai roi arweiniad, nid Aelodau'r Cynulliad. A'r system newydd bellach ar waith, mae'r dystiolaeth yn dangos yn glir fod bylchau yn y gwasanaeth a gynigir gan feddygon teulu y tu allan i oriau arferol. Ceir ardaloedd, fel y dywedodd Jonathan Morgan a David Melding, lle y mae'r system yn gweithio'n eithaf da, ond ceir ardaloedd hefyd lle y mae'r gwasanaeth yn eilradd, a siarad yn blwmp ac yn blaen. I hynny y dylech fod wedi ymateb. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwrthod derbyn bod problem—efallai y dylwn fy nghywiro fy hun a dweud, Llywodraeth y Cynulliad heblaw un Gweinidog.

Dywed y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ei bod yn obeithiol y bydd y gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau arferol yn gadarn, bod problemau dechreuol, ond bod y system wedi'i pharatoi a'i rheoli'n dda yn y bôn. Fodd bynnag, nid felly y mae'n ymddangos i lawer o gleifion

not working effectively in Bridgend, Cardiff, Carmarthenshire, Gwent, Neath Port Talbot, Rhondda Cynon Taf and Gwynedd, and we can give you strings of complaints from these areas. Therefore, please do not tell us that we have a responsibility not to make complaints, Minister. You have a responsibility to respond positively and to put in place a system that will not fail the patients of Wales. This is why we brought forward this debate. You resisted having the debate, Minister, because you know that this is a serious issue, and it is about time that you responded to it.

ledled Cymru. Er enghraifft, nid yw'r system yn gweithio'n effeithiol ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, Caerdydd, sir Gaerfyrddin, Gwent, Castell-nedd Port Talbot, Rhondda Cynon Taf a Gwynedd, a gallwn roi gwybod ichi am gwynion lu o'r ardaloedd hynny. Felly, Weinidog, peidiwch â dweud wrthym bod gennym gyfrifoldeb i beidio â gwneud cwynion, os gwelwch yn dda. Mae gennych chi gyfrifoldeb i ymateb yn gadarnhaol a sefydlu system na wnaiff gam â chleifion Cymru. Dyna pam y gwnaethom ddwyn y ddadl hon gerbron. Gwnaethoch wrthwynebu cael dadl, Weinidog, gan y gwyddoch mai mater difrifol yw hwn, ac mae'n hen bryd ichi ymateb iddo.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 1: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 2: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:



The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
 Amendment 3: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri

Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM2148): O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Motion (NDM2148): For 26, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Hart, Edwina  
Davies, Andrew  
Sinclair, Karen  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Davidson, Jane  
Jones, Carwyn  
Essex, Sue  
Hutt, Jane  
Law, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Gregory, Janice  
Gwyther, Christine  
Jones, Ann  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Lewis, Huw  
James, Irene  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Lloyd, Val  
Andrews, Leighton  
Sargeant, Carl  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Chapman, Christine  
Mewies, Sandy  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.  
Motion defeated.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings today's proceedings to a close. **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.37 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 5.37 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau  
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)

Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Law, Peter (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Marek, John (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)