



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)**

Dydd Mawrth 18 Mawrth 2003

Tuesday 18 March 2003

Cynnwys
Contents

- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog
Questions to the First Minister
- 22 Cynnig Trefniadol
Procedural Motion
- 26 Datganiad Busnes
Business Statement
- 28 Datganiad ar Gyflog Cyfartal
Statement on Equal Pay
- 41 Pwyntiau o Drefn
Points of Order
- 42 Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion
Composite Motion: Approval of Orders
- 44 Pwynt o Drefn
Point of Order
- 44 Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Diwygio Rheoliadol (Cytundebau Rheoli Tai) 2003
Approval of the Regulatory Reform (Housing Management Agreements) Order 2003
- 47 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Canolfannau Preswyl i Deuluoedd (Cymru) 2003 a'r Rheoliadau Safonau Gofynnol Cenedlaethol ar gyfer Canolfannau Preswyl i Deuluoedd (Cymru) 2003
Approval of the Residential Family Centres (Wales) Regulations 2003 and the National Minimum Standards for Residential Family Centres (Wales) Regulations 2003
- 51 Cymorth Rhanbarthol Dewisol a Grant Buddsoddi'r Cynulliad
Regional Selective Assistance and the Assembly Investment Grant
- 78 Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru): Dechreuad Newydd i Gymru
Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru): A Fresh Start for Wales

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister

Cartrefi Gofal Cyhoeddus a Phreifat (Ynys Môn) Public and Private Care Homes (Anglesey)

Q1 Peter Rogers: Can the Minister make a statement on the market competition of public and private care homes on the isle of Anglesey? (OAQ23317)

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): Private care homes make up some 75 per cent of the market in Anglesey. There are currently 52 independent care homes on the island, with a total of 558 beds; six are run by the local authority, accounting for a further 168 beds. Councils should apply Best Value principles when providing or purchasing care services, and I would expect them not to act in ways that conflict with the spirit of the Competition Act 1998.

Peter Rogers: You will be concerned to hear that the council's award to the private sector in January for the coming year was £8.75 per week. Three weeks later it awarded its own care homes £26.98 per week, which has caused uproar on the island. What action can we take against the council, which does not believe in Best Value?

The First Minister: If you believe that that does not follow from my first reply to you, you will have the opportunity to raise that during your meeting to discuss this issue with Jane Hutt at 4.30 p.m. today. You will have the right to make your case and say that that is contrary to Best Value principles. We should be aware that in the competition—which should not really be a competition—in caring for elderly people, between domiciliary care and residential care, and within residential care between council-run homes and privately-run homes, the case mix is never the same. The fee difference should be justified by the case mix difference and other factors, such as the wage levels and

C1 Peter Rogers: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y farchnad gystadleuol rhwng cartrefi gofal cyhoeddus a phreifat ar Ynys Môn? (OAQ23317)

Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan): Cartrefi gofal preifat sy'n ffurfio tua 75 y cant o'r farchnad yn Ynys Môn. Mae 52 o gartrefi gofal annibynnol ar yr ynys ar hyn o bryd, gyda chyfanswm o 558 o welyau; caiff chwech eu rhedeg gan yr awdurdod lleol, ac mae hynny felly'n creu 168 yn fwy o welyau. Dylai cynghorau gymhwyso egwyddorion Gwerth Gorau wrth ddarparu neu brynu gwasanaethau gofal, a disgwylw'n iddynt beidio â gweithredu mewn unrhyw fodd sy'n groes i ysbryd Deddf Cystadleuaeth 1998.

Peter Rogers: Bydd yn ofid ichi glywed mai dyfarniad y cyngor i'r sector preifat yn Ionawr ar gyfer y flwyddyn i ddod oedd £8.75 yr wythnos. Dair wythnos yn ddiweddarach, dyfarnodd £26.98 yr wythnos i'w gartrefi gofal ei hun, ac mae hynny wedi achosi stŵr ar yr ynys. Pa gamau y gallwn eu cymryd yn erbyn y cyngor, nad yw'n credu mewn Gwerth Gorau?

Y Prif Weinidog: Os credwch nad yw hynny'n dilyn o'r ateb cyntaf a roddais i chi, cewch gyfle i godi hynny yn ystod eich cyfarfod i drafod y pwnc hwn gyda Jane Hutt am 4.30 p.m. heddiw. Bydd gennych hawl i gyflwyno'ch achos ac i ddweud bod hynny'n groes i egwyddorion Gwerth Gorau. Dylem fod yn ymwybodol, wrth ystyried y gystadleuaeth—na ddylai fod yn gystadleuaeth mewn gwirionedd—wrth ofalu am yr henoed, rhwng gofal yn y cartref a gofal preswyl, ac o fewn gofal preswyl rhwng cartrefi a gaiff eu rhedeg gan y cyngor a rhai preifat, nad yw'r cymysgedd achosion byth yr un fath. Dylai'r gwahaniaeth rhwng y ffioedd gael ei gyfiawnhau gan y

pension arrangements that are different in the private sector and local authority owned homes.

gwahaniaeth yn y cymysgedd achosion a ffactorau eraill, megis lefelau cyflog a threfniadau pensiwn sy'n wahanol yn y sector preifat a chartrefi sy'n eiddo i'r awdurdod lleol.

Eleanor Burnham: Can you clarify the consequences of the Community Care Bill for care homes in Anglesey?

Eleanor Burnham: A allwch egluro beth fydd canlyniadau'r Mesur Gofal Cymunedol i gartrefi gofal yn Ynys Môn?

The First Minister: The Community Care Bill will affect care homes in Anglesey as elsewhere in Wales in that they will need to be in a position whereby they can compete with domiciliary care. An assessment is needed of what is the best for the individual. If it is best for that person is to go into residential care, the choice is not really between council-owned care and other care, it is between how to give the appropriate domiciliary support or residential care if they are not able to be maintained in their own home. That principle must always apply.

Y Prif Weinidog: Bydd y Mesur Gofal Cymunedol yn effeithio ar gartrefi gofal yn Ynys Môn fel y bydd mewn mannau eraill yng Nghymru i'r graddau y byddant yn gorfod bod mewn sefyllfa i allu cystadlu â gofal yn y cartref. Mae angen asesiad o'r hyn sydd orau i'r unigolyn. Os mai'r peth gorau yw bod y person hwnnw'n cael ei dderbyn i ofal preswyl, nid rhwng gofal o eiddo'r cyngor a gofal arall y mae'r dewis mewn gwirionedd, ond rhwng sut i roi'r cymorth priodol yn y cartref neu ofal preswyl os na ellir ei gynnal yn ei gartref ei hun. Rhaid rhoi'r egwyddor honno ar waith bob amser.

David Lloyd: A fydd y Prif Weinidog yn clustnodi arian penodol ychwanegol i godi lefelau ffioedd i gartrefi preswyl yn Ynys Môn?

David Lloyd: Will the First Minister allocate specific additional funding to raise fees levels for residential homes in Anglesey?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid mater i ni ydyw gwneud hynny. Y sefyllfa ddiweddaraf yw bod £12 miliwn wedi'i glustnodi, i sicrhau bod pobl sy'n gorfod gadael ysbytai am eu bod yn blocio gwelyau cleifion ag arnynt angen llawdriniaeth frys yn gallu symud allan ar frys pan fydd hynny o les iddynt. Gallant fynd i gartref preswyl neu i'w cartrefi eu hunain gyda'r cymorth sydd ei angen arnynt. Mae'r arian yn cael ei glustnodi at y pwrpas ac nid ar gyfer y cartref preswyl.

The First Minister: It is not for us to do that. The latest situation is that £12 million has been allocated to ensure that people who have to be discharged from hospital because they are blocking beds needed by other patients requiring urgent treatment can be discharged quickly when that benefits them. They can go to a residential home or to their own homes with the necessary support. The money is allocated for the purpose and not for the residential home.

Ffyniant Economaidd yn Sir Benfro Economic Prosperity in Pembrokeshire

Q2 Richard Edwards: What steps is the First Minister taking to improve economic prosperity in Pembrokeshire? (OAQ23269)

C2 Richard Edwards: Pa gamau y mae'r Prif Weinidog yn eu cymryd i hybu ffyniant economaidd yn Sir Benfro? (OAQ23269)

The First Minister: A number of Assembly Government, Welsh Development Agency and Wales Tourist Board programmes are available in the area, including regional selective assistance and Assembly investment grants for small and medium-sized

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae nifer o raglenni o eiddo Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a Bwrdd Croeso Cymru ar gael yn yr ardal, gan gynnwys cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol a grantiau buddsoddi'r Cynulliad ar gyfer busnesau bach a chanolig

enterprises. The area is also eligible for Objective 1 funding. Negotiations are continuing with potential occupiers of Cleddau Bridge and the Dewhirst facility—the one in Cardigan, not the one in Fishguard, although workers do commute to Cardigan from north Pembrokeshire. Andrew Davies and I have had meetings with major investors and have visited the area to discuss what can happen in the petrochemicals sector as regards the liquefied natural gas facilities that are proposed by Esso and Petroplus, and, of course, the Bluestone project, which is subject to planning permission.

Richard Edwards: Thank you, First Minister. I urge you and the Minister for Economic Development to ensure that Fishguard's last invasion centre is included in the regeneration plan for north Pembrokeshire. It fits in with the aspirations of the plan in terms of tourism, the development of the town centre, and the commitment to lifelong learning within the community. It has the potential to create a regeneration trigger for the area, and has widespread community support. However, typically, it has not been included by Pembrokeshire County Council, for all its lip service to the importance of community involvement, in its submission to the regeneration plan. Will you support the last invasion centre?

The First Minister: I have visited the centre on many occasions, and I am one of its greatest fans; the quality of its design and finish means that it is able to proudly carry the title of Wales's equivalent of the Bayeux tapestry. It undoubtedly has a future role in tourism and in lifelong learning in Pembrokeshire. What you should probably do in this case, Richard, is to write to Andrew Davies to see whether finding a permanent home for the last invasion centre project can be included in the scheme. We cannot substitute our judgment for the judgment of Pembrokeshire council on all occasions—as you would, no doubt, like—but we can ensure that matters such as this are given their proper place in the order of priorities for regenerating the economy of north Pembrokeshire.

eu maint. Mae'r ardal yn gymwys hefyd ar gyfer cyllid Amcan 1. Mae negodiadau'n parhau gyda rhai a allai ddod yn ddeiliaid yn y cyfleuster ym Mhonteledau a chyfleuster Dewhirst—yr un yn Aberteifi, nid yr un yn Abergwaun, er bod gweithwyr yn cymudo i Aberteifi o ogledd Sir Benfro. Mae Andrew Davies a minnau wedi cael cyfarfodydd gyda buddsoddwyr mawr ac wedi ymweld â'r ardal i drafod beth a all ddigwydd yn y sector petrocemegion o ran y cyfleusterau nwy naturiol hylifedig arfaethedig gan Esso a Petrol Plus ac, wrth gwrs, prosiect Bluestone, y bydd yn rhaid cael caniatâd cynllunio ar ei gyfer.

Richard Edwards: Diolch i chi, Brif Weinidog. Anogaf chi a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd i sicrhau y caiff canolfan y glaniad olaf yn Abergwaun ei chynnwys yn y cynllun adfywio ar gyfer gogledd Sir Benfro. Mae'n cydweddu â'r dyheadau yn y cynllun o ran twristiaeth, datblygu canol y dref, a'r ymrwymiad i ddysgu gydol oes yn y gymuned. Mae ynddi botensial i ysgogi adfywiad yn yr ardal, ac mae cefnogaeth eang iddi yn y gymuned. Fodd bynnag, yn nodweddiadol, er cymaint y mae Cyngor Sir Penfro yn esgus pleidio'r pwysigrwydd o sicrhau ymrwymiad gan y gymuned, nid yw wedi'i chynnwys yn yr hyn a gyflwynodd ar gyfer y cynllun adfywio. A wnewch gefnogi canolfan y glaniad olaf?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf wedi ymweld â'r ganolfan lawer gwaith, ac yr wyf yn un o'i hedmygwyr mwyaf; mae ansawdd ei dyluniad a'i gorffeniad yn golygu bod ganddi le i ymfalchïo mai ganddi hi y mae'r hyn sy'n cyfateb yng Nghymru i dapestri Bayeux. Mae'n sicr bod iddi rôl yn y dyfodol mewn twristiaeth ac mewn dysgu gydol oes yn Sir Benfro. Mae'n debyg mai'r hyn y dylech ei wneud yn yr achos hwn, Richard, yw ysgrifennu at Andrew Davies i weld a oes modd cynnwys y gwaith o ddod o hyd i gartref parhaol i brosiect canolfan y glaniad olaf yn y cynllun. Ni allwn farnu yn lle cyngor Sir Benfro ar bob achlysur—fel y dymunech chi, mae'n siŵr—ond gallwn sicrhau bod materion o'r math hwn yn cael eu priod le yn y drefn o flaenoriaethau ar gyfer adfywio economi gogledd Sir Benfro.

Cynog Dafis: Pan gollwyd 900 o swyddi yng nghanolfan alwadau Doc Penfro o ganlyniad i gwmp ITV Digital tua blwyddyn yn ôl, yr oedd y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd yn hyderus y byddai swyddi newydd yn cael eu creu yn lle'r hen rai. Dywedodd eich bod wedi gwneud hynny o'r blaen ac y byddech yn gwneud hynny eto. Serch hynny, mae'r ganolfan yn gwbl wag—yn wacach nag yr oedd dri mis yn ôl. A ydych yn cytuno mai'r hyn a geir yma yw un arall o addewidion Llafur wedi'i thorri'n rhacs?

Cynog Dafis: When 900 jobs were lost at the Pembroke Dock call centre as a result of the collapse of ITV Digital around 12 months ago, the Minister for Economic Development was confident that new jobs would be created to replace the old ones. He said that you had done so before, and that you would do so again. However, the centre is completely empty—emptier than it was three months ago. Do you agree that what we have here is another promise that has been broken by Labour?

Y Prif Weinidog: Pan fo swyddi newydd yn cael eu creu mewn canolfan alwadau, mae hynny'n digwydd yn gyflym; yn anffodus, os ydych yn colli eich cwsmer, heb i hynny fod oherwydd unrhyw fai ar y gweithwyr, yr ydych yn colli'r swyddi yn gyflym hefyd. Mae trafodaethau yn mynd rhagddynt yn awr gyda mwy nag un cwmni sydd am gymryd rhan—rhan helaeth efallai—o'r ganolfan. Yr ydym yn rhoi pob cefnogaeth iddynt er mwyn dod â'r trafodaethau i ben yn fuan. [*Torri ar draws.*]

The First Minister: When new call centre jobs are created, they are created quickly; unfortunately, if you lose your customer, through no fault of the workers, those jobs are lost equally quickly. Discussions are ongoing with more than one company wishing to use part—perhaps most—of the centre. We are giving them every support in order to bring discussions to a swift conclusion. [*Interruption.*]

Y Llywydd: Nawr, nawr Cynog; yr ydych wedi cael un cwestiwn.

The Presiding Officer: Now, now Cynog; you have had one question.

Ymosodiad Terfysgol yng Nghymru Terrorist Attack on Wales

Q3 David Ian Jones: Does the First Minister propose to issue guidance to the public as to the action to be taken in the event of a terrorist attack on Wales? (OAQ23270)

C3 David Ian Jones: A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn bwriadu cyhoeddi canllawiau i'r cyhoedd ynghylch camau i'w cymryd pe bai ymosodiad terfysgol yn digwydd yng Nghymru? (OAQ23270)

The First Minister: This is a matter for the Home Office—it takes the lead for the UK on the issue of terrorism. The Home Secretary announced to the House of Commons on 3 March that, in the next few weeks, he intends to establish a dedicated website that will draw on all the relevant advice of the security and intelligence services, on civil resilience information and material that departments publish on their task of protecting the public in this country. It will include information that is readily available on general civil contingency, resilience and protection. However, it will not include the kind of leaflet that the Australian Government

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae hyn yn fater i'r Swyddfa Gartref—hi sy'n arwain yn y DU ar fater terfysgaeth. Cyhoeddodd yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref gerbron Tŷ'r Cyffredin ar 3 Mawrth ei fod yn bwriadu sefydlu gwefan bwrpasol, yn yr wythnosau nesaf, a fydd yn gwneud defnydd o holl gyngor perthnasol y gwasanaethau diogelwch a chudd-wybodaeth, ac o'r wybodaeth a deunyddiau sy'n ymwneud â gwrthsafiad sifil y mae adrannau'n eu cyhoeddi fel rhan o'u gorchwyl o amddiffyn y cyhoedd yn y wlad hon. Bydd yn cynnwys gwybodaeth hawdd ei chael am gynllunio sifil cyffredinol wrth gefn, gwrthsefyll ac amddiffyn. Fodd

recently issued giving information on what the Australian people should do in the event of a terrorist attack.

David Ian Jones: There is clearly some confusion as to who is responsible for this, and whether or not it is a devolved issue. Last week, in an answer to Peter Black, you indicated that the co-ordination of emergency services planning inevitably falls to us. We must consider raising awareness of the health issues that would arise if Wales faced a bioterrorist threat. Given that we are now only a matter of hours away from war with Iraq, and that the Prime Minister has recently issued a warning as to the heightened status of the terrorist threat, is it not disturbing that the people of Wales have not been provided with a single piece of information as to how to act in the event of a terrorist attack?

2.10 p.m.

The First Minister: That is unworthy of you, David. If the Home Secretary announces that he, in the next few weeks, following 3 March—so you can assume that it is imminent—is going to establish a dedicated website pulling together all of this information in a way that is available to the public, that is what he is going to do. It is imminent. The Home Office is responsible for the provision, whereas we have statutory responsibility for matters relating to the health service, including the ambulance service. The other emergency services are matters for Government departments in Westminster. Co-ordination is often down to us, almost regardless of statutory designations. We found that out in dealing with foot and mouth disease and we have asked for powers to co-ordinate emergency services to be made clearer, given that we are responsible for the ambulance service, while responsibility for the other services is reserved. However, the Home Secretary has said that he will do this, and I would imagine that the provision of that information is imminent.

Mick Bates: It is a disappointment to many of us that the diplomatic process seems to

bynnag, ni fydd yn cynnwys y math o daflen a gyhoeddwyd gan Lywodraeth Awstralia yn ddiweddar yn rhoi gwybodaeth am yr hyn y dylai pobl Awstralia ei wneud os bydd ymosodiad terfysgol.

David Ian Jones: Mae'n amlwg bod peth dryswch ynghylch pwy sy'n gyfrifol am hyn, ac a yw'n fater a ddatganolwyd ai peidio. Yr wythnos diwethaf, mewn ateb i Peter Black, dywedasoeh ei bod yn anochel bod cydlynu cynllunio gwasanaethau brys yn dod i'n rhan ni. Rhaid inni ystyried hybu ymwybyddiaeth o'r materion iechyd a godai pe byddai Cymru'n wynebu bygythiad terfysgol biolegol. Gan ein bod o fewn oriau bellach i ryfel yn erbyn Irac, a bod y Prif Weinidog wedi cyhoeddi rhybudd yn ddiweddar fod y bygythiad oddi wrth derfysgaeth yn fwy, onid yw'n peri pryder na roddwyd yr un darn o wybodaeth i bobl Cymru am y camau y dylid eu cymryd os bydd ymosodiad terfysgol?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae hynny'n annheilwng ohonoch, David. Os yw'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref yn cyhoeddi, yn yr wythnosau nesaf, ar ôl 3 Mawrth—felly gallwch gymryd ei fod ar fin digwydd—ei fod am sefydlu gwefan bwrpasol sy'n cyfuno'r holl wybodaeth hon fel y bydd ar gael i'r cyhoedd, dyna a wnaiff. Mae ar fin digwydd. Y Swyddfa Gartref sy'n gyfrifol am y ddarpariaeth, tra bo gennym ni gyfrifoldeb statudol dros faterion sy'n ymwneud â'r gwasanaeth iechyd, gan gynnwys y gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Mae'r gwasanaethau brys eraill yn fater i adrannau Llywodraeth yn San Steffan. Mater i ni'n aml yw cydlynu, ni waeth beth fo'r dynodiadau statudol bron. Darganfuasom hynny wrth ddelio â chlwy'r traed a'r genau ac yr ydym wedi gofyn am roi gwedd eglurach ar bwerau i gydlynu gwasanaethau brys, gan mai ni sy'n gyfrifol am y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, tra bo'r cyfrifoldeb dros y gwasanaethau eraill wedi'i gadw. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref wedi dweud y gwnaiff hyn, a thybiwn fod y wybodaeth honno ar fin cael ei darparu.

Mick Bates: Siom i lawer ohonom yw bod y broses ddiplomyddol wedi methu, i bob

have failed and we are on the verge of war. In view of that, what discussions have you had with your Westminster colleagues regarding the retention of essential fuel supplies? In the event of war, it seems likely that fuel supplies will be disrupted. What provision is being made to ensure that our essential services have fuel in the event of a terrorist attack in Wales?

The First Minister: That kind of provision and the stepping up of preparations for what might go wrong in the event of a terrorist attack as a consequence of any military action in the middle east, has been going on, at an enhanced level, since 11 September. That includes fuel provision—although there is no sign as yet that what might happen in the middle east tomorrow or the day after will affect oil prices, which are now falling—the availability of smallpox vaccine, and the other provisions that you would expect to be available given possible revenge attacks of a biological, radiological or nuclear kind.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Mae'n debyg ein bod yn derbyn y gall fod ymosodiad terfysgol ar Gymru yn dilyn penderfyniad Tony Blair a George Bush i fynd i ryfel yn erbyn Irac. Ar 29 Hydref 2002, gwnaethoch bleidleisio o blaid cynnig a oedd yn cynnwys y geiriau:

'i sicrhau bod unrhyw ymgyrch filwrol yn erbyn Irac yn cydymffurfio â thelerau Siarter y Cenhedloedd Unedig?'

Gan fod Kofi Annan wedi dweud bod mynd i ryfel heb ail benderfyniad yn groes i Siarter y Cenhedloedd Unedig, a ydych yn gwrthbynebu penderfyniad George Bush a Tony Blair i fynd i ryfel?

Y Prif Weindog: Clywais yr hyn a ddywedodd Kofi Annan a chydymdeimlaf â'i safbwynt. Yr wyf hefyd wedi clywed Prif Weinidog Lloegr yn esbonio pam y bu'n amhosibl i gael trafodaeth deg ar gael ail benderfyniad gerbron cyngor diogelwch y Cenhedloedd Unedig. Mae'n rhaid i bobl wrando yn ofalus ar y ddadl yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin. Yr Aelodau Seneddol fydd yn penderfynu a ydynt yn cefnogi'r hyn sydd

golwg, a'n bod ar drothwy rhyfel. Yng ngolwg hynny, pa drafodaethau a gawsoch â'ch cyd-Weinidogion yn San Steffan ynghylch cadw cyflenwadau tanwydd hanfodol? Os bydd rhyfel, ymddengys yn debygol y bydd ymyrryd â chyflenwadau tanwydd. Pa ddarpariaeth a wneir i sicrhau bod tanwydd ar gyfer ein gwasanaethau hanfodol os bydd ymosodiad terfysgol yng Nghymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae darparu o'r fath a'r cynnydd yn y paratodau ar gyfer yr hyn a allai fynd o'i le os bydd ymosodiad terfysgol o ganlyniad i unrhyw ymladd yn y dwyrain canol, yn mynd ymlaen, ar lefel uwch, ers 11 Medi. Mae hynny'n cynnwys darparu tanwydd—er nad oes arwydd hyd yn hyn y bydd yr hyn a all ddigwydd yn y dwyrain canol yfory neu drennydd yn effeithio ar brisiau olew, sy'n disgyn ar hyn o bryd—argaeledd brechlynnau rhag y frech wen, a'r darpariaethau eraill y disgwyliech iddynt fod ar gael o ystyried y posibilrwydd o ddial drwy ymosodiadau biolegol, radiolegol neu niwclear.

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): It appears that we accept that there could be a terrorist attack on Wales following Tony Blair's and George Bush's decision to wage war on Iraq. On 29 October 2002, you voted in favour of a motion that included the words:

'to ensure that any military action taken against Iraq is governed by the terms of the UN Charter?'

Now that Kofi Annan has said that waging war without a second resolution is contrary to the UN Charter, do you oppose George Bush's and Tony Blair's decision to wage war?

The First Minister: I heard what Kofi Annan said and I sympathise with his viewpoint. I have also heard the Prime Minister's explanation as to why it was impossible to hold a balanced discussion on getting a second resolution before the UN security council. People must listen carefully to the debate in the House of Commons. Members of Parliament will decide whether or not they support what has happened so

wedi digwydd hyd yn hyn neu beidio. Bydd pleidlais heno yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin a Thŷ'r Arglwyddi ar y dadleuon sydd yn digwydd yno ar hyn o bryd, yn y lle priodol.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Gofynnaf ichi eto: a ydych yn cefnogi bwriad Tony Blair a George Bush i fynd i ryfel?

Y Prif Weinidog: Arhosaf am gasgliadau y ddadl a chanlyniad y pleidleisiau am 10 p.m.; bydd gennym gyfle wedyn i egluro ein safbwynt ar ôl ystyried yr hyn sydd yn cael ei ddweud yn y ddadl. Dechreuodd y ddadl honno ryw ddwy awr yn ôl a bydd yn gorffen o fewn saith awr a hanner.

far. There will be a vote tonight in the House of Commons and House of Lords on the debates that are taking place there at the moment, in the appropriate place.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I will ask you again: do you support Tony Blair's and George Bush's intention to wage war?

The First Minister: I will await the conclusions of the debate and the result of the votes at 10 p.m.; we will then have an opportunity to express our view after having considered what has been said in the debate. That debate began some two hours ago and will finish in about seven-and-a-half hours' time.

Mynd i'r Afael ag Argyfwng Mawr yng Nghymru Dealing with Major Emergencies in Wales

Q4 Ann Jones: Can the Minister assure this Assembly that he has considered and has confidence in the contingency plans and preparedness for dealing with any major emergencies that might occur in Wales? (OAQ23272)

The First Minister: Multi-agency groups exist in all four police areas in Wales to ensure that plans are in place to respond effectively to major emergencies in their areas. The three major regional health service areas are working with the police forces. We continue to work closely with these groups to help develop response plans for any major emergency that might occur, including any that may result from the military action that is likely to occur in the middle east. Cardiff international airport will be one of a rotation of airports that will receive incoming casualties from time to time. The casualties will be distributed, as appropriate, among the hospitals. For example, they will be sent to Morriston Hospital for burns injuries, or to Llandough Hospital, the University Hospital of Wales, or Frenchay Hospital in Bristol, and so on, for other injuries, depending on the type of injury suffered by the servicemen and women returning from the middle east.

C4 Ann Jones: A all y Gweinidog roi sicrwydd i'r Cynulliad ei fod wedi ystyried y cynlluniau wrth gefn i fynd i'r afael ag unrhyw argyfwng mawr a allai ddigwydd yng Nghymru, ynghyd â'r paratoadau, a bod ganddo ffydd yn y cynlluniau hynny? (OAQ23272)

Y Prif Weinidog: Ceir grwpiau amlasiantaethol ym mhob un o'r pedair ardal heddlu yng Nghymru i sicrhau bod cynlluniau'n barod i ymateb yn effeithiol i argyfyngau mawr yn eu hardaloedd. Mae'r tair ardal gwasanaeth iechyd rhanbarthol mawr yn gweithio gyda'r heddluoedd. Parhawn i gydweithio'n agos â'r grwpiau hyn i helpu i ddatblygu cynlluniau ymateb ar gyfer unrhyw argyfwng mawr a allai ddigwydd, gan gynnwys unrhyw un a allai godi o ganlyniad i'r ymladd sy'n debygol o ddigwydd yn y dwyrain canol. Maes awyr rhyngwladol Caerdydd fydd un o'r rhai ar y rota o feysydd awyr a fydd yn derbyn clwyfedigion a ddaw i mewn o bryd i'w gilydd. Caiff y clwyfedigion eu dosbarthu, fel y bo'n briodol, rhwng yr ysbytai. Er enghraifft, anfonir rhai sydd â llosgiadau i Ysbyty Treforys, neu i Ysbyty Llandochau, Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru, neu Ysbyty Frenchay ym Mryste, ac yn y blaen, yn achos anafiadau eraill, yn ôl y math o anaf a gafodd y milwyr sy'n dychwelyd o'r dwyrain canol.

Ann Jones: Will you join me in condemning the highly provocative remarks made by Bernard Jenkins at the weekend? He said that I, as a Fire Brigades Union member, and my former FBU colleagues, are friends of Saddam. Do you agree that these remarks only serve to provoke, rather than to assist a speedy resolution to the fire service dispute? The fire service has a pivotal role, as does any emergency service, in making contingency plans for the major incidents that it has to attend daily. How confident are you that Wales can deal with everyday emergencies such as chemical spillages, oil pollution and leaks onto our coastline, and major motorway accidents? Are you convinced that we would have enough cover should such an incident occur within the next few days?

The First Minister: Tomorrow could be a difficult day for the reasons to which you have alluded. I deprecate Bernard Jenkins's unnecessarily inflammatory remarks, and I am sure that he regretted them as soon as he had said them. Everybody accepts that the FBU, even if they disagree with its pay claim or the way in which it has conducted the dispute, is sincere in its representation of the views of its members at control-room and at operational level. However, I will write to you on the planning for tomorrow and any subsequent days when the FBU is not available to provide cover.

Geraint Davies: A number of staff, particularly accident and emergency staff, have been called up from my local general hospital, the Royal Glamorgan Hospital, to serve in the imminent Iraq war. Can you tell us how many staff from hospitals across Wales have been similarly called up, and what plans do you have to ensure that vital hospital services are maintained during the crisis?

The First Minister: The Ministry of Defence has provided us with a figure of just under 1,000 for the UK NHS as a whole. On that basis, approximately 50 staff will probably have been called up throughout Wales. I cannot give a more precise estimate than that.

Ann Jones: A wnewch ymuno â mi i gollfarnu'r sylwadau tra herllyd a fynegwyd gan Bernard Jenkins ar y penwythnos? Dywedodd fy mod i, fel aelod o Undeb y Brigadau Tân, a'm cyn-gydweithwyr yn yr undeb, yn ffrindiau i Saddam. A gytunwch mai'r cwbl a wnaiff y sylwadau hynny yw pryfocio, yn hytrach na helpu i gael ateb buan i anghydfod y gwasanaeth tân? Mae rôl ganolog i'r gwasanaeth tân, yn yr un modd â phob gwasanaeth brys, wrth wneud cynlluniau wrth gefn ar gyfer y digwyddiadau difrifol y mae'n gorfod ymdrin â hwy bob diwrnod. Pa mor ffyddiog yr ydych y gall Cymru ddelio â digwyddiadau brys pob dydd fel colli cemegion, llygredd olew a gollyngiadau ar ein glannau, a damweiniau difrifol ar draffyrdd? A ydych yn sicr y byddai gennym ddigon o ddarpariaeth pe bai digwyddiad o'r fath yn y dyddiau nesaf?

Y Prif Weinidog: Gallai yfory fod yn ddiwrnod anodd am y rhesymau y cyfeiriasoch atynt. Dirmygaf y sylwadau diangen o ymfflamychol a wnaeth Bernard Jenkins, ac yr wyf yn siŵr iddo fod yn edifar amdanynt yn syth. Mae pawb yn derbyn bod Undeb y Brigadau Tân yn ddiwyll wrth gynrychioli barn ei aelodau yn yr ystafelloedd rheoli ac ar y lefel weithredol, hyd yn oed os ydynt yn anghytuno â'i hawliad tâl neu'r modd yr aeth ynghylch yr anghydfod. Fodd bynnag, gwnaf ysgrifennu atoch ynghylch y cynllunio ar gyfer yfory ac unrhyw ddyddiau wedyn pan nad yw'r undeb ar gael i ddarparu gwasanaeth.

Geraint Davies: Mae nifer o staff, a staff damweiniau ac achosion brys yn benodol, wedi'u galw o'm hysbyty cyffredinol lleol, Ysbyty Brenhinol Morgannwg, i wasanaethu yn y rhyfel sydd ar fin digwydd yn erbyn Irac. A allwch ddweud wrthym sawl aelod o staff o ysbytai ledled Cymru a alwyd i'r fyddin yn yr un modd, a pha gynlluniau sydd gennych i sicrhau y cynhelir gwasanaethau ysbyty hollbwysig yn ystod yr argyfwng?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn wedi rhoi ffigur i ni o ychydig yn llai na 1,000 am y GIG yn y DU gyfan. Ar sail hynny, mae'n debyg bod tua 50 o staff wedi'u galw i'r fyddin ledled Cymru. Ni allaf roi amcangyfrif manylach na hynny.

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): It is clear, sadly, that we are on the verge of international engagement in Iraq, and many of the issues on which you are now touching are issues that we should have discussed some time ago. I deplore the fact that we have not been given that opportunity. I wrote to you on 13 March, urging an immediate debate, and received an acknowledgement card this morning. This is not appropriate, given the seriousness of the situation.

In reply to David Ian Jones earlier, you seemed to indicate that the emergency planning was being co-ordinated from the Home Office. When we sent troops to Afghanistan, the co-ordination took place in Wales. I press you to give an assurance—I appreciate that you cannot go into specific details—that vaccinations will be available in the event of a terrorist attack. What will happen in relation to funding if we treat, as we should, civilians, and, particularly, injured servicemen and women, at Morriston Hospital and Llandough Hospital? Also, as Mick Bates mentioned, what will happen in relation to fuel provision? Can you assure us that this planning has taken place? We have not had a chance to debate these issues, and I am not happy with how you have handled this matter, First Minister. How prepared are we in Wales, and can you indicate that we are having an input into arrangements? You spoke glibly about information given by the Home Office. I hope that there is provision for this information to be given in Welsh as well as in English.

The First Minister: It would be surprising to access that information in Welsh on the Home Office website, but we can try to ensure that that is done as soon as possible. I do not understand why you accuse me of glibness; that is an unnecessary and cheap remark, even for you. You have no right to expect daily replies to your correspondence from my office; my office has work to do other than to reply to your letters. It is important to stress that, since the attacks of 11 September, Assembly health officials have been working closely with the other UK health departments to examine and to improve NHS resilience to the new threats

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): Mae'n amlwg, gwaetha'r modd, ein bod ar drothwy ymladd rhyngwladol yn Irac, ac mae llawer o'r materion y cyfeiriwch atynt yn awr yn rhai y dylem fod wedi'u trafod beth amser yn ôl. Gresynaf at y ffaith na roddwyd y cyfle hwnnw i ni. Ysgrifennais atoch ar 13 Mawrth, gan bwysu am gael dadl ar unwaith, a chefais gerdyn cydnabod y bore yma. Nid yw hynny'n briodol, o ystyried mor ddifrifol yw'r sefyllfa.

Wrth ateb David Ian Jones yn gynharach, ymddangosai eich bod yn dweud bod y cynllunio argyfwng yn cael ei gydlynu gan y Swyddfa Gartref. Pan wnaethom anfon milwyr i Affganistan, yng Nghymru y bu'r cydlynu. Pwysaf arnoch i roi sicrwydd—sylweddolaf na allwch fynd i fanylion penodol—y bydd brechiadau ar gael os bydd ymosodiad terfysgol. Beth fydd yn digwydd o ran cyllid os byddwn yn trin, fel y dylem, ddinasyddion sifil ac, yn enwedig, milwyr a anafwyd, yn Ysbyty Treforys ac Ysbyty Llandochau? Hefyd, fel y nododd Mick Bates, beth fydd yn digwydd o ran darparu tanwydd? A allwch ein sicrhau bod y cynllunio hwn wedi digwydd? Ni chawsom gyfle i drafod y materion hyn, ac nid wyf yn fodlon ar y modd yr ydych wedi trin y mater hwn, Brif Weinidog. Pa mor barod yr ydym yng Nghymru, ac a allwch nodi a oes gennym fewnbwn i'r trefniadau? Gwnaethoch gyfeirio'n ysgafn at wybodaeth a roddir gan y Swyddfa Gartref. Gobeithiaf fod darpariaeth i roi'r wybodaeth hon yn y Gymraeg yn ogystal â'r Saesneg.

Y Prif Weinidog: Byddai'n syndod pe byddai modd cael y wybodaeth honno yn y Gymraeg ar wefan y Swyddfa Gartref, ond gallwn geisio sicrhau y gwneir hynny cyn gynted ag y bo modd. Nid wyf yn deall pam yr ydych yn fy nghyhuddo o fod yn ysgafn; sylw salw a diangen yw hwnnw, hyd yn oed gennych chi. Nid oes gennych hawl i ddisgwyl cael ateb i'ch gohebiaeth gan fy swyddfa o fewn y diwrnod; mae gan fy swyddfa waith arall i'w wneud heblaw ateb eich llythyrau chi. Mae'n bwysig nodi bod swyddogion iechyd y Cynulliad yn cydweithio'n agos ag adrannau iechyd eraill yn y DU, ers yr ymosodiadau ar 11 Medi, i

that have emerged. That includes stockpiling smallpox vaccines, making preparations for chemical, biological or radiological incidents, building up the level of expertise available to us in Wales in the event of such an outbreak, and learning how to handle the decontamination arrangements.

2.20 p.m.

On emergency planning, the only all-Wales emergency planning room is located in the Assembly. That is where action will be pulled together. Although the statutory responsibility for emergency planning remains with the Home Office, the facility for co-ordinating the action will be based in the Assembly.

Nick Bourne: The letter was personal: it was written five days ago and copies were sent to the other party leaders. I expected a personal response, which is what usually happens within that timeframe, particularly on such an important issue. It is not a question of being glib; this is the most important issue of the day. We have not had a chance to discuss it in the Assembly. You dealt with some of the issues that I raised, for which I am grateful. However, can you assure us about funding? Furthermore, will we be given a proper chance to debate these issues in full? They matter to the people of Wales and we have not had an opportunity to discuss them until now.

The First Minister: The Business Minister will deal with matters relating to business later. On funding, if you mean—and I am trying to interpret your remarks—to ask whether there will be additional funding available for the national health service in the event that it is called upon to treat substantial numbers of wounded, injured or contaminated servicemen or servicewomen, we anticipate that the Ministry of Defence will make the appropriate payments in such an event.

archwilio ac i wella gallu'r GIG i wrthsefyll y bygythiadau newydd a ddaeth i'r amlwg. Mae hynny'n cynnwys storio brechlynnau rhag y frech wen, paratoi ar gyfer digwyddiadau cemegol, biolegol neu radiolegol, cynyddu'r arbenigedd sydd ar gael i ni yng Nghymru rhag ofn y bydd achos o'r fath, a dysgu sut i drafod y trefniadau dihalogi.

Ynghylch cynllunio argyfwng, mae'r unig ystafell gynllunio argyfwng i Gymru gyfan yn y Cynulliad. Yn y fan honno y cyd-drefnir unrhyw gamau a gymerir. Er mai gan y Swyddfa Gartref y mae'r cyfrifoldeb statudol dros gynllunio argyfwng o hyd, bydd y cyfleuster i gydlynu'r camau a gymerir yn y Cynulliad.

Nick Bourne: Yr oedd y llythyr yn un personol: fe'i hysgrifennwyd bum niwrnod yn ôl ac anfonwyd copïau at arweinyddion y pleidiau eraill. Disgwyliais gael ymateb personol, sef yr hyn a ddigwydd fel arfer o fewn y cyfnod hwnnw, yn enwedig ar fater mor bwysig. Nid mater o fod yn llithrig yw hyn; dyma fater pwysicaf y dydd. Ni chawsom gyfle i'w drafod yn y Cynulliad. Gwnaethoch ddelio â rhai o'r materion a godais, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am hynny. Fodd bynnag, a allwch roi sicrwydd i ni ynghylch cyllid? At hynny, a gawn gyfle priodol i drafod y materion hyn yn llawn? Maent yn rhai sydd o bwys i bobl Cymru ac ni chawsom gyfle i'w trafod hyd yn hyn.

Y Prif Weinidog: Bydd y Trefnydd yn ymdrin â materion sy'n ymwneud â busnes yn ddiweddarach. Ynghylch cyllid, os mai'r hyn a olygwch—ac yr wyf yn ceisio dehongli'ch sylwadau—yw gofyn a fydd cyllid ychwanegol ar gael i'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol os oes angen iddo drin niferoedd mawr o filwyr sydd wedi'u clwyfo, eu hanafu neu'u halogi, rhagwelwn y bydd y Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn yn gwneud y taliadau priodol mewn achos o'r fath.

Rhyfel Posibl yn Irac **Possible War in Iraq**

Q5 John Griffiths: Will the First Minister make a statement on the consequences for Wales of the latest situation regarding possible war in Iraq? (OAQ23316)

The First Minister: We are trying to measure those consequences. Since 11 September, we have dealt with this issue on a cross-party basis, because of concerns expressed at the time about deteriorating inter-community relations in the areas of Wales that have substantial and visible ethnic minority populations. Those populations need not necessarily be Muslim, but some people assume that anyone who visibly belongs to an ethnic minority group must be a Muslim and is, therefore, a potential terrorist. Due to the likelihood of an outbreak of hostilities in the middle east shortly, we will convene an urgent meeting of the Interfaith Council for Wales on 27 March.

John Griffiths: My supplementary is about the Interfaith Council for Wales. I know from my experiences in Newport East—and the same is true of other constituencies in Wales that have substantial ethnic minority populations—that there has been a big increase in hostility, tension, and even verbal and physical abuse, since 11 September. The current crisis in Iraq has heightened the situation. Tragically, war seems to be imminent in Iraq. What practical steps can we take to monitor the situation and the impact upon ethnic minorities in those constituencies, and address any problems, as and when they arrive?

The First Minister: It is a sad fact of life that, if there is an outbreak over the next few days—and we must anticipate that there will be—that it is likely to cause, at least for a short while, some rise in inter-community tension. It will affect cities such as Newport, Swansea and Cardiff, where most of the ethnic minority populations in Wales are concentrated. You might say that it is fortunate—although that may not be the right

C5 John Griffiths: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar oblygiadau'r sefyllfa ddiweddaraf o ran rhyfel posibl yn Irac i Gymru? (OAQ23316)

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym yn ceisio mesur y goblygiadau hynny. Ers 11 Medi, yr ydym wedi ymdrin â'r mater hwn mewn modd trawsbleidiol, oherwydd y pryderon a fynegwyd ar y pryd ynghylch y dirywiad yn y cysylltiadau rhwng cymunedau yn y rhannau o Gymru lle y mae poblogaethau lleiafrifol ethnig sylweddol a gweladwy. Nid Moslemiaid yw'r poblogaethau hynny o reidrwydd, ond mae rhai'n cymryd bod unrhyw un y mae'n amlwg ar ei olwg ei fod yn aelod o grŵp lleiafrifol ethnig yn Foslem ac, felly, yn derfysgwr posibl. Am ei bod yn debyg y bydd ymladd yn y dwyrain canol cyn hir, gwnawn gynnull cyfarfod brys o Gyngor Rhyng-grefyddol Cymru ar 27 Mawrth.

John Griffiths: Mae'r cwestiwn atodol sydd gennyf yn ymwneud â Chyngor Rhyng-grefyddol Cymru. Gwn o'm profiadau yn Nwyrain Casnewydd—ac mae'r un peth yn wir am etholaethau eraill yng Nghymru sydd â phoblogaeth leiafrifol ethnig sylweddol—fod cynnydd mawr wedi bod mewn gelyniaeth, tyndra, a hyd yn oed camdriniaeth ar lafar ac yn gorfforol, ers 11 Medi. Mae'r argyfwng presennol yn Irac wedi dwysáu'r sefyllfa. Gwaetha'r modd, ymddengys fod rhyfel ar fin digwydd yn Irac. Pa gamau ymarferol y gallwn eu cymryd i gadw golwg ar y sefyllfa ac ar yr effaith ar leiafrifoedd ethnig yn yr etholaethau hynny, ac i ymateb i unrhyw broblemau, os ydynt yn codi?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'n ffaith drist, os bydd rhyfel yn dechrau yn ystod y dyddiau nesaf—a rhaid inni ddisgwyl y bydd—ei fod yn debygol o beri rhywfaint o dyndra rhwng cymunedau, am gyfnod byr o leiaf. Bydd yn effeithio ar ddinasoedd fel Casnewydd, Abertawe a Chaerdydd, lle y mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r poblogaethau lleiafrifol ethnig yng Nghymru. Gellid dweud ei bod yn ffodus—er nad hwnnw yw'r gair priodol, efallai—

word—that since 11 September we have had a degree of practice, albeit for all the wrong reasons. Everyone now has each other's telephone numbers and we can communicate with community leaders from different faiths and denominations, and with ethnic minority groups. We can get together more quickly now to stop or stamp out any rise in activities. I will not name those activities as it could encourage the wrong kind of person to take a hint from that. Such activities went on for about three months after 11 September, and then eased off. We certainly hope that that will not happen again. What happens in the middle east is not about Christians versus Muslims: this is not a repeat of the crusades. The similar activity that took place in Kosovo four years ago was aimed at preventing Muslims from being assassinated and raped by people masquerading as Christian fanatics acting on behalf of the Serbian Government. Action was taken then, although not within the United Nations framework, to prevent ethnic cleansing against Muslims. Therefore, there is no question of anybody in this country, or in any governmental institution in this country, being prejudiced against Muslims in our society or worldwide.

Jocelyn Davies: The Stop the War Coalition is urging people to down tools for just 15 minutes at midday on the day that war is declared. Some Welsh councils, in conjunction with trade unions, have declared their intention to do so. Will you join them in that silent, peaceful protest?

The First Minister: I cannot imagine downing tools to protest. On this crisis—if it occurs over the next few days, as we anticipate it will—one great advantage of living in a democracy is that we respect one another's differing opinions. People in Iraq—except for the northern Iraq devolved salient—do not have that. They do not have the luxury of a stop the war coalition, peace movements, or movements that strongly disagree with the Government. One benefit of living in a democracy is that people respect each other's differing opinions, and are able to express those opinions in different ways.

inni gael rhywfaint o ymarfer ers 11 Medi, er bod hynny am y rhesymau anghywir. Mae gan bawb rifau teleffon ei gilydd erbyn hyn a gallwn gysylltu ag arweinwyr cymunedol o wahanol grefyddau ac enwadau, a chyda grwpiau lleiafrifol ethnig. Gallwn ddod at ein gilydd yn gyflymach yn awr i atal neu ddileu unrhyw gynnydd mewn gweithgareddau. Nid enwaf y gweithgareddau hynny gan y gallai rhywun drwg gymryd hynny'n awgrym. Aeth gweithgareddau o'r fath ymlaen am tua thri mis ar ôl 11 Medi, ac arafu wedyn. Yr ydym yn sicr yn gobeithio na fydd hynny'n digwydd eto. Nid yw'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn y dwyrain canol yn rhywbeth rhwng Cristnogion a Moslemiaid: nid croesgad yw hon. Amcan y gweithgaredd tebyg a fu yn Kosovo bedair blynedd yn ôl oedd atal lladd a threisio Moslemiaid gan rai a oedd yn ffugio bod yn eithafwyr Cristnogol a weithredai ar ran Llywodraeth Serbia. Cymerwyd camau bryd hynny, er nad oeddent o fewn fframwaith y Cenhedloedd Unedig, i atal sgwrio ethnig yn erbyn Moslemiaid. Felly, nid oes lle i gredu bod gan unrhyw un yn y wlad hon, neu mewn unrhyw sefydliad llywodraethol yn y wlad hon, ragfarn yn erbyn Moslemiaid yn ein cymdeithas neu'n fyd-eang.

Jocelyn Davies: Mae Cynghair Atal y Rhyfel yn annog pobl i roi'r gorau i'w gwaith am 15 munud yn unig am hanner dydd ar y diwrnod y datgenir rhyfel. Mae rhai cyngorau yng Nghymru, ar y cyd ag undebau llafur, wedi datgan eu bwriad i wneud hynny. A wnewch ymuno â hwy yn y brostest ddistaw, heddychlon honno?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni allwn ddychmygu rhoi'r gorau i weithio er mwyn protestio. Ynghylch yr argyfwng hwn—os digwydd dros y dyddiau nesaf, fel yr ydym yn disgwyl—un fantais fawr o fyw mewn democratiaeth yw ein bod yn parchu gwahaniaeth barn rhwng pobl. Nid yw'r fantais honno gan bobl yn Irac—heblaw am y rhai yn y rhan ogleddol o Irac sydd wedi'i datganoli. Nid oes ganddynt y moethusrwydd o gynghair atal y rhyfel, mudiadau heddwch, neu fudiadau sy'n anghytuno'n bendant â'r Llywodraeth. Un fantais o fyw mewn democratiaeth yw bod pobl yn parchu gwahaniaeth barn, ac yn

gallu mynegi barn mewn gwahanol ffyrdd.

Targedau Dogfennau Strategol **Targets in Strategic Documents**

C6 Cynog Dafis: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar unrhyw dargedau nad yw Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi'u bodloni yn y dogfennau strategol a gyhoeddwyd ganddi hyd yma? (OAQ23286)

Q6 Cynog Dafis: Will the First Minister make a statement on any targets that the Welsh Assembly Government has failed to meet from its strategic documents published to date? (OAQ23286)

Y Prif Weinidog: Byddai'n well gennyf bwysleisio'r rhai yr ydym wedi eu cyflawni, yn enwedig y rhai eithaf newydd, gan gynnwys targedau newydd ar angiogramau. Mae bron â bod yn afresymol i Plaid Cymru, os na all ei hymchwilywyr ddod o hyd i wallau yn ein rhaglen, ddisgwyl inni wneud ei gwaith ymchwil ar ei rhan. Nid oes gennym amser i wneud hynny wrth inni gynllunio a gosod targedau newydd ac, yng nghyswllt angiogramau, wrth inni gyrraedd y targed, sef nad oes unrhyw un yn aros mwy na chwe mis i dderbyn triniaeth neu ddiagnosis.

The First Minister: I would prefer to emphasise those that we have met, particularly the relatively new ones, including new targets on angiograms. It is almost unreasonable for Plaid Cymru, if its researchers cannot find errors in our programme, to expect us to do its research work on its behalf. We do not have time to do so when we are planning and setting new targets and, in the context of angiograms, meeting the target, namely that no-one waits more than six months to receive treatment or diagnosis.

Cynog Dafis: Efallai bod y Prif Weinidog am gellwair, ond yr wyf fi o ddifrif. Mae'r targed yn 'GwellCymru.com' yn nodi bod bwriad i greu 34,000 o swyddi yn ardal Amcan 1 erbyn Mawrth 2003—sef yn awr. Erbyn Tachwedd 2002, dim ond 10,000 o swyddi a oedd wedi eu creu. Yn ôl Dylan Jones-Evans, mae hyd at hanner y rheini yn swyddi gweinyddu'r prosiectau, a ddaw i ben ar ddiwedd y rhaglen. Yn ogystal â hynny, mae'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd wedi hawlio'r clod am 800 o swyddi nad ydynt ar gael. A gytunwch fod y sefyllfa hon yn llanestr llwyr, ac a ydych yn dal yn awyddus i'r Llywodraeth, a chithau, gael eich barnu ar eich record?

Cynog Dafis: The First Minister may want to jest, but I am serious. The target in 'BetterWales.com' notes the intention to create 34,000 jobs in the Objective 1 area by March 2003—which is now. By November 2002, only 10,000 jobs had been created. According to Dylan Jones-Evans, as many as half of those jobs are related to administrating the projects, and will come to an end at the end of the programme. In addition to that, the Minister for Economic Development has claimed credit for 800 jobs that do not exist. Do you agree that this situation is a complete mess, and are you still eager for you and your Government to be judged on your record?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ydwyf, yn sicr. Mae diweithdra wedi gostwng yn gyflymach yn ardal Amcan 1, felly mae'n rhaid bod rhywbeth da yn digwydd yno. Dylai hyd yn oed Plaid Cymru a'r Athro Dylan Jones-Evans allu gweld bod diweithdra yn gostwng yn gyflymach yn ardal Amcan 1 nag yng ngweddill Cymru. Mae'n amlwg, felly, bod rhywbeth da yn digwydd yn yr economi, a'i fod yn digwydd yn gyflymach yn ardal Amcan 1. Nid yw'r ffigurau hyn ar greu swyddi ychwanegol, neu'r cynnydd yng nghyfanswm cyflogaeth, yn ardal Amcan 1

The First Minister: Yes, certainly. Unemployment has fallen more rapidly in the Objective 1 area, so something good must be happening there. Even Plaid Cymru and Professor Dylan Jones-Evans should be able to see that unemployment is falling more rapidly in the Objective 1 area than in the rest of Wales. It is obvious, therefore, that something good is happening to the economy, and that it is happening more rapidly in the Objective 1 area. These figures on creating additional jobs, or the increase in employment in general, in the Objective 1

o'i gymharu ag ardaloedd eraill, yn cymharu o ran faint y gallwch wasgu arnynt, gan eich bod yn gweithio ar lefel is na lefel Cymru gyfan. Mae'r ffigurau yr ydym wedi eu cyhoeddi yn ymwneud â chynnydd mewn cyflogaeth ar lefel Cymru gyfan. Mae hynny'n llawer mwy dibynadwy; gallwn ddibynnu ar ffigurau Cymru gyfan. Gallwch ddibynnu ar y ffigurau diweithdra, hyd yn oed ar y lefel leol.

Kirsty Williams: Given the British Medical Association's announcement that it has delayed balloting its members on the proposed new GP contract, what do you anticipate will be the effect on the Government's policy to recruit and retain GPs, especially in rural areas? What action is this administration taking to move this agenda forward, not only for a new GP contract, but also for a new contract for consultants, which is vital if we are to achieve an improved NHS for the people of Wales?

The First Minister: Ballots are being held on pay increases for nurses and professions allied to medicine—that is a massive exercise. There are also new contracts for GPs and for consultants. We have failed in Wales in the ballot on the mark 1 new contract for consultants. I was not aware that the GPs were also balloting: I am interested in that. In trying to encourage GPs to accept a new contract, which will involve new ways of working, it is possible that some GPs will do well while others lose out—I hope that that that will not be the case because some GPs in rural Wales have to deal with sparse populations. You may be particularly concerned about GPs in Powys. You cannot cover a large area, such as Powys, with a long list as you can in urban areas, such as Cardiff or Swansea.

2.30 p.m.

Jonathan Morgan: In your response to Cynog Dafis you refused to refer to any of the education targets that have been set and

area compared to other areas, do not compare in terms of how much pressure you can put on them, because you are working at a lower level than the all-Wales level. The figures that we have published on the increase in employment are at the all-Wales level. That is far more reliable; we can rely on the all-Wales figures. You can rely on the unemployment figures even at the local level.

Kirsty Williams: Yng ngolwg y cyhoeddiad gan Gymdeithas Feddygol Prydain ei bod wedi gohirio cynnal pleidlais ymysg ei haelodau ar y contract newydd arfaethedig i feddygon teulu, beth a ragwelwch fydd yr effaith ar bolisi'r Llywodraeth ar gyfer recriwtio a chadw meddygon teulu, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd gwledig? Pa gamau y mae'r weinyddiaeth hon yn eu cymryd i fwrw ymlaen â'r agenda hon, nid yn unig i gael contract newydd i feddygon teulu, ond i gael contract newydd hefyd ar gyfer ymgynghorwyr, gan fod hynny'n hollbwysig os ydym i sicrhau gwell GIG i bobl Cymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Cynhelir pleidleisiau ar godiadau yn y tâl i nyrsys a phroffesiynau sy'n gysylltiedig â meddygaeth—mae hwnnw'n waith mawr iawn. Mae contractau newydd hefyd i feddygon teulu ac ymgynghorwyr. Yr ydym wedi methu yng Nghymru ar y bleidlais ar fersiwn cyntaf y contract newydd i ymgynghorwyr. Ni wyddwn fod y meddygon teulu'n bwrw pleidlais hefyd: mae hynny o ddi-ddordeb i mi. Wrth geisio cymell meddygon teulu i dderbyn contract newydd, a fydd yn golygu dulliau newydd o weithio, mae'n bosibl y bydd rhai meddygon teulu'n gwneud yn dda tra bydd eraill ar eu colled—gobeithiaf nad felly y bydd gan fod rhai meddygon teulu yng Nghymru wledig yn gorfod delio â phoblogaethau tenau. Efallai'ch bod yn poeni'n benodol am feddygon teulu ym Mhowys. Ni ellir gofalu am ardal fawr, fel Powys, gyda rhestr hir fel y gellir mewn ardaloedd trefol, fel Caerdydd ac Abertawe.

Jonathan Morgan: Yn eich ymateb i Cynog Dafis gwnaethoch wrthod cyfeirio at unrhyw un o'r targedau addysg sydd wedi'u gosod

missed, particularly the target set by your colleague, the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, for key stage 3 attainment. She has spent an additional £25 million in the past year in order to reach those targets, but has only increased attainment by 1 per cent. Are you happy that we are spending such a large sum of money for such a small return in achievement?

a'u methu, yn enwedig y targed a osodwyd gan eich cyd-Weinidog, y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, ar gyfer cyrhaeddiad yng nghyfnod allweddol 3. Gwariodd £25 miliwn ychwanegol yn y flwyddyn a aeth heibio i gyrraedd y targedau hynny, ond nid yw ond wedi cynyddu'r cyrhaeddiad o 1 y cant. A ydych yn fodlon ein bod yn gwario swm mor fawr i gael cynnydd mor fach mewn cyrhaeddiad?

The First Minister: When you set 100 or more targets, it would not be reasonable to expect to hit every one. You will overfulfil some of those targets and you will barely meet others. The majority has been met, but some will not be. On the issue of whether improvements happen more quickly in key stage 1 than in key stage 3, young people at key stage 3, particularly boys, are in a difficult age group. There is a falling away in educational attendance and interest in the 11 to 14-year-old age group. We have not been able to crack that yet. I fully accept that, as does the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, I am sure.

Y Prif Weinidog: Pan osodir 100 neu ragor o dargedau, ni fyddai'n rhesymol disgwyl cyrraedd pob un. Gorgyflawnir ar rai o'r targedau hynny a phrin gyrhaeddir eraill. Cyrhaeddwyd y mwyafrif ohonynt, ond ni chyrrhaeddir rhai. Ynghylch y mater o ba un a yw gwelliannau'n digwydd yn gynt yng nghyfnod allweddol 1 nag yng nghyfnod allweddol 3, mae pobl ifanc yng nghyfnod allweddol 3, yn enwedig bechgyn, mewn grŵp oedran anodd. Ceir llai o bresenoldeb a diddordeb mewn addysg yn y grŵp oedran 11 i 14 blwydd oed. Nid ydym wedi gallu datrys hynny eto. Yr wyf yn llawn dderbyn hynny, fel y mae'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, yr wyf yn siŵr.

**'Cynllun i Gymru 2001'
'Plan for Wales 2001'**

C7 Ieuan Wyn Jones: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar y camau a gymerwyd yn ystod y chwe mis diwethaf i roi ar waith y polisiau a amlinellwyd yn 'Cynllun i Gymru 2001'? (OAQ23276)

Q7 Ieuan Wyn Jones: Will the First Minister make a statement on the implementation of policies outlined in 'Plan for Wales 2001' during the last six months? (OAQ23276)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae un agwedd ar y polisiau lle yr ydym bron â chyrraedd y targed a osodwyd, a lle y ceir ystadegau gweddol newydd, sydd o ddiddordeb i bawb yn y Cynulliad, yn ymwneud â'r Fargen Newydd i bobl ifanc. Gosodais darged y byddai 30,000 o bobl ifanc wedi sicrhau swyddi parhaol neu gyfleoedd hyfforddi erbyn diwedd y Cynulliad hwn. Mae'r ffigur diweddaraf sydd ar gael, hyd at Ragfyr 2002, yn nodi bod 28,400 o bobl ifanc wedi sicrhau swyddi parhaol neu gyfleoedd hyfforddi ers Mai 1999. Felly, yr ydym yn agos at gyrraedd y targed hwnnw.

The First Minister: One aspect of the policies where we are close to reaching the target set and where there are relatively new statistics, which are of interest to everyone in the Assembly, involves the New Deal for young people. I set a target that 30,000 young people would have secured permanent jobs or training opportunities by the end of this Assembly. The most recent figure available, up to December 2002, indicates that 28,400 young people have secured permanent jobs or training opportunities since May 1999. Therefore, we are close to attaining that target.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Dychwelaf at eich ateb i gwestiwn Cynog Dafis lle y dywedasoeh na wyddech beth oedd yn digwydd yn ardal

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I return to your answer to Cynog Dafis's question where you said that you did not know what was happening

Amcan 1, ond bod rhywbeth yn digwydd gan fod nifer y swyddi yn cynyddu. Dywed yr Athro Dylan Jones-Evans fod hanner y swyddi a grëwyd yn rhai gweinyddol a ddaw i ben o fewn dwy flynedd. Nid ydynt felly yn swyddi parhaol, cynaliadwy nac yn rhai hirdymor. Os nad ydych am wrando ar sylwadau Dylan Jones-Evans, beth am ichi wrando ar rai Russell Lawson o Ffederasiwn y Busnesau Bach. Dywed nad yw'r rhain yn swyddi go iawn. Beth fydd yn digwydd i'r 4,000 o weinyddwyr ymhen dwy flynedd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Credaf eich bod yn dibynnu gormod ar eiriau yr Athro Dylan Jones-Evans. Pe baech am ganfod unrhyw un arall ym mywyd cyhoeddus Cymru sy'n ymosodol a drwgdybus ynglŷn â'r lles a ddaw o Amcan 1, Russell Lawson fyddai'r person hwnnw. Mae'n cynrychioli'r FSB ac, wrth gwrs, mae'n naturiol iddo gredu y dylai'r holl arian fynd yn syth i'r sector preifat. Mae Cyllid Cymru—sy'n fanc er na chaiff ei alw'n fanc am resymau cyfreithiol—wedi'i sefydlu a bu'r sector preifat a'r FSB yn galw am y math hwnnw o fanc i fuddsoddi mewn cwmnïau bach a chanolig eu maint â'u gwreiddiau yng Nghymru. Cyflawnwyd hynny, ni sydd wedi ei gyflwyno a chaiff llawer o'i arian oddi wrth Amcan 1. Er nad yw'r arian yn mynd yn uniongyrchol i'r cwmnïau hynny, aiff drwy lyfrau Cyllid Cymru. Credaf fod pawb, gan gynnwys sawl aelod o'r FSB, yn canmol a chroesawu'r datblygiad hwnnw.

Christine Chapman: Do you agree that the announcement by your Cabinet colleague, Jane Hutt, before Christmas of a new, £30 million Cynon Valley hospital and two new primary care centres for my constituents is an example of how Labour in the Assembly is delivering on its health commitments in 'Plan for Wales 2001'? Do you also agree that it is vital that we raise people's aspirations for a modernised health service in the Valleys, which is desperately needed after generations of neglect under the previous Government?

The First Minister: I agree. We promised new community-based hospitals as well as

in the Objective 1 area but that something must be happening because the number of jobs is increasing. Professor Dylan Jones-Evans says that half the jobs created are administrative posts, which will come to an end within two years. Therefore, they are not permanent, sustainable or long-term jobs. If you do not wish to listen to the comments of Dylan Jones-Evans, what about listening to Russell Lawson of the Federation of Small Businesses. He says that these are not real jobs. What will happen to the 4,000 administrators in two years' time?

The First Minister: I think that you are overly dependent on the words of Professor Dylan Jones-Evans. If you wanted to find someone else in public life in Wales who attacks Objective 1, and is suspicious of the benefit it brings, Russell Lawson would be that person. He represents the FSB and, of course, he naturally believes that all the funding should go directly to the private sector. Finance Wales—which is a bank although it is not called a bank for legal reasons—has been established, and the private sector and the FSB have been calling for that type of bank which can invest in small and medium-sized businesses based in Wales. That was achieved, we introduced it and it receives a great deal of money through Objective 1. Although the funding is not handed directly to those businesses, it goes through the books of Finance Wales. I believe that everyone, including many members of the FSB, commend and welcome that development.

Christine Chapman: A ydych yn cytuno bod y cyhoeddiad gan eich cyd-Weinidog yn y Cabinet, Jane Hutt, cyn y Nadolig am ysbyty newydd gwerth £30 miliwn ar gyfer cwm Cynon a'r ddwy ganolfan gofal sylfaenol ar gyfer fy etholwyr yn enghraifft o'r modd y mae Llafur yn y Cynulliad yn cyflawni ei hymrwymadau ar iechyd yn 'Cynllun i Gymru 2001'? A gytunwch hefyd ei bod yn hollbwysig inni ennyn mwy o uchelgais mewn pobl i weld gwasanaeth iechyd modern yn y Cymoedd, y mae taer angen amdano ar ôl cenedlaethau o esgeulustod o dan y Llywodraeth flaenorol?

Y Prif Weinidog: Cytunaf. Gwnaethom addo codi ysbytai newydd yn y gymuned yn

the new hospital for Baglan, in Neath Port Talbot. I was present at the opening of that hospital, built with private finance initiative funding. Many of the other hospitals are in areas where it is not easy to make use of PFI. As a result, they are being built with conventional public capital—many will now be built. They are in the ‘Plan for Wales 2001’ and I am pleased that they have reached the next stage in the building process, and are closer to opening their doors.

David Melding: How is your NHS modernisation agenda helped by the fact that, despite spending an additional 40 per cent in the health service, you now treat 3 per cent fewer hospital patients?

The First Minister: I do not think that that is true. Our problem is that, as technology and methods of medicine change, patients who received new forms of treatment are not included in statistics in the early years, as the statistics only include areas of treatment that have been going on for years. When the alternative pathways to treatment are captured in the statistics, you will find that the increase in treatment is substantial and is achieved in ways that are of greater benefit to the patient than old-fashioned, conventional treatment.

ogystal â'r ysbyty newydd ym Maglan, yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot. Yr oeddwn yn bresennol pan agorwyd yr ysbyty hwnnw, a godwyd gyda chyllid o fenter cyllid preifat. Mae llawer o'r ysbytai eraill mewn ardaloedd lle nad yw'n hawdd defnyddio menter cyllid preifat. O ganlyniad i hynny, fe'u codir gyda chyllid cyhoeddus confensiynol—codir llawer yn awr. Maent yn y 'Cynllun i Gymru 2001' ac yr wyf yn falch eu bod wedi cyrraedd y cam nesaf yn y broses adeiladu, a'u bod yn nes at agor eu drysau.

David Melding: Pa gymorth i'ch agenda ar gyfer moderneiddio'r GIG yw'r ffaith eich bod bellach yn trin 3 y cant yn llai o gleifion ysbyty, er gwario 40 y cant yn ychwanegol yn y gwasanaeth iechyd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni chredaf fod hynny'n wir. Y broblem sydd gennym yw, wrth i dechnoleg a dulliau meddygol newid, nad yw cleifion sy'n cael mathau newydd o driniaeth wedi'u cynnwys mewn ystadegau yn y blynyddoedd cynnar, gan nad yw'r ystadegau ond yn cynnwys meysydd triniaeth sy'n mynd ymlaen ers blynyddoedd. Pan gofnodir y dulliau eraill o driniaeth yn yr ystadegau, cewch fod cynnydd sylweddol mewn triniaeth a'i fod yn cael ei gyflawni mewn moddau sy'n gwneud mwy o les i'r claf na thriniaeth gonfensiynol, hen-ffasiwn.

Cyfle Cyfartal Equality of Opportunity

C8 David Lloyd: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar flaenoriaethau ei Lywodraeth o ran sicrhau cyfle cyfartal i bawb yng Nghymru yn ystod y mis nesaf? (OAQ23277)

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn y cyfnod presennol, yr ydym yn cefnogi ymgyrch y Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal a Chyngres yr Undebau Llafur yng Nghymru i wthio'r agenda ar gydraddoldeb tâl yn y sectorau preifat a chyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn ei blaen.

David Lloyd: Sut yr ydych yn bwriadu hyrwyddo diogelwch y gymuned Foslemaidd yng Nghymru yn ystod unrhyw ryfel ag Irac? Yr ydym wedi clywed eisoes fod rhifau ffôn

Q8 David Lloyd: Will the First Minister make a statement on his Government's priorities, with regards to securing equality of opportunity for everyone in Wales, during the next month? (OAQ23277)

The First Minister: At present, we are supporting the campaign by the Equal Opportunities Commission and the Wales Trades Union Congress to push forward the equal pay agenda in the private and public sectors in Wales.

David Lloyd: How do you intend to promote the security of the Muslim community in Wales in the event of any war with Iraq? We have already heard that phone

wedi'u cyfnewid, a bod trafodaethau ar y gweill, ond beth yr ydych am ei wneud?

Y Prif Weinidog: Byddwn yn cynnal cyfarfod brys gydag arweinwyr y pleidiau eraill ar 27 Mawrth—wythnos i ddydd Iau—a byddwn yn cwrdd ag arweinwyr y gwahanol grefyddau yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys y Moslemiaid, er mwyn gwneud paratodau i sicrhau na fydd yr hyn a ddigwyddodd yn y tri mis ar ôl 11 Medi 2001 yn digwydd eto. Byddwn yn ystyried yr hyn a all ddigwydd o ganlyniad i ymgyrch filwrol yn y dwyrain canol, neu derfysg yng ngwledydd y gorllewin.

Lorraine Barrett: With regard to equality of opportunity for everyone, including deaf people, will you join me in welcoming today's statement by Andrew Smith MP that the UK Labour Government recognises British sign language as a language in its own right? This will be an important step towards ensuring that deaf people become less marginalised.

The First Minister: I was not aware of that development, but I strongly welcome it. People who are deaf have their own language, and the recognition of that language is a great step forward in the inclusion of deaf people in society, and mainstreaming them in society.

William Graham: With regard to equality of opportunity, does fair play extend to people on hospital waiting lists, to people on consultants' waiting lists, to farmers waiting for payment within time limits, to people who own nursing and residential homes, or to the victims of crime?

The First Minister: Absolutely. None of those groups does not deserve fair play or does not receive fair play. There is, however, a reprehensible practice by which some consultants in the health service encourage people to come to see them in private waiting rooms in order to advance up the waiting list. That is caused by the pressure of long waiting lists, but it is a long-standing practice. It is an issue on which I would welcome your support. We are trying to ensure that consultants do not do this in order to change

numbers have been exchanged and that discussions are ongoing, but what are you going to do?

The First Minister: We will hold an urgent meeting with other party leaders on 27 March—a week Thursday—and we will meet with leaders of the various faiths in Wales, including the Muslim faith, in order to make arrangements to ensure that what happened during the three months after 11 September 2001 does not happen again. We will consider what could happen as a result of a military campaign in the middle east, or terrorism in the west.

Lorraine Barrett: Gyda golwg ar gyfle cyfartal i bawb, gan gynnwys pobl fyddar, a wnewch ymuno â mi i groesawu'r datganiad gan Andrew Smith AS fod Llywodraeth Lafur y DU yn cydnabod iaith arwyddion Prydain yn iaith drwy ei hawl ei hun? Bydd hyn yn gam pwysig ymlaen tuag at sicrhau na fydd pobl fyddar yn cael eu gwthio i'r ymylon i'r un graddau.

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni wyddwn am y datblygiad hwnnw, ond fe'i croesawaf yn fawr. Mae gan bobl sy'n fyddar eu hiaith eu hun, ac mae cydnabod yr iaith honno'n gam mawr ymlaen er mwyn cynnwys pobl fyddar mewn cymdeithas, a'u gosod yn y brif ffrwd mewn cymdeithas.

William Graham: Gyda golwg ar gyfle cyfartal, a yw chwarae teg i fod ar gael hefyd i bobl ar restrau aros ysbytai, pobl ar restrau aros ymgynghorwyr, ffermwyr sy'n disgwyl am daliad o fewn terfyn amser, pobl sy'n berchen ar gartrefi nyrsio a phreswyl, neu'r rhai sy'n dioddef gan drosedd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn hollol. Nid oes yr un o'r grwpiau hynny nad yw'n haeddu chwarae teg neu'n cael chwarae teg. Er hynny, mae arfer gresynus gan rai ymgynghorwyr yn y gwasanaeth iechyd o annog pobl i ddod i'w gweld mewn ystafelloedd aros preifat er mwyn cael dringo'r rhestr aros. Achosir hynny gan y pwysau oherwydd rhestrau aros hir, ond mae'n arfer hirsefydlog. Mae'n fater y byddwn yn falch o gael eich cefnogaeth arno. Yr ydym yn ceisio sicrhau na wnaiff

queue priorities. Patients should not pay to see the consultant privately at the out-patient level in order to get quicker treatment at the in-patient level. That is reprehensible.

ymgynghorwyr hyn er mwyn newid blaenoriaethau yn y rhestr aros. Ni ddylai cleifion dalu i weld yr ymgynghorydd yn breifat fel claf allanol er mwyn cael eu trin yn gynt fel claf mewnol. Mae hynny'n resynus.

Y Llywydd: Mae cwestiwn 9 (OAQ23284) wedi'i drosglwyddo ar gyfer ateb ysgrifenedig.

The Presiding Officer: Question 9 (OAQ23284) has been transferred for written answer.

2.40 p.m.

Dynodi Swyddfeydd Post Trefol Designation of Urban Post Offices

Q10 Gwenda Thomas: What discussions has the First Minister had with Post Office Ltd regarding the designation of urban post offices? (OAQ23319) [R]

C10 Gwenda Thomas: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cael â Swyddfa'r Post Cyf ynghylch dynodi swyddfeydd post trefol? (OAQ23319) [R]

The First Minister: I have not discussed the matter with the company. However, I understand that Edwina Hart, the Finance Minister, has written to the chair of the Royal Mail Group advisory board for Wales to inquire about post office classification.

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf wedi trafod y mater gyda'r cwmni. Er hynny, deallaf fod Edwina Hart, y Gweinidog Cyllid, wedi ysgrifennu at gadeirydd bwrdd ymgynghorol Grŵp y Post Brenhinol i Gymru i holi ynghylch dosbarthu swyddfeydd post.

Gwenda Thomas: The Cadoxton branch post office in my constituency is to close in April. As it is designated an urban branch, it is one of the first casualties of reorganisation. Cadoxton is a village, with an electorate of fewer than 2,000 people but, because Post Office Ltd has decided that it is part of Neath's urban sprawl, it is now deemed to be serving 10,001 people, which is the criterion used in its branch designation procedure. Do you agree that to deny a community the continued use of a village post office on that basis is not only unreasonable, but discriminates against elderly and disabled people?

Gwenda Thomas: Mae swyddfa bost gangen Llangatwg yn fy etholaeth i gau yn Ebrill. Gan ei bod wedi'i dynodi'n gangen drefol, hi yw un o'r rhai cyntaf i ddioddef gan yr ad-drefnu. Pentref yw Llangatwg, a chanddo lai na 2,000 o etholwyr ond, gan fod Swyddfa'r Post Cyf wedi penderfynu ei fod yn rhan o flerdwf trefol Castell-nedd, bernir yn awr ei bod yn gwasanaethu 10,001 o bobl, sef y maen prawf a ddefnyddir yn ei gweithdrefn ar gyfer dynodi canghennau. A gytunwch nad yw hynny'n sail resymol i wrthod gadael i gymuned barhau i ddefnyddio swyddfa bost bentref, a'i bod hefyd yn gwahaniaethu yn erbyn pobl oeddrannus a phobl anabl?

The First Minister: It could have that effect. I am not sure whether you are referring to a main post office or a sub-post office. I am not sure how you classify the post office, given the nature of Cadoxton, which is both a suburb and a village, and which is and is not part of Neath. However, we must find a way of allowing Assembly Members, and others, to make a plea that particular post offices are wrongly classified.

Y Prif Weinidog: Gallai gael effaith o'r fath. Nid wyf yn sicr a ydych yn cyfeirio at brif swyddfa bost neu at is-swyddfa bost. Nid wyf yn sicr ym mha ddsbarth y byddai'r swyddfa bost honno, oherwydd natur Llangatwg, sy'n faestref ac yn bentref, ac sy'n rhan ac eto heb fod yn rhan o Gastell-nedd. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni ddarganfod modd i ganiatáu i Aelodau o'r Cynulliad, ac eraill, wneud apêl i'r perwyl

bod swyddfeydd post penodol wedi'u camddosbarthu.

Brian Hancock: Last week, it was announced that around 150 post offices will close in Wales over the coming year or so. What action have you taken to prevent this haemorrhaging of services from our suburban and urban communities? This is especially important given that, next month, the benefit and pensions payment systems will change. Also, when my constituents have rung the helpline, they have found it to be far from helpful.

Brian Hancock: Yr wythnos diwethaf, cyhoeddwyd y bydd tua 150 o swyddfeydd post yn cau yng Nghymru dros y flwyddyn nesaf, fwy neu lai. Pa gamau a gymerasoch i atal colli'r gwasanaethau hyn o'n cymunedau mewn trefi a maestrefi? Mae hyn yn arbennig o bwysig yng ngolwg y ffaith y bydd y systemau talu budd-daliadau a phensiynau'n newid y mis nesaf. Hefyd, pan ffoniodd fy etholwyr y llinell gymorth, ni chawsant fawr o gymorth ganddi.

The First Minister: Post Office Ltd wrote to all sub-post masters—and I am not sure whether Cadoxton is a sub-post office—on 10 April 2002, informing them of whether or not their post office was within the scope of the restructuring proposals, namely the urban reinvention programme, and providing further details of that scheme. Rural post offices are not affected by these proposals, which is Gwenda's point. Some post offices will be unable to find alternative business when benefit payments cease to be paid through post offices; others, in rural areas, will find alternative business possible, especially with the assistance that we have set out. Some sub-post masters and mistresses would rather retire with dignity—which this proposal allows them to do—than make a desperate effort to find somebody to sell their business to.

Y Prif Weinidog: Ysgrifennodd Swyddfa'r Post Cyf at yr holl is-bostfeistri—ac nid wyf yn sicr ai is-swyddfa bost yw un Llangatwg—ar 10 Ebrill 2002, gan eu hysbysu a oedd eu swyddfa bost o fewn cwrpas y cynigion ailstrwythuro, sef y rhaglen ailddyfeisio trefol, a chan roi rhagor o fanylion am y cynllun hwnnw. Nid yw'r cynigion hyn yn effeithio ar swyddfeydd post gwledig, a dyna oedd y pwnt a oedd gan Gwenda. Bydd rhai swyddfeydd post yn methu â dod o hyd i fusnes arall pan roddir y gorau i dalu budd-daliadau drwy swyddfeydd post; bydd eraill, mewn ardaloedd gwledig, yn ei chael yn bosibl dod o hyd i fusnes arall, yn enwedig gyda'r cymorth yr ydym wedi'i gynnig. Mae rhai is-bostfeistri ac is-bostfeistresi y byddai'n well ganddynt ymddeol yn urddasol—ac mae'r cynnig hwn yn eu galluogi i wneud hynny—yn hytrach na chwilio'n wyllt am rywun y gallant werthu eu busnes iddo.

In the past, sub-post offices were little goldmines, but that is no longer as true as, following changes in the benefit regulations, they are in a more competitive market. Access to the urban reinvention or the rural redevelopment proposals offers potential to some post offices, but will not save every post office in Wales.

Yn y gorffennol, yr oedd is-swyddfeydd post yn talu'n dda, ond nid yw hynny'n wir bellach oherwydd, ar ôl y newidiadau i'r rheoliadau budd-dal, maent mewn marchnad fwy cystadleuol. Mae'r gallu i dderbyn y cynigion ar ailddyfeisio trefol neu ailddatblygu gwledig yn cynnig potensial i rai swyddfeydd post, ond ni fyddant yn achub pob swyddfa bost yng Nghymru.

Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi derbyn cais, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.9, i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ystyried mater penodol, sef y

The Presiding Officer: I have received a request, under Standing Order No. 6.9, for the National Assembly to consider a

sefyllfa ddiweddaraf yn Irac a'i goblygiadau i Gymru. Yr wyf yn fodlon fod hwn yn fater brys sydd o bwys cyhoeddus o dan y Rheol Sefydlog, a chaniatâf dair munud i arweinydd yr wrthblaid gynnig y cynnig, a thair munud i'r Trefnydd ymateb cyn inni bleidleisio ar y mater.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Cynigaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.9, yn ystyried mater penodol, sef y sefyllfa ddiweddaraf yn Irac a'i goblygiadau i Gymru.

Gan fod y cynnig hwn wedi ei wneud ar y cyd ag Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru, yr wyf yn fodlon rhannu'r tair munud gydag ef.

Gofynnaf am y ddadl hon oherwydd bod George Bush a Tony Blair wedi methu â pherswadio'r gymuned ryngwladol fod rhyfel yn gyfiawn, ac wedi penderfynu mynd i ryfel yn groes i siarter y Cenhedloedd Unedig—*[Torri ar draws.]*

*Gohiriwyd y Cyfarfod Llawn.
Plenary suspended.*

*Ailymgynullodd y Cynulliad am 2.54 p.m.
The Assembly reconvened at 2.54 p.m.*

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Fel yr oeddwn yn egluro, yr wyf yn gwneud cais o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.9 am ddadl ar y sefyllfa ryngwladol ynglŷn ag Irac a'r effaith y mae'n sicr o'i chael ar Gymru. Gofynnaf am ddadl oherwydd bod George Bush a Tony Blair wedi methu â pherswadio'r gymuned ryngwladol bod rhyfel yn gyfiawn ac wedi penderfynu mynd i ryfel yn groes i siarter y Cenhedloedd Unedig. Mae gan y penderfyniad hwn oblygiadau pellgyrhaeddol i Gymru a gwledydd eraill y byd.

Nid oes cyfiawnhad moesol, strategol na chyfreithiol i'r rhyfel hwn ac mae'n bwysig inni gael cyfle i fynegi ein safbwynt yn glir yn y Cynulliad cyn i'r rhyfel ddechrau. Mae dadl wedi'i threfnu ar gyfer dydd Mawrth nesaf, ond bydd hynny'n rhy hwyr, gan y bydd y rhyfel wedi dechrau erbyn hynny. Gofynnaf felly inni naill ai gynnal y ddadl

particular matter, namely the latest situation in Iraq and its implications for Wales. I am satisfied that this is a matter of urgent public importance under the Standing Order, and will allow the leader of the opposition three minutes to propose the motion, and three minutes for the Business Minister to respond before we proceed to a vote.

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales, under Standing Order No. 6.9, considers a particular matter, namely the latest situation in Iraq and its implications for Wales.

As this request has been made jointly with the Leader of the Welsh Conservatives, I am happy to share the three minutes with him.

I request this debate because George Bush and Tony Blair have failed to persuade the international community that war is just, and have decided to wage war contrary to the United Nations charter—*[Interruption.]*

Ieuan Wyn Jones: As I was explaining, I am making a request under Standing Order No. 6.9 for a debate on the international situation with regard to Iraq and the effect that it will undoubtedly have on Wales. I am requesting a debate because George Bush and Tony Blair have failed to persuade the international community that war is just and have decided to go to war contrary to the United Nations charter. This decision has far-reaching implications for Wales and the other countries of the world.

There is no moral, strategic or legal justification for this war and it is important that we have an opportunity to clearly express our views in the Assembly before the outbreak of war. A debate has been arranged for next Tuesday, but that will be too late, because the war will have begun by then. I therefore ask that we either hold that

honno heddiw—a dyna fy nymuniad—neu yfory, os yw hynny'n fwy priodol. Gofynnaf hefyd i'r Trefnydd drefnu bod y ddadl ar gynnig penodol, fel bo modd i'r gwrthbleidiau gyflwyno gwelliannau. Mae'n bwysig bod Aelodau yn cael cyfle i bleidleisio ar y mater, gan ei fod yn fater mor ddifrifol.

Nick Bourne: Whatever our views on this issue, I deplore the recent interruption to proceedings. Such action is the antithesis of democracy, because it makes it more likely that the Assembly will have to tighten its security procedures, making it more difficult for people to come to hear our debates, which I regret.

In support of what the leader of Plaid Cymru said, the Assembly has had, or should have had, ample opportunity to debate this issue. The Welsh Conservative Party previously pressed for this debate. There are many direct implications for Wales, several of which were touched upon during First Minister's questions. We have not received full answers to those questions and, on one or two occasions, have not received any answer to such questions at all. It is high time that we were given the opportunity to debate this issue. I do not accept the argument that we should wait to hear what is said in Westminster. That is an extraordinary tack to take, given that Wales has a devolved body and given the clear implications for Wales in terms of civil defence, preparation for health issues and the communal problems that may arise, although I hope that they will not. Those matters will not be fully aired in Westminster. Therefore, I support the need for an urgent debate on this matter today. If it is offered for tomorrow, I hope that it will be for the two hours that were scheduled for a debate on this matter next week. I also agree that we need a specific motion that can be amended.

The Business Minister (Carwyn Jones): The Government accepts that the matter should be debated this week. The original request was for a debate under Standing Order No. 6.9, which we accept. Our

debate today—that is my preference—or tomorrow, if that is more appropriate. I also ask the Business Minister to arrange that the debate is on a specific motion, so that the opposition parties can table amendments. It is important that Members have an opportunity to vote on the matter, since it is such a serious matter.

Nick Bourne: Beth bynnag fo'n barn am y mater hwn, gresynaf at yr ymyriad diweddar â'r trafodion. Mae gweithred o'r fath yn gwbl groes i ddemocratiaeth, gan ei bod yn peri ei bod yn fwy tebygol y bydd y Cynulliad yn gorfod tynhau ei weithdrefnau diogelwch, gan ei gwneud yn anos i bobl ddod i wrando ar ein dadleuon, ac mae hynny'n ofid i mi.

Er mwyn ategu'r hyn a ddywedodd arweinydd Plaid Cymru, mae'r Cynulliad wedi cael, neu dylai fod wedi cael, digon o gyfle i drafod y mater hwn. Mae Plaid Geidwadol Cymru wedi pwysu cyn hyn am y ddadl hon. Mae llawer o oblygiadau uniongyrchol i Gymru, y cyfeiriwyd at nifer ohonynt yn ystod y cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog. Ni chawsom atebion llawn i'r cwestiynau hynny ac, ar un neu ddau o achlysuron, ni chawsom ateb o gwbl i gwestiynau o'r fath. Mae'n hen bryd inni gael y cyfle i drafod y mater hwn. Nid wyf yn derbyn y ddadl y dylem aros i glywed yr hyn a ddywedir yn San Steffan. Mae hwnnw'n safbwynt rhyfeddol, o ystyried bod gan Gymru gorff datganoledig a bod goblygiadau amlwg i Gymru o ran amddiffyn sifil, paratoi ar gyfer materion iechyd a'r problemau cymunedol a allai godi, er fy mod yn gobeithio na fyddant. Ni chaiff y materion hynny eu gwyntyllu'n llawn yn San Steffan. Gan hynny, cefnogaf yr angen am ddadl frys ar y mater hwn heddiw. Os cynigir hi ar gyfer yfory, gobeithiaf y bydd yn parhau am y ddwy awr a amserlennwyd ar gyfer dadl ar y mater hwn yr wythnos nesaf. Cytunaf hefyd fod arnom angen cynnig penodol y gellir ei ddiwygio.

Y Trefnydd (Carwyn Jones): Mae'r Llywodraeth yn derbyn y dylid cael dadl ar y mater hwn yr wythnos hon. Yr oedd y cais gwreiddiol yn un am ddadl o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.9, ac yr ydym yn derbyn

suggestion is to propose tomorrow, under Standing Order No. 6.9, that an urgent debate be held on this matter then. I therefore ask the leaders of Plaid Cymru and the Welsh Conservative Party to withdraw their request for an urgent debate to be held today on the basis of our giving an undertaking that there will be an urgent debate held tomorrow, when all matters can be aired.

We suggest that this be done tomorrow, because Parliament is debating the matter as we speak. It is right that Parliament—in this case, the superior house—has the opportunity to discuss the matter properly. It also of benefit to Members of this Chamber to know the views of Parliament and those who sit in Parliament before considering the matter further in Wales.

Members of this Assembly would not welcome a devolved matter being debated in Parliament at the same time as it was being debated in this Chamber, and we should extend the same courtesy to Members of the United Kingdom Parliament. Therefore, we give an undertaking today that a request for an urgent debate, under Standing Order No. 6.9, will be made tomorrow.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Plaid Cymru would have preferred the debate to be on a substantive motion that could be amended. However, given the circumstances and the fact that it is important that the Assembly debates this matter, I accept that tomorrow is an appropriate time to debate the matter, as the Business Minister suggests. I will therefore not ask the Assembly to vote on the motion.

Nick Bourne: I will go along with that, with the proviso that I would appreciate an undertaking from the Business Minister as to the length of the debate. It is important that as many people as possible can speak during this debate, and he has not yet indicated its duration.

Carwyn Jones: The allocation of time is not a matter for me. It is for the Presiding Officer to decide what he feels is appropriate.

The Presiding Officer: I have heard the exchanges.

hynny. Ein hawgrym yw y dylid rhoi cynnig gerbron yfory, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.9, i gynnal dadl frys ar y mater hwn bryd hynny. Gan hynny, gofynnaf i arweinwyr Plaid Cymru a Phlaid Geidwadol Cymru dynnu'n ôl eu cais am gynnal dadl frys heddiw am ein bod yn ymgymryd y cynhelir dadl frys yfory, pan ellir gwyntyllu'r holl faterion sy'n codi.

Awgrymwn y dylid gwneud hyn yfory, gan fod y Senedd yn cael dadl ar y mater ar hyn o bryd. Mae'n iawn i'r Senedd—sef y tŷ uwch, yn yr achos hwn—gael cyfle i drafod y mater yn briodol. Mae hefyd o fudd i Aelodau'r Siambr hon wybod barn y Senedd a'r rhai sydd yn y Senedd cyn ystyried y mater ymhellach yng Nghymru.

Ni fyddai Aelodau o'r Cynulliad hwn yn croesawu cynnal dadl ar fater datganoledig yn y Senedd ar yr un pryd ag y cynhelid dadl arno yn y Siambr hon, a dylem ddangos yr un cwrteisi i Aelodau Senedd y Deyrnas Unedig. Gan hynny, ymgymerwn heddiw y gwneir cais yfory am ddadl frys, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.9.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Buasai'n well gan Blaid Cymru gael dadl ar gynnig pendant y gellid ei ddiwygio. Serch hynny, yng ngolwg yr amgylchiadau a'r ffaith ei bod yn bwysig i'r Cynulliad gael dadl ar y mater hwn, derbynaf fod yfory'n adeg briodol i gael dadl ar y mater, fel y mae'r Trefnydd yn awgrymu. Gan hynny, ni ofynnaf i'r Cynulliad bleidleisio ar y cynnig.

Nick Bourne: Gwnaf gyd-fynd â hynny, ar yr amod y byddwn yn gwerthfawrogi cael ymgymeriad gan y Trefnydd ynghylch hyd y ddadl. Mae'n bwysig bod cynifer ag y bo modd yn gallu siarad yn ystod y ddadl hon, ac nid yw wedi nodi ei hyd eto.

Carwyn Jones: Nid yw'r dyrannu ar amser yn fater i mi. Mater i'r Llywydd yw penderfynu beth y mae ef yn teimlo sy'n briodol.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi clywed yr hyn a ddywedwyd.

Nick Bourne: It depends on other Government business, does it not?

Nick Bourne: Mae'n dibynnu ar fusnes arall y Llywodraeth, onid yw?

3.00 p.m.

The Presiding Officer: Indeed.

Y Llywydd: Yn wir.

O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.9, nid oes darpariaeth i dynnu cynnig yn ôl, ond mae arweinydd yr wrthblaid wedi'n hysbysu ei fod yn dymuno tynnu'r cynnig yn ôl. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu i'r cynnig gael ei dynnu'n ôl? Gwelaf nad oes.

Under Standing Order No. 6.9, there is no provision to withdraw a motion, but the leader of the opposition has informed us that he wishes to withdraw the motion. Does any Member object to the motion being withdrawn? I see that no-one does.

Dafydd Wigley: Pwynt o drefn. Mae'r pwynt o drefn hwn yn uniongyrchol gysylltiedig â'r mater dan sylw. A oes gennych hawl, wrth benderfynu ar fusnes Cyfarfod Llawn yfory, i roi blaenoriaeth i drafod y cynnig hwn, goruwch unrhyw gynigion eraill? Byddai hynny'n sicrhau digon o amser ar gyfer y ddadl.

Dafydd Wigley: Point of order. This point of order is directly related to the matter in hand. Are you entitled, in deciding on the business for tomorrow's Plenary, to give priority to discussing this motion over any other motions? That would ensure sufficient time for the debate.

Y Llywydd: Os derbyniaf gais am ddadl brys o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.9 yfory—ac ymddengys y byddaf—ac y derbynnir y cais hwnnw drwy bleidlais gan y Cynulliad, mae gan y Llywydd hawl dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.9(c) i addasu'r amserlen ar gyfer busnes fel y gwêl yn dda.

The Presiding Officer: If I receive a request for an urgent debate under Standing Order No. 6.9 tomorrow—and it appears that I will—and if that request is accepted by means of a vote in the Assembly, the Presiding Officer is entitled, under Standing Order No. 6.9(c) to adapt the timetable for business as he sees fit.

Datganiad Busnes Business Statement

The Business Minister (Carwyn Jones): I wish to report a change to tomorrow's business. The motion to transfer the responsibilities of the Animal Health Act 2002 to the Welsh Assembly Government, scheduled for tomorrow, has not been tabled and will be taken in Committee. There will also be alterations to tomorrow's business given the matter that we have just considered. At the moment, business for the next two weeks is as shown on the Chamberweb, under supporting documents. However, given that I have said that I will make time available tomorrow to consider the matter that we have just discussed, I will come forward with a revised draft business statement for the next two weeks under Standing Orders Nos. 5.4 and 5.5 to reflect

Y Trefnydd (Carwyn Jones): Dymunaf adrodd ar newid i'r busnes ar gyfer yfory. Ni chyflwynwyd y cynnig, a amserlennwyd ar gyfer yfory, i drosglwyddo'r cyfrifoldebau sydd yn y Ddeddf Iechyd Anifeiliaid 2002 i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, ac fe'i cymerir yn y Pwyllgor. Bydd newidiadau i'r busnes ar gyfer yfory hefyd yng ngolwg y mater yr ydym newydd ei ystyried. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r busnes ar gyfer y ddwy wythnos nesaf fel y'i dangosir ar we'r Siambr, o dan ddogfennau ategol. Fodd bynnag, gan fy mod wedi dweud y byddaf yn neilltuo amser yfory i ystyried y mater yr ydym newydd ei drafod, rhoddaf ddatganiad busnes drafft diwygiedig gerbron ar gyfer y ddwy wythnos nesaf o dan Reolau Sefydlog Rhifau 5.4 a 5.5 i adlewyrchu'r newidiadau sy'n ofynnol i

the changes required to business to accommodate that debate. Members will be notified of those changes as soon as possible via the intranet and the internet and, hopefully, by hard copy.

Following this morning's meeting of the Business Committee, the Deputy Presiding Officer determined that, under Standing Order No. 22.5, the following items of legislation need not be referred to a Subject Committee for extended consideration: the Leasehold Reform (Notices) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003, the Apple and Pear Research Council (Dissolution) Order 2003, the Horticultural Development Council (Amendment) Order 2003, the Leasehold Reform (Collective Enfranchisement) (Counter Notices) (Wales) Regulations 2003, the Commission for Health Improvement (Functions) (Wales) Regulations 2003 and the Zoo Licensing Act 1981 (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003.

Y Llywydd: A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes drafft? Gwelaf nad oes. A oes unrhyw sylwadau ar y datganiad busnes?

Cynog Dafis: A all y Trefnydd drefnu i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes wneud datganiad ar gyllidebau ysgolion ar gyfer 2003-04? Y rheswm tros y cais yw bod tri ohonom wedi cwrdd ddydd Gwener diwethaf â saith o benaethiaid ysgolion uwchradd Powys, y mae eu hysgolion yn wynebu toriadau o 2 y cant mewn termau real os na fydd y sefyllfa'n newid. O ganlyniad, byddant yn gorfod diswyddo staff. Mae angen datganiad gan y Gweinidog i esbonio sut y gall y cynnydd mewn arian i ysgolion, y bu iddi ymffrostio cymaint amdano, droi'n doriadau yn nifer y staff mewn ysgolion. Beth yw'r gwirionedd ynglŷn â dyraniad Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru i ysgolion ar gyfer addysg ôl-16? Hoffwn hefyd eglurhad o i ba raddau y mae'r sefyllfa ym Mhowys yn adlewyrchu'r sefyllfa gyffredinol ar draws Cymru. Gwn fod helynt yn Sir y Fflint a phryderon yng Ngwynedd. Mae hyn yn fater brys a byddwn yn gwerthfawrogi datganiad neu hyd yn oed ddadl ar y testun.

Jonathan Morgan: Further to discussions this morning, I request a statement by the

busnes er mwyn cynnwys y ddadl honno. Hysbysir Aelodau am y newidiadau hynny cyn gynted ag y bo modd drwy'r fewnwyd a'r rhyngwyd a, gobeithio, ar gopi caled.

Ar ôl y cyfarfod o'r Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, penderfynodd y Dirprwy Lywydd, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.5, nad oes angen cyfeirio'r eitemau deddfwriaeth a ganlyn i Bwyllgor Pwnc i'w hystyried yn helaethach: Rheoliadau Diwygio Lesddaliad (Hysbysiadau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003, Gorchymyn y Cyngor Ymchwil Afalau a Gellyg (Diddymu) 2003, Gorchymyn y Cyngor Datblygu Garddwriaeth (Diwygio) 2003, Rheoliadau Diwygio Lesddaliad (Rhyddfrenio ar y Cyd) (Gwrth-hysbysiadau) (Cymru) 2003, Rheoliadau'r Comisiwn Gwella Iechyd (Swyddogaethau) (Cymru) 2003 a Rheoliadau Deddf Trwyddedu Sŵau 1981 (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003.

The Presiding Officer: Are there any objections to the draft business statement? I see that there are not. Are there any comments on the business statement?

Cynog Dafis: Can the Business Minister arrange for the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to make a statement on school budgets for 2003-04? The reason behind the request is that, last Friday, three of us met seven secondary school headteachers from Powys, whose schools face cuts of 2 per cent in real terms unless the situation changes. As a result, they will have to make staff redundant. We need a statement from the Minister to explain how the increase in funding for schools, of which she has bragged so much, can lead to a decrease in the number of staff in schools. What is the truth about Education and Learning Wales's allocation to schools for post-16 education? I would also like clarification as to what extent the situation in Powys reflects the general situation across Wales. I know that there are difficulties in Flintshire and concerns in Gwynedd. This is an urgent matter and I would appreciate a statement or even a debate on the issue.

Jonathan Morgan: Ymhellach i drafodaethau y bore yma, gofynnaf am

Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning on ELWa and the issues in relation to that organisation that are a cause of concern to Members. We have made this request on several occasions and we feel that the Assembly should make time available so that Members can quiz the Minister on those issues.

Carwyn Jones: The situation with regard to ELWa has been considered thoroughly and the Minister's position remains the same. If the Minister wishes to add anything in future, I am sure that she will do so. Your request is noted.

Ynglŷn ag ysgolion ym Mhowys, Sir y Fflint a Gwynedd, mae'r rhain yn faterion i'r siroedd yn hytrach nag i'r Cynulliad. Os ydyw'n wir y bydd toriadau ym Mhowys, dylid holi awdurdod Powys yn ei gylch yn hytrach na holi'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Gweinidog wedi clywed eich sylwadau, Cynog, ac, eto, os oes ganddi rywbeth i'w ychwanegu, yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnaiff hynny.

*Derbniwyd y datganiad busnes.
Business statement adopted.*

Datganiad ar Gyflog Cyfartal Statement on Equal Pay

The Business Minister (Carwyn Jones): The 'close the pay gap' campaign has been running for the past year and has made a great start in addressing the issue of equal pay for men and women. The campaign was initiated because of the 'The Gender Pay Gap in Wales' report produced by a team from the University of Wales, Swansea. The report showed that, 30 years after the Equal Pay Act 1970, women's wages in Wales were on average 13 per cent lower than those of men.

Part-time women workers are even worse off. Independent research has also shown that, even when women and men with the same characteristics are employed in the same industries and occupations, women have lower average earnings. Evidence also showed that men and women who were

ddatganiad gan y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ar ELWa a'r materion sy'n ymwneud â'r corff hwnnw sy'n peri pryder i Aelodau. Gwnaethom y cais hwn sawl gwaith a theimlwn y dylai'r Cynulliad neilltuo amser fel y gall Aelodau holi'r Gweinidog am y materion hynny.

Carwyn Jones: Mae'r sefyllfa o ran ELWa wedi'i hystyried yn drwyadl a'r un yw safbwynt y Gweinidog o hyd. Os yw'r Gweinidog yn dymuno ychwanegu rhywbeth yn y dyfodol, yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnaiff hynny. Nodwyd eich cais.

As regards schools in Powys, Flintshire and Gwynedd, these are matters for the counties, rather than for the Assembly. If it is true that there are to be cuts in Powys, you should question Powys authority about that, not the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning. However, the Minister has heard your comments, Cynog, and, again, if she has anything to add, I am sure that she will do so.

Y Trefnydd (Carwyn Jones): Bu'r ymgyrch 'cau'r bwlch cyflog' yn rhedeg dros y flwyddyn a aeth heibio ac mae wedi dechrau'n dda ar y gwaith o ymdrin â mater tâl cyfartal i ddynion a menywod. Cychwynnwyd yr ymgyrch oherwydd adroddiad 'The Gender Pay Gap in Wales' a gynhyrchwyd gan dîm ym Mhrifysgol Cymru, Abertawe. Dangosodd yr adroddiad fod cyflogau menywod yng Nghymru, 30 mlynedd ar ôl Deddf Cyflog Cyfartal 1970, yn 13 y cant yn is ar gyfartaledd na rhai dynion.

Mae'n waeth byth ar fenywod sy'n gweithio'n rhan-amser. Mae ymchwil annibynnol wedi dangos, hyd yn oed pan gyflogir menywod a dynion sydd â'r un nodweddion yn yr un diwydiannau a galwedigaethau, fod enillion menywod yn is ar gyfartaledd. Yr oedd tystiolaeth hefyd yn

covered by a national collective agreement had higher average earnings than equivalent workers who were not covered. Furthermore, on average, women's weekly earnings were higher in the public than the private sector, partly due to higher rates of trade union membership in the public sector.

Acknowledging that there is a problem can be an important step forward. Tackling it is even more important. The Assembly is committed to a Wales where fairness, justice and equality are fundamental to all that we do. For our leadership role to be effective, it was important that we first put our own house in order. The Assembly undertook its own internal audit of staff, pay and grading structures. That enabled us to make adjustments and increases to recognise the talent and diversity of our civil service staff. We want to lead by example and have done so by showing that we are committed to working for a democratic and inclusive society that benefits all of our people. As a result, the Assembly has won a Castle Award, recognising the great achievements of the equal pay audit.

It is not only a statutory obligation; all Assembly Members recognise that we have a moral duty to work towards making Wales an inclusive society. Having taken our own moral stance, as a Government, it is then our task to be as effective as possible in taking the message to all sections of society. Our strategy is one of partnership. The 'close the pay gap' campaign, which was launched in partnership with the Equal Opportunities Commission and the Wales Trades Union Congress, not only aimed to raise awareness of equal pay issues, but has also developed constructive tools for the private and public sectors. Through seminars, CD-ROMs, publications, media and advertising, the campaign aimed to encourage private and public sector employers to address the inequalities in pay. Equal pay review kits, produced as part of the campaign, can be used to identify and resolve pay inequalities.

dangos bod enillion dynion a menywod sydd o dan gydgytundeb cenedlaethol yn uwch ar gyfartaledd na gweithwyr cyfatebol nad oeddent o dan gydgytundeb o'r fath. At hynny, ar gyfartaledd, yr oedd enillion wythnosol menywod yn uwch, ar gyfartaledd, yn y sector cyhoeddus nag yn y sector preifat, yn rhannol oherwydd y cyfraddau uwch o aelodaeth o undebau llafur yn y sector cyhoeddus.

Mae cydnabod y ffaith bod problem yn gallu bod yn gam pwysig ymlaen. Mae mynd i'r afael â hi'n bwysicach byth. Mae'r Cynulliad wedi ymrwmo i sicrhau y cawn Gymru lle y bydd tegwch, cyfiawnder a chydardoldeb yn rhan annatod o bob dim a wnawn. Er mwyn inni fod yn effeithiol yn ein rôl fel arweinydd, yr oedd yn bwysig inni roi trefn ar ein pethau ein hun yn gyntaf. Cynhaliodd y Cynulliad archwiliad mewnol o staff, tâl a strwythurau graddio. Bu hynny'n fodd inni wneud newidiadau a rhoi codiadau er mwyn cydnabod dawn ac amrywiaeth y staff yn ein gwasanaeth sifil. Yr ydym am arwain drwy esiampl a gwnaethom hynny drwy ddangos ein bod wedi ymrwmo i weithio i gael cymdeithas ddemocrataidd a chynhwysol a ddaw â budd i'n holl bobl. O ganlyniad i hynny, mae'r Cynulliad wedi ennill Gwobr Castle, sy'n gydnabyddiaeth i gyflawniadau mawr yr archwiliad tâl cyfartal.

Nid rhwymedigaeth statudol yn unig ydyw; mae holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn cydnabod ein bod o dan ddyletswydd foesol i weithio i wneud Cymru'n gymdeithas gynhwysol. A ninnau wedi gwneud safiad moesol, fel Llywodraeth, ein gwaith wedyn yw bod mor effeithiol ag y bo modd wrth fynd â'r neges i bob rhan o gymdeithas. Strategaeth o bartneriaeth yw ein hun ni. Mae'r ymgyrch 'cau'r bwlch cyflog', a lansiwyd mewn partneriaeth â'r Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal a Chyngres Undebau Llafur Cymru, wedi ceisio hybu ymwybyddiaeth o faterion tâl cyfartal, a hefyd wedi datblygu offer adeiladol ar gyfer y sectorau preifat a chyhoeddus. Drwy seminarau, CD-ROMs, cyhoeddiadau, y cyfryngau a hysbysebu, ceisiodd yr ymgyrch annog gweithwyr yn y sectorau preifat a chyhoeddus i roi sylw i anghydardoldebau mewn tâl. Gellir defnyddio pecynnau adolygu tâl cyfartal, a gynhyrchwyd fel rhan o'r ymgyrch, i ganfod

a datrys anghydraddoldebau mewn tâl.

Pay reviews help employers to plan for the future. Most importantly, open and fair pay systems improve staff morale and send a positive message to staff that they are valued. It is also important to consider the educational aspects. Many of us think that gender stereotyping is no longer an issue. In fact, figures released last year by the Equal Opportunities Commission show that at GCSE level, girls make up 94 per cent of all those in home economic lessons—which is called design technology these days—while boys account for 65 per cent of those in PE lessons. Stereotype trends are just as noticeable in the workforce. We recognise the demands on the workforce and the need for it to adapt to succeed. It is critical for us to increase the pool of talent from which we recruit. We need to breakdown the stereotypes and offer equal pay for work of equal value. We need to recruit more women into all areas of work.

Late last year, the Equal Opportunities Commission launched a resource pack for schools. The 'What's Stopping You?' pack aims to show children that they can succeed in careers or subjects regardless of their sex. It was prepared for teachers and career-advisers as a tool to help break down barriers and stereotypes. In the space of nearly four years, we have created a democratic Welsh polity. The Assembly has the most gender-balanced legislature and Cabinet in the world. The equal pay campaign, 'closing the pay gap' is an essential part of our agenda. We need to carry on the good work of this campaign to take forward the Assembly agenda in tackling poverty, social exclusion and economic regeneration.

Partnership has been the key and we must continue to work with the EOC and Wales TUC. An assessment of the campaign's effectiveness is already being explored. We need to determine what has worked and how effective it has been. Gender-related statistics are vital in providing data and must be

Mae adolygiadau tâl yn helpu cyflogwyr i gynllunio ar gyfer y dyfodol. Yn bwysicaf oll, mae systemau tâl teg ac agored yn hybu morâl staff ac yn dangos i'r staff eu bod yn cael eu gwerthfawrogi. Mae hefyd yn bwysig ystyried yr agweddau addysgol. Mae llawer ohonom yn tybio nad yw stereoteipio yn ôl rhyw yn fater sy'n codi bellach. Mewn gwirionedd, mae ffigurau a gyhoeddwyd y llynedd gan y Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal yn dangos mai merched, ar lefel TGAU, yw 94 y cant o'r rhai sy'n dilyn gwersi economeg tŷ—a elwir yn dechnoleg dylunio y dyddiau hyn—tra mai bechgyn yw 65 y cant o'r rhai mewn gwersi ymarfer corfforol. Mae tueddiadau i stereoteipio yr un mor amlwg yn y gweithlu. Cydnabyddwn y galwadau sydd ar y gweithlu a'r angen iddo ymaddasu er mwyn llwyddo. Mae'n hollbwysig inni gynyddu'r gronfa o ddoniau y gallwn recriwtio ohoni. Rhaid inni chwalu'r stereoteipiau a chynnig tâl cyfartal am waith cywerth. Rhaid inni recriwtio rhagor o fenywod i bob maes gwaith.

Ddiwedd y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, gwnaeth y Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal lansio pecyn adnoddau ar gyfer ysgolion. Mae'r pecyn 'Beth sy'n eich rhwystro chi?' yn ceisio dangos i blant y gallant lwyddo mewn gyrfaedd neu bynciau beth bynnag fo'u rhyw. Fe'i paratowyd ar gyfer athrawon a chynghorwyr gyrfaedd i fod yn offeryn i helpu i chwalu rhwystrau a stereoteipiau. O fewn ymron i bedair blynedd, yr ydym wedi creu ffurflywodraeth Gymreig ddemocrataidd. Gan y Cynulliad y mae'r ddeddfwrfa a'r Cabinet mwyaf cytbwys o ran y rhywiau yn y byd. Mae'r ymgyrch tâl cyfartal, 'cau'r bwlech cyflog', yn rhan annatod o'n hagenda. Rhaid inni barhau â gwaith da'r ymgyrch hon er mwyn bwrw ymlaen ag agenda'r Cynulliad o ran ymladd tlodi, allgáu cymdeithasol ac adfywio economaidd.

Partneriaeth fu'r allwedd a rhaid inni barhau i weithio gyda'r Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal a Chyngres Undebau Llafur Cymru. Mae asesiad o effeithiolrwydd yr ymgyrch o dan ystyriaeth eisoes. Rhaid inni ganfod beth sydd wedi gweithio a pha mor effeithiol y bu. Mae ystadegau sy'n ymwneud â'r

improved. We must continue to persuade and encourage all employers, in the private, public and voluntary sectors, to complete pay reviews and push for equal pay. The campaign must also target specific sectors, such as finance, retail and tourism. Voluntary bodies must be included, particularly those funded by the Assembly, as well as Assembly sponsored public bodies.

rhywiau'n hollbwysig wrth ddarparu data a rhaid cael rhai gwell. Rhaid inni barhau i ddwyn perswâd ac annog yr holl gyflogwyr, yn y sectorau preifat, cyhoeddus a gwirfoddol, i gwblhau adolygiadau tâl a phwyso am dâl cyfartal. Rhaid i'r ymgyrch dargedu sectorau penodol hefyd, fel cyllid, adwerthu a thwristiaeth. Rhaid cynnwys cyrff gwirfoddol, yn enwedig y rhai a gyllidir gan y Cynulliad, yn ogystal â chyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad.

3.10 p.m.

The Assembly must continue to look not only at pay, but also at the work-life balance of its employees. The extra family responsibilities that fall on women should not affect their careers or earning capacity. Those businesses that supply and support the Assembly must be included as a matter of ethics. The Assembly has not only been involved in a successful campaign to close the pay gap, but has also begun to implement the policy to improve the work and lifestyle of its employees.

Rhaid i'r Cynulliad barhau i edrych nid yn unig ar dâl, ond hefyd ar y cydbwysedd rhwng bywyd a gwaith ymysg ei weithwyr. Ni ddylai'r cyfrifoldebau teuluol ychwanegol a ddaw i ran menywod gael effaith ar eu gyrfaedd neu eu gallu i ennill. Rhaid cynnwys o ran moeseg y busnesau hynny sy'n cyflenwi ac yn cynorthwyo'r Cynulliad. Yn ogystal â chymryd rhan mewn ymgyrch lwyddiannus i gau'r bwloch cyflog, mae'r Cynulliad hefyd wedi dechrau rhoi'r polisi ar waith er mwyn gwella gwaith a ffordd o fyw ei weithwyr.

Helen Mary Jones: Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales welcomes this statement and it has strongly supported the campaign. I am a former employee of the Equal Opportunities Commission, and I am well aware of the importance of these issues and, as the Minister rightly mentioned, how important they continue to be. Will the Minister tell us more about the outcome of the internal pay review, the disparities it revealed, and the extent to which the Government had to take major steps to address them? I ask that in the context of encouraging others, and I welcome the spirit in which the Government has been happy to take the beam out of its own eye with regard to equal pay before it has asked others to take the splinters out of theirs. In view of the success of this approach, is the Minister considering taking a rather more robust approach, particularly with ASPBs and other bodies, which are funded by the National Assembly, and insisting that pay audits should be undertaken? Partnership is the right way to proceed but, if you come up against a brick wall, you must press on regardless.

Helen Mary Jones: Mae Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales yn croesawu'r datganiad hwn a bu'n gefnogol iawn i'r ymgyrch. Yr wyf yn gyn-weithiwr i'r Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal, ac yr wyf yn ymwybodol iawn o bwysigrwydd y materion hyn ac, fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, pa mor bwysig y byddant yn dal i fod. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddweud rhagor wrthym am ganlyniad yr adolygiad tâl mewnol, y gwahaniaethau a amlygodd, a'r graddau y bu'n rhaid i'r Llywodraeth gymryd camau sylweddol i ymdrin â hwy? Gofynnaf hynny yn y cyddestun o annog eraill, a chroesawaf barodrwydd y Llywodraeth i dynnu'r trawst o'i llygad ei hun o ran tâl cyfartal cyn gofyn i eraill dynnu'r brycheuyn o'u llygaid hwy. Yng ngolwg llwyddiant y dull hwn o weithredu, a yw'r Gweinidog yn ystyried cymryd agwedd fwy cadarn, yn enwedig at gyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad a chyrff eraill, a gyllidir gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, a mynnu y cynhelir archwiliadau o dâl? Partneriaeth yw'r modd iawn i fynd ynghylch hyn, ond os cyrhaeddwch fur diadlam, rhaid ichi bwysio ymlaen beth bynnag.

In that context, what discussions, if any, has the Minister had with colleagues at Westminster about this successful campaign, and will he revisit the issue—which is important to the Equal Opportunities Commission—of making pay reviews compulsory for larger bodies? It would not be appropriate for small employers, but it must be done with the larger bodies. The Assembly's Committee on Equality of Opportunity supports that view. I press the Minister to take that forward. This is an example of good practice; let us use it.

Finally, subject to the outcome of the review of the campaign's success and the outcome of the election, will the Minister's party be prepared to continue the campaign if it is in Government following the election? Plaid Cymru would be happy to do so following the election if it is in Government.

Carwyn Jones: There would have been little point to a year-long campaign, if nothing was going to happen after it. It is important that this is not seen as window dressing, but as a campaign that continues indefinitely. It is important for us as an institution to get our own house in order before we begin to preach to ASPBs or the public sector and the private sector. That is why an equal pay review was so important. We have also carefully considered the make-up of our staff. We know, for example, that we have not recruited the desired number of people from black and minority ethnic communities. We are considering an outreach campaign to address that. We also know that, while women are reasonably well represented in the civil service as a whole, they are badly represented in its upper echelons. Those who are familiar with the civil service will know that it operates a little like the army, where there are non-commissioned officers at the bottom and officers at the top. There are few women in the officer grade. We must address that issue soon.

There are hidden difficulties that women, in particular, face. We have tried to remedy them during the past few months. I will

Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, pa drafodaethau, os dim, a gafodd y Gweinidog â'i gyd-Weinidogion yn San Steffan ynghylch yr ymgyrch lwyddiannus hon, ac a wnaiff ailystyried y mater—sy'n bwysig i'r Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal—o beri i adolygiadau tâl fod yn orfodol i gyrff mwy? Ni fyddai'n briodol i gyflogwyr llai, ond rhaid gwneud hynny yn achos y cyrff mwy. Mae Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal y Cynulliad o blaid hynny. Pwysaf ar y Gweinidog i frwr ymlaen â hyn. Mae'n enghraifft o arfer da; gadewch inni ei defnyddio.

Yn olaf, yn amodol ar ganlyniad yr adolygiad o lwyddiant yr ymgyrch a chanlyniad yr etholiad, a fydd plaid y Gweinidog yn barod i barhau â'r ymgyrch os bydd mewn Llywodraeth ar ôl yr etholiad? Byddai Plaid Cymru yn fodlon gwneud hynny ar ôl yr etholiad os bydd mewn Llywodraeth.

Carwyn Jones: Ni fuasai fawr o ddiben mewn ymgyrchu am flwyddyn gyfan, os na ddigwyddai dim ar ôl hynny. Mae'n bwysig nad ystyrir hyn yn sioe, ond yn ymgyrch sy'n parhau am gyfnod amhenodol. Mae'n bwysig inni roi trefn ar ein pethau ein hun fel sefydliad cyn inni ddechrau pregethu wrth gyrff cyhoeddus a noddur gan y Cynulliad neu'r sector cyhoeddus a'r sector preifat. Dyna pam yr oedd adolygiad tâl cyfartal mor bwysig. Yr ydym wedi ystyried cyfansoddiad ein staff yn ofalus hefyd. Gwyddom, er enghraifft, nad ydym wedi recriwtio'r nifer a ddymunir o blith cymunedau lleiafrifol ethnig a chroenddu. Yr ydym yn ystyried ymgyrch allanol i ymdrin â hynny. Gwyddom hefyd, er bod cynrychiolaeth weddol dda gan fenywod yn y gwasanaeth sifil yn ei gyfarwydd, nad oes ganddynt gynrychiolaeth dda yn yr haenau uchaf. Bydd y rhai sy'n gyfarwydd â'r gwasanaeth sifil yn gwybod ei fod yn gweithredu fel y fyddin i ryw raddau, lle y mae swyddogion digomisiwn ar y gwaelod a swyddogion ar y brig. Ychydig o fenywod sydd yn nosbarth y swyddogion. Rhaid inni ymdrin â'r mater hwnnw cyn hir.

Mae anawsterau cudd y mae menywod, yn benodol, yn eu hwynebu. Yr ydym wedi ceisio cael ateb iddynt yn ystod y misoedd

highlight two. First, we had no set policy on adoption leave. It was far worse than our policy on maternity leave. That has now been brought into line, and I welcome that. Secondly, we identified another difficulty: women who took a career break to have children and so on, who left a particular position in the Assembly civil service, returned to the same grade rather than the grade they would have reached had they stayed there. We want to address that issue so that women, or anyone who takes a career break for childcare, can continue to ascend the ladder even though they are not physically in the building. That is important as it was identified as a hidden barrier. In terms of providing equal pay ourselves, the work to improve the make-up of the civil service and to remove hidden barriers continues.

Helen Mary's last point questioned what has been done with the UK Government: I have had meetings with Barbara Roche on this matter and I have met Margaret Curran, my Scottish counterpart, and we discussed what has been done in our respective countries. The 'close the pay gap' campaign puts us ahead of Scotland and, in certain cases, we are ahead of England. We can all be proud of that.

The suggestion that equal pay reviews should be made compulsory is interesting. I have not yet raised it with colleagues elsewhere in the United Kingdom. However, I am sure that the Minister who will be in place after the election would want to raise that suggestion with colleagues elsewhere in the UK because there comes a point when an element of compulsion must be introduced, as encouragement can only go so far. Over the next few months, we must explore whether that point has yet been reached.

Christine Chapman: I welcome the progress that we are making in this regard. It is vital that women secure parity of pay and have an opportunity to secure equal pay. Do you agree that measures to achieve equality must include a strategy to improve access to good childcare provision? According to the

diwethaf. Tynnaf sylw at ddau ohonynt. Yn gyntaf, nid oedd gennym bolisi penodol ar seibiant ar gyfer mabwysiadu. Yr oedd yn waeth o lawer na'n polisi ar seibiant mamolaeth. Mae hynny wedi'i gysoni bellach, ac yr wyf yn croesawu hynny. Yn ail, gwnaethom ganfod anhawster arall: yr oedd menywod a gymerai saib yn eu gyrfa i gael plant ac yn y blaen, a adawai swydd benodol yng ngwasanaeth sifil y Cynulliad, yn dod yn ôl ar yr un raddfa yn hytrach nag ar y raddfa y byddent wedi'i chyrraedd pe byddent wedi aros. Dymunwn ymdrin â'r mater hwnnw fel bod menywod, neu unrhyw un sy'n cymryd saib yn ei yrfa ar gyfer gofal plant, yn gallu parhau i ddringo'r ysgol er nad ydynt yn yr adeilad eu hunain. Mae hynny'n bwysig gan ei fod wedi'i nodi'n rhwystr cudd. O ran darparu tâl cyfartal ein hun, mae'r gwaith ar wella cyfansoddiad y gwasanaeth sifil a dileu rhwystrau cudd yn parhau.

Yn y pwynt olaf a wnaeth, holodd Helen Mary beth a wnaed gyda Llywodraeth y DU: yr wyf wedi cael cyfarfodydd gyda Barbara Roche ar y mater hwn ac wedi cwrdd â Margaret Curran, yr un sy'n cyfateb imi yn yr Alban, a gwnaethom drafod yr hyn a wnaed yn ein priod wledydd. Mae'r ymgyrch 'cau'r bwlch cyflog' yn ein rhoi ar y blaen i'r Alban ac, mewn rhai achosion, yr ydym ar y blaen i Loegr. Gallwn ymfalchïo yn hynny.

Mae'r awgrym y dylid peri i adolygiadau tâl cyfartal fod yn orfodol yn un diddorol. Nid wyf wedi'i godi eto gyda'm cyd-Weinidogion mewn manau eraill yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Er hynny, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Gweinidog a benodir ar ôl yr etholiad yn dymuno codi'r awgrym hwnnw gyda'i gyd-Weinidogion mewn manau eraill yn y DU oherwydd daw adeg pan fo'n rhaid cyflwyno rhywfaint o orfodaeth, gan mai ond hyn y gellir ei gyflawni drwy anogaeth. Dros y misoedd nesaf, rhaid inni ymchwilio i ganfod a gyrhaeddwyd yr adeg honno.

Christine Chapman: Croesawaf y cynnydd a wnawn yn hyn o beth. Mae'n hollbwysig bod menywod yn sicrhau cydraddoldeb o ran tâl a'u bod yn cael cyfle i wneud hynny. A gytunwch y dylai mesurau i sicrhau cydraddoldeb gynnwys strategaeth i hybu'r gallu i gael darpariaeth dda o ofal plant? Yn

Chwarae Teg report, 'Ten Years On', it is the lack of childcare facilities that continues to make it difficult for women with children to have a full-time job. Do you agree that good childcare facilities should be available for everyone, and not only be the prerogative of the more affluent? Will you join me in paying tribute to the progress made by Objective 1 in securing good projects for childcare provision as this will obviously have an impact on the economic inactivity rate in Wales? Also, do you regret certain comments made recently that some of these projects are politically incorrect? We do not think that that is the case. These projects are innovative.

Carwyn Jones: Some people in business—not the majority, but there are some—cannot see the economic benefits of childcare, in that it releases talent into the marketplace. However, that fact is self-evident. I absolutely and wholeheartedly agree that childcare is a real problem in Wales and it will be a challenge for all those involved in politics over the next 10 years. It is a real barrier to entering the workplace and to remaining in employment. It not only affects those who are seeking to enter work for the first time, it also affects those who are in quite well-paid jobs in that they often have to earn a substantial salary before working becomes financially worthwhile. We should bear that in mind. We should be ashamed that we do not have crèche facilities in the Assembly. We do not have crèche facilities in Cathays park: they must be shared with Cardiff County Council in Gabalfa. There are a limited number of places and we should bear in mind the size of this institution. There are no crèche facilities in the bay and we should get to grips with that quickly. It means that many people who have much to contribute, people with a tremendous amount of talent, are prevented from making a contribution that they sorely want to make.

David Melding: Minister, the Welsh Conservative Party is delighted to note the success of this campaign. As the chair of the 'close the pay gap' campaign joint working group, I would like to put on record our thanks to Sue Dyer of the Equal Opportunities Commission and Felicity

ôl adroddiad Chwarae Teg, 'Ten Years On', diffyg cyfleusterau gofal plant sy'n peri ei bod yn dal i fod yn anodd i fenywod â phlant gael swydd amser-llawn. A gytunwch y dylai cyfleusterau gofal plant da fod ar gael i bawb, ac na ddylai fod yn hawl i rai mwy cefnog yn unig? A wnewch ymuno â mi i ganmol y cynnydd a wnaeth Amcan 1 o ran sicrhau prosiectau da ar gyfer darparu gofal plant gan ei bod yn amlwg y caiff hyn effaith ar y gyfradd anweithgarwch economaidd yng Nghymru? Hefyd, a yw rhai sylwadau a wnaed yn ddiweddar, i'r perwyl bod rhai o'r prosiectau hyn yn wleidyddol anghywir, yn peri gofid i chi? Ni chredwn fod hynny'n wir. Mae'r prosiectau hyn yn rhai arloesol.

Carwyn Jones: Mae rhai pobl mewn busnes—nid y mwyafrif, ond mae rhai—na allant weld y manteision economaidd a geir o ofal plant, i'r graddau ei fod yn peri bod doniau ar gael yn y farchnad. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ffaith honno'n amlwg ohoni'i hun. Cytunaf yn llwyr ac yn galonnog fod gofal plant yn broblem wirioneddol yng Nghymru ac y bydd yn cynnig her i bawb sy'n ymwneud â gwleidyddiaeth dros y 10 mlynedd nesaf. Mae'n rhwystr gwirioneddol rhag ymgymryd â swydd ac aros mewn gwaith. Mae hyn yn effeithio ar y rhai sy'n ceisio dechrau gweithio am y tro cyntaf, a hefyd ar y rhai sydd mewn swyddi sy'n talu'n eithaf da am eu bod yn aml yn gorfod ennill cyflog sylweddol cyn i waith fod yn fuddiol yn ariannol. Dylem gofio hynny. Dylem deimlo cywilydd o fod heb gyfleusterau meithrinfa yn y Cynulliad. Nid oes gennym gyfleusterau ym mharc Cathays: rhaid eu rhannu gyda Chyngor Sir Caerdydd yng Ngabalfa. Mae nifer y lleoedd yn gyfyngedig a dylem gofio maint y sefydliad hwn. Nid oes cyfleusterau meithrinfa yn y bae a dylem ymdrin â hynny'n fuan. Golyga fod llawer o bobl y mae ganddynt lawer i'w gyfrannu, rhai sy'n dalentog iawn, yn cael eu hatal rhag cyfrannu yn y modd y maent yn taer ddymuno ei wneud.

David Melding: Weinidog, mae Plaid Geidwadol Cymru wrth ei bodd o nodi llwyddiant yr ymgyrch hon. Fel cadeirydd cyd-weithgor yr ymgyrch 'cau'r bwlch cyflog', carwn roi ar gof a chadw ein diolch i Sue Dyer o'r Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal a Felicity Williams o Gyngres Undebau Llafur

Williams of the Wales Trades Union Congress, who not only served on the group but have also driven forward the campaign and have helped to achieve some of its most significant outcomes. I also commend, and ask you to commend, the general work of the Equal Opportunities Commission and the Wales TUC in taking forward this agenda and ensuring that equality is more widely recognised in the workplace.

The Assembly has tried to put its own house in order, but it is a large employer. It also deals with many agencies directly, or it is at least responsible for providing their budgets. I suspect that it will take many years before this is mainstreamed. I am grateful to the various Ministers who have written directly to the chief executives of various agencies—the health bodies and local authorities—to ensure that they take up this campaign directly. Attendance at the various seminars that have been held has been encouraging. That is as a result of the high-level endorsement, and I hope that it will continue. We need to be vigilant and never become complacent in thinking that now we have achieved this, we can move on; the effort must be sustained.

3.20 p.m.

Finally, I welcome your remarks that the campaign should continue. I suspect that any conceivable coalition or Government that emerges after 1 May will commit to continuing this campaign. I remind you, Minister, that, to date, the campaign has only cost £70,000, and, given its achievements, that is the most remarkable value for money. The campaign demonstrated genuine joint working between the Assembly and various agencies and bodies, such as the Equal Opportunities Commission and the Wales Trades Union Congress. If we could commit to a budget of another £70,000 for next year—I am not being frivolous, that is approximately what we need—that would be money well spent and it would provide a rich reward.

Carwyn Jones: I thank you for your remarks, David. It is refreshing to hear a

Cymru, sydd nid yn unig wedi gwasanaethu ar y gweithgor ond hefyd wedi gyrru'r ymgyrch yn ei blaen ac wedi helpu i sicrhau rhai o'i chanlyniadau pwysicaf. Yr wyf hefyd yn cymeradwyo, ac yn gofyn i chi gymeradwyo, gwaith cyffredinol y Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal a Chyngres Undebau Llafur Cymru wrth fwrw ymlaen â'r agenda hon a sicrhau cydnabyddiaeth ehangach i gydraddoldeb yn y gweithle.

Mae'r Cynulliad wedi ceisio rhoi trefn ar ei bethau ei hun, ond mae'n gyflogwr mawr. Mae hefyd yn ymwneud â llawer o asiantaethau'n uniongyrchol, neu mae o leiaf yn gyfrifol am ddarparu eu cyllidebau. Yr wyf yn amau y cymer flynyddoedd lawer i osod hyn yn y brif ffrwd. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r gwahanol Weinidogion a ysgrifennodd yn uniongyrchol at brif weithredwyr gwahanol asiantaethau—y cyrff iechyd ac awdurdodau lleol—i sicrhau eu bod yn ymgymryd â'r ymgyrch hon yn syth. Bu'r presenoldeb yn y gwahanol seminarau a gynhaliwyd yn galonogol. Mae hynny'n ganlyniad i'r gymeradwyaeth a roddwyd ar lefel uchel, a gobeithiaf y bydd yn parhau. Rhaid inni fod yn wyliadwrus a pheidio byth â mynd yn ddifater a meddwl, gan ein bod wedi cyflawni hyn, y gallwn symud ymlaen at bethau eraill; rhaid parhau â'r gwaith.

Yn olaf, croesawaf eich sylwadau i'r perwyl y dylai'r ymgyrch barhau. Yr wyf yn amau y bydd unrhyw glymblaid neu Lywodraeth debygol a ddaw i'r amlwg ar ôl 1 Mai yn ymrwymo i barhau â'r ymgyrch hon. Yr wyf yn eich atgoffa, Weinidog, nad yw'r ymgyrch wedi costio ond £70,000 hyd yn hyn, ac, yng ngolwg yr hyn a gyflawnodd, mae hynny'n rhoi gwerth rhyfeddol am arian. Mae'r ymgyrch wedi amlygu cydweithio gwirioneddol rhwng y Cynulliad a gwahanol asiantaethau a chyrff, fel y Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal a Chyngres Undebau Llafur Cymru. Os gallem ymrwymo i gyllideb o £70,000 arall ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf—nid wyf yn gwamalu, dyna'r hyn y mae arnom ei angen, yn fras—byddai hynny'n wariant doeth a thalai ar ei ganfed.

Carwyn Jones: Diolchaf ichi am eich sylwadau, David. Mae'n braf clywed aelod o

member of the Welsh Conservative Party saying that money has been well spent rather than that money has been wasted. I am grateful for that observation. I echo what you said about Sue Dyer and the work that she has put in, and the comments that you made about partnership working. It is now 30 years since the Equal Pay Act 1970 but, as there are still horrendous examples of unequal pay, we still have a tremendous amount of work to do. It cannot be right, even to an economist, who considers this from an economic rather than a social point of view, that imperfections exist in the marketplace—if I can put it that way—which mean that it is not possible for people to fulfil their potential. We must hammer that message home. This is not a year-long campaign of words, where nothing happens at the end of it, or a campaign that does not seek to improve people's economic lot, because it clearly does so. I welcome your words and the support that you have given to the campaign throughout.

Eleanor Burnham: As the Welsh Liberal Democrats' equality spokesperson, I am delighted to be involved in this moral and, perhaps, morale crusade. I also thank Sue of the Equal Opportunities Commission, and Felicity Williams. We know that pay inequality remains a significant problem in Wales. I have mentioned in the past Polly Toynbee's book, which is a hard-hitting and hard-working book, written during her sabbatical from *The Guardian*. It has caused great embarrassment and everyone should read it, not least the obvious people in Government.

I will discuss some points and ask you to comment upon them. I understand that female academics in Wales earn approximately 19 per cent less than their male counterparts. Cardiff University is among the UK's worst offenders, with a 22 per cent difference in pay, according to the most recent figures for 1999-2000. What can we, or the Minister, do to counter this situation?

As a member of the joint working group, I chaired the recent north Wales launch of the 'close the pay gap' kit for small and medium-

Blaid Geidwadol Cymru yn dweud bod arian wedi'i wario'n ddoeth yn hytrach na bod arian wedi'i wastraffu. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y sylw hwnnw. Ategaf yr hyn a ddywedasoch am Sue Dyer a'i chyfraniad i'r gwaith, a'ch sylwadau am weithio mewn partneriaeth. Mae 30 mlynedd bellach ers i Ddeddf Cyflog Cyfartal 1970 ddod i rym ond, gan fod enghreifftiau ofnadwy o hyd o dâl anghyfartal, mae gennym lawer iawn o waith i'w wneud eto. Ni all fod yn iawn, hyd yn oed yng ngolwg economegydd, sy'n edrych ar hyn o safbwynt economaidd yn hytrach nag un cymdeithasol, fod diffygion yn y farchnad—os caf ei roi felly—sy'n golygu nad oes modd i bobl gyflawni eu potensial. Rhaid inni gyfleu'r neges honno. Nid ymgyrch o eiriau am flwyddyn yw hon, a dim yn digwydd ar y diwedd, neu ymgyrch nad yw'n ceisio gwella byd pobl yn economaidd, gan ei bod yn amlwg ei bod yn gwneud hynny. Croesawaf eich geiriau a'r gefnogaeth a roesoch i'r ymgyrch ar ei hyd.

Eleanor Burnham: Fel llefarydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru ar gydraddoldeb, yr wyf wrth fy modd yn cymryd rhan yn yr ymgyrch hon, sy'n un foesol a hefyd, o bosibl, yn un sy'n hybu morâl. Diolchaf finnau i Sue o'r Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal, ac i Felicity Williams. Gwyddom fod anghydraddoldeb o ran tâl yn broblem fawr yng Nghymru o hyd. Yr wyf wedi cyfeirio yn y gorffennol at lyfr Polly Toynbee, sy'n llyfr deifiol ac effeithiol, a ysgrifennodd yn ystod cyfnod sabothol o'i gwaith yn *The Guardian*. Mae wedi peri annifyrrwch mawr a dylai pawb ei ddarllen, a'r rhai amlwg mewn Llywodraeth yn anad neb.

Gwnaf drafod rhai pwyntiau a gofyn ichi wneud sylw arnynt. Deallaf fod academyddion benywaidd yng Nghymru'n ennill tua 19 y cant yn llai na'u cymheiriaid gwrywaidd. Prifysgol Caerdydd yw un o'r tramgwyddwyr gwaethaf yn y DU, gyda 22 y cant o wahaniaeth mewn tâl, yn ôl y ffigurau diweddaraf ar gyfer 1999-2000. Beth y gallwn ni, neu'r Gweinidog, ei wneud i herio'r sefyllfa hon?

Fel aelod o'r cyd-weithgor, bîm yn cadeirio yn y cyfarfod a gynhaliwyd yn y Gogledd yn ddiweddar i lansio'r pecyn 'cau'r bwllch

sized enterprises, and was pleased with the backing of the Equal Opportunities Commission, the Wales TUC and the Welsh Development Agency. I echo what David Melding said about the cost-effectiveness of this campaign. It is hard hitting and effective. We had a lively discussion and there was constructive support.

How can we help women coming off benefits? I echo what Christine said, namely, that the biggest worry for most people—particularly women—coming off benefits to take low-paid work, is how will they be able to finance childcare. I agree with Christine that this is one of the thorniest issues. Perhaps you can help us, Minister?

Carwyn Jones: I refer you to what I said to Christine, namely that it will be the major challenge for all Members over the course of the next five to 10 years. We are lagging somewhat behind other countries in terms of affordable and available childcare, and the situation must change.

As regards academics in Wales, a career break may mean that an academic does not ascend a university's pay scale. The particular academic that Eleanor Burnham mentioned may have returned to the same point on the scale that she was on when she left perhaps five or six years previously. As a result, there is an inevitable gap between a lecturer like her and a male lecturer who has remained in post and has not taken any career breaks. Therefore, men ascend the scale; women do not.

There is a long way to go in terms of promoting equal pay. The Assembly, at least, has put its house in order. I have hosted seminars with the health service, local government and other sectors, in order to get this message across. We must roll this out to Assembly sponsored public bodies and to other areas of the public sector for which the Assembly is responsible. Although it will take time, I have no doubt that we will see a narrowing of the pay gap over the next 10 years.

cyflog' ar gyfer busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint, ac yr oeddwn yn falch o gael cefnogaeth y Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal, Cyngres Undebau Llafur Cymru ac Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru. Atef af yr hyn a ddywedodd David Melding am gost-effeithiolrwydd yr ymgyrch hon. Mae'n un ddiarbed ac effeithiol. Cawsom drafodaeth fywiog a chafwyd cefnogaeth adeiladol.

Sut y gallwn helpu menywod sy'n rhoi'r gorau i dderbyn budd-daliadau? Atef af yr hyn a ddywedodd Christine, sef mai'r hyn sy'n peri'r pryder mwyaf i'r rhan fwyaf o bobl—yn enwedig menywod—sy'n rhoi'r gorau i dderbyn budd-daliadau er mwyn cymryd gwaith am dâl isel, yw sut y byddant yn gallu talu am ofal plant. Cytunaf â Christine mai hwn yw un o'r materion mwyaf dyrys. Efallai y gallwch ein helpu, Weinidog?

Carwyn Jones: Fe'ch cyfeiriaf at yr hyn a ddywedais wrth Christine, sef mai hon fydd yr her fwyaf i'r holl Aelodau dros y pump i 10 mlynedd nesaf. Yr ydym ar ei hôl hi braidd o'n cymharu â gwledydd eraill o ran gofal plant fforddiadwy a hygyrch, a rhaid i'r sefyllfa newid.

Ar academyddion yng Nghymru, gallai saib gyrfa olygu nad yw academydd yn dringo ar raddfa tâl prifysgol. Efallai fod yr academydd penodol y cyfeiriodd Eleanor Burnham ati wedi dychwelyd ar yr un pwynt ar y raddfa ag yr oedd pan ymadawodd tua phump neu chwe blynedd ynghynt, o bosibl. O ganlyniad i hynny, mae'n anorfod bod bwlech rhwng darlithydd o'i math hi a darlithydd gwrywaidd sydd wedi aros yn ei swydd a heb gymryd unrhyw seibiau gyrfa. Gan hynny, mae dynion yn dringo'r raddfa; nid yw menywod.

Mae llawer iawn i'w wneud o ran hyrwyddo tâl cyfartal. Mae'r Cynulliad, o leiaf, wedi rhoi trefn ar ei bethau. Yr wyf wedi llywyddu mewn seminarau gyda'r gwasanaeth iechyd, llywodraeth leol a sectorau eraill, er mwyn cyfleu'r neges hon. Rhaid inni ehangu hyn i gynnwys cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad a meysydd eraill yn y sector cyhoeddus y mae'r Cynulliad yn gyfrifol amdanynt. Er y bydd yn cymryd amser, yr wyf yn sicr y byddwn yn gweld y bwlech cyflog yn dechrau cau dros y 10 mlynedd

nesaf.

Karen Sinclair: You spoke about the importance of crèche facilities; I agree with you on that. However, as someone who has juggled work with parenting, I know that pre-school childcare is by far the easiest to organise, and definitely the easiest to find. What work are you undertaking, if any, to allow for term-time working? That would make a massive difference to working women with school age children. The length of time during which school age children need parental care far exceeds the length of time when crèche care is needed. How will you be proactive in taking this forward?

Carwyn Jones: Now that we have identified the problem, we must look carefully at how to resolve it. Childcare only became a political issue recently. It will take sometime to resolve the situation. I am not sure whether I agree that childcare is easy to find. Speaking from personal experience, it depends on where you live and how affordable that childcare is. In some parts of Wales it is reasonably easy; in other parts it is exceptionally difficult, especially in some areas of the Valleys, particularly in the western Valleys of the former coalmining area. Childcare is not the easiest or cheapest service in the world to find.

You are right, we must be careful not to concentrate on childcare provision during term time. Working parents have difficulties in terms of childcare during school holidays. For older children, there is provision in many parts of Wales in the way of summer schools and clubs. However, with pre-school children, it can be difficult to juggle the responsibilities of work and childcare. Having recognised the problem, we need to look carefully at how we can sort it out.

Rosemary Butler: International women's day was celebrated on 8 March. The first such day was held in Europe in 1911 when 1 million women took to the streets. One issue they campaigned for was equal pay. That was

Karen Sinclair: Gwnaethoch sôn am bwysigrwydd cyfleusterau meithrinfa; cytunaf â chi ar hynny. Fodd bynnag, fel un sydd wedi ymdopi â gweithio a magu plant, gwn mai gofal plant cyn-ysgol yw'r hyn sy'n hawsaf ei drefnu o bell ffordd, a'r un hawsaf dod o hyd iddo'n sicr. Pa waith yr ydych yn ei wneud, os rhywbeth, i ddarparu ar gyfer gweithio yn ystod tymhorau ysgol? Gwnâi hynny lawer o wahaniaeth i fenywod sy'n gweithio a chanddynt blant o oedran ysgol. Mae ar blant o oedran ysgol angen gofal gan eu rhieni am gyfnod hwy o lawer na'r amser y mae arnynt angen gofal mewn meithrinfa. Sut y gwnewch gymryd camau i frwr ymlaen â hyn?

Carwyn Jones: A ninnau bellach wedi canfod y broblem, rhaid inni ystyried yn ofalus sut y gallwn ei datrys. Dim ond yn ddiweddar y daeth gofal plant yn fater gwleidyddol. Cymer beth amser i ddatrys y sefyllfa. Nid wyf yn sicr a fyddwn yn cytuno bod gofal plant yn hawdd dod o hyd iddo. A siarad o brofiad personol, mae'n dibynnu ar ba le yr ydych yn byw a pha mor fforddiadwy yw'r gofal plant hwnnw. Mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru, mae'n eithaf hawdd; mewn rhannau eraill, mae'n arbennig o anodd, yn enwedig mewn rhai ardaloedd yn y Cymoedd, yn enwedig yng Nghymoedd gorllewinol yr hen ardal lofaol. Nid gofal plant yw'r gwasanaeth rhataf yn y byd na'r un hawsaf dod o hyd iddo.

Yr ydych yn iawn, rhaid inni ofalu peidio â chanolbwyntio ar ddarparu gofal plant yn ystod y tymor ysgol. Mae rhieni sy'n gweithio'n profi anawsterau o ran sicrhau gofal plant yn ystod y gwyliau ysgol. Ar gyfer plant hŷn, mae darpariaeth mewn llawer rhan o Gymru ar ffurf ysgolion haf a chlybiau. Fodd bynnag, yn achos plant cyn oedran ysgol, gall fod yn anodd ymdopi â chyfrifoldebau gwaith a gofal plant. A ninnau wedi cydnabod y broblem, rhaid inni edrych yn ofalus ar y modd y gallwn ei datrys.

Rosemary Butler: Dathlwyd diwrnod rhyngwladol y menywod ar 8 Mawrth. Cynhaliwyd y diwrnod cyntaf o'r fath yn Ewrop yn 1911 pan ddaeth 1 filiwn o fenywod allan i'r strydoedd. Un mater yr

ninety years ago and we are still debating it.

The point about equal pay has been made today, but there must also be equality of opportunity. If women do not have the opportunity to get into the workplace, they cannot possibly have equal pay. Childcare must be affordable, accessible, high quality, and available all year round. We need to address that.

The statement highlighted the 'What's Stopping You?' pack. It is important to consider what schools are doing to change younger girls' mindsets. Last week, I had the privilege of launching a 'women into construction' day at the University of Wales College, Newport. The day had been organised for 14-year-old girls across south-east Wales and tried to show that other choices are on offer, not just the stereotypical women's jobs, such as jobs in the construction industry. When the girls were given the details of comparative wages of an engineer and a nurse, and a range of other jobs, they could see the difference. The motto I shared with them was: 'the money is where the boys are, so you need to go where the boys are going.' The catchphrase of the day was not 'Bob the Builder' but 'Babs the Builder'; I said that it should be 'Babs the Boss'. That is what we should be aiming for.

This must be mainstreamed, and we must push forward. We have cross-party consent. One of the best things the Assembly can achieve is to have equality of opportunity and pay for both genders.

3.30 p.m.

Carwyn Jones: You are right, Rosemary. We have moved from a situation where equal pay was not recognised and was explicit, in the sense that women were deliberately paid less than men, to a situation where it is implicit and hidden in many ways. That does not mean that it has disappeared or that we must not tackle it, but it is more difficult to spot. That is why equal pay reviews are important. Your points on access are also exceptionally important in terms of removing

oeddent yn ymgyrchu drosto oedd tâl cyfartal. Yr oedd hynny 90 mlynedd yn ôl ac yr ydym yn dal i'w drafod.

Gwnaed y pwynt am dâl cyfartal heddiw, ond rhaid wrth gyfle cyfartal hefyd. Os na chaiff menywod gyfle i ddechrau gweithio, nid oes modd iddynt gael tâl cyfartal. Rhaid i ofal plant fod yn fforddiadwy, yn hygyrch, ac o ansawdd da, a rhaid iddo fod ar gael gydol y flwyddyn. Rhaid inni ymdrin â hynny.

Tynnwyd sylw at y pecyn 'Beth sy'n eich rhwystro chi?' yn y datganiad. Mae'n bwysig ystyried beth y mae ysgolion yn ei wneud i newid cyfeiriad meddwl merched ifanc. Yr wythnos diwethaf, cefais y fraint o lansio diwrnod 'menywod mewn adeiladu' yng Ngholeg Prifysgol Cymru, Casnewydd. Trefnwyd y diwrnod ar gyfer merched 14 blwydd oed ledled y De-ddwyrain a cheisiodd ddangos bod dewisiadau eraill ar gael, ac nid y swyddi ystrydebol i fenywod yn unig, fel swyddi yn y diwydiant adeiladu. Ar ôl cael manylion am y gymhariaeth rhwng cyflogau peiriannydd a nyrs, ac amryw o swyddi eraill, gallai'r merched weld y gwahaniaeth. Yr arwyddair a rennais i â hwy oedd: 'mae'r arian lle y mae'r bechgyn, felly rhaid i chi fynd i ble y mae'r bechgyn yn mynd.' Hoff ymadrodd y diwrnod oedd nid 'Bob yr Adeiladwr' ond 'Babs yr Adeiladwr'; dywedais i mai 'Babs y Gaffer' y dylai fod. At hynny y dylem anelu.

Rhaid gosod hyn yn y brif ffrwd, a rhaid inni roi hwb ymlaen iddo. Mae'r holl bleidiau'n gytûn. Un o'r pethau gorau y gall y Cynulliad ei gyflawni yw cyfle a thâl cyfartal i'r ddau ryw.

Carwyn Jones: Yr ydych yn iawn, Rosemary. Yr ydym wedi symud oddi wrth sefyllfa lle na chydabyddid yr hawl i dâl cyfartal a lle yr oedd hynny'n amlwg, yn yr ystyr y telid llai i fenywod nag i ddynion yn fwriadol, at sefyllfa lle y mae'n oblygedig ac ynghudd ar lawer ystyr. Ni olyga hynny ei bod wedi diflannu neu na ddylem ymdrin â hi, ond mae'n anos ei gweld. Dyna pam y mae adolygiadau tâl cyfartal yn bwysig. Mae'r pwyntiau a wnaethoch am fynediad yn

the barriers to work that exist for many women. To return to my previous points, I reiterate what we need to do on childcare issues, and on removing those barriers.

Ann Jones: We have just heard Rosemary say that women took to the streets to protest for equal pay in 1911. It took over 100 years to secure the minimum wage, which was one of Keir Hardie's aims. It is my Labour Government that delivered the minimum wage, and it is this Labour-led Assembly Government that is delivering on equal pay. We need practical action to deliver fair pay for more women, and policies aimed at opening up the Labour market for women. We must keep our eye on the ball. I hope that you agree, Carwyn, that the Assembly has taken an excellent campaign out into the public arena. We have considered our own inadequacies. The dedication of the equal pay working group's chairperson, David Melding—who has kept us all in line—and the commitment from the former Minister with responsibility for equality of opportunity, Edwina Hart, as well as your commitment, Carwyn, has ensured that that has happened. The only way to ensure that we do not stand still, or even allow everyone else to catch up with us and move ahead, is to have a committed budget line to ensure that campaigns such as promoting equal pay are carried on in the next Assembly. I hope that whoever is Minister with responsibility for equality of opportunity in the next Government will honour that request from the equal pay working group.

Carwyn Jones: I can only echo much of what you say. Equal pay and equality is a recurring theme. We cannot resolve this in one campaign, before moving on, we must build on that work. On stereotyping, which Rosemary raised, engineering is a prime example. It has been difficult to attract girls to engineering because of society's view that engineering is done in overalls and using spanners. In the past, schools have also been responsible for diverting talented, able girls away from engineering, for example, because they do not consider that it is a proper job for

eithriadol o bwysig hefyd o ran dileu'r rhwystrau rhag gwaith sy'n bodoli yn achos llawer o fenywod. Gan fynd yn ôl at y pwyntiau a wneuthum o'r blaen, ailadroddaf yr hyn y mae angen inni ei wneud ynghylch materion gofal plant, ac ynghylch dileu'r rhwystrau hynny.

Ann Jones: Yr ydym newydd glywed Rosemary yn dweud bod menywod wedi dod allan i'r strydoedd i ymgyrchu dros dâl cyfartal yn 1911. Cymerodd dros 100 mlynedd i sicrhau'r isafswm cyflog, a oedd yn un o nodau Keir Hardie. Fy Llywodraeth Lafur i a gyflwynodd yr isafswm cyflog, a'r Llywodraeth Gynulliad hon dan arweiniad Llafur sy'n mynd â'r maen i'r wal ar dâl cyfartal. Mae arnom angen camau ymarferol i sicrhau tâl teg ar gyfer rhagor o fenywod, a pholisïau sydd â'r bwriad o agor y farchnad lafur i fenywod. Rhaid inni gadw llygad barcud ar hyn. Gobeithiaf eich bod yn cytuno, Carwyn, fod y Cynulliad wedi cynnal ymgyrch ragorol yn y maes cyhoeddus. Yr ydym wedi ystyried ein diffygion ein hun. Mae ymroddiad cadeirydd y gweithgor tâl cyfartal, David Melding—a gadwodd drefn arnom i gyd—ac ymroddiad y Gweinidog blaenorol a oedd â chyfrifoldeb dros gyfle cyfartal, Edwina Hart, yn ogystal â'ch ymroddiad chi, Carwyn, wedi sicrhau hynny. Yr unig fodd i sicrhau na fyddwn yn sefyll yn ein hunfan, neu hyd yn oed yn gadael i bawb arall ein dal a mynd o'n blaen, yw cael llinell gyllideb benodol i sicrhau bod ymgyrchoedd fel yr un dros dâl cyfartal yn parhau yn y Cynulliad nesaf. Gobeithiaf y bydd pwy bynnag sy'n Weinidog â chyfrifoldeb dros gyfle cyfartal yn y Llywodraeth nesaf yn cydsynio â'r cais hwnnw gan y gweithgor tâl cyfartal.

Carwyn Jones: Ni allaf ond ategu llawer o'r hyn a ddywedwch. Mae tâl cyfartal a chydaddoldeb yn thema sy'n codi dro ar ôl tro. Ni allwn ddatrys hyn mewn un ymgyrch, cyn symud ymlaen, rhaid inni adeiladu ar sail y gwaith hwnnw. Ynghylch stereoteipio, a godwyd gan Rosemary, mae peirianeg yn enghraifft dda iawn. Bu'n anodd denu merched i beirianeg oherwydd barn cymdeithas mai rhywbeth a wneir mewn troswisg a chyda sbaneri yw peirianeg. Yn y gorffennol, bu ysgolion hefyd yn gyfrifol am droi merched galluog a thalentog oddi wrth

them. Medicine is okay, but engineering is not. There is a successful engineering department at the University of Wales, Swansea, which has successfully tried to attract more girls into engineering. However, the situation remains that if girls enter engineering, for example, it is seen as a novelty and is often used as an example—with people saying ‘look, it is wonderful, we have girls doing engineering’. We should not aim for that, but for a position where it is not seen as a novelty, but as normal.

beirianneg, er enghraifft, am nad oeddent yn credu ei fod yn waith priodol iddynt. Mae meddygaeth yn iawn, ond nid peirianneg. Mae adran peirianneg lwyddiannus ym Mhrifysgol Cymru, Abertawe, sydd wedi llwyddo i ddenu rhagor o ferched i beirianneg. Fodd bynnag, y sefyllfa o hyd yw, os bydd merched yn mynd yn beirianwyr, y gwelir hynny'n newyddbeth a'i ddefnyddio'n aml fel esiampl—a phobl yn dweud ‘edrychwch, mae'n rhyfeddol, mae gennym ferched sy'n gwneud peirianneg’. Ni ddylem anelu at hynny, ond at sefyllfa lle nas gwelir yn newyddbeth, ond yn beth normal.

Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order

Alun Cairns: Point of order. I raise this under Standing Order No. 6.33, which relates to written Assembly questions, and Standing Order No. 2.7, which relates to the Ministerial Code. On 4 March, I tabled eight written Assembly questions due for answer on 11 March. It was only after chasing on several occasions that I received the answers by 14 March. I will also mention the quality of the answers that were provided and the details with regard to factual questions that were not provided. I am extremely disappointed about the quality of answers that I received about the LG investment in south-east Wales. I seek your guidance, Llywydd, as to how I can pursue the matter again to receive factual answers to information that is not commercially confidential.

Alun Cairns: Pwynt o drefn. Codaf hyn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.33, sy'n ymwneud â chwestiynau Cynulliad ysgrifenedig, a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 2.7, sy'n ymwneud â Chôd y Gweinidogion. Ar 4 Mawrth, cyflwynais wyth cwestiwn Cynulliad ysgrifenedig a oedd i'w hateb ar 11 Mawrth. Dim ond ar ôl holi ar sawl achlysur y cefais yr atebion, a hynny ar 14 Mawrth. Cyfeiriai hefyd at ansawdd yr atebion a ddarparwyd a'r manylion o ran cwestiynau ffeithiol nas darparwyd. Yr wyf yn siomedig dros ben yn ansawdd yr atebion a gefais ynghylch buddsoddiad LG yn y De-ddwyrain. Ceisiaf eich cyfarwyddyd, Lywydd, ynghylch sut y gallaf fynd ynghylch y mater hwn eto er mwyn cael atebion ffeithiol am wybodaeth nad yw'n fasnachol gyfrinachol.

The Presiding Officer: The content of questions is not a matter for me directly. The Minister will be able to read this exchange in our Record. You can pursue the matter by tabling further questions. The Table Office is always available to advise all Members in order to elicit information that may be required. Information is, of course, subject to the normal rules of commercial confidentiality.

Y Llywydd: Nid yw cynnwys cwestiynau'n fater i mi'n uniongyrchol. Bydd y Gweinidog yn gallu darllen y geiriau rhyngom ar hyn yn ein Cofnod. Gallwch fynd ynghylch y mater hwn drwy gyflwyno cwestiynau pellach. Mae'r Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar gael bob amser i gynghori'r holl Aelodau er mwyn cael gwybodaeth y gofynnir amdani. Wrth gwrs, mae gwybodaeth yn ddarostyngedig i'r rheolau arferol ar gyfrinachedd masnachol.

Peter Law: Point of order. Earlier this afternoon, the leader of the Welsh Conservatives, in a preamble to his speech on Iraq, referred to the demonstration that took place in the Chamber this afternoon. He suggested that there may need to be a review

Peter Law: Pwynt o drefn. Yn gynharach y prynhawn yma, cyfeiriodd arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru, mewn rhagymadrodd i'w araith ar Irac, at y gwrthdystiad a fu yn y Siambr y prynhawn yma. Awgrymodd ei bod yn bosibl y bydd angen cael adolygiad o

of security, and so on. That is understandable in the circumstances. It is inevitable that in a centre of democracy, such as this one, there will be demonstrations from time to time. On this occasion, it was a peaceful demonstration, from what I witnessed. The police and security services acted swiftly and efficiently today. You, Presiding Officer, and your staff also dealt with the intervention in a professional and dignified manner. It is important to reflect on that today, particularly as we have recently had a security review. We need to be aware but we also need to understand the situation. I thank all concerned.

ddiogelwch, ac yn y blaen. Gellir deall hynny o dan yr amgylchiadau. Mae'n anorffod mewn canolfan i ddemocratiaeth, fel hon, y bydd gwrthdystiadau o bryd i'w gilydd. Y tro hwn, yr oedd yn wrthdystiad heddychlon, o'r hyn a welais i. Cymerwyd camau buan ac effeithlon gan yr heddlu a'r gwasanaethau diogelwch heddiw. Gwnaethoch chi, Lywydd, a'ch staff ddelio â'r ymyriad mewn modd proffesiynol ac urddasol hefyd. Mae'n bwysig myfyrio ar hynny heddiw, yn enwedig am ein bod wedi cael adolygiad o ddiogelwch yn ddiweddar. Rhaid inni fod yn effro ond rhaid inni ddeall y sefyllfa hefyd. Diolchaf i bawb a oedd yn gysylltiedig.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Peter.

Y Llywydd: Diolch ichi, Peter.

Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion **Composite Motion: Approval of Orders**

Y Llywydd: O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25, ni fydd dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

The Presiding Officer: Under Standing Order No. 22.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

Y Trefnydd (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiau fod

The Business Minister (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25:

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 22.25:

1.a. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ar 11 Mawrth 2003, ac sydd heb nodi unrhyw faterion sy'n destun pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Meddygol Cyffredinol) (Diwygio) (Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2003;

1.a. considers the report of the Legislation Committee, laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 11 March 2003, which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the National Health Service (General Medical Services) (Amendment) (No. 2) (Wales) Regulations 2003;

b. yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Meddygol Cyffredinol) (Diwygio) (Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Mawrth 2003;

b. approves the National Health Service (General Medical Services) (Amendment) (No. 2) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 10 March 2003;

2.a. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ar 11 Mawrth 2003, ac sydd heb nodi unrhyw faterion sy'n destun pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Fferyllol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003;

2.a. considers the report of the Legislation Committee, laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 11 March 2003, which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the National Health Service (Pharmaceutical Services) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003;

- b. yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Fferyllol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Mawrth 2003;*
- b. approves the National Health Service (Pharmaceutical Services) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 10 March 2003;*
- 3.a. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ar 11 Mawrth 2003, ac sydd heb nodi unrhyw faterion sy'n destun pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003;*
- 3.a. considers the report of the Legislation Committee, laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 11 March 2003, which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the National Health Service (General Dental Services) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003;*
- b. yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Mawrth 2003;*
- b. approves the National Health Service (General Dental Services) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 10 March 2003;*
- 4.a. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ar 11 Mawrth 2003, ac sydd heb nodi unrhyw faterion sy'n destun pryder yn y gorchymyn drafft Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Offthalmig Cyffredinol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003;*
- 4.a. considers the report of the Legislation Committee, laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 11 March 2003, which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the National Health Service (General Ophthalmic Services) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003;*
- b. yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Offthalmig Cyffredinol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Mawrth 2003. (NDM1399)*
- b. approves the National Health Service (General Ophthalmic Services) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 10 March 2003. (NDM1399)*

*Cynnig (NDM1399): O blaid 30, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1399): For 30, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Janet
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane

Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Law, Peter
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Pugh, Alun
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

Dafydd Wigley: Pwynt o drefn. Nid yw fy mheiriant pleidleisio yn gweithio.

Dafydd Wigley: Point of order. My voting pad is not working.

Y Llywydd: Byddai'n anffodus pe bai camgymeriad yn record pleidleisio Dafydd Wigley. Cawn olwg ar y peiriant ac fe nodir yn y Cofnod fod Dafydd Wigley yn bresennol.

The Presiding Officer: It would be unfortunate if there was a mistake on Dafydd Wigley's voting record. We will have a look at the pad and it will be noted in the Record that Dafydd Wigley is present.

Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Diwygio Rheoliadol (Cytundebau Rheoli Tai) 2003 Approval of the Regulatory Reform (Housing Management Agreements) Order 2003

The Finance Minister (Edwina Hart): I propose that

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Edwina Hart): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 24, agrees that the Secretary of State makes the Regulatory Reform (Housing Management Agreements) Order 2003, which was laid in the Table Office in the Assembly on 10 March 2003. (NDM1400)

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24, yn cytuno bod yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yn gwneud y Gorchymyn Diwygio Rheoliadol (Cytundebau Rheoli Tai) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Mawrth 2003. (NDM1400)

Janet Davies: It seems that this measure removes a smidgen of bureaucracy and, therefore, it deserves to be supported: Plaid Cymru will support it. There is a problem with the amount of bureaucracy in the UK, which is restricting the Government's work, whether in health, education or housing. Good governance involves achieving fairness, justice, sustainability and so on without having to establish complex rules for every action. Although a commitment to human rights, democracy and compassion is

Janet Davies: Ymddengys fod y mesur hwn yn dileu tipyn bach o fiwrocratiaeth a'i fod, felly, yn haeddu cefnogaeth: bydd Plaid Cymru yn ei gefnogi. Mae problem o ran faint o fiwrocratiaeth sydd y DU, sy'n cyfyngu ar waith y Llywodraeth, boed hynny mewn iechyd, addysg neu dai. Mae llywodraethu da'n golygu sicrhau tegwch, cyfiawnder, cynaliadwyedd ac yn y blaen heb orfod gosod rheolau cymhleth ar gyfer pob gweithred. Er mai ymrwymiad i hawliau dynol, democratiaeth a thosturi yw'r agwedd

the most important feature of a government, it is crucial that governance is undertaken with intelligence, understanding and the confidence to allow people, organisations and internal levels of Government the right to take action in their own way. The constant ratcheting up of pettifogging rules brings Governments into disrepute. In the 1980s and early 1990s, Conservative bureaucracy hampered the delivery of good services by local government, which still has to fight its way through jungles of targets, benchmarks and controls.

This measure is intended to allow local authorities more freedom so that they can provide better management services to tenants. I hope that they use it well and prove to the New Labour Government in London and Cardiff that the commitment to bureaucracy is borne out of a lack of understanding and intelligence.

William Graham: The Housing Act 1985 enabled local housing authorities to appoint a manager to exercise specified housing management functions in respect of their housing stock and associated land. In essence, the reform Order allows local authorities to authorise a manager, with the consent of the authority, to agree that another person will exercise any management function that could be undertaken by a manager under the agreement. Where a body or association is the manager, a committee, sub-committee, officer or employee of the body or association may undertake those management functions.

The Order opens out the management and development of local authority housing stock, allowing the independent sector to be contracted to maintain social housing in Wales. It also suggests that the Assembly Government recognises the need for housing stock transfer and the use of PFI for the repair and maintenance of houses. We note the pioneering nature of such PFI schemes in England and hope that they will be more actively promoted in Wales. We therefore ask the Minister to widely promote the opportunity that these regulations allow for our local authorities to have greater scope in delegating housing management services and

bwysicaf ar lywodraeth, mae'n hollbwysig llywodraethu mewn modd deallus a chydymdeimladol, a bod â'r hyder i ganiatáu pobl, cyrff a lefelau mewnol Llywodraeth i gymryd camau yn eu ffordd eu hunain. Mae'r cynnydd cyson mewn rheolau gorfawwl yn rhoi enw drwg i Lywodraethau. Yn y 1980au a dechrau'r 1990au, yr oedd biwrocraetiaeth y Ceidwadwyr yn rhwystr i ddarparu gwasanaethau da gan lywodraeth leol, sy'n dal i orfod ymlafnio drwy ddrysi ni o dargedau, meincnodau a rheolaethau.

Bwriad y mesur hwn yw caniatáu mwy o ryddid i awdurdodau lleol fel y gallant ddarparu gwell gwasanaethau rheoli ar gyfer tenantiaid. Gobeithiaf y byddant yn gwneud defnydd da ohono ac yn dangos i'r Llywodraeth Lafur Newydd yn Llundain a Chaerdydd fod yr ymrwymiad i fiwrocraetiaeth yn ganlyniad i ddiffyg dealltwriaeth a deallusrwydd.

William Graham: Yr oedd Deddf Tai 1985 yn galluogi awdurdodau tai lleol i benodi rheolwr i arfer swyddogaethau rheoli tai penodol mewn cysylltiad â'u stoc dai a'r tir a oedd yn gysylltiedig â hi. Yn y bôn, mae'r Gorchymyn diwygio'n caniatáu i awdurdodau lleol awdurdodi rheolwr, gyda chydysniad yr awdurdod, i gytuno y bydd rhywun arall yn arfer unrhyw swyddogaeth rheoli y gallai rheolwr ymgymryd â hi o dan y cytundeb. Os mai corff neu gymdeithas yw'r rheolwr, caiff pwyllgor, is-bwyllgor, swyddog neu un sy'n gweithio i'r corff neu gymdeithas ymgymryd â'r swyddogaethau rheoli hynny.

Mae'r Gorchymyn yn agor y gwaith o reoli a datblygu stoc dai awdurdodau lleol, gan ganiatáu gosod gwaith cynnal tai cymdeithasol yng Nghymru ar gytundeb i'r sector annibynnol. Mae hefyd yn awgrymu bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cydnabod yr angen am drosglwyddo stoc tai a'r defnydd o fentrau cyllid preifat ar gyfer atgyweirio a chynnal a chadw tai. Nodwn natur arloesol cynlluniau PFI o'r fath yn Lloegr a gobeithiwn y cânt eu hyrwyddo'n fwy egniol yng Nghymru. Gan hynny, gofynnwn i'r Gweinidog hyrwyddo'n eang y cyfle a geir drwy'r rheoliadau hyn i'n hawdurdodau lleol gael mwy o gyfle i ddirprwyo gwasanaethau

to be able to take full advantage of modern procurement practice. rheoli tai a gallu manteisio'n llawn ar arferion caffael cyfoes.

3.40 p.m.

The Finance Minister (Edwina Hart): The purpose of this regulatory reform Order is to ensure that local authorities gain more freedom in letting their housing management contracts. I will ensure that this is well publicised.

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Edwina Hart): Pwrpas y Gorchymyn diwygio rheoliadol hwn yw sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol yn cael mwy o ryddid wrth osod eu contractau rheoli tai. Gwnaf sicrhau cyhoeddusrwydd da ar gyfer hyn.

I concur with Janet's points about government and bureaucracy and, as a member of a socialist, Labour-led Government—[*Interruption.*]

Yr wyf yn cyd-fynd â'r sylwadau a wnaeth Janet am lywodraeth a biwrocratiaeth ac, fel aelod o Lywodraeth sosialaidd o dan arweiniad Llafur—[*Torri ar draws.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order. The Minister is entitled to make her speech and to choose her adjectives as she will.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae gan y Gweinidog hawl i wneud ei haraith ac i ddewis ei hansoddeiriau fel y mynno.

Edwina Hart: I pride myself on the fact that we are a good Government that has ensured that we have governed properly.

Edwina Hart: Ymfalchïaf yn y ffaith ein bod yn Llywodraeth dda sydd wedi sicrhau ein bod wedi llywodraethu'n briodol.

Cynnig (NDM1400): O blaid 32, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM1400): For 32, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Janet
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Law, Peter
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Canolfannau Preswyl i Deuluoedd (Cymru) 2003 a'r
Rheoliadau Safonau Gofynnol Cenedlaethol ar gyfer Canolfannau Preswyl i
Deuluoedd (Cymru) 2003
Approval of the Residential Family Centres (Wales) Regulations 2003 and the
National Minimum Standards for Residential Family Centres (Wales)
Regulations 2003**

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): I propose that **Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly considers the principle of the Residential Family Centres (Wales) Regulations 2003 laid in the Table Office on 25 February 2003. (NDM1401) *y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Canolfannau Preswyl i Deuluoedd (Cymru) 2003 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 25 Chwefror 2003. (NDM1401)*

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly:

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 4 March 2003, which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5 in relation to the draft Order, the Residential Family Centres (Wales) Regulations 2003; *1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Mawrth 2003, nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5 mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Canolfannau Preswyl i Deuluoedd (Cymru) 2003;*

2. approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 25 February 2003, the regulatory appraisal, laid in the Table Office on 25 February 2003, and the memorandum of corrections, laid in the Table Office on 10 March 2003. (NDM1402) *2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r Gorchymyn drafft a'r arfarniad rheoliadol, y gosodwyd copi o'r ddau ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 25 Chwefror 2003, a'r memorandwm cywiriadau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Mawrth 2003. (NDM1402)*

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly considers the principle of the National Minimum Standards for Residential Family Centres (Wales) Regulations 2003, which was laid in Table Office on 10 March 2003. (NDM1403) *y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor y Rheoliadau Safonau Gofynnol Cenedlaethol ar gyfer Canolfannau Preswyl i Deuluoedd (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Mawrth 2003. (NDM1403)*

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 27.2(iii), considers *Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 27.2(iii),*

the National Minimum Standards for Residential Family Centres (Wales) Regulations 2003, which was laid in Table Office on 10 March 2003. (NDM1404)

yn ystyried y Rheoliadau Safonau Gofynnol Cenedlaethol ar gyfer Canolfannau Preswyl i Deuluoedd (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Mawrth 2003. (NDM1404)

Kirsty Williams: I welcome these regulations. While they affect few centres in Wales—only two have been identified as not being regulated—it is important that these settings, which potentially provide services for vulnerable families, should be regulated to ensure good-quality services and due regard for children’s safety.

Kirsty Williams: Croesawaf y rheoliadau hyn. Er nad ydynt yn effeithio ar lawer o ganolfannau yng Nghymru—dim ond dwy y canfuwyd eu bod heb eu rheoleiddio—mae’n bwysig rheoleiddio’r manau hyn, a all ddarparu gwasanaethau ar gyfer teuluoedd sy’n agored i niwed, er mwyn sicrhau gwasanaethau o ansawdd da a sylw dyladwy i ddiogelwch plant.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): I thank Kirsty for her supportive remarks.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Diolchaf i Kirsty an ei sylwadau cefnogol.

*Cynnig (NDM1401): O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1401): For 29, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Janet
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Law, Peter
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1402): O blaid 30, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1402): For 30, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Janet
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Law, Peter
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1403): O blaid 31, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1403): For 31, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, David Ian
Jones, Elin
Law, Peter
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David

Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1404): O blaid 34, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1404): For 34, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gibbons, Brian
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, David Ian
Jones, Elin
Law, Peter
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.46 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.46 p.m.*

Cymorth Rhanbarthol Dewisol a Grant Buddsoddi'r Cynulliad Regional Selective Assistance and the Assembly Investment Grant

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1, 4 and 5 in the name of Jocelyn Davies and amendments 2 and 3 in the name of Jonathan Morgan.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 4 a 5 yn enw Jocelyn Davies a gwelliannau 2 a 3 yn enw Jonathan Morgan.

The Minister for Economic Development (Andrew Davies): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd (Andrew Davies): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales notes the continuing strong support offered by regional selective assistance and the Assembly investment grant to investment by companies, and welcomes the impact on improving the Welsh economy. (NDM1405)

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn nodi'r cymorth cadarn sy'n parhau i gael ei gynnig gan y cynllun cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol a grant buddsoddi'r Cynulliad i fuddsoddiad gan gwmnïau, ac yn croesawu'r effaith ar wella economi Cymru. (NDM1405)

Since the Assembly was established in 1999, take-up of regional selective assistance has gone from strength to strength, bringing enormous benefits to the Welsh economy. The figures for the period between July 1999 and the end of February this year make impressive reading. No fewer than 750 grant offers, worth £405 million, have been accepted, and these should lever in a massive £1.7 billion of private sector investment, creating 31,000 jobs and safeguarding nearly 13,000 further jobs.

Ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad yn 1999, mae'r defnydd o gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol wedi mynd o nerth i nerth, gan ddod â buddion aruthrol i economi Cymru. Mae'r ffigurau ar gyfer y cyfnod rhwng Gorffennaf 1999 a diwedd Chwefror eleni'n drawiadol. Derbyniwyd cymaint â 750 o gynigion grant, gwerth £405 miliwn, a dylai'r rhain ddod â'r swm aruthrol o £1.7 biliwn o fuddsoddiad gan y sector preifat, gan greu 31,000 o swyddi a diogelu ymron i 13,000 yn rhagor o swyddi.

For many years, RSA has been the main Government tool for aiding investment and job creation in the UK. Independent reviews of the scheme have repeatedly shown that it is instrumental in winning new investment projects and new jobs to areas of high economic need. The scheme has been applied particularly successful in Wales, facilitating the development of indigenous business and the winning of many good-quality inward investment projects.

Ers blynyddoedd lawer, bu cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol yn brif offeryn gan y Llywodraeth i hybu buddsoddi a chreu swyddi yn y DU. Mae adolygiadau annibynnol o'r cynllun wedi dangos dro ar ôl tro ei fod yn allweddol i ddenu prosiectau buddsoddi newydd a swyddi newydd i ardaloedd a chanddynt anghenion economaidd mawr. Cymhwyswyd y cynllun yn arbennig o lwyddiannus yng Nghymru, gan hwyluso'r gwaith o ddatblygu busnes cynhenid a denu llawer o brosiectau mewnfuddsoddi o safon.

Our record speaks for itself, with more RSA offered in 2001-02 than ever before. We are on course to achieve a similar level this year, with no fewer than 211 offers having been made up to the end of February 2003, with a total value of £114 million. These offers support plans for £424 million of private sector investment, creating nearly 9,000 jobs and safeguarding a further 2,000.

Mae ein record yn siarad drosti'i hun, gan fod mwy o gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol wedi'i gynnig yn 2001-02 nag erioed o'r blaen. Yr ydym ar y trywydd iawn i sicrhau lefel debyg eleni, gan fod cymaint â 211 o gynigion wedi'u gwneud hyd at ddiwedd Chwefror 2003, sy'n werth cyfanswm o £114 miliwn. Mae'r cynigion hyn yn cefnogi cynlluniau ar gyfer £424 miliwn o fuddsoddiad gan y

sector preifat, a fydd yn creu ymron i 9,000 o swyddi ac yn diogelu 2,000 yn rhagor o swyddi.

I am particularly delighted with our record of supporting indigenous Welsh businesses, which we recognise as being vital to local communities and to the national economy. So far this financial year, no less than 70 per cent of all RSA offers have been made to Welsh companies, and a further 16 per cent to UK-owned companies.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Thank you for giving the percentage figures in terms of the grants made. What percentage of the money made available through RSA was given to companies from Wales, and what percentage went to companies from outside Wales?

Andrew Davies: I will come on to that in a minute. Examples of some of the indigenous companies supported include Décor Frame plc of Bridgend, which is creating 100 jobs, Brecon Carreg, the well-known bottled water company in Powys, and FD Systems in Nantgarw, which is one of Wales's fastest growing companies.

However, for any economy to compete successfully in the global market, it must have a good balance of indigenous and inward investment projects. Indeed, the winning of foreign direct investment is vital to our future prosperity. I am delighted to say that, here too, we have an excellent record as we continue to win a disproportionately large share of inward investment projects coming to the UK, against the background of a declining world market for foreign direct investment. Last year, Wales's proportion stood at 8 per cent of the UK total—nearly double the level of the preceding year. Foreign-owned companies accounted for 14 per cent of the total number of RSA offers made, and a little over 40 per cent of the total value. The answer to your question, therefore, Rhodri, is that about 60 per cent of the total grant offer is made to Welsh-based or UK companies, as opposed to overseas companies.

Yr wyf yn arbennig o falch o'n record o gefnogi busnesau cynhenid yng Nghymru, y cynabyddwn eu bod yn hollbwysig i gymunedau lleol ac i'r economi genedlaethol. Hyd yma, yn y flwyddyn ariannol hon, gwnaed cymaint â 70 y cant o'r holl gynigion o gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol i gwmnïau Cymreig, a 16 y cant ar ben hynny i gwmnïau y mae eu perchnogion yn y DU.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Diolch i chi am roi'r ffigurau canran ar gyfer y grantiau a roddwyd. Pa ganran o'r arian a ddarparwyd drwy gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol a roddwyd i gwmnïau o Gymru, a pha ganran a aeth i gwmnïau o'r tu allan i Gymru?

Andrew Davies: Deuaf at hynny mewn munud. Rhai enghreifftiau o'r cwmnïau cynhenid a gynorthwywyd yw Décor Frame ccc ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, sy'n creu 100 o swyddi, Brecon Carreg, y cwmni dŵr potel adnabyddus ym Mhowys, ac FD Systems yn Nantgarw, sydd ymysg y cwmnïau sy'n tyfu gyflymaf yng Nghymru.

Fodd bynnag, os yw unrhyw economi i gystadlu'n llwyddiannus yn y farchnad fyd-eang, rhaid iddi fod â chwybysedd da o brosiectau cynhenid a phrosiectau mewnfuddsoddi. Yn wir, mae ennill buddsoddiad uniongyrchol o dramor yn hollbwysig er mwyn ein ffyniant yn y dyfodol. Yr wyf yn falch o ddweud bod gennym record ragorol yn hyn o beth hefyd gan ein bod yn dal i ennill cyfran fwy na'n siâr o'r prosiectau mewnfuddsoddi a ddaw i'r DU, yng nghyd-destun y gostyngiad mewn buddsoddi uniongyrchol o dramor ym marchnad y byd. Y llynedd, yr oedd cyfran Cymru'n 8 y cant o gyfanswm y DU—ymron ddwywaith y lefel yn y flwyddyn cyn hynny. Rhoddwyd 14 y cant o'r cynigion o gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol i gwmnïau a chanddynt berchnogion tramor, sef ychydig dros 40 y cant o gyfanswm eu gwerth. Yr ateb i'ch cwestiwn, felly, Rhodri, yw y cynigir tua 60 y cant o'r holl grantiau i gwmnïau sydd â'u pencadlys yng Nghymru neu'r DU, yn hytrach na chwmnïau tramor.

3.50 p.m.

The apparently high value of these offers reflects the fact that large multi-national companies, such as Ford in Bridgend, or Continental Teves UK Ltd in Ebbw Vale, tend to come forward with larger, more capital-intensive projects, which usually provide more jobs. These companies also stimulate new supply-chain opportunities for indigenous firms.

The fact that we are supporting foreign-owned companies that are willing to invest in Wales does not mean that indigenous Welsh companies go without—far from it. On the contrary, both the First Minister and I have given repeated assurances that no worthwhile eligible project will be refused RSA for lack of funds. Given that the amount of grant offered is always the minimum necessary to ensure that a project proceeds, it is clear that indigenous companies are not disadvantaged in any way. I therefore reject Jocelyn Davies's amendment 1, and Jonathan Morgan's amendment 3, both of which appear to call for less support for inward investors. The two amendments seem to be based upon a fundamental misconception of how RSA operates.

Members should be proud of our record in attracting and retaining inward investors to Wales, as it is a huge vote of confidence in the skills of our workforce and in our economy. Recent successes on this front include the Australian-owned Simsmetal, which built the UK's first major fridge recycling plant in Newport; the French-owned Tillery Valley Foods Ltd, which is already a major employer in Abertillery and which is creating a further 100 new jobs, and also the highly-regarded and long-established Georgia Pacific (GB) Ltd paper company near Maesteg in Janice Gregory's constituency, which I was delighted to visit when its RSA announcement was made last year.

Other success stories include the BT Ignite

Mae gwerth ymddangosiadol uchel y cynigion hyn yn adlewyrchu'r ffaith bod cwmnïau rhyngwladol mawr, fel Ford ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, neu Continental Teves UK Cyf yng Nglynebwy, yn tueddu i gyflwyno prosiectau mwy sy'n fwy cyfalafddwys, sy'n darparu mwy o swyddi fel arfer. Yn ogystal â hynny, mae'r cwmnïau hyn yn creu cyfleoedd newydd mewn cadwynau cyflenwi i fusnesau cynhenid.

Nid yw'r ffaith ein bod yn cynorthwyo cwmnïau sydd â pherchnogion tramor sy'n barod i fuddsoddi yng Nghymru yn golygu bod cwmnïau cynhenid yng Nghymru ar eu colled—dim o gwbl. I'r gwrthwyneb, mae'r Prif Weinidog a minnau wedi rhoi sicrwydd dro ar ôl tro na wrthodir cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol i unrhyw brosiect cymwys buddiol oherwydd diffyg cyllid. O gofio mai swm y grant a gynigir ym mhob achos yw'r lleiaf sydd ei angen i sicrhau bod y prosiect yn mynd rhagddo, mae'n amlwg nad yw cwmnïau cynhenid o dan unrhyw fath o anfantais. Gan hynny, gwrthodaf welliant 1 Jocelyn Davies, a gwelliant 3 Jonathan Morgan, y mae'r ddau ohonynt yn ymddangos eu bod yn galw am lai o gymorth i fewnfuddsoddwyr. Mae'n ymddangos bod y ddau welliant wedi'i seilio ar gamddealltwriaeth sylfaenol o'r modd y mae cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol yn gweithredu.

Dylai Aelodau ymfalchïo yn ein record o ran denu mewnfuddsoddwyr i Gymru a'u cadw yma, gan fod hynny'n dangos ffydd mawr yn sgiliau ein gweithlu ac yn ein heconomi. Rhai o'r llwyddiannau a gafwyd yn y maes hwn yn ddiweddar yw Simsmetal, sydd dan berchnogaeth Awstralaidd, a gododd waith ailgylchu oergelloedd mawr cyntaf y DU yng Nghasnewydd; Tillery Valley Foods Cyf, sydd dan berchnogaeth Ffrengig, ac sydd eisoes yn gyflogwr o bwys yn Abertyleri ac yn creu 100 yn rhagor o swyddi newydd, a hefyd y cwmni papur hirsefydlog a mawr ei barch Georgia Pacific (GB) Cyf ger Maesteg yn etholaeth Janice Gregory, yr oeddwn yn falch iawn o ymweld ag ef pan wnaed cyhoeddiad o gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol ar ei gyfer y llynedd.

Rhai o'r llwyddiannau eraill yw cyfleuster

web-hosting facility in Cardiff bay, which is adding a further 200 well-paid jobs to its existing base of around 130 employees. It is the first major data centre in Wales and should give a major boost to e-commerce throughout the country.

The list of projects facilitated by RSA support is long and varied. It includes the like of Norgine in Hengoed, as well as Provalis and Faurecia in Flintshire, Wholebake Foods Ltd in Denbighshire, and Bluestone in Pembrokeshire, which should give a major boost to tourism in Wales, as well as creating 600 much-needed jobs.

There is a good spread of projects across the whole of Wales, and therefore I reject Jonathan Morgan's amendment 2, which cites disproportionate geographic demand and calls for a better geographical spread of projects. This ignores the fact that we are obliged by EU rules to restrict the scheme's operation to assisted areas only. It also ignores the fact that demand is naturally higher in areas where there is the greatest density of registered companies.

I also reject Jocelyn Davies's amendment 5 regarding the fall in manufacturing jobs. The drift of low-cost manufacturing to the cheaper labour markets of eastern Europe and the far east is a problem common not just to Wales and the UK but to much of western Europe, especially in these difficult times for the global economy.

It is misleading to look at manufacturing in isolation, as employment in Wales has risen by 61,000 over the year to December. The rise in employment rates in Wales is higher than for any other UK region.

Elin Jones: A ydych yn barod i gydnabod y bu dros hanner y twf mewn cyflogaeth yng Nghymru ers 1999 yn y sector cyhoeddus a bod hynny'n dangos diffyg cynaliadwyedd yn y sector busnes? Ni allwn adeiladu ein heconomi ar sail twf mewn cyflogaeth yn y sector cyhoeddus yn unig. Mae colled net o 41,000 swyddi yn yr union sector sy'n cynhyrchu elw, sef gweithgynhyrchu.

cynnal gwe BT Ignite ym mae Caerdydd, sy'n ychwanegu 200 yn rhagor o swyddi â chyflog da at ei sylfaen bresennol o tua 130 o weithwyr. Hi yw'r ganolfan ddata fawr gyntaf yng Nghymru a dylai roi hwb mawr i e-fasnach ledled y wlad.

Mae'r rhestr o brosiectau a hwyluswyd drwy gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol yn un hir ac amrywiol. Mae'n cynnwys rhai fel Norgine yn Hengoed, yn ogystal â Provalis a Faurecia yn Sir y Fflint, Wholebake Foods Cyf yn Sir Ddinbych, a Bluestone yn Sir Benfro, a ddylai roi hwb mawr i dwristiaeth yng Nghymru, yn ogystal â chreu 600 o swyddi y mae eu mawr angen.

Mae amrywiaeth dda o brosiectau ledled Cymru gyfan ac felly gwrthodaf welliant 2 Jonathan Morgan, sy'n cyfeirio at alw daearyddol anghymesur ac yn galw am rannu prosiectau'n well yn ddaearyddol. Mae hyn yn anwybyddu'r ffaith bod rheolau'r UE yn ein gorfodi i roi'r cynllun ar waith mewn ardaloedd a gynorthwyir yn unig. Mae hefyd yn anwybyddu'r ffaith bod y galw yn siŵr o fod yn uwch mewn ardaloedd lle y mae'r crynhoad mwyaf o gwmnïau cofrestredig.

Yr wyf hefyd yn gwrthod gwelliant 5 Jocelyn Davies ynghylch y gostyngiad yn nifer y swyddi gweithgynhyrchu. Mae'r duedd i weithgynhyrchu cost-isel symud i'r marchnadoedd llafur rhatach yn nwyrain Ewrop a'r dwyrain pell yn broblem sy'n gyffredin nid yn unig i Gymru a'r DU ond i lawer o orllewin Ewrop, yn enwedig yn y cyfnod anodd hwn i'r economi fyd-eang.

Camarweiniol yw edrych ar weithgynhyrchu ar wahân, gan fod cyflogaeth yng Nghymru wedi codi o 61,000 dros y flwyddyn hyd at fis Rhagfyr. Mae'r cynnydd yn y cyfraddau cyflogaeth yng Nghymru yn fwy nag mewn unrhyw ranbarth arall yn y DU.

Elin Jones: Are you willing to acknowledge that since 1991 over half of the growth in employment in Wales has been in the public sector and that that reflects a lack of sustainability in the business sector? We cannot build our economy on the basis of an increase in employment in the public sector alone. Some 41,000 jobs have been lost in the very sector that makes a profit, namely

manufacturing.

Andrew Davies: I expected a question on this so I did some research on it. According to the Labour Force Survey, in 1997 the number of people employed in the public sector was just under 325,000 and in 2002 it was just under 359,000. The figure has declined; public sector employment peaked in 2000. Therefore, the proportion of the workforce employed in the public sector at the beginning of the period is virtually identical to that employed at the end. The manufacturing base was decimated in the early 1980s. I have made that point several times, and I know that the Conservatives do not like to hear it. I will give you some figures. Employment in manufacturing has been in decline not only in Wales, but throughout the UK. Alun Cairns will not like hearing that between 1979-80 and 1982-83—the first four years of Conservative Government and of Mrs Thatcher's regime—there was an annual net decline of 22,500 in those employed in manufacturing. It is misleading to say that there has only been a decline in recent years.

Alun Cairns: The Minister referred to the first four years of Conservative Government from 1979 onwards. I was not even at secondary school then, so I cannot accept responsibility for that figure, although I wish that the Minister would accept the responsibility of government now.

The Labour Force Survey figures, which I have in front of me now, show that 38,000 manufacturing jobs in the poorest areas of Wales were lost between November 1999 and November 2002. That is 24 per cent of the manufacturing workforce. The survey figures bear no relation to those given by the Minister. The blatant misuse of Assembly policies has prevented economic growth in those areas.

Andrew Davies: I am on record as accepting that there have been losses in manufacturing, which, in the last year, outweighed the job gain. I have said consistently that that has been the case. However, that is not specific to

Andrew Davies: Yr oeddwn yn disgwyl cael cwestiwn am hyn felly gwneuthum ychydig o ymchwil iddo. Yn ôl yr Arolwg Gweithlu Llafur, yn 1997 ychydig yn llai na 325,000 a gyflogid yn y sector cyhoeddus ac yn 2002, ychydig yn llai na 359,000 a gyflogid. Mae'r ffigur wedi gostwng; yr oedd cyflogaeth yn y sector cyhoeddus ar ei uchaf yn 2000. Gan hynny, mae'r gyfran o'r gweithlu a gyflogid yn y sector cyhoeddus ar ddechrau'r cyfnod bron yr un fath â'r gyfran a gyflogir ar y diwedd. Drylliwyd y sylfaen gweithgynhyrchu ddechrau'r 1980au. Gwneuthum y pwynt hwnnw sawl gwaith, a gwn nad yw'r Ceidwadwyr yn hoffi'i glywed. Rhoddaf rai ffigurau i chi. Bu dirywiad yn y gyflogaeth mewn gweithgynhyrchu nid yn unig yng Nghymru, ond ledled y DU. Ni fydd yn dda gan Alun Cairns glywed bod dirywiad net blynyddol o 22,500 yn y nifer a gyflogid mewn gweithgynhyrchu rhwng 1979-80 a 1982-83—pedair blynedd cyntaf Llywodraeth Geidwadol Mrs Thatcher. Camarweiniol yw dweud mai ond yn y blynyddoedd diweddar y bu dirywiad.

Alun Cairns: Cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog at bedair blynedd cyntaf y Llywodraeth Geidwadol o 1979 ymlaen. Nid oeddwn hyd yn oed yn yr ysgol uwchradd bryd hynny, felly ni allaf dderbyn cyfrifoldeb am y ffigur hwnnw, er y byddai'n dda gennyf pe byddai'r Gweinidog yn derbyn cyfrifoldeb llywodraeth yn awr.

Mae ffigurau'r Arolwg Gweithlu Llafur, sydd gennyf o'm blaen yn awr, yn dangos bod 38,000 o swyddi gweithgynhyrchu yn yr ardaloedd tlotaf yng Nghymru wedi'u colli rhwng Tachwedd 1999 a Thachwedd 2002. Dyna 24 y cant o'r gweithlu gweithgynhyrchu. Nid oes cysylltiad o gwbl rhwng ffigurau'r arolwg a'r rhai a roddodd y Gweinidog. Mae'r camddefnyddio amlwg ar bolisiau'r Cynulliad wedi atal twf economaidd yn yr ardaloedd hynny.

Andrew Davies: Yr wyf wedi dweud ar goedd fy mod yn derbyn bod colledion wedi bod mewn gweithgynhyrchu, a oedd, yn y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, yn fwy na'r nifer o swyddi a enillwyd. Yr wyf wedi dweud yn

Wales, Scotland, England and most European Union economies have been affected. However, the rate of decline and loss of manufacturing jobs was much higher—and I have said this publicly—after Geoffrey Howe’s deflationary budget in 1981, which decimated Welsh manufacturing. I will not, therefore, take lessons on job losses in manufacturing from the Conservatives. In the first four years of the previous Conservative Government, the annual decrease was 22 per cent, which is a phenomenal decrease.

The Assembly Government’s record of success is not confined to regional selective assistance. We have brought forward other initiatives with the aim of fine-tuning economic support to the needs of Wales. There is no better example of this than the highly successful Assembly investment grant; it has been an outstanding success since its introduction in April 2002. The grant is aimed at addressing the needs of our indigenous small and medium-sized enterprises, which are the engine house of our national economy. The scheme offers simplified, fast-track grants and, for the first time, a meaningful package of investment aid is available throughout Wales, including in non-assisted areas. As you would expect, the highest proportion of potential assistance is in the most economically deprived areas, but we have also ensured that grant-aid ceilings in all other areas are at the maximum level allowed by the European Union.

I therefore reject Jocelyn Davies’s amendment 4, which calls for a strategy to target support at Welsh indigenous businesses. We are already doing that, and with much success, through the various initiatives outlined in our economic strategy, ‘A Winning Wales’, such as the entrepreneurship action plan and through the Assembly’s investment grant scheme. The success of the AIG scheme has been such that it has surpassed all initial forecasts. In its first 11 months, no fewer than 328 offers of grant have been made, with a total value of almost £10.5 million. These grants are forecast to lever in £32 million in private sector

gyson ei bod felly. Fodd bynnag, nid Cymru yn unig sydd felly. Effeithiwyd ar yr Alban, Lloegr a’r rhan fwyaf o economïau’r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Er hynny, yr oedd cyfradd y dirywiad a’r colledion mewn swyddi gweithgynhyrchu yn uwch o lawer—ac yr wyf wedi dweud hyn ar goedd—ar ôl cyllideb ddatchwyddol Geoffrey Howe yn 1981, a ddinistriodd weithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru. Gan hynny, ni chymeraf wersi ar golledion swyddi mewn gweithgynhyrchu gan y Ceidwadwyr. Ym mhedair blynedd cyntaf y Llywodraeth Geidwadol flaenorol, y gostyngiad blynyddol oedd 22 y cant, sy’n ostyngiad syfrdanol.

Nid yw record llwyddiant Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gyfyngedig i gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol. Yr ydym wedi cyflwyno mentrau eraill gyda’r bwriad o fanwl gyweirio cymorth economaidd i fodloni anghenion Cymru. Nid oes gwell enghraifft o hynny na grant buddsoddi tra llwyddiannus y Cynulliad; bu’n eithriadol o lwyddiannus ers ei gyflwyno yn Ebrill 2002. Bwriad y grant yw ymdrin ag anghenion ein busnesau cynhenid bach a chanolig eu maint, sef peiriandy ein heconomi genedlaethol. Mae’r cynllun yn cynnig grantiau syml, drwy ddull carlam ac, am y tro cyntaf, mae pecyn ystyrllon o gymorth buddsoddi ar gael ledled Cymru, gan gynnwys ardaloedd nas cynorthwyr. Fel y disgwyliid, darperir y gyfran fwyaf o gymorth posibl yn yr ardaloedd mwyaf economaidd ddifreintiedig, ond yr ydym hefyd wedi sicrhau bod y terfynau uchaf ar gyfer cymorth grant yn yr holl ardaloedd eraill wedi’u gosod ar y lefel uchaf a ganiateir gan yr Undeb Ewropeaidd.

Gan hynny, gwrthodaf welliant 4 Jocelyn Davies, sy’n galw am strategaeth i dargedu cymorth ar fusnesau cynhenid Cymru. Yr ydym eisoes yn gwneud hynny’n llwyddiannus iawn drwy’r gwahanol fentrau a ddisgrifir yn ein strategaeth economaidd, ‘Cymru’n Ennill’, fel y cynllun gweithredu entrepreneuriaeth a thrwy gynllun grant buddsoddi’r Cynulliad. Gymaint fu llwyddiant cynllun grant buddsoddi’r Cynulliad fel ei fod wedi rhagori ar yr holl ragolygon gwreiddiol. Yn ei 11 mis cyntaf, cynigiwyd cynifer â 328 o grantiau, gyda gwerth cyfanswm o ymron i £10.5 miliwn. Rhagwelir y bydd y grantiau hyn yn codi £32

investment. Moreover, the grants have been well spread, with 149 in south-east Wales, 84 in mid and west Wales and 95 in north Wales.

The Assembly Government can be justifiably proud of its record in facilitating the growth and development of businesses throughout Wales. It is determined to continue that good work and to spearhead the further development of Wales into a modern world-class economy.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Proposers of amendments will have the usual five minutes in which to speak. I propose to limit other speakers to three minutes, which should enable us to include everyone and finish this debate by 4.30 p.m.

4.00 p.m.

Elin Jones: Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 1: dileu popeth ar ôl 'gwmnïau' ac ychwanegu

ond yn nodi bod llai na 35 y cant o gyllideb y cynllun cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol wedi'i dyrannu i gwmnïau cynhenid o Gymru ers mis Ebrill 2001.

Cynigiaf gwelliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn cydnabod yr angen am strategaeth sy'n targedu cymorth at gwmnïau cynhenid o Gymru sydd â'r potensial i dyfu.

Cynigiaf gwelliant 5. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn gresynu at y gostyngiad o 41,000 o swyddi net yn y sector gweithgynhyrchu ers mis Tachwedd 1999.

Croesawaf y ddadl hon; y mae'n un o'r ychydig gyfleoedd a gawsom, yn amser y Llywodraeth, i drafod datblygu economaidd. Nid oes amheuaeth fod cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol yn fecanwaith ariannol defnyddiol i gefnogi twf busnes, ac y gallai grant buddsoddi'r Cynulliad brofi i fod llawn mor ddefnyddiol.

miliwn o fuddsoddiad gan y sector preifat. At hynny, mae'r grantiau wedi'u gwasgaru'n wastad ac yn eang, gyda 149 yn y Ddeddwyrain, 84 yn y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin a 95 yn y Gogledd.

Mae gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad le i ymfalchïo yn ei record o ran hwyluso twf a datblygiad busnesau ledled Cymru. Mae'n benderfynol o barhau â'r gwaith da hwnnw ac i arwain yn yr ymgyrch i ddatblygu Cymru ymhellach yn economi fodern o'r radd flaenaf.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Caiff y rhai sy'n cynnig gwelliannau bum munud i siarad, yn ôl yr arfer. Bwriadaf gyfyngu siaradwyr eraill i dri munud, a thrwy hynny dylem allu cynnwys pawb a gorffen y ddadl hon erbyn 4.30 p.m.

Elin Jones: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 1: delete all after 'companies' and insert

but notes that less than 35 per cent of the RSA budget since April 2001 has been awarded to Welsh indigenous companies.

I propose amendment 4. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

recognises the need for a strategy that targets support to Welsh indigenous companies with growth potential.

I propose amendment 5. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

regrets the fall in net employment of 41,000 in the manufacturing sector since November 1999.

I welcome this debate; it is one of the few opportunities that we have had to discuss economic development in Government time. There is no doubt that RSA is a useful financial mechanism to support business growth, and that the Assembly investment grant could prove to be as equally useful.

Fodd bynnag, mae diffygion yn y drefn bresennol. Yn gyntaf, mae gormod o sefydliadau cyhoeddus yn ymwneud â busnes ac yn cynnig cymorth o wahanol fathau. Mae busnesau'n gorfod cysylltu â swyddog o'r Cynulliad os oes ydynt am gael RSA; cysylltu â'r WDA os ydynt am ddefnyddio RSA ar gyfer uned ddatblygu; cysylltu ag ELWa ar gyfer hyfforddiant, a chysylltu â llywodraeth leol i gael grantiau llai ar gyfer marchnata ac yn y blaen. Rhaid iddynt hefyd gysylltu â Cyllid Cymru a Chyswllt Busnes. Er bod rhain i gyd yn perthyn i'r sector cyhoeddus, mae busnesau'n gorfod delio gyda phedwar neu bum swyddog gwahanol i drafod un cynllun datblygu.

Mae'n ddrwg gennyf ddweud fy mod, ar sawl achlysur, wedi clywed cwynion gan fusnesau am y diffyg cydweithio rhwng swyddogion y gwahanol sefydliadau cyhoeddus hyn. Yn achlysurol, mae croes-dynnu rhwng y swyddogion.

Erbyn hyn, mae'r Cynulliad, drwy'r twf yn RSA a thrwy gyflwyniad grant buddsoddi'r Cynulliad, yn ymwneud fwyfwy â busnes yn uniongyrchol. Cyn hir, bydd yn rhaid i ni ofyn a oes angen i'r Cynulliad, WDA a llywodraeth leol ymwneud â busnes yn uniongyrchol. Oni ddylid sianelu'r cymorth drwy un pwynt? Dyna fyddai orau i fusnes a dyna beth yw bwriad y sector: i ddarparu gwasanaethau i fusnes mewn modd effeithiol i'w galluogi i dyfu a datblygu.

Gwendid mawr arall y system bresennol yw'r diffyg hyblygrwydd i gwrdd ag anghenion penodol busnesau unigol. Mae gan y sector cyhoeddus res hir o fentrau, ond yn aml, nid ydynt yn cyd-fynd â'r hyn sydd ei angen ar fusnes. Dim ond ychydig dros 20 o gwmnïau Cymreig sydd wedi eu rhestru'n gyhoeddus. Rhaid i ni adeiladu ar sail ein cwmnïau cynhenid er mwyn sicrhau cynaliadwyedd economaidd ein gwlad.

Mae angen rhaglen benodol ar gyfer cwmnïau Cymreig sy'n medru profi eu gallu i dyfu a chreu swyddi dros gyfnod. Dylai'r sector cyhoeddus ddarparu cefnogaeth iddynt yn ôl eu hanghenion unigol. Nid yw raglen benodol o'r fath yn bodoli ar hyn o bryd. Mae

However, there are deficiencies in the current system. First, there are too many public bodies dealing with business and offering assistance of various kinds. Businesses must contact an Assembly official if they want RSA; the Welsh Development Agency if they want to use RSA for a development unit; ELWa for training; and local government to get smaller grants for marketing and so on. They must also contact Finance Wales and Business Connect. Even though all these are in the public sector, businesses have to deal with four or five different officials to discuss one development scheme.

I am sorry to say that I have, on several occasions, heard complaints from businesses about the lack of co-operation between officials in these various public organisations. On occasion, officials are at cross purposes.

By now, the Assembly, through the growth in RSA and the introduction of the Assembly investment grant, is increasingly dealing with business directly. We will soon have to ask whether the Assembly, the WDA and local government need to deal directly with business. Should assistance not be channelled through a single point? That is what would be best for business and that is the public sector's aim: to effectively provide services to business, enabling them to grow and develop.

Another significant weakness in the current system is the lack of flexibility to meet the specific needs of certain businesses. There is a long list of initiatives in the public sector, but they often do correspond to businesses' needs. Only a little over 20 per cent of Welsh companies are publicly listed. We must build on the foundation of our indigenous businesses to ensure the economic sustainability of our country.

We need a specific programme for Welsh companies that can prove their ability to grow and create jobs over time. The public sector should provide them with support according to their individual needs. No such programme exists at the moment. We need to

angen troi'r system ar ei ben er mwyn cwrdd ag anghenion yr union gwmnïau a fydd yn medru datblygu a chreu twf yn yr economi Gymreig.

Drwy ddull o'r fath, fe fyddem yn medru gwyrddroi'r sefyllfa bresennol, sy'n gwbl anghynaliadwy gan fod llai na 35 y cant o gyllideb RSA wedi mynd i gwmnïau Cymreig dros y ddwy flynedd diwethaf. Mae dros 65 y cant o'r elw a ddeilliwyd o RSA wedi gadael Cymru, gan fod y cwmnïau wedi'u cofrestru y tu allan i Gymru.

Nid yw'r ffigurau a ddefnyddiwyd gan y Torïaid yng ngwelliant 3 yn ddilys bellach. Mae ffigurau mwy diweddar ar gael. Felly, pleidleisiwn yn erbyn gwelliant 3 ac o blaid ein gwelliant ni, sy'n cynnwys y ffigurau cywir. Fodd bynnag, cefnogwn welliant 2 gan fod diffyg cydbwysedd daearyddol o ran sut y dyrennir RSA. Mae tuedd amlwg i ddyrannu RSA ar hyd coridor yr M4. Yr wyf yn synnu mai'r Torïaid a gyflwynodd gwelliant 2. Efallai, o'r diwedd, eu bod yn dechrau cydnabod yr angen am dargedau rhanbarthol ar gyfer creu swyddi a datblygu economaidd.

Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw effaith y grant ar gynaliadwyedd a thwf busnesau Cymreig, nid faint o arian sy'n cael ei wario ar RSA, sef yr hyn y mae'r Gweinidog yn hoffi ei bwysleisio. Rhaid sicrhau bod yr effaith honno'n cyffwrdd â phob cymuned yng Nghymru, yn enwedig y rhai mwyaf anghenus o fewn ardal Amcan 1. Rhaid sicrhau hefyd fod cyfran o RSA yn cefnogi strategaeth o fuddsoddi mewn busnesau Cymreig.

Alun Cairns: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Amendment 2: create a new point:

regrets the disproportionate geographic demand for regional selective assistance support and calls on the Assembly Government to stimulate quality projects in all parts of Wales.

I propose amendment 3. Create a new point:

turn the system on its head to meet the needs of the very companies that can develop and create growth in the Welsh economy.

Through such an approach, we could transform the current situation, which is completely unsustainable given that less than 35 per cent of RSA funding has gone to indigenous Welsh companies over the last two years. Over 65 per cent of the profit resulting from RSA has left Wales, because the companies are registered outside Wales.

The figures used by the Tories in amendment 3 are out of date. More recent figures are available. Therefore, we will vote against amendment 3 and in favour of our amendment, which includes the correct figures. However, we will support amendment 2 because there is a lack of geographical balance in terms of how RSA is allocated. There is an obvious tendency to allocate RSA along the M4 corridor. I am surprised that amendment 2 was tabled by the Tories. Perhaps, at last, they are beginning to acknowledge the need for regional targets for job creation and economic development.

What is important is the grant's impact on the sustainability and growth of business in Wales, not how much money is spent on RSA, which is what the Minister likes to emphasise. We must ensure that that impact touches every community in Wales, especially the communities within the Objective 1 area that need it most. We must also ensure that a percentage of RSA supports an investment strategy in indigenous Welsh businesses.

Alun Cairns: Cynigïaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu pwynt newydd;

yn gresynu at y ffaith bod y galw daearyddol am gymorth o dan y cynllun cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol yn anghymesur, ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i ysgogi prosiectau o ansawdd ym mhob rhan o Gymru.

Cynigïaf gwelliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd:

agrees to investigate why indigenous business received only 28 per cent of last year's regional selective assistance spend when the cost per job ratio offers better value for money for the tax payer.

yn cytuno i ymchwilio i weld pam mai 28 y cant yn unig o'r gwariant o dan y cynllun cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol a gafodd busnesau cynhenid y llynedd, pan fo'r gymhareb cost fesul swydd yn cynnig gwell gwerth am arian i'r trethdalwr.

I welcome today's debate on the Assembly Government's key economic levers in job creation. It is an opportunity to highlight the worrying state of the economy and to reflect on the progress, or lack of it, that the Assembly Government has made over the last four years. I also wish to pursue the £30 million RSA payment that appears to have been made in error—an issue that the Minister is clearly avoiding addressing in the written Assembly questions to which I referred in my point of order earlier today. There is no doubt that Assembly Government spin is aimed at fooling the electorate with regard to our economic position. The Minister's desperation is demonstrated by his reference to the UK Government of 23 years ago, which had a better record in manufacturing than he has. If he wishes to go back further, the preceding Government had to go to the International Monetary Fund to bail out a bankrupt United Kingdom. The reality is that we have never been so poor in comparison to England. The GDP per capita, or wealth gap, is at its widest since records began—it is now down to 80 per cent of the UK average. Full time earnings are down to 86 per cent of the UK average, compared to more than 90 per cent in 1997, and overall earning is only 77 per cent of the UK average—

Croesawaf y ddadl heddiw ar brif offer economaidd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer creu swyddi. Mae'n gyfle i dynnu sylw at bryder ynghylch cyflwr yr economi ac i fyfyrto ynghylch y cynnydd, neu ddiffyg cynnydd, a wnaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad dros y pedair blynedd diwethaf. Yr wyf hefyd yn dymuno trafod y taliad cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol o £30 miliwn yr ymddengys ei fod wedi'i wneud drwy gamgymeriad—mater y mae'n amlwg bod y Gweinidog yn osgoi ymdrin ag ef yn y cwestiynau Cynulliad ysgrifenedig y cyfeiriais atynt yn fy mhwynt o drefn yn gynharach heddiw. Nid oes dwywaith nad bwriad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad drwy ei sbin yw twyllo'r etholwyr mewn cysylltiad â'n sefyllfa economaidd. Gwelir mor fain yw hi ar y Gweinidog drwy ei gyfeiriad at Lywodraeth y DU 23 blynedd yn ôl, yr oedd ei record ar weithgynhyrchu'n well na'i un ef. Os carai fynd yn ôl ymhellach, bu'n rhaid i'r Llywodraeth flaenorol fynd ar ofyn y Gronfa Ariannol Ryngwladol i achub y Deyrnas Unedig rhag methdaliad. Y gwir yw na fuom erioed cyn dlotod mewn cymhariaeth â Lloegr. Mae'r CMC y pen, neu'r bwllch cyfoeth, ar ei fwyaf ers dechrau'i gofnodi—mae wedi gostwng bellach i 80 y cant o gyfartaledd y DU. Mae enillion amser-llawn wedi gostwng i 86 y cant o gyfartaledd y DU, o'i gymharu â mwy na 90 y cant yn 1997, ac nid yw'r enillion cyffredinol ond yn 77 y cant o gyfartaledd y DU—

David Davies: Does the Member believe that the situation would have been better during the 1980s had we nationalised every business in sight, pulled out of the European Union and joined some kind of confederation with the Soviet Union, which was the Labour Party's policy in 1983?

David Davies: A yw'r Aelod yn credu y buasai'r sefyllfa'n well yn ystod y 1980au pe byddem wedi gwladoli pob busnes o fewn golwg, wedi tynnu allan o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd ac wedi ymuno â rhyw fath o gydffederasiwn â'r Undeb Sofietaidd, sef polisi'r Blaid Lafur yn 1983?

Alun Cairns: I am grateful for that question, David, because it highlights that the Assembly Government has made some progress in recognising the success of Conservative economic policies. It is a shame

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cwestiwn hwnnw, David, gan ei fod yn tynnu sylw at y ffaith bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi gwneud rhywfaint o gynnydd o ran cydnabod llwyddiant polisiau economaidd

that the Assembly Government does not follow them with the same enthusiasm as the UK Government in Westminster. It is my judgment that GDP and average earnings are two of the most important measurements of progress. However, what about the Assembly Government's own targets, which are its measures of progress? In 'BetterWales.com', the Government stated that it would create 34,000 jobs in west Wales and the Valleys. The Minister's answers in the Economic Development Committee recently revealed that only 10,000 jobs had been created in west Wales and the Valleys. The Government's plan was to create 7,000 jobs from inward investment every year since 1998. It is again 10,000 jobs short of the net additional jobs that it should have created.

Much emphasis was also placed on the quality of jobs and the need to move away from low pay as a competitive advantage in Wales—a policy that was applauded by all parties. As a result, research and development spending became the target in 'BetterWales.com'. That was an opportunity for us to increase employment in this highly skilled, high value, highly regarded sector. 'BetterWales.com' committed the Assembly Government to doubling the percentage of total UK spending in research and development in Wales by March 2003. It is far from its goal. Instead of Wales's percentage of UK research and development spend increasing, it fell by 36 per cent, from £203 million to £136 million. That is a decrease, from 1.7 per cent of the UK spend to 1.1 per cent. That is the progress on the promises made in the many strategic documents launched when the Assembly was established four years ago.

The opportunity of unprecedented resources has been wasted. The opportunities of Objective 1, RSA, the Assembly investment grant and increased spending from Westminster have all been wasted. The way in which the economy has been managed is scandalous. The biggest scandal is the minuscule scale of funding for indigenous Welsh businesses. Professor Dylan Jones-Evans, who has been mentioned several times today, highlighted to a group of accountants

Ceidwadol. Mae'n drueni nad yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn eu dilyn mor frwdfrydig ag y mae Llywodraeth y DU yn San Steffan. Yn fy marn i, CMC ac enillion cyfartalog yw dau o'r mesuriadau pwysicaf o gynnydd. Fodd bynnag, beth am dargedau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ei hun, sef ei mesuriadau hi o gynnydd? Yn 'GwellCymru.com', dywedodd y Llywodraeth y byddai'n creu 34,000 o swyddi yn y Gorllewin a'r Cymoedd. Yr oedd atebion y Gweinidog yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn ddiweddar yn dangos mai dim ond 10,000 o swyddi a grewyd yn y Gorllewin a'r Cymoedd. Bwriad y Llywodraeth oedd creu 7,000 o swyddi drwy fewnffuddsoddi bob blwyddyn ers 1998. Unwaith eto, mae'n 10,000 o swyddi'n brin o'r swyddi ychwanegol net y dylai fod wedi'u creu.

Rhodddwyd llawer o bwyslais hefyd ar ansawdd swyddi a'r angen i symud oddi wrth dâl isel fel mantais gystadleuol yng Nghymru—polisi a ganmolwyd gan bob plaid. O ganlyniad i hynny, daeth gwariant ar ymchwil a datblygu'n darged yn 'GwellCymru.com'. Yr oedd hynny'n gyfle inni hybu cyflogaeth yn y sector hwn, sy'n un tra medrus, uchel ei werth a mawr ei barch. Yn 'GwellCymru.com', ymrwymodd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ddyblu'r ganran o gyfanswm y gwariant yn y DU ar ymchwil a datblygu yng Nghymru erbyn Mawrth 2003. Mae ymhell o'i nod. Yn hytrach na chodi, gostwng a wnaeth canran Cymru o wariant y DU ar ymchwil a datblygu o 36 y cant, o £203 miliwn i £136 miliwn. Gostyngiad yw hwnnw, o 1.7 y cant o wariant y DU i 1.1 y cant. Dyna'r cynnydd ar yr addewidion a wnaed yn y nifer fawr o ddogfennau strategol a lansiwyd pan sefydlwyd y Cynulliad bedair blynedd yn ôl.

Mae'r cyfle a gafwyd drwy'r adnoddau mwyaf erioed wedi mynd yn wastraff. Mae'r cyfleoedd a gafwyd drwy Amcan 1, cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol, grant buddsoddi'r Cynulliad a mwy o wariant gan San Steffan i gyd wedi'u gwastraffu. Mae'r modd y rheolwyd yr economi'n gywilyddus. Y gwarth mwyaf yw cyn lleied o gyllid a roddwyd i fusnesau cynhenid Cymru. Yn ddiweddar, gwnaeth yr Athro Dylan Jones-Evans, y bu sawl cyfeiriad ato heddiw, dynnu

recently that, of the £60 million RSA spend last year, only £17 million went to Welsh indigenous business—28 per cent, despite the fact that cost per job to the taxpayer is half that of foreign direct investment. As one who believes strongly in the principles of the free market, I recognise the importance of a balance between foreign direct investment and indigenous business. However, as a taxpayer, I recognise the better value offered by the expansion of Welsh business. That gives us the biggest bang for the buck.

sylw grŵp o gyfrifyddion at y ffaith mai dim ond £17 miliwn o'r £60 miliwn o gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol a wariwyd y llynedd a aeth i fusnes cynhenid yng Nghymru—28 y cant, er bod y gost fesul swydd i'r trethdalwr yn hanner yr hyn ydyw ar gyfer buddsoddi uniongyrchol o dramor. Fel un sy'n credu'n gryf yn egwyddorion y farchnad rydd, gwelaf bwysigrwydd cael cydbwysedd rhwng buddsoddi uniongyrchol o dramor a busnes cynhenid. Fodd bynnag, fel trethdalwr, cydnabyddaf y gwerth gwell a geir o ehangu busnesau Cymru. Hynny sy'n cael yr effaith fwyaf am yr arian.

4.10 p.m.

The Government has failed Wales in this regard. If there is a lack of quality projects coming forward in Wales compared to those coming through inward investment, then the Assembly Government needs to simulate demand from Welsh business and make clear the support that is available. Who would have thought that Ynys Môn, Merthyr Tydfil and Ceredigion would be at the bottom of the league table of RSA applications and offers made? They are some of our poorest communities and the businesses in those communities need to be stimulated to generate employment. I have not had the opportunity to highlight the scandal in relation to LG Semiconductors—

Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi gwneud cam â Chymru yn hyn o beth. Os yw nifer y prosiectau o ansawdd da a gyflwynir yng Nghymru'n brin o'i gymharu â'r rhai a ddaw drwy fewnfuddsoddi, dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad symbylu'r galw gan fusnes yng Nghymru ac egluro pa gymorth sydd ar gael. Pwy a dybiai mai Ynys Môn, Merthyr Tudful a Cheredigion a fyddai ar waelod y gynghrair o ran ceisiadau am gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol a'r cynigion a wnaed? Hwyl yw rhai o'n cymunedau tlotaf a rhaid symbylu'r busnesau yn y cymunedau hynny er mwyn creu cyflogaeth. Ni chefais gyfle i dynnu sylw at y sgandal ynghylch LG Semiconductors—

Peter Law: As you Tories are so concerned about these poor communities, would you like to reflect on what you did to poor communities in the 1980s when you closed all the collieries, and thousands of people were thrown out of work because of Tory policy? Would you like to reflect on the devastation that you caused, which we are still trying to get over? That is what the Minister is working on every day.

Peter Law: Gan eich bod chi'r Toriaid yn ymboeni gymaint am y cymunedau tlawd hyn, a hoffech fyfyrion ynghylch yr hyn a wnaethoch i gymunedau tlawd yn y 1980au pan wnaethoch gau'r holl lofeydd, a phan ddiswyddwyd miloedd o bobl oherwydd polisi Toriaidd? A hoffech fyfyrion ynghylch y distryw a achoswyd gennych, yr ydym yn dal i geisio ei ddatrys? Dyna'r hyn y mae'r Gweinidog yn gweithio arno bob diwrnod.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Alun Cairns, you will have an extra minute.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Alun Cairns, cewch funud ychwanegol.

Alun Cairns: I am grateful, Deputy Presiding Officer. I could not have timed that intervention any better if I had planned it. If Peter Law looked at the amount of RSA that was paid to Blaenau Gwent for the seven years before 1997 and for the six years since 1997 the additional funding that the

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar, Ddirprwy Lywydd. Ni allaswn amseru'r ymyriad hwnnw'n well na phe byddwn wedi'i gynllunio. Pe byddai Peter Law yn edrych ar y swm o gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol a dalwyd i Flaenau Gwent dros y saith mlynedd cyn 1997 a thros y chwe

Conservative Party pumped into Blaenau Gwent through RSA payments is quite staggering. It would be useful if he looked back at the record instead of making a rhetorical point.

The remaining 30 seconds give me an opportunity to highlight the issues in relation to LG Semiconductors. I hope that the Minister will say whether we have breached the European Commission state aid rules, as it appears that £30 million was paid to LG Semiconductors, a company that did not create any jobs in Wales. Will he tell us the dates of those payments and will he come clean and give us all the information instead of the fudge that he offered in response to written Assembly questions last week?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I remind Members that they now have three minutes each.

Delyth Evans: Yr wyf wedi edrych ar ystadegau'r cymorth rhanbarth dewisol a grantiau buddsoddiad y Cynulliad ar gyfer fy rhanbarth rhwng Ebrill a Rhagfyr 2002. Mae'n glir bod y ddau gynllun hyn yn gwneud cyfraniad pwysig i economi ac i gyfleoedd gwaith y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin drwy greu cannoedd o swyddi newydd a diogelu cannoedd yn rhagor. Mae nifer o lwyddiannau y gallwn gyfeirio atynt ond yr wyf am sôn am ddwy enghraifft benodol.

Yr oedd Elizabeth the Chef yn Aberystwyth wedi bygwth cau gyda cholled o 121 swydd ond, diolch i waith caled Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, grantiau cymorth rhanbarth dewisol a Chyllid Cymru, llwyddwyd i ddiogelu dyfodol y cwmni hwn a swyddi mwyafrif y gweithwyr.

Elin Jones: Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o lwyddiant y cynllun gyda Elizabeth the Chef ac yr ydym yn ymfalchïo yn hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'r cwmni yn ei chael yn anodd i dderbyn y taliadau gan fod biwrocratiaeth cymorth rhanbarth dewisol yn sylweddol. A gytunwch fod angen sicrhau bod yr arian yn cyrraedd y cwmnïau gyda datblygiadau fel hyn cyn gynted ag y bo modd, yn enwedig lle

blynedd ers 1997, gwelai fod y cyllid ychwanegol a bwmpiodd y Blaid Geidwadol i Flaenau Gwent drwy gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol yn eithaf syfrdanol. Byddai'n fuddiol pe bai'n edrych ar y record yn lle gwneud pwynt rhethregol.

Mae'r 30 eiliad sy'n weddill yn rhoi cyfle imi dynnu sylw at y materion sy'n ymwneud ag LG Semiconductors. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn dweud a ydym wedi torri rheolau'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd ar gymorth gwladol, gan ei bod yn ymddangos bod £30 miliwn wedi'i dalu i LG Semiconductors, cwmni na chreodd unrhyw swyddi yng Nghymru. A wnaiff roi gwybod inni am ddyddiadau'r taliadau hynny ac a wnaiff gyfaddef y cwbl a rhoi'r holl wybodaeth i ni yn hytrach na'r lol a gynigiodd mewn ymateb i gwestiynau Cynulliad ysgrifenedig yr wythnos diwethaf?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf yn atgoffa Aelodau mai tair munud yr un sydd ganddynt yn awr.

Delyth Evans: I have looked at the RSA and Assembly investment grant statistics for my region from April to December 2002. It is obvious that these two schemes make an important contribution to the economy and to employment opportunities in mid and west Wales by creating hundreds of new jobs and safeguarding hundreds more. There are many successes to which I could refer, but I will mention two specific examples.

Elizabeth the Chef in Aberystwyth had threatened to close with the loss of 121 jobs but, thanks to the hard work of the Welsh Development Agency, RSA grants and Finance Wales, the future of this company and the majority of the jobs were safeguarded.

Elin Jones: I am aware of the scheme's success in assisting Elizabeth the Chef and we are pleased about that. However, the company has had difficulty in obtaining payments as RSA entails a great deal of bureaucracy. Do you agree that we need to ensure that the funding reaches the companies as soon as possible in such cases, especially where the managers are trying to

mae'r rheolwyr yn ceisio prynu'r cwmni?

buy the company?

Delyth Evans: Cytunaf, ond yr wyf hefyd yn meddwl ei fod yn bwysig i bobl dderbyn bod yn rhaid rhoi sicrwydd i'r cynllun busnes a dangos y gwerir yr arian yn gyfrifol pan roddir arian cyhoeddus i gwmnïau o'r fath. Rhaid i bobl dderbyn bod proses y mae'n rhaid iddynt ei dilyn er mwyn cael mynediad i'r arian hwn.

Delyth Evans: I agree, but I also believe that it is important for people to accept that assurances must be given on the business plan and it must be shown that money is being spent responsibly when public money is given to such companies. People must accept that there is a process that they must follow in order to access these funds.

Heddiw, fe welais ddatganiad gan y WDA bod cwmni cyflenwadau swyddfa, Mr-Office.com, yn creu 32 o swyddi newydd ym Machynlleth, eto gyda chefnogaeth grant buddsoddiad y Cynulliad. Llongyfarchaf y WDA am ddarparu uned fodern bwrpasol i weddu ag anghenion cwmni o'r fath. Fel Aelod Cynulliad yr wyf wedi ymweld â chwmnïau ar draws fy rhanbarth, o Aberhonddu i Aberystwyth, a dim ond canmoliaeth o'r Gweinidog a'r asiantaethau yr ydwyf i yn ei glywed—[*Chwerthin.*]

Today, I saw a statement from the WDA that an office supplies company, Mr-Office.com, is creating 32 new jobs in Machynlleth, again with the support of the Assembly investment grant. I congratulate the WDA for providing a modern unit, appropriate for the needs of such a company. As an Assembly Member I have visited companies throughout my region, from Brecon to Aberystwyth, and I hear only praise for the Minister and the agencies—[*Laughter.*]

Yr wyf yn dweud y gwir, Alun; ni fyddwn yn ei ddweud pe na bai'n wir.

I am telling the truth, Alun; I would not say it unless it were true.

Clywaf ganmol am yr asiantaethau—y WDA ac ELWa—am y gefnogaeth mae cwmnïau wedi ei derbyn i sicrhau llwyddiant eu busnesau. Dyfynnaf ddwy enghraifft o'r deufis diwethaf, Brecon Foods Ltd yn Aberhonddu a Rachel's Dairy yn Aberystwyth, dau gwmni a allasai fod wedi adleoli oherwydd llwyddiant eu busnes a'r pellter oddi wrth eu marchnadoedd. Maent wedi penderfynu ac maent yn parhau'n bendant eu bod am aros yng Nghymru, yn rhannol oherwydd y gefnogaeth a gânt drwy grantiau, drwy'r WDA a thrwy'r Cynulliad. Dyna beth y maent yn ei ddweud wrthyf. Nid sbin yw hyn, Alun; dyma beth mae'r bobl uchaf yn y cwmnïau hyn yn ei ddweud wrthyf fel Aelod o'r Cynulliad.

I hear praise for the agencies—the WDA and ELWa—for the support that companies have received to ensure the success of their business. To quote two examples from the last two months, Brecon Foods Ltd in Brecon and Rachel's Dairy in Aberystwyth are two companies that could have relocated because of the success of their business and their distance from their markets. However, they decided and they remain certain that they want to stay in Wales, partly because of the support that they receive from grants, the WDA, and the Assembly. That is what they tell me. This is not spin, Alun; this is what the most senior people in these companies are telling me as an Assembly Member.

Alun Cairns: A ydych yn awgrymu ein bod yn cynnal cystadleuaeth rhwng y gymeradwyaeth y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei derbyn a'r cwynion yr wyf fi yn eu derbyn bron pob wythnos ynglŷn â'r problemau gyda chymorth dewisol rhanbarthol?

Alun Cairns: Are you suggesting that we have a competition between the praise that the Minister receives and the complaints that I receive almost every week on the problems with RSA?

Delyth Evans: Credaf y byddem i gyd yn derbyn bod problemau gyda biwrocratiaeth, ond y neges bwysicaf yw un o lwyddiant,

Delyth Evans: I believe that we would all accept that there are problems with bureaucracy, but the most important message

cynnydd a chefnogaeth i fusnesau ledled Cymru. Dyna'r neges sydd yn gorfod cael ei chyfleu o'n trafodaeth heddiw. Canmolaf y gwaith da sydd yn cael ei wneud, a chymeradwyaf waith y Gweinidog.

Mick Bates: I welcome this debate on the benefits brought by RSA and the Assembly investment grant, both of which have proved to be immensely useful in business development. The overall aim is to continue the increasing level of employment and to reduce economic inactivity, and both grants are part of that process. A previous speaker mentioned Mr-Office.com in Machynlleth, which I have visited. The people there welcome these grants, but they involve considerable bureaucracy, which we should not overlook. We should be aware of the fact that bureaucracy is a burden to those in business, and I look forward to the day when we establish a business impact group in Wales, to consider the impact of regulation and of obtaining grants for all businesses. This could be part of a portfolio to attract more businesses to develop in Wales.

As a small indigenous business, I have been touched today by the concerns of the Conservatives and of Plaid Cymru for such businesses. In running my business, one important factor for me was being able to access free advice. What did the Tories do? They cut it. They axed the free advisory service to farmers, and they then proceeded to cut the support to farmers by a quarter. How can we accept that they want to support indigenous businesses, when they wanted to get rid of them? It is rubbish.

Alun Cairns: I cannot believe the number of weak points in Mick Bates's argument. Does he forget the enterprise allowance scheme, which led to the establishment of thousands of small businesses, many of which are now medium-sized businesses, and some are even bigger than that?

Mick Bates: Is it a weak point that you took away a free advisory service to 22,000 businesses? Answer the point. You took it away. At least with these grants we have successfully reintroduced support. As I said,

is one of success, progress and support for businesses throughout Wales. That is the message that must be conveyed in our debate today. I praise the good work that is being done and I applaud the Minister's work.

Mick Bates: Croesawaf y ddadl hon ar y buddion a gafwyd o gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol a grant buddsoddi'r Cynulliad, y mae'r ddau ohonynt wedi profi'n dra defnyddiol wrth ddatblygu busnes. Y nod gyffredinol yw parhau â'r cynnydd yn y lefel o gyflogaeth a lleihau anweithgarwch economaidd, ac mae'r ddau grant yn rhan o'r broses honno. Cyfeiriodd siaradwr blaenorol at Mr-Office.com ym Machynlleth, yr ymwelais ag ef. Mae'r bobl yno'n croesawu'r grantiau hyn, ond maent yn golygu cryn fïwrocratiaeth, ac ni ddylem ddiystyru hynny. Dylem fod yn ymwybodol o'r ffaith bod biwrocratiaeth yn faich ar y rhai mewn busnes, ac edrychaf ymlaen at y dydd y sefydlwn grŵp effaith ar fusnes yng Nghymru, i ystyried yr effaith o reoleiddio a sicrhau grantiau ar bob busnes. Gallai hynny fod yn rhan o bortffolio i ddenu rhagor o fusnesau i ddatblygu yng Nghymru.

Fel un sy'n fusnes bach cynhenid, cyffyrddwyd â'm calon gan bryderon y Ceidwadwyr a Phlaid Cymru am fusnesau o'r fath. Wrth redeg fy musnes i, un ffactor pwysig i mi oedd gallu cael cyngor rhad ac am ddim. Beth a wnaeth y Torïaid? Gwnaethant ei dorri. Rhoesant derfyn ar y gwasanaeth ymgynghorol rhad ac am ddim i ffermwyr, ac wedyn aethant ymlaen i dorri'r cymorth i ffermwyr o chwarter. Sut y gallwn dderbyn eu bod am gynorthwyo busnesau cynhenid, a hwythau wedi dymuno cael gwared arnynt? Lol ydyw.

Alun Cairns: Mae'n anodd gennyf goelio bod cynifer o ddiffygion yn nadl Mick Bates. A anghofiodd y cynllun lwfans menter, a arweiniodd at sefydlu miloedd o fusnesau bach, y mae llawer ohonynt bellach yn fusnesau canolig eu maint, a rhai'n fwy na hynny?

Mick Bates: Ai diffyg yw eich bod chi wedi diddymu gwasanaeth ymgynghorol rhad ac am ddim i 22,000 o fusnesau? Atebwch y pwnt. Gwnaethoch ei ddiddymu. O leiaf ein bod ni wedi llwyddo i ailgyflwyno cymorth

this is part of a portfolio for ensuring genuine business support. At last, we have a free advisory service to the agricultural industry, namely Farming Connect. We also have a broad range of support in the form of Business Connect, and Finance Wales provides funding to support businesses. My colleague—with his strong point—almost destroyed many communities by removing the support to 22,000 indigenous businesses—

David Davies: Will the Member give way?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You are running over time, Mick; you must finish your speech.

Mick Bates: I will take your point later. In conclusion, these processes must provide a good monitoring service to show the cost of jobs created in particular areas, and a route map to help businesses to auto-access training for Objective 1 and Objective 3 applications. In this way, having restored the advisory service and having restored and introduced these grants, we can build a modern Welsh economy.

4.20 p.m.

Janice Gregory: Labour's record on economic achievement is strong: we have cut unemployment in Ogmores by 52 per cent since 1999; long term youth unemployment has been slashed by 70 per cent through the New Deal; the Chancellor of the Exchequer has cut income tax to 22p and introduced the minimum wage and working families tax credit—which benefits 1,977 families in Ogmores; projects in the Bridgend local authority area have benefited from more than £10.9 million in Objective 1 funding, and projects in the Rhondda Cynon Taf area have benefited from more than £26.9 million.

Alun Cairns: You highlighted the Objective 1 money that is being spent in Bridgend. Does it bother you that expenditure per head in Bridgend is almost the lowest in Wales?

Janice Gregory: I am sure that Objective 1

drwy'r grantiau hyn. Fel y dywedais, mae hyn yn rhan o bortffolio ar gyfer sicrhau cymorth gwirioneddol i fusnes. O'r diwedd, mae gennym wasanaeth ymgynghorol rhad ac am ddim i'r diwydiant amaethyddol, sef Cyswllt Ffermio. Mae gennym amrediad eang o gymorth hefyd ar ffurf Cyswllt Busnes, ac mae Cyllid Cymru yn darparu cyllid i gynorthwyo busnesau. Bu ymron i'm cyd-Aelod—gyda'i bwynt cryf—ddinistrio llawer o gymunedau drwy ddileu'r cymorth i 22,000 o fusnesau cynhenid—

David Davies: A wnaiff yr Aelod ildio?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae'ch amser wedi dod i ben, Mick; rhaid ichi orffen eich araith.

Mick Bates: Cymeraf eich pwynt yn ddiweddarach. I gloi, rhaid i'r prosesau hyn ddarparu gwasanaeth monitro da i ddangos cost y swyddi a greir mewn ardaloedd penodol, a map i helpu busnesau i gael eu hyfforddi'n awtomatig ar gyfer ceisiadau Amcan 1 ac Amcan 3. Drwy hynny, wedi adfer y gwasanaeth ymgynghorol ac adfer a chyflwyno'r grantiau hyn, gallwn adeiladu economi Gymreig fodern.

Janice Gregory: Mae'r record o gyflawniadau economaidd sydd gan Lafur yn gadarn: yr ydym wedi torri diweithdra yn Ogwr o 52 y cant er 1999; torrwyd diweithdra hirdymor ymysg pobl ifanc o 70 y cant drwy'r Fargen Newydd; mae Canghellor y Trysorlys wedi gostwng treth incwm i 22c ac wedi cyflwyno isafswm cyflog a chredyd treth i deuluoedd sy'n gweithio—sydd o fudd i 1,977 o deuluoedd yn Ogwr; mae prosiectau yn ardal awdurdod lleol Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr wedi cael mwy na £10.9 miliwn o gyllid Amcan 1, a phrosiectau yn ardal Rhondda Cynon Taf wedi elwa ar fwy na £26.9 miliwn.

Alun Cairns: Gwnaethoch dynnu sylw at yrian Amcan 1 sy'n cael ei wario ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr. A yw'r ffaith mai'r gwariant y pen ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr yw'r isaf bron yng Nghymru yn eich poeni?

Janice Gregory: Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y

funding in Bridgend will increase, at least by the next Assembly elections.

Since the Assembly's inception—*[Interruption.]* I would like some order please.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. There is far too much chatter. I do not mind people talking but I should not be able to hear them. I can hear about seven different conversations at the moment. That is not right.

Janice Gregory: Since the Assembly's inception in May 1999, 25 offers of RSA—worth nearly £13 million—have been made to projects whose actual or proposed locations are in my constituency. The aim is to lever in an extra £38.3 million of private investment to create 999 jobs and to safeguard a further 815 jobs. This figure does not include the support given to the Ford plant in Bridgend—one of the area's major employers. An RSA grant from the Assembly Government has supported 640 new jobs at the plant—highly skilled jobs for local people.

Our actions are making a difference. I have spoken to local people who are benefiting from Assembly Government assistance; they know beyond a shadow of a doubt that our job creation initiatives are delivering for them. It is disappointing, although not surprising, that the nationalists will not welcome the positive impact of these policies on the Welsh economy. We must, of course, strike a balance between supporting indigenous businesses and attracting inward investors. However, when I speak to workers at the Ford plant in Bridgend, the Georgia Pacific paper mills in the Llynfi valley, and the Lloyds TSB call centre in Pencoed—hundreds of people whose jobs have been supported by the Government's RSA grants—they are glad that this Assembly Government supports inward investment. That creates employment, builds a more prosperous local economy and provides a future for their families. When I speak to members of senior management at Ford and Sony, they are quick to impress on me their commitment, not only to the local workforce,

cyllid Amcan 1 ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr yn codi, erbyn etholiadau nesaf y Cynulliad o leiaf.

Ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad—*[Torri ar draws.]* Carwn gael rhywfaint o drefn, os gwelwch yn dda.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae gormod o lawer o fân siarad. Caiff pobl siarad ond ni ddylwn allu eu clywed. Gallaf glywed tua saith gwahanol sgwrs ar hyn o bryd. Nid yw hynny'n iawn.

Janice Gregory: Ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad ym Mai 1999, cynigiwyd 25 o grantiau cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol—gwerth bron £13 miliwn—i brosiectau sydd wedi'u lleoli, neu y bwriedir eu lleoli, yn fy etholaeth i. Y nod yw codi £38.3 miliwn o fuddsoddiad preifat i greu 999 o swyddi ac i ddiogelu 815 o swyddi ymhellach. Nid yw'r ffigur hwnnw'n cynnwys y cymorth a roddwyd i waith Ford ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr—un o brif gyflogwyr yr ardal. Mae grant cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cynnal 640 o swyddi newydd yn y gwaith hwnnw—swyddi tra medrus ar gyfer pobl leol.

Mae'r camau a gymerwn yn gwneud gwahaniaeth. Yr wyf wedi siarad â phobl leol sy'n elwa ar gymorth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad; gwyddant heb unrhyw amheuaeth fod ein mentrau creu swyddi'n dwyn ffrwyth yn eu hachos hwy. Mae'n peri siom, ond nid syndod, na wnaiff y cenedlaetholwyr groesawu effaith gadarnhaol y polisïau hyn ar economi Cymru. Wrth gwrs, rhaid inni ddal y ddysgl yn wastad rhwng cefnogi busnesau cynhenid a denu mewnfuddsoddwyr. Fodd bynnag, pan siaradaf â gweithwyr yng ngwaith Ford ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, melinau papur Georgia Pacific yng nghwm Llynfi, a chanolfan alwadau Lloyds TSB ym Mhen-coed—cannoedd o bobl y cynhaliwyd eu swyddi drwy grantiau cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol y Llywodraeth—maent yn falch bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad hwn yn cefnogi mewnfuddsoddi. Mae hynny'n creu cyflogaeth, yn adeiladu economi leol fwy ffyniannus ac yn cynnig dyfodol i'w teuluoedd. Pan siaradaf â rhai o'r uwch reolwyr yn ngweithfeydd Ford a Sony, maent am gyfleu imi'n syth eu hymrwymiad, nid yn

but also to indigenous businesses, with which they work in partnership and who, in turn, benefit from inward investment.

Thanks to this Labour Government's record investment in jobs and skills, and to the sound economic platform that we have established, unemployment is at its lowest for a generation. I will not say that we can sit back and call it a job well done; we cannot and we will not. There is a long way to go before Labour's commitment to full employment is met. However, we are well on the way.

Peter Law: Regional selective assistance and Assembly investment grants are two important tools that can be used to attract new industry and jobs to our communities. When Alun Cairns gave way earlier, he did not say that when RSA came in, labour-intensive companies and collieries went out—800 jobs were lost in every colliery. It also happened in the steel industry. That is the difference. If high technology replaces—

David Davies: Is it not the case that more coal mining jobs were lost in the early seventies under a Labour Government than were lost under the Conservative Government?

Peter Law: That is not what I said. I was talking about the 1980s—you need to listen to what I say.

We need to look carefully at the picture across Wales. We heard the Minister's comments about the fact that unemployment is down—as Janet also mentioned—and £1.7 billion has been spent, with 31,000 jobs created and many more safeguarded. That is important. I have seen the good work that has been carried out in my own area: at Tillery Valley Foods, and the Sofegi Filtration transfer, which took over the former Bosal factory, which suffered redundancies. We must recognise that there are pockets in Wales where the situation is not so good—in Blaenau Gwent, unfortunately, we still have high unemployment. With the closure of the steelworks last year, and 200 jobs under

unig i'r gweithlu lleol, ond hefyd i fusnesau cynhenid, y maent yn gweithio mewn partneriaeth â hwy ac sydd, yn eu tro, yn elwa ar fewnfuddsoddi.

Diolch i'r buddsoddiad mwyaf erioed gan y Llywodraeth Lafur hon mewn swyddi a sgiliau, ac i'r sylfaen economaidd gadarn yr ydym wedi'i gosod, mae diweithdra ar ei isaf ers cenhedlaeth. Ni ddywedaf y gallwn eistedd yn ôl a chanmol y gwaith a wnaed; ni allwn ac ni wnawn. Mae llawer i'w wneud eto cyn cyflawni ymrwymiad Llafur i gyflogaeth lawn. Er hynny, yr ydym wedi cyflawni llawer.

Peter Law: Mae cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol a grantiau buddsoddi'r Cynulliad yn ddau offeryn pwysig y gellir eu defnyddio i ddenu diwydiannau a swyddi newydd i'n cymunedau. Pan ildiodd Alun Cairns yn gynharach, ni ddywedodd fod cwmnïau llafurddwys a glofeydd wedi diflannu pan gyflwynwyd cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol—collwyd 800 o swyddi ym mhob glofa. Digwyddodd yn y diwydiant dur hefyd. Dyna'r gwahaniaeth. Os yw uwch-dechnoleg yn cymryd lle—

David Davies: Onid yw'n wir bod mwy o swyddi mewn glofeydd wedi'u colli ddechrau'r saith degau o dan Lywodraeth Lafur nag a gollwyd dan y Llywodraeth Geidwadol?

Peter Law: Nid hynny a ddywedais. Yr oeddwn yn sôn am y 1980au—dylech wrando ar fy ngeiriau.

Rhaid inni edrych yn ofalus ar y darlun ledled Cymru. Clywsom sylwadau'r Gweinidog am y ffaith bod diweithdra wedi gostwng—a sonidd Janet am hynny hefyd—a bod £1.7 biliwn wedi'i wario, gan greu 31,000 o swyddi a diogelu llawer mwy. Mae hynny'n bwysig. Gwelais y gwaith da a wnaed yn fy ardal i: yn Tillery Valley Foods, a throsglwyddo Sofegi Filtration, a gymerodd hen ffatri Bosal, lle y collwyd swyddi. Rhaid inni gydnabod bod mannau yng Nghymru lle nad yw'r sefyllfa gystal—ym Mlaenau Gwent, gwaetha'r modd, mae gennym ddiweithdra uchel o hyd. Wedi cau'r gwaith dur y llynedd, a'r bygythiad i 200 o swyddi yn Wyvern Furniture Cyf, mae llawer i'w

threat at Wyvern Furniture Ltd, there is still much more to be done. I ask the Minister and his team to concentrate further on those deprived and excluded areas. In fairness, I have no complaint about what he has done so far, but this matter needs special consideration, which is why I am speaking today. We not only need to secure jobs, but we need quality jobs, which are not always available in some of these communities. The jobs that we lost in steelworking, because of the Corus closures, as well as in the mining industry, were quality jobs.

It is important to look in future at the possibility, in places such as Blaenau Gwent, of the direction of industry. That would require UK legislation, but it needs to be considered. If we are to get through to the places where most of these jobs do not always reach, we need to take new initiatives. Finally, will the Minister consider something that is in his power, namely to create an enterprise zone in Blaenau Gwent? I have been impressed with the success of the few enterprise zones that we have in Wales. I asked the Minister's predecessor—the First Minister—to establish an enterprise zone in Blaenau Gwent, and there is still a case to be made for an enterprise zone in such areas, which has high unemployment as well as serious deprivation and exclusion. I hope that in our fight to bring in new jobs, to tackle the opportunities before us, and to create opportunities for our people, we will consider enterprise zones in future.

Brian Gibbons: One of the most remarkable achievements of the Welsh economy over recent years has been its ability to reduce unemployment to the lowest levels in a generation, as other Members have mentioned.

Alun Cairns: Will you give way?

Brian Gibbons: No, hold on for a minute. We have done that at a time when there has been a major recess in the United States, the crisis in the far east, stagnant growth in euroland, the events of 11 September, and the dotcom collapse. These developments have led to a significant reduction in the level of

wneud eto. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog a'i dîm ganolbwyntio ymhellach ar yr ardaloedd difreintiedig hynny sydd wedi'u hallgáu. Er tegwch, nid oes gennyf unrhyw gŵyn ynghylch yr hyn a wnaeth hyd yma, ond mae'r mater hwn yn galw am sylw arbennig, a dyna pam yr wyf yn siarad heddiw. Nid yn unig mae'n rhaid inni ddiogelu swyddi, ond mae arnom angen rhai o ansawdd da hefyd, ac nid yw'r rhain ar gael bob amser yn rhai o'r cymunedau hyn. Yr oedd y swyddi cynhyrchu dur a gollwyd, oherwydd cau gweithfeydd Corus, yn ogystal â'r rhai yn y diwydiant glo, yn rhai o ansawdd da.

Mae'n bwysig ystyried y posibilrwydd yn y dyfodol, mewn mannau fel Blaenau Gwent, o gyfarwyddo diwydiant. Byddai hynny'n gofyn deddfwriaeth ar gyfer y DU, ond rhaid ei ystyried. Os ydym i gyrraedd y mannau lle nad yw'r rhan fwyaf o'r swyddi hyn yn eu cyrraedd bob amser, rhaid inni gychwyn mentrau newydd. Yn olaf, a wnaiff y Gweinidog ystyried rhywbeth sydd yn ei allu, sef creu ardal fenter ym Mlaenau Gwent? Mae gennyf feddwl mawr o lwyddiant yr ychydig ardaloedd menter sydd gennym yng Nghymru. Gofynnais i ragflaenydd y Gweinidog—y Prif Weinidog—sefydlu ardal fenter ym Mlaenau Gwent, ac mae dadl o hyd dros gael ardal fenter mewn ardaloedd o'r fath, lle y mae diweithdra uchel yn ogystal ag amddifadedd ac allgáu difrifol. Yr wyf yn gobeithio, wrth ymladd i ennill swyddi newydd, i achub ar y cyfleoedd sydd ar gael i ni, ac i greu cyfleoedd ar gyfer ein pobl, y byddwn yn ystyried ardaloedd menter yn y dyfodol.

Brian Gibbons: Un o gyflawniadau hynotaf economi Cymru dros y blynyddoedd diweddar yw ei bod wedi gallu gostwng diweithdra i'r lefelau isaf mewn cenhedlaeth, fel y dywedodd Aelodau eraill.

Alun Cairns: A wnewch ildio?

Brian Gibbons: Na wnaf, arhoswch funud. Gwnaethom hynny ar adeg o ddirwasgiad mawr yn yr Unol Daleithiau, yr argyfwng yn y dwyrain canol, cynnydd marwaidd yn yr ewro-dir, digwyddiadau 11 Medi, a methiant cwmnïau'r we. Mae'r datblygiadau hyn wedi arwain at ostyngiad sylweddol ym maint y

foreign direct investment in Wales, which has been one of the most valuable motors for economic development and job creation. Despite this loss, there has continued to be a significant increase in job numbers. My constituency area of Neath Port Talbot has the fifth highest level of RSA grants in Wales, and the seventh highest level of Assembly investment grants.

When I saw that this debate had been tabled I rang several job support agencies in the Neath Port Talbot area to ask how they felt Assembly investment grants and RSA were working. The overall message I received was positive—AIG and RSA are working well. The Assembly investment grant, in particular, has been warmly welcomed, not least because of its rapid turnaround, and the fact that it was considerably less bureaucratic than RSA. However, there was concern about some slippage in the amount of time that it was taking recently to deal with AIGs. I also asked the job support agencies about their observations on why there was an apparent under-application by indigenous firms for the uptake of grants, as is noted in the Plaid Cymru and Conservative amendments. Their reply was that virtually every company that was eligible for support was receiving the level of support for which it was asking. They also said that the relatively low level of indigenous companies currently applying for RSA was a reflection of the level of new companies coming into the market, and was in no way representative of any discrimination against indigenous companies.

That is also borne out by the fact that, in the Neath Port Talbot area, we had the second highest increase in VAT registrations in 2001-02. That is clear evidence that AIG and RSA is working for our small and medium-sized enterprises. All is not well, however, and there is a feeling that RSA could be simplified. There is also concern that many people in our business community do not know about RSA and AIG, and there are some concerns about the quality of advice

buddsoddi uniongyrchol o dramor yng Nghymru, a fu'n un o'r sbardunau mwyaf gwerthfawr ar gyfer datblygu economaidd a chreu swyddi. Er gwaethaf y golled hon, bu cynnydd sylweddol a pharhaus yn nifer y swyddi. Ardal Castell-nedd Port Talbot yn fy etholaeth i yw'r bumed uchaf yng Nghymru o ran y lefel o grantiau cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol, a'r seithfed uchaf o ran lefel grantiau buddsoddi'r Cynulliad.

Pan welais fod y ddaidl hon wedi'i chyflwyno, ffoniais sawl asiantaeth cymorth swyddi yn ardal Castell-nedd Port Talbot i ofyn am eu barn ynghylch gweithrediad grantiau buddsoddi'r Cynulliad a chymorth rhanbarthol dewisol. Yr oedd y neges a gefais yn gadarnhaol at ei gilydd—mae grantiau buddsoddi'r Cynulliad a chymorth rhanbarthol dewisol yn gweithio'n dda. Bu croeso cynnes, yn benodol, i grant buddsoddi'r Cynulliad, a hynny'n anad dim am y gellir ei roi ar waith yn gyflym, a'r ffaith ei fod yn llai biwrocraidaidd o lawer na chymorth rhanbarthol dewisol. Er hynny, yr oedd pryder ynghylch oedi cyn delio â grantiau buddsoddi'r Cynulliad yn ddiweddar. Gofynnais i'r asiantaethau cymorth swyddi hefyd am sylwadau ynghylch pam yr oedd prinder ymddangosiadol yn y nifer o geisiadau am grantiau gan fusnesau cynhenid, fel y nodir yng ngwelliannau Plaid Cymru a'r Ceidwadwyr. Eu hateb oedd bod bron bob cwmni a oedd â hawl i gael cymorth yn derbyn y lefel o gymorth y gofynnai amdani. Dywedasant hefyd fod y nifer gymharol isel o gwmnïau cynhenid a oedd yn ymgeisio am gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol ar hyn o bryd yn adlewyrchiad o nifer y cwmnïau newydd yn y farchnad, ac nad oedd yn arwydd o gwbl o unrhyw wahaniaethu yn erbyn cwmnïau cynhenid.

Ategir hynny gan y ffaith mai gennym ni yn ardal Castell-nedd Port Talbot yr oedd y cynnydd ail uchaf yn y cofrestriadau TAW yn 2001-02. Mae hynny'n dystiolaeth amlwg bod grant buddsoddi'r Cynulliad a chymorth rhanbarthol dewisol yn diwallu anghenion ein busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint. Nid yw popeth fel y dylai fod, fodd bynnag, ac mae teimlad y gellid symleiddio cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol. Mae pryder hefyd fod llawer o bobl yn ein cymuned busnes na

available, particularly by some smaller private sector advisers.

wyddant am gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol a grant buddsoddi'r Cynulliad, ac mae rhai pryderon ynghylch ansawdd y cyngor sydd ar gael, yn enwedig gan rai cynghorwyr llai yn y sector preifat.

4.30 p.m.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Bu'r drafodaeth heddiw yn ddiddorol. Yr oeddwn yn rhyfeddu braidd fod Mick Bates wedi dewis ailadrodd datganiad enwog George Bush pan ddywedodd:

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Today's debate has been interesting. I was somewhat surprised that Mick Bates chose to repeat George Bush's famous statement when he said:

'I know about small businesses: I was one'.

Yr wyf yn gwybod am fusnesau bach: dyna a oeddwn i.

Credaf mai 'I am one' a ddywedodd Mick Bates ac yr hoffai nodi mai rhedeg busnes bach y mae yn hytrach na bodoli fel busnes bach. Mae gwahaniaeth, Mick.

I believe that Mick Bates said 'I am one' and that he would like it noted that he runs a small business rather than exists as a small business. There is a difference, Mick.

Mae'n ddiddorol clywed yr holl ystadegau sy'n cael eu taflu yn ôl ac ymlaen yn y drafodaeth. Tybiaf ein bod oll yn defnyddio ystadegau'r Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol; er bod Andrew Davies yn sôn am lwyddiant Llywodraeth y Cynulliad er 1999, mae eraill ohonom yn gweld y diffygion yn glir gan ddefnyddio'r un ystadegau. Efallai fod gwerth mewn atgoffa Andrew o'r hanes anffodus hwnnw am ystadegydd a foddodd mewn afon er mai dim ond chwe modfedd oedd dyfnder y dŵr ar gyfartaledd. Pe gallai ddeall hynny, efallai y gallai ddeall na ddylai ddefnyddio ystadegau unigol y tu allan i'w cyd-destun er mwyn ceisio cyfiawnhau ei bolisi. Bu £240 miliwn yn y gronfa hon ers Ebrill 2001. Felly, nid oes rhyfedd bod Delyth, Janice, Brian ac eraill yn darganfod cwmnïau unigol a elwodd o'r sefyllfa.

It is interesting to hear all the statistics being thrown back and forth in the debate. I suspect that we are all using statistics from the Office for National Statistics; although Andrew Davies spoke of the Assembly Government's success since 1999, others can clearly identify deficiencies using the very same statistics. It may be worth reminding Andrew of that unfortunate story about a statistician who drowned in a river even though the average depth of the water was only six inches. If he could understand that, he could perhaps understand that he should not use individual statistics out of their context in order to try to justify his policy. There has been £240 million in this fund since April 2001. Therefore, it is not surprising that Delyth, Janice, Brian and others can find individual companies that have benefited from the situation.

Trof yn ôl at fy mhwynt cyntaf. Pa ystadegau bynnag y mae Andrew yn dewis eu defnyddio, aeth dwy rhan o dair o'r cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol i gwmnïau y tu allan i Gymru. Pwysleisiaf hynny. Mae hefyd yn wir bod cwmnïau o Gymru yn fwy llwyddiannus wrth ddefnyddio'r arian—maent 50 y cant yn fwy cost effeithiol. Fodd bynnag, mae'r grantiau y maent yn eu derbyn ar gyfartaledd yn llai na'r rhai a gaiff cwmnïau o'r tu allan i Gymru—rhoddir £12,000 ar gyfartaledd i gwmnïau o Gymru a £18,000 i gwmnïau o'r

I will return to my first point. Whichever statistics Andrew chooses to use, two thirds of the RSA has gone to companies outside Wales. I emphasise that. It is also true that Welsh companies are more successful in their use of the funding—they are 50 per cent more cost effective. However, the grants that they receive are, on average, less than those paid to companies from outside Wales—£12,000 is given, on average, to companies from Wales and £18,000 to companies from outside Wales. Less than a third of the fund

tu allan. Aeth llai na thraean o'r gronfa i fusnesau bach. Gŵyr unrhyw un sy'n gwybod unrhyw beth am economi Cymru mai busnesau bach yw ei hasgwrn cefn. Pe bai gan y Gweinidog bolisi a chanddo gyfeiriad, byddai'n buddsoddi yn y cwmnïau bach hynny. Mae pentwr o ystadegau y gallwn eu taflu atoch, Andrew. Fodd bynnag, pe baech yn siarad â chwmnïau ledled Cymru, fe ddywedant eu bod yn ei chael yn anodd cael arian RSA a'i fod yn llai nag y bu. Gwaith y Gweinidog yw sicrhau bod y gronfa ar gael i fusnesau a'i bod yn rhwydd iddynt gael yr arian hwnnw.

The Minister for Economic Development (Andrew Davies): In my opening address, I referred to the record levels of grant and investment over the past two years that have been made possible by the RSA and AIG schemes. It is clear from comments made by the Conservatives and the nationalists that they have completely misunderstood how the system works. These are demand—

Cynog Dafis *rose*—

Andrew Davies: I have a limited amount of time.

These are demand-led measures and companies—be they Welsh-based companies, UK companies or overseas investors—must decide whether or not they wish to apply. The Assembly Government is putting record levels of funding into the schemes. We have made it clear that no worthwhile RSA or AIG application will be turned down because of lack of funding. It is quite misleading to say that there is a shortage of funding. I hope that Rhodri Glyn Thomas will consider that and withdraw his comment. I also refer to the fact that Wales is at the top of the UK league in terms of the level of investment support being offered to businesses. However, Assembly Government grants are only a part—

Rhodri Glyn Thomas *rose*—

Andrew Davies: I have a limited amount of

has gone to small businesses. Anyone who knows anything about the Welsh economy knows that small businesses are its backbone. If the Minister had a policy that had direction, he would invest in those small businesses. I could throw a mountain of statistics at you, Andrew. However, if you spoke to companies across Wales, they would tell you that they are finding it difficult to obtain RSA funding and that it is less than it used to be. It is the Minister's job to ensure that the fund is available to businesses and that it is easy for them to access that funding.

Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd (Andrew Davies): Yn fy anerchiad agoriadol, cyfeiriais at y lefelau uchaf erioed o grantiau a buddsoddi dros y ddwy flynedd diwethaf sydd wedi'u hwyluso drwy'r cynlluniau cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol a grant buddsoddi'r Cynulliad. Mae'n amlwg oddi wrth sylwadau a wnaed gan y Ceidwadwyr a'r cenedlaetholwyr eu bod wedi llwyr gamddeall dull gweithredu'r system. Cael eu harwain—

Cynog Dafis *a gododd*—

Andrew Davies: Mae'r amser sydd gennyf yn gyfyngedig.

Mesurau sy'n cael eu harwain gan y galw yw'r rhain ac mae'n rhaid i gwmnïau—boed hwy'n gwmnïau sydd wedi'u lleoli yng Nghymru neu'r DU, neu'n fuddsoddwyr tramor—benderfynu a ydynt yn dymuno ymgeisio ai peidio. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn rhoi mwy o arian yn y cynlluniau hyn nag erioed o'r blaen. Rhoesom ar ddeall na wrthodir yr un cais buddiol am gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol neu grant buddsoddi'r Cynulliad oherwydd diffyg cyllid. Cwbl gamarweiniol yw dweud bod prinder cyllid. Gobeithiaf y bydd Rhodri Glyn Thomas yn ystyried hynny ac yn tynnu ei sylw'n ôl. Cyfeiriaf hefyd at y ffaith mai Cymru sydd ar ben cynghrair y DU o ran y lefel o gymorth buddsoddi a gynigir i fusnesau. Er hynny, un rhan yn unig yw grantiau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad—

Rhodri Glyn Thomas *a gododd*—

Andrew Davies: Mae'r amser sydd gennyf

time.

Assembly Government grants are only a part—albeit an important part—of our approach to facilitating growth in Wales. We are also active in other areas, including developing a team Wales approach to business support. We are not saying that the system is perfect. However, in reply to the points that Brian Gibbons and Elin Jones made, we are always looking to provide a seamless, more co-ordinated approach. We will launch that with the business support process fairly soon. In terms of account management, we are working with the WDA, Education and Learning Wales, Finance Wales, the Wales Tourist Board and local authorities. As with the Bluestone project in Pembrokeshire, we will again respond with a Team Wales approach to RSA and other investment opportunities.

4.33 p.m.

I have acknowledged the slippage time, Brian, and, as I have said to the Economic Development Committee, one problem is that we have been overwhelmed by the scale of the demand, which shows that we are filling a gap in the market. We are employing more staff to deal with those applications.

On this hoary old chestnut of supporting indigenous companies, it is a 'little-Wales' approach—*y parti bach*. It is Wales for the Welsh. Are you serious that we should not give grants and other support to overseas investors, such as Ford Motor Company, General Dynamics UK Ltd, and British Aerospace in Broughton? Are we saying that we do not want to help companies that support us through direct employment as well as via their impact on the supply chain? Over 70 per cent of the grants offered so far this year have been to Welsh-based companies. Their value was lower, because Welsh-based companies tend to be smaller, but the number of offers made to them was far greater. It is up to companies to decide how much funding to apply for; we do not dictate that—we respond to grant applications. Clearly, the forces of conservatism on both sides of the Chamber do not understand how the system works.

yn gyfyngedig.

Un rhan yn unig yw grantiau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad—er eu pwysiced—o'n dull o hwyluso twf yng Nghymru. Yr ydym yn cymryd camau mewn meysydd eraill, ac mae hynny'n cynnwys datblygu dull tîm Cymru o gynnis cymorth i fusnes. Nid ydym yn dweud bod y system yn berffaith. Fodd bynnag, mewn ymateb i'r pwyntiau a wnaeth Brian Gibbons ac Elin Jones, yr ydym bob amser yn ceisio darparu dull gweithredu difwlch a mwy cydlynol. Byddwn yn lansio hynny gyda'r broses cymorth busnes cyn bo hir. O ran rheoli cyfrifon, yr ydym yn gweithio gyda'r WDA, Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru, Cyllid Cymru, Bwrdd Croeso Cymru ac awdurdodau lleol. Yn yr un modd â'r prosiect Bluestone yn Sir Benfro, ymatebwn eto drwy ddull Tîm Cymru o ymdrin â chymorth rhanbarthol dewisol a chyfleoedd eraill i fuddsoddi.

Yr wyf wedi cydnabod bod oedi, Brian, ac, fel y dywedais wrth y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, un broblem yw ein bod wedi cael ein llethu gan faint y galw, ac mae hynny'n dangos ein bod yn llanw bwlch yn y farchnad. Yr ydym yn cyflogi mwy o staff i ddelio â'r ceisiadau hynny.

Ynghylch yr hen syniad o gefnogi cwmnïau cynhenid, ymateb 'Cymru fach' ydyw—*y parti bach*. Cymru i'r Cymry ydyw. A ydych o ddifrif yn credu na ddylem roi grantiau a chymorth arall i fuddsoddwyr o dramor, fel Ford Motor Company, General Dynamics UK Cyf, a British Aerospace ym Mrychdyn? Ai dweud yr ydym nad ydym am helpu cwmnïau sy'n ein cynnal drwy gyflogaeth uniongyrchol yn ogystal â thrwy eu heffaith ar y gadwyn gyflenwi? Mae mwy na 70 y cant o'r grantiau hyd yma eleni wedi'u cynnig i gwmnïau sydd wedi'u lleoli yng Nghymru. Yr oedd eu gwerth yn llai, am fod cwmnïau sydd wedi'u lleoli yng Nghymru'n tueddu i fod yn llai, ond yr oedd nifer y cynigion iddynt yn fwy o lawer. Mater i gwmnïau yw penderfynu pa faint o gyllid y maent am ymgeisio amdano; nid ydym yn pennu hynny—yr ydym yn ymateb i geisiadau am grant. Mae'n amlwg nad yw grymoedd ceidwadaeth ar ddwy ochr y

Siambwr yn deall sut y mae'r system yn gweithio.

Peter Law, I can supply you with figures on regional selective assistance and Assembly investment grants. Further to your question about enterprise zones, I am more than happy to discuss that with you at the earliest opportunity.

Peter Law, gallaf ddarparu ffigurau i chi am gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol a grantiau buddsoddi'r Cynulliad. Ymhellach i'ch cwestiwn am ardaloedd menter, yr wyf yn fwy nad bodlon trafod hynny gyda chi ar y cyfle cyntaf.

We are committed to making Wales a better and more prosperous place in which to live and work, and the Assembly's record on business support speaks for itself. Unemployment, interest rates and inflation are at record lows in Wales, and those are stable conditions for economic growth.

Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i wneud Cymru'n lle gwell a mwy ffyniannus i fyw a gweithio, ac mae record y Cynulliad ar gymorth i fusnes yn siarad drosti'i hun. Mae diweithdra, cyfraddau llog a chwyddiant ar eu hisaf erioed yng Nghymru, ac mae'r rhain yn amodau sefydlog ar gyfer twf economaidd.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.
Amendment 1: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Graham, William
Hancock, Brian
Jones, David Ian
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 2: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick
 Cairns, Alun
 Dafis, Cynog
 Davies, David
 Graham, William
 Hancock, Brian
 Jones, David Ian
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Davidson, Jane
 Edwards, Richard
 Essex, Sue
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Halford, Alison
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sinclair, Karen
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 7, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 40.
 Amendment 3: For 7, Abstain 0, Against 40.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, David
 Graham, William
 Jones, David Ian
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Dafis, Cynog
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Edwards, Richard
 Essex, Sue
 Evans, Delyth
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Halford, Alison
 Hancock, Brian
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn

Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Kirsty
 Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 9, Ymatal 7, Yn erbyn 31.
 Amendment 4: For 9, Abstain 7, Against 31.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Dafis, Cynog
 Hancock, Brian
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Edwards, Richard
 Essex, Sue
 Evans, Delyth
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Halford, Alison
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
 The following Members abstained:
 Bourne, Nick
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, David
 Graham, William
 Jones, David Ian
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 18, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.
Amendment 5: For 18, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Janet
Graham, William
Hancock, Brian
Jones, David Ian
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.*

*Cynnig (NDM1405): O blaid 31, Ymatal 10, Yn erbyn 7.
Motion (NDM1405): For 31, Abstain 10, Against 7.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Graham, William
Jones, David Ian
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan

Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Janet
Hancock, Brian
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

4.40 p.m.

Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru) Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru)

Dechreuad Newydd i Gymru A Fresh Start for Wales

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Carwyn Jones.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Carwyn Jones.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Cynigiaf fod

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I propose that

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn credu bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi bod yn fethiant a bod Cymru yn haeddu dechreuad newydd. (NDM1406)

the National Assembly for Wales believes that the Welsh Assembly Government has been a failure and Wales deserves a fresh start. (NDM1406)

Yr ydym bellach o fewn tair wythnos i ddiwedd y Cynulliad cyntaf. Mae gan y rheini ohonom sy'n cofio'r dyddiau cynnar atgofion am ddyddiau cynhyrfus, â'r holl sôn am ddechrau newydd i Gymru, gwleidyddiaeth gynhwysol ac ati. Yr oedd

We are now within three weeks of the end of the first Assembly. Those of us who remember the early days have memories of exciting days, with all the talk of a new start for Wales, of inclusive politics and so on. Hopes were high; there was the hope of a

gobeithion yn uchel; yr oedd gobaith am ddechrau newydd i Gymru, y byddai'r Cynulliad yn rhoi arweiniad i'r genedl ac y byddai'r Llywodraeth yn llywodraethu Cymru gyfan. Daeth y Llywodraeth i fodolaeth ar don o ewyllys da. Er siom y misoedd cyntaf, adnewyddwyd yr ysbryd o ewyllys da pan ddaeth y Prif Weinidog presennol i'w swydd.

Mae'n siom i'r gobeithion hynny gael eu chwalu. Mae'n siom bod y Llywodraeth Lafur/Democrataidd Ryddfrydol bresennol wedi methu mewn cymaint o feysydd. Er ein bod oll yn cydnabod mai gwan yw pwerau'r Cynulliad, methodd y Llywodraeth â defnyddio'r pwerau hynny i'r eithaf. Mae wedi chwarae'n saff ar bob achlysur yn hytrach na bod yn anturus; mae arni ofn ypsetio Llundain ac felly ni wna'r hyn sy'n iawn dros Gymru.

Methodd hefyd â chyflawni ei haddewidion. Gwelir y methiant hwnnw amlycaf yn y gwasanaeth iechyd ac yn yr economi, y byddaf yn eu trafod yn fanylach yn y man.

David Davies: Pam nad oedd eich plaid chi yn barod i ypsetio Llundain ar ddechrau'r Cynulliad drwy bleidleisio o blaid codi'r gwaharddiad ar gig eidion ar yr asgwrn?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Nid wyf yn siŵr sut y mae'r cwestiwn hwnnw'n berthnasol i ymosodiad ar y Llywodraeth, ond efallai y caf gyfle i'w ateb yn nes ymlaen os bydd amser yn caniatáu.

Y peth lleiaf y mae etholwyr yn ei ddisgwyl gan Lywodraeth yw y bydd yn ceisio gwireddu ei haddewidion. Mae'r Llywodraeth bresennol yn trin addewidion yn hynod wamal. Ystyriwch y rhestrau aros. Nid dweud y byddai'n lleihau rhestrau aros a wnaeth y Blaid Lafur, ond y byddai'n eu dileu'n llwyr. Yr ydym o fewn chwe wythnos i'r etholiad ac mae rhestrau aros wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol. Ni fu i'r Llywodraeth eu dileu na'u lleihau; mae'r rhestrau aros wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol.

Ystyriwn ei record ar yr economi. Bu i'r Llywodraeth gynnwys targedau yn ei strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol, sy'n ddogfen hynod o

new start for Wales, that the Assembly would provide leadership for the nation and that the Government would govern the whole of Wales. The Government came into existence on the crest of a wave of goodwill. Even after the disappointment of the first months, the spirit of goodwill was reignited when the present First Minister came to office.

It is disappointing that those hopes were shattered. It is a disappointing that the current Labour/Liberal Democrat Government has failed on so many counts. Although we all acknowledge that the Assembly's powers are limited, the Government has failed to make the full use of those powers. It has played safe at all times, rather than being adventurous; it is afraid of upsetting London so it does not do what is right for Wales.

It has also failed to fulfil its promises. That failure is most evident in the health service and in the economy, which I will discuss in more detail later.

David Davies: Why was your party not willing to upset London at the beginning of the Assembly by voting in favour of lifting the ban on beef on the bone?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I am not sure how that question is relevant to an attack on the Government, but perhaps I will have an opportunity to respond later on if time permits.

The least that the electorate expects from a Government is that it attempts to fulfil its promises. The current Government is flippant about its pledges. Consider waiting lists. The Labour Party did not say that it would reduce waiting lists, but that it would completely eliminate them. We are within six weeks of the election and waiting lists have lengthened considerably. The Government has neither eliminated nor reduced them; the waiting lists have lengthened considerably.

Let us consider its record on the economy. The Government included targets in its national economic development strategy, which is a highly ambitious document. It said

uchelgeisiol. Dywedodd y byddai lefel cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen Cymru yn codi i 90 y cant o gyfartaledd Prydain erbyn 2010, ac y byddai 135,000 o swyddi'n cael eu creu. Nid oes argoel ein bod yn mynd i'r cyfeiriad iawn ar GDP, bedair blynedd ar ôl i Lafur ddod i rym yn y Cynulliad. Disgynnodd y ffigur o 90 y cant yn 1979 i 80 y cant adeg creu'r Cynulliad. Er na chyhoeddwyd ffigurau ers hynny, y tebygrwydd yw bod y ffigur wedi disgyn ymhellach. Deallwn fod y Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol wedi gohirio cyhoeddi ei ffigurau, er na wyddwn y rheswm dros hynny. Mae arbenigwyr yn y maes sydd wedi astudio'r ffigurau yn dweud eu bod yn disgwyl y bydd y ffigur wedi disgyn ymhellach.

Therefore here we are, four years after Labour came to power in the National Assembly and almost three and a half years since the coalition was established, looking at a record of underachievement that has tossed away all the goodwill of the first term and dashed all our hopes that devolution would bring a fresh start to Wales. The biggest failure is failing to make devolution work for Wales. It is often asked what the Assembly Government has achieved. The reply is swift: very little; some tinkering around the edges, avoiding the big issues.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: You referred to tinkering at the edges of policy decisions and to this Government's failure. Are you surprised that only two Cabinet Ministers are present for this debate to defend the Government's record? The other seven have disappeared, knowing that we would criticise their handling of their portfolios.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: They often leave the Chamber when they are being criticised, but they are happy to stand at the rostrum when they have good news to announce. They are all here nodding in a row when there is good news, but they quietly slip out of the Chamber when their record is under scrutiny. The people of Wales will notice the empty front bench.

How can you make this institution relevant to the people of Wales, if they believe, or

that Wales's gross domestic product per capita level would increase to 90 per cent of the British average by 2010, and that 135,000 jobs would be created. There is no indication that we are going in the right direction on GDP, four years after Labour came to power in the Assembly. The figure fell from 90 per cent in 1979 to 80 per cent at the Assembly's inception. Although no figures have been published since, the likelihood is that the figure has fallen further. We understand that the Office for National Statistics has delayed publishing its figures, although we do not know why. Experts in the field who have studied the figures say that they expect that the figure will have fallen further.

Felly dyma ni, bedair blynedd ar ôl i Lafur ddod i rym yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a bron dair blynedd a hanner ers sefydlu'r glymblaid, yn edrych ar record o dangyrhaeddiad sydd wedi taflu holl ewyllys da'r tymor cyntaf ac wedi chwalu'r holl obeithion a oedd gennym y byddai datganoli'n dod â dechreuad newydd i Gymru. Y methiant mwyaf yw methu â pheri i ddatganoli weithio dros Gymru. Gofynnir yn aml beth a gyflawnodd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae'r ateb yn un sydyn: ychydig iawn; rhywfaint o dincera ar yr ymylon, gan osgoi'r pynciau mawr.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Gwnaethoch gyfeirio at dincera ar ymylon penderfyniadau polisi ac at fethiant y Llywodraeth hon. A ydych yn synnu mai dim ond dau o Weinidogion y Cabinet sy'n bresennol ar gyfer y ddaidl hon i amddiffyn record y Llywodraeth? Mae'r saith arall wedi diflannu, gan wybod y byddem yn beirniadu eu dull o drafod eu portffolios.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Maent yn aml yn gadael y Siambr pan gânt eu beirniadu, ond maent yn fodlon sefyll ar y llwyfan pan fo ganddynt newyddion da i'w cyhoeddi. Maent i gyd yma'n nodio eu pennau mewn rhes pan fo newyddion da, ond yn sleifio'n ddistaw o'r Siambr pan yw eu record yn cael ei graffu. Bydd pobl Cymru'n sylwi ar y fainc flaen wag.

Sut y gallwch beri i'r sefydliad hwn fod yn berthnasol i bobl Cymru, os credant, neu os

perceive that the Cabinet is a form of club on the banks of the river Taff—and a closed club at that? There is a widely held view—it may be the perception of many—that the Government does not care about the rest of Wales. The most obvious example of the WAG's failure to meet its pledges is on health. That is the biggest issue, which the people of Wales will consider to be most relevant at the next Assembly election. It is important to remind ourselves of what the Labour Party said in its 1999 election manifesto. It stated that no-one would have to wait for more than six months for an outpatient appointment. The figure in 1999 was 21,828; today, it is over 82,000. It stated that no-one would have to wait more than 18 months for in-patient treatment. The figure in 1999 was 2,197; today, it is over 5,000.

Therefore, how does the Government answer questions on its record on health? It gives three answers, depending on the circumstances. First, the Minister for Health and Social Services denies any responsibility for managing the health service, stating that it is not up to her and that she is not responsible for the problems. Secondly, it ignores the pledges and then invents new ones and claims progress against the new ones, ignoring the fact that it made the original pledges in its own manifesto. Thirdly, and most surprisingly, last week, the First Minister acknowledged that waiting list numbers had increased, but he stated that they were moving in the right direction. The figure was 21,000 when he came into office; now it is over 82,000; the dip is less than 900 in a month, but the figure is still 82,460.

On the economy, the Government has produced unrealistic targets in the national economic development strategy. There is no commitment to review the Barnett formula that would give the Assembly block grant an estimated additional £800 million to tackle the economic problems facing our communities. There is also the debacle over top-up fees and student finance. The Government is in an almighty mess on that. Peter Hain initially stated that we would get

canfyddant fod y Cabinet yn fath o glwb ar lannau Taf—a chlwb caeedig ar ben hynny? Ceir barn gyffredin—efallai mai dyna'r canfyddiad sydd gan lawer o bobl—nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn poeni am weddill Cymru. Yr enghraifft amlycaf o fethiant Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gadw ei haddewidion yw iechyd. Dyna'r pwnc mwyaf, y bydd pobl Cymru'n ei ystyried yn fwyaf perthnasol yn etholiad nesaf y Cynulliad. Mae'n bwysig inni ein hatgoffa ein hun am yr hyn a ddywedodd y Blaid Lafur yn ei maniffesto ar gyfer etholiad 1999. Dywedodd na fyddai neb yn gorfod disgwyl yn hwy na chwe mis am apwyntiad fel claf allanol. Y ffigur yn 1999 oedd 21,828; heddiw, mae dros 82,000. Dywedodd na fyddai neb yn gorfod disgwyl yn hwy na 18 mis am driniaeth fel claf mewnol. Yn ffigur yn 1999 oedd 2,197; heddiw, mae dros 5,000.

Felly, sut y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ateb cwestiynau ar ei record ar iechyd? Mae'n rhoi tri ateb, yn ôl yr amgylchiadau. Yn gyntaf, mae'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn gwadu bod ganddi unrhyw gyfrifoldeb dros reoli'r gwasanaeth iechyd, gan ddatgan nad hi sy'n atebol ac nad yw'n gyfrifol am y problemau. Yn ail, mae'n anwybyddu'r addewidion ac wedyn yn dyfeisio rhai newydd ac yn hawlio ei bod yn gwneud cynnydd yn ôl y rhai newydd, gan anwybyddu'r ffaith mai hi a wnaeth yr addewidion gwreiddiol yn ei maniffesto ei hun. Yn drydydd, ac yn fwyaf syfrdanol, yr wythnos diwethaf, cydnabu'r Prif Weinidog fod y niferoedd ar y rhestr aros wedi cynyddu, ond dywedodd eu bod yn symud i'r cyfeiriad iawn. Y ffigur pan ddaeth i'w swydd oedd 21,000; mae bellach dros 82,000; mae'r gostyngiad yn llai na 900 mewn mis, ond mae'r ffigur cyn uchod â 82,460 o hyd.

Ar yr economi, mae'r Llywodraeth wedi nodi targedau afrealistig yn y strategaeth datblygu economaidd cenedlaethol. Nid oes ymrwymiad i adolygiad o fformiwla Barnett a ychwanegai swm amcangyfrifedig o £800 miliwn at grant bloc y Cynulliad i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau economaidd sy'n wynebu ein cymunedau. Ceir y ddadl hefyd ynghylch ffioedd ychwanegol a chyllid myfyrwyr. Mae'r Llywodraeth mewn llanastr ofnadwy yn hynny o beth. Dywedodd Peter Hain ar y

the relevant powers; Jane Davidson said that it was too soon and that she wanted to know when she would get the money. Last week, she said that she wanted the powers, to which Charles Clarke said that she would have to wait until after the Assembly election.

Cynog Dafis: Does this debacle, as Ieuan describes it, have anything to do with the fact that Don Touhig, the Parliamentary Under-Secretary of State at the Wales Office with responsibility for education, has decided not to attend a meeting of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee to give evidence on this matter?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: That is another clear example of the Government trying to run away from its responsibilities. The people of Wales must know what the Government's position will be before the Assembly election, otherwise they will be voting without information. Yesterday, Peter Hain said that Labour supporters opposed the war against Iraq because they were already disillusioned with the Government, as it had not been sufficiently committed to the redistribution of wealth. Peter Hain was absolutely right. What, therefore, is the alternative? Wales needs a party that will bring credibility to the Assembly, and treat it as a national institution and not a glorified county council. It needs a party that will ensure that the Assembly works for the whole of Wales, supports our public services, and ensures that money goes to front-line staff in the health service, and is not spent on bureaucrats. It needs a party that will allow our teachers to be free to teach and not get bogged down in endless paperwork. It needs a party that will scrap tests at key stages 2 and 3; that will create regional job targets and spread prosperity more evenly throughout Wales. Wales needs a Government that puts the interests of Wales first to work for the whole of Wales. After four years of failure under this Labour and Liberal Democrat coalition, we need a fresh start. Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales will provide it after 1 May.

4.50 p.m.

dechrau y caem y pwerau perthnasol; dywedodd Jane Davidson ei bod yn rhy fuan a'i bod am gael gwybod pa bryd y câi'r arian. Yr wythnos diwethaf, dywedodd ei bod am gael y pwerau, ac ymateb Charles Clarke i hynny oedd y byddai'n gorfod disgwyl tan ar ôl etholiad y Cynulliad.

Cynog Dafis: A yw'r llangstr hwn, fel y mae Ieuan yn ei ddisgrifio, yn ymwneud o gwbl â'r ffaith bod Don Touhig, yr Is-Ysgrifennydd Seneddol yn Swyddfa Cymru sy'n gyfrifol am addysg, wedi penderfynu peidio â dod i gyfarfod o'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i roi tystiolaeth ar y mater hwn?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Dyna enghraifft amlwg arall o'r Llywodraeth yn ceisio ffoi rhag ei chyfrifoldebau. Rhaid i bobl Cymru gael gwybod beth fydd safbwynt y Llywodraeth cyn etholiad y Cynulliad, neu fel arall byddant yn pleidleisio heb wybodaeth. Ddoe, dywedodd Peter Hain fod cefnogwyr Llafur yn gwrthwynebu'r rhyfel yn erbyn Irac am eu bod eisoes wedi siomi yn y Llywodraeth, am nad oedd wedi ymrwymo'n ddigonol i ailddosbarthu cyfoeth. Yr oedd Peter Hain yn llygad ei le. Beth, felly, yw'r dewis arall? Mae ar Gymru angen plaid a ddaw â hygrededd i'r Cynulliad, a'i drin fel sefydliad cenedlaethol ac nid fel rhyw gyngor sir mawreddog. Mae arni angen plaid a fydd yn sicrhau bod y Cynulliad yn gweithio dros Gymru gyfan, yn cefnogi ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, ac yn sicrhau bod arian yn mynd at staff y rheng flaen yn y gwasanaeth iechyd, ac na chaiff ei wario ar fiwrocratiaid. Mae arni angen plaid a fydd yn gadael i'n hathrawon fod yn rhydd i ddysgu ac nid bod at eu clustiau mewn gwaith papur diddiwedd. Mae arni angen plaid a fydd yn dileu profion yng nghyfnodau allweddol 2 a 3; a fydd yn creu targedau swyddi rhanbarthol ac yn gwasgaru ffyniant yn fwy gwastad ledled Cymru. Mae ar Gymru angen Llywodraeth sy'n rhoi buddiannau Cymru'n gyntaf er mwyn gweithio dros Gymru gyfan. Ar ôl pedair blynedd o fethiant o dan y glymblaid Lafur a Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol hon, mae arnom angen dechreuad newydd. Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales a fydd yn rhoi hynny ar ôl 1 Mai.

The Business Minister (Carwyn Jones): I propose amendment 1. Delete:

has been a failure and Wales deserves a fresh start.

and replace with:

has delivered the benefits of devolution to people throughout Wales through stable and innovative government, and the implementation of policies set out in its programme for government. Together these have laid the foundations for a fairer and more prosperous future.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Many Members wish to speak, so I will limit speeches to three minutes. The Minister will have eight minutes to respond to the debate, and the opening and closing speakers will have 15 minutes. Since Ieuan has taken 10 minutes, Rhodri will have five minutes to wind up. All other speakers will have three minutes.

Huw Lewis: Not unusually, Plaid Cymru is asking a great deal of us today. By implication, it is asking us to suspend our disbelief to consider and imagine that it is fit for Government. How can Plaid Cymru—a party that cannot even be honest with itself—imagine that it is fit to govern Wales and be trusted with £12 billion of public money? I have been a critic of this Labour administration in the Assembly when necessary, but I also know and recognise that this administration has delivered for my constituency, for example. Although I may still be impatient on key issues of social justice and tackling poverty, in the last four years, we have made great progress in my constituency. We have seen the redevelopment of the NHS through a hospital redevelopment programme and money has been allocated for a new hospital. The Assembly has provided 320 direct jobs, the Heads of the Valleys road has been dualled, and I hope that, in the near future, there will be a university presence, which will make Merthyr Tydfil a university town for the first time. These developments have taken place because of the Labour administration and they would never have happened under Plaid

Y Trefnydd (Carwyn Jones): Cynigïaf welliant 1. Dileu'r geiriau:

wedi bod yn fethiant a bod Cymru yn haeddu dechreuad newydd

gan roi'r geiriau a ganlyn yn eu lle:

wedi dod â manteision datganoli i bobl ledled Cymru drwy lywodraeth sefydlog ac arloesol, a thrwy weithredu'r polisiau a nodir yn ei rhaglen lywodraethu. Gyda'i gilydd, maent wedi gosod y seiliau ar gyfer dyfodol mwy teg a ffyniannus.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae llawer o Aelodau'n dymuno siarad, felly cyfyngaf areithiau i dri munud. Caiff y Gweinidog wyth munud i ymateb i'r ddadl, a 15 munud a gaiff y siaradwyr sy'n agor ac yn cloi. Gan fod Ieuan wedi cymryd 10 munud, caiff Rhodri bum munud i gloi. Caiff yr holl siaradwyr eraill dri munud.

Huw Lewis: Yn ôl ei harfer, mae Plaid Cymru yn gofyn llawer iawn gennym heddiw. Drwy oblygiad, mae'n gofyn inni atal ein hanghrediniaeth ac ystyried a dychmygu ei bod yn addas i fod yn Llywodraeth. Sut y gall Plaid Cymru—plaid nad yw hyd yn oed yn gallu dweud y gwir wrthi'i hun—ddychmygu ei bod yn addas i lywodraethu Cymru a gofalu am £12 biliwn o arian cyhoeddus? Yr wyf wedi beirniadu'r weinyddiaeth Lafur hon yn y Cynulliad pan fu angen hynny, ond yr wyf hefyd yn gwybod ac yn cydnabod bod y weinyddiaeth hon wedi mynd â'r maen i'r wal dros fy etholaeth i, er enghraifft. Er y gallwn fod yn ddiamynedd o hyd ynghylch materion allweddol sy'n ymwneud â chyfiawnder cymdeithasol a mynd i'r afael â thlodi, yn y pedair blynedd diwethaf, yr ydym wedi gwneud llawer o gynnydd yn fy etholaeth i. Gwelsom ailddatblygu'r GIG drwy raglen ailddatblygu ysbytai a dyrannwyd arian ar gyfer ysbyty newydd. Mae'r Cynulliad wedi darparu 320 o swyddi'n uniongyrchol, mae ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd wedi'i deoli ac yr wyf yn gobeithio, yn y dyfodol agos, y bydd presenoldeb gan brifysgol, a wnaiff Ferthyr Tudful yn dref brifysgol am y tro cyntaf.

Cymru.

Mae'r datblygiadau hyn wedi digwydd oherwydd y weinyddiaeth Lafur ac ni fyddent erioed wedi digwydd o dan Blaid Cymru.

Plaid Cymru cannot be honest with itself about its own constitutional policy. It is afraid to use the term independence when that is what it believes. It is a party that hides its true intentions behind gobbledegook and sophistry. Its policy platform rests on a simple hypocrisy. I have asked this question of Plaid Cymru for four years, and I have waited four years for an answer. I will ask it again because the people of Wales will ask it over and over again. How will Plaid Cymru pay for its policy platform? How can it on the one hand demand more from the British taxpayer, and on the other, demand that we withdraw from the British state? What would be the costs to the Welsh taxpayer of a Welsh divorce from the United Kingdom? It is hypocritical for it to dodge and fudge the answers to those questions. It is staggering that, after 75 years campaigning and calling for an end to the British state, it is unable to tell people what the financial implications of these policies are. If it cannot be straight on questions of such fundamental importance, it cannot honestly expect people to trust it to run Wales, and expect them to listen to its criticisms of this Assembly Government.

Ni all Plaid Cymru ddweud y gwir wrthi'i hun am ei pholisi cyfansoddiadol ei hun. Mae arni ofn defnyddio'r gair annibyniaeth, er mai yn hynny y mae'n credu. Mae'n blaid sy'n cuddio ei gwir fwriadau y tu ôl i ffiloreg a thwyllresymu. Mae ei rhaglen bolisi yn seiliedig ar ragrith plaen. Yr wyf yn gofyn y cwestiwn hwn i Blaid Cymru ers pedair blynedd, ac yr wyf wedi disgwyl pedair blynedd am ateb. Fe'i gofynnaf eto oherwydd bydd pobl Cymru'n ei ofyn dro ar ôl tro. Sut y gwnaiff Plaid Cymru dalu am ei rhaglen bolisi? Sut y gall ar yr un llaw alw am fwy gan y trethdalwr Prydeinig, ac ar y llaw arall, mynnu ein bod yn tynnu allan o'r wladwriaeth Brydeinig? Beth fyddai'r costau i'r trethdalwr yng Nghymru pe byddai Cymru'n ymwahanu o'r Deyrnas Unedig? Rhagrith ar ei rhan yw osgoi a ffugio'r atebion i'r cwestiynau hynny. Mae'n syfrdanol, ar ôl 75 mlynedd o ymgyrchu a galw am roi terfyn ar y wladwriaeth Brydeinig, nad yw'n gallu dweud wrth bobl beth yw goblygiadau ariannol y polisiau hyn. Os na all ddweud y gwir ar gwestiynau o bwysigrwydd sylfaenol fel hyn, ni all ddisgwyl o ddifrif i bobl ymddiried ynnddi i redeg Cymru, a disgwyl iddynt wrando ar ei beirniadaethau o'r Llywodraeth Cynulliad hon.

That is the pattern of Plaid Cymru politics. It says whatever is necessary to win the votes of whomever it happens to be talking to at the time. Unless it owns up and is honest, it will remain unfit to hold office. It will be unfit to run our schools, our hospitals, and our economy. It will never face the Welsh electorate with honesty, and it will be judged accordingly. That is why its criticism of this Government is hollow and has no basis in honour or in honesty.

Dyna batrwm gwleidyddiaeth Plaid Cymru. Dywed beth bynnag y bo'i angen i ennill pleidleisiau'r sawl y mae'n digwydd siarad â hwy ar y pryd. Os na wnaiff gyfaddef a bod yn onest, bydd yn dal i fod yn anaddas i fod mewn grym. Bydd yn anaddas i redeg ein hysgolion, ein hysbytai, a'n heconomi. Ni wnaiff byth wynebu etholwyr Cymru'n onest, a chaiff ei barnu'n unol â hynny. Dyna pam y mae ei beirniadaeth ar y Llywodraeth hon yn ddiwerth ac nid oes sail iddi mewn anrhydedd neu onestrwydd.

David Lloyd: Cyfyngaf fy sylwadau i iechyd. Mae pawb yn ymwybodol erbyn hyn o addewidion Llafur ynglŷn â rhestrau aros yn 1999. Fe'u hailadroddaf, gan fod Huw Lewis wedi anghofio. Nid oedd neb i aros dros chwe mis i weld arbenigwr erbyn mis Mai 2003, a neb i aros dros 18 mis i dderbyn

David Lloyd: I will limit my comments to health. Everyone is aware by now of Labour's pledges on waiting lists in 1999. I will repeat them, since Huw Lewis has forgotten. No-one was to wait over six months to see a specialist by May 2003, and no-one would wait over 18 months for

llawdriniaeth erbyn mis Mai 2003. Y realiti yw bod dros 82,000 o bobl yng Nghymru yn aros dros chwe mis i weld arbenigwr, tra bod 700 o bobl yn unig yn aros yn Lloegr. Mae dros 5,000 o bobl yng Nghymru yn aros dros 18 mis am lawdriniaeth, lle nad oes neb yn aros cyhyd yn Lloegr. Dyna fesur methiant Llafur, mesur y dioddefaint yng Nghymru a mesur y sialens i drawsnewid yr ystadegau enbydus hyn.

Mae'r rhestrau aros yn bod am nad oes gennym y gallu i drin pawb sydd angen triniaeth yn syth. Nid oes digon o welyau, nyrsys, na meddygon. Yr ateb yw cynyddu capasiti'r gwasanaeth iechyd i drin mwy o bobl drwy gael mwy o welyau a staff ac nid drwy ad-drefnu'r gwasanaeth am y chweched tro mewn 13 blynedd. Mae'r ad-drefnu'n gostus, yn gymhlethdod ac yn gwro'r sylw a'r gallu oddi wrth fusnes craidd y gwasanaeth iechyd, sef trin pobl. Parlysir y gwasanaeth mewn ad-drefniant dibwrpas.

Nid yw methiannau'r Llywodraeth Lafur-Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wedi eu cyfyngu i un rhan o'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans dan bwysau echrydus. Ni all ymateb i alwadau brys fel ag y dylai gan ei fod yn dal i aros am yr arian i wireddu'r weledigaeth o ymateb i anghenion cleifion a nodwyd yn yr adroddiad 'Operational Research in Health' dros ddwy flynedd yn ôl. Yr wyf yn derbyn llythyrau a galwadau cyson ar ddeintyddiaeth, am y prinder, neu'r diffyg llwyr, o ddeintyddion sy'n gweithio yn y gwasanaeth iechyd, yng Ngheredigion, Crymymch a Dinbych-y-pysgod. Rhaid gweithredu ar frys i adennill deintyddiaeth yn wasanaeth craidd i'n gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae'n fethiant ledled Cymru.

Nid yw amser yn caniatáu i mi restru rhagor o fethiannau'r Llywodraeth Lafur-Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn y maes iechyd. Fodd bynnag, ar 1 Mai bydd dewis syml gan bobl Cymru, pobl fel trigolion Merthyr Tudful: mwy o'r un methiannau neu newid clir a radical Plaid Cymru. Cefnogwch y cynnig.

Nick Bourne: Like previous speakers, I regret that there are not more Ministers

surgery by May 2003. The reality is that over 82,000 people in Wales are waiting over six months to see a specialist, while only 700 people are waiting in England. Over 5,000 people in Wales are waiting for surgery for over 18 months, while no-one is waiting as long in England. That is the measure of Labour's failure, of the suffering in Wales and of the challenge to turn these dire statistics around.

Waiting lists exist because we do not have the capacity to treat everyone who needs treatment immediately. There are not enough beds, nurses, or doctors. The answer is to increase the health service's capacity to treat more people by having more beds and staff, and not by reorganising the service for the sixth time in 13 years. The reorganisation is expensive and complex, and deflects focus and capacity from the core business of the health service, namely treating people. The service is paralysed by the unnecessary reorganisation.

The failures of the Labour-Liberal Democrat Government are not limited to one part of the health service. The ambulance service is under severe pressure. It cannot respond to emergency calls as it should as it is still waiting for funds to implement the vision of responding to patients' needs noted in the 'Operational Research in Health' report over two years ago. I frequently receive letters and calls on dentistry, about the shortage, or total absence of NHS dentists in Ceredigion, Crymymch and Tenby. We must act quickly so that dentistry again becomes a core service in our health service. It is a failure throughout Wales.

Time constraints do now allow me to list more of the Labour-Liberal Democrat Government's failures on health. However, on 1 May, a simple choice will face the people of Wales, people like those in Merthyr Tydfil: more of the same failures or Plaid Cymru's clear and radical change. Support the motion.

Nick Bourne: Fel siaradwyr blaenorol, mae'n ofid imi nad oes mwy o Weinidogion

present to hear us savage their records. It is clear what they think of this debate and why they are not here. On economic development, most of the new jobs that have been created are in the public sector; Objective 1 money has been squandered, and the Economic Development Committee, which has a majority of Liberal and Labour Members, savaged 'A Winning Wales'. There is a long list of problems concerning rural development, mostly to do with the Minister admittedly, but late payments top the list, followed by the GM debacle, the standstill rule, disposal of fallen livestock and double tagging. Are these the Government successes in which we are invited to believe?

When a number of people combined to put the First Minister in office just over three years ago there was a period of great hope, but we have gone backwards since then—nowhere more so than in health. We have already heard the comparison with England, and it is absolutely right. England, with a population of some 50 million, has 676 people waiting over six months for outpatient treatment. There are 82,460 in Wales, which is a national scandal. The First Minister's claim that it is moving in the right direction is an insult to everyone on that waiting list as only 21,000 were waiting four years ago. In the care sector—also under health and social services—there are 2,000 less care home places than there were four years ago. One of the reasons for this is that the administration insists on spending money as if it was going out of fashion, on things that do not matter to people, such as the new Assembly building—for which Plaid Cymru must share the blame—and mini embassies; the great growth in civil service numbers; and the money spent on a driverless train, money that is now being cancelled. It is absolutely staggering. I must say that there is only one Minister left in the Chamber now.

Initially we had the First Minister and a Labour Government, then we had a coalition and then one of the coalition partners turned on the other saying that he lived in cloud-

yn bresennol i'n clywed yn lladd ar eu record. Mae'n amlwg beth yw eu barn am y ddadl hon a pham nad ydynt yma. Ynghylch datblygu economaidd, mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r swyddi newydd a grewyd yn y sector cyhoeddus; mae arian Amcan 1 wedi'i afradu, ac mae'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, y mae arno fwyaf o Aelodau Llafur a Rhyddfrydol, wedi lladd ar 'Cymru'n Ennill'. Mae rhestr hir o broblemau sy'n ymwneud â datblygu gwledig, y rhan fwyaf ohonynt yn gysylltiedig â'r Gweinidog, rhaid cyfaddef, ond mae taliadau hwyr ar ben y rhestr, wedyn llastr y cynyddau a addaswyd yn enetig, y rheol i gyfyngu ar symud anifeiliaid, gwaredu anifeiliaid marw a thagio dwbl. Ai dyma'r llwyddiannau gan y Llywodraeth y gofynnir inni gredu ynddynt?

Pan ddaeth nifer o bobl at ei gilydd i roi'r Prif Weinidog yn ei swydd ychydig dros dair blynedd yn ôl, bu cyfnod o obaith mawr, ond yr ydym wedi mynd yn ein hól ers hynny—a hynny'n anad dim mewn iechyd. Clywsom y gymhariaeth â Lloegr eisoes, ac mae'n gwbl gywir. Yn Lloegr, sydd â phoblogaeth o tua 50 miliwn, mae 676 o bobl yn disgwyl yn hwy na chwe mis am driniaeth fel claf allanol. Mae 82,460 yng Nghymru, ac mae hynny'n warth arnom fel cenedl. Mae honiad y Prif Weinidog ei bod yn symud i'r cyfeiriad iawn yn sarhad ar bawb ar y rhestr aros honno gan mai dim ond 21,000 a oedd yn aros bedair blynedd yn ôl. Yn y sector gofal—hefyd o dan iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol—mae 2,000 yn llai o leoedd mewn cartrefi gofal nag yr oedd bedair blynedd yn ôl. Un o'r rhesymau am hynny yw bod y weinyddiaeth yn mynnu gwario arian fel pe na bai yfory'n bod, ar bethau nad ydynt o bwys i bobl, fel adeilad newydd y Cynulliad—y mae'n rhaid i Blaid Cymru rannu'r bai amdano—a llysgenadaethau bach; y cynnydd mawr yn y niferoedd yn y gwasanaeth sifil; a'r arian a wariwyd ar drên heb yrrwr, arian sydd bellach yn cael ei atal. Mae'n gwbl syfrdanol. Rhaid imi ddweud mai dim ond un Gweinidog sydd ar ôl yn y Siambr yn awr.

Ar y dechrau yr oedd gennym Brif Weinidog a Llywodraeth Lafur, ac yna clymblaid cyn i un o bartneriaid y glymblaid droi yn erbyn y llall gan ddweud ei fod yn byw mewn byd

cuckoo-land and that he was unfit to govern. That may well be true, but pots and kettles spring to mind. From this Government we have had—and this is also true of the Government in Westminster—higher taxes and worse services; more laws and less order; more promises and less hope. When we thought that it could not get any worse—all credit to the First Minister—he made matters worse by going into coalition with the Liberal Democrats. He put two Liberal Democrat Members in his Cabinet and six in his pocket and it has gone from bad to worse since then. We are in a position where the electorate is about to make a decision. It is time that the Government went, and it soon will.

ffantasi a'i fod yn anaddas i lywodraethu. Efallai fod hynny'n wir, ond mae'r dywediad Saesneg am y sosban a'r tegell yn dod i'r meddwl. Gan y Llywodraeth hon—ac mae hefyd yn wir am y Llywodraeth yn San Steffan—cawsom drethi uwch a gwasanaethau gwaeth; rhagor o gyfreithiau a llai o drefn; mwy o addewidion a llai o obaith. Â ninnau'n tybio na allai fynd yn waeth arnom—pob clod i'r Prif Weinidog—gwnaeth bethau'n waeth drwy ffurfio clymblaid â'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Rhoddodd ddau o Aelodau'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn ei Gabinet a chwech yn ei boced ac aeth pethau o ddrwg i waeth ers hynny. Yr ydym mewn sefyllfa lle y mae'r etholwyr ar fin gwneud penderfyniad. Mae'n bryd i'r Llywodraeth fynd, a dyna a wnaiff cyn hir.

5.00 p.m.

Peter Black: Here we have another Plaid Cymru minority debate, another wasted opportunity. Ieuan Wyn Jones repeated the assertion that he made in January that the Assembly is being used as a large county council, rather than as a national body that expresses the aspirations of a nation. That is certainly the case when you look at Plaid Cymru's record in tabling motions in the time allocated to it. It has failed to put forward constructive policy ideas of its own in these slots. It has failed to use the time to bring forward its own legislation as other groups have done; and it has failed in its duties in opposition to contribute to the success of the Assembly. Judging by the debate before us now, it prefers to use the Assembly as a sixth form debating society, rather than as a national body that has matured under this partnership Government.

Peter Black: Dyma ddadl plaid leiafrifol arall o eiddo Plaid Cymru, a chyfle arall wedi'i golli. Ailadroddodd Ieuan Wyn Jones yr haeriad a wnaeth yn Ionawr i'r perwyl bod y Cynulliad yn cael ei ddefnyddio fel cyngor sir mawr, yn hytrach na chorff cenedlaethol sy'n mynegi dyheadau cenedl. Mae hynny'n sicr o fod yn wir pan ystyriwch record Plaid Cymru o ran cyflwyno cynigion yn yr amser a ddyrannwyd iddi. Mae wedi methu â chyflwyno syniadau polisi adeiladol o'i heiddo'i hun ar yr amseroedd hyn. Methodd â defnyddio'r amser i roi ei deddfwriaeth ei hun gerbron fel y gwnaeth grwpiau eraill; methodd yn ei dyletswyddau fel gwrthblaid i gyfrannu at lwyddiant y Cynulliad. Ar sail y ddadl sydd o'n blaen yn awr, mae'n well ganddi ddefnyddio'r Cynulliad fel cymdeithas ddadlau chweched dosbarth, yn hytrach nag fel corff cenedlaethol sydd wedi aeddfedu o dan y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth hon.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Will you give way?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: A wnewch ildio?

Peter Black: I have no time to give way; I only have two minutes.

Peter Black: Nid oes gennyf amser i'w roi; dim ond dau funud sydd gennyf.

I have lost count of the number of strategies and actions which have allowed the Assembly to stake out the claim to national leadership, and which have slowly created a distinctive and beneficial agenda in Wales.

Yr wyf wedi colli cyfrif ar y nifer o strategaethau a champau gweithredu sydd wedi rhoi lle i'r Cynulliad allu haeru ei fod yn cynnig arweiniad i'r genedl, ac sydd wedi araf greu agenda neilltuol a llesol yng

The partnership Government has listened to people and organisations in Wales and created a voice and a Government that is the envy of English MPs and English regions.

The list of achievements is immense. It includes introducing free prescriptions for under-25s, freezing prescription charges, and bringing in free dental checks for the over-60s and the under-25s. There has been massive investment in the health service, aimed specifically at increasing capacity. We have introduced free personal care for the first six weeks after a patient is discharged from hospital. There are over 150 more training places for nurses and doctors, and 500 more doctors and nurses are now employed in Wales's health service.

By contrast, the Conservatives, when they were in power, cut 7,000 beds in Wales. They closed 70 hospitals, introduced charges for eye and dental care and increased prescription charges from 20p in 1979 to £5.65. That would not have happened if there had been an Assembly at that time, even one with the limited powers that we have now.

Thanks to the National Assembly partnership Government, there are now 700 more teachers employed in Wales, free entrance to museums, free bus passes for the elderly, and more money for school buildings. That is not the record of a county council, nor is it a record of failure. It is the record of a partnership Government investing in the future of our nation. It is a record that has responded to the needs of Wales with policies made in Wales. If there has been a failure, then it has been a failure of opposition. No doubt, the Welsh electorate will judge that on 1 May.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call Helen Mary Jones.

Helen Mary Jones: I had almost dozed off. Lists are terribly tedious and as Peter was not happy to take any interventions, I rather lost

Nghymru. Mae'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth wedi gwrandao ar bobl a chyrff yng Nghymru ac wedi creu llais a Llywodraeth sy'n destun cenfigen ymhlith Aelodau Seneddol a rhanbarthau Lloegr.

Mae'r rhestr o gyflawniadau yn faith. Mae'n cynnwys cyflwyno presgripsiynau rhad ac am ddim i rai dan 25 oed, rhewi taliadau presgripsiwn, a chyflwyno archwiliadau deintyddol rhad ac am ddim i rai dros 60 oed a rhai dan 25 oed. Bu buddsoddiad enfawr yn y gwasanaeth iechyd, a anelwyd yn benodol at ehangu capasiti. Yr ydym wedi cyflwyno gofal personol am ddim ar gyfer y chwe wythnos gyntaf wedi i glaf gael ei ryddhau o'r ysbyty. Mae mwy na 150 o leoedd hyfforddi ychwanegol ar gyfer nyrsys a meddygon, ac mae 500 yn rhagor o feddygon a nyrsys wedi'u cyflogi yng ngwasanaeth iechyd Cymru erbyn hyn.

Mewn cyferbyniad â hynny, pan oedd y Ceidwadwyr mewn grym, bu iddynt ddileu 7,000 o welyau yng Nghymru. Caewyd 70 o ysbytai ganddynt, cyflwynwyd taliadau am ofal llygaid a gofal deintyddol a chynyddwyd taliadau presgripsiwn o 20c yn 1979 i £5.65. Ni fyddai hynny wedi digwydd pe bai gennym Gynulliad ar y pryd, hyd yn oed un a chanddo'r pwerau cyfyngedig sydd gennym ni'n awr.

Diolch i Lywodraeth bartneriaeth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, mae 700 yn rhagor o athrawon wedi'u cyflogi yng Nghymru, ceir mynediad am ddim i amgueddfeydd, tocynnau bws am ddim i'r henoed, a mwy o arian ar gyfer adeiladau ysgol. Nid record cyngor sir yw honno, ac nid yw'n record o fethiant ychwaith. Record ydyw o Lywodraeth bartneriaeth sy'n buddsoddi yn nyfodol ein cenedl. Record ydyw sydd wedi ymateb i anghenion Cymru drwy ddarparu polisïau a wnaed yng Nghymru. Os bu methiant, methiant yr wrthblaid yw hwnnw. Mae'n sicr y bydd etholwyr Cymru'n rhoi eu barn ar hynny ar 1 Mai.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Galwaf ar Helen Mary Jones.

Helen Mary Jones: Yr oeddwn bron â chysgu. Mae rhestrau'n ofnadwy o ddiflas a chan nad oedd Peter yn fodlon derbyn

the plot.

Clearly, this Government has failed. The Labour Party in Wales, with its lack of vision and inability to develop real policy, is nothing more than a vote machine. It has been unable to follow through on those few policies that it has formulated: most of the decent ones, of course, were borrowed from Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales.

I could highlight an enormous list of failures in education but, at the risk of sounding like Peter Black, I shall refrain. I must, however, mention the baccalaureate, which is nothing of the kind; the crisis that we still face in special needs education—particularly special needs education through the medium of Welsh, since we were promised that it would be resolved; and the complete failure to deal with the bureaucratic burden.

I have three particularly stark examples. Ieuan Wyn Jones has already mentioned university funding. After four years of a Labour Government, most people freely acknowledge that the situation is a complete mess. The political consensus in the Assembly, which I think includes the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, is that we oppose top-up fees, but there is concern about where the money will come from if we do not introduce them. We have been told repeatedly that negotiations are ongoing, and last week we had an announcement—as we know, it is always exciting when Jane Davidson makes an announcement to cheers all round—that the Department for Education and Skills had apparently accepted that student finance was to be devolved to Wales, and that Wales would adopt a different approach to top-up fees. The Department for Education and Skills then announced that the matter was still under consideration and that it was ‘premature’ to suggest that things would be different here. Given that we were told about the close co-operation between Labour in London and Labour in Wales, that suggests to me that they simply do not know how to manage the devolution settlement with which they have left us. What a farce. Jane

unrhyw ymyriadau, yr oeddwn wedi colli'r trywydd braidd.

Mae'n amlwg bod y Llywodraeth hon wedi methu. Nid yw'r Blaid Lafur yng Nghymru, â'i diffyg gweledigaeth a'i hanallu i ddatblygu polisi go-iawn, yn fawr mwy na pheiriant ennill pleidleisiau. Ni lwyddodd i ddilyn yr ychydig bolisiau a greodd i'r pen: benthyciwyd y rhan fwyaf o'r rhai da oddi wrth Blaid Cymru—The Party of Wales, wrth gwrs.

Gallwn dynnu sylw at restr hir iawn o fethiannau mewn addysg ond, gan y byddai perygl imi swnio fel Peter Black, ymataliaf rhag gwneud hynny. Serch hynny, rhaid imi sôn am y fagloriaeth, nad yw'n ddim o'r fath beth; yr argyfwng a wynebwn o hyd mewn addysg anghenion arbennig—yn enwedig addysg anghenion arbennig drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, gan ein bod wedi cael addewid y câi hynny ei ddatrys; a'r methiant llwyr i ddelio â'r baich biwrocraidd.

Mae gennyf dair enghraifft arbennig o drawiadol. Mae Ieuan Wyn Jones wedi sôn eisoes am gyllido prifysgolion. Wedi pedair blynedd o Lywodraeth Lafur, mae'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yn cydnabod yn agored fod y sefyllfa'n llanastr llwyr. Y consensws gwleidyddol yn y Cynulliad, sy'n cynnwys y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, yr wyf yn credu, yw ein bod yn gwrthwynebu ffioedd ychwanegol, ond mae pryder ynghylch lle y ceir yr arian os na wnawn eu cyflwyno. Dywedwyd wrthym dro ar ôl tro fod negodiadau'n mynd rhagddynt, a'r wythnos diwethaf cawsom gyhoeddiad—fel y gwyddom, mae'n adeg gyffrous bob tro y gwnaiff Jane Davidson gyhoeddiad gan ysgogi banllefau o gymeradwyaeth—fod yr Adran Addysg a Sgiliau wedi derbyn, i bob golwg, fod cyllid myfyrwyr i'w ddatganoli i Gymru, ac y byddai Cymru'n cymryd agwedd wahanol at ffioedd ychwanegol. Wedyn cyhoeddodd yr Adran Addysg a Sgiliau fod y mater yn cael ei ystyried o hyd a'i bod yn 'rhy gynnar' i awgrymu y byddai pethau'n wahanol yma. Gan y dywedwyd wrthym fod cydweithredu clòs rhwng Llafur yn Llundain a Llafur yng Nghymru, mae hynny'n awgrymu i mi na wyddant o gwbl sut i reoli'r setliad datganoli y maent wedi'i adael i ni. Am ffars. Mae'r cyhoeddiad gan

Davidson's announcement exemplifies a rattled Minister rushing to release good news before she has even attained a result. That leaves potential students, their families and the universities in a state.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I can hear David Melding and Peter Black talking more clearly than I can hear you. That really ought not to happen.

Helen Mary Jones: Thank you for stepping in. As a former teacher, I am used to talking sense while little boys make silly noises. The Minister has put great emphasis on the relationship with the profession but she has introduced a workload agreement that is not in fact an agreement at all because two of the main teaching unions have not signed up to it, and she refuses to do anything to include them and to encourage them to sign up. I would like to say more about that and about the 1.1 per cent pay cut that teachers are facing, but time does not allow for this.

I will finish by mentioning ELWa: I do not believe that I need to say anything else. This was a good idea that has been utterly ruined. This Government has failed teachers and other education workers, learners and communities, and it has failed to make a success of the devolution settlement with which the Labour Party landed us. There are two main lessons to be learnt from this: the devolution settlement does not work and we need a proper parliament, and Labour does not work for Wales. Our communities and our nation are crying out for a fresh start, and they will get it on 1 May.

Christine Chapman: Contrary to Plaid Cymru's proposal, I am proud of what Labour in the Assembly has achieved in a short time. There is still much to do and those of us who serve Valleys communities realise that there is a huge task ahead of us. Years of Tory neglect did not only leave the people of Wales with a poor economy but also with a lack of self-esteem and a powerlessness, which take time to correct. Under this Labour-led administration, my constituents in the Cynon Valley—obviously there is still

Jane Davidson yn dangos Gweinidog sydd wedi cynhyrfu yn brysio i ryddhau newyddion da cyn iddi sicrhau canlyniad hyd yn oed. Mae hynny'n gadael darpar fyfyrwyr, eu teuluoedd a'r prifysgolion mewn sefyllfa ddifrifol.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Gallaf glywed lleisiau David Melding a Peter Black yn gliriach na'ch llais chi. Ni ddylai fod felly.

Helen Mary Jones: Diolch ichi am ddod i'r adwy. Fel cyn-athrawes, yr wyf wedi arfer â siarad yn synhwyrol tra bo bechgyn bach yn gwneud synau gwirion. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi rhoi pwys mawr ar y berthynas â'r proffesiwn ond mae wedi cyflwyno cytundeb ar lwyth gwaith nad yw'n gytundeb o gwbl, mewn gwirionedd, am nad yw dau o brif undebau'r athrawon wedi rhoi sêl eu bendith iddo, ac mae'n gwrthod gwneud dim i'w cynnwys a'u hannog i'w gymeradwyo. Carwn ddweud rhagor am hynny ac am y toriad o 1.1 y cant yn eu cyflog y mae athrawon yn ei wynebu, ond nid oes digon o amser i wneud hynny.

Gorffennaf drwy sôn am ELWa: ni chredaf fod angen imi ddweud dim rhagor. Yr oedd hwn yn syniad da a ddifethwyd yn llwyr. Mae'r Llywodraeth hon wedi gwneud cam ag athrawon a gweithwyr addysg eraill, dysgwyr a chymunedau, a methodd â throï'r setliad datganoli a adawyd inni gan Lafur yn llwyddiant. Mae dwy wers bwysig i'w dysgu oddi wrth hynny: nid yw'r setliad datganoli'n gweithio ac mae arnom angen senedd iawn, ac nid yw Llafur yn gweithio dros Gymru. Mae ein cymunedau a'n cenedl yn galw am ddechreuad newydd, a chânt hynny ar 1 Mai.

Christine Chapman: Yn groes i gynnig Plaid Cymru, ymfalchïaf yn yr hyn a gyflawnodd Llafur yn y Cynulliad mewn cyfnod byr. Mae llawer i'w wneud eto ac mae'r rhai ohonom sy'n gwasanaethu cymunedau yn y Cymoedd yn sylweddoli bod tasg enfawr o'n blaen. Yr oedd blynyddoedd o esgeulustod gan y Torïaid wedi gadael economi wael i bobl Cymru, a diffyg hunan-barch ac ymdeimlad o ddiymadferthedd hefyd, y mae angen amser i'w gwella. O dan y weinyddiaeth hon sy'n

work to be done—tell me of the improvements that they see daily. Employment is rising, and is rising faster in the Objective 1 area, and indigenous businesses that I have spoken to are expanding. I have met more general practitioners in Cynon Valley, and Jane Hutt recently announced public funding for our new hospital. This did not happen under the previous administration. Our older people have renewed independence and mobility. The partnership Government has delivered for Wales in this historic first term. It was interesting to read the Bevan Foundation's analysis of the way in which Labour policies have impacted on the Valleys in particular. It says that there has been a new sense of vitality, optimism and confidence among many communities and individuals and that these developments were unthinkable a decade ago.

On the economy, a range of initiatives is making Wales a more confident nation. Objective 1 is part of that, and, contrary to what is said by the opposition, which is only interested in scaremongering, it is working to help to regenerate our poorest areas. Do not just rely on the figures: talk to the people whose lives are different as a result of such initiatives. For example, hotel and guesthouse owners around Wales now receive many more visitors as tourists are attracted to their improved accommodation, and young people, are becoming more mature and self-reliant and have a different outlook because Objective 1 has given them an opportunity to develop their skills. Childcare programmes now provide support for parents who want to take up new job opportunities. A company in Bridgend that I visited can now employ more workers because its new equipment makes it more competitive. I have also visited a company in St Asaph, which, had it not been for new premises as a result of Objective 1, would have moved to the midlands. Had it not been for the support given by Objective 1 to help start up his business, the young managing director of a new company in Cynon Valley would have taken his good degree and his enterprise out of Wales in the belief that to get on you had to get out of Wales. This is changing as a result of

cael ei harwain gan Lafur, mae fy etholwyr yng Nghwm Cynon—mae gwaith i'w wneud o hyd, wrth gwrs—yn dweud wrthyf am y gwelliannau a welant bob dydd. Mae cyflogaeth ar gynydd, ac yn cynyddu'n gynt yn yr ardal Amcan 1, ac mae busnesau cynhenid yr wyf wedi siarad â hwy'n ehangu. Yr wyf wedi cwrdd â mwy o feddygon teulu yng Nghwm Cynon, a chyhoeddodd Jane Hutt gyllid cyhoeddus yn ddiweddar ar gyfer ein hysbyty newydd. Ni ddigwyddodd hyn o dan y weinyddiaeth flaenorol. Mae gan ein pobl hŷn fwy o annibyniaeth a gallu i symud o gwmpas. Mae'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth wedi mynd â'r maen i'r wal dros Gymru yn y tymor cyntaf hanesyddol hwn. Diddorol oedd darllen dadansoddiad Sefydliad Bevan o effaith polisïau Llafur ar y Cymoedd yn benodol. Dywed fod ymdeimlad newydd o egni, gobaith a hyder wedi codi ymysg llawer o gymunedau ac unigolion ac na ellid dychmygu'r datblygiadau hyn ddegawd yn ôl.

Ynghylch yr economi, mae amrediad o fentrau'n gwneud Cymru'n genedl fwy hyderus. Mae Amcan 1 yn rhan o hynny, ac, yn groes i'r hyn a ddywedir gan yr wrthblaid, nad yw ond yn ymddiddori mewn codi bwganod, mae'n gweithio i helpu i adfywio ein hardaloedd tlotaf. Peidiwch â dibynnu ar y ffigurau'n unig: siaradwch â'r rhai y mae eu bywyd yn wahanol o ganlyniad i fentrau o'r fath. Er enghraifft, mae perchnogion gwestai ledled Cymru'n cael llawer mwy o ymwelwyr bellach gan fod twristiaid yn cael eu denu i'r llety gwell sydd ganddynt, ac mae pobl ifanc yn mynd yn fwy aeddfed a hunanddibynnol ac mae eu hagwedd yn wahanol am fod Amcan 1 wedi rhoi cyfle iddynt ddatblygu eu sgiliau. Bellach mae rhaglenni gofal plant yn cynnig cymorth i rieni sydd am achub ar gyfleoedd gwaith newydd. Mae cwmni ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, yr ymwelais ag ef, yn gallu cyflogi rhagor o weithwyr yn awr am fod yr offer newydd sydd ganddo'n peri ei fod yn fwy cystadleuol. Ymwelais hefyd â chwmni yn Llanelwy a fyddai wedi symud i ganolbarth Lloegr oni bai am yr adeilad newydd a gafodd o ganlyniad i Amcan 1. Oni bai am y cymorth a roddwyd drwy Amcan 1 i'w helpu i sefydlu ei fusnes, byddai rheolwr gyfarwyddwr ifanc ar gwmni newydd yng Nghwm Cynon wedi mynd â'i radd a'i fenter

Objective 1. Plaid Cymru would never have obtained Objective 1 funding. Therefore, I am pleased with what Welsh Labour is doing in the Assembly; it is getting on with the job of restoring the pride of the people of Wales.

David Davies: The motion before us is factual: it asks us to decide whether or not the Welsh Assembly Government has failed the people of Wales. Anyone who reads the last Labour Party manifesto—I managed to get hold of one earlier—will see that this work of fiction demonstrates what a failure it has been in all policy areas. It told us that it would save the NHS in 24 hours, and what is the reality? We have seen a huge rise in waiting lists. Its only policy is to spend £15 million employing yet more bureaucrats to reorganise it. ‘Education, education, education’ was another favourite Labour Party soundbite when this manifesto was written, but the reality is that, in my constituency and all over the Welsh countryside, small schools are being shut down. It promised to save the environment, and yet the Assembly is ordering local authorities to set aside areas of land to allow for quarrying in the future.

5.10 p.m.

It even said that it would be good for agriculture: I do not need to mention foot and mouth disease or late payments. A lady in Abergavenny rang me to say that she had applied for a movement licence for a bull, and that an official from the Assembly had said that he needed to know what the bull’s sex was. [*Laughter.*] That is the Labour Party for you; that is a true story. It has even promised to keep its promises. Its manifesto in 1997 states that the Labour Party promises not to

‘promise what we cannot deliver, and to deliver what we promise’.

We have now seen it all. We have had enough of Labour’s tired excuses: ‘it is not our fault, it is the previous Minister’s fault’; ‘it is because our targets are too ambitious’; ‘it is the officials’; ‘it is the computers’. We

o Gymru gan gredu bod rhaid gadael Cymru er mwyn dod ymlaen yn y byd. Mae hyn yn newid o ganlyniad i Amcan 1. Ni fyddai Plaid Cymru erioed wedi sicrhau cyllid Amcan 1. Gan hynny, yr wyf yn falch o’r hyn a wnaiff Llafur Cymru yn y Cynulliad; mae’n mynd ymlaen â’r gwaith o adfer balchder pobl Cymru.

David Davies: Mae’r cynnig sydd ger ein bron yn un ffeithiol: mae’n gofyn inni benderfynu a yw Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi siomi pobl Cymru. Bydd unrhyw un sy’n darllen maniffesto diwethaf y Blaid Lafur—llwyddais i gael un yn gynharach—yn gweld bod y ffuglen hon yn dangos graddau ei methiant ym mhob maes polisi. Dywedodd wrthym y byddai’n achub y GIG o fewn 24 awr, a beth yw’r gwirionedd? Gwelsom gynnydd aruthrol mewn rhestrau aros. Yr unig bolisi sydd ganddi yw gwario £15 miliwn i gyflogi mwy o fiwrocrataid eto i’w ad-drefnu. ‘Addysg, addysg, addysg’ oedd un arall o hoff arwyddeiriau’r Blaid Lafur pan ysgrifennwyd y maniffesto hwn, ond y gwir yw, yn fy etholaeth i a ledled cefn gwlad Cymru, fod ysgolion bach yn cael eu cau. Addawodd achub yr amgylchedd, ac eto mae’r Cynulliad yn mynnu bod awdurdodau lleol yn neilltuo tir er mwyn caniatáu cloddio yn y dyfodol.

Dywedodd y byddai’n llesol i amaethyddiaeth hyd yn oed: nid oes rhaid imi sôn am glwy’r traed a’r genau a thaliadau hwyr. Fe’m ffonwyd gan wraig yn y Fenni a ddywedodd ei bod wedi gwneud cais am drwydded symud ar gyfer tarw, a bod swyddog o’r Cynulliad wedi dweud bod rhaid iddo gael gwybod beth oedd rhyw’r tarw. [*Chwerthin.*] Dyna’r Blaid Lafur i chi; stori wir yw honno. Mae hyd yn oed wedi addo cadw ei haddewidion. Dywed ei maniffesto yn 1997 fod y Blaid Lafur yn addo peidio ag

addo’r hyn na allwn ei gyflawni, a chyflawni’r hyn yr ydym yn ei addo.

Gwelsom y cwbl bellach. Yr ydym wedi cael digon o hen esgusion Llafur: ‘nid ein bai ni ydyw, bai’r Gweinidog blaenorol ydyw’; ‘am fod ein targedau’n rhy uchelgeisiol y mae hyn’; ‘y swyddogion sydd ar fai’; ‘y

heard the favourite one again today: 'it is all the fault of the previous Conservative Government'. Labour never talks about the previous Labour Government in the 1970s, as my colleague Alun Cairns pointed out. It never talks about the great successes of Callaghan and Wilson—that was too long ago. Yet, we must hear all about the Conservatives in the 1980s. What about the 1980s? Labour complains about the 1980s but at the time the Labour Party wanted to pull out of the European Union and join some form of free trading arrangement with the failing socialist economies of eastern Europe. Labour was wrong about that, and it recognises that now. It wanted to nationalise all kinds of businesses and industries—that would have been a total failure for the economy in the 1980s. It now accepts that it was wrong. It wanted to get rid of our nuclear weapons. As we stand on the brink of war today, we know just how wrong Labour was. Do not talk about the Conservative Party of the 1980s. Today's Labour Party is closer to the Conservative Government of the 1980s than to the Labour Party at that time. However, there is one major difference between the Conservative Party of today and the Labour Party. We have a simple belief. We will put—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Your time is up.

Brian Hancock: Without doubt, the Welsh Assembly Government's biggest failure is the economy. It has failed to support Welsh businesses, and particularly, small businesses—the building blocks of our economy. However, that is not surprising given that we have had three different Ministers for Economic Development since 1999. The Government has completely lacked direction and strategy. The coalition has failed to support Welsh businesses, reach its targets and make effective use of Objective 1 funding. This has caused the gap in gross domestic product per capita, wages and productivity between Wales and the UK to grow even wider than it was in 1999.

Over two-thirds of the RSA budget still goes to firms from outside Wales, which means that two-thirds of the profits flow out of

cyfrifiaduron sydd ar fai'. Clywsom y ffefryn eto heddiw: 'mae'r holl fai ar y Llywodraeth Geidwadol flaenorol'. Nid yw Llafur byth yn sôn am y Llywodraeth Lafur flaenorol yn y 1970au, fel y nododd fy nghyd-Aelod Alun Cairns. Nid yw byth yn sôn am lwyddiannau mawr Callaghan a Wilson—yr oedd hynny'n rhy bell yn ôl. Eto, rhaid inni gael clywed o hyd am y Ceidwadwyr yn y 1980au. Beth am y 1980au? Mae Llafur yn cwyno am y 1980au ond ar y pryd yr oedd y Blaid Lafur am dynnu allan o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd ac ymuno â rhyw fath o drefniant masnachu rhydd gydag economïau sosialaidd diffygiol dwyrain Ewrop. Yr oedd Llafur wedi camgymryd ar hynny, ac mae'n cydnabod hynny'n awr. Yr oedd am wladoli pob math o fusnesau a diwydiannau—byddai hynny wedi peri methiant llwyr yn yr economi yn y 1980au. Mae'n derbyn bellach y bu'n anghywir. Yr oedd am gael gwared ar ein harfau niwclear. A ninnau'n sefyll ar drothwy rhyfel heddiw, gwyddom gymaint yr oedd Llafur yn camgymryd. Peidiwch â sôn am Blaid Geidwadol y 1980au. Mae'r Blaid Lafur heddiw'n agosach at Lywodraeth Geidwadol y 1980au nag at y Blaid Lafur yn y cyfnod hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, mae un gwahaniaeth mawr rhwng y Blaid Geidwadol heddiw a'r Blaid Lafur. Mae gennym gredo syml. Rhoddwn—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae'ch amser ar ben.

Brian Hancock: Heb os, methiant mwyaf Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yw'r economi. Methodd â chefnogi busnesau Cymreig ac, yn enwedig, busnesau bach—conglfeini ein heconomi. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n syndod a ninnau wedi cael tri gwahanol Weinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd ers 1999. Ni fu gan y Llywodraeth unrhyw gyfeiriad na strategaeth. Mae'r glymblaid wedi methu â chefnogi busnesau Cymreig, cyrraedd ei thargedau a defnyddio cyllid Amcan 1 yn effeithiol. Oherwydd hyn, mae'r bwlch yn y cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen, cyflogau a chynhyrchiant rhwng Cymru a'r DU yn fwy nag yr oedd yn 1999 hyd yn oed.

Mae mwy na dwy ran o dair o'r gyllideb cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol yn dal i fynd i fusnesau o'r tu allan i Gymru, sy'n golygu

Wales. It is no wonder that, in the last two years, the number of companies exporting from Wales has fallen, while Scotland has seen a rise of 12 per cent and Northern Ireland a rise of 17 per cent.

It is small businesses that have suffered most under this Government. Less than a third of RSA funding goes to small businesses despite the fact that 99.3 per cent of all Welsh firms are small and medium-sized enterprises, with less than 50 employees. Small businesses do not get the help that they require with the application process. As a result, the bureaucratic barrier that this Government has created has disillusioned small businesses.

On Objective 1, the Government's record is even worse: less than a third of the jobs promised for west Wales and the Valleys have been created. The target was 34,000 jobs, but only 10,000 have been achieved. In Islwyn, there is a fantastic opportunity to regenerate the former Navigation Colliery site in Crumlin. It is situated on the A467 from Newport to Ebbw Vale, it has 100m of rail track and space for a park and ride station. It is on the main fibre optic route, and on the spine that runs northwards. Yet, nothing is planned: no station, no server farm, no economic units, no starter units, no re-skilling centre—just 15 jobs in a car repair garage. We need leadership, speculation to accumulate, and sustainable jobs.

It is typical of this Government to go for headlines rather than facts in its desperate attempt to boost figures. Ten per cent of all the jobs that the Government claims to have created under Objective 1 do not exist. Even worse, the Minister for Economic Development has tried to divert the blame to officials at the Welsh European Funding Office. Is that leadership? Delivering broadband for information and communications technology could be achieved, if there were a single project under Objective 1 to promote business, upskilling and training. How much is spent on that under Objective 1? It is very little, if anything

bod dwy ran o dair o'r elw'n gadael Cymru. Nid oes ryfedd bod nifer y cwmnïau sy'n allforio o Gymru wedi gostwng yn y ddwy flynedd diwethaf, tra cafwyd cynnydd o 12 y cant yn yr Alban a 17 y cant yng Ngogledd Iwerddon.

Busnesau bach sydd wedi dioddef fwyaf o dan y Llywodraeth hon. Aiff llai na thraean o gyllid cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol i fusnesau bach er bod 99.3 y cant o'r holl fusnesau yng Nghymru'n fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint, a chanddynt lai na 50 o weithwyr. Nid yw busnesau bach yn cael y cymorth y mae arnynt ei angen gyda'r broses ymgeisio. O ganlyniad i hynny, mae'r rhwystr biwrocraataidd a greodd y Llywodraeth hon wedi dadrithio busnesau bach.

Ar Amcan 1, mae record y Llywodraeth yn waeth byth: llai na thraean o'r swyddi a addawyd ar gyfer y Gorllewin a'r Cymoedd sydd wedi'u creu. Y targed oedd 34,000 o swyddi, ond dim ond 10,000 a sicrhawyd. Yn Islwyn, mae cyfle gwych i adfywio hen safle glofa'r Navigation yng Nghrymlyn. Mae ar yr A467 rhwng Casnewydd a Glynebwy, mae arno 100 medr o drac rheilffordd a lle ar gyfer gorsaf parcio a theithio. Mae ar y prif lwybr opteg ffeibr, ac ar y llinell sy'n rhedeg tua'r gogledd. Ac eto, nid oes dim yn yr arfaeth: dim gorsaf, dim fferm wasanaethu, dim unedau economaidd, dim unedau meithrin, dim canolfan dysgu sgiliau newydd—dim ond 15 o swyddi mewn modurdy sy'n trwsio ceir. Mae arnom angen arweiniad, menter er mwyn cronni, a swyddi cynaliadwy.

Mae'n nodweddiadol o'r Llywodraeth hon ei bod yn dewis penawdau yn hytrach na ffeithiau yn ei hymgais anobeithiol i wella ffigurau. Nid yw 10 y cant o'r holl swyddi y mae'r Llywodraeth yn honni ei bod wedi'u creu o dan Amcan 1 yn bodoli. Yn waeth byth, mae'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd wedi ceisio rhoi'r bai ar swyddogion yn Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru. Ai arweiniad yw hynny? Gellid darparu'r band eang ar gyfer technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu, pe byddai prosiect sengl o dan Amcan 1 i hyrwyddo busnes, gwella sgiliau a hyfforddi. Faint a gaiff ei wario ar hynny o dan Amcan 1?

at all.

John Griffiths: Although it is election time, this is an unconvincing attempt to paint a picture of the Welsh Assembly Government and its achievements since devolution that is unrealistic. If this sort of view became widely accepted and widespread, it would cast doubt on devolution itself. That is disappointing coming from Plaid Cymru, which at least purports to support devolution. Wales has seen achievement as a result of stability. Members have already mentioned some headline achievements. I could do the same, but I do not want to repeat what Members have said. We know the headline achievements: free bus travel; free entry to museums and galleries; the abolition of testing for seven-year-olds and league tables; the reduction of class sizes; free school milk; free prescriptions for those aged under 25; lower prescription charges; Assembly investment grants; and Objective 1. It is a long list, and those are just the headlines.

Brian Hancock *rose—*

John Griffiths: I am sorry, Brian, I do not have time to take an intervention. A raft of achievements underlie those headlines. This motion paints a misleading and inaccurate picture of the Assembly Government's achievements. There has been an effective partnership between Labour at Westminster and the Labour-led administration in the Assembly. An impressive year on year budgetary increase reflects that, and has allowed us to fulfil our ambitions for Wales.

Devolution has been a huge step forward for Wales. Moving from administrative devolution to democratic devolution has empowered the people of Wales. The Assembly Government has been able to use the opportunity that devolution brings to deliver for the people of Wales. That delivery is growing, and is becoming more impressive, and the Assembly as an institution is growing in stature. I welcome that and look forward to it continuing. However, the unrealistic negativity that we have seen from Plaid Cymru today risks

Ychydig iawn, os unrhywbeth o gwbl.

John Griffiths: Er ei fod yn amser etholiad, mae hon yn ymgais anargyhoeddiadol i dynnu llun afrealistig o Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'i chyflawniadau ers datganoli. Os câi safbwynt o'r math hwn ei dderbyn yn gyffredinol, byddai'n bwrw amheuaeth ar ddatganoli ei hun. Mae'n siomedig mai gan Blaid Cymru y ceir hyn, gan ei bod yn cymryd arni gefnogi datganoli, o leiaf. Mae Cymru wedi gweld cyflawniadau oherwydd sefydlogrwydd. Mae Aelodau eisoes wedi sôn am rai o'r prif gyflawniadau. Gallwn i wneud yr un peth, ond nid wyf am ailadrodd yr hyn a ddywedodd Aelodau. Gwyddom beth yw'r prif gyflawniadau; teithio ar fysiau am ddim; mynediad am ddim i amgueddfeydd ac orielau; diddymu profion ar gyfer rhai saith mlwydd oed a thablau cynghrair; lleihau maint dosbarthiadau; llaeth am ddim yn yr ysgol; presgripsiynau am ddim i ran dan 25 oed; taliadau presgripsiwn is; grantiau buddsoddi'r Cynulliad; ac Amcan 1. Mae'n rhestr hir, a dim ond y penawdau yw'r rheini.

Brian Hancock *a gododd—*

John Griffiths: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Brian, nid oes gennyf ddigon o amser i dderbyn ymyriad. Mae llu o gyflawniadau'n gefn i'r penawdau hynny. Mae'r cynnig hwn yn tynnu darlun camarweiniol ac anghywir o gyflawniadau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Bu partneriaeth effeithiol rhwng Llafur yn San Steffan a'r weinyddiaeth sy'n cael ei harwain gan Llafur yn y Cynulliad. Mae'r cynnydd yn y gyllideb o'r naill flwyddyn i'r llall yn adlewyrchu hynny, ac mae wedi ein galluogi i gyflawni ein huchelgeisiau ar gyfer Cymru.

Bu datganoli'n gam enfawr ymlaen i Gymru. Mae'r newid o ddatanoli gweinyddol i ddatganoli democrataidd wedi galluogi pobl Cymru. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi gallu defnyddio'r cyfle a geir drwy ddatganoli i gyflawni dros bobl Cymru. Mae cyflawni o'r fath ar gynnydd, ac yn gwneud mwy o argraff, ac mae'r Cynulliad fel sefydliad yn tyfu o ran ei statws. Croesawaf hynny ac edrychaf ymlaen at ei weld yn parhau. Fodd bynnag, mae perygl y bydd y negyddoldeb afrealistig a gawsom gan Blaid Cymru heddiw'n niweidio datganoli. Mae'n

damaging devolution. It is election time, but it is over the top to paint the Welsh Assembly Government as a failure. It is unbalanced, and is not in touch with reality. In Newport East alone, we have seen the urban regeneration company, several million pounds' worth of investment in the NHS, and Communities First areas. That is an impressive catalogue. Let us be realistic and recognise the achievements of devolution and the Welsh Assembly Government.

David Ian Jones: Coming as I do every week to Cardiff from farthest north Wales, I often feel as a resident of a remote colonial outpost in Asia Minor must have felt when visiting imperial Rome. Lest it should be thought that this is some form of incipient paranoia on my part, Members might find it instructive to note that a public opinion poll carried out last week by the *North Wales Weekly News* found that only one fifth of those questioned felt that the Assembly had been successful in its first term. More disturbingly for anyone who is concerned about democracy in Wales, is that only one in three of those questioned plan to vote in the Assembly elections in May. The reason for that is that the Assembly appears to the people of north Wales to be remote, out of touch, and dominated—as it is—by interests from the populous south-eastern part of Wales. This was always a factor inherent in the demographic—

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I know that you have only been an Assembly Member for a short time, David, but have you noticed that we have a Government here? We are not discussing the failings of the National Assembly for Wales, but the failings of the coalition Government.

David Ian Jones: You have taken the words out of my mouth. I was about to say that this was always a danger inherent in the demographic factors at work in Wales, and should have been addressed by the Assembly Government. However, the Government has not addressed these factors, and the alienation that is felt by many of the people of north Wales continues. For example, not only has

amser etholiad, ond mynd dros ben llestri yw portreadu Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru fel pe bai'n fethiant. Mae hynny'n anghyfbwys ac yn afrealistig. Yn Nwyrain Casnewydd yn unig, gwelsom y cwmni adfywio trefol, gwerth sawl miliwn o bunnoedd o fuddsoddiad yn y GIG, ac ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Mae honno'n rhestr drawiadol. Gadewch inni fod yn realistig a chydabod cyflawniadau datganoli a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

David Ian Jones: Gan fy mod yn teithio bob wythnos i Gaerdydd o'r Gogledd pell, yr wyf yn aml yn teimlo fel y byddai un o'r trigolion o gyrion pellaf yr ymerodraeth Rufeinig yn Asia Leiaf yn sicr o deimlo wrth ymweld â Rhufain. Rhag ofn i rywun feddwl mai rhyw fath o baranoia cychwynnol yw hyn ar fy rhan, efallai y bydd Aelodau'n ei chael yn fuddiol nodi bod arolwg barn cyhoeddus a wnaed yr wythnos diwethaf gan y *North Wales Weekly News* wedi darganfod mai dim ond un o bob pump a holwyd a deimlai fod y Cynulliad wedi bod yn llwyddiannus yn ei dymor cyntaf. Yr hyn sy'n peri mwy o ofid i rywun sy'n pryderu ynghylch democratiaeth yng Nghymru yw mai dim ond un o bob tri o'r rhai a holwyd sy'n bwriadu pleidleisio yn etholiadau'r Cynulliad ym Mai. Y rheswm am hynny yw bod y Cynulliad, yng ngolwg pobl y Gogledd, yn ymddangos ei fod yn bell a heb gysylltiad, a'i fod yn cael ei draarglwyddiaethu—fel y mae—gan fuddiannau'r rhan boblog o Gymru yn y deddwyrain. Bu hyn yn ffactor annatod erioed yn y demograffig—

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Gwn nad ydych ond yn Aelod o'r Cynulliad ers cyfnod byr, David, ond a ydych wedi sylwi bod gennym Lywodraeth yma? Nid trafod diffygion Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yr ydym, ond diffygion y Llywodraeth glymblaid.

David Ian Jones: Yr ydych wedi mynd â'r geiriau o'm ceg. Yr oeddwn ar fin dweud y bu hyn yn berygl sy'n rhan annatod erioed o'r ffactorau demograffig sydd ar waith yng Nghymru, ac y dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad fod wedi rhoi sylw iddo. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r Llywodraeth wedi rhoi sylw i'r ffactorau hyn, ac mae'r ymddieithrio a deimlir gan lawer o bobl y Gogledd yn

the north Wales farming community suffered the body blow of foot and mouth disease, but that has been compounded by the inept and gross failure of the Assembly Government to ensure that support payments due to farmers were paid when and as required.

5.20 p.m.

Tom Middlehurst: You mentioned the Government's failures, David. Do you agree that farmers did particularly well because of the consideration given by the Westminster and Assembly Governments during the foot and mouth disease crisis, which resulted in £54.5 million in compensation being given to 800 claimants in Wales? I do not think that the Westminster or Assembly Governments failed farmers on that occasion.

David Ian Jones: The Government could hardly do less in those circumstances. However, I object to the fact that we have a complacent Minister for Rural Development, who clearly does not give a fig for farmers when it comes to making support payments.

That problem must be addressed and the next Assembly must take it seriously. If it does not, the people of north Wales, entirely as a result of how this Government has managed the Assembly, will consider devolution to have been a complete and utter failure.

The Business Minister (Carwyn Jones): The Labour-led Welsh Assembly Government is coming to the end of its inaugural term and it looks forward to another term following the election on 1 May. It will soon be presenting to the Welsh people a confident message that they and their devolved Government are succeeding. It is Plaid Cymru's historic role to proclaim failure and to limit the confidence and aspirations of the people of Wales. Those people are weary of that message and that is why they are decisively turning away from Plaid Cymru and choosing to support those in the Welsh Assembly Government and its successful programme for prosperity and social justice.

parhau. Er enghraifft, ar ben yr ergyd drom a gafodd y gymuned ffermio yn y Gogledd o ganlyniad i glwy'r traed a'r genau, cafwyd y methiant dybryd a di-glem gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i sicrhau y câi'r cymorthdaliadau a oedd yn ddyledus i ffermwyr eu talu yn ôl yr angen.

Tom Middlehurst: Gwnaethoch sôn am fethiannau'r Llywodraeth, David. A gytunwch fod y ffermwyr wedi gwneud yn arbennig o dda oherwydd y taliadau a roddodd Llywodraethau San Steffan a'r Cynulliad yn ystod argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau, a arweiniodd at dalu £54.5 miliwn o iawndal i 800 o hawlwr yng Nghymru? Ni chredaf fod Llywodraeth San Steffan neu Lywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi gwneud cam â ffermwyr y tro hwnnw.

David Ian Jones: Prin y gallai'r Llywodraeth wneud yn llai o dan yr amgylchiadau hynny. Fodd bynnag, gwrthwynebaf y ffaith bod gennym Weinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig difater, y mae'n amlwg nad yw'n malio dim am ffermwyr pan ddaw'n fater o roi cymorthdaliadau.

Rhaid ymdrin â'r broblem honno a rhaid i'r Cynulliad nesaf ei chymryd o ddifrif. Os na wnaiff, bydd pobl y Gogledd, yn gyfan gwbl oherwydd dull y Llywodraeth hon o reoli'r Cynulliad, yn barnu bod datganoli'n fethiant llwyr.

Y Trefnydd (Carwyn Jones): Mae'r Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru dan arweiniad Llafur yn dod i ddiwedd ei thymor agoriadol ac yn edrych ymlaen at dymor arall ar ôl yr etholiad ar 1 Mai. Cyn hir bydd yn cyflwyno neges hyderus i bobl Cymru i'r perwyl eu bod hwy a'u Llywodraeth ddatganoledig yn llwyddo. Rôl hanesyddol Plaid Cymru yw cyhoeddi methiant a chyfyngu ar hyder a dyheadau pobl Cymru. Mae'r bobl hynny wedi blino ar y neges honno a dyna pam y maent yn troi'n benderfynol oddi wrth Blaid Cymru ac yn dewis cefnogi'r rhai yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'i rhaglen lwyddiannus ar gyfer ffyniant a chyfiawnder cymdeithasol.

I will begin with the economy, which is in the process of a positive transformation. There are 61,000 more jobs in Wales than there were a year ago. Unemployment is at 3.5 per cent, the same level as in 1975, when the last Labour Government was in power. That is a third of the level in 1986 and less than half the level in 1997. Youth unemployment has been cut by 75 per cent since 1997. Young people have the expectation again that they will work and succeed. Look around you. You can see the hope in young faces that you did not see a decade ago in the barren and destructive Tory years.

In the past year, we have seen an increase in the level of economic activity—the proportion of people of working age in work. For many years, there had been an apparently fixed gap of around 5 per cent between the activity rate in Wales and that elsewhere in the UK. It has now reduced to 2.5 per cent. That gap was a significant part of the explanation why Wales was a relatively poor country by UK standards. The gap is now eroding fast. The generation of people who thought that they might never work again—the people of Merthyr Tydfil and Blaenau Gwent—and those communities that felt permanently excluded are beginning to re-engage in the economy as a result of the actions of the Labour Government in Westminster and in the Assembly.

The Assembly Government cannot claim credit for all that, but it will claim credit for creating an expectation of lifelong learning, investing in broadband technology—with £115 million committed to the extent that it gives Wales a real competitive advantage over other parts of the UK—and developing the knowledge economy by building bridges between universities and business and through the powerful Technium model and the knowledge exploitation fund. We have encouraged innovation, enterprise and diversity, and maximised the use of regional selective assistance to encourage the highest quality of investment in Wales. That is a track record of economic success on which the Assembly Government will build in the second Assembly.

Dechreuaf drwy sôn am yr economi, sydd ar ganol gweddnewidiad er gwell. Mae 61,000 yn rhagor o swyddi yng Nghymru nag yr oedd flwyddyn yn ôl. Mae diweithdra ar 3.5 y cant, yr un lefel ag yr oedd yn 1975, pan oedd y Llywodraeth Lafur ddiwethaf mewn grym. Dyna un rhan o dair o'r lefel yn 1986 a llai na hanner y lefel yn 1997. Lleihawyd diweithdra ymysg pobl ifanc o 75 y cant ers 1997. Unwaith eto mae pobl ifanc yn gallu disgwyl y byddant yn gweithio ac yn llwyddo. Edrychwch o'ch cwmpas. Gallwch weld y gobaith mewn wynebau ifanc na welech ddegawd yn ôl ym mlynnyddoedd llwm a dinistriol y Toriaid.

Yn y flwyddyn a aeth heibio, gwelsom gynnydd yn lefel y gweithgarwch economaidd—y gyfran o bobl o oedran gweithio mewn gwaith. Am flynyddoedd lawer, yr oedd bwlch a ymddangosai'n un parhaol o tua 5 y cant rhwng y gyfradd weithgarwch yng Nghymru a'r un mewn rhannau eraill o'r DU. Mae wedi disgyn bellach i 2.5 y cant. Y bwlch hwnnw oedd un o'r rhesymau pennaf am dlodi cymharol Cymru yn ôl safonau'r DU. Mae'r bwlch hwnnw'n cau'n gyflym. Mae'r genhedlaeth a gredai nad oedd yn debygol o weithio byth eto—pobl Merthyr Tudful a Blaenau Gwent—a'r cymunedau hynny a deimlai eu bod wedi'u hallgáu'n barhaol yn dechrau cymryd rhan yn yr economi eto o ganlyniad i'r camau a gymerodd y Llywodraeth Lafur yn San Steffan ac yn y Cynulliad.

Ni all Llywodraeth y Cynulliad hawlio'r holl glod am hynny, ond gwnaiff hawlio clod am greu disgwyliad o ddysgu gydol oes, buddsoddi mewn technoleg band eang—gan neilltuo £115 miliwn fel y caiff Cymru fantais gystadleuol wirioneddol dros rannau eraill o'r DU—a datblygu'r economi wybodaeth drwy godi pontydd rhwng prifysgolion a busnes a thrwy fodel effeithiol y Technium a'r gronfa defnyddio gwybodaeth. Yr ydym wedi hyrwyddo arloesi, menter ac amrywiaeth, ac wedi gwneud y defnydd mwyaf o gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol er mwyn hybu buddsoddi o'r ansawdd gorau yng Nghymru. Dyna record o lwyddiant economaidd y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei datblygu yn yr ail Gynulliad.

Educational achievement in Wales has improved markedly in the past four years. Attainment levels in both primary and secondary schools are the highest ever. The performance and motivation of pupils, teachers and families are higher because we have reduced primary school class sizes, we have abolished unnecessary testing and been willing to develop the role of professional judgment, and we have ended the publication of league tables that served to denigrate and dishearten those working in the toughest school environments.

Brian Hancock: You mentioned league tables: did you know that I told the Minister that, in considering secondary legislation, I had tried to find a way of abolishing league tables and that it was in the Minister's power to carry that out? I ended up with careers education. Therefore, that could have been done sooner, but it had to be pointed out to you.

Carwyn Jones: Your point is noted, Brian, but it was the Assembly Government that ensured that league tables were abolished. We have established an integrated planning and funding regime for post-16 education. It has already resulted in wider participation, more diversity and greater parity between different forms of learning. We are making lifelong learning a reality.

Helen Mary Jones: Are you trying to tell the Assembly that ELWa is a success? If you believe that, you must be the only person in Wales who does. Not even the Minister is convinced of that anymore.

Carwyn Jones: I am sorry to hear Plaid Cymru denigrating the idea of lifelong learning, of the extension of post-16 education, and of greater diversity in education. We have a higher education strategy that provides the collaborative framework for a distinctive approach to higher education in Wales. We also have Assembly learning grants, which have shown that learning beyond the age of 18 is an opportunity for all, including the poorest people in society.

Mae cyrhaeddiad addysgol yng Nghymru wedi gwella'n sylweddol yn y pedair blynedd diwethaf. Y lefelau cyrhaeddiad mewn ysgolion cynradd ac uwchradd yw'r rhai uchaf erioed. Mae perfformiad a chymhelliant disgyblion, athrawon a theuluoedd yn well am ein bod wedi lleihau maint dosbarthiadau ysgol gynradd, diddymu profion diangen ac wedi bod yn barod i ddatblygu rôl barn broffesiynol, ac yr ydym wedi rhoi'r gorau i gyhoeddi tablau cynghrair a oedd yn bychanu ac yn digalonni'r rhai sy'n gweithio yn yr amgylcheddau ysgol anoddaf.

Brian Hancock: Gwnaethoch sôn am dablau cynghrair: a wyddoch fy mod wedi dweud wrth y Gweinidog fy mod, wrth ystyried is-ddeddfwriaeth, wedi ceisio darganfod modd i ddiddymu tablau cynghrair a bod gan y Gweinidog bŵer i gyflawni hynny? Addysg gyrfaoedd a gefais yn y diwedd. Felly, galleid gwneud hynny'n gynt, ond bu'n rhaid tynnu'ch sylw ato.

Carwyn Jones: Mae'r pwynt a wnaethoch wedi'i nodi, Brian, ond Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a sicrhodd ddiddymu tablau cynghrair. Yr ydym wedi sefydlu cyfundrefn cynllunio a chyllido integredig ar gyfer addysg ôl-16. Mae wedi arwain eisoes at gyfranogi ehangach, mwy o amrywiaeth a mwy o gydraddoldeb rhwng gwahanol fathau o ddysgu. Yr ydym yn gwneud dysgu gydol oes yn ffaith.

Helen Mary Jones: A ydych yn ceisio dweud wrth y Cynulliad bod ELWa yn llwyddiant? Os credwch hynny, rhaid mai chi yw'r unig un yng Nghymru. Nid yw'r Gweinidog wedi'i hargyhoeddi o hynny hyd yn oed erbyn hyn.

Carwyn Jones: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf glywed Plaid Cymru yn bychanu'r syniad o ddysgu gydol oes, ymestyn addysg ôl-16, a mwy o amrywiaeth mewn addysg. Mae gennym strategaeth addysg uwch sy'n darparu'r fframwaith cydweithredol ar gyfer dull neilltuol o ymdrin ag addysg uwch yng Nghymru. Mae grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad gennym hefyd, sydd wedi dangos bod dysgu ar ôl 18 oed yn gyfle i bawb, gan gynnwys y rhai tlotaf mewn cymdeithas.

I will turn to health. Much is made of health; the same figures are parroted around day after day. Health and social care provision in Wales is improving. Plaid Cymru may denigrate daily the efforts of everyone in NHS Wales but, alongside the continuing unmet demand, there is real improvement in the supply of services. We have reduced the number of people waiting more than 18 months for orthopaedic surgery by 95 per cent. It took a lot of money and a lot of effort by a lot of people, but we did it.

If you consider other targets—in cancer care and cardiac treatment—you will find the same record of success. Increased investment has resulted in 150 more doctors, 990 more nurses and eight new hospitals. However, just as important is our investment in our capacity for the long term, which includes new training facilities in Cardiff, the North and Swansea—and Gwent is next. The previous Tory Government neglected all these matters for 18 long years.

Nick Bourne *rose*—

Carwyn Jones: We are increasing the support that we offer to elderly people in their homes, as part of a strategy that responds to demographic change and to our objective of giving people the opportunity to stay as independent as they choose. Six weeks' free personal care for people leaving hospital is part of that strategy to support and maintain independent living.

Nick Bourne: Will the Minister reconsider his comment on the number of people on waiting lists and his dismissal of it as a mere statistic? There are 82,460 people with every reason to be annoyed with your Labour Government. Four years ago, you promised them that they would not be on a waiting list, yet they are. When you came into Government, only 21,000 people were on that waiting list, so will you reconsider your comment and apologise to those people who are now on Labour's waiting list?

Carwyn Jones: That apology will be forthcoming when the Conservatives

Gwnaf droi at iechyd. Ceir llawer o sôn am iechyd; ailadroddir yr un ffigurau droeon. Mae'r ddarpariaeth iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yng Nghymru'n gwella. Caiff Plaid Cymru fychanu ymdrechion pawb yn GIG Cymru yn feunyddiol ond, ochr yn ochr â'r galw sydd heb ei ateb, mae gwelliant gwirioneddol wrth gyflenwi gwasanaethau. Yr ydym wedi gostwng y nifer sy'n disgwyl yn hwy na 18 mis am lawdriniaeth orthopedig o 95 y cant. Yr oedd hynny'n gofyn llawer o arian a llawer o ymdrech gan lawer o bobl, ond gwnaethom lwyddo.

Os ystyriwch dargedau eraill—mewn gofal canser a thriniaeth y galon—cewch yr un record o lwyddiant. O ganlyniad i'r cynnydd mewn buddsoddi, cafwyd 150 yn rhagor o feddygon, 990 yn rhagor o nyrsys ac wyth ysbyty newydd. Fodd bynnag, yr un mor bwysig â hynny yw ein buddsoddiad mewn capasiti ar gyfer y tymor hir, sy'n cynnwys cyfleusterau hyfforddi newydd yng Nghaerdydd, y Gogledd ac Abertawe—a Gwent sydd nesaf. Esgeuluswyd yr holl faterion hynny gan y Llywodraeth Doriaidd flaenorol am 18 mlynedd hir.

Nick Bourne *a gododd*—

Carwyn Jones: Yr ydym yn cynnig mwy o gymorth i bobl oeddrannus yn eu cartrefi, fel rhan o strategaeth sy'n ymateb i newid demograffig ac i'n hamcan o roi cyfle i bobl barhau i fod mor annibynnol ag y dewisant. Un rhan o'r strategaeth honno i hyrwyddo a chynnal y gallu i fyw'n annibynnol yw chwe wythnos o ofal personol am ddim i bobl sy'n gadael yr ysbyty.

Nick Bourne: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ailystyried ei sylw am y nifer o bobl ar restrau aros a'r ffaith ei fod wedi'i wfftio fel ystadegyn yn unig? Mae 82,460 o bobl sydd â phob rheswm i fod yn ddig wrth eich Llywodraeth Lafur chi. Bedair blynedd yn ôl, gwnaethoch addo na fyddent ar restr aros, ond maent. Pan ddaethoch i Lywodraeth, dim ond 21,000 a oedd ar y rhestr aros honno, felly a wnewch ailystyried y sylw a wnaethoch ac ymddiheuro i'r bobl hynny sydd ar restr aros Llafur yn awr?

Carwyn Jones: Ceir yr ymddiheuriad hwnnw pan wnaiff y Ceidwadwyr

apologise for the 18 years of underinvestment in the health service, cutting the number of beds, doctors and services available. The NHS dentist problem began with them, because they cut fees.

David Davies: The Minister talks about cutting the number of beds, but is he not aware that they were usually in psychiatric wards? We took people out of Victorian institutions and put them into the community to live fulfilling lives.

Carwyn Jones: I am stunned by that, because the experience of all those involved with care in the community from the beginning is that people were chucked out of those institutions onto the street, and the institutions were then sold at great profit by those running the health service at the time—with the approval of the Conservative Party.

Consider free bus passes for elderly and disabled people. That has been an outstandingly cost-effective way of improving people's quality of life, assisting independent lifestyles and supporting public transport. A simple policy with multiple effects; real joined-up Government. Our policy of free access to galleries and museums has had the same results.

Consider Communities First—socialism in action. That strategy aims to give people in our 100 poorest communities the power, capacity and ambition to demand their place in the Welsh economy and their share of learning opportunities, health and social care. That is what Plaid Cymru calls failure; it is what we call success. Plaid Cymru is the failure for not recognising that.

Plaid Cymru said that we would run away from the electorate. No way. We will put our policies and our programme before the electorate of Wales on 1 May with confidence and absolute faith in its judgment. The opposition parties should be warned: the day of judgment is at hand.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: It is nice to see that the Ministers have returned to the Chamber.

ymddiheuro am y 18 mlynedd o danfuddsoddi yn y gwasanaeth iechyd, o ostwng nifer y gwelyau, y meddygon a'r gwasanaethau sydd ar gael. Hwyl a roddodd gychwyn i'r broblem a geir o ran deintyddion yn y GIG, drwy dorri ffioedd.

David Davies: Mae'r Gweinidog yn sôn am ostwng nifer y gwelyau, ond oni wyl mai mewn wardiau seiciatryddol yr oedd y rhan fwyaf ohonynt? Aethom â phobl o sefydliadau Fictoraidd a'u rhoi yn y gymuned i fyw bywydau cyflawn.

Carwyn Jones: Mae hynny'n fy syfrdanu, oherwydd profiad pawb a fu'n gysylltiedig â gofal yn y gymuned o'r dechrau yw bod pobl wedi'u taflu i'r stryd o'r sefydliadau hynny, a bod y sefydliadau wedi'u gwerthu wedyn am elw mawr gan y rhai a oedd yn rhedeg y gwasanaeth iechyd ar y pryd—gyda chymeradwyaeth y Blaid Geidwadol.

Ystyriwch docynnau bws am ddim i bobl oedranus a phobl anabl. Bu hynny'n fodd eithriadol o gost-effeithiol o wella ansawdd bywyd pobl, hyrwyddo ffyrdd o fyw annibynnol a chefnogi trafndiaeth gyhoeddus. Polisi syml ag iddo effeithiau lluosog; Llywodraeth gydgyssylltiedig yng ngwir ystyr y gair. Yr un fu canlyniadau ein polisi o gynnig mynediad am ddim i orielau ac amgueddfeydd.

Ystyriwch Cymunedau yn Gyntaf—sosiolaeth ar waith. Nod y strategaeth honno yw rhoi'r grym, y gallu a'r uchelgais i bobl yn ein 100 cymuned dlotaf fel y gallant hawlio eu lle yn economi Cymru a'u cyfran o gyfleoedd dysgu, iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Methiant y mae Plaid Cymru yn galw hynny; llwyddiant yr ydym ni'n ei alw. Plaid Cymru sydd wedi methu am nad yw'n cydnabod hynny.

Dywedodd Plaid Cymru y byddem yn rhedeg oddi wrth yr etholwyr. Dim o gwbl. Rhoddwn ein polisiâu a'n rhaglen gerbron etholwyr Cymru yn hyderus ar 1 Mai gan ymddiried yn llwyr yn eu barn. Dylid rhoi rhybudd i'r gwrthbleidiau: mae dydd y farn gerllaw.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Braf yw gweld bod y Gweinidogion wedi dod yn ôl i'r Siambr. Yn

As usual, they are too late to defend their record. The coalition has done what it always does: when in trouble, roll out Carwyn Jones. He has surpassed himself today. He took credit for reducing primary school class sizes. The birth rate has decreased, Carwyn—I presume that you take responsibility for that, too. That is the reason why primary school class sizes are smaller. Perhaps you would like to defend the record on secondary schools and tell us why you have failed miserably to reduce secondary school class sizes. Carwyn returned to his former incarnation as a barrister, gallantly trying to argue a case in which he does not believe. He did not even give the impression that he believed in it.

The Ministers have now returned. Unfortunately, you have missed a catalogue of your failures. That is the trend of this Government: Ministers appear for pictures and take the credit, but once they have to take responsibility, they run a mile from any decision. Consider ELWa and the £4 million that mischievously found its way into the bank account of an independent company. The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning told us that she took a general policy decision on that. How do you take a general policy decision, Minister? Do you look at the figures and the details, or do you just generally agree to it? When you have to take responsibility, you are not there. You do not want to know. You were at the Pop Factory every other week when there were pictures and credit to be taken. Once you had to take responsibility, you walked away.

I turn to the Minister for Health and Social Services. The Labour Government made two promises on health. The first was on outpatient waiting times; there are 82,000 failures on that. The second was on in-patient waiting times, where there are 5,000 failures. The Minister has not even bothered to apologise to the Welsh public and to those who are suffering on those waiting lists. Despite all this, you tell us that you have succeeded.

ôl eu harfer, maent yn rhy hwyr i amddiffyn eu record. Gwnaeth y glymblaid yr hyn a wnaiff bob amser: os yw mewn trafferthion, mae'n rhoi Carwyn Jones ymlaen. Gwnaeth yn well nag erioed heddiw. Cymerodd y clod am leihau maint dosbarthiadau ysgol gynradd. Mae'r gyfradd genedigaethau wedi gostwng, Carwyn—cymeraf eich bod yn derbyn y cyfrifoldeb am hynny, hefyd. Dyna pam y mae maint dosbarthiadau ysgol gynradd yn llai. Efallai yr hoffech amddiffyn y record ar ysgolion uwchradd a dweud pam yr ydych wedi methu'n druenus â lleihau maint dosbarthiadau ysgol uwchradd. Aeth Carwyn yn ôl i'w ymgnawdoliad blaenorol fel bargyfreithiwr, gan geisio dadlau'n ddewr dros achos nad yw'n credu ynddo. Ni roddodd yr argraff ei fod yn credu ynddo hyd yn oed.

Mae'r Gweinidogion wedi dychwelyd. Gwaetha'r modd, yr ydych wedi colli rhestr o'ch methiannau. Mae hynny'n duedd gan y Llywodraeth hon: mae Gweinidogion yn dod i'r golwg i gael tynnu eu llun a chymryd y clod, ond pan fo'n rhaid iddynt gymryd cyfrifoldeb, maent yn ffoi rhag unrhyw benderfyniad. Ystyriwch ELWa a'r £4 miliwn a ganfu ei ffordd yn ddireidus i gyfrif banc cwmni annibynnol. Dywedodd y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes wrthym ei bod wedi gwneud penderfyniad polisi cyffredinol ar hynny. Sut yr ydych yn gwneud penderfyniad polisi cyffredinol, Weinidog? A ydych yn edrych ar y ffigurau a'r manylion, neu a ydych yn cytuno'n gyffredinol i'w wneud? Pan fo'n rhaid ichi gymryd cyfrifoldeb, nid ydych ar gael. Nid ydych am wybod. Buoch yn y Pop Factory bob yn ail wythnos pan oedd lluniau i'w tynnu a chlod i'w gymryd. Pan oedd yn rhaid ichi gymryd cyfrifoldeb, gwnaethoch ei osgoi.

Trof at y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Gwnaeth y Llywodraeth Lafur ddwy addewid ar iechyd. Yr oedd y gyntaf ar amseroedd aros cleifion allanol; mae 82,000 o fethiannau ar hynny. Yr oedd yr ail ar amseroedd aros cleifion mewnol, lle y mae 5,000 o fethiannau. Nid yw'r Gweinidog hyd yn oed wedi trafferthu ymddiheuro i'r cyhoedd yng Nghymru ac i'r rhai sy'n dioddef ar y rhestrau aros hynny. Er gwaethaf hynny oll, yr ydych yn dweud ichi

lwyddo.

What about the Deputy First Minister and Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad? If it is not the fault of a computer, it is that of an official—anybody apart from Michael German, who will not take responsibility. It is not surprising that the Ministers were not here to defend their record.

The Minister for Economic Development tells us that he understands economic issues. He will not take interventions, and he will not answer questions unless he is reading the answer given to him by officials. In the four years that Labour has been in government in the Assembly, 17,000 net jobs have been lost in manufacturing. How do you explain that? You tell us that you have created jobs through Objective 1. Have you read Professor Dylan Jones-Evans's assessment of those jobs? Half those jobs will disappear. Have you read the comments of Dr Phillip Boland of the University of Wales, Cardiff? He does not believe that this is sustainable. Russell Lawson of the Federation of Small Businesses does not believe you when you make these claims.

The record is clear. Carwyn tells us that Labour will go to the electorate with its policies and its programmes. It will not go to the electorate with its record on 1 May, because it knows what will happen. We know what will happen on 1 May.

We have a First Minister who is supposed to lead this coalition Government. Can we ever get vision or leadership from him? Take the Assembly building for example. It is hardly surprising that there is a fence around the site of the Assembly building—the First Minister has been sitting on it for the last three years. We have never had a statement from him on the Assembly building. He does not have a view on the pay negotiations with the Fire Brigades Union. He does not have a view on Iraq. On what do you have a view, First Minister? What are your leadership qualities? What are you trying to tell the Welsh public—People expect—

Beth am y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor? Os nad cyfrifiadur sydd ar fai, rhoddir y bai ar swyddog—unrhyw un heblaw Michael German, na wnaiff gymryd cyfrifoldeb. Nid yw'n syndod nad oedd y Gweinidogion yma i amddiffyn eu record.

Dywed y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd wrthym ei fod yn deall materion economaidd. Ni wnaiff dderbyn ymyriadau, ac ni wnaiff ateb cwestiynau oni bai ei fod yn darllen yr ateb a roddwyd iddo gan swyddogion. Yn y pedair blynedd y bu Llafur mewn llywodraeth yn y Cynulliad, collwyd 17,000 o swyddi net mewn gweithgynhyrchu. Sut yr eglurwch hynny? Dywedwch wrthym eich bod wedi creu swyddi drwy Amcan 1. A ydych wedi darllen asesiad yr Athro Dylan Jones-Evans o'r swyddi hynny? Bydd hanner y swyddi hynny'n diflannu. A ydych wedi darllen sylwadau Dr Phillip Boland o Brifysgol Cymru, Caerdydd? Nid yw ef yn credu bod hyn yn gynaliadwy. Nid yw Russell Lawson o Ffederasiwn y Busnesau Bach yn eich credu pan wnewch yr honiadau hyn.

Mae'r record yn amlwg. Dywed Carwyn yr aiff Llafur at yr etholwyr gyda'i bolisiau a'i raglenni. Nid aiff â'i record at yr etholwyr ar 1 Mai, gan y gŵyr beth fydd yn digwydd. Gwyddom beth fydd yn digwydd ar 1 Mai.

Mae gennym Brif Weinidog sydd i fod i arwain y Llywodraeth glymblaid hon. A gawn weledigaeth neu arweiniad ganddo byth? Cymerwch adeilad y Cynulliad, er enghraifft. Prin ei fod yn syndod bod ffens o amgylch safle adeilad y Cynulliad—bu'r Prif Weinidog yn eistedd arni am y tair blynedd diwethaf. Ni chawsom ddatganiad ganddo erioed am adeilad y Cynulliad. Nid oes ganddo farn am y negodiadau tâl ag Undeb y Brigadau Tân. Nid oes ganddo farn am Irac. Am ba beth y mae gennych farn, Brif Weinidog? Beth yw'ch rhinweddau fel arweinydd? Beth yr ydych yn ceisio'i ddweud wrth y cyhoedd yng Nghymru? Mae pobl yn disgwyl—

Huw Lewis *rose*—

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Do not bother, Huw. It will be painful for you and embarrassing for your party. Trust me, it is a bad idea.

The people of Wales know the Government's record. On 1 May it will pay the price and we will have a Plaid Cymru Government in the Assembly.

Huw Lewis *a gododd*—

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Peidiwch â thrafferthu, Huw. Bydd yn boenus i chi ac yn codi cywilydd ar eich plaid. Cymerwch fy ngair i, nid yw'n syniad da.

Mae pobl Cymru'n gwybod beth yw record y Llywodraeth. Ar 1 Mai bydd yn talu'r pris a chawn Lywodraeth Plaid Cymru yn y Cynulliad.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 30, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 19.
Amendment 1: For 30, Abstain 0, Against 19.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

Bourne, Nick
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Edwards, Richard
Graham, William
Hancock, Brian
Jones, David Ian
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Rogers, Peter
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment accepted.*

Motion NDM1406 as amended:

the National Assembly for Wales believes that the Welsh Assembly Government has delivered the benefits of devolution to people throughout Wales through stable and innovative government, and the implementation of policies set out in its programme for government. Together these

Cynnig NDM1406 fel y'i diwygiwyd:

mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn credu bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi dod â manteision datganoli i bobl ledled Cymru drwy lywodraeth sefydlog ac arloesol, a thrwy weithredu'r polisiau a nodir yn ei rhaglen lywodraethu. Gyda'i gilydd, maent wedi gosod y seiliau ar gyfer dyfodol mwy teg

*have laid the foundations for a fairer and a ffyniannus.
more prosperous future.*

Cynnig (NDM1406): O blaid 31, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 18.

Motion (NDM1406): For 31, Abstain 0, Against 18.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

Bourne, Nick
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Hancock, Brian
Jones, David Ian
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Rogers, Peter
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings today's proceedings to a close. **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.35 p.m.
The session ended at 5.35 p.m.*