



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mercher, 13 Hydref 2004**

**Wednesday, 13 October 2004**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

Anerchiad gan Jean-Yves Le Drian, Llywydd Cyngor Rhanbarthol Llydaw Address by Jean-Yves Le Drian, President of the Regional Council of Brittany.....	3
Datganiad gan y Dirprwy Lywydd Statement by the Deputy Presiding Officer.....	8
Atal Rheolau Sefydlog Suspension of Standing Orders .....	8
Ethol Aelodau Awdurdodau Lleol i'r Cyngor Partneriaeth Llywodraeth Leol Election of Local Authority Members to the Local Government Partnership Council.....	9
Cwestiynau ar Lywodraeth Leol i'r Gweinidog Cyllid Questions on Local Government to the Finance Minister.....	15
Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes Questions to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning.....	33
Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order.....	47
Y Cynllun Gweithredu Datblygu Cynaliadwy The Sustainable Development Action Plan.....	49
Adolygiad y Comisiwn Annibynnol o Gynllun y Sector Gwirfoddol The Independent Commission's Review of the Voluntary Sector Scheme.....	83
Dadl Fer: Mynd i'r afael â'r Fasnach Gig Anghyfreithlon Short Debate: Combating the Illegal Meat Trade.....	100

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefardwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

**Anerchiad gan Jean-Yves Le Drian, Llywydd Cyngor Rhanbarthol Llydaw**  
**Address by Jean-Yves Le Drian, President of the Regional Council of Brittany**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** It is my great pleasure to welcome Mr Jean-Yves Le Drian, President of the Regional Council of Brittany, to the National Assembly for Wales and to ask to him to address us. [*Applause.*]

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae'n bleser mawr gennyf groesawu Mr Jean-Yves Le Drian, Llywydd Cyngor Rhanbarthol Llydaw, i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a gofyn iddo ein hannerch. [*Cymeradwyaeth.*]

*Traddodwyd yr anerchiad yn Ffrangeg. Darperir isod drawsgrifiad o'r cyfieithiad ar y pryd. The address was delivered in French. A transcription of the simultaneous translation follows.*

**Mr Jean-Yves Le Drian:** Deputy Presiding Officer, First Minister, Assembly Members, dear friends, Brittany, through me, fully acknowledges the honour bestowed upon it by our being solemnly received here in your parliament. Your Assembly is no ordinary forum: it is at the same time the symbol of a strong and proud past brutally interrupted by the failure of Owain Glyndŵr, and vanishing after the Act of Union of 1536, and of rebirth, through its reestablishment during the reform of 1997. Through this devolution that you wanted and obtained, you have risen to the position of a responsible, autonomous and representative Assembly, opening the road to other ambitions without denying that you are part of the United Kingdom. You are now the forum of renewed and decentralised democracy. I pay homage to all of you as representatives of the Welsh people, and more specifically to the Presiding Officer, Lord Elis-Thomas, who could not be here today, and the First Minister, Rhodri Morgan, with whom my predecessor had begun the relationship and commitments between Brittany and Wales.

**Mr Jean-Yves Le Drian:** Ddirprwy Lywydd, Brif Weinidog, Aelodau Cynulliad, gyfeillion annwyl, mae Llydaw, drwof fi, yn cydnabod yn llawn yr anrhydedd a roddir iddi wrth gael ein derbyn yn urddasol yma yn eich senedd. Nid fforwm cyffredin yw eich Cynulliad: ar yr un pryd mae'n symbol o orffennol cryf a balch a chwalwyd yn greulon gan fethiant Owain Glyndŵr, ac a ddiplannodd ar ôl Deddf Uno 1536, ac a gafodd ei aileni, drwy ei ailsefydlu yn ystod diwygiad 1997. Drwy'r datganoliad hwn yr oeddech am ei gael ac a gawsoch, yr ydych wedi codi i statws Cynulliad cyfrifol, awtonomaidd a chynrychioliadol, sy'n gwneud uchelgeisiau eraill yn bosibl heb wadu eich bod yn rhan o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Fforwm democratiaeth wedi ei hadnewyddu a'i datganoli ydych bellach. Talaf deyrnged i bob un ohonoch fel cynrychiolwyr pobl Cymru, ac yn fwy penodol i'r Llywydd, yr Arglwydd Elis-Thomas, na allai fod yma heddiw, a'r Prif Weinidog, Rhodri Morgan, yr oedd fy rhagflaenydd wedi dechrau'r berthynas ag ef a'r ymrwymadau rhwng Llydaw a Chymru.

I also pay tribute to your history and struggles. When I was much younger, my first knowledge of Wales came from a romantic reading of Richard Llewellyn's bestseller, *How Green was my Valley*. The memory that I have of that book is of tough times and transformations, but also of the strong determination of the characters. That determination still very much exists. You have gone through the trauma of your first industrial revolution, with the harshness of the coal mines, many dramas, towns and ports being built too quickly, and the wealth,

Talaf deyrnged hefyd i'ch hanes a'ch brwydrau. Pan oeddwn yn llawer iau, deuthum i wybod am Gymru y tro cyntaf drwy ddarllen llyfr poblogaidd Richard Llewellyn, *How Green was my Valley*, a oedd yn ymddangos yn rhamantus i mi. Y cof sydd gennyf am y llyfr hwnnw yw darllen am gyfnodau anodd a chyfnodau o newid, ond hefyd penderfyniad cryf y cymeriadau. Mae'r penderfyniad hwnnw yn dal i fodoli. Yr ydych wedi dioddef trawma eich chwyldro diwydiannol cyntaf, gyda chaledi'r pyllau glo, llawer o ddigwyddiadau annisgwyl, trefi

but also, and above all, the misery, that all this engenders. You have also known the rejection of poverty and of exploitation, which expressed itself through an original workingmen's movement that first of all found its expression in a particular radicalism embodied during his time by your illustrious leader, Lloyd George. You have also known immigration, the abolition of your customary laws, the renouncement, through statute, of your language and then, later, the new trauma of pit closures and the necessary restructuring of your economy, but you have always known how to keep your determination and pride. That not only means that you win at rugby, but that you will never give up and, just like the red dragon, you will never compromise your history and your destiny. That is what gives your new Assembly strength and vigour.

That is also what makes us Bretons and Welsh so similar. The Celtic community has shaped our societies. History, moral, rural and religious traditions, language and culture are all marked by this common heritage. What we reject and our belief in the future of our peoples brings us together. Our geographical territories are also similar in terms of our peripheral position, coastal nature, equivalent populations and similar economic and demographic weight in comparison with the nation as a whole. Furthermore, we have in common a shared belief that education and training are the axes of development and growth, and that everything possible must be done so that access to knowledge for the next generation is made easier for all. You are proud of your successes in this regard, and so are we.

You strongly assert your identity, and so do we, but we still share the same values of openness to the world and to others. The assertion of our identity is, for both of us, the opposite of the insular identity that can be so damaging. The fear of others and of the unknown has no place in our collective behaviour. You have developed that faith in such a way as to have transformed your national saint's day into a day of world peace

a phorthladdoedd yn cael eu hadeiladu yn rhy gyflym, a'r cyfoeth, ond hefyd, yn anad dim, y dioddefaint, y mae hyn oll yn ei greu. Yr ydych hefyd wedi dysgu gwrthod tloidi ac annhegwch, a fynegodd ei hun drwy fudiad gwreiddiol y gweithwyr a fynegodd ei hun am y tro cyntaf mewn radicaliaeth benodol a ymgorfforwyd yn ystod ei oes ef gan eich arweinydd enwog, Lloyd George. Yr ydych hefyd wedi profi mewnfudo, diddymwyd eich deddfau arferol, gwaharddwyd eich iaith, drwy statud, ac yna, yn ddiweddarach, bu ichi ddiodef y trawma newydd o weld pyllau glo yn cau, a'r gwaith angenrheidiol o ailstrwythuro eich economi, ond yr ydych bob amser wedi gwybod sut i aros yn benderfynol a balch. Mae hynny'n golygu nid yn unig eich bod yn ennill wrth chwarae rygbi, ond na fyddwch byth yn rhoi'r ffidil yn y to ac, fel y ddraig goch, na fyddwch byth yn peryglu eich hanes a'ch ffawd. Dyna'r hyn sy'n rhoi cryfder a bywiogrwydd i'ch Cynulliad newydd.

Dyna hefyd sy'n ein gwneud ni'r Llydawiaid a'r Cymry mor debyg i'n gilydd. Mae'r gymuned Geltaidd wedi llunio ein cymdeithasau. Caiff hanes, traddodiadau moesol, gwledig a chrefyddol, iaith a diwylliant oll eu llunio gan y dreftadaeth gyffredin hon. Mae'r hyn a wrthodwn a'n cred yn nyfodol ein pobl yn ein dwyn ynghyd. Mae ein tiriogaethau daearyddol hefyd yn debyg o ran ein sefyllfa ymylol, ein natur arfordiol, ein poblogaethau tebyg a'n pwysigrwydd economaidd a demograffig tebyg o gymharu â'r genedl gyfan. At hynny, rhannwn y gred mai canolbwynt datblygiad a thwf yw addysg a hyfforddiant, a bod yn rhaid gwneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i sicrhau bod y wybodaeth honno ar gael yn haws ar gyfer y genhedlaeth nesaf. Yr ydych yn falch o'ch llwyddiannau yn hyn o beth, fel ninnau.

Yr ydych yn arddel eich hunaniaeth yn gryf, fel ninnau, ond rhannwn yr un gwerthoedd o hyd o fod yn agored i'r byd ac i eraill. Arddel ein hunaniaeth, i'n dwy wlad, yw gwrthwyneb yr hunaniaeth ynysig a all fod mor niweidiol. Nid oes lle i ofni eraill ac ofni'r anhysbys yn ein cydymddygiad. Yr ydych wedi datblygu'r ffydd honno yn y fath fodd fel eich bod wedi trawsnewid gŵyl genedlaethol eich nawddsant i fod yn

and friendship between peoples. We are not only Celtic cousins, but brothers in our convictions, which is why we have so much to do together, and why we want to do so much together. In many areas you have shown us the way. The regeneration of your language is active and has progressed significantly since the Welsh Language Act 1993. You have been able to create suitable tools for communication and training and have seen excellent results, for example, through the Welsh Books Council, which we have visited, and the Welsh television channel, which we also visited. We want stronger co-operation between our office for the Breton language and that for the Welsh language in the framework of the European network of offices for languages of which Wales has been president. However, we should go further than that: our partnership cannot simply be a linguistic one, even though that is important.

We want to act together by twinning our secondary schools, strengthening inter-university exchanges, and giving more strength and scope to the European mechanisms that already exist, such as SOCRATES or Erasmus. We also want to be partners in the EARLALL European network of local and regional representatives for lifelong training. In the same spirit, we want to encourage more twinning between our towns and villages. There are already 48 such arrangements and many more can be created. Exchanges of young people and of sportsmen and sportswomen will strengthen our friendship in the future.

However, we must go further. The economic transformations that we are going through and the greater ones that are before us mean that more active co-operation is required. You have created an economic development agency that helps your companies and sectors and supports your presence abroad. We are building a similar presence and we propose uniting and cross-fertilising our networks. This cross-fertilisation could take the form of annual fora for our companies, especially those that are strong on innovation and new technology. The same logic could inspire tourism, where we have very many assets, especially in the maritime area, and where

ddiwrnod o heddwch ledled y byd a chyfeillgarwch rhwng pobloedd. Nid cefndryd Celtaidd yn unig ydym, ond brodyr yn ein hargyhoeddiadau, a dyna pam mae gennym gymaint i'w wneud gyda'n gilydd, a pham yr ydym am wneud cymaint gyda'n gilydd. Yr ydych wedi dangos y ffordd inni mewn sawl maes. Mae adfywiad eich iaith yn ffynnu ac wedi datblygu'n sylweddol ers Deddf yr Iaith Gymraeg 1993. Yr ydych wedi gallu creu dulliau addas ar gyfer cyfathrebu a hyfforddi ac wedi cael canlyniadau rhagorol, er enghraifft, drwy Gyngor Llyfrau Cymru, y bu inni ymweld ag ef, a'r sianel deledu Gymraeg, y bu inni ymweld â hi hefyd. Yr ydym am gael cydweithrediad cryfach rhwng ein swyddfa ar gyfer y Llydaweg a'r un ar gyfer yr iaith Gymraeg yn fframwaith y rhwydwaith Ewropeaidd o swyddfeydd ar gyfer ieithoedd y bu Cymru yn llywydd arno. Fodd bynnag, dylem fynd ymhellach na hynny: ni all ein partneriaeth fod yn un ieithyddol yn unig, er bod hynny'n bwysig.

Yr ydym am gydweithredu drwy efeillio ein hysgolion uwchradd, cryfhau'r gwaith cyfnewid rhwng prifysgolion, a rhoi mwy o gryfder a chwmpas i'r dulliau Ewropeaidd sydd eisoes yn bodoli, megis SOCRATES neu Erasmus. Yr ydym hefyd am fod yn bartneriaid yn y rhwydwaith Ewropeaidd o gynrychiolwyr lleol a rhanbarthol ar gyfer hyfforddiant gydol oes EARLALL. Yn yr un ysbryd, yr ydym am annog mwy o efeillio rhwng ein trefi a'n pentrefi. Eisoes mae 48 o drefniadau o'r fath a gellir creu llawer mwy. Bydd teithiau cyfnewid i bobl ifanc a'r rhai sy'n cymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon yn cryfhau ein cyfeillgarwch yn y dyfodol.

Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni fynd ymhellach. Mae'r trawsnewidiadau economaidd sy'n mynd rhagddynt a'r trawsnewidiadau mwy sydd o'n blaenau yn golygu bod angen cydweithredu'n well. Yr ydych wedi creu awdurdod datblygu economaidd sy'n helpu eich cwmnïau a'ch sectorau ac sy'n cynnal eich presenoldeb dramor. Yr ydym yn creu presenoldeb tebyg a bwriadwn uno a chroesffrwythloni ein rhwydweithiau. Gallai'r croesffrwythloni hwn fod ar ffurf y fforymau blynyddol ar gyfer ein cwmnïau, yn enwedig y rhai sy'n canolbwyntio ar arloesedd a thechnoleg newydd. Gallai'r un rhesymeg ysbrydoli twristiaeth, lle y mae

Brittany has great knowledge that it could share.

We also want to act together at the European level. The enlargement of the European Union has meant that the centre of gravity is going eastwards and therefore our peripheral position has been accentuated. This geographic position must not lead to exclusion, which is why we must act together with greater force in the Conference of Peripheral Maritime Regions of Europe in order to reinforce the Atlantic arc. This also means that we have to mobilise our energies so that future cohesion policies do not exclude our regions, which are still penalised by economic transformations and our marginal geographical positions. The fact that the future constitution of Europe recognises regional realities, and stipulates that the political aim of the EU must be balance, greater equilibrium and territorial cohesion, is progress. However, many Governments, ours among them, have decided to limit the common budgetary line to 1 per cent of European gross domestic product per capita, which does not give us sufficient means to act. Similarly, the maritime region limit of 150 km for two regions to have financed and supported co-operation is not satisfactory, because, even with our Cornish friends, we still lack 3 km in order to be able to have this European funding. This is rather stupid. Therefore we must act together to defend our position in the European Union. The European Commission's decision to have a Green Paper on maritime policies will be another opportunity for us to act together.

We will therefore have many opportunities to work together in the future. All this rests on our common culture and creativity. We are happy that Alan Stivell and Jean-Louis Jossic of the group Tri Yann were able to come with us today. All this work will also rest on our common festivals. We are also happy that Jean-Pierre Pichard and David Petersen have been reunited to think about future inter-celtic festivals. This also rests on our common emotional strengths, symbolised by

gennym lawer o asedau, yn enwedig rhai morol, a lle y mae gan Lydaw wybodaeth helaeth y gallai ei rhannu.

Yr ydym hefyd am gydweithredu ar y lefel Ewropeaidd. Mae ehangu'r Undeb Ewropeaidd wedi golygu mai tua'r dwyrain fydd y canolbwynt yn y dyfodol ac felly mae ein lleoliad ymylol wedi cael ei amlygu. Rhaid i'r lleoliad daearyddol hwn beidio ag arwain at allgáu, a dyna pam y mae'n rhaid inni gydweithredu gyda mwy o rym yng Nghynhadledd Rhanbarthau Morol Ymylol Ewrop er mwyn atgyfnerthu bwa'r Iwerydd. Mae hyn hefyd yn golygu bod yn rhaid inni ddefnyddio ein hegni yn y ffordd gywir fel nad yw polisïau cydlyniant yn y dyfodol yn allgáu ein rhanbarthau, sy'n parhau i gael eu cosbi gan drawsnewidiadau economaidd a'n lleoliadau daearyddol ymylol. Mae'r ffaith y bydd cyfansoddiad Ewrop yn y dyfodol yn cydnabod realiti rhanbarthau, ac yn mynnu bod yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yn anelu'n wleidyddol at fwy o gydbwysedd a chydlyniant tiriogaethol yn gam ymlaen. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer o Lywodraethau, yn cynnwys ein Llywodraeth ni, wedi penderfynu cyfyngu ar y llinell gyllidebol gyffredin i 1 y cant o'r cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth Ewropeaidd y pen, nad yw'n rhoi digon o fodd i ni weithredu. Yn yr un modd, nid yw'r terfyn rhanbarthol morol o 150km i ddau ranbarth gael cydweithrediad wedi ei ariannu a'i gefnogi yn foddhaol, oherwydd, hyd yn oed gyda'n ffrindiau yng Nghernyw, yr ydym 3km yn brin o hyd o allu cael y cyllid Ewropeaidd hwn. Mae hyn yn wirion braidd. Felly rhaid inni gydweithredu i amddiffyn ein sefyllfa yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Bydd penderfyniad y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd i gael Papur Gwyrdd ar bolisïau morol yn gyfle arall inni gydweithredu.

Felly, bydd sawl cyfle gennym i gydweithio yn y dyfodol. Mae hyn i gyd yn dibynnu ar ein diwylliant a'n creadigrwydd cyffredin. Yr ydym yn falch bod Alan Stivell a Jean-Louis Jossic o'r grŵp Tri Yann wedi gallu dod gyda ni heddiw. Bydd yr holl waith hwn yn dibynnu hefyd ar ein gwyliau cyffredin. Yr ydym yn falch hefyd bod Jean-Pierre Pichard a David Petersen wedi dod ynghyd unwaith eto i feddwl am sefydlu gwyliau rhyng-Geltaidd yn y dyfodol. Mae hyn hefyd yn

our common anthem, written by your bard, Evan James, and taken up again by Taldir in 'Bro Goz Ma Zadou', which we sang together last night.

We are the lands of our fathers, as our anthem says. Ours are ancient lands and, despite all the hiccups of history, we have been able to preserve our languages and commonalities. We have often walked side by side, sometimes not seeing each other, but never forgetting each other. I hope that a new era of our being reunited is beginning, in which our lands will have a future and hope in a reconciled, brotherly Europe. Long live Brittany and long live Wales! [*Applause.*]

**Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan):**  
Lywydd Llydaw a'ch dirprwyaeth, hoffwn droi at y Ffrangeg yn fyr.

Aujourd'hui, nous célébrons quelque chose d'historique. Nous pouvons célébrer le passé que nous avons en commun et l'avenir que nous espérons créer nos deux pays péninsulaires mais pas insulaires.

I think that I speak for everyone in Wales when I say that we see a huge opportunity for exploiting what we can do together to create a more prosperous and diverse future, respecting our common Celtic heritage and our strangely isolated Atlantic positions on the western edge of France and the United Kingdom. However, that isolation will not be a hindrance to a greater, more diverse economic future. We will work together and build on the plans that you and I discussed this morning and which your delegation will work on in future. Your visit has been a wonderful occasion.

Diolch am eich ymweliad. Byddwn yn gallu creu dyfodol llawer mwy cyfoethog i'r berthynas hanesyddol rhwng Llydaw a Chymru. Diolch yn fawr. [*Cymeradwyaeth.*]

dibynnu ar ein cryfderau emosiynol cyffredin, wedi eu symboleiddio gan ein hanthem gyffredin, a ysgrifennwyd gan eich bardd, Evan James, ac a ddefnyddiwyd eto gan Taldir yn 'Bro Goz Ma Zadou', y bu inni ei chanu gyda'n gilydd neithiwr.

Hen wledydd ein tadau ydym, fel y dywed ein hanthem. Hen wledydd yw ein gwledydd ni ac, er gwaethaf holl rwystrau hanes, yr ydym wedi gallu cadw ein hieithoedd a'n nodweddion cyffredin. Yr ydym wedi cydgerdded yn aml, weithiau heb weld ein gilydd, ond heb anghofio ein gilydd byth. Gobeithiaf fod cyfnod newydd o gael ein haduno yn dechrau lle y bydd gan ein gwledydd ddyfodol a gobaith mewn Ewrop frawdol wedi ei chymodi. Llydaw am byth a Chymru am byth! [*Cymeradwyaeth.*]

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):**  
President of Brittany and your deputation, I will say a few words in French.

Today, we celebrate something historic. We can celebrate our common past and the future that our two peninsular, but not insular, countries hope to create.

Credaf fy mod yn siarad ar ran pawb yng Nghymru pan ddywedaf ein bod yn gweld cyfle enfawr i wneud popeth posibl gyda'n gilydd i greu dyfodol mwy ffyniannus ac amrywiol, gan barchu ein treftadaeth Geltaidd gyffredin a'n lleoliadau ynysig braidd ar Fôr yr Iwerydd ar ochr orllewinol Ffrainc a'r Deyrnas Unedig. Fodd bynnag, ni fydd y lleoliadau ynysig hyn yn rhwystr i ddyfodol economaidd gwell a mwy amrywiol. Byddwn yn cydweithio ac yn adeiladu ar y cynlluniau y bu i chi a minnau eu trafod y bore yma ac y bydd eich dirprwyaeth yn gweithio arnynt yn y dyfodol. Mae eich ymweliad wedi bod yn achlysur gwych.

Thank you for your visit. We will be able to create a more prosperous future in the historic relations between Brittany and Wales. Thank you very much. [*Applause.*]

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Dirprwy Lywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Deputy Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

**Datganiad gan y Dirprwy Lywydd**  
**Statement by the Deputy Presiding Officer**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** In the absence of the Presiding Officer, I will be chairing the majority of today's meeting. Under Standing Order No. 1.11, I may ask David Melding to act as a temporary chair later on.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yn absenoldeb y Llywydd, byddaf yn cadeirio'r mwyafrif o'r cyfarfod heddiw. O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 1.11, efallai y gofynnaf i David Melding weithredu fel cadeirydd dros dro yn nes ymlaen.

**Atal Rheolau Sefydlog**  
**Suspension of Standing Orders**

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 37.5, agrees to suspend the notice requirements of Standing Order No. 6.13 to enable motion NNDM2123 tabled on 12 October 2004, to be debated in Plenary on Wednesday, 13 October 2004. (NDM2124)*

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 37.5, yn cytuno i ohirio gofynion Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.13 i ganiatáu dadl ar gynnig NNDM2123, a gyflwynwyd ar 12 Hydref 2004, yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ddydd Mercher, 13 Hydref 2004. (NDM2124)*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** A two-thirds majority vote in favour is needed for the motion to be carried.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae angen pleidlais gyda mwyafrif o ddwy ran o dair o blaid er mwyn i'r cynnig gael ei dderbyn.

*Cynnig (NDM2124): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*  
*Motion (NDM2124): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark



James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Peter  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Ethol Aelodau Awdurdodau Lleol i'r Cyngor Partneriaeth Llywodraeth Leol Election of Local Authority Members to the Local Government Partnership Council**

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I **Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Cynigiau fod  
 propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with paragraphs 1(1) and 3 of Schedule 11 to the Government of Wales Act 1998, appoints the following local authority members to the Local Government Partnership Council for Wales:*

*County and County Borough Councils (10 representatives): Cllr A. Aldridge, Cllr J. Hopkins, Cllr M. Gravell, Cllr M. Jones, Cllr R. Berman, Cllr R. Bright, Cllr B. Wellington, Cllr D. Lloyd Evans, Cllr J. James, Cllr D. Bowen;*

*Cynghorau Sir a Bwrdeistref Sirol (10 cynrychiolydd): y Cynghorydd A. Aldridge, y Cynghorydd J. Hopkins, y Cynghorydd M. Gravell, y Cynghorydd M. Jones, y Cynghorydd R. Berman, y Cynghorydd R. Bright, y Cynghorydd B. Wellington, y Cynghorydd D. Lloyd Evans, y Cynghorydd J. James, y Cynghorydd D. Bowen;*

*Community Councils (2 representatives): Cllr M. Stephens, Cllr T. Thomas;*

*Cynghorau Cymuned (2 gynrychiolydd): y Cynghorydd M. Stephens, y Cynghorydd T. Thomas;*

*Fire Authorities (1 representative): Cllr D. Rees;*

*Awdurdodau Tân (1 cynrychiolydd): y Cynghorydd D. Rees;*

*National Park Authorities (1 representative): Cllr S. Watkins.*(NNDM2123)

*Awdurdodau Parc Cenedlaethol (1 cynrychiolydd): y Cynghorydd S. Watkins.* (NNDM2123)

**Mark Isherwood:** It is with a heavy heart that I make this contribution. I object to the election of Councillor Alex Aldridge to the Local Government Partnership Council. I do not object in order to score party political points or because of a personal vendetta, but on the basis of two key—[*Interruption.*]

**Mark Isherwood:** Gwnaf y cyfraniad hwn gyda chalon drom. Gwrthwynebaf ethol y Cynghorydd Alex Aldridge i'r Cyngor Partneriaeth Llywodraeth Leol. Nid wyf yn gwrthwynebu er mwyn sgorio pwyntiau gwleidyddol nac oherwydd fendeta bersonol, ond ar sail dau werth allweddol—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I want to hear what Mark has to say, not least because I want to check that it is in order.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Yr wyf am glywed yr hyn sydd gan Mark i'w ddweud, yn bennaf am fy mod am gadarnhau ei fod mewn trefn.

**Mark Isherwood:** Is it in order for me to continue?

**Mark Isherwood:** A yw mewn trefn imi barhau?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Yes.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Ydyw.

**Mark Isherwood:** I raise this objection on the basis of two values that brought me into politics—truth and justice. A letter dated 16 October to the First Minister stated that Councillor Aldridge had been hostile towards Andy Sutton, the former internal auditor of Flintshire County Council, ever since he investigated serious allegations made against Councillor Aldridge in 1999. The letter goes on to say that before Andy Sutton and his staff could write the report on this matter, the former treasurer took charge of the file and wrote an audit report herself. I have been advised that a report compiled by a county treasurer cannot be—

**Mark Isherwood:** Codaf y gwrthwynebiad hwn ar sail dau werth a'm harweiniodd at wleidyddiaeth—gwirionedd a chyfiawnder. Datganodd llythyr dyddiedig 16 Hydref at y Prif Weinidog fod y Cynghorydd Aldridge wedi bod yn gas tuag at Andy Sutton, cyn archwiliwr mewnol Cyngor Sir y Fflint, ers iddo ymchwilio i honiadau difrifol a wnaed yn erbyn y Cynghorydd Aldridge yn 1999. Â'r llythyr yn ei flaen i ddweud bod y cyn drysorydd wedi cymryd cyfrifoldeb am y ffeil ac wedi ysgrifennu adroddiad archwilio ei hun, cyn i Andy Sutton a'i staff allu ysgrifennu'r adroddiad ar y mater hwn. Fe'm cynghorwyd na all adroddiad a luniwyd gan drysorydd sirol—

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** May I ask whether this is in order?

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** A allaf ofyn a yw hyn mewn trefn ai peidio?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I am the Deputy Presiding Officer, Sue. When I hear something which is out of order, I shall call attention to it without your assistance. However, Mark, it is discourteous to refer to members telling untruths or lies. While it is in order to discuss the suitability of any name here, please try to do so in a courteous manner.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Fi yw'r Dirprwy Lywydd, Sue. Pan glywaf rywbeth sydd allan o drefn, fe dynnaf sylw ato heb eich cymorth chi. Fodd bynnag, Mark, mae'n anghwrtais cyfeirio at aelodau yn dweud anwiredd neu gelwydd. Er ei fod mewn trefn i drafod addasrwydd unrhyw enw yma, ceisiwch wneud hynny mewn ffordd gwrtais.

**Mark Isherwood:** I stress that I was quoting from a letter rather than making my own

**Mark Isherwood:** Pwysleisiaf mai dyfynnu o lythyr yr oeddwn yn hytrach na gwneud fy

comments. To quote again from that letter, it states that the report—which was not an audit report—was ‘apologetic, incomplete and sought premature right to close the investigation’. During the tribunal, an audit file relating to the investigation of Mr Aldridge was submitted to the internal auditor by Flintshire’s Queen’s counsel. The auditor responded that this file was incomplete and that items had been removed. I have been shown some of those items and they raise a number of questions, which must be answered.

Secondly, when Flintshire County Council debated the district auditor’s report prompted by the internal auditor’s findings on 20 February 2001, Mr Aldridge referred to a letter that he had received from the then Finance Minister, Edwina Hart, a copy of which he gave to the press. The letter dated 16 February 2001 was in response to Mr Aldridge’s letter of 13 February. Mr Aldridge read out the letter which

‘gave an assurance that her [the Minister’s] judgement would never be influenced by the sort of scurrilous material that had been circulated to her and many others as a commentary on the district auditor’s report.’

It seems to me that in respect of Mr Aldridge and Flintshire County Council, the Welsh Assembly Government had no qualms about involving itself in the internal operational matters of local government. Furthermore, this so-called scurrilous material was subsequently upheld in the Andy Sutton employment tribunal decision of 2002 which, as the employment tribunal service has told me, is legally binding in its entirety. This includes the statement that

‘there had been positive falsification of documentation on the so-called ultra vires case’.

It reported that the district auditor, prior to the debate when the letter was produced by the Minister, had been

‘critical of the way in which Mr Loveridge, as

syllwadau fy hun. I ddyfynnu eto o’r llythyr hwnnw, noda fod yr adroddiad—nad oedd yn adroddiad archwilio—yn ymddiheurol, yn anghyflawn ac yn ceisio’r hawl gynamserol i gau’r ymchwiliad. Yn ystod y tribiwnlys, cyflwynwyd ffeil archwilio yn ymwneud â’r ymchwiliad ynghylch Mr Aldridge i’r archwiliwr mewnol gan gwnsler y Frenhines yn sir y Fflint. Ymatebodd yr archwiliwr drwy ddweud nad oedd y ffeil hon yn gyflawn a bod eitemau wedi cael eu tynnu ohoni. Dangoswyd rhai o’r eitemau hynny imi a chodant nifer o gwestiynau, y mae’n rhaid eu hateb.

Yn ail, pan drafododd Cyngor Sir y Fflint adroddiad yr archwiliwr dosbarth a ysgogwyd gan ganfyddiadau’r archwiliwr mewnol ar 20 Chwefror 2001, cyfeiriodd Mr Aldridge at lythyr a dderbyniodd gan y Gweinidog Cyllid ar y pryd, Edwina Hart, a rhoddodd gopi ohono i’r wasg. Yr oedd y llythyr dyddiedig 16 Chwefror 2001 mewn ymateb i lythyr Mr Aldridge dyddiedig 13 Chwefror. Darllenodd Mr Aldridge y llythyr a

roddodd sicrwydd na fyddai’r math o ddeunydd enllibus a oedd wedi cael ei ddsbarthu iddi hi a llawer o rai eraill fel sylwadaeth ar adroddiad yr archwiliwr dosbarth byth yn dylanwadu ar ei barn hi [y Gweinidog].

Ymddengys imi, o ran Mr Aldridge a Chyngor Sir y Fflint, nad oedd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn poeni dim ynghylch cynnwys ei hun ym materion gweithredol mewnol llywodraeth leol. At hynny, cadarnhawyd y deunydd enllibus hwn, fel y’i gelwid, wedi hynny ym mhenderfyniad tribiwnlys cyflogaeth Andy Sutton yn 2002 sydd, fel y dywedodd y gwasanaeth tribiwnlys cyflogaeth wrthyf, yn gyfreithiol rwymol yn ei gyfanrwydd. Mae hyn yn cynnwys y datganiad

bod y dogfennau ar yr achos ultra vires, fel y’i gelwir, yn bendant wedi cael eu ffugio.

Dywedodd fod yr archwiliwr dosbarth, cyn y ddadl pan gynhyrchwyd y llythyr gan y Gweinidog, wedi bod

yn feirniadol o’r ffordd yr oedd Mr

county secretary, had portrayed counsel's opinion to elected members'.

The tribunal states that the advice of the legal counsel was received in February 1999. There was no dispute, on the evidence that we heard, that the county secretary was disappointed by its tone and content. Therefore—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You are straying too far. You need to come back to the motion, that these are the members who are to be appointed to the Local Government Partnership Council.

**Mark Isherwood:** Despite this, and given the apparent close contact between the Minister and Mr Aldridge at the time, the Minister granted a special dispensation to write off the ultra vires amount, which had been criticised. The tribunal decision document included a statement that

'there is no doubt, under the financial regulations that all officers must co-operate with internal audit and that as county secretary, Mr Loveridge's explanation of why he delayed avoiding responding to the internal audit was far from convincing.'

I have been informed by the internal audit manager that the sequence of the denial of actions—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I have to stop you. You are out of order. Unless you can come back to order, you will have to sit down. Please address the issue that we are appointing members to the Local Government Partnership Council.

**Mark Isherwood:** The denial of access to documents and information coincided with the arrival of Mr Aldridge as leader of the council.

Furthermore, the district auditor's report recommended the abolition—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You have had five minutes. Please conclude.

Loveridge, fel ysgrifennydd sirol, wedi portreadu barn y cwnsler i'r aelodau etholedig.

Noda'r tribiwnlys fod cyngor y cwnsler cyfreithiol wedi cael ei dderbyn ym mis Chwefror 1999. Ni fu unrhyw anghydfod, yn ôl y dystiolaeth a glywsom, fod yr ysgrifennydd sirol wedi ei siomi gan ei dôn a'i gynnwys. Felly—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Yr ydych yn crwydro yn rhy bell. Mae angen ichi ddychwelyd at y cynnig, mai dyma'r aelodau sydd i'w penodi i'r Cyngor Partneriaeth Llywodraeth Leol.

**Mark Isherwood:** Er gwaethaf hyn, ac o gofio'r cyswllt agos amlwg rhwng y Gweinidog a Mr Aldridge ar y pryd, rhoddodd y Gweinidog oddefeb arbennig i ddileu'r swm ultra vires, a oedd wedi cael ei feirniadu. Yr oedd dogfen penderfyniad y tribiwnlys yn cynnwys datganiad

nad oes unrhyw amheuaeth, o dan y rheoliadau ariannol, fod yn rhaid i bob swyddog gydweithredu ag archwiliad mewnol ac nad oedd eglurhad Mr Loveridge, fel ysgrifennydd sirol, ynglŷn â pham yr oedd wedi osgoi ymateb i'r archwiliad mewnol yn argyhoeddedig o bell ffordd.

Fe'm hysbyswyd gan y rheolwr archwiliad mewnol bod y drefn o ran gwadu'r camau a gymerwyd—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae'n rhaid imi eich atal. Yr ydych allan o drefn. Oni allwch ddod yn ôl i drefn, bydd yn rhaid ichi eistedd. Ymdriniwch â mater penodi aelodau i'r Cyngor Partneriaeth Llywodraeth Leol.

**Mark Isherwood:** Bu i'r achos o wadu'r hawl i weld dogfennau a gwybodaeth gyddaro â chyrrhaeddiad Mr Aldridge fel arweinydd y cyngor.

At hynny, argymhellodd adroddiad yr archwiliwr dosbarth y dylid diddymu—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Yr ydych wedi cael pum munud. Dewch i ben os gwelwch yn dda.

**Mark Isherwood:** Given the points that I have raised and the other material that I have, which I am happy to share with Members, I believe it would be a betrayal of the Assembly's duty to appoint this councillor to this body.

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** I support the motion. As the agreed leader of the Welsh Local Government Association, Alex Aldridge will be a valuable member of the Local Government Partnership Council.

In view of some of the comments made today, I will check the Record in respect of the inferences made about me. I regard that last contribution as absolute abuse in some areas. We must recognise that in working with the Welsh Local Government Association, it has suggested that these people be part of the partnership council. This is about partnership and we must have the right balance on these partnership councils, and the Assembly should therefore support the motion.

2.10 p.m.

**Sue Essex:** Edwina gave a good reply, but on behalf of all Members, other than Mr Isherwood, I stress what a disgraceful performance he gave. I must put on record that Alex Aldridge has not been indicted of anything. He has been cleared by all the statutory agencies. I object to the slur on my colleague, Edwina Hart. She has made that representation, but I object to that on behalf of everyone else here. I am proud to put Alex Aldridge's name forward, as is everyone else. He has been nominated by the Welsh Local Government Association. I have never before heard anything like Mark Isherwood's comments in the Chamber and I hope never to hear such comments again.

**Carl Sargeant:** I will clarify some matters for Members by asking Mark Isherwood if he suggests that Alex Aldridge has ever altered any forms regarding the ultra vires payment? Is that the accusation?

**David Davies:** I do not pretend to be familiar with what was just discussed, but I know that

**Mark Isherwood:** O gofio'r pwyntiau a godais a'r deunydd arall sydd gennyf, yr wyf yn fodlon ei rannu gyda'r Aelodau, credaf y byddai'n bradychu dyletswydd y Cynulliad i benodi'r cynghorydd hwn i'r corff hwn.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** Cefnogaf y cynnig. Fel arweinydd cytûn Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, bydd Alex Aldridge yn aelod gwerthfawr o'r Cyngor Partneriaeth Llywodraeth Leol.

O gofio rhai o'r sylwadau a wnaed heddiw, gwiriaf y Cofnod o ran yr ensyniadau a wnaed amdanaf fi. Yn fy marn i, yr oedd rhai rhannau o'r cyfraniad olaf hwnnw yn sarhad llwyr. Rhaid inni gydnabod wrth weithio gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, i'r awgrym gael ei wneud y dylai'r bobl hyn fod yn rhan o'r cyngor partneriaeth. Mae a wnelo hyn â phartneriaeth a rhaid inni gael y cydbwysedd cywir ar y cynghorau partneriaeth hyn, ac felly dylai'r Cynulliad gefnogi'r cynnig.

**Sue Essex:** Rhoddodd Edwina ateb da, ond ar ran yr holl Aelodau, heblaw Mr Isherwood, pwysleisiaf iddo roi perfformiad gwarthus. Rhaid imi gofnodi na chyhuddwyd Alex Aldridge o unrhyw beth. Fe'i cliriwyd gan bob un o'r asiantaethau statudol. Gwrthwynebaf y sen ar fy nghyd-Aelod, Edwina Hart. Gwnaeth y sylw hwnnw, ond gwrthwynebaf hynny ar ran pob un arall yma. Yr wyf yn falch o roi enw Alex Aldridge gerbron, fel y mae pob un arall. Fe'i henwebwyd gan Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru. Nid wyf erioed wedi clywed unrhyw beth fel y sylwadau a wnaeth Mark Isherwood yn y Siambr a gobeithiaf na chlywaf y fath sylwadau byth eto.

**Carl Sargeant:** Egluraf rai materion i'r Aelodau drwy ofyn i Mark Isherwood a yw'n awgrymu bod Alex Aldridge erioed wedi newid unrhyw ffurflenni o ran y taliad ultra vires? Ai hynny yw'r cyhuddiad?

**David Davies:** Nid wyf yn esgus bod yn gyfarwydd â'r hyn sydd newydd gael ei

my colleague, Mark Isherwood, has every right to raise this matter in the way he did and that it is unacceptable for Ministers of the Assembly Government to try to silence him as they try to silence many others in the Chamber when they hear something that they do not like. I accordingly trust Mark, and will vote with him.

**Mark Isherwood** *rose*—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Mark, you have already spoken; you cannot speak again on this.

**Sandy Mewies:** After hearing Mark Isherwood's long and rather confused speech, instead of hiding behind jargon, he should make explicit his accusations, if he has the courage to do so.

**Lorraine Barrett:** If anyone votes against this motion, does that mean that we will not have representatives on the partnership council?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** If the motion is defeated, we will not be able to appoint members to the partnership council and I suspect that the Government will have some more thinking to do.

drafod, ond gwn fod gan fy nghyd-Aelod, Mark Isherwood, bob hawl i godi'r mater hwn yn y ffordd a wnaeth a'i bod yn annerbyniol i Weinidogion Llywodraeth y Cynulliad geisio ei dawelu fel y maent yn ceisio tawelu sawl un arall yn y Siambr pan glywant rywbeth nad ydynt yn ei hoffi. Felly yr wyf yn ymddiried yn Mark, a byddaf yn pleidleisio gydag ef.

**Mark Isherwood** *a gododd*—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mark, yr ydych eisoos wedi siarad; ni allwch siarad eto ar hyn.

**Sandy Mewies:** Ar ôl clywed araith hir Mark Isherwood a oedd braidd yn ddrislyd, yn lle cuddio y tu ôl i jargon, dylai fynegi ei gyhuddiadau yn glir, os yw'n ddigon dewr i wneud hynny.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Os bydd unrhyw un yn pleidleisio yn erbyn y cynnig hwn, a yw hynny'n golygu na fydd gennym gynrychiolwyr ar y cyngor partneriaeth?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Os bydd y cynnig yn methu, ni fyddwn yn gallu penodi aelodau i'r cyngor partneriaeth ac yr wyf yn amau y bydd yn rhaid i'r Llywodraeth ystyried hyn ymhellach.

*Cynnig (NNDM2123): O blaid 48, Ymatal 2, Yn erbyn 6.  
Motion (NNDM2123): For 48, Abstain 2, Against 6.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Davies, David  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Williams, Brynle

Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Davies, Glyn  
 Morgan, Jonathan

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

## **Cwestiynau ar Lywodraeth Leol i'r Gweinidog Cyllid Questions on Local Government to the Finance Minister**

### **Cydweithio rhwng y Cynulliad a Llywodraeth Leol Co-operation between the Assembly and Local Government**

**Q1 Denise Idris Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on increasing public awareness about the co-operation and collaboration between the Assembly and local government? (OAQ38291)

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** The local government partnership scheme and the partnership council clearly demonstrate the Assembly Government's commitment to working in partnership with local government. As you may know, that was outlined in the Government of Wales Act 1998. We are seeking to raise awareness of the benefits of this partnership, for example, by publicising the second round of policy agreements, which are jointly agreed between

**C1 Denise Idris Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar gynyddu ymwybyddiaeth y cyhoedd o'r cydweithio a'r cydweithredu a geir rhwng y Cynulliad a Llywodraeth Leol? (OAQ38291)

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Mae cynllun partneriaeth llywodraeth leol a'r cyngor partneriaeth yn dangos yn glir ymrwymiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i weithio mewn partneriaeth â llywodraeth leol. Fel y gwyddoch efallai, amlinellwyd hynny yn Neddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Yr ydym yn ceisio codi ymwybyddiaeth o fanteision y bartneriaeth hon, er enghraifft, drwy gyhoeddi'r ail gylch o gytundebau polisi, y cytunir arnynt ar y cyd rhwng y Cynulliad a

the Assembly and each local authority and which will deliver improved outcomes at local level. In real terms, schemes such as the concessionary travel scheme illustrate how the partnership works in practice.

**Denise Idris Jones:** You will be present at the community strategy launch, which is to be held at the Llandudno Conference Centre on 27 October and where I believe that you will sign the partnership agreement for the public to view and ask questions. Do you agree that that will increase public awareness of the co-operation and collaboration between the Assembly and local government?

**Sue Essex:** Yes, I am looking forward to that because the community strategies are the core documents for local authorities. Those strategies not only represent the relationship between the Assembly and local government, but the relationship between other aspects of community. Therefore, I am pleased that Conwy has made this advance on its community strategy and look forward to sharing that special day with its representatives.

**Glyn Davies:** Co-operation and collaboration between the Assembly and local government depend on allowing local authorities the freedom to act in the best interests of the people who live in their areas. I raise the issue of hypothecation, as I have done many times before. Since the Assembly Government was established, the level of hypothecation has increased every year and has now doubled. Do you recognise that that is extremely damaging to the relationship between local government and the Assembly, and will you give us a commitment that you will try to reverse that trend in the future?

**Sue Essex:** One significant aspect of the advent of the Assembly, and certainly with regard to our policies, is that we have invested a great deal of additional money in local authorities through grants. Many of the changes that we have seen on the ground with regard to education, social care, transport grants, waste grants and so on, have developed as a result of those grants. We have signed a grants protocol, which means that, after a period of time, if we are satisfied

phob awdurdod lleol ac a fydd yn cyflawni canlyniadau gwell yn lleol. Mewn termau gwirioneddol, mae'r cynlluniau megis y cynllun tocynnau mantais yn dangos sut y mae'r bartneriaeth yn gweithio yn ymarferol.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Byddwch yn bresennol yn lansiad y strategaeth gymunedol, a gynhelir yng Nghanolfan Gynadledda Llandudno ar 27 Hydref, lle, fe gredaf, y byddwch yn llofnodi'r cytundeb partneriaeth i'r cyhoedd ei weld a holi cwestiynau. A gytunwch y bydd hynny'n codi ymwybyddiaeth y cyhoedd o'r cydweithio a'r cydweithredu rhwng y Cynulliad a llywodraeth leol?

**Sue Essex:** Ie wir, yr wyf yn edrych ymlaen at hynny oherwydd strategaethau cymunedol yw'r dogfennau craidd ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol. Mae'r strategaethau hynny nid yn unig yn cynrychioli'r berthynas rhwng y Cynulliad a llywodraeth leol, ond y berthynas rhwng agweddau eraill ar y gymuned. Felly, yr wyf yn falch bod Conwy wedi datblygu ei strategaeth gymunedol fel hyn ac edrychaf ymlaen at rannu'r diwrnod arbennig hwnnw gyda'i gynrychiolwyr.

**Glyn Davies:** Mae cydweithio a chydweithredu rhwng y Cynulliad a llywodraeth leol yn dibynnu ar roi'r rhyddid i awdurdodau lleol weithredu er budd y bobl sy'n byw yn eu hardaloedd. Codaf fater clustnodi, fel y gwneuthum sawl gwaith o'r blaen. Ers i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad gael ei sefydlu, mae lefel y clustnodi wedi cynyddu bob blwyddyn a bellach mae wedi dyblu. A gydnabyddwch fod hynny'n niweidiol iawn i'r berthynas rhwng llywodraeth leol a'r Cynulliad, ac a roddwch ymrwymiad inni y ceisiwch wrthdroi'r duedd honno yn y dyfodol?

**Sue Essex:** Un agwedd bwysig ar ddyfodiad y Cynulliad, ac yn sicr o ran ein polisiau, yw ein bod wedi buddsoddi llawer o arian ychwanegol mewn awdurdodau lleol drwy grantiau. Mae llawer o'r newidiadau a welsom ar lawr gwlad o ran addysg, gofal cymdeithasol, grantiau trafniadaeth, grantiau gwastraff ac ati, wedi datblygu o ganlyniad i'r grantiau hynny. Yr ydym wedi llofnodi protocol grantiau, sy'n golygu, ar ôl cyfnod o amser, os ydym yn fodlon bod yr awdurdod



that the authority is able to deal with those responsibilities, the money will be subsumed into the revenue support grant. I can assure you that this Government's intent is to move more towards hypothecation. However, we will deal with each grant as it comes along. The WLGA knows now that we are determined to move that along. I have given the commitment at the partnership council to speed up the process.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Yn ddi-ddorol ddigon, Weinidog, yr ydych wedi cyhoeddi'r cynnydd o 5 y cant i lywodraeth leol yn y gyllideb, a byddwch yn trafod hynny yr wythnos nesaf. Fodd bynnag, mae'n siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol bod y Cynghorydd Alex Aldridge, arweinydd Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, wedi dweud bod y setliad yn hynod o siomedig. Cyfeiriodd at y ffaith y bydd y cytundeb pwysau gwaith athrawon, gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, gwaith cynnal a chadw ffyrdd ac yn y blaen, yn golygu bod awdurdodau lleol yn mynd i orfod codi'r dreth gyngor yn uwch nag a wnaethant y llynedd er mwyn ymateb i'r galwadau hynny. Yn unol â'r penderfyniad ar 5 y cant, faint fydd y dreth gyngor yn gorfod codi yng Nghymru i sicrhau bod gwasanaethau o leiaf yn parhau i fod crystal ag y maent ar hyn o bryd?

**Sue Essex:** To correct you, Alex Aldridge said in the press release that he was disappointed, not very disappointed, and he did not talk about council tax increases. One journalist told me that the language was more moderate than that heard in previous years. As I said yesterday, if I was the leader of local government, whatever figure was announced, I would be likely to say that I was disappointed, because I would be hoping for a large increase. I accept that—that is the nature of the situation. However, if you read on in the press release, Alex pays tribute to the way in which we have worked together this year to try to get accurate figures with regard to the pay and price pressures, nowhere more so than with regard to the workload agreement. On the teachers' workload agreement, we have provided £25 million for the first year, and £37 million for the next year and the year after that. That is additional money and it is recognised. We have worked out, with local government,

yn gallu delio â'r cyfrifoldebau hynny, y caiff yr arian ei gynnwys yn y grant cynnal refeniw. Gallaf eich sicrhau mai bwriad y Llywodraeth hon yw symud tuag at glustnodi. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn delio â phob grant yn ei dro. Gŵyr CLILC ein bod bellach yn benderfynol o ddatblygu hynny. Yr wyf wedi rhoi'r ymrwymiad yn y cyngor partneriaeth i gyflymu'r broses.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Interestingly enough, Minister, you have announced the increase of 5 per cent for local government in your budget, and you will be discussing that next week. However, I am sure that you are aware that Councillor Alex Aldridge, the leader of the WLGA, has said that the settlement is very disappointing. He referred to the fact that the teachers' workload agreement, social services, and the maintenance of roads and so on, will mean that local authorities will have to increase council tax more than they did last year in order to respond to those demands. Pursuant to that decision on a 5 per cent increase, how much do you expect council tax to increase in Wales to ensure that public services remain at least as good as they are at present?

**Sue Essex:** I'ch cywiro, dywedodd Alex Aldridge yn y datganiad i'r wasg ei fod yn siomedig, nid yn hynod o siomedig, ac ni soniodd am gynnydd yn y dreth gyngor. Dywedodd un newyddiadurwr wrthyf fod yr iaith yn fwy cymedrol na'r hyn a glywyd mewn blynyddoedd blaenorol. Fel y dywedais ddoe, pe bawn i yn arweinydd llywodraeth leol, beth bynnag fyddai'r ffigur a gyhoeddid, byddwn yn debygol o ddweud fy mod yn siomedig, oherwydd byddwn yn gobeithio am gynnydd mawr. Derbyniaf hynny—dyna natur y sefyllfa. Fodd bynnag, os parhewch i ddarllen y datganiad i'r wasg, mae Alex yn talu teyrnged i'r ffordd yr ydym wedi cydweithio eleni i geisio cael ffigurau cywir ynghylch y pwysau o ran cyflogau a phrisiau, yn bennaf o ran y cytundeb llwyth gwaith. O ran y cytundeb llwyth gwaith athrawon, yr ydym wedi darparu £25 miliwn ar gyfer y flwyddyn gyntaf, a £37 miliwn ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf a'r flwyddyn wedi hynny. Arian ychwanegol yw hynny a

exactly how the workload agreement will affect local authorities and how it will be implemented in schools. As you said, that is not the settlement figure—we will be setting the local government settlement figure next week. We have included the quantum figures. Five per cent is slightly higher than last year's figure, but lest you forget, Ieuan, local government will benefit from many other areas of spend. The big thrust of the budget and the emphasis on early years and supporting communities is something that councils across Wales, whatever their political affiliation, are extremely pleased about.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** We are still on the first question, which has already taken five minutes. I will leave it to Members' powers of arithmetic, but we will run into 30 or 40 minutes if we carry on at this rate. I appeal for succinct questions and answers.

**John Griffiths:** Do you agree that one agreement that deserves to be publicised is that between Newport City Council and the Assembly, whereby Newport City Council has made pledges to improve education, to cut anti-social behaviour, to provide more support for older people to remain in their own homes, to support local small businesses and to work harder to promote the recycling of domestic waste?

2.20 p.m.

**Sue Essex:** Yes. That is living proof of partnership working with real targets on matters that mean something to people in their homes and communities. I pay tribute to people in the Newport area, in particular, for what they have done on recycling. It is tremendous; they have shown the way.

chydabyddir hynny. Yr ydym wedi cyfrifo, gyda llywodraeth leol, yn union sut y bydd y cytundeb llwyth gwaith yn effeithio ar awdurdodau lleol a sut y caiff ei weithredu mewn ysgolion. Fel y dywedaso, nid y ffigur setliad yw hynny—byddwn yn pennu'r ffigur setliad ar gyfer llywodraeth leol yr wythnos nesaf. Yr ydym wedi cynnwys y ffigurau cwantwm. Mae pump y cant ychydig yn uwch na ffigur y llynedd, ond rhag ofn ichi anghofio, Ieuan, bydd llywodraeth leol yn elwa ar lawer o feysydd gwariant eraill. Mae prif ergyd y gyllideb a'r pwyslais ar flynyddoedd cynnar a chefnogi cymunedau yn rhywbeth y mae cynghorau ledled Cymru, beth bynnag fo'u cysylltiad gwleidyddol, yn hynod falch yn ei gylch.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr ydym ar y cwestiwn cyntaf o hyd, sydd eisoes wedi cymryd pum munud. Fe'i gadawaf i allu'r Aelodau i rifo, ond aiff 30 neu 40 munud heibio os parhawn fel hyn. Apeliaf am gwestiynau ac atebion cryno.

**John Griffiths:** A gytunwch mai un cytundeb sy'n haeddu sylw yw'r un rhwng Cyngor Dinas Casnewydd a'r Cynulliad, lle mae Cyngor Dinas Casnewydd wedi addo gwella addysg, lleihau ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol, darparu mwy o gymorth i bobl hŷn i aros yn eu cartrefi eu hunain, rhoi cymorth i fusnesau bach lleol a gweithio'n galetach i hyrwyddo'r nod o ailgylchu gwastraff cartref?

**Sue Essex:** Cytunaf. Mae hynny'n brawf pendant o'r gwaith partneriaeth gyda thargedau gwirioneddol ar faterion sy'n golygu rhywbeth i bobl yn eu cartrefi a'u cymunedau. Talaf deyrnged i bobl yn ardal Casnewydd, yn arbennig, am yr hyn y maent wedi ei wneud o ran ailgylchu. Mae'n wych; maent wedi dangos y ffordd.

### **Rôl Cyngorau Cymuned The Role of Community Councils**

**Q2 William Graham:** Will the Minister make a statement on her considerations on the role of community councils in Wales? (OAQ38271)

**C2 William Graham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ei barn am rôl cyngorau cymuned yng Nghymru? (OAQ38271)

**Sue Essex:** The Welsh Assembly Government is committed to supporting the valuable role played by community and town councils and to assist in giving them opportunities to enhance their role. Our proposals are contained in the response, issued in August, to the research report undertaken by the University of Wales, Aberystwyth into the role, functions and future potential of community and town councils.

**William Graham:** Will you consider giving the same amount of money, proportionally, to community councils in Wales as that spent by Westminster on English community councils? They get some £48 million a year for their projects.

**Sue Essex:** The issue of finance was one of the points raised, and I have discussed it with community councils. We will look at that, particularly at the possibility of freeing up some capital. There is a cumbersome arrangement at the moment, and maybe we could help in that kind of framework.

**Janice Gregory:** I agree that community and town councils perform a valuable function at grass-roots level. However, many of the community councillors who were elected in June have told me that they would appreciate, and would benefit from, some type of training, though it need not be as intense as that received by city and county borough councillors. Can you tell the Assembly if that training is available and, if it is not, will you consider the matter?

**Sue Essex:** Again, the Aberystwyth report recommended training as an important issue for councillors and staff. One Voice Wales will give greater support to members, it has greater capacity to do so. Training and support—the two run together—will be at the top of the agenda. Also, I am about to issue a good councillor's guide, which will help people who want to put their names forward as councillors to feel more secure in doing so.

**Mick Bates:** As a former community and county councillor, I am aware that people are

**Sue Essex:** Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ymrwymedig i gefnogi'r rhan werthfawr a chwaraeir gan gynghorau tref a chymuned ac i helpu i roi cyfleoedd iddynt wella'r rôl honno. Cynhwysir ein cynigion yn yr ymateb, a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Awst, i'r adroddiad ymchwil a wnaed gan Brifysgol Cymru, Aberystwyth i rôl, swyddogaethau a photensial cynghorau tref a chymuned yn y dyfodol.

**William Graham:** A ystyriwch roi'r un swm o arian, yn gymesur, i gynghorau cymuned yng Nghymru â'r swm a werir gan San Steffan ar gynghorau cymuned yn Lloegr? Cânt tua £48 miliwn y flwyddyn am eu prosiectau.

**Sue Essex:** Yr oedd cyllid yn un o'r pwyntiau a godwyd, ac yr wyf wedi ei drafod gyda chynghorau cymuned. Edrychwn ar hynny, yn arbennig ar y posibilrwydd o ryddhau peth cyfalaf. Mae trefniant beichus ar hyn o bryd, ac efallai y gallem helpu yn y math hwnnw o fframwaith.

**Janice Gregory:** Cytunaf fod cynghorau tref a chymuned yn cyflawni swyddogaeth werthfawr ar lawr gwlad. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer o'r cynghorwyr cymuned a etholwyd ym mis Mehefin wedi dweud wrthyf y byddent yn gwerthfawrogi ac yn elwa ar ryw fath o hyfforddiant, er na fyddai angen iddo fod mor ddwys â'r hyfforddiant a gaiff cynghorwyr dinas a bwrdeistref sirol. A allwch ddweud wrth y Cynulliad a yw'r hyfforddiant hwnnw ar gael, ac os nad ydyw, a wnewch ystyried y mater?

**Sue Essex:** Unwaith eto, argymhellodd adroddiad Aberystwyth hyfforddiant fel mater pwysig i gynghorwyr a'r staff. Bydd Un Llais i Gymru yn rhoi mwy o gefnogaeth i aelodau, mae ganddo fwy o gapasiti i wneud hynny. Bydd hyfforddiant a chefnogaeth—mae'r ddau yn cydreddeg—ar frig yr agenda. Hefyd, yr wyf ar fin cyhoeddi canllaw cynghorwyr da, a fydd yn helpu pobl sydd am roi eu henwau gerbron fel cynghorwyr i deimlo'n fwy sicr wrth wneud hynny.

**Mick Bates:** Fel cyn-gynghorydd cymuned a sir, yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod pobl yn

deeply concerned about how little power community councils have. You have had a full report on this matter, so how will you increase those powers and will there be any financial support for community councils to help them to have real responsibility for their local areas?

**Sue Essex:** That is an interesting point. I have spoken to the different community council organisations and at national conferences, and in practice I have found that although some community and town councils want to take on more responsibility, many do not. We must respect that, and I am conscious of that point. I have always said that I am happy to support those community councils that want more power and want to take on more responsibility for their community because there will then be a close relationship between the service delivery and the locality. However, I respect the other community councils that may want to pull back from that, and are happy with what they are doing. Many councillors have said to me that they do not want to go further. For those that want to go further, we are considering getting a charter or agreement between county and local councillors for a good way forward on service level agreements and so on.

**Christine Chapman:** As others have said, community councillors are valuable, but I believe that many people are unaware of the local services and actions that they undertake on behalf of the community. Do you agree that a good public communications strategy is vital if community councils are to encourage younger people to get involved in their activities, and more local residents to take ownership of improving their area?

**Sue Essex:** The report picked up those two issues. On the relationship with the local community and trying to ensure better communication, local residents in many cases do not understand what a community council does, and that is a great shame because there is an opportunity at that level to get a relationship going. The other interesting recommendation is the idea of co-opting people aged between 16 and 25 to local

gofidio llawer am fod gan gynghorau cymuned gyn lleied o bŵer. Cawsoch adroddiad llawn ar y mater hwn, felly sut y byddwch yn cynyddu'r pwerau hynny ac a fydd unrhyw gymorth ariannol ar gael i gynghorau cymuned i'w helpu i deimlo'n wirioneddol gyfrifol am eu hardaloedd lleol?

**Sue Essex:** Mae hynny'n bwynt diddorol. Yr wyf wedi siarad â'r sefydliadau cynghorau cymuned gwahanol ac mewn cynadleddau cenedlaethol, ac yn ymarferol, yr wyf wedi canfod, er bod rhai cynghorau tref a chymuned am ysgwyddo mwy o gyfrifoldeb, nad yw llawer ohonynt am wneud hynny. Rhaid inni barchu hynny, ac yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r pwynt hwnnw. Yr wyf bob amser wedi dweud fy mod yn fodlon cefnogi'r cynghorau cymuned hynny sydd am gael mwy o bŵer ac am ysgwyddo rhagor o gyfrifoldeb dros eu cymuned oherwydd bydd perthynas agos wedyn rhwng darparu'r gwasanaethau a'r ardal leol. Fodd bynnag, parchaf y cynghorau cymuned eraill sydd am dynnu'n ôl o hynny o bosibl, ac sy'n fodlon ar yr hyn y maent yn ei wneud. Mae llawer o gynghorwyr wedi dweud wrthyf nad ydynt am fynd ymhellach. I'r rhai sydd am fynd ymhellach, yr ydym yn ystyried cael siarter neu gytundeb rhwng cynghorwyr sir a chynghorwyr lleol ar gyfer ffordd dda ymlaen ar gytundebau lefel gwasanaeth ac yn y blaen.

**Christine Chapman:** Fel y mae eraill wedi'i ddweud, mae cynghorwyr cymuned yn werthfawr, ond credaf nad yw llawer o bobl yn ymwybodol o'r gwasanaethau lleol a'r hyn a gyflawnant ar ran y gymuned. A gytunwch fod strategaeth cysylltiadau cyhoeddus dda yn hollbwysig er mwyn i gynghorau cymuned annog pobl iau i ymwneud â'u gweithgareddau, a chael mwy o drigolion lleol i ymgymryd â'r gwaith o wella eu hardal?

**Sue Essex:** Cyfeiriodd yr adroddiad at y ddau fater hynny. O ran y berthynas â'r gymuned leol a cheisio sicrhau gwell cysylltiadau, nid yw trigolion lleol mewn sawl achos yn deall yr hyn a wna cyngor cymuned, ac mae hynny'n drueni mawr oherwydd mae cyfle ar y lefel honno i ddatblygu perthynas. Yr argymhelliad diddorol arall yw'r syniad o gyfethol pobl rhwng 16 a 25 oed ar gynghorau cymuned lleol. Yn ystod yr

community councils. During this study I heard that many young people start off in community councils. That is their first political—small ‘p’—interest in terms of being an elected representative. We all felt that, if we could find a way to encourage those youngsters to come in and cut their teeth, then that is what we need to do, even though they may choose not to go on any further. That recommendation was, therefore, useful.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Although I hate doing this, I appeal again for succinct questions and answers. We have had two questions in 12 minutes—that really is too slow.

astudiaeth hon, clywais fod llawer o bobl ifanc yn dechrau mewn cynghorau cymuned. Dyna’u diddordeb gwleidyddol cyntaf—‘g’ fach—o ran bod yn gynrychiolydd etholedig. Teimlai pob un ohonom, pe gallem ddod o hyd i ffordd o annog y bobl ifanc hynny i ddod i mewn ac ennill profiad, dyna’r hyn y mae’n rhaid inni ei wneud, er na fyddent yn dewis mynd ymhellach efallai. Felly yr oedd yr argymhelliad hwnnw yn ddefnyddiol.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Er nad wyf yn hoffi gwneud hyn, apeliaf eto am gwestiynau ac atebion cryno. Yr ydym wedi cael dau gwestiwn mewn 12 munud—mae hynny’n rhy araf o lawer.

### **Y Dreth Gyngor yng Ngheredigion The Council Tax in Ceredigion**

**Q3 Lisa Francis:** Will the Minister make a statement on the rebanding and revaluation of council tax in Ceredigion? (OAQ38288)

**C3 Lisa Francis:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ailfandio ac ailbriso’r dreth gyngor yng Ngheredigion? (OAQ38288)

**Sue Essex:** Every home in Ceredigion should have received notification from the Valuation Office Agency of its proposed council tax band. Advice has also been provided on how to query valuation bandings, together with information about transitional arrangements and help available for those on a low or fixed income.

**Sue Essex:** Dylai pob cartref yng Ngheredigion fod wedi derbyn hysbysiad gan Asiantaeth y Swyddfa Brisio am ei fand treth gyngor arfaethedig. Darparwyd cyngor hefyd ar sut i gwestiynu bandiau prisio, ynghyd â gwybodaeth am drefniadau trosiannol a’r cymorth sydd ar gael i’r rhai sydd ar incwm isel neu sefydlog.

**Lisa Francis:** Next year, 38 per cent of Ceredigion properties will move to a higher council tax band, and council tax for many will increase again. We heard much about the poll tax in yesterday’s debate. What I recall about the poll tax is not so much that people were fundamentally opposed to it, but that their tax bills went up. [*Laughter.*]

**Lisa Francis:** Y flwyddyn nesaf, bydd 38 y cant o gartrefi yng Ngheredigion yn symud i fand treth gyngor uwch, a bydd y dreth gyngor i lawer yn cynyddu eto. Clywsom lawer am dreth y pen yn y ddadl ddoe. Yr hyn a gofiaf am dreth y pen yw nid yn gymaint fod pobl yn y bôn yn ei gwrthwynebu ond bod eu biliau treth wedi codi. [*Chwerthin.*]

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. This should be a question to the Minister about council tax.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Dylai hyn fod yn gwestiwn i’r Gweinidog am y dreth gyngor.

**Lisa Francis:** ‘Can’t pay, won’t pay’ was the slogan. Given that, do you not think that, as history has an uncanny knack of repeating itself, and we have a long history of public protest in this country, your Labour strategists should be getting just a little nervous?

**Lisa Francis:** Y slogan oedd ‘Can’t pay, won’t pay’. O gofio hynny, oni chredwch, gan fod gan hanes y ddawn ryfedd o ailadrodd ei hun, ac mae gennym hanes hir o wrthdystio yn gyhoeddus yn y wlad hon, y dylai’r strategyddion Llafur fod ychydig yn nerfus?

**Sue Essex:** Let us take Ceredigion before I address the poll tax. Looking at the figures, the band movements in Ceredigion are not too different from the Welsh average, and that is the important point. I have, therefore, no basis to expect that either the grant levels or the tax yield will vary significantly, but I still need to see the exact figures.

I think that you are unwise to remind us of the poll tax. I remember being a councillor at that time, and there were many who could not pay because they did not have any income, yet they were still expected to pay. It was an extraordinarily difficult time for people and families in the ward that I represented, and I hope that we never return to such a situation. The difference now is that we have a Labour Government. I understand the difficulties in paying council tax, which is why we have made strong representations on reforming the council tax benefit system. In fact, the matters that we have been talking about have been approved and reiterated in the select committee that has just dealt with it. The idea is that we stop talking about it as a benefit and more as an entitlement. That, and similar approaches, could improve the situation for those at the lower end of the income scale.

**Elin Jones:** Wrth i'r aifandio ddigwydd, mae'r dreth gyngor yng Ngheredigion yn cynrychioli tua 5 y cant o gyflogau cyfartalog yno, a thua 20 y cant o bensiynau. Beth bynnag fo'ch barn am dreth incwm lleol, a ydych yn derbyn bod y gyfundrefn dreth bresennol yn annheg gan ei bod yn cymryd canrannau mor sylweddol o incwm—5 y cant ac 20 y cant o bensiynau—heb unrhyw gysylltiad â'r gallu i dalu?

**Sue Essex:** I recognise that argument, and, in committee and in the work that we have done, we have tried to resolve the issues of fairness, and balance that between the efficiency and the effectiveness of a property-based tax. As I have said in the Chamber before, I was keen on the idea of local income tax until I really worked through the issue and saw the problems of delivery. The balance of funding review—and I think that Michael Lyons will

**Sue Essex:** Gadewch inni ystyried Ceredigion cyn imi ymdrin â threth y pen. Gan edrych ar y ffigurau, nid yw'r symudiadau yn y bandiau yng Ngheredigion yn wahanol iawn i'r cyfartaledd yng Nghymru, a dyna'r pwynt pwysig. Felly, nid oes gennyf reswm dros ddisgwyl y bydd naill ai'r lefelau grant neu'r incwm o'r dreth yn amrywio'n sylweddol, ond mae angen imi weld yr union ffigurau o hyd.

Credaf eich bod yn annoeth i'n hatgoffa o dreth y pen. Cofiaf fod yn gynghorydd bryd hynny, ac yr oedd llawer na allent dalu gan nad oedd unrhyw incwm ganddynt, ac eto yr oedd disgwyl iddynt dalu o hyd. Yr oedd yn gyfnod eithriadol o anodd i bobl a theuluoedd yn y ward a gynrychiolwyd gennyf, a gobeithiaf na ddychwelwn i sefyllfa debyg byth eto. Y gwahaniaeth yn awr yw bod gennym Lywodraeth Lafur. Deallaf yr anawsterau o ran talu'r dreth gyngor a dyna pam yr ydym wedi gwneud sylwadau cryf ar ddiwygio system budd-dal y dreth gyngor. Mewn gwirionedd, mae'r materion y buom yn siarad amdanynt wedi cael eu cymeradwyo a'u hailadrodd yn y pwyllgor dethol sydd newydd ddelio â hyn. Y syniad yw ein bod yn rhoi'r gorau i siarad am y peth fel budd-dal a siarad amdano mwy fel hawl. Gallai hynny, a dulliau tebyg, wella'r sefyllfa i'r rhai ar ben isaf y raddfa incwm.

**Elin Jones:** As the rebanding is being done, council tax in Ceredigion represents around 5 per cent of average earnings there, and around 20 per cent of pensions. Whatever your opinion on a local income tax, do you accept that the current taxation system is unfair in that it takes such high percentages of income—5 per cent and 20 per cent of pensions—without any link to the ability to pay?

**Sue Essex:** Yr wyf yn cydnabod y ddadl honno, ac yn y pwyllgor ac yn y gwaith a wnaethom, yr ydym wedi ceisio datrys materion tegwch, a chydbwysu hynny rhwng effeithlonrwydd ac effeithiolrwydd treth ar sail eiddo. Fel y dywedais o'r blaen yn y Siambr, yr oeddwn o blaid y syniad o dreth incwm leol nes imi ystyried y mater o ddifrif a gweld y problemau o ran ei chyflwyno. Bydd yr adolygiad o gydbwysedd cyllid—a

look at this, too—will be looking at a greater diversification of the tax base, so there will not be so much emphasis on council tax alone.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** According to analysis that I have seen on figures that you published for Ceredigion, there will be a 2.5 per cent increase in council tax, as projected without tax breaks, as a result of the revaluation and people's houses moving up bands. That would mean that, in turn, the revenue support grant settlement for Ceredigion would fall by £0.5 million. Taxpayers in Ceredigion will pay £0.5 million more, and the revenue support grant would fall by £0.5 million. Will you make up that difference or do you intend to ask taxpayers to carry the burden in council tax?

2.30 p.m.

**Sue Essex:** I am sure that you understand, Mike, because you and I attended the consultative forum on finance last week, that the tax yield is a key element of the revenue support grant, but it is not the only element of it. Other elements are coming in that will significantly impact on the formula this year—personal social services being the major one. We still have to consider that and the overall figures. The local government settlement that we will put down next week will reflect that consideration.

**Michael German:** If you consider the settlement this year and the revaluation on a like-for-like basis, and, given that more tax is to be collected in Ceredigion because of the rebanding exercise, would you agree that council tax payers would be asked to pay £0.5 million and that £0.5 million would be taken off the RSG because of the way in which the RSG reflects the tax base? Do you agree with those figures on a like-for-like basis?

**Sue Essex:** You are not taking into account the calculations on the standard spending assessment. That is what I have said. The SSA has many other elements that may or

chredaf y bydd Michael Lyons yn edrych ar hyn hefyd—yn ystyried sicrhau mwy o amrywiaeth o ran y sylfaen dreth, ac felly ni fydd cymaint o bwyslais ar y dreth gyngor yn unig.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Yn ôl y dadansoddiad a welais ar ffigurau y bu ichi eu cyhoeddi ar gyfer Ceredigion, bydd cynnydd o 2.5 y cant yn y dreth gyngor, fel y rhagwelwyd heb fanteision treth, o ganlyniad i ailbrisio a thai pobl yn symud i fand uwch. Byddai hynny'n golygu, yn ei dro, y byddai'r setliad grant cynnal refeniw ar gyfer Ceredigion yn gostwng £0.5 miliwn. Bydd trethdalwyr yng Ngheredigion yn talu £0.5 miliwn yn fwy, a byddai'r grant cynnal refeniw yn gostwng £0.5 miliwn. A dalwch y gwahaniaeth hwnnw neu a fwriadwch ofyn i drethdalwyr ysgwyddo'r baich o ran y dreth gyngor?

**Sue Essex:** Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn deall, Mike, oherwydd bu i chi a minnau fynychu'r fforwm ymgynghorol ar gyllid yr wythnos diwethaf, fod yr incwm o'r dreth yn elfen allweddol o'r grant cynnal refeniw, ond nid dyma'r unig elfen ohono. Ceir elfennau eraill a fydd yn effeithio'n sylweddol ar y fformiwla eleni—a'r brif un yw'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol personol. Rhaid inni ystyried honno o hyd a'r ffigurau cyffredinol. Bydd y setliad llywodraeth leol a gyflwynwn yr wythnos nesaf yn adlewyrchu'r ystyriaeth honno.

**Michael German:** Os ystyriwch y setliad eleni a'r ailbrisio ar sail tebyg am debyg, ac, o gofio y bydd mwy o dreth yn cael ei chasglu yng Ngheredigion oherwydd yr ymarfer ailfandio, a gytunwch y byddai talwyr y dreth gyngor yn gorfod talu £0.5 miliwn ac y byddai £0.5 miliwn yn cael ei dynnu o'r grant cynnal refeniw oherwydd y ffordd y mae'r grant cynnal refeniw yn adlewyrchu'r sylfaen dreth? A gytunwch â'r ffigurau hynny ar sail tebyg am debyg?

**Sue Essex:** Nid ydych yn ystyried y cyfrifiadau ar yr asesiad o wariant safonol. Dyna'r hyn a ddywedais. Mae gan yr asesiad o wariant safonol lawer o elfennau eraill a

may not counter the impact of revaluation, and that is why it is too early to say. We had a long debate yesterday about what the levels of council tax will be.

allai neu na allai wrthsefyll effaith ailbriso, a dyna pam y mae'n rhy gynnar i ddweud. Cawsom ddadl hir ddoe ynglŷn â beth fydd lefelau'r dreth gyngor.

### **Adolygiad o Gydbwysedd Cyllid The Balance of Funding Review**

**Q4 Peter Black:** What is the process for carrying forward the balance of funding review? (OAQ38300)

**C4 Peter Black:** Beth yw'r broses ar gyfer bwrw ati â'r adolygiad o gydbwysedd cyllid? (OAQ38300)

**Sue Essex:** The review in Wales is complete, and we have submitted our document. The review's purpose was to collect evidence to make a submission to the equivalent review in England. That has been done. However, I hope to build on this and to submit evidence to the independent inquiry into local government funding being chaired by Sir Michael Lyons.

**Sue Essex:** Mae'r adolygiad yng Nghymru wedi'i gwblhau, ac yr ydym wedi cyflwyno ein dogfen. Diben yr adolygiad oedd casglu tystiolaeth i wneud cyflwyniad i'r adolygiad cyfatebol yn Lloegr. Gwnaed hynny. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiaf adeiladu ar hyn a chyflwyno tystiolaeth i'r ymchwiliad annibynnol i gyllid llywodraeth leol sy'n cael ei gadeirio gan Syr Michael Lyons.

**Peter Black:** Will you make a further submission on this review in terms of the evidence that you can gather from the rebanding of council tax? Do you not think that some of the evidence that will come forward from the rebanding exercise will give further credence to the campaign to abolish the tax?

**Peter Black:** A wnewch chi gyflwyniad arall ar yr adolygiad hwn o ran y dystiolaeth y gallwch ei chasglu wrth ailfandio'r dreth gyngor? Oni chredwch y bydd peth o'r dystiolaeth a ddaw i'r amlwg yn sgîl yr ymarfer ailfandio yn rhoi coel bellach ar yr ymgyrch i ddiddymu'r dreth?

**Sue Essex:** I am looking for an early meeting with Sir Michael Lyons, and I will submit the evidence that we gave before. We would be happy to share our experiences on rebanding. Rebanding simply provides accurate figures, 12 years on from the original banding and valuation exercise. It would be untenable for any Government to run a property tax without its being accurate, because many anomalies arose over those 12 years. However, I will put that information Sir Michael Lyons's way, and I am sure that he will be open to any comments.

**Sue Essex:** Bwriadaf gynnal cyfarfod cynnar gyda Syr Michael Lyons, a byddaf yn cyflwyno'r y bu inni ei rhoi o'r blaen. Byddem yn fodlon rhannu ein profiadau ar ailfandio. Mae ailfandio yn rhoi ffigurau cywir, 12 mlynedd wedi'r ymarfer bandio a phrisio gwreiddiol. Byddai'n anghynaliadwy i unrhyw Lywodraeth gynnal treth eiddo heb iddi fod yn gywir, oherwydd cododd sawl anghysondeb dros y 12 mlynedd hynny. Fodd bynnag, cyflwynaf y wybodaeth honno i Syr Michael Lyons, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yn agored i unrhyw sylwadau.

**David Lloyd:** A yw'r modd y mae'r heddlu yn cael eu hariannu hefyd yn cael ei adolygu?

**David Lloyd:** Is the way in which the police are funded also to be reviewed?

**Sue Essex:** I am not sure about that. I have views on police funding, but the main bulk of the funding comes from the Home Office, although some of it comes through us. I do not believe that that will be included in Michael Lyons's review, but I will check that for you.

**Sue Essex:** Nid wyf yn siŵr am hynny. Mae gennyf farn ar ariannu'r heddlu, ond daw'r rhan fwyaf o'r cyllid o'r Swyddfa Gartref, er bod peth ohono'n dod drwom ni. Ni chredaf y caiff hynny ei gynnwys yn adolygiad Michael Lyons, ond gwiriaf hynny ichi.



**Mark Isherwood:** What measures will the Welsh Assembly Government take in the balance of funding review to tackle the unsustainable postcode lottery caused by its local government funding formula, which continues to fund schoolchildren, the vulnerable and the elderly on the basis of where they live rather than on what they need?

**Sue Essex:** I do not know whether you were listening, Mark, but I have just said that the balance of funding review has been completed. That was in answer to Peter's first question. On the geographical differences, that is the nature of unitary authorities. The SSA is accounted on a geographical basis, that is, on the basis of 22 local authorities. There is nothing that I am going to do, or anyone else wants to do, to change that.

**Mark Isherwood:** Pa fesurau y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn eu cymryd yn yr adolygiad o gydbwysedd cyllid i fynd i'r afael â'r loteri cod post anghynaliadwy a achosir gan ei fformiwla cyllid llywodraeth leol, sy'n parhau i ariannu plant ysgol, y rhai diamddiffyn a'r henoed yn seiliedig ar ble y maent yn byw yn hytrach nag ar yr hyn y mae arnynt ei angen?

**Sue Essex:** Ni wn a oeddech yn gwranddo, Mark, ond yr wyf newydd ddweud bod yr adolygiad o gydbwysedd cyllid wedi ei gwblhau. Ateb i gwestiwn cyntaf Peter oedd hynny. O ran y gwahaniaethau daearyddol, dyna natur awdurdodau unedol. Cyfrifir yr asesiad o wariant safonol ar sail ddaearyddol, hynny yw, ar sail 22 o awdurdodau lleol. Nid wyf yn bwriadu gwneud dim i newid hynny, ac nid oes neb arall am wneud unrhyw beth i newid hynny ychwaith.

### **Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Modern Modern Public Services**

**Q5 Brynle Williams:** Good afternoon, Minister. What investment is the Welsh Assembly Government making to improve modern public services in Wales? (OAQ38287)

**Sue Essex:** Good afternoon, Brynle, it is nice to see you. I announced my draft budget on 11 October. This provides an additional £2.5 billion in our yearly spending power by 2007-08, compared with the current year. It will enable the Welsh Assembly Government to deliver its commitments set out in 'Wales: A Better Country' and will contribute significantly to better public services.

**Brynle Williams:** Why have you failed to persuade the Chancellor to give noticeable amounts of money to Wales for improving public services so that you do not have to raid your reserves to make up the large shortfall?

**Sue Essex:** I do not know who has been giving you advice on mathematics, Brynle, but you need to go back to them and ask them to look at this again. You will remember that

**C5 Brynle Williams:** Prynawn da, Weinidog. Pa fuddsoddiad y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i wella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus modern yng Nghymru? (OAQ38287)

**Sue Essex:** Prynawn da, Brynle, mae'n braf eich gweld. Cyhoeddais fy nghyllideb ddrafft ar 11 Hydref. Mae hyn yn darparu £2.5 biliwn ychwanegol o ran ein gwariant blynyddol erbyn 2007-08, o gymharu â'r flwyddyn bresennol. Bydd yn galluogi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gyflawni ei hymrwymadau a nodir yn 'Cymru: Gwlad Well' a bydd yn cyfrannu'n sylweddol at wasanaethau cyhoeddus gwell.

**Brynle Williams:** Pam yr ydych wedi methu â darbwylllo'r Canghellor i roi symiau sylweddol o arian i Gymru er mwyn gwella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus fel nad oes yn rhaid ichi ddefnyddio arian wrth gefn i wneud iawn am y diffyg mawr?

**Sue Essex:** Ni wn pwy sydd wedi bod yn rhoi cyngor ichi ar fathemateg, Brynle, ond mae angen ichi fynd yn ôl atynt a gofyn iddynt edrych ar hyn eto. Fe gofiwch, yn yr

in the comprehensive spending review we had enormous sums of extra money from Gordon Brown—it was a good settlement. The only reason that we can put these large sums of money into public services is because we have had good settlements from Gordon Brown—over this period, the settlement will be 4.3 per cent above inflation. I remember that during the Tory years inflation ran at about 9 or 15 per cent. It is no good shaking your head, Brynle. To get settlements above inflation from a Chancellor of the Exchequer then would have meant that we would have been in double figures. No-one wants to go back to those terrible days.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Tybiaf y byddech yn derbyn bod cynnig gwasanaeth cynghori i bobl sydd wedi dioddef camdriniaeth rywiol yn wasanaeth cyhoeddus. Sut y gallwch gynorthwyo mudiad sydd yn gweithio'n genedlaethol, ar draws ffiniau llywodraeth leol, i gael ei ariannu gan fwy nag un awdurdod lleol ac awdurdod iechyd lleol, a sicrhau nad yw pobl yn manteisio ar y ffaith y gallant gael mynediad i'r gwasanaeth hwnnw yn wirfoddol, fel nad yw corff o'r fath yn wynebu problemau ariannol sylfaenol?

**Sue Essex:** You raise a more general point, about how we fund national organisations. Such important organisations include Welsh Women's Aid, in terms of domestic abuse, and Sustrans, in terms of my former environment portfolio. Many of these get grant funding under the social justice heading—I am pretty sure that that is true, but I will check it. That is where I would direct people for that kind of area. I do not know exactly which organisation you are talking about—if you wish to write to me or to Edwina we will look at the particular circumstances.

adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant, inni gael symiau enfawr o arian ychwanegol gan Gordon Brown—yr oedd yn setliad da. Yr unig reswm y gallwn neilltuo'r symiau mawr hyn o arian ar gyfer gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yw am ein bod wedi cael setliadau da gan Gordon Brown—dros y cyfnod hwn, bydd y setliad 4.3 y cant yn uwch na chwyddiant. Yr oedd chwyddiant, fe gofiau, yn ystod blynyddoedd y Toriaid, tua 9 neu 15 y cant. Ofer ichi ysgwyd eich pen, Brynle. Er mwyn cael setliadau yn uwch na chwyddiant gan Ganghellor y Trysorlys bryd hynny byddai wedi golygu y byddem wedi cyrraedd ffigurau dwbl. Nid oes neb am ddychwelyd i'r dyddiau ofnadwy hynny.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I assume that you would accept that offering counselling to people who have suffered sexual abuse is a public service. How can you assist an organisation that works nationally, across local government boundaries, to gain funding from more than one local authority and local health authority, and ensure that people do not take advantage of the fact that they can gain access to that service voluntarily, so that such organisations do not face fundamental financial problems?

**Sue Essex:** Codwch bwynt mwy cyffredinol ynglŷn â sut yr ariannwn sefydliadau cenedlaethol. Mae sefydliadau pwysig o'r fath yn cynnwys Cymorth i Fenywod yng Nghymru, o ran cam-drin yn y cartref, a Sustrans, o ran fy mhortffolio amgylchedd blaenorol. Caiff llawer o'r rhain arian grant o dan y pennawd cyfiawnder cymdeithasol—yr wyf yn eithaf siŵr bod hynny'n wir, ond fe'i gwiriaf. Dyna lle y byddem yn cyfeirio pobl ar gyfer y math hwnnw o faes. Ni wn yn union am ba sefydliad yr ydych yn sôn—os hoffech ysgrifennu ataf fi neu Edwina fe wnawn edrych ar yr amgylchiadau arbennig.

### **Yr Ailbrisiad Diweddar The Recent Revaluation**

**Q6 David Davies:** Will local authority funding by the National Assembly for Wales be in any way affected by the recent property revaluation? (OAQ38303)

**C6 David Davies:** A fydd yr ymarfer diweddar i ailbrisiu eiddo yn effeithio mewn unrhyw ffordd ar y cyllid y bydd awdurdodau lleol yn ei dderbyn oddi wrth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol? (OAQ38303)

**Sue Essex:** The overall amount of revenue support grant on an all-Wales basis is not affected by revaluation. The recent property revaluation exercise will impact on individual authorities' revenue support grant allocations. Authorities will also receive transitional funding under the arrangements to limit the council tax increases faced by residents moving up more than one band.

**David Davies:** You say that it will impact on revenue support grant funding. Can you clarify that? Are you saying that if a local authority receives an extra amount of money as a result of more houses moving up into higher bands, an equivalent amount of money will be deducted from the revenue support grant that it was getting from the Assembly? Is that correct, roughly speaking?

**Sue Essex:** Going back to Mike's point, there is an assessment of the council tax yield. Therefore, that reflects property values. The way that the grant is calculated will be that the grant will be equal to the standard spending assessment, minus the estimate on council tax yield. That is where it comes in. The mistake that Mike made was to say that that is the total basis of what the grant would be. The standard spending assessment is a key element of that. I hope that that helps.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** O ble yn union y daw'r cyllid ar gyfer y cynllun rhyddhad, ac ym mha linell gyllideb y mae wedi ei gynnwys? Pryd y gallwch ddweud wrth awdurdodau lleol pa gyfanswm y byddant yn ei dderbyn o dan y cynllun rhyddhad hwn?

**Sue Essex:** I will not be able to tell them the total that they will get, because they will not know that until next year, and until the final revaluation lists are through. The lists that have gone out are the draft lists. The Valuation Office Agency will publish the final lists for 1 April; we currently have rough estimates. I mention the final lists because there will be variations as people's situations are resolved. Many people are trying to resolve their different views on the valuation of their properties. A working group has been set up between Welsh local government and us to try to work out the eligibility, because this is about all eligible

**Sue Essex:** Nid yw ailbrisiu yn effeithio ar gyfanswm y grant cynnal refeniw i Gymru gyfan. Bydd yr ymarfer ailbrisiu eiddo diweddar yn effeithio ar ddyraniadau grant cynnal refeniw awdurdodau unigol. Bydd awdurdodau hefyd yn cael cyllid trosiannol o dan y trefniadau i gyfyngu ar y codiadau yn y dreth gyngor a wynebir gan drigolion sy'n codi mwy nag un band.

**David Davies:** Yr ydych yn dweud y bydd yn effeithio ar gyllid y grant cynnal refeniw. A allwch egluro hynny? A ydych yn dweud, os bydd awdurdod lleol yn cael swm ychwanegol o arian o ganlyniad i fwy o dai yn symud i fandiau uwch, y caiff swm cyfatebol o arian ei ddidynnu o'r grant cynnal refeniw yr oedd yn ei gael o'r Cynulliad? A yw hynny'n gywir, yn fras?

**Sue Essex:** Gan ddychwelyd at bwynt Mike, ceir asesiad o'r incwm o'r dreth gyngor. Felly, mae hynny'n adlewyrchu gwerthoedd eiddo. Caiff y grant ei gyfrifo fel hyn: bydd y grant yn cyfateb i'r asesiad o wariant safonol, llai'r amcangyfrif ar yr incwm o'r dreth gyngor. Dyna sut y mae hynny'n berthnasol. Y camgymeriad a wnaeth Mike oedd dweud mai hynny fyddai cyfanswm sail y grant. Elfen allweddol o hynny yw'r asesiad o wariant safonol. Gobeithiaf fod hynny'n helpu.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Where exactly will the funding come from for the relief scheme, and in which budget line has it been included? When can you tell local authorities how much they will receive as a result of this relief scheme?

**Sue Essex:** Ni fyddaf yn gallu dweud wrthynt y cyfanswm a gânt, oherwydd ni fyddant yn gwybod hynny tan y flwyddyn nesaf, a nes bod y rhestrau ailbrisiu terfynol gennym. Rhestrau drafft yw'r rhai a ddsbarthwyd. Bydd Asiantaeth y Swyddfa Brisio yn cyhoeddi'r rhestrau terfynol ar gyfer 1 Ebrill; ar hyn o bryd amcangyfrifon bras sydd gennym. Soniaf am y rhestrau terfynol oherwydd bydd amrywiadau wrth i sefyllfaoedd pobl gael eu datrys. Mae llawer o bobl yn ceisio dod i benderfyniad o ran eu safbwyntiau gwahanol ar brisiu eu heiddo. Sefydlwyd gweithgor rhwng llywodraeth leol Cymru a ninnau i geisio canfod pwy sy'n

households. On where the funding is, I have assured everyone in local government that it will not be top-sliced off the revenue support grant. The 5 per cent figure that I announced does not contain, and would not have to provide, funding for that moderation scheme. That will come from us, from end-of-year flexibility or reserves. We cannot do it any other way because we do not know what that will be until we have the accurate figures.

gymwys, oherwydd mae a wnelo hyn â phob cartref cymwys. O ran y cyllid, yr wyf wedi sicrhau pawb mewn llywodraeth leol na chaiff ei frigidori oddi ar y grant cynnal refeniw. Nid yw'r ffigur 5 y cant a gyhoeddais yn cynnwys cyllid ar gyfer y cynllun cymedroli hwnnw ac ni fyddai'n gorfod darparu'r cyllid hwnnw. Daw hynny oddi wrthym ni, o hyblygrwydd diwedd blwyddyn neu arian wrth gefn. Ni allwn ei wneud mewn unrhyw ffordd arall oherwydd ni wyddom beth fydd hynny nes bod y ffigurau cywir gennym.

2.40 p.m.

**Jenny Randerson:** Fifty-seven per cent of properties in Cardiff will go up by one band or more. While the total tax take could stay the same, it is clear that the majority of council tax payers will pay an increased burden. I am concerned about those living in modest homes near Cardiff city centre, which are now high in value. Many of those people have lived in those houses for many years, have a limited income and have not benefited from a buoyant property market. You have recognised the problems in introducing a transitional period. Do you not acknowledge that that is tinkering at the edges of a profoundly unfair tax, which statistics prove hits the poorest hardest?

**Jenny Randerson:** Bydd 57 y cant o gartrefi yng Nghaerdydd yn codi un band neu fwy. Er y gallai cyfanswm yr incwm o'r dreth aros yr un peth, mae'n amlwg y bydd y mwyafrif o dalwyr y dreth gyngor yn talu mwy. Pryderaf ynglŷn â'r rhai sy'n byw mewn cartrefi eithaf cyffredin yn agos at ganol dinas Caerdydd, sydd bellach yn uchel o ran gwerth. Mae llawer o'r bobl hynny wedi byw yn y cartrefi hynny ers blynyddoedd lawer, mae ganddynt incwm cyfyngedig ac nid ydynt wedi elwa ar farchnad eiddo fywiog. Yr ydych wedi cydnabod y problemau wrth gyflwyno cyfnod trosiannol. Oni chydabyddwch mai gwneud mân newidiadau i dreth hollol annheg yw hynny, sydd, yn ôl yr ystadegau, yn effeithio fwyaf ar y tlotaf?

**Sue Essex:** We introduced the moderation scheme because we felt that it was the fair thing to do. That has been warmly welcomed by everyone, whichever party they come from. Having no-one go up more than band in any one year helps to phase in this change. I appreciate that some people will find this change difficult, but it has to be made. We cannot confuse council tax yield with the council tax charge. That is why I have urged caution among those who are making dramatic pronouncements about council tax rises. This is not a marginal issue; it is important. In terms of council tax benefits, many of the people whom you and I deal with are eligible for those benefits. You find that out when you sit down with them and work it out. I would like to see a bigger group of people eligible. Therefore, I am using all my powers, and I hope that others will do so too, in urging our parliamentary colleagues to

**Sue Essex:** Cyflwynasom y cynllun cymedroli oherwydd teimlwyd mai dyna oedd y peth teg i'w wneud. Croesawyd hynny yn frwd gan bawb, pa blaid bynnag yr oeddent yn perthyn iddi. Mae sicrhau bod neb yn codi mwy nag un band mewn unrhyw un flwyddyn yn helpu i gyflwyno'r newid hwn yn raddol. Gwerthfawrogaf y bydd y newid hwn yn anodd i rai pobl, ond mae'n rhaid ei wneud. Ni allwn ddrysu incwm o'r dreth gyngor â thâl y dreth gyngor. Dyna pam yr wyf wedi annog y rhai sy'n gwneud datganiadau dramatig ynglŷn â chodiadau yn y dreth gyngor i fod yn bwyllog. Nid mater ymylol mo hwn; mae'n bwysig. O ran budd-daliadau'r dreth gyngor, mae llawer o'r bobl yr ydych chi a minnau yn ymdrin â hwy yn gymwys ar gyfer y budd-daliadau hynny. Yr ydych yn canfod hynny pan eisteddwch gyda hwy a chyfrifo hyn. Hoffwn weld grŵp mwy o bobl yn gymwys. Felly, defnyddiaf fy

extend that council tax benefit system and make it applicable to a larger group of people.

mhwerau i gyd, a gobeithiaf y bydd eraill yn gwneud hynny hefyd, i annog ein cyd-aelodau seneddol i estyn y system budd-dal treth gyngor a'i gwneud yn gymwys i grŵp mwy o bobl.

### **Refeniw Ychwanegol yn sgîl Ailfandio Extra Revenue Derived from Rebanding**

**Q7 David Davies:** Will the Minister allow local authorities to retain any extra revenue that they derive from having an increased number of houses in higher bands as a result of revaluation? (OAQ38302)

**C7 David Davies:** A fydd y Gweinidog yn caniatáu i awdurdodau lleol gadw unrhyw refeniw ychwanegol y byddant yn ei gasglu o gael mwy o dai mewn bandiau uwch, yn sgîl yr ymarfer ailbriso? (OAQ38302)

**Sue Essex:** As I explained in reply to your previous question, what we take from our revenue support grant budget is the notional council tax yield. It is up to local authorities to then decide what they charge in council tax.

**Sue Essex:** Fel yr esboniais yn fy ateb i'ch cwestiwn blaenorol, yr hyn a gymerwn o'n cyllideb grant cynnal refeniw yw'r incwm tybiannol o'r dreth gyngor. Cyfrifoldeb awdurdodau lleol yw penderfynu wedyn faint i'w godi o ran y dreth gyngor.

**David Davies:** If I heard you correctly—and I think that you have deliberately made this rather opaque—the answer to my question is that, no, you will not allow local authorities to keep that additional money. When you calculate the RSG you will be considering the standard spending assessment, which will include the amount of additional money that a local authority has taken from increased council tax bands. Why not be honest about this and admit that council tax payers will be paying twice: first, in increased council taxes due to a lack of Assembly funding, and, secondly, from the revaluation. If you think that that is scaremongering, Minister—

**David Davies:** Os bu imi eich clywed yn gywir—a chredaf ichi wneud hyn yn fwriadol aneglur—yr ateb i'm cwestiwn yw, na, ni fyddwch yn caniatáu i awdurdodau lleol gadw'r arian ychwanegol hwnnw. Pan gyfrifwch y grant cynnal refeniw byddwch yn ystyried yr asesiad o wariant safonol, a fydd yn cynnwys y swm o arian ychwanegol y bydd awdurdod lleol wedi ei gymryd yn sgîl bandiau treth gyngor uwch. Byddwch yn onest ynglŷn â hyn a chyfaddef y bydd talwyr y dreth gyngor yn talu dwywaith: yn gyntaf, oherwydd y dreth gyngor uwch yn sgîl prinder arian y Cynulliad, ac yn ail, oherwydd yr ailbriso. Os credwch mai codi bwganod yw hynny, Weinidog—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. It is not a question of whether the Minister believes that you are scaremongering. You must ask a question.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw'n berthnasol a yw'r Gweinidog yn credu eich bod yn codi bwganod ai peidio. Rhaid ichi ofyn cwestiwn.

**David Davies:** If you can guarantee that council taxes will be no higher than inflation, we will stop scaremongering.

**David Davies:** Os gallwch warantu na fydd y dreth gyngor yn uwch na chwyddiant, fe wnawn roi'r gorau i godi bwganod.

**Sue Essex:** I do not know whether you understand the nature of local democracy, but people are elected as councillors to decide on matters such as council tax. As I said yesterday and on Monday, we have carefully considered the pressures placed on local government. We believe that the 5 per cent

**Sue Essex:** Ni wn a ydych yn deall natur democratiaeth leol, ond caiff pobl eu hethol fel cynghorwyr i benderfynu ar faterion megis y dreth gyngor. Fel y dywedais ddoe a dydd Llun, yr ydym wedi rhoi ystyriaeth ofalus i'r pwysau a osodir ar lywodraeth leol. Credwn fod y setliad 5 y cant yn deg a

settlement is fair and reasonable. You will see how it will be distributed when I announce the settlement next week.

rhesymol. Cewch weld sut y caiff ei ddosbarthu pan gyhoeddaf y setliad yr wythnos nesaf.

### **Cytundeb Polisi ag Awdurdodau Lleol The Policy Agreement with Local Authorities**

**Q8 Rosemary Butler:** Will the Minister give an update on the progress made with the policy agreement with local authorities? (OAQ38294)

**C8 Rosemary Butler:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am hynt cytundebau polisi ag awdurdodau lleol? (OAQ38294)

**Sue Essex:** We have made steady progress, and I think that all 22 local authorities will have signed up by the end of October or early November. I signed the first policy agreement with Blaenau Gwent County Borough Council a few weeks ago at a local school.

**Sue Essex:** Yr ydym wedi gwneud cynnydd cyson a chredaf y bydd pob un o'r 22 o awdurdodau lleol wedi ymrwymo i hyn erbyn diwedd Hydref neu ddechrau Tachwedd. Llofnodais y cytundeb polisi cyntaf gyda Chyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Blaenau Gwent ychydig wythnosau yn ôl mewn ysgol leol.

**Rosemary Butler:** It will be great when all the authorities have signed up and I am delighted that Newport County Council has already done so. One of the four targets in the agreement is on developing strong and safe communities. Do you agree that the community warden scheme in Newport is exemplary and the envy of many Members in the Chamber? John Griffiths already mentioned the excellent work being carried out by Newport Wastesavers. Will you give a commitment to continue supporting such initiatives, which can be life-changing for the people of Newport?

**Rosemary Butler:** Bydd yn wych pan fydd yr holl awdurdodau wedi ymrwymo i hyn ac yr wyf yn falch bod Cyngor Sir Casnewydd eisoes wedi gwneud hynny. Un o'r pedwar targed yn y cytundeb yw datblygu cymunedau cryf a diogel. A gytunwch fod y cynllun wardeiniaid cymunedol yng Nghasnewydd yn wych ac yn achos cenfigen i lawer o Aelodau yn y Siambr? Soniodd John Griffiths eisoes am y gwaith rhagorol sy'n cael ei wneud gan Newport Wastesavers. A wnewch ymrwymo i barhau i gefnogi mentrau o'r fath, a all newid bywydau pobl Casnewydd?

**Sue Essex:** I believe that the policy agreements and associated grants are a major breakthrough. People looking at what we are doing in Wales think that it is good. So that everyone knows, what we have done is to introduce some adaptations this year, so that, of the 16 measures within each policy agreement, eight are National-Assembly-driven, and are strategic and consistent across the 22 local authorities, and the other eight are local indicators. That gives a good balance, as it allows all local authorities to say what types of issues are important to them. If you have an issue such as community wardens, which is important in terms of giving people security and confidence in their communities, I would applaud that. If Newport is doing something that other local authorities can run with and copy, or use in their own way, that is good.

**Sue Essex:** Credaf fod y cytundebau polisi a'r grantiau cysylltiedig yn gam mawr ymlaen. Mae pobl sy'n edrych ar yr hyn a wnawn yng Nghymru o'r farn ei fod yn dda. Fel y gŵyr pawb, bu inni gyflwyno rhai addasiadau eleni, fel bod wyth o'r 16 o fesurau o fewn pob cytundeb polisi wedi eu llywio gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ac yn strategol a chyson ar draws y 22 o awdurdodau lleol, a dangosyddion lleol yw'r wyth arall. Rhydd hynny gydbwysedd da, gan ei fod yn caniatáu i bob awdurdod lleol ddweud pa fathau o faterion sy'n bwysig iddynt hwy. Os oes gennych fater i'w godi megis wardeiniaid cymunedol, sy'n bwysig o ran rhoi sicrwydd a hyder i bobl yn eu cymunedau, byddwn yn cymeradwyo hynny. Os yw Casnewydd yn gwneud rhywbeth y gall awdurdodau lleol eraill ei efelychu, neu ei ddefnyddio yn eu ffordd hwy eu hunain,

mae hynny'n beth da.

**Alun Cairns:** Many local authority pension funds are experiencing a great shortfall. Much of it is as a result of the economic cycle and the poor performance of the stock market, but much is also due to the pension tax recently introduced by Gordon Brown. What extra funding will be introduced, and what policy agreement will you come to, in order to plug this gap in pension funding?

**Alun Cairns:** Mae diffyg mawr mewn llawer o gronfeydd pensiwn awdurdodau lleol. Mae llawer o'r diffyg o ganlyniad i'r cylch economaidd a pherfformiad gwael y farchnad stoc ond mae llawer ohono o ganlyniad hefyd i'r dreth bensiwn a gyflwynwyd yn ddiweddar gan Gordon Brown. Pa arian ychwanegol a gaiff ei gyflwyno, a pha gytundeb polisi a lunnir gennych, er mwyn llenwi'r bwllch hwn o ran ariannu pensiynau?

**Sue Essex:** Policy agreements would not be appropriate, Alun, because local government pension schemes all run on the basis of the former eight counties—I do not know whether you can remember them. That is how they were set up. We have regular discussions with local authorities on the pressures on their pensions. A report is due before long from the actuaries on the latest estimates, and that element will be taken into account. The pressure was also discussed at the consultative forum on finance meeting, and we have given a commitment that we will take that into account.

**Sue Essex:** Ni fyddai cytundebau polisi yn briodol, Alun, oherwydd caiff pob cynllun pensiwn llywodraeth leol ei redeg ar sail yr wyth sir flaenorol—ni wn a allwch eu cofio. Dyna sut y cawsant eu sefydlu. Cawn drafodaethau rheolaidd gydag awdurdodau lleol ar y pwysau sydd ar eu pensiynau. Caiff adroddiad ei gyhoeddi maes o law gan yr actiwariaid ar yr amcangyfrifon diweddaraf, a chaiff yr elfen honno ei hystyried. Trafodwyd y pwysau hefyd yng nghyfarfod y fforwm ymgynghorol ar gyllid, ac yr ydym wedi addo ystyried hynny.

### Pleidleisio drwy'r Post Postal Ballots

**Q9 Janet Davies:** Will the Minister make a statement on the future use of postal ballots in Wales? (OAQ38255)

**C9 Janet Davies:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ddefnyddio papurau pleidleisio drwy'r post yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol? (OAQ38255)

**Sue Essex:** The Assembly Government is keen to foster new methods of voting where they can be shown to improve levels of participation. I am mindful of the reservations of the Electoral Commission in its recent report on all-postal ballots, following the electoral pilots in four English regions in June, and we will continue to work with the commission and others to establish secure methods of alternative voting.

**Sue Essex:** Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn awyddus i hyrwyddo dulliau newydd o bleidleisio lle y gellir dangos eu bod yn cynyddu'r nifer sy'n pleidleisio. Cadwaf mewn cof amheuan y Comisiwn Etholiadol yn ei adroddiad diweddar ar bleidleisio drwy'r post yn unig, yn dilyn y pedwar cynllun peilot etholiadol mewn pedwar rhanbarth yn Lloegr ym mis Mehefin, a byddwn yn parhau i gydweithio â'r comisiwn ac eraill i sefydlu dulliau diogel, amgen o bleidleisio.

**Janet Davies:** I found it difficult to hear you Minister, as people were talking quite loudly around me.

**Janet Davies:** Bu'n anodd imi eich clywed, Weinidog, am fod pobl yn siarad yn eithaf uchel o'm hamgylch.

If postal ballots go ahead in Wales, what measures of accountability will you introduce

Os cyflwynir system o bleidleisio drwy'r post yng Nghymru, pa fesurau atebolrwydd y

to deal with anything that goes wrong? That should include accountability to the Minister responsible for local government, whoever that may be.

**Sue Essex:** The opportunity for postal voting will still exist, and we know that increasing numbers of people are choosing that option. That is a trend that will continue. Your question was about all-postal ballots; clearly, the Electoral Commission had some reservations about that, mainly in terms of security. I am not sure whether any of the accusations with regard to security were revealed to be true; I have not seen any evidence of that. The Assembly has very few powers on elections. I believe that that is an omission, as does the Electoral Commission. I hope that we will be given further powers, which will allow us to take a more active role in good practice in terms of how postal ballots and other systems are conducted.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** In relation to all-postal ballots, you spoke about the Electoral Commission's recommendations. It recommended against all-postal ballots because of the danger of corruption, as much as security issues. If we are given the powers, will you give an assurance that you will not seek all-postal ballots, because of those dangers?

**Sue Essex:** It is a little premature to ask that question. I used the word 'security' in the broadest sense; I do not mean the kind of security seen in the Afghanistan elections as, thankfully, no-one here is intimidated into not going to cast a vote. There was a feeling at the time of the all-postal ballots that they were open to fraud, and that there may have been some fraud. As I understand it, that has not been proven. However, if the perception exists, you must take it seriously.

I would like to see further analysis of what happened in the all-postal ballots. They have downsides as well as upsides. However, whatever happens, we will see more and more people taking advantage of voting

byddwch yn eu cyflwyno i ymdrin ag unrhyw beth a aiff o chwith? Dylai hynny gynnwys atebolrwydd i'r Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am lywodraeth leol, pwy bynnag y bo.

**Sue Essex:** Bydd y cyfle i bleidleisio drwy'r post yn parhau, a gwyddom fod nifer gynyddol o bobl yn dewis gwneud hynny. Mae honno'n duedd a fydd yn parhau. Yr oedd eich cwestiwn yn ymwneud â phleidleisio drwy'r post yn unig; mae'n amlwg bod rhai amheuon gan y Comisiwn Etholiadol ynghylch hynny, yn bennaf o ran diogelwch. Nid wyf yn siŵr a oedd unrhyw rai o'r cyhuddiadau ynghylch diogelwch yn wir; nid wyf wedi gweld unrhyw dystiolaeth o hynny. Ychydig iawn o bwerau sydd gan y Cynulliad o ran etholiadau. Credaf fod hynny'n ddiffyg, a'r un yw barn y Comisiwn Etholiadol. Gobeithiaf y cawn ragor o bwerau, a fydd yn ein galluogi i chwarae rhan well mewn arferion da, o ran sut y gweithredir y system o bleidleisio drwy'r post a systemau eraill.

**Arweinwyr Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Ynghylch pleidleisio drwy'r post yn unig, bu ichi sôn am argymhellion y Comisiwn Etholiadol. Argymhellodd na ddylid cyflwyno pleidleisio drwy'r post yn unig oherwydd y perygl o lygredd yn gymaint â materion yn ymwneud â diogelwch. Os rhoddir y pwerau inni, a sicrhewch na fyddwch yn ceisio cyflwyno pleidleisio drwy'r post yn unig, oherwydd y peryglon hynny?

**Sue Essex:** Mae ychydig yn rhy gynnar i ofyn y cwestiwn hwnnw. Defnyddiais y gair 'diogelwch' yn ei ystyr ehangaf; ni olygaf y math o ddiogelwch a welir yn yr etholiadau yn Affganistan oherwydd, yn ffodus, ni chaiff neb yma ei fygwth a'i atal rhag bwrw pleidlais. Yr oedd ymdeimlad ar adeg y pleidleisio drwy'r post yn unig ei fod yn agored i dwyll, ac efallai y cafwyd rhywfaint o dwyll. Fel y deallaf, ni phrofwyd hynny. Fodd bynnag, os oes canfyddiad felly, rhaid ichi ei gymryd o ddifrif.

Hoffwn weld rhagor o waith dadansoddi o'r hyn a ddigwyddodd yn yr etholiadau pleidleisio drwy'r post yn unig. Mae anfanteision yn ogystal â manteision. Fodd bynnag, beth bynnag a ddigwydd, gwelwn



through the post. We must ensure that that process is as fair and accessible as possible. We tried hard this time, as an Assembly Government, to improve postal ballot forms. However, I am sure that there is still room for improvement so that people can understand and use the forms correctly.

nifer gynyddol o bobl yn manteisio ar y cyfle i bleidleisio drwy'r post. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod y broses honno mor deg a hygyrch â phosibl. Bu inni ymdrechu'n galed y tro hwn, fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, i wella'r papurau pleidleisio drwy'r post. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siŵr bod lle i wella o hyd fel y gall pobl ddeall a defnyddio'r papurau yn gywir.

2.50 p.m.

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes Questions to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning**

### **Addysg Bellach Further Education**

**C1 Alun Ffred Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar addysg bellach? (OAQ38313)

**Q1 Alun Ffred Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on further education? (OAQ38313)

**C3 Alun Ffred Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar gyllideb addysg bellach Gymraeg? (OAQ38312)

**Q3 Alun Ffred Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on the Welsh-medium further education budget? (OAQ38312)

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Mae addysg bellach yng Nghymru yn parhau i fod yn rhan bwysig o gynlluniau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i wneud Cymru'n wlad sy'n dysgu. Mae'r gyllideb ddrafft a gyhoeddwyd, yn dangos y bydd cynnydd o ryw 5 y cant yn llinell sylfaen ELWa y flwyddyn nesaf, a fydd yn ei alluogi i ddatblygu darpariaeth graidd ymhellach yn unol ag anghenion dysgwyr. Bydd hyn yn gysylltiedig â'r broses o gyflwyno system gynllunio a chyllido newydd.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** Further education in Wales continues to be a major part of the Assembly Government's plans to make Wales a learning country. As the published draft budget shows, ELWa's baseline will increase by around 5 per cent next year, which will enable it to further develop core provision in line with learners' needs. This will be linked to the roll-out of its new planning and funding system.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Gan fod y Llywodraeth, yr wythnos hon, wedi cyhoeddi ei chyllideb am y tair blynedd nesaf, a oes gan y Gweinidog unrhyw gynlluniau i osod cyllideb fynegol tair blynedd ar gyfer ELWa er mwyn sicrhau dilyniant mewn addysg ôl 16 oed?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** As the Government has published its three-year budget this week, does the Minister have any plans to set a three-year indicative budget for ELWa in order to secure continuity in post-16 education?

**Jane Davidson:** Y dyraniad ychwanegol ar gyfer ELWa y flwyddyn nesaf yw 6 y cant, a 6 y cant eto y flwyddyn ddilynol. Felly, rhoddir 5 y cant yn y flwyddyn gyntaf, 6 y cant yn yr ail flwyddyn, a 6 y cant yn y drydedd flwyddyn.

**Jane Davidson:** The additional allocation for ELWa next year is 6 per cent, and 6 per cent in the subsequent year. Therefore, 5 per cent will be allocated in the first year, 6 per cent in the second, and 6 per cent in the third year.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Bydd nifer o golegau addysg bellach mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn gweld crebachu ar eu cyllid dan fformiwla arfaethedig ELWa. A ydych yn cydnabod bod costau gwirioneddol ychwanegol yn wynebu colegau megis Coleg Meirion-Dwyfor, yn fy etholaeth i, oherwydd natur wasgaredig y boblogaeth a'r ffaith ei fod yn cynnig cwricwlwm gwirioneddol ddwyieithog?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'r fformiwla y mae ELWa yn ei defnyddio yn cydnabod elfen yr iaith Gymraeg. Gofynnais yn benodol i ELWa sicrhau bod y Gymraeg yn cael y cydbwysedd cywir yn y trefniadau newydd. Mae'n bwysig bod pob gweithgaredd dysgu yn cael cyllideb yn arbennig i'r pwnc, a bod y gweithgaredd hefyd yn cynorthwyo'r dysgwr. Gall y darparwyr, megis y colegau, drefnu'r gyllideb yn llawn drwy roi rhan o'r gyllideb i gyrsiau llai a rhan i gyrsiau mwy. Bydd y croesffrwythloni sy'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd yn bosibl yn y dyfodol hefyd.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** O safbwynt colegau addysg bellach, cyhoeddwyd y bydd ELWa yn penodi am y tro cyntaf lywodraethwr allanol i fwrdd llywodraethu coleg addysg bellach. Gan fod llawer o golegau addysg bellach yn wynebu diffygion yn eu cyllidebau eleni, sawl penodiad arall y gallwn ei ddisgwyl yn ystod yr wythnosau nesaf?

**Jane Davidson:** Nifer fach o golegau yng Nghymru sy'n wynebu trafferthion gyda'u cyllidebau. Tri choleg yn unig sy'n wynebu'r fath drafferth yng Nghymru gyfan. Ar hyn o bryd, un coleg sy'n gweld yr un camau ag a gymerwyd o safbwynt ELWa. Mae'n bosibl y bydd un arall hefyd. Y peth pwysicaf i Aelodau'r Cynulliad yw mai ni yw gwarcheidwaid arian Cymru. Bydd rhaid inni weithio gyda'n gilydd i sicrhau y caiff yr arian ei wario'n gywir.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Y gwir amdani, Weinidog, yw nad y colegau sydd wedi gofyn am y penodiad hwn. Fe'i gorfodwyd arnynt gan ELWa. Yr hyn a ddywed y colegau bach yw, nad yw'r setliad ariannol yn ddigon i sicrhau eu bod yn gallu darparu ystod eang o bynciau mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Dywedant

**Alun Ffred Jones:** A number of further education colleges in rural areas will see a contraction of their budget under the proposed ELWa formula. Do you acknowledge that there are additional real costs facing colleges such as Coleg Meirion-Dwyfor, in my constituency, because of the scattered nature of the population and the fact that it offers a truly bilingual curriculum?

**Jane Davidson:** The formula that ELWa utilises acknowledges the Welsh language element. I specifically requested that ELWa ensures that the adequate weighting is given for the Welsh language in the new arrangements. It is important that every learning activity has a specified budget line a also supports the learner. The providers, such as the colleges, are able to organise their own budgets by allocating some of the budget to small courses and others to larger courses. Cross-fertilization, which already occurs, will also be possible in the future.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** In respect of further education colleges, it has been announced that ELWa is to appoint an external governor to a further education college board of governors for the first time. Since a number of further education colleges are facing shortfalls in their budgets this year, how many more appointments can we expect during the next few weeks?

**Jane Davidson:** Only a small number of colleges in Wales are facing serious budgetary problems. In Wales, only three are in this situation and one of those is currently seeing these actions taken by ELWa. It is possible that one further college will face the same action. The most important point for Assembly Members is that we are the guardians of funding for Wales and we must work together to ensure that that funding is spent appropriately.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** The fact of the matter, Minister, is that it is not the colleges that have sought this appointment. It was forced upon them by ELWa. The smaller colleges say that the financial settlement is not sufficient to ensure the provision of a wide range of courses in rural areas. They say that

fod eisiau mwy o arian arnynt yn hytrach na mwy o lywodraethwyr.

**Jane Davidson:** Y mae nifer fach o golegau'n wynebu problemau mwy elfennol na'r rhai a restrwyd gennych. Bydd rhaid inni sicrhau bod arian ar gyfer colegau yn cael ei wario'n iawn.

**Nick Bourne:** You mentioned that only three colleges are in serious financial straits. All three further education colleges in mid Wales had an operating deficit in 2002-03. The figures for this year are not yet available, but Coleg Powys has prepared a deficit budget for 2004-05. Alun Ffred already referred to the extra cost of bilingualism, but there is also a sparsity factor. Staff and governors are worried that ELWa's national planning and funding system will lead to a further cap on resources. What reassurances can you give to those three colleges?

**Jane Davidson:** The majority of our colleges are in relatively good financial health in the sense that ELWa is not worried about making its auditable governance statement on its long-term financial health. Only a small number of colleges are categorised by ELWa as category D, which means that they are either facing serious financial difficulty in the next two years or have been in serious financial difficulty and have not yet evidenced in their latest audited financial statements that they are in the process of recovery. There is a very small number in that category. Only when you are in that category are special measures taken.

On other colleges, as I said to Alun Ffred Jones, we are looking at a 5 per cent increase in ELWa's budget for the coming financial year and a 6 per cent increase in the budget for the following financial years, which is well above inflation.

**Nick Bourne:** I heard you say that, and you may choose to use the definition, 'serious' financial difficulty, but the three colleges in mid Wales are in financial difficulty. You talk about an increase in ELWa's budget, but the indicative figures that it published show a

they need more funding rather than more governors.

**Jane Davidson:** A small number of colleges face more fundamental problems than those that you outlined. We must ensure that money for colleges is spent correctly.

**Nick Bourne:** Bu ichi sôn mai dim ond tri choleg sy'n wynebu trafferthion ariannol difrifol. Yr oedd diffyg gweithredol gan y tri choleg addysg bellach yn y Canolbarth yn 2002-03. Nid yw'r ffigurau ar gyfer eleni ar gael eto, ond mae Coleg Powys wedi paratoi cyllideb ddiffyg ar gyfer 2004-05. Cyfeiriodd Alun Ffred eisoes at gost ychwanegol dwyieithrwydd, ond rhaid ystyried teneurwydd y boblogaeth hefyd. Mae staff a llywodraethwyr yn pryderu y bydd system gynllunio a chyllido genedlaethol ELWa yn arwain at ostyngiad pellach mewn adnoddau. Pa sicrwydd y gallwch ei roi i'r tri choleg hynny?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae sefyllfa ariannol mwyafrif ein colegau yn gymharol dda yn yr ystyr nad yw ELWa yn pryderu am wneud ei ddatganiad llywodraethu archwiliadwy ar ei sefyllfa ariannol hirdymor. Dim ond nifer fach o golegau sydd wedi'i gosod yng nghategori D gan ELWa, sy'n golygu naill ai y byddant yn wynebu trafferthion ariannol difrifol yn ystod y ddwy flynedd nesaf neu eu bod wedi bod mewn trafferthion ariannol difrifol ac nad ydynt wedi dangos eto yn eu datganiadau ariannol archwiliedig diweddaraf fod y sefyllfa yn gwella. Nifer fach iawn sydd yn y categori hwnnw. Dim ond pan fyddwch yn y categori hwnnw y cymerir camau arbennig.

O ran colegau eraill, fel y dywedais wrth Alun Ffred Jones, mae cynnydd o 5 y cant yng nghyllideb ELWa ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf a chynnydd o 6 y cant yn y gyllideb ar gyfer y blynnyddoedd ariannol dilynol, sy'n llawer uwch na chwyddiant.

**Nick Bourne:** Fe'ch clywais yn dweud hynny, ac efallai y byddwch yn dewis defnyddio'r diffiniad, trafferthion ariannol 'difrifol', ond mae'r tri choleg yn y Canolbarth mewn trafferthion ariannol. Yr ydych yn sôn am gynnydd yng nghyllideb

£500,000 reduction in allocation for Powys local education authority and Coleg Powys, which is causing concern and is bound to impair the quality of education at that college. I return to my specific question: what reassurance can you give to the three further education colleges in mid Wales?

**Jane Davidson:** The reassurance that I will give this Assembly is that the colleges that will do well in Wales are those that manage their business well and do not just rely on the recurrent funding mechanism money in terms of the allocation for their pupils, but also undertake work-based learning activity and adult and community education activity and colleges, which, when benchmarked against each other, demonstrate that they are good value in terms of public funding. The whole point of the national planning and funding mechanism is to ensure that we have a level playing field across all providers that is based on learners so that they can get the best learning.

**Christine Gwyther:** Do you agree that a vital aspect of the ASPB merger is to ensure not only that we have clarity of policy from now on, but clarity of funding?

**Jane Davidson:** I agree.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Clywais eich sylwadau ond mae argyfwng yn rhai o golegau llai y Gogledd. Felly, os oes argyfwng cyffredinol, sut y cânt ddigon o arian i weithredu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg?

**Jane Davidson:** You need to return to the dictionary definition of 'crisis'. That word is used a great deal in the Chamber. We have put in place funding ahead of inflation in our colleges year-on-year-on-year. By the time we reach 2007, the budget for education and lifelong learning in the Assembly will have risen by 99 per cent since 1999. That is the kind of investment that this Government is making and we have many more learners as a result. However, it is important that ELWa, and subsequently the Assembly, can benchmark the colleges' activity to ensure that we all get best value for money and

ELWa, ond dengys y ffigurau dangosol a gyhoeddodd ostyngiad o £500,000 yn y dyraniad ar gyfer awdurdod addysg lleol Powys a Choleg Powys, sy'n peri pryder ac yn sicr o amharu ar ansawdd yr addysg yn y coleg hwnnw. Dychwelaf at fy nghwestiwn penodol: pa sicrwydd y gallwch ei roi i'r tri choleg addysg bellach yn y Canolbarth?

**Jane Davidson:** Y sicrwydd a roddaf i'r Cynulliad hwn yw mai'r colegau a fydd yn gwneud yn dda yng Nghymru fydd y rhai sy'n rheoli eu busnes yn dda ac nad ydynt yn dibynnu'n gyfan gwbl ar yr arian a ddaw o'r dull cyllido rheolaidd drwy'r dyraniad ar gyfer eu disgyblion, ond sydd hefyd yn ymgymryd â gweithgarwch dysgu seiliedig ar waith a gweithgarwch addysg oedolion a chymunedol a cholegau sy'n dangos eu bod yn rhoi gwerth da am arian cyhoeddus pan gânt eu meincodi yn erbyn ei gilydd. Diben y dull cynllunio a chyllido cenedlaethol yw sicrhau chwarae teg i bob darparwr, a hynny'n seiliedig ar ddysgwyr er mwyn sicrhau y cânt y cyfleoedd dysgu gorau.

**Christine Gwyther:** A gytunwch mai un o'r agweddau hollbwysig ar y dasg o uno'r CCNC yw sicrhau bod gennym eglurder o ran cyllido o hyn ymlaen, yn ogystal ag eglurder o ran polisi?

**Jane Davidson:** Cytunaf.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I heard your comments, but there is also a crisis in some smaller colleges in north Wales. Therefore, if there is a general crisis, how will they secure sufficient funding to operate through the medium of Welsh?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae angen ichi droi at eiriadur i gael diffiniad o 'argyfwng'. Defnyddir y gair hwnnw yn aml iawn yn y Siambr. Yr ydym wedi neilltuo cyllid uwchlaw chwyddiant yn ein colegau bob blwyddyn. Erbyn inni gyrraedd 2007, bydd y gyllideb ar gyfer addysg a dysgu gydol oes yn y Cynulliad wedi codi 99 y cant ers 1999. Dyna'r math o fuddsoddiad y mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn ei wneud ac mae llawer mwy o ddysgwyr gennym o ganlyniad i hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig y gall ELWa, ac wedyn y Cynulliad, feincodi gweithgarwch y colegau er mwyn sicrhau y

learning delivered.

caiff pob un ohonom y gwerth gorau am arian ac y cyflwynir cyfleoedd dysgu.

3.00 p.m.

**Leighton Andrews:** Coleg Morgannwg has approached me about the implications of the national funding and planning system for its budget in the next year or so. It believes that it may lose over £600,000, whereas other colleges, allegedly in more rural areas, may be gaining to the tune of £1 million. Will you undertake to look at the national funding and planning system to ensure that there is no discrimination against colleges working in socially deprived communities?

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae Coleg Morgannwg wedi cysylltu â mi ynghylch goblygiadau y system gynllunio a chyllido genedlaethol i'w gyllideb yn y blynyddoedd nesaf. Cred y gallai golli dros £600,000, ond y gallai colegau eraill, mewn ardaloedd mwy gwledig yn ôl y sôn, gael £1 filiwn yn ychwanegol. A wnewch chi addo ystyried y system gynllunio a chyllido genedlaethol er mwyn sicrhau na wahaniaethir yn erbyn colegau sy'n gweithio mewn cymunedau cymdeithasol-ddifreintiedig?

**Jane Davidson:** The national planning and funding system will contain weightings in terms of deprivation, the Welsh language and sparsity. We are still looking at the final detail, and I have stated that I want to be satisfied that the formula is fair across the whole of Wales and takes account of the specific issues in different parts of Wales. It is important to point out that change will be introduced in a carefully managed way and, in the first year of transition, in 2005-06, all providers can expect to operate on the same funding levels as at present in real terms, provided the numbers of learners do not fall. Let us be honest about that. We are providing the funding as we move from system to another.

**Jane Davidson:** Bydd y system gynllunio a chyllido genedlaethol yn cynnwys pwysoliadau i ystyried amddifadedd, y Gymraeg a theneurwydd poblogaeth. Yr ydym yn parhau i ystyried y manylion terfynol, ac yr wyf wedi dweud fy mod am sicrhau bod y fformiwla yn deg i Gymru gyfan ac yn ystyried y materion penodol mewn rhannau gwahanol o Gymru. Mae'n bwysig nodi y caiff newid ei gyflwyno mewn ffordd a reolir yn ofalus ac, yn y flwyddyn drosglwyddo gyntaf, yn 2005-06, gall pob darparwr ddisgwyl gweithredu gyda'r un lefelau cyllido ag ar hyn o bryd mewn termau real, ar yr amod nad yw nifer y dysgwyr yn gostwng. Gadewch inni fod yn onest am hynny. Darparwn y cyllid wrth inni drosglwyddo o un system i'r llall.

**Peter Black:** There is a difference between special measures and the proper funding of further education colleges. As over half of those colleges have a deficit, will you give a guarantee that the increased funding to ELWa will tackle those colleges' deficit in the next few years?

**Peter Black:** Mae gwahaniaeth rhwng mesurau arbennig a chyllido colegau addysg bellach yn briodol. Am fod diffyg gan dros hanner y colegau hynny, a sicrhewch y bydd y cyllid ychwanegol a roddir i ELWa yn mynd i'r afael â diffyg y colegau hynny yn yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf?

**Jane Davidson:** Colleges are autonomous bodies, Peter. They are run by their own governing bodies. We have put increased funding into colleges and staff of colleges in Wales benefit from a pay agreement, in which 100 per cent of colleges are participating. I am informed by the National Association of Teachers in Further Education that only around 17 per cent of colleges in England benefit from such an agreement. We

**Jane Davidson:** Mae colegau yn gyrrff hunanlywodraethol, Peter. Cânt eu rhedeg gan eu cyrff llywodraethu eu hunain. Yr ydym wedi rhoi mwy o arian i golegau ac mae staff colegau yng Nghymru yn manteisio ar gytundeb cyflogau, y mae pob un o'r colegau yn rhan ohono. Fe'm hysbyswyd gan Gymdeithas Genedlaethol Athrawon mewn Addysg Bellach mai dim ond tua 17 y cant o golegau yn Lloegr sy'n rhan o gytundeb o'r

support our staff well in Wales. This was a commitment of the previous Post-16 Education and Training Committee, and it is vital that we carry it on.

fath. Rhoddwn gymorth da i'n staff yng Nghymru. Yr oedd hwn yn un o ymrwymiadau'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 blaenorol, ac mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn cynnal yr ymrwymiad hwnnw.

### **Ymweliadau Addysgol a Gweithgareddau Allgwricwlar Educational Visits and Extra-curricular Activities**

**Q2 Laura Anne Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on out-of-school educational visits and extra-curricular activities? (OAQ38345)

**Jane Davidson:** Educational visits are an important part of the school curriculum and extra-curricular activities are an important supplement. Young people can benefit enormously from taking part in visits and other activities with their schools.

**Laura Anne Jones:** School trips and visits provide some of the most memorable and enriching experiences for children and young people. However, it has been well-documented that many schools do not take children on visits that include outdoor activities for fear of litigation were an accident to occur. Are you concerned that schools take the view that the risks of accidents outweigh the benefits of activities, and how are you addressing that issue?

**Jane Davidson:** I would be disappointed if schools across the board took that view, but I know that they do not. Many schools are undertaking many activities, and, like you, I believe that it is an important enrichment agenda.

**Christine Gwyther:** Will you join me in congratulating schools from across my constituency which took part in the launch—in which you were good enough to help—of the children's university of mid and west Wales this week? It is important that children and young people are able to display their extra-curricular activities, which do not just take place behind the bike sheds, but in orchestras, sport and all kinds of activities, in readiness for their future life.

**C2 Laura Anne Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ymweliadau addysgol y tu allan i'r ysgol ynghyd â gweithgareddau allgwricwlar? (OAQ38345)

**Jane Davidson:** Mae ymweliadau addysgol yn rhan bwysig o'r cwricwlwm ysgol ac mae gweithgareddau allgwricwlar yn bwysig wrth ychwanegu at hynny. Gall pobl ifanc gael budd mawr o gymryd rhan mewn ymweliadau a gweithgareddau eraill gyda'u hysgolion.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Mae teithiau ac ymweliadau ysgol yn rhoi rhai o'r profiadau mwyaf cofiadwy a mwyaf cyfoethog i blant a phobl ifanc. Fodd bynnag, mae'n hysbys bod llawer o ysgolion yn dewis peidio â mynd â'u plant ar ymweliadau sy'n cynnwys gweithgareddau awyr agored gan fod arnynt ofn wynebu achos o ymgyfreitha pe bai damwain yn digwydd. A bryderwch fod ysgolion o'r farn bod y risg o ddamweiniau yn bwysicach na manteision y gweithgareddau, a sut yr ydych yn ymdrin â'r mater hwnnw?

**Jane Davidson:** Byddwn yn siomedig pa bai ysgolion yn gyffredinol yn coleddu'r farn honno, ond gwn nad yw hynny'n wir. Mae llawer o ysgolion yn ymgymryd â llawer o weithgareddau, ac, fel chithau, credaf fod hon yn agenda gyfoethogi bwysig.

**Christine Gwyther:** A ymunwch â mi i longyfarch ysgolion ledled fy etholaeth a gymerodd ran yn yr achlysur—yr oeddech mor garedig â chynorthwyo ynddo—i lansio prifysgol y plant yn y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin yr wythnos hon? Mae'n bwysig y gall plant a phobl ifanc ddangos y gweithgareddau allgwricwlar y cymerant ran ynddynt, nad ydynt ond yn digwydd y tu ôl i'r cytiau beiciau, ond mewn cerddorfeydd, chwaraeon a phob math o weithgareddau, i'w

paratoi ar gyfer y dyfodol.

**Jane Davidson:** Carmarthenshire, Pembrokeshire and Ceredigion local authorities have joined the new mid and west Wales children's university, which will provide a range of enriched activities in and outside school. That model already exists in Cardiff and Wrexham and I am keen to see it extended across Wales.

**Jane Davidson:** Mae awdurdodau lleol sir Gaerfyrddin, sir Benfro a Cheredigion wedi ymuno â phrifysgol newydd y plant yn y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin, a fydd yn darparu amrywiaeth o weithgareddau cyfoethocach yn yr ysgol a'r tu allan iddi. Mae'r model hwnnw yn bodoli eisoes yng Nghaerdydd a Wrecsam ac yr wyf yn awyddus iddo gael ei ymestyn ledled Cymru.

### **Brecwastau am Ddim yn yr Ysgol (Cost) Free School Breakfasts (Cost)**

**Q4 David Davies:** What is the estimated cost of the free school breakfast pilot project? (OAQ38376)

**C4 David Davies:** Beth yw'r amcangyfrif o gost y prosiect peilot i ddarparu brecwast am ddim mewn ysgolion? (OAQ38376)

**Jane Davidson:** The Finance Minister has previously announced that up to £1.5 million will be available in 2004-05 from end-of-year flexibility to cover the anticipated costs of the pilot this year. The draft budget includes a baseline of £3.5 million in 2005-06, rising to £8.5 million in 2007-08. When we have evidence on future costs, we will be able to revisit the funding levels.

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'r Gweinidog Cyllid wedi cyhoeddi'n flaenorol y bydd hyd at £1.5 miliwn ar gael yn 2004-05 o'r hyblygrwydd diwedd blwyddyn i dalu am gostau disgwylidig y prosiect peilot eleni. Mae'r gyllideb ddrafft yn cynnwys llinell sylfaen o £3.5 miliwn yn 2005-06, gan godi i £8.5 miliwn yn 2007-08. Pan fydd tystiolaeth gennym o gostau yn y dyfodol, gallwn ailystyried y lefelau cyllido.

**David Davies:** It is over two years now since you made a manifesto commitment to free school breakfasts across the board. You now have some costs for the pilot project, but it still appears that you have no idea how much your manifesto commitment will cost. When are we likely to have costings on this? When will you start adding up how much money it will take to implement the manifesto promises that you made to the people of Wales before being elected?

**David Davies:** Gwnaethoch ymrwymiad yn eich maniffesto dros ddwy flynedd yn ôl bellach i gyflwyno brecwastau am ddim ym mhob ysgol gynradd. Mae gennych rai costau ar gyfer y prosiect peilot erbyn hyn, ond ymddengys nad oes syniad gennych faint y bydd yr ymrwymiad yn eich maniffesto yn ei gostio. Pryd yr ydym yn debygol o weld y costau ar gyfer hyn? Pryd y byddwch yn dechrau cyfrifo faint o arian y bydd ei angen i wireddu'r addewidion a wnaethoch yn eich maniffesto i bobl Cymru cyn cael eich ethol?

**Jane Davidson:** You seem to know a lot about our manifesto, apart from the important detail that this commitment is to be met by 2007. Therefore, this commitment will take account of this comprehensive spending review. The pilots are just starting and, unlike you, we like to work on the basis of evidence. When we have that evidence, we will bring it to the Assembly.

**Jane Davidson:** Ymddengys eich bod yn gwybod llawer am ein maniffesto, ar wahân i'r manylyn pwysig mai erbyn 2007 y bwriedir cyflawni'r ymrwymiad hwn. Felly, bydd yr ymrwymiad hwn yn ystyried yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr hwn o wariant. Mae'r prosiectau peilot ar fin dechrau ac, yn wahanol i chi, yr ydym yn hoffi gweithio ar sail tystiolaeth. Pan fydd y dystiolaeth honno gennym, byddwn yn ei chyflwyno gerbron y Cynulliad.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Do you agree that this policy of free school breakfasts can not only be measured in terms of cash, but in terms of benefits, and that improved learning by the pupils who will benefit from these free breakfasts, and the reduction in truancy rates, will more than justify any expenditure?

**Jane Davidson:** The reason that we included this pledge in our manifesto was that successful breakfast schemes in schools had demonstrated positive attitudinal changes—evidence that contributed to our manifesto commitment. We know that with such schemes come improved attendance and behaviour, fewer discipline problems, and greater sustained concentration. These are the benefits that this policy will bring.

**Janet Ryder:** I take you back to the point that David Davies raised on the cost of this commitment. I have a written response from you that shows that you had no idea about the costs of providing free school breakfasts, which you confirmed today by what you said, namely that you are still waiting for the costs of those pilots and you do not know what the eventual cost will be. How many of your other election pledges have you not costed? Have you costed the pledge not to introduce top-up fees until 2007, yes or no? If the answer is 'yes', will you please publish the figures as you have been asked to do many times before, for the rest of the Assembly to see?

**Jane Davidson:** I say to you, as I have said many times before, we work on the basis of evidence. The Rees commission is undertaking to provide that evidence basis for us at the moment. We will bring an interim report on the student top-up fees issues to the Assembly in February next year, with the final report in April. I stand by the answer that I gave to David.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Do you agree that you cannot put a price on children having a healthy start to their learning day? It will

**Jeff Cuthbert:** A gytunwch y gellir mesur y polisi hwn o roi brecwastau am ddim yn yr ysgol nid dim ond o ran arian parod, ond o ran y manteision, ac y bydd y dysgu gwell gan y disgyblion a fydd yn elwa ar y brecwastau hyn am ddim, a'r gostyngiad mewn cyfraddau triwantiaeth, yn cyfiawnhau unrhyw wariant?

**Jane Davidson:** Y rheswm inni gynnwys yr addewid honno yn ein maniffesto oedd bod cynlluniau brecwast llwyddiannus mewn ysgolion wedi arwain at newidiadau cadarnhaol mewn agweddau—tystiolaeth a gyfrannodd at yr ymrwymiad yn ein maniffesto. Gwyddom y gall cynlluniau o'r fath arwain at bresenoldeb ac ymddygiad gwell, llai o broblemau disgyblaeth, a'r gallu i ganolbwyntio'n barhaus yn well. Dyma'r manteision a ddaw yn sgîl y polisi hwn.

**Janet Ryder:** Dychwelaf at y pwynt a gododd David Davies ar gost yr ymrwymiad hwn. Cefais ymateb ysgrifenedig gennych sy'n dangos nad oedd unrhyw syniad gennych ynghylch costau rhoi brecwastau am ddim mewn ysgolion, a chadarnhawyd hynny gennych heddiw gan yr hyn a ddywedwyd gennych, sef eich bod yn parhau i aros am gostau'r prosiectau peilot hynny ac na wyddoch beth fydd y costau yn y pen draw. Sawl addewid arall a wnaethoch cyn yr etholiad nad ydych wedi'u prisio? A ydych wedi prisio'r addewid i beidio â chyflwyno ffioedd ychwanegol tan 2007, do ynteu naddo? Os gwnaethoch chi hynny, a wnewch chi gyhoeddi'r ffigurau fel y gofynnwyd ichi ei wneud droeon o'r blaen, er mwyn i weddill y Cynulliad eu gweld?

**Jane Davidson:** Dywedaf wrthy'ch, fel y dywedais droeon o'r blaen, ein bod yn gweithio ar sail tystiolaeth. Mae comisiwn Rees wrthi'n gwneud gwaith i ddarparu'r dystiolaeth honno inni ar hyn o bryd. Byddwn yn cyflwyno adroddiad interim ar ffioedd ychwanegol i fyfyrwyr gerbron y Cynulliad ym mis Chwefror y flwyddyn nesaf, a chaiff yr adroddiad terfynol ei gyflwyno ym mis Ebrill. Glynaf wrth yr ateb a roddais i David.

**Lorraine Barrett:** A gytunwch na allwch roi pris ar sicrhau bod plant yn dechrau eu diwrnod dysgu mewn ffordd iach? Bydd yn



ensure that they remain alert throughout the morning and bring about all the benefits that were mentioned by Jeff Cuthbert.

**Jane Davidson:** I agree that the value is priceless, but, as a Minister, I must put a price on it. Therefore, I will make sure that that information is available. [*Interruption.*]

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. We are running late; we have a five-minute deadline to get through this item of business. The Minister must be heard because she is answering questions from Assembly Members. The fact that some Assembly Members do not want to hear the answer does not mean that I or other Members do not. Therefore, I ask for a bit of quiet.

sicrhau eu bod yn effro drwy'r bore a daw'r manteision a grybwyllwyd gan Jeff Cuthbert yn ei sgîl.

**Jane Davidson:** Cytunaf fod y gwerth yn amhrisiadwy, ond, fel Gweinidog, rhaid imi roi pris arno. Felly, sicrhaf fod y wybodaeth honno ar gael. [*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Yr ydym yn rhedeg yn hwyr. Mae gennym bum munud yn weddill ar gwestiynau i'r Gweinidog. Rhaid i'r Gweinidog gael ei chlywed am ei bod yn ateb cwestiynau gan Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Nid yw'r ffaith nad yw rhai Aelodau Cynulliad am glywed yr atebion yn golygu nad wyf fi nac Aelodau eraill am eu clywed. Felly, gofynnaf ichi fod yn dawel.

### **Darpariaeth Cyfrwng Cymraeg mewn Prifysgolion Welsh-medium Provision in Universities**

**C5 Elin Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ynglŷn â'r ddarpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg mewn prifysgolion? (OAQ38310)

**Jane Davidson:** Yr wyf yn hapus gyda'r cynnydd sy'n cael ei wneud yn y maes pwysig hwn. Mae grŵp llywio cenedlaethol Andrew Green, a sefydlwyd gan Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru, wedi cynhyrchu ei strategaeth ddrafft ar gyfer darpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg mewn addysg uwch. Yr wyf yn disgwyl derbyn argymhellion y grŵp erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn. Yn ddiweddar, cyhoeddodd CCAUC raglen o bum cymrawd addysgu llwyddiannus ar gyfer 2004-05. Mae hyn yn adeiladu ar lwyddiant y fenter addysgu cyfrwng Cymraeg a gyflwynwyd yn 2003-04.

**Elin Jones:** Gostyngodd y canran o'ch cyllideb addysg uwch oedd i'w wario'n benodol ar addysg uwch cyfrwng Cymraeg yn 2003-04, o'i chymharu â 2002-03. A ydych yn bwriadu cynyddu'r ganran hon yn y blynnyddoedd nesaf er mwyn cyrraedd eich targed o 7 y cant o fyfyrwyr yn astudio drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg erbyn 2010—targed yr ydych yn bell ohono ar hyn o bryd?

**Q5 Elin Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement regarding Welsh-medium provision in universities? (OAQ38310)

**Jane Davidson:** I am pleased with the progress that is being made in this important area. Andrew Green's national steering group, established by the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales, has produced its draft strategy for Welsh-medium provision in higher education. I expect to receive the group's recommendations by the end of this year. HEFCW has also recently announced a programme of five successful teaching fellows for 2004-05. This builds on the success of the Welsh-medium teaching initiative introduced in 2003-04.

**Elin Jones:** The percentage of your higher education budget that was to be spent specifically on Welsh-medium higher education decreased in 2003-04, compared with 2002-03. Do you intend to increase that percentage in the years to come in order to meet your target of 7 per cent of students studying through the medium of Welsh by 2010—a target that is out of reach at the moment?

3.10 p.m.

**Jane Davidson:** Credaf y byddai'n

**Jane Davidson:** I believe that it would be

ddefnyddiol ichi ddarllen y strategaeth ddrafft ac ysgrifennu ataf ynghylch y targedau ynddi. Er hynny, mae'r strategaeth yn dweud nad yw'n siŵr am y premiwm cyfrwng Cymraeg ar hyn o bryd ac a yw'r system yn gwella ac ati. Dywedais innau fod arian ar gael yn y gyllideb gydweithredu i annog mwy o bobl i weithio ar y cyd. Mae arian ar gael, felly, os bydd y strategaeth yn un dda. Ymgynghorwyd ar y strategaeth tan 15 Medi, ac wedi i CCAUC gytuno ar y strategaeth, fe ddaw yn ôl ataf i i'w hystyried yn yr hydref.

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn trafod cynllun Andrew Green. A gawn ni drafod yr adroddiad yn y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes cyn hir?

**Jane Davidson:** Wedi i CCAUC gytuno ar yr adroddiad, bydd yn bosibl inni ddod ag ef gerbron y pwyllgor am ei farn.

**Alun Cairns:** Are you worried about the likely fall in demand for Welsh-medium higher education, which will arise because the sixth-form funding formula will lead to the demise of sixth forms, forcing pupils into further education or sixth-form colleges that predominantly teach through the medium of English?

**Jane Davidson:** Since there is only one sixth-form college in Wales, and it does not teach through the medium of Welsh, I think your hypothesis unlikely. I am not worried because your hypothesis is wrong.

useful for you to read the draft strategy and write to me about the targets therein. However, the strategy states that it is unsure about the Welsh-medium premium at present and whether the system is improving and so on. I have said that funding is available through the collaboration budget to encourage more people to co-operate. The money is, therefore, available if the strategy is a good one. The strategy was out for consultation until 15 September, and once HEFCW has agreed on the strategy, it will return to me for consideration in the autumn.

**Leighton Andrews:** It is important that we discuss Andrew Green's strategy. Will we have an opportunity to discuss the report in the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee in the near future?

**Jane Davidson:** Once HEFCW has agreed on the report, it will be possible to bring it before the committee for its consideration.

**Alun Cairns:** A ydych yn pryderu ynghylch y gostyngiad tebygol yn y galw am addysg uwch cyfrwng Cymraeg, a ddaw yn sgîl y ffaith y bydd y fformiwla cyllido ar gyfer darpariaeth chweched dosbarth yn arwain at derfynu'r ddarpariaeth honno, gan orfodi disgyblion i fynd i golegau addysg bellach neu chweched dosbarth sy'n addysgu drwy gyfrwng y Saesneg yn bennaf?

**Jane Davidson:** Am mai dim ond un coleg chweched dosbarth sydd yng Nghymru, ac nad yw'n addysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, credaf fod eich damcaniaeth yn annhebygol. Ni phryderaf am fod eich damcaniaeth yn anghywir.

### **Lwfans Cynhaliaeth Addysg Newydd The New Education Maintenance Allowance**

**Q6 Rosemary Butler:** How many Welsh students have applied for the new education maintenance allowance? (OAQ38365)

**Jane Davidson:** Students in Wales have only been able to apply for the education maintenance allowance since mid September. Information on the number of eligible applicants will not be available until mid-November.

**C6 Rosemary Butler:** Faint o fyfyrwyr Cymru sydd wedi gwneud cais am y lwfans cynhaliaeth addysg newydd? (OAQ38365)

**Jane Davidson:** Dim ond ers canol mis Medi y bu'n bosibl i fyfyrwyr yng Nghymru wneud cais am y lwfans cynhaliaeth addysg. Ni fydd gwybodaeth ar nifer yr ymgeiswyr cymwys ar gael tan ganol mis Tachwedd.

**Rosemary Butler:** It will be interesting to see how many students apply because I have quite a number in my constituency who are thrilled to bits to get this money. Of course, 17-year-olds are missing out, and they complain quite bitterly that they do not receive this allowance. One aspect that worries me is the ease of acquiring this grant. Can you assure us that there will be support for staff to ensure that students who apply for the grant get it easily?

**Jane Davidson:** It is a UK-wide scheme that operates in exactly the same way across the whole of the United Kingdom. I can assure you that, in the pilot scheme in England, they found that it was worth paying an administrative charge to schools and colleges with more than 10 EMA students, and that is budgeted for in the additional funding—because this is additional funding that we have been given by Gordon Brown—for the delivery of this scheme.

**David Melding:** Is it not strange that the Government gives with one hand and takes with the other? Do you not think that we should look at student support comprehensively?

**Jane Davidson:** I am slightly confused as to how we are taking from the 16-year-olds; I thought that we were just giving. We are giving them more opportunities—we already have more young people staying in learning in Wales at 16 years of age than in England. Also, in England, the new EMA was found to generate a substantial increase of nearly six percentage points, particularly among young men and those who are entitled to the full EMA. This Government is demonstrating a clear social justice agenda, and it is a giving agenda.

**Kirsty Williams:** It is not actually correct to say that the scheme operates in the same way in England and Wales because, as you know, 17-year-olds in parts of England are eligible for education maintenance allowances. Does it not seem particularly unfair that 16-year-olds have a source of funding and 18-year-olds have a source of funding in some

**Rosemary Butler:** Bydd yn ddiddorol gweld faint o fyfyrwyr sy'n gwneud cais gan fod nifer eithaf mawr yn fy etholaeth i sydd wrth eu bodd o gael yr arian hwn. Wrth gwrs, ni all llawer o bobl ifanc 17 mlwydd oed ei gael, ac maent yn cwyno'n eithaf hallt na chânt y lwfans hwn. Un agwedd sy'n fy mhryderu yw pa mor hawdd yw cael y grant hwn. A allwch ein sicrhau y bydd cymorth i staff er mwyn sicrhau bod myfyrwyr sy'n gwneud cais am y grant yn ei gael yn hawdd?

**Jane Davidson:** Cynllun i'r DU gyfan ydyw sy'n gweithredu yn yr un ffordd yn union ledled y Deyrnas Unedig gyfan. Gallaf eich sicrhau, yn y cynllun peilot yn Lloegr, iddynt weld ei bod yn werth talu tâl gweinyddol i ysgolion a cholegau sydd â mwy na 10 o fyfyrwyr sy'n cael y lwfans cynhaliaeth addysg, a chlustnodir arian ar gyfer hynny yn y cyllid ychwanegol—am mai cyllid ychwanegol a roddwyd inni gan Gordon Brown yw hwn—i gyflwyno'r cynllun hwn.

**David Melding:** Onid yw'n rhyfedd bod y Llywodraeth yn rhoi arian gydag un llaw ac yn ei dynnu'n ôl gyda'r llaw arall? Oni chredwch y dylem ystyried cymorth i fyfyrwyr mewn ffordd gynhwysfawr?

**Jane Davidson:** Yr wyf wedi drysu ychydig o ran sut yr ydym yn tynnu arian oddi wrth bobl ifanc 16 mlwydd oed; yr oeddwn yn credu mai dim ond rhoi arian yr oeddem yn ei wneud. Yr ydym yn rhoi mwy o gyfleoedd iddynt—mae mwy o bobl eisoes yn parhau i ddyngu yng Nghymru ar ôl iddynt gyrraedd 16 mlwydd oed nag yn Lloegr. Yn ogystal, yn Lloegr, canfuwyd bod y lwfans cynhaliaeth addysg newydd yn creu cynnydd sylweddol o bron chwe phwynt canran, yn arbennig ymhlith dynion ifanc a'r rhai sy'n gymwys i gael y lwfans cynhaliaeth addysg llawn. Mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn dangos agenda glir o ran cyfiawnder cymdeithasol, ac agenda o roi ydyw.

**Kirsty Williams:** Nid yw'n hollol gywir dweud bod y cynllun yn gweithredu yn yr un ffordd yng Nghymru a Lloegr oherwydd, fel y gwyddoch, mae pobl ifanc 17 mlwydd oed mewn rhannau o Loegr yn gymwys i gael lwfansau cynhaliaeth addysg. Onid yw'n arbennig o annheg bod gan bobl ifanc 16 mlwydd oed ffynhonnell arian a bod gan bobl

settings, although the criteria of parental income are different, yet 17-year-olds are being left out in this way?

**Jane Davidson:** I said that the scheme in full was run across the whole of the UK. It has been run in exactly the way across the whole of the UK. However, the Government in England has supported the continuation of funding in the pilot areas for 16, 17 and 18-year-olds. In the rest of the UK, outside those specific pilot areas. The scheme is for 16-year-olds this year, 16 and 17-year-olds next year, and 16, 17 and 18-year-olds the year after that.

ifanc 18 mlwydd oed ffynhonnell arian mewn rhai lleoliadau, er bod y meini prawf o ran incwm rhieni yn wahanol, ond y caiff pobl ifanc 17 mlwydd oed eu hepgor yn y ffordd hon?

**Jane Davidson:** Dywedais fod y cynllun llawn yn weithredol ledled y DU gyfan. Fe'i gweithredwyd yn yr un ffordd yn union ledled y DU gyfan. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Llywodraeth yn Lloegr wedi cefnogi parhau â chyllid yn yr ardaloedd peilot ar gyfer pobl ifanc 16, 17 a 18 mlwydd oed. Yng ngweddill y DU, y tu allan i'r ardaloedd peilot penodol hynny, mae'r cynllun ar gyfer pobl ifanc 16 mlwydd oed, pobl ifanc 16 a 17 mlwydd oed y flwyddyn nesaf, a phobl ifanc 16, 17 a 18 mlwydd oed y flwyddyn ar ôl hynny.

### **Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru Education and Learning Wales**

**Q7 Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on ELWa? (OAQ38307)

**C7 Ieuan Wyn Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ELWa? (OAQ38307)

**Jane Davidson:** As the First Minister announced, ELWa will merge with the Welsh Assembly Government by 1 April 2006. A project is under way to determine how this is to be accomplished, and the legislation required to implement this decision is being prepared. ELWa representatives are fully involved in this work, and further details will be announced when the scoping study is complete.

**Jane Davidson:** Fel y cyhoeddodd y Prif Weinidog, bydd ELWa yn uno â Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru erbyn 1 Ebrill 2006. Mae prosiect ar y gweill i benderfynu sut i wneud hyn, ac mae'r ddeddfwriaeth sydd ei hangen i weithredu'r penderfyniad hwn wrthi'n cael ei pharatoi. Mae cynrychiolwyr ELWa yn cymryd rhan lawn yn y gwaith hwn, a chaiff rhagor o fanylion eu cyhoeddi pan fydd yr astudiaeth gwmpasu wedi'i chwblhau.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** On the figures published by ELWa for sixth form and further education college funding next year, you say that you are a giving Government, but the budgets of 14 local authorities and 16 further education colleges will be substantially reduced when the new system comes in. That means that they will eventually have less money. As I said earlier, is it not the case that the colleges that you say are now in deficit will be even more in deficit when this new formula is introduced? What assessment have you made of the number of sixth forms that will have to close when ELWa introduces its new formula?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** O ran y ffigurau a gyhoeddwyd gan ELWa ar gyfer cyllid darpariaeth chweched dosbarth a cholegau addysg bellach y flwyddyn nesaf, dywedwch eich bod yn Llywodraeth sy'n rhoi, ond caiff cyllidebau 14 o awdurdodau lleol ac 16 o golegau addysg bellach eu lleihau'n sylweddol pan gyflwynir y system newydd. Golyga hynny y bydd llai o arian ganddynt yn y pen draw. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, onid yw'n wir y bydd y colegau y dywedwch eu bod mewn diffyg ar hyn o bryd mewn diffyg hyd yn oed yn fwy pan gyflwynir y fformiwla newydd hon? Pa asesiad a wnaethoch o sawl chweched dosbarth fydd yn gorfod cau pan fydd ELWa yn cyflwyno ei fformiwla newydd?

**Jane Davidson:** As I said in my previous response, the change will be introduced in a carefully managed way, with safety netting over the first three years of the new system to allow all providers sufficient time to plan for the future. Therefore, for 2005-06, which is the year of transition, all providers can expect to operate on the same funding levels as at present, in real terms, provided that numbers of learners do not fall. Therefore, there are two clear planning years, namely this year and next year, before the scheme is introduced, and even in that third year, providers currently funded above the harmonised rate will receive funding at this year's level. We have offered protection all the way through. You and your party signed up to the principles of a level playing field, but, as is always the case, when the difficult decisions about supporting learners need to be taken, you back off.

**Leighton Andrews:** I welcome the safety-netting procedures as you know; I argued for them for some time. Will you ensure that ELWa considers the safety-netting proposals in respect of further education colleges as well as sixth forms? It is important that reassurance is given that those safety-netting proposals will also apply to them.

**Jane Davidson:** You are right, Leighton. The proposals will operate across the providers. That is the main issue, because we want to ensure that, in the longer term, we create a level playing field. The focus is on learner choices. If you look in the *Learning Works* supplement from ELWa in today's *The Western Mail*, you will see that, for the first time ever, Barry College is offering a Welsh-medium hairdressing course to students from Ysgol Gyfun Bro Morgannwg, the students of which asked for this course in a school survey. Those are the kinds of new collaborations that we can offer as a result of more opportunity based on learner choices.

**Mark Isherwood:** To reassure colleges, you referred to funding at current levels, but will you recognise that the lack of an evidence

**Jane Davidson:** Fel y dywedais yn fy ymateb blaenorol, caiff y newid ei gyflwyno mewn ffordd a reolir yn ofalus, a bydd rhwyd ddiogelwch dros dair blynedd gyntaf y system newydd i roi digon o amser i bob darparwr gynllunio i'r dyfodol. Felly, ar gyfer 2005-06, sef y flwyddyn drosglwyddo, gall pob darparwr ddisgwyl gweithredu ar yr un lefelau cyllido â'r lefelau presennol, mewn termau gwirioneddol, ar yr amod nad yw niferoedd y dysgwyr yn gostwng. Felly, mae dwy flynedd gynllunio glir, sef eleni a'r flwyddyn nesaf, cyn cyflwyno'r cynllun, a hyd yn oed yn y drydedd flwyddyn honno, caiff darparwyr a gaiff fwy o gyllid na'r gyfradd wedi'i chysoni ar hyn o bryd gyllid ar yr un lefel ag eleni. Yr ydym wedi darparu camau diogelu drwy gydol y broses. Bu i chi a'ch plaid gytuno ar egwyddorion chwarae teg, ond, fel sydd bob amser yn wir, pan fydd angen gwneud y penderfyniadau anodd ynghylch cefnogi dysgwyr, yr ydych yn tynnu'n ôl.

**Leighton Andrews:** Croesawaf y gweithdrefnau rhwyd ddiogelwch fel y gwyddoch; bu imi ddadlau drostynt am beth amser. A sicrhewch fod ELWa yn ystyried y cynigion ar gyfer rhwyd ddiogelwch mewn perthynas â cholegau addysg bellach yn ogystal â darpariaeth chweched dosbarth? Mae'n bwysig eu sicrhau y bydd y cynigion ar gyfer rhwyd ddiogelwch yn berthnasol iddynt hwy hefyd.

**Jane Davidson:** Yr ydych yn gywir, Leighton. Bydd y cynigion yn gweithredu ar draws y darparwyr. Dyna'r prif fater, am ein bod am sicrhau bod gennym chwarae teg yn y tymor hwy. Canolbwyntir ar ddewisiadau i'r dysgwr. Os edrychwch ar atodiad *Mae Dysgu yn Gweithio* gan ELWa yn *The Western Mail* heddiw, fe welwch, am y tro cyntaf erioed, fod Coleg y Barri yn cynnig cwrs trin gwallt cyfrwng Cymraeg i fyfyrwyr o Ysgol Gyfun Bro Morgannwg. Gofynnodd myfyrwyr yr ysgol honno am y cwrs hwn mewn arolwg yn yr ysgol. Dyna'r math o gydweithredu newydd y gallwn ei gynnig o ganlyniad i fwy o gyfleoedd yn seiliedig ar ddewisiadau dysgwyr.

**Mark Isherwood:** Er mwyn sicrhau colegau, bu ichi gyfeirio at gyllid ar y lefelau presennol, ond a gydnabyddwch fod diffyg

basis for funding at current levels is leading to cuts in many colleges to the extent that, for instance—and you must acknowledge this—the Welsh College of Horticulture at Northop is asking all of its teaching staff to reapply for their jobs, and job losses among the teaching staff have already taken place because of the funding crisis in which the college has found itself?

**Jane Davidson:** Once again, I refuse to accept the word ‘crisis’ in a growing budget area. We have always funded above the level of inflation. I accept the point about an evidence base, but when I became Minister, I inherited a post-1992 system that the Conservative Government put in place in terms of formula-funding colleges. We are now creating the evidence base, which is derived from the needs of learners, not institutions. However, the protection will enable institutions to manage themselves through the transition period.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Question 8 (OAQ38332) has been transferred for written answer.

tystiolaeth ar gyfer cyllid ar y lefelau presennol yn arwain at doriadau mewn llawer o golegau i'r graddau bod Coleg Garddwriaeth Cymru yn Llaneurgain, er enghraifft—a rhaid ichi gydnabod hyn—yn gofyn i bob un o'i staff addysgu ailymgeisio am eu swyddi, a bod swyddi eisoes wedi'u colli ymhlith y staff addysgu oherwydd yr argyfwng cyllido yn y coleg?

**Jane Davidson:** Unwaith eto, gwrthodaf dderbyn y gair ‘argyfwng’ mewn maes lle y mae'r gyllideb yn cynyddu. Yr ydym bob amser wedi rhoi mwy o gyllid na lefel chwyddiant. Derbynaf y pwynt ynghylch tystiolaeth, ond pan gefais fy mhenodi yn Weinidog, etifeddais system ôl-1992 a sefydlwyd gan y Llywodraeth Geidwadol o ran cyllido colegau gan ddefnyddio fformiwla. Yr ydym bellach yn casglu'r dystiolaeth, sy'n deillio o anghenion dysgwyr, yn hytrach na sefydliadau. Fodd bynnag, bydd y camau diogelu yn galluogi sefydliadau i reoli eu hunain yn ystod y cyfnod trosglwyddo.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trosglwyddwyd cwestiwn 8 (OAQ38332) i'w ateb yn ysgrifenedig.

### **Dysgu Ieithoedd Tramor Foreign Language Learning**

**Q9 Denise Idris Jones:** What action is the Minister taking to increase the take-up of foreign language learning in Wales? (OAQ38359)

**Jane Davidson:** We are implementing our ‘Languages Count’ strategy. That includes a programme of support and training for schools delivered by the Centre for Information on Language Teaching and Research Cymru, pilots of teaching foreign languages at key stage 2 involving 105 primary schools, new guidance from Estyn and ACCAC, and the inclusion of a language model in the baccalaureate.

3.20 p.m.

**Denise Idris Jones:** I am sure that you would agree that learning foreign languages is beneficial. I was a French teacher in my former career, and I know that introducing

**C9 Denise Idris Jones:** Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i gynyddu'r nifer sy'n cychwyn dysgu ieithoedd tramor yng Nghymru? (OAQ38359)

**Jane Davidson:** Yr ydym yn gweithredu ein strategaeth ‘Ieithoedd sy'n Cyfrif’. Mae hynny'n cynnwys rhaglen o gymorth a hyfforddiant i ysgolion a gyflwynir gan y Ganolfan Wybodaeth ac Ymchwil ar Ddysgu Ieithoedd, cynlluniau peilot o ran addysgu ieithoedd tramor yng nghyfnod allweddol 2 yn cynnwys 105 o ysgolion cynradd, canllawiau newydd gan Estyn ac ACCAC, a chynnwys model iaith yn y fagloriaeth.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddech yn cytuno bod dysgu ieithoedd tramor yn fuddiol. Yr oeddwn yn athrawes Ffrangeg o'r blaen, a gwn fod cyflwyno

foreign languages to primary school pupils, or to even younger children, as you have done in certain pilot scheme schools in Wales, gives them a head start and instils the necessary confidence to help them continue studying foreign languages at secondary level and even further.

**Jane Davidson:** I am pleased to say that 2,500 pupils are currently involved in the primary school project. In the Meirionnydd Nant Conwy area, for example, two secondary clusters are involved in the key stage 2 modern foreign language pilot schemes. Primary schools in these cluster areas are teaching Spanish, French and German to pupils in years five and six. Therefore, quite a range of languages are being taught.

ieithoedd tramor i ddisgyblion ysgolion cynradd, neu i blant iau hyd yn oed, fel y gwnaethoch mewn rhai ysgolion a oedd yn rhan o'r cynllun peilot yng Nghymru, yn rhoi mantais iddynt ac yn meithrin yr hyder angenrheidiol i'w helpu i barhau i astudio ieithoedd tramor yn yr ysgol uwchradd a hyd yn oed ar ôl hynny.

**Jane Davidson:** Yr wyf yn falch o ddweud bod 2,500 o ddisgyblion yn rhan o'r prosiect ysgolion cynradd ar hyn o bryd. Yn ardal Meirionnydd Nant Conwy, er enghraifft, mae dau glwstwr uwchradd yn rhan o'r cynlluniau peilot o ran ieithoedd tramor modern yng nghyfnod allweddol 2. Mae ysgolion cynradd yn yr ardaloedd clwstwr hyn yn addysgu Sbaeneg, Ffrangeg ac Almaeneg i ddisgyblion ym mlynnyddoedd pump a chwech. Felly, addysgir amrywiaeth eithaf eang o ieithoedd.

### **Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order**

**Carl Sargeant:** Point of order. I raise this point under Standing Order No. 7.2. Will you give guidance, Deputy Presiding Officer, on the misleading statements made earlier by Mark Isherwood relating to the leader of the Welsh Local Government Association and Flintshire County Council, Alex Aldridge, which detract from the dignity of the Assembly? The protocol on conduct in the Chamber states that:

'Personal allegations against Members or other persons will therefore normally be considered offensive, including allegations of uttering falsehoods, allegations of corrupt or unfair or illegal practices'.

Following a comprehensive and full review by PricewaterhouseCoopers and North Wales Police into Flintshire County Council's business and activities, the investigations found no evidence of criminal or civil misconduct. Do you agree that this is inappropriate language to use in the Chamber and is an abuse of the qualified privilege that this Member had? Will you ask him to make these observations outside the Chamber, in public, where Mr Aldridge will have the right

**Carl Sargeant:** Pwynt o drefn. Codaf y pwynt hwn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 7.2. A roddwch gyfarwyddyd, Ddirprwy Lywydd, ar y datganiadau camarweiniol a wnaed yn gynharach gan Mark Isherwood ynghylch arweinydd Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ac Arweinydd Cyngor Sir y Fflint, Alex Aldridge, sy'n amharu ar urddas y Cynulliad? Noda'r protocol ar ymddygiad yn y Siambr:

'Gan amlaf, felly, ystyrir cyhuddiadau personol ynghylch Aelod neu unrhyw berson arall, gan gynnwys cyhuddiadau sydd yn gelwydd llwyr, cyhuddiadau o weithgareddau llwgr neu annheg neu anghyfreithlon...yn dramgwyddus'.

Yn dilyn adolygiad cynhwysfawr a llawn gan PricewaterhouseCoopers a Heddlu Gogledd Cymru o fusnes a gweithgareddau Cyngor Sir y Fflint, ni chanfu'r ymchwiliadau unrhyw dystiolaeth o gamymddygiad troseddol na sifil. A gytunwch fod hon yn iaith amhriodol i'w defnyddio yn y Siambr a'i bod yn achos o gamddefnyddio'r fraint gymwysedig oedd gan yr Aelod hwnnw? A ofynnwch iddo wneud y sylwadau hyn y tu allan i'r Siambr, yn gyhoeddus, lle y bydd gan Mr Aldridge yr

to reply?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I do not know anything about the activities of North Wales Police, and I will not invite anyone to say outside the Chamber what they may or may not have said inside it. However, Members have special privileges in speaking in the Chamber, and the Presiding Officer has consistently said that these privileges must be exercised responsibly. The Presiding Officer has also said that it is unacceptable to make allegations of misconduct against persons outside the Chamber. However, it must be in order for Members, in debating a motion to appoint individuals to a body, to argue that one or more of these individuals is not appropriate for appointment and to give reasons for that. This must be done courteously and not offensively. I did not judge that Mark Isherwood strayed outside this line, although he may well have come close to it. I shall study the Record, draw it to the attention of the Presiding Officer, and come back to it if necessary.

**Sandy Mewies:** Further to that point of order, am I correct in thinking that, under Standing Orders, if a Member considers that exceptional circumstances exist that could justify a departure from what you have just read, the Presiding Officer should be consulted in advance? If that is the case, did that happen?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I am not aware of that, but I do not think—and again I will consider Standing Orders carefully—that Members have to consult the Presiding Officer or the Deputy Presiding Officer before making any speeches. They are responsible for their own words in the Chamber.

**Leighton Andrews:** Further to that point of order, as I understand it, paragraph 8 of the protocol on conduct in the Chamber states that:

‘If a Member considers exceptional circumstances exist that could justify a departure...the Presiding Officer should be consulted in advance.’

That is in the protocol. I therefore repeat

hawl i ymateb?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Ni wn unrhyw beth am weithgareddau Heddlu De Cymru, ac ni fyddaf yn gwahodd neb i ddweud y tu allan i'r Siambr yr hyn y gall fod wedi'i ddweud neu beidio y tu mewn iddi. Fodd bynnag, mae gan Aelodau freintiau arbennig wrth siarad yn y Siambr, ac mae'r Llywydd wedi dweud yn gyson fod yn rhaid arfer y breintiau hyn yn gyfrifol. Mae'r Llywydd wedi dweud hefyd nad yw'n dderbyniol gwneud honiadau o gamymddwyn yn erbyn pobl y tu allan i'r Siambr. Fodd bynnag, rhaid ei bod mewn trefn i Aelodau, wrth drafod cynnig i benodi unigolion i gorff, ddadlau nad yw un neu fwy o'r unigolion hyn yn briodol i'w penodi a rhoi'r rhesymau dros hynny. Rhaid gwneud hyn mewn ffordd gwrtais ac nid mewn ffordd sy'n peri tramgwydd. Yn fy marn i, ni chrosodd Mark Isherwood y llinell hon, er iddo ddod yn agos ati o bosibl. Byddaf yn astudio'r Cofnod, yn tynnu sylw'r Llywydd ato, ac yn dychwelyd at y mater os bydd angen.

**Sandy Mewies:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, a wyf yn gywir i feddwl, o dan y Rheolau Sefydlog, os bydd Aelod o'r farn bod amgylchiadau eithriadol yn bodoli a allai gyfiawnhau gwyro oddi wrth yr hyn yr ydych newydd ei ddarllen, y dylid ymgynghori â'r Llywydd ymlaen llaw? Os yw hynny'n wir, a ddigwyddodd hynny?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o hynny, ond ni chredaf—ac unwaith eto byddaf yn ystyried y Rheolau Sefydlog yn ofalus—fod yn rhaid i Aelodau ymgynghori â'r Llywydd neu'r Dirprwy Lywydd cyn gwneud unrhyw araith. Maent yn gyfrifol am eu geiriau eu hunain yn y Siambr.

**Leighton Andrews:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, fel y'i deallaf, mae paragraff 8 o'r protocol ar ymddygiad yn y Siambr yn nodi:

‘Os yw Aelod yn ystyried fod amgylchiadau arbennig yn bodoli a fyddai'n cyfiawnhau gweithredu'n groes i hyn, dylid ymgynghori â'r Llywydd o flaen llaw.’

Mae hynny yn y protocol. Felly ailadroddaf



Sandy Mewies's question: was the Presiding Office consulted in advance?

gwestiwn Sandy Mewies: a ymgynghorwyd â Swyddfa'r Llywydd ymlaen llaw?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I am not aware of that. However, this is not the same as Standing Orders. Guidance is just that—guidance. That is not the same as Standing Orders. If this was mentioned in Standing Orders, then I would expect it to be obeyed on every occasion. However, that is not the case.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hyn yr un peth â Rheolau Sefydlog. Canllawiau yw canllawiau a dim byd mwy. Nid ydynt yr un peth â Rheolau Sefydlog. Pe crybwyllid hyn mewn Rheolau Sefydlog, yna byddwn yn disgwyl i bobl ufuddhau iddo bob amser. Fodd bynnag, nid felly y mae hi.

**Mark Isherwood** *rose*—

**Mark Isherwood** *a gododd*—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I do not think that there is any more to say on this. I will study the Record. If there is anything that needs to be drawn to the Assembly's attention, either I or the Presiding Officer will do so.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Ni chredaf fod unrhyw beth arall i'w ddweud ar y mater hwn. Byddaf yn astudio'r Cofnod. Os bydd unrhyw beth y mae angen tynnu sylw'r Cynulliad ato, byddaf fi neu'r Llywydd yn gwneud hynny.

### **Y Cynllun Gweithredu Datblygu Cynaliadwy The Sustainable Development Action Plan**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, amendments 2 and 3 in the name of Kirsty Williams and amendments 4, 5, 6, 7, 8 and 9 in the name of Jonathan Morgan.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, gwelliannau 2 a 3 yn enw Kirsty Williams a gwelliannau 4, 5, 6, 7, 8 a 9 yn enw Jonathan Morgan.

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Cynigiad fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. welcomes 'The Sustainable Development Action Plan of the Welsh Assembly Government 2004-07';*

*1. yn croesawu 'Cynllun Gweithredu Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar Ddatblygu Cynaliadwy 2004-07';*

*2. thanks all individuals, organisations and Assembly committees that responded to the consultation on the draft action plan;*

*2. yn diolch i'r unigolion, sefydliadau a phwyllgorau'r Cynulliad a ymatebodd i'r ymgynghoriad ar y cynllun gweithredu drafft;*

*3. notes the Sustainable Development Annual Report 2004 on progress in implementing the scheme;*

*3. yn nodi'r Adroddiad Blynyddol ar Ddatblygu Cynaliadwy 2004 ar hynt y gwaith o weithredu'r cynllun;*

4. *welcomes the focus of the action plan on practical action to address the challenges identified in the formal review of the sustainable development scheme, in particular the proposed action on climate change and procurement.* (NDM2119)

Since the first scheme was introduced in November 2000, the Welsh Assembly Government has learned much about sustainable development and what is entailed in having to integrate it into everything that we do. It is always challenging and rarely easy, but it has enabled us in the first four years to lay strong foundations that will lead to tangible change. The first action plan, introduced three years ago, was mainly about establishing organisational architecture and getting the right policies in place to direct change. Almost all those actions have been completed; those that have not reflect our changing knowledge about this issue.

4. *yn croesawu'r ffaith fod y cynllun gweithredu'n canolbwyntio ar gamau ymarferol i fynd i'r afael â'r heriau a nodwyd yn yr adolygiad ffurfiol o'r cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy, yn arbennig y camau gweithredu arfaethedig ar newid hinsawdd a chaffael.* (NDM2119)

Ers i'r cynllun cyntaf gael ei gyflwyno ym mis Tachwedd 2000, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi dysgu cryn dipyn am ddatblygu cynaliadwy a'r her o'i integreiddio'n wirioneddol ym mhopeth a wnawn. Mae bob amser yn heriol ac anaml y mae'n hawdd, ond mae wedi ein galluogi yn y pedair blynedd cyntaf i osod sylfeini cryf a fydd yn arwain at newid gwirioneddol. Yr oedd y cynllun gweithredu cyntaf, a gyflwynwyd dair blynedd yn ôl, yn ymwneud yn bennaf â sefydlu pensaernïaeth sefydliadol a sicrhau bod y polisiau cywir ar waith i gyfeirio newid. Mae bron pob un o'r camau gweithredu hynny wedi'u cymryd bellach; mae'r rhai nad ydynt wedi'u cymryd yn adlewyrchu'r wybodaeth newydd sydd gennym am y mater hwn.

*Daeth David Melding i'r Gadair am 3.26 p.m.*

*David Melding took the Chair at 3.26 p.m.*

The independent effectiveness report that we published last year concluded that, despite achieving real progress on sustainable development in some areas, there were problems in turning good intentions into change on the ground. It concluded that in the new action plan the Assembly Government should identify key challenges for Wales and ways of overcoming barriers to change. I believe that this new plan fulfils that mandate.

It has taken a year to develop the new scheme and action plan. In order to address the concerns identified in the effectiveness report, we have taken the time to engage stakeholders from all sectors of society, through events and consultation, to build consensus on the big issues and on action for change. The formal consultation stage before the summer recess revealed a high level of support for the plan, but also areas that needed further work or clarity. These included areas such as timescales and targets, resources, health, transport, sustainable

Daeth yr adroddiad annibynnol ar effeithiolrwydd a gyhoeddwyd gennym y llynedd i'r casgliad, er bod cynnydd gwirioneddol ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy mewn rhai meysydd, fod problemau o ran troi bwriadau da yn newidiadau ar lawr gwlad. Daeth i'r casgliad y dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn y cynllun gweithredu newydd, nodi heriau allweddol yng Nghymru a ffyrdd o oresgyn rhwystrau i newid. Credaf fod y cynllun newydd hwn yn cyflawni hynny.

Mae wedi cymryd blwyddyn i ddatblygu'r cynllun a'r cynllun gweithredu newydd. Er mwyn mynd i'r afael â'r pryderon a nodwyd yn yr adroddiad effeithiolrwydd, yr ydym wedi cymryd yr amser i gysylltu â rhanddeiliaid o bob rhan o gymdeithas, drwy ddigwyddiadau ac ymgynghoriadau, er mwyn cael consensws ar y materion pwysig ac ar weithredu i newid. Dangosodd yr ymgynghoriad ffurfiol cyn toriad yr haf fod cryn gefnogaeth i'r cynllun, ond bod hefyd feysydd lle yr oedd angen rhagor o waith neu eglurder. Ymhlith y rhain yr oedd meysydd

consumption, energy efficiency and renewable technologies. It has not been possible for us to take on board all the comments—some are not within the scope of the Assembly’s powers and functions—but, together with other Cabinet colleagues, I have added an additional set of 10 actions synthesised from the comments made. Taken together with existing commitments in the draft plan, these actions will lead to a step change in delivery around sustainable development, will serve as an addendum to ‘Wales: A Better Country’ and will be reported on annually.

Underlying the individual actions in the action plan is a story about how to meet the challenge of sustainable development. It reflects the Government’s belief that sustainable development is the only process that will enable us to achieve the vision of a sustainable future for Wales as set out in ‘Wales: A Better Country’. Some of the actions are internal and involve removing or altering processes that act as barriers to change on the ground. However, many other actions reflect our growing understanding of how it is possible to get seemingly unconnected issues to work together in order to create change. No-one who heard Professor Sir John Houghton speak at the Assembly recently can be in any doubt about the seriousness of the threat of climate change. We cannot ignore it because it suits us to do so.

Much of this plan is about procurement and ensuring that the £4 billion of Assembly Government money spent every year by the public sector is used to tackle climate change and, in doing so, to create jobs, new opportunities, a healthier environment and better communities. There are new commitments on energy efficiency, embedded micro-regeneration of renewables and design standards in public buildings, which will sit alongside existing commitments, such as those in technical advice note 12 on planning briefs for larger area sites and those proposed in draft TAN 8. Our commitment to reshaping procurement

megis amserlenni a thargedau, adnoddau, iechyd, trafniadaeth, defnydd cynaliadwy, effeithlonrwydd ynni a thechnolegau adnewyddadwy. Ni fu’n bosibl inni weithredu ar bob un o’r sylwadau—nid yw rhai o fewn pwerau a swyddogaethau’r Cynulliad—ond, ar y cyd â’r cyd-Weinidogion yn y Cabinet, yr wyf wedi ychwanegu rhestr o 10 o gamau gweithredu ychwanegol a baratowyd drwy gyfuno’r sylwadau a wnaed. Ynghyd â’r ymrwymadau sydd eisoes yn y cynllun drafft, bydd y camau gweithredu hyn yn arwain at newid sylweddol o ran cyflawni ym maes datblygu cynaliadwy. Byddant yn atodiad i ‘Cymru: Gwlad Well’ a rhoddir adroddiad arnynt yn flynyddol.

Yn sail i’r camau gweithredu unigol yn y cynllun gweithredu sonnir am sut i ateb her datblygu cynaliadwy. Mae’n adlewyrchu barn y Llywodraeth mai datblygu cynaliadwy yw’r unig broses a fydd yn ein galluogi i wireddu’r weledigaeth ar gyfer dyfodol cynaliadwy i Gymru fel y nodwyd yn ‘Cymru: Gwlad Well’. Mae rhai o’r camau gweithredu yn gamau i’w cymryd yn fewnol ac maent yn golygu dileu neu newid prosesau sy’n rhwystro newid ar lawr gwlad. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer o gamau gweithredu eraill yn adlewyrchu ein dealltwriaeth gynyddol o’r ffordd y gellir cael materion digyswllt i bob golwg i gydblythu er mwyn creu newid. Ni all neb a glywodd yr Athro Syr John Houghton yn siarad yn y Cynulliad yn ddiweddar amau pa mor ddifrifol yw bygythiad newid yn yr hinsawdd. Ni allwn ei anwybyddu am ei bod yn gyfleus inni wneud hynny.

Mae’r cynllun hwn yn ymwneud i raddau helaeth â chaffael a sicrhau y caiff y £4 biliwn o arian Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a werir bob blwyddyn gan y sector cyhoeddus ei ddefnyddio i fynd i’r afael â newid yn yr hinsawdd ac, wrth wneud hynny, i greu swyddi, cyfleoedd newydd, amgylchedd iachach a chymunedau gwell. Mae ymrwymadau newydd ynglŷn ag effeithlonrwydd ynni, dulliau annatod o feicro-adyfio defnyddiau adnewyddadwy a safonau dylunio mewn adeiladau cyhoeddus, a fydd yn sefyll ochr yn ochr â’r ymrwymadau a wnaed eisoes, megis y rhai yn nodyn cyngor technegol 12 ar friffiau

also applies to issues such as vehicle procurement, and these changes will take effect as new contracts replace old ones.

Jane Davidson plans to change school meals so that we address growing concerns regarding our children's health, and benefit communities and the environment as food purchasing comes closer to home. This will not be an overnight change as existing contracts will need to run their course and new supply chains must be created. However, some local authorities are ahead of the game and demonstrating the benefits to others.

I will refer briefly to resources. The vast majority of the actions in the plan have no additional money attached to them, and I make no apologies for that. A key lesson that we have learned over the past five years about sustainable development is that it is rarely about having to find large sums of new money. What is really needed is better use of the money that we already have. We need to use money where it is most needed—to plug gaps and take advantage of new opportunities. The waste strategy is a perfect example. Over the last four years, the Welsh Assembly Government and local authorities have been working together to shape the direction and resources available to tackle the problem of waste in Wales. However, it became apparent that additional resources were needed to continue the progress towards fulfilling obligations under the landfill directive. I am delighted to report that, as a result, an additional £33 million will be made available over the next three years.

3.30 p.m.

The action plan is primarily about the Welsh Assembly Government and its agencies and how we intend to fulfil the commitments in the new sustainable development scheme. I am full of respect for those people and organisations that have no duty to do this but still work towards creating a sustainable Wales. Most undertake this unpaid and

cynllunio ar safleoedd mwy a'r rhai a gynigir yn y TAN 8 drafft. Mae ein hymrwymiad i ail-lunio prosesau caffael hefyd yn berthnasol i faterion megis caffael cerbydau, a bydd y newidiadau hyn yn dod yn weithredol wrth i gontractau newydd ddisodli hen gontractau.

Mae Jane Davidson yn bwriadu newid pryddau bwyd mewn ysgolion er mwyn inni allu mynd i'r afael â'r pryderon cynyddol o ran iechyd ein plant, ac er budd cymunedau a'r amgylchedd wrth i fwydydd gael eu prynu'n fwy lleol. Ni fydd hyn yn digwydd dros nos gan y bydd angen i'r contractau cyfredol ddod i ben a bydd yn rhaid creu cadwyni cyflenwi newydd. Fodd bynnag, mae rhai awdurdodau lleol ar y blaen ac yn dangos y manteision i eraill.

Cyfeirir yn fyr at adnoddau. Nid oes unrhyw arian ychwanegol wedi'i neilltuo ar gyfer y rhan fwyaf o'r camau gweithredu yn y cynllun, ac nid ymddiheuraf am hynny. Un o'r gwersi allweddol yr ydym wedi'i dysgu dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf ynglŷn â datblygu cynaliadwy yw mai anaml y mae gofyn am ddod o hyd i symiau mawr o arian newydd. Yr hyn sydd ei angen mewn gwirionedd yw defnyddio'r arian yn well lle mae ei angen fwyaf—i lenwi bylchau a manteisio ar gyfleoedd newydd. Mae'r strategaeth wastraff yn enghraifft berffaith. Dros y pedair blynedd diwethaf, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ac awdurdodau lleol wedi bod yn cydweithio i bennu'r cyfeiriad a'r adnoddau sydd ar gael i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem o ran gwastraff yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, daeth yn amlwg fod angen adnoddau ychwanegol i barhau â'r cynnydd tuag at gyflawni rhwymedigaethau o dan y gyfarwyddeb dirlewni. Yr wyf yn falch o nodi, o ganlyniad i hynny, y caiff £33 miliwn ychwanegol ei ddarparu dros y tair blynedd nesaf.

Mae'r cynllun gweithredu yn ymwneud yn bennaf â Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'i hasiantaethau a'r ffordd y bwriadwn gyflawni'r ymrwymadau yn y cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy newydd. Mae gennyf barch mawr tuag at y bobl a'r sefydliadau hynny nad oes unrhyw ddyletswydd arnynt i wneud hyn ond sydd eto yn dal i weithio tuag

unrecognised work daily, and many others are prepared to contribute their time and expertise to help us fulfil the duty. There is little direct reference to communities in the action plan but, ultimately, it is what the plan is about, therefore specific reference is not needed. This contains an important point for those of us who look to work through partnership. The Assembly Government sets the strategic direction and pace for sustainable development in Wales but, without the commitment and active empowerment of people at a community level, change will not happen. We know full well that this is the case.

Getting messages across about sustainable consumption and production will be a huge challenge, and I very much hope that, in addition to working with the UK Government on this issue, we will be able to work with organisations and communities in Wales to develop a tailored approach that is right for us. Exploring the potential use of renewable energy to help tackle fuel poverty in vulnerable households will give us an insight into how we address concerns over new technology within an elderly population. For example, the NHS in Wales, in association with Tower Colliery, is assessing the potential for the use of coalfield methane at five hospital sites in south Wales. Methane is 21 times more damaging to the environment in terms of global warming than carbon dioxide. Therefore, using methane as a fuel where its damage is reduced by combustion provides a rare opportunity to reduce emissions, provide energy and demonstrate to the public that problems can often be turned into solutions.

Much of the innovative work on coalfield methane is being done in Germany, particularly in North Rhine-Westphalia. Our links with the region through the network of regional governments for sustainable development and our links with other European regions have enabled us to share knowledge and experience and bring them home to Wales. I am delighted to say that in the public gallery today we are joined by 12 scholars from India, whom I met yesterday

at greu Cymru gynaliadwy. Mae'r rhan fwyaf yn ymgymryd â'r gwaith hwn yn ddi-dâl ac yn gweithio'n feunyddiol heb unrhyw gydnabyddiaeth, ac mae llawer o bobl eraill yn barod i roi o'u hamser a chynnig eu harbenigedd i'n helpu i gyflawni'r ddyletswydd. Prin y cyfeirir yn uniongyrchol at gymunedau yn y cynllun gweithredu ond, yn y pen draw, dyna nod y cynllun, felly nid oes angen cyfeiriadau penodol. Mae hyn yn cynnwys pwynt pwysig i'r rhai ohonom sydd am weithio mewn partneriaeth. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn pennu'r cyfeiriad strategol a'r amserlen ar gyfer datblygu cynaliadwy yng Nghymru ond, heb ymrwymiad ac ymdrech i rymuso pobl mewn cymunedau, ni fydd dim yn newid. Gwyddom yn iawn mai felly y mae.

Bydd y dasg o gyfleu negeseuon ynglŷn â defnydd a chynhyrchu cynaliadwy yn her fawr, a gobeithiaf yn fawr y byddwn, yn ogystal â gweithio gyda Llywodraeth y DU ar y mater hwn, yn gallu gweithio gyda sefydliadau a chymunedau yng Nghymru i ddatblygu camau gweithredu wedi'u teilwra sy'n briodol inni. Bydd ymchwilio i'r defnydd posibl o ynni adnewyddadwy i helpu i fynd i'r afael â thlodi tanwydd mewn cartrefi tlawd yn ein helpu i ddeall sut y dylem ymdrin â phryderon ynglŷn â thechnoleg newydd mewn poblogaeth oedranus. Er enghraifft, mae'r GIG yng Nghymru, ar y cyd â Phwll y Tŵr, yn asesu'r posibilrwydd o ddefnyddio methan maes glo mewn pump ysbyty yn y De. Mae methan 21 gwaith yn fwy niweidiol i'r amgylchedd o safbwynt cynhesu bydol na charbon deuocsid. Felly byddai'r defnydd o fethan fel tanwydd lle y gellir ei wneud yn llai niweidiol drwy ymlosgi yn gyfle prin i leihau gollyngiadau, darparu ynni a dangos i'r cyhoedd y gall problemau yn aml gael eu troi'n atebion.

Gwneir llawer o'r gwaith arloesol ar fethan maes glo yn yr Almaen, yn enwedig yng Ngogledd y Rhein-Westffalia. Drwy ein cysylltiadau â'r rhanbarth drwy rwydwaith y llywodraethau rhanbarthol ar gyfer datblygu cynaliadwy a'n cysylltiadau â rhanbarthau eraill yn Ewrop gallwn rannu gwybodaeth a phrofiad a dod â hwy adref i Gymru. Mae'n bleser gennyf nodi bod 12 o ysgolheigion o'r India, y cyfarfûm â hwy ddoe, wedi ymuno â ni heddiw yn yr oriel gyhoeddus. Maent yn

and who are visiting the UK as part of the Chevening/Young Indian Environmental Management and Sustainable Development Programme sponsored by the Foreign and Commonwealth Office. As part of the programme, they are on a week-long visit to Wales to study the integration of sustainable development into policy and governance. I believe that what they will see this week, and particularly here this afternoon, is a country that does not pretend that it has all the answers, but which is trying hard to find them. More than anything else, I hope that they depart with the idea that all Assembly Members, from all parties, are fully committed to sustainable development and to a brighter future not only for ourselves and for future generations in the UK, but for future generations throughout the world.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I propose amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Minister to:*

*(a) revise 'Planning Policy Wales' so that there is a presumption in favour of renewable energy; and*

*(b) urgently review progress towards the creation of clear sustainable development indicators to enable more measurable targets to be set and monitored.*

Amendment 1 calls on the Minister to revise 'Planning Policy Wales' to ensure that it does not unnecessarily restrict the development of renewable energy. The amendment also refers to specific indicators. The debate on the need for renewable energy is moving fast. 'Planning Policy Wales' had to be written and developed at a certain time, but there is a risk that it may fall behind in meeting our sustainable development requirements. Technical advice note 8 is part of this process, but we are concerned that the Minister needs to ensure a consistent approach in all of the Assembly Government's planning tools and documents. In general, we are pleased with the approach outlined in the section on climate change, particularly the strong reference to community-based renewable energy projects, which may be key in a situation where people

ymweld â'r DU fel rhan o Raglen Rheoli Amgylcheddol a Datblygu Cynaliadwy i Indiaid Ifanc/Chevening a noddir gan y Swyddfa Dramor a Chymanwlad. Fel rhan o'r rhaglen, maent yn ymweld â Chymru am wythnos i astudio'r broses o integreiddio datblygu cynaliadwy â pholisi a llywodraeth. Credaf mai'r hyn a welant yr wythnos hon, ac yn enwedig yma y prynhawn yma, yw gwlad nad yw'n cymryd arni ei bod yn gwybod yr atebion i gyd, ond gwlad sy'n ymdrechu'n galed i ddod o hyd iddynt. Uwchlaw popeth, gobeithiaf y byddant yn gadael Cymru gyda'r argraff fod pob Aelod o'r Cynulliad, o bob plaid, yn gwbl ymrwymedig i ddatblygu cynaliadwy ac i ddyfodol mwy disglair nid yn unig i ni ein hunain a chenedlaethau i ddod yn y DU, ond i genedlaethau i ddod drwy'r byd i gyd.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar y Gweinidog:*

*(a) i ddiwygio 'Polisi Cynllunio Cymru' fel bod rhagdybiaeth o blaid ynni adnewyddadwy; a*

*(b) i adolygu ar frys y cynnydd tuag at greu dangosyddion datblygu cynaliadwy clir i alluogi pennu a monitro targedau mwy mesuradwy.*

Mae gwelliant 1 yn galw ar y Gweinidog i ddiwygio 'Polisi Cynllunio Cymru' i sicrhau nad yw'n cyfyngu'n ddiangen ar ddatblygiad ynni adnewyddadwy. Cyfeiria'r gwelliant hefyd at ddangosyddion penodol. Mae'r ddadl ynglŷn â'r angen am ynni adnewyddadwy yn datblygu'n gyflym. Bu raid i 'Polisi Cynllunio Cymru' gael ei ysgrifennu a'i ddatblygu ar adeg benodol, ond mae perygl na fydd yn bodloni ein gofynion datblygu cynaliadwy yn y dyfodol. Mae nodyn cyngor technegol 8 yn rhan o'r broses hon, ond ein pryder ni yw bod angen i'r Gweinidog sicrhau cysondeb ym mhob offeryn a dogfen gynllunio o eiddo Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Yn gyffredinol, yr ydym yn fodlon ar yr ymagwedd a amlinellir yn yr adran ar newid yn yr hinsawdd, yn enwedig y cyfeiriad cryf at brosiectau ynni adnewyddadwy yn y gymuned, a allai fod yn

are understandably concerned about larger-scale commercial development. Will the Minister ensure that planning guidance reflects the emphasis on community renewable energy development? Renewable energy has to be about more than wind power. For the future, we would seek a stronger emphasis on the potential of biomass, tidal energy, energy crops and solar power.

In respect of the second part of our amendment, on the need for specific indicators, the plan before us today is an improvement on the first draft. I congratulate the Minister and his officials on that; we are happy to welcome the new document. The Minister talked about the process of which this is a part, and it is a process that needs to continue. However, the plan before us today still tells us a great deal about what will be done. Mercifully, it tells us a little more about what will be done than the original draft did, but it tells us little about the specific outcome for that activity and how we will know what has worked or has not. We have the overall targets on renewable energy, but the plan is thin on the detail of how those targets might be met.

The report on the action plan makes reference to the development of an integration tool. This should enable us to set indicators and monitor them. The Minister's report, rather mysteriously, tells us that integration tools will be taken forward—whatever that means—in 2004-05. Our amendment seeks to press the Minister to urgently review this process and speed it up. Without a consistent and clear appraisal methodology, we will not know whether anything has changed. We will know that a great deal will have been done, but, unless we can see what has changed, all the doing in the world will not deliver sustainable development.

Will the Minister explain what 'taking forward' means in the context of developing the indicators, and will he give us a date by which the appraisal tools will be ready? After

allweddol mewn sefyllfa lle y mae pobl yn pryderu ynglŷn â datblygiadau masnachol ar raddfa fwy, a hynny'n ddealladwy. A wnaiff y Gweinidog sicrhau bod canllawiau cynllunio yn adlewyrchu'r pwyslais ar ddatblygu ynni adnewyddadwy yn y gymuned? Rhaid bod ynni adnewyddadwy yn cwmpasu mwy nag ynni gwynt. Yn y dyfodol, byddem yn ceisio rhoi pwyslais cryfach ar y posibilïadau a gynigir gan fïomàs, ynni'r llanw, ynni cynydau ac ynni'r haul.

O ran ail ran ein gwelliant, ynglŷn â'r angen am ddangosyddion penodol, mae'r cynllun sydd ger ein bron heddiw yn welliant ar y drafft cyntaf. Llongyfarchaf y Gweinidog a'i swyddogion ar hynny; yr ydym yn fwy na pharod i groesawu'r ddogfen newydd. Soniodd y Gweinidog am y broses y mae hwn yn rhan ohoni, ac mae'n broses y mae angen iddi barhau. Fodd bynnag, mae'r cynllun ger ein bron heddiw yn dal i ddweud cryn dipyn wrthym am yr hyn a gaiff ei wneud. Diolch byth, rhydd ychydig yn fwy o wybodaeth am yr hyn a fydd yn cael ei wneud na'r drafft gwreiddiol, ond nid oes fawr o wybodaeth am y canlyniad penodol ar gyfer y gweithgaredd hwnnw a sut y byddwn yn gwybod beth sydd wedi llwyddo a beth sydd wedi methu. Nodir y targedau cyffredinol ar gyfer ynni adnewyddadwy, ond nid oes llawer o fanylion yn y cynllun am y ffordd y gellid cyflawni'r targedau hynny.

Cyfeiria'r adroddiad ar y cynllun gweithredu at ddatblygu offeryn integreiddio. Dylai hwn fod yn fodd inni nodi dangosyddion a'u monitro. Mae cyfeiriad annelwig braidd yn adroddiad y Gweinidog at ddatblygu offer integreiddio—beth bynnag yw ystyr hynny—yn 2004-05. Nod ein gwelliant yw pwyso ar y Gweinidog i adolygu ar frys y broses hon a'i chyflymu. Heb fethodoleg arfarnu gyson a chlir, ni fyddwn yn gwybod a oes unrhyw beth wedi newid. Byddwn yn gwybod bod cryn dipyn wedi'i wneud, ond, oni allwn weld beth sydd wedi newid, ni fydd yr holl gamau gweithredu yn y byd yn sicrhau datblygu cynaliadwy.

A wnaiff y Gweinidog egluro beth yw ystyr 'datblygu' yng nghyd-destun datblygu'r dangosyddion, ac a rydd inni ddyddiad pryd y bydd yr offer arfarnu yn barod? Wedi'r

all, we are asking for many big changes. Organisations and individuals need to know what is expected of them, by when, and how they will know whether or not they have achieved it.

The action plan is an improvement, but there are some concerns: for example, the whole transport aspect remains weak. However, some progress has been made and it is right that we should acknowledge that.

To conclude, I raise a final underlying concern. The emphasis in this plan on partnership working is right, but political leadership will also be needed. There is no sign in this action plan, or in the Government's overall approach, of an understanding that a move towards sustainable development challenges powerful vested interests that have strong reasons for not coming on board. The Minister referred to some of the challenges and difficulties. However, it is not just a question of challenges and difficulties but, potentially, of outright resistance. The Government needs to understand that this will not always be a comfortable process, that real political leadership will be needed, and that difficult decisions will have to be made, if change is to be delivered and sustained.

It remains to be seen whether or not this Government has the commitment and courage to provide that political leadership. I believe that it could. I certainly know that this Assembly has the commitment to make this work. With that one caveat and concern, I commend amendment 1 to Members.

**Mick Bates:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 2: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Assembly Government to provide an indicator for sustainable development similar to how GDP is used to measure economic performance.*

I propose amendment 3. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

cyfan, yr ydym yn gofyn am lawer o newidiadau mawr. Mae angen i sefydliadau ac unigolion wybod yr hyn a ddisgwylir oddi wrthynt, erbyn pryd, a sut y byddant yn gwybod pa un a ydynt wedi ei gyflawni ai peidio.

Mae'r cynllun gweithredu yn welliant, ond erys rhai pryderon: er enghraifft, mae pob agwedd ar drafnidiaeth yn dal i fod yn wan. Fodd bynnag, gwnaed peth cynnydd ac mae'n briodol inni gydnabod hynny.

I gloi, codaf fater arall sy'n achos pryder. Mae'r pwyslais yn y cynllun hwn ar weithio mewn partneriaeth yn briodol, ond bydd angen arweiniad gwleidyddol hefyd. Nid oes unrhyw arwydd yn y cynllun hwn, nac yn ymagwedd gyffredinol y Llywodraeth, ei bod yn deall y bydd symud tuag at ddatblygu cynaliadwy yn herio grwpiau neu unigolion â buddiannau pwerus a rhesymau cryf dros beidio â chydweithredu. Cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog at rai o'r heriau a'r anawsterau. Fodd bynnag, nid heriau ac anawsterau yn unig sydd dan sylw ond gwrthwynebiad llwyr, o bosibl. Mae angen i'r Llywodraeth ddeall na fydd y broses hon yn un gyfforddus bob amser, y bydd angen arweiniad gwleidyddol gwirioneddol, ac y bydd yn rhaid gwneud penderfyniadau anodd, er mwyn cyflawni newidiadau a'u cynnal.

Amser a ddengys pa un a fydd gan y Llywodraeth hon yr ymrwymiad a'r dewrder i roi'r arweiniad gwleidyddol hwnnw. Credaf y gallai wneud hynny. Gwn yn sicr fod gan y Cynulliad yr ymrwymiad i sicrhau bod hyn yn gweithio. Ar wahân i'r rhybudd a'r pryder hwnnw, cymeradwyaf welliant 1 i'r Aelodau.

**Mick Bates:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i ddarparu dangosydd ar gyfer datblygu cynaliadwy i'w ddefnyddio yn debyg i'r modd y defnyddir CMC i fesur perfformiad economaidd.*

Cynigiaf welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:



*acknowledges the ambition of the aims of the action plan and calls on the Assembly Government to ensure that sustainable development is at the forefront of criteria for existing spending.*

The debate surrounding sustainability and climate change is often characterised by a lack of political will, and sometimes, unfortunately, a great deal of political opportunism. We often feel that we know what to do, but do not want to do it just yet. It might be naive to think that we can solve all the issues of sustainability overnight. Like many other Members, I have often been frustrated at the lack of progress towards our goal of sustainable development. Today, I see a little light at the end of the tunnel. I see an action plan that contains many positive targets. The targets have dates, which I welcome. I accept that this is a step in the right direction towards meeting our duty for sustainable development embodied in clause 121 of the Government of Wales Act 1998. The Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome the action plan's ambition and congratulate all those who prepared the documents. I know that a great many people, including the Minister, worked hard to take on board many of the excellent suggestions made by stakeholders in Wales. That team work and partnership is a reality—long may it continue and long may the Minister continue to take on board the often critical suggestions.

*yn cydnabod uchelgais amcanion y cynllun gweithredu, ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i sicrhau bod datblygu cynaliadwy yn un o'r prif feini prawf ar gyfer gwariant cyfredol.*

Nodweddir y ddadl ynglŷn â chynaliadwyedd a newid yn yr hinsawdd yn aml gan ddiffyg ewyllys wleidyddol, ac weithiau, yn anffodus, gryn dipyn o oportiwnistiaeth wleidyddol. Teimlwn yn aml ein bod yn gwybod beth i'w wneud, ond nid ydym yn hollol barod i'w wneud eto. Efallai ei bod yn naif credu y gallwn ddatrys holl faterion cynaliadwyedd dros nos. Fel llawer o Aelodau eraill, yr wyf yn aml wedi teimlo rhwystredigaeth ynglŷn â'r diffyg cynnydd tuag at ein nod o ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Heddiw, gwelaf lygedyn o obaith. Gwelaf gynllun gweithredu sy'n cynnwys llawer o dargedau cadarnhaol. Mae dyddiadau wedi'u pennu ar gyfer y targedau, sef rhywbeth a groesawaf. Derbyniaf fod hyn yn gam i'r cyfeiriad iawn tuag at gyflawni ein dyletswydd i hyrwyddo datblygu cynaliadwy a geir yng nghymal 121 Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn croesawu uchelgais y cynllun gweithredu ac yn llongyfarch pawb a baratodd y dogfennau. Gwn fod cryn nifer o bobl, gan gynnwys y Gweinidog, wedi gweithio'n galed i weithredu ar yr awgrymiadau rhagorol niferus a wnaed gan randdeiliaid yng Nghymru. Ceir gweithio tîm a gweithio mewn partneriaeth gwirioneddol—hir y parhaed a hir y parhao'r Gweinidog i ystyried awgrymiadau sy'n aml yn feiriadol.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.40 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.40 p.m.*

The targeting of local authorities and Assembly buildings to ensure that they are examples of good standards of energy efficiency as embodied in the Building Research Establishment Environmental Assessment Method standards is excellent. The energy-saving ethic is too often missed, in terms of people just saying let us produce more energy. The attack on fuel poverty is also an admirable aim and I recommend that the Minister consider how that can be addressed by the building of affordable housing. Only today, the community land

Mae'r penderfyniad i dargedu awdurdodau lleol ac adeiladau'r Cynulliad er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn enghreifftiau o safonau da o effeithlonrwydd ynni fel yr ymgorfforir yn safonau Dull Asesu Amgylcheddol y Sefydliad Ymchwil Adeiladu yn rhagorol. Yn rhy aml collir egwyddor arbed ynni, lle y mae pobl yn dweud beth am gynhyrchu rhagor o ynni. Mae'r ymgais i drechu tloedi tanwydd hefyd yn nod clodwiw ac argymhellaf y dylai'r Gweinidog ystyried sut y gellir ymdrin â hynny drwy adeiladu tai fforddiadwy. Dim ond heddiw, dywedodd yr

trusts told us how that could be achieved and how we could address sustainability for householders by making houses energy-efficient.

In my constituency of Montgomeryshire, there is an excellent project in Llanwddyn that I would recommend anyone to visit. Renewable energy is used to heat the school, the community centre and houses. On transport, the Minister said that he would look at research and development, which I welcome. Public sector procurement has long been an important issue and you mentioned the £4 million that we need to address that. That is all good stuff.

Encouraging co-operative agri-environmental schemes is again excellent and I recommend a project in Montgomeryshire called Pontbren, where there is a small pilot scheme. If you are looking a pilot scheme, that is a great example. This is all good stuff provided that the financial commitment exists. I fear that unless you make that commitment today, many of these good intentions will slip away into some dust-filled corner at the back of your office. That is why our amendment 3 calls for a commitment to put sustainable development first in terms of spending. You may say that you already do that, but if that were the case, this action plan would not be needed. Only this week, we heard Sue Essex make an announcement on the new Assembly budget. There was no mention of sustainable development. Therefore, I hope that you will support amendment 3.

Jenny Randerson will say more about amendment 2, on the need for a robust indicator, similar to GDP, which would lead us forward and ensure that people understand how we measure sustainable development. I like the report's structure, particularly the reference to an international dimension; I am pleased about that. However, it is a little strange that the Labour Party in Westminster can be close to Mr Bush when it comes to war, but cannot use its influence when it comes to getting the North Americans to accept the Kyoto protocol. Therein lies a challenge for your party, given that carbon

ymddiriedolaethau tir cymuned wrthym sut y gellid cyflawni hynny a sut y gallem fynd i'r afael â chynaliadwyedd i randdeiliaid drwy sicrhau bod tai yn defnyddio ynni'n effeithlon.

Yn fy etholaeth i, sef sir Drefaldwyn, mae prosiect rhagorol yn Llanwddyn. Byddwn yn argymhell i unrhyw un ymweld ag ef. Defnyddir ynni adnewyddadwy i wresogi'r ysgol, y ganolfan gymunedol a thai. O ran trafnidiaeth, dywedodd y Gweinidog y byddai'n ystyried gwaith ymchwil a datblygu, a chrosawaf hynny. Mae caffael yn y sector cyhoeddus wedi bod yn fater pwysig ers amser a bu ichi sôn am y £4 miliwn sydd ei angen arnom i fynd i'r afael â hynny. Mae hynny i gyd yn newyddion da.

Mae annog cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol cydweithredol hefyd yn ardderchog ac argymhellaf brosiect yn sir Drefaldwyn o'r enw Pontbren, lle y mae cynllun peilot bach. Os ydych yn chwilio am gynllun peilot, mae hwnnw'n enghraifft wych. Mae hyn i gyd yn newyddion da ar yr amod bod ymrwymiad ariannol. Ofnaf y bydd llawer o'r bwriadau da hyn yn diflannu i ryw gornel fach angof yng nghefn eich swyddfa oni wnewch yr ymrwymiad hwnnw heddiw. Dyna pam y mae ein gwelliant 3 yn galw am ymrwymiad i roi blaenoriaeth i ddatblygu cynaliadwy o ran gwariant. Efallai y byddwch yn dweud eich bod yn gwneud hynny eisoes, ond pe bai hynny yn wir, ni fyddai angen y cynllun gweithredu hwn. Dim ond yr wythnos hon, clywsom Sue Essex yn gwneud cyhoeddiad ar gyllideb newydd y Cynulliad. Nid oedd dim sôn am ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Felly, gobeithiaf y byddwch yn cefnogi gwelliant 3.

Bydd Jenny Randerson yn dweud rhagor am welliant 2, ynglŷn â'r angen am ddangosydd cadarn, yn debyg i CMC, a fyddai'n ein harwain ymlaen ac yn sicrhau bod pobl yn deall sut yr ydym yn mesur datblygu cynaliadwy. Yr wyf yn hoffi strwythur yr adroddiad, yn enwedig y cyfeiriad at ddimensiwn rhyngwladol; yr wyf yn falch o hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae braidd yn rhyfedd bod y Blaid Lafur yn San Steffan yn gallu bod yn agos at Mr Bush o ran y rhyfel, ond na all ddefnyddio ei dylanwad i ddarbwylllo pobl Gogledd America i dderbyn protocol Kyoto. Dyna'r her i'ch plaid, o gofio bod

dioxide emissions have increased.

Turning briefly to the other amendments, I am surprised that the Welsh Conservative's amendment 4 calls for flexibility on the renewable energy target. I am not sure which target it refers to, but there is a target to produce 10 per cent of electricity from renewable sources by 2010. It is a bit much for this party—which I often call the chameleon of politics, because it is green in one place and carbon black in another—to make such demands. They are building a windfarm in one place and—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Mick, you must wind up now.

**Mick Bates:** Finally, I like the quotations at the beginning of each section in the action plan and I ask the Minister if he would include the following quotation, which is particularly important:

'Our future is not a gift, but a reward for what we do now.'

Let us hope that your words about implementation and delivery come true for the sake of Wales.

**Glyn Davies:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Amendment 4: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Assembly Government to take a flexible approach to its 2010 renewable energy target, in order that dependence on on-shore wind turbines can be reduced.*

I propose amendment 5. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*recognises the contribution made to a sustainable Wales by country sports.*

I propose amendment 6. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*condemns the Welsh Assembly Government's lack of commitment to agri-environment schemes.*

gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid wedi cynyddu.

Gan droi'n fyr at y gwelliannau eraill, synnaf fod gwelliant 4 Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn galw am hyblygrwydd ynglŷn â'r targed ynni adnewyddadwy. Nid wyf yn siŵr at ba darged y mae'n cyfeirio, ond mae targed i gynhyrchu 10 y cant o drydan o ffynonellau adnewyddadwy erbyn 2010. Mae'n eironig braidd bod y blaid hon—cameleon y byd gwleidyddol, fel y'i galwaf yn aml, am ei bod yn wyrdd mewn un man ond mor ddu â charbon mewn man arall—yn galw am y fath beth. Maent yn adeiladu fferm wynt mewn un man ac—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mick, rhaid ichi ddirwyn i ben yn awr.

**Mick Bates:** Yn olaf, yr wyf yn hoffi'r dyfyniadau ar ddechrau pob adran yn y cynllun gweithredu a gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog a fyddai'n fodlon cynnwys y dyfyniad canlynol, sy'n bwysig iawn:

'Nid rhodd yw ein dyfodol, ond gwobr am yr hyn a wnawn yn awr.'

Gobeithiaf y bydd eich geiriau am weithredu a chyflwyno yn cael eu gwireddu er mwyn Cymru.

**Glyn Davies:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Gwelliant 4: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i fod yn hyblyg gyda'i tharged ar gyfer ynni adnewyddadwy erbyn 2010, er mwyn lleihau'r ddibyniaeth ar dyrbinau gwynt ar y tir.*

Cynigiaf welliant 5. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn cydnabod y cyfraniad y mae chwaraeon cefn gwlad yn ei wneud i Gymru gynaliadwy.*

Cynigiaf welliant 6. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn beirniadu diffyg ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol.*

I propose amendment 7. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*condemns the Welsh Assembly Government's refusal to allow the Brecon Beacons National Park to rule out new large-scale quarrying in its unitary development plan.*

I propose amendment 8. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure that the protection of the red squirrel continues following the sale of Assembly woodland by Forestry Commission Wales.*

I propose amendment 9. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*condemns the undermining of sustainable communities in Powys by the use of 'planning gain' which reduces the affordability of housing.*

We will withdraw amendment 9 because that subject deserves a more thorough debate than would be possible today. I also declare an interest in relation to amendment 4, as I have a potential family interest in an onshore windfarm. I suspect most of us in the Chamber will agree with the Minister's speech today. I certainly did, and we welcome the inclusion of a duty to promote sustainable development in the Government of Wales Act 1998. I also welcome the move from the concept of sustainable development to action on sustainable development, or, as the Minister said, the transfer from good intentions into change. I am not sure whether I accept Mick Bates's point about the importance of investing large sums of money at this stage. This is not about new money, as the Minister said—it is about attitude. We can argue about money, but we will not argue about attitude. When deciding on my amendments today, I specifically focused on the need to emphasise the mainstreaming of sustainable development and to include it at every level of decision making. A whole range of subject areas could have been chosen, but I chose a number of important ones that I wanted to introduce to this debate.

Cynigiaf welliant 7. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn beirniadu Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru am wrthod caniatáu i Barc Cenedlaethol Bannau Brycheiniog wahardd chwarela newydd ar raddfa eang yn ei gynllun datblygu unedol.*

Cynigiaf welliant 8. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau bod y wiwer goch yn parhau i gael ei hamddiffyn wedi i Gomisiwn Coedwigaeth Cymru werthu coetir sy'n eiddo i'r Cynulliad.*

Cynigiaf welliant 9. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn beirniadu'r ffaith bod cymunedau cynaliadwy ym Mhowys wedi cael eu tanseilio trwy ddefnyddio 'lles cynllunio', sy'n gwneud tai yn llai fforddiadwy.*

Tynnwn welliant 9 yn ôl am fod y pwnc hwnnw yn haeddu dadl fwy trwyadl nag a fyddai'n bosibl heddiw. Hefyd, datganaf fuddiant mewn perthynas â gwelliant 4, gan fod gennyf fuddiant teuluol posibl mewn fferm wynt ar y tir. Credaf y bydd y rhan fwyaf ohonom yn y Siambr yn cytuno ag araith y Gweinidog heddiw. Yn sicr gwneuthum innau, a chrosawn y penderfyniad i gynnwys dyletswydd i hyrwyddo datblygu cynaliadwy yn Neddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Croesawaf hefyd yr ymgais i symud o'r cysyniad o ddatblygu cynaliadwy i gamau gweithredu ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy, neu, fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, troi bwriadau da yn newidiadau. Nid wyf yn siŵr a dderbyniaf bwynt Mick Bates am bwysigrwydd buddsoddi symiau mawr o arian ar hyn o bryd. Nid oes a wnelo hyn ag arian newydd, fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog—agweddau pobl sy'n bwysig. Gallwn ddadlau ynglŷn ag arian, ond ni fyddwn yn dadlau ynglŷn ag agweddau. Wrth benderfynu ar fy ngwelliannau heddiw, canolbwyntiais yn benodol ar yr angen am bwysleisio'r gwaith o brif ffrydio datblygu cynaliadwy a'i gynnwys ym mhob lefel o'r broses gwneud penderfyniadau. Gellid bod wedi dewis nifer fawr o feysydd, ond

dewisais nifer o feysydd pwysig yr oeddwn am eu cyflwyno i'r ddadl hon.

First, on amendment 4, we have asked for some flexibility with regard to the target of having 10 per cent of energy production from renewable energy sources by 2010. I put much consideration into tabling this amendment, but I would not want to give the impression that we are not committed to trying to achieve that target—we are. There is no doubt that climate change is perhaps the most important issue that we will face over the next few years, and it will become even more important. I do not know whether the problem is the result of man's activities—we are not debating that—but whether it is or not makes no difference. It is clear that climate change is becoming a massively important issue, and we must address it. My concern about the target results from my acceptance of the thrust of the Minister's argument in the TAN 8 consultation document. However, if the target is to be achieved, the only practical way of achieving it, because of the state of knowledge about renewable energy sources, is through a massive expansion of onshore wind power. If other sources of renewable energy can be developed to enable that target to be introduced without a massive concentration on just one source, that would be good news. However, I do not want us to pursue a short-term target and pollute the support for tackling climate change that exists throughout Wales by going down a road that will create a great deal of opposition.

**Helen Mary Jones:** We can all have some sympathy with your concerns, but will you define the nature of this flexibility that you are asking for? Some of us are, frankly, sceptical that flexibility, from the Conservatives, is more about junking than about flexibility. I hope that you can reassure me otherwise.

**Glyn Davies:** I am not sure what that means, but flexibility means the potential to reduce the target, or to move the date by which the target might be achieved forward to some

Yn gyntaf, o ran gwelliant 4, yr ydym wedi gofyn am rywffaint o hyblygrwydd o ran y targed o gynhyrchu 10 y cant o ynni o ffynonellau ynni adnewyddadwy erbyn 2010. Myfyriais gryn dipyn wrth gyflwyno'r gwelliant hwn, ond ni hoffwn roi'r argraff nad ydym yn ymrwymedig i geisio cyflawni'r targed hwnnw—yr ydym yn ymrwymedig. Nid oes amheuaeth mai newid yn yr hinsawdd o bosibl yw'r mater pwysicaf y byddwn yn ei wynebu dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf, a bydd yn dod yn bwysicach byth. Ni wn ai gweithgareddau dynol sydd wedi achosi'r broblem—nid dyna destun ein dadl heddiw—ond pa un a yw hynny'n wir ai peidio nid oes gwahaniaeth. Mae'n amlwg bod newid yn yr hinsawdd yn dod yn fater hynod bwysig, a rhaid inni fynd i'r afael ag ef. Mae fy mhryder ynglŷn â'r targed yn codi o'r ffaith fy mod yn derbyn byrdwn dadl y Gweinidog yn y ddogfen ymgynghori ar TAN 8. Fodd bynnag, er mwyn cyflawni'r targed, yr unig ffordd ymarferol o'i gyflawni, o ystyried y wybodaeth gyfredol am ffynonellau ynni adnewyddadwy, yw drwy ehangu ar raddfa fawr ynni'r gwynt ar y tir. Os gellir datblygu ffynonellau eraill o ynni adnewyddadwy a fydd yn ein galluogi i gyflwyno'r targed hwnnw heb ganolbwyntio bron yn gyfan gwbl ar un ffynhonnell yn unig, byddai hynny yn newyddion da. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf am inni anelu at darged byrdymor a llygru'r gefnogaeth i fynd i'r afael â newid yn yr hinsawdd a geir ledled Cymru drwy fynd ar drywydd a fydd yn creu cryn wrthwynebiad.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Gall pob un ohonom gydymdeimlo rywffaint â'ch pryderon, ond a wnech ddiffinio natur yr hyblygrwydd hwn yr ydych yn gofyn amdano? A dweud y gwir, mae gan rai ohonom amheuan mai cael gwared o'r targed yn hytrach na bod yn hyblyg yn ei gylch sydd gan y Ceidwadwyr mewn golwg. Gobeithiaf eich bod yn gallu rhoi sicrwydd imi nad yw hynny'n wir.

**Glyn Davies:** Nid wyf yn siŵr beth yw ystyr hynny, ond mae hyblygrwydd yn golygu'r posibilrwydd o ostwng y targed hwnnw, neu symud y dyddiad ar gyfer cyflawni'r targed

extent. We would like to see the target reached, but I believe that the TAN 8 consultation document, in its current form, will create much opposition and contention. It may be possible to change the document when we discuss it in committee later, and that is why I use the term 'flexibility' and nothing more definitive.

In amendment 5, I raise the issue of country sports. Over recent years, there has been much discussion about welfare and liberty issues around country sports. However, there has been little discussion about the contribution that country sports make to economic activity and the sustainability of the environment. In the part of Wales where I live, the contribution of country sports to the economy and the environment is massive and, in some areas, is greater than that of agriculture. To turn to amendment 8, I chose red squirrels as the subject of this amendment, but I could have chosen skylarks, Manx shearwaters, the pearl-bordered fritillary, or, indeed, the house sparrow. I chose the red squirrel because I have a personal interest in promoting the interests of this rare species. The issue is about the Forestry Commission controlling Government land, and its decision to sell a forest in Ynys Môn, without consulting the bodies that are concerned with the protection of the red squirrel. That was a low-key decision, which demonstrated that the sustainable development argument is not reaching that level. I hope that the Minister will make a commitment on that; I am sure that he will.

3.50 p.m.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** It is a great pleasure to talk about one of the key challenges of the future, that of sustainability, and to welcome the sustainable development action plan. We must all work together on sustainable development, not only Governments and businesses, but communities and individuals, to ensure the future of our people and our country.

It is widely recognised that there are three prongs to sustainable development—economic, social and environmental factors.

i'r dyfodol i ryw raddau. Hoffem weld y targed yn cael ei gyflawni, ond credaf y bydd y ddogfen ymgynghori ar TAN 8, ar ei ffurf bresennol, yn creu cryn wrthwynebiad a dadleuon. Efallai y bydd yn bosibl newid y ddogfen wrth inni ei thrafod yn y pwyllgor yn nes ymlaen, a dyna pam y defnyddiaf y term 'hyblygrwydd' a dim byd mwy pendant.

O ran gwelliant 5, codaf fater chwaraeon cefn gwlad. Dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf, bu llawer o drafodaeth ynglŷn â materion lles a rhyddid o ran chwaraeon cefn gwlad. Fodd bynnag, ni fu fawr o drafodaeth ynglŷn â'r cyfraniad a wna chwaraeon cefn gwlad i weithgaredd economaidd a chynaliadwyedd yr amgylchedd. Yn y rhan o Gymru lle yr wyf yn byw, mae cyfraniad chwaraeon cefn gwlad i'r economi a'r amgylchedd yn un sylweddol ac, mewn rhai ardaloedd, mae'n gwneud mwy o gyfraniad nag amaethyddiaeth. Gan droi at welliant 8, dewisais wiwerod cochion fel testun y gwelliant hwn, ond gallwn fod wedi dewis ehedyddion, pâl Manaw, brith perlog, neu, yn wir, adar y to. Dewisais y wiwer goch am fod gennyf ddiddordeb personol mewn hyrwyddo buddiannau'r rhywogaeth brin hon. Y mater dan sylw yw rheolaeth y Comisiwn Coedwigaeth dros dir y Llywodraeth, a'i benderfyniad i werthu coedwig ar Ynys Môn, heb ymgynghori â'r cyrff sy'n ceisio gwarchod y wiwer goch. Yr oedd hynny yn benderfyniad a wnaed ar lefel isel, a ddangosodd nad yw'r ddadl ynglŷn â datblygu cynaliadwy yn cyrraedd y lefel honno. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn gwneud ymrwymiad ar hynny; yr wyf yn sicr y gwnaiff.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Mae'n bleser mawr siarad am un o heriau allweddol y dyfodol, sef cynaliadwyedd, a chroesawu'r cynllun gweithredu datblygu cynaliadwy. Rhaid i bob un ohonom gydweithio ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy, nid dim ond Llywodraethau a busnesau, ond cymunedau ac unigolion, er mwyn sicrhau dyfodol ein pobl a'n gwlad.

Cydnabyddir yn gyffredinol fod tair elfen i ddatblygu cynaliadwy—ffactorau economaidd, cymdeithasol ac amgylcheddol.

Eradicating poverty is indispensable to sustainable development. In Wales, everyone should have the opportunity to fulfil their potential, through access to high-quality public services, education and employment opportunities, decent housing and good local environments. The sustainable development action plan, working in tandem with the aims of 'Wales: A Better Country', will ensure that Wales's economic prosperity goes hand in hand with sustainability for the first time. Many of the forces that work against sustainability are the everyday pressures of economic development and, quite rightly, Governments, businesses and communities strive to build a prosperous economy to support a viable society. That is why I hosted an event last week during which Simon Brooks, the head of the Welsh Institute for Competitive Advantage, explained the unique needs of Welsh businesses in the field of sustainability. I am sure that there will be developments from that meeting. We all know that a vibrant entrepreneur-led economy is key to Wales's success. However, since the establishment of the Assembly, and its statutory duty to be sustainable, we have all come to realise that economies must be based on sustainability for long-term prosperity and stability. Economic growth that does not integrate environmental and social factors is not a sustainable development.

The action plan is right to look hard at our patterns of production and consumption. That is clearly our biggest challenge. We must begin by putting our house in order and that is why the procurement initiative is so important—we must practice what we preach. Using the public sector spending power, which amounts to some £4 billion, on goods and services will be a tremendous boost as the public sector works more sustainably and helps to achieve change. To decouple economic growth from environmental degradation we must address the impact of products and services across their life cycle, through manufacture, distribution, use and disposal. I am pleased that this is an important aspect of the action plan.

Working in partnership with businesses is

Rhaid dileu tiodi er mwyn cyflawni datblygu cynaliadwy. Yng Nghymru, dylai pawb gael y cyfle i gyflawni eu potensial, drwy wasanaethau cyhoeddus o safon dda, cyfleoedd addysg a chyflogaeth, tai safonol ac amgylchedd lleol da. Bydd y cynllun gweithredu datblygu cynaliadwy, gan weithio ar y cyd â nodau 'Cymru: Gwlad Well', yn sicrhau bod ffyniant economaidd Cymru yn mynd law yn llaw â chynaliadwyedd am y tro cyntaf. Ymhlith y lluoedd niferus sy'n gweithio yn erbyn cynaliadwyedd y mae pwysau pob dydd datblygu economaidd ac, yn hollol deg, mae Llywodraethau, busnesau a chymunedau yn ymdrechu i adeiladu economi ffyniannus i gynnal cymdeithas ddichonadwy. Dyna pam y cynhelais ddigwyddiad yr wythnos diwethaf lle yr esboniodd Simon Brooks, pennaeth Sefydliad Cymru er Mantais Gystadleuol, anghenion unigryw busnesau Cymru ym maes cynaliadwyedd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd datblygiadau yn deillio o'r cyfarfod hwnnw. Gwyddom oll mai economi fywiog a arweinir gan entrepreneuriaid yw'r allwedd i lwyddiant Cymru. Fodd bynnag, ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad, a'i ddyletswydd statudol i gynaliadwyedd, yr ydym oll wedi sylweddoli bod yn rhaid i economïau fod yn seiliedig ar gynaliadwyedd er mwyn cael ffyniant a sefydlogrwydd yn yr hirdymor. Nid datblygu cynaliadwy yw twf economaidd sy'n methu ag integreiddio ffactorau amgylcheddol a chymdeithasol.

Mae'n briodol bod y cynllun gweithredu yn edrych o ddifrif ar ein patrymau cynhyrchu a defnyddio. Dyna'r her fwyaf inni mae'n amlwg. Rhaid inni ddechrau drwy roi trefn ar bethau yma a dyna pam mae'r fenter gaffael mor bwysig—rhaid inni ddilyn ein pregeth ein hunain. Bydd defnyddio grym gwario'r sector cyhoeddus, sef tua £4 biliwn, ar nwyddau a gwasanaethau yn hwb mawr wrth i'r sector cyhoeddus weithio'n fwy cynaliadwy a helpu i gyflawni newid. Er mwyn datgysylltu twf economaidd oddi wrth ddirywiad amgylcheddol, rhaid inni fynd i'r afael ag effaith cynnyrch a gwasanaethau o'r dechrau i'r diwedd, drwy weithgynhyrchu, dosbarthu, defnyddio a gwaredu. Yr wyf yn falch bod hyn yn agwedd bwysig ar y cynllun gweithredu.

Mae gweithio mewn partneriaeth â busnesau

clearly essential in this regard. The Confederation of British Industry and the Federation of Small Businesses are willing partners in working for a better Wales. That is why I welcome the plan's commitment to launch a second-phase business and environmental action plan and a review of our waste strategy in 2007. We must encourage an environmentally aware civil society. Consumers should have access to information so that they can make more sustainable choices, and that is why the media campaign to promote waste minimalisation, recycling and energy efficiency is vital, if we are to raise the importance of the issue in the national psyche and make sustainability second nature.

When we look at the global picture, at the threat of climate change, at our unsustainable patterns of production and consumption, and at the chronic poverty that still exists, particularly in Africa, for example, we see that much more needs to be done across the world. On this point, I was pleased to attend the Africa Matters reception, sponsored by the Amicus trade union, that was held here yesterday evening. The meeting was addressed by Willy Madisha—I hope that I pronounced his name correctly—the president of the Congress of South African Trade Unions, who spoke graphically about the importance of issues such as this one to southern Africa. It is vital that the action plan fits neatly into the UK's wider sustainable development strategy, and forms the basis of a strategy that challenges expectation and ensures that the UK can be a leading advocate for pressurising change around the world. The key to being able to make that change is proving that we are passionate about sustainability. This action plan will mean that Wales can hold its head high on the world stage and lead from the front in pushing for a more sustainable approach around the world.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I appeal for brief speeches. Members will realise that it is now 3.55 p.m. and that we have a deadline of 5.00 p.m. to begin the short debate. Where possible, brief speeches would be appreciated.

yn amlwg yn hanfodol yn hyn o beth. Mae Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain a'r Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach yn bartneriaid parod o ran gweithio dros Gymru well. Dyna pam y croesawaf ymrwymiad y cynllun i lansio cynllun gweithredu ail gam i fusnesau a'r amgylchedd ac adolygiad o'n strategaeth wastraff yn 2007. Rhaid inni annog cymdeithas ddinesig sy'n ymwybodol o'r amgylchedd. Dylai gwybodaeth fod ar gael i ddefnyddwyr er mwyn iddynt allu gwneud mwy o ddewisiadau cynaliadwy, a dyna pam mae'r ymgyrch yn y cyfryngau i annog pobl i gynhyrchu cyn lleied o wastraff â phosibl ac i hyrwyddo ailgylchu ac effeithlonrwydd ynni yn hollbwysig, er mwyn inni godi pwysigrwydd y mater ym meddylfryd y genedl a sicrhau bod cynaliadwyedd yn ail natur inni.

Pan edrychwn ar y darlun byd-eang, ar fygythiad newid yn yr hinsawdd, ar ein patrymau anghynaliadwy o gynhyrchu a defnyddio, ac ar y tlodi enbyd sy'n bodoli o hyd, yn enwedig yn Affrica, er enghraifft, fe welwn fod angen gwneud llawer mwy ledled y byd. O ran y pwynt hwn, roedd yn bleser gennyf fynychu derbyniad ymgyrch Africa Matters, a noddir gan undeb llafur Amicus, a gynhaliwyd yma neithiwr. Anerchwyd y cyfarfod gan Willy Madisha—gobeithiaf imi ynganu ei enw yn gywir—llywydd Cyngres Undebau Llafur De Affrica, a siaradodd yn fywiog am bwysigrwydd materion megis hwn i dde Affrica. Mae'n hollbwysig bod y cynllun gweithredu'n cydweddu'n dda â strategaeth datblygu cynaliadwy ehangach y DU, a'i fod yn sail i strategaeth a fydd yn herio disgwyliadau ac yn sicrhau y gall y DU fod yn un o'r prif eiriolwyr dros newid ledled y byd. Yr allwedd i allu gwneud y newid hwnnw yw profi ein bod yn frwdfrydig dros gynaliadwyedd. Bydd y cynllun gweithredu hwn yn golygu y gall Cymru ddal ei phen yn uchel ar lwyfan y byd ac arwain y gad o ran pwyso am ymagwedd fwy cynaliadwy dros y byd i gyd.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Apeliaf at Aelodau am areithiau byr. Bydd Aelodau yn sylweddoli ei bod hi'n 3.55 p.m. a bod yn rhaid inni ddechrau'r ddadl fer erbyn 5.00 p.m.. Lle bynnag y bo modd, gwerthfawrogn areithiau byr.



**Alun Ffred Jones:** Mae llawer sy'n dda ynglŷn â'r ddogfen hon, ac nid oes angen imi ailadrodd y gefnogaeth gyffredinol iddi. Er hynny, mae'r diffyg targedau a manylion am weithredu ymarferol yn wendid. Os ydym o ddiffrif eisiau i'r cyhoedd afael yn y syniad o ddatblygu cynaliadwy, mae gwaith addysgu enfawr o'n blaen. O ran y ddogfen hon, mae ei hieithwedd yn broblemus. Mae'n iawn i gyfreithwyr ddefnyddio iaith sy'n annealladwy i'r rhan fwyaf o bobl er mwyn cynnal dirgeledd y proffesiwn, ond nid yw hynny'n ddigon da i raglen fel hon—oni bai eich bod yn ceisio celu'r gwir. Fy awgrym yw y dylid rhoi cytundeb i gwmi i gyfleu sylfaen yr adroddiad hwn mewn llyfryn hwylus, ymarferol a dealladwy i'w ddsbarthu i bob ysgol, coleg, cyngor a chymdeithas fel y bydd pawb yn deall yr hyn sydd raid ei gyflawni yn y blynyddoedd nesaf a sut mae cyrraedd yno.

Trafodaf yn fyr un adran yn unig o'r cynllun, sef cymunedau cryf. Mae cyfeiriad at 'fframwaith cadarn eisoes ar waith'. Rhan o'r fframwaith hwnnw yw 'Iaith Pawb'. Yr wyf yn byw mewn cymuned ôl-ddiwydiannol lle mae'r Gymraeg yn dal yn iaith gymunedol fyw. Mae parhad yr iaith fel iaith gymunedol yn un o amcanion 'Iaith Pawb' ac yn rhan o'r weledigaeth gynaliadwy. Serch hynny, o edrych ar 'Iaith Pawb', ni allaf yn fy myw gyfeirio at un peth ynddi sy'n dylanwadu'n gadarnhaol ac ymarferol ar barhad yr iaith yn y dyffryn. Mae'r bwch rhwng rhethreg a realiti yn anferth, ac ni allwn barhau yn y modd hwn.

Yr elfen bwysicaf ar hyn o bryd sy'n tansellio llawer o gymunedau gwledig a lled-drefol yw anallu pobl a theluoedd ifanc i gael gafael ar dŷ fforddiadwy. Mae cyfeiriad yma at annog awdurdodau parciau cenedlaethol i ddarparu tai cynaliadwy cost-isel. Oni ddylai'r anogaeth honno fod ar bob awdurdod cyhoeddus ac nid dim ond y parciau cenedlaethol?

Yr wyf newydd wrando ar brofiad yr Alban lle mae uned tir cymunedol wedi'i ffurfio er 1997. Yr oedd cyfarwyddwr yr uned yn gallu cyfeirio at gymunedau wedi'u grymuso, a

**Alun Ffred Jones:** There is much to commend in this document, and I do not need to reiterate the general support for it. However, the absence of targets and detail about practical application is a weakness. If we seriously want the public to embrace the concept of sustainable development, we have a great deal of educating to do. With regard to this document, the language is problematic. It is fine for lawyers to use language that is impenetrable to the majority of people to maintain the mystique of the profession, but that is not good enough for a programme such as this—unless you are trying to hide the truth. My suggestion is that a contract should be awarded to a company to communicate the basics of this report in an easy-to-use, practical and understandable booklet to be distributed to every school, college, council and society so that everyone will know what must be achieved in the coming years and how to achieve it.

I will briefly discuss just one section of the scheme, namely strong communities. There is a reference that a 'strong framework is already in place'. Part of that framework is 'Iaith Pawb'. I live in a post-industrial community where Welsh is still a living community language. The survival of Welsh as a community language is one of the aims of 'Iaith Pawb' and part of the vision for sustainability. However, in looking at 'Iaith Pawb', I cannot for the life of me find reference to anything that could have a positive or practical influence on the language's continued existence in the vale. There is a vast chasm between rhetoric and reality, and we cannot continue in this way.

The most important element that is currently undermining many of our rural and semi-urban communities is young people and families' inability to obtain affordable housing. Reference is made to encouraging national park authorities to provide low-cost sustainable housing. Should not every public authority be encouraged to provide such housing and not just the national parks?

I have just listened to Scotland's experience where a community land unit has been in existence since 1997. The unit's director could refer to communities that had been

bod cynaliadwyedd yn cael ei hyrwyddo drwy'r rhaglen honno. Daeth 200,000 erw i berchenogaeth cymunedau, gyda 400,000 ar y ffordd. Mae codi ac adnewyddu tai yn rhan o'r rhaglen, a'r cynlluniau yn codi o'r cymunedau eu hunain. Byddwn lawer mwy bodlon gyda'r cynllun gweithredu hwn pe bai ynddo enghreifftiau penodol yn hytrach na geiriau fel 'cyhoeddi', 'arfarnu', 'fframwaith', 'annog' ac ati. Yr her yw troi'r dymuniadau da hyn yn weithredu ymarferol ar lawr gwlad.

**Brian Gibbons:** The action plan is firm evidence that, at last, the Welsh Assembly Government is getting to grips with the statutory obligation for sustainable development. It is a unique statutory requirement, but it is fair to say that, throughout most of the first Assembly, it was more a statement of principle, aspiration and intention. It is only now that, with the introduction of the action plan, we are really starting to move the agenda forward, with the possible exception of the excellent progress that we have made on the social justice agenda with programmes such as Communities First, the Townsend formula on health and so on. Outside that area, I think that we have much progress to make. That was brought home to me during a meeting at the beginning of the summer, sponsored by the Construction Industry Training Board, which Jeff Cuthbert also attended. One of the people at that event complained that the Welsh Assembly Government was not stringent enough in using its capacity as a customer in the private sector procurement and they said that, for example, in the area of training, they were unhappy that the Assembly Government was not using its full capacity. They found that their company, as a good practitioner and trainer in the construction industry, was being undercut by competitors who did not have the same commitment to training and sustainable development. In such areas where health and safety and apprenticeship and training are crucial and where there are problems such as bogus self-employment, it is a sad reflection that a major player made this comment. Hopefully, the action plan will mean that this type of comment will not be made in the

rejuvenated and to the promotion of sustainability through that programme. Some 200,000 acres have come into community ownership, with a further 400,000 on the way. The building and renovation of housing is part of that programme, and the plans originate from within the communities themselves. I would be far happier with this action plan were it to contain specific examples rather than words such as 'issuing', 'appraisal', 'framework', 'encourage', and so on. The challenge is to turn these laudable aspirations into practical action on the ground.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae'r cynllun gweithredu yn dystiolaeth gadarn fod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, o'r diwedd, yn mynd i'r afael â'r rhwymedigaeth statudol ynglŷn â datblygu cynaliadwy. Mae'n ofyniad statudol unigryw, ond mae'n deg dweud, drwy gydol y rhan fwyaf o'r Cynulliad cyntaf, nad oedd ond yn ddatganiad o egwyddor, dyhead a bwriad. Dim ond yn awr, yn sgîl cyflwyno'r cynllun gweithredu, yr ydym yn wir ddechrau symud yr agenda yn ei blaen, gyda'r eithriad posibl o'r cynnydd rhagorol a wnaethom ar yr agenda cyfiawnder cymdeithasol gyda rhaglenni megis Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, fformiwla Townsend ar iechyd ac ati. Y tu allan i'r maes hwnnw, credaf fod gennym gryn dipyn i'w wneud. Sylweddolais hynny yn ystod cyfarfod ar ddechrau'r haf, a noddwyd gan Fwrdd Hyfforddi'r Diwydiant Adeiladu, a fynychwyd gan Jeff Cuthbert hefyd. Cwynodd un o'r bobl yn y digwyddiad hwnnw nad oedd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ddigon llym wrth ddefnyddio ei gallu fel cwsmer yn caffael yn y sector preifat a dywedodd, er enghraifft, ym maes hyfforddiant, ei fod yn anfodlon nad oedd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn defnyddio ei gallu yn llawn. Yn ei brofiad ef nid oedd ei gwmmi, fel ymarferydd a hyfforddwr da yn y diwydiant adeiladu, yn gallu cystadlu o ran pris â chwmnïau eraill nad oedd ganddynt yr un ymrwymiad i hyfforddi a datblygu cynaliadwy. Mewn meysydd o'r fath lle y mae iechyd a diogelwch a phrentisiaethau a hyfforddiant yn hollbwysig a lle y cyfyd problemau megis hunan-gyflogaeth ffug, mae'n drist nodi bod cwmni pwysig wedi gwneud y sylw hwn. Gobeithiaf y bydd y cynllun gweithredu yn golygu na fydd sylwadau o'r fath yn cael eu gwneud yn y

future.

dyfodol.

4.00 p.m.

The action plan gives us an opportunity to develop an integrated approach across all of our agendas. In the Economic Development and Transport Committee meeting this morning, we heard a good example of where this type of approach is needed when we discussed the benefits of dualling the Heads of the Valleys road. It was pointed out that something more than simply providing a better road was needed in this area. The action plan speaks of liveable places and strong communities, and the point was made in the committee meeting that we need to improve the built-up and natural environment of these communities, because they will not be sustainable in future if we do not address all of these dimensions.

Mae'r cynllun gweithredu yn rhoi cyfle inni ddatblygu agenda integredig ar draws pob un o'n hagedâu. Yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth y bore yma, clywsom enghraifft dda o ble mae angen gweithredu o'r fath, pan drafodwyd manteision deuoli ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd gennym. Nodwyd bod angen darparu mwy na ffordd well yn yr ardal hon. Mae'r cynllun gweithredu yn sôn am leoedd y gellir byw ynddynt a chymunedau cryf, a gwnaed y pwynt yng nghyfarfod y pwyllgor fod angen inni wella amgylchedd adeiledig a naturiol y cymunedau hyn, am na fyddant yn gynaliadwy yn y dyfodol os nad awn i'r afael â phob un o'r dimensiynau hyn.

This document emphasises the importance of climate change and the challenge that that brings. The objectives of creating liveable places and achieving our targets for climate change lead us to where the balance should be in the guidance document, technical advice note 8.

Mae'r ddogfen hon yn pwysleisio pwysigrwydd newid yn yr hinsawdd a'r her a ddaw yn ei sgîl. Mae'r amcanion o greu lleoedd y gellir byw ynddynt a chyflawni ein targedau ar gyfer newid yn yr hinsawdd yn ein tywys at y cydbwysedd cywir yn y ddogfen arweiniad, nodyn cyngor technegol 8.

It is true that wind power will bear the brunt of our delivering our 4 terawatt target by 2010. However, nothing in this document provides justification for delivering this target through the clustering strategy, which is explicit—although I think that the word 'implicit' has been used—in the TAN 8 guidance, and it is not acceptable that this strategy should have an over-dependence on a limited number of communities, placing a great burden on them when they are struggling with their natural and built environment. Other parts of the United Kingdom, which also have renewable energy targets, are not going down the clustering road. We are doing something different in Wales in terms of our sustainable development strategy and renewable energy, and it needs justification.

Mae'n wir mai ynni'r gwynt fydd y brif ffynhonnell ar gyfer cyflawni ein targed o 4 terawat erbyn 2010. Fodd bynnag, nid oes dim yn y ddogfen hon yn cyfiawnhau cyflawni'r targed hwn drwy'r strategaeth glystyru, sy'n amlwg—er y credaf i'r gair 'ymhlyg' gael ei ddefnyddio—yn y canllawiau TAN 8, ac nid yw'n dderbyniol i'r strategaeth hon fod yn or-ddibynnol ar nifer fach o gymunedau, gan roi baich mawr arnynt a hwythau'n wynebu anawsterau gyda'u hamgylchedd naturiol ac adeiledig. Mewn rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig, sydd â thargedau ynni adnewyddadwy hefyd, nid oes strategaeth glystyru. Yr ydym yn gwneud rhywbeth gwahanol yng Nghymru, o ran ein strategaeth datblygu cynaliadwy ac ynni adnewyddadwy, ac mae angen cyfiawnhau hynny.

**Glyn Davies:** I note your comment on clustering, and I agree with it—that will be part of the discussion. However, can we achieve the target without going down the

**Glyn Davies:** Nodaf eich sylw ar glystyru, a chytunaf—bydd hynny yn rhan o'r drafodaeth. Fodd bynnag, a allwn gyflawni'r targed heb greu ynni'r gwynt ar y tir ar y

road of having the degree of wind power being created onshore that is mentioned in the TAN 8 consultation document, and stick with all the targets that we are already committed to achieving?

**Brian Gibbons:** The target is challenging, and if we were to rely purely on onshore windfarms, it might be unattainable, but if you read the document, you will see that it states that, while 6 to 8 per cent of our renewable energy will come from onshore windfarms, the other 2 to 4 per cent will come from other sources. Therefore, it is possible to deliver that target, but it must be an obligation on a wider range of citizens in Wales. This is a national duty for all of us, and it should not be confined to a limited part of Wales.

**Brynle Williams:** I support my colleagues who have contributed to this debate. This is an important issue, with key strands that affect us all in some way. It is an area where all Ministers have collective responsibility. The Conservative Party amendments are sensible, and all Members should be able to sign up to them. Rejecting these amendments would be irresponsible. It would send out a signal that the Assembly is not working constructively for the good of the people of Wales.

We need a sustainable society that has a population with a balanced age structure, which recognises and nurtures indigenous cultures, living and thriving communities with access to public services, which meet local needs, and where people participate in the process of making decisions about their own future. The gross shortage of affordable housing is a continuing problem. This applies not only in north Wales, but in south Wales. We have had glossy reports, but it is time that we all moved forward: radical thinking is needed.

Reference has also been made to the sustainability of field sports and their contribution to the community.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Will you join me in commending organisations such as the British Association for Shooting and Conservation and the Countryside Alliance?

raddfa y cyfeirir ati yn y ddogfen ymgynghori ar TAN 8, a chadw at bob un o'r targedau yr ydym eisoes wedi addo eu cyflawni?

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae'r targed yn un heriol, a phe baem yn dibynnu ar ffermydd gwynt ar y tir yn unig, efallai na fyddai modd ei gyflawni, ond os darllenwch y ddogfen, fe welwch ei bod yn nodi, er y bydd 6 i 8 y cant o'n hynni adnewyddadwy yn dod o ffermydd gwynt ar y tir, y bydd y 2 i 4 y cant arall yn dod o ffynonellau eraill. Felly, mae'n bosibl cyflawni'r targed hwnnw, ond rhaid iddo fod yn ddyletswydd ar nifer fwy o bobl yng Nghymru. Mae hyn yn ddyletswydd genedlaethol i bob un ohonom, ac nid i ran o Gymru yn unig.

**Brynle Williams:** Cefnogaf fy nghyd-Aelodau sydd wedi cyfrannu at y ddatl hon. Mae hwn yn fater pwysig, gyda llinynnau allweddol sy'n effeithio ar bob un ohonom ryw ffordd neu'i gilydd. Mae'n faes lle mae gan bob Gweinidog gyd-gyfrifoldeb. Mae gwelliannau'r Blaid Geidwadol yn rhai synhwyrol, a dylai pob Aelod allu eu cefnogi. Byddai'n anghyfrifol gwrthod y gwelliannau hyn. Byddai'n dangos nad yw'r Cynulliad yn gweithio'n adeiladol er budd pobl Cymru.

Mae angen cymdeithas gynaliadwy sydd â phoblogaeth sy'n gytbwys o ran oedran, sy'n cydnabod ac yn meithrin diwylliannau brodorol, cymunedau byw a llewyrchus sy'n cael gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, sy'n diwallu anghenion lleol, a lle y mae pobl yn cymryd rhan yn y broses o wneud penderfyniadau ynglŷn â'u dyfodol. Mae'r prinder mawr o dai fforddiadwy yn broblem o hyd. Mae hyn yn wir nid yn unig yn y Gogledd, ond yn y De. Yr ydym wedi cael adroddiadau swmpus, ond mae'n bryd i bob un ohonom symud ymlaen: syniadau radical sydd eu hangen.

Cyfeiriwyd hefyd at gynaliadwyedd hela a'i gyfraniad i'r gymuned.

**Laura Anne Jones:** A ymunwch â mi i gymeradwyo mudiadau megis Cymdeithas Saethu a Chadwraeth Prydain a'r Gynghrair Cefn Gwlad? Mae'n ymwneud â sawl

It is involved in several projects that promote conservation by integrating the management of shooting land into local biodiversity plans, aimed at increasing the quality and quantity of wildlife. Would you therefore join me in urging Members to support amendment 5, which recognises the important role that country sports play in sustainable development?

**Brynle Williams:** Certainly. We had a presentation in the neuadd recently; I believe that the sum could be as much as £200 million.

As a farmer, I did not particularly like the idea of live export, but that was worth £100 million; here we have something that can sustain and benefit the whole countryside. We need a sustainable economy that provides prosperity for all rural communities through increased economic activity and higher incomes. There needs to be a variety of employment opportunities in a range of industries and services. This is not rocket science, and should be a matter of course. We need a sustainable environment where the natural and built heritage is conserved, enhanced and managed as a positive asset. Wales is steeped in heritage, which we must nurture and protect.

A strong, sustainable policy framework is essential. We need to ensure that the integrated development and coherent implementation of the policies and programmes that affect rural Wales are working for the people of Wales. We have made a start, but we need to go further and quicker.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I appreciate the succinct speeches that Members are making.

**Val Lloyd:** I will focus on one key element included in the action plan, albeit an important one, namely supporting Welsh business in sustainable production. Ensuring that businesses actively develop sustainable ways of working can lead to tangible environmental and economic benefits, and I am encouraged by the work that has already been undertaken. The innovative Business

prosiect sy'n hyrwyddo cadwraeth drwy integreiddio'r ffordd y rheolir tir saethu â chynlluniau bioamrywiaeth lleol, gyda'r nod o wella ansawdd bywyd gwyllt a chynyddu niferoedd. A ymunech â mi, felly, i annog Aelodau i gefnogi gwelliant 5, sy'n cydnabod y rhan bwysig y mae chwaraeon cefn gwlad yn ei chwarae o ran datblygu cynaliadwy?

**Brynle Williams:** Yn sicr. Cawsom gyflwyniad yn y neuadd yn ddiweddar; credaf fod y swm gymaint â £200 miliwn o bosibl.

Fel ffermwr, nid oeddwn yn hoff iawn o'r syniad o allforio anifeiliaid byw, ond yr oedd y fasnach honno yn werth £100 miliwn; yma mae gennym rywbeth a all gynnal a bod o fudd i bob rhan o gefn gwlad. Mae angen inni gael economi gynaliadwy sy'n golygu bod pob cymuned wledig yn ffynnu drwy weithgaredd economaidd uwch ac incwm uwch. Mae angen amrywiaeth o gyfleoedd gwaith mewn nifer o ddiwydiannau a gwasanaethau. Nid yw hyn yn gymhleth, dylai ddigwydd fel mater o drefn. Mae angen amgylchedd cynaliadwy lle y caiff y dreftadaeth naturiol ac adeiledig ei diogelu, ei gwella a'i rheoli fel ased cadarnhaol. Mae gan Gymru dreftadaeth fawr, y mae'n rhaid inni ei meithrin a'i diogelu.

Mae fframwaith polisi cynaliadwy a chryf yn hanfodol. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod y ffordd y caiff y polisiau a'r rhaglenni sy'n effeithio ar Gymru wledig eu datblygu a'u rhoi ar waith mewn modd integredig a chydlynus yn gweithio i bobl Cymru. Yr ydym wedi dechrau, ond mae angen inni fynd ymhellach ac yn gynt.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Gwerthfawrogaf arweithiau cryno yr Aelodau.

**Val Lloyd:** Canolbwyntiaf ar un elfen allweddol ond un bwysig yn y cynllun gweithredu, sef helpu busnesau Cymru i gynhyrchu mewn modd cynaliadwy. Mae sicrhau bod busnesau yn mynd ati i ddatblygu ffyrdd cynaliadwy o weithio yn gallu arwain at fanteision amgylcheddol ac economaidd gwirioneddol, ac fe'm calonogir gan y gwaith sydd eisoes wedi'i wneud. Mae Cynllun

and Environment Action Plan for Wales, which was launched last year, is indicative of the ongoing commitment towards more sustainable, greener business practices. The plan is a means of co-coordinating and emphasising the considerable support service that is available to assist the business sector, and this action plan has already delivered many successful working partnerships with key organisations to support business.

The business sector is not only being given encouragement, but it is being provided with the practical means to develop sustainable practices, giving it the necessary tools and support, and advances have been made. Due to time constraints, I refer you to the business and environment action plan annual report for this year, which highlights innovative and sustainable practice now prevalent in industries. A crucial factor in promoting continued change is the establishment of an expert panel on resource management that will establish a framework for business needs in the longer term.

4.10 p.m.

Sustainable development is becoming a consideration for those at the sharp end. Progress is being made, but it is important to ensure that the pace of change does not slow down and that businesses remain in tune with the need to work sustainably. A recent report by the Joseph Rowntree Foundation cited evaluation and evidence-based policy making as being under-represented in the sustainable development process. Therefore, I wonder whether the Minister could give an assurance today that adequate incentives and support are in place to sustain the culture shift, already afoot in the business sector, towards environmentally friendly sustainable practice becoming the norm. It is important that that is addressed so that our specific commitment to sustainable development is upheld and progress to date is built in rather than just bolted on.

**Jenny Randerson:** Around 30 years ago I read a book by an American scientist called Paul Ehrlich who spelled out the fact that we all faced a gloomy future, and, in fact, doom,

Gweithredu Cymru—Busnes a'r Amgylchedd, sef cynllun arloesol a lansiwyd y llynedd, yn dangos yr ymrwymiad parhaus i arferion busnes gwyrddach a mwy cynaliadwy. Mae'r cynllun yn fodd i gydlynw a phwysleisio'r gwasanaeth cymorth sylweddol sydd ar gael i helpu'r sector busnes, a thrwy'r cynllun gweithredu hwn mae llawer o bartneriaethau gwaith llwyddiannus eisoes wedi datblygu gyda mudiadau allweddol i roi cymorth i fusnesau.

Mae'r sector busnes nid yn unig yn cael anogaeth, ond mae'n cael ffyrdd ymarferol o ddatblygu arferion cynaliadwy, gan roi iddo yr offer a'r cymorth angenrheidiol, ac mae datblygiadau wedi deillio o hynny. Am fod amser yn brin, fe'ch cyfeiraf at adroddiad blynyddol Cynllun Gweithredu Cymru—Busnes a'r Amgylchedd ar gyfer eleni, sy'n nodi'r arferion arloesol a chynaliadwy sydd bellach yn gyffredin mewn diwydiannau. Ffactor hollbwysig wrth annog y newid parhaus yw sefydlu panel o arbenigwyr ar reoli adnoddau a fydd yn sefydlu fframwaith ar gyfer anghenion busnes yn y tymor hwy.

Mae datblygu cynaliadwy yn dod yn ystyriaeth i'r rhai yn y rheng flaen. Gwneir cynnydd, ond mae'n bwysig sicrhau na fydd y broses newid yn arafu a bod busnesau yn parhau yn effro i'r angen am weithio mewn modd cynaliadwy. Mewn adroddiad diweddar gan Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree nodwyd na roddwyd digon o flaenoriaeth i werthuso a llunio polisiau ar sail tystiolaeth yn y broses datblygu cynaliadwy. Felly, tybed a allai'r Gweinidog roi sicrwydd heddiw fod digon o gymhellion a chymorth ar waith i barhau â'r newid diwylliannol sydd eisoes ar droed yn y sector busnes, tuag at sicrhau bod arferion cynaliadwy ac eco-gyfeillgar yn dod yn fwyfwy cyffredin. Mae'n bwysig mynd i'r afael â hynny fel bod ein hymrwymiad penodol i ddatblygu cynaliadwy yn parhau a bod y cynnydd a wnaed hyd yma yn rhan annatod yn hytrach nag yn atodiad.

**Jenny Randerson:** Tua 30 mlynedd yn ôl darllenas lyfr gan wyddonydd o America o'r enw Paul Ehrlich a eglurodd fod pob un ohonom yn wynebu dyfodol tywyll, ac, yn

if we did not do something about the way that we behave. It is therefore depressing that, while we debate this issue today, I feel that, not only have we made no progress, we have actually gone backwards. More recently, Sir John Houghton came to speak to us. In a matter-of-fact way, and using statistics, he pointed out that even if we all learnt our lesson now and stopped what we are doing, the situation will still worsen. The picture for 2050 is grim. Some of us here will still be alive then, as will our children. Last night, Sir David King warned that climate change is the greatest threat facing Britain and the world. Last week, we heard that the rise in carbon dioxide emissions is much worse than expected.

Therefore, Glyn, there is no time for flexibility; that has run out. We greatly prize our obligation to sustainable development. However, much of what has been achieved, and much of what is in the plan, although perhaps well intentioned, does not have a sufficient sense of urgency. For example, we seemed to wait forever for TAN 8, and valuable time has been wasted. It has finally arrived, but it gives too much weight to wind power, which is the easy option. I know that it is a planning document, but there are planning issues that must be considered in relation to other forms of renewable energy. We should not be relying entirely on wind power and saying that that is the only way to reach our targets in 2010.

**Glyn Davies:** That is doublespeak. There is no room for any flexibility in terms of TAN 8, and yet we know that the research has not been carried out to enable alternative sources to provide the renewable energy that is needed to achieve the targets.

**Jenny Randerson:** That is completely untrue. I suggest that you consider Austria, where there is a wider variety of renewable energy sources than simply wind power. It is achieving much higher targets than we are. Look abroad; the examples are there. This country has simply not grasped them.

wir, dinistr, os na fyddem yn gwneud rhywbeth ynglŷn â'n hymddygiad. Felly mae'n dorcalonnus, er ein bod yn trafod y mater hwn heddiw, ein bod nid yn unig wedi methu â gwneud cynnydd ond bod y sefyllfa wedi gwaethygu yn fy mam i. Yn fwy diweddar, daeth Syr John Houghton i siarad â ni. Mewn ffordd hamddenol, a chan ddefnyddio ystadegau, nododd y bydd y sefyllfa yn mynd yn waeth hyd yn oed os yw pob un ohonom yn dysgu ein gwers yn awr ac yn peidio â gwneud yr hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud. Tywyll yw'r darlun ar gyfer 2050. Bydd rhai ohonom yma yn dal yn fyw, fel y bydd ein plant. Neithiwr, rhybuddiodd Syr David King mai newid yn yr hinsawdd yw'r bygythiad mwyaf y mae Prydain a'r byd yn ei wynebu. Yr wythnos diwethaf, clywsom fod y cynnydd yn y gollyngiadau o garbon deuocsid yn llawer mwy na'r disgwyl.

Felly, Glyn, nid oes amser am hyblygrwydd; mae'r amser wedi dod i ben. Yr ydym yn rhoi gwerth mawr ar ein rhwymedigaeth ynglŷn â datblygu cynaliadwy. Fodd bynnag, er mai da yw'r bwriadau, nid oes digon o frys yn perthyn i'r hyn sydd wedi cael ei wneud, nac i lawer o'r hyn sydd yn y cynllun. Er enghraifft, yr oeddem fel petaem yn aros hydoedd am TAN 8, a chollwyd amser gwerthfawr. Mae wedi cyrraedd o'r diwedd, ond rhydd lawer gormod o bwys ar ynni'r gwynt, sef dewis hawdd. Gwn mai dogfen gynllunio ydyw, ond cyfyd materion cynllunio y mae'n rhaid eu hystyried mewn perthynas â mathau eraill o ynni adnewyddadwy. Ni ddylem fod yn dibynnu'n llwyr ar ynni'r gwynt ac yn dweud mai dyma'r unig ffordd o gyrraedd ein targedau yn 2010.

**Glyn Davies:** Siarad dwbl yw hynny. Nid oes lle i unrhyw hyblygrwydd o ran TAN 8, ac eto gwyddom na wnaed ymchwil i ffynonellau amgen a allai ddarparu'r ynni adnewyddadwy sydd ei angen er mwyn cyflawni'r targedau.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae hynny yn hollol anghywir. Meddyliwch am Awstria, lle mae mwy o amrywiaeth o ffynonellau ynni adnewyddadwy nag ynni'r gwynt yn unig. Mae'n cyflawni targedau uwch o dipyn nag yr ydym ni. Edrychwch dramor; ceir enghreifftiau yno. Y gwir amdani yw nad

yw'r wlad hon wedi bachu ar y cyfleoedd.

The Minister's budget line shows a worrying lack of ambition and commitment to sustainability. I know that there is more to this than money, but money needs to be flowing through. The sustainable development fund of £1 million is unchanged all the way through, which is a real-terms cut. The small sum of £578,000 for environmental research is unchanged all the way through, which is also a real-terms cut. Therefore, we are not even reaching fully within our own organisation. We welcomed the fact that the Minister attended the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee meeting this morning to talk about national parks, but I must tell you, Minister, the words 'sustainable development' do not crop up often enough in economic development terms. We too often leave the phrase off the agenda when you are not present. Therefore, it is not surprising that we still have not got the message through to many ASPBs, and certainly not to local government. The procurement initiative is good, but it has a long way to go.

I commend the section of the report on the need to develop tools to measure progress. This is a key issue. GVA is a blunt instrument, and we urgently need a sustainable development index. Good work has been done, and its urgent nature needs to be taken into account. Without these figures, there will be no incentive for progress. Only 2.43 per cent of electricity is produced from renewable sources, therefore achieving our target of producing 10 per cent from renewable sources could prove impossible because we are easily deflected each time we need to make a difficult decision. We need to smarten up our targets. I want to see a kerbside recycling target for Wales as a whole, especially for the recycling of plastics. We also need to consider current systems in order to make it as easy as possible for people to make their lives energy efficient. Anyone who wants to save energy has a bewildering array of agencies from which to seek advice. We need to create a simpler system and adopt a one-stop-shop approach to energy efficiency and all other environmental aspects of life. The Assembly school report reads 'well intentioned, but

Mae llinell gyllideb y Gweinidog yn dangos diffyg uchelgais ac ymrwymiad i gynaliadwyedd sy'n achos pryder. Gwn fod angen mwy nag arian yn hyn o beth, ond mae angen arian ar gyfer hyn. Nid yw'r gronfa datblygu cynaliadwy o £1 filiwn wedi newid, sy'n doriad mewn termau real. Nid yw'r swm bach o £578,000 ar gyfer ymchwil i'r amgylchedd wedi newid, sydd hefyd yn doriad mewn termau real. Felly, nid ydym yn ymgeisio i'r eithaf hyd yn oed yn ein sefydliad ein hunain. Croesawyd y ffaith gennym fod y Gweinidog wedi dod i Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad y bore yma i drafod parciau cenedlaethol, ond rhaid imi ddweud wrthyh, Weinidog, nid yw'r geiriau 'datblygu cynaliadwy' yn codi'n ddigon aml o ran datblygu economaidd. Yn rhy aml yr ydym yn hepgor yr ymadrodd o'r agenda, pan nad ydych yn bresennol. Felly, nid yw'n syndod nad ydym wedi llwyddo eto i gyfleu'r neges i lawer o CCNC, ac yn sicr nid i lywodraeth leol. Mae'r fenter gaffael yn dda, ond mae tipyn o ffordd i fynd.

Cymeradwyaf yr adran o'r adroddiad ar yr angen am ddatblygu offer i fesur cynnydd. Mae hwn yn fater allweddol. Mae gwerth ychwanegol crynswth yn amrwd, ac mae angen inni gael mynegai datblygu cynaliadwy fel mater o frys. Gwnaed gwaith da, ac mae angen ystyried natur frys y gwaith hwnnw. Heb y ffigurau hyn, ni fydd dim cymhelliad i wneud cynnydd. Dim ond 2.43 y cant o drydan a gynhyrchir oddi wrth ffynonellau adnewyddadwy, felly efallai y bydd yn amhosibl cyflawni ein targed o gynhyrchu 10 y cant o ffynonellau adnewyddadwy am ei bod yn hawdd ein troi oddi ar y trywydd iawn bob tro y mae angen inni wneud penderfyniad anodd. Mae angen inni fireinio ein targedau. Hoffwn weld targed ar gyfer casglu gwastraff i'w ailgylchu o fin y ffordd i Gymru gyfan, yn enwedig o ran ailgylchu plastigion. Mae angen hefyd inni ystyried y systemau cyfredol er mwyn ei gwneud cyn hawsed â phosibl i bobl ddefnyddio ynni yn effeithlon yn eu bywydau pob dydd. I unrhyw un sydd am arbed ynni, mae amrywiaeth dryslyd o asiantaethau y gall droi atynt am gyngor. Mae angen inni greu system symlach a chael siop un stop ar gyfer



needs to make more effort'. I commend the report and the plan, but we need to develop the sense of urgency surrounding sustainable development.

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** I start by dealing with the amendments. I will not support amendment 1 because TAN 8 deals with planning policy, and consultation on the draft note is ongoing. On the question of indicators, which also applies to amendment 2, I received an interim report from the indicators working group addressing the commitment made in the scheme on the development of high-level summary indicators. However, I cannot support amendment 2 because we do not yet have the indicator. We want the indicator, but there is no point in calling for something that does not yet exist. We will want to make sure that the indicator is put in place, but we cannot give a commitment as to when that will be.

**Helen Mary Jones:** If you cannot give us a commitment, Minister, can you give us an indication as to when you hope the indicator will be in place? I endorse everything that Jenny Randerson said and agree that it is difficult to measure progress. The actions in the report are good, but we cannot measure progress against the outcomes of those actions unless we have indicators.

**Carwyn Jones:** I will consider this as a matter of urgency because it is important that we develop an indicator as soon as possible.

Amendment 3 deals with existing spending and, given that this is committed, I cannot support the amendment. Had the amendment referred to future spending, it would have been more acceptable.

Turning to amendment 5, I agree that shooting and fishing contribute to the countryside. Amendment 6 was not discussed during the debate, but I wish to say that we have a proud record on agri-environment schemes.

effeithlonrwydd ynni a phob agwedd amgylcheddol arall ar fywyd. Mae adroddiad ysgol y Cynulliad yn darllen 'bwriadau da, ond mae angen gwneud mwy o ymdrech'. Cymeradwyaf yr adroddiad a'r cynllun, ond mae angen inni ddatblygu'r ymdeimlad o frys o ran datblygu cynaliadwy.

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Dechreuaf drwy ymdrin â'r gwelliannau. Ni chefnogaf welliant 1 gan fod TAN 8 yn trafod polisi cynllunio, ac mae'r ymgynghoriad ar y nodyn drafft yn parhau. O ran dangosyddion, sydd hefyd yn berthnasol i welliant 2, cefais adroddiad interim oddi wrth y gweithgor dangosyddion yn ymdrin â'r ymrwymiad a wnaed yn y cynllun o ran datblygu dangosyddion cryno lefel uchel. Fodd bynnag, ni allaf gefnogi gwelliant 2 am nad oes gennym y dangosydd eto. Yr ydym am gael y dangosydd, ond ofer yw galw am rywbeth nad yw'n bodoli eto. Byddwn am wneud yn siŵr bod y dangosydd yn cael ei roi ar waith, ond ni allwn wneud ymrwymiad ynghylch pryd y bydd hynny'n digwydd.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Os na allwch wneud ymrwymiad, Weinidog, a allwch awgrymu pryd y gobeithiwch y bydd y dangosydd ar waith? Cymeradwyaf bopeth a ddywedodd Jenny Randerson a chytunaf ei bod yn anodd mesur cynnydd. Mae'r camau gweithredu yn yr adroddiad yn rhai da, ond ni allwn fesur cynnydd yn erbyn canlyniadau'r camau gweithredu hynny oni bai fod gennym ddangosyddion.

**Carwyn Jones:** Ystyriaf hyn fel mater o frys am ei bod yn bwysig ein bod yn datblygu dangosydd cyn gynted ag y bo modd.

Mae gwelliant 3 yn ymdrin â'r gwariant presennol ac, o gofio bod hynny wedi'i neilltuo, ni allaf gefnogi'r gwelliant. Pe bai'r gwelliant wedi cyfeirio at wariant yn y dyfodol, byddai wedi bod yn fwy derbyniol.

Gan droi at welliant 5, cytunaf fod saethu a physgota yn gwneud cyfraniad i gefn gwlad. Ni thrafodwyd gwelliant 6 yn y ddadl, ond hoffwn ddweud bod gennym record y gallwn ymfalchïo ynddi o ran cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol.

**John Griffiths:** Returning to amendment 5, do you agree that if rural Wales is to be sustainable, we need to promote an image of our countryside as a green, pleasant and progressive area, and not one where the barbaric and outdated practice of recreational foxhunting continues? If we are concerned with sustainability, the sooner recreational foxhunting is banned, the better.

**Carwyn Jones:** There are many who would agree with you.

**Brynle Williams** *rose*—

**Carwyn Jones:** I do not want to turn this into a debate on hunting. I will not take any more interventions on hunting; this debate is about sustainable development. The Conservatives tried to turn this partially into a debate on hunting, but that is not the subject under discussion.

We have a proud record on the agri-environment schemes of Tir Gofal and Tir Cynnal. We are seen as world leaders, or certainly as European leaders, in this field.

4.20 p.m.

Amendment 7 was also not discussed during the debate. When the Assembly Government issues TANs, it expects them to be followed. It is as simple as that, regardless of what the local planning authority is. In terms of the red squirrel, no land has been sold recently on Anglesey, as far as I am aware. Land has been put up for potential sale at Pentraeth, and I have met with the Forestry Commission to discuss the red squirrel situation there. There is no commitment yet to sell the land. I am monitoring this and I have spoken to the red squirrel group on Anglesey several times and I am committed to ensuring that the red squirrel has as sustainable a future as possible on Anglesey.

**David Davies:** You talk about support for the red squirrel. What about the thwaite shad—of which you may not have heard—which is threatened by the possibility of large-scale

**John Griffiths:** Gan ddychwelyd i welliant 5, a gytunwch, er mwyn i Gymru wledig fod yn gynaliadwy, fod angen inni hybu delwedd o'n cefn gwlad fel ardal werdd, dymunol a blaengar, ac nid ardal lle mae'r arfer barbariaid a hen ffasiwn o hela llwynogod fel gweithgaredd hamdden yn parhau? Os yw cynaliadwyedd o bwys inni, gorau po gyntaf y gwaherddir hela llwynogod fel gweithgaredd hamdden.

**Carwyn Jones:** Byddai llawer yn cytuno â chi.

**Brynle Williams** *a gododd*—

**Carwyn Jones:** Nid wyf am droi'r ddadl hon yn ddadl ar hela. Ni dderbyniaf unrhyw ymyriadau eraill ar hela; datblygu cynaliadwy yw testun y ddadl hon. Ceisiodd y Ceidwadwyr droi'r ddadl hon yn ddadl ar hela i raddau, ond nid dyna'r testun o dan drafodaeth.

Mae gennym record y gallwn ymfalchïo ynddi o ran cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol megis Tir Gofal a Thir Cynnal. Ystyrir ein bod yn arwain y byd, neu yn sicr yn arwain Ewrop, yn y maes hwn.

Ni thrafodwyd gwelliant 7 yn ystod y ddadl hon ychwaith. Pan fydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cyhoeddi nodiadau cyngor technegol, mae'n disgwyl iddynt gael eu dilyn. Mae mor syml â hynny, waeth pwy yw'r awdurdod cynllunio lleol. O ran y wiwer goch, hyd y gwn i, nid oes unrhyw dir wedi cael ei werthu'n ddiweddar ar Ynys Môn. Mae tir wedi cael ei roi ar werth ym Mhentraeth, ac yr wyf wedi cyfarfod â'r Comisiwn Coediwgaeth i drafod y sefyllfa yno o ran y wiwer goch. Nid oes ymrwymiad eto i werthu'r tir. Yr wyf yn monitro hyn ac yr wyf wedi siarad â grŵp gwiwerod cochion Ynys Môn sawl gwaith ac yr wyf yn ymrwymedig i sicrhau bod dyfodol mor gynaliadwy â phosibl i'r wiwer goch ar Ynys Môn.

**David Davies:** Yr ydych yn sôn am gymorth i'r wiwer goch. Beth am y wangen—efallai nad ydych wedi clywed amdani—sydd o dan fygythiad oherwydd y posibilrwydd y caiff

gravel extraction throughout the Usk valley? The thwaite shad is an unusual fish found in the river Usk.

**Carwyn Jones:** I know what a shad is and it is not threatened by anything, because there are no applications for sand-gravel extraction in the Usk valley.

With reference to amendment 4, the UK Government signed the Kyoto agreement. As part of the agreement, we have signed up to targets for renewable energy. If we do not meet those targets, it will undoubtedly reflect badly on us as a country. Is it the Conservative Party's intention that we should try to reach these targets? Yes or no?

**Glyn Davies** *rose*—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Are you seeking to intervene?

**Glyn Davies:** I am responding to the Minister's invitation. If the Minister had listened carefully to my contribution, he would have heard me saying that I hope that we will be able to reach the targets. He may be a little deaf on occasion.

**Carwyn Jones:** If you want to reach the targets, the only way to do so is via wind power. It is made clear in the document. All the technical information suggests that. I note that the amendment refers to on-shore wind turbines. Can I assume, therefore, that you merely wish to shift them off-shore? That is the only alternative, which is in stark contrast to the position taken by the Conservative Party last week. We are used to that kind of change of view when it suits the Conservatives. We cannot achieve our targets in terms of renewable energy if we do not accept that wind power will play a major part in doing so. Otherwise we will run away from that situation. To sum up—*[Interruption.]*

I will not respond to the barking across the Chamber.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. The Minister is clearly not giving way.

gro eu tynnu ar raddfa fawr ar hyd dyffryn Wysg? Mae'r wangen yn bysgodyn anghyffredin sydd i'w gael yn afon Wysg.

**Carwyn Jones:** Gwn beth yw gwangen ac nid oes dim yn fygythiad iddi, oherwydd nid oes unrhyw geisiadau i dynnu gro tywod yn nyffryn Wysg.

Gan gyfeirio at welliant 4, llofnododd Llywodraeth y DU gytundeb Kyoto. Fel rhan o'r cytundeb, yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i dargedau ar gyfer ynni adnewyddadwy. Os na chyflawnwn y targedau hynny, bydd hynny yn ddi-os yn adlewyrchu'n wael arnom fel gwlad. Ai bwriad y Blaid Geidwadol yw y dylem geisio cyrraedd y targedau hyn? Ie neu nage?

**Glyn Davies** *a gododd*—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. A ydych yn ceisio ymyrryd?

**Glyn Davies:** Yr wyf yn ymateb i wahoddiad y Gweinidog. Pe bai'r Gweinidog wedi gwrando'n astud ar fy nghyfraniad, byddai wedi fy nghlywed yn dweud fy mod yn gobeithio y byddwn yn gallu cyrraedd y targedau. Gall fod ychydig yn fyddar weithiau.

**Carwyn Jones:** Os ydych am gyrraedd y targedau, yr unig ffordd o wneud hynny yw drwy ynni'r gwynt. Mae hynny'n eglur yn y ddogfen. Mae'r holl wybodaeth dechnegol yn awgrymu hynny. Nodaf fod y gwelliant yn cyfeirio at dyrbinau ar y tir. A ddylwn dybio, felly, mai eu symud i'r môr yw eich dymuniad? Dyna'r unig ddewis arall, sydd mewn gwrthgyferbyniad llwyr â barn y Blaid Geidwadol yr wythnos diwethaf. Yr ydym yn gyfarwydd â'r fath newid meddwl pan fydd yn gyfleus i'r Ceidwadwyr. Ni allwn gyflawni ein targedau o ran ynni adnewyddadwy oni dderbyniwn y bydd ynni'r gwynt yn chwarae prif ran yn hynny o beth. Fel arall byddwn yn osgoi'r sefyllfa honno. I gloi—*[Torri ar draws.]*

Nid ymatebaf i'r gweiddi ar draws y Siambr.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae'n amlwg nad yw'r Gweinidog yn ildio.

**Carwyn Jones:** Time is short, and it is rather rich for those who have not been in the Chamber for the entire debate to try to intervene. If they had taken more interest in sustainable development in the first place, perhaps their interventions would have been more valid.

It is of no good to say that we are only small and that we can only make a small contribution to reducing carbon dioxide levels. There is a Chinese proverb which says that the person who moved a mountain is the one who started taking away the small stones. Our challenge is whether or not we are brave enough to start to move those small stones. Do we stand firm now and make a difference to climate change or do we run away? If we run away, how will we look our children in the face in the future? It is important that we stand firm in terms of climate change and that we make our contribution, to ensure that, when future generations judge us, we can say that we did our part. I hope that everyone in the Chamber will agree.

**Kirsty Williams:** I seek guidance. I believe that I have an interest with regard to amendment 7. I am seeking guidance as to whether I am able to vote on the other amendments. I will not vote on amendment 7 because of that interest.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I cannot give you instantaneous guidance. However, this is a matter for Members themselves.

**Glyn Davies:** During my speech, I declared an interest. Do I need to do that specifically?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I thought that you wanted to say why you were not voting.

**Glyn Davies:** That was it. I may have a potential family interest. I said that in my speech.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The Clerk and I have not had an opportunity to assess any declarations of interest. If in doubt, Members should not vote on any amendment

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae amser yn brin, ac mae'n eironig braidd i'r rhai nad ydynt wedi bod yn y Siambr am y ddadl gyfan geisio ymyrryd. Pe baent wedi cymryd mwy o ddiddordeb mewn datblygu cynaliadwy yn y lle cyntaf, efallai y byddai eu hymyriadau wedi bod yn fwy dilys.

Ofer dweud mai gwlad fach ydym ac mai dim ond cyfraniad bach y gallwn ei wneud i leihau lefelau carbon deuocsid. Mae dihareb Tsieinëeg yn dweud bod y sawl sy'n symud mynydd yn dechrau drwy symud y cerrig mân. Yr her inni yw a ydym yn ddigon dewr i ddechrau symud y cerrig mân hynny ai peidio. A ydym yn mynd i sefyll yn gadarn yn awr a gwneud gwahaniaeth o ran newid yn yr hinsawdd neu a ydym yn mynd i ffoi? Os ydym yn ffoi, sut y gallem edrych ym myw llygad ein plant yn y dyfodol? Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn sefyll yn gadarn o ran newid yn yr hinsawdd a'n bod yn gwneud ein cyfraniad, er mwyn sicrhau y gallwn ddweud, pan fydd cenedlaethau'r dyfodol yn ein barnu, inni chwarae ein rhan. Gobeithiaf y bydd pawb yn y Siambr yn cytuno.

**Kirsty Williams:** Gofynnaf am gyfarwyddyd. Credaf fod gennyf fuddiant o ran gwelliant 7. Hoffwn wybod a allaf bleidleisio ar y gwelliannau eraill. Ni phleidleisiaf ar welliant 7 oherwydd y buddiant hwnnw.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Ni allaf roi cyfarwyddyd ar unwaith. Fodd bynnag, mater i'r Aelodau eu hunain yw hwn.

**Glyn Davies:** Yn ystod fy araith, datgenais fuddiant. A oes angen imi wneud hynny yn benodol?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Meddyliais eich bod am ddweud pam nad oeddech yn pleidleisio.

**Glyn Davies:** Dyna ydoedd. Mae'n bosibl bod gennyf fuddiant teuluol. Dywedais hynny yn fy araith.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Nid yw'r Clerc a minnau wedi cael cyfle i asesu unrhyw fuddiannau. Os oes amheuaeth, ni ddylai Aelodau bleidleisio ar unrhyw welliant y mae

in which they may have an interest.

ganddynt fuddiant posibl ynddo.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 23, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.*

*Amendment 1: For 23, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*

*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.*

*Amendment 2: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene

Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 27, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 3: For 27, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 11, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 45.  
Amendment 4: For 11, Abstain 0, Against 45.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine

Davies, David  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Williams, Brynle

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 23, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 33.  
Amendment 5: For 23, Abstain 1, Against 33.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John

Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Wood, Leanne

Ymataliodd yr Aelod canlynol:  
 The following Member abstained:

Davies, Janet

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 27, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
 Amendment 6: For 27, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda



*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 16, Ymatal 10, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 7: For 16, Abstain 10, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 8: O blaid 27, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 8: For 27, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

Tynnwyd gwelliant 9 yn ôl.  
Amendment 9 withdrawn.

*Cynnig (NDM2119): O blaid 57, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2119): For 57, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian

Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Adolygiad y Comisiwn Annibynnol o Gynllun y Sector Gwirfoddol The Independent Commission's Review of the Voluntary Sector Scheme**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1 and 2 in the name Jonathan Morgan and amendment 3 and 4 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 2 yn enw Jonathan Morgan a gwelliannau 3 a 4 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** Cynigiad fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. welcomes the recommendations of the independent commission which reviewed the voluntary sector scheme;*

*1. yn croesawu argymhellion y comisiwn annibynnol a gynhaliodd yr adolygiad o gynllun y sector gwirfoddol;*

*2. notes the first stage strategic implementation plan setting out the initial response of the Welsh Assembly Government;*

*2. yn nodi'r cynllun gweithredu strategol—y cam cyntaf, sy'n pennu ymateb cychwynnol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru;*

3. recognises the Minister's intention to work with the voluntary sector in implementing the recommendations. (NDM2120)

4.30 p.m.

The review was undertaken by an independent commission because it was important that we had a non-partisan view. I commissioned this review, and I believe that the Assembly should first look at any recommendations that I propose and decide how we respond to the report.

The commission took evidence from all the relevant interests. I was particularly anxious to hear the views of local voluntary and community groups on how well the present scheme serves their needs. The commission reported to me on 31 March 2004. Its findings were put out to consultation for a 12-week period, ending on 28 June. The result of all this work has been a series of recommendations that I have been pleased to accept, and many of them can be implemented quickly and with rapid effect. Others will take more time and need some further development. As a whole package, however, I am convinced that the reforms will strengthen the scheme and continue the Assembly's strong record of engagement with the sector. In all of this, it is important, therefore, to continue to take voluntary organisations and interests with us on the road upon which we have set out. That is why I have published a first-stage strategic implementation plan, which takes on board the concerns that were raised in committee about this being the first stage of the plan. The title used is deliberate and it makes clear our intention to move towards implementation. However, it also illustrates our continuing commitment to surrounding that implementation with ongoing discussions and dialogue with interested groups and individuals.

I wanted to present a plan which was clear and which sets everything out. I have included my conclusions on each recommendation in the commission's report, the action that is being taken or is ongoing, and who has responsibility for that action.

3. yn cydnabod bwriad y Gweinidog i gydweithio â'r sector gwirfoddol i weithredu'r argymhellion. (NDM2120)

Cynhaliwyd yr adolygiad gan gomisiwn annibynnol am ei bod yn bwysig sicrhau barn amhleidiol. Comisiynais yr adolygiad hwn, a chredaf y dylai'r Cynulliad edrych yn gyntaf ar unrhyw argymhellion a gynigaf a phenderfynu sut y dylem ymateb i'r adroddiad.

Cymerodd y comisiwn dystiolaeth gan bob un o'r buddiannau perthnasol. Yr oeddwn yn awyddus iawn i glywed safbwyntiau grwpiau gwirfoddol a chymunedol lleol o ran llwyddiant y cynllun presennol i ddiwallu eu hanghenion. Cyflwynodd y comisiwn adroddiad imi ar 31 Mawrth 2004. Cyflwynwyd ei ganfyddiadau i ymgynghori arnynt am gyfnod o 12 wythnos, a ddaeth i ben ar 28 Mehefin. O ganlyniad i'r holl waith hwn, lluniwyd cyfres o argymhellion y bu'n bleser gennyf eu derbyn, a gellir gweithredu llawer ohonynt yn gyflym a chydag effaith uniongyrchol. Bydd yn cymryd mwy o amser i weithredu eraill, ac mae angen eu datblygu ymhellach. Fel pecyn cyfan, fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn argyhoeddedig y bydd y diwygiadau yn atgyfnerthu'r cynllun ac yn barhad o record dda y Cynulliad o gydweithio gyda'r sector. Yn hyn oll, felly, mae'n bwysig parhau i gynnwys mudiadau a buddiannau gwirfoddol wrth inni deithio ar hyd y ffordd yr ydym wedi dechrau arni. Dyna pam y cyhoeddais gynllun gweithredu strategol cam cyntaf, sy'n ystyried y pryderon a godwyd yn y pwyllgor mai dyma gam cyntaf y cynllun. Mae'r teitl a ddefnyddiwyd yn fwriadol ac yn pwysleisio ein bwriad o symud tuag at weithredu. Fodd bynnag, dengys hefyd ein hymrwymiad parhaus i sicrhau bod y camau gweithredu hynny wedi'u hategu gan drafodaethau a deialog parhaus gyda grwpiau ac unigolion sydd â diddordeb.

Yr oeddwn am gyflwyno cynllun a oedd yn glir ac sy'n nodi popeth. Yr wyf wedi cynnwys fy nghasgliadau ar bob un o argymhellion adroddiad y comisiwn, y camau sydd ar waith neu sy'n mynd rhagddynt, a phwy sy'n gyfrifol am y camau hynny. Fodd

However, I also want a plan that can continue to be shaped by experience and ongoing contributions from others. That is why, where the recommendations require a wider input from the sector, I have agreed to the creation of a short-life working group, which will include people from the voluntary sector.

Turning briefly to the amendments, I am afraid that it will be necessary to reject them all. I especially regret doing so in relation to the first amendment in the name of Jonathan Morgan, as I am grateful for the support that it expresses for the plan. Unfortunately, it also seeks to replace the second point of the Government's motion, rather than to augment it, and, as Minister, I need the Assembly Government's own position on record.

The other amendments fall into the category of the 'stating-the-exceedingly-obvious amendments'. I am dealing with everything that is included in them. I do not wish to sound churlish, but they are reiterations. The voluntary sector scheme is rightly valued across the Assembly by Members from all parties. It will continue and we would all wish to make a contribution. The proposals that have emanated from the commission will strengthen the scheme still further and thus cement the support which it commands among politicians here and among those thousands of people in Wales who, week-in and week-out, make a contribution through voluntary effort and association. The first-stage implementation plan shows how we will begin to translate the commission's proposals into action, and I am glad to commend it to you this afternoon.

**Mark Isherwood:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Amendment 1: delete point 2 and replace with:

*acknowledges the first stage of the strategic implementation plan commands wide cross-party support.*

I propose amendment 2. In point 3, replace 'recognises the Minister's intention to work with', with

*acknowledges that the Minister will be*

bynag, yr wyf hefyd am sicrhau cynllun a all barhau i gael ei lunio drwy brofiad a chyfraniadau parhaus gan eraill. Dyna pam yr wyf wedi cytuno, lle y mae angen mwy o fewnbwn gan y sector ar yr argymhellion, i greu gweithgor oes byr, a fydd yn cynnwys pobl o'r sector gwirfoddol.

Gan droi'n gryno at y gwelliannau, yn anffodus bydd yn rhaid gwrthod pob un ohonynt. Mae'n edifar iawn gennyf wneud hynny o ran y gwelliant cyntaf yn enw Jonathan Morgan, gan fy mod yn ddiolchgar am y gefnogaeth a fynegir ganddo i'r cynllun. Yn anffodus, mae hefyd yn ceisio disodli ail bwynt cynnig y Llywodraeth, yn hytrach nag ychwanegu ato, ac, fel y Gweinidog, mae angen imi sicrhau bod safbwynt Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ei hun wedi'i gofnodi.

Mae'r gwelliannau eraill yn y categori 'gwelliannau sy'n datgan yr hyn sy'n gwbl amlwg'. Yr wyf yn ymdrin â phopeth a nodwyd ynddynt. Nid wyf am swnio'n anfoesgar, ond maent yn ailadroddus. Mae Aelodau o bob plaid ar draws y Cynulliad yn gwerthfawrogi cynllun y sector gwirfoddol, a hynny'n gwbl briodol. Bydd yn parhau a byddem oll yn awyddus i gyfrannu ato. Bydd y cynigion a gyflwynwyd gan y comisiwn yn atgyfnerthu'r cynllun ymhellach eto ac felly'n cadarnhau'r gefnogaeth iddo ymhlith gwleidyddion yma ac ymhlith y miloedd o bobl yng Nghymru sy'n cyfrannu, wythnos ar ôl wythnos, drwy ymdrech a chysylltiadau gwirfoddol. Dengys y cynllun gweithredu cam cyntaf sut y byddwn yn dechrau troi cynigion y comisiwn yn gamau gweithredu, ac mae'n bleser gennyf ei gymeradwyo ichi y prynhawn yma.

**Mark Isherwood:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Gwelliant 1: dileu pwynt 2 a rhoi'r canlynol yn ei le:

*yn cydnabod bod cam cyntaf y cynllun gweithredu strategol yn derbyn cefnogaeth drawsbleidiol eang.*

Cynigiaf welliant 2. Ym mhwynt 3, dileu'r geiriau 'yn cydnabod bwriad y Gweinidog i gydweithio â'r,' ac yn eu lle rhoi

*yn cydnabod y bydd yn rhaid i'r Gweinidog*

*required to work with all sectors and organisations that actively promote progress within.*

The Minister's positive response to the review of the scheme is welcome. I note my comments when we discussed this on 7 July. I said that the challenge must be to ensure that the scheme delivers the aims of the Government of Wales Act 1998 and that it promotes and supports the interests of voluntary organisations at all levels in Wales. That now means turning words into action. I have looked at the response of the Wales Council for Voluntary Action, and I endorse its comments in point 6, which states that,

'it is unclear why some recommendations, particularly actively promoting consistent application of the scheme and the code of practice for funding the voluntary sector, have only been accepted in principle'.

Similarly, on the strategic action plan, I accept in principle recommendation 24 to move to a six-year review cycle for grant schemes. We need to deliver longer, sustainable funding structures for the future, and I would be grateful if the Minister would expand on that. I endorse the WCVA's response that it is important that arrangements to improve communication and representation are owned by the sector, that they reflect the ways in which groups choose to network, and do not create unnecessarily bureaucratic processes. Clearly, that is a critical point.

Referring briefly to my last speech, I raised a number of questions to which I have not received answers, and I would be grateful if you could answer them. I said that:

'I share the concern expressed to me by the Association of Voluntary Organisations in Wrexham, that funding figures of £116 million on page 22 of this report look substantial until one realises that that figure includes £68.5 million of...funding for social housing.'

I also asked for

*gydweithio â phob sector a phob sefydliad sy'n gweithio i hyrwyddo datblygiadau oddi mewn.*

Croesewir ymateb cadarnhaol y Gweinidog i'r adolygiad o'r cynllun. Nodaf fy sylwadau pan drafodwyd y mater gennym ar 7 Gorffennaf. Dywedais mai'r her fydd sicrhau bod y cynllun yn cyflawni nodau Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 a'i fod yn hyrwyddo ac yn cefnogi buddiannau mudiadau gwirfoddol ar bob lefel yng Nghymru. Bellach mae hynny'n golygu gweithredu'r geiriau. Edrychais ar ymateb Cyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru, a chymeradwyaf ei sylwadau ym mhwynt 6, sy'n datgan,

nid yw'n eglur pam mai dim ond mewn egwyddor y derbyniwyd rhai argymhellion, yn arbennig o ran bwrw ati i hyrwyddo'r broses o gymhwyso'r cynllun a'r cod ymarfer ar gyfer ariannu'r sector gwirfoddol mewn ffordd gyson.

Yn yr un modd, o ran y cynllun gweithredu strategol, derbyniasf mewn egwyddor argymhelliad 24 i symud i gylch adolygu chwe blynedd ar gyfer cynlluniau grant. Mae angen inni gyflwyno strwythurau ariannu cynaliadwy, hwy ar gyfer y dyfodol, a byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallai'r Gweinidog ymhelaethu ar hynny. Cymeradwyaf ymateb CGGC ei bod yn bwysig sicrhau mai'r sector sy'n berchen ar drefniadau i wella cyfathrebu a chynrychiolaeth, eu bod yn adlewyrchu'r ffyrdd y mae grwpiau yn dewis rhwydweithio, ac nad ydynt yn creu prosesau biwrocraidd diangen. Yn amlwg, mae hynny'n bwynt hollbwysig.

Gan gyfeirio'n gryno at fy araith ddiwethaf, codais nifer o gwestiynau na dderbyniasf atebion iddynt, a byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech eu hateb. Dywedais:

'rhannaf y pryder a fynegwyd imi gan y Gymdeithas Mudiadau Gwirfoddol yn Wrecsam, fod ffigurau ariannu o £116 miliwn ar dudalen 22 yr adroddiad hwn yn edrych yn sylweddol nes bod rhywun yn sylweddoli bod y ffigur hwnnw yn cynnwys y £68.5 miliwn o arian...ar gyfer tai cymdeithasol.'

Gofynnais hefyd am

'an explanation of how the Welsh Development Agency allocates the £11.32 million to the sector'.

However, I now note and welcome the WDA's response on that matter, which has helped to explain this. I say again that

'the Volunteer Bureaux which have received one year funding under the Active Communities initiative are very appreciative but would like a clear time table laid down by the Minister, outlining the future proposals'.

I must also point out that due to the lateness in deciding on the funding over the last two years, the organisation has had to let two members of staff go. I also asked how we will meet the many practical concerns that were raised in the public consultation on the social enterprise action plan. I will not repeat them, but these are critical to this scheme. To conclude, the Wales Council for Voluntary Action has said that the report sets out constructive proposals to address the recommendations that apply to the Assembly Government and the voluntary sector, and these should now be taken forward, as soon as possible, in consultation and in real working partnership in the public, voluntary and private sectors.

**Leanne Wood:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 3: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Minister to rigorously monitor progress on the delivery of the strategic implementation plan and to report regularly to the Social Justice Committee and the full Assembly.*

I propose amendment 4. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*and, in doing so, reaffirms the fundamental principles of independence and partnership with the voluntary sector, on which the scheme is based; and agrees with the*

'esboniad o sut y mae Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru yn dyrannu'r £11.32 miliwn i'r sector'.

Fodd bynnag, nodaf yn awr ymateb y WDA ar y mater hwnnw, a chroesawaf yr ymateb hwnnw, sydd wedi helpu i egluro hyn. Dywedaf eto fod

'y Canolfannau Gwirfoddoli a gafodd arian am flwyddyn o dan y fenter Cymunedau Byw yn werthfawrogol iawn ond hoffent gael amserlen glir wedi ei phennu gan y Gweinidog, yn amlinellu'r cynigion ar gyfer dyfodol'.

Rhaid imi nodi hefyd o ganlyniad i'r oedi wrth bennu cyllid yn ystod y ddwy flynedd diwethaf, bod y mudiad wedi gorfod diswyddo dau aelod o staff. Gofynnais hefyd sut y byddwn yn ymateb i'r llu o bryderon ymarferol a godwyd yn yr ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus ar y cynllun gweithredu mentrau cymdeithasol. Nis hailadroddaf, ond maent yn hanfodol i'r cynllun hwn. I gloi, mae Cyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru wedi datgan bod yr adroddiad yn nodi cynigion adeiladol i ymdrin â'r argymhellion sy'n berthnasol i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r sector gwirfoddol, ac y dylid gweithredu arnynt yn awr, cyn gynted â phosibl, drwy ymgynghori â'r sector cyhoeddus, y sector gwirfoddol a'r sector preifat a thrwy lunio partneriaethau gwaith gwirioneddol gyda hwy.

**Leanne Wood:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 3: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar y Gweinidog i fynd ati'n drylwyr i fonitro hynt y gwaith o gyflawni'r cynllun gweithredu strategol ac i adrodd yn ôl yn rheolaidd i'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio a'r Cynulliad llawn.*

Cynigiaf welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*ac, wrth wneud hynny, i gadarnhau'r egwyddorion sylfaenol y mae'r cynllun yn seiliedig arnynt, sef annibyniaeth a phartneriaeth â'r sector gwirfoddol, ac yn*

*Voluntary Sector Partnership Council the arrangements for implementing the recommendations of the commission and preparing the strategic action plan.*

Plaid Cymru welcomes the recommendations of the commission, and we look forward to the results of their implementation. I understand that, following today's debate, the recommendations will be further discussed with the Voluntary Sector Partnership Council, when it next meets in November. The Voluntary Sector Partnership Council has endorsed the recommendations and proposed that they be implemented in full. The Minister will be aware of the work undertaken by the voluntary sector network since the last meeting of the VSPC, setting out proposals on how the commissioners' report can be implemented. I would be grateful if the Minister would inform us what steps she is taking to move that work forward. Draft terms of reference for a compliance and funding sub-committee and a communications strategy have been drawn up. Has the Minister had sight of those documents, and what is she doing to action them? It would be useful if those documents were discussed with the voluntary sector network before the next meeting of the Voluntary Sector Partnership Council.

The commission has stated clearly that communication within the voluntary sector needs to be improved. It is vital that the voluntary sector takes the lead on improving that communication. It should be done in consultation with all other partners, but, ultimately, it should be carried out by the sector itself. In implementing these recommendations, we must not forget the needs of the small grass-roots voluntary organisations that deliver services on the front line. The key issue for those organisations is funding. Plaid Cymru—the Party of Wales regrets that there has not been a firm commitment of additional financial resources for the implementation of recommendation 5, which relates to enhanced training availability, and recommendation 41.

On the strategic action plan, will you confirm, Minister, that the action plan that we have seen is not the same thing as the strategic action plan, which has yet to be developed? A

*ogystal â hynny i gytuno ar y trefniadau ar gyfer gweithredu argymhellion y comisiwn a pharatoi'r cynllun gweithredu strategol gyda Chyngor Partneriaeth y Sector Gwirfoddol.*

Mae Plaid Cymru yn croesawu argymhellion y comisiwn, ac edrychwn ymlaen at ganlyniadau eu gweithredu. Yr wyf ar ddeall, yn dilyn dadl heddiw, y caiff yr argymhellion eu trafod ymhellach gyda Chyngor Partneriaeth y Sector Gwirfoddol, yn ei gyfarfod nesaf ym mis Tachwedd. Mae Cyngor Partneriaeth y Sector Gwirfoddol wedi cymeradwyo'r argymhellion ac wedi cynnig y dylid eu gweithredu'n llawn. Bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o'r gwaith a wnaed gan rwydwaith y sector gwirfoddol ers cyfarfod diwethaf y cyngor, yn nodi cynigion o ran sut y gellir gweithredu adroddiad y comisiynwyr. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallai'r Gweinidog ein hysbysu o ba gamau y mae'n eu cymryd i ddatblygu'r gwaith hwnnw. Lluniwyd cylch gorchwyl drafft ar gyfer is-bwyllgor cydymffurfiaeth a chyllid a strategaeth gyfathrebu. A yw'r Gweinidog wedi gweld y dogfennau hynny, a pha gamau a gymerir ganddi i'w rhoi ar waith? Byddai'n ddefnyddiol pe gellid trafod y dogfennau hynny gyda rhwydwaith y sector gwirfoddol cyn cyfarfod nesaf Cyngor Partneriaeth y Sector Gwirfoddol.

Mae'r comisiwn wedi datgan yn glir bod angen gwella prosesau cyfathrebu o fewn y sector gwirfoddol. Mae'n hanfodol bod y sector gwirfoddol yn cymryd yr awenau o ran gwella'r prosesau cyfathrebu hynny. Dylid gwneud hynny drwy ymgynghori â'r holl bartneriaid eraill, ond, yn y pen draw, y sector ei hun ddylai wneud y gwaith. Wrth weithredu'r argymhellion hyn, rhaid inni gofio anghenion y mudiadau gwirfoddol bach ar lawr gwlad sy'n cyflwyno gwasanaethau ar y rheng flaen. Arian yw'r brif broblem i'r mudiadau hynny. Mae Plaid Cymru—the Party of Wales yn gresynu na fu ymrwymiad cadarn o adnoddau ariannol ychwanegol i weithredu argymhelliad 5, sy'n ymwneud â chynyddu'r hyfforddiant sydd ar gael, ac argymhelliad 41.

O ran y cynllun gweithredu strategol, a wnewch gadarnhau, Weinidog, nad yw'r cynllun gweithredu a welsom yr un peth â'r cynllun gweithredu strategol, nas datblygwyd



strategic action plan must include measurable outcomes. Work on such a plan should begin as quickly as possible in a joint working group, to be established by the Voluntary Sector Partnership Council. I am grateful to the Minister for confirming that that joint work will be undertaken, but I ask her to let us know when the first meeting is likely to take place.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I welcome the report and I pay tribute to the hard work of the independent commission. As the report acknowledges, the Government of Wales Act 1998 gave the voluntary sector a unique status and role in working with the National Assembly for Wales. It is heartening to read this report and see how this relationship has developed constructively.

I will focus on one section of the report: the impact of this scheme on volunteering. Next week I will speak at a meeting of Home-start St Mellons, which is in my constituency. It is an excellent organisation that offers advice and support to families with children under five years of age. The home visit scheme is the key to its success, which is entirely dependent on volunteers. In St Mellons, there are currently around 17 volunteers offering support to about 27 families.

4.40 p.m.

It is often said—but I have no hesitation in repeating it—that volunteering makes a valuable contribution to organisations and to those who volunteer, as well as to those who receive the services and to communities and society as a whole. However, organisations such as Home-Start could do with some additional support, and I ask the Minister to reconsider the calls in the report for a commitment to provide long-term core funding through a dedicated funding stream and to call for more partnership working between the voluntary sector and the further and higher education sectors to help provide suitable training. I am sure that these recommendations will be supported by organisations such as Home-Start as a means of supporting their excellent work. I note

eto? Rhaid i gynllun gweithredu strategol gynnwys canlyniadau mesuradwy. Dylai gwaith ar gynllun o'r fath ddechrau cyn gynted â phosibl mewn cyd-weithgor, i'w sefydlu gan Gyngor Partneriaeth y Sector Gwirfoddol. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am gadarnhau y gwneir gwaith ar y cyd, ond gofynnaf iddi ein hysbysu pryd y mae'r cyfarfod cyntaf yn debygol o gael ei gynnal.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Croesawaf yr adroddiad a thalaf deyrnged i waith caled y comisiwn annibynnol. Fel y mae'r adroddiad yn cydnabod, rhoddodd Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 statws a rôl unigryw i'r sector gwirfoddol i weithio gyda Chynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Mae'n galonogol darllen yr adroddiad hwn a gweld sut y mae'r gydberthynas hon wedi datblygu mewn ffordd adeiladol.

Canolbwyntiaf ar un adran o'r adroddiad: effaith y cynllun hwn ar wirfoddoli. Yr wythnos nesaf byddaf yn annerch cyfarfod Home-Start yn Llaneirwg, sydd yn fy etholaeth i. Mae'n fudiad ardderchog sy'n cynnig cyngor a chymorth i deuluoedd â phlant o dan bum mlwydd oed. Mae'r cynllun ymweliadau cartref yn allweddol i'w lwyddiant, sy'n gwbl ddbynnol ar wirfoddolwyr. Ar hyn o bryd, mae tua 17 o wirfoddolwyr yn cynnig cymorth i tua 27 o deuluoedd yn Llaneirwg.

Dywedir yn aml—ond nid ofnaf ei ailadrodd—bod gwirfoddoli yn gwneud cyfraniad gwerthfawr i fudiadau ac i'r rhai sy'n gwirfoddoli, yn ogystal ag i'r rhai sy'n derbyn y gwasanaethau ac i gymunedau a chymdeithas yn gyffredinol. Fodd bynnag, mae angen cymorth ychwanegol ar fudiadau megis Home-Start, a gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ailystyried y galwadau yn yr adroddiad am ymrwymiad i ddarparu cyllid craidd hirdymor drwy lif arian penodol ac i alw am fwy o waith partneriaeth rhwng y sector gwirfoddol a'r sectorau addysg bellach ac uwch i helpu i ddarparu hyfforddiant addas. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd mudiadau megis Home-Start yn cefnogi'r argymhellion hyn fel ffordd o gefnogi eu gwaith ardderchog. Nodaf o ymateb cychwynnol Llywodraeth

from the Welsh Assembly Government's initial response that it accepts, in principle, the recommendation for long-term core funding, which I welcome. I look forward to the Minister's continued work with the voluntary sector—which holds her in high esteem—in implementing the recommendations, especially in supporting the work of an essential asset, our volunteers in Wales.

**Peter Black:** As other Members have done, I, too, welcome this action plan in response to the review. It is clear to all that it has benefited from the Minister's open-minded, constructive and inclusive approach to the review of the voluntary sector scheme. That is evident in the action plan.

I want to focus on two or three issues in the scheme that still need some attention, although the action plan will hopefully take those forward. As we have debated this on several occasions, there is an element of repetition, but some of the issues are worth repeating, particularly those on funding. With regard to how the Assembly handles the issue, funding is starting to move towards a situation which most people are happy with and feel is acceptable in that we are looking at securing long-term and core funding for many measures and the many independent organisations that we fund. That does not always happen across Wales; it is certainly not happening on a local level, and we should not forget that many voluntary sector organisations are not funded directly by the Assembly, but rather by local councils or other statutory bodies. Getting those bodies to follow suit in terms of how we approach voluntary sector funding is important to the success of this scheme and to putting the voluntary sector on a firm footing.

A second issue is that of simplicity. Many voluntary sector organisations deal with grant regimes of varying complexity, whether Objective 1, Objective 2, lottery funding or whatever. We should do all that we can to simplify those grant regimes to make it easier to apply for grants and to ensure that, in implementing those grants, the monitoring

Cynulliad Cymru ei bod yn derbyn, mewn egwyddor, yr argymhelliad ar gyfer cyllid craidd hirdymor, a chroesawaf hynny. Edrychaf ymlaen at weld y Gweinidog yn parhau i weithio gyda'r sector gwirfoddol—y mae ganddo feddwl uchel iawn ohoni—i weithredu'r argymhellion, yn arbennig o ran cefnogi gwaith ased hanfodol, sef ein gwirfoddolwyr yng Nghymru.

**Peter Black:** Fel y gwnaeth Aelodau eraill, yr wyf fi, hefyd, yn croesawu'r cynllun gweithredu hwn mewn ymateb i'r adolygiad. Mae'n amlwg i bawb ei fod wedi elwa ar ymagwedd feddwl-agored, adeiladol a chynhwysol y Gweinidog tuag at yr adolygiad o gynllun y sector gwirfoddol. Mae hynny'n amlwg yn y cynllun gweithredu.

Hoffwn ganolbwyntio ar ddau neu dri mater yn y cynllun y mae angen rhywfaint o sylw arnynt o hyd, er y bydd y cynllun gweithredu, gobeithio, yn mynd i'r afael â'r rhain. Gan ein bod wedi trafod hyn sawl gwaith, mae elfen o ailadrodd, ond mae rhai o'r materion yn werth eu hailadrodd, yn arbennig y rhai sy'n ymwneud â chyllid. O ran sut mae'r Cynulliad yn ymdrin â'r mater, yr ydym yn dechrau gweld sefyllfa ariannol y mae'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yn fodlon arni ac yn teimlo ei bod yn dderbyniol yn yr ystyr ein bod yn ceisio sicrhau cyllid craidd, hirdymor ar gyfer sawl mesur ac ar gyfer y mudiadau annibynnol niferus a ariennir gennym. Nid yw hynny'n digwydd bob amser ledled Cymru; yn sicr, nid yw'n digwydd ar lefel leol, a dylem gofio nad ariennir sawl mudiad yn y sector gwirfoddol yn uniongyrchol gan y Cynulliad, ond yn hytrach gan gynghorau lleol neu gyrff statudol eraill. Mae sicrhau cydymffurfiaeth y cyrff hynny o ran sut yr ydym yn ariannu'r sector gwirfoddol yn bwysig o ran llwyddiant y cynllun hwn ac er mwyn rhoi sylfaen gadarn i'r sector gwirfoddol.

Mae'r ail fater yn ymwneud â symplrwydd. Mae llawer o fudiadau'r sector gwirfoddol yn ymdrin â systemau grant sy'n amrywio o ran cymhlethdod, boed yn Amcan 1, Amcan 2, arian y loteri neu beth bynnag. Dylem oll wneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i symleiddio'r systemau grant hynny i'w gwneud yn haws i wneud cais am grantiau ac i sicrhau, wrth

process is not too cumbersome. That, too, is important and I hope that we can take that forward. The last issue is one that Leanne mentioned, which is how we measure the actions in this report. It is important that, if we are to implement the review's important recommendations, we have an action plan that is measurable, with clear objectives that are monitored annually—or more frequently if needs be—to ensure that we meet them and, if we do not, to put that right.

**Gwenda Thomas:** When the Local Government and Housing Committee, which I had the honour of chairing, undertook its policy review into community regeneration during the first Assembly, a constant cause of complaint from all organisations, including the Wales Council for Voluntary Action, was the constant struggle in which they were engaged to secure funding. All had complex portfolios of funding that drew on diverse sources. This created large administrative loads that meant that staff time and effort was constantly engaged in maintaining funding streams. Programmes were seen as complex and difficult to understand, with complicated application procedures and a diverse range of deadlines and eligibility criteria. There was a clear need for streamlining and consolidation of the various funding streams into a clearer and co-ordinated programme. The committee made several recommendations on the complexity of funding and the bureaucracy associated with it, many of which are now in place. These same considerations also apply to the funding of the voluntary sector. I am glad to see that the independent commission and the Welsh Assembly Government agree. They have identified the need to continue with more urgency the work on quantifying all grants paid to voluntary organisations by the Assembly Government and its Assembly sponsored public bodies in order to establish a baseline for funding.

The committee's report also identified the need for core funding. What was applicable in the cause of community regeneration is equally applicable when applied to the work

weithredu'r grantiau hynny, nad yw'r broses fonitro yn rhy lafurus. Mae hynny, hefyd, yn bwysig a gobeithiaf y gallwn fynd i'r afael â hynny. Y mater olaf yw'r mater a grybwyllwyd gan Leanne, sef sut i fesur y camau gweithredu yn yr adroddiad hwn. Os ydym am weithredu argymhellion pwysig yr adolygiad, mae'n bwysig sicrhau bod gennym gynllun gweithredu sy'n fesuradwy, gydag amcanion clir a gaiff eu monitro'n flynyddol—neu'n fwy aml os bydd angen—er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn eu bodloni ac, os nad ydym yn gwneud hynny, i unioni hynny.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Pan gynhaliodd y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai, y cefais yr anrhydedd o'i gadeirio, ei adolygiad polisi o adfywio cymunedol yn ystod y Cynulliad cyntaf, un o'r cwynion rheolaidd a godwyd gan bob mudiad, gan gynnwys Cyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru, oedd y frwydr barhaus yr oeddent yn ei hwynebu i sicrhau cyllid. Yr oedd gan bob un ohonynt bortffolio ariannu cymhleth a oedd yn manteisio ar amrywiol ffynonellau. Yr oedd hyn yn creu beichiau gweinyddol mawr a oedd yn golygu bod y gwaith o gynnal llifoedd ariannu yn mynd â'r rhan fwyaf o amser ac ymdrech y staff. Yr oeddent o'r farn bod rhaglenni yn gymhleth ac yn anodd i'w deall, gyda gweithdrefnau cymhleth ar gyfer gwneud cais ac ystod amrywiol o derfynau amser a meini prawf cymhwyster. Yr oedd angen amlwg i symleiddio a chyfuno'r amrywiol lifoedd ariannu i greu rhaglen gliriach, wedi'i chydlynu. Gwnaeth y pwyllgor sawl argymhelliad o ran cymhlethdod y broses ariannu a'r fiwrocratiaeth gysylltiedig, y mae llawer ohonynt bellach wedi'u rhoi ar waith. Mae'r un ystyriaethau hyn hefyd yn berthnasol i ariannu'r sector gwirfoddol. Yr wyf yn falch o weld bod y comisiwn annibynnol a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gytûn. Maent wedi nodi'r angen i barhau â'r gwaith i feintoli pob grant a delir i fudiadau gwirfoddol gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r cyrff cyhoeddus a noddur gan y Cynulliad er mwyn pennu gwaelodlin ar gyfer y broses ariannu, a hynny fel mater o frys.

Nododd adroddiad y pwyllgor hefyd yr angen am gyllid craidd. Mae'r hyn a oedd yn berthnasol o ran adfywio cymunedol yr un mor berthnasol i waith y sector gwirfoddol yn

of the voluntary sector as a whole. The distinction between project funding and core funding is critical to any organisation. The former is generally available from a wide range of sources and can be used to fund specific actions that are project based. However, such funding tends to be hypothecated and cannot be allocated to fund core organisational costs, such as general administration and premises. A commitment to long-term core funding can mean the difference between success and failure, particularly for some of the smaller organisations.

Following its work on funding community regeneration, the committee moved on to consider capacity building. Once again, the problems identified in relation to community regeneration may be applied to the voluntary sector as a whole. Recommendations 49 to 53 relate to maximising community participation and consultation at the grass roots in the implementation of Communities First. The Local Government and Public Services Committee also believed that capacity development was integral to the regeneration process and that it was important to ensure that communities are supported and that the active groups and individuals within those communities maximise their skills.

Communities First benefited from the reports and recommendations produced by the previous committee and by the subsequent review undertaken by Huw Lewis as Deputy Minister. It is good to see that many of the generic recommendations are now being applied to the voluntary sector, and I like to think that I, and colleagues past and present, had a small part in influencing that.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I will speak primarily to amendment 3. In doing so, I reiterate the appreciation that has already been expressed of the independent commission's work. I can attest that it was a challenging process—I was the first Assembly Member that the commission interviewed—and I am pleased that the process has been completed so successfully. We welcome the Minister's acceptance of the recommendations.

Minister, it is sometimes necessary in

gyffredinol. Mae'r gwahaniaeth rhwng cyllid prosiectau a chyllid craidd yn hanfodol i unrhyw fudiad. Mae'r cyntaf ar gael yn gyffredinol o amrywiaeth eang o ffynonellau a gellir ei ddefnyddio i ariannu camau gweithredu penodol sy'n seiliedig ar brosiectau. Fodd bynnag, tuedda cyllid o'r fath i gael ei glustnodi ac ni ellir ei ddyrannu i ariannu costau craidd mudiadau, megis gweinyddu cyffredinol ac adeiladau. Gall ymrwymiad i gyllid craidd hirdymor olygu'r gwahaniaeth rhwng llwyddiant a methiant, yn arbennig i rai o'r mudiadau llai.

Yn dilyn ei waith i ariannu adfywio cymunedol, aeth y pwyllgor ati i ystyried meithrin gallu. Unwaith eto, mae'r problemau a nodwyd o ran adfywio cymunedol yn berthnasol i'r sector gwirfoddol yn gyffredinol. Mae argymhellion 49 i 53 yn ymwneud â chynyddu cyfranogiad cymunedol ac ymgynghori ar lawr gwlad i'r eithaf wrth weithredu Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Yr oedd y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus hefyd o'r farn bod datblygu gallu yn rhan annatod o'r broses adfywio a'i bod yn bwysig sicrhau y caiff cymunedau eu cefnogi ac y rhoddir cyfle i grwpiau ac unigolion gweithgar o fewn y cymunedau hynny wneud y gorau o'u sgiliau.

Bu i Cymunedau yn Gyntaf elwa ar yr adroddiadau a'r argymhellion a gynhyrchwyd gan y pwyllgor blaenorol a chan yr adolygiad dilynol a gynhaliwyd gan Huw Lewis fel Dirprwy Weinidog. Mae'n braf gweld bod llawer o'r argymhellion cyffredinol bellach yn cael eu cymhwyso i'r sector gwirfoddol, a hoffwn feddwl fod gennyf fi, a'm cyd-Aelodau yn y gorffennol a'r presennol, ran fach i'w chwarae wrth ddylanwadu ar hynny.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Cyfeiriaf yn bennaf at welliant 3. Wrth wneud hynny, ategaf y gwerthfawrogiad a fynegwyd eisoes o waith y comisiwn annibynnol. Gallaf gadarnhau ei bod yn broses heriol—fi oedd yr Aelod cyntaf o'r Cynulliad i'r comisiwn gyfwrdd â hi—ac yr wyf yn falch o weld bod y broses wedi'i chwblhau mor llwyddiannus. Croesawn y ffaith bod y Gweinidog yn derbyn yr argymhellion.

Weinidog, weithiau mewn bywyd

political life to restate the obvious for reasons of reassurance. I therefore believe that amendment 3 is needed, because it is important that we emphasise the need for strong political leadership and to maintain strong cross-party support in approach to a positive Government engagement with the voluntary sector. The coming of the National Assembly has led to a departure from the pre-devolution approach in this regard. This relationship has been transformed from one of a patron, namely the Government, with what was perceived as a rather insignificant and aggravating client, namely the voluntary sector, to a real, dynamic partnership that is set in the National Assembly's structures. That has been strongly embraced at a political level across the parties, but I have concerns about how easy it is to embed this change into the organisational culture across the Welsh Assembly Government and beyond, for example into that of Assembly sponsored public bodies.

The Minister has demonstrated her commitment, and I do not believe that anyone could doubt it, but it will require a good deal of her time and attention to ensure delivery of the commission's recommendations across Government. Amendment 3 asks for regular reports to committee and to the Assembly. It assumes that reports will be made regularly to the Voluntary Sector Partnership Council, because of the importance of ensuring not only ongoing cross-party support, but cross-party understanding of what the recommendations set out to achieve. I am particularly keen that Members should have an opportunity to scrutinise progress on the delivery of the recommendations that the Minister has, at this stage, accepted in principle, and I hope that we can soon have some clarity about how she intends to proceed with them. I appreciate that what is before us is the first draft of an implementation programme, but there is a concern about acceptance in principle sometimes being polite language for leaving recommendations on the table. I have no doubt that that is not the case here, but we need to see how this will be taken forward.

There would be great value in establishing a

gwleidyddol rhaid ailddatgan yr hyn sy'n amlwg er mwyn rhoi sicrwydd. Credaf felly fod angen gwelliant 3, gan ei bod yn bwysig inni bwysleisio'r angen am arweinyddiaeth wleidyddol gref a chynnal cefnogaeth drawsbleidiol gref wrth geisio sicrhau cyfranogiad cadarnhaol gan y Llywodraeth gyda'r sector gwirfoddol. Ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, newidiodd yr ymagwedd cyn-datganoli yn hyn o beth. Trawsfurfiwyd y gydberthynas hon o gydberthynas noddwr, sef y Llywodraeth, â'r hyn a ystyriwyd yn gleient cymharol ddibwys a phryfoclyd, sef y sector gwirfoddol, i fod yn bartneriaeth wirioneddol ddeinamig sy'n rhan o strwythurau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Rhoddwyd croeso cynnes i hynny ar lefel wleidyddol ym mhob plaid, ond yr wyf yn pryderu o ran pa mor hawdd y bydd i gyflwyno'r newid hwn i'r diwylliant sefydliadol ym mhob rhan o Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a thu hwnt, er enghraifft i ddiwylliant sefydliadol cyrff cyhoeddus a noddwr gan y Cynulliad.

Mae'r Gweinidog wedi dangos ei hymrwymiad, ac ni chredaf y gallai unrhyw un ei amau, ond bydd angen iddi roi cryn dipyn o'i hamser a'i sylw i sicrhau y caiff argymhellion y comisiwn eu cyflwyno ar draws y Llywodraeth. Mae gwelliant 3 yn gofyn am adroddiadau rheolaidd i'r pwyllgor ac i'r Cynulliad. Mae'n tybio y cyflwynir adroddiadau rheolaidd i Gyngor Partneriaeth y Sector Gwirfoddol gan ei bod yn bwysig sicrhau dealltwriaeth drawsbleidiol o'r hyn y mae'r argymhellion yn anelu at ei gyflawni, yn ogystal â chefnogaeth drawsbleidiol barhaus. Yr wyf yn awyddus iawn i'r Aelodau gael cyfle i graffu ar y cynnydd a wneir wrth gyflwyno'r argymhellion y mae'r Gweinidog eisoes wedi'u derbyn mewn egwyddor, a gobeithiaf y gallwn gael rhywfaint o eglurhad cyn bo hir o ran y ffordd y bwriada fynd i'r afael â hwy. Gwerthfawrogaf mai drafft cyntaf rhaglen weithredu sydd ger ein bron ar hyn o bryd, ond ceir pryder weithiau mai ffordd gwrtais o nodi bod argymhellion yn cael eu rhoi i'r neilltu yw sôn am eu derbyn mewn egwyddor. Ni chredaf fod hynny'n wir yn yr achos hwn, ond mae angen inni weld sut y gweithredir ar hyn.

Byddai'n werthfawr iawn sefydlu gweithgor

small working party of partnership council members, Assembly Members and representatives from the sector to work with officials and the Wales Council for Voluntary Action on implementing those recommendations that relate to the working of the council, and to help monitor delivery to the timescale that the Minister has set on all the recommendations.

4.50 p.m.

I trust that the Minister will agree to support this proposal, which I believe was put forward in the last partnership council meeting. I am unclear as to whether this was the group to which the Minister referred in her speech or whether this would need to be perhaps in addition to working with that group.

The relationship with voluntary organisations is key to the Assembly's engagement with communities across Wales. We support the Minister's acceptance of the commission's recommendations and look forward to working with the Minister and the sector to ensure that they are implemented effectively and timely.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I remind Members that I must call the Minister at 4.54 p.m..

**Sandy Mewies:** Having refreshed my memory about the guidance and protocol of the Chamber today, I will not deviate or repeat myself if at all possible.

I was one of the Assembly Members who submitted written evidence to the review, and I have spoken to it in the past. I know that funding has been one of the voluntary sector's main considerations. The Minister has accepted most of these recommendations, and I know that, generally, the sector has welcomed this. It is particularly pleased, and I can say this for my local voluntary council in Flintshire, that the three-year minimum period for grant awards would be adopted wherever possible. Also welcome is the consideration to core-fund organisations that take a strategic role or where capacity building is an objective. This is important, and I hope that the Minister will inform us as

bach o aelodau'r cyngor partneriaeth, Aelodau'r Cynulliad a chynrychiolwyr o'r sector i weithio gyda swyddogion a Chyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru i weithredu'r argymhellion hynny sy'n ymwneud â gwaith y cyngor, ac i helpu i fonitro'r gwaith o gyflwyno'r argymhellion yn unol â'r terfynau amser a bennwyd gan y Gweinidog ar eu cyfer.

Hyderaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn cytuno i gefnogi'r cynnig hwn, a gyflwynwyd yn ôl pob sôn yng nghyfarfod diwethaf y cyngor partneriaeth. Nid wyf yn siŵr ai dyma'r grŵp y cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog ato yn ei haraith neu ba un a fyddai angen sefydlu'r grŵp hwn yn ogystal â'r gwaith gyda'r grŵp hwnnw.

Mae'r gydberthynas â mudiadau gwirfoddol yn allweddol i gyfranogiad y Cynulliad gyda chymunedau ledled Cymru. Cefnogwn y ffaith bod y Gweinidog wedi derbyn argymhellion y comisiwn ac edrychwn ymlaen at gydweithio gyda'r Gweinidog a'r sector er mwyn sicrhau y cânt eu gweithredu mewn ffordd effeithiol ac amserol.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Atgoffaf yr Aelodau fod yn rhaid imi alw ar y Gweinidog am 4.54 p.m..

**Sandy Mewies:** Ar ôl cael fy atgoffa o ganllawiau a phrotocol y Siambr heddiw, ceisiaf beidio â gwyrto o'r pwnc nac ailadrodd os yn bosibl.

Yr oeddwn yn un o Aelodau'r Cynulliad a gyflwynodd dystiolaeth ysgrifenedig i'r adolygiad, ac yr wyf wedi cyfeirio ato yn y gorffennol. Gwn mai cyllid oedd un o brif ystyriaethau'r sector gwirfoddol. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi derbyn y rhan fwyaf o'r argymhellion hyn, a gwn, yn gyffredinol, fod y sector wedi croesawu hyn. Yr wyf yn arbennig o falch, a gallaf ddatgan hyn ar ran fy nghyngor gwirfoddol lleol yn sir y Fflint, y byddai'r isafswm cyfnod o dair blynedd ar gyfer dyfarnu grantiau yn cael ei fabwysiadu lle bynnag y bo'n bosibl. Croesewir hefyd y ffaith bod ystyriaeth yn cael ei rhoi i ddarparu cyllid craidd i fudiadau sy'n ymgymryd â rôl strategol neu lle y mae meithrin gallu yn un

to when this will come about.

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** Having an independent commission was not an easy decision—it is much easier to review your own work yourself and to decide on outcomes. However, as Helen said, we have cross-party consensus on the voluntary sector and that dictated the decision. That is why I am pleased to accept its recommendations. I realise that you agree with me, Helen, that amendment 3 states the obvious, but I give my commitment that I report to committee regularly and allocate further Government time in due course to further discussions on voluntary sector issues; I hope that you accept that that is my intention.

You are spot on, Gwenda—all the stuff that came out of the Local Government and Public Services Committee review has a direct correlation in the independent commission's report. The recommendations of that committee have been taken forward into Hugh's report, and are now taken forward in all aspects of Government policy. That will also be the case in respect of this voluntary sector report.

On points made by Peter and others, the funding issue is core to this, and there will have to be much discussion about how we are going to get this right. If we are talking about six years, and we are initially guaranteeing three years, it can be a complex area, because it will not be only us invited, but local government and other bodies as well. How we can deal with that issue will be worthy of considerable discussion in committee and the voluntary sector partnership. Your points about grant regimes are also essential. On the action plan, we will have to see how this is implemented properly for the voluntary sector, how we achieve the outcomes, and consider the most innovative ways of dealing with it.

o'u hamcanion. Mae hyn yn bwysig, a gobeithiaf y gall y Gweinidog ein hysbysu pryd y cyflwynir y trefniant hwn.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** Nid oedd penodi comisiwn annibynnol yn benderfyniad hawdd—mae bob amser yn haws adolygu eich gwaith eich hun a phenderfynu ar ganlyniadau. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedodd Helen, mae gennym gonsensws trawsbleidiol o ran y sector gwirfoddol a dyna arweiniodd at y penderfyniad. Dyna pam y mae'n bleser gennyf dderbyn ei argymhellion. Sylweddolaf eich bod yn cytuno â mi, Helen, bod gwelliant 3 yn datgan yr hyn sy'n amlwg, ond gallaf gadarnhau fy mod yn cyflwyno adroddiadau rheolaidd i'r pwyllgor ac y byddaf yn neilltuo mwy o amser y Llywodraeth maes o law i gynnal trafodaethau pellach ar faterion sy'n ymwneud â'r sector gwirfoddol; gobeithiaf y derbyniwch mai dyna yw fy mwriad.

Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle, Gwenda—mae cyswllt uniongyrchol rhwng holl ganfyddiadau adolygiad y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus ac adroddiad y comisiwn annibynnol. Cynhwyswyd argymhellion y pwyllgor hwnnw yn adroddiad Hugh, ac fe'u cynhwysir bellach ym mhob agwedd ar bolisi'r Llywodraeth. Bydd hynny hefyd yn wir yn achos yr adroddiad hwn ar y sector gwirfoddol.

O ran y pwyntiau a wnaed gan Peter ac eraill, mae cyllid yn greiddiol i hyn, a bydd yn rhaid cynnal llawer o drafodaethau o ran sut i daro'r cydbwysedd cywir. Os ydym yn sôn am chwe blynedd, a'n bod yn gwarantu tair blynedd i ddechrau, gall fod yn faes cymhleth, gan nad ni fydd yr unig rai i gael gwahoddiad, ond llywodraeth leol a chyrrff eraill hefyd. Bydd angen cryn drafodaeth yn y pwyllgor ac ym mhartneriaeth y sector gwirfoddol ar sut y gallwn fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwnnw. Mae eich pwyntiau o ran systemau grant hefyd yn hanfodol. O ran y cynllun gweithredu, bydd yn rhaid inni weld sut y caiff ei weithredu'n briodol i'r sector gwirfoddol, sut y cyflawnwn y canlyniadau, ac ystyried y ffyrdd mwyaf arloesol o ymdrin ag ef.

We all commend volunteers, Lorraine, and I welcome your comments about the group in St Mellons. Long-term funding is an issue for them, and we must value them and help them with capacity. That must be taken forward. Leanne, my officials have already had discussions with voluntary sector officials about how we will take the strategy forward in all sorts of ways, and I intend, following the Assembly's agreement to this motion, to move quickly on these matters. You have my assurances that there will be a paper before the November meeting of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee and a full and frank discussion in the voluntary sector.

It is important that we all go forward together on some of these wider issues. Mark Isherwood alluded to paragraph 6, which extends wider than the Assembly—it goes into local health boards and Assembly sponsored public bodies. That is why I have said that I accept it in principle, but that I will have to do much more work in that area. I will finish, as I am conscious of the time constraints on this debate. I thank Members for their contributions and hope that they will support us. I assure you all that this will be taken through with the committee and the voluntary sector partnership, and I will ensure that there is Government time for further discussion on it as developments occur that will be of interest to Members.

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I request that the division bell be rung.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Under Standing Order No. 6.24, at least three Members must request that the bell be rung. Do three Members support the request? I see that they do. Clerk, please ring the bell.

5.00 p.m.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 1: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

Mae pob un ohonom yn cymeradwyo gwirfoddolwyr, Lorraine, a chrosawaf eich sylwadau ynghylch y grŵp yn Llaneirwg. Mae cyllid hirdymor yn broblem iddynt, a rhaid inni eu gwerthfawrogi a'u helpu o ran capasiti. Rhaid gweithredu ar hynny. Leanne, mae fy swyddogion eisoes wedi cynnal trafodaethau gyda swyddogion yn y sector gwirfoddol ynghylch sut y byddwn yn rhoi'r strategaeth ar waith mewn sawl gwahanol ffordd, ac, ar ôl cael cytundeb y Cynulliad i'r cynnig hwn, bwriadaf symud yn gyflym mewn perthynas â'r materion hyn. Gallaf eich sicrhau y caiff papur ei gyflwyno gerbron cyfarfod mis Tachwedd y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ac y cynhelir trafodaeth lawn ac agored yn y sector gwirfoddol.

Mae'n bwysig inni i gyd fwrw ati gyda'n gilydd ar rai o'r materion ehangach hyn. Cyfeiriodd Mark Isherwood at baragraff 6, sy'n cwmpasu mwy na'r Cynulliad—mae'n cynnwys byrddau iechyd lleol a chyrrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad. Dyna pam y dywedais fy mod yn ei gefnogi mewn egwyddor, ond y bydd yn rhaid imi wneud llawer mwy o waith yn y maes hwnnw. Dof i ben, gan fy mod yn ymwybodol o gyfyngiadau amser y ddatl hon. Diolchaf i Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau gan obeithio y byddant yn ein cefnogi. Gallaf eich sicrhau y caiff hyn oll ei drafod gyda'r pwyllgor a phartneriaeth y sector gwirfoddol, ac fe sicrhaf y caiff amser ei neilltuo gan y Llywodraeth i gynnal trafodaeth bellach arno wrth i ddatblygiadau fynd rhagddynt a fydd o ddiddordeb i Aelodau.

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Galwaf am i'r gloch gael ei chanu.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.24, rhaid i o leiaf dri Aelod alw am i'r gloch gael ei chanu. A oes tri Aelod yn cefnogi'r cais? Gwelaf eu bod. Clerc, canwch y gloch.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:



The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 41.  
 Amendment 2: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 41.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Melding, David  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary

Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
 Amendment 3: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
 Amendment 4: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:

The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM2120): O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2120): For 54, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane

Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Dadl Fer Short Debate**

#### **Mynd i'r afael â'r Fasnach Gig Anghyfreithlon Combating the Illegal Meat Trade**

**Brynle Williams:** I am delighted to be leading the short debate this afternoon. Combating the illegal meat trade is an issue that goes way beyond party politics. It is important to everyone in the Chamber, to our families, friends, and to the people of Wales and, indeed, the United Kingdom. One only has to remember the foot and mouth disease outbreak in 2001. To set the scene, the illegal trade in unfit meat poses a risk to public and animal health in the United Kingdom. In order to start addressing the issue, it is imperative that we give a voice to environmental health professionals, to the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs and to the Meat Hygiene Service, who are battling daily to combat the trade. This would not just focus on the large-scale poultry fraud that has been uncovered over the last few years, but would allow us to delve into less publicised illegal practices,

**Brynle Williams:** Pleser mawr imi yw arwain y ddadl fer y prynhawn yma. Mae mynd i'r afael â'r fasnach gig anghyfreithlon yn broblem sydd yn mynd ymhell y tu hwnt i wleidyddiaeth plaid. Mae'n bwysig i bawb yn y Siambr, i'n teuluoedd, i'n ffrindiau, ac i bobl Cymru ac, yn wir, pobl y Deyrnas Unedig. Nid oes ond angen inni gofio am argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau yn 2001. I osod y cefndir, mae'r fasnach anghyfreithlon mewn cig sy'n anaddas i'w fwyta yn risg i iechyd y cyhoedd ac iechyd anifeiliaid yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Er mwyn dechrau mynd i'r afael â'r broblem, mae'n hollbwysig ein bod yn rhoi llais i weithwyr proffesiynol ym maes iechyd yr amgylchedd, i Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig, ac i'r Gwasanaeth Hylendid Cig, sy'n brwydro'n feunyddiol i fynd i'r afael â'r fasnach. Byddai hyn nid yn unig yn canolbwyntio ar y twyll ar raddfa fawr yn ymwneud â dofednod a

which include the alleged sale of unfit meat. The debate must also look at other areas such as illegal imports and the continuing trade in smokies. I will return to the issue of smokies later.

This is the right time to raise the profile of meat fraud and its impact on public health, as the Government now appears to be taking note of the scale of the problem. I urge everyone here this afternoon, and the people of our fair country, to make the authorities aware of geographical areas in need of investigation. In 2003, many individuals and farming unions supported the UK-wide 'Stamp it Out' campaign, which aimed to reduce the quantity of unfit meat in the UK food chain through enforcement, raising public awareness and, where necessary, through changes in legislation. I spoke to many people while collating the information for my speech this afternoon, and research uncovered meat traders selling carcasses that were, and I quote, 'unfit for dogs'. Allegations have also been made against independent meat consultants who have advised meat traders how to offload potentially dangerous meat carcasses onto the open market. These people must be brought to book and not sit in positions of authority.

During my time as a farmer, I have heard of many serious cases of abuse, but perhaps the most serious involved sheep carcasses which were illegally slaughtered and sold by a London trader who was recently convicted of keeping meat in unhygienic conditions. The carcasses, known as smokies, are flamed using high powered blowtorches. The profit from one transit van load of smokies can be as much as £6,000. The trader in this case also supplied meat to butchers' shops and restaurants. Around 40 carcasses were sold from the back of a van and they were found to be emaciated and infected with tapeworm and other diseases. This is a distressing tale, but one which clearly needs to be highlighted and brought out into the open. Is it not time that the trade in smokies was addressed?

ddatgelwyd dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf, ond byddai hefyd yn caniatáu inni ymchwilio i arferion anghyfreithlon nad ydynt wedi cael cymaint o gyhoeddusrwydd, sy'n cynnwys honiadau o werthu cig sy'n anaddas i'w fwyta. Rhaid i'r ddatl hefyd edrych ar feysydd eraill fel mewnfurion anghyfreithlon a'r fasnach barhaus mewn cig wedi'i gochi. Dychwelaf at gig wedi'i gochi yn nes ymlaen.

Yn awr yw'r amser cywir i godi proffil twyll yn ymwneud â chig a'i effaith ar iechyd y cyhoedd, gan yr ymddengys bod y Llywodraeth bellach yn cymryd sylw o faint y broblem. Anogaf bawb sydd yma y prynhawn yma, a phobl ein gwlad brydferth, i sicrhau bod yr awdurdodau yn ymwybodol o ardaloedd daearyddol y mae angen ymchwilio iddynt. Yn 2003, cefnogwyd ymgyrch 'Stamp it Out' y DU gan lawer o unigolion ac undebau ffermio. Ei nod oedd lleihau swm y cig anaddas i'w fwyta yng nghadwyn fwyd y DU drwy orfodi, codi ymwybyddiaeth ymysg y cyhoedd a, lle bo angen, drwy newid mewn deddfwriaeth. Siaradais â llawer o bobl tra'n casglu'r wybodaeth ar gyfer fy araith y prynhawn yma, a datgelodd ymchwil fasnachwyr cig yn gwerthu carcasau a oedd, a dyfynnaf, yn 'anaddas i gŵn'. Gwnaed honiadau hefyd yn erbyn ymgynghorwyr cig annibynnol sydd wedi cynghori masnachwyr cig sut i werthu carcasau cig a allai fod yn beryglus ar y farchnad agored. Rhaid dod â'r bobl hyn i gyfrif a'u gwahardd o swyddi ag awdurdod.

Yn ystod fy nghyfnod fel ffermwr, yr wyf wedi clywed am sawl achos difrifol o gamarfer, ond efallai mai'r un mwyaf difrifol oedd yr un yn ymwneud â charcasau defaid a laddwyd yn anghyfreithlon ac a werthwyd gan fasnachwr o Lundain a gafodd ei gollfarnu'n ddiweddar o gadw cig mewn amodau anhylan. Caiff y carcasau, a elwir yn gig wedi'i gochi, ei fflamio drwy ddefnyddio chwythlampau pwerus iawn. Gall yr elw o un fan ddsbarthu yn llawn cig wedi'i gochi fod cymaint â £6,000. Yn yr achos hwn bu'r masnachwr hefyd yn cyflenwi cig i siopau cigydd a bwytai. Gwerthwyd tua 40 o garcasau o gefn fan a chanfuwyd eu bod yn ddi-gnawd ac wedi eu heintio gan lyngyr rhuban a chlefydau eraill. Mae hon yn stori ingol, ond yn un y mae angen ei hamlygu a

dod â hi i olau dydd. Onid yw'n bryd mynd i'r afael â'r fasnach mewn cig wedi'i gochi?

Smokies are often produced in extremely unhygienic conditions and can pose a health risk to the consumer. This must stop now. There is a call for this meat, therefore the meat should be processed through a registered abattoir, and checked by inspectors and the Meat Hygiene Service. It should be brought in from the cold and made legally safe. The illegal trade in smokies is being perpetrated by a small number of people. These people are highly motivated by greed and they do not care that their activities could cause great harm to the reputation of the overwhelming majority of decent law-abiding farmers. This is an important issue which must be taken seriously.

I fully support the respected Farmers Union of Wales and the National Farmers Union which have publicly endorsed and thrown their weight behind the 'Stamp it Out' campaign. The Farmers Union of Wales states that we need to work together to combat the problem of unfit meat entering the food chain, and that the campaign endeavours to cover a wide range of initiatives, including illegal imports, bush meat, illegal slaughter and the alleged sale of unfit meat. Former FUW president, Bob Parry, said that the union was deeply concerned by the damage that the trade in illegal meat was causing the farming industry. As a practising farmer, I endorse this statement.

We must send out a strong message to the people of Wales that we are committed to assisting law enforcement authorities in their crackdown on those responsible for the dirty meat trade. The vast majority of this illegal meat ends up on the dinner plates of members of our community. The illegal meat trade is estimated by experts to be worth in excess of £1 billion per year. I am sure that the Minister could use this money for many purposes. I call on the Government to provide additional resources to Her Majesty's Customs and Excise and local authority environmental health officers to help them stem the flood of illegal meat entering Britain.

Caiff cig wedi'i gochi ei gynhyrchu mewn amodau hynod o fudr yn aml a gall beri risg i iechyd y sawl a fydd yn ei fwyta. Rhaid i hyn ddod i ben yn awr. Mae galw am y cig hwn, felly dylid ei brosesu drwy ladd-dy cofrestredig, a'i archwilio gan arolygwyr a'r Gwasanaeth Hylendid Cig. Ni ddylid ei anwybyddu a dylid ei wneud yn gyfreithlon ddiogel. Mae'r fasnach anghyfreithlon mewn cig wedi'i gochi yn cael ei chyflawni gan nifer fechan o bobl. Mae trachwant yn gymhelliant mawr i'r bobl hyn ac nid ydynt yn malio y gallai eu gweithgareddau niweidio enw da y mwyafrif mawr o ffermwyr parchus nad ydynt yn torri'r gyfraith. Mae hwn yn fater pwysig y dylid ei gymryd o ddifrif.

Cefnogaf yn llwyr Undeb Amaethwyr Cymru ac Undeb Cenedlaethol yr Amaethwyr, sydd wedi cymeradwyo a chefnogi'r ymgyrch 'Stamp it Out' yn gyhoeddus. Mae Undeb Amaethwyr Cymru yn datgan bod angen inni gydweithio i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem o gig sy'n anaddas i'w fwyta yn cyrraedd y gadwyn fwyd, a bod yr ymgyrch yn ymdrechu i gwmpasu ystod eang o fentrau, gan gynnwys mewnfion anghyfreithlon, cig anifeiliaid gwyllt, lladd anifeiliaid yn anghyfreithlon a honiadau o werthu cig sy'n anaddas i'w fwyta. Dywedodd cyn-lywydd Undeb Amaethwyr Cymru, Bob Parry, fod yr undeb yn pryderu'n fawr am y niwed yr oedd y fasnach gig anghyfreithlon yn ei achosi i'r diwydiant ffermio. Fel ffermwr fy hun, cytunaf â'r datganiad hwn.

Rhaid inni anfon neges gref i bobl Cymru ein bod yn ymrwymedig i gynorthwyo awdurdodau sy'n gorfodi'r gyfraith yn eu hymgais i gosbi'n llym y rhai sy'n gyfrifol am y fasnach gig fudr. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r cig anghyfreithlon hwn yn cyrraedd platiau cinio pobl yn ein cymunedau. Mae'r arbenigwyr yn amcangyfrif bod y fasnach gig anghyfreithlon yn werth mwy nag £1 biliwn y flwyddyn. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gallai'r Gweinidog ddefnyddio'r arian hwn at sawl diben. Galwaf ar y Llywodraeth i ddarparu adnoddau ychwanegol i Dollau Tramor a Chartref Ei Mawrhydi a swyddogion iechyd yr amgylchedd awdurdodau lleol i'w helpu i atal y llif o gig anghyfreithlon rhag dod i

Brydain.

Most experts agree that the 2001 foot and mouth disease epidemic was triggered following a batch of infected meat which was illegally imported into this country. Members of the farming community and the public do not want a repeat of the shocking scenes of 2001, which is why they believe that the Government must take immediate action and take the threat posed by illegal meat seriously.

Cytuna'r rhan fwyaf o arbenigwyr i'r epidemig o glwy'r traed a'r genau gychwyn o ganlyniad i gig wedi'i heintio a gafodd ei fewnforio'n anghyfreithlon i'r wlad hon. Nid yw aelodau o'r gymuned ffermio na'r cyhoedd am weld y golygfeydd erchyll a welwyd yn 2001 unwaith eto, a dyna pam y maent yn credu bod yn rhaid i'r Llywodraeth gymryd camau ar unwaith a chymryd y bygythiad a ddaw yn sgîl cig anghyfreithlon o ddifrif.

The cost to the UK economy of the foot and mouth disease outbreak is estimated at £8 billion. We will never know the real emotional cost to the British public—remember the emptiness of the countryside. The real cost of that will never be known. What will be remembered is the overwhelming devastation to everyone involved: the tourism industry, the Welsh economy and the rural and urban communities.

Amcangyfrifir bod argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau wedi costio £8 biliwn i economi'r DU. Ni fyddwn byth yn gwybod maint y gost emosiynol wirioneddol i'r cyhoedd ym Mhrydain—cofiwch wacter cefn gwlad. Ni chawn byth wybod cost wirioneddol hynny. Yr hyn a gofir yw'r effaith hynod ddinistriol ar bawb dan sylw: y diwydiant twristiaeth, economi Cymru a'r cymunedau gwledig a threfol.

5.10 p.m.

I am not only concerned with illegal meat imports and the health risks that they pose, but also with the criminal gangs linked to the production of illegal meat in Britain. All major political parties support calls to combat illegal meat. The Lord Mayor of London, who is on record as saying that Customs and Excise and health officers frequently come across appalling imports of meat intended for consumption in London, is also supportive. He has stated that

Yr wyf yn pryderu, nid yn unig am fewnforio cig yn anghyfreithlon a'r risgiau i iechyd a ddaw yn ei sgîl, ond hefyd am y gangiau o droseddwyr sy'n gysylltiedig â chynhyrchu cig anghyfreithlon ym Mhrydain. Mae pob un o'r prif bleidiau gwleidyddol yn cefnogi'r galwadau i fynd i'r afael â chig anghyfreithlon. Mae Arglwydd Faer Llundain, sydd wedi cael ei gofnodi yn dweud bod y Tollau Tramor a Chartref a swyddogion iechyd yn canfod yn aml achosion gwarthus o gig wedi'i fewnforio sydd wedi'i fwriadu i gael ei fwyta yn Llundain, hefyd yn gefnogol. Nododd mai'r

'The best way to stifle this black market trade is to pool expertise and show that we are serious about stopping the spread of illegal meat throughout our city.'

ffordd orau i atal y fasnach hon ar y farchnad ddu yw dod ag arbenigedd ynghyd a dangos ein bod o ddifrif ynghylch atal cig anghyfreithlon rhag lledaenu drwy ein dinas.

No-one can argue with him on this issue, and I sincerely hope that the Government is listening to the reasons of farming unions, political parties and interested groups. A senior Peer admitted that the UK had a two-tier food market and stated that:

Ni all neb ddadlau gydag ef ar hyn, a mawr obeithiaf fod y Llywodraeth yn gwrandao ar resymau'r undebau ffermio, y pleidiau gwleidyddol, a'r grwpiau â diddordeb. Cyfaddefodd un o aelodau blaenllaw Tŷ'r Arglwyddi bod marchnad fwyd dwy haen yn y DU a nododd:

‘Higher standards in the retail and wholesale trade account for 90 per cent of what gets into the food chain. Another proportion is not of the same standard and avoids regulations before appearing in outlets or restaurants. There is a problem.’

I am concerned that, along with a failure by the courts to levy appropriate penalties for food offences, local authorities’ funding is an issue. I firmly support calls made by a leading trade union for x-ray machines to be installed at all ports of entry to scan personal luggage. More sniffer dogs—on which the Minister made a recent welcome announcement—should be employed around the clock at international airports, and there should be greater co-operation between enforcement agencies.

Should we not be adopting a similar approach to North America and Australia in terms of their codes of practice in ports and airports? On both continents, there are extreme penalties for even attempting to take illegal meat into those countries. In some cases, there is immediate incarceration without exception. They have strict penalties for dairy and vegetable matter and, of course, meat. Do you agree that there should be better signage to warn people of the penalties? There is a need for harsher penalties and those could be put in place at a relatively low cost. Only this week, I was given a demonstration of computer software for scanning personal luggage, which can identify all organic matter, which also aids law enforcement. Surely, this must be a worthwhile tool in the armoury to combat illegal trade.

To put things in context, the value of a suitcase of illegal meat can be £10,000 and more. If the perpetrator is caught, he is fined around £50 and his goods are confiscated. He is then left to simply try again. I am sure that you agree that that is no deterrent.

Another major issue of concern is the dealing in endangered species meat. This is a prime opportunity to help. We must—and I stress the word ‘must’—stamp out this filthy trade.

Safonau uwch mewn yn y fasnach manwerthu a chyfanwerthu sy’n cyfrif am 90 y cant o’r hyn sy’n cyrraedd y gadwyn fwyd. Mae cyfran arall nad yw o’r un safon ac sy’n osgoi rheoliadau cyn ymddangos mewn siopau neu fwytai. Mae problem.

Yr wyf yn pryderu, ynghyd â methiant y llysoedd i bennu cosbau priodol am droseddau’n ymwneud â bwyd, bod cyllid awdurdodau lleol yn broblem. Cefnogaf yn gadarn alwadau gan undeb llafur blaenllaw i beiriannau pelydr-x gael eu gosod ym mhob porthladd a maes awyr yn y DU er mwyn sganio bagiau personol. Dylid defnyddio rhagor o gŵn synhwyro—rhywbeth y bu i’r Gweinidog wneud cyhoeddiad i’w groesawu arno’n ddiweddar—24 awr y dydd mewn meysydd awyr rhyngwladol, a dylai asiantaethau gorfodi gydweithio yn well.

Oni ddylem fod yn mabwysiadu ymagwedd debyg i Ogledd America ac Awstralia o ran eu codau ymarfer mewn porthladdoedd a meysydd awyr? Ar y ddau gyfandir, mae cosbau eithafol am hyd yn oed ymgeisio i fynd â chig anghyfreithlon i mewn i’r gwledydd hynny. Mewn rhai achosion, caiff pobl eu carcharu ar unwaith yn ddiethriad. Mae ganddynt gosbau llym ar gyfer deunydd llaeth a llysiau ac, wrth gwrs, cig. Oni chytunwch y dylai fod gwell arwyddion i rybuddio pobl am y cosbau? Mae angen cosbau llymach a gellid trefnu hynny am gost gymharol isel. Dim ond yr wythnos hon, gwelais arddangosiad o feddalwedd cyfrifiadurol ar gyfer sganio bagiau personol, a all nodi deunydd organig, sydd hefyd yn cynorthwyo’r broses o orfodi’r gyfraith. Onid yw hwn yn offeryn defnyddiol yn y frwydr i fynd i’r afael â masnach anghyfreithlon?

I roi pethau yn eu cyd-destun, gall llund cês dillad o gig anghyfreithlon fod yn werth £10,000 a mwy. Os caiff y drwgweithredwr ei ddal, caiff ddirwy o tua £50 a chaiff ei nwyddau eu hatafael. Yna fe’i gadewir i roi cynnig arall arni. Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch nad yw hynny’n atal dim.

Un prif fater arall o bryder yw’r fasnach mewn cig rhywogaethau prin. Mae hwn yn gyfle euraid i helpu. Rhaid—a phwysleisiaf y gair ‘rhaid’—inni gael gwared ar y fasnach



The meat of members of the ape family and the endangered gorilla is imported. Surely we can see the opportunities for cross infection with diseases which come from bush meat. Ebola hemorrhagic fever is a severe, often fatal disease in humans and non-human primates—monkeys, gorillas, and chimpanzees—that has appeared sporadically since its initial recognition in 1976. This must be noted. Besides the trade in this meat, we are slaughtering some of the world's rarest creatures simply to appease the greed of man. Surely we also have a duty of care to the wildlife of the world. What happens if a disease from illegal bush meat is transferred to man? Remember the 2001 foot and mouth disease outbreak.

Biosecurity is an important issue. Without it, we might as well close our files and our briefcases and go home. I urge all of you this afternoon to support the Government's endeavours.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Cefnogaf lawer o'r hyn y mae Brynle wedi'i ddweud ynglŷn â chig sy'n cael ei fewnforio yn anghyfreithlon i Brydain a'r peryglon sydd ynghlwm â hynny. Cefnogaf yn arbennig yr alwad i gyfreithloni 'smokies' ac i gael cyfundrefn gyfreithiol fel y gall y diwydiant amaethyddiaeth fanteisio ar y galw sy'n amlwg yn bodoli, a fyddai'n llesol i'r diwydiant ac i bawb arall.

**Mick Bates:** I thank Brynle for highlighting this important subject. I will raise three issues that are the same as those raised by my colleague, Roger Williams MP, in Westminster, which are about protection against the import of disease. I hope that the Minister will use his influence to ensure that Westminster is working towards scrapping the allowance of 1 kilo of meat for every individual who comes into this country. Food labelling must be clear, so that when people purchase meat products, there is a standard on it which states that it is legal and properly processed. Finally, we must invest in technology that enables controls to take place at all ports of entry, such as airports and seaports. The technology already exists—there would be no additional costs. I hope

aflan hon yn llwyr. Caiff cig aelodau o deulu'r epa a'r gorila prin ei fewnforio. Oni allwn weld y cyfleoedd am draws-heintio gyda chlefydau sy'n deillio o gig anifeiliaid gwyllt. Mae twymyn ebola hemorrhagic yn glefyd difrifol, ac yn aml yn angheuol i bobl a deudroedolion—mwncïod, gorilaod a thsimpansiadaid—sydd wedi ymddangos o bryd i'w gilydd ers iddo gael ei gydnabod am y tro cyntaf yn 1976. Rhaid nodi hyn. Yn ogystal â'r fasnach gig hon, yr ydym yn lladd rhai o greaduriaid prinnaf y byd dim ond er mwyn lleddfu trachwant dyn. Onid oes gennym hefyd ddyletswydd gofal tuag at fywyd gwyllt y byd? Beth fydd yn digwydd os caiff clefyd yn deillio o gig anifeiliaid gwyllt anghyfreithlon ei drosglwyddo i bobl? Cofiwch argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau 2001.

Mae bioddiogelwch yn fater pwysig. Hebdo, waeth inni gau ein ffeiliau a'n bagiau dogfennau a mynd adref. Pwysaf ar bob un ohonoch y prynhawn yma i gefnogi ymdrechion y Llywodraeth.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I support much of what Brynle has said about meat which is imported illegally into Britain and the dangers associated with that. I particularly support the call to legalise smokies and for a legal system so that the agricultural industry can take advantage of the demand that obviously exists, which would be beneficial for the industry and for everyone else.

**Mick Bates:** Diolchaf i Brynle am amlygu'r pwnc pwysig hwn. Codaf yr un tri mater ag a godwyd gan fy nghyd-aelod, Roger Williams AS, yn San Steffan, sy'n ymwneud â diogelu rhag mewnforio clefydau. Gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn defnyddio ei ddylanwad i sicrhau bod San Steffan yn gweithio tuag at ddileu'r lwfans o 1 cilo o gig ar gyfer pob unigolyn a ddaw i mewn i'r wlad hon. Rhaid i'r labeli ar fwyd fod yn glir, fel bod safon ar gynnyrch cig sy'n nodi ei fod yn gyfreithlon ac wedi'i brosesu'n gywir pan fydd pobl yn ei brynu. Yn olaf, rhaid inni fuddsoddi mewn technoleg sy'n galluogi i reolaethau gael eu gweithredu ym mhob mynedfa i'r DU, fel meysydd awyr a phorthladdoedd. Mae'r dechnoleg eisoes yn bodoli—ni fyddai costau ychwanegol. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog

that the Minister will take that on board, and ensure that it will be installed in Cardiff.

**The Minister for the Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** I am grateful to Brynle Williams for raising this important issue, which has implications for the agricultural industry and for public health, and it is therefore of great interest to me. I welcome the opportunity to brief the Assembly on what the Assembly Government and our partners are doing to fight the illegal meat trade. We know that the illegal meat trade does not have such a high profile as the illegal trafficking of drugs or other organised crime, although, in recent months, there has been a growing media interest. It is important to stress at the outset that the vast majority of farmers, and those involved in the meat trade in Wales, are producing high-quality meat which meets all legal requirements. Nevertheless, this illegal trade, perpetrated by a small minority, has the potential to damage public health, the environment and animal health and it causes severe economic loss to the agriculture industry, as well as having the potential to damage the reputation of Welsh agriculture.

As Brynle has already mentioned, profits for the perpetrators can be substantial. The trade is a major criminal activity and must be treated as such. The knock-on consequences of these illegal activities include the loss of revenue to slaughterhouse operators and to the meat processing industry, as well as the loss of consumer confidence in the farming industry, which can seriously undermine the farming industry when these activities receive publicity or media attention. A number of different activities fall within the description 'illegal meat activity'. It covers the illegal killing of animals for the production of smokies. It includes the cleaning up and reintroduction of waste or condemned meat into the food chain, presenting a public health risk to consumers, and it covers the illegal importation of meat which may carry disease not found in the UK, presenting a risk to the national herd and to consumers. The Welsh Assembly Government, together with the Department

yn ystyried hynny, ac yn sicrhau y caiff ei osod yng Nghaerdydd.

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Brynle Williams am godi'r mater pwysig hwn, y mae iddo oblygiadau i'r diwydiant amaethyddol ac iechyd cyhoeddus, ac sydd felly o ddiddordeb mawr imi. Croesawaf y cyfle i roi amlinelliad i'r Cynulliad o'r hyn y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'n partneriaid yn ei wneud i frwydro yn erbyn y fasnach gig anghyfreithlon. Gwyddom nad oes gan y fasnach gig anghyfreithlon broffil mor uchel â'r fasnach gyffuriau anghyfreithlon neu gangiau troseddwr eraill, er y gwelwyd diddordeb cynyddol ynnddi gan y cyfryngau dros y misoedd diwethaf. Mae'n bwysig pwysleisio o'r cychwyn bod y mwyafrif helaeth o ffermwyr, a'r rhai sy'n rhan o'r fasnach gig yng Nghymru, yn cynhyrchu cig o safon uchel sy'n bodloni'r holl ofynion cyfreithiol. Serch hynny, mae'n bosibl i'r fasnach anghyfreithlon hon, a gyflawnir gan leiafrif bach, achosi niwed i iechyd cyhoeddus, yr amgylchedd ac iechyd anifeiliaid ac mae'n peri colled economaidd ddifrifol i'r diwydiant amaeth, yn ogystal â meddu ar y gallu i niweidio enw da amaethyddiaeth Cymru.

Fel y soniodd Brynle eisoes, gall yr elw i'r drwgweithredwyr fod yn sylweddol. Mae'r fasnach yn weithgaredd troseddol mawr a rhaid ei drin felly. Mae sgîl-effeithiau'r gweithgareddau anghyfreithlon hyn yn cynnwys gweithredwyr lladd-dai a'r diwydiant prosesu cig yn colli refeniw, yn ogystal â'r defnyddwyr yn colli hyder yn y diwydiant ffermio, a all danseilio'r diwydiant ffermio'n sylweddol pan gaiff y gweithgareddau hyn gyhoeddusrwydd neu sylw gan y cyfryngau. Cwmpesir nifer o weithgareddau gwahanol gan y disgrifiad 'gweithgaredd anghyfreithlon yn ymwneud â chig'. Mae'n cwmpasu lladd anifeiliaid yn anghyfreithlon er mwyn cynhyrchu cig wedi'i gochi. Mae'n cynnwys glanhau ac ailgyflwyno cig gwastraff neu gig wedi'i gondemnio i'r gadwyn fwyd, gan achosi risg i ddefnyddwyr o ran iechyd cyhoeddus, ac mae'n cwmpasu mewnfario cig yn anghyfreithlon, cig a allai gario clefyd nad yw'n gyffredin yn y DU, sy'n achosi risg i'r

for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs, the Food Standards Agency, local authorities and others, is working hard to combat all of these strands of illegal meat activity.

fuches genedlaethol ac i'r defnyddwyr. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, ynghyd ag Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig, yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd, awdurdodau lleol ac eraill, yn gweithio'n galed i fynd i'r afael â phob un o'r gweithgareddau anghyfreithlon hyn sy'n ymwneud â chig.

What action is being taken to combat the illegal trade in smokies, therefore? For over three years, food safety and animal health enforcement officers from local authorities in west Wales have been working in partnership with the Food Standards Agency, the police and other agencies to investigate the illegal slaughter of livestock and the supply of unfit meat for human consumption. The slaughtering of animals for this trade normally takes place in unlicensed premises, usually farm buildings, and in unsanitary and unhygienic conditions. The criminals do not make proper arrangements for the disposal of waste products from animals and are therefore committing further offences under animal by-products legislation.

Pa gamau a gymerir i fynd i'r afael â'r fasnach anghyfreithlon mewn cig wedi'i gochi, felly? Ers dros dair blynedd, bu swyddogion gorfodi diogelwch bwyd ac iechyd anifeiliaid o awdurdodau lleol yn y Gorllewin yn gweithio mewn partneriaeth â'r Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd, yr heddlu ac asiantaethau eraill i ymchwilio i achosion o ladd anifeiliaid yn anghyfreithlon a chyflenwi cig sy'n anaddas i'w fwyta. Fel arfer caiff anifeiliaid eu lladd ar gyfer y fasnach hon mewn adeiladau annhrwyddedig, adeiladau fferm fel arfer, ac mewn amodau afiach a budr. Nid yw'r troseddwr yn gwneud trefniadau priodol i waredu cynnyrch gwastraff sy'n deillio o anifeiliaid ac felly maent yn cyflawni rhagor o droseddau o dan ddeddfwriaeth sgil-gynhyrchion anifeiliaid.

5.20 p.m.

While the vast majority of farmers strive to comply with the food safety and animal health and welfare measures, it is evident that there is an element within the industry that conducts its activities either having scant regard to, or attempting to deliberately circumvent, the requirements of the law. It is a small minority that sometimes gives a bad name to the law-abiding majority, much to their annoyance and distress. The investigations that have been carried out in west Wales have uncovered extremely lucrative and sophisticated operations, involving many individuals working in separate teams and supplying different markets. There is also evidence of complete disregard for the welfare of the sheep both prior to and during slaughter. Animals are often inadequately stunned, bleeding arrangements are haphazard, and temporary and slaughtering operations are carried out in full view of fellow creatures awaiting their turn.

Er bod y mwyafrif helaeth o ffermwyr yn ymdrechu i gydymffurfio â'r mesurau diogelwch bwyd ac iechyd a lles anifeiliaid, mae'n amlwg bod elfen yn y diwydiant sy'n cynnal ei weithgaredd naill ai heb falio rhyw lawer am ofynion y gyfraith, neu sy'n ceisio eu hosgoi yn fwiadol. Lleiafrif bach ydyw sydd weithiau'n rhoi enw drwg i'r mwyafrif sy'n parchu'r gyfraith, er mawr ddieter a gofid iddynt. Mae'r ymchwiliadau yn y Gorllewin wedi datgelu gweithgareddau hynod broffidiol a soffistigedig, sy'n cynnwys llawer o unigolion sy'n gweithio mewn timau gwahanol ac sy'n cyflenwi marchnadoedd gwahanol. Mae tystiolaeth hefyd o ddifaterwch llwyr tuag at les y defaid cyn eu lladd ac yn ystod y broses o'u lladd. Yn aml ni chaiff anifeiliaid eu llonyddu'n ddigonol, mae'r trefniadau gwaedu'n digwydd ar hap, a chaiff gweithgaredd dros dro a gweithgaredd lladd eu cyflawni yng ngŵydd yr anifeiliaid eraill sy'n aros eu tro.

I wish to refer specifically to smokies,

Hoffwn gyfeirio'n benodol at gig wedi'i

particularly in the light of recent press articles that have speculated that the activity could be legalised in the near future. Smokies are produced by burning the fleece off illegally slaughtered sheep and goat carcasses, often with a blowtorch, which gives a strong smoked flavour to the meat. The production of smokies for sale for human consumption is illegal because the animals are slaughtered in unlicensed premises without official supervision and with the skin remaining attached to the meat. This is contrary to EU law and the requirements of the UK's fresh meat hygiene regulations. Smokies pose a significant risk to public health for a number of reasons: the animals are slaughtered in unlicensed premises where BSE controls are not applied and the specified risk material is not removed under the supervision of the Meat Hygiene Service. Contamination by faecal material may result in the presence of harmful bacteria such as e-coli and Salmonella. There are concerns about the effect of potential residues from veterinary medicines, and serious concerns about animal welfare in view of the primitive conditions in which the animals may be slaughtered. The Food Standards Agency recognises that one way to combat the trade in smokies would be to make their production legal in licensed slaughterhouses and subject to the proper conditions, thus enabling the farming community to benefit from the apparent demand for the product. Consequently, the agency has commissioned research to determine whether there is any way that smokies, or skin-on sheep carcasses, can be produced safely, humanely and legally in licensed premises. The research project, which is being carried out by Bristol University Veterinary School, is expected to report its conclusions by November 2005. If the conclusions are positive, the agency will consider approaching the European Commission to have the law changed to allow the production of smokies. However, I must emphasise that the production of smokies is currently illegal and there is no prospect of this changing in the short term. The activity will remain illegal unless or until the law is changed.

gochi, yn arbennig yng ngoleuni erthyglau sydd wedi ymddangos yn y wasg yn ddiweddar sydd wedi damcaniaethu y gallai'r gweithgaredd gael ei gyfreithloni yn y dyfodol agos. Caiff cig wedi'i gochi ei gynhyrchu drwy losgi'r cnu oddi ar garcasau defaid a geifr a laddwyd yn anghyfreithlon, yn aml gyda chwythlamp, sy'n rhoi blas mwg cryf i'r cig. Mae cynhyrchu cig wedi'i gochi i'w werthu i'w fwyta gan bobl yn anghyfreithlon oherwydd caiff yr anifeiliaid eu lladd mewn adeiladau annhrwyddedig heb oruchwyliaeth swyddogol a chyda'r croen ynghlwm wrth y cig. Mae hyn yn groes i gyfraith yr UE a gofynion rheoliadau hylendid cig ffres y DU. Mae cig wedi'i gochi yn achosi risg i iechyd cyhoeddus am sawl rheswm: caiff yr anifeiliaid eu lladd mewn adeiladau annhrwyddedig heb gymhwysio rheolaethau BSE a heb dynnu'r deunydd risg penodedig o dan oruchwyliaeth y Gwasanaeth Hylendid Cig. Gallai halogi drwy ddeunydd ysgarthol arwain at bresenoldeb bacteria niweidiol fel e-coli a Salmonella. Mae pryder ynghylch effaith gweddillion posibl meddyginiaethau milfeddygol, a phryderon dybryd am les anifeiliaid yng ngoleuni'r amodau cyntefig y gallai'r anifeiliaid gael eu lladd ynddynt. Mae'r Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd yn cydnabod mai un ffordd o fynd i'r afael â'r fasnach mewn cig wedi'i gochi fyddai cyfreithloni'r broses o'u cynhyrchu mewn lladd-dai trwyddedig a sicrhau eu bod yn ddarostyngedig i'r amodau cywir, gan alluogi'r gymuned ffermio i elwa ar y galw ymddangosiadol am y cynnyrch. O ganlyniad, mae'r asiantaeth wedi comisiynu ymchwil i benderfynu a oes unrhyw ffordd o gynhyrchu cig wedi'i gochi, neu garcasau defaid gyda chroen arnynt, yn ddiogel, yn ddi-boen ac yn gyfreithlon mewn adeiladau trwyddedig. Disgwylir i'r prosiect ymchwil, a gynhelir gan Ysgol Filfeddygol Prifysgol Bryste, gyflwyno adroddiad ar ei gasgliadau erbyn Tachwedd 2005. Os bydd y casgliadau hyn yn gadarnhaol, bydd yr asiantaeth yn ystyried gwneud cais i'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd i newid y gyfraith er mwyn galluogi cig wedi'i gochi i gael ei gynhyrchu. Fodd bynnag, rhaid imi bwysleisio bod cynhyrchu cig wedi'i gochi yn anghyfreithlon ar hyn o bryd ac na ragwelir y bydd hyn yn newid yn y byr dymor. Bydd y gweithgaredd yn parhau i fod yn anghyfreithlon oni chaiff y

gyfraith ei newid, neu hyd nes y gwneir hynny.

It is important to note that experience to date shows that those who engage in the smokies trade are also often involved in other illegal meat activities, supplying unfit meat locally and nationally. Any future legalisation of skin-on sheep meat production would therefore only be one element of the fight against organised meat crime in Wales.

Mae'n bwysig nodi bod profiad hyd yma yn dangos bod y rhai sy'n ymwneud â'r fasnach cig wedi'i gochi yn aml yn ymwneud â gweithgareddau anghyfreithlon eraill sy'n ymwneud â chig hefyd, gan gyflenwi cig nad yw'n addas i'w fwyta yn lleol ac yn genedlaethol. Dim ond un elfen o'r frwydr yn erbyn gangiau o droseddwr sy'n cyflawni troseddau'n ymwneud â chig yng Nghymru fyddai cyfreithloni cynhyrchu cig dafad â chroen arno yn y dyfodol.

In the light of the activity uncovered in west Wales, the National Assembly agreed to provide funding to the Food Standards Agency in Wales to set up a co-ordinating unit, to be located within a local authority in Wales. Following deliberations by the Society of Directors of Public Protection in Wales, it was agreed that Ceredigion County Council would host the Food Fraud Coordination Unit, which has been operational since the beginning of August. The aim of the unit is to effectively co-ordinate the enforcement endeavours of local authorities in Wales, to ensure that deliberate contraventions of food safety control measures are dealt with firmly and consistently, and to ensure that the risks to public health and safety and the harm to the reputation of the Welsh food and agriculture industries are minimised.

Yng ngoleuni'r gweithgaredd a ddatgelwyd yn y Gorllewin, cytunodd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i ddarparu cyllid i'r Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd yng Nghymru i sefydlu uned gydgyssylltu, i'w lleoli mewn awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru. Yn dilyn trafodaethau gan Gymdeithas Cyfarwyddwyr Diogelu'r Cyhoedd yng Nghymru, cytunwyd mai Cyngor Sir Ceredigion fyddai'n cynnal yr Uned Gydgyssylltu Twyll Bwyd a fu'n weithredol ers dechrau mis Awst. Nod yr uned yw cydlynu ymdrechion gorfodi awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru yn effeithiol, i sicrhau yr ymdrinnir ag achosion bwriadol o dorri mesurau diogelwch bwyd yn gadarn ac yn gyson, a sicrhau bod y risgiau i iechyd a diogelwch y cyhoedd a'r niwed i enw da diwydiannau bwyd ac amaeth Cymru yn cael eu lleihau.

While responsibility for the investigation of food safety breaches will remain with the local authority in whose area the offences are committed, experience has demonstrated that the individuals involved in this type of illegal activity do not observe county boundaries, for obvious reasons. Linked offences and lines of inquiry may extend across several local authority areas and involve a number of officers from different disciplines, departments and agencies. In such circumstances, it is important that everyone is aware of the type and nature of offences being investigated and their role in helping to bring the perpetrators to account. There is one rule that applies in any attempt by any law-enforcement agency to enforce the law, namely that people are often not put off committing crime by the penalty, but by the

Er y bydd y cyfrifoldeb dros ymchwilio i achosion o dorri rheolau diogelwch bwyd yn parhau i gael eu hysgwyddo gan yr awdurdod lleol y cyflawnir y troseddau yn ei ardal, dengys profiad nad yw'r unigolion sy'n ymwneud â'r math hwn o weithgaredd anghyfreithlon yn parchu ffiniau siroedd, am resymau amlwg. Gallai troseddau ac ymchwiliadau cysylltiedig ymestyn dros ardaloedd sawl awdurdod lleol a chynnwys nifer o swyddogion o wahanol ddisgyblaethau, adrannau ac asiantaethau. Mewn amgylchiadau o'r fath, mae'n bwysig bod pawb yn ymwybodol o'r math o droseddau yr ymchwilir iddynt a'u natur, a'u rôl o ran helpu i ddwyn y drwgweithredwyr hyn i gyfrif. Mae un rheol sy'n berthnasol i unrhyw ymgais gan unrhyw asiantaeth gorfodi'r gyfraith i orfodi'r gyfraith, sef nad

fear of getting caught and of evidence being given against them. You can have the most draconian penalties in the world, but if nobody is prepared to give evidence against those people, the penalties are worthless. Our message must be that, if people know that this trade is taking place, they must report it. If they do not report it, they cause harm, not just potentially to human health, but to the image of Wales abroad that we are working so hard to build up.

The Food Standards Agency has been supporting Welsh local authorities in several ways, including the secondment of investigators to authorities involved in particularly complex cases and the provision of relevant training to all Welsh local authorities. The FSA is also taking action on a UK basis, which can be of assistance to local authorities in Wales. This includes the setting up of a fighting fund, on which local authorities may be able to draw during their investigations, and the establishment of a UK illegal meat taskforce of trained and experienced local authority enforcement officers to act as a source of intelligence gathering and specialist advice. Welsh local authorities have already benefited from links with the UK taskforce and from the fighting fund. The FSA will continue to work with local authorities to ensure that the law is enforced and to combat the illegal meat trade.

In conclusion, the Assembly Government is committed to supporting those agencies involved in tackling meat crime. Those in the farming community also need to work together to combat these activities, which not only pose a threat to public health and animal welfare, but threaten the good name of the farming industry and the people of Wales. With the information provided by people locally, we can make a real dent in meat crime, which is the challenge that we all face.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That concludes this afternoon's business.

y gosb yn aml sy'n atal pobl rhag cyflawni'r trosedd, ond yr ofn o gael eu dal a thystiolaeth yn cael ei rhoi yn eu herbyn. Gallwch gael y cosbau llymaf yn y byd, ond os nad oes neb yn barod i roi tystiolaeth yn erbyn y bobl hyn, mae'r cosbau'n ddiwerth. Y neges y mae'n rhaid ei chyfleu yw, os yw pobl yn gwybod bod y fasnach hon yn digwydd, rhaid iddynt hysbysu'r awdurdodau. Os na wnânt hynny, maent yn achosi niwed, nid yn unig niwed posibl i iechyd pobl, ond niwed i ddelwedd Cymru dramor yr ydym yn gweithio mor galed i'w datblygu.

Bu'r Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd yn cefnogi awdurdodau lleol Cymru mewn sawl ffordd, yn cynnwys rhoi secondiad i ymchwilyr i awdurdodau sy'n ymwneud ag achosion arbennig o gymhleth a darparu'r hyfforddiant perthnasol i bob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru. Mae'r asiantaeth hefyd yn cymryd camau ar gyfer y DU gyfan, a all fod o gymorth i awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru. Mae hyn yn cynnwys sefydlu cronfa i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem, y gall awdurdodau lleol ei defnyddio yn ystod eu hymchwiliadau, a sefydlu tasglu cig anghyfreithlon yn y DU o swyddogion gorfodi awdurdodau lleol hyfforddedig a phrofiadol i weithredu fel ffynhonnell casglu gwybodaeth a chynghor arbenigol. Mae awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru eisoes wedi elwa ar gysylltiadau gyda thasglu'r DU ac ar y gronfa hon. Bydd yr asiantaeth yn parhau i weithio gydag awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau y caiff y gyfraith ei gorfodi ac i fynd i'r afael â'r fasnach gig anghyfreithlon.

I gloi, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ymrwymedig i gefnogi'r asiantaethau hynny sy'n ceisio mynd i'r afael a throeddau'n ymwneud â chig. Mae angen i'r rhai yn y gymuned ffermio gydweithio hefyd i fynd i'r afael â'r gweithgareddau hyn, sydd nid yn unig yn fygythiad i iechyd y cyhoedd a lles anifeiliaid, ond sy'n fygythiad i enw da y diwydiant ffermio yng Nghymru a phobl Cymru. Gyda'r wybodaeth a ddarperir gan bobl yn lleol, gallwn ostwng troeddau'n ymwneud â chig yn sylweddol, a dyna'r her y mae pob un ohonom yn ei hwynebu.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.26 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 5.26 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau  
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Law, Peter (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Marek, John (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)

Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)