



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)**

Dydd Mercher 26 Mawrth 2003

Tuesday 26 March 2003

Cynnwys
Contents

- 4 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg
Questions to the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language
- 9 Cwestiynau i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor
Questions to the Deputy First Minister and Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad
- 24 Cwestiynau ar Lywodraeth Agored i'r Trefnydd
Questions on Open Government to the Business Minister
- 31 Cwestiwn Brys: Strwythur ELWa yn y Dyfodol
Urgent Question: The Future Structure of ELWa
- 41 Pwynt o Drefn
Point of Order
- 41 Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion
Composite Motion: Approval of Orders
- 43 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Lwfansau i Aelodau Cyngorau Cymuned) (Cymru) 2003
Approval of the Local Authorities (Allowances for Members of Community Councils) (Wales) Regulations 2003
- 46 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Gwasanaethau Maethu (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2003
Approval of the Fostering Services (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2003
- 48 Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol 2001 (Cychwyn Rhif 5) (Cymru) 2003, Rheoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Llety Preswyl) (Taliadau Ychwanegol, Cyfraniadau Perthnasol ac Asesu Adnoddau) (Cymru) 2003, a Rheoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Llety Preswyl) (Diystyru Adnoddau) (Cymru) 2003
Approval of the Health and Social Care Act 2001 (Commencement No. 5) (Wales) Order 2003, the National Assistance (Residential Accommodation) (Additional Payments, Relevant Contributions and Assessment of Resources) (Wales) Regulations 2003, and the National Assistance (Residential Accommodation) (Disregarding of Resources) (Wales) Regulations 2003
- 55 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Symiau at Anghenion Personol) (Cymru) 2003
Approval of the National Assistance (Sums for Personal Requirement) (Wales) Regulations 2003
- 62 Rheoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Asesu Adnoddau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003
The National Assistance (Assessment of Resources) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003
- 63 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Asesu Adnoddau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003
Approval of the National Assistance (Assessment of Resources) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003

- 71 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cyfrifon Dysgu Unigol (Cymru) 2003
Approval of the Individual Learning Accounts (Wales) Regulations 2003
- 77 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Addysg (Addysg Feithrin a Chynlluniau Datblygu Blynyddoedd Cynnar a Gofal Plant) (Cymru) 2003
Approval of the Education (Nursery Education and Early Years Development of Childcare Plans) Wales Regulations 2003
- 79 Cyllideb Atodol
Supplementary Budget
- 93 Datblygu Cynaliadwy
Sustainable Development
- 103 Dadl Fer: Rhaid Cadw Dyffryn Wysg i Genedlaethau'r Dyfodol Fedru ei Fwynhau
Short Debate: The Usk Valley must be Preserved for the Enjoyment of Future Generations

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

**Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg
Questions to the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language**

**Canslo Ymgynghoriad (Amodau Grantiau Diwygiedig)
Consultation Cancellation (Revised Condition of Grants)**

Q1 Janet Ryder: What are the reasons for cancelling the consultation process on revised condition of grants that was due to take place in January/February 2003? (OAQ23627)

The Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language (Jenny Randerson): The Arts Council of Wales consulted the arts umbrella bodies and used feedback from individual revenue clients to establish the terms and conditions of the new funding schemes. The new funding schemes combine Assembly and lottery funding streams, and are designed to simplify and streamline the council's processes. The conditions have not changed; they have just been combined for the first time.

Janet Ryder: I am sure that you know that the way in which the arts council introduced its new conditions of grant has caused considerable confusion and discontent within the sector, not to mention delays in the funding process. Many of the arts council's revenue clients have still not received their grant offer letters. This has led to the genuine possibility of redundancies and cancelled performances by some companies. As the Minister with responsibility for this area, can you give an assurance that this will not happen?

Jenny Randerson: At this morning's Culture Committee meeting, coincidentally, Peter Tyndall, the chief executive of the arts council answered questions on this issue. He agreed that the way in which the terms and conditions for new funding streams had been combined with a letter and documentation could have been introduced more clearly. Work is being done on that issue, and he gave a commitment that the information on funding would be available to groups by 1 April—I believe that that is the date that he gave. There should be no question of

C1 Janet Ryder: Beth yw'r rhesymau am ganslo'r broses ymgynghori ynghylch yr amodau grantiau diwygiedig, y bwriadwyd ei chynnal ym mis Ionawr/Chwefror 2003? (OAQ23627)

Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg (Jenny Randerson): Ymgynghorodd Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru â chyrff ymbarél y celfyddydau a defnyddiodd adborth gan gleientiaid refeniw unigol i sefydlu termau ac amodau'r cynlluniau ariannu newydd. Mae'r cynlluniau ariannu newydd yn cyfuno ffrydiau ariannu'r Cynulliad a'r loteri, ac fe'u cynlluniwyd i symleiddio prosesau'r cyngor. Nid yw'r amodau wedi newid; dim ond wedi eu cyfuno am y tro cyntaf y maent.

Janet Ryder: Mae'n siŵr y gwyddoch bod y ffordd y cyflwynodd y cyngor celfyddydau ei amodau grant newydd wedi achosi cryn ddryswch ac anniddigrwydd o fewn y sector, heb sôn am oedi yn y broses ariannu. Mae llawer o gleientiaid refeniw cyngor y celfyddydau heb dderbyn eu llythyrau cynnig grant eto. Arweiniodd hyn at y posibilrwydd gwirioneddol y bydd diswyddiadau ac y bydd rhai cwmnïau yn canslo perfformiadau. Fel y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am y maes hwn, a allwch roi sicrwydd na fydd hyn yn digwydd?

Jenny Randerson: Yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Diwylliant y bore hwn, fel mae'n digwydd, atebodd Peter Tyndall, prif weithredwr cyngor y celfyddydau, gwestiynau ar y mater hwn. Cytunodd y gallai'r ffordd y cafodd y termau ac amodau ar gyfer y ffrydiau ariannu newydd eu cyfuno gyda llythyr a dogfennaeth fod wedi bod yn gliriach. Gwneir gwaith ar y mater hwnnw, a rhoddodd ymrwymiad y byddai'r wybodaeth am ariannu ar gael i grwpiau erbyn 1 Ebrill—credaf mai dyna oedd y dyddiad a roddodd. Ni ddylai diswyddiadau fod yn ystyriaeth.

redundancies. The arts council has had a massive uplift in its funding; revenue clients, and other applicants, should not fear problems at this time.

Glyn Davies: Arts council grants can be a complicated and controversial issue. At this morning's Committee meeting, the chair of the Arts Council of Wales referred to two occasions when the council and the Minister had been in dispute with regard to responsibility for awarding grants. What were those two examples?

Jenny Randerson: I am not aware of any dispute with the arts council with regard to the conditions of awarding grants to specific organisations. There has never been a formal dispute or anything other than the usual flow of information which exists with a body such as the arts council. I stress that the new funding streams simplify the situation for the future—from 43 different funding streams to 11. That is a considerable simplification.

Cafodd cyngor y celfyddydau gynnydd anferthol yn ei arian; ni ddylai cleientiaid refeniw nac ymgeiswyr eraill ofni problemau ar yr adeg hon.

Glyn Davies: Gall grantiau cyngor y celfyddydau fod yn bwnc cymhleth ac yn bwnc llosg. Yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor y bore hwn, cyfeiriodd cadeirydd Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru at ddau achlysur lle bu anghydfod rhwng y cyngor a'r Gweinidog ynglŷn â'r cyfrifoldeb dros ddyfarnu grantiau. Beth oedd y ddwy enghraifft honno?

Jenny Randerson: Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o unrhyw anghydfod gyda chyngor y celfyddydau ynglŷn ag amodau dyfarnu grantiau i sefydliadau penodol. Ni chafwyd anghydfod ffurfiol erioed nac unrhyw beth ar wahân i'r llif arferol o wybodaeth sy'n rhedeg rhyngom a chorff fel cyngor y celfyddydau. Pwysleisiaf fod y ffrydiau ariannu newydd yn symleiddio'r sefyllfa ar gyfer y dyfodol—o 43 o ffrydiau ariannu gwahanol i 11. Mae hynny'n symleiddiad sylweddol.

Hyrwyddo Chwaraeon Lleiafrifol Promoting Minority Sports

Q2 Brian Hancock: What steps is the Minister taking to promote minority sports in Wales? (OAQ23615)

Jenny Randerson: The Welsh Assembly Government continues to work closely with the Sports Council for Wales to help to promote minority sports in Wales. The sports council is this year funding 57 governing bodies and the Elite Cymru scheme, to support athletes across a wide range of sports.

Brian Hancock: As chair of the Newport Harriers Athletics Club, I know of the problems of finding coaches, trainers and officials to promote the sport. This situation is replicated with other sports throughout Wales, particularly netball and basketball in Cardiff and Newport. Will you consider schemes to allow individual coaches and trainers to access training in order to better promote their sports, even if that only means

C2 Brian Hancock: Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i hyrwyddo chwaraeon lleiafrifol yng Nghymru? (OAQ23615)

Jenny Randerson: Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn parhau i weithio'n agos â Chyngor Chwaraeon Cymru i helpu i hyrwyddo chwaraeon lleiafrifol yng Nghymru. Mae'r cyngor chwaraeon eleni yn ariannu 57 o gyrff llywodraethu a chynllun Elite Cymru, i gefnogi athletwyr ar draws ystod eang o chwaraeon.

Brian Hancock: Fel cadeirydd clwb athletau Newport Harriers, gwn am y problemau o geisio dod o hyd i hyfforddwyr a swyddogion i hyrwyddo chwaraeon. Efelychir y sefyllfa hon mewn chwaraeon eraill ledled Cymru, yn arbennig pêl-rwyd a phêl-fasged yng Nghaerdydd a Chasnewydd. A ystyriwch gynlluniau i alluogi hyfforddwyr unigol i gael hyfforddiant er mwyn hyrwyddo eu chwaraeon yn well, hyd yn oed os yw hynny

paying for the time that they must take off from work?

Jenny Randerson: You have raised an important issue if we are to develop all kinds of sports in Wales. We already have the Coach Cymru scheme, which has awarded £25,200 in the last financial year to support athletics coaches. I am awaiting firm proposals from the sports council for a considerable expansion of the support for coaching in all sports in Wales. That funding is earmarked for coaching in 2003-04. I will release the money after I have received the detailed proposals.

Alun Pugh: Minister, rock-climbing is a minority sport but safety levels are quite high. Climbers share the mountains with walkers who sometimes get themselves into difficulties. Can you give us a report of yesterday's meeting with the Wales Outdoor Activities Forum?

Jenny Randerson: The meeting did not take place yesterday. My diary is so full that I cannot recall when it did take place, but it was as recent as the end of last week. I can give you positive information. The forum has produced an excellent report, which is on time and has firm proposals. I thank all of the forum's members for their work. I have made an additional £40,000 available to fund its proposals. They will include the provision of improved weather forecasts for leisure users and mountaineers. We will also fund other aspects of the work, such as more noticeboards and so on. Other partners are involved, such as the Wales Tourist Board, which has produced a valuable leaflet on safety.

ond yn golygu talu am yr amser y mae'n rhaid iddynt ei gymryd o'r gwaith?

Jenny Randerson: Yr ydych wedi codi mater pwysig os ydym am ddatblygu pob math o chwaraeon yng Nghymru. Mae gennym y cynllun Coach Cymru eisoes, y dyfarnwyd £25,200 iddo yn y flwyddyn ariannol ddiwethaf i gefnogi hyfforddwyr athletau. Yr wyf yn aros am gynigion pendant gan y cyngor chwaraeon i ehangu'r cymorth hyfforddi yn sylweddol i bob math o chwaraeon yng Nghymru. Clustnodwyd yr arian hwnnw ar gyfer hyfforddi yn 2003-04. Byddaf yn rhyddhau'r arian ar ôl imi dderbyn y cynigion manwl.

Alun Pugh: Weinidog, mae dringo creigiau ymysg y chwaraeon lleiafrifol ond mae'r lefelau diogelwch yn eithaf uchel. Mae dringwyr yn rhannu'r mynyddoedd gyda cherddwyr sydd weithiau'n mynd i drafferthion. A allwch roi adroddiad inni ar y cyfarfod ddoe gyda Fforwm Gweithgareddau Awyr Agored Cymru?

Jenny Randerson: Ni chynhaliwyd y cyfarfod ddoe. Mae fy nyddiadur mor llawn fel na allaf gofio pryd y'i cynhaliwyd, ond yr oedd mor ddiweddar â diwedd yr wythnos diwethaf. Gallaf roi gwybodaeth gadarnhaol ichi. Cynhyrchodd y fforwm adroddiad rhagorol, mewn da bryd ac mae'n cynnwys cynigion pendant. Diolchaf i bob aelod o'r fforwm am eu gwaith. Yr wyf wedi sicrhau bod £40,000 ychwanegol ar gael i ariannu ei gynigion. Byddant yn cynnwys darparu gwell rhagolygon y tywydd i ddefnyddwyr hamdden a mynyddwyr. Byddwn hefyd yn ariannu agweddau eraill ar y gwaith, megis mwy o hysbysfyrddau ac ati. Mae partneriaid eraill yn gysylltiedig â hyn, megis Bwrdd Croeso Cymru, sydd wedi cynhyrchu taflen werthfawr ar ddiogelwch.

Hyrwyddo a Marchnata Treftadaeth Cymru Promoting and Marketing Welsh Heritage

Q3 Brian Hancock: Will the Minister make a statement on how the cultural Assembly sponsored public bodies are promoting and marketing Welsh heritage? (OAQ23614)

C3 Brian Hancock: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ynghylch sut mae'r cyrff cyhoeddus diwylliannol a noddur gan y Cynulliad yn hyrwyddo ac yn marchnata treftadaeth Cymru? (OAQ23614)

Jenny Randerson: All cultural Assembly sponsored public bodies within my portfolio promote and market Welsh heritage as part of their functions. In addition, other bodies funded by the Assembly Government such as the Wales Tourist Board, Cadw, the Council of Museums in Wales and the Welsh Books Council have an important role to play.

Brian Hancock: Welsh heritage comes in a number of guises, for example, the former Navigation Colliery site at Crumlin, which has grade II* listed buildings. I want to bring it back into use as an economic development unit, for start-ups, and as a skills and communications centre. Our waterways and canals are also part of our heritage—

The Presiding Officer: Order. You have had the benefit of two questions today. I do not think that we need a speech as well as a supplementary.

Brian Hancock: Minister, what steps are you taking to protect and develop the heritage of Wales, bearing in mind the consultative strategy document 'Waterways for Wales'?

Jenny Randerson: As you know, Brian, this is not one of my responsibilities; it is not in my portfolio. For your information, Cadw has offered a grant of £45,000 towards the emergency repairs to four of the five main structures at Navigation Colliery in Crumlin in order to ensure that the buildings are wind and weather proof. Cadw has also had discussions with the site owner, the Welsh Development Agency and the local authority about future options for the site. The local authority is pursuing a possible way forward and the Assembly Government is keeping a watching brief. You should refer your question on waterways to my colleague, Sue Essex.

David Melding: Minister, one way of commemorating our magnificent heritage is to erect more statues. Do you not agree with me that Iolo Morganwg, the greatest Welshman in the Romantic movement, deserves to be commemorated by a major statue?

Jenny Randerson: Mae pob corff cyhoeddus diwylliannol a noddir gan y Cynulliad sydd o fewn fy mhortffolio yn hyrwyddo ac yn marchnata treftadaeth Cymru fel rhan o'u swyddogaethau. Yn ogystal, mae gan gyrff eraill a noddir gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad megis Bwrdd Croeso Cymru, Cadw, y Cyngor Amgueddfeydd yng Nghymru a Chyngor Llyfrau Cymru rôl bwysig i'w chwarae.

Brian Hancock: Mae sawl gwedd ar dreftadaeth Cymru, er enghraifft, hen safle Glofa Navigation yng Nghrymlyn, sydd yn adeilad rhestredig gradd II*. Yr wyf am ei adfer i'w ddefnyddio fel uned ddatblygu economaidd, i fusnesau newydd, ac fel canolfan sgiliau a chyfathrebu. Mae ein dyfrffyrdd a'n camlesi hefyd yn rhan o'n treftadaeth—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr ydych wedi cael y fraint o ddau gwestiwn heddiw. Ni chredaf fod angen araith arnom yn ogystal â chwestiwn atodol.

Brian Hancock: Weinidog, pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd i ddiogelu a datblygu treftadaeth Cymru, gan ystyried y ddogfen strategol ymgynghorol 'Dyfrffyrdd Cymru'?

Jenny Randerson: Fel y gwyddoch, Brian nid yw hyn yn un o'm cyfrifoldebau i; nid yw o fewn fy mhortffolio. Er gwybodaeth, mae Cadw wedi cynnig grant gwerth £45,000 tuag at y gost o wneud atgyweiriadau brys i bedwar o blith y pump prif adeilad yng Nglofa Navigation yng Nghrymlyn er mwyn eu diogelu rhag y gwynt a'r tywydd. Cafodd Cadw drafodaethau hefyd â pherchennog y safle, Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a'r awdurdod lleol ynghylch yr opsiynau ar gyfer dyfodol y safle. Mae'r awdurdod lleol yn mynd ar drywydd ffordd bosibl ymlaen ac mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cadw llygad ar bethau. Dylech gyfeirio eich cwestiwn ar ddyfrffyrdd at fy nghyd-weinidog, Sue Essex.

David Melding: Weinidog, un ffordd o goffâu ein treftadaeth wych yw codi mwy o gerfluniau. Oni chytunwch â mi y dylid coffâu Iolo Morganwg, y Cymro mwyaf yn y mudiad Rhamantaidd, â cherflun mawr?

Jenny Randerson: I would not wish to raise one of our forefathers above another. It is important that we acknowledge that we should have more public art. The Arts Council of Wales is working on a strategy on this. 'Creative Future' contains a commitment that that work will be done. We need to develop an ethos in Wales of celebrating our past and doing so in the very best style and presentation of the present and the future.

Jenny Randerson: Ni fyddwn am ddyrchafu un o'n cyndeidiau yn uwch nag un arall. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cydnabod y dylem gael mwy o gelf gyhoeddus. Mae Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru yn gweithio ar strategaeth ynglŷn â hyn. Mae 'Cymru Greadigol' yn cynnwys ymrwymiad y cyflawnir y gwaith hwnnw. Rhaid inni ddatblygu ethos yng Nghymru o ddathlu ein gorffennol a gwneud hynny yn y ffordd orau bosibl o gyflwyno'r presennol a'r dyfodol.

Rhwystrau o ran Cymryd Rhan mewn Chwaraeon Barriers to Participation in Sport

Q4 Ann Jones: Will the Minister make a statement on overcoming the barriers to participation in sport experienced by people in the most deprived communities of Wales? (OAQ23637)

C4 Ann Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ynghylch gorchfygu'r rhwystrau y mae pobl yn ardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig Cymru yn eu hwynebu o ran cymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon? (OAQ23637)

Jenny Randerson: The Welsh Assembly Government, working alongside the Sports Council for Wales, is fully committed to providing sporting opportunities for all. For example, the social inclusion in sport initiative, aimed at supporting the development of local sport projects, encourages participation and significantly improves access to sport for those in deprived communities in Wales.

Jenny Randerson: Mewn cydweithrediad â Chyngor Chwaraeon Cymru, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gwbl ymrwymedig i ddarparu cyfleoedd chwaraeon i bawb. Er enghraifft, mae'r fenter cynhwysiant cymdeithasol mewn chwaraeon, a anelir at gefnogi datblygu prosiectau chwaraeon lleol, yn annog pobl i gymryd rhan ac yn gwella'n sylweddol fynediad i chwaraeon i'r rhai hynny mewn cymunedau difreintiedig yng Nghymru.

2.10 p.m.

Ann Jones: I hope that you agree that everyone deserves access to the best sporting opportunities. Sport has an important role to play in meeting national health targets, for example, and in improving quality of life. It can be effective in community regeneration and in cutting down on the rate of youth offending. I recently visited a get hooked on fishing initiative, which takes those likely to be young offenders and channels that 'entrepreneurship' into another direction. Do you agree that it is vital that we ensure that children in our most deprived communities can benefit from experiences that children in many other areas take for granted?

Ann Jones: Gobeithiaf y cytunwch fod pawb yn haeddu'r cyfle i fanteisio ar y cyfleoedd chwaraeon gorau. Mae rôl arbennig gan chwaraeon o ran cyflawni targedau iechyd cenedlaethol, er enghraifft, ac i wella ansawdd bywyd. Gall fod yn effeithiol o ran adfywio cymunedau a lleihau troseddu ymhlith ieuenctid. Yn ddiweddar ymwelais â menter bachu ar bysgota, sy'n derbyn ieuenctid sy'n debygol o droseddu ac yn sianelu'r 'entrepreneuriaeth' honno i gyfeiriad arall. A gytunwch ei bod yn hollbwysig ein bod yn sicrhau bod plant yn ein cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig yn gallu elwa ar brofiadau y mae plant mewn llawer o ardaloedd eraill yn eu cymryd yn ganiataol?

Jenny Randerson: I agree wholeheartedly. The link with health and community regeneration is important. It is important for

Jenny Randerson: Cytunaf yn llwyr. Mae'r ddolen gyswllt rhwng iechyd ac adfywio cymunedau yn bwysig. Mae'n bwysig i'r

the whole community, not just young people, because older people find groups of children hanging around street corners during the holidays, for example, intimidating, although their fears are not always justified. Therefore, the swimming initiative that is being piloted this Easter in 10 local authorities in Wales is important and I hope that all 22 local authorities will be involved in the initiative by the summer. To give an example, Ynys Môn local authority is not only providing swimming free of charge, but is providing buses so that children from deprived communities can access the swimming pools.

Gareth Jones: Un o'r anawsterau mwyaf mewn nifer o'n cymunedau, yn enwedig y rhai difreintiedig, yw'r diffyg strategaeth leol i hyrwyddo chwaraeon, drwy adeiladau canolfannau chwaraeon neu byllau nofio, er enghraifft. Pwy ddylai fod yn gyfrifol am gynllunio darpariaeth, gan gofio nad oes gan unigolion yn y gymuned, yn aml, yr arian i dalu ymgynghorwyr proffesiynol i gynllunio ar eu rhan?

Jenny Randerson: When we are talking about large infrastructure projects—and swimming pools are expensive—it is important that work is done in partnership. The community may know what it wants and needs, but it is dependent upon outside funding, which is normally, although not exclusively, provided by the Sports Council for Wales. There are often vigorous discussions as a result of that process, but the sports council can bring its professional expertise to bear, and the local authorities can provide the local knowledge, and one hopes that, as a result, we will have a good range of swimming pools and other such large projects that require a strategic approach, throughout Wales.

gymuned gyfan, nid dim ond i bobl ifanc, gan fod grwpiau o blant yn cicio eu sodlau ar gorneli strydoedd yn ystod gwyliau, er enghraifft, yn codi ofn ar bobl hŷn, er na ellir cyfiawnhau eu hofnau bob tro. Felly, mae'r fenter nofio y cynhelir peilot ohoni mewn 10 awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru y Pasg hwn yn bwysig, a gobeithiaf y bydd pob un o'r 22 awdurdod lleol yn cymryd rhan yn y fenter erbyn yr haf. I roi un enghraifft, mae awdurdod lleol Ynys Môn nid yn unig yn darparu nofio am ddim, ond hefyd mae'n darparu bysiau fel y gall plant o gymunedau difreintiedig ddefnyddio'r pyllau nofio.

Gareth Jones: One of the greatest difficulties in many of our communities, especially the deprived ones, is the absence of a local strategy to promote sport, through building sports centres or swimming pools, for example. Who should be responsible for planning provision, bearing in mind that individuals in the community often do not have the money to pay professional consultants to plan on their behalf?

Jenny Randerson: Pan fyddwn yn siarad am brosiectau seilwaith mawr—ac mae pyllau nofio yn ddrud—mae'n bwysig y gwneir y gwaith mewn partneriaeth. Efallai y gŵyr y gymuned beth yr hoffai ei gael a beth sydd ei angen arni, ond dibynna hyn ar arian o'r tu allan, a ddarperir fel arfer, er nid yn gyfan gwbl, gan Gyngor Chwaraeon Cymru. Yn aml ceir trafodaethau brwd o ganlyniad i'r broses honno, ond gall y cyngor chwaraeon ddefnyddio ei arbenigedd proffesiynol, a gall yr awdurdodau lleol ddarparu'r wybodaeth leol, a'r gobaith yw, o ganlyniad, y bydd gennym ystod dda o byllau nofio a phrosiectau mawr eraill sydd angen ymagwedd strategol ledled Cymru.

Grwpiau Mam a'i Phlentyn Mother and Toddler Groups

Q5 Janet Davies: How is the Minister supporting mother and toddler groups in predominantly Welsh-speaking areas as a means of encouraging the use of the language in the home? (OAQ23612)

C5 Janet Davies: Sut y mae'r Gweinidog yn cefnogi grwpiau mam a'i phlentyn mewn ardaloedd lle y siaredir Cymraeg yn bennaf, er mwyn annog defnydd o'r iaith yn y cartref? (OAQ23612)

Jenny Randerson: The Assembly Government supports Cylchoedd Ti a Fi—mother and toddler groups—through Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin and the Welsh Language Board. Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin development officers and group leaders provide support to parents to further develop their child's linguistic ability outside the Ti a Fi groups. This funding will increase by 30 per cent in 2003-04 to over £1 million. The pioneering Twf project also works with Ti a Fi groups to highlight the advantages of raising children bilingually.

Janet Davies: The scheme could cause problems for small mother and toddler groups that operate in the private or charity sector. Can you give a commitment to supporting such small groups, which are crucial to some Welsh-speaking villages?

Jenny Randerson: The approach taken by the Welsh Assembly Government is not exclusive. For example, the Twf project works with Sure Start and Wales Pre-School Playgroups Association as well as Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin. Those three groups should cover every type of group in existence. Please write to me with details of a specific example that causes you concern and I will raise it with the Welsh Language Board to see if we can ensure that funding is distributed as fairly, evenly and widely as possible because the ultimate aim is to ensure that children are given early exposure to the Welsh language, however that is achieved.

Kirsty Williams: Parents like me who can only speak English, but who want their children to be bilingual, rely on the availability of Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin groups. However, you may be aware that the meithrin groups in my hometown of Brecon, and in Builth Wells, are severely threatened by the lack of available and suitable premises. What can you do to alleviate the situation? Will your officials meet with representatives of those groups and the Welsh Language Board to consider what can be done to ensure that there is meithrin provision available in the south of Brecon and Radnoshire?

Jenny Randerson: Cefnogir Cylchoedd Ti a Fi—grwpiau mam a phlentyn—gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, drwy'r Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin a Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg. Mae swyddogion datblygu ac arweinwyr grwpiau Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin yn rhoi cymorth i rieni i ddatblygu gallu ieithyddol eu plentyn ymhellach y tu allan i'r grwpiau Ti a Fi. Yn ystod 2003-04 bydd yr arian hwn yn cynyddu 30 y cant i fwy na £1 miliwn. Mae'r prosiect arloesol Twf hefyd yn gweithio â grwpiau Ti a Fi i amlygu'r manteision o fagu plant yn ddwyieithog.

Janet Davies: Gallai'r cynllun greu problemau i grwpiau bach mam a'i phlentyn sy'n gweithredu yn y sectorau preifat neu elusennol. A wnewch chi ymrwmo i gefnogi grwpiau bach o'r fath, sy'n hanfodol i rai pentrefi Cymraeg eu hiaith?

Jenny Randerson: Nid yw ymagwedd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn anghynhwysol. Er enghraifft, mae'r prosiect Twf yn cydweithio â Chychwyn Cadarn a Chymdeithas Cylchoedd Chwarae Cyn-ysgol Cymru yn ogystal â Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin. Dylai'r tri grŵp hyn gwmpasu pob math o grŵp sy'n bodoli ar hyn o bryd. Ysgrifennwch ataf â manylion o enghraifft benodol sy'n peri gofid ichi ac fe'i codaf gyda Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg er mwyn sicrhau y dosberthir yr arian mor deg, mor gyfartal ac mor eang â phosibl oherwydd ein nod yn y pen draw yw sicrhau bod plant yn cael eu cyflwyno i'r iaith Gymraeg yn gynnar, sut bynnag y cyflawnir hynny.

Kirsty Williams: Mae rhieni fel fi sy'n uniaith Saesneg, ond sydd am i'w plant fod yn ddwyieithog, yn dibynnu ar argaeledd grwpiau fel Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin. Fodd bynnag, efallai y gwyddoch fod y grwpiau meithrin o dan fygythiad mawr yn y dref lle yr wyf yn byw sef Aberhonddu, ac yn Llanfair-ym-Muallt oherwydd prinder adeiladau addas. Beth allwch chi ei wneud i wella'r sefyllfa? A wnaiff eich swyddogion gyfarfod â chynrychiolwyr y grwpiau hynny a Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg er mwyn ystyried beth y gellir ei wneud i sicrhau bod darpariaeth feithrin ar gael yn ne Brycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed?

Jenny Randerson: You raised this with me last summer, and I hoped that the additional funding coming through from the beginning of April would address the problem. I will ask officials to contact the Welsh Language Board, which I am sure will be happy to meet with you and representatives of the relevant groups to ensure that those problems are tackled, if not in the coming funding year, perhaps in future planning rounds.

Jenny Randerson: Codasoch hyn gyda mi yr haf diwethaf, a gobeithiais y byddai'r arian ychwanegol a fydd ar gael o ddechrau Ebrill yn datrys y broblem. Gofynnaf i swyddogion i gysylltu â Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg, ac yr wyf yn ffyddiog y bydd yn fodlon cwrdd â chi a chynrychiolwyr y grwpiau perthnasol er mwyn sicrhau yr ymdrinnir â'r problemau hynny, os nad yn y flwyddyn ariannu bresennol, efallai mewn cylchoedd cynllunio yn y dyfodol.

Canolfan Hyfforddi ar gyfer Timau Rhyngwladol Cymru Training Centre for Wales's International Teams

C6 Dafydd Wigley: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cynnal ag Undeb Rygbi Cymru a Chymdeithas Pêl-droed Cymru o ran darparu canolfan hyfforddi ar gyfer eu timau rhyngwladol? (OAQ23613)

Q6 Dafydd Wigley: What discussions has the Minister had with the Welsh Rugby Union and the Football Association of Wales with regard to providing a training centre for their international teams? (OAQ23613)

Jenny Randerson: I have not been formally approached by either governing body to discuss this matter, but I am aware that it is a priority for these two major sports in Wales.

Jenny Randerson: Ni chysylltodd yr un o'r ddau gorff llywodraethu â mi yn ffurfiol i drafod y mater hwn, ond yr wyf yn ymwybodol ei fod yn flaenoriaeth i'r ddwy brif gamp hon yng Nghymru.

Dafydd Wigley: Will you join with me in wishing Mark Hughes and his team every success on Saturday? Given that neither the Welsh Rugby Union nor the Football Association of Wales are cash-rich bodies and that both urgently need a training centre for their national teams, will you take a proactive role to get both bodies together to make progress for the benefit of both our national teams?

Dafydd Wigley: A ymunwch â mi i ddymuno pob llwyddiant i Mark Hughes a'i dîm ddydd Sadwrn? O gofio nad yw Undeb Rygbi Cymru na Chymdeithas Pêl-droed Cymru yn gyrrff sydd â phwll diwaelod o arian a bod angen canolfan hyfforddi ar gyfer eu timau cenedlaethol ar fyrder ar y naill a'r llall, a wnewch chi fod yn rhagweithiol er mwyn dod â'r ddau gorff at ei gilydd i wneud cynnydd er budd ein dau dîm cenedlaethol?

Jenny Randerson: I wish our team well, and I will be in the stadium on Saturday. I eagerly anticipate a tenth victory in a row. There is eminent common sense in the two bodies sharing a training facility. That is a potential opportunity. However, a planning application has been submitted in relation to the rugby training facility, which means that I cannot discuss specific proposals. However, in terms of future direction, it is essential for the Assembly Government to do all that it can to encourage both sports to work together.

Jenny Randerson: Dymunaf yn dda i'n tîm, a byddaf yn y stadiwm ddydd Sadwrn. Edrychaf ymlaen yn frwd at ddegfed buddugoliaeth yn olynol. Synnwyr cyffredin amlwg fyddai sicrhau bod y ddau gorff yn rhannu cyfleuster hyfforddi. Mae hynny'n gyfle posibl. Fodd bynnag, cyflwynwyd cais cynllunio mewn perthynas â'r cyfleuster hyfforddi rygbi, sy'n golygu na allaf drafod cynigion penodol. Fodd bynnag, o ran y cyfeiriad yn y dyfodol, mae'n hanfodol bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwneud popeth o fewn ei gallu i annog y ddwy gamp i gydweithio.

David Ian Jones: Do you agree that Wales's oldest and finest football club, Wrexham

David Ian Jones: A gyfunwch fod gan Wrecsam, clwb pêl-droed hynaf a gorau

AFC, already has excellent training facilities in north Wales, which have been used by the England football team? Do you agree that it would be an excellent idea for the Welsh football and rugby teams to consider Wrexham as a suitable location for their new training facilities?

Jenny Randerson: I thought that the next speaker would suggest a possible home. We have not reached the basic principle of the idea yet, let alone discussing potential sites. I have visited Wrexham football club, which provides excellent facilities.

Cymru, gyfleusterau hyfforddi rhagorol yn y Gogledd eisoes, a ddefnyddiwyd gan dîm pêl-droed Lloegr? A gytunwch y byddai'n syniad rhagorol i dimau pêl-droed a rygbi Cymru ystyried Wrecsam fel lleoliad addas ar gyfer eu cyfleusterau hyfforddi newydd?

Jenny Randerson: Yr oeddwn yn amau y byddai'r siaradwr nesaf yn awgrymu cartref posibl. Nid ydym wedi trafod egwyddor sylfaenol y syniad eto, heb sôn am drafod safleoedd posibl. Yr wyf wedi ymweld â chlwb pêl-droed Wrecsam, sy'n darparu cyfleusterau rhagorol.

Arddangos Celf Fodern o Gymru Displaying Welsh Modern Art

Q7 Peter Black: Will the Minister make a statement on what she is doing to promote the displaying of Welsh modern art throughout Wales? (OAQ23640)

C7 Peter Black: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ynghylch ei dulliau o hyrwyddo arddangos celf fodern o Gymru ar draws Cymru? (OAQ23640)

Jenny Randerson: The National Museums and Galleries of Wales's final report and recommendations following its consultation exercise on the future display of its art collections will be completed later this year. I look forward to receiving the museum's report and will consider its recommendations carefully in the context of future budget funding rounds.

Jenny Randerson: Caiff adroddiad ac argymhellion terfynol Amgueddfeydd ac Orielaau Cenedlaethol Cymru yn dilyn ei ymgynghoriad ar arddangos ei gasgliadau celf yn y dyfodol eu cwblhau yn ddiweddarach eleni. Edrychaf ymlaen at dderbyn adroddiad yr amgueddfa a byddaf yn ystyried ei argymhellion yn ofalus yng nghyd-destun cylchoedd ariannu'r gyllideb yn y dyfodol.

2.20 p.m.

Peter Black: Will you acknowledge the need for a home for Welsh modern art in Wales? In addition, following the outcome of the national museum's investigations, will you consider basing the permanent home of Welsh modern art outside Cardiff, in order to spread the benefits of that kind of display around Wales?

Peter Black: A wnewch chi gydnabod bod angen cartref ar gyfer celf fodern o Gymru yng Nghymru? Yn ogystal, yn dilyn canlyniad ymchwiliadau'r amgueddfa genedlaethol, a wnewch chi ystyried lleoli cartref parhaol celf fodern o Gymru y tu allan i Gaerdydd, er mwyn lledaenu manteision y math honno arddangosfa ledled Cymru?

Jenny Randerson: The national museum is doing a great deal of work, and is in close consultation with the Arts Council of Wales, on the issue of displaying art. That work involves the plotting of a long and complex strategic process over the next couple of years, during which sites, costings and funding routes will be compared. However, it is important to consider the short term, as

Jenny Randerson: Mae'r amgueddfa genedlaethol yn gwneud cryn dipyn o waith, ac yn ymgynghori'n agos â Chyngor Celfyddydau Cymru, ar y mater o arddangos gwaith celf. Mae'r gwaith hwnnw yn cynnwys llunio proses strategol hir a chymhleth dros y ddwy flynedd nesaf, a chaiff safleoedd, costau a llwybrau ariannu eu cymharu yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw. Fodd

well as the long term. We need to build upon the work that has already started on the Sharing the Treasures project, ensuring that more galleries become accessible. I recently attended the reopening of the Davies Gallery in Newtown, which had received considerable investment. That gallery was displaying pictures which had been in the national museum a few months previously. That kind of example must be spread throughout Wales, and in the longer term, we must consider an iconic national gallery building for modern art.

Phil Williams: Bearing in mind the timescale of the national museum's report, will the Assembly Government make a commitment, in principle, to establishing some form of national gallery, which is adequate to display the wealth of modern art in Wales, in time to influence the final choice of the Cultural Capital of Europe 2008?

Jenny Randerson: The national museum's timescale means that a final decision will not be made for some years. It has not yet completed the basic work on costs and location. The proposal has been made in principle, but the museum has not yet made a decision on its own set of proposals.

Lorraine Barrett: After speaking to many artists, it is obvious that there is some dispute as to what constitutes modern art. Does the Minister agree that it is important to promote Welsh art in its many forms, regardless of whether or not it is modern?

Jenny Randerson: I did not want to take issue with Peter as to whether he meant modern art, contemporary art, Welsh art, Welsh modern art or modern art in Wales. That constituted a lengthy part of the national museum's consultation process. We could have an interesting academic debate on this subject, but this is not the right place for it.

David Davies: Various works of ancient and modern Welsh art are currently held in storage by the national art gallery. Rather than allowing them to languish in basements or on the office walls of one or two lucky

bynnag, mae'n bwysig ystyried y tymor byr, yn ogystal â'r tymor hir. Mae angen inni ddatblygu'r gwaith a gychwynwyd eisoes ar y prosiect Rhannu'r Trysorau, gan sicrhau bod rhagor o orielau yn dod yn hygyrch. Yn ddiweddar mynychais achlysur ailagor Oriol Davies yn y Drenewydd, a dderbyniodd fuddsoddiad sylweddol. Yr oedd yr oriel honno yn arddangos lluniau a fu yn yr amgueddfa genedlaethol ychydig fisoedd yn gynharach. Rhaid lledaenu'r math honno o esiampl ledled Cymru, ac yn y tymor hwy, rhaid inni ystyried adeilad oriel genedlaethol eiconig ar gyfer celf fodern.

Phil Williams: O gofio terfynau amser adroddiad yr amgueddfa genedlaethol, a wnaiff Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ymrwymiad, mewn egwyddor, i sefydlu rhyw fath o oriel genedlaethol, a fydd yn ddigonol i arddangos y cyfoeth o gelf fodern yng Nghymru, mewn pryd i ddylanwadu ar ddewis terfynol Prifddinas Diwylliant Ewrop 2008?

Jenny Randerson: Golyga terfynau amser yr amgueddfa genedlaethol na chaiff penderfyniad terfynol ei wneud am rai blynyddoedd. Nid yw wedi cwblhau'r gwaith sylfaenol ar gostau a lleoliad eto. Gwnaethpwyd y cynnig mewn egwyddor, ond nid yw'r amgueddfa wedi gwneud penderfyniad ar ei chyfres ei hun o gynigion eto.

Lorraine Barrett: Ar ôl siarad â nifer o artistiaid, mae'n amlwg fod peth anghytuno o ran beth yn union yw celf fodern. A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno ei bod yn bwysig hybu pob ffurf ar gelf o Gymru, boed yn fodern ai peidio?

Jenny Randerson: Nid oeddwn am ofyn i Peter a oedd yn golygu celf fodern, celf gyfoes, celf o Gymru, celf fodern o Gymru, neu gelf fodern yng Nghymru. Yr oedd hynny'n rhan hirfaith o broses ymgynghori yr amgueddfa genedlaethol. Gallem gynnal dadl academaidd ddiddorol ar y pwnc hwn, ond nid dyma'r lle priodol ar gyfer hynny.

David Davies: Mae amrywiol weithiau celf hynafol a modern o Gymru yn cael eu storio gan yr oriel gelf genedlaethol. Yn hytrach na gadael iddynt hel llwch mewn seleri neu ar furiau swyddfeydd ambell i Gomisiynwr

European Commissioners, do you not agree that it would be a good idea to allow Welsh institutions, such as Welsh regiments of the British Army, to display appropriate paintings in places where they can be more widely appreciated?

Jenny Randerson: I refer you to my previous answer. We need to urgently consider extending the current schemes for the wider display of art throughout Wales.

Ewropeaidd ffodus, oni chytunwch y byddai'n syniad da caniatáu i sefydliadau Cymreig, megis catrodau Cymreig o Fyddin Prydain, arddangos darluniau priodol mewn lleoedd y gellir eu gwerthfawrogi'n ehangach?

Jenny Randerson: Fe'ch cyfeiriaf at fy ateb blaenorol. Mae angen inni ystyried ymestyn y cynlluniau presennol ar gyfer arddangos celf ledled Cymru ar fyrder.

**Cwestiynau i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r
Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor
Questions to the Deputy First Minister and
Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad**

**Datblygu Gwledig ym Mrycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed
Rural Development in Brecon and Radnorshire**

Q1 Kirsty Williams: What has been achieved in terms of rural development in Brecon and Radnorshire since the establishment of the partnership Government? (OAQ23600)

The Deputy First Minister and Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad (Michael German): The partnership Government has introduced a wide range of measures, which will help to promote sustainable rural communities, including those in Brecon and Radnorshire. These include support for agriculture and food processing and measures to help broaden the rural economy and tackle social exclusion in the countryside. This morning, I met representatives of the first nine successful rural community action partnerships under the 'Rural Community Action—Gweithredu Dros Gymunedau Gwledig' strategy. One of the successful partnerships covers Powys.

Kirsty Williams: I am glad that you are in a position to announce those grants today. Many groups in my constituency are concerned with community economic regeneration. What will be done in Powys to promote the work of those groups?

Michael German: The community partnership for Powys put forward a bid for £150,000 per year, for three years. I am

C1 Kirsty Williams: Beth a gyflawnwyd ym maes datblygu gwledig ym Mrycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed ers sefydlu'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth? (OAQ23600)

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor (Michael German): Cyflwynodd y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth amrywiaeth eang o fesurau, a fydd o gymorth i hybu cymunedau gwledig cynaliadwy, gan gynnwys y rhai ym Mrycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed. Mae'r rhain yn cynnwys cymorth ar gyfer amaethyddiaeth a phrosesu bwyd a mesurau i helpu i ehangu'r economi wledig a mynd i'r afael ag allgáu cymdeithasol yng nghefn gwlad. Cyfarfûm y bore yma â chynrychiolwyr naw o'r partneriaethau gweithredu dros gymunedau gwledig llwyddiannus cyntaf o dan y strategaeth 'Rural Community Action—Gweithredu Dros Gymunedau Gwledig'. Mae un o'r partneriaethau llwyddiannus yn cwmpasu Powys.

Kirsty Williams: Yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn gallu cyhoeddi'r grantiau hynny heddiw. Mae llawer o grwpiau yn fy etholaeth yn ymwneud ag adfywio economaidd cymunedol. Beth a gaiff ei wneud ym Mhowys i hybu gwaith y grwpiau hynny?

Michael German: Cyflwynodd partneriaeth gymunedol Powys gais am £150,000 y flwyddyn, am dair blynedd. Yr wyf yn falch

pleased that that figure has been agreed; it is nearly £0.5 million over the next three years. The partnership will be allowed to access a share of the £0.5 million of project funding that will be available from 1 April, for that year, to use for community regeneration projects in Powys. The Powys rural community action partnership could also use this money to match-fund structural funds. It can also bid for money from other Welsh Assembly Government funds such as the village facilities and amenities fund, the post offices development fund and, after 1 January 2004, article 33 money.

Cynog Dafis: Beth yw eich barn ynglŷn â thalu costau archwilio cig? Gofynnaf y cwestiwn gan fod maniffesto'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn 1999 yn dweud y byddech o blaid i'r Llywodraeth dalu'r costau hynny, ynghyd â chostau milfeddygol a gwaredu, fel mater o iechyd cyhoeddus, yn unol â'r hyn a welir mewn gwledydd Ewropeaidd eraill. A ydych wedi gwneud unrhyw beth ynghylch hyn neu a ydych wedi anghofio'n gyfan gwbl am yr ymrwymiad hwnnw?

Michael German: Thank you for that question—it was, of course, about a manifesto and not about the partnership Government programme. *[Interruption.]* There are a few issues in Plaid Cymru's manifesto that did not appear in a Government programme—I do not think that any of them did. On the meat hygiene service, as you know, there has been a reduction in the costs for small abattoirs and that is something that I welcome.

Glyn Davies: As farming jobs have been lost all over Wales in the last few years, one can only suppose that the same would apply in Brecon and Radnorshire. What are you doing to prevent the situation worsening, which it will do on 1 May, when the uncertainty and shambles of the new fallen stock regulations come into being? What are you doing to prevent that disaster from happening because, as far as I can see, you are doing nothing?

Michael German: Glyn, you have your opinion, but those in the industry know that

bod cytundeb ynglŷn â'r ffigur hwnnw; mae bron yn £0.5 miliwn dros y tair blynedd nesaf. Caniateir i'r bartneriaeth ddefnyddio cyfran o'r £0.5 miliwn o'r arian prosiect a fydd ar gael o 1 Ebrill ymlaen, ar gyfer y flwyddyn honno, ar gyfer prosiectau adfywio cymunedol ym Mhowys. Gallai'r bartneriaeth gweithredu dros gymunedau gwledig ym Mhowys ddefnyddio'r arian hwn hefyd fel arian cyfatebol ar gyfer cronfeydd strwythurol. Gall hefyd wneud cais am arian o gronfeydd eraill Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru megis y gronfa cyfleusterau ac amwynderau pentref, y gronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post ac arian ethygl 33, ar ôl 1 Ionawr 2004.

Cynog Dafis: What is your opinion regarding meeting the costs of meat inspection? I pose the question as the Liberal Democrat manifesto in 1999 stated that you would be in favour of the Government meeting those costs, as well as veterinary and disposal costs, as a matter of public health, as happens in other European countries. Have you done anything about this or have you completely forgotten about that commitment?

Michael German: Diolch am y cwestiwn hwnnw—yr oedd, wrth gwrs, yn ymwneud â maniffesto ac nid â rhaglen y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth. *[Torri ar draws.]* Mae ambell i fater ym maniffesto Plaid Cymru nad ymddangosodd yn rhaglen y Llywodraeth—ni chredaf i'r un ohonynt ymddangos. O ran y gwasanaeth hylendid cig, fel y gwyddoch, bu lleihad yn y costau ar gyfer lladd-dai bach ac mae hynny'n rhywbeth a groesawaf.

Glyn Davies: Gan fod swyddi ffermio wedi'u colli ledled Cymru yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, gellid tybio y byddai hynny yr un mor wir am Frycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed. Beth ydych chi'n ei wneud i atal y sefyllfa rhag gwaethygu, a fydd yn digwydd ar 1 Mai, pan fydd yr ansicrwydd a'r anhrefn ynghylch y rheoliadau stoc marw yn codi? Beth ydych chi'n ei wneud i atal y drychineb honno rhag digwydd, oherwydd nid ydych yn gwneud unrhyw beth, hyd y gwelaf i?

Michael German: Glyn, rhydd i bawb ei farn, ond gŵyr y rhai yn y diwydiant bod

the Welsh Assembly Government has taken a strong lead in dealing with this issue. It has come forward with a proposal to part-fund a scheme—as you know, the law says that it cannot fully fund the scheme, and I am sure that you would not want the Assembly to break the law. The Government has said that it wants to engage the industry in order to find the other part of the funding. It has met with the industry and the ball now firmly lies in the court of others. The Assembly Government has done the right thing and has done the work on this matter.

Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi dangos arweiniad cryf o ran ymdrin â'r mater hwn. Cyflwynodd gynnig i ariannu cynllun yn rhannol—fel y gwyddoch, yn ôl y gyfraith ni all ariannu'r cynllun yn llawn, ac yr wyf yn sicr na fydddech am i'r Cynulliad dorri'r gyfraith. Dywedodd y Llywodraeth ei bod am gynnwys y diwydiant er mwyn dod o hyd i weddill yr arian. Cyfarfu â'r diwydiant a dyletswydd eraill yw cymryd y cam nesaf erbyn hyn. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi gwneud y peth cywir ac wedi gwneud ei gwaith ar y mater hwn.

Iawndal am Gnydau Halogedig Compensation for Crop Contamination

Q2 Eleanor Burnham: Does the National Assembly have any provision to pay compensation to non-GM farmers for the contamination of their crops by genetically modified organisms? (OAQ23665)

C2 Eleanor Burnham: A oes gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol unrhyw ddarpariaeth i dalu iawndal i ffermwyr nad ydynt yn tyfu cynydau GM, os yw eu cynydau'n cael eu halogi gan organebau a addaswyd yn enetig? (OAQ23665)

Michael German: The Assembly's policy, as set out in the partnership agreement, 'Putting Wales First', is to operate the most restrictive policy possible, within the context of European Union legislation, on the future development of genetically modified crops in Wales. In relation to liability, I am awaiting the report of the independent Agriculture and Environment Biotechnology Commission, due to be published in May 2003, on issues of liability relating to genetically modified organisms. Specifically, it is considering whether the existing liability regime is sufficient, whether it needs revision, and whether there are other ways of addressing the issues raised. I will be considering the issue further in the light of the commission's report and ongoing EU negotiations in relation to wider environmental liability. However, my view, in principle, is that the polluter should pay.

Michael German: Polisi'r Cynulliad, fel y nodwyd yn y cytundeb partneriaeth, 'Rhoi Cymru'n Gyntaf', yw gweithredu'r polisi mwyaf cyfyngol posibl, o fewn cyd-destun deddfwriaeth yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, ar ddatblygu cynydau a addaswyd yn enetig yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol. Mewn perthynas ag atebolrwydd, yr wyf yn disgwyl adroddiad y Comisiwn Biotechnoleg Amaethyddol ac Amgylcheddol annibynnol a gyhoeddir ym mis Mai 2003, ar faterion atebolrwydd sy'n ymwneud ag organebau a addaswyd yn enetig. Yn benodol, mae'n ystyried pa un ai a yw'r system atebolrwydd bresennol yn ddigonol, pa un ai a oes angen ei diwygio, a ph'un a oes ffyrdd eraill o ymdrin â'r materion a godwyd. Byddaf yn ystyried y mater ymhellach yng ngoleuni adroddiad y comisiwn a negodiadau parhaus yr UE mewn perthynas ag atebolrwydd amgylcheddol ehangach. Fodd bynnag, fy marn i, mewn egwyddor, yw y dylai'r llygrwr dalu.

Eleanor Burnham: I congratulate you on continuing to pursue one of the Assembly's defining characteristics, namely following the most restrictive policy possible regarding GM crops. However, the separation distances—with particular reference to future prohibition notices—and the differences in

Eleanor Burnham: Fe'ch llongyfarchaf am barhau i fynd ar drywydd un o nodweddion arbennig y Cynulliad, sef dilyn y polisi mwyaf cyfyngol posibl ynghylch cynydau GM. Fodd bynnag, mae'r pellteroedd rhwng cynydau—gan gyfeirio'n arbennig at hysbysiadau gwahardd yn y dyfodol—a'r

articles 16 and 23, and their effectiveness, are a particularly complex element of the debate, as recently highlighted by Michael Meacher. Potentially, different policies on genetic modification may be implemented in England. Can you assure me that potential compensation claims arising from cross-border contamination will not have to be met by ourselves in Wales, where we continue to be proud of our GM-free status?

gwahaniaethau yn erthyglau 16 a 23, a'u heffeithiolrwydd, yn elfen arbennig o gymhleth o'r ddadl, fel yr amlygwyd yn ddiweddar gan Michael Meacher. Gellir gweithredu polisiau gwahanol ar addasu genetig o bosibl yn Lloegr. A allwch fy sicrhau na fydd yn rhaid i geisiadau posibl am iawndal sy'n deillio o halogi trawsffiniol gael eu talu gennym ni yng Nghymru, lle yr ydym yn parhau i ymfalchïo yn ein statws o gnydau sy'n rhydd o GM?

2.30 p.m.

Michael German: As I have said, the principle is that the polluter should pay. I believe that that is right. The issue of co-existence will, as I recently reported to the Assembly, come to the fore in the next six months. The commission has called a meeting of stakeholders across the European Union to discuss co-existence in late April 2003 and the Welsh Assembly Government will be represented at that. The stakeholder meeting will be held with the staff of the European Commissioner for Agriculture and Fisheries in order to try to find a way through these difficult issues.

Michael German: Fel y dywedais, yr egwyddor yw y dylai'r llygrwr dalu. Credaf fod hynny'n iawn. Bydd y mater o gydfodolaeth yn dod i'r amlwg yn ystod y chwe mis nesaf, fel y dywedais yn ddiweddar wrth y Cynulliad. Mae'r comisiwn wedi galw cyfarfod o randdeiliaid ar draws yr Undeb Ewropeaidd er mwyn trafod cyd-fodolaeth ar ddiwedd Ebrill 2003 a bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cael ei chynrychioli yn y cyfarfod hwnnw. Bydd cyfarfod y rhanddeiliaid yn cael ei gynnal gyda staff y Comisiynydd Ewropeaidd dros Amaethyddiaeth a Physgodfeydd er mwyn ceisio datrys y materion dyrys hyn.

Our policy is clear: we want the most restrictive policy possible, and liability should fall upon those who cause the trouble.

Mae ein polisi yn eglur: yr ydym am gael y polisi mwyaf cyfyngol posibl, a'r sawl sy'n creu'r trafferth ddylai fod yn atebol.

Jocelyn Davies: We are all aware that liability in relation to GM contamination is being decided at EU level. As you said, the Assembly's policy is clear: the polluter should pay. Will you give us your assurance that you will not support the UK line unless it fully protects our organic and conventional growers?

Jocelyn Davies: Yr ydym oll yn ymwybodol y caiff atebolrwydd mewn perthynas â halogi GM ei benderfynu ar lefel yr UE. Fel y dywedasoch, mae polisi'r Cynulliad yn eglur: y llygrwr ddylai dalu. A wnewch chi ein sicrhau na fyddwch yn cefnogi polisi'r DU oni bai ei fod yn diogelu ein tyfwyr organig a chonfensiynol yn llawn?

Michael German: It is always my intention to support the National Assembly's view. The Welsh Assembly Government has taken a strong stance, and it has found support in many quarters. At the moment, I understand that people have only seen a leaked copy of the document that the commission will be issuing. However, the document that I have seen puts far too much emphasis on economic aspects. We have to consider the purity of organic and other farm produce and protect the industry. The Assembly has taken

Michael German: Fy mwriad bob amser yw cefnogi safbwynt y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi gwneud safiad cryf, a chafodd gefnogaeth o sawl tu. Ar hyn o bryd, deallaf mai dim ond copi a ddatgelwyd i'r wasg o'r ddogfen y bydd y comisiwn yn ei chyhoeddi y mae pobl wedi ei gweld. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ddogfen yr wyf fi wedi ei gweld yn rhoi llawer gormod o bwyslais ar agweddau economaidd. Rhaid inni ystyried purdeb cynnyrch organig a chynnyrch fferm arall a diogelu'r

a strong view and that should continue.

diwydiant. Mae'r Cynulliad wedi mabwysiadu safbwynt cryf a dylai hynny barhau.

William Graham: In the hope that further documentation will not be lost, would you outline who it is that advises you on the safety of GM crops and current research in this controversial area?

William Graham: Yn y gobaith na chaiff dogfennaeth bellach ei cholli, a wnewch chi amlinellu pwy sy'n eich cynghori ar ddiogelwch cynydau GM ac ymchwil gyfredol yn y maes dadleuol hwn?

Michael German: I have just reported to you that the Agriculture and Environmental Biotechnology Commission and the other scientific commissions of the UK Government advise us. We do not have a separate scientific facility in Wales, though there is scientific debate on this in Wales, which is part of the ongoing public debate on genetic modification. There was a recent conference at the Institute of Grassland and Environmental Research in Aberystwyth, which was very well attended and to which Welsh scientists contributed. We will take into account all three strands of the full public debate when it comes to a conclusion at the end of September.

Michael German: Yr wyf newydd ddweud wrthyfch mai'r Comisiwn Biotechnoleg Amaethyddol ac Amgylcheddol a chomisiynau gwyddonol eraill y DU sy'n ein cynghori. Nid oes gennym gyfleuster gwyddonol ar wahân yng Nghymru, er bod dadl wyddonol ar hyn yng Nghymru, sy'n rhan o'r ddadl gyhoeddus barhaus ar addasu genetig. Cynhaliwyd cynhadledd yn ddiweddar yn Sefydliad Ymchwil Tir Glas a'r Amgylchedd yn Aberystwyth, a fynychwyd gan nifer dda iawn o bobl ac a oedd yn cynnwys cyfraniadau gan wyddonwyr o Gymru. Byddwn yn ystyried tri maes y ddadl gyhoeddus lawn pan ddaw i ben ar ddiwedd mis Medi.

Tagio Defaid a Geifr Sheep and Goat Tagging

Q3 David Davies: Will the Minister make a statement on the new sheep and goat tagging procedures? (OAQ23599)

C3 David Davies: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y gweithdrefnau newydd ar gyfer tagio defaid a geifr? (OAQ23599)

Michael German: The individual identification of sheep and goats comes into force on 1 April 2003. Farmers are required to individually identify all animals born on the holding from this date. They are also required to individually identify any animals born on the holding and not currently identified. These requirements apply equally to pet animals. However, these measures should not be confused with the European Commission's double tagging proposals.

Michael German: Daw y system o nodi defaid a geifr yn unigol i rym ar 1 Ebrill 2003. Mae'n ofynnol i ffermwyr nodi yr holl anifeiliaid a anwyd ar eu daliad o'r dyddiad hwn ymlaen yn unigol. Mae hefyd yn ofynnol iddynt nodi unrhyw anifeiliaid a anwyd ar y daliad nad ydynt wedi eu nodi ar hyn o bryd. Mae'r gofynion hyn yr un mor berthnasol i anifeiliaid anwes. Fodd bynnag, ni ddylid drysu'r gofynion hyn gyda chynigion tagio dwbl y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd.

David Davies: You seem to be adding to the confusion, Minister. Could you tell us briefly and simply whether all new-born sheep and goats born on a farm and not moved anywhere have to be tagged or not? Will they have to be tagged immediately? Will inspectors who find new-born lambs without tags be able to levy a fine on the farmer?

David Davies: Ymddengys eich bod yn ychwanegu at y dryswch, Weinidog. A allwch ddweud wrthym yn fyr ac yn syml pa un ai a oes rhaid tagio'r holl ddefaid a geifr newydd-anedig ar fferm ac nad ydynt wedi eu symud i unrhyw le. A fydd yn rhaid eu tagio ar unwaith? A fydd arolygwyr sy'n canfod ŵyn newydd-anedig heb dag yn gallu

Since they are completely unworkable, do you condemn these proposals out of hand? When will you have an idea of what is forthcoming? I believe there are more regulations on the way on this matter. What will they mean for farmers and when are they likely to be introduced?

Michael German: I will take your last point first. The industry is generally in favour of the UK proposals. The difficulties lie in the European Union proposals. The industry, the UK Government and the Assembly Government find that there are severe practical difficulties in operating the EU proposals. That debate continues.

With respect to your first point, the regulation applies to lambs or kids born from 1 February 2003 onwards. The EU requirement is to identify the sheep and goats as soon as possible after birth. Farmers should therefore take the opportunity to identify animals when they are first gathered for routine procedures. They must be identified before leaving the holding on which they were born, or before their first birthday. That is the regulation that applies to them.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Mae'r Gweinidog yn tanbrisió'r broblem drwy ddweud bod anawsterau ymarferol. Onid yw'n amhosibl gweithredu'r cynllun hwn yn ymarferol ac oni fydd yn creu problemau enfawr i ffermwyr, sydd weithiau yn gofalu am filoedd o ddefaid? Byddai tagio dwbl yn creu problemau enfawr iddynt. A yw'n bwriadu gwneud mwy na dweud bod problem, ac a wnaiff sicrhau y caiff y rheoliadau hyn eu newid?

Michael German: This is a European directive and we cannot change the European Union's viewpoint on our own. The first stage is to get the UK Government's view to coincide with ours, which it does. There are practical difficulties, and it is not so much the tagging as the traceability and recording issues that arise from it that cause the industry most problems. Two fora have been held in Wales, one in Brecon on 11 March and the other in St Asaph on 24 March. Both were attended by the farming unions and

dirwyo'r ffermwr? Gan eu bod yn gwbl anymarferol, a ydych yn condemnio'r cynigion hyn yn llwyr? Pa bryd y bydd gennych syniad o'r hyn sydd yn yr arfaeth? Credaf fod mwy o reoliadau ar y ffordd ar y mater hwn. Beth a fyddant yn ei olygu i ffermwyr a pha bryd y maent yn debygol o gael eu cyflwyno?

Michael German: Ymdriniaf â'ch pwynt olaf yn gyntaf. Mae'r diwydiant yn gyffredinol o blaid cynigion y DU. Mae'r anawsterau yn deillio o gynigion yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Gwêl y diwydiant, Llywodraeth y DU a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad fod anawsterau ymarferol sylweddol o ran gweithredu cynigion yr UE. Mae'r ddadl honno'n parhau.

Mewn perthynas â'ch pwynt cyntaf, mae'r rheoliad yn berthnasol i wŷn neu fynnod a anwyd o 1 Chwefror 2003 ymlaen. Gofyniad yr UE yw nodi'r defaid a'r geifr cyn gynted ag y bo modd ar ôl eu geni. Dylai ffermwyr felly fanteisio ar y cyfle i nodi anifeiliaid pan gânt eu cynnull am y tro cyntaf ar gyfer gweithdrefnau arferol. Rhaid iddynt gael eu nodi cyn gadael y daliad y cawsant eu geni arno, neu cyn eu pen-blwydd cyntaf. Dyna yw'r rheoliad sy'n berthnasol iddynt hwy.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: The Minister underplays the problem when he says that there are practical difficulties. Is it not impossible to implement this scheme in practice and will it not create massive problems for farmers, who sometimes care for thousands of sheep? Double tagging would create huge problems for them. Does he intend to do more than just state that there is a problem, and will he ensure that these regulations are changed?

Michael German: Cyfarwyddeb Ewropeaidd yw hon ac ni allwn newid safbwynt yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ar ein safbwynt ni. Y cam cyntaf yw cael safbwynt Llywodraeth y DU i gyd-fynd â'n safbwynt ni, ac mae'n gwneud hynny eisoes. Ceir anawsterau ymarferol, nid yn gymaint o ran tagio ond o ran y materion olrhain a chofnodi sy'n deillio ohono ac sy'n achosi'r rhan fwyaf o broblemau i'r diwydiant. Cynhaliwyd dau fforwm yng Nghymru, un ohonynt yn Aberhonddu ar 11 Mawrth a'r llall yn Lanelwyr ar 24 Mawrth.

farmers nominated by their union representatives. We are now collating the views expressed there, and we will take forward that public debate to try to influence—not necessarily the UK's position, which is quite clear—but the European Union's position, which will be debated soon.

Peter Rogers: I listened to your remarks carefully, Minister. This is a bureaucratic decision taken in Brussels without any understanding of tagging ewes and lambs and without common sense. Is not traceability based on containing disease in this country? Given the outbreak of foot and mouth disease here, would it not be better for the European Union to put a greater emphasis on the British Government taking action to stop meat imports entering this country, to check at ports and to ensure that swill is properly prepared for animals? That would be a far better means of containing disease than traceability and tagging measures.

Michael German: I am grateful to you for your question. The European Union has not yet taken a decision on this, and we have an opportunity to make the position of the Welsh Assembly Government and the UK Government clear. It is wrong to say that the decision has been taken; it has not. That is why we have consulted on this matter and are taking the issues forward. On the matter of illegal meat imports, I will make a statement in my report to Committee next week. It is too complicated a matter to discuss at this stage in Plenary; it will be better that I give a detailed report on the recent Veterinary Laboratories Agency analysis to the Committee next week.

Mynychwyd y ddau gan yr undebau ffermwyr a'r ffermwyr a enwebwyd gan eu cynrychiolwyr undeb. Yr ydym yn awr yn casglu'r safbwyntiau a fynegwyd yno, a byddwn yn ceisio datblygu'r ddadl gyhoeddus er mwyn ceisio dylanwadu—nid ar safbwynt y DU o anghenraid, sy'n eithaf clir—ond ar safbwynt yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, a fydd yn cael ei drafod yn fuan.

Peter Rogers: Gwrandewais ar eich sylwadau yn ofalus, Weinidog. Penderfyniad biwrocraidd a wnaethpwyd ym Mrwsel yw hwn heb unrhyw ddealltwriaeth o dagio mamogiaid ac ŵyn ac heb unrhyw synnwyr cyffredin. Onid yw olrhain yn seiliedig ar atal clefyd rhag lledaenu yn y wlad hon? O gofio argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau yma, oni fyddai'n well i'r Undeb Ewropeaidd roi rhagor o bwyslais ar sicrhau bod Llywodraeth Prydain yn cymryd camau i atal allforion cig rhag dod i mewn i'r wlad hon, gwirio pob porthladd a sicrhau y caiff golchion eu paratoi'n briodol ar gyfer anifeiliaid? Byddai hynny'n llawer gwell ffordd o atal clefyd rhag lledaenu na mesurau olrhain a thagio.

Michael German: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am eich cwestiwn. Nid yw'r Undeb Ewropeaidd wedi gwneud penderfyniad ynglŷn â hyn eto, ac mae cyfle gennym i egluro safbwynt Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a Llywodraeth y DU. Mae'n anghywir i ddweud i'r penderfyniad gael ei wneud; ni chafodd ei wneud. Dyna pam ein bod wedi ymgynghori ar y mater hwn ac yn datblygu'r materion. O ran allforion cig anghyfreithlon, byddaf yn gwneud datganiad yn fy adroddiad i'r Pwyllgor yr wythnos nesaf. Mae'n fater rhy gymhleth i'w drafod yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar hyn o bryd; byddai'n well pe bawn yn rhoi adroddiad manwl ar ddadansoddiad diweddar yr Asiantaeth Labordai Milfeddygol i'r Pwyllgor yr wythnos nesaf.

Safonau Iechyd a Lles ar gyfer Anifeiliaid Fferm Health and Welfare Standards for Farm Animals

Q4 Ann Jones: What action has the Minister taken to ensure decent health and welfare standards for farm animals in Wales? (OAQ23595)

C4 Ann Jones: Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cymryd i sicrhau safonau iechyd a lles boddhaol ar gyfer anifeiliaid fferm yng Nghymru? (OAQ23595)

Michael German: In January, I launched a consultation document on the preparation of a comprehensive strategy for animal health and welfare, including farm and companion animals. A wide range of meetings is underway to develop the strategy, which we plan to publish later in 2003.

Ann Jones: I welcome the launch of that health and welfare strategy consultation document, which aims to build a shared vision with stakeholders and has a commitment to develop a sustainable future. The strategy has the potential to provide a clear direction for the development of future policies and the revision of existing measures. It could also increase the transparency of Government actions and be a mechanism to move towards better public information and advice. Do you agree that such an outcome can only be achieved if it is accompanied by clear target outcomes and a realistic timetable for their achievement?

Michael German: That is absolutely right. If you set an impossible target it will be missed. We are considering a 10-year period and over that time we hope to substantially raise the levels of animal health and welfare in Wales. That amount of time is necessary to allow people to adjust. However, setting out the direction in advance makes it clear that this will benefit everyone.

David Davies: Do you agree that, instead of implementing ever higher standards of health and welfare for animal rearing in Wales, we should ensure high standards of animal health and welfare across the whole of Europe? It is impossible for farmers in Wales to compete if we continue to allow meat that has not been reared to the same standards that we expect from our farmers to be imported.

Michael German: My remit does not run to managing the French, German and other EU members—[*Interruption.*] He said outside the United Kingdom. We continually consider the issue of a level playing field within the European Union. It is right that the European Union should impose standards across the

Michael German: Ym mis Ionawr, lansiais ddogfen ymgynghori ar baratoi strategaeth gynhwysfawr ar gyfer iechyd a lles anifeiliaid, gan gynnwys anifeiliaid fferm ac anifeiliaid anwes. Mae amrywiaeth helaeth o gyfarfodydd yn mynd rhagddynt er mwyn datblygu'r strategaeth, y bwriadwn ei chyhoeddi yn ddiweddarach yn 2003.

Ann Jones: Croesawaf lansio'r ddogfen ymgynghorol strategaeth iechyd a lles, sydd â'r nod o adeiladu gweledigaeth gyffredin gyda rhanddeiliaid ac sydd ag ymrwymiad i ddatblygu dyfodol cynaliadwy. Mae gan y strategaeth y potensial i roi cyfeiriad eglur ar gyfer datblygu polisiau yn y dyfodol a diwygio'r mesurau presennol. Gallai hefyd gynyddu tryloywder camau'r Llywodraeth a gweithredu fel dull ar gyfer symud tuag at wybodaeth a chynghor cyhoeddus gwell. A gytunwch mai dim ond os caiff ei ategu gan ganlyniadau targed eglur ac amserlen realistig ar gyfer eu cyflawni y gellir cyflawni canlyniad o'r fath?

Michael German: Mae hynny'n hollol gywir. Os byddwch yn pennu targed amhosibl ni fyddwch yn ei gyflawni. Yr ydym yn ystyried cyfnod o 10 mlynedd a thros yr amser hwnnw gobeithiwn gynyddu lefelau iechyd a lles anifeiliaid yng Nghymru yn sylweddol. Bydd angen cymaint â hynny o amser er mwyn galluogi pobl i addasu. Fodd bynnag, bydd pennu'r cyfeiriad ymlaen llaw yn ei gwneud yn amlwg bod hyn o fantais i bawb.

David Davies: Yn hytrach na gweithredu safonau iechyd a lles uwch byth ar gyfer magu anifeiliaid yng Nghymru, oni chytunwch y dylem sicrhau safonau iechyd a lles anifeiliaid uchel ledled Ewrop? Mae'n amhosibl i ffermwyr yng Nghymru gystadlu os ydym yn parhau i ganiatáu i gig na chafodd ei fagu i'r un safonau ag y disgwyliwn gan ein ffermwyr ni i gael ei fewnforio.

Michael German: Nid yw fy nghylch gwaith yn ymestyn i reoli polisiau amaeth Ffrainc, yr Almaen ag aelod-wladwriaethau eraill yr UE—[*Torri ar draws.*] Dywedodd y tu allan i'r Deyrnas Unedig. Yr ydym yn ystyried y mater o amodau cyfartal o fewn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yn barhaus. Mae'n briodol y

board, and it is in a position to do so. If you know of an instance where the rules have not been obeyed, let me know and I will take it up on your behalf.

dylai'r Undeb Ewropeaidd osod safonau cyffredinol, ac mae mewn sefyllfa i wneud hynny. Os gwyddoch am enghraifft lle na chadwyd at y rheolau, gadewch imi wybod a byddaf yn mynd ar drywydd y mater ar eich rhan.

2.40 p.m.

Gwerthu Cynnyrch Cymreig mewn Archfarchnadoedd Selling Welsh Produce in Supermarkets

Q5 Janet Ryder: What recent discussions has the Minister held with representatives of supermarket chains regarding selling Welsh produce? (OAQ23609)

C5 Janet Ryder: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cynnal yn ddiweddar gyda chynrychiolwyr y cwmnïau archfarchnad ynghylch gwerthu cynnyrch o Gymru? (OAQ23609)

Michael German: My most recent discussion was with Tesco on Monday. The Welsh Development Agency's Food Directorate and the agri-food partnership are continuously pursuing opportunities on my behalf with all supermarkets in Wales to promote and encourage the supply of home-produced products.

Michael German: Fy nhrafodaeth ddiweddaraf oedd yr un gyda Tesco ddydd Llun. Mae Cyfarwyddiaeth Fwyd Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a'r bartneriaeth fwyd-amaeth yn barhaol yn dilyn cyfleoedd ar fy rhan gyda'r holl archfarchnadoedd yng Nghymru i hyrwyddo ac annog cyflenwadau o gynhyrchion cynnyrch cartref.

Janet Ryder: Supermarket chains often say that the bar to using local produce is problems with the logistics of supply and of quantity and quality. What are you doing to overcome these problems, many of which are connected to road infrastructure and transport problems, in order to aid the industry for which you have responsibility and to develop a positive future for it?

Janet Ryder: Mae cwmnïau archfarchnad yn aml yn datgan mai'r rhwystr rhag defnyddio cynnyrch lleol yw problemau gyda logisteg cyflenwi a maint ac ansawdd. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i oresgyn y problemau hyn, y mae llawer ohonynt yn gysylltiedig â phroblemau seilwaith ffyrdd a phroblemau trafniadaeth, er mwyn cynorthwyo'r diwydiant y mae gennych gyfrifoldeb amdano ac i ddatblygu dyfodol cadarnhaol iddo?

Michael German: Consistency of supply and quality of supply are issues that vex supermarket chains. We need to be able to produce the product to time, in sufficient quantities, and to a consistent quality, and the Welsh Development Agency's Food Directorate is addressing this. I was pleased to note this week that eight of Wales's cheese manufacturers have formed a co-operative. That includes our largest manufacturer, South Caernarfon Creameries, as well as smaller cheese manufacturers in Wales. We hope that up to 40 manufacturers will join this co-operative so that we can work together to ensure that we achieve consistent standards. That must also happen across the

Michael German: Mae cysondeb cyflenwadau ac ansawdd cyflenwadau yn faterion sy'n pryderu cwmnïau archfarchnadoedd. Mae angen inni allu cynhyrchu'r nwyddau yn brydlon, mewn maint digonol, ac yn ôl safon gyson, ac mae Cyfarwyddiaeth Fwyd Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru yn mynd i'r afael â hynny. Yr oedd yn dda gennyf nodi bod wyth o gynhyrchwyr caws Cymru wedi ffurfio cwmni cydweithredol. Mae hynny'n cynnwys Hufenfa De Caernarfon, ein cynhyrchydd mwyaf, ynghyd â chynhyrchwyr caws llai eu maint yng Nghymru. Gobeithiwn y bydd hyd at 40 o gynhyrchwyr yn ymuno â'r cwmni cydweithredol hwn fel ein bod yn gallu

dairy sector and the meat sector; we expect nothing less. Purchasers have made it clear to me that these issues are to the fore, and I assure you that the agri-food partnership is addressing them.

Alun Pugh: Janet Ryder is right: it is important that local supermarkets stock local specialities and I am sure that she misses her native pease-pudding and Newcastle brown ale. Do you agree that Wales produces some excellent food and that our future must lie in the development of a vigorous export market to distribute our produce to hundreds of millions of consumers outside Wales, in addition to the 3 million at home?

Michael German: The export market is crucial. Several months ago I met all of the consultants who promote Welsh food on our behalf across Europe. Their response to my question as to what more I can do in my role to assist the export of Welsh food products, was to say that more products are needed. We need variety, innovation, good packaging, and changes in design. Consistency and quality are the watch-words. I am pleased to tell you that the largest ever number of Welsh exhibitors attended the international food exhibition this week in London. The Welsh food awards have gone a long way to contributing to the successful development of Welsh products. I do not think that England has been as successful with its products.

David Ian Jones: Do you agree that the 'Welsh-reared' logo is valuable and is a unique selling point for Welsh produce? In terms of logistics, do you agree that supermarkets should be commended for sourcing their meat and other products, as far as possible, from local suppliers? One such supermarket is Tesco at Llandudno Junction, which sources its Welsh lamb from Mr John Owen of Llwydfaen, Glan Conwy, whose farm is five miles away as the crow flies.

Michael German: I am sure that consumers who visit Tesco in Llandudno Junction will

gweithio gyda'n gilydd i sicrhau ein bod yn cyrraedd safonau cyson. Rhaid i hynny ddigwydd hefyd ar draws y sector llaeth a'r sector cig, ni fodlonwn ar lai na hynny. Mae prynwyr wedi pwysleisio mai'r materion hyn sydd yn cael y flaenoriaeth, a gallaf eich sicrhau bod y bartneriaeth bwyd-amaeth yn mynd i'r afael â hwy.

Alun Pugh: Mae Janet Ryder yn gywir: mae'n bwysig bod archfarchnadoedd lleol yn gwerthu danteithion lleol ac yr wyf yn siŵr ei bod yn gweld eisiau ei phwddin pys brodorol, a'i chwrw Newcastle. A gytunwch fod Cymru yn cynhyrchu bwyd ardderchog a bod ein dyfodol mewn datblygu marchnad allforio fywiog i ddsbarthu ein cynnyrch i gannoedd o filiynau o ddefnyddwyr y tu allan i Gymru, yn ogystal â'r 3 miliwn gartref.

Michael German: Mae'r farchnad allforio yn hollbwysig. Sawl mis yn ôl cyfarfûm â'r holl ymgynghorwyr sy'n hyrwyddo bwyd Cymru ar ein rhan ledled Ewrop. Eu hymateb i'm cwestiwn, beth yn rhagor y gallaf ei wneud yn fy rôl i gynorthwyo'r gwaith o allforio cynhyrchion bwyd Cymru, oedd dweud bod angen mwy o gynhyrchion. Mae arnom angen amrywiaeth, arloesedd, pecynnu da a newidiadau mewn dylunio. Cysondeb ac ansawdd yw'r geiriau allweddol. Mae'n dda gennyf allu dweud wrthy ch i'r nifer mwyaf erioed o arddangoswyr o Gymru fynychu'r arddangosfa fwyd ryngwladol yn Llundain yr wythnos hon. Mae gwobrau bwyd Cymru wedi cyflawni llawer o ran cyfrannu at ddatblygu cynhyrchion Cymreig yn llwyddiannus. Nid wyf o'r farn bod Lloegr yr un mor llwyddiannus â'i chynnyrch hi.

David Ian Jones: A gytunwch fod y logo 'magwyd yng Nghymru' yn werthfawr a'i fod yn ffordd unigryw o hybu cynnyrch Cymru? O ran logisteg, a gytunwch y dylid canmol archfarchnadoedd am sicrhau mai cyflenwyr cig a chynhyrchion eraill lleol a ddefnyddir ganddynt? Un archfarchnad o'r fath yw Tesco yng Nghyffordd Llandudno sy'n prynu ei chig oen Cymreig oddi wrth Mr John Owen Llwydfaen, Glan Conwy, y mae ei fferm bum milltir oddi yno fel yr hed y frân.

Michael German: Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y cwsmeriaid sy'n ymweld â Tesco yng

be pleased to know that. The reared in Wales and Welsh logos are important, particularly for the meat sector. We have developed the 'Wales: the True Taste' logo, which is highly appropriate for processed products because it is indicative of quality as well as of origin. I hope that the 'Wales: the True Taste' awards, of which I spoke, will contribute to an increase in the amount of Welsh products being sourced by supermarkets in Wales and beyond, and ensure that its high quality is recognised. We have had considerable success in Wales, with small companies growing rapidly through the use of the 'Wales: The True Taste' logo.

Nghyffordd Llandudno yn falch o glywed hynny. Mae'r logos magwyd yng Nghymru a'r logos Cymreig yn bwysig, yn arbennig i'r sector cig. Yr ydym wedi datblygu logo 'Cymru: y Gwir Flas', sydd yn briodol iawn ar gyfer cynhyrchion a broseswyd oherwydd ei fod yn dynodi ansawdd yn ogystal â tharddiad. Gobeithiaf y bydd gwobrau 'Cymru: y Gwir Flas' y cyfeiriais atynt, yn cyfrannu at gynnydd yn y cynhyrchion Cymreig a brynir gan archfarchnadoedd yng Nghymru a thu hwnt, ac yn gwneud yn siŵr bod ei hansawdd da yn cael ei gydnabod. Cawsom gryn lwyddiant yng Nghymru, gyda chwmnïau bach yn tyfu'n gyflym drwy'r defnydd o'r logo 'Cymru: Y Gwir Flas'.

Cwestiynau ar Lywodraeth Agored i'r Trefnydd Questions on Open Government to the Business Minister

Lleihau'r Bwlch Cyflog Narrowing the Pay Gap

Q1 Ann Jones: What assessment has the Minister made of the success of narrowing the pay gap between men and women in Wales? (OAQ23644)

C1 Ann Jones: Pa asesiad mae'r Gweinidog wedi ei wneud o lwyddiant y cynllun i leihau'r bwlch cyflog rhwng dynion a menywod yng Nghymru? (OAQ23644)

The Business Minister (Carwyn Jones): The report 'Wales Leads the Way: Close the Pay Gap Campaign' was presented to the Committee on Equality of Opportunity on 20 March. This details and assesses the successful campaign to narrow the pay gap run by the Assembly in partnership with the Equal Opportunities Commission and the Wales Trades Union Congress over the past year.

Y Trefnydd (Carwyn Jones): Cafodd yr adroddiad 'Cymru'n Arwain y Ffordd: Ymgyrch Cau'r Bwlch Cyflog' ei gyflwyno i'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal ar 20 Mawrth. Mae hwn yn manylu ar ac yn asesu'r ymgyrch lwyddiannus i leihau'r bwlch cyflog sydd wedi cael ei gynnal gan y Cynulliad mewn partneriaeth â'r Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal a Chyngres Undebau Llafur Cymru dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf.

Ann Jones: I recommend that report to everyone who is in employment or seeking employment; it is a way to tackle the scourge of unequal pay. We cannot allow the pay gap to continue for another generation. Do you agree that the only way to ensure that we do not stand still on this matter—or allow everyone else to catch up with us before we move ahead—is to have a committed budget line to ensure that campaigns such as that to promote equal pay continue in the next Assembly?

Ann Jones: Argymhellaf yr adroddiad hwnnw i bawb sy'n gweithio neu'n chwilio am waith; mae'n ddull o fynd i'r afael â chosb cyflogau anghyfartal. Ni allwn adael i'r bwlch cyflog barhau am genhedlaeth arall. A gytunwch mai'r unig ffordd o sicrhau nad arhoswn yn yr unfan ar hyn—neu adael i bawb arall ddal i fyny â ni cyn i ni symud ymlaen—yw cael llinell gyllideb neilltuedig i sicrhau bod ymgyrchoedd tebyg i'r un sy'n hyrwyddo cyflog cyfartal yn parhau yn y Cynulliad nesaf?

Carwyn Jones: Although it is not possible to make that commitment today, I agree with your point. It is not enough to run a year-long

Carwyn Jones: Er nad yw'n bosibl rhoi'r ymrwymiad hwnnw heddiw, cytunaf â'ch pwynt. Nid yw rhedeg ymgyrch am flwyddyn

campaign and hope that the issue is resolved. Inequality of pay has remained an issue for the past 30 years and more. I am sure that the issue will be considered after the election.

a gobeithio y caiff y mater ei ddatrys yn ddigon. Mae cyflog anghyfartal wedi bod yn bwnc ers 30 mlynedd a mwy. Yr wyf yn siŵr y caiff y mater ei ystyried ar ôl yr etholiad.

Hyrwyddo Archwiliadau Cyflog Cyfartal Promoting Equal Pay Audits

Q2 Ann Jones: Will the Minister make a statement on the promotion of equal pay audits in Wales? (OAQ23645)

C2 Ann Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar hyrwyddo archwiliadau cyflog cyfartal yng Nghymru? (OAQ23645)

Carwyn Jones: The ‘close the pay gap’ campaign in Wales produced kits to deliver equal pay audits and promoted those kits through a series of events. You will be aware, Ann, that the Assembly has led the way and has won a Castle award for its pay audit.

Carwyn Jones: Cynhyrchodd yr ymgyrch ‘cau’r bwlch cyflog’ yng Nghymru becynnau i ddarparu archwiliadau cyflog cyfartal, a hyrwyddodd y pecynnau hynny drwy gyfres o ddigwyddiadau. Byddwch yn ymwybodol, Ann, fod y Cynulliad wedi arwain y ffordd ac wedi ennill gwobr Castle am ei archwiliad cyflog.

Ann Jones: The fight for equal pay is not over—we must keep on fighting. I thank you, Minister, for the excellent way in which you have carried this campaign forward. Do you agree that, although businesses prefer to take a voluntary route towards equal pay, we must work with them to ensure that they take up the kits and equal pay audits? We must take businesses with us and work with them to ensure equal pay across Wales. That should be done voluntarily, and in partnership with businesses, rather than being compulsory—unless that becomes necessary.

Ann Jones: Nid yw’r frwydr dros gyflog cyfartal drosodd—rhaid parhau i frwydro. Diolchaf i chi Weinidog, am y modd ardderchog yr ydych wedi datblygu’r ymgyrch hon. A gytunwch, er bod yn well gan fusnesau gymryd llwybr gwirfoddol tuag at gyflog cyfartal, fod yn rhaid inni weithio gyda hwy i sicrhau eu bod yn defnyddio’r pecynnau a’r archwiliadau cyflog cyfartal? Rhaid inni fynd â busnesau gyda ni a gweithio gyda hwy i sicrhau cyflog cyfartal ledled Cymru. Dylid gwneud hynny’n wirfoddol ac mewn partneriaeth â busnesau, yn hytrach na bod yn wirfoddol—oni fydd angen gwneud hynny.

Carwyn Jones: We must stick with the voluntary route at the moment. We have had some success in communicating the need for equal pay audits to local government, the health service and other public bodies in Wales. The private sector is a harder nut to crack. Some larger companies have shown interest and have conducted equal pay audits, but we have some way to go in terms of convincing small and medium-sized enterprises of the benefits of equal pay. Those benefits include a happier workforce that feels it is being treated fairly and equally. That work must continue. We acknowledge that there is still some way to go, but that should not be a disincentive to us.

Carwyn Jones: Rhaid inni lynu wrth y llwybr gwirfoddol am y tro. Cawsom rywfaint o lwyddiant wrth gyfleu’r angen am archwiliadau cyflog cyfartal i lywodraeth leol, y gwasanaeth iechyd a chyrrff cyhoeddus eraill yng Nghymru. Mae’r sector preifat yn broblem ddyrys iawn i’w ddatrys. Dangosodd rhai cwmnïau mwy eu maint ddiddordeb ac maent wedi cynnal archwiliadau cyflog cyfartal, ond mae gennym rywfaint o waith i’w wneud o ran argyhoeddi busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint o fanteision cyflog cyfartal. Ymhlith y manteision hynny mae gweithlu hapusach sy’n teimlo ei fod yn cael ei drin yn deg a chyfartal. Rhaid i’r gwaith hwnnw barhau. Cydnabyddwn fod rhywfaint o waith i’w wneud o hyd, ond ni ddylai hynny ein gwangalonni.

Janet Ryder: You seemed to imply that the Assembly has achieved some success with the NHS and local government in implementing equal pay audits. However, in a meeting of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity last week, the Welsh Local Government Association gave a presentation that clearly showed that local government—which, along with the health service, is the biggest employer of women in Wales—had not made progress on its equal pay audit. How will the Minister work proactively with local government to ensure that it undertakes these audits and can indicate to the Assembly what kind of financial burden it will face in delivering equal pay for the many women that it employs?

Janet Ryder: Ymddengys eich bod yn awgrymu bod y Cynulliad wedi cael rhywfaint o lwyddiant gyda'r GIG a llywodraeth leol wrth weithredu archwiliadau cyflog cyfartal. Fodd bynnag, mewn cyfarfod o'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal yr wythnos diwethaf, rhoddodd Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru gyflwyniad a ddangosai'n eglur nad oedd llywodraeth leol—sef y sefydliad, ynghyd â'r gwasanaeth iechyd, sy'n cyflogi'r nifer mwyaf o ferched yng Nghymru—wedi gwneud cynnydd ar ei archwiliad cyflog cyfartal. Sut y bydd y Gweinidog yn gweithio'n rhagweithiol gyda llywodraeth leol i sicrhau ei bod yn cynnal yr archwiliadau hyn, ac yn gallu dangos i'r Cynulliad pa fath o faich ariannol y bydd yn ei wynebu wrth gyflwyno cyflog cyfartal i'r merched niferus a gyfloga?

Carwyn Jones: The 'close the pay gap' campaign held a session for local government. That was primarily for officers, although some elected members were present. Like you, I heard what the WLGA's representatives said last week, and it caused me some concern. It is essential that pay audits are conducted. To cite financial problems as a reason for not conducting a pay audit is not a good excuse and could not be used in court. I encourage the WLGA to work with the Assembly and the Assembly Government so that we can find a way forward, in partnership, to ensure that more equal pay audits take place in local government.

Carwyn Jones: Cynhaliodd yr ymgyrch 'cau'r bwlch cyflog' sesiwn ar gyfer llywodraeth leol. Yr oedd hynny'n bennaf i swyddogion, er bod rhai aelodau etholedig yn bresennol. Fel chithau, clywais beth oedd gan gynrychiolwyr Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru i'w ddweud yr wythnos diwethaf ac achosodd gryn bryder i mi. Mae'n hanfodol bod archwiliadau cyflog yn cael eu cynnal. Nid yw nodi problemau ariannol fel rheswm dros beidio â chynnal archwiliad cyflog yn esgus da, ac ni ellid ei ddefnyddio mewn llys. Anogaf y gymdeithas i weithio gyda'r Cynulliad a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad fel y gallwn ganfod ffordd ymlaen, mewn partneriaeth, i sicrhau bod rhagor o archwiliadau cyflog cyfartal yn cael eu cynnal mewn llywodraeth leol.

Gwefan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol The National Assembly Website

Q3 Christine Chapman: What action has the Minister taken to promote use of the National Assembly website in Wales? (OAQ23643)

C3 Christine Chapman: Pa gamau mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cymryd i hybu'r defnydd o wefan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yng Nghymru? (OAQ23643)

Carwyn Jones: The website for the National Assembly has been extended and improved in recent years and its use is encouraged wherever appropriate in our publications and correspondence. The launch of the Assembly's publication scheme, in November 2002, was the latest step in

Carwyn Jones: Ymestynnwyd gwefan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a'i gwella yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf ac anogir ei defnydd lle bynnag y bo'n briodol yn ein cyhoeddiadau a'n gohebiaeth. Lansiad cynllun cyhoeddiadau'r Cynulliad, ym mis Tachwedd 2002, oedd y cam diweddaraf i

enhancing and drawing attention to the huge range of material available on the website.

Christine Chapman: Do you agree that a commitment to open government and making information available in Wales also means a commitment to encouraging the use of, and access to, the information that is provided? Do you also agree that, in order to improve participation in politics through the Assembly's website, we must address the 55 per cent of adults who, according to a recent Welsh Consumer Council survey, do not use the internet? Will you promise to work with the Minister for Economic Development to improve internet services and make broadband available across Wales?

2.50 p.m.

Carwyn Jones: I will. The Minister for Economic Development has a passion for information technology, and I am sure that he is addressing this. The older a section of the population is, the less likely it is to use the internet and information technology. You are right that we now have a far more open and democratic system of government than we have ever had, and it is right that people should have as much access to information as possible.

Phil Williams: A gytunwch y byddai gweddarlledu pob cyfarfod Pwyllgor a Chyfarfod Llawn, gan gynnwys hen gyfarfodydd Pwyllgor a Chyfarfodydd Llawn, yn rhoi'r mynediad gorau i bobl Cymru i waith y Cynulliad? A gytunwch hefyd ei bod yn bwysig cael band eang drwy Gymru i ganiatáu i we-ddarlledu roi safon ddigonol o wybodaeth fideo o gyfarfodydd y Cynulliad?

Carwyn Jones: Ar we-ddarlledu, nid yw'r dechnoleg ISDN yn ddigon da ar hyn o bryd i bobl allu gwylio unrhyw beth am fwy na 10 munud neu chwarter awr, oherwydd oedi o ryw fath. Deallaf fod y sefyllfa o ran band eang yn wahanol, ac mae'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd wedi gwneud llawer o waith ar estyn band eang drwy Gymru, er bod peth ffordd i fynd ar hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn gwneud yn dda o gymharu â rhai rhannau eraill o Brydain.

wella a thynnu sylw at yr ystod eang o ddeunyddiau sydd ar gael ar y wefan.

Christine Chapman: A gytunwch fod ymrwymiad i lywodraeth agored a sicrhau bod gwybodaeth ar gael yng Nghymru hefyd yn golygu ymrwymiad i annog defnydd o'r wybodaeth a ddarperir ac annog mynediad iddi? A gytunwch hefyd, er mwyn gwella cyfranogiad mewn gwleidyddiaeth drwy wefan y Cynulliad, fod yn rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â'r 55 y cant o oedolion nad ydynt, yn ôl arolwg diweddar gan Gyngor Defnyddwyr Cymru, yn defnyddio'r rhyngwyd? A wnewch chi addewid i weithio gyda'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd i wella'r gwasanaethau rhyngwyd a darparu band eang ledled Cymru?

Carwyn Jones: Gwnaf. Mae'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd yn frwd am dechnoleg gwybodaeth, ac yr wyf yn siŵr ei fod yn mynd i'r afael â hyn. Po hynaf yw adran o'r boblogaeth, y lleiaf tebygol ydyw o ddefnyddio'r rhyngwyd a thechnoleg gwybodaeth. Yr ydych yn gywir fod gennym bellach system o lywodraeth lawer mwy agored a democrataidd nag a gawsom erioed o'r blaen, ac mae'n iawn bod gan bobl fynediad mor eang â phosibl i wybodaeth.

Phil Williams: Do you agree that webcasting every Committee meeting and Plenary session, including previous Committee meetings and Plenary sessions, would provide the people of Wales with the best access to the Assembly's work? Do you also agree that it is important to have broadband throughout Wales to allow webcasting to provide an adequate standard of video information of the Assembly's meetings?

Carwyn Jones: On webcasting, the ISDN technology is not good enough at present for people to be able to watch anything for more than 10 or 15 minutes, because of some kind of time lag. I understand that the situation regarding broadband is different, and the Minister for Economic Development has carried out a great deal of work on extending broadband throughout Wales, although there is some way to go on that. However, we are doing well compared with some other parts of Britain.

Brian Gibbons: Nonetheless, Minister, do you agree that a stranger visiting the National Assembly website is unlikely to repeat that experience? The design of the website is counter-intuitive, and the search engine is hostile to yielding any useful answers. Do you believe that the website's design is crucial if we are to allow the Welsh public to engage with the Assembly's activities?

Carwyn Jones: I believe that I am right in saying that the website is a matter for the Presiding Office rather than the Government. However, as far as the Government is concerned, we will seek to promote as much openness as possible. I hope that your points on the website being difficult to access and hostile in answering questions are not aimed at any Minister.

The Presiding Officer: Order. It might be helpful for me to indicate that I can only claim possession of the smallest possible part of the Assembly website.

David Davies: Minister, one sure-fire way to encourage more people to use the website is audience participation. Why not allow people to vote on Assembly projects, such as the £50 million allocated for a new building, or the £15 million allocated to reorganising the health service, or the millions of pounds allocated to what your own press officials call 'Welsh embassies'? I guarantee that, if you allow people to express an opinion on those and many other matters, many people from Monmouthshire would be quick to log on.

Carwyn Jones: That is what the people of Monmouthshire have told you. I am sorry that they deem you, as their elected representative, so inadequate that they want access to the Assembly themselves.

The Presiding Officer: Question 4 (OAQ23650) is withdrawn.

Brian Gibbons: Serch hynny, Weinidog, oni chytunwch y byddai dieithryn sy'n ymweld â gwefan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn annhebygol o ailadrodd y profiad hwnnw? Mae dyluniad y wefan yn wrthreddfol, ac mae'r peiriant chwilio yn wrthwynebus i ildio atebion defnyddiol. A gredwch fod dyluniad y wefan yn hollbwysig os ydym i ganiatáu i bobl Cymru ymwneud â gweithgareddau'r Cynulliad?

Carwyn Jones: Credaf fy mod yn iawn i ddweud bod y wefan yn fater i Swyddfa'r Llywydd yn hytrach na'r Llywodraeth. Fodd bynnag, o ran y Llywodraeth, byddwn yn ceisio bod mor agored â phosibl. Gobeithiaf nad yw eich sylwadau fod y wefan yn anodd i'w chyrchu ac yn wrthwynebus wrth ateb cwestiynau wedi eu hanelu at unrhyw Weinidog.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Efallai y byddai o gymorth pe bawn yn nodi mai dim ond y rhan leiaf posibl o wefan y Cynulliad y gallaf hawlio perchenogaeth ohoni.

David Davies: Weinidog, un ffordd sicr o annog rhagor o bobl i ddefnyddio'r wefan yw cyfranogiad cynulleidfa. Pam na allwn ganiatáu i bobl bleidleisio ar brosiectau'r Cynulliad, megis y £50 miliwn a glustnodwyd ar gyfer adeilad newydd, neu'r £15 miliwn a glustnodwyd i ad-drefnu'r gwasanaeth iechyd, neu'r miliynau o bunnoedd a glustnodwyd i'r hyn y mae eich swyddogion y wasg yn eu galw'n 'llysgenadaethau Cymreig'? Gallaf eich sicrhau, pe baech yn caniatáu i bobl fynegi barn ar y rhain a llawer o faterion eraill, byddai llawer o bobl yn sir Fynwy yn cysylltu â'r wefan ar unwaith.

Carwyn Jones: Dyna a ddywedodd pobl Sir Fynwy wrthy ch. Mae'n drueni eu bod o'r farn eich bod chi, fel eu cynrychiolydd etholedig, mor annigonol fel eu bod am gael mynediad i'r Cynulliad eu hunain.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 4 (OAQ23650) yn ôl.

Canllawiau ar Lywodraeth Agored Guidance on Open Government

Q5 Peter Black: What guidance is the Welsh Assembly Government issuing to Assembly sponsored public bodies on advertising their meetings and opening them to the public? (OAQ23646)

Carwyn Jones: We encourage ASPBs to make their meetings open to the public wherever possible, and public notices frequently appear in the press about these meetings. However, many discussions by ASPB boards, particularly about commercially confidential or staff matters, need to be held in private.

Peter Black: Despite the many reforms that have been carried out through the ASPBs since the advent of the Assembly, most people are still ignorant of what they do, when they meet, and how they operate. Is it possible to evaluate whether a code could be drafted for ASPBs to consider how they could be more open and accessible to the public?

Carwyn Jones: Our ASPBs are required, where possible, to follow the approach to openness set out in our Code of Practice on Public Access to Information, and ASPB officials will receive training on our code and on implementing the Freedom of Information Act 2000. We expect ASPBs to follow the example that we have given.

Glyn Davies: Where your guidance indicates to ASPBs that they should be open to the public and that that should be maximised, will it also include the advice that they should make sufficient Welsh language translation equipment available for members of the public to use at meetings?

Carwyn Jones: It is good practice to make translation facilities available at meetings. They should also be adequate for the purpose otherwise there is little point of them being

C5 Peter Black: Pa ganllawiau mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi eu rhoi i gyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad i hysbysebu eu cyfarfodydd a'u gwneud yn agored i'r cyhoedd? (OAQ23646)

Carwyn Jones: Anogwn gyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad i wneud eu cyfarfodydd yn agored i'r cyhoedd lle bo hynny'n bosibl, a bydd hysbysiadau cyhoeddus am y cyfarfodydd hyn i'w gweld yn aml yn y wasg. Fodd bynnag mae'n angenrheidiol i lawer o'r trafodaethau gan fyrddau'r gyrff hynny, yn enwedig am faterion masnachol cyfrinachol neu faterion staff gael eu cynnal yn breifat.

Peter Black: Er gwaethaf y diwygiadau lawer a gyflawnwyd drwy gyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad ers dyfodiad y Cynulliad, ni wŷyr y rhan fwyaf o bobl o hyd pa beth a wnânt, pryd y maent yn cyfarfod, a sut y maent yn gweithredu. A yw'n bosibl gwerthuso a ellid drafftio cod ar gyfer y gyrff hyn i ystyried sut y gallant fod yn fwy agored a hygyrch i'r cyhoedd?

Carwyn Jones: Mae'n ofynnol i gyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad, lle bo'n bosibl, ddilyn yr ymagwedd tuag at fod yn agored a nodir yn ein Cod Ymarfer ar Ganiatáu i'r Cyhoedd Weld Gwybodaeth, a bydd swyddogion y gyrff yn derbyn hyfforddiant ar ein cod ac ar roi Deddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000 ar waith. Disgwyliwn i'r gyrff ddilyn yr esiampl a roddwyd gennym.

Glyn Davies: Pan fo eich canllawiau yn dweud wrth y gyrff hyn y dylent fod yn agored i'r cyhoedd ac y dylid sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd cymaint â phosibl, a fyddant hefyd yn cynnwys cyngor y dylent ddarparu digon o offer cyfieithu Cymraeg at ddefnydd aelodau'r cyhoedd mewn cyfarfodydd?

Carwyn Jones: Mae'n arfer da i ddarparu cyfleusterau cyfieithu mewn cyfarfodydd. Dylent hefyd fod yn addas i'r diben, neu fel arall, nid oes fawr o bwrpas iddynt gael eu

available. In terms of ASPBs, we would expect them to provide adequate translation facilities at public meetings.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Does the Minister recall the promise that there would be a bonfire of quangos? Is that now on the backburner? [*Laughter.*]

Carwyn Jones: Quangos are far more democratically accountable now than they were. There has been a bonfire of quangos in many ways. It may be that, in the future, that bonfire may need to be rekindled.

The Presiding Officer: Question 6 (OAQ23649) has been withdrawn.

darparu. O ran cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad byddem yn disgwyl iddynt ddarparu cyfleusterau cyfieithu addas mewn cyfarfodydd cyhoeddus.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: A yw'r Gweinidog yn cofio'r addewid y byddai coelcerth o gwangos? A yw hynny wedi'i anghofio erbyn hyn? [*Chwerthin.*]

Carwyn Jones: Mae cwangos bellach yn llawer mwy atebol yn ddemocrataidd nag yr oeddent. Bu coelcerth o gwangos mewn sawl ffordd. Mae'n bosibl y bydd angen ailgynnau'r goelcerth yn y dyfodol.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 6 (OAQ23649) yn ôl.

Targedau i Fesur Perfformiad y Llywodraeth Government Performance Measurement Targets

Q7 David Melding: What targets have been set to measure the Welsh Assembly Governments performance in open government? (OAQ23648)

Carwyn Jones: As I said in answer to Owen John Thomas on 6 November 2002, the increase in people's interest and understanding of government will be the measure of our success. It is not easy to set quantifiable and empirical targets for that, but the turnout at the forthcoming elections will be one indicator.

David Melding: Do you agree that when Ministers deny Assembly Members official documents, the matter should be referred to an independent source in order to assure that no abuse of practice is taking place? Do you also agree that the reformed office of an ombudsman would perhaps be suitable to deliver such a service?

Carwyn Jones: I am not aware that any such situation has arisen.

Dafydd Wigley: Oni ddylem gael targed i sicrhau na fydd unrhyw Aelod o'r Cynulliad yn cael ei atal rhag gweld unrhyw ddogfennau oni eithriwyd hwy o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 17.5? Gan fod y Cynulliad yn gorff ymgorfforedig, a wnaiff gadarnhau y caiff yr holl ddogfennau sydd ym meddiant

C7 David Melding: Pa dargedau sydd wedi'u pennu o ran mesur perfformiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru fel llywodraeth agored? (OAQ23648)

Carwyn Jones: Fel y dywedais mewn ateb i Owen John Thomas ar 6 Tachwedd 2002, cynnydd yn niddordeb pobl a'u dealltwriaeth o lywodraeth fydd ffon fesur ein llwyddiant. Nid yw'n hawdd gosod targedau mesuradwy ac empeiraidd ar gyfer hynny, ond bydd nifer y rhai a fydd yn pleidleisio yn yr etholiadau sydd i ddod yn un dangosydd.

David Melding: A gytunwch pan fydd Gweinidogion yn gwrthod rhoi dogfennau swyddogol i Aelodau'r Cynulliad, y dylai'r mater gael ei gyfeirio at ffynhonnell annibynnol er mwyn gwneud yn siŵr nad oes camarfer? A gytunwch hefyd y gallai swydd ddiwygiedig ombwdsmon fod yn addas i ddarparu gwasanaeth o'r fath?

Carwyn Jones: Nid wyf yn ymwybodol bod unrhyw sefyllfa o'r fath wedi codi.

Dafydd Wigley: Should we not have a target of ensuring that no Assembly Member is refused access to any documents unless they are exempt under Standing Order No. 17.5? As the Assembly is a corporate body, will he confirm that all the documents in the possession of Ministers should be treated as

Gweinidogion eu trin fel rhai sydd o dan reolaeth y Cynulliad at ddibenion y Rheolau Sefydlog hynny?

Carwyn Jones: Mae'r Rheolau Sefydlog yn glir ar hyn. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r dogfennau ar gael i Aelodau cyffredin. Fodd bynnag, mae eithriadau lle y mae'n bosibl y caiff dogfennau eu cadw gan y Gweinidog neu lle na ellir eu rhoi i Aelodau cyffredin.

Alun Cairns: In response to David Melding, the Minister said that he was not aware of any Minister hiding behind official procedures in order not to divulge information. Are you aware that the Minister for Economic Development is hiding behind official procedures and the excuse of commercial confidentiality? Factual information, which is already in the public domain and should be presented to the Economic Development Committee, shows that he made a £30 million payment in error to LG.

Carwyn Jones: Our Standing Orders are clear on that point. They are there to advise Members as to what information is available. Some Members may believe that they are being deprived of information. However, that may not be the understanding of everyone else in the Chamber.

ones that are under the control of the Assembly for the purposes of those Standing Orders?

Carwyn Jones: The Standing Orders are clear on this. Most documents are available to ordinary Members. However, there are exceptions where it is possible that documents will be retained by the Minister or where they cannot be given to ordinary Members.

Alun Cairns: Mewn ymateb i David Melding, dywedodd y Gweinidog nad oedd yn ymwybodol o unrhyw Weinidog yn cuddio y tu ôl i weithdrefnau swyddogol er mwyn osgoi rhyddhau gwybodaeth. A ydych yn ymwybodol fod y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd yn cuddio y tu ôl i weithdrefnau swyddogol a'r esgus o gyfrinachedd masnachol? Mae gwybodaeth ffeithiol, sydd eisoes yn nwylo'r cyhoedd, ac a ddylai gael ei chyflwyno i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, yn dangos iddo roi taliad o £30 miliwn i LG ar gam.

Carwyn Jones: Mae'n Rheolau Sefydlog yn glir ar y pwynt hwnnw. Maent yno i gynghori Aelodau ynglŷn â pha wybodaeth sydd ar gael. Efallai fod rhai Aelodau yn credu bod gwybodaeth yn cael ei chelu oddi wrthynt. Fodd bynnag, nid fel yna y gwêl pawb arall hi yn y Siambr.

Cwestiwn Brys Urgent Question

Strwythur ELWa yn y Dyfodol The Future Structure of ELWa

Alun Cairns: Will the Minister make a statement on the future structure of ELWa? (EAQ23911)

Alun Cairns: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar strwythur ELWa yn y dyfodol? (EAQ23911)

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I notified the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee last year that Hugh Rawlings had completed his review of the senior staff structure of the component councils of ELWa. I indicated to the Committee, and to the chairs of the National Council for Education and Training and the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales, that I was minded to accept the recommendations. That had to be subject to

Y Gweinidog Dros addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Hysbysais y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes y llynedd bod Hugh Rawlings wedi cwblhau ei adolygiad o strwythur staff uwch cynghorau cyfansoddol ELWa. Nodais wrth y Pwyllgor, ac wrth gadeiryddion y Cyngor Cenedlaethol dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant a Chyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru ei bod yn fwriad gennyf i dderbyn yr argymhellion. Yr oedd yn rhaid i hynny fod yn amodol ar y ddau

the two councils working out the practical details for the way ahead. It remains important that HEFCW and the national council work together closely. Maintaining a continuum from further education to higher education has vital benefits for access and learning. However, the existing model of a joint secretariat for both councils is not well adapted to current needs. The range and scope of what the Assembly requires of the national council and HEFCW have grown vigorously and substantially since the inception of ELWa. It is essential that the councils are in a position to deliver. Pre-eminently, this means that the existing split responsibility at the most senior level will end. I have agreed with the councils that the full-time chief executive and finance director posts should now be put in place. Existing postholders have a legal right to opt for either council. I understand, although I have not received formal confirmation, that existing postholders will continue to serve the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales. As the employers, the councils will announce the specifics shortly.

gyngor yn trefnu'r manylion ymarferol ar gyfer y ffordd ymlaen. Mae'n parhau yn bwysig bod y cyngor cyllido addysg uwch a'r cyngor cenedlaethol yn cydweithio'n agos. Mae manteision hollbwysig i fynediad a dysgu yn sgîl cynnal continwmm o addysg bellach i addysg uwch. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r model presennol o gyd-ysgrifenyddiaeth ar gyfer y ddau gyngor yn cydweddu'n dda â'r anghenion presennol. Mae ystod a chwmpas yr hyn y mae'r Cynulliad yn ei ofyn gan y cyngor cenedlaethol a'r cyngor cyllido addysg uwch wedi tyfu ar garlam ac yn sylweddol ers sefydlu ELWa. Mae'n hanfodol bod y cynghorau mewn sefyllfa i ddarparu. Yn fwyaf arbennig, golyga hyn y daw'r cyfrifoldeb presennol a rennir ar y lefel uchaf i ben. Cytunais â'r cynghorau y dylid rhoi'r swyddi prif weithredwr a chyfarwyddwr cyllid llawn amser ar waith yn awr. Mae gan ddeiliaid y swyddi presennol yr hawl gyfreithiol i ddewis y naill gyngor neu'r llall. Deallaf, er nad wyf wedi cael cadarnhad ffurfiol, y bydd deiliaid y swyddi presennol yn parhau i wasanaethu Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch yng Nghymru. Fel cyflogwyr, bydd y cynghorau yn cyhoeddi'r manylion yn fuan.

3.00 p.m.

Alun Cairns: ELWa is a £500 million quango that was created two years ago. There were no standing orders and no internal financial rules. There have been £2.2 million in irregular payments and an advance grant of £4 million that contravened Government accounting procedures. Some £1.5 million were transferred from the training budget to pay for redundancies. Four directors have been disciplined; there are suggestions of conflicts of interest in relation to the advance payment of £4 million, and now the need for an extra £3 million to prevent redundancies in April 2003. Is this not a sad indictment of the Minister that her management of ELWa, the biggest quango in Wales, has been wholly inadequate? Is the restructuring of ELWa at this time not awfully convenient, bearing in mind all those scandals for which she accepts no responsibility?

Alun Cairns: Mae ELWa yn gwango £500 miliwn a grëwyd ddwy flynedd yn ôl. Nid oedd ganddo reolau sefydlog na rheolau ariannol mewnol. Gwnaed £2.2 miliwn o daliadau afreolaidd a rhoddwyd grant ymlaen llaw o £4 miliwn a oedd yn groes i weithdrefnau cyfrifo'r Llywodraeth. Trosglwyddwyd rhyw £1.5 miliwn o'r gyllideb hyfforddi i dalu am daliadau colli swyddi. Disgyblwyd pedwar cyfarwyddwr; ceir awgrymiadau o wrthdaro buddiannau mewn perthynas â'r blaendal o £4 miliwn, a'r angen yn awr am £3 miliwn i rwystro colli swyddi ym mis Ebrill 2003. Onid yw hyn yn adlewyrchu'n wael ar y Gweinidog fod ei rheolaeth ar ELWa, y cwango mwyaf yng Nghymru, wedi bod yn gwbl annigonol? Onid yw ailstrwythuro ELWa ar yr adeg hon yn ofnadwy o gyfleus, o gofio'r holl sgandalau nad yw hi'n derbyn cyfrifoldeb o gwbl amdanynt?

Jane Davidson: Being accused of restructuring ELWa 'at this time', as if there

Jane Davidson: Mae cael eich cyhuddo o ailstrwythuro ELWa 'ar yr adeg hon', fel pe

had been no precursor to this proposal, is extraordinary. I remind Members that I addressed this issue in a letter to members of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee in July last year. In that letter, I stated that I would commission Hugh Rawlings to carry out a review. This followed the Committee's review of higher education in Wales, which had demonstrated that Assembly Members were interested in taking a much greater hands-on role in the delivery of the higher education agenda than had been envisaged when the education and training action group for Wales was established.

For that reason, it seemed right to review whether the structure of the ELWa national council and the ELWa HEFWC was appropriate to deliver the huge agenda of post-16 education and training and a huge agenda in the university sector, which was identified by the Committee. That letter was sent to Members in July, and I received no questions relating to it. In November, I gave a full report, which included the text of the Rawlings report identifying the issues, to Committee members, and I told Members 'at that time' that I was minded to accept the report's recommendations; Members did not comment. Is it not interesting that you comment now because you did not use the proper Assembly procedures in Committee? I was committed then to deliver this outcome. However, as I am not the statutory employer of the chief executive or of the finance director of either organisation, it then became a matter for the two councils as to whether they would deliver this agenda.

Mick Bates: We will all welcome the review, if you can then demonstrate a more effective delivery of our agenda. I want to highlight the effectiveness of the delivery so far in terms of ELWa's shortfall in the funding of post-16 education. How will this review improve the effectiveness of the delivery of that fund? On Monday night, I attended a meeting of a governing body at which it projected a £30,000 shortfall in its post-16 funding. If we are to split this responsibility, as the review suggests, we also need

na bai dim awgrym wedi bod o'r bwriad hwn cyn hyn, yn rhyfeddol. Atgoffaf Aelodau fy mod wedi mynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn mewn llythyr at aelodau'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ym mis Gorffennaf y llynedd. Yn y llythyr hwnnw, bu imi ddatgan y byddwn yn comisiynu Hugh Rawlings i gynnal adolygiad. Dilynodd hyn adolygiad y Pwyllgor o addysg uwch yng Nghymru a ddangosodd fod gan Aelodau'r Cynulliad ddiddordeb mewn cymryd rôl fwy uniongyrchol yn y gwaith o gyflawni'r agenda addysg uwch nag a ragwelwyd pan sefydlwyd grŵp gweithredu addysg a hyfforddiant Cymru.

Am y rheswm hwnnw, ymddangosai'n iawn i adolygu a oedd strwythur cyngor cenedlaethol ELWa a chyngor cyllido addysg uwch ELWa yn briodol i gyflawni agenda enfawr addysg a hyfforddiant ôl-16 ac agenda enfawr yn y sector prifysgolion, a ddynodwyd gan y Pwyllgor. Anfonwyd y llythyr hwnnw at Aelodau ym mis Gorffennaf, ac ni dderbyniais unrhyw gwestiynau yn ei gylch. Ym mis Tachwedd, rhoddais adroddiad llawn, a oedd yn cynnwys testun adroddiad Rawlings yn nodi'r materion, i aelodau'r Pwyllgor, a dywedais wrth yr aelodau 'ar yr adeg honno' ei bod yn fwriad gennyf dderbyn argymhellion yr adroddiad; ni wnaeth yr Aelodau unrhyw sylw. Onid yw'n ddiddorol eich bod yn gwneud sylwadau yn awr oherwydd na ddefnyddiasoch weithdrefnau cywir y Cynulliad yn y Pwyllgor? Yr oeddwn yn ymrwymedig bryd hynny i sicrhau'r canlyniad hwn. Fodd bynnag, gan nad fi yw cyflogwr statudol prif weithredwr na chyfarwyddwr cyllid y naill gorff na'r llall, daeth yn fater wedyn i'r ddau gyngor a fyddent yn cyflawni'r agenda hon.

Mick Bates: Byddwn i gyd yn croesawu'r adolygiad, os gallwch ddangos wedyn fod ein hagenda yn cael ei chyflawni yn fwy effeithiol Yr wyf am amlygu effeithiolrwydd y cyflawni hyd yma o ran y diffyg yng nghyllid ELWa i ariannu addysg ôl-16. Sut y bydd yr adolygiad hwn yn gwella effeithiolrwydd cyflawni'r gronfa honno? Nos Lun mynychais gyfarfod o gorff llywodraethwyr lle yr oedd yn rhagweld diffyg o £30,000 yn ei gyllid ar gyfer addysg ôl-16. Os ydym i rannu'r cyfrifoldeb hwn fel

assurances that the shortfall in Wales, which appears to be £10.9 million, will be met through implementing this review.

Jane Davidson: I am happy to comment on ELWa's delivery at both national council and higher education funding council levels. In the two years since ELWa was established, over 25,000 young people have started work-based learning; some 5,380 adults have begun work-based learning; more than 900 started the new modern skills diploma for adults, exceeding the target of 700; training need analyses for businesses was 70 per cent above target, with 1,329 businesses availing of those services, and there were 305 innovation development fund projects. That was in the first year. In the second year, the number of trainees in work-based learning was 14 per cent over target. The number of organisations that gained Investor in People recognition was 10 per cent above the target. The number of companies supported by workforce development was 5 per cent above the target. Learners from the poorest Welsh wards on work-based learning programmes have surpassed their target by 43 per cent, and learners on work-based learning programmes through the medium of Welsh have surpassed their target by 107 per cent. That is what ELWa has delivered. In terms of sixth-form funding for schools, specifically raised today, we are, and will continue to be, in dialogue with the Welsh Local Government Association and ELWa over funding for our schools.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Minister, one major criticism of ELWa has been that a decision was taken—and we do not know where it was taken—over the new body having no shadow period. The recommendations of the original education and training action group for Wales, chaired by Peter Hain, and the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee, ably chaired by my colleague Cynog Dafis, were to secure a shadow period but, for some

yr awgryma'r adolygiad, mae angen sicrwydd arnom hefyd y bydd y diffyg yng Nghymru, sydd yn £10.9 miliwn yn ôl pob golwg, yn cael ei dalu drwy weithredu'r adolygiad hwn.

Jane Davidson: Y mae'n dda gennyf wneud sylw ar gyflawniad ELWa ar lefel y cyngor cenedlaethol a lefel y cyngor cyllido addysg uwch. Yn y ddwy flynedd ers i ELWa gael ei sefydlu, mae dros 25,000 o bobl ifanc wedi dechrau cymryd rhan mewn dysgu sy'n seiliedig ar waith; dechreuodd rhyw 5,380 o oedolion gymryd rhan mewn dysgu sy'n seliedig ar waith; dechreuodd mwy na 900 ar y diploma sgiliau modern newydd i oedolion, gan fynd y tu hwnt i'r targed o 700; yr oedd y dadansoddiadau o anghenion hyfforddi i fusnesau 70 y cant yn uwch na'r targed, gyda 1,329 o fusnesau yn manteisio ar y gwasanaethau hynny, a chafwyd 305 o brosiectau'r gronfa datblygu menter. Digwyddodd hynny yn y flwyddyn gyntaf. Yn yr ail flwyddyn yr oedd nifer yr hyfforddeion a oedd yn cymryd rhan mewn dysgu sy'n seiliedig ar waith 14 y cant yn uwch na'r targed. Yr oedd nifer y sefydliadau a enillodd gydnabyddiaeth Buddsoddwr mewn Pobl 10 y cant yn uwch na'r targed. Yr oedd nifer y cwmnïau a gefnogid gan ddatblygiad gweithlu 5 y cant yn uwch na'r targed. Mae nifer y dysgwyr o'r wardiau tlotaf yng Nghymru sy'n cymryd rhan mewn rhaglenni dysgu sy'n seiliedig ar waith 43 y cant yn uwch na'r targed, ac mae nifer y dysgwyr sy'n cymryd rhan mewn rhaglenni dysgu sy'n seiliedig ar waith drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg 107 y cant yn uwch na'r targed. Dyna beth mae ELWa wedi ei gyflawni. O ran ariannu chweched dosbarth mewn ysgolion, a godwyd yn benodol heddiw, yr ydym yn cynnal trafodaethau gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ac ELWa yn glŷn ag ariannu ein hysgolion a byddwn yn parhau i wneud hynny.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Weinidog, un feirniadaeth fawr ar ELWa oedd bod penderfyniad wedi ei wneud—ac ni wyddom ble y'i gwnaed—a olygai na fu cyfnod cysgodol ar gyfer y corff newydd. Argymhellion grŵp gweithredu addysg a hyfforddiant Cymru, a gadeiriwyd gan Peter Hain, a'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes a gadeiriwyd yn fedrus gan fy nghyd-Aelod Cynog Dafis, oedd sicrhau cyfnod

reason, a contrary decision was taken. Do you accept that that was a big mistake, and that it is one of the main reasons why ELWa has found itself in considerable difficulty over recent months?

Do you also accept that the reason for the difficulties in obtaining information from you is because you have consistently confused your role as an accountable Minister with the role of the National Audit Office and the Audit Committee? Their audit role is entirely separate, as was clarified in the Chamber yesterday. It would have been far better had you been open and transparent about your involvement with ELWa at an earlier date, to ensure that Assembly Members and the public were fully aware of which decisions you took in your capacity as Minister.

Do you accept that the National Audit Office's disclosure, subsequently considered by the Audit Committee, of financial irregularities—and they were irregularities—amounting to more than £2 million, is deeply embarrassing for the biggest quango in Wales? Do you also accept that the NAO's disclosure concerning the payment made to Avanti in relation to the Pop Factory is also deeply embarrassing, because substantial sums of money were clawed back? In relation to that project, do you accept that the information you have given me does not satisfy my request, made in my original question and in my point of order yesterday? The information I asked you to provide was that which ELWa gave you, upon which your submission was based. Do you agree that I should be given that information, and not what you have given me, which does not satisfy that Standing Order?

Minister, there is now no alternative but to split ELWa. Managerially, that seems to be the only sensible way forward. In your answer, I could find neither an acknowledgement that mistakes and errors were made, nor that you, as Minister, were accountable for those mistakes and errors, and that you should apologise accordingly.

cysgodol, ond, am ryw reswm, gwnaed penderfyniad i'r gwrthwyneb. A dderbyniwch fod hynny'n gamgymeriad mawr, ac mai dyna un o'r prif resymau pam mae ELWa wedi wynebu anawsterau dybryd dros y misoedd diwethaf?

A dderbyniwch hefyd mai'r rheswm pam y bu'n anodd cael gwybodaeth gennych yw eich bod yn gyson wedi cymysgu eich rôl fel Gweinidog atebol gyda rôl y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol a'r Pwyllgor Archwilio? Mae eu rolau archwilio yn gwbl ar wahân, fel yr eglurwyd yn y Siambr ddoe. Byddai wedi bod yn llawer gwell petaech wedi bod yn agored a thryloyw ynglŷn â'ch ymwneud ag ELWa ar adeg gynharach i sicrhau bod Aelodau'r Cynulliad a'r cyhoedd yn gwbl ymwybodol o ba benderfyniadau a wnaed gennych yn eich swydd fel Gweinidog.

A dderbyniwch fod datgeliad y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol, a gafodd ei ystyried yn ddiweddarach gan y Pwyllgor Archwilio, o afreoleidd-dra ariannol—ac yr oedd afreoleidd-dra—o fwy na £2 filiwn, yn destun cywilydd mawr i'r cwango mwyaf yng Nghymru? A dderbyniwch hefyd fod datgeliad y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol ynglŷn â'r taliad a wnaed i Avanti mewn cysylltiad â'r Ffatri Bop hefyd yn destun cywilydd mawr, oherwydd bod symiau sylweddol o arian wedi eu hadfachu? Mewn perthynas â'r prosiect hwnnw, a dderbyniwch nad yw'r wybodaeth a roesoch i mi yn bodloni fy nghais, a wnaed yn fy nghwestiwn gwreiddiol ac yn fy mhwynt o drefn ddoe? Y wybodaeth y gofynnais ichi ei darparu oedd yr hyn a roddodd ELWa i chi, y seiliwyd eich cyflwyniad arno. A gytunwch y dylwn fod wedi cael y wybodaeth honno, ac nid yr hyn a roesoch i mi, nad yw'n bodloni'r Rheol Sefydlog honno?

Weinidog, nid oes unrhyw ddewis arall yn awr ond rhannu ELWa. O safbwynt rheoli, ymddengys mai honno yw'r unig ffordd synhwyrol i symud ymlaen. Yn eich ateb ni allwn weld cydnabyddiaeth fod gwallau a chamgymeriadau wedi eu gwneud, nac ychwaith eich bod chi, fel Gweinidog yn atebol am y gwallau a'r camgymeriadau hynny, ac y dylech ymddiheuro yn unol â hynny.

Jane Davidson: Substantial preparatory work was completed before the council came into being on 1 April 2001. That preparatory work on the council started in November 2000, so there was a time between November and April before the council was fully established.

During ELWa's first year, it operated as 'business as usual'. It did not change any decisions of its forerunner organisations and carried out its responsibilities to ensure that business as usual was the watchword. It delivered that successfully.

On your second point, your allegations about openness are extraordinary. Let us look back at my actions in terms of my concerns about ELWa's procurement practices, and my reporting to the Committee. I reported the possible control failures concerning ELWa to the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee on 22 May 2002. The chairman of the national council—ELWa wrote to us in March 2002 saying that she had commissioned an independent review, so that ELWa could give us correct and proper information about whether or not it was concerned. That review reported to the council in early May, following which I reported at the earliest possible opportunity, which was to the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee on 22 May. At that time, I confirmed my intention to press ahead with a review by a senior Assembly official; this would overview what was happening and determine whether or not there was a problem that we needed to address. I wrote to the chairs of both ELWa councils at that time. On 26 June, when Adam Peat had completed his report, I conveyed that to the Committee. In July, I wrote to Committee members advising them that I had commissioned a review of ELWa's senior structure, to be conducted by Hugh Rawlings. I also wrote to the chairs of the ELWa councils at that time, enclosing the terms of the review. In November I reported to the Committee that the Auditor General would be reporting on procurement procedures. I also reported in November that I was minded to accept the Rawlings recommendations.

Jane Davidson: Cwblhawyd gwaith paratoadol sylweddol cyn i'r cyngor ddod i fodolaeth ar 1 Ebrill 2001. Dechreuodd y gwaith paratoadol hwnnw ar y cyngor ym mis Tachwedd 2000, felly yr oedd cyfnod o amser rhwng Tachwedd ac Ebrill cyn i'r cyngor gael ei sefydlu'n llawn.

Yn ystod blwyddyn gyntaf ELWa, gweithredodd fel pe na bai dim wedi newid, hynny yw 'busnes fel arfer'. Ni newidiodd benderfyniadau'r sefydliadau a'i rhagflaenodd a chyflawnodd ei gyfrifoldebau i sicrhau mai busnes fel arfer oedd yr arwyddair. Cyflawnodd hynny'n llwyddiannus.

Ar eich ail bwynt, mae eich cyhuddiadau ynghylch bod yn agored yn anghredadwy. Gadewch inni edrych yn ôl ar fy ngweithredoedd o ran fy mhryder am brosesau caffael ELWa, a'm hadroddiadau i'r Pwyllgor. Soniais am y methiannau rheoli posibl ynglŷn ag ELWa wrth y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ar 22 Mai 2002. Ysgrifennodd cadeirydd y cyngor cenedlaethol—ELWa atom ym mis Mawrth 2002 gan ddweud ei bod wedi comisiynu adolygiad annibynnol, fel y gallai ELWa roi gwybodaeth gywir a phriodol inni ynglŷn â pha un ai a oedd yn pryderu ai peidio. Cyflwynwyd yr adolygiad hwnnw i'r cyngor yn gynnar ym mis Mai, ac yna adroddais innau ar y cyfle cyntaf i'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ar 22 Mai. Ar yr adeg honno, cadarnheais fy mwriad i fwrw ymlaen gydag adolygiad gan uwch swyddog yn y Cynulliad; byddai hynny'n rhoi trosolwg o'r hyn a oedd yn digwydd ac yn penderfynu a oedd problem yr oedd angen inni fynd i'r afael â hi ai peidio. Ysgrifennais at gadeiryddion dau gyngor ELWa bryd hynny. Ar 26 Mehefin, pan gwblhaodd Adam Peat ei adroddiad, hysbysais y Pwyllgor o hynny. Ym mis Gorffennaf, ysgrifennais at aelodau'r Pwyllgor yn eu cynghori fy mod wedi comisiynu adolygiad o strwythur uwch ELWa, a oedd i'w gynnal gan Hugh Rawlings. Hefyd ysgrifennais at gadeiryddion ELWa bryd hynny, gan amgáu telerau'r adolygiad. Ym mis Tachwedd, adroddais i'r Pwyllgor y byddai'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol yn rhoi adroddiad ar y gweithdrefnau caffael. Hefyd adroddais ym

Representatives of the national council appeared before the Committee on 5 December.

mis Tachwedd fy mod yn bwriadu derbyn argymhellion Rawlings. Ymddangosodd cynrychiolwyr y cyngor cenedlaethol gerbron y Pwyllgor ar 5 Rhagfyr.

3.10 p.m.

Therefore, there were many occasions on which Committee members could have questioned me about issues relating to ELWa. There is no point shaking your head, Ieuan. They could have done so. In looking back, I am sure that you are concerned that your Members did not take advantage of those opportunities. They could have taken advantage of the opportunity following my letter to all Committee members on the Rawlings review, when I reported on that review to Committee, or when I reported to the Committee on the Peat report.

Felly, bu sawl achlysur lle y gallai aelodau'r Pwyllgor fod wedi fy holi ynglŷn â materion yn ymwneud ag ELWa. Ofer yw ysgwyd eich pen, Ieuan. Gallent fod wedi gwneud hynny. Wrth edrych yn ôl, yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn pryderu na fanteisiodd eich Aelodau ar y cyfleoedd hynny. Gallent fod wedi manteisio ar y cyfle hwnnw yn dilyn fy llythyr at holl aelodau'r Pwyllgor ar adolygiad Rawlings, pan adroddais ar yr adolygiad hwnnw i'r Pwyllgor, neu pan adroddais i'r Pwyllgor ar adroddiad Peat.

The overall conclusion of the Peat report, as mentioned in the Auditor General's report, spelt out clearly that there were

Daeth adroddiad Peat, fel y soniwyd yn adroddiad yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol, i'r casgliad cyffredinol

'currently no evident weaknesses in the control environment within ELWa'.

nad oes gwendidau amlwg yn yr amgylchedd rheoli o fewn ELWa ar hyn o bryd.

That was as of July. Members must remember that we are discussing action that took place between April 2001 and March 2002. It was important for me to have confidence from a senior Assembly official that there were no problems in terms of the control environment.

Dyna oedd y sefyllfa ym mis Gorffennaf. Rhaid i Aelodau gofio ein bod yn trafod gweithredu a ddigwyddodd rhwng Ebrill 2001 a Mawrth 2002. Yr oedd yn bwysig i mi wybod gan uwch swyddog yn y Cynulliad nad oedd problemau o ran yr amgylchedd rheoli.

Compliance with the control environment is clearly a different issue. We do not know yet what happened in terms of the Pop Factory. You speculate as to what happened, as do other Members, but the council is getting on with its job and is carrying out a proper investigation. When that investigation has been completed, we will know of the concerns and the measures that the council will take to address those concerns. You should ask Plaid Cymru Committee members why they did not question me on these matters over the five-month period during which I reported the issues to Committee.

Mae cydymffurfio â'r amgylchedd rheoli yn amlwg yn fater gwahanol. Nid ydym yn gwybod eto beth ddigwyddodd o ran y Ffatri Bop. Yr ydych yn dyfalu ynghylch yr hyn a ddigwyddodd, fel y gwna Aelodau eraill, ond mae'r cyngor yn bwrw ymlaen â'i waith ac yn cynnal ymchwiliad priodol. Pan gaiff yr ymchwiliad hwnnw ei gwblhau, byddwn yn gwybod am y pryderon a'r camau y bydd y cyngor yn eu cymryd i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau hynny. Dylech ofyn i aelodau Plaid Cymru ar y Pwyllgor pam na wnaethant fy holi ar y materion hyn yn ystod y cyfnod o bum mis pan gyflwynais y materion i'r Pwyllgor.

On your last point, I have fully complied with the requirements of Standing Orders. I would have been happy to give you the brief given

Ar eich pwynt olaf, yr wyf wedi cydymffurfio'n llawn â gofynion y Rheolau Sefydlog. Buaswn wedi bod yn hapus i roi'r

to me when I made my statement. However, Standing Order No. 17.5 (iii) prevents the disclosure of a document that contains

‘information supplied in confidence by, or consists of confidential correspondence with, a person or organisation (including a public authority) which was not under any legal obligation to disclose it and has not consented to its disclosure to Assembly Members other than Ministers’.

That rule applies, as I said in my previous answer to you. Advice to Ministers from officials is covered by that Standing Order. However, in the spirit of openness, I was happy to give that information to you. Therefore, I reject the notion that I have not been open. The same Standing Order applies to the further information that you seek—the information is the responsibility of ELWa, which has not yet consented to its disclosure. I am in discussions with the national council on that. However, that is explicitly covered by the Standing Order. I state that clearly: I have fully complied with Standing Orders, I have always determined to be open with the Assembly and I will continue to do so.

The Presiding Officer: Order. This is an urgent question, not a statement. Several Members have indicated that they wish to ask questions. I appeal for brief questions and answers.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I want to clarify your response to my earlier question about this information. Are you saying that you accept that you have not yet provided all the information that I requested, in my question and in my point of order yesterday, because ELWa has not yet decided to release the submission that it gave to you?

Jane Davidson: You have only just asked for that information, so I need time for proper consultation. ELWa will need to take legal advice on complying with that Standing Order. That is a matter for ELWa. These issues are under independent investigation by

brïff a roddwyd i mi pan wneuthum fy natganiad. Fodd bynnag, mae Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 17.5 (iii) yn rhwystro dogfen sy'n cynnwys y canlynol rhag cael eu datgan

‘gwybodaeth a roddwyd yn gyfrinachol gan berson neu gorff (gan gynnwys awdurdod cyhoeddus), neu sy'n cynnwys gohebiaeth gyfrinachol â hwy, lle nad oedd y person neu'r corff hwnnw wedi cytuno i'w datgelu i Aelodau o'r Cynulliad heblaw Weinidogion’.

Mae'r rheol honno'n berthnasol fel y dywedais yn fy ateb blaenorol i chi. Mae'r Rheol Sefydlog honno yn cwmpasu cyngor i Weinidogion gan swyddogion. Fodd bynnag, wrth geisio bod yn agored, yr oeddwn yn falch o roi'r wybodaeth honno i chi. Felly, gwrthodaf y syniad nad wyf wedi bod yn agored. Mae'r un Rheol Sefydlog yn ymwneud â gwybodaeth bellach a geisiwch—cyfrifoldeb ELWa yw'r wybodaeth, nad yw hyd yn hyn wedi cydsynio i'w datgelu. Yr wyf mewn trafodaethau gyda'r cyngor cenedlaethol ar hynny. Fodd bynnag cwmpesir hynny'n benodol gan y Rheol Sefydlog. Datganaf hynny'n glir. Yr wyf wedi cydymffurfio'n llwyr â'r Rheolau Sefydlog, yr wyf bob amser wedi bod yn benderfynol o fod yn agored gyda'r Cynulliad a byddaf yn parhau i wneud hynny.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Cwestiwn brys yw hwn, nid datganiad. Dangosodd sawl Aelod eu bod yn dymuno gofyn cwestiynau. Apeliad am gwestiynau ac atebion byr.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Yr wyf am gael eglurhad ar eich ymateb i'm cwestiwn cynharach am y wybodaeth hon. Ai dweud yr ydych nad ydych eto wedi rhoi'r holl wybodaeth y gofynnais amdano yn fy nghwestiwn ac yn fy mhwynt o drefn ddoe, gan nad yw ELWa eto wedi penderfynu rhyddhau'r cyflwyniad a roddodd i chi?

Jane Davidson: Yr ydych newydd ofyn am y wybodaeth honno, felly mae angen amser arnaf i ymgynghori'n briodol. Bydd angen i ELWa gymryd cyngor cyfreithiol ar gydymffurfio â'r Rheol Sefydlog honno. Mae hynny'n fater i ELWa. Mae'r materion hyn o

the National Audit Office, in which I have a great deal of confidence.

Karen Sinclair: We are currently awaiting the outcome of ELWa's review of vocational training in terms of agriculture and land-based courses. The Welsh Assembly Government's review proposes to locate two new lead centres for this type of training in north and south Wales. Llysfasi, in my constituency, is eminently well placed to deliver this agenda in north and mid-Wales. However, to date announcements about our proposals have not come through. When can we expect announcements about our plans as they would give a clear lead to land-based further education sectors, which do not currently know—

The Presiding Officer: Order. This is an urgent question on the structure of ELWa. Funding practice decisions do not arise from this question.

Karen Sinclair: ELWa's indecision causes many problems.

The Presiding Officer: That should be pursued with the Minister through other means.

Cynog Dafis: Nodaf awgrym y Gweinidog fod gwaith aelodau'r Pwyllgor a gwaith aelodau Plaid Cymru ar y Pwyllgor wedi bod yn anfodhaol neu'n ddiffygiol gan nad ydym wedi codi'r materion hyn eisoes. A wnaiff gadarnhau nad oedd unrhyw gyfeiriad at gyllido'r Ffatri Bop ac Avanti yn unrhyw un o'i datganiadau i'r Pwyllgor? Ni chofiaf unrhyw gyfeiriad yn cael ei wneud at y mater hwnnw yn y Pwyllgor.

Cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog at fwriad i ystyried arferion cyllidol ELWa yn gynnar ac yr oedd aelodau'r Pwyllgor yn hollol fodlon ei bod yn gwneud hynny. Rhoddodd wybodaeth i ni ynghylch ymchwiliad Hugh Rawlings i strwythur ELWa, ac yr oeddem yn hollol fodlon ar hynny. Pan wnaeth ddatganiad ei bod yn bwriadu gweithredu argymhelliad Hugh Rawlings ynglŷn â rhannu swyddogaeth prif weithredwr y Cyngor

dan ymchwiliad annibynnol gan y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol y mae gennyf hyder mawr ynddi.

Karen Sinclair: Yr ydym ar hyn o bryd yn disgwyl canlyniad adolygiad ELWa o hyfforddiant galwedigaethol o ran cyrsiau amaethyddiaeth a chyrsiau'n ymwneud â'r tir. Mae adolygiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cynnig lleoli dwy ganolfan arweniol ar gyfer y math hwn o hyfforddiant yn y Gogledd a'r De. Mae Llysfasi, yn fy etholaeth i mewn lleoliad gwyh i gyflawni'r agenda hon yn y Gogledd a'r Canolbarth. Fodd bynnag, hyd yma ni chafwyd cyhoeddiadau am ein cynigion. Pryd y gallwn ddisgwyl cael cyhoeddiadau am ein cynlluniau gan y byddent yn rhoi arweiniad pendant i'r sectorau addysg bellach sy'n ymwneud â'r tir nad ydynt yn gwybod ar hyn o bryd—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae hwn yn gwestiwn brys ar strwythur ELWa. Nid yw penderfyniadau arfer ariannu yn codi o'r cwestiwn hwn.

Karen Sinclair: Mae amhendanturwydd ELWa yn achosi llawer o broblemau.

Y Llywydd: Dylid trafod hynny â'r Gweinidog drwy ddulliau eraill.

Cynog Dafis: I note the Minister's suggestion that Committee members' work and the work of Plaid Cymru members on the Committee has been unsatisfactory or deficient given that we have not raised these issues previously. Will she confirm that she made no reference to funding the Pop Factory and Avanti in any of her statements to the Committee? I do not recall any reference being made to that matter in Committee.

The Minister referred to an intention to consider the funding practices of ELWa at an early stage and Committee members were perfectly happy for her to do so. She provided us with information about Hugh Rawlings's investigation into ELWa's structure and we were perfectly happy with that. When she announced that she intended to implement Hugh Rawlings's recommendations regarding separating the

Cenedlaethol oddi wrth y Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch, nododd y Pwyllgor bod hynny'n synhwyrol.

Daeth ELWa o flaen y Pwyllgor i gyflwyno ei adroddiad blynyddol beth amser yn ôl a bydd y Gweinidog yn cofio ein bod wedi holi ELWa'n galed y diwrnod hwnnw a'n bod wedi mynegi cryn anfodlonrwydd ynghylch agweddau ar ei waith. Felly, gobeithiaf na fydd y Gweinidog yn dal at ei hawgrym fod aelodau'r Pwyllgor wedi bod yn euog o unrhyw ddiffyg o ran craffu.

Jane Davidson: You stated that members were entirely happy with what I was doing in Committee and yet all the questions over the past weeks have related to the information that I gave to the Committee over a period of five months. I confirm that I have never made a statement to the Committee about the Pop Factory because that was ELWa's responsibility and it was dealing with that. It only became a matter of concern for us in terms of proper governance and proper delivery of Government accounting rules when we were led to understand that rules set by the Assembly may have been breached.

The important issue for Members is that because good governance and proper procedures are in place, we can be certain of ensuring that organisations comply properly with public accounting rules. I am confident that what I have announced today, in terms of the separation of functions between the chief executive and finance directors of the two organisations, will enable us to deliver a greatly improved service in terms of the two huge education and lifelong learning agendas.

Y Llywydd: Cyn symud ymlaen, rhoddaf ragybudd i Aelodau y bydd y sesiwn gwestiynau nesaf, sef cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog ddydd Mawrth, yn cael ei gofnodi'n ffotograffaid i bwrpas gwybodaeth gyhoeddus ac addysg.

3.20 p.m.

function of the National Council's chief executive from the Higher Education Funding Council, the Committee noted that that was sensible.

ELWa came before the Committee some time ago to present its annual report and the Minister will recall that we questioned ELWa hard on that day and that we expressed considerable dissatisfaction with aspects of its work. Therefore, I hope that the Minister will not persist in suggesting that Committee members have been guilty of a lack of scrutiny.

Jane Davidson: Dywedasoeh fod yr Aelodau yn gwbl fodlon ar yr hyn yr oeddwn yn ei wneud yn y Pwyllgor ac eto mae'r holl gwestiynau dros yr wythnosau diwethaf wedi ymwneud â'r wybodaeth a roddais i'r Pwyllgor dros gyfnod o bum mis. Cadarnhaf na wneuthum ddatganiad erioed i'r Pwyllgor am y Ffatri Bop oherwydd cyfrifoldeb ELWa yw hynny ac yr oedd yn ymdrin â hynny. Daeth yn fater o bryder i ni o ran llywodraethu priodol a chyflawni rheolau cyfrifo'r Llywodraeth yn briodol pan gawsom ein harwain i gredu bod y rheolau a osodwyd gan y Cynulliad o bosibl wedi eu torri.

Y mater pwysig i Aelodau yw gan fod llywodraethu da a gweithdrefnau priodol ar waith, gallwn sicrhau bod cyrff yn cydymffurfio'n briodol â rheolau cyfrifo cyhoeddus. Yr wyf yn hyderus y bydd yr hyn a gyhoeddais heddiw o ran gwahanu swyddogaethau'r prif swyddog a chyfarwyddwyr cyllid y ddau gorff, yn ein galluogi i ddarparu gwasanaeth llawer iawn gwell o ran dwy agenda enfawr addysg a dysgu gydol oes.

The Presiding Officer: Before moving on, I give Members prior notice that the next question session, namely questions to the First Minister on Tuesday, will be recorded photographically for the purposes of public information and education.

**Pwynt o Drefn
Point of Order**

Janet Ryder: I raise a point of order to allow me to correct something that I could not possibly allow to stand on the record. Alun Pugh asserted that Newcastle Brown Ale was my local drink. I come from Sunderland, which had a much more famous brewery in Vaux. I would like that corrected: Vaux is the drink from Sunderland.

Janet Ryder: Codaf bwynt o drefn i ganiatáu imi gywiro rhywbeth na allwn byth ganiatáu iddo gael ei gofnodi. Haerodd Alun Pugh mai cwrw Newcastle Brown oedd fy nghwrw lleol. Yr wyf yn hannu o Sunderland, a oedd â bragdy llawer enwocach yn Vaux. Hoffwn i hynny gael ei gywiro: Vaux yw'r ddiod o Sunderland.

**Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion
Composite Motion: Approval of Orders**

Y Llywydd: O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

The Presiding Officer: Under Standing Order No. 22.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

Y Trefnydd (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiaf fod

The Business Minister (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 22.25,

1a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Mawrth 2003, ac sydd heb nodi unrhyw faterion sy'n destun pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft Gorchymyn y Cwricwlwm Sylfaenol ar gyfer Cymru (Diwygio) 2003; ac

1a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 11 March 2003, which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Basic Curriculum For Wales (Amendment) Order 2003; and

b) yn cymeradwyo Gorchymyn y Cwricwlwm Sylfaenol ar gyfer Cymru (Diwygio) 2003 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 25 Chwefror 2003;

b) approves the Basic Curriculum For Wales (Amendment) Order 2003, laid in the Table Office on 25 February 2003;

2a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Mawrth 2003, ac sydd heb nodi unrhyw faterion sy'n destun pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Cyllid Cyfalaf) (Cyfradd y Disgownt ar gyfer 2003-04) (Cymru) 2003; ac

2a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 18 March 2003, which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Local Authorities (Capital Finance) (Rate of Discount of 2003-04) (Wales) Regulations 2003; and

b) yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Cyllid Cyfalaf) (Cyfradd y Disgownt ar gyfer 2003-04) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Mawrth 2003;

b) approves the Local Authorities (Capital Finance) (Rate of Discount of 2003-04) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 11 March 2003;

3a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Mawrth 2003, ac sydd heb nodi unrhyw faterion sy'n destun pryder yn y Gorchymyn

3a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 18 March 2003, which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the

- drafft Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Cyllid Cyfalaf) (Diwygio) (Cymru), 2003 ac* *Local Authorities (Capital Finance) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003, and*
- b) yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Cyllid Cyfalaf) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Mawrth 2003;* *b) approves the Local Authorities (Capital Finance) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 11 March 2003;*
- 4a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Mawrth 2003, ac sydd heb nodi unrhyw faterion sy'n destun pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft Gorchymyn Adnabod a Symud Defaid a Geifr (Mesurau Dros Dro) (Cymru) (Rhif 2) (Diwygio) (Rhif 2) 2003; ac* *4a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 18 March 2003, which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Sheep and Goats Identification and Movement (Interim Measures) (Wales) (No. 2) (Amendment) (No. 2) Order 2003; and*
- b) yn cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Adnabod a Symud Defaid a Geifr (Mesurau Dros Dro) (Cymru) (Rhif 2) (Diwygio) (Rhif 2) 2003 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Mawrth 2003. (NDM1425)* *b) approves the Sheep and Goats Identification and Movement (Interim Measures) (Wales) (No. 2) (Amendment) (No. 2) Order 2003, laid in the Table Office on 11 March 2003. (NDM1425)*

*Cynnig (NDM1425): O blaid 40, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1425): For 40, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gibbons, Brian
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet

Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Kirsty
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Lwfansau i Aelodau Cynghorau
 Cymuned) (Cymru) 2003
 Approval of the Local Authorities (Allowances for Members of Community Councils)
 (Wales) Regulations 2003**

The Finance Minister (Edwina Hart): I propose that

the National Assembly considers the principle of the Local Authorities (Allowances for Members of Community Councils) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 13 March 2003. (NDM1426)

I propose that

the National Assembly:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 18 March 2003, which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the Local Authorities (Allowances for Members of Community Councils) (Wales) Regulations 2003; and

2. approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 13 March 2003. (NDM1427)

Janet Ryder: I declare an interest as a member of a town community council. I do not know of any community council that pays attendance allowances at present. Membership of a community council is still viewed as a service to the community. That may well change following the review into the scope and duties of town and community councils, but at present, it is for individual town and community councils to decide, and it will be their decision as to what level, if any, of attendance allowance to set.

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Edwina Hart): Cynigiaf fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Lwfansau i Aelodau Cynghorau Cymuned) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Mawrth 2003. (NDM1426)

Cynigiaf fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Mawrth 2003, nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5 mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Lwfansau i Aelodau Cynghorau Cymuned) (Cymru) 2003; ac

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Mawrth 2003. (NDM1427)

Janet Ryder: Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o gyngor cymuned tref. Ni wn am unrhyw gyngor cymuned sy'n talu lwfans mynychu cyfarfodydd ar hyn o bryd. Ystyrir aelodaeth cyngor cymuned yn wasanaeth i'r gymuned o hyd. Gall hynny newid o bosibl yn dilyn yr adolygiad o gwmpas a dyletswyddau cynghorau tref a chymuned, ond ar hyn o bryd, penderfyniad y cynghorau tref a chymuned yw hyn, a hwy fydd yn penderfynu ar ba lefel y dylid pennu'r lwfans mynychu cyfarfodydd, os o gwbl. Fodd

However, we must consider recompensing members for travel to conferences and for training. If we hope to encourage more members to take up training, the Minister must consider that element in future.

Eleanor Burnham: The Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome this motion. We are committed to the principle of devolved government and of devolving power to its lowest and most accessible level. In essence, this motion should encourage people from all walks of life to become community councillors, particularly those who are already in work but cannot afford to suffer a loss of earnings. Hopefully, it will lead to more effective local government and local democracy, and encourage more people to vote in local elections. It should also encourage more people to stand as candidates to represent their local communities. When do you expect the study into community councils to be completed, and do you accept that they are underutilised at present? Do you agree that they should have a more substantive role?

The Finance Minister (Edwina Hart): I will respond to the relevant points. I take Janet's point about training courses on board. My community council review is not relevant to these regulations.

Peter Law: Point of order. I declare an interest. I am the presiding officer of the Wales local councils association. It is non-remunerated, but I declare an interest.

The Presiding Officer: And what a fine presiding officer role that is.

bynag, rhaid inni ystyried ad-dalu aelodau am deithio i gynadleddau ac i gael hyfforddiant. Os ydym yn gobeithio annog mwy o aelodau i ymgymryd â hyfforddiant, rhaid i'r Gweinidog ystyried yr elfen honno yn y dyfodol.

Eleanor Burnham: Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn croesawu'r cynnig hwn. Yr ydym wedi ymrwmo i egwyddor llywodraeth ddatganoledig ac i ddatganoli grym i'w lefel isaf a mwyaf hygyrch. Yn ei hanfod, dylai'r cynnig hwn annog pobl o bob galwedigaeth i ddod yn gynghorwyr cymuned, yn arbennig y rhai hynny sydd yn gweithio'n barod ond na allant fforddio colli cyflog. Bydd yn arwain at lywodraeth leol a democratiaeth leol fwy effeithiol, gobeithio, ac yn annog mwy o bobl i bleidleisio mewn etholiadau lleol. Dylai hefyd annog mwy o bobl i sefyll fel ymgeiswyr i gynrychioli eu cymunedau lleol. Pryd y disgwyliwch i'r astudiaeth i gynghorau cymuned gael ei chwblhau, ac a dderbyniwch na chânt eu defnyddio'n ddigonol ar hyn o bryd? A gytunwch y dylent gael rôl fwy sylweddol?

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Edwina Hart): Byddaf yn ymateb i'r pwyntiau perthnasol. Derbyniaf bwynt Janet am gyrsiau hyfforddi. Nid yw fy adolygiad o gynghorau cymuned yn berthnasol i'r rheoliadau hyn.

Peter Law: Pwynt o drefn. Datganaf fuddiant. Fi yw llywydd cymdeithas cynghorau lleol Cymru. Nid yw'n swydd â thâl, ond datganaf fuddiant.

Y Llywydd: A dyna rôl lywyddol ardderchog yw honno.

*Cynnig (NDM1426): O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1426): For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane

Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gibbons, Brian
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1427): O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1427): For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gibbons, Brian
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina

Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Gwasanaethau Maethu (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2003
 Approval of the Fostering Services (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2003**

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): I propose that

the National Assembly considers the principle of the Fostering Services (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 11 March 2003. (NDM1428)

I propose that

the National Assembly

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 18 March 2003, which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the Fostering Services (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2003; and

2. approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 11 March 2003. (NDM1429)

Y Llywydd: Nid oes siaradwyr, felly symudwn yn syth at bleidlais.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Cynigiaf fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Gwasanaethau Maethu (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Mawrth 2003. (NDM1428)

Cynigiaf fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Mawrth 2003, nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5 mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Gwasanaethau Maethu (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2003;

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Mawrth 2003. (NDM1429)

The Presiding Officer: There are no speakers, therefore we will move immediately to a vote.

*Cynnig (NDM1428): O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1428): For 42, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gibbons, Brian
Gwyther, Christine
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1429): O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1429): For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog

Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Edwards, Richard
 Essex, Sue
 Evans, Delyth
 German, Michael
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hancock, Brian
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol 2001 (Cychwyn Rhif 5) (Cymru) 2003, Rheoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Llety Preswyl) (Taliadau Ychwanegol, Cyfraniadau Perthnasol ac Asesu Adnoddau) (Cymru) 2003, a Rheoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Llety Preswyl) (Diystyru Adnoddau) (Cymru) 2003
Approval of the Health and Social Care Act 2001 (Commencement No. 5) (Wales) Order 2003, the National Assistance (Residential Accommodation) (Additional Payments, Relevant Contributions and Assessment of Resources) (Wales) Regulations 2003, and the National Assistance (Residential Accommodation) (Disregarding of Resources) (Wales) Regulations 2003

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): I propose that

the National Assembly considers the principle of the Health and Social Care Act 2001 (Commencement No. 5) (Wales) Order 2003, laid in the Table Office on 4 March 2003. (NDM1430)

I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Cynigiaf fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Deddf Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol 2001 (Cychwyn Rhif 5) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Mawrth 2003. (NDM1430)

Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly

1. *considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 18 March 2003, which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the Health and Social Care Act 2001 (Commencement No 5) (Wales) Order 2003; and*

2. *approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 4 March 2003. (NDM1431)*

I propose that

the National Assembly considers the principle of the National Assistance (Residential Accommodation) (Additional Payments, Relevant Contributions and Assessment of Resources) (Wales) Regulations 2003 laid in the Table Office on 4 March 2003. (NDM1432)

I propose that

the National Assembly

1. *considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 18 March 2003, which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No.11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the National Assistance (Residential Accommodation) (Additional Payments, Relevant Contributions and Assessment of Resources) (Wales) Regulations 2003; and*

2. *approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft and the regulatory appraisal, both laid in the Table Office on 4 March 2003, and the memorandum of corrections laid in Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 19 March 2003. (NDM1433)*

I propose that

the National Assembly considers the principle of the National Assistance (Residential Accommodation) (Disregarding of Resources) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol

1. *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Mawrth 2003, nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5 mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft Gorchymyn Deddf Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol 2001 (Cychwyn Rhif 5) (Cymru) 2003; ac*

2. *yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Mawrth 2003. (NDM1431)*

Cynigiau fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Llety Preswyl) (Taliadau Ychwanegol, Cyfraniadau Perthnasol ac Asesu Adnoddau) (Cymru) 2003 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Mawrth 2003. (NDM1432)

Cynigiau fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol

1. *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Mawrth 2003, nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5 mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Llety Preswyl) (Taliadau Ychwanegol, Cyfraniadau Perthnasol ac Asesu Adnoddau) (Cymru) 2003; ac*

2. *yn cymeradwyo gwneud y Gorchymyn yn unol â'r drafft a'r Arfarniad Rheoliadol, y gosodwyd copi o'r ddau ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Mawrth 2003 a'r memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 19 Mawrth 2003. (NDM1433)*

Cynigiau fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Llety Preswyl) (Diystyru Adnoddau) (Cymru) 2003 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa

in the Table Office on 4 March 2003. (NDM1434) *Gyflwyno ar 4 Mawrth 2003. (NDM1434)*

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 18 March 2003, which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the National Assistance (Residential Accommodation) (Disregarding of Resources) (Wales) Regulations 2003; and

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Mawrth 2003, nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5 mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Llety Preswyl) (Diystyru Adnoddau) (Cymru) 2003; ac

2. approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft and the regulatory appraisal, both laid in the Table Office on 4 March 2003. (NDM1435)

2. yn cymeradwyo gwneud y Gorchymyn yn unol â'r drafft a'r arfarniad rheoliadol, y gosodwyd copi o'r ddau ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Mawrth 2003. (NDM1435)

I would like to speak on the National Assistance (Assessment of Resources) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003 to which there is a Plaid Cymru amendment. Jocelyn Davies, Dai Lloyd and Geraint Davies have tabled an amendment that proposes raising the upper capital limit by a further £5,000, an increase of 32 per cent on the current limit. I cannot support this amendment. That change would not exempt any more people from paying towards their care than the regulations that I have tabled.

Hoffwn siarad am Reoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Asesu Adnoddau) (Gwelliant) (Cymru) 2003 y mae Plaid Cymru yn cynnig gwelliant iddynt. Mae Jocelyn Davies, Dai Lloyd a Geraint Davies wedi cyflwyno gwelliant sy'n argymhell codi'r terfyn cyfalaf uchaf £5,000 arall, cynnydd o 32 y cant ar y terfyn presennol. Ni allaf gefnogi'r gwelliant hwn. Ni fyddai'r newid hwnnw yn eithrio mwy o bobl rhag talu tuag at eu gofal na'r rheoliadau a gyflwynais.

The Presiding Officer: Order. My understanding is that we are taking NDM1430, NDM1431, NDM1432, NDM1433, NDM1434 and NDM1435 together. The motion to which you refer, for which an amendment has been tabled, will be taken separately.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Fy nealltwriaeth i yw ein bod yn cymryd NDM1430, NDM1431, NDM1432, NDM1433, NDM1434 a NDM1435 gyda'i gilydd. Caiff y cynnig y cyfeiriwch ato, y cyflwynwyd gwelliant ar ei gyfer, ei gymryd ar wahân.

Gan nad oes unrhyw un am siarad ar y cynigion hyn, galwaf bleidlais.

Given that no-one wishes to speak on these motions, I call for a vote.

*Cynnig (NDM1430): O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1430): For 44, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary

Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gibbons, Brian
Gwyther, Christine
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1431): O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1431): For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth

German, Michael
Griffiths, John
Gibbons, Brian
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion carried.

Cynnig (NDM1432): O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM1432): For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gibbons, Brian
Gwyther, Christine
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Law, Peter

Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion carried.

Cynnig (NDM1433): O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM1433): For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gibbons, Brian
Gwyther, Christine
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1434): O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1434): For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gibbons, Brian
Gwyther, Christine
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1435): O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1435): For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gibbons, Brian
Gwyther, Christine
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion carried.

3.30 p.m.

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Symiau at Anghenion Personol)
(Cymru) 2003**
**Approval of the National Assistance (Sums for Personal Requirement) (Wales)
Regulations 2003**

The Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 to NDM1437 in the names of Jonathan Morgan, David Melding and Alun Cairns.
Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 i NDM1437 yn enwau Jonathan Morgan, David Melding ac Alun Cairns.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): I propose that
Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly considers the principle of the National Assistance (Sums for Personal Requirement) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 11 March 2003. (NDM1436)

I propose that

the National Assembly

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 18 March 2003, which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the National Assistance (Sums for Personal Requirement) (Wales) Regulations 2003, and

2. approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 11 March 2003. (NDM1437)

David Melding: I propose the following amendment in my name and the names of Jonathan Morgan and Alun Cairns. Amendment 1: in regulation 2 delete ‘£17.80’ and insert ‘£20.00’.

I will outline why we have tabled an amendment to increase the personal allowance from the proposed £17.80 to £20. All the parties here want to look at the funding of personal care. The Labour Party, the Liberal Democrats and Plaid Cymru have called for free personal care: we are calling for an inquiry by the Health and Social Services Committee. However, there is no doubt that, were we to raise the level of allowances and look at the rules and regulations that apply to various charging policies, we could go a long way towards exempting people from paying for personal care, especially those whose income is well below average. Although that is often the case, such people must still pay various charges. In this case, we are considering people in residential care. At present, the disregarded sum is £16.80. All personal expenditure in the week—on gifts, stationery, haircuts and so on—must come from that sum. The Minister proposes an increase of £1, which is considerably above inflation, and I welcome that. However, we should set

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Symiau at Anghenion Personol) (Cymru) 2003 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Mawrth 2003. (NDM1436)

Cynigiau fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Mawrth 2003, nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5 mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Symiau at Anghenion Personol) (Cymru) ac

2. yn cymeradwyo gwneud y Gorchymyn yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Mawrth 2003. (NDM1437)

David Melding: Cynigiau y gwelliant canlynol yn fy enw i, Jonathan Morgan ac Alun Cairns. Gwelliant 1: yn rheoliad 2, dileu ‘£17.80’ ac yn ei le rhoi ‘£20.00’.

Amlinellaf pam ein bod wedi cyflwyno gwelliant i gynyddu'r lwfans personol o'r £17.80 a gynigir i £20. Mae'r holl bleidiau yma am ystyried ariannu gofal personol. Galwodd y Blaid Lafur, y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a Phlaid Cymru am ofal personol am ddim: yr ydym yn galw am ymchwiliad gan y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Fodd bynnag, nid oes amheuaeth, pe baem yn codi lefel y lwfansau ac edrych ar y rheolau a'r rheoliadau sy'n berthnasol i bolisiau codi tâl amrywiol, y gallem gyflawni llawer o ran eithrio pobl rhag talu am ofal personol, yn enwedig y rheini y mae eu hincwm yn is o lawer na'r cyffredin. Er bod hynny yn aml yn wir, rhaid i bobl o'r fath dalu taliadau amrywiol o hyd. Yn yr achos hwn, yr ydym yn ystyried pobl mewn gofal preswyl. Ar hyn o bryd, y swm a anwybyddir yw £16.80. Rhaid i holl wariant personol yr wythnos—ar roddion, deunyddiau papur, torri gwallt ac ati—ddod o'r swm hwnnw. Cynigiau'r Gweinidog gynnydd o £1, sy'n sylweddol uwch na chwyddiant, a chroesawaf hynny.

this allowance at a reasonable level. Setting it at £20 should be a first step. We should then look to raise it further, but given the amount of expenditure that would be required, I propose £20 initially. That would be a good start, though it would not finish the job. I call on the other parties to honour the commitments they have made in this regard and vote for our amendment.

Kirsty Williams: David is right that we need a wholesale review of these charges. The majority of Members accept the principle of free personal care as outlined by the Royal Commission on Long Term Care for the Elderly. I am heartened because I know that many organisations representing the needs and views of older people acknowledge that, in accepting that principle, this Government has gone a long way. We do not have the powers of the Scottish Parliament, but David Melding is right: we cannot use that as an excuse to not move this agenda forward. We have power over these allowances, which gives us an opportunity to alleviate the cost of care for many people, who, as David said, are currently paying these costs out of limited resources.

I am glad that David acknowledged that the increase proposed today is well above inflation. I understand that, for the first time, we are breaking the link with England. Until now, we have always gone in train with England and our allowances have always been the same as in England. My understanding is that this allowance is more generous than those in England and Scotland. For the first time, the Assembly has decided to break that link and act independently in a way that recognises the needs of older people in Wales.

David is right to challenge us. I welcome the chance to debate the Liberal Democrats' proposals in this regard with David over the coming weeks. It is incumbent upon us to consider our personal stances. The Liberal Democrats' proposals go much further than this proposal and I welcome the opportunity to debate them with David over the coming weeks, and, hopefully, to take action when the Assembly returns on 2 May.

Fodd bynnag, dylem bennu'r lwfans hwn ar lefel resymol. Fel cam cyntaf, dylid ei bennu ar £20. Yna dylem ystyried ei godi ymhellach, ond o gofio swm y gwariant y byddai ei angen, cynigïaf £20 i gychwyn. Byddai hynny'n ddechrau da, er na fyddai'n dod â'r gwaith i ben. Galwaf ar y pleidiau eraill i anrhydeddu'r ymrwymïadau a wnaethant yn hyn o beth a phleidleisio dros ein gwelliant.

Kirsty Williams: Mae David yn iawn i ddweud bod angen inni adolygu'r taliadau hyn yn eu cyfanrwydd. Mae mwyafrif yr Aelodau yn derbyn yr egwyddor o ofal personol am ddim fel yr amlinellwyd gan y Comisiwn Brenhinol ar Ofal Hirdymor i'r Henoed. Mae'n codi fy nghalon gan fy mod yn gwybod bod llawer o sefydliadau sy'n cynrychioli anghenion a safbwyntïau pobl hÿn yn cydnabod bod y Llywodraeth hon, wrth dderbyn yr egwyddor honno, wedi cyflawni llawer. Nid oes gennym bwerau Senedd yr Alban, ond mae David Melding yn iawn: ni allwn ddefnyddio hynny fel esgus i beidio â datblygu'r agenda hon. Mae gennym bŵer dros y lwfansau hyn, sy'n rhoi cyfle inni leddfu cost gofal i lawer o bobl, sydd, fel y dywedodd David, yn defnyddio adnoddau cyfyngedig i dalu'r costau hyn ar hyn o bryd.

Yr wyf yn falch i David gydnabod bod y cynnydd a gynigir heddiw yn uwch o lawer na chwyddiant. Deallaf ein bod, am y tro cyntaf, yn torri'r cyswllt â Lloegr. Hyd yn hyn, yr ydym wastad wedi dilyn Lloegr a bu ein lwfansau yr un peth â rhai Lloegr erioed. Fel y deallaf, mae'r lwfans hwn yn fwy hael na'r rhai yn Lloegr a'r Alban. Am y tro cyntaf, mae'r Cynulliad wedi penderfynu torri'r cyswllt hwnnw a gweithredu'n annibynnol mewn ffordd sy'n cydnabod anghenion pobl hÿn yng Nghymru.

Mae David yn iawn i'n herio. Croesawaf y cyfle i drafod cynigion y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn hyn o beth gyda David dros yr wythnosau nesaf. Mae'n ddyletswydd arnom i ystyried ein safïadau personol. Â cynigion y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ymhellach o lawer na'r cynnig hwn a chroesawaf y cyfle i'w trafod gyda David dros yr wythnosau nesaf, a, gobeithio, i weithredu arnynt pan fydd y Cynulliad yn

dychwelyd ar 2 Mai.

David Lloyd: Plaid Cymru will support the amendment. It is a modest increase in personal allowance—effectively an increase in pocket money—from £17.80 to £20 a week for elderly people in residential care. Allowing £20 a week for personal requirements, seems to me reasonable in twenty-first century Wales. Within our powers—the backdrop to this is the vote on free personal care for the elderly—

David Lloyd: Bydd Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi'r gwelliant. Mae'n gynydd cymedrol yn y lwfans personol—cynydd mewn arian poced yn y bôn—o £17.80 i £20 yr wythnos i bobl oedrannus mewn gofal preswyl. Ymddengys i mi fod caniatáu £20 yr wythnos ar gyfer gofynion personol yn rhesymol yng Nghymru'r unfed ganrif ar hugain. O fewn ein pwerau—y cefndir i hyn yw'r bleidlais ar ofal personol am ddim i'r henoed—

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: On Kirsty Williams's comments, is it not strange that the Liberal Democrats say that they propose to go further than the amendment and yet they are not prepared to vote for it? If you were discussing this with rational people, you would expect them to vote for it, would you not?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: O ran sylwadau Kirsty Williams, onid yw'n rhyfedd bod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn dweud eu bod yn bwriadu mynd ymhellach na'r gwelliant ac eto nid ydynt yn barod i bleidleisio drosto? Pe baech yn trafod hyn gyda phobl resymol, byddech yn disgwyl iddynt bleidleisio drosto, oni fyddech?

David Lloyd: I am grateful for that intervention, which was enlightening, as always. We look forward to contributions from the Liberal Democrats in various hustings over the coming weeks. To cut to the chase—

David Lloyd: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am yr ymyriad hwnnw, a oedd yn oleuedig, fel arfer. Edrychwn ymlaen at gyfraniadau gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ar lwyfannau etholiad yn ystod yr wythnosau i ddod. I droi at y pwnc dan sylw—

Glyn Davies: Do you share my surprise that Rhodri Glyn Thomas was surprised that the Liberal Democrats should say two confusing things at the same time?

Glyn Davies: A rannwch fy syndod bod Rhodri Glyn Thomas wedi synnu bod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn dweud dau beth dryslyd yr un pryd?

David Lloyd: That was a well-made point and I am sure that Rhodri Glyn has heard your comments and is suitably chastened. This is a modest increase. The cost benefit analysis shows that the increase would cost £1.8 million. This is about how we value our elderly people. I ask Members to vote in favour of the amendment.

David Lloyd: Yr oedd hwnnw'n bwynt da ac yr wyf yn siŵr bod Rhodri Glyn wedi clywed eich sylwadau ac wedi ei geryddu'n briodol. Mae hynny'n gynydd cymedrol. Dengys y dadansoddiad budd cost y byddai'r cynnydd yn costio £1.8 miliwn. Mae a wnelo hyn â'r modd y gwerthfawrogwn ein pobl oedrannus. Gofynnaf i'r Aelodau bleidleisio o blaid y gwelliant.

David Davies: Presiding Officer, with your great political experience, you must be aware that it is the oldest rule in the political book to say that you will vote against a proposal because you want something better. The Liberal Democrats have done that today. They have the opportunity to join members of the Conservative Party and of Plaid Cymru to effect a real improvement in the quality of care for old people. The choice is theirs: vote

David Davies: Lywydd, gyda'ch profiad gwleidyddol helaeth, rhaid eich bod yn gwybod mai'r rheol hynaf mewn gwleidyddiaeth yw dweud y byddwch yn pleidleisio yn erbyn cynnig am eich bod am gael rhywbeth gwell. Gwnaeth y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol hynny heddiw. Mae'r cyfle ganddynt i ymuno ag aelodau'r Blaid Geidwadol ac aelodau Plaid Cymru i gyflawni gwelliant gwirioneddol yn ansawdd

with us now and take that opportunity today.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): Electioneering was inevitable. I did not expect that we would get through the afternoon without it, and we have not. The Conservatives' amendment proposes that the allowance be increased to £20 per week, which is an increase of 19 per cent on the current year's allowance. No more people would benefit under the amendment's proposals than would benefit under the regulations that I have tabled, although it would mean that those who benefit would be better off. However, 19 per cent far exceeds what is allowed in the Assembly's budget for local government cost increases, and the £1.8 million additional cost would have to be found from other approved Assembly budgets to compensate local government. The regulations that I am proposing would increase the personal requirement allowance for 2003-04 by £1, from £16.80 to £17.80 a week. That is an increase of nearly 6 per cent, as David Melding has acknowledged, and is around one and a half times the rise in average earnings. That is a great step forward. This increase begins to mark out a different path for Wales, and is higher than the increase proposed in England. For the first time, as Kirsty said, the link with the allowance set by the Department for Work and Pensions will be broken. I commend these regulations to Members and will not support the amendment.

y gofal i hen bobl. Eu dewis hwy ydyw: pleidleisiwch gyda ni yn awr a manteisiwch ar y cyfle hwnnw heddiw.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Yr oedd ymgyrchu'n anochel. Ni ddisgwyliais y byddem yn cyrraedd diwedd y prynhawn hebdo, ac nid ydym wedi gwneud hynny. Mae gwelliant y Ceidwadwyr yn cynnig cynyddu'r lwfans i £20 yr wythnos, sef cynnydd o 19 y cant ar lwfans y flwyddyn gyfredol. Ni fyddai mwy o bobl yn elwa o dan gynigion y gwelliant nag a fyddai'n elwa o dan y rheoliadau a gyflwynais i, er y byddai'n golygu y byddai'r rheini sydd yn elwa yn well eu byd. Fodd bynnag, mae 19 y cant yn well o lawer na'r hyn a ganiatawyd yng nghyllideb y Cynulliad ar gyfer cynnydd yng nghostau llywodraeth leol, a byddai'r gost ychwanegol o £1.8 miliwn yn gorfod dod o gyllidebau cymeradwy eraill y Cynulliad i ddigolledu llywodraeth leol. Byddai'r rheoliadau a gynigaf yn cynyddu'r lwfans personol ar gyfer 2003-04 o £16.80 i £17.80 yr wythnos, sef cynnydd o £1. Mae hynny'n gynnydd o bron i 6 y cant, fel y mae David Melding wedi cydnabod, ac mae tua un waith a hanner y cynnydd mewn enillion cyfartalog. Mae hynny'n gam mawr iawn ymlaen. Mae'r cynnydd hwn yn dechrau nodi llwybr gwahanol i Gymru, ac mae'n uwch na'r cynnydd a gynigir yn Lloegr. Am y tro cyntaf, fel y dywedodd Kirsty, caiff y cyswllt â'r lwfans a bennir gan yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau ei dorri. Cymeradwyaf y rheoliadau hyn i'r Aelodau ac ni chefnogaf y gwelliant.

3.40 p.m.

Cynnig (NDM1436): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM1436): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew

Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Edwards, Richard
 Essex, Sue
 Evans, Delyth
 German, Michael
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hancock, Brian
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, David Ian
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Kirsty
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 17, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 32.
Amendment 1: For 17, Abstain 0, Against 32.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Cairns, Alun
 Dafis, Cynog
 Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Hancock, Brian
 Jones, David Ian
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Edwards, Richard
 Essex, Sue
 Evans, Delyth
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Halford, Alison
 Hart, Edwina

Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.*

*Cynnig (NDM1437): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1437): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gibbons, Brian
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, David Ian
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet

Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

**Rheoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Asesu Adnoddau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003
The National Assistance (Assessment of Resources) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations
2003**

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): I propose that **Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly considers the principle of the National Assistance (Assessment of Resources) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 13 March 2003. (NDM1438) *y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Asesu Adnoddau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Mawrth 2003. (NDM1438)*

Y Llywydd: Nid oes siaradwyr, felly symudwn at bleidlais. **The Presiding Officer:** There are no speakers, therefore we will move to a vote.

*Cynnig (NDM1438): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1438): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gibbons, Brian
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, David Ian

Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Kirsty
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Asesu Adnoddau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003
 Approval of the National Assistance (Assessment of Resources) (Amendment) (Wales)
 Regulations 2003**

The Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 in the names of Jocelyn Davies, David Lloyd and Geraint Davies.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enwau Jocelyn Davies, David Lloyd a Geraint Davies.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 18 March 2003, which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the National Assistance (Assessment of Resources) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003; and

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Mawrth 2003, nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5, mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Asesu Adnoddau) (Diwygio) (Cymru)2003; ac

2. approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 13 March 2003 and the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 19 March 2003. (NDM1439)

2. yn cymeradwyo gwneud y Gorchymyn yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Mawrth 2003 a'r Memorandwm Cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd at yr Aelodau drwy'r e-bost ar 19 Mawrth 2003. (NDM1439)

David Lloyd: I propose the following amendment in my name and the names of Jocelyn Davies and Geraint Davies. Amendment 1: in regulation 2(3) delete '£20,000' and insert '£25,000'.

Our amendment proposes to delete the £20,000 capital line and replace it with a £25,000 capital line. This is an annual debate; Members will recall that a similar debate was held this time last year. It follows on from the debate on personal allowances, and also tries to address the issue of free personal care for the elderly within the confines of the Assembly's powers. It is distressing when elderly people must sell their homes to fund their long-term residential and nursing care.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Are we expecting another principled move by the Liberal Democrats? Will they go further and vote against the amendment this time?

David Lloyd: As always, I am pleased to receive an intervention from Rhodri Glyn. We await events.

Evidence presented to the Royal Commission on Long Term Care for the Elderly showed that the current system demands that people of modest means make themselves poor before they are entitled to assistance from local authorities. Increasing the public subsidy by means of our amendment will give greater assistance to people in a complex and inconsistent system. Furthermore, research conducted by the Joseph Rowntree Foundation has shown that, in many cases, authorities do not monitor an individual's assets, so that many people may continue to be charged the full cost of care when they are entitled to some state help.

The National Assembly can further demonstrate its commitment to people in residential care today by adopting the Plaid Cymru recommendation. The capital limits are relatively low; even the sum proposed in our amendment—£25,000—is relatively low, bearing in mind the considerable increase in house prices in Wales over the last three or four years. The Minister's proposed increase

David Lloyd: Cynigiau y gwelliant canlynol yn fy enw i, ac yn enw Jocelyn Davies a Geraint Davies. Gwelliant 1: yn rheoliad 2(3), dileu '£20,000' ac yn ei le rhoi '£25,000'.

Mae ein gwelliant yn cynnig dileu'r llinell gyfalaf o £20,000 a rhoi llinell gyfalaf o £25,000 yn ei lle. Mae hon yn ddadl flynyddol; bydd yr Aelodau yn cofio i ddadl debyg gael ei chynnal yr adeg hon y llynedd. Mae'n dilyn y ddadl ar lwfansau personol, ac mae hefyd yn ceisio ymdrin â gofal personol am ddim i'r henoed o fewn cyfyngiadau pwerau'r Cynulliad. Mae'n dorcalonnus pan fydd yn rhaid i bobl oedrannus werthu eu cartrefi i ariannu eu gofal preswyl a nyrsio hirdymor.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: A ydym yn disgwyl cam egwyddorol arall gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol? A ânt ymhellach a phleidleisio yn erbyn y gwelliant y tro hwn?

David Lloyd: Yr wyf bob amser yn falch o dderbyn ymyriad oddi wrth Rhodri Glyn. Arhoswn i weld.

Dangosodd tystiolaeth a gyflwynwyd i'r Comisiwn Brenhinol ar Ofal Hirdymor i'r Henoed fod y system bresennol yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i bobl ag incwm cymedrol wneud eu hunain yn dlawd cyn y cânt hawl i gymorth gan awdurdodau lleol. Bydd cynyddu'r cymhorthdal cyhoeddus drwy gyfrwng ein gwelliant yn rhoi hyd yn oed mwy o gymorth i bobl mewn system gymhleth ac anghyson. At hynny, mae ymchwil a gynhaliwyd gan Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree wedi dangos nad yw awdurdodau, mewn llawer o achosion, yn monitro asedau unigolyn, fel bod llawer o bobl yn parhau i orfod talu cost lawn gofal pan fydd hawl ganddynt i gael rhywfaint o gymorth y wladwriaeth.

Gall y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ddangos ei ymrwymiad ymhellach i bobl mewn gofal preswyl heddiw drwy fabwysiadu argymhelliad Plaid Cymru. Mae'r terfynau cyfalaf yn gymharol isel; mae hyd yn oed y swm a gynigir yn ein gwelliant—£25,000—yn gymharol isel, o gofio'r cynnydd sylweddol mewn prisiau tai yng Nghymru dros y tair neu bedair blynedd diwethaf. Nid

does not seem to take such increases into account. An increase of £25,000 would be fairer, and would go some way towards reflecting the recent increases in house prices more appropriately.

During last year's debate, the Minister mentioned research being undertaken by Professor David Bell of Stirling University—

Peter Black: It seems that whatever the Government proposes, you are determined to try to trump it with a different figure. You refer to the rise in house prices. However, £25,000 would make little difference in that regard. If you are going to do this properly, do you not believe that you need to have a proper investigation and consider a much more substantial figure, such as £60,000?

David Lloyd: I am glad that you intervened at that point, Peter, because that is what the Minister said in reply to the debate on this a year ago. We have deferred to a proper study, by Professor David Bell of Stirling University, which acknowledged that many homes in Wales are of lower capital value than those elsewhere in the United Kingdom. There are proportionately more homeowners in low value homes in Wales, and therefore more homeowners would be unduly disadvantaged in Wales. That research is supposed to be ongoing. Therefore, your intervention is timely but, as a member of the Government, you should have been aware of that research.

What is your response to that commissioned policy review, Minister? Will we have another delaying tactic, as suggested by your colleague, Peter Black, or will we have a meaningful response? I agree that £25,000 is not a lot, but the Assembly does not have the relevant powers. Our proposal will cost £3.2 million. When we set this limit of £25,000 a year ago it was a third of the average house price in Wales of £75,000. That seemed to be a meaningful level when we researched this with Westminster colleagues. There would be room for manoeuvre, but it looks as if even this will be voted down. I am disappointed by that, because we are talking about justice for

yw cynnydd arfaethedig y Gweinidog yn ymddangos fel pe bai'n ystyried cynnydd o'r fath. Byddai cynnydd o £25,000 yn decach, a byddai'n mynd gam o'r ffordd tuag at adlewyrchu'r cynnydd diweddar mewn prisiau tai yn fwy priodol.

Yn ystod y ddadl y llynedd, soniodd y Gweinidog am ymchwil gan yr Athro David Bell o Brifysgol Stirling—

Peter Black: Ymddengys eich bod yn benderfynol, beth bynnag yw'r swm a gynigir gan y Llywodraeth, o ragori arno gyda ffigur gwahanol. Cyfeiriwch at y cynnydd mewn prisiau tai. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddai £25,000 yn gwneud fawr o wahaniaeth yn hynny o beth. Os ydych am wneud hyn yn iawn, oni chredwch fod angen i chi gynnal ymchwiliad priodol ac ystyried swm mwy sylweddol o lawer, megis £60,000?

David Lloyd: Yr wyf yn falch ichi ymyrryd bryd hynny, Peter, oherwydd dyna'r hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog mewn ateb i'r ddadl ar hyn flwyddyn yn ôl. Yr ydym wedi caniatáu astudiaeth briodol gan yr Athro David Bell o Brifysgol Stirling, sy'n cydnabod bod llawer o gartrefi yng Nghymru â gwerth cyfalaf is na rhai mewn mannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Mae mwy o berchnogion tai yn ôl cyfran mewn cartrefi gwerth isel yng Nghymru, ac felly byddai mwy o berchnogion tai o dan anfantais ddiangen yng Nghymru. Tybir bod yr ymchwil honno yn mynd rhagddi. Felly, mae eich ymyriad yn amserol, ond fel aelod o'r Llywodraeth, dylech fod wedi bod yn ymwybodol o'r ymchwil honno.

Beth yw eich ymateb i'r adolygiad polisi hwnnw a gomisiynwyd, Weinidog? A gawn ni dacteg oedi arall, fel yr awgrymwyd gan eich cyd-Aelod, Peter Black, neu a gawn ni ymateb ystyrllon? Cytunaf nad yw £25,000 yn swm mawr, ond nid oes gan y Cynulliad y pwerau perthnasol. Bydd ein cynnig yn costio £3.2 miliwn. Pan bennwyd y terfyn hwn o £25,000 gennym flwyddyn yn ôl, yr oedd yn draean o bris tŷ ar gyfartaledd yng Nghymru, sef £75,000. Ymddangosai hynny yn lefel ystyrllon pan ymchwiliasom i hyn gyda'n cyd-aelodau yn San Steffan. Byddai gennym le i symud o fewn hynny, ond ymddengys y bydd hyd yn oed hyn yn cael ei wrthod. Mae

our elderly people who are homeowners.

hynny'n fy siomi, oherwydd sôn yr ydym am gyfiawnder i'n pobl oedrannus sy'n berchnogion tai.

David Melding: I am pleased that you have been able to call me, Presiding Officer. Much has been made of the fact that the Plaid Cymru amendment to this motion, and our amendment to the preceding motion, draws on the budget and will result in considerable extra expenditure. It has been suggested that these figures have been plucked from the air and have not been properly accounted for. However, when the Health and Social Services Committee considered the proposed budget, the opposition parties raised these points and informed the Minister that we would seek to make these amendments in Committee, which we did, and that we would then seek to make them in Plenary. Therefore, as far as we are concerned, if we had been in control of the budget as governing parties, we would have committed to increasing resources in order to implement these amendments.

David Melding: Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi gallu galw arnaf, Lywydd. Soniwyd llawer am y ffaith bod gwelliant Plaid Cymru i'r cynnig hwn, a'n gwelliant ni i'r cynnig blaenorol, yn tynnu ar y gyllideb ac y bydd yn arwain at gryn wariant ychwanegol. Awgrymwyd bod y ffigurau hyn wedi eu creu o ddychymyg ac na chawsant eu cyfrifo'n gywir. Fodd bynnag, pan ystyriodd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol y gyllideb arfaethedig, cododd y gwrthbleidiau y pwyntiau hyn a hysbyswyd y Gweinidog y byddem yn ceisio gwneud y gwelliannau hyn yn y Pwyllgor, ac fe wnaethom hynny, ac y byddem wedyn yn ceisio eu gwneud mewn Cyfarfod Llawn. Felly, hyd y gwelwn ni, pe baem wedi rheoli'r gyllideb fel y pleidiau mewn grym, byddem wedi addo cynyddu adnoddau er mwyn rhoi'r gwelliannau hyn ar waith.

I was interested to hear the Deputy Minister for Local Government say that a capital disregard of £60,000 would be more appropriate. That was announced with a great flurry at the Liberal Democrat conference in Swansea this weekend. I find it strange that they will have to wait a whole year, since these regulations are annual events, before they can attempt to put into place £60,000. Let me tell the Deputy Minister that £25,000 is closer to £60,000 than £20,000 is: I know that maths is not his forte. The amendment takes us closer to the Liberal Democrats policy, and it is strange that they will vote against it.

Yr oedd yn ddiddorol clywed y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Lywodraeth Leol yn dweud y byddai anwybyddiad cyfalaf o £60,000 yn fwy priodol. Cyhoeddwyd hynny gyda chryn gyffro yng nghynhadledd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn Abertawe y penwythnos hwn. Mae'n rhyfedd bod yn rhaid iddynt aros blwyddyn gyfan, cyn y gallant ymdrechu i roi £60,000 ar waith gan mai digwyddiadau blynyddol yw'r rheoliadau hyn. Mae £25,000, Ddirprwy Weinidog, yn agosach at £60,000 na £20,000: gwn nad mathemateg yw ei gryfder. Mae'r gwelliant yn mynd â ni yn agosach at bolisi'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ac mae'n rhyfedd meddwl y byddant yn pleidleisio yn ei erbyn.

3.50 p.m.

Cynog Dafis: I wonder, David, whether you are not being unfair. Lembit Öpik made an appeal for no-one to attack the Liberal Democrats at any time. They are obviously looking for an easy ride over the next month.

Cynog Dafis: Onid ydych yn ymddwyn yn annheg David? Apeliodd Lembit Öpik at bobl i beidio ag ymosod ar y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ar unrhyw adeg. Maent yn amlwg yn gobeithio am gyfnod hawdd yn ystod y mis nesaf.

David Melding: They have announced all their policies. No wonder they do not want to be attacked. If I had to defend those policies,

David Melding: Maent wedi cyhoeddi eu polisiau i gyd. Nid oes ryfedd nad ydynt am i neb ymosod arnynt. Pe bawn i yn gorfod

or be held responsible for them, I would be pleading for sweetness and light and no hard punches.

Peter Black: The policies in our manifesto, which we passed at the weekend, will be put before the people of Wales in the election on 1 May. If we are in a position to implement them, we will certainly do so. Will you accept that, although £25,000 is closer to £60,000, it still makes very little difference because of rises in house prices? It is better to do this properly, rather than approve a half-measure such as you are proposing today.

David Melding: If £25,000 is a half-measure, then the £20,000 that you are going to vote for is presumably an even lower estimate. You need to go on a logic course, though while we are talking about the Liberal Democrat manifesto, logic is not likely to be the prevailing principle. We support this amendment.

Kirsty Williams: Presiding Officer, I suspect that, had you called the Minister next and not allowed me to speak, I would have been accused of running scared of the comments from the political parties on either side of me. My colleagues must make the distinction between what you are able to put in a partnership agreement and what is the stated policy.

Owen John Thomas *rose—*

The Presiding Officer: Order. One at a time. We are all very excited about the election; probably more excited than the electorate.

Kirsty Williams: I suspect, Presiding Officer, that your observation is right. Hopefully, however, policies of that kind will ignite interest in what the National Assembly can do.

A distinction must be made between what you intend to put in a partnership agreement and what your aims are for the second term of the National Assembly. Once again we are breaking the link with England; we are increasing allowances, and we have

amddiffyn y polisiau hynny, neu fod yn atebol amdanynt, byddem yn ymbil am heddwch a dim ergydion caled.

Peter Black: Caiff y polisiau yn ein maniffesto, a basiwyd dros y penwythnos, eu rhoi gerbron pobl Cymru yn yr etholiad ar 1 Mai. Os byddwn mewn sefyllfa i'w gweithredu, gwnawn hynny yn sicr. A dderbyniwch, er bod £25,000 yn agosach at £60,000, nid yw'n gwneud llawer o wahaniaeth oherwydd y cynnydd mewn prisiau tai? Mae'n well gwneud hyn yn gywir, yn hytrach na chyfaddawdu fel y cynigiwch wneud heddiw.

David Melding: Os yw £25,000 yn gyfaddawd, yna mae'r £20,000 yr ydych chi'n bwriadu pleidleisio o'i blaid yn amcangyfrif hyd yn oed yn is gellid tybio. Mae angen ichi fynd ar gwrs rhesymeg, er tra'n sôn am faniffesto'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, nid rhesymeg fydd yr egwyddor bennaf mae'n siŵr. Cefnogwn y gwelliant hwn.

Kirsty Williams: Lywydd, pe baech wedi galw ar y Gweinidog i siarad nesaf a heb ganiatáu imi siarad, tybiaf y byddwn wedi cael fy nghyhuddo o fod ag ofn sylwadau'r pleidiau gwleidyddol ar y naill ochr i mi. Rhaid i'm cyd-Aelodau wahaniaethu rhwng yr hyn y gallwch ei roi mewn cytundeb partneriaeth a'r hyn a nodir yn y polisi datganedig.

Owen John Thomas *a gododd—*

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Un ar y tro. Mae pob un ohonom yn edrych ymlaen yn eiddgar at yr etholiad; yn edrych ymlaen yn fwy na'r etholwyr mae'n siŵr.

Kirsty Williams: Tybiaf, Lywydd, fod eich sylw yn gywir. Fodd bynnag, gobeithio y bydd polisiau o'r math hwnnw yn tanio diddordeb yn yr hyn y gall y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ei wneud.

Rhaid gwahaniaethu rhwng yr hyn y bwriadwch ei roi mewn cytundeb partneriaeth a beth yw eich nodau ar gyfer ail dymor y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Unwaith eto, yr ydym yn torri'r cyswllt â Lloegr; yr ydym yn cynyddu lwfansau, a chydabuom,

acknowledged, as a partnership Government, that there needs to be work in this area. We must take on board the findings of the research that has been carried out, and develop a policy that targets help and support at people who need it. While this amendment gives an increase in the capital limit, the reality is that few new people would be significantly helped by this proposal. It is fine political grandstanding stuff, but it does not get help to where it is needed most. We need a comprehensive review, as David Melding has said, not just on charges of this kind, but charges right across the board for our elderly and most vulnerable people.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): Dai's amendment proposes to raise the upper capital limit by a further £5,000, a total increase of 32 per cent on the current limit. This amendment came to Committee after the budget planning round. It had not been raised while the Health and Social Services Committee had the opportunity to express its views on the budget planning arrangements. The change would not exempt any more people from paying towards their care than is the case under the regulations that I have tabled.

David Melding: I thought the Minister would be gracious enough to acknowledge that I raised this when we looked at the budget initially. I told her that it would be a priority for the Welsh Conservative Party.

Jane Hutt: These are budget planning priority issues. We estimate that this would cost an additional £2.6 million; that is a total of around £3.2 million for local authority budgets. As you recognise, we would need to make good, as the Assembly has agreed upon the budget, the additional spend for local government through a special grant by adjusting other Assembly programmes to pay for it. It is true that part of the cost for local government would, in effect, replace the benefit of the attendance allowance, which ceases to be payable when people receive public funding towards their care. That is a substantial issue in terms of the changes that we want to make. Scotland found that to be true in terms of new free personal care arrangements. The regulations that I am proposing will mean increases of 4.3 per cent

fel Llywodraeth bartneriaeth, fod angen gwneud gwaith yn y maes hwn. Rhaid inni ystyried canfyddiadau'r ymchwil a gyflawnwyd, a datblygu polisi sy'n targedu help a chefnogaeth i bobl sydd eu hangen. Er bod y gwelliant hwn yn cynyddu'r terfyn cyfalaf, y gwirionedd yw mai ychydig o bobl y byddai'r cynnig hwn yn eu helpu'n sylweddol. Mae'n ddeunydd gwleidyddol gwych, ond nid yw'n targedu help lle mae ei angen fwyaf. Mae angen adolygiad cynhwysfawr arnom, fel y dywedodd David Melding, nid ar daliadau o'r math hwn yn unig, ond ar daliadau yn gyffredinol i'n pobl oedranus a'n pobl fwyaf diamddiffyn.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Mae gwelliant Dai yn cynnig codi'r terfyn cyfalaf uwch gan £5,000 arall, cyfanswm cynnydd o 32 y cant ar y terfyn cyfredol. Daeth y gwelliant hwn i'r Pwyllgor ar ôl cylch cynllunio'r gyllideb. Ni chafodd ei godi tra yr oedd gan y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol y cyfle i fynegi ei farn ar drefniadau cynllunio'r gyllideb. Ni fyddai'r newid yn eithrio mwy o bobl rhag talu tuag at eu gofal na'r hyn sy'n wir o dan y rheoliadau a gyflwynais i.

David Melding: Credais y byddai'r Gweinidog yn ddigon graslon i gydnabod imi godi hyn pan edrychasom ar y gyllideb y tro cyntaf. Dywedais wrthi y byddai'n flaenoriaeth i Blaid Geidwadol Cymru.

Jane Hutt: Materion blaenoriaethaol o ran cynllunio'r gyllideb yw'r rhain. Amcangyfrifwn y byddai hyn yn costio £2.6 miliwn ychwanegol; mae hynny'n gyfanswm o tua £3.2 miliwn ar gyfer cyllidebau awdurdodau lleol. Fel y cydnabyddwch, gan fod y Cynulliad wedi cytuno ar y gyllideb, byddai angen inni sicrhau'r gwariant ychwanegol ar gyfer llywodraeth leol drwy grant arbennig drwy addasu rhaglenni eraill y Cynulliad i dalu amdano. Mae'n wir y byddai rhan o'r gost i lywodraeth leol, mewn gwirionedd, yn disodli budd y lwfans gweini, sy'n peidio â bod yn daladwy pan fydd pobl yn cael arian cyhoeddus i dalu am eu gofal. Mae hynny'n fater pwysig o ran y newidiadau yr ydym am eu gwneud. Gwelodd yr Alban fod hynny'n wir o ran trefniadau gofal personol am ddim newydd.

and 5.3 per cent in the lower and upper capital limits respectively. That is well above inflation, as Dai recognised, is above the rise in average earnings, and is affordable within the Assembly's budget. It also allows for cost rises in local government expenditure. Therefore, the resulting capital limits will be higher than those enforced for 2003-04 in England and Scotland. That shows that we are marking out our own distinctive path in Wales.

In response to Dai, David and Kirsty, it is important that we examine ways of easing the pressure on people to sell their homes to pay for care. Studies are currently being undertaken to consider the details of the implications and costs involved in increasing the capital limits beyond those in the proposed regulations. We know that older people in Wales have relatively high levels of capital assets but low levels of income. The strategy group for older people is considering that. The regulations before the Assembly today will help people moving into care homes by allowing them, in certain circumstances, to make their own additional payments if they wish to be housed in more expensive accommodation than that usually funded by local authorities. The regulations also give more help to people who do not wish to sell their homes during their lifetime to pay for care by allowing local authorities to take a charge on their property. That is also a significant step forward, which we have not discussed today in terms of the regulations before us, but which will make a substantial difference to people in that situation. We are taking a distinctive path and the further research that has been commissioned will inform us in terms of future budget planning rounds.

Bydd y rheoliadau a gynigaf yn golygu cynnydd o 4.3 y cant a 5.3 y cant yn y terfynau cyfalaf is ac uwch yn y drefn honno. Mae hynny yn uwch o lawer na chwyddiant, fel y dywedodd Dai, yn uwch na'r cynnydd mewn enillion cyfartalog, ac yn fforddiadwy o fewn cyllideb y Cynulliad. Mae hefyd yn caniatáu ar gyfer cynnydd ariannol yng ngwariant llywodraeth leol. Felly, bydd y terfynau cyfalaf o ganlyniad yn uwch na'r rhai a orfodir ar gyfer 2003-04 yn Lloegr ac yn yr Alban. Dengys hynny ein bod yn dewis ein llwybr neilltuol ein hunain yng Nghymru.

Mewn ymateb i Dai, David a Kirsty, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn archwilio ffyrdd o leddfu'r pwysau ar bobl i werthu eu cartrefi i dalu am ofal. Cynhelir astudiaethau ar hyn o bryd i ystyried manylion y goblygiadau a'r costau sy'n gysylltiedig â chynyddu'r terfynau cyfalaf y tu hwnt i'r rheini yn y rheoliadau arfaethedig. Gwyddom fod gan bobl hŷn yng Nghymru lefelau cymharol uchel o asedau cyfalaf ond lefelau isel o incwm. Mae'r grŵp strategaeth i bobl hŷn yn ystyried hynny. Bydd y rheoliadau gerbron y Cynulliad heddiw yn helpu pobl sy'n symud i gartrefi gofal drwy ganiatáu iddynt, mewn amgylchiadau penodol, wneud eu taliadau ychwanegol eu hunain os dymunant gael eu rhoi mewn cartrefi drutach na'r hyn a ariennir fel arfer gan awdurdodau lleol. Mae'r rheoliadau hefyd yn rhoi mwy o help i bobl nad ydynt yn dymuno gwerthu eu cartrefi yn ystod eu bywydau i dalu am ofal drwy ganiatáu i awdurdodau lleol arwystlo eu heiddo. Mae hynny'n gam mawr ymlaen hefyd, na thrafodasom heddiw o ran y rheoliadau ger ein bron, ond a fydd yn gwneud gwahaniaeth mawr i bobl yn y sefyllfa honno. Yr ydym yn dewis llwybr neilltuol a bydd yr ymchwil bellach a gomisiynwyd yn sail i'n cylchoedd cynllunio'r gyllideb yn y dyfodol.

Gwelliant 1: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 32.

Amendment 1: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 32.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary

Hancock, Brian
Jones, David Ian
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.*

*Cynnig (NDM1439): O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1439): For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gibbons, Brian
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, David Ian
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary

Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Kirsty
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cyfrifon Dysgu Unigol (Cymru) 2003
 Approval of the Individual Learning Accounts (Wales) Regulations 2003**

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I propose that **Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly considers the principle of the Individual Learning Accounts (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 4 March 2003. (NDM1440) *y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Cyfrifon Dysgu Unigol (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Mawrth 2003. (NDM1440)*

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly:

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 11 March 2003, which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the Individual Learning Accounts (Wales) Regulations 2003; and *1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Mawrth 2003, nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5, mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Cyfrifon Dysgu Unigol (Cymru) 2003; osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Chwefror 2003; ac*

2. approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft and the regulatory appraisal, both laid in the Table Office on 4 March 2003 (NDM1441) *2. yn cymeradwyo gwneud y Gorchymyn yn unol â'r drafft a'r arfarniad rheoliadol, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Mawrth 2003. (NDM1441)*

Helen Mary Jones: Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales will not oppose these regulations. They bring into effect the procedures outlined in the Minister's statement on 22 and 26 February. However, I will raise some specific points. We support targeting the individual learning accounts as it seems appropriate that

Helen Mary Jones: Ni fydd Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales yn gwrthwynebu'r rheoliadau hyn. Rhoddant y gweithdrefnau a amlinellir yn natganiad y Gweinidog ar 22 a 26 Chwefror ar waith. Fodd bynnag, codaf rai pwyntiau penodol. Cefnogwn y gwaith o dargedu cyfrifon dysgu unigol gan ei fod yn

they should be targeted at those with qualifications that are no higher than GCSE or NVQ level 2. However, we are concerned that that should not be set in stone. Will the Minister confirm that she will keep that level of targeting under review? We will hopefully reach the point where there are fewer people in that position and we may then wish to raise the threshold. I understand that the regulations make that possible, but will the Minister confirm today that she intends to do that, and indicate the type of education and training for which people will be able to pay, that will be available under this regulation? Regulation 7 states that the National Assembly for Wales—presumably meaning the National Assembly Government—will specify which education and training will be funded. Bearing in mind that these individual learning accounts will be targeted at those who may not previously have been successful in education and training, such clarification would help to engage their interests. If she cannot do so now, will she say when that detail will be provided?

4.00 p.m.

I want to pursue the issue of the programme's annual budget. In her statement on 26 February, the Minister said that it would be £2 million per annum, which we welcome. She also said, however, that the number of people who could benefit—should every place be taken—would be approximately 20,000, each of whom would receive £200. I do not claim that mathematics is my strong point, but I think that 20,000 times £200 is £4 million, not £2 million. Will the Minister clarify whether the budget will remain under review?

In the statement, the Minister said that no money would be spent until she was satisfied that the council systems and controls were working effectively. I remind the Chamber that we are talking about ELWa. It is difficult for any of us to have confidence in the council's systems and controls. It was interesting, earlier this afternoon, to hear the Minister criticise our scrutiny. She has got that the wrong way round—it is our job to scrutinise her. I raised concerns at the time and, in Committee, the Minister told me that she was unable to answer them because the

ymddangos yn briodol y dylent gael eu targedu at y rheini sydd â chymwysterau nad ydynt yn uwch na TGAU neu lefel 2 CGC. Fodd bynnag, pryderwn na ddylai hyn fod yn derfynol. A wnaiff y Gweinidog gadarnhau y bydd yn parhau i adolygu'r lefel honno o dargedu? Gobeithio y deawn i'r pwynt lle y bydd llai o bobl yn y sefyllfa honno ac yna efallai y byddwn am godi'r trothwy. Deallaf fod y rheoliadau yn gwneud hynny'n bosibl, ond a wnaiff y Gweinidog gadarnhau heddiw ei bod yn bwriadu gwneud hynny, a nodi'r math o addysg a hyfforddiant y bydd pobl yn gallu talu amdano, a fydd ar gael o dan y rheoliad hwn? Noda Rheoliad 7 y bydd Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru—sef Llywodraeth y Cynulliad Genedlaethol—yn nodi pa addysg a hyfforddiant a ariennir. O gofio y targedir y cyfrifon dysgu unigol hyn at y rheini na fu'n llwyddiannus o'r blaen o ran addysg a hyfforddiant, byddai eglurhad o'r fath yn helpu i ennyn eu diddordeb. Os na all wneud hynny yn awr, a ddywed pryd y darperir y manylion hynny?

Yr wyf am drafod cyllideb flynyddol y rhaglen ymhellach. Yn ei datganiad ar 26 Chwefror, dywedodd y Gweinidog y byddai'r gyllideb yn £2 filiwn y flwyddyn, swm a groesawn. Dywedodd hefyd, fodd bynnag, mai nifer y bobl a allai elwa ar hyn—pe bai pob lle yn cael ei gymryd—fyddai tua 20,000, a byddai pob un yn cael £200. Ni honnaf mai mathemateg yw fy nghryfder, ond credaf mai 20,000 wedi ei luosi gyda £200 yw £4 miliwn, nid £2 filiwn. A wnaiff y Gweinidog egluro a fydd y gyllideb yn parhau i gael ei hadolygu?

Yn y datganiad, dywedodd y Gweinidog na chât arian ei wario hyd nes y byddai'n fodlon bod systemau a rheolaethau'r cyngor yn gweithio'n effeithiol. Atgoffaf y Siambr ein bod yn sôn am ELWa. Mae'n anodd i unrhyw un fod â hyder yn systemau a rheolaethau'r cyngor. Yr oedd yn ddiddorol clywed y Gweinidog, yn gynharach y prynhawn yma, yn beirniadu ein dull craffu. Mae wedi camddeall hynny—ein gwaith ni yw craffu ar ei gwaith. Codais bryderon ar y pryd ac, yn y Pwyllgor, dywedodd y Gweinidog wrthyf nad oedd yn gallu eu hateb gan fod y mater

issue was commercially confidential, which we respected at the time.

The broader concern about ILAs is, given the mess that ELWa is making of so much else, whether the Minister is really confident that those systems are in place? Everyone has acknowledged, and is pleased, that the situation that arose in England did not arise here. We were extremely fortunate. I have little confidence that such a situation could be avoided this time—unless the Minister takes greater political responsibility for ensuring that robust systems are in place.

Brian Gibbons: One of the more attractive features of this is that there is no upper age limit for people eligible to apply under the ILA programme. Evidence gathering for the older people strategy in Wales found that a main criticism was that older people were being excluded from the opportunity of lifelong learning. The regulations appear not to impose an upper age limit. I want further assurance that those courses for which older people may use their ILAs will not be limited to those with a vocational bent. If older people want to engage in activities, which may be regarded as self-improvement in the most liberal sense of the word, I want confirmation that the ILA accounts will allow them to do so.

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I know that you welcome the targeting of those on the lowest incomes and with the lowest qualifications, and that will remain under review. Sadly, however, the money that we have put in place now will not be enough to assist all those with low qualifications or low income over the next year, which is the period during which these regulations will apply.

I specified the relevant types of education and training in my statement to Members. All learning must be accredited by an external awarding body or meet standards determined by the Wales credit framework team. All courses must have clearly defined learning outcomes, level descriptors, learning hours and levels of tutor support. We are, therefore,

yn fasnachol gyfrinachol, a pharchwyd hynny gennym ar y pryd.

Y pryder mwy cyffredinol am gyfrifon dysgu unigol, o gofio'r llanastr a wna ELWa o gymaint o bethau eraill, yw pa un ai a yw'r Gweinidog yn wirioneddol hyderus bod y systemau hynny ar waith? Mae pawb wedi cydnabod na chododd y sefyllfa a gododd yn Lloegr yma, ac maent yn falch o hynny. Yr ydym yn eithriadol o ffodus. Nid oes gennyf lawer o hyder y gellid osgoi sefyllfa o'r fath y tro hwn—oni chymher y Gweinidog fwy o gyfrifoldeb gwleidyddol dros sicrhau bod systemau cadarn ar waith.

Brian Gibbons: Un o nodweddion mwy deniadol hyn yw nad oes terfyn oedran uwch ar gyfer pobl sy'n gymwys i wneud cais o dan y rhaglen cyfrifon dysgu unigol. Yn ystod y broses o gasglu tystiolaeth ar gyfer y strategaeth pobl hŷn yng Nghymru, canfuwyd mai'r brif feirniadaeth oedd bod pobl hŷn yn cael eu hallgáu o'r cyfle i ddysgu gydol oes. Ymddengys nad yw'r rheoliadau yn gosod terfyn oedran uwch. Yr wyf am gael sicrwydd pellach na chaiff y cyrsiau hynny lle y gall pobl hŷn ddefnyddio eu cyfrifon dysgu unigol, eu cyfyngu i'r rheini sydd â thuedd alwedigaethol. Os bydd pobl hŷn am gael eu cynnwys mewn gweithgareddau, a allai gael eu hystyried yn hunanwelliant yn yr ystyr fwyaf rhydd o'r gair, yr wyf am gael cadarnhad y bydd y cyfrifon dysgu unigol yn caniatáu iddynt wneud hynny.

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Gwn eich bod yn croesawu'r gwaith o dargedu'r rheini ar yr incwm isaf a'r rhai sydd â'r cymwysterau isaf a pharheir i adolygu hynny. Yn anffodus, fodd bynnag, ni fydd yr arian a sicrhawyd gennym yn ddigon yn awr i gynorthwyo pawb â chymwysterau isel neu ar incwm isel yn ystod y flwyddyn i ddod, sef y cyfnod pan fydd y rheoliadau hyn yn berthnasol.

Nodais y mathau perthnasol o addysg a hyfforddiant yn fy natganiad i'r Aelodau. Rhaid i'r holl ddysgu gael ei achredu gan gorff dyfarnu allanol neu fodloni safonau a bennwyd gan dîm fframwaith credyd Cymru. Rhaid i bob cwrs gael canlyniadau dysgu wedi eu diffinio'n glir, disgrifwyr lefel, oriau dysgu a lefelau cymorth tiwtoriaid. Felly,

talking about courses which may contribute to people's ability to move on to accredited learning. The budget is £2 million. If everyone who took up the opportunity had 50 per cent of their course fees paid and had a highest prior level learning attainment of level 2 or below, the number of people receiving ILAs would be 20,000. If, however, everyone were to operate at 100 per cent cost, the figure would be 10,000. The number will probably be somewhere in the middle. We are considering three levels of targeting: we will pay the full £200 to those on income support and who have learning lower than level 2; 80 per cent of course costs will be paid to those on working families tax credit, disabled person's tax credit, housing benefit or council tax benefit, whose learning is at level 2 or below; and we will pay 50 per cent of course costs, up to a value of £100, to the highest prior learning attainment of level 2 or below. Those are the three specified categories.

Helen Mary Jones: Will you clarify that? If too many applications are at the higher end, will people have to go on a waiting list? If more eligible people request individual learning accounts than there is money available to pay for, what system will be implemented? Will applicants have to wait, as people are having to wait for modern apprenticeships? What will happen?

Jane Davidson: We have allocated £2 million in this year's budget and over the next three years for individual learning accounts. Should they become so popular that we need to review the budget, we will do so in concert with ELWa. These accounts are focused on learners and on improving qualifications, which is key for all Assembly Members and not just the Welsh Assembly Government.

ELWa has run the individual learning accounts in Wales in an exemplary way. That is why we held on to individual learning accounts for longer than anywhere else in the UK. With a belt-and-braces approach—even in a climate of much mist and allegation—we are confident that the individual learning accounts are run in a robust fashion, which is down to ELWa. That means that we are

soniwn am gyrsiau a all gyfrannu at allu pobl i symud ymlaen i ddysgu achrededig. Dwy filiwn o bunnoedd yw'r gyllideb. Pe telid 50 y cant o ffioedd y cwrs i bawb a fanteisiai ar y cyfle a phe bai gan bawb gyrhaeddiad lefel dysgu blaenorol uchaf o lefel 2 neu is byddai nifer y bobl a gâi cyfrifon dysgu unigol yn 20,000. Fodd bynnag, pe bai pawb yn gweithredu ar gost o 100 y cant, byddai'r ffigur hwnnw yn 10,000. Bydd y nifer rhywle yn y canol mae'n siŵr. Yr ydym yn ystyried tair lefel o dargedu: byddwn yn talu'r £200 yn llawn i'r rheini ar gymhorthdal incwm a'r rheini sydd â lefel dysgu yn is na lefel 2; telir 80 y cant o gostau'r cwrs i'r rheini ar gredyd treth i deuluoedd sy'n gweithio, credyd treth person anabl, budd-dal tai neu fudd-dal y dreth gyngor, sydd ar lefel 2 neu is o ran dysgu; a byddwn yn talu 50 y cant o gostau'r cwrs, hyd at £100, i'r cyrhaeddiad dysgu blaenorol uchaf sef lefel 2 neu is. Dyna'r tri chategori penodol.

Helen Mary Jones: A wnewch chi egluro hynny? Os oes gormod o geisiadau ar y pen uchaf, a fydd pobl yn gorfod mynd ar restr aros? Os bydd mwy o bobl gymwys yn gofyn am gyfrifon dysgu unigol na'r arian sydd ar gael i dalu amdanynt, pa system fydd yn cael ei gweithredu? A fydd ymgeiswyr yn gorfod aros, fel y mae pobl yn gorfod aros am brentisiaethau modern? Beth fydd yn digwydd?

Jane Davidson: Yr ydym wedi dyrannu £2 filiwn yng nghyllideb eleni a thros y tair blynedd nesaf ar gyfer cyfrifon dysgu unigol. Os deuant mor boblogaidd fel bod angen inni adolygu'r gyllideb, gwnawn hynny ar y cyd ag ELWa. Canolbwyntia'r cyfrifon hyn ar ddysgwyr ac ar wella cymwysterau, sy'n allweddol i bob Aelod Cynulliad ac nid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn unig.

Mae ELWa wedi rhedeg y cyfrifon dysgu unigol yng Nghymru mewn ffordd ragorol. Dyna pam ein bod wedi dal ein gafael ar gyfrifon dysgu unigol am fwy o amser nag yn unman arall yn y DU. Gydag ymagwedd ofalus—hyd yn oed mewn hinsawdd o niwl a honiadau—yr ydym yn hyderus bod y cyfrifon dysgu unigol yn cael eu gweithredu mewn dull cadarn, ac ELWa sy'n gyfrifol am

ahead of all other parts of the UK in reintroducing individual learning accounts. That should be added to ELWa's list of successes in terms of delivery, which I outlined earlier.

To respond to Brian, I have already answered some of your points. Our non-accredited approach will also encourage older people. I was delighted to be invited to launch a website for the Gwendraeth valley this morning. My audience at the launch was a group of older learners, who were all talking about the importance of such initiatives and looking forward to the results of the Assembly's commitment to lifelong learning for the future.

hyn. Golyga hynny ein bod ar y blaen i rannau eraill o'r DU wrth ailgyflwyno cyfrifon dysgu unigol. Dylid ychwanegu hynny at restr o lwyddiannau ELWa o ran cyflawni, sef rhywbeth a amlinellais yn gynharach.

Mewn ymateb i Brian, yr wyf eisoes wedi ateb rhai o'ch pwyntiau. Bydd ein hymagwedd anachrededig yn annog pobl hŷn hefyd. Yr oeddwn yn falch o gael fy ngwahodd i lansio gwefan ar gyfer cwm Gwendraeth y bore yma. Grŵp o ddysgwyr hŷn oedd fy nghynulleidfa yn yr achlysur lansio, a phob un yn sôn am bwysigrwydd mentrau o'r fath a'u bod yn edrych ymlaen at ganlyniadau ymrwymiad y Cynulliad i ddysgu gydol oes yn y dyfodol.

Cynnig (NDM1440): O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM1440): For 44, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gibbons, Brian
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, David Ian
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun

Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1441): O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1441): For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, David Ian
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.09 p.m.

The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.09 p.m.

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Addysg (Addysg Feithrin a Chynlluniau Datblygu
Blynyddoedd Cynnar a Gofal Plant) (Cymru) 2003
Approval of the Education (Nursery Education and Early Years Development of
Childcare Plans) Wales Regulations 2003**

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I propose that
Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly considers the principle of the Education (Nursery Education and Early Years Development of Childcare Plans) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office and emailed to Members on 19 March 2003. (NDM1442)

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Addysg (Addysg Feithrin a Chynlluniau Datblygu Blynyddoedd Cynnar a Gofal Plant) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd at yr Aelodau drwy'r e-bost ar 19 Mawrth 2003. (NDM1442)

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly approves that the Education (Nursery Education and Early Years Development of Childcare Plans) (Wales) Regulations 2003 is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 19 March 2003. (NDM1443)

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Addysg (Addysg Feithrin a Chynlluniau Datblygu Blynyddoedd Cynnar a Gofal Plant) (Cymru) 2003 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd at yr Aelodau drwy'r e-bost ar 19 Mawrth 2003. (NDM1443)

Owen John Thomas: Yr wyf o blaid y cynnig hwn, ond tynnaf sylw at y ffaith nad yw'n gwneud dim mwy na'i gwneud yn ddyletswydd statudol ar awdurdodau lleol i ddarparu addysg ar gyfer plant pedair oed: hynny yw, darpariaeth a fu ar gael i dros 99 y cant o blant pedair oed ledled Cymru ers sawl blwyddyn.

Owen John Thomas: I support this motion, but wish to highlight the fact that it does no more than to place a statutory duty on local authorities to provide education for four-year-olds: that is, a provision that has been available to over 99 per cent of four-year-olds across Wales for many years.

4.10 p.m.

Jane Davidson: No, that is not what is proposed in these regulations. They propose that early years development partnerships become early years development and childcare partnerships, which provides a statutory basis for childcare.

Jane Davidson: Na, nid dyna'r hyn a gynigir yn y rheoliadau hyn. Cynigiant fod partneriaethau datblygu blynyddoedd cynnar yn dod yn bartneriaethau gofal plant a datblygu blynyddoedd cynnar, sy'n darparu sail statudol ar gyfer gofal plant.

*Cynnig (NDM1442): O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1442): For 42, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor

Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gibbons, Brian
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, David Ian
Jones, Gareth
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Phil

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion carried.

Cynnig (NDM1443): O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM1443): For 42, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gregory, Janice

Griffiths, John
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hancock, Brian
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, David Ian
 Jones, Gareth
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Cyllideb Atodol Supplementary Budget

The Finance Minister (Edwina Hart): I propose that

the National Assembly, in accordance with Standing Order No. 19.4, adopts the supplementary budget for the financial years 2003-04, 2004-05 and 2005-06, laid in the Table Office on Tuesday 18 March 2003. (NDM1444)

The supplementary budget takes on board adjustments to our resources as a result of the Chancellor of the Exchequer's pre-budget statement on 27 November last year. This is in addition to transfers to and from other Government departments, as well as changes within the budget itself and other changes of a technical nature.

As Members will know, this supplementary budget does not reflect the Chancellor's budget, which will not take place until 9 April this year. It will therefore be for the incoming Assembly Government to consider whether there is a need for an in-year motion to allocate any additional moneys for the forthcoming financial year.

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Edwina Hart): Cynigiau fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 19.4, yn mabwysiadu'r gyllideb atodol ar gyfer y blynyddoedd ariannol 2003-04, 2004-05 a 2005-06, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ddydd Mawrth 18 Mawrth 2003. (NDM1444)

Mae'r gyllideb atodol yn ystyried addasiadau i'n hadnoddau o ganlyniad i ddatganiad rhag-gyllidebol Canghellor y Trysorlys ar 27 Tachwedd y llynedd. Mae hyn yn ychwanegol at unrhyw gyllid a drosglwyddir rhwng adrannau eraill y Llywodraeth, yn ogystal â newidiadau yn y gyllideb ei hun a newidiadau eraill sy'n dechnegol eu natur.

Fel y gwyr yr Aelodau, nid yw'r gyllideb atodol hon yn adlewyrchu cyllideb y Canghellor, na chaiff ei chynnal tan 9 Ebrill eleni. Felly Llywodraeth nesaf y Cynulliad fydd yn ystyried a oes angen cynnig mewn-blwyddyn i ddyrannu cyllid ychwanegol ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol i ddod.

In overall terms, the Assembly budget has been reduced by over £119 million for 2003-04, nearly £84 million for 2004-05 and over £78 million for 2005-06. Before anyone gets excited about that, this is a Treasury requirement. The reduction is of a technical nature, and involves resource budgeting.

Elsewhere, the main external transfers include the following. From the Department for Work and Pensions, there is a consequential of over £109 million for 2003-04, and, for the following two years, £122 million and nearly £132 million respectively. This is to cover the increased costs of pensions in the national health service. Also from the Department for Work and Pensions, will be a transfer of £23 million in 2003-04, rising to £27 million in 2005-06, for Supporting People. This funding has been classified as annually managed expenditure. In addition, small transfers from the Home Office in relation to Supporting People will be added to our departmental expenditure limit. Also in relation to the DWP, £8.8 million has gone the other way due to a transfer of the responsibility for providing funding to local authorities for the administration of council tax and housing benefit.

From the Home Office, over £2 million is to be transferred from 2003-04 to 2005-06 for prison healthcare. This is a provisional figure and is subject to review, given that a timetable for the full transfer of responsibility to the NHS in Wales has yet to be determined. There is also a net transfer out of nearly £13.5 million in relation to police funding, which reflects the curious triangular flow of resources between the Assembly, the Office of the Deputy Prime Minister and the Home Office in this regard.

Cynog Dafis *rose*—

Edwina Hart: From the Department for Education and Skills, a consequential of some £6.5 million for 2003-04 in relation to extending employer training has been added to the reserve. Turning to the reserve itself, it has been reduced by some £17 million for

Yn gyffredinol, mae cyllideb y Cynulliad wedi gostwng mwy na £119 miliwn ar gyfer 2003-04, bron £84 miliwn ar gyfer 2004-05 a mwy na £78 miliwn ar gyfer 2005-06. Cyn i bobl ddechrau cynhyrfu, mae hyn yn ofyniad gan y Trysorlys. Mae'r gostyngiad yn un technegol, ac mae'n ymwneud â chyllidebu ar sail adnoddau.

Mewn rhannau eraill o'r gyllideb, ymhlith y prif symiau a drosglwyddir yn allanol mae'r canlynol. O'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau, ceir addasiad canlyniadol o dros £109 miliwn ar gyfer 2003-04, ac ar gyfer y ddwy flynedd ddilynol, £122 miliwn a bron £132 miliwn yn y drefn honno. Y rheswm am hyn yw costau cynyddol pensiynau yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Hefyd, bydd yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau yn trosglwyddo £23 miliwn yn 2003-04, gan gynyddu i £27 miliwn yn 2005-06, ar gyfer Cynorthwyo Pobl. Dosbarthwyd yr arian hwn fel gwariant a reolir yn flynyddol. Yn ogystal, caiff y symiau bach a drosglwyddir o'r Swyddfa Gartref mewn perthynas â Chynorthwyo Pobl eu hychwanegu at ein terfyn gwariant adrannol. Hefyd, mewn perthynas â'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau, trosglwyddwyd £8.8 miliwn i'r cyfeiriad arall yn sgîl trosglwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb dros ddarparu arian i awdurdodau lleol ar gyfer gweinyddu'r dreth gyngor a budd-dal tai.

Bwriedir trosglwyddo dros £2 filiwn o'r Swyddfa Gartref o 2003-04 i 2005-06 ar gyfer gofal iechyd mewn carchardai. Ffigur dros dro ydyw a chaiff ei adolygu, o gofio na phennir amserlen ar gyfer trosglwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb yn llawn i'r GIG yng Nghymru eto. Caiff bron £13.5 miliwn ei drosglwyddo o gyllid yr heddlu, sy'n adlewyrchu'r llif rhyfedd hwnnw rhwng tair cyllideb sef, y Cynulliad, Swyddfa'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Swyddfa Gartref, yn hyn o beth.

Cynog Dafis *a gododd*—

Edwina Hart: O'r Adran Addysg a Sgiliau, ychwanegwyd addasiad canlyniadol o ryw £6.5 miliwn i'r gronfa wrth gefn ar gyfer 2003-04 mewn cysylltiad ag ymestyn hyfforddiant cyflogwyr. Gan droi at y gronfa wrth gefn ei hun, mae wedi gostwng tua £17

2003-04 since the final budget. This leaves £35.5 million in cash and nearly £55 million on a resource basis.

I highlight an additional £8 million for 2003-04 to support the objectives of 'Reaching Higher'. This follows the extensive consultation between the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning and higher education institutions over the winter months, as trailed in my draft budget announcement last autumn. Each financial year also sees a transfer of £4 million from the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales's capital to current expenditure lines to reflect a re-profiling of capital spending, which is, of course, cost-neutral to the reserve.

Other allocations from the reserve include over £5 million to cover the costs of Assembly sponsored public bodies pay remits and pensions and an additional £3 million to cover an expected shortfall in the provision in the additional costs of teachers' pensions. The same amount will be added to the deprivation fund and there will be £2 million for additional support to police authorities. Again these are all issues which have been trailed by Ministers in previous statements, so they will come as no surprise to Members. In terms of inter-main expenditure group transfers, £32 million has been returned to the revenue support grant for future years due to the decision to postpone the transfer of funding of nursing home care from local government. A further £15 million has been transferred to the revenue support grant to cover free home care and delayed transfers of care. There have been a series of transfers relating to programmes for children and young people, resulting in a total provision of over £40 million, £44 million and £52 million respectively in each of the next three years under the Cymorth banner. A similar exercise has been conducted in relation to the Education and Lifelong Learning MEG, where budget expenditure lines are being merged to provide greater transparency. For example, a number of lines are being merged into early years and pupil support, producing total funding of nearly £19 million next year.

miliwn ar gyfer 2003-04 ers y gyllideb derfynol. O ganlyniad, mae'n cynnwys £35.5 miliwn mewn arian parod a bron £55 miliwn ar sail adnoddau.

Tynnaf sylw at £8 miliwn ychwanegol ar gyfer 2003-04 i gynorthwyo amcanion 'Ymgeisio yn Uwch'. Mae hyn yn dilyn cryn dipyn o ymgynghori rhwng y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes a sefydliadau addysg uwch dros fisoedd y gaeaf, fel y rhagwelwyd yn fy nghyhoeddiad ar y gyllideb ddrafft yn ystod yr hydref y llynedd. Ar gyfer pob blwyddyn ariannol bwriedir trosglwyddo £4 miliwn o gyfalaf Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru i'r llinellau gwariant presennol er mwyn adlewyrchu'r penderfyniad i ailbroffilio gwariant cyfalaf, sydd, wrth gwrs, yn gost niwtral i'r gronfa wrth gefn.

Ymhlith y dyraniadau eraill o'r gronfa wrth gefn mae dros £5 miliwn ar gyfer costau cylch gwaith cyflogau a phensiynau cyrrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad a £3 miliwn ychwanegol i dalu am ddiffyg a ragwelir yn y ddarpariaeth ar gyfer costau ychwanegol pensiynau athrawon. Ychwanegir yr un swm at y gronfa amddifadedd a bydd £2 filiwn ar gyfer cymorth ychwanegol i awdurdodau heddlu. Unwaith eto, mae'r holl faterion hyn eisoes wedi'u nodi gan Weinidogion mewn datganiadau blaenorol, felly ni fyddant yn peri syndod i'r Aelodau. O ran y symiau a drosglwyddir rhwng y prif grwpiau gwariant, ad-dalwyd £32 miliwn i'r grant cymorth refeniw ar gyfer y dyfodol yn sgîl y penderfyniad i ohirio trosglwyddo cyllid gofal cartrefi nyrsio oddi wrth llywodraeth leol. Trosglwyddwyd £15 miliwn yn rhagor i'r grant cymorth refeniw i dalu am ofal yn y cartref am ddim ac oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal. Trosglwyddwyd nifer o symiau mewn perthynas â rhaglenni i blant a phobl ifanc, gan roi darpariaeth o dros £40 miliwn, £44 miliwn a £52 miliwn yn y drefn honno ym mhob un o'r tair blynedd nesaf o dan faner Cymorth. Gwnaed ymarfer tebyg mewn perthynas â phrif grŵp gwariant Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, lle mae llinellau gwariant y gyllideb yn cael eu huno er mwyn iddynt fod yn fwy tryloyw. Er enghraifft, unwyd nifer o linellau o dan flynyddoedd cynnar a chymorth i ddisgyblion, gan roi cyfanswm o

bron £19 miliwn y flwyddyn nesaf.

The tables circulated do not include the allocations coming from uncommitted carry-forward—end-year flexibility. That information will be provided during the course of the coming financial year. However, there is one exception that I should highlight, as the need to allocate funding is particularly urgent. In my final budget speech in November, I announced significant increases for the drug and alcohol treatment fund budget for the next three years of £18 million in total. I said at the time that I would continue to consider the availability and demand for treatment and address any shortages, which indicated a particular need to invest in the Rhondda.

As a result, we have now drafted a framework model for a project that draws together the whole range of substance misuse treatment services that I wish to be implemented in the Rhondda. The project will build treatment services to ensure that clients can assess the type of treatment that will deal most effectively with their particular problems, whether through counselling services, community detoxification, supervised methadone consumption or, in the most acute cases, in-patient detoxification services. To this end, I will set aside £500,000 for 2003-04 from underspends forecast from this year. Resources for future years will be made available when the project is fully developed, by which time I would expect up to 200 additional people a year to be able to access treatment services in the Rhondda. That would enable us to help all the people who are currently on the waiting list.

I hope that all the key stakeholders in the area will now rise to the challenge and work with the Assembly to take this project from the drawing board and make it a reality so that people in the Rhondda can begin to benefit from these services as soon as possible. All the information is before Members, and I commend the motion to the Assembly.

Janet Ryder: You have ended on a good

Nid yw'r tablau a ddosbarthwyd yn cynnwys dyraniadau o arian nas neilltuwyd ac a gariwyd ymlaen—hyblygrwydd diwedd blwyddyn. Darperir y wybodaeth honno yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf. Fodd bynnag, mae un eithriad y dylwn dynnu'ch sylw ato, gan fod angen dyrannu arian iddo yn ddybryd. Yn fy araith ar y gyllideb derfynol ym mis Tachwedd, cyhoeddais y byddai cynnydd sylweddol yn y gyllideb ar gyfer triniaeth cyffuriau ac alcohol yn ystod y tair blynedd nesaf sef cyfanswm o £18 miliwn. Dywedais ar y pryd y byddwn yn parhau i ystyried pa driniaeth sydd ar gael a'r galw am driniaeth ac unioni unrhyw ddiffyg, a nododd fod angen buddsoddi yn y Rhondda yn benodol.

O ganlyniad, yr ydym bellach wedi llunio fframwaith enghreifftiol ar gyfer prosiect sy'n tynnu ynghyd yr amrediad cyfan o wasanaethau ar gyfer trin pobl sy'n camddefnyddio sylweddau yr hoffwn ei roi ar waith yn y Rhondda. Bydd y prosiect yn datblygu gwasanaethau triniaeth er mwyn sicrhau y gall cleientiaid asesu'r math o driniaeth a fydd yn mynd i'r afael â'u problemau penodol hwy yn fwyaf effeithiol, pa un ai drwy wasanaethau cynghori, dadwenwyno yn y gymuned, y defnydd o fethadon o dan oruchwyliaeth neu, yn yr achosion mwyaf difrifol, gwasanaethau dadwenwyno i gleifion mewnol. I'r perwyl hwn, byddaf yn neilltuo £500,000 ar gyfer 2003-04 o'r tanwariant a ragwelir ar gyfer eleni. Caiff adnoddau ar gyfer y dyfodol eu neilltuo pan fydd y prosiect wedi datblygu'n llawn, ac erbyn hynny disgwyliaf i wasanaeth triniaeth fod ar gael i hyd at 200 o bobl y flwyddyn yn ychwanegol yn y Rhondda. Byddai hynny yn ein galluogi i helpu'r holl bobl sydd ar y rhestr aros ar hyn o bryd.

Gobeithiaf y bydd pob rhanddeiliad allweddol yn yr ardal yn ateb yr her yn awr gan weithio gyda'r Cynulliad i ddatblygu'r prosiect amlinellol hwn a'I wireddu fel y gall pobl yn y Rhondda ddechrau elwa ar y gwasanaethau hyn mor fuan â phosibl. Mae'r holl wybodaeth gerbron yr Aelodau, a chymeradwyaf y cynnig i'r Cynulliad.

Janet Ryder: Yr ydych wedi gorffen gydag

piece of electioneering. It is good news for the Rhondda and I welcome the extra funding for drug and alcohol treatment services in that area. This is our last opportunity to discuss the budget in this Assembly and it is the Minister's last chance to address some of the questions that we will soon have to face on people's doorsteps. I accept what the Minister said about this being a case of moving from one budget line to the next—shifting the chairs on the Titanic—but can she explain some of those changes in more detail, particularly in terms of the health budget, where there are considerable movements? If one were to be cynical, on paper it might appear that money is being made available through the revenue line to cover the cost of the new health boards. However, I am sure that the Minister will assure us that that is not the case.

Cynog Dafis: Cyfeiriasoch at y byrddau iechyd lleol. Mynychais gyfarfod gyda chynrychiolwyr bwrdd iechyd lleol Sir Benfro ddydd Llun. Ar 15 Hydref 2002, cyhoeddodd y Gweinidog y byddai cyllid ychwanegol ar gael ar gyfer codi ysbytai newydd, gan gynnwys un yn Ninbych-y-pysgod. Fodd bynnag, yn y cyfarfod yn Ninbych-y-pysgod ddydd Llun, dysgais mai canolfan iechyd heb welyau a fyddai'n cael ei hadeiladu ac nid ysbyty. Gan fod Edwina Hart wedi gwrthod ildio, a allwch chi wasgu arni i sicrhau bod addewid y Llywodraeth a wnaethpwyd ar 15 Hydref yn cael ei gadw?

Janet Ryder: I hope that the Minister will confirm that the promise will be adhered to.

The Minister has provided good explanations for moving money around in this budget. However, children's services and long-term care for the elderly seem to be losing out at a time when children's services in social services departments cannot cope with the changes demanded by the Waterhouse report and when long-term care for the elderly is in great demand.

The other disappointment was the failure to fund the report commissioned by the Government into properly funding the

ymgais dda i ennill pleidleisiau. Mae'n newyddion da i'r Rhondda a chroesawaf yr arian ychwanegol ar gyfer gwasanaethau triniaeth cyffuriau ac alcohol yn yr ardal honno. Dyma'r cyfle olaf a gawn i drafod y gyllideb yn y Cynulliad hwn a dyma gyfle olaf y Gweinidog i fynd I'r afael â rhai o'r cwestiynau y bydd yn rhaid inni eu hwynebu ar garreg drws pobl cyn bo hir. Derbyniaf yr hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog mai symud arian o'r naill linell i'r llall yn y gyllideb a wna—gwneud ychydig newidiadau dibwys—ond a wnaiff esbonio rhai o'r newidiadau hynny yn fanylach, yn arbennig o ran y gyllideb iechyd, lle caiff cryn dipyn o arian ei symud? Pe baech yn sinigaidd, gallai ymddangos ar bapur fod arian yn cael ei ddarparu drwy'r llinell refeniw i dalu am gost y byrddau iechyd newydd. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Gweinidog yn rhoi sicrwydd inni nad fel yna y mae pethau.

Cynog Dafis: You referred to the local health boards. I met with representatives from the Pembrokeshire local health board on Monday. On 15 October 2002, the Minister announced that extra finance would be available to build new hospitals, including one in Tenby. However, in the meeting in Tenby on Monday, I learned that a health centre without beds will be built rather than a hospital. Given that Edwina Hart refused to take an intervention, could you press her to ensure that the Government adheres to the commitment that it made on 15 October?

Janet Ryder: Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn cadarnhau y bwriedir cadw at yr addewid.

Mae'r Gweinidog wedi rhoi esboniadau da am symud arian o fewn y gyllideb hon. Fodd bynnag, ymddengys fod gwasanaethau plant a gofal hirdymor i'r henoed ar eu colled ar adeg pan na all gwasanaethau plant mewn adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ymdopi â'r newidiadau a fynnis yn adroddiad Waterhouse a phan fo galw mawr am ofal hirdymor i'r henoed.

Y siom arall oedd y methiant i ariannu'r adroddiad a gomisiynwyd gan y Llywodraeth ar gyllid priodol i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans.

ambulance service. We have not seen any progress on that in the last four years—the ambulance service is still underfunded. It could be said, therefore, that that money is being used for the new health boards rather than for front-line services.

4.20 p.m.

On local government, there is little comfort for people who are facing massive council tax rises. For those lucky enough to live in Plaid Cymru areas, council taxes are not increasing greatly. For those people who must pay high police precepts—

David Davies: Do you believe that council tax rises are a result of council policies, or a result of National Assembly funding for local authorities?

Janet Ryder: It is a mixture. We have maintained all along that the money that has been allocated to local government has not covered the massive increases in expenditure it has faced this year in particular. The Minister touched upon the issue of high police precepts. A consequence of the Westminster Government's policing policies is that Welsh police forces are losing money again, which is a big disappointment. However, the biggest disappointment over the last four years has been this Government's failure to invest in housing as the spur to the whole economy. Money has been invested into homelessness strategies among other issues, but perhaps the Minister should take the Chartered Institute of Housing's advice. We have an excellent housing strategy now and, as the institute states, the Minister should now put her budget where her strategy is. If we invested in housing as the key to the whole economy, every £1 spent on housing would be repaid in the economy three or four times over. That great opportunity has been missed.

On agriculture, why has the Minister for Rural Development seemingly allowed £2.4 million to be cut from the market support schemes, at a time when the industry is facing so many crises? Perhaps it has been

Ni fu unrhyw gynnydd ar hynny yn ystod y pedair blynedd diwethaf—ni chaiff y gwasanaeth ambiwlans ddigon o arian o hyd. Gellid dweud, felly, bod yr arian hwnnw yn cael ei ddefnyddio ar gyfer y byrddau iechyd newydd yn hytrach na gwasanaethau rheng flaen.

O ran llywodraeth leol, nid oes fawr o gysur i bobl sy'n wynebu cynnydd enfawr yn y dreth gyngor. I'r bobl hynny sy'n ddigon ffodus i fyw yn ardaloedd Plaid Cymru, nid yw'r dreth gyngor yn cynyddu ryw lawer. I'r bobl hynny sy'n gorfod talu praeseptau heddlu uchel—

David Davies: Ai polisïau'r cynghorau, ynteu'r arian a roddir gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i awdurdodau lleol sy'n gyfrifol am y cynnydd yn y dreth gyngor, yn eich barn chi?

Janet Ryder: Mae'n gymysgedd o'r ddau. Yr ydym bob amser wedi dweud nad yw'r arian a ddyrannwyd i lywodraeth leol wedi darparu ar gyfer y cynnydd enfawr mewn gwariant a wynebodd eleni yn arbennig. Soniodd y Gweinidog am braeseptau heddlu uchel. Un o ganlyniadau polisïau plismona Llywodraeth San Steffan yw bod heddluoedd yng Nghymru yn colli arian unwaith eto, sy'n siom fawr. Fodd bynnag, y siom fwyaf yn ystod y pedair blynedd diwethaf oedd methiant y Llywodraeth i fuddsoddi mewn tai fel sbardun i'r economi gyfan. Buddsoddiwyd arian mewn strategaethau digartrefedd ymhlith materion eraill, ond efallai y dylai'r Gweinidog dderbyn cyngor y Sefydliad Siartredig Tai. Erbyn hyn mae gennym strategaeth dai ardderchog ac, fel y noda'r sefydliad, dylai'r Gweinidog ddechrau ymrwymo i ariannu ei strategaeth ei hun. Pe baem yn buddsoddi mewn tai fel allwedd i'r economi gyfan, byddai pob £1 a werir ar dai yn cael ei thalu yn ôl deirgwaith neu bedair gwaith yn yr economi. Collwyd y cyfle gwych hwnnw.

O ran amaethyddiaeth, pam mae'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig wedi caniatáu i £2.4 miliwn gael ei dorri o'r cynlluniau cymorth i'r farchnad, yn ôl pob golwg, pan fo'r diwydiant yn wynebu cymaint o argyfyngau?

moved somewhere else in the budget, but will he explain how the industry will be supported?

On education, we have been told time and again that we have had a good educational settlement this year and that schools have done well. Why, therefore, are the same schools telling us that there will be teacher redundancies? We will have to address that interesting question in the coming weeks. It seems that front-line services—children's services, services for the elderly, ambulance services, roads, agriculture, economic development and housing—all lose out in this budget, and the only gainers are the administrative staff of the new health boards.

Alison Halford: I will talk briefly about the Minister's budget and the top-slicing of £11 million from police funds. I am familiar with police budgets. The truth is that the Assembly funds the police, but has no control over how the money is spent. We have already given almost £0.5 billion to police coffers in Wales. The ordinary person in Wales would be horrified to learn that we cannot guarantee value for money. That is why the idea of the Assembly controlling our police is so popular. Most Assembly Members, Ministers and even the four chief constables are in favour of it. Unfortunately, the Home Office stoutly refuses to relinquish control, which is a pity. Police funding is a riddle wrapped in a mystery inside an enigma. The numerous and increasing funding streams are shrouded in secrecy. Have police funding issues been complicated for a reason? No-one knows who is accountable for what. That is why I firmly agree with the Minister that police funding should be more open and accountable. Top-slicing £11 million on a promise from the Home Office that it will give us more money is daft. Will that really happen, or is it more sleight of hand by the Home Office?

Local people are being forced to pay more for their bobbies through the back door, and no-one is questioning it, apart from the Minister, who has realised that Wales is being disadvantaged. Why do we spend hundreds

Efallai fod y swm hwnnw wedi'i symud i rywle arall yn y gyllideb, ond a wnaiff esbonio pa gymorth a gaiff y diwydiant?

O ran addysg, dywedwyd wrthym dro ar ôl tro fod gennym setliad da ar gyfer addysg eleni a bod ysgolion wedi gwneud yn dda. Pam, felly, mae'r un ysgolion yn dweud wrthym y bydd athrawon yn colli eu swyddi? Bydd yn rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â'r cwestiwn diddorol hwnnw yn ystod yr wythnosau nesaf. Ymddengys fod gwasanaethau rheng flaen—gwasanaethau plant, gwasanaethau i'r henoed, gwasanaethau ambiwlans, ffyrdd, amaethyddiaeth, datblygu economaidd a thai—oll ar eu colled yn y gyllideb hon, a'r unig rai a fydd ar eu hennill yw staff gweinyddol y byrddau iechyd newydd.

Alison Halford: Hoffwn sôn yn fyr am gyllideb y Gweinidog a brigdorri £11 miliwn o gyllid yr heddlu. Yr wyf yn gyfarwydd â chyllidebau'r heddlu. Y gwir yw bod y Cynulliad yn ariannu'r heddlu, ond nad oes ganddo reolaeth dros y ffordd y gwerir yr arian. Yr ydym eisoes wedi rhoi bron £0.5 biliwn i goffrau'r heddlu yng Nghymru. Byddai'r cyhoedd yng Nghymru yn arswydo i glywed na allwn sicrhau gwerth am arian. Dyna pam mae'r syniad bod y Cynulliad yn rheoli ein heddlu mor boblogaidd. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o Aelodau'r Cynulliad, y Gweinidogion a hyd yn oed y pedwar prif gwnstabl o blaid hynny. Yn anffodus, mae'r Swyddfa Gartref yn gwrthod yn lân ag ildio rheolaeth, sy'n drueni. Mae cyllid yr heddlu yn ddirgelwch llwyr. Cuddiwyd y ffrydiau niferus a chynyddol o arian o dan len o ddirgelwch. A oes rheswm pam y cymlethwyd materion sy'n ymwneud â chyllid yr heddlu? Ni wŷr neb pwy sy'n gyfrifol am beth. Dyna pam y cytunaf yn llwyr â'r Gweinidog y dylai cyllid yr heddlu fod yn fwy agored ac atebol. Mae'n hurt brigdorri £11 miliwn am fod y Swyddfa Gartref wedi addo y bydd yn rhoi mwy o arian inni. A fydd hynny yn digwydd mewn gwirionedd, neu ai ystryw arall gan y Swyddfa Gartref ydyw?

Bydd yn rhaid i bobl leol dalu mwy am eu plismyn mewn ffordd anuniongyrchol, ac nid oes neb yn lleisio amheun ynglŷn â hynny, ar wahân i'r Gweinidog, sydd wedi sylweddoli bod Cymru o dan anfantais. Pam

of hours scrutinising the organisations that we fund, yet allow the police to be exempt from such scrutiny? It is silly, particularly as the police service does not come cheap. In my area, complaints abound about a lack of police cover, yet local contributions have risen by almost 200 per cent since 1997. This year, we will suffer a further 33 per cent increase. It is wrong that the Assembly cannot scrutinise how this money is spent. I accept that chief constables are responsible for the operational control of their forces, but are we not entitled to have some idea of what is spent on administrative costs?

Speaking from experience, police authorities are untouchable corporate bodies. They are loyal fan clubs of the chief constable and, usually, they meekly accept his or her reports, sometimes even verbally. It is sad that they do not have the ability to check the accuracy of what they are told. This corporate club frowns on members who dare to scrutinise the overweening power of the chief constable. Unless the Assembly controls police funding, it will never control the haphazard way in which some authorities are run. The time has come to ensure that policing is devolved. I accept that the Home Secretary tried to change the management style of the police and failed. However, in Edwina, we have a Minister who should be able to control devolved policing; at least then our budgets would be open and transparent. We would all be better for it.

David Ian Jones: The Conservative Party notes changes to the budget, much of which, as the Minister said, are administrative in nature, consisting of movements between main expenditure groups, some of which clearly eluded Janet Ryder.

Considerable resources are being channelled towards health expenditure, specifically to revenue expenditure for local health boards. If it could be guaranteed that such expenditure would result in more satisfactory patient outcomes, then it would be hard to criticise. However, we are not, even objectively, seeing such outcomes; waiting

y treuliwn oriau lawer yn craffu ar waith y sefydliadau a ariennir gennym, ond yn eithrio'r heddlu rhag hynny? Mae'n hurt, yn enwedig o gofio nad am swm bach y cynhelir yr heddlu. Yn fy ardal i, mae cwynion di-rif na ddarperir digon o ddarpariaeth gan yr heddlu, ac eto mae cyfraniadau lleol wedi cynyddu bron 200 y cant er 1997. Eleni, wynebwn gynnydd arall o 33 y cant. Nid yw'n iawn bod y Cynulliad yn methu craffu ar y ffordd y caiff yr arian hwn ei wario. Derbyniaf mai'r prif gwnstabiliaid sy'n gyfrifol am reolaeth weithredol dros eu heddluoedd, ond oni ddylai fod gennym yr hawl i gael rhyw amcan o faint a werir ar gostau gweinyddol?

Gan siarad o brofiad, mae awdurdodau'r heddlu yn gyrff corfforaethol na ellir eu cyffwrdd. Maent yn glwbiau cefnogwyr triw i'r prif gwnstabl ac, fel arfer, maent yn derbyn ei adroddiadau neu ei hadroddiadau, yn ddi-gwestiwn, hyd yn oed ar lafar weithiau. Mae'n drist nad oes modd iddynt wirio pa mor gywir yw'r hyn a ddywedwyd wrthynt. Mae'r clwb corfforaethol hwn yn gwgu ar aelodau sy'n beiddio craffu ar rym trahaus y prif gwnstabl. Hyd nes y bo'r Cynulliad yn rheoli cyllid yr heddlu, ni fydd byth yn rheoli'r ffordd ar hap y caiff rhai awdurdodau eu rhedeg. Daeth yr amser i sicrhau bod rheolaeth dros yr heddlu yn cael ei datganoli. Derbyniaf fod yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref wedi ceisio newid dulliau rheoli'r heddlu ac wedi methu. Fodd bynnag, mae Edwina yn Weinidog a ddylai fod yn gallu rheoli'r heddlu datganoledig; o leiaf byddai ein cyllidebau yn agored ac yn dryloyw wedyn. Byddai hynny yn fuddiol i bawb.

David Ian Jones: Noda'r Blaid Geidwadol y newidiadau i'r gyllideb, y mae llawer ohonynt, fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, yn rhai gweinyddol, sy'n cynnwys symudiadau rhwng y prif grwpiau gwariant, rhai ohonynt nad yw Janet Ryder yn amlwg wedi eu deall.

Rhoddir adnoddau sylweddol i wariant ar iechyd, yn benodol gwariant refeniw ar gyfer byrddau iechyd lleol. Pe bai modd sicrhau y byddai gwariant o'r fath yn arwain at ganlyniadau mwy boddhaol i gleifion, yna byddai'n anodd beirniadu hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid ydym, hyd yn oed yn wrthrychol, yn gweld canlyniadau o'r fath; mae rhestrau

lists continue to increase, as do waiting times. In her budget statement in October, the Minister announced that Mr Derek Wanless had been appointed to advise on a review of health and social care in Wales. We should not forget the advice that Mr Wanless gave in his report to the UK Government on the future of the NHS, which was that

‘money on its own is not enough and provides no guarantee of success—it is essential that resources are efficiently and effectively used. Resources and reform must go hand in hand—both are vital. Neither will deliver without the other.’

With regard to that statement, one wonders whether increased expenditure is sensible, in the absence of the review that Mr Wanless is about to undertake.

Sir John Bourn has already voiced concerns about the proposed local health boards. We also heard about the memorandum to the First Minister from an official, which indicated that, in the official’s opinion, NHS restructuring was likely to result in additional chaos, and that the cost of the exercise was still unknown. It appears that there will be additional costs to the restructuring; it will not be cost neutral, as was previously indicated. Will the Minister indicate this afternoon her current best estimate of the likely cost of the restructuring of the health service?

I would also be grateful if the Minister would indicate to the Assembly her opinion of the likely effect of increased national insurance contributions, which are due to commence at the beginning of the next financial year. Much of the increase in this budget, such as it is, will go straight back to the Treasury in the form of national insurance contributions.

One relatively small point that I feel is important, and which I would like to draw to the Minister’s attention, is to do with flood protection. At a meeting of the North Wales Regional Committee earlier this year, there was an impressive presentation by a representative of the Environment Agency Wales. He said, in no uncertain terms, that, in

aros yn parhau i gynyddu, a’r amseroedd aros hefyd. Yn ei datganiad cyllideb ym mis Hydref, cyhoeddodd y Gweinidog fod Mr Derek Wanless wedi’i benodi i gynghori ar adolygiad o iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yng Nghymru. Ni ddylem anghofio’r cyngor a roddodd Mr Wanless yn ei adroddiad i Lywodraeth y DU ar ddyfodol y GIG, sef

nid yw arian ynddo’i hun yn ddigon ac nid yw’n gwarantu llwyddiant—mae’n hanfodol bod adnoddau’n cael eu defnyddio’n effeithlon ac yn effeithiol. Rhaid i adnoddau a diwygiadau fynd law yn llaw—mae’r ddau yn hanfodol. Ni fydd y naill yn gwneud gwahaniaeth heb y llall.

O ran y datganiad hwnnw, tybed a yw gwariant cynyddol yn synhwyrol, yn niffyg yr adolygiad y mae Mr Wanless ar fin ei gynnal.

Mae Syr John Bourn eisoes wedi mynegi pryderon am y byrddau iechyd lleol arfaethedig. Clywsom hefyd am y memorandum i’r Prif Weinidog oddi wrth swyddog, a nododd fod ailstrwythuro’r GIG yn debygol o arwain at fwy o ddrwschwch, ym marn y swyddog, ac na wyddid o hyd beth fyddai cost yr ymarfer. Ymddengys y bydd yr ailstrwythuro yn arwain at gostau ychwanegol; ni fydd yn gost niwtral, fel yr awgrymwyd o’r blaen. A wnaiff y Gweinidog y prynhawn yma nodi ei hamcangyfrif cyfredol agosaf o gostau tebygol ailstrwythuro’r gwasanaeth iechyd?

Byddwn yn ddiolchgar hefyd pe bai’r Gweinidog yn dweud wrth y Cynulliad beth, yn ei barn hi, fydd effaith debygol cynyddu’r cyfraniadau yswiriant gwladol, a fydd yn cychwyn ar ddechrau’r flwyddyn ariannol nesaf. Bydd llawer o’r cynnydd yn y gyllideb hon, fel ag y mae, yn cael ei ad-dalu i’r Trysorlys yn syth ar ffurf cyfraniadau yswiriant gwladol.

Mae un pwynt cymharol fach sy’n bwysig yn fy nhyb i, ac yr hoffwn dynnu sylw’r Gweinidog ato, yn ymwneud ag amddiffyn rhag llifogydd. Mewn cyfarfod o Bwyllgor Rhanbarthol y Gogledd yn gynharach eleni, rhoddwyd cyflwyniad gwych gan gynrychiolydd o Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd Cymru. Dywedodd, heb flewyn ar dafod, fod

his opinion, there was an underspend of some £2.6 million per annum in flood protection. That is a relatively small point in the context of a budget of this size, but I ask the Minister to take on board my concern that problems caused by a failure to secure flood protection measures are cumulative. If we do not spend sufficiently now, we will probably have to spend considerably more in the future to put right the consequences of the underspend. I ask the Minister to reconsider this item of the budget.

4.30 p.m.

Peter Black: I welcome this budget, particularly the additional money for higher education, health and local government. It is a credit to the Minister that the budget is presented so transparently, that we can debate it in this way and that all the relevant information is made available to us. That is in stark contrast to the situation pre-devolution. I will refer briefly to Janet Ryder's comments on housing. I was interested to hear that the main plank in Plaid Cymru's manifesto will be a commitment to housing. Housing is important, but a balance must be struck in the budget. It is easy to promise the money, but facing the reality of finding it is not so easy. We have heard that £2.9 billion needs to be spent on public sector housing. That sort of money is not available in the Assembly's budget. We must therefore consider private finance, as money cannot be taken from the health service or from education.

David Davies: I am astounded by this damascene conversion of a Liberal Democrat to the idea that Government coffers are not unlimited. Will you now advise the leader of the Liberal Democrats that increasing income tax by 1p will not help to pay for all the promises made in your national manifesto?

Peter Black: You are obviously reading different manifestos from ours, because we have never promised that. Our manifestos are costed and we have always said where the money would come from and how we would spend it.

Since 1992, we have spent more money on

tanwariant o ryw £2.6 miliwn y flwyddyn ar amddiffyn rhag llifogydd yn ei farn ef. Mae hynny yn bwynt cymharol fach yng nghydestun cyllideb o'r maint hwn, ond gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ystyried fy mhryder y bydd problemau a achoswyd gan fethiant i sicrhau mesurau i amddiffyn rhag llifogydd yn cynyddu. Os na wariwn ddigon yn awr, bydd yn rhaid inni wario llawer mwy yn y dyfodol i unioni canlyniadau'r tanwariant. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ailystyried yr eitem hon o'r gyllideb.

Peter Black: Croesawaf y gyllideb hon, yn enwedig yr arian ychwanegol ar gyfer addysg uwch, iechyd a llywodraeth leol. Mae'n glod i'r Gweinidog fod y gyllideb hon yn cael ei chyflwyno mewn ffordd mor dryloyw, y gallwn ei thrafod yn y ffordd hon a bod yr holl wybodaeth berthnasol ar gael inni. Mae hynny mewn gwrthgyferbyniad llwyr â'r sefyllfa cyn datganoli. Cyfeiriaf yn fyr at sylwadau Janet Ryder ar dai. Yr oedd yn ddi-ddorol clywed mai un o brif fesurau manifesto Plaid Cymru fydd ymrwymiad i dai. Mae tai yn bwysig, ond rhaid cael cydbwysedd yn y gyllideb. Mae'n hawdd addo'r arian, ond nid yw mor hawdd dod o hyd iddo mewn gwirionedd. Clywsom fod angen gwario £2.9 biliwn ar dai sector cyhoeddus. Nid yw swm o'r fath ar gael yng nghyllideb y Cynulliad. Felly rhaid inni ystyried cyllid preifat, gan na ellir tynnu arian oddi wrth y gwasanaeth iechyd nac oddi wrth addysg.

David Davies: Synnaf at y dröedigaeth hon gan Ddemocrat Rhyddfrydol at y syniad nad yw coffrau'r Llywodraeth yn ddiderfyn. A wnewch ddweud wrth arweinydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn awr na fydd cynnydd o 1c yn y dreth incwm yn helpu i dalu am yr holl addewidion yn eich manifesto cenedlaethol?

Peter Black: Mae'n amlwg eich bod yn darllen manifestos gwahanol i'n rhai ni, gan nad ydym erioed wedi addo hynny. Mae ein manifestos wedi'u costio ac yr ydym bob amser wedi dweud o ble y deuai'r arian a sut y byddem yn ei wario.

Er 1992, yr ydym wedi gwario mwy o arian

the capital programme on housing. We are spending more money on the home energy efficiency scheme, on fire safety, on homelessness and a range of other issues, all of which are important in terms of the overall housing agenda. I will refer briefly to three other issues. The first is police funding. I wholeheartedly endorse Alison Halford's comments on police funding. It is iniquitous that £11.3 million is being top-sliced from our budget and returned to the Home Office for distribution by means of grants in England and Wales. Although the Welsh police forces can bid for that money, and may ultimately secure more money than would otherwise have been the case, there is no guarantee that that money will return to Wales. If it does return to Wales, it will be ringfenced or hypothecated so that it can only be spent on certain projects. We need more control over police funding in Wales and to be able to decide the crime and disorder agenda ourselves and direct the resources accordingly.

Secondly, I welcome the money in the budget for Supporting People. The £23 million will, hopefully, be adequate. However, the most important aspect of it is that it is being introduced as annually managed expenditure, which means that we can respond to the demands of the service and made adjustments as we go along. That gives us room to grow.

Thirdly, I welcome the extra resources for local government to deal with the pressures it is under. The Minister's announcement on substance misuse and the scheme in the Rhondda is particularly worth mentioning. It is important that we are now getting to grips with this agenda. We are putting additional resources into combating substance misuse. We are identifying where the money has gone over the past two years and ensuring that that money reaches treatment centres so that they can tackle this malaise which affects large parts of Wales, particularly deprived communities.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call Phil Williams.

Phil Williams: I did not submit my name for

ar y rhaglen gyfalaf ar dai. Yr ydym yn gwario mwy o arian ar y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni yn y cartref, ar ddiogelwch tân, ar ddigartrefedd ac ar ystod o faterion eraill, y mae pob un ohonynt yn bwysig o ran yr agenda dai yn ei chyfanrwydd. Cyfeiriaf yn fyr at dri mater arall. Y cyntaf yw cyllid yr heddlu. Cefnogaf i'r carn yr hyn a ddywedodd Alison Halford am gyllid yr heddlu. Nid yw'n iawn bod £11.3 miliwn yn cael ei frigdorri o'n cyllideb a'i ad-dalu i'r Swyddfa Gartref i'w ddosbarthu drwy gyfrwng grantiau yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Er y gall heddluoedd yng Nghymru wneud cais am yr arian hwnnw, ac y gallant sicrhau mwy o arian yn y pen draw nag y byddai wedi dod i'w rhan fel arall, nid oes sicrwydd y daw'r arian hwnnw yn ôl i Gymru. Os daw yn ôl i Gymru, caiff ei glustnodi neu ei bridianu fel na fydd modd ei wario ond ar brosiectau penodol yn unig. Mae angen mwy o reolaeth dros gyllid yr heddlu yng Nghymru a'r gallu i benderfynu ar yr agenda trosedd ac anhrefn ein hunain a chyfeirio adnoddau yn unol â hynny.

Yn ail, croesawaf yr arian yn y gyllideb ar gyfer Cynorthwyo Pobl. Bydd y £23 miliwn, gobeithio, yn ddigon. Fodd bynnag, yr agwedd bwysicaf yw ei fod yn cael ei gyflwyno fel gwariant a reolir yn flynyddol, sy'n golygu y gallwn ymateb i ofynion y gwasanaeth ac addasu wrth inni fynd yn ein blaenau. Mae hynny yn rhoi lle i dyfu.

Yn drydydd, croesawaf yr adnoddau ychwanegol a roddir i lywodraeth leol i ymdopi â'r pwysau sydd arni. Mae'n werth nodi cyhoeddiad y Gweinidog ar gamddefnyddio sylweddau a'r cynllun yn y Rhondda yn arbennig. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn awr yn mynd i'r afael â'r agenda hon. Yr ydym yn neilltuo adnoddau ychwanegol i ymladd y camddefnydd o sylweddau. Yr ydym yn nodi lle y gwariwyd yr arian dros y ddwy flynedd diwethaf a sicrhau bod yr arian hwnnw yn cyrraedd canolfannau triniaeth fel y gallant fynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon sy'n effeithio ar rannau helaeth o Gymru, yn enwedig cymunedau difreintiedig.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Galwaf ar Phil Williams.

Phil Williams: Ni chyflwynais fy enw ar

this debate. I want to contribute to the debate on sustainable development.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have your name in front of me. I will cross it off the list.

Brian Gibbons: Thank you. I did submit my name by e-mail, I am glad to say. In response to David Ian Jones's contribution, a paper that went before the Health and Social Services Committee this morning deals with health service costs. If you read that, you will be better informed. You may not feel that all your questions are answered in it, but it addresses many of your concerns.

I never fail to be amazed by Plaid Cymru's gall. I was particularly amazed by Janet Ryder's contribution, which mentioned council tax in Plaid Cymru-run areas. A feature of this Assembly is that Plaid Cymru Members complain about services for which Plaid Cymru councils have responsibility. The main reason why those services are not delivered is probably that that Janet Ryder helpfully gave us, namely that the Plaid Cymru councillors are not prepared to take financial responsibility for the services for which Plaid Cymru Assembly Members are asking.

Janet Ryder: Thank you for giving me the opportunity to remind the Assembly of the tremendous debt in which years of having a Labour-run council left Rhondda Cynon Taf. The council has now successfully turned that around and, for the first time in many years, its accounts have been signed off and closed. No Labour-run council has achieved that in Rhondda for many years.

Brian Gibbons: That is because this Labour-led administration introduced the deprivation fund, of which the single biggest beneficiary is Rhondda Cynon Taf. Plaid Cymru failed to support that and in doing so it has also failed to give additional support to Merthyr, Blaenau Gwent, and Neath Port Talbot. The people will make their judgment.

The Finance Minister (Edwina Hart): I am

gyfer y ddadl hon. Hoffwn gyfrannu at y ddadl ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae eich enw o'm blaen. Fe'i tynnaf o'r rhestr.

Brian Gibbons: Diolch yn fawr. Cyflwynais fy enw drwy e-bost, mae'n dda gennyf nodi. Mewn ymateb i gyfraniad David Ian Jones, mae papur a gyflwynwyd gerbron y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol y bore yma yn trafod costau'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Os darllenwch y papur hwnnw, bydd mwy o wybodaeth gennych. Efallai na fyddwch yn teimlo ei fod yn ateb pob un o'ch cwestiynau, ond mae'n ymdrin â llawer o'ch pryderon.

Caf fy syfrdanu o hyd gan hyfdra Plaid Cymru. Synnais yn fawr at gyfraniad Janet Ryder, a gyfeiriodd at y dreth gyngor yn ardaloedd o dan arweiniad Plaid Cymru. Un nodwedd ar y Cynulliad hwn yw bod Aelodau Plaid Cymru yn cwyno am wasanaethau y mae gan gynghorau Plaid Cymru gyfrifoldeb drostynt. Y prif reswm tebygol pam na ddarperir y gwasanaethau hynny yw'r rheswm y bu Janet Ryder mor garedig â'i roi inni, sef nid yw cynghorwyr Plaid Cymru yn barod i ymgymryd â chyfrifoldeb ariannol dros y gwasanaethau y mae Aelodau Cynulliad Plaid Cymru yn gofyn amdanynt.

Janet Ryder: Diolch ichi am roi'r cyfle imi atgoffa'r Cynulliad o'r ddyled enfawr a fu gan gyngor Rhondda Cynon Taf ar ôl blynyddoedd o dan arweiniad y Blaid Lafur. Erbyn hyn, mae'r cyngor wedi trawsnewid y sefyllfa ac, am y tro cyntaf ers blynyddoedd lawer, mae ei gyfrifon wedi'u cymeradwyo ac wedi'u cau. Nid yw cyngor o dan arweiniad Llafur wedi llwyddo i wneud hynny yn y Rhondda ers blynyddoedd maith.

Brian Gibbons: Y rheswm am hynny yw bod y weinyddiaeth hon o dan arweiniad Llafur wedi cyflwyno'r gronfa amddifadedd, a Rhondda Cynon Taf sy'n elwa fwyaf ar y gronfa honno. Ni chefnogodd Plaid Cymru hynny ac o'r herwydd methodd hefyd â rhoi cymorth ychwanegol i Ferthyr, Blaenau Gwent, a Chastell-nedd Port Talbot. Bydd pobl yn barnu hynny.

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Edwina Hart): Yr

sure that many of us sympathise and agree with Alison's heartfelt points on police funding. I receive many questions from Members and from the public about the transparency of police funding and I feel, from the mood in the Chamber, that devolution of responsibility for the police will be a burning issue for the next Assembly.

I thank Peter Black for his contribution. He answered some of the points that I would otherwise have had to deal with. Brian Gibbons made the valuable point that some of the issues raised by David Ian Jones have been covered in the health paper that was before the Health and Social Service Committee today. You cannot put a price on democracy in the health service and we must consider that in terms of the 22 local health boards. I also read Derek Wanless's comments. He is reviewing the health service in Wales because we realise that this is not just about increasing expenditure; it is about increasing the effective use of money and examining the service's structures. I look forward to Derek Wanless's report and I hope that when we all, hopefully, return in May, we can implement the report's proposals and get an efficient and effective health service, given the money flowing through, and the changes that we need.

Local government and other bodies have debated the increase in national insurance and its impact on them. The generosity of the settlement in the total budget will allow them to accommodate this.

Sue Essex regularly raises the issue of the money available for flood protection with me, and I am sure that it will continue to be an issue in budget planning rounds. The underspends are small; I try to monitor them across the board. I do not like underspends, because they mean that you have not efficiently considered how money is spent. However, I assure you that we are acutely aware of the need for flood protection and that the Minister for Environment regularly raises the issue with me.

wyf yn siŵr bod llawer ohonom yn cydymdeimlo ac yn cytuno â'r pwyntiau a wnaed yn angerddol gan Alison ynglŷn â chyllid yr heddlu. Caf lawer o gwestiynau gan yr Aelodau a chan y cyhoedd am dryloywder cyllid yr heddlu a themlaff, o'r awyrgylch yn y Siambr, y bydd datganoli'r cyfrifoldeb dros yr heddlu yn bwnc llosg I'r Cynulliad nesaf.

Diolchaf i Peter Black am ei gyfraniad. Atebodd rai o'r pwyntiau y buasai'n rhaid imi ymdrin â hwy fel arall. Gwnaeth Brian Gibbons bwynt gwerthfawr fod rhai o'r materion a godwyd gan David Ian Jones wedi'u trafod yn y papur iechyd a gyflwynwyd i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol heddiw. Ni allwch roi pris ar ddemocratiaeth yn y gwasanaeth iechyd a rhaid inni ystyried hynny yng nghyd-destun y 22 o fyrdau iechyd lleol. Darllenais sylwadau Derek Wanless hefyd. Mae'n adolygu'r gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru gan ein bod yn sylweddoli nad oes a wnelo hyn â gwariant cynyddol yn unig; mae a wnelo â gwneud defnydd mwy effeithiol o arian ac archwilio strwythurau'r gwasanaeth. Edrychaf ymlaen at adroddiad Derek Wanless a gobeithiaf y gallwn, pan fyddwn oll, gobeithio, yn dychwelyd ym mis Mai, weithredu argymhellion yr adroddiad a sicrhau gwasanaeth iechyd effeithlon ac effeithiol, o gofio'r arian sy'n llifo i mewn iddo a'r newidiadau sydd eu hangen.

Mae llywodraeth leol a chyrff eraill wedi trafod y cynnydd mewn yswiriant gwladol ac effaith hynny arnynt. Oherwydd y setliad hael o fewn y gyllideb gyfan bydd modd iddynt ddarparu ar gyfer hyn.

Mae Sue Essex yn codi mater yr arian sydd ar gael ar gyfer amddiffyn rhag llifogydd gyda mi yn rheolaidd, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yn parhau i gael ei godi yn ystod cylchoedd cynllunio'r gyllideb. Swm bach yw'r tanwariant: ceisiaf ei fonitro'n gyffredinol. Nid wyf yn hoffi tanwariant, gan ei fod yn golygu nad ydych wedi ystyried sut y dylid gwario'r arian yn effeithlon. Fodd bynnag, rhoddaf sicrwydd ichi ein bod yn ymwybodol iawn o'r angen am amddiffyn rhag llifogydd a bod y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd yn codi'r mater gyda mi yn rheolaidd.

On Members' comments about what we have not done with regard to health and social services, the transfers in the health and social services budget are transparent. Members ask about social services; they should be well aware that the budget lines are being transferred into Cymorth, the children and youth support fund. That is a matter of record. This budget contains nothing that is not on record and that has not been discussed previously.

In reply to Janet Ryder's point about electioneering in Rhondda, I made it clear when I produced my final budget that I would make an announcement on this issue to the Assembly. Everything that I have announced in terms of higher education and other issues today was flagged up previously, as is right and proper, because I knew that I could not use the supplementary budget for electioneering purposes. I therefore put the changes on record last year. I reject your assumptions, Janet. If you were ever to get into power, you might play such games. However, I know that Labour will always be in power, and I do not play those games with money or with people's lives.

O ran sylwadau'r Aelodau ynglŷn â'r hyn nad ydym wedi'i wneud ym maes iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, mae'r symiau a drosglwyddir yn y gyllideb iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn dryloyw. Mae'r Aelodau yn holi ynglŷn â gwasanaethau cymdeithasol; dylent wybod yn iawn bod y llinellau cyllideb yn cael eu trosglwyddo i Cymorth, y gronfa gymorth i blant a phobl ifanc. Cofnodwyd hynny. Nid oes dim byd yn y gyllideb hon nad yw wedi ei gofnodi ac nad yw wedi'i drafod o'r blaen.

Mewn ymateb i bwynt Janet Ryder ynglŷn â cheisio ennill pleidleisiau yn y Rhondda, eglurais pan luniais fy nghyllideb derfynol y byddwn yn gwneud cyhoeddiad ar y mater hwn i'r Cynulliad. Nodwyd popeth yr wyf wedi'i gyhoeddi o ran addysg uwchradd a materion eraill heddiw o'r blaen, fel sy'n briodol, am fy mod yn gwybod na allwn ddefnyddio'r gyllideb atodol at ddibenion ymgyrchu etholiadol. Felly, cofnodais y newidiadau y llynedd. Gwrthodaf eich tybiaethau, Janet. Pe baech chi'n dod i rym, Janet, efallai y byddech yn ceisio gwneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, gwn y bydd Llafur mewn grym am byth, ac nid wyf yn chwarae ag arian na bywydau pobl.

*Cynnig (NDM1444): O blaid 30, Ymatal 12, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1444): For 30, Abstain 12, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw

Lloyd, Val
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
 The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick
 Davies, David
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Hancock, Brian
 Jones, David Ian
 Jones, Gareth
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

4.40 p.m.

Datblygu Cynaliadwy Sustainable Development

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1 and 3 in the name of Jocelyn Davies and amendment 4 in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Amendment 2 has not been selected.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 3 yn enw Jocelyn Davies a gwelliant 4 yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Nid yw gwelliant 2 wedi'i ddedhol.

The Minister for Environment (Sue Essex): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd (Sue Essex): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales welcomes the report on progress in sustainable development in 2002-03, presented by the Minister for Environment, which was e-mailed to Members on 19 March 2003, acknowledges the good progress made over the past year, and calls upon the Minister to publish a final report during April 2003, based upon this document. (NDM1445)

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn croesawu'r adroddiad ar hynt datblygu cynaliadwy yn 2002-03, a gyflwynwyd gan y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd ac a anfonwyd at yr Aelodau drwy'r e-bost ar 19 Mawrth 2003, yn cydnabod y cynnydd da a wnaethpwyd yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf ac yn galw ar y Gweinidog i gyhoeddi adroddiad terfynol yn ystod Ebrill 2003, wedi'i seilio ar y ddogfen hon. (NDM1445)

Today, we are putting the finishing touches to the third statutory report on progress made towards sustainable development in Wales. Last week, Members received the draft of our annual report for 2002-03, which will be finalised after this debate and, as required by

Heddiw, yr ydym yn rhoi'r cyffyrddiadau olaf i'r trydydd adroddiad statudol ar y cynnydd a wnaed tuag at ddatblygu cynaliadwy yng Nghymru. Yr wythnos diwethaf, derbyniodd yr Aelodau ddrafft o'n hadroddiad blynyddol ar gyfer 2002-03, a

law, at the end of the financial year in April.

Sustainable development is about ensuring a better quality of life for everyone now, and in generations to come, by seeking opportunities for simultaneous economic, environmental and social progress. I am proud of the action taken this year by, not only the Assembly, but a range of agencies and organisations in Wales, both at an international level and through practical achievements. Wales continues to lay the foundations for a more sustainable way of living and working, which will improve the quality of life for everyone in Wales, not just for this generation, but for those that will follow.

We have come a long way since 1999, and since the scheme was created two and a half years ago in November 2000. It is worth remembering that there were no role models for this scheme—we had to find our way forward in new territory. I always stress the strapline that we use: ‘learning to live differently’—with an emphasis on ‘learning’.

I now turn to the report. I draw your attention to the indicators and to some of the key points. This is the first year in which there has been some movement on the 12 initial indicators. I am pleased that, of the nine indicators for which new information is available, more than half have shown improvement. There was progress on the indicators on employment, education, crime, air quality, recycling and the Welsh language, and river quality remained good. The indicators that showed some decline—climate change, renewable energy and household waste per person—were based on figures compiled before 2002 and, therefore, do not reflect the current picture. We will have a more accurate picture next year. Our work on revising the sustainable development indicators has not yet been completed. However, we will drive that work forward in view of our obligation to renew the scheme after the election. We have reconvened the indicators working group to consider how to deal with this process. Other soon-to-be-published statistics on sustainable

gaiff ei gwblhau ar ôl y ddadl hon ac, fel sy'n ofynnol yn ôl y gyfraith, ar ddiwedd y flwyddyn ariannol yn Ebrill.

Mae datblygu cynaliadwy yn ymwneud â sicrhau ansawdd bywyd gwell i bawb yn awr, ac ar gyfer cenedlaethau i ddod, drwy geisio cyfleoedd ar gyfer cynnydd economaidd, amgylcheddol a chymdeithasol ochr yn ochr â'i gilydd. Yr wyf yn falch o'r camau a gymerwyd eleni nid yn unig gan y Cynulliad, ond gan amrywiaeth o asiantaethau a sefydliadau yng Nghymru, ar lefel ryngwladol a thrwy gyflawniadau ymarferol. Mae Cymru yn parhau i osod y sylfeini ar gyfer ffordd fwy cynaliadwy o fyw a gweithio, a fydd yn gwella ansawdd bywyd i bawb yng Nghymru, nid ar gyfer y genhedlaeth hon yn unig, ond hefyd ar gyfer cenedlaethau'r dyfodol.

Mae llawer wedi'i gyflawni ers 1999, ac ers i'r cynllun gael ei greu ddwy flynedd a hanner yn ôl yn Nhachwedd 2000. Mae'n werth cofio nad oedd unrhyw rôl-fodelau ar gyfer y cynllun hwn—yr oedd yn rhaid inni dorri tir newydd. Pwysleisïaf yr is-bennawd a ddefnyddiwn bob amser: ‘dysgu i fyw'n wahanol’—gyda phwyslais ar y ‘dysgu’.

Trof at yr adroddiad yn awr. Tynnaf eich sylw at y dangosyddion ac at rai o'r pwyntiau allweddol. Dyma'r flwyddyn gyntaf lle y cafwyd peth newid yn y 12 dangosydd cychwynnol. Yr wyf yn falch bod mwy na hanner o'r naw dangosydd y mae gwybodaeth newydd ar gael ar eu cyfer wedi dangos gwelliant. Cafwyd cynnydd ar y dangosyddion ar gyflogaeth, addysg, troseddau, ansawdd aer, ailgylchu a'r Gymraeg, a pharhaodd ansawdd yr afonydd i fod yn dda. Seilwyd y dangosyddion a oedd yn dangos rhywfaint o ddirywiad—newid yn yr hinsawdd, ynni adnewyddadwy a gwastraff cartrefi fesul person—ar ffigurau a luniwyd cyn 2002 ac felly, nid ydynt yn adlewyrchu'r sefyllfa bresennol. Bydd gennym ddarlun cywirach y flwyddyn nesaf. Ni chwblhawyd ein gwaith ar adolygu'r dangosyddion datblygu cynaliadwy eto. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn datblygu'r gwaith hwnnw o gofio ein rhwymedigaeth i adnewyddu'r cynllun ar ôl yr etholiad. Yr ydym wedi ailgynnull y gweithgor dangosyddion i ystyried sut y dylid ymdrin

development are also encouraging, particularly those on bathing water quality—a practical and symbolic indicator of the environment in Wales.

The majority of our scheme and action plan commitments has been, or is being, met. It is important that a Government responds to opportunities as well as to challenges. This year, inevitably, we have covered elements that are not in our action plan. We have exceeded all our expectations in terms of international activity: the Gauteng agreement was Wales's flagship this year. Members will remember that Rhodri Morgan signed that agreement at Johannesburg last year. Work on partnerships in Wales has also been strong; the concordat with Welsh local government was drawn up, for example.

Working with the public is also vital, and that matter was raised at the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee this morning. Public awareness is a key issue. We need to be in a position whereby people can be asked to take action and to make a contribution, so that they can make changes in their lives. They cannot do that in a vacuum. There is no point in urging people to act more sustainably unless they have the opportunity to do so. Raising awareness about waste is an obvious example of that. I have also commissioned preparatory work on a campaign based around the ecological footprint, which will be an opportunity to consider surveys of public awareness.

As regards our in-house activities, we take our responsibilities seriously. For example, in terms of green housekeeping, 70 per cent of the electricity that we buy is generated from renewable energy. We have also undertaken important work on mainstreaming sustainability. 'Well Being in Wales', a health document adopted by the Assembly last December, clearly highlights the contribution that the health service in Wales can make to sustainable development, bearing in mind that it is Wales's largest employer.

To summarise, we have learnt a great deal

â'r broses hon. Mae'r ystadegau a gyhoeddir yn fuan ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy hefyd yn galonogol, yn enwedig y rhai ar ansawdd dyfroedd nofio—dangosydd ymarferol a symbolaidd o'r amgylchedd yng Nghymru.

Mae'r mwyafrif o'r ymrwymadau yn ein cynllun a'n cynllun gwaith wedi'u bodloni neu yn cael eu bodloni. Mae'n bwysig bod Llywodraeth yn ymateb i gyfleoedd yn ogystal â heriau. Eleni, yn anochel, yr ydym wedi cwmpasu elfennau nad ydynt yn ein cynllun gweithredu. Yr ydym wedi mynd y tu hwnt i'r disgwyl o ran gweithgaredd rhyngwladol: cytundeb Gauteng oedd cytundeb pennaf Cymru eleni. Bydd yr aelodau'n cofio i Rhodri Morgan lofnodi'r cytundeb hwnnw yn Johannesburg y llynedd. Bu'r gwaith ar bartneriaethau yng Nghymru yn gryf hefyd; lluniwyd y concordat â llywodraeth leol Cymru, er enghraifft.

Mae gweithio â'r cyhoedd hefyd yn hanfodol, a chodwyd y mater hwnnw ym Mhwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth y bore yma. Mae ymwybyddiaeth gyhoeddus yn fater allweddol. Mae angen inni fod mewn sefyllfa lle y gellir gofyn i bobl gymryd camau a gwneud cyfraniad, fel y gallant wneud newidiadau yn eu bywydau. Ni allant wneud hynny mewn gwactod. Ofer yw annog pobl i weithredu'n fwy cynaliadwy oni chânt y cyfle i wneud hynny. Mae codi ymwybyddiaeth am wastraff yn enghraifft amlwg o hynny. Yr wyf hefyd wedi comisiynu gwaith paratoadol ar ymgyrch sy'n seiliedig ar yr olion troed ecolegol, a fydd yn gyfle i ystyried arolygon o ymwybyddiaeth gyhoeddus.

O ran ein gweithgareddau mewnol, yr ydym yn cymryd ein cyfrifoldebau o ddifrif. Er enghraifft, o ran materion mewnol gwyrdd, caiff 70 y cant o'r trydan a brynwn ei gynhyrchu o ynni adnewyddadwy. Yr ydym hefyd wedi gwneud gwaith pwysig ar osod cynaliadwyedd yn y brif ffrwd. Mae'r ddogfen 'Lles yng Nghymru', dogfen iechyd a fabwysiadwyd gan y Cynulliad fis Rhagfyr diwethaf, yn amlwg yn amlygu'r cyfraniad y gall y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru ei wneud i ddatblygu cynaliadwy, o ystyried mai dyma brif gyflogwr Cymru.

I grynhoi, yr ydym wedi dysgu llawer ers i'r

since the scheme was created two and a half years ago. We are happy to share our experience and to listen to others. It is pleasing that our efforts are being recognised elsewhere. Jonathan Porritt, the chair of the Sustainable Development Commission, wrote last summer in the sustainable regions newsletter:

'If anyone agrees with *The Economist's* recent conclusion that sustainable development is 'a rather woolly concept', all very well in theory but impossible to put into practice, I'm putting them on the first train to Cardiff.... That's not to say that Wales has all the answers to its serious and complex challenges.... But it does seem that Wales is trying to tackle these issues with gusto and tenacity, in a holistic, long-term way, looking for the mutually reinforcing economic, environmental and social benefits sustainable development requires.'

That is a telling remark. Jonathan Porritt is right—we do not have all the answers, but we are pursuing the sustainable development agenda seriously. I consider it a distinguishing feature of the Assembly.

Time is short, but I will mention a few key practical examples, because there are important practical examples behind the theory and the words. On transport, the concessionary fares scheme is about to be extended to men aged over 60. That is a good example of a social policy and a transport policy coming together, not only giving pensioners the opportunity to travel freely, but improving public transport in Wales. The waste strategy and dealing with waste sustainably are imperative. We are considering the supply and development of the markets. Brian Hancock gave us a good, practical example in Committee this morning of small and medium-sized enterprises in Wales that are already developing environmental products.

Tir Gofal is widely recognised, certainly at the European level, as an important sustainable agri-environmental scheme. The environmental development fund, or the

cynllun gael ei greu ddwy flynedd a hanner yn ôl. Yr ydym yn hapus i rannu ein profiad ac i wrando ar eraill. Mae'n dda bod ein hymdrechion yn cael eu cydnabod mewn manau eraill. Ysgrifennodd Jonathan Porritt, cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Cynaliadwy, yr haf diwethaf yng nghylchlythyr y rhanbarthau cynaliadwy:

Os oes unrhyw un yn cytuno gyda chasgliad diweddar *The Economist* fod datblygu cynaliadwy yn syniad eithaf niwlog, sy'n iawn mewn egwyddor ond sydd yn amhosibl i'w weithredu, rhoddaf hwy ar y trên cyntaf i Gaerdydd.... Nid yw hynny i ddweud bod gan Gymru'r holl atebion i'w heriau difrifol a chymleth.... Ond mae'n ymddangos bod Cymru'n ceisio mynd i'r afael â'r problemau hyn mewn modd brwdfrydig, di-droi, a chyfannol, ac o safbwynt hirdymor, gan chwilio am y buddion economaidd, amgylcheddol a chymdeithasol sy'n atgyfnerthu ei gilydd y mae datblygu cyaliadwy ei angen.

Mae hynny'n sylw grymus. Mae Jonathan Porritt yn iawn—nid yw'r holl atebion gennym, ond yr ydym yn mynd ar drywydd yr agenda datblygu cynaliadwy o ddifrif. Credaf ei fod yn nodwedd amlwg ar y Cynulliad.

Mae amser yn brin, ond crybwyllaf ychydig o enghreifftiau ymarferol allweddol, gan fod enghreifftiau ymarferol pwysig y tu ôl i'r ddamcaniaeth a'r geiriau. Ar drafnidiaeth, mae'r cynllun tocynnau mantais ar fin cael ei ymestyn i ddynion dros 60 oed. Mae hynny'n enghraifft dda o bolisi cymdeithasol a pholisi trafnidiaeth yn dod ynghyd, nid yn unig i roi'r cyfle i bensiynwyr deithio'n rhydd, ond i wella trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Mae'r strategaeth wastraff ac ymdrin â gwastraff yn gynaliadwy yn hanfodol. Yr ydym yn ystyried cyflenwad a datblygiad y marchnadoedd. Rhoddodd Brian Hancock enghraifft dda, ymarferol i ni yn y Pwyllgor y bore yma o fentrau bach a chanolig eu maint yng Nghymru sydd eisoes yn datblygu cynnyrch amgylcheddol.

Cydnabyddir Tir Gofal yn helaeth, yn arbennig ar y lefel Ewropeaidd, fel cynllun amaeth-amgylcheddol cynaliadwy pwysig. Mae'r gronfa datblygu economaidd, neu'r

sustainable development fund, has supported over 220 projects in national parks and areas of outstanding natural beauty, such as the Brecon Beacons Solar Club. There are many important initiatives on the ground. Cymru Ar-lein—Online for a Better Wales is a major initiative. Our business and environment action plan, recently launched by Andrew Davies, means that we are working with business, and puts us at the forefront of sustainable development. That gives us a stronger environmental goods and services business sector, and a much stronger green brand image on the world stage.

The Wales Tourist Board's 10-year strategy, 'Achieving our Potential', includes specific initiatives, such as the green sea partnership, which involves over 40 public, private and voluntary organisations, and the publication of a 'greening your business' guide. Integrating sustainable development into procurement is also important and we need to ensure that the Welsh procurement initiative comes through. Finally, on social housing, innovative work has been done through the social housing innovation programme, and on Rethinking Construction. These are just some of the huge number of examples of practice backing up the theory.

I will not support the amendments. We should not short-change ourselves in Wales. We have made big strides in two and a half years, including in the last 12 months, and we are starting to make a tangible difference. We have laid excellent foundations for the Assembly to build upon. Jocelyn, I think that I have explained that the legal situation means that we cannot publish the report until the end of the financial year. Therefore I will not support amendment 3. I will listen to Members' comments with great interest.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Cynigiad y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 1: dileu 'croesawu' a rhoi 'nodi' yn ei le.

Cynigiad welliant 3. Dileu popeth ar ôl '19 Mawrth 2003' a rhoi yn eu lle:

yn gresynu at fethiant y Llywodraeth i

gronfa datblygu cynaliadwy, wedi cynnal dros 220 o brosiectau mewn parciau cenedlaethol ac ardaloedd o harddwch naturiol eithriadol, fel Clwb Solar Bannau Brycheiniog. Mae llawer o fentrau pwysig ar waith. Mae Cymru Ar-lein—Online for a Better Wales yn fenter o bwys. Golyga ein cynllun gweithredu busnes a'r amgylchedd, a lansiwyd yn ddiweddar gan Andrew Davies, ein bod yn gweithio gyda busnes, ac mae'n sicrhau ein bod ar flaen y gad o ran datblygu cynaliadwy. Rhydd hynny sector busnes nwyddau a gwasanaethau amgylcheddol cryfach, a delwedd brand gwyrdd llawer cryfach yn y byd.

Mae strategaeth 10-mlynedd Bwrdd Croeso Cymru, 'Cyflawni ein Potensial', yn cynnwys mentrau penodol, fel partneriaeth y môr glas, sy'n cynnwys dros 40 o sefydliadau cyhoeddus, preifat a gwirfoddol, a chyhoeddi canllaw 'gwyrddu eich busnes'. Mae integreiddio datblygu cynaliadwy yn y broses gaffael hefyd yn bwysig ac mae angen inni sicrhau bod menter caffael Cymru yn llwyddiannus. Yn olaf, ar dai cymdeithasol, gwnaed gwaith arloesol drwy'r rhaglen arloesi tai cymdeithasol, ac ar Ailfeddwl am Adeiladu. Dyma rai o'r niferoedd mawr o enghreifftiau o arfer sy'n ategu'r ddamcaniaeth.

Ni chefnogaf y diwygiadau. Ni ddylem dwyllo ein hunain yng Nghymru. Gwnaethom ddatblygiadau mawr mewn dwy flynedd a hanner, yn cynnwys yn ystod y 12 mis diwethaf, ac yr ydym yn dechrau gwneud gwahaniaeth sylweddol. Yr ydym wedi gosod seiliau ardderchog i'r Cynulliad adeiladu arnynt. Jocelyn, credaf i mi esbonio bod y sefyllfa gyfreithiol yn golygu na allwn gyhoeddi'r adroddiad tan ddiwedd y flwyddyn ariannol. Felly ni chefnogaf welliant 3. Gwrandawaf ar sylwadau'r Aelodau â chryn ddiddordeb.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 1: delete 'welcomes' and replace with 'notes'.

I propose amendment 3. Delete all after '19 March 2003' and replace with:

regrets the failure of the Government to

a) gyflwyno'r adroddiad terfynol mewn pryd i'r Cynulliad gynnal dadl arno ac;

a) produce the final report in time for debate by the Assembly and;

b) i gwrdd â'r dyddiadau terfyn a nodir yn y cynllun gweithredu.

b) to meet its own deadlines identified in the action plan.

Mae Plaid Cymru yn cymryd datblygu cynaliadwy o ddifrif. Yr wyf wedi fy argyhoeddi bod y Gweinidog yn gwbl ddiffuant yn ei hymrwymiad i ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wedi cyflwyno'r gwelliannau hyn oherwydd nad oes unrhyw beth yn yr adroddiad hwn sy'n ein galluogi i weld beth yn union y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi ei gyflawni ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Mae gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ymrwymiad statudol i ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Un o'r pethau mwyaf cynhyrfus ynglŷn â Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 yw bod yr ymrwymiad hwnnw wedi ei osod arnom. Ar un adeg, yr oedd bron â bod yn unigryw, ond erbyn hyn mae sefydliadau gwleidyddol eraill wedi dilyn yr arweiniad, ac wedi derbyn yr un ymrwymiad statudol.

Plaid Cymru takes sustainable development seriously. I am convinced that the Minister is totally sincere in her commitment to sustainable development. However, we have tabled these amendments as there is nothing in this report that enables us to see what exactly the Government has achieved on sustainable development. The National Assembly has a statutory obligation as regards sustainable development. One of the most exciting aspects of the Government of Wales Act 1998 is that it imposes that commitment upon us. At one time, it was almost unique, but by now other political institutions have followed that lead and have assumed the same statutory obligation.

Os ydym am gymryd datblygu cynaliadwy o ddifrif, rhaid iddo fod yn greiddiol i bopeth y mae'r sefydliad hwn yn ei wneud. Dyna'r gwendid a'r methiant ar ran y Llywodraeth. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi cyfeirio, yn gwbl briodol, at nifer o gynlluniau unigol a gyflwynwyd yn enw datblygu cynaliadwy. Fodd bynnag, os ydym o ddifrif ynglŷn â chynaliadwyedd, nid oes modd ei ychwanegu i faes polisi—rhaid iddo fod yn greiddiol i'r maes polisi hwnnw. Efallai fod y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd wedi cyflwyno elfennau o ddatblygu cynaliadwy mewn un rhan o'i faes cyfrifoldeb, ond nid yw'r ystod polisiâu a gyflwynir ganddo yn gynaliadwy. Ni chaiff datblygu economaidd ei ystyried yn nhermau cynaliadwyedd, gan ei fod wedi'i seilio ar dwf economaidd. Rhaid gofyn a gaiff hynny ei ystyried mewn modd cynaliadwy, a'r ateb syml yw 'na chaiff'. Gellir sôn am gynlluniau a dderbynnir gan lywodraeth leol, ond mae'r hyn sy'n greiddiol i lywodraeth leol, sef Gwerth Gorau, yn tansilio cynaliadwyedd yn gyfan gwbl. Ni all awdurdodau lleol weithredu, meithrin a datblygu polisiâu cynaliadwy oherwydd cânt eu rhwymo gan Werth Gorau, sy'n eu gorfodi i chwilio am yr ateb mwyaf

If we are to take sustainable development seriously, it must be central to everything that this institution does. That is the weakness and the failure on the Government's part. The Minister has referred, quite appropriately, to several individual schemes that have been put forward in the name of sustainable development. However, if we are serious about sustainability, it is not possible to tag it on to a policy area—it must be central to that policy area. The Minister for Economic Development may have introduced elements of sustainable development in one part of his area of responsibility, but the range of policies that he introduces are not sustainable. Economic development is not considered in terms of sustainability, as it is based on economic growth. We have to ask whether that is considered in a sustainable way, and the simple answer is 'no'. It is possible to refer to schemes that are accepted by local authorities, but Best Value, which is central to local government, completely undermines sustainability. Local authorities cannot implement, encourage and develop sustainable policies because they are bound by Best Value, which forces them to look for the most cost-effective solution in the short

cost-effeithiol yn y tymor byr yn hytrach nag am ateb hirdymor.

4.50 p.m.

Nid wyf am ymddiheuro am gynnig y gwelliannau hyn. Er ein bod yn nodi y cymerwyd rhai camau, nid oes tystiolaeth yn yr adroddiad sy'n ein galluogi i groesawu yr hyn a wnaethpwyd. Nid oes dim ynddo sy'n dangos hynny. Ni chawsom ein hargyhoeddi hyd yn oed fod y Gweinidog wedi llwyddo i berswadio ei chyd-Weinidogion i dderbyn y dylai cynaliadwyedd fod yn rhan sylfaenol o ddatblygu polisiau—nid oes arwyddion o hynny. Gofynnwn am adroddiad llawn ac am gyfres lawn o ddangosyddion er mwyn inni allu gwerthuso'r hyn a gyflawnodd y Llywodraeth. Rhaid iddynt hefyd ddangos yn glir sut y mae cynaliadwyedd yn ganolog ym mhollisiau'r Llywodraeth. Gofynnwn am gyfres gyraeddadwy o dargedau mewn meysydd polisi allweddol a mecanwaith fydd yn ein galluogi i werthuso sut y mae cynaliadwyedd yn cyfrannu at ddatblygu polisiau.

We are asking for a full appraisal integration tool. We need that so that we can evaluate exactly what is being done. We also desperately need the technical advice note on renewable energy. Phil Williams will refer to renewable energy and to information technology in detail.

I will refer to the section on the Welsh language, which underlines the weakness in the way that this Government approaches sustainable development. Linguistic growth is important, but if you want to make a language sustainable, you need more than just growth. You have to create the opportunities for people to use the language every day, and that is not in the policy at this time. There are good elements, but we are looking for sustainable development to underpin everything this Government does. That just does not happen at present.

David Davies: I propose amendment 4 in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Delete

acknowledges the good progress made over

term rather than for the long-term solution.

I will not apologise for proposing these amendments. Although we note that some steps have been taken, there is no evidence in the report that enables us to welcome what has been achieved. There is nothing in it that shows that. We are not even persuaded that the Minister has succeeded in persuading her colleagues to accept that sustainability should be fundamental to the development of policies—there are no indications of that. We call for a full report and a full set of indicators so that we can evaluate what the Government has achieved. They must also show clearly how sustainability is central to the Government's policies. We call for an attainable series of targets in key policy areas and a mechanism that will enable us to evaluate the way in which sustainability contributes towards policy development.

Yr ydym yn gofyn am ddull integreiddio arfarniad llawn. Mae angen hynny arnom fel y gallwn werthuso'n union beth sy'n cael ei wneud. Mae angen y nodyn cyngor technegol ar ynni adnewyddadwy arnom yn ddirfawr hefyd. Bydd Phil Williams yn cyfeirio at ynni adnewyddadwy ac at dechnoleg gwybodaeth yn fanwl.

Cyfeirïaf at yr adran ar y Gymraeg, sy'n amlygu'r gwendid yn y ffordd y mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn mynd i'r afael â datblygu cynaliadwy. Mae twf ieithyddol yn bwysig, ond os ydych am wneud iaith yn gynaliadwy, mae angen mwy na thwf yn unig arnoch. Rhaid creu'r cyfleoedd i bobl ddefnyddio'r iaith bob dydd, ac nid yw hynny yn y polisi ar hyn o bryd. Ceir elfennau da, ond yr ydym yn disgwyl i ddatblygu cynaliadwy ategu popeth a wna'r Llywodraeth hon. Nid yw hynny'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd.

David Davies: Cynigïaf welliant 4 yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Dileu

yn cydnabod y cynnydd da a wnaed dros y

the past year,

I begin by expressing my commitment to preserving the environment for future generations, repeating, as I often do, that the Conservative Party will not hesitate to support the Government when it introduces stronger environmental legislation that will be of practical use. Recently, we supported air quality regulations and voted enthusiastically to support the Government. Unlike some opposition parties in recent history—and, as we saw today, even some coalition partners—we do not play games by voting against good legislation on the grounds that it does not go far enough. However we will not give the Government carte blanche to pass whatever legislation it wishes, because there is one difference between the Conservative Party and most of the other major political parties—

Kirsty Williams: Was not a Conservative Member expelled from the party group for abstaining in a budget vote? The rest of you voted against the budget because, in your view, it did not go far enough. You wanted more money, and you voted against extra money for the health service on the basis that it did not go far enough. I recall that one of your Members was expelled from your group.

David Davies: I do not think that we want to revisit the Rod Richards episode at the moment. At that time there were vigorous debates in the Conservative Party as to what course of action should be taken. That has nothing to do with the environment.

We will not give the Government carte blanche to pass whatever legislation it wishes. There is one major difference between us and other parties. The left seems to believe that there is a simple choice between a stronger economy and a cleaner environment. The Conservative Party recognises that a cleaner environment can only be paid for by a growing economy.

A recent comparison of over 100 nations—and I am looking at Phil Williams, because

flwyddyn ddiwethaf,

Dechreuaf drwy ddatgan fy ymrwymiad i ddiogelu'r amgylchedd ar gyfer y cenedlaethau i ddod, gan ailadrodd, fel y gwnaf yn aml, y bydd y Blaid Geidwadol yn barod i gynorthwyo'r Llywodraeth pan fydd yn cyflwyno deddfwriaeth amgylcheddol gryfach a fydd o ddefnydd ymarferol. Yn ddiweddar, cefnogwyd rheoliadau ansawdd aer gennym a phleidleisasom yn frwd o blaid y Llywodraeth. Yn wahanol i rai gwrthbleidiau yn ddiweddar—ac, fel y gwelwyd heddiw, rhai o bartneriaid y glymblaid hyd yn oed—nid ydym yn chwarae gemau drwy bleidleisio yn erbyn deddfwriaeth dda ar y sail nad yw'n mynd yn ddigon pell. Fodd bynnag ni fyddwn yn rhoi rhwydd hynt i'r Llywodraeth basio pa ddeddfwriaeth bynnag a ddymuna, gan fod un gwahaniaeth rhwng y Blaid Geidwadol a'r rhan fwyaf o'r pleidiau gwleidyddol mawr eraill—

Kirsty Williams: Oni waharddwyd Aelod Ceidwadol o grŵp y blaid am ymatal mewn pleidlais ar y gyllideb? Pleidleisiodd y gweddill ohonoch yn erbyn y gyllideb oherwydd, yn eich barn chi, nid oedd yn mynd yn ddigon pell. Yr oeddech am gael rhagor o arian, a phleidleisiasoch yn erbyn arian ychwanegol ar gyfer y gwasanaeth iechyd ar y sail nad oedd yn mynd yn ddigon pell. Cofiaf i un o'ch Aelodau gael ei wahardd o'ch grŵp.

David Davies: Ni chredaf ein bod am ailystyried hanes Rod Richards ar hyn o bryd. Ar y pryd cafwyd cryn drafod yn y Blaid Geidwadol o ran pa gamau y dylid eu cymryd. Nid oes a wnelo hynny ddim â'r amgylchedd.

Ni roddwn rwydd hynt i'r Llywodraeth basio pa ddeddfwriaeth bynnag a ddymuna. Mae un gwahaniaeth mawr rhyngom ni a phleidiau eraill. Mae'n ymddangos bod y chwith o'r farn bod dewis syml rhwng economi gryfach ac amgylchedd glanach. Mae'r Blaid Geidwadol yn cydnabod mai dim ond drwy economi sy'n tyfu y gellir talu am amgylchedd glanach.

Mesurodd cymhariaeth ddiweddar o dros 100 o wledydd—ac yr wyf yn edrych ar Phil

he likes statistics—measured the environmental dimensions and gross domestic product per capita of countries such as Tanzania and Ethiopia, and placed those two near the bottom of the league both in the measurement of GDP per capita and in the environmental indices measuring quality of life. North American and western European countries came out near the top—and it is interesting to note that Canada was placed far ahead of the USA. The reason for those results is that it is only as countries get wealthier that they can afford to apply evermore stringent environmental standards. However, if the standards applied are so stringent that they begin to damage the economy, limit growth, or strangle the ability of businesses to make the profits that fund the taxes that pay for the legislation, the environment will undoubtedly suffer more.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: It is often said that the Conservative Party knows the cost of everything, but the value of nothing. You have patently proved that during the last three minutes. You cannot buy a clean environment; you must develop policies to create one. When the Conservative Party decides to start defending and supporting such policies, you can start talking about sustainable development.

David Davies: You have just revealed the fundamental weakness in your political outlook. You can, and must, buy a cleaner environment. Yes, policies must be developed, but they must also be paid for. It is precisely because we can afford a cleaner environment that we have a better environment than many other countries in the developing world.

I wonder what stereotypes are conjured up by the following images: a multinational corporation, such as Esso, a voluntary organisation, such as Friends of the Earth, and a government body, such as the Environment Agency. I know what you think. You view the multinational as a large, faceless organisation run by businessmen who are only interested in generating vast profit. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Yes.'] It is fine that you feel that way, as it proves my

Williams, gan ei fod yn hoffi ystadegau—y dimensiynau amgylcheddol a chynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen mewn gwledydd fel Tansania ac Ethiopia, a rhoddodd y ddwy wlad honno yn agos at waelod y gynghair o ran mesur CMC y pen ac yn y mynegeion amgylcheddol sy'n mesur ansawdd bywyd. Daeth gwledydd Gogledd America a gorllewin Ewrop yn agos at frig y gynghair—ac mae'n ddi-ddorol sylwi bod Canada ymhell ar y blaen i UDA. Y rheswm dros y canlyniadau hynny yw mai dim ond wrth i wledydd fynd yn fwy cyfoethog y gallant fforddio cymhwyso safonau amgylcheddol mwy caeth. Fodd bynnag, os yw'r safonau a gymhwyswyd mor gaeth fel eu bod yn dechrau amharu ar yr economi, cyfyngu ar dwf, neu rwystro gallu busnesau i wneud yr elw sy'n ariannu'r trethi sy'n talu am y ddeddfwriaeth, mae'n siŵr y bydd yr amgylchedd yn dioddef mwy.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Dywedir yn aml bod y Blaid Geidwadol yn gwybod cost popeth, ond gwerth dim. Yr ydych wedi profi hynny'n glir yn ystod y tair munud diwethaf. Ni allwch brynu amgylchedd glân; rhaid ichi ddatblygu polisiau i greu un. Pan fydd y Blaid Geidwadol yn dechrau amddiffyn a chefnogi polisiau o'r fath, gallwch ddechrau siarad am ddatblygu cynaliadwy.

David Davies: Yr ydych newydd ddangos y gwendid sylfaenol yn eich agwedd wleidyddol. Gallwch, a rhaid ichi, brynu amgylchedd glanach. Oes, rhaid datblygu polisiau, ond rhaid talu amdanynt hefyd. Mae gennym amgylchedd gwell na llawer o wledydd eraill yn y byd sy'n datblygu oherwydd gallwn fforddio amgylchedd glanach.

Tybed pa ystrydebau a gyflëir gan y delweddau canlynol: corfforaeth amlwladol, fel Esso, sefydliad gwirfoddol, fel Cyfeillion y Ddaear, a chorff llywodraethol, fel Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd. Gwn beth yr ydych yn ei feddwl. Yr ydych yn ystyried y corfforaethau amlwladol fel sefydliadau mawr, anhysbys, a gaiff eu rhedeg gan ddynion busnes a'u hunig ddi-ddordeb yw gwneud elw mawr. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'Ydym.'] Mae'n iawn eich bod

point. That is your stereotyping.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Will you give way?

David Davies: I do not wish to have a running debate with you. No doubt, you also see pressure groups as being run on tiny budgets by dedicated idealists, and government organisations as being run by impartial and unbiased professionals. The reality is far more complicated than that. All those groups have their own vested interests. The multinationals have a vested interest in protecting their profits. However, we often forget that their directors are human beings, just like everyone else. They have families; they want to leave a legacy for future generations.

Larger pressure groups often have a budget of millions, and they also have a vested interest. The more people are concerned about the environment, the more likely they are to write out the cheques that pay the salaries—and, in some cases, large salaries—of the staff of these voluntary groups. Government organisations, such as the Environment Agency—which, overall, does a good job—also have a vested interest. The more they can talk up the problems, the more they can demand more funding from the relevant Minister.

That is not to attack any of those organisations, specifically or generically. In fact, I am a member of an environmental pressure group, Surfers against Sewage. I believe that such groups have played a hugely positive role in highlighting environmental problems, just as the Environment Agency has played its part in solving those problems. However, to unquestioningly swallow every statistic, to pass legislation as a result of scare stories, and to swallow all of the stereotypes—as you clearly have—is tremendously naive. If we are to become a respected institution, we must guard against knee-jerk legislation.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You must wind up.

yn teimlo fel yna, gan ei fod yn profi fy mhwynt. Dyna eich ystrydebu chi.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: A ildiwch?

David Davies: Nid wyf am gael trafodaeth barhaus â chi. Yn ddiau, yr ydych hefyd yn ystyried carfanau pwyso yn grwpiau sy'n cael eu rhedeg ar gyllidebau bach gan ddelfrydwyr ymroddedig, a sefydliadau'r llywodraeth yn rhywbeth sy'n cael ei redeg gan bobl broffesiynol amhleidiol a diduedd. Mae'r realiti yn llawer mwy cymhleth na hynny. Mae i bob grŵp ei fudd ei hun. Mae'r cwmnïau amlwladol yn gweithredu er eu budd eu hunain i ddiogelu eu helw. Fodd bynnag, yn aml byddwn yn anghofio mai bodau dynol yw eu cyfarwyddwyr, fel pawb arall. Mae ganddynt deuluoedd; maent am adael etifeddiaeth ar gyfer cenedlaethau'r dyfodol.

Yn aml mae gan garfanau pwyso gyllideb o filiynau o bunnoedd, ac mae i bob un ei fudd ei hun hefyd. Po fwyaf y bydd pobl yn pryderu am yr amgylchedd, y mwyaf tebygol y byddant o ysgrifennu'r sicciau sy'n talu'r cyflogau—ac, mewn rhai achosion, cyflogau mawr—staff y grwpiau gwirfoddol hyn. Mae i sefydliadau'r llywodraeth, fel Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd—sydd, yn gyffredinol, yn gwneud gwaith da—fudd hefyd. Po fwyaf y gallant chwyddo'r problemau, y mwyaf y gallant fynnu mwy o arian gan y Gweinidog perthnasol.

Nid ymosod ar un o'r sefydliadau hynny, yn benodol neu yn gyffredinol yw diben hyn. A dweud y gwir, yr wyf yn aelod o garfan bwysu amgylcheddol, Surfers against Sewage. Credaf fod grwpiau o'r fath wedi chwarae rôl gadarnhaol iawn wrth amlygu problemau amgylcheddol, yn union fel y mae Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd wedi chwarae ei rhan wrth ddatrys y problemau hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae derbyn pob ystadegyn yn ddigwestiwn, pasio deddfwriaeth o ganlyniad i straeon braw, a derbyn yr holl ystrydebau—fel y gwnaethoch chi mae'n amlwg—yn anhygoel o ddiniwed. Er mwyn dod yn sefydliad a berchir, rhaid inni ddiogelu rhag deddfwriaeth ddifeddl.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Rhaid ichi ddirwyn i ben.

David Davies: I will just end on a positive note. [*Laughter.*] The situation has been getting better for a long time. We have seen improvements in the food we eat, the water we drink and the air we breathe. Over the last year—

David Davies: Yr wyf am orffen ar nodyn cadarnhaol. [*Chwerthin.*] Bu'r sefyllfa yn gwella ers peth amser. Gwelwyd gwelliannau yn y bwyd a fwytawn, y dŵr a yfwn a'r aer a anadlwn. Dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I must interrupt this debate, as we have reached 5 p.m. and, under Standing Order No. 6.3(v), I must protect the time for the short debate. I remind Members that, under Standing Order No. 6.18, they may propose that the current debate be allowed to continue today or adjourned to another day.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Rhaid imi dorri ar draws y ddadl hon, gan ei bod yn 5 p.m. ac, yn ôl Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.3(v), rhaid imi ddiogelu'r amser ar gyfer y ddadl fer. Atgoffaf Aelodau y gallant gynnig, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.18, fod y ddadl bresennol yn parhau heddiw neu'n cael ei gohirio tan ddiwrnod arall.

I see that no Member wishes to make such a proposal. Therefore, under Standing Order No. 6.3(v), we move on to the short debate.

Gwelaf nad oes unrhyw Aelod arall yn dymuno gwneud cynnig o'r fath. Felly, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif. 6.3(v), symudwn ymlaen i'r ddadl fer.

The Business Minister (Carwyn Jones): Point of order. Should there not be a vote before we move on?

Y Trefnydd (Carwyn Jones): Pwynt o drefn. Oni ddylid cael pleidlais cyn inni symud ymlaen?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: No. There is an opportunity for Members to make a proposal under Standing Order No. 6.18, but no such proposal was made. Therefore, under Standing Order No. 6.3(v), we move on to the short debate.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Na ddylid. Ceir cyfle i'r Aelodau wneud cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif. 6.18, ond ni wnaed cynnig o'r fath. Felly, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif. 6.3(v), symudwn ymlaen i'r ddadl fer.

5.00 p.m.

Dadl Fer Short Debate

Rhaid Cadw Dyffryn Wysg i Genedlaethau'r Dyfodol Fedru ei Fwynhau The Usk Valley must be Preserved for the Enjoyment of Future Generations

David Davies: I am grateful for the opportunity to introduce a short debate. I will allow contributions by Janet Davies, Eleanor Burnham and, if there is sufficient time, Kirsty Williams. If anyone else is interested in speaking, I will try to fit you in.

David Davies: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i gyflwyno dadl fer. Byddaf yn caniatáu cyfraniadau gan Janet Davies, Eleanor Burnham ac, os bydd digon o amser, Kirsty Williams. Os bydd gan unrhyw un arall ddiddordeb mewn siarad, fe geisiaf eich cynnwys.

About a year ago, it became apparent that the Usk valley faced a potential threat from the possibility of sand and gravel extraction, or, in other words, quarrying. This became apparent from the consultation on the draft 'Minerals Technical Advice Note (Wales)—

Tua blwyddyn yn ôl, daeth yn amlwg bod Dyffryn Wysg yn wynebu perygl oherwydd y posibilrwydd o echdynnu tywod a graean, neu, mewn geiriau eraill, chwarelu. Daeth hyn yn amlwg o'r ymgynghoriad ar y Nodyn Cyngor Technegol ar Fwynhau (Cymru)—

Aggregates', which required large areas of the Usk valley to be set aside for future sand and gravel extraction. [*Interruption.*]

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Members are allowed to talk in the Chamber, and procedural arguments and discussions can take place, but they must be conducted quietly.

David Davies: Twenty-nine sites are listed, and they run through the Usk valley in the Monmouthshire County Council area and are also in parts of the Brecon Beacons National Park. It has been suggested that between 100,000 and 500,000 tonnes of sand could be extracted from these sites annually. The matter was discussed by Monmouthshire County Council, and local people quickly formed an action group to fight against these proposals. I spoke at a public meeting in June 2002, and was delighted with the strength of support for protecting the Usk valley that came from people from all over the county.

The current situation is that the vast majority of sand and gravel used in south Wales comes from dredging that takes place in the Bristol channel. The background to the decision to consider extraction from the Usk valley stems from an understandable concern over the effect that the current dredging in the channel is having on sand movement on beaches across south Wales.

I am more familiar than most with these beaches, particularly those that run from Nash Point to Langland Bay, as I have been surfing off them on a weekly, and sometimes daily, basis for the last 14 years. From my own observations, there appears to be some sand loss, particularly from Rest Bay and Porthcawl. However, many other factors could be responsible for this.

The whole of the Bristol channel area is subject to an extremely strong tidal pattern. The River Severn has the second highest tidal range in the world, and as a layman I can appreciate that strong tides, combined with waves that can regularly reach the beaches at heights of 10ft or more at certain times of the

Cerrig Môn', sy'n ei gwneud yn ofynnol i ardaloedd mawr o ddyffryn Wysg gael eu neilltuo ar gyfer echdynnu tywod a graean yn y dyfodol. [*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Caniateir i Aelodau siarad yn y Siambr, a gellir cynnal dadleuon a thrafodaethau gweithdrefnol, ond rhaid eu cynnal yn ddistaw.

David Davies: Rhestrir naw safle ar hugain, ac maent yn rhedeg drwy ddyffryn Wysg yn ardal Cyngor Sir Sir Fynwy ac maent hefyd mewn rhannau o Barc Cenedlaethol Bannau Brycheiniog. Awgrymwyd y gallai rhwng 100,000 a 500,000 o dunelli o dywod gael eu hechdynnu o'r safleoedd hyn bob blwyddyn. Trafodwyd y mater gan Gyngor Sir Sir Fynwy, ac ni fu fawr o dro cyn i'r bobl leol sefydlu grŵp gweithredu i wrthwynebu'r cynigion hyn. Anerchais gyfarfod cyhoeddus ym mis Mehefin 2002, ac yr oeddwn yn falch iawn o weld maint y gefnogaeth tuag at ddiogelu dyffryn Wysg gan bobl o bob rhan o'r sir.

Y sefyllfa bresennol yw y daw'r rhan fwyaf o dywod a graean a ddefnyddir yn ne Cymru o dreillio sy'n digwydd ym Môr Hafren. Mae cefndir y penderfyniad i ystyried echdynnu o ddyffryn Wysg yn deillio o bryder dealladwy ynglŷn â'r effaith y mae'r treillio presennol ym Môr Hafren yn ei gael ar symudiadau tywod ar draethau ar draws de Cymru.

Yr wyf yn fwy cyfarwydd â'r traethau hyn na'r rhan fwyaf o'r bobl, yn arbennig y traethau sy'n rhedeg o Nash Point i Fae Langland, am fy mod wedi bod yn syrffio arnynt yn wythnosol, ac weithiau'n ddyddiol, dros yr 14 mlynedd diwethaf. O'r hyn yr wyf wedi'i weld, ymddengys bod rhywfaint o dywod wedi diflannu, yn arbennig o Rest Bay a Phorthcawl. Fodd bynnag, gallai llawer o ffactorau eraill fod yn gyfrifol am hyn.

Mae ardal gyfan môr Hafren yn cael ei hamlygu i batrwm llanw cryf iawn. Yr Afon Hafren sydd â'r ail ystod llanw uchaf yn y byd, ac fel lleygwr gallaf werthfawrogi y bydd llanwau cryf, ynghyd â thonau a all gyrraedd y traethau'n rheolaidd ar uchder o 10tr neu fwy yn ystod rhai adegau o'r

year, will inevitably have an impact on sand movement.

However, I do not pretend to be an expert. All the expert advice that I have heard suggests to me that, if there is sand loss across all those beaches—it is a bit of an ‘if’—it could be due to a number of reasons. One way of getting expert opinion would be to undertake a further study, and that is why I fully support the bid made by Cardiff University’s school of engineering, which has a world-renowned expertise in measuring the different factors that affect sand movement around coastal areas.

If sand loss can be shown to be the result of dredging—that is a big ‘if’—there are three options. The first would be to stop sand and gravel extraction everywhere, but that cannot be done because we need sand for building purposes. The second option would be to stop dredging and rely on land-based extraction. The third option would be to replace the sand artificially, which is a relatively common and inexpensive procedure that is carried out on beaches around Europe and even in the UK.

If we have a problem, I would have thought that the last option would be the obvious course of action. However, the Assembly has instead opted to assume that there is a problem and then decide, without sufficient information, that the only way to solve the problem—which may not even exist—is to take the drastic course of action of putting in place a mechanism that would allow quarries to be set up throughout the Usk valley. Quite rightly, these proposals have been strongly resisted by the local authority and by the Brecon Beacons National Park. They will use the Assembly’s own regulations to argue against setting these areas aside. Paragraph 13 of ‘Minerals Planning Guidance (Wales)’ states that safeguarding areas requires that:

‘the location and quality of mineral is known, and that the environmental constraints associated with extraction have been considered.’

Neither of those two stipulations have been

flwyddyn, yn anochel yn cael effaith ar symudiad tywod.

Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn honni fy mod yn arbenigwr. Mae’r holl gyngor arbenigol a glywais yn awgrymu i mi, os yw tywod yn diflannu ar draws yr holl draethau hynny—ac mae’n ‘os’ mawr—gallai nifer o resymau fod yn gyfrifol am hyn. Un ffordd o sicrhau barn arbenigol fyddai cynnal astudiaeth bellach, a dyna paham y rhof fy nghefnogaeth lwyr i’r cynnig a wnaed gan goleg perianeg Prifysgol Cymru, sydd ag arbenigedd bydenwog o ran mesur y ffactorau gwahanol sy’n effeithio ar symudiadau tywod o amgylch ardaloedd arfordirol.

Os gellir dangos mai treillio sy’n achosi i dywod ddiflannu—ac mae’n ‘os’ mawr—mae tri opsiwn. Y cyntaf fyddai rhoi’r gorau i echdynnu tywod a graean ym mhob man, ond ni ellir gwneud hynny oherwydd mae angen tywod arnom at ddibenion adeiladu. Yr ail opsiwn fyddai rhoi’r gorau i dreillio a dibynnu ar echdynnu ar y tir. Y trydydd opsiwn fyddai adnewyddu’r tywod yn artiffisial, sy’n weithdrefn gymharol gyffredin a rhad a gynhelir ar draethau ledled Ewrop a hyd yn oed yn y DU.

Os oes gennym broblem, credaf mai’r opsiwn olaf fyddai’r cam gweithredu amlwg. Fodd bynnag, yn hytrach mae’r Cynulliad wedi dewis cymryd bod yna broblem ac yna penderfynu, heb wybodaeth ddigonol, mai’r unig ffordd i ddatrys y broblem—nad yw hyd yn oed yn bodoli o bosibl—yw cymryd camau gweithredu eithafol a sefydlu system a fyddai’n caniatáu i chwareli gael eu sefydlu ar hyd dyffryn Wysg. Wrth reswm, mae’r awdurdod lleol a Pharc Cenedlaethol Bannau Brycheiniog wedi gwrthwynebu’r cynigion hyn yn chwyrn. Byddant yn defnyddio rheoliadau’r Cynulliad ei hun i ddadlau yn erbyn neilltuo’r ardaloedd hyn. Mae paragraff 13 ‘Arweiniad Cynllunio Mwynau (Cymru)’ yn nodi, er mwyn diogelu ardaloedd ei bod yn ofynnol:

‘bod lleoliad ac ansawdd y mwynau yn hysbys a bod y cyfyngiadau amgylcheddol sy’n gysylltiedig a’u cloddio wedi’u hystyried.’

Nid yw’r naill amod na’r llall wedi’u bodloni.

met. The location and quality of material has not been properly documented. Of the 29 sites that are earmarked for being set aside, there is no bore-hole data for 15 of them. I have also been informed by experts, such as Professor Ron Bridle from Cardiff University's school of engineering, that the sand that could be extracted from the valley area is likely to be coarser and of a poorer quality, and therefore of less use to the building industry, than the sand that comes from the ocean—it depends upon the amount of movement and rubbing of particles that takes place.

On environmental constraints, despite all of its debates on sustainable development, the Assembly does not seem to care enough, because the Usk Valley is, without doubt, one of the most beautiful parts of Wales. Parts of the affected area lie within the national park, and the Usk river is a candidate for special area of conservation status. The valley is designated a special landscape area. Therefore, it should come as no surprise that tourism is the single biggest industry in the area in terms of generating employment and revenue.

If quarrying were allowed, all of those jobs would be under threat, as would the quality of life of everyone living in the area. The quarries would form a scar running the length of the valley. When I met representatives from Hanson plc to discuss how the effect could be mitigated, they accepted that, given the valley's topography, it would be difficult to hide the visual intrusion caused by the quarrying. There would also be noise, not only from the workings and explosions, but also from hundreds of lorries travelling up and down roads, some of which are already falling apart. Our valley would be polluted by dust and particles and our tourism-based economy would choke on the fumes, dust and noise.

At least one potential applicant has met me to discuss a proposed planning application. I am reliably informed that one large company is interested. There would currently be no grounds for considering such an application. However, if these areas were set aside for quarrying, a refusal of an application by the

Nid yw lleoliad nac ansawdd y deunydd wedi'u dogfennu'n briodol. O'r 29 safle sydd wedi'u clustnodi i'w neilltuo, nid oes data tyllau turio ar gael ar gyfer 15 ohonynt. Yr wyf hefyd wedi'm hysbysu gan arbenigwyr, yr Athro Ron Bridle o goleg peirianeg Prifysgol Caerdydd yn eu plith, bod y tywod y gellid ei echdynnu o ardal y dyffryn yn debygol o fod yn frasach ac o ansawdd salach, ac felly byddai'n llai defnyddiol i'r diwydiant adeiladu, na'r tywod a ddaw o'r môr—mae'n dibynnu ar nifer y symudiadau a'r gronynnau yn rhwbio yn erbyn ei gilydd.

O ran cyfyngiadau amgylcheddol, er gwaethaf ei holl ddadleuon ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy, ymddengys nad yw'r Cynulliad yn malio digon, oherwydd mae Dyffryn Wysg, heb amheuaeth, yn un o'r rhannau prydferthaf yng Nghymru. Mae rhannau o'r ardal yr effeithir arni o fewn y parc cenedlaethol, ac mae afon Wysg yn ymgeisydd ar gyfer statws ardal cadwraeth arbennig. Mae'r dyffryn wedi'i bennu yn ardal tirwedd arbennig. Felly, ni ddylai ein synnu mai twristiaeth yw'r diwydiant mwyaf yn yr ardal yn nhermau creu cyflogaeth a chynhyrchu refeniw.

Pe caniateid chwarelu, byddai'r holl swyddi hynny dan fygythiad, yn ogystal ag ansawdd bywyd pawb sy'n byw yn yr ardal. Byddai'r chwareli'n ffurfio craith ar hyd y dyffryn. Pan gyfarfûm â chynrychiolwyr o Hanson ccc i drafod sut y gellid lleihau'r effaith, derbyniasant, o ystyried topograffi'r dyffryn, y byddai'n anodd cuddio'r ymyrraeth weledol y byddai'r chwarelu'n ei greu. Byddai sŵn hefyd, nid yn unig o ganlyniad i'r gweithfeydd a'r ffrwydradau, ond hefyd oherwydd y cannoedd o lorïau'n teithio ar hyd y ffyrdd; y mae rhai o'r ffyrdd hynny eisoes yn dirywio. Byddai ein dyffryn yn cael ei lygru gan lwch a gronynnau a byddai ein heconomi sy'n seiliedig ar dwristiaeth yn mygu ar y mygdarth, y llwch a'r sŵn.

Mae o leiaf un darpar ymgeisydd wedi cwrdd â mi i drafod cais cynllunio arfaethedig. Mae gennyf wybodaeth ddibynadwy sy'n dweud bod un cwmni mawr wedi mynegi diddordeb. Ni fyddai unrhyw sail ar hyn o bryd ar gyfer ystyried cais o'r fath. Fodd bynnag, petai'r ardaloedd hyn yn cael eu neilltuo ar gyfer

local planning authority—the council or the parks, which certainly would refuse it—would lead to an appeal to the Assembly. The applicants would argue that setting aside these areas would be a good reason—a presumption, if you like—for allowing extraction to take place. We have all seen what happens at these public inquiries: an expensive barrister well-versed in planning law would be appointed by the large companies interested in quarrying and no-one could guarantee the outcome.

If these areas are left out of the unitary development plan, the Minister must accept that there will be no quarrying. However, if local authorities are forced to include them in the UDP, there may be quarries. We must assume that, at some point, there almost certainly will be. On behalf of everyone living in Monmouthshire, and those who care about our rural environment, I ask the Minister to reconsider this issue. Do not safeguard any parts of the Usk Valley for future quarrying developments, but safeguard it for future generations to enjoy.

Janet Davies: I thank David for allowing me to speak in this debate. We all agree that the Usk valley is beautiful and should be preserved for future generations. However, it is dangerous to set up the Usk Valley against the Gower when it comes to sand and gravel extraction because there are problems for both areas. We are not sure about the effects of extraction in the Bristol channel, but care must be taken on that.

It is crucial that we reduce the use of sand and gravel. People who want to build patios in their gardens and who want new roads should be aware that the effect is to increase the need for sand and gravel. We should use recycled materials wherever possible, accepting that it is not always possible. I agree with most of what David said. There is overkill on the number of safeguarded areas, and we should minimise that amount. Other factors are contributing to the degradation of the landscape in other areas of the Usk valley. The big plastic banners that were used

chwarelu, byddai gwrthod cais gan yr awdurdod cynllunio lleol—y cyngor neu'r parciau, a fyddai'n sicr o'i wrthod—yn arwain at apêl i'r Cynulliad. Byddai'r ymgeiswyr yn dadlau y byddai neilltuo'r ardaloedd hyn yn rheswm da—yn rhagdybiaeth, os hoffech—dros ganiatáu echdynnu. Mae pob un ohonom wedi gweld beth sy'n digwydd yn yr ymchwiliadau cyhoeddus hyn: byddai bargyfreithiwr drud sydd â phrofiad helaeth o'r gyfraith gynllunio yn cael ei benodi gan y cwmnïau mawr sydd â diddordeb mewn cloddio ac ni allai unrhyw un warantu'r canlyniad.

Os na chaiff yr ardaloedd hyn eu cynnwys yn y cynllun datblygu unedol, rhaid i'r Gweinidog dderbyn na fydd unrhyw chwarelu. Fodd bynnag, os caiff awdurdodau lleol eu gorfodi i'w cynnwys yn y CDU, efallai y bydd chwareli. Rhaid inni dybio ei bod yn sicr y bydd chwareli rhywbryd. Ar ran pawb sy'n byw yn Sir Fynwy, a'r rhai sy'n poeni am ein hamgylchedd gwledig, gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ailystyried y mater hwn. Peidiwch â diogelu unrhyw ran o Ddyffryn Wysg ar gyfer datblygiadau chwarelu yn y dyfodol, ond diogelwch y dyffryn er mwyn i genedlaethau'r dyfodol ei fwynhau.

Janet Davies: Diolchaf i David am ganiatáu imi siarad yn y ddadl hon. Yr ydym oll yn cytuno bod dyffryn Wysg yn hardd ac y dylid ei ddiogelu ar gyfer cenedlaethau'r dyfodol. Fodd bynnag, mae'n beryglus cymharu Dyffryn Wysg â Phenrhyn Gŵyr wrth drafod echdynnu tywod a graean oherwydd mae problemau'n bodoli yn y ddwy ardal. Nid ydym yn siŵr o effeithiau echdynnu ym môr Hafren, ond dylid trin y mater hwnnw'n ofalus.

Mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn lleihau'r defnydd a wneir o dywod a graean. Dylai pobl sydd yn dymuno adeiladu patios yn eu gerddi ac sydd am gael ffyrdd newydd fod yn ymwybodol bod hyn yn cynyddu'r angen am dywod a graean. Dylem ddefnyddio deunyddiau wedi'u hailgylchu lle bynnag y bo'n bosibl, gan dderbyn nad yw hyn bob amser yn bosibl. Cytunaf â'r rhan fwyaf o'r hyn a ddywedodd David. Mae yna ormod o ardaloedd a ddiogelir, a dylem leihau'r nifer hwnnw. Mae ffactorau eraill yn arwain at ddirywio tirwedd mewn ardaloedd eraill yn

in a liberty march have not been destroyed for seven months, and nitrates are leaking into the water courses. We must look at the whole picture; it is not just about sand and gravel extraction.

5.10 p.m.

Eleanor Burnham: I am not an expert on the Usk valley, so my contribution will be brief. It is interesting to hear a Tory talking about these issues. I sat here in amazement because I thought that he would take a different slant, but I was badly briefed. However, it fascinates me that, in this pre-election period, the Tories are jumping up and down and talking about sustainable development. I apologise for not contributing to the previous debate on sustainable development, but the Assembly is upholding it. Sue Essex has piloted many excellent schemes, and I have no doubt that she will use her judgment and experience to ensure that the problems of the Usk valley and of the Bristol channel, which are just as worrying, are eliminated.

Kirsty Williams: I declare an interest. My husband owns 200 acres of agricultural land alongside the river Usk. I share David Davies's concerns. The community councils in Llangynidr, Talybont-on-Usk, and Cradoc are deeply concerned about what these proposals could mean for those parts of the national park. It is incomprehensible that an area, which is included in the national park because it is important, should be exposed to developments of this kind. My constituents are worried. When this was discussed previously, I asked the Minister to write to the community councils in my constituency that were concerned about this issue. She undertook to do that, and I would be grateful if she would confirm whether or not she did so.

The Minister for Environment (Sue Essex): I am in a strange position here. I understood the title of this short debate to encompass a much wider issue. David, you concentrated on sand and gravel and, because we have had various discussions on that subject, I thought that you would want to raise wider issues relating to the Usk valley. I

nyffryn Wysg. Nid yw'r baneri plastig mawr a ddefnyddiwyd mewn gorymdaith dros ryddid wedi'u dinistrio ar ôl saith mis, ac mae nitradau yn gollwng i'r cyrsiau dŵr. Rhaid inni edrych ar y darlun cyfan; nid echdynnu tywod a graean yw'r unig broblem.

Eleanor Burnham: Nid wyf yn arbenigwraig ar ddyffryn Wysg, felly bydd fy nghyfraniad yn fyr. Mae'n ddiddorol clywed Tori yn trafod y materion hyn. Eisteddais yma mewn syndod oherwydd credais y byddai'n cymryd safbwynt gwahanol, ond ni chefais y wybodaeth gywir. Fodd bynnag, rhyfeddaff, yn y cyfnod hwn cyn yr etholiad, bod y Toriaid yn creu stŵr ac yn trafod datblygu cynaliadwy. Ymddiheuraf am beidio â chyfrannu i'r ddatl flaenorol ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy, ond mae'r Cynulliad yn cefnogi hynny. Mae Sue Essex wedi cyflwyno llawer o gynlluniau peilot gwych, ac yr wyf yn sicr y bydd yn defnyddio ei barn a'i phrofiad i sicrhau y caiff problemau dyffryn Wysg a môr Hafren, sy'n peri'r un math o bryderon, eu datrys.

Kirsty Williams: Datganaf fuddiant. Mae fy ngŵr yn berchen ar 200 erw o dir amaethyddol gerllaw afon Wysg. Rhannaf bryderon David. Mae cynghorau cymuned Llangynidr, Talybont-ar-Wysg, a Chradoc yn bryderus iawn ynglŷn â'r hyn y gallai'r cynigion hyn ei olygu i'r rhannau hynny o'r parc cenedlaethol. Mae y tu hwnt i ddirnadaeth bod ardal, sydd wedi'i chynnwys yn y parc cenedlaethol am ei bod yn bwysig, yn cael ei hamlygu i ddatblygiadau o'r math hwn. Mae fy etholwyr yn bryderus. Pan drafodwyd y mater hwn o'r blaen, gofynnais i'r Gweinidog ysgrifennu at y cynghorau cymuned yn fy etholaeth i a oedd yn poeni am y mater hwn. Addawodd wneud hynny, a byddwn yn gwerthfawrogi pe gallai gadarnhau pa un a wnaeth hynny.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd (Sue Essex): Yr wyf mewn sefyllfa ryfedd yma. Yr oeddwn wedi dehongli teitl y ddatl fer hon i gwmpasu mater ehangach o lawer. David, fe wnaethoch ganolbwyntio ar dywod a graean ac, oherwydd inni gael trafodaethau amrywiol ar y pwnc hwnnw, credais y'n byddech am godi materion ehangach sy'n

hope that you will accept that I consider the sustainable development of the Usk valley in a much broader context. I know that sand and gravel is important to you and to residents, but there are so many other important factors with regard to the natural environment. I will run through some of them. I can understand the sentiment behind your speech, but we must consider the key factors of the sustainable future of the Usk valley, which are not just about sand and gravel. I assure you that Government structures, decisions, policies and programmes promote, improve and protect our natural and built environment. That does not mean preserving the whole of the Usk valley exactly as it is at present; in some areas, such as Newport, action is needed to upgrade and improve its features. The Usk valley encompasses the Brecon Beacons and extends all the way down to Newport and the estuary. I took that into account when considering the geographical background.

Making our actions sustainable is not an easy task. Part of it means husbanding non-renewable resources, such as precious minerals for future generations. Like all sand and gravel areas in the UK, Monmouthshire must recognise and protect its scarce resources through the planning process. That is the nature of the sustainability. However, today I wish to celebrate, under a number of headings, the actions that the Assembly, in partnership with others, is taking to ensure that the beauty of the Usk valley is retained and promoted and can be enjoyed for a long time to come.

The geology of the Usk valley makes it special. It has been created by glaciers, with terraces cut into the side of the valley. That, combined with the agricultural input over the years, makes it a special landscape. It is domestic, yet it has a dramatic hillside setting.

Landscape conservation is imperative. I am sure that Monmouthshire's unitary development plan, and the UDPs of the surrounding area, will be protected. Nature

gysylltiedig â dyffryn Wysg. Gobeithiaf y byddwch yn derbyn fy mod yn ystyried datblygu cynaliadwy yn nyffryn Wysg mewn cyd-destun ehangach o lawer. Gwn fod tywod a graean yn bwysig i chi ac i'r trigolion, ond mae cymaint o ffactorau pwysig eraill sy'n ymwneud â'r amgylchedd naturiol. Soniaf am rai ohonynt. Gallaf ddeall y teimlad y tu ôl i'ch araith, ond rhaid inni ystyried ffactorau allweddol dyfodol cynaliadwy dyffryn Wysg, sy'n ymwneud â mwy na thywod a graean. Hoffwn eich sicrhau bod strwythurau, penderfyniadau, polisiau a rhaglenni'r Llywodraeth yn hyrwyddo gwella ac yn diogelu ein hamgylchedd naturiol ac adeiledig. Nid yw hyn yn golygu cadw dyffryn Wysg yn union fel y mae ar hyn o bryd; mewn rhai ardaloedd, fel Casnewydd, mae angen gweithredu i uwchraddio a gwella ei nodweddion. Mae dyffryn Wysg yn cynnwys Bannau Brycheiniog ac mae'n ymestyn yr holl ffordd i Gasnewydd a'r aber. Ystyriaais hynny wrth bwysio a mesur y cefndir daearyddol.

Nid yw'n hawdd sicrhau bod y camau a gymerwn yn gynaliadwy. Mae rhan ohono'n golygu trefnu adnoddau nad ydynt yn adnewyddadwy, fel mwynau gwerthfawr ar gyfer cenedlaethau'r dyfodol. Fel pob ardal tywod a graean yn y DU, rhaid i Sir Fynwy gydnabod a diogelu ei hadnoddau prin drwy'r broses gynllunio. Dyna yw natur cynaliadwyedd. Fodd bynnag, heddiw hoffwn ddathlu, o dan nifer o benawdau, y camau y mae'r Cynulliad, mewn partneriaeth ag eraill, yn eu cymryd i sicrhau y caiff harddwch dyffryn Wysg ei ddiogelu a'i hyrwyddo ac y gall pobl ei fwynhau am flynyddoedd maith i ddod.

Mae daeareg dyffryn Wysg yn ei wneud yn ddyffryn arbennig. Fe'I crewyd gan rewlifau, gyda rhesi wedi'u torri i mewn i ochr y dyffryn. Mae hynny, ynghyd â'r dylanwad amaethyddol dros y blynyddoedd, yn gwneud y tirwedd yn un arbennig. Mae'n ddomestig, ond eto mae iddo leoliad trawiadol ar ochr y brynau.

Mae diogelu tirweddau'n hollbwysig. Yr wyf yn siŵr y caiff cynllun datblygu unedol Sir Fynwy, a chynlluniau datblygu unedol y dalgylch, eu diogelu. Mae cadwraeth natur yn

conservation relates to the natural environment. In the Usk valley, there are a number of sites that are important for nature conservation. These sites and the related legislation provide the local authority with a wonderful opportunity to protect the flora and fauna. All UDPs should be used to identify them and to outline appropriate policies for where development proposals might impact on their areas. There are several candidates for special areas of conservation and sites of special scientific interest. The floodplains support some bird interest, particularly the lapwing and over-wintering wading birds. Riparian habitats also protect those. You must look at the total natural environment of the Usk valley—from Brecon, and the area where the springs arise, down to the Severn estuary—to get an overall picture of the value of this unique landscape.

Access to the countryside is particularly important. If the countryside is to be protected and secured in the way that you want, people must enjoy rights of way and opportunities for access. I was pleased to hear that a Monmouthshire local access forum, among others, is being formed in the Usk valley area. These fora have an important role to play in identifying access opportunities. The Usk valley walk is 50 miles long and runs from Caerleon to Brecon. The Usk valley walk partnership, Newport City Council, Monmouthshire County Council, the Brecon Beacons national park and British Waterways have attracted funding to update and improve the entire route. If we believe in sustainability for future generations, it is crucial that people have the opportunity to enjoy access to a particularly splendid landscape. The river quality of the Usk is crucial. The Environment Agency's monitoring shows that the River Usk meets the highest water quality standards. Action is being taken to tackle threats to the quality of the river: for example, a number of sewage treatment works in the area are being improved as part of Dŵr Cymru's environment programme. Actions being taken to reduce diffuse pollution include the designation of the great spring and the nitrate-vulnerable zone. I think that either Eleanor Burnham or Janet Davies mentioned that.

gysylltiedig â'r amgylchedd naturiol. Yn nyffryn Wysg, mae nifer o safleoedd sy'n bwysig o ran cadwraeth natur. Mae'r safleoedd hyn a'r ddeddfwriaeth gysylltiedig yn darparu cyfle gwych i'r awdurdod lleol ddiogelu'r planhigion a'r anifeiliaid. Dylid defnyddio pob cynllun datblygu unedol i'w nodi ac amlinellu polisiau priodol mewn sefyllfa pan allai'r cynigion datblygu effeithio ar eu hardaloedd hwy. Mae sawl ymgeisydd ar gyfer ardaloedd cadwraeth a safleoedd o ddiddordeb gwyddonol arbennig. Mae'r gorlifdiroedd yn gartref i rai adar, yn arbennig y cornicyll ac adar hirgoes sy'n treulio'r gaeaf yno. Mae cynefinoedd glannau afon hefyd yn diogelu'r rheini. Rhaid ichi edrych ar amgylchedd naturiol dyffryn Wysg yn ei gyfanrwydd—o Aberhonddu, a'r ardal lle mae'r nentydd yn tarddu, i aber afon Hafren—er mwyn cael darlun cyflawn o werth y tirlun unigryw hwn.

Mae cael mynediad i gefn gwlad yn arbennig o bwysig. Os ydym am ddiogelu cefn gwlad yn y modd a ddymunwch, rhaid i bobl allu cael hawliau tramwy a chyfleoedd i gael mynediad. Yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed bod fforwm mynediad lleol Sir Fynwy, ymhlith eraill, yn cael ei sefydlu yn ardal dyffryn Wysg. Mae gan y fforymau hyn rôl bwysig i'w chwarae wrth nodi cyfleoedd mynediad. Mae llwybr dyffryn Wysg yn 50 milltir o hyd ac yn rhedeg o Gaerllion i Aberhonddu. Mae partneriaeth llwybr dyffryn Wysg, Cyngor Sir Casnewydd, Cyngor Sir Sir Fynwy, parc cenedlaethol Bannau Brycheiniog a Dyffrydd Prydain wedi denu nawdd i ddiweddarau a gwella'r llwybr cyfan. Os ydym yn credu mewn cynaliadwyedd ar gyfer cenedlaethau'r dyfodol, mae'n hollbwysig sicrhau bod gan bobl fynediad i dirwedd sy'n arbennig o hardd. Mae ansawdd afon Wysg yn hollbwysig. Mae gwaith monitro Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn dangos bod Afon Wysg yn bodloni'r safonau ansawdd dŵr uchaf. Mae camau'n cael eu cymryd i fynd i'r afael â bygythiadau i ansawdd yr afon: er enghraifft, mae nifer o weithfeydd trin carthion yn yr ardal yn cael eu gwella fel rhan o raglen amgylchedd Dŵr Cymru. Ymhlith y camau sy'n cael eu cymryd i leihau llygredd gwasgaredig mae nodi ardal y prif ffrydiau a'r ardal sy'n agored i nitradau. Credaf fod naill ai Eleanor Burnham neu Janet Davies wedi crybwyll hynny.

A range of issues need to be considered in addition to the particular points that David is worried about. We need to see this as a whole. Clearly the unitary development plans of all local authorities are crucial, and we need to ensure that the environment is sustainable for the future. I will listen to the points that you have raised. You have made them before and Kirsty has made them too. I will check the position with the community councils and we will continue this dialogue. Together we have to find a way to protect our natural resources in a way that respects local communities and the environment. It is not about exploitation, but defining areas and resources that we must protect for future generations. I understand that people feel worried, and we will continue to be vigilant to ensure that we get the right wording and the right approach to these and other sensitive issues in south Wales.

Mae angen ystyried ystod o faterion yn ychwanegol at y pwyntiau penodol sy'n peri pryder i David. Mae angen inni ystyried hyn yn ei gyfanrwydd. Yn amlwg, mae cynlluniau datblygu unedol pob awdurdod lleol yn hanfodol, ac mae angen inni sicrhau bod yr amgylchedd yn gynaliadwy ar gyfer y dyfodol. Byddaf yn gwrandao ar y pwyntiau a godwyd gennych. Yr ydych wedi'u codi o'r blaen ac mae Kirsty wedi'u codi hefyd. Byddaf yn gofyn barn y cynghorau cymuned a byddaf yn parhau â'r drafodaeth hon. Gyda'n gilydd, rhaid inni ddod o hyd i ffordd o ddiogelu ein hadnoddau naturiol lleol a'r amgylchedd. Nid mater o eesbloetio yw hyn, ond diffinio'r ardaloedd a'r adnoddau hynny y mae'n rhaid inni eu diogelu ar gyfer cenedlaethau'r dyfodol. Deallaf fod pobl yn poeni, a byddwn yn parhau i fod yn ofalus er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn mynegi hyn yn gywir ac yn mabwysiadu'r ymagwedd gywir wrth drafod y materion hyn a materion sensitif eraill yn ne Cymru.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings today's proceedings to a close.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.19 p.m.
The session ended at 5.19 p.m.*