



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mawrth 11 Chwefror 2003**

**Tuesday 11 February 2003**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog  
*Questions to the First Minister*
- 27 Datganiad Busnes  
*Business Statement*
- 31 Pwyntiau o Drefn  
*Points of Order*
- 32 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Addysg (Unedau Cyfeirio Disgyblion) (Apelau yn erbyn Gwaharddiadau Parhaol) (Cymru) 2003  
*Motion to approve The Education (Pupil Referral Units) (Appeals Against Permanent Exclusion) (Wales) Regulations 2003*
- 41 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd a Thaliadau Optegol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003  
*Approval of the National Health Service (Optical Charges and Payments) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003*
- 46 Penodi Personau i Weinyddu'r Llw  
*Appointment of Persons to Administer the Oath*
- 50 Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol am Wasanaethau ar gyfer Plant ag Anghenion Iechyd Arbennig  
*The Health and Social Services Committee's Report on Services for Children with Special Health Needs*
- 76 Dyfodol y Cynlluniau Amaeth-Amgylcheddol  
*The Future of Agri-Environmental Schemes*

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## **Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister**

### **Datblygu Polisi Policy Development**

**C1 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ei gyfrifoldeb dros ddatblygu polisi yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol? (OAQ22312)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn gyfrifol am ddatblygu polisiau a chydlynu materion trawsbynciol. Yr wyf hefyd yn cadeirio isbwyllgorau'r Cabinet ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy, Corus, a Chymru a'r byd. Yr wyf yn cydlynu polisiau mewn perthynas â'r Gogledd, ac yr wyf yn arwain ar y berthynas rhwng Cymru a gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yn ogystal â'r cyfrifoldebau penodol hynny, fel Prif Weinidog, yr ydych yn gyfrifol am yr holl feysydd polisi. Beth yw eich barn am y sefyllfa ym maes polisi iechyd? Dywed y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol fod y gost ychwanegol o hyd at £15 miliwn sydd ei angen ar gyfer ailstrwythuro'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn gost niwtral; dywed y meddyg parchus, cydnabyddedig Dr Maurice Slevin fod y gwasanaeth iechyd drwy Brydain ar fin hunanddinstrio; mae prif weithredwyr ymddiriedolaethau yng Nghymru yn derbyn mwy o gyflog nag yn unrhyw le arall ym Mhrydain. A dderbyniwch fod y sefyllfa allan o reolaeth ac mai chi sydd â'r cyfrifoldeb o ddatrys y *shambles* hwn?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n hawdd defnyddio geiriau di-ystyr fel *shambles*. Pan af o amgylch ysbytai Cymru, gwelaf fod y staff yn gweithio'n galed a'u bod yn cael mantais o'r buddsoddiadau a wnaethom: mae nifer o staff ychwanegol yn cael eu hyfforddi ar hyn o bryd, a bydd codiadau syfrdanol yn y nifer o ddoctoriaid a nyrsys pan fyddant wedi gorffen eu hyfforddiant. Mae bron pob ysbyty yr ymwelaf ag ef, fel yr ysbytai ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr a Threforus y bu imi ymweld â hwy yn ddiweddar, yn manteisio ar y buddsoddiadau enfawr a wnaed—weithiau

**Q1 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Will the First Minister make a statement on his responsibility for policy development in the National Assembly? (OAQ22312)

**The First Minister:** I am responsible for developing policies and for co-ordinating cross-cutting issues. I also chair the Cabinet sub-committees on sustainable development, Corus, and Wales and the world. I co-ordinate policies in relation to north Wales, and I lead on the relations between Wales and the rest of the United Kingdom.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** In addition to those specific responsibilities, as First Minister, you are responsible for all policy areas. What is your view on the situation that exists in relation to health policy? The Minister for Health and Social Services states that the additional cost of up to £15 million, which is needed to restructure the health service, is cost neutral, while the acclaimed and respected Dr Maurice Slevin states that the NHS throughout the UK is about to self-destruct. The chief executives of trusts in Wales receive higher salaries than their counterparts elsewhere in Britain. Do you accept that the situation is out of control and that it is your responsibility to sort this shambles out?

**The First Minister:** It is easy to use meaningless words such as 'shambles'. When I visit the hospitals of Wales, I find that staff are working hard and that they are benefiting from the investments that we have made: more staff are currently being trained, and there will be a massive increase in the number of doctors and nurses when they complete their training. Almost every hospital that I visit, such as those in Bridgend and Morriston which I visited recently, has benefited as a result of these massive investments—£10 million here, £2 million

£10 miliwn, dro arall £2 filiwn—er mwyn gwella'r cyfleusterau yn ein hysbytai.

**Alun Pugh:** The protection of children has been an important aspect of policy development; we have created the Children's Commissioner for Wales. Do you share my concerns about the covert use of camera mobile phones in children's changing rooms, and will you consider offering guidance to local authorities to prevent paedophiles from abusing this latest piece of information and communications technology?

**The First Minister:** I want to consult with the four chief constables of Wales on that matter to see if they share the same concerns as you, Alun. I have read about your concerns in the press, and other people have made similar comments. Before I take this matter up officially, I will consult with specialists in the four police forces in Wales who deal with matters relating to paedophiles.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Sylwais eich bod yn mynd ar daith o amgylch ysbytai Cymru o bryd i'w gilydd, fel pob Aelod o'r Cynulliad. Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn gwybod y cyhoeddwyd heddiw fod prif weithredwyr ysbytai yng Nghymru yn ennill cyflogau o £110,000 y flwyddyn, sydd yn uwch nag unrhyw ran arall o'r Deyrnas Gyfunol. A allwch gyfiawnhau'r cyflogau hynny, ac, os gallwch, beth yw eich neges i nyrsys Cymru sydd wedi derbyn codiad cyflog yn unol â chwyddiant yn unig?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni wnaethoch ddyfynnu'r ffigur o ran codiadau cyflog y prif weithredwyr. Efallai y gallech ysgrifennu ataf gyda'r ffigur hwnnw. Ni allwch gymharu'r ffigur o ran codiadau cyflog nyrsys gyda'r ffigur o ran cyflog y prif weithredwyr: mae honno'n gymhariaeth anghywir. Pan ailddarllenwch yr hyn yr ydych newydd ei ddweud, bydd yn rhaid ichi dderbyn hynny. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn gosod canllawiau i'r ymddiriedolaethau iechyd ynglŷn â maint cyflogau eu prif weithredwyr. Fodd bynnag, eu cyfrifoldeb hwy yw recriwtio prif weithredwyr a thalu cyflogau sydd yn deilwng yn eu tyb hwy, ac sydd yn dilyn ein canllawiau. Dywed y canllawiau hynny y dylid ystyried cyflogau staff wrth osod

there—to improve the facilities in our hospitals.

**Alun Pugh:** Bu amddiffyn plant yn agwedd bwysig ar ddatblygu polisi; bu inni greu'r Comisiynydd Plant i Gymru. A rannwch fy mhryderon ynghylch defnyddio ffonau symudol â chamera yn y dirgel mewn ystafelloedd newid i blant, ac a wnewch ystyried cynnig cyfarwyddyd i awdurdodau lleol i atal pedoffiliaid rhag camddefnyddio'r dechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu ddiweddaraf hon?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dymunaf ymgynghori â phedwar prif gwnstabl Cymru ar y mater hwnnw i weld a ydynt yn rhannu'r un pryderon â chi, Alun. Yr wyf wedi darllen am eich pryderon yn y wasg, a gwnaeth eraill sylwadau tebyg. Cyn imi godi'r mater hwn yn swyddogol, ymgynghoraf ag arbenigwyr yn y pedwar heddlu yng Nghymru sy'n ymdrin â materion sy'n gysylltiedig â phedoffiliaid.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** I noticed that you visit the hospitals of Wales from time to time, as do all Assembly Members. I am sure that you know that an announcement was made today that chief executives of hospitals in Wales are paid salaries of £110,000 per annum, which is higher than any other part of the UK. Can you justify those salaries, and, if you can, what is your message to nurses in Wales who have only been offered pay increases that are in line with inflation?

**The First Minister:** You did not quote the figure for the pay increase that chief executives received. Maybe you could write to me with that figure. You cannot compare pay increases for nurses with the chief executives' salaries: that is an erroneous comparison. If you re-read what you have just said, you would have to accept that. It is important that we set guidelines for the health trusts as to how much they pay their chief executives. However, the trusts are responsible for recruiting chief executives and paying salaries that they consider to be appropriate and that comply with our guidelines. Those guidelines state that trusts must take staff salaries into account when determining chief executives' salaries, and

cyflogau'r prif weithredwyr, ac y dylid cadw perthynas rhwng y ddau.

keep both in relation to each other.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** You are on record as saying that top-up fees, and the way in which we deal with them, will be a major test for how we handle devolution when working with Westminster. You said that top-up fees are hugely important. Can you outline the details and timescale of talks that you and the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning will have with Peter Hain and Charles Clarke? Contradictory and confusing messages have been sent out to parents, students and our universities. The matter needs clarifying. Can you confirm that top-up fees will not be put on the growing list of matters that are to be kicked into touch until after the Assembly elections?

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Yr ydych wedi dweud ar goedd y bydd ffioedd ychwanegol, a'r modd yr ymdriniwn â hwy, yn brawf o bwys am y modd y trafodwn ddatganoli wrth weithio gyda San Steffan. Dywedasoeh fod ffioedd ychwanegol yn bwysig dros ben. A allwch amlinellu manylion ac amserlen y trafodaethau a gewch chi a'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes gyda Peter Hain a Charles Clarke? Anfonwyd negeseuon anghyson a dryslyd at rieni a myfyrwyr ac i'n prifysgolion. Mae angen egluro'r mater hwn. A allwch gadarnhau na roddir ffioedd ychwanegol ar y rhestr gynyddol o faterion sydd i'w rhoi o'r neilltu tan ar ôl etholiadau'r Cynulliad?

**The First Minister:** I do not know of any messages that were sent out to parents on top-up fees. The talks are underway, but it is difficult to predict when they will be completed. You need to predict the cost of transferring to a top-up system, and what the benefits and disbenefits would be in transferring responsibility for student finance.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni wn am unrhyw negeseuon a anfonwyd at rieni am ffioedd ychwanegol. Mae'r trafodaethau'n mynd rhagddynt, ond anodd yw proffwydo pa bryd y'u cwblheir. Mae angen proffwydo'r gost o drosglwyddo i system o ffioedd ychwanegol, a pha fanteision ac anfanteision a geid wrth drosglwyddo cyfrifoldeb dros gyllid myfyrwyr.

The benefits of wider access and an excellence agenda in the Welsh higher education sector would be easier to achieve if we had control over student finances. At present we do not have that control. The cross-border flow of students—there are 21,000 full-time students from Wales studying in England, and 27,000 from England studying in Wales—has to be bottomed-out before we reach a position where we can make recommendations. The Assembly will be the first to know when we have reached a firm position, and when we have collected and agreed the facts and figures with the Department for Education and Skills.

Byddai'n haws sicrhau manteision mynediad ehangach ac agenda rhagoriaeth yn sector addysg uwch Cymru pe byddai gennym reolaeth dros gyllid myfyrwyr. Nid yw'r rheolaeth honno gennym ar hyn o bryd. Rhaid mynd at waelod y rhesymau dros y llif o fyfyrwyr sy'n croesi'r ffin—mae 21,000 o fyfyrwyr llawn-amser o Gymru yn astudio yn Lloegr, a 27,000 o Loegr yn astudio yng Nghymru—cyn y byddwn mewn sefyllfa i allu gwneud argymhellion. Y Cynulliad fydd y cyntaf i gael gwybod pan fyddwn wedi ffurfio barn bendant, a phan fyddwn wedi casglu a chytuno ar y ffeithiau a'r ffigurau gyda'r Adran Addysg a Sgiliau.

### Gwelyau mewn Cartrefi Gofal Care Home Beds

**Q2 David Melding:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the provision and availability of care home beds in Cardiff? (OAQ22329)

**C2 David Melding:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am y ddarpariaeth o welyau mewn cartrefi gofal yng Nghaerdydd a'r nifer sydd ar gael? (OAQ22329)

**The First Minister:** Between April 2002 and January 2003, 19 care homes closed and no new care homes opened in the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales's Cardiff region. This, along with variations to the number of beds registered in existing care homes, has resulted in a total loss of 131 beds. The current total number of beds is 2034. That is roughly a 6.5 per cent loss. None of the closures have resulted from enforcement action taken by CSIW.

**David Melding:** That was a frank answer that did not hide behind statistics. We have lost about 10 per cent of our residential homes. We have lost 10 per cent of the nursing care beds; roughly, the number of beds has dropped from 825 to 750. That is a worrying trend. There are knock-on affects, such as providing care in a hospital setting, which is much more expensive for the public purse. Is it not time for the fee levels to be reviewed in the nursing and residential home sector?

**The First Minister:** You and your party have an unhealthy obsession with the matter of fee levels, David. The fee levels taken together with the provision of services for domiciliary care is the issue. When domiciliary care is made available for people who would otherwise be in nursing or residential homes, then that would provide an alternative to nursing care homes. Probably 90 per cent of people would prefer that alternative. Sometimes domiciliary care is expensive; it can be more expensive than nursing care homes. Domiciliary care is the choice that a majority of people would make for themselves or on behalf of frailer members of their family. We aim to achieve a level playing field where choice is made on the basis of what is best for the patient, and not what numbers or statistics say what is best. That is the holy grail of managing care in the community.

**Kirsty Williams:** The statistics that you gave are similar across Wales and show that the numbers of care home beds are falling. Is it not inappropriate that the Government in London is considering fining any local

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Rhwng Ebrill 2002 ac Ionawr 2003, caeodd 19 o gartrefi gofal ac nid agorodd unrhyw gartrefi gofal newydd yn rhanbarth Caerdydd Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru. Mae hyn, ynghyd â'r amrywiadau yn nifer y gwelyau a gofrestrwyd yn y cartrefi gofal presennol, wedi arwain at golli cyfanswm o 131 o welyau. Cyfanswm y nifer o welyau ar hyn o bryd yw 2034. Mae hynny'n golled o tua 6.5 y cant. Ni chaewyd yr un ohonynt o ganlyniad i gamau gorfodi gan Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru.

**David Melding:** Yr oedd hwnnw'n ateb gonest nad oedd yn cuddio y tu ôl i ystadegau. Yr ydym wedi colli tua 10 y cant o'n cartrefi preswyl. Yr ydym wedi colli 10 y cant o'r gwelyau gofal nyrsio; yn fras, mae nifer y gwelyau wedi gostwng o 825 i 750. Mae hwnnw'n duedd sy'n peri gofid. Ceir sgîl-ffeithiau, fel darparu gofal mewn ysbytai, sy'n ddrutach o lawer i'r pwrs cyhoeddus. Onid yw'n bryd adolygu lefelau'r ffioedd yn y sector cartrefi nyrsio a phreswyl?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae gennych chi a'ch plaid obsesiwn afiach â mater lefelau ffioedd, David. Lefelau'r ffioedd ynghyd â'r ddarpariaeth o wasanaethau ar gyfer gofal yn y cartref yw'r mater pwysig. Pan fo gofal yn y cartref ar gael ar gyfer pobl a fyddai mewn cartrefi nyrsio neu breswyl fel arall, yna byddai hynny'n cynnig dewis arall yn lle cartrefi gofal nyrsio. Mae'n debyg y byddai'n well gan 90 y cant o bobl gymryd y dewis hwnnw. Mae gofal yn y cartref yn ddrud weithiau; gall fod yn ddrutach na chartrefi gofal nyrsio. Gofal yn y cartref yw'r hyn a ddewisai'r rhan fwyaf o bobl drostynt eu hunain neu ar ran aelodau mwy eiddil o'u teulu. Ein nod yw sicrhau sefyllfa gyfartal lle y dewisir ar sail yr hyn sydd orau i'r claf, ac nid ar sail yr hyn y dywed rhifau neu ystadegau sydd orau. Dyna sy'n ddelfrydol wrth reoli gofal yn y gymuned.

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae'r ystadegau a roesochn yn debyg ledled Cymru ac yn dangos bod niferoedd y gwelyau mewn cartrefi gofal yn gostwng. Onid yw'n amhriodol bod y Llywodraeth yn Llundain yn ystyried dirwyo

authority that has difficulty in placing patients in care home beds following their discharge from hospital? Should not the Assembly reject similar proposals for fining Welsh local authorities?

2.10 p.m.

**The First Minister:** I understand your strong feelings on this. It is known as following the Swedish model. Normally, that is what happens when there is a Volvo in front of me. However, that system appears to work in Sweden and acts as a disincentive to local authorities and other agencies, which have the job of trying to accommodate people properly at home, or, if that is not possible, in a nursing or old people's home. There is a difference of opinion on whether or not a system of issuing fines would work in the UK. We are following one route and the Department of Health in London proposes to follow another. We have no proposals to follow either the Swedish model or its variant—the Department of Health model—in Wales.

**Owen John Thomas:** We are losing a huge number of care beds per year in Wales while hospital buildings in the Cardiff region such as the Cardiff Royal Infirmary, Sully Hospital and the Royal Hamadryad Hospital could be used for post-treatment care. Can you think of a better use for the Cardiff Royal Infirmary?

**The First Minister:** That is institutional care on a massive scale. No-one, apart from you, has proposed that the Cardiff Royal Infirmary should become a huge old people's home with 500 beds. That does not make a great deal of sense. I have never heard anyone suggest that. For example, those who have been campaigning to restore Cardiff Royal Infirmary have never suggested that; they want it to be a hospital.

You mentioned a huge loss of care home beds, but the figures that I gave indicated a loss of around 6.5 per cent in an eight-month period, which would translate into a 10 per cent loss over a 12-month period. That reduction is related to the current housing boom. As a result of the boom, people who had converted large Victorian and Edwardian

unrhyw awdurdod lleol sy'n ei chael yn anodd lleoli cleifion mewn gwelyau cartref gofal ar ôl eu rhyddhau o'r ysbyty? Oni ddylai'r Cynulliad wrthod cynigion tebyg am ddirwyo awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Deallaf eich teimladau cryf am hyn. Dilyn y model Swedaidd y gelwir hynny. Fel arfer, dyna'r hyn sy'n digwydd pan fo Volvo o'm blaen. Fodd bynnag, ymddengys fod y system honno'n gweithio yn Sweden ac yn wrthanogaeth i awdurdodau lleol ac asiantaethau eraill, sy'n gyfrifol am geisio cartrefu pobl yn briodol yn eu cartrefi, neu, os nad yw hynny'n bosibl, mewn cartref nyrsio neu gartref hen bobl. Mae gwahaniaeth barn ynghylch a fyddai system dirwyo yn gweithio yn y DU ai peidio. Yr ydym yn dilyn un llwybr ac mae'r Adran Iechyd yn Llundain yn bwriadu dilyn un arall. Nid oes gennym unrhyw fwriad i ddilyn y model Swedaidd neu'r amrywiad arno—model yr Adran Iechyd—yng Nghymru.

**Owen John Thomas:** Yr ydym yn colli nifer enfawr o welyau bob blwyddyn yng Nghymru, tra gellid defnyddio adeiladau ysbyty yn rhanbarth Caerdydd fel Ysbyty Brenhinol Caerdydd, Ysbyty Sili a'r Ysbyty Hamadryad Brenhinol ar gyfer gofal ar ôl triniaeth. A allwch feddwl am well defnydd i Ysbyty Brenhinol Caerdydd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dyna ofal sefydliadol ar raddfa anferth. Nid oes neb, heblaw chi, wedi awgrymu y dylai Ysbyty Brenhinol Caerdydd ddod yn gartref hen bobl anferth gyda 500 o welyau. Nid yw hynny'n gwneud fawr o synnwyr. Ni chlywais neb arall yn awgrymu hynny erioed. Er enghraifft, nid yw'r rhai a fu'n ymgyrchu dros adfer Ysbyty Brenhinol Caerdydd wedi awgrymu hynny erioed; maent am iddo fod yn ysbyty.

Gwnaethoch sôn am golli nifer enfawr o welyau mewn cartrefi gofal, ond yr oedd y ffigurau a roddais yn dangos colled o tua 6.5 y cant mewn cyfnod o wyth mis, a fyddai'n rhoi colled o 10 y cant dros gyfnod o 12 mis. Mae'r gostyngiad hwnnw'n gysylltiedig â'r cynnydd presennol ym mhrisiau tai. Oherwydd y cynnydd hwnnw, mae rhai a

houses—of which we have many in Cardiff—into old people’s homes are now reversing those conversions. It was possible to make a great deal of money by converting large houses into homes because they were too big for your average family. However, converting these houses into flats and putting them back into residential occupation can now generate more money. That happens during a housing boom. We are experiencing the biggest housing boom for 13 or 14 years. When the boom is over, the factor that drives that process will cease.

oedd wedi addasu tai Fictoraidd ac Edwardaidd mawr—y mae gennym lawer ohonynt yng Nghaerdydd—yn gartrefi hen bobl bellach yn dadwneud yr addasiadau hynny. Yr oedd modd gwneud llawer o arian drwy droi tai mawr yn gartrefi am eu bod yn rhy fawr i’r teulu cyffredin. Erbyn hyn, fodd bynnag, gellir cynhyrchu mwy o arian drwy droi’r tai hyn yn fflatiau a’u rhoi’n ôl mewn daliadaeth breswyl. Mae hynny’n digwydd pan fo cynnydd ym mhrisiau tai. Yr ydym yn profi’r cynnydd mwyaf ym mhrisiau tai ers 13 neu 14 mlynedd. Pan ddaw’r cynnydd i ben, bydd y ffactor sy’n ysgogi’r broses honno’n darfod.

### **Amseroedd Aros Diweddaraf mewn Ysbytai Latest Hospital Waiting Times**

**C3 David Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am yr amseroedd aros diweddaraf mewn ysbytai? (OAQ22307)

**Q3 David Lloyd:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the latest hospital waiting times? (OAQ22307)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae’r nifer o gleifion sy’n aros dros 18 mis am driniaeth orthopedig a thros bedwar mis am lawdriniaeth ar gataractau wedi gostwng. Ar lawdriniaeth y galon, mae’r gwasanaeth wedi cyrraedd a chadw at y targed pwysig lle nad oes unrhyw glaf yn aros mwy na 12 mis. Mae’n symud tuag at sicrhau, o ddiwedd mis Mawrth 2003 ymlaen, na fydd rhaid i unrhyw glaf aros mwy na chwe mis am eu harchwiliad angiograffeg. Ar driniaeth orthopedig, mae’r nifer o bobl sy’n aros dros 18 mis wedi gostwng o 1,700 yn ystod y 12 mis diwethaf. Mae bron pob ymddiriedolaeth yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys Ymddiriedolaeth NHS Gwent, wedi cyflawni’r targed o sicrhau na fydd unrhywun yn gorfod aros dros 18 mis am driniaeth fewnol.

**The First Minister:** The number of patients waiting over 18 months for orthopaedic treatment and over four months for cataract surgery has decreased. On cardiac surgery, the service has reached the important target that no patient waits longer than 12 months and has sustained that success. It is on schedule to ensure that, from the end of March 2003, no patient will have to wait longer than six months for an angiography investigation. On orthopaedic treatment, the number of people waiting for during 18 months has reduced by 1,700 over the past 12 months. Almost all trusts in Wales, including Gwent NHS Trust, have met the key target of ensuring that no-one will have to wait more than 18 months for in-patient treatment.

**David Lloyd:** Mae tystiolaeth fod nyrsys yn gorfod dioddef dicter, llid a cherydd cynyddol gan gleifion a’u perthnasau oherwydd eu bod yn gorfod aros mor hir am driniaeth ar restrau aros diderfyn. Sut ydych yn ymateb i hyn?

**David Lloyd:** There is evidence that nurses have to face increasing criticism, resentment and rage from patients and their families because they have to wait so long for treatment on endless waiting lists. How do you react to this?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni chlywais am enghreifftiau o’r fath. Yn sicr mae’n annheg i bobl geryddu nyrsys neu feddygon ynghylch materion y tu allan i reolaeth staff y GIG. Mae bron pawb â phrofiad o driniaeth yn y GIG, yn bersonol neu drwy eu perthnasau, yn

**The First Minister:** I have not heard of such examples. It is certainly unfair of people to criticise nurses or doctors about matters that are outside the control of NHS staff. Almost everyone with experience of NHS treatment, either personally or through their relatives,



fodlon â'r driniaeth honno. Fodd bynnag, maent yn dweud nad oes digon o driniaeth ar gael. Er hynny, gwnaethpwyd nifer o welliannau i'r mathau o driniaeth a thechnoleg a ddefnyddir heddiw nad oedd ar gael pum mlynedd yn ôl. Mae pobl yn falch o'r safon y maent yn ei dderbyn.

**John Griffiths:** Given the substantial challenges facing Gwent NHS Trust in terms of reducing waiting times, will you join me in welcoming the commissioning of Professor Brian Edwards's report by Jane Hutt and in looking forward to early implementation of the report's recommendations?

**The First Minister:** Yes I will. I read the report last week. It is comprehensive, but simple to read and easy to understand, which I found helpful. Discussion of the challenges faced by Gwent NHS Trust and the best solutions to those challenges, in the short, medium and long term, with some observations on the similar problems of the orthopaedic waiting lists for joint replacements and so on in the Cardiff area—the south-east Wales problem as distinct from the Gwent problem. I understand that Jane Hutt, the Minister for Health and Social Services will, be presenting the Assembly Government's response to the next Health and Social Services Committee at the end of this month.

**Nick Bourne:** Glyn Jones, who lives in Powys, must wait six months longer than English patients at the same hospital to get his hip operation. He is not the only one, and it is because of Labour's dogma. His anger was summed up when he said that he paid as much as his English counterparts towards the health service, that it was a disgrace that he must wait six months longer because he lives in Wales and that he was being discriminated against. What do you say to Mr Jones, First Minister, and how do you justify the second-class treatment that patients are getting in Wales, compared with England?

**The First Minister:** There are many areas where they will receive faster treatment.

are pleased with that treatment. However, those individuals state that not enough treatment is available. Despite that, there has been a number of advances in the types of treatments and technologies used today, many of which were not available five years ago. People are satisfied by the standard of treatment that they receive.

**John Griffiths:** O gofio'r heriau mawr sy'n wynebu Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwent o ran lleihau amseroedd aros, a ymunwch â mi i groesawu'r ffaith bod Jane Hutt wedi comisiynu adroddiad gan yr Athro Brian Edwards, ac i edrych ymlaen at roi argymhellion yr adroddiad hwnnw ar waith yn fuan?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gwnaf. Darllenais yr adroddiad yr wythnos diwethaf. Mae'n gynhwysfawr, ond yn syml i'w ddarllen ac yn hawdd ei ddeall, a chefais hynny'n fuddiol. Ceir trafodaeth ar yr heriau y mae Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwent yn eu hwynebu a'r dulliau gorau o ateb yr heriau hynny, yn y tymor byr, canolig a hir, ynghyd â rhai sylwadau am y problemau tebyg sydd ynglŷn â'r rhestrau aros orthopedig ar gyfer gosod cymalau newydd ac yn y blaen yn ardal Caerdydd—y broblem yn y De-ddwyrain yn hytrach na'r broblem yng Ngwent. Deallaf y bydd Jane Hutt, y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, yn cyflwyno ymateb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i gyfarfod nesaf y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar ddiwedd y mis hwn.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae Glyn Jones, sy'n byw ym Mhowys, yn gorfod aros chwe mis yn hwy na chleifion o Loegr yn yr un ysbyty i gael llawdriniaeth ar ei glun. Nid ef yw'r unig un, ac mae hynny oherwydd dogma Llafur. Mynegodd ei ddieter yn gryno drwy ddweud ei fod yn talu cymaint â'i gymheiriaid yn Lloegr tuag at y gwasanaeth iechyd, ei bod yn warthus ei fod yn gorfod aros chwe mis yn hwy am ei fod yn byw yng Nghymru a bod gwahaniaethu'n digwydd yn ei erbyn. Beth a ddywedwch wrth Mr Jones, Brif Weinidog, a sut yr ydych yn cyfiawnhau'r driniaeth eilradd a gaiff cleifion yng Nghymru, o'u cymharu â'r rhai yn Lloegr?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae llawer o feysydd lle y cânt eu trin yn gyflymach. Mae

There are variations between different parts of the United Kingdom because of the differing commissioning priorities of the health authorities and local health boards. That is unavoidable. It will occur in England and it will occur between Scotland and England and between Wales and England. Sometimes it appears to benefit the patient one way on this side of the border and sometimes it does not. I would be grateful if you could pass the letter on to me, and I will consider whether there is any basis to your allegation.

**Nick Bourne:** I will pass on the details of that case. However, there are many others. If you have contrasting cases, I would be interested in seeing evidence of them because, as far as I can see, they are apocryphal. Even the Secretary of State for Wales, Peter Hain, has said that the waiting list record in Wales is not as good as it should be, and that is a Labour perspective. In England, NHS patients will be given a six-month deadline to be dealt with in hospital. If that does not work, they can go elsewhere, which is similar to a previous Welsh Conservative policy. However, we welcome sinners who come to repent, as it is a good policy. Will you announce a similar one for the people of Wales, or can we expect the same abysmal record and growing waiting list crisis that currently exist?

**The First Minister:** In my answer to Dai Lloyd's original question—which you obviously did not pick up—I listed the areas where improvements had been made and the key priority areas as regards cardiac surgery and long waits on orthopaedics. I agree with Peter Hain, and with everybody in Wales, that the long waiting lists in orthopaedics are unacceptable. They will be reduced. We are training additional medics and nurses, who will be able to carry out the expansion in the treatment capacity of the NHS. The increase in the medical school intake in Wales is currently 89 per cent, and it would be even higher if lecturers could be hired, but they cannot. Nobody can ensure a faster rate of increase than that. It never happened under the Conservatives, and, unfortunately, for doctors to be available now, they would have

amrywiaethau rhwng gwahanol rannau o'r Deyrnas Unedig oherwydd gwahanol flaenoriaethau comisiynu'r awdurdodau iechyd a'r byrddau iechyd lleol. Ni ellir osgoi hynny. Fe'i ceir yn Lloegr ac fe'i ceir rhwng yr Alban a Lloegr a rhwng Cymru a Lloegr. Weithiau mae'n ymddangos ei fod o fudd i'r claf mewn un modd yr ochr hon i'r ffin ac weithiau nid ydyw. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar os gallech drosglwyddo'r llythyr i mi, a gwnaf ystyried a oes unrhyw sail i'ch honiad.

**Nick Bourne:** Gwnaf drosglwyddo manylion yr achos hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer o rai eraill. Os oes gennych achosion sydd mewn gwrthgyferbyniad i hynny, byddai o ddiddordeb imi weld tystiolaeth ohonynt oherwydd, hyd y gwelaf fi, maent yn rhai apocryffaid. Mae hyd yn oed Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, Peter Hain, wedi dweud nad yw'r record o ran rhestrau aros yng Nghymru gystal ag y dylai fod, a safbwynt Llafur yw hwnnw. Yn Lloegr, rhoddir terfyn amser o chwe mis i gleifion y GIG gael sylw mewn ysbyty. Os nad yw hynny'n gweithio, cânt fynd i rywle arall, ac mae hynny'n debyg i bolisi blaenorol gan Geidwadwyr Cymru. Fodd bynnag, croesawn bechaduriaid sy'n dod i edifarhau, gan ei fod yn bolisi da. A gyhoeddych un tebyg ar gyfer pobl Cymru, neu a allwn ddisgwyl yr un record alaethus a'r un argyfwng cynyddol o ran y rhestrau aros ag a geir ar hyn o bryd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn fy ateb i gwestiwn gwreiddiol Dai Lloyd—na wnaethoch ei glywed, mae'n amlwg—rhestrais y meysydd lle y cafwyd gwelliannau a'r prif feysydd blaenoriaeth o ran llawfeddygaeth y galon a'r aros hir am driniaethau orthopedig. Cytunaf â Peter Hain, a phawb yng Nghymru, fod y rhestrau aros hir mewn orthopedeg yn annerbyniol. Fe'u gostyngir. Yr ydym yn hyfforddi meddygon a nyrsys ychwanegol, a fydd yn gallu cynyddu'r capasiti ar gyfer triniaethau yn y GIG. Mae'r cynnydd yn y nifer a dderbynnir i ysgolion meddygol yng Nghymru yn 89 y cant ar hyn o bryd, a byddai'n uwch byth os gellid cyflogi darlithwyr, ond ni ellir gwneud hynny. Ni all neb sicrhau cynnydd cyflymach na hynny. Ni ddigwyddodd erioed o dan y Ceidwadwyr ac, yn anffodus, er mwyn i feddygon fod ar gael

to have entered medical school when the Conservatives were in power. They did not expand medical education, and that is why we have the current pinch point. However, we are putting it right, as quickly as we can, by almost doubling the medical school intake in Wales. Unfortunately, it takes some six years to train a medic and 10 years to train a consultant. If you have not worked out that a doctor who is available now must have entered medical school when your party was in power, then your mathematics is even worse than I thought.

yn awr, byddai'n rhaid iddynt fod wedi mynd i ysgol feddygol pan oedd y Ceidwadwyr mewn grym. Ni wnaethant ehangu addysg feddygol, a dyna pam y mae gennym brinder ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn cywiro hynny, cyn gyflymed ag y gallwn, drwy bron ddyblu'r nifer a dderbynnir i ysgolion meddygol yng Nghymru. Gwaetha'r modd, cymer ryw chwe blynedd i hyfforddi meddyg a 10 mlynedd i hyfforddi ymgynghorydd. Os nad ydych wedi deall bod yn rhaid bod meddyg sydd ar gael yn awr wedi mynd i ysgol feddygol pan oedd eich plaid chi mewn grym, mae'ch mathemateg yn waeth nag yr oeddwn yn tybio.

### Cymunedau Gwledig Rural Communities

**C4 Cynog Dafis:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am sut mae polisiâu ei Lywodraeth wedi effeithio ar gymunedau gwledig yng Nghymru? (OAQ22323)

**Q4 Cynog Dafis:** Will the First Minister make a statement on how his Government's policies have impacted on rural communities in Wales? (OAQ22323)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym wedi cyflwyno ystod eang o fesurau a fydd yn helpu i hyrwyddo cymunedau gwledig cynaliadwy. Mae'r rhain yn cynnwys rhoi cymorth i amaethyddiaeth a phrosesu bwyd, a mesurau i geisio ehangu'r economi wledig a mynd i'r afael ag allgáu cymdeithasol yng nghefn gwlad. Yn ogystal, ymwelodd Andrew Davies, y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd, ag Aberteifi ddydd Iau diwethaf i gyhoeddi'r cynllun enfawr ar gyfer adfywio economi gorllewin Cymru, sef cylchoedd Aberteifi ac Abergwaun, a ddiodeffodd gymaint pan gaeodd ffatrioedd gwnio Dewhirst.

**The First Minister:** We have introduced a wide range of measures that will help to promote sustainable rural communities. These include support for agriculture and food processing, and measures to try to broaden the rural economy and tackle social exclusion in the countryside. In addition, Andrew Davies, the Minister for Economic Development, visited Cardigan last Thursday to announce the huge scheme to revitalise the west Wales economy in the Cardigan and Fishguard areas, which suffered so much as a result of the closure of the Dewhirst sewing factories.

**Cynog Dafis:** Ddwy flynedd yn ôl, rhoddodd Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru oddeutu £1 miliwn i geisio achub cwmni KTH Wales Cyf yn Llanidloes. Cyhoeddwyd heddiw y bydd y ffatri hwnnw'n cau, ac y bydd 250 o swyddi'n cael eu colli. Mae hynny'n ddifrifol i'r gymuned, ac mae hefyd yn adlewyrchiad difrifol ar bolisi datblygu economaidd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Gyfunol, a dylech gydnabod hynny. Sut ydych am ymateb i'r drychineb hon?

**Cynog Dafis:** Two years ago, the Welsh Development Agency gave around £1 million to try to save KTH Wales Ltd in Llanidloes. It was announced today that that factory is to close, leading to a loss of 250 jobs. That is sombre news for the community, and it is also a sombre reflection on the economic development policy of the Assembly Government and the UK Government, and you should acknowledge that. How will you respond to this disaster?

2.20 p.m.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Os ydych am gael eich

**The First Minister:** If you want to be taken

cymryd o ddifrif fel rhywun a chanddo syniadau synhwyrol am yr economi, dylech fod wedi croesawu'r ffaith ein bod wedi achub y cwmni hwn rhag cau ddwy flynedd yn ôl gan ddarparu £1 miliwn i ailwampio'r ffatri ac yn y blaen. Ar y pryd, yr oedd y ffatri yn cyflogi 120 o bobl. Cododd y ffigur hwn i 250 o bobl dros y ddwy flynedd diwethaf, ond, yn anffodus, mae Triplex Components Group Cyf yn awr yn dweud nad oes modd i'r ffatri barhau. Efallai ei fod wedi cynyddu'r nifer o weithwyr yn y ffatri yn rhy gyflym—nid wyf yn sicr, ond dyna un o'r damcaniaethau am yr hyn sydd wedi mynd o chwith. Fodd bynnag, nid yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn rhedeg ffatrioedd. Gallwn helpu, a bu inni helpu, ond, yn anffodus, ni arweiniodd hynny at ganlyniad terfynol da, wedi dwy flynedd o dyfiant. Ni ddywedais erioed y gallem ni, neu unrhywun arall, wahardd ffatrioedd rhag cau. Mae ffatrioedd yn methu, a phan ddigwydd hynny, nid ni sydd ar fai. Gwnaethom yr ymdrech i helpu'r ffatri hwn unwaith a bu inni lwyddo am ddwy flynedd, ond, yn anffodus, mae'r ffatri wedi methu yn awr.

**Richard Edwards:** Will you join me in welcoming the substantial package announced last week by the Minister for Economic Development to rejuvenate the north Pembrokeshire economy? Will you also join me in condemning the Jonahs of the apocalypse party whose principal joy is to spread bad news and undermine the Government's good work?

**The First Minister:** I also commend the drawing-up of the regeneration plan for the north Pembrokeshire and south Ceredigion coastal areas in partnership with the two local authorities concerned. The plan includes exciting projects, such as Theatr Mwldan in Cardigan, the Blaenannerch technology park in nearby Aberporth, and the proposal for the marina-based expansion at Fishguard. Some of these projects are underway, some are reasonably straightforward and others require further work before they can proceed. They are all part of the £60 million plan that Andrew Davies announced last Thursday, and which I saw for myself in part on a private visit on Friday. It demonstrates the Assembly Government's ability to respond to crises such as that which occurred when,

seriously as someone with sensible ideas on the economy, you should have welcomed the fact that, two years ago, we helped save this company from closure by providing £1 million to refurbish the factory and so on. At the time, the factory employed 120 people. That has risen to 250 people over the past two years, but, unfortunately, Triplex Components Group Ltd now says that there is no way that the factory can continue. It may have increased the number of workers in the factory too quickly—I am not sure, but that is one of the theories as to what went wrong. However, the Assembly Government does not run factories. We can help, and we did help, but, unfortunately, that did not lead to a desirable outcome, after two years of growth. I have never said that we, or anyone else, can prohibit factories from closing. Factories fail, and when they do, it is not our fault. We made the effort to help this factory once and we succeeded for two years, but, unfortunately, the factory has now failed.

**Richard Edwards:** A ymunwch â mi i groesawu'r pecyn sylweddol a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos diwethaf gan y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd ar gyfer adfywio economi gogledd Sir Benfro? A ymunwch â mi hefyd i gollfarnu proffwydi gwae plaid yr apocalyps sy'n cael eu pleser mwyaf o ledaenu newyddion drwg a thanseilio gwaith da'r Llywodraeth?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf hefyd yn cymeradwyo paratoi'r cynllun adfywio ar gyfer ardaloedd arfordir gogledd Sir Benfro a de Ceredigion mewn partneriaeth â'r ddau awdurdod lleol dan sylw. Mae'r cynllun yn cynnwys prosiectau cyffrous, fel Theatr Mwldan yn Aberteifi, parc technoleg Blaenannerch yn Aberporth gerllaw, a'r cynllun ehangu sy'n seiliedig ar y marina yn Abergwaun. Mae rhai o'r prosiectau hyn ar y gweill, mae rhai'n eithaf syml ac mae eraill yn gofyn gwaith pellach cyn y gallant fynd yn eu blaenau. Maent i gyd yn rhan o'r cynllun £60 miliwn a gyhoeddodd Andrew Davies ddydd Iau diwethaf, ac a welais dros of fy hun yn rhannol ar ymweliad preifaf ar ddydd Gwener. Dengys allu Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ymateb i argyfyngau fel yr un a

regrettably, Dewhurst abandoned clothing production in Wales.

ddigwyddodd, gwaetha'r modd, pan roddodd Dewhurst y gorau i gynhyrchu dillad yng Nghymru.

**'Cynllun i Gymru 2001'  
'Plan for Wales 2001'**

**C5 Elin Jones:** A oes gan y Prif Weinidog gynlluniau i adolygu'r targedau a nodwyd yn y ddogfen strategol 'Cynllun i Gymru 2001'? (OAQ22311)

**Q5 Elin Jones:** Does the First Minister have plans to review the targets in the 'Plan for Wales 2001' strategic document? (OAQ22311)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid oes gennyf gynlluniau helaeth ond yr ydym yn gwneud ambell newid bach drwy godi neu ostwng targedau. Fodd bynnag, mae'r egwyddorion yn parhau i fod yn berthnasol.

**The First Minister:** I do not have any wide-ranging plans but we do make a few minor changes in revising the targets upwards or downwards. However, the principles remain relevant.

**Elin Jones:** Mae'r ffigurau masnach diweddar ar gyfer y Deyrnas Gyfunol yn drychinebus, ac mae'n glir mai polisïau Gordon Brown sydd ar fai. Er bod 'Cynllun i Gymru 2001' yn dweud y byddwch yn cynyddu'r nifer o gwmnïau sydd yn allforio erbyn 2003-04, bu cwmp o 10 y cant mewn allforion o Gymru y llynedd, tra bu cynnydd o 1 y cant mewn allforion o'r Deyrnas Gyfunol yn gyffredinol. Dywedasoeh wrth Geraint Davies ychydig o wythnosau yn ôl nad oeddech wedi trafod gyda Gordon Brown effaith niweidiol ei bolisïau ar weithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru ers sbel. Pryd y bwriadwch drafod hyn gyda Gordon Brown er mwyn inni weld newid yn y gyfradd gyfnewid? Efallai nad ydych yn gyfrifol am redeg ffatrioedd, ond un o'ch cyfrifoldebau yw sefyll yn gadarn dros Gymru a gweithredu er lles Cymru.

**Elin Jones:** The latest UK trade figures are disastrous, and Gordon Brown's economic policies are clearly to blame. Although the 'Plan for Wales 2001' says that you will increase the number of companies exporting by 2003-04, there was a 10 per cent drop in exports from Wales last year, while there was an increase of 1 per cent in exports from the UK as a whole. You told Geraint Davies some weeks ago that you had not discussed with Gordon Brown the detrimental effect of his policies on manufacturing in Wales for some time. When do you intend to discuss this with Gordon Brown so that we can see a change in the exchange rate? You may not be responsible for running factories, but one of your responsibilities is to stand up for Wales and to take action for the benefit of Wales.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Os ystyriwch y patrwm y tu ôl i'r gostyngiad o 10 y cant yn ein allforion rhwng Medi 2001 a 2002, gwelwch faint o'r cwmp hwnnw y gellir ei egluro gan y cwmp mewn allforion o Aerospace Wales i'r Unol Daleithiau yn enwedig. Ein cwmni mwyaf o ran allforion yw Airbus yn etholaeth Tom Middlehurst, ac, yn anffodus, ar ôl digwyddiadau 11 Medi 2001, cafwyd gostyngiad enfawr mewn allforion awyrennau, gan gynnwys yr adenydd, o'r Gogledd i'r Unol Daleithiau. Mae'r ffaith bod hwn yn gwmni mor fawr yn effeithio ar y patrwm, a gallech weld hynny pe ystyriech y manylion y tu ôl i'r ffigurau.

**The First Minister:** If you consider the pattern behind the reduction of 10 per cent in our exports between September 2001 and 2002, you will see how much of it is explained by the fall in exports from Aerospace Wales to the USA in particular. Our largest exporting company is Airbus in Tom Middlehurst's constituency, and, unfortunately, after the events of 11 September 2001, there was a massive reduction in the export of aeroplanes, including the wings, from north Wales to the USA. The fact that this is such a large company affects the pattern, and you would see that if you considered the details behind

Derbyniaf y bu'r bunt yn rhy gryf o'i gymharu â'r ewro yn ystod y chwech neu saith mlynedd diwethaf, ond mae'n dechrau gwanychu. Nid yw wedi disgyn yn ddigon pell yn fy marn i, ond o leiaf bu'r ewro yn werth 66c ers dechrau'r flwyddyn, o'i gymharu â 58c ddwy flynedd yn ôl a 62c y llynedd. Hoffwn weld yr ewro yn dychwelyd i'w lefel lansiad o 70c. Gwelech wedyn gynnydd rhesymol mewn allforion o'r sector gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru.

**Alun Cairns:** The last six days have been appalling in terms of economic data published by independent sources. The First Minister mocked my question to the Minister for Economic Development last Wednesday on the Confederation of British Industry's report on output. Another CBI report has since stated that smaller firms are feeling the heat of the manufacturing downturn more than most. Today, KTH Wales Ltd announced 250 redundancies. I appreciate that surveys are predictions, but the announcement on KTH is a reality. Although we like the First Minister's jokes and like to see him heckle questioners now and again, if he cannot accept economic reality, what hope can he offer those 250 people who have lost their jobs? What plans does he have to review the economic strategy, because it clearly is not working after four years?

**The First Minister:** You must not misunderstand what I said to Cynog earlier. I regret enormously the loss of 250 jobs resulting from the closure of KTH in Llanidloes, particularly given our involvement in saving the factory two years ago. The factory has doubled in size since then, so, had we not become involved, there would not have been 250 jobs there in the first place—in fact, nobody would have been working there. Naturally, that makes one feel the blow, though not as much as those directly affected. However, to say that our intervention two years ago, which saved 120 jobs and led to the creation of a further 130 jobs, indicates that our economic policy is a failure is absurd. I presume that, as free-

the figures.

I accept that the pound has been too strong compared to the euro over the last six or seven years, but it is beginning to weaken. It has not fallen far enough in my view, but at least the euro has been worth 66p since the start of the year, compared to 58p two years ago and 62p last year. I would like to see the euro return to its launch level of 70p. You would then see a reasonable increase in exports from the manufacturing sector in Wales.

**Alun Cairns:** Bu'r chwe diwrnod diwethaf yn ofnadwy o ran y data economaidd a gyhoeddwyd gan ffynonellau annibynnol. Gwnaeth y Prif Weinidog hwyl am ben fy nghwestiwn i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd ddydd Mercher diwethaf ar adroddiad Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain ar allbwn. Ers hynny, nododd adroddiad arall gan y cydffederasiwn fod busnesau llai'n teimlo effaith y dirywiad mewn gweithgynhyrchu'n waeth nag eraill. Heddiw, cyhoeddodd KTH Wales Cyf ei fod yn diswyddo 250 o weithwyr. Sylweddolaf mai rhagfynegiadau yw arolygon, ond mae'r cyhoeddiad am KTH yn ffaith. Er ein bod yn hoff o gellwair y Prif Weinidog ac yn hoffi ei weld yn heclo cwestiynwyr o bryd i'w gilydd, os na all dderbyn y realiti economaidd, pa obaith y gall ei gynnig i'r 250 hynny a gollodd eu swyddi? Pa gynlluniau sydd ganddo i adolygu'r strategaeth economaidd, gan ei bod yn amlwg nad yw'n gweithio ar ôl pedair blynedd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Rhaid ichi beidio â chamddeall yr hyn a ddywedais wrth Cynog yn gynharach. Mae colli'r 250 o swyddi oherwydd cau KTH yn Llanidloes yn ofid mawr imi, yn enwedig gan inni fod yn gysylltiedig ag achub y ffatri ddwy flynedd yn ôl. Mae'r ffatri wedi dyblu yn ei maint ers hynny, felly, pe na fyddem wedi bod yn gysylltiedig, ni fuasai 250 o swyddi yn y lle cyntaf—mewn gwirionedd, ni fuasai neb yn gweithio yno. Wrth gwrs, mae hynny'n peri i rywun deimlo'r ergyd, ond nid cymaint â'r rhai a effeithir yn uniongyrchol. Fodd bynnag, afresymegol yw dweud bod ein hymyriad ddwy flynedd yn ôl, a achubodd 120 o swyddi ac a arweiniodd at greu 130 o swyddi ychwanegol, yn dangos bod ein polisi

market advocates, the Conservatives would not have intervened in the first place. Therefore, the factory would have gone broke two years ago and those 250 people would not have been employed there to be made redundant. You mentioned that I occasionally make fun of your tendency to leap like some demented vulture onto any bad news and play it up for all its worth. You referred to one CBI survey, which appeared in two halves. I have previously said that I never believe anything that comes through from just one survey, and I have mentioned the four successive surveys that showed a reasonably respectable pattern whereby Wales was the best, or joint best, performing part of the UK. Those surveys were the Reed survey, the Manpower survey, the Purchasing Managers' Index report and a fourth whose name I forget. When four surveys say the same thing, then I start to take notice. I agree with you that the CBI survey was bad, but it was just one survey. You called it two surveys, but it was one survey in two parts. That further illustrates your vulture-like tendency.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. We are not here to discuss birds of prey.

**The First Minister:** You cannot proclaim the apocalypse every six days. You must reserve the description of bad news for what really is bad news. You, however, are always the same; every week is the apocalypse for you, Alun.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Can we bring you back to the real world, First Minister? I remember your strictures when I questioned you last week on Education and Learning Wales's financial difficulties. You told me that it was a matter for the Audit Committee and had nothing to do with ministerial responsibility. Since then, I have discovered that the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning told the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee in May 2002 that an investigation was being set up into those irregularities and that she would make a statement about them. That is ministerial responsibility. Today, we

economiaidd yn fethiant. Yr wyf yn cymryd, fel rhai sy'n dadlau dros farchnad rydd, na fyddai'r Ceidwadwyr wedi ymyrryd yn y lle cyntaf. Felly, byddai'r ffatri wedi mynd i'r wal ddwy flynedd yn ôl ac ni fyddai'r 250 hynny wedi'u cyflogi yno fel y gellid eu diswyddo. Gwnaethoch sôn fy mod weithiau'n gwneud hwyl am ben eich tuedd i neidio fel rhyw fwltur gwallgof ar unrhyw newyddion drwg a gwneud môr a mynydd ohono hyd y gellir. Gwnaethoch gyfeirio at un arolwg gan Gydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain, a ymddangosodd mewn dau hanner. Yr wyf wedi dweud o'r blaen nad wyf byth yn credu dim a ddaw o un arolwg yn unig, ac yr wyf wedi sôn am y pedwar arolwg dilynol a ddangosodd batrwm gweddol dderbyniol a olygai mai Cymru oedd y rhan o'r DU a oedd yn perfformio orau neu'n gydorau. Yr arolygon hynny oedd arolwg Reed, arolwg Manpower, adroddiad y Purchasing Managers' Index a phedwerydd nad wyf yn cofio ei enw. Pan ddywed pedwar arolwg yr un peth, yna dechreuaf gymryd sylw. Cytunaf â chi fod arolwg y cydffederasiwn yn wael, ond un arolwg oedd hwnnw. Gwnaethoch chi ei alw'n ddau arolwg, ond un arolwg mewn dwy ran ydoedd. Mae hynny'n dangos y tuedd fwlturaidd sydd ynoch ymhellach.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid ydym yma i drafod adar ysglyfaethus.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni chewch ddatgan apocalyps bob chwe diwrnod. Rhaid ichi gadw'r disgrifiad o newyddion drwg ar gyfer yr hyn sy'n newyddion drwg mewn gwirionedd. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych yr un fath bob amser; mae pob wythnos yn apocalyps yn eich golwg chi, Alun.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** A gawn ddod â chi'n ôl i'r byd go-iawn, Brif Weinidog? Cofiaf eich beirniadaeth pan y'ch holais yr wythnos diwethaf am anawsterau ariannol Dysgu ac Addysg Cymru. Dywedasoeh wrthyf mai mater i'r Pwyllgor Archwilio ydoedd ac nad oedd a wnelo ef â chyfrifoldeb gweinidogol. Ers hynny, darganfyddais fod y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes wedi dweud wrth y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ym Mai 2002 fod ymchwiliad yn cael ei sefydlu mewn cysylltiad â'r afreoleidd-dra hwnnw ac y gwnâi ddatganiad yn ei gylch. Dyna gyfrifoldeb gweinidogol. Heddiw,

learn of further difficulties with another company that was given £4 million by ELWa and forced to pay half that money back, plus interest, because it had not used it for the purpose for which it was given. This is a matter for you, First Minister: we are talking about public money. Will you accept responsibility and that it was a major mistake for you to decide that ELWa should not have a shadow year? Why do you not apologise for that?

**The First Minister:** Let me give you a lesson about the real world: concentrate on what matters. Education and Learning Wales has presided over a 40 per cent increase in the number of apprentices in training in Wales. Are you interested, Ieuan? Is anybody in Plaid Cymru interested in the real world? What does it think about the 40 per cent increase in the number of apprentices in training in Wales, which has been sponsored by ELWa? I can see that the Plaid Cymru Members are not interested at all; they are looking down in embarrassment. They do not want to know about the success story that ELWa has presided over. If you are not interested, the people of Wales are.

2.30 p.m.

Regarding the repayment of sums by the Avanti group and the Pop Factory, all that has happened is that Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council changed its mind about how it was going to redevelop the former Pioneer supermarket, next to the Pop Factory. The leader of that council is sitting three yards away from you, and I am sure that she could have explained this to you. Dafydd Wigley could also have told you what the Audit Committee is responsible for. As a result of the council's decision, it was not possible to proceed with the idea of putting the music café into the former Pioneer store. Therefore, the money allocated for that purpose has not been spent. Arrangements are now being made by the Pop Factory and ELWa to repay the money. It is as simple as that.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** The question that you must answer, First Minister, is why £4 million was given up front to the Avanti

cawsom wybod am anawsterau pellach gyda chwmmni arall y rhoddodd ELWa £4 miliwn iddo ac a orfodwyd i dalu hanner yr arian hwnnw'n ôl, ynghyd â llog, am nad oedd wedi'i ddefnyddio i'r diben arfaethedig. Mae hyn yn fater i chi, Brif Weinidog: yr ydym yn sôn am arian cyhoeddus. A wnewch dderbyn cyfrifoldeb a derbyn mai camgymeriad mawr ar eich rhan oedd penderfynu na ddylai ELWa gael blwyddyn gysgodol? Pam nad ymddiheurwch am hynny?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gadewch imi roi gwrs i chi am y byd go-iawn: canolbwyntiwrch ar yr hyn sy'n cyfrif. Mae Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru wedi arolygu cynnydd o 40 y cant yn nifer y prentisiaid sy'n derbyn hyfforddiant yng Nghymru. A yw hynny o ddiddordeb i chi, Ieuan? A oes rhywun ym Mhlaid Cymru sy'n ymddiddori yn y byd go-iawn? Beth yw ei barn am y 40 y cant o gynnydd yn nifer y prentisiaid sy'n derbyn hyfforddiant yng Nghymru, a noddwyd gan ELWa? Gallaf weld nad yw hynny o ddiddordeb o gwbl i Aelodau Plaid Cymru; maent yn edrych i lawr gan deimlo'n chwithig. Nid ydynt am wybod am y llwyddiant o dan law ELWa. Os nad oes gennych chi ddiddordeb, mae gan bobl Cymru.

Ynghylch ad-dalu'r arian gan grŵp Avanti a'r Ffatri Bop, y cwbl a ddigwyddodd oedd bod Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf wedi ailfeddwl am y modd yr oedd am ailddatblygu cyn archfarchnad Pioneer, sydd wrth ochr y Ffatri Bop. Mae arweinydd y cyngor hwnnw'n eistedd deirllath oddi wrthy, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y gallai fod wedi egluro hyn i chi. Byddai Dafydd Wigley yntau wedi gallu dweud wrthy am yr hyn y mae'r Pwyllgor Archwilio yn gyfrifol amdano. O ganlyniad i benderfyniad y cyngor, nid oedd modd mynd ymlaen â'r syniad o roi'r caffi cerddoriaeth yng nghyn siop Pioneer. Gan hynny, ni wariwyd yr arian a neilltuwyd i'r pwrpas hwnnw. Gwneir trefniadau'n awr gan y Ffatri Bop ac ELWa i ad-dalu'r arian. Mae cyn symled â hynny.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Y cwestiwn y mae'n rhaid i chi ei ateb, Brif Weinidog, yw pam y rhoddwyd £4 miliwn ymlaen llaw i grŵp



group. That money was not used for a full year; it was stuck in the bank account. Do you call that financial responsibility? Are you saying that the use of public money is not a matter for your Government? The people of Wales will have a different verdict on 1 May.

**The First Minister:** If you are alleging that there has been ministerial involvement in a misuse of public money, Ieuan, you better say so and choose your words carefully. You had also better explain it to the Presiding Officer, because I find that a bizarre smear.

There are procedures for ensuring that money is paid out for proper purposes and is repaid. It is a matter for the chief executive of ELWa, as the accounting officer, to ensure that the money is used properly. The repayment that I have just described to you—you have not responded to that—will include interest where appropriate.

ELWa gave out money for a particular purpose, and the Avanti group was not able to use it for that purpose because the council changed its mind about what was to happen to the property. Previously the group had been able to proceed on the basis that the former Pioneer supermarket would be available for this project. Rhondda Cynon Taf may well have had good reasons for changing its mind; I am not criticising Pauline Jarman or her council. However, I am criticising your attempt at a smear in the Chamber and the implication that something naughty is going on. Money is being repaid to ELWa because it was not possible to use it for the designated scheme due to factors entirely outside the control of ELWa and the Avanti group. They simply could not proceed with the scheme, and as a result the money is being paid back.

**Pauline Jarman:** First Minister, will you apologise for accusing a local authority of having a part to play in ELWa funding and the retention of money by companies it sought to fund? You know that there is no truth in that. The local authority had no part to play in the granting of £4 million to the Avanti group. I would like you to apologise publicly. You are quick enough to make

Avanti. Ni ddefnyddiwyd yr arian hwnnw am flwyddyn gyfan; yr oedd yn sownd yn y cyfrif banc. Ai cyfrifoldeb ariannol y galwch hynny? A ydych yn dweud nad yw'r defnydd o arian cyhoeddus yn fater i'ch Llywodraeth? Bydd gan bobl Cymru ddyfarniad gwahanol ar 1 Mai.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Os ydych yn honni bod cysylltiad gweinidogol â chamddefnyddio arian cyhoeddus, Ieuan, gwell ichi ddweud hynny a dewis eich geiriau'n ofalus. Byddai'n well ichi ei egluro i'r Llywydd hefyd, oherwydd yr wyf yn cael hynny'n sarhad rhyfedd.

Mae gweithdrefnau i sicrhau y caiff arian ei dalu ar gyfer dibenion priodol ac y caiff ei ad-dalu. Mae'n fater i brif weithredwr ELWa, fel y swyddog cyfrifo, sicrhau y caiff yr arian ei ddefnyddio'n briodol. Bydd yr ad-daliad yr wyf newydd ei ddisgrifio i chi—nid ydych wedi ymateb i hynny—yn cynnwys llog lle y bo'n briodol.

Rhoddodd ELWa arian ar gyfer pwrpas penodol, ac nid oedd grŵp Avanti yn gallu ei ddefnyddio i'r pwrpas hwnnw am fod y cyngor wedi ailfeddwl ynghylch yr hyn a oedd i ddigwydd i'r eiddo. Cyn hynny yr oedd y grŵp wedi gallu mynd ymlaen gan ddeall y byddai cyn archfarchnad Pioneer ar gael ar gyfer y prosiect hwn. Mae'n ddigon posibl bod rhesymau da gan Rhondda Cynon Taf dros ailfeddwl; nid wyf yn beirniadu Pauline Jarman na'i chyngor. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn beirniadu'ch ymgais i bardduo yn y Siambr a'r awgrym bod rhywbeth drwg yn digwydd. Ad-delir arian i ELWa am nad oedd modd ei ddefnyddio ar gyfer y cynllun a ddynodwyd oherwydd ffactorau a oedd yn gyfan gwbl y tu hwnt i reolaeth ELWa a grŵp Avanti. Ni allent fynd ymlaen â'r cynllun, ac o ganlyniad i hynny ad-delir yr arian.

**Pauline Jarman:** Brif Weinidog, a wnewch ymddiheuro am gyhuddo awdurdod lleol o fod â rhan yn y cyllido gan ELWa a chadw arian gan gwmnïau y ceisiodd eu cyllido? Gwyddoch nad oes gwir yn hynny. Nid oedd gan yr awdurdod lleol unrhyw ran i'w chwarae wrth roi £4 miliwn i grŵp Avanti. Dymunaf ichi ymddiheuro'n gyhoeddus. Yr ydych yn ddigon parod i wneud cyhuddiadau,

allegations, but you know the truth. I declare an interest as leader of Rhondda Cynon Taf council.

**The First Minister:** I am sorry, Pauline, but if ever there were a demonstration of someone being cut to the quick, that was it. I did not make any allegation of wrongdoing on the part of Rhondda Cynon Taf. What I said was that factors outside the control of the Avanti group and ELWa, involving a decision by Rhondda Cynon Taf on the redevelopment of the property next to the Pop Factory, made it impossible for the original scheme to proceed. As a result, a large part of the money is having—*[Interruption.]*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The First Minister is replying to a supplementary question.

ond gwyddoch y gwir. Datganaf fuddiant fel arweinydd cyngor Rhondda Cynon Taf.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Pauline, ond oes bu erioed amlygiad o rywun yn cael ei bigo i'r byw, hwnnw oedd. Ni wneuthum unrhyw gyhuddiad o ddrwgweithredu gan Rhondda Cynon Taf. Yr hyn a ddywedais oedd bod ffactorau y tu hwnt i reolaeth grŵp Avanti ac ELWa, a oedd yn ymwneud â phenderfyniad gan Rhondda Cynon Taf ynghylch ailddatblygu'r eiddo nesaf at y Ffatri Bop, wedi peri ei bod yn amhosibl i'r cynllun gwreiddiol fynd yn ei flaen. O ganlyniad i hynny, mae rhan fawr o'r arian yn cael—*[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn ateb cwestiwn atodol.

#### **Adroddiad DEFRA DEFRA Report**

**Q6 Richard Edwards:** When was the recent Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs report on GM contamination made available to the Welsh Assembly Government? (OAQ22304)

**The First Minister:** It was made available on 29 August 2002.

**Richard Edwards:** While I accept that a report of 119 pages can easily get lost in the middle of a pile of documents, is it not the case that the report shows conclusively that contamination from genetically-modified crops cannot be contained; that separation distances are a nonsense; that cross-contamination threatens the integrity of conventional and organic farming alike; and that had the National Institute of Agricultural Botany's report been shown to Members before 18 December 2002, the draft regulations that were carried on that day might have been rejected because they were not restrictive enough? Many of us expressed grave reservations at that time, even without the benefit of the report. Would you not agree, therefore, that the regulations should now be brought back to the Assembly for further debate and tightening up?

**C6 Richard Edwards:** Pryd y cafodd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gopi o adroddiad Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig ar halogi cynydau oherwydd addasu genetig? (OAQ22304)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Fe'i darparwyd ar 29 Awst 2002.

**Richard Edwards:** Er fy mod yn derbyn ei bod yn hawdd i adroddiad o 119 tudalen fynd ar goll yng nghanol pentwr o ddogfennau, onid yw'n wir bod yr adroddiad yn profi'n derfynol na ellir atal halogi gan gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig; mai lol yw pellteroedd gwahanu; bod croeshalogi'n bygwth uniondeb ffermio confensiynol a ffermio organig fel ei gilydd; a phe byddai adroddiad Sefydliad Cenedlaethol Botaneg Amaethyddol wedi'i ddangos i Aelodau cyn 18 Rhagfyr 2002, y gallai'r rheoliadau drafft a dderbyniwyd ar y diwrnod hwnnw fod wedi'u gwrthod am nad oeddent yn ddigon cyfyngiadol? Gwnaeth llawer ohonom fynegi amheuon mawr ar y pryd, hyd yn oed heb y fantais o weld yr adroddiad. Oni fyddech yn cytuno, felly, y dylid dod â'r rheoliadau'n ôl i'r Cynulliad yn awr i'w trafod a'u tynhau ymhellach?

**The First Minister:** That is a legal and procedural issue on which I do not feel qualified to comment. Provided that you could translate the conclusions of the NIAB report—which went to the Advisory Committee on Releases to the Environment on 5 September—to the situation in Wales, it would have fortified the views expressed here on 18 December. There is a question as to whether, given that the report pointed in the same direction, it would have altered those views. It might have strengthened them. However, that depends on what view people took of whether you can translate the experience with oilseed rape, of which we have little in Wales, to other crops of which we have more experience. I do not feel qualified to answer on that. You may want to take this up as a matter of procedure, in terms of guessing what would have happened if the report had been available on 18 December and whether there is a remedy available. However, I will discuss this matter with Carwyn Jones.

**William Graham:** Considering the chronology of the handling of the NIAB report I expect that you share my gratitude to the *Independent on Sunday*, *The Western Mail* and to GM Free Cymru for bringing this matter to public attention, otherwise your deputy might have continued in blissful ignorance. What arrangements have you made to ensure that this sort of event does not occur again?

**The First Minister:** Everyone has been sensitised to the matter of ensuring that Ministers' attentions are drawn to documents on the basis of their possible political sensitivity, even if their agricultural sensitivity is judged to be minor in Wales. I doubt that there is a single official working for the Assembly Government who has not drawn that conclusion from this unhappy story.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** O ystyried nad oedd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn ymwybodol iddo dderbyn yr adroddiad ym mis Awst, nad oedd yn ymwybodol y trafodwyd ef gan ACRE ym Medi ac yn Hydref, ac nad oedd yn ymwybodol ohono ar 18 Rhagfyr, a allwch esbonio pam yr ysgrifennodd at GM Free Cymru i ddweud ei fod yn ymwybodol o gasgliadau'r adroddiad ym mis Mai y

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hwnnw'n fater cyfreithiol a threfniadol na themlaf fy mod yn gymwys i wneud sylw arno. Os gellid cymhwyso casgliadau adroddiad Sefydliad Cenedlaethol Botaneg Amaethyddol—a aeth gerbron y Pwyllgor Ymgynghorol ar Ollyngiadau i'r Amgylchedd ar 5 Medi—at y sefyllfa yng Nghymru, byddai wedi ategu'r barnau a fynegwyd yma ar 18 Rhagfyr. Mae amheuaeth ynghylch a fyddai'r adroddiad wedi newid y barnau hynny, gan ei fod yn pwyntio i'r un cyfeiriad. Gallai fod wedi'u hategu. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny'n dibynnu ar farn pobl o ran a ellid cymhwyso'r profiad gyda rēp had olew, nad oes gennym fawr ohoni yng Nghymru, at gnydau eraill y mae gennym fwy o brofiad ohonynt. Ni themlaf fy mod yn gymwys i roi ateb ar hynny. Efallai y byddwch am godi hyn fel mater o drefniadaeth, o ran dyfalu beth a fyddai wedi digwydd pe buasai'r adroddiad ar gael ar 18 Rhagfyr ac a oes meddyginiaeth ar gael. Fodd bynnag, gwnaf drafod y mater hwn gyda Carwyn Jones.

**William Graham:** O ystyried y gronoleg wrth drafod adroddiad Sefydliad Cenedlaethol Botaneg Amaethyddol, yr wyf yn cymryd eich bod yn ddiolchgar fel minnau i'r *Independent on Sunday*, *The Western Mail* ac i GM Free Cymru am ddod â'r mater hwn i sylw'r cyhoedd, neu fel arall gallai'ch dirprwy fod wedi dilyn ei hynt yn anwybodus braf. Pa drefniadau a wnaethoch i sicrhau na cheir digwyddiad o'r fath eto?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae pawb yn fwy effro i'r mater o sicrhau bod dogfennau a allai fod yn wleidyddol sensitif yn cael eu dwyn i sylw Gweinidogion, hyd yn oed os bernir mai prin yw eu sensitifrwydd o ran amaethyddiaeth yng Nghymru. Mae'n amheus gennyf a oes yr un swyddog sy'n gweithio i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad na ddaeth i'r casgliad hwnnw yn sgîl yr hanes anffodus hwn.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Given that the Deputy First Minister was not aware that he had received the report in August, was not aware that it had been discussed by ACRE in September and in October, and was not aware of it on 18 December, can you explain why he wrote to GM Free Cymru to say that he was aware of the report's conclusions in May of last year?

llynedd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Credaf fod GM Free Cymru ei hunan wedi tynnu'r un casgliad, oherwydd cyhoeddwyd yr ymchwil ar wefan ryw 18 mis yn ôl, ym mis Mai. Yr oedd y casgliadau yno i'w gweld; nid oeddynt ar ffurf adroddiad penodol ond arweinia'r ddau at yr un casgliad yn y diwedd. Rhaid i chi geisio dyfalu beth fyddai wedi digwydd yn y ddadl ar 18 Rhagfyr pe baem wedi derbyn yr adroddiad hwn yn swyddogol drwy beirianwaith DEFRA ac ACRE: a fyddai wedi gwneud gwahaniaeth ynteu a fyddai wedi gwneud dim mwy na chryfhau'r duedd yr oeddem oll yn anelu tuag ato beth bynnag?

**The First Minister:** I think that GM Free Cymru came to the same conclusion, because the research was published on a website some 18 months ago, in May. The conclusions were there for all to see; they were not in the form of a specific report, but they lead to the same conclusion. You have to try to second guess what would have happened in the debate on 18 December had we officially received that report through DEFRA and ACRE mechanisms: would it have made a difference or would it just have strengthened the tendency towards which we were all leaning anyway?

### Adroddiad Victoria Climbié Victoria Climbié Report

**Q7 Gwenda Thomas:** What discussions has the First Minister had with the Secretary of State for Wales in relation to the implications for Wales of the Victoria Climbié report? (OAQ22325)

**C7 Gwenda Thomas:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cael gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru mewn perthynas â goblygiadau adroddiad Victoria Climbié i Gymru? (OAQ22325)

**The First Minister:** I have not had any discussions with the Secretary of State on this matter. However, there was a discussion on some of the significant issues raised by the Laming inquiry report on this appalling and tragic case in the meeting of the Cabinet sub-committee for children and young people last week. The Assembly Government will issue a response as soon as possible.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni chefais unrhyw drafodaethau gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol ar y mater hwn. Fodd bynnag, bu trafodaeth ar rai o'r materion pwysig a godwyd gan adroddiad ymchwiliad Laming ar yr achos brawychus a thrychinebus hwn yn y cyfarfod o is-bwyllgor y Cabinet ar gyfer plant a phobl ifanc yr wythnos diwethaf. Bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cyhoeddi ymateb mor fuan ag y bo modd.

**Gwenda Thomas:** If accepted, recommendation 6 of the Victoria Climbié report will mean that every local authority with responsibility for providing social services will have to establish a committee for children and families, comprising council members and lay people. It will have to ensure that services for children and families are co-ordinated properly and that the inter-agency dimension of the work is managed effectively. Do you agree that the Assembly would be well advised to require local authorities in Wales to take that action in any case?

**Gwenda Thomas:** Os caiff ei dderbyn, bydd argymhelliad 6 yn adroddiad Victoria Climbié yn golygu y bydd pob awdurdod lleol sy'n gyfrifol am ddarparu gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn gorfod sefydlu pwyllgor ar gyfer plant a theuluoedd, a fydd yn cynnwys aelodau o'r cyngor a llygwyr. Bydd yn gorfod sicrhau y caiff gwasanaethau ar gyfer plant a theuluoedd eu cydlynu'n briodol ac y ceir rheolaeth effeithiol ar yr agwedd ryngasiantaethol ar y gwaith. A greddwch y byddai'n ddoeth i'r Cynulliad fynnu bod awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru'n cymryd y camau hynny beth bynnag?

**The First Minister:** There are many recommendations in the Laming report and there has already been a partial response to

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae llawer o argymhellion yn adroddiad Laming a chafwyd ymateb rhannol i rai ohonynt eisoes.

some of them. For example, the Children's Commissioner for Wales was asked whether he thought it satisfactory for child protection work in England to be centralised into a national, England-only agency with a chief executive who would be, in effect, the children's commissioner for England. He did not think that it was satisfactory because it would not be as independent as his office. Many issues arise from the report with regard to child protection and member involvement. We should return to this when we give our considered response; I am sure that Gwenda and the committee will take a great deal of interest in that.

**Jonathan Morgan:** This case highlighted real failings in social services and other departments, in taking note of the problems that had occurred in Victoria's case. Do we not now need to see real improvements in the provision of social services by Cardiff County Council? A recent report highlighted that children's services were not reviewing cases often enough and that young children had been left in high-risk environments. When will the Government be able to update the Assembly as to what progress the authority has made?

2.40 p.m.

**The First Minister:** You will know what happens when this procedure is set in motion in the case of a joint inquiry report by the Social Services Inspectorate for Wales and the Audit Commission. There was a fairly damning report on Cardiff, as was the case with Torfaen three years ago. A procedure is set in motion that involves the Minister for Health and Social Services having a face-to-face meeting with the chief executive and leader of the council. One of those meetings has already taken place and another is due to be held fairly soon.

Er enghraifft, gofynnwyd i Gomisiynydd Plant Cymru a oedd yn credu ei bod yn briodol canoli gwaith amddiffyn plant yn Lloegr mewn asiantaeth genedlaethol, i Loegr yn unig, gyda phrif weithredwr a fyddai, i bob pwrpas, yn gomisiynydd plant i Loegr. Ni chredai y byddai'n foddhaol gan na fyddai mor annibynnol â'i swyddfa ef. Mae llawer o faterion yn codi o'r adroddiad mewn cysylltiad ag amddiffyn plant a'r rhan a gymerir gan aelodau. Dylem fynd yn ôl at hyn pan roddwn ein hymateb ystyriol; yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Gwenda a'r pwyllgor yn ymddiddori'n fawr yn hynny.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Gwnaeth yr achos hwn dynnu sylw at wendidau gwirioneddol mewn gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ac adrannau eraill, o ran sylwi ar y problemau a oedd wedi codi yn achos Victoria. Onid oes angen bellach inni weld gwelliannau gwirioneddol yn y ddarpariaeth o wasanaethau cymdeithasol gan Gyngor Sir Caerdydd? Pwysleisiwyd mewn adroddiad diweddar nad oedd gwasanaethau plant yn adolygu achosion yn ddigon aml a bod plant ifanc wedi'u gadael mewn amgylcheddau lle'r oedd risg mawr. Pa bryd y bydd y Llywodraeth yn gallu rhoi gwybod i'r Cynulliad am y cynnydd a wnaeth yr awdurdod?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gwyddoch beth sy'n digwydd pan roddir y weithdrefn hon ar waith yn achos adroddiad ar ymchwiliad ar y cyd gan yr Arolygiaeth Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru a'r Comisiwn Archwilio. Cafwyd adroddiad eithaf damniol ar Gaerdydd, fel y cafwyd yn achos Tor-faen dair blynedd yn ôl. Rhoddir gweithdrefn ar waith sy'n golygu bod y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn cael cyfarfod wyneb yn wyneb â phrif weithredwr ac arweinydd y cyngor. Mae un o'r cyfarfodydd hynny wedi bod eisoes ac mae un arall i'w gynnal yn eithaf buan.

### **Dibynadwyedd y System Reilffyrdd Reliability of the Rail System**

**Q8 Peter Rogers:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the reliability of the rail

**C8 Peter Rogers:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ba mor ddibynadwy yw'r

system in Wales? (OAQ22336)

**The First Minister:** Train operator performance figures and commentary are published in the Strategic Rail Authority's six monthly publication *On Track*—essential reading for everyone. The latest published data for Wales and Borders Trains as at 30 September 2002 shows 80.1 per cent of trains arriving on time. I believe that 'on time' in that context means within 10 minutes of the published time.

**Peter Rogers:** We aim to reduce traffic congestion on our roads and make rail a more attractive alternative form of transport. Do you not agree that more funding from the transport grant settlement should be allocated to our railways?

**The First Minister:** I am not sure what more we can do; we are pumping a lot of additional money into the rail system. We are doing that with regard to the Wales and borders franchise, which will ensure an all-Wales franchise with the exception of the two mainline services. We are also investing in improvements to the Valley lines in the Cynon valley and the Llynfi valley, with increased frequency of services. There are also the projects to reopen the Vale of Glamorgan line and the Ebbw valley line to passenger services. We have also been working closely with the SRA to restore Sunday services to the central Wales line.

**Christine Chapman:** You mentioned the agreement with the SRA to secure half-hourly services between Cardiff and Aberdare. Do you agree that that has been much anticipated and is vital in order to open up jobs and amenities in Cardiff to Valley communities? I thank you, First Minister, and Sue Essex, for your persistence in ensuring that this project is delivered for the people of Cynon valley.

**The First Minister:** You are right to draw the Assembly's attention to the problems that might have arisen, but which fortunately will

system reilffyrdd yng Nghymru? (OAQ22336)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cyhoeddir ffigurau perfformiad a sylwebaeth am y gweithredwyr trenau yng nghyhoeddiad chwemisol yr Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol—*On Track*—deunydd darllen hanfodol i bawb. Mae'r data diweddaraf a gyhoeddwyd ar gyfer Wales and Borders Trains fel yr oedd ar 30 Medi 2002 yn dangos bod 80.1 y cant o'r trenau wedi cyrraedd yn brydlon. Credaf fod 'prydlon' yn y cyd-destun hwnnw'n golygu o fewn 10 munud i'r amser a gyhoeddwyd.

**Peter Rogers:** Yr ydym yn ceisio lleihau tagfeydd traffig ar ein ffyrdd a pheri i reilffyrdd fod yn ddewis mwy deniadol fel trafndiaeth. Onid ydych yn cytuno y dylid dyrannu mwy o gyllid o'r setliad grant trafndiaeth i'n rheilffyrdd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn siŵr beth y gallwn ei wneud yn ychwaneg; yr ydym yn pwmpio llawer mwy o arian ychwanegol i'r system reilffyrdd. Yr ydym yn gwneud hynny mewn cysylltiad â masnachfaint Cymru a'r gororau, a fydd yn sicrhau masnachfaint i Gymru gyfan heblaw'r gwasanaethau ar y ddwy brif linell. Yr ydym hefyd yn buddsoddi mewn gwelliannau yn rheilffyrdd y Cymoedd yng nghwm Cynon a chwm Llynfi, gyda gwasanaethau amlach. Ceir prosiectau hefyd i ailagor llinell Bro Morgannwg a llinell glyn Ebwy ar gyfer gwasanaethau teithwyr. Buom yn cydweithio'n agos hefyd â'r Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol i adfer gwasanaethau ar y Sul ar linell y Canolbarth.

**Christine Chapman:** Gwnaethoch sôn am y cytundeb gyda'r Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol i sicrhau gwasanaethau bob hanner awr rhwng Caerdydd ac Aberdâr. A ydych yn cytuno bod disgwyl mawr wedi bod am hynny a'i fod yn hollbwysig er mwyn agor swyddi a mwynderau yng Nghaerdydd i gymunedau yn y Cymoedd? Diolchaf i chi, Brif Weinidog, ac i Sue Essex, am eich dyfalbarhad wrth sicrhau y cyflawnir y prosiect hwn ar gyfer pobl cwm Cynon.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n briodol ichi dynnu sylw'r Cynulliad at y problemau a allai fod wedi codi, ond na fyddant yn codi bellach, yn

not now arise, with regard to our spending around £10 million on the Mountain Ash passing loop, which permits trains to pass each other inside the Cynon valley and to manoeuvre around freight trains. Without that loop we would have been restricted to hourly services from Aberdare to Cardiff for many years to come. That obviously affects commuting. The service has been a great success and it was essential to progress to a half-hourly service. Had we spent the money on the capital and then not got the revenue funding, that would not have been good. Fortunately, it now looks as though the problem is solved.

ffodus, mewn cysylltiad â'r gwariant o tua £10 miliwn gennym ar linell osgoi Aberpennar, sy'n caniatáu i drenau fynd heibio i'w gilydd o fewn cwm Cynon ac i symud o gwmpas trenau nwyddau. Heb gael y llinell osgoi honno byddem wedi ein cyfyngu i wasanaethau bob awr o Aberdâr i Gaerdydd am flynyddoedd lawer i ddod. Mae'n amlwg bod hynny'n effeithio ar gymudo. Bu'r gwasanaeth yn llwyddiant mawr ac yr oedd yn hollbwysig er mwyn symud ymlaen at wasanaeth pob hanner awr. Pe byddem wedi gwario'r arian ar y cyfalaf a heb gael y cyllid refeniw wedyn, ni fyddai hynny wedi bod yn dda. Yn ffodus, ymddengys fod y broblem wedi'i datrys bellach.

### **Canolfannau ar gyfer Ceiswyr Lloches Centres for Asylum Seekers**

**Q9 David Davies:** Will the First Minister give an assurance that no centres for asylum seekers will be developed in Wales without proper public consultation? (OAQ22308)

**C9 David Davies:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog roi sicrwydd na fydd unrhyw ganolfannau ar gyfer ceiswyr lloches yn cael eu datblygu yng Nghymru heb ymgynghori'n briodol â'r cyhoedd? (OAQ22308)

**The First Minister:** You were no doubt pleased with the publication at lunchtime today of the list of the asylum accommodation centres, which no longer includes the former Sully Hospital. You will also be interested in the application that has been made to develop an immigrant appellate hearing centre in Langstone, just east of Newport. Although the Home Office is exempt from the provisions of land use planning legislation, it is going through a similar planning process. Newport County Borough Council has objected to the application and as a result it has been referred to the Assembly for determination. The next step will be to hold a public inquiry, before the final decision is taken by an Assembly planning decision committee.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n siŵr eich bod wrth eich bodd â'r rhestr o ganolfannau lletya ceiswyr lloches a gyhoeddwyd amser cinio heddiw, nad yw bellach yn cynnwys cyn Ysbyty Sili. Byddwch yn ymddiddori hefyd yn y cais a wnaed i ddatblygu canolfan gwranddo apelau mewnfudwyr yn Langstone, ychydig i'r dwyrain o Gasnewydd. Er bod y Swyddfa Gartref wedi'i heithrio rhag darpariaethau deddfwriaeth cynllunio dibenion tir, mae'n dilyn proses gynllunio debyg. Mae Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Casnewydd wedi gwrthwynebu'r cais ac, o ganlyniad i hynny, fe'i cyfeiriwyd i'r Cynulliad i'w benderfynu. Y cam nesaf fydd cynnal ymchwiliad cyhoeddus, cyn gwneud y penderfyniad terfynol gan bwyllgor penderfyniadau cynllunio yn y Cynulliad.

**David Davies:** You will be aware that there has rightly been much public concern about the large numbers of people entering the country claiming asylum-seeker status when they are in fact seeking a better way of life. No-one can blame them for doing so, but the Government should be doing more to stop it. Do you agree that there is concern over the Government's suggestion that it will use

**David Davies:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod llawer o bryder wedi bod ymysg y cyhoedd, a hynny'n briodol, ynghylch y niferoedd mawr o bobl sy'n dod i'r wlad gan hawlio statws ceisiwr lloches a hwythau mewn gwirionedd yn chwilio am well ffordd o fyw. Ni all neb weld bai arnynt am wneud hynny, ond dylai'r Llywodraeth wneud rhagor i'w atal. A ydych yn cytuno bod pryder ynghylch awgrym y

planning legislation to get around the requirement to have a full public consultation before setting up accommodation centres for asylum seekers? Do you regret this and do you agree that it would be highly unfair to local communities to have large numbers of asylum seekers located among them without consultation having taken place?

**The First Minister:** You are using the 'apocalypse now' trick; I thought Alun Cairns had a monopoly on that in your group. You would have done well not to have just read out what you had prepared but to have listened to my comments about Sully Hospital and the immigrant appellate hearing centre at Newport. Unfortunately, you are on a wild goose chase about a matter that does not pertain to Wales.

**John Griffiths:** The people of Newport East are grateful that a public inquiry will be held on the proposed asylum seeker appeals centre in Langstone in my constituency. They are also grateful for the way in which the Assembly has handled the matter to date. Do you agree that politicians and other public figures should be careful about public statements on asylum seekers, given the sensitivities involved and the problems of hostility towards, and physical attacks on, asylum seekers? Such problems have, unfortunately, occurred and are more likely to do so in future if public figures are not guarded in their comments.

**The First Minister:** I agree. Perhaps it is too much to ask David Davies to be the still, small voice of calm and conscience when discussing this issue. However, it behoves all of us to be careful in commenting on such issues, as what we say could be misinterpreted as applying to anybody and everybody who was not born in this country or who are of a different ethnicity to the person making the comments. We must be careful if we are to preserve good race relations at this difficult time.

Llywodraeth y bydd yn defnyddio deddfwriaeth gynllunio i osgoi'r angen i gael ymgynghori cyhoeddus llawn cyn sefydlu canolfannau llety ar gyfer ceiswyr lloches? A yw hynny'n ofid i chi ac a ydych yn cytuno mai tra annheg â chymunedau lleol fyddai iddynt gael niferoedd mawr o geiswyr lloches wedi'u lleoli yn eu mysg heb fod ymghynghori wedi digwydd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych yn defnyddio'r tric 'apocalyps yn awr'; tybiais fod gan Alun Cairns fonopoli ar hynny yn eich grŵp chi. Buasai'n well ichi beidio â darllen yr hyn yr oeddech wedi'i baratoi a gwranddo ar fy sylwadau am Ysbyty Sili a'r ganolfan gwranddo apelau mewnfudwyr yng Nghasnewydd. Gwaetha'r modd, yr ydych yn rhedeg ar ôl cysgod ynghylch mater nad yw'n berthnasol i Gymru.

**John Griffiths:** Mae pobl Dwyrain Casnewydd yn ddiolchgar y bydd ymchwiliad cyhoeddus ar y ganolfan apelau ceiswyr lloches arfaethedig yn Langstone yn fy etholaeth i. Maent yn ddiolchgar hefyd am y modd y mae'r Cynulliad wedi trafod y mater hwn hyd yma. A ydych yn cytuno y dylai gwleidyddion a ffigyrau cyhoeddus eraill fod yn ofalus ynghylch gwneud datganiadau cyhoeddus am geiswyr lloches, yng ngolwg y materion sensitif sy'n gysylltiedig a'r problemau o ran gelyniaeth yn erbyn ceiswyr lloches ac ymosodiadau corfforol arnynt? Mae problemau o'r fath wedi codi, gwaetha'r modd, ac maent yn fwy tebygol o godi yn y dyfodol os nad yw ffigyrau cyhoeddus yn ofalus wrth wneud sylwadau.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cytunaf â hynny. Efallai ei bod yn ormod gofyn i David Davies fod yn llef ddistaw fain dros lonyddwch a chydwybod wrth drafod y mater hwn. Er hynny, dylem oll fod yn ofalus wrth wneud sylwadau am faterion o'r fath, oherwydd gellid camddechongli'r hyn a ddywedwn i olygu ei fod yn berthnasol i bawb a phobun na aned yn y wlad hon neu sydd ag ethnigrwydd gwahanol i'r sawl sy'n gwneud y sylwadau. Rhaid inni fod yn ofalus os ydym i gadw cysylltiadau hiliol da ar yr adeg anodd hon.



### **Cod i'r Gweinidogion The Ministerial Code**

**Q10 Helen Mary Jones:** Will the First Minister make a statement on overseeing the adherence to the ministerial code of conduct? (OAQ22324)

**The First Minister:** Cabinet Ministers are personally responsible for complying with the provisions of the Ministerial Code. I take whatever action is necessary to ensure the policing of that code.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I am glad to hear that. I draw your attention to section 8.3 of the code, which refers to a Minister's responsibility to make as much information as possible available to Committees. In light of your earlier response to Ieuan Wyn Jones about grave financial and other mismanagement at Education and Learning Wales, I remind you that the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning has admitted that she knew in May 2002 of at least some of the concerns. She has never made a full report to Committee about those concerns. Under the code, will you investigate what she knew, when she knew it and what she did with that information? Do you agree that, if she had even a partial knowledge of what was going on and failed to make a full report on that to Committee, she has breached the code? Do you further agree that, if she did not know what was going on in ELWa, she is incompetent?

**The First Minister:** You are wide of the mark. It is absurd to suggest that the Minister knew at an early stage that there was a breach of the normal standards of spending that we expect to be upheld—which is the responsibility of ELWa's chief executive—and withheld that information from the Committee. A Minister may know of a problem, and may discuss it with the chair, board or chief executive of the quango. However, until the full picture is available and it is clear that something has gone wrong and that money has been spent in an unauthorised way, there is nothing further that the Minister can do other than to keep

**C10 Helen Mary Jones:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am oruchwylio bod Gweinidogion yn cadw at y cod ymddygiad ar gyfer Gweinidogion? (OAQ22324)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae Gweinidogion y Cabinet yn bersonol gyfrifol am gydymffurfio â darpariaethau y Cod i'r Gweinidogion. Cymeraf ba bynnag gamau sy'n angenrheidiol i sicrhau yr arolygir gweithrediad y cod hwnnw.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yr wyf yn falch o glywed hynny. Tynnaf eich sylw at adran 8.3 o'r cod, sy'n cyfeirio at gyfrifoldeb Gweinidog i ddarparu cymaint o wybodaeth ag y bo modd i Bwyllgorau. Yng ngolwg eich ymateb cynharach i Ieuan Wyn Jones am gamreoli difrifol ar gyllid a materion eraill yn Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru, yr wyf yn eich atgoffa bod y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes wedi cyfaddef ei bod yn gwybod ym mis Mai 2002 am o leiaf rai o'r pryderon. Nid yw erioed wedi rhoi adroddiad llawn i'r Pwyllgor am y pryderon hynny. O dan y cod, a wnewch ymchwilio i'r hyn a wyddai, pa bryd y cafodd wybod amdano a beth a wnaeth â'r wybodaeth honno? A gytunwch, os gwyddai hyd yn oed yn rhannol am yr hyn a oedd yn mynd ymlaen a'i bod wedi methu â rhoi adroddiad llawn am hynny i'r Pwyllgor, ei bod wedi torri'r cod? A gytunwch ymhellach, os na wyddai beth a oedd yn mynd ymlaen yn ELWa, ei bod yn analluog?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych ymhell ohoni. Peth hurt yw awgrymu bod y Gweinidog yn gwybod yn gynnar fod methiant i gynnal y safonau gwariant arferol a ddisgwyliwn—sy'n gyfrifoldeb i brif weithredwr ELWa— a'i bod wedi cadw'r wybodaeth honno oddi wrth y Pwyllgor. Gallai Gweinidog wybod am broblem, a'i thrafod gyda chadeirydd, bwrdd neu brif weithredwr y cwango. Serch hynny, hyd nes y ceir y darlun cyflawn ac y gwelir bod rhywbeth wedi mynd o'i le a bod arian wedi'i wario mewn modd nas awdurdodwyd, nid oes dim y gall y Gweinidog ei wneud yn rhagor heblaw cadw llygad barcud ar y sefyllfa a rhoi gwybod i'r

close tabs on the situation and to inform the overall accounting officer—that is, the Permanent Secretary—so that he can keep an even closer eye on it. You cannot report an allegation to a Committee. The Audit Committee is the only Committee that can investigate matters of probity, on the basis of a National Audit Office report. That is the Committee's work. Assembly Ministers are not responsible for policing the probity of expenditure by quangos or civil servants; we are responsible for implementing the policies. However, we must ensure that public money is being properly spent when the NAO draws to our attention the fact that something has gone wrong. There is a procedure to deal with that once the Audit Committee has completed a report on the issue. We will prepare our response on this particular issue once the Audit Committee has completed its report.

**The Presiding Officer:** I make it clear to Members that allegations relating to standards and alleged issues involving the Ministerial Code should not be bandied about in the Chamber. Standing Order No. 16.1(ii) makes it clear that such matters are to be investigated, where appropriate, by the Committee on Standards of Conduct. I would be grateful if Members would observe that in future.

**David Ian Jones:** Does the First Minister agree that one fundamental weakness of the Ministerial Code is that it effectively renders him judge and jury of his own court? Ought not the oversight of the code—

2.50 p.m.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Clearly, Members are not listening when the Presiding Officer pronounces on matters of order. Under Standing Order No. 16, it is clear that this is not a matter for judges and juries, but for reporting to the Committee on Standards of Conduct, where appropriate.

**David Ian Jones:** I appreciate that, Llywydd, but this is a matter of principle rather than an individual case.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. There can be

swyddog cyfrifo cyffredinol—sef yr Ysgrifennydd Parhaol—fel y gall gadw golwg manylach byth arni. Ni allwch adrodd am gyhuddiad i Bwyllgor. Y Pwyllgor Archwilio yw'r unig Bwyllgor a all ymchwilio i faterion o uniondeb, ar sail adroddiad gan y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol. Dyna waith y Pwyllgor. Nid yw Gweinidogion y Cynulliad yn gyfrifol am arolygu uniondeb y gwariant gan gwangos neu weision sifil; yr ydym yn gyfrifol am roi'r polisïau ar waith. Er hynny, rhaid inni sicrhau bod arian cyhoeddus yn cael ei wario'n briodol pan yw'r Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol yn tynnu ein sylw at y ffaith bod rhywbeth wedi mynd o'i le. Ceir gweithdrefn i ddelio â hynny wedi i'r Pwyllgor Archwilio gwblhau ei adroddiad ar y mater. Gwnawn baratoi ein hymateb ar y mater penodol hwn wedi i'r Pwyllgor Archwilio gwblhau ei adroddiad.

**Y Llywydd:** Rhoddaf ar ddeall i Aelodau na ddylid taflu cyhuddiadau ynghylch safonau a materion honedig sy'n ymwneud â Chod y Gweinidogion yn ôl a blaen yn y Siambr. Mae Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 16.1(ii) yn rhoi ar ddeall y dylai'r Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad ymchwilio i faterion o'r fath, os yw'n briodol. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe byddai Aelodau'n dilyn hynny yn y dyfodol.

**David Ian Jones:** A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn cytuno mai un o wendidau sylfaenol Cod y Gweinidogion yw ei fod i bob pwrpas yn ei wneud ef yn farnwr ac yn rheithgor yn ei lys ei hun? Oni ddylai'r oruchwyliaeth ar y cod—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'n amlwg nad yw Aelodau'n gwranddo pan yw'r Llywydd yn dyfarnu ar faterion o drefn. O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 16, mae'n amlwg nad yw hyn yn fater i farnwyr a rheithgorau, ond yn un i'w adrodd i'r Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad, os yw'n briodol.

**David Ian Jones:** Gwerthfawrogaf hynny, Lywydd, ond mae hyn yn fater o egwyddor yn hytrach nag achos unigol.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni ellir cael materion o

no matters of principle outwith the remit of Standing Orders. egwyddor y tu allan i gwmpas y Rheolau Sefydlog.

**David Ian Jones:** In that case, I shall not pursue the matter. **David Ian Jones:** Os felly, nid af ar ôl y mater.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am grateful to you. **Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i chi.

### **Datganiad Busnes Business Statement**

**The Business Minister (Carwyn Jones):** There is one change to this week's business. Today's motion to approve the Voluntary Adoption Agencies and the Adoption Agencies (Miscellaneous Amendments) Regulations 2003 has been moved to Tuesday, 25 February. This is due to late drafting amendments to the document. As for the next three weeks' business, the draft business statement can be found on the Chamberweb, under supporting documents.

**Y Trefnydd (Carwyn Jones):** Mae un newid i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Mae'r cynnig ar gyfer heddiw i gymeradwyo Rheoliadau Asiantaethau Mabwysiadu Gwirfoddol a'r Asiantaethau Mabwysiadu (Diwygiadau Amrywiol) 2003 wedi'i symud i ddydd Mawrth, 25 Chwefror. Mae hynny oherwydd newidiadau drafftio hwyr i'r ddogfen. Am fusnes y tair wythnos nesaf, gellir gweld y datganiad busnes drafft ar we'r Siambr, o dan ddogfennau ategol.

Following the Business Committee meeting this morning, the Deputy Presiding Officer determined that, under Standing Order No. 22.5, the following items of legislation need not be referred to a Subject Committee for extended consideration. They are the Animal By-products (Identification) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003; the Powys Health Care National Health Service Trust (Dissolution) Order 2003; the Council Tax Discount Disregards (Amendment) (Wales) Order 2003; the Care Standards Act 2000 (Commencement No. 11) (Wales) Order 2003; the Financing of Maintained Schools (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003; and the Health Authorities (Transfer of Functions, Staff, Property, Rights and Liabilities and Abolition) (Wales) Order 2003.

Ar ôl cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, penderfynodd y Dirprwy Lywydd, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.5, nad oes angen cyfeirio'r eitemau deddfwriaeth a ganlyn i Bwyllgor Pwnc i'w hystyried yn helaethach. Y rhain yw Rheoliadau Sgil-gynhyrchion Anifeiliaid (Adnabod) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003; Gorchymyn Ymddiriedolaeth Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol Gofal Iechyd Powys (Diddymu) 2003; Gorchymyn Treth Gyngor (Diystyru Gostyngiad) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003; Gorchymyn Deddf Safonau Gofal 2000 (Cychwyn Rhif 11) (Cymru) 2003; Rheoliadau Ariannu Ysgolion a Gynhelir (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003; a Gorchymyn Awdurdodau Iechyd (Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau, Staff, Eiddo, Hawliau a Rhwymedigaethau a Diddymu) (Cymru) 2003.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes gwrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes? **The Presiding Officer:** Are there any objections to the business statement?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Oes.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yes.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes 10 gwrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes? Gwelaf fod. Felly, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 5.4, gofynnaf i'r Trefnydd gynnig yn ffurfiol i'r datganiad gael ei dderbyn.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there 10 objections to the business statement? I see that there are. Therefore, under Standing Order No. 5.4, I call the Business Minister to formally propose that the business statement be adopted.

**Carwyn Jones:** Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn derbyn y datganiad busnes.*

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf un Aelod o bob grŵp plaid i siarad yn fyr ar y cynnig.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Gŵyr y Trefnydd inni, fel grŵp, alw ar sawl achlysur am ddatlawn yn y Siambr ar y sefyllfa sy'n datblygu o ran y bygythiad o ymosodiad milwrol ar Irac. Bu i grŵp Plaid Cymru gynnal dadl fer ar y mater yn ei hamser ei hunan, a thynnodd Dafydd Wigley sylw at nifer o gyfrifoldebau Llywodraeth Cymru ynddi, o ran paratoi Cymru a phobl Cymru ar gyfer goblygiadau'r fath ymosodiad. Eto i gyd, gwrthododd y Weithrediaeth yn gyson ein ceisiadau iddi gynnal dadl yma.

A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno, yng nghyfarfod grŵp Plaid Cymru y bore yma, y bu i bob aelod o'r grŵp fynegi i nifer helaeth o'u hetholwyr gysylltu â hwy yn gofyn pryd y bydd Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ymdrin â'r mater o safbwynt Cymru? Pryd y bydd Aelodau Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn cael mynegi eu barn ar y mater hwn, yn unol â cheisiadau eu hetholwyr? Tybiaf fod aelodau o'r Llywodraeth hefyd wedi derbyn ymholiadau o'r fath gan eu hetholwyr; sylwais dros y penwythnos i aelodau'r Cabinet fynegi eu gwrthwynebiad i unrhyw ymosodiad ar Irac heb ail benderfyniad gan y Cenedloedd Unedig. A wnaiff y Trefnydd dderbyn bod angen inni gynnal trafodaeth lawn ar y pwnc hwn yn y Siambr? Os nad yw'n fodlon ymrwymo i hynny, bydd Plaid Cymru yn gwrthwynebu y datganiad busnes. Anogaf bawb sy'n teimlo'n gryf fod gennym gyfrifoldeb i drafod hyn i ymuno â ni a gwrthod y datganiad busnes.

**Nick Bourne:** We do not believe that it is appropriate at this stage to support Plaid Cymru's request. It is a serious issue, but we feel that, until matters develop, it would be premature to consider this issue. Perhaps we could revisit the matter following a second

**Carwyn Jones:** I propose that

*the National Assembly adopts the business statement.*

**The Presiding Officer:** I call one Member from each party group to speak briefly on the motion.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** The Business Minister knows that we, as a group, have called several times for a full debate in the Chamber on the evolving situation with regard to the threat of military action against Iraq. The Plaid Cymru group has held a short debate on the matter in its own time, during which Dafydd Wigley drew attention to some of the Government of Wales's responsibilities in terms of preparing Wales and the people of Wales for the implications of such an attack. Yet the Executive has repeatedly rejected our requests for it to hold a debate here.

Does the Minister agree that, during the Plaid Cymru meeting this morning, every member of the group said that many of their constituents had contacted them asking when the National Assembly for Wales will deal with this matter from a Welsh perspective? When will Members of the National Assembly for Wales get to state their opinion on this matter, as their constituents have requested? I imagine that members of the Government have also received such inquiries from their constituents; I noted over the weekend that some Cabinet members expressed their opposition to any attack on Iraq without a second United Nations resolution. Will the Business Minister accept that we need to have a full debate on this subject in the Chamber? Unless he is willing to commit to that, Plaid Cymru will reject the business statement. I urge everyone who feels strongly that we have a responsibility to discuss this matter to join us in rejecting the business statement.

**Nick Bourne:** Ni chredwn ei bod yn briodol cefnogi cais Plaid Cymru ar hyn o bryd. Mae hyn yn fater difrifol, ond teimlwn mai cynamserol fyddai ystyried y mater hwn, hyd nes y bydd materion yn datblygu. Efallai y gallem ailystyried y mater ar ôl ail

UN resolution. Plaid Cymru has already done immense damage by sponsoring visits to Iraq and giving comfort to someone who is clearly a monstrous dictator. That is not to say that we should not work through the United Nations; we should. However, as far as we are concerned, that is already happening. Plaid Cymru has every right to raise this issue but, just as it did not support us on previous issues, we do not feel it appropriate to support Plaid Cymru on this occasion. Unlike Plaid Cymru, which did a cartwheel within a week last week, we have been consistent. We have said previously, when such issues have arisen, that there may be a time to consider it. However, now is not that time.

**Kirsty Williams:** I have some sympathy with the principle of Rhodri Glyn's point: the Assembly should have an opportunity at some stage to debate a situation that is growing in seriousness. Unlike Mr Bourne, I am not confident about waiting for a second resolution from the United Nations, because there may never be one, as much as many Members would like to see one. However, I object to Plaid Cymru using this opportunity to raise this issue. Rhodri Glyn Thomas was present at the Business Committee meeting this morning and had an opportunity to raise an objection to the business statement then and to put forward his point of view, but he did not do so. If Plaid Cymru feels so strongly about this, why did it not raise it through the appropriate channels, namely in the Business Committee meeting this morning?

**The Business Minister (Carwyn Jones):** It would not be right for me to reveal what goes on in the Business Committee, however, this is the first time that I have heard this request today.

Ar sefyllfa Irac, bydd yn rhaid inni weld beth sydd yn digwydd yn ystod yr wythnosau nesaf. Ar hyn o bryd, nid oes unrhyw beth wedi newid. Os bydd newid mawr, ac os caiff rhywbeth ei drefnu gan y Cenhedloedd Unedig, neu os bydd gweithred filwrol—a gobeithiwn na fydd hynny'n digwydd—wedyn byddai amser i drafod y mater.

benderfyniad gan y Cenhedloedd Unedig. Mae Plaid Cymru wedi gwneud niwed mawr eisoes drwy noddi ymweliadau ag Irac a chysuro rhywun sy'n amlwg yn unben gwrthun. Nid yw hynny'n gyfystyr â dweud na ddylem weithio drwy'r Cenhedloedd Unedig; dylem wneud hynny. Er hynny, hyd y gwelwn ni, mae hynny'n digwydd eisoes. Mae gan Plaid Cymru bob hawl i godi'r mater hwn ond, yn yr un modd ag y peidiodd â'n cefnogi ni ar faterion blaenorol, ni theimlwn ei bod yn briodol cefnogi Plaid Cymru y tro hwn. Yn wahanol i Plaid Cymru, a wnaeth olwyndro o fewn wythnos yr wythnos diwethaf, buom ni'n gyson. Yr ydym wedi dweud o'r blaen, pan gododd materion o'r fath, y bydd adeg briodol i'w ystyried o bosibl. Fodd bynnag, nid hon yw'r adeg.

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae gennyf beth cydymdeimlad ag egwyddor y pwynt a wnaeth Rhodri Glyn: dylai'r Cynulliad gael cyfle ar ryw adeg i drafod sefyllfa sy'n mynd yn fwy difrifol. Yn wahanol i Mr Bourne, nid wyf yn ffyddiog ynghylch aros am ail benderfyniad gan y Cenhedloedd Unedig, gan ei bod yn bosibl na cheir un byth, er cymaint y carai llawer o Aelodau ei weld. Er hynny, gwrthwynebaf i Plaid Cymru ddefnyddio'r cyfle hwn i godi'r mater hwn. Yr oedd Rhodri Glyn Thomas yn bresennol yn nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma a chafodd gyfle i wrthwynebu'r datganiad busnes bryd hynny a chyflwyno ei safbwynt, ond ni wnaeth hynny. Os yw Plaid Cymru yn teimlo mor gryf am hyn, pam na chododd ef drwy'r sianel briodol, sef yn y cyfarfod o'r Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma?

**Y Trefnydd (Carwyn Jones):** Ni fyddai'n iawn imi ddatgelu beth sy'n mynd ymlaen yn y Pwyllgor Busnes, er hynny, dyma'r tro cyntaf imi glywed y cais hwn heddiw.

On the situation in Iraq, we will have to see what happens over the next few weeks. At present, nothing has changed. If there is a great change, and something is organised by the United Nations, or there is military action—and we hope that that will not happen—then there would be time to debate the matter.

Ni allaf fynegi barn ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd yng nghyfarfodydd grŵp Plaid Cymru—nid wyf yn cael gwahoddiad i gyfarfodydd y grŵp hwnnw fel rheol. Gwelwn wleidyddiaeth synthetig heddiw, oherwydd yr oedd gan Blaid Cymru ddadl plaid leiafrifol yr wythnos diwethaf a dewisodd fand eang fel pwnc, yn hytrach nag Irac. Os yw'r pwnc hwn mor bwysig, pam na ddewisodd—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r Trefnydd wedi gwrando ar yr hyn sydd gan Aelodau i'w ddweud, ac mae'n iawn iddynt wrando ar ei ymateb.

**Carwyn Jones:** Pam felly, os yw'r pwnc hwn mor bwysig, nad hwn fu pwnc y ddadl plaid leiafrifol yr wythnos diwethaf? Chwarae gwleidyddiaeth yw hyn; nid yw hyn yn fater y mae Plaid Cymru'n teimlo'n gryf amdano drwy'r amser.

I cannot express an opinion on what happens in Plaid Cymru group meetings—I am not invited to those meetings as a rule. We are seeing synthetic politics today, because Plaid Cymru had a minority party debate last week and it chose broadband as a subject, rather than Iraq. If this subject is so important, why did it not choose—[*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The Business Minister has listened to what Members have to say, and they should therefore listen to his response.

**Carwyn Jones:** Why therefore, if this subject is so important, was this not the subject of the minority party debate last week? This is playing politics; it is not a matter that Plaid Cymru consistently feels strongly about.

*Cynnig: O blaid 39, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 13.*

*Motion: For 39, Abstain 0, Against 13.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, David Ian  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Phil

Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order**

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Pwynt o drefn. Mae hyn yn deillio o'r datganiad busnes. Yr oeddwn o dan yr argraff bod trafodaethau'r Pwyllgor Busnes yn gyfrinachol, ac na ddylid eu datgelu. Buaswn yn gwerthfawrogi eich cyngor ar y mater hwn, Lywydd. Cyfeiriodd Kirsty Williams yn benodol at drafodaethau a ddigwyddodd yn y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma wrth drafod y datganiad busnes. Hoffwn gofnodi bod Plaid Cymru wedi cyflwyno dadleuon ar Irac ar ddau achlysur.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae'r Pwyllgor Busnes yn rhan allweddol o'n gweithgareddau, ac mae'n un o ddirgeleddau mawr y Cynulliad, a'r modd y mae'r Cynulliad yn gweithio o gwbl. Yr wyf wedi datgan o'r Gadair hon yn y gorffennol ei bod yn bwysig, er mwyn i'n gweithdrefnau allu gweithio'n effeithiol ac er mwyn i ni allu dod i gytundeb drwy drafodaethau cyfrinachol, fod yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn y Pwyllgor Busnes yn gyfrinachol. Ni chlywais y Trefnydd yn datgelu unrhyw fater yn ymwneud â chyfarfod y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Kirsty Williams ddywedais i.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Os wyf yn gwneud datganiad o'r Gadair, mae'n amlwg beth yw ei ystyr.

**Peter Rogers:** Point of order. You will recall, Presiding Officer, that on 28 January I raised a point of order regarding inaccurate information on the payment window for farmers given by the Business Minister during the business statement, and following a supplementary question to the First

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Point of order. This arises from the business statement. I was under the impression that the deliberations of the Business Committee were confidential, and should not be disclosed. I would appreciate your advice on this matter, Presiding Officer. Kirsty Williams referred specifically to discussions that occurred in the Business Committee this morning in commenting on the business statement. For the record, Plaid Cymru has presented debates on Iraq on two occasions.

**The Presiding Officer:** The Business Committee is a key part of our activities. It is one of the great mysteries of the Assembly, and is what keeps the Assembly's cogs turning. I have stated from this Chair in the past that it is important, in order for our procedures to work effectively and in order for us to be able come to agreement through confidential discussions, that what occurs in the Business Committee is confidential. I did not hear the Business Minister disclosing any issue regarding this morning's Business Committee meeting.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I said Kirsty Williams.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. If I make a statement from the Chair, my meaning is clear.

**Peter Rogers:** Pwynt o drefn. Byddwch yn cofio, Lywydd, fy mod wedi codi pwynt o drefn ar 28 Ionawr ynghylch gwybodaeth anghywir am y ffenestr dalu ar gyfer ffermwyr a roddwyd gan y Trefnydd yn ystod y datganiad busnes, ac ar ôl cwestiwn atodol i'r Prif Weinidog. Yr oedd y Prif Weinidog

Minister. The First Minister had agreed to write to me on my claims that many payments do not have windows. To date, I have received no such letter.

wedi cytuno i ysgrifennu ataf ynghylch fy honiadau nad oes ffenestri ar gyfer llawer o daliadau. Hyd yn hyn, nid wyf wedi derbyn llythyr o'r fath.

3.00 p.m.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Although it is not a matter that relates directly to procedure in this Chamber, I recollect that it was raised on 28 January. At that time I indicated that I would also look forward to reading a copy of the correspondence. I am still looking forward to doing that. I am sure that the First Minister will have noted what is in the Record, and will have heard what was said today.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Er nad yw hyn yn fater sy'n ymwneud yn uniongyrchol â'r weithdrefn yn y Siambr hon, yr wyf yn cofio iddo gael ei godi ar 28 Ionawr. Bryd hynny, nodais y byddwn innau'n edrych ymlaen at ddarllen copi o'r ohebiaeth. Yr wyf yn dal i edrych ymlaen at wneud hynny. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd y Prif Weinidog wedi nodi'r hyn sydd yn y Cofnod, ac y bydd wedi clywed yr hyn a ddywedwyd heddiw.

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Addysg (Unedau Cyfeirio Disgyblion) (Apelau yn erbyn Gwaharddiadau Parhaol) (Cymru) 2003  
Motion to approve The Education (Pupil Referral Units) (Appeals Against Permanent Exclusion) (Wales) Regulations 2003**

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose that

*the National Assembly considers the principle of the Education (Pupil Referral Units) (Appeals Against Permanent Exclusion) (Wales) Regulations 2003, which were laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 2 May 2001. (NDM1338)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly approves that the Education (Pupil Referral Units) (Appeals Against Permanent Exclusion) (Wales) Regulations 2003 is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 4 February 2003. (NDM1339).*

Members will note that no Legislation Committee report is laid in respect of these Regulations, procedural requirements having been disappplied by the Assembly Cabinet under Standing Order 22.27 (i), (ii) and (iii). I felt that it was important to give Members the opportunity to consider those in Plenary.

The regulations introduce the statutory right

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Addysg (Unedau Cyfeirio Disgyblion) (Apelau yn erbyn Gwaharddiadau Parhaol) (Cymru) 2003 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ar 4 Chwefror 2003. (NDM1338)*

Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn cymeradwyo gwneud Rheoliadau Addysg (Unedau Cyfeirio Disgyblion) (Apelau yn erbyn Gwaharddiadau Parhaol) (Cymru) 2003 yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ar 4 Chwefror 2003. (NDM1339)*

Bydd Aelodau'n nodi na osodwyd adroddiad gan y Pwyllgor Deddfau mewn cysylltiad â'r Rheoliadau hyn, gan fod y gofynion trefniadol wedi'u datgymhwyso gan Gabinet y Cynulliad o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.27 (i), (ii) a (iii). Teimlais ei bod yn bwysig rhoi cyfle i Aelodau eu hystyried yn y Cyfarfod Llawn.

Mae'r rheoliadau'n cyflwyno hawl statudol i



of appeal against permanent exclusions from pupil referral units. Although we said, in National Assembly circular 3/99 'Pupil Support and Social Inclusion', that there should be arrangements for hearing appeals against the permanent exclusion from pupil referral units, until now there has not been a statutory right of appeal.

After it came to light that that situation was not compliant with human rights legislation on the right to a fair and impartial trial, a provision was included in the Education Act 2002 to provide for a statutory right of appeal. The Act was welcomed in plenary on 16 October 2002. The particular provision was referred to in the Annex to my Ministerial Report, which was presented to the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee on 24 October 2002.

The regulations are to introduce the right of appeal contained in that provision of the Education Act 2002, and bring the position of pupils who are permanently excluded from PRUs into line with the position of pupils who are currently permanently excluded from mainstream schools.

The regulations mirror existing procedures for independent appeals against permanent exclusions as far as possible. They specify the process for notifying the pupils or their parents of their right to appeal, and the procedure for appealing; the responsibility of the local education authority to make arrangements to enable an appeal, and the powers of an appeal panel, that is, where they determine that that pupil should not have been excluded.

Under the Act, the right of appeal is given retrospectively from 1 September 1994, which is the date when PRUs were first recognised by statute. That allows for appeals against permanent exclusion decisions that were made before the regulations came into force. Retrospective appeals will need to be lodged no later than 30 school days after the date on which regulations come into force.

Members may have concerns about exclusion procedures and appeals in general, but I stress

apelio yn erbyn gwaharddiadau parhaol o unedau cyfeirio disgyblion. Er inni ddweud, yng nghylchlythyr 3/99 y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol 'Cefnogi Disgyblion a Chynhwysiant Cymdeithasol', y dylid cael trefniadau i wrando apelau yn erbyn gwaharddiad parhaol o unedau cyfeirio disgyblion, ni fu hawl apêl statudol hyd yn hyn.

Wedi iddi ddod yn amlwg nad oedd y sefyllfa'n cydymffurfio â deddfwriaeth hawliau dynol ar yr hawl i gael prawf teg a diduedd, cynhwyswyd darpariaeth yn y Ddeddf Addysg 2002 i ddarparu ar gyfer hawl apêl statudol. Croesawyd y Ddeddf yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 16 Hydref 2002. Cyfeiriwyd at y ddarpariaeth benodol yn yr Atodiad i'm Hadroddiad Gweinidogol, a gyflwynwyd i'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ar 24 Hydref 2002.

Pwrpas y rheoliadau yw cyflwyno'r hawl i apêl a geir yn y ddarpariaeth honno yn y Ddeddf Addysg 2002, a chysoni sefyllfa disgyblion sydd wedi'u gwahardd yn barhaol o unedau cyfeirio disgyblion â sefyllfa disgyblion sydd wedi'u gwahardd yn barhaol o ysgolion y brif ffrwd ar hyn o bryd.

Mae'r rheoliadau'n adlewyrchu'r gweithdrefnau presennol ar gyfer apelau annibynnol yn erbyn gwaharddiadau parhaol i'r graddau mwyaf posibl. Maent yn nodi'r broses ar gyfer hysbysu disgyblion neu eu rhieni am eu hawl i apelio, a'r weithdrefn ar gyfer apelio; cyfrifoldeb yr awdurdod addysg lleol i wneud trefniadau i hwyluso apêl, a phwerau panel apêl, hynny yw, os penderfynant na ddylai disgybl fod wedi'i wahardd.

O dan y Ddeddf, rhoddir yr hawl i apêl yn ôl-weithredol o 1 Medi 1994, sef y dyddiad y cydnabuwyd unedau cyfeirio disgyblion drwy statud yn gyntaf. Mae hynny'n darparu ar gyfer apelau yn erbyn penderfyniadau i wahardd yn barhaol a wnaed cyn i'r rheoliadau ddod i rym. Bydd yn rhaid cyflwyno apelau ôl-weithredol cyn pen cyfnod o 30 diwrnod ysgol ar ôl y dyddiad y daw'r rheoliadau i rym.

Efallai y bydd gan Aelodau bryderon ynghylch gweithdrefnau gwahardd ac

that the regulations are effectively an interim arrangement. The regulations are simply to bring PRUs into line with mainstream schools regarding exclusion appeal decisions.

I will examine procedures relating to exclusions and appeals against exclusions in the next couple of months. Naturally, I intend to consult thoroughly on any possible changes to the exclusion procedures, which will also be made in regulations under the Act. At that time the regulations before the Chamber will probably need to be amended. Members will have an opportunity to scrutinise any proposed changes when the future regulations are drawn up.

**Helen Mary Jones:** The regulations, as the Minister said, genuinely tidy up an anomalous situation. I am glad that the Minister is going to keep the regulations under review, in the light of the wider review that she is holding into the appeals against exclusions system.

The length of time that is allowed for appeal concerns us. The period of 15 school days is effectively three weeks. That sounds like a long time, but the regulations will affect a small number of children, young people, and families who will be living through difficult circumstances and under much pressure. Those children would not be in pupil referral units if their families were not having severe difficulties with them and with their education.

In my experience as a teacher, families will often wish to explore other possibilities before they decide to make a formal appeal. They may seek an alternative placement elsewhere, but they might not be able to find one. At that point, they may decide to appeal against the exclusion. Will the Minister agree to keep an eye on the issue of timescales in her review?

There is a balance to be achieved here. You do not want the process to drag out, and you do not want staff, particularly in these small units, to be under pressure. On the other hand, it is important that children, young people and their families are given sufficient

apelau'n gyffredinol, ond pwysleisiaf mai trefniant dros dro yw'r rheoliadau, i bob pwrpas. Unig ddiben y rheoliadau yw cysoni unedau cyfeirio disgyblion ag ysgolion y brif ffrwd o ran apelau yn erbyn penderfyniadau i wahardd.

Archwiliaf y gweithdrefnau sy'n ymwneud â gwaharddiadau ac apelau yn erbyn gwahardd yn y misoedd nesaf. Wrth gwrs, bwriadaf ymgynghori'n drwyadl ynghylch unrhyw newidiadau posibl i'r gweithdrefnau gwahardd, a wneir mewn rheoliadau o dan y Ddeddf hefyd. Bryd hynny, mae'n debyg y bydd yn rhaid diwygio'r rheoliadau sydd gerbron y Siambr. Caiff Aelodau gyfle i graffu ar unrhyw newidiadau arfaethedig pan lunnir y rheoliadau yn y dyfodol.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, mae'r rheoliadau'n rhoi trefn ar sefyllfa afreolaidd. Yr wyf yn falch y bydd y Gweinidog yn dal y rheoliadau o dan sylw, yng ngolwg yr adolygiad ehangach y mae'n ei gynnal o'r system apelau yn erbyn gwaharddiadau.

Mae'r cyfnod a ganiateir ar gyfer apêl yn peri pryder i ni. Mae'r cyfnod o 15 diwrnod ysgol yn dair wythnos i bob pwrpas. Mae hynny'n swnio'n gyfnod hir, ond bydd y rheoliadau'n effeithio ar nifer fach o blant, pobl ifanc, a theuluoedd a fydd yn byw o dan amgylchiadau anodd a llawer o bwysau. Ni fuasai'r plant hynny mewn unedau cyfeirio disgyblion os nad oedd eu teuluoedd yn profi anawsterau difrifol gyda hwy a'u haddysg.

Yn fy mhrofiad i fel athrawes, bydd teuluoedd yn aml yn dymuno ymchwilio i bosibiliadau eraill cyn penderfynu apelio'n ffurfiol. Gallent geisio lleoliad gwahanol mewn man arall, ond efallai na fyddant yn gallu dod o hyd i un. Bryd hynny, gallent benderfynu apelio yn erbyn y gwaharddiad. A wnaiff y Gweinidog gytuno i gadw golwg ar fater y cyfnod amser yn ei hadolygiad?

Rhaid dal y ddysgl yn wastad yn hyn o beth. Nid yw rhywun yn dymuno i'r broses lusgo ymlaen, nac yn dymuno i staff fod o dan bwysau, yn enwedig yn yr unedau bach hyn. Ar y llaw arall, mae'n bwysig bod plant, pobl ifanc a'u teuluoedd yn cael digon o amser i

time to weigh up their circumstances, particularly in some situations—perhaps in rural counties—where there may be little alternative provision. We will support these regulations today, but I hope that the Minister will agree to address the issue of timescales in the broader review.

**Mick Bates:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats support these regulations. The introduction of a statutory right to appeal against permanent exclusion from pupil referral units not only complies with human rights legislation, but is fair and just. The Welsh Liberal Democrats believe that everyone has the right to good quality education and to equality of opportunity. Disruptive children are children with problems and needs, and they deserve to be treated constructively, not to be excluded and written off. They need help and assistance. I reinforce Helen Mary's statement that there must be some consideration of the time period between the incident and the appeals.

We favour individual behaviour plans for problem pupils, which involve the school, the parents and the child. These would supply the help and assistance that problem pupils need. They would also place pupils at the centre of their own education. I am certain that the Minister agrees that reinforcing that principle would be welcome. Problem pupils are more likely to drink, take drugs, damage property, handle stolen goods and commit assaults. They are also more likely to end up homeless. Exclusion is not a solution, it merely creates more problems for the pupil and for society as a whole.

**Jonathan Morgan:** We will support these regulations as the Minister has outlined them. There is a sense of natural justice that some sort of appeal should be possible where a pupil has been excluded from a pupil referral unit. I am surprised that concerns are being raised at this juncture about the time period in which an appeal needs to be made, because there have already been ample opportunities for both Plaid Cymru and the Liberal Democrats to raise objections.

ystyried eu hamgylchiadau, yn enwedig mewn rhai sefyllfaoedd—mewn siroedd gwledig efallai—lle nad oes fawr o ddewis o ran darpariaeth o bosibl. Byddwn yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn heddiw, ond gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn cytuno i ymdrin â mater y cyfnod amser yn yr adolygiad ehangach.

**Mick Bates:** Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn. Mae cyflwyno hawl apêl statudol yn erbyn gwaharddiadau parhaol o unedau cyfeirio disgyblion yn cydymffurfio â deddfwriaeth hawliau dynol, ac mae hefyd yn deg ac yn gyfiawn. Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn credu bod gan bawb hawl i gael addysg o ansawdd da a chyfle cyfartal. Mae plant trafferthus yn blant sydd â phroblemau ac anghenion, ac maent yn haeddu cael eu trin yn adeiladol, nid eu hallgáu a'u diystyru. Mae arnynt angen cymorth. Ategef yr hyn a ddywedodd Helen Mary am yr angen i roi rhyw ystyriaeth i'r cyfnod rhwng y digwyddiad a'r apelau.

Yr ydym yn ffafrio cynlluniau ymddygiad unigol ar gyfer disgyblion problemus, a fydd yn cynnwys yr ysgol, y rhieni a'r plentyn. Byddai'r rhain yn rhoi'r cymorth y mae ar ddisgyblion problemus ei angen. Byddent hefyd yn gwneud disgyblion yn ganolog i'w haddysg eu hunain. Yr wyf yn sicr bod y Gweinidog yn cytuno ei bod yn dderbyniol ategu'r egwyddor honno. Mae disgyblion problemus yn fwy tebygol o yfed, cymryd cyffuriau, difrodi eiddo, trafod nwyddau sydd wedi'u dwyn ac ymosod. Maent hefyd yn fwy tebygol o fod yn ddigartref yn y diwedd. Nid yw gwahardd yn ateb, nid yw ond yn creu mwy o broblemau i'r disgybl ac i gymdeithas yn ei chyfanrwydd.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Byddwn yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn fel y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u hamlinellu. Teimlir mai mater o gyfiawnder naturiol yw y dylai rhyw fath o apêl fod yn bosibl pan yw disgybl wedi'i wahardd o uned cyfeirio disgyblion. Yr wyf yn synnu bod pryderon yn cael eu codi'n awr ynghylch y cyfnod y mae'n rhaid cyflwyno apêl oddi mewn iddo, oherwydd bu digonedd o gyfleoedd eisoes i Blaid Cymru a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol godi gwrthwynebiadau.

Regulation no. 5 places a duty on the local education authority to make arrangements for an appeal. Are we, as an Assembly, able to stipulate the number of members on an appeal panel and the sort of background that we expect those people to have? Headteachers are somewhat concerned that not enough is being done to take account of the views of the teaching profession regarding LEA-administered school permanent exclusion panels. Can we stipulate the membership, for example, by suggesting that a serving member of staff from a pupil referral unit should be part of an appeal panel, so that they can put across the case of the pupil referral unit?

I am looking forward to the review announced by the Minister. There are some general concerns that must be raised about the appeals process, specifically relating to schools, where a headteacher's decision to exclude a pupil, which is then upheld by the school governing body, can be overturned by an independent panel. There are also some more general issues that we need to consider in the next couple of months.

**David Davies:** I echo the point made so well by Jonathan Morgan. There is a perception that the current procedures for making appeals against exclusion from mainstream schools often seem to work against teachers, who feel justifiably let down when young troublemakers who have threatened or attacked them and are consequently excluded are then let back into the classroom after an appeal. If that happens when the appeal panels are set up for the pupil referral units, teachers and those working in pupil referral units will be further demoralised. Will the Minister assure us that the panels will be composed of people who understand the problems faced by teachers and that they will not be packed with naive do-gooders who will side with the troublemakers, rather than with the hard-pressed teachers? Will she clarify the point that she made about retrospective appeals—[*Interruption.*]

3.10 p.m.

Mae rheoliad rhif 5 yn rhoi'r awdurdod addysg lleol o dan ddyletswydd i wneud trefniadau ar gyfer apêl. A ydym ni, fel Cynulliad, yn gallu rhagnodi nifer yr aelodau ar banel apêl a'r math o gefndir y disgwyliwn y bydd y bobl hynny'n meddu arno? Mae penaethiaid ysgol braidd yn bryderus na wneir digon i ystyried barn athrawon am baneli gwaharddiadau parhaol o ysgolion a weinyddir gan awdurdod addysg lleol. A allwn ragnodi'r aelodaeth, er enghraifft, drwy awgrymu y dylai aelod staff sy'n gwasanaethu mewn uned cyfeirio disgyblion fod yn rhan o banel apêl, fel y gall gyflwyno achos yr uned cyfeirio disgyblion?

Edrychaf ymlaen at yr adolygiad a gyhoeddwyd gan y Gweinidog. Mae rhai pryderon cyffredinol y mae'n rhaid eu codi ynghylch y broses apelau, mewn cysylltiad ag ysgolion yn benodol, lle y mae penderfyniad gan bennaeth ysgol i wahardd disgybl, a gadarnheir wedyn gan gorff llywodraethu'r ysgol, yn gallu cael ei wyrdroi gan banel annibynnol. Mae rhai materion mwy cyffredinol hefyd y dylem eu hystyried yn y misoedd nesaf.

**David Davies:** Ategaf y pwynt a wnaed gystal gan Jonathan Morgan. Ceir canfyddiad bod y gweithdrefnau presennol ar gyfer apelio yn erbyn gwaharddiadau o ysgolion y brif ffrwd yn aml yn gweithio'n erbyn athrawon, y mae'n deg iddynt deimlo eu bod wedi cael cam pan fydd pobl ifanc trafferthus sydd wedi'u bygwth neu wedi ymosod arnynt ac wedi'u gwahardd o ganlyniad yn cael dod yn ôl i'r ystafell ddosbarth ar ôl apêl. Os digwydd hynny pan sefydlir paneli apêl ar gyfer yr unedau cyfeirio disgyblion, bydd athrawon a'r rhai sy'n gweithio mewn unedau cyfeirio disgyblion yn digalonni ymhellach. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ein sicrhau y bydd aelodau'r paneli'n rhai sy'n deall y problemau y mae athrawon yn eu hwynebu ac na fyddant yn llawn ymyrwy'r daionus naif a fydd yn ochri gyda'r pobl ifanc trafferthus, yn hytrach na'r athrawon sydd dan bwysau? A wnaiff egluro'r pwynt a wnaeth am apelau ôl-weithredol—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. David Davies has a unique point of view and is entitled to express it.

**David Davies:** I can assure the Presiding Officer that it is not a unique point of view because it is shared by many teachers across the country.

**Helen Mary Jones:** The Presiding Officer is correct, David, in that you often have an interesting point of view, but will you tell us who these do-gooders are who crawl out of the woodwork to poison our education system and where they are from?

**David Davies:** I am happy to do so. If you had read *The Western Mail* today, you would have seen a report about teachers in a school in Llantwit Major, who were furious when someone who had threatened and shot a teacher with a kind of air pistol was allowed back into the school after being excluded. I suggest that do-gooders sat on the appeal panel that made that decision.

Will the Minister clarify the point about retrospective appeals and assure us that pupils who have been excluded from a pupil referral unit will not be allowed to claim any form of compensation years after the decision has been made. The Liberal Democrat education spokesperson made the point that excluded pupils are more likely to drink, smoke, take drugs and handle stolen goods, which is precisely why some of them do not belong in any form of educational establishment.

**Lorraine Barrett:** David Davies never lets us down. I thought he would be the one to raise a particular ongoing case. It is always dangerous to use a specific individual as an example. I refer you to the *Daily Mirror*, where you might see the other side of the story behind that case. None of us know all the details and we should not use individual cases as examples because there is always another side to the story. While I sympathise with the staff and head teacher of that school, you should consider the case in a calmer way, David.

I support Helen Mary Jones's comments and

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae gan David Davies safbwynt unigryw ac mae ganddo hawl i'w fynegi.

**David Davies:** Gallaf sicrhau'r Llywydd nad yw'n safbwynt unigryw oherwydd fe'i rhennir gan lawer o athrawon ledled y wlad.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Mae'r Llywydd yn gywir, David, wrth ddweud bod eich safbwynt yn aml yn ddiddorol, ond a wnewch ddweud wrthym pwy yw'r ymyrwyr daionus hyn sy'n ymlusgo o'u cuddfannau i wenwyno ein system addysg ac o ble y deuant?

**David Davies:** Yr wyf yn falch o wneud hynny. Pe byddech wedi darllen *The Western Mail* heddiw, byddech wedi gweld adroddiad am athrawon mewn ysgol yn Llanilltud Fawr, a oedd yn gynddeiriog pan oedd rhywun a oedd wedi bygwth a saethu athro â rhyw fath o bistol aer wedi cael dod yn ôl i'r ysgol ar ôl cael ei wahardd. Awgrymaf mai ymyrwyr daionus a oedd yn eistedd ar y panel apêl a wnaeth y penderfyniad hwnnw.

A wnaiff y Gweinidog egluro'r pwynt am apelau ôl-weithredol a'n sicrhau na fydd disgyblion a waharddwyd o uned cyfeirio disgyblion yn cael hawlio unrhyw fath o iawndal flynyddoedd ar ôl y penderfyniad. Llefarydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ar addysg a wnaeth y pwynt bod disgyblion a waharddwyd yn fwy tebygol o yfed, ysmegu, cymryd cyffuriau a thrafod nwyddau sydd wedi'u dwyn, a dyna'r union reswm pam a ddylai rhai ohonynt gael lle mewn unrhyw fath o sefydliad addysgol.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Nid yw David Davies byth yn ein siomi. Tybiais mai ef fyddai'r un i godi un achos penodol cyfredol. Mae bob amser yn beryglus defnyddio unigolyn penodol fel enghraifft. Fe'ch cyfeiriaf at y *Daily Mirror*, lle y gallech weld ochr arall y stori sy'n gefndir i'r achos hwnnw. Ni wyr yr un ohonom yr holl fanylion ac ni ddylem ddefnyddio achosion unigol yn enghreifftiau gan fod ochr arall i'r stori bob amser. Er fy mod yn cydymdeimlo â'r staff a phennaeth yr ysgol honno, dylech ystyried yr achos yn fwy pwylllog, David.

Ategfaf sylwadau Helen Mary Jones a'i chais

her request that the Minister consider, in her review, what other opportunities may be available for pupils who have been excluded from a referral unit. If they are in such a unit, it is clear that they already have problems. If they are expelled, those problems will be compounded. Everyone is entitled to an independent appeal mechanism—that is natural justice. However, what is on offer for those who might lose an appeal to be allowed back into a referral unit? I presume that such questions will be addressed by the Minister's review in due course. I wanted to make the case that everyone is entitled to be heard by an independent appeal panel, even—and I am sure that all Members agree—David Davies, if he were expelled from this Chamber. If that were to happen, could I be on the panel?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. There is no independent appeal process for someone who is expelled from this Chamber.

**Rosemary Butler:** Does the Minister agree that the Prince's Trust is undertaking excellent work to help pupils who are excluded from referral units? Could she speak to ELWa about ensuring that proper funding is available to help the Prince's Trust and these young students who are always in need of assistance?

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I am grateful that Members support the regulations because they are about natural justice. We must ensure, as I described at the outset, that people have a right to appeal against a decision that can affect the rest of their lives. These are temporary regulations to be operated by the same panel composition that is outlined in existing regulations in schools. We had some concerns about that. That is why we need to go through the process of undertaking a proper review.

England recently changed the composition of its independent appeal panels. It considered the requirement on panels to balance the interest of the excluded pupil against the interest of the rest of the school community, prevented exclusions from being overturned solely on the basis of a technical defect in prior procedure, and introduced a new ability

i'r Gweinidog ystyried, yn ei hadolygiad, pa gyfleoedd eraill a allai fod ar gael i ddisgyblion a waharddwyd o uned cyfeirio. Os ydynt mewn uned o'r fath, mae'n amlwg bod ganddynt broblemau eisoes. Os cânt eu diarddel, bydd y problemau hynny'n gwaethygu. Mae gan bawb hawl i fecanwaith apêl annibynnol—cyfiawnder naturiol yw hynny. Fodd bynnag, beth sydd ar gael i'r rhai a allai golli apêl i gael dychwelyd i uned cyfeirio? Cymeraf y bydd cwestiynau o'r fath yn cael eu trafod yn adolygiad y Gweinidog gyda hyn. Yr oeddwn am ddadlau bod gan bawb hawl i wrandawriad gan banel apêl annibynnol, hyd yn oed—ac yr wyf yn siŵr bod yr holl Aelodau'n cytuno—David Davies, os câi ei ddiarddel gan y Siambr hon. Pe digwyddai hynny, a gawn i fod ar y panel?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid oes proses apêl annibynnol ar gyfer rhywun a gaiff ei ddiarddel gan y Siambr hon.

**Rosemary Butler:** A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno bod Ymddiriedolaeth y Tywysog yn gwneud gwaith rhagorol i helpu disgyblion a waharddwyd o unedau cyfeirio? A allai siarad ag ELWa ynghylch sicrhau bod cyllid priodol ar gael i helpu Ymddiriedolaeth y Tywysog a'r myfyrwyr ifanc hyn y mae arnynt angen cymorth bob amser?

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar bod Aelodau'n cefnogi'r rheoliadau gan eu bod yn ymwneud â chyfiawnder naturiol. Rhaid inni sicrhau, fel y disgrifiais ar y dechrau, fod gan bobl hawl i apelio yn erbyn penderfyniad sy'n gallu effeithio ar weddill eu bywyd. Rheoliadau dros dro yw'r rhain sydd i'w gweithredu gan banel sydd â'r un cyfansoddiad â'r un a amlinellir yn y rheoliadau presennol ar gyfer ysgolion. Yr oedd gennym rai pryderon am hynny. Dyna pam y mae'n rhaid inni fynd drwy'r broses o gynnal adolygiad priodol.

Mae Lloegr wedi newid cyfansoddiad ei phaneli apêl annibynnol yn ddiweddar. Ystyriodd y gofyniad i baneli ddal y ddysgl yn wastad rhwng buddiant y disgybl a waharddwyd a buddiant gweddill y gymuned ysgol, ataliodd y gallu i wyrddroi gwaharddiadau ar sail diffyg technegol yn y weithdrefn flaenorol yn unig, a chyflwynodd

for appeal panels in exceptional cases, to overturn an exclusion without directing that a pupil be reinstated in that school. These are sensible proposals, which would be appropriate for us to consider. However, under the Education Act 2002, the Assembly has the responsibility for this; therefore, we need to hold our own consultation on what exclusion mechanisms are right for us. It is also important that we explore the local authority's role in exclusion, because local authorities have a duty to make a place available within three weeks to young people who are excluded from school for whatever reason, to ensure that they are in full-time education. We need to build in a response that takes account of that duty.

David, when you say that there are young people who should not be in any kind of educational establishment, there is a danger of going down the route of saying that certain young people should be excluded from learning opportunities. The Assembly is clear about wanting to balance the interests of excluded pupils against the interests of school communities and others. We should do our best to ensure that all young people have access to learning opportunities. I will also want to take that up in terms of how we tackle exclusions in a way that benefits individuals and the school community and contributes to the individual's learning. Rosemary's point about the Prince's Trust and other similar organisations that can offer valuable educational experiences alongside schools is an important one.

allu newydd i baneli apêl gael gwyrddroi gwaharddiad, mewn achosion eithriadol, heb gyfarwyddo y dylai disgybl gael ei adfer i'r ysgol dan sylw. Mae'r rhain yn gynigion synhwyrol, y byddai'n briodol inni eu hystyried. Fodd bynnag, o dan y Ddeddf Addysg 2002, y Cynulliad sy'n gyfrifol am hyn; felly, rhaid inni gynnal ein hymgyngoriad ein hun ar ba fecanweithiau sy'n iawn i ni. Mae hefyd yn bwysig inni ymchwilio i rôl yr awdurdod lleol mewn gwahardd, gan fod awdurdodau lleol o dan ddyletswydd i ddarparu lle o fewn tair wythnos i bobl ifanc sydd wedi'u gwahardd o'r ysgol am ba bynnag reswm, i sicrhau eu bod mewn addysg lawn-amser. Rhaid inni gynnwys ymateb sy'n ystyried y ddyletswydd honno.

David, pan ddywedwch fod pobl ifanc na ddylent fod mewn unrhyw fath o sefydliad addysgol, mae perygl o ddilyn y llwybr o ddweud y dylai rhai pobl ifanc gael eu hallgáu o gyfleoedd dysgu. Mae'r Cynulliad yn bendant ynghylch dymuno dal y ddysgl yn wastad rhwng buddiannau disgyblion a waharddwyd a buddiannau cymunedau ysgol ac eraill. Dylem wneud ein gorau i sicrhau bod pob person ifanc yn gallu cael cyfleoedd dysgu. Byddaf am godi hynny hefyd yng nghyd-destun ymdrin â gwaharddiadau mewn modd sydd o fudd i unigolion a'r gymuned ysgol ac yn cyfrannu at ddysgu'r unigolyn. Mae'r pwynt a wnaeth Rosemary am Ymddiriedolaeth y Tywysog a chyrrff tebyg sy'n gallu cynnig profiadau addysgol pwysig ochr yn ochr ag ysgolion yn un pwysig.

*Cynnig (NDM1338): O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM1338): For 44, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth

German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1338): O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1338): For 44, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, David Ian



Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd a Thaliadau Optegol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003**  
**Approval of the National Health Service (Optical Charges and Payments) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003**

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

*the National Assembly considers the principle of the National Health Service (Optical Charges and Payments) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003 laid in the Table Office on 14 January 2003. (NDM1341)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the National Health Service (Optical Charges and Payments) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 21 January 2002;*

*2. approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 14 January 2003 and the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 4 February 2003. (NDM1342)*

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd a Thaliadau Optegol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Ionawr 2003. (NDM1341)*

Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5 mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd a Thaliadau Optegol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 21 Ionawr 2003;*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Ionawr 2003 a'r memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd at yr Aelodau trwy'r e-bost ar 4 Chwefror 2003. (NDM1342)*

These regulations further amend the National Health Service (Optical Charges and Payments) Regulations 1997, and will provide for the funding of a second set of optical appliances for certain people up to the age of 19, upon the optician applying for and receiving the approval of the appropriate health authority. The regulations reflect the decision taken by the Assembly early last year to support the Government's amendment to Pauline Jarman's motion that sought to introduce this measure at the optometrist's discretion. The Government's amendment secures this important provision by regulation for the most vulnerable in society with a clear clinical need. Decisions will continue to be taken based on the experience and professionalism of the optometric profession in the primary care setting, supported by the appropriate authorities, ensuring consistency and equality of access across Wales.

**Pauline Jarman:** As colleagues will know, in a few weeks' time, I will stand down from the National Assembly. Before some of you say 'and about time too', I would like to say that it has been an honour and a privilege for me to represent the people of South Wales Central during this historic first Assembly, which has been described by some as a learning curve, by others as a roller-coaster ride and, perhaps uncharitably, by a few as something of a damp squib.

As someone who actively campaigned for a National Assembly for Wales—or as I would have preferred it, a real Parliament for Wales—for as long as I can recall, I feel that there is a huge amount of work to be done if we are serious about winning for our National Assembly its rightful place in the hearts and minds of the people of Wales. Before I take my bow, and devote my energies full time to the rigours of local government in Rhondda Cynon Taf, I hope that Members of all parties will feel able to support the legislation before us today, so that young people in Wales can obtain a second pair of NHS glasses free.

3.20 p.m.

Since I first put this proposal before

Mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn diwygio ymhellach Reoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd a Thaliadau Optegol) 1997, a byddant yn darparu ar gyfer talu am ail set o gyfarpar optegol i rai pobl hyd at 19 oed, pan yw'r optegydd yn gwneud cais ac yn derbyn caniatâd gan yr awdurdod iechyd priodol. Mae'r rheoliadau'n adlewyrchu'r penderfyniad a wnaed gan y Cynulliad yn gynnar y flwyddyn ddiwethaf i gefnogi gwelliant y Llywodraeth i gynnig Pauline Jarman a geisiai gyflwyno'r mesur hwn i'w weithredu yn ôl doethineb yr optometrydd. Mae gwelliant y Llywodraeth yn sicrhau'r ddarpariaeth bwysig hon drwy reoleiddio ar gyfer y rhai sy'n fwyaf agored i niwed mewn cymdeithas sydd ag angen clinigol amlwg. Parheir i wneud penderfyniadau ar sail profiad a phroffesiynoldeb yr optometryddion ym maes gofal sylfaenol, gyda chefnogaeth yr awdurdodau priodol, gan sicrhau mynediad unffurf a chyfartal ledled Cymru.

**Pauline Jarman:** Fel y gŵyr cyd-Aelodau, ymhen ychydig wythnosau, byddaf yn gorffen yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Cyn i rai ohonoch ddweud 'a hen bryd hefyd', hoffwn ddweud mai braint ac anrhydedd i mi oedd cynrychioli pobl Canol De Cymru yn ystod y Cynulliad cyntaf hanesyddol hwn, a alwyd gan rai'n gromlin dysg, gan eraill yn daith wib, a chan rai, yn angharedig o bosibl, yn rhyw fath o fatsien wlyb.

Fel un a fu'n ymgyrchu'n weithredol dros Gynulliad Cenedlaethol i Gymru—neu fel y buasai'n well gennyf fi, Senedd go-iawn i Gymru—hyd y gallaf gofio, teimlaf fod gwaith aruthrol i'w wneud os ydym o ddifrif ynghylch ennill lle priodol i'n Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yng nghalonau a meddyliau pobl Cymru. Cyn imi ymadael, a rhoi o'm hegni'n llawn-amser i waith caled llywodraeth leol yn Rhondda Cynon Taf, gobeithiaf y bydd Aelodau o bob plaid yn teimlo eu bod yn gallu cefnogi'r ddeddfwriaeth sydd ger ein bron heddiw, fel y bydd pobl ifanc yng Nghymru'n gallu cael ail sbectol GIG am ddim.

Ers imi roi'r cynnig hwn gerbron Aelodau

Members a year ago, it has been the subject of extensive consultation. I am pleased that these measures have received broad support from representatives of the profession and UK health departments. Today it has reached the final hurdle, and I hope that Members will give it their full support. Colleagues will be familiar, from previous debates, with the compelling arguments that back this proposal.

I do not intend to cover old ground in any great detail today; the statistics and the arguments speak for themselves. If a child is heavily dependent on glasses and they break, that child's confidence and education suffer tremendously. This legislation has developed out of a genuine concern for the welfare of these young people. Furthermore, the financial implications of the proposal can be accommodated within existing planned provision for contractual payments within the family health services budget expenditure line.

Today there is an opportunity for the Assembly to make a real difference to the lives of young people in Wales. I am often asked by people in South Wales Central, an area which I am proud voted 'yes' in 1997, 'What has the Assembly done for us?'. I hope that colleagues will today give this legislation their final approval, so that the next time that I am asked that question, there will be one more compelling piece of evidence that I can use to demonstrate to people in our communities that we can make a difference and that they were right to have the confidence to vote 'Yes for Wales' almost six years ago.

**Kirsty Williams:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats are happy to support the changes that are before us and to acknowledge that Pauline Jarman first brought this idea before the Chamber. At that time, I expressed my reservations about its practicality. However, those reservations have been overcome during the consultation period and the regulations have been drawn up in such a way as to ensure continuity so that opticians are not put in the invidious position of having to choose who should receive a second pair of spectacles. Existing regulations allow for a

flwyddyn yn ôl, bu ymgynghori helaeth arno. Yr wyf yn falch bod y mesurau hyn wedi'u cefnogi'n gyffredinol gan gynrychiolwyr y proffesiwn ac adrannau iechyd y DU. Heddiw daeth at ei chlwyd olaf, a gobeithiaf y bydd Aelodau'n ei chefnogi'n llawn. Bydd cyd-Aelodau'n gyfarwydd, ar ôl y dadleuon blaenorol, â'r dadleuon perswadiol o blaid y cynnig hwn.

Ni fwriadaf ymdrin yn fanwl heddiw â dim a ddywedwyd o'r blaen; mae'r ystadegau a'r dadleuon yn siarad drostynt eu hunain. Os yw plentyn yn ddibynnol iawn ar sbectol a honno'n torri, mae hyder ac addysg y plentyn hwnnw'n dioddef yn aruthrol. Mae'r ddeddfwriaeth hon wedi codi o wir bryder am les y bobl ifanc hyn. Yn ogystal â hynny, gellir darparu ar gyfer goblygiadau ariannol y cynnig o fewn y ddarpariaeth a gynlluniwyd eisoes ar gyfer taliadau cytundebol yn y llinell gwariant cyllideb i wasanaethau iechyd teuluol.

Mae cyfle heddiw i'r Cynulliad wneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol ym mywydau pobl ifanc yng Nghymru. Mae pobl yng Nghanol De Cymru, sy'n ardal yr wyf yn falch o ddweud ei bod wedi rhoi pleidlais 'ie' yn 1997, yn gofyn yn aml imi, 'Beth a wnaeth y Cynulliad drosom ni?' Gobeithiaf y bydd cyd-Aelodau'n cymeradwyo'r ddeddfwriaeth hon yn derfynol heddiw, fel y bydd un darn arall o dystiolaeth berswadiol y tro nesaf y gofynnir y cwestiwn hwnnw i mi, y gallaf ei ddefnyddio i ddangos i bobl yn ein cymunedau ein bod yn gallu gwneud gwahaniaeth a'u bod yn iawn i fod yn ddigon hyderus i bleidleisio 'Ie dros Gymru' ymron i chwe blynedd yn ôl.

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn falch o gefnogi'r newidiadau syd ger ein bron ac o gydnabod mai Pauline Jarman a ddaeth â'r syniad hwn gerbron y Siambr yn gyntaf. Ar y pryd, mynegais amheuon ynghylch ei ymarferoldeb. Fodd bynnag, cafwyd gwared â'r amheuon hynny yn ystod y cyfnod ymgynghori ac mae'r rheoliadau wedi'u llunio yn y fath fodd fel eu bod yn sicrhau dilyniant, fel na fydd optegwyr yn y sefyllfa gas o orfod dewis pwy a ddylai gael ail sbectol. Mae'r rheoliadau presennol yn

second pair of spectacles to be given to children, but the changes proposed today move that agenda forward. I am pleased that we have been able to take the principle of legislation proposed under Standing Order No. 29 and, after developing it further, act upon it.

**David Melding:** I congratulate a fellow Member for South Wales Central and wish her well for the future. It is an achievement to get a piece of legislation accepted and brought forward by the Minister. We will miss the Member's contributions in future. Like the Chair of the Health and Social Services Committee, I think that it is to be hoped that public policy in this area will be clarified and that the flexibility that we would all want—that is, in certain cases, it is appropriate to provide a spare pair of spectacles—is now ensured in the system. It is important that the system is not abused, but is used responsibly. I am sure that all involved will do so. We will support the motion.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I thank Pauline for her contribution; she did indeed bring the principle of this legislation before the Assembly in her debate under Standing Order No. 29. The regulations reflect the decision that we took in January last year, while also strengthening and securing the provision already available by means of guidance issued in 1997. I am glad that all Members appear to support these measures.

caniatáu rhoi ail sbectol i blant, ond mae'r newidiadau a gynigir heddiw yn symud yr agenda honno yn ei blaen. Yr wyf yn falch ein bod wedi gallu derbyn egwyddor deddfwriaeth a gynigiwyd o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29 a'n bod, ar ôl ei datblygu ymhellach, wedi gweithredu'n unol â hynny.

**David Melding:** Llongyfarchaf gyd-Aelod dros Ganol De Cymru a dymunaf yn dda iddi ar gyfer y dyfodol. Mae'n gamp cael gan y Gweinidog dderbyn deddfwriaeth a'i dwyn gerbron. Byddwn yn colli cyfraniadau'r Aelod yn y dyfodol. Yn yr un modd â Chadeirydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, credaf mai'r gobaith yw y bydd gwedd eglurach ar bolisi cyhoeddus yn y maes hwn a bod yr hyblygrwydd y byddem oll yn dymuno ei gael—sef, mewn rhai achosion, ei bod yn briodol darparu sbectol wrth gefn—wedi'i sicrhau bellach yn y system. Mae'n bwysig na chaiff y system ei chamddefnyddio, a'i bod yn cael ei defnyddio'n gyfrifol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd pawb sy'n gysylltiedig yn gwneud hynny. Cefnogwn y cynnig.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Diolchaf i Pauline am ei chyfraniad; hi, yn wir, a ddaeth ag egwyddor y deddfwriaeth hon gerbron y Cynulliad yn ei dadl o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29. Mae'r rheoliadau'n adlewyrchu'r penderfyniad a wnaethom ym mis Ionawr y llynedd, a hefyd yn cryfhau ac yn sicrhau'r ddarpariaeth sydd eisoes ar gael drwy gyfarwyddyd a gyhoeddwyd yn 1997. Yr wyf yn falch bod yr holl Aelodau, yn ôl pob golwg, yn cefnogi'r mesurau hyn.

*Cynnig (NDM1341): O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1341): For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint

Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1341): O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1341): For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina

Hutt, Jane  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, David Ian  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Penodi Personau i Weinyddu'r Llw Appointment of Persons to Administer the Oath**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer (John Marek):** I propose that  
**Y Dirprwy Lywydd (John Marek):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales resolves that any person occupying a post of Clerk to the Assembly, Deputy Clerk to the Assembly, or in the absence of both the Clerk and Deputy Clerk, a member of the senior civil service within the Presiding Office shall be a person appointed by the Assembly under Section 20(2) of the Government of Wales Act 1998 to be a person before whom the oath can be taken or the affirmation made. (NDM1332)*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn penderfynu y bydd unrhyw berson sy'n gweithio fel Clerc y Cynulliad, Dirprwy Glerc y Cynulliad, neu yn absenoldeb y Clerc a'r Dirprwy Glerc, aelod o'r uwch wasanaeth sifil o fewn Swyddfa'r Llywydd yn berson a benodir gan y Cynulliad o dan adran 20(2) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 i fod yn berson y gellir cymryd y llw neu wneud y datganiad o'i flaen. (NDM1332)*

This is an administrative elucidation so that, when we start the next Assembly, more than one person can administer the oath: that could be the Clerk to the Assembly, the Deputy Clerk or any member of the senior civil service—some two or three officials would be eligible. That would mean that Members should not have to wait for an undue length of time before they take the oath in the new Assembly. There is nothing more to this motion than that; I commend it to Plenary.

Eglurhad gweinyddol yw hwn fel y bydd mwy nag un person yn gallu gweinyddu'r llw, pan ddechreuwn y Cynulliad nesaf: gallai fod yn Glerc i'r Cynulliad, yn Ddirprwy Glerc neu'n unrhyw aelod o'r uwch wasanaeth sifil—byddai rhyw ddau neu dri swyddog yn gymwys. Golygai hynny na fyddai Aelodau'n gorfod disgwyl yn hwy na rhaid cyn cymryd y llw yn y Cynulliad newydd. Nid oes mwy na hynny yn y cynnig hwn; fe'i cymeradwyaf i'r Cyfarfod Llawn.

**John Griffiths:** In considering administering the oath, I look forward to some future developments. Members should be given a choice: those who wish to swear allegiance to the sovereign should be allowed to do so, but republicans, such as myself, should have the opportunity to take an alternative oath, for example, to serve the people of Wales. This is a badly needed change, which is in keeping with our new modern democracy in Wales and with the modern age.

**David Melding:** Most of us in this Chamber regard it appropriate to take an oath, at present and in future, which honours the head of state and the constitution.

**Elin Jones:** Yr wyf hefyd—*[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae hon yn ddadl gyfansoddiadol ddiddorol.

**Elin Jones:** Yr wyf yn cefnogi galwad John Griffiths dros gynnig dewis amgen o lw i Aelodau'r Cynulliad a fydd yn gwasanaethu yn yr ail Gynulliad, fel y bydd y rheini ohonom sydd yn weriniaethwyr yn gallu tyngu llw i Gymru ac i bobl Cymru.

**Alun Pugh:** I did not intend to speak in this debate but my colleague, John Griffiths, made a good point. My priority is to serve the inhabitants—*[Interruption.]*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This is an ordinary debate, like any other.

**Alun Pugh:** My priority is to serve the inhabitants of Colwyn Bay, Abergele and Ruthin rather than the inhabitants of Buckingham Palace. The Richard commission should consider this matter.

**David Davies:** I will make one point. We live in a constitutional democracy, in which it is accepted that the monarch is the head of state. In a democracy, we must all do and accept things with which we do not necessarily agree: the Assembly is an obvious example for me. Unlike certain people in this Chamber, I am prepared to accept a

**John Griffiths:** Wrth ystyried gweinyddu'r llw, edrychaf ymlaen at rai datblygiadau yn y dyfodol. Dylai Aelodau gael dewis: dylai'r rhai sy'n dymuno talu llw teryngarwch i'r Frenhines gael gwneud hynny, ond dylai gweriniaethwyr, fel myfi, gael y cyfle i dyngu llw arall, er enghraifft, i wasanaethu pobl Cymru. Mae taer angen y newid hwn, sy'n gydnaws â'n democratiaeth fodern newydd yng Nghymru a'r oes fodern.

**David Melding:** Mae'r rhan fwyaf ohonom yn y Siambr hon yn ei ystyried yn briodol cymryd llw, ar hyn o bryd ac yn y dyfodol, sy'n anrhydeddu pen y wladwriaeth a'r cyfansoddiad.

**Elin Jones:** I also—*[Interruption.]*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This is an interesting constitutional debate.

**Elin Jones:** I support John Griffiths's call for Assembly Members who will serve in the second Assembly to be given an alternative choice of oath, so that those of us who are republicans will be able to swear an oath of allegiance to Wales and to the people of Wales.

**Alun Pugh:** Nid oeddwn wedi bwriadu siarad yn y ddadl hon ond mae fy nghyd-Aelod, John Griffiths, wedi gwneud pwynt da. Fy mlaenoriaeth i yw gwasanaethu trigolion—*[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Dadl arferol yw hon, fel unrhyw un arall.

**Alun Pugh:** Fy mlaenoriaeth i yw gwasanaethu trigolion Bae Colwyn, Abergele a Rhuthun yn hytrach na thrigolion Palas Buckingham. Dylai comisiwn Richard ystyried y mater hwn.

**David Davies:** Gwnaf un pwynt. Yr ydym yn byw mewn democratiaeth gyfansoddiadol, lle y derbynnir mai'r Frenhines yw pen y wladwriaeth. Mewn democratiaeth, rhaid i bob un ohonom wneud a derbyn pethau nad ydym yn cytuno â hwy o reidrwydd: mae'r Cynulliad yn enghraifft amlwg yn fy achos i. Yn wahanol i rai yn y Siambr hon, yr wyf yn

democratic mandate for a change to the constitution. However, I am not aware of any democratic mandate to remove the Queen as head of state. Until then, all Members who are elected to the Assembly or Parliament should continue to swear an oath of allegiance to the Queen.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Pan soniodd David Davies am y teulu brenhinol, tybiais ei fod yn dychwelyd at ei thema flaenorol o blant a phobl ifanc sydd yn cyflawni gweithrediadau gwrthgymdeithasol ac sydd yn gweithredu mewn ffordd na fyddem yn ei chymeradwyo.

**Alun Cairns:** I will contribute briefly to this debate. I respect the viewpoint of many of the republicans who have spoken today. However, it is ironic and hypocritical that many of those same republicans attend events at Buckingham Palace and take pleasure in meeting Her Majesty, the Queen, when she visits the Assembly, as well as in many other royal engagements.

3.30 p.m.

**Richard Edwards:** I will not take any lessons in hypocrisy from an Assembly Member who does not believe in this Assembly, yet, at the same time, is a Member of it. As somebody who, like Pauline Jarman, will not be returning to the Assembly in May, I agree with John Griffiths's temperate, sensible statement. It is sensible and progressive that Members who are republicans, though not necessarily nationalists, should have the choice of swearing an oath of allegiance to the people of Wales rather than to any parasite in Buckingham Palace.

**Peter Law:** It is interesting how this has arisen after three and a half years, and I am touched by some of my colleagues' comments. However, if the principle is the same as in Parliament—and I agree with the Deputy Presiding Officer's bringing this forward—that is, no oath, no pay, I would be interested to see who is the fastest in here on 2 May.

**The Presiding Officer:** I think that I should

barod i dderbyn mandad democrataidd ar gyfer newid i'r cyfansoddiad. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn ymwybodol o unrhyw fandad democrataidd i gael gwared â'r Frenhines fel pen y wladwriaeth. Tan hynny, dylai'r holl Aelodau a etholir i'r Cynulliad neu i'r Senedd barhau i dalu llw teyrngarwch i'r Frenhines.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** When David Davies mentioned the royal family, I thought he was going to return to his earlier theme of children and young people who commit anti-social acts and who behave in ways of which we would not approve.

**Alun Cairns:** Gwnaf gyfrannu'n fyr i'r ddadl hon. Parchaf safbwynt llawer o'r gweriniaethwyr a siaradodd heddiw. Fodd bynnag, eironig a rhagrithiol yw bod llawer o'r gweriniaethwyr hynny'n ymbresenoli mewn digwyddiadau ym Mhalas Buckingham ac yn ymhyfrydu mewn cwrdd â'i Mawrhydi y Frenhines, pan ymwêl â'r Cynulliad, ac ar lawer o achlysuron brenhinol eraill hefyd.

**Richard Edwards:** Ni chymeraf unrhyw wersi mewn rhagrith gan Aelod Cynulliad nad yw'n credu yn y Cynulliad hwn ac sydd eto, ar yr un pryd, yn Aelod ohono. A siarad fel rhywun na fydd yn dychwelyd i'r Cynulliad ym mis Mai, fel Pauline Jarman hithau, cytunaf â datganiad cymedrol a synhwyrol John Griffiths. Peth synhwyrol a blaengar yw y dylai Aelodau sy'n weriniaethwyr, er nad ydynt o reidrwydd yn genedlaetholwyr, gael y dewis o dalu llw teyrngarwch i bobl Cymru yn hytrach nag unrhyw baraseit ym Mhalas Buckingham.

**Peter Law:** Mae'n ddiddorol bod hyn wedi codi ar ôl tair blynedd a hanner, ac mae rhai o sylwadau fy nghyd-Aelodau wedi cyffwrdd â'm calon. Fodd bynnag, os yw'r egwyddor yr un fath ag ydyw yn y Senedd—a chytunaf y dylai'r Dirprwy Lywydd fod wedi dod â hyn gerbron—hynny yw, dim llw, dim tâl, byddai o ddiddordeb imi weld pwy fydd y cyflymaf drwy'r drws ar 2 Mai.

**Y Llywydd:** Credaf y dylwn alw'n awr ar y



now call the Deputy Presiding Officer to respond. Dirprwy Lywydd i ymateb.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** If I were to say that this whole debate was out of order, I would be ruled out of order by the Presiding Officer, so I will not say it. [*Laughter.*] Clearly, it was in order. However, the proposal is simply a matter of convenience for Members in taking the oath at the beginning of the next Assembly. Members are entitled to seek ways and means of proposing motions in order for further consideration to be given to the views that they have expressed. However, this is a slightly different matter. The proposal is administratively helpful to the National Assembly, and I hope that Members will commend it.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Pe dywedwn fod y ddadl hon i gyd allan o drefn, byddai'r Llywydd yn dyfarnu fy mod allan o drefn, felly ni ddywedaf hynny. [*Chwerthin.*] Wrth gwrs, yr oedd mewn trefn. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r cynnig ond yn fater o gyfleuster i Aelodau wrth gymryd y llw ar ddechrau'r Cynulliad nesaf. Mae hawl gan Aelodau i geisio dulliau o roi cynigion gerbron er mwyn rhoi rhagor o ystyriaeth i'r safbwyntiau y maent wedi'u mynegi. Fodd bynnag, mae'r mater hwn braidd yn wahanol. Mae'r cynnig o gymorth i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn weinyddol, a gobeithiaf y bydd Aelodau'n ei gymeradwyo.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am grateful to the Deputy Presiding Officer, as always, for his advice in these matters.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Dirprwy Lywydd, fel yr wyf bob amser, am ei gyngor ar y materion hyn.

*Cynnig (NDM1332): O blaid 42, Ymatal 2, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1332): For 42, Abstain 2, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Melding, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Davies, Geraint  
 Pugh, Alun

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.32 p.m.  
 The Deputy Presiding Officer came to the Chair at 3.32 p.m.*

**Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol am Wasanaethau  
 ar gyfer Plant ag Anghenion Iechyd Arbennig  
 The Health and Social Services Committee's Report on Services for Children  
 with Special Health Needs**

**Kirsty Williams:** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales notes the report of the Health and Social Services Committee on its review of services for children with special health needs, which was laid in the Table Office on 11 December 2002. (NDM1343)*

In June 2001, the Health and Social Services Committee decided that it wanted to consider in detail issues surrounding children's health and wellbeing. It would have been impossible to do justice to such a wide subject in the time available. Therefore, following informal consultation with professionals and the voluntary sector in the summer of that year, we narrowed the scope of the review to focus on services for children with special health needs. In October of that year, we published our terms of reference and went out to widespread public consultation.

Children in Wales experience a wide range of chronic health problems and disabilities, but there are issues that are common to many.

**Kirsty Williams:** Cynigiad fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn nodi Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar ei adolygiad o'r gwasanaethau i blant ag anghenion iechyd arbennig a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Rhagfyr 2002. (NDM1343)*

Ym Mehefin 2001, penderfynodd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ei fod yn dymuno ystyried yn fanwl faterion sy'n ymwneud ag iechyd a lles plant. Buasai'n amhosibl gwneud cyfiawnder â phwnc mor eang yn yr amser a oedd ar gael. Felly, ar ôl ymgynghori'n anffurfiol â gweithwyr proffesiynol a'r sector gwirfoddol yn haf y flwyddyn honno, gwnaethom gyfyngu ar gwmpas yr adolygiad er mwyn canolbwyntio ar wasanaethau ar gyfer plant ag anghenion iechyd arbennig. Ym mis Hydref y flwyddyn honno, gwanethom gyhoeddi ein cylch gorchwyl a mynd ati i ymgynghori'n eang â'r cyhoedd.

Mae plant yng Nghymru'n profi amrediad eang o broblemau iechyd cronig ac anableddau, ond mae rhai materion sy'n

We identified eight key aspects of the service for consultation. We received evidence from many parents and carers, as well as from service providers and voluntary groups. Around 70 organisations and individuals sent us their written views, and 19 were invited to discuss them with the Committee. I take this opportunity to thank all those who gave evidence, whether in written or oral form. I know that it was not easy for many of the families to find the time to come to talk to the Committee about their experiences, but their contribution helped us to build a picture of what was happening in Wales, and what needed to happen.

The issues are not just about health and social care, and they cannot be looked at separately from education issues and the other services that these children need. Our review also involved the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee and the Local Government and Housing Committee, and I place on record my thanks to Gwenda Thomas and Cynog Dafis who represented their Committees' interests in our discussions. I also thank Professor Jo Sibert of the University of Wales School of Medicine's department of child health and his team of researchers for their work in producing the literature review for the Wales Office of Research and Development for Health and Social Care. The presentation of its findings to the Committee meant that we also benefited from that professional knowledge and expertise. I hope that the literature review, which is considerable, will prove to be a source of valuable information, not only to Members, but to all those working on child health issues.

There is no doubt that much progress has been made in providing services for children with special health needs and that there is greater awareness of those needs. The Committee received much evidence of apparent good practice but, unfortunately, there was little or no systematic identification or evaluation of this practice, nor were there many easy means of disseminating it. The key to success, we believe, is the better co-ordination of services. Services should focus on the needs of the child and his or her family. The constraints of rigid,

gyffredin i lawer. Gwnaethom nodi wyth agwedd allweddol ar y gwasanaeth ar gyfer ymgynghori. Cawsom dystiolaeth gan lawer o rieni a gofalwyr, a hefyd gan ddarparwyr gwasanaethau a grwpiau gwirfoddol. Gwnaeth tua 70 o gyrff ac unigolion anfon eu barn atom yn ysgrifenedig, a gwahoddwyd 19 ohonynt i drafod eu barn gyda'r Pwyllgor. Achubaf ar y cyfle hwn i ddiolch i bawb a roddodd dystiolaeth, boed honno yn ysgrifenedig neu ar lafar. Gwn nad oedd yn hawdd i lawer o'r teuluoedd gael amser i ddod i siarad â'r Pwyllgor am eu profiadau, ond yr oedd eu cyfraniad yn gymorth inni ffurfio darlun o'r hyn a oedd yn digwydd yng Nghymru, a beth a ddylai ddigwydd.

Mae'r materion dan sylw'n ymwneud â mwy nag iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yn unig, ac ni ellir edrych arnynt ar wahân i faterion addysg a'r gwasanaethau eraill y mae ar y plant hyn eu hangen. Yr oedd ein hadolygiad hefyd yn cynnwys y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes a'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai, a rhoddaf ar gof a chadw fy niolchiadau i Gwenda Thomas a Cynog Dafis a gynrychiolodd fuddiannau eu Pwyllgorau yn ein trafodaethau. Diolchaf hefyd i'r Athro Jo Sibert o adran iechyd plant Ysgol Feddyaeth Prifysgol Cymru a'i dîm o ymchwilyr am eu gwaith wrth gynhyrchu'r adolygiad o lenyddiaeth i Swyddfa Ymchwil a Datblygu Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol Cymru. Am ei bod wedi cyflwyno ei chanfyddiadau i'r Pwyllgor, yr oeddem ninnau wedi cael budd o'r wybodaeth a'r arbenigedd proffesiynol hwnnw. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr adolygiad o lenyddiaeth, sy'n un sylweddol, yn profi'n ffynhonnell wybodaeth werthfawr, nid yn unig i Aelodau, ond i bawb sy'n gweithio ar faterion iechyd plant.

Nid oes amheuaeth na wnaed llawer o gynnydd yn y gwaith o ddarparu gwasanaethau ar gyfer plant ag anghenion iechyd arbennig a bod mwy o ymwybyddiaeth o'r anghenion hynny. Cafodd y Pwyllgor lawer o dystiolaeth o arferion a ymddangosai'n rhai da ond, gwaetha'r modd, nid oedd y nesaf peth i ddim o ddynodi neu werthuso systematig ar yr arferion hyn, ac nid oedd llawer o ddulliau o'u lledaenu'n rhwydd ychwaith. Yr allwedd i lwyddiant, yn ein barn ni, yw gwell cydlynau ar wasanaethau. Dylai gwasanaethau

organisational structures preclude that, and the Committee seeks to make further improvements as too many barriers remain between agencies that should be working together. A child-centred approach considers the child's needs holistically as well as in the context of the wider family. Brothers and sisters should be helped to understand their sibling's condition, thereby ensuring that their own development and relationship within the family does not take second place. The Committee's report contains 27 recommendations, many of which would not be costly to implement. They are about better and more efficient ways of working, which could, in the longer term, save money and resources and ensure that families' needs are met before they reach crisis point.

I will briefly highlight some of our recommendations. There was much concern about the importance of early diagnosis and the benefits of early intervention. We heard different views from paediatricians about the value of universal child surveillance and I am pleased that, in response to these concerns, the Minister has already established a group, led by the Chief Medical Officer for Wales, to consider child health surveillance. The Committee recommended that the working group's findings inform the national service framework for children and we also recommended that the new local health boards should have strategies to ensure that there is early access to diagnostic services for vulnerable babies. There was evidence that the professionals giving advice and information to parents following diagnosis did not always appreciate how difficult it was for parents to absorb and understand the information being given at such a difficult, stressful and often traumatic time. We felt that parents needed time to digest what they had been told, and an opportunity to return at a later date to ask more questions. How information is given at the time of diagnosis must be carefully and sympathetically planned and it should be given in an appropriate environment and through the right medium. More training is needed so that providing information becomes an integral part of the diagnostic process and not an

ganolbwyntio ar anghenion y plentyn a'i deulu. Mae'r cyfyngiadau mewn strwythurau trefniadol anhyblyg yn atal hynny, ac mae'r Pwyllgor yn ceisio sicrhau gwelliannau pellach gan fod gormod o rwystrau o hyd rhwng asiantaethau a ddylai fod yn cydweithio. Drwy ddull gweithredu plentyn-ganolog, ystyrir anghenion y plentyn yn gyfannol a hefyd yng nghyd-destun y teulu ehangach. Dylid helpu brodyr a chworydd i ddeall anhwylder eu brawd neu chwaer, gan sicrhau drwy hynny nad yw eu datblygiad a'u perthynas eu hun o fewn y teulu'n dod yn ail. Ceir 27 o argymhellion yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor, a gellid rhoi llawer ohonynt ar waith heb fynd i gostau mawr. Maent yn ymwneud â dulliau gweithio gwell a mwy effeithlon a allai arbed arian ac adnoddau, yn y tymor hwy, a sicrhau y diwellir anghenion teuluoedd cyn iddynt fynd yn rhai argyfyngus.

Tynnaf sylw'n fyr at rai o'n hargymhellion. Yr oedd llawer o bryder ynghylch pwysigrwydd diagnosis cynnar a'r manteision o ymyrryd yn gynnar. Clywsom wahanol farn gan bediatregwyr am werth gwyliadwriaeth gyffredinol ar blant ac yr wyf yn falch bod y Gweinidog, mewn ymateb i'r pryderon hyn, wedi sefydlu grŵp eisoes, o dan arweiniad Prif Swyddog Meddygol Cymru, i ystyried gwyliadwriaeth iechyd plant. Gwnaeth y Pwyllgor argymhell y dylai canfyddiadau'r gweithgor gael eu hystyried yng nghyd-destun y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol i blant a gwnaethom argymhell hefyd y dylai'r byrddau iechyd lleol newydd fod â strategaethau i sicrhau y gellir cael gwasanaethau diagnostig yn gynnar ar gyfer babanod eiddil. Yr oedd tystiolaeth nad oedd y gweithwyr proffesiynol a roddai gyngor a gwybodaeth i rieni ar ôl rhoi diagnosis yn deall bob amser mor anodd ydoedd i rieni amgyffred a deall y wybodaeth a roddid ar adeg sy'n anodd, yn llawn straen ac yn drawmatig yn aml. Teimlem fod ar rieni angen amser i dreulio'r hyn a ddywedid wrthynt, a chyfle i ddychwelyd ar ôl hynny i ofyn rhagor o gwestiynau. Rhaid cynllunio'r dull o roi gwybodaeth ar adeg diagnosis mewn modd gofalus a llawn cydymdeimlad a dylid ei rhoi mewn amgylchedd addas a thrwy'r cyfrwng iawn. Mae angen mwy o hyfforddiant fel bod darparu gwybodaeth yn dod yn rhan annatod o'r broses ddiagnostig

incidental afterthought, involving shoving an often out-of-date leaflet into an upset parent's hands.

The effective co-ordination of care is perhaps the single most important issue that we identified, and is the starting point of a holistic approach to the assessment of the child's and the family's needs. The appointment of a care co-ordinator or key worker as the first point of contact for the family could reduce stress and frustration for parents who may be overwhelmed by the plethora of agencies with which they must deal.

Most Members will have received correspondence about shortages in therapy services, especially speech and language therapy. The increased demand for these services is not confined to Wales; there are problems across the UK that must be addressed. We need long-term strategies, but, in the short term, the Government must work with these professions to discover what can be done to manage the service more effectively and to provide support to the therapists delivering it. The possibility of training therapy assistants to deliver basic services under supervision could be explored.

The Committee considered that the school nursing service could be the keystone supporting the links between the family and health, education and social care services. We hope that the recommendations of Professor Dame Jill Macleod Clark's report on school nursing will be implemented fully. Access to respite care, particularly in times of crisis, is crucial, and we were concerned at the variation in its availability across Wales. Respite care benefits the whole family, but each family has differing needs. While respite care for the weekend is valuable to some, a few hours to allow parents some freedom can be of a huge help to others. What suits one family might not suit another. Flexibility in respite provision is essential.

ac nid yn rhywbeth y digwyddir meddwl amdano wedyn, sy'n golygu gwrthio taflen, a honno wedi dyddio mewn llawer achos, i ddwylo rhiant gofidus.

Yr angen i gydlynu gofal yn effeithiol yw'r mater pwysicaf y gwnaethom ei nodi, o bosibl, a hwnnw yw'r man cychwyn i ymagwedd gyfannol at asesu anghenion y plentyn a'r teulu. Drwy benodi cydlynnydd gofal neu weithiwr allweddol yn bwynt cyswllt cyntaf i'r teulu, gellid lleihau'r tyndra a'r rhwystredigaeth a deimlir gan rieni a allai gael eu llethu gan y gormodedd o asiantaethau y maent yn gorfod delio â hwy.

Bydd y rhan fwyaf o Aelodau wedi cael gohebiaeth am brinder mewn gwasanaethau therapi, yn enwedig therapi iaith a lleferydd. Nid yn unig yng Nghymru y mae'r galw am y gwasanaethau hyn ar gynnydd; ceir problemau ledled y DU y mae'n rhaid ymdrin â hwy. Mae arnom angen strategaethau tymor-hir, ond, yn y tymor byr, rhaid i'r Llywodraeth weithio gyda'r proffesiynau hyn i ddarganfod beth y gellir ei wneud i reoli'r gwasanaeth yn fwy effeithiol a chynorthwyo'r therapyddion sy'n ei ddarparu. Gellid ymchwilio i'r posibilrwydd o hyfforddi cynorthwywyr therapi i ddarparu gwasanaethau sylfaenol o dan oruchwyliaeth.

Yr oedd y Pwyllgor o'r farn y gallai'r gwasanaeth nyrsio ysgol fod yn gonglfaen i gynnal y cysylltiadau rhwng y teulu a gwasanaethau iechyd, addysg a gofal cymdeithasol. Gobeithiwn y bydd yr argymhellion yn adroddiad yr Athro y Fonesig Jill Macleod Clark ar nyrsio ysgol yn cael eu gweithredu'n llawn. Mae'r gallu i gael gofal seibiant, yn enwedig ar adegau o argyfwng, yn hollbwysig, ac yr oeddem yn bryderus ynghylch yr amrywiaeth yn y ddarpariaeth ohono ledled Cymru. Mae gofal seibiant yn dod â budd i'r teulu cyfan, ond mae anghenion pob teulu'n wahanol. Tra bo gofal seibiant dros y penwythnos yn werthfawr i rai, mae ychydig oriau i roi rhywfaint o ryddid i rieni yn gallu bod o gymorth mawr iawn i eraill. Nid yw'r hyn sy'n addas i un teulu yn addas i un arall o reidrwydd. Mae'n hollbwysig cael hyblygrwydd yn y ddarpariaeth o ofal seibiant.

3.40 p.m.

In the course of our investigation, Committee members visited several schemes that provide advice and support to families. I am pleased that we were able to return to the special needs activity club in Margam just before Christmas to formally launch our report. Such organisations are voluntary, and their success are due to the determination and commitment of their members, many of whom have children with special needs themselves. We would like local authorities throughout Wales to support similar centres. Issues related to the provision of equipment cause anguish for many families. Sometimes the child has outgrown equipment before it is even delivered. We recommend that the statutory agencies pool their equipment budgets, the management of stores and use of equipment. Equipment that is no longer required by a client should be quickly passed on to someone who may be able to use it.

We welcome the move to bring special needs education into mainstream schooling. However, special needs services in mainstream schools should be monitored carefully. We recommend that the national service framework for children contain a detailed section on special education and health needs. Furthermore, a member of each local health board should be given responsibility for children's services and rights.

Finally, I referred earlier to the need to evaluate and disseminate good practice and information. We believe that the national service framework should and could provide the means for this to happen. As Chair of the Committee, I look forward to receiving a full response from the Welsh Assembly Government. I hope that, in years to come, the appropriate Subject Committee— whoever the Chair and its members may be— will look back on this report and use it as a way to evaluate the implementation and the progress that the Assembly has made in this special area.

Yn ystod ein hymchwiliad, ymwelodd aelodau'r Pwyllgor â sawl cynllun sy'n darparu cyngor a chymorth i deuluoedd. Yr wyf yn falch ein bod wedi gallu dychwelyd i'r clwb gweithgareddau anghenion arbennig ym Margam ychydig cyn y Nadolig i lansio ein hadroddiad yn ffurfiol. Mae cyrff o'r fath yn wirfoddol, ac mae eu llwyddiant yn ganlyniad i benderfyniad ac ymroddiad eu haelodau, y mae gan lawer ohonynt blant ag anghenion arbennig eu hunain. Byddem yn falch pe byddai awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru'n cynorthwyo canolfannau tebyg. Mae materion sy'n ymwneud â darparu offer yn peri gofid i lawer o deuluoedd. Weithiau bydd y plentyn wedi mynd yn rhy fawr i'r offer cyn eu danfon hyd yn oed. Yr ydym yn argymhell y dylai'r asiantaethau statudol gyfuno eu cyllidebau offer, y rheolaeth ar eu storfeydd a'r defnydd o offer. Wedi i angen y cleient am yr offer ddod i ben, dylid eu trosglwyddo'n gyflym i rywun a allai eu defnyddio.

Yr ydym yn croesawu'r camau a gymerir i ddod ag addysg anghenion arbennig i addysg y brif ffrwd. Serch hynny, dylid monitro gwasanaethau anghenion arbennig yn ysgolion y brif ffrwd yn fanwl. Yr ydym yn argymhell y dylai'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol i blant gynnwys adran fanwl ar anghenion addysg ac iechyd arbennig. At hynny, dylid rhoi cyfrifoldeb i aelod o bob bwrdd iechyd lleol dros wasanaethau a hawliau plant.

Yn olaf, cyfeiriais yn gynharach at yr angen i werthuso a lledaenu arferion da a gwybodaeth. Credwn y dylai ac y gallai'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol fod yn fodd i gyflawni hynny. Fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor, edrychaf ymlaen at gael ymateb llawn gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Gobeithiaf, yn y blynyddoedd sydd i ddod, y bydd y Pwyllgor Pwnc priodol—pwy bynnag fo'i Gadeirydd a'i aelodau—yn edrych yn ôl ar yr adroddiad hwn ac yn ei ddefnyddio'n fodd i werthuso gweithrediad a chynnydd y Cynulliad yn y maes arbennig hwn.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Eleven **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae 11 o Aelodau

Members have requested to speak in this debate, therefore I would be obliged if Members made succinct speeches wherever possible so that I can call everyone who wishes to speak.

**David Lloyd:** Diolchaf i bawb a fu'n ymwneud â'r adolygiad hwn o wasanaethau ar gyfer plant ag anghenion iechyd arbennig. Diolchaf hefyd i'r plant a'r rhieni sydd wedi brwydro am flynyddoedd gyda system sy'n gallu ymddangos yn ddidostur, yn oeraidd ac yn bell. Diolchaf i'r holl fudiadau ac unigolion yn y maes a gyflwynodd dystiolaeth, i'm cyd-Aelodau, ac i glerc a dirprwy glerc y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol am eu gwaith dygn a phwrpasol bob amser.

Caiff plant ag anghenion iechyd arbennig eu diffinio fel plant â nam corfforol, cyflyrau meddygol cymhleth neu gronig, neu anawsterau emosiynol, ymddygiad neu ddysgu. Mae'r maes yn eang a'r sialens yn enfawr.

Un canfyddiad a arweiniodd y Pwyllgor i sefydlu'r adolygiad hwn oedd, pan wneir diagnosis mewn un sector, megis y gwasanaeth iechyd, ond ceir triniaeth mewn sector gwahanol, er enghraifft, addysg, ceir bron bob amser ddiffyg gwasanaethau a diffyg cydlynw gwasanaethau. Yn ogystal mae prinder aelodau staff allweddol, megis therapyddion lleferydd, sy'n gallu siarad Cymraeg.

Wrth i'r adolygiad fynd yn ei flaen, cadarnhawyd y pryderon ynghylch gwasanaethau. Daeth nifer o themâu i'r amlwg yn gyson: pwysigrwydd diagnosis cynnar—dim diagnosis, dim help. Themâu eraill oedd y fantais o gael gweithiwr allweddol, fel y clywsom, a phwysigrwydd hanfodol cydlynw gwasanaethau ar draws gwahanol ffiniau, megis rhwng y gwasanaeth iechyd ac addysg a rhwng gwasanaethau plant ac oedolion. Mater arall oedd yr angen dybryd i recriwtio a chadw staff megis therapyddion lleferydd, nyrsys mewn ysgolion ac yn y blaen. Thema arall oedd yr angen am lawer mwy o ofal seibiant a mwy o hyblygrwydd mewn darpariaeth gofal seibiant a'r angen am ddarpariaeth brydlon o offer angenrheidiol, fel y dywedodd Kirsty.

wedi gofyn am gael siarad yn y ddatl hon, felly byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe byddai Aelodau'n gwneud areithiau cryno lle bynnag y bo modd fel y gallaf alw ar bawb sy'n dymuno siarad.

**David Lloyd:** I thank everyone who was involved in this review of services for children with special health needs. I also thank the children and parents who have battled for years with a system that can appear unsympathetic, cold and distant. I thank all the associations and individuals in the field who presented evidence, my fellow Members, and the clerk and deputy clerk of the Health and Social Services Committee for their thorough and purposeful work at all times.

Children with special health needs are defined as children who are physically impaired, have chronic or complex medical conditions, or have emotional, behavioural or learning difficulties. The field is broad and the challenge is huge.

One perception that led the Committee to establish this review was that, when a diagnosis is made in one sector, such as the health service, but the treatment occurs in a different sector, for example, education, then, almost without exception, there is a shortage of services and insufficient co-ordination of those services. In addition, there is a shortage of key staff members, such as speech therapists, who can speak Welsh.

As the review proceeded, the concerns regarding these services were confirmed. Many themes frequently came to the fore: the importance of early diagnosis—no diagnosis, no help. Other themes were the advantage of having a key worker, as we heard, and the essential importance of the co-ordination of services across the different boundaries, such as those between health and education services and between services for children and adults. Another issue was the pressing need to recruit and retain staff such as speech therapists, school nurses and so on. Another theme was the need for much more respite care and more flexibility in the provision of respite care and the need for prompt provision of the necessary equipment, as Kirsty said. There is also a need for prompt

Mae angen hefyd am asesiadau prydlon ac i addasiadau a chymorth tebyg gael ei ddarparu yn gynnar ac nid ar ôl misoedd neu flynyddoedd o oedi a brwydro am gyfiawnder ar ran y rhieni.

Mae angen hefyd adolygu amodau'r ddeddfwriaeth ar grantiau cyfleusterau anabl. Mae argymhelliad 17 yr adroddiad yn nodi y dylai ein hawdurdodau lleol—fel y nododd Kirsty—gefynogi canolfannau cyngor a chefnogaeth anghenion arbennig fel y gallant ddarparu gwasanaethau i blant a chefnogaeth i ofalwyr a theuluoedd. Mae enghreifftiau arbennig, fel y gwelsom, yn Nhor-faen ac ym Margam.

Time and again the urgent need for early diagnosis in order to get a service was raised. Other recurrent issues were the importance of having a key worker to lead the family through the maze of officialdom, the importance of co-ordination between various interfaces such as health and education, the development of more services such as more speech therapy services, and the importance of respite care. Those themes were stressed repeatedly in the review and also surface frequently in my postbag. Last Friday, I met the mother of a nine-year-old child with Asberger's syndrome. As we know, autism spectrum disorders are becoming evermore prevalent, yet the picture is one of real anger and frustration for parents, who continually have to battle for services for their children. There is a great need to develop autism services in Wales. Difficulties in obtaining the diagnosis of autism remain, and no diagnosis equals no help, which equals no statement and, in this mother's experience, there is no post-diagnosis support either. There was real anger at last Friday's meeting at the lack of co-ordination between agencies. This is because autism does not appear to be on any Government department's radar despite the shocking rise in the number of those with the disorder. These issues are common to many of the diverse clinical entities that formed this review of provision for children with special health needs. The review was extensive and wide-ranging, and it involved much hard work on the part of many people. In addition to the 27 recommendations, it has produced an expectation of action. That expectation is

assessments and for adaptations and similar assistance to be provided early on, and not after months or years of delays and battling for justice on the part of the parents.

There is also a need to review the provisions of legislation on disabled facilities grants. Recommendation 17 in the report notes that our local authorities—as Kirsty said—should support the special needs advice and support centres so that they can provide services to children and support for carers and families. There are particular examples, as we saw, in Torfaen and Margam.

Dro ar ôl tro cyfeiriwyd at yr angen dybryd am ddiagnosis cynnar er mwyn cael gwasanaeth. Materion eraill a gododd yn aml oedd y pwysigrwydd o gael gweithiwr allweddol i arwain y teulu drwy'r dryswch biwrocraidd, y pwysigrwydd o gydlyn rhwng gwahanol ryngwynebau fel iechyd ac addysg, yr angen i ddatblygu rhagor o wasanaethau, ym maes therapi lleferydd, er enghraifft, a phwysigrwydd gofal seibiant. Rhoddwyd pwyslais ar y themâu hynny dro ar ôl tro yn yr adolygiad a daethant i'r golwg yn aml hefyd yn fy mag llythyrau. Ddydd Gwener diwethaf, cyfarfûm â mam plentyn naw mlwydd oed sydd â syndrom Asperger. Fel y gwyddom, mae anhwylderau yn yr amrediad awtistiaeth yn mynd yn fwyfwy cyffredin, ac eto gwelir bod rhieni'n teimlo'n wirioneddol ddiog a rhwystredig o orfod brwydro'n barhaus am wasanaethau i'w plant. Mae angen dybryd am ddatblygu gwasanaethau awtistiaeth yng Nghymru. Profir anawsterau o hyd wrth gael diagnosis o awtistiaeth, ac os na cheir diagnosis, ni cheir cymorth, sy'n golygu na cheir datganiad ac, ym mhrofiad y fam hon, ni cheir cymorth ar ôl cael diagnosis ychwaith. Yr oedd dicter gwirioneddol yn y cyfarfod ddydd Gwener diwethaf oherwydd y diffyg cydlyn rhwng asiantaethau. Y rheswm am hynny yw nad yw awtistiaeth wedi dod i sylw'r un adran o Lywodraeth, i bob golwg, er gwaethaf y cynnydd arswydus yn y nifer sydd â'r anhwylder hwn. Mae'r materion hyn yn gyffredin i lawer o'r gwahanol anhwylderau a drafodwyd yn yr adolygiad hwn o'r ddarpariaeth ar gyfer plant ag anghenion iechyd arbennig. Yr oedd yr adolygiad yn un



born out of years of anger and frustration on the part of the families affected. That expectation must be translated into the political will and into the resources to effect meaningful change in the lives of children with special health needs, their families and their carers in Wales.

**Ann Jones:** I also add my thanks to those who worked hard to produce this report. This is vital if we are to ensure that the next generation of children will be healthier than the present one. The report covers many issues. I will briefly focus on the link between children's health and child poverty, and, in particular, the issue of low birth-weight.

The effects of being born with a low birth-weight persist throughout a person's life, and we must do more to tackle this issue. Low birth-weight is associated with poorer health not only in childhood but through to adulthood. Children born to mothers from the poorer social classes are 25 per cent more likely to have a low birth-weight. There is also a 45 per cent greater chance that babies born to single mothers, that is, babies whose fathers are absent when the birth is registered, will have a low birth-weight. Some 1,400 babies weighing below 2.5lb are born each year. A further 14,000 babies are born with a birth-weight of between 2.5lb and 4.5lb. Those babies have certain health problems at that age, but also go on to develop further or multi-health problems throughout their childhood and into their young adulthood. The mothers of low birth-weight children are often young and inexperienced and are unlikely to be able to combine employment with caring for a vulnerable or sick child. This group is also likely to be ill-informed about what financial or other help is available. In other words, these people are on the edges of social exclusion. I hope that this report will galvanise action to improve the health of mothers and their children. We must start with the mothers. We must have a positive emphasis on the importance of maternal wellbeing. As Peter Townsend's

eang a chynhwysfawr, a golygodd lawer o waith caled gan lawer o bobl. Yn ogystal â'r 27 argymhelliad, mae wedi creu disgwyliad o weithredu. Mae'r disgwyliad hwnnw'n ffrwyth blynyddoedd o ddieter a rhwystredigaeth ar ran y teuluoedd yr effeithir arnynt. Rhaid troi'r disgwyliad hwnnw'n ewyllys gwleidyddol ac yn adnoddau i reoli newid yn effeithiol ym mywydau plant ag anghenion iechyd arbennig, eu teuluoedd a'u gofalwyr yng Nghymru.

**Ann Jones:** Yr wyf finnau'n diolch i'r rhai a weithiodd yn galed i gynhyrchu'r adroddiad hwn. Mae hyn yn hollbwysig os ydym i sicrhau y bydd y genhedlaeth nesaf o blant yn iachach na'r un bresennol. Mae'r adroddiad yn ymdrin â llawer o faterion. Canolbwytiaf yn fyr ar y cysylltiad rhwng iechyd plant a thlodi ymysg plant, ac, yn benodol, mater pwysau geni isel.

Mae effeithiau pwysau geni isel yn parhau drwy gydol oes rhywun, a rhaid inni wneud rhagor i fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn. Mae pwysau geni isel yn gysylltiedig ag iechyd gwaeth nid yn unig yn ystod plentyndod, ond drwodd i oedoliaeth hefyd. Mae plant a aned i famau yn y dosbarthiadau cymdeithasol tlotach yn 25 y cant yn fwy tebygol o fod â phwysau geni isel. Mae hefyd yn 45 y cant yn fwy tebygol y bydd babanod a enir i famau sengl, hynny yw, babanod y mae eu tadau'n absennol pan gofrestrir yr enedigaeth, yn rhai â phwysau geni isel. Genir tua 1,400 o fabanod sy'n llai na 2.5 pwys bob blwyddyn. Genir 14,000 o fabanod pellach sydd â phwysau geni rhwng 2.5 pwys a 4.5 pwys. Mae'r babanod hynny'n profi problemau iechyd penodol yn yr oed hwnnw, ond maent hefyd yn mynd ymlaen i ddatblygu problemau iechyd pellach neu luosog drwy gydol eu plentyndod ac i'w hoedoliaeth gynnar. Mae mamau plant â phwysau geni isel yn ifanc ac yn ddibrofiad yn aml ac maent yn annhebygol o allu cyfuno cyflogaeth a gofalu am blentyn eiddil neu sâl. Mewn geiriau eraill, mae'r bobl hyn ar fin cael eu hallgáu'n gymdeithasol. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr adroddiad hwn yn ysgogi camau i wella iechyd mamau a'u plant. Rhaid inni ddechrau gyda'r mamau. Rhaid inni roi pwyslais cadarnhaol ar bwysigrwydd lles y fam. Fel y mae adroddiad Peter Townsend

report has clearly demonstrated, the health service cannot solve these problems by itself. However, there are areas where we may have an impact.

I believe that the NHS and the new local health boards can undertake that role. We must face up to the challenge of improving the response to local needs. However, we must also look beyond that and use the money for Communities First areas to co-ordinate action and encourage community members to contribute to the reduction of problems such as low birth-weight. There are interventions with behavioural or empowerment focuses. We need to build on those and take those people with us in doing so. I commend to you, as always, what I regard as the greatest achievement in the Communities First ward in my constituency, namely the food co-operative. If we could establish food co-operatives across Wales, it would go some way towards tackling these problems.

3.50 p.m.

**David Melding:** I am pleased to commend this report, which received all-party support in Committee, to the Assembly. We were greatly assisted in the process of putting it together by the secretariat. However, at all stages, each Committee member's ideas were taken forward and we reflected deeply on the evidence that we received. The quality of the report is principally due to the clarity and strength of the evidence submitted, both directly in Committee and through a number of site visits. Those of us who went on the site visits were impressed by what we saw, by the commitment of parents and carers and by their reasonable demands for an adequate level of support. I will not go through issues that have already been mentioned, but I was impressed by the evidence of the need for key workers. The run-around experienced by many when they are suddenly catapulted into an intense role of caring for a child with complex needs can be dispiriting.

I was also impressed by the call for greater joint working. I know that we are encouraging that, as well as flexibility in

wedi dangos yn eglur, ni all y gwasanaeth iechyd ddatrys y problemau hyn ar ei ben ei hun. Er hynny, mae meysydd lle y gallem gael effaith.

Credaf y gall y GIG a'r byrddau iechyd lleol ymgymryd â'r rôl honno. Rhaid inni wynebu'r her o ymateb yn well i anghenion lleol. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni edrych y tu hwnt i hynny hefyd a defnyddio'r arian ar gyfer ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf i gydlynu'r camau a gymerir ac annog aelodau o'r gymuned i gyfrannu at leihau problemau fel pwysau geni isel. Ceir ymyriadau sy'n canolbwyntio ar ymddygiad neu alluogi. Rhaid inni adeiladu ar sail y rhain a mynd â'r bobl hynny gyda ni wrth wneud hynny. Cymeradwyaf i chi, fel y gwnaf bob amser, yr hyn a ystyriaf yn gyflawniad mwyaf yn y ward Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn fy etholaeth i, sef y fenter bwyd gydweithredol. Os gallem sefydlu mentrau bwyd cydweithredol ledled Cymru, cyfrannai i ryw raddau at ddatrys y problemau hyn.

**David Melding:** Yr wyf yn falch o gymeradwyo'r adroddiad hwn, a gefnogwyd gan yr holl bleidiau yn y Pwyllgor, i'r Cynulliad. Cawsom lawer o gymorth yn y broses o'i lunio gan yr ysgrifenyddiaeth. Fodd bynnag, ar bob cam, ystyriwyd syniadau pob aelod o'r Pwyllgor a gwnaethom fyfyrion ddwys ynghylch y dystiolaeth a gawsom. Mae ansawdd yr adroddiad yn ganlyniad yn bennaf i eglurdeb a chryfder y dystiolaeth a gyflwynwyd, yn uniongyrchol yn y Pwyllgor a thrwy nifer o ymweliadau safle. Gwnaed argraff ar y rhai ohonom a aeth ar yr ymweliadau safle gan yr hyn a welsom, gan ymroddiad rhieni a gofawyr a chan eu galwadau rhesymol am lefel ddigonol o gymorth. Nid af drwy'r materion y cyfeiriwyd atynt eisoes, ond gwnaed argraff arnaf gan y dystiolaeth i'r angen am weithwyr allweddol. Mae'r rhedeg o gwmpas a brofir gan lawer pan gânt eu taflu'n sydyn i rôl ddwys o ofalu am blentyn sydd ag anghenion cymhleth yn gallu peri digalondid.

Gwnaed argraff arnaf hefyd gan yr alwad am fwy o weithio ar y cyd. Gwn ein bod yn hyrwyddo hynny, yn ogystal â hyblygrwydd

pooling budgets and managing equipment stores, for example, but there is a long way to go. We need much smarter working. It is not about overall resources; indeed, were we to add to the current resources available without tackling the organisational challenges, we would still have deficiencies. We must tackle that. The state of the school nursing service must also be improved and we need to implement Dame June Clark's extensive report.

I want to concentrate on and amplify the issue of access to pre-school education for children with special health needs. A real advance in recent years is that children are given, as of right, access to pre-school education. That is of great help to parents, many of whom want to combine caring responsibilities with a job, and it allows them a degree of respite if the child they are caring for has a special need. However, the evidence was clear that, the more complex the needs of your child, the less likely it is that that child will receive any level of pre-school education. That is utterly perverse and works against the contract that I think society should have with these loving parents and guardians who take on the obligations of care with a light and loving heart. They need to be sustained in that role and not entirely engulfed by these responsibilities because otherwise they will be worn down and they will lose their hinterland and their ability to care for other children in the family. The caring relationship cannot be sustained in such a stressful situation. We must revisit the issue of parents and children with the most acute need not receiving care or access to pre-school education.

I commend the Chair of the Committee on the way in which she led us in this work. The report is of a high quality. It stands careful scrutiny and I am sure that the Executive's response to its recommendations will be positive on the whole. It is a coherent report and is not a mere wish list: it tries to grapple with the issue. Perhaps we are becoming slightly whimsical or concerned about our fate as we approach the end of this first Assembly, but looking back, two aspects of

drwy gyfuno cyllidebau a rheoli storfeydd offer, er enghraifft, ond mae llawer i'w wneud eto. Mae arnom angen gweithio llawer mwy clyfar. Nid yr adnoddau cyffredinol yw'r hyn sydd dan sylw; yn wir, pe byddem yn ychwanegu at yr adnoddau presennol sydd ar gael heb fynd i'r afael â'r heriau trefniadol, byddai diffygion gennym o hyd. Rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â hynny. Rhaid gwella cyflwr y gwasanaeth nyrsio ysgol hefyd a rhaid inni roi adroddiad cynhwysfawr y Fonesig June Clark ar waith.

Dymunaf ganolbwyntio ac ymhelaethu ar fater y mynediad i addysg cyn-ysgol ar gyfer plant ag anghenion iechyd arbennig. Un cam gwirioneddol ymlaen yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf yw bod plant yn cael yr hawl i addysg cyn-ysgol. Mae hynny o gymorth mawr i rieni, y mae llawer ohonynt am gyfuno cyfrifoldebau gofal â swydd, ac mae'n rhoi mwy o seibiant iddynt os oes angen arbennig gan y plentyn y maent yn gofalu amdano. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd yn amlwg o'r dystiolaeth mai po fwyaf cymhleth y mae anghenion eich plentyn, lleiaf tebygol ydyw y caiff y plentyn hwnnw unrhyw lefel o addysg cyn-ysgol. Mae hynny'n gwbl wrthnysig ac yn mynd yn groes i'r contract a ddylai fod, yn fy marn i, rhwng cymdeithas a'r rhieni a gwarcheidwad cariadus hynny sy'n ymgymryd ag ymrwymadau gofal yn siriol ac yn gariadlon. Mae arnynt angen eu cynnal yn y rôl honno ac nid eu llyncu'n llwyr gan y cyfrifoldebau hyn oherwydd fel arall byddant wedi blino'n lân a byddant yn colli eu bywyd ehangach a'u gallu i ofalu am blant eraill yn y teulu. Ni ellir cynnal y berthynas ofalgar mewn sefyllfa sy'n peri'r fath straen. Rhaid inni ailystyried mater y rhieni a'r plant mwyaf anghenus nad ydynt yn cael gofal neu'r gallu i gael addysg cyn-ysgol.

Canmolaf Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor ar ei dull o'n harwain yn y gwaith hwn. Mae'r adroddiad o ansawdd da. Cymer ei archwilio'n fanwl ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd ymateb y Weithrediaeth i'w argymhellion yn gadarnhaol ar y cyfan. Mae'n adroddiad rhesymegol ac yn amgenach na rhestr o ddymuniadau: mae'n ceisio mynd i'r afael â'r mater dan sylw. Efallai ein bod yn mynd braidd yn ysmala neu'n bryderus ynghylch ein tynged wrth inni ddynesu at ddiwedd y

the work of the Health and Social Services Committee stand out. They are the report and inquiry to establish the office of the Children's Commissioner for Wales and this report on children with particularly complex health needs. I commend this report to the Assembly for its approval.

**Peter Law:** I am pleased to see this report, and I commend the Committee on its work, particularly with regard to speech and language therapy. I know that the Minister will be listening carefully because she is committed to improving children's lives and to giving them the therapy that they need. I have spoken about this issue on a number of occasions in this Chamber, and I cannot emphasise enough how serious the lack of provision of speech and language therapy across Wales is. I know, as Kirsty Williams said, that it is a matter that affects the UK as a whole, but it is so significant a problem in Wales now—you heard earlier the phrase 'no diagnosis, no treatment'—that we need an emergency taskforce to deal with it. We must get to grips with it because time is passing by for these young people. If you live in a deprived community, and are excluded from much of what other people take for granted, the last thing that you want—but on many occasions have to face—is to go through life with the problem of not being able to converse with your fellow human beings. If we do not adopt an effective approach to these problems, then these young children face a lifetime's impediment.

In June 2002, across the whole of Gwent, 2,000 young people had waited for over two years for an appointment to see a speech and language therapist. I am glad that the Committee highlighted the shortfall in the number of therapists in Wales. There are therapists with a caseload, on average, of 141 people, compared with a recommended caseload of 44. That is horrific. The therapist has no chance of dealing with that. Let us also not forget those who want to converse through the medium of Welsh. Welsh-language speech therapists are like gold. That is another big problem.

Cynulliad cyntaf hwn, ond wrth edrych yn ôl, mae dwy agwedd ar waith y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn dod i'r amlwg. Y rhain yw'r adroddiad a'r ymchwiliad i sefydlu swydd Comisiynydd Plant Cymru a'r adroddiad hwn ar blant ag anghenion iechyd arbennig o gymhleth. Cymeradwyaf yr adroddiad hwn i'r Cynulliad er mwyn iddo gael ei sêl bendith.

**Peter Law:** Yr wyf yn falch o weld yr adroddiad hwn, a chanmolaf y Pwyllgor ar ei waith, yn enwedig mewn cysylltiad â therapi iaith a lleferydd. Gwn y bydd y Gweinidog yn gwrando'n astud gan ei bod wedi ymrwymo i wella bywydau plant a rhoi iddynt y therapi y mae arnynt ei angen. Yr wyf wedi siarad am y mater hwn nifer o weithiau yn y Siambr hon, ac ni allaf bwysleisio ddigon mor ddifrifol yw'r diffyg darpariaeth o therapi iaith a lleferydd ledled Cymru. Gwn, fel y dywedodd Kirsty Williams, ei fod yn fater sy'n effeithio ar y DU gyfan, ond mae'n broblem mor fawr yng Nghymru bellach—clywsoch y dywediad 'dim diagnosis, dim triniaeth' yn gynharach—fel bod arnom angen tasglu argyfwng i ymdrin â hi. Rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â hyn gan fod amser yn mynd heibio yn achos y bobl ifanc hyn. Os ydych yn byw mewn cymuned ddifreintiedig, ac wedi'ch allgáu o lawer o'r hyn y mae pobl eraill yn ei gymryd yn ganiataol, y peth olaf yr ydych am ei gael—ond yn gorfod ei wynebu mewn llawer achos—yw gorfod mynd drwy'ch bywyd â'r broblem o fethu â sgwrsio â'ch cyd-ddyn. Os nad ymdriniwn yn effeithiol â'r problemau hyn, bydd y plant ifanc hyn yn wynebu rhwystr ar hyd eu hoes.

Ym Mehefin 2002, ledled Gwent, yr oedd 2,000 o bobl ifanc wedi disgwyl am fwy na dwy flynedd am apwyntiad i weld therapydd iaith a lleferydd. Yr wyf yn falch bod y Pwyllgor wedi tynnu sylw at y prinder o therapyddion yng Nghymru. Ceir therapyddion â llwyth achosion o 141 o bobl, ar gyfartaledd, o'i gymharu â'r nifer o 44 a argymhellir. Mae hynny'n frawychus. Nid oes gobaith i'r therapydd ddelio â hynny. Gadewch inni beidio ag anghofio ychwaith y rhai sy'n dymuno sgwrsio drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Mae therapyddion lleferydd Cymraeg yn brin fel aur. Mae honno'n broblem fawr arall.

I am impressed with the Committee's work, but we must get to grips with this problem today. I hope that the Minister will consider carefully whether we need an emergency taskforce. The problem is not going away in places such as Blaenau Gwent. We could have had an I CAN centre, which I was looking forward to, and which Torfaen County Council and Blaenau Gwent Council supported, but, sadly, Gwent Health Authority and the Gwent Healthcare Trust did not support it, and the children who suffer from these speech impediments and need support lost that opportunity. Their parents sometimes feel that they are forgotten because the system is not operating as it should. Therefore, I welcome the recommendation in the report that a special needs support and advice centre be established in each area. That is positive, as are the other issues that have been mentioned, such as appointing a member of a local health board to be responsible for children's health services—a kind of champion in each area—because many of life's unglamorous problems are often ignored.

We are talking about a small minority of people, but not being able to converse with your fellow human beings is a major problem. That is the legacy of not providing effective speech and language therapy. This is an important report, which points us in the right direction. I sincerely hope that the Minister will be able to take this forward and make positive inroads into this serious problem of the lack of opportunity in Wales for young people to get the speech and language therapy that they deserve, and for the parents to have the support that they need and want.

**Gareth Jones:** Mae gofyn inni nodi adroddiad, sy'n ein hatgoffa, wedi bron i bedair blynedd o Lywodraeth Lafur yn y Cynulliad, fod diffygion a gwendidau amlwg yn bodoli yn y gwasanaeth a gynigir i blant ag anghenion iechyd arbennig. Mae'r methiant i ddarparu gwasanaethau effeithiol cydlynus a dibynadwy ar ôl Cynulliad cyfan yn sicr o fod yn siom i'r plant a'r teuluoedd, y gweithwyr allweddol, pawb arall sydd wedi gweithio mor galed i dynnu sylw'r

Edmygaf waith y Pwyllgor, ond rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon heddiw. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn ystyried yn ofalus a oes arnom angen tasglu argyfwng. Nid yw'r broblem yn diflannu mewn mannau fel Blaenau Gwent. Gallem fod wedi cael canolfan I CAN, yr oeddwn i'n edrych ymlaen ati ac a gefnogwyd gan gyngor sir Tor-faen a chyngor Blaenau Gwent, ond nid gan Awdurdod Iechyd Gwent ac Ymddiriedolaeth Gofal Iechyd Gwent, gwaetha'r modd, ac mae'r plant sy'n dioddef gan y namau hynny ar eu lleferydd ac sydd ag angen cymorth wedi colli'r cyfle hwnnw. Mae eu rhieni'n teimlo weithiau eu bod wedi'u hanghofio am nad yw'r system yn gweithredu fel y dylai. Gan hynny, croesawaf yr argymhelliad yn yr adroddiad y dylid sefydlu canolfannau cymorth a chyngor anghenion arbennig ym mhob ardal. Mae hynny'n gadarnhaol, fel y mae'r materion eraill a grybwyllwyd, fel penodi aelod o fwrdd iechyd lleol i fod yn gyfrifol am wasanaethau iechyd plant—math o gefnogwr ym mhob ardal—gan fod llawer o'r problemau anatyniadol mewn bywyd yn cael eu hanwybyddu'n aml.

Yr ydym yn sôn am leiafrif bach, ond mae methu â sgwrsio â'ch cyd-ddyn yn broblem fawr. Dyna ganlyniad peidio â darparu therapi iaith a lleferydd effeithiol. Adroddiad pwysig yw hwn, sy'n dangos y cyfeiriad iawn i ni. Hyderaf yn fawr y bydd y Gweinidog yn gallu bwrw ymlaen â hyn a chael effaith bendant ar y broblem ddifrifol hon o'r diffyg cyfle yng Nghymru i bobl ifanc gael y therapi iaith a lleferydd y maent yn ei haeddu, ac i'r rhieni gael y cymorth y mae arnynt ei eisiau a'i angen.

**Gareth Jones:** We are asked to note a report that reminds us that, after almost four years of a Labour Government in the Assembly, there are deficiencies and obvious weaknesses in the services that are offered to children with special health needs. The failure to provide effective, co-ordinated and reliable services after a full Assembly is sure to be a disappointment for children and their families, the key workers, and everyone else who has worked so hard to draw the attention

Gweinidog ac holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad at ffaeleddau amlwg y gwasanaeth. Mae cyfeiriadau at arfer da, ond prin iawn yw'r rheini. Dyma adroddiad arall i'w ychwanegu at y pentwr sydd eisoes wedi eu cyhoeddi gan y Llywodraeth ar yr un testun. Beth ddaeth o'r strategaeth a lansiwyd ym Medi 2001 ar wasanaeth iechyd meddwl plant a phobl ifanc, 'Busnes Pawb'?

4.00 p.m.

Yr oedd y strategaeth honno yn argymhell nifer o bethau a argymhellir yn yr adroddiad hwn, sef canoli'r gwasanaeth o amgylch y plentyn, asesu anghenion Cymru gyfan a sicrhau cydweithio effeithiol rhwng asiantaethau. Yr ydym wedi clywed hyn i gyd o'r blaen. Cyhoeddwyd adroddiad arall, 'Gwireddu'r Addewidion', a groesawyd yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 4 Gorffennaf 2002, ac a arweiniodd at adroddiad arall yn y Gogledd, sef, 'Strategaeth Ddrafft ar gyfer Plant ac Oedolion gydag Anableddau Dysgu yng Ngogledd Cymru'. Unwaith eto, addewid o newidiadau er gwell sydd yma ac nid strategaeth yng ngwir ystyr y gair gydag amserlen o dargedau ac arian wedi ei glustnodi ar eu cyfer.

Mae'r holl adroddiadau hyn, ac eraill, yn symptom o salwch meddyliol gwleidyddol—yr hyn a elwir gan y Sais yn *analysis paralysis*. Mae'r salwch hwn yn peri i'r Llywodraeth a'i chyd-gleifion, y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol—gan eu bod bob amser am hawlio'r clod—ddadansoddi popeth, a newid dim yn y diwedd. Ar ben hynny, bydd llawer o'r argymhellion pwysig y cyfeirir atynt yn yr adroddiad yn sicr o fynd ar goll yn y dadansoddiad diangen arall sy'n digwydd, sef ailstrwythuro'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn gyfan gwbl.

Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn cyfeirio at anghenion arbennig mewn perthynas ag addysg. Sut yn union y bydd unrhyw Weinidog yn ymateb i'r argymhelliad y dylai rhieni gael dewis ysgol addas ar gyfer eu plentyn? A ydym yn cyfeirio at ysgolion arbennig, neu ysgolion prif ffrwd? Sut ar y ddaear y gallwch ehangu dewis rhieni tra bo ysgolion arbennig, naill ai yn cau neu yn prysur gael eu haddasu ar gyfer plant â phroblemau ymddygiad? Sawl ysgol arbennig

of the Minister and all Assembly Members to the obvious deficiencies in the service. There are references to good practice, but they are scarce. This is another report to add to the pile that the Government has already published on the same subject. What happened to the strategy, launched in September 2001, on child and adolescent mental health service, 'Everybody's Business'?

That strategy made several recommendations that are also made in this report, namely focusing the service on the child, assessing the needs of the whole of Wales and ensuring effective co-operation between agencies. We have heard it all before. Another report was published, 'Fulfilling the Promises', which was welcomed in Plenary on 4 July 2002, and which led to another report in north Wales, namely, 'Draft Strategy for Children and Adults with Learning Disabilities in North Wales'. Once again, there is a promise that improvements will be made but there is no strategy in the true sense of the word with a timetable of targets and money allocated for them.

All these reports, and others, are a symptom of political mental illness—what is called 'analysis paralysis'. This illness makes the Government and its fellow-patients, the Liberal Democrats—as they always insist on claiming the credit—analyse everything, but change nothing in the end. On top of that, many of the important recommendations that are referred to in the report will certainly be lost in the other unnecessary analysis that is happening, which is the wholesale restructuring of the health service.

This report refers to special needs in relation to education. How exactly will any Minister respond to the recommendation that parents should be allowed to choose a suitable school for their child? Are we referring to special schools, or to mainstream schools? How on earth can you expand the choice for parents, while special schools are either closing or are in the process of being adapted for children with behavioural problems? How many special schools for the partially blind or deaf

ar gyfer y rhannol ddall neu fyddar sydd gennym yng Nghymru bellach? Sut y bydd unrhyw Weinidog yn diwallu'r galw hwn o gael dewis ysgol o dan y fath amgylchiadau pan ydym yn tanseilio ein hadnoddau presennol? Pa ddarpariaeth fydd ar gyfer cynyddu nifer y therapyddion—y cyfeiriodd Peter Law atynt—yn enwedig y rhai sy'n gweithio drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg? Mae'r sefyllfa hon yr un mor ddyrys heddiw ag yr oedd bedair blynedd yn ôl. Mae'r un peth yn wir o ran anghenion dyslecsia.

Unwaith eto, nid yw'n anhawster i mi nodi adroddiad sydd yn ein hatgoffa'n fyw o'n flodi mewn maes mor hanfodol bwysig—a diolch am yr adroddiad hwn. Fodd bynnag, pryd y cawn y pleser o gael nodi strategaeth gan Lywodraeth Cymru sydd yn nodi pa welliannau y gallwn edrych ymlaen atynt, pa bryd y cânt eu gweithredu, a faint o arian a glustnodir ar eu cyfer, i gynorthwyo plant ag anghenion iechyd arbennig ac sy'n dioddef o dan y gwasanaeth presennol, fel ag y mae'r adroddiad hwn yn ein hatgoffa?

**Val Lloyd:** I too welcome the work in this important area, which is evident in this report. I am also pleased that the evidence was gathered from such a wide range of individuals and organisations.

Kirsty talked about waiting for a diagnosis, which is, at any time, a nerve-racking experience, even for oneself. However, waiting for a firm diagnosis for a child in your care must be even worse. The inevitable stress could well be exacerbated by other feelings, particularly more personal ones, as specific to each case. Therefore, the need for privacy, sensitivity, and protected time for the initial discussion, which is mentioned in the document, is an important recommendation. As well as this, information must be given in a language that is understandable to those caring for the child and, if applicable, to the child itself.

Immediate reactions to hearing a diagnosis vary, but there must be follow-up opportunities for parents to question and talk at length with suitably knowledgeable health practitioners as soon as they are ready. The anxiety surrounding the diagnosis may not

do we have in Wales at the moment? How can any Minister satisfy this demand to be able to choose schools under such circumstances when we are undermining our present resources? What provision will be available to increase the number of therapists—to which Peter Law referred—especially those who work through the medium of Welsh? This situation is just as complex today as it was four years ago. The same is true in terms of dyslexic needs.

Once again, I have no difficulty in noting this report, which reminds us vividly of our desperate situation in such a crucial field—and I am grateful for this report. However, when will we have the pleasure of noting a strategy by the Government of Wales that states what improvements we can look forward to, when they will be delivered, and how much money will be allocated for them, to help children who have special health needs and who are suffering under the present service, as this report reminds us?

**Val Lloyd:** Yr wyf finnau'n croesawu'r gwaith yn y maes pwysig hwn, a welir yn yr adroddiad hwn. Yr wyf hefyd yn falch i'r dystiolaeth gael ei chasglu o blith amrediad mor eang o unigolion a chyrrff.

Soniodd Kirsty am aros am ddiagnosis, sy'n brofiad dirdynnol ar unrhyw adeg, hyd yn oed ar eich cyfer eich hun. Fodd bynnag, mae aros am ddiagnosis pendant ar gyfer plentyn sydd o dan eich gofal yn sicr o fod yn waeth byth. Gallai'r straen anorfod gael ei ddwysáu gan deimladau eraill, yn enwedig rhai mwy personol, yn ôl yr achos penodol. Gan hynny, mae'r argymhelliad am yr angen am breifatrwydd, sensitifrwydd, a diogelu amser ar gyfer y drafodaeth ddechreuol, a grybwyllir yn y ddogfen, yn un pwysig. Yn ogystal â hynny, rhaid rhoi gwybodaeth mewn iaith sy'n ddealladwy i'r rhai sy'n gofalu am y plentyn ac, os yw'n berthnasol, y plentyn ei hun.

Mae'r ymateb yn syth ar ôl clywed diagnosis yn amrywio, ond rhaid cael cyfleoedd ar ôl hynny i rieni ofyn cwestiynau a siarad yn hirfaith ag ymarferwyr iechyd sydd â gwybodaeth briodol cyn gynted ag y byddont yn barod. Oherwydd y pryder ynghylch y

lead them to absorb everything at first, and time for reflection is needed. It might be an idea to offer comprehensive advice in a written and/or visual format, which can be reviewed in more familiar surroundings. Perhaps it would be even better to have a contact number for those who have either personal or professional experience of this specific diagnosis to offer a friendly ear and a friendly voice to those whose loved ones have just been diagnosed with this problem. Recommendations 6 and 7 cover this ground, but they are not as explicit as I would have liked.

David has already talked about the need for a key workers. When I have talked with parents whose children have special health needs, that necessitate multi-agency participation it is noticeable that those who have had early identification of a key worker or a co-ordinator feel more in control, more involved, and better able to cope and adjust than those who have not. I strongly support the use of parent-held records. These empower parents, and facilitate the sharing of information between agencies. There are excellent examples of joint working between agencies, and examples of good practice should always be disseminated. However, like the parent-held records, the major beneficiary of joint working should be—and is—the child, although there are subsidiary benefits to the agencies involved.

Respite services have also been highlighted. From the letters in my postbag it seems that access to these is problematic. Parents value them, but they sometimes find that access is limited, and the nature of the services on offer does not always match their specific needs or the needs of their child. I recognise, as have others, that there is heavy demand on those services, but they are desperately needed. The main problem that I have come across, as well as that of the amount of services on offer, is the flexibility needed to match varying demands. Respite care is not an added extra, it is essential for the health of parents and siblings, allowing them to recharge their batteries and sustain their caring responsibilities.

diagnosis mae'n bosibl na fyddant yn amgyffred popeth ar unwaith, ac mae angen amser i fyfyr. Gallai fod yn syniad da cynnig cyngor cynhwysfawr ar ffurf ysgrifenedig ac/neu weledol, y gellir troi'n ôl ato mewn amgylchoedd mwy cartrefol. Efallai y byddai'n well byth cael rhif cyswllt fel y gall y rheini sydd â phrofiad personol neu broffesiynol o'r diagnosis penodol wrando neu siarad yn gyfeillgar â'r rhai y mae eu hanwyliaid newydd gael diagnosis o'r broblem dan sylw. Mae argymhellion 6 a 7 yn ymdrin â hyn, ond nid ydynt mor bendant ag y dymunwn.

Mae David wedi sôn eisoes am yr angen am weithwyr allweddol. Pan siaradaf â rhieni y mae eu plant ag anghenion iechyd arbennig, sy'n gofyn cyfraniad gan sawl asiantaeth, gellir sylwi bod y rhai y dynodwyd gweithiwr allweddol neu gydlynnydd ar eu cyfer yn fuan, yn teimlo bod ganddynt fwy o reolaeth a chysylltiad, a'u bod yn gallu ymdopi ac ymaddasu'n well na'r rhai sydd heb un. Yr wyf yn gadarn o blaid defnyddio cofnodion a ddelir gan rieni. Mae'r rhain yn galluogi rhieni, ac yn hwyluso rhannu gwybodaeth rhwng asiantaethau. Mae enghreifftiau rhagorol o weithio ar y cyd rhwng asiantaethau, a dylid lledaenu enghreifftiau o arfer da bob amser. Fodd bynnag, yn yr un modd â chofnodion a ddelir gan rieni, yr un a ddylai—ac sydd—yn elwa'n bennaf yw'r plentyn, er bod manteision yn sgîl hynny i'r asiantaethau sy'n gysylltiedig.

Tynnwyd sylw at wasanaethau gofal seibiant hefyd. Yn ôl y llythyrau a dderbyniaf, ymddengys bod problemau wrth gael mynediad iddynyt. Mae rhieni'n eu gwerthfawrogi, ond weithiau maent yn cael fod y mynediad iddynt yn gyfyngedig, ac nad yw natur y gwasanaethau a gynigir yn addas bob tro i'w hanghenion penodol hwy neu anghenion eu plentyn. Yr wyf yn cydnabod, fel y gwnaeth eraill, fod galwadau mawr ar y gwasanaethau hynny, ond mae taer angen amdanynt. Y brif broblem y deuthum i ar ei thraws, yn ogystal â nifer y gwasanaethau sydd ar gael, yw'r hyblygrwydd sydd ei angen i ateb y galwadau amrywiol. Nid ychwanegiad yw gofal seibiant, mae'n hanfodol er mwyn iechyd rhieni a brodyr a chwiorydd, ac yn caniatáu iddynt gael eu cefn atynt a pharhau â'u cyfrifoldebau gofal.



I too welcome the Committee's views that the recommendations of Professor Clark's report on the school nursing service should be implemented. It could be claimed that I say that because I have worked with June Clark for several years. However, the recommendations in that school nursing service report will benefit not only children who have special health needs, but all children. It was evident throughout the review that there is a pressing need for more detailed and focused research on operational practices so that a sound body of validated knowledge can be built up and used to inform evidence-based practice. This will assist practitioners across the relevant services and agencies to further develop their knowledge and skills, and to continue providing the best quality care for children with special health needs.

**William Graham:** I am not a member of the Health and Social Services Committee, but I was impressed with its report, and I congratulate its members on bringing forward the most relevant recommendations. As part of one's duties as an Assembly Member, it has been a privilege to raise awareness of a wide spectrum of disabilities, particularly autism, which, unfortunately, is becoming all too common.

I will also discuss recommendations 6 and 7, regarding the provision of information. As previous speakers have said, these recommendations are welcome, but they perhaps need to be strengthened further—no doubt the Chair of the Committee will consider that further. Statementing is a legal right—I direct that primarily at local authorities. It is not a stigma; it is a way of obtaining specialist services. Recommendation 12 recognises the acute shortage of speech therapists. I would welcome an assurance from the Minister that she will consider this, particularly the fact that those speech therapists should be sensitive to culture and language.

On the provision of equipment, I was particularly surprised that there was not more

Yr wyf finnau'n croesawu barn y Pwyllgor y dylai argymhellion adroddiad yr Athro Clark ar y gwasanaeth nyrsio ysgol gael eu gweithredu. Gellid honni fy mod yn dweud hynny am i mi weithio gyda June Clark am sawl blwyddyn. Fodd bynnag, bydd yr argymhellion yn yr adroddiad hwnnw ar y gwasanaeth nyrsio ysgol yn dod â budd nid yn unig i blant sydd ag anghenion iechyd arbennig, ond i bob plentyn. Yr oedd yn amlwg drwy gydol yr adolygiad fod taer angen ymchwil fanylach a mwy penodol ar arferion gweithredol fel y gellir creu cronfa ddibynadwy o wybodaeth ddilysedig a'i defnyddio i oleuo ymarfer sy'n seiliedig ar dystiolaeth. Bydd hyn yn helpu ymarferwyr yn yr holl wasanaethau ac asiantaethau perthnasol i ddatblygu eu gwybodaeth a'u sgiliau ymhellach, ac i barhau i ddarparu gofal o'r ansawdd gorau ar gyfer plant ag anghenion iechyd arbennig.

**William Graham:** Nid wyf yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, ond yr wyf yn llawn edmygedd o'i adroddiad, a llongyfarchaf ei aelodau ar ddod ag argymhellion tra pherthnasol gerbron. Fel rhan o'm dyletswyddau fel Aelod Cynulliad, bu'n fraint cael hybu ymwybyddiaeth o amrediad eang o anabledau, ac awtistiaeth yn enwedig, sy'n dod yn gyffredin iawn, gwaetha'r modd.

Trafodaf innau hefyd argymhellion 6 a 7, sy'n ymwneud â darparu gwybodaeth. Fel y dywedodd siaradwyr blaenorol, mae'r argymhellion hyn i'w croesawu, ond efallai fod angen eu cryfhau ymhellach—mae'n siŵr y bydd Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor yn ystyried hynny ymhellach. Mae hawl gyfreithiol i gael datganiad—cyfeiriaf y sylw hwnnw at awdurdodau lleol yn bennaf. Nid yw'n warthnod; mae'n fodd i gael gwasanaethau arbenigol. Mae argymhelliad 12 yn cydnabod y prinder dybryd o therapyddion lleferydd. Byddai'n dda gennyf gael sicrwydd gan y Gweinidog y bydd yn ystyried hyn, yn enwedig y ffaith y dylai'r therapyddion lleferydd hynny fod yn sensitif i ddiwylliant ac iaith.

Ynghylch darparu offer, synnais yn fawr nad oedd mwy o fanylion am hynny, o ystyried

detail on this, considering the range and diversity of equipment provided. As Chair of the former Pre-16 Education Committee, I was incredibly impressed with the service provided at Trinity Fields Special School in Caerphilly, yet the service at a special needs school in Haverfordwest, which was provided with great love and enthusiasm, was, frankly, amateur. I know that the Minister will reconsider that. It is hoped that, on recommendation 26, which describes the codification of practice, as my colleague has often said, best practice should be usual practice.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I also welcome this report to help children and young people with special educational needs and behavioural challenges, and their families, through the medium of English and Welsh.

4.10 p.m.

In July 2002, the Audit Commission's report found that the needs of children with the most severe special educational needs are often not met by the present costly, bureaucratic and slow system. It stated that one in five children has some form of special educational needs, ranging from mild dyslexia to behavioural problems to complex medical conditions. In most cases, this is dealt with in schools, but some need more than their school can provide, as I discovered when dealing peripatetically with under-achieving 14 to 16-year-olds in north Wales, prior to becoming an Assembly Member. The Audit Commission report called for a high level, independent review of the system in England and Wales.

There are pockets of good practice across Wales, but more needs to be done to ensure that these families receive the best services, from initial diagnosis through to a smooth transition to adult services. That can only be achieved by sharing validated good practice, and cohesive working between the various agencies and the families and carers. Based on this admirable report to the Health and Social Services Committee these practices, which have been highlighted, but which I will skim through quickly, include the co-

amrediad ac amrywiaeth yr offer a ddarperir. Fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 gynt, yr oedd gennyf feddwl mawr iawn o'r gwasanaeth a ddarperid yn Ysgol Arbennig Trinity Fields yng Nghaerffili, ac eto yr oedd y gwasanaeth mewn ysgol anghenion arbennig yn Hwlfordd, a ddarperid yn gariadlon ac yn frwdfrydig iawn, yn amaturaidd, a dweud y gwir. Gwn y bydd y Gweinidog yn ailystyried hynny. Ynghylch argymhelliad 26, sy'n disgrifio'r cyfundrefnu ar arferion, fel y mae fy nghyd-Aelod wedi dweud yn aml, hyderir y bydd yr arfer gorau'n arfer arferol.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yr wyf finnau hefyd yn croesawu'r adroddiad hwn i helpu plant a phobl ifanc ag anghenion addysgol arbennig a heriau o ran eu hymddygiad, a'u teuluoedd, drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg a'r Saesneg.

Ym mis Gorffennaf 2002, canfu adroddiad y Comisiwn Archwilio nad yw anghenion plant sydd â'r anghenion addysgol arbennig mwyaf difrifol yn cael eu diwallu mewn llawer achos gan y system ddud, fiwrocataidd ac araf a geir ar hyn o bryd. Dywedodd fod gan un o bob pump o blant ryw fath o angen addysgol arbennig, yn amrywio o ddyslecsia cymedrol i broblemau ymddygiadol i anhwylderau meddygol cymhleth. Yn y rhan fwyaf o achosion, ymdrinnir â hyn mewn ysgolion, ond mae ar rai angen mwy na'r hyn y gall eu hysgol ei ddarparu, fel y darganfûm wrth deithio o gwmpas yn trafod rhai 14 i 16 mlwydd oed a oedd yn tangyflawni yn y Gogledd, cyn dod yn Aelod o'r Cynulliad. Galwodd adroddiad y Comisiwn Archwilio am adolygiad annibynnol ar lefel uchel o'r system yng Nghymru a Lloegr.

Ceir pocedi o arfer da ledled Cymru, ond rhaid gwneud mwy i sicrhau bod y teuluoedd hyn yn cael y gwasanaethau gorau, o'r diagnosis dechreuol drwodd at drawsnewid esmwyth i wasanaethau ar gyfer oedolion. Yr unig fodd i gyflawni hynny yw drwy rannu arferion da dilysedig, a gweithio cydlynol rhwng y gwahanol asiantaethau a'r teuluoedd a'r gofawyr. Ar sail yr adroddiad rhagorol hwn i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, mae'r arferion hyn, y tynnwyd sylw atynt, ond y gwnaf frysio drwyddynt, yn

ordination of health, education and other officials and agencies from the local level up to the national level—and to Westminster where appropriate. This will help to ensure, among other things, early detection and optimal treatment of special needs as quickly and as effectively as possible. They will also include feedback and consultation in policy making and implementation with the parents and practitioners involved in day-to-day childcare to ensure that Government activities target the needs of particular families, children and localities. They also include ensuring that a key worker service assigns an agent to individual children to help co-ordinate health, social, and educational services concerning care for each individual child; ensuring that equipment and other infrastructure resources are available to meet the specific needs of these children; and improving speech disability services for children with special needs, particularly with regard to Welsh language specialists.

All these need to be adequately funded. I trust that the Minister will commit fully to addressing these challenges as soon as possible, to support children, young people, and their families who face these enormous challenges that blight their lives.

**Karen Sinclair:** I also welcome this thorough report. I am pleased that the report notes that work is needed to ensure the smooth transition from children's services to adult services, for youngsters with complex special needs in relation to respite care. This needs to be not just acknowledged as a problem, but also prioritised for improvement. The report mentions encouraging best practice and pooling budgets. I would argue that we should go much further than encouragement. At present, the differences in terms of provision, certainly in my constituency, is startling. Currently, at the transition stage, parents—who are also usually the primary carers—find that the provision that they have received over the years for people with complex health and social needs dries up. They also find that, suddenly, the potential providers from health and social services are more interested in protecting their budgets than offering care

cynnwys cydlynu iechyd, addysg a swyddogion ac asiantaethau eraill o'r lefel leol i'r lefel genedlaethol—ac i San Steffan pan fo'n briodol. Bydd hyn o gymorth i sicrhau, ymysg pethau eraill, y bydd anghenion arbennig yn cael eu darganfod yn gynnar a'u trin yn y modd gorau posibl a hynny mor gyflym ac effeithiol ag y gellir. Byddant hefyd yn cynnwys adborth ac ymgynghori wrth lunio a gweithredu polisi gyda'r rhieni a'r ymarferwyr sy'n ymwneud â gofal plant o ddydd i ddydd i sicrhau bod gweithgareddau'r Llywodraeth yn targedu anghenion teuluoedd, plant ac ardaloedd penodol. Maent hefyd yn cynnwys sicrhau bod gwasanaeth gweithwyr allweddol yn pennu un i weithredu dros blant unigol i helpu i gydlynu gwasanaethau iechyd, cymdeithasol, ac addysgol sy'n gysylltiedig â gofal am bob plentyn unigol; sicrhau bod offer ac adnoddau seilwaith eraill ar gael i fodloni anghenion y plant hyn; a gwella gwasanaethau anabledd lleferydd ar gyfer plant ag anghenion arbennig, yn enwedig o ran arbenigwyr yn y Gymraeg.

Rhaid cyllido pob un o'r rhain yn ddigonol. Hyderaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn ymrwymo'n llawn i ymdrin â'r heriau hyn cyn gynted ag y bo modd, er mwyn cynorthwyo plant, pobl ifanc, a'u teuluoedd sy'n wynebu'r heriau enfawr hyn sy'n difetha eu bywydau.

**Karen Sinclair:** Yr wyf finnau'n croesawu'r adroddiad cynhwysfawr hwn. Yr wyf yn falch bod yr adroddiad yn nodi bod angen gwaith i sicrhau trawsnewid esmwyth o wasanaethau i blant i wasanaethau i oedolion, ar gyfer pobl ifanc sydd ag anghenion arbennig cymhleth mewn cysylltiad â gofal seibiant. Rhaid cydnabod y broblem hon, a rhoi blaenoriaeth i'w datrys. Mae'r adroddiad yn sôn am hybu'r arferion gorau a rhannu cyllidebau. Byddwn i'n dadlau y dylem fynd ymhellach o lawer na hybu. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r gwahaniaethau o ran darparu, yn fy etholaeth i'n sicr, yn syfrdanol. Ar hyn o bryd, yn y cyfnod trawsnewid, mae rhieni—sydd hefyd yn brif ofalwyr fel arfer—yn cael bod y ddarpariaeth a gawsant dros y blynyddoedd ar gyfer rhai ag anghenion iechyd a chymdeithasol cymhleth yn dechrau dod i ben. Gwelant hefyd, yn sydyn, fod y darparwyr dichonol mewn gwasanaethau iechyd a chymdeithasol yn ymddiddori'n fwy

packages.

Parents—the 24-hour carers—are left facing a future where they are subjected to listening to arguments as to which percentage of their child's needs falls to a health budget, and which percentage falls to a social services budget. This distasteful argument often leaves parents who are becoming older feeling absolutely desperate. Their natural support network of other parents, met through school events, has fallen away, as school no longer features in their lives, and it is often left to individual parents to fight alone for their own and their children's rights. Many parents, left exhausted by their carer role, become depressed, disillusioned and desperate. It is imperative that we ensure equal access to respite care for adults with complex special needs, equal to that on offer to those under 19 years of age. The biggest reassurance that you can give to the parent of a child with complex special needs is that their son or daughter will receive quality care, commensurate with their needs, regardless of whose budget pays for it. They need an assurance that the respite care on offer, as they move from children's services to adult services, remains of high quality. Parents need the assurance that the transition will be smooth and as event-free as possible. Their lives are complicated enough, and they deserve our support.

**Christine Chapman:** Like many Members, I regularly meet parents who are concerned about special needs provision for their children. I agree with Peter Law that problems with speech and language therapy services are particularly acute in poorer areas.

On children with special educational needs, I also flag up the problem of Asperger's syndrome, which Dai Lloyd mentioned earlier. Children with Asperger's have difficulties in socialising, communication and behaviour. It can be traumatic for a parent to receive the news that their child is affected by

mewn diogelu eu cyllidebau na chynnig pecynnau gofal.

Gadewir y rhieni—y rhai sy'n gofalu nos a dydd—i wynebu dyfodol lle y maent yn gorfod gwrando ar ddadleuon ynghylch pa ganran o anghenion eu plentyn sy'n perthyn i gyllideb iechyd, a pha ganran sy'n perthyn i gyllideb gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Yn aml, mae'r ddadl ddi-chwaeth hon yn peri i rieni sy'n dechrau mynd i oed deimlo'n gwbl anobeithiol. Mae eu rhwydwaith naturiol o gefnogaeth gan rieni eraill, y cyfarfuant â hwy drwy ddigwyddiadau yn yr ysgol, wedi darfod, gan nad yw'r ysgol yn rhan o'u bywyd bellach, ac mae rhieni unigol yn aml yn gorfod ymladd ar eu pen eu hun dros eu hawliau hwy a hawliau eu plant. Mae llawer o rieni, sydd wedi ymlâdd oherwydd eu rôl fel gofalwyr, yn mynd yn isel eu hysbryd, yn cael eu dadrithio ac yn anobeithio. Mae'n hollbwysig ein bod yn sicrhau'r un hawl i gael gofal seibiant ar gyfer oedolion sydd ag anghenion arbennig cymhleth, a bod hwnnw gystal â'r hyn sydd ar gael i'r rhai o dan 19 mlwydd oed. Y tawelwch meddwl mwyaf y gallwch ei roi i riant plentyn ag anghenion arbennig cymhleth yw y bydd ei fab neu'i ferch yn cael gofal o ansawdd da, sy'n gymesur â'i anghenion, ni waeth cyllideb pwy sy'n talu amdano. Mae ar rieni angen sicrwydd y bydd y gofal seibiant a gynigir, wrth iddynt symud o wasanaethau i blant i wasanaethau i oedolion, yn dal i fod o ansawdd da. Mae ar rieni angen sicrwydd y bydd y trawsnewid yn esmwyth ac mor ddidrafferth ag y bo modd. Mae eu bywydau'n gymhleth ddigon, ac maent yn haeddu ein cefnogaeth.

**Christine Chapman:** Fel llawer o Aelodau, yr wyf yn cwrdd yn rheolaidd â rhieni sy'n bryderus ynghylch darpariaeth anghenion arbennig ar gyfer eu plant. Cytunaf â Peter Law fod problemau o ran gwasanaethau therapi iaith a lleferydd yn arbennig o ddifrifol mewn ardaloedd tlotach.

Ynghylch plant ag anghenion addysgol arbennig, yr wyf finnau'n tynnu sylw at broblem syndrom Asperger, y cyfeiriodd Dai Lloyd ati'n gynharach. Mae plant sydd â syndrom Asperger yn profi anawsterau o ran cymdeithasu, cyfathrebu ac o ran eu hymddygiad. Gall fod yn brofiad ysgytwol i

Asperger's. Kirsty mentioned the disruption that the syndrome can cause to other siblings and parents. Living in a household where a child has Asperger's can be extremely stressful.

Parents will want to have the best possible advice and support. A number of parents in my constituency have told me that that support is not always forthcoming. Parents often complain that statementing takes too long, thus delaying the time until an assessment can be given. As I understand it, under the current rules, if a child has an IQ that is below 75, then support is given; but if a child has an IQ above 75, then it is extremely difficult to get support; flexibility is needed.

That children with special needs are being supported in mainstream schools, and are being educated with their friends and in the community in which they live, should be welcomed. Nevertheless, that support can be patchy, depending on the school that the child attends. Expertise among teachers concerning the needs of children who have Asperger's syndrome is inconsistent. Unless that is examined children who need support will be faced with the lottery of provision that is dependent on where they live. Dealing with Asperger's syndrome should be given priority on teacher training courses.

I am pleased with the reference to the availability of care and treatment, and the apparent good practice that exists. However, the report states that

'that must be validated and disseminated.'

There is a gap in services. Parents have told me that it is difficult to access information about available support. A family that I am currently dealing with was initially told that their child did not have Asperger's syndrome. Despite being on benefits, they decided to have a private assessment done, at which time they learned that their child actually did have Asperger's. We need to minimise such cases. A consistent level of support needs to be guaranteed, irrespective of the region of Wales in which you live.

riant gael y newydd bod syndrom Asperger yn effeithio ar ei blentyn. Soniodd Kirsty am y modd y mae'r syndrom yn gallu amharu ar frodyr a chwiorydd a rhieni. Gall fod yn ddiryngol iawn byw mewn cartref lle y mae plentyn â syndrom Asperger.

Bydd rhieni am gael y cyngor a'r cymorth gorau posibl. Mae nifer o rieni yn fy etholaeth wedi dweud wrthyf nad yw cymorth ar gael bob amser. Mae rhieni'n cwyno'n aml ei bod yn cymryd yn rhy hir iddynt gael datganiad, fel bod oedi cyn gellir cael asesiad. Fel yr wyf fi'n ei ddeall, o dan y rheolau presennol, os yw cyniferydd deallusrwydd y plentyn yn is na 75, rhoddir cymorth; ond os yw cyniferydd deallusrwydd y plentyn yn uwch na 75, mae'n anodd iawn cael cymorth; mae angen hyblygrwydd.

Dylid croesawu'r ffaith bod plant ag anghenion arbennig yn cael cymorth yn ysgolion y brif ffrwd, a'u bod yn cael eu haddysgu gyda'u ffrindiau ac yn y gymuned lle y maent yn byw. Er hynny, gall y cymorth hwnnw fod yn anghyson, ac mae'n dibynnu ar ba ysgol y mae'r plentyn yn mynd iddi. Ni cheir arbenigedd cyson ymysg athrawon o ran anghenion plant sydd â syndrom Asperger. Os na roddir sylw i hynny, bydd plant y mae arnynt angen cymorth yn wynebu ansicrwydd o ran darpariaeth yn ôl lle y maent yn byw. Dylid rhoi blaenoriaeth i drin syndrom Asperger mewn cyrsiau hyfforddi athrawon.

Yr wyf yn fodlon ar y cyfeiriad at argaeledd gofal a thriniaeth, a'r arfer ymddangosiadol dda a geir. Fodd bynnag, dywed yr adroddiad

y dylid ei ddilysu a'i ledaenu.

Mae bwlch mewn gwasanaethau. Mae rhieni wedi dweud wrthyf ei bod yn anodd cael gwybodaeth am y cymorth sydd ar gael. Yr oedd teulu yr wyf yn ymwneud â hwy ar hyn o bryd wedi'u hysbysu i ddechrau nad oedd syndrom Asperger ar eu plentyn. Er eu bod yn cael budd-daliadau, penderfynasant gael asesiad preifat, a dyna pryd y cawsant wybod bod syndrom Asperger ar eu plentyn. Rhaid inni sicrhau y ceir y nifer lleiaf posibl o achosion o'r fath. Rhaid gwarantu lefel gyson o gymorth, ym mha ranbarth bynnag o

Gymru y mae rhywun yn byw.

When faced with Asperger's syndrome, parents often get together to support each other. I pay tribute to the excellent work that is being done by the Cynon Valley Autism and Aspergers Support Group.

Pan wynebant syndrom Asperger, mae rhieni'n aml yn dod ynghyd i gefnogi ei gilydd. Talaf deyrnged i'r gwaith rhagorol a wneir gan Grŵp Cymorth Awtistiaeth a Syndrom Asperger Cwm Cynon.

I welcome the report. It notes the good practice that exists, but Members need to ensure that the special needs provision benefits all young people who require it and not just a few.

Croesawaf yr adroddiad. Mae'n nodi'r arferion da sy'n bodoli, ond rhaid i Aelodau sicrhau bod y ddarpariaeth ar gyfer anghenion arbennig yn dod â budd i bob person ifanc y mae arno'i hangen ac nid ychydig yn unig.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I welcome Recommendation 18, which concerns the supply of equipment and having a designated lead agency in every area.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Croesawaf argymhelliad 18, sy'n ymwneud â chyflenwi offer a phennu asiantaeth arweiniol ym mhob ardal.

I dealt with a sad case of a four-year-old girl with cerebral palsy who desperately needed a particular type of chair, which would enable her to be more mobile, alert and safe. For months, the petition for the chair went back and forth between the health authority and the education and social services departments—by the end of that time, her parents were in despair. That went on until I became a pain in the neck, and the health authority eventually said that it would supply the chair. It is not right that a child and distraught parents should suffer for months in that way, with no-one taking responsibility. I hope that recommendation 18 is fully implemented.

Bûm yn ymwneud ag achos trist merch bedair blwydd oed â pharlys yr ymennydd yr oedd taer angen arni fath penodol o gadair, a'i galluogai i fod yn fwy symudol, effro a diogel. Am fisoedd, aeth y ddeiseb dros gael y gadair yn ôl a blaen rhwng yr awdurdod iechyd a'r adrannau addysg a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol—erbyn diwedd y cyfnod hwnnw, yr oedd y rhieni wedi anobeithio. Aeth hynny ymlaen nes imi eu poeni, a dywedodd yr awdurdod iechyd yn y diwedd y byddai'n cyflenwi'r gadair. Nid yw'n iawn i blentyn a rhieni mewn trallod ddioddef felly am fisoedd, heb i neb dderbyn cyfrifoldeb. Gobeithiaf y caiff argymhelliad 18 ei weithredu'n llawn.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I was pleased when the Health and Social Services Committee decided to review the health services for children with special needs. I commend the Committee, of which I was a Member, on its work and its report. The Committee thanks all those who gave evidence, both parents and professionals. I assure Members, and all who contributed, that they have had a major influence on the Welsh Assembly Government.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Yr oeddwn yn falch pan benderfynodd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol adolygu'r gwasanaethau iechyd ar gyfer plant ag anghenion arbennig. Canmolaf y Pwyllgor, yr oeddwn i'n aelod ohono, ar ei waith a'i adroddiad. Mae'r Pwyllgor yn diolch i bawb a roddodd dystiolaeth, yn rhieni a gweithwyr proffesiynol. Yr wyf yn sicrhau Aelodau, a phawb a gyfrannodd, iddynt gael dylanwad mawr ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

4.20 p.m.

Many Members have spoken about the need to pay particular attention to these groups and to the needs of these young people. Last

Mae llawer o Aelodau wedi siarad am yr angen i dalu sylw arbennig i'r grwpiau hyn ac i anghenion y bobl ifanc hyn. Yr wythnos

week, I visited the Caerphilly children's centre to learn about its use of the flexibilities special grant, which this year is worth £7 million, and will rise to £9 million next year. That money is important to many of the recommendations that came from the Committee. It was David who said that we need to be smarter in how we use the money that we have to spend under the Health Act 1999. The opportunity for this kind of co-ordination is at the heart of delivering a better joined-up service for the families of children and young people. The Caerphilly children's centre project is led by a clinical nurse specialist, and her role is to develop a model of co-ordinated care for parents, aided and guided by the parents who are members of the parents' committee.

That is just one example of several projects across Wales where co-operation allows care to be co-ordinated across services for the benefit of children and their families. Another example is the multi-disciplinary service for disabled children in Bridgend, which is currently being developed. We must look to those projects as models for the rest of Wales. The flexibilities special grant is crucial, particularly the recommendation in relation to equipment. We already have a number of equipment stores across Wales, which have been funded by the Assembly Government's flexibilities special grant to local authorities.

I have considered each one of the Committee report's 26 recommendations, and I support all of them in principle. In fact, action is already underway to implement a number of those recommendations. An action plan is going out to Members this afternoon. I did not want to take all the time that I could have taken to respond, because this is such an important report. You will see the detailed Assembly Government response to every recommendation in the Committee's report in that action plan.

I will however mention some of the specific points. It is clear that, as Kirsty said, our children's national service framework will

diwethaf, ymwelais â chanolfan plant Caerffili i ddysgu am y modd y mae'n defnyddio'r grant hyblygrwydd arbennig, sy'n werth £7 miliwn eleni, ac a fydd yn codi i £9 miliwn y flwyddyn nesaf. Mae'r arian hwnnw'n bwysig ar gyfer llawer o'r argymhellion a gyflwynodd y Pwyllgor. David a ddywedodd fod rhaid inni fod yn fwy clyfar o ran y modd yr ydym yn defnyddio'r arian sydd gennym i'w wario o dan y Ddeddf Iechyd 1999. Mae'r cyfle i weithio'n gydlynol fel hyn yn hanfodol er mwyn darparu gwasanaeth mwy cydgysylltiedig ar gyfer teuluoedd plant a phobl ifanc. Mae prosiect canolfan plant Caerffili yn cael ei arwain gan nyrs arbenigwraig glinigol, a'i rôl hi yw datblygu model o ofal cydlynol ar gyfer rhieni, gyda chymorth ac arweiniad gan y rhieni sy'n aelodau o'r pwyllgor rhieni.

Nid yw honno ond yn un enghraifft o blith nifer o brosiectau ledled Cymru lle y mae cydweithredu'n hwyluso'r gwaith o gydlynu rhwng gwasanaethau er budd plant a'u teuluoedd. Enghraifft arall yw'r gwasanaeth amlddisgyblaethol ar gyfer plant anabl ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr sy'n cael ei ddatblygu ar hyn o bryd. Rhaid inni ystyried y prosiectau hynny'n fodelau i weddill Cymru. Mae'r grant hyblygrwydd arbennig yn hollbwysig, yn enwedig ar gyfer yr argymhelliad sy'n ymwneud ag offer. Mae gennym nifer o storfeydd offer ledled Cymru eisoes, ac maent wedi'u cyllido drwy grant hyblygrwydd arbennig Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i awdurdodau lleol.

Yr wyf wedi ystyried pob un o'r 26 o argymhellion sydd yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor, a chefnogaf bob un ohonynt mewn egwyddor. Mewn gwirionedd, dechreuwyd cymryd camau eisoes i roi nifer o'r argymhellion hynny ar waith. Anfonir cynllun gweithredu at Aelodau y prynhawn yma. Nid oeddwn am gymryd yr holl amser y gallwn fod wedi'i gymryd i ymateb, oherwydd bod yr adroddiad hwn mor bwysig. Byddwch yn gweld ymateb manwl Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i bob argymhelliad yn adrodd y Pwyllgor yn y cynllun gweithredu hwnnw.

Gwnaf sôn, er hynny, am rai o'r pwyntiau penodol. Mae'n amlwg, fel y dywedodd Kirsty, y bydd ein fframwaith gwasanaeth

take us forward strategically. Work that covers the whole spectrum of health and social care has already started in earnest. It will address the health and social care needs of children and young people from before conception to their eighteenth birthday. Ann Jones's point about low birth-weight is important, and we must tackle the social aspect of that through the impact of Sure Start and the wider social health and wellbeing agenda.

The children's national service framework is moving forward, with expert groups considering how they can develop standards for the first phase of their work. A child-centred approach directs us to establish care pathways that a child can travel through with their family and to establish the standards of service that can be expected, so that we do not just rely on the good practice that we identified during our review. It must be a national service framework in which not only is health and social care provision co-ordinated, but education and housing services also. Parents should have a single point of contact in a key worker, and co-ordinated services.

Dai, I was disappointed by your negative response to the fact that Wales is taking forward a pioneering national strategy for autism. I was disappointed that you were not present when we launched that strategy. Autism Cymru is pleased that we are in the lead on this initiative. Yesterday, I met Scottish representatives who want to learn about our Welsh national strategy for autism, because it gives us a lead in securing high-quality services of proven effectiveness. They must be uniformly accessible across Wales. The social care needs are already being addressed under our Children First programme. We are already seeing development in terms of our all-Wales disability managers' network group, which has developed as a result of Children First.

A number of people have mentioned respite care, Karen, in particular. That is an important group for ensuring that we can

cededlaethol i blant yn ein harwain yn strategol. Dechreuwyd o ddifrif eisoes ar waith sy'n ymdrin â'r holl amrediad o iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Bydd yn rhoi sylw i anghenion iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol plant a phobl ifanc o'r adeg cyn eu cenedlu hyd at eu pen-blwydd yn 18. Mae'r pwynt a wnaeth Ann Jones am bwysau geni isel yn bwysig, a rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â'r agwedd gymdeithasol ar hynny drwy effaith Cychwyn Cadarn a'r agenda ehangach ar gyfer iechyd a lles cymdeithasol.

Mae'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol i blant yn symud ymlaen, ac mae grwpiau arbenigol yn ystyried sut y gallant ddatblygu safonau ar gyfer cyfnod cyntaf eu gwaith. Oherwydd bod gennym ddull gweithredu sy'n canolbwyntio ar y plentyn, byddwn yn sefydlu llwybrau gofal y gall plentyn eu dilyn gyda'i deulu ac yn sefydlu'r safonau gwasanaeth y gellir eu disgwyl, fel nad ydym ond yn dibynnu ar yr arferion da y bu inni eu canfod yn ystod ein hadolygiad. Rhaid iddo fod yn fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol sy'n cydlynu gwasanaethau addysg a thai yn ogystal â'r ddarpariaeth iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Dylai rhieni gael un pwynt cyswllt ar ffurf gweithiwr allweddol, a gwasanaethau wedi'u cydlynu.

Dai, yr oeddwn yn siomedig yn eich ymateb negyddol i'r ffaith bod Cymru'n bwrw ymlaen â strategaeth genedlaethol arloesol ar gyfer awtistiaeth. Yr oeddwn yn siomedig nad oeddech yn bresennol pan wnaethom lansio'r strategaeth honno. Mae Awtistiaeth Cymru yn falch ein bod ar y blaen gyda'r fenter hon. Ddoe, cyfarfûm â chynrychiolwyr o'r Alban sydd am gael gwybod am ein strategaeth genedlaethol Gymreig ar gyfer awtistiaeth, am ei bod yn rhoi mantais inni wrth sicrhau gwasanaethau o ansawdd da y profwyd eu bod yn effeithiol. Rhaid iddynt fod ar gael yn unffurf ledled Cymru. Mae'r anghenion gofal cymdeithasol yn cael sylw eisoes o dan ein rhaglen Rhoi Plant yn Gyntaf. Yr ydym eisoes yn gweld datblygu yng nghyd-destun ein grŵp rhwydwaith rheolwyr anabled i Gymru gyfan, sydd wedi datblygu o ganlyniad i Rhoi Plant yn Gyntaf.

Mae nifer wedi sôn am ofal seibiant, a Karen yn benodol. Mae hwnnw'n grŵp pwysig er mwyn sicrhau y gallwn nodi anghenion



identify particular respite service needs. Our carers' special grant also indicates that there must be respite for children with special needs. We must remember that disabled children and their families will access a greater range and choice of services through direct payment and voucher schemes.

Speech and language therapy is critical, and Peter Law and many others have mentioned this. Jane Davidson and I have set up a multi-disciplinary group to address this issue. We are receiving a report from that group shortly. In our workforce plans we have said that we must identify the number of speech and language therapists and increase the numbers in training. Cynog and others discussed language therapy assistants and we must consider how we can make better use of them.

We must also ensure that we take forward—as Dai and many others mentioned—our own unique code on special needs, which focuses on Welsh issues, including the Welsh language and Welsh circumstances and structures. The Assembly backed it unanimously in November 2001 and schools and local education authorities must implement it from April 2002.

We are taking many of these recommendations forward. This excellent report was brought to the Committee and I pay tribute to all who contributed to it and to Kirsty's leadership in delivering a report that is evidently from the people of Wales. As I have demonstrated today, the Welsh Assembly Government is taking this forward and will ensure that the changes are delivered through its national service framework and all the other measures which I have mentioned.

**Kirsty Williams:** I thank everyone for their contributions and comments on this report, especially my fellow Committee members. I welcome both Dai Lloyd and David Melding's comments as they have worked hard, as have other Committee members, in preparing this report.

Ann took the opportunity—as she did

penodol o ran y gwasanaeth gofal seibiant. Mae ein grant arbennig i ofalwyr hefyd yn dangos bod rhaid wrth ofal seibiant i blant sydd ag anghenion arbennig. Rhaid inni gofio y bydd plant anabl a'u teuluoedd yn gallu cael dewis mwy amrywiol o wasanaethau drwy gynlluniau talu uniongyrchol a thalebau.

Mae therapi iaith a lleferydd yn hollbwysig, ac mae Peter Law a llawer un arall wedi sôn am hyn. Mae Jane Davidson a minnau wedi sefydlu grŵp amlddisgyblaethol i ymdrin â'r mater hwn. Byddwn yn cael adroddiad gan y grŵp hwnnw cyn hir. Yn ein cynlluniau gweithlu, yr ydym wedi dweud bod rhaid inni ganfod y nifer o therapyddion iaith a lleferydd a geir a hyfforddi mwy ohonynt. Gwnaeth Cynog ac eraill drafod cynorthwywyr therapi iaith a rhaid inni ystyried sut y gallwn eu defnyddio'n well.

Rhaid inni sicrhau hefyd—fel y dywedodd Dai a llawer un arall—ein bod yn bwrw ymlaen â'n cod unigryw ar anghenion arbennig, sy'n canolbwyntio ar faterion Cymreig, gan gynnwys y Gymraeg ac amgylchiadau a strwythurau yng Nghymru. Gwnaeth y Cynulliad ei gefnogi'n unfrydol ym mis Tachwedd 2001 a rhaid i ysgolion ac awdurdodau addysg lleol ei roi ar waith o Ebrill 2002.

Yr ydym yn bwrw ymlaen â llawer o'r argymhellion hyn. Rhoddwyd yr adroddiad rhagorol hwn gerbron y Pwyllgor a thalaf deyrnged i bawb a gyfrannodd ato ac i arweiniad Kirsty wrth sicrhau adroddiad sy'n amlwg yn un gan bobl Cymru. Fel yr wyf wedi dangos heddiw, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn bwrw ymlaen â hyn a bydd yn sicrhau y cyflawnir y newidiadau drwy ei fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol a'r holl fesurau eraill yr wyf wedi sôn amdanynt.

**Kirsty Williams:** Diolchaf i bawb am eu cyfraniadau a'u sylwadau am yr adroddiad hwn, yn enwedig fy nghyd-aelodau o'r Pwyllgor. Croesawaf y sylwadau gan Dai Lloyd a David Melding gan eu bod wedi gweithio'n galed, fel y gwnaeth aelodau eraill o'r Pwyllgor, wrth baratoi'r adroddiad hwn.

Achubodd Ann ar y cyfle—fel y gwnaeth

throughout the review—to raise the important issue of low birth-weight babies. I am grateful that she has done so. We could do much more as a nation to improve the worrying statistics that she quoted. I am pleased that David pointed out that many of our recommendations must be implemented because there is agreement about a lack of resources. Much of what we found as a Committee, and much of what we comment on simply requires people to improve their co-operation and we cannot use a lack of resources as an excuse for that. There is no reason why many of these recommendations cannot be achieved because many simply require people to break down the traditional barriers of how they worked in the past and move forward.

Peter Law highlights a problem that affects his constituency badly; the Gwent region probably has some of the longest waiting lists for speech and language therapists. It is unacceptable to the Health and Social Services Committee that constituents in Gwent should wait such a long time when children in other parts of Wales receive the service within a reasonable timescale. That inequality cannot be acceptable to any of us in this Chamber. I am grateful for Val's comments: she brings great professional expertise in this field to this debate. I also appreciate the positive comments of William Graham and Eleanor Burnham. Karen Sinclair raised the vexed issue of the transition period as a person moves from children's to adult services. It is highly complex and worrying for parents who are getting on in age. They are looking for reassurance about what will happen to their child while their ability to care for that child is perhaps lessening. If I were to consider leading on another Committee report at another time we would do well to look at services in that particular area. Christine Chapman and Lorraine Barrett, I hope that the report has some resonance for you, that it reflects the particular problems that constituents bring to you and that it addresses those particular concerns.

Gareth Jones's was the only dissenting voice

drwy gydol yr adolygiad—i godi'r mater pwysig o fabanod â phwysau geni isel. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar iddi am wneud hynny. Gallem wneud llawer mwy fel cenedl i wella'r ystadegau a ddyfynnodd, gan eu bod yn destun gofid. Yr wyf yn falch bod David wedi nodi bod rhaid rhoi llawer o'n hargymhellion ar waith am fod cytundeb ynghylch diffyg adnoddau. Y cwbl sydd ei angen ar gyfer llawer o'r hyn a ddarganfuom fel Pwyllgor, a llawer o'r hyn y gwnaethom sylwadau amdano, yw gwell cydweithrediad ac ni allwn gymryd diffyg adnoddau'n esgus am hynny. Nid oes rheswm dros fethu â chyflawni llawer o'r argymhellion hyn oherwydd y cwbl sy'n ofynnol yn achos llawer ohonynt yw i bobl chwalu'r rhwystrau traddodiadol o ran eu dull o weithio yn y gorffennol a symud ymlaen.

Mae Peter Law yn tynnu sylw at broblem ddifrifol yn ei etholaeth; mae'n debyg mai yn rhanbarth Gwent y ceir rhai o'r rhestrau aros hwyaf am therapyddion iaith a lleferydd. Nid yw'n dderbyniol gan y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol fod etholwyr yng Ngwent yn gorfod aros cyhyd pan fo plant mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru'n derbyn y gwasanaeth o fewn cyfnod rhesymol o amser. Ni all y fath anghydraddoldeb fod yn dderbyniol gan neb yn y Siambr hon. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y sylwadau a wnaeth Val: mae ganddi arbenigedd proffesiynol helaeth i'w gyfrannu i'r ddadl hon. Yr wyf hefyd yn gwerthfawrogi'r sylwadau cadarnhaol gan William Graham ac Eleanor Burnham. Gwnaeth Karen Sinclair godi mater dyrys y cyfnod o drawsnewid wrth i rywun fynd o wasanaethau i blant i wasanaethau i oedolion. Mae'n astrus iawn ac yn peri pryder i rieni sy'n mynd i oed. Maent yn ceisio tawelwch meddwl ynghylch yr hyn a ddigwydd i'w plentyn tra bo'u gallu i ofalu am y plentyn hwnnw'n lleihau o bosibl. Pe byddwn yn ystyried arwain ar adroddiad Pwyllgor arall rywbryd, byddai'n ddoeth inni ystyried gwasanaethau yn y maes penodol hwnnw. Christine Chapman a Lorraine Barrett, gobeithiaf eich bod yn teimlo bod yr adroddiad yn berthnasol i chi i ryw raddau, ei fod yn adlewyrchu'r problemau penodol y mae'ch etholwyr yn eu codi gyda chi a'i fod yn ymdrin â'r pryderon penodol hynny.

Llais Gareth Jones oedd yr unig un anghytûn

this afternoon. I am disappointed, Gareth, that you could not accept the spirit in which this report was taken forward. The spokespeople of all the political parties agreed that this report needed to be done.

**Gareth Jones:** Yr unig beth yr oeddwn yn ceisio ei ddweud, Kirsty, oedd er fy mod yn gwerthfawrogi'r adroddiad a'r gwaith a wnaethpwyd i'w lunio, nid ydyw ond yn ailadrodd yr un stori drosodd a throsodd. Gwyddom beth yw'r problemau, yr oeddem yn gwybod beth oeddynt bedair blynedd yn ôl—ceisio dangos yr oeddwn nad ydym wedi symud ymlaen. Mae'r un anghenion yn aros. Sut y bydd yr adroddiad hwn yn newid y sefyllfa er gwell?

4.30 p.m.

**Kirsty Williams:** Thank you for the clarification, Gareth; that did not come through in your contribution. Unfortunately, the problems that we are facing were created well before the last three or four years. These are intrinsic problems that have established themselves over many years as a result of practice taking place in a certain way. The Minister with responsibility for special needs, and the Assembly as a whole, must face the challenge of breaking the traditional work pattern in which we have become entrenched and which has led to the problems that we have identified.

I have had the great privilege of being the Chair of the Health and Social Services Committee from day one of this Assembly. I am the only surviving Chair from those early days. There were times when I thought that I would not make it, but I am privileged to have enjoyed that position for the last three and a half years. In that time, the Committee has added great value to the work of the National Assembly and, in preparing reports of this kind, it has demonstrated how the National Assembly can work at its best, with Members from all political parties sharing their views and ideas around the table and discussing them without adopting the yah-boo style that is often seen in the Chamber. As a result of such positive work we have created a positive report. The challenge of making that report a reality now lies in the

y prynhawn yma. Yr wyf yn siomedig, Gareth, na allech dderbyn yr ysbryd y datblygwyd yr adroddiad hwn ynddo. Yr oedd llefaryddion yr holl bleidiau gwleidyddol yn cytuno bod angen llunio'r adroddiad hwn.

**Gareth Jones:** All I was trying to say, Kirsty, was that although I value the report and the work that has gone into its creation, it only repeats the same story over and over again. We know what the problems are, we knew what they were four years ago—I was trying to show that we have not moved forward. The same needs remain. How will this report improve the situation?

**Kirsty Williams:** Diolch ichi am egluro, Gareth; ni chyflewyd hynny yn eich cyfraniad. Gwaetha'r modd, cafodd y problemau a wynebwn eu creu ymhell cyn y tair neu bedair blynedd diwethaf. Maent yn broblemau cynhenid sydd wedi ymwreiddio dros flynyddoedd lawer am fod yr ymarfer wedi digwydd mewn modd penodol. Rhaid i'r Gweinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb dros anghenion arbennig, a'r Cynulliad cyfan, wynebu'r her o chwalu'r patrwm gwaith traddodiadol sydd wedi ymwreiddio mor ddwfn ac sydd wedi arwain at y problemau yr ydym wedi'u nodi.

Cefais y fraint fawr o fod yn Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol o ddiwrnod cyntaf y Cynulliad hwn. Fi yw'r unig Gadeirydd sydd wedi goroesi ers y dyddiau cynnar hynny. Bu adegau pan gredais na fyddwn yn dod drwyddi, ond bu'n fraint imi gyflawni'r swydd hon am y tair blynedd a hanner diwethaf. Yn y cyfnod hwnnw, mae'r Pwyllgor wedi ychwanegu gwerth mawr at waith y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ac, wrth baratoi adroddiadau o'r math hwn, mae wedi dangos sut y gall y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol weithio ar ei orau, wrth i Aelodau o'r holl bleidiau gwleidyddol rannu eu barn a'u syniadau o gylch y bwrdd a'u trafod heb fabwysiadu'r arddull cecrus a welir yn aml yn y Siambr. O ganlyniad i waith cadarnhaol o'r fath, yr ydym wedi creu adroddiad

hands of the Executive.

cadarnhaol. Mae'r her o wireddu'r adroddiad  
hwnnw yn nwylo'r Weithrediaeth yn awr.

*Cynnig (NDM1343): O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM1343): For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

**Dyfodol y Cynlluniau Amaeth-Amgylcheddol**  
**The Future of Agri-Environmental Schemes**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol

selected amendments 1, 2 and 3 in the name of Jonathan Morgan.

**The Deputy First Minister and Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad (Michael German):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales recognises the valuable contribution made by the Tir Gofal and organic farming schemes to the promotion of environmental sustainability in Wales, and agrees that every effort should be made to broaden the scope of future agri-environmental schemes, subject to the outcome of the mid-term review of the common agricultural policy, so that environmental benefits across Wales are maximised.* (NDM1344)

Agri-environmental schemes are the sharp end of a new way of thinking about agriculture, management of the environment and the Welsh countryside. Our scheme, Tir Gofal, is an internationally recognised model due to its whole-farm, comprehensive approach. I can now announce the details of our new organic stewardship payments, which will be significantly higher than those being introduced in England. Agri-environmental schemes are here to stay. We must look to the future and take further steps to enhance environmental management.

The first agri-environmental scheme in Wales was the Cambrian mountains and Llŷn peninsula environmentally sensitive area scheme, which was later extended to other parts of Wales. Tir Cymen was introduced in 1992 and was available in three pilot areas. The habitat scheme, a part-farm scheme, was introduced to protect and enhance habitats like broadleaved woodlands, semi-natural grasslands and coastal belts. The moorland scheme was set up to protect moorlands through stocking rate reductions. The success of those schemes was such that, by 1996, consultation identified overwhelming support for a single whole-farm agri-environmental scheme that would be available throughout Wales.

Tir Gofal was launched in 1999 as the

gwelliannau 1, 2 a 3 yn enw Jonathan Morgan.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor (Michael German):** Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn cydnabod cyfraniad gwerthfawr Tir Gofal a'r cynllun ffermio organig at hyrwyddo cynaliadwyedd yr amgylchedd yng Nghymru, ac yn cytuno y dylid gwneud pob ymdrech i ehangu cwmpas cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol yn y dyfodol, gan ddibynnu ar ganlyniad yr adolygiad canol tymor o'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin, er mwyn cael y buddiannau amgylcheddol gorau posibl i Gymru gyfan.* (NDM1344)

Cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol yw'r elfen fwyaf blaengar mewn ffordd newydd o feddwl am amaethyddiaeth, rheoli'r amgylchedd a chefn gwlad Cymru. Mae ein cynllun, Tir Gofal, yn fodel a gydnabuwyd yn rhyngwladol oherwydd ei ddull cynhwysfawr sy'n ymwneud â'r fferm gyfan. Yn awr, gallaf gyhoeddi manylion ein taliadau stiwardiaeth organig newydd, a fydd yn uwch o lawer na'r rhai a gyflwynir yn Lloegr. Mae cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol wedi ennill eu plwyf. Rhaid inni edrych tua'r dyfodol a chymryd camau pellach i wella'r rheolaeth ar yr amgylchedd.

Y cynllun amaeth-amgylcheddol cyntaf yng Nghymru oedd cynllun ardal amgylchedd arbennig mynyddoedd y Cambrian a phenrhyn Llŷn, a estynnwyd yn ddiweddarach i gynnwys rhannau eraill o Gymru. Cyflwynwyd Tir Cymen yn 1992 ac yr oedd ar gael mewn tair ardal beilot. Cyflwynwyd y cynllun cynefinoedd, cynllun ar gyfer rhannau o ffermydd, i ddiogelu a gwella cynefinoedd fel coetiroedd llydanddail, tir glas lled-naturiol a lleiniau arfordirol. Sefydlwyd y cynllun rhostir i ddiogelu rhostiroedd drwy ostwng cyfraddau stocio. Gymaint oedd llwyddiant y cynlluniau hynny fel i broses ymgynghori yn 1996 amlygu cefnogaeth ysgubol i ddatblygu un cynllun amaeth-amgylcheddol ar gyfer ffermydd cyfan a fyddai ar gael ledled Cymru.

Lansiwyd Tir Gofal yn 1999 fel prif gynllun

Assembly's flagship environmentally-friendly farming scheme and it is regarded as one of the best of its type in Europe. Its principal objectives are to improve, restore and create wildlife habitats; to protect and restore characteristic rural landscapes; to protect and conserve historic and archaeological features; and to provide public access to the countryside. It covers whole farms and is available throughout Wales. To date some 1,300 agreements have been signed and a further 200 are in their final stages. It gave me great pleasure, last September, to visit the thousandth farmer to have joined Tir Gofal and the next milestone, the two-thousandth agreement, should be reached by the end of this year.

By the end of this financial year, some £26 million will have been committed to Tir Gofal agreements and a further £55 million is committed for the next three years. This is overwhelmingly from Assembly resources, and only around 15 per cent comes from the European Union. In addition, we will be recycling modulation receipts, which are expected to have reached £7.5 million by October 2003, to further increase the total available resources. As questions have been asked about modulation, I should mention that in 2002, for the first time, £725,000 in modulation money became available to the Assembly to spend on Tir Gofal. However, because of the foot and mouth disease outbreak in the previous year, which meant that our inspectors and those within the Countryside Council for Wales who were dealing with the scheme were unable to gain access to farms, there was an underspend in the Tir Gofal budget for that year.

We have therefore rolled the money forward. N+3 applies in this scheme and we have until October 2004 to spend the 2001 receipts, although I anticipate that we will have spent all of those receipts during this current year.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** You make a great deal of the fact that all of this money is available, but do you recognise that a significant number of farmers in Wales have still not received their environmentally sensitive area payments, to which they have been entitled for over six

ffermio ystyriol o'r amgylchedd y Cynulliad ac fe'i hystyrir yn un o'r goreuon o'i fath yn Ewrop. Ei brif amcanion yw gwella, adfer a chreu cynefinoedd i fywyd gwyllt; diogelu ac adfer nodweddion tirluniau gwledig; diogelu a chadw nodweddion hanesyddol ac archaeolegol; a darparu mynediad i'r cyhoedd i gefn gwlad. Mae'n cwmpasu ffermydd cyfan ac mae ar gael ledled Cymru. Hyd yma, arwyddwyd tua 1,300 o gytundebau ac mae 200 o rai pellach bron â'u cwblhau. Cefais bleser mawr, fis Medi diwethaf, o ymweld â'r milfed ffermwr i ymuno â Tir Gofal a dylem gyrraedd y garreg filltir nesaf, cytundeb rhif dwy fil, erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn hon.

Erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn ariannol hon, bydd tua £26 miliwn wedi'i neilltuo ar gyfer cytundebau Tir Gofal ac mae £55 miliwn pellach wedi'i neilltuo ar gyfer y tair blynedd nesaf. Daw'r rhan helaethaf ohono o adnoddau'r Cynulliad, a dim ond tua 15 y cant a ddaw o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Yn ogystal, byddwn yn ailgylchu derbyniadau modiwlleiddio, y disgwylir iddynt gyrraedd £7.5 miliwn erbyn mis Hydref 2003, er mwyn cynyddu ymhellach gyfanswm yr adnoddau sydd ar gael. Gan fod cwestiynau wedi'u codi ynghylch modiwlleiddio, dylwn nodi bod £725,000 o arian modiwlleiddio wedi dod i'r Cynulliad yn 2002, am y tro cyntaf, i'w wario ar Tir Gofal. Fodd bynnag, oherwydd yr achosion o glwy'r traed a'r genau yn y flwyddyn flaenorol, a olygai nad oedd ein harolygwyr ni a'r rhai yng Nghyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru a oedd yn delio â'r cynllun yn gallu cael mynediad i ffermydd, bu tanwario ar y gyllideb Tir Gofal ar gyfer y flwyddyn honno.

Gan hynny, yr ydym wedi dwyn yr arian ymlaen. Mae N+3 yn berthnasol i'r cynllun hwn ac mae gennym tan fis Hydref 2004 i wario derbyniadau 2001, er fy mod yn rhagweld y byddwn wedi gwario'r cwbl o'r arian hwnnw yn ystod y flwyddyn bresennol.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr ydych yn gwneud yn fawr o'r ffaith bod yr holl arian hwn ar gael, ond a ydych yn cydnabod bod nifer fawr o ffermwyr yng Nghymru heb dderbyn eu taliadau ardal amgylchedd arbennig eto, a hwythau â hawl i'w derbyn ers dros chwe

months? They have now been told that the Welsh Assembly Government has no facility to pay them. Can you assure us that these payments will be made quickly, and that the arrangements for doing so are in place?

**Michael German:** I assure you that Assembly officials are making every effort to ensure that all payments are made as rapidly as possible and that the rate of payment is accelerated.

We have carried out a thorough stock-take of Tir Gofal, which is important, because it was clear from the beginning that the administration needed to be streamlined to enable a greater number of farmers to benefit from the scheme. The resulting changes will be introduced by the time that the scheme reopens later this year.

The organic farming scheme is more specialised and has different objectives. Organic farming offers significant environmental benefits and the level of payments reflects this. To date, more than 550 farms have entered the scheme and the support that we have provided for conversion, through the establishment of Organic Centre Wales and through the provision of specialist advice as a part of Farming Connect, is tailored to maximise the environmental gains and to deliver a viable organic business.

I announced last October that I would introduce new payments for organic stewardship. This will be realised through an amendment to the organic farming scheme, and there are several improvements. Current and new agreements will be extended from five to 10 years—

**Peter Rogers** *rose*—

**Michael German:** I will take an intervention when I finish discussing the improvements.

There will be an option to withdraw at the fifth anniversary. Farmers who have converted to organic production without assistance will be eligible to enter the scheme for a five-year period. Payment rates in years 4 and 5 will be increased from £20 to £35 per hectare on arable land, from £15 to £35 per

mis? Dywedwyd wrthynt bellach nad oes gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gyfleuster i'w talu. A allwch ein sicrhau y gwneir y taliadau hyn yn gyflym, a bod y trefniadau i wneud hynny ar waith?

**Michael German:** Yr wyf yn eich sicrhau bod swyddogion y Cynulliad yn gwneud pob ymdrech i sicrhau y gwneir yr holl daliadau cyn gynted ag y bo modd ac y cyflymir y gyfradd dalu.

Yr ydym wedi cloriannu Tir Gofal yn drwyadl, ac mae hynny'n bwysig, gan ei bod yn amlwg o'r dechrau fod angen symleiddio'r gweinyddu fel y gallai nifer fwy o ffermwyr elwa o'r cynllun. Cyflwynir y newidiadau a ddaw yn sgîl hynny erbyn adeg ailagor y cynllun yn ddiweddarach eleni.

Mae'r cynllun ffermio organig yn fwy arbenigol ac mae iddo amcanion gwahanol. Mae ffermio organig yn cynnig llawer o fanteision amgylcheddol ac mae lefel y taliadau'n adlewyrchu hynny. Hyd yma, mae mwy na 550 o ffermydd wedi ymuno â'r cynllun ac mae'r cymorth a roesom ar gyfer trosglwyddo, drwy sefydlu Canolfan Organig Cymru, a thrwy ddarparu cyngor arbenigol fel rhan o Cyswllt Ffermio, wedi'i addasu i gael y buddiannau amgylcheddol mwyaf posibl a sicrhau busnes organig dichonadwy.

Cyhoeddais fis Hydref diwethaf y byddwn yn cyflwyno taliadau newydd ar gyfer stiwardiaeth organig. Gwireddir hynny drwy newid i'r cynllun ffermio organig, ac mae sawl gwelliant. Bydd y cytundebau presennol a rhai newydd yn cael eu hystyngi o bump i 10 mlynedd—

**Peter Rogers** *a gododd*—

**Michael German:** Gwnaf dderbyn ymyriad ar ôl gorffen trafod y gwelliannau.

Gellir tynnu allan o'r cynllun ar ddiwedd y bumed flwyddyn. Bydd ffermwyr sydd wedi troi at gynhyrchu organig heb gymorth yn gymwys i ymuno â'r cynllun am gyfnod o bum mlynedd. Bydd y cyfraddau talu ym mlynnyddoedd 4 a 5 yn cael eu cynyddu o £20 i £35 yr hecтар ar dir â'r, o £15 i £35 yr hecтар

hectare on enclosed land, and from £5 to £10 per hectare on unenclosed land. These new rates will then continue as organic stewardship payments in years 6 to 10. The new rates are significantly higher than those announced by the Department for the Environment, Food and Rural Affairs in England. Our arable rate is £5 per hectare or 17 per cent higher, our enclosed land rate is £12 per hectare or 52 per cent higher, and our unenclosed land rate is £5 per hectare or 100 per cent higher. These changes must be approved by the European Commission before they can be introduced. They were submitted at the end of last year and I expect to hear the outcome within a few months. This stewardship scheme is a significant initiative and another important example of our commitment to the organic sector in Wales.

**Peter Rogers:** You say that you have plans for the organic sector in Wales, but why have last year's organic conversion payments not been made? I remember seeing Eleanor Burnham in Anglesey in October, asking about those payments. They have still not been made. Why will you not make these organic conversion payments?

**Michael German:** I refer you to the reason that I gave earlier.

It is too early to make a full evaluation of Tir Gofal, but the results so far indicate that there is a strong case for the existence of a whole-farm agri-environmental scheme such as Tir Gofal in Wales. I welcome the fact that the Assembly's Agriculture and Rural Development Committee is considering these issues, because we need to further develop the agri-environmental approach for several reasons. First, farmers feel that if they are all required to contribute towards the funding of a rural development measure, they should all be able to benefit from it. There is a long waiting list for Tir Gofal, which is a measure of its popularity. At the same time, it has exacting requirements, and there is a strong feeling that we should take a broader approach and give farmers access to at least a first level of agri-environmental payments in return for meeting basic environmental

ar dir caeëdig, ac o £5 i £10 yr hectar ar dir agored. Bydd y cyfraddau newydd hyn yn parhau ar ffurf taliadau stiwardiaeth organig ym mlynnyddoedd 6 i 10. Mae'r cyfraddau newydd yn uwch o lawer na'r rhai a gyhoeddwyd gan Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig yn Lloegr. Mae ein cyfradd ar gyfer tir âr yn £5 yr hectar neu 17 y cant yn uwch, mae ein cyfradd ar gyfer tir caeëdig yn £12 yr hectar neu 52 y cant yn uwch, ac mae ein cyfradd ar gyfer tir agored yn £5 yr hectar neu 100 y cant yn uwch. Rhaid i'r newidiadau hyn gael eu cymeradwyo gan y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd cyn y gellir eu rhoi ar waith. Fe'u cyflwynwyd iddo ddiwedd y flwyddyn ddiwethaf a disgwyliaf glywed y canlyniad o fewn ychydig fisoedd. Mae'r cynllun stiwardiaeth hwn yn fenter o bwys ac yn enghraifft bwysig arall o'n hymrwymiad i'r sector organig yng Nghymru.

**Peter Rogers:** Dywedwch fod gennych gynlluniau ar gyfer y sector organig yng Nghymru, ond pam na wnaed y taliadau trosglwyddo organig ar gyfer y flwyddyn ddiwethaf? Cofiaf weld Eleanor Burnham yn Ynys Môn ym mis Hydref, yn holi ynghylch y taliadau hynny. Ni wnaethpwyd y taliadau hyd yn hyn. Pam na wnewch y taliadau trosglwyddo organig hyn?

**Michael German:** Fe'ch cyfeiriaf at y rheswm a roddais yn gynharach.

Mae'n rhy fuan eto i werthuso Tir Gofal yn llawn, ond mae'r canlyniadau hyd yma'n dangos bod dadl gryf dros fodolaeth cynllun amaeth-amgylcheddol ar gyfer y fferm gyfan fel Tir Gofal yng Nghymru. Croesawaf y ffaith bod Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig y Cynulliad yn ystyried y materion hyn, gan fod angen inni ddatblygu'r dull amaeth-amgylcheddol ymhellach am sawl rheswm. Yn gyntaf, mae ffermwyr yn teimlo, os yw'n ofynnol iddynt oll gyfrannu at gyllido mesur datblygu gwledig, y dylent oll gael elwa arno. Mae rhestr aros hir am Tir Gofal, ac mae hynny'n arwydd o'i boblogrwydd. Er hynny, mae iddo ofynion manwl, ac mae teimlad cryf y dylem ymgymryd â dull gweithredu ehangach a galluogi ffermwyr i gael lefel gyntaf o daliadau amaeth-amgylcheddol o leiaf yn gyfnewid am fodloni amodau amgylcheddol



conditions. This is important in terms of equity but it also sends a strong signal to farmers that in future they will receive a larger proportion of their public funding for the provision of identifiable environmental benefits. Secondly, some of the major environmental challenges cannot be delivered on a single farm but require concerted action across holdings. Such challenges include tackling diffused pollution, enhancing biodiversity, safeguarding the historic environment and traditional landscapes and providing new public access. In conjunction with proposals for a broader scheme, I also intend to develop proposals for co-operative action to tackle specific issues, including commons management, diffused pollution within a river catchment and protection of critical species or wildlife habitats in targeted geographical areas. We are developing proposals for a river catchment scheme with several partners.

**Eleanor Burnham:** How do you address the difficulty that Dafydd Morris, the famous shepherd, brought to my attention a couple of weeks ago, namely that if there is open access to high ground those who farm that land cannot register as organic farmers because they cannot prove that every dog that comes onto the land has been sufficiently wormed? Can you reassure him that this is being addressed?

4.40 p.m.

**Michael German:** The new access regulations being developed in Whitehall will have an impact on certain aspects of farming. We can discuss further how the organic scheme will work within the context of those regulations. In managing the uptake of the scheme, we can make adjustments to accommodate that.

Following the publication of 'Farming for the Future', we met with many key stakeholders in 2002 and later this year—

**Brian Hancock** *rose*—

**Michael German:** I will run out of time if I take any more interventions. Members can

sylyfaenol. Mae hyn yn bwysig o ran tegwch, ond mae hefyd yn cyfleu'n gryf i ffermwyr y byddant yn cael cyfran fwy o'u cyllid cyhoeddus yn y dyfodol am ddarparu buddion amgylcheddol y gellir eu nodi. Yn ail, mae rhai heriau amgylcheddol pwysig na ellir eu cyflawni ar un fferm ac sy'n gofyn cydweithredu rhwng ffermydd. Ymhlith yr heriau hynny y mae ymdrin â llygredd gwasgaredig, hybu amrywiaeth fiolegol, diogelu'r amgylchedd hanesyddol a thirluniau traddodiadol a darparu mynediad newydd i'r cyhoedd. I gyd-fynd â chynigion ar gyfer cynllun mwy cyffredinol, yr wyf hefyd yn bwriadu datblygu cynigion ar gyfer gweithredu ar y cyd i fynd i'r afael â materion penodol, gan gynnwys rheoli tir comin, llygredd gwasgaredig o fewn dalgylch afon a diogelu rhywogaethau neu gynefinoedd bywyd gwyllt hanfodol mewn ardaloedd daearyddol penodol. Yr ydym yn datblygu cynigion ar gyfer cynllun dalgylch afon gyda sawl partner.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Sut y bwriadwch ymdrin â'r anhawster y gwnaeth Dafydd Morris, y bugail enwog, ei ddwyn i'm sylw rai wythnosau'n ôl sef, os oes mynediad agored i dir uchel, ni all y rhai sy'n ffermio'r tir hwnnw ymgofrestru'n ffermwyr organig am na allant brofi bod pob ci a ddaw ar y tir wedi'i ddilyngyru'n ddigonol? A allwch roi sicrwydd iddo fod y mater hwn yn derbyn sylw?

**Michael German:** Bydd y rheoliadau mynediad newydd sy'n cael eu datblygu yn Whitehall yn effeithio ar rai agweddau ar ffermio. Gallwn drafod ymhellach sut y bydd y cynllun organig yn gweithio yng nghydestun y rheoliadau hynny. Wrth reoli'r defnydd o'r cynllun, gallwn wneud newidiadau i ddarparu ar gyfer hynny.

Ar ôl cyhoeddi 'Ffermio i'r Dyfodol', gwnaethom gwrdd â llawer o'r prif randdeiliaid yn 2002 ac yn ddiweddarach eleni—

**Brian Hancock** *a gododd*—

**Michael German:** Ni fydd gennyf amser ar ôl os derbyn iaf ragor o ymyriadau. Gall

make comments in their speeches and I will refer to them in my closing speech.

Later this year, we will consult more widely with the industry, environmental interests and the public to receive feedback on our proposals. I intend to develop a prototype scheme that can be piloted on a sample of farms before introducing the new scheme more widely.

All that has to be set in the context of the mid-term review of the common agricultural policy. Funding for the introduction of the new, broader scheme that I outlined will depend on the outcome of that review. A lot of hard negotiating needs to be done before we will be clear on what that outcome will be. Nevertheless, the proposals that we have developed with our funding partners represent an exciting opportunity—one that we are determined to achieve, if possible. I look to Members for support in taking this programme forward.

I now turn to the three amendments in the name of Jonathan Morgan. I will support amendment 1. I have already acknowledged the important role played by the Organic Centre Wales in developing the sector. I will not support amendments 2 and 3. Amendment 2 displays a lack of understanding of the processes involved, and of the regulatory framework for the use of modulated receipts. Amendment 3 fails to recognise that I have already announced the annual maintenance payments for organic farmers and that the detailed arrangements are subject to the European Commission accepting modifications to the rural development plan for Wales, which were submitted at the end of last year for its consideration.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Ymunwn â'r Gweinidog i nodi pwysigrwydd y cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol hyn. Croesawn y ffaith bod y Gweinidog yn ehangu'r cynlluniau ac yn galluogi ffermwyr i ddod i mewn ar wahanol lefelau. Serch hynny, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'r Gweinidog yn cydnabod ei fod yn wynebu rhai problemau difrifol. Er cymaint y mae'n clodfori Tir Gofal, y gwir plaen amdani yw nad oes digon o ffermwyr yn gallu cael mynediad i Dir Gofal, ac, hyd yn

Aelodau wneud sylwadau yn eu hareithiau a gwnaf gyfeirio atynt yn fy araith ar y diwedd.

Yn ddiweddarach eleni, byddwn yn ymgynghori'n ehangach gyda'r diwydiant, buddiannau amgylcheddol a'r cyhoedd er mwyn cael adborth ar ein cynigion. Bwriadaf ddatblygu cynllun prototeip y gellir ei ragbrofi ar sampl o ffermydd cyn cyflwyno'r cynllun newydd yn fwy eang.

Rhaid rhoi hynny i gyd yng nghyd-destun yr adolygiad canol tymor o'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin. Bydd y cyllid ar gyfer cyflwyno'r cynllun newydd, ehangach a ddisgrifiais yn dibynnu ar ganlyniad yr adolygiad hwnnw. Bydd angen llawer o negodi caled cyn y byddwn yn gwybod beth fydd y canlyniad. Er hynny, mae'r cynigion yr ydym wedi'u datblygu gyda'n partneriaid cyllido'n cynnig cyfle cyffrous—un yr ydym yn benderfynol o fanteisio arno, os oes modd. Gobeithiaf gael cefnogaeth gan Aelodau i fwrw ymlaen â'r rhaglen hon.

Trof yn awr at y tri gwelliant yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Gwnaf gefnogi gwelliant 1. Yr wyf eisoes wedi cydnabod y rôl bwysig y mae Canolfan Organig Cymru yn ei chwarae wrth ddatblygu'r sector. Ni wnaif gefnogi gwelliannau 2 a 3. Mae gwelliant 2 yn amlygu diffyg dealltwriaeth o'r prosesau dan sylw, ac o'r fframwaith rheoliadol ar gyfer defnyddio arian a dderbynnir drwy fodiwleiddio. Mae gwelliant 3 yn methu â chydabod fy mod eisoes wedi cyhoeddi'r taliadau cynnal blynyddol ar gyfer ffermwyr organig a bod y trefniadau manwl yn amodol ar barodrwydd y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd i dderbyn newidiadau i'r cynllun datblygu gwledig i Gymru, a gyflwynwyd ddiwedd y flwyddyn diwethaf i'w hystyried ganddo.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** We join the Minister in noting the importance of these agri-environmental schemes. We welcome the fact that the Minister is expanding these schemes and enabling farmers to enter the schemes at different levels. However, I am sure that the Minister would accept that he is faced with some serious problems. However much he may praise Tir Gofal, the truth of the matter is that not enough farmers can access Tir Gofal, and, even with these proposed

oed gyda'r newidiadau y bwriedir eu cyflwyno, ni fydd digon o ffermwyr yn gallu cael mynediad o hyd i wneud gwahaniaeth sylfaenol i sefyllfa amaethyddiaeth yng Nghymru. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn derbyn hynny.

Cyfeiriaf at y ffigurau a ryddhawyd yn ystod y dyddiau diwethaf ynglŷn ag incwm ffermydd. Mae'r incwm net tebygol yn y sector llaeth ar gyfer 2002-03, er enghraifft, yn hanner yr hyn ydoedd yng nghanol y 1990au—yn 1994-95, 1995-96 a 1996-97. A yw'r Gweinidog yn derbyn bod argyfwng gwirioneddol yn ein hwynebu? A yw wedi ystyried sut y gall ffermwyr llaeth gael mynediad i Dir Gofal? Byddai'r taliadau hynny yn gymorth enfawr iddynt o ran eu hincwm net.

Cyfeiriaf hefyd ar yr hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog am y cynllun organig. Croesawaf yn fawr ei ddatganiad heddiw ar y taliadau ychwanegol. Os deallais yn iawn, soniwyd, Weinidog, am ffermwyr sydd wedi trosglwyddo i'r cyllun organig heb gymorth yr arian trosglwyddo. A dderbyniwyd fod ffermwyr sydd wedi trosglwyddo i gynhyrchu'n organig ac wedi derbyn y tâl trosglwyddo yn wynebu problemau ariannol unwaith y daw'r tâl hwnnw i ben? Dyma ddychwelyd eto at y sector llaeth oherwydd newidiodd nifer o ffermwyr llaeth i gynhyrchu llaeth organig pan oedd ei bris tua 33c neu 34c y litr ond, erbyn hyn, y mae wedi gostwng i 21c neu 22c y litr. Mae'r gwahaniaeth rhwng hynny a phris llaeth arferol yn golygu bod ffermwyr wedi gorfod cwtogi ar faint y maent yn ei gynhyrchu, a wynebant broblemau difrifol. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ystyried y sefyllfa honno hefyd?

A dderbyniwyd, Weinidog, fod y broblem gyda thaliadau hwyr yn creu anawsterau i bobl sy'n cymryd rhan yn y cynlluniau hyn? A dderbyniwyd fod £7 miliwn sydd i'w dalu i ffermwyr o dan y cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol, ac mewn taliadau grantiau gwella ffermydd a grantiau menter ffermydd, yn hwyr? Mae ffermwyr yn disgwyl yr arian hwnnw, ac mae'r £7 miliwn yn ychwanegol at y swm sy'n daladwy o dan bolisi amaethyddol cyffredinol Ewrop, sef dros £70 miliwn. Yr oedd ffermwyr yn disgwyl derbyn yr arian erbyn hyn, ond maent yn aros o hyd,

changes, it will remain the case that not enough farmers will be able to access Tir Gofal to make a fundamental difference to the situation of agriculture in Wales. I hope that the Minister will accept that.

I refer to figures that were published in the last few days on farm incomes. The likely net income in the dairy sector for 2002-03, for example, is half of what it was in the mid 1990s—in 1994-95, 1995-96 and 1996-97. Does the Minister accept that we are facing a real crisis? Has he considered how dairy farmers can access Tir Gofal? Those payments would be of great assistance to them in terms of their net income.

I also refer to what the Minister said about the organic scheme. I warmly welcome the statement that he made today on additional payments. If I understood correctly, you refer, Minister, to farmers who have transferred into the organic scheme without the help of conversion funding. Do you accept that farmers who have transferred into organic farming and who have received conversion payments face financial difficulties once those payments stop? That brings us back to the dairy sector because many farmers switched to producing organic milk when its price was around 33p or 34p per litre but, by now, it has fallen to 21p or 22p per litre. The difference between that and the price of conventionally-produced milk means that farmers have had to restrict production, and they face serious problems. Will the Minister also consider that situation?

Minister, do you accept that the problem with late payments creates difficulties for participants in these schemes? Do you accept that £7 million that is payable to farmers under the agri-environmental schemes, and in payments of farm improvement grants and farm enterprise grants, is late? Farmers are expecting that money, and the £7 million is in addition to the sum payable under the European common agricultural policy, which amounts to more than £70 million. Farmers expected to receive that money by now, but they are still waiting, which causes great

sy'n peri problemau mawr iddynt.

Nid wyf am ailadrodd y ddadl ar daliadau hwyr. Yr ydym wedi dwyn y mater i sylw'r Gweinidog mewn modd mor uniongyrchol â phosibl, ond gofynnwn iddo dderbyn bod y sefyllfa yn ddifrifol.

O fewn y darlun ehangach, mae cydnabyddiaeth ein bod am gael ein symud o statws piler 1 i biler 2. Gwelwn werth hynny, yn enwedig pan gawn arian cyfatebol gan y Trysorlys. A wnaiff y Gweinidog dderbyn bod problem o ran dyraniad Prydain o'r arian Ewropeaidd sydd ar gael, a chanran Cymru ohono, sy'n golygu na chawn yr arian Ewropeaidd sydd ar gael inni? Er enghraifft, soniodd y Gweinidog am 15 y cant ond gallai'r ffigur fod gymaint â 75 y cant mewn ardaloedd Amcan 1.

Mae fy amser yn dod i ben—fel arian ffermwyr. Bydd Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi tri gwelliant y Blaid Geidwadol ond gwerthfawrogwn rai o ddatganiadau'r Gweinidog y prynhawn yma.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I should have called Peter Rogers first to propose the amendments. Peter, I apologise for calling Rhodri Glyn Thomas instead, and I apologise to Rhodri, as he made his speech without the benefit of hearing what Peter Rogers was going to say. However, nothing is lost; I will put it right by calling Peter Rogers.

**Peter Rogers:** I propose amendment 1, 2 and 3 in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Amendment 1: add a new point:

*acknowledges the contribution to the development of organic farming in Wales by the Organic Centre Wales.*

I propose amendment 2: add a new point:

*regrets the failure of the Government to apply money modulated from EU support payments to agri-environmental schemes in an acceptable time frame.*

I propose amendment 3: add a new point:

problems for them.

I do not want to rehearse the debate on late payments. We have drawn the matter to the Minister's attention in as direct a manner as possible, but we ask him to accept that the situation is grave.

Within the broader picture, it is acknowledged that we want to be moved from pillar 1 to pillar 2 status. We see the value of that, especially when we receive match funding from the Treasury. Will the Minister accept that there is a problem in terms of the British allocation of the European funds available, and the Welsh share of it, which means that we will not receive the European funds available to us? For instance, the Minister mentioned 15 per cent but the figure could be as much as 75 per cent in Objective 1 areas.

The time allocated to me is coming to an end—just like farmers' money. Plaid Cymru will support the three Conservative Party amendments, but we appreciate some of the Minister's statements this afternoon.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Dylwn fod wedi galw ar Peter Rogers yn gyntaf i gynnig y gwelliannau. Peter, ymddiheuraf am alw ar Rhodri Glyn Thomas yn lle hynny, ac ymddiheuraf i Rhodri, gan ei fod wedi gwneud ei araith heb gael y fantais o glywed beth yr oedd Peter Rogers am ei ddweud. Fodd bynnag, ni chollwyd dim; gwnaf gywiro hynny drwy alw ar Peter Rogers.

**Peter Rogers:** Cynigiau welliannau 1, 2 a 3 yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Gwelliant 1: ychwanegu pwynt newydd:

*yn cydnabod cyfraniad canolfan organig Cymru i ddatblygiad ffermio organig yng Nghymru.*

Cynigiau welliant 2: ychwanegu pwynt newydd:

*yn gresynu at fethiant y Llywodraeth i roi arian wedi'i fodwleiddio o daliadau cymorth yr UE i gynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol o fewn cyfnod derbyniol.*

Cynigiau welliant 3: ychwanegu pwynt

newydd:

*regrets the failure of the coalition Government to make announcements about annual maintenance payments to organic farmers within an acceptable time frame.*

*yn gresynu at fethiant y Llywodraeth glymblaid i wneud cyhoeddiadau ynghylch taliadau cynnal blynyddol i ffermwyr organig mewn cyfnod derbyniol.*

It is not a problem that I did not propose my amendments first. Judging by how many Members are present in the Chamber, I think that some people have had enough of what is happening to agriculture.

Nid yw'r ffaith fy mod heb gynnig fy ngwelliannau'n gyntaf yn peri problem. A barnu yn ôl y nifer o Aelodau sy'n bresennol yn y Siambr, credaf fod rhai pobl wedi cael digon ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd i amaethyddiaeth.

The Assembly is now in its fourth year and, the more we go down this road—and having had to listen to the standard of Mike's answers on payments to Ieuan and me—the more I find it unacceptable that a Minister has reached this stage without gaining an understanding of the problem. We know what the problem is and it has nothing to do with any computer; it is that staff were moved out of offices in May, moved from processing agri-environmental schemes to processing cattle movement tracing schemes, and they have not been returned to process the agri-environmental schemes. That is why farmers now face late payments.

Mae'r Cynulliad yn ei bedwaredd flwyddyn bellach, a pho bellaf yr awn ar hyd y ffordd hon—ac wedi gorfod gwranddo ar safon atebion Mike ar daliadau i Ieuan a mi—mwyaf annerbyniol ydyw yn fy ngolwg i fod Gweinidog wedi dod cyn belled â hyn heb amgyffred y broblem. Gwyddom beth yw'r broblem ac nid oes a wnelo hi ddim ag unrhyw gyfrifiadur; y broblem yw bod staff wedi'u symud o swyddfeydd ym Mai, wedi'u symud oddi wrth brosesu cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol ac at brosesu cynlluniau olrhain symudiadau gwartheg, ac nad anfonwyd hwy'n ôl i brosesu'r cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol. Dyna pam y mae ffermwyr yn wynebu taliadau hwyr yn awr.

Do not shake your head, Mike, we know very well what is wrong; you will not acknowledge anything that has happened and you are a disgrace as a Minister.

Peidiwch ag ysgwyd eich pen, Mike, gwyddom yn iawn beth sydd o'i le; ni wnewch gydnabod dim sydd wedi digwydd ac yr ydych yn destun cywilydd fel Gweinidog.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Peter, the word 'disgrace' crosses over the boundary of acceptable language. Use a nicer word. [*Laughter.*]

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Peter, mae'r geiriau 'testun cywilydd' yn croesi ffin yr hyn sy'n dderbyniol. Defnyddiwch air mwy dymunol. [*Chwerthin.*]

4.50 p.m.

**Glyn Davies:** We could come up with a few. What about 'pillar of incompetence'? Maybe Members have ideas about other words that we could use to describe him.

**Glyn Davies:** Gallem feddwl am rai. Beth am 'golofn o anallu'? Efallai fod gan Aelodau syniadau am eiriau eraill y gallem eu defnyddio i'w ddisgrifio.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I am sorry now that I interrupted you, Peter. Please carry on.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae'n edifar gennyf yn awr am dorri ar eich traws, Peter. Ewch ymlaen, os gwelwch yn dda.

**Peter Rogers:** Returning to organic farming—another of the Government's

**Peter Rogers:** Gan droi'n ôl at ffermio organig—un arall o brif gynlluniau'r

flagship schemes—we heard about milk producers who switched to organic farming, and I remember attending the launch in Builth Wells. To convert to that scheme requires extensive work and, unless you can guarantee that the money spent will be earned back, the scheme is in danger of collapsing. For example, a farmer in north Wales, with two children of school age, was declared bankrupt because of the expense of diversifying to the organic farming scheme. He went through the independent appeals process and had to pay back £12,000. You know very well, Minister, that that was force majeure and that the Welsh Administration Ombudsman will find in favour of that.

You cannot deny people the money from these agri-environmental schemes, and you cannot continue being blasé about the future, because there will be no future for farming. I need only remind you of land in parts of France and Italy. Unless managed land is farmed in a system and unless you intend to provide support for family farming in Wales, as is the case in other parts of Europe, you will not begin to realise your vision of an appealing, sustainable and environmentally friendly landscape. The opposite is happening in many places and, until the Assembly wakes up and realises the importance of supporting farming, we are headed for disaster.

Members have asked and have written to you about payments to organic farming groups, yet we have received no response. It is inexcusable; this has nothing to do with payment windows. You tell the Assembly that you can make between 3,000 and 4,000 payments per day, but that is just about writing cheques. I do not know how many cheques you can write manually, but organic farmers have nothing to do with payment windows. You are in breach of legislation, Minister. It was your Government that raised this issue of bill payment in Parliament.

Our amendment 2 concerns the money modulated from EU support payments. It is vital that that should have been used. You pass it off by blaming foot and mouth disease, but why did you not include that extra money in last year's budget? You

Llywodraeth—clywsom am gynhyrchwyr llaeth sydd wedi troi at ffermio organig, a chofiaf fod yn bresennol yn y cyfarfod lansio yn Llanfair ym Muallt. Rhaid wrth waith helaeth i drosglwyddo i'r cynllun hwnnw ac, os na allwch warantu y bydd yr arian a warir yn cael ei ennill yn ôl, mae perygl i'r cynllun fethu. Er enghraifft, cafodd ffermwr yn y Gogledd, sydd â dau blentyn o oedran ysgol, ei ddyfarnu'n fethdalwr oherwydd cost arallgyfeirio i'r cynllun ffermio organig. Aeth drwy'r broses apelau annibynnol a bu'n rhaid iddo dalu £12,000 yn ôl. Gwyddoch yn iawn, Weinidog, mai gorfodaeth oedd hynny ac y bydd Ombwdsmon Gweinyddiaeth Cymru yn dyfarnu o blaid hynny.

Ni allwch wrthod arian i bobl o'r cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol hyn, ac ni allwch barhau i fod yn ddidaro ynghylch y dyfodol, oherwydd ni fydd dyfodol i ffermio. Nid oes ond angen imi'ch atgoffa am diroedd mewn rhannau o Ffrainc a'r Eidal. Os na chaiff tir rheoledig ei ffermio yn ôl system ac os na fwriadwch ddarparu cymorth ar gyfer ffermio teuluol yng Nghymru, fel a ddigwydd mewn rhannau eraill o Ewrop, nid oes gobaith ichi gyflawni'ch gweledigaeth o dirlun deniadol, cynaliadwy ac amgylchedd-garedig. Y gwrthwyneb i hynny sy'n digwydd mewn llawer man a, hyd nes y bydd y Cynulliad yn deffro ac yn sylweddoli mor bwysig yw cefnogi ffermio, byddwn yn mynd ar ein pen i ddiristr.

Mae Aelodau wedi gofyn i chi ac wedi ysgrifennu atoch ynghylch taliadau i grwpiau ffermio organig, ac eto ni chawsom ymateb. Ni ellir esgusodi hynny; nid yw hyn yn ymwneud â ffenestri talu. Dywedwch wrth y Cynulliad y gallwch wneud rhwng 3,000 a 4,000 o daliadau y diwrnod, ond dim ond ysgrifennu sicciau yw hynny. Ni wn pa sawl sic y gallwch ei hysgrifennu â llaw, ond nid oes a wnelo ffemwyr organig ddim â ffenestri talu. Yr ydych yn mynd yn groes i ddeddfwriaeth, Weinidog. Eich Llywodraeth chi a gododd fater talu biliau yn y Senedd.

Mae gwelliant 2 o'n heiddo'n ymwneud â'r arian sydd wedi'i fodiwleiddio o gymorthdaliadau'r UE. Yr oedd yn hollbwysig ei ddefnyddio. Yr ydych yn cymryd amoch mai ar glwy'r traed a'r genau yr oedd y bai, ond pam na wnaethoch

created Tir Gofal for an elite. What about the young farmers who only took over the tenancies of farms in October? No provision was made for sheep and suckler cow quotas; we could not even give them a small base of financial return from Tir Gofal, because you turned them down. Money is there, which could amount to almost £17 million. That money should have been in the rural economy last year.

For goodness' sake, Mike, spare us any more of your hare-brained schemes. I suggest that you put your head down and walk away from this job, and let somebody who understands it and who appreciates the role that the Welsh farmer should have in this country come in.

**Mick Bates:** I welcome this opportunity to consider the future of agri-environmental schemes. This debate is essentially about land use and management, which is important to farmers' incomes. Fortunately, there has been a fundamental shift in attitude among the public and farmers about the need for agri-environmental schemes and good funding. A few years ago, the environment was seen as the domain of a few long-haired hippies living in a wigwam and the odd cranky farmer.

**Glyn Davies:** They are all on the front bench.

**Mick Bates:** I cannot see any.

We have come a long way since then, and agricultural interest groups and environmental lobby groups have made significant progress by working together—we must all remember that. Useful schemes have been established, such as the environmentally sensitive area scheme, Tir Cymen and Tir Gofal, the habitat scheme, the moorland scheme, organic schemes and a raft of cross-compliance measures that have pushed the industry into a more agri-environmental-orientated payment scheme. It is important not to lose sight at this stage of the importance of agri-environmental schemes, and that farming is about food production. The integration of these aims into agri-environmental schemes must take account of the issue of income through food production.

gynnwys yr arian ychwanegol hwnnw yng nghyllideb y flwyddyn ddiwethaf? Gwnaethoch greu Tir Gofal ar gyfer elit. Beth am y ffermwyr ifanc sydd ond wedi ymgymryd â thenantiaethau ffermydd ers mis Hydref? Ni ddarparwyd ar gyfer cwotâu defaid a buchod sugno; nid oeddem hyd yn oed yn gallu rhoi cyfle bach iddynt wneud elw o Tir Gofal, oherwydd gwnaethoch eu gwrthod. Mae arian yno, a allai fod yn gymaint â bron £17 miliwn. Dylasai'r arian hwnnw fod yn yr economi wledig y llynedd.

Er mwyn popeth, Mike, peidiwch â rhoi rhagor o'ch cynlluniau hurt i ni. Awgrymaf y dylech ostwng eich pen a gadael y swydd hon, a gadael i rywun sy'n ei deall ac sy'n deall y rôl a ddylai fod i'r ffermwr o Gymro yn y wlad hon gymryd eich lle.

**Mick Bates:** Croesawaf y cyfle hwn i ystyried dyfodol cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol. Mae'r ddadl hon yn ymwneud yn y bôn â defnyddio a rheoli tir, sy'n bwysig i incwm ffermwyr. Yn ffodus, bu newid agwedd sylfaenol ymysg y cyhoedd a ffermwyr ynghylch yr angen am gynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol a chyllido da. Ychydig o flynyddoedd yn ôl, ystyrid bod yr amgylchedd yn faes i ychydig o hipis hirwallt yn byw mewn wigwam ac ambell ffermwr cranclyd.

**Glyn Davies:** Maent i gyd ar y fainc flaen.

**Mick Bates:** Ni allaf fi eu gweld.

Bu newid mawr ers hynny, ac mae grwpiau buddiant amaethyddol a grwpiau lobbïo amgylcheddol wedi gwneud cynnydd sylweddol drwy gydweithio—rhaid inni i gyd gofio hynny. Sefydlwyd cynlluniau defnyddiol, fel y cynllun ardal amgylchedd arbennig, Tir Cymen a Tir Gofal, y cynllun cynefinoedd, y cynllun rhostir, cynlluniau organig a llu o fesurau trawsgydymffurfiol sydd wedi gwthio'r diwydiant i gyfundrefn daliadau sydd â mwy o ogwydd amaeth-amgylcheddol. Mae'n bwysig peidio â cholli golwg ar hyn o bryd ar bwysigrwydd cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol, a'r ffaith bod ffermio'n ymwneud â chynhyrchu bwyd. Wrth integreiddio'r nodau hyn â chynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol, rhaid ystyried mater incwm o gynhyrchu bwyd.

I will concentrate on the need to ensure that these schemes are properly evaluated, and to ensure that we broaden access. We often forget that expenditure on these schemes must be justified. My view that Tir Gofal is elitist—which Peter also raised—is well documented and we need to broaden access. Where Government expenditure is involved, we must give good reasons for why these schemes are essential. I therefore call for a greater review of the applicable sustainability indicators to show the benefits of organic farming and how environmental biodiversity, for example, has been increased by the expenditure. We have some way to go to develop an index of sustainable economic welfare that accounts for these factors to enable further funding that is not based solely on the recommendations of a few people. I have fully understood the economic value of environmental schemes to the industry for a long time and have sung the praises of many. However, I welcome most of your remarks on extending access to these schemes.

Tir Gofal—fine scheme though it is—has proved exclusive. There are about 22,000 businesses that can access agri-environment moneys, but perhaps, as you said, only 2,000 were eligible for Tir Gofal. I believe that that is the way to justify modulation to people. Modulation takes money from every business, so let us ensure that every business sees the benefits of that modulated money, which is, of course, match-funded. We should also use this evaluation to evaluate the marketing opportunities that these offer. Organic farming conversion payments are a classic example of money being used to convert to a style of farming without sufficient attention being paid to the need to market and process its products. Only by adding value and creating a niche market were people able to sustain an income from that farming method. There are many other similar schemes. As the Minister knows, I and 10 others are directly involved in the Pontbren environmental scheme to use environmental enhancements to sell our products, in particular our lamb. It is

Canolbwytiaf ar yr angen i sicrhau bod y cynlluniau hyn yn cael eu gwerthuso'n briodol, ac i sicrhau ein bod yn ehangu'r mynediad iddynt. Anghofiwn yn aml fod rhaid cyfiawnhau'r gwariant ar y cynlluniau hyn. Yr wyf wedi dweud ar goedd lawer gwaith fod Tir Gofal yn elitaidd—a chyfeiriodd Peter at hynny hefyd—a rhaid inni ehangu'r mynediad iddo. Lle y ceir gwariant gan Lywodraeth, rhaid inni roi rhesymau da dros ddweud bod y cynlluniau hyn yn hanfodol. Galwaf felly am adolygiad helaethach o'r dangosyddion cynaliadwyedd sy'n berthnasol er mwyn dangos buddion ffermio organig a'r cynnydd mewn amrywiaeth biolegol yn yr amgylchedd, er enghraifft, o ganlyniad i'r gwariant. Rhaid inni wneud cryn dipyn eto i ddatblygu mynegrif o les economaidd cynaliadwy sy'n egluro'r ffactorau hyn fel y gellir hwyluso cyllido pellach nad yw ond yn seiliedig ar argymhellion ychydig o bobl. Yr wyf wedi llawn amgyffred gwerth economaidd cynlluniau amgylcheddol i'r diwydiant ers amser maith ac wedi canu clodydd llawer ohonynt. Fodd bynnag, croesawaf y rhan fwyaf o'ch sylwadau am ehangu'r mynediad i'r cynlluniau hyn.

Mae Tir Gofal—er cystal cynllun ydyw—wedi bod yn gyfyngedig. Gall tua 22,000 o fusnesau dderbyn arian amaeth-amgylcheddol ond, fel y dywedaso, mae'n bosibl mai dim ond 2,000 a oedd yn gymwys ar gyfer Tir Gofal. Credaf mai hynny yw'r modd i gyfiawnhau modiwlleiddio i bobl. Mae modiwlleiddio'n mynd ag arian oddi wrth bob busnes, felly gadewch inni sicrhau bod pob busnes yn gweld manteision yr arian sydd wedi'i fodiwlleiddio, y rhoddir arian cyfatebol ato, wrth gwrs. Dylem ddefnyddio'r gwerthusiad hwn hefyd i bwysu a mesur y cyfleoedd marchnata y maent yn eu cynnig. Mae'r taliadau trosglwyddo ar gyfer ffermio organig yn enghraifft glasurol o ddefnyddio arian i droi at ddull o ffermio heb dalu digon o sylw i'r angen i farchnata a phrosesu ei gynhyrchion. Dim ond drwy ychwanegu gwerth a chreu marchnad arbenigol yr oedd pobl yn gallu cynnal incwm o'r dull hwnnw o ffermio. Mae llawer o gynlluniau tebyg. Fel y gŵyr y Gweinidog, yr wyf fi a 10 arall yn ymwneud yn uniongyrchol â chynllun amgylcheddol



important that we take note of that.

One way to ensure successful broadening of access is to reduce the bureaucratic burden in the application process as much as possible. I recommend that the Minister—with his fine words about broadening access—consider how the standard costs used to work, whereby an individual producer proposed his schemes, which were then assessed. The scheme was then undertaken and payment was made per unit, for example, per metre of pleached hedge or square metre of pond area and so on. That would help a lot. If we want to enhance biodiversity, safeguard our heritage, reduce pollution and keep farmers producing food, we must widen access. To do that, funding must be secured.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Cawsom ein hatgoffa gan y Gweinidog am y cynnig yn 1996 i gael un cynllun cenedlaethol i Gymru o'r holl gynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol. Yr oeddwn yn falch o fod, pan oeddwn yn Aelod Seneddol, yn rhan o'r trafodaethau a arweiniodd at greu'r cynllun cynhwysfawr hwnnw. Un agwedd hynod ddiddorol ar y cynlluniau hyn yw bod dealltwriaeth ar draws y sbectwm gwleidyddol, a hefyd ymysg amaethwyr a mudiadau amgylcheddol, eu bod yn rhan bwysig o'r diwydiant ac economi cefn gwlad erbyn hyn. Yn y cyfnod hwnnw, yr oeddwn yn falch o fod yn aelod o Bwyllgor Dethol Amaeth rhwng 1992 a 1997. Perswadiais y Pwyllgor i ddod i Gymru i weld ein cynlluniau blaengar, megis Tir Cymen, ac i weld a ellid cynnwys nifer fawr o'u helfennau mewn cynlluniau ar draws gwledydd Prydain. Mae'n ddiddorol bod y gwaith arloesol a wnaethpwyd o dan y cynlluniau hynny bellach yn cael eu derbyn, nid yn unig yng Nghymru, ond ar draws y Deyrnas Gyfunol.

5.00 p.m.

Un o'n pryderon ynglŷn â Tir Gofal—erystal cynllun yw hwnnw—yw'r ffaith bod angen i Lywodraeth San Steffan, yn bennaf, sylweddoli pwysigrwydd arian cyfatebol i sicrhau y gall y cynlluniau hyn ddefnyddio

Pontbren i ddefnyddio gwelliannau amgylcheddol i werthu ein cynhyrchion, yn enwedig ein cig oen. Mae'n bwysig inni nodi hynny.

Un modd i ehangu mynediad yn llwyddiannus yw lleihau'r baich biwrocraidd yn y broses ymgeisio gymaint ag y bo modd. Yr wyf yn argymhell y dylai'r Gweinidog—gyda'i eiriau teg am ehangu mynediad—ystyried dull gweithredu'r costau safonol, a oedd yn fodd i gynhyrchydd unigol gynnig ei gynlluniau, a gâi eu hasesu wedyn. Ymgymeryd â'r cynllun wedyn a thelid fesul uned, er enghraifft, am bob medr o wrych a blygwyd neu am bob medr sgwâr o lyn ac yn y blaen. Byddai hynny'n gymorth mawr. Os ydym am hybu amrywiaeth biolegol, diogelu ein treftadaeth, lleihau llygredd a chadw ffermwyr i gynhyrchu bwyd, rhaid inni ehangu'r mynediad. Er mwyn gwneud hynny, rhaid sicrhau cyllid.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** The Minister reminded us of the proposal in 1996 to have one national scheme for Wales from all the agri-environmental schemes. I was pleased, as a Member of Parliament, to be a part of the discussions that led to the creation of that comprehensive scheme. A particularly interesting aspect of these schemes is that there is an understanding across the political spectrum, and among farmers and environmental organisations, that they now make an important contribution to the industry and the rural economy. During that period, I was pleased to be a member of the Select Committee on Agriculture between 1992 and 1997. I persuaded the Committee to come to Wales to see our innovative schemes, such as Tir Cymen, and to see whether many of their elements could be included in schemes throughout the countries of Britain. It is interesting that the innovative work carried out under those schemes is now accepted, not only in Wales, but throughout the United Kingdom.

One of our concerns about schemes such as Tir Gofal—as good as that scheme is—is that the Government, in Westminster in particular, must realise the importance of match funding to ensure that these schemes

arian Ewropeaidd yn llawn. Daeth un o'i broblemau i'r amlwg ar y dechrau pan fethodd y Llywodraeth Geidwadol, a'r Llywodraeth Lafur a'i dilynodd, â buddsoddi digon o arian yn y cynllun i sicrhau mynediad ehangach i'r cynllun i ffermwyr. Nid ar y cynllun yr oedd y bai, ond ar y Llywodraeth nad oedd yn fodlon ymrwymo digon o arian i sicrhau y byddai'r cynllun yn gweithio. Dywedodd Mick Bates, Rhodri Glyn Thomas, ac eraill fod Tir Gofal yn rhy gyfyng ar hyn o bryd o ran nifer y ffermwyr a gaiff geisio amdano. Gobeithiaf, wrth inni ddatblygu'r cynlluniau hyn, y bydd y Llywodraeth, yn enwedig yn San Steffan, yn sylweddoli'r angen am arian cyfatebol i sicrhau ein bod yn gwneud y defnydd mwyaf ohonynt.

Other Members have referred to a delay in the payments of several existing agri-environmental schemes and I must say to the Minister—although not in the terms used by other Members—that there is real concern in the industry about the long delay in the payments. I know of farmers who have a contract with the Welsh Assembly Government, previously the Welsh Office, under the old environmentally sensitive area scheme, who should be paid when an application is made. Some of them made their applications last August and they have still not been paid. Payments have been promised month after month, week after week, but nothing has happened.

Now we are told that these payments will be made by the end of February, but no-one is giving any clear guidance. Minister, we understand that there is currently no Government system to make these agri-environment payments to farmers. Will you answer that point? The Minister only gave a general reply that the Government is doing its best to try to make these payments. However, in reality not a single ESA payment has been made to a farmer in Wales since August 2002 and if that is true—and it has not been denied—then we need an answer as to why that is the case. This is not a matter of an open window period, it is a contractual obligation. If that contractual obligation is not met, the Government must answer for it.

can fully exploit European funding. One of its problems came to the fore at the outset when the Conservative Government, and the subsequent Labour Government, failed to invest sufficient money in the scheme to ensure wider access to the scheme for farmers. That was not the fault of the scheme, but of the Government, which was not willing to commit sufficient funds to ensure that the scheme would work. Mick Bates, Rhodri Glyn Thomas, and others have said that Tir Gofal is too restrictive at present in terms of the number of farmers who can apply to join it. I hope that, as we develop these schemes, the Government, particularly in Westminster, will realise the need for match funding to ensure that we make the best possible use of the schemes.

Mae Aelodau eraill wedi cyfeirio at yr oedi cyn gwneud taliadau mewn nifer o'r cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol presennol a rhaid imi ddweud wrth y Gweinidog—er nad yn yr un geiriau a ddefnyddiwyd gan Aelodau eraill—fod pryder gwirioneddol yn y diwydiant ynghylch yr oedi hir cyn gwneud y taliadau. Gwn am ffermwyr sydd â chontract â Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, a'r Swyddfa Gymreig cyn hynny, o dan yr hen gynllun ardaloedd amgylchedd arbennig, y dylid eu talu pan wneir cais. Gwnaeth rhai ohonynt gais fis Awst diwethaf ac nid ydynt wedi'u talu byth. Addawyd taliadau fis ar ôl mis, wythnos ar ôl wythnos, ond nid oes dim wedi digwydd.

Dywedir wrthym yn awr y bydd y taliadau hyn yn cael eu gwneud erbyn diwedd Chwefror, ond nid oes neb yn rhoi unrhyw gyfarwyddyd clir. Weinidog, deallwn nad oes system gan y Llywodraeth ar hyn o bryd i roi'r taliadau amaeth-amgylcheddol hyn i ffermwyr. A wnewch ateb y pwynt hwnnw? Dim ond ateb cyffredinol a roddodd y Gweinidog, i'r perwyl bod y Llywodraeth yn gwneud ei gorau i geisio gwneud y taliadau hynny. Fodd bynnag, mewn gwirionedd ni wnaed yr un taliad ardal amgylchedd arbennig i ffermwr yng Nghymru ers Awst 2002 ac os yw hynny'n wir—ac ni wadwyd hynny—mae arnom angen ateb ynghylch pam y mae felly. Nid mater o gyfnod ffenestr agored yw hwn, mae'n ymrwymiad cytundebol. Os na chyflawnir yr ymrwymiad cytundebol hwnnw, rhaid i'r Llywodraeth

ateb am hynny.

I hope that when the Minister responds, instead of giving a general reply saying that the Government is doing its best, he will address the central question: will these payments be made or not? No payments have been made so far—he has not denied that. When will they be paid? Farmers are entitled to know the answer. As farmers have come to accept over recent years that agri-environmental payments are part of the agricultural network, it is vital that they have confidence that they will be paid on time after entering into a contract with the Government.

**Alun Pugh:** Tir Gofal and similar agri-environmental schemes must be a key part of the future of Welsh agriculture because many of us spend significant parts of our leisure and working lives in the great Welsh outdoors. We have plenty of examples of best practice in environmental management and the length of the application list is an indicator of its success. Anyone who regularly walks up the Watkin path on Snowdon cannot fail to notice the massive improvements in environmental management in that area.

However, I draw the Minister's attention to those tenant farmers who wish to join Tir Gofal but who are thwarted by landowners who block applications for financial reasons. It is unfair to tenants and the environment. I hope that the Minister will consider the regulations to see how we can prevent landlords from making unreasonable objections to Tir Gofal applications.

**Peter Rogers:** Are you aware that initially Tir Gofal did not even require any authorisation from the landowner to put in place Tir Gofal arrangements? You are talking absolute rubbish.

**Alun Pugh:** I know from tenant farmers in my constituency that they want to join Tir Gofal but are unable to do so at present.

Production subsidies were introduced by the great post-1945 Labour Government when

Pan fydd y Gweinidog yn ymateb, gobeithiaf y bydd yn ymdrin â'r cwestiwn canolog, yn hytrach na rhoi ateb cyffredinol yn dweud bod y Llywodraeth yn gwneud ei gorau, sef a wneir y taliadau hyn ai peidio? Ni wnaed unrhyw daliadau hyd yn hyn—nid yw wedi gwadu hynny. Pa bryd y'u gwneir? Mae gan ffermwyr hawl i wybod yr ateb. Gan fod ffermwyr wedi dod i dderbyn dros y blynyddoedd fod taliadau amaeth-amgylcheddol yn rhan o'r rhwydwaith amaethyddol, mae'n hollbwysig y gallant fod yn hyderus y cânt eu talu'n brydlon ar ôl gwneud contract gyda'r Llywodraeth.

**Alun Pugh:** Rhaid i Tir Gofal a chynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol tebyg fod yn rhan allweddol o ddyfodol amaethyddiaeth yng Nghymru gan fod llawer ohonom yn treulio llawer o'n hamser hamdden a'n bywyd gweithio yn yr awyr agored. Mae gennym ddigon o enghreifftiau o arferion da mewn rheoli amgylcheddol ac mae hyd y rhestr ceisiadau'n arwydd o'i lwyddiant. Mae unrhyw un sy'n cerdded yn rheolaidd ar lwybr Watkin ar yr Wyddfa'n sicr o sylwi ar y gwelliannau aruthrol yn y rheoli amgylcheddol yn yr ardal honno.

Fodd bynnag, tynnaf sylw'r Gweinidog at y tenantiaid ffermydd hynny sy'n dymuno ymuno â Thir Gofal ond sy'n cael eu rhwystro gan berchnogion tir sy'n atal ceisiadau am resymau ariannol. Mae'n annheg â'r tenantiaid a'r amgylchedd. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn ystyried y rheoliadau i weld sut y gallwn rwystro landlordiaid rhag cyflwyno gwrthwynebiadau afresymol i geisiadau i ymuno â Tir Gofal.

**Peter Rogers:** A wyddoch nad oedd yn ofynnol, ar ddechrau Tir Gofal, gael unrhyw awdurdodiad gan y perchennog tir i roi trefniadau Tir Gofal ar waith? Yr ydych yn siarad lol llwyr.

**Alun Pugh:** Yr wyf wedi cael gwybod gan denantiaid ffermydd yn fy etholaeth i eu bod yn dymuno ymuno â Thir Gofal ond nad ydynt yn gallu gwneud hynny ar hyn o bryd.

Cyflwynwyd cymorthdaliadau cynhyrchu gan y Llywodraeth Lafur fawr ar ôl 1945 pan

food rationing was in place and security of food supplies was still an issue. Today, crude production subsidies fail on many counts. They tend to benefit large agri-businesses companies rather than small family farms. They are expensive for taxpayers and food buyers alike and they damage third world producers. If subsidies are to continue, and there is a role for continuing subsidies and support, then major reform is required.

**Glyn Davies:** I agree with all of the wording in the motion. There is no doubt about the potential of agri-environmental schemes to benefit the rural economy and people's perception of it. I have been a great supporter of agri-environmental schemes since they started around 10 or 15 years ago. Originally we had environmentally sensitive area schemes, followed by Tir Cymen. Agri-environmental schemes have a tremendous potential, which Alun Pugh touched upon. They have the potential to reconnect the rural and urban parts of Wales, and to build a bridge between them. There is a great deal of dissension and people are critical of rural areas, which has worried me over the past few years. Agri-environmental schemes have a great potential to build a bridge between these two areas.

I agree with the Minister about the implications of the mid-term review. There are matters of concern. A great deal depends on what we can agree and on whether we can enter into the broad and shallow scheme, which I hope will broaden access. A part of the motion tries to address that. I question the sheer nerve of the coalition Government in stating that every effort should be made to broaden the environmental scheme in future. If that is simply a matter of discussing the desirability of a broad and shallow scheme, then I agree with that. However, bearing in mind the written answer that I received from the Minister last week, the Government has some nerve to say what it did. The Minister resorts to his usual bluster and assertion without challenging the point expressed in our amendment 2. I will refer to the written answer. I tabled the written question because I knew what had happened in Westminster—

oedd dogni ar fwyd a sicrwydd cyflenwadau bwyd yn dal i fod yn fater o bwys. Heddiw, mae cymorthdaliadau cynhyrchu bras yn methu ar lawer cyfrif. Tueddant i roi mantais i gwmnïau busnes amaethyddol mawr yn hytrach na ffermydd teuluol bach. Maent yn ddrud i drethdalwyr a phrynwyr bwyd fel ei gilydd ac maent yn gwneud niwed i gynhyrchwyr y trydydd byd. Os yw cymorthdaliadau i barhau, ac mae rôl i gymorthdaliadau a chymorth yn y dyfodol, mae angen diwygio helaeth.

**Glyn Davies:** Cytunaf â phob gair yn y cynnig. Nid oes dwywaith am y potensial sydd mewn cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol i ddod â budd i'r economi wledig a chanfyddiad pobl ohoni. Yr wyf yn gefnogwr mawr i gynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol ers eu cychwyn tua 10 neu 15 mlynedd yn ôl. Ar y dechrau cawsom gynlluniau ardaloedd amgylchedd arbennig ac wedyn Tir Cymen. Mae potensial aruthrol mewn cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol, y mae Alun Pugh wedi cyfeirio ato. Mae potensial ynddynt i ailgysylltu'r rhannau gwledig a threfol o Gymru, ac i godi pont rhyngddynt. Mae llawer iawn o gynnen ac mae pobl yn feirniadol o ardaloedd gwledig, a bu hynny'n destun gofid i mi dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Mae potensial mawr mewn cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol i bontio'r ddwy ardal hyn.

Cytunaf â'r Gweinidog am oblygiadau'r adolygiad canol tymor. Mae materion sy'n peri pryder. Mae llawer yn dibynnu ar yr hyn y gallwn gytuno arno ac ar a allwn ddechrau ar y cynllun eang a bas, a fydd yn ehangu mynediad, yr wyf yn gobeithio. Mae un rhan o'r cynnig yn ceisio ymdrin â hynny. Yr wyf yn amheus ynghylch ehofndra'r Llywodraeth glymblaid wrth ddweud y dylid gwneud pob ymdrech i ehangu'r cynllun amgylcheddol yn y dyfodol. Os nad yw hynny ond yn fater o drafod dymunoldeb cynllun eang a bas, yr wyf yn cytuno â hynny. Fodd bynnag, o gofio'r ateb ysgrifenedig a gefais gan y Gweinidog yr wythnos diwethaf, mae'n eithaf digywilydd i'r Llywodraeth ddweud hynny. Mae'r Gweinidog yn troi at ei gega a'u daeru arferol heb herio'r pwynt a fynegir yng ngwelliant 2 o'n heiddo. Gwnaf gyfeirio at yr ateb ysgrifenedig. Cyflwynais y cwestiwn ysgrifenedig am y gwyddwn beth a

a parliamentary question was tabled by David Lidington, the shadow Secretary of State for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs, asking Margaret Beckett how much modulation money had been spent. Her answer stated that the Government had only spent a little over half of the money. I wondered how much of that money was spent in Wales, therefore I tabled my written question. The relevant part of the answer stated that for the 2001 scheme, the total received through modulation was £724,000 and, for 2002, the receipts were £2.3 million. The anticipated amount for the current scheme was £4.5 million.

The Minister acknowledges that he has three years in which to spend this money. However, none of that money has been spent. Arrangements are in hand to spend £700,000 of the 2001 receipts in the current year to finance Tir Gofal. Agricultural incomes are at a historic low and there is a long list of people wanting to access the Tir Gofal scheme. The credibility of the Tir Gofal scheme is in doubt because people feel that they cannot access it. Even worse, the principle of modulation is also being discredited. I have a personal problem with this given that the Minister previously responsible for agriculture would not discuss modulation with the farming industry because it was unpopular. I decided that because modulation was the future I would go out and talk about this unpopular concept. The way in which the Minister has behaved in relation to recycling this money will cause outrage in the rural community and make modulation even more unacceptable. It seriously damages the credibility of Tir Gofal and the principle of modulation.

5.10 p.m.

This is a serious issue. It is worse than the late payments issue, because that was due to incompetence. It is worse than the genetically modified organisms issue, which was also due to incompetence. This is deliberate. If a Minister deliberately takes an action that

oedd wedi digwydd yn San Steffan—cyflwynwyd cwestiwn seneddol gan David Lidington, Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yr wrthblaid dros yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig, yn gofyn i Margaret Beckett faint o'r arian modiweiddio a wariwyd. Yn ei hateb dywedodd mai dim ond ychydig yn fwy na hanner yr arian yr oedd y Llywodraeth wedi'i wario. Yr oeddwn am wybod faint o'r arian hwnnw a wariwyd yng Nghymru, felly cyflwynais fy nghwestiwn ysgrifenedig. Yn y rhan berthnasol o'r ateb, dywedwyd mai'r cyfanswm a dderbyniwyd drwy fodiweiddio ar gyfer cynllun 2001 oedd £724,000, a bod £2.3 miliwn wedi'i dderbyn ar gyfer 2002. Y swm disgwyliedig ar gyfer y cynllun presennol oedd £4.5 miliwn.

Mae'r Gweinidog yn cydnabod bod ganddo dair blynedd i wario'r arian hwn. Er hynny, nid oes dim o'r arian hwnnw wedi'i wario. Mae trefniadau ar y gweill i wario £700,000 o'r arian a dderbyniwyd yn 2001 yn y flwyddyn bresennol i gyllido Tir Gofal. Mae incymau amaethyddol ar eu hisaf ers amser maith ac mae rhestr hir o bobl sydd am ymuno â chynllun Tir Gofal. Mae amheuaeth ynghylch hygredd cynllun Tir Gofal am fod pobl yn teimlo na allant ymuno ag ef. Yn waeth byth, mae egwyddor modiweiddio yn cael ei thanseilio hefyd. Mae hyn yn fy nhrangwyddo i gan nad oedd y Gweinidog a arferai fod yn gyfrifol am amaethyddiaeth yn barod i drafod modiweiddio gyda'r diwydiant ffermio am ei fod yn amhoblogaidd. Penderfynais, gan mai modiweiddio oedd biau'r dyfodol, y byddwn yn mynd allan ac yn siarad am y cysyniad amhoblogaidd hwn. Bydd ymddygiad y Gweinidog mewn cysylltiad ag ailgylchu'r arian hwn yn peri dicter yn y gymuned wledig ac yn peri i fodiweiddio fod yn fwy annerbyniol byth. Mae'n amharu'n ddifrifol ar hygredd Tir Gofal ac egwyddor modiweiddio.

Mae hyn yn fater difrifol. Mae'n waeth na mater y taliadau hwyr, gan fod hynny'n ganlyniad i anallu. Mae'n waeth na mater yr organebau a addaswyd yn enetig, a oedd hefyd yn ganlyniad i anallu. Mae hyn yn fwriadol. Os yw Gweinidog yn cymryd

causes such offence to the rural community, he should not continue in post, as he will have lost his credibility.

I welcome the announcement of funding for the maintenance payments; that is right. However, I am concerned that momentum has been lost in Wales. A few years ago, the general impression across Britain was that Wales was leading the way in terms of the organic sector. Maintenance payments were announced in England some months ago. The Assembly Minister was silent for months, and the whole momentum switched to England. Today, the Minister has announced the funding, probably because the Conservatives' amendment 3 dragged the information out of him. He was probably awaiting a public relations opportunity in which to make this announcement.

We will support the motion, because it is right. However, the Minister's ability to deliver on it is limited.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I welcome this motion as it provides an opportunity to measure the partnership Government's success in delivering the Assembly's commitment to sustainable development. Tir Gofal has been a landmark scheme, with over 700 projects agreed since it was established. Organic farming is particularly environmentally friendly, and the market demand for organic produce has not yet been met. Promoting the organic sector was one of our key strategies for rural Wales and Welsh agriculture. Not only has this helped the organic sector, it has also helped to establish the brand of quality now associated with Welsh foods worldwide.

I support the announcement of the organic stewardship scheme and, in particular, the new payment rates, which are significantly higher than those offered by DEFRA in England. The arable rate in Wales is £5 per hectare or 17 per cent higher; our enclosed land rate is £12 per hectare or 52 per cent higher; and our unenclosed land rate is £5 per hectare or 100 per cent higher. Put simply, under this partnership Government, Welsh farmers are getting a better deal than those in England. However, will the Minister's commit to ensuring that all payments due to

camau bwriadol sy'n peri'r fath dramgwydd i'r gymuned wledig, ni ddylai barhau yn ei swydd, gan y bydd wedi colli ei hygrededd.

Croesawaf y cyhoeddiad am gyllid ar gyfer y taliadau cynnal; mae hynny'n iawn. Er hynny, pryderaf fod y momentwm wedi'i golli yng Nghymru. Ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl, yr argraff gyffredinol ledled Prydain oedd mai Cymru a oedd ar y blaen o ran y sector organig. Cyhoeddwyd taliadau cynnal yn Lloegr rai misoedd yn ôl. Bu Gweinidog y Cynulliad yn ddistaw am fisoedd, ac mae'r holl fomentwm wedi mynd i Loegr. Heddiw, mae'r Gweinidog wedi cyhoeddi'r cyllid a hynny, yn ôl pob tebyg, am fod gwelliant 3 y Ceidwadwyr wedi ei orfodi i roi'r wybodaeth honno. Mae'n debyg ei fod yn disgwyl am gyfle i wneud y cyhoeddiad hwn a fyddai'n hyrwyddo cysylltiadau cyhoeddus.

Cefnogwn y cynnig, am ei fod yn iawn. Fodd bynnag, prin yw gallu'r Gweinidog i'w gyflawni.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Croesawaf y cynnig hwn gan ei fod yn cynnig cyfle i bwysu a mesur llwyddiant y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth wrth gyflawni ymrwymiad y Cynulliad i ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Bu Tir Gofal yn gynllun o bwys mawr, a chytunwyd ar fwy na 700 o brosiectau ers ei sefydlu. Mae ffermio organig yn arbennig o lesol i'r amgylchedd, ac ni ddiwallwyd galw'r farchnad am gynnyrch organig eto. Hyrwyddo'r sector organig oedd un o'n prif strategaethau ar gyfer y Gymru wledig ac amaethyddiaeth Cymru. Yn ogystal â helpu'r sector organig, mae hefyd wedi helpu i sefydlu'r brand o ansawdd da sydd bellach yn gysylltiedig â bwydydd o Gymru drwy'r byd.

Cefnogaf y cyhoeddiad am y cynllun stiwardiaeth organig ac, yn benodol, y cyfraddau tâl newydd, sy'n uwch o lawer na'r rhai a gynigir gan DEFRA yn Lloegr. Mae'r gyfradd ar gyfer tir â'r yng Nghymru'n £5 yr hectar neu 17 y cant yn fwy; mae ein cyfradd ar gyfer tir caeedig yn £12 yr hectar neu 52 y cant yn fwy; ac mae ein cyfradd ar gyfer tir agored yn £5 yr hectar neu 100 y cant yn fwy. A'i roi'n syml, o dan y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth hon, mae ffermwyr Cymru'n cael gwell bargaen na'r rhai yn Lloegr. Fodd bynnag, a wnaiff y Gweinidog ymrwymo i

farmers will be made forthwith to alleviate any financial hardship?

**The Deputy First Minister and Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad (Michael German):** I thank Members for the generally constructive nature of the debate. I will deal with the constructive points made. I will remind the Conservative Party of the damage that it has caused Welsh farmers. The fact that it turned down the agri-monetary compensation that was due to Britain will create more anguish over the next 10, 15, 20 or even 40 years. I will return to that point in a minute; we must give the Conservatives some of their own medicine. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.']

I agree with Rhodri Glyn Thomas that not enough farmers can get into the scheme—

**David Davies** *rose*—

**Michael German:** Sit down. [*Interruption.*]

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order.

**David Davies:** Will the Minister give way?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. The red button is on; you cannot be heard. The Minister had five minutes in which to speak, but I will now allow him an extra minute because of all the unseemly interruptions.

**Michael German:** Thank you. I agree that not enough farmers are coming into the scheme. The target was for 25 per cent of agricultural land to be covered under Tir Gofal. We will achieve that during this year, ahead of time. However, the interest lies in the broad and shallow scheme, hence the problem raised by the Conservative Party. The accelerating number of Tir Gofal schemes coming into place at the moment is important. There have been 750 agreements in the last 12 months and probably—

**Nick Bourne** *rose*—

**Michael German:** I will not take any interventions at the moment. [ASSEMBLY

sicrhau y bydd yr holl daliadau sy'n ddyledus i ffermwyr yn cael eu gwneud yn syth er mwyn lleddfu unrhyw galedi ariannol?

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor (Michael German):** Diolchaf i Aelodau am natur y ddadl a oedd yn adeiladol gan mwyaf. Ymdriniaf â'r pwyntiau adeiladol a wnaed. Gwnaf atgoffa'r Blaid Geidwadol am y niwed a wnaeth i ffermwyr Cymru. Bydd y ffaith iddi wrthod yr iawndal amaeth-ariannol a oedd yn ddyledus i Brydain yn creu mwy o ofid dros y 10, 15, 20 neu hyd yn oed 40 mlynedd nesaf. Af yn ôl at y pwynt hwnnw mewn munud; rhaid inni roi blas o'u ffisig eu hun i'r Ceidwadwyr. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.']

Cytunaf â Rhodri Glyn Thomas nad yw digon o ffermwyr yn gallu dod yn rhan o'r cynllun—

**David Davies** *a gododd*—

**Michael German:** Eisteddwch. [*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn.

**David Davies:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ildio?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r botwm coch ymlaen; ni ellir eich clywed. Pum munud a oedd gan y Gweinidog i siarad, ond caniatâf funud ychwanegol iddo'n awr oherwydd yr holl dorri ar draws anwedus.

**Michael German:** Diolch i chi. Cytunaf nad oes digon o ffermwyr yn ymuno â'r cynllun. Y targed oedd cynnwys 25 y cant o dir amaethyddol o dan Tir Gofal. Byddwn yn cyflawni hynny yn ystod y flwyddyn hon, cyn pryd. Fodd bynnag, mae'r diddordeb pennaf yn y cynllun eang a bas; dyna pam y codwyd y broblem gan y Blaid Geidwadol. Mae'r nifer cynyddol o gynlluniau Tir Gofal a roddir ar waith ar hyn o bryd yn bwysig. Bu 750 o gytundebau yn y 12 mis diwethaf ac yn ôl pob tebyg—

**Nick Bourne** *a gododd*—

**Michael German:** Ni dderbyniaf unrhyw ymyriadau ar hyn o bryd. [AELODAU'R

MEMBERS: ‘Oh.’] I have not reached the point when I will tell the Conservatives of the trouble that they have caused the people of Wales. There has been a huge acceleration in paying Tir Gofal payments. I expect to make a full announcement in Committee tomorrow of the current situation in terms of payments. However, Ieuan, ESA payments, along with organic payments, will restart in the next few weeks. The farm improvement grant payments, the farm enterprise grant payments and the woodland scheme payments have already started. The backlog of approximately £280,000—not millions of pounds, as some claim—will be cleared quickly. I understand the difficulties in terms of payments and we have previously discussed this. In terms of the organic scheme, the introduction of maintenance payments over an extended period will apply to those who received help for conversion and are now experiencing difficulties.

I agree with Mick Bates that monitoring and evaluation are important. Arrangements are in place, not only to monitor compliance, which we must carry out, but also to monitor the longer-term benefits. We cannot determine those benefits at the moment because it takes time for the scheme to get up and running. I recognise that standard costs may help in terms of simplifying schemes, but, because this is public money, we must take account of our inherent duty to ensure value for money. Therefore, we prefer competitive quotations.

Although Alun Pugh is not in the Chamber, in response to his question on tenant farmers, it is important to ensure that the landlord signs up so that there is a long-term commitment to the agreement. However, I am looking to include further flexibility in the arrangements, where possible, in order to assist tenant farmers.

I inform Ieuan that match funding for European money is not an issue in terms of Tir Gofal. We have put in enormous amounts of money, far more than would be required as match funding. I recognise the inherent difficulties in negotiating the UK position and the European position as part of the review of the common agricultural policy

CYNULLIAD: ‘O.’] Nid wyf wedi dod at y man lle y dywedaf wrth y Ceidwadwyr am y drafferth y maent wedi’i hachosi i bobl Cymru. Mae’r taliadau Tir Gofal yn cael eu talu’n gyflymach o lawer. Yr wyf yn disgwyl y gallaf wneud cyhoeddiad llawn yn y Pwyllgor yfory am y sefyllfa bresennol o ran taliadau. Fodd bynnag, Ieuan, bydd y taliadau ardal amgylchedd arbennig, ynghyd â thaliadau organig, yn aildechrau yn yr wythnosau nesaf. Mae taliadau’r grant gwella ffermydd, y taliadau grant mentrau fferm a thaliadau’r cynllun coetir wedi dechrau eisoes. Bydd yr ôl-groniad o tua £280,000—nid miliynau o bunnoedd, fel y mae rhai’n honni—yn cael ei glirio’n fuan. Deallaf yr anawsterau o ran taliadau ac yr ydym wedi trafod hyn o’r blaen. O ran y cynllun organig, bydd cyflwyno’r taliadau cynnal dros gyfnod estynedig yn berthnasol i’r rhai a gafodd gymorth i drosglwyddo ac sydd bellach yn profi anawsterau.

Cytunaf â Mick Bates fod monitro a gwerthuso’n bwysig. Mae trefniadau ar waith, nid yn unig i fonitro cydymffurfio, fel yr ydym yn gorfod gwneud, ond hefyd i fonitro’r buddion tymor-hir. Na allwn bennu’r holl fuddion hynny ar hyn o bryd am ei bod yn cymryd amser i’r cynllun ddod yn gwbl weithredol. Yr wyf yn cydnabod y gall costau safonol fod o gymorth o ran symleiddio cynlluniau, ond, gan mai arian cyhoeddus yw hwn, rhaid inni ystyried ein dyletswydd ymlynol i sicrhau gwerth am arian. Gan hynny, mae’n well gennym ddyfynbrisiau cystadleuol.

Er nad yw Alun Pugh yn y Siambr, mewn ymateb i’w gwestiwn am denantiaid ffermydd, mae’n bwysig sicrhau bod y landlord yn ymuno fel bod ymrwymiad tymor-hir i’r cytundeb. Serch hynny, yr wyf yn ystyried ffyrdd o wneud y trefniadau’n fwy hyblyg, lle y bo modd, er mwyn cynorthwyo tenantiaid ffermydd.

Hysbysaf Ieuan nad yw cyllid cyfatebol ar gyfer arian Ewropeaidd yn fater sy’n codi yng nghyd-destun Tir Gofal. Yr ydym wedi buddsoddi symiau enfawr o arian, mwy o lawer na’r hyn a fyddai’n ofynnol fel cyllid cyfatebol. Yr wyf yn cydnabod yr anawsterau sydd o ran negodi safbwynt y DU a’r safbwynt Ewropeaidd fel rhan o’r adolygiad



because of the difficulties with pillar 2 funding caused by the Conservative Party. [Interruption.] Mrs Thatcher was responsible for it.

On pillar 2, the £4.5 million has not been collected. Glyn said that we should be spending that £4.5 million now, but it will not be collected until the end of this year. Last year's receipts and those of the previous year will be available to us this year. The Conservatives think that I am now responsible for foot and mouth disease. They have another thing coming. It does not say much about their competence either.

**Peter Rogers:** Will you give way?

**Michael German:** No. You have had your chance. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.']

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. The Minister is not giving way, so please sit down, Peter.

**Michael German:** The Conservatives cannot deny the difficulties that they have caused Welsh agriculture by turning money down. The cost to Welsh farmers will become more apparent if I cannot negotiate a stronger position. The UK Government supports our efforts to prioritise redressing the historic imbalance in pillar 2. The Conservatives may not like the truth when it hits them between the eyes.

The organic payments, which will restart in the next few weeks, are higher than those in England. Therefore, I reject any claims that we are not giving a better deal to organic farmers.

**Nick Bourne** *rose*—

**Michael German:** I will not give way. I remind the Conservatives that the Tir Gofal budget for the next three years is £55 million. Modulation for the next three years will amount to £7.5 million; that is in future, as is the match funding from the UK Government. I believe that the £55 million that the Assembly Government is contributing to Tir Gofal demonstrates our commitment to ensuring a good deal for Welsh farmers,

o'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin oherwydd yr anawsterau gyda chyllid piler 2 a achoswyd gan y Blaid Geidwadol. [Torri ar draws.] Mrs Thatcher a fu'n gyfrifol am hynny.

Ynghylch piler 2, mae £4.5 miliwn heb ei gasglu. Dywedodd Glyn y dylem fod yn gwario'r £4.5 miliwn hwnnw yn awr, ond ni chesglir ef tan ddiwedd y flwyddyn hon. Bydd yr arian a dderbyniwyd y llynedd a'r flwyddyn cynt ar gael i ni eleni. Cred y Ceidwadwyr mai myfi sy'n gyfrifol bellach am glwy'r traed a'r genau. Cânt feddwl eto. Nid yw hynny'n dweud llawer am eu gallu hwy ychwaith.

**Peter Rogers:** A wnewch ildio?

**Michael German:** Na wnaif. Cawsoch eich cyfle. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.']

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw'r Gweinidog yn ildio, felly eisteddwech, Peter, os gwelwch yn dda.

**Michael German:** Ni all y Ceidwadwyr wadu'r anawsterau y maent wedi'u hachosi i amaethyddiaeth yng Nghymru drwy wrthod arian. Bydd y gost i ffermwyr Cymru yn dod yn fwy amlwg os na allaf negodi i sicrhau sefyllfa gadarnach. Mae Llywodraeth y DU yn cefnogi ein hymdrechion i roi blaenoriaeth i wneud iawn am yr anghydbwysedd sy'n bod ers amser maith o ran piler 2. Efallai nad yw'r Ceidwadwyr yn hoffi clywed y gwir pan yw'n eu bwrw yn eu talcen.

Mae'r taliadau organig, a fydd yn aildechrau yn yr wythnosau nesaf, yn fwy na'r rhai yn Lloegr. Felly, gwrthodaf unrhyw honiadau nad ydym yn rhoi gwell bargaen i ffermwyr organig.

**Nick Bourne** *a gododd*—

**Michael German:** Nid ildiaf. Yr wyf yn atgoffa'r Ceidwadwyr bod y gyllideb ar gyfer Tir Gofal dros y tair blynedd nesaf yn £55 miliwn. Bydd y modiwlleiddio ar gyfer y tair blynedd nesaf yn dod i £7.5 miliwn; yn y dyfodol y mae hynny, fel y mae'r cyllid cyfatebol oddi wrth Lywodraeth y DU. Credaf fod y £55 miliwn y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei gyfrannu at Tir Gofal yn dangos ein hymrwymiad i sicrhau bargaen dda

unlike the deal that the Conservatives served i ffermwyr Cymru, yn wahanol i'r fargen a  
up for them. roddodd y Ceidwadwyr iddynt.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 1: For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment accepted.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 18, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.  
Amendment 2: For 18, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Graham, William  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Jones, David Ian  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Phil

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 18, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26.  
 Amendment 3: For 18, Abstain 0, Against 26.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Graham, William  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Jones, David Ian  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment rejected.*

Motion NDM1344 as amended:

*the National Assembly for Wales*

*recognises the valuable contribution made by the Tir Gofal and organic farming schemes to the promotion of environmental sustainability in Wales, and agrees that every effort should be made to broaden the scope of future agri-environmental schemes, subject to the outcome of the mid-term review of the common agricultural policy, so that environmental benefits across Wales are maximised; and*

*acknowledges the contribution to the development of organic farming in Wales by the Organic Centre Wales.*

Cynnig NDM1344 wedi'i ddiwygio:

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*yn cydnabod cyfraniad gwerthfawr Tir Gofal a'r cynllun ffermio organig at hyrwyddo cynaliadwyedd yr amgylchedd yng Nghymru, ac yn cytuno y dylid gwneud pob ymdrech i ehangu cwmpas cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol yn y dyfodol, gan ddibynnu ar ganlyniad yr adolygiad canol tymor o'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin, er mwyn cael y buddiannau amgylcheddol gorau posibl i Gymru gyfan; ac*

*yn cydnabod cyfraniad canolfan organig Cymru i ddatblygiad ffermio organig yng Nghymru.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amended motion: For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri

Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
Amended motion carried.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â  
today's proceedings to a close. chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.21 p.m.  
The session ended at 5.21 p.m.*