



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mawrth, 2 Tachwedd 2004**

**Tuesday, 2 November 2004**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 3 Ethol i'r Pwyllgor Deddfau  
Election to the Legislation Committee
- 4 Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog  
Questions to the First Minister
- 29 Cwestiwn Brys: Llifogydd  
Urgent Question: Floods
- 33 Datganiad Busnes  
Business Statement
- 37 Pwynt o Drefn  
Point of Order
- 38 Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion  
Composite Motion: Approval of Orders
- 40 Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau Deddf yr Asiantaeth Diogelu Iechyd 2004 i'r Prif Weinidog  
Delegation of Functions of the Health Protection Agency Act 2004 to the First Minister
- 48 Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau Rhan 8 Deddf Ymddygiad Gwrthgymdeithasol 2003  
i'r Prif Weinidog  
Delegation of Functions of Part 8 of the Anti-social Behaviour Act 2003  
to the First Minister
- 53 Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau Deddf Addysg Uwch 2004 i'r Prif Weinidog  
Delegation of Functions of the Higher Education Act 2004 to the First Minister
- 89 Pwyntiau o Drefn  
Points of Order
- 89 Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru): Y Bwlch Cyfoeth  
Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru): The Prosperity Gap

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

**Ethol i'r Pwyllgor Deddfau  
Election to the Legislation Committee**

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I **Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Cynigiau fod  
propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Orders Nos. 8.3 and 11.1, elects Janet Ryder (Plaid Cymru) to its Legislation Committee in place of Elin Jones (Plaid Cymru).(NDM2136)* *Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn unol â Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 8.3 ac 11.1 yn ethol Janet Ryder (Plaid Cymru) i'w Bwyllgor Deddfau yn lle Elin Jones (Plaid Cymru).(NDM2136)*

*Cynnig (NDM2136): O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2136): For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine

Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

## **Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister**

### **Archif Genedlaethol i Gymru A National Archive for Wales**

**C1 Owen John Thomas:** Pa gamau y mae'r Llywodraeth yn eu cymryd i sefydlu archif genedlaethol ar gyfer Cymru? (OAQ38786)

**Q1 Owen John Thomas:** What steps is the Government taking to set up a national archive for Wales? (OAQ38786)

**Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan):** Nid ydym yn cymryd unrhyw gamau penodol i sefydlu swyddfa cofnodion cyhoeddus dros Gymru. Mae fy swyddogion yn cydweithio'n agos gyda'r Archif Genedlaethol yn Kew ar gynigion i lunio'r ddeddfwriaeth newydd ar archifau a chofnodion cenedlaethol. Mae'r gwaith hwn megis dechrau, yn dilyn cyfnod o ymgynghori.

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** We are not taking any specific steps to set up a public records office for Wales. My officials are working closely with the National Archives at Kew on proposals for new legislation on national records and archives. These proposals are still in the early stages of development following a period of consultation.

**Owen John Thomas:** Ar hyn o bryd, mae llawer o gofnodion Cymru yn Llundain, yn yr hyn a elwir yn 'archif genedlaethol'—Cymru a Lloegr, felly—ond mae'r Amgueddfa ac Oriol Genedlaethol yng Nghaerdydd a Llyfrgell Genedlaethol Cymru yn Aberystwyth yn cynnal arddangosfeydd sydd yn defnyddio ein harchifau i addysgu'r bobl a helpu gyda'r cwricwlwm yn yr ysgolion. Oni fyddai'n llawer gwell i'r cofnodion a'r archifau yn Llundain sydd yn perthyn i Gymru gael eu dychwelyd i Gymru mor fuan ag sydd yn bosibl? Mae'n rhaid cofio hefyd bod 500 o bobl mewn swyddi da yn Llundain ac yn ennill arian da. Gan ein bod yn edrych ar ddod â mwy o bwerau i'r Cynulliad drwy ymgorffori mwy o gyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad, onid oes cyfle i chi fynd ati i drefnu bod hyn yn digwydd yn fuan?

**Owen John Thomas:** At present, many of Wales's records are held in London, in what is called a 'national archive'—England and Wales, therefore—but the National Museum and Gallery in Cardiff and the National Library of Wales in Aberystwyth hold exhibitions that use our archives to educate people and to assist with the curriculum in schools. Would it not be much better for the records and archives in London that relate to Wales to be returned to Wales as soon as possible? It must also be borne in mind that in London there are 500 people in good jobs and earning good wages. Since we are looking to enhance the Assembly's powers by incorporating more Assembly sponsored public bodies, is this not an opportunity for you to make this happen in the near future?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r gwaith hwn yn cael ei wneud drosom gan Kew yn rhad ac am ddim, felly efallai y dylai Owen John Thomas egluro i'r Cynulliad beth y byddai'n ei dorri o'r gyllideb diwylliant pe baem yn gorfod gwneud y gwaith hwn. Byddai'r gost rywle rhwng y £4 miliwn y flwyddyn y mae'n ei gostio yng Ngogledd Iwerddon i wneud y

**The First Minister:** This work is done on our behalf by Kew free of charge, so perhaps Owen John Thomas should explain to the Assembly what he would cut from the culture budget if we had to do this work. The cost would be somewhere between the £4 million a year that this work costs in Northern Ireland and the £7 million that it costs Scotland.

gwaith a'r £7 miliwn y flwyddyn y mae'n ei gostio i'r Alban.

**Lisa Francis:** Is that why your Government will not consider establishing a national public records office within the national library at Aberystwyth? Have you never considered that possibility?

**Lisa Francis:** Ai hynny yw'r rheswm pam na wnaiff eich Llywodraeth ystyried sefydlu archifdy gwladol oddi mewn i'r llyfrgell genedlaethol yn Aberystwyth? Onid ydych erioed wedi ystyried y posibilrwydd hwnnw?

**The First Minister:** As I mentioned, the cost of the present public records office for Northern Ireland is £4 million a year, and the cost of that for Scotland is £7 million a year. The service provided free of charge to us by Kew is an extremely good one, and at the moment there is no prospect of our being able to find the between £4 million and £7 million that it would cost us to run the service separately for Wales. Perhaps you would also like to explain, if you commend this course of action and it is to appear in the Conservative manifesto, what you would cut from the budget? It would cost us around £5 million or £6 million for a service that we now receive free of charge.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Fel y dywedais, cost yr archifdy gwladol presennol ar gyfer Gogledd Iwerddon yw £4 miliwn y flwyddyn, a chost yr un ar gyfer yr Alban yw £7 miliwn y flwyddyn. Mae'r gwasanaeth a ddarperir yn rhad ac am ddim i ni gan Kew yn un da dros ben, ac ar hyn o bryd nid oes golwg y byddwn yn gallu dod o hyd i'r swm o rhwng £4 miliwn a £7 miliwn a gostiai inni redeg y gwasanaeth ar wahân i Gymru. Efallai y carech chithau egluro, os ydych yn cymeradwyo'r dull gweithredu hwn ac os bydd ym maniffesto'r Ceidwadwyr, pa beth a dorrech o'r gyllideb? Costiai tua £5 miliwn neu £6 miliwn i ni am wasanaeth yr ydym yn ei gael yn rhad ac am ddim ar hyn o bryd.

### **Tai Fforddiadwy Affordable Housing**

**Q2 Glyn Davies:** What action is the Government taking to promote affordable housing in Wales? (OAQ38769)

**C2 Glyn Davies:** Pa gamau y mae'r Llywodraeth yn eu cymryd i hyrwyddo tai fforddiadwy yng Nghymru? (OAQ38769)

**The First Minister:** Our budget proposals indicate a progressive increase in funding for the social housing grant from £59.4 million in the present financial year to £96.4 million in 2007-08. That is an increase of over 62 per cent on the current level of funding.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae ein cynigion ar gyfer y gyllideb yn dangos y ceir cynnydd graddol yn yr arian ar gyfer y grant tai cymdeithasol o £59.4 miliwn yn y flwyddyn ariannol bresennol i £96.4 miliwn yn 2007-08. Mae hynny'n gynydd o fwy na 62 y cant ar y lefel ariannu bresennol.

**Glyn Davies:** I will raise another point. In Powys, and possibly in other places, when planning permission is granted for small housing estates, the council demands, as a condition, that more than £1,000 per house is given to the education authority or towards community facilities. Since the market sets the price of 65 per cent of the housing that can be sold on the open market, this burden falls on the 35 per cent now classed as affordable housing. It is a straightforward stealth tax on affordable housing in the small communities of Powys. Do you think that that is reasonable? Do you condone it?

**Glyn Davies:** Codaf bwynt arall. Ym Mhowys, ac mewn mannau eraill o bosibl, pan roddir caniatâd cynllunio ar gyfer ystadau bach o dai, mae'r cyngor yn mynnu, fel amod, y rhoddir mwy na £1,000 y tŷ i'r awdurdod addysg neu tuag at gyfleusterau cymunedol. Gan mai'r farchnad sy'n pennu'r pris o 65 y cant o'r tai y gellir eu gwerthu ar y farchnad agored, mae'r baich hwn yn dod i ran y 35 y cant a ddynodir yn awr yn dai fforddiadwy. Nid yw'n ddim amgen na threth lechwraidd ar dai fforddiadwy mewn cymunedau bach ym Mhowys. A ydych yn credu bod hynny'n rhesymol? A ydych yn ei

esgusodi?

**The First Minister:** I am not aware of this provision and whether or not it is unique to Powys. I do not know if it happens elsewhere, and whether it is related to any measures, guidance or regulations that we have introduced. That was not in the preamble to your question; perhaps you would write to me with more details of what is happening in Powys, so that we know what has caused this problem. I will not be able to answer until I know whether Powys is doing this because it is being told to do so, or whether it is doing it off its own bat.

**Mick Bates:** The lack of affordable rental properties is also a massive problem in Powys. Recently, 90 per cent of the county council's lets were for homeless people, thereby reducing the availability of affordable rental properties. What is your Government doing to ensure that sufficient affordable rental properties are available while also solving the homelessness problem?

**The First Minister:** As I said in my reply to Glyn Davies, I do not believe that you could expect us to do much more than put a 62 per cent social housing grant increase in the budget proposals currently before the Assembly. It will increase from £59 million this year to £96 million in six years' time, so you can see that there is plenty of leeway there for local authorities to make provision. It is up to local authorities what they do in terms of distributing that social housing grant for schemes such as homebuy or shared equity purchase. You will be aware that we have increased the shared equity limits in rural areas from 30 to 50 per cent, which is a major change to provide assistance. However, we still do not get local authorities spending a large amount of money from their social housing grant on homebuy, largely because they are doing what you recommend, which is to concentrate on the rental sector and registered social landlords, housing associations and so on. We would want to see a balance between what they do in terms of shared equity assisted purchase and the rental sector.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni wn am y ddarpariaeth hon ac a yw'n unigryw i Bowys ai peidio. Ni wn a yw'n digwydd mewn mannau eraill, ac a yw'n gysylltiedig ag unrhyw fesurau, canllawiau neu reoliadau a gyflwynwyd gennym ni. Nid oedd sôn am hynny yn y rhagymadrodd i'ch cwestiwn; efallai yr ysgrifennwch ataf gan roi mwy o fanylion i mi am yr hyn sy'n digwydd ym Mhowys, fel y cawn wybod beth a achosodd y broblem hon. Ni fyddaf yn gallu ateb hyd nes y caf wybod a yw Powys yn gwneud hyn am ei fod yn cael ei gyfarwyddo i wneud felly, neu a yw'n ei wneud ar ei fenter ei hun.

**Mick Bates:** Mae prinder tai fforddiadwy i'w rhentu'n broblem aruthrol ym Mhowys hefyd. Mae 90 y cant o dai'r cyngor sir a osodwyd yn ddiweddar wedi'u dyrannu i bobl ddigartref, fel bod llai o dai fforddiadwy ar gael i'w rhentu. Beth y mae'ch Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod digon o dai fforddiadwy ar gael i'w rhentu gan ddatrys problem digartrefedd hefyd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Fel y dywedais yn fy ateb i Glyn Davies, ni chredaf y gallech ddisgwyl inni wneud llawer mwy na chynnwys cynnydd o 62 y cant ar gyfer y grant tai cymdeithasol yn y cynigion ar gyfer y gyllideb sydd gerbron y Cynulliad ar hyn o bryd. Bydd yn codi o £59 miliwn eleni i £96 miliwn ymhén chwe blynedd, felly gallwch weld bod digon o gyfle i awdurdodau lleol gael gwneud darpariaeth. Mater i awdurdodau lleol yw'r hyn a wnânt o ran dosbarthu'r grant tai cymdeithasol hwnnw ar gyfer cynlluniau fel cymorth prynu neu brynu ecwiti ar y cyd. Gwyddoch ein bod wedi codi'r cyfyngiadau ar ecwiti ar y cyd mewn ardaloedd gwledig o 30 i 50 y cant, ac mae hynny'n newid mawr er mwyn cynnig cymorth. Er hynny, ni welir awdurdodau lleol yn gwario symiau mawr o arian eto o'u grant tai cymdeithasol ar y cynllun cymorth prynu, a hynny'n bennaf am eu bod yn gwneud fel yr ydych yn ei argymhell, sef canolbwyntio ar y sector rhentu a landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig, cymdeithasau tai ac yn y blaen. Carem weld cydbwysedd rhwng yr hyn a wnânt o ran rhoi cymorth i brynu drwy ecwiti ar y cyd a'r sector rhentu.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Yn ôl ffigurau a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos diwethaf, mae 9,000 o deuluoedd bellach yn cael eu hystyried yn ddigartref yng Nghymru. Mae ffigurau digartrefedd wedi codi ym mhob un o'r pedair blynedd diwethaf. Onid yw hynny'n gondemniad llwyr o bolisi eich Llywodraeth ar dai?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r diffiniad hefyd wedi'i newid, wrth gwrs. Yn 2001, neu efallai 2000 os ydych yn cymharu â'r cyfnod presennol, nid oedd rhai categorïau o'r bobl a ystyrir yn ddigartref erbyn hyn yn cael eu cynnwys yn y ffigurau. Erbyn hyn, yr ydym yn ystyried pobl sengl 16, 17, 18 ac 19 oed yn ddigartref os ydynt yn dod o gategoriâu penodol, er enghraifft os ydynt wedi bod yn y system gofal neu os ydynt wedi dioddef rhyw fath o drais yn y cartref. Yr ydym hefyd yn cynnwys y rhai sy'n gadael y lluoedd arfog. Nid ydych yn sôn am yr un categorïau wrth gymharu pedair blynedd yn ôl â'r sefyllfa yn awr.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Mae'r ffigurau wedi codi ers y llynedd. Mae nifer fawr o bobl yn ychwanegol yn ddigartref eleni o'i gymharu â'r llynedd, nid 2001. Gadewch inni edrych ar ffigurau'r llynedd. Mae bron i 3,000 o bobl bellach mewn llety dros dro—ffigur sydd wedi dyblu mewn blwyddyn. Mae mwy a mwy o bobl yn cael eu rhoi mewn llety gwely a brecwast. Mae 50,000 o blant yng Nghymru yn ôl Shelter yn byw mewn tai nad ydynt yn ffit, ac mae hynny'n ychwanegu at broblem asthma. Sut y gallwch gyfiawnhau hyn saith mlynedd ar ôl ethol Llywodraeth Lafur?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych yn neidio o un gymhariaeth i'r llall. Ni allwch fy meio i am ddelio â'r gymhariaeth a wnaethoch â'r sefyllfa bedair blynedd yn ôl; yr oedd y gosodiad hwnnw yn eich cwestiwn gwreiddiol.

2.10 p.m.

I droi at yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd ers y llynedd, yr ydym wedi codi'r grant digartrefedd o ryw 40 y cant ac yr ydym yn derbyn bod llawer gormod o deuluoedd mewn llety gwely a brecwast pan fo tai

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** According to figures published last week, 9,000 families are currently deemed to be homeless in Wales. Homelessness figures have increased in each of the last four years. Is that not a complete condemnation of your Government's housing policy?

**The First Minister:** The definition has also changed, of course. In 2001, or perhaps in 2000 if you are comparing with the present day, some categories of those now deemed to be homeless were not included in the figures. We now consider 16, 17, 18 and 19-year-old single people to be homeless if they fall into specific categories, for example if they have been in the care system or if they have suffered some sort of domestic violence. We also include those leaving the armed forces. You are not talking about the same categories when you compare the situation four years ago with the current situation.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** The figures have gone up since last year. Many more people are homeless this year compared with last year, not 2001. Let us consider last year's figures. Nearly 3,000 people are now in temporary accommodation—a figure that has doubled in a year. More and more people are housed in bed and breakfast accommodation. According to Shelter, 50,000 children in Wales live in unfit housing, which contributes to the problem of asthma. How can you justify this seven years after the election of a Labour Government?

**The First Minister:** You are jumping from one comparison to another. You cannot blame me for dealing with the comparison that you made with the situation four years ago; that was in your original question.

Turning to what has happened since last year, we have increased the homelessness grant by some 40 per cent and we accept that there are far too many families in bed and breakfast accommodation, while local authority council

cyngor gwag gan awdurdodau lleol. Byddwn yn trafod y mater hwn y prynhawn yma a bydd Edwina Hart yn galw ar ein hawdurdodau lleol i wneud mwy dros y digartref, pan fo tai gwag ganddynt neu *voids*, fel y'u gelwir, tra bod teuluoedd mewn llety gwely a brecwast pan nad oes angen iddynt fod.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I recognise that there will be an increase in the social housing grant budget, but, First Minister, you must recognise that the policies that you have pursued in the Assembly's first five years have led directly to so many people now being accepted as homeless. You have not allowed local authorities to build new homes and you have prevented them from using the money that they raise from the sale of council houses, as the Tories did, to build more houses. Your answers are complacent and typical of the New Labour philosophy of blaming everybody else and not accepting responsibility. What we want from this First Minister is leadership. Will you now give us a real lead on this and tell us how your Government intends to build more houses for rent and to enable more young people to buy houses in their own communities?

**The First Minister:** You cannot have it both ways, Ieuan. You are going down the road of empty words, as though they could substitute for policies, which is quite extraordinary. You will have heard me say that we are increasing the money available under the social housing grant, which local authorities can spend to meet the social housing needs in their areas, from its present level of £59 million to £96 million. That is a substantial increase of 62 per cent. It is up to the local authorities to decide how they address social housing needs, including homelessness. You cannot have it both ways. You are blaming us for having expanded the categories for homelessness, and therefore think that you can in some way nail us for the increase in homelessness, which was caused by our redefining the categories for homelessness more widely. Do you want us to count only those who are sleeping on street corners or in hostels? Of course you do not, but then you would not have this line of attack. We have been more generous in classifying more types

houses lie empty. We will discuss this issue later this afternoon and Edwina Hart will call on our local authorities to do more for the homeless, when they have empty houses or voids, as they are called, while there are families in bed and breakfast accommodation when there is no need for them to be.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Derbynïaf y bydd cynnydd yn y gyllideb ar gyfer y grant tai cymdeithasol, ond, Brif Weinidog, rhaid ichi dderbyn mai'r polisïau a ddilynasoch ym mhym mlynedd cyntaf y Cynulliad sydd wedi arwain yn uniongyrchol at dderbyn cynifer o bobl yn awr yn rhai digartref. Nid ydych wedi caniatáu i awdurdodau lleol godi tai newydd ac yr ydych wedi'u hatal rhag defnyddio'r arian a godant o werthu tai cyngor i godi mwy o dai, fel y gwnaeth y Torïaid. Mae'ch atebion yn ddfater ac yn nodweddiadol o athroniaeth Llafur Newydd o feio pawb arall a pheidio â derbyn cyfrifoldeb. Yr hyn yr ydym am ei gael gan y Prif Weinidog hwn yw arweiniad. A rowch wir arweiniad i ni'n awr ar hyn a dweud wrthym sut y mae'ch Llywodraeth yn bwriadu codi mwy o dai i'w rhentu a galluogi mwy o bobl ifanc i brynu tai yn eu cymunedau?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni allwch ei chael y ddwy ffordd, Ieuan. Yr ydych yn defnyddio geiriau gwag, fel petaent yn gwneud y tro yn lle polisïau, ac mae hynny'n rhyfeddol. Byddwch wedi fy nghlywed yn dweud ein bod yn cynyddu'r arian sydd ar gael o dan y grant tai cymdeithasol, y gall awdurdodau lleol ei wario i ddiwallu'r anghenion o ran tai cymdeithasol yn eu hardaloedd, o'i lefel bresennol o £59 miliwn i £96 miliwn. Dyna gynnydd sylweddol o 62 y cant. Mater i'r awdurdodau lleol yw penderfynu sut y maent am ymateb i anghenion sy'n ymwneud â thai cymdeithasol, gan gynnwys digartrefedd. Ni allwch ei chael y ddwy ffordd. Yr ydych yn ein beio am ymestyn y categorïau digartrefedd, ac felly credwch y gallwch roi'r bai arnom rywsut am y cynnydd mewn digartrefedd, sydd wedi'i achosi drwy ehangu cwmpas y categorïau digartrefedd. A ydych yn dymuno inni gyfrif y rhai sy'n cysgu ar gornel y stryd neu mewn hosteli'n unig? Nac ydych, wrth gwrs, ond wedyn ni allech ymosod fel hyn. Buom yn fwy hael drwy



of people as being homeless, and then you attack us for an increase in homelessness. Which way do you want it? What is your policy on this? We are increasing the budget for homelessness by 40 per cent and the overall budget for the social housing grant by 62 per cent. It is then up to local authorities to decide how they meet their social housing needs, including the needs of the homeless.

**Carl Sargeant:** There has been a clear increase in social housing grant, which is a Welsh Labour investment, which flies in the face of the opposition. Would you agree that Corus Living Solutions in Alyn and Deeside could provide an ideal opportunity for this Government in terms of the development of fixed cost, highly efficient, low cost housing?

**The First Minister:** You and I went around the Corus factory and it is an impressive operation. Corus, through Living Solutions, would like to provide good-quality housing that can be built quickly. Initially the housing will probably be used in areas such as army camps for temporary barracks, accommodating people in the public sector who need to find accommodation quickly and so forth. Once it is established in the market it could be used for other purposes, though it will probably never be accepted as permanent accommodation.

**Brynle Williams:** In terms of homelessness and affordable housing, I am concerned that in Flintshire there are 120 families living in hotels, at a cost of around £1.75 million. Surely this money should be put into affordable housing? It is ratepayers' money and we should be making better use of it. It is ridiculous that families are in hotel accommodation costing £100 per person per night.

**The First Minister:** That is true if local authorities have voids and council houses, which, if they were able to get the repairs done quickly to bring those empty council houses up to scratch, could be re-let. That is the key measure of how efficient a local authority housing department is—how short

ddynodi mwy o fathau o bobl yn rhai digartref, ac wedyn yr ydych yn ymosod arnom gan ddweud bod digartrefedd wedi cynyddu. Pa un o'r ddau yr ydych am ei gael? Beth yw'ch polisi chi ar hyn? Yr ydym yn rhoi 40 y cant yn fwy yn y gyllideb ar gyfer digartrefedd a 62 y cant yn fwy yn y gyllideb gyffredinol ar gyfer y grant tai cymdeithasol. Lle'r awdurdodau lleol wedyn yw penderfynu sut i ddiwallu eu hanghenion o ran tai cymdeithasol, gan gynnwys anghenion y digartref.

**Carl Sargeant:** Bu cynnydd pendant ym maint y grant tai cymdeithasol, ac mae hynny'n fuddsoddiad gan Lafur Cymru sy'n gwrthbrofi honiadau'r gwrthbleidiau. A ydych yn cytuno y gallai Corus Living Solutions yn Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy gynnig cyfle delfrydol i'r Llywodraeth hon o ran datblygu tai tra effeithlon ar gost isel benodol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Aethom ein dau o gwmpas ffatri Corus ac mae'n waith sylweddol. Byddai Corus, drwy Living Solutions, yn hoffi darparu tai o ansawdd da y gellir eu codi'n gyflym. Ar y dechrau, mae'n debyg y defnyddir y tai mewn mannau fel gweryslyoedd byddin i wneud barics dros dro, i gartrefu rhai yn y sector cyhoeddus y mae'n rhaid iddynt ddod o hyd i lety'n fuan ac yn y blaen. Ar ôl eu sefydlu yn y farchnad, gellid eu defnyddio i ddibenion eraill, er na chânt byth eu derbyn fel llety parhaol, mae'n debyg.

**Brynle Williams:** Gyda golwg ar ddigartrefedd a thai fforddiadwy, pryderaf fod 120 o deuluoedd yn sir y Fflint yn byw mewn gwestai, ar gost o tua £1.75 miliwn. Oni ddylid rhoi'r arian hwn tuag at dai fforddiadwy? Arian y trethdalwyr ydyw a dylem ei ddefnyddio'n well. Peth hurt yw bod teuluoedd yn aros mewn gwestai ar gost o £100 y person y noson.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hynny'n wir os oes gan awdurdodau lleol dai gwag a thai cyngor y gellid eu hailosod, pe gallent eu hatgyweirio'n gyflym a chodi'r tai cyngor gwag hynny at y safon. Dyna'r ffon fesur allweddol ar gyfer mesur pa mor effeithiol yw adran dai awdurdod lleol—pa mor fyr yw

its void periods are, so that it accommodates families who otherwise must remain in bed and breakfast accommodation. That is a win-win situation. The tenants, particularly those with children, do not want to be in bed and breakfast accommodation. If there are voids and the local authorities can speed up repairs so that instead of taking three months, they only take a week, then it means that they get more rent, they save money on bed and breakfast accommodation and the tenant family is much happier to be in its house or flat. That is what they should aim for.

ei chyfnodau gwag, fel ei bod yn cartrefu teuluoedd sydd fel arall yn gorfod parhau i aros mewn llety gwely a brecwast. Mae pawb ar ei ennill felly. Nid yw'r tenantiaid, yn enwedig y rhai sydd â phlant, yn dymuno aros mewn llety gwely a brecwast. Os oes tai gwag ac os gall yr awdurdodau lleol eu hatgyweirio'n gynt fel na chymerir ond wythnos i wneud hynny, yn hytrach na thri mis, byddant yn cael mwy o rent, byddant yn arbed arian ar lety gwely a brecwast a bydd y teulu o denantiaid yn hapusach o lawer yn ei dŷ neu fflat. At hynny y dylent anelu.

### **Cymryd Rhan yn y Broses Ddemocrataidd Participation in the Democratic Process**

**Q3 Janet Ryder:** How is the Government encouraging the participation of minority ethnic groups in the democratic process? (OAQ38782)

**C3 Janet Ryder:** Sut y mae'r Llywodraeth yn annog grwpiau lleiafrifol ethnig i gymryd rhan yn y broses ddemocrataidd? (OAQ38782)

**The First Minister:** It is not a function of the Assembly, but now that we have a specialist body in the Electoral Commission, it can encourage participation in and promotion of the democratic process, which includes the work that we are undertaking with the commission and other stakeholders to promote best practice in all aspects of the democratic process. I believe that we want to see participation by people from all communities, including majority and minority communities, in terms of voting, being selected for and standing in elections and being elected.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid yw'n swyddogaeth i'r Cynulliad, ond gan fod gennym gorff arbenigol bellach ar ffurf y Comisiwn Etholiadol, gall hyrwyddo'r broses ddemocrataidd ac annog rhagor i gymryd rhan ynddi, ac mae hynny'n cynnwys y gwaith a wnawn gyda'r comisiwn a rhanddeiliaid eraill i hybu'r arferion gorau ym mhob agwedd ar y broses ddemocrataidd. Credaf ein bod am weld rhai o bob cymuned yn cymryd rhan, gan gynnwys cymunedau mwyafrifol a lleiafrifol, o ran pleidleisio, dethol ymgeiswyr a sefyll mewn etholiadau a chael eu hethol.

**Janet Ryder:** Do you accept that the current international situation and the dishonesty of Tony Blair in relation to the causes of the war in Iraq have made it difficult for the Muslim citizens of Wales to have confidence in the democratic process? What steps are you taking to address their understandable concerns and to promote their inclusion?

**Janet Ryder:** A ydych yn derbyn bod y sefyllfa ryngwladol bresennol ac anonestrydd Tony Blair mewn cysylltiad ag achosion y rhyfel yn Irac wedi'i gwneud yn anodd i ddinasyddion Moslemaidd Cymru ymddiried yn y broses ddemocrataidd? Pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd i ymateb i'w pryderon dealladwy ac i hyrwyddo'r gwaith o'u cynnwys ynddi?

**The First Minister:** What is important is that any under-represented ethnic minority or religious group, whichever group the Muslims represent, should take full part in the democratic process. If they have views that are different from those of the Government, they have every right to nominate candidates and ensure that those

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw bod unrhyw leiafrif ethnig neu grŵp crefyddol sydd wedi'i dangynrychioli, pa un bynnag yw'r Moslemaid, yn cymryd rhan lawn yn y broses ddemocrataidd. Os yw eu barn yn wahanol i un y Llywodraeth, mae ganddynt bob hawl i enwebu ymgeiswyr a sicrhau y mynegir y farn honno'n fwy

views are expressed more effectively across the board.

It is important to note that Syniad, the development arm of the Welsh Local Government Association, is currently undertaking a survey of the councillors who were elected in June. That survey will include a question on the ethnic background of councillors in Wales. When that survey is published early next year, in a few months' time, it will show the representation of people in Wales across the board and whether there is significant under-representation from the ethnic minority groups in Wales. Then perhaps we can address your question again.

**Lorraine Barrett:** One way of encouraging the participation of minority ethnic groups in the democratic process is by working with them at a young age. I therefore thank you for ensuring that the Butetown Youth Pavilion is not being auctioned off today. Will you now look at ensuring that this facility is secured for the community of Butetown, which has one of the highest black and minority ethnic communities in Wales?

**The First Minister:** I am glad that you raised that point because by and large, Wales has a much smaller representation of ethnic-minority communities than England. We lack the big metropolitan areas that England has, where there has been a large immigration of black and visible ethnic minorities over the past 50 years. There are exceptions, such as Butetown, which is known in Wales and Europe as an area of strong ethnic-minority representation. Therefore, the Butetown Youth Pavilion issue has become an important one and we were somewhat bewildered by Cardiff County Council's decision not to purchase the site from the Welsh Development Agency, thereby giving the WDA no alternative but to seek an option for it, which could have undesirable consequences in Butetown. I am pleased that it has been withdrawn and that we now have some breathing space in which to search for alternative solutions.

**Jonathan Morgan:** On the participation issue in terms of the democratic process, over the weekend, Neil Kinnock reiterated his

effeithiol yn gyffredinol.

Mae'n bwysig nodi bod Syniad, sef cangen ddatblygu Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, yn cynnal arolwg ar hyn o bryd o'r cynghorwyr a etholwyd ym mis Mehefin. Bydd yr arolwg hwnnw'n cynnwys cwestiwn ar gefndir ethnig cynghorwyr yng Nghymru. Pan gyhoeddir yr arolwg hwnnw ddechrau'r flwyddyn nesaf, ymhen rhai misoedd, bydd yn dangos cynrychiolaeth pobl yng Nghymru'n gyffredinol ac a yw grwpiau lleiafrifol ethnig yng Nghymru wedi'u tangynrychioli'n sylweddol. Gallwn ymdrin â'ch cwestiwn eto bryd hynny, efallai.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Un modd i annog grwpiau lleiafrifol ethnig i gymryd rhan yn y broses ddemocrataidd yw gweithio gyda hwy pan ydynt yn ifanc. Gan hynny, diolchaf ichi am sicrhau na roddir Pafiliwn Ieuentid Butetown ar ocsiwn heddiw. A wnewch ystyried sicrhau'r cyfleuster hwn ar gyfer cymuned Butetown yn awr, gan mai yno y ceir un o'r cymunedau mwyaf o bobl dduon a lleiafrifoedd ethnig yng Nghymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi codi'r pwynt hwnnw oherwydd, at ei gilydd, mae cynrychiolaeth lai o lawer o gymunedau lleiafrifol ethnig yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr. Nid oes gennym ardaloedd metropolitaidd mawr fel a geir yn Lloegr, lle y cafwyd mewnfudiad mawr o leiafrifoedd pobl dduon a lleiafrifoedd ethnig gweladwy dros yr 50 mlynedd diwethaf. Mae eithriadau, fel Butetown, sy'n adnabyddus yng Nghymru ac yn Ewrop fel ardal ac ynddi gynrychiolaeth gryf o leiafrifoedd ethnig. Gan hynny, mae pwnc Pafiliwn Ieuentid Butetown wedi dod yn un pwysig a buom mewn penbleth braidd ynghylch penderfyniad Cyngor Sir Caerdydd i beidio â phrynu'r safle oddi wrth Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, fel nad oedd dewis arall gan y WDA ond ceisio'i werthu, a gallai hynny beri canlyniadau annymunol yn Butetown. Mae'n dda gennyf ddweud ei fod wedi'i dynnu'n ôl a bod gennym gyfle'n awr i chwilio am atebion eraill.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Ynghylch cymryd rhan yn y broses ddemocrataidd, dros y penwythnos, ailddatganodd Neil Kinnock ei

view that voting in this country should be made compulsory. While I do not support that course of action, do you, as First Minister, favour that?

**The First Minister:** To be honest, I have not given it any thought. If you visit Australia, you will see that the consequences of compulsory voting appear to be healthy. I do not object to it in principle, but I think that you have to somehow inspire rather than force people to vote. That is the right way forward. Looking at the television last night and this morning, it was interesting to see the queues of people voting early in the case of Florida, as you are allowed to vote early there. It reminded me of the scenes in South Africa in its first election around 12 years ago. People who feel that their part in the democratic process is denied, as did many of the ethnic minority black people of Florida in 2000, who felt cheated by the outcome of the election, are determined that there will be no mistake this time. We will have to see what happens. However, to see people standing in hot weather for five hours in order to vote puts us all to shame.

farn y dylai pleidleisio yn y wlad hon fod yn ofodol. Er nad wyf yn cefnogi'r dull gweithredu hwnnw, a ydych chi, fel Prif Weinidog, yn bleidiol i hynny?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** A dweud y gwir, nid wyf wedi meddwl dim amdano. Os ewch i Awstralia, gwelwch fod canlyniadau pleidleisio gorfodol yn ymddangos yn iach. Nid wyf yn ei wrthwynebu mewn egwyddor, ond credaf fod yn rhaid ichi rywsut ysbrydoli pobl yn hytrach na'u gorfodi i bleidleisio. Dyna'r llwybr y dylid ei ddilyn. Wrth edrych ar y teledu neithiwr a'r bore yma, yr oedd yn ddi-ddorol gweld y ciwiau o bobl yn pleidleisio'n gynnar yn Fflorida, gan y gellir pleidleisio'n gynnar yn y fan honno. Yr oedd yn fy atgoffa o'r hyn a welwyd yn Ne Affrica yn ei hetholiad cyntaf tua 12 mlynedd yn ôl. Mae rhai sy'n teimlo bod eu rhan yn y broses ddemocrataidd wedi'i gwrthod iddynt, fel yr oedd llawer o bobl dduon o leiafrifoedd ethnig yn Fflorida yn 2000, a deimlai eu bod wedi'u twyllo gan ganlyniad yr etholiad, yn benderfynol na fydd unrhyw gamgymeriad y tro hwn. Bydd yn rhaid inni ddisgwyl i weld beth a ddigwydd. Fodd bynnag, mae gweld rhai'n sefyll ar dywydd poeth am bum awr i bleidleisio yn codi cywilydd arnom i gyd.

2.20 p.m.

### **Refferendwm ar Bwerau Deddfu Referendum on Law-making Powers**

**Q4 Leanne Wood:** What discussions has the First Minister had with the Secretary of State for Wales regarding the need to hold a referendum on law-making powers for the National Assembly? (OAQ38779)

**C4 Leanne Wood:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cael ynghylch yr angen i gynnal refferendwm ar bwerau deddfu i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol? (OAQ38779)

**The First Minister:** I have had many such discussions. We would probably need to have a referendum, as we have indicated, before the adoption of the full Richard commission proposals on the Assembly's powers. However, there should be a non-referendum based choice in the White Paper that will be published shortly after Labour is re-elected—with your full support and co-operation, if you are interested in this issue, Leanne—in the general election. If Labour is re-elected, there will be a White Paper, which will include two choices, one of which will involve a referendum, and one of which will

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cefais lawer trafodaeth o'r fath. Mae'n debyg y byddai'n rhaid inni gael refferendwm, fel yr ydym wedi nodi, cyn mabwysiadu holl gynigion comisiwn Richard ar bwerau'r Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, mae'n debyg y ceir dewis nad yw'n seiliedig ar refferendwm yn y Papur Gwyn a gyhoeddir yn fuan ar ôl ailethol Llafur—gyda'ch cefnogaeth a'ch cydweithrediad llawn, os oes gennych ddiddordeb yn y pwnc hwn, Leanne—yn yr etholiad cyffredinol. Os ailetholir Llafur, bydd Papur Gwyn, a fydd yn cynnwys dau ddewis, y bydd un ohonynt yn gofyn refferendwm, ac un na fydd. Un o'r

not. One of those choices will be the full Richard or the full Monty if you like, and the other will be a more evolutionary approach.

**Leanne Wood:** Following a 'yes' vote in Plaid Cymru's proposed made-in-Wales referendum, of which I am sure you are aware, First Minister, the Assembly, which would then be a proper parliament, would be able to legislate on school transport. When will you be prepared to commit to legislating to ensure that all school buses have seat belts and a seat for each child?

**The First Minister:** To return to the preamble to your question, a made-in-Wales referendum is an inherent nonsense. As far as I am aware, we had all accepted, until the last few months, when Plaid Cymru proposed this idea, that we cannot change our own powers, nor vote to change those powers because that would be ultra vires under section 36 of the Government of Wales Act 1998. We can only have a referendum on our existing powers. Clearly, there are a whole range of issues—it would be invidious to pick out one or two—on which we could have either greater or full legislative powers and the greater the legislative power, the more that we can do. It is about having the tools to do the job. That can be done in one or two ways, as I have mentioned, and it would be on the assumption that Labour has a majority in the next election. However, that is due to, and under, the democratic process.

**Lynne Neagle:** Do you agree that given that Plaid Cymru's made-in-Wales referendum would have no legal weight—a fact observed by Plaid's own representative on the Richard commission—that such a referendum would be a huge waste of money? Plaid Cymru's meaningless referendum would cost at least £3 million. Do you agree that that would be money better spent on public services in Wales, rather than fulfilling the pipe dreams of Plaid Cymru?

**The First Minister:** It would cost £3 million, but it would be recorded in the national archive under Owen John Thomas's proposal, which would cost another £5 million. Plaid

dewisiadau hynny fydd holl gynigion Richard, a'r llall fydd dull gweithredu mwy graddol.

**Leanne Wood:** Ar ôl cael pleidlais o blaid yn y refferendwm y mae Plaid Cymru'n cynnig y dylid ei alw a'i gynnal yng Nghymru, yr wyf yn siŵr y gwyddoch amdano, Brif Weinidog, byddai'r Cynulliad, a fyddai wedyn yn senedd iawn, yn gallu deddfu ar gludiant ysgol. Pa bryd y byddwch yn barod i ymrwymo i ddeddfu i sicrhau y bydd gwregysau ar seddau ym mhob bws ysgol a sedd ar gyfer pob plentyn?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gan fynd yn ôl at y rhagymadrodd i'ch cwestiwn, mae refferendwm a elwir yng Nghymru'n nonsens o'i hanfod. Hyd y gwn i, yr oeddem oll wedi derbyn, tan y misoedd diwethaf, pan gynigiodd Plaid Cymru y syniad hwn, na allwn newid ein pwerau, na phleidleisio i newid y pwerau hynny gan y byddai hynny y tu hwnt i'n hawdurdod o dan adran 36 Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Ni allwn ond cael refferendwm ar ein pwerau presennol. Mae'n amlwg bod amryw o bynciau—peth anodd fyddai dewis un neu ddau—y gallem gael mwy o bwerau deddfu, neu bwerau deddfu llawn, arnynt a pho fwyaf y pŵer i ddeddfu, mwyaf oll y gallwn ei wneud. Mae'n ymwneud â chael yr offer i wneud y gwaith. Gellir sicrhau hynny drwy un neu ddau o ddulliau, fel y dywedais, gan gymryd y caiff Llafur fwyafrif yn yr etholiad nesaf. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny'n dibynnu ar y broses ddemocrataidd ac yn ddarostyngedig iddi.

**Lynne Neagle:** A ydych yn cytuno, gan na fyddai unrhyw bwys cyfreithiol i'r refferendwm y carai Plaid Cymru ei alw yng Nghymru—ac mae hynny'n ffaith a nodwyd gan gynrychiolydd Plaid Cymru ar gomisiwn Richard—y byddai refferendwm o'r fath yn wastraff mawr ar arian? Byddai refferendwm diystyr Plaid Cymru'n costio o leiaf £3 miliwn. A ydych yn cytuno mai gwell fyddai gwario'r arian hwnnw ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, yn hytrach nag ar wireddu breuddwydion gwrrach Plaid Cymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Costiai £3 miliwn, ond fe'i cofnodid yn yr archif genedlaethol o dan gynnyg Owen John Thomas, a gostiai £5 miliwn arall. Felly, byddai Plaid Cymru'n

would have to therefore find £8 million, which would otherwise be spent on front-line public services.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** I wonder if we can clear up this issue of whether or not you want a referendum, First Minister. You sound strangely ambivalent about it. I know that you initially rubbished the idea, but the Labour Party seemed to overrule you. Is it your personal belief now that we should have a full referendum for law-making powers? A simple 'yes' or 'no' will do.

**The First Minister:** No, there will be a choice in the White Paper—a referendum-based choice on full law-making powers and a non-referendum-based choice on a more evolutionary approach to expand our legislative capacity, but without opting for full primary law-making powers.

**Nick Bourne:** You have said that before. However, I asked—and, as First Minister, I would hope that you have a view on this—about your personal preference. Do you, not the Labour Party, want a referendum on law-making powers?

**The First Minister:** I am a member of the Labour Party. That seems to be a bit of a mystery and a surprise to you, but I would have thought that that would have been fairly clear after 41 years. We voted unanimously on the package to be presented via Labour's manifesto. Provided that Labour gets the support of the people of the United Kingdom and has a third successive term, a White Paper will be published involving consultation on a choice—a referendum-based choice, which can involve a dramatic shift in the legislative powers of the Assembly, and a non-referendum-based choice involving an evolution rather than a revolution in the Assembly's legislative powers.

**Nick Bourne:** You have set out the choices for the Labour Party two or three times now. I will ask you again, in the hope that you have some vision and leadership—although that flies in the face of the evidence—what is your personal preference?

gorfod dod o hyd i £8 miliwn, a gâi ei wario fel arall ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus yn y rheng flaen.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Tybed a allwn gael eglurhad ynghylch a ydych am gael refferendwm ai peidio, Brif Weinidog. Yr ydych yn swnio'n rhyfedd o amwys yn ei gylch. Gwn eich bod wedi wfftio'r syniad ar y dechrau, ond yr oedd yn ymddangos bod y Blaid Lafur wedi penderfynu yn eich erbyn. Ai'ch cred bersonol yn awr yw y dylem gael refferendwm llawn ar bwerau deddfu? Bydd 'ie' neu 'nace' yn ddigon.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nace, bydd dewis yn y Papur Gwyn—dewis sy'n seiliedig ar refferendwm ar bwerau deddfu llawn a dewis nad yw'n seiliedig ar refferendwm ar ddull gweithredu mwy graddol i ychwanegu at ein gallu i ddeddfu, ond heb ddewis pwerau deddfu sylfaenol llawn.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr ydych wedi dweud hynny o'r blaen. Fodd bynnag, holais am yr hyn sydd orau gennych yn bersonol—a gobeithiaf fod gennych farn am hyn, a chithau'n Brif Weinidog. A ydych chi, nid y Blaid Lafur, yn dymuno cael refferendwm ar bwerau deddfu?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn aelod o'r Blaid Lafur. Ymddengys fod hynny'n dipyn o ddirgelwch ac yn destun syndod i chi, ond tybiaswn y byddai hynny'n eithaf amlwg ar ôl 41 mlynedd. Gwnaethom bleidleisio'n unfrydol o blaid y pecyn sydd i'w gyflwyno drwy fanifesto Llafur. Ar yr amod y caiff Lafur gefnogaeth pobl y Deyrnas Unedig ac y caiff drydydd tymor yn olynol, cyhoeddir Papur Gwyn a fydd yn golygu ymgynghori ar ddewis—dewis sy'n seiliedig ar refferendwm, a all olygu newid mawr ym mhwerau deddfu'r Cynulliad, a dewis nad yw'n seiliedig ar refferendwm sy'n golygu newid graddol yn hytrach na chwyldro o ran pwerau deddfu'r Cynulliad.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr ydych wedi nodi'r dewision i'r Blaid Lafur ddwy neu dair gwaith bellach. Gofynnaf ichi eto, gan obeithio bod gennych ryw faint o weledigaeth ac arweiniad i'w cynnig—er bod y dystiolaeth yn mynd yn groes i hynny—beth

sydd orau gennych chi yn bersonol?

**The First Minister:** The consultation will take place in the six months after Labour is re-elected, provided that that is the case. I am fascinated by your virtual acceptance of the fact that Labour is more likely than not to win a third term, shown by your interest in what will happen in that consultation. We will consult throughout Wales on the right way forward. At the end of the consultation, we will know what the people of Wales want: whether they want to go for an evolutionary—[*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The First Minister is answering the question in his inimitable way.

**The First Minister:** It is simple. Do you want the full shilling, the full monty, the full Richard commission proposals, which are unlikely to be achieved before the next Assembly elections in 2007, or something that can be brought in before the election that will also have big advantages?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** What is your view?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order.

**The First Minister:** I have always favoured the idea that we can have our legislative powers enhanced in time for the next election in 2007. That would be an important achievement because we could then use those tools to do the job for the whole of the next Assembly term rather than having to wait for the fourth Assembly term, 2011 to 2015. However, the matter is subject to consultation. If the overwhelming view of the people of Wales is that they would rather wait until 2011 and have a referendum on the full monty, the full Richard solution, I would also be happy to go along with that.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** Can we leave the blurb and move towards the reality of what primary legislative powers might mean? Yesterday, the House of Commons gave the Gambling Bill its second reading, which would have profound repercussions for Wales were those powers developed here. Today's announcement of

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Bydd yr ymgynghoriad yn digwydd yn y chwe mis ar ôl ailethol Llafur, os digwydd hynny. Ymddiddoraf yn fawr yn y ffaith eich bod yn derbyn fwy neu lai fod Llafur yn debygol o ennill trydydd tymor, a amlygir yn eich diddordeb yn yr hyn a ddigwydd yn yr ymgynghoriad hwnnw. Ymgynghorwn ledled Cymru ar y llwybr y dylid ei ddilyn. Ar ôl yr ymgynghoriad, byddwn yn gwybod beth yw dymuniad pobl Cymru: pa un a ydynt am ddewis—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn ateb y cwestiwn yn ei ddull dihafal ei hun.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n syml. A ydych am gael y pecyn cyfan, holl gynigion comisiwn Richard, sy'n annhebygol o gael eu cyflawni cyn etholiadau nesaf y Cynulliad yn 2007, neu rywbeth y gellir ei gyflwyno cyn yr etholiad a fydd hefyd yn dod â manteision mawr?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Beth yw'ch barn chi?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Bûm yn bleidiol erioed i'r syniad y gallwn gael mwy o bwerau deddfu mewn pryd ar gyfer yr etholiad nesaf yn 2007. Byddai hynny'n gyflawniad o bwys oherwydd wedyn gallem ddefnyddio'r offer hynny i wneud y gwaith drwy gydol tymor y Cynulliad nesaf yn hytrach na gorfod disgwyl am dymor y pedwerydd Cynulliad, 2011 i 2015. Fodd bynnag, mae'r mater hwnnw'n amodol ar ymgynghori. Os mai barn y mwyafrif llethol o bobl Cymru yw y byddai'n well ganddynt aros tan 2011 a chael refferendwm ar holl gynigion Richard, byddwn hefyd yn fodlon cyd-fynd â hynny.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** A gawn adael y broliant a throi at yr hyn y gallai pwerau deddfu sylfaenol ei olygu mewn gwirionedd? Ddoe, rhoddwyd ail ddarlleniad yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin i'r Mesur Hapchwarae, a gâi effaith bellgyrhaeddol ar Gymru os datblygid y pwerau hynny yma. Mae'r cyhoeddiad heddiw am y setliad

the local government settlement almost feels as if it should be part of that Bill because the random and arbitrary nature of the outcomes of that settlement is clear. The outcry from your party on the local government settlement and the Gambling Bill are about the same. Having seen the effects of revaluation and what it means for the people of Wales, do you think that you should have postponed the revaluation exercise and gone with the same timetable as England, so that you would have had a chance to hear the results of the Lyons review before making a decision on whether to proceed with an unfair council tax or the alternative system that the Lyons review may have given you?

**The First Minister:** The only regret is that we did not undertake the revaluation and rebanding earlier, because if you leave it too long, the shock effect is much greater. After 11 or 12 years we should now be on our second revaluation, not our first. The more frequently you revalue, the smaller the effect and the shock when the results come out. That was made clear to us by Dennis Hastert, the speaker of the United States House of Representatives. In the US, there is an obligation by law to revalue every five years, and he said that we should never let it slip past five years because, if you do, the shock, when it comes, hits you big time. We have seen the size of the shock. It is also important to say that the idea of going for a local income tax poses a pretty big problem for the electorate in Wales. Do you want your local authority to set the level of your income tax? I think that there would be a resounding 'No' in Wales to the proposition that your local council would, in the end, set the level of income tax.

**Michael German:** Look at what the Rhodri Morgan casino has delivered for Wales in this gamble that we have with council tax and the local government settlement. There is an increase in Cardiff of 3.5 per cent and, if Sue Essex had not boosted that from an artificial low, it would have been even less. Next year, Conwy and Wrexham will also get the same minimum increase in grants. The Labour leader of the Welsh Local Government Association has said that this will mean that councils face hard choices between

llywodraeth leol yn ymddangos bron fel pe bai'n rhan o'r Mesur hwnnw gan ei bod yn amlwg bod canlyniadau'r setliad hwnnw'n ddiamecan ac yn fympwyol. Mae'r banllefau o brotest a gododd o'ch plaid ynghylch y setliad llywodraeth leol a'r Mesur Hapchwarae yn debyg iawn i'w gilydd. A chithau wedi gweld effeithiau'r ailbrisiad a'r hyn y mae'n ei olygu i bobl Cymru, a gredwch y dylech fod wedi gohirio'r ailbrisiad a dilyn yr un amserlen â Lloegr, fel y cawsech gyfle i glywed canlyniadau adolygiad Lyons cyn penderfynu a ddylid parhau â threth gyngor annheg neu fabwysiadu system arall y gallai adolygiad Lyons fod wedi'i chynnig i chi?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr unig beth y gellir bod yn edifar amdano yw na wnaethom yr ailbrisiad a'r ailfandio'n gynharach, oherwydd os gadewir hynny'n rhy hir, mae'r ysgytwad a geir yn llawer mwy. Gan fod 11 neu 12 mlynedd wedi mynd heibio, dylem fod wedi ailbrisiad am yr eildro erbyn hyn, nid y tro cyntaf. Po amlaf y ceir ailbrisiad, lleiaf fydd yr effaith a'r ysgytwad pan gyhoeddir y canlyniadau. Eglurwyd hynny i ni gan Dennis Hastert, llefarydd Tŷ'r Cynrychiolwyr yn yr Unol Daleithiau. Yn yr Unol Daleithiau, mae cyfraith yn mynnu bod ailbrisiad yn digwydd bob pum mlynedd, a dywedodd na ddylem byth ei adael yn hwy na phum mlynedd oherwydd, os gwneir hynny, mae'r ysgytwad a geir yn un mawr. Gwelsom faint yr ysgytwad. Mae hefyd yn bwysig dweud bod y syniad o gael treth incwm leol yn codi problem eithaf mawr i'r etholwyr yng Nghymru. A ydych am weld eich awdurdod lleol yn pennu lefel eich treth incwm? Credaf mai 'na' fyddai'r ateb hygryw yng Nghymru i'r cynnig mai'r cyngor lleol a ddylai bennu lefel treth incwm yn y pen draw.

**Michael German:** Edrychwch ar yr hyn y mae casino Rhodri Morgan wedi'i roi i Gymru yn yr hapchwarae a gawsom â'r dreth gyngor a'r setliad llywodraeth leol. Ceir cynnydd o 3.5 y cant yng Nghaerdydd a, pe na byddai Sue Essex wedi rhoi hwb iddo gan ei fod yn artiffisial o isel, buasai'n llai byth. Y flwyddyn nesaf, bydd Conwy a Wrecsam hwythau'n gweld yr un math o gynnydd bach yn eu grantiau. Mae arweinydd Llafur Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru wedi dweud y bydd hyn yn golygu y bydd



significant cuts in local services or unacceptable increases in council tax. Do you agree that the lottery of council tax increases will happen again when the councils that face the lowest increases this year will also receive the lowest increase the following year? Why should Wales suffer this lottery when people in England may wait for the Lyons review and find out the result before possibly changing the system?

**The First Minister:** Your obsession with the lottery, Mike, is leading you to forget that the biggest single influence in revising the formula this year is not the revaluation, the rebanding exercise—you seem to have ignored that, perhaps you have not read past the headline or the first lines of the WLGA press release—but the changes to personal social services that are a reassessment of what the real burden is, caused by the different numbers of children in care or elderly people requiring care. That has a bigger influence than the revaluation.

2.30 p.m.

You, of course, are interested in the revaluation because you think that, in some way, it plays into the hands of the tiny minority in Wales that would like to have the local authority setting the level of income tax. You are barking up the wrong tree in that regard, and I do not think that that has any support in Wales. There will be individuals who support it, but most of those are the individuals who should be applying for council tax benefit because, as I have said time and again, only 40 per cent of owner-occupiers who are eligible for council tax benefit actually claim it. That is a real shame, and we must work hard with the Welsh Local Government Association to double, or increase by two-thirds, the number of eligible owner-occupiers claiming council tax benefit from the current figure of 40 per cent.

**Michael German:** The 0.5 million householders in Wales who will be affected by an increase in the band and who will not

cynghorau'n wynebu dewis anodd rhwng gwneud toriadau sylweddol mewn gwasanaethau lleol a phennu codiadau annerbyniol yn y dreth gyngor. A ydych yn cytuno y bydd loteri'r codiadau yn y dreth gyngor yn digwydd eto pan fydd y cynghorau sy'n wynebu'r codiadau isaf eleni hefyd yn cael y cynnydd lleiaf y flwyddyn wedyn? Pam y dylai Cymru oddef y loteri hon a phobl yn Lloegr yn cael aros am adolygiad Lyons a gweld y canlyniad cyn newid y system, o bosibl?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'ch obsesiwn â'r loteri, Mike, yn peri ichi anghofio nad yr ailbrisió, yr ailfandio, a gaiff y dylanwad mwyaf wrth adolygu'r fformiwla eleni—ymddengys eich bod wedi anwybyddu hynny, efallai nad ydych wedi darllen yr hyn sydd o dan y pennawd neu linellau cyntaf y datganiad i'r wasg gan CLILC—ond y newidiadau i wasanaethau cymdeithasol personol sy'n ganlyniad i ailasesiad o'r baich gwirioneddol, a achosir gan y gwahanol niferoedd o blant sydd dan ofal a phobl oeddrannus y mae arnynt angen gofal. Mae hynny'n fwy o ddylanwad nag ydyw'r ailbrisiad.

Yr ydych chi, wrth gwrs, yn ymddiddori yn yr ailbrisiad gan y credwch fod hynny rywsut yn rhoi mantais i'r lleiafrif bach yng Nghymru a garai weld yr awdurdod lleol yn pennu lefel treth incwm. Yr ydych yn mynd ar y trywydd anghywir yn hynny o beth, ac ni chredaf fod unrhyw gefnogaeth i hynny yng Nghymru. Ceir unigolion sydd o'i blaid, ond mae'r rhan fwyaf ohonynt yn rhai a ddylai ymgeisio am y budd-dal treth gyngor oherwydd, fel y dywedais dro ar ôl tro, dim ond 40 y cant o'r perchen-feddianwyr sy'n gymwys i gael y budd-dal treth gyngor sy'n ei hawlio. Mae hynny'n drueni mawr, a rhaid inni weithio'n galed gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru i ddyblu, neu gynyddu o ddwy ran o dair, y nifer o berchen-feddianwyr cymwys sy'n hawlio'r budd-dal treth gyngor oddi ar y ffigur presennol o 40 y cant.

**Michael German:** Ni chewch unrhyw ddiolch gan yr hanner miliwn o ddeiliaid tai yng Nghymru a effeithir drwy godi band, na

be helped by any dampening scheme will not thank you when they face council tax increases of 20 per cent based simply on the house in which they live rather than on their ability to pay. Would it not have been better to have postponed the increase following revaluation and follow England in looking at the system first before deciding to go down this lottery route?

**The First Minister:** Here we go again. How many mentions of the lottery is that? This is becoming a bit of an obsession on your part due to the weakness of your argument. You have not yet accepted that you are wrong, Mike, in seeing the revaluation exercise as the major influence on this when I have told you that it is not—it is the personal social services re-assessment of relative need between the different authorities in Wales. Perhaps you do not realise that, or perhaps you realise that it weakens your argument, but you should go back to your researchers and look again at the major influences on the differences. The other point that I ought to make is that Sue Essex and Gordon Brown have been working closely on the business rate issue, and that issue will result in an additional £13 million that will be applicable in this area to help keep council tax levels moderate. That is the by-product of close partnership between a Labour Government in Westminster and a Labour administration in the Assembly.

chânt gymorth gan unrhyw gynllun lleddfu, pan wynebant gynnydd o 20 y cant yn y dreth gyngor, a hynny'n ôl y math o dŷ y maent yn byw ynddo yn hytrach na'u gallu i dalu. Oni fuasai'n well gohirio'r cynnydd ar ôl ailbriso a dilyn Lloegr drwy ystyried y system yn gyntaf cyn penderfynu parhau â'r loteri hon?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dyma ni eto. Pa sawl gwaith y soniwyd am y loteri? Mae hyn yn troi'n dipyn o obsesiwn gennych a hynny'n rhannol oherwydd gwendid eich dadl. Nid ydych yn derbyn eich bod wedi camgymryd eto, Mike, o ran barnu mai'r ailbrisiad yw'r dylanwad mwyaf ar hyn a minnau wedi dweud wrthyhych nad ydyw—y dylanwad mwyaf arno yw'r ailasesiad o'r angen cymharol am wasanaethau cymdeithasol personol yn y gwahanol awdurdodau yng Nghymru. Efallai na sylweddolwch hynny, neu efallai y sylweddolwch ei fod yn gwanhau'ch dadl, ond dylech fynd yn ôl at eich ymchwilyr ac ailedrych ar y dylanwadau mwyaf ar y gwahaniaethau. Y pwynt arall y dylwn ei wneud yw bod Sue Essex a Gordon Brown wedi bod yn cydweithio'n glôs ar fater trethi busnes, a bydd hynny'n arwain at gael £13 miliwn ychwanegol a ddefnyddir yn y maes hwn i helpu i gadw'r dreth gyngor ar lefelau cymedrol. Mae hynny'n ganlyniad i'r bartneriaeth glôs rhwng Llywodraeth Lafur yn San Steffan a gweinyddiaeth Lafur yn y Cynulliad.

### **Diogelwch Plant yn Ysgolion Sir Fynwy The Safety of Children in Monmouthshire Schools**

**Q5 David Davies:** What discussions has the First Minister had with the Home Office about the safety of children in Monmouthshire schools following the escape of a prisoner from Prescoed open prison? (OAQ38772)

**C5 David Davies:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cael gyda'r Swyddfa Gartref ynghylch diogelwch plant Sir Fynwy ar ôl i garcharor ddianc o garchar agored Prescoed? (OAQ38772)

**The First Minister:** I have had no such discussions with Paul Goggins, but Edwina Hart has repeated her concerns to Home Office Ministers about the housing of sex offenders in an open prison and the implications for the safety of the local community.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni chefais unrhyw drafodaethau o'r fath â Paul Goggins, ond mae Edwina Hart wedi ailddatgan ei phryderon i Weinidogion y Swyddfa Gartref ynghylch cadw troseddwyr rhyw mewn carchar agored a goblygiadau hynny i ddiogelwch y gymuned leol.

**David Davies:** I am grateful for your reply. When Edwina Hart answered that question last week, she did not make it entirely clear that she had those concerns, although I felt that that was probably implicit in the answer. Can you therefore confirm, clearly and categorically, that the Welsh Assembly Government is opposed to the housing of sex offenders in Prescoed open prison?

**David Davies:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich ateb. Pan atebodd Edwina Hart y cwestiwn hwnnw yr wythnos diwethaf, nis gwnaeth yn hollol glir bod ganddi bryderon o'r fath, er fy mod yn teimlo bod hynny ymhlyg yn yr ateb, yn ôl pob tebyg. A allwch gadarnhau felly, yn blwmp ac yn blaen, fod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n gwrthwynebu cadw troseddwy'r rhyw yng ngharchar agored Prescoed?

**The First Minister:** We have not said so in those precise terms. It would not be fair of me to read out the second letter, which was issued some weeks ago, but it expresses Edwina's concern, as she said in June, because of the fears expressed in the local community around Usk following the escape of a convicted rapist from Prescoed on 7 October. She says in her letter that there will be a progress report after six months, but she expresses the hope that the review will be brought forward and will take the escape into account.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid ydym wedi dweud hynny yn yr union eiriau hynny. Ni fyddai'n deg imi ddarlenn yn uchel yr ail lythyr, a anfonwyd rai wythnosau'n ôl, ond mae'n mynegi'r pryder sydd gan Edwina, fel y dywedodd ym mis Mehefin, oherwydd yr ofnau a fynegwyd yn y gymuned leol o gwmpas Brynbuga wedi i dreisiwr euogfarnedig ddianc o garchar Prescoed ar 7 Hydref. Dywed yn ei llythyr y ceir adroddiad ar gynnydd ar ôl chwe mis, ond mae'n mynegi'r gobaith y bydd yr adolygiad yn cael ei gynnal yn gynharach ac yn ystyried y dihangiad hwnnw.

### **Darpariaeth Cronfeydd Strwythurol Ewropeaidd The Provision of European Structural Funds**

**Q6 Michael German:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the future provision of European structural funds to Wales post-2006? (OAQ38805)

**C6 Michael German:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar ddarpariaeth cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd i Gymru yn y dyfodol, ar ôl 2006? (OAQ38805)

**The First Minister:** You will be aware that the European Commission issued its draft structural funds regulations on 15 July, but, obviously, matters have moved on since then because they will now move more into the forum of the Council of Ministers. We must get at the UK Government and the other governments in the Council of Ministers and the European Parliament because they will carry on bargaining over the financial perspective, which will determine how much is in the budget overall, as well as the actual regional funds and their structure, and the implications for the state aid regime. We do not expect that to reach a climax until this time next year or later, although it could drag on well into 2006.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gwyddoch i'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd gyhoeddi ei reoliadau drafft ar y cronfeydd strwythurol ar 15 Gorffennaf, ond, wrth gwrs, cafwyd datblygiadau ers hynny gan y bydd mwy o drafod arnynt yn awr yng Nghyngor y Gweinidogion. Rhaid inni ddylanwadu ar Lywodraeth y DU a'r llywodraethau eraill yng Nghyngor y Gweinidogion a Senedd Ewrop gan mai hwy fydd yn bargeinio ar yr agwedd ariannol, gan bennu'r swm a fydd yn y gyllideb gyffredinol, yn ogystal â'r cronfeydd rhanbarthol a'u strwythur, a'r goblygiadau i'r gyfundrefn cymorth gwladol. Nid ydym yn disgwyl y deuir â hynny i'r pen tan yr adeg hon y flwyddyn nesaf neu wedyn, er y gallai lusgo ymlaen ymhell i 2006.

**Michael German:** There is a choice to make: do you support the UK Government's line, which would reduce the amount of money

**Michael German:** Mae dewis i'w wneud: a ydych yn cefnogi safbwynt Llywodraeth y DU, a barai fod llai o arian ar gael i

available for structural funds and not make Wales a beneficiary in the longer term, or do you accept what is on offer from Europe? The main body of thinking is that structural funds are good for Wales and they provide a flexible way of dealing with the problems facing Wales. On which side will you lay your chips?

**The First Minister:** The important banker, namely the one who is governing the roulette wheel, if you like, is the Chancellor of the Exchequer, Gordon Brown, in the sense that the Assembly is united across all four parties on there being little point in our getting European structural funds unless they are covered by funding over and above the Barnett formula. Fortunately, our influence with Gordon Brown is such that not only have the structural funds been provided over and above the Barnett formula, but the £13 million to which I referred a few minutes ago, as regards the money that would be applied in terms of the return of the business rate to local government, is also over and above the Barnett formula. The key question is: is it over and above the Barnett formula? That is our point and the main prize, because we will not take our structural funds expenditure out of our health and education expenditure; we need it to come directly from the Treasury and for it to be over and above the Barnett formula. That is extremely important.

**Elin Jones:** Mae swyddogion yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant wedi dweud yn gyhoeddus nad yw Amcan 1 yn bwysig i'r Deyrnas Gyfunol yn ei chyfanrwydd. A oes gennych unrhyw hyder, felly, yn swyddogion yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant i gynnal y trafodaethau gyda'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd er lles Cymru, lle mae Amcan 1 yn bwysig i'r dyfodol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r un egwyddor yn wir ynglŷn â chael arian cyfatebol uwchben yr hyn yr ydym yn ei gael o dan fformiwla Barnett. Pan oedd Glannau Mersi ac ucheldiroedd ac ynysoedd yr Alban yn derbyn yr arian hwn, nid oedd yr Alban na'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant, na'r adran arall yn Lloegr a arferai fod yn gyfrifol am wariant ar y cronfeydd strwythurol, yn derbyn arian

gronfeydd strwythurol ac na fyddai Cymru ar ei hennill yn y tymor hwy, neu a ydych yn derbyn yr hyn a gynigir gan Ewrop? Y farn gyffredin yw bod cronfeydd strwythurol yn llesol i Gymru a'u bod yn ddull hyblyg o ymdrin â'r problemau sy'n ei hwynebu. Ar ba un y byddwch chi'n mentro?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Y banciwr pwysig, sef yr un sy'n rheoli'r rwlét, os caf ei roi felly, yw Canghellor y Trysorlys, Gordon Brown, yn yr ystyr bod pob un o'r pedair plaid yn y Cynulliad yn gytûn nad oes fawr o ddiben inni gael cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd os nad oes cyllid ar eu cyfer ar ben yr hyn a geir drwy fformiwla Barnett. Yn ffodus, mae ein dylanwad ar Gordon Brown yn gyfryw fel bod y cronfeydd strwythurol wedi'u darparu ar ben yr hyn a geir drwy fformiwla Barnett, ac fel bod y £13 miliwn y cyfeiriais ato ychydig funudau'n ôl, mewn cysylltiad â'r arian a ddefnyddid wrth ddychwelyd trethi busnes i lywodraeth leol, hefyd yn cael ei gynnig ar ben yr hyn a geir drwy fformiwla Barnett. Y cwestiwn allweddol yw: a ydyw'n ychwanegol at yr hyn a geid drwy fformiwla Barnett? Dyna'r pwynt sydd gennym a dyna'r wobr fwyaf, oherwydd ni thynnwn ein gwariant ar gyfer cronfeydd strwythurol o'n gwariant ar iechyd ac addysg; mae arnom angen iddo ddod yn uniongyrchol o'r Trysorlys ac iddo fod yn ychwanegol at yr hyn a geir drwy fformiwla Barnett. Mae hynny'n bwysig dros ben.

**Elin Jones:** Department of Trade and Industry officials have stated publicly that Objective 1 is not important to the UK as a whole. Do you therefore have any confidence in DTI officials' ability to negotiate with the European Commission in the interests of Wales, where Objective 1 is important for the future?

**The First Minister:** The principle is the same as regards receiving match funding over and above the Barnett formula. When Merseyside and the islands and highlands of Scotland received this money, neither Scotland nor the DTI, nor the other department in England formerly responsible for expenditure on the structural funds, received money over and above the Barnett

yn uwch na fformiwla Barnett. Dywedwyd wrth Lywodraeth yr Alban i dynnu'r arian o'i chyllideb gyffredinol. Oherwydd bod dwy ran o dair o Gymru yn dod o dan Amcan 1, yr oedd yn amhosibl i ni wneud hynny, ac yr oedd yn rhaid dwyn perswâd ar y Canghellor yn 1999 a 2000 i'r perwyl hwnnw achos bod yr arian hwn yn llawer pwysicach i Gymru nag i Brydain Fawr yn ei chyfanrwydd. Cawsom arian cyfatebol uwchben fformiwla Barnett ar y sail hwnnw, ac mae hynny'r un mor wir ar gyfer y cyfnod sydd yn dechrau ar 1 Ionawr 2007.

formula. The Government in Scotland was told to take the money out of its general budget. As two thirds of Wales comes under Objective 1, it was impossible for us to do that, and we had to persuade the Chancellor of that in 1999 and 2000 because this money is much more important for Wales than for the United Kingdom as a whole. We received match funding over and above the Barnett formula on that basis, and that is just as true for the period beginning 1 January 2007.

### **Addysgu Cyfrwng Cymraeg mewn Addysg Bellach ac Uwch Welsh-medium Tuition in Further and Higher Education**

**C7 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar addysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg o ran addysg bellach ac uwch? (OAQ38781)

**Q7 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Will the First Minister make a statement on Welsh medium tuition in further and higher education? (OAQ38781)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ymrwymo i gryfhau addysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg mewn addysg bellach ac uwch. Mae'r cynnydd yn y ddau sector yn galonogol, ond mae llawer o waith i'w wneud eto cyn inni gyrraedd ein targed, sydd yn uchelgeisiol ond sydd hefyd yn bwysig.

**The First Minister:** The Assembly Government is committed to strengthening Welsh-medium teaching in further and higher education. There has been encouraging progress in both sectors, but there is still much work to do before we reach our ambitious, but important, target.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae'n amlwg nad yw myfyrwyr addysg bellach ac addysg uwch yng Nghymru yn cytuno â'ch asesiad bod y sefyllfa yn oleuedig ac yn obeithiol gan eu bod yn protestio ar hyn o bryd oherwydd y diffygion yn y system sydd yn golygu na allant gael cyrsiau drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Onid y gwir yw, er eich bod yn sôn am ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Cymru i addysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, nad oes gennych unrhyw gynlluniau ar gyfer dilyniant o'r sector gynradd i'r sector uwchradd ac i addysg bellach ac uwch, a, hyd nes y byddwch yn sicrhau'r dilyniant hwnnw a'i ariannu, mae eich geiriau o ymrwymiad i sicrhau Cymru ddwyieithog yn gwbl wag?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** It is clear that students in higher and further education in Wales do not agree with your assessment that the situation is enlightened and hopeful, because they are currently protesting because of the inadequacies of the system, which leaves them unable to access courses through the medium of Welsh. Is it not true that, while you talk of the Government of Wales's commitment to teaching through the medium of Welsh, you have no plans for continuity from the primary to the secondary sector and to the further and higher sectors, and, until you ensure that continuity and fund it, your so-called commitment to a bilingual Wales is nothing but rhetoric?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nac ydyw. Y targed ar gyfer addysg bellach yn 2002-03, er enghraifft, oedd 8,000, a chyrraeddwyd y targed hwnnw. Codwyd y targed wedyn i 9,000, a gobeithiwn y bydd y targed hwnnw yn 2003-04 hefyd wedi'i gyrraedd. Felly, yr ydym yn uchelgeisiol, ac yr ydym yn

**The First Minister:** No, it is not. The target for 2002-03 in further education, for example, was 8,000 and that target was achieved. The target was then raised to 9,000, and we hope that that target for 2003-04 will also have been achieved. Therefore, we are ambitious, and we are achieving or exceeding

cyrraedd y targedau hyn, neu'n mynd yn uwch na hynny. Yr ydych yn ceisio dweud bod protestiadau gan grwpiau o fyfyrwyr yn dangos nad ydym yn ddigon uchelgeisiol, ond ni allwch gymryd grwpiau o brotestwyr fel rhyw fath o fesur gwrthrychol o alw. Os ydych am ffurfio grŵp protest oherwydd bod gennych ryw fesur gwrthrychol newydd o'r galw, byddai gennym grwpiau protest ar bopeth. Mae'n rhaid ichi geisio mesur y galw, y gallu i'w gyflawni, a faint o adnoddau y byddai'n ei gymryd i hyfforddi'r addysgwyr a fyddai'n mynd i feysydd newydd lle nad oedd adnoddau Cymraeg o'r blaen, ac wedyn yr ydych yn cynyddu'r hyn y gallwch ei wneud yn y sectorau anoddaf fel eich bod yn eu cyrraedd.

2.40 p.m.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Is it the case, First Minister, that a ceiling has been set on the numbers of Welsh learners that any institution can register? This would mean that some organisations would have to refuse some prospective students who wish to learn Welsh. If that is the case, how will it help the Assembly Government's stated Welsh language aims?

**The First Minister:** It is important that we increase the capability to teach new subjects through the medium of Welsh, especially in more vocational areas. I think that I have mentioned in answer to questions over the past fortnight how much we encourage the active citizenship of 14, 15 and 16-year-olds in Welsh-medium secondary education to insist on a wider provision through the medium of Welsh, rather than the classic academic subjects in the sixth form or further education colleges. I have mentioned that Ysgol Gyfun Bro Morgannwg has asked for a hairdressing course through the medium of Welsh to be provided by Barry College, and that is currently being provided. However, you cannot always do that because you must be able to teach the hairdressing tutor, if he or she does not speak Welsh, how to teach the course through the medium of Welsh. We are gradually expanding that, and, as I mentioned to Rhodri Glyn, we have set demanding and high targets, and we have exceeded them in those cases.

these targets. You are trying to say that protests by groups of students point to a lack of ambition on our part, but I do not believe that you can take groups of student protestors as some kind of objective measure of demand. If you form a protest group because you have some new objective measure of demand, we would have protest groups on everything. You have to try to gauge the demand, the capacity available to meet it, and how much resource it would take to train the educationalists who would go into areas where previously no Welsh-medium resources existed, and then you increase what you can do in the more difficult sectors so that you achieve that.

**Laura Anne Jones:** A yw'n wir, Brif Weinidog, fod cyfyngiad wedi'i osod ar nifer y dysgwyr Cymraeg y gall unrhyw sefydliad eu cofrestru? Golygai hynny y byddai rhai cyrff yn gorfod gwrthod rhai darpar fyfyrwyr sy'n dymuno dysgu Cymraeg. Os felly y mae, sut y bydd hynny o gymorth i gyrraedd y nodau y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi'u gosod ar gyfer y Gymraeg?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n bwysig inni gynyddu'r gallu i ddysgu pynciau newydd drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, yn enwedig mewn meysydd sy'n fwy galwedigaethol. Credaf fy mod wedi sôn wrth ateb cwestiynau dros y pythefnos diwethaf gymaint yr ydym yn hyrwyddo dinasyddiaeth weithredol ymysg rhai 14, 15 a 16 flwydd oed mewn addysg uwchradd cyfrwng Cymraeg fel y byddant yn mynnu darpariaeth ehangach drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, yn hytrach na'r pynciau academiaidd arferol yn y chweched dosbarth neu mewn colegau addysg bellach. Cyfeiriaais at y ffaith bod Ysgol Gyfun Bro Morgannwg wedi gofyn i Goleg y Barri ddarparu cwrs trin gwallt drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, a darperir hwnnw'n awr. Fodd bynnag, ni ellir gwneud hynny ym mhob achos gan fod rhaid dysgu'r tiwtor trin gwallt, os nad yw'n siarad y Gymraeg, fel y gall gyflwyno'r cwrs drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Yr ydym yn ehangu hynny'n raddol, ac, fel y dywedais wrth Rhodri Glyn, yr ydym wedi gosod targedau uchel ac ymestynnol, ac yr ydym wedi rhagori arnynt yn yr achosion hynny.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Beth sy'n digwydd, fodd bynnag, os nad oes arian ar gael i'r colegau hyn? Sylwais, er enghraifft, nad oes unrhyw ddarpariaeth yng Ngholeg Iâl ond i ddysgu Cymraeg fel pwnc penodol. Felly, os dywedwch y gall pobl wneud y cyrsiau hyn, sut y gallant wneud hynny os nad oes darpariaeth? Beth a wnewch i sicrhau bod digon o arian ar gael a bod gan bobl ddigon o hyder i bwyso am hyn?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid dyna'r wybodaeth sydd gennyf fi. Rhestrir Coleg Iâl yn y papur gwybodaeth sydd gennyf ymhlith y tua dwsin o leoedd lle y gall cyrsiau newydd galwedigaethol gael eu dysgu. Rhestrir Coleg Iâl fel coleg lle y gallwch astudio cyrsiau blynyddoedd cynnar a gofal drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg.

**Eleanor Burnham:** What happens, however, if there is no funding available for these colleges? I noticed, for example, that there is only provision in Yale College to teach Welsh as a specific subject. Therefore, if you say that people can take these courses, how can they do so if there is no provision? What will you do to ensure that enough money is available and that people have enough confidence to push for this?

**The First Minister:** That is not the information that I have. Yale College is listed in the information that I have among about the dozen places where new vocational courses can be taught. Yale College is listed as a college where you can undertake early years and childcare courses through the medium of Welsh.

#### **Lefelau Gwerth Ychwanegol Crynswth Gross Value Added Levels**

**Q8 Janet Davies:** Will the First Minister make a statement on gross value added levels? (OAQ38784)

**The First Minister:** This is a fascinating statistical concept that has confused all of us who were used to thinking of gross domestic product as the proper measure of regional differentials and absolutes. The latest estimates published by the Office for National Statistics show gross value added in Wales in 2002 at £35.1 billion or £12,020 per head. That translates into a relativity per head of 78.8 per cent of the UK average. Estimates for 2003 are due to be published in December.

**Janet Davies:** Regional disparity of gross value added levels between the two NUTS II areas in Wales does not look quite as healthy. From 1995 to 2001, east Wales levels increased much more than those in west Wales, particularly if you consider them in pounds per head. Can you therefore justify your policies, which appear to disproportionately benefit the richer areas of Wales?

**The First Minister:** I do not believe that that

**C8 Janet Davies:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar lefelau gwerth ychwanegol crynswth? (OAQ38784)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r cysyniad ystadegol tra diddorol hwn wedi drysu pob un ohonom a arferai feddwl mai cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth oedd y dull priodol o fesur gwerthoedd gwahaniaethol ac absoliwt rhanbarthol. Mae'r amcangyfrifon diweddaraf a gyhoeddwyd gan y Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol yn dangos mai'r gwerth ychwanegol crynswth yng Nghymru yn 2002 oedd £35.1 biliwn neu £12,020 y pen. Mae hynny'n rhoi gwerth cymharol o 78.8 y cant y pen o'r cyfartaledd yn y DU. Mae'r amcangyfrifon am 2003 i'w cyhoeddi ym mis Rhagfyr.

**Janet Davies:** Nid yw'r gwahaniaeth yn lefelau'r gwerth ychwanegol crynswth rhwng y ddau ranbarth NUTS II yng Nghymru'n ymddangos cyn iached â hynny. Rhwng 1995 a 2001, bu llawer mwy o gynnydd yn y lefelau yn y Dwyrain nag yn y rhai yn y Gorllewin, yn enwedig o ran y swm y pen. Gan hynny, a allwch gyfiawnhau'ch polisiâu, yr ymddengys eu bod yn dod â budd anghyfartal i ardaloedd cyfoethocach Cymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni chredaf mai felly y

is the case. The problem is that when you go from the UK level to the Wales level, the statistics become much more unreliable, and when you subdivide within Wales, they become more unreliable and subject to an error margin again. There is much commuting across the border between the two NUTS II areas of west Wales and the Valleys and east Wales. If you commute across that border, the wealth that you create will be accounted for in the place that you work, but the GVA per head will be counted in the place of residence. If there is net commuting across that line, as there is on a pretty massive scale in south-east Wales, it can screw up the error margin in the figures even more. People are not interested in whether you work in Cardiff or Bridgend, for example—they are interested in what is the average wealth coming into the household. Unfortunately, GVA per head figures at that NUTS II level will miss that where there is net commuting.

**John Griffiths:** Do you agree that any marginal benefit to GVA in Wales from Las-Vegas-style super casinos under the proposed gambling Act will be far outweighed by the disadvantages—increasing gambling addiction, taking money out of the pockets of the people of Wales, often those least able to afford it, worsening debt, family breakdown and crime?

**The First Minister:** That is certainly one of the major purposes of the Bill, which had its Second Reading yesterday. It is likely to be amended, we understand, during the course of its passage through Parliament. We do not know what its final shape will be, particularly in terms of the part that refers to mega casinos. Ninety per cent of the Bill intends to do what you described, namely to make it far more difficult for people to become addicted to gambling by removing one-arm-bandit machines from chip shops, take-away establishments and taxi ranks where they do a great deal of damage. People visit such places for other reasons, but they can be tempted to gamble. However, with mega casinos, whether you like them or not, you must go to them; they do not come to you. They will not be on the high street. As I understand it, the

mae. Y broblem yw bod yr ystadegau'n mynd yn llawer mwy annibynadwy wrth fynd o lefel y DU i lefel Cymru, ac wrth eu hisrannu o fewn Cymru, ânt yn fwy annibynadwy ac yn fwy amodol ar lwfans cyfeiliornad. Ceir llawer o gymudo dros y ffin rhwng y ddau ranbarth NUTS II, sef gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd a dwyrain Cymru. Os cymudwch dros y ffin honno, cyfrifir y cyfoeth a grewch yn eich lle gwaith, ond cyfrifir y gwerth ychwanegol crynswth yn y lle yr ydych yn preswyllo. Os ceir cymudo net dros y llinell honno, fel y ceir yn helaeth iawn yn y De-ddwyrain, gall hynny beri mwy byth o gyfeiliornad yn y ffigurau. Nid ymddiddorir ynghylch a ydych yn gweithio yng Nghaerdydd neu ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, er enghraifft—ymddiddorir yn y cyfoeth cyfartalog a ddaw i'r teulu. Yn anffodus, ni fydd y ffigurau am y gwerth ychwanegol crynswth ar lefel NUTS II yn cynnwys hynny os ceir cymudo net.

**John Griffiths:** A ydych yn cytuno y bydd unrhyw fudd ymylol i werth ychwanegol crynswth yng Nghymru o gasinos mawr o'r math a geir yn Las Vegas o dan y Ddeddf arfaethedig ar hapchwarae'n cael ei wrthbwyso i raddau helaeth gan yr anfanteision—mwy o gaethiwed i hapchwarae, cymryd arian o bocedi pobl Cymru, a hwythau'n aml yn rhai sydd â'r lleiaf o allu i'w fforddio, creu mwy o ddyled, chwalu teuluoedd a throseddau?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn sicr, dyna un o brif ddibenion y Mesur, y cafwyd yr Ail Ddarlleniad arno ddoe. Mae'n debygol o gael ei newid, yr ydym yn deall, yn ystod ei hynt drwy'r Senedd. Ni wyddom beth fydd ei ffurf derfynol, yn enwedig gyda golwg ar y rhan sy'n cyfeirio at gasinos mawr. Mae'r rhan helaethaf o'r Mesur yn ceisio gwneud yr hyn a ddisgrifiwch, sef peri iddi fod yn llawer mwy anodd i bobl fynd yn gaeth i hapchwarae drwy fynd â pheiriannau hapchwarae o siopau sglodion, siopau sy'n gwerthu prydau parod a safleoedd taccis lle y gwnânt lawer o niwed. Aiff pobl i leoedd o'r fath am resymau eraill, ond gallant gael eu denu i hapchwarae. Fodd bynnag, yn achos gasinos mawr, pa un a ydych yn eu hoffi ai peidio, rhaid i chi fynd atynt hwy; ni ddeuant atoch chi. Ni fyddant ar y stryd fawr. Fel yr



Conservative Party's policy is that it believes that this is a commercial opportunity for every high street. The Government sees it as a regeneration opportunity to be restricted to derelict dockland areas where the casinos could unlock regeneration. It is important to note that there is a triple lock on the Bill: the Houses of Parliament must pass it and may amend it substantially, the Assembly will then have to decide whether it wants to amend the Town and Country Planning (Use Classes) Order 1987 to cover the building of mega casinos, and then local authorities will have to decide whether they want such casinos. There will only be one or two at the most in Wales, and every local authority must decide whether they want one because no-one can force mega casinos on local authorities that do not want to give them planning permission.

wyf fi'n deall hyn, polisi'r Blaid Geidwadol yw bod hyn yn cynnig cyfle masnachol i bob stryd fawr. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei ystyried yn gyfle i adfywio y dylid ei gyfyngu i ardaloedd dociau adfeiliedig lle y gallai casinos roi hwb i adfywio. Mae'n bwysig nodi bod clo trebl ar y mesur: rhaid i ddau Dŷ'r Senedd ei dderbyn a gallent ei newid yn sylweddol, bydd y Cynulliad wedyn yn gorfod penderfynu a yw am newid Gorchymyn Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Dosbarthiadau Defnydd) 1987 i gynnwys adeiladu casinos mawr, ac wedyn bydd awdurdodau lleol yn gorfod penderfynu a ydynt am gael casinos o'r fath. Ni fydd ond dau neu dri ar y mwyaf yng Nghymru, a rhaid i bob awdurdod lleol benderfynu a yw am gael un oherwydd ni all neb orfodi casinos mawr ar awdurdodau lleol nad ydynt yn dymuno rhoi caniatâd cynllunio ar eu cyfer.

### **Cyllido Cyfleusterau Chweched Dosbarth The Funding of Sixth Forms**

**Q9 Peter Black:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the funding of sixth forms? (OAQ38788)

**C9 Peter Black:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar gyllido'r ddarpariaeth chweched dosbarth? (OAQ38788)

**The First Minister:** Education and Learning Wales has provided local authorities with indicative allocations for sixth forms for the next academic year under its new national planning and funding system for post-16 learning. It will shortly notify authorities of their actual 2005-06 budgets, having reviewed and finalised the weighting factors appropriate to learning provision across Wales.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru wedi hysbysu awdurdodau lleol am y dyraniadau dynodol i gyfleusterau chweched dosbarth ar gyfer y flwyddyn academiaidd nesaf o dan ei system gynllunio ac ariannu genedlaethol newydd ar gyfer dysgu ôl-16. Cyn hir, bydd yn rhoi gwybod i awdurdodau am eu hunion gyllidebau ar gyfer 2005-06, ar ôl adolygu a phennu'n derfynol y ffactorau pwysoli sy'n berthnasol i'r ddarpariaeth dysgu ledled Cymru.

**Peter Black:** Do you share my concerns and those of some of the teachers' unions that the indicative increase in funding for ELWa is not sufficient to cover a proper transitional scheme for schools around Wales to ensure that they do not lose out significantly as a result of the funding changes? Do you not think that the Government needs to revisit this issue to ensure that schools will not lose funding as a result of the change in the way that sixth forms are funded?

**Peter Black:** A ydych yn rhannu'r pryderon sydd gennyf fi a rhai o undebau'r athrawon nad yw'r cynnydd dynodol yn y cyllid ar gyfer ELWa yn ddigon i dalu am gynllun trosiannol priodol i ysgolion yng Nghymru i sicrhau na fyddant ar eu colled yn sylweddol o ganlyniad i'r newidiadau i gyllido? Oni chredwch fod angen i'r Llywodraeth ailystyried y mater hwn i sicrhau na fydd ysgolion yn colli cyllid o ganlyniad i'r newid i'r dull o ariannu cyfleusterau chweched dosbarth?

**The First Minister:** We must accept that it is sixth-form and further education provision.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Rhaid inni dderbyn mai darpariaeth chweched dosbarth ac addysg

Four or five years ago, the Assembly accepted that the insane competition for bums on seats between FE colleges and sixth forms should stop, and that learners should be able to decide whether they want to attend a sixth form or an FE college or a combination of both. They could then choose the right combination of academic and vocational subjects for them, whether they were provided in an FE college or in a sixth form. I do not think that there can be any going back on that without a huge deterioration in value for money. It would be something of a novelty if the teachers' unions had all accepted the budget as being adequate. I have never known teachers' unions to say anything other than, 'Well, we would like more to be spent in education'. That is quite right, because that is their job. However, we must all recognise that in the budget proposals that were approved in draft form by the Assembly last week and which will return for final approval, ELWa will have an increased investment of £25 million next year, £45 million in 2006-07 and £57 million in 2007-08. There will also be a capital expenditure line for ELWa so that it can carry out some modernisation of the stock. I believe that we all accept that the stock, particularly in the FE sector, has been running down and has not been adequately modernised. Therefore, much better choice will be available in post-16 education in Wales.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** While no-one denies that funding for sixth forms must be adequate, do you agree that levels of deprivation must be given considerable weight? Furthermore, is it not right that we should consider the overall provision for post-16 education, of which sixth form education is a major, but not the only, part?

**The First Minister:** That was the point that I was making earlier. It is important that people realise that the choice is, and should be, in the learners' hands. It should be a matter of what is right for them, and not what provides additional income for headteachers or schools if they can increase the number of

bellach ydyw. Bedair neu bum mlynedd yn ôl, derbyniodd y Cynulliad y dylai'r cystadlu hurt am fyfyrwyr rhwng colegau addysg bellach a chyfleusterau chweched dosbarth ddod i ben, ac y dylai dysgwyr gael penderfynu a oeddent am dderbyn eu haddysg mewn cyfleuster chweched dosbarth neu goleg addysg bellach neu gyfuniad o'r ddau. Wedyn gallent ddewis y cyfuniad o bynciau academaidd a galwedigaethol a oedd yn addas iddynt, pa un a gynigid hwy mewn coleg addysg bellach neu mewn cyfleuster chweched dosbarth. Ni chredaf y gellir ailfeddwl am hynny heb beri dirywiad mawr yn y gwerth am arian. Buasai'n beth newydd pe byddai holl undebau'r athrawon wedi derbyn bod y gyllideb yn ddigonol. Ni chlywais ddim arall erioed gan undebau'r athrawon heblaw, 'Wel, caredm weld mwyr'n cael ei wario ar addysg'. Mae hynny'n berffaith briodol, gan mai hynny yw eu gwaith. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni oll gydnabod bod y cynigion ar gyfer y gyllideb a gymeradwywyd ar ffurf ddrafft gan y Cynulliad yr wythnos diwethaf ac a ddaw gerbron eto i'w cymeradwyo'n derfynol, yn cynnwys £25 miliwn o fuddsoddiad ychwanegol yn ELWa y flwyddyn nesaf, £45 miliwn yn 2006-07 a £57 miliwn yn 2007-08. Bydd llinell gwariant cyfalaf ar gyfer ELWa hefyd fel y gall foderneiddio rhywfaint o'r stoc. Credaf ein bod ni i gyd yn derbyn bod y stoc, yn enwedig yn y sector addysg bellach, wedi dirywio ac nad yw wedi'i foderneiddio'n ddigonol. Felly, bydd gwell dewis o lawer ar gael mewn addysg ôl-16 yng Nghymru.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Er nad oes neb yn gwadu nad oes rhaid cael cyllido digonol ar gyfer cyfleusterau chweched dosbarth, a ydych yn cytuno bod rhaid rhoi pwys sylweddol ar lefelau amddifadedd? At hynny, onid yw'n iawn inni ystyried y ddarpariaeth gyffredinol ar gyfer addysg ôl-16, nad yw addysg chweched dosbarth ond yn rhan ohoni, er ei phwysiced?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dyna'r pwynt a wneuthum yn gynharach. Mae'n bwysig i bobl sylweddoli mai yn nwylo'r dysgwyr y mae'r dewis, ac felly y dylai fod. Dylai fod yn fater o'r hyn sy'n iawn iddynt hwy, ac nid yr hyn sy'n rhoi incwm ychwanegol i benaethiaid ysgol neu ysgolion os gallant godi nifer y

pupils. Viability is an issue, and it will be different in rural areas where there are long travelling distances to the nearest FE college or to other schools. There is a gender balance issue and an issue in terms of trying to ensure that people choose the courses that are best for them. Frequently, that will be a combination of academic and vocational subjects. That erodes the historic boundary that has existed, but which is not fit for purpose in the twenty-first century, between the FE and sixth-form sectors.

disgyblion. Mae dichonadwyedd yn fater o bwys, a bydd yn wahanol mewn ardaloedd gwledig lle y mae'n rhaid teithio'n bell i gyrraedd y coleg addysg bellach agosaf neu ysgolion eraill. Mae mater yn codi o ran cydbwysedd y rhywiau a cheisio sicrhau bod pobl yn dewis y cyrsiau sy'n fwyaf addas iddynt. Yn aml, byddant yn gyfuniad o bynciau academaidd a rhai galwedigaethol. Mae hynny'n graddol ddileu'r ffin a geid yn y gorffennol rhwng y sector addysg bellach a'r sector chweched dosbarth, nad yw'n briodol yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain.

### **Polisïau Trafnidaeth Gyhoeddus yng Nghymoedd y De Public Transport Policies in the South Wales Valleys**

**Q10 William Graham:** Will the First Minister make a statement concerning the impact of his administration's policies on public transport in the south Wales Valleys? (OAQ38793)

**C10 William Graham:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar yr effaith y mae polisïau ei weinyddiaeth yn ei chael ar drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus yng nghymoedd y De? (OAQ38793)

2.50 p.m.

**The First Minister:** The better the public transport system, the more efficient the commuting system and the greater the participation in the economy. It also means that it is easier for 16 to 18 year-olds who do not have a car to get to their first jobs. Being able to commute by bus or train up or down the Valleys is better for everyone. This is what we have in mind for this incredibly important segment of the Welsh economy, which is linked together, where half of the population live within 25 miles of the centre of Cardiff.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Po orau fydd y system drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus, mwyaf effeithlon fydd y system gymudo a mwyaf fydd y cyfranogi yn yr economi. Mae hefyd yn ei gwneud yn haws i rai 16 i 18 mlwydd oed gael eu swydd gyntaf os nad oes ganddynt gar. Mae gallu cymudo mewn bws neu ar y trê'n i fyny ac i lawr y Cymoedd yn well i bawb. Hynny sydd gennym mewn golwg ar gyfer y rhan dra phwysig hon o economi Cymru, sy'n gydgyssylltiedig, lle y mae hanner y boblogaeth yn byw o fewn 25 milltir i ganol Caerdydd.

**William Graham:** Therefore, First Minister, you would agree that the transport divide is a major problem that underpins other social and consumer problems, particularly in finding employment. Those are the words of the Welsh Consumer Council. Can you demonstrate how your Government's policies will help to find employment for people in the Valleys?

**William Graham:** Gan hynny, Brif Weinidog, a gytunech fod y rhaniad a geir o ran trafnidiaeth yn broblem fawr sydd wrth wraidd problemau cymdeithasol eraill a phroblemau a brofir gan ddefnyddwyr, yn enwedig wrth iddynt geisio cael gwaith. Geiriau Cyngor Defnyddwyr Cymru yw'r rhain. A allwch ddangos sut y bydd polisïau'ch Llywodraeth yn helpu i sicrhau gwaith i bobl y Cymoedd?

**The First Minister:** You will have noticed that we are introducing low-cost bus travel for 16 and 17-year-olds. This parallels the free bus passes for over 60s. However, unlike the focus on the social life of over 60s, this

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Byddwch wedi sylwi ein bod yn cyflwyno teithio ar fysiau ar gost isel i rai 16 a 17 flwydd oed. Mae hynny'n cydfynd â'r tocynnau bws am ddim i rai dros 60 oed. Fodd bynnag, yn wahanol i'r pwyslais ar

measure aims to focus on employment opportunities for 16-year-olds. It has been done for precisely the reason that you highlighted. Someone's first job could be five or 10 miles away from where they live, and they probably would not be able afford a car until they had been working for a while and put a bit of money away. If 16 to 18-year-olds can commute to their first job until they have some savings, it makes an enormous difference to their economic opportunities at the start of their working careers.

**Peter Law:** Would you agree that one of the best examples of helping people in the Valleys to access job opportunities is the proposed reopening of the Ebbw valley railway line? Can you confirm that this is on target and that the contract will shortly be let to reopen the Cardiff to Ebbw Vale line, which will give my constituents in Blaenau Gwent, and others in the Ebbw valley, the opportunity to access economic, educational and social opportunities along the coastal belt?

**The First Minister:** We are very hopeful of the opening during 2006 of the Ebbw valley railway. I am aware that there is a degree of unhappiness in the Newport area that the link will solely be with Cardiff in stage 1. We are considering the possibilities in this regard by addressing Network Rail's issues surrounding the Gaer tunnel and the relevant signal box. We are trying to ensure that the connection to Newport will be available by 2009 at the very latest, and earlier if possible.

**Kirsty Williams:** Pensioners and 16 and 17-year-olds can only benefit from this administration's policy if there are buses to catch. My constituents in upper Swansea valley communities such as Coelbren, Ynys Wen and Pen-y-cae have fewer bus services than they did two years ago. Bus services are non-existent in the evenings and very few and far between at weekends. How will your administration tackle the problem of limited access to buses and no train services in these areas?

fywyd cymdeithasol y rhai sydd dros 60 oed, amcan y mesur hwn yw canolbwyntio ar gyfleoedd gwaith i rai 16 flwydd oed. Fe'i cyflwynwyd am yr union reswm a nodasoch. Gallai rhywun gael ei swydd gyntaf bump neu 10 milltir o'r lle y mae'n byw, ac mae'n debyg na allai fforddio prynu car hyd nes y byddai wedi gweithio am ychydig a rhoi ychydig o arian o'r neilltu. Os gall rhai 16 i 18 mlwydd oed gymudo i'w swydd gyntaf hyd nes y byddant wedi cynilo rhywfaint, gwnaiff wahaniaeth enfawr i'w cyfleoedd economaidd ar ddechrau eu gyrfa mewn gwaith.

**Peter Law:** A gytunech mai un o'r enghreifftiau gorau o helpu pobl yn y Cymoedd i sicrhau cyfleoedd gwaith yw'r bwriad i ailagor rheilffordd glyn Ebwy? A allwch gadarnhau fod hynny'n mynd rhagddo ac y caiff contract ei osod cyn hir i ailagor y rheilffordd o Gaerdydd i Lynebwy, a rydd gyfle i'm hetholwyr ym Mlaenau Gwent, ac eraill yng nglyn Ebwy, gael manteisio ar gyfleoedd economaidd, addysgol a chymdeithasol ar yr arfordir?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym yn dra hyderus y caiff rheilffordd glyn Ebwy ei hagor yn ystod 2006. Gwn fod rhywfaint o anfodlonrwydd yn ardal Casnewydd mai dim ond â Chaerdydd y ceir cysylltiad yng nghanam 1. Yr ydym yn ystyried y posibilïadau yn hynny o beth drwy ymdrin â'r materion y mae Network Rail wedi'u codi mewn cysylltiad â thwnnel y Gaer a'r caban signalau perthynol. Yr ydym yn ceisio sicrhau y bydd y cysylltiad â Chasnewydd ar gael erbyn 2009 fan bellaf, ac yn gynt na hynny os oes modd.

**Kirsty Williams:** Nid yw pensiynwyr a rhai 16 a 17 flwydd oed ond yn gallu cael budd o bolisi'r weinyddiaeth hon os oes bysiau sydd ar gael iddynt. Mae llai o wasanaethau bws ar gael i'm hetholwyr mewn cymunedau yng nghwm Tawe uchaf fel Coelbren, Ynys Wen a Phen-y-cae nag yr oedd ddwy flynedd yn ôl. Nid oes gwasanaethau bws o gwbl gyda'r hwyr ac maent yn brin iawn ar y penwythnosau. Sut y bydd eich gweinyddiaeth yn ymdrin â'r broblem o fynediad cyfyngedig i fysiau a diffyg gwasanaethau trên yn yr ardaloedd hynny?

**The First Minister:** You cannot have a bus service from every community in Wales to every other community in Wales. By providing the backbone of demand for a service by making bus travel freely available through free bus passes, it becomes far more likely that provision will be available to villages that would not have been reached under the previous dispensation. I am sorry to hear about the situation that you described in the Coelbren, Ynys Wen and Pen-y-cae areas of the upper Swansea valley. I would be grateful if you would write to me to explain what has happened, noting who the operator was and whether another operator has been sought to cover the area. However, you would probably not wish to dissent from the general proposition that providing free bus travel for the elderly gives the service a backbone and enables operators to plan in the knowledge that they will be recompensed for the fact that elderly people travel for free. Bus services are therefore provided in places where none previously existed. I am sorry if there are some contrary examples, but I am sure that they are in a small minority.

**Leighton Andrews:** Would you agree that public transport in the Rhondda Fach would be vastly improved by the development of the Porth-Rhondda Fach relief road? I reiterate my constituents' concerns that this road should be delivered.

**The First Minister:** I am not sure of the detail of the Rhondda Fach relief road's impact on public transport. Sometimes, relief roads have a reverse impact because, instead of going up valleys near to where people live and following main streets, they can make it more difficult to reach residential neighbourhoods. I am not sure whether this is true of the Rhondda Fach relief road, but it is a possibility. Perhaps you could write to me, noting the specific importance of public transport and the relief road.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni ellir cael gwasanaeth bws rhwng pob cymuned a'i gilydd yng Nghymru. Drwy gynnig sylfaen i'r galw am wasanaeth drwy ddarparu teithio am ddim ar fysiau drwy roi tocynnau bws am ddim, bydd yn llawer mwy tebygol y ceir darpariaeth ar gyfer pentrefi a fyddai y tu hwnt i gyrraedd o dan y drefn flaenorol. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf glywed am y sefyllfa a ddisgrifiasoch yn ardaloedd Coelbren, Ynys Wen a Phen-y-cae yng nghwm Tawe uchaf. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe byddech yn ysgrifennu ataf i egluro beth a ddigwyddodd, gan nodi pwy oedd y gweithredwr ac a geisiwyd cael gweithredwr arall ar gyfer yr ardal. Er hynny, mae'n debyg na fyddech am anghytuno â'r gosodiad cyffredinol bod darparu teithio am ddim ar fysiau i'r henoed yn rhoi sylfaen i'r gwasanaeth ac yn galluogi gweithredwyr i gynllunio gan wybod y cânt eu had-dalu oherwydd bod pobl oedrannus yn teithio am ddim. Drwy hynny, darperir gwasanaethau bws mewn mannau nad oeddent o'r blaen. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf os oes rhai enghraifftiau i'r gwrthwyneb, ond yr wyf yn siŵr mai ychydig iawn ohonynt a geir.

**Leighton Andrews:** A gytunech y byddai trafniadaeth gyhoeddus yn Rhondda Fach yn well o lawer os câi ffordd liniaru Porth-Rhondda Fach ei hadeiladu? Ailddatganaf bryderon fy etholwyr y dylai'r ffordd hon gael ei hadeiladu.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn siŵr beth fyddai union effaith ffordd liniaru Rhondda Fach ar drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus. Weithiau, caiff ffyrdd lliniaru effaith o chwith oherwydd, yn lle mynd i fyny cymoedd ger y mannau y mae pobl yn byw a dilyn y prif strydoedd, gallant beri iddi fod yn anos cyrraedd ardaloedd preswyl. Nid wyf yn sicr a yw hynny'n wir am ffordd liniaru Rhondda Fach, ond mae'n bosibl. Efallai y gallech ysgrifennu ataf, gan nodi union bwysigrwydd trafniadaeth gyhoeddus a'r ffordd liniaru.

## **Cwestiwn Brys Urgent Question**

### **Llifogydd Floods**

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi derbyn cwestiwn brys ar fater o bwys cyhoeddus gan Ieuan

**The Presiding Officer:** I have accepted an urgent question on a matter of public

Wyn Jones o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.34.

importance from Ieuan Wyn Jones under Standing Order No. 6.34.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y problemau a achoswyd yn ddiweddar gan y llifogydd yn Ynys Môn a gweddill Cymru? (EAQ39272)

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on the recent flooding problems in Ynys Môn and the rest of Wales? (EAQ39272)

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Bu i'r glaw trwm diweddar achosi llifogydd gwael mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru. Effeithiwyd ar 100 o ddarnau o eiddo gan y llifogydd, gydag Ynys Môn a rhannau o Wynedd a Chonwy ymhlith y gwaethaf yr effeithiwyd arnynt. Caf ar ddeall fod yr awdurdodau lleol wedi ymdrin â'r mater yn briodol a bod arolygon i'w cynnal i weld a yw'n bosibl gwneud unrhyw welliannau yn y dyfodol.

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** The recent heavy rain caused severe flooding in some parts of Wales. One hundred properties were affected by floods, and Ynys Môn and parts of Gwynedd and Conwy were among the worst affected areas. I understand that local authorities have dealt with the issue appropriately and that surveys will be undertaken to see whether any improvements can be made in the future.

Cynigiaf fy nghydymdeimlad i'r rhai yr effeithiwyd arnynt.

I extend my sympathy to those who were affected.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Diolch am eich ymateb i'r cwestiwn brys ac am eich ymateb ac ymateb eich adran ar y pryd: yr oeddech yn cydnabod y problemau a gododd ym Miwmares, yn arbennig, ac yn ne'r ynys yn gyffredinol.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Thank you for your response to the urgent question and also for your response and that of your department at the time: you acknowledged the problems which arose in Beaumaris, in particular, and in the south of the island in general.

Mae'n siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol bod gwerth mis o law wedi disgyn mewn cyfnod byr ar 22 Hydref. Yr wyf yn deall bod yr amgylchiadau yn anghyffredin a bod topograffi'r ynys yn ei gwneud yn anodd i gario'r dŵr i fwrdd yn fuan. Fodd bynnag, bu i'r llifogydd hyn achosi difrod sylweddol, nid yn unig i dai preifat, ond i nifer o fusnesau. Gwyddoch fod problemau ym Miwmares, Llangefni, Dwyran, Benllech a lleoedd eraill ar yr ynys.

I am sure that you are aware that on 22 October a month's worth of rain fell in a short time. I understand that the circumstances were exceptional and that the topography of the island makes it difficult to drain water away swiftly. However, these floods caused significant damage, not only to private houses, but also to a number of businesses. You know that there are problems in Beaumaris, Llangefni, Dwyran, Benllech and other areas on the island.

You will accept that there are several measures that we can look at to try to alleviate the pressure on these communities in future. We could look at improving the storm drain capacity, for example. We are also looking at improving river and sea defences in parts of Anglesey. I visited some of the worst affected areas with the Environment Agency and the county council, which will be drawing up a proposal and, eventually, presenting you with an application for funding under the flood

Byddwch yn derbyn bod sawl mesur y gallwn eu hystyried i geisio lleddfu'r pwysau ar y cymunedau hyn yn y dyfodol. Gallem ystyried helaethu'r draeniau llifogydd, er enghraifft. Yr ydym hefyd yn ystyried gwella'r amddiffynfeydd rhag afonydd a'r môr mewn rhannau o Ynys Môn. Ymwelais â rhai o'r ardaloedd a effeithiwyd waethaf gydag Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd a'r cyngor sir, a fydd yn llunio cynnig ac, yn y pen draw, yn cyflwyno cais i chi am gyllid o dan y grantiau amddiffyn rhag llifogydd. Yng

defence grants. Given your sympathetic comments so far, will you look favourably at such an application, as it will require substantial investment?

Finally, a number of properties are so badly affected that they are not able to obtain insurance cover due to flooding some two or three years ago. What discussions can you or the Government have with insurance companies? People have lost thousands of pounds, and businesses in some cases.

**Carwyn Jones:** I would be grateful for examples of people who are in that position. I do not doubt that there are people in that position, but it would be helpful to know who they are, if possible, and their circumstances so that we can examine the matter further.

Any applications for flood defence grants will be a matter that I will consider. An extra £5 million has been granted in the budget to tackle flooding over the next three years. We all need to realise that flooding is becoming an increasing problem, particularly in areas that traditionally have not been liable to flooding, certainly severe flooding, in the past. You are right to say that, in Anglesey, on the weekend of 22 and 23 October, 100 mm of water fell over a 16-hour period, which is the greatest amount on record. It is no surprise that flooding occurred as a result.

If there are plans to deal with the situation or for reducing the risk of flooding, I will try to consider them favourably.

**Eleanor Burnham:** You probably realise that since I have become an Assembly Member, I have written to various Ministers—including yourself—about the lower Dee valley, which particularly affects Trevalyn. During the last two weeks—*[Interruption.]* other than Anglesey, this is north Wales, Rhodri Glyn—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I need no assistance in interpreting the meaning of questions. When a question includes the words ‘and the rest of Wales’, even I understand what it means.

ngolwg eich sylwadau cydymdeimladol hyd yma, a wnewch edrych yn ffafriol ar gais o’r fath, gan y bydd yn gofyn buddsoddiad sylweddol?

Yn olaf, mae rhai adeiladau a effeithir mor ddrwg fel na ellir cael yswiriant ar eu cyfer oherwydd llifogydd a gafwyd ddwy neu dair blynedd yn ôl. Pa drafodaethau y gallwch chi neu’r Llywodraeth eu cael gyda chwmnïau yswiriant? Mae rhai wedi colli miloedd o bunnoedd, a’u busnesau mewn rhai achosion.

**Carwyn Jones:** Byddwn yn ddiolchgar o gael enghraifftiau o rai sydd yn y sefyllfa honno. Nid wyf yn amau nad oes rhai sydd yn y sefyllfa honno, ond byddai’n fuddiol cael gwybod pwy ydynt, os oes modd, a beth yw eu hamgylchiadau fel y gallwn ymchwilio i’r mater ymhellach.

Bydd unrhyw geisiadau am grantiau amddiffyn rhag llifogydd yn fater a ystyriaf. Rhoddwyd £5 miliwn ychwanegol yn y gyllideb i ymdrin â llifogydd dros y tair blynedd nesaf. Rhaid i ni i gyd sylweddoli bod llifogydd yn dod yn fwyfwy o broblem, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd na fuont yn agored i lifogydd, neu lifogydd difrifol yn sicr, yn y gorffennol. Yr ydych yn iawn wrth ddweud bod 100 milimetr o law wedi disgyn ar Ynys Môn, ar benwythnos 22 a 23 Hydref, dros gyfnod o 16 awr, sef y mwyaf a gofnodwyd erioed. Nid yw’n syndod bod llifogydd wedi digwydd o ganlyniad i hynny.

Os oes cynlluniau i ddelio â’r sefyllfa neu i leihau’r perygl o lifogydd, ceisiaf eu hystyried yn ffafriol.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae’n debyg eich bod yn sylweddoli fy mod wedi ysgrifennu at sawl Gweinidog—a chithau yn eu plith—ers imi ddod yn Aelod o’r Cynulliad am ddyffryn Dyfrdwy isaf, sy’n effeithio ar Drefalun yn benodol. Yn ystod y pythefnos diwethaf—*[Torri ar draws.]* heblaw Ynys Môn, yn y Gogledd y mae hyn, Rhodri Glyn—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid oes arnaf angen unrhyw gymorth i ddehongli ystyr cwestiynau. Os yw cwestiwn yn cynnwys y geiriau ‘a gweddill Cymru’, yr wyf fi hyd yn oed yn deall ei ystyr.

**Eleanor Burnham:** During the last two weeks, like Ieuan Wyn Jones, I went around the constituency and the region, even, looking at various flooded areas. I was concerned and—[*Interruption.*] Wellies and so on, yes.

3.00 p.m.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I advise Eleanor Burnham not to take interventions during a question.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I put pressure on the Environment Agency in relation to certain issues surrounding the lower Dee valley, to be far more proactive and effective in flood management, and to listen and take advice from local people. There are two former river authority personnel in our area who are particularly concerned. To cut a long story short, we have now agreed with the Environment Agency that two sluice gates on either side of the weir in Chester need to be opened, although the Environment Agency asserted it would cost £70,000 for a feasibility study. How can you help us to ensure that the Environment Agency listens to local concerns? That was my first question.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I think that was the question.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Thank you. The second question is—[*Laughter.*] Will the Minister use the excellent national flood forum to hold public events to raise awareness so that people know where they can go, because that is an important issue? Diolch yn fawr, Llywydd, for your indulgence.

**Carwyn Jones:** Chester was not in Wales the last time that I looked, although I accept that the Dee—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The river Dee is in Wales; I represent part of that area.

**Carwyn Jones:** I understand that the river Dee heads towards Chester. In terms of Eleanor's points, I would ask her to write to

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yn ystod y pythefnos diwethaf, fel Ieuan Wyn Jones, euthum o gwmpas yr etholaeth a'r rhanbarth, hyd yn oed, gan edrych ar wahanol ardaloedd lle y cafwyd llifogydd. Yr oeddwn yn bryderus ac—[*Torri ar draws.*] Gan wisgo esgidiau glaw ac yn y blaen, ie.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Cynghoraf Eleanor Burnham i beidio â derbyn ymyriadau yn ystod cwestiwn.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Rhoddais bwysau ar Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd mewn cysylltiad â rhai materion sy'n ymwneud â dyffryn Dyfrdwy isaf, gan ofyn iddi fod yn llawer mwy rhagweithiol ac effeithiol wrth reoli llifogydd, ac iddi wrando ar bobl leol a chymryd cyngor ganddynt. Mae dau o gynweithwyr yr awdurdod afonydd yn ein hardal sy'n arbennig o bryderus. Mewn byr eiriau, yr ydym bellach wedi cytuno ag Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd bod angen agor dau fflodiard ar ddwy ochr y gored yng Nghaer, er bod Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn mynnu y costiai £70,000 i gael astudiaeth ddichonoldeb. Sut y gallwch ein helpu i sicrhau y bydd Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn gwrando ar bryderon pobl leol? Dyna oedd fy nghwestiwn cyntaf.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Tybiaf mai hwnnw oedd y cwestiwn.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Diolch i chi. Yr ail gwestiwn yw—[*Chwerthin.*] A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddefnyddio'r fforwm llifogydd cenedlaethol rhagorol i gynnal digwyddiadau cyhoeddus i hybu ymwybyddiaeth fel y gŵyr pobl i ble y gallant fynd, gan fod hynny'n fater pwysig? Diolch yn fawr, Lywydd, am eich goddefgarwch.

**Carwyn Jones:** Nid oedd Caer yng Nghymru y tro diwethaf imi edrych, er fy mod yn derbyn bod Dyfrdwy—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae afon Dyfrdwy yng Nghymru; cynrychiolaf ran o'r ardal honno.

**Carwyn Jones:** Deallaf fod afon Dyfrdwy'n mynd tua Chaer. O ran y pwyntiau a wnaeth Eleanor, gofynnaf iddi ysgrifennu ataf gan



me with details, because she mentioned that a number of people are unhappy and I need more detail to answer the question properly. In response to her second question, it is a matter for the operating authorities, namely the Environment Agency and local authorities, to ensure that they are able to publicise potential flooding problems as widely as possible, so that people are as educated as possible about the problems that may arise.

roi'r manylion, oherwydd dywedodd fod sawl un yn anfodlon ac mae arnaf angen mwy o fanylion fel y gallaf ateb y cwestiwn yn iawn. I ymateb i'w hail gwestiwn, mater i'r awdurdodau gweithredol, sef Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd ac awdurdodau lleol, yw sicrhau y gallant roi cymaint o gyhoeddusrwydd ag y bo modd i broblemau a allai godi o ran llifogydd, fel y bydd pobl yn gwybod cymaint ag y bo modd am y problemau a allai godi.

## **Datganiad Busnes Business Statement**

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I have one change to report to this week's business. I will be tabling a no named day motion tomorrow to bring forward, from 10 November, a motion to recommend the appointment of the Auditor General for Wales. Business for the next three weeks is as set out in the draft statement, which can be found on the Chamberweb under supporting documents.

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Mae gennyf un newid i'w adrodd i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Byddaf yn cyflwyno cynnig heb ddyddiad trafod yfory i ddwyn cynnig gerbron, o 10 Tachwedd, i argymhell penodi Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru. Mae busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y mae wedi'i nodi yn y datganiad drafft, y gellir ei weld ar we'r Siambr o dan ddogfennau ategol.

Further to this morning's deliberations in the Business Committee, the Deputy Presiding Officer has made determinations under Standing Order No. 24.6 that the following items of subordinate legislation need not be referred to a subject committee for extended consideration: the Local Authorities (Calculation of Council Tax Base) and Council Tax (Prescribed Classes of Dwellings) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2004, the Local Authorities (Alternative Arrangements) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004, the Local Authorities Executive Arrangements (Functions and Responsibilities) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004, the Education (Listed Bodies) (Wales) Order 2004, and the Feeding Stuffs, the Feeding Stuffs (Sampling and Analysis) and the Feeding Stuffs (Enforcement) (Amendment) (Wales) (No. 2) Regulations 2004.

Ymhellach i'r trafodion y bore yma yn y Pwyllgor Busnes, mae'r Dirprwy Lywydd wedi penderfynu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.6 nad oes angen cyfeirio'r eitemau is-ddeddfwriaeth a ganlyn i bwyllgor pwnc i'w hystyried yn helaethach: Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Cyfrifo Sylfaen Treth Gyngor) a'r Dreth Gyngor (Dosbarthau Rhagnodedig ar Anheddau) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2004, Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Trefniadau Amgen) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004, Rheoliadau Trefniadau Gweithrediaeth Awdurdodau Lleol (Swyddogaethau a Chyfrifoldebau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004, Gorchymyn Addysg (Cyrff sy'n Cael eu Rhestru) (Cymru) 2004, a Rheoliadau Porthiant, Porthiant (Samplu a Dadansoddi) a Phorthiant (Gorfodi) (Diwygio) (Cymru) (Rhif 2) 2004.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes drafft? Gwelaf fod o leiaf 10 gwrthwynebiad. Felly, yr wyf yn gofyn i'r Trefnydd gynnig y datganiad busnes yn ffurfiol. Yna, galwaf ar Aelod o bob grŵp gwleidyddol i ymateb yn fyr.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there any objections to the draft business statement? I see that there are at least 10 objections. Therefore, I ask the Business Minister to formally propose the business statement. I will then call on a Member of each political

group to respond briefly.

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales adopts the business statement.*

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** You will be aware that we have made two requests for a debate on after-hours cover in terms of health provision in Wales. We have just received your reply that there will be no debate. That means that your response time is almost as bad as primary care response times. Given the level of concern about out-of-hours healthcare provision, as raised by one of your fellow Ministers—I know that you habitually ignore Carl Sargeant, but I presumed you would take some notice of Carwyn Jones and his concerns—we call once again for a debate.

I also ask for a statement on the future of Wrexham Football Club and the Racecourse ground. As someone who spent his formative years on the terraces supporting Wrexham—and I have fond memories of extending a warm welcome to supporters from Port Vale and Chester to the Racecourse ground—I would like the Minister responsible for sport to make a statement on the future of that important football ground.

**David Melding:** You will know that this morning I asked you to allocate time for discussion of the Gambling Bill. I noticed that one of your backbenchers pressed this point and in fact the First Minister made a somewhat turgid and certainly prolix response. A more systematic debate is required and we will oppose the business statement until time is allocated for a debate.

On post office closures, Crown post offices are now closing, which is a matter of great concern to our constituents across Wales. Now is the time to influence the decision that is about to be made because of its impact on the people of Wales given the comprehensive closure programme of sub-post offices. We are also distressed that the local government settlement was made in the form of a written statement. We believe that despite the fact that we had the debate later, the place for this

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn derbyn y datganiad busnes.*

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Gwyddoch ein bod wedi gwneud dau gais am gael dadl ar y gwasanaeth ar ôl oriau yng nghyd-destun y ddarpariaeth iechyd yng Nghymru. Yr ydym newydd gael ateb gennych yn dweud na fydd dadl. Mae hynny'n golygu bod eich amser ymateb bron cyn waethed â'r amseroedd ymateb mewn gofal sylfaenol. Yng ngolwg maint y pryder am y ddarpariaeth gofal iechyd y tu allan i oriau, fel y'u codwyd gan un o'ch cyd-Weinidogion—gwn eich bod yn arfer anwybyddu Carl Sargeant, ond tybiais y cymerech rywfaint o sylw o Carwyn Jones a'i bryderon—galwn unwaith eto am ddadl.

Gofynnaf hefyd am ddatganiad ar ddyfodol Clwb Pêl-droed Wrecsam a'r Cae Ras. Fel un a dreuliodd flynyddoedd ei lasoed ar y terasau'n cefnogi Wrecsam—ac mae gennyf atgofion hapus am estyn croeso cynnes i gefnogwyr Port Vale a Chaer i'r Cae Ras—carwn i'r Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am chwaraeon wneud datganiad ar ddyfodol y cae pêl-droed pwysig hwnnw.

**David Melding:** Gwyddoch fy mod wedi gofyn y bore yma ichi neilltuo amser ar gyfer trafodaeth ar y Mesur Hapchwarae. Sylwais fod un o'ch meincwyr cefn wedi gwneud y pwynt hwn a rhoddodd y Prif Weinidog ateb a oedd braidd yn rhwysgfawr ac yn sicr yn hirwyntog. Mae angen dadl fwy systematig a gwrthwynebwn y datganiad busnes hyd nes y neilltuir amser ar gyfer dadl.

Ynghylch cau swyddfeydd post, mae swyddfeydd post y Goron yn cau'n awr, ac mae hynny'n peri pryder mawr i'n hetholwyr ledled Cymru. Dyma'r adeg i ddylanwadu ar y penderfyniad sydd ar fin cael ei wneud oherwydd ei effaith ar bobl Cymru yng ngolwg y rhaglen gyffredinol i gau is-swyddfeydd post. Mae hefyd yn destun gofid i ni fod y setliad llywodraeth leol wedi'i wneud ar ffurf datganiad ysgrifenedig. Er inni gael dadl yn ddiweddarach, credwn y

important statement to be made was in the Chamber so that the Minister could have been questioned on it.

**Kirsty Williams:** I associate the Welsh Liberal Democrats with the concerns about proposed closure of Crown post offices throughout Wales, which is a serious matter.

On GP out-of-hours cover, there is widespread concern across Wales about whether the provision put in place by local health boards to cover out-of-hours medical care is adequate. There is huge confusion among patients as to what services they should be accessing and when. That has been compounded by the fact that a Minister in your Government publicly protested against the inadequacy of levels of service in his constituency. A month after the out-of-hours service was introduced in Wales, we must have the opportunity to raise concerns in the Chamber on behalf of our constituents. To run away from this issue confirms to the people of Wales that this Government has something to hide.

**Leighton Andrews:** The day after our final Plenary before the half-term break, United Polymers Ltd in my constituency went into administration. Fifty workers have lost their jobs and between 200 and 250 await the outcome. We are losing the Chubb factory further down the valley next year. Will the Minister for Transport and Economic Development make a statement on this? I know that his officials have met with the company's management as have representatives of the Welsh Development Agency. I have met the administrators who are seeking to sell the company as a going concern, which I am sure that you, and everyone else in the Chamber, would wish to be the likely outcome.

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** On GP out-of-hours services, the Government has no plans to debate this issue in its own time. On the issue raised recently in the local press, I understand that a meeting is taking place this afternoon between Primecare and the local health board to review the early experience of the out-of-hours service. I will not comment on the

dylai'r datganiad pwysig hwn fod wedi ei wneud yn y Siambr fel y gallesid holi'r Gweinidog arno.

**Kirsty Williams:** Cysylltaf Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru â'r pryderon ynghylch y bwriad i gau swyddfeydd post y Goron ledled Cymru, gan fod hynny'n fater difrifol.

Ynghylch gwasanaethau meddygon teulu y tu allan i oriau, mae pryder cyffredinol ledled Cymru ynghylch a yw'r ddarpariaeth a wnaeth byrddau iechyd lleol ar gyfer gofal meddygol y tu allan i oriau'n ddigonol. Mae dryswch mawr ymysg cleifion ynghylch pa wasanaethau y dylent eu defnyddio a pha bryd. Dwysawyd hynny gan y ffaith bod Gweinidog yn eich Llywodraeth wedi protestio ar goedd yn erbyn y lefelau gwasanaeth annigonol yn ei etholaeth. Fis ar ôl cyflwyno'r gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau yng Nghymru, rhaid inni gael cyfle i fynegi pryderon yn y Siambr ar ran ein hetholwyr. Mae'r ymgais i osgoi trafodaeth ar y mater hwn yn cadarnhau ym meddwl pobl Cymru fod gan y Llywodraeth hon rywbeth i'w guddio.

**Leighton Andrews:** Drannoeth ein Cyfarfod Llawn olaf cyn toriad hanner tymor, aeth United Polymers Cyf yn fy etholaeth i ddwylo'r gweinyddwyr. Collodd 50 o weithwyr eu swyddi ac mae rhwng 200 a 250 yn disgwyl y canlyniad. Byddwn yn colli ffatri Chubb yn bellach i lawr y cwm y flwyddyn nesaf. A wnaiff y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth ddatganiad ar hyn? Gwn fod ei swyddogion wedi cwrdd â rheolwyr y cwmni fel y mae cynrychiolwyr Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru. Cyfarfûm â'r gweinyddwyr sy'n ceisio gwerthu'r cwmni fel busnes gweithredol, ac yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod chi, fel pawb arall yn y Siambr, yn dymuno mai hynny fydd y canlyniad tebygol.

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Ynghylch gwasanaethau meddygon teulu y tu allan i oriau, nid oes gan y Llywodraeth unrhyw fwriad i gael dadl ar y mater hwn yn ei hamser ei hun. Ynghylch y mater a godwyd yn ddiweddar yn y wasg leol, deallaf fod cyfarfod y prynhawn yma rhwng Primecare a'r bwrdd iechyd lleol i adolygu'r profiad cynnar o'r gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau. Ni

reported remarks made by an Assembly Member in a personal capacity. The wider picture across Wales is of a relatively smooth transition between the previous system and the present arrangements. Jane Hutt will report to the Health and Social Services Committee at the end of November by which time most local health boards will have exercised their new responsibilities for some two months.

Rhodri Glyn mentioned Wrexham Football Club—no-one is more concerned about this than me, but the situation is currently sensitive and it would not be helpful to debate it in the Chamber.

On the Gambling Bill, it is too soon to give an indication of when this matter will be debated in Plenary. It spans several portfolios and Ministers will wish to consider how they consult Members on individual issues following the conclusion of the UK legislative process.

3.10 p.m.

On post office closures, although it is a non-devolved issue, Edwina Hart constantly monitors such matters. It is too soon to schedule a debate on the matter and I understand that Post Office Ltd is discussing options with the relevant stakeholders. We have no intention of departing from the Government's convention for handling the local government settlement, which has been in place since the Assembly's inception. Members will have an opportunity to debate the settlement later in the session. Leighton, on United Polymers Ltd, Andrew Davies, the Minister for Economic Development and Transport, together with the WDA, has been working closely with the company over the last few months to try to ensure its continued survival. He has expressed his disappointment about the appointment of the administrators last week, and he will continue to work closely with them to try to protect the jobs for Maerdy, as we realise the importance of that. At this stage, it would be premature to make a more detailed statement, but I am sure that Andrew Davies will keep you informed of any developments.

wnaf sylw am y sylwadau a adroddwyd a wnaed gan Aelod o'r Cynulliad fel unigolyn. Yr hyn a welir yn gyffredinol ledled Cymru yw newid cymharol ddiraffferth o'r system flaenorol i'r trefniadau presennol. Bydd Jane Hutt yn adrodd i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ddiwedd Tachwedd, ac erbyn hynny bydd y rhan fwyaf o'r byrddau iechyd lleol wedi bod yn arfer eu cyfrifoldebau newydd am ryw ddau fis.

Cyfeiriodd Rhodri Glyn at Glwb Pêl-droed Wrecsam—nid oes neb yn fwy pryderus am hyn na myfi, ond mae'r sefyllfa'n un dringar ar hyn o bryd ac ni fyddai'n fuddiol cael dadl arni yn y Siambr.

Ynghylch y Mesur Hapchwarae, mae'n rhy fuan i ddweud pa bryd y ceir dadl ar y mater hwn yn y Cyfarfod Llawn. Mae'n rhychwantu sawl portffolio a bydd Gweinidogion yn dymuno ystyried y modd yr ymgynghorant ag Aelodau ar faterion neilltuol ar ôl cwblhau proses ddeddfu'r DU.

Ynghylch cau swyddfeydd post, er mai mater nas datganolwyd ydyw, mae Edwina Hart yn cadw golwg ar faterion o'r fath yn barhaus. Mae'n rhy fuan i amserlennu dadl ar y mater a deallaf fod Swyddfa'r Post Cyf yn trafod y dewision sydd ar gael gyda'r rhanddeiliaid perthnasol. Nid oes gennym unrhyw fwriad i ymadael â chonfensiwn y Llywodraeth ar gyfer trafod y setliad llywodraeth leol, sydd ar waith ers cychwyn y Cynulliad. Caiff Aelodau gyfle i gael dadl ar y setliad yn ddiweddarach yn y sesiwn. Leighton, ynghylch United Polymers Cyf, mae Andrew Davies, y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth, ynghyd â'r WDA, wedi bod yn cydweithio'n agos â'r cwmni dros y misoedd diwethaf i geisio sicrhau ei barhad. Mynegodd ei siom ynghylch penodi'r gweinyddwyr yr wythnos diwethaf, a bydd yn dal i gydweithio'n agos â hwy i geisio diogelu'r swyddi i Faerdy, gan ein bod yn sylweddoli bod hynny'n bwysig. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'n rhy fuan i wneud datganiad manylach, ond yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Andrew Davies yn rhoi gwybod i chi am unrhyw ddatblygiadau.

*Cynnig: O blaid 31, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.*

*Motion: For 31, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

### **Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order**

**Janet Davies:** Point of order. I raise this point about written answers to questions. I asked the Minister for Economic Development and Transport about an increase in his budget line and I received a reply on 26 October stating that he would write to me shortly and that a copy of the letter would be published on the intranet and internet. Is it satisfactory that written questions should be answered in this way?

**The Presiding Officer:** This is not a matter for me, as I am concerned with matters that take place in Plenary. There is nothing that I can discover in the guidance on Assembly questions that refers to the length of time between a reply indicating a Minister's

**Janet Davies:** Pwynt o drefn. Codaf y pwynt hwn ynghylch atebion ysgrifenedig i gwestiynau. Holais y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth am y cynnydd yn ei gyllideb a chefais ateb ar 26 Hydref a nodai yr ysgrifennai ataf cyn hir ac y cyhoeddiid copi o'r llythyr ar y fewnwyd a'r rhyngwyd. A yw'n foddhaol i gwestiynau ysgrifenedig gael eu hateb fel hyn?

**Y Llywydd:** Nid yw hyn yn fater i mi, gan mai â materion sy'n codi yn y Cyfarfod Llawn y mae a wnelwyf fi. Nid oes dim y gallaf ei weld yn y canllawiau ar gwestiynau Cynulliad sy'n cyfeirio at y cyfnod rhwng ateb sy'n nodi bwriad Gweinidog i

intention to write and a letter. This delay does not seem inordinate to me, and I do not know whether there are special circumstances. However, the Minister will have heard that, and he does not seem to want to intervene on this point of order. I assume therefore that by raising this issue, honour is satisfied.

ysgrifennu ac anfon y llythyr. Nid yw'r oedi hwn yn ymddangos yn ormodol i mi, ac ni wn a oes amgylchiadau arbennig. Er hynny, bydd y Gweinidog wedi clywed hynny, ac nid yw'n ymddangos ei fod yn dymuno ymyrryd ar y pwynt o drefn hwn. Cymeraf felly ei bod yn gyfartal rhyngoch drwy godi'r mater hwn.

### **Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion Composite Motion: Approval of Orders**

**The Presiding Officer:** Under Standing Order No. 24.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

**Y Llywydd:** O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I propose that

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 24.25:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25:*

*1.a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 19 October 2004 on the draft regulations, the Oil and Fibre Plant Seed (Wales) Regulations 2004; and*

*1.a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 19 Hydref 2004 ar y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Hadau Planhigion Olew a Ffibr (Cymru) 2004; a*

*b) approves the Oil and Fibre Plant Seed (Wales) Regulations 2004 is made in accordance with:*

*b) yn cymeradwyo bod y Rheoliadau Hadau Planhigion Olew a Ffibr (Cymru) 2004 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*i) the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 13 October 2004;*

*i) y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Hydref 2004;*

*ii) regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 20 October 2004;*

*ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Hydref 2004;*

*iii) the memorandum of correction laid in the Table Office on 20 October 2004;*

*iii) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Hydref 2004;*

*2.a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 19 October 2004 on the draft regulations, the Care Council for Wales (Specification of Social Care Workers) (Registration) Order 2004; and*

*2.a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 19 Hydref 2004 ar y gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Cyngor Gofal Cymru (Pennu Gweithwyr Gofal Cymdeithasol) (Cofrestru) 2004; a*

*b) approves the Care Council for Wales (Specification of Social Care Workers) (Registration) Order 2004 is made in accordance with:*

*b) yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn Cyngor Gofal Cymru (Pennu Gweithwyr Gofal Cymdeithasol) (Cofrestru) 2004 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:*

*i) the draft regulations laid in the Table*

*i) y gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y*

*Office on 6 October 2004;*

*Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Hydref 2004;*

*ii) regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 20 October 2004;*

*ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Hydref 2004;*

*3. a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office, on 19 October 2004 on the draft regulations, the Local Authorities (Goods and Services) (Public Bodies) (Wales) Order 2004; and*

*3. a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 19 Hydref 2004 ar y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Awdurdodau Lleol (Nwyddau a Gwasanaethau) (Cyrff Cyhoeddus) (Cymru) 2004; a*

*b) approves the Local Authorities (Goods and Services) (Public Bodies) (Wales) Order 2004 is made in accordance with:*

*b) yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn Awdurdodau Lleol (Nwyddau a Gwasanaethau) (Cyrff Cyhoeddus) (Cymru) 2004 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:*

*i) the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 6 October 2004;*

*i) y Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Hydref 2004;*

*ii) regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 6 October 2004;*

*ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Hydref 2004;*

*4. a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 19 October 2004 on the draft regulations, the National Assistance (Assessment of Resources) (Amendment No. 2) (Wales) Regulations 2004; and*

*4. a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 19 Hydref 2004 ar y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Asesu Adnoddau) (Diwygio Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2004; a*

*b) approves the National Assistance (Assessment of Resources) (Amendment No. 2) (Wales) Regulations 2004 is made in accordance with:*

*b) yn cymeradwyo bod y Rheoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Asesu Adnoddau) (Diwygio Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2004 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*i) the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 6 October 2004;*

*i) y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Hydref 2004;*

*ii) regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 6 October 2004. (NDM2137)*

*ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Hydref 2004. (NDM2137)*

*Cynnig (NDM2137): O blaid 56, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 1.  
Motion (NDM2137): For 56, Abstain 0, Against 1.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelod canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Member voted against:

Burnham, Eleanor

Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

**Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau Deddf yr Asiantaeth Diogelu Iechyd 2004  
i'r Prif Weinidog  
Delegation of Functions of the Health Protection Agency Act 2004  
to the First Minister**

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiaf fod

*1. the National Assembly, acting under section 62(1)(b) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, resolves to delegate all the functions of the National Assembly contained*

*1. Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol ag adran 62(1)(b) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn penderfynu dirprwyo holl swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad*



*in or under the Health Protection Agency Act 2004 to the Assembly First Minister, save those which by law cannot be so delegated.*

*2. Nothing in this motion will have the effect of reducing the pre-eminence of the authority of the full Assembly or of reducing the role of the Assembly Committees in the exercise of the above functions.*

*3. This delegation will be made in the knowledge that those functions will, as appropriate, be further delegated to the appropriate Assembly Minister and to staff.* (NDM2139)

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae'r Asiantaeth Diogelu Iechyd yn gorff sy'n bodoli yng Nghymru ac yn Lloegr. A allwch ddweud felly pa gynrychiolaeth fydd gan Gymru ar yr asiantaeth hon? Gan fod yr asiantaeth yn ymwneud â diogelu iechyd, a fyddwch yn gofyn i'r asiantaeth ddatgelu gwybodaeth inni am y problemau sy'n bodoli yn ein hysbytai o ran methicillin resistant staphylococcus aureus?

**Jonathan Morgan:** I reiterate Rhodri Glyn Thomas's comments on MRSA and the spread of hospital-based infections. In the light of the transfer of power to deal with this area of public health to the Assembly, it would be an intuitive way of dealing with this new body if we were to instruct it at the earliest opportunity to undertake a piece of work on how the spread of hospital-based infections could be reduced and how the agency could advise the Government on the spread of MRSA. We recently saw the Minister washing her hands on a hospital ward somewhere in Wales, and barking on about the introduction of bottles of soap. Frankly, more needs to be done to prevent the spread of hospital-based infections and more must be done to limit the spread and development of MRSA—much more than merely promoting hand washing by nurses. I hope that the Government will instruct the new agency to examine the extent of the damage being done in hospitals throughout Wales and whether there should be specific recommendations for the Assembly Government and Assembly Members to

*Cenedlaethol sydd wedi eu cynnwys yn Neddf yr Asiantaeth Diogelu Iechyd 2004, neu sy'n dod o dan y ddeddf honno, i Brif Weinidog Cymru, heblaw am y rhai hynny na ellir eu dirprwyo yn gyfreithiol.*

*2. Ni fydd unrhyw beth yn y cynnig hwn yn golygu y caiff goruchafiaeth awdurdod y Cynulliad llawn na rôl Pwyllgorau'r Cynulliad o ran gweithredu'r swyddogaethau uchod eu lleihau.*

*3. Caiff y swyddogaethau hyn eu dirprwyo gan ei wneud yn hysbys y byddant yn cael eu dirprwyo ymhellach i'r Gweinidog priodol yn y Cynulliad, ac i staff pan fo hynny'n briodol.* (NDM2139)

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** The Health Protection Agency is an England and Wales body. Can you tell us, therefore, what representation Wales will have on this agency? As the agency deals with safeguarding health, will you be asking the agency to disclose information to us on the problems that exist in our hospitals with regard to methicillin resistant staphylococcus aureus?

**Jonathan Morgan:** Ategef y sylwadau a wnaeth Rhodri Glyn Thomas am MRSA ac ymlediad heintiau mewn ysbytai. Yng ngolwg y ffaith bod pŵer yn cael ei drosglwyddo i'r Cynulliad i ddelio â'r maes iechyd cyhoeddus hwn, peth naturiol wrth ddelio â'r corff newydd hwn fyddai ei gyfarwyddo ar y cyfle cyntaf i ymchwilio i'r modd y gellid cyfyngu ar ymlediad heintiau mewn ysbytai a'r modd y gallai'r asiantaeth roi gwybod i'r Llywodraeth am ymlediad MRSA. Yn ddiweddar, gwelsom y Gweinidog yn golchi ei dwylo mewn ward ysbyty rywle yng Nghymru, ac yn arthio am gyflwyno poteli sebon. A dweud y gwir, mae angen gwneud mwy i atal ymlediad heintiau mewn ysbytai a rhaid gwneud mwy i gyfyngu ar ymlediad a datblygiad MRSA—llawer mwy na dim ond hyrwyddo golchi dwylo gan nyrsys. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Llywodraeth yn cyfarwyddo'r asiantaeth newydd i ymchwilio i faint y niwed a wneir mewn ysbytai ledled Cymru ac a ddylid cael argymhellion penodol i'w hystyried gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ac Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Mae hon yn broblem ddifrifol sy'n effeithio ar lawer o bobl yng

consider. This is a serious problem that affects many people in Wales. Too many people go into hospital for one form of treatment and are being killed off by something that they did not have when they went in. The Government should take this seriously when considering what directions it wants to give to this new agency.

**Kirsty Williams:** In welcoming this agency I ask the Minister, with regard to the points made by Jonathan and Rhodri Glyn about MRSA, whether this agency will have access to the MRSA figures at acute hospitals in Wales. As colleagues will be aware, the Minister has these figures, but the rest of us are not allowed to see them because we might misinterpret them. Will those figures be made available to this agency?

**Alun Cairns:** I am grateful to Kirsty for giving way. Do you agree that it would be sensible for the Minister to publish those figures now, before the implementation of the Freedom of Information Act 2000, because come 1 January she will have no option?

**Kirsty Williams:** Yes, it would be sensible for the Minister to publish the figures on MRSA now. She has them, but according to the Minister we cannot be trusted with that information because we might misinterpret it. It strikes me that she can interpret it properly, but she thinks that we are too stupid to do so. More importantly, the public does not have access to that information and I would be grateful to know whether the new agency will have access to those figures.

Given the recent publicity on mumps outbreaks in England and Wales and the relatively low levels of take-up of the measles, mumps and rubella vaccine, with parents choosing not to have their children immunised, and the fact that this agency has a responsibility to consider issues on infectious diseases and control, will the Minister outline what she will do in conjunction with the agency to encourage more parents to take up the MMR vaccine at GPs' surgeries?

**Lorraine Barrett:** I ask the Minister to

Nghymru. Ceir gormod o bobl sy'n mynd i'r ysbyty ar gyfer un math o driniaeth ac yn cael eu lladd gan rywbeth nad oedd arnynt pan aethant i mewn. Dylai'r Llywodraeth gymryd hyn o ddifrif wrth ystyried pa gyfarwyddiadau y mae'n dymuno'u rhoi i'r asiantaeth newydd hon.

**Kirsty Williams:** Wrth groesawu'r asiantaeth hon, gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog, gyda golwg ar y pwyntiau a wnaeth Jonathan a Rhodri Glyn am MRSA, a fydd yr asiantaeth hon yn cael gweld y ffigurau am MRSA mewn ysbytai aciwt yng Nghymru. Fel y gŵyr cyd-Aelodau, mae'r ffigurau hyn gan y Gweinidog, ond ni chaiff y gweddill ohonom eu gweld gan y gallem eu camddehongli. A fydd y ffigurau hynny ar gael i'r asiantaeth hon?

**Alun Cairns:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Kirsty am ildio. A ydych yn cytuno y byddai'n beth synhwyrol i'r Gweinidog gyhoeddi'r ffigurau hynny'n awr, cyn rhoi Deddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000 ar waith, gan na fydd ganddi ddewis yn y mater pan ddêl 1 Ionawr?

**Kirsty Williams:** Ydwyf, byddai'n beth synhwyrol i'r Gweinidog gyhoeddi'r ffigurau ar MRSA yn awr. Maent ganddi ond, yn ôl y Gweinidog, ni ellir ymddiried y wybodaeth honno i ni gan y gallem ei chamddehongli. Yr hyn sy'n fy nharo i yw ei bod hi'n gallu ei dehongli'n iawn, ond ei bod yn credu ein bod ni'n rhy ddwl i wneud hynny. Yn bwysicach, nid yw'r cyhoedd yn cael gweld y wybodaeth honno a byddwn yn ddiolchgar o gael gwybod a fydd yr asiantaeth newydd yn cael gweld y ffigurau hynny.

Yng ngolwg y cyhoeddusurwydd diweddar am achosion o'r dwymyn doben yng Nghymru a Lloegr a lefelau cymharol isel y niferoedd sy'n derbyn brechlyn y frech goch, y dwymyn doben a rwela, gan fod rhieni'n dewis peidio â chael imiwneiddio eu plant, a'r ffaith bod yr asiantaeth hon yn gyfrifol am ystyried materion sy'n ymwneud â chlefydau heintus a rheoli, a wnaiff y Gweinidog nodi beth a wnaiff ar y cyd â'r asiantaeth i annog mwy o rieni i gymryd y brechlyn MMR ym meddygfeydd meddygon teulu?

**Lorraine Barrett:** Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog

ensure that she takes the message back to the medical profession that the Conservatives do not think that washing hands is crucial in stopping cross-contamination by MRSA. I am amazed at Jonathan Morgan's comments. [*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I will not have barking or barracking—or even 'Barretting'—in the Chamber. [*Laughter.*]

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** This debate is about the delegation of Assembly functions under the Government of Wales Act 1998 to the First Minister. We are all familiar with the process—it is taking forward this delegation and ensuring that it is made in Wales. We had an opportunity to scrutinise this in the Health and Social Services Committee meeting on 5 May and no amendments were proposed by the committee members—they were content with the provisions of the Health Protection Agency Bill, which has gone through Parliament. It is inappropriate to then try to open this up as a debate on the issues; this is a technical delegation of functions. However, I will answer Rhodri Glyn's point. He asked me to ensure that Wales's interests are taken into account by the Health Protection Agency.

3.20 p.m.

As the agency is an England and Wales body, I am committed to ensuring that Wales's priorities are reflected in its work. I am sure that you are aware of that, Rhodri Glyn, because its representatives attended a useful reception here. Also, Dr Parvaiz Ali, who is an expert physicist, sits on the agency's board as a non-executive member representing Wales. However, because Baroness Finlay of Llandaff raised this question in the House of Lords, it was agreed at governmental level that we should have further representation, so that the national public health service for Wales now has an observer in agency meetings. I know that Ilora Finlay was grateful to the Government for taking this issue on board.

sicrhau ei bod yn mynd â'r neges yn ôl at y proffesiwn meddygol nad yw'r Ceidwadwyr yn credu bod golchi dwylo'n hollbwysig i atal croesheintio gan MRSA. Synnaf at sylwadau Jonathan Morgan. [*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni chymeraf arthio neu heclo—neu hyd yn oed 'Barrettio'—yn y Siambr. [*Chwerthin.*]

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Mae'r ddadl hon yn ymwneud â dirprwyo swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad o dan Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 i'r Prif Weinidog. Yr ydym oll yn gyfarwydd â'r broses hon—mae'n rhoi'r ddirprwyaeth hon ar waith ac yn sicrhau y'i gwneir yng Nghymru. Cawsom gyfle i graffu ar hyn yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar 5 Mai ac ni chynigiwyd unrhyw newidiadau gan aelodau'r pwyllgor—yr oeddent yn fodlon ar ddarpariaethau Mesur yr Asiantaeth Diogelu Iechyd, sydd wedi mynd drwy'r Senedd. Amhriodol yw ceisio troi hyn wedyn yn ddadl ar bynciau'r dydd; cynnig technegol i ddirprwyo swyddogaethau yw hwn. Er hynny, atebaf y pwynt a wnaeth Rhodri Glyn. Gofynnodd imi sicrhau y bydd yr Asiantaeth Diogelu Iechyd yn ystyried buddiannau Cymru.

Gan mai corff i Gymru a Lloegr yw'r asiantaeth hon, yr wyf wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau y caiff blaenoriaethau Cymru eu hadlewyrchu yn ei gwaith. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gwyddoch am hynny, Rhodri Glyn, oherwydd bu ei chynrychiolwyr mewn cyfarfod croeso buddiol yma. Hefyd, mae Dr Parvaiz Ali, sy'n ffisegydd arbenigol, yn eistedd ar fwrdd yr asiantaeth fel aelod anweithredol sy'n cynrychioli Cymru. Fodd bynnag, gan fod y Farwnes Finlay o Landaf wedi codi'r cwestiwn hwn yn Nhŷ'r Arglwyddi, cytunwyd ar lefel lywodraethol y dylem gael cynrychiolaeth helaethach, fel bod gwasanaeth iechyd cyhoeddus cenedlaethol Cymru bellach yn sylwebydd yng nghyfarfodydd yr asiantaeth. Gwn fod Ilora Finlay yn ddiolchgar i'r Llywodraeth am ystyried y mater hwn.

If you want a debate about MRSA in the UK and how we in Wales handle the issue, you will know, as the First Minister has said, that our MRSA rates are lower than those of Scotland and England. [*Interruption.*] Do you want to hear them or not?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The Minister will be heard.

**Jane Hutt:** If Members want to raise the issue, then I tell you that, per head of population, according to bed use, it is 11 in Wales, 15 in Scotland, and 17 in England. Ours is the lowest figure. Surely, you recognise the importance of that figure. In relation to the information produced by the national public health service for Wales, to which responsibility has been delegated in terms of the Health Protection Agency Bill, the national public health service is taking responsibility, with the Welsh Assembly Government, for the healthcare associated—

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I hope that you are not hiding behind technicalities, Minister. There is grave public concern in Wales about the level of MRSA, and the public is entitled to know. Are you prepared to give us an undertaking to publish the total figures for Wales so that we can make our own comparison in relation to those in England and Scotland? Will you publish the full figures per hospital?

**Jane Hutt:** I have just given you the information. I published it now in this debate. It is 11 per 100,000 bed days. Is it not important that you have that information? The figures are 11 in Wales, 15 in Scotland, and 17 in England. That is what you asked me for, and that is what I have given you.

**Nick Bourne and Alun Cairns** *rose*—

**Jane Hutt:** I am not taking any further interventions. I am going back to Kirsty's points about—

**Nick Bourne and Alun Cairns** *rose*—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I cannot have two of you standing at once. Alun, I think

Os ydych am gael dadl ar MRSA yn y DU a'r modd yr ydym ni'n trafod y mater hwn yng Nghymru, gwyddoch, fel y dywedodd y Prif Weinidog, fod ein cyfraddau MRSA ni'n is na'r rhai yn yr Alban a Lloegr. [*Torri ar draws.*] A ydych am eu clywed ai peidio?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Gwrandewir ar y Gweinidog.

**Jane Hutt:** Os yw Aelodau'n dymuno codi'r mater hwn, dywedaf wrthyhych ei bod yn 11 y pen o'r boblogaeth yng Nghymru, yn ôl y defnydd o welyau, yn 15 yn yr Alban, ac yn 17 yn Lloegr. Ein ffigur ni yw'r un isaf. Yr ydych yn sicr o sylweddoli bod y ffigur hwnnw'n bwysig. Gyda golwg ar y wybodaeth a gynhyrchir gan wasanaeth iechyd cyhoeddus cenedlaethol Cymru, y dirprwywyd cyfrifoldeb iddo yng nghydestun Mesur yr Asiantaeth Diogelu Iechyd, mae'r gwasanaeth iechyd cyhoeddus cenedlaethol yn ymgymryd â chyfrifoldeb, gyda Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, dros y gofal iechyd sy'n gysylltiedig—

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Gobeithiaf nad ydych yn cuddio y tu ôl i fanylion technegol, Weinidog. Mae pryder dirfawr ymysg y cyhoedd yng Nghymru am lefel MRSA, ac mae gan y cyhoedd hawl i wybod. A ydych yn barod i roi ymgymeriad i ni y cyhoeddwch y ffigurau cyfanswm ar gyfer Cymru fel y gallwn ni eu cymharu â'r rhai yn Lloegr a'r Alban? A wnewch gyhoeddi'r ffigurau llawn am bob ysbyty?

**Jane Hutt:** Yr wyf newydd roi'r wybodaeth i chi. Fe'i cyhoeddais yn awr yn y ddadl hon. Mae'n 11 y 100,000 o ddyddiau gwely. Onid yw'n bwysig ichi gael y wybodaeth honno? Y ffigurau yw 11 yng Nghymru, 15 yn yr Alban, a 17 yn Lloegr. Am hynny y gwnaethoch ofyn i mi, a dyna a roddais i chi.

**Nick Bourne ac Alun Cairns** *a godasant*—

**Jane Hutt:** Nid wyf yn derbyn unrhyw ymyriadau pellach. Af yn ôl at y pwyntiau a wnaeth Kirsty am—

**Nick Bourne ac Alun Cairns** *a godasant*—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni allaf adael i'r ddau ohonoch fod ar eich traed yr un pryd. Alun,

that your leader stood first.

**Jane Hutt:** I am not taking any more interventions. I am responding to Kirsty's question on the national public health service, which is taking responsibility in Wales for those functions that, in England, are undertaken by the Health Protection Agency. Yes, we are promoting the take up of MMR, and we can give you the latest figures, and perhaps I can give them to the committee. Also, many of you will have seen a useful booklet in pharmacies.

**Nick Bourne:** Will you give way?

**Jane Hutt:** I will just finish this point first.

The booklet is available from pharmacies and general practitioners' surgeries, and encourages parents to consider information about immunisation across the board, including MMR. It is important that the national public health service takes this forward. In fact, that is part of its function. Take-up is being closely monitored, and I am happy to bring this back to the Health and Social Services Committee.

**Nick Bourne:** I am grateful to you for giving way on this issue, which goes to the heart of our work in the Assembly. Your Government has a commitment, which we all support, to openness and transparency. Since you are so confident, why will you not publish the figures per hospital so that we can see the rates of MRSA, make our own judgment, and then question you on them? Will you undertake to do that? It is important, as it goes to the heart of everything that you are supposed to believe in.

**Jane Hutt:** I have given information about MRSA levels today, and I also make the point that we must remember that the healthcare-associated infection strategy that I launched in September is important for all healthcare-associated infections. In terms of clarifying the issue, you know that, on that day, I also explained to people that MRSA represents only 3 to 4 per cent of all healthcare-associated infections in Wales. As

credaf mai'ch arweinydd a safodd gyntaf.

**Jane Hutt:** Nid wyf yn derbyn rhagor o ymyriadau. Yr wyf yn ymateb i'r cwestiwn a ofynnodd Kirsty am y gwasanaeth iechyd cyhoeddus cenedlaethol, sy'n ymgymryd â chyfrifoldeb yng Nghymru dros y swyddogaethau hynny a gyflawnir yn Lloegr gan yr Asiantaeth Diogelu Iechyd. Ydym, yr ydym yn annog cymryd y brechlyn MMR, a gallwn roi'r ffigurau diweddaraf i chi, ac efallai y gallaf eu rhoi i'r pwyllgor. Hefyd, bydd llawer ohonoch wedi gweld llyfryn buddiol mewn fferyllfeydd.

**Nick Bourne:** A wnewch ildio?

**Jane Hutt:** Gorffennaf y pwynt hwn yn gyntaf.

Mae'r llyfryn ar gael mewn fferyllfeydd ac ym meddygfeydd meddygon teulu, ac mae'n annog rhieni i ystyried gwybodaeth am imiwneiddio'n gyffredinol, gan gynnwys MMR. Mae'n bwysig bod y gwasanaeth iechyd cyhoeddus cenedlaethol yn hyrwyddo hyn. A dweud y gwir, mae hynny'n rhan o'i swyddogaeth. Cedwir golwg manwl ar y nifer sy'n ei dderbyn, a byddaf yn falch o ddod â hyn yn ôl i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i chi am ildio ar y mater hwn, a aiff at wraidd ein gwaith yn y Cynulliad. Mae'ch Llywodraeth wedi gwneud ymrwymiad, a gefnogir gan bawb ohonom, i weithredu'n agored ac yn dryloyw. Gan eich bod mor ffyddiog, pam na wnewch gyhoeddi'r ffigurau am bob ysbyty fel y gallwn weld y cyfraddau MRSA, ffurfio ein barn ein hunain, ac wedyn eich holi yn eu cylch? A wnewch ymgymryd i wneud hynny? Mae'n bwysig, gan ei fod yn mynd at wraidd pob dim yr ydych i fod i gredu ynddo.

**Jane Hutt:** Yr wyf wedi rhoi gwybodaeth am lefelau MRSA heddiw, a nodaf hefyd fod rhaid inni gofio bod y strategaeth ar heintiadau sy'n gysylltiedig â gofal iechyd a lansiays ym mis Medi yn un bwysig ar gyfer yr holl heintiadau sy'n gysylltiedig â gofal iechyd. O ran egluro'r mater, gwyddoch fy mod, ar y diwrnod hwnnw, wedi egluro hefyd nad yw MRSA ond yn gyfrifol am 3 i 4 y cant o'r holl heintiadau sy'n gysylltiedig â

elected representatives, you also have a responsibility to ensure that this information is put into perspective. I gave you this information when I launched the healthcare-associated infection strategy. Three to four per cent of these infections are MRSA, and we in Wales have lower rates than the rest of the UK.

Jonathan tried to pour scorn on what is critical in terms of the way forward in healthcare-associated infections, namely the use of alcohol gel at the entrance to every ward in our hospitals. That is a critical factor in terms of preventing infections. Ann Jones and I used this alcohol gel last week when we were at Glan Clwyd District General Hospital. This is best practice, it is clinically proven, and it is driven by our national public health service and is a key part of our work in relation to healthcare-associated infections.

On the issues that Nick—

**Jonathan Morgan:** Will you give way?

**Jane Hutt:** No, I am answering your leader.

On what Nick has said to me, there are problems around how we convey this information. There are great differences between trusts in terms of the acute sector in relation to risk and levels of infection, so it is difficult to give a good comparison. We do not want league tables, do we? I am sure that you recognise that. You know that the information is in an anonymised form at present, but I accept that we must ensure that we make the information available to the public in the best possible way to reassure them, to help them to recognise the risks, and to ensure that they have an understanding of, and are educated about, the risks in terms of healthcare infections.

**Kirsty Williams:** Will you give way?

**Jane Hutt:** No, I want to conclude now.

gofal iechyd yng Nghymru. Fel cynrychiolwyr etholedig, mae gennych chi gyfrifoldeb i sicrhau y gwelir y wybodaeth hon yn ei gwir oleuni. Rhoddais y wybodaeth hon i chi wrth lansio'r strategaeth ar heintiadau sy'n gysylltiedig â gofal iechyd. MRSA yw 3 i 4 y cant o'r heintiadau hyn, ac mae gennym ni yng Nghymru gyfraddau is na gweddill y DU.

Ceisiodd Jonathan wfftio'r hyn sy'n hollbwysig o ran y dull o ymdrin â heintiadau sy'n gysylltiedig â gofal iechyd, sef y defnydd o gel alcohol wrth y fynedfa i bob ward yn ein hysbytai. Mae hynny'n ffactor hollbwysig wrth atal heintiadau. Gwnaeth Ann Jones a mi ddefnyddio'r gel alcohol hwn yr wythnos diwethaf pan oeddem yn Ysbyty Dosbarth Cyffredinol Glan Clwyd. Dyma'r arfer gorau, fe'i profwyd yn glinigol, ac fe'i hyrwyddir gan ein gwasanaeth iechyd cyhoeddus cenedlaethol ac mae'n rhan allweddol o'n gwaith mewn cysylltiad â heintiadau sy'n gysylltiedig â gofal iechyd.

Ar y materion y mae Nick—

**Jonathan Morgan:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Jane Hutt:** Na wna, yr wyf yn ateb eich arweinydd.

Ynghylch yr hyn a ddywedodd Nick wrthyf, mae problemau o ran y modd yr ydym yn cyfleu'r wybodaeth hon. Mae gwahaniaethau mawr rhwng ymddiriedolaethau yn y sector aciwt mewn cysylltiad â risg a lefelau heintiad, felly mae'n anodd cynnig cymhariaeth dda. Nid ydym am gael tablau cynghrair, onid ydym? Yr wyf yn siŵr y derbyniwch hynny. Gwyddoch fod y wybodaeth ar ffurf ddi-enw ar hyn o bryd, ond derbyniaf fod rhaid inni sicrhau y darperir y wybodaeth i'r cyhoedd yn y modd gorau posibl er mwyn tawelu eu meddwl, eu helpu i adnabod y peryglon, a sicrhau eu bod yn deall y peryglon sy'n ymwneud â heintiadau mewn gofal iechyd, ac yn cael eu haddysgu amdanynt.

**Kirsty Williams:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Jane Hutt:** Na wna, yr wyf am derfynu'n awr.

This is about the delegation of a technical function to ensure that we now have the functions of the Health Protection Agency, through the First Minister.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I did not intend to raise an issue of order on this matter, and the Minister knows how much I respect her, but this is not a technical motion; this is a motion of delegation and a piece of primary legislation. The powers under the primary legislation reside with the National Assembly. This motion of delegation means that those powers are delegated to Ministers and, therefore, in my view, it is appropriate for Assembly Members to raise any issues that are relevant to the Act, for example, the agency's powers of direction. All of these issues are relevant. This is perhaps not the equivalent of the Second Reading debate in Westminster but it is certainly the equivalent of the Third Reading debate, and it is appropriate that Assembly Members should be able to raise all matters within the area of a particular Act when the powers under that piece of legislation are the subject of a debate on whether or not those powers should be delegated to the First Minister and to Assembly Ministers.

After that short seminar on the constitution, I call for a vote.

Mae hyn yn ymwneud â dirprwyo swyddogaeth dechnegol i sicrhau ein bod yn meddu'n awr ar swyddogaethau'r Asiantaeth Diogelu Iechyd, drwy'r Prif Weinidog.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid oeddwn wedi bwriadu codi mater o drefn ar y pwnc hwn, a gŵyr y Gweinidog gymaint yr wyf yn ei pharchu, ond nid cynnig technegol yw hwn; mae'n gynnig i ddirprwyo ac yn eitem ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol. Mae'r pwerau o dan y ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol yn nwylo'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Mae'r cynnig hwn i ddirprwyo'n golygu bod y pwerau hynny i'w dirprwyo i Weinidogion ac, felly, yn fy marn i, mae'n briodol i Aelodau'r Cynulliad godi unrhyw faterion sy'n berthnasol i'r Ddeddf, er enghraifft, pwerau'r asiantaeth i gyfarwyddo. Mae'r holl faterion hyn yn berthnasol. Efallai nad yw hyn yn cyfateb i ddadl yr Ail Ddarlleniad yn San Steffan ond mae'n sicr yn cyfateb i ddadl y Trydydd Darlleniad, ac mae'n briodol i Aelodau'r Cynulliad allu codi'r holl faterion sy'n berthnasol i Ddeddf neilltuol pan fo pwerau'r Ddeddf honno'n destun dadl ynghylch a ddylid dirprwyo'r pwerau hynny i'r Prif Weinidog ac i Weinidogion y Cynulliad.

Wedi'r seminar byr hwnnw ar y cyfansoddiad, galwaf am bleidlais.

*Cynnig (NDM2139): O blaid 57, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2139): For 57, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Gibbons, Brian

Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

**Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau Rhan 8 o Ddeddf Ymddygiad Gwrthgymdeithasol  
 2003 i'r Prif Weinidog  
 Delegation of Functions of Part 8 of the Anti-social Behaviour Act 2003  
 to the First Minister**

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** **The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** I Cynigial fod propose that

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol ag adran 62(1)(b) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn penderfynu dirprwyo holl swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol sydd wedi eu cynnwys yn Rhan 8 (adrannau 68, 71, 72, 73, 74, 81, 82, 83, 93 a 94) Deddf Ymddygiad Gwrthgymdeithasol 2003, i Brif Weinidog Cymru, heblaw am y rhai hynny na ellir eu dirprwyo yn gyfreithiol.*

*1. the National Assembly for Wales, acting under section 62(1)(b) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, resolves to delegate all the functions of the National Assembly contained in Part 8 (sections 68, 71, 72, 73, 74, 81, 82, 83, 93 and 94) of the Anti-social Behaviour Act 2003 to the Assembly First Minister, save those which by law cannot be so delegated.*



2. Ni fydd unrhyw beth yn y cynnig hwn yn golygu y caiff goruchafiaeth awdurdod y Cynulliad llawn na rôl pwyllgorau'r Cynulliad o ran gweithredu'r swyddogaethau uchod eu lleihau.

3. Caiff y swyddogaethau hyn eu dirprwyo gan ei gwneud yn hysbys y byddant yn cael eu dirprwyo ymhellach i'r Gweinidog priodol yn y Cynulliad ac i staff, fel y bo hynny'n briodol. (NDM2140)

**Brynle Williams:** I am sure that all parties will support the documentation laid before us. This legislation will assist and hopefully protect people who have to live in close proximity to excessively high hedges.

3.30 p.m.

Individuals may feel that if people do not comply with the legislation to cut hedges to the appropriate height, it will simply be a neighbour nuisance. In speaking with community safety officers in Wales, I have been told in general terms that this often leads to serious neighbour disputes and is, apparently, the major factor in neighbour disputes. This can ultimately lead to anti-social behaviour. When disputes occur, the police and local authorities are often called, which leads to extra pressure on services. If people do not comply with this new legislation they can be issued with an ASBO. There are four stages, however, before an ASBO is issued: a letter is delivered by the police, there is an interview with a station inspector, the person would be made subject to an acceptable behaviour contract, and then the ASBO is issued.

This legislation will give neighbours more power to deal with high hedges. Farmers have to cut hedges regularly every two years. People will know exactly where they stand. If people do not co-operate and still keep their hedges at an unacceptable height, they will have to pay the price. I understand from community safety officers that no money has been ring-fenced to support this new piece of

2. Nothing in this motion will have the effect of reducing the pre-eminence of the authority of the full Assembly or of reducing the role of the Assembly committees in the exercise of the above functions.

3. This delegation will be made in the knowledge that those functions will, as appropriate, be further delegated to the appropriate Assembly Minister and to staff. (NDM2140)

**Brynle Williams:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd pob plaid yn cefnogi'r dogfennau sydd wedi'u gosod ger ein bron. Bydd y ddeddfwriaeth hon yn helpu a, gobeithio, yn gwarchod rhai sy'n gorfod byw'n agos iawn i wrychoedd sy'n rhy uchel.

Gallai rhai deimlo mai dim ond niwsans o du cymdogion a achosir os na chydymffurfir â'r ddeddfwriaeth sy'n mynnu y torrri gwrychoedd fel eu bod o uchder priodol. Wrth siarad â swyddogion diogelwch cymunedol yng Nghymru, dywedwyd wrthyf yn gyffredinol fod hyn yn aml yn arwain at anghydfodau difrifol rhwng cymdogion a hwn, mae'n debyg, yw'r prif ffactor mewn anghydfodau rhwng cymdogion. Gall hynny arwain yn y pen draw at ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol. Pan geir anghydfodau, gelwir yr heddlu a'r awdurdodau lleol mewn llawer achos, ac mae hynny'n rhoi mwy o bwysau ar wasanaethau. Os na fydd pobl yn cydymffurfio â'r ddeddfwriaeth newydd hon, gellir cyflwyno gorchymyn ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol iddynt. Mae pedwar cam, fodd bynnag, cyn y gellir cyflwyno gorchymyn o'r fath: trosglwyddir llythyr gan yr heddlu, ceir cyfweiliad ag arolygydd mewn gorsaf, gwneir contract ymddygiad derbyniol â'r rhai dan sylw, ac wedyn cyflwynir y gorchymyn ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol.

Bydd y ddeddfwriaeth hon yn rhoi mwy o bŵer i gymdogion ymdrin â gwrychoedd uchel. Mae ffermwyr yn gorfod torri gwrychoedd yn rheolaidd bob dwy flynedd. Gwyddant yn union ble y maent yn sefyll. Os na chydymffurfiant drwy gadw gwrychoedd ar uchder derbyniol, rhaid iddynt dalu'r pris. Deallaf gan swyddogion diogelwch cymunedol nad oes unrhyw arian wedi'i

legislation. How can we expect local authorities to deliver if funding is not made available to them? We need to consider this seriously, Minister, to make it a success. I look forward to hearing your views on this, and I hope that you will mention discussions that you have had and will ask the Finance Minister to support local authorities.

**Sandy Mewies:** It was my understanding, Minister, that local authorities would be able to charge a fee if a complaint was made, and that they would judge that fee. I understand that this is just guidance on the particular way that local authorities should handle these complaints and it gives them the authority to do so. I have dealt with many cases of high hedges and trees, as a county councillor and an Assembly Member—as I am sure many Members have—and I hope that you will tell local authorities to bring this part of the Act into being as soon as possible. I have some cases that have been outstanding for a considerable time—as others will have—and local authorities and those making these complaints must know immediately that this can start, because some complaints have gone on for 15 or 20 years.

**Mick Bates:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome this piece of legislation and the whole process of ASBOs. Sandy raised an important point about the timing and the urgency in many cases where high hedges have been a nuisance to many people. Brynle's point about the regulation and its impact on farmers cutting hedges needs to be answered, Minister. Does that apply to all parts of land in their ownership—for example, if a cottage's view was blocked by a hedge and the landowner who was responsible for that hedge refused to cut it, although it was not next to a highway, would they be subject to an ASBO to cut that hedge?

**Helen Mary Jones:** I welcome the implementation of this part of this legislation. It seems slightly strange perhaps that this comes under anti-social behaviour

glustnodi ar gyfer yr eitem ddeddfwriaeth newydd hon. Sut y gallwn ddisgwyl i awdurdodau lleol roi hyn ar waith os na roddir cyllid iddynt? Rhaid inni ystyried hyn o ddifrif, Weinidog, er mwyn sicrhau ei lwyddiant. Edrychaf ymlaen at glywed eich barn am hyn, a gobeithiaf y byddwch yn crybwyll trafodaethau a gawsoch ac yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog Cyllid gynorthwyo awdurdodau lleol.

**Sandy Mewies:** Yr oeddwn i'n deall, Weinidog, y byddai awdurdodau lleol yn cael codi ffi os gwneid cwyn, ac mai hwy a fyddai'n pennu'r ffi honno. Deallaf mai dim ond canllawiau yw'r rhain ar y modd penodol y dylai awdurdodau lleol drafod y cwynion hyn a'u bod yn eu hawdurdodi i wneud hynny. Yr wyf wedi ymdrin â sawl achos lle y ceid gwrychoedd a choed uchel, fel cynghorydd sir ac fel Aelod o'r Cynulliad—fel y mae sawl Aelod, yr wyf yn siŵr—a gobeithiaf y byddwch yn dweud wrth awdurdodau lleol am roi'r rhan hon o'r Ddeddf ar waith cyn gynted ag y bo modd. Mae gennyf rai achosion sy'n aros i gael eu penderfynu ers cryn amser—fel y bydd gan eraill—a rhaid i awdurdodau lleol a'r rhai sy'n gwneud y cwynion hynny gael gwybod ar unwaith y gellir rhoi hyn ar waith, gan fod rhai cwynion wedi parhau am 15 i 20 mlynedd.

**Mick Bates:** Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n croesawu'r eitem ddeddfwriaeth hon a holl broses y gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol. Cododd Sandy bwynt pwysig ynghylch yr amseru a'r brys mewn sawl achos lle y bu gwrychoedd yn niwsans i lawer o bobl. Weinidog, rhaid ateb y pwynt a wnaeth Brynle am y rheoliad a'i effaith ar dorri gwrychoedd gan ffermwyr. A yw hynny'n berthnasol i'r holl ddarnau o dir sy'n eiddo iddynt—er enghraifft, os oedd gwrych yn cuddio'r olygfa o fwthyn a'r perchennog tir a oedd yn gyfrifol am y gwrych hwnnw'n gwrthod ei dorri, er nad oedd ger priffordd, a wneid gorchymyn ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yn ei erbyn i dorri'r gwrych hwnnw?

**Helen Mary Jones:** Croesawaf y ffaith bod y rhan hon o'r ddeddfwriaeth yn cael ei rhoi ar waith. Ymddengys yn rhyfedd braidd, o bosibl, fod y mater hwn yn dod o dan

legislation. However, as Sandy Mewies mentioned, many families have to live with high hedges and we must think about what that means. It means that the light of your property is affected, and, in some cases, there are concerns with trees about danger and safety. This is a serious issue, therefore, and we welcome this implementation. I associate myself with all the remarks that have been made to the Minister about the urgency of getting local authorities to address this problem. Some authorities with whom I have raised these problems in the past have been fairly unsympathetic about the seriousness of this issue. However, we now have the legislation, and I hope that the Minister will give strong guidance to ensure that all local authorities across Wales take the issue seriously.

**Brynle Williams:** As well as hedge height there is an awful lot of trouble with high hedges interfering with drainage and private properties. This plays a major part in neighbour confrontations. Massive hedges and their roots cause problems.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I concur with Brynle Williams's comments. Such hedges seriously affect people's properties and we must ensure that all local authorities take this issue seriously and give it priority where appropriate.

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** Complaints can be made within the system, but they are subject to a fee. Local authorities set their own fees and, therefore, there is no need for additional financial support.

The complaints system will be operational by the end of 2004. A complainant will be required to prove that the hedge in question comprises wholly or predominantly of a line of two or more evergreen or semi-evergreen trees or shrubs, that it is over 2 metres high, that it acts, to some degree, as a barrier to light or access and, because of its site, that it is adversely affecting the complainant's

ddeddfwriaeth ar ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol. Er hynny, fel y dywedodd Sandy Mewies, mae llawer o deuluoedd yn gorfod dioddef gwrychoedd uchel a rhaid inni ystyried canlyniadau hynny. Mae'n effeithio ar y golau a ddaw i'ch tŷ, ac, mewn rhai achosion, mae pryderon ynghylch perygl a diogelwch mewn cysylltiad â choed. Mae hyn yn fater pwysig, felly, a chroesawn y ffaith ei bod yn cael ei rhoi ar waith. Cysylltaf fy hun â'r holl sylwadau i'r Gweinidog ynghylch yr angen i beri i awdurdodau lleol ymdrin â'r broblem hon ar frys. Mae rhai awdurdodau lleol yr wyf wedi codi'r mater hwn gyda hwy yn y gorffennol wedi bod yn eithaf amharod i dderbyn bod y mater hwn yn un difrifol. Fodd bynnag, mae gennym ddeddfwriaeth ar hyn yn awr, a gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn rhoi canllawiau cadarn i sicrhau y bydd pob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru'n cymryd y mater hwn o ddifrif.

**Brynle Williams:** Yn ogystal ag uchder gwrychoedd, ceir llawer iawn o drafferthion am fod gwrychoedd uchel yn amharu ar ddraeniad a thai preifat. Mae hyn yn cyfrannu'n helaeth at wrthdaro rhwng cymdogion. Mae gwrychoedd anferth a'u gwreiddiau'n peri problemau.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yr wyf yn cyd-fynd â'r sylwadau a wnaeth Brynle Williams. Mae gwrychoedd o'r fath yn amharu'n ddifawr ar eiddo pobl a rhaid inni sicrhau y bydd yr holl awdurdodau lleol yn cymryd y mater hwn o ddifrif ac yn rhoi blaenoriaeth iddo os yw hynny'n briodol.

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Gellir gwneud cwynion o fewn y system, ond codir ffi am hynny. Awdurdodau lleol sy'n pennu eu ffioedd eu hunain ac, felly, nid oes angen cymorth ariannol ychwanegol.

Bydd y system gwyno ar waith erbyn diwedd 2004. Bydd yn ofynnol i achwynydd profi bod y gwrych dan sylw wedi'i ffurfio'n bennaf neu'n gyfan gwbl o linell o ddwy neu ragor o brysgwydd neu goed bytholwyrdd neu led-fytholwyrdd, ei fod yn uwch na 2 fedr, ei fod, i ryw raddau, yn rhwystro golau neu fynediad ac, oherwydd ei leoliad, ei fod yn amharu ar fwynhad rhesymol yr

reasonable enjoyment of his or her domestic property. Local authorities have the power to investigate complaints, but there will be a right of appeal to the Assembly against either a remedial notice—where the local authority upholds a complaint—or any other decision by a local authority on a complaint, for example, a refusal to uphold a complaint. Therefore, there is a right of appeal to the Assembly against a decision by a local authority.

Roots are covered by existing law. If roots enter into a person's property and cause a nuisance, under law it is possible for that person to take action. The legislation on high hedges provides redress for people, which was not available under existing law, who have suffered for a long time because of high hedges and loss of light or access to their properties. This is an excellent piece of legislation that has been widely supported. I am sure that some of the queries that Members may have can be ironed out during the course of the next week or so, and certainly in the committee meeting tomorrow. It is intended that the system will be operational by the end of the year.

achwynydd o'i eiddo domestig. Mae pŵer gan awdurdodau lleol i ymchwilio i gwynion, ond bydd hawl i apelio at y Cynulliad yn erbyn un ai rhybudd i wella—os yw awdurdod lleol yn cadarnhau cwyn—neu unrhyw benderfyniad arall gan awdurdod lleol, er enghraifft, gwrthodiad i gadarnhau cwyn. Felly, mae hawl i apelio at y Cynulliad yn erbyn penderfyniad gan awdurdod lleol.

Mae darpariaeth ynghylch gwreiddiau o dan ddeddfwriaeth sy'n bod eisoes. Os yw gwreiddiau'n ymledu i eiddo rhywun ac yn peri niwsans, mae modd iddo gymryd camau o dan y gyfraith. Mae'r ddeddfwriaeth ar wrychoedd uchel yn cynnig modd i unioni cam, nad oedd ar gael o dan y gyfraith cynt, yn achos rhai sydd wedi dioddef yn hir oherwydd gwrychoedd uchel a cholli golau neu fynediad i'w heiddo. Mae hon yn eitem ddeddfwriaeth ragorol a gefnogwyd yn gyffredinol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gellir ateb rhai o'r cwestiynau sydd gan Aelodau yn ystod yr wythnosau nesaf, ac yn sicr yng nghyfarfod y pwyllgor yfory. Mae'n fwriad y bydd y system ar waith erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn.

*Cynnig (NDM2140): O blaid 57, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2140): For 57, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine

Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

### **Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau Deddf Addysg Uwch 2004 i'r Prif Weinidog Delegation of Functions of the Higher Education Act 2004 to the First Minister**

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1 and 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams and amendments 3, 4, 5 and 6 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams a gwelliannau 3, 4, 5 a 6 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiau fod

*1. the National Assembly, acting under section 62(1)(b) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, resolves to delegate the functions of the National Assembly contained in and under the Higher Education Act 2004 to the First Minister, save those which by law cannot be so delegated.*

*1. Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol ag adran 62(1)(b) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn penderfynu dirprwyo holl swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol sydd wedi eu cynnwys yn Neddf Addysg Uwch 2004, neu sy'n dod o dan y ddeddf honno, i Brif Weinidog Cymru, heblaw am y rhai hynny na ellir eu dirprwyo yn gyfreithiol.*

*2. Nothing in this motion will have the effect of reducing the pre-eminence of the authority of the full Assembly or of reducing the role of*

*2. Ni fydd unrhyw beth yn y cynnig hwn yn golygu y caiff goruchafiaeth awdurdod y Cynulliad llawn na rôl Pwyllgorau'r*

*the Assembly committees in the exercise of the above function.*

*3. This delegation will be made in the knowledge that those functions will, as appropriate, be further delegated to the appropriate Assembly Minister and to staff. (NDM2138)*

The Higher Education Act 2004 received Royal Assent on 1 July, and today I move that these functions be delegated to the First Minister. The Act contains significant new powers for the Assembly to determine tuition fee and student support arrangements in Wales from 2006. These powers will enable the Assembly Government to keep to its commitment not to introduce variable fees in the lifetime of this Assembly. The Assembly Government will also keep to its commitment that higher education institutions will not be disadvantaged by not being able to charge variable fees in the lifetime of this Assembly. The independent study into the devolution of the student support and tuition fee regime in Wales, chaired by Professor Teresa Rees, has met regularly since 15 July, and will report to me in February and April 2005. I will propose a way forward on the best funding and student support regime for higher education in Wales based on the evidence of this independent study.

'Reaching Higher' has set our agenda for change and development in higher education and we will ensure that the tuition fee and student support arrangements in Wales from 2006 will support our vision for the sector.

**Leanne Wood:** You said that the Assembly and not Westminster will decide the level of university fees. In light of that, do you believe that the Rees commission, which you set up, is a waste of money?

**Jane Davidson:** The Rees commission will advise the Assembly Government on the best way forward and ensure that our universities are properly funded and that our widening access agenda for students is not compromised.

*Cynulliad o ran gweithredu'r swyddogaethau uchod eu lleihau.*

*3. Caiff y swyddogaethau hyn eu dirprwyo gan ei gwneud yn hysbys y byddant yn cael eu dirprwyo ymhellach i'r Gweinidog priodol yn y Cynulliad ac i staff, fel y bo hynny'n briodol. (NDM2138)*

Rhodddwyd Cydsyniad Brenhinol i Ddeddf Addysg Uwch 2004 ar 1 Gorffennaf, a chynigiad heddiw y dylid dirprwyo'r swyddogaethau hyn i'r Prif Weinidog. Mae'r Ddeddf yn cynnwys pwerau newydd o bwys i'r Cynulliad gael pennu'r trefniadau ar gyfer ffioedd dysgu a chymorth i fyfyrwyr yng Nghymru o 2006. Bydd y pwerau hyn yn galluogi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ddal at ei hymrwymiad i beidio â chyflwyno ffioedd amrywiadwy yn ystod oes y Cynulliad hwn. Bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad hefyd yn dal at ei hymrwymiad i sicrhau na roddir sefydliadau addysg uwch dan anfantais am na allant godi ffioedd amrywiadwy yn ystod oes y Cynulliad hwn. Mae'r rhai sy'n cynnal yr astudiaeth annibynnol ar ddatganoli'r gyfundrefn cymorth i fyfyrwyr a ffioedd dysgu i Gymru, o dan gadeiryddiaeth yr Athro Teresa Rees, wedi cwrdd yn rheolaidd ers 15 Gorffennaf, a byddant yn adrodd i mi ym mis Chwefror a mis Ebrill 2005. Byddaf yn cynnig ffordd ymlaen i gael y gyfundrefn gyllido a chymorth i fyfyrwyr orau i addysg uwch yng Nghymru ar sail tystiolaeth yr astudiaeth annibynnol hon.

Mae 'Ymgeisio yn Uwch' wedi gosod ein hagenda ar gyfer newid a datblygu mewn addysg uwch a sicrhawn y bydd y trefniadau yng Nghymru ar gyfer ffioedd dysgu a chymorth i fyfyrwyr o 2006 yn ategu ein gwelediaeth ar gyfer y sector hwn.

**Leanne Wood:** Dywedasoeh mai'r Cynulliad ac nid San Steffan fydd yn penderfynu lefel ffioedd prifysgol. Yng ngolwg hynny, a gredwch fod comisiwn Rees, a sefydlwyd gennyh, yn wastraff ar arian?

**Jane Davidson:** Bydd comisiwn Rees yn rhoi cyngor i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ar y ffordd orau ymlaen ac yn sicrhau y caiff ein prifysgolion eu hariannu'n briodol ac na cheir bygythiad i'n hagenda ar ehangu mynediad ar gyfer myfyrwyr.

We will continue to build towards a world-class higher education sector that excels in teaching, research and development. We have made great progress in widening access to higher education and we will not lose sight of that aim. One of our key commitments is to enhance Welsh-medium teaching and learning. To date, the experience in higher education has been that Welsh-speaking students have been able to benefit from pockets of excellence. The challenge for us all is to move beyond those islands of enthusiasm and develop a more strategic approach towards developing and sustaining high-quality teaching and learning through the medium of Welsh.

3.40 p.m.

I have been encouraged by the work conducted over recent months by the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales working group chaired by Andrew Green. In the light of that work, I am pleased to announce that, today, I have approved the release of reconfiguration funding for a Welsh-medium project received from the sector. The project will increase the teaching capacity and material resource in the sector in the short to medium term and will result in a real increase in choice for students wishing to study through the medium of Welsh. The project forms an integral part of the strategy developed by the working group. I have given approval in advance of the whole strategy, so that structures can be put in place for the project to start in the next academic year.

The total bid is worth almost £3 million, and the programme extends to 2011-12. The postgraduate teaching fellowship element of the bid builds on the existing highly successful programme and will provide for up to six fellowships per year up to 2007-08. The second exciting element of the scheme is to support research scholarships—up to 10 scholarships per year for an initial three-year period. Each scholar will be funded for a maximum period of five years, establishing real growth in the strength and depth of Welsh-medium provision in the sector. I expect to be able to make further announcements with regard to the broader

Parhawn i geisio sector addysg uwch o'r radd flaenaf sy'n rhagori mewn dysgu, ymchwil a datblygu. Gwnaethom gynnydd mawr wrth ehangu mynediad i addysg uwch ac ni chollwn olwg ar y nod honno. Un o'n hymrwymadau pwysicaf yw hyrwyddo dysgu ac addysgu cyfrwng Cymraeg. Hyd yma, y profiad a gafwyd mewn addysg uwch yw bod myfyrwyr Cymraeg eu hiaith wedi gallu cael budd o ragoriaeth a geir hwnt ac yma. Yr her i ni i gyd yw mynd y tu hwnt i'r ynysoedd hynny o frwdfrydedd a datblygu dull mwy strategol o ddatblygu a chynnal dysgu ac addysgu o ansawdd da drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg.

Fe'm calonogwyd gan y gwaith a wnaed dros y misoedd diwethaf gan weithgor Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru o dan gadeiryddiaeth Andrew Green. Yng ngoleuni'r gwaith hwnnw, yr wyf yn falch o gyhoeddi fy mod heddiw wedi cymeradwyo darparu cyllid ad-drefnu ar gyfer prosiect cyfrwng Cymraeg a gynigiwyd gan y sector. Bydd y prosiect yn cynyddu'r capasiti dysgu a'r adnoddau materol yn y sector yn y tymor byr a chanolig a bydd yn arwain at gynnig mwy o ddewis gwirioneddol i fyfyrwyr sy'n dymuno astudio drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Mae'r prosiect yn rhan annatod o'r strategaeth a ddatblygwyd gan y gweithgor. Yr wyf wedi cymeradwyo'r strategaeth gyfan ymlaen llaw, fel y gellir rhoi trefniadau ar waith i'r prosiect gael dechrau yn y flwyddyn academiaidd nesaf.

Mae'r cais cyfan yn werth bron £3 miliwn, ac mae'r rhaglen yn ymestyn hyd 2011-12. Mae'r elfen yn y cais sy'n ymwneud â chymrodoriaethau dysgu i raddedigion yn adeiladu ar sail y rhaglen dra llwyddiannus bresennol a bydd yn darparu ar gyfer hyd at chwe chymrodoriaeth y flwyddyn hyd 2007-08. Yr ail elfen gyffrous yn y cynllun yw cymorth ar gyfer ysgoloriaethau ymchwil—hyd at 10 ysgoloriaeth y flwyddyn am gyfnod o dair blynedd ar y dechrau. Darperir cyllid i bob ysgolor am gyfnod o hyd at bum mlynedd, gan sicrhau gwir gynnydd o ran cryfder a manylder yn y ddarpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg yn y sector hwn.

strategy for strengthening Welsh-medium provision over the coming months.

**Owen John Thomas:** A yw hyn yn golygu y bydd canran y myfyrwyr sy'n derbyn rhywfaint o'u haddysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn cynyddu o'r 3 y cant presennol i 7 y cant erbyn 2010? Dyna'r amcan a osodwyd gennych yn 'Iaith Pawb'.

**Jane Davidson:** This will dramatically contribute towards that objective. This strategy was put forward by an independent group and, as I have just said, I expect to be able to make further announcements with regard to the broader strategy for strengthening Welsh-medium provision over the coming months.

I turn to the amendments to the motion. Amendments 1, 3 and 4 are matters for the Rees review. The Rees review will consider all the options for financing higher education in Wales, and it is not reasonable now to bind the Government's hands in terms of the solutions we might adopt. I will not support these amendments.

I will not support amendment 2, as nothing in this motion will have the effect of reducing the pre-eminence of the authority of the full Assembly, as with all motions to delegate functions. This amendment is therefore redundant.

I will not support amendment 5. The draft budget includes above-inflation increases to the higher education baselines for the next three years. This allows us to meet our commitments in 'Reaching Higher' and to begin to respond to other pressures in the sector, including those associated with the new pay framework. I am, however, waiting for detailed costings from the sector on the full costs of implementing that framework.

Finally, I will not support amendment 6. Our commitment is to enhance delivery of Welsh-medium education. We have a national steering group, which will shortly submit its strategy and will prepare an appraisal of the

Disgwyliaf y byddaf yn gallu gwneud cyhoeddiadau pellach mewn cysylltiad â'r strategaeth ehangach i gryfhau'r ddarpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg dros y misoedd i ddod.

**Owen John Thomas:** Does this mean that the percentage of students receiving some of their education through the medium of Welsh will increase from 3 per cent as is the case at present to 7 per cent by 2010? This is the target that you set in 'Iaith Pawb'.

**Jane Davidson:** Bydd hyn yn cyfrannu'n sylweddol at gyflawni'r amcan hwnnw. Cyflwynwyd y strategaeth hon gan grŵp annibynnol ac, fel yr wyf newydd ddweud, disgwyliaf y byddaf yn gallu gwneud cyhoeddiadau pellach ar y strategaeth ehangach i gryfhau'r ddarpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg dros y misoedd i ddod.

Trof at y gwelliannau i'r cynnig. Materion i adolygiad Rees yw gwelliannau 1, 3 a 4. Bydd adolygiad Rees yn ystyried yr holl ddewisiadau ar gyfer ariannu addysg uwch yng Nghymru, ac nid yw'n rhesymol clymu dwylo'r Llywodraeth yn awr o ran yr atebion y gallem eu defnyddio. Ni chefnogaf y gwelliannau hyn.

Ni chefnogaf welliant 2, gan nad oes dim yn y cynnig hwn a gaiff yr effaith o leihau goruchafiaeth awdurdod y Cynulliad llawn, yn yr un modd â'r holl gynigion i ddirprwyo swyddogaethau. Gan hynny, mae'r gwelliant hwn yn ddiangen.

Ni chefnogaf welliant 5. Mae'r gyllideb ddrafft yn cynnwys codiadau sy'n uwch na chwyddiant yn y llinellau sylfaen ar gyfer addysg uwch ar gyfer y tair blynedd nesaf. Mae hyn yn caniatáu inni gyflawni ein hymrwymadau yn 'Ymgeisio yn Uwch' a dechrau ymateb i bwysau eraill a geir yn y sector hwn, gan gynnwys y rhai sy'n gysylltiedig â'r fframwaith cyflogau newydd. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn aros i gael prisiau manwl gan y sector ar yr holl gostau a geir o roi'r fframwaith hwnnw ar waith.

Yn olaf, ni chefnogaf welliant 6. Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i hybu'r ddarpariaeth o addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg. Mae gennym grŵp llywio cenedlaethol, a fydd yn cyflwyno ei strategaeth cyn hir a bydd yn paratoi



various options. In the meantime, I have just announced substantial additional support for an exciting series of initiatives developed by the sector.

I commend to Members the Government motion, unamended, to delegate the functions of the Higher Education Act 2004.

**Peter Black:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 1: insert the words

*believes that variable tuition fees are, in principle, wrong and*

between the words '*the National Assembly*' and '*acting under Section 62*'.

I propose amendment 2. Insert the words

*or which concern tuition fee structure*

after the words

*'save those which by law cannot be so delegated'.*

This Act, as we have heard, would convert a UK higher education system, based primarily on educational merit, into a market-driven system where students' academic choices are made on the basis of affordability. This is the basis of our opposition to the Act and of our concerns as regards what will happen to the Act when powers are delegated to the Welsh Assembly Government.

At least English higher education institutions have some certainty. They know how much they will charge for courses, and when. They can plan for income and invest accordingly. Students know where they stand, even if this position is unpalatable and untenable. In Wales, there is no such certainty. Not only do higher education institutions not know where they stand regarding future income, there is no money in the budget for the next couple of years to enable them to compete against English institutions for new staff and to retain staff. They have been set adrift by the Minister.

gwerthusiad o'r gwahanol ddewisiadau. Yn y cyfamser, yr wyf newydd gyhoeddi cymorth ychwanegol sylweddol ar gyfer cyfres o fentrau cyffrous a ddatblygwyd gan y sector.

Cymeradwyaf i Aelodau gynnig y Llywodraeth, heb ei ddiwygio, i ddirprwyo swyddogaethau Deddf Addysg Uwch 2004.

**Peter Black:** Cynigaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 1: ychwanegu'r geiriau

*yn credu bod ffioedd dysgu amrywiol mewn egwyddor yn anghywir, a chan*

rhwng y geiriau '*cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*' a '*weithredu'n unol ag adran 62*'.

Cynigaf welliant 2. Ychwanegu'r geiriau

*neu'r rheini sy'n ymwneud â strwythur y ffioedd dysgu*

ar ôl y geiriau

*'heblaw am y rhai hynny na ellir eu dirprwyo yn gyfreithiol'.*

Amcan y Ddeddf hon, fel y clywsom, yw troi system addysg uwch y DU, sy'n seiliedig yn bennaf ar deilyngdod addysgol, yn system a ysgogir gan y farchnad lle y gwnaiff myfyrwyr ddewisiadau academiaidd ar sail fforddiadwyedd. Dyma sail ein gwrthwynebiad i'r Ddeddf a'n pryderon ynghylch yr hyn a ddigwydd i'r Ddeddf pan ddirprwyir pwerau i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Mae rhywfaint o sicrwydd gan sefydliadau addysg uwch yn Lloegr, o leiaf. Gwyddant ba faint y byddant yn codi am gyrsiau, a pha bryd. Gallant gynllunio ar gyfer incwm a buddsoddi'n unol â hynny. Gŵyr myfyrwyr ble y maent yn sefyll, hyd yn oed os yw'r sefyllfa hon yn annerbyniol ac yn anghynaliadwy. Yng Nghymru, ni cheir sicrwydd o'r fath. Nid yw sefydliadau addysg uwch wedi cael gwybod ym mhle y maent yn sefyll o ran yr incwm a gânt yn y dyfodol, ac, ar ben hynny, nid oes arian yn y gyllideb ar gyfer y flwyddyn neu ddwy nesaf i'w galluogi i gystadlu yn erbyn sefydliadau yn

Lloegr am staff newydd ac i gadw staff.  
Mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u gadael ar y clwt.

Students in Wales face a worse dilemma. If they go to an English higher education institution, they know that they could face a £3,000 a year fee and that they may graduate with a debt of up to £20,000, or possibly more. If they opt to study at a Welsh higher education institution, and start in 2006, they will not pay fees in the first year but may possibly pay fees in the second and third years—in fact, they most probably will do so. How is that an incentive for anyone to go to college in Wales? It is not. Higher education policy in Wales is a mess. The Rees commission is doing an important job but we have discovered that its hands are tied, because the Minister has told the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee that its job is not to determine whether or not we have fees, but to determine the appropriate fee structure for Wales. It is an important distinction. The Rees commission is not there, as the Minister has just asserted in response to amendment 1, to decide whether or not tuition fees are wrong in principle, but to determine how tuition fees are to be imposed in Wales.

The assurances given to students that there will not be top-up fees before 2007 are meaningless, because it is clearly the intention of this Government to introduce fees in one form or another after 2007. The only questions are what form those fees will take, and when and how they will be imposed.

The indications are that this Labour Assembly Government fully intends to fall in line with Charles Clarke and penalise students who opt for higher education. Under this Labour Government, a graduate earning £15,000 a year will pay a marginal tax rate of 42 per cent. That is more than a millionaire pays. No assurances have been given so far, by the Minister or by the Labour Assembly Government, that the same will not apply to Welsh students studying in Wales.

Mae myfyrwyr yng Nghymru'n wynebu cyfyng-gyngor gwaeth. Os ânt i sefydliad addysg uwch yn Lloegr, gwyddant y gallent orfod talu ffi o £3,000 y flwyddyn ac y gallent fod â dyled o hyd at £20,000, neu fwy efallai, ar ôl graddio. Os dewisant dderbyn eu haddysg mewn sefydliad addysg uwch yng Nghymru, gan ddechrau yn 2006, ni fyddant yn talu ffioedd yn y flwyddyn gyntaf ond gallent dalu ffioedd yn yr ail a'r drydedd flwyddyn—a dweud y gwir, mae'n fwy na thebyg y byddant yn gwneud. Pa fath o anogaeth yw hynny i rywun fynd i goleg yng Nghymru? Dim o gwbl. Mae polisi addysg uwch yng Nghymru yn llanastr. Mae comisiwn Rees yn gwneud gwaith pwysig ond yr ydym wedi darganfod bod ei ddwylo wedi'u clymu, gan fod y Gweinidog wedi dweud wrth y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes nad pennu a gawn ffioedd ai peidio yw ei waith, ond pennu strwythur ffioedd addas i Gymru. Mae hynny'n wahaniaeth pwysig. Nid pwrpas comisiwn Rees yw penderfynu a yw ffioedd dysgu'n anghywir mewn egwyddor ai peidio, fel y mae'r Gweinidog newydd honni wrth ymateb i welliant 1, ond pennu ym mha fodd y mae ffioedd dysgu i'w gosod yng Nghymru.

Mae'r sicrwydd a roddwyd i fyfyrwyr na fydd ffioedd ychwanegol cyn 2007 yn ddiystyr, gan ei bod yn amlwg mai bwriad y Llywodraeth hon yw cyflwyno ffioedd ar ryw ffurf neu'i gilydd ar ôl 2007. Yr unig gwestiynau sy'n weddill yw pa ffurf a fydd i'r ffioedd hynny, a pha bryd ac ym mha fodd y cânt eu gosod.

Yn ôl pob golwg, mae Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad yn llawn fwriadu ufuddhau i Charles Clarke a chosbi myfyrwyr sy'n dewis mynd i addysg uwch. O dan y Llywodraeth Lafur hon, bydd graddedigion sy'n ennill £15,000 y flwyddyn yn talu treth ar gyfradd ffiniol o 42 y cant. Mae hynny'n fwy nag y mae miliynydd yn ei dalu. Ni roddwyd unrhyw sicrwydd hyd yma, gan y Gweinidog neu gan Lywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad, na fydd hynny'n wir hefyd am fyfyrwyr o Gymru sy'n derbyn eu haddysg yng Nghymru.

We believe that the future of students in Welsh higher education institutions is not safe in the hands of this Assembly Government. This is a simple issue. Tuition fees are wrong. They build a barrier to learning for young people wishing to continue their studies. The UK Labour Government has already broken a manifesto promise by introducing top-up fees. This Labour Assembly Government has demonstrated through its actions that it cannot be trusted on this issue either. It is already hedging around its 2003 manifesto policy and now it is saying that fees in Wales are inevitable. We believe that the only way to protect the interests of students is to retain the power to abolish tuition fees with the whole Assembly. I urge you to support our amendment 1, which opposes tuition fees in principle, and also our amendment 2, which would retain the powers to decide on tuition fees with the whole Assembly.

**Janet Ryder:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 3: add as a new bullet point 2 and renumber accordingly:

*calls on the First Minister to show leadership in creating a sustainable funding system for higher education.*

I propose amendment 4. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*demands a commitment from the Minister to fully fund the 2006 student cohort.*

I propose amendment 5. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*demands that the Minister increases funding for higher education to ensure that the costs of bringing in the new pay framework are met.*

I propose amendment 6. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*instructs the Minister to bring forward to Plenary, within six months, a strategy and timetable for the implementation and*

Credwn nad yw dyfodol myfyrwyr mewn sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru yn ddiogel yn nwylo'r Llywodraeth Cynulliad hon. Mater syml yw hwn. Mae ffioedd dysgu'n anghywir. Maent yn codi rhwystr rhag dysgu i bobl ifanc sy'n dymuno parhau â'u haddysg. Mae Llywodraeth Lafur y DU eisoes wedi torri addewid yn ei manifesto drwy gyflwyno ffioedd ychwanegol. Mae Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad wedi dangos drwy ei gweithredoedd na ellir ymddiried ynnddi ar y mater hwn ychwaith. Mae eisoes yn gogordroi ynghylch y polisi yn ei manifesto yn 2003 a dywed bellach ei bod yn anorfod y ceir ffioedd yng Nghymru. Credwn mai'r unig fodd i ddiogelu buddiannau myfyrwyr yw cadw'r pŵer i ddiddymu ffioedd dysgu yn nwylo'r Cynulliad cyfan. Fe'ch anogaf i gefnogi gwelliant 1 o'n heiddo, sy'n gwrthwynebu ffioedd dysgu mewn egwyddor, a hefyd gwelliant 2 o'n heiddo, a gadwai'r pwerau i benderfynu ar ffioedd dysgu yn nwylo'r Cynulliad cyfan

**Janet Ryder:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 3: ychwanegu pwynt bwled 2 newydd ac ailrifo'r pwyntiau sy'n weddill yn unol â hynny:

*yn galw ar y Prif Weinidog i ddangos arweiniad drwy greu system ariannu gynaliadwy ar gyfer addysg uwch.*

Cynigiau welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn mynnu ymrwymiad gan y Gweinidog i ariannu cohort myfyrwyr 2006 yn llawn.*

Cynigiau welliant 5. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn mynnu bod y Gweinidog yn cynyddu'r arian i addysg uwch i sicrhau yr ysgwyddir cost cyflwyno'r fframwaith cyflogau newydd.*

Cynigiau welliant 6. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn cyfarwyddo'r Gweinidog i roi ger bron y Cyfarfod Llawn cyn pen chwe mis strategaeth ac amserlen i roi Coleg Ffederal Cymraeg ar*

*development of a Welsh Federal College.*

As has been said, this Higher Education Act transfers certain powers to the Assembly and gives us an opportunity to decide not to introduce fees in Wales. Or does it? As my colleague, Simon Thomas, said during the debate on this Bill at Westminster:

‘The devolution of power to the National Assembly is a bit of a nonsense and a sop, because if the Assembly does not have powers on taxation or full legislative powers, it will not be able to address the matter’.

Plaid Cymru strongly believes that the taxation system is the best and fairest way of funding higher education, particularly in light of the Government’s aspiration for 50 per cent of our young people to go to university. Debt, or the fear of debt, is the single most influential factor in deterring students from poorer backgrounds from entering higher education. Is this really an effective way of funding education? Tuition fees will raise only a fraction of the money needed by higher education. Add to that the confusing and costly to administer package of grants and loans to be introduced, and the Government will be spending nearly half the amount raised on administration.

The gap in funding between institutions in England and Wales is growing. The core funding for this sector needs to rise sharply to enable it to introduce the new pay framework and to increase its research capacity. The Minister must look again at her policy of retaining funds from this sector to force mergers. Our institutions need that money now to address real challenges, especially that posed by the 2008 research assessment.

In the 2001 research assessment, only Cardiff made it into the top 10 of UK universities. The second highest place achieved by a Welsh university was forty-seventh, which was achieved by Bangor. The situation must improve.

*waith ac i’w ddatblygu.*

Fel y dywedwyd, mae’r Ddeddf Addysg Uwch hon yn trosglwyddo rhai pwerau i’r Cynulliad ac yn rhoi cyfle inni benderfynu peidio â chyflwyno ffioedd yng Nghymru. Ond a ydyw mewn gwirionedd? Fel y dywedodd un o’r cyd-aelodau, Simon Thomas, yn ystod y ddadl ar y Mesur hwn yn San Steffan:

Mae datganoli pŵer i’r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ddisynnwyr braidd ac yn ymgais i gau cegau, oherwydd os nad yw’r Cynulliad yn meddu ar bwerau trethu neu bwerau deddfu llawn, ni fydd yn gallu ymdrin â’r mater hwn.

Mae Plaid Cymru yn credu’n gryf mai’r system drethu sy’n cynnig y modd gorau a thecaf i ariannu addysg uwch, yn enwedig yng ngolwg uchelgais y Llywodraeth i beri i 50 y cant o’n pobl ifanc fynd i brifysgol. Dyled, neu ofn dyled, yw’r ffactor mwyaf dylanwadol un o ran troi myfyrwyr o gefndiroedd tlotach oddi wrth addysg uwch. A yw’r dull hwn o ariannu addysg yn un effeithiol mewn gwirionedd? Ni fydd ffioedd dysgu ond yn codi cyfran fach o’r arian y mae ar addysg uwch ei angen. Bydd hynny, ynghyd â’r pecyn o grantiau a benthyciadau a gyflwynir, sy’n ddruslyd ac yn ddrud i’w weinyddu, yn peri y bydd y Llywodraeth yn gwario bron hanner y swm a godir ar weinyddu.

Mae’r bwlch o ran cyllido rhwng sefydliadau yng Nghymru a Lloegr yn mynd yn fwy. Rhaid cael cynnydd sydyn yn y cyllid craidd ar gyfer y sector hwn i’w alluogi i gyflwyno’r fframwaith cyflogau newydd a chynyddu ei gapasiti ymchwil. Rhaid i’r Gweinidog ailedrych ar ei pholisi o gadw cyllid oddi wrth y sector hwn i orfodi cyfuno. Mae ar ein sefydliadau angen yr arian hwnnw’n awr i ymateb i’r heriau sylweddol sy’n codi, yn enwedig her yr asesiad ymchwil yn 2008.

Yn yr asesiad ymchwil yn 2001, dim ond Caerdydd a oedd yn 10 uchaf prifysgolion y DU. Y safle ail uchaf i brifysgol yng Nghymru oedd y seithfed a deugain, a gafwyd gan Fangor. Rhaid i’r sefyllfa wella.

3.50 p.m.

One of the few parts of this Act to gain overall support is that which introduces an arts and humanities research council. This offers a recognition of the importance of the role of the arts and humanities in research, and the opportunity to address now the acute shortage of research on Wales and Welsh issues. However, the main purpose of the Act was always to ensure greater funding for universities.

The confusion that the Minister has caused by her commitment not to introduce fees until 2007 has been considerable and must be cleared up now. It is worth noting that the commitment was not to introduce fees until 2007, when, no doubt, fees will be introduced. Every time the Minister speaks, it is to refer to fees being brought in after 2007, although that, of course, is for Teresa Rees to decide. The confusion arises out of misunderstanding among everyone, apparently, except the Minister. It was assumed that 'no fees until 2007', as Peter Black has outlined, meant that students beginning their degree in 2006 would not have to pay fees for the duration of their course. That was what the universities themselves expected, but now that does not seem to be the case. Even the Minister, when challenged, does not know the answer to that question, because she has also left that decision to Teresa Rees.

New Labour and this Minister abdicated their legitimate political power to hide behind a commission which will almost certainly recommend the introduction of fees. Plaid Cymru remains opposed to the introduction of fees, and will support the Liberal Democrat amendment, but we also want a commitment from the Minister that the 2006 cohort will be fully funded. This election bribe has caused enough problems. Unfortunately, the Minister has failed to clarify the situation today.

In England, universities are already seeing a rise in applicants who want to avoid paying fees. It is anticipated that more students will require places next year, instead of taking a

Un o'r ychydig rannau o'r Ddeddf hon a gafodd gefnogaeth gyffredinol yw honno sy'n cyflwyno cyngor ymchwil y celfyddydau a'r pynciau dyneiddiol. Mae hyn yn gydnabyddiaeth i rôl bwysig y celfyddydau a'r pynciau dyneiddiol mewn ymchwil, ac yn cynnig cyfle i ymdrin yn awr â'r prinder difrifol o ran ymchwil ar Gymru a materion Cymreig. Fodd bynnag, prif bwrpas y Ddeddf erioed oedd sicrhau mwy o gyllid i brifysgolion.

Mae ymrwymiad y Gweinidog i beidio â chyflwyno ffioedd tan 2007 wedi peri cryn ddryswch a rhaid datrys hynny'n awr. Mae'n werth nodi mai'r ymrwymiad oedd peidio â chyflwyno ffioedd tan 2007, pan gaiff ffioedd eu cyflwyno, yn ddi-os. Bob tro y mae'r Gweinidog yn siarad, mae'n cyfeirio at gyflwyno ffioedd ar ôl 2007, er mai mater i'w benderfynu gan Teresa Rees yw hynny, wrth gwrs. Mae'r dryswch yn codi o gamddealltwriaeth gan bawb, mae'n debyg, heblaw'r Gweinidog. Cymerwyd bod 'dim ffioedd tan 2007' yn golygu, fel y nododd Peter Black, na fyddai myfyrwyr sy'n dechrau ar eu cyrsiau gradd yn 2006 yn gorfod talu ffioedd drwy gydol eu cwrs. Hynny yr oedd y prifysgolion eu hunain yn ei ddisgwyl, ond nid felly y mae bellach, yn ôl pob golwg. Ni wŷr y Gweinidog hyd yn oed yr ateb i'r cwestiwn hwnnw, pan gaiff ei herio, gan ei bod wedi gadael y penderfyniad hwnnw hefyd i Teresa Rees.

Mae Llafur Newydd a'r Gweinidog hwn wedi ymwrthod â'u pŵer gwleidyddol cyfreithlon er mwyn ymguddio y tu ôl i gomisiwn a fydd bron yn sicr o argymhell cyflwyno ffioedd. Mae Plaid Cymru'n dal i wrthwynebu cyflwyno ffioedd, a bydd yn cefnogi gwelliant y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, ond yr ydym hefyd am gael ymrwymiad gan y Gweinidog y bydd carfan 2006 yn cael ei hariannu'n llawn. Mae'r llwgrwobr etholiadol hon wedi peri digon o broblemau. Gwaetha'r modd, mae'r Gweinidog wedi methu ag egluro'r sefyllfa heddiw.

Yn Lloegr, mae prifysgolion eisoes yn gweld cynnydd yn nifer yr ymgeiswyr sydd am osgoi talu ffioedd. Rhagwelir y bydd mwy o fyfyrwyr yn gofyn am leoedd y flwyddyn

gap year. In Wales, we have two intakes of students before fees are introduced—two years in which there could conceivably be an influx of students from England, where fees will have already been introduced, seeking to avoid having to pay fees here. That would have a detrimental impact on the places available to Welsh students. No doubt the promise from the Minister that no Welsh institution will lose out will ring as hollow as many of her other promises.

The other aspect of higher education that needs an immediate response from the Government is the development of a Welsh federal college. As has already been said, it is currently estimated that around 3 per cent of students in Wales receive their education through the medium of Welsh, including those who are studying the language itself. The Government has pledged to raise that figure to 7 per cent by 2010. Despite today's announcement, it seems that there is no firm strategy to develop a Welsh federal college. A handful of bursaries per year will go little way towards offering those students in Wales who aspire to study through the medium of their own first language in their own country the right to study within their own federal college. We still await the Minister's publication of a firm strategy not only to reach the Government's own target of 7 per cent by 2010, but to fulfil the aspirations of many Welsh students who have campaigned long and hard for many years to establish a university in their own country where they can study through the medium of their own language.

**Peter Law:** I have no doubt that the best interests of higher education students are best served by this Assembly Government and this Minister. Let us be honest—the rag-bag opposition that we have here would be torn apart arguing and would never find the necessary funding. It is easy to come up with alternatives, but putting them into practice is not easy. I pay tribute to the Minister for how she has worked on this issue and for appointing the Rees commission. I hope that we will not see top-up fees in Wales after the Rees commission has reported. As I have said before, I will find it hard to support any top-up fees.

nesaf, yn lle cymryd blwyddyn o seibiant. Yng Nghymru, bydd myfyrwyr yn cael eu derbyn am ddwy flynedd cyn cyflwyno ffioedd—dwy flynedd pan ddichon y ceir mewnlifiad o fyfyrwyr o Loegr, lle y bydd ffioedd eisoes wedi'u cyflwyno, i geisio osgoi talu ffioedd yma. Byddai hynny'n peri bod llai o leoedd ar gael i fyfyrwyr o Gymru. Mae'n sicr y bydd addewid y Gweinidog na fydd unrhyw sefydliad yng Nghymru ar ei golled yn swnio'r un mor wag â llawer o'i haddewidion eraill.

Yr agwedd arall ar addysg uwch sy'n galw am ymateb ar unwaith gan y Llywodraeth yw datblygu coleg ffederal Cymraeg. Fel y dywedwyd eisoes, amcangyfrifir yn awr mai tua 3 y cant o'r myfyrwyr yng Nghymru sy'n derbyn eu haddysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, gan gynnwys y rhai sy'n astudio'r Gymraeg fel pwnc. Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi addo codi'r ffigur hwnnw i 7 y cant erbyn 2010. Er gwaethaf y cyhoeddiad heddiw, ymddengys nad oes unrhyw strategaeth bendant i ddatblygu coleg ffederal Cymraeg. Ychydig iawn a wnaiff llond llaw o fwrariaethau y flwyddyn i gynnig i'r myfyrwyr hynny yng Nghymru sy'n dyheu am astudio drwy gyfrwng eu hiaith gyntaf yn eu gwlad eu hunain yr hawl i astudio yn eu coleg ffederal eu hunain. Yr ydym yn dal i ddisgwyl i'r Gweinidog gyhoeddi strategaeth bendant nid yn unig i gyrraedd targed y Llywodraeth o 7 y cant erbyn 2010, ond i gyflawni dyheadau llawer o fyfyrwyr yng Nghymru sydd wedi ymgyrchu'n hir ac yn galed am flynyddoedd lawer i sefydlu prifysgol yn eu gwlad eu hunain lle gallant astudio drwy gyfrwng eu hiaith eu hunain.

**Peter Law:** Nid oes gennyf unrhyw amheuaeth nad y Llywodraeth Cynulliad hon a'r Gweinidog hwn a wnaiff ofalu orau am fuddiannau myfyrwyr addysg uwch. Gadewch inni ddweud y gwir plaen—byddai'r gybolfa o wrthblaid sydd gennym yma'n cael ei rhwygo'n ddarnau gan ffræo ac ni ddeuai byth o hyd i'r cyllid y mae ei angen. Digon hawdd yw cynnig dewisiadau eraill, ond nid mor hawdd yw eu rhoi ar waith. Talaf deyrnged i'r Gweinidog am y modd y gweithiodd ar y mater hwn ac am benodi comisiwn Rees. Gobeithiaf na welwn ffioedd ychwanegol yng Nghymru wedi i gomisiwn Rees gyflwyno'i adroddiad. Fel y

dywedais o'r blaen, fe'i caf yn anodd cefnogi unrhyw fath o ffioedd ychwanegol.

There are no soft options in politics—for Ministers or Assembly Members. We are here to represent the people with whom we have a contract. I would be failing in my duty to the people of Blaenau Gwent if I did not say how much I regret and feel ashamed of the fact that my Government in Westminster reneged on a manifesto commitment and introduced this. I commend those MPs—

Nid oes unrhyw ddewisiadau hawdd mewn gwleidyddiaeth—i Weinidogion neu i Aelodau o'r Cynulliad. Yr ydym yma i gynrychioli'r bobl y gwnaethom contract â hwy. Byddwn yn methu yn fy nyletswydd tuag at bobl Blaenau Gwent pe na ddywedwn gymaint yr wyf yn gofidio ac yn cywilyddio ynghylch y ffaith bod fy Llywodraeth yn San Steffan wedi troi cefn ar ymrwymiad yn ei manifestio ac wedi cyflwyno hyn. Canmolaf yr ASau hynny—

**Helen Mary Jones:** I am struck by what you have said—we all know that you have taken a principled stand on this in the past. Will you therefore be supporting Kirsty Williams's amendment 1, which states that

**Helen Mary Jones:** Fe'm trawyd gan yr hyn a ddywedasoch—yr ydym oll yn gwybod eich bod wedi gwneud safiad egwyddorol ar hyn yn y gorffennol. A fyddwch felly'n cefnogi gwelliant 1 o eiddo Kirsty Williams, sy'n dweud bod

'variable tuition fees are in principle wrong'?

'ffioedd dysgu amrywiol mewn egwyddor yn anghywir'?

**Peter Law:** I do not think that you should pre-empt anything that I am about to do or say. This is a matter for the individual. I do not want to be nasty, but as I told Peter Black earlier: phone a clairvoyant.

**Peter Law:** Ni chredaf y dylech geisio achub y blaen ar unrhyw beth yr wyf ar fin ei wneud neu ei ddweud. Mater i'r unigolyn yw hwn. Nid wyf am fod yn gas, ond fel y dywedais wrth Peter Black yn gynharach: ffoniwch glirweledydd.

We are all here to represent our communities and the greater good of the people of Wales. There comes a time when you must stand up on a principle, when you think that that is right. That is why we are sent here. This is our parliament—or as near as we can get to a parliament; this is our democratically elected Assembly. This is the theatre of expression for the people of Wales, and this is where people believe that we have the duty to speak on their behalf. The comfort-zone approach—sitting in the Chamber with hands up and mouths closed—is not what the people expect of us on issues such as this.

Ein pwrpas ni i gyd yw cynrychioli ein cymunedau a gweithio er lles pobl Cymru'n gyffredinol. Daw adeg y mae'n rhaid sefyll dros egwyddor, pan gredwch ei bod yn iawn. Dyna pam y cawn ein hanfon yma. Hon yw ein senedd—neu'r peth agosaf y gallwn ei gael i senedd; hwn yw ein Cynulliad a etholwyd yn ddemocrataidd. Dyma'r man i fynegi barn dros bobl Cymru, a dyma'r man y cred pobl ein bod dan ddyletswydd i siarad ar eu rhan. Mae'r bobl yn disgwyl mwy gennym ar faterion fel hyn nag ymgysuro gan eistedd yn y Siambr a'n dwylo i fyny a'n cegau ynghau.

Although the Liberal Democrats' amendment is what we call a mischief-making amendment—there is no doubt that that is what it is—I will put that to one side. What is important is that it talks about principle. If we believe in a principle, we must make some sort of a stand on the way. This is on the way, because this is the delegation of powers to the

Er bod gwelliant y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn un a alwn yn welliant codi helynt—nid oes amheuaeth nad hynny ydyw—diystyraf hynny. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw ei fod yn sôn am egwyddor. Os credwn mewn egwyddor, rhaid inni wneud rhyw fath o safiad ar hyd y ffordd. Mae hyn ar y ffordd, gan mai dirprwyo pwerau i'r Prif Weinidog

First Minister and the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning. That is how it should be, but it does not hurt for us to give some words of advice on the way as an attention getter, or to help focus the First Minister's mind on how the Assembly feels and how the majority of the people of Wales feel. I commend the actions of Members of Parliament who voted against top-up fees, such as the MP for Blaenau Gwent, Llew Smith, Julie Morgan and Jon Owen Jones. They are to be commended, because they stood up on a principle.

**Jenny Randerson:** Jon Owen Jones voted against top-up fees, but he voted in favour of tuition fees on three occasions.

**Peter Law:** That was a little political snipe. You could not help yourself, could you Jenny? We are talking about an opportunity for the Government to take note of the great depth of feeling on this. We are talking about young people being loaded up with another £9,000 in debt and facing £35,000 of debt in 2010, it has been assessed. Is that the way to start working life? We are talking about creating the first generation of young people who are weighed down by a tax on education. Forty-five Members of the Labour Party who voted on this went through a system of free higher education, as did many in the Chamber today. Therefore, it would be hypocritical of us to introduce these top-up fees.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Do you agree that it is shameful for us, as adults, to subject these young people to more substance misuse in credit, debt or whatever you want to call it?

**Peter Law:** It is totally unacceptable, because these young people are the future of our nation. They are the tomorrow of this world.

**Brian Gibbons:** I do not understand Eleanor's statement, because most of us are in debt and credit up to our eyes when we buy a house and a car; that is the lot of virtually everyone in our society. I do not know where she is coming from.

ac i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes y ceisir yn awr. Felly y dylai fod, ond ni wnaiff ddrwg inni gynnig ychydig eiriau o gyngor ar y ffordd er mwyn cael sylw, neu i helpu i dynnu sylw'r Prif Weinidog at deimladau'r Cynulliad a mwyafrif pobl Cymru. Cymeradwyaf y camau a gymerodd Aelodau Seneddol a bleidleisiodd yn erbyn ffioedd ychwanegol, fel yr AS dros Flaenau Gwent, Llew Smith, Julie Morgan a Jon Owen Jones. Maent i'w canmol, gan eu bod wedi sefyll dros egwyddor.

**Jenny Randerson:** Pleidleisiodd Jon Owen Jones yn erbyn ffioedd ychwanegol, ond pleidleisiodd o blaid ffioedd dysgu ar dri achlysur.

**Peter Law:** Beirmiadaeth fach wleidyddol oedd honno. Nid oeddech yn gallu ymrwngod, Jenny, nac oeddech? Yr ydym yn sôn am roi cyfle i'r Llywodraeth nodi'r teimladau cryf a geir am hyn. Yr ydym yn sôn am roi pobl ifanc dan faich ychwanegol o £9,000 o ddyled ac am beri iddynt wynebu £35,000 o ddyled yn 2010, yn ôl yr asesiad. Ai felly y dylid dechrau bywyd gwaith? Yr ydym yn sôn am greu'r genhedlaeth gyntaf o bobl ifanc sy'n cael ei llethu gan dreth ar addysg. Mae 45 o Aelodau'r Blaid Lafur a bleidleisiodd ar hyn wedi mynd drwy system addysg uwch am ddim, fel y gwnaeth llawer sydd yn y Siambr heddiw. Felly, rhagrith ar ein rhan fyddai cyflwyno'r ffioedd ychwanegol hyn.

**Eleanor Burnham:** A ydych yn cytuno ei bod yn beth gwarthus i ni, fel oedolion, beri i'r bobl ifanc hyn fod yn fwy agored i gamddefnyddio credyd, dyled neu beth bynnag yr ydych am ei alw?

**Peter Law:** Mae'n gwbl annerbyniol, oherwydd y bobl ifanc hyn yw dyfodol ein cenedl. Hwyl yw dyfodol y byd.

**Brian Gibbons:** Ni ddeallaf yr hyn a ddywedodd Eleanor, gan fod y rhan fwyaf ohonom at ein clustiau mewn dyled a chredyd wrth brynu tŷ a char; dyna ffawd bron bawb yn ein cymdeithas. Ni wn ar ba sail y mae'n dweud hynny.



**The Presiding Officer:** Order. That was to be an intervention on Peter Law.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr oedd hynny i fod yn ymyriad ar Peter Law.

**Peter Law:** It is not the same kind of debt, Brian—

**Peter Law:** Nid yr un math o ddyled ydyw, Brian—

**Jocelyn Davies:** Will you give way?

**Jocelyn Davies:** A wnewch ildio?

**Peter Law:** Well, I am running out of time—

**Peter Law:** Wel, yr wyf yn mynd yn brin o amser—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I am a bit concerned about allowing interventions on interventions. Peter is in injury time, but I will extend his time a little further.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr wyf yn bryderus braidd ynghylch caniatáu ymyriadau ar ymyriadau. Mae Peter wedi mynd dros ei amser, ond estynnaf ei amser ychydig mwy.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Will those young people from Blaenau Gwent who will stick their necks out, go to university and load themselves with £36,000 worth of debt then go out and buy a house and get a mortgage, if they are already burdened with debt?

**Jocelyn Davies:** A fydd y bobl ifanc hynny o Flaenau Gwent sy'n mentro, yn mynd i brifysgol ac yn mynd i ddyled o £36,000 yn mynd ymlaen wedyn i brynu tŷ a chodi morgais, os ydynt eisoes yn ysgwyddo dyled mor fawr?

**Peter Law:** There are built-in means testing benefits that will help many of the poorer students in Blaenau Gwent and they will not be faced with such problems. However, we are not talking about rich families being laden down with £9,000-worth of debt either, Brian. Let us get that clear—we are not talking about rich families here. So there will be an element there and in many other poorer areas.

**Peter Law:** Ceir budd-daliadau cysylltiedig sy'n amodol ar brawf moddion a fydd yn helpu llawer o'r myfyrwyr tlotach yn Mlaenau Gwent ac ni fyddant yn wynebu problemau o'r fath. Fodd bynnag, nid sôn am deuluoedd cyfoethog yn cael eu llethu gan £9,000 o ddyledion yr ydym ychwaith, Brian. Gadewch inni ddeall hyn—nid ydym yn sôn am deuluoedd cyfoethog yn awr. Felly bydd elfen yno ac mewn sawl ardal dlotach arall.

4.00 p.m.

The young people of tomorrow, and students in general, expect a great deal of the Government, as only the Government can change this tax on learning. It is down to us now. The challenge is to the First Minister to do something about it. That is the expectation of devolution. We need a solution to this issue that is in the traditional style of the Labour and trade union movement. Anything less will be a failure, and we look to the First Minister to deliver what we believe is right for the young people of the future.

Mae pobl ifanc y dyfodol, a myfyrwyr yn gyffredinol, yn disgwyl llawer iawn gan y Llywodraeth, gan mai dim ond y Llywodraeth a all newid y dreth hon ar ddyysgu. Daeth i'n rhan ni i weithredu'n awr. Yr her yw i'r Prif Weinidog wneud rhywbeth yn ei gylch. Dyna a ddisgwylir drwy ddatganoli. Rhaid inni gael ateb i'r mater hwn yn null traddodiadol mudiad Llafur a'r undebau llafur. Methiant fydd unrhyw beth llai na hynny, a disgwyliwn i'r Prif Weinidog sicrhau'r hyn y credwn ei fod yn iawn i bobl ifanc y dyfodol.

**David Davies:** If ever there was a legislative pig in a poke, this is it. If this motion is carried today, it may be portrayed as good news, giving us the power to do whatever we wish to do with tuition fees, but the reality is

**David Davies:** Os bu erioed achos o brynu cath mewn cwd deddfwriaethol, dyma fe. Os derbynnir y cynnig hwn heddiw, gallai gael ei bortredu'n newyddion da, gan ei fod yn rhoi pŵer inni wneud yr hyn a fynwnn â ffioedd

that, despite what the Minister says, our hands will be well and truly tied. When tuition fees are introduced in England, what choice does the Minister believe we will have? We will have a couple of options. We could opt not to introduce the fees and not to invest any additional money into universities in Wales. If we do that, then we will quickly see a growing disparity between the standards of Welsh and English universities because the English ones will be in receipt of much greater funding. Our universities will become second-rate establishments offering lower educational standards, attractive only to those who do not have any money. In other words, we will be creating the very kind of inequality that New Labour claims to despise, and which it has all too often helped to create. It is not an outcome that the Conservative Party would ever support.

Our next option could be to waive tuition fees in Wales, but to provide the extra money to Welsh universities from our existing budgets. That would at least have the advantage of ensuring that standards in Wales do not fall behind those in England. However, if we did that, Welsh universities would be deluged with applications from English students, who would, not surprisingly, be absolutely delighted to be able to study in a high-quality institution without having to pay tuition fees. Who could possibly blame them for that? There are approximately 16 times as many people living in England as in Wales, which I assume means that there are 16 times as many students. How many Welsh students, therefore, would end up securing places in Welsh universities, when they would have to compete with 16 times as many people from the rest of the UK? The reality would be that many Welsh students would be forced to go to English institutions, where they would have to pay tuition fees, and yet Welsh taxpayers would still lose out because money would be lost from our health service and other public services in order to put that money back into Welsh universities. That would be a huge double whammy and another completely unworkable option, as the Minister knows only too well.

The only alternative, therefore, if we rule out

dysgu, ond y gwir yw y bydd ein dwylo wedi'u clymu, er gwaethaf yr hyn a ddywed y Gweinidog. Pan gyflwynir ffioedd dysgu yn Lloegr, pa ddewis fydd gennym ym marn y Gweinidog? Bydd gennym ddau neu dri dewis. Gallem ddewis peidio â chyflwyno'r ffioedd a pheidio â buddsoddi unrhyw arian ychwanegol mewn prifysgolion yng Nghymru. Os gwnawn hynny, gwelwn wahaniaeth yn codi'n gyflym rhwng y safonau mewn prifysgolion yng Nghymru a'r rhai yn Lloegr, oherwydd bydd y rhai yn Lloegr yn cael mwy o gyllid o lawer. Bydd ein prifysgolion yn troi'n sefydliadau eilradd sy'n cynnig safonau addysgol is, na fyddant ond yn denu rhai sydd heb arian. Mewn geiriau eraill, byddwn yn creu'r union fath o anghydraddoldeb y mae Llafur Newydd yn honni ei ffieiddio, ac y mae wedi helpu i'w greu yn llawer rhy aml. Ni fyddai'r Blaid Geidwadol byth yn cefnogi canlyniad o'r fath.

Y dewis posibl nesaf fyddai hepgor ffioedd dysgu yng Nghymru, a darparu'r arian ychwanegol i brifysgolion yng Nghymru o'n cyllidebau presennol. O leiaf y byddai hynny'n cynnig y fantais o sicrhau na fydd safonau yng Nghymru'n mynd yn is na'r rhai yn Lloegr. Fodd bynnag, pe gwnaem hynny, byddai prifysgolion yng Nghymru'n cael eu boddi gan geisiadau gan fyfyrwyr o Loegr, a fyddai wrth eu bodd, wrth gwrs, o allu derbyn eu haddysg mewn sefydliad rhagorol heb orfod talu ffioedd dysgu. Pwy a allai weld bai arnynt am hynny? Mae tua 16 waith yn fwy o bobl yn byw yn Lloegr nag yng Nghymru, a chymeraf felly fod 16 waith yn fwy o fyfyrwyr. Pa nifer o fyfyrwyr o Gymru, felly, a gâi le mewn prifysgolion yng Nghymru, pe byddent yn gorfod cystadlu yn erbyn 16 waith yn fwy o bobl o weddill y DU? Y gwir yw y byddai llawer o fyfyrwyr o Gymru'n gorfod mynd i sefydliadau yn Lloegr, lle y byddent yn gorfod talu ffioedd dysgu, ac eto byddai trethdalwyr Cymru'n dal i fod ar eu colled gan y collid arian o'n gwasanaeth iechyd a gwasanaethau cyhoeddus eraill er mwyn ailgyfeirio'r arian hwnnw i brifysgolion Cymru. Byddai hynny'n ergyd ddwbl anferth ac yn ddewis arall sy'n gwbl anymarferol, fel y gŵyr y Gweinidog yn iawn.

Yr unig ddewis arall, felly, os diystyrwn roi

not putting extra money into universities, and if we rule out fees, is to follow the English path and introduce the very tuition fees that all of us in the opposition, and one or two Labour Members, it seems, oppose. We are being given these powers today only to carry out a policy that the majority of us do not support. What a sad day that is for democracy in Wales, and particularly so for those from the poorest backgrounds who want to study. They have been betrayed by the Labour Party—a party that was apparently created at the turn of the last century to help the working classes. There is only one alternative to this provision, and, unfortunately, the powers to allow us to follow that alternative do not exist. The alternative is to stop filling universities with non-academic students following nebulous courses such as surf studies, which do not lead to jobs. We must encourage those people instead to study shorter vocational courses. With the money saved as a result, tuition fees could be scrapped and the smaller number of students studying academic courses would be able to do so regardless of family background. That is the answer to our problems. The solution is not this piece of legislation, but a Conservative Government that will represent the interests of students across the United Kingdom.

**Leighton Andrews:** I declare two interests. My wife is a member of the council of the University of Wales, Bangor, and I am an honorary professor at the Cardiff University. I do not consider that either of those interests prevent me from voting on today's amendments.

Croesawaf ddatganiad y Gweinidog ar ddysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Mae'n ddatganiad pwysig ac edrychaf ymlaen at y strategaeth lawn. Yr wyf am godi un pwynt arall. Mae'r Cwmni Benthyciadau Myfyrwyr Cyf wedi anfon llythyr at fyfyrwyr sydd wedi ysgrifennu at y cwmni yn Gymraeg yn dweud:

'Oherwydd materion gyda chynhyrchiad canolog o lythyrau dwyieithog i'r cwsmeriaid pwy sy'n dymuno derbyn pob gohebiaeth drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg mae yno rhywfaint o ohiriad wedi bod yn eich derbynriad o'ch

arian ychwanegol i brifysgolion, ac os diystyrwn ffioedd, yw dilyn yr un llwybr â Lloegr a chyflwyno'r union ffioedd dysgu y mae pawb ohonom yn y gwrthbleidiau, ac un neu ddau o Aelodau Llafur, mae'n ymddangos, yn eu gwrthwynebu. Rhoddir y pwerau hyn inni heddiw ond inni weithredu polisi nad yw'r rhan fwyaf ohonom yn ei gefnogi. Am ddiwrnod trist i ddemocratiaeth yng Nghymru, ac yn enwedig i'r rhai o'r cefndiroedd tlotaf sydd am fynd i brifysgol. Fe'u bradychwyd gan y Blaid Lafur—plaid a grëwyd ar droad y ganrif ddiwethaf i helpu'r dosbarth gweithiol, yn ôl y sôn. Nid oes ond un dewis arall yn lle'r ddarpariaeth hon, a, gwaetha'r modd, nid yw'r pwerau a ganiatâi inni gymryd y dewis hwnnw yn bod. Y dewis yw rhoi'r gorau i lenwi prifysgolion â myfyrwyr anacademaidd sy'n dilyn cyrsiau annelwig fel astudiaethau brigdonni, nad ydynt yn arwain at swyddi. Yn lle hynny, dylem annog y bobl hynny i ddilyn cyrsiau galwedigaethol byrrach. Gellid defnyddio'r arian a arbedid o ganlyniad i hynny i gael gwared â ffioedd dysgu a byddai'r nifer llai o fyfyrwyr a ddilynai gyrsiau academaidd yn gallu gwneud hynny beth bynnag fyddai eu cefndir teuluol. Dyna'r ateb i'n problemau. Nid yr eitem ddeddfwriaeth hon yw'r ateb, ond Llywodraeth Geidwadol a safai dros fuddiannau myfyrwyr ledled y Deyrnas Unedig.

**Leighton Andrews:** Datganaf ddau fuddiant. Mae fy ngwraig yn aelod o gyngor Prifysgol Cymru, Bangor, ac yr wyf yn athro mygedol ym Mhrifysgol Caerdydd. Nid ystyriaf fod y naill na'r llall o'r buddiannau hynny'n fy atal rhag pleidleisio ar y gwelliannau heddiw.

I welcome the Minister's statement on teaching through the medium of Welsh. It is an important statement and I look forward to seeing the strategy in full. I wish to raise one further point. The Student Loans Company Ltd has sent a letter to students who had written to the company in Welsh stating:

Because of issues relating to the central production of bilingual letters for those customers who wish to receive all correspondence through the medium of Welsh there has been some delay in you

gohebiaeth gan y Student Loans Company Ltd neu eich awdurdod addysg lleol.’

Mae hwn yn annerbyniol a gobeithiaf fod y Gweinidog yn cytuno. Yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at y Gweinidog, y cwmni a Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg ar y pwnc hwn. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd y sefyllfa yn newid pan gawn y pwerau hyn.

I wanted to raise that issue because it is important that if we bring powers over higher education to the Assembly—including powers over the Student Loans Company Ltd—we must ensure that students who study through the medium of Welsh are treated on the same basis as those who choose to study through the medium of English. If they choose to correspond with the Student Loans Company through the medium of Welsh, they should be treated in exactly the same way.

On the substance of the proposals, in practice people talk about the introduction of a market into higher education, but in reality there has been a global market in higher education for many years. In some ways it has been deepened, if you like, by the introduction of on-line courses and the growth of internet-based services and so on. The question of the introduction of a market relates to what has been happening throughout the higher education system globally, it is not suddenly being introduced by the introduction of fees into the UK. The choice that I consider, and I made my position on this matter clear when we debated it last February, is that, as far as I can see, the proposals that are before us improve the situation for my constituents over current provision. The removal of up-front fees is a key factor. There is no question, from the original Rees commission research, that up-front fees were one of the major disincentives for students from poorer backgrounds to go into higher education. If I had had to face up-front fees, I would have found it difficult to enter higher education when I did.

The second area is the strengthening of grant procedures for students—it is a bonus for access and must be supported. On variability,

receiving correspondence from the Student Loans Company Ltd or your local education authority.

This is unacceptable and I hope that the Minister agrees. I have written to the Minister, the company and the Welsh Language Board on this matter. I hope that the situation will change when we get these powers.

Yr oeddwn am godi'r mater hwnnw gan ei bod yn bwysig, os deawn â phwerau dros addysg uwch i'r Cynulliad—gan gynnwys pwerau dros y Cwmni Benthyciadau Myfyrwyr Cyf—ein bod yn sicrhau y caiff myfyrwyr sy'n derbyn eu haddysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg eu trin yn gyfartal â'r rhai sy'n dewis derbyn eu haddysg drwy gyfrwng y Saesneg. Os dewisant ohebu â'r Cwmni Benthyciadau Myfyrwyr drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, dylent gael eu trin yn union yr un modd.

Ynghylch sylwedd y cynigion hyn, mae pobl yn arfer sôn am gyflwyno marchnad mewn addysg uwch, ond mewn gwirionedd bu marchnad fyd-eang mewn addysg uwch ers blynnyddoedd lawer. Mae wedi'i dwysáu ar rai ystyron, os caf ei roi felly, drwy gyflwyno cyrsiau ar-lein a drwy dwf gwasanaethau sy'n seiliedig ar y rhyngwyd ac yn y blaen. Mae'r mater o gyflwyno marchnad yn berthnasol i'r hyn a fu'n digwydd yn y system addysg uwch drwy'r byd, ac nis cyflwynir yn sydyn drwy gyflwyno ffioedd yn y DU. Y dewis a ystyriaif fi, ac eglurais fy marn am y mater hwn pan gawsom ddadl arno fis Chwefror diwethaf, yw bod y cynigion sydd ger ein bron, hyd y gwelaf fi, yn cynnig gwell darpariaeth na'r un a geir ar hyn o bryd i'm hetholwyr. Mae dileu ffioedd a delir ymlaen llaw yn ffactor allweddol. Nid oes amheuaeth, yng ngolwg yr ymchwil wreiddiol gan gomisiwn Rees, nad oedd ffioedd a delir ymlaen llaw yn un o'r gwrthanogaethau mwyaf i fyfyrwyr o gefndiroedd tlotach rhag mynd i addysg uwch. Pe byddwn i wedi gorfod talu ffioedd ymlaen llaw, fe'i cawswn yn anodd mynd i addysg uwch ar yr adeg y gwneuthum.

Yr ail faes yw gwella gweithdrefnau grant ar gyfer myfyrwyr—mae hynny'n fodd i hyrwyddo mynediad a rhaid ei gefnogi.

I have a difficulty with the idea of variability between institutions. That in itself would produce a different kind of market, and that, specifically, is the issue with which I am most concerned. That is why I welcome that fact that a cap has been placed on the level of fees that institutions may charge. In debating this issue we must recognise that for those of us who were in university 25 or 30 years ago, the situation has changed dramatically in terms of access to higher education. There has been a significant growth in the numbers going on to higher education, not least under the Labour Government since 1997, and that is to be welcomed. I particularly welcome the work done on access by the University of Glamorgan, which is adjacent to my constituency. It has pioneered access to higher education for many people who would not previously have gone into it.

**Helen Mary Jones:** There are communities in the region that I represent that are particularly dependent on a thriving higher education sector and I therefore welcome the opportunity to participate in this debate. The Minister's refusal to address seriously the funding crisis that faces higher education in Wales amounts at least to an ostrich impression, if not to a serious dereliction of duty—her complacency and slowness to act on these matters have been astonishing. The higher education institutions in the region that I represent are already under tremendous funding pressure, and the same is true across Wales. The Education and Lifelong Learning Committee's inquiry last year into higher education funding was told that higher education funding for students had fallen by 38 per cent in real terms across the UK since 1989. The situation that that created and the pressures placed on Wales's smaller institutions, as a consequence, have made the situation worse. We have heard this afternoon how Welsh institutions have been underfunded in terms of research and I believe that their good record in terms of widening participation will be one that they cannot sustain, let alone build upon, without a major expansion of numbers and funding.

Ynghylch amrywioldeb, fe'i caf yn anodd derbyn y syniad o amrywioldeb rhwng sefydliadau. Byddai hynny'n creu marchnad o fath gwahanol ohono'i hun a dyna'r union fater yr wyf yn fwyaf pryderus yn ei gylch. Dyna pam y croesawaf y ffaith bod cyfyngiad wedi'i osod ar lefel y ffioedd y gall sefydliadau eu codi. Wrth gael dadl ar y mater hwn, rhaid inni gydnabod bod y sefyllfa o ran mynediad i addysg uwch wedi newid yn drawiadol o'r hyn y mae'r rhai ohonom a fu mewn prifysgol 25 neu 30 mlynedd yn ôl yn ei gofio. Mae'r niferoedd sy'n mynd ymlaen i addysg uwch wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol, o dan y Llywodraeth Lafur er 1997 yn anad yr un cyfnod arall, ac mae hynny i'w groesawu. Croesawaf yn enwedig y gwaith a wnaed ar fynediad gan Brifysgol Morgannwg, sy'n agos i'm hetholaeth i. Mae wedi arloesi ar fynediad i addysg uwch ar gyfer llawer o bobl na fyddai wedi mynd iddi cynt.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Mae cymunedau yn y rhanbarth a gynrychiolaf sy'n arbennig o ddibynnol ar fodolaeth sector addysg uwch ffyniannus ac yr wyf felly'n croesawu'r cyfle i gymryd rhan yn y ddadl hon. Mae gwrthodiad y Gweinidog i ymdrin o ddifrif â'r argyfwng o ran ariannu y mae addysg uwch yng Nghymru'n ei wynebu'n dangos ei bod yn cuddio ei phen yn y tywod neu, yn waeth, ei bod yn esgeuluso'i dyletswydd yn ddifrifol—bu ei difaterwch a'i harafwch wrth gymryd camau ynghylch y materion hyn yn syfrdanol. Mae'r sefydliadau addysg uwch yn y rhanbarth a gynrychiolaf o dan bwysau aruthrol o ran cyllido eisoes, a hynny a welir ledled Cymru. Yn ymchwiliad y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i gyllido addysg uwch a gynhaliwyd y llynedd, cafwyd gwybod bod y cyllid ar gyfer myfyrwyr mewn addysg uwch wedi gostwng o 38 y cant yn ôl ei wir werth ledled y DU er 1989. Mae'r sefyllfa a grëwyd drwy hynny a'r pwysau a roddwyd ar y sefydliadau llai yng Nghymru, o ganlyniad, wedi peri i'r sefyllfa waethygu. Clywsom y prynhawn yma fod ymchwil mewn sefydliadau yng Nghymru wedi'i thanariannu ac ni chredaf y byddant yn gallu parhau â'u record dda ar ehangu cyfranogiad, heb sôn am wella arni, os na cheir cynnydd mawr o ran niferoedd a chyllid.

4.10 p.m.

The Minister will not tell us how she can fund even a standstill position in higher education, let alone an expansion under the terms of this Act, without imposing variable fees. She hides behind the Rees commission, but she has already referred on several occasions to, for example, fee structures. Talking about fees in that way pre-empts the outcome of the Rees commission. Indeed, this will be yet another commission that this Government establishes, spends a lot of money on, and ignores its outcome, as it did with the Richard commission. The Minister's stance on this issue is a breach of the principle, though not the letter, of this Government's commitment not to introduce variable fees, and is deeply regrettable. One might almost be tempted to oppose the delegation of these powers to such a disingenuous and ineffective Government, but these are, obviously, proper matters for the Government to deal with.

Our amendment 3 calls on the First Minister to give the lead that his Minister has singularly failed to give on developing sustainable higher education funding for Wales. Even if this amendment is carried, I am not sanguine that he has either the will or the capacity to give such a lead. Nevertheless, I commend amendments 3, 4, 5 and 6 to the Assembly to steer this rather feeble Government in the direction of developing the secure, inclusive and vibrant higher education sector on which the future of Wales will depend.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** I welcome this first legislative step by the Assembly to delegate these particular higher education powers to the First Minister and the people of Wales. These powers will enable Wales to shape Wales's education future to a greater degree than ever before. It is also the first step by the Assembly to formally vote through these particular powers to us; that must be understood, too. It is, relatively speaking, early days. Running in tandem, as has been mentioned, with the devolution of these powers is the Rees commission, which is a body of highly respected and independent minds taking evidence on how best to shape

Ni ddywed y Gweinidog wrthym sut y bydd yn gallu cyllido addysg uwch fel y bydd yn parhau fel y mae, heb sôn am ei heangu o dan delerau'r Ddeddf hon, heb osod ffioedd amrywiadwy. Cuddia y tu ôl i gomisiwn Rees, ond mae eisoes wedi cyfeirio ar sawl achlysur at strwythurau ffioedd, er enghraifft. Mae sôn am ffioedd yn y modd hwnnw'n achub y blaen ar ganlyniad trafodion comisiwn Rees. Yn wir, dyma gomisiwn arall y bydd y Llywodraeth yn ei sefydlu, yn gwario llawer o arian arno, ac yn anwybyddu'i ganlyniad, fel y gwnaeth yn achos comisiwn Richard. Mae safbwynt y Gweinidog ar y mater hwn yn groes i egwyddor, ond nid i lythyren, yr ymrwymiad a wnaeth y Llywodraeth hon i beidio â chyflwyno ffioedd amrywiadwy, ac mae'n dra anffodus. Mae rhywun bron â chael ei demtio i wrthwynebu dirprwyo'r pwerau hyn i Lywodraeth mor anonest ac aneffeithiol, ond mae'n amlwg ei bod yn briodol i'r Llywodraeth ddelio â'r materion hyn.

Mae gwelliant 3 o'n heiddo yn galw ar y Prif Weinidog i roi'r arweiniad y mae ei Weinidog wedi methu'n llwyr â'i roi ar ddatblygu cyllido cynaliadwy ar gyfer addysg uwch yng Nghymru. Hyd yn oed os derbynnir y gwelliant hwn, nid wyf yn ffyddiog bod ganddo'r ewyllys neu'r gallu i roi arweiniad o'r fath. Er hynny, cymeradwyaf welliannau 3, 4, 5 a 6 i'r Cynulliad i droi'r Llywodraeth wantan hon at ddatblygu'r sector addysg uwch diogel, cynhwysol a bywiog y bydd dyfodol Cymru'n dibynnu arno.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Croesawaf y cam deddfwriaethol cyntaf hwn gan y Cynulliad i ddirprwyo'r pwerau hyn dros addysg uwch i'r Prif Weinidog ac i bobl Cymru. Bydd y pwerau hyn yn galluogi Cymru i bennu cyfeiriad addysg yng Nghymru at y dyfodol i fwy o raddau nag erioed o'r blaen. Hwn hefyd yw'r cam cyntaf gan y Cynulliad i bleidleisio dros gymryd y pwerau hyn; rhaid deall hynny, hefyd. Megis dechrau yr ydym. Ochr yn ochr â datganoli'r pwerau hyn, fel y dywedwyd, y mae comisiwn Rees, sy'n gorff ac ynddo rai sydd o feddwl annibynnol ac yn fawr eu parch sy'n cymryd tystiolaeth ar y modd gorau i ddarparu cymorth i'n pobl ifanc

the future provision of education support to our young people. This review group is an independent body, which is taking a comprehensive look at our future needs to ensure that our policies are evidence based and fit for purpose.

The Minister has said many times that the Labour Assembly Government will not introduce variable fees in the lifetime of this Assembly, as we pledged, and that Professor Rees will conduct her independent review. The Minister has also confirmed that no higher education institution will be financially disadvantaged by the manifesto commitment not to introduce variable fees in the 2006-07 academic year. We will deliver on our promise to the people of Wales and we will show that we are serious about access to higher education and about listening to the needs of students. I accept that that could include the provision of vocational degrees and higher level shorter courses supported by industry. Financial support by industry, for teaching as well as for research, are issues that the Rees commission could well consider. I refer to my own experience as a student, as I was fully supported by the National Coal Board, although I stress that that did not include my bar bill.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I am relieved to hear about your bar bill. Can you tell us what your understanding of the 2006 cohort is? Does it mean that no-one who enters higher education in 2006 will have to pay fees? The matter is far from clear, and I am sure that you would want to help clarify this matter in support of your Minister.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** That was a nice try, but I will wait for the outcome of the Rees commission before I make any predictions in that regard.

With regard to the involvement of industry, while I accept that we no longer have large employers like the National Coal Board to provide financial support to individuals, there is scope for support through the various sector skills councils that now represent their industries, and I trust that the Rees commission will take evidence and

mewn addysg yn y dyfodol. Corff annibynnol yw'r grŵp adolygu hwnnw, ac mae'n ystyried ein hanghenion at y dyfodol mewn modd cynhwysfawr er mwyn sicrhau bod ein polisiau'n seiliedig ar dystiolaeth ac yn addas i'w diben.

Mae'r Gweinidog wedi dweud lawer gwaith na wnaiff Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad gyflwyno ffioedd amrywiadwy yn ystod oes y Cynulliad hwn, fel y gwnaethom addo, ac y bydd yr Athro Rees yn cynnal ei hadolygiad annibynnol. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi cadarnhau hefyd na fydd unrhyw sefydliad addysg uwch o dan anfantais ariannol oherwydd yr ymrwymiad yn y maniffesto i beidio â chyflwyno ffioedd amrywiadwy ym mlwyddyn academaidd 2006-07. Cyflawnwn ein haddewid i bobl Cymru a dangoswn ein bod o ddifrif ynghylch mynediad i addysg uwch a gwranddo ar beth yw wir anghenion myfyrwyr. Derbyniaf y gallai hynny gynnwys darparu graddau galwedigaethol a chyrsgiau byrrach ar lefel uwch a gaiff gymorth gan ddiwydiant. Mae'n ddigon posibl y bydd comisiwn Rees yn ystyried cymorth ariannol gan ddiwydiant ar gyfer dysgu yn ogystal ag ymchwil. Cyfeiriaf at fy mhrofiad fy hun fel myfyriwr, gan imi gael fy nghynnal yn gyfan gwbl gan y Bwrdd Glo Cenedlaethol, er fy mod yn pwysleisio nad oedd hynny'n cynnwys fy miliau diodydd.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Mae'n dda gennyf glywed am eich biliau diodydd. A allwch ddweud wrthym am yr hyn a ddeallwch am garfan 2006? A yw'n golygu na fydd neb sy'n mynd i addysg uwch yn 2006 yn gorfod talu ffioedd? Mae'r mater hwnnw ymhell o fod yn eglur, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y carech roi cymorth i'w egluro er cefnogi'ch Gweinidog.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Yr oedd hwnnw'n gynnig da, ond disgwyliaf ganlyniad trafodion comisiwn Rees cyn gwneud unrhyw broffwydoliaethau am hynny.

Gyda golwg ar y rhan a gymerir gan ddiwydiant, er fy mod yn derbyn nad oes gennym gyflogwyr mawr fel y Bwrdd Glo Cenedlaethol bellach i roi cymorth ariannol i unigolion, mae cyfle i roi cymorth drwy'r gwahanol gynghorau sgiliau sector sy'n cynrychioli eu diwydiannau'n awr, a hyderaf y bydd comisiwn Rees yn cymryd tystiolaeth

information from them in due course.

The Minister has created an environment in which the review group can make a learned and evidence-based review of what Wales's higher education sector and our young students truly need. The review group is due to produce a final report in April 2005, and that is just about six months away. This is where we are now, and it would indeed be misguided to try to pre-empt conclusions or do anything today that would bind the review group's hands or prevent the Assembly Government from implementing the best solutions arising from the Rees commission report. We will definitely not ignore its findings.

What is the point of spending valuable time and money on this if we attempt to pre-empt the results in the way that the opposition parties are seeking to do? They do not know the results of the Rees review, no-one does, so let us accept these significant new powers and let the review group do its job without political interference and petty political point scoring.

This is a great day that will see the functions—

**Peter Black:** Will you give way?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** No, I am finishing now.

This measure enables us to make further progress in delivering a world-class higher education system that matches the needs of the people of Wales and our institutions.

**Jenny Randerson:** The fact that the Welsh Liberal Democrats will oppose this delegation of power is exceptional, but this is an issue of exceptional importance, and the Labour Assembly Government has not shown itself in the last year or so to be up to the task. On too many issues, it has danced to London's tune or has shown itself to be the prisoner of its party. It has failed to deliver for the people of Wales on the future of EU funding, the review of local council tax, and on the Richard commission. I commend and thank Peter Law for his speech of principle

a gwybodaeth ganddynt hwy gyda hyn.

Mae'r Gweinidog wedi creu awyrgylch lle y gall y grŵp adolygu wneud adolygiad sy'n ddysgedig ac yn seiliedig ar dystiolaeth o wir anghenion sector addysg uwch Cymru a'n myfyrwyr ifanc. Mae'r grŵp adolygu i fod i gynhyrchu adroddiad terfynol yn Ebrill 2005, sef ymhen tua chwe mis. Dyma lle'r ydym arni'n awr, ac annoeth iawn fyddai ceisio achub y blaen ar gasgliadau neu wneud dim heddiw a fyddai'n clymu dwylo'r grŵp adolygu neu'n atal Llywodraeth y Cynulliad rhag mabwysiadu'r atebion gorau sy'n codi o drafodion comisiwn Rees. Ni fyddwn yn anwybyddu ei ganfyddiadau, yn sicr.

I beth y gwariwn arian a threulio amser gwerthfawr ar hyn os ceisiwn achub y blaen ar ganlyniadau fel y mae'r gwrthbleidiau'n ceisio ei wneud? Ni wyddant hwy beth fydd canlyniadau adolygiad Rees, na neb arall ychwaith, felly gadewch inni dderbyn y pwerau pwysig newydd hyn a gadael i'r grŵp adolygu wneud ei waith heb ymyrraeth wleidyddol a sgorio pwyntiau gwleidyddol dibwys.

Mae heddiw'n ddiwrnod mawr y gwelir y swyddogaethau—

**Peter Black:** A wnewch ildio?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Na wnaif, yr wyf ar fin gorffen.

Mae'r mesur hwn yn ein galluogi i wneud cynnydd pellach i sicrhau system addysg uwch o'r radd flaenaf sy'n diwallu anghenion pobl Cymru a'n sefydliadau.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae'r ffaith y bydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n gwrthwynebu dirprwyo pŵer yn eithriadol, ond mae hyn yn fater o bwys eithriadol, ac yn y flwyddyn a aeth heibio mae Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad wedi dangos nad yw'n gallu gwneud y gwaith. Ar ormod o lawer o faterion, mae wedi dilyn Llundain yn slafaid neu wedi dangos ei bod yn degan yn nwylo ei phlaid. Methodd â mynd â'r maen i'r wal er mwyn pobl Cymru ar ddyfodol cyllid yr UE, yr adolygiad o'r dreth gyngor leol, ac ar gomisiwn Richard. Cymeradwyaf a diolchaf i



and for not following in the same footsteps. He could probably do without my commendation, but it is meant in the best spirit.

We all know how the commitment not to introduce top-up fees before 2007 came about: it was a result of the partnership agreement and flowed from the Rees commission, which was set up as a result of the Liberal Democrats' fundamental opposition to tuition fees. It is important that we remember that the Rees commission's first report noted the deterrent effect that tuition fees have on applicants from poorer homes in particular. That may be due to income and means testing.

The Welsh Liberal Democrats are pleased that these powers in the Act have been delegated to the Assembly, but we believe that they should stay with the Assembly as a whole, because we cannot trust the Assembly Government to play fair by the students or by the higher education sector as a whole. For instance, there is nothing in the draft budget for 2007-08 to cover the cost of either extending Assembly learning grants to cover the cost of top-up fees or of giving money to higher education institutions to replace the income that they would otherwise receive from those fees. In fact, the money available next year for student support has been cut.

In addition, the timetable for the Minister's decision is far too leisurely. Cardiff University told me a year ago that it was already losing staff to England. They were tempted by the higher levels of salary being offered by universities there, which felt secure in the knowledge that they would have the funding from top-up fees. Universities in Wales need reassurance on this issue now, not in many months to come.

I represent a constituency which has two universities and the Royal Welsh College of Music and Drama and which also acts as a dormitory for many University of Glamorgan students. I talk almost daily to students, and they are united with university staff at all levels in not wanting top-up fees. They rightly regard them as creating divisions between students and between universities,

Peter Law am ei araith egwyddorol ac am beidio â dilyn yr un llwybr. Mae'n debyg y byddai'n well ganddo beidio â chael ei ganmol gennyf fi, ond dywedaf hyn gyda'r bwriad gorau.

Yr ydym oll yn gwybod sut y cafwyd yr ymrwymiad i beidio â chyflwyno ffioedd ychwanegol cyn 2007: yr oedd yn ganlyniad i'r cytundeb partneriaeth ac yn deillio o gomisiwn Rees, a sefydlwyd o ganlyniad i wrthwynebiad llwyr y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol i ffioedd dysgu. Mae'n bwysig inni gofio bod adroddiad cyntaf comisiwn Rees wedi nodi bod ffioedd dysgu yn rhwystr i ymgeiswyr o gartrefi tlotach yn benodol. Gallai hynny fod yn ganlyniad i incwm a'r prawf moddion.

Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n falch bod y pwerau hyn yn y Ddeddf wedi'u dirprwyo i'r Cynulliad, ond credwn y dylent aros yn nwylo'r Cynulliad fel cyfangorff, gan na allwn ymddiried yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i fod yn deg â myfyrwyr neu'r sector addysg uwch yn ei gyfarwydd. Er enghraifft, nid oes dim yn y gyllideb ddrafft ar gyfer 2007-08 i dalu un ai am ymestyn grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad i dalu cost ffioedd ychwanegol neu i roi arian i sefydliadau addysg uwch yn lle'r incwm a gaent fel arall o'r ffioedd hynny. Mewn gwirionedd, mae'r arian sydd ar gael y flwyddyn nesaf ar gyfer cymorth i fyfyrwyr wedi'i dorri.

Yn ogystal â hynny, mae'r amserlen ar gyfer penderfyniad y Gweinidog yn rhy hir o lawer. Dywedodd Prifysgol Caerdydd wrthyf flwyddyn yn ôl ei bod eisoes yn colli staff i Loegr. Fe'u temtiwyd gan y lefelau cyflog uchel a gynigir gan y prifysgolion yno, a wyddai'n sicr y caent gyllid o ffioedd ychwanegol. Rhaid i brifysgolion yng Nghymru gael sicrwydd ar y mater hwnnw'n awr, nid ymhen misoedd lawer.

Cynrychiolaf etholaeth y ceir ynddi ddwy brifysgol a Choleg Cerdd a Drama Brenhinol Cymru ac sydd hefyd yn breswylfan i lawer o fyfyrwyr Prifysgol Morgannwg. Byddaf yn siarad â myfyrwyr bron bob dydd, ac maent yn gytûn â staff prifysgol ar bob lefel ynghylch gwrthwynebu ffioedd ychwanegol. Barnant yn gywir eu bod yn creu rhaniadau rhwng myfyrwyr a rhwng prifysgolion, a

and they feel that they are bound to deter poor and middle-income families from sending their children to university.

I share the concern expressed to me by many people that graduates who take less-well-paid jobs, such as those in the social services sector, will be paying back their loans when they are middle aged. Therefore, I ask the Minister to give us a straight answer. Have you already made up your mind about top-up fees? If not, why is there no money in the budget to cover higher education institutions, and why have you also cut student support in next year's budget? In addition, we need to know why we should trust the Assembly Government in future.

4.20 p.m.

We all remember the broken promise, which has been referred to twice, in Labour's 2001 manifesto. That broken promise said precisely:

'We will not introduce top-up fees and have legislated to prevent them'.

If we cannot trust the London branch of the Labour Party, why should we trust the Welsh branch?

**Laura Anne Jones:** Whether we have the power to decide on top-up fees or not, our hands will be tied. The only way that the people of Wales will have the education that they deserve, regardless of their background, is by voting in a Conservative Government next year, which will abolish tuition fees.

Having graduated in 2000, I was lucky enough to miss tuition fees. However, I speak to many friends that have just left university with debts of between £12,000 and £15,000. This is not the way for young people to start the rest of their lives. This Assembly Government has ruled out top-up fees only until the Assembly election in 2007, which suggests that the door is wide open for top-up fees in Wales. I shudder to think that this could leave future graduates with debts of up to £30,000. This Government is always keen

theimlant eu bod yn sicr o atal teuluoedd tlawd a rhai ar incwm canolig rhag anfon eu plant i brifysgol.

Rhannaf y pryder a fynegwyd imi gan lawer o bobl y bydd graddedigion sy'n cymryd swyddi â chyflogau llai, fel y rhai yn y sector gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, yn dal i dalu'n ôl eu benthyciadau pan fyddant yn ganol oed. Gan hynny, gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog roi ateb syml i ni. A ydych wedi penderfynu eisoes ynghylch ffioedd ychwanegol? Os nad ydych, pam nad oes arian yn y gyllideb i dalu i sefydliadau addysg uwch, a pham yr ydych hefyd wedi cwtogi ar gymorth i fyfyrwyr yn y gyllideb ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf? Hefyd, rhaid inni gael gwybod pam y dylem ymddiried yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn y dyfodol.

Yr ydym oll yn cofio'r addewid a dorrrwyd, y cyfeiriwyd ati ddwywaith, ym maniffesto Llafur yn 2001. Union eiriau'r addewid a dorrrwyd oedd:

Ni chyflwynwn ffioedd ychwanegol ac yr ydym wedi deddfu i'w hatal.

Os na allwn ymddiried yng nghanen Llundain y Blaid Lafur, pam y dylem ymddiried yng nghanen Cymru?

**Laura Anne Jones:** Pa un a oes gennym bŵer i benderfynu ar ffioedd ychwanegol ai peidio, bydd ein dwylo wedi'u clymu. Yr unig fodd i bobl Cymru gael yr addysg y maent yn ei haeddu, beth bynnag fo'u cefndir, yw drwy bleidleisio i gael Llywodraeth Geidwadol y flwyddyn nesaf, gan y bydd yn diddymu ffioedd dysgu.

A minnau wedi graddio yn 2000, bŵm yn ddigon ffodus i osgoi talu ffioedd dysgu. Er hynny, byddaf yn siarad â llawer o ffrindiau sydd wedi gadael prifysgol a chanddynt ddyledion sydd rhwng £12,000 a £15,000. Nid felly y dylai pobl ifanc ddechrau ar weddill eu bywyd. Nid yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ond wedi diystyru cyflwyno ffioedd ychwanegol tan etholiad y Cynulliad yn 2007, ac mae hynny'n awgrymu bod pob posibilrwydd y ceir ffioedd ychwanegol yng Nghymru. Arswydaf o feddwl y gallai hynny

to harp on about equal access to universities for all. However, it is naive to suggest that introducing top-up fees will not put young people off university education. A recent report suggests that changes to university admissions will do little to help the poor of Wales. With debts as an issue, many people now feel that a university education is out of their reach, and God knows what they will think after 2007.

Therefore, is this Assembly Government concerned that young people may be deterred from further education? Is it concerned by warnings that top-up fees could lead to a drop in students studying certain subjects, such as science? The cost of top-up fees could introduce significant disincentives against studying science, engineering and technology at university. It could create an incentive for institutions not to provide the most expensive courses. Since the 1990s there has been a downward trend in science graduates in subjects such as physics, biology, medicine, chemistry and engineering. Science courses are naturally more expensive to run, and top-up fees would only exacerbate the problem of lowering the number of science graduates that carry on to be doctors, medical researchers and so on.

The spill-over effect of this would be disastrous for Wales. The absence of tuition fees could make Wales more attractive for undergraduates, especially for science courses, which could help the problem of the Welsh brain-drain. In light of this, variable tuition fees are, in principle, wrong on many different levels. If the Assembly Government has any thought for the future of Welsh education and the future of Wales as a nation, it will not introduce top-up fees in three years' time in any form. Education should not come with a price tag.

**Owen John Thomas:** Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am gynnwys yn ei haraith

adael graddedigion mewn dyledion o hyd at £30,000 yn y dyfodol. Mae'r Llywodraeth hon bob amser yn hoff o rygnu ar yr un hendant ynghylch mynediad cyfartal i brifysgolion i bawb. Fodd bynnag, peth naif yw awgrymu na fydd cyflwyno ffioedd ychwanegol yn troi pobl ifanc oddi wrth addysg prifysgol. Mae adroddiad diweddar yn awgrymu mai ychydig a wnaiff newidiadau i drefniadau derbyn y prifysgolion i helpu tlodion Cymru. Gan fod dyledion yn pwyso ar eu meddwl, mae llawer yn teimlo bellach fod addysg prifysgol y tu hwnt i'w cyrraedd, a Duw a wŷr beth fydd eu barn ar ôl 2007.

Felly, a yw'r Llywodraeth Cynulliad hon yn poeni y gallai pobl ifanc gael eu troi oddi wrth addysg bellach? A yw'n pryderu ynghylch rhybuddion y gallai ffioedd ychwanegol beri gostyngiad yn nifer y myfyrwyr sy'n astudio rhai pynciau, fel y gwyddorau? Mae'n bosibl y bydd cost ffioedd ychwanegol yn wrthanogaeth fawr rhag astudio'r gwyddorau, peirianeg a thechnoleg yn y brifysgol. Gallai gymell sefydliadau i beidio â chynnig y cyrsiau drutaf. Ers y 1990au, bu gostyngiad yn nifer graddedigion y gwyddorau mewn pynciau fel ffiseg, bioleg, meddygaeth, cemeg a pheirianeg. Mae cyrsiau'r gwyddorau'n ddrotach i'w rhedeg, wrth gwrs, ac ni fyddai ffioedd ychwanegol ond yn gwaethygu problem y gostyngiad yn nifer graddedigion y gwyddorau sy'n mynd ymlaen i fod yn feddygon, yn ymchwilwyr meddygol ac yn y blaen.

Byddai sgîl-effaith hynny ar Gymru'n drychinebus. Pe na cheid ffioedd dysgu, gallai hynny beri i Gymru fod yn fwy deniadol i is-raddedigion, yn enwedig yn achos cyrsiau'r gwyddorau, a gallai hynny fod yn fodd i ddatrys problem yr ymfudiad ymennydd o Gymru. Yng ngolwg hynny, mae ffioedd dysgu amrywiadwy'n anghywir mewn egwyddor ar sawl lefel wahanol. Os yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn poeni o gwbl am ddyfodol addysg yng Nghymru a dyfodol Cymru fel cenedl, ni chyflwynna ffioedd ychwanegol ymhen tair blynedd. Ni ddylid rhoi pris ar addysg.

**Owen John Thomas:** I thank the Minister for including in her speech a little on higher

ychedig bach ar addysg uwch cyfrwng Cymraeg, er i hyn gael ei gynnwys oherwydd bod Plaid Cymru wedi cynnig gwelliant ar y pwnc hwnnw.

There is, in Wales, a finite number of places for students in higher education over the next three years. Given that Wales will have two intake years without top-up fees after the introduction of top-up fees into England, there is likely to be a huge increase in the number of students from England seeking admission to colleges in Wales. In that event, Minister, what preparations do you envisage making to ensure that Welsh students will not be denied access to the cheaper admission available at university colleges in Wales? It would be ridiculous if, after all the work that has been done to try to ensure that students in Wales do not pay top-up fees at the beginning—and the intention was that they would not pay them at all at first—and after all this preparation, Welsh students could not get into their own universities. How do you intend to tackle that problem, Minister?

I ddychwelyd at y Gymraeg, ni fanylais ddigon ar y pwnc hwn. Mae'n flin gennyf ddweud mai hanner addewidion yr ydym yn eu cael gennych drwy'r amser, Weinidog. Un enghraifft yw'r cyrsiau sabothol yr oeddwn yn eu disgwyl gennych dair blynedd yn ôl. Yr ydym yn dal i ddisgwyl manylion amdanynt, er eich bod wedi addo i mi y byddwn yn clywed amdanynt ym mis Hydref, ac mae'n fis Tachwedd erbyn hyn.

Pryd a roddwch fanylion ynglŷn â'r arian a'r nifer o fyfyrwyr fydd yn elwa ar yr arian ychwanegol a gaiff ei wario ar addysg uwch yng Nghymru?

**Mark Isherwood:** The Welsh Conservatives have consistently opposed Labour's tuition and top-up fees. As somebody who attended university on a full grant because my father was unemployed, it is clear to me that the Higher Education Act 2004 is not about the needs of young people or employers as based on evidence, but about broken manifesto promises and a dogmatic numbers game played by an unprincipled and discredited Prime Minister. Delegating functions to the

education through the medium of Welsh, although this was included because Plaid Cymru proposed an amendment on that issue.

Ceir nifer penodol o leoedd i fyfyrwyr mewn addysg uwch yng Nghymru dros y tair blynedd nesaf. Gan y bydd Cymru'n derbyn myfyrwyr am ddwy flynedd heb godi ffioedd ychwanegol ar ôl cyflwyno ffioedd ychwanegol yn Lloegr, mae'n debygol y bydd cynnydd anferth yn nifer y myfyrwyr o Loegr a fydd yn ceisio dod i golegau yng Nghymru. Os digwydd hynny, Weinidog, pa baratodau yr ydych yn rhagweld eu gwneud i sicrhau na wrthodir i fyfyrwyr o Gymru y mynediad rhatach a fydd ar gael mewn colegau prifysgol yng Nghymru? Peth chwerthinllyd, wedi'r holl waith a wnaed i geisio sicrhau na fydd myfyrwyr yng Nghymru'n talu ffioedd ychwanegol ar y dechrau—a'r bwriad ar y dechrau oedd na fyddent yn eu talu o gwbl—ac wedi'r holl waith paratoi hwn, fyddai i fyfyrwyr o Gymru fethu â chael lle yn eu prifysgolion eu hunain. Sut yr ydych yn bwriadu ymdrin â'r broblem honno, Weinidog?

To return to the Welsh language, I did not go into enough detail on this issue. I am sorry to say that we receive half promises from you all the time, Minister. One example is the sabbatical courses that I had expected from you three years ago. We are still awaiting details about them, although you promised me that I would hear about them in October, and it is now November.

When will you give details about the funding and the number of students who will benefit from the additional funding that will be spent on higher education in Wales?

**Mark Isherwood:** Mae Ceidwadwyr Cymru wedi gwrthwynebu ffioedd dysgu a ffioedd ychwanegol Llafur yn gyson. A minnau'n un a aeth i brifysgol ar grant llawn gan fod fy nhad yn ddi-waith, mae'n amlwg i mi nad yw Deddf Addysg Uwch 2004 yn ymwneud ag anghenion profedig pobl ifanc neu gyflogwyr, ond ag addewidion maniffesto a dorwyd a gêm rhifau ddogmatig sy'n cael ei chwarae gan Brif Weinidog diegwyddor ac anhygred. Ni fydd dirprwyo swyddogaethau

First Minister will not change that. This Labour Government has an ideological commitment to expanding university places, and it expects young graduates, most of whom will be on average incomes, to mortgage their futures to pay for that. This is about burdening young people with a dead weight of debt into their middle years and generating cross-border inequalities that will force Wales to introduce top-up fees. I had the privilege and the pleasure of visiting the University of Wales, Bangor last week, where over half of our Welsh-medium students are studying. I was told that the university had opposed student fees but that now they were being introduced in England, their introduction in Wales had become inevitable. I was told that there was now no option other than to introduce some student fee scheme if universities in Wales are to survive competitively. The university stressed that it is not competing in a Wales-only market but that it is in direct competition with English universities. I was told that the funding gap between England, Scotland and Wales was opening up again and that, with England pushing ahead, Wales needed something in place urgently to allow universities to plan effectively and to present what they offer to future students. It particularly emphasised that it was looking forward to the Rees commission report because it needs a lead-in time for prospectuses now being prepared for 2006 entries and because students in Wales enrolling before 2007 must know whether they will be hit by retrospective fees.

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning must now give priority to the business needs of Welsh universities, particularly as her strategy for the higher education sector in Wales states that it is

‘to be regarded as the destination of first choice by a majority of learners in Wales by 2010’.

The Labour Governments in Westminster and Cardiff must now come clean and recognise what independent research has concluded, namely that 50 per cent graduates does not

i’r Prif Weinidog yn newid hynny. Mae’r Llywodraeth Lafur hon wedi ymrwymo’n ideolegol i gynyddu nifer y lleoedd mewn prifysgolion, ac mae’n disgwyl i raddedigion ifanc, y bydd y rhan fwyaf ohonynt ar incwm canolig, forgeisio eu dyfodol i dalu am hynny. Mae hyn yn golygu rhoi pobl ifanc dan faich o ddyled yn eu canol oed a chreu anghydraddoldebau ar draws y ffin a fydd yn gorfodi Cymru i gyflwyno ffioedd ychwanegol. Cefais y ffrainc a’r pleser o ymweld â Phrifysgol Cymru, Bangor yr wythnos diwethaf, lle y mae mwy na hanner ein myfyrwyr cyfrwng Cymraeg. Dywedwyd wrthyf fod y brifysgol wedi gwrthwynebu ffioedd myfyrwyr ond gan eu bod bellach yn cael eu cyflwyno yn Lloegr, ei bod yn anorfod y cânt eu cyflwyno yng Nghymru. Dywedwyd wrthyf nad oedd dewis bellach ond cyflwyno rhyw fath o gynllun ffioedd myfyrwyr os yw prifysgolion yng Nghymru i allu cystadlu. Pwysleisiodd y brifysgol nad cystadlu mewn marchnad i Gymru yn unig yr ydoedd a’i bod yn cystadlu’n uniongyrchol â phrifysgolion yn Lloegr. Dywedwyd wrthyf fod y bwlch cyllido rhwng Lloegr, yr Alban a Chymru yn mynd yn fwy eto a, gan fod Lloegr yn ymwthio ymlaen, fod ar Gymru angen rhywbeth ar frys fel y gallai prifysgolion gynllunio’n effeithiol a chynnig yr hyn sydd ganddynt i fyfyrwyr yn y dyfodol. Pwysleisiodd yn benodol ei bod yn edrych ymlaen at weld adroddiad comisiwn Rees gan fod arni angen amser i baratoi’r prospectysau ar gyfer myfyrwyr a dderbynnir yn 2006 ac am fod rhaid i fyfyrwyr yng Nghymru sy’n cofrestru cyn 2007 gael gwybod a fyddant yn gorfod talu ffioedd adolygol.

Rhaid i’r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes roi blaenoriaeth yn awr i anghenion busnes prifysgolion Cymru, yn enwedig gan fod ei strategaeth ar gyfer y sector addysg uwch yng Nghymru’n datgan ei fod

i’w ystyried yn ddewis cyntaf gan y rhan fwyaf o ddysgwyr yng Nghymru erbyn 2010.

Rhaid i’r Llywodraethau Llafur yn San Steffan a Chaerdydd ddweud y gwir yn awr a chydabod yr hyn a gasglwyd drwy ymchwil annibynnol, sef nad yw cael 50 y cant yn

mean 50 per cent jobs with graduate-level salaries. In reality, Labour's bribes to its backbench rebels to get this passed will not work, because those bribes are built upon prejudice and inequality. It is not fair that a graduate with middle-income parents going into a low-paid public sector job should have larger debts than a graduate with lower-income parents going into a higher paid job. With only 17 per cent of university students coming from lower-income backgrounds, Labour's proposals, notwithstanding its backbench bribes, will penalise those from the lowest income backgrounds the hardest.

Dr Phillip Evans, chair of a committee of headteachers looking into higher education, states that,

'the more levelling down there is, the less these degrees will mean. If everyone has the same degree, I will tell my students to go straight into the workplace, whatever their background'.

The chair of the Headmasters' and Headmistresses' Conference has stated that having more students will not necessarily lead to a more prosperous country. There should be an independent inquiry into the number of graduates that society requires, and the type of skills that society needs. The National Union of Teachers says that top-up fees will deter graduates from taking low-paid public sector jobs. The Association of Graduate Recruiters has stated that its employers receive an average of 42 applications per graduate vacancy, and that there is no shortage of graduates.

**Leighton Andrews:** By what number would you like to reduce the forecast for graduates coming out of Wales in the future?

**Mark Isherwood:** Our UK policy is not to decrease current levels but to remove an artificial 50 per cent target, which I will come to shortly.

raddedigion yn golygu y bydd 50 y cant o swyddi'n rhai â chyflogau ar lefel graddedigion. Mewn gwirionedd, ni fydd llwgrwobrwyon Llafur i'w wrthryfelwyr ar y meinciau cefn i gael derbyn hyn yn llwyddo, gan fod y llwgrwobrwyon hynny'n seiliedig ar ragfarn ac anghydraddoldeb. Nid yw'n deg y bydd y graddedigion hynny a aiff i swyddi â chyflog isel yn y sector cyhoeddus, y mae eu rhieni ar incwm canolig, yn mynd i fwy o ddyled na graddedigion y mae eu rhieni ar incwm is a aiff i swyddi â chyflog uwch. Gan mai dim ond 17 y cant o fyfyrwyr prifysgol sy'n dod o gefndiroedd ag incwm is, bydd cynigion Llafur, er gwaethaf ei lwgrwobrwyon i'w feincwyr cefn, yn cosbi'r rhai o gefndiroedd sydd â'r incwm isaf yn fwyaf caled.

Dywed Dr Phillip Evans, sy'n gadeirydd ar bwyllgor o benaethiaid ysgol sy'n ymchwilio i addysg uwch, mai

po fwyaf o israddio a geir, lleiaf fydd ystyr y graddau hynny. Os mai'r un radd a fydd gan bawb, dywedaf wrth fy myfyrwyr am fynd yn syth i'r gweithle, beth bynnag fo'u cefndir.

Mae cadeirydd Cynhadledd Penaethiaid Ysgol wedi dweud na fydd cael mwy o fyfyrwyr yn golygu o reidrwydd y ceir gwlad fwy llewyrchus. Dylid cael ymchwiliad annibynnol i ganfod nifer y graddedigion y mae ar gymdeithas ei angen, a'r math o sgiliau y mae ar gymdeithas eu hangen. Dywed Undeb Cenedlaethol yr Athrawon y bydd ffioedd ychwanegol yn atal graddedigion rhag cymryd swyddi â chyflog isel yn y sector cyhoeddus. Mae Cymdeithas y Recriwtwyr Graddedigion wedi datgan bod ei chyflogwyr yn cael 42 o geisiadau ar gyfartaledd am bob swydd wag ar gyfer graddedigion, ac nad oes prinder graddedigion.

**Leighton Andrews:** O ba nifer y carech ostwng y rhagolwg ar gyfer graddedigion o Gymru yn y dyfodol?

**Mark Isherwood:** Ein polisi ar gyfer y DU yw na ddylid gostwng y lefelau presennol ond y dylid dileu'r targed artiffisial o 50 y cant, a deuaf at hynny cyn hir.

We must have equality of opportunity and ensure that vocational, technical, and academic education and training have equal status. We must recognise the findings of a report by Cardiff University and Lancaster University, 'The Mismanagement of Talent: Employability and Jobs in the Knowledge Economy', which concludes that there is a strong case for more weight being placed on the FE sector and vocational qualifications and less on obliging almost anybody who has achieved A-levels to read a subject that seems to be academic. For all those reasons, a future UK Conservative Government will restore free access to higher education, abolish tuition fees, retain grants for less well-off students, end means testing for student loans, abolish Labour's 50 per cent participation target and cut student debt in half. This is our policy. A UK Conservative Government would act for the entire community and not be bogged down by Labour's costly targets and regulations. In a competitive higher education market, a Welsh Assembly Government, of whatever colour, would be obliged to follow.

Rhaid inni gael cyfle cyfartal a sicrhau'r un statws i addysg a hyfforddiant galwedigaethol, technegol ac academiaidd. Rhaid inni gydnabod canfyddiadau adroddiad gan Brifysgol Caerdydd a Phrifysgol Caerhirfryn, 'The Mismanagement of Talent: Employability and Jobs in the Knowledge Economy', a ddaw i'r casgliad bod dadl gryf dros roi mwy o bwys ar y sector addysg bellach a chymwysterau galwedigaethol a llai ar fynnu y bydd unrhyw un a enillodd gymwysterau Safon Uwch yn astudio pwnc sy'n ymddangos yn academiaidd. Am bob un o'r rhesymau hynny, bydd Llywodraeth Geidwadol yn y DU yn y dyfodol yn adfer mynediad am ddim i addysg uwch, yn diddymu ffioedd dysgu, yn cadw grantiau ar gyfer myfyrwyr llai cefnog, yn rhoi terfyn ar y prawf moddion ar gyfer benthyciadau myfyrwyr, yn dileu targed Llafur o 50 y cant o gyfranogiad ac yn torri dyledion myfyrwyr yn eu hanner. Dyna yw ein polisi. Byddai Llywodraeth Geidwadol yn y DU yn gweithredu er mwyn y gymuned gyfan, heb ei llyffetheirio gan dargedau a rheoliadau drud Llafur. Mewn marchnad addysg uwch gystadleuol, byddai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, o ba bynnag liw gwleidyddol, yn gorfod dilyn.

4.30 p.m.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I am grateful to Members for their contributions. I will pick up Members' references to the previous Rees commission report in supporting the case and, unfortunately, in misinterpreting some of the report's information. One of the recommendations was that up-front tuition fees should be removed because they were a disincentive to students who would not have to pay. Therefore, a large number of young people did not even think of going on to university because they thought that they had to pay fees when, in fact, they did not. The evidence produced by Professor Teresa Rees and her team was categorically the last nail in the coffin of up-front fees in the United Kingdom. This would not have happened without the Assembly.

**Jenny Randerson:** Do you not agree with the logic that, regardless of whether you are

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau. Ymdriniaf â chyfeiriadau Aelodau at adroddiad blaenorol comisiwn Rees wrth bledio'r achos a, gwaetha'r modd, wrth gamddechongli rhywfaint o'r wybodaeth yn yr adroddiad. Un o'r argymhellion oedd y dylid dileu ffioedd a delid ymlaen llaw gan eu bod yn wrthanogaeth i fyfyrwyr na fyddent yn gorfod eu talu. Felly, yr oedd nifer fawr o bobl ifanc nad oedd hyd yn oed yn ystyried mynd i brifysgol gan eu bod yn tybio y byddent yn gorfod talu ffioedd er nad oedd gofyn iddynt wneud. Y dystiolaeth a ddangosodd yr Athro Teresa Rees a'i thîm oedd yr hoelen olaf un yn yr arch o ran ffioedd a delir ymlaen llaw yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Ni ddigwyddasai hynny oni bai am y Cynulliad.

**Jenny Randerson:** Oni chytunwch fod lle i gredu mai'r un fydd y rhwystur, pa un ai

talking about up-front tuition fees or deferred tuition fees, if people think that they will have to repay the fees in the end, it will be an equal deterrent? Do you not agree with Members from all parties who have expressed concern about the level of accumulated debt with which young people will face life when they finish their degrees?

**Jane Davidson:** You chose to quote the Rees commission incorrectly. The commission said that the key issue related to up-front fees, while it endorsed a deferred graduate contribution. This is the system that will be operated from 2006 in England and Wales. The Rees commission endorsed this measure. It is politically inconvenient to you, but it was endorsed.

**Eleanor Burnham** *rose*—

**Jane Davidson:** We have asked the Rees commission to consider how to bring together issues surrounding higher education planning and funding in order to meet our twin objectives of ensuring that higher education institutions are properly funded and that we do not in any way compromise on our widening access agenda. We have had greater success with widening access in Wales, and, as a result of the 'Reaching Higher' strategy, we have deliberately made additional investment in this agenda. We will keep our manifesto commitments.

**Eleanor Burnham** *rose*—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I do not think that the Minister is giving way.

**Jane Davidson:** We have made it clear that we have two main manifesto commitments. The first is that there will be no variable fees in Wales in 2006-07. This was a manifesto commitment during the 2003 Assembly elections. At that time, we could only commit ourselves to the period of this Assembly. We also said that, with the income foregone, we would provide a supplementary income stream. Sue Essex has indicated that this money is in the budget reserve for 2006-07.

ffioedd dysgu a delir ymlaen llaw neu ffioedd dysgu gohiriedig sydd dan sylw, os yw pobl yn tybio y byddant yn gorfod ad-dalu'r ffioedd ar y diwedd? Oni chytunwch ag Aelodau o bob plaid a fynegodd bryder ynghylch maint y ddyled gronedig y bydd pobl ifanc yn ei hwynebu yn eu bywyd ar ôl gorffen eu cyrsiau gradd?

**Jane Davidson:** Gwnaethoch ddewis camddyfynnu geiriau comisiwn Rees. Dywedodd y comisiwn fod y mater hwn yn ymwneud â ffioedd a delir ymlaen llaw, tra oedd o blaid cyfraniad gohiriedig gan raddedigion. Honno yw'r system a fydd ar waith o 2006 yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Cefnogodd comisiwn Rees y mesur hwn. Mae'n wleidyddol anghyfleus i chi, ond fe'i cefnogwyd.

**Eleanor Burnham** *a gododd*—

**Jane Davidson:** Yr ydym wedi gofyn i gomisiwn Rees ystyried sut i gyd-drafod materion sy'n ymwneud â chynllunio a chyllido addysg uwch er mwyn cyrraedd ein hamcanion deul o sicrhau y caiff sefydliadau addysg uwch eu cyllido'n briodol ac na pheryglwn ein hagenda ar ehangu mynediad mewn unrhyw fodd. Cawsom fwy o lwyddiant wrth ehangu mynediad yng Nghymru, ac, o ganlyniad i strategaeth 'Ymgeisio yn Uwch', yr ydym wedi ychwanegu'n fwriadol at y buddsoddiad yn yr agenda hon. Daliwn at ein hymrwymiaidau maniffesto.

**Eleanor Burnham** *a gododd*—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni chredaf fod y Gweinidog am ildio.

**Jane Davidson:** Yr ydym wedi egluro bod gennym ddau brif ymrwymiad maniffesto. Y cyntaf yw na cheir ffioedd amrywiadwy yng Nghymru yn 2006-07. Yr oedd hynny'n ymrwymiad maniffesto yn ystod etholiadau'r Cynulliad yn 2003. Bryd hynny, ni allem ond ymrwymo ar gyfer cyfnod y Cynulliad hwn. Dywedasom hefyd y darparem lif incwm atodol yn lle'r incwm yr eid hebddo. Mae Sue Essex wedi nodi bod yr arian hwn yng nghronfa wrth gefn y gyllideb ar gyfer 2006-07.



The Rees commission served us well the last time, and we have seen a substantial number of students from low-income backgrounds go on not just to university, but into further education because of our innovative Assembly learning grants. These are available for study at higher and further education institutions. We want to ensure that this continues. Any decision on the introduction of a new fee structure in Wales would be a matter for the Assembly, because it would require regulations.

Turning to issues surrounding Welsh-medium education, I was interested to hear Members promote, as in a vacuum, the concept of a Welsh federal college. I have no objection to a Welsh federal college. However, I am not into concepts. I am into delivery, which means that we want to ensure that we put the money in place for delivery. I would be interested to see—and I will ask the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales to show me—how many Assembly Members who stand here and spout have contributed to a national consultation on the way forward for Welsh-medium education. I look forward to HEFCW sending me your contributions to its proposed strategy. HEFCW consulted during the summer. It is clear from the objections in the Chamber that not one Member of Plaid Cymru even bothered to respond. I will take an intervention from Owen John Thomas, and hope that he will tell me how he responded to the consultation.

**Owen John Thomas:** Yr hyn a wnaif i yw cynrychioli pobl Canol De Cymru. Fel tad i chwech o blant sydd wedi cael addysg Gymraeg, gyda'r ddau ieuengaf yn disgwyl mynd i'r coleg ym mis Medi ac yn methu â chael addysg Gymraeg yn ôl eu dymuniad, credaf ei fod yn warthus eich bod yn siarad fel hyn. Peidiwch â cheisio bychanu pobl sy'n credu yn yr iaith Gymraeg ac yn ei chefnogi, yn wahanol i chi. Yr ydych yn dweud llawer ond yn gwneud dim llawer.

**Jane Davidson:** I would never belittle people who support the Welsh language. I am very

Bu comisiwn Rees yn fuddiol iawn inni y tro diwethaf, a gwelsom nifer sylweddol o fyfyrwyr o gefndiroedd incwm isel yn mynd i brifysgol, a hefyd i addysg bellach, am ein bod wedi arloesi drwy gynnig grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad. Mae'r rhain ar gael i astudio mewn sefydliadau addysg uwch a sefydliadau addysg bellach. Dymunwn sicrhau y bydd hynny'n parhau. Byddai unrhyw benderfyniad ar gyflwyno strwythur ffioedd newydd yng Nghymru'n fater i'r Cynulliad, gan y byddai angen rheoliadau ar gyfer hynny.

Gan droi at faterion sy'n ymwneud ag addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg, yr oedd o ddiddordeb imi glywed Aelodau yn hyrwyddo, mewn gwagle fel petai, y cysyniad o goleg ffederal Cymraeg. Nid oes gennyf unrhyw wrthwynebiad i goleg ffederal Cymraeg. Er hynny, nid cysyniadau sy'n mynd â'm bryd. Mynd â'r maen i'r wal sy'n bwysig i mi, felly yr ydym am sicrhau y rhoddwn arian ar waith i fynd â'r maen i'r wal. Byddai o ddiddordeb imi gael gweld—a gofynnaf i Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru ddangos i mi—faint o Aelodau Cynulliad sy'n sefyll ar eu traed ac yn parablu yma sydd wedi cyfrannu i'w ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus ar y ffordd ymlaen i addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg. Edrychaf ymlaen at gael eich cyfraniadau i'w strategaeth arfaethedig gan y cyngor cyllido. Ymgynghorodd y cyngor cyllido yn ystod yr haf. Mae'n amlwg oddi wrth y gwrthwynebiadau yn y Siambr na wnaeth yr un Aelod o Blaid Cymru drafferthu ymateb hyd yn oed. Derbyniaf ymyriad gan Owen John Thomas, a gobeithiaf y dywed wrthyf sut yr ymatebodd i'r ymgynghoriad.

**Owen John Thomas:** What I will do is represent the people of South Wales Central. As a father of six children who have received Welsh-medium education, and whose youngest two are expecting to go to college in September but are unable to receive Welsh-medium education as they wish, I think that it is disgraceful that you should speak like this. Do not try to belittle people who believe in the Welsh language and who support it, unlike you. You say a lot, but do not do much.

**Jane Davidson:** Ni fyddwn byth yn bychanu rhai sydd o blaid y Gymraeg. Yr wyf yn sicr

much one of them myself. That is why I said that I want to focus on issues around delivery. We have a national steering group independent of the Assembly taking evidence across Wales as to the best route forward in the delivery of Welsh-medium education. That steering group has presented HEFCW with a strategy which includes the exciting proposals that I have announced today. HEFCW has asked me to respond in advance of agreeing that strategy, and I have put over £3 million on the table to respond to a national strategy. The Assembly should be pleased that we have those committed people out there who are contributing towards this agenda in terms of improving the delivery in Wales's universities.

I agree with Peter Law that there are no soft options. My job as Minister is to protect the interests of institutions and future students. It is not a soft option; it is a hard option. It will involve the Assembly making hard decisions. I say to David Davies—and I will ensure that your ad hoc advice is available to the Rees commission, as you are able to analyse the whole issue in a matter of three minutes—that I will not listen to the Conservatives, who propose to introduce commercial rates on loans so that the poorer you are, the more there is to pay back as a result of the university experience.

I agree with your point, Leighton. The fact that the Student Loans Company is not dealing properly with Welsh-medium inquiries, is appalling. I have raised this issue with Kim Howells, the Minister of State for Lifelong Learning, Further and Higher Education in England. This is a matter for the Department for Education and Skills. I shall be meeting Kim shortly to discuss this further. If you vote against the delegation, you will be voting against ensuring that Wales can offer a full, bilingual student support system and a student loan system.

In response to Jenny Randerson's point, the Assembly learning grant budget is a demanded budget. We have given an undertaking

yn un ohonynt. Dyna pam y dywedais fy mod am ganolbwyntio ar faterion sy'n ymwneud â chyflawni'r amcan. Mae gennym grŵp llywio cenedlaethol sy'n annibynnol ar y Cynulliad sy'n cymryd tystiolaeth ledled Cymru ynghylch y ffordd orau i ddarparu addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg yn y dyfodol. Mae'r grŵp llywio hwnnw wedi cyflwyno strategaeth i Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru sy'n cynnwys y cynigion cyffrous yr wyf wedi'u cyhoeddi heddiw. Gofynnodd y cyngor cyllido imi ymateb cyn cytuno ar y strategaeth honno, a rhoddais fwy na £3 miliwn ar y bwrdd i ymateb i strategaeth genedlaethol. Dylai'r Cynulliad fod yn falch bod gennym bobl ymroddedig o'r fath yn y maes sy'n cyfrannu at yr agenda hon o ran gwella'r dull o ddarparu ym mhrifysgolion Cymru.

Cytunaf â Peter Law nad oes unrhyw ddewisiadau hawdd. Fy ngwaith i fel Gweinidog yw diogelu buddiannau sefydliadau a myfyrwyr y dyfodol. Nid yw'n ddewis hawdd; mae'n ddewis anodd. Bydd yn rhaid i'r Cynulliad wneud penderfyniadau anodd o'r herwydd. Dywedaf wrth David Davies—a sicrhaf y bydd eich cyngor parod ar gael i gomisiwn Rees, gan eich bod yn gallu dadansoddi'r holl fater mewn tair munud—na wrandawaf ar y Ceidwadwyr, sy'n cynnig cyflwyno cyfraddau masnachol ar fenthyciadau fel mai po dlotaf yr ydych, mwyaf y bydd i'w dalu'n ôl o ganlyniad i'r profiad o fod mewn prifysgol.

Cytunaf â'r pwynt a wnaethoch chi, Leighton. Mae'n beth gwarthus nad yw'r Cwmni Benthyciadau Myfyrwyr yn delio'n briodol ag ymholiadau drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Yr wyf wedi codi'r mater hwn gyda Kim Howells, y Gweinidog Gwladol dros Ddysgu Gydol Oes ac Addysg Bellach ac Uwch yn Lloegr. Mae hyn yn fater i'r Adran Addysg a Sgiliau. Byddaf yn cwrdd â Kim cyn hir i drafod hyn ymhellach. Os pleidleisiwch yn erbyn y dirprwyo, byddwn yn pleidleisio yn erbyn sicrhau y gall Cymru gynnig system gymorth myfyrwyr a system benthyciadau myfyrwyr ddwyieithog, gyflawn.

Mewn ymateb i'r pwynt a wnaeth Jenny Randerson, mae cyllideb grant dysgu'r Cynulliad yn cael ei arwain gan y galw.

again this year, which you have once again deliberately misinterpreted, that every student eligible for the funding will be able to receive it. The current issue is that, even with a 13 per cent increase in applications for Assembly learning grants, the budget was underspent. We do not leave the money in the budget to be underspent, but we have guaranteed to put any money into the budget that is required in terms of a demand-led budget.

4.40 p.m.

It is interesting that no-one who contributed to the debate thought about the amount of money that will come from Westminster for the student support agenda.

Owen John Thomas mentioned sabbaticals. In 'Iaith Pawb', we said that sabbaticals would be in place for 2005-06. The information was published in October, it is included in the budget, and you will be able to discuss this in committee next week. Regarding Mark Isherwood's contribution—we do not have a 50 per cent target for graduates in Wales. We have never had that target, and I must have said so on numerous occasions in the Chamber. It is an England-only target. In Wales, we have never had—*[Interruption]*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order.

**Jane Davidson:** I commend the motion, unamended, to Members.

Rhoesom ymgymeriad eto eleni, a gamddehonglwyd yn fwriadol gennych eto, y bydd pob myfyriwr sy'n gymwys i gael y cyllid hwn yn gallu ei dderbyn. Yr hyn sydd dan sylw ar hyn o bryd yw bod tanwario ar y gyllideb, er bod 13 y cant yn fwy o geisiadau am grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad. Ni adawn yr arian yn y gyllideb i'w danwario, ond yr ydym wedi gwarantu y rhoddwn unrhyw arian y mae ei angen yn y gyllideb hon sy'n cael ei harwain gan y galw.

Mae'n ddiddorol nad oedd neb a gyfrannodd i'r ddadl wedi ystyried y swm o arian a ddaw o San Steffan ar gyfer yr agenda ar gymorth i fyfyrwyr.

Cyfeiriodd Owen John Thomas at gyrsiau sabothol. Yn 'Iaith Pawb', dywedasom y byddai cyrsiau sabothol ar gael yn 2005-06. Cyhoeddwyd y wybodaeth hon ym mis Hydref, ac fe'i ceir yn y gyllideb, a byddwch yn gallu trafod hyn yn y pwyllgor yr wythnos nesaf. Gyda golwg ar gyfraniad Mark Isherwood—nid oes gennym darged o 50 y cant ar gyfer graddedigion yng Nghymru. Nid yw hynny erioed wedi bod yn darged gennym, ac yr wyf yn sicr o fod wedi dweud hynny ar sawl achlysur yn y Siambr. Targed i Loegr yn unig ydyw. Yng Nghymru, ni chawsom erioed—*[Torri ar draws]*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn.

**Jane Davidson:** Cymeradwyaf y cynnig, heb ei ddiwygio, i Aelodau.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 31, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.*

*Amendment 1: For 31, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane

Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Peter  
 Lloyd, David  
 Marek, John  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
 Amendment 2: For 29, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Marek, John  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
 Amendment 3: For 29, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 4: For 29, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy

Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
 Amendment 5: For 29, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Marek, John  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 18, Ymatal 11, Yn erbyn 30.  
 Amendment 6: For 18, Abstain 11, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 German, Michael  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin

Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Marek, John  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment defeated.*

Motion NDM2138 as amended:

*1. the National Assembly believes that variable tuition fees are, in principle, wrong and acting under section 62(1)(b) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, resolves to delegate the functions of the National Assembly contained in and under the Higher Education Act 2004 to the Assembly First Minister, save those which by law cannot be so delegated.*

*2. Nothing in this motion will have the effect of reducing the pre-eminence of the authority of the full Assembly or of reducing the role of the Assembly Committees in the exercise of the above functions.*

Cynnig NDM2138 wedi'i ddiwygio:

*1. Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn credu bod ffioedd dysgu amrywiol mewn egwyddor yn anghywir, a chan weithredu'n unol ag adran 62(1)(b) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn penderfynu dirprwyo holl swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol sydd wedi eu cynnwys yn Neddf Addysg Uwch 2004, neu sy'n dod o dan y ddeddf honno, i Brif Weinidog Cymru, heblaw am y rhai hynny na ellir eu dirprwyo yn gyfreithiol.*

*2. Ni fydd unrhyw beth yn y cynnig hwn yn golygu y caiff goruchafiaeth awdurdod y Cynulliad llawn na rôl Pwyllgorau'r Cynulliad o ran gweithredu'r swyddogaethau uchod eu lleihau.*

3. *This delegation will be made in the knowledge that those functions will, as appropriate, be further delegated to the appropriate Assembly Minister and to staff.*
3. *Caiiff y swyddogaethau hyn eu dirprwyo gan ei gwneud yn hysbys y byddant yn cael eu dirprwyo ymhellach i'r Gweinidog priodol yn y Cynulliad ac i staff, fel y bo hynny'n briodol.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 59, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amended motion: For 59, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine



Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
 Amended motion carried.*

### **Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order**

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Point of order. I am not sure that my vote on amendment 1 was recorded.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Pwynt o drefn. Nid wyf yn sicr a gofnodwyd fy mhleidlais ar welliant 1.

**The Presiding Officer:** Thank you for raising that matter. I can confirm that your vote was not recorded. However, your comments will be placed on record.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch i chi am godi'r mater hwnnw. Gallaf gadarnhau na chofnodwyd eich pleidlais. Fodd bynnag, bydd eich sylwadau wedi'u cofnodi.

**Andrew Davies:** Point of order. I voted the wrong way on amendment 1. [*Laughter.*]

**Andrew Davies:** Pwynt o drefn. Pleidleisiais yn anghywir ar welliant 1. [*Chwerthin.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Which way a member votes is a not a matter for me; what is a matter for me is whether a vote that has been properly cast is properly recorded.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw'r modd y mae Aelod yn pleidleisio'n fater i mi; yr hyn sy'n fater i mi yw a yw pleidlais a gafodd ei bwrw'n gywir wedi'i chofnodi'n gywir.

### **Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru) Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru)**

#### **Y Bwlch Cyfoeth The Prosperity Gap**

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, amendment 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams and amendment 3 in the name of David Melding.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, gwelliant 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams a gwelliant 3 yn enw David Melding.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Cynigiad fod

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I propose that

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn gresynu at y bwlch cyfoeth sy'n tyfu o dan Lafur Newydd. (NDM2135)*

*the National Assembly for Wales deplores the widening prosperity gap under New Labour. (NDM2135)*

Cynigiad welliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Dileu'r cyfan ar ôl 'Cymru' a rhoi yn ei le:

I propose amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies: delete all after 'Wales' and replace with

*yn cydnabod bod Llafur Newydd wedu methu â chau'r bwlch rhwng y cyfoethog a'r tlawd.*

*recognises that New Labour has failed to close the gap between the rich and the poor.*

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i gyflwyno'r

I am grateful for the opportunity to present

ddadl hon yn enwedig gan ein bod yn trafod un o'r pynciau pwysicaf sydd yn ein hwynebu ar hyn o bryd, sef y bwlch amlwg sydd wedi cynyddu rhwng y tlawd a'r cyfoethog. Mae anghyfartaledd difrifol sy'n gwaethygu ac y mae nifer cynyddol o bobl yng Nghymru bellach yn teimlo bod eu hamgylchiadau yn gwaethygu.

Cyfeiriaf at dri maes sy'n adlewyrchu'r anghyfartaledd hwn, sef yr economi, tai a iechyd.

Yn gyntaf, gwladwriaeth Prydain yw'r mwyaf anghyfartal yn Ewrop. Mae'r bwlch rhwng y tlawd a'r cyfoethog yn fwy nag mewn unrhyw wladwriaeth arall yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Mae'r mynegai Ewropeaidd yn dangos bod bwlch o 33 y cant rhwng yr ardal gyfoethocaf ym Mhrydain a'r ardal dlotaf, sef gogledd-ddwyrain Lloegr. Mae Cymru yn ail o'r gwaelod ar y rhestr honno.

Mae'r bwlch felly rhwng y tlawd a'r cyfoethog ym Mhrydain yn fwy nag y mae yng Ngorllewin yr Almaen wedi iddo uno â'r dwyrain. Ymunodd rhan o ddwyrain Ewrop â Gorllewin yr Almaen ac y mae'r bwlch ym Mhrydain rhwng de-ddwyrain Lloegr a Chymru yn fwy nag ydyw rhwng yr ardaloedd hynny yn yr Almaen. Ffactor arall y mae'n rhaid ei gofio yw bod cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen Cymru yn is nag oedd yn 1978. Bryd hynny, yr oedd CMC Cymru yn 88 y cant o lefel Prydain a heddiw mae wedi gostwng i 79 y cant. Nid oes argoel y bydd pethau'n newid, felly mae sefyllfa Cymru wedi gwanhau.

Os edrychwn ar nifer y bobl sydd yn anweithredol yn economaidd, yng Nghymru mae'r cyfartaledd yn uwch nac ym Mhrydain. Fis Awst eleni, yr oedd 24 y cant o bobl yng Nghymru yn anweithredol yn economaidd o'i gymharu â dim ond 22 y cant ym Mhrydain.

4.50 p.m.

Mae sefyllfa merched yn waeth hyd yn oed, oherwydd yr oedd 30 y cant o ferched Cymru yn economaidd anweithredol o gymharu â 26.5 y cant ym Mhrydain. Fel yr awgrymais yn barod, mae lefelau gwerth ychwanegol crynswth y pen yng Nghymru yr isaf ond un ym Mhrydain. Dim ond gogledd-ddwyrain

this debate, particularly given that we are discussing one of the most important issues currently facing us, namely the widening gap between rich and poor. There is serious inequality which is getting worse and an increasing number of people now feel that their circumstances are deteriorating.

I will address three areas which illustrate this inequality, namely the economy, housing and health.

First, the British state is the most unequal in Europe. The gap between rich and poor is wider than in any other state in the European Union. The European index shows a gap of 33 per cent between the richest area and poorest area in Britain, namely north-east England. Wales is second from bottom on that list.

Therefore, the gap between the rich and poor in Britain is wider than in West Germany after unification with the east. A part of eastern Europe joined West Germany and the gap between south-east England and Wales is wider than it is between those areas in Germany. Another factor that we must remember is that gross domestic product per capita in Wales is lower than it was in 1978, when it was 88 per cent of the level in Britain. Today, it has reduced to 79 per cent. There is no indication that things will change, therefore Wales's situation has weakened.

If we look at the number of people who are economically inactive, in Wales the average is higher than in Britain. In August this year, 24 per cent of people in Wales were economically inactive compared with only 22 per cent in the UK.

The situation for women is even worse because 30 per cent of women in Wales were economically inactive, compared with 26.5 per cent in Britain. As I have already suggested, the gross value added levels per head in Wales are the lowest but one in Britain. Only north-east England is worse.

Lloegr sydd yn waeth. Yr oedd dyfodiad arian Amcan 1 i fod i leihau'r anghyfartaledd yng Nghymru. Nid yw Cymru mewn sefyllfa gyfartal o'i chymharu â Phrydain a rhannau o Ewrop, ac mae'r anghyfartaledd o fewn Cymru yn ein pryderu'n fawr. Yr oedd arian Amcan 1 i fod i leihau'r bwlch hwnnw, ond mae anghyfartaledd economaidd sylweddol a chynyddol o fewn Cymru. Er enghraifft, yn 1995, yr oedd GVA y pen yng ngorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd yn 74 y cant o GVA y pen ddwyrain Cymru. Erbyn 2001, yr oedd y ffigur wedi gostwng i 67 y cant. Fel yr awgrymais yn barod, nid oes unrhyw argoel y bydd y ffigurau hynny'n gwella.

Mae lefelau diweithdra o fewn Cymru hefyd yn codi yn y gorllewin a'r Cymoedd ac yn gostwng yn y dwyrain. Felly, mae sefyllfa economaidd Cymru ym Mhrydain yn gwaethgu ac mae sefyllfa'r gorllewin a'r Cymoedd o fewn Cymru hefyd yn gwaethgu. Ar ôl saith mlynedd o Lywodraeth Lafur, mae anghyfartaledd Cymru o fewn Prydain ac anghyfartaledd ardaloedd o fewn Cymru yng Nghymru yn waeth nag ydoedd o dan y Torïaid.

**Brian Gibbons:** Would you agree, Ieuan, that between 1997 and the date of the latest figures actual GVA per capita in Wales has increased by 13 to 15 per cent?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yes, but it has increased less than GVA in the rest of the United Kingdom. That is the problem. It increases, but at a slower rate, so the gap between Wales and Britain is wider, and the gap between west Wales and the Valleys and east Wales is also widening. That was a duff point, Brian.

Let us look at housing.

Un o'r materion pwyiscaf a wynebwn yw tai, ac eglurais hynny yn ystod cwestiynau'r Prif Weinidog heddiw. Mae mwy a mwy o bobl yn ddi-gartref yng Nghymru, ac mae'r niferoedd yn codi bob blwyddyn ers pedair blynedd. Mae'r ffigurau diweddaraf yn sgandal llwyr—mae dros 9,000 o deuluoedd wedi'u derbyn yn ddi-gartref, ac mae hanner y teuluoedd hynny â phlant neu fam sy'n feichiog. Mae bron i 3,000 o bobl yn byw

Objective 1 was supposed to reduce inequality in Wales. Wales is not in a position of parity with Britain and parts of Europe, and the inequality within Wales causes us great concern. Objective 1 funding was supposed to narrow that gap, but there is increasing and substantial economic inequality within Wales. For example, in 1995, GVA per head in west Wales and the Valleys was 74 per cent of that in east Wales. By 2001, that figure had fallen to 67 per cent. As I have already suggested, there is no indication that those figures will improve.

Unemployment levels in Wales are also rising in west Wales and the Valleys and decreasing in the east. Therefore, Wales's economic situation within Britain is worsening and the situation of west Wales and the Valleys within Wales is also worsening. After seven years of Labour Government, the inequality of Wales within Britain and of areas of Wales within Wales is worse than it was under the Tories.

**Brian Gibbons:** A gytunech, Ieuan, fod y gwir werth ychwanegol crynswth y pen yng Nghymru, rhwng 1997 a dyddiad y ffigurau diweddaraf, wedi codi o 13 i 15 y cant?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Cytunaf, ond bu llai o gynnydd ynddo nag yn y gwerth ychwanegol crynswth yng ngweddill y Deyrnas Unedig. Dyna'r broblem. Mae'n codi, ond yn arafach, felly mae'r bwlch rhwng Cymru a Phrydain yn ehangach, ac mae'r bwlch rhwng gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd a dwyrain Cymru'n cynyddu hefyd. Yr oedd hwnnw'n bwynt diwerth, Brian.

Gadewch inni droi at dai.

One of the most important issues that we face is housing, as I explained during First Minister's questions today. More and more people are homeless in Wales, and the numbers have increased every year for four years. The latest figures are a total scandal—over 9,000 families are deemed to be homeless, and half of those families have children or a mother who is pregnant. Almost 3,000 people live in temporary

mewn llety dros dro—mae'r ffigwr hwnnw wedi dyblu mewn blwyddyn. Mae mwy a mwy o bobl yn cael eu rhoi mewn llety gwely a brecwast ac, fel y gwyddom o'n hetholaethau ein hunain, mae hynny'n golygu bod teuluoedd yn cael eu chwalu.

Mae ffigurau felly yn warthus, ac maent yn gondemniad llwyr o'r Llywodraeth Lafur. Mae pobl yn methu â chael tŷ addas ar rent, ac yn methu â fforddio prynu tŷ. Mae hwn yn fater sy'n effeithio ar bob rhan o Gymru—o Fôn i Fynwy, o Gaerdybi i Gaerdydd ac o Fiwmaris i'r Bontfaen. Mae problemau digartrefedd difrifol ar draws Gymru, sy'n effeithio ar bawb—pobl ifanc, teuluoedd, yr henoed, pobl abl a phobl anabl. Mae 50,000 o blant yng Nghymru yn byw mewn tai anaddas, ac mae canlyniadau hynny yn costio £50 miliwn i'r gwasanaeth iechyd bob blwyddyn.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.55 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.55 p.m.*

What about the inequalities in the health service? We know that those inequalities are growing ever wider. I have explained in the last three weeks the differences between Wales and England and the differences between Wales and Scotland. I do not have time to go into the figures because other Members will want to contribute, but the sad reality is that the inequality in Wales means, for example, that in England, only 552 patients are waiting more than 12 months for treatment, compared with 8,188 in Wales. That is an enormous difference. There are seven times more people waiting for orthopaedic surgery in Wales after 12 months than the total number of people who are waiting in England. That is an absolute disgrace.

Where does this inequality lead us? It leads us to the sad fact that the only way in which patients can get elective surgery in Wales quicker—than three years in some cases—is if they pay for it privately. The rich can pay, and the poor must wait. We now find that whatever criterion we use—the economy, housing or health—the prosperity gap between Wales and the rest of Britain, and between different parts of Wales, is growing ever wider, and all this is after seven years of

accommodation—that figure has doubled in a year. More and more people are being placed in bed and breakfast accommodation and, as we know from our own constituencies, that means that families break down.

Such figures are a disgrace, and a total condemnation of the Labour Government. People cannot get a decent house to rent, and cannot afford to buy a house. This issue affects every part of Wales—from Anglesey to Monmouthshire, from Holyhead to Cardiff and from Beaumaris to Cowbridge. There are serious homelessness problems across Wales, which affect everybody—young people, families, the elderly, the able bodied and the disabled. As many as 50,000 children in Wales live in unsuitable housing and the consequences of that costs the health service £50 million every year.

Beth am anghydraddoldebau yn y gwasanaeth iechyd? Gwyddom fod yr anghydraddoldebau hynny'n cynyddu fwyfwy. Eglurais yn y tair wythnos diwethaf y gwahaniaethau rhwng Cymru a Lloegr a'r gwahaniaethau rhwng Cymru a'r Alban. Nid oes gennyf ddigon o amser i fanylu ar y ffigurau gan y bydd Aelodau eraill yn dymuno cyfrannu, ond y gwir trist yw bod yr anghydraddoldeb a geir yng Nghymru'n golygu, er enghraifft, mai dim ond 552 o gleifion yn Lloegr sy'n disgwyl yn fwy na 12 mis am driniaeth, o'i gymharu ag 8,188 yng Nghymru. Mae hynny'n wahaniaeth enfawr. Mae saith gwaith yn fwy o bobl yn disgwyl am lawdriniaeth orthopedig yng Nghymru ar ôl 12 mis na'r holl nifer sy'n disgwyl yn Lloegr. Mae hynny'n hollol gywilyddus.

Beth yw canlyniad yr anghydraddoldeb hwn? Y canlyniad i hyn yw'r ffaith drist mai'r unig fodd y gall cleifion gael llawdriniaeth ddewisol yng Nghymru'n gynharach—cyn pen tair blynedd mewn rhai achosion—yw drwy dalu amdani'n breifat. Gall y cyfoethog dalu, a rhaid i'r tlawd aros. Cawn bellach, ni waeth pa faen prawf a ddefnyddiwn—yr economi, tai neu iechyd—fod y bwch cyfoeth rhwng Cymru a gweddill Prydain, a rhwng gwahanol rannau o Gymru, yn mynd

a Labour Government. New Labour in Wales is complacent and arrogant: complacent because it thinks that it will be in power forever, and arrogant because it will not listen to anyone. Our job is to shake New Labour out of its complacency and strip it of its arrogance. The people of Wales deserve better than this.

**Michael German:** I propose amendment 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*notes that after seven years of a Labour Government, the poorest 10 per cent still pay over four times more of their income in council tax than the richest 10 per cent and believes that to narrow the prosperity gap council tax should be scrapped and replaced with a local income tax linked to ability to pay.*

I am grateful to Plaid Cymru for bringing forward this motion. It is broad in context and allows us to examine the Labour record in Wales and across the United Kingdom. Before dealing with the issues mentioned in our amendment, I will discuss two groups of people who are feeling the pinch as a result of the lowering of prosperity in our society: pensioners on the one hand, and students on the other.

Our society is growing older and more people are living longer, which means that increasing amounts of people need proper support as pensioners. We know that the way in which the Labour Party deals with the poverty of pensioners and their problems is to offer them pension credit. Four out of 10 people across Wales who are eligible for pension credit and other funding of this sort do not take it up. Those figures were produced by the Department for Work and Pensions, so we know that their accuracy is not in doubt. There was a massive publicity campaign at the beginning, but it is now tailing off, and people are no longer encouraged to take up pension credit. A huge number of people are suffering as a result of a system that has not hit the button as far as the prosperity of our older people is concerned.

yn fwy byth, a hyn oll ar ôl saith mlynedd o Lywodraeth Lafur. Mae Llafur Newydd yng Nghymru'n ddifater ac yn drahaus: mae'n ddifater oherwydd y cred y bydd mewn grym am byth, ac mae'n drahaus am na wnaiff wrando ar neb. Ein gwaith ni yw ysgwyd Llafur Newydd o'i ddifaterwch a'i ddinoethi o'i drahauster. Mae pobl Cymru'n haeddu gwell na hyn.

**Michael German:** Cynigiau welliant 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn nodi bod y 10 y cant tlotaf, saith mlynedd ar ôl ethol Llywodraeth Lafur, yn dal i dalu dros pedair gwaith mwy o'u hincwm mewn treth gyngor na'r 10 y cant cyfoethocaf ac yn credu, er mwyn cau'r bwlch cyfoeth, y dylid diddymu'r dreth gyngor a sefydlu treth incwm leol sy'n gysylltiedig â'r gallu i dalu yn ei lle.*

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Blaid Cymru am ddwyn y cynnig hwn gerbron. Mae ei gyddestun yn eang ac mae'n caniatáu inni edrych ar record Llafur yng Nghymru a ledled y Deyrnas Unedig. Cyn delio â'r materion y cyfeirir atynt yn ein gwlliant, trafodaf ddau grŵp o bobl sy'n teimlo'r esgid yn gwasgu am fod ffyniant yn mynd tuag at i lawr yn ein cymdeithas: pensiynwyr ar y naill law, a myfyrwyr ar y llaw arall.

Mae ein cymdeithas yn heneiddio ac mae mwy o bobl yn byw'n hwy, ac oherwydd hynny mae ar fwy o bobl angen cymorth priodol fel pensiynwyr. Gwyddom mai'r modd y mae'r Blaid Lafur yn delio â thlodi pensiynwyr a'u problemau yw cynnig credyd pensiwn iddynt. Mae pedwar o bob 10 o'r rhai sy'n gymwys i gael credyd pensiwn a chyllid arall o'r math hwn ledled Cymru nad ydynt yn ei gymryd. Yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau a gynhyrchodd y ffigurau hynny, felly gwyddom nad oes amheuaeth am eu cywirdeb. Cafwyd ymgyrch gyhoeddusrwydd enfawr ar y dechrau, ond mae honno'n mynd yn llai'n awr, ac nid yw pobl yn cael eu hannog bellach i gymryd credyd pensiwn. Mae nifer fawr o bobl yn dioddef o ganlyniad i system sydd heb gyrraedd y nod o ran ffyniant ein pobl hyn.

**Jenny Randerson:** Do you share my concern about the recent news that pension credit staff have been told that they can no longer run drop-in surgeries for people to come in to make inquiries about their eligibility for pension credit? They will now rely entirely on telephone contact, which has already failed to attract a large percentage of the people who should get those credits.

**Michael German:** That is the absolute worry. Not only do you have an imperfect system—a credit based system, or a scheme involving means testing—to help the older members of our society, but civil servants, who are supposed to encourage people to take it up, are now being told ‘we do not want you to do as much as you possibly can’. Essentially that means that the Treasury saves money that is due to our older people and should be in their pockets. We should pay people a proper pension so that they can live their older lives in dignity. The situation has gone from bad to worse, as there is clear evidence now that those who are approaching pensionable age are not picking up this money. As every month goes by, pensioners are missing out on the money to which they are entitled. It is shocking that more pensioners die each month than sign up for pension credits.

The second group of people that I will refer to are students. It is now our policy in the National Assembly that variable tuition fees are wrong, and therefore I would hope that the Government takes action to ensure that the student debt with which it is crippling many of our young people will be put right. As this is a nation that will depend in future on the skills of our young people and on developing skills in our society, it is crucial that the Government thinks its way out of the problems that now face it. It can no longer run with the UK policy, or the Labour Government policy from London, that tuition fees and debts are the way forward to increase skills levels in our society. That means that you will have to find a way of finding the money, at the UK level and in Wales, and answer the fundamental question of how to deal with the problem of tuition fees.

**Jenny Randerson:** A ydych yn rhannu fy mhryder ynghylch y newydd diweddar bod staff y credyd pensiwn wedi'u hysbysu na chânt gynnal cymorthfeydd galw heibio bellach fel y gall pobl ddod heibio a holi ynghylch eu cymhwyster i gael credyd pensiwn? Byddant bellach yn dibynnu'n llwyr ar gyswllt dros y teleffon, sydd eisoes wedi methu â denu canran fawr o'r rhai a ddylai gael y credydau hynny.

**Michael German:** Dyna'r pryder mwyaf. Nid yn unig y ceir system amherffraith—system sy'n seiliedig ar gredydau, neu gynllun sy'n cynnwys prawf moddion—i helpu aelodau hŷn ein cymdeithas, ond yr hyn a ddywedir wrth weision sifil, sydd i fod i annog pobl i'w derbyn, yw ‘nid ydym am ichi wneud eich gorau glas’. Yr hyn y mae hynny'n ei olygu, yn y bôn, yw y bydd y Trysorlys yn arbed arian sy'n ddyledus i'n pobl hŷn ac a ddylai fod yn eu poced. Dylem dalu pensiwn iawn i bobl fel y gallant fyw gydag urddas yn eu henaint. Mae'r sefyllfa wedi mynd o ddrwg i waeth, a cheir tystiolaeth bendant bellach nad yw'r rhai sy'n dynesu at oed ymddeol yn cymryd yr arian hwn. Wrth i bob mis fynd heibio, mae pensiynwyr yn colli'r arian y mae ganddynt hawl iddo. Mae'n frawychus bod mwy o bensiynwyr yn marw bob mis nag sy'n ymgeisio am gredydau pensiwn.

Yr ail grŵp y cyfeiriai ato yw myfyrwyr. Mae bellach yn bolisi gennym yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol fod ffioedd dysgu amrywiadwy'n anghywir, ac felly gobeithiaf y bydd y Llywodraeth yn cymryd camau i sicrhau y gwneir iawn am y ddyled ymysg myfyrwyr sy'n andwyo llawer o'n pobl ifanc. Gan y bydd y genedl hon yn dibynnu yn y dyfodol ar sgiliau ein pobl ifanc ac ar y gwaith o feithrin sgiliau yn ein cymdeithas, mae'n hollbwysig i'r Llywodraeth ddod o hyd i fodd i ddatrys y problemau sy'n ei hwynebu'n awr. Ni all bellach gyd-fynd â pholisi'r DU, neu bolisi'r Llywodraeth Lafur yn Llundain, sy'n dal mai ffioedd dysgu a dyledion yw'r modd i godi lefelau sgiliau yn ein cymdeithas. Oherwydd hynny, bydd yn rhaid ichi ganfod modd i gael yr arian, ar lefel y DU ac yng Nghymru, a datrys problem sylfaenol y ffioedd dysgu.

5.00 p.m.

Finally, with regard to our amendment, we heard the local government settlement today, and the figures are quite clear. We are on a carousel that hits people in one street because their houses have been rebanded, while others in the next street may not be hit so hard. It is difficult to tell where the blow will land, but you can be sure that an extra burden is being placed on people's pockets because of the revaluation of their homes. The likely increase in your council tax is 20 per cent, if you go up one band, and, in a second year, because the dampening scheme that the Minister has put in place does not last beyond the first year, if you are going up two bands you are likely to see your council tax increase by 40 per cent. It is not obvious where this will hit. It could depend on the street you live in, or on whether you have extended your house. Many people, particularly pensioners, will be hurt by this system based on property value, and not on ability to pay. We must deal with the problems of our pensioners, council tax and students. Let us hope that the Government will listen, and learn the lessons of this afternoon. It is now being told clearly that it must find an alternative to the way in which its London Government sees student debt being handled. Get on and give us the answers—let us hear them.

**Alun Cairns:** I propose amendment 3 in the name of David Melding: add at the end of the motion:

*and calls for a review of 'A Winning Wales' and its target to achieve 90 per cent of UK GDP per capita by 2010.*

We are happy to support the amendment in the name of Jocelyn Davies, as it is factually accurate. Also, Mike, we agree with the first part of the Liberal Democrat amendment, but, unfortunately, as it makes reference to the local income tax that you want to introduce and which would disadvantage many people because of administration costs, we cannot support it. We do not think that you have costed your proposal for local income tax. However, I certainly agree with and endorse the first half of the amendment.

Yn olaf, gyda golwg ar ein gwelliant, clywsom y setliad llywodraeth leol heddiw, ac mae'r ffigurau'n eithaf clir. Mae gennym chwyrligwgan sy'n taro rhai mewn un stryd gan fod eu tai wedi'u hailfandio, heb daro eraill yn y stryd nesaf mor galed. Anodd yw dweud pwy a gaiff ei daro, ond gallwch fod yn sicr bod pobl o dan faich ariannol ychwanegol oherwydd ailbrisiu eu cartrefi. Mae'ch treth gyngor yn debygol o godi o 20 y cant, os ydych yn codi un band, ac, yn yr ail flwyddyn, gan nad yw'r cynllun lleddfu a roddodd y Gweinidog ar waith yn parhau ar ôl y flwyddyn gyntaf, os ydych yn codi dau fand, mae'n debygol o godi o 40 y cant. Nid yw'n amlwg pwy a gaiff ei daro. Gallai fod yn amodol ar y stryd y mae rhywun yn byw ynddi, neu a ydyw wedi codi estyniad i'w dŷ. Bydd llawer o bobl, a phensiynwyr yn enwedig, yn cael eu brifo gan y system hon sy'n seiliedig ar werth eiddo, ac nid ar y gallu i dalu. Rhaid inni ddelio â phroblemau ein pensiynwyr, y dreth gyngor a myfyrwyr. Gadewch inni obeithio y gwnaiff y Llywodraeth wrando, a dysgu'r gwersi a gafodd y prynhawn yma. Dywedir wrthi'n glir yn awr fod rhaid iddi ddod o hyd i ddull o drin dyledion ymysg myfyrwyr sy'n wahanol i'r un sydd gan ei Llywodraeth yn Llundain. Ewch ati a rhowch yr atebion i ni—gadedwch inni eu clywed.

**Alun Cairns:** Cynigiau welliant 3 yn enw David Melding. Ychwanegu ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*ac yn galw am adolygiad o 'Cymru'n Ennill' a'i tharged o gyrraedd lefel CMC y pen sy'n 90 y cant o lefel y DU erbyn 2010.*

Yr ydym yn fodlon cefnogi'r gwelliant sydd yn enw Jocelyn Davies, gan ei fod yn ffeithiol gywir. Hefyd, Mike, cytunwn â rhan gyntaf gwelliant y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, ond, gwaetha'r modd, gan ei fod yn cyfeirio at y dreth incwm leol yr ydych am ei chyflwyno a barai anfantais i lawer o bobl oherwydd costau gweinyddu, ni allwn ei gefnogi. Ni chredwn eich bod wedi prisio'ch cynllun ar gyfer treth incwm leol. Er hynny, yr wyf yn sicr yn cytuno â rhan gyntaf y gwelliant ac yn ei chymeradwyo.

This is not the first time that I have tabled such an amendment, and its purpose is to gain the Minister's recognition that 'A Winning Wales' and the targets contained in it will not be achieved. Pretending otherwise makes the Assembly—or, should I say, the Assembly Government, or even, given the vote earlier, the Minister—look foolish. Any objective analysis would recognise that, if current policies are pursued with the same levels of funding, the ultimate target—the one that really matters—of reaching 90 per cent of UK GDP per capita by 2010 will not be achieved. When Labour came to power, Wales's GDP per capita as a proportion of the UK per capita was 81.6 per cent. The latest figure available, for 2002, shows a dramatic decline to 78.8 per cent over that short period. It is expected that the new figures, to be published within the next few weeks, will show a further decline because the key indices, such as activity, have certainly not been tackled in the intervening time.

The business community laughed at the target when the document was written, and now that the wealth gap between Wales and the rest of the United Kingdom has widened, the previously unattainable target is now impossible under the resources available. It was deemed impossible to close the 8.4 per cent gap in 10 years, so what hope do we have to close a 12.2 per cent gap in the five to six years remaining? Furthermore, the Assembly's key economic development agencies, the Welsh Development Agency and the Wales Tourist Board, are about to embark on a major reorganisation. No matter how smooth the unwanted transition to the civil service, it will be impossible to maintain the same focus on economic development objectives. To deny that fact will make the Minister look even more foolish than he already does. Anyone involved in the merger of two or three large organisations would recognise the short-term cost in performance before they can be in any position to realise any long-term gain—even if that were to be the case, which I do not think it will be.

While the Minister continues to abandon policies of equal opportunities, including a fair and open appointment system, we cannot be sure that the best person has got the job as

Nid hwn yw'r tro cyntaf imi gyflwyno gwelliant o'r fath, a'i amcan yw peri i'r Gweinidog gydnabod na chyflawnir 'Cymru'n Ennill' a'r targedau a geir ynddo. Mae cymryd arnoch fel arall yn peri i'r Cynulliad—neu, a ddylwn ddweud, Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, neu hyd yn oed, yng ngolwg y bleidlais yn gynharach, y Gweinidog—ymddangos yn ffôl. Byddai unrhyw ddadansoddiad gwrthrychol yn cydnabod, os dilynir y polisiau presennol gyda'r un lefelau o gyllid, na chyrrhaeddir y prif darged—yr un sy'n cyfrif o ddirif—o gyrraedd 90 y cant o CMC y pen y DU erbyn 2010. Pan ddaeth Llafur i rym, CMC y pen Cymru, fel cyfran o CMC y pen y DU, oedd 81.6 y cant. Mae'r ffigur diweddaraf sydd ar gael, am 2002, yn dangos gostyngiad sylweddol i 78.8 y cant dros y cyfnod byr hwnnw. Disgwylir y bydd y ffigurau newydd, a gyhoeddir o fewn yr wythnosau nesaf, yn dangos gostyngiad pellach oherwydd, yn sicr, nid ymdriniwyd â'r mynegeion allweddol, fel gweithgarwch, yn y cyfamser.

Chwerthin am ben y targed a wnaeth pobl fusnes pan ysgrifennwyd y ddogfen honno, a chan fod y bwloch cyfoeth rhwng Cymru a gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig wedi mynd yn fwy, mae'r targed a oedd gynt y tu hwnt i gyrraedd bellach yn amhosibl yng ngolwg yr adnoddau sydd ar gael. Barnwyd ei bod yn amhosibl cau'r bwloch o 8.4 y cant mewn 10 mlynedd, felly pa obaith sydd inni gau bwloch o 12.2 y cant yn y pump i chwe blynedd sy'n weddill? At hynny, mae prif asiantaethau datblygu economaidd y Cynulliad, Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a Bwrdd Croeso Cymru, ar drothwy ad-drefniant mawr. Ni waeth pa mor rhwydd y bydd y trosglwyddiad diangen i'r gwasanaeth sifil, bydd yn amhosibl canolbwyntio i'r un graddau ar amcanion datblygu economaidd. Byddai gwadu'r ffaith honno'n peri i'r Gweinidog ymddangos yn ffolach byth. Byddai unrhyw un sy'n ymwneud â chyfuno dau neu dri chorff mawr yn cydnabod y gost dymor byr a geir o ran perfformiad cyn y byddant mewn lle i sicrhau unrhyw enillion tymor hir—hyd yn oed os bydd hynny'n digwydd, ac ni chredaf y bydd.

Tra pery'r Gweinidog i droi cefn ar bolisiau cyfle cyfartal, gan gynnwys system benodi deg ac agored, ni allwn fod yn sicr mai'r ymgeisydd gorau a gafodd swydd y prif



chief executive. I am sure that the Members who are always the first to rightly champion the causes and benefits of equal opportunities will be as angry as I am about the prejudices and interference shown by the Minister. A better woman or man may have applied for that job had it been advertised and had an open and fair selection process been followed. He or she may have done a better job of giving the Minister the chance of closing the prosperity gap.

**Andrew Davies:** For the record, I absolutely, categorically refute the allegation that I interfered in any process of appointing the temporary chief executive of the WDA. As I have said in the Chamber and in writing in response to questions from Alun, this was entirely a matter for the board of the WDA. I also want to put on record that this is in great contrast to the restructuring undertaken by the former chief executive of the WDA—the organisation, design and development—when none of the senior management team’s jobs were advertised publicly.

**Alun Cairns:** I am grateful for the Minister’s comments because this is the first time that he has sought to answer these questions. Until now he has merely passed the blame and the responsibility to the Welsh Development Agency. What of the answers that he did not give to those written questions that were tabled a fortnight ago on the communications that took place between his office or himself and Welsh Development Agency officials? Is he calling the board member who has contacted me and told me about these communications a liar? I will happily give way if the Minister wants to intervene.

The other question that was not asked at the time was: what appointment process was followed when Graham Hawker was given the role of chief executive? Was the same appointment process followed for Gareth Hall as that for Graham Hawker? The Minister needs to answer those questions and not just abdicate responsibility to the Welsh Development Agency. This is an example of the hypocrisy of the administration and of the First Minister. This Minister has a veto on that appointment. When the WDA makes the appointment, it is by ministerial—

weithredwr. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yr Aelodau sydd bob amser am y cyntaf i ddadlau, a hynny’n briodol, dros achos a manteision cyfle cyfartal, mor ddig ag yr wyf fi ynghylch y rhagfarnau a’r ymyrraeth a gafwyd o du’r Gweinidog. Efallai y byddai rhywun gwell wedi ymgeisio am y swydd honno pe cawsai ei hysbysebu a phe bai proses ddedhol deg ac agored wedi’i dilyn. Efallai y byddai wedi rhoi mwy o obaith i’r Gweinidog gau’r bwlch cyfoeth.

**Andrew Davies:** Er mwyn i bawb gael gwybod, yr wyf yn gwrthod yn llwyr yr honiad imi ymyrryd mewn unrhyw broses ar gyfer penodi prif weithredwr dros dro y WDA. Fel y dywedais yn y Siambr ac mewn llythyrau mewn ymateb i gwestiynau gan Alun, mater i fwrdd y WDA yn unig oedd hwn. Yr wyf hefyd am ddweud ar goedd fod hyn yn gwbl wahanol i’r ad-drefnu a wnaed gan gyn-brif weithredwr y WDA—y trefnu, y cynllunio a’r datblygu—pan na hysbysebwyd yr un o swyddi’r uwch dîm rheoli’n gyhoeddus.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am sylwadau’r Gweinidog gan mai hwn yw’r tro cyntaf iddo geisio ateb y cwestiynau hyn. Hyd yma, nid yw ond wedi bwrw’r bai a’r cyfrifoldeb ar Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru. Beth am yr atebion na roddodd i’r cwestiynau ysgrifenedig hynny a gyflwynwyd bythefnos yn ôl ar y cyfathrebu a fu rhwng ei swyddfa neu ef ei hun a swyddogion Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru? A yw’n galw’r aelod o’r bwrdd a gysylltodd â mi a’m hysbysu am y cyfathrebiadau hyn yn gelwyddgi? Byddaf yn falch o ildio os yw’r Gweinidog yn dymuno ymyrryd.

Y cwestiwn arall nas gofynnwyd ar y pryd oedd: pa broses benodi a ddilynwyd pan roddwyd rôl y prif weithredwr i Graham Hawker? A ddilynwyd yr un broses benodi yn achos Gareth Hall ag yn achos Graham Hawker? Rhaid i’r Gweinidog ateb y cwestiynau hynny yn hytrach nag ymwrthod â’r cyfrifoldeb dros Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru. Dyma enghraifft o ragrith y weinyddiaeth a’r Prif Weinidog. Gall y Gweinidog hwn roi fetu ar y penodiad hwnnw. Pan fydd y WDA yn penodi, gwneir hynny drwy—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. The Minister is not a hypocrite. I would like you to withdraw that. You can refer to the administration as hypocritical but not the Minister.

**Alun Cairns:** I will withdraw that comment, Deputy Presiding Officer, but I hope that you accept that the Minister has been inconsistent in this policy, as have the supporting backbenchers. They are always happy to champion the causes of equal opportunities, but when it comes to appointing a chief executive of the Welsh Development Agency, they do not seem to be as critical—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Your time has run out.

**Alun Cairns:** May I make a closing statement?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** If you are quick.

**Alun Cairns:** In considering the state of the economy and the Welsh Development Agency's appointment process, backbenchers need to ask themselves a question: do they see themselves as defenders of the Minister or as people who stand on principle to represent their constituencies and who stand by the principles of equal opportunities?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Peth cymharol yw tloidi, ond mae'r bwlch rhwng y cyfoethocaf yn ein cymdeithas a'r tlotaf, a rhwng yr ardaloedd cyfoethocaf a'r tlotaf, yn dal i dyfu o dan Lywodraeth Lafur. Pa ryfedd? Onid hoff gyfaill Prif Weinidog Prydain, Peter Mandelson, a ddywedodd ei fod o blaid pobl sydd yn '*stinking rich*'? Os yw Cymru i barhau yn gymuned o gymunedau, mae'n rhaid inni sicrhau datblygiad cyson a chynaliadwy ar draws y wlad.

Yr wyf am ystyried dau faes lle mae Llafur yn y Cynulliad yn methu rhannau helaeth o Gymru. Cafwyd addewid y byddai swyddi sector cyhoeddus yn cael eu hailddosbarthu drwy'r wlad, ond beth sydd wedi digwydd yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf? Yn fy ardal i, bydd aildrefnu a chanoli o fewn y gwasanaeth budd-daliadau yn arwain at 50 o swyddi yn

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw'r Gweinidog yn rhagrithiwr. Carwn ichi dynnu hynny'n ôl. Cewch ddweud bod y weinyddiaeth yn rhagrithiol ond nid y Gweinidog.

**Alun Cairns:** Tynnaf y sylw hwnnw'n ôl, Ddirprwy Lywydd, ond gobeithiaf eich bod yn derbyn bod y Gweinidog wedi bod yn anghyson yn y polisi hwn, fel y bu'r meincwyr cefn sy'n ei gefnogi. Maent bob amser yn barod i ddadlau dros achosion cyfle cyfartal, ond pan ddaw'n fater o benodi prif weithredwr Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, nid yw'n ymddangos eu bod mor feirniadol—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae'ch amser ar ben.

**Alun Cairns:** A gaf i wneud gosodiad i gloi?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Os gwnewch hynny'n gyflym.

**Alun Cairns:** Wrth ystyried cyflwr yr economi a phroses benodi Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, rhaid i feincwyr cefn ofyn cwestiwn iddynt eu hunain: a ydynt yn eu hystyried eu hunain yn amddiffynwyr i'r Gweinidog neu'n rhai sy'n sefyll yn egwyddorol i gynrychioli eu hetholaethau ac sy'n arddel egwyddorion cyfle cyfartal?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Poverty is relative, but the gap between the wealthiest in our society and the poorest, and between the wealthiest and poorest regions, continues to widen under a Labour Government. Why should we be surprised? Was it not the Prime Minister's dear friend, Peter Mandelson, who said that he was all for people who are '*stinking rich*'? If Wales is to remain a community of communities, we must ensure consistent and sustainable development across the country.

I will consider two areas where Labour in the Assembly is failing many parts of Wales. It was pledged that public sector jobs would be redistributed across Wales, but what has happened in recent years? In my area, the reorganisation and centralisation within the benefits service will lead to 50 jobs disappearing from the Porthmadog area, for

diflannu o ardal Porthmadog, er enghraifft. Ardal wledig yw honno sydd eisoes yn wynebu colli ugeiniau o swyddi yng nghanolfan y llu awyr yn Llanfair, ger Harlech. Symudir dros 40 o swyddi eraill o ganolfan alw yr heddlu yng Nghaernarfon, a bu ymdrech ddiweddar i drosglwyddo 20 o swyddi cymorth ym maes iechyd o Gaernarfon i'r Wyddgrug. Cyrff y mae gan y Llywodraeth Lafur gyfrifoldeb uniongyrchol amdanynt yw'r rhain. Mae'r canoli bob amser i'r dwyrain ac, yn aml, i ardaloedd lle nad oes prinder gwaith nac amrywiaeth swyddi. Mae hyn ar ben y llif a welwyd yn y gwasanaethau sylfaenol, sef Dŵr Cymru Welsh Water a Scottish Power Manweb. Swyddi parhaol oedd y rhain, gyda phensiwn call ar ddiwedd gwasanaeth.

5.10 p.m.

Mewn ardal lle mae cyflogau cyfartalog ymhlith yr isaf yng Nghymru bydd yr ailfandio a'r setliad treth gyngor yn rhoi baich annheg pellach ar bensynwyr a'r rhai ar gyflogau isel. I'r rhain, mae'r baich treth gyngor wedi codi o fod yn 13 y cant o'u hincwm i dros 19 y cant ers i Lafur ddod i rym, sef codiad o 30 y cant. Ai tegwch yw hynny?

Ar dai, mae Ieuan Wyn Jones wedi cyfeirio at sgandal y sefyllfa yn gyffredinol. Nid oes dadl bod anhawster a methiant pobl—o bob cefndir—i gael to uwch eu pennau yn drychineb gymdeithasol ac yn tanseilio cymunedau. Dof yn ôl at y frawddeg honno bod Cymru yn gymuned o gymunedau. Os na fyddwn yn ofalus, ni fydd hynny'n wir. Efallai fod chwyddiant ym mhrisiau tai wedi bod yn dda i Gordon Brown a'r economi Brydeinig ond mae'n arwain at anghydraddoldeb cymdeithasol, ac nid oes ymateb gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad hyd y gwelaf, dim ond geiriau gwag.

Nodaf ddwy enghraifft yn unig o'r ardal yr wyf yn byw ynddi. Mae yno un cwpl ifanc, heb gar a chydag un plentyn yn yr ysgol. Mae eu cartref, sef tŷ ar rent mewn teras, ar werth; nid oes gobaith ganddynt ei brynu. Er mwyn addysg y plentyn a gwaith nid ydynt eisiau symud o'r pentref. Nid oes tŷ ar rent yn y sector preifat, dim un gan y cyngor, a dim gan y gymdeithas dai leol. Beth yw'r ateb?

example. That is a rural area that also faces dozens of job losses in the air-force base in Llanfair, near Harlech. Over 40 other jobs are to be moved from the police call centre in Caernarfon, and there was a recent attempt to transfer 20 health support jobs from Caernarfon to Mold. These are organisations for which the Labour Government has direct responsibility. Centralisation always moves eastwards and, often, to areas where there is no shortage or a lack of variety of jobs. This is on top of the drift seen in the utilities, namely Dŵr Cymru Welsh Water and Scottish Power Manweb. These were permanent posts with a proper pension at the end of service.

In an area where the average wage is among the lowest in Wales, the rebanding and the council tax settlement will place a further unfair burden on pensioners and those on lower incomes. For these, the tax burden has increased from being 13 per cent of their income to over 19 per cent since Labour came to power, an increase of 30 per cent. Is that fair?

On housing, Ieuan Wyn Jones has mentioned the scandal of the overall situation. There is no doubt that the inability of people—from all backgrounds—to put a roof over their heads is a social disaster and undermines communities. I return to the point that Wales is a community of communities. If we are not careful, that will no longer be the case. The inflation in house prices may have been good for Gordon Brown and the British economy, but it leads to social inequality, and there is no response from the Assembly Government as far as I can see, nothing but empty words.

I will give just two examples from the area where I live. There is one young couple who do not have a car and who have one child at school. Their home, a rented terraced house, is for sale; they have no hope of buying it. For the sake of their child's education and their work they do not want to leave the village. There is no house for rent in the private sector, and nothing available from the

Mae'r cwpwl wedi gwahanu a'r ddau wedi mynd yn ôl i fyw at eu rhieni.

Cefais enghraifft arall yr wythnos diwethaf. Mae cwpwl ifanc lleol wedi gwneud yr hyn y maent i fod i'w wneud, sef mynd i goleg a graddio, ac mae'r ddau mewn swyddi yn y sector cyhoeddus—swyddi da yn ôl safonau lleol. Maent yn chwilio am dŷ i ddechrau cartref, ond nid oes ganddynt obaith rhentu na phrynu yn eu hardal. Fodd bynnag, mae Gordon Brown yn rhoi mantais treth i bobl gyfoethog i brynu tai haf yn rhan o'u cynllun pensiwn. Rhoddaf enghraifft arall o'r broblem sy'n ein hwynebu mewn ardaloedd fel fy un i. Mae hen bentref chwarel yn ymyl lle yr wyf yn byw; tyddynnod sydd yno. Mae tri thŷ ar werth yno, a'r isaf yn £230,000.

Galwaf heddiw am sefydlu uned ymddiriedolaeth tir yng Nghymru i alluogi pobl yn eu bröydd eu hunain i brynu tir yn rhad—neu gael tir yn rhad—er mwyn codi tai i ddiwallu galw'r gymuned honno, ar rent, rhan-berchnogaeth neu dai preifat, gyda'r amod bod yn rhaid i'r tai hynny aros yn fforddiadwy am byth. Os nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn fodlon helpu ein cymunedau i sicrhau eu dyfodol, rhowch y gallu a'r hawl i bobl wneud hynny drostynt eu hunain.

**Christine Gwyther:** I will use part of my contribution to underline my confidence in the acting chief executive of the Welsh Development Agency. It has pained me to hear the smears that we have heard this afternoon. I knew this individual when he worked in the field as regional director for south-west Wales and I have seen his work at a more strategic level when he came to work in Cardiff at the main offices. He enjoys not only ministerial confidence, but that of backbenchers, his board, his workforce and the business community in Wales. I want that to be placed on record.

**Alun Cairns:** Will you give way?

**Christine Gwyther:** I will certainly not, Alun.

Plaid Cymru's amendment is bizarre. It appears to amend its own motion by

council or the local housing association. What is the solution? The couple has separated and both have gone back to live with their parents.

I heard another example last week. A young local couple have done what they are supposed to do and gone to college and graduated, and both are in public sector jobs—good jobs by local standards. They are looking for their first home, but they have no chance of renting or buying in their own area. However, Gordon Brown provides tax incentives for the rich to buy holiday homes as part of their pension schemes. I will give another example of the problem facing us in areas such as mine. There is an old quarrying village near where I live, which includes several cottages. There are three houses for sale there, and the cheapest is £230,000.

I call today for a land trust unit to be established in Wales to enable people in their own areas to buy land cheaply—or to acquire land cheaply—to build housing to respond to demand within that community, be it accommodation for rent, part ownership or private housing, with the condition that those houses remain affordable forever. If the Government is unwilling to help our communities to survive, give the people the right and the ability to do so for themselves.

**Christine Gwyther:** Defnyddiaf ran o'm cyfraniad i bwysleisio fy ymddiriedaeth ym mhrif weithredwr dros dro Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru. Bu'n ofid imi glywed y difrïo a glywsom y prynhawn yma. Adwaenwn yr un sydd dan sylw pan oedd yn gweithio yn y maes fel cyfarwyddwr rhanbarthol dros dde-orllewin Cymru a gwelais ei waith ar lefel fwy strategol pan ddaeth i weithio i Gaerdydd yn y brif swyddfa. Mae'r Gweinidogion yn ymddiried ynddo, yn ogystal â meincwyr cefn, ei fwrdd, ei weithlu a phobl fusnes yng Nghymru. Yr wyf am i bawb gael gwybod hynny.

**Alun Cairns:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Christine Gwyther:** Na wna, yn sicr, Alun.

Mae gwelliant Plaid Cymru yn un rhyfedd. Mae fel pe bai'n diwygio ei chynnig ei hun

intrinsically saying the same thing using a slightly different sentence construction, which is rather odd. It shows a lack of clarity, which comes through in its economic policy. The poverty gap has not closed, we should all agree on that, but it is closing across the UK. I accept that the top 1 per cent of the UK's people are richer than they were, and perhaps richer than they should be, but there is a real redistribution of wealth between the top 25 per cent—the top quartile of the UK—and the bottom 25 per cent, and we need to keep that sort of redistribution going. We need to do it for economic and social justice reasons.

We can do that through the UK Government tax policy, as well as by lifting those living on a lower wage into a high-wage, high-skill economy. The Welsh Assembly Government is doing that in several ways—through Communities First and the vital capacity building that that programme brings to those communities coping with disadvantage, but also by better training and technology transfer and by lifting the barriers to economic inactivity. A few Members mentioned economic inactivity, and the Welsh Assembly Government is seriously considering how to lift those barriers. I hope that the work that the Economic Development and Transport Committee is doing on economic inactivity will help to inform decision-making at Government level.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Do you not think that we should be concentrating on FE and vocational skills and not on the artificial target of getting 50 per cent of young people into HE?

**Christine Gwyther:** The 50 per cent target is not a Wales target; it is a UK-wide target and is not held by the Minister in Wales. Further education and skills are as important to this Government and to Welsh Labour as higher education. Both are similarly important to the future of the people of Wales.

It is also important to recognise that UK

drwy ddweud yr un peth yn y bôn gan newid trefn y frawddeg ryw ychydig, ac mae hynny'n eithaf rhyfedd. Dengys ddiffyg eglurder, a welir hefyd yn ei pholisi economaidd. Nid yw'r bwch cyfoeth wedi cau, dylem oll gyuno ar hynny, ond mae'n cau ledled y DU. Derbyniad fod yr 1 y cant uchaf o boblogaeth y DU yn gyfoethocach nag yr oeddent, ac yn gyfoethocach efallai nag y dylent fod, ond ceir gwir ailddosbarthu ar gyfoeth rhwng y 25 y cant uchaf—y chwarter uchaf yn y DU—a'r 25 y cant isaf, a rhaid inni sicrhau y bydd ailddosbarthu o'r fath yn parhau. Rhaid gwneud hynny am resymau economaidd a rhai sy'n ymwneud â chyfiawnder cymdeithasol.

Gallwn wneud hynny drwy bolisi treth Llywodraeth y DU, yn ogystal â drwy godi'r rhai sy'n byw ar gyflog is fel eu bod yn rhan o economi dra medrus gyda chyflogau uchel. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n gwneud hynny mewn sawl modd—drwy Cymunedau yn Gyntaf a'r gwaith hollbwysig o ddatblygu capasiti a wnaiff y rhaglen honno mewn cymunedau sy'n ymdopi ag anfanteision, a hefyd drwy gynnig gwell hyfforddiant a drwy drosglwyddo technoleg a drwy chwalu rhwystrau gweithgarwch economaidd. Mae rhai Aelodau wedi sôn am anweithgarwch economaidd, ac mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ystyried o ddifrif sut i chwalu'r rhwystrau hynny. Gobeithiaf y bydd y gwaith a wnaiff y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth ar anweithgarwch economaidd yn gymorth i oleuo penderfyniadau ar lefel Llywodraeth.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Oni chredwch y dylem ganolbwyntio ar addysg bellach a sgiliau galwedigaethol yn hytrach nag ar y targed artiffisial o beri i 50 y cant o bobl ifanc fynd i addysg uwch?

**Christine Gwyther:** Nid yw'r targed o 50 y cant yn berthnasol i Gymru; mae'n darged ledled y DU ac nid yw'r Gweinidog yng Nghymru'n ei arddel. Mae addysg bellach a sgiliau gyn bwysiced i'r Llywodraeth hon ac i Lafur Cymru ag y mae addysg uwch. Mae'r ddau yr un mor bwysig i ddyfodol pobl Cymru.

Mae hefyd yn bwysig cydnabod y bydd twf

economic growth will slow down. The Institute of Directors published a press release today, in which it states that it expects, not a downturn, but a slowing down of growth. Forecasters always say that you should never trust forecasts—I assume that they mean other people's forecasts. The current figures for this year—it is important that we deal with actual figures as well as forecasts—show a 3.1 per cent growth in the UK and a 3.4 per cent growth in Wales. If we can sustain that sort of margin, we will be doing well.

**Mark Isherwood:** I wish to refer to a couple of points that you made on economic inactivity. The Assembly's own figures out this month show that economic inactivity in Wales has increased to 25.3 per cent compared with 21.6 per cent in the UK, and that employment has fallen to 71.2 per cent compared with 74.7 per cent in the UK. UK statistics will confirm that the poorest 20 per cent are paying the highest proportion of tax under New Labour. Both Experion and Cambridge Econometrics forecast that the prosperity gap between the UK and Wales will rise year on year to 2005. Your comments are encouraging, but please stick to the evidence because you claim to be an evidence-based Government.

**Christine Gwyther:** I will stick to the evidence. You gave a speech instead of asking a question. If you are asking me to stick to the evidence, then I certainly will.

The Welsh Conservatives, as evidenced by their spokesperson earlier, want to unpick the Welsh Assembly Government's wealth targets, set out in 'A Winning Wales'. Are they afraid that we will hit those targets, leaving opposition parties with no axe to grind? A proper and real opposition party would remain ambitious for Wales and would push the Government to achieve the best that it can. Sadly, that pressure is left to Labour backbenchers to apply, in the void left by a timid opposition. We are no longer talking about clear blue water; we are talking about blue funk.

economaidd y DU yn arafu. Cyhoeddodd Sefydliad y Cyfarwyddwyr ddatganiad i'r wasg heddiw, yn nodi ei fod yn disgwyl i'r twf arafu, ond na cheir dirywiad. Dywed awduron rhagolygon bob amser na ddylid byth ddibynnu ar ragolygon—cymeraf eu bod yn sôn am ragolygon a wnaed gan eraill. Mae'r ffigurau presennol ar gyfer eleni—mae'n bwysig inni ddelio â'r gwir ffigurau yn ogystal â rhagolygon—yn dangos 3.1 y cant o dwf yn y DU a 3.4 y cant o dwf yng Nghymru. Os gallwn gynnal gwahaniaeth tebyg i hwnnw, gwnawn yn dda.

**Mark Isherwood:** Dymunaf gyfeirio at un neu ddau o bwyntiau a wnaethoch am anweithgarwch economaidd. Mae ffigurau'r Cynulliad ei hun a gyhoeddwyd y mis hwn yn dangos bod anweithgarwch economaidd yng Nghymru wedi codi i 25.3 y cant o'i gymharu â 21.6 y cant yn y DU, a bod cyflogaeth wedi disgyn i 71.2 y cant o'i gymharu â 74.7 y cant yn y DU. Bydd ystadegau'r DU yn cadarnhau mai'r 20 y cant o bobl dlotaf sy'n talu'r gyfran fwyaf o dreth o dan Lafur Newydd. Mae Experion a Cambridge Econometrics yn rhagweld y bydd y bwlch cyfoeth rhwng y DU a Chymru'n ehangu o'r naill flwyddyn i'r llall tan 2005. Mae'ch sylwadau'n galonogol, ond daliwch at y dystiolaeth, os gwelwch yn dda, gan eich bod yn honni bod y Llywodraeth yn un sy'n gweithredu ar sail tystiolaeth.

**Christine Gwyther:** Daliaf at y dystiolaeth. Rhoesoch araith yn lle gofyn cwestiwn. Os ydych yn gofyn imi ddal at y dystiolaeth, byddaf yn sicr o wneud hynny.

Mae Ceidwadwyr Cymru, fel y dangosodd eu llefarydd yn gynharach, yn dymuno dadwneud targedau cyfoeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, fel y'u nodir yn 'Cymru'n Ennill'. A oes arnynt ofn y byddwn yn cyrraedd y targedau hynny, fel na fydd gan y gwrthbleidiau gyllell i'w hogi? Byddai gwrthblaid a oedd o ddifrif yn aros yn uchelgeisiol dros Gymru ac yn gwrthio'r Llywodraeth i wneud y gorau a allo. Gwaetha'r modd, gadewir i feincwyr cefn Llafur roi'r pwysau hynny, gan nad yw'r gwrthbleidiau dihyder yn gwneud. Nid ydym yn sôn am ddŵr glas clir bellach; yr ydym yn sôn am rai sydd wedi dychryn.

**Alun Cairns** *rose*—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Christine Gwyther is not giving way.

**Christine Gwyther:** I will give way.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** You only have around 20 seconds.

**Alun Cairns:** Even on the basis of the evidence that she presented, which was disproved by my colleague, Mark Isherwood, there would be no hope in the world of closing the wealth gap within that period with such a small increase year on year. Wales needs to achieve double digit growth figures if we are ever to achieve that 90 per cent target.

**Christine Gwyther:** Your colleague did not disprove the evidence; he came up with a separate set of evidence. We could argue the toss all afternoon, but it is best if we do not.

Coming back to Plaid Cymru, as this is its debate, its own adviser, Eurfyl ap Gwilym, says that the party's draft general election manifesto is dispiriting, harks back to a world long gone, and encourages a begging-bowl mentality. He does not like the way in which the Plaid Cymru manifesto is written, neither does Welsh Labour and neither will the Welsh public.

**Elin Jones:** Dechreuaf drwy gadarnhau na fydd datblygu casinos fel rhan o strategaeth i gryfhau'r economi yn rhan o fanifesto Plaid Cymru, er ei bod amlwg y bydd hynny'n rhan o fanifesto'r Blaid Lafur. Oherwydd hynny, mae'n well gennyf gadw at fanifesto Plaid Cymru.

5.20 p.m.

'Joined-up thinking' yw'r rhethreg a glywn gan y Llywodraeth yn dragwyddol, ond mae'r realiti yn wahanol iawn. Cyhoeddodd yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau fwy neu lai dros nos ei bod yn bwriadu cau saith o ganolfannau budd-daliadau Cymru, gan ganoli'r gwaith mewn nifer fach o ganolfannau galwadau. Ar yr un pryd, mae BT yn bwriadu cael gwared ar gyfran

**Alun Cairns** *a gododd*—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw Christine Gwyther yn ildio.

**Christine Gwyther:** Ildiaf.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Nid oes gennych ond tua 20 eiliad.

**Alun Cairns:** Hyd yn oed ar sail y dystiolaeth a gyflwynodd, a wrthbrofwyd gan fy nghyd-Aelod Mark Isherwood, ni fyddai unrhyw obaith o gau'r bwloch cyfoeth yn y cyfnod hwnnw o gael cynnydd mor fach o'r naill flwyddyn i'r llall. Rhaid i Gymru sicrhau twf mewn ffigurau dwbl os ydym byth i gyrraedd y targed hwnnw o 90 y cant.

**Christine Gwyther:** Ni wnaeth eich cyd-Aelod ddadbrofi'r dystiolaeth; cyflwynodd set wahanol o dystiolaeth. Gallem ddadlau am hynny drwy'r prynhawn, ond byddai'n well inni beidio.

Gan ddod yn ôl at Blaid Cymru, gan mai ei dadl hi yw hon, dywed ei chynghorwr ei hun, Eurfyl ap Gwilym, fod manifesto drafft y blaid ar gyfer yr etholiad cyffredinol yn ddigalon, yn hen ffasiwn, ac yn hyrwyddo meddylfryd y cardotyn. Nid yw ef na Llafur Cymru'n hoffi arddull manifesto Plaid Cymru, ac ni fydd pobl Cymru ychwaith.

**Elin Jones:** I will begin by confirming that developing casinos as part of a strategy to strengthen the economy will not be part of the Plaid Cymru manifesto, although it is clear that that will be part of the Labour Party manifesto. For that reason, I prefer to stick with the Plaid Cymru manifesto.

We perpetually hear the Government's rhetoric of 'joined-up thinking', but the reality is very different. The Department for Work and Pensions announced almost overnight that it intends to close seven benefits offices in Wales and centralise the service in a small number of call centres. At the same time, BT intends to get rid of a large proportion of its kiosks. Therefore, one hand

sylweddol o giosgau ffôn. Felly, mae un llaw yn gorfodi defnydd o'r ffôn, a'r llall yn cael gwared ar ffonau.

forces the use of phones while the other gets rid of them.

Mae'n fwiad cau canolfan fudd-daliadau Aberystwyth. Wedi hynny, bydd y canolfannau agosaf dros 70 milltir i ffwrdd yn Llanelli ac yn Abertawe. Nid y sector preifat yn unig sy'n cadw datblygiadau i goridorau'r M4 a'r A55; mae'r Llywodraeth yn gwneud yr un peth. Gan na fydd canolfan fudd-daliadau rhwng yr M4 a'r A55, bydd y rhan helaethaf o Gymru wledig heb wasanaeth wyneb yn wyneb.

The benefits office in Aberystwyth has been earmarked for closure. Were this to happen, the closest offices would be over 70 miles away in Llanelli and Swansea. It is not only the private sector that confines developments to the M4 and A55 corridors; the Government is following suit. Given that no benefits offices will be located in the region between the M4 and the A55, most of rural Wales will not have access to a face-to-face service.

Mae'r ganolfan yn Aberystwyth yn delio gydag 20,000 o gleientiaid sy'n derbyn budd-daliadau ac efallai arnynt angen cyngor a chymorth i ddeall eu hawliau yn well. Bwm mewn cyfarfod a drefnwyd gan Undeb y Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus a Masnachol nos Iau diwethaf i ymgyrchu yn erbyn cau'r ganolfan hon. Yr oedd dicter a siom y gweithwyr yn amlwg, ynghyd â chefnogaeth gref mudiadau cynghori fel Age Concern, Cyngor ar Bopeth a mudiadau sy'n gweithio gyda phobl anabl i gadw'r ganolfan hon ar agor. Mynegwyd barn unfrydol na fyddai canolfan alwadau, lle bynnag fyddai'r ganolfan, yn darparu gwasanaeth teg i'r rhai sydd fwyaf angen cyngor ar fudd-daliadau yng Ngheredigion a'r Canolbarth.

The office in Aberystwyth deals with 20,000 clients who receive benefits and who may need advice and assistance in gaining a better understanding of their rights. I attended a meeting arranged by the Public and Commercial Services Union on Thursday night to campaign against the closure. The workers' frustration and disappointment was clear for all to see, as was the strong support of counselling organisations such as Age Concern, Citizens Advice and organisations working with disabled people for retaining the office in Aberystwyth. Everyone was in agreement that a call centre, wherever it may be located, would not provide an equitable service to those who most need advice on benefits in Ceredigion and mid Wales.

Mae nifer o bobl ag arnynt angen trafod budd-daliadau wyneb yn wyneb gyda rhywun yr ymddiriedant ynddo, nid â llais dieithr ar ben arall y ffôn heb unrhyw wybodaeth am eu hachosion na'u hamgylchiadau. Mae'r gallu i ffonio, felly, yn hanfodol yn hyn o beth. Serch hynny, mae cymunedau fel Llanafan, Llangeitho, Cwrtnewydd a degau o gymunedau tebyg ar fin colli eu ciosgau ffôn. Mae'n gwbl amlwg bod pobl sy'n derbyn budd-daliadau yn fwy tebygol o fod heb ffôn preifat. Bwriad y Llywodraeth, felly, yw tynnu'r gwasanaeth oddi wrth y bobl sydd fwyaf ei angen. Llywodraeth Lafur Llundain sy'n arwain, tra bo Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad yn cadw'n dawel. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog, wrth ymateb i'r ddadl, yn ymrwymo i ymladd yn erbyn penderfyniad yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau i gau canolfannau budd-daliadau yng Nghymru. Dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad weithredu fel

Many people need to discuss benefits face-to-face with someone they trust, not with an unfamiliar voice at the other end of the phone with little or no information about their cases or circumstances. The availability of a phone is, of course, essential if call centres are to be used. However, communities such as Llanafan, Llangeitho, Cwrtnewydd and dozens of similar communities are about to lose their phone boxes. It is obvious that people on benefits are more likely to be without the use of a private phone. Therefore, the Government intends to take the service away from the very people who need it most. The Labour Government in London is leading the way, while the Assembly Labour Government says nothing. In responding to the debate, I hope that the Minister gives a commitment to oppose the Department for Work and Pensions' decision to close benefits offices in Wales. The Assembly



llais Cymru, nid llais Llundain yng Nghymru.

Government should provide a voice for Wales, not a voice for London in Wales.

Bydd undeb PCS yn cynnal streic ddydd Gwener yn erbyn cau canolfannau budd-daliadau a thoriadau mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn gyffredinol, a bwriadaf gefnogi protest yr aelodau yn Aberystwyth.

The PCS will hold a one-day strike on Friday to protest against the closure of benefits offices and public service cuts in general. I intend to support the members' protest in Aberystwyth.

Yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio yn sôn wythnos diwethaf ei bod yn bwriadu dwyn sylw'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant at broblemau ciosgau ffôn mewn nifer o'n cymunedau. Mae nifer o resymau dros wrthwynebu cael gwared ar giosgau, ond efallai taw'r rheswm y dylem oll ei gofio yw'r ffaith y defnyddir ciosgau mewn argyfwng. Gwelwyd enghraifft o hyn ym Mhont-siân yn fy etholaeth i pan aeth Tafarn Bach ar dân. Pe na bai'r ciosg yno, byddai'r daith wedi bod yn un bell i alw'r frigâd dân, a byddai'r dinistr i'r teulu a'r cwsmeriaid wedi bod yn fwy o lawer. Efallai y gallai BT roi stori ciosg Pont-siân yn droednodyn i'w cyfrifon nesaf, i ddangos bod gan giosgau ffôn werth cymdeithasol, hyd yn oed os nad oes ganddynt werth masnachol. Wrth ddweud hynny, yr wyf yn tybio bod gan BT ddiddordeb mewn lles cymdeithasol.

I was pleased to hear the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration last week state that she intends to draw the attention of the Department of Trade and Industry to problems relating to phone boxes in many of our communities. There are several reasons why we should oppose getting rid of phone boxes, but perhaps the one that we should always bear in mind is that phone boxes are used in emergencies. One such example was the use of the phone box in Pont-siân in my constituency to report a fire in the local pub, Tafarn Bach. Without the use of that kiosk, the caller would have had to travel quite a distance in order to call the fire brigade, and the family and customers would have suffered far greater damage as a result. Perhaps BT, if it has any interest in social responsibility, could include the story of the Pont-siân kiosk as a footnote to its latest accounts, to show that kiosks have a social value even if they lack commercial value.

Ni fydd pobl gyfoethocaf Ceredigion a thu hwnt yn gweld eisiau'r ganolfan fudd-daliadau na chiosgau ffôn, na swyddfeydd post efallai. Serch hynny, bydd y tlotaf a'r mwyaf difreintiedig yn dioddef. Ai dyma a olyga Llafur Newydd wrth ddweud ei bod am dargedu pobl fwyaf difreintiedig cymdeithas? A yw am eu targedu er mwyn eu hamddifadu fwyfwy o'u hawliau a'r gwasanaethau sydd eu hangen arnynt?

The wealthiest people in Ceredigion and beyond will not miss the benefits office or phone boxes, and they may not even miss post offices. However, the poorest and most disadvantaged will suffer. Is this what New Labour has in mind when it says that it wants to target the most disadvantaged in society? Does it want to target them in order to further deprive them of their rights and the services they require?

**The Minister for Economic Development and Transport (Andrew Davies):** On seeing the Plaid Cymru motion and amendment for this debate, I thought 'Here we go again'; it is typical of the nationalists with their dispiriting, backward-looking, begging-bowl mentality. Before I am accused of being overly aggressive in how I describe the main opposition party, I make it clear that I am quoting one of Plaid Cymru's key strategists, Eurfyl ap Gwilym, who also accepted that significant redistribution has been achieved

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth (Andrew Davies):** Pan welais gynnig a gwelliant Plaid Cymru ar gyfer y ddadl hon, yr hyn a ddaeth i'm meddwl oedd 'Dyma ni eto'; mae'n nodweddiadol o'r cenedlaetholwyr a'u meddylfryd digalon, hen ffasiwn a chardlotlyd. Cyn imi gael fy nghyhuddo o fod yn orymosodol yn fy nisgrifiad o'r brif wrthblaid, egluraf fy mod yn dyfynnu geiriau un o brif strategwyr Plaid Cymru, Eurfyl ap Gwilym, a dderbyniodd hefyd fod

under Labour. It is a pity that the nats cannot be as honest in this debate.

The opposition does no more than make accusations and claims that everyone knows that Wales is the worst place in the world to live, without providing the supporting evidence.

**Elin Jones:** Point of order. Is that an appropriate way to describe the main opposition party?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** It would be better to rephrase. The correct terminology is Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales. The Presiding Officer has often said that we should refer to the parties appropriately. Please ensure that you do so in future.

**Andrew Davies:** Yes, I will. I notice that Plaid Cymru does not like to be described as a nationalist party. I am proud to describe myself as a socialist. I wonder why you cannot accept that. I listened to the leader of the opposition party, and to Plaid Cymru's spokesperson on economic development, but I did not hear an alternative economic policy initiative that would address the issue of raising economic activity or reducing poverty in Wales.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones** *rose*—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Time is short. There is three minutes to go, and we will run over. We must hear the Minister.

**Andrew Davies:** If Plaid Cymru keeps repeating its propaganda, I will keep repeating the facts. First, under Labour, we have historically high levels of employment—more than 100,000 more jobs since 1997. Secondly, under Welsh Labour, unemployment has fallen to levels not seen for 30 years, below the UK average on claimant count. Thirdly, under Labour, the pay gap is narrowing; average weekly earnings in Wales increased by 5.4 per cent last year, which is faster than most of England, including London and the south-east.

aiddosbarthu sylweddol wedi'i sicrhau o dan Lafur. Mae'n drueni na all y cenedlaetholwyr fod mor onest â hynny yn y ddaidl hon.

Y cwbl a wnaiff y gwrthbleidiau yw gwneud cyhuddiadau a honiadau bod pawb yn gwybod mai Cymru yw'r lle gwaethaf yn y byd i fyw, heb gynnig tystiolaeth i ategu hynny.

**Elin Jones:** Pwynt o drefn. A yw hynny'n ffordd briodol o ddisgrifio'r brif wrthblaid?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Byddai'n well ei aralleirio. Y term cywir yw Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales. Mae'r Llywydd wedi dweud yn aml y dylem gyfeirio at bleidiau mewn modd priodol. Gofalwch eich bod yn gwneud hynny yn y dyfodol, os gwelwch yn dda.

**Andrew Davies:** Gwnaf hynny. Sylwaf nad yw Plaid Cymru'n hoffi cael ei galw'n blaid genedlaethol. Yr wyf yn falch o'm galw fy hun yn sosialydd. Tybed pam na allwch dderbyn hynny. Gwrandewais ar arweinydd yr wrthblaid, ac ar lefarydd Plaid Cymru ar ddatblygu economaidd, ond ni chlywais sôn am fenter polisi economaidd wahanol a ymdriniai â'r mater o hybu gweithgarwch economaidd neu leihau tloidi yng Nghymru.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones** *a gododd*—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae amser yn brin. Mae tair munud ar ôl, a byddwn yn rhedeg yn hwyr. Rhaid inni wrando ar y Gweinidog.

**Andrew Davies:** Os bydd Plaid Cymru yn dal i ailadrodd ei phropaganda, byddaf fi'n dal i ailadrodd y ffeithiau. Yn gyntaf, o dan Lafur, mae gennym lefelau cyflogaeth sydd ar eu uchaf erioed—dros 100,000 yn fwy o swyddi er 1997. Yn ail, o dan Lafur Cymru, mae diweithdra wedi gostwng i lefelau nas gwelwyd am 30 mlynedd, ac maent yn is na'r cyfrif cyfartalog o hawlwr budd-dal yn y DU. Yn drydydd, o dan Lafur, mae'r bwch cyflog yn lleihau; bu cynnydd o 5.4 y cant yn yr enillion wythnosol cyfartalog yng Nghymru y llynedd, ac mae hynny'n fwy nag yn y rhan fwyaf o Loegr, gan gynnwys

Llundain a'r de-ddwyrain.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Are you proud of the fact that your Government has presided over a £30 average decrease in female wages in Wales? What do you propose to do about that? The Westminster Government could insist that all employers do a proper equal pay audit, but it is not prepared to do so.

**Helen Mary Jones:** A ydych yn ymfalchïo yn y ffaith bod cyflogau menywod yng Nghymru wedi gostwng o fwy na £30 ar gyfartaledd o dan eich Llywodraeth? Beth yr ydych yn bwriadu ei wneud am hynny? Gallai Llywodraeth San Steffan fynnu y bydd yr holl gyflogwyr yn cynnal archwiliad cyflogau cyfartal iawn, ond nid yw'n barod i wneud hynny.

**Andrew Davies:** Wages for women in Wales have risen faster than wages for men over the last few years. That is a fact and an example of Labour policies delivering.

**Andrew Davies:** Mae cyflogau menywod yng Nghymru wedi codi'n gynt na rhai dynion dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Mae hynny'n ffaith ac yn enghraifft o lwyddiant polisiau Llafur.

Fourthly, under Labour, European structural funds are helping to boost the most economically disadvantaged areas in Wales with more than 2,000 projects, and investment of more than £2 billion leading to more than 80,000 jobs created or safeguarded. Fifth, under Labour we have the Communities First programme, which targets the most deprived communities and helps to bridge the prosperity gap between them and the more affluent communities. I am sure that the opposition will continue to ignore the facts, but the Welsh public will not.

Yn bedwerydd, o dan Lafur, mae cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd yn helpu i hybu'r ardaloedd yng Nghymru sydd o dan yr anfantais economaidd fwyaf a cheir mwy na 2,000 o brosiectau a buddsoddiad o fwy na £2 biliwn sy'n arwain at greu neu ddiogelu mwy na 80,000 o swyddi. Yn bumed, o dan Lafur mae gennym raglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, sy'n targedu'r cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig ac yn helpu i gau'r bwlch cyfoeth rhyngddynt hwy a'r cymunedau mwy llewyrchus. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y gwrthbleidiau'n dal i anwybyddu'r ffeithiau, ond ni wnaiff pobl Cymru.

**Owen John Thomas** *rose*—

**Owen John Thomas** *a gododd*—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. He is not giving way. We are short of time.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw'n ildio. Yr ydym yn brin o amser.

**Andrew Davies:** With reference to David Melding's amendment, 'A Winning Wales' is reviewed on a regular basis. It is a dynamic policy document setting out how we achieve our vision for the economic future of Wales. If each specific target is met, all else being equal—as I have consistently said—we will achieve our aspiration to increase the GVA of Wales relative to the UK. The relative decline in Welsh GVA per head dates back to 1997, at least, well before Labour took power in Westminster in 1997, and well before the National Assembly was established in 1999.

**Andrew Davies:** Gyda golwg ar welliant David Melding, caiff 'Cymru'n Ennill' ei hadolygu'n rheolaidd. Mae'n ddogfen bolisi ddeinamig sy'n nodi'r modd y byddwn yn gwireddu ein gweledigaeth ar gyfer dyfodol economaidd Cymru. Os cyrhaeddir pob un o'r targedau, a bod popeth arall yn gyfartal—fel yr wyf wedi dweud bob amser—cyflawnwn ein huchelgais i gynyddu gwerth ychwanegol crynswth Cymru o'i gymharu ag un y DU. Mae'r gostyngiad cymharol yn y gwerth ychwanegol crynswth y pen yng Nghymru'n dyddio'n ôl i 1997, o leiaf, ymhell cyn i Lafur ddod i rym yn San Steffan yn 1997, ac ymhell cyn sefydlu'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn 1999.

Under Labour, Welsh GVA is increasing and the long-term downward trend of relative GVA has been arrested.

O dan Lafur, mae gwerth ychwanegol crynswth Cymru ar gynnydd ac mae'r gostyngiad tymor hir yn y gwerth ychwanegol crynswth cymharol wedi'i atal.

5.30 p.m.

Moving to Kirsty's amendment, income tax revenues can vary greatly. Taxes based on property values are simpler to administer and more stable, giving local government more certainty of income when planning local services. The Assembly Government, as my colleague Sue Essex has said, believes that there should be further reform of the council tax benefit system, particularly for the earnings and savings thresholds which should help the most needy and disadvantaged.

Gan droi at welliant Kirsty, mae'r refereniw o dreth incwm yn gallu amrywio'n fawr. Mae trethi sy'n seiliedig ar eiddo yn symlach i'w gweinyddu ac yn fwy sefydlog, fel eu bod yn rhoi mwy o sicrwydd i lywodraeth leol am ei hincwm wrth iddi gynllunio gwasanaethau lleol. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, fel y mae fy nghyd-Weinidog Sue Essex wedi dweud, yn credu y dylid diwygio system y budd-dal treth gyngor ymhellach, yn enwedig mewn cysylltiad â throthwyon enillion a chynilion gan fod hynny'n debygol o fod o gymorth i'r rhai mwyaf anghenus a difreintiedig.

In conclusion, social justice, spreading prosperity and improving the health of the people of Wales are at the heart of our vision as a Government for Wales. It is a vision which we are putting into practice throughout Wales, with the result that we are improving the lives and life chances of many thousands of our people. The Assembly Government has the right policies to tackle the inequalities that were bequeathed to us by the former Conservative Government.

I gloi, mae cyfiawnder cymdeithasol, lledaenu ffyniant a gwella iechyd pobl Cymru yn rhan hanfodol o'n gweledigaeth fel Llywodraeth Cymru. Mae'n weledigaeth yr ydym yn ei rhoi ar waith ledled Cymru ac, o ganlyniad i hynny, yr ydym yn gwella bywydau a chyfleoedd bywyd miloedd lawer o'n pobl. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn meddu ar y polisiau iawn i fynd i'r afael â'r anghydraddoldebau a adawyd i ni gan y Llywodraeth Geidwadol a'n rhagflaenodd.

**Leanne Wood:** While New Labour, at UK level, can claim some success in tackling poverty, the gap between rich and poor has continued to grow. The introduction of a minimum wage, albeit at a level which is set too low, the introduction of working families' tax credits, even though they are notoriously difficult to claim, and the reduction of unemployment, even though we have seen a rise in part time and low paid work, have all contributed to the reduction in poverty. I acknowledge that.

**Leanne Wood:** Er y gall Llafur Newydd, ar lefel y DU, honni iddi gael peth llwyddiant wrth fynd i'r afael â thlodi, mae'r bwlch rhwng y cyfoethog a'r tlawd wedi parhau i gynyddu. Mae cyflwyno isafswm cyflog, er ei fod wedi'i osod yn rhy isel, a chyflwyno credydau treth i deuluoedd sy'n gweithio, er ei bod yn ddjarhebol o anodd eu hawlio, a lleihau diweithdra, er y gwelsom fwy o waith rhan amser a gwaith ar gyflog isel, oll wedi cyfrannu at leihau tlodi. Yr wyf yn cydnabod hynny.

However, the situation in Wales continues to be pretty dire. Minister, I shall present you with some facts. We have the highest rate of child poverty in the UK, the highest rate of teenage pregnancy in Europe and youth unemployment stands at 28.6 per cent. On a UK level, while 0.5 million children have been lifted out of poverty, Save the Children

Er hynny, mae'r sefyllfa yng Nghymru'n eithaf truenus o hyd. Weinidog, rhoddaf ychydig o ffeithiau i chi. Gennym ni y mae'r gyfradd uchaf o dlodi plant yn y DU, y gyfradd uchaf o feichiogi mysg rhai yn eu harddegau yn Ewrop ac mae diweithdra mysg pobl ifanc yn 28.6 y cant. Ar lefel y DU, er bod hanner miliwn o blant wedi'u

says that 1 million children are living in severe and persistent poverty. It has been much easier to lift those children who are just below the poverty line than to affect vulnerable and disadvantaged children who fall way below it.

The Government's strategy has been to focus on getting parents into work, but this is not possible for everyone. Its approach has been attacked by a wide variety of critics, including its own friends, from Anthony Giddens to the Institute for Public Policy Research. All are in agreement that the impact on long term inequality is, at best, patchy. The Government's own social exclusion unit says that those who seem to benefit least from policies also seem to be those who suffer persistent poverty.

While we hear a lot from the Government about poverty, we do not hear much about inequality. It appears to be an old-fashioned concept. The wealthiest 10 per cent of the population now owns more than half of the UK's wealth. As Alun Ffred Jones mentioned earlier, Tony Blair's good friend Peter Mandelson said in a speech to Silicon Valley executives that New Labour is now intensely relaxed about people getting filthy rich.

Poverty levels are affected much more by the distribution of income than by overall economic growth. Sweden has a much lower gross domestic product per capita than the US, but the bottom fifth of Swedes are 41 per cent better off than the bottom fifth of Americans, because Swedish income is more evenly distributed.

Income inequality has other negative spin-offs in addition to poverty. It leads to a decline in social cohesion, which results in lower levels of trust among citizens, pushing up crime rates. It results in uneven and reduced political participation, with fewer people voting. It results in weaker support for public spending on social provision and generally more reactionary public opinions. The sacking of 104,000 civil servants will also result in further inequalities.

codi allan o dlodi, dywed Save the Children fod 1 miliwn o blant yn byw mewn tlodi difrifol a pharhaol. Bu'n haws o lawer codi'r plant hynny sydd ychydig o dan y llinell dlodi na chael effaith ar blant difreintiedig sy'n agored i niwed sy'n disgyn o dani.

Strategaeth y Llywodraeth yw canolbwyntio ar beri i rieni ddechrau gweithio, ond nid yw hynny'n bosibl i bawb. Ymosodwyd ar ei dull gweithredu gan amrywiaeth fawr o feirniaid, gan gynnwys ei ffrindiau ei hun, o Anthony Giddens i'r Sefydliad Ymchwil Polisi Cyhoeddus. Mae pawb yn gytûn mai bylchog ar y gorau yw'r effaith a geir ar anghydraddoldeb tymor hir. Mae uned allgâu cymdeithasol y Llywodraeth ei hun yn dweud ei bod yn ymddangos mai'r rhai sy'n cael y budd lleiaf o bolisiau yw'r rhai sy'n dioddef gan dlodi parhaol.

Er y clywn lawer gan y Llywodraeth am dlodi, ni chlywn lawer am anghydraddoldeb. Ymddengys ei fod yn gysyniad hen ffasiwn. Y 10 y cant cyfoethocaf yn y boblogaeth sydd bellach yn berchen ar fwy na hanner cyfoeth y DU. Fel y dywedodd Alun Ffred Jones yn gynharach, mewn araith a draddododd ffrind mawr Tony Blair, Peter Mandelson, i weithredwyr yn Silicon Valley dywedwyd bod Llafur Newydd yn fodlon iawn bellach i bobl fynd i ddrewi o arian.

Ceir llawer mwy o effaith ar lefelau tlodi drwy ddsbarthu incwm na drwy dwf economaidd cyffredinol. Mae gan Sweden gynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen sy'n llawer is nag un yr Unol Daleithiau, ond mae'r un rhan o bump o bobl Sweden sy'n lleiaf cyfoethog yn 41 y cant yn gyfoethocach na'r un rhan o bump o Americanaid sy'n lleiaf cyfoethog, gan fod incwm yn Sweden wedi'i ledaenu'n fwy gwastad.

Ceir sgîl-ffeithiau negyddol eraill o anghydraddoldeb incwm yn ogystal â thlodi. Mae hefyd yn peri dirywiad o ran cydlynad cymdeithasol, sy'n arwain at lai o ymddiriedaeth ymysg dinasyddion, sy'n peri cynnydd mewn cyfraddau trosedd. Mae'n peri y bydd llai'n cymryd rhan mewn gwleidyddiaeth, a hynny mewn modd anwastad, ac y bydd llai'n pleidleisio. Mae'n arwain at lai o gefnogaeth i wariant cyhoeddus ar ddarpariaeth gymdeithasol ac at

safbwyntiau cyhoeddus mwy adweithiol yn gyffredinol. Bydd diswyddo 104,000 o weision sifil hefyd yn arwain at fwy o anghydraddoldebau.

Plaid Cymru's draft manifesto has been mentioned, and I would like to inform Members on the Labour side of the Chamber about it. Unlike New Labour, our members get to amend our draft manifesto and vote on it. All our members have an input into the process, and we will see the results at the end of this month. We still have democracy in Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales, unlike New Labour.

Cyfeiriwyd at fanifesto drafft Plaid Cymru, a charwn roi gwybod amdano i Aelodau ar ochr Llafur y Siambr. Yn wahanol i Lafur Newydd, mae ein haelodau'n cael cynnig newidiadau i'n manifesto drafft a phleidleisio arno. Mae pob un o'n haelodau'n cyfrannu i'r broses, a gwelwn y canlyniadau ar ddiwedd y mis hwn. Mae gennym ddemocratiaeth o hyd ym Mhlaid Cymru—The Party of Wales, yn wahanol i Lafur Newydd.

The only way to address the growing gap between the rich and the poor in the UK is through the taxation and benefit system. The growing gap has been created as a result of Government policy, and only Government policy can reduce it. Unless New Labour gets to grip with this issue, you will have to accept that the prosperity gap will continue to grow, and you will have to admit that you have given up on the socialist principle of redistribution of wealth.

Yr unig fodd i ymdrin â'r bwlch cynyddol rhwng y cyfoethog a'r tlawd yn y DU yw drwy'r system drethu a budd-daliadau. Crëwyd y bwlch cynyddol o ganlyniad i bolisi Llywodraeth, a dim ond polisi Llywodraeth a all ei leihau. Os nad aiff Llafur Newydd i'r afael â'r mater hwn, bydd yn rhaid ichi dderbyn y bydd y bwlch cyfoeth yn dal i ehangu, a bydd yn rhaid ichi gyfaddef eich bod wedi rhoi'r gorau i'r egwyddor sosialaidd o ailddosbarthu cyfoeth.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 27, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.*

*Amendment 1: For 27, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne

Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 17, Ymatal 2, Yn erbyn 38.  
Amendment 2: For 17, Abstain 2, Against 38.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
German, Michael  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 10, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 47.*

*Amendment 3: For 10, Abstain 0, Against 47.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM2135): O blaid 25, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 32.*  
*Motion (NDM2135): For 25, Abstain 0, Against 32.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary



Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion defeated.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings today's proceedings to a close. **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.37 p.m.  
 The meeting ended at 5.37 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau  
 Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)

Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Law, Peter (Llafur – Labour)  
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
Marek, John (Annibynnol – Independent)  
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)