



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mercher 5 Mawrth 2003**

**Wednesday 5 March 2003**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 4 Cwestiynau ar Lywodraeth Leol i'r Gweinidog Cyllid  
*Questions on Local Government to the Finance Minister*
- 14 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd  
*Questions to the Minister for Environment*
- 26 Pwynt o Drefn  
*Point of Order*
- 28 Datganiad ar Ymateb y Llywodraeth i Adroddiad Blynyddol Comisiynydd Plant Cymru  
*Statement on the Government's Response to the Annual Report of the Children's Commissioner for Wales*
- 44 Datganiad ar Ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ar Ynni Adnewyddadwy  
*Statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's Response to the Economic Development Committee's Report on Renewable Energy*
- 54 Datganiad gan y Llywydd  
*Statement by the Presiding Officer*
- 54 Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Diwygio'r Heddlu 2002 (Cychwyn) 2003  
*Approval of the Police Reform Act 2002 (Commencement) Order 2003*
- 57 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Ariannu Ysgolion a Gynhelir (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003  
*Approval of the Financing of Maintained Schools (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003*
- 62 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Dreth Gyngor (Gweinyddu a Gorfodi) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003  
*Approval of the Council Tax (Administration and Enforcement) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003*
- 64 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Addysg (Cyflenwi Gwybodaeth) (Cymru) 2003  
*Approval of the Education (Supply of Information) (Wales) Regulations 2003*
- 67 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau (Trefniadau Ymsefydlu Athrawon) (Cymru) 2003  
*Approval of the Education (Induction Arrangements for School Teachers) (Wales) Regulations 2003*
- 71 Cymeradwyo Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) Adroddiad Grant Arbennig (Rhif 5) (Cymru) 2003  
*Approval of Local Government Finance (Wales) Special Grant Report (No. 5) (Wales) 2003*
- 75 Cymeradwyo Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) Adroddiad Grant Arbennig (Rhif 12) (Cymru) 2002  
*Approval of the Local Government Finance (Wales) Special Grant Report (No. 12) (Wales) 2002*
- 84 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Tir Gofal (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003  
*Approval of the Tir Gofal (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003*

89 Dadl Fer: Gweithio ar Draws Ffiniau  
*Short Debate: Cross-border Working*

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## **Cwestiynau ar Lywodraeth Leol i'r Gweinidog Cyllid Questions on Local Government to the Finance Minister**

### **Morâl Staff Cyngor Sir Caerdydd Staff Morale in Cardiff County Council**

**Q1 Jonathan Morgan:** What meeting has the Minister had with Cardiff County Council to assess staff morale within the authority? (OAQ22790)

**The Finance Minister (Edwina Hart):** I do not have such meetings with local authorities.

**Jonathan Morgan:** That is a great shame because Cardiff County Council is in crisis. It has been battling with an increase in council tax, which you have saddled it with. As the budget settlement was not sufficient, the council has had to raise council tax in the city by around 12 per cent, which will hit pensioners on fixed incomes and hard-working families. We also have the so-called Echogate scandal. A senior corporate official has been asking Labour Party members to write to the *South Wales Echo* to boost the Lord Mayor's image, and at the same time having a go at the First Minister, who has intervened in this matter. That is a disgrace. Do you agree that your party's actions in local government are affecting morale among employees, and is bringing local government into disrepute?

**Edwina Hart:** It is only the comments of Welsh Conservatives in this Chamber, who have never managed local government in Wales in any real sense, that are bringing local government into disrepute. Let me make it clear that Cardiff will receive £306 million of unhypothecated grant for 2003-04—a 7.2 per cent increase. Cardiff's problems have arisen because of the census; that is where the blame lies. Twenty eight per cent of the formula is based on population data, which is a great deal of income for Cardiff. Allegations have been made in the papers concerning a senior official, but that is a matter for Cardiff council. The official is employed by the council, and the council

**C1 Jonathan Morgan:** Pa gyfarfod y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i gael â Chyngor Sir Caerdydd i asesu morâl y staff o fewn yr awdurdod? (OAQ22790)

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Edwina Hart):** Ni châf gyfarfodydd o'r fath gydag awdurdodau lleol.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Mae hynny'n drueni mawr, oherwydd mae Cyngor Sir Caerdydd yn wynebu argyfwng. Bu'n brwydro â chynnydd yn y dreth gyngor, y gwnaethoch ei roi yn faich arno. Oherwydd nad oedd y setliad cyllideb yn ddigonol, bu'n rhaid i'r cyngor godi'r dreth gyngor yn y ddinas tua 12 y cant, a fydd yn ergyd i bensynwyr ar incwm sefydlog ac i deuluoedd sy'n gweithio. Mae gennym hefyd y sgandal Echogate, fel y'i gelwir. Mae uwch swyddog corfforaethol wedi bod yn gofyn i aelodau'r Blaid Lafur ysgrifennu at y *South Wales Echo* i roi hwb i ddelwedd yr Arglwydd Faer, ac ar yr un pryd ymosod ar y Prif Weinidog, a ymyrrodd yn y mater hwn. Mae hynny'n warth. A gytunwch fod gweithredoedd eich plaid mewn llywodraeth leol yn effeithio ar y morâl ymysg cyflogaion, ac yn dwyn anfri ar lywodraeth leol?

**Edwina Hart:** Dim ond sylwadau Ceidwadwyr Cymru, nad ydynt erioed wedi rheoli llywodraeth leol o ddifrif yng Nghymru, yn y Siambr hon sy'n dwyn anfri ar lywodraeth leol. Gadewch imi ei gwneud yn glir y bydd Caerdydd yn derbyn grant heb ei bridianu o £306 miliwn ar gyfer 2003-04—cynnydd o 7.2 y cant. Deilliodd problemau Caerdydd o'r cyfrifiad; dyna wraidd y broblem. Mae 28 y cant o'r fformiwla yn seiliedig ar ddata poblogaeth, sy'n gryn dipyn o incwm i Gaerdydd. Gwnaethpwyd honiadau yn y papurau ynglŷn ag uwch swyddog, ond mater i gyngor Caerdydd yw hynny. Cyflogir y swyddog gan y cyngor, a rhaid i'r cyngor ddelio ag unrhyw

must deal with any problems with its employees. I would not expect the leader of Cardiff council to come over and have a chat with me about staff morale in the National Assembly, and I certainly will not do so with him.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Staff morale in the public sector, including in Cardiff council, has been undermined over many years by the introduction of anti-union legislation. Will you commit to discussing the repeal of that Tory legislation with the UK Government?

**Edwina Hart:** The UK Government did an excellent job in considering existing legislation when it came to power in 1997. However, I remain committed to ensuring that we have the best quality legislation across Europe in respect of trade union rights.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 2 (OAQ22788) yn ôl.

broblemau gyda'i gyflogeion. Ni fyddwn yn disgwyl i arweinydd cyngor Caerdydd ddod draw i gael sgwrs gyda mi ynglŷn â morâl staff yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ac yn sicr ni fyddaf innau yn gwneud hynny gydag ef.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Tanseiliwyd morâl staff yn y sector cyhoeddus, gan gynnwys cyngor Caerdydd, dros flynyddoedd lawer drwy gyflwyno deddfwriaeth gwrth-undebol. A wnewch chi ymrwymo i drafod diddymu'r ddeddfwriaeth Doriaidd honno gyda Llywodraeth y DU?

**Edwina Hart:** Gwnaeth Llywodraeth y DU waith ardderchog wrth ystyried y ddeddfwriaeth bresennol pan ddaeth i rym yn 1997. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn ymrwymedig o hyd i sicrhau bod gennym y ddeddfwriaeth o'r ansawdd orau yn Ewrop o ran hawliau undebau llafur.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 2 (OAQ22788) has been withdrawn.

### **Partneriaethau Gostwng Troseddu ac Anhrefn Crime and Disorder Reduction Partnerships**

**C3 David Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar sut y mae partneriaethau gostwng troseddu ac anhrefn yn cael eu hariannu? (OAQ22808)

**Edwina Hart:** Eighty per cent of the partnerships' funding has come from the Assembly and the Home Office. I recently announced £11.2 million for the next three years for the new safer communities fund, 75 per cent of which will go to partnerships for projects to reduce crime and disorder.

**David Lloyd:** A oes strategaeth benodol felly i ariannu'r partneriaethau hyn yn y tymor hir, neu ai ar hap a damwain y bydd yn digwydd?

**Edwina Hart:** It is not done on an ad hoc basis. We must consider the funding streams that accompany the three-year Government expenditure patterns. However, we need to secure funding in this area. I will be happy to come back to you on this matter when I have made further inquiries. We must be positive about the extra work carried out by the

**Q3 David Lloyd:** Will the Minister make a statement on how crime and disorder reduction partnerships are funded? (OAQ22808)

**Edwina Hart:** Daeth 80 y cant o arian y partneriaethau gan y Cynulliad a'r Swyddfa Gartref. Cyhoeddais yn ddiweddar y rhoddid £11.2 miliwn ar gyfer y tair blynedd nesaf i'r gronfa cymunedau diogelach newydd, y bydd 75 y cant ohono yn mynd i bartneriaethau ar gyfer prosiectau i leihau troseddu ac anhrefn.

**David Lloyd:** Is there a specific strategy therefore to fund these partnerships in the long term or will it be done on an ad hoc basis?

**Edwina Hart:** Nid yw'n digwydd ar hap a damwain. Rhaid inni ystyried y ffrydiau ariannu sy'n cyd-fynd â phatrymau gwariant tair blynedd y Llywodraeth. Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni sicrhau arian yn y maes hwn. Yr wyf yn fodlon dychwelyd atoch ynghylch y mater hwn ar ôl imi wneud ymholiadau pellach. Rhaid inni fod yn gadarnhaol am y

partnerships; they should be allowed to continue and prosper.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call Peter Law.

**Peter Law:** Sorry, Presiding Officer, I did not want to ask a supplementary on this question. I was trying to get your attention to ask a supplementary on the next question, not on this one.

**The Presiding Officer:** In that case, I will await the next question with interest.

**Alun Cairns:** Skewen Community Council in the Aberavon constituency has expressed a desire to install closed circuit television. It has been in touch with the crime and disorder partnership, which has stated that capital funding is available, but funding the maintenance and monitoring of the service that is required is an issue. What plans does the Minister have to support, not only the community council based in Skewen, but community councils across the whole of Wales, and enable them to introduce such a scheme?

**Edwina Hart:** We discussed CCTV this morning in the Local Government and Housing Committee. I have agreed to consider the funding strands and report back to the Committee. I am sure that that information would be of interest to all Members and I will place the report in the Library.

### **Cynrychiolaeth Gyfrannol ar gyfer Etholiadau Llywodraeth Leol Proportional Representation for Local Government Elections**

**Q4 Kirsty Williams:** Will the Minister make a statement on proportional representation for local government elections? (OAQ22801)

**Edwina Hart:** I refer you to the Local Government and Housing Committee's discussions on 11 December and 15 January.

**Kirsty Williams:** Have you had any discussions with your Labour Party colleagues in Scotland, who see the benefits of introducing proportional representation for local government elections in Scotland?

gwaith ychwanegol a wneir gan y partneriaethau; dylid caniatáu iddynt barhau a ffynnu.

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf ar Peter Law.

**Peter Law:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Lywydd, nid wyf am ofyn cwestiwn atodol i'r cwestiwn hwn. Yr oeddwn yn ceisio tynnu eich sylw er mwyn gofyn cwestiwn atodol i'r cwestiwn nesaf, nid i'r cwestiwn hwn.

**Y Llywydd:** Os felly, arhosaf yn awchus am y cwestiwn nesaf.

**Alun Cairns:** Dymuna Cyngor Cymuned Sgiwen yn etholaeth Aberafan osod teledu cylch cyfyng. Cysylltodd â'r bartneriaeth troseddu ac anhrefn, a nododd bod arian cyfalaf ar gael, ond mae ariannu'r broses o gynnal a chadw a monitro'r gwasanaeth yn broblem. Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Gweinidog i gefnogi, nid yn unig gyngor cymuned Sgiwen, ond cynghorau cymuned ledled Cymru, a'u galluogi i gyflwyno cynllun o'r fath?

**Edwina Hart:** Trafodwyd teledu cylch cyfyng gennym y bore yma yn y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai. Cytunais i ystyried y ffrydiau ariannu ac adrodd yn ôl i'r Pwyllgor. Yr wyf yn sicr y byddai'r wybodaeth honno o ddiddordeb i bob Aelod a byddaf yn rhoi'r adroddiad yn y Llyfrgell.

**C4 Kirsty Williams:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ddefnyddio cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol ar gyfer etholiadau llywodraeth leol? (OAQ22801)

**Edwina Hart:** Fe'ch cyfeiriaf at drafodaethau'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai ar 11 Rhagfyr a 15 Ionawr.

**Kirsty Williams:** A ydych wedi cael unrhyw drafodaethau gyda'ch cyd-aelodau o'r Blaid Lafur yn yr Alban, sy'n gweld manteision cyflwyno cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol ar gyfer etholiadau llywodraeth leol yn yr Alban? Pa

What discussions have you had with the Welsh Local Government Association to ascertain its level of support in terms of improving local government in this way?

**Edwina Hart:** I have had no discussions with any of the parties mentioned.

**William Graham:** Do you agree that, given that we have committed the electorate in Wales to practically one election every year until 2011, we require stability in our voting system, and that voter fatigue has a greater impact on participation in elections than changing the voting system?

**Edwina Hart:** We are all concerned, across the parties, about voter fatigue and the lack of interest in voting. The most useful issues outlined by the Sunderland report were those of greater participation in the electoral and democratic processes, for which there is cross-party support.

**Peter Law:** Do you agree that PR is a perversion of democracy and a distortion of reality? That is my experience of the representation in this Chamber. Furthermore, will you join me in congratulating a man of principle, your deputy Peter Black, who, at a recent meeting of the Local Government and Housing Committee, abstained on a vote on Plaid Cymru's motion calling for the use of PR in local government elections? The motion fell as a result.

**Edwina Hart:** We will have to consider the minutes of that Committee meeting; we will discuss the issue further after the Assembly elections.

**Janet Ryder:** I am glad that Peter stated that we had put forward the idea of proportional representation because it is the best way of ensuring that every single vote counts and that the end result represents the proportion of the votes cast for each party. A recent survey by the Electoral Reform Society showed that over 70 per cent of the people who responded would prefer a form of PR. Therefore Minister, do you believe that you and the Labour Party are, yet again, standing

drafodaethau yr ydych wedi eu cael â Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru i ddarganfod lefel ei chefnogaeth o ran gwella llywodraeth leol yn y ffordd hon?

**Edwina Hart:** Nid wyf wedi cael trafodaethau ag unrhyw un a grybwyllwyd.

**William Graham:** A ydych yn cytuno, gan ein bod wedi ymrwymo etholwyr yng Nghymru i un etholiad y flwyddyn bron hyd 2011, bod angen sefydlogrwydd yn ein system bleidleisio, a bod diflastod pleidleiswyr yn cael mwy o effaith ar gymryd rhan mewn etholiadau na newid y system bleidleisio?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr ydym i gyd yn pryderu, ym mhob plaid, ynglŷn â diflastod pleidleiswyr a'r diffyg diddordeb mewn pleidleisio. Y materion mwyaf defnyddiol a amlinellwyd yn adroddiad Sunderland oedd y rhai yn ymwneud â chyfranogiad mwy mewn prosesau etholiadol a democrataidd, ac mae cefnogaeth drawsbleidiol i hynny.

**Peter Law:** A gytunwch fod cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol yn gwyrdroi democratiaeth ac yn aflunio realiti? Dyna fy mhrofiad i o'r gynrychiolaeth yn y Siambr hon. Hefyd, a wnewch chi ymuno â mi i longyfarch dyn o egwyddor, eich dirprwy Peter Black, y bu iddo, mewn cyfarfod diweddar o'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai, ymatal ei bleidlais ar gynnig Plaid Cymru yn galw am ddefnyddio cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol mewn etholiadau llywodraeth leol? O ganlyniad, methodd y cynnig.

**Edwina Hart:** Rhaid inni ystyried cofnodion y cyfarfod Pwyllgor hwnnw; trafodwn y mater ymhellach wedi etholiadau'r Cynulliad.

**Janet Ryder:** Yr wyf yn falch bod Peter wedi datgan mai ni a gynigiodd y syniad o gynrychiolaeth gyfrannol oherwydd dyna'r ffordd orau o sicrhau bod pob pleidlais yn cyfrif a bod y canlyniad yn cynrychioli cyfran y pleidleisiau ar gyfer pob plaid. Mewn arolwg diweddar gan y Gymdeithas Diwygio Etholiadol dangoswyd y byddai'n well gan fwy na 70 y cant o'r bobl a ymatebodd ryw fath o gynrychiolaeth gyfrannol. Felly Weinidog, a gredwch eich

in the way of people who have expressed a strong opinion in favour of PR?

**Edwina Hart:** I always find that if I want to get a result from a survey, I ask the right questions. I understand that there is an interest in PR across the country, but to ensure achievements in Wales, you have to vote for Labour.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 5 (OAQ22822) yn ôl.

bod chi a'r Blaid Lafur, unwaith eto yn rhwystro pobl sydd wedi mynegi barn yn gryf o blaid cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf bob amser yn cael mai'r ffordd orau o gael canlyniad o arolwg yw gofyn y cwestiynau cywir. Deallaf fod diddordeb mewn cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol ar draws y wlad, ond er mwyn sicrhau llwyddiannau yng Nghymru, rhaid pleidleisio dros Lafur.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 5 (OAQ22822) has been withdrawn.

### **Mesur ar Dai Ambreswyliaeth Bill on Houses in Multiple Occupation**

**Q6 Owen John Thomas:** What discussions has the Minister had with her counterpart in Westminster in order to influence the content and timing of a Bill on houses in multiple occupation? (OAQ22798)

**Edwina Hart:** I have been in regular contact with Westminster colleagues over the content and timing of the proposed housing Bill.

**Owen John Thomas:** There is a growing housing crisis in the city of Cardiff resulting from a combination of factors, one of which is the loss to would-be home seekers of a wide choice of privately rented flats and maisonettes. By now, such premises are largely rented only as housing units to be shared by groups of students. In that way, landlords avoid costly and strict regulations applied to flats as well as the need to pay council tax. The up-keep of such properties is often minimal and pays little regard to the feelings of those in the wider community. Will you press your Westminster counterpart to expedite the introduction of the long-awaited houses in multiple occupation measure and ensure that all privately owned rented property, including student accommodation, will be covered by the requirements of the Bill?

**Edwina Hart:** We are all concerned about this. This Government is committed to introducing a national mandatory licensing scheme that aims to provide safe and acceptable living conditions without reducing

**C6 Owen John Thomas:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael gyda'i chyfatebydd yn San Steffan gyda'r bwriad o ddylanwadu ar gynnwys ac amseriad Mesur ar dai mewn ambreswyliaeth? (OAQ22798)

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf wedi bod mewn cysylltiad yn rheolaidd â'n cyd-aelodau yn San Steffan ynglŷn â chynnwys ac amseriad y Mesur tai arfaethedig.

**Owen John Thomas:** Mae'r argyfwng tai yn gwaethygu yn ninas Caerdydd, ac mae'n deillio o gyfuniad o ffactorau, gan gynnwys y golled i'r rhai a fyddai'n edrych am gartref o'r dewis eang o fflatiau a fflatiau deulawr a gaiff eu rhentu'n breifat. Erbyn hyn, mae eiddo o'r fath yn cael ei osod ar rent gan amlaf fel unedau tai i'w rhannu gan grwpiau o fyfyrwyr yn unig. Drwy hynny, mae landlordiaid yn osgoi rheoliadau costus a llym sy'n berthnasol i fflatiau yn ogystal â'r angen i dalu'r dreth gyngor. Ychydig o waith cynnal a chadw sydd mewn tai o'r fath yn aml iawn ac ni ystyrir teimladau'r rhai hynny yn y gymuned ehangach. A wnewch chi bwysu ar eich cyd-Weinidog yn San Steffan i gyflymu'r broses o gyflwyno'r Mesur hir ddisgwyliedig ar dai mewn ambreswyliaeth a sicrhau ei fod yn cwmpasu pob eiddo preifat ar rent, gan gynnwys llety myfyrwyr?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr ydym i gyd yn pryderu ynglŷn â hyn. Mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn ymrwymedig i gyflwyno cynllun trwyddedu gorfodol cenedlaethol gyda'r bwriad o ddarparu amgylchiadau byw diogel a



the supply of private-rented accommodation. The licensing proposals include changing the legal definition of houses in multiple occupation to bring many more properties, including additional student accommodation, into the ambit of registration. I would be pleased to press the point, if you wish, with the UK Government.

derbyniol heb leihau'r cyflenwad o lety a gaiff ei rentu'n breifat. Mae'r cynigion trwyddedu yn cynnwys newid y diffiniad cyfreithiol o dai mewn amlbreswyliaeth er mwyn dod â llawer mwy o eiddo, gan gynnwys llety myfyrwyr ychwanegol, o dan yr amodau cofrestru. Byddwn yn fodlon pwysu ar Lywodraeth San Steffan ynglŷn â'r mater hwn, os dymunwch.

2.10 p.m.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 7 (OAQ22802) has been withdrawn.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 7 (OAQ22802) yn ôl.

### **Adnewyddu Stoc Dai Hŷn Renewal of Older Housing Stock**

**Q8 Brian Gibbons:** What plans are there to promote the renewal of older private housing stock in Wales? (OAQ22824)

**C8 Brian Gibbons:** Pa gynlluniau sydd ar y gweill i hybu adnewyddu stoc dai hŷn yng Nghymru? (OAQ22824)

**Edwina Hart:** The plans to promote the renewal of older private housing stock are set out in the national housing strategy. Next year, we will provide over £20 million to support existing and new housing renewal areas and a further £31 million for strategic housing schemes, many of which involve the renewal of older private housing. We are also encouraging local authorities to take full advantage of improved accessibility and opportunities to renew older housing, following recent changes made to the private sector renewal arrangements.

**Edwina Hart:** Nodir y cynlluniau i hyrwyddo adnewyddu stoc dai hŷn yn y strategaeth dai genedlaethol. Y flwyddyn nesaf, byddwn yn darparu dros £20 miliwn i gynnal ardaloedd adnewyddu tai newydd a'r rhai sydd eisoes yn bodoli a £31 miliwn yn ychwanegol ar gyfer cynlluniau tai strategol, y mae llawer ohonynt yn ymwneud ag adnewyddu tai preifat hŷn. Yr ydym hefyd yn annog awdurdodau lleol i fanteisio i'r eithaf ar well hygyrchedd a chyfleoedd i adnewyddu tai hŷn, o ganlyniad i newidiadau diweddar yn nhrefniadau adnewyddu'r sector preifat.

**Brian Gibbons:** That is good news. You are probably aware of the recent excellent report on energy efficiency by the Economic Development Committee. It states that one of the most challenging aspects of improving energy efficiency in Wales is the older solid-walled properties that are not close to a mains gas network. Do you consider that, as part of an overall strategic approach to housing in Wales, we need to examine this category of housing?

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae hynny'n newyddion da. Yr ydych yn ôl pob tebyg yn ymwybodol o adroddiad diweddar ardderchog y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ar effeithlonrwydd ynni. Mae'n nodi mai un o'r agweddau mwyaf heriol ar wella effeithlonrwydd ynni yng Nghymru yw'r eiddo sydd â waliau soled hŷn ac nad ydynt yn agos at rwydwaith nwy. A ydych yn ystyried, fel rhan o ymagwedd strategol gyffredinol tuag at dai yng Nghymru, bod angen inni ystyried y categori hwn o dai?

**Edwina Hart:** Yes, I would be delighted, on the back of that excellent report, to undertake some work on that.

**Edwina Hart:** Ar sail yr adroddiad ardderchog hwnnw, byddai'n bleser gennyf ymgymryd â pheth gwaith ar hynny.

**Janet Davies:** The Chartered Institute of

**Janet Davies:** Mae ymateb y Sefydliad

Housing's response to the Assembly Government's plans for housing notes that credit approvals for private housing repair grants halved during the 1990s and have not been increased in real terms since. I know that you are in a highly combative mood today, but will you tell me how you propose to fund these needs?

**Edwina Hart:** When I consider the whole issue of housing, I will take all these issues on board in the next planning round. I have made changes and I have increased the budget. I want that to be an ongoing process.

**William Graham:** You will have noted the Joseph Rowntree Foundation report, which highlighted that 92 per cent of assistance with housing costs goes to tenants and that half of those testified as being poor were in fact homeowners. Do you agree that we need to change the assumption that housing tenure is a measure of relative advantage and direct increased levels of funding to homeowners?

**Edwina Hart:** Given the number of private houses in Wales across the Valleys and other areas, that matter requires our attention. I will look into it and report back.

Siartredig Tai i gynlluniau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer tai yn nodi i gymeradwyaethau credyd ar gyfer grantiau i atgyweirio tai preifat hanneru yn ystod y 1990au ac nad ydynt wedi cynyddu mewn termau gwirioneddol ers hynny. Gwn eich bod mewn hwyliau ymosodol heddiw, ond a wnewch ddweud wrthyf sut yr ydych yn bwriadu ariannu'r anghenion hyn?

**Edwina Hart:** Pan ystyriaf y mater tai yn ei gyfanrwydd, byddaf yn ystyried yr holl faterion hyn yn y cylch cynllunio nesaf. Yr wyf wedi gwneud newidiadau ac yr wyf wedi cynyddu'r gyllideb. Yr wyf am i hynny fod yn broses barhaus.

**William Graham:** Byddwch wedi nodi adroddiad Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree, a amlygodd y ffaith bod 92 y cant o'r cymorth ar gyfer costau tai yn mynd i denantiaid a bod hanner y bobl y dywedir eu bod yn dlawd yn berchnogion tai mewn gwirionedd. A gytnwch bod yn rhaid inni newid y rhagdybiaeth bod daliadaeth tai yn fantais gymharol a chyfeirio mwy o arian i berchnogion tai?

**Edwina Hart:** O ystyried nifer y tai preifat yng Nghymru yn y Cymoedd ac mewn ardaloedd eraill, mae angen inni roi sylw i'r mater hwnnw. Fe archwiliaf y mater ac adrodd yn ôl arno.

### **Ymddygiad Gwrth-gymdeithasol Anti-social Behaviour**

**Q9 Ann Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on tackling anti-social behaviour? (OAQ22816)

**Edwina Hart:** Yes. Anti-social behaviour blights the lives of many communities and businesses across Wales, and it is no longer acceptable. We all recognise that the actions of a mindless few mean that many people live in fear. The wide-ranging measures available to deal with anti-social behaviour include the provisions of anti-social behaviour orders, which are being used increasingly in Wales. The police and community safety partnerships have acted on a number of fronts to tackle anti-social behaviour in order to build communities in which people can live without fear.

**C9 Ann Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar fynd i'r afael ag ymddygiad gwrth-gymdeithasol? (OAQ22816)

**Edwina Hart:** Gwnaf. Mae ymddygiad gwrth-gymdeithasol yn amharu ar fywydau llawer o gymunedau a busnesau ledled Cymru, ac nid yw'n dderbyniol mwyach. Yr ydym oll yn cydnabod bod gweithredoedd lleiafrif difeddwl yn golygu bod llawer o bobl yn byw mewn ofn. Mae'r mesurau cynhwysfawr sydd ar gael i ddelio ag ymddygiad gwrth-gymdeithasol yn cynnwys darpariaethau gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrth-gymdeithasol, sy'n cael eu defnyddio fwyfwy yng Nghymru. Mae'r heddlu a phartneriaethau diogelwch yn y gymuned wedi gweithredu ar nifer o wahanol

agweddau i fynd i'r afael ag ymddygiad gwrth-gymdeithasol er mwyn adeiladu cymunedau y gall pobl fyw ynddynt heb ofn.

**Ann Jones:** I share your appreciation of the regeneration work that is going on within communities. So often, the anti-social behaviour of a few halts that process. Will you consider urging the crime and disorder partnerships to make tackling anti-social behaviour and obtaining anti-social behaviour orders against those persistent offenders as a high priority in the expenditure of next year's money?

**Ann Jones:** Rhannaf eich gwerthfawrogiad o'r gwaith adfywio sy'n mynd rhagddo mewn cymunedau. Mor aml, mae ymddygiad gwrth-gymdeithasol ychydig o unigolion yn llesteirio'r broses honno. A wnewch chi ystyried annog y partneriaethau troseddu ac anhrefn i roi blaenoriaeth uchel i fynd i'r afael ag ymddygiad gwrth-gymdeithasol a sicrhau gorchmynion gwrth-gymdeithasol yn erbyn troseddwy'r parhaus wrth wario arian y flwyddyn nesaf?

**Edwina Hart:** I will take up your point, because North Wales Police is one of four forces in England and Wales to pilot on-the-spot fines for anti-social behaviour, and early indications are that these are working well.

**Edwina Hart:** Byddaf yn ystyried eich pwynt, gan fod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru yn un o bedwar heddlu yng Nghymru a Lloegr i gynnal cynllun peilot o ddirwyon yn y fan a'r lle am ymddygiad gwrth-gymdeithasol, a'r arwyddion cynnar yw bod y rhain yn gweithio'n dda.

**Glyn Davies:** Do you agree that the breakdown of discipline, often in schools, is a root cause of anti-social behaviour? Should we not be giving every possible support to headteachers who wish to introduce innovative ways of developing greater discipline in their schools?

**Glyn Davies:** A ydych yn cytuno mai methiant disgyblaeth, yn aml mewn ysgolion, sydd wrth wraidd ymddygiad gwrth-gymdeithasol? Oni ddylem fod yn rhoi pob cymorth posibl i benaethiaid ysgolion sy'n dymuno cyflwyno ffyrdd arloesol o ddatblygu mwy o ddisgyblaeth yn eu hysgolion?

**Edwina Hart:** It is important that we have an integrated approach across the Assembly to all these anti-social behaviour issues. That will include the wider education agenda and other Ministers and their portfolios. We must crack the issue because we need to deal with the apparent lack of respect for others in society.

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'n bwysig bod gennym ymagwedd integredig ar draws y Cynulliad tuag at yr holl faterion ymddygiad gwrth-gymdeithasol hyn. Bydd hynny'n cynnwys yr agenda addysg ehangach a Gweinidogion eraill a'u portffolios. Rhaid inni ddatrys y mater gan fod angen inni ddelio â'r diffyg parch, yn ôl pob golwg, tuag at eraill mewn cymdeithas.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Are you aware of the excellent work done by Cardiff council's community safety officer who has worked with the police to implement anti-social behaviour orders, three of which were recently successful in Cardiff?

**Lorraine Barrett:** A ydych yn ymwybodol o'r gwaith rhagorol a wnaed gan swyddog diogelwch yn y gymuned cyngor Caerdydd sydd wedi gweithio gyda'r heddlu i weithredu gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrth-gymdeithasol, gyda tri ohonynt yn llwyddiannus yng Nghaerdydd yn ddiweddar?

**Edwina Hart:** I am aware of the excellent work that is being undertaken by Cardiff council in that regard. Other local authorities

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r gwaith ardderchog sy'n cael ei wneud gan gyngor Caerdydd yn hynny o beth. Mae

have also been active in that area.

awdurdodau lleol eraill hefyd wedi bod yn weithgar yn y maes hwnnw.

**Pauline Jarman:** Regarding the Communities First partnership grants that are available, particularly for the setting up costs for CCTV, they also need to be monitored professionally as part of the active fight against crime. Will you seriously consider the need for greater flexibility within that grant system, so that the split between capital and revenue will enable us to continue offering good service to communities in Wales?

**Pauline Jarman:** Ynglŷn â'r grantiau partneriaeth Cymunedau yn Gyntaf sydd ar gael, yn arbennig ar gyfer costau gosod teledu cylch cyfyng, mae hefyd angen iddynt gael eu monitro'n broffesiynol fel rhan o'r frwydr yn erbyn troseddau. A wnewch chi ystyried o ddifrif yr angen am fwy o hyblygrwydd o fewn y system grant honno, fel bod y rhaniad rhwng cyfalaf a refeniw yn ein galluogi i barhau i gynnig gwasanaeth da i gymunedau yng Nghymru?

**Edwina Hart:** I will consider that, and perhaps I will address it in my report on CCTV funding to the Local Government and Housing Committee, which I promised this morning, if that would be helpful.

**Edwina Hart:** Byddaf yn ystyried hynny, ac efallai y cyfeiriai ato yn fy adroddiad ar ariannu teledu cylch cyfyng i'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai, yr addewais fore heddiw, os byddai hynny o gymorth.

#### **Ymgeiswyr mewn Etholiadau Cynghorau Council Election Candidates**

**Q10 Owen John Thomas:** Has Cardiff County Council sought guidance from the Minister concerning the interpretation of the rules concerning the residential qualifications of council election candidates? (OAQ22799)

**C10 Owen John Thomas:** A yw Cyngor Sir Caerdydd wedi gofyn am ganllawiau gan y Gweinidog ynghylch dehongli'r rheolau ynghylch cymwysterau preswyllo ymgeiswyr mewn etholiadau cynghorau? (OAQ22799)

**Edwina Hart:** No.

**Edwina Hart:** Naddo.

**Owen John Thomas:** Thank you for your reply, Minister. [*Laughter.*] I am that sure you will be aware of the disquiet that has been expressed in Cardiff recently at the lack of transparency in the apparent residential or business qualifications of at least one prominent Labour candidate. Is this not a matter that should concern you as the Minister responsible for local government, and one upon which you might expect to be consulted? If the administration of local government, and its openness, in particular, is not the responsibility of an Assembly Minister, then whose responsibility is it?

**Owen John Thomas:** Diolch am eich ateb, Weinidog. [*Chwerthin.*] Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r pryder sydd wedi'i fynegi yng Nghaerdydd yn ddiweddar ynglŷn â'r diffyg eglurder yng nghymwysterau preswyl neu fusnes o leiaf un ymgeisydd Llafur blaenllaw. Onid yw hwn yn fater a ddylai fod yn berthnasol i chi fel y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am lywodraeth leol, ac un y byddai disgwyl ichi ymgynghori yn ei gylch? Os nad cyfrifoldeb Gweinidog Cynulliad yw gweinyddu llywodraeth leol, a'i natur agored, yn arbennig, yna cyfrifoldeb pwy ydyw?

**Edwina Hart:** Local authorities' returning officers must ensure that candidates in local elections are qualified, as defined in the Local Government Act 1972.

**Edwina Hart:** Rhaid i swyddogion canlyniadau awdurdodau lleol sicrhau bod ymgeiswyr mewn etholiadau lleol yn gymwys, fel y diffinnir yn Neddf Lywodraeth Lleol 1972.

**Jonathan Morgan:** You may not have met Cardiff County Council to discuss the

**Jonathan Morgan:** Efallai nad ydych wedi cyfarfod â Chyngor Sir Caerdydd i drafod y

qualifications needed to be a local government candidate, but I am sure that the general secretary of the Labour Party has met with the Lord Mayor to discuss his qualifications. We have a Lord Mayor who does not live in the ward that he represents or in the city of which he is Lord Mayor. Do you agree that a one-quarter share in a house in Cathays may legally qualify as a business qualification for standing as a local government candidate, but does not really follow the spirit of the regulations and the law governing this area of local government?

**Edwina Hart:** I will not be embroiled in ongoing attempts to undermine the leader of Cardiff council.

**Y Llywydd:** Trosglwyddwyd cwestiwn 11 (OAQ22797) ar gyfer ateb ysgrifenedig. Tynnwyd cwestiynau 12 (OAQ22788), 13 (OAQ22805), ac 14 (OAQ22809) yn ôl.

cymwysterau sydd eu hangen i fod yn ymgeisydd llywodraeth leol, ond yr wyf yn siŵr bod ysgrifennydd cyffredinol y Blaid Lafur wedi cwrdd â'r Arglwydd Faer i drafod ei gymwysterau. Mae gennym Arglwydd Faer nad yw'n byw yn y ward y mae'n ei chynrychioli neu yn y ddinas y mae'n Arglwydd Faer arni. A gytunwch y gall bod yn berchen ar chwarter tŷ yn Cathays gymhwyso'n gyfreithiol fel cymhwyster busnes er mwyn sefyll fel ymgeisydd llywodraeth leol, ond nad yw mewn gwirionedd yn dilyn ysbryd y rheoliadau a'r gyfraith sy'n rheoli'r maes hwn o lywodraeth leol?

**Edwina Hart:** Ni fyddaf gael fy nghynnwys mewn ymdrechion parhaus i danseilio arweinydd cyngor Caerdydd.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 11 (OAQ22797) has been transferred for written answer. Questions 12 (OAQ22788), 13 (OAQ22805), and 14 (OAQ22809) are withdrawn.

### **Grantiau i Gynghorau Cymuned Grants to Community Councils**

**Q15 David Davies:** What plans does the Minister have to provide grants to community councils to improve amenities for young people? (OAQ22793)

**Edwina Hart:** Funding for the improvement of amenities for young people is available under the children and young people support fund and Communities First. Proposals for both forms of expenditure, worked up by the local partnerships, are open to community councils seeking to become involved in this process.

**David Davies:** I am glad that I prepared my supplementary. Community councils would no doubt wish that the process was as speedy and efficient as the Minister when answering questions. I have been dealing with one community council in Raglan, which has been trying for some time to provide a skateboard park for the local children. It cannot get enough money from the local authority, which is strapped for funds, as you are aware, Minister, but it is also unable to get anything from the Assembly. Will the

**C15 David Davies:** Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Gweinidog i roi grantiau i gynghorau cymuned er mwyn gwella amwynderau i bobl ifanc? (OAQ22793)

**Edwina Hart:** Mae arian ar gyfer gwella amwynderau ar gyfer pobl ifanc ar gael o dan gronfa cymorth i blant a phobl ifanc a Chymunedau yn Gyntaf. Mae cynigion ar gyfer y ddau fath o wariant, sydd wedi'u llunio gan bartneriaethau lleol, ar agor i gynghorau cymuned sy'n awyddus i ddod yn rhan o'r broses hon.

**David Davies:** Yr wyf yn falch fy mod wedi paratoi fy nghwestiwn atodol. Byddai cynghorau cymuned, bid siŵr yn awyddus i'r broses fod mor gyflym ac effeithlon â'r Gweinidog wrth iddi ateb cwestiynau. Yr wyf wedi bod yn delio ag un cyngor cymuned yn Rhaglan, sydd wedi bod yn ceisio darparu parc sgrialfyrddio ar gyfer plant lleol ers peth amser. Ni all gael digon o arian gan yr awdurdod lleol, sy'n brin o arian, fel y gwyddoch, Weinidog, ond ni all ychwaith gael dim gan y Cynulliad. A wnaiff y

Minister consider that situation in Raglan, and in other similar small villages, to ensure that young people have access to clean, healthy outdoor activities?

**Edwina Hart:** I agree that we should ensure that young people have access to good amenities. If you want to write to me on the specific issue of Raglan, I will take the matter on board, but Monmouthshire had an excellent council tax settlement.

**The Presiding Officer:** Thank you Minister. We have run out of questions, with two minutes remaining.

Gweinidog ystyried y sefyllfa yn Rhaglan, ac mewn pentrefi bychain eraill, i sicrhau bod gan bobl ifanc fynediad i weithgareddau awyr agored glân ac iach?

**Edwina Hart:** Cytunaf y dylem sicrhau bod gan bobl ifanc fynediad i amwynderau da. Os dymunwch ysgrifennu ataf ynglŷn â mater Rhaglan yn benodol, byddaf yn ystyried y mater, ond cafodd Sir Fynwy setliad treth yngor ardderchog.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch, Weinidog. Nid oes rhagor o gwestiynau, ac mae dwy funud yn weddill.

### Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd Questions to the Minister for Environment

#### Prosiect ULTra Caerdydd Cardiff ULTra Project

**Q1 Owen John Thomas:** What plans does the Minister have for the use of the funds available following the decision to cease funding the Cardiff ULTra project? (OAQ22841)

**The Minister for Environment (Sue Essex):** The funds to which you refer come from the transport grant scheme. The scheme supports local authority initiatives across Wales. It is allocated to specific schemes and initiatives based on the bid that we received, and not on the basis of local authority boundaries. This year, a total of 218 bids were received. If we had approved all of them, a total of £138 million would have been required for this year. Following careful assessment of the bids on 30 January 2003, I announced allocations using all of this year's budget provision. Cardiff's original bid for support for ULTra followed our encouragement to local authorities to promote innovative transport solutions. We have supported its development, as has the European Commission's evaluation and demonstration of innovative city transport project and the Department for Transport's innovative transport scheme.

2.20 p.m.

**Owen John Thomas:** I congratulate you on the sensible, if belated, decision to abandon

**C1 Owen John Thomas:** Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Gweinidog i ddefnyddio'r arian sydd ar gael yn dilyn y penderfyniad i beidio ag ariannu prosiect ULTra Caerdydd bellach? (OAQ22841)

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd (Sue Essex):** Mae'r arian y cyfeiriwch ato yn dod o'r cynllun grant trafndiaeth. Cefnoga'r cynllun fentrau awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru. Fe'i ddyrennir i gynlluniau a mentrau penodol yn seiliedig ar y cais a gawsom, ac nid ar sail ffiniau awdurdodau lleol. Eleni, cafwyd cyfanswm o 218 o geisiadau. Pe byddem wedi cymeradwyo pob un ohonynt, byddai wedi bod angen cyfanswm o £138 miliwn eleni. Yn dilyn asesiad gofalus o'r ceisiadau ar 30 Ionawr 2003, cyhoeddais ddyraniadau gan ddefnyddio'r gyllideb gyfan am eleni. Gwnaeth Caerdydd ei chais gwreiddiol am gymorth ar gyfer ULTra yn dilyn ein hanogaeth i awdurdodau lleol hybu atebion arloesol i broblemau trafndiaeth. Yr ydym wedi cefnogi ei ddatblygiad, fel y gwnaeth prosiect y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd i werthuso ac arddangos trafndiaeth dinesig arloesol a chynllun trafndiaeth arloesol yr Adran Drafndiaeth.

**Owen John Thomas:** Fe'ch llongyfarchaf ar y penderfyniad synhwyrol, hyd yn oed os

this absurd project. Cardiff should be emulating other major cities in England and in mainland Europe, which are spending money wisely on developing integrated services using combinations of buses, trams and light railways to solve their transport problems. The South Wales Integrated Fast Transit consortium strategy is now two years old and shows little signs of progress. Will you ensure that the £14 million now available in the wake of the ULTra flop is spent on a transport infrastructure for this region, preferably on links between the Valleys and Cardiff and between the city centre and the bay?

**Sue Essex:** As you know, I support a real push on integration and have done so over the last few years. That is why we have received collaborative bids; we support integration schemes. There has been huge progress within the SWIFT consortium area. If you travel around south Wales, to Caerphilly, Bridgend and other places, you will see progress. You know that the improvements that we have earmarked for Queen Street station—

**Owen John Thomas:** They have not taken place.

**Sue Essex:** Of course not, we must work to prepare—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Each Member is allowed one supplementary question unless he or she is leader of the opposition, which you are not as yet, Owen John.

**Sue Essex:** The changes at Queen Street will be a major improvement in linking Cardiff and the Valleys. I reject your argument that there are not good schemes that do exactly what you said, namely ensuring proper integration between Cardiff and the Valleys.

**David Davies:** The ULTra scheme has not yet been ruled out, has it?

**Sue Essex:** If you read the allocation letter, you will see our concerns expressed there. I find it extraordinary that many people stress

yw'n hwyr, i roi'r gorau i'r prosiect hurt hwn. Dylai Caerdydd fod yn efelychu dinasoedd mawr eraill yn Lloegr ac ar dir mawr Ewrop, sy'n gwario arian yn ddoeth ar ddatblygu gwasanaethau integredig gan ddefnyddio cyfuniad o fysiau, tramiau a rheilffyrdd ysgafn i ddatrys eu problemau trafniadaeth. Mae strategaeth consortiwm Teithio Cyflym Integredig De Cymru yn awr yn ddyflwydd oed ond nid oes fawr o arwyddion ei fod yn datblygu. A wnewch chi sicrhau bod y £14 miliwn sydd ar gael yn awr o ganlyniad i fethiant ULTra yn cael ei wario ar rwydwaith trafniadaeth ar gyfer y rhanbarth hwn, os yn bosibl ar gysylltiadau rhwng y Cymoedd a Chaerdydd a rhwng canol y ddinas a'r bae?

**Sue Essex:** Fel y gwyrddoch, yr wyf yn cefnogi hybu integreiddio ac yr wyf wedi gwneud hynny dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Dyna pam ein bod wedi derbyn ceisiadau ar y cyd; yr ydym yn cefnogi cynlluniau integreiddio. Gwnaed cynnydd enfawr o fewn ardal consortiwm SWIFT. Os ydych yn teithio o amgylch de Cymru, i Gaerffili, Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr a lleoedd eraill, byddwch yn gweld cynnydd. Gwyddoch fod y gwelliannau yr ydym wedi'u clustnodi ar gyfer gorsaf Heol y Frenhines—

**Owen John Thomas:** Nid ydynt wedi cael eu cyflawni.

**Sue Essex:** Wrth gwrs nad ydynt, rhaid inni weithio i baratoi—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae gan bob Aelod hawl i ofyn un cwestiwn atodol oni bai ei fod ef neu hi yn arweinydd yr wrthblaid, swydd nad ydych chi, Owen John, eto yn ei dal.

**Sue Essex:** Bydd y newidiadau yn Heol y Frenhines yn welliant mawr o ran cysylltu Caerdydd a'r Cymoedd. Gwrthodaf eich dadl nad oes cynlluniau da sy'n gwneud yn union yr hyn a ddywedasoch, sef, integreiddio digonol rhwng Caerdydd a'r Cymoedd.

**David Davies:** A ydyw'n iawn i ddweud nad yw'r cynllun ULTra wedi ei ddiystyru eto?

**Sue Essex:** Os darllenwch y llythyr dyrannu, byddwch yn gweld ein pryderon wedi'u mynegi ynddo. Rhyfeddaf fod cymaint o bobl

the need to support Cardiff as a European capital, yet somehow think that we should not consider innovative transport solutions. Our position was made clear in the letter to Cardiff council. It is in the Library for you to read if you wish.

yn pwysleisio'r angen i gefnogi Caerdydd fel prifddinas Ewropeaidd, ond nad ydynt yn credu y dylem ystyried atebion arloesol i broblemau trafnidiaeth. Gwnaed ein sefyllfa yn eglur yn y llythyr i gyngor Caerdydd. Mae yn y Llyfrgell ichi ei ddarllen os dymunwch.

### **Safleoedd Tir Glas yn y Brifddinas Greenfield Sites in the Capital City**

**Q2 Jonathan Morgan:** What meetings has the Minister had with Cardiff County Council about the protection of greenfield sites in the capital city? (OAQ22828)

**C2 Jonathan Morgan:** Pa gyfarfodydd mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cael gyda Chyngor Dinas Caerdydd i drafod gwarchod safleoedd tir glas yn y brifddinas? (OAQ22828)

**Sue Essex:** As a Minister, I have not had any meetings with Cardiff County Council or any other local authority in Wales about the protection of greenfield sites. I do not see any need to do so as the policy is set out clearly in 'Planning Policy Wales', which states that, wherever possible, previously developed land should be used in preference to greenfield sites and that insensitive infilling should be avoided.

**Sue Essex:** Fel Gweinidog, nid wyf wedi cael unrhyw gyfarfodydd gyda Chyngor Sir Caerdydd nac unrhyw awdurdod lleol arall yng Nghymru ynglŷn â diogelu safleoedd tir glas. Ni welaf yr angen i wneud hynny gan fod y polisi wedi'i nodi'n glir ym 'Mholisi Cynllunio Cymru', sy'n nodi, lle bynnag y bo'n bosibl, y dylid defnyddio tir a ddatblygwyd eisoes cyn defnyddio safleoedd tir glas a dylid osgoi mewnlenni ansensitif.

**Jonathan Morgan:** You will be aware of the over-development of the Pontprennau area of the city, where an additional 4,000 homes will be built on greenfield sites. There seems to be an overemphasis on placing new homes on greenfield sites on the eastern side of the city, while the western side has seen a reduction in the possible number of new homes being built there. Should not more be done to protect greenfield sites from over-development?

**Jonathan Morgan:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol o or-ddatblygiad ardal Pontprennau yn y ddinas, lle yr adeiladwyd 4,000 o gartrefi ychwanegol ar safleoedd tir glas. Ymddengys bod gorbwyslais ar osod cartrefi newydd ar safleoedd tir glas ar ochr ddwyreiniol y ddinas, tra bod yr ochr orllewinol wedi gweld gostyngiad yn y nifer posibl o gartrefi newydd sy'n cael eu hadeiladu yno. Oni ddylid gwneud mwy i ddiogelu safleoedd tir glas rhag gor-ddatblygu?

**Sue Essex:** I refer you to my original answer. Our policy is made clear in the planning guidance. Pontprennau is in my constituency, Cardiff North. You will be well aware that I opposed the idea of 4,000 units being built there. I do not think that I can say more on that as Minister.

**Sue Essex:** Fe'ch cyfeiriaf at fy ateb gwreiddiol. Nodir ein polisi yn glir yn y canllawiau cynllunio. Mae Pontprennau yn fy etholaeth i, Gogledd Caerdydd. Byddwch yn gwbl ymwybodol fy mod wedi gwrthwynebu'r syniad o adeiladu 4,000 o unedau yno. Ni chredaf y gallaf ddweud mwy ar hynny fel Gweinidog.

**Janet Davies:** As it is difficult for you to answer that specific question, I will pose it in more general terms. Since 'Planning Policy Wales' states that brownfield sites should be used in preference to greenfield sites, what action can you take against local authorities that breach those guidelines?

**Janet Davies:** Gan ei bod y anodd ichi ateb y cwestiwn penodol hwnnw, yr wyf am ei ofyn mewn termau mwy cyffredinol. Gan fod 'Polisi Cynllunio Cymru' yn nodi y dylid defnyddio safleoedd tir llwyd cyn defnyddio safleoedd tir glas, pa gamau y gallwch chi eu cymryd yn erbyn awdurdodau lleol sy'n



torri'r canllawiau hynny?

**Sue Essex:** That policy is not set out in regulations. We have had this discussion before; David has raised it previously. Each case must be considered individually. For example, in Cardiff, Newport, and probably Swansea too, there is a considerable amount of brownfield land that could be brought back into use. Examples of that approach surround the Assembly building, where economics have made it worthwhile to do that. The situation varies across the country. In Ceredigion, for example, there is not as much brownfield land. 'Planning Policy Wales' sets out our objectives. I have not received any evidence that local authorities, in pursuing their development plans, are not trying to follow that. We must give them a degree of discretion so that they can respond to the circumstances in their own authority areas.

**Sue Essex:** Ni nodir y polisi hwnnw mewn rheoliadau. Yr ydym wedi cael y drafodaeth hon eisoes; mae David wedi ei godi o'r blaen. Rhaid ystyried pob achos yn unigol. Er enghraifft, yng Nghaerdydd, Casnewydd ac Abertawe hefyd mae'n debyg, mae eithaf tipyn o dir llwyd y gellid ei ailddatblygu. Mae enghreifftiau o'r ymagwedd honno'n amgylchynu adeilad y Cynulliad, lle mae economeg wedi'i gwneud yn fuddiol i wneud hynny. Mae'r sefyllfa'n amrywio ledled y wlad. Yng Ngheredigion, er enghraifft, nid oes cymaint o dir llwyd. Mae 'Polisi Cynllunio Cymru' yn nodi ein hamcanion. Nid wyf wedi derbyn unrhyw dystiolaeth, nad yw awdurdodau lleol wrth ddilyn eu cynlluniau datblygu, yn ceisio dilyn hynny. Rhaid inni roi rhywfaint o ryddid iddynt allu ymateb i'r amgylchiadau yn ardaloedd eu hawdurdod eu hunain.

### **Ffordd Ddosbarthu Amgylchol yng Nghaerdydd Peripheral Distributor Road in Cardiff**

**Q3 Jonathan Morgan:** Will the Minister make a statement on the level of financial support required to complete the peripheral distributor road in Cardiff? (OAQ22827)

**C3 Jonathan Morgan:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar lefel y gefnogaeth ariannol sydd ei hangen i gwblhau'r ffordd ddosbarthu amgylchol yng Nghaerdydd? (OAQ22827)

**Sue Essex:** The scheme comprises 5.25 km of dual carriageway from Butetown link to Southern way. The total projected scheme cost notified by Cardiff County Council for the eastern bay link scheme in its transport grant bid submitted in August 2002, was £180 million. This is an increase of £16 million on the cost estimated in the previous year. In 2001-02 I allocated funding to the council to enable it to take forward analysis of the options for funding delivery of the local transport plan, including the eastern bay link. I allocated further funds for this purpose in 2002-03 and again in 2003-04. The council's work on developing this public-private partnership approach has not yet reached a conclusion.

**Sue Essex:** Mae'r cynllun yn cynnwys 5.25 km o ffordd ddeuol o ffordd gyswllt Butetown i'r ffordd Ddeheuol. Cyfanswm rhagamcanol y cynllun a nodwyd gan Gyngor Sir Caerdydd ar gyfer cynllun ffordd gyswllt dwyrain y bae yn ei gais am grant trafndiaeth a gyflwynwyd yn Awst 2002, oedd £180 miliwn. Mae hwn yn gynydd o £16 miliwn ar y gost a amcangyfrifwyd yn y flwyddyn flaenorol. Yn 2001-2 dyrennais arian i'r cyngor er mwyn ei alluogi i ddadansoddi'r opsiynau ar gyfer ariannu'r cynllun trafndiaeth lleol, yn cynnwys ffordd gyswllt dwyrain y bae. Dyrennais arian pellach i'r perwyl hwn yn 2002-03 ac eto yn 2003-04. Nid yw gwaith y cyngor ar ddatblygu'r ymagwedd bartneriaeth cyhoeddus-preifat hon wedi ei gwblhau eto.

**Jonathan Morgan:** We have the proposed new Assembly building and new office buildings in Cardiff bay. Many organisations and individuals, including those who will be

**Jonathan Morgan:** Mae adeilad arfaethedig newydd y Cynulliad a swyddfeydd newydd ym mae Caerdydd. Mae nifer o sefydliadau ac unigolion, yn cynnwys y rhai a leolir yng

located at the Wales Millennium Centre, believe that for the transport structure in Cardiff bay to be complete the distributor road needs to be finished as quickly as possible. Will the Assembly Government give any commitment to financial support to complete the road soon?

**Sue Essex:** As you have just heard me say, the cost is £180 million. That is probably two and a half times my annual transport grant budget, which has to cover all of Wales. You can therefore see the difficulty. We all agree that this link is needed, which is why we have given around £10.8 million to the local authority over previous years, to develop the design and to look at partnership ways of delivering. Our discussions with Cardiff County Council underline that. It is looking at ways in which it can work together with others to raise that sum.

**Alison Halford:** Will the Minister comment on the use of the transport grant for innovative work in my part of Wales? In addition to the Flint road improvement and the funding for the NEWDART consultation in Mostyn, your demand-responsive transport pilot scheme has been highly applauded in Flintshire, as have all your initiatives and your generosity towards Flintshire. It will certainly help to serve the villages around Holywell. Will the Minister say when that scheme will be—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This question is about Cardiff.

**Phil Williams:** What is the total cost of all the committed road schemes and those on the preparation list—including the Cardiff one—which are eligible for transport grant? Given that the transport grant is to cover public transport as well, what is your estimate of the number of years that it will take to complete the schemes listed, assuming the grant after 2006 remains at the increased level of £91 million per year?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This question

Nghanolfan Mileniwm Cymru, o'r farn bod angen cwblhau'r ffordd ddosbarthu cyn gynted â phosibl er mwyn i'r strwythur trafniadaeth ym mae Caerdydd fod yn gyflawn. A fydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn rhoi unrhyw ymrwymiad i roi cymorth ariannol er mwyn cwblhau'r ffordd yn fuan?

**Sue Essex:** Fel yr ydych newydd fy nghlywed yn dweud, cyfanswm y gost yw £180 miliwn. Mae'n debygol bod hynny ddwy waith a hanner fy nghyllideb grant trafniadaeth flynyddol, sy'n gorfod cwmpasu Cymru gyfan. Felly gallwch weld yr anhawster. Yr ydym oll yn cytuno bod angen y ffordd gyswllt hon, a dyna pam yr ydym wedi rhoi oddeutu £10.8 miliwn i'r awdurdod lleol dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf, er mwyn datblygu'r cynllun ac ystyried dulliau partneriaeth o gyflawni hyn. Mae ein trafodaethau gyda Chyngor Sir Caerdydd yn tanlinellu hynny. Mae'n ystyried ffyrdd y gall gydweithio ag eraill er mwyn codi'r swm hwnnw.

**Alison Halford:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog sylwadau ar y defnydd o'r grant trafniadaeth ar gyfer gwaith arloesol yn fy ardal i? Yn ogystal â gwella ffordd y Fflint a'r arian ar gyfer ymgynghoriad NEWDART ym Mostyn, mae eich cynllun peilot trafniadaeth sy'n ymateb i alw wedi derbyn cymeradwyaeth fawr yn Sir y Fflint, fel ag y mae eich holl fentrau a'ch haelioni tuag at Sir y Fflint. Yn sicr, bydd yn helpu i wasanaethu'r pentrefi o amgylch Treffynnon. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddweud pryd y bydd y cynllun hwnnw yn—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r cwestiwn hwn yn ymwneud â Chaerdydd.

**Phil Williams:** Beth yw cyfanswm cost yr holl gynlluniau ffyrdd yr ymrwymwyd iddynt a'r rheini ar y rhestr baratoi—yn cynnwys un Caerdydd—sy'n gymwys ar gyfer grant trafniadaeth? O ystyried bod y grant trafniadaeth yn cwmpasu trafniadaeth gyhoeddus hefyd, beth yw eich amcangyfrif o ran nifer y blynyddoedd y bydd yn cymryd i gwblhau'r cynlluniau a restrir, gan gymryd bod y grant ar ôl 2006 yn parhau ar y lefel uwch o £91 miliwn y flwyddyn?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r cwestiwn hwn yn

is very specific. It is about one particular road in Cardiff. That is my ruling. Question 4 (OAQ22854) is withdrawn.

benodol iawn. Mae'n ymwneud ag un ffordd arbennig yng Nghaerdydd. Dyna fy nyfarniad innau. Tynnwyd cwestiwn 4 (OAQ22854) yn ôl.

### **Dangosyddion Datblygu Cynaliadwy Sustainable Development Indicators**

**Q5 Janet Davies:** When does the Minister expect the full set of sustainable development indicators, originally promised for summer 2002, to come before the Assembly? (OAQ22845)

**C5 Janet Davies:** Pryd mae'r Gweinidog yn disgwyl i'r set lawn o ddangosyddion datblygu cynaliadwy, a addäwyd yn wreiddiol ar gyfer yr haf 2002, gael eu cyflwyno gerbron y Cynulliad? (OAQ22845)

**Sue Essex:** As we have discussed previously, we have not completed our work on indicators. We have been working on other unforeseen and important activities. For example, we had the opportunity to set Wales's work on the international stage at Johannesburg. We now are in a position to return to the remaining questions over the suite of indicators, with a view to their informing the review of the sustainable development scheme that the Assembly is obliged by the Government of Wales Act 1998 to undertake after the elections. It is my view that that will be done over some months, depending upon which indicators we can get through the system.

**Sue Essex:** Fel yr ydym wedi trafod yn flaenorol, nid ydym wedi cwblhau ein gwaith ar ddangosyddion. Yr ydym wedi bod yn gweithio ar weithgareddau nas rhagwelwyd a gweithgareddau pwysig eraill. Er enghraifft, cawsom y cyfle i roi gwaith Cymru ar y llwyfan rhyngwladol yn Johannesburg. Yr ydym bellach yn gallu dychwelyd at y cwestiynau sy'n weddill ynglŷn â'r gyfres o ddangosyddion, gyda'r nod y byddant yn llywio'r adolygiad o'r cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy y mae'n ofynnol i'r Cynulliad, o dan Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, ei gynnal ar ôl yr etholiadau. Fy marn innau yw y gwneir hynny dros rai misoedd, yn dibynnu ar ba ddangosyddion y gallwn eu cael drwy'r system.

**Janet Davies:** Minister, I am sure that you would agree that there is a strong need for these indicators in order to, among other matters, be able to publish an annual report, as is required. The deadline of the end of last year was missed. I am somewhat perturbed to hear that this will be coming out over some months. Do you share my view that these indicators are essential to measuring progress on sustainable development, particularly in view of the statutory requirement to publish a report on the scheme in the year following the election?

**Janet Davies:** Weinidog, yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch fod angen mawr am y dangosyddion hyn er mwyn medru cyhoeddi adroddiad blynyddol, ymysg materion eraill, fel sy'n ofynnol. Methwyd y dyddiad a bennwyd, sef diwedd y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Yr wyf braidd yn bryderus i glywed y bydd hyn yn digwydd dros rai misoedd. A ydych yn cyd-fynd â mi bod y dangosyddion hyn yn hanfodol i fesur cynnydd ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy, yn arbennig yng ngoleuni'r gofyniad statudol i gyhoeddi adroddiad ar y cynllun yn y flwyddyn yn dilyn yr etholiad?

**Sue Essex:** The report on indicators will be available in March 2003. We had the opportunity to be involved in the Johannesburg summit. I think that you will admit that put an additional strain on the small group of people who were dealing with sustainable development. Your party did not want us to walk away from that, and we did

**Sue Essex:** Bydd yr adroddiad ar ddangosyddion ar gael ym Mawrth 2003. Cawsom y cyfle i gymryd rhan yn yr uwchgynhadledd yn Johannesburg. Credaf y byddwch yn cyfaddef bod hynny wedi rhoi pwysau ychwanegol ar y grŵp bach o bobl a oedd yn ymdrin â datblygu cynaliadwy. Nid oedd eich plaid yn dymuno inni anwybyddu

not. That does not mean that we do not take indicators seriously; we do. I am glad to say that the number of staff in the sustainable development unit has now been increased and we will be working specifically on making progress with this. I will mention one indicator that will take some time, which is the ecological footprint. We have an ecological footprint calculation at present, but we are hoping to do this to a greater degree of sophistication with Biffaward funding coming in. I assure you that we take indicators seriously and we will be responding to this over the next 12 months. However other priorities came up for which we were not prepared. We all agreed that we needed to grasp those opportunities and I am glad that we did.

2.30 p.m.

**Glyn Davies:** Minister, have you assessed the implications of the Westminster Government's policy on renewable energy for new windfarm developments in Wales? What discussions have you had about transferring the power to deal with larger windfarm planning applications to the National Assembly?

**Sue Essex:** We are progressing the transfer of powers in conjunction with the Wales Office. We have regular discussions with the Wales Office about a series of issues, including that one. Discussions are ongoing and I believe that we all want those powers transferred.

On the Government's policy on renewable energy, I remind you that Andrew Davies set out our policy on renewable energy last week and today he will respond to the Economic Development Committee's report on renewable energy. With regard to the planning aspects of that—and you and I have discussed this many times—the technical advice group is trying to prepare a way forward for planning that will correspond with our ambitions for renewable energy. That will be published, probably in June. I anticipate, from my discussions with the staff and others involved, that it will be a positive planning document that will sit alongside our ambitions for renewable energy production.

hynny, ac ni wnaethom. Nid yw hynny'n golygu nad ydym yn cymryd dangosyddion o ddifrif; yr ydym. Mae'n bleser gennyf ddweud bod nifer y staff yn yr uned datblygu cynaliadwy wedi'i gynyddu a byddwn yn gweithio'n benodol ar wneud cynnydd yn hyn o beth. Crybwyllaf un dangosydd a fydd yn cymryd peth amser, sef yr ôl troed ecolegol. Mae gennym gyfrifiad ôl troed ecolegol ar hyn o bryd, ond yr ydym yn gobeithio gwneud hyn yn fwy soffistigedig ar ôl derbyn arian Biffaward. Rhoddaf sicrwydd ichi ein bod yn cymryd dangosyddion o ddifrif a byddwn yn ymateb i hyn dros y 12 mis nesaf. Fodd bynnag, ymddangosodd blaenoriaethau eraill nad oeddem wedi paratoi ar eu cyfer. Cytunom oll fod angen inni fanteisio ar y cyfleoedd hyn ac yr wyf yn falch ein bod wedi gwneud.

**Glyn Davies:** Weinidog, a ydych wedi asesu goblygiadau polisi Llywodraeth San Steffan ar ynni adnewyddadwy ar gyfer datblygiadau ffermydd gwynt newydd yng Nghymru? Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi'u cael am drosglwyddo'r pŵer i ymdrin â cheisiadau cynllunio ar gyfer ffermydd gwynt mwy i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol?

**Sue Essex:** Yr ydym yn symud ymlaen ar drosglwyddo pwerau mewn cysylltiad â Swyddfa Cymru. Yr ydym yn cynnal trafodaethau rheolaidd â Swyddfa Cymru am gyfres o faterion, yn cynnwys y mater hwnnw. Mae'r trafodaethau yn parhau a chredaf y byddwn oll am i'r pwerau hynny gael eu trosglwyddo.

O ran polisi'r Llywodraeth ar ynni adnewyddadwy, fe'ch atgoffaf fod Andrew Davies wedi nodi ein polisi ar ynni adnewyddadwy yr wythnos diwethaf a heddiw bydd yn ymateb i adroddiad y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ar ynni adnewyddadwy. O ran yr agweddau cynllunio ar hynny—ac yr ydym ni'n dau wedi trafod hyn sawl gwaith—mae'r grŵp cyngor technegol yn ceisio paratoi ffordd ymlaen ar gyfer cynllunio a fydd yn cyfateb â'n huchelgeisiau ar gyfer ynni adnewyddadwy. Caiff hynny ei gyhoeddi, ym Mehefin yn fwy na thebyg. Rhagwelfaf, o'm trafodaethau â'r staff ac eraill sy'n gysylltiedig â hi, y bydd hon yn ddogfen

gynllunio gadarnhaol a fydd yn sefyll ochr yn ochr â'n huchelgeisiau ar gyfer cynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy.

### **Tai i Bobl Leol Houses for Local People**

**C6 Dafydd Wigley:** Pa ystyriaeth a roddir i newid canllawiau cynllunio fel y gellir darparu tai i bobl leol mewn ardaloedd gwledig? (OAQ22847)

**Sue Essex:** 'Planning Policy Wales', published in March 2002, requires local authorities to take account of local housing needs in preparing their statutory unitary development plans and planning the provision of land for housing. I have also recently written to all local planning authorities to encourage them to make more use of their existing powers to address local housing needs.

**Dafydd Wigley:** A ydych chi'n ymwybodol o gyfarfod a gynhaliwyd ar 8 Ionawr yng Nghaernarfon lle yr oedd cynrychiolwyr Cyfarwyddiaeth Tai y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a swyddogion Cyngor Gwynedd yn gyfûn bod angen newid y canllawiau cynllunio er mwyn sicrhau unrhyw obaith y byddai pobl ifanc yn gallu canfod tai mewn ardaloedd fel Pen Llŷn? Pa drafodaethau a gawsoch chi gyda'r Gyfarwyddiaeth Tai er mwyn symud ymlaen gyda'r agenda hon?

**Sue Essex:** I was not aware of the details of that meeting. However, our planning policy, the recently announced second-homes study, and its recommendations, are made in consultation with colleagues in the Housing Directorate. As I said in my initial answer, we feel that there is enormous scope within existing powers. My letter of 30 January stressed the need for local authorities in Wales to complete housing need surveys. If you want to be able to back up your policies on local housing needs, then that need must be demonstrated. I am not saying that it does not exist; we both know that it does. However, getting an accurate picture of need makes matters easier for me and for Edwina in terms of the rural homebuy scheme, which has been successful, and in working with registered social landlords and others to

**Q6 Dafydd Wigley:** What consideration is being given to amending planning guidelines to enable houses to be provided to local people in rural areas? (OAQ22847)

**Sue Essex:** Mae 'Polisi Cynllunio Cymru', a gyhoeddwyd ym Mawrth 2002, yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i awdurdodau lleol ystyried anghenion tai lleol wrth baratoi eu cynlluniau datblygu unedol statudol a chynllunio'r ddarpariaeth o dir ar gyfer tai. Yn ogystal, yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu yn ddiweddar at yr holl awdurdodau lleol i'w hannog i wneud mwy o ddefnydd o'u pwerau presennol er mwyn mynd i'r afael ag anghenion tai lleol.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Are you aware of a meeting that was held on 8 January in Caernarfon at which representatives from the National Assembly's Housing Directorate and officials from Gwynedd Council agreed that a change in the planning guidelines was necessary if there was ever to be a hope of young people being able to find houses in areas such as the Llŷn peninsula? What discussions have you had with the Housing Directorate in order to move this agenda forward?

**Sue Essex:** Nid oeddwn yn ymwybodol o fanylion y cyfarfod hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, llunnir ein polisi cynllunio, yr astudiaeth o ail gartrefi a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar, a'i hargymhellion, mewn ymgynghoriad â swyddogion yn y Gyfarwyddiaeth Tai. Fel y dywedais yn fy ateb cychwynnol, teimlwn fod cyfle anferth o fewn y pwerau presennol. Pwysleisiodd fy llythyr dyddiedig 30 Ionawr yr angen i awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru gwblhau arolygon anghenion tai. Os ydych yn dymuno ategu eich polisiau ar anghenion tai lleol, yna rhaid dangos yr angen hwnnw. Nid wyf yn dweud nad yw'n bodoli; yr ydym ni'n dau yn gwybod ei fod. Fodd bynnag, mae cael darlun cywir o ran angen yn gwneud materion yn haws imi ac i Edwina o ran y cynllun prynu cartref yng nghefn gwlad, sydd wedi bod yn llwyddiannus, ac

progress housing provision in the areas of greatest need.

**Peter Black:** Minister, do you agree that making provision in unitary development plans for new houses to be built solely for local people could distort the housing market and stifle economic growth? The way forward is to ensure that housing need is assessed and to provide financial assistance for people to stay in their own communities.

**Sue Essex:** The planning system is about considering housing need and housing supply. It cannot totally supplant the market. I understand the pressures, but we must work within the planning guidelines. To reiterate Dafydd's point, this is based on demonstrated local housing need. We need synergy between housing policies. The community plans and development plans of local authorities need to be at one. We want to see every local authority in Wales go in that direction.

**David Ian Jones:** Remarkably, I find myself echoing Peter Black's point; there is a danger of market distortion. Can this problem not be more imaginatively addressed by the proper use of section 106 obligations?

**Sue Essex:** Section 106 obligations have traditionally been used in Wales to provide all kinds of community facilities and to preserve the availability of local affordable housing. My experience of working with housing associations in Wales in the past is that they have used that agreement to secure occupancy clauses and thus ensure that affordable housing is available. That is important. Returning to Dafydd's original point, that principle must be applied across Wales where affordable housing is needed.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 7 (OAQ22825) has been transferred for written answer.

wrth weithio gyda landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig ac eraill i ddatblygu darpariaeth tai yn yr ardaloedd sydd â'r angen mwyaf.

**Peter Black:** Weinidog, a gytunwch y gallai gwneud darpariaeth mewn cynlluniau datblygu unedol ar gyfer adeiladu tai newydd ar gyfer pobl leol yn unig aflunio'r farchnad tai ac atal twf economaidd? Y ffordd ymlaen yw sicrhau y caiff anghenion tai eu hasesu a darparu cymorth ariannol i bobl i aros yn eu cymunedau eu hunain.

**Sue Essex:** Mae'r system gynllunio yn ymwneud ag ystyried anghenion tai a'r cyflenwad o dai. Ni all ddisodli'r farchnad yn gyfan gwbl. Deallaf y pwysau, ond rhaid inni weithio o fewn y canllawiau cynllunio. I ailadrodd pwynt Dafydd, mae hyn yn seiliedig ar angen tai lleol sydd wedi'i ddangos. Mae angen synergedd arnom rhwng polisïau tai. Mae angen i gynlluniau cymunedol a chynlluniau datblygu awdurdodau lleol fod yn gyson. Yr ydym am weld pob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru yn mynd i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw.

**David Ian Jones:** Yn rhyfedd, ategaf bwynt Peter Black; mae perygl o aflunio'r farchnad. A ellir mynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon yn fwy creadigol drwy ddefnyddio rhwymedigaethau adran 106 yn gywir?

**Sue Essex:** Yn draddodiadol mae rhwymedigaethau adran 106 wedi'u defnyddio yng Nghymru i ddarparu pob math o gyfleusterau cymunedol ac i ddiogelu argaeledd tai lleol fforddiadwy. Fy mhrofiad i o weithio gyda chymdeithasau tai yng Nghymru yn y gorffennol yw eu bod wedi defnyddio'r cytundeb hwnnw i sicrhau cymalau deiliadaeth ac felly sicrhau bod tai fforddiadwy ar gael. Mae hynny'n bwysig. Gan ddychwelyd at bwynt gwreiddiol Dafydd, rhaid rhoi'r egwyddor honno ar waith ledled Cymru lle mae angen tai fforddiadwy.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae Cwestiwn 7 (OAQ22825) wedi'i drosglwyddo ar gyfer ateb ysgrifenedig.

**Methan yn Gollwng o Hen Weithfeydd Cloddio**  
**Methane Seepage from Old Mine Works**

**Q8 Brian Gibbons:** Has any environmental impact assessment taken place in Wales to assess the greenhouse gas effect of methane seepage from old mine works? (OAQ22831)

**C8 Brian Gibbons:** A wnaethpwyd unrhyw asesiad o'r effaith ar yr amgylchedd yng Nghymru o ganlyniad i effaith tŷ gwydr methan yn gollwng o hen weithfeydd cloddio? (OAQ22831)

**Sue Essex:** The latest published information shows that fugitive emissions of methane from coal mining amounted to 9,500 tonnes in 1999, which represents 4 per cent of total methane emissions in Wales. These statistics only relate to working mines, as it was previously thought that methane emissions from closed mines were negligible. However, in light of recent findings, research is now underway to establish a more reliable estimate of emissions from that source.

**Sue Essex:** Mae'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf a gyhoeddwyd yn dangos bod 9,500 o fethan wedi'i ollwng o ganlyniad i fwyngloddio glo yn 1999, sef 4 y cant o gyfanswm gollyngiadau methan yng Nghymru. Mae'r ystadegau hyn yn cynnwys gweithfeydd cloddio gweithredol yn unig, oherwydd credwyd yn flaenorol bod gollyngiadau o fethan o weithfeydd cloddio wedi'u cau yn fach iawn. Fodd bynnag, yng ngoleuni canfyddiadau diweddar, mae ymchwil ar waith bellach i bennu amcangyfrif mwy dibynadwy o ran gollyngiadau o'r ffynhonnell honno.

**Brian Gibbons:** That is helpful. We all know of the danger that methane gas poses in terms of global warming. The biggest source of methane is the breaking of wind by livestock. [*Laughter.*] It is just like the ruddy duck again. The Coal Authority has recently highlighted, as part of its submission to the Government's energy review, the potential of tapping methane leakage from old mine works as part of a sustainable energy policy. Do you think that there would be any merit in adopting such an approach in Wales, given the amount of seepage that you have just reported?

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae hynny'n ddefnyddiol. Yr ydym oll yn gwybod am berygl nwy methan o ran cynhesu byd-eang. Y ffynhonnell fwyaf o fethan yw da byw yn torri gwynt [*Chwerthin.*] Mae'r un fath â'r hwyaden goch unwaith eto. Yn ddiweddar, mae'r Awdurdod Glo wedi amlygu, fel rhan o'i gyflwyniad i adolygiad ynni'r Llywodraeth, fod modd tynnu methan sy'n gollwng o hen weithfeydd cloddio fel rhan o bolisi ynni cynaliadwy. A gredwch y byddai unrhyw werth mewn mabwysiadu ymagwedd o'r fath yng Nghymru, o ystyried faint o ollyngiad yr ydych newydd ei nodi?

**Sue Essex:** You always come up with the kind of information that falls into the 'not a lot of people know that' category. It immediately prompted David Davies to raise his hand. I will certainly look into the issue that you raised. I know that you are concerned about emissions and the dangers of greenhouse gases, as am I. The research to which I referred, which was commissioned by the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs, will be informative. I will take up your point about tapping, and consider whether that could be of use.

**Sue Essex:** Yr ydych bob tro'n cyflwyno'r math o wybodaeth sydd yn y categori 'does dim llawer o bobl yn gwybod hynny'. Gwnaeth hyn i David Davies godi ei law ar unwaith. Byddaf yn sicr yn edrych i mewn i'r mater a godasoch. Gwn eich bod yn pryderu am ollyngiadau a pheryglon nwyon tŷ gwydr, fel yr wyf innau. Bydd yr ymchwil y cyfeiriais ati, a gomisiynwyd gan Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig, yn rhoi gwybodaeth inni. Codaf eich pwynt ynglŷn â thynnu methan, ac ystyried pa un a allai hynny fod o ddefnydd.

**Phil Williams:** I reaffirm Brian Gibbons's

**Phil Williams:** Ategef bwynt Brian Gibbons

point about the danger of methane. Not only is it over 20 times the cross-section, but it hits those wavelengths that are unaffected by carbon dioxide. Therefore, burning methane is the one form of burning fossil fuels that positively mitigates global warming. Are there any plans or discussions about using the methane reserves in the coalfield in the same way as reserves in landfill are currently used, to great effect? Has this been considered as part of the renewable energy policy?

**Sue Essex:** I am not sure, to be honest, Phil. I will discuss that with my colleague, Andrew Davies, who is responsible for renewable energy, and we will provide you with a response.

**David Davies:** This is a serious point. Are you aware of recent research that shows that most of the current global warming is due to natural planetary cycles, and that it is not the result of man-made pollutants? As Phil suggested, the majority of global warming results from carbon dioxide, not methane. Given the relatively small amounts of methane going into the atmosphere, and the fact that it is not the largest contributor to global warming by far, should we not be careful in taking measures that may dampen economic growth, and should that not be costed carefully against the potential benefits, which recent research shows would be small?

**Sue Essex:** I am not sure to which research you refer. Perhaps it was commissioned by George Bush. There has been debate for many years as to whether global warming exists. Once that was recognised—*[Interruption.]* I am talking about global warming; it is taking place. The second point relates to the cause of that global warming. For many years, people disputed that it was man-made. They argued, as you do, that it was primarily due to planetary cycles.

2.40 p.m.

The last report that I read—and Phil will no

ynglŷn â pherygl methan. Mae nid yn unig dros 20 gwaith y trawstoriad, ond mae'n taro'r tonfeddi hynny nas effeithir arnynt gan garbon deuocsid. Felly, mae llosgi methan yn un math o losgi tanwydd ffosil sy'n bendant yn gostwng cynhesu byd-eang. A oes unrhyw gynlluniau neu drafodaethau am ddefnyddio'r cronfeydd methan wrth gefn yn y maes glo yn yr un ffordd ag y caiff cronfeydd mewn safleoedd tirlenwi eu defnyddio'n effeithiol iawn ar hyn o bryd? A yw hyn wedi'i ystyried fel rhan o'r polisi ynni adnewyddadwy?

**Sue Essex:** Nid wyf yn siŵr, a bod yn onest, Phil. Trafodaf hynny gyda'm cyd-Aelod, Andrew Davies, sy'n gyfrifol am ynni adnewyddadwy, a byddwn yn rhoi ateb ichi.

**David Davies:** Mae hwn yn bwynt difrifol. A ydych yn ymwybodol o ymchwil ddiweddar sy'n dangos mai cylchredau planedol naturiol sy'n achosi'r rhan fwyaf o'r cynhesu byd-eang presennol ac nad yw'n ganlyniad i lygryddion o waith dyn? Fel yr awgrymodd Phil, mae'r rhan fwyaf o gynhesu byd-eang yn deillio o garbon deuocsid, ac nid methan. O ystyried y symiau cymharol fach o fethan sy'n mynd i mewn i'r atmosffer, a'r ffaith nad methan sy'n cyfrannu fwyaf i gynhesu byd-eang o bell ffordd, oni ddylem fod yn ofalus wrth gymryd mesurau a allai wanhau twf economaidd, ac oni ddylai hynny gael ei gostio'n ofalus yn erbyn y buddiannau posibl, y mae ymchwil ddiweddar yn dangos y byddent yn fach?

**Sue Essex:** Nid wyf yn siŵr at ba ymchwil y cyfeiriasoch. Efallai y cafodd ei chomisiynu gan George Bush. Bu dadlau ers blynyddoedd lawer o ran pa un a yw cynhesu byd-eang yn bodoli. Ar ôl i hynny gael ei gydnabod—*[Torri ar draws.]* Yr wyf yn siarad am gynhesu byd-eang; mae'n digwydd. Mae'r ail bwynt yn gysylltiedig â'r hyn sy'n achosi cynhesu byd-eang. Am lawer o flynyddoedd, yr oedd pobl yn dadlau pa un ai dyn a oedd yn gyfrifol ai peidio. Dadleuasant, fel a wnewch chi, mai cylchredau planedol oedd yn bennaf gyfrifol.

Mae'r adroddiad diwethaf a ddarllenais—ac



doubt have a view on this—is about as accurate a piece of work as has been published on this issue. It stated that around 80 per cent of global warming is the result of humankind's activities, particularly industrial activities. Around 20 per cent is the result of planetary cycles. It seems to me that the outcomes of global warming will be severe. People think that we will be able to grow vines on the slopes of the Rhondda—which might be nice—but global warming will in fact cause huge instability in meteorological conditions across the world and result in the need for migration. We will see migration across the world in a way that we have not seen before. Many parts of the globe will be turned into deserts, if current predictions are accurate. Therefore, the situation is serious. We must consider all the elements that contribute to that, be they carbon dioxide or methane, to see where we can minimise the damage. We must do that sensibly. We understand the impact that changes will have on industry and we have considered this issue in south Wales, where we have heavy industries operating. The long-term implications are serious and we must play our part in Wales to ensure that we contribute to global action on combating this problem.

yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd gan Phil farn ar hyn—yn un o'r darnau mwyaf cywir o waith sydd wedi'i gyhoeddi ar y mater hwn. Nododd fod oddeutu 80 y cant o gynhesu byd-eang o ganlyniad i weithgarwch dynol ryw, yn arbennig gweithgarwch diwydiannol. Mae oddeutu 20 y cant o ganlyniad i gylchredau planedol. Ymddengys imi y bydd canlyniadau cynhesu byd-eang yn ddifrifol. Credir y byddwn yn gallu tyfu gwinwydd ar lethrau'r Rhondda—gallai hynny fod yn braf—ond mewn gwirionedd bydd cynhesu byd-eang yn achosi ansadrwydd anferth mewn amodau meteorolegol ledled y byd ac yn arwain at yr angen am ymfudo. Byddwn yn gweld ymfudo ledled y byd mewn ffordd nas gwelwyd cyn hyn. Caiff sawl rhan o'r byd ei throï yn anialwch, os yw'r rhagolygon presennol yn gywir. Felly, mae'r sefyllfa'n un ddifrifol. Rhaid inni ystyried yr holl elfennau sy'n cyfrannu at hynny, boed hynny yn garbon deuocsid neu'n fethan, er mwyn gweld lle gallwn leihau'r niwed i'r eithaf. Rhaid inni wneud hynny'n synhwyrol. Deallwn yr effaith y caiff newidiadau ar ddiwydiant ac yr ydym wedi ystyried y mater hwn yn ne Cymru, lle mae diwydiannau trwm yn gweithredu. Mae'r goblygiadau hirdymor yn ddifrifol a rhaid inni chwarae ein rhan yng Nghymru er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn cyfrannu at gamau gweithredu byd-eang ar ddatrys y broblem hon.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 9 (OAQ22848) yn ôl.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 9 (OAQ22848) has been withdrawn.

### **Gwella Cysylltiadau rhwng Caerdydd a'r Cymoedd Improving Links between Cardiff and the Valleys**

**Q10 Christine Chapman:** What measures has the Welsh Assembly Government taken to improve road traffic links between Cardiff and the south Wales Valleys? (OAQ22838)

**C10 Christine Chapman:** Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi'u cymryd i wella cysylltiadau i draffig ar y ffyrdd rhwng Caerdydd a Chymoedd y De? (OAQ22838)

**Sue Essex:** In 2001, I announced an indicative date of 2004-05 for the start of the construction of the Porth relief road in the Rhondda—I know that you are originally from the Rhondda—which will provide access from the A470 to a large area of the Rhondda. This is not only about transport, but also about supporting economic regeneration. I am also, as you know,

**Sue Essex:** Yn 2001, cyhoeddais ddyddiad dynodol o 2004-05 ar gyfer cychwyn adeiladu ffordd liniaru y Porth yn y Rhondda—gwn eich bod yn hanu o'r Rhondda yn wreiddiol—a fydd yn cysylltu'r A470 ag ardal fawr o'r Rhondda. Nid yw hyn yn ymwneud â thrafnidiaeth yn unig, ond cynorthwyo adfer economaidd. Yr wyf hefyd, fel y gwyddoch, yn cefnogi amrywiaeth o

supporting a range of integrated transport measures to improve transport links between the Valleys and Cardiff.

**Christine Chapman:** The people of Rhondda will be pleased about that. I also welcome the investment to improve road services, especially the A470 between Abercynon and Cardiff. I, and many of my constituents, use that road daily. Do you agree that people spend a great deal of time on narrow and difficult Valleys roads, trying to access the main transport links? Do you also agree that those roads need to be adequately maintained by local authorities if we are to capitalise on improvements to main and trunk roads?

**Sue Essex:** The A470 has become an important economic lifeline between Valleys communities and Cardiff: it is a highly-used road. Areas in the Valleys, such as the one which you represent, have problems because the high streets have triple use: people live along them, park on them and use them as bus routes, and they are also often through routes for the valley. There are occasions—for example, with the announced construction of the Bargoed bypass—when we can look to offset that main valley route in order to take some of the through traffic out of the community and allow it to regenerate. In other areas, as you say, road surfaces are important, particularly for buses and coaches, so that people have a good journey. In the past few years, although not this year, we were able to give additional money in road maintenance grants to all local authorities in Wales.

fesurau trafnidiaeth integredig er mwyn gwella'r cysylltiadau trafnidiaeth rhwng y Cymoedd a Chaerdydd.

**Christine Chapman:** Bydd pobl y Rhondda yn falch am hynny. Croesawaf hefyd y buddsoddiad i wella gwasanaethau ffyrdd, yn enwedig yr A470 rhwng Abercynon a Chaerdydd. Yr wyf innau, a nifer o'm hetholwyr, yn defnyddio'r ffordd honno bob dydd. A gytunwch fod pobl yn treulio llawer iawn o amser ar ffyrdd cul ac anodd y Cymoedd, yn ceisio cyrraedd y prif gysylltiadau trafnidiaeth? A gytunwch hefyd fod angen i'r ffyrdd hyn gael eu cynnal a'u cadw'n ddigonol gan awdurdodau lleol er mwyn inni fanteisio ar welliannau i briffyrdd a chefnffyrdd?

**Sue Essex:** Mae'r A470 wedi dod yn gyswllt economaidd pwysig rhwng cymunedau'r Cymoedd a Chaerdydd: mae'n ffordd a ddefnyddir llawer. Mae ardaloedd yn y Cymoedd, megis yr ardal a gynrychiolwch chi, yn cael problemau oherwydd bod tri defnydd i'r strydoedd mawr: mae pobl yn byw arnynt, yn parcio arnynt ac yn eu defnyddio fel llwybrau bysiau, ac maent yn aml yn ffyrdd drwy'r cwm. Mae adegau—er enghraifft, cyhoeddi adeiladu'r ffordd osgoi ym Margoed—lle gallwn ystyried gwrthbwysu'r prif lwybr hwnnw drwy'r cwm er mwyn symud rhywfaint o'r drafnidiaeth drwodd allan o'r gymuned a'i galluogi i adfywio. Mewn ardaloedd eraill, fel y dywedwch, mae arwynebedd ffyrdd yn bwysig, yn enweig ar gyfer bysiau, fel bod pobl yn cael siwrnai dda. Yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf, ond nid eleni, yr oeddem yn gallu rhoi arian ychwanegol mewn grantiau cynnal a chadw ffyrdd i bob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru.

#### **Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order**

**Karen Sinclair:** Point of order. I raise this under Standing Order No. 6. I indicated earlier to the Presiding Officer that I wished to ask a supplementary question to Jonathan Morgan's question 2 to Sue Essex. I wanted to ask a general question, which did not pertain to any region. The Presiding Officer indicated that I could not ask that question because question 2 related to Cardiff. For

**Karen Sinclair:** Pwynt o drefn. Codaf y pwynt o drefn hwn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6. Dywedais yn gynharach wrth y Llywydd fy mod yn dymuno gofyn cwestiwn atodol i gwestiwn 2 Jonathan Morgan i Sue Essex. Yr oeddwn am ofyn cwestiwn cyffredinol, nad oedd yn ymwneud ag unrhyw ranbarth. Nododd y Llywydd nad oedd modd imi ofyn y cwestiwn hwnnw oherwydd bod cwestiwn

clarification, is it the practice now that if an area-specific question is asked, every supplementary question must also be specific to that area?

**The Presiding Officer:** The practice on questions has not changed.

**Phil Williams:** Further to that point of order, the timetable for the completion of the Cardiff road depends critically on the budget available and the total value of the schemes on the official list of committed projects and those under preparation. I felt that my question was, in every sense, a genuine and a totally relevant supplement to the last sentence in the Minister's reply. Therefore, I would like you to reconsider your ruling. In such a case, where probably the largest single project on the list will dominate the timetable, my question was a genuine supplementary question under Standing Order No. 6.30, which states that the reply—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I know full well what Standing Order No. 6.30 states. The time allocated to questions is limited, and I am always anxious to get through as many as possible. It is important that supplementary questions are specific, brief, and directly related to the main question. That is why I made a judgment today that, on several questions relating to Cardiff, the supplementary questions should relate specifically to Cardiff. It has always been the case that where a place name is mentioned, the supplementary question should be relevant to that place. That has always been our position. I do not intend to discuss this further, because there is an important statement to follow.

**Rosemary Butler:** Further to that point of order, perhaps in the new Assembly after the election, the Presiding Officer could consider asking new Assembly Members when they sign in to promise not to mention Cardiff County Council more than twice during their term of office.

**The Presiding Officer:** That would be a great relief to whomever my successor as Presiding Officer may be.

2 yn ymwneud â Chaerdydd. Er mwyn eglurhad, ai'r arfer bellach yw os gofynnir cwestiwn sy'n benodol i ardal, bod yn rhaid i bob cwestiwn atodol hefyd fod yn benodol i'r ardal honno?

**Y Llywydd:** Nid yw'r arfer ar gwestiynau wedi newid.

**Phil Williams:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, mae'r amserlen ar gyfer cwblhau ffordd Caerdydd yn dibynnu'n llwyr ar y gyllideb sydd ar gael a chyfanswm gwerth y cynlluniau ar y rhestr swyddogol o brosiectau yr ymrwymir iddynt a'r rheini sy'n cael eu paratoi. Teimlais fod fy nghwestiwn, ym mhob ystyr, yn ddilys ac yn gwestiwn atodol cwbl berthnasol i frawddeg olaf ateb y Gweinidog. Felly, hoffwn ichi ailystyried eich dyfarniad. Mewn achos o'r fath, lle mae'n debygol y bydd y prosiect unigol mwyaf ar y rhestr yn dominyddu'r amserlen, yr oedd fy nghwestiwn yn gwestiwn atodol dilys o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.30 sy'n datgan bod yr ateb—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Gwn yn iawn yr hyn y mae Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.30 yn ei ddatgan. Mae'r amser a ddyrennir i gwestiynau wedi'i gyfyngu, ac yr wyf bob tro'n awyddus i fynd drwy gynifer â phosibl. Mae'n bwysig bod cwestiynau atodol yn benodol, yn fyr, ac yn uniongyrchol gysylltiedig â'r prif gwestiwn. Dyna pam y penderfynais heddiw y dylai'r cwestiynau atodol i sawl cwestiwn yn ymwneud â Chaerdydd ymwneud yn benodol â Chaerdydd. Dyna beth sydd wedi digwydd erioed, sef lle crybwyllir enw lle, dylai'r cwestiwn atodol fod yn berthnasol i'r lle hwnnw. Dyna fu ein safbwynt erioed. Nid wyf yn bwriadu trafod hyn ymhellach, oherwydd bod datganiad pwysig yn dilyn.

**Rosemary Butler:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, efallai yn y Cynulliad newydd ar ôl yr etholiad, y gallai'r Llywydd ystyried gofyn i Aelodau Cynulliad newydd pan fyddant yn cyrraedd beidio â chrybwyll Cyngor Sir Caerdydd fwy na dwywaith yn ystod eu cyfnod yn y swydd.

**Y Llywydd:** Byddai hynny'n rhyddhad mawr i bwy bynnag fydd yn fy olynu fel y Llywydd.

**Datganiad ar Ymateb y Llywodraeth i Adroddiad Blynyddol  
Comisiynydd Plant Cymru  
Statement on the Government's Response to the Annual Report  
of the Children's Commissioner for Wales**

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Aelodau yn fodlon i mi ddweud ein bod yn croesawu Comisiynydd Plant Cymru yma heddiw.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am sure that Members will be happy for me to say that we welcome the Children's Commissioner for Wales here today.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cyhoeddodd Comisiynydd Plant Cymru, Peter Clarke, ei adroddiad blynyddol cyntaf ym mis Hydref 2002, ac fe'i cyflwynodd i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar 28 Tachwedd. Yr wyf yn falch o gael y cyfle hwn i gyflwyno ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i'r adroddiad.

**The First Minister:** The Children's Commissioner for Wales, Peter Clarke, published his first annual report in October 2002, and presented it to the Health and Social Services Committee on 28 November. I am pleased to have this opportunity to present the Welsh Assembly Government's response to the report.

Cymerodd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad y cyfle cyntaf posibl i ddatgan ein hymrwymiad i sefydlu amddifynnydd â llais annibynnol dros blant yng Nghymru. Mesur Comisiynydd Plant Cymru oedd y darn cyntaf o ddeddfwriaeth Cymru'n unig i basio drwy'r Senedd ar gais y Cynulliad. Yr oedd yn briodol y daeth Peter Clarke yn gomisiynydd plant statudol cyntaf y Deyrnas Unedig ar Ddydd Gŵyl Dewi 2001. Mae adroddiad Peter Clarke yn llwyr gyfiawnhau'r flaenoriaeth a roesom i greu swydd y comisiynydd plant. Mae'n tynnu ein sylw at y sylwadau a wnaed iddo dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf gan blant a phobl ifanc. Wrth godi proffil y pynciau hyn, mae'n cyflawni ei rôl fel amddifynnydd â llais dros blant Cymru. Ar yr un pryd, mae'n cyflwyno sawl her arwyddocaol i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, y gallwn yn awr ymateb iddynt yn ffurfiol.

The Assembly Government took the earliest possible opportunity to declare our commitment to establishing an independent champion for children in Wales. The Children's Commissioner for Wales Bill became the first piece of Wales-only legislation to pass through Parliament at the Assembly's request. It was fitting that Peter Clarke became the first statutory children's commissioner in the UK on St David's Day 2001. Peter Clarke's report fully vindicates the priority we gave to creating the post of children's commissioner. He draws our attention to the comments that he has received from children and young people over the past year. By raising the profile of these issues, he fulfils his role as champion and advocate for children in Wales. At the same time, he throws down a number of significant challenges to the Assembly Government, to which we can now formally respond.

The commissioner set out his overriding concern for the position of children and young people by drawing attention to the extent of child poverty in this country. The Welsh Assembly Government shares his concern for this issue. No-one, especially children and young people, should be disadvantaged or prevented from achieving their full potential because of where they live or their family circumstances. Over the past few years, we have devised new ways to

Nododd y comisiynydd ei bryder mawr ynghylch sefyllfa plant a phobl ifanc drwy dynnu sylw at raddau tlodi plant yn y wlad hon. Rhanna Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ei bryder ynghylch y mater hwn. Ni ddylai neb, yn enwedig plant a phobl ifanc, fod o dan anfantais neu gael eu hatal rhag gwireddu eu potensial llawn oherwydd yr ardal lle y maent yn byw neu eu hamgylchiadau teuluol. Dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf, lluniasom ffyrdd newydd o fynd i'r afael â

address poverty. Two programmes in particular, Communities First and Cymorth, the children and youth support fund, have been established to target those areas that suffer the greatest disadvantage and deprivation. Poverty affects children and young people in many ways, and these measures aim to tackle the issue on many fronts: through education, training, and employment opportunities, as well as through making improvements in housing, the surrounding environment, and health.

In order to bring our programmes into a cohesive framework, we have set up a task group to advise us on the production of a child anti-poverty strategy. It is chaired by Charlotte Williams, a lecturer in social policy at the University of Wales, Bangor. The group has the task of preparing a report that will set out a long-term strategic direction and recommendations for further action on which the Assembly Government can develop firm proposals.

The commissioner acknowledges that the Assembly Government has made significant progress in supporting the active participation of children and young people. We support Funky Dragon, the children and young people's Assembly for Wales, as a representative, self-governing body that is managed by children and young people. Funky Dragon has established a website and has published good practice guidelines on participation, entitled 'Breathing Fire into Participation'.

2.50 p.m.

We were pleased to note that the commissioner identified the Children First programme as an example of good practice in the participation of children and young people. As part of that programme, we have established an advocacy task group to undertake a full review of children's advocacy in Wales. Last week, the commissioner published 'Telling Concerns', his review of complaints and whistle-blowing procedures and children's advocacy services in Wales. Most of the recommendations are directed at local authorities, but the advocacy task group will have a key role to play in advising the Assembly Government on its

thlodi. Sefydlwyd dwy raglen yn arbennig, sef Cymunedau yn Gyntaf a Cymorth, y gronfa gymorth i blant a phobl ifanc, i dargedu'r ardaloedd hynny sydd o dan yr anfantais fwyaf ac sy'n dioddef yr amddifadedd mwyaf. Mae tlodi yn effeithio ar blant a phobl ifanc mewn sawl ffordd, a nod y mesurau hyn yw mynd i'r afael â'r broblem o sawl cyfeiriad: drwy addysg, hyfforddiant a chyfleoedd cyflogaeth, ac hefyd drwy wella tai, yr amgylchedd o'n hamgylch ac iechyd.

Er mwyn rhoi ein rhaglenni mewn fframwaith cydlynus, sefydlwyd grŵp gorchwyl gennym i'n cynghori ar gynhyrchu strategaeth gwrth-dlodi plant. Fe'i cadeirir gan Charlotte Williams, darlithydd mewn polisi cymdeithasol ym Mhrifysgol Cymru, Bangor. Mae gan y grŵp y dasg o baratoi adroddiad a fydd yn nodi cyfeiriad strategol hirdymor ac argymhellion ar gyfer gweithredu ymhellach fel y gall Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ddatblygu cynigion cadarn.

Mae'r comisiynydd yn cydnabod bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi gwneud cynnydd sylweddol i gefnogi cyfranogiad gweithredol plant a phobl ifanc. Cefnogwn Ddraig Ffyncci, sef y Cynulliad i blant a phobl ifanc yng Nghymru, fel corff cynrychioliadol, hunanlywodraethol a reolir gan blant a phobl ifanc. Mae Draig Ffyncci wedi sefydlu gwefan ac wedi cyhoeddi canllawiau ar arfer da ar gyfranogi, o'r enw 'Chwythu Tân i mewn i Gyfranogi'.

Yr oeddem yn falch o nodi bod y comisiynydd wedi enwi'r rhaglen Plant yn Gyntaf fel enghraifft o arfer da o ran cyfranogiad plant a phobl ifanc. Fel rhan o'r rhaglen honno, sefydlwyd grŵp gorchwyl eiriolaeth gennym i gynnal adolygiad llawn o eirioli plant yng Nghymru. Yr wythnos diwethaf, cyhoeddodd y comisiynydd 'Telling Concerns', ei adolygiad o gwynion a gweithdrefnau seinio rhybudd a gwasanaethau eirioli plant yng Nghymru. Cyfeirir y rhan fwyaf o'r argymhellion at awdurdodau lleol, ond bydd gan y grŵp gorchwyl eiriolaeth rôl allweddol i'w chwarae wrth gynghori Llywodraeth y

response.

The commissioner raised several educational issues, reflecting the concerns of children and young people. He has welcomed the changes that we have already made to the national curriculum assessments, through discontinuing the key stage 1 tests and the assessment of post-16 qualifications and key skills. These changes will reduce the pressures on students and their teachers, and will introduce a more flexible student-centred approach to assessing key skills, particularly in the 14 to 19 age range.

He also reports the concerns expressed to him by young people about the poor standards of school toilets. Improvements to toilet facilities are eligible under the school buildings improvement grant, and I am pleased to report that many such schemes have now been funded. The Assembly is committed to improving school buildings as a key priority, and to ensuring that all school buildings in Wales are in good physical condition and well maintained by 2010, at the latest.

As well as taking on the role of the independent champion for the rights of children and young people in Wales, the commissioner and his team also have a duty to challenge policies or actions that he feels are detrimental to the interests of young people. He has already shown how he is influencing the policy agenda whenever and wherever it impacts upon children and young people. One of his first public announcements concerned the effect that building schools on former landfill sites might have on children's health. As a direct result of those concerns, the Welsh Assembly Government is now researching ways in which the planning system can consider health issues more appropriately. The views of a broad range of community interests will also be taken into account, through improved consultation procedures on planning policy development.

The commissioner has raised concerns over the protection of children's rights, in particular, the physical punishment of children. The Assembly Government has

Cynulliad ar ei hymateb.

Cododd y comisiynydd sawl mater addysgol, gan adlewyrchu pryderon plant a phobl ifanc. Croesawodd y newidiadau a wnaethom eisoes i asesiadau'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol, drwy roi'r gorau i brofion cyfnod allweddol 1 ac asesu cymwysterau ôl-16 a sgiliau allweddol. Bydd y newidiadau hyn yn lleihau'r pwysau ar fyfyrwyr a'u hathrawon, gan gyflwyno ymagwedd tuag at asesu sgiliau allweddol sydd yn fwy hyblyg ac sydd yn canolbwyntio'n fwy ar fyfyrwyr, yn enwedig yn yr ystod oedran 14 i 19 mlwydd oed.

Mae hefyd yn nodi'r pryderon a fynegwyd iddo gan bobl ifanc ynghylch safonau gwael toiledau ysgol. Mae gwelliannau i doiledau yn gymwys o dan y grant gwella adeiladau ysgolion, ac yr wyf yn falch o nodi bod llawer o gynlluniau o'r fath bellach wedi eu hariannu. Mae'r Cynulliad yn ymrwymedig i wella adeiladau ysgolion fel blaenoriaeth allweddol, ac i sicrhau bod pob adeilad ysgol yng Nghymru mewn cyflwr da ac yn cael ei gynnal yn dda erbyn 2010, fan pellaf.

Yn ogystal ag ymgymryd â rôl hyrwyddwr annibynnol dros hawliau plant a phobl ifanc yng Nghymru, mae gan y comisiynydd a'i dîm ddyletswydd hefyd i herio polisiau neu weithredoedd sydd yn anfanteisiol i bobl ifanc yn ei farn ef. Eisoes dangosodd sut y mae'n dylanwadu ar yr agenda bolisi pryd bynnag a lle bynnag y mae'n effeithio ar blant a phobl ifanc. Soniodd un o'i gyhoeddiadau cyhoeddus cyntaf am yr effaith y gallai adeiladu ysgolion ar hen safleoedd tirlenwi ei chael ar iechyd plant. O ganlyniad uniongyrchol i'r pryderon hynny, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ymchwilio yn awr i ffyrdd lle y gall y system gynllunio ystyried materion iechyd yn fwy priodol. Caiff safbwyntiau ystod eang o fuddiannau cymunedol eu hystyried hefyd drwy weithdrefnau ymgynghori gwell ar ddatblygu polisi cynllunio.

Cododd y comisiynydd bryderon ynghylch diogelu hawliau plant, yn arbennig, cosbi plant yn gorfforol. Nododd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ei gwrthwynebiad, mewn

stated its opposition, in principle, to hitting children as a form of punishment. We are working towards changing the attitude of parents and carers towards it, and we have already banned its use in every form of public care and in all regulated children's services in Wales. We are now developing a children and parents' code for Wales to provide guidance on a range of issues surrounding positive parenting, family relationships and behaviour.

Wales was commended by the recent report of the United Nations committee on the rights of the child on our establishment of the post of Children's Commissioner for Wales. The commissioner has indicated that he intends to review the position of children in Wales, in the context of their rights under the UN convention on the rights of the child. We welcome this proposal.

The Assembly Government welcomes this report and the important issues that it raises. We intend to build upon the progress we have made over the past year in addressing these matters. I take this opportunity to thank Peter Clarke and his colleagues for their work, and to wish them success for the coming year.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I also thank Peter Clarke and his team. All of us involved in establishing the Children's Commissioner for Wales will feel that it is one of the best achievements of this first National Assembly; when the National Assembly's history is written, that achievement will be recorded. It is pleasing to see Wales commended by the UN, particularly in a context where the British Government and Britain overall did not do very well; Wales did well, partly because of the children's commissioner.

Given the importance of the commissioner's report and the Government's response to it, we regret that the matter could only be dealt with in a statement. Although it may not be possible, due to time constraints, to hold a full debate in response to this commissioner's report and the Government's response to it, will the Government consider establishing a principle of holding a proper debate in

egwyddor, i fwrw plant fel math o gosb. Yr ydym yn gweithio tuag at newid agwedd rhieni a gofalwyr tuag ato, ac eisoes bu inni wahardd ei ddefnydd mewn pob math o ofal cyhoeddus ac ym mhob gwasanaeth i blant a reoleiddir yng Nghymru. Yr ydym wrthi'n datblygu cod plant a rhieni ar gyfer Cymru i ddarparu canllawiau ar ystod o faterion ynghylch rhianta cadarnhaol, cydberthnasau teuluol ac ymddygiad.

Canmolwyd Cymru yn adroddiad diweddar pwyllgor y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar hawliau'r plentyn am inni sefydlu swydd Comisiynydd Plant Cymru. Mae'r comisiynydd wedi nodi ei fod yn bwriadu adolygu sefyllfa plant yng Nghymru, yng nghyd-destun eu hawliau o dan gonfensiwn y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar hawliau'r plentyn. Croesawn y cynnig hwn.

Croesawa Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yr adroddiad hwn a'r materion pwysig a godir ynddo. Bwriadwn adeiladu ar y cynnydd a wnaethom dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf i fynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn. Manteisiaf ar y cyfle hwn i ddiolch i Peter Clarke a'i gydweithwyr am eu gwaith, gan ddymuno pob llwyddiant iddynt yn y flwyddyn i ddod.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Diolchaf innau hefyd i Peter Clarke a'i dîm. Bydd pob un ohonom a fu'n gysylltiedig â sefydlu Comisiynydd Plant Cymru yn teimlo ei fod yn un o gyflawniadau gorau y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol cyntaf hwn; pan ysgrifennir hanes y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, caiff y cyflawniad hwnnw ei gofnodi. Mae'n bleser gweld Cymru yn cael ei chanmol gan y Cenhedloedd Unedig, yn arbennig mewn cyd-destun lle na wnaeth Llywodraeth Prydain a Phrydain yn gyffredinol yn dda iawn; gwnaeth Cymru yn dda, yn rhannol oherwydd y comisiynydd plant.

O gofio pwysigrwydd adroddiad y comisiynydd ac ymateb y Llywodraeth iddo, gresynwn mai dim ond mewn datganiad y gellid ymdrin â'r mater. Er nad yw'n bosibl efallai, oherwydd cyfyngiadau amser, i gynnal dadl lawn mewn ymateb i adroddiad y comisiynydd hwn ac ymateb y Llywodraeth iddo, a wnaiff y Llywodraeth ystyried sefydlu egwyddor o gynnal dadl briodol yn y

future? The commissioner's report contains wide-ranging issues, which we can only touch upon in a statement on your response. More needs to be said, and more Members may want to speak, than can be fitted into this relatively short slot.

Having said that, I will raise some specific concerns. On school toilets, there can be no worse mark of disrespect than expecting our children and young people to use facilities that we would not dream of using, and which would be unlawful in a workplace. I acknowledge the National Assembly Government's work with regard to school buildings overall, but will you speak to your colleague, the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, about asking local education authorities to give specific priority to toilet facilities? It is a basic request and LEAs should give priority to it when distributing the funding available in the grant scheme. It cannot be right that children still have to go outside to go to the lavatory in our schools, and it is interesting that children have also identified this as a priority.

The commissioner's report, and your response to it, refer to testing, and the commissioner's report asks for a wide-ranging national debate on how best we can test children and young people. Do you accept what the commissioner says, namely that children are currently seriously over-tested, and that the generation of children that have passed through the system have suffered from that? The commissioner refers to losing the thrill of learning. I acknowledge that positive steps have been taken—abolishing key stage 1 tests was excellent—but what will your Government do to promote a national debate about this whole issue?

On special educational needs, the commissioner's report says that services for children with special needs are in crisis in Wales. Does the Government of Wales acknowledge that, and will you, in response to the commissioner's report, give a higher priority to the issues that have been identified? Again, one acknowledges that some changes have been made, but Members

dyfodol? Mae adroddiad y comisiynydd yn cynnwys materion pellgyrhaeddol, y gallwn ond cyffwrdd arnynt mewn datganiad ar eich ymateb. Mae angen dweud mwy, ac efallai fod mwy o Aelodau am siarad, na'r hyn y gellir ei gynnwys yn y cyfnod amser cymharol byr hwn.

Wedi dweud hynny, codaf rai pryderon penodol. O ran toiledau ysgol, nid oes gwaeth arwydd o amarch na disgwyl i'n plant a'n pobl ifanc ddefnyddio cyfleusterau na fyddem yn breuddwydio am eu defnyddio, ac a fyddai'n anghyfreithlon yn y gweithle. Cydnabyddaf waith Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o ran adeiladau ysgolion yn gyffredinol, ond a wnewch chi siarad â'ch cyd-Aelod, y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, ynghylch gofyn i awdurdodau addysg lleol roi blaenoriaeth benodol i gyfleusterau toiled? Mae'n gais sylfaenol a dylai awdurdodau addysg lleol roi blaenoriaeth iddo wrth ddsbarthu'r arian sydd ar gael yn y cynllun grant. Ni all fod yn iawn bod plant yn dal i orfod mynd y tu allan i fynd i'r toiled yn ein hysgolion, ac mae'n ddiddorol bod plant wedi nodi hyn hefyd fel blaenoriaeth.

Mae adroddiad y comisiynydd, a'ch ymateb iddo, yn cyfeirio at brofi, ac mae adroddiad y comisiynydd yn gofyn am ddatl genedlaethol gynhwysfawr ar y ffordd orau o brofi plant a phobl ifanc. A dderbyniwch yr hyn a ddywed y comisiynydd, sef bod plant ar hyn o bryd yn cael eu gorbroti'n ddifrifol, a bod y genhedlaeth o blant sydd wedi mynd drwy'r system wedi dioddef yn sgîl hynny? Mae'r comisiynydd yn cyfeirio at golli gwefr dysgu. Cydnabyddaf fod camau cadarnhaol wedi eu cymryd—yr oedd diddymu profion cyfnod allweddol 1 yn rhagorol—ond beth a wna eich Llywodraeth i hyrwyddo dadl genedlaethol ar y mater hwn yn ei gyfanrwydd?

O ran anghenion addysgol arbennig, dywed adroddiad y comisiynydd fod gwasanaethau i blant ag anghenion arbennig yn wynebu argyfwng yng Nghymru. A yw Llywodraeth Cymru yn cydnabod hynny ac a wnewch chi, mewn ymateb i adroddiad y comisiynydd, roi blaenoriaeth uwch i'r materion a nodwyd? Unwaith eto, cydnabyddir y gwnaed rhai newidiadau, ond gŵyr yr Aelodau o'u



will know from their constituency surgeries that they are not enough and that they do not happen fast enough.

Your statement referred to landfill sites. It is a good thing—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I draw Helen Mary Jones's attention to the fact that she should be asking questions on a statement; we are listening to what is about to become a speech. Nothing prevents Helen Mary, or anyone else, requesting a debate on the commissioner's report and on the Government response to it in Government time or in opposition party time. I emphasise that, in order to allow as many Members as possible to ask questions, remarks should be limited. I will allow preambles but not speeches.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I apologise. I have one further brief question on landfill sites. How can your Government, on one level, write to local authorities advising them that they can safely ignore what the commissioner says about the reports on building on landfill sites, and then say that you are allowing his views to influence policy. That is difficult to understand. It is a matter of grave concern and I want you to respond to it.

**The First Minister:** I agree with your first remark, namely that it is to the enormous credit of the Assembly that its first action leading to an all-Wales Bill was establishing the post of the Children's Commissioner for Wales. It is a matter of personal pride and pleasure to me that establishing the post of Children's Commissioner for Wales by legislation was one of a relatively small number of matters for which I was responsible in Labour's 1999 manifesto. It is rare for politicians to be able to say that they feel partially personally responsible for a manifesto intention becoming a reality. I still pinch myself sometimes that it happened in that way. However, it could not have happened without cross-party support in the Assembly, and the climate established by the Waterhouse report in stating that this should happen when the Assembly came into being.

cyngorfeydd nad ydynt yn ddigon ac nad ydynt yn digwydd yn ddigon cyflym.

Cyfeiriodd eich datganiad at safleoedd tirlenwi. Mae'n beth da—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Tynnaf sylw Helen Mary Jones at y ffaith y dylai fod yn gofyn cwestiynau ar ddatganiad; yr ydym yn gwrandao ar yr hyn sydd ar fin troi'n araith. Nid oes dim yn atal Helen Mary, nac unrhyw un arall, rhag gofyn am ddatl ar adroddiad y comisiynydd ac ar ymateb y Llywodraeth iddo yn ystod amser y Llywodraeth neu yn ystod amser gwrthblaid. Pwysleisaf y dylid cyfyngu ar y sylwadau, er mwyn caniatáu i gymaint o Aelodau â phosibl ofyn cwestiynau. Caniatâf ragymadroddion, ond nid areithiau.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Ymddiheuraf. Mae gennyf un cwestiwn byr arall ar safleoedd tirlenwi. Sut y gall eich Llywodraeth, ar y naill law, ysgrifennu at awdurdodau lleol yn eu cyngori y gallant yn ddiogel anwybyddu'r hyn a ddywed y comisiynydd am yr adroddiadau ar adeiladu ar safleoedd tirlenwi, a dweud, ar y llaw arall, eich bod yn caniatáu i'w safbwyntiau ddylanwadu ar bolisi. Mae hynny'n anodd i'w ddeall. Mae'n fater sy'n peri pryder mawr ac yr wyf am ichi ymateb iddo.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cytunaf â'ch sylw cyntaf, sef ei fod er clod mawr i'r Cynulliad mai sefydlu swydd Comisiynydd Plant Cymru oedd ei enghraifft gyntaf o ddeddfu Mesur i Gymru gyfan. Mae'r ffaith bod sefydlu swydd Comisiynydd Plant Cymru yn un o'r nifer cymharol fach o faterion yr oeddwn yn gyfrifol amdano ym maniffesto Llafur yn 1999 yn fater yr ymfalchïaf ynddo ac sy'n rhoi pleser i mi yn bersonol. Anaml y gall gwleidyddion ddweud eu bod hwy yn bersonol yn teimlo'n rhannol gyfrifol am droi bwriad maniffesto yn realiti. Ni allaf gredu o hyd ei fod wedi digwydd felly. Fodd bynnag, ni allai fod wedi digwydd heb gefnogaeth drawsbleidiol yn y Cynulliad a heb yr hinsawdd a sefydlwyd gan adroddiad Waterhouse wrth nodi y dylai hyn ddigwydd pan ddaeth y Cynulliad i fod.

You questioned whether this statement should have been a debate. It is for the Business Committee to decide whether there should be a debate, but, as far as I am aware, a statement is necessary to give the Welsh Assembly Government's formal response to the children's commissioner's annual report.

On school toilets, I agree that the *tŷ bach tu fas* is the ultimate form of social exclusion. I remember the *tŷ bach* at the end of the playground in Radyr council school when I was a pupil there, and the tales of many disasters on the way to the *tŷ bach tu fas*. Such accidents are difficult and nasty experiences for children to have to cope with—not in 1943 when I went to school, with all the exigencies of war, but in 2003, 60 years later. It is still happening and it is not good enough. The provision of funding for school building improvements is now sufficient for there to be no excuses not to put these matters right over the next few years. There are no excuses for that and we will continue to press for it to be as high on the agenda of school building improvements as possible, in line with the priority that children give it.

3.00 p.m.

You also mentioned stress and tests. A major improvement, which is always commented upon favourably to me whenever I visit a junior school, was getting rid of the key stage 1 tests. Whether we can go further than that is a matter for future discussion in the light of what I believe will prove to be the beneficial effects of abolishing key stage 1 tests, when that can be analysed. There is a more general issue about how much examination pressure is good for children, and I note the comments that have been made about AS-levels, which inject examinations into what used to be the relatively quiet year of what was called the lower sixth form when I was in school.

You also mentioned special educational needs. There is great dissatisfaction with this, and always has been, because it is so difficult to establish a right to a statement and then to get the additional attention that a child needs.

Gwnaethoch holi a ddylai'r datganiad hwn fod wedi bod yn ddadl. Cyfrifoldeb y Pwyllgor Busnes yw penderfynu a ddylid cynnal dadl, ond, hyd y gwn i, mae angen datganiad i roi ymateb ffurfiol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i adroddiad blynyddol y comisiynydd plant.

O ran toiledau ysgolion, cytunaf mai'r *tŷ bach tu fas* yw'r enghraifft berffaith o allgáu cymdeithasol. Cofiaf y *tŷ bach* ar ben arall iard chwarae ysgol gyngor Radur pan oeddwn yn ddisgybl yno, a'r hanesion am drychinebau lu ar y ffordd i'r *tŷ bach tu fas*. Mae damweiniau o'r fath yn anodd ac yn brofiadau diflas i blant ymdopi â hwy—nid yn 1943 pan euthum i i'r ysgol, gyda holl gyfyngderau rhyfel, ond yn 2003, 60 mlynedd yn ddiweddarach. Mae'n digwydd o hyd, ac nid yw'n ddigon da. Mae'r arian a ddarperir ar gyfer gwelliannau i adeiladau ysgolion yn ddigonol yn awr fel nad oes esgus dros beidio ag unioni pethau dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf. Nid oes unrhyw esgus dros hynny a byddwn yn parhau i bwysu i sicrhau'r flaenoriaeth uchaf posibl i'r mater hwn ar yr agenda gwelliannau i adeiladau ysgolion, yn unol â'r flaenoriaeth a rydd plant iddo.

Soniasoch hefyd am straen a phroffion. Yr oedd cael gwared ar y profion cyfnod allweddol 1 yn un gwelliant mawr, y gwneir sylwadau ffafriol amdano wrthyf bob tro yr ymwelaf ag ysgolion iau. Mae pa un a allwn fynd ymhellach na hynny yn fater i'w drafod yn y dyfodol yng ngoleuni'r hyn a fydd, yn fy marn i, yn effeithiau buddiol diddymu profion cyfnod allweddol 1, pan allwn ddadansoddi hynny. Mae mater mwy cyffredinol ynghylch faint o bwysau arholiadau sy'n dda i blant, a nodaf y sylwadau a wnaed am arholiadau Safon Uwch Atodol, sy'n chwistrellu arholiadau i'r flwyddyn a arferai fod yn gymharol dawel sef yr hyn a elwid yn chweched dosbarth isaf pan oeddwn i yn yr ysgol.

Soniasoch hefyd am anghenion addysgol arbennig. Mae cryn anfodlonrwydd gyda hyn, ac wedi bod erioed, gan ei fod mor anodd sefydlu hawl i ddatganiad ac yna cael y sylw ychwanegol sydd ei angen ar blentyn. Yr

I was talking to a parent this morning who told me how pleased he was that his son was able to obtain additional help for dyslexia without being taken out of his regular school, and about how good the progress had been. However, I know that that is not the case throughout Wales. Special educational needs provision covers a wide range of measures, but I think that we are making progress on that front. Through the statementing procedure, it is a right, and accessing provision without financial considerations restricting it so much that you might as well not have that right, is important.

We have not said to local authorities that they can safely ignore the views of the children's commissioner on landfill—that is a distortion of what we have said. We said to them that they should respect his views. However, we have also told them that he is not an overlord and does not issue commands to local authorities stating 'thou shalt not build that school on that site'. It was never envisaged that the children's commissioner would have such power over local authorities. They should take into account what the commissioner has said, and if they wish to maintain their previous position, that they would be within their legal rights to build on such sites, they can do so. We have told authorities that they should respect the commissioner's views, and certainly not safely ignore them. However, parents who are worried about particular schools or sites must not expect the commissioner to act as a kind of chief justice of the Supreme Court of the United States and order local authorities not to build a school on a certain site.

**Gwenda Thomas:** I realise that this statement is on the Welsh Assembly Government's response to the annual report of the Children's Commissioner for Wales, but subsequent to that report, the commissioner has produced a report that expresses concern about the implementation of the Waterhouse recommendations given that they affect local government. In particular, he has expressed concern about corporate parenting. You will be aware that the Local Government and Housing Committee has also raised these concerns. In

oeddwn yn siarad â rhiant y bore yma a ddywedodd wrthyf pa mor falch yr oedd bod ei fab yn gallu cael help ychwanegol ar gyfer dyslecsia heb orfod gadael ei ysgol arferol, ac am y cynnydd da a wnaed. Fodd bynnag, gwn nad felly y mae ledled Cymru. Mae darpariaeth anghenion addysgol arbennig yn cwmpasu ystod eang o fesurau, ond credaf ein bod yn gwneud cynnydd yn hynny o beth. Drwy'r weithdrefn datganiadau, mae yn hawl, ac mae cael gafael ar ddarpariaeth heb ystyriaethau ariannol yn ei chyfyngu gymaint fel y byddai bron yn well peidio â chael yr hawl honno, yn bwysig.

Nid ydym wedi dweud wrth awdurdodau lleol y gallant yn ddiogel anwybyddu safbwyntiau'r comisiynydd plant ar dirlenwi—mae hynny'n gwyrdroi'r hyn a ddywedwyd gennym. Dywedasom wrthynt y dylent barchu ei safbwyntiau. Fodd bynnag, dywedasom wrthynt hefyd nad yw'n unben ac nad yw'n rhoi gorchmynion i awdurdodau lleol yn datgan 'ni chewch adeiladu'r ysgol honno ar y safle hwnnw'. Ni ragwelwyd erioed y byddai gan y comisiynydd plant y fath bŵer dros awdurdodau lleol. Dylent ystyried yr hyn a ddywedodd y comisiynydd, ac os ydynt am barhau i arddel eu barn flaenorol, y byddent o fewn eu hawliau cyfreithiol i adeiladu ar safleoedd o'r fath, gallant wneud hynny. Yr ydym wedi dweud wrth yr awdurdodau y dylent barchu safbwyntiau'r comisiynydd, ac yn sicr na fyddai'n ddiogel iddynt eu hanwybyddu. Fodd bynnag, ni ddylai rhieni sy'n gofidio am ysgolion neu safleoedd arbennig ddisgwyl i'r comisiynydd weithredu fel rhyw fath o brif ustus Goruchaf Lys yr Unol Daleithiau a gorchymyn awdurdodau lleol i beidio ag adeiladu ysgol ar safle penodol.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Sylweddolaf fod y datganiad hwn ar ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i adroddiad blynyddol Comisiynydd Plant Cymru, ond yn dilyn yr adroddiad hwnnw, mae'r comisiynydd wedi cynhyrchu adroddiad sy'n mynegi pryder ynghylch gweithredu argymhellion Waterhouse o gofio eu bod yn effeithio ar lywodraeth leol. Yn arbennig, mynegodd bryder ynghylch rhianta corfforaethol. Byddwch yn ymwybodol y cododd y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai y pryderon hyn hefyd. Mewn ymateb i

response to a written question from me, you gave an assurance that the Cabinet's sub-committee on children and young people would discuss this issue. Will you seek progress on this so that we can avoid negative comments in next year's report?

**The First Minister:** I am grateful for your comments, because I did have a problem with a question that you asked on corporate parenting previously, as I did not hear the word 'corporate'. It is an important issue. Local authority members and officers sometimes have to stand in for the natural parents of a child. We have discussed this in the sub-committee and we will make recommendations on how the new duties of corporate parenting should be carried forward in an appropriate and sensitive way. Not everything recommended by Waterhouse in this regard is easy to implement. There are many pros and cons on the issue of whether random visits by councillors are better than organised ones. There is a role here for specialist officers who have gone through the new Criminal Records Bureau procedures. Many local authority members will not have gone through that process and will not expect to do so either. There are many implications following those procedures, which will prevent some people from making random visits to looked-after children in short or long-term care. Those issues have been considered in extenso in the sub-committee. Either I, or Jane Hutt who chairs that sub-committee, will be able to report back further.

**David Melding:** I commend the work of the children's commissioner, Peter Clarke, and his team. This is an historical occasion. We have this first report, which was initially presented to the Assembly last autumn, and we now have the Government's response. An opportunity to debate the report more fully would be welcome, though a statement is appropriate in the first instance. I congratulate the Government, the Minister for Health and Social Services, and all of the political parties here for their leadership in establishing the children's commissioner. The Conservatives did not commit to establishing the commissioner in its last manifesto but we changed our policy in the Assembly's first months. Our comments and

gwestiwn ysgrifenedig gennyf fi, rhoddwyd sicrwydd gennych y byddai is-bwyllgor y Cabinet ar blant a phobl ifanc yn trafod y mater hwn. A wnewch sicrhau bod cynnydd ar hyn fel y gallwn osgoi sylwadau negyddol yn adroddiad y flwyddyn nesaf?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich sylwadau, oherwydd yr oedd cwestiwn a ofynnwyd gennych ar rianta corfforaethol o'r blaen yn peri problem imi, gan na chlywais y gair 'corfforaethol'. Mae'n fater pwysig. Weithiau, rhaid i aelodau awdurdodau lleol a swyddogion gymryd lle rhieni naturiol plentyn. Yr ydym wedi trafod hyn yn yr is-bwyllgor a gwnawn argymhellion ar sut y dylid datblygu dyletswyddau newydd rianta corfforaethol mewn ffordd briodol a sensitif. Nid yw popeth a argymhellir gan Waterhouse yn hyn o beth yn hawdd i'w roi ar waith. Mae llawer o fanteision ac anfanteision o ran pa un a yw hapymweliadau gan gynghorwyr yn well nag ymweliadau wedi eu trefnu. Mae rôl yma i swyddogion arbenigol sydd wedi bod drwy weithdrefnau newydd y Swyddfa Cofnodion Troseddol. Ni fydd llawer o aelodau awdurdodau lleol wedi bod drwy'r broses honno ac ni fyddant yn disgwyl gwneud hynny ychwaith. Mae llawer o oblygiadau yn dilyn y gweithdrefnau hynny, a fydd yn atal rhai pobl rhag ymweld ar hap â phlant sy'n derbyn gofal byrdymor neu hirdymor. Ystyriwyd y materion hynny yn helaeth yn yr is-bwyllgor. Byddaf i, neu Jane Hutt sy'n cadeirio'r is-bwyllgor hwnnw, yn gallu cyflwyno adroddiad arall ar hyn.

**David Melding:** Cymeradwyaf waith y comisiynydd plant, Peter Clarke, a'i dîm. Mae hwn yn achlysur hanesyddol. Mae gennym yr adroddiad cyntaf hwn, a gyflwynwyd am y tro cyntaf i'r Cynulliad yr hydref diwethaf, ac erbyn hyn mae ymateb y Llywodraeth gennym. Byddwn yn croesawu'r cyfle i drafod yr adroddiad yn llawnach, er bod datganiad yn briodol yn y lle cyntaf. Llongyfarchaf y Llywodraeth, y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, a'r holl bleidiau gwleidyddol yma am eu harweinyddiaeth wrth sefydlu'r comisiynydd plant. Nid ymrwymodd y Ceidwadwyr i sefydlu'r comisiynydd yn eu maniffesto diwethaf ond newidiasom ein polisi yn ystod misoedd cyntaf y Cynulliad.

advice were received with good grace. We are grateful for that because we see the office beginning to flourish and take root. It is important that the office of the children's commissioner receives cross-party support in future.

This is how devolution should work. We should establish best practice in certain areas and then see that emulated across the United Kingdom. I believe that that is likely to happen in the case of establishing the children's commissioner. It demonstrates what can happen when you have a model of governance that allows for some form of devolution or federalism. I wish that we had picked our targets in some other areas with the necessary discipline to really make a difference.

I will focus on one issue, which is not in the report as such. The office of the children's commissioner was established because of the concern of many people about the cases in north Wales—but then, unfortunately, similar cases were found all round Wales—and about the state of social care for children. The Waterhouse report recommended that the children's commissioner be established. Since then we have seen joint reviews of social services in nearly every authority. Within the next six months every authority will have been inspected. Several of our authorities have failed badly and I think that nearly all of them have failed in terms of the quality of children's services that they deliver. No authority has been found to be delivering children's services well. We must ponder this point carefully. The phenomenon that established the office of the children's commissioner still exists and probably in its full force as it did, alas, 10 or 20 years ago. We must acknowledge that if we do not improve the quality of children's services, we will not gain anything like the level of benefit we would want to have from the office of the children's commissioner.

The commissioner should currently be considering the future of the joint reviews of social services. I believe that what was presented to the Health and Social Services Committee last week is that we move away from a robust and comprehensive system of

Derbyniwyd ein sylwadau a'n cyngor yn raslon. Yr ydym yn ddiolchgar am hynny oherwydd yr ydym yn dechrau gweld y swydd yn ffynnu ac yn gwreiddio. Mae'n bwysig bod swydd y comisiynydd plant yn cael cefnogaeth drawsbleidiol yn y dyfodol.

Dyma sut y dylai datganoli weithio. Dylem sefydlu arfer gorau mewn rhai meysydd ac yna dylem weld hynny'n cael ei efelychu ledled y Deyrnas Unedig. Credaf ei fod yn debygol o ddigwydd yn achos sefydlu'r comisiynydd plant. Mae'n dangos beth all ddigwydd pan fydd gennych fodel llywodraethu sy'n caniatáu ar gyfer rhyw fath o ddatganoli neu ffederaliaeth. Gresyn na fyddem wedi dewis ein targedau mewn rhai meysydd eraill gyda'r ddisgyblaeth angenrheidiol i wneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol.

Canolbwyntiaf ar un mater, nad oedd yn yr adroddiad fel y cyfryw. Sefydlwyd swydd y comisiynydd plant oherwydd pryder llawer o bobl ynghylch yr achosion yn y Gogledd—ond yna, yn anffodus, daeth achosion tebyg i'r golwg ledled Cymru—a phryder ynghylch cyflwr gofal cymdeithasol i blant. Argymhellodd adroddiad Waterhouse y dylid sefydlu comisiynydd plant. Ers hynny gwelsom adolygiadau ar y cyd o wasanaethau cymdeithasol ymron pob awdurdod. O fewn y chwe mis nesaf bydd pob awdurdod wedi ei archwilio. Mae sawl un o'n hawdurdodau wedi methu'n wael a chredaf fod bron pob un ohonynt wedi methu o ran ansawdd y gwasanaethau plant a ddarparant. Ni chanfuwyd un awdurdod a oedd yn darparu gwasanaethau plant yn dda. Rhaid inni ystyried y pwynt hwn yn ofalus. Mae'r ffenomenon a sefydlodd swydd y comisiynydd plant yn bodoli o hyd ac mae yr un mor amlwg mae'n siŵr ag yr oedd, ysywaeth, 10 neu 20 mlynedd yn ôl. Rhaid inni gydnabod, os na wellwn ansawdd gwasanaethau plant, ni chawn unrhyw beth tebyg i lefel y budd y byddem yn dymuno ei chael o swydd y comisiynydd plant.

Dylai'r comisiynydd fod wrthi ar hyn o bryd yn ystyried dyfodol yr adolygiadau ar y cyd o wasanaethau cymdeithasol. Credaf mai'r hyn a gyflwynwyd i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yr wythnos diwethaf oedd y dylem symud i ffwrdd o

joint reviews to a system that will be located within the Assembly—not without—without operational independence. I fear for the future of the inspection of social services and local authorities. We would be in dereliction of our duty to children if we did not ensure that the system remains robust.

**The First Minister:** David, I think that you struck the right note, in that I welcome the words of congratulation in your opening remarks, which noted the historical significance. History of course is one thing, but avoiding complacency on the back of congratulation is equally important. You said that we should ensure that the work proceeds and that we remember why the children's commissioner had to be instituted. It was instituted because the Waterhouse inquiry found this gulag archipelago of children's homes across north Wales; however, that was not restricted to north Wales, nor was it restricted to Wales. In remembering that, we must ensure that not only are there far fewer children's homes and people in the looked-after sector who are looked after in a different way, but also that they are inspected and that standards are maintained, so that we never have to institute another Waterhouse report in Wales. Likewise, when it comes to individual children who are at home, it is not always the answer. The Victoria Climbié case proves that; that case was not in Wales, but that is not relevant. The recommendation made by the Lord Laming inquiry into that case—which was a disaster and tragedy—said that England should follow Wales's lead, and have a children's commissioner. Victoria Climbié was not in residential care, but was being looked after by relatives. Her case was not being followed up in terms of the warnings received by local authorities, the police, school teachers and so on.

3.10 p.m.

You mentioned the joint review of social services; the system needs to be at its very best to ensure that children's services receive an appropriately high priority within social

system gadarn a chynhwysfawr o adolygiadau ar y cyd i system a fydd wedi ei lleoli o fewn y Cynulliad—nid y tu allan—heb annibyniaeth weithredol. Pryderaf ynghylch dyfodol archwiliadau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ac awdurdodau lleol. Byddem yn esgeuluso ein dyletswydd i blant pe na baem yn sicrhau bod y system yn parhau yn gadarn.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** David, credaf ichi daro'r nodyn cywir, yn yr ystyr fy mod yn croesawu'r llongyfarchiadau yn eich sylwadau agoriadol, a nododd yr arwyddocâd hanesyddol. Mae hanes yn un peth wrth gwrs, ond mae osgoi hunanfodddhad ar draul llongyfarchiadau yr un mor bwysig. Dywedasoeh y dylem sicrhau bod y gwaith yn mynd yn ei flaen a'n bod yn cofio pam y bu'n rhaid sefydlu'r comisiynydd plant. Fe'i sefydlwyd am fod ymchwiliad Waterhouse wedi canfod y casgliad hwn o gartrefi plant ledled y Gogledd lle yr oedd llawer o blant yn wynebu dioddefaint a chaledi; fodd bynnag, ni chyfyngwyd hynny i'r Gogledd, nac i Gymru ychwaith. Wrth gofio hynny, rhaid inni sicrhau, nid yn unig fod llai o gartrefi plant a llai o bobl yn y sector gofal sy'n derbyn gofal mewn ffordd wahanol, ond hefyd y cânt eu harchwilio ac y caiff safonau eu cynnal fel nad oes rhaid inni gychwyn adroddiad Waterhouse arall yng Nghymru. Yn yr un modd, o ran plant unigol sy'n byw gartref, nid dyma'r ateb bob tro. Mae achos Victoria Climbié yn profi hynny; nid yng Nghymru yr oedd yr achos hwnnw, ond nid yw hynny'n berthnasol. Dywedodd yr argymhelliad a wnaed gan ymchwiliad Arglwydd Laming i'r achos hwnnw—a oedd yn drychineb ac yn drasiedi—y dylai Lloegr ddilyn esiampl Cymru, a sefydlu comisiynydd plant. Nid oedd Victoria Climbié mewn gofal preswyl, ond yr oedd perthnasau yn gofalu amdani. Ni weithredwyd ar ei hachos yn dilyn y rhybuddion a dderbyniwyd gan awdurdodau lleol, yr heddlu, athrawon ysgol ac yn y blaen.

Soniasoch am yr adolygiad ar y cyd o wasanaethau cymdeithasol; mae angen i'r system fod ar ei gorau i sicrhau bod gwasanaethau plant yn cael blaenoriaeth

services. The Audit Commission and the Social Services Inspectorate carry out their work independently, ensuring that there is follow up by appropriate authorities. We have seen local authorities go through the mill, starting with Torfaen County Borough Council about three years ago, and recently Cardiff council—I think that there has been one other since then. None have been particularly encouraging, but the turnaround that has been achieved since this process began with the Torfaen inquiry is encouraging. Seeing Torfaen council, then later the Vale of Glamorgan Council, succeed in turning around services gives hope that other authorities that have had a fairly severe dressing down in joint reviews will also see that there is a way forward. If it has been done in Torfaen and in the Vale of Glamorgan, there is no reason why it cannot be done by other Welsh authorities that receive adverse reports.

**The Presiding Officer:** We have less than five minutes left for this statement, so I ask for concise questions and answers.

**Peter Black:** I also offer my congratulations to the Children's Commissioner for Wales on his work; it justifies the cross-party consensus on setting up this post. As has been said, the circumstances which led to setting up this post justify the work which has been carried out to date by the commissioner.

I echo David Melding's comments about the joint reviews of social services. The results of the reviews are obviously a matter of concern. As further reviews are carried out, we will take an interest in their findings. The important point is that, when the post of the Children's Commissioner for Wales was set up, the Assembly did not necessarily get all its own way with regard to all the powers that we wanted the commissioner to have. I would be interested to know whether there is an ongoing dialogue between the Assembly and the commissioner in terms of how he could do his job more effectively with additional powers. If that is the case, what can the Assembly Government do to assist the

briodol uchel o fewn gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Mae'r Comisiwn Archwilio a'r Arolygiaeth Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn cyflawni eu gwaith yn annibynnol, gan sicrhau bod yr awdurdodau priodol yn gweithredu ar y gwaith hwnnw. Gwelsom awdurdodau lleol yn mynd drwy'r felin, gan ddechrau gyda Chyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Tor-faen tua thair blynedd yn ôl, ac yn ddiweddar gyda chyngor Caerdydd—credaf y bu un arall ers hynny. Ni fu'r un ohonynt yn arbennig o galonogol, ond mae'r newid a gyflawnwyd ers i'r broses hon ddechrau gydag ymchwiliad Tor-faen yn galonogol. Mae gweld cyngor Tor-faen, yna Cyngor Bro Morgannwg yn ddiweddarach, yn llwyddo i wrydroi gwasanaethau yn rhoi gobaith y bydd awdurdodau eraill a geryddwyd yn eithaf llym mewn adolygiadau ar y cyd yn gweld bod ffordd ymlaen. Os cafodd ei gyflawni yn Nhor-faen ac ym Mro Morgannwg, nid oes rheswm pam na all awdurdodau eraill yng Nghymru a gafodd adroddiadau anffafriol wneud hynny.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae gennym lai na phum munud yn weddill ar gyfer y datganiad hwn, felly gofynnaf am gwestiynau ac atebion cryno.

**Peter Black:** Hoffwn innau hefyd longyfarch Comisiynydd Plant Cymru ar ei waith; mae'n cyfiawnhau'r consensws trawsbleidiol ar sefydlu'r swydd hon. Fel y soniwyd, mae'r amgylchiadau a arweiniodd at sefydlu'r swydd hon yn cyfiawnhau'r gwaith a wnaed hyd yma gan y comisiynydd.

Ategaf sylwadau David Melding ar yr adolygiadau ar y cyd o wasanaethau cymdeithasol. Mae canlyniadau'r adolygiadau yn amlwg yn achosi pryder. Wrth i adolygiadau pellach gael eu cynnal, byddwn yn cymryd diddordeb yn eu canfyddiadau. Y pwynt pwysig i'w gofio yw, pan sefydlwyd swydd Comisiynydd Plant Cymru, na chafodd y Cynulliad o reidrwydd ei ffordd ei hun yn gyfan gwbl o ran yr holl bwerau yr oeddem am i'r comisiynydd eu cael. Byddai diddordeb gennyf wybod a yw'r Cynulliad a'r comisiynydd yn trafod ar hyn o bryd sut y gallai wneud ei swydd yn fwy effeithiol gyda phwerau ychwanegol. Os felly, beth all Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ei

commissioner to acquire those additional powers?

**The First Minister:** The commissioner's powers were set up in two steps: first under the Care Standards Act 2000, which covered the provisions under that Act, and secondly under the Children's Commissioner for Wales Act 2001. It means that the commissioner and his team is not restricted to operating within the powers of the Assembly; they can operate more widely than that. In addition to considering education, health and the other matters that are devolved to us, they can consider youth justice matters for which the youth justice board, and not us, is responsible. It is important that those two areas are seen together. It is fortunate that the commissioner's powers are not restricted to the matters devolved to the Assembly. The work of the commissioner would be unduly restricted if he could only deal with devolved services. I understand that the Select Committee on Welsh Affairs is currently considering the difficulties caused by where the boundary line is currently drawn with regard to children's and young people's services in terms of what is devolved and what is reserved by Westminster.

**Pauline Jarman:** The Government's response to the report pays regard to the needs of Welsh speakers, and the difficulties of providing therapy services to children and young people—in particular speech and language therapy. What is your expectation, and what is the requirement, of Assembly sponsored public bodies in managing children's services with regard to protecting the rights of the child to a choice of language? To assist you, it appears that—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The First Minister does not need any further assistance. You have asked a question.

**The First Minister:** I have the answer here. The report prepared by the University of Wales, Bangor, 'Acknowledging Need', identified a number of important recommendations with regard to special educational needs and Welsh speakers, but the same would apply to the training of more staff. We are short of speech and language therapists in the health service and the

wneud i gynorthwyo'r comisiynydd i gaffael y pwerau ychwanegol hynny?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Sefydlwyd pwerau'r comisiynydd mewn dau gam: yn gyntaf o dan Ddeddf Safonau Gofal 2000, a gwmpasai'r darpariaethau o dan y Ddeddf honno, ac yn ail o dan Ddeddf Comisiynydd Plant Cymru 2001. Golyga nad yw'r comisiynydd a'i dîm wedi'u cyfyngu i weithredu o fewn pwerau'r Cynulliad; gallant weithredu yn fwy eang na hynny. Yn ogystal ag ystyried addysg, iechyd a'r materion eraill a ddatganolir inni, gallant ystyried materion cyfiawnder ieuencid y mae'r bwrdd cyfiawnder ieuencid, ac nid ni, yn gyfrifol amdanynt. Mae'n bwysig ystyried y ddau faes hynny gyda'i gilydd. Mae'n ffodus nad yw pwerau'r comisiynydd yn gyfyngedig i'r materion a ddatganolir i'r Cynulliad. Byddai gwaith y comisiynydd yn rhy gyfyngedig pe bai ond yn gallu ymdrin â gwasanaethau datganoledig. Deallaf fod y Pwyllgor Dethol ar Faterion Cymreig yn ystyried ar hyn o bryd yr anawsterau sy'n codi o ganlyniad i'r man lle y tynnir y llinell derfyn ar hyn o bryd mewn perthynas â gwasanaethau plant a phobl ifanc o ran yr hyn sy'n ddatganoledig a'r hyn a gedwir gan San Steffan.

**Pauline Jarman:** Mae ymateb y Llywodraeth i'r adroddiad yn rhoi sylw i anghenion siaradwyr Cymraeg, ac anawsterau darparu gwasanaethau therapi i blant a phobl ifanc—yn arbennig therapi lleferydd ac iaith. Beth yr ydych yn ei ddisgwyl gan gyrff cyhoeddus a noddur gan y Cynulliad, a beth yw'r gofyniad, wrth reoli gwasanaethau plant mewn perthynas â diogelu hawliau'r plentyn i ddewis iaith? I'ch cynorthwyo, ymddengys fod—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid oes angen i'r Prif Weinidog gael unrhyw gymorth pellach. Yr ydych wedi gofyn cwestiwn.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r ateb gennyf yma. Nododd yr adroddiad a baratowyd gan Brifysgol Cymru, Bangor, 'Cydnabod Angen', nifer o argymhellion pwysig o ran anghenion addysgol arbennig a siaradwyr Cymraeg, ond byddai'r un peth yn berthnasol o ran hyfforddi rhagor o staff. Yr ydym yn brin o therapyddion lleferydd ac iaith yn y gwasanaeth iechyd a'r gwasanaeth addysg, ac



education service, and we are particularly short of those with Welsh language competence. We must ensure that we make good those shortages by training more speech therapists, and we are doing that.

**Christine Chapman:** I welcome the stance that the commissioner has taken against the physical punishment of children, as well as your statement. Bearing in mind the increasing number of parliamentarians who support this campaign, and the increasing number of countries that have banned and are looking to ban the physical punishment of children, will you continue to take a lead so that Wales is viewed as a country that supports parents to develop better, alternative, non-violent forms of discipline? That will have an impact on how young people relate to society as a whole in future.

**The First Minister:** There are different kinds of bans. We have banned the use of physical punishment in statutory public premises, that is, in the looked-after sector—children’s care homes and so on—and also in schools. However, the course of banning physical punishment in the home is not open to us. I am sure, Christine, that you attended a presentation by a Swedish expert, whose surname I cannot remember—I believe her first name was Malin—who said that although Sweden has a civil code that bans physical punishment in the home, it has never had to use the associated statutory sanctions. The idea of sending parents to jail for smacking their children was not viable. We would welcome a non-statutory code. People question the usefulness of such a code if a parent who slaps does not fear being sent to jail. However, given that statutory sanctions have never been used in Sweden, we need not fear that a non-statutory code would be useless. We hope to publish that code soon.

**David Ian Jones:** I also welcome the commissioner’s report and your Government’s response to it. I will refer briefly to your policy on school bullying, which is a major issue and turns school into a living hell for many children. I am glad to see the guidance that you have issued, which concentrates on the need for policies that

yr ydym yn arbennig o brin o rai sy’n gallu siarad Cymraeg. Rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn gwneud iawn am y diffygion hynny drwy hyfforddi mwy o therapyddion lleferydd, ac yr ydym yn gwneud hynny.

**Christine Chapman:** Croesawaf safbwynt y comisiynydd ar beidio â chosbi plant yn gorfforol, yn ogystal â’ch datganiad chi. O gofio bod nifer gynyddol o Aelodau Seneddol yn cefnogi’r ymgyrch hon, a bod nifer gynyddol o wledydd wedi gwahardd, neu y disgwylir iddynt wahardd, cosbi plant yn gorfforol, a wnewch chi barhau i arwain y blaen fel yr ystyrir Cymru fel gwlad sy’n cynorthwyo rhieni i ddatblygu ffurfiau amgen, di-drais, gwell ar ddisgyblaeth? Caiff hynny effaith ar y modd y mae pobl ifanc yn ymwneud â chymdeithas yn gyffredinol yn y dyfodol.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae mathau gwahanol o waharddiadau. Gwaharddwyd y defnydd o gosb gorfforol mewn eiddo cyhoeddus statudol, hynny yw, yn y sector gofal—cartrefi gofal plant ac yn y blaen—a hefyd mewn ysgolion. Fodd bynnag, nid yw gwahardd cosb gorfforol yn y cartref yn agored i ni. Yr wyf yn siŵr, Christine, i chi fynychu cyflwyniad gan arbenigwr o Sweden, na allaf gofio ei chyfenw—credaf mai Malin oedd ei henw cyntaf—a ddywedodd nad yw Sweden erioed wedi gorfod defnyddio’r cosbau statudol cysylltiedig, er bod ganddi god sifil sy’n gwahardd cosb gorfforol yn y cartref. Nid oedd y syniad o anfon rhieni i’r carchar am daro eu plant yn ymarferol. Byddem yn croesawu cod anstatudol. Mae pobl yn amau defnyddioldeb cod o’r fath os nad yw rhiant sy’n taro yn ofni cael ei anfon i’r carchar. Fodd bynnag, o gofio nas defnyddiwyd cosbau statudol erioed yn Sweden, nid oes angen inni ofni y byddai cod anstatudol yn ddiwerth. Gobeithiwn gyhoeddi’r cod hwnnw yn fuan.

**David Ian Jones:** Croesawaf innau adroddiad y comisiynydd hefyd ac ymateb eich Llywodraeth iddo. Cyfeiriaf yn fras at eich polisi ar fwlio mewn ysgolion, sydd yn broblem fawr ac sy’n troi ysgol yn uffern ar y ddaear i lawer o blant. Yr wyf yn falch o weld y canllawiau a gyhoeddwyd gennych, sy’n canolbwyntio ar yr angen am bolisiau

create a positive school environment, leading to mutual respect. In that context, I draw your attention to the Drugs Abuse Resistance Education charity in the Rhondda, which has been highly successful. It does not simply concentrate on drugs and drug abuse, but adopts a holistic approach of teaching mutual respect to children. The director of DARE appeared before the Local Government and Housing Committee today to give a presentation, and I hope that you would carefully consider making funds available to evaluate the work of DARE so that this worthwhile project might be extended across the whole of Wales.

**The First Minister:** I agree. Bullying has not gone away because we have appointed a children's commissioner. It is an everyday occurrence in schoolyards and wherever children congregate. We must try to ensure that we inculcate an anti-bullying culture, the first and most important aspect of which is the willingness of the bullied child to report it and not hide it and bottle it up. That is the first and most vital step. One of the purposes of a children's commissioner is that children who are bullied, who might otherwise believe that they must cope with it themselves—and sometimes they cannot—feel that their voice will always be heard with respect by their champion. The commissioner was appointed on their behalf and he can be easily approached. That is the first step towards remedying the bullying problem.

I commend your comments on drug education. The difficulty is that there is a group of schoolchildren for whom the stolen fruit is sweetest. If you simply say 'thou shalt not touch drugs', it is almost certain that they will want to try them, because they must be good if they are banned. It is important to try to educate children to not want to try the stolen fruit, which could lead to addiction or destroy their life chances. We must discover what works best for susceptible children who want to try something even more if adults tell them that it is banned.

sy'n creu amgylchedd ysgol cadarnhaol, gan arwain at barch ar y ddwy ochr. Yn y cyddestun hwnnw, tynnaf eich sylw at yr elusen Addysg Gwrthsefyll Camddefnyddio Cyffuriau (DARE) yn y Rhondda, sydd wedi bod yn llwyddiannus iawn. Nid yw'n canolbwyntio ar gyffuriau a chamddefnyddio cyffuriau yn unig, ond mabwysia ymagwedd gyfannol tuag at addysgu plant i barchu ei gilydd. Ymddangosodd cyfarwyddwr DARE gerbron y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai heddiw i roi cyflwyniad, a gobeithio y byddwch yn rhoi ystyriaeth ofalus i sicrhau bod arian ar gael i werthuso gwaith DARE fel y gellid ymestyn y prosiect gwerthfawr hwn ar draws Cymru gyfan.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cytunaf. Nid yw bwlio wedi diflannu am ein bod wedi penodi comisiynydd plant. Mae'n rhywbeth sy'n digwydd bob dydd ar iardiau ysgolion a lle bynnag y daw plant at ei gilydd. Rhaid inni geisio sicrhau ein bod yn cyflwyno diwylliant gwrth-fwlio, a'r agwedd gyntaf a phwysicaf ar hyn yw parodrwydd y plentyn sy'n cael ei fwlio i ddweud wrth rywun amdano a pheidio â'i guddio a'i gadw yn gyfrinach. Dyna'r cam cyntaf a phwysicaf. Un o ddibenion comisiynydd plant yw bod plant sy'n cael eu bwlio, a allai fel arall gredu bod yn rhaid iddynt ymdopi â hyn ar eu pen eu hunain—ac weithiau ni allant—yn teimlo y caiff eu llais ei glywed bob amser gyda pharch gan eu hamddiffynnydd. Penodwyd y comisiynydd ar eu rhan ac mae'n hawdd mynd ato. Dyma'r cam cyntaf tuag at unioni problem bwlio.

Cymeradwyaf eich sylwadau ar addysg cyffuriau. Yr anhawster yw bod grŵp o blant ysgol sy'n credu mai'r ffrwyth gwaharddedig yw'r un mwyaf melys. Os dywedwch 'ni ddylech ymhél â chyffuriau', mae bron yn sicr y byddant am roi cynnig arnynt, oherwydd rhaid eu bod yn dda os ydynt wedi eu gwahardd. Mae'n bwysig ceisio addysgu plant i beidio ag ysu am roi cynnig ar fwyta'r ffrwyth gwaharddedig, a allai arwain at fod yn gaeth i rywbeth neu ddinistrio eu cyfleoedd mewn bywyd. Rhaid inni ddarganfod yr hyn sy'n gweithio orau i blant sy'n agored i ddylanwadau drwg sydd am roi cynnig ar rywbeth hyd yn oed yn fwy os yw oedolion yn dweud wrthynt ei fod wedi ei

wahardd.

3.20 p.m.

**Rosemary Butler:** I am delighted that Peter Clarke has ruffled feathers since he has been in post, and he has ruffled them in many areas that, perhaps, those of us involved at the beginning did not expect him to, but it has been right and appropriate for him to do so.

I will concentrate on excluded children, and not just those excluded from school but from exclusion units. There is no backstop. I know that we are considering new regulations and guidance on exclusions, but there is currently no funding for these unfortunate children.

**The First Minister:** I was not familiar with children being excluded from exclusion units, but we agree entirely with the priority that the children's commissioner has given to the damaging long-term effects of being excluded on children's life chances. Some children are excluded at an early age and are dismissed contemptuously. The phrase that I have heard used is 'borstal bait', and some so-called experts will tell you that they can 'spot them at four'. It is a disgrace for children to be seen as such a problem. The attitude of getting rid of such children from classrooms or schools before they upset other children is not the right approach to take.

We have made £11 million available for tackling social disadvantage this year through the grants for education support and training programme. That includes action to address school attendance and behaviour, and preventative work to avoid exclusion and to develop curricular flexibility, out-of-school provision and reintegration mechanisms for excluded pupils. However, I will have to write to you, Rosemary, concerning children excluded from exclusion units, after taking specialist advice from Jane Davidson.

**Rosemary Butler:** Yr wyf yn falch bod Peter Clarke wedi codi gwrychyn pobl ers iddo ddechrau yn ei swydd, ac mae wedi gwneud hynny mewn sawl maes nad oedd rhai ohonom a fu'n gysylltiedig ag ef ar y cychwyn yn disgwyl iddo ei wneud, ond bu'n iawn ac yn briodol iddo wneud hynny.

Canolbwyntiaf ar blant a waherddir, ac nid y rheini a waherddir o'r ysgol yn unig ond o unedau gwahardd hefyd. Nid oes unrhyw gefnogaeth. Gwn ein bod yn ystyried rheoliadau a chanllawiau newydd ar waharddiadau, ond ar hyn o bryd nid oes arian ar gael ar gyfer y plant anffodus hyn.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid oeddwn yn gyfarwydd â phlant yn cael eu gwahardd o unedau gwahardd, ond cytunwn yn llwyr â'r flaenoriaeth y mae'r comisiynydd plant wedi ei rhoi i effeithiau hirdymor niweidiol ar gyfleoedd plant mewn bywyd os cânt eu gwahardd. Gwaherddir rhai plant ifanc ac fe'u diystyrir yn ddirmygus. Yr ymadrodd a glywais yn cael ei ddefnyddio yn aml yw '*borstal bait*', a bydd rhai o'r arbenigwyr, fel y'u gelwir, yn dweud wrthyh y gallant eu henwi yn bedair oed. Mae'n warthus bod plant yn cael eu hystyried yn broblem o'r fath. Nid cael gwared ar blant o'r fath o ystafelloedd dosbarth neu ysgolion cyn iddynt amharu ar blant eraill yw'r ymagwedd gywir i'w mabwysiadu.

Yr ydym wedi sicrhau bod £11 miliwn ar gael i fynd i'r afael ag anfantais gymdeithasol eleni drwy'r rhaglen grantiau cynnal addysg a hyfforddiant. Mae hynny'n cynnwys cymryd camau i fynd i'r afael â phresenoldeb plant mewn ysgolion a'u hymddygiad, a gwneud gwaith ataliol i osgoi gwaharddiadau a datblygu hyblygrwydd cwricwlaidd, darpariaeth y tu allan i'r ysgol a dulliau o ail-integreiddio disgyblion a waharddwyd. Fodd bynnag, bydd yn rhaid imi ysgrifennu atoch, Rosemary, ynghylch y plant a waherddir o unedau gwahardd, ar ôl gofyn i Jane Davidson am gyngor arbenigol.

**Datganiad ar Ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i Adroddiad y Pwyllgor  
Datblygu Economaidd ar Ynni Adnewyddadwy  
Statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's Response to the Economic  
Development Committee's Report on Renewable Energy**

**The Minister for Economic Development (Andrew Davies):** I welcome the opportunity to respond to the Economic Development Committee's review of energy policy in Wales. I want to record my thanks to the Committee, its Chair, members and the special adviser, Professor Jake Chapman, and congratulate them on the depth of their inquiry and their valuable contribution to the development of Welsh energy policy. The Committee made six primary recommendations, which are embodied in the vision that I set out in my statement on energy policy last week.

On carbon reduction, the Committee favours a zero carbon electricity system in the next 20 to 50 years. Last week, I gave a clear lead on this, and set an ambition to achieve a 20 per cent reduction in carbon by 2020. The development of renewable energy resources is integral to this. However, there needs to be a mixture of measures embracing energy generation, conservation, and efficiency. This is the way forward that supports our industrial base and complements our sustainable development duties.

The Committee recommends a benchmark for renewable energy production of 4 terawatt hours per year, by 2010. This is a realistic target, but we want to move on by endorsing that and building it into a 2020 benchmark, through the carbon reduction ambition that I set out last week. That would broadly equate to a renewable energy benchmark of about 7 TWh for electricity production for 2020. The use of wind power replacing electricity generation from older, unmodernised coal fuel stations will take us a considerable way towards meeting our carbon dioxide reduction targets.

Renewable energy offers economic development opportunities in urban and rural areas. I am confident that this can be done in

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd (Andrew Davies):** Croesawaf y cyfle i ymateb i adolygiad y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd o bolisi ynni yng Nghymru. Hoffwn gofnodi fy niolch i'r Pwyllgor, ei Gadeirydd, ei aelodau a'r ymgynghorydd arbennig, yr Athro Jake Chapman, a'u llongyfarch ar fanylder eu hymchwiliad a'u cyfraniad gwerthfawr i'r broses o ddatblygu polisi ynni yng Nghymru. Gwnaeth y Pwyllgor chwe argymhelliad sylfaenol, sydd wedi'u cynnwys yn y weledigaeth a nodais yn fy natganiad ar bolisi ynni yr wythnos diwethaf.

O ran lleihau carbon, mae'r Pwyllgor o blaid system trydan sero carbon yn ystod yr 20 i 50 mlynedd nesaf. Yr wythnos diwethaf, rhoddais arweiniad clir ar hyn, a phennais uchelgais i gyflawni gostyngiad o 20 y cant mewn carbon erbyn 2020. Mae datblygu adnoddau ynni adnewyddadwy yn hanfodol yn hyn o beth. Fodd bynnag, mae angen cymysgedd o fesurau sy'n ymgorffori cynhyrchu ynni, arbed ynni, ac effeithlonrwydd. Dyma'r ffordd ymlaen sy'n cefnogi ein sail ddiwydiannol ac yn ategu ein dyletswyddau o ran datblygu cynaliadwy.

Mae'r Pwyllgor yn argymhell meincnod o 4 awr terawat y flwyddyn erbyn 2010 ar gyfer cynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy. Mae'r targed hwn yn realistig, ond yr ydym am symud ymlaen drwy gymeradwyo hynny a'i gynnwys o fewn meincnod 2020, drwy'r uchelgais i leihau carbon a nodwyd gennyf yr wythnos diwethaf. Byddai hynny yn fras yn gyfwerth â meincnod ynni adnewyddadwy o tua 7 TWh ar gyfer cynhyrchu trydan ar gyfer 2020. Bydd defnyddio ynni gwynt i ddisodli'r broses o gynhyrchu trydan o orsafoedd tanwydd glo hŷn, nas moderneiddiwyd, o gymorth sylweddol i gyflawni ein targedau lleihau carbon deuocsid.

Mae ynni adnewyddadwy yn cynnig cyfleoedd datblygu economaidd mewn ardaloedd trefol a gwledig. Yr wyf yn

a way that protects environmentally sensitive areas and important tourist destinations. I have asked the Wales Tourist Board to consider how it could assist in assessing the effects of renewable energy and, particularly, windfarms on tourism. I want as many projects as possible to proceed, with the full involvement of the local community.

Working with our partners will be an essential component in the progress of renewable energy policy in Wales. This partnership approach is exemplified through the workings of the technical advice note 8 group. That group is facilitating work to consider the spatial implications of renewable energy technologies and providing planning advice on various technologies requiring different approaches. We will set high standards and encourage best practice and exemplar projects.

In the short term, onshore and offshore wind power are the technologies most likely to contribute. We are exploring options for repowering existing windfarms, and will hold a seminar later this month to consider this in greater depth. The two offshore windfarms off north Wales have received approval. At North Hoyle, 80 per cent of the onshore works have been completed. It is in line to be completed on schedule and begin operating from October 2003. The Rhyl Flats site is likely to proceed with a slightly longer timescale, although it has received consent, and the Scarweather Sands project, in the Bristol channel, will be determined by the Assembly.

Future offshore generation is an exciting new area of development. We are working with the UK Government and hope that further strategic areas off the Welsh coast can be considered. Between 2010 and 2020, tidal stream, photovoltaic, biomass and, perhaps, wave, are expected to begin to make significant contributions. Biomass has the potential to be of interest to Wales, but is currently an area of market uncertainty. We are investigating prospects and already some biomass projects are being progressed with Objective 1 support. The Forestry Commission's biomass capital grant scheme, partly funded by Objective 1, will, I hope, be

hyderus y gellir gwneud hyn mewn ffordd sy'n diogelu ardaloedd amgylcheddol sensitif a chyrchfannau pwysig i dwristiaid. Yr wyf wedi gofyn i Fwrdd Croeso Cymru ystyried sut y gallai helpu wrth asesu effeithiau ynni adnewyddadwy, a ffermydd gwynt yn arbennig, ar dwristiaeth. Yr wyf am i gymaint o brosiectau â phosibl fynd rhagddynt, gan gynnwys y gymuned leol yn llawn.

Bydd gweithio gyda'n partneriaid yn elfen hanfodol wrth ddatblygu polisi ynni adnewyddadwy yng Nghymru. Ceir enghraifft o'r ymagwedd bartneriaeth hon yng ngwaith grŵp nodyn cyngor technegol 8. Mae'r grŵp hwnnw yn hwyluso gwaith i ystyried goblygiadau gofodol technolegau ynni adnewyddadwy ac yn darparu cyngor cynllunio ar amrywiol dechnolegau lle y mae angen ymagweddau gwahanol. Byddwn yn gosod safonau uchel ac yn annog arfer gorau a phrosiectau enghreifftiol.

Yn y tymor byr, pŵer y gwynt ar y tir ac o'r lan sy'n fwyaf tebygol o gyfrannu. Yr ydym yn archwilio opsiynau ar gyfer ailweithredu ffermydd gwynt sy'n bodoli eisoes, a byddwn yn cynnal seminar yn ddiweddarach yn y mis i ystyried hyn yn fanylach. Mae'r ddwy fferm wynt alltraeth oddi ar arfordir y Gogledd wedi'u cymeradwyo. Yn North Hoyle, cwblhawyd 80 y cant o'r gwaith ar y tir. Disgwylir i'r gwaith gael ei gwblhau yn unol â'r amserlen ac y bydd yn dechrau gweithredu o fis Hydref 2003. Mae safle Fflatiau y Rhyl yn debygol o gymryd yn hirach, er iddo dderbyn caniatâd, a'r Cynulliad fydd yn penderfynu ar brosiect Scarweather Sands, yn môr Hafren.

Mae cynhyrchu ynni alltraeth yn y dyfodol yn faes newydd a chyffrous i'w ddatblygu. Yr ydym yn gweithio gyda Llywodraeth y DU a'r gobaiith yw y gellir ystyried ardaloedd strategol pellach oddi ar arfordir Cymru. Rhwng 2010 a 2020, disgwylir i dechnolegau ffrwd llanw, ffotofoltaidd, bio-màs ac, efallai, tonnau, ddechrau cyfrannu'n sylweddol. Gallai bio-màs fod o ddiddordeb i Gymru, ond ar hyn o bryd mae'n faes o ansicrwydd yn y farchnad. Yr ydym yn ymchwilio i gyfleoedd ac mae rhai prosiectau bio-màs eisoes ar waith gyda chymorth Amcan 1. Gobeithiaf y bydd cynllun grant cyfalaf y Comisiwn Coedwigaeth, a ariennir yn

a catalyst in this process. I am hopeful that structural funds will be used effectively to stimulate a wide range of renewable developments. Tidal stream, tidal barrage and wave power have considerable potential for Wales. A number of technologies are being supported, including the Pembrokeshire project by Tidal Hydraulic Generators Ltd. There is a real potential to attract this formative range of tidal technologies to Wales. A number of developers are showing interest and the implementation of the Assembly Government's innovation action plan 'Wales for Innovation', which I launched yesterday, will also help to support new technologies in the energy sector. We are working with the WDA to bring together the best ideas from the private and academic sectors.

In the longer term, special projects such as the Severn barrage may have tremendous potential. Barrages have environmental and economic implications and we see value in further studies. I will continue to press the importance of this on the Minister of State for Energy and Construction. Also in the longer term, energy systems based on fuel cells powered by hydrogen look attractive. Research and development opportunities are already becoming evident in Wales, and we will continue to consider carefully every opportunity to put Wales in the forefront of hydrogen energy developments. The Committee has recommended developing the use of green energy in the Assembly estate and by other agencies and public bodies. The latest figures indicate that a 100 per cent green supply at Cathays park and Cardiff bay represents over 75 per cent of the National Assembly for Wales's total electricity consumption. We will assess the feasibility of procuring clean electricity supply throughout the rest of the estate. The National Assembly for Wales has also developed a greening operations policy and action plan, which incorporates targets for reducing energy consumption. This will form the basis of an environmental management system, which will be accredited to a recognised standard. Although initially targeting the main buildings in Cardiff, we aim to roll out the EMS to other buildings in the estate where appropriate.

rhannol gan Amcan 1, yn gatalydd yn y broses hon. Yr wyf yn obeithiol y caiff cronfeydd strwythurol eu defnyddio'n effeithiol i ysgogi amrywiaeth eang o ddatblygiadau adnewyddadwy. Mae gan bŵer ffrwd llanw, morgloddiau llanw a phŵer y tonnau gryn botensial i Gymru. Cefnogir nifer o dechnolegau, gan gynnwys prosiect Sir Benfro gan Tidal Hydraulic Generators Ltd. Mae potensial gwirioneddol i ddenu'r amrywiaeth ffurfiannol o dechnolegau llanw hyn i Gymru. Mae nifer o ddatblygwyr yn dangos diddordeb a bydd gweithredu cynllun gweithredu arloesedd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad 'Cymru o Blaid Arloesi', a lansiwyd gennyf ddoe, hefyd yn helpu i gefnogi technolegau newydd yn y sector ynni. Yr ydym yn gweithio gyda'r WDA i ddod â'r syniadau gorau o'r sector preifat a'r sector academaidd ynghyd.

Yn y tymor hwy, gallai fod i brosiectau arbennig fel morglawdd Hafren botensial enfawr. Mae gan forgloddiau oblygiadau amgylcheddol ac economaidd a gwelwn werth astudiaethau pellach. Parhaf i bwysleisio pwysigrwydd hyn i'r Gweinidog Gwladol dros Ynni ac Adeiladu. Hefyd yn y tymor hwy, mae systemau ynni yn seiliedig ar gellau tanwydd a yrrir gan hydrogen yn opsiwn deniadol. Mae cyfleoedd ymchwil a datblygu eisoes yn dod i'r amlwg yng Nghymru, a byddwn yn parhau i ystyried pob cyfle yn ofalus i sicrhau bod Cymru ar flaen y gad o ran datblygiadau ynni hydrogen. Mae'r Pwyllgor wedi argymhell y dylid datblygu'r defnydd o ynni gwyrdd yn ystad y Cynulliad a chan asiantaethau a chyrrff cyhoeddus eraill. Noda'r ffigurau diweddaraf fod cyflenwad sy'n wyrdd 100 y cant ym Mharc Cathays a bae Caerdydd yn cynrychioli dros 75 y cant o gyfanswm defnydd trydan Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Byddwn yn asesu dichonoldeb caffael cyflenwad trydan glân drwy weddill yr ystad. Mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru hefyd wedi datblygu polisi a chynllun gweithredu gwyrddhau, sy'n cynnwys targedau ar gyfer lleihau'r defnydd o ynni. Bydd hyn yn sail i system rheoli amgylcheddol, a achredir i safon gydnabyddedig. Er mai targedu'r prif adeiladau yng Nghaerdydd a wnawn i ddechrau, ein nod yw cyflwyno'r system rheoli amgylcheddol i adeiladau eraill yn yr

ystad lle y bo'n briodol.

The Committee has recognised the association between renewable energy development and infrastructure strengthening. This is a key issue for the future development of distributed generation through renewable sources. It is one of a range of issues that has been conveyed to me in the many meetings that the First Minister and I have held with senior industry representatives. It is also an issue that I have raised with the UK energy Minister, and I will continue to do so. The energy White Paper sets out a number of actions being taken by OFGEM to help distributed generation, and we will of course be involved in these. We are talking with infrastructure providers and with the distribution network companies in Wales and OFGEM to establish a way forward. As part of this work, we are making a baseline assessment of the electricity infrastructures in Wales and their ability to accommodate increased levels of distributed generation. The Assembly Government shares the Committee's views on the importance of planning, and sees advantages in holding the powers within electricity legislation to determine large-scale energy generation projects. You will know it is also an issue on which I have given evidence to the Richard commission. We shall continue to press that it is anomalous that such powers are not within the Assembly, and we hope that the UK Government will share this view.

Looking forward, we are arranging a second Wales energy summit to discuss strategic energy policy issues with the industry. Using the outcome from this, the Economic Development Committee's excellent work, and our continuing dialogue with our partners, we are drawing up an action plan to implement our new energy policies. I assure the Assembly that our objective is to keep Wales at the forefront of renewable developments in energy production and in creating a new mainstream industrial sector.

3.30 p.m.

**Phil Williams:** Your statement has made me a happy person. It was this issue, more than

Mae'r Pwyllgor wedi cydnabod y cysylltiad rhwng datblygu ynni adnewyddadwy ac atgyfnerthu seilwaith. Mae hwn yn fater allweddol ar gyfer datblygu cynhyrchu a ddsbarthwyd drwy ffynonellau adnewyddadwy yn y dyfodol. Mae'n un o blith amrywiaeth o faterion a gyflewyr imi yn y cyfarfodydd niferus a gynhaliwyd rhyngof fi a'r Prif Weinidog ac uwch gynrychiolwyr y diwydiant. Mae hefyd yn fater a godais gyda Gweinidog ynni'r DU, ac fe barhaf i wneud hynny. Noda'r Papur Gwyn ar ynni nifer o gamau gweithredu a gymerir gan OFGEM i hwyluso cynhyrchu a ddsbarthwyd, a byddwn wrth gwrs yn gysylltiedig â'r rhain. Yr ydym yn trafod gyda darparwyr seilwaith a chyda chwmnïau'r rhwydwaith dosbarthu yng Nghymru ac OFGEM i bennu'r ffordd ymlaen. Fel rhan o'r gwaith hwn, yr ydym yn cynnal asesiad gwaelodlin o'r seilweithiau trydan yng Nghymru a'u gallu i ymdopi â lefelau cynyddol o gynhyrchu a ddsbarthwyd. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cytuno â barn y Pwyllgor ar bwysigrwydd cynllunio, ac yn gweld manteision cadw'r pwerau o fewn deddfwriaeth trydan i wneud penderfyniadau ar brosiectau cynhyrchu ynni mawr. Byddwch hefyd yn ymwybodol imi roi tystiolaeth i gomisiwn Richard ar y mater hwn. Byddwn yn parhau i bwysleisio ei bod yn anghyson nad oes gan y Cynulliad bwerau o'r fath, a gobeithiwn y bydd Llywodraeth y DU o'r un farn.

Gan edrych ymlaen, yr ydym yn trefnu ail uwch-gynhadledd ynni yng Nghymru i drafod materion polisi ynni strategol gyda'r diwydiant. Gan ddefnyddio'r canlyniad a ddaw o hyn, gwaith ardderchog y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, a'n trafodaethau parhaus gyda'n partneriaid, yr ydym yn llunio cynllun gweithredu i roi ein polisiau ynni newydd ar waith. Gallaf sicrhau'r Cynulliad mai cadw Cymru ar flaen y gad o ran datblygiadau adnewyddadwy ym maes cynhyrchu ynni a chreu sector diwydiannol prif ffrwd newydd yw ein nod.

**Phil Williams:** Mae eich datganiad wedi fy mhlesio'n fawr. Y mater hwn, yn fwy nag

any other, that brought me back into active politics. Your statement clears any problems that I may have with my conscience when I return to my scientific career in May. I enthusiastically welcome the fact that you have not only endorsed the Committee's benchmark of 4 TWh, but have also set a benchmark of 7 TWh by 2020. I cannot resist adding that Plaid Cymru set the target of 4 TWh in 1992 for this decade. However, this is a genuine all-party policy development that shows inclusivity at its best.

I will not list all the sentences with which I agree; I will merely ask a few brief questions. You mentioned Objective 1 in connection with biomass. There is over £80 million of grant available for clean energy and energy infrastructure and, so far, these funds are under-committed. What plans are in the pipeline to ensure that we use these funds efficiently to implement the policy? I welcome your commitment to a range of renewable technologies. In planning renewable energy with public support, it is essential that we deploy the full range in the most appropriate locations. We expect technical advice note 8 in the near future, which will largely deal with wind energy. Will you press the Minister for Environment to start the planning work on the new technologies that will be implemented after 2010?

I welcome your reference to fuel cells powered by hydrogen. As fuel cells were invented in Swansea, and as Ford is at the forefront of introducing fuel cell engines, have you held discussions with Ford management in the Welsh automotive forum, in the hope that Wales can have a just and large share of this new technology? I have two other brief questions. We have always stressed that conservation of energy is as important as renewable generation. You mentioned the roll-out of the environmental management system to public sector buildings. Have you held discussions with the Minister for Environment and the Minister responsible for housing to see how soon it will be practical to apply the Building Research Establishment environmental assessment method excellence standards to

unrhyw fater arall, a'm denodd yn ôl i wleidyddiaeth. Mae eich datganiad yn ateb unrhyw broblemau a allai fod gennyf o ran fy nghydwybod pan ddychwelaf i'm gyrfa wyddonol ym mis Mai. Croesawaf yn frwd y ffaith ichi nid yn unig gymeradwyo meincnod 4 TWh y Pwyllgor, ond ichi hefyd bennu meincnod o 7 TWh erbyn 2020. Ni allaf beidio ag ychwanegu bod Plaid Cymru wedi pennu'r targed o 4 TWh yn 1992 ar gyfer y degawd hwn. Fodd bynnag, dyma enghraifft wirioneddol o ddatblygu polisi yn drawsbleidiol sy'n dangos cynwysoldeb ar ei orau.

Ni restraf yr holl frawddegau y cytunaf â hwy; yn hytrach gofynnaf rai cwestiynau byr. Bu ichi grybwyll Amcan 1 mewn perthynas â bio-màs. Mae grant gwerth dros £80 miliwn ar gael ar gyfer ynni glân a seilwaith ynni ac, hyd yma, nid yw'r holl arian hwn wedi'i ymrwymo. Pa gynlluniau sydd ar y gweill i sicrhau y defnyddiwn yr arian hwn yn effeithlon i weithredu'r polisi? Croesawaf eich ymrwymiad i amrywiaeth o dechnolegau adnewyddadwy. Wrth gynllunio ynni adnewyddadwy gyda chefnogaeth y cyhoedd, mae'n hanfodol inni ddefnyddio'r amrywiaeth llawn yn y lleoliadau mwyaf priodol. Disgwyliwn nodyn cyngor technegol 8 yn y dyfodol agos, a fydd yn ymdrin yn bennaf ag ynni'r gwynt. A roddwch bwysau ar y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd i ddechrau ar y gwaith cynllunio ar y technolegau newydd a weithredir ar ôl 2010?

Croesawaf eich cyfeiriad at gellau tanwydd a yrrir gan hydrogen. Gan mai yn Abertawe y dyfeisiwyd celloedd tanwydd, a chan fod Ford ar flaen y gad o ran cyflwyno injans celloedd tanwydd, a gynaliasoch drafodaethau gyda rheolwyr Ford yn fforwm moduron Cymru, yn y gobaith y gall Cymru sicrhau cyfran deg a mawr o'r dechnoleg newydd hon? Mae gennyf ddau gwestiwn byr arall. Yr ydym bob amser wedi pwysleisio bod arbed ynni yr un mor bwysig â chynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy. Soniasoch am gyflwyno'r system rheoli amgylcheddol i adeiladau yn y sector cyhoeddus. A gynaliasoch drafodaethau gyda'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd a'r Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am dai i weld pa mor gyflym y bydd yn ymarferol cymhwysu safonau rhagoriaeth dull asesu amgylcheddol y Sefydliad



all new public sector buildings? Finally, I welcome the commitment to conducting research into new technologies, such as those included in the innovation action plan. The basic economic importance of energy in itself and as a contributor to regional economic development is great, so will you press for an appropriate earmarked budget to support co-ordinated research in the new technologies, which could be so important to the economic regeneration of Wales?

**Andrew Davies:** I never thought that I would stand at the rostrum and hear you say that I have helped clear your conscience. As I said when you first announced that you would not stand for re-election, you will be a great loss to the Assembly. You have made an immense contribution to the Committee's policy development on this. Your grasp of the technicalities of the field and your commitment shine through in the Committee's report.

On Objective 1, it is no secret that there has been a lack of response to the priority and measure to which you referred. However, some projects are underway. A large regional bid has received a formal grant offer of just under £3.6 million, in support of a low carbon partnership proposal. I have asked officials and the Welsh European Funding Office to consider potential projects that may benefit from Objective 1 funding. There is evidence that that is beginning to bear fruit, and that projects will be coming forward.

On TAN 8, I am discussing with Sue Essex the implications for other energy-production technologies. I will double-check with Sue where we are with TAN 8 in terms of planning other than windfarm developments. On fuel cells, you are right that the automotive sector in particular sees a huge opportunity here. I have discussed this with the Welsh Development Agency, and particularly with the Welsh automotive forum. This was also raised at an Accelerate Wales dinner at which I spoke a few months ago. A huge amount of work is being done in this area, both within the WDA, in academia and in the automotive industry.

Ymchwil Adeiladu i bob adeilad newydd yn y sector cyhoeddus? I gloi, croesawaf yr ymrwymiad i gynnal ymchwil i dechnolegau newydd, megis y rheini a gynhwyswyd yn y cynllun gweithredu arloesedd. Mae pwysigrwydd economaidd sylfaenol ynni ynddo'i hun ac fel elfen sy'n cyfrannu at ddatblygu economaidd rhanbarthol yn sylweddol, felly a bwyswch am gyllideb briodol wedi'i chlustnodi i gefnogi ymchwil wedi'i chydlynu i'r technolegau newydd, a allai fod mor bwysig i adfywiad economaidd Cymru?

**Andrew Davies:** Ni feddyliais erioed y byddwn yma o flaen y darllenfwrdd ac yn eich clywed yn dweud fy mod wedi helpu i glirio eich cydwybod. Fel y dywedais pan gyhoeddasoch gyntaf na fyddech yn sefyll i gael eich ailethol, byddwch yn golled fawr i'r Cynulliad. Gwnaethoch gyfraniad aruthrol i waith y Pwyllgor wrth ddatblygu polisi ar hyn. Mae eich meistrolaeth ar elfennau technegol y maes a'ch ymrwymiad yn amlwg yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor.

O ran Amcan 1, nid yw'n gyfrinach y bu diffyg ymateb i'r flaenoriaeth a'r mesur y cyfeiriasoch atynt. Fodd bynnag, mae rhai prosiectau yn mynd rhagddynt. Derbyniodd cais rhanbarthol mawr gynnig grant ffurfiol o ychydig o dan £3.6 miliwn, i gefnogi cynnig partneriaeth carbon isel. Yr wyf wedi gofyn i swyddogion a Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru ystyried prosiectau posibl a allai elwa ar arian Amcan 1. Ceir tystiolaeth bod hynny yn dechrau dwyn ffrwyth, ac y caiff prosiectau eu cyflwyno.

O ran TAN 8, yr wyf yn trafod y goblygiadau ar gyfer technolegau cynhyrchu ynni eraill gyda Sue Essex. Gofynnaf i Sue gadarnhau'r sefyllfa sydd ohoni gyda TAN 8 o ran cynllunio ac eithrio datblygiadau ffermydd gwynt. O ran celloedd tanwydd, yr ydych yn llygad eich lle i nodi bod cyfle enfawr i'r sector moduron yn arbennig. Yr wyf wedi trafod hyn gydag Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, ac yn arbennig gyda fforwm moduron Cymru. Codwyd hyn hefyd mewn cinio Sbardun Cymru y bûm yn ei annerch ychydig fisoedd yn ôl. Mae swm enfawr o waith yn mynd rhagddo yn y maes hwn, o fewn y WDA, y byd academiaidd a'r diwydiant moduron.

Conservation and the rolling out of EMS has been discussed at official level, but I will need to get back to you on the points about housing standards and apply them to other public buildings. Your suggestion of an earmarked budget for research and development is interesting. I will consider the possibilities of that in the context of the Wales for Innovation action plan. We will consider whether there would be any advantages in pursuing that.

**Brian Gibbons:** This international view of Wales is linked to its old historical, industrial past in terms of slag heap, smoke stack industries and so on. Your statement gives us the opportunity to project Wales as being at the cutting edge of environmentally friendly energy creation. It presents an opportunity to project a new image of Wales. Even in my constituency, which is in the heartland of industrial south Wales, projects such as wind farms, biomass, energy from waste and so on, are being implemented. That epitomises what you said.

On the role of the Welsh Assembly Government as an exemplar of good practice in this area, you mentioned buildings and so forth, but you did not mention the role of the public sector and its transport fleet. Will you give that some thought? The road vehicle is one of the main sources of pollution and of energy production inefficiencies. What role could the Welsh Assembly Government have in terms of moving forwards on the public sector vehicle fleet and on issues such as conversion to liquified petroleum gas, fuel cell technology and so on? If the public sector led on these issues, it would create the critical mass in the market to be able to move this type of environmentally friendly technology further forward, much faster.

**Andrew Davies:** I agree with your point that the old, stereotypical images of Wales are out of date. Following our commitment and policies on renewable energy, we are rapidly becoming a global showcase for sustainable energy production and production technologies.

Trafodwyd arbed ynni a chyflwyno systemau rheoli amgylcheddol ar lefel swyddogol, ond bydd angen imi ddod yn ôl atoch ar y pwyntiau am safonau tai a'u cymhwyso i adeiladau cyhoeddus eraill. Mae eich awgrym o gyllideb wedi'i chlustnodi ar gyfer ymchwil a datblygu yn ddiddorol. Ystyriaf y posibilïadau yng nghyd-destun y cynllun gweithredu Cymru o Blaid Arloesi. Ystyriwn pa un a fyddai unrhyw fanteision yn deillio o ddilyn y trywydd hwnnw.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae'r farn ryngwladol hon o Gymru wedi'i chysylltu â'i hen orffennol hanesyddol, diwydiannol yn nhermau diwydiannau tomenni sorod, cyrn mwg ac yn y blaen. Rhydd eich datganiad y cyfle inni hyrwyddo Cymru fel lleoliad sy'n arloesi o ran dulliau cynhyrchu ynni sy'n gyfeillgar i'r amgylchedd. Rhydd gyfle i gyflwyno delwedd newydd o Gymru. Hyd yn oed yn fy etholaeth i, sydd yng nghanol y De diwydiannol, mae prosiectau megis ffermydd gwynt, bio-màs, ynni o wastraff ac yn y blaen, yn cael eu gweithredu. Mae hynny'n arwydd amlwg o'r hyn a ddywedaso.

O ran rôl Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru fel enghraifft o arfer da yn y maes hwn, crybwyllaso adeiladau ac yn y blaen, ond ni soniasoch am rôl y sector cyhoeddus a'i gerbydau. A roddwch ystyriaeth i hynny? Cerbydau ar y ffordd yw un o'r prif ffynonellau o lygredd ac aneffeithlonrwyddau o ran cynhyrchu ynni. Pa rôl y gallai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ei chwarae o ran symud ymlaen mewn perthynas â cherbydau'r sector cyhoeddus ac ar faterion megis addasu i nwy petrolewm hylifedig, technoleg celloedd tanwydd ac yn y blaen? Ped arweiniai'r sector cyhoeddus ar y materion hyn, byddai'n creu'r màs critigol yn y farchnad i allu datblygu'r math hwn o dechnoleg sy'n gyfeillgar i'r amgylchedd ymhellach, yn llawer cyflymach.

**Andrew Davies:** Cytunaf â'ch pwynt nad yw'r hen ddelweddau ystrydebol o Gymru yn ddilys erbyn hyn. Yn dilyn ein hymrwymiad a'n polisiâu ar ynni adnewyddadwy, yr ydym yn prysur ddatblygu fel enghraifft fyd-eang ar gyfer cynhyrchu ynni a thechnolegau cynhyrchu cynaliadwy.

I will have to discuss the role of the public sector and the transport fleet with Sue Essex as it is within her portfolio. I will let you know of any work being undertaken on that.

**Alun Cairns:** I thank the Minister for his statement and echo his comments on the Committee's Chair and the special adviser to the Committee, Jake Chapman. I add my recognition of the Clerk and Deputy Clerk, John Grimes and Siân Wilkins for their efforts in drafting the papers. I could not offer my gratitude to them until now.

I cannot be as enthusiastic about this as Phil Williams. He said that it was an all-party paper. However, he also recalled that my representations could not be accepted given the Committee's majority view. Therefore, rather than offer its whole-hearted endorsement, the Conservative group abstained from voting for or against the report in Plenary.

I detect conflicts in Assembly Government policy, of which I have two examples. A week ago, an Assembly Minister and a Deputy Minister said that an offshore windfarm—the Scarweather Sands proposal—mentioned in this report, was a bad idea and that it would have a negative impact on tourism. However, the Minister for Economic Development is displaying a particular enthusiasm for offshore wind energy today, stating that it is the only viable means of renewable energy available in the short and medium term. There is a conflict between the Minister responsible for energy and the two Labour Assembly Members representing the constituency for which the windfarm is proposed. In response to Phil Williams, at least Plaid Cymru Assembly Members did not attend an anti-Scarweather Sands windfarm meeting and I respect their position on that—

3.40 p.m.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This is not a debate. There should be a preamble and a series of sharp questions to the Minister on the statement. I hope, Alun, that you are about to conclude your series of questions.

Bydd yn rhaid imi drafod rôl y sector cyhoeddus a'i gerbydau gyda Sue Essex gan ei fod yn rhan o'i phortffolio. Fe'ch hysbysaf am unrhyw waith sy'n mynd rhagddo yn hynny o beth.

**Alun Cairns:** Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei ddatganiad ac adleisiaf ei sylwadau ar Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor ac ymgynghorydd arbennig y Pwyllgor, Jake Chapman. Hoffwn gydnabod hefyd y Clerc a'r Dirprwy Clerc, John Grimes a Siân Wilkins am eu hymdrechion wrth ddrafftio'r papurau. Ni allwn ddiolch iddynt tan yn awr.

Ni allaf fod mor frwdfrydig â Phil Williams am hyn. Dywedodd mai papur trawsbleidiol ydoedd. Fodd bynnag, cofiai hefyd na ellid derbyn fy sylwadau o gofio barn fwyafrifol y Pwyllgor. Felly, yn hytrach na chynnig ei gymeradwyaeth lwyr, ymatalodd grŵp y Ceidwadwyr rhag pleidleisio o blaid nac yn erbyn yr adroddiad yn y Cyfarfod Llawn.

Synhwyraf wrthdaro ym mholisi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, a nodaf ddwy enghraifft. Wythnos yn ôl, dywedodd Gweinidog a Dirprwy Weinidog o'r Cynulliad fod fferm wynt ar y môr—cynnig Scarweather Sands—a grybwyllir yn yr adroddiad hwn, yn syniad gwael ac y byddai'n effeithio'n andwyol ar dwristiaeth. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd yn frwdfrydig iawn o blaid ynni gwynt ar y môr heddiw, gan nodi mai dyma'r unig gyfrwng ynni adnewyddadwy ymarferol sydd ar gael yn y byr dymor a'r tymor canolig. Ceir gwrthdaro rhwng y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am ynni a'r ddau Aelod Llafur o'r Cynulliad sy'n cynrychioli'r etholaeth lle y cynigir lleoli'r fferm wynt. Mewn ymateb i Phil Williams, o leiaf ni aeth Aelodau Plaid Cymru y Cynulliad i gyfarfod yn erbyn fferm wynt Scarweather Sands ac mae gennyf barch tuag at eu safbwynt yn hynny o beth—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid dadl yw hon. Dylid cael rhagymadrodd a chyfres o gwestiynau cyflym i'r Gweinidog ar y datganiad. Gobeithiaf, Alun, eich bod ar fin dod â'ch cyfres o gwestiynau i ben.

**Alun Cairns:** Will the Minister confirm that the Assembly Cabinet has conflicting views on this issue? Will he also give more details about the sensitivities with regard to windfarms, and will he ask the Wales Tourist Board to consider how to assess those sensitivities? Considering and accepting applications for windfarms before any report is complete pre-empts any independent investigation. We need to recognise that some of—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I would love to hear some questions.

**Alun Cairns:** At a time when there is so much excitement about new technology, is it not a major strategic error of judgment to place all emphasis on wind, when—  
[*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Alun Cairns is about to conclude his question.

**Alun Cairns:** As we have heard, photovoltaic cells, hydrogen technology and other means of energy production are now possible. Why is the Minister putting all of his eggs into one basket?

**Andrew Davies:** It was too much to expect a consensus on this—certainly when Alun is around. Why change a habit of a lifetime? Alun sees conspiracies and conflicts where they do not exist. It is appropriate for Members, as constituency Members, to attend meetings and pass comment on matters that affect them and their constituents. However, I am speaking as the Minister responsible for energy policy in the Assembly Government. I will repeat what I said in my statement. We support, in principle, the development of wind energy. I also said that I want as many projects as possible to proceed—and I do not think that Alun heard this part—with the full involvement of the local community. It is for the Assembly to decide on the Scarweather Sands development. It would be inappropriate for me to comment on that, as the Assembly's application will be determined under the Transport and Works Act 1992.

**Alun Cairns:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog gadarnhau bod gan Cabinet y Cynulliad safbwyntiau sy'n gwrthdaro ar y mater hwn? A wnaiff hefyd roi mwy o fanylion am yr elfennau sensitif sydd ynghlwm wrth ffermydd gwynt, ac a wnaiff ofyn i Fwrdd Croeso Cymru ystyried sut y dylid asesu'r elfennau hynny? Mae ystyried a derbyn ceisiadau ar gyfer ffermydd gwynt cyn cwblhau unrhyw adroddiad yn achub y blaen ar unrhyw ymchwiliad annibynnol. Mae angen inni gydnabod bod rhai—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Byddai'n dda gennyf glywed rhywfaint o gwestiynau.

**Alun Cairns:** Ar adeg lle y ceir cymaint o gyffro am dechnoleg newydd, nid yw rhoi'r pwyslais cyfan ar wynt yn gamfarn strategol sylweddol, pan—  
[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae Alun Cairns ar fin dod â'i gwestiwn i ben.

**Alun Cairns:** Fel y clywsom, mae celloedd ffotofoltaidd, technoleg hydrogen a dulliau eraill o gynhyrchu ynni bellach yn bosibl. Pam mae'r Gweinidog yn rhoi ei wyau i gyd mewn un fasedd?

**Andrew Davies:** Yr oedd yn ormod i ddisgwyl cytundeb barn ar hyn—yn sicr gydag Alun yn bresennol. Pam newid arferion oes? Gwêl Alun gynllwynio a gwrthdaro lle na fodolant. Mae'n briodol i Aelodau, fel Aelodau etholaethau, fynychu cyfarfodydd a chyflwyno sylwadau ar faterion sy'n effeithio arnynt hwy a'u hetholwyr. Fodd bynnag, siaradaf fel y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am bolisi ynni yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Ailadroddaf yr hyn a ddywedais yn fy natganiad. Mewn egwyddor, yr ydym o blaid datblygu ynni'r gwynt. Dywedais hefyd fy mod am i gymaint o brosiectau â phosibl fynd rhagddynt—ac ni chredaf i Alun glywed y rhan hon—gan gynnwys y gymuned leol yn llawn. Y Cynulliad fydd yn penderfynu ar ddatblygiad Scarweather Sands. Ni fyddai'n briodol imi wneud sylwadau ar hynny, gan y gwneir penderfyniad ar gais y Cynulliad o dan Ddeddf Trafnidiaeth a Gwaith 1992.

At least three parties in the Assembly have welcomed this report and see that, if we are to reduce global warming and to contribute towards that, there is an imperative to move away from carbon-based energy production and towards renewables.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I will be brief and to the point. I am speaking on behalf of Mick Bates—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I have no problem with you speaking on behalf of yourself and the Liberal Democrats but—

**Eleanor Burnham:** I am not a member of the Economic Development Committee. I commend this interesting and informative report and thank everyone who has contributed towards it. Devolution gives us a real chance to put a global stamp on environmental issues; we endeavour to do that. While the Liberal Democrats agree with the Committee's report, the target of 10 per cent of Welsh energy needs being provided by renewables by 2010 is not radical enough: Wales has the capacity to provide much more than that—*[Interruption.]*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Alun Cairns, you were heard in relative silence.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Have you considered setting a target of 15 per cent by 2010? Finally, with regard to biomass, which is a relatively new industry and has less opposition than windpower, what steps has the Assembly taken to promote this growing sector?

**Andrew Davies:** We will consider the developments in this area over the next few years and will then decide whether the targets are achievable or whether we need to reconsider them. We may be able to exceed them—we cannot tell at this stage. However, we would always consider our policies in the light of achievements.

Windpower clearly has a huge impact, not only in terms of energy production but also indirectly, in terms of the environmental goods and services sector, which includes

Mae o leiaf tair plaid yn y Cynulliad wedi croesawu'r adroddiad hwn gan weld, os ydym am leihau cynhesu byd-eang ac er mwyn cyfrannu at hynny, bod yn rhaid symud oddi wrth gynhyrchu ynni yn seiliedig ar garbon a thuag at ynni adnewyddadwy.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Byddaf yn gryno a chraff. Yr wyf yn siarad ar ran Mick Bates—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr wyf yn fodlon ichi siarad ar eich rhan chi a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ond—

**Eleanor Burnham:** Nid wyf yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Cymeradwyaf yr adroddiad diddorol ac addysgiadol hwn a diolchaf i bawb a gyfrannodd ato. Rhydd datganoli gyfle gwirioneddol inni roi stamp byd-eang ar faterion amgylcheddol; ceisiwn wneud hynny. Er bod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn cytuno ag adroddiad y Pwyllgor, nid yw'r targed o ddiwallu 10 y cant o anghenion ynni Cymru drwy ddefnyddio ynni adnewyddadwy yn ddigon radical: gallai Cymru ddarparu llawer mwy na hynny—*[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Alun Cairns, rhoddwyd tawelwch cymharol ichi siarad.

**Eleanor Burnham:** A ystyriasoch bennu targed o 15 y cant erbyn 2010? I gloi, o ran bio-màs, sy'n ddiwydiant cymharol newydd ac y ceir llai o wrthwynebiad iddo na phŵer y gwynt, pa gamau a gymerodd y Cynulliad i hyrwyddo'r sector cynyddol hwn?

**Andrew Davies:** Ystyriwn y datblygiadau yn y maes hwn yn ystod yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf a phenderfynwn wedi hynny pa un a ellir cyflawni'r targedau neu a oes angen inni eu hailystyried. Mae'n bosibl y gallwn ragori arnynt—ni allwn ddweud ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, byddem bob amser yn ystyried ein polisiau yng ngoleuni cyflawniadau.

Yn amlwg, caiff pŵer y gwynt effaith enfawr, nid yn unig o ran cynhyrchu ynni ond hefyd yn anuniongyrchol, o ran y sector nwyddau a gwasanaethau amgylcheddol, sy'n

energy, windfarm production, and other areas. Therefore, we believe that windpower has huge potential in Wales, and is an area of which we have barely scratched the surface. This sector was included in the business environment action plan, which I launched last week, as we believe that it has huge potential, and wind energy will play a key role in that.

cynnwys ynni, cynhyrchu ffermydd gwynt, a meysydd eraill. Felly, credwn fod i bŵer y gwynt botensial enfawr yng Nghymru, a'i fod yn faes lle yr ydym megis cychwyn. Cynhwyswyd y sector hwn yn y cynllun gweithredu amgylchedd busnes, a lansiwyd gennyf yr wythnos diwethaf, gan ein bod o'r farn bod iddo botensial enfawr, a bydd ynni'r gwynt yn chwarae rhan allweddol yn hynny.

### **Datganiad gan y Llywydd Statement by the Presiding Officer**

**The Presiding Officer:** I wish to refer to events that took place during yesterday's Plenary, when I interrupted Jonathan Morgan while he was making what he said was a point of order. I have reflected on this and believe that I was right to interrupt him because he was not raising a matter of order with which I could deal. As I have repeated on several occasions, points of order are opportunities to raise matters of order on which I can rule; they are not opportunities for extended free debate. I will continue to interrupt points of order that do not fulfil the appropriate criteria.

**Y Llywydd:** Hoffwn gyfeirio at ddigwyddiadau Cyfarfod Llawn ddoe, pan dorrais ar draws Jonathan Morgan wrth iddo wneud yr hyn a oedd, yn ei farn ef, yn bwynt o drefn. Ystyriais y mater a chredaf fy mod yn iawn i dorri ar ei draws am nad oedd yn codi pwynt o drefn y gallwn ymdrin ag ef. Fel yr ailadroddais sawl gwaith, mae pwyntiau o drefn yn gyfleoedd i godi materion o drefn y gallaf ddyfarnu arnynt; nid ydynt yn gyfleoedd ar gyfer dadl rydd estynedig. Parhaf i dorri ar draws pwyntiau o drefn nad ydynt yn bodloni'r meini prawf priodol.

Following my interruption, I said that,

Ar ôl imi dorri ar draws, dywedais,

'It is not appropriate to name officials in the Chamber.'

'Nid yw'n briodol enwi swyddogion yn y Siambr.'

On reflection, and following advice, I have concluded that this may have been a more sweeping statement than I intended. I made a considered statement on National Assembly officials on 4 February. That statement did not apply to officials of Assembly sponsored public bodies. There is no barrier to Members naming officials under appropriate circumstances, but I counsel Members to use the utmost restraint before naming, in an opprobrious manner, any individual, official or, for that matter, anyone else connected with Assembly proceedings. It is certainly inappropriate to do so through a point of order raised to me.

Ar ôl meddwl, ac yn dilyn cyngor, deuthum i'r casgliad efallai i'r datganiad hwn swnio'n fwy cyffredinol nag y bwriadais. Ar ôl ystyried, gwneuthum ddatganiad ar swyddogion y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar 4 Chwefror. Nid oedd y datganiad hwnnw yn berthnasol i swyddogion cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad. Nid oes unrhyw beth i rwystro Aelodau rhag enwi swyddogion o dan amgylchiadau priodol, ond cynghoraf Aelodau i ymatal i'r eithaf cyn enwi unrhyw unigolyn, swyddog neu, a dweud y gwir, unrhyw un arall sy'n ymwneud â thrafodion y Cynulliad mewn modd sarhaus. Yn sicr mae'n amhriodol gwneud hynny drwy bwynt o drefn a gyfeirir ataf.

### **Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Diwygio'r Heddlu 2002 (Cychwyn) 2003 Approval of the Police Reform Act 2002 (Commencement) Order 2003**

**The Finance Minister (Edwina Hart): I Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Edwina Hart):**

propose that

*the National Assembly:*

*considers the principle of the Police Reform Act 2002 (Commencement) Order 2003, laid in the Table Office on 4 February 2003. (NDM1371)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 11 February 2003, which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the Police Reform Act 2002 (Commencement) Order 2003; and*

*2. approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 4 February 2003. (NDM1372)*

**Janet Ryder:** This Order brings the crime and disorder reduction partnerships into force and charges them with developing strategies for reducing crime and disorder in their area and for combating substance misuse. It also states that, in determining which matters to include or not to include in these strategies, they shall be mindful of the guidance issued for that purpose by the Minister. Will the Minister publish that guidance? What prominence does she give in that guidance to recording racist incidents and incidents of hate crime generally, with which these new crime and disorder reduction partnerships will be charged? If they are to record such incidences, and devise a strategy to deal with them—this is an ugly side of society, and one which nobody would want to admit exists, but which, unfortunately, is on the increase—they must acknowledge that such crimes are difficult to record because many people suffer high levels of verbal abuse before reporting them. We must confront and deal with crime of this sort. It stems from a hatred and intolerance of difference. Many Assembly strategies deal with that issue through education and social inclusion. However, the guidance that you will issue for the development of those strategies will be

Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Deddf Diwygio'r Heddlu 2002 (Cychwyn) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Chwefror 2003. (NDM1371)*

Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5 mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Deddf Diwygio'r Heddlu 2002 (Cychwyn) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Chwefror 2003; ac*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Chwefror 2003. (NDM1372)*

**Janet Ryder:** Daw'r Gorchymyn hwn â'r partneriaethau lleihau troseddau ac anhrefn i rym gan eu gwneud hwy yn gyfrifol am ddatblygu strategaethau i leihau troseddau ac anhrefn yn eu hardal hwy a gwrthsefyll camddefnyddio sylweddau. Noda hefyd, wrth benderfynu pa faterion i'w cynnwys ai peidio yn y strategaethau hyn, y dylent ystyried y canllawiau a gyhoeddwyd at y diben hwnnw gan y Gweinidog. A wnaiff y Gweinidog gyhoeddi'r canllawiau hynny? Pa bwys a rydd yn y canllawiau hynny ar gofnodi digwyddiadau hiliol a digwyddiadau yn ymwneud â throseddau casáu yn gyffredinol y bydd y partneriaethau lleihau troseddau ac anhrefn newydd hyn yn gyfrifol amdanynt? Er mwyn cofnodi digwyddiadau o'r fath a llunio strategaeth i ddelio â hwy—mae hon yn ochr hyll o gymdeithas, ac yn un na fyddai neb am gyfaddef ei bod yn bodoli, ond sydd, yn anffodus, ar gynnydd—rhaid iddynt gydnabod bod troseddau o'r fath yn anodd i'w cofnodi gan fod cymaint o bobl yn dioddef llawer iawn o ddifenwi cyn hysbysu'r awdurdodau. Rhaid inni wynebu a delio â throseddau o'r fath. Deillia o gasineb ac anoddefgarwch tuag at fod yn wahanol. Mae llawer o strategaethau'r Cynulliad yn delio â'r broblem honno drwy addysg a

important in shaping the response of communities to the crucial issue of hate crime. Many groups would be interested if you were to publish the guidance that you intend to issue.

chynhwysiant cymdeithasol. Fodd bynnag, bydd y canllawiau a gyhoeddwyd i ddatblygu'r strategaethau hynny yn bwysig wrth lunio ymateb cymunedau i broblem hollbwysig troseddau casáu. Byddai gan lawer o grwpiau ddiddordeb pe baech yn cyhoeddi'r canllawiau y bwriadwch eu cyflwyno.

3.50 p.m.

**Eleanor Burnham:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats would give more power over policing in Wales to a stronger Senedd. However, I welcome this Order as it offers greater autonomy to authorities at a local level, while ensuring that the Assembly, not Westminster, takes the lead in co-ordinating crime and disorder reduction strategies for the whole of Wales. That flexibility can lead to a more innovative and appropriate reduction strategy, which, in turn, can potentially address crime and disorder much more effectively at a local level. As local strategies will report to the Assembly and to the Secretary of State, it also ensures that Wales will have a holistic approach to reducing crime and disorder. In general, this Order will give the National Assembly more teeth to govern and care for society.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Byddai Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn rhoi mwy o bŵer dros blismona yng Nghymru i Senedd gryfach. Fodd bynnag, croesawaf y Gorchymyn hwn gan ei fod yn cynnig mwy o hunanlywodraeth i awdurdodau ar lefel leol, tra'n sicrhau bod y Cynulliad, ac nid San Steffan, yn arwain y blaen wrth gydgyssylltu strategaethau i leihau troseddau ac anhrefn ar gyfer Cymru gyfan. Gall yr hyblygrwydd hwnnw arwain at strategaeth leihau fwy arloesol a phriodol a all, yn ei thro, fynd i'r afael o bosibl â throseddau ac anhrefn yn llawer mwy effeithiol ar lefel leol. Gan y bydd strategaethau lleol yn atebol i'r Cynulliad ac i'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol, mae hefyd yn sicrhau y bydd gan Gymru ymagwedd gyfannol tuag at leihau troseddau ac anhrefn. Yn gyffredinol, bydd y Gorchymyn hwn yn rhoi mwy o rym i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol reoli a gofalu am gymdeithas.

**The Finance Minister (Edwina Hart):** Consultation is about to begin on the detailed guidance for the partnerships in drawing up the substance misuse strategies. On the crime reduction side, I do not think that there will be prescriptive guidance, because I want to give local determination in strategic planning in this particular area. I am happy to take up Janet's points about race hate crimes, which we also discussed in this context in the Local Government and Housing Committee meeting this morning. We are more than happy to allow Members to see the guidance when it is produced.

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Edwina Hart):** Mae'r broses ymgynghori ar fin dechrau ar y canllawiau manwl ar gyfer y partneriaethau i lunio'r strategaethau ar gyfer camddefnyddio sylweddau. O ran lleihau troseddau, ni chredaf y bydd canllawiau cyfarwyddol, oherwydd yr wyf am sicrhau bod modd gwneud penderfyniadau lleol o ran cynllunio strategol yn y maes penodol hwn. Yr wyf yn fodlon trafod pwyntiau Janet am droseddau yn ymwneud â chasineb hiliol, a drafodasom hefyd yn y cyd-destun hwn yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai y bore yma. Yr ydym yn fwy na pharod i'r Aelodau weld y canllawiau pan gânt eu cynhyrchu.

*Cynnig (NDM1371): O blaid 32, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1371): For 32, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:



Barrett, Lorraine  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Y Llywydd:** Mae nam ar y system bleidleisio. Bydd yn rhaid inni bleidleisio trwy ddangos dwylo.

**The Presiding Officer:** There is a problem with the voting system. We will have to vote by show of hands.

*Cynhaliwyd pleidlais drwy ddangos dwylo.  
A vote was held by show of hands.*

*Derbyniwyd cynnig NDM1372.  
Motion NDM1372 was carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Ariannu Ysgolion a Gynhelir (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003  
Approval of the Financing of Maintained Schools (Amendment) (Wales)  
Regulations 2003**

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly considers the principle of the Financing of Maintained Schools (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 12 February 2003. (NDM1373)*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Ariannu Ysgolion a Gynhelir (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 12 Chwefror 2003. (NDM1373)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly:*

1. *considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 25 February 2003, which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the Financing of Maintained Schools (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003; and*

2. *approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 12 February 2003. (NDM1374)*

**Helen Mary Jones:** Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales will support these regulations, which are technical. However, I would like to press the Minister as to how confident she is that a sufficient amount of funding will be delegated by local authorities to schools. We know that there have been problems with this in the past. There are examples of schools having to consider making redundancies because there was uncertainty on this issue. Will the Minister assure us that this will not happen again and that these issues will be adequately addressed in the long term?

I will also question the Minister further about another issue regarding financing maintained schools, namely the proposals made by Education and Learning Wales for funding sixth forms. Will the Minister consider—she may not be able to give me a reply today on this—given the grave concern about the impact that that will have, particularly on smaller sixth forms, intervening to delay the implementation of those proposals so that further consideration can be given to a more effective and just formula?

**Jonathan Morgan:** The Welsh Conservative Party will support these regulations on the basis of a commitment from the Minister to review the way in which this money will be allocated to local authorities. We would hope that this money could be ring-fenced directly to schools, so that they had the resources to cope with this responsibility. However, we understand that we must allow local

Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:*

1. *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5 mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Ariannu Ysgolion a Gynhelir (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 25 Chwefror 2003; ac*

2. *yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 12 Chwefror 2003. (NDM1374)*

**Helen Mary Jones:** Bydd Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn, sy'n dechnegol. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn bwysu ar y Gweinidog a gofyn pa mor hyderus ydyw y caiff digon o arian ei ddirprwyo gan awdurdodau lleol i ysgolion. Gwyddom y bu problemau gyda hyn yn y gorffennol. Bu enghreifftiau o ysgolion yn gorfod ystyried diswyddo pobl gan fod ansicrwydd ynghylch y mater hwn. A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi sicrwydd inni na fydd hyn yn digwydd eto ac yr ymdrinnir yn ddigonol â'r materion hyn yn yr hirdymor?

Holaf y gweinidog ymhellach hefyd ynghylch mater arall yn ymwneud ag ariannu ysgolion a gynhelir, sef y cynigion a wnaed gan Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru ar gyfer ariannu darpariaeth chweched dosbarth. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ystyried—efallai na fydd yn gallu rhoi ateb imi heddiw ar hyn—o gofio'r pryder difrifol ynghylch yr effaith y bydd hynny'n ei chael, yn arbennig ar ddsbarthiadau llai yn y chweched dosbarth, ymyrryd i ohirio'r broses o roi'r cynigion hyn ar waith fel y gellir rhoi mwy o ystyriaeth i fformiwla fwy effeithiol a theg?

**Jonathan Morgan:** Bydd Plaid Geidwadol Cymru yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn ar sail ymrwymiad gan y Gweinidog i adolygu'r modd y dyrennir yr arian hwn i awdurdodau lleol. Byddem yn gobeithio y gellid clustnodi'r arian hwn yn uniongyrchol i ysgolion, fel bod yr adnoddau ganddynt i ymdopi â'r cyfrifoldeb hwn. Fodd bynnag, deallwn fod yn rhaid inni ganiatáu i

authorities to hold this money back in their budgets for an additional year. Minister, on the amount of money that has been allocated for the 2003-04 financial year, are you convinced, and will you state categorically, that county councils have the necessary funding to meet their responsibilities concerning the cost of the teachers' restructured pay, and their national insurance and pension contributions? Some concern has been expressed by local authorities that they have not been given sufficient resource to meet these responsibilities, which, in certain instances, has led to those authorities increasing their council tax beyond normal expectations.

**Eleanor Burnham:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats also welcome this motion. There is much to be said for extending the length of the budget cycle from one to three years—if not longer—to give schools a better understanding of what funding they can expect to receive. This would mean that they could better plan for the future. We look forward to the review of the funding formula that is currently under consultation. We agree that money should be spent where it is needed most, especially in the poorer areas of the index of multiple deprivation. However, we must consider school transport costs for rural schools to ensure that sufficient support is given. When I was a member of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee, you will remember, Minister, that I asked you about Flintshire. Headteachers in Flintshire are currently lobbying me hard because they are concerned that, despite what we are saying in the Assembly, the money has not reached them. Could you allay their fears?

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I remind Members that this particular set of regulations concerns the fact that we gave local authorities permission to retain funding centrally, to ensure that they had enough to pay the additional money due to teachers as a result of the new threshold arrangements. Had the money been delegated to individual schools, and a teacher in another school went through the threshold, the required money would not be available. Local authorities need that flexibility. I am grateful to all

awdurdodau lleol ddal yr arian hwn yn ôl yn eu cyllidebau am flwyddyn arall. Weinidog, o ran swm yr arian a ddyrannwyd ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol 2003-04, a ydych yn argyhoeddedig, ac a wnewch chi nodi hynny'n bendant, bod gan gynghorau sir yr arian angenrheidiol i gyflawni eu cyfrifoldebau o ran cost cyflogau athrawon wedi eu hailstrwythuro, a'u cyfraniadau yswiriant gwladol a'u cyfraniadau pensiwn? Mynegwyd peth pryder gan awdurdodau lleol na chawsant ddigon o adnoddau i gyflawni'r cyfrifoldebau hyn, sydd, mewn rhai achosion, wedi peri i'r awdurdodau hynny gynyddu eu treth gyngor y tu hwnt i'r disgwyliadau arferol.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn croesawu'r cynnig hwn hefyd. Mae llawer o blaid ymestyn hyd y cylch cyllideb o flwyddyn i dair blynedd—os nad yn hwy—fel bod ysgolion yn deall yn well pa arian y gallant ddisgwyl ei gael. Byddai hyn yn golygu y gallent gynllunio'n well ar gyfer y dyfodol. Edrychwn ymlaen at adolygiad y fformiwla ariannu yr ymgynghorir yn ei chylch ar hyn o bryd. Cytunwn y dylid gwario'r arian lle mae ei angen fwyaf, yn enwedig yn ardaloedd tlotach y mynegai amlamddifadedd. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni ystyried costau cludiant ysgol ar gyfer ysgolion gwledig i sicrhau y rhoddir digon o gefnogaeth. Pan oeddwn yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, fe gofiwch, Weinidog, imi ofyn cwestiwn i chi am Sir y Fflint. Mae prifathrawon yn Sir y Fflint ar hyn o bryd yn pwysu arnaf gan eu bod yn gofidio nad yw'r arian wedi eu cyrraedd, er gwaethaf yr hyn a ddywedwn yn y Cynulliad. A allech leddfu eu pryderon?

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Hoffwn atgoffa'r Aelodau bod y gyfres arbennig hon o reoliadau yn ymwneud â'r ffaith inni roi caniatâd i awdurdodau lleol gadw'r arian yn ganolog, er mwyn sicrhau bod digon ganddynt i dalu'r arian ychwanegol a oedd yn ddyledus i athrawon o ganlyniad i'r trefniadau trothwy newydd. Pe bai'r arian wedi ei ddirprwyo i ysgolion unigol, a phe bai athro mewn ysgol arall yn mynd drwy'r trothwy, ni fyddai'r arian angenrheidiol ar gael. Mae angen yr hyblygrwydd hwnnw ar

Members for their support.

This is the time of year when local authorities across Wales set their budgets and we do not yet have the outcome of that. Looking at the facts, the settlement has been increased some 9.2 per cent although the predicted increase in pay for teachers was 4 per cent; that increase subsequently turned out to be 2.9 per cent. The settlement takes account of all pay and price pressures, and additional money was put into teachers' pensions. I am confident that local authorities across Wales can set a proper education budget.

I was in a similar situation last year during budget discussions and yet, last year saw some 400 additional teachers in Wales. Therefore, we have seen substantial increases in teacher numbers year on year. Locally, there will be changes in funding because of issues around pupil numbers and rolls. However, as I have said previously, we are consulting on issues surrounding the context of the funding formula, so that local authorities can have a lower percentage related to pupil numbers when they create their local funding formula. That was welcomed by Committee members, and consultation will start in March.

awdurdodau lleol. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i bob Aelod am eu cefnogaeth.

Dyma'r adeg o'r flwyddyn pan fo awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru yn pennu eu cyllidebau ac nid yw canlyniad hynny gennym eto. Wrth edrych ar y ffeithiau, cynyddwyd y setliad tua 9.2 y cant, er mai 4 y cant oedd y cynnydd a ragwelwyd mewn cyflogau athrawon; yn y pen draw 2.9 y cant oedd y cynnydd hwnnw. Mae'r setliad yn ystyried yr holl bwysau ar gyflogau a phrisiau, a sicrhawyd rhagor o arian ar gyfer pensiynau athrawon. Yr wyf yn hyderus y gall awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru bennu cyllideb addysg briodol.

Yr oeddwn mewn sefyllfa debyg y llynedd yn ystod trafodaethau ar y gyllideb ac eto, gwelwyd tua 400 o athrawon ychwanegol y llynedd yng Nghymru. Felly, yr ydym wedi gweld cynnydd sylweddol yn nifer yr athrawon o flwyddyn i flwyddyn. Yn lleol, bydd newidiadau o ran ariannu oherwydd problemau ynghylch nifer y disgyblion a'r cofrestri. Fodd bynnag, fel y soniais o'r blaen, yr ydym yn ymgynghori ar faterion yn ymwneud â chyd-destun y fformiwla ariannu, fel y gall awdurdodau lleol gael canran is mewn perthynas â nifer y disgyblion pan fyddant yn creu eu fformiwla ariannu leol. Croesawyd hynny gan aelodau'r Pwyllgor, a bydd y broses ymgynghori yn dechrau ym mis Mawrth.

*Cynnig (NDM1373): O blaid 32, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM1373): For 32, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, David  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann

Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1374): O blaid 31, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1374): For 31, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, David  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

4.00 p.m.

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Dreth Gyngor (Gweinyddu a Gorfodi) (Diwygio)  
(Cymru) 2003**  
**Approval of the Council Tax (Administration and Enforcement) (Amendment)  
(Wales) Regulations 2003**

**The Finance Minister (Edwina Hart):** I propose that

*the National Assembly:*

*considers the principle of the Council Tax (Administration and Enforcement) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003 laid in the Table Office on 4 February 2003. (NDM1375)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 25 February 2003, which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the Council Tax (Administration and Enforcement) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003; and*

*2. approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 4 February 2003. (NDM1376)*

These regulations are routine and technical, and ensure that the new working tax credit and the disabled tax credit do not count as earnings for the purposes of making deductions from earnings under the attachments of earnings orders.

**Janet Ryder:** I welcome these regulations. Unfortunately, there is some confusion and concern among people who are eligible to claim these benefits. What else can the Minister do to advertise this?

**Eleanor Burnham:** This is about joined-up government and preventing contradictions. We support this motion.

**The Presiding Officer:** A succinct response might be in order, Minister.

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Edwina Hart):** Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau'r Dreth Gyngor (Gweinyddu a Gorfodi) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Chwefror 2003. (NDM1375)*

Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5 mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau'r Dreth Gyngor (Gweinyddu a Gorfodi) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 25 Chwefror 2003; ac*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Chwefror 2003. (NDM1376)*

Mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn rhai arferol a thechnegol, ac yn sicrhau nad yw'r credyd treth gwaith newydd a'r credyd treth i berson anabl yn cyfrif fel enillion at ddibenion gwneud didyniadau o enillion o dan y gorchymyn atafael enillion.

**Janet Ryder:** Croesawaf y rheoliadau hyn. Yn anffodus, mae peth dryswch a phryder ymysg pobl ifanc sy'n gymwys i hawlio'r budd-daliadau hyn. Beth arall y gall y Gweinidog ei wneud i hysbysebu hyn?

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae a wnelo hyn â llywodraeth gydgysylltiedig ac atal gwrthddywediadau. Cefnogwn y cynnig hwn.

**Y Llywydd:** Byddai ymateb byr yn briodol, Weinidog.

**The Finance Minister (Edwina Hart):** I will take those points on board, and consider the wider issue raised by Janet Ryder.

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Edwina Hart):** Ystyriaf y pwyntiau hynny a'r mater ehangach ei gwmpas a godwyd gan Janet Ryder.

*Cynnig (NDM1375): O blaid 31, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1375): For 31, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, David  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1376): O blaid 32, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1376): For 32, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Essex, Sue

Evans, Delyth  
 German, Michael  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Addysg (Cyflenwi Gwybodaeth) (Cymru) 2003 Approval of the Education (Supply of Information) (Wales) Regulations 2003**

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose that **Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly:*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:*

*considers the principle of the Education (Supply of Information) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 4 February 2003. (NDM1377)*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Addysg (Cyflenwi Gwybodaeth) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Chwefror 2003. (NDM1377)*

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly:*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 25 February 2003, which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the Education (Supply of Information) (Wales) Regulations 2003; and*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5 mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Addysg (Cyflenwi Gwybodaeth) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 25 Chwefror 2003; ac*

*2. approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft Order and the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 4 February 2003. (NDM1378)*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r Gorchymyn drafft a'r arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Chwefror 2003. (NDM1378)*

**Gareth Jones:** Ar ran Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales, dywedaf ei bod yn briodol bod y Cynulliad yn defnyddio is-

**Gareth Jones:** On behalf of Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales, I say that it is appropriate that the Assembly uses



ddeddfwriaeth i sicrhau trefniadau cyffredin ar gyfer holl athrawon Cymru, boed wedi'u cyflogi gan awdurdodau addysg lleol neu asiantaethau athrawon llanw. Bydd y rheoliadau newydd hefyd yn lleihau gweinyddiaeth a rhywfaint o fiwrocratiaeth; trueni na fyddai mwy o hynny'n digwydd yn gyffredinol ym myd addysg.

Gofynnaf ddau gwestiwn pendol. Cyflwynir categorïau newydd o resymau dros wahardd unigolion o'u gwaith ar sail iechyd. Pam? A oes unrhyw achosion arbennig wedi arwain at y mesur a'r gofyn hwn? A oes perygl o gamwahaniaethu yn erbyn rhai athrawon ar sail cyflwr eu hiechyd? Cyfeiriaf hefyd at y ffaith bod y disgwyliadau a'r cyfrifoldebau ar y cyflogwr a'r asiant i gyflwyno adroddiadau cywir, cyfiawn a theg, o dyngedfennol bwys i'r unigolyn. Gall unrhyw gyhuddiad ar gam gael effaith niweidiol ar ddyfodol proffesiynol yr athro neu athrawes dan waharddiad.

I ba raddau y byddwch chi, Weinidog, yn monitro ac yn gwirio bod gan yr asiantaethau hyn, a phob ysgol, drefn ddisgyblu ddibynadwy a thryloyw, y mae pob athro, pob pennaeth a phob aelod o gyrff llywodraethu, yn ei deall ac, yn bwysicach, yn deall bod system o'r fath ar waith. A ydych yn gwirio bod y wybodaeth a drosglwyddir o dan y Rheoliadau hyn yn gwbl ddbynadwy a bod system ddisgyblu y gallwn ddbynnu arni ar gael yn ein hysgolion a bod pawb sydd o bwys yn deall y system honno?

**Eleanor Burnham:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome these regulations, which remove the anomaly of teachers from supply agencies being treated differently from other teachers. Teacher supply agencies will now be brought into line with all other teacher employers and must report cases of unacceptable professional conduct to the National Assembly for Wales, and cases of serious professional incompetence to the General Teaching Council for Wales. This is most welcome as, currently, there is no requirement for teacher supply agencies to report such cases, though the Amy Gehring case in England reveals the need to bring teachers from supply agencies in line with other teachers. These regulations will help to

subordinate legislation to ensure common arrangements for all teachers in Wales, be they employed by local education authorities or supply teaching agencies. These new regulations will also cut down on administration and bureaucracy to some extent; it is a shame that this does not happen more generally in education.

I will ask two specific questions. New categories of reasons for suspending people from their work on health grounds are included. Why? Are there any particular cases that have led to this measure and requirement? Is there a danger of discrimination against some teachers on the grounds of their medical conditions? I will also refer to the fact that the expectations and responsibilities on employers and agents to present correct, fair and just reports is of vital importance to the individual. Any false accusation can have a detrimental effect on a suspended teacher's professional future.

To what extent will you, Minister, monitor and verify that these agencies, and every school, have a reliable and transparent disciplinary system, which every teacher, every headteacher and every member of governing bodies understands and, more importantly, understand that such a system is in place. Do you monitor whether the information transferred under these Regulations is totally reliable and that a system on which we can rely will be in place in our schools and that all important parties understand that system?

**Eleanor Burnham:** Croesawa Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru y rheoliadau hyn, sy'n dileu yr anghysondeb bod athrawon o asiantaethau cyflenwi yn cael eu trin yn wahanol i athrawon eraill. Caiff asiantaethau cyflenwi athrawon eu cysoni yn awr â phob cyflogwr athrawon arall a rhaid iddynt hysbysu Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru am achosion o ymddygiad proffesiynol annerbyniol, a hysbysu Cyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru am achosion o anghymhwyster proffesiynol difrifol. Mae hyn yn dra derbyniol oherwydd, ar hyn o bryd, nid oes unrhyw ofyniad i asiantaethau cyflenwi athrawon hysbysu unrhyw un am achosion o'r fath, er bod achos Amy Gehring yn Lloegr yn dangos yr angen i gysoni

maintain standards in the teaching profession and help to protect children who may otherwise be vulnerable from contact with unsuitable people.

athrawon o asiantaethau cyflenwi ag athrawon eraill. Bydd y rheoliadau hyn yn helpu i gynnal safonau yn y proffesiwn addysgu ac yn helpu i ddiogelu plant a allai fel arall fod yn ddiamddiffyn wrth ddod i gysylltiad â phobl anaddas.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** These regulations are important because they will ensure that all teachers, wherever they come from, are treated in exactly the same way. I assure Gareth that they are properly monitored; they need to be in order to make absolutely sure that unsuitable people are prevented from working with children in our schools.

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn bwysig gan y byddant yn sicrhau bod pob athro, o ble bynnag y daw, yn cael ei drin yn union yr un ffordd. Hoffwn sicrhau Gareth eu bod yn cael eu monitro'n gywir; mae angen iddynt fod mewn trefn er mwyn bod yn hollol sicr yr atelir pobl anaddas rhag gweithio gyda phlant yn ein hysgolion.

*Cynnig (NDM1377): O blaid 32, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1377): For 32, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1378): O blaid 31, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM1378): For 31, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau (Trefniadau Ymsefydlu Athrawon) (Cymru) 2003  
Approval of the Education (Induction Arrangements for School Teachers)  
(Wales) Regulations 2003**

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose that **Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly:*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:*

*considers the principle of the Education (Induction Arrangements for School Teachers) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 4 February 2003. (NDM1379)*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Addysg (Trefniadau Ymsefydlu ar gyfer Athrawon Ysgol) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Chwefror 2003. (NDM1379)*

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly:*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 25*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at*

*February 2003, which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the Education (Induction Arrangements for School Teachers) (Wales) Regulations 2003; and*

*2. approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft Order and the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 4 February 2003. (NDM1380)*

**Cynog Dafis:** Croesawaf y rheoliadau hyn. Nodir, serch hynny, fod Cymru ar ei hôl hi, braidd, gan fod y system hon wedi bod ar waith yn Lloegr ers Medi 1999. Y fframwaith sy'n cael ei sefydlu heddiw—mae'r nodyn esboniadol yn nodi bod y rheoliadau yn gosod y fframwaith—ond mae canllawiau pellach i ddod. Pryd gaiff y canllawiau hyn eu cyhoeddi, ac a fydd cyfle i'r Cynulliad eu trafod? Mae hyn yn bwysig o ystyried bod y buddsoddiad ariannol yn sylweddol, sef £17 miliwn dros dair blynedd.

Pan drafodwn hynny, pa safonau a ddefnyddir i fesur athrawon newydd sy'n mynd drwy'r broses? Dylid gweld hyn yng nghyd-destun datblygiad proffesiynol athrawon yn gyffredinol. Yng Ngogledd Iwerddon, mae cynllun newydd o ddatblygiad proffesiynol cynnar yn cael ei ddatblygu ac mae adrannu addysg y prifysgolion yn parhau i weithio gydag athrawon yn nhair blynedd gyntaf eu gwaith. Maent yn cydweithio ag awdurdodau addysg i gynnig hyfforddiant a chynhaliadau barhaus. Soniodd y Gweinidog yr wythnos diwethaf ei bod yn awyddus i ddysgu gwersi gan wledydd eraill. A yw'r Gweinidog wedi edrych ar yr esiampl hon, ac os nad yw wedi gwneud hynny, a wnaiff hi? A yw'n cytuno y dylai bod gan sefydliadau addysg uwch rôl yn y gwaith o ddatblygu athrawon yn broffesiynol yn y blynyddoedd cynnar ac wedi hynny? Teimlwn y dylai Cyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru gymryd cyfrifoldeb am ddatblygu'r rhaglenni datblygiad proffesiynol yn gynnar, ac wedi hynny, gyda'r sefydliadau addysg uwch. A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno â'r hyn yr ydym yn awyddus i'w weld, ac y bwriadwn ei gyflwyno ar ôl yr etholiad?

4.10 p.m.

*unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5 mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Addysg (Trefniadau Ymsefydlu ar gyfer Athrawon Ysgol) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 25 Chwefror 2003; ac*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r Gorchymyn drafft a'r arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Chwefror 2003. (NDM1380)*

**Cynog Dafis:** I welcome these regulations. It will be noted, however, that Wales is rather lagging behind, as this system has been operational in England since September 1999. Today, it is the framework that is being established—the explanatory note states that the regulations set out the framework—but further guidelines will follow. When will these guidelines be published, and will the Assembly have an opportunity to debate them? This is important given that the financial investment is considerable, namely £17 million over three years.

When we discuss that, by what standards will new teachers be assessed as they go through this process? This should be seen in the context of the professional development of teachers generally. In Northern Ireland, a new scheme of early professional development is being developed and university education departments continue to work with teachers during their first three years in post. They co-operate with education authorities to provide continuous training and support. The Minister remarked last week that she is keen to learn lessons from other countries. Has the Minister looked at this example, and if not, will she do so? Does she agree that higher education institutions should have a role in the work of developing teachers professionally during the early years and later? The General Teaching Council for Wales should take responsibility for the professional development programmes early on, and later, with the higher education institutions. Does the Minister agree with what we are keen to see, and intend to introduce following the election?

**Eleanor Burnham:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome and support these regulations, as they will introduce an induction year for all newly-qualified teachers in Wales, which will help and support them in their jobs of supplying good quality education to their pupils. At present, induction is determined and supported locally. Moving to a more standardised system is a step forward. There has also been a compulsory induction scheme for newly-qualified teachers in England since 1 September 1999. The introduction of an induction programme for newly-qualified teachers in Wales will ensure cross-border parity, thus allowing teachers in Wales the same professional qualifications and opportunities as their colleagues in England.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I thank Members for their contributions. You are not correct, Cynog—although, as Eleanor said, induction was introduced in England in 1999, England does not have the programme that we are considering, namely induction plus two years of early professional development. I stress that, rather than simply overlaying our political view, we go out to consultation. We established an early professional development framework, which included members of the higher education institutions, to consider how to take this forward. There is strong support for the proposal that, in Wales, the induction period should be followed by a two-year programme of flexible and coherent early professional development. That programme will be an entitlement for all new teachers in Wales and will provide them with vital support during the early years of their career. It will be distinctive, as it will provide new teachers with a bridge between their induction period and their career-long continuing professional development. They will have mentors, and there is money attached to it, so we can ensure that they are getting the best possible support for their professional development.

The guidance has also been developed in consultation with the early professional development partnership group. It includes a

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn croesawu ac yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn, gan y byddant yn cyflwyno blwyddyn ymsefydlu i'r holl athrawon newydd gymhwyso yng Nghymru, a fydd yn eu helpu ac yn eu cynnal yn eu swyddi i gyflenwi addysg o safon i'w disgyblion. Ar hyn o bryd, penderfynir ar y dull ymsefydlu yn lleol ac fe'i cefnogir yn lleol. Mae symud i system wedi ei safoni fwy yn gam ymlaen. Bu cynllun ymsefydlu gorfodol hefyd i athrawon newydd gymhwyso ar waith yn Lloegr er 1 Medi 1999. Bydd cyflwyno rhaglen ymsefydlu i athrawon newydd gymhwyso yng Nghymru yn sicrhau cydraddoldeb trawsffiniol, gan ganiatáu i athrawon yng Nghymru gael yr un cymwysterau a chyfleoedd proffesiynol â'u cyd-athrawon yn Lloegr.

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Diolchaf i'r Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau. Nid ydych yn gywir, Cynog—er, fel y dywedodd Eleanor, cyflwynwyd ymsefydlu yn Lloegr yn 1999, nid oes gan Loegr y rhaglen yr ydym ninnau yn ei hystyried, sef ymsefydlu ynghyd â dwy flynedd o ddatblygiad proffesiynol cynnar. Pwysleisiaf ein bod yn trefnu cyfnod ymgynghori yn hytrach na gorfodi ein barn wleidyddol yn unig. Sefydlwyd fframwaith datblygu proffesiynol cynnar gennym, a oedd yn cynnwys aelodau o'r sefydliadau addysg uwch, i ystyried sut i ddatblygu hyn. Mae cefnogaeth gref i'r cynnig y dylai'r cyfnod ymsefydlu, yng Nghymru, gael ei ddilyn gan raglen dwy flynedd o ddatblygiad proffesiynol cynnar hyblyg a chydlynol. Bydd y rhaglen honno yn rhywbeth y bydd gan bob athro newydd yng Nghymru yr hawl iddi a bydd yn rhoi cymorth hollbwysig iddynt yn ystod blynyddoedd cynnar eu gyrfa. Bydd yn wahanol, gan y bydd yn darparu pont i athrawon newydd rhwng eu cyfnod ymsefydlu a'u datblygiad proffesiynol parhaus ar hyd eu gyrfa. Bydd ganddynt fentor, ac mae arian ar gael ar gyfer hyn, fel y gallwn sicrhau eu bod yn cael y cymorth gorau posibl ar gyfer eu datblygiad proffesiynol.

Datblygwyd y canllawiau hyn hefyd drwy ymgynghori â'r grŵp partneriaeth datblygiad proffesiynol cynnar. Mae'n cynnwys llawlyfr

handbook for induction, early professional development, and an induction tutor briefing programme. The handbook is available on the Learning Wales website, and contains general guidance on the induction framework, the end-of-induction standard, and specific sections related to newly-qualified teachers, induction tutors, schools and LEAs. It is currently being used by schools participating in the induction pilot programme. The final version of the handbook, which will be used from 2003, will contain real examples from schools that are currently participating in the induction pilot programme. I will report back to Committee on this issue.

ymsefydlu, datblygiad proffesiynol cynnar, a rhaglen friffio ar gyfer tiwtoriaid ymsefydlu. Mae'r llawlyfr ar gael ar wefan Dysgu Cymru, ac mae'n cynnwys canllawiau cyffredinol ar y fframwaith ymsefydlu, y safon diwedd ymsefydlu, ac adrannau penodol yn ymwneud ag athrawon newydd gymhwyso, tiwtoriaid ymsefydlu, ysgolion ac awdurdodau addysg lleol. Fe'i defnyddir ar hyn o bryd gan ysgolion sy'n cymryd rhan yn y rhaglen beilot ar ymsefydlu. Bydd fersiwn terfynol y llawlyfr, a ddefnyddir o 2003, yn cynnwys enghreifftiau go iawn gan ysgolion sydd yn cymryd rhan yn y rhaglen beilot ar ymsefydlu ar hyn o bryd. Byddaf yn cyflwyno adroddiad i'r Pwyllgor ar hyn.

*Cynnig (NDM1379): O blaid 32, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM1379): For 32, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1380): O blaid 32, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM1380): For 32, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.13 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.13 p.m.*

**Cymeradwyo Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) Adroddiad Grant Arbennig  
(Rhif 5) (Cymru) 2003  
Approval of Local Government Finance (Wales) Special Grant Report (No. 5)  
(Wales) 2003**

**The Minister for Environment (Sue Essex):** I propose that **Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd (Sue Essex):** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly, under section 88B of the Local Government Finance Act 1988, and in accordance with Standing Order No. 19.8, approves the Local Government Finance (Wales) Special Grant Report (No. 5) (Wales) 2003 which was laid in the Table Office on 25 February 2003. (NDM1383)*

**Janet Davies:** Plaid Cymru will support this motion, which refers to finance for the

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol o dan adran 88B o Ddeddf Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol 1988, ac yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 19.8, yn cymeradwyo Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) Adroddiad Grant Arbennig (Rhif 5) (Cymru) 2003 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 25 Chwefror 2003. (NDM1383)*

**Janet Davies:** Bydd Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi'r cynnig hwn, sy'n cyfeirio at gyllid

removal of ozone-depleting substances from domestic refrigerators. Although we support this motion, this is a classic example of how legislation should not have been handled. The important issue of improving the environment through the better handling of a major pollutant was botched. Despite the long run-in from European legislation, and the fact that it had already been in place for two years for commercial products, the legal requirement to remove these substances in January 2002 caught the United Kingdom unprepared. Refrigerator mountains provided the press and the media with endless copy—gleeful copy, unfortunately, in the case of the right-wing tabloids.

Looking forward, I am sure that lessons have been learnt. Those lessons include producing goods that are easily disposed of and in an environmentally-friendly manner, having systems in place to deal with European legislation in good time, and informing interested parties professionally. I am glad to see from annex C that the backlog has been cleared. However, this is still costing money. Therefore, it is important that we help local authorities with their finance, because it is not fair that they should have to meet all costs. However, we should recognise that waste is a valuable and valued product, and its disposal should not be a financial drain.

Unlike fridges, Assembly Members are often expected to be in more than one place at one time. During the windfarm objectors meeting, I was at my village school governors meeting, which had been arranged more than a term earlier. I regard that as a duty. I should not be attacked for attending that meeting instead of a meeting on windfarms.

**David Davies:** Those comments are rather disingenuous, because these regulations caught Plaid Cymru by surprise. When I previously talked about the impending fridges crisis, Plaid Cymru Members were falling about in the aisles. Such comments, therefore, are rather rich. The fact is that fridges were already being disposed of in the most environmentally friendly way possible—they were being re-used. They

ar gyfer gwaredu sylweddau sy'n disbyddu'r osôn o oergelloedd domestig. Er y cefnogwn y cynnig hwn, mae hon yn enghraifft glasurlo o sut na ddylid bod wedi trafod deddfwriaeth. Gwnaed cawl o fater pwysig gwella'r amgylchedd drwy drin un o'r prif lygryddion yn well. Er gwaethaf yr amser maith ers cyflwyno'r deddfwriaeth Ewropeaidd, a'r ffaith ei bod ar waith ar gyfer cynnyrch masnachol ers dwy flynedd, nid oedd y Deyrnas Unedig wedi ymbaratoi ar gyfer y gofyniad cyfreithiol i waredu'r sylweddau hyn ym mis Ionawr 2002. Yr oedd pentyrrau o oergelloedd yn rhoi straeon di-ben-draw i'r wasg a'r cyfryngau—a oedd, yn anffodus, yn fêl ar fysedd y papurau tabloid asgell dde.

Gan edrych ymlaen, yr wyf yn siŵr bod gwersi wedi'u dysgu. Mae'r gwersi hynny yn cynnwys cynhyrchu nwyddau y gellir eu gwaredu'n hawdd ac mewn ffordd sy'n ystyriol i'r amgylchedd, rhoi systemau ar waith i ymdrin â deddfwriaeth Ewropeaidd mewn da bryd, a hysbysu'r sawl a chanddo fuddiant yn broffesiynol. Yr wyf yn falch o weld yn ôl atodiad C fod yr ôl-groniad wedi'i glirio. Fodd bynnag, mae hyn yn dal i gostio arian. Felly, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn helpu awdurdodau lleol gyda'u cyllid, gan nad yw'n deg disgwyl iddynt dalu'r holl gostau. Fodd bynnag, dylem gydnabod bod gwastraff yn gynnyrch gwerthfawr, ac ni ddylai'r broses o'i waredu fod yn faich yn ariannol.

Yn wahanol i oergelloedd, yn aml disgwylir i Aelodau Cynulliad fod mewn mwy nag un lle ar yr un pryd. Yn ystod y cyfarfod â gwrthwynebwyr y ffermydd gwynt, yr oeddwn mewn cyfarfod â llywodraethwyr fy ysgol bentref, a drefnwyd o leiaf dymor ymlaen llaw. Teimlaf fod hynny yn ddyletswydd arnaf. Ni ddylai pobl ymosod arnaf am fynd i'r cyfarfod hwnnw yn lle'r cyfarfod ar ffermydd gwynt.

**David Davies:** Mae'r sylwadau hynny braidd yn anonest, gan nad oedd Plaid Cymru yn barod ar gyfer y rheoliadau hyn. Pan siaradais am yr argyfwng a oedd ar fin digwydd o ran oergelloedd, yr oedd Aelodau Plaid Cymru yn eu dyblau'n chwethin. Felly, mae'r sylwadau hyn braidd yn smala. Y gwir yw bod oergelloedd eisoes yn cael eu gwaredu yn y ffordd fwyaf ystyriol o'r amgylchedd—yr oeddent yn cael eu hailddefnyddio. Fe'u



were going to Africa where they were being used by people in third world countries who could not possibly afford to buy brand new fridges.

The CFCs that caused the depletion of the ozone layer are no longer used in fridges. Mankind has done everything possible, just about, to eradicate the problems caused by CFCs. As a result, research suggests that the ozone layer is now recovering. That is a good example of how laws should not be brought in. To return to Janet's point, the right-wing press is not the problem; it is the bureaucrats in Brussels and London that are the problem. They bring in laws without considering their effect, not only on the countries where they are brought in as legislation, but on other countries that are affected—particularly in the third world and eastern Europe.

**Eleanor Burnham:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats continue to support this special grant report, as there is little doubt that money is needed. That Wales now has the capacity to process its own fridges, and that the backlog has been dealt with, is good news. I understand that Industrial Plastics Recyclers Ltd in Knighton is one of two processing plants funded through the National Assembly for Wales investment grants scheme and Finance Wales. In an area that struggles to secure quality jobs, this company has increased its labour force significantly, and is set to employ up to 50 people. Many people questioned whether sustainable development would be possible, in theory or in practice: this is an excellent example of sustainable development, as well as of the partnership Government's commitment to it.

**The Minister for Environment (Sue Essex):** I proposed this motion in the forlorn hope that we would not have to go over past ground; I am ever the optimist. Janet and David, you know the story—we have covered it many times. I want to give some hope to Members—we have removed the backlog of the storage of fridges. This will be a problem for a few years, but next year will bring the all-Wales contract, covering virtually all local authorities in Wales. Therefore, some good has come from this. Financially, our support

hanfonid i Affrica lle y caent eu defnyddio gan bobl mewn gwledydd trydydd byd na allent byth fforddio prynu oergelloedd newydd sbon.

Ni ddefnyddir y nwyon CFC sy'n disbyddu'r haen osôn mewn oergelloedd mwyach. Mae'r ddynolryw wedi gwneud popeth o fewn ei gallu, mwy neu lai, i ddileu'r problemau a achosir gan nwyon CFC. O ganlyniad awgryma ymchwil fod yr haen osôn yn adfer erbyn hyn. Mae hynny yn enghraifft dda o'r ffordd na ddylid cyflwyno deddfwriaeth. Gan ddychwelyd at bwynt Janet, nid y wasg asgell dde yw'r broblem; y swyddogion ym Mrwsel a Llundain yw'r broblem. Cyflwynant ddeddfwriaeth heb ystyried ei heffaith, nid yn unig ar y gwledydd lle y'i cyflwynir, ond hefyd ar wledydd eraill yr effeithir arnynt—yn enwedig y trydydd byd a dwyrain Ewrop.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn parhau i gefnogi'r adroddiad grant arbennig hwn, gan nad oes amheuaeth bod angen yr arian hwn. Mae'r ffaith bod gennym y gallu yng Nghymru i brosesu ein hoergelloedd ein hunain, a'r ffaith nad oes ôl-groniad, yn newyddion da. Deallaf fod Industrial Plastics Recyclers Ltd yn Nhrefyclo yn un o'r ddau waith prosesu a ariennir drwy gynllun grantiau buddsoddi Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Chyllid Cymru. Mewn ardal sy'n cael trafferth i sicrhau swyddi o safon, mae'r cwmni hwn wedi cynyddu ei weithlu'n sylweddol, ac mae'n bwriadu cyflogi hyd at 50 o bobl. Mynegodd llawer o bobl amheuaeth a fyddai datblygu cynaliadwy yn bosibl, yn ddamcaniaethol neu'n ymarferol: dyma enghraifft ardderchog o ddatblygu cynaliadwy, yn ogystal ag ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth iddo.

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd (Sue Essex):** Cynigiais y cynnig hwn yn y gobaith ofer na fyddai neb am godi hen hanes; Yr wyf bob amser yn berson gobeithiol. Janet a David, fe wyddoch yr hanes—yr ydym wedi trafod hyn droeon. Yr wyf am roi llygedyn o obaith i'r Aelodau—yr ydym wedi clirio'r ôl-groniad o oergelloedd a oedd yn cael eu storio. Erys yn broblem am ychydig o flynyddoedd, ond y flwyddyn nesaf bwriedir cyflwyno'r contract i Gymru gyfan, a fydd yn cwmpasu bron pob awdurdod lleol yng

for local government is much stronger than in England. We have done our duty by local government, and will continue to do so this coming year. No-one is more committed than me to turning waste to resource, Janet. You saw at the Committee presentation how we are doing that in Wales. It will take some time, but we must all learn together—there is no monopoly on wisdom. I hope that during the next Assembly people will continue to pay the same attention to turning waste to resource as we have done during this Assembly.

Nghymru. Felly, ceir rhyw lygedyn o oleuni. Yn ariannol, mae ein cymorth i lywodraeth leol yn llawer mwy nag yn Lloegr. Yr ydym wedi gofalu am lywodraeth leol, a byddwn yn parhau i wneud hynny yn ystod y flwyddyn i ddod. Nid oes neb yn fwy cefnogol na minnau i droi gwastraff yn adnoddau, Janet. Gwelsoch yn y cyflwyniad i'r Pwyllgor sut yr ydym yn gwneud hynny yng Nghymru. Bydd yn cymryd peth amser, ond rhaid inni oll ddysgu gyda'n gilydd—nid oes neb yn hollwybodus. Gobeithiaf y bydd pobl yn parhau i roi'r un sylw i droi gwastraff yn adnoddau yn ystod y Cynulliad nesaf ag y gwnaethom yn ystod y Cynulliad hwn.

*Cynnig (NDM1383): O blaid 30, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1383): For 30, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

4.20 p.m.

**Cymeradwyo Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) Adroddiad Grant Arbennig  
(Rhif 12) (Cymru) 2002  
Approval of the Local Government Finance (Wales) Special Grant Report  
(No. 12) (Wales) 2002**

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose that

*the National Assembly, under section 88B of the Local Government Finance Act 1988, and in accordance with Standing Order No. 19.8, approves the Local Government Finance (Wales) Special Grant Report (No. 12) (Wales) 2002 which was laid in the Table Office on 25 February 2003. (NDM1384)*

I am pleased to bring forward this special grant report for the Assembly's approval. It distributes an additional £32 million to local education authorities in Wales for improving standards in schools. We want authorities to use this significant amount of additional revenue funding that was set aside in our approved budget for 2003-04 to drive up standards in three ways: by reducing the size of junior classes, by supporting initiatives to improve standards of attainment at key stage 3 and by supporting low-performing schools. This money builds on the special grants that we provided for similar purposes in 2001-02 and 2002-03. The grant for 2003-04 is up £7 million on 2002-03. We have also made a planned provision of £35 million in the budget for 2004-05. Those injections of substantial additional funding should ensure sustained school improvement across the three target areas.

The Welsh Assembly Government remains committed to the reduction of class sizes in primary schools. The introduction of the statutory 30-pupil limit in infant classes has been hugely successful. Infant class sizes in Wales remain at historically low levels. We are determined to see the benefits of smaller class sizes extended to all primary age children and have, uniquely in Wales, made the commitment to tackle junior class sizes. The money provided to authorities over the last two years has already made an impact with the number of junior pupils in classes of over 30 falling from 29 per cent in September

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, o dan adran 88B o Ddeddf Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol 1988, ac yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 19.8, yn cymeradwyo Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) Adroddiad Grant Arbennig (Rhif 12) (Cymru) 2002 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 25 Chwefror 2003. (NDM1384)*

Mae'n bleser gennyf gyflwyno'r adroddiad grant arbennig hwn i'r Cynulliad ei gymeradwyo. Mae'n dosbarthu £32 miliwn ychwanegol i awdurdodau addysg lleol yng Nghymru er mwyn gwella safonau mewn ysgolion. Yr ydym am i'r awdurdodau ddefnyddio'r refeniw sylweddol ychwanegol hwn a neilltuwyd yn ein cyllideb gymeradwy ar gyfer 2003-04 er mwyn codi safonau mewn tair ffordd: drwy leihau maint dosbarthiadau mewn ysgolion cynradd, drwy gefnogi mentrau i wella safonau cyrhaeddiad yn ystod cyfnod allweddol 3 a thrwy gefnogi ysgolion sy'n tangyflawni. Mae'r arian hwn yn ychwanegol at y grantiau arbennig a ddarparwyd gennym at ddibenion tebyg yn 2001-02 a 2002-03. Cynyddodd y grant ar gyfer 2003-04 £7 miliwn o'i gymharu â 2002-03. Gwnaethom ddarpariaeth wedi'i chynllunio o £35 miliwn yn y gyllideb ar gyfer 2004-05. Dylai'r symiau sylweddol ychwanegol hyn sicrhau bod ysgolion yn parhau i wella ar draws y tri maes targed.

Erys Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ymrwymedig i leihau maint dosbarthiadau mewn ysgolion cynradd. Bu'r penderfyniad i gyflwyno terfyn statudol o 30 o ddisgyblion mewn dosbarthiadau babanod yn llwyddiant ysgubol. Mae maint dosbarthiadau babanod yng Nghymru yn is nag erioed. Yr ydym yn benderfynol o estyn manteision dosbarthiadau llai i bob plentyn ysgol gynradd, ac yr ydym wedi gwneud ymrwymiad unigryw yng Nghymru i fynd i'r afael â maint dosbarthiadau cynradd. Mae'r arian a ddarparwyd i'r awdurdodau yn ystod y ddwy flynedd diwethaf eisoes wedi cael

2000 to 17 per cent in September 2002. The target for September 2003, namely the effective elimination of junior classes of over 30 pupils, is ambitious. However, it is achievable given the resources being provided and the general fall in primary school pupil numbers.

The second purpose of this grant is to improve standards at key stage 3. The progress of pupils slows when they transfer from primary to secondary education. I am concerned that improvements in performance levels at key stage 3 between 1997 and 2002 have been limited. That contrasts with considerable improvement made in achievement levels at the end of key stage 2. Authorities and schools have developed important initiatives to improve teaching and learning using the special grant funding provided over the last two financial years. Those need to be sustained and embedded if they are to produce lasting results. The contribution of funding in 2003-04 will allow that to happen.

I am also concerned about the continuing gap in achievement between the best and the least-well performing schools. All authorities now have procedures in place for identifying and supporting under-performing schools. Continued funding will help authorities to ensure that these arrangements function properly and that sufficient resources are available to target the schools in most need. As in previous years, authorities have discretion over how to allocate their grant between the three specified purposes. However, that is more limited than in previous years as a result of new grant conditions designed to ensure that LEAs which still have more than 20 per cent of junior pupils in classes of over 30, give priority to eliminating large junior classes by September 2003 and to ensuring that at least £3 million is spent on assisting the lowest performing schools. Such schools are often in deprived areas and have to deal with additional challenges to significantly change pupil outcomes. That funding will help them to meet those challenges. I commend this

effaith. Gostyngodd nifer y disgyblion cynradd sydd mewn dosbarthiadau o fwy na 30 o blant o 29 y cant ym mis Medi 2000 i 17 y cant ym mis Medi 2002. Mae'r targed ar gyfer Medi 2003, sef dim dosbarthiadau cynradd gyda mwy na 30 o ddisgyblion, yn un uchelgeisiol. Fodd bynnag, mae'n gyraeddadwy o ystyried yr adnoddau a ddarperir a'r gostyngiad cyffredinol yn nifer disgyblion ysgolion cynradd.

Ail bwrpas y grant hwn yw gwella safonau yn ystod cyfnod allweddol 3. Mae datblygiad disgyblion yn arafu ar ôl iddynt drosglwyddo o'r ysgol gynradd i'r ysgol uwchradd. Pryderaf mai ychydig o welliant a gafwyd o ran perfformiad yn ystod cyfnod allweddol 3 rhwng 1997 a 2002. Mae hynny mewn gwrthgyferbyniad â'r gwelliant sylweddol a wnaed o ran cyrhaeddiad ar ddiwedd cyfnod allweddol 2. Mae'r awdurdodau a'r ysgolion wedi datblygu mentrau pwysig i wella addysgu a dysgu gan ddefnyddio arian y grant arbennig a ddarparwyd yn ystod y ddwy flwyddyn ariannol ddiwethaf. Mae angen cynnal a sefydlu'r mentrau hyn er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn dwyn ffrwyth yn yr hirdymor. Bydd cyfrannu arian yn 2003-04 yn fodd i hynny ddigwydd.

Pryderaf hefyd ynglŷn â'r bwlch o ran cyrhaeddiad sy'n bodoli o hyd rhwng yr ysgolion sy'n cyflawni orau a'r ysgolion sy'n cyflawni waethaf. Erbyn hyn mae pob awdurdod wedi rhoi gweithdrefnau ar waith ar gyfer nodi a chefnogi ysgolion sy'n tangyflawni. Bydd arian parhaus yn helpu'r awdurdodau i sicrhau bod y trefniadau hyn yn gweithio'n iawn a bod digon o adnoddau ar gael i dargedu'r ysgolion sydd â'r angen mwyaf. Fel mewn blynyddoedd blaenorol, mae gan awdurdodau ddisgresiwn ynglŷn â'r ffordd y maent yn dyrannu eu grant rhwng y tri phwrpas penodedig. Fodd bynnag, ni chânt yr un rhyddid eleni o gymharu â blynyddoedd blaenorol o ganlyniad i amodau grant newydd sydd â'r nod o sicrhau bod awdurdodau addysg lleol, lle mae dros 20 y cant o ddisgyblion cynradd mewn dosbarthiadau o fwy na 30, yn rhoi blaenoriaeth i gael gwared â dosbarthiadau cynradd mawr erbyn Medi 2003 a sicrhau y caiff o leiaf £3 miliwn ei wario ar gymorth i'r ysgolion â'r perfformiad gwaethaf. Mae'r ysgolion hyn yn aml mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig a chânt heriau

report to Members. It supports the Assembly's key priority of improving school standards. Schools and their pupils will benefit directly from the additional funding.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales supports this special grant report; it would be impossible to vote against this extra funding. However, I take this opportunity to focus on concerns that schools often raise with me on having to depend on special grant reports for work that they consider to be central. Can the Minister tell us more about the process by which she anticipates that this money will be paid to schools? I appreciate that LEAs may do it in different ways, but the smaller primary schools in my constituency find it a burden to have to make bids for specific pots of money. That in itself becomes a pressure on the school, which will deter some—those who perhaps need it most—from making funding applications. While we will support the special grant report, I urge the Minister to reconsider how much money is provided through special grant reports compared to the amount of money that schools know that they can depend on year after year. I welcome the idea of targeting some of the money at schools in more deprived areas. I hope that local authorities follow the Minister's wishes in that regard and also her wish that the majority of the money should be spent in schools. I have concerns as to whether all authorities will do that, but we can only urge them to do so. I urge the Minister to reconsider the amount of money paid through special grants, because of the burden that it places on the schools that need it most.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Minister, I welcome this positive report. Would you welcome the use of this grant to avoid mixed age-group classes, particularly where the arrangement straddles key stage 1 and 2?

ychwanegol i newid canlyniadau disgyblion yn sylweddol. Bydd yr arian hwn yn eu helpu i wynebu'r heriau hynny. Cymeradwyaf yr adroddiad hwn i'r Aelodau. Mae'n cefnogi blaenoriaeth allweddol y Cynulliad i wella safonau ysgolion. Bydd ysgolion a'u disgyblion yn elwa'n uniongyrchol ar yr arian ychwanegol hwn.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Mae Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales yn cefnogi'r adroddiad grant arbennig hwn; byddai'n amhosibl pleidleisio yn erbyn yr arian ychwanegol hwn. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn fanteisio ar y cyfle hwn i ganolbwyntio ar bryderon y mae ysgolion yn aml yn eu codi gyda mi ynglŷn â'u dibyniaeth ar adroddiadau grant arbennig ar gyfer gwaith sy'n hanfodol yn eu barn hwy. A all y Gweinidog ddweud mwy wrthym am y ffordd y mae'n rhagweld y caiff yr arian hwn ei dalu i ysgolion? Derbyniaf y gall awdurdodau addysg lleol wneud hynny mewn ffyrdd gwahanol, ond mae'n faich ar ysgolion cynradd llai o faint yn fy etholaeth i orfod gwneud ceisiadau am symiau penodol o arian. Mae hynny ynddo'i hun yn rhoi pwysau ar yr ysgol, a bydd hynny yn darbwyllo rhai—y rhai â'r angen mwyaf efallai—i beidio â gwneud cais am arian. Er y cefnogwn yr adroddiad grant arbennig, apelïaf ar y Gweinidog i ailystyried sut y darperir llawer o'r arian drwy adroddiadau grant arbennig o gymharu â'r swm o arian y gŵyr ysgolion y gallant ddibynnu arno flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn. Croesawaf y syniad o dargedu'r arian at ysgolion mewn ardaloedd mwy difreintiedig. Gobeithïaf y bydd yr awdurdodau lleol yn gweithredu'n unol â dymuniadau'r Gweinidog yn hynny o beth a hefyd ei dymuniad y dylai'r rhan fwyaf o'r arian gael ei wario mewn ysgolion. Pryderaf na fydd pob awdurdod yn gwneud hynny, ond ni allwn ond apelio arnynt i wneud hynny. Apeliïaf ar y Gweinidog i ailystyried y swm o arian a delir drwy grantiau arbennig, oherwydd y baich a rydd ar yr ysgolion sydd â'r angen mwyaf.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Weinidog, croesawaf yr adroddiad cadarnhaol hwn. A groesawch y defnydd o'r grant hwn i gael gwared â dosbarthiadau oedran cymysg, yn enwedig lle mae'r trefniant yn rhychwantu cyfnod allweddol 1 a 2?

**Eleanor Burnham:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome this special grant report as it provides LEAs with an additional £32 million to help reduce class sizes. It confirms the partnership Government's commitment to education. The partnership Government has increased its support for education in Wales; increased the number of primary and secondary school teachers; increased funding for school buildings and repairs; as well as reintroducing free school milk. However, Minister, as I stated earlier, I am constantly lobbied by headteachers, particularly those in Flintshire, as they have grave concerns about needing more money for school improvements. Will you assure us that you can help, perhaps by discussing the issue with Flintshire County Council? If we say that the money is available, and the headteachers say that they are not receiving it, we must find out where it is going.

**Brian Gibbons:** I welcome this special grant report. We all know that social and economic circumstances are the strongest predictors of educational achievement or disadvantage. This grant will help to address educational disadvantage by reducing class sizes and by providing extra funds for schools with a low performance. In terms of social justice, we know that education is one of the main pathways to a better life for people who live in Wales's most deprived communities. Through promoting education, one of the most important Welsh Assembly Government strategic targets of tackling inequality will be delivered. The Minister deserves credit for the consistent way that she has pursued this policy, from the innovative early-years curriculum through to the Assembly learning grants.

One aspect of this special grant report gives rise to some concern, namely the basis for awarding the grant. I represent the Neath Port Talbot area, where the LEA has invested heavily—well above the Welsh average—in our education system, from nursery through to A-levels. The results of schools in Neath Port Talbot, particularly at GCSE level, show

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn croesawu'r adroddiad grant arbennig hwn gan ei fod yn darparu £2 filiwn ychwanegol i awdurdodau addysg lleol i'w helpu i leihau maint dosbarthiadau. Mae'n cadarnhau ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth i addysg. Mae'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth wedi cynyddu'r cymorth a rydd i addysg yng Nghymru; mae wedi cynyddu nifer yr athrawon ysgol gynradd ac uwchradd; mae wedi cynyddu'r cyllid ar gyfer adeiladau ysgolion a gwaith trwsio; yn ogystal ag ailgyflwyno llaeth ysgol am ddim. Fodd bynnag, Weinidog, fel y nodais yn gynharach, caf fy lobio drwy'r amser gan benaethiaid, yn enwedig penaethiaid yn Sir y Fflint, gan fod pryderon mawr ganddynt ynglŷn â'r angen am arian ar gyfer gwelliannau i ysgolion. A wnewch chi roi sicrwydd inni y gallwch helpu, efallai, drwy drafod y mater gyda Chyngor Sir y Fflint? Os dywedwn ni fod yr arian ar gael, a dywed y penaethiaid nad ydynt yn ei gael, rhaid inni ganfod i ble mae'n mynd.

**Brian Gibbons:** Croesawaf yr adroddiad grant arbennig hwn. Gŵyr pob un ohonom mai amgylchiadau cymdeithasol ac economaidd yw'r ffactorau pwysicaf ar gyfer rhagweld cyrhaeddiad addysgol neu anfantais. Bydd y grant hwn yn helpu i fynd i'r afael ag anfantais addysgol drwy leihau maint dosbarthiadau a thrwy roi arian ychwanegol i ysgolion sy'n cyflawni'n wael. O ran cyfiawnder cymdeithasol, gwyddom mai addysg yw un o'r prif lwybrau tuag at fywyd gwell i bobl sy'n byw yng nghymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig Cymru. Drwy hyrwyddo addysg, caiff un o dargedau strategol pwysicaf Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru sef mynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldeb ei gyflawni. Rhaid rhoi clod i'r Gweinidog am y ffordd gyson y mae wedi dilyn y polisi hwn, o'r cwricwlwm blynyddoedd cynnar arloesol i grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad.

Mae un agwedd ar yr adroddiad grant arbennig hwn yn achosi pryder, sef y sail ar gyfer dyfarnu'r grant. Cynrychiolaf ardal Castell-nedd Port Talbot, lle mae'r AALL wedi buddsoddi llawer—yn llawer uwch na'r cyfartaledd yng Nghymru—yn ein system addysg, o ysgolion meithrin i arholiadau safon uwch. Dengys canlyniadau ysgolion

that they are out-performing expectations, given the social economic mix of pupils at those schools. A fortnight ago I visited Cwrt Sart Comprehensive School in Briton Ferry and I compliment Mr Peter Harrison and his staff on their success. During the visit, Mr Harrison said that the school's achievements for its pupils are compromised by difficulties in maintaining the necessary level of funding to tackle the social disadvantage that exists in the school's catchment area.

4.30 p.m.

However, because Neath Port Talbot is a high-investment area in terms of education, as a result of the high council tax levied on its voters, this causes a double whammy. On one hand, local council tax payers pay a high council tax to fund the excellent system that we have in Neath Port Talbot, but on the other hand we find ourselves potentially ineligible for funding streams, such as this, which are solely based on underperformance. In terms of social justice and equity, it would be much better if a formula were devised to reward schools that deliver excellent results, such as the comprehensive schools in Neath Port Talbot, while recognising the social and democratic mix of the pupils attending those schools.

I have no doubt that Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council and the local education authority will not be unhappy at this special grant, as it is generous. The Minister deserves to be commended for it. However, there is a perverse incentive in this system, and it is important that we do not reward underachievement while failing to reward good achievement.

**Jonathan Morgan:** The Welsh Conservative group will support the payment of £32 million. As Helen Mary Jones has noted, we cannot do much else. However, we also are concerned about the way in which substantial sums of money are continuously allocated through special grant reports. Between 1999 and March 2002, in excess of £101 million was allocated through education special grant

yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot, yn arbennig ar lefel TGAU, eu bod yn cyflawni'n well na'r disgwyl, o ystyried ystod economaidd gymdeithasol y disgyblion yn yr ysgolion hynny. Bythefnos yn ôl ymwelais ag Ysgol Gyfun Cwrt Sart yn Llansawel a chanmolais Mr Peter Harrison a'i staff ar eu llwyddiant. Yn ystod yr ymweliad, dywedodd Mr Harrison fod cyflawniadau'r ysgol dros ei disgyblion yn cael eu rhoi yn y fantol oherwydd anawsterau o ran sicrhau'r lefel o ariannu sydd ei hangen i fynd i'r afael â'r anfantais gymdeithasol a geir yn ardal dalgylch yr ysgol.

Fodd bynnag, gan fod Castell-nedd Port Talbot yn ardal lle mae buddsoddiad mawr mewn addysg, o ganlyniad i'r dreth gyngor uchel a godir ar yr etholwyr, mae ar ei cholled ar ddau gyfrif. Ar y naill law, mae talwyr y dreth gyngor yn lleol yn talu treth gyngor uchel i ariannu'r system ardderchog sydd gennym yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot, ond ar y llaw arall, cawn nad ydym yn gymwys o bosibl i gael arian, megis y grant hwn, sy'n gwbl seiliedig ar dangyflawni. O ran cyfiawnder a thegwch cymdeithasol, byddai'n well pe câi fformiwla ei llunio i wobrwyo ysgolion sy'n cael canlyniadau ardderchog, megis yr ysgolion cyfun yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot, tra'n cydnabod ystod gymdeithasol a democrataidd y disgyblion sy'n mynychu'r ysgolion hynny.

Nid wyf yn tybied y bydd Cyngor Bwrdeistref Castell-nedd Port Talbot yn anfodlon ar y grant arbennig hwn, gan ei fod yn hael. Mae'r Gweinidog yn haeddu clod amdano. Fodd bynnag, mae cymhelliad croes yn y system hon, ac mae'n bwysig nad ydym yn gwobrwyo'r rhai sy'n tangyflawni tra'n methu â gwobrwyo cyflawniad da.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Bydd grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn cefnogi'r taliad o £32 miliwn. Fel y nododd Helen Mary Jones, go brin y gallwn beidio â gwneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, pryderwn hefyd am y ffordd y caiff symiau sylweddol o arian eu dyrannu o hyd drwy adroddiadau grant arbennig. Rhwng 1999 a Mawrth 2002, dyrannwyd dros £101 miliwn drwy adroddiadau grant arbennig addysg.

reports. That is a substantial amount of money. The Minister will, no doubt, trumpet the fact that the money increases every year. However, schools have difficulties because mainstream budgets do not increase at the same level as the annual increases in the education budget announced by the Minister. Every year, schools must bid for money. They must go through a bidding process, and that is becoming difficult and bureaucratic. They want to see money put into mainstream budgets.

While this money is useful, it is not the first time that money has been allocated for this purpose. There have been at least two other special grant reports where money has been allocated for the same aims and objectives. Schools want to see the money mainstreamed into their budgets, so that they can determine how best to spend that money to meet the National Assembly's aspirations. This will not assist those schools in Wales, either here in Cardiff or in Flintshire, that face substantial budget cuts either in this or the next financial year. This money will not help them out of the hole in which they will find themselves. Many of those schools, particularly those in Cardiff, will have to sack teachers in order to meet local authority spending cuts from 2004. Therefore, while this money is useful and welcome, it is not being directed at schools in the right way.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I am somewhat surprised that, in the third year in which we have delivered special grant reports, both opposition spokespeople do not seem to understand how they are delivered and used in schools. The money is not delivered by way of a bidding process; it is specifically targeted. We had much positive response to our previous special grant reports, which brought infant class sizes down to 30 or less. We have now made a commitment to achieve the same with junior class sizes, as it makes good educational sense. Clearly, you cannot allocate a certain amount of money to all schools if you want to reduce junior class sizes. You allocate the money to the schools that have junior class sizes of more than 30. It

Mae hynny'n swm mawr. Bydd y Gweinidog, mae'n siŵr, yn pwysleisio'r ffaith bod yr arian yn cynyddu bob blwyddyn. Fodd bynnag, caiff ysgolion anawsterau am nad yw'r cyllidebau prif ffrwd yn cynyddu ar yr un lefel â'r cynnydd blynyddol yn y gyllideb addysg a gyhoeddir gan y Gweinidog. Bob blwyddyn, rhaid i ysgolion wneud cais am arian. Rhaid iddynt fynd drwy broses ymgeisio, ac mae hynny'n mynd yn anodd a biwrocraataidd. Maent am weld yr arian yn cael ei roi i gyllidebau prif ffrwd.

Er bod yr arian hwn yn ddefnyddiol, nid dyma'r tro cyntaf i arian gael ei ddyrannu at y diben hwn. Bu o leiaf ddau adroddiad grant arbennig arall lle y dyrannwyd arian at yr un nodau ac amcanion. Mae ysgolion am weld yr arian yn cael ei ddyrannu i'w cyllidebau prif ffrwd, fel y gallant benderfynu ar y ffordd orau o wario'r arian hwnnw i gyflawni dyheadau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Ni fydd hyn o gymorth i'r ysgolion hynny yng Nghymru, naill ai yma yng Nghaerdydd neu yn Sir y Fflint sy'n wynebu toriadau sylweddol yn eu cyllidebau naill ai yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol hon neu'r un nesaf. Ni fydd yr arian hwn yn eu helpu i ddod allan o'r twll y byddant ynddo. Oherwydd toriadau yng ngwariant awdurdodau lleol o 2004, bydd rhaid i lawer o'r ysgolion hyn, yn enwedig y rhai yng Nghaerdydd, ddiswyddo athrawon. Felly, er bod yr arian hwn yn ddefnyddiol, ac yn dderbyniol, nid yw'n cael ei gyfeirio at ysgolion yn y ffordd gywir.

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Synnaf braidd, yn y drydedd flwyddyn o ddarparu adroddiadau grant arbennig, at y ffaith nad yw llefarwyr y ddwy wrthblaid yn deall yn ôl pob golwg sut y cânt eu darparu a'u defnyddio mewn ysgolion. Ni ddarperir yr arian drwy gyfrwng proses ymgeisio; caiff ei dargedu'n benodol. Ymatebodd llawer yn gadarnhaol i'n hadroddiadau grant arbennig blaenorol, a fu'n fodd i ostwng maint dosbarthiadau babanod i 30 neu lai. Yr ydym bellach wedi gwneud ymrwymiad i wneud yr un peth o ran maint dosbarthiadau cynradd, gan fod hynny'n gwneud synnwyr yn addysgol. Yn amlwg, ni ellwch ddyrannu swm penodol o arian i bob ysgol os ydych am leihau maint dosbarthiadau cynradd. Yr ydych yn



is, therefore, targeted money. The same applies in terms of key stage 3 improvements. Some authorities—we are using the normal allocation formula across authorities—have small junior class sizes, so they would not use this money to reduce junior class sizes; they would, in fact, like to see some of their junior class sizes increase. Therefore, the money can also be used to improve key stage 3 performance. Although that performance is not improving as quickly as we would like, the achievements are increasing year on year, as the chief inspector of schools has confirmed.

This year, for the first time, we are investing the £3 million into focusing on schools because Estyn had previously noted that while LEAs do a great deal to support school improvement, they do not generally target enough resources on schools most in need. Brian's examples are the exception rather than the rule, because some LEAs in Wales have specifically targeted resources and have worked closely with the schools. The 'Narrowing the Gap in the Performance of Schools' project identified a number of schools that, in partnership with the LEAs, saw performance increase year on year above cohort expectation. That is what we want for the whole of Wales. This year, we are asking that local authorities use their share of the £3 million to give priority to those secondary schools with fewer than 35 per cent of pupils attaining five A\* to C at GCSE, and to primary and secondary school, which have more than 10 per cent of pupils eligible for free school meals, but which are in the lower quartile of every school band as regards pupil outcomes. We are putting in place a specific deprivation grant this year, because we have identified time and again in Committee that we need additional resources to tackle deprivation.

On mixed age groups, Gwenda, the chief inspector has specifically said that there is nothing wrong with mixed-age teaching, provided that the teachers are fully able to

dyrannu'r arian i'r ysgolion cynradd y mae ganddynt ddsbarthiadau sy'n cynnwys mwy na 30 o ddisgyblion. Arian wedi'i dargedu ydyw, felly. Mae hynny'n wir am welliannau yn ystod cyfnod allweddol 3. Mewn rhai awdurdodau—yr ydym yn defnyddio'r fformiwla ddyrannu arferol, ar draws awdurdodau—ceir dosbarthiadau cynradd bach, felly ni fyddent yn defnyddio'r arian hwn i leihau maint dosbarthiadau cynradd; yn wir, hoffent weld rhai o'r dosbarthiadau cynradd yn cynyddu. Felly, gellir defnyddio'r arian hefyd i wella perfformiad yn ystod cyfnod allweddol 3. Er nad yw'r perfformiad hwnnw'n gwella cyn gyflymed ag y dymunem, mae'r cyflawniadau'n cynyddu flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn, ac mae hynny wedi ei gadarnhau gan y prif arolygydd ysgolion.

Eleni, am y tro cyntaf, yr ydym yn buddsoddi'r £3 miliwn er mwyn canolbwyntio ar ysgolion gan fod Estyn wedi nodi'n flaenorol, er bod yr AALI yn gwneud cryn dipyn i gefnogi gwelliannau mewn ysgolion, nad ydynt yn gyffredinol yn targedu digon o adnoddau at ysgolion â'r angen mwyaf. Eithriad yw'r enghreifftiau a nodwyd gan Brian, am fod rhai AALI yng Nghymru wedi targedu adnoddau'n benodol ac maent wedi cydweithio'n agos â'r ysgolion. Nododd y prosiect 'Cau'r Bwlch ym Mherfformiad Ysgolion' nifer o ysgolion, a oedd, mewn partneriaeth â'r AALI, wedi gwella eu perfformiad flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn yn uwch na'r disgwyl ar gyfer eu carfan. Dyna'r hyn a ddymunwn i Gymru gyfan. Eleni, yr ydym yn gofyn i awdurdodau lleol ddefnyddio'u cyfran o'r £3 miliwn i roi blaenoriaeth i'r ysgolion uwchradd lle mae llai na 35 y cant o'r disgyblion yn cael pum TGAU gradd A\* i C, ac i'r ysgolion cynradd ac uwchradd lle mae dros 10 y cant o'r disgyblion yn gymwys i gael cinio ysgol am ddim, ond sydd yn y pedwarant isaf ar gyfer pob band ysgol o ran canlyniadau disgyblion. Yr ydym yn rhoi grant amddifadedd penodol ar waith eleni, gan ein bod wedi nodi dro ar ôl tro yn y Pwyllgor fod angen inni roi adnoddau ychwanegol i fynd i'r afael ag amddifadedd.

O ran grwpiau oedran cymysg, Gwenda, nododd y prif arolygydd yn benodol nad oes dim byd o'i le ar addysg oedran cymysg, ar yr amod y gall yr athrawon ddiwallu

deal with the needs of the range of ages in their classes. There are many good examples of it. My own children were educated in mixed-age classes with four age groups in just two classes in primary school. That is the norm in Wales because we have so many small schools. There is nothing intrinsically wrong in mixed-age teaching compared with straight year teaching. The issue is always about the quality of delivery. When people make comparisons with budgets in England, they must consider section 52, which takes account of all the expenditure in Wales per pupil head, and compare it with the expenditure in England per pupil head. The last figures we have, demonstrate that if you take London out of the equation—because it is not comparable to any other part of England or Wales—the average spend in Wales was £3,134 per head against £3,095 in England. I repeat that 9.2 per cent is a good settlement. We are in that febrile time of budget setting inside local government, but we can hold our heads high and say that we have put additional investment into education, and the figures stack up in terms of pupil spend.

We are also introducing statutory budget forums, which will ensure that there is a proper dialogue between our local authorities and their schools on specific costs. That must also always take account of future costs. These specific grants have been effective. They have brought infant class sizes down, they have brought junior class sizes down—a Wales-only policy—they are improving achievement at key stage 3, and our achievement across the board last year was good. These grants are delivering. I spend a great deal of time with teachers in schools and in conferences, and people welcome this additional money being targeted on specific initiatives because they can see exactly what it is delivering.

**Gareth Jones:** Yr ydym yn falch o glywed bod y gwariant yng Nghymru ychydig yn well nag yn Lloegr. Fodd bynnag, canlyniad y dull hwn o ariannu yw bod gwahaniaeth

anghenion yr ystod oedran yn eu dosbarthiadau yn llawn. Ceir sawl enghraifft dda. Cafodd fy mhlant fy hun addysg mewn dosbarthiadau oedran cymysg lle y cafodd pedwar grŵp oedran eu haddysgu mewn dau ddosbarth yn yr ysgol gynradd. Mae hynny'n beth arferol yng Nghymru am fod gennym gymaint o ysgolion bach. Nid oes dim byd o'i le ar addysg oedran cymysg o'i chymharu ag addysg yn ôl blwyddyn yn unig. Yr hyn sydd o bwys bob amser yw ansawdd yr addysg a ddarperir. Pan fydd pobl yn cymharu cyllidebau yn Lloegr, rhaid iddynt ystyried adran 52, sy'n cynnwys holl wariant fesul disgybl yng Nghymru a'i gymharu â gwariant fesul disgybl yn Lloegr. Yn ôl y ffigurau diweddaraf sydd gennym, os nad ydych yn cynnwys Llundain—am nad yw'n debyg i unrhyw ran arall o Gymru na Lloegr—gwerir ar gyfartaledd £3,134 y pen yng Nghymru o gymharu â £3,095 yn Lloegr. Dywedaf drachefn fod 9.2 y cant yn setliad da. Yr ydym ar ganol y cyfnod gwyllt hwnnw pan gaiff cyllidebau eu pennu mewn llywodraeth leol, ond gallwn ddal ein pennau'n uchel a dweud ein bod wedi gwneud buddsoddiad ychwanegol mewn addysg, ac mae'r ffigurau'n dangos hynny o ran gwariant fesul disgybl.

Yr ydym hefyd yn cyflwyno fforymau cyllideb statudol, a fydd yn sicrhau bod dialog priodol rhwng ein hawdurdodau lleol a'u hysgolion ynglŷn â chostau penodol. Rhaid i hynny bob amser ystyried costau yn y dyfodol hefyd. Bu'r grantiau penodol hyn yn effeithiol. Maent wedi llwyddo i leihau maint dosbarthiadau babanod, maent wedi lleihau maint dosbarthiadau cynradd—polisi i Gymru yn unig—maent yn gwella cyflawniad yn ystod cyfnod allweddol 3, ac yr oedd ein cyflawniad yn gyffredinol y llynedd yn dda. Mae'r grantiau hyn yn gwneud gwahaniaeth. Treuliaf gryn dipyn o amser yng nghwmni athrawon mewn ysgolion ac mewn cynadleddau, ac mae pobl yn croesawu'r ffaith bod yr arian ychwanegol hwn yn cael ei dargedu at fentrau penodol gan y gallant weld beth yn union y mae'n ei gyflawni.

**Gareth Jones:** We are pleased to hear that the spending in Wales is a little higher than it is in England. However, the result of this funding system is that there is a great deal of

dybryd yng ngwariant y pen yn ôl y disgybl o un awdurdod i'r llall drwy Gymru. Mae hynny'n creu anfantais i rai disgyblion mewn rhai ysgolion ac awdurdodau. Oni chredwch ei bod yn hen bryd inni ystyried y sefyllfa hon? Dylid sicrhau bod arian craidd ar gael ar gyfer pob ysgol er mwyn iddynt wybod lle maent yn sefyll, yn hytrach na chael gwahaniaeth dybryd rhwng awdurdodau, sy'n creu sefyllfa loteri?

variation in the spending per pupil from one authority to the next throughout Wales. That creates a disadvantage for some pupils in some schools and local authorities. Do you not believe that it is high time that we consider this situation? Core funding should be available for every school so that they know where they stand, rather than having great variation between authorities, which creates a lottery situation?

4.40 p.m.

**Jane Davidson:** We have discussed this many times, and your comments interest me as I did not think that your party wanted to see funding distributed centrally. Local authorities are responsible for that funding, and their responsibilities in terms of the educational needs of their areas are related to a range of issues, such as school transport, special educational needs, the number of schools and pupils in an area, and the physical condition of schools. That is why funding must be determined locally. We are considering substantial investment in our children in Wales.

**Jane Davidson:** Yr ydym wedi trafod hyn droeon, ac mae eich sylwadau'n ddiddorol imi gan fy mod yn meddwl nad oedd eich plaid am weld cyllid yn cael ei ddyrannu'n ganolog. Yr awdurdodau lleol sy'n gyfrifol am y cyllid hwnnw, ac mae eu cyfrifoldebau o ran anghenion addysgol eu hardaloedd yn ymwneud ag ystod o faterion, megis cludiant ysgol, anghenion addysgol arbennig, nifer yr ysgolion a'r disgyblion mewn ardal, a chyflwr ysgolion. Dyna pam y mae'n rhaid penderfynu ar gyllid yn lleol. Yr ydym yn ystyried buddsoddiad sylweddol yn ein plant yng Nghymru.

*Cynnig (NDM1384): O blaid 35, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1384): For 35, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan

Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Tir Gofal (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003 Approval of the Tir Gofal (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003**

**The Deputy First Minister and Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad (Michael German):** I propose that

*the National Assembly considers the principle of the Tir Gofal (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003 laid in the Table Office on 25 February 2003. (NDM1381)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly approves that the Tir Gofal (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003 is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 25 February 2003. (NDM1382)*

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Bydd y newidiadau i'r ddeddfwriaeth a gynigir heddiw yn hwyluso gallu ffermwyr, gobeithio, i ymuno â chynllun Tir Gofal. Credaf fod pob un ohonom yn derbyn bod y cynllun hwn yn eithriadol o bwysig o ran dyfodol amaethyddiaeth. Mae'n bwysig i gynifer o ffermwyr â phosibl allu ymuno â'r cynllun amaeth-amgylcheddol hwn. Bu pryder ynglŷn â'r ffaith mai dim ond rhai mathau o ffermydd a allai wneud hynny. Ond y mae'r newidiadau hyn yn mynd ran o'r ffordd, o leiaf, at hwyluso gallu ffermydd eraill i ymuno.

Mae'n sylfaenol bwysig bod mwy o arian ar gael ar gyfer y cynllun hwn. Mae modd gwneud hynny drwy drosglwyddo arian o biler 1 i biler 2. Mae pob plaid yn y Cynulliad yn derbyn yr egwyddor honno, a gobeithiaf ein bod yn symud tuag ati. Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhaid gwarantu bod arian ychwanegol ar gael o'r Trysorlys. Rhaid i'r

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor (Michael German):** Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Tir Gofal (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 25 Chwefror 2003. (NDM1381)*

Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Tir Gofal (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 25 Chwefror 2003. (NDM1382)*

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** The changes to the legislation proposed today will hopefully facilitate the ability of farmers to join the Tir Gofal scheme. I believe that we all accept that this scheme is extremely important in terms of the future of agriculture. It is important that as many farmers as possible can join this agri-environmental scheme. There has been concern about the fact that only some types of farms could do so. However, these changes go part of the way, at least, towards making it easier for other farms to join.

It is of fundamental importance that more funding should be available for this scheme. That can be done by transferring money from pillar 1 to pillar 2. That principle is supported by all parties in the Assembly, and I hope that we are moving towards that. However, we must ensure that additional money is available from the Treasury. The additional

arian ychwanegol a ddaw o Ewrop fod y swm mwyaf sydd ar gael. Mae trafferthion o ran hynny hyd y gwelaf, gan fod modd, yn sicr yn ardaloedd Amcan 1, i'r arian ychwanegol o Ewrop fod hyd at 70 y cant o'r cyfanswm sydd ar gael. Nid yw hynny'n bosibl ar hyn o bryd oherwydd bod y swm o arian a fu ar gael i Gymru gan Ewrop yn draddodiadol mor isel. Collodd cynlluniau fel hyn filiynau o bunnoedd dros y blynyddoedd oherwydd hynny. Mae'n rhaid i ni nodi'n glir mai'r rheswm dros hynny yw cytundeb Fontainebleau a'r ffaith bod Llywodraethau Ceidwadol rhwng 1979 ac 1997 wedi ceisio ad-daliad gan Ewrop yn hytrach na buddsoddi arian Ewropeaidd mewn cynlluniau fel hwn. Mae'r economi wledig ac amaethyddiaeth wedi talu'n ddrud iawn am hynny. Gobeithio bod modd trafod y setliad gan Ewrop eto o fewn y trafodaethau sy'n cael eu cynnal ar hyn o bryd ar ddiwygio'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin. Mae'n rhaid i ni sylweddoli y gwnaed colledion mawr, a derbyn hynny.

Yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd y newidiadau hyn yn hwyluso'r ffordd i ffermwyr ymuno â'r cynllun pwysig hwn ac y gall y Gweinidog neilltuo mwy o arian iddo. Gobeithiaf hefyd y gwnaiff ymladd achos Cymru er mwyn dadwneud y drwg a wnaethpwyd gan Lywodraethau Ceidwadol rhwng 1979 ac 1997 o ran y mater hollbwysig hwn i'r economi wledig.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I am pleased to welcome these proposals to simplify and improve this successful scheme as they will cut red tape for farmers, who lobby me hard. There has been considerable demand for Tir Gofal, as we know, and these measures will help to spread its benefits more widely and ease some of the bureaucratic burdens on farmers.

money from Europe must be the largest sum available. There are problems with that as far as I can see, because it is possible, certainly in Objective 1 areas, for the additional European funding to be up to 70 per cent of the total available. That is not currently possible because the sum of money traditionally available from Europe for Wales has been so small. Schemes such as this have lost millions of pounds over the years because of that. We must note clearly that that has been caused by the Fontainebleau agreement and the fact that Conservative Governments between 1979 and 1997 tried to secure a rebate from Europe rather than investing European funding in schemes such as this. The rural economy and agriculture have paid a heavy price for that. I hope that we can discuss the settlement from Europe again within the current discussion on reforming the common agriculture policy. We must realise that great losses have been incurred, and accept that

I hope that these changes will make it easier for farmers to join this important scheme and that the Minister can commit more funding to it. I also hope that he will fight Wales's corner to undo the harm done by Conservative Governments between 1979 and 1997 in terms of this vital issue for the rural economy.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae'n dda gennyf groesawu'r cynigion hyn i symleiddio a gwella'r cynllun llwyddiannus hwn gan y bydd yn lleihau biwrocratiaeth i ffermwyr, sy'n fy lobio yn daer. Bu cryn alw am Tir Gofal, fel y gwyddom, a bydd y mesurau hyn yn helpu i estyn ei fanteision yn ehangach a lleddfdu rhai o'r beichiau biwrocraidaidd ar ffermwyr.

**Glyn Davies:** We support these regulation changes; they will enhance an excellent scheme. Tir Gofal has the potential to transform Wales's image; I do not believe that we have fully cashed in on that. I supported the principles that now form the basis of Tir Gofal when they were first introduced under other agri-environment schemes some 15 years ago. It is an excellent scheme and its biggest potential is in building bridges between those who live and work in rural areas and those who have become more distant in their understanding of what underpins living in a rural area. The Tir Gofal principle has great potential for rebuilding bridges. It can also greatly benefit Wales's wildlife, particularly if we develop it to deal with group applications. Mick Bates raised the possibility yesterday—or at least I raised it with him and he agreed—of group membership applications for canals or rivers, or in valleys where the economic and environmental benefits can be maximised. Its other benefit is in delivering access. Access is a controversial issue but Tir Gofal can deliver access on a voluntary basis, often in places where people want to walk. It has tremendous potential, but these benefits cannot all be delivered within the existing budget.

Much of what Rhodri Glyn Thomas said was difficult to decipher—it was gibberish, with one or two sensible pieces in the middle where he said that the Minister must maximise the budget. I criticise the Minister for not recycling modulated moneys to Tir Gofal as quickly as he might have done. If there is one scheme under the rural affairs budget that he should maximise—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas** *rose*—

**Glyn Davies:** I am not giving way to you because of your contribution. If there is one area, in terms of Assembly budgets, in which you should maximise funds, it is in promoting Tir Gofal.

**Janet Ryder:** I will not repeat how important

**Glyn Davies:** Cefnogwn y newidiadau hyn i'r rheoliadau; byddant yn gwella cynllun sydd eisoes yn un ardderchog. Mae gan Tir Gofal y potensial i drawsnewid delwedd Cymru; ni chredaf ein bod wedi manteisio i'r eithaf ar hynny. Cefnogais yr egwyddorion sydd bellach yn sail i Tir Gofal pan gawsant eu cyflwyno gyntaf o dan gynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol eraill tua 15 mlynedd yn ôl. Mae'n gynllun ardderchog a'r potensial mwyaf yw ei allu i bontio rhwng pobl sy'n byw ac yn gweithio mewn ardaloedd gwledig a phobl sydd wedi colli rhywfaint o ddealltwriaeth o'r hyn sy'n sylfaen i fyw mewn ardal wledig. Mae gan egwyddor Tir Gofal botensial mawr i ailbontio. Gall hefyd fod yn fuddiol iawn i fywyd gwylt Cymru, yn enwedig os byddwn yn ei ddatblygu i ymdrin â cheisiadau gan grwpiau. Cododd Mick Bates y posibilrwydd ddoe—neu o leiaf codais hynny gydag ef a chytunodd â mi—o geisiadau am aelodaeth grŵp ar gyfer camlesi neu afonydd, neu mewn cymoedd lle y gellir sicrhau'r manteision economaidd ac amgylcheddol mwyaf posibl. Mantais arall sydd ganddo yw ei fod yn rhoi mynediad. Mae mynediad yn bwnc dadleuol ond gall Tir Gofal fod yn fodd i roi mynediad ar sail wirfoddol, yn aml mewn mannau lle mae pobl yn dymuno cerdded. Mae ganddo botensial mawr iawn, ond ni ellir gwireddu hynny i gyd o fewn y gyllideb gyfredol.

Yr oedd llawer o'r hyn a ddywedodd Rhodri Glyn Thomas yn anodd ei ddeall—sothach ydoedd, gydag ambell ddarn synhwyrol yn y canol lle y dywedodd fod yn rhaid i'r Gweinidog sicrhau'r gyllideb fwyaf posibl. Beirniadaf y Gweinidog am beidio â defnyddio arian wedi ei fodwleiddio ar gyfer Tir Gofal cyn gynted ag y gallai fod wedi gwneud. Os oes un cynllun o dan gyllideb materion gwledig y dylai ei ddatblygu'n llawn—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas** *a gododd*—

**Glyn Davies:** Nid ildiaf ichi oherwydd eich cyfraniad. Os oes un maes, o ran cyllidebau'r Cynulliad, lle y dylech roi'r cyllid mwyaf posibl, hyrwyddo Tir Gofal ydyw.

**Janet Ryder:** Ni ddywedaf eto pa mor

this scheme is to farmers. Does the Minister share my concern for tenant farmers who want to access the scheme but who need their landlords' consent? Will the Minister consider their situation and see what can be done to help them access this scheme?

**The Deputy First Minister and Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad (Michael German):** I thank Members for their comments. I support and welcome most of the comments relating to the regulations. Those who spoke more generally of Tir Gofal mentioned pillar 2 funding—[*Interruption.*]

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. There are about six different conversations taking place. I want to hear what the Minister has to say.

**Michael German:** The other issue— [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Where is he?']

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order.

**Michael German:** I am glad that the Conservatives are in favour of a new debating Chamber so that they can see me. Perhaps they can vote that way rather than shout about it. Pillar 2 is one of the most important issues facing Wales and I am glad that this Government has succeeded in convincing the UK Government of that.

bwysig yw'r cynllun hwn i ffermwyr. A yw'r Gweinidog yn rhannu fy mhryder ynglŷn â ffermwyr sy'n denantiaid sydd am ymuno â'r cynllun ond y mae angen caniatâd eu landlordiaid arnynt? A wnaiff y Gweinidog ystyried eu sefyllfa a gweld beth y gellir ei wneud i'w helpu i ymuno â'r cynllun?

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor (Michael German):** Diolchaf i'r Aelodau am eu sylwadau. Cefnogaf a chroesawaf y rhan fwyaf o'r sylwadau ynglŷn â'r rheoliadau. Soniodd y rhai a siaradodd yn fwy cyffredinol am Tir Gofal am arian piler 2—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae tua chwe gwahanol sgwrs yn cael eu cynnal. Yr wyf am glywed yr hyn y mae'r Gweinidog am ei ddweud.

**Michael German:** Y mater arall yw— [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'Ble mae ef?']

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn.

**Michael German:** Yr wyf yn falch bod y Ceidwadwyr o blaid Siambr ddadlau newydd er mwyn iddynt gael fy ngweld. Efallai y gallant bleidleisio dros hynny yn hytrach na gweiddi amdano. Mae piler 2 yn un o'r materion pwysicaf a wyneba Cymru ac yr wyf yn falch o nodi bod y Llywodraeth hon wedi llwyddo i ddarbwyllio Llywodraeth y DU o hynny.

*Cynnig (NDM1381): O blaid 30, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1381): For 30, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John

Gibbons, Brian  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Gareth  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

4.50 p.m.

*Cynnig (NDM1382): O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1382): For 29, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Gareth  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*



## Dadl Fer Short Debate

### Gweithio ar Draws Ffiniau Cross-border Working

**Karen Sinclair:** I have agreed that Ann Jones, Eleanor Burnham and Janet Davies can contribute, as time permits.

Devolution has given us the chance to develop uniquely Welsh policies. Since the birth of the Assembly, Labour has developed many distinct policies to benefit people in Wales: long may we continue to do so. However, we should never develop different policies for the sake of it and we need to ensure that people in Wales never lose the advantage that close cross-border working has to offer.

Twelve hundred years on, Offa's Dyke is a wonderful tourist attraction, but has become all but invisible for much of its length. The same can be said of the Wales-England border, in the eyes of those who live along it. Nowhere is this truer than in north-east Wales. Catch the train from Rhyl to Chester and you will see a harmonious integrated area of economic activity. Historically, Wrexham, Flintshire and west Cheshire have evolved to form a population of about half a million people who are culturally and financially linked.

When Wales plays England, there are never divided loyalties, especially when it comes to rugby. However, in many ways the people of Wrexham and Flintshire have far more in common with the north-west of England than with the rest of Wales. We look towards Chester, Liverpool and Manchester, rather than Cardiff, as our big cities. My neighbours in Llangollen travel each morning to work in Chester, Manchester and the Wirral. However, this is not a one-way street. The interaction is reciprocal. Many travel to work from England to Wales each day: to Airbus UK at Broughton, to our schools and to our hospitals. We travel to Chester, Shrewsbury or Manchester sometimes for our shopping needs, and this is a two-way interaction that generates revenue for our tourism industry. I am told that Wrexham welcomes shoppers

**Karen Sinclair:** Cytunais y gall Ann Jones, Eleanor Burnham a Janet Davies gyfrannu, os bydd amser yn caniatáu.

Mae datganoli wedi rhoi cyfle inni ddatblygu polisiau sy'n unigryw i Gymru. Ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad, mae Llafur wedi datblygu llawer o bolisiau unigryw er budd pobl Cymru: boed inni barhau i wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, ni ddylem byth ddatblygu polisiau gwahanol er mwyn bod yn wahanol ac mae angen inni sicrhau na fydd pobl yng Nghymru byth yn colli'r fantais sy'n deillio o weithio ar draws ffiniau.

Ddeuddeg canrif yn ddiweddarach, mae Clawdd Offa yn atyniad gwych i dwristiaid, ond mae wedi mynd yn anweladwy bron ar hyd y rhan fwyaf ohono. Gellir dweud yr un peth am y ffin rhwng Cymru a Lloegr, yng ngolwg y rhai sy'n byw ar hyd-ddi. Nid oes man gwell i weld hynny nag yn y Gogledd-ddwyrain. Os daliwch y trê'n o'r Rhyl i Gaer fe welwch un ardal integredig gytûn o weithgaredd economaidd. Yn hanesyddol, mae Wrecsam, Sir y Fflint a gorllewin Sir Gaer wedi datblygu yn boblogaeth o ryw hanner miliwn o bobl sydd â chysylltiadau diwylliannol ac ariannol.

Pan fydd Cymru yn chwarae yn erbyn Lloegr, nid oes byth unrhyw amheuaeth ynghylch pa dîm a gefnogir, yn enwedig o ran rygbi. Fodd bynnag, ar sawl cyfrif mae gan bobl Wrecsam a Sir y Fflint lawer mwy yn gyffredin â gogledd-orllewin Lloegr na gweddill Cymru. Ystyriwn Gaer, Lerpwl a Manceinion, yn hytrach na Chaerdydd, fel ein dinasoedd mawr. Mae fy nghymdogion yn Llangollen yn teithio bob bore i weithio yng Nghaer, Manceinion a Chilgwri. Fodd bynnag, nid llwybr unffordd mohono. Daw eraill o'r cyfeiriad arall. Mae llawer yn teithio o Loegr i Gymru bob dydd: i Airbus UK ym Mrychdwn, i'n hysgolion a'n hysbytai. Teithiwn i Gaer, Amwythig neu Fanceinion weithiau i siopa, ac mae'r cysylltiadau dwyffordd hyn yn creu refeniw i'n diwydiant twristiaeth. Dywedwyd wrthyf fod siopwyr o

from as far afield as Chester and Manchester, and our new pedestrianised shopping area attracts people from great distances. The ripple effect from these visitors means that the benefits of this cross-border pollination spread westward. In many areas, cross-border working makes sense for the people of north-east Wales.

With today's advances in highly specialised medicine, we must foster our centres of excellence. Unfortunately, we lack the population density to sustain such centres in north Wales for many specialist services—but not all. Indeed, we can be justifiably proud of our new cancer facility at Ysbyty Glan Clwyd. However, for many other specialist services, we have access to the excellent services in Liverpool, Gobowen and Manchester. We should always seek the best solution to a problem, regardless of geographical boundaries. The people of north-east Wales need us to develop the best methods of working to suit their needs. They are not interested in political or ideological squabbling. I welcome the children's hospital being built in Cardiff. However, let us not be under any illusions; this will be a children's hospital for south Wales, not a children's hospital for Wales. We in north Wales already have access to excellent services at Alder Hey, in Liverpool. Given the choice of an hour in an ambulance to Alder Hey or a three-and-a-half hour trek to south Wales, I know which one I would choose. This is an example of developing services according to need, and not according to lines on maps. The Labour-led Assembly is working hard to ensure that the people of Wales receive the best service, regardless of administrative borders.

These principles also hold true for education. Centres of excellence in further and higher education depend on cross-border working. Welsh students and educational institutions in Wales have always benefited from this two-way travel of students and we need to continue to foster this. For example, looking at a Wales-only map, the North East Wales Institute of Higher Education's closest

leoedd mor bell i ffwrdd â Chaer a Manceinion yn dod i Wrecsam, ac mae ein hardal siopa newydd i gerddwyr yn denu pobl o bell. Mae effaith ehangach yr ymwelwyr hyn yn golygu bod manteision y cyfnewid trawsffiniol hwn yn ymestyn tua'r gorllewin. Mewn sawl ardal, mae gweithio ar draws ffiniau yn gwneud synnwyr i bobl y Gogledd-ddwyrain.

O gofio'r datblygiadau diweddaraf ym maes meddygaeth arbenigol iawn, rhaid inni feithrin ein canolfannau rhagoriaeth. Yn anffodus, nid oes gennym ddigon o boblogaeth i gynnal canolfannau o'r fath yn y Gogledd ar gyfer nifer o'r gwasanaethau arbenigol—ond nid pob un. Yn wir, gallwn ymfalchïo yn ein cyfleuster canser newydd yn Ysbyty Glan Clwyd. Fodd bynnag, ar gyfer llawer o wasanaethau arbenigol eraill, gallwn ddefnyddio'r gwasanaethau rhagorol yn Lerpwl, Gobowen a Manceinion. Dylem bob amser geisio dod o hyd i'r ateb gorau i broblem, waeth beth fo'r ffiniau daearyddol. Mae pobl y Gogledd-ddwyrain angen inni ddatblygu'r dulliau gorau posibl o weithio er mwyn diwallu eu hanghenion. Nid oes ganddynt ddiddordeb mewn dadleuon gwleidyddol neu ideolegol. Croesawaf y penderfyniad i adeiladu ysbyty i blant yng Nghaerdydd. Fodd bynnag, gadewch inni beidio â thwylo ein hunain; ysbyty i blant yn y De fydd yr ysbyty hwn, nid ysbyty i blant Cymru. Yr ydym ni yn y Gogledd eisoes yn defnyddio'r gwasanaethau ardderchog yn ysbyty Alder Hey, yn Lerpwl. O gael y dewis rhwng taith awr mewn ambiwlans i ysbyty Alder Hey neu daith tair awr a hanner i'r De, gwn pa un a ddewiswn. Mae hon yn enghraifft o ddatblygu gwasanaethau yn ôl yr angen, ac nid yn ôl ffiniau ar fapiau. Mae'r Cynulliad o dan arweiniad Llafur yn gweithio'n galed i sicrhau y caiff pobl Cymru y gwasanaeth gorau, waeth beth fo'r ffiniau gweinyddol.

Mae'r egwyddorion hyn yn wir hefyd am addysg. Mae canolfannau rhagoriaeth ym maes addysg bellach ac uwch yn dibynnu ar weithio ar draws y ffiniau. Mae myfyrwyr o Gymru a sefydliadau addysgol yng Nghymru wedi elwa erioed ar y traffig dwyffordd o fyfyrwyr ac mae angen inni barhau i feithrin hyn. Er enghraifft, o edrych ar fap o Gymru yn unig, ymddengys mai Prifysgol Cymru,

neighbour seems to be the University of Wales, Bangor. However, look at the whole picture and you will see that there are 14 other higher education establishments that are closer to NEWI: in Manchester, Chester, Liverpool and even Wolverhampton. Almost half of NEWI's students are from outside Wales, and around 40 per cent of Welsh students, my son included, choose to attend establishments in Wales.

NEWI however is finding life increasingly difficult under the cross-border rules relating to the Higher Education Funding Council for England and the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales. This is not a new problem relating to devolution. It goes back to the history of the two funding councils, but it is now exacerbated by the growing reputation of NEWI and the clear drive in certain areas for NEWI to be involved in initiatives in England. NEWI's activity in England would in many instances bring money back into Wales, encouraging students from England to study in Wales, and lecturers in further education colleges to send their students to Wales.

It will never be in Wales's interest to hamper this reciprocal flow of students. It is about choice and it is about delivering. Since 1999, it has also been about additionality. Through the Assembly learning grant, Wales's most needy students can access additional financial help wherever they choose to study in the UK. Devolution is about delivering extra benefits to those people in Wales, and it should never lead to us losing out. North-east Wales's rising prosperity is heavily interlinked with the economy of the north-west of England. In contrast to south Wales, there is no physical divide along our border. A myriad of toll-free roads, including the A55, carry a steady stream of two-way traffic between Wales and England every day. People travel each way for work and for pleasure. To those making these journeys the border is almost invisible, and most definitely irrelevant.

As I have already stated, many people who live in north-east Wales commute each day to England. Some have moved to Wales to

Bangor yw cymydog agosaf Sefydliad Addysg Uwch Gogledd-Ddwyrain Cymru. Fodd bynnag, edrychwch ar y darlun cyfan ac fe welwch fod 14 o sefydliadau addysg uwch eraill sy'n agosach at NEWI: ym Manceinion, Caer, Lerpwl a hyd yn oed Wolverhampton. Daw bron hanner myfyrwyr NEWI o'r tu allan i Gymru, ac mae tua 40 y cant o fyfyrwyr o Gymru, fy mab yn eu plith, yn dewis mynychu sefydliadau yng Nghymru.

Fodd bynnag mae anawsterau NEWI ar gynnydd o dan y rheolau trawsffiniol sy'n ymwneud â Chyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Lloegr a Chyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru. Nid yw hon yn broblem newydd sydd wedi codi yn sgîl datganoli. Mae a wnelo â hanes y ddau gyngor cyllido, ond mae'r sefyllfa yn gwaethygu erbyn hyn oherwydd enw da cynyddol NEWI a'r symbyliad amlwg mewn rhai meysydd i NEWI fod yn rhan o fentrau yn Lloegr. Byddai gweithgaredd NEWI yn Lloegr mewn sawl maes yn dod ag arian yn ôl i Gymru, yn annog myfyrwyr o Loegr i astudio yng Nghymru ac yn annog darlithwyr mewn colegau addysg bellach i anfon eu myfyrwyr i Gymru.

Ni fydd byth yn fuddiol i Gymru i rwystro'r llif dwyffordd hwn o fyfyrwyr. Mae'n ymwneud â dewis a hefyd cyflawni. Ers 1999, mae hefyd wedi ymwneud ag ychwanegedd. Drwy grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad, gall myfyrwyr mwyaf anghenus Cymru gael cymorth ariannol ychwanegol lle bynnag y dewisant astudio yn y DU. Nod datganoli yw rhoi mwy o fanteision i bobl yng Nghymru, ac ni ddylai byth beri inni fod ar ein colled. Mae ffyniant cynyddol y Gogledd-ddwyrain yn gysylltiedig iawn ag economi gogledd-orllewin Lloegr. Yn wahanol i'r De, nid oes rhaniad ffisegol ar hyn ein ffin. Ceir llif parhaus o draffig dwyffordd rhwng Cymru a Lloegr bob dydd ar hyd lluo o ffyrdd di-doll, gan gynnwys yr A55. Mae pobl yn teithio i'r naill gyfeiriad a'r llall ar gyfer gwaith a phleser. I'r rhai sy'n gwneud y teithiau hyn mae'r ffin bron yn anweladwy, ac yn sicr mae'n amherthnasol.

Fel y nodais eisoes, mae llawer o bobl sy'n byw yn y Gogledd-ddwyrain yn teithio i'w gwaith yn Lloegr bob dydd. Mae rhai wedi

enjoy the beautiful scenery, some for the lower house prices. Despite the recent vocal protests by small minority groups in Wales, I am convinced that this cross-border interaction brings many economic benefits to Wales. For the most part, cross-border commuters are high-earners, and by living in Wales they will spend this income in Wales, supporting local shops and services and contributing through their council taxes.

The Cheshire and north-east Wales liaison group meets quarterly. It is an active group that meets to discuss many of the cross-border issues that I have mentioned. The group consists of senior representatives from Wrexham, Flintshire, Cheshire and Chester City authorities and aims to consider the wider implications of all developments in the region. It is currently working towards a joint economic development strategy to complement the report being produced by the north Wales economic forum.

Transport remains the most literal example of cross-border interaction. As in other areas, we need to maintain needs-driven policies and services in transport. In the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee's review of public transport, we considered establishing an all-Wales passenger transport association. I am pleased to say that we concluded that this would not offer any additional benefits over regional arrangements; I believe it would have been detrimental.

The proposed Wales and borders franchise is an excellent example of the Assembly delivering according to the needs of the people of Wales. The franchise has been shaped to reflect our travel patterns rather than blindly following lines on a map. It brings together the services we use throughout Wales into one cohesive whole. These are not necessarily contained within Wales. There is the much-celebrated free bus pass for pensioners and disabled people in Wales. That is another shining example of additionality. You may not be aware that these passes are also valid for travel from

symud i Gymru er mwyn mwynhau'r golygfeydd hardd, rhai oherwydd prisiau tai is. Er gwaethaf y gwrthwynebiadau croch yn ddiweddar gan grwpiau lleiafrifol bach yng Nghymru, yr wyf yn argyhoeddedig y daw llawer o fanteision economaidd i Gymru yn sgîl y cysylltiadau trawsffiniol hyn. Ar y cyfan, mae'r cymudwyr dros y ffin yn ennill cyflogau da, a thrwy fyw yng Nghymru, byddant yn gwario'r incwm hwn yng Nghymru, gan gefnogi siopau a gwasanaethau lleol a chyfrannu at eu treth yngor.

Mae grŵp cydlynu Caer a'r Gogledd-ddwyrain yn cyfarfod bob chwarter. Mae'n grŵp gweithgar sy'n cyfarfod i drafod llawer o'r materion trawsffiniol a grybwyllais. Mae'r grŵp yn cynnwys uwch gynrychiolwyr o awdurdod Wrecsam, Sir y Fflint, Sir Gaer a Dinas Caer. Ei nod yw ystyried goblygiadau ehangach pob datblygiad yn y rhanbarth. Ar hyn o bryd mae'n gweithio tuag at strategaeth datblygu economaidd ar y cyd i ategu'r adroddiad y mae fforwm economaidd Gogledd Cymru yn ei lunio.

Erys trafndiaeth yn un o'r enghreifftiau mwyaf llythrennol o gysylltiadau ar draws ffiniau. Fel mewn meysydd eraill, mae angen inni gael polisiâu a gwasanaethau ym maes trafndiaeth sydd wedi'u llywio gan angen. Yn adolygiad Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth, bu inni ystyried sefydlu cymdeithas trafndiaeth teithwyr i Gymru gyfan. Yr wyf yn falch o ddweud inni ddod i'r casgliad na fyddai'n cynnig unrhyw fanteision ychwanegol o'i chymharu â threfniadau rhanbarthol; credaf y byddai wedi bod yn niweidiol.

Mae'r fasnachfaint arfaethedig i Gymru a'r gororau yn enghraifft ardderchog o'r Cynulliad yn darparu yn ôl anghenion pobl Cymru. Lluniwyd y fasnachfaint i ystyried ein patrymau teithio yn hytrach na dilyn yn slafaid ffiniau ar fap. Mae'n dwyn ynghyd y gwasanaethau a ddefnyddiwn ledled Cymru yn un fasnachfaint gydlynol. Nid yw'r rhain o reidrwydd ar dir Cymru. Ceir hefyd docyn bws am ddim i bensiynwyr a phobl anabl yng Nghymru, y bu cryn groeso iddo. Dyma enghraifft wych arall o ychwanegedd. Efallai nad ydych yn ymwybodol bod y tocynnau bws hyn hefyd yn ddilys i deithio o Gymru i

Wales into England.

Loegr.

5.00 p.m.

Again, the Assembly is delivering a service that reflects Welsh people's needs, rather than being limited to self-imposed barriers. The concept of additionality is at the heart of Welsh Labour's policy objectives in the Assembly. Older people in Wales benefit from winter fuel allowances and free bus passes. Young people benefit from the New Deal, but in Wales they can also access the Assembly learning grant. Businesses seeking to invest in Wales will enjoy the same low interest rates as the rest of the UK, but can also access structural funds and Assembly investment grants that are unique to Wales.

Unwaith eto, mae'r Cynulliad yn darparu gwasanaeth sy'n ystyried anghenion pobl Cymru, yn hytrach na chael ei gyfyngu gan rwystrau a osodwyd ganddo ef ei hun. Cysyniad ychwanegedd sydd wrth amcanion polisi Llafur Cymru yn y Cynulliad. Mae pobl hŷn yng Nghymru yn elwa ar y lwfans tanwydd gaeaf a thocynnau bws am ddim. Mae pobl ifanc yn elwa ar y Fargen Newydd, ond yng Nghymru gallant hefyd wneud cais am grant dysgu'r Cynulliad. Caiff busnesau sydd am fuddsoddi yng Nghymru yr un cyfraddau llog isel â gweddill y DU, ond gallant hefyd wneud cais am gronfeydd strwythurol a grantiau buddsoddi'r Cynulliad sydd yn unigryw i Gymru.

There are many other examples of the Assembly's delivering additional benefits to the people of Wales. Prescription charges are lower in Wales than in England and have been scrapped for those aged under 25. We have introduced free dental checks for those aged under 25 and for those aged over 60 and scrapped testing for seven-year-olds. The latest digital hearing aids are now available on the NHS across Wales—a full three years ahead of England, and neonatal hearing screening will be launched tomorrow.

Ceir sawl enghraifft arall o fanteision ychwanegol a roddir i bobl Cymru gan y Cynulliad. Mae taliadau presgripsiynau yn is yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr ac yr ydym wedi'u dileu ar gyfer pobl o dan 25 oed. Yr ydym wedi cyflwyno archwiliadau deintyddol am ddim ar gyfer pobl o dan 25 oed a thros 60 oed ac wedi dileu profion ar gyfer plant saith oed. Mae'r cymhorthion clyw digidol diweddaraf ar gael gan y GIG ar draws Cymru bellach—tair blynedd lawn o flaen Lloegr, a chaiff profion sgrinio clyw ar gyfer babanod newydd-anedig eu lansio yfory.

The Welsh Assembly Government has demonstrated that it can deliver additional benefits for the people of Wales while remaining mindful of the historic and deeply rooted interdependence between Wales and England. We must continue to develop our policies to reflect the needs of the people of Wales and to nurture our partnerships with the rest of the UK. We must never be tempted to draw down the borders and forge a separatist path to fulfil misjudged ideological agendas. Historically and post devolution, the relationship between England and Wales always has been, and should remain, one of interdependence and not independence.

Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi dangos y gall roi manteision ychwanegol i bobl Cymru tra'n ystyried y gyd-ddibyniaeth hanesyddol a dwfn rhwng Cymru a Lloegr. Rhaid inni barhau i ddatblygu ein polisïau i ystyried anghenion pobl Cymru a meithrin ein partneriaethau â gweddill y DU. Ni ddylem byth gael ein tentio i gau'r ffiniau a mynd ar drywydd ymwahanol er mwyn cyflawni agendâu ideolegol cyfeiliornus. Yn hanesyddol ac ers datganoli, mae'r berthynas rhwng Cymru a Lloegr erioed wedi bod yn un o gyd-ddibyniaeth ac nid annibyniaeth, a dylai barhau felly.

**Ann Jones:** I thank you, Karen, for raising this important subject. I am sure that you will

**Ann Jones:** Diolch ichi, Karen, am godi'r pwnc pwysig hwn. Yr wyf yn siŵr y

agree that devolution is a shared commitment to Wales and to the rest of the UK. It combines the capacity to provide Welsh solutions to distinctive Welsh problems with a strength that comes from being part of the United Kingdom: proud to be Welsh and glad to be British also. As we debate in the Chamber, we must remember the correct policies to tackle Welsh problems and that we share with England a long porous border that carries two-way traffic, which, as you demonstrated in your short debate, we need to understand and not condemn.

I want to share some of my recollections of when we were campaigning for the establishment of the Assembly. I recall many people from the former county of Clwyd asking what the impact would be on them. Those people were worried about whether they would be cut off from the neighbouring economies of Cheshire and Lancashire and their relationship with Merseyside. As you have said, many now think that they have had to close down those barriers. Therefore, those who seek to separate Wales from the rest of the UK need to explain to workers at Broughton, manufacturing workers in Saint Athan and retail workers in Wrexham why they care more about cutting off Wales from Britain and putting jobs at risk than defending the thousands of jobs that a British Labour Government is delivering for Wales.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You have had one and a half minutes. You need to wind up.

**Ann Jones:** In a world that is becoming ever more interdependent, what disfigures Wales is not the border with England but the poverty that only a Labour Government can, and will, eradicate.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I thank Karen for allowing me to contribute. I agree that we need to continue to build on the vibrant cross-border activities in north Wales. Before I came to the Assembly, I was privileged to be a candidate in the general election in Chester. The strong links with Wales were brought home to me at that time.

On transport, I am impressed with Taith,

cytunwch fod datganoli yn ymrwymiad a rennir i Gymru ac i weddill y DU. Mae'n cyfuno'r gallu i roi atebion Cymreig i broblemau sy'n unigryw i Gymru â'r nerth a ddaw o fod yn rhan o'r Deyrnas Unedig: yn falch o fod yn Gymry ac yn falch o fyw ym Mhrydain hefyd. Wrth inni gynnal dadleuon yn y Siambur, rhaid inni gofio'r polisïau cywir i fynd i'r afael â phroblemau Cymru a'r ffaith ein bod yn rhannu ffin hir, hawdd ei chroesi, a groesir o'r naill gyfeiriad neu'r llall â Lloegr, y mae angen inni ei deall ac nid ei chondemnïo, fel yr ydych wedi dangos yn eich dadl fer.

Hoffwn rannu rhai o'm hatgofion o'n hymgyrch dros sefydlu'r Cynulliad. Cofiaf lawer o bobl o hen sir Clwyd yn gofyn imi pa effaith a gâi arnynt hwy. Pryderai'r bobl hynny pa un a gâi'r cysylltiad rhyngddynt hwy ac economi gyfagos Sir Gaer a Sir Gaerhirfryn a'u perthynas â Glannau Merswy eu torri. Fel y dywedaso, erbyn hyn mae llawer yn meddwl y bu'n rhaid iddynt gau'r rhwystrau hynny. Felly, mae angen i'r rhai sydd am rannu Cymru oddi wrth weddill y DU esbonio i'r gweithwyr ym Mrychdwn, y gweithwyr gweithgynhyrchu yn Sain Tathan a'r gweithwyr manwerthu yn Wrecsam pam y mae torri'r cysylltiad rhwng Cymru a Phrydain a rhoi swyddi yn y fantol yn bwysicach iddynt hwy na diogelu'r miloedd o swyddi y mae'r Llywodraeth Lafur Brydeinig yn eu creu ar gyfer Cymru.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Cawsoch funud a hanner. Mae angen ichi ddirwyn i ben.

**Ann Jones:** Mewn byd sy'n dod yn fwyfwy cyd-ddibynnol, yr hyn sy'n aflunio Cymru yw nid y ffin â Lloegr, ond y tlodi y gall dim ond Llywodraeth Lafur ei ddileu ac y bydd yn ei ddileu.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Diolchaf i Karen am roi cyfle imi gyfrannu. Cytunaf fod angen inni barhau i adeiladu ar y gweithgareddau trawsffiniol bywiog yn y Gogledd. Cyn imi ddod i'r Cynulliad, cefais y fraint o fod yn ymgeisydd yn yr etholiad cyffredinol yng Nghaer. Daeth y cysylltiadau cryf â Chymru yn amlwg imi bryd hynny.

O ran trafndiaeth, mae Taith, a fu'n rhan o

which has been involved in the Economic Development Committee's discussions on the possibilities of the all-Welsh franchise, which it now strongly supports. Education issues and the NHS have been mentioned. Environmental matters, such as flood management in the Dee valley, are also cross-border issues. That flood management scheme is hugely important to us in Rosset, as is the Deeside Industrial Park to which others have referred. I make particular mention of the Cheshire north-east Wales liaison group, which does a wonderful job.

As Assembly Members, we must continue to act almost as missionaries in north Wales on behalf of the Assembly. We need to continue to engage with the media so that those in north-east Wales can understand the benefits of the Assembly. I commend you on this debate, Karen.

**Janet Davies:** This is an important subject because working with other countries is crucial for peace and prosperity. That is obviously true about England, as our legislation is almost the same, and it is particularly true in relation to the economy and the environment. However, there are other borders, notably our sea border with Ireland. In west Wales, this border is of great economic importance. Ireland and Wales also share a cultural background, and we spend holidays in each other's countries. Ireland needs routes through Wales for its exports, and surface access to the European Union.

Physical borders are easily recognised but others also exist. Spiritual and cultural borders can unite or divide. The Assembly has an understanding with Silesia, which is struggling to overcome pollution and dependence on old heavy industry, as we were forced to do. We learn from each other and from places such as Hainault in Belgium and the Ruhr in Germany, in seeing how they have worked through their industrial changes.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You have run out of time.

**The Business Minister (Carwyn Jones):** I congratulate Karen on her mature approach to

drafodaethau'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ar fasnachfaint bosibl i Gymru gyfan, a gefnogir yn frwd ganddo bellach, wedi gwneud argraff arnaf. Cyfeiriwyd at addysg a'r GIG. Mae materion amgylcheddol, megis rheoli llifogydd yn nyffryn Dyfrdwy, hefyd yn rhai trawsffiniol. Mae'r cynllun rheoli llifogydd yn bwysig tu hwnt inni yn yr Orsedd Goch, fel y mae Parc Diwydiannol Glannau Dyfrdwy, y cyfeiriodd eraill ato. Hoffwn sôn yn benodol am grŵp cydlynu Sir Gaer a gogledd-ddwyrain Cymru, sy'n gwneud gwaith rhagorol.

Fel Aelodau Cynulliad, rhaid inni barhau i fod yn genhadon bron yn y Gogledd ar ran y Cynulliad. Mae angen inni barhau i gysylltu â'r cyfryngau fel y gall pobl yn y Gogledd-ddwyrain ddeall manteision y Cynulliad. Fe'ch cymeradwyaf am y ddadl hon, Karen.

**Janet Davies:** Mae hwn yn bwnc pwysig am fod cydweithio â gwledydd eraill yn hollbwysig o ran heddwch a ffyniant. Mae hynny'n amlwg yn wir am Loegr, gan fod ein deddfwriaeth bron yr un peth, ac mae'n sicr yn wir mewn perthynas â'r economi a'r amgylchedd. Fodd bynnag, ceir ffiniau eraill, yn benodol ein ffin forol ag Iwerddon. Yn y Gorllewin, mae'r ffin hon yn bwysig iawn yn economaidd. Mae Iwerddon a Chymru hefyd yn rhannu cefndir diwylliannol, ac yr ydym yn treulio ein gwyliau yng ngwledydd ein gilydd. Mae angen llwybrau drwy Gymru ar Iwerddon ar gyfer ei hallforion, a mynediad dros y tir i'r Undeb Ewropeaidd.

Mae'n hawdd adnabod ffiniau ffisegol ond ceir mathau eraill o ffiniau. Gall ffiniau ysbrydol a diwylliannol uno neu rannu. Mae gan y Cynulliad ddealltwriaeth â Silesia, sy'n cael anhawster i oresgyn llygredd a'i dibyniaeth ar hen ddiwydiannau trwm, fel y bu raid inni ei wneud. Yr ydym yn dysgu oddi wrth ein gilydd ac o leoedd megis Hainault yng Ngwlad Belg a Dyffryn Ruhr yn yr Almaen, drwy weld sut y maent hwy wedi ymdopi â'u newidiadau diwydiannol.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae eich amser ar ben.

**Y Trefnydd (Carwyn Jones):** Llongyfarchaf Karen ar ei dull aeddfed o ystyried y ffordd

the consideration of how government best works in the modern world. Real life cannot be packaged into distinct and separate units of Government and administration. All borders are artificial constructions: some are constructions of physical geography and others are of the mind. Just as men and women have good reason to create borders, there are just as good reasons to work across those borders.

Since 1997, the British Labour Party has taken truly historic steps to fundamentally change the nature of the British state. It was the most centralised state in the modern world—certainly in modern Europe, bar France possibly—and we have taken major steps towards its decentralisation and modernisation. The first step was to create the National Assembly for Wales, the Northern Ireland Assembly and the Scottish Parliament; English regional assemblies will probably follow. In the NHS, we are continuing to promote the spirit of decentralisation and we have taken care to encourage the role of local authorities in Wales.

Karen said that we must decentralise government in Wales, but we must also learn to work across the borders that we have created as human beings. Ten years ago, the Harvard Business School professor Rosabeth Moss Kanter wrote *When Giants Learn to Dance*. She analysed the need for the giant business corporations of the twentieth century to break up and decentralise in the twenty-first century, releasing the energy and innovative potential of their constituent parts. However, she also argued that, as quickly as we break up bureaucracies, so we must build bridges between the newer and smaller entities that are created. That is what devolution is all about.

**Janet Davies:** It is not controversial, but I am sure that you would agree that working with people from other cultures and religions, and with those who speak other languages, is crucial in developing awareness, understanding and respect for both our differences and our common humanity?

**Carwyn Jones:** Yes, but we must be careful

orau y gall llywodraeth weithio yn y byd modern. Ni ellir rhannu bywyd go iawn yn unedau penodol ac ar wahân o Lywodraeth a gweinyddiaeth. Mae pob ffin yn wneuthuredig: caiff rhai eu creu gan ddaeryddiaeth ffisegol a chaiff eraill eu creu ym meddyliau pobl. Fel y mae gan bobl resymau da dros greu ffiniau felly mae rhesymau cystal dros weithio ar draws y ffiniau hyn.

Ers 1997, mae Plaid Lafur Prydain wedi cymryd camau gwirioneddol hanesyddol i newid natur hanfodol y wladwriaeth Brydeinig. Prydain oedd y wladwriaeth fwyaf canolog yn y byd modern—yn sicr yn Ewrop fodern, heblaw Ffrainc o bosibl—ac yr ydym wedi cymryd camau breision tuag at ei datganoli a'i moderneiddio. Y cam cyntaf oedd creu Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, Cynulliad Gogledd Iwerddon a Senedd yr Alban; yn eu tro, daw cynulliadau rhanbarthol yn Lloegr yn fwy na thebyg. Yn y GIG, yr ydym yn parhau i annog ysbryd datganoli ac wedi cymryd pob gofal i hybu rôl awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru.

Dywedodd Karen fod yn rhaid inni ddatganoli llywodraeth yng Nghymru, ond rhaid inni hefyd ddysgu gweithio ar draws y ffiniau yr ydym wedi'u creu fel pobl. Ddeng mlynedd yn ôl, ysgrifennodd yr Athro Rosabeth Moss Kanter o Ysgol Fusnes Harvard *When Giants Learn to Dance*. Dadansoddodd yr angen i gorfforaethau busnes enfawr yr ugeinfed ganrif ymddatod a datganoli yn yr un unfed ganrif ar hugain, gan ryddhau egni eu rhannau cyfansoddol a'u potensial i arloesi. Fodd bynnag dadleuodd hefyd fod yn rhaid inni bontio rhwng yr endidau newydd a llai o faint a grëwyd cyn gyflymed ag yr ydym yn chwalo biwrocratiaethau. Dyna hanfod datganoli.

**Janet Davies:** Nid yw'n ddadleuol, ond yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch fod gweithio gyda phobl o ddiwylliannau a chrefyddau eraill a phobl sy'n siarad ieithoedd eraill yn hollbwysig i feithrin ymwybyddiaeth, dealltwriaeth a pharch tuag at ein gwahaniaethau a'n dynoliaeth gyffredin?

**Carwyn Jones:** Cytunaf, ond rhaid inni fod



not to bolster borders that do not exist or create boundaries that are not already there. That is important in Wales, and elsewhere in Europe.

In the mid 1990s, unitary authorities were created in Wales. As they were so small, it was expected that they would work across their borders. We expect local authorities to plan transportation across the whole of north Wales or urban south Wales. We expect them to collaborate around economic development and to identify economic objectives. We also expect them to share specialist facilities when there is an economic case for doing so.

The Assembly should follow that example. Working in partnership is a sign of confidence. If there is one thing that we have lacked for many years in Wales, it is confidence. We should not fear our neighbours, we should seek to work with them. We should not fear the fact that people seek to live in Wales and work in England, or vice versa. We should welcome that; in an increasingly interdependent world, it is natural for economies to be tied in this way.

For too many years in Wales, we have chased our own shadows, and have thought of ourselves as a people constantly under threat who must constantly defend themselves. We should move away from those shadows and start looking at ourselves as a modern, vibrant democracy that is confident enough to stand up and be counted, certainly among the devolved administrations of Britain, and carve a mark in Europe. However, that does not mean that we should put up borders or create divisions where such divisions do not exist, as that is a sign of a lack of confidence and, in some ways, immaturity.

5.10 p.m.

We should not see the fact that we have a large country, England, on our doorstep as something to fear, but as something to exploit, frankly. The English economy, its large cities, such as Manchester and Liverpool, and its towns and cities on our borders, such as Shrewsbury and Bristol, can provide markets for our goods. They provide tourists who come to and spend money in

yn ofalus i beidio ag atgyfnerthu ffiniau nad ydynt yn bodoli neu greu ffiniau newydd. Mae hynny'n bwysig yng Nghymru, ac yng ngweddill Ewrop.

Yng nghanol y 1990au, crëwyd awdurdodau unedol yng Nghymru. Gan eu bod mor fach, disgwyliid iddynt weithio ar draws eu ffiniau. Disgwyliwn i awdurdodau lleol gynllunio trafniadaeth ar draws y Gogledd i gyd neu ardaloedd trefol y De i gyd. Disgwyliwn iddynt gydweithredu o ran datblygu economaidd a nodi amcanion economaidd. Disgwyliwn iddynt hefyd rannu cyfleusterau arbenigol pan fo rheswm economaidd dros wneud hynny.

Dylai'r Cynulliad ddilyn yr esiampl honno. Mae gweithio mewn partneriaeth yn arwydd o hyder. Os bu un peth y buom yn brin ohono yng Nghymru am flynyddoedd lawer, hyder yw hwnnw. Ni ddylem ofni ein cymdogion, dylem geisio gweithio gyda hwy. Ni ddylem ofni'r ffaith bod pobl am fyw yng Nghymru a gweithio yn Lloegr, neu fel arall. Dylem groesawu hynny; mewn byd sy'n gynyddol gyd-ddibynnol, mae'n naturiol i economïau fod ynghlwm wrth ei gilydd yn y ffordd hon.

Ers gormod o flynyddoedd yng Nghymru, yr ydym wedi bod yn ofnus, ac wedi ystyried ein hunain yn genedl o dan fygythiad parhaus y mae'n rhaid iddi ei hamddiffyn ei hun o hyd. Dylem beidio â bod mor ofnus a dechrau ystyried ein hunain yn ddemocratiaeth fodern, fywiog sy'n ddigon hyderus i sefyll dros ein hegwyddorion, yn sicr ymhlith gweinyddiaethau datganoledig Prydain a gwneud marc yn Ewrop. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny yn golygu y dylem greu ffiniau neu ymraniadau lle na cheir ymraniadau o'r fath, gan fod hynny'n arwydd o ddiffyg hyder, ac mewn sawl ffordd, anaeddfedrwydd.

Ni ddylem ystyried y ffaith bod gwlad fawr, sef Lloegr, drws nesaf inni, yn rhywbeth i'w ofni, ond yn rhywbeth i'w ddefnyddio, a bod yn onest. Gall economi Lloegr, ei dinasoedd mawr, megis Manceinion a Lerpwl, ei threfi a'i dinasoedd ar y gororau, megis Amwythig a Bryste, fod yn farchnadoedd i'n nwyddau. Gallant ddarparu twristiaid sy'n dod i Gymru ac yn gwario arian yma. Maent yn darparu

Wales. They provide jobs, so that people can work in England and still live in Wales. We should welcome that, not be afraid of it. It is a natural part of progress, and helps us to maintain our identity, while also accepting that we have to live and make our way in the world.

It is also important to realise that, while we create bridges across the UK, we should also seek to build them with Europe. We cannot, on the one hand, argue that we should work in partnership across Britain and on the other fail to do the same in Europe. It is exceptionally important for Wales to work in conjunction with our partners in the rest of Europe.

We should have the confidence to recognise the reality of the economic links between north-east Wales and north-west England, and south-east Wales and south-west England. As we continue our investment in the Heads of the Valleys road, we will enhance our links with the Midlands. We should not be afraid to tell investors that Cardiff is only 90 minutes from Heathrow, as that helps to attract investment into Wales. Being close to a large international airport—and 90 minutes is close, in international terms—is a selling point and not something to be afraid of. We need only consider what can be achieved when cross-border and cross-boundary working is effective to realise that. The border between England and Wales is invisible; it is a political boundary without physical features. The border between Northern Ireland and the Republic of Ireland is invisible; it is a creation of the mind and has no physical features. It is a line drawn on a map.

Consider Northern Ireland and the Republic of Ireland. That is a state boundary, and not a national boundary as between Wales and England. The links between the towns on both sides of the border are clear, between Newry and Dundalk, between Lifford and Strabane, between the west bank of the river Foyle and the city of Derry and the towns surrounding it, which are in the republic. For many years, there was no cross-border working and, as a result, the economies of both countries suffered. Northern Ireland was

swyddi, fel y gall pobl weithio yn Lloegr a byw yng Nghymru o hyd. Dylem groesawu hynny, nid ei ofni. Mae'n rhan naturiol o gynnydd, ac yn ein helpu i gadw ein hunaniaeth, tra'n derbyn hefyd fod yn rhaid inni fyw a dod ymlaen yn y byd.

Mae hefyd yn bwysig sylweddoli, tra yr ydym yn creu pontydd ar draws y DU, y dylem hefyd geisio pontio gydag Ewrop. Ni allwn, ar y naill law, ddadlau y dylem weithio mewn partneriaeth ar draws Prydain ac ar y llall, beidio â gwneud yr un peth yn Ewrop. Mae'n hynod bwysig bod Cymru yn gweithio mewn cydweithrediad â'n partneriaid yng ngweddill Ewrop.

Dylem fod yn ddigon hyderus i adnabod realiti'r cysylltiadau economaidd rhwng gogledd-ddwyrain Cymru a gogledd-orllewin Lloegr, a de-ddwyrain Cymru a de-orllewin Lloegr. Wrth inni barhau â'n buddsoddiad yn ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd, byddwn yn gwella ein cysylltiadau â Chanolbarth Lloegr. Ni ddylem betruso rhag dweud wrth fuddsoddwyr mai dim ond taith 90 munud o Heathrow yw Caerdydd, gan fod hynny yn helpu i ddenu buddsoddiad yng Nghymru. Mae bod yn agos at faes awyr rhyngwladol mawr—ac mae 90 munud yn agos, o safbwynt rhyngwladol—yn atyniad ac nid yn rhywbeth i'w ofni. Er mwyn sylweddoli hynny nid oes angen inni ond ystyried yr hyn y gellir ei gyflawni pan geir cydweithio effeithiol ar draws ffiniau. Mae'r ffin rhwng Cymru a Lloegr yn anweladwy; mae'n ffin wleidyddol heb nodweddion ffisegol. Mae'r ffin rhwng Gogledd Iwerddon a Gweriniaeth Iwerddon yn anweladwy; mae'n ffin a grëir gan bobl ac nid oes unrhyw nodweddion ffisegol iddi. Mae'n llinell a dynnwyd ar fap.

Gadewch inni ystyried Gogledd Iwerddon a Gweriniaeth Iwerddon. Dyma ffin wladwriaethol ac nid ffin genedlaethol fel sydd rhwng Cymru a Lloegr. Mae'r cysylltiadau rhwng y trefi ar y naill ochr a'r llall i'r ffin yn amlwg, rhwng Newry a Dundalk, rhwng Lifford a Strabane, rhwng glan orllewinol afon Foyle a dinas Derry a'r trefi o'i hamgylch, sydd yn y weriniaeth. Am flynyddoedd lawer, ni fu unrhyw weithio ar draws y ffin ac, o ganlyniad, dioddefodd economïau'r ddwy wlad. Yr oedd Gogledd

a long way behind the rest of the UK, and the economy of the Republic of Ireland bumped along as it had done for 30 or 40 years after independence. In the early 1990s, the dividend of Objective 1 in the Republic of Ireland and the peace dividend in Northern Ireland became clear. People working together, establishing links, has been encouraged, not just between Northern Ireland and the Republic of Ireland, but between communities in Northern Ireland, which is one of the most divided societies in Europe. Where there is partnership among different areas of Belfast city, and between towns in Northern Ireland and the Republic of Ireland, the dividends can be seen. Northern Ireland is currently benefiting from an economic drive in the Republic of Ireland, particularly in the east.

My message is clear: when people work together across boundaries—no matter how insurmountable those boundaries may be and, in the case of Northern Ireland and the Republic of Ireland, it was an armed boundary until around five or six years ago—people will prosper. If people seek to ignore each other, do not work together, and seek out boundaries and divisions, they will not prosper.

**Kirsty Williams:** Carwyn will be aware that, as I represent Brecon and Radnorshire, I have the constituency with probably the longest geographical border between England and Wales. Many of my constituents seek services across the border, particularly NHS services. Do you think that it is acceptable for a hospital in Wales to tell GPs in my constituency that it would not admit a patient with a postcode beginning with 'HR'—an English postcode? Will you work with your colleague, the Minister for Health and Social Services, to find out why that Welsh hospital took the decision not to admit a Welsh citizen because, on the basis of the 'HR' at the beginning of their postcode, they were perceived to live in England?

**Carwyn Jones:** There are no bars, as far as I am aware, to people crossing the border to receive health treatment. Many people from

Iwerddon cryn dipyn ar ei hôl hi o gymharu â gweddill y DU, ac yr oedd economi Gweriniaeth Iwerddon yn rhygnu ymlaen fel y gwnaeth am 30 neu 40 mlynedd ar ôl annibyniaeth. Ar ddechrau'r 1990au, daeth effaith Amcan 1 yn y Weriniaeth a heddwch yng Ngogledd Iwerddon yn amlwg. Anogwyd pobl i gydweithio, i sefydlu cysylltiadau, nid yn unig rhwng Gogledd Iwerddon a Gweriniaeth Iwerddon, ond rhwng cymunedau o fewn Gogledd Iwerddon, sydd yn un o'r cymunedau mwyaf rhanedig yn Ewrop. Lle ceir partneriaeth ymhlith gwahanol rannau o ddinas Belfast, a rhwng trefi yng Ngogledd Iwerddon a Gweriniaeth Iwerddon, gellir gweld y buddiannau. Ar hyn o bryd mae Gogledd Iwerddon yn elwa ar brysurdeb economaidd yng Ngweriniaeth Iwerddon, yn enwedig yn y dwyrain.

Mae fy neges yn glir: pan fo pobl yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd ar draws ffiniau—waeth pa mor anorchfygol fo'r ffiniau hynny ac, yn achos Gogledd Iwerddon a Gweriniaeth Iwerddon, bu'n ffin wedi'i harfogi tan tua phum neu chwe blynedd yn ôl—bydd pobl yn ffynnu. Os bydd pobl yn ceisio anwybyddu ei gilydd, peidio â gweithio gyda'i gilydd, ac yn chwilio am ffiniau ac ymraniadau, ni fyddant yn ffynnu.

**Kirsty Williams:** Fe wŷr Carwyn, gan fy mod yn cynrychioli Brycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed mai gennyf fi y mae'r etholaeth â'r ffin ddaearyddol hwyaf o bosibl rhwng Cymru a Lloegr. Mae llawer o'm hetholwyr yn croesi'r ffin i gael gwasanaethau, yn enwedig gwasanaethau'r GIG. A gweddwch ei bod yn dderbyniol i ysbyty yng Nghymru ddweud wrth feddygon teulu yn fy etholaeth na fyddai'n derbyn claf sydd â chod post sy'n dechrau gyda'r llythrennau 'HR'—cod post yn Lloegr? A wnewch chi weithio gyda'ch cyd-Weinidog, y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, i ganfod pam y gwnaeth ysbyty yng Nghymru y penderfyniad i beidio â derbyn rhywun o Gymru, gan iddo dybio bod yr unigolyn hwnnw yn byw yn Lloegr, ar y sail bod 'HR' ar ddechrau ei god post?

**Carwyn Jones:** Nid oes unrhyw rwystr, hyd y gwn i, i bobl groesi'r ffin i gael triniaeth iechyd. Bydd llawer o bobl o Frycheiniog a

Brecon and Radnor will go to the Royal Shrewsbury Hospital, and many will go to Hereford, and we should not seek to change that. We must be realistic. We talk about basing the children's hospital in Cardiff, knowing full well that, along the northern coast, children will still attend Alder Hey as it is the hospital that is most convenient for them. We cannot change that; it is practical in terms of people's health. To change it would be a political act, rather than an act to benefit children's health.

The message is that when people work together, you have harmony and prosperity; when people seek conflict, everybody suffers.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings today's proceedings to a close.

Sir Faesyfed yn mynd i Ysbyty Brenhinol Amwythig, a bydd llawer yn mynd i Henffordd, ac ni ddylem geisio newid hynny. Rhaid inni fod yn realistig. Yr ydym yn sôn am leoli'r ysbyty plant yng Nghaerdydd, gan wybod yn iawn y bydd plant ar hyd arfordir y Gogledd yn parhau i fynd i ysbyty Alder Hey gan mai hwnnw yw'r ysbyty mwyaf cyfleus iddynt. Ni allwn newid hynny; mae'n ymarferol o ran iechyd pobl. Byddai newid hynny yn weithred wleidyddol, yn hytrach na gweithred er budd iechyd plant.

Y neges yw y bydd cytundeb a ffyniant pan fo pobl yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd; pan fo pobl yn chwennych anghydfod, bydd pawb yn dioddef.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.14 p.m.  
The session ended at 5.14 p.m.*