



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mawrth 25 Chwefror 2003**

**Tuesday 25 February 2003**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog  
*Questions to the First Minister*
- 23 Datganiad ar Ymateb i Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig ar Dechnoleg Gwybodaeth a Chyfathrebu yng Nghymru Wledig  
*Statement on the Response to the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee's Report on Information and Communications Technology in Rural Wales*
- 34 Datganiad Busnes  
*Business Statement*
- 41 Pwyntiau o Drefn  
*Points of Order*
- 43 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Refferenda) (Deisebau a Chyfarwyddiadau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003  
*Approval of the Local Authorities (Referendums) (Petitions and Directions) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003*
- 47 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Asiantaethau Mabwysiadu Gwirfoddol ac Asiantaethau Mabwysiadu (Diwygiadau Amrywiol) 2003  
*Approval of the Voluntary Adoption Agencies and Adoption Agencies (Miscellaneous Amendments) Regulations 2003*
- 48 Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion  
*Composite Motion: Approval of Orders*
- 51 Cymeradwyo Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) Adroddiad Grant Arbennig (Cymru) 2003  
*Approval of the Local Government Finance (Wales) Special Grant Report (Wales) 2003*
- 53 Cynllun Gweithredu Busnes a'r Amgylchedd  
*The Business and Environment Action Plan*
- 73 Cydweithredu Rhyngwladol mewn Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes  
*International Co-operation in Education and Lifelong Learning*

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## **Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister**

### **Stoc Marw Fallen Stock**

**Q1 Peter Rogers:** Will the First Minister make a statement on what plans are in place to deal with fallen stock after April 2003? (OAQ22600)

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** The Welsh Assembly Government has strongly supported efforts to develop workable UK-wide arrangements for the collection and disposal of fallen stock when the European Union regulation preventing burial on farms comes into force. The Deputy First Minister and Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad, Mike German, has raised this issue with Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs Ministers on numerous occasions; we are eager to see realistic negotiations to secure agreement on a UK-wide scheme, with costs shared between government and industry. Mike German has written to the industry in Wales to confirm that the Assembly Government is prepared to contribute to the additional costs of an agreed and admissible scheme that is also financially supported and operated by the industry itself.

**Peter Rogers:** Where has common sense and reason gone? [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.']

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. That supplementary is in order. Peter Rogers, please continue.

**Peter Rogers:** The movement of live animals is kept in check in order to control disease, yet here we have legislation allowing lorries to pick up dead stock from up to 40 farms and to travel hundreds of miles to reach the nearest incinerator. The nearest incinerator to north Wales is in Widnes. Are we all utterly bonkers?

**The First Minister:** We do not have

**C1 Peter Rogers:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar y cynlluniau a fydd ar waith i fynd i'r afael â stoc marw ar ôl mis Ebrill 2003? (OAQ22600)

**Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan):** Bu Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gefnogol iawn i ymdrechion i ddatblygu trefniadau ymarferol i'r DU gyfan ar gyfer casglu a gwaredu stoc marw erbyn y daw rheoliad yr Undeb Ewropeaidd sy'n gwahardd claddu ar ffermydd i rym. Mae'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor, Mike German, wedi codi'r mater hwn gyda Gweinidogion Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig ar sawl achlysur; yr ydym yn awyddus i weld negodiadau realistig i sicrhau cytundeb ar gynllun i'r DU gyfan, gyda'r costau'n cael eu rhannu rhwng llywodraeth a diwydiant. Mae Mike German wedi ysgrifennu at y diwydiant yng Nghymru i gadarnhau bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn barod i gyfrannu at gostau ychwanegol a geir o gynllun cytunedig a derbyniol a gaiff ei gefnogi'n ariannol a'i weithredu hefyd gan y diwydiant ei hun.

**Peter Rogers:** I ble'r aeth synnwyr cyffredin a rheswm? [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.']

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r cwestiwn atodol hwnnw mewn trefn. Peter Rogers, ewch yn eich blaen.

**Peter Rogers:** Cedwir golwg ar wahardd ar symud anifeiliaid byw er mwyn rheoli afiechyd, ac eto mae'r ddeddfwriaeth hon yn caniatáu i lorïau godi stoc marw o hyd at 40 o ffermydd a theithio cannoedd o filltiroedd i gyrraedd y llosgydd agosaf. Mae'r llosgydd agosaf i ogledd Cymru yn Widnes. A ydym oll yn gwbl wallgof?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid oes gennym

rendering facilities in Wales; we inherited that situation from the previous Government. It is a problem, and we have unsuccessfully tried to negotiate rendering facilities in Wales. To contest the principle that fallen stock may have a contributory role in spreading animal disease is not what I want to do now. The regulation comes into force on 1 April, and we must deal with it as best we can, in the most practical manner.

**Mick Bates:** First Minister, do you agree that we could solve the problem of fallen stock and meet our aim of achieving sustainability if we followed the Scottish Executive's example? It plans to fund a collection scheme for fallen stock and convert that stock into biodiesel.

**The First Minister:** I am unaware of that scheme, although I know that the Scottish Executive is considering how best to make funds available to solve this problem, as are we. The idea of converting fallen stock into biodiesel has not come to my attention, but I will look into the matter. If the Scottish Executive has adopted that scheme as its proposed solution to this issue, the legal grounds for having a scheme that is not UK-wide are open to question. Such legal matters continue to be the subject of much correspondence and to-ing and fro-ing between the Scottish Executive, the Welsh Assembly Government and DEFRA.

**Cynog Dafis:** Bydd y Prif Weinidog yn cytuno bod gennym broblem go ddifrifol yma. Sut y gallwn gael gwared ar anifeiliaid trig ar y naill law, gan osgoi llygredd a phob mathau o broblemau felly ac, ar y llaw arall, ddelio â'r gost sylweddol i ffermwyr, a hwythau ag incwm mor gyfyng ar hyn o bryd? Ymhellach i sylwadau Mick Bates, pwysodd Undeb Amaethwyr Cymru sawl mis yn ôl am astudiaeth i'r posibilrwydd o ddatblygu pwerdy o ryw fath, gan ddefnyddio da trig fel tanwydd. Gallai hynny ladd dau aderyn gydag un garreg, a byddai'n dda pe bai modd symud tua'r cyfeiriad hwnnw.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Y mae'r egwyddor a roddais yn fy ateb cyntaf yn bwysig, sef ein bod yn barod i wneud cyfraniad ariannol i'r diwydiant fel rhan o'n cyfraniad i ddatrys y

gyfleusterau rendro yng Nghymru; bu inni etifeddu'r sefyllfa honno oddi wrth y Llywodraeth flaenorol. Mae'n broblem, ac yr ydym wedi ceisio negodi, heb lwyddiant, i gael cyfleusterau rendro yng Nghymru. Nid herio'r egwyddor y gallai stoc marw gyfrannu at ledaenu afiechyd ymysg anifeiliaid yr wyf am ei wneud yn awr. Daw'r rheoliad i rym ar 1 Ebrill, a rhaid inni ymdrin ag ef orau y gallwn, yn y modd mwyaf ymarferol.

**Mick Bates:** Brif Weinidog, a gytunwch y gallem ddatrys problem y stoc marw a chyrraedd ein nod o sicrhau cynaliadwyedd pe byddem yn dilyn esiampl Gweithrediaeth yr Alban? Mae'n bwriadu cyllido cynllun casglu stoc marw a throi'r stoc hwnnw'n fiodisel.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni wn am y cynllun hwnnw, er y gwn fod Gweithrediaeth yr Alban yn ystyried y modd gorau o ddarparu cyllid i ddatrys y broblem hon, fel yr ydym ninnau. Nid yw'r syniad o droi stoc marw'n fiodisel wedi dod i'm sylw, ond ymchwiliad i'r mater. Os yw Gweithrediaeth yr Alban wedi mabwysiadu'r cynllun hwnnw fel ei hateb arfaethedig i'r mater hwn, mae'r ddadl gyfreithiol dros gael cynllun nad yw'n un i'r DU gyfan yn amheus. Mae llawer o ohebiaeth a mynd a dod o hyd ar faterion cyfreithiol o'r fath rhwng Gweithrediaeth yr Alban, Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a DEFRA.

**Cynog Dafis:** The First Minister will agree that we have quite a serious problem here. On the one hand, how can we dispose of fallen stock, preventing pollution and all sorts of similar problems while, on the other hand, dealing with the substantial cost to farmers, whose incomes are currently so limited? Further to Mick Bates's comments, the Farmers' Union of Wales lobbied several months ago for a study into the possibility of developing some form of powerhouse, using fallen stock as fuel. That could kill two birds with one stone, and a move in that direction would prove beneficial.

**The First Minister:** The principle that I outlined in my first answer is important, namely that we are prepared to make a financial contribution to the industry as part

problem. Fodd bynnag, rhaid bod y diwydiant yn fodlon cyfrannu hefyd. Gan nad oes gennym leoliad rendro yng Nghymru, fel sydd yn Widnes, mae gennym broblem ynglŷn â beth i'w wneud gyda'r anifeiliaid. Bûm yn trafod a allem gyfrannu tuag at sefydlu ffatri rendro yng Nghymru ond, hyd yn hyn, nid oedd yn bosibl.

of our contribution to solving the problem. However, the industry must also be willing to contribute. As we do not have a rendering facility in Wales like that in Widnes, we have a problem as to what to do with the animals. We have discussed whether we could contribute towards establishing a rendering factory in Wales but, as yet, it has not proved possible.

### **Tegwch yn y Systemau Cartrefi Gofal Fairness in the Care Homes Systems**

**Q2 David Ian Jones:** What measures does the First Minister propose to promote fairness in the care homes systems? (OAQ22608)

**C2 David Ian Jones:** Pa fesurau y mae'r Prif Weinidog yn eu cynnig i hyrwyddo tegwch yn y systemau cartrefi gofal? (OAQ22608)

**The First Minister:** Fee levels vary according to the care and facilities provided, the nature of the commissioning arrangement—for example, whether by block or spot purchase—and local circumstances. It is for local authorities to negotiate fee levels with service providers. Good commissioning must incorporate the principles of Best Value in an open and structured way and local authorities need to be fair in their dealings with independent providers and comply with the relevant legislation.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae lefelau ffioedd yn amrywio yn ôl y gofal a'r cyfleusterau a ddarperir, natur y trefniant comisiynu—er enghraifft, drwy brynu mewn crynswth neu'n unigol—ac amgylchiadau lleol. Mater i awdurdodau lleol yw negodi lefelau ffioedd gyda darparwyr gwasanaethau. Wrth gomisiynu da rhaid dal at egwyddorion Gwerth Gorau mewn modd agored a threfnus a rhaid i awdurdodau lleol ymwneud yn deg â darparwyr annibynnol a chydymffurfio â'r ddeddfwriaeth berthnasol.

**David Ian Jones:** I am sure that you will be concerned that over 700 care home beds have been lost in Wales over the past year. Half of those are in north Wales. Do you agree that the crisis in the care homes sector is caused, at least in part, by the fact that local authorities support residents of council-run homes at a higher rate than residents of private homes? That is exacerbated by the fact that local authorities also provide capital support for their own homes. What can be done to ensure that private care homes do not continue to close because of unfair competition from council-run homes?

**David Ian Jones:** Yr wyf yn siŵr ei bod yn destun pryder i chi fod mwy na 700 o welyau mewn cartrefi gofal wedi'u colli yng Nghymru dros y flwyddyn a aeth heibio. Mae hanner y rheini yn y Gogledd. A gytunwch fod yr argyfwng yn y sector cartrefi gofal wedi'i achosi, yn rhannol o leiaf, gan y ffaith bod awdurdodau lleol yn cynnal preswylwyr mewn cartrefi sy'n cael eu rhedeg gan gynghorau ar gyfradd uwch na phreswylwyr mewn cartrefi preifat? Gwaethygir hynny gan y ffaith bod awdurdodau lleol hefyd yn darparu cymorth cyfalaf ar gyfer eu cartrefi eu hunain. Beth y gellir ei wneud i sicrhau na fydd cartrefi gofal preifat yn dal i gau oherwydd cystadlu annheg oddi wrth gartrefi sy'n cael eu rhedeg gan gynghorau?

**The First Minister:** There is a legal case in Northern Ireland, involving the Competition Commission appeal tribunal, between Bettercare Group Ltd and the Director-General of the Office of Fair Trading in relation to the complaint that North and West Belfast NHS Trust acted uncompetitively by

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae achos cyfreithiol yng Ngogledd Iwerddon, sy'n ymwneud â thribiwnlys apêl y Comisiwn Cystadleuaeth, rhwng Bettercare Group Cyf a Chyfarwyddwr Cyffredinol y Swyddfa Masnachu Teg mewn cysylltiad â'r gŵyn bod Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gogledd a Gorllewin

paying more for directly-provided services than externally-commissioned ones. There is also another case elsewhere in Europe.

That will help to clarify to what extent the competition legislation applies to the commissioning of care by statutory authorities. Other than that, I can only repeat what I said in my original answer. These are matters for local authorities; they have to apply Best Value standards. If you are aware of any complaints that have not yet been resolved, where authorities are not applying Best Value standards, then we will consider them. However, the problem is that wages probably account for 70 per cent of the total cost of care homes, whether in the private or public sectors. Public sector wage levels, particularly sickness and holiday pay provision, tend to be better than those in the private care home sector.

**Kirsty Williams:** Is it your Government's intention to abandon physical standards in care homes as happened in England last week?

**The First Minister:** I heard about that on the radio; I have not yet received any official briefing on this. It is important to us to ensure that the care home industry can adapt to higher standards. Care homes should not be faced with suddenly having to decide whether or not to continue because they feel that they cannot raise the capital or get the bank loans to make the relevant improvements required.

David Ian Jones mentioned earlier the fact that 700 care home beds had been lost in Wales over the past year. I do not have that figure, but I will not seek to deny it. I have no idea whether it is correct, but it would not be far out, I would think. However, as far as I am aware, none of those care home beds were lost as a result of any actions taken by the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales.

**David Lloyd:** Beth y mae'r Prif Weinidog yn

Belfast wedi gweithredu'n anghystadl euol drwy dalu mwy am wasanaethau a ddarperir yn uniongyrchol na rhai a gomisiynir yn allanol. Mae achos arall yn rhywle arall yn Ewrop hefyd.

Bydd hynny o gymorth i ddangos i ba raddau y mae'r ddeddfwriaeth cystadleuaeth yn berthnasol i gomisiynu gofal gan awdurdodau statudol. Heblaw hynny, ni allaf ond ailadrodd yr hyn a ddywedais yn fy ateb gwreiddiol. Materion i awdurdodau lleol yw'r rhain; rhaid iddynt gymhwyso safonau Gwerth Gorau. Os gwyddoch am unrhyw gwynion sydd heb eu datrys eto, lle nad yw awdurdodau'n cymhwyso safonau Gwerth Gorau, yna gwnawn eu hystyried. Fodd bynnag, y broblem yw mai cyflogau, o bosibl, sy'n cyfrif am 70 y cant o gyfanswm costau cartrefi gofal, boed hwy yn y sector preifat neu'r sector cyhoeddus. Mae lefelau cyflog y sector cyhoeddus, yn enwedig y ddarpariaeth ar gyfer salwch a thâl gwyliau, yn tueddu i fod yn well na'r rhai yn sector y cartrefi gofal preifat.

**Kirsty Williams:** A yw'ch Llywodraeth yn bwriadu rhoi'r gorau i safonau ffisegol mewn cartrefi gofal fel a ddigwyddodd yn Lloegr yr wythnos diwethaf?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Clywais am hynny ar y radio; nid wyf wedi cael unrhyw gyfarwyddyd swyddogol ar hyn eto. Mae'n bwysig gennym sicrhau y gall y diwydiant cartrefi gofal ymaddasu i safonau uwch. Ni ddylai cartrefi gofal orfod penderfynu'n sydyn a ydynt am barhau ai peidio am eu bod yn teimlo na allant godi cyfalaf neu gael benthyciadau gan y banc i wneud y gwelliannau perthnasol sy'n ofynnol.

Cyfeiriodd David Ian Jones yn gynharach at y ffaith bod 700 o welyau mewn cartrefi gofal wedi'u colli yng Nghymru dros y flwyddyn a aeth heibio. Nid yw'r ffigur hwnnw gennyf, ond ni wnaaf geisio'i wadu. Nid oes gennyf unrhyw syniad a yw'n gywir, ond nid yw'n bell ohoni, dybiwn i. Er hynny, hyd y gwn i, ni chollwyd yr un o'r gwelyau hynny mewn cartrefi gofal oherwydd unrhyw gamau a gymerwyd gan Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru.

**David Lloyd:** What is the First Minister

ei wneud i hyrwyddo'r syniad o gael un sector ac un gweithlu ar draws y maes gofal?

doing to promote the idea of having one sector and one workforce across the field of care?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hwnnw'n syniad uchelgeisiol. Mae'r sector gofal mewn economi gymysg. Os ydych yn trafod pa un ai ydym yn bwriadu cael gwared ar y sector preifat ynteu'r sector cyhoeddus, gallaf ddweud wrthy ch nad oes gennym fwriad o'r fath—bydd yn parhau yn economi gymysg.

**The First Minister:** That is an ambitious concept. The care sector is based in a mixed economy. If you are talking about whether or not we intend to get rid of the public or private sector, I can tell you that we have no such intention—it will remain a mixed economy.

### **Argaeledd Dogfennau ar Bolisiau'r Llywodraeth Availability of Papers on Government Policies**

**Q3 Phil Williams:** What steps have been taken to ensure that all papers used in defining Government targets in health, education, transport and the economy will be available to the Government that takes office in May? (OAQ22616)

**C3 Phil Williams:** Pa gamau a gymerwyd i sicrhau y bydd pob dogfen a ddefnyddir i ddiffinio targedau'r Llywodraeth ym meysydd iechyd, addysg, trafndiaeth a'r economi ar gael i'r Llywodraeth a fydd yn dod i rym ym mis Mai? (OAQ22616)

**The First Minister:** I assume that you mean if there were no continuity of administration. There is a long-standing parliamentary convention on this. However, you are getting so excited about the idea of a change of administration, you have decided not to stand for election on 1 May. The convention is that any incoming administration not of the same political colour as the outgoing one is not allowed to see the ministerial papers that constitute advice to Ministers, but is allowed to see all the factual data.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cymeraf eich bod yn golygu os na cheir parhad yn y weinyddiaeth. Mae confensiwn seneddol hirsefydlog ar hyn. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych yn cynhyrfu gymaint ynghylch y syniad o newid gweinyddiaeth fel eich bod wedi penderfynu peidio â sefyll i gael eich ethol ar 1 Mai. Y confensiwn yw na chaniateir i unrhyw weinyddiaeth newydd nad yw o'r un lliw gwleidyddol â'r un sy'n ymadael gael gweld y papurau gweinidogol sy'n ffurfio cyngor i Weinidogion, ond y caniateir iddi weld yr holl ddata ffeithiol.

**Phil Williams:** Your Government set a series of precise targets in 'BetterWales.com' and 'Plan for Wales 2001', yet you have failed to meet many of them, such as the reduction in hospital waiting lists, the increase in our proportion of UK research and the increase in our relative gross domestic product per capita. I have always assumed that those targets were based on a thorough analysis and evaluation of the anticipated output from your policies. Would you agree that it would be a high priority for a new Government to have full access to those preliminary papers to identify why they were so misleading and to ensure that any future targets are realistic?

**Phil Williams:** Bu i'ch Llywodraeth osod cyfres o dargedau manwl yn 'GwellCymru.com' a 'Cynllun i Gymru 2001', ac eto yr ydych wedi methu cyrraedd llawer ohonynt, fel y gostyngiad mewn rhestrau aros ysbytai, y cynnydd yn ein cyfran o ymchwil y DU a'r cynnydd yn ein cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen. Yr wyf wedi cymryd erioed fod y targedau hynny'n seiliedig ar ddadansoddiad a gwerthusiad trwyadl o'r allbwn disgwylidig o'ch polisiau. A gytunwch y byddai'n flaenoriaeth uchel gan Lywodraeth newydd gael gweld y papurau rhagarweiniol hynny er mwyn canfod pam yr oeddent mor gamarweiniol ac i sicrhau bod unrhyw dargedau yn y dyfodol yn realistig?

2.10 p.m.

**The First Minister:** We have exceeded some targets and missed others. That is in the nature of government. Your comment about the GDP per capita target is absurd, as it is a 10-year target and does not have any intervening steps. Therefore, I do not know how you can say that the target has been missed. A preliminary course in statistics might be in order for you, Phil. The convention that, when there is a change in the colour of the administration, the incoming administration should not see ministerial papers, will be adhered to. It is a cast-iron convention that advice to Ministers and their responses to it are the property of those Ministers. I am sure that civil servants here will ensure that that convention is adhered to.

**Peter Black:** Given the success of the partnership Government in achieving the target of reducing the number of children in most junior classes to below 30, should we not now set a new target for the next administration of achieving a further reduction to 25 children in all classes in Wales?

**The First Minister:** We must not anticipate what political parties will say in their manifestos. Targets are there to be met, preferably early, and exceeded. When targets are met, people will increase them: they will see a good trend in public service provision and try to build on it. However, I do not want to anticipate the content of the manifestos of the four political parties that are represented here.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** In your last manifesto you promised to end the six-month wait for out-patient treatment and the 18-month wait for in-patient treatment. Do you accept that it is a shaming indictment of your time as First Minister that the waiting list position has become worse month after month—excepting one month—since you took office? Do you accept that your promise has been broken and will you take this opportunity to apologise to the people of Wales?

**The First Minister:** Your summary is not accurate. The out-patient waiting list situation

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym wedi rhagori ar rai targedau ac wedi methu eraill. Peth felly yw llywodraeth. Mae'ch sylw am darged y CMC y pen yn hurt, gan ei fod yn darged 10-mllynedd ac nid oes unrhyw gamau rhyngol. Gan hynny, ni wn sut y gallwch ddweud bod y targed hwnnw wedi'i fethu. Efallai y byddai'n briodol ichi ddilyn cwrs rhagarweiniol mewn ystadegaeth, Phil. Glynir wrth y confensiwn na ddylai'r weinyddiaeth newydd, pan fo newid yn lliw y weinyddiaeth, gael gweld papurau gweinidogol. Confensiwn sy'n gadarn fel y graig yw bod cyngor i Weinidogion a'u hatebion iddo'n eiddo i'r Gweinidogion hynny. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd gweision sifil yma yn sicrhau y glynir wrth y confensiwn hwnnw.

**Peter Black:** Yng ngolwg llwyddiant y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth wrth gyrraedd y targed o ostwng nifer y plant yn y rhan fwyaf o ddsbarthiadau iau i lai na 30, oni ddylem osod targed newydd yn awr ar gyfer y weinyddiaeth nesaf o sicrhau gostyngiad pellach i 25 o blant yn yr holl ddsbarthiadau yng Nghymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Rhaid inni beidio â cheisio rhagweld yr hyn a ddywed pleidiau gwleidyddol yn eu maniffestos. Mae targedau yno i'w cyrraedd, yn gynnar os oes modd, a'u curo. Pan gyrhaeddir targedau, bydd pobl yn gosod rhai uwch: gwelant duedd da yn y ddarpariaeth o wasanaethau cyhoeddus a cheisiant ei hybu. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf am geisio rhagweld cynnwys maniffestos y pedair plaid wleidyddol sydd wedi'u cynrychioli yma.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Yn eich maniffesto diwethaf bu ichi addo rhoi pen ar yr arhosiad o chwe mis am driniaeth fel claf allanol a'r arhosiad o 18 mis am driniaeth fel claf mewnol. A ydych yn derbyn mai collfarn waradwyddus ar eich cyfnod yn Brif Weinidog yw bod sefyllfa'r rhestrau aros wedi gwaethygu fis ar ôl mis—heblaw un mis—ers ichi ddod i'ch swydd? A dderbyniwch bod eich addewid wedi'i dorri ac a wnewch achub ar y cyfle hwn i ymddiheuro i bobl Cymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid yw'ch crynodeb yn gywir. Mae'r sefyllfa o ran rhestrau aros



has improved in recent months and I trust that it will continue to improve. Many of the other targets that we have set have been achieved. The targets for cardiac and orthopaedic surgery waiting times either are, or are close to, being achieved. The indications are that, after initial problems, health service targeting is now more effective than it was.

**Nick Bourne:** I have the figures here. Five thousand people have been waiting more than 18 months for in-patient treatment and over 83,000 for out-patient treatment. We are not talking about a small number of people. Do you expect that these people will be treated by 1 May or will you take this opportunity to apologise for what was a serious promise in your last manifesto?

**The First Minister:** Provided that the lists are headed in the right direction, as they are at present, then I am happy that we are providing the necessary additional workforce training to expand the national health service's capacity to treat. It is an unfortunate truth that for doctors to be available to us now they had to have entered medical school when your party was still in power. However, your party did not expand the numbers entering medical school and it cut the numbers being trained as nurses. Consequently, those staff are not available. You must bear your share of the responsibility for the difficulties in expanding the NHS's capacity to treat. We are addressing the problem and the benefits will be felt during the next four years.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 4 (OAQ22601) has been withdrawn.

cleifion allanol wedi gwella yn y misoedd diwethaf a hyderaf y bydd yn dal i wella. Cyrhaeddwyd llawer o'r targedau eraill a osodwyd gennym. Mae'r targedau ar gyfer amseroedd aros am lawdriniaeth gardiaidd neu orthopedig wedi'u cyrraedd, neu'n agos at gael eu cyrraedd. Yr arwyddion yw bod y targedu yn y gwasanaeth iechyd, ar ôl problemau dechreuol, yn fwy effeithiol yn awr nag yr oedd.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae'r ffigurau gennyf yma. Mae 5,000 o bobl yn aros am fwy na 18 mis am driniaeth fel claf mewnol a mwy na 83,000 am driniaeth fel claf allanol. Nid nifer fach o bobl sydd dan sylw. A ydych yn rhagweld y bydd y bobl hyn wedi'u trin erbyn 1 Mai neu a wnewch achub ar y cyfle hwn i ymddiheuro am yr hyn a oedd yn addewid difrifol yn eich maniffesto diwethaf?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ar yr amod bod y rhestrau'n mynd i'r cyfeiriad iawn, fel y maent ar hyn o bryd, yr wyf yn fodlon ein bod yn darparu'r hyfforddiant ychwanegol angenrheidiol i'r gweithlu i gynyddu gallu'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol i drin. Y gwir anffodus yw y byddai'n rhaid i feddygon fod wedi dechrau mewn ysgol feddygol pan oedd eich plaid chi'n dal i fod mewn grym er mwyn iddynt fod ar gael i ni'n awr. Fodd bynnag, ni wnaeth eich plaid gynyddu'r niferoedd a âi i ysgol feddygol a chwtogodd y nifer a oedd yn cael ei hyfforddi'n nyrsys. O ganlyniad, nid yw'r staff hynny ar gael. Rhaid ichi dderbyn eich rhan chi o'r cyfrifoldeb am yr anawsterau a geir wrth gynyddu capasiti'r GIG i drin. Yr ydym yn ymdrin â'r broblem a gwelir y manteision yn ystod y pedair blynedd nesaf.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 4 (OAQ22601) yn ôl.

### **Cynnydd Tebygol yn y Dreth Gyngor (Caerdydd) Likely Increase in Council Tax (Cardiff)**

**Q5 Owen John Thomas:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the likely increase in council tax in Cardiff? (OAQ22615)

**C5 Owen John Thomas:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar y cynnydd tebygol yn y dreth gyngor yng Nghaerdydd? (OAQ22615)

**Q9 Jonathan Morgan:** Will the First Minister make a statement on his Government's financial settlement for Cardiff

**C9 Jonathan Morgan:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar setliad ariannol ei Lywodraeth ar gyfer Cyngor Sir Caerdydd yn

County Council for 2003-04 compared to the present financial year? (OAQ22603)

**The First Minister:** The level of council tax increases is a matter for local authorities to decide in the light of local needs and priorities. Cardiff County Council will receive £306 million in non-hypothecated funding from the Assembly Government in the financial year 2003-04, an increase of 7.2 per cent on the present year.

**Owen John Thomas:** I am sure that you will agree that the spectacle of the First Minister of a Labour-led Assembly administration and the leader of a Labour-led county council blaming each other for this regrettable increase sends confusing signals to the people of Cardiff. However you choose to look at it, Labour has little to be proud of in this saga. Do not look so surprised, Rhodri—you read the *South Wales Echo*. Will you join me in congratulating Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council, which is run by Plaid Cymru, on its financial management, which has enabled it to limit the council tax increase to below 5 per cent?

**The First Minister:** I have never heard such claptrap in my life. Perhaps in re-reading the *South Wales Echo*—or reading it for the first time—you could draw to my attention to where I blame the Labour-led administration in Cardiff. I did not do so. Please read the newspaper again and do not get overexcited by your wish to praise other authorities.

We have a great deal of sympathy with Cardiff council in having to adjust to the fact that the 2001 census showed that 20,000 fewer people are resident in Cardiff than were thought to be living there. The council's standard spending assessment has therefore been re-adjusted. That re-adjustment will take place over two years. It is for the council to decide what level of council tax increase to levy, and it is in the process of doing so. I have not blamed the Labour-led authority for what it has done; I have said that the council should not blame the Assembly for whatever increase in council tax it decides upon.

2003-04 o'i gymharu â'r setliad ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol hon? (OAQ22603)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mater i'w benderfynu gan awdurdodau lleol yng ngoleuni anghenion a blaenoriaethau lleol yw maint y cynnydd yn y dreth gyngor. Bydd Cyngor Sir Caerdydd yn derbyn £306 miliwn mewn cyllid heb ei bridianu oddi wrth Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn y flwyddyn ariannol 2003-04, sef cynnydd o 7.2 y cant o'i gymharu â'r flwyddyn bresennol.

**Owen John Thomas:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch fod gweld Prif Weinidog gweinyddiaeth a arweinir gan Lafur ac arweinydd cyngor sir a arweinir gan Lafur yn rhoi'r bai ar ei gilydd am y cynnydd anffodus hwn yn cyfleu neges ddryslyd i bobl Caerdydd. Ym mha ffordd bynnag y dewiswch edrych ar hyn, ychydig o le sydd gan Lafur i ymfalchïo yn y saga hon. Peidiwch ag edrych mor synn, Rhodri—yr ydych yn darllen y *South Wales Echo*. A ymunwch â mi i longyfarch Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf, sy'n cael ei redeg gan Blaid Cymru, ar ei reolaeth ariannol, sydd wedi'i alluogi i gadw'r cynnydd yn y dreth gyngor o dan 5 y cant?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni chlywais erioed y fath lol. Wrth ailddarllen y *South Wales Echo*—neu ei ddarllen am y tro cyntaf—efallai y gallech dynnu fy sylw at y man lle'r wyf yn rhoi'r bai ar y weinyddiaeth a arweinir gan Lafur yng Nghaerdydd. Ni wneuthum hynny. Darllenwch y papur eto a pheidiwch â gorgynhyrfu oherwydd eich dymuniad i ganmol awdurdodau eraill.

Mae gennym lawer iawn o gydymdeimlad â chyngor Caerdydd am ei fod yn gorfod ymaddasu i'r ffaith bod cyfrifiad 2001 yn dangos bod 20,000 yn llai o bobl yn preswylïo yng Nghaerdydd nag y tybiem. Ailaddaswyd asesiad gwariant safonol y cyngor o'r herwydd. Bydd y newid hwnnw'n digwydd dros gyfnod o ddwy flynedd. Mater i'r cyngor yw penderfynu ar faint y cynnydd yn y dreth gyngor y mae am ei godi, ac mae wrthi'n gwneud hynny. Nid wyf wedi rhoi'r bai ar yr awdurdod a arweinir gan Lafur am yr hyn a wnaeth; yr wyf wedi dweud na ddylai'r cyngor feio'r Cynulliad am ba bynnag gynnydd yn y dreth gyngor y

penderfyna arno.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Not being a Cardiff council tax payer yourself, you might not be aware that Cardiff council will cut public services to prevent hitting residents with an increase in council tax of between 13 and 18 per cent. According to the authority, that projected increase is a result of it taking on extra responsibilities such as providing free bus travel for pensioners, meeting the increase in teachers' pay, pension costs, national insurance and so on. Russell Goodway has said that he blames the Labour Party. Do you share his view?

**Jonathan Morgan:** Gan nad ydych yn un o drethdalwyr cyngor Caerdydd, efallai na wyddoch y bydd cyngor Caerdydd yn torri ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus er mwyn peidio â bwrw trigolion â chynnydd yn y dreth gyngor a fyddai rhwng 13 a 18 y cant. Yn ôl yr awdurdod, mae'r cynnydd rhagamcanedig yn ganlyniad iddo ymgymryd â chyfrifoldebau ychwanegol fel darparu teithio am ddim ar fysiau i bensiynwyr, talu am y cynnydd yn nhâl athrawon, costau pensiwn, yswiriant gwladol ac yn y blaen. Dywed Russell Goodway ei fod yn rhoi'r bai ar y Blaid Lafur. A ydych o'r un farn ag ef?

**The First Minister:** I read that article—I cannot remember in which newspaper it appeared—in which Russell Goodway refers to the fact that William Hague's now notorious letter to John Morris started a trend, which Russell Goodway regrets that Labour has not reversed, of increasing the proportion of local authorities' resources raised by council tax, as opposed to being provided from grants from the then Welsh Office. That letter was sent in 1996. Russell Goodway believes that Labour should have reversed that trend, but the Treasury and the Assembly have not done so in the six years that Labour has been in power. You could perhaps ask William Hague whether he now regrets writing that letter in 1996 to John Morris, which explained what the game was.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Darllenais yr erthygl honno—ni allaf gofio ym mha bapur newydd yr oedd—lle y mae Russell Goodway yn cyfeirio at y ffaith bod llythyr William Hague at John Morris, sy'n ddrwg-enwog bellach, wedi cychwyn tuedd, y mae'n ofid gan Russell Goodway nad yw Llafur wedi'i wrthdroi, o gynyddu'r gyfran o adnoddau awdurdodau lleol a godir drwy'r dreth gyngor, yn hytrach na'u bod yn cael eu darparu o grantiau oddi wrth y Swyddfa Gymreig, fel yr oedd ar y pryd. Anfonwyd y llythyr hwnnw yn 1996. Cred Russell Goodway y dylai Llafur fod wedi gwrthdroi'r tuedd hwnnw, ond nid yw'r Trysorlys a'r Cynulliad wedi gwneud hynny yn y chwe blynedd y bu Llafur mewn grym. Efallai y gallech ofyn i William Hague a yw'n edifar ganddo bellach am ysgrifennu'r llythyr hwnnw yn 1996 at John Morris, a eglurodd beth oedd ar y gweill.

It is important to note that grants have been made available in many other areas besides the one that I mentioned. I understand that 20 per cent of Cardiff's expenditure, some £91 million, is funded by special and specific grants, which tend to be funded at a level above, rather than below, the average. However, we sympathise with Cardiff council in having to adjust to the census figures; I understand that it is taking the matter up with the Office for National Statistics. Population loss in Cardiff is approximately half the big population losses recorded in the 2001 census for Manchester, Westminster, Kensington, Chelsea and other inner city authorities in England.

Mae'n bwysig nodi bod grantiau wedi'u darparu mewn llawer o feysydd eraill heblaw'r un a grybwyllais. Deallaf fod 20 y cant o wariant Caerdydd, tua £91 miliwn, yn cael ei gyllido drwy grantiau arbennig a phenodol, y mae tuedd iddynt gael eu cyllido ar lefel sy'n uwch na'r cyfartaledd, yn hytrach nag oddi tano. Er hynny, cydymdeimlwn â chyngor Caerdydd am ei fod yn gorfod ymaddasu i ffigurau'r cyfrifiad; deallaf ei fod yn codi'r mater gyda'r Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol. Mae'r boblogaeth a gollwyd yng Nghaerdydd tua hanner cymaint â'r colledion mawr mewn poblogaeth a gofnodwyd yng nghyfrifiad 2001 ar gyfer Manceinion, Westminster,

Kensington, Chelsea ac awdurdodau eraill yng nghanol dinasoedd Lloegr.

**Janet Ryder:** In your letter to the *South Wales Echo*, you said that there was no way that Cardiff council could argue that a shortfall in money from the Assembly was responsible for the increase in council tax. However, do you agree that the revenue support grant comprises a large proportion of local government funding? With only a 2.4 per cent indicative increase for local government next year, are you not consigning your colleagues in local government to oblivion? Many councils will have to resort to steep increases in council tax to maintain the levels of service to which people have become accustomed.

**The First Minister:** I said earlier, in response to Owen John Thomas's question, that I had never heard such claptrap, but that came close. Cardiff council has received an increase of 7.2 per cent, which is 2 per cent below the 9.2 per cent average increase for Wales. That has been caused by the downward adjustment of the standard spending assessment due to the loss of 5 to 6 per cent of Cardiff's population according to the census. The re-adjustment to take that into account will take place over two years, starting on 1 April 2003. It is tough; I expressed my sympathies to Cardiff in having to make that adjustment in the letter that I wrote to the *South Wales Echo*.

How you deduce from that that I have consigned local government councillors to oblivion is a matter that you will have to write to me about, if you can make sense of such an absurd proposition.

#### **Effaith Polisiâu'r Llywodraeth ar Gymoedd y Gorllewin Effect of Government Policies on the West Wales Valleys**

**C6 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar y ffordd y mae polisiâu ei Lywodraeth yn effeithio ar bobl sy'n byw yng Nghymoedd gorllewin Cymru? (OAQ22596)

2.20 p.m.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf am ddarparu dwy

**Janet Ryder:** Yn eich llythyr i'r *South Wales Echo*, dywedasoch nad oedd modd i gyngor Caerdydd ddadlau mai diffyg mewn arian oddi wrth y Cynulliad a oedd yn gyfrifol am y cynnydd yn y dreth gyngor. Fodd bynnag, a gytunwch fod y grant cynnal refeniw yn gyfran fawr o gyllid llywodraeth leol? Gan mai dim ond 2.4 y cant yw'r cynnydd dynodol i lywodraeth leol y flwyddyn nesaf, onid ydych yn bwrw eich cyd-aelodau mewn llywodraeth leol i e bargofiant? Bydd llawer o gynghorau'n gorfod cynyddu'r dreth gyngor yn sylweddol er mwyn cadw'r lefelau o wasanaeth y mae pobl wedi ymgyfarwyddo â hwy.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dywedais yn gynharach, mewn ymateb i gwestiwn Owen John Thomas, nad oeddwn erioed wedi clywed y fath lol, ond yr oedd hynny'n agos iddo. Mae cyngor Caerdydd wedi cael cynnydd o 7.2 y cant, sy'n 2 y cant yn llai na'r cynnydd cyfartalog o 9.2 y cant ar gyfer Cymru. Mae hynny'n ganlyniad i ostwng yr asesiad gwariant safonol oherwydd colli rhwng 5 a 6 y cant o boblogaeth Caerdydd yn ôl y cyfrifiad. Bydd y newid i roi cyfrif am hynny'n digwydd dros gyfnod o ddwy flynedd, gan ddechrau ar 1 Ebrill 2003. Mae'n anodd; mynegais fy nghydymdeimlad â Chaerdydd am ei fod yn gorfod gwneud y newid hwnnw yn y llythyr a ysgrifennais i'r *South Wales Echo*.

Mae'r casgliad y daethoch iddo, sef fy mod wedi bwrw cynghorwyr llywodraeth leol i e bargofiant, yn fater y bydd yn rhaid ichi ysgrifennu ataf yn ei gylch, os gallwch wneud synnwyr o osodiad mor afresymol.

**Q6 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the effect of his Government's policies on people living in the west Wales Valleys? (OAQ22596)

**The First Minister:** I will provide you with

enghraifft. Un ohonynt yw ffordd newydd Cwm Aman a Gwendraeth a fydd yn costio £3.5 miliwn. Rhoddodd Sue Essex, y Gweinidog â chyfrifoldeb dros drafnidiaeth, ganiatâd i Gyngor Sir Caerfyrddin adeiladu ffordd newydd a fydd yn darparu gwell cysylltiadau rhwng Stryd y Parc a Phontaman, fel rhan o ffordd ddsbarthu Rhydaman, a rhwng ffordd liniaru Rhydaman a'r A474.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Dywedodd y Prif Weinidog ei fod am roi dwy enghraifft: un a roddodd. Fe'i cyfeiriaf at ddatblygu economaidd. Bydd yn gwybod am adroddiad ar Gwmaman, a gyhoeddwyd rai blynyddoedd yn ôl, a gyfeiriodd at y cwm fel y cwm anghofiedig. O ran datblygu economaidd, a yw'n derbyn yr anwybyddir cymoedd fel Cwmaman yn llwyr gan fod ei bolisiau wedi eu seilio ar dargedau cenedlaethol? A yw'n derbyn y byddai Cwmaman, a chymoedd ac ardaloedd eraill yng Nghymru, yn cael y sylw a haeddant pe bai ganddo bolisi datblygu economaidd wedi ei seilio ar dargedau rhanbarthol yn hytrach na bod yr holl swyddi yn cael eu creu ar hyd goridorau'r M4 a'r A55?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ymddiheuraf: yr oeddwn am roi ail enghraifft sef datblygiad canolfan alwadau newydd Elev8 Solutions Cyf yn Rhydaman. Derbyniodd y cwmni grant gennym, a chrewyd dros 100 o swyddi o ganlyniad. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych wedi dangos pa mor afresymol yw galwad Plaid Cymru am sefydlu targedau llai na rhai i Gymru gyfan. Yr ydym wastad wedi dweud ein bod yn hollti Cymru yn ddwy ran sef ardal Amcan 1 a gweddill Cymru, neu ddwyrain Cymru. Mae Rhodri Glyn am gael targedau ar gyfer pob pentref a chwm. Mae'n afresymol gofyn am osod targed ar gyfer twf economaidd mewn ardal fel Cwmaman. Ni ellir gwneud hynny am ei fod yn llawer rhy fach; byddai'n golygu gosod cannoedd o dargedau ar draws Cymru. Ni fyddai hynny'n gwneud unrhyw synnwyr o ran polisi a strategaeth ar gyfer datblygu economaidd.

**Alun Cairns:** One of the Assembly Government's central policies was to create 34,000 new jobs in west Wales and the Valleys by March 2003, according to 'BetterWales.com'. Only some 10,000 new

two examples. The first is the new Amman and Gwendraeth Valley road, which will cost £3.5 million. Sue Essex, the Minister responsible for transport, has given Carmarthenshire County Council permission to build a new road, which will provide better links between Park Street and Pontaman, as part of the Ammanford distributor road, and between the Ammanford relief road and the A474.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** The First Minister said that he would give two examples: he only gave one. I refer him to economic development. He will be aware of a report published some years ago on Cwmaman, which referred to the valley as the forgotten valley. In terms of economic development, does he accept that valleys such as Cwmaman are totally ignored because his policies are based on national targets? Does he accept that, if his economic development policy were based on regional targets, Cwmaman and other valleys and areas in Wales would be given the attention that they deserve instead of all the jobs being created along the M4 and A55 corridors?

**The First Minister:** I apologise: I was going to give you a second example, which is the new Elev8 Solutions Ltd call centre development in Ammanford. It received a grant from us, and 100 jobs have been created as a result. However, you have shown how preposterous Plaid Cymru's demands are in calling for targets that are smaller than all-Wales targets. We have always said that we are dividing Wales into two parts, namely the Objective 1 area and the rest of Wales, or east Wales. Rhodri Glyn wants targets for every village and valley. It is unreasonable to ask for a target for economic growth in an area such as Cwmaman. That cannot be done because it is much too small; it would involve setting hundreds of targets across Wales. That would make no sense in terms of a policy and a strategy for economic development.

**Alun Cairns:** Un o bolisiau canolog Llywodraeth y Cynulliad oedd creu 34,000 o swyddi newydd yng ngorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd erbyn Mawrth 2003, yn ôl 'GwellCymru.com'. Dim ond tua 10,000 o

jobs have been created thus far. Do you expect to create some 24,000 new jobs this month?

**The First Minister:** The overall picture for job creation is extremely good. The latest figures show an increase of 61,000 jobs in Wales between the last quarter of 2001 and that of 2002. Circumstantial evidence shows that many of those jobs have been created in Objective 1 Wales, as unemployment is falling more rapidly there than in the rest of Wales. That is a good sign. I am aware of the figures to which you refer, but we believe that the pattern will become clearer when we have more accurate data on where jobs are being created. All that I can confirm is that the number of jobs in Wales is rising rapidly, more rapidly than in the UK, and unemployment is falling more rapidly in the Objective 1 area of Wales.

swyddi newydd a grewyd hyd yn hyn. A ydych yn disgwyl creu tua 24,000 o swyddi newydd y mis hwn?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r darlun cyffredinol o ran creu swyddi'n dda dros ben. Mae'r ffigurau diweddaraf yn dangos cynnydd o 61,000 o swyddi yng Nghymru rhwng chwarter olaf 2001 a chwarter olaf 2002. Mae tystiolaeth amgylchiadol yn dangos bod llawer o'r swyddi hynny wedi'u creu yng Nghymru Amcan 1, gan fod diweithdra'n disgyn yn gynt o lawer yno nag yng ngweddill Cymru. Mae hynny'n arwydd da. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r ffigurau y cyfeiriwch atynt, ond credwn y bydd y patrwm yn eglurach pan fydd gennym ddata manylach ynghylch lle y creir swyddi. Y cwbl y gallaf ei gadarnhau yw bod nifer y swyddi yng Nghymru'n codi'n gyflym, yn gynt nag yn y DU, a bod diweithdra'n gostwng yn gynt yn ardal Amcan 1 Cymru.

#### **Cynlluniau Peilot Wardeiniaid Cymdogaeth Neighbourhood Warden Pilot Schemes**

**Q7 Brian Gibbons:** Has the First Minister had any discussions with police services on the role of neighbourhood warden pilot schemes in Wales? (OAQ22602)

**The First Minister:** I have not had any direct discussions with police services on the role of particular neighbourhood warden schemes in Wales. However, I know that neighbourhood wardens can make an important contribution to building a sense of safety in communities and giving reassurance that enables people, particularly those who are vulnerable and elderly, to reclaim their streets and communities. We are aware of some nine neighbourhood watch schemes in Wales, four of which have been supported by UK Government resources and five by community safety partnerships.

**Brian Gibbons:** Do you agree that much of the most debilitating and destructive anti-social activity that blights the most needy communities in Wales does not include major crime but rather the incessant drip of vandalism, social nuisance, car theft and burglary, and that these are the type of

**C7 Brian Gibbons:** A yw'r Prif Weinidog wedi cynnal unrhyw drafodaethau â gwasanaethau'r heddlu ynghylch rôl cynlluniau peilot y wardeiniaid cymdogaeth yng Nghymru? (OAQ22602)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni chefais unrhyw drafodaethau uniongyrchol â gwasanaethau'r heddlu am rôl unrhyw gynlluniau wardeiniaid cymdogaeth penodol yng Nghymru. Er hynny, gwn fod wardeiniaid cymdogaeth yn gallu rhoi cyfraniad o bwys at feithrin ymdeimlad o ddiogelwch mewn cymunedau a rhoi'r tawelwch meddwl sy'n galluogi pobl, yn enwedig rhai sy'n oedranus ac yn agored i niwed, i hawlio'n ôl eu strydoedd a'u cymunedau. Gwyddom am ryw naw cynllun gwarchod cymdogol yng Nghymru, y cynhaliwyd pedwar ohonynt gan adnoddau Llywodraeth y DU a phump gan bartneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol.

**Brian Gibbons:** A ydych yn cytuno nad troseddu difrifol yw llawer o'r gweithgaredd gwrthgymdeithasol mwyaf gwanychol a dinistriol sy'n bla ar y cymunedau mwyaf anghenus yng Nghymru ond, yn hytrach, y llif diderfyn o fandaliaeth, niwsans cymdeithasol, dwyn ceir a byrgleriaeth, ac

activities that neighbourhood warden schemes are particularly suited to addressing, as you said in your initial reply? Do you also think that it would be appropriate for the police services in Wales to spend more time considering that option?

**The First Minister:** Yes, I do. It is not only neighbourhood warden schemes that tackle such issues: there are three or four different schemes that can achieve the same objective of helping to encourage people to act as the eyes and ears of the police force in order to drive drug dealers out of communities, to prevent teenage vandals getting out of hand and so on. Reducing youth nuisance, maintaining a pleasant built environment and preventing vandalism are important goals, which can be achieved by neighbourhood wardens or community support officers. That has also been a major role for Communities First constables in police authority areas that were eligible for such funding.

**David Davies:** Do you regret the fact that we are becoming increasingly dependent on neighbourhood warden schemes and other cut-price policing schemes to defend property owners against criminality? This is primarily because of a shortage of police officers and, secondly, because persistent criminals know that, in the unlikely event of being caught and convicted, they will face a meaningless sanction from judges and courts.

**The First Minister:** You are, yet again, *The Sun* editorial, in human form, at Assembly Member level. We must ensure that success in turning round difficult situations, such as vandalism, young people who cause nuisance to pensioners, or drug dealers and so on, is followed up and that best practice is spread across Wales. Some of the projects that I have visited recently show evidence of great success through the use of Communities First constables, neighbourhood wardens or community support officers. I am aware that some police forces are sceptical about CSOs. Gwent Police is the only police force in Wales that has applied for, and received, funding for CSOs. However, the other methods that we have mentioned are showing

mai'r rhain yw'r math o weithgareddau y mae cynlluniau wardeiniaid cymdogaeth yn arbennig o addas i'w trin, fel y dywedasoeh yn eich ymateb cyntaf? A ydych hefyd yn credu y byddai'n briodol i wasanaethau'r heddlu yng Nghymru dreulio mwy o amser yn ystyried y dewis hwnnw?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ydwyf. Nid y cynlluniau wardeiniaid cymdogaeth yw'r unig rai sy'n mynd i'r afael â materion o'r fath: mae tri neu bedwar gwahanol gynllun sy'n gallu cyflawni'r un amcan o helpu i annog pobl i weithredu fel llygiaid a chlustiau i'r heddlu er mwyn gyrru gwerthwyr cyffuriau o gymunedau, i atal fandaliaid yn eu harddegau rhag mynd dros ben llestri ac yn y blaen. Mae lleihau niwsans oddi wrth bobl ifanc, cynnal amgylchedd adeiledig dymunol ac atal fandaliaeth yn nodau pwysig, y gellir eu cyflawni drwy wardeiniaid cymdogaeth neu swyddogion cymorth cymunedol. Bu honno'n rôl bwysig erioed i gwnstabiliaid Cymunedau yn Gyntaf mewn ardaloedd awdurdod heddlu a oedd yn gymwys i gael cyllid o'r fath.

**David Davies:** A yw'n ofid i chi ein bod yn mynd yn fwyfwy dibynnol ar gynlluniau wardeiniaid cymdogaeth a chynlluniau plismona rhad eraill i amddiffyn perchnogion eiddo rhag troseddoldeb? Mae hyn yn ganlyniad yn bennaf i brinder heddweision ac, yn ail, i'r ffaith bod troseddwyr cyson yn gwybod, os cânt eu dal a'u dyfarnu'n euog, er annhebyced hynny, y byddant yn wynebu cosb ddiystyr gan farnwyr a llysoedd.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Chi, eto byth, yw erthygl olygyddol *The Sun* ar ffurf ddynol, ar lefel Aelod o'r Cynulliad. Rhaid inni sicrhau y dilynir y llwyddiant wrth weddnewid sefyllfaoedd anodd, fel fandaliaeth, pobl ifanc sy'n peri niwsans i bensynwyr, neu werthwyr cyffuriau ac yn y blaen, ac y caiff yr arferion gorau eu lledaenu ledled Cymru. Mae rhai o'r prosiectau yr ymwelais â hwy'n ddiweddar yn dangos tystiolaeth o lwyddiant mawr drwy ddefnyddio cwnstabiliaid Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, wardeiniaid cymdogaeth neu swyddogion cymorth cymunedol. Gwn fod rhai heddluoedd yn amheus ynghylch swyddogion cymorth cymunedol. Heddlu Gwent yw'r unig heddlu yng Nghymru sydd wedi ymgeisio am gyllid

signs of success and accomplishing what you believe is impossible in this country, David. It is not impossible—it is a matter of spreading best practice.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Do you remember the former Home Office minister who introduced the ‘Walking with a Purpose’ slogan, where neighbourhood wardens walked around villages? I wonder what David Davies thinks about that?

**David Davies:** May I answer that?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. You are not yet a Minister, David.

**The First Minister:** There are many ways of putting the frighteners on miscreants; David Davies dressed in a police uniform may be a suitable way of sending naughty children to bed or drug dealers packing. Perhaps we could suggest that to him after 1 May.

**Brian Hancock:** Do you agree that the Home Office should fund police services properly and fully? Islwyn has been fortunate in receiving some CSOs. However, chief constables will tell you that the Home Office is not listening to their priorities, nor to the priorities of Wales, and that we end up with warden schemes protecting the safety and security of our communities.

**The First Minister:** We are aware of the argument with regard to the Home Office funding rules, which give much additional funding to big city police forces with the worst crime levels. That causes difficulty for Welsh police forces, in particular Dyfed Powys Police, which has a phenomenal record of catching criminals; it is hurt by the reallocation of resources to the Metropolitan Police, the Greater Manchester Police and the Avon and Somerset Police for example. Money is being pumped into those forces to deal with huge crime waves and big-time drug-dealing gangs in some of England’s big cities. We have none of that in Wales. The

ar gyfer swyddogion cymorth cymunedol, a’i dderbyn. Er hynny, mae’r dulliau eraill yr ydym wedi cyfeirio atynt yn dangos arwyddion o lwyddiant ac o gyflawni’r hyn y credwch ei fod yn amhosibl yn y wlad hon, David. Nid yw’n amhosibl—mae’n fater o ledaenu’r arferion gorau.

**Lorraine Barrett:** A ydych yn cofio’r cyn-Weinidog yn y Swyddfa Gartref a gyflwynodd y slogan ‘*Walking with a Purpose*’, lle’r oedd wardeiniaid cymdogaeth yn cerdded o gwmpas pentrefi? Tybed beth yw barn David Davies am hynny?

**David Davies:** A gaf ateb hynny?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid ydych yn Weinidog eto, David.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae llawer dull a modd i godi braw ar ddrwgweithredwyr; efallai y byddai cael David Davies wedi’i wisgo fel heddwys yn fodd addas i yrru plant drwg i’w gwelyau neu i yrru gwerthwyr cyffuriau ar ffo. Efallai y gallem awgrymu hynny iddo ar ôl 1 Mai.

**Brian Hancock:** A ydych yn cytuno y dylai’r Swyddfa Gartref gyllido gwasanaethau’r heddlu yn llawn ac yn briodol? Bu Islwyn yn ffodus o gael rhai swyddogion cymorth cymunedol. Er hynny, dywed prif gwnstabiliaid wrthy ch nad yw’r Swyddfa Gartref yn gwrando ar eu blaenoriaethau hwy, na blaenoriaethau Cymru, ac mai’r hyn a gawn yn y diwedd yw cynlluniau wardeiniaid i sicrhau diogelwch ein cymunedau.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym yn ymwybodol o’r ddadl ynghylch rheolau cyllido’r Swyddfa Gartref, sy’n rhoi llawer o gyllid ychwanegol i heddluoedd y dinasoedd mawr sydd â’r lefelau gwaethaf o drosedd. Mae hynny’n peri anhawster i heddluoedd Cymru, yn enwedig Heddlu Dyfed Powys, sydd â record nodedig o ddal troseddwyr; mae wedi’i frifog gan yr adleoli ar adnoddau i Heddlu Llundain, Heddlu Manceinion Fwyaf a Heddlu Avon a Gwlad yr Haf, er enghraifft. Mae arian yn cael ei bwmpio i’r heddluoedd hynny er mwyn delio â’r tonnau enfawr o droseddu a’r gangiau gwerthu cyffuriau mawr yn rhai o ddinasoedd mawr Lloegr. Nid



reallocation is unpopular, but Edwina and I are trying to find constructive ways around it in meetings with Wales' chief constables.

oes gennym ddim o hynny yng Nghymru. Mae'r adleoli'n amhoblogaidd, ond mae Edwina a minnau'n ceisio dulliau adeiladol o ymdrin â hyn mewn cyfarfodydd gyda phrif gwnstabiliaid Cymru.

### Recruiwio Athrawon yng Ngogledd Cymru Recruitment of Teachers in North Wales

**Q8 Eleanor Burnham:** How many additional teachers have been recruited in north Wales since the partnership Government was established? (OAQ22605)

**C8 Eleanor Burnham:** Sawl athro ychwanegol sydd wedi'i recriwio yn y Gogledd ers sefydlu'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth? (OAQ22605)

**The First Minister:** The latest figure is 50. However, that only covers the first two years, from January 2000 to January 2002 because the school census data for the year since January 2002 is not yet to hand.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Y ffigur diweddaraf yw 50. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny ond yn cynnwys y ddwy flynedd cyntaf, o Ionawr 2000 hyd Ionawr 2002 gan nad yw'r data o'r cyfrifiad ysgolion ar gyfer y flwyddyn ers Ionawr 2002 wedi dod i law eto.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I welcome the commitment shown by the partnership Government to education in north Wales and across the country. However, the secondary sector is generally failing to fill teaching posts. For example, in Gwynedd and Anglesey, 1,000 primary school places have been lost in the last three years due to the falling number of pupils; yet, two thirds of those on teacher training courses in Wales wish to work in the primary sector, while 10 per cent of secondary posts are empty. Do you agree that we must make teaching in secondary schools a more appealing option for trainees? How do you propose to do that?

**Eleanor Burnham:** Croesawaf yr ymrwymiad a amlygwyd gan y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth i addysg yn y Gogledd ac ar draws y wlad. Fodd bynnag, mae'r sector ysgolion uwchradd, yn gyffredinol, yn methu â llenwi swyddi athrawon. Er enghraifft, yng Ngwynedd ac Ynys Môn, collwyd 1,000 o leoedd mewn ysgolion cynradd yn y tair blynedd diwethaf oherwydd gostyngiad yn nifer y disgyblion; ac eto, mae dwy ran o dair o'r rhai sy'n dilyn cyrsiau hyfforddiant athrawon yng Nghymru'n dymuno gweithio yn y sector ysgolion cynradd, tra bo 10 y cant o'r swyddi mewn ysgolion uwchradd yn wag. A gytunwch fod rhaid inni beri bod dysgu mewn ysgolion uwchradd yn ddewis mwy deniadol i rai dan hyfforddiant? Sut yr ydych yn bwriadu gwneud hynny?

2.30 p.m.

**The First Minister:** The number of graduates applying for postgraduate certificate of education courses to be secondary teachers in Wales at 24 January this year shows a rise of 17.1 per cent compared with this time last year. This shows that the problem—if it exists—will soon be solved.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gwelwyd cynnydd o 17.1 y cant ar 24 Ionawr eleni yn nifer y graddedigion sy'n ymgeisio am dystysgrif addysg i raddedigion i ddod yn athrawon ysgol uwchradd yng Nghymru o'i gymharu â'r adeg hon y llynedd. Dengys hynny y bydd y broblem—os yw'n bod—yn cael ei datrys cyn hir.

**Dafydd Wigley:** O gofio bod cyfartaledd maint dosbarthiadau uwchradd yng Nghymru wedi codi o 20.7 i 21.3 rhwng 1999 a 2001, a bod y cynnydd yng nghostau cyllido

**Dafydd Wigley:** Bearing in mind that average class sizes in secondary schools increased from 20.7 to 21.3 between 1999 and 2001, and that the increase in sixth form

chweched dosbarth yn cynnwys cynnydd o 10 y cant yn nifer y disgyblion rhwng Medi 2000 a Medi 2002, cynnydd o 5 y cant yn y gost cyllido pensiynau, a chynnydd o 1 y cant yn y gost yswiriant gwladol yn ychwanegol at y 2.7 y cant o ran chwyddiant cyflogau—gan roi cynnydd o 19 y cant—sut all codiad o 7.5 y cant yn yr arian a ddarperir gan Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru ddatrys y sefyllfa? Onid yw'n anorfod y bydd maint dosbarthiadau chweched dosbarth yn parhau i godi yn sylweddol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn siŵr o hynny. Yr oedd sefydlu'r system ar y cyd rhwng ELWa, colegau addysg bellach, ac awdurdodau lleol, o ran y dull traddodiadol o ariannu'r chweched dosbarth, a chymryd y cyfrifoldeb am hynny, yn golygu cysoni'r ddwy system. Yr oedd hefyd yn golygu cysoni, i raddau helaeth, yr hollt cynyddol rhwng tâl athrawon ysgol a thâl darlithwyr addysg bellach. Setlir hyn gan y grant ychwanegol o £9 miliwn a ddarparwyd ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf. Yr ydym hefyd yn ceisio sicrhau bod plant 16 oed yn cael dewis yr hyn sydd orau iddynt hwy yn hytrach na pharhau â'r hen gwestiwn o bwy sydd yn berchen ar beth o ran colegau addysg bellach a'r chweched dosbarth traddodiadol.

**Alun Pugh:** I am glad that you raised further education because good teachers are essential, as are good buildings. Will you join me in congratulating Abergele College on establishing a high-quality centre of excellence in that town?

**The First Minister:** I recently visited Coleg Abergele, which is semi-detached from Ysgol Emrys ap Iwan. They both serve approximately the same catchment area, which means that adults can attend courses that were previously the reserve of sixth formers. Conversely, sixth formers can undertake vocational courses alongside more academic A-level subjects at the same location. That provision answers Dafydd Wigley's argument that this is bad for sixth forms. The Abergele-type solution suits both sides; it offers a choice of what best suits the sixth formers and adults who have been attracted to the Abergele campus of Llandrillo College.

funding costs includes a 10 per cent increase in the number of pupils between September 2000 and September 2002, an increase of 5 per cent in pension costs, and an increase of 1 per cent in national insurance costs in addition to the wage inflation of 2.7 per cent—giving an increase of 19 per cent—how can the 7.5 per cent increase in the funding provided by Education and Learning Wales be sufficient? Is it not unavoidable that sixth form class sizes will continue to swell significantly?

**The First Minister:** I am not sure about that. Establishing the collaborative system between ELWa, further education colleges, and local authorities in terms of the traditional way of funding sixth forms, and taking responsibility for that, meant making both systems compatible. It also meant closing, to a great extent, the increasing gap between the salaries of schoolteachers and further education lecturers. That will be settled by the additional grant of £9 million provided for next year. We are also trying to ensure that 16-year-olds are able to choose what is best for them rather than continuing with the old question of who owns what between further education colleges and traditional sixth forms.

**Alun Pugh:** Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi codi mater addysg bellach gan fod athrawon da yn hollbwysig, fel y mae adeiladau da. A wnewch ymuno â mi i longyfarch Coleg Abergele ar sefydlu canolfan ragoriaeth o ansawdd yn y dref honno?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ymwelais â Choleg Abergele, sydd ar led-wahân i Ysgol Emrys ap Iwan, yn ddiweddar. Mae'r ddau'n gwasanaethu'r un dalgylch yn fras, ac mae hynny'n golygu y gall oedolion ddilyn cyrsiau a oedd gynt yn faes i fyfyrwyr chweched dosbarth. Ar y llaw arall, gall myfyrwyr chweched dosbarth ddilyn cyrsiau galwedigaethol ochr yn ochr â phynciau Safon Uwch mwy academiaidd yn yr un man. Mae'r ddarpariaeth honno'n ateb dadl Dafydd Wigley fod hyn yn beth drwg i fyfyrwyr chweched dosbarth. Mae'r ateb yn null Abergele yn addas i'r ddwy ochr; mae'n cynnig dewis o'r hyn sy'n gweddu orau i'r myfyrwyr chweched dosbarth ac i'r oedolion a ddenwyd i gampws Coleg Llandrillo yn

Abergele.

**Peter Rogers:** Teaching is the most vulnerable profession. Should this not be recognised and should teachers already in the profession not be given all possible support to stop the drain away from it? Mrs Ann Hughes, headmistress of Ysgol Goronwy Owen, Benllech, is a perfect example. She was suspended by the council on paid leave for six months following malicious claims made, mainly, by a local councillor who has since been served with a police harassment order for stalking her. The Assembly has been investigating the complaint against the council since May, yet three weeks ago, the Isle of Anglesey County Council put Mrs Hughes's name forward to attend a reception at 10 Downing Street in recognition of her contribution to services for pupils with special needs. Does not this hypocritical treatment need urgent investigation?

**Peter Rogers:** Dysgu yw'r proffesiwn sy'n fwyaf agored i niwed. Oni ddylid cydnabod hynny ac oni ddylai athrawon sydd eisoes yn y proffesiwn gael pob cefnogaeth bosibl er mwyn atal y niferoedd sy'n ei adael? Mae Mrs Ann Hughes, prifathrawes Ysgol Goronwy Owen, Benllech, yn enghraifft berffaith. Fe'i hataliwyd o'i swydd ar gyflog gan y cyngor ar ôl honiadau maleisus a wnaed, yn bennaf, gan gynghorydd lleol y cyflwynwyd gorchymyn aflonyddu iddo bellach gan yr heddlu am ei fod yn ei dilyn. Mae'r Cynulliad yn ymchwilio i'r gŵyn yn erbyn y cyngor ers mis Mai, ac eto dair wythnos yn ôl, cyflwynodd Cyngor Sir Ynys Môn enw Mrs Hughes i fod yn bresennol mewn derbyniad yn 10 Stryd Downing er mwyn cydnabod ei chyfraniad i wasanaethau ar gyfer disgyblion sydd ag anghenion arbennig. Onid oes angen ymchwilio ar fyrder i'r driniaeth ragrithiol hon?

**The First Minister:** I will not criticise without knowing the details. The story you relate, the details of which I have no reason to doubt, is extremely convoluted and verges on the bizarre in terms of whether Anglesey council values this teacher's services highly or not. I would be grateful for more detail. With regard to our involvement in a regulatory or monitoring role, I will look into the matter and write to you.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni wnafe feirniadu heb wybod y manylion. Mae'r hanes a adroddwch, nad oes gennyf unrhyw le i amau ei fanylion, yn un tra astrus ac yn ymylu ar fod yn anhygoel o ran ystyried a yw cyngor Ynys Môn yn rhoi gwerth ar wasanaethau'r athrawes hon ai peidio. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar o gael rhagor o fanylion. O ran ein cysylltiad ni mewn rôl rheoleiddio neu fonitro, gwnaf ymchwilio i'r mater ac ysgrifennu atoch.

### **Datblygu Polisi Policy Development**

**C10 Cynog Dafis:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar ei flaenoriaethau ef o ran datblygu polisi yn ystod y ddau fis nesaf? (OAQ22598)

**Q10 Cynog Dafis:** Will the First Minister make a statement on his priorities with regard to policy development for the next two months? (OAQ22598)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n blaenoriaethau wedi eu gosod yn y 'Cynllun i Gymru'. Ni fyddwn yn disgwyl iddynt newid ond byddwn yn disgwyl symud ymlaen gyda'r blaenoriaethau hynny, sef creu mwy o swyddi yn ychwanegol at y 61,000 o swyddi a grëwyd yng Nghymru dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, a chodi ansawdd y swyddi hynny. Bu inni weithio i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw y bore yma gydag Adam Ingram wrth drafod sefydlu canolfan newydd yr Asiantaeth Atgyweirio

**The First Minister:** Our priorities have been set out in the 'Plan for Wales'. I would not expect them to change but I would expect to progress with those priorities, adding to the 61,000 jobs that have been created in Wales over the last year, and improving the quality of those jobs. We were working towards that this morning with Adam Ingram when discussing establishing the new Defence Aviation Repair Agency centre. The new Centerprise International Ltd factory in

Awyrennau Amddiffyn. Bydd ffatri newydd Centerprise International Cyf yng Nghaerffili, a gyhoeddwyd ddydd Gwener diwethaf, hefyd yn creu tua 100 o swyddi technolegol ychwanegol, a fydd yn gofyn am sgiliau uwch ac yn talu cyflogau uwch.

**Cynog Dafis:** A ydych yn cytuno y dylai fod yn flaenoriaeth i roi hwb i'r ddwy ardal sydd wedi dioddef yn arbennig yn ddiweddar, sef Aberteifi ac Abergwaun? Yr wyf wedi gweld y cynllun gweithredu a baratowyd ar gyfer Abergwaun, ond, hyd yn hyn, nid yw'n rhoi manylion am y cynlluniau a fydd yn cael eu gweithredu. Pryd fydd gwybodaeth bendant a manwl ar gael ar sut y gweithredir y cynllun hwn yn ymarferol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn derbyn eich pwynt; mae eisiau rhagor o fanylion ar y ffordd y bydd y cynllun hwn yn cael ei weithredu. Fodd bynnag, credaf y byddech yn derbyn nad mater o ddatblygu polisi yw hynny ond mater o'r ffordd yr ydych yn gweithredu polisi mewn ardal sydd wedi dioddef ergydion caled, fel arfordir gogledd Sir Benfro a de Ceredigion.

**Nick Bourne:** Further to your comments on the job losses in west Wales, do you agree that the outward migration of people from west Wales has a serious effect on rural communities and the Welsh language? We know that there has been a decline—admittedly only a small decline, but a decline nevertheless—in the number of people speaking Welsh in parts of rural west Wales. Is it not important for the Government to undertake a review of rural public services as a whole, in particular the health service, as we know that delivering healthcare in a rural setting is different from delivering it in an urban setting? I have urged the Minister for Health and Social Services to consider this; will you consider it urgently?

**The First Minister:** You have raised three questions. Your figures on the number of Welsh speakers do not appear to tally with mine. I understood from the census that the percentage of people speaking Welsh had risen, not fallen. On the cost of delivering health services being different in rural areas, it is markedly different and has always been

Caerphilly, which was announced last Friday, will also create 100 additional technological jobs that will require higher skill levels and will pay higher salaries.

**Cynog Dafis:** Do you agree that giving a boost to the two areas that have suffered particularly recently, namely Cardigan and Fishguard, should be a priority? I have seen the action plan for Fishguard but, as yet, it does not give details of the schemes to be implemented. When will we have definite and detailed information on the way in which this action plan is to be implemented in practical terms?

**The First Minister:** I accept your point; we need more detail about the way in which the plan will be rolled out. However, I am sure that you would accept that this is not a matter of policy development but a matter of the way in which you implement policy in an area that has suffered severe blows, such as the coast of north Pembrokeshire and south Ceredigion.

**Nick Bourne:** Ymhellach i'ch sylwadau am golledion swyddi yn y Gorllewin, a ydych yn cytuno bod allfudiad pobl o'r Gorllewin yn cael effaith ddifrifol ar gymunedau gwledig ac ar y Gymraeg? Gwyddom fod dirywiad wedi bod—dim ond dirywiad bach, rhaid cyfaddef, ond dirywiad er hynny—yn nifer y rhai sy'n siarad y Gymraeg yn rhannau gwledig y Gorllewin. Onid yw'n bwysig i'r Llywodraeth gynnal adolygiad o wasanaethau cyhoeddus gwledig yn eu cyfanrwydd, yn enwedig y gwasanaeth iechyd, gan y gwyddom fod darparu gofal iechyd mewn lleoliad gwledig yn wahanol i'w ddarparu mewn lleoliad trefol? Yr wyf wedi annog y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i ystyried hyn; a wnewch chi ei ystyried ar frys?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych wedi codi tri chwestiwn. Ymddengys nad yw'ch ffigurau chi ar nifer y siaradwyr Cymraeg yn cyd-fynd â'm rhai i. Deëllais o'r cyfrifiad fod canran y rhai sy'n siarad y Gymraeg wedi codi, nid gostwng. Ynghylch y gwahaniaeth yn y gost o ddarparu gwasanaethau iechyd mewn ardaloedd gwledig, mae'n dra wahanol a bu

so, particularly in Powys, as that is the only area of Wales—and possibly the only part of the UK—not to have a district general hospital. It also has different administrative arrangements for that reason. The lack of a district general hospital means that people requiring tertiary care are distributed between Shrewsbury, Aberystwyth, Carmarthen, Abergavenny, and so on. We take all of those problems into consideration when making healthcare provision arrangements.

felly erioed, yn enwedig ym Mhowys, gan mai honno yw'r unig ardal yng Nghymru—a'r unig ran o'r DU o bosibl—sydd heb ysbyty dosbarth cyffredinol. Mae ei threfniadau gweinyddol yn wahanol oherwydd hynny hefyd. Gan nad oes ysbyty dosbarth cyffredinol yno, mae rhai y mae arnynt angen gofal trydyddol yn cael eu dosbarthu rhwng Amwythig, Aberystwyth, Caerfyrddin, y Fenni, ac yn y blaen. Yr ydym yn ystyried yr holl broblemau hynny wrth wneud trefniadau i ddarparu gofal iechyd.

### **Tocynnau Mantais Bws i Ddnyion dros 60 Oed Free Bus Passes for Men Aged Over 60**

**Q11 Christine Chapman:** What action is the Welsh Assembly Government taking to publicise free bus passes for men aged over 60 from 1 April? (OAQ22609)

**C11 Christine Chapman:** Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn eu cymryd i roi cyhoeddusrwydd i'r ffaith y caiff dynion dros 60 oed basiau i deithio am ddim ar fysiau o 1 Ebrill ymlaen? (OAQ22609)

**The First Minister:** I declare an interest in this issue—I wish that people would not continue to ask me questions on this matter, as I have to declare an interest every time. The Minister for Environment launched an advertising campaign on 10 February and a series of regional launches will be held at the end of March and the beginning of April.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Datganaf fuddiant yn y mater hwn—byddai'n dda gennyf pe na fyddai pobl yn dal i ofyn cwestiynau i mi ar y mater hwn, gan fod rhaid imi ddatgan buddiant bob tro. Lansiodd y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd ymgyrch hysbysebu ar 10 Chwefror a chynhelir cyfres o gyfarfodydd lansio rhanbarthol ddiwedd Mawrth a dechrau Ebrill.

**Christine Chapman:** It is almost a year since the launch of the free bus pass scheme, and we know that it has been a resounding success. In my constituency, as in others, it has helped to increase independence, access and mobility, to encourage social contact, and to reduce isolation. Do you agree that it is important that local bus services are reliable? I have often spoken about this in Plenary. If we are to maximise this benefit for the over 60s and the disabled, will you ensure that the Assembly does everything possible to address this issue?

**Christine Chapman:** Mae blwyddyn, bron, ers lansio'r cynllun tocynnau bws am ddim, a gwyddom iddo fod yn llwyddiant digamsyniol. Yn fy etholaeth i, yn yr un modd ag eraill, bu o gymorth i hybu annibyniaeth, mynediad a symudoledd, i feithrin cysylltiadau cymdeithasol, ac i leihau arwahanrwydd. A gytunwch ei bod yn bwysig bod gwasanaethau bysiau lleol yn ddibynadwy? Yr wyf wedi sôn am hyn yn aml mewn Cyfarfodydd Llawn. Os ydym i sicrhau'r budd mwyaf posibl i rai dros 60 oed a'r anabl, a wnewch sicrhau bod y Cynulliad yn gwneud popeth y gellir ei wneud i ymdrin â'r mater hwn?

**The First Minister:** That is a matter for the Department for Transport's regulatory services, not a matter for us, through the transport commissioner's system. However, on a recent visit to Cynon Valley, a local journalist forcibly made the point to me that one of the biggest running sores in Cynon

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hynny'n fater i wasanaethau rheoliadol yr Adran Drafnidiaeth, nid i ni, drwy system y comisiynydd trafnidiaeth. Fodd bynnag, pan ymwelais â Chwm Cynon yn ddiweddar, gwnaeth newyddiadurwr lleol gyfleu'n gryf i mi mai un o'r pethau a barai'r dicter mwyaf

Valley was the unreliability of the local bus service. When you have a successful policy, as this undoubtedly is for all the reasons you listed, it is important that you follow it through so that service operators can take advantage of it. Using the over 60s, who use the service with free bus passes, as a backbone for providing increased and more reliable services to a wider range of destinations would lead to an increase in ridership, which is the technical term, of buses throughout Wales. It would also extend the scheme to include those who cannot access free bus passes at present because of a lack of bus services in their areas, by using the success of the bus services, as they are currently funded, as the basis for expanding the number of areas where bus services are available.

2.40 p.m.

**Janet Davies:** Given the increased use of bus services, what action will your Government take to ensure that the allocation of finance to local government for the free bus passes is addressed so that the present disparities, whereby some councils are underfunded and others appear to be overfunded, are relieved?

**The First Minister:** This is a vexed issue. Detailed negotiations took place with the Welsh Local Government Association in the run-up to the launch. A formula was agreed by all local authorities and that formula has since been implemented. If new figures come to light indicating that that figure needs to be adjusted because some authorities may be overfunded and others may be underfunded, we will take that on board during the next budgeting period. However, if you make a stab at this in agreement with Wales's 22 local authorities, you will not necessarily get it right the first time. Everyone has signed up to this on the grounds that they are keen that this policy be implemented. Local authorities have implemented it, and it is a success. Any tweaking that is required should not detract from the enormous success of the policy.

yng Nghwm Cynon oedd diffyg dibynadwyedd y gwasanaeth bysiau lleol. Pan geir polisi llwyddiannus, fel y mae'r polisi hwn am yr holl resymau yr ydych wedi'u rhestru, mae'n bwysig ei ddilyn i'r pen fel bod gweithredwyr gwasanaethau'n gallu manteisio arno. Os gellid defnyddio'r rhai dros 60 oed, sy'n defnyddio'r gwasanaeth gyda thocynnau bws am ddim, fel asgwrn cefn i fwy o ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau ac i wasanaethau mwy dibynadwy a gyrhaeddai amryw o fannau ychwanegol, byddai hynny'n peri cynnydd yn nifer y teithwyr rheolaidd ar fysiau ledled Cymru. Byddai hefyd yn ymestyn y cynllun i gynnwys rhai nad ydynt yn gallu cael tocynnau bws am ddim ar hyn o bryd am nad oes gwasanaethau bysiau yn eu hardal, drwy ddefnyddio llwyddiant y gwasanaethau bysiau, fel y'u cyllidir ar hyn o bryd, i sicrhau bod gwasanaethau bysiau ar gael mewn rhagor o ardaloedd.

**Janet Davies:** Yng ngolwg y ffaith bod mwy o ddefnydd ar wasanaethau bysiau, pa gamau y bydd eich Llywodraeth yn eu cymryd i sicrhau y rhoddir sylw i'r dyrannu ar gyllid i lywodraeth leol ar gyfer tocynnau bws am ddim fel y gellir lliniaru'r anghyfartaledd presennol, sy'n golygu nad yw rhai cynghorau'n cael digon o gyllid a bod eraill, i bob golwg, yn cael gormod?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hyn yn fater dyrys. Cafwyd negodiadau manwl â Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru yn y cyfnod cyn lansio. Cytunwyd ar fformiwla gan yr holl awdurdodau lleol a rhoddwyd y fformiwla honno ar waith ers hynny. Os daw ffigurau newydd i law sy'n dangos bod angen newid y fformiwla honno am fod rhai awdurdodau'n cael gormod o gyllid, o bosibl, ac eraill heb gael digon, gwnawn ystyried hynny yn ystod y cyfnod cyllidebu nesaf. Fodd bynnag, os rhowch gynnig arni mewn cytundeb â'r 22 awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru, nid ydych yn sicr o'i gael yn iawn y tro cyntaf. Mae pawb wedi cytuno i hyn am eu bod yn awyddus i'r polisi hwn gael ei roi ar waith. Mae awdurdodau lleol wedi'i roi ar waith, ac mae'n llwyddiant. Os bydd angen unrhyw fân newidiadau, ni ddylai hynny dynnu oddi wrth lwyddiant aruthrol y polisi.

**William Graham:** Will you indicate the cost of screening the current advertising campaign to publicise the availability of free bus passes?

**The First Minister:** I will just check whether I have details of the cost of the 30-second and 10-second television adverts with me. I do not, but I will write to you to inform you of the cost of the advertising campaign.

**William Graham:** A wnewch nodi'r gost o ddarlledu'r ymgyrch hysbysebu bresennol i dynnu sylw at y ffaith bod tocynnau bws am ddim ar gael?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Fe edrychaf i weld a yw manylion cost yr hysbysebion teledu 30-eiliad a 10-eiliad gennyf. Nid yw'r manylion gennyf, ond gwnaf ysgrifennu atoch i roi gwybod ichi am gost yr ymgyrch hysbysebu.

**Datganiad ar Ymateb i Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig ar Dechnoleg Gwybodaeth a Chyfathrebu yng Nghymru Wledig  
Statement on the Response to the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee's Report on Information and Communications Technology in Rural Wales**

**The Deputy First Minister and Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad (Michael German):** I welcome the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee's report on ICT in rural Wales and congratulate the Committee on its thorough investigation. The availability of high-quality ICT provision in our rural communities and businesses in rural areas is crucial to their future. The Cabinet has carefully considered the report's recommendations and I have recently sent a detailed written response on behalf of the Cabinet to the Chair of the Committee.

The exploitation of ICT to build a strong, sustainable, competitive and prosperous economy is a recurrent theme throughout 'A Winning Wales' and we are in the process of rolling out 'A Winning Wales' across rural Wales. This includes addressing the ICT needs of rural areas.

Both Cymru Ar-lein—Online for a Better Wales and Broadband Wales have been much discussed recently, but I want to highlight what they are delivering for rural areas. I will first discuss Cymru Ar-lein. It explicitly addresses the needs of rural Wales, as it is designed to create a Wales where all businesses, wherever they are located, are able to exploit ICT fully in order to improve their competitiveness, and to enable them to innovate and grow. It is a European exemplar of regional government action in the development of ICT, addressing not just

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor (Michael German):** Croesawaf adroddiad y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig ar TGCh yng Nghymru wledig a llongyfarchaf y Pwyllgor ar ei ymchwiliad trwyadl. Mae'n hollbwysig i ddyfodol ein cymunedau gwledig a busnesau mewn ardaloedd gwledig fod darpariaeth TGCh o ansawdd da ar gael iddynt. Mae'r Cabinet wedi ystyried argymhellion yr adroddiad yn ofalus ac yr wyf wedi anfon ymateb ysgrifenedig manwl yn ddiweddar ar ran y Cabinet at Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor.

Mae defnyddio TGCh i adeiladu economi gryf, gynaliadwy, gystadleuol a ffyniannus yn thema sy'n codi dro ar ôl tro drwy 'Cymru'n Ennill' ac yr ydym ar ganol lledaenu 'Cymru'n Ennill' ar draws Cymru wledig. Mae hynny'n cynnwys ymdrin ag anghenion TGCh ardaloedd gwledig.

Bu llawer o drafod ar Cymru Ar-lein—Online for a Better Wales a Band Eang Cymru yn ddiweddar, ond yr wyf am dynnu sylw at y modd y maent yn mynd â'r maen i'r wal dros ardaloedd gwledig. Ymdrniaf â Cymru Ar-lein yn gyntaf. Mae'n ymwneud yn benodol ag anghenion Cymru wledig, a'i amcan yw creu Cymru lle y mae pob busnes, ym mha le bynnag y mae, yn gallu defnyddio TGCh i'r eithaf er mwyn bod yn fwy cystadleuol, a chael arloesi a thyfu. Mae'n esiampl Ewropeaidd o weithredu gan lywodraeth ranbarthol i ddatblygu TGCh,

cables, wires and signals but connectivity, content and capability as well.

We support a range of programmes through Cymru Ar-lein designed to assist communities and small and medium-sized enterprises to get the most from ICT, particularly for businesses to improve their competitiveness through the effective take-up of e-commerce. These include providing £750,000 per annum for three years through the Welsh Development Agency for the provision of impartial, free ICT advice to small businesses across Wales; looking at how the existing e-business clubs operating in Wales can benefit from working collaboratively to help them raise the level of awareness of the potential benefits of ICT to a wider audience of SMEs; promoting the benefits of ICT to businesses and communities in rural Wales through the £21 million Opportunity Wales project; supporting business support initiatives such as the WDA's mobile training centre, which tours Wales highlighting the benefits of ICT and allows a high-tech, IT-equipped, broadband-connected facility to be taken out to SMEs; introducing a large-scale e-communities programme, working with ELWa and the WDA, to help individuals, families, businesses, voluntary organisations and schools in communities across Wales make more effective use of the internet and ICT; and establishing local ICT support centres to provide technical or mentoring advice and offer free hands-on technical services on a proactive basis.

We also have the all-Wales network of ICT support centre advisers, who can provide demonstrations of ICT solutions to SMEs, and the ICT support centres themselves, which we have equipped with broadband technology to offer a 'try-before-you-buy' facility. In addition, ELWa has established a pre-pilot e-placement scheme in Pembrokeshire that will be followed by a number of full pilots this year, followed by roll-out across Wales.

Cymru Ar-lein also takes full account of

sy'n ymdrin nid yn unig â cheblau, gwifrau a signalau ond â chysylltedd, cynnwys a gallu hefyd.

Yr ydym yn cefnogi amrediad o raglenni drwy Cymru Ar-lein sydd â'r bwriad o helpu cymunedau a busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint i gael y budd mwyaf o TGCh, fel y gall busnesau, yn benodol, ddod yn fwy cystadleuol drwy ymgymryd ag e-fasnach yn effeithiol. Ymhlith y rhain y mae'r ddarpariaeth o £750,000 y flwyddyn dros dair blynedd drwy Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru i ddarparu cyngor diduedd ar TGCh yn rhad ac am ddim i fusnesau bach ledled Cymru; ystyried sut y gall y clybiau e-fusnes sy'n gweithredu yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd gael budd o gydweithio i helpu i hybu ymwybyddiaeth o fanteision dichonol TGCh ymysg cynulleidfa ehangach o fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint; hyrwyddo manteision TGCh ymysg busnesau a chymunedau yng Nghymru wledig drwy'r prosiect Cyfle Cymru sy'n werth £21 miliwn; cefnogi mentrau cymorth busnes fel canolfan hyfforddi symudol y WDA, sy'n teithio Cymru gan dynnu sylw at fanteision TGCh ac yn cynnig modd i ddangos cyfleuster uwchdechnolegol â chyfarpar TG a chysylltiad â'r band eang i fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yn y fan a'r lle; cyflwyno rhaglen e-gymunedau helaeth, gan weithio gydag ELWa a'r WDA, i helpu unigolion, teuluoedd, busnesau, cyrff gwirfoddol ac ysgolion mewn cymunedau ledled Cymru i ddefnyddio'r rhyngwyd a TGCh yn fwy effeithiol; a sefydlu canolfannau cymorth TGCh lleol i ddarparu cyngor technegol a mentora a chynnig gwasanaethau technegol uniongyrchol yn rhad ac am ddim mewn dull rhagweithiol.

Yn ogystal â hynny, mae gennym rwydwaith o gynghorwyr canolfan cymorth TGCh i Gymru gyfan, sy'n gallu arddangos atebion TGCh i fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint, ac i'r canolfannau cymorth TGCh eu hun, yr ydym wedi'u cyfarparu â thechnoleg band eang er mwyn cynnig cyfleuster 'profi cyn prynu'. At hynny, mae ELWa wedi cychwyn cynllun e-leoliadau cyn-ragbrofol yn Sir Benfro cyn cynnal nifer o ragbrofion llawn eleni, a'i ledaenu ledled Cymru ar ôl hynny.

Mae Cymru Ar-lein yn rhoi pob ystyriaeth



Wales's bilingual identity, in its policy development and service delivery processes. It is particularly important that service users can access ICT through their chosen language, and the Assembly Government is committed to building on the principles and actions outlined in 'Iaith Pawb', its national action plan for a bilingual Wales. Set out in this is a range of projects being introduced by the Welsh Language Board, which reflect the importance of developing new opportunities to use the language and ensuring that it is promoted on the internet and in new IT packages.

Broadband Wales is the largest comprehensive UK broadband initiative and is designed to address market failure in Wales. A five-year, £115 million comprehensive supply and demand side interventions programme will help extend the foundations of an all-Wales broadband infrastructure, stimulating significant further private investment in the future.

Our aim is that, within five years, Broadband Wales will have increased the affordable availability of terrestrial broadband services in Wales by 30 per cent and brought broadband to virtually all new and existing business parks in Wales that have identified a need. It will also make the cost of broadband services in Wales far more competitive, bringing broadband to 310,000 extra homes and 67,000 businesses by 2007. Some of its key activities include delivering financial interventions, namely small tactical subsidy schemes such as for satellite broadband and large-scale strategic interventions through a reverse subsidy auction, to enhance large parts of the Welsh infrastructure; addressing high-end broadband users and international connectivity as well as the entry level ADSL-type services that some suppliers would have us believe is all that matters; and supporting local projects and initiatives, such as e-fro and Arwain, to show us what different technologies can do.

Crucially, it is technology-neutral, supporting the most appropriate technology

hefyd i hunaniaeth ddwyieithog Cymru, yn ei brosesau datblygu polisi a darparu gwasanaethau. Mae'n arbennig o bwysig bod defnyddwyr gwasanaethau'n gallu defnyddio TGCh drwy eu dewis iaith, ac mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ymrwmo i adeiladu ar sail yr egwyddorion a'r camau gweithredu a ddisgrifir yn 'Iaith Pawb', ei chynllun gweithredu cenedlaethol ar gyfer Cymru ddwyieithog. Ynndo nodir amrediad o brosiectau a gyflwynir gan Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg, sy'n adlewyrchu pwysigrwydd datblygu cyfleoedd newydd i ddefnyddio'r iaith a sicrhau y caiff ei hyrwyddo ar y rhyngwyd ac mewn pecynnau TG newydd.

Band Eang Cymru yw'r fenter band eang gynhwysfawr fwyaf yn y DU a'i bwriad yw ymdrin â methiant y farchnad yng Nghymru. Bydd rhaglen bum mlynedd gynhwysfawr o ymyriadau ar ochr y cyflenwad a'r galw, sy'n werth £115 miliwn, yn gymorth i ymestyn seilwaith band eang i Gymru gyfan, gan ysgogi buddsoddiad preifat sylweddol pellach yn y dyfodol.

Ein nod ar gyfer Band Eang Cymru yw y bydd, o fewn pum mlynedd, wedi darparu 30 y cant yn rhagor o wasanaethau band eang daearol fforddiadwy yng Nghymru ac y bydd wedi dod â band eang i ymron bob parc busnes yng Nghymru sydd wedi nodi bod arnynt ei angen, boed yn barc newydd neu'n un sy'n bod eisoes. Bydd hefyd yn peri i gost gwasanaethau band eang yng Nghymru fod yn llawer mwy cystadleuol, gan ddod â band eang i 310,000 o gartrefi ychwanegol a 67,000 o fusnesau erbyn 2007. Rhai o'i brif weithgareddau yw darparu ymyriadau ariannol, sef cynlluniau cymhorthdal tactegol bach fel yr un ar gyfer band eang drwy loeren ac ymyriadau strategol helaeth drwy arwerthiant cymorthdaliadau gwrthol, i wella rhannau helaeth o'r seilwaith yng Nghymru; rhoi sylw i ddefnyddwyr band eang yn y pen uchaf a chysylltedd rhyngwladol yn ogystal â'r gwasanaethau o'r math ASDL ar gyfer dechreuwyr y byddai rhai cyflenwyr am inni gredu mai hwy'n unig sy'n cyfrif; a helpu prosiectau a mentrau lleol, megis e-fro ac Arwain, i ddangos inni beth y gall gwahanol dechnolegau eu gwneud.

Mae o'r pwys mwyaf ei fod yn ddiuedd o ran technoleg, ac yn cefnogi'r dechnoleg

for the area at the time and allowing different companies to deliver solutions. After all, effective competition and a viable market is what will drive prices down for consumers in the long term, not ongoing subsidies. That reduction in cost is a major factor for rural users.

A range of initiatives in both the private and public sectors is being introduced. For businesses, these include the satellite subsidy scheme, which makes broadband an affordable option for businesses in Wales, and the broadband demonstration centres throughout Wales, which let businesses try before they buy. For the public sector, there is the lifelong learning network, providing broadband to schools, learning centres and libraries in Wales—we have spent £10 million on supplying multimedia equipment at these locations. There is also a £20 million contract to provide broadband connectivity to all hospitals in Wales, providing up to 550 hospitals, general practitioners and homeworkers with high-speed broadband connectivity which makes it much easier for clinicians to share information and undertake remote diagnostics. We are continuing to work to aggregate public sector demand and local authorities are expected to be connected to the core network by the end of March 2003. We are also continuing to press the UK Government and the Radiocommunications Agency to ensure that the needs of Wales are taken fully into account in the issue of licences for the 3.4 GHz waveband spectrum and other future licence auctions.

Ultimately, affordable access to broadband is impossible without the appropriate means of supply, and, yet, without demand, commercial operators will not find it economically viable to invest in Wales and roll out their broadband infrastructure at a competitive price. The Assembly Government has recognised this fact, and over the lifetime of Broadband Wales, we aim to create a virtuous circle where increased demand feeds further supply leading to further increases in demand and supply.

sy'n fwyaf addas i'r ardal dan sylw ar y pryd ac yn caniatáu i wahanol gwmnïau roi atebion ar waith. Wedi'r cwbl, cystadlu effeithiol a marchnad ddichonadwy yw'r hyn a fydd yn gyrru'r prisiau i lawr ar gyfer cwsmeriaid yn y pen draw, nid cymorthdaliadau parhaus. Mae'r gostyngiad hwnnw yn y gost yn ffactor o bwys i ddefnyddwyr gwledig.

Cyflwynir amrediad o fentrau yn y sectorau preifat a chyhoeddus. Ar gyfer busnesau, mae'r rhain yn cynnwys y cynllun cymhorthdal lloeren, sy'n peri bod band eang yn ddewis fforddiadwy i fusnesau yng Nghymru, a'r canolfannau arddangos band eang ledled Cymru, sy'n gadael i fusnesau brofi cyn prynu. I'r sector cyhoeddus, mae rhwydwaith dysgu gydol oes, sy'n darparu'r band eang ar gyfer ysgolion, canolfannau dysgu a llyfrgelloedd yng Nghymru—yr ydym wedi gwario £10 miliwn ar gyflenwi offer amlgyfrwng yn y lleoliadau hyn. Mae contract o £20 miliwn hefyd i ddarparu cysylltedd â'r band eang ar gyfer yr holl ysbytai yng Nghymru, fel y bydd hyd at 550 o ysbytai, meddygon teulu a gweithwyr cartref yn meddu ar gysylltedd cyflym drwy'r band eang sy'n ei gwneud yn haws o lawer i glinigwyr rannu gwybodaeth ac ymgymryd â diagnosteg o bell. Yr ydym yn dal i weithio i gyfuno'r galw gan y sector cyhoeddus a disgwylir y bydd awdurdodau lleol wedi'u cysylltu â'r rhwydwaith craidd erbyn diwedd Mawrth 2003. Yr ydym hefyd yn dal i bwysu ar Lywodraeth y DU a'r Asiantaeth Radio-gyfathrebu i sicrhau ystyriaeth lawn i anghenion Cymru wrth roi trwyddedau ar gyfer y rhychwant tonfedd 3.4 GHz ac wrth arwerthu trwyddedau eraill yn y dyfodol.

Yn y pen draw, ni ellir cael mynediad fforddiadwy i fand eang heb ddull cyflenwi priodol, ac eto, heb y galw, ni fydd gweithredwyr masnachol yn ei chael yn economaidd ddichonadwy buddsoddi yng Nghymru a darparu eu seilwaith band eang am bris cystadleuol. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cydnabod y ffaith hon ac, yn ystod oes Band Eang Cymru, bwriadwn greu cylch rhinweddol lle y mae galw cynyddol yn porthi cyflenwad pellach gan arwain at gynydd pellach yn y galw a'r cyflenwad.

In summary, with these two initiatives and with ICT being a cross-cutting theme in our main policies, the Assembly Government is making excellent progress towards meeting the ICT needs of rural Wales. The recommendations made in the Committee's report have contributed to this and I look forward to working with it to support and develop the delivery of high-quality ICT services across rural Wales.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Thank you for your statement. You said that you believe it to be crucial to have a technology-neutral approach to broadband connection in Wales. Perhaps you should rephrase that as a technology-neutered approach, given that you seem to be ignoring the technology. You do not have a strategic plan to ensure that people in rural areas can get that connection. What in this statement is specific to rural areas? Your approach is the same as that which the Minister for Economic Development has for the whole of Wales. There is nothing specifically rural in your statement; you have merely taken part of the text that we have had read to us on several occasions by Andrew Davies and presented it as a rural strategy. The truth of the matter is that there is no rural strategy.

2.50 p.m.

For urban communities, we are clear that DSL is the most suitable technology and that a capital investment of some £35 million would bring broadband to about 80 per cent of the population. The situation in rural areas is different and, in those areas, we need to consider wireless technology. That should be reserved for those rural areas that are too remote from exchanges to benefit from DSL. A proper strategy would identify the frequencies needed by various communities. However, you prefer ad hoc initiatives, without a strategy or pattern. That has led to a situation where, for the 3.5 GHz licence auction, Wales has been divided into four areas linked to England.

You said in your statement:

I grynhoi, gyda'r ddwy fenter hon a TGCh yn thema drawsbynciol yn ein prif bolisiau, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwneud cynnydd rhagorol tuag at ddiwallu anghenion TGCh Cymru wledig. Mae'r argymhellion yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor wedi cyfrannu at hyn ac edrychaf ymlaen at weithio gydag ef i hybu a datblygu'r gwaith o ddarparu gwasanaethau TGCh o ansawdd da ledled Cymru wledig.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Diolch i chi am eich datganiad. Dywedasoeh eich bod yn credu ei bod yn hollbwysig cael ymagwedd ddiuedd at dechnoleg o ran cysylltiadau band eang yng Nghymru. Efallai y dylech aralleirio hynny a'i galw'n ymagwedd ysbaddedig, gan ei bod yn ymddangos eich bod yn anwybyddu'r dechnoleg. Nid oes gennych strategaeth i sicrhau bod pobl mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn gallu cael y cysylltiad hwnnw. Pa beth yn y datganiad hwn sy'n ymwneud yn benodol ag ardaloedd gwledig? Yr un yw'ch ymagwedd chi â'r un sydd gan y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd ar gyfer Cymru gyfan. Nid oes dim sy'n benodol wledig yn eich datganiad; y cwbl a wnaethoch oedd cymryd rhan o'r testun a ddarllenwyd i ni ar sawl achlysur gan Andrew Davies a'i chyflwyno fel strategaeth wledig. Y gwir amdani yw nad oes strategaeth wledig.

Yn achos cymunedau trefol, deallwn mai DSL yw'r dechnoleg fwyaf addas ac y byddai buddsoddiad cyfalaf o tua £35 miliwn yn dod â'r band eang i tua 80 y cant o'r boblogaeth. Mae'r sefyllfa mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn wahanol ac, yn yr ardaloedd hynny, rhaid inni ystyried technoleg ddi-wifr. Dylid cadw hynny ar gyfer yr ardaloedd gwledig hynny sy'n rhy bell o gyfnewidfydd i allu defnyddio DSL. Byddai strategaeth briodol yn dynodi'r amleddau y mae ar wahanol gymunedau eu hangen. Fodd bynnag, mae'n well gennych fentrau unswydd, heb strategaeth neu batrwm. Mae hynny wedi arwain at sefyllfa, yn achos yr arwerthiant o drwyddedau 3.5 GHz, lle y mae Cymru wedi'i rhannu'n bedair ardal a gysylltir â Lloegr.

Dywedasoeh yn eich datganiad:

'We also continue to press the UK Government and the Radiocommunications Agency to ensure that the needs of Wales are taken fully into account in the issue of the licences of 3.4 GHz waveband spectrum'.

The truth of the matter, Minister, is that it is far too late. You have already lost that battle—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I wish that the acting spokesperson for ICT would not make a speech, but would ask a question.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I am attempting to ask some questions, but I am trying to inform the Minister at the same time—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. In statements, I allow preambles for one spokesperson from each party group. Yours has been a substantial preamble and we should have some questions now.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** What are you doing, Minister, to reserve a limited number of satellite channels for Wales once we move to SDSL? I presume, Minister, that you agree that Wales should have some 400 channels. What are you doing to reserve those channels for rural areas in Wales? I presume that you are aware that once you use wireless connections they cannot be reused. What are you doing to ensure those connections are available for businesses in rural areas? What are you doing to ensure that some of the money in the Objective 1 programme for broadband will be spent in rural areas? You have not yet spent a penny of it.

**Michael German:** I do not want to say 'wrong, wrong and wrong', but I will correct you on one matter. You referred to a 3.5 GHz licence; 3.4 GHz is correct.

More than half of the Broadband Wales investment money provided is for rural areas. The Assembly's intervention aims to address the parts of Wales where the private sector cannot intervene. In terms of ADSL, SDSL

Yr ydym hefyd yn dal i bwysu ar Lywodraeth y DU a'r Asiantaeth Radio-gyfathrebu i sicrhau ystyriaeth lawn i anghenion Cymru wrth roi trwyddedau ar gyfer y rhychwant tonfedd 3.4 GHz.

Y gwir amdani, Weinidog, yw ei bod yn rhy hwyr o lawer. Yr ydych eisoes wedi colli'r frwydr honno—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Byddai'n dda gennyf pe na fyddai'r llefarydd gweithredol ar TGCh yn gwneud araith, ond y byddai'n gofyn cwestiwn.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr wyf yn ceisio gofyn rhai cwestiynau, ond yr wyf yn ceisio hysbysu'r Gweinidog ar yr un pryd—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mewn datganiadau, yr wyf yn caniatáu rhagymadroddi gan un llefarydd o bob grŵp plaid. Yr ydych chi wedi rhagymadroddi'n helaeth a dylem gael rhai cwestiynau'n awr.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud, Weinidog, i gadw nifer fach o sianeli lloeren ar gyfer Cymru wedi inni symud at SDSL? Yr wyf yn cymryd, Weinidog, eich bod yn cytuno y dylai Cymru gael tua 400 o sianeli. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i gadw'r sianeli hynny ar gyfer ardaloedd gwledig yng Nghymru? Cymeraf eich bod yn ymwybodol o'r ffaith na ellir aildefnyddio cysylltiadau di-wifr ar ôl eu defnyddio am y tro cyntaf. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod y cysylltiadau hynny ar gael i fusnesau mewn ardaloedd gwledig? Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i sicrhau y bydd rhywfaint o'r arian yn y rhaglen Amcan 1 ar gyfer y band eang yn cael ei wario mewn ardaloedd gwledig? Nid ydych wedi gwario'r un geiniog ohono eto.

**Michael German:** Nid wyf am ddweud 'anghywir, anghywir ac anghywir', ond gwnaf eich cywiro ar un mater. Gwnaethoch gyfeirio at drwydded 3.5 GHz; 3.4 GHz sy'n gywir.

Mae mwy na hanner yr arian buddsoddi a ddarparwyd ar gyfer Band Eang Cymru wedi'i neilltuo i ardaloedd gwledig. Drwy ymyrryd mae'r Cynulliad yn ceisio rhoi sylw i'r rhannau o Gymru lle na all y sector preifat

and DSL, the marketplace has largely taken that up except for where the support for work on exchanges has been provided by the Welsh Development Agency through existing schemes. The whole thrust of the strategy is technology-neutral. That is why it is important that we seek opportunities to provide broadband through wireless transmission. You cannot identify a single frequency that would be suitable for rural areas. Some wave carriers will carry distances, some will bounce off the side of mountains and some will not. You have to judge each community separately. I am pleased to tell you that the agency is likely to consider bids from small rural areas rather than large conurbations in the future.

I am hopeful that that will happen in Wales and that the agency will receive bids from companies that want to tackle those issues. On reverse subsidy auction, which I am sure you are aware of, an open procurement exercise would decipher what level of broadband businesses in Wales would receive were the Assembly Government to invest however many millions. That answers the accusation that we are not moving forward. We will use the most suitable technology, whether it be optic fibre, cable, twisted cable, wireless or satellite.

**Mick Bates:** I thank the Minister for his statement, and the Committee and its Chair for undertaking this important review. There is no doubt that ICT will strengthen the viability of rural communities by exposing local businesses to the wider world of commerce, in particular, tourism. Similarly, ICT allows rural communities to promote themselves, and by extension, their distinct cultures to the whole world, while gathering more information.

Two particular issues must be addressed. First, while I accept the usefulness of the satellite broadband subsidy scheme, which is 50 per cent—and businesses in my constituency are using it; although satellite occasionally has a time delay and the dial-up

ymyrryd. O ran ADSL, SDSL a DSL, mae'r farchnad wedi ymgymryd â hynny i raddau helaeth heblaw am y cymorth a roddwyd ar gyfer gwaith ar gyfnewidfeydd gan Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru drwy gynlluniau sy'n bod eisoes. Ymagwedd ddiduedd at dechnoleg a geir yn y strategaeth drwyddi draw. Dyna pam y mae'n bwysig inni geisio cyfleoedd i ddarparu band eang drwy drosglwyddo di-wifr. Ni ellir dynodi un amledd a fyddai'n addas i ardaloedd gwledig. Bydd rhai cludwyr tonnau'n teithio cryn bellter, bydd rhai'n sboncio oddi ar ochrau mynyddoedd ac eraill ddim. Rhaid ystyried pob cymuned ar wahân. Yr wyf yn falch o ddweud wrthyf fod yr asiantaeth yn debygol o ystyried ceisiadau gan ardaloedd gwledig bach yn hytrach na chytrefi mawr yn y dyfodol.

Yr wyf yn hyderus y bydd hynny'n digwydd yng Nghymru ac y bydd yr asiantaeth yn derbyn ceisiadau oddi wrth gwmnïau sydd am ymdrin â'r materion hynny. Ynghylch yr arwerthiannau gwrthol o gymorthdaliadau, yr wyf yn sicr y gwyddoch amdano, byddai ymarferiad caffael agored yn canfod pa lefel o'r band eang y byddai busnesau yng Nghymru'n ei chael os byddai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn buddsoddi hyn a hyn o filiynau. Mae hynny'n ateb y cyhuddiad nad ydym yn symud ymlaen. Gwnawn ddefnyddio'r dechnoleg fwyaf addas, boed honno'n ffeibrau optig, cebl, cebl troellog, di-wifr neu loeren.

**Mick Bates:** Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei ddatganiad, ac i'r Pwyllgor a'i Gadeirydd am ymgymryd â'r adolygiad pwysig hwn. Nid oes amheuaeth na fydd TGCh yn peri i gymunedau gwledig fod yn fyw dichonadwy drwy agor busnesau lleol i fyd masnach ehangach, ac i dwristiaeth yn enwedig. Yn yr un modd, mae TGCh yn caniatáu i gymunedau gwledig eu hyrwyddo eu hunain, a thrwy estyniad, eu diwylliannau gwahanol ledled y byd, gan gasglu rhagor o wybodaeth yr un pryd.

Rhaid ymdrin â dau fater penodol. Yn gyntaf, er fy mod yn derbyn bod y cynllun cymhorthdal band eang lloeren, sy'n cynnig 50 y cant, yn ddefnyddiol—ac mae busnesau yn fy etholaeth i'n ei ddefnyddio; er bod oedi ambell waith gyda thechnoleg lloeren a bod y

system is sometimes just as good—we must consider the roll-out of wireless into rural areas. While there is optic fibre technology in my constituency in the main towns, remote areas do not have it. There is no scheme at present that would roll-out wireless technology. Will you highlight the money and the schemes that will provide rural Wales with that technology?

Secondly, will you consider the costs of connecting wireless to the BT system, because they can be prohibitive for small community schemes? I recently visited one such scheme in Portishead in Bristol, where the cost issue was the only major obstacle to taking up more small businesses through a wireless broadband scheme. If we crack those two issues, we will be able to bring broadband to all of rural Wales.

**Michael German:** The Assembly Government funds the e-fro broadband wireless project to test out the access for wireless in a rural community, specifically in Dyffryn Ogwen, near Bethesda. It is intended to try to stimulate the demand for broadband and create online communities, which will enable us to roll it out elsewhere in Wales. I am hopeful that the agency responsible for the licensing at the Radiocommunications Agency will soon enable bidders to make local bids in future auctions. It may then be possible to make specific bids, such as making a wireless scheme available to Llanidloes. The funding that is available is used in a whole raft of projects, some of which I mentioned earlier. However, our intention is to support markets where there is market failure because the private sector will not be able to bear the costs of bringing broadband to rural communities.

**Peter Rogers:** It is typical, Mike, that you should be making this statement today, following the furore regarding computers in rural Wales over the last few years, and particularly following your comments in the National Farmers' Union annual meeting in Stoneleigh. How will you instil confidence in those living in rural areas that you are the man to deliver this? I have heard so many

system deialu lawn cystal weithiau—rhaid inni ystyried lledaenu technoleg ddi-wifr mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Er bod technoleg ffeibrau optig yn fy etholaeth i yn y prif drefi, nid ydyw i'w chael mewn ardaloedd diarffordd. Nid oes cynllun ar hyn o bryd a fyddai'n lledaenu technoleg ddi-wifr. A wnewch dynnu sylw at yr arian a'r cynlluniau a ddarparar'r dechnoleg honno ar gyfer Cymru wledig?

Yn ail, a wnewch ystyried costau cysylltu'r dechnoleg ddi-wifr â system BT, oherwydd gallant fod yn ormod i gynlluniau cymunedol bach? Ymwelais ag un cynllun o'r fath yn ddiweddar yn Portishead ym Mryste, ac yn y fan honno mater y gost oedd yr unig rwystr mawr rhag cynnwys rhagor o fusnesau bach mewn cynllun band eang di-wifr. Os gwnawn ddatrys y ddau fater hynny, byddwn yn gallu dod â band eang i'r cyfan o Gymru wledig.

**Michael German:** Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cyllido'r prosiect band eang di-wifr e-fro i roi prawf ar fynediad drwy dechnoleg ddi-wifr mewn cymuned wledig, yn benodol yn Nyffryn Ogwen, ger Bethesda, yn yr achos hwn. Bwriedir ceisio symbylu'r galw am fand eang a chreu cymunedau ar-lein, a fydd yn ein galluogi i'w lledaenu mewn mannau eraill yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn hyderus y bydd yr asiantaeth sy'n gyfrifol am drwyddedu yn yr Asiantaeth Radio-gyfathrebu yn galluogi ymgeiswyr cyn hir i gyflwyno ceisiadau lleol mewn arwerthiannau yn y dyfodol. Wedyn gallai fod yn bosibl cyflwyno ceisiadau penodol, fel un i ddarparu cynllun di-wifr ar gyfer Llanidloes. Defnyddir y cyllid sydd ar gael mewn toreth o brosiectau, y cyfeiriais at rai ohonynt yn gynharach. Fodd bynnag, ein bwriad yw cefnogi marchnadoedd pan fo methiant yn y farchnad oherwydd ni fydd y sector preifat yn gallu dwyn y costau o ddod â band eang i gymunedau gwledig.

**Peter Rogers:** Mae'n nodweddiadol, Mike, mai chi sy'n gwneud y datganiad hwn heddiw, ar ôl yr helynt ynghylch cyfrifiaduron yng Nghymru wledig dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf, ac yn enwedig yn sgîl eich sylwadau yng nghyfarfod blynyddol Undeb Cenedlaethol yr Amaethwyr yn Stoneleigh. Sut y gwnewch ennyn hyder yn y rhai sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd gwledig i

times that everything that has gone wrong in rural areas concerns ICT or computers. We must have action, not words. You have not delivered ICT in the divisional offices. You must cut out the fluffy talk and start delivering. How can you overcome the problem of installing computer networks in rural areas? A number of practicalities must be addressed more thoroughly. This review began in 2001. Almost two years on, can you give us a strict timetable of the current procedures for installing connections and for training and advising local communities on the benefits of information and communications technology?

gredu mai chi yw'r un i gyflawni hyn? Clywais gynifer o weithiau fod popeth a aeth o'i le mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn ymwneud â TGCh neu gyfrifiaduron. Rhaid inni gael gweithredu, nid geiriau. Nid ydych wedi rhoi TGCh ar waith yn y swyddfeydd rhanbarthol. Rhaid ichi hepgor y siarad niwlog a dechrau mynd â'r maen i'r wal. Sut y gallwch oresgyn y broblem o osod rhwydweithiau cyfrifiadurol mewn ardaloedd gwledig? Rhaid ymdrin yn fwy trylwyr â nifer o faterion ymarferol. Dechreuodd yr adolygiad hwn yn 2001. Ar ôl ymron ddwy flynedd, a allwch roi amserlen bendant i ni o'r gweithdrefnau presennol ar gyfer gosod cysylltiadau a hyfforddi a chynghori cymunedau lleol ynghylch manteision technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu?

3.00 p.m.

What provisions will the Government put in place to ensure that ICT access costs will be no more expensive in rural areas than in more densely populated areas? The Agriculture and Rural Development Committee report makes that important recommendation. That is an important factor. It is also crucial that money is invested into ICT in rural areas, but that needs to be counterbalanced by investing much-needed funds into rural businesses. It is all very well providing greater access to ICT in rural areas, but there will be little point in doing so unless individuals can gain business advantages from it.

Pa ddarpariaethau a wnaiff y Llywodraeth i sicrhau na fydd y costau o gael TGCh yn ddрутach mewn ardaloedd gwledig nag mewn ardaloedd mwy poblog? Mae adroddiad y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig yn gwneud yr argymhelliad pwysig hwnnw. Mae hynny'n ffactor pwysig. Mae hefyd yn hollbwysig y caiff arian ei fuddsoddi mewn TGCh mewn ardaloedd gwledig, ond rhaid gwrthbwysio hynny drwy fuddsoddi cyllid y mae mawr angen amdano mewn busnesau gwledig. Mae'n iawn darparu rhagor o fynediad i TGCh mewn ardaloedd gwledig, ond nid oes fawr o ddiben gwneud hynny os na all unigolion gael manteision busnes drwyddi.

We have learned recently of concerns that you kept money out of the rural economy by trapping many millions of pounds with auctioneers and brokers even though that money was needed to develop those very businesses.

Cawsom wybod yn ddiweddar am bryderon eich bod wedi cadw arian oddi wrth yr economi wledig drwy gadw miliynau lawer o bunnoedd yn nwylo arwerthwyr a broceriaid er bod angen yr arian hwnnw i ddatblygu'r union fusnesau hynny.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Issues relating to agricultural policy are not directly relevant to this statement. You may answer the remaining points, Minister.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw materion sy'n ymwneud â pholisi amaethyddol yn uniongyrchol berthnasol i'r datganiad hwn. Cewch ateb y pwyntiau sy'n weddill, Weinidog.

**Michael German:** The real issues—which Peter was trying to get at—are how to support companies to become ICT proficient, and how to assimilate demand. The budget

**Michael German:** Y materion pwysig—yr oedd Peter yn ceisio dod atynt—yw sut i helpu cwmnïau i ddod yn hyfedr mewn TGCh, a sut i ddiwallu'r galw. Cyllideb ar

available for Broadband Wales is primarily for rural areas. Over the next five years, the budget for demand stimulation is £8 million and the available budget for supply stimulation is a further £15 million. All of that information is available, which you might want to know.

I want to talk briefly about Opportunity Wales, which provides mid-term ICT advice to small and medium-sized enterprises throughout Objective 1 areas. The scheme, run by the private sector, is soon to be rolled out in the rest of Wales. It is a public-private partnership venture worth £21 million and, in its first six months, provided support to over 1,200 small and medium-sized enterprises across Objective 1 areas in Wales. Rest assured that no effort is spared in providing the necessary advice, via both the Welsh Development Agency and Opportunity Wales. However, the aim is to try to counteract market failure. If the market cannot provide the ICT support, then the Assembly Government will do so.

**Phil Williams:** I live in a rural area, too far from an exchange to get digital subscriber line, but in sight of a transmitting mast. Do you agree that my best hope of getting broadband access in the near future is for the Government to determine the number and range of potential users in rural areas within sight of each existing transmitter, and to identify the most suitable frequency from the available set in each case, to avoid frequency contention? Do you agree that it would then be possible to extend broadband to all of Wales at far less capital cost than £150 million and long before five years?

**Michael German:** If it were as simple as that, Phil, the matter would have been dealt with differently. Of course I would like to talk to you about nanotubes, but we are a little further down the line than present technology.

Licences for wireless is the crucial issue for the future, and is the best opportunity for rural Wales; different frequencies will suit

gyfer ardaloedd gwledig yn bennaf yw un Band Eang Cymru. Dros y pum mlynedd nesaf, y gyllideb ar gyfer ysgogi'r galw yw £8 miliwn ac mae'r gyllideb sydd ar gael i symbylu'r cyflenwad yn £15 miliwn ar ben hynny. Mae'r holl wybodaeth honno ar gael, ac efallai yr hoffech ei chael.

Dymunaf siarad yn fyr am Cyfle Cymru, sy'n darparu cyngor canol tymor ar TGCh ar gyfer busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint ledled ardaloedd Amcan 1. Mae'r cynllun hwnnw, sy'n cael ei redeg gan y sector preifat, i'w ledaenu cyn hir i weddill Cymru. Mae'n fenter partneriaeth gyhoeddus-preifat sy'n werth £21 miliwn ac, yn ei chwe mis cyntaf, rhoddodd gymorth i fwy na 1,200 o fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint ledled ardaloedd Amcan 1 yng Nghymru. Cewch fod yn dawel eich meddwl y gwneir pob ymdrech i ddarparu'r cyngor sydd ei angen, drwy Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a Cyfle Cymru. Yr amcan, fodd bynnag, yw ceisio gwrthweithio methiant y farchnad. Os na all y farchnad ddarparu cymorth TGCh, bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwneud hynny.

**Phil Williams:** Yr wyf yn byw mewn ardal wledig, sy'n rhy bell o gyfnewidfa i gael llinell danysgrifio ddigidol, ond sydd yng ngolwg mast trosglwyddo. A ydych yn cytuno mai'r gobaith mwyaf sydd gennyf o gael defnyddio band eang yn y dyfodol agos yw i'r Llywodraeth bennu nifer ac amrediad y defnyddwyr dichonol mewn ardaloedd gwledig sydd o fewn golwg pob trosglwyddydd sy'n bod eisoes, a phennu'r amledd mwyaf addas o blith y set sydd ar gael ym mhob achos, er mwyn osgoi cystadlu am amleddau? A ydych yn cytuno y byddai modd wedyn ymestyn band eang i gynnwys Cymru gyfan am gost cyfalaf lai o lawer na £150 miliwn ac ymhell cyn pen pum mlynedd?

**Michael German:** Pe byddai cyn symled â hynny, Phil, byddai'r mater wedi'i drafod yn wahanol. Byddwn wrth fy modd yn siarad â chi am nanotiwbiau, wrth gwrs, ond yr ydym wedi mynd ychydig ymhellach na'r dechnoleg bresennol.

Trwyddedau ar gyfer y dechnoleg ddi-wifr yw'r mater hollbwysig ar gyfer y dyfodol, a dyma'r cyfle gorau i Gymru wledig; bydd



different geographical areas. My earlier announcement—that the Radiocommunications Agency is closely considering whether or not it can persuade bidders to make local bids—will help that along. A bidder can determine the geographical landscape of a local area, and our task is to support that bidding process, to ensure that bids are appropriate to local geography. We must work closely with the agency to ensure that bids progress rapidly. A wide range of frequencies are still available and are underused.

**Glyn Davies:** I will respect your wish that I ask just one question, Llywydd, but I hope that you will allow me, as Chair of the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee, to thank the Minister for his statement. I also thank him for his detailed response to me, which I shall make available to the Committee. I am sure that we will return to this issue in the future.

I have a general question for the Minister, which picks up on the question asked by Rhodri Glyn Thomas. We often talk of ICT's potential to benefit rural Wales. However, I have always feared that ICT development has the potential to increase the technology gap, which would be a great disadvantage to rural Wales. Do you accept that that is a real possibility? Do you also accept that it is your job, and that of the Government, to identify that possibility, and to ensure that there is a transfer of investment and that a greater proportion of your effort is spent in dealing with rural Wales to tackle this potential for a widening technology gap? People automatically assume at present that that gap will narrow.

**Michael German:** The issues that you raise are relevant to rural areas around Europe, where not being close to the appropriate broadband technology puts companies at a disadvantage, and does not permit the latest form of company development to take place. That is why the Broadband Wales programme is so important. If you consider that more than half of the existing programme is going into rural areas, that means that, per head of population,

gwahanol amleddau'n addas i wahanol ardaloedd daearyddol. Bydd y cyhoeddiad a wneuthum yn gynharach—bod yr Asiantaeth Cysylltiadau Radio yn ystyried yn fanwl a all ddarbwylllo ymgeiswyr i gyflwyno ceisiadau lleol—yn rhoi hwb i hynny. Caiff ymgeisydd bennu tirlun daearyddol ardal leol, a'n tasg ni yw cefnogi'r broses ymgeisio honno, i sicrhau bod ceisiadau'n addas i ddaearyddiaeth leol. Rhaid inni gydweithio'n agos â'r asiantaeth i sicrhau yr aiff ceisiadau yn eu blaen yn gyflym. Mae amrediad eang o amleddau ar gael o hyd ac nid oes digon o ddefnydd arnynt.

**Glyn Davies:** Gwnaf barchu'ch dymuniad imi ofyn ond un cwestiwn, Lywydd, ond gobeithiaf y gwnewch ganiataú i mi, fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig, ddiolch i'r Gweinidog am ei ddatganiad. Diolchaf iddo hefyd am ei ymateb manwl i mi, y byddaf yn ei ddarparu i'r Pwyllgor. Yr wyf yn siŵr y deawn yn ôl at y mater hwn yn y dyfodol.

Mae gennyf gwestiwn cyffredinol i'r Gweinidog, sy'n dilyn y cwestiwn a ofynnodd Rhodri Glyn Thomas. Byddwn yn sôn yn aml am y potensial sydd mewn TGCh i ddod â budd i Gymru wledig. Er hynny, yr wyf yn ofni erioed y gallai datblygu TGCh fod yn fodd i ehangu'r bwloch technoleg, a byddai hynny'n anfantais fawr i Gymru wledig. A ydych yn derbyn y gallai hynny ddigwydd? A ydych hefyd yn derbyn mai'ch gwaith chi, a gwaith y Llywodraeth, yw canfod y posibilrwydd hwnnw, a sicrhau'ch bod yn trosglwyddo buddsoddiad ac yn gwneud mwy o ymdrech wrth ddelio â Chymru wledig i ymdrin â'r posibilrwydd o ymledu yn y bwloch technoleg? Ar hyn o bryd, mae pobl yn ei chymryd yn ganiataol y bydd y bwloch hwnnw'n lleihau.

**Michael German:** Mae'r materion yr ydych yn eu codi'n berthnasol i ardaloedd gwledig ledled Ewrop, lle y mae pellter o'r dechnoleg band eang briodol yn rhoi cwmnïau o dan anfantais ac yn rhwystro datblygu'r math diweddaraf o gwmni. Dyna pam y mae rhaglen Band Eang Cymru mor bwysig. Os ystyriwch fod mwy na hanner y rhaglen bresennol yn mynd at ardaloedd gwledig, golyga hynny fod ardaloedd gwledig Cymru'n cael mwy o fudd ohoni, a hynny'n

disproportionately, Wales's rural areas benefit more from it. The Welsh Assembly Government—probably uniquely in the United Kingdom—is trying to address the market failure where the market cannot supply the appropriate levels of broadband because it does not have the demand generated in advance for it. It is addressing that intervention, and, as I said in my statement, it is not about sustaining subsidies, it is about promoting the market so that it grows itself, and from then on it becomes self-sustainable. This objective is about redressing the disadvantage.

**Brian Hancock:** Minister, you talk about the roll-out of broadband to schools, libraries, hospitals and GPs and that if Objective 1 could achieve only one project it would be the roll-out of broadband. Therefore, if we are talking about ICT, why have rural post offices not been included in this roll-out? There is a network of post offices; they have the Horizon computer system, and they could serve rural communities well.

**Michael German:** I understand the issue concerning the trial that took place in England of the project that was demonstrated to us in the neuadd by the Post Office. I hope that the Post Office will continue that project and that it will be taken forward further. However, small businesses, wherever they are, can access the Broadband Wales programme, and there are regional, local, and specific initiatives to allow companies to take the opportunities on board. The availability of affordable terrestrial broadband services in Wales will be increased during the lifespan of the five-year broadband Wales programme by 30 per cent. That is an extra 67,000 businesses across Wales that proportionately, as I explained, are potentially able to access broadband in that period. I hope that the Post Office sector, as you mentioned, will be part of that.

anghyfartal, am bob pen o'r boblogaeth. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru—ac mae'n unigryw yn y Deyrnas Unedig yn hyn o beth, yn ôl pob tebyg—yn ceisio ymdrin â methiant y farchnad lle na all y farchnad gyflenwi'r lefelau priodol o'r dechnoleg band eang am na chrewyd y galw amdani ymlaen llaw. Mae'n rhoi sylw i'r ymyriad hwnnw ac, fel y dywedais yn fy natganiad, nid parhau â chymorthdaliadau yw'r bwriad, ond hyrwyddo'r farchnad fel ei bod yn tyfu, ac yn dod yn hunangynhaliol o hynny ymlaen. Cywiro'r anfantais yw'r amcan yn hyn o beth.

**Brian Hancock:** Weinidog, yr ydych yn sôn am ledaenu band eang i ysgolion, llyfrgelloedd, ysbytai a meddygon teulu ac, os mai dim ond un prosiect y gallai Amcan 1 ei gyflawni, lledaenu band eang fyddai hwnnw. Gan hynny, os ydym yn sôn am TGCh, pam nad yw swyddfeydd post gwledig wedi'u cynnwys wrth ei ledaenu? Mae rhwydwaith o swyddfeydd post; mae system gyfrifiaduron Horizon ganddynt, a gallent wasanaethu cymunedau gwledig yn dda.

**Michael German:** Yr wyf yn deall y mater sy'n codi ynghylch y rhagbrawf a fu yn Lloegr ar y prosiect a ddangoswyd i ni yn y neuadd gan Swyddfa'r Post. Gobeithiaf y bydd Swyddfa'r Post yn parhau â'r prosiect hwnnw ac y caiff ei ddatblygu ymhellach. Fodd bynnag, mae busnesau bach, ym mha le bynnag y maent, yn gallu defnyddio rhaglen Band Eang Cymru, ac mae mentrau rhanbarthol, lleol a phenodol i ganiatáu i gwmnïau fanteisio ar y cyfleoedd. Bydd 30 y cant yn rhagor o wasanaethau band eang daearol fforddiadwy ar gael yng Nghymru erbyn diwedd oes pum mlynedd rhaglen Band Eang Cymru. Dyna 67,000 o fusnesau ychwanegol ledled Cymru a fyddai, yn ôl eu cyfran, fel yr eglurais, yn gallu cael y band eang yn y cyfnod hwnnw. Gobeithiaf y bydd sector Swyddfa'r Post, fel y gwnaethoch sôn, yn rhan o hynny.

### **Datganiad Busnes Business Statement**

**The Business Minister (Carwyn Jones):** Y Trefnydd (Carwyn Jones): Nid oes There are no changes to this week's business. newidiadau i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Am

As for the next three weeks' business, the draft statement can be found on the Chamberweb under supporting documents. Following the Business Committee meeting this morning, the Deputy Presiding Officer determined that, under Standing Order No. 22.5, the following items of legislation need not be referred to a Subject Committee for extended consideration: the Basic Curriculum for Wales (Amendment) Order 2003; the Revenue Support Grant (Specified Bodies) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003; the Feeding Stuffs (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003; the Residential Family Centres (Wales) Regulations 2003; the National Health Service (General Medical Services) (Amendment) (No. 2) (Wales) Regulations 2003; the National Health Service (General Dental Services) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003; the National Health Service (Pharmaceutical Services) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003; the National Health Service (General Ophthalmic Services) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003; the Health and Social Care Act 2001 (Commencement No. 4) (Wales) Order 2003; and the Local Health Boards (Transfer of Staff) (Wales) Order 2003.

fusnes y tair wythnos nesaf, gellir gweld y datganiad drafft ar we'r Siambr o dan ddogfennau ategol. Yn dilyn y cyfarfod o'r Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, penderfynodd y Dirprwy Lywydd, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.5, nad oes angen cyfeirio'r eitemau deddfwriaeth a ganlyn i Bwyllgor Pwnc i'w hystyried yn helaethach: Gorchymyn y Cwricwlwm Sylfaenol ar gyfer Cymru (Diwygio) 2003; Rheoliadau Grant Cynnal Refeniw (Cyrff Penodedig) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003; Rheoliadau Porthiant (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003; Rheoliadau Canolfannau Preswyl i Deuluoedd (Cymru) 2003; Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Meddygol Cyffredinol) (Diwygio) (Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2003; Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003; Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Fferyllol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003; Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Offthalmig Cyffredinol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003; Gorchymyn Deddf Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol 2001 (Cychwyn Rhif 4) (Cymru) 2003; a Gorchymyn y Byrddau Iechyd Lleol (Trosglwyddo Staff) (Cymru) 2003.

3.10 p.m.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiadau i'r datganiad busnes? Gwelaf fod. A oes 10 Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf eu bod. Galwaf ar y Trefnydd felly i gynnig y datganiad busnes yn ffurfiol. Byddaf wedyn yn caniatáu i un Aelod o bob grŵp siarad, ac i'r Gweinidog ymateb, cyn galw pleidlais.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there any objections to the business statement? I see that there are. Do 10 Members object? I see that they do. I therefore call the Business Minister to formally propose the business statement. I will then allow one Member from each group to speak, and the Minister to respond, before calling a vote.

**Carwyn Jones:** Cynigiad fod

**Carwyn Jones:** I propose that

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn derbyn y datganiad busnes.*

*the National Assembly adopts the business statement.*

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Mae'n debyg y byddwch chi, Lywydd, a'r Trefnydd, yn cofio i grŵp Plaid Cymru wneud cais am ddadl ar Irac cyn y toriad hanner tymor. Gŵyr y Trefnydd hefyd ein bod wedi adnewyddu ein cais yn ystod y dyddiau diwethaf. Gŵyr fy mod wedi ysgrifennu at y Prif Weinidog yn gofyn am

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** I am sure that you, Presiding Officer, and the Business Minister, will remember that the Plaid Cymru group requested a debate on Iraq before the half-term recess. The Business Minister also knows that we have renewed our request during these past few days. He knows that I have written to the

gynnal dadl ar y mater; mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi gwrthod y cais. Golyga hynny, felly, nad oes ond un ffordd arall y gallwn ddangos bod angen inni gael trafodaeth ar hyn, sef drwy wrthwynebu'r datganiad busnes.

First Minister asking for a debate to be held on the matter; the First Minister has refused that request. As a result, the only way in which we can demonstrate the need to hold a debate on this is to object to the business statement.

Gofynnaf am y ddadl hon, nid yn unig oherwydd bod miloedd o Gymry wedi cerdded yn y brotest fawr yn Llundain rai dyddiau yn ôl, ond oherwydd bod llawer o bobl wedi gofyn i mi wneud hyn, drwy lythyr, drwy e-bost, drwy alwad ffôn, neu drwy ymweliad personol. Maent yn methu'n lân â deall pam na chaiff y Cynulliad y cyfle i drafod y pwnc mawr y mae pawb yn ei drafod y dyddiau hyn.

I ask for this debate, not only because thousands of Welsh people marched in the great protest in London some days ago, but also because many people have asked me to do so, in letters, e-mails, phone calls or in person. They cannot fathom why the Assembly is denied the opportunity to discuss the big issue that everyone is discussing these days.

Yr wyf wedi derbyn llythyr oddi wrth y Prif Weinidog ar y mater, ond ni dderbyniaf ei resymeg dros wrthod cynnal dadl. Ei ddadl ef yw bod cyfle i Aelodau Seneddol Cymru fynegi barn ar y mater yfory. Fodd bynnag, o ystyried mai 40 Aelod Seneddol sydd gan Gymru—o gyfanswm o 650 o ASau—ni chlywir barn Cymru yn y drafodaeth honno. Mae'n bwysig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru—yr unig gorff democrataidd sydd gennym—yn cael cyfle i leisio barn ar y mater hwn.

I have received a letter from the First Minister on the matter, but I do not accept his rationale for refusing to hold a debate. His argument is that Welsh Members of Parliament will have an opportunity to state their opinions on the matter tomorrow. However, given that Wales has only 40 Members of Parliament—out of a total of 650 MPs—Wales's opinion will not be heard in that debate. It is important that the National Assembly for Wales—the only democratic body that we have—has an opportunity to voice its opinion on this matter.

On the day that thousands of Welsh people took part in the historic march in London, along with people from all over the United Kingdom, the First Minister told the people of Wales where he stood on this issue. He said that he backed Tony Blair. He could have told the press that this is a matter for Westminster, or that he does not have a view on the matter—which is what he expects the National Assembly to say today. The National Assembly for Wales should be given an opportunity to express a view on the issue that everybody in Wales is talking about. I ask the First Minister to reconsider. He is right that people are entitled to make their views known. However, that should be on the basis of a resolution, made in Government time, in our National Assembly.

Ar y diwrnod y cymerodd miloedd o bobl Cymru ran yn yr orymdaith hanesyddol yn Llundain, ochr yn ochr â phobl o bob rhan o'r Deyrnas Unedig, dywedodd y Prif Weinidog wrth bobl Cymru ym mhle'r oedd yn sefyll ar y mater hwn. Dywedodd ei fod yn cefnogi Tony Blair. Gallai fod wedi dweud wrth y wasg mai mater i San Steffan yw hwn, neu nad oes ganddo farn ar y mater—sef yr hyn y mae'n disgwyl i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ei ddweud heddiw. Dylai Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru gael cyfle i fynegi barn ar y mater y mae pawb yng Nghymru'n sôn amdano. Gofynnaf i'r Prif Weinidog ailystyried. Mae'n iawn wrth ddweud bod gan bobl hawl i ddatgan eu barn. Fodd bynnag, dylid gwneud hynny ar sail penderfyniad, a wneir yn amser y Llywodraeth, yn ein Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

Can there be a more important issue to discuss? The United States is about to tear up the international consensus on resolving

A ellid cael pwnc pwysicach i'w drafod? Mae'r Unol Daleithiau ar fin chwalu'r consensws rhyngwladol ynghylch datrys

conflict, and we in Wales do not have an opportunity to raise our voice against that. The people of Wales expect their elected representatives to make their views clear. As I understand it, the Business Minister's position is that there might be a debate after a war has started. What is the point of that? When would the people of Wales have an opportunity to express their opposition to that war, if a debate is only held after a war has started?

There is no point in appealing to the First Minister again. He has made his position clear in his letter to me. Therefore, I appeal to those Assembly Members who have signed the statement of opinion opposing a war in Iraq, to make it clear that that statement of opinion can be put to the test and that we should have a vote in the National Assembly. We all know in our hearts that the National Assembly should hold this debate. I appeal to all Assembly Members to agree that the National Assembly should discuss this issue and invite them to support us in opposing today's business statement.

**Jonathan Morgan:** We will vote against the business statement for two reasons. The first reason, as outlined by the leader of the opposition, is that we support the need for the National Assembly for Wales to debate the Iraq situation. I will not reiterate the points made, except to say that we feel that this is a matter of the utmost national importance, and the nation's institutions should debate these issues; the Assembly has a right to debate the international situation. The second reason is that we have requested an Assembly debate on Education and Learning Wales. It has been rumoured that the Minister may make a written statement; if a statement is made on ELWa, I urge the Business Minister to ensure that it is an oral statement, so that Members can scrutinise the Government Minister appropriately. For those reasons, we will vote against today's business statement.

**Kirsty Williams:** As was stated before the recess, we need to carefully consider the scheduling of a debate on the Iraq situation. I do not feel that the situation has changed to the extent that a debate should be scheduled for this week, so it is difficult to understand

anghydfod, ac nid oes cyfle gennym ni yng Nghymru i godi ein llais yn erbyn hynny. Mae pobl Cymru'n disgwyl i'w cynrychiolwyr etholedig ddatgan eu barn. Fel yr wyf fi'n ei ddeall, safbwynt y Trefnydd yw efallai y bydd dadl ar ôl dechrau rhyfel. Beth yw diben hynny? Pa bryd y câi pobl Cymru gyfle i fynegi eu gwrthwynebiad i'r rhyfel hwnnw, os mai dim ond ar ôl dechrau rhyfel y cynhelir dadl?

Nid oes diben apelio eto at y Prif Weinidog. Eglurodd ei safbwynt yn ei lythyr ataf. Felly, apelïaf at yr Aelodau hynny o'r Cynulliad a arwyddodd y datganiad barn yn gwrthwynebu rhyfel yn Irac, i roi ar ddeall y gellir rhoi prawf ar y datganiad barn hwnnw ac y dylem gael pleidlais yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Yr ydym oll yn gwybod yn ein calonnau y dylai'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gynnal y ddadl hon. Apelïaf at bob Aelod o'r Cynulliad i gytuno y dylai'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol drafod y mater hwn ac fe'u gwahoddaf i'n cefnogi drwy wrthwynebu'r datganiad busnes heddiw.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Pleidleisiwn yn erbyn y datganiad busnes am ddau reswm. Y rheswm cyntaf, fel yr amlinellodd arweinydd yr wrthblaid, yw ein bod yn ategu'r angen i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru drafod y sefyllfa ynghylch Irac. Ni wnaif ailddatgan y pwyntiau a wnaed, heblaw am ddweud ein bod yn teimlo bod hyn yn fater sydd o'r pwys mwyaf i'r genedl, ac y dylai sefydliadau'r genedl drafod y materion hyn; mae gan y Cynulliad hawl i drafod y sefyllfa ryngwladol. Yr ail reswm yw ein bod wedi gofyn am ddadl yn y Cynulliad ar Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru. Cafwyd sïon y gallai'r Gweinidog wneud datganiad ysgrifenedig; os gwneir datganiad am ELWa, anogaf y Trefnydd i sicrhau mai datganiad llafar ydyw, fel y gall Aelodau holi Gweinidog y Llywodraeth yn briodol. Am y rhesymau hynny, pleidleisiwn yn erbyn y datganiad busnes heddiw.

**Kirsty Williams:** Fel y dywedwyd cyn y toriad, rhaid inni ystyried yr amserlennu ar gyfer dadl ar y sefyllfa ynghylch Irac yn ofalus. Ni theimlaf fod y sefyllfa wedi newid i'r fath raddau fel y dylid amserlennu dadl ar gyfer yr wythnos hon, felly anodd yw deall

why the Conservative Party, which said before the recess that it was not the right time for a debate, is now saying that it is. An opportunity is available in tomorrow's short debate—[*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I will protect the right of all minority parties to be heard in the National Assembly.

**Kirsty Williams:** The situation is developing. The Prime Minister will make a statement in the House of Commons today, and a debate will be held there tomorrow. I am surprised that Plaid Cymru holds the abilities of Wales's 40 Members of Parliament in such low regard that it says that they cannot make a difference in tomorrow's debate. I hope that my party colleagues—[*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I want Kirsty Williams to be heard with respect and courtesy.

**Kirsty Williams:** The Business Minister should review the situation and an opportunity should be made available for the Assembly to debate this issue before British troops are sent into Iraq.

**The Business Minister (Carwyn Jones):** I will first deal with ELWa. The matter concerned is an operational matter for ELWa. The Minister is happy to provide a written statement to inform Members of the situation; when Members have read that statement, they will perhaps be better informed as to the true situation.

Turning to the Iraq situation, I remind Members that Plaid Cymru had a minority party debate scheduled three or four weeks ago, which afforded it an opportunity to debate Iraq—as the Scottish National Party did in the Scottish Parliament. However, Plaid Cymru felt that debating broadband was more important. The opportunity was missed, and the chance was fluffed. The SNP—[*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The Minister is also to be heard in silence.

**Carwyn Jones:** I would have more respect

pam y mae'r Blaid Geidwadol, a ddywedodd cyn y toriad nad hon oedd yr adeg iawn ar gyfer dadl, yn dweud bellach ei bod yn iawn. Bydd cyfle yn y ddadl fer yfory—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Gwnaf amddiffyn hawl pob plaid leiafrifol i gael ei chlywed yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae'r sefyllfa'n datblygu. Bydd y Prif Weinidog yn gwneud datganiad yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin heddiw, a chynhelir dadl yno yfory. Yr wyf yn synnu bod gan Blaid Cymru gyn lleied o feddwl o alluoedd 40 Aelod Seneddol Cymru fel y dywed na allant wneud gwahaniaeth yn y ddadl yfory. Gobeithiaf y bydd fy nghyd-Aelodau o'm plaid—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr wyf am i Kirsty Williams gael gwrandawriad parchus a chwrtais.

**Kirsty Williams:** Dylai'r Trefnydd adolygu'r sefyllfa a dylid rhoi cyfle i'r Cynulliad drafod y mater hwn cyn i filwyr Prydain gael eu hanfon i Irac.

**Y Trefnydd (Carwyn Jones):** Ymdriniaf ag ELWa yn gyntaf. Mae'r mater dan sylw'n fater gweithredol i ELWa. Bydd y Gweinidog yn falch o ddarparu datganiad ysgrifenedig i hysbysu'r Aelodau am y sefyllfa; pan fydd Aelodau wedi darllen y datganiad hwnnw, efallai y byddant yn fwy gwybodus ynghylch y wir sefyllfa.

Gan droi at y sefyllfa ynghylch Irac, yr wyf yn atgoffa Aelodau fod Plaid Cymru wedi cael amserlennu dadl plaid leiafrifol dair neu bedair wythnos yn ôl, a roddodd gyfle iddi drafod Irac—fel y gwnaeth Plaid Genedlaethol yr Alban yn Senedd yr Alban. Fodd bynnag, teimlai Plaid Cymru ei bod yn bwysicach trafod y band eang. Collwyd y cyfle a gwnaed cawl ohoni. Mae Plaid Genedlaethol yr Alban—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Dylid gwrandao ar y Gweinidog mewn distawrwydd hefyd.

**Carwyn Jones:** Byddai gennyf fwy o barch

for Plaid Cymru's position had it been consistent and insisted on using its minority party debate to discuss the Iraq situation; it did not take that opportunity to do so. I speak for my party when I say that Labour Assembly Members are free to express whichever point of view they wish to express—in private and in public. Members of the Labour Party group in the National Assembly are able to put forward any view without fear—as has been done by many Members—and the media is able to question those Members on those views. There is no question of Assembly Members being unable to put forward their points of view. However, we must separate the two issues with regard to the Iraq situation. The first issue is diplomatic and defence policy: those are not devolved matters. We are not a state, even though that is what Plaid Cymru might want. We do not have accredited diplomatic missions around the world. We do not have a seat in the United Nations with diplomats who seek our guidance with regard to which way they should vote. We do not have national armed forces that we seek to command. We do not have diplomats in Europe, or elsewhere in the world, looking to us to provide a lead in terms of the diplomacy to be used with other states. We are not a state; this is a devolved Assembly. Other parties may decide that they wish to see Wales become a state in the future; they should put that before the Welsh electorate. There is a danger of this Chamber being seen as a talking shop, if it debates an issue over which it has no control. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.'] That is the reality, if we consider diplomatic and defence policies. The opposition may think that this Government has no control whatsoever, but, as opposition parties, they would think that. The Government is delivering in many ways.

3.20 p.m.

If there came a point at which a conflict affected public services in Wales, responsibility for which is devolved to this Assembly, it would then be appropriate to debate the matter. Members should bear that in mind. However, it does us no good to

at safbwynt Plaid Cymru pe buasai'n gyson ac wedi mynnu cael defnyddio ei dadl plaid leiafrifol i drafod y sefyllfa ynghylch Irac; nid achubodd ar y cyfle hwnnw i wneud hynny. Siaradaf dros fy mhlaidd pan ddywedaf fod Aelodau Cynulliad Llafur yn rhydd i fynegi pa bynnag safbwynt a ddymunant—yn breifat ac yn gyhoeddus. Gall aelodau o grŵp y Blaid Lafur yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gyflwyno unrhyw farn yn ddi-ofn—fel y gwnaeth llawer o Aelodau—a gall y cyfryngau holi'r Aelodau hynny am eu barn. Nid oes amheuaeth nad yw Aelodau o'r Cynulliad yn gallu cyflwyno eu safbwynt. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni wahaniaethu rhwng y ddau fater sy'n ymwneud â'r sefyllfa ynghylch Irac. Y mater cyntaf yw polisi diplomyddol ac amddiffyn: nid yw'r materion hynny wedi'u datganoli. Nid gwladwriaeth ydym, er bod Plaid Cymru yn dymuno hynny o bosibl. Nid oes gennym genadaethau diplomyddol achrededig o gwmpas y byd. Nid oes gennym sedd yn y Cenhedloedd Unedig a diplomyddion sy'n ceisio cyfarwyddyd gennym o ran pa ffordd y dylent bleidleisio. Nid oes gennym luoedd arfog cenedlaethol y ceisiwn eu cyfarwyddo. Nid oes gennym ddiplomyddion yn Ewrop, neu fannau eraill yn y byd, sy'n disgwyl inni roi arweiniad o ran y ddiplomyddiaeth sydd i'w harfer gyda gwladwriaethau eraill. Nid gwladwriaeth ydym; Cynulliad datganoledig yw hwn. Gall pleidiau eraill benderfynu eu bod yn dymuno gweld Cymru'n wladwriaeth yn y dyfodol; dylent roi hynny gerbron etholwyr Cymru. Mae perygl y caiff y Siambr hon ei hystyried yn siop siarad, os caiff ddadl ar fater nad oes ganddi reolaeth drosto. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.'] Dyna'r gwir, os ystyriwn bolisiâu diplomyddol ac amddiffyn. Efallai fod yr wrthblaid yn credu nad oes gan y Llywodraeth hon unrhyw reolaeth o gwbl, ond, fel gwrthbleidiau, maent yn debygol o feddwl hynny. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn mynd â'r maen i'r wal mewn sawl ffordd.

Pe deuai adeg pan oedd gwrthdaro'n effeithio ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, y mae'r cyfrifoldeb drostynt wedi'i ddatganoli i'r Cynulliad hwn, byddai'n briodol cael dadl ar y mater bryd hynny. Dylai'r Aelodau gofio hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n gwneud lles

debate matters over which we have no control. The other difficulty is that this is such a fast-changing situation that what you decide is your policy one day may well change the next. The United Nation's Security Council is debating the matter. It is presumptuous of us to think that we can influence the UN's Security Council and how other countries vote. How it enforces its resolutions is a matter for the UN. The situation changes not just by the day, but by the hour. To try to consider and debate the situation in the present context, given the separation between devolved and non-devolved matters, is difficult to justify. However, if there comes a time when devolved services are affected, there will be a debate.

inni drafod materion nad oes gennym reolaeth drostynt. Yr anhawster arall yw bod y sefyllfa hon yn newid mor gyflym fel y byddai'r polisi y penderfynid arno un diwrnod yn newid y diwrnod wedyn. Mae Cyngor Diogelwch y Cenhedloedd Unedig yn trafod y mater. Mae'n rhyfygus inni feddwl y gallwn ddylanwadu ar Gyngor Diogelwch y Cenhedloedd Unedig a'r modd y mae gwledydd eraill yn pleidleisio. Mater i'r Cenhedloedd Unedig yw'r modd y mae'n gweithredu ei benderfyniadau. Nid o ddydd i ddydd yn unig mae'r sefyllfa'n newid, ond o awr i awr. Anodd yw cyfiawnhau ymgais i ystyried a thrafod y sefyllfa yn y cyd-destun presennol, o ystyried y rhaniad rhwng materion sydd wedi'u datganoli a rhai sydd heb eu datganoli. Er hynny, os daw adeg pan effeithir ar wasanaethau a ddatganolwyd, bydd dadl.

*Cynnig: O blaid 28, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 24.*

*Motion: For 28, Abstain 1, Against 24.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Edwards, Richard

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Graham, William  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil



*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

### **Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order**

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Pwynt o drefn. Hoffwn gael eich barn ar gynnal trafodaethau yn y Cynulliad yn unol â Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. A wnewch gadarnhau bod y Ddeddf yn datgan ei bod yn gyfrifoldeb ar y Cynulliad i drafod unrhyw fater a allai effeithio ar Gymru ac ar fywydau pobl yng Nghymru? O ran y cofnod, a wnewch chi hefyd gadarnhau bod Plaid Cymru wedi cynnal dadl blaid leiafrifol ar Irac a bod Dafydd Wigley wedi cynnal dadl fer ar yr un pwnc?

**Y Llywydd:** Mae'r Ddeddf yn glir ar y mater hwn:

'The Assembly may consider and make appropriate representations about any matter affecting Wales.'

**Nick Bourne:** Point of order. I have given you prior notice of this point of order. It relates to statements made in the Chamber last week by the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to the effect that, while the Audit Committee was considering ELWa and payments to Avanti Group, she was not able to answer questions relating to their financial activities. Having been a member of the National Assembly Advisory Group and being reasonably well-acquainted with Standing Orders, I ask you to confirm that there is nothing in Standing Orders, the Act, or our conventions, to prevent the Minister from making a statement.

From the point of view of political convenience, I can well understand her not wanting to make a statement, because we know that she authorised this payment. It is entirely appropriate for the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to make a full statement in Plenary so that we can question her about a serious issue relating to probity and payment by an Assembly sponsored public body. The Business Minister may wish to consider this because, although we have no direct control over Iraq,

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Point of order. I would like your ruling on holding debates in the Assembly in accordance with the Government of Wales Act 1998. Will you confirm that the Act states that it is the Assembly's duty to discuss any issue that could affect Wales and the lives of people in Wales? For the record, will you also confirm that Plaid Cymru held a minority party debate on Iraq and that Dafydd Wigley held a short debate on the same subject?

**The Presiding Officer:** The Act is clear on this matter:

Gall y Cynulliad ystyried a chyflwyno sylwadau addas am unrhyw fater sy'n effeithio ar Gymru.

**Nick Bourne:** Pwynt o drefn. Yr wyf wedi'ch hysbysu ymlaen llaw am y pwynt o drefn hwn. Mae'n ymwneud â datganiadau a wnaed yn y Siambr yr wythnos diwethaf gan y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i'r perwyl na allai ateb cwestiynau'n ymwneud â'r gweithgareddau ariannol dan sylw tra oedd y Pwyllgor Archwilio yn ystyried ELWa a thaliadau i Grŵp Avanti. A minnau wedi bod yn aelod o Grŵp Ymgynghorol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ac yn un sy'n weddol gyfarwydd â Rheolau Sefydlog, gofynnaf ichi gadarnhau nad oes dim mewn Rheolau Sefydlog, yn y Ddeddf, neu yn ein confensiynau, i atal y Gweinidog rhag gwneud datganiad.

O ran cyfleuster gwleidyddol, gallaf ddeall yn iawn pam nad yw'n dymuno gwneud datganiad, oherwydd gwyddom ei bod wedi awdurdodi'r taliad hwn. Mae'n gwbl briodol i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes wneud datganiad llawn yn y Cyfarfod Llawn fel y gallwn ei holi am fater difrifol sy'n ymwneud ag uniondeb a thaliad gan gorff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad. Efallai y bydd y Trefnydd yn dymuno ystyried hyn oherwydd, er nad oes gennym reolaeth uniongyrchol dros Irac, dylem gael

we should have some control over what happens in ELWa.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Further to that point of order, I support that request and ask you, Presiding Officer, to indicate whether it would be appropriate for the Minister to consider making an oral statement. It would be inappropriate for the matter to be dealt with by means of a written statement because Assembly Members would then not have an opportunity to question the Minister on what is at the very heart of the National Assembly: the accountability of Ministers. Ministers must be accountable for their decisions, whether those decisions relate to their direct responsibilities in their departments, or to Assembly-sponsored bodies. Ministers cannot simply walk away from answering questions on their areas of accountability in the Assembly. I fully support the Leader of the Welsh Conservatives' request that there should be an oral statement by the Minister.

**The Presiding Officer:** Nothing prevents any Minister from taking any action or making any statement within the Government of Wales Act 1998, our powers and Standing Orders as they see fit. There is nothing in our procedures to prevent that. There are no conventions of that kind that operate here that are not clearly stated within Standing Orders and within the Act.

**Nick Bourne:** Point of order. This relates to late responses to questions to the Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad that I had chased up. I had a reply on 19 February eventually; they had been due for answer on 14 February. The reply said that a response would be put in the Library for me in due course. As I have done in similar situations previously, I raise the issue with you, because not only was the question answered late, but it was not given a full answer at all; the answer was pretty inadequate.

**The Presiding Officer:** The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives knows full well—for we have discussed these matters publicly and privately—that the content of ministerial answers is not a matter for me. The timeliness of answers certainly is. If there are

rhywfaint o reolaeth dros yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn ELWa.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, ategaf y cais hwnnw a gofynnaf ichi nodi, Lywydd, a fyddai'n briodol i'r Gweinidog ystyried gwneud datganiad llafar. Byddai'n amhriodol delio â'r mater drwy ddatganiad ysgrifenedig oherwydd ni châi Aelodau o'r Cynulliad gyfle wedyn i holi'r Gweinidog am yr hyn sy'n gwbl ganolog i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol: atebolrwydd Gweinidogion. Rhaid i Weinidogion fod yn atebol am eu penderfyniadau, pa un a yw'r penderfyniadau hynny'n ymwneud â'u cyfrifoldebau uniongyrchol yn eu hadrannau, neu gyrff a noddir gan y Cynulliad. Ni all Gweinidogion osgoi ateb cwestiynau am y meysydd y maent yn atebol drostynt yn y Cynulliad. Llwyf gefnogaf gais Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru am gael datganiad llafar gan y Gweinidog.

**Y Llywydd:** Nid oes dim yn Neddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, ein pwerau na'n Rheolau Sefydlog i atal unrhyw Weinidog rhag cymryd camau neu wneud unrhyw ddatganiad fel y gwêl orau. Nid oes dim yn ein gweithdrefnau i atal hynny. Nid oes unrhyw gonfensiynau o'r math hwnnw sydd ar waith yma sydd heb eu datgan yn eglur mewn Rheolau Sefydlog ac yn y Ddeddf.

**Nick Bourne:** Pwynt o drefn. Mae hyn yn ymwneud ag atebion hwyr i gwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor yr oeddwn wedi mynd ar eu hôl. Cefais ateb yn y pen draw ar 19 Chwefror; yr oeddent i fod i gael eu hateb ar 14 Chwefror. Dywedwyd yn yr ateb y câi ymateb ei osod yn y Llyfrgell ar fy nghyfer gyda hynny. Fel y gwneuthum mewn sefyllfaoedd tebyg o'r blaen, codaf y mater hwn gyda chi, oherwydd atebwyd y cwestiwn yn hwyr, ac ar ben hynny ni roddwyd ateb llawn iddo o gwbl; yr oedd yr ateb yn eithaf tila.

**Y Llywydd:** Gŵyr Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn iawn—gan ein bod wedi trafod y materion hyn yn gyhoeddus ac yn breifat—nad yw cynnwys atebion y Gweinidogion yn fater i mi. Mae amseroldeb atebion, yn sicr. Os oes materion sy'n ymwneud ag

issues relating to timeliness, then it is appropriate that they are raised.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Point of order. This follows on from a point of order raised by the leader of the opposition in the last Plenary session. It refers to the allegations made by the First Minister that Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council was involved in ELWa's funding of the Avanti Media Group, and that the council was in some way responsible for the fact that millions of pounds of public money remained unused in Avanti's bank account for almost a year. We have now placed in the Library copies of documents that clearly show that that is not the case, and that this particular ELWa-Avanti project is in no way dependent upon any decision to be made by Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council.

**The Presiding Officer:** I would be grateful if it could be made clear how this is point of order that is for me. All this is history.

**Helen Mary Jones:** It is history, but it relates to the First Minister misleading the Assembly, either inadvertently or deliberately. Is he now prepared to apologise for that, both to the Assembly and to the council?

**The Presiding Officer:** It is not a matter for me whether the First Minister wishes to apologise or to make any statement. He is perfectly able to speak for himself.

amseroldeb, mae'n briodol eu codi.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Pwynt o drefn. Mae hyn yn dilyn pwynt o drefn a godwyd gan arweinydd yr wrthblaid yn y Cyfarfod Llawn diwethaf. Mae'n cyfeirio at gyhuddiadau a wnaed gan y Prif Weinidog fod Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf yn gysylltiedig â chyllido Avanti Media Group gan ELWa, a bod y cyngor yn gyfrifol rywfodd am y ffaith bod miliynau o bunnoedd o arian cyhoeddus wedi aros yn segur yng nghyfrif banc Avanti am ymron i flwyddyn. Yr ydym bellach wedi gosod yn y Llyfrgell gopiâu o ddogfennau sy'n dangos yn bendant nad yw hynny'n wir, ac nad yw'r prosiect penodol hwn gan ELWa ac Avanti'n ddibynnol o gwbl ar unrhyw benderfyniad sydd i'w wneud gan Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf.

**Y Llywydd:** Byddwn yn ddiolchgar os gellid rhoi ar ddeall sut y mae'r pwynt o drefn hwn yn fater i mi. Hanes yw hyn i gyd.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Hanes ydyw, ond mae'n ymwneud â charmarwain y Cynulliad gan y Prif Weinidog, un ai drwy amryfusedd neu o fwriad. A yw'n barod i ymddiheuro am hynny'n awr, i'r Cynulliad ac i'r cyngor?

**Y Llywydd:** Nid mater i mi yw a ydyw'r Prif Weinidog yn dymuno ymddiheuro neu wneud unrhyw ddatganiad. Mae'n gwbl alluog i siarad drosto'i hun.

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Refferenda) (Deisebau a Chyfarwyddiadau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003**  
**Approval of the Local Authorities (Referendums) (Petitions and Directions) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003**

**The Finance Minister (Edwina Hart):** I propose that

*the National Assembly considers the principle of the Local Authorities (Referendums) (Petitions and Directions) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 28 January 2003. (NDM1352)*

I propose that

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Edwina Hart):** Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Refferenda) (Deisebau a Chyfarwyddiadau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Ionawr 2003. (NDM1352)*

Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly:*

1. *considers the report of the Legislation Committee which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5 in relation to the draft Order, the Local Authorities (Referendums) (Petitions and Directions) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 4 February 2003;*

2. *approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 28 January 2003, and the memorandum of corrections, laid in the Table Office on 17 February 2003. (NDM1353)*

**Janet Ryder:** Raising petitions to request a referendum is one way in which people can influence their local authority. However, the regulations stipulate that 10 per cent of the population have to sign the petition, and that there is a limited time period in which the petitions can be handed in. Does the Minister agree that there are other ways in which people can influence local authorities? A good way is to consider standing for election. If they are successful, they can have a long-term influence on their council. Perhaps, like me, the Minister is looking forward to the local elections in 2004 and seeing a wide range of candidates.

**William Graham:** I welcome these regulations. Will the Minister clarify the way in which the proper officer within an authority must publish the verification number within a 14-day period? How will that be published? Apart from that, we welcome the regulations.

**Eleanor Burnham:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats also welcome these changes. They further reinforce the understanding that local authorities are ultimately responsible to the electorate, which can be forgotten by authorities such as Cardiff, whose control freakery and waste has led to council tax hikes of 12 per cent. That is unnecessary given that, under the partnership Government, local authorities have received the biggest settlement ever. That is thanks to Edwina Hart, and is more than local

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:*

1. *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5, mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Refferenda) (Deisebau a Chyfarwyddiadau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Chwefror 2003;*

2. *yn cymeradwyo gwneud y Gorchymyn yn unol â'r rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Ionawr 2003, a'r memorandwm cywiriadau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Chwefror 2003. (NDM1353)*

**Janet Ryder:** Mae codi deisebau i ofyn am refferendwm yn un modd i bobl ddylanwadu ar eu hawdurdod lleol. Fodd bynnag, mae'r rheoliadau'n mynnu bod 10 y cant o'r boblogaeth yn arwyddo'r ddeiseb, a bod cyfnod penodol pan ellir cyflwyno'r deisebau. A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno bod moddau eraill i bobl ddylanwadu ar awdurdodau lleol? Un ffordd dda yw ystyried sefyll etholiad. Os ydynt yn llwyddiannus, gallant gael dylanwad hirdymor ar eu cyngor. Efallai fod y Gweinidog, fel minnau, yn edrych ymlaen at yr etholiadau lleol yn 2004 ac at weld amrywiaeth eang o ymgeiswyr.

**William Graham:** Croesawaf y rheoliadau hyn. A wnaiff y Gweinidog egluro'r modd y mae'n rhaid i'r swyddog priodol mewn awdurdod gyhoeddi'r rhif dilysu o fewn cyfnod o 14 diwrnod? Sut y caiff ei gyhoeddi? Ar wahân i hynny, croesawn y rheoliadau.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn croesawu'r newidiadau hyn hefyd. Maent yn cadarnhau ymhellach y ddealltwriaeth mai awdurdodau lleol sy'n atebol i'r etholwyr yn y pen draw, a gall hynny fynd yn anghof gan awdurdodau fel Caerdydd, y mae ei obsesiwn â rheoli a'i wastraff wedi arwain at godiadau o 12 y cant yn y dreth gyngor. Nid oes angen hynny gan fod awdurdodau lleol, o dan y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth, wedi cael y setliad mwyaf erioed. I Edwina Hart y mae'r diolch am

authorities elsewhere will get. Although these regulations are more about tying up loose ends than introducing a new policy, we agree that such tidying up is needed and commend these changes.

hynny, ac mae'n fwy nag a gaiff awdurdodau lleol mewn mannau eraill. Er bod y rheoliadau hyn yn ymwneud yn fwy â thacluso na chyflwyno polisi newydd, cytunwn fod angen tacluso o'r fath a chymeradwywn y newidiadau hyn.

3.30 p.m.

**The Finance Minister (Edwina Hart):** These regulations will create an improved atmosphere in local authorities and I thank William Graham for his comments. I understand that the verification numbers will be printed and made publicly available, but I will look into the detail, respond to William and place a copy of that information in the Members' Library. I concur with Janet Ryder on people standing for election. We hope that as many people as possible stand for election to local government, as that is in the interests of democracy. I will put Eleanor Burnham's comments on Cardiff in the dustbin.

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Edwina Hart):** Bydd y rheoliadau hyn yn creu gwell awyrgylch mewn awdurdodau lleol a diolchaf i William Graham am ei sylwadau. Deallaf y bydd y rhifau dilysu'n cael eu hargraffu ac y byddant ar gael i'r cyhoedd, ond ymchwiliaf i'r manylion a rhoi ateb i William a gosod copi o'r wybodaeth honno yn Llyfrgell yr Aelodau. Cytunaf â Janet Ryder ynghylch pobl yn sefyll etholiadau. Gobeithiwn y bydd cynifer ag y bo modd yn sefyll etholiad i lywodraeth leol, gan fod hynny er budd democratiaeth. Rhoddaf sylwadau Eleanor Burnham am Gaerdydd yn y bin lludw.

*Cynnig (NDM1352): O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1352): For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Law, Peter

Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1353): O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM1353): For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Asiantaethau Mabwysiadu Gwirfoddol ac  
Asiantaethau Mabwysiadu (Diwygiadau Amrywiol) 2003  
Approval of the Voluntary Adoption Agencies and Adoption Agencies  
(Miscellaneous Amendments) Regulations 2003**

**Y Llywydd:** O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn. **The Presiding Officer:** Under Standing Order No. 22.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

**Y Trefnydd (Carwyn Jones):** Cynigiaf fod **The Business Minister (Carwyn Jones):** I propose that

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reolau Sefydlog Rhifau 23.10, 23.11 a 22.25:* *the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order Nos. 23.10, 23.11 and 22.25:*

*1. yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Asiantaethau Mabwysiadu Gwirfoddol ac Asiantaethau Mabwysiadu (Diwygiadau Amrywiol) 2003 a'r safonau gofynnol cenedlaethol cysylltiedig, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Chwefror 2003; ac* *1. approves the Voluntary Adoption Agencies and Adoption Agencies (Miscellaneous Amendments) Regulations 2003 and the associated national minimum standards laid in the Table Office on 17 February 2003; and*

*2. yn ystyried y memorandwm esboniadol a'r arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Chwefror 2003. (NDM1354)* *2. considers the explanatory memorandum and regulatory appraisal both laid in Table Office on 17 February 2003. (NDM1354)*

*Cynnig (NDM1354): O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1354): For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian

Gwyther, Christine  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, David Ian  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion Composite Motion: Approval of Orders**

**Y Llywydd:** O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

**The Presiding Officer:** Under Standing Order No. 22.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

**Y Trefnydd (Carwyn Jones):** Cynigiaf fod

**The Business Minister (Carwyn Jones):** I propose that

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25:*

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 22.25:*

*1. yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Atgyfeiriadau ac Apelau) (Gweithdrefn Sylwadau Ysgrifenedig) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 29 Ionawr 2003;*

*1. approves the Town and Country Planning (Referrals and Appeals) (Written Representations Procedure) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 29 January 2003;*

*2. yn ystyried:*

*2. considers:*

*a) adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw faterion sy'n destun pryder yn y Gorchmyn drafft Rheoliadau Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Atgyfeiriadau ac Apelau) (Gweithdrefn Sylwadau Ysgrifenedig) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Chwefror 2003; ac*

*a) the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Town and Country Planning (Referrals and Appeals) (Written Representations Procedure) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 11 February 2003; and*



- b) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Chwefror 2003; b) the memorandum of corrections laid in Table Office on 17 February 2003;
3. yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Hysbysiadau Gorfodi ac Apelau) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 29 Ionawr 2003; 3. approves the Town and Country Planning (Enforcement Notices and Appeals) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 29 January 2003;
4. yn ystyried: 4. considers:
- a) adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw faterion sy'n destun pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Hysbysiadau Gorfodi ac Apelau) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Chwefror 2003; ac a) the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Town and Country Planning (Enforcement Notices and Appeals) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 11 February 2003; and
- b) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Chwefror 2003; b) the memorandum of corrections laid in Table Office on 17 February 2003;
5. yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Gorfodi) (Gweithdrefn Sylwadau Ysgrifenedig) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 29 Ionawr 2003; 5. approves the Town and Country Planning (Enforcement) (Written Representations Procedure) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 29 January 2003;
6. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw faterion sy'n destun pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Gorfodi) (Gweithdrefn Sylwadau Ysgrifenedig) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Chwefror 2003; 6. considers the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Town and Country Planning (Enforcement) (Written Representations Procedure) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 11 February 2003;
7. yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru (Cyfansoddiad) (Diwygio) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Chwefror 2003; 7. approves the General Teaching Council for Wales (Constitution) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 4 February 2003;
8. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw faterion sy'n destun pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Cyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru (Cyfansoddiad) (Diwygio) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Chwefror 2003; 8. considers the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the General Teaching Council for Wales (Constitution) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 11 February 2003;
9. yn cymeradwyo rheoliadau cymorthdaliadau amaethyddol (Apelau) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Chwefror 2003; 9. approves the Agricultural Subsidies (Appeals) (Wales)(Amendment) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 4 February 2003;
10. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw faterion sy'n destun pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, 10. considers the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the

*Rheoliadau Cymorthdaliadau Amaethyddol (Apelau) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Chwefror 2003;* *Agricultural Subsidies (Appeals) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 11 February 2003;*

*11. yn cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Gwahardd Cadw neu Ollwng Pysgod Byw (Rhywogaethau Penodedig) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Chwefror 2003;* *11. approves the Prohibition of Keeping or Release of Live Fish (Specified Species) (Wales) Order 2003, laid in the Table Office on 4 February 2003;*

*12. yn ystyried:*

*12. considers:*

*(a) adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw faterion sy'n destun pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Gwahardd Cadw neu Ollwng Pysgod Byw (Rhywogaethau Penodedig) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Chwefror 2003; ac*

*a) the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Prohibition of Keeping or Release of Live Fish (Specified Species) (Wales) Order 2003, laid in the Table Office 11 February 2003; and*

*(b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Chwefror 2003. (NDM1355)*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in Table Office on 4 February 2003. (NDM1355)*

*Cynnig (NDM1355): O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM1355): For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary

Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) Adroddiad Grant Arbennig  
 (Cymru) 2003**  
**Approval of the Local Government Finance (Wales) Special Grant Report  
 (Wales) 2003**

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

*the National Assembly, under section 88B of the Local Government Finance Act 1988, and in accordance with Standing Order No. 19.8, approves the Local Government Finance (Wales) Special Grant Report (Wales) 2003 which was laid in the Table Office on 17 February 2003. (NDM1356)*

**David Lloyd:** Plaid Cymru welcomes this special grant report on the social services performance management development fund Wales 2003 and its £2.725 million in support for costs incurred in enabling local authorities to improve management capacity and capability with regard to IT systems.

We welcome sharing information, establishing good working links, benchmarking and learning from good practices in social services. We need to emphasise the need to integrate that ethos throughout the social services sector. The annual report of the Social Services Inspectorate demonstrated the lack of political leadership in the development of social services and the dangers of working in isolation from other local authorities. The joint review of Cardiff social services also

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol o dan adran 88B o Ddeddf Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol 1988, ac yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 19.8, yn cymeradwyo Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) Adroddiad Grant Arbennig (Cymru) 2003 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Chwefror 2003. (NDM1356)*

**David Lloyd:** Mae Plaid Cymru yn croesawu'r adroddiad grant arbennig hwn ar gronfa datblygu rheoli perfformiad y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol 2003 a'r £2.725 miliwn o gymorth sydd ynglwm wrtho ar gyfer costau a geir wrth alluogi awdurdodau lleol i wella'u capasiti rheoli a'u gallu o ran systemau TG.

Yr ydym yn croesawu'r rhannu ar wybodaeth, sefydlu cysylltiadau gweithio da, meincodi a dysgu oddi wrth arferion da mewn gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Rhaid inni bwysleisio'r angen i integreiddio'r ethos hwnnw yn y sector gwasanaethau cyhoeddus drwyddo draw. Dangosodd adroddiad blynyddol yr Arolygiaeth Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol fod diffyg arweiniad gwleidyddol wrth ddatblygu gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a bod peryglon o ganlyniad i weithio ar wahân i awdurdodau lleol eraill.

referred to the lack of communication and support from managers and politicians. The need for performance management has never been more acute.

We welcome any additional money directed towards the social services sector, but does this special grant represent new additional money this year? What plans does the Minister have to audit performance as well as to provide year-on-year funding to improve performance in social services throughout Wales?

**Kirsty Williams:** I welcome this special grant. Over the last three and three-quarter years numerous reports on social services departments have highlighted the need for investment to allow local authorities to have the information that they need to plan comprehensive services and to ensure that those services are responsive and meet the needs of their local populations. The special grant has, in the past, received cross-party support, and I hope that it will again today.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** As you know, a special ring-fenced grant of £9.4 million was approved for this in 2000-01. This special grant takes forward our performance management strategy for social services. It is additional money to instigate the performance management framework that is essential for improving performance in social services.

We will discuss this at length tomorrow in the Health and Social Services Committee. We have found that the joint reviews have been powerful instruments for improving performance and have been the catalyst for change in social services. We are now consulting on how to take this forward as we complete this current round of joint reviews by the Audit Commission and the Social Services Inspectorate.

Yr oedd cyfeiriad yn yr adolygiad ar y cyd o wasanaethau cymdeithasol Caerdydd hefyd at y diffyg cyfathrebu a'r diffyg cefnogaeth gan reolwyr a gwleidyddion. Ni fu erioed fwy o angen am reoli perfformiad.

Croesawn unrhyw arian ychwanegol a gyfeirir tuag at y sector gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, ond a yw'r grant arbennig hwn yn golygu arian ychwanegol newydd eleni? Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Gweinidog i archwilio perfformiad yn ogystal â darparu cyllid o'r naill flwyddyn i'r llall i wella perfformiad mewn gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ledled Cymru?

**Kirsty Williams:** Croesawaf y grant arbennig hwn. Dros y tair blynedd a thri chwarter diwethaf mae nifer o adroddiadau ar adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol wedi tynnu sylw at yr angen i fuddsoddi er mwyn galluogi awdurdodau lleol i gael y wybodaeth y mae arnynt ei hangen i gynllunio gwasanaethau cynhwysfawr ac i sicrhau bod y gwasanaethau hynny'n ymatebol ac yn diwallu anghenion eu poblogaethau lleol. Cafodd y grant arbennig gefnogaeth yr holl bleidiau yn y gorffennol, a gobeithiaf y caiff eto heddiw.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Fel y gwyddoch, cymeradwywyd grant arbennig o £9.4 miliwn wedi'i bridianu ar gyfer hyn yn 2000-01. Mae'r grant arbennig hwn yn mynd â'n strategaeth rheoli perfformiad ar gyfer gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn ei flaen. Mae'n arian ychwanegol i sefydlu fframwaith rheoli perfformiad sy'n hollbwysig er mwyn gwella perfformiad mewn gwasanaethau cymdeithasol.

Cawn drafodaeth hir ar hyn yfory yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Cawsom fod yr adolygiadau ar y cyd yn gyfryngau effeithiol i wella perfformiad a buont yn gatalydd i newid mewn gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Yr ydym yn ymgynghori'n awr ar y modd i fwrw ymlaen â hyn wrth inni gwblhau'r cylch cyfredol hwn o adolygiadau ar y cyd gan y Comisiwn Archwilio a'r Arolygiaeth Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol.

*Cynnig (NDM1356): O blaid 41, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM1356): For 41, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Cynllun Gweithredu Busnes a'r Amgylchedd  
The Business and Environment Action Plan**

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. **Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

**The Minister for Economic Development (Andrew Davies):** I propose that **Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd (Andrew Davies):** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly:*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:*

*1. welcomes the Welsh Assembly Government's business and environment* *1. yn croesawu cynllun gweithredu Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer*

*action plan for Wales, which was e-mailed to Members on 18 February 2003;*

*2. recognises that it will assist businesses in Wales to identify and meet the challenges of sustainable development;*

*3. supports the action plan's guiding principles on sustainable development and resource management. (NDM1357)*

I am pleased to introduce the business and environment action plan for Wales. I welcome the opportunity for a timely debate of its principles and themes. I hope that this debate will yield thoughtful contributions from everyone, which will help inform our lead bodies in taking forward their actions during the period of initial delivery.

An annual report is automatically scheduled into action plans like this one, therefore I hope that Jocelyn Davies will appreciate that I intend to reject her amendment because her request is already implicit in my proposal. This action plan derives directly from our sustainable development duty, our working-in-partnership objectives and the strategic vision for business and environment as described in the chapter 'Setting a Fresh Direction' of 'A Winning Wales'. It comes at a time when business, service providers and others are looking for greater clarity and leadership on the sustainable business agenda in Wales.

Today, I will set the background and discuss how the action plan will deliver. A business environment scoping study was carried out by the ARENA Network and Groundwork Wales on behalf of the Welsh Assembly Government and the Welsh Development Agency, followed by an informal consultation with lead bodies and service providers.

3.40 p.m.

We then carried out an external consultation exercise under the title 'Sustainable Business Wales' during the autumn term. A revised version of the action plan, together with an overview of the responses, was discussed at

*busnes a'r amgylchedd, a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ar 18 Chwefror 2003;*

*2. yn cydnabod y bydd yn cynorthwyo busnesau yng Nghymru i nodi a wynebu'r her a ddaw yn sgîl datblygu cynaliadwy;*

*3. yn cefnogi prif egwyddorion y cynllun gweithredu ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy a rheoli adnoddau. (NDM1357)*

Yr wyf yn falch o gyflwyno'r cynllun gweithredu ar gyfer busnes a'r amgylchedd i Gymru. Croesawaf y cyfle i gael dadl amserol ar ei egwyddorion a'i themâu. Gobeithiaf y bydd y ddadl hon yn ysgogi cyfraniadau ystyriol gan bawb, a fydd o gymorth i oleuo meddwl ein cyrff arweiniol wrth iddynt gymryd camau ymlaen yn ystod y cyfnod cyntaf o'i weithredu.

Mae adroddiad blynyddol yn cael ei gynnwys yn awtomatig yn amserlen cynlluniau gweithredu o'r math hwn, felly gobeithiaf y bydd Jocelyn Davies yn deall fy mod am wrthod ei gwelliant am fod ei chais eisoes yn rhan annatod o'm cynnig. Mae'r cynllun gweithredu hwn yn deillio'n uniongyrchol o'n dyletswydd datblygu cynaliadwy, ein hamcanion o ran gweithio mewn partneriaeth a'r weledigaeth strategol ar gyfer busnes a'r amgylchedd fel y'i disgrifir yn y bennod 'Pennu Cyfeiriad Newydd' yn 'Cymru'n Ennill'. Daw ar adeg pan fo busnes, darparwyr gwasanaethau ac eraill yn ceisio mwy o eglurder ac arweiniad ar yr agenda busnes cynaliadwy yng Nghymru.

Heddiw, gwnaf ddisgrifio'r cefndir a thrafod sut y bydd y cynllun gweithredu'n cyrraedd y nod. Cynhaliwyd astudiaeth gwmpasu ar fusnes a'r amgylchedd gan Rwydwaith ARENA a Groundwork Cymru ar ran Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ac Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, a bu ymgynghoriad anffurfiol ar ôl hynny gyda chyrff arweiniol a darparwyr gwasanaethau.

Wedyn gwnaethom gynnal ymgynghoriad allanol o'r enw 'Busnes Cynaliadwy Cymru' yn ystod tymor yr hydref. Trafodwyd fersiwn diwygiedig o'r cynllun gweithredu, ynghyd â throsolwg ar yr ymatebion, yn y Pwyllgor

the Economic Development Committee and within the Assembly Cabinet. The responses to the consultation exercise gave unanimous support for the draft action plan, with many of the respondents particularly supporting the idea of a well co-ordinated approach.

Having considered all comments and views carefully, we have now produced an action plan that defines our objectives more clearly and provides a holistic framework for our lead bodies so that they can achieve the maximum benefits for organisations in Wales. Against our commitment to pursue sustainable development, we are constantly promoting the benefits of being more environmentally conscious and sensitive to diversity issues.

**David Davies:** Will the Minister tell us therefore whether this will be published on recyclable or recycled paper?

**Andrew Davies:** I assume that all Assembly and Government documents are printed on recyclable paper. However, I will seek confirmation of that.

Against our commitment to pursue sustainable development, we are constantly promoting the benefits of being more environmentally conscious and sensitive to diversity issues. However, if we impose sustainable development in its widest form too quickly upon companies, it could hinder rather than accelerate the take-up of economic, environmental and social best practice.

This action plan offers a phased approach, which will initially focus on resource management. This offers great commercial benefits for companies at the same time as minimising the burden on the environment. Our business and environment lead bodies in Wales already help organisations through a variety of support programmes, but this plan, through implementation of its three themes, will further enhance and focus the delivery of these services.

The first theme is that of a strategic

Datblygu Economaidd ac yng Nghabinet y Cynulliad. Yr oedd yr ymatebion i'r ymgynghoriad yn unfryd o blaid y cynllun gweithredu drafft, ac yr oedd llawer o'r rhai a ymatebodd yn cefnogi'n benodol y syniad o ddull gweithredu cydlynol.

Ar ôl ystyried yr holl sylwadau a safbwyntiau'n ofalus, yr ydym bellach wedi cynhyrchu cynllun gweithredu sy'n diffinio ein hamcanion yn eglurach ac yn darparu fframwaith cyfannol ar gyfer ein cyrff arweiniol fel y gallant sicrhau'r manteision mwyaf posibl i gyrff yng Nghymru. Ochr yn ochr â'n hymrwymiad i hybu datblygu cynaliadwy, yr ydym bob amser yn hyrwyddo'r manteision o fod yn fwy ymwybodol o'r amgylchedd ac yn sensitif i faterion sy'n ymwneud ag amrywiaeth.

**David Davies:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym a gyhoeddir hwn ar bapur ailgylchadwy neu ailgylchedig?

**Andrew Davies:** Cymeraf fod holl ddogfennau'r Cynulliad a'r Llywodraeth yn cael eu hargraffu ar bapur ailgylchadwy. Er hynny, ceisiaf gadarnhad o hynny.

Ochr yn ochr â'n hymrwymiad i hybu datblygu cynaliadwy, yr ydym bob amser yn hyrwyddo'r manteision o fod yn fwy ymwybodol o'r amgylchedd ac yn sensitif i faterion sy'n ymwneud ag amrywiaeth. Fodd bynnag, os gorfodwn ddatblygu cynaliadwy ar ei ffurf ehangaf yn rhy gyflym ar gwmnïau, gallai arafu yn hytrach na chyflymu'r graddau y maent yn ymgymryd â'r arferion economaidd, amgylcheddol a chymdeithasol gorau.

Mae'r cynllun gweithredu hwn yn cynnig dull gweithredu graddol, a fydd yn canolbwyntio'n gyntaf ar reoli adnoddau. Mae hyn yn cynnig manteision masnachol mawr i gwmnïau ac yn lleddfu'r baich ar yr amgylchedd yr un pryd. Mae ein cyrff arweiniol ar fusnes a'r amgylchedd yng Nghymru eisoes yn helpu cyrff drwy amryw o raglenni cymorth, ond bydd y cynllun hwn, drwy weithredu ei dair thema, yn hybu ac yn canolbwyntio gweithrediad y gwasanaethau hyn ymhellach.

Y thema gyntaf yw fframwaith strategol.

framework. The framework links up enhanced delivery, quality assurance and better evaluation against a clear policy agenda. It recognises the benefits of strong links with our new sustainable development forum for Wales and the UK Government's Advisory Committee on Business and the Environment. It sets out to improve, promote and market all aspects of sustainable development and enhance the training network and skills base for business and environment in Wales. It also suggests developing a holistic, analytical approach for ensuring the long-term sustainability of industrial sites in Wales.

This framework will provide the Assembly with the ability to measure how well the plan is progressing and how it should be further adapted against ever-changing circumstances. On the skills front, our lead bodies are already making progress through a new training programme, Confidence in Learning, which is an Objective 1 project supported by the European social fund and Education and Learning Wales, with the training provided by ARENA Network.

The second theme is sustainable solutions. It is designed to help businesses in Wales seize ever-increasing market opportunities through, for example, increased support for development of low carbon technologies and the encouragement of more growth in our environmental goods and services sector. It encourages innovation initiatives based around resource management and the development of an eco-design pilot project. It also encourages an adequate and integrated infrastructure to reprocess recycled materials associated with a stable and efficient recycle market. It also involves providing increased support for our environmental goods and services companies to seize international opportunities.

The final theme is that of greening Welsh business. This sets out to enhance the effectiveness of our service providers. It does this by setting targets for organisations to be accredited to environmental management systems, by raising the priority of energy conservation—which I will say more about in my statement on the energy programme in

Mae'r fframwaith yn cysylltu gweithredu gwell, sicrhau ansawdd a gwell gwerthuso ar sail agenda bolisi bendant. Cydnebydd y manteision a geir o gysylltiadau cryf â'n fforwm datblygu cynaliadwy newydd i Gymru a Phwyllgor Ymgynghorol Llywodraeth y DU ar Fusnes a'r Amgylchedd. Mae'n ceisio gwella, hyrwyddo a marchnata pob agwedd ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy a hybu'r rhwydwaith hyfforddi a'r sylfaen sgiliau ar gyfer busnes a'r amgylchedd yng Nghymru. Mae hefyd yn awgrymu datblygu dull gweithredu cyfannol, dadansoddol i sicrhau bod safleoedd diwydiannol yng Nghymru'n gynaliadwy yn y tymor hir.

Bydd y fframwaith hwn yn galluogi'r Cynulliad i fesur llwyddiant y cynllun ac i ganfod sut y gellid ei addasu ymhellach i amgylchiadau cyfnewidiol. O ran sgiliau, mae ein prif gyrff yn gwneud cynnydd eisoes drwy raglen hyfforddi newydd, Confidence in Learning, sy'n brosiect Amcan 1 a gefnogir gan gronfa gymdeithasol Ewrop a Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru, a darperir yr hyfforddiant ar ei gyfer gan Rwydwaith ARENA.

Yr ail thema yw atebion cynaliadwy. Ei hamcan yw helpu busnesau yng Nghymru i achub ar y nifer gynyddol o gyfleoedd a geir yn y farchnad, er enghraifft, drwy roi mwy o gymorth i ddatblygu technolegau carbon isel a hybu rhagor o dwf yn ein sector nwyddau a gwasanaethau amgylcheddol. Mae'n hybu mentrau arloesedd sy'n seiliedig ar reoli adnoddau a datblygu prosiect peilot mewn cynllunio ecolegol. Mae hefyd yn hyrwyddo seilwaith digonol ac integredig i ailbrosesu defnyddiau wedi'u hailgylchu mewn cysylltiad â marchnad sefydlog ac effeithlon ar eu cyfer. Mae hefyd yn golygu rhoi mwy o gymorth i'n cwmnïau nwyddau a gwasanaethau amgylcheddol gael achub ar gyfleoedd rhyngwladol.

Y thema olaf yw gwyrddu busnes Cymru. Mae'n ceisio hybu effeithiolrwydd ein darparwyr gwasanaethau. Gwnaiff hynny drwy osod targedau ar gyfer achredu cyrff o dan systemau rheoli amgylcheddol, drwy roi mwy o flaenoriaeth i arbed ynni—y dywedaf ragor amdano yn fy natganiad ar y rhaglen ynni yn y Cyfarfod Llawn yfory—a thrwy



tomorrow's Plenary—and by tackling sustainable procurement policies.

Members may already be aware of the ARENA Network organisation and its highly-regarded Green Dragon standard, which provides a phased approach for companies to adopt an environmental management system. By supporting companies such as Sony and Transco, to which I recently presented the Green Dragon award, we are demonstrating our commitment to environmental best practice. As Sony's managing director said at the award presentation, an environmentally sustainable business is a good business—it makes business sense. We will ensure that the well-regarded base of the Green Dragon standard is used as a spring board to make environmental management systems commonplace in Welsh organisations. We must urge companies to treat energy efficiency as a management priority and to make better use of support such as the Carbon Trust's Action Energy programme, which offers a tailor-made service to larger businesses that want to reduce energy costs and offers interest free loans to small and medium-sized enterprises. In effect, doing less with more.

By creating sustainable public procurement policies we can set an example and influence other public bodies to follow suit. By working together, lead bodies can help suppliers in Wales to win more orders, on merit. This action plan will make a difference to organisations, particularly small companies, and in the long term will allow Wales the opportunity to adopt sustainable best practice while ensuring economic stability. Businesses will only remain competitive in the longer term by embracing the sustainability agenda.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.45 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.45 p.m.*

**Janet Davies:** I propose amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to provide a progress report on the business*

ymdrin â pholisïau caffael cynaliadwy.

Efallai y bydd Aelodau'n gwybod eisoes am y corff Rhwydwaith ARENA a'i safon Draig Werdd, sy'n uchel ei pharch, sy'n cynnig modd i gwmnïau fabwysiadu system reoli amgylcheddol yn raddol. Drwy gefnogi cwmnïau fel Sony a Transco, y cyflwynais wobwr y Ddraig Werdd iddynt yn ddiweddar, yr ydym yn dangos ein hymrwymiad i'r ymarfer amgylcheddol gorau. Fel y dywedodd rheolwr gyfarwyddwr Sony yn y cyfarfod lle y cyflwynwyd y wobwr, mae busnes sy'n amgylcheddol gynaliadwy'n fusnes da—mae'n gwneud synnwyr o ran busnes. Gwnawn sicrhau y caiff y safon Draig Werdd uchel ei pharch ei defnyddio'n fan cychwyn i beri bod systemau rheoli amgylcheddol yn dod yn gyffredin mewn cyrff yng Nghymru. Rhaid inni annog cwmnïau i drin effeithlonrwydd ynni fel blaenoriaeth rheoli a gwneud gwell defnydd o gymorth fel rhaglen Action Energy yr Ymddiriedolaeth Carbon, sy'n cynnig gwasanaeth a addasir yn arbennig ar gyfer busnesau mwy sydd am leihau costau ynni ac yn cynnig benthyciadau di-log i fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint. Gwneud llai gyda mwy, mewn gwirionedd.

Drwy greu polisiau caffael cyhoeddus cynaliadwy gallwn osod esiampl a dylanwadu ar gyrff cyhoeddus eraill i'n dilyn. Drwy weithio gyda'i gilydd, gall cyrff arweiniol helpu cyflenwyr yng Nghymru i ennill rhagor o archebion, ar sail teilyngdod. Bydd y cynllun gweithredu hwn yn gwneud gwahaniaeth i gyrff, yn enwedig cwmnïau bach, ac yn y tymor hir bydd yn rhoi cyfle i Gymru fabwysiadu'r arferion cynaliadwy gorau gan sicrhau sefydlogrwydd economaidd yr un pryd. Ni fydd busnesau ond yn parhau'n gystadleuol yn y tymor hwy drwy dderbyn agenda cynaliadwyedd.

**Janet Davies:** Cynigïaf welliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i roi adroddiad ar hynt y cynllun gweithredu*

*and environment action plan within the next 12 months.*

This plan is badly needed. In achieving sustainable development, the Assembly must recognise the tension between economic growth and care for the environment more clearly than it has in the past. It is often said that our country is an ideal place to achieve sustainable development, but there are massive problems in doing so. We need economic growth in the Valleys where we must not only provide jobs but also we must maintain vibrant communities, the social and physical infrastructure and the new greenness of recent years. We also need growth in the rural areas beyond Swansea and throughout Ceredigion and Powys up to Denbighshire and all points west. However, we keep getting growth along the eastern M4 and the A55, which peters out towards the west. This brings major environmental problems, the longer travelling distances and poor public transport means an increase in cars and pollution. Furthermore, acres of green fields giving way to housing means a loss of habitat and wildlife corridors that amounts to a loss of species. Economic problems in the Valleys mean that housing loses value and communities break down. We must get economic development into the Valleys, Ceredigion, Gwynedd and Powys. It is a difficult project that is likely to face local opposition in some areas, remembering that these are the cleanest, greenest and most bio-diverse areas of the country and that development will change rural areas dramatically.

The Economic Development Committee will have spent many hours listening to experts discussing how to resolve this conflict. This plan puts forward the benefits that accrue for companies that work with the environment. It will be difficult for existing firms, particularly small and medium-sized enterprises, to find resources to change. European Union directives are the drivers of environmental improvements and successes. New companies need help to establish their operations in ways that will embrace and embed environmental techniques and strategies. On page 3 of the plan there is a

*ar gyfer busnes a'r amgylchedd o fewn y 12 mis nesaf.*

Mae taer angen y cynllun hwn. Wrth sicrhau datblygu cynaliadwy, rhaid i'r Cynulliad gydnabod y gwrthdymnu rhwng twf economaidd a gofal am yr amgylchedd yn fwy eglur nag a wnaeth yn y gorffennol. Dywedir yn aml fod ein gwlad yn lle delfrydol i sicrhau datblygu cynaliadwy, ond ceir problemau aruthrol wrth wneud hynny. Mae arnom angen twf economaidd yn y Cymoedd lle y mae'n rhaid inni ddarparu swyddi a hefyd gynnal cymunedau bywiog, y seilwaith cymdeithasol a ffisegol a gwyrddni newydd y blynyddoedd diweddar. Mae arnom angen twf yn yr ardaloedd gwledig y tu hwnt i Abertawe a ledled Ceredigion a Phowys a hyd at Sir Ddinbych a phob man tua'r gorllewin. Yr hyn o gawn o hyd, fodd bynnag, yw twf ar hyd rhan ddwyreiniol yr M4 a'r A55, sy'n dod i ben tua'r gorllewin. Mae hyn yn arwain at broblemau amgylcheddol mawr, mae'r pellteroedd teithio hwy a'r drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus wael yn golygu mwy o geir a mwy o ddfwytiant. At hynny, mae ildio erwau o gaeau glas i dai yn golygu colli cynefinoedd a choridorau bywyd gwyllt sy'n arwain at golli rhywogaethau. Mae problemau economaidd yn y Cymoedd yn golygu bod tai'n colli eu gwerth a bod cymunedau'n ymddatod. Rhaid inni roi datblygu economaidd ar waith yn y Cymoedd, Ceredigion, Gwynedd a Phowys. Mae'n brosiect anodd sy'n debygol o gael ei wrthwynebu'n lleol mewn rhai ardaloedd, o gofio mai'r rhain yw'r ardaloedd glanaf, gwyrddaf a mwyaf biolegol amrywiol yn y wlad ac y bydd datblygu'n peri newid trawiadol mewn ardaloedd gwledig.

Bydd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd wedi treulio oriau lawer yn gwrandao ar arbenigwyr yn trafod sut i ddatrys y gwrthdaro hwn. Mae'r cynllun hwn yn cyflwyno'r manteision a ddaw i ran cwmnïau sy'n gweithio gyda'r amgylchedd. Bydd yn anodd i'r busnesau presennol, yn enwedig rhai bach a chanolig eu maint, ddod o hyd i adnoddau i newid. Cyfarwyddbau'r Undeb Ewropeaidd sy'n ysgogi gwelliannau a llwyddiannau amgylcheddol. Mae ar gwmnïau newydd angen cymorth i gychwyn eu gweithrediadau mewn modd a fydd yn cwmpasu ac yn sefydlu technegau a strategaethau

reference to managing resources from a whole-life perspective. This is essential and promoting it requires consistent support from the Government and its agencies. However, it also requires firms to have an understanding of Government guidelines on EU directives, such as those on waste management and habitats and species. Given that DEFRA has signally failed to produce such guidelines in good time, or to produce them at all in the recent past, will this not be a major obstacle to successful achievement?

Plaid Cymru supports the need to phase in measures, provided that the phases progress clearly and at sufficient speed. Our amendment explicitly notes that progress must be monitored so that remedial action can be taken when necessary. We also accept the necessity of prioritising management of resources but this will demand a far greater effort from concerned parties than we have previously seen.

There are three themes to the action plan and I will refer to just one of them—sustainable solutions. I have come across medium-sized firms with good ideas that are central to sustainability. I have previously mentioned a firm that deals with waste management and recently I came across a firm which is in the early days of exploiting naturally occurring mine and coalfield gas in south-east Wales. As yet, neither has reached its full potential. Wariness and mistrust of Government agencies means that they work independently, yet they have so much to give to our economy and environment. If we are to achieve our sustainable development objectives, firms such as these will need all the encouragement and support that they can get.

3.50 p.m.

**Mick Bates:** Thank you, Minister, for outlining this business and environment action plan, which the Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome. The plan is the product of the Assembly Government's economic development strategy, 'A Winning Wales', and its objective is to encourage green

amgylcheddol. Ar dudalen 3 y cynllun cyfeirir at reoli adnoddau o safbwynt oes gyfan. Mae hyn yn hollbwysig ac er mwyn ei hyrwyddo rhaid wrth gymorth cyson gan y Llywodraeth a'i hasiantaethau. Fodd bynnag, mae hefyd yn golygu y bydd yn rhaid i fusnesau ddeall canllawiau'r Llywodraeth ar gyfarwydddebau'r UE, fel y rhai ar reoli gwastraff a chynefinoedd a rhywogaethau. Gan fod DEFRA wedi methu'n llwyr â chynhyrchu canllawiau o'r fath yn brydlon, neu eu cynhyrchu o gwbl yn ddiweddar, oni fydd hyn yn rhwystr mawr i lwyddiant?

Mae Plaid Cymru yn ategu'r angen i gyflwyno mesurau'n raddol, ar yr amod bod y cynnydd yn amlwg ac yn ddigon cyflym. Mae ein gwelliant yn nodi'n eglur fod rhaid monitro'r cynnydd fel y gellir cymryd camau adferol pan fo angen. Yr ydym hefyd yn derbyn yr angen i roi blaenoriaeth i reoli adnoddau ond bydd hyn yn gofyn llawer mwy o ymdrech gan y rhai sy'n gysylltiedig nag a welsom cyn hyn.

Mae tair thema i'r cynllun gweithredu a chyfeiriaf at un ohonynt yn unig—atebion cynaliadwy. Deuthum ar draws busnesau canolig eu maint sydd â syniadau da sy'n anhepgor ar gyfer cynaliadwyedd. Yr wyf wedi sôn o'r blaen am fusnes sy'n delio â rheoli gwastraff ac, yn ddiweddar, deuthum ar draws busnes sy'n dechrau defnyddio nwy sy'n digwydd yn naturiol mewn cloddfeydd ac mewn meysydd glo yn y De-ddwyrain. Hyd yn hyn, nid yw'r naill na'r llall wedi cyflawni ei botensial. Am eu bod yn ochelgar ac yn ddrwgdybus o asiantaethau Llywodraeth, maent yn gweithio'n annibynnol, ac eto mae ganddynt gymaint i'w gyfrannu i'n heconomi a'n hamgylchedd. Os ydym i gyrraedd ein hamcanion o ran datblygu cynaliadwy, bydd ar fusnesau fel y rhain angen yr holl anogaeth a chefnogaeth y gallant eu cael.

**Mick Bates:** Diolch i chi, Weinidog, am amlinellu'r cynllun gweithredu hwn ar gyfer busnes a'r amgylchedd, a groesewir gan Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru. Mae'r cynllun yn deillio o strategaeth datblygu economaidd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, 'Cymru'n Ennill', a'i amcan yw hybu

opportunities and environmental best practice in business. It also builds on the Assembly's commitment to sustainable development. The Assembly has already developed a sustainable development scheme, which is unique and we can be justifiably proud of it.

The business and environmental action plan is testament to a necessary shift in economic development and environmental thinking. We must ensure economic growth and the economic livelihood of the people of Wales, but we must also protect the environment. It cannot be a case of environmentalists versus business people; it must be a case of environmentalists working with business people to create a sustainable future. The mantra must be, 'Let us work together to achieve this'.

The action plan's slogan is 'Making more with less'. The first stage of the objective must be to improve resource management. This is an essential first step for any sustainable future. Energy efficiency, recycling, and increased use of environmentally friendly packaging and sustainable building materials are particularly important.

The action plan rightly highlights that sustainable solutions must be found and seeks to promote the commercial opportunities of new, low-carbon technology, encourage more innovation in business and environmental activities, and provide more support for research and development. I believe that we must take a step forward in this area in our innovation plan. Developing a science strategy for Wales has been mentioned in the Economic Development Committee and many of these issues would flow from that, particularly in terms of innovation. The development of recycling and markets for recycled products is also a key area and has the potential to create business and job opportunities.

We must integrate our thinking and ensure that, as research and development is undertaken, we consider how we can use recycled products, as European regulations

cyfleoedd gwyrdd a'r arferion amgylcheddol gorau mewn busnes. Mae hefyd yn adeiladu ar sail ymrwymiad y Cynulliad i ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Mae'r Cynulliad eisoes wedi datblygu cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy, sy'n unigryw ac yn un y gallwn ymfalchïo ynddo.

Mae cynllun gweithredu busnes a'r amgylchedd yn dyst i newid angenrheidiol yn y meddwl am ddatblygu economaidd a'r amgylchedd. Rhaid inni sicrhau twf economaidd a bywoliaeth economaidd pobl Cymru, ond rhaid inni warchod yr amgylchedd hefyd. Ni chaiff fod yn fater o wrthdymnu rhwng amgylcheddwyr a phobl busnes; rhaid iddo fod yn fater o amgylcheddwyr yn gweithio gyda phobl busnes i greu dyfodol cynaliadwy. Y mantra sydd ei angen yw, 'Gadewch inni weithio gyda'n gilydd i gyflawni hyn'.

Arwyddair y cynllun gweithredu yw 'Gwneud mwy gyda llai'. Y cam cyntaf tuag at yr amcan hwnnw, o reidrwydd, yw gwella rheoli adnoddau. Dyma gam cyntaf hanfodol ar gyfer unrhyw ddyfodol cynaliadwy. Mae effeithlonrwydd ynni, ailgylchu, a mwy o ddefnydd o becynnu amgylchedd-garedig a defnyddiau adeiladu cynaliadwy yn arbennig o bwysig.

Mae'r cynllun gweithredu'n tynnu sylw'n briodol at y ffaith bod rhaid dod o hyd i atebion cynaliadwy ac mae'n ceisio hyrwyddo'r cyfleoedd masnachol a geir o dechnoleg newydd, carbon-isel, yn hybu rhagor o arloesi mewn gweithgareddau busnes ac amgylcheddol, ac yn rhoi mwy o gymorth ar gyfer ymchwil a datblygu. Credaf fod yn rhaid inni gymryd cam ymlaen yn y maes hwn yn ein cynllun arloesedd. Cyfeiriwyd at ddatblygu strategaeth gwyddoniaeth i Gymru yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a byddai llawer o'r materion hyn yn deillio o hynny, yn enwedig o ran arloesi. Mae datblygu ailgylchu a marchnadoedd ar gyfer cynhyrchion ailgylchedig yn faes allweddol hefyd ac mae ynddo'r potensial i greu busnes a chyfleoedd gwaith.

Rhaid inni integreiddio ein syniadau a sicrhau, wrth ymgymryd ag ymchwil a datblygu, ein bod yn ystyried sut y gallwn ddefnyddio cynhyrchion ailgylchedig, gan

are a factor in this respect. For example, a recent regulation by the European court will greatly affect the way in which we can dispose of waste, as it has ruled that some waste disposal activities, such as incineration, are non-recovering, and therefore, you will no longer be able to derive energy from such waste. However, the forthcoming electrical goods waste regulations will offer business opportunities.

The Deputy First Minister and Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad recently launched, in Llanwddyn, Montgomeryshire, the first biomass heating project in Wales. Small, private businesses should be encouraged to visit this exemplar project, to see how they can reduce their running costs by using timber, while also reducing carbon emissions. This is our central theme and goal.

I am pleased to see, from the greening Welsh business section of the action plan, that the Assembly is ensuring that its own procurement policies are based on sustainable objectives. It is vital that the Assembly takes the lead on this and demonstrates that it is setting the pace. However, the way in which we assess data is important. I have long been concerned that the raw gross domestic product measure does not encourage us, as a nation, to consider how we impact on our environment. I strongly recommend that we move to an index of sustainable economic welfare, which would enable us to assess how our theme of sustainable development impacts on the Welsh environment.

Finally, with all these great aims, it is time that the Assembly recognised the efforts of many small businesses in Wales to achieve these goals so that we have our own business and environment awards, which would encourage all companies to move in the direction that we want. This is the beginning of something very good. Let us hope it is, and let us hope that the funding is there to enable our businesses to move in the right direction.

**David Davies:** This business and environment action plan looks like an

fod rheoliadau Ewropeaidd yn ffactor yn hyn o beth. Er enghraifft, bydd rheoliad diweddar a wnaed gan y llys Ewropeaidd yn cael effaith fawr ar y modd y gallwn gwaredu gwastraff, gan ei fod wedi dyfarnu bod rhai gweithgareddau gwaredu gwastraff, fel llosgi, yn anadferol, ac felly, ni fyddwch bellach yn gallu cael ynni o wastraff o'r fath. Er hynny, bydd y rheoliadau ar wastraff nwyddau trydanol sydd ar ddod yn cynnig cyfleoedd busnes.

Yn ddiweddar, gwnaeth y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor lansio, yn Llanwddyn, Sir Drefaldwyn, y prosiect gwresogi biomas cyntaf yng Nghymru. Dylid annog busnesau bach, preifat i ymweld â'r prosiect enghreifftiol hwn, i weld sut y gallant leihau eu costau rhedeg drwy ddefnyddio coed, gan leihau gollyngiadau carbon yr un pryd. Dyma ein thema a'n nod ganolog.

Yr wyf yn falch o weld, oddi wrth yr adran yn y cynllun ar wyrddu busnes yng Nghymru, fod y Cynulliad yn sicrhau bod ei bolisiau caffael ei hun yn seiliedig ar amcanion cynaliadwy. Mae'n hollbwysig bod y Cynulliad yn arwain ar hyn ac yn dangos ei fod ar y blaen. Fodd bynnag, mae'r modd yr ydym yn asesu data'n bwysig. Yr wyf yn bryderus ers amser maith nad yw'r mesur cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth bras yn ein cymell, fel cenedl, i ystyried ein heffaith ar yr amgylchedd. Yr wyf yn argymhell yn gryf y dylem symud at fynegrif lles economaidd cynaliadwy, a'n galluogai i asesu sut y mae ein thema o ddatblygu cynaliadwy'n effeithio ar yr amgylchedd yng Nghymru.

Yn olaf, gyda'r holl amcanion rhagorol hyn, mae'n bryd i'r Cynulliad gydnabod yr ymdrechion a wneir gan lawer o fusnesau bach yng Nghymru i gyrraedd y nodau hyn fel y gallwn gael ein gwobrwyon busnes a'r amgylchedd ein hun, a fyddai'n annog pob cwmni i symud i'r cyfeiriad a ddymunwn. Dyma ddechrau rhywbeth da iawn. Gadewch inni obeithio mai dyna ydyw, a gadewch inni obeithio bod cyllid ar gael i alluogi ein busnesau i symud i'r cyfeiriad iawn.

**David Davies:** Mae'r cynllun gweithredu hwn ar gyfer busnes a'r amgylchedd yn

innocuous if vacant document, which exhorts businesses to be more environmentally sensitive; but it is essentially meaningless, as one would expect. Numerous civil servants have spend many hours drafting it, conjuring up a utopian picture of how companies could thrive and prosper, if only they would erect windmills on their premises and adopt policies of purchasing supplies, not from the cheapest supplier, which is normally the case if you want to survive in business, but from whoever happens to have the biggest number of brownie points from the environmental lobby.

This document will be published and distributed to large numbers of businesses, whose managers will flick through it quickly, snigger quietly and then chuck it straight into the bin. I have nothing in particular against that, except that it is a waste of money and that not all our documents are produced on recycled paper. Most of them are not. I asked a question about it recently. I have no reason to think that this document is printed on recycled paper.

I have some specific concerns. First, the Minister talks of changing public body procurement policy, what exactly does he mean by this? Who will decide whether or not a company which is supplying material to the National Assembly for Wales or to any other public body is complying with some environmental scheme? If a public body does not procure supplies from the cheapest possible source, that will be bad news for taxpayers, and we need a full explanation of that. I am concerned about the language used in the document—[*Interruption.*] Does the Deputy First Minister wish to intervene? He is more than welcome to. No, obviously he does not.

Unlike the Deputy First Minister, who seems to be laughing and sniggering throughout this, I worked in a family transport business for many years. It was a company that grew from a £50 per week Welsh Development Agency grant to a company with a £2 million turnover. We worked in transport, which is one of the fields mentioned in here. You

ymddangos yn ddogfen ddiniwed os gwag, sy'n annog busnesau i fod yn fwy amgylcheddol sensitif; ond mae'n ddiystyr, yn y bôn, fel y byddai rhywun yn disgwyl. Mae nifer o weision sifil wedi treulio oriau lawer yn ei drafftio, gan greu darlun iwtopaidd o'r modd y gallai cwmnïau ffynnu a llwyddo, pe na fyddent ond yn codi melinau gwynt ar eu tir ac yn mabwysiadu polisi o brynu cyflenwadau, nid gan y cyflenwr rhataf, sef yr hyn sy'n digwydd fel arfer os ydych am barhau mewn busnes, ond gan bwy bynnag sy'n digwydd bod wedi cael y nifer fwyaf o sêr aur gan y lobi amgylcheddol.

Caiff y ddogfen hon ei chyhoeddi a'i dosbarthu i nifer fawr o fusnesau, y bydd eu rheolwyr yn bodio drwyddi'n gyflym, yn cilwenu'n ddistaw ac wedyn yn ei thaflu'n syth i'r bin. Nid oes gennyf ddim byd yn benodol yn erbyn hynny, heblaw ei fod yn wastraff arian ac na chynhyrchir y cwbl o'n dogfennau ar bapur a ailgylchwyd. Nid yw hynny'n digwydd i'r rhan fwyaf ohonynt. Gofynnais gwestiwn am hynny'n ddiweddar. Nid oes gennyf unrhyw le i gredu bod y ddogfen hon wedi'i hargraffu ar bapur a ailgylchwyd.

Mae gennyf rai pryderon penodol. Yn gyntaf, mae'r Gweinidog yn sôn am newid polisi caffael cyrff cyhoeddus, ond beth yn union y mae'n ei olygu wrth hynny? Pwy fydd yn penderfynu a yw cwmni sy'n cyflenwi defnyddiau i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru neu i unrhyw gorff cyhoeddus arall yn cydymffurfio â rhyw gynllun amgylcheddol? Os nad yw corff cyhoeddus yn caffael cyflenwadau o'r ffynhonnell rataf posibl, bydd hynny'n newyddion drwg i'r trethdalwyr, ac mae arnom angen eglurhad llawn ar hynny. Yr wyf yn bryderus ynghylch yr iaith a ddefnyddir yn y ddogfen—[*Torri ar draws.*] A yw'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn dymuno ymyrryd? Mae pob croeso iddo wneud hynny. Na, mae'n amlwg nad ydyw.

Yn wahanol i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog, yr ymddengys ei fod yn chwethin ac yn cilwenu drwy hyn, fe weithiais mewn busnes cludiant teuluol am flynyddoedd lawer. Yr oedd yn gwmni a dyfodd o grant £50 yr wythnos gan Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru yn gwmni â throsiant o £2 filiwn. Yr oeddem yn gweithio mewn cludiant, sy'n un o'r

might think that it is exactly the kind of company that this document seeks to target. But if this sort of thing came through the letterbox, it would go into the bin, because the language does not make any sense. What does

‘integration of business sustainability into Welsh Development Agency business gateway mainstream support programmes’

mean? I have no doubt that it is easy enough once you explain it, but you will not be able to go and explain it to the managers in companies and they will not want to hang around listening for an explanation, because they are too busy trying to make profits and survive. There are many examples of that in that document.

I am also concerned about sustainable building materials. Can the Minister tell us which building materials are not sustainable? Figures show that virtually every material that is used in building at the moment is available in vast quantities throughout the world.

**Mick Bates:** Will you give way?

**David Davies:** I will give way. Mick Bates does the courtesy of asking me, unlike his boss-man.

**Mick Bates:** Thank you for giving way, David. I want to clarify a point about the commercial operation of the tendering process. You suggest that we always buy the cheapest. Myself and my colleagues in the agricultural industry are always promoting our own products, such as Welsh lamb and Welsh beef. Are you suggesting that because Argentinian beef is cheaper, or because New Zealand lamb is cheaper, that every local authority, and everyone else, should buy those products?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. We must keep to the subject of this debate.

**David Davies:** Obviously not. That has nothing to do with it. That was nothing but a clever ploy to get me off track. You will always try to buy good quality, Mick. But the point is that if you are going to have the

meysydd a grybyllir yma. Gallech feddwl mai dyna'r union fath o gwmni y mae'r ddogfen hon yn ceisio ei dargedu. Ond os deuai rhywbeth o'r math hwn drwy'r twll llythrau, âi'n syth i'r bin, am nad yw'r iaith yn gwneud unrhyw synnwyr. Beth y mae

integreiddio cynaliadwyedd busnes â rhaglenni cymorth prif ffrwd porth busnes Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru

yn ei olygu? Nid wyf yn amau na fydd yn ddigon hawdd ei ddeall wedi ichi ei egluro, ond ni allwch fynd at y rheolwyr mewn cwmnïau a'i egluro ac ni fyddant am aros i wrando am eglurhad, gan eu bod yn rhy brysur yn ceisio gwneud elw a pharhau mewn busnes. Mae llawer o enghreifftiau o hynny yn y ddogfen honno.

Yr wyf hefyd yn poeni ynghylch defnyddiau adeiladu cynaliadwy. A all y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym pa ddefnyddiau adeiladu nad ydynt yn gynaliadwy? Dengys ffigurau fod symiau anferth i'w cael ledled y byd o ymron bob defnydd a ddefnyddir i adeiladu ar hyn o bryd.

**Mick Bates:** A wnewch ildio?

**David Davies:** Gwnaf ildio. Mae Mick Bates mor gwrtais â gofyn i mi, yn wahanol i'w feistr.

**Mick Bates:** Diolch i chi am ildio, David. Hoffwn egluro pwynt ynghylch gweithrediad masnachol y broses dendro. Awgrymwch ein bod yn prynu'r cynnyrch rhataf bob tro. Yr wyf fi a'm cydweithwyr yn y diwydiant amaethyddol bob amser yn hyrwyddo ein cynhyrchion ein hun, megis cig oen a chig eidion o Gymru. A ydych yn awgrymu, am fod cig eidion o'r Ariannin yn rhatach, neu am fod cig oen o Seland Newydd yn rhatach, y dylai pob awdurdod lleol, a phawb arall, brynu'r cynhyrchion hynny?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Rhaid inni gadw at bwnc y ddadl hon.

**David Davies:** Nac ydwyf, wrth gwrs. Mae hynny'n gwbl amherthnasol. Nid oedd hynny'n ddim ond dyfais glyfar i'm bwrw oddi ar y trywydd. Byddwch bob amser yn ceisio prynu cynnyrch o ansawdd da, Mick.

public buying—[*Interruption.*]

Let me finish—calm down. If you expect public bodies to procure from a source that is not the cheapest, then we need a full explanation as to what the criteria will be. I can think of lots of reasons why the Ministry of Defence would want to buy British beef rather than Argentinian. I regret that it does not always do that. The criteria should be clearly laid down, otherwise we are going to get a 'jobs for the boys or girls' situation, with public bodies procuring from whoever they want, not because it is a better quality product, but because it happens to be supplied by someone of whom they might approve.

4.00 p.m.

The Minister has said that his scheme offers great commercial benefits to all companies and, if that is the case, then he will have no problem getting companies to sign up. I suspect that the vast majority of companies will share my scepticism and therefore I seek assurance that everything in this plan will be optional.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am y datganiad arbennig hwn o bolisi'r Llywodraeth ym maes polisi economaidd a ddatblygir yn gynaliadwy. Nid yw pob perchennog busnes yng Nghymru yn rhannu siniciaeth David Davies, ac nid ydynt mor unlygeidiog ag ef. Gwyddom beth fyddai canlyniad dilyn y math o bolisiau a awgryma oherwydd dioddefodd llawer o fusnesau yng Nghymru rhwng 1979 ac 1997 o ganlyniad i bolisiau'r Llywodraeth Geidwadol oedd yn denu busnesau i Gymru ond yn gwneud dim i gynnal nac i hybu busnesau cynhenid. Mae'r cynllun a gyflwyna Llywodraeth Cymru yn cynnig rhywfaint o obaith y gallwn ddatblygu ein heconomi mewn ffordd sy'n gydnaws â busnesau Cymru. Mae'r egwyddorion a'r hyn yr ydych yn gobeithio ei gyflawni yn dderbyniol. Fodd bynnag, oni fyddech yn credu—a ninnau'n agosáu at etholiadau cyntaf Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru—y dylai canlyniadau rhai o'ch polisiau fod yn

Ond y pwynt yw, os bydd y cyhoedd yn prynu—[*Torri ar draws.*]

Gadewch imi orffen—byddwch yn dawel. Os disgwyliwch i gyrff cyhoeddus gaffael o ffynhonnell heblaw'r un rataf, mae arnom angen eglurhad llawn ynghylch pa feini prawf a ddefnyddir. Gallaf feddwl am lawer o resymau pam y byddai'r Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn yn dymuno prynu cig eidion o Brydain yn hytrach na chig eidion o'r Ariannin. Mae'n ofid i mi nad yw'n gwneud hynny bob amser. Dylid nodi'r meini prawf yn eglur neu, fel arall, cawn sefyllfa o 'swyddi i'r dethol rai', lle y mae cyrff cyhoeddus yn caffael gan bwy bynnag a ddymunant, nid am ei fod yn well cynnyrch, ond am ei fod yn digwydd cael ei gyflenwi gan rywun sydd, o bosibl, yn cael sêl eu bendith.

Mae'r Gweinidog wedi dweud bod ei gynllun yn cynnig manteision masnachol mawr i bob cwmni ac, os felly, ni fydd yn ei chael yn anodd cael gan gwmnïau ymuno. Yr wyf yn amau y bydd y mwyafrif llethol o gwmnïau mor amheugar â minnau ac felly gofynnaf am sicrwydd y bydd dewis ynghylch popeth yn y cynllun hwn.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I thank the Minister for this particular statement on the Government's policy in the field of economic policy that is developed in a sustainable manner. Not all business owners in Wales share David Davies's cynicism and neither are they as biased as he is. We all know what the consequences of implementing the kind of policies that he suggests would be because many businesses in Wales suffered between 1979 and 1997 as a result of the Conservative Government's policies that attracted businesses to Wales but failed to do anything to sustain or to promote indigenous businesses. The scheme presented by the Government of Wales offers some hope that we can develop our economy in a way that is appropriate for businesses in Wales. The principles and what you hope to achieve are acceptable. However, do you not believe—as we approach the first National Assembly for Wales elections—that the results of some of your policies should now be evident?



amllwg erbyn hyn?

Yr ydych yn sôn am greu ynni glân ac am ddefnyddio cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd a chynhaliaeth ariannol arall er mwyn hybu hyn. A ddywedwch pam mai dim ond 16 y cant o'r £26 miliwn sydd ar gael i ddatblygu'r sector ynni glân a ymrwymwyd yn ystod tair blynedd cyntaf Amcan 1? Pam y talwyd allan lai nag 1 y cant o'r cymhorthdal hwn? Weinidog, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn dweud wrthym—fel y gwnewch yn gyson—fod y dechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu ddiweddaraf a'i isadeiledd yn eithriadol o bwysig i Gymru. Clywsom y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor yn dweud hynny yn gynharach. Gofynnais y cwestiwn hwn iddo ac fe ddewisodd beidio ag ateb. Efallai y byddwch chi yn barod i ateb pam na wariwyd ceiniog o'r £70 miliwn a glustnodwyd ar gyfer hynny o fewn Amcan 1 hyd yn hyn?

Y mae £70 miliwn arall ar gael ar gyfer isadeiledd amgylcheddol, ond ymrwymwyd llai na £1 miliwn ohono hyd yn hyn. Llai na 2 y cant o'r arian sydd ar gael ar gyfer trafnidiaeth a hygyrchedd a wariwyd, a dim ond 10 y cant ohono a ymrwymwyd. Dim ond 3 y cant o'r £15 miliwn o grantiau sydd ar gael ar gyfer isadeiledd sydd wedi'i ymrwymo. Cytunwn â'ch bwriadau a'ch dyheadau, Weinidog, ond nid yw'r ystadegau yn tystio i lwyddiannau'r Llywodraeth.

Beth yn union yr ydych yn ei olygu wrth sôn am ddatblygu economi gynaliadwy? A ydych yn sôn am gynnal datblygiad economaidd neu am ddatblygu'r economi yn gynaliadwy? Mae'r ddau beth yn dra gwahanol ac o ddarlenn eich adroddiad nid wyf yn glir at ba un yr ydych yn cyfeirio. Soniasoch fod 80 y cant o'r cymorth dewisol rhanbarthol—y prif gymhorthdal a delir er mwyn helpu busnesau sefydlu yma—wedi ei gyflwyno i fusnesau yng Nghymru ond mae gwahaniaeth rhwng busnesau yng Nghymru a busnesau o Gymru, lle mae'r arian sy'n mynd i fewn i'r busnesau hynny'n cael ei ailfuddsoddi yn yr economi Gymreig. A wnewch gadarnhau mai dim ond 28 y cant o'r cymorthdaliadau hyn sydd wedi'u rhoi i fusnesau Cymreig, a bod 72 y cant o'r cymorthdaliadau wedi'u rhoi i

You mention generating clean energy and using the European structural funds and other financial means to develop this. Will you tell us why only 16 per cent of the £26 million that is available to develop the clean energy sector has been committed during the first three years of Objective 1? Why has less than 1 per cent of this subsidy been paid out? Minister, I am sure that you will tell us—as you often do—that the latest information and communications technology and its infrastructure are exceptionally important for Wales. We heard the Deputy First Minister and Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad saying that earlier. I asked him this question and he chose not to answer. Perhaps you will be willing to tell us why not one penny of the £70 million that has been allocated for that within Objective 1 has been spent to date?

Another £70 million is available for environmental infrastructure, but less than £1 million has been committed to date. Less than 2 per cent of the money that is available for transport and accessibility has been spent, and only 10 per cent of it has been committed. Only 3 per cent of the £15 million of grants that are available for energy infrastructure has been committed. We agree with your intentions and aspirations Minister, but the statistics do not attest to the Government's achievements.

What exactly do you mean when you refer to developing a sustainable economy? Are you talking about sustaining economic development or developing the economy in a sustainable way? They are two quite different issues and from reading your report I am not clear as to which you refer. You mentioned that 80 per cent of regional selective assistance—the main subsidy paid to help businesses establish here—has been given to businesses in Wales but there is a difference between businesses in Wales and businesses from Wales, where the money that goes into those businesses is reinvested in the Welsh economy. Will you confirm that only 28 per cent of those subsidies have been given to Welsh businesses, and that 72 per cent of those subsidies have gone to businesses from

fusnesau o'r tu allan i Gymru er mwyn iddynt adleoli i Gymru? Mae'r arian a gynhyrchir gan y busnesau hynny yn gadael Cymru, ac nid ydym yn elwa arno. Sut y mae hynny'n cydweddu â'r syniad o economi gynaliadwy yng Nghymru?

Weinidog, croesawaf eich dyheadau. Fodd bynnag, ar ôl tair blynedd a hanner o Lywodraeth Cymru, mae'n hen bryd troi dyheadau yn ganlyniadau go iawn.

**Alun Cairns:** I will add to some of the comments made by my colleague, David Davies. It is worth putting the economy in context. Business is hurting, and the Welsh economy is suffering as a result. Despite the Minister's claims about employment, the targets set to be achieved by March 2003—particularly in communities that need more development, let alone sustainable development—have not been met. The target for the creation of 34,000 jobs, set for March 2003, has not been achieved. The electorate will judge the Government on that.

**Brian Gibbons:** I am sure that the electorate will be happy to compare the Labour Government's record with the disastrous record of the previous Conservative administration.

**Alun Cairns:** The electorate will see that, compared with the rest of the United Kingdom, we are poorer now than we were in the last century. Voters will mark their crosses on the ballot paper accordingly.

Although I am sure that the Minister intended for this document to address the sustainability agenda, I fear that the business community will be sceptical. The business community's experience of so-called sustainable policies, from both the Assembly and Westminster Governments, means that it believes that sustainability costs money. Policies pursued in the name of sustainability, such as the climate change levy, have cost manufacturing industries enormous sums of money. The Economic Development Committee met a fortnight ago in Shotton, where a company director made a presentation to the

outside Wales so that they can relocate to Wales? The money that is generated by those businesses leaves Wales and we do not profit from it. How does that lie with the idea of a sustainable economy in Wales?

Minister, I welcome your aspirations. However, after three and a half years of the Government of Wales, it is high time that aspirations become real results.

**Alun Cairns:** Ymhelaethaf ar rai o'r sylwadau a wnaeth fy nghyd-Aelod, David Davies. Mae'n werth rhoi'r economi yn ei chyd-destun. Mae busnes mewn trafferthion, ac mae economi Cymru'n dioddef o ganlyniad. Er gwaethaf honiadau'r Gweinidog am gyflogaeth, ni chyrrhaeddwyd y targedau a bennwyd ar gyfer Mawrth 2003—yn enwedig mewn cymunedau y mae arnynt angen rhagor o ddatblygu, heb sôn am ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Ni chyrrhaeddwyd y targed ar gyfer creu 34,000 o swyddi, a bennwyd ar gyfer Mawrth 2003. Bydd yr etholwyr yn barnu'r Llywodraeth ar sail hynny.

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yr etholwyr yn falch o gymharu record y Llywodraeth Lafur â record drychinebus y weinyddiaeth Geidwadol flaenorol.

**Alun Cairns:** Bydd yr etholwyr yn gweld ein bod yn dlotach yn awr, o'n cymharu â gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig, nag yr oeddem yn y ganrif ddiwethaf. Bydd pleidleiswyr yn rhoi eu croesau ar y papur pleidleisio yn unol â hynny.

Er fy mod yn siŵr bod y Gweinidog yn bwriadu i'r ddogfen hon roi sylw i'r agenda cynaliadwyedd, mae arnaf ofn y bydd y gymuned fusnes yn amheus ohoni. Mae profiad y gymuned fusnes o bolisiau cynaliadwy, fel y'u gelwir, o eiddo Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a Llywodraeth San Steffan, yn golygu ei bod yn credu bod cynaliadwyedd yn costio arian. Mae polisiau a ddilynir yn enw cynaliadwyedd, fel yr ardoll newid hinsawdd, wedi costio symiau anferth o arian i ddiwydiannau gweithgynhyrchu. Cyfarfu'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd bythefnos yn ôl yn

Committee underlining the cost of the climate change levy, telling us what a blunt instrument it had been, and the difference it had made to the bottom line, running to millions of pounds.

The interpretation and timing of legislation is also key. I have been closely involved with a company which has been asked by the Environment Agency to fit a carbon scrubber. I am aware of similar companies in other parts of the world, such as northern Spain, which have not been asked by the equivalent of the Environment Agency to fit carbon scrubbers, despite this being a Europe-wide policy. Carbon scrubbers cost £5 million.

All this needs to be set in context. Business is hurting, taxes are rising and, to date, the business community's impression is that sustainability costs more despite what the Assembly Government says.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Gwrandewais yn ofalus ar eich dadansoddiad economaidd o'r hyn sydd ei angen ar fusnesau yng Nghymru. A wrthodwch y ddadl y gall datblygu'r economi yn gynaliadwy fod yn fuddiol i fusnesau? Rhaid i chi gydnabod bod y polisiau a ddilynwyd gan Lywodraethau Ceidwadol rhwng 1979 a 1997 wedi arwain at ddynodi Cymru yn wlad gymharol dlawd yn Ewrop, lle mae cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen yn llai na 75 y cant o gyfartaledd Ewrop—dyna sut yr oedd Cymru yn gymwys i dderbyn arian Amcan 1. Yr oedd hynny'n ganlyniad uniongyrchol i bolisiau'r Llywodraeth Geidwadol. Beth yw eich ateb? Os nad polisiau cynaliadwy yw'r ateb, pam y bu i'r polisiau a ddilynwyd gan y Llywodraeth Geidwadol fethu?

**Alun Cairns:** In the minute that I have left, I can hardly answer all the questions that Rhodri Glyn Thomas—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. As that intervention was almost a speech, I will extend your time.

4.10 p.m.

**Alun Cairns:** I am grateful for that

Shotton, lle y rhoddodd cyfarwyddwr cwmni gyflwyniad i'r Pwyllgor gan dynnu sylw at gost yr ardoll newid hinsawdd, a dweud wrthym iddi fod yn aneffeithiol, a sôn am y gwahaniaeth a wnaeth i'r elw, a oedd yn filiynau o bunnoedd.

Mae dehongli ac amseru deddfwriaeth yn allweddol hefyd. Bùm mewn cysylltiad agos â chwmni y mae Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd wedi gofyn iddo osod golchwr carbon. Gwn am gwmnïau tebyg mewn rhannau eraill o'r byd, fel gogledd Sbaen, lle nad yw'r corff sy'n cyfateb i Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd wedi gofyn iddynt osod golchwyr carbon, er mai polisi i Ewrop gyfan ydyw. Mae golchwyr carbon yn costio £5 miliwn.

Rhaid gosod hyn oll yn ei gyd-destun. Mae busnes mewn trafferthion, mae trethi'n codi a, hyd yn hyn, yr argraff a gafodd y gymuned fusnes yw bod cynaliadwyedd yn costio mwy er gwaethaf yr hyn a ddywed Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I listened carefully to your economic analysis of what businesses in Wales require. Do you reject the argument that developing the economy in a sustainable way could be beneficial to businesses? You must recognise that the policies adopted by Conservative Governments between 1979 and 1997 led to Wales being designated a relatively poor nation of Europe, where gross domestic product per capita is less than 75 per cent of the European average—that is why Wales qualified for Objective 1 funding. That was a direct result of Conservative Government policies. What is your answer? If sustainable policies are not the answer, why did the policies of the Conservative Government fail?

**Alun Cairns:** Yn y munud sydd gennyf ar ôl, prin y gallaf ateb yr holl gwestiynau y mae Rhodri Glyn Thomas—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Gan fod yr ymyriad hwnnw bron â bod yn araith, gwnaf ymestyn eich amser.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am yr

extension, but your indulgence in allowing me an extra minute will not give me adequate time to provide Rhodri Glyn Thomas with accurate information, as he seems to be ignorant in such matters. He has ignored my central theme. I said that the experience of the business community is that sustainability costs more, as a result of policies introduced by the Assembly and Westminster Governments. It is sad that that is the case because it need not have been. If innovative policies had been introduced, sustainability would not have cost more. This document would have been better received if such reckless policies had not been introduced. The business community looks for simplicity and clarity. My colleague David Davies provided some comments to support that.

At a time when the Minister is seeking to reduce the number of business support initiatives, I cannot resist referring to some initiatives included in the paper. There is a plan for a resources management best practice support initiative scheme, and an integrated suite of needs-based resources management support programmes. Such initiatives will confuse the business community. It would be far better if the principles that the Government claims to stand by, ran as a common theme throughout the business support schemes that already exist. That would be simpler. If that is what the Minister proposes, he should have stated that in the document and omitted the gobbledegook.

**Brian Hancock:** For nearly three years, I was a member of the Economic Development Committee, which discussed the business environment. Now, I am a member of the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee, which discusses the environment for business. How will this plan help? Will it actively demand that a balance exists between the environment and business? Will it sort out the problem of building a factory alongside a site of special specific interest that is home to fritillary butterflies? Will it encourage developers to look after those butterflies so that they survive? That is active management. If such a win-win situation is not possible, we will not secure the future of

estyniad hwnnw, ond ni fydd eich hynawsedd wrth ganiatáu munud ychwanegol i mi yn rhoi digon o amser imi roi gwybodaeth gywir i Rhodri Glyn Thomas, gan ei fod yn ymddangos yn anwybodus ynghylch materion o'r fath. Anwybyddodd y thema ganolog a oedd gennyf. Dywedais mai profiad y gymuned fusnes yw bod cynaliadwyedd yn costio rhagor, o ganlyniad i bolisïau a gyflwynwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a Llywodraeth San Steffan. Mae'n drist ei bod felly oherwydd nid oedd hynny'n anorfod. Pe byddid wedi cyflwyno polisïau arloesol, ni fuasai cynaliadwyedd wedi costio mwy. Cawsai'r ddogfen hon well derbynriad pe na chawsai polisïau mor anystyriol eu cyflwyno. Mae'r gymuned fusnes yn chwilio am symlrwydd ac eglurder. Gwnaeth fy nghyd-Aelod David Davies rai sylwadau i ategu hynny.

Ar adeg pan fo'r Gweinidog yn ceisio lleihau nifer y mentrau cymorth busnes, ni allaf beidio â chyfeirio at rai o'r mentrau a geir yn y papur. Mae cynllun ar gyfer menter i gefnogi'r arferion gorau mewn rheoli adnoddau, a set integredig o raglenni cymorth ar gyfer rheoli adnoddau sy'n seiliedig ar anghenion. Bydd mentrau o'r fath yn peri dryswch i'r gymuned fusnes. Byddai'n well o lawer pe byddai'r egwyddorion y mae'r Llywodraeth yn honni ei bod yn eu harddel yn rhedeg yn thema gyffredin drwy'r cynlluniau cymorth busnes sy'n bod eisoes. Byddai hynny'n symlach. Os mai hynny y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei gynnig, dylai fod wedi datgan hynny yn y ddogfen a hepgor y ffiloreg.

**Brian Hancock:** Bùm am ymron i dair blynedd yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, a drafodai'r amgylchedd busnes. Yn awr, yr wyf yn aelod o Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth, sy'n trafod yr amgylchedd ar gyfer busnes. Sut y bydd y cynllun hwn o gymorth? A fydd yn galw'n daer am gydbwysedd rhwng yr amgylchedd a busnes? A fydd yn datrys y broblem o godi ffatri am y terfyn â safle o ddiddordeb gwyddonol arbennig sy'n gynefin i löynnod byw brith? A fydd yn annog datblygwyr i ofalu am y glöynnod byw hynny fel eu bod yn parhau? Dyna yw rheoli gweithredol. Os na ellir cael sefyllfa lle y mae'r ddwy ochr ar eu hennill, ni fyddwn yn

such species.

Will the plan actively demand that recyclates be used? Stockpiling recyclates without an end use is only waste disposal. Will this plan actively demand that companies use recyclates? Will it promote the use of waste car tyres, for example? After 2006, we will not be able to place used tyres in landfill sites. In Newbridge, in my constituency, a plant produces play surfaces from old car tyres. It imports the granulated rubber. In Knighton, Powys, there are mountains of car tyres, but no facility to granulate, crumble and chip them. Therefore, we do not have problems. However, in that constituency, the council is also redeveloping play surfaces, but it cannot afford to put rubber surfaces down. That manufacturer needs a link between the recycle in car tyres and the product. Will this plan actively promote that?

I have also supported moulded paper products. Two Americans have set up a factory in Pontllanffraith, which will employ 32 people. The company will replace expensive polystyrene material with moulded paper, which is compressed to protect the televisions produced by Panasonic and LG. This also has a greater remit, and other products can be developed if we follow them through. Where in this plan do we actively demand the sustainable development of business and the environment?

**The Minister for Economic Development (Andrew Davies):** There is much in this action plan that we should welcome. Even though Wales is already ahead of the game in the UK in the business and environment arena, we are further creating a strong network for Welsh businesses to take on sustainability issues.

Mick Bates raised the environment and business awards. We feel that the Green Dragon awards largely fulfil that role. It is not just an award scheme as it is also ensuring, or helping to ensure, that companies adopt environmentally sustainable

sicrhau dyfodol rhywogaethau o'r fath.

A fydd y cynllun yn mynnu y caiff defnyddiau ailgylchedig eu defnyddio? Nid yw pentyrru defnyddiau ailgylchedig yn ddim amgenach na gwaredu gwastraff os nad oes defnydd iddynt wedi hynny. A fydd y cynllun hwn yn mynnu bod cwmnïau'n defnyddio defnyddiau ailgylchedig? A wnaiff hybu'r defnydd o deians ceir gwastraff, er enghraifft? Ar ôl 2006, ni chawn roi teians a ddefnyddiwyd mewn safleoedd tirlenwi. Yn Nhrecelyn, yn fy etholaeth i, ceir gwaith sy'n cynhyrchu arwynebau chwarae o hen deians ceir. Mae'n mewnforio'r rwber gronynnog. Yn Nhrefyclo, Powys, mae tomennydd o deians ceir, ond dim cyfleuster i'w gronynnu, eu briwsioni a'u torri'n naddion. Felly, nid oes problemau gennym ni. Fodd bynnag, yn yr etholaeth honno, mae'r cyngor hefyd yn ailddatblygu arwynebau chwarae, ond ni all fforddio gosod arwynebau rwber. Mae ar y cynhyrchydd hwnnw angen cysylltiad rhwng y defnydd ailgylchedig mewn teians ceir a'r cynnyrch. A wnaiff y cynllun hwn hyrwyddo hynny?

Yr wyf wedi cefnogi cynhyrchion o bapur wedi'i fowldio hefyd. Mae dau Americanwr wedi sefydlu ffatri ym Mhontllanffraith, a fydd yn cyflogi 32 o bobl. Bydd y cwmni'n gwneud papur wedi'i fowldio, a gywesgir i ddiogelu'r setiau teledu a gynhyrchir gan Panasonic ac LG, i gymryd lle defnyddiau polystyren drud. Mae cylch gwaith ehangach i hyn, a gellir datblygu cynhyrchion eraill os parhawn â hyn. Ym mhle yn y cynllun hwn yr ydym yn mynnu y caiff busnes a'r amgylchedd eu datblygu'n gynaliadwy?

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd (Andrew Davies):** Mae llawer yn y cynllun hwn y dylem ei groesawu. Er bod Cymru ar y blaen eisoes yn y DU ym maes busnes a'r amgylchedd, yr ydym yn creu rhwydwaith cadarn ar ben hynny fel y gall busnesau yng Nghymru fynd i'r afael â materion cynaliadwyedd.

Gwnaeth Mick Bates godi mater gwobrwyon yr amgylchedd a busnes. Teimlwn fod gwobrwyon y Ddraig Werdd yn cyflawni'r rôl honno i raddau helaeth. Nid cynllun gwobrwyo'n unig ydyw gan ei fod hefyd yn sicrhau, neu'n helpu i sicrhau, fod cwmnïau'n

business practices.

In response to David Davies, I confirm that the action plan was, and is still being, printed on recycled paper. He said that signing up to the plan should be optional—I sometimes wonder whether the Tories are living in a time warp. It is almost as if they believe that the Welsh and UK Governments are part of a Soviet system. These are recommendations to business and we are not seeking to dictate to it in any way. He also said that the plan is utopian. Is it utopian for Tony Abbott, the managing director of Sony in Bridgend, to say, when I awarded the Green Dragon award to the company, that sustainable business practices are good business practices? Businesses and business organisations have responded positively to the action plan. The Tories know the cost of everything and the value of nothing. I do not believe that they understand modern industry. It is not only about reducing costs; it is also about the quality of the product and the reliability of supply and components. Their comments demonstrate their lack of understanding of the modern economy and modern industry. The environmental goods and services industry has huge potential in Wales for the sector and for individual companies. I accompanied several companies on a trade mission to Prague before Christmas. That is a crucial area where we have a real advantage in Wales.

Orangebox, which was awarded a Wales environment award in 2002 under the category of companies with between 50 and 250 employees, has said that environmentally sustainable business is good business. It is about reducing cost by reducing waste and use of energy. Orangebox has achieved the ISO 14001 environmental standard and is taking major steps towards its green goal. Its achievements include shifting production from solvent to water-based adhesives and creating an environmental supply chain project. Alun Cairns may say it is gobbledegook, but these are business practices that are being demonstrated. Accelerate Wales, through the Welsh

mabwysiadu arferion busnes sy'n amgylcheddol gynaliadwy.

Mewn ymateb i David Davies, cadarnhaf fod y cynllun gweithredu wedi'i argraffu ar bapur ailgylchedig, a'i fod yn dal i gael ei argraffu ar bapur o'r fath. Dywedodd y dylai fod dewis o ran ymaelodi â'r cynllun—yr wyf yn meddwl weithiau tybed a yw'r Torïaid yn byw mewn oes arall. Mae bron fel pe baent yn credu bod Llywodraethau Cymru a'r DU yn rhan o system Sofietaidd. Argymhellion i fusnes yw'r rhain ac nid ydym yn ceisio rhoi gorchmynion iddo mewn unrhyw fodd. Dywedodd hefyd fod y cynllun yn iwtopaidd. Ai bod yn iwtopaidd yr oedd Tony Abbott, rheolwr gyfarwyddwr Sony ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, pan ddywedodd, wrth imi gyflwyno gwobr y Ddraig Werdd i'r cwmni, fod arferion cynaliadwy'n arferion busnes da? Mae busnesau a chyrrff busnes wedi ymateb yn gadarnhaol i'r cynllun gweithredu. Gŵyr y Torïaid gost popeth ond ni wyddant werth dim byd. Ni chredaf eu bod yn deall diwydiant modern. Nid lleihau costau yw'r unig beth sydd dan sylw; mae'n ymwneud hefyd ag ansawdd y cynnyrch a dibynadwyedd y cyflenwad a'r cydrannau. Mae eu sylwadau'n amlygu eu diffyg dealltwriaeth o'r economi fodern a diwydiant modern. Mae potensial aruthrol yn y diwydiant nwyddau a gwasanaethau amgylcheddol yng Nghymru ar gyfer y sector ac ar gyfer cwmnïau unigol. Euthum gyda sawl cwmni ar ymgyrch fasnach i Brâg cyn y Nadolig. Mae hwnnw'n faes hollbwysig lle y mae gennym fantais wirioneddol yng Nghymru.

Mae Orangebox, y dyfarnwyd iddo wobwr amgylchedd Cymru yn 2002 yng nghategori'r cwmnïau a chanddynt rhwng 50 a 250 o weithwyr, wedi dweud bod busnes amgylcheddol gynaliadwy'n fusnes da. Mae'n ymwneud â lleihau cost drwy leihau gwastraff a'r defnydd o ynni. Mae Orangebox wedi cyrraedd safon amgylcheddol ISO 14001 ac mae'n cymryd camau bras at gyrraedd ei nod gwyrdd. Rhai o'i gyflawniadau yw troi at gynhyrchu gludiau sy'n seiliedig ar ddŵr yn hytrach na thoddyddion a chreu prosiect cadwyn gyflenwi amgylcheddol. Gall Alun Cairns ddweud mai ffloreg ydyw, ond mae'r rhain yn enghreifftiau o arferion busnes sy'n cael

automotive forum, is helping individual companies to reduce costs and to improve their business practices.

**Alun Cairns:** Does the Minister not fear that there is a conflict between what he says is the stated policy of reducing the number of business support schemes and the introduction of a range of business support schemes, which he says is in the plan?

**Andrew Davies:** There is nothing incompatible in that. Those measures and approaches will be mainstreamed into the business support programme, which will be delivered by the Welsh Development Agency, business support organisations and suppliers on the ground. That is not contradictory and does not add red tape. It is about building best practice. I am rather perplexed by the Conservatives' attitude. They are out of date and living in a time warp. As Brian Gibbons pointed out, it is bizarre that the Tories have highlighted the gross domestic product gap between Wales and the rest of the UK. They never ask why there is a huge disparity whereby the GDP in Wales stands at 80 per cent of the UK average. That is the case because during the 18 years from 1979 to 1997, the Conservative Government decimated industries such as coal, steel and manufacturing. That started with Geoffrey Howe's budget in 1981, which decimated—I use that word advisedly—manufacturing in Wales. It is also bizarre, given their background, that they seem to believe that we should not encourage companies to reduce environmental pollution. We see the fact that companies are reducing pollution and adopting environmental best practice as a benefit while they only see it as red tape. I confirm Tony Abbott's point that environmentally sustainable business practices are also good business practices.

I will officially launch the business and environment action plan on Thursday 27 February at the Wales environmental conference, which is to be held at the Cardiff International Arena. The conference is jointly sponsored by the Welsh Assembly Government, the Environment Agency, the

eu rhoi ar waith. Mae Sbardun Cymru, drwy fforwm moduron Cymru, yn helpu cwmnïau unigol i leihau costau a gwella eu harferion busnes.

**Alun Cairns:** Onid yw'r Gweinidog yn ofni bod anghysondeb rhwng yr hyn a ddywed yw'r polisi penodedig o ostwng nifer y cynlluniau cymorth busnes a chyflwyno amrediad o gynlluniau cymorth busnes, y dywed eu bod yn y cynllun?

**Andrew Davies:** Nid oes dim sy'n anghydnaws yn hynny. Caiff y mesurau a'r dulliau gweithredu hynny eu cynnwys ym mhrif ffrwd y rhaglen cymorth busnes, a weithredir gan Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, cyrff cymorth busnes a chyflenwyr yn y maes. Nid yw hynny'n anghyson ac nid yw'n ychwanegu biwrocratiaeth. Mae'n ymwneud â meithrin yr arferion gorau. Yr wyf mewn penbleth braidd ynghylch agwedd y Ceidwadwyr. Maent ar ei hôl hi ac yn byw mewn oes arall. Fel y nododd Brian Gibbons, mae'n rhyfedd bod y Torïaid wedi tynnu sylw at y bwlch yn y cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth rhwng Cymru a gweddill y DU. Nid ydynt byth yn gofyn pam y mae gwahaniaeth anferth, gydag CMC Cymru yn 80 y cant o gyfartaledd y DU. Mae felly am fod y Llywodraeth Geidwadol, yn ystod y 18 mlynedd rhwng 1979 a 1997, wedi anrheithio diwydiannau fel glo, dur a gweithgynhyrchu. Dechreuodd hynny gyda chyllideb Geoffrey Howe yn 1981, a anrheithiodd weithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru, ac nid wyf yn gor-ddweud. Mae hefyd yn rhyfedd, o ystyried eu cefndir, eu bod yn credu, i bob golwg, na ddylem annog cwmnïau i leihau llygredd amgylcheddol. Yr ydym ni'n gweld y ffaith bod cwmnïau'n lleihau llygredd a mabwysiadu'r arferion amgylcheddol gorau'n beth llesol tra na fo'n ddim ond biwrocratiaeth yn eu golwg hwy. Ategaf y pwynt a wnaeth Tony Abbott, sef bod arferion busnes amgylcheddol gynaliadwy'n arferion busnes da hefyd.

Byddaf yn lansio'r cynllun gweithredu ar gyfer busnes a'r amgylchedd yn swyddogol ddydd Iau 27 Chwefror yng nghynhadledd amgylcheddol Cymru, a gynhelir yn Arena Ryngwladol Caerdydd. Mae'r gynhadledd wedi'i noddi ar y cyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, Asiantaeth yr

Countryside Council for Wales and the Forestry Commission. Sue Essex and I will address the audience and convey the message, which I believe most Members support whatever their political differences, that the Government and the Assembly attach a great deal of importance to effective and practical sustainable development for the future of Wales.

Amgylchedd, Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru a'r Comisiwn Coedwigaeth. Bydd Sue Essex a minnau'n annerch y gynulleidfa ac yn cyfleu'r neges, y credaf fod y rhan fwyaf o'r Aelodau'n ei chefnogi beth bynnag fo'u gwahaniaethau gwleidyddol, fod y Llywodraeth a'r Cynulliad yn rhoi pwys mawr iawn ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy effeithiol ac ymarferol er mwyn dyfodol Cymru.

4.20 p.m.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 17, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
Amendment 1: For 17, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Edwards, Richard  
Graham, William  
Hancock, Brian  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Lloyd, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected.*

*Cynnig (NDM1357): O blaid 39, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 6.  
Motion (NDM1357): For 39, Abstain 0, Against 6.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Black, Peter  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Graham, William  
Jones, David Ian



Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

Morgan, Jonathan

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Cydweithredu Rhyngwladol mewn Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes International Co-operation in Education and Lifelong Learning**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jonathan Morgan and amendments 2 and 3 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Jonathan Morgan a gwelliannau 2 a 3 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly:*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:*

*1. considers that international co-operation in education and lifelong learning is crucial in making Wales internationally renowned as a learning country, and*

*1. yn ystyried bod cydweithredu rhyngwladol yn y byd addysg a dysgu gydol oes yn hollbwysig i sicrhau bod Cymru yn cael cydnabyddiaeth ryngwladol fel gwlad sy'n dysgu; ac*

*2. believes that drawing on international experience and best practice offers great opportunities for learners and practitioners throughout Wales. (NDM1358)*

*2. yn credu bod dysgu o brofiadau ac arferion gorau gwledydd eraill yn rhoi cyfleoedd gwyb i ddysgwyr ac ymarferwyr ledled Cymru. (NDM1358)*

The Assembly is committed to making Wales a learning country. To achieve that, we must actively seek to share experiences and best practice within Europe and further afield in every area of education and training. Our programme for making Wales a learning country is ambitious. It includes the effective and practical approach that we are taking in partnership with other nations. As I will set out in this debate, the programme that we have developed seeks to learn from, and with, partners across the globe, from the Basque Country to New South Wales, using our strengths and learning from the specialisms of others. We will learn from good practice wherever we find it and adapt it to meet our own particular needs to create our system in our own country. We have already committed ourselves to language-learning sabbaticals for teachers and other educational practitioners, modelled on those in the Basque Country, from 2005 onwards, which have been allocated £1 million. However, in adapting policy and practice elsewhere to specific Welsh circumstances, I would not look to implement a country's education policy wholesale. I therefore reject all the amendments.

I will set out today the key areas where we are learning from others and they are learning from us. Lifelong learning is a fundamental requirement for a strong economy, and regions across Europe have recognised that. Wales is a founder member of the European Association of Regional and Local Authorities for Lifelong Learning. That network offers us the unique opportunity to work in partnership with other regions on the development of new policies, strategies and methods for successful lifelong learning. It also serves as a platform for Wales to comment on European policy development, such as the European Commission's consultation paper on future programmes in education, training and youth. EARLALL is a growing institution: it now has 15 member regions and countries, spread across seven member states, and it is likely to expand further. Within EARLALL, we lead on adult education, an area in which we have a particularly proud tradition. We will develop

Mae'r Cynulliad wedi ymwymo i wneud Cymru'n wlad sy'n dysgu. Er mwyn cyflawni hynny, rhaid inni ymdrechu i rannu profiadau a'r arferion gorau o fewn Ewrop a'r tu hwnt ym mhob maes o fewn addysg a hyfforddiant. Mae ein rhaglen ar gyfer troi Cymru'n wlad sy'n dysgu'n un uchelgeisiol. Mae'n cynnwys y dull gweithredu effeithiol ac ymarferol yr ydym yn ei ddilyn mewn partneriaeth â chenhedloedd eraill. Fel y nodaf yn y ddatl hon, mae'r rhaglen yr ydym wedi'i datblygu'n ceisio dysgu oddi wrth ac ar y cyd â phartneriaid ledled y byd, o Wlad y Basg i Dde Cymru Newydd, gan ddefnyddio ein cryfderau a dysgu oddi wrth arbenigaethau eraill. Gwnawn ddysgu oddi wrth arferion da ym mhle bynnag y'u cawn a'u haddasu i ddiwallu ein hanghenion penodol er mwyn creu ein system yn ein gwlad ein hun. Yr ydym eisoes wedi ymrwymo i gyfnodau dysgu-iaith sabothol ar gyfer athrawon ac ymarferwyr addysgol eraill, sy'n dilyn patrwm y rhai yng Ngwlad y Basg, o 2005 ymlaen, y dyrannwyd £1 filiwn ar eu cyfer. Fodd bynnag, wrth addasu polisi ac ymarfer o fannau eraill i amgylchiadau penodol yng Nghymru, ni fyddwn yn ystyried gweithredu polisi addysg unrhyw wlad yn ei gyfanrwydd. Gan hynny, gwrthodaf yr holl welliannau.

Heddiw nodaf y meysydd allweddol lle'r ydym ni'n dysgu oddi wrth eraill a hwythau'n dysgu oddi wrthym ni. Mae dysgu gydol oes yn angen sylfaenol ar gyfer economi gryf, ac mae rhanbarthau ledled Ewrop wedi cydnabod hynny. Mae Cymru'n un o'r gwledydd a sefydlodd Gymdeithas Ewropeaidd yr Awdurdodau Rhanbarthol a Lleol dros Ddysgu Gydol Oes. Mae'r rhwydwaith hwnnw'n cynnig cyfle unigryw inni weithio mewn partneriaeth â rhanbarthau eraill ar ddatblygu polisiau, strategaethau a dulliau newydd ar gyfer dysgu gydol oes llwyddiannus. Mae hefyd yn cynnig llwyfan i Gymru gael gwneud sylwadau am ddatblygiad polisi Ewropeaidd, fel papur ymgynghori'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd ar raglenni addysg, hyfforddiant ac ieuencid ar gyfer y dyfodol. Mae'r gymdeithas yn sefydliad sydd ar gynnydd: bellach mae ganddi 15 o aelod ranbarthau a gwledydd ar draws saith aelod wladwriaeth, ac mae'n debygol o dyfu ymhellach. O fewn y

our proposals in that area in the coming months. EARLALL has also been testing the relevance of—or in Euro parlance, valorising—existing learning proposals and projects to test their transferability to other regions, countries and member states in Europe. In Wales, we have been undertaking a particular valorising programme, which considers the parity of esteem between vocational and academic learning routes. That work may also assist us in developing our own policies on learning pathways for the 14 to 19 age range.

European programmes for education and training have existed for more than a decade. They have enabled thousands of Welsh pupils, students, teachers and academics to experience closer links with other countries, from pursuing their studies in another country to virtual exchanges. Wales has been particularly successful in school and university exchange programmes to date and we are working closely with the regional network for Wales and the British Council to ensure that European money continues to flow into Wales. Our own programmes complement the activity funded by the European Union. Over the past two years, the General Teaching Council for Wales has run continuing professional development projects for teachers. As a result, over 160 teacher exchanges and visits have taken place all over the globe, broadening the knowledge of our teachers and raising Wales's profile further. That is a tremendous success for a small country, and I am pleased to confirm that funding for this programme will be available again in 2003. However, school exchanges and similar projects are only one element of being part of Europe. Our young people must be fully aware of the European Union, its bodies and the increasingly important role of regional government within it. How can people engage in a debate on the euro, or the future constitution, if they do not know what is in place now? European resource centres enable local schools and others to increase their knowledge of European affairs and opportunities. I have recently agreed to fund the two such centres

gymdeithas, yr ydym ni'n arwain ar addysg oedolion, maes lle y mae gennym draddodiad arbennig o anrhydeddus. Gwnawn ddatblygu ein cynigion yn y maes hwnnw yn y misoedd i ddod. Yn ogystal, bu'r gymdeithas yn rhoi prawf ar berthnasedd—neu, yn iaith Ewrop, yn pennu gwerth—y cynigion a'r prosiectau dysgu presennol i ganfod a ellir eu trosglwyddo i ranbarthau, gwledydd ac aelod wladwriaethau eraill yn Ewrop. Yng Nghymru, buom yn ymgymryd â rhaglen benodol ar gyfer pennu gwerth, sy'n ystyried cydraddoldeb yn y parch at lwybrau dysgu galwedigaethol ac academiaidd. Gallai'r gwaith hwnnw fod o gymorth inni hefyd wrth inni ddatblygu ein polisiau ein hun ar lwybrau dysgu i rai rhwng 14 a 19 oed.

Mae rhaglenni Ewropeaidd ar gyfer addysg a hyfforddiant yn bod ers mwy na degawd. Maent wedi galluogi miloedd o ddisgyblion, myfyrwyr, athrawon ac academwyr yng Nghymru i gael cysylltiadau agosach â gwledydd eraill, a'r rheini'n amrywio o dderbyn eu haddysg mewn gwlad arall i gyfnewidiadau rhithwir. Bu Cymru'n arbennig o lwyddiannus mewn rhaglenni cyfnewid rhwng ysgolion a phrifysgolion hyd yn hyn ac yr ydym yn cydweithio'n agos â'r rhwydwaith rhanbarthol i Gymru a'r Cyngor Prydeinig i sicrhau bod arian Ewropeaidd yn dal i lifo i Gymru. Mae ein rhaglenni ni'n cydweddu â'r gweithgaredd a gyllidir gan yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Dros y ddwy flynedd diwethaf, mae Cyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru wedi rhedeg prosiectau datblygu proffesiynol parhaus ar gyfer athrawon. O ganlyniad, cafwyd mwy na 160 o ymweliadau ac ymweliadau cyfnewid gan athrawon ledled y byd, gan gynyddu gwybodaeth ein hathrawon a hybu amlygrwydd Cymru ymhellach. Mae hynny'n llwyddiant aruthrol i wlad fach, ac yr wyf yn falch o gadarnhau y bydd cyllid ar gyfer y rhaglen hon ar gael eto yn 2003. Fodd bynnag, dim ond un elfen o fod yn rhan o Ewrop yw cyfnewid rhwng ysgolion a phrosiectau tebyg. Rhaid i'n pobl ifanc fod yn gwbl ymwybodol o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd, ei gyrff a'r rôl gynyddol bwysig sydd i lywodraeth ranbarthol oddi mewn iddo. Sut y gall pobl gymryd rhan mewn dadl ar yr ewro, neu ar gyfansoddiad y dyfodol, os na wyddant beth sydd ar waith ar hyn o bryd? Mae canolfannau adnoddau Ewropeaidd yn

in Wales, in Cardiff and in Bangor, on a temporary basis, while longer-term decisions about supporting them are made.

Our focus must not be limited to schools and academia. The Leonardo programme offers financial support for work placements, including language training abroad for young employees and for those who are undergoing a change of profession. These placements give young people a unique opportunity to gain international work experience and expand foreign language skills, which are so essential to the future economy of Wales. I am particularly pleased to say that a north Wales organisation, the European Centre for Traditional and Regional Cultures, is a successful participant in this programme. Backed by European money and match funding from the Welsh Assembly Government, ECTARC has organised work placements all over Europe for over 150 employees from across Wales. Higher employability and higher professional satisfaction for the participants are proven outcomes, and I want to encourage greater take-up in this area.

Outside the EU programmes, we recognise that different countries and regions have different strengths and interests. My policy has been to establish real and practical links with individual regions or countries to take advantage of those key strengths or shared interests. Within the European Association of Regional Local Authority for Lifelong Learning network, I have signed a memorandum of understanding with my counterpart in the Basque Country. Experts in both nations will work together on key areas such as lifelong learning, the Welsh language and early years provision. Wales has established and maintained successful links with the four motor regions. Recent collaborations have taken place in fields as diverse as e-procurement, waste water treatment and a virtual university project.

galluogi ysgolion lleol ac eraill i ddysgu mwy am faterion a chyfleoedd Ewropeaidd. Yr wyf wedi cytuno'n ddiweddar i gyllido dwy ganolfan o'r fath yng Nghymru, yng Nghaerdydd ac ym Mangor, a hynny dros dro, tra gwneir penderfyniadau tymor-hwy ynghylch eu cynnal.

Rhaid inni beidio â chanolbwyntio ar ysgolion a'r byd academiaidd yn unig. Mae rhaglen Leonardo yn cynnig cymorth ariannol ar gyfer lleoliadau mewn gwaith, gan gynnwys hyfforddiant iaith dramor ar gyfer gweithwyr ifanc a rhai sy'n newid eu proffesiwn. Mae'r lleoliadau hyn yn rhoi cyfle unigryw i bobl ifanc gael profiad gwaith rhyngwladol ac i feithrin sgiliau mewn ieithoedd tramor, sydd mor hanfodol i economi Cymru yn y dyfodol. Yr wyf yn arbennig o falch o ddweud bod corff yng ngogledd Cymru, y Ganolfan Ewropeaidd ar gyfer Diwylliannau Traddodiadol a Rhanbarthol, yn cymryd rhan yn y rhaglen hon yn llwyddiannus. Gyda chymorth arian Ewropeaidd a chyllid cyfatebol gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, mae'r ganolfan wedi trefnu lleoliadau gwaith ledled Ewrop i fwy na 150 o weithwyr o bob rhan o Gymru. Profwyd bod y rhai a gymerodd ran yn fwy cyflogadwy a'u bod yn fwy bodlon yn eu proffesiwn, ac yr wyf am annog mwy i gymryd rhan yn y maes hwn.

Y tu allan i raglenni'r UE, yr ydym yn cydnabod bod gan wahanol wledydd a rhanbarthau wahanol gryfderau a diddordebau. Y polisi a ddilynais oedd sefydlu cysylltiadau gwirioneddol ac ymarferol â rhanbarthau neu wledydd unigol er mwyn manteisio ar y cryfderau allweddol hynny neu fuddiannau cyffredin. O fewn rhwydwaith Cymdeithas Ewropeaidd yr Awdurdodau Rhanbarthol a Lleol dros Ddysgu Gydol Oes, yr wyf wedi arwyddo memorandwm o gyd-ddealltwriaeth gyda'r un sy'n cyfateb i mi yng Ngwlad y Basg. Bydd arbenigwyr yn y ddwy wlad yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd ar feysydd allweddol fel dysgu gydol oes, y Gymraeg a darpariaeth y blynyddoedd cynnar. Mae Cymru wedi sefydlu a chadw cysylltiadau llwyddiannus gyda'r pedwar rhanbarth sbardun. Cafwyd cydweithredu'n ddiweddar mewn meysydd mor amrywiol ag e-gaffael, trin dŵr gwastraff a phrosiect prifysgol rithwir.

Looking further afield into the future, we must not ignore the process of European enlargement. It will create a single market of 450 million people. For the future of Wales, we must actively engage in that, and I am pleased to say that we are doing so. Thirteen of our higher education institutions are already involved in partnership programmes with their counterparts in eastern Europe. The Welsh Assembly Government has signed a memorandum of understanding with Silesia, which includes co-operation on education and lifelong learning. We want to extend the access to the EARLALL network to more regional and local governments in the enlargement countries with our partners in Italy, Spain and Denmark. In order to do so, we aim to participate in a joint Leonardo project, which will include regions in Poland, Serbia, Bulgaria and Romania. Our main priority in that is to achieve greater information exchange on lifelong learning with those regions.

The EU is growing, but the world is getting smaller. We are also looking beyond Europe to New South Wales and Cuba for higher education partnerships, to Canada for experience in bilingualism, and to Singapore for ICT and research issues. The higher education links created across the globe make a significant contribution to sustaining Wales's profile worldwide, as well as bringing academic and commercial benefits. Last year, we funded a number of bursaries to allow academics from Welsh institutions to travel to New South Wales. We signed a memorandum of understanding with Cuba. To promote Wales in the world more widely, we are also working closely with the British Council and the Welsh Higher Education International Liaison Association, which works on behalf of HE institutions in Wales to attract international students. There has been a 9 per cent increase in the number of students who came to Wales to study last year.

In addition to a full programme of international school links with the British

Gan edrych ymhellach i'r dyfodol, rhaid inni beidio ag anwybyddu'r broses o ehangu Ewrop. Bydd yn creu marchnad sengl o 450 miliwn o bobl. Er mwyn dyfodol Cymru, rhaid inni gymryd rhan weithredol yn hynny, ac yr wyf yn falch o ddweud ein bod yn gwneud hynny. Mae 13 o'n sefydliadau addysg uwch eisoes yn cymryd rhan mewn rhaglenni partneriaeth gyda'u cymheiriaid yn nwyrain Ewrop. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi arwyddo memorandwm o gyd-ddealltwriaeth gyda Silesia, sy'n cynnwys cydweithredu ar addysg a dysgu gydol oes. Yr ydym am ehangu'r mynediad i rwydwaith Cymdeithas Ewropeaidd yr Awdurdodau Rhanbarthol a Lleol dros Ddysgu Gydol Oes i ragor o lywodraethau rhanbarthol a lleol yng ngwledydd yr ehangu gyda'n partneriaid yn yr Eidal, Sbaen a Denmarc. Er mwyn gwneud hynny, bwriadwn gymryd rhan mewn prosiect Leornado ar y cyd, a fydd yn cynnwys rhanbarthau yng Ngwlad Pwyl, Serbia, Bwlgaria a Romania. Ein blaenoriaeth bennaf yn hynny yw sicrhau mwy o gyfnewid gwybodaeth ar ddysgu gydol oes gyda'r rhanbarthau hynny.

Mae'r UE yn tyfu, ond mae'r byd y mynd yn llai. Yr ydym hefyd yn edrych y tu hwnt i Ewrop i Dde Cymru Newydd a Chiwba am bartneriaethau mewn addysg uwch, i Ganada am brofiad mewn dwyieithrwydd, ac i Singapôr ar gyfer materion TGCh ac ymchwil. Mae'r cysylltiadau mewn addysg uwch a grewyd ledled y byd yn cyfrannu'n helaeth at gynnal amlygrwydd Cymru, yn ogystal â dod â manteision academiaidd a masnachol. Y llynedd, gwnaethom gyllido nifer o fwrsariau i ganiatáu i academwyr o sefydliadau yng Nghymru i deithio i Dde Cymru Newydd. Gwnaethom arwyddo memorandwm o gyd-ddealltwriaeth â Chiwba. Er mwyn hyrwyddo Cymru'n ehangach yn y byd, yr ydym hefyd yn cydweithio'n agos â'r Cyngor Prydeinig a Chymdeithas Gydlynol Ryngwladol Addysg Uwch Cymru, sy'n gweithio ar ran sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru i ddenu myfyrwyr rhyngwladol. Bu cynnydd o 9 y cant yn y nifer o fyfyrwyr a ddaeth i Gymru i astudio y llynedd.

Yn ogystal â rhaglen lawn o gysylltiadau rhyngwladol rhwng ysgolion gyda'r Cyngor

Council, recent projects include a platform for over 20 Welsh performing and visual artists at a UK festival in New York following the events of 11 September, a Welsh cultural week in Japan, which also promoted Welsh higher and further education institutions to potential students, and the successful virtual links through the montage programme between ourselves and New South Wales. Our partnership with the British Council is successful, and I want its regional office in Cardiff to become even more involved in exchange and European funding programmes in the future to ever increase Welsh take-up of these opportunities.

Wales can only benefit from European and international co-operation. If we are to be a learning country, we must learn from the best out there and bring that experience to Wales. However, we must make our own decisions about how we effect that in Wales. We must play our part on the international stage now and set in place the conditions for us to do so in the future.

4.30 p.m.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I propose amendment 1: add at the end of point 2:

*, who are currently restricted due to a lack of ambition on the part of the Welsh Assembly Government.*

We will not support amendments 2 and 3. On amendment 2, we agree that a pilot scheme should be introduced for sabbaticals for the teaching profession, but this should be a wider initiative than merely sending teachers to the Basque Country. A huge number of opportunities can be created by introducing sabbaticals for teachers to develop their professional skills in a variety of areas. Amendment 3 is unnecessary. Cuba does not have much to teach us on personal and social education, for example. Indeed, amendment 3 is needed almost as much as we needed this debate.

When I considered this motion, I did not realise that what we would get from the

Prydeinig, rhai o'r prosiectau diweddar yw'r llwyfan a roddwyd i dros 20 o artistiaid y celfyddydau perfformio a gweledol o Gymru mewn gŵyl o eiddo'r DU yn Efrog Newydd yn sgîl digwyddiadau 11 Medi, wythnos ddiwylliannol Gymreig yn Siapan, a oedd hefyd yn hyrwyddo sefydliadau addysg bellach ac uwch Cymru ymysg darpar fyfyrwyr, a'r cysylltiadau rhithwir llwyddiannus drwy'r rhaglen gyfodol rhyngom ni a De Cymru Newydd. Mae ein partneriaeth gyda'r Cyngor Prydeinig yn un lwyddiannus, ac yr wyf am i'w swyddfa ranbarthol yng Nghaerdydd gymryd mwy o ran eto mewn rhaglenni cyfnewid a chyllido Ewropeaidd yn y dyfodol er mwyn cael mwy o gynnydd yn y nifer sy'n manteisio ar y cyfleoedd hyn yng Nghymru.

Mae Cymru'n sicr o gael budd o gydweithredu Ewropeaidd a rhyngwladol. Os ydym i fod yn wlad sy'n dysgu, rhaid inni ddysgu oddi wrth y goreuon a dod â'r profiad hwnnw i Gymru. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i ni benderfynu sut yr ydym i gyflawni hynny yng Nghymru. Rhaid inni chwarae ein rhan ar y llwyfan rhyngwladol yn awr a chreu'r amodau i allu gwneud hynny yn y dyfodol.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Cynigiaf welliant 1. Ychwanegu ar ddiwedd pwynt 2:

*, sydd ar hyn o bryd yn cael eu cyfyngu gan ddiffyg uchelgais Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.*

Ni chefnogwn welliannau 2 a 3. Ynghylch gwelliant 2, cytunwn y dylid cyflwyno cynllun peilot ar gyfer cyfnodau sabothol i athrawon, ond dylai fod yn fenter ehangach nag anfon athrawon i Wlad y Basg yn unig. Gellir creu nifer aruthrol o gyfleoedd drwy gyflwyno cyfnodau sabothol i athrawon gael datblygu eu sgiliau proffesiynol mewn amryw o feysydd. Nid oes angen gwelliant 3. Nid oes gan Giwba lawer i'w ddysgu i ni am addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol, er enghraifft. Yn wir, mae angen gwelliant 3 ymron gymaint ag y mae arnom angen y ddadl hon.

Pan ystyriais y cynnig hwn, ni sylweddolais mai'r hyn a gaem gan y Gweinidog fyddai

Minister would be a minor progress report that could have been dealt with in a ministerial statement. We have not considered any specific proposals for the future this afternoon. We have not debated any ideas regarding what the Government intends to do in the future, and we have not considered specific outcomes and successes for Wales. I accept the need to consider best practice—either within the United Kingdom, or on the EU mainland—in areas such as language learning, ICT developments, and personal and professional developments for teachers; there is a huge amount of work going on in educational establishments in mainland Europe. However, this debate has not done any justice so far to what is happening there. This debate will be considered as irrelevant by headteachers who are struggling to recruit teachers into the profession in Wales. It will be considered irrelevant by governors who are struggling to ensure that good teachers are retained in schools. This debate will also be considered to be irrelevant by pupils, and particularly by students in Wales who are struggling to avoid the life-crippling debts that have been inflicted upon them by your Government. This debate is a classic example of time-filling by the Assembly Government.

I listened to the Minister with interest. We heard the usual self-congratulatory speech that we expect from her. She is not interested in discussing issues that are of concern to the teaching profession, pupils, headteachers and governors in Wales. Instead, we have an hour's debate on what it is like to go to Cuba, and what links we have with Canada, and what is happening in other parts of the world. If you are serious, Minister, about the need—which is 'crucial', according to the motion—to link Wales with international developments in lifelong learning, why is it not mentioned in your paving document, 'The Learning Country'? There is no section in that vast Government document on international experiences, or on the need to link Wales with other parts of the world in terms of what is happening outside Wales. I do not believe that there is any reference to the European Union in the document. Yet your motion states that there is a crucial link between Wales as a learning country and

adroddiad bach ar gynnydd y gellid bod wedi ymdrin ag ef mewn datganiad gweiniogol. Nid ydym wedi ystyried unrhyw gynigion penodol ar gyfer y dyfodol y prynhawn yma. Nid ydym wedi trafod unrhyw syniadau ynghylch yr hyn y bwriada'r Llywodraeth ei wneud yn y dyfodol, ac nid ydym wedi ystyried canlyniadau a llwyddiannau penodol i Gymru. Yr wyf yn derbyn bod angen ystyried yr arferion gorau—un ai o fewn y DU, neu ar dir mawr yr UE—mewn meysydd fel dysgu ieithoedd, datblygiadau mewn TGCh, a datblygiadau personol a phroffesiynol ar gyfer athrawon; mae llawer o waith yn mynd ymlaen mewn sefydliadau addysgol ar dir mawr Ewrop. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r ddadl hon hyd yn hyn wedi gwneud cyfiawnder â'r hyn sy'n digwydd yno. Ystyrir y ddadl hon yn un amherthnasol gan benaethiaid ysgol sy'n ei chael yn anodd recriwtio athrawon i'r proffesiwn yng Nghymru. Fe'i hystyrir yn amherthnasol gan lywodraethwyr sy'n ei chael yn anodd sicrhau y cedwir athrawon da mewn ysgolion. Ystyrir y ddadl hon yn un amherthnasol hefyd gan ddisgyblion, ac yn enwedig gan fyfyrwyr yng Nghymru sy'n ei chael yn anodd osgoi'r dyledion andwyol a orfodwyd arnynt gan eich Llywodraeth chi. Mae'r ddadl hon yn enghraifft glasurolo lenwi amser gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Gwrandewais ar y Gweinidog yn llawn diddordeb. Clywsom yr araith hunanglodforus arferol a ddisgwyliwn ganddi. Nid yw'n ymddiddori mewn trafod materion sydd o bwys gan athrawon, disgyblion, penaeithiaid ysgol a llywodraethwyr yng Nghymru. Yn lle hynny, cawn awr o ddadl ar y profiad o fynd i Giwba, pa gysylltiadau sydd gennym â Chanada, a'r hyn sy'n digwydd mewn rhannau eraill o'r byd. Os ydych o ddfrif, Weinidog, ynghylch yr angen—sy'n 'hollbwysig', yn ôl y cynnig—i gysylltu Cymru â datblygiadau rhyngwladol mewn dysgu gydol oes, pam nad oes sôn amdano yn eich dogfen ymbaratoi, 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu'? Nid oes unrhyw adran yn y ddogfen anferth honno o eiddo'r Llywodraeth am brofiadau rhyngwladol, neu am yr angen i gysylltu Cymru â rhannau eraill o'r byd o ran yr hyn sy'n digwydd y tu allan i Gymru. Ni chredaf fod unrhyw gyfeiriad at yr Undeb Ewropeidd yn y ddogfen. Ac eto, dywed

what is happening in the European Union. Why, if that link is so crucial and if what is happening in Europe is so crucial, is there no reference to lifelong learning on an European basis? Some interesting European Commission documents have been published in recent years, but there is no reference to those documents in 'The Learning Country'.

If the Government is serious about linking what happens in Wales with what happens in mainland Europe and in the structures of the European Union, why is more reference not made to that in your document, 'The Learning Country', which you cite every time you speak in the Chamber as being the bible for educational development in Wales? Earlier, the Business Minister, in responding to a request for a debate on Iraq, said that there was a risk that the Assembly debating Chamber could be seen as a talking shop. Anyone in the teaching profession, any student in Wales, or anyone struggling to run their schools who hears this debate this afternoon and listens to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning will think exactly that.

We tabled amendment 1 because we wanted to criticise the Government for failing to be ambitious. You cannot escape the concerns of headteachers and pupils that we are not being ambitious enough in Wales, when other countries—not just in the United Kingdom, but further afield in Europe—are being far more ambitious than the Government in Wales. If this debate is the best that we can do at this late stage, it is best that you retire to greener pastures.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 2: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government, in piloting language-learning sabbaticals for teachers in Wales, to draw on the experience of the Basque Country, which included extended one-year teacher sabbaticals, delivered in dedicated training units.*

eich cynnig fod cysylltiad hollbwysig rhwng Cymru fel gwlad sy'n dysgu a'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Os yw'r cysylltiad hwnnw mor bwysig ac os yw'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn Ewrop mor bwysig, pam nad oes cyfeiriad at ddysgu gydol oes ar lefel Ewropeaidd? Cyhoeddwyd rhai dogfennau diddorol gan y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf, ond nid oes cyfeiriad atynt yn 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu'.

Os yw'r Llywodraeth o ddifrif ynghylch cysylltu'r hyn sy'n digwydd yng Nghymru a'r hyn sy'n digwydd ar dir mawr Ewrop ac yn strwythurau'r Undeb Ewropeaidd, pam nad oes mwy o sôn am hynny yn eich dogfen, 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu', y cyfeiriwch ati bob tro y siaradwch yn y Siambr fel y beibl ar gyfer datblygu addysgol yng Nghymru? Yn gynharach, dywedodd y Trefnydd, wrth ymateb i gais am ddadl ar Irac, fod perygl y gallai Siambr ddadlau'r Cynulliad gael ei hystyried yn siop siarad. Bydd unrhyw athro, unrhyw fyfyrwr yng Nghymru, neu unrhyw un sy'n ei chael yn anodd rhedeg ei ysgol, sy'n clywed y ddadl hon y prynhawn yma ac yn gwranddo ar y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, yn meddwl yr union beth hwnnw.

Gwnaethom gyflwyno gwelliant 1 am ein bod yn dymuno beirniadu'r Llywodraeth am fetu â bod yn uchelgeisiol. Ni allwch osgoi pryderon penaethiaid ysgol a disgyblion am ein diffyg uchelgais yng Nghymru, pan fo gwledydd eraill—nid yn unig yn y Deyrnas Unedig, ond ymhellach draw yn Ewrop—yn fwy uchelgeisiol o lawer na'r Llywodraeth yng Nghymru. Os mai'r ddadl hon yw'r gorau y gallwn ei wneud mor hwyr â hyn, byddai'n well ichi ymddeol i diroedd brasach.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, wrth gynnal cynlluniau peilot ar gyfer cyfnodau dysgu iaith sabothol i athrawon yng Nghymru, fanteisio ar brofiad Gwlad y Basg, a ddarparodd gyfnodau sabothol estynedig am flwyddyn i athrawon, mewn unedau hyfforddi pwrpasol.*



I propose amendment 3: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*welcomes the educational links that have been established between Wales and Cuba and aspires to emulate the Cuban education system in:*

*a) providing free access to higher education; and*

*b) improving levels of adult literacy.*

The Business Minister has already reminded the Assembly that we should take care to avoid the Assembly being seen as a talking shop. I would, therefore, like to ask him why he has had what we would call in Llanelli the brass neck to table this pointless motion. It reminds me of the motions that I would draft for Plaid Cymru conferences when I was a member of the youth section in 1983—full of good intentions, hard to disagree with and utterly meaningless. In the 1980s, our steering committee had the good sense to throw those motions out and to refuse to debate them. This motion is unworthy of any Government, let alone the Government of Wales.

Our nation faces the possibility of being drawn into a war and we, as its democratic representatives, are not allowed to debate the issue. More directly, we face a major crisis in terms of public confidence in ELWa, the largest education body set up and funded by this Government. It is stunning to hear the Minister say today that we are seen in Europe to be leading on adult education, given the state of the major body that funds adult education in Wales. Had the Minister spent more time sorting that out and less time junketing around the world, we might be in a better position. We are being asked to debate a motion that states the blindingly obvious, and the Government should be ashamed of itself. The absence of most of the Minister's colleagues from the Chamber suggests that they agree with me.

The opposition parties are left with two

Cynigiaf gwelliant 3: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn croesawu'r cysylltiadau addysgol sydd wedi'u meithrin rhwng Cymru a Chiwba, ac yn ceisio efelychu system addysg Ciwba drwy:*

*a) ddarparu addysg uwch am ddim; a*

*b) gwella lefelau llythrennedd ymhlith oedolion.*

Mae'r Trefnydd eisoes wedi atgoffa'r Cynulliad y dylem ofalu rhag gadael i'r Cynulliad gael ei weld yn siop siarad. Carwn ofyn iddo, felly, pam y bu mor ddigywilydd â chyflwyno'r cynnig dibwrpas hwn. Mae'n fy atgoffa o'r cynigion a ddrafftaiwn ar gyfer cynadleddau Plaid Cymru pan oeddwn yn aelod o'r adran ieuentid yn 1983—yn llawn bwriadau da, yn anodd anghydweld â hwy ac yn gwbl ddiystyr. Yn y 1980au, bu ein pwyllgor llywio mor ddoeth â chael gwared â'r cynigion hynny a gwrthod cael dadl arnynt. Mae'r cynnig hwn yn annheilwng o unrhyw Lywodraeth, heb sôn am Lywodraeth Cymru.

Mae ein cenedl yn wynebu'r posibilrwydd o gael ei thynnu i ryfel ac ni chaniateir i ni, fel ei chynrychiolwyr democrataidd, drafod y pwnc. Yn fwy uniongyrchol, yr ydym yn wynebu argyfwng mawr o ran yr hyder sydd gan y cyhoedd yn ELWa, y corff addysg mwyaf a sefydlwyd ac a ariennir gan y Llywodraeth hon. Syfrdanol yw clywed y Gweinidog yn dweud heddiw y cawn ein gweld yn Ewrop fel rhai sydd ar y blaen mewn addysg oedolion, o ystyried cyflwr y prif gorff sy'n cyllido addysg oedolion yng Nghymru. Pe byddai'r Gweinidog wedi treulio mwy o amser yn datrys hynny a llai o amser yn jolihetio o gwmpas y byd, gallem fod mewn gwell sefyllfa. Gofynnir inni drafod cynnig sy'n dweud yr hyn sy'n amlwg, a dylai'r Llywodraeth deimlo cywilydd. Mae'r ffaith nad yw'r rhan fwyaf o gyd-Weinidogion y Gweinidog yn y Siambwr yn awgrymu eu bod yn cytuno â mi.

Gadewir y gwrthbleidiau â dau ddewis—un

options—either to ignore such nonsense and treat it with the contempt that it deserves or to attempt to amend the motion and give it some kind of substance. We decided to table amendments 2 and 3 in an attempt to add something useful and workable to the motion, in the interests of the dignity of this Assembly.

Owen John Thomas will set out in detail the case for amendment 2; I will merely say that we could learn much from the success of colleagues in the Basque Country in promoting their language. I am surprised that, in refusing to support amendment 2, the Minister makes it clear that whatever she may say, she does not agree with it in practice.

I will address amendment 3. As we all know, the Minister has spent much time in Cuba, so she will be as aware as I am of its achievements. Its achievement in terms of adult literacy has been stunning. Given the disturbing levels of functional illiteracy in some of our communities, I suggest that we seriously consider how those levels of adult literacy were achieved and identify any lessons to be learned.

In terms of higher education, the Minister knows that article 26 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights states that

‘higher education shall be equally accessible to all on the basis of merit.’

Huge steps have been taken in Cuba in turning this theoretical right into reality. However, I share some of the concerns expressed by Jonathan Morgan about Cuba’s tendency to restrict access to higher education on the grounds of belief or ideology. That is unacceptable. However, it is no more unacceptable than the restrictions on the grounds of wealth and resources that will result from Charles Clarke’s elitist top-up fees approach to funding higher education in England. We do not even know what the Minister’s approach will be in Wales; perhaps that is another issue which we should be debating this afternoon. She tells us that she is in discussions and that there are important pros and cons to having this matter

ai anwybyddu’r fath lol a’i ddiystyru fel y dylid neu geisio diwygio’r cynnig a rhoi rhyw fath o sylwedd iddo. Penderfynasom gyflwyno gwelliannau 2 a 3 mewn ymgais i ychwanegu rhywbeth buddiol ac ymarferol at y cynnig, er mwyn urddas y Cynulliad hwn.

Bydd Owen John Thomas yn cyflwyno dadl fanwl dros welliant 2; y cwbl a ddywedaf yw y gallem ddysgu llawer oddi wrth lwyddiant ein cymheiriaid yng Ngwlad y Basg wrth hyrwyddo eu hiaith. Yr wyf yn synnu bod y Gweinidog, wrth wrthod cefnogi gwelliant 2, yn rhoi ar ddeall, beth bynnag a ddywed, nad yw’n cytuno ag ef mewn egwyddor.

Ymdriniaf â gwelliant 3. Fel yr ydym oll yn gwybod, mae’r Gweinidog wedi treulio llawer o amser yng Nghiwba, felly bydd mor ymwybodol ag yr wyf fi o’i chyflawniadau. Bu ei chyflawniad o ran llythrennedd ymysg oedolion yn syfrdanol. O ystyried y lefelau ysgytiol o anllythrennedd ymarferol mewn rhai o’n cymunedau, awgrymaf y dylem ystyried yn ofalus sut y sicrhawyd y lefelau hynny o lythrennedd ymysg oedolion a chanfod unrhyw wersi sydd i’w dysgu.

O ran addysg uwch, gŵyr y Gweinidog fod erthygl 26 o’r Datganiad Cyffredinol ar Hawliau Dynol yn datgan y

‘dylai fod mynediad llawn a chydadd i bawb i addysg uwchradd ar sail teilyngdod.’

Cymerwyd camau bras yng Nghiwba wrth roi’r hawl ddamcaniaethol hon ar waith. Fodd bynnag, rhannaf rai o’r pryderon a fynegwyd gan Jonathan Morgan ynghylch y tuedd yng Nghiwba i gyfyngu ar yr hawl i gael addysg uwch ar sail cred neu ideoleg. Mae hynny’n annerbyniol. Er hynny, nid yw’n fwy annerbyniol na’r cyfyngiadau ar sail cyfoeth ac adnoddau a fydd yn dilyn y dull elitaidd Charles Clarke o godi ffioedd ychwanegol i gyllido addysg uwch yn Lloegr. Nid ydym hyd yn oed yn gwybod beth fydd dull gweithredu’r Gweinidog yng Nghymru; efallai fod hwnnw’n fater arall y dylem fod yn ei drafod y prynhawn yma. Dywed wrthym ei bod yn cymryd rhan mewn trafodaethau a bod manteision ac anfanteision

devolved to consider; she should have spent time this afternoon telling us what those pros and cons are, instead of stating the blindingly obvious.

The Minister mentioned that, after her visit to Cuba, a memorandum of understanding was signed between Cuba and Wales. What are the practical outcomes of that and the many other memoranda of understanding that she listed? Have any of them had a practical impact?

Had the Government decided to support our amendments, which were drafted so that it could do so, we would have voted in favour of the motion. However, after the Minister's usual self-congratulatory speech, we cannot do much but abstain. We cannot oppose the obvious, but neither can we debase the National Assembly by supporting such a meaningless motion.

4.40 p.m.

**Mick Bates:** Today seems to be quite a good day for hypocrisy. 'Dafydd Abstain' returns. You made the wrong decision, Helen; you should have sat down and shut up.

The Welsh Liberal Democrats, unlike Jonathan, appreciate that education is not one-track; it has many dimensions. We consider international co-operation in education to be a good thing. Exchange visits and exchanges of information relating to educational practices and methods breed tolerance and understanding through knowledge. I am pleased to have been associated with many schools, and particularly Castle Caereinion school, whose pupils came to meet the Minister here last year with teachers from all over Europe partaking in an internet project centred on all aspects of life throughout Europe. I also hope, with other parties, to start an exchange to Appalachia in America. That is an important dimension to education worthy of our discussion. The pilot Welsh baccalaureate also stems from the international dimension of education.

pwysig i'w hystyried o ran datganoli'r mater hwn; dylai fod wedi treulio amser y prynhawn yma'n dweud wrthym beth yw'r manteision a'r anfanteision hynny, yn lle datgan yr hyn sy'n amlwg i bawb.

Cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog at y ffaith bod memorandwm o gyd-ddealltwriaeth wedi'i arwyddo rhwng Ciwba a Chymru, ar ôl ei hymweliad â'r wlad honno. Beth yw'r canlyniadau ymarferol i hwnnw a'r nifer fawr o femoranda o gyd-ddealltwriaeth eraill a restrodd? A gafodd unrhyw un ohonynt effaith ymarferol?

Pe byddai'r Llywodraeth wedi penderfynu cefnogi ein gwelliannau, a ddrafftwyd fel y gallai wneud hynny, byddem wedi pleidleisio o blaid y cynnig. Fodd bynnag, ar ôl araith hunanglodforus arferol y Gweinidog, ni allwn wneud fawr dim heblaw ymatal. Ni allwn wrthwynebu'r hyn sy'n amlwg, ond ni allwn ddiraddio'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ychwaith drwy gefnogi cynnig mor ddiystyr.

**Mick Bates:** Mae heddiw'n ymddangos yn ddiwrnod eithaf da ar gyfer rhagrith. Daeth 'Dafydd Ymatal' yn ei ôl. Gwnaethoch benderfyniad anghywir, Helen; dylech fod wedi eistedd a chau'ch ceg.

Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, yn wahanol i Jonathan, yn deall bod mwy nag un llwybr mewn addysg; mae iddi lawer agwedd. Credwn fod cydweithredu rhyngwladol mewn addysg yn beth da. Mae ymweliadau cyfnewid a chyfnewid gwybodaeth ynghylch arferion a dulliau addysgol yn meithrin goddefgarwch a dealltwriaeth drwy wybodaeth. Yr wyf yn falch imi fod yn gysylltiedig â llawer o ysgolion, ac ysgol Castell Caereinion yn enwedig, y daeth ei disgyblion yma i gwrdd â'r Gweinidog y llynedd gydag athrawon o bob rhan o Ewrop a oedd yn cyfranogi o brosiect rhyngwyd a oedd yn ymwneud â phob agwedd ar fywyd ledled Ewrop. Gobeithiaf hefyd gychwyn cynllun cyfnewid, gyda phleidiau eraill, ag Appalachia yn America. Mae honno'n agwedd bwysig ar addysg y mae'n deilwg o'i thrafod gennym. Mae cynllun peilot bagloriaeth Cymru hefyd yn deillio o'r agwedd ryngwladol ar addysg.

Personal and social education has a massive international dimension in terms of teaching pupils that they are global citizens. It is vital that young people are aware of the opportunities open to them, and the challenges that today's globalised world presents. The Assembly has already convened a working group on global citizenship jointly with the Department for International Development. More room exists to develop a whole-school approach and ethos to global citizenship, which must be done in tandem with sustainable development, community values and involvement, linking the local with the global.

At the Welsh Liberal Democrats' conference, we discussed our consultation paper, 'Education and Lifelong Learning: Carrying the Standard Beyond 2003', launched in April 2002, on personal and social education. We put forward a policy of developing a whole-school approach and ethos to personal and social education, sustainable development and global citizenship, with responsibility for this allocated to a clearly identified individual.

The Welsh Liberal Democrats will oppose the Conservatives' amendment 1 as we believe that the Welsh Assembly Government is ambitious about improving education, as can be seen in many of its actions: scrapping key stage 1 tests for seven-year-olds; providing free school milk again; providing Assembly learning grants to increase access to education; more primary school and secondary school teachers; more money for school buildings; and, particularly, the Welsh baccalaureate.

**Jonathan Morgan:** You always say that the Liberal Democrats are the driving force behind the coalition, and I assume that you include education in that. However, your document—and the Minister's—'The Learning Country' does not contain references to experiences in the European Union nor in any other countries. If you are serious about linking what we do here with what happens outside Wales and outside the

Mae agwedd ryngwladol bwysig dros ben i addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol o ran dysgu disgyblion i weld eu bod yn ddinasyddion byd. Mae'n hollbwysig bod pobl ifanc yn ymwybodol o'r cyfleoedd sydd ar gael iddynt, a'r heriau a geir yn y byd globaleiddiedig hwn. Mae'r Cynulliad eisoes wedi ffurfio gweithgor ar ddinasyddiaeth fyd-eang ar y cyd â'r Adran dros Ddatblygu Rhyngwladol. Mae lle o hyd i ddatblygu ymagwedd ac ethos ynghylch dinasyddiaeth fyd-eang sy'n cynnwys yr ysgol gyfan, a rhaid gwneud hynny ar y cyd â datblygu cynaliadwy, a gwerthoedd a chysylltiad cymunedol, gan gysylltu'r lleol â'r byd-eang.

Yng nghynhadledd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, gwnaethom drafod ein papur ymgynghori, 'Education and Lifelong Learning: Carrying the Standard Beyond 2003', a lanswyd yn Ebrill 2002, ar addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol. Gwnaethom gyflwyno polisi o ddatblygu ymagwedd ac ethos ar gyfer yr ysgol gyfan ynghylch addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol, datblygu cynaliadwy a dinasyddiaeth fyd-eang, gan ddyrannu'r cyfrifoldeb dros hynny i unigolyn penodedig.

Bydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n gwrthwynebu gwelliant 1 y Ceidwadwyr gan ein bod yn credu bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn uchelgeisiol ynghylch gwella addysg, fel y gellir gweld yn llawer o'r camau a gymerodd: cael gwared â phroffion cyfnod allweddol 1 ar gyfer rhai saith mlwydd oed; darparu llaeth am ddim yn yr ysgol eto; darparu grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad er mwyn ehangu mynediad i addysg; rhagor o athrawon ysgol gynradd ac ysgol uwchradd; mwy o arian ar gyfer adeiladau ysgol; ac, yn enwedig, bagloriaeth Cymru.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yr ydych yn dweud bob amser mai'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yw'r grym ysgogol yn y glymblaid, a chymeraf eich bod yn cynnwys addysg yn hynny. Er hynny, nid yw'ch dogfen chi—ac un y Gweinidog—'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu' yn cynnwys cyfeiriadau at brofiadau yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd nac mewn unrhyw wledydd eraill. Os ydych o ddifrif ynghylch cysylltu'r hyn a wnawn yma â'r hyn sy'n

United Kingdom, why are such references not made in your paving document?

**Mick Bates:** It is obvious, Jonathan, that we are discussing an international aspect of education today; it is here for you to debate, yet you have not taken part in it. Your wish to exclude yourself is understandable: you are small-minded.

The Welsh Liberal Democrats will also oppose Plaid Cymru's amendment 2 and amendment 3. I am astounded by amendment 3. Cuba does not offer a good example of an education system, despite the many supporters of it.

**Jonathan Morgan:** The Minister seems to think so.

**Mick Bates:** That is her opinion, not mine. Plaid Cymru states in its amendment that access to Cuban universities is free. That is all well and good if you happen to agree with the political views of the Cuban Government. If you do not agree—and say so publicly—you are prevented from attending university and are either exiled or imprisoned. [*Interruption.*]

Let us have a bit of order, please.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Mick, you know better than that. I am responsible for maintaining order and nothing so far has been out of order.

**Mick Bates:** Perhaps Plaid Cymru should check with the president of the Young Cubans for Democracy movement, Néstor Rodríguez Lobaina, who has been prevented from continuing his studies and imprisoned because he expressed views against the Cuban Government.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Will you give way, or are you afraid?

**Mick Bates:** Afraid? Absolutely not.

**Helen Mary Jones:** The trouble with writing your speech too carefully before you hear

digwydd y tu allan i Gymru a'r tu allan i'r Deyrnas Unedig, pam nad oes cyfeiriadau o'r fath yn eich dogfen ymbaratoi?

**Mick Bates:** Mae'n amlwg, Jonathan, ein bod yn trafod agwedd ryngwladol ar addysg heddiw; mae yma ichi ei thrafod, ac eto ni chymerasoch ran. Mae'n hawdd deall eich dymuniad i beidio â chymryd rhan: yr ydych yn fychanfrydig.

Bydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru hefyd yn gwrthwynebu gwelliant 2 a gwelliant 3 o eiddo Plaid Cymru. Mae gwelliant 3 yn peri syndod i mi. Nid yw Ciwba'n enghraifft dda o system addysg, er gwaethaf ei chefnogwyr lu.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Ymddengys fod y Gweinidog yn meddwl felly.

**Mick Bates:** Ei barn hi yw hynny, nid f'un i. Dywed Plaid Cymru yn ei gwelliant fod mynediad i brifysgolion Ciwba am ddim. Mae hynny'n iawn os ydych yn digwydd cytuno â barn wleidyddol Llywodraeth Ciwba. Os nad ydych yn cytuno—ac yn dweud hynny ar goedd—cewch eich rhwystro rhag mynd i brifysgol a chewch eich alltudio neu'ch carcharu. [*Torri ar draws.*]

Gawn ni ychydig o drefn, os gwelwch yn dda.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mick, gwyddoch yn well na hynny. Myfi sy'n gyfrifol am gadw trefn ac ni ddywedwyd dim sydd allan o drefn hyd yn hyn.

**Mick Bates:** Efallai y dylai Plaid Cymru holi llywydd y mudiad Ciwbaniaid Ifanc dros Ddemocratiaeth, Néstor Rodríguez Lobaina, a gafodd ei rwystro rhag parhau â'i addysg a'i garcharu am ddatgan barn yn erbyn Llywodraeth Ciwba.

**Helen Mary Jones:** A wnewch ildio, neu a oes ofn arnoch?

**Mick Bates:** Ofn? Dim o gwbl.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yr hyn sydd o'i le ar ysgrifennu araith yn rhy ofalus cyn clywed

what others say is that you end up making a bit of an idiot of yourself. I made clear that we oppose what Cuba does, but we are also clear that, on the grounds of wealth, we oppose the restrictions that are coming in here. Where do you stand on that matter? In Committee, you have repeatedly said that you support the Basque approach to in-depth learning for teachers to enable them to teach in the medium of the native language. Will you now vote against this motion? You accuse us of hypocrisy, but come on, Mick, take the beam from your own eye.

**Mick Bates:** We have dedicated centres in Wales as a result of our policy development. Just because you happen to think that you have put down one specific aspect of the baccalaureate does not negate all our work. The work is being done here. You must re-examine your consciences about your support for Cuban education because this is a real case. It is fine to protest about this motion being all apple pie and grandmotherly and so on, but you participated in it. Face the facts, your Cuban example is a bad one. Academic freedom does not exist in Cuba. Lecturers are fired and students thrown out. That may be the sort of higher education system Plaid wants, and which other misinformed people may admire, but the Welsh Liberal Democrats value freedom of expression and freedom of support as the basis of education and civilisation.

**David Davies:** I am delighted to follow Mick Bates and I will pick up where he left off because he has a point. The Plaid Cymru amendment 3 actually states that we aspire to emulate the Cuban education system. That is clearly a positive comment about what is happening in Cuba. You say that we welcome the educational link established between Wales and Cuba and aspire to emulate their system. You have made a positive statement about the Cuban educational system and are following the Minister—in spirit if not in body—on this.

beth a ddywed eraill yw eich bod yn eich gwneud eich hun yn destun sbort yn y pen draw. Rhoddais ar ddeall ein bod yn gwrthwynebu'r hyn a wnaiff Ciwba, ond yr ydym yn dweud yn bendant hefyd ein bod yn gwrthwynebu'r cyfyngiadau ar sail cyfoeth a gyflwynir yma. Beth yw'ch barn chi am y mater hwnnw? Yn y Pwyllgor, dywedasocho dro ar ôl tro eich bod yn cefnogi dull y Basgiaid o ddysgu trwyadl ar gyfer athrawon i'w galluogi i ddysgu drwy gyfwrng yr iaith frodorol. A wnewch bleidleisio yn erbyn y cynnig hwn yn awr? Yr ydych yn ein cyhuddo o ragrith, ond, dewch yn eich blaen, Mick, tynnwch y trawst sydd yn eich llygad eich hun.

**Mick Bates:** Mae gennym ganolfannau pwrpasol yng Nghymru o ganlyniad i'r polisi a ddatblygwyd gennym. Nid yw'r ffaith eich bod yn digwydd credu eich bod wedi bychanu un agwedd benodol ar y fagloriaeth yn peri bod ein holl waith yn ofer. Gwneir y gwaith yma. Rhaid ichi archwilio'ch cydwybod eto ynghylch eich cefnogaeth i addysg Ciwba gan fod hwn yn achos go iawn. Mae'n iawn protestio bod y cynnig hwn yn ddelfrydgar ac yn orofalus ac ati, ond gwnaethoch gymryd rhan ynddo. Wynebwich y gwir, mae Ciwba'n esiempl ddrwg ichi ei chynnig. Ni cheir rhyddid academiaidd yng Nghiwba. Caiff darlithwyr eu diswyddo a myfyrwyr eu diarddel. Efallai mai honno yw'r math o system addysg uwch y mae Plaid Cymru am ei chael, ac y gallai eraill sydd o dan gamargraff ei hedmygu, ond mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn trysori rhyddid barn a rhyddid cefnogaeth fel sail i addysg a gwareiddiad.

**David Davies:** Yr wyf yn falch iawn o ddilyn Mick Bates a dilynaf yr un trywydd oherwydd yr oedd ganddo ddadl gref. Mae gwelliant 3 Plaid Cymru yn datgan ein bod yn ceisio efelychu system addysg Ciwba. Mae hynny'n amlwg yn sylw cadarnhaol am yr hyn sy'n digwydd yng Nghiwba. Dywedwich ein bod yn croesawu'r cysylltiad addysgol sydd wedi'i feithrin rhwng Cymru a Chiwba ac yn ceisio efelychu ei system. Gwnaethoch ddatganiad cadarnhaol am system addysg Ciwba ac yr ydych yn dilyn y Gweinidog—mewn egwyddor os nad yn weithredol—ar hyn.

**Helen Mary Jones:** If you look at our amendment 3 it says:

‘emulate the Cuban education system in:

a) providing free access to higher education; and

b) improving levels of adult literacy.’

Surely, not even you could disagree with that. I made it clear in my speech that I find other elements of the Cuban system abhorrent. I should not need to repeat this point.

**David Davies:** You know perfectly well that the majority of countries provide free access to higher education and are certainly committed to improving adult literacy. Why have you singled out Cuba? In doing so, you are sending a positive message, particularly as the Minister has signed a memorandum of understanding with that country.

As a member of Amnesty International and a supporter of human rights in countries across the world, be they extreme right-wing dictatorships such as Burma or Zimbabwe, or socialist basket cases such as North Korea, I must express my regret that so many Members in Labour and Plaid Cymru—with honourable exceptions among the Liberal Democrats—have chosen to make positive comments about this regime. It is the utmost hypocrisy. This Chamber regularly trumpets its commitment to minorities of every kind and reacts with hysteria when anyone questions the excessive way in which this is sometimes done. However, our education Minister appears to support a dictator who, for example, has persistently rounded up homosexuals and held them in forced-labour camps for re-education. Many of those people have disappeared, never to return. In the 1970s, matters became particularly bad when gays were described as pathological, with widespread purges undertaken against them. The situation has improved slightly, but even so, homosexual behaviour can be punishable by a year in jail. However, I remember that I was criticised a couple of years ago because I wanted to prevent books

**Helen Mary Jones:** Os edrychwch ar welliant 3 o’n heiddo, y geiriau yw:

‘efelychu system addysg Ciwba drwy:

a) ddarparu addysg uwch am ddim; a

b) gwella lefelau llythrennedd ymhlith oedolion.’

Siawns na allech chi hyd yn oed anghytuno â hynny. Rhoddais ar ddeall yn fy araith fy mod yn cael elfennau eraill yn system Ciwba’n wrthun. Ni ddylwn orfod ailadrodd y pwnt hwn.

**David Davies:** Gwyddoch yn iawn fod y rhan fwyaf o wledydd yn darparu addysg uwch am ddim a’u bod wedi ymrwymo’n bendant i wella llythrennedd ymysg oedolion. Pam yr ydych wedi dewis Ciwba? Wrth wneud hynny, yr ydych yn anfon neges gadarnhaol, yn enwedig gan fod y Gweinidog wedi arwyddo memorandwm cydddealltwriaeth gyda’r wlad.

Fel aelod o Amnest Rhyngwladol ac un sy’n cefnogi hawliau dynol mewn gwledydd ledled y byd, boed hwy’n unbenaethau asgell-dde eithafol fel Byrma neu Simbabwe, neu rai anobeithiol sosialaidd fel Gogledd Corea, rhaid imi fynegi gofid am fod cynifer o Aelodau Llafur a Phlaid Cymru—gydag eithriadau anrhydeddus ymysg y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol—wedi dewis gwneud sylwadau cadarnhaol am y llywodraeth hon. Dyma ragrith o’r mwyaf. Mae’r Siambr hon yn datgan ei hymrwymiad i leiafrifoedd o bob math yn rheolaidd ac yn ymateb yn hysteraidd pan fo unrhyw un yn cwestiynu’r modd gormodol y gwneir hynny weithiau. Fodd bynnag, ymddengys fod ein Gweinidog dros addysg yn cefnogi unben sydd, er enghraifft, wedi casglu gwrywydwydwr at ei gilydd dro ar ôl tro a’u dal mewn gwersylloedd llafur gorfodol i’w hailaddysgu. Mae llawer o’r bobl hynny wedi diflannu am byth. Yn y 1970au, aeth pethau’n arbennig o ddrwg pan elwid hoywon yn rhai patholegol, a chafwyd gwared â llawer ohonynt. Mae’r sefyllfa wedi gwella ychydig ond, er hynny, gellir rhoi cosb o flwyddyn mewn carchar am ymddygiad gwrywydiol. Er hynny, cofiaf

that promoted homosexuality, or any other kind of sexuality, from being put into Welsh schools. What absolute hypocrisy. As well as discriminating against those who have a different or unusual sexual orientation, the Cuban state also locks up anyone who expresses political views that upset its dictator. A number of people are currently serving long sentences in Cuban jails. I will read a few of their names and let the Minister's head hang in shame as she considers them.

Bernardo Arévalo Padrón was sentenced to six years in jail for showing disrespect towards Fidel Castro. Francisco Chaviano González was sentenced to 15 years' imprisonment. Eddy Alfredo Mena y González was sentenced to five years' imprisonment for disrespect and public disorder, which is sometimes a euphemism for homosexual activity. Néstor Rodríguez Lobaina was sentenced to six years and two months in prison. Carlos Oquendo Rodríguez was sentenced to two years in prison. I will also mention two others who have just marked their first anniversary in a Cuban jail. They are Leonardo Miguel Bruzón Avila, who was arrested for trying to participate in dissident activities and Carlos Alberto Domínguez González, the reason for whose arrest is unclear, though it is thought that he was trying to hold a Catholic mass for political prisoners. These people have been in jail for over a year, Minister, and you have signed a memorandum of understanding with the person who put them there—somebody who has murdered homosexuals—and then you criticise me for trying to stop books that promote homosexuality and other forms of sexuality from being used in Welsh schools. You are showing utter, rampant hypocrisy. Sever your links with this man immediately and start campaigning for those who languish in Cuban jails for expressing their beliefs or sexuality.

4.50 p.m.

**Owen John Thomas:** Efallai y cawn ni ddychwelyd i'r pwnc, sef addysg. Croesawaf

imi gael fy meirniadu ychydig o flynyddoedd yn ôl am fy mod am atal llyfrau a oedd yn hyrwyddo gwrywgydiaeth, neu unrhyw fath arall o rywioldeb, rhag cyrraedd ysgolion Cymru. Y fath ragrith. Yn ogystal â gwahaniaethu yn erbyn y rhai sydd â thuedd rhywiol gwahanol neu anarferol, mae gwladwriaeth Cwba hefyd yn carcharu unrhyw un sy'n mynegi barn wleidyddol sy'n digio'i hunben. Mae nifer o bobl yn treulio cyfnodau hir mewn carcharau yng Nghwba ar hyn o bryd. Darllenaf rai o'u henwau a gadael i'r Gweinidog ostwng ei phen o gywilydd wrth iddi eu hystyried.

Dedfrydwyd Bernardo Arévalo Padrón i chwe blynedd mewn carchar am amharchu Fidel Castro. Dedfrydwyd Francisco Chaviano González i 15 mlynedd mewn carchar. Dedfrydwyd Eddy Alfredo Mena y González i bum mlynedd mewn carchar am ddirmyg ac anhrefn gyhoeddus, sydd weithiau'n air teg am weithgaredd gwrywgydiol. Dedfrydwyd Néstor Rodríguez Lobaina i chwe blynedd a dau fis mewn carchar. Dedfrydwyd Carlos Oquendo Rodríguez i ddwy flynedd mewn carchar. Cyfeiriaf at ddau arall hefyd sydd newydd gwblhau eu blwyddyn gyntaf mewn carchar yng Nghwba. Y rhain yw Leonardo Miguel Bruzón Avila, a arestiwyd am geisio cymryd rhan mewn gweithgareddau anghytunol, a Carlos Alberto Domínguez González, y mae'r rheswm am ei arestio'n ansicr, er y credir ei fod yn ceisio cynnal offeren Gatholig ar gyfer carcharorion gwleidyddol. Mae'r bobl hyn yn y carchar ers dros flwyddyn, Weinidog, ac yr ydych chi wedi arwyddo memorandwm cyd-ddealltwriaeth gyda'r un a'u rhoddodd yno—rhywun sydd wedi llofruddio gwrywgydwyr—ac wedyn yr ydych yn fy meirniadu i am geisio atal defnyddio llyfrau sy'n hyrwyddo gwrywgydiaeth a mathau eraill o rywioldeb mewn ysgolion yng Nghymru. Yr ydych yn amlygu rhagrith llwyr a diymatal. Torrwch eich cysylltiadau â'r dyn hwn ar unwaith, a dechreuwch ymgyrchu dros y sawl sy'n dihoeni mewn carcharau yng Nghwba am fynegi eu barn neu eu rhywioldeb.

**Owen John Thomas:** Perhaps we can return to the issue, which is education. I welcome



dröedigaeth aelodau'r clymblaid i'r safbwynt bod gan wledydd y tu hwnt i Loegr rywbeth i'w gyfrannu i'n trafodaethau. Yr wyf yn falch bod sawl Gweinidog wedi elwa ar ymweliadau â Gwlad y Basg, Catalwnia, Cwbec a Chiwba. Fodd bynnag, er mor bwysig yw darganfod arfer da, pwysicaf oll yw sicrhau bod yr amgylchiadau perthnasol y mae'r arfer da yn ffynnu o danynt yn cael eu sefydlu yng Nghymru. Yn hyn o beth, mae Gwlad y Basg a Chymru mor debyg i'w gilydd ag y gall dwy wlad fod o ran poblogaeth, arwynebedd, statws llywodraethol, canran y siaradwyr o'u hieithoedd brodorol, a dylanwad rhyngwladol cryf ieithoedd y ddwy wladwriaeth y maent yn rhan ohonynt, sef Sbaeneg a Saesneg.

Yn 1979, pan lansiodd Llywodraeth Gwlad y Basg ei chunllun i wrthdroi dirywiad yr iaith frodorol, gosododd addysg yn beiriant i yrru'r broses hon yn ei blaen ac i fod yn brif faes am y newid mwyaf. Yr adeg honno, yr oedd tua 20 y cant o ddisgyblion ysgol y wlad yn derbyn eu haddysg drwy gyfrwng y Fasgeg neu'n ddwyieithog. Ni allai'r mwyafrif o athrawon yr ysgolion eraill ddysgu drwy gyfrwng y Fasgeg, nac, yn wir, siarad yr iaith. Serch hynny, yr oedd Llywodraeth newydd y Basgiaid yn benderfynol o adfer yr iaith frodorol, ac aeth ati i greu a chyflawni strategaeth genedlaethol bwrpasol gref. Gan ddechrau gyda mintai o'r athrawon mwyaf brwd a pharod, sefydlwyd cyrsiau blwyddyn; un i siaradwyr yr iaith frodorol astudio methodoleg dysgu cyfrwng y Fasgeg, ac un arall i athrawon uniaith Sbaeneg a oedd eisiau dod yn siaradwyr y Fasgeg. Byddai'r athrawon a lwyddai i ddysgu'r Fasgeg wedyn yn mynychu cwrs blwyddyn i ddod yn gyfarwydd â'r dulliau dysgu cyfrwng Basgeg. Hefyd, lansiwyd cwrs tri mis i hyfforddi athrawon pynciau arbennig, megis mathemateg, gwyddoniaeth ac ati, i ddysgu drwy gyfrwng yr iaith frodorol.

Cyllidwyd y cyrsiau i gyd gan y Llywodraeth a rhyddhawyd tua 900 o athrawon y flwyddyn i'w mynychu. Ers dechrau'r cyrsiau sabothol yn 1980, mae canran y disgyblion sy'n derbyn addysg cyfrwng

the conversion of members of the coalition to the position that countries other than England also have something to contribute to our deliberations. I am pleased that several Ministers have benefited from their visits to the Basque Country, Catalonia, Québec and Cuba. However, as important as finding best practice is, the most important thing is ensuring that the relevant circumstances in which best practice flourishes are established in Wales. In this respect, the Basque Country and Wales are as similar as two countries can be in terms of population, surface area, governmental status, the percentage of their indigenous language speakers, and the strong international influence of the languages of the states of which they are a part, namely, Spanish and English.

In 1979, when the Basque Government launched its scheme to reverse the decline in the native language, it chose education as the motor to drive the process forward and to be the main arena for maximum change. At that time, about 20 per cent of the country's schoolchildren received their education through the medium of Euskara, the Basque language, or bilingually. The majority of teachers in the other schools were not able to teach through the medium of Euskara, or indeed speak the language. However, the new Basque Government was determined to revive the indigenous language, and it strove to create and achieve a strong, purposeful national strategy. Starting with a contingent of the most enthusiastic teachers, year-long courses were established; one was for speakers of the indigenous language to study the methodology of Euskara-medium teaching, and another was for monoglot Spanish-speaking teachers wishing to learn Euskara. Those teachers who successfully learned Euskara would then attend a year-long course to become skilled in Euskara-medium teaching methods. Also, a three-month course was launched to train teachers of particular subjects, such as mathematics, science and so on, to teach through the medium of the indigenous language.

The courses were all financed by the Government and about 900 teachers were released annually to attend them. Since the inception of the sabbatical courses in 1980, the percentage of pupils receiving Euskara-

Basgeg wedi codi o 20 y cant i 55 y cant gyda'r nifer sy'n derbyn eu haddysg yn ddwyieithog yn 34 y cant. Mae'r gweddill, sy'n dysgu'r iaith fel pwnc, wedi syrthio i 11 y cant. Felly, mae 89 y cant o blant Gwlad y Basg yn derbyn eu haddysg drwy gyfrwng y Fasgeg yn llawn neu'n ddwyieithog. Erbyn heddiw, mae'r pwyslais yng Ngwlad y Basg wedi symud o hyfforddiant i athrawon i addysgofal ar gyfer y plant ieuaf hyd at ddwyflwydd. Yn hyn o beth, mae parodrwydd i ddysgu'n reddfol mor gryf fel ei fod yn paratoi plant i ddechrau dysgu trydedd iaith erbyn cyrraedd yr adran iau yn saith oed.

Felly, gyd-Aelodau, mae'r gwaith a wnaed yng Ngwlad y Basg i'w efelychu, nid yn unig wrth inni drefnu cyrsiau sabothol Cymraeg i athrawon, neu wrth ymchwilio dulliau newydd o ddysgu ieithoedd tramor, ond hefyd wrth drawsffurfio addysg blynnyddoedd cynnar yn ysgolion Cymru. Nid gofyn yr ydym i athrawon a phobl Cymru fynd draw i Wlad y Basg; gofyn yr ydym iddynt efelychu ei dulliau i gyrraedd y nod o gael Cymru ddwyieithog yn y dyfodol.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** All our European and international activities are part of the journey to achieve the common aim of making Wales internationally renowned as a country for learners and practitioners. We should, therefore, be talking about how we address that and we should be developing the right kind of relationships to ensure that other countries are fully aware of what we are doing in Wales, what we are attempting to do, and developing the right kind of relationship with us. If we really are to make Wales a learning country, it is terribly important to raise the profile of learning. I reject the suggestion, Jonathan, that 'The Learning Country' does not refer to the international dimension. On page 40, the specific point is made that we need to increase the number of international students. Right throughout 'The Learning Country' we talk about evidence-based policy making. We want to draw not just on evidence in Wales, but on evidence wherever we can find it, to help us construct mechanisms that are useful.

medium education has risen from 20 per cent to 55 per cent, with the number receiving bilingual education at 34 per cent. The remainder, learning the language as a subject, has fallen to 11 per cent. Therefore, 89 per cent of Basque children receive their education either fully through the medium of Euskara or bilingually. Today, the emphasis in the Basque Country has shifted from teacher training to educate for the youngest children up to two years of age. In this respect, the ability to learn instinctively is so strong that it prepares the children to start learning a third language by the time they reach junior level at age seven.

Therefore, colleagues, the work accomplished in the Basque Country is to be emulated, not only through organising Welsh-language sabbatical courses for teachers, or in researching new methods of teaching foreign languages, but also in transforming early years education in Welsh schools. We are not asking the people of Wales or their teachers to go to the Basque Country; we are asking them to emulate its methods to achieve the goal of a bilingual Wales in the future.

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Mae ein holl weithgareddau Ewropeaidd a rhyngwladol yn rhan o'r daith tuag at gyrraedd y nod gyffredinol o sicrhau bod Cymru'n cael ei chydnabod yn rhyngwladol yn wlad ar gyfer dysgwyr ac ymarferwyr. Gan hynny, dylem drafod y modd i ymdrin â hynny a datblygu cysylltiadau o'r math a fydd yn sicrhau y bydd gwledydd eraill yn llwyr ymwybodol o'r hyn a wnawn yng Nghymru, a'r hyn y ceisiwn ei wneud, ac yn datblygu cysylltiadau priodol â ni. Os ydym o ddifrif am droi Cymru'n wlad sy'n dysgu, mae'n ofnadwy o bwysig hybu amlygrwydd dysgu. Gwrthodaf yr awgrym, Jonathan, nad yw 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu' yn cyfeirio at yr agwedd ryngwladol. Ar dudalen 40, gwneir pwynt penodol i'r perwyl bod rhaid inni gynyddu nifer y myfyrwyr rhyngwladol. Drwy 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu' yr ydym yn sôn am lunio polisi ar sail tystiolaeth. Nid tystiolaeth o Gymru'n unig yr ydym am ei defnyddio, ond tystiolaeth ym mha le bynnag y gallwn ei chael, i'n helpu i greu mecanweithiau defnyddiol.

**Jonathan Morgan:** This is a substantial Government document. It is the bible that you tend to quote when you make statements in the Chamber or come to Committee with your proposals. It is the basis upon which you are bringing reform into Wales. If international development is as crucial to the development of learners and practitioners in Wales as your motion states, why does it not get an airing in Plenary? One bullet point is insufficient if this is so crucial to developing the education system in Wales.

**Jane Davidson:** There has been much posturing this afternoon. If you read the words of the motion, you will see that we say that international co-operation is crucial to making Wales internationally renowned. I accept Helen Mary's point that its importance is self-evident. Clearly, to have an international profile, you must have international co-operation, and the motion therefore focuses on that. It is extraordinary that Plaid Cymru, whose amendments have been torn to pieces by Members, will abstain on a motion that considers that international co-operation in education and lifelong learning is crucial to making Wales internationally renowned as a learning country, and believes that drawing on international experience of best practice offers great opportunities for learners and practitioners throughout Wales. Abstaining on such a motion is extraordinary. I would have been content to support amendment 2 if it had mentioned drawing on the experience of the Basque Country. I am doing that: we have a technical committee and officials meet to discuss the three specific areas of work. However, the amendment speaks of one-year sabbaticals, delivered in dedicated training units. My colleague in the Basque Country pointed out that many teachers do not need a whole year. Teachers who already have a good understanding of Basque can often be trained in three months. We do not want to limit the extent of training or where training takes place.

**Owen John Thomas:** Three types of course exist in the Basque Country—I paid to go there to find this out. One of the courses is

**Jonathan Morgan:** Mae hon yn ddogfen o sylwedd o eiddo'r Llywodraeth. Hi yw'r beibl yr ydych yn dueddol o ddyfynnu ohono pan wnewch ddatganiad yn y Siambr neu gyflwyno'ch cynigion i'r Pwyllgor. Hi yw'r sail i'r diwygiadau yr ydych yn eu cyflwyno yng Nghymru. Os yw datblygu rhyngwladol mor hanfodol i ddatblygiad dysgwyr ac ymarferwyr yng Nghymru ag y dywed eich cynnig, pam na chaiff ei wyntyllu yn y Cyfarfod Llawn? Nid yw un pwynt bwled yn ddigon os yw hyn mor hanfodol i ddatblygu'r system addysg yng Nghymru.

**Jane Davidson:** Bu llawer o ymagweddu y prynhawn yma. Os darllenwch eiriau'r cynnig, gwelwch ein bod yn dweud bod cydweithredu rhyngwladol yn hollbwysig i sicrhau bod Cymru'n cael cydnabyddiaeth ryngwladol. Derbyniaf bwynt Helen Mary i'r perwyl ei fod yn amlwg ohono'i hun. Wrth gwrs, er mwyn cael proffil rhyngwladol, rhaid wrth gydweithredu rhyngwladol, felly mae'r cynnig yn canolbwyntio ar hynny. Mae'n rhyfeddol y bydd Plaid Cymru, y tynnwyd ei gwelliannau'n gareiau gan Aelodau, yn ymatal ar gynnig sy'n datgan bod cydweithredu rhyngwladol mewn addysg a dysgu gydol oes yn hollbwysig i sicrhau bod Cymru'n cael cydnabyddiaeth ryngwladol fel gwlad sy'n dysgu, ac yn dal bod elwa ar brofiad rhyngwladol o'r arferion gorau'n cynnig cyfleoedd mawr i ddysgwyr ac ymarferwyr ledled Cymru. Mae'n rhyfeddol ei bod yn ymatal ar gynnig o'r fath. Buaswn yn fodlon cefnogi gwelliant 2 pe bai wedi sôn am elwa ar brofiad Gwlad y Basg. Yr wyf yn gwneud hynny: mae gennym bwyllgor technegol ac mae swyddogion yn cwrdd i drafod y tri maes gwaith penodol. Fodd bynnag, mae'r gwelliant yn sôn am gyfnodau sabothol o flwyddyn, a ddarperir mewn unedau hyfforddi pwrpasol. Tynnodd y Gweinidog sy'n cyfateb i mi yng Ngwlad y Basg sylw at y ffaith nad oes angen blwyddyn gyfan ar lawer o athrawon. Yn aml, gellir hyfforddi athrawon sydd â chrap da ar y Fasseg mewn tri mis. Nid ydym am gyfyngu ar faint yr hyfforddiant nac ymhle y mae'n digwydd.

**Owen John Thomas:** Ceir tri math o gwrs yng Ngwlad y Basg—telais i fynd yno i ddarganfod hynny. Mae un o'r cysiau ar

for people who cannot speak the Basque language at all. They study the language for a year, and if they pass—and only 80 per cent pass in the first year—they progress to a second course for a year, where they learn to teach through the medium of Basque. Those who speak the language study a different course. When the sabbatical system began, it attracted people who were keen and who wanted to make the transition from teaching through the medium of Spanish to teaching through the medium of Basque. These people had a grasp of the language, but it was still a year-long course. The third course—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. This is an intervention, not a speech.

**Jane Davidson:** I am grateful for your information, but I already know this from talking to my colleague in the Basque Country. You have proposed an amendment about one aspect of that country's experience and I am not prepared to support an amendment on one aspect alone. We have put the money in place for language-learning sabbaticals, and we will discuss how we can best deliver that in Wales with colleagues in the Welsh Language Board, with the new unit, with the new forum that is being established, and with our education partners.

5.00 p.m.

Jonathan Morgan said that headteachers will consider that this debate is irrelevant. This afternoon, I sat in the hot seat for 'pen i ben', the on-line community for newly qualified headteachers in Wales, and answered questions on what they felt were relevant and important issues. A question was raised about how we expand our international opportunities—someone who was strongly supportive of the Comenius programme wanted to see an extension in this area. One headteacher asked me today about what we should be doing about this.

**Jonathan Morgan:** It is interesting, Minister, that one headteacher mentioned European experiences. How many headteachers tackled you on ELWa? How many headteachers tackled you on teacher recruitment and retention, pupil discipline

gyfer rhai na fedrant y Fasgeg o gwbl. Astudiant yr iaith am flwyddyn, ac os ydynt yn llwyddo—a dim ond 80 y cant sy'n llwyddo yn y flwyddyn gyntaf—ânt ymlaen i ail gwrs blwyddyn, lle y dysgant sut i ddysgu drwy gyfrwng y Fasgeg. Mae'r rhai sy'n medru'r iaith yn dilyn cwrs gwahanol. Pan ddechreuodd y system sabathol, denodd rai a oedd yn frwd ac a oedd am newid o ddysgu drwy gyfrwng y Sbaeneg at ddysgu drwy gyfrwng y Fasgeg. Yr oedd gan y bobl hynny ryw grap ar yr iaith, ond cwrs blwyddyn ydoedd, er hynny. Mae'r trydydd cwrs—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Ymyriad yw hwn, nid araith.

**Jane Davidson:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y wybodaeth a roddwch, ond gwn hyn eisoes drwy siarad â'r Gweinidog addysg yng Ngwlad y Basg. Yr ydych wedi cynnig gwelliant ar un agwedd yn unig ar brofiad y wlad honno. Yr ydym wedi neilltuo arian ar gyfer cyfnodau dysgu iaith sabothol, a thrafodwn sut y gallwn gyflawni hynny orau yng Nghymru gyda chydweithwyr ym Mwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg, gyda'r uned newydd, gyda'r fforwm newydd a sefydlir, a chyda'n partneriaid mewn addysg.

Dywedodd Jonathan Morgan y byddai penaethiaid ysgol yn ystyried y ddadl hon yn amherthnasol. Y prynhawn yma, eisteddais yn y sedd boeth ar gyfer 'pen i ben', y gymuned ar-lein i brifathrawon sydd newydd ymgymhwysu yng Nghymru, ac atebais gwestiynau ar yr hyn a deimlent oedd yn faterion perthnasol a phwysig. Gofynnwyd cwestiwn ynghylch sut y gallwn ehangu ein cyfleoedd rhyngwladol—yr oedd rhywun a oedd yn gefnogol iawn o raglen Comenius am weld ehangu yn y maes hwn. Gofynnodd un pennaeth ysgol imi heddiw beth y dylem ei wneud am hyn.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Mae'n ddiddorol, Weinidog, fod un pennaeth ysgol wedi sôn am brofiadau Ewropeaidd. Sawl pennaeth ysgol a'ch holodd am ELWa? Sawl pennaeth ysgol a'ch holodd am recriwtio a chadw athrawon, disgyblu disgyblion a gorweithio

and being overworked as a result of bureaucracy? Those issues are also high priorities.

**Jane Davidson:** Headteachers' questions are still coming in. However, it was interesting that of the first three that I saw, one dealt with the international dimension, from someone who was not aware that this debate was to be held this afternoon. In responding, I said that this debate was being held today. The important question is whether you have confidence that Wales can play its part in the world. Plaid Cymru has clearly lost that, if it is to abstain on a motion about international co-operation. The rest of us should believe strongly in Wales playing its role in the world, having an inter-dependent world, having citizenship and solidarity that stretches across borders, and having young people who are able to fully play their role in Europe. The European White Paper on youth has outlined proposals about how to involve young people in community life and public decision-making. I am proud to say that we have already incorporated many of the themes and principles of the White Paper.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Given your enthusiasm for the need for Wales to play its part in Europe and in international affairs, you would clearly welcome a debate on the Iraq situation.

**Jane Davidson:** I will continue to focus on the issues before us, dealing with the way in which we develop our education system and work with partners to contribute to the best kind of education system in Wales—that is my job as Minister. From language to citizenship to sustainable development, we want to include European and global perspectives. I am glad that Mick mentioned the baccalaureate, as that is what the Welsh baccalaureate does. Its core programme will include the study of political, social and economic issues in Wales, Europe and the world. It will include a modern foreign language module, an extended individual project, work-related education, a period of work experience, and key skills. We are considering new methods of delivery, and to be effective in that, we will learn from others,

oherwydd biwrocratiaeth? Mae'r materion hynny'n flaenoriaethau uchel hefyd.

**Jane Davidson:** Mae cwestiynau prifathrawon yn dal i ddod i mewn. Er hynny, diddorol oedd sylwi, o blith y tri chyntaf a welais, fod un yn ymwneud â'r agwedd ryngwladol, a hynny gan rywun na wyddai fod y ddadl hon i'w chynnal y prynhawn yma. Wrth ymateb, dywedais fod y ddadl hon yn cael ei chynnal heddiw. Y cwestiwn pwysig yw pa un ai a ydych yn hyderus y gall Cymru chwarae ei rhan yn y byd. Mae'n amlwg nad ydyw Plaid Cymru, os yw i ymatal ar gynnig am gydweithredu rhyngwladol. Dylai'r gweddill ohonom gredu'n gryf y dylai Cymru chwarae ei rhan yn y byd, y dylid cael byd rhyngddibynnol, dinasyddiaeth a chydymddibyniad sy'n ymestyn dros ffiniau, a phobl ifanc sy'n gallu chwarae eu rôl lawn yn Ewrop. Mae'r Papur Gwyn Ewropeaidd ar ieuenctid wedi amlinellu cynigion ynghylch y modd i gynnwys pobl ifanc mewn bywyd cymunedol a phenderfyniadau cyhoeddus. Yr wyf yn falch o ddweud ein bod eisoes wedi cynnwys llawer o themâu ac egwyddorion y Papur Gwyn.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** O wybod eich bod mor frwd dros yr angen i Gymru chwarae ei rhan yn Ewrop ac mewn materion rhyngwladol, mae'n amlwg y byddech yn croesawu dadl ar y sefyllfa ynghylch Iraq.

**Jane Davidson:** Daliaf i ganolbwyntio ar y materion ger ein bron, sy'n ymwneud â'r modd yr ydym yn datblygu ein system addysg ac yn gweithio gyda phartneriaid i gyfrannu at y math gorau o system addysg yng Nghymru—dyna fy ngwaith fel Gweinidog. O iaith i ddinasyddiaeth i ddatblygu cynaliadwy, yr ydym am gynnwys safbwyntiau Ewropeaidd a byd-eang. Yr wyf yn falch bod Mick wedi sôn am y fagloriaeth, gan mai dyna a wnaiff y fagloriaeth Gymreig. Bydd ei rhaglen graidd yn cynnwys astudio materion gwleidyddol, cymdeithasol ac economaidd yng Nghymru, Ewrop a'r byd. Bydd yn cynnwys modiwl iaith dramor fodern, prosiect unigol estynedig, addysg sy'n gysylltiedig â gwaith, cyfnod o brofiad gwaith, a sgiliau allweddol. Yr ydym yn ystyried dulliau newydd o'i darparu ac, er

and others will learn from us. This has been an important debate, as it demonstrates the importance of this agenda in Wales.

mwyn gwneud hynny'n effeithiol, dysgwn oddi wrth eraill, a bydd eraill yn dysgu oddi wrthym ni. Bu hon yn ddadl bwysig, gan ei bod yn dangos pwysigrwydd yr agenda hon yng Nghymru.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26.*

*Amendment 1: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 26.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, David  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Hancock, Brian  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Lloyd, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 11, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.*

*Amendment 2: For 11, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Hancock, Brian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina

Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, David Ian  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant  
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 11, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 3: For 11, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Hancock, Brian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, David Ian  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected.*

*Cynnig (NDM1358): O blaid 30, Ymatal 11, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1358): For 30, Abstain 11, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, David  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, David Ian  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*  
*Motion carried.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â  
today's proceedings to a close. chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.05 p.m.*  
*The session ended at 5.05 p.m.*