



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mawrth 4 Chwefror 2003**

**Tuesday 4 February 2003**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 3     Datganiad gan y Llywydd  
*Statement by the Presiding Officer*
- 4     Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog  
*Questions to the First Minister*
- 26    Datganiad Busnes  
*Business Statement*
- 29    Cynnig o Gerydd  
*Censure Motion*
- 44    Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Gwasanaethau Maethu (Cymru) 2003  
*Approval of the Fostering Services (Wales) Regulations 2003*
- 49    Dadl o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29: Deddfwriaeth ar Daliadau Presgripsiwn  
*Debate under Standing Order No. 29: Legislation on Prescription Charges*
- 64    Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru): Cyfathrebu  
*Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru): Communications*

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

### **Datganiad gan y Llywydd Statement by the Presiding Officer**

**Y Llywydd:** Cyn imi alw ar Brif Weinidog Cymru i ateb cwestiynau heddiw, gwnaf ddatganiad yn deillio o rywbeth a ddigwyddodd yr wythnos diwethaf, ac sydd wedi digwydd sawl gwaith yn y Cynulliad. Yn ei ddyddiau cynnar, cytunodd y Cynulliad ar brotocol i bennu ffiniau'r berthynas rhwng Aelodau a swyddogion y Cynulliad. Egwyddor sylfaenol y protocol yw y dylai'r berthynas rhwng Aelodau a staff fod yn broffesiynol, gyda'r naill yn parchu'r llall.

Ar 12 Medi 2000, dyfernais y dylai Aelod sydd am godi cwestiwn am ymddygiad swyddog ddod i'm swyddfa yn y lle cyntaf, ac y byddwn innau wedyn yn codi'r mater yn uniongyrchol gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Parhaol. Dyfernais hefyd ar 5 Mawrth 2002 na ddylid enwi swyddogion yn y Siambr, gan na allant ateb yn ôl. Yng ngoleuni'r ceisiadau a gefais yr wythnos diwethaf, hoffwn ategu'r dyfarniadau hyn a'u hesbonio'n fanylach.

O dan ein cyfansoddiad presennol, mae holl staff y Cynulliad, y rheini sy'n gweithio i Weinidogion ac o fewn Swyddfa'r Llywydd yn gweithio i ni fel corff corfforaethol. Am y rheswm hwnnw, mae gennyf hefyd rôl i'w hamddiffyn. Bu'r Cynulliad yn ffodus i recriwtio staff mor ymroddedig ac o safon mor uchel. Mae perygl inni anghofio'r hyn y maent yn ei wneud a dibrisio'u cyfraniad. Fodd bynnag, mae pob Aelod yn gwybod mai staff y Cynulliad, boed yma yn y bae, ym mharc Cathays, neu yn ein swyddfeydd ledled Cymru, yw ein caffaeliad mwyaf, ac maent hefyd yn gaffaeliad i Gymru.

Os bydd Aelodau yn teimlo bod unrhyw aelod unigol o staff wedi camymddwyn, wedi ymddwyn yn amhriodol neu wedi ymddwyn yn groes i les y Cynulliad, mae dyletswydd arnynt i'w hetholwyr i godi'r mater gyda mi, er mwyn imi allu trefnu ymchwiliad o dan y trefniadau a gyhoeddais ym Medi 2000. Fodd bynnag, dylent godi'r mater hwnnw yn

**The Presiding Officer:** Before I call on the First Minister to answer questions, I will make a statement arising from something that happened last week, and which has happened a number of times in the Assembly. In its early days, the Assembly agreed a protocol to set the parameters of the relationship between Members and Assembly officials. The protocol's fundamental principle is that the relationship between Members and staff should be professional and based on mutual respect.

On 12 September 2000, I ruled that a Member who wishes to raise a question about the conduct of an official should come to my office in the first instance, and that I would then raise the matter directly with the Permanent Secretary. I also ruled on 5 March 2002 that officials should not be named in the Chamber, as they cannot answer back. In the light of requests that I received last week, I wish to restate and explain those rulings in more detail.

Under our current settlement, all Assembly staff, those who work for Ministers and in the Presiding Office, work for us as a corporate body. For that reason, I also have a role to protect them. The Assembly was lucky to recruit such committed and high-quality staff. There is a danger that we forget what they do and undervalue their contribution. However, all Members know that the Assembly staff, whether here in the bay, in Cathays park, or in offices across Wales, are our greatest asset, and they are also an asset to Wales.

If Members believe that an individual member of staff has behaved wrongly, inappropriately or against the Assembly's interests, they have a duty to their electorate to raise the matter with me, so that I can arrange an investigation under the procedures that I announced in September 2000. However, they should raise the matter

breifat yn y lle cyntaf. Penderfynodd y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad yn ei seithfed adroddiad ym mis Rhagfyr 2001 y byddai enwi a beirniadu swyddog yn gyhoeddus yn tramgwyddo Cod Safonau ar gyfer Aelodau. O bryd i'w gilydd, bydd Aelodau am feirniadu'r ffordd y mae staff yn gyffredinol wedi ymddwyn. Mae gan Aelodau yr hawl hwnnw fel cynrychiolwyr etholedig pobl Cymru. Fodd bynnag, mae dyletswydd arnom oll i feddwl yn ofalus cyn gweld bai ar ein staff a beirniadu'u hymddygiad. Rhaid cofio nad ydynt yn gallu ateb yn ôl.

Ar ben hynny, ni all fod yn iawn enwi aelod unigol o staff mewn ffordd sarhaus neu annheg mewn trafodaeth. Byddai hynny'n sicr yn mynd yn groes i'r gofyn sydd arnom i ddangos parch i'n gilydd.

Disgwyliaf i bob Aelod gadw at y dyfarniad hwn yng Nghyfarfodydd Llawn y dyfodol. Bydd rheolau mewn Pwyllgorau o reidrwydd ychydig yn wahanol gan fod swyddogion yn cael ymddangos yno yn bersonol ond yr wyf yn mawr obeithio y bydd Cadeiryddion y Pwyllgorau yn cadw mewn cof yr egwyddorion a osodais gerbron.

privately in the first instance. The Committee on Standards of Conduct concluded in its seventh report in December 2001 that publicly naming and criticising an official was a breach of the Code of Standards for Members. From time to time, Members will wish to criticise the way in which staff in general have operated. Members have that right as the elected representatives of the people of Wales. However, we all have a duty to think carefully before we blame our staff and criticise their conduct. We must remember that they cannot answer back.

Moreover, it can never be right for individual members of staff to be named in an opprobrious or unfair manner in our debates. That is not in keeping with the mutual respect that is enjoined upon us.

I will expect all Members to comply with this ruling in Plenary in future. Somewhat different rules will necessarily apply in Committees as officials are allowed to appear before them in person, but I hope that Committee Chairs will bear in mind the principles that I have outlined.

## **Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister**

### **Cynnydd yn y Dreth Gyngor ar gyfer Trethdalwyr yn y Gymru Wledig Increase in Council Tax for Rural Welsh Ratepayers**

**Q1 Peter Rogers:** Will the Minister make a statement on the increase in council tax for rural Welsh ratepayers? (OAQ22149)

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** Decisions on council tax levels are for local authorities. We are responsible for grant support provision to local authorities. I am sure that you will have a particular interest in Anglesey and Gwynedd. Next year we will provide Gwynedd council with £1,154 per head of population in grant. That is the fourth highest level of funding per head in Wales. Anglesey will get £1,128 per head, which is the seventh highest level in Wales.

**Peter Rogers:** My concern relates to funding

**C1 Peter Rogers:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y cynnydd yn y dreth gyngor ar gyfer trethdalwyr yn y Gymru wledig? (OAQ22149)

**Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan):** Awdurdodau lleol sy'n penderfynu ar lefelau'r dreth gyngor. Yr ydym ni'n gyfrifol am ddarparu grant cynnal i awdurdodau lleol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn ymddiddori'n benodol yn Ynys Môn a Gwynedd. Y flwyddyn nesaf, darparwn £1,154 y pen o'r boblogaeth mewn grant ar gyfer Cyngor Gwynedd. Dyna'r lefel bedwaredd uchaf o gyllid y pen yng Nghymru. Caiff Ynys Môn £1,128 y pen, sef y lefel seithfed uchaf yng Nghymru.

**Peter Rogers:** Mae'r pryder sydd gennyf yn

the police force. Is it reasonable to demand extra money from north Wales ratepayers to fund 50 extra community police officers when that is not happening in other parts of Wales? Why is the North once again being made to suffer and having to pay the price for a service that is widespread in the rest of Wales?

**The First Minister:** That is a matter for the chief constable in north Wales as distinct from Wales's other three chief constables. Perhaps the possibility of using the Communities First programme should be considered, but that is up to the partnerships determining Communities First priorities in that area. In other parts of Wales, Communities First initiatives are being used to develop teams of 'bobbies on the beat'. That has been introduced successfully across Wales. Perhaps these ideas have not been raised as frequently in north Wales. I am not sure about that. However, these matters are for local determination.

**Mick Bates:** Do you agree that this grant support settlement, at almost four times the rate of inflation, is yet another example of this partnership Government's positive attitude towards, and support for, local democracy?

**The First Minister:** Yes, because we did that mainly through unhypothecated funding. Local authorities have full discretion over grants, which strengthens local democracy. We have also ensured that to a small degree through specific programmes such as the performance incentive grant, with which we are all familiar. It provides additional incentive whereby local authorities can get some reward for implementing a programme or carrying out general efficiencies in an area that merits a reward. It is a generous settlement and is miles ahead of inflation. We hope that it will be the basis of reasonable council tax settlements in the new financial year.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Pan fydd biliau y dreth gyngor yn cael eu dosbarthu mewn ardaloedd gwledig yng Nghymru eleni, a ydych yn poeni y bydd praesept yr heddlu yn ymddangos ar yr un bil? Ni fydd etholwyr yn

ymwneud â chyllido'r heddlu. A yw'n rhesymol mynnu arian ychwanegol gan drethdalwyr y Gogledd i gyllido 50 o heddwision cymunedol ychwanegol pan nad yw hynny'n digwydd mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru? Pam mai'r Gogledd sy'n gorfod dioddef eto a thalu'r pris am wasanaeth sy'n gyffredin yng ngweddill Cymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hynny'n fater i'r prif gwnstabl yn y Gogledd yn hytrach na thri phrif gwnstabl arall Cymru. Efallai y dylid ystyried y posibilrwydd o ddefnyddio'r rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, ond mae hynny'n fater i'r partneriaethau sy'n pennu blaenoriaethau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn yr ardal honno. Mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru, defnyddir mentrau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf i ddatblygu timau o 'blismyn ar eu rhawd'. Cyflwynwyd hynny'n llwyddiannus ledled Cymru. Efallai nad yw'r syniadau hyn wedi'u crybwyll mor aml yn y Gogledd. Nid wyf yn sicr am hynny. Fodd bynnag, materion i'w penderfynu'n lleol yw'r rhain.

**Mick Bates:** A gytunwch bod y setliad grant cynnal hwn, sydd bron bedair gwaith yn fwy na chyfradd chwyddiant, yn enghraifft arall o ymagwedd gadarnhaol y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth hon at ddemocratiaeth leol ac o'i chefnogaeth iddi?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ydwyf, oherwydd gwnaethom hynny yn bennaf drwy gyllid nas pridiannwyd. Mae gan awdurdodau lleol ryddid llwyr i weithredu ynghylch grantiau, ac mae hynny'n cryfhau democratiaeth leol. Yr ydym wedi sicrhau hynny hefyd, i raddau, drwy raglenni penodol fel y grant cymell perfformiad, yr ydym oll yn gyfarwydd ag ef. Mae'n cynnig anogaeth ychwanegol fel y gall awdurdodau lleol gael rhyw wobwr am roi rhaglen ar waith neu am gymryd camau i wella effeithlonrwydd yn gyffredinol mewn maes sy'n haeddu gwobr. Mae'n setliad hael ac mae ymhell ar y blaen i chwyddiant. Gobeithiwn y bydd hynny'n sylfaen i setliadau treth gyngor rhesymol yn y flwyddyn ariannol newydd.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** When council tax bills are distributed in rural areas in Wales this year, are you concerned that the police precept will appear on the same bill? The electorate will not be able to differentiate

gallu gwahaniaethu rhwng y naill a'r llall a bydd y cynnydd yn y gost yn cael ei weld fel cynnydd eithriadol yn y dreth gyngor o ganlyniad i braesept yr heddlu a'r ffaith nad yw Llywodraeth San Steffan yn ariannu heddluoedd gwledig yn ddigonol.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym i gyd yn derbyn bod yr heddlu wedi cyflawni llwyddiant aruthrol, yn enwedig Heddlu Dyfed Powys o ran dal troseddwy. Mae'n ysgubol; mae ar y blaen mewn tabl sy'n cymharu llwyddiant yn yr agwedd honno ar yr heddlu. Mae'r praesept—y dreth ychwanegol ar gyfer yr heddlu—wastad wedi cael ei basio ymlaen gan y Cynulliad i awdurdodau lleol i'w osod ar eu biliau.

O ran y grant, derbyniodd Cyngor Sir Caerfyrddin gynnydd o 10 y cant. Mae'n uwch na'r grant ar gyfer Cymru gyfan, sydd wedi'i godi gan 9.22 y cant. Felly, ni chredaf y bydd cwynion o'r gornel honno o Gymru

between one and the other and the increased cost will be perceived as a huge increase in council tax because of the police precept and the fact that the Westminster Government does not fund rural police forces adequately.

**The First Minister:** We all accept that the police has had great success, particularly Dyfed Powys Police in terms of catching criminals. It is incredible; it is ahead in a table comparing success rates in that aspect of police work. The precept—the additional tax for the police—has always been passed on by the Assembly to the local authorities to be placed on their bills.

On the grant, Carmarthenshire County Council received an increase of 10 per cent. That is higher than the grant for the whole of Wales, which has been increased by 9.22 per cent. Therefore, I do not believe that there will be complaints from that corner of Wales.

2.10 p.m.

### **Materion Trawsbynciol yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cross-cutting Issues in the National Assembly**

**C2 Geraint Davies:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar ei rôl fel cydlynnydd materion trawsbynciol o fewn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol? (OAQ22142)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ein prif flaenoriaeth yw magu hyder yn ein cymunedau tlotaf bod eu strydoedd a'u cymunedau'n ddiogel. Dyna'r sylfaen a dyna pam yr oeddwn am bwysleisio'r ffordd y mae'r cymunedau hyn yn derbyn ac yn defnyddio'r rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Bûm yn dyst i hyn yn y Rhondda, lle y mae pum heddwes wedi'u hychwanegu i'r tîm lleol er mwyn iddynt fod mewn cysylltiad uniongyrchol â'r gymuned. Mae hyn yn dangos i ddinasyddion Tylorstown, a gweddill y Rhondda, mai hwy sydd yn cymryd drosodd ac mai hwy sydd yn berchen ar y strydoedd yn hytrach na'r sawl sydd yn gwerthu cyffuriau.

**Geraint Davies:** Mae'n bwysig inni weithio gyda'n gilydd. Mae 'Iaith Pawb' yn datgan bod y Gymraeg yn fater trawsbynciol. A yw

**Q2 Geraint Davies:** Will the First Minister make a statement on his role as co-ordinator of cross-cutting issues in the National Assembly? (OAQ22142)

**The First Minister:** Our main priority is to build confidence in our poorest communities that their streets and communities are safe. This is the basis and that is why I wanted to emphasise the way in which these communities accept and use the Communities First programme. I have witnessed this in the Rhondda, where five police officers have been added to the local team so that they can be in direct contact with the community. This shows the citizens of Tylorstown, and the rest of the Rhondda, that they are taking over and that it is they who own the streets, rather than the drug dealers.

**Geraint Davies:** It is important that we work together. 'Iaith Pawb' states that the Welsh language is a cross-cutting issue. Does that

hynny'n golygu eich bod yn rhoi ymrwymiad statudol i'r iaith, a fyddai'n ei gwneud yn gyfartal â'r tair thema drawsbynciol arall, neu a yw'n golygu ymrwymiad gwirfoddol yn unig?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r Cynulliad wedi dewis y tair thema hynny, sydd yn sylfaenol drawsbynciol. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n golygu na allwn ychwanegu agweddau eraill. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ceisio defnyddio'r Gymraeg ar sail cyfartaledd, a'i gosod yn y brif ffrwd, er mwyn sicrhau nad yw ein hymrwymiad wedi'i ymyleiddio, ond ei fod yn berthnasol i'n holl waith.

**Kirsty Williams:** Do you agree that building sustainable communities should be at the core of the Assembly's cross-cutting themes? Will you therefore join me in condemning the Post Office's proposals to close its branch at Upper Cwmtwrch in my constituency? Will you carefully consider the community's application to the post office development fund, which is usually used to fund proposals by postmasters, to help it secure post office facilities in the village?

**The First Minister:** Many will be familiar with Upper Cwmtwrch, if only because of the famous, if mythical, occasion when the Pope asked Clive Rowlands where he was from; when Clive Rowlands replied 'Cwmtwrch', the Pope is alleged to have asked 'Upper or Lower?' It is important that the communities of Upper and Lower Cwmtwrch retain their pride, and, without a postal service, that may not be easy. We want to maintain postal services wherever that is viable. However, if the local postmaster or postmistress decides that the business is not viable, a search will be carried out, with assistance, for someone else who may be able to take the business over.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** Do you accept that competence or, perhaps more correctly, incompetence affects the delivery of policy on these cross-cutting issues? The Minister for Health and Social Services presides over the worst waiting list position in the western world. The Finance Minister appointed

mean that you are making a statutory commitment to the language, which would give it equal status with the other three cross-cutting themes, or is this merely a voluntary commitment?

**The First Minister:** The Assembly has chosen those three themes, which are fundamentally cross-cutting. However, that does not mean that we cannot add other aspects. The Assembly Government endeavours to use the Welsh language on the basis of equality and to mainstream it to ensure that our commitment to it is not marginalised, but that it cuts across all aspects of our work.

**Kirsty Williams:** A ydych yn cytuno y dylai'r gwaith o greu cymunedau cynaliadwy fod yn ganolog i themâu trawsbynciol y Cynulliad? A wnewch ymuno â mi felly i gollfarnu bwriad Swyddfa'r Post i gau ei changen yng Nghwmtwrch Uchaf yn fy etholaeth i? A wnewch ystyried yn ofalus gais y gymuned hon i'r gronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post, a ddefnyddir fel arfer i gyllido cynigion gan bostfeistri, i'w helpu i sicrhau cysfleusterau swyddfa bost yn y pentref?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Bydd llawer yn gyfarwydd â Chwmtwrch Uchaf, pe na bai hynny ond oherwydd y tro enwog, os chwedlonol, y gofynnodd y Pab i Clive Rowlands o ble'r hanai; pan atebodd Clive Rowlands 'Cwmtwrch', honnir bod y Pab wedi gofyn 'Cwmtwrch Uchaf ynteu Cwmtwrch Isaf?' Mae'n bwysig bod cymunedau Cwmtwrch Uchaf ac Isaf yn cadw eu hunan-falchder ac, os nad oes gwasanaeth post, gallai hynny fod yn anodd. Yr ydym am gadw gwasanaethau post ym mhle bynnag y bo hynny'n ddichonadwy. Fodd bynnag, os penderfyna'r postfeistr neu'r bostfeistres nad yw'r busnes yn ddichonadwy, rhoddir cymorth i chwilio am rywun arall a allai ymgymryd â'r busnes.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** A ydych yn derbyn bod gallu neu, yn fwy cywir efallai, anallu yn effeithio ar y dull o gyflawni polisi ar y materion trawsbynciol hyn? Mae'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn goruchwylio'r sefyllfa waethaf o ran rhestrau aros yn y byd gorllewinol. Penododd y

Richard Rogers, then sacked him, then insulted him, then compensated him, and then reinstated him. The Minister for Economic Development told us that it cost £76 million to create 44 jobs and, above all, the Minister for Rural Development has provided us with more bungalows than a series of *Rainbow*. The farmers and many of your backbenchers want him to go, but you want him to stay because we cannot have Laurel without Hardy. Is it not time that you got a grip on the Government's incompetence? What plans do you have to tackle this incompetence so that we can begin to see delivery on these cross-cutting issues?

**The First Minister:** I am fascinated to hear of your interest in cross-cutting issues. Your preamble was one long collection of sneers and smears, which are not worthy of you. You must sort out the problems in your own party. You attack the Minister for Health and Social Services for reorganising the health service on almost the same day as Iain Duncan Smith, your 'quiet man' leader, also promises to reorganise the health service. Therefore, you must decide whether you are for or against reorganising the health service, and then you can tell us what your policy is. Your party cannot announce a policy in Westminster that opposes the Conservative policy in Cardiff. You cannot have such inconsistencies. That also applies to your policy on public spending cuts. You have to decide whether you will opt for 20 per cent cuts in public spending as your budget spokesperson in Westminster did. The cuts will be decided in Westminster, but their knock-on effect on Wales will be enormous. When you have decided on a consistent policy then perhaps you will come back and tell us what it is.

**Nick Bourne:** The First Minister has given us his usual homily on sneers and smears, before going straight into sneers and smears himself. Whatever you may have learned during your expensive Oxford and Harvard education, it was certainly not good manners.

You should concentrate on the issues. One of

Gweinidog Cyllid Richard Rogers, yna'i ddiswyddo, ac yna ei sarhau, a thalu iawndal iddo, ac wedyn ei ailbenodi. Dywedodd y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd iddi gostio £76 miliwn i greu 44 o swyddi ac, yn fwy na dim, cafwyd mwy o fwnglera gan y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig na'r hyn a geir mewn cyfres o raglenni *Rainbow*. Mae'r ffermwyr a llawer o'ch meincwyr cefn am iddo fynd, ond yr ydych chi am iddo aros am na allwn gael Laurel heb Hardy. Onid yw'n bryd ichi fynd i'r afael ag anallu'r Llywodraeth? Pa gynlluniau sydd gennych i ymdrin â'r anallu hwn fel y gallwn ddechrau mynd â'r maen i'r wal ar y materion trawsbynciol hyn?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf wedi fy nghyfareddu o glywed am eich diddordeb mewn materion trawsbynciol. Yr oedd eich rhagymadrodd yn gasgliad hir o sylwadau dirmygus a sarhaus, nad ydynt yn deilwng ohonoch. Rhaid ichi roi trefn ar y problemau yn eich plaid eich hun. Ymosodwch ar y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol am aildrefnu'r gwasanaeth iechyd ar yr un diwrnod bron ag y mae Iain Duncan Smith, eich 'dyn tawel' o arweinydd, yn addo aildrefnu'r gwasanaeth iechyd hefyd. Felly, rhaid ichi benderfynu a ydych o blaid neu yn erbyn aildrefnu'r gwasanaeth iechyd, ac wedyn gallwch ddweud wrthym beth yw eich polisi. Ni all eich plaid gyhoeddi polisi yn San Steffan sy'n mynd yn groes i'r polisi Ceidwadol yng Nghaerdydd. Ni allwch gael anghysonderau o'r fath. Mae hynny'n berthnasol hefyd i'ch polisi ar doriadau mewn gwariant cyhoeddus. Rhaid ichi benderfynu a fyddwch yn dewis toriadau o 20 y cant mewn gwariant cyhoeddus fel y gwnaeth eich llefarydd ar y gyllideb yn San Steffan. Penderfynir ar y toriadau yn San Steffan, ond bydd eu heffaith ganlyniadol ar Gymru'n anferth. Pan ydych wedi penderfynu ar bolisi cyson, efallai y deuwch yn ôl a dweud wrthym beth ydyw.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi rhoi ei bregeth arferol i ni ar wneud sylwadau dirmygus a sarhaus, cyn dechrau hynny ei hun. Beth bynnag y gwnaethoch ei ddysgu yn ystod eich addysg ddrud yn Rhydychen a Harvard, nid moesgarwch ydoedd yn sicr.

Dylech ganolbwyntio ar y materion dan sylw.



the issues that I referred to—not that you dealt with any of the issues in my question—was the Assembly building. Is it not cynicism of the first order to postpone the announcement of the costs of what we are told will be a fixed price project until immediately after the Assembly elections? Is that not a denial of the openness that you are supposed to favour? Your Minister responsible for open government has to sit on these decisions and make sure that they will be made after the elections. Will you tell us how much the new building is going to cost before the election so that the people of Wales know how much money will be wasted?

**The First Minister:** Coming from somebody who refused to take part in any of the meetings where the cost was discussed, that question is as bold as brass and is arrogant. If it takes a certain amount of time for cost certainty to be achieved, then we can do nothing about that. The construction of a landmark building—and there is an example of this in Scotland at the moment—is not the same as the construction of a Tesco supermarket or a school, which have many right angles and which duplicate similar buildings. One-off buildings, which often have many interesting wavy lines, are difficult to construct with cost certainty. The Scots are finding that out, but we are determined not to proceed with our building until we have cost certainty. We have been advised that we will not have that cost certainty until May or June. You may want to interpret that as a cynical motive, but perhaps you should first look at the mote in your own eye.

Un o'r materion y cyfeiriais atynt—er na wnaethoch ddelio â'r un o'r materion a godais yn fy nghwestiwn—oedd adeilad y Cynulliad. Onid sinigiaeth o'r radd flaenaf yw gohirio cyhoeddi costau'r hyn y dywedir wrthym ei fod yn brosiect pris sefydlog tan yn union ar ôl etholiadau'r Cynulliad? Onid yw hynny'n golygu ymwrthod â'r dull agored o weithredu yr ydych i fod i'w ffafrio? Mae'r Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am lywodraeth agored yn gorfod gohirio'r penderfyniadau hyn a sicrhau y gwneir hwy ar ôl yr etholiadau. A wnewch ddweud wrthym beth fydd cost yr adeilad newydd cyn yr etholiad fel bod pobl Cymru'n gwybod faint o arian a wastraffir?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gan mai rhywun a wrthododd gymryd rhan yn yr un o'r cyfarfodydd lle y trafodwyd y gost sy'n ei ofyn, mae'r cwestiwn hwnnw'n un digywilydd a haerllug. Os cymer rywfaint o amser i gael sicrwydd o'r gost, ni allwn wneud dim am hynny. Nid yw codi adeilad nodedig—a cheir enghraifft o hyn yn yr Alban ar hyn o bryd—yr un fath â chodi archfarchnad Tesco neu ysgol, sydd â llawer o onglau sgwâr ac sy'n copïo adeiladau tebyg. Mae'n anodd bod yn sicr o'r gost wrth godi adeiladau unigryw, sydd â llawer o gromliniau diddorol yn aml. Mae'r Albanwyr yn darganfod hynny, ond yr ydym yn benderfynol o beidio â bwrw ymlaen â'n hadeilad ni hyd nes y byddwn yn sicr o'r gost. Fe'n hysbyswyd na fyddwn yn gallu bod yn sicr o'r gost tan fis Mai neu Fehefin. Efallai y byddwch am ddehongli hynny'n gymhelliad sinigaidd, ond efallai y dylech edrych yn gyntaf ar y brycheuyn yn eich llygad chi.

### Safonau Addysgiadol yng Nghaerdydd Educational Standards in Cardiff

**Q3 Jonathan Morgan:** What steps does the First Minister and his Government intend taking to improve educational standards in Cardiff? (OAQ22130)

**C3 Jonathan Morgan:** Pa gamau y mae'r Prif Weinidog a'i Lywodraeth yn bwriadu'u cymryd i wella safonau addysgiadol yng Nghaerdydd? (OAQ22130)

**The First Minister:** Those are matters for the local authority, but I was pleased to note that Cardiff County Council has increased its schools budget by 8 per cent in the current financial year. That compares to a Welsh

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Materion i'r awdurdod lleol yw'r rhain, ond yr oeddwn yn falch o sylwi bod Cyngor Sir Caerdydd wedi cynyddu ei gyllideb ysgolion o 8 y cant yn y flwyddyn ariannol gyfredol. Mae hynny'n

increase of 6.9 per cent. That is a welcome step forward.

**Jonathan Morgan:** You may have noticed that Cardiff County Council intends to review its funding formula—that is, the means by which it allocates money to schools—in the future. You may also have noticed that schools in the north of the city, and in your own constituency, will lose tens of thousands of pounds from their future budget settlements as a result of that review. What representations have you made as First Minister and as the Assembly Member for Cardiff West to Cardiff County Council? What message would you send to the parents of the pupils who attend the schools that will be affected by the budget cuts?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Jonathan Morgan asked the First Minister to discourse upon his responsibilities as a Cardiff Assembly Member. We are always delighted to hear the First Minister discourse upon his responsibilities as First Minister, but he is not required to answer in this Chamber for what he does as an Assembly Member for Cardiff. If that were the case, we would all have to answer questions.

**The First Minister:** Jonathan is vigilant, but that let him down on 27 December. On that date the chair of the council's education committee, who is also the deputy mayor and has responsibility for education and children, wrote to local MPs, Assembly Members, chairs of governing bodies, councillors, and headteachers to advise that the LEA had decided to delay implementing any changes until all consultees had had sufficient time to examine the proposals. That decision took account of the fact that the Assembly Government intended to put in place new regulations for the 2004-05 financial year. Consultation will begin on those proposal later this month.

**Y Llywydd:** Cyn galw arweinydd yr wrthblaid, atgoffaf Aelodau mai am Gaerdydd y mae'r cwestiwn hwn felly ni

cymharu â chynnydd o 6.9 y cant yng Nghymru. Mae hynny'n gam ymlaen i'w groesawu.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Efallai y byddwch wedi sylwi bod Cyngor Sir Caerdydd yn bwriadu adolygu ei fformiwla gyllido—hynny yw, ei ddull o ddyrannu arian i ysgolion—yn y dyfodol. Efallai'ch bod wedi sylwi hefyd y bydd ysgolion yng ngogledd y ddinas, ac yn eich etholaeth chi, yn colli degau o filoedd o bunnoedd o'u setliadau cyllideb yn y dyfodol o ganlyniad i'r adolygiad hwnnw. Pa sylwadau yr ydych wedi'u cyflwyno fel Prif Weinidog ac fel yr Aelod Cynulliad dros Orllewin Caerdydd i Gyngor Sir Caerdydd? Pa neges a fydddech yn ei hanfon at rieni'r disgyblion sy'n derbyn eu haddysg yn yr ysgolion y bydd y toriadau yn y gyllideb yn effeithio arnynt?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Gofynnodd Jonathan Morgan i'r Prif Weinidog draethu ar ei gyfrifoldebau fel un o Aelodau'r Cynulliad dros Gaerdydd. Yr ydym wrth ein bodd bob amser o glywed y Prif Weinidog yn traethu ar ei gyfrifoldebau fel Prif Weinidog, ond nid yw'n ofynnol iddo fod yn atebol yn y Siambr hon am yr hyn a wnaiff fel un o Aelodau'r Cynulliad dros Gaerdydd. Os felly yr oedd, byddem oll yn gorfod ateb cwestiynau.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae Jonathan yn wylriadwrus, ond methodd ar 27 Rhagfyr. Ar y diwrnod hwnnw ysgrifennodd cadeirydd pwyllgor addysg y cyngor, sydd hefyd yn ddirprwy faer ac yn gyfrifol am addysg a phlant, at Aelodau Seneddol lleol, Aelodau Cynulliad, cadeiryddion cyrff llywodraethu, cynghorwyr, a phenaethiaid ysgol i roi gwybod bod yr awdurdod addysg lleol wedi penderfynu peidio â rhoi unrhyw newidiadau ar waith hyd nes y byddai pawb yr ymgynghorwyd â hwy wedi cael digon o amser i graffu ar y cynigion. Gwnaed y penderfyniad hwnnw yng ngolwg y ffaith bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn bwriadu rhoi rheoliadau newydd ar waith ar gyfer blwyddyn ariannol 2004-05. Dechreuir ymgynghori ar y cynigion hynny'n ddiweddarach y mis hwn.

**The Presiding Officer:** Before I call the leader of the opposition I remind Members that this is a question about Cardiff so I will

fyddaf yn derbyn cwestiwn am Gaergybi nac unrhyw fan arall i'r gogledd o Gaerdydd.

not accept questions about Holyhead or any other point to the north of Cardiff.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** You addressed in your response to Jonathan Morgan the educational standards in Cardiff schools. Cardiff also has a famous university. That university is presently the only Welsh university that has indicated that, as one of the 19 elite universities in the UK, it would like to charge extra fees. Government policy in relation to top-up fees in Wales is unclear. Peter Hain has been telling us one thing and Jane Davidson has been telling us another. Is it your policy to allow Cardiff university to charge extra fees for students in 2006?

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Gwnaethoch gyfeirio yn eich ymateb i Jonathan Morgan at y safonau addysgol yn ysgolion Caerdydd. Mae gan Gaerdydd brifysgol enwog hefyd. Ar hyn o bryd, y brifysgol honno yw'r unig un yng Nghymru a nododd, fel un o'r 19 o brifysgolion gorau yn y DU, y carai godi ffioedd ychwanegol. Mae polisi'r Llywodraeth o ran ffioedd ychwanegol yng Nghymru'n aneglur. Bu Peter Hain yn dweud un peth wrthym a Jane Davidson yn dweud peth arall. Ai'ch polisi chi yw gadael i brifysgol Caerdydd godi ffioedd ychwanegol ar fyfyrwyr yn 2006?

2.20 p.m.

**The First Minister:** As far as I am aware, Cardiff University is the only Welsh university that is a member of the Russell Group of Universities. Two Scottish universities are also members, but the overwhelming majority are English universities. Those universities are thought likely to make use of the ability to charge fees of up to £3,000 set out in the White Paper announced by Charles Clarke a week last Wednesday. We are currently weighing up the pros and cons in terms of transferring functions over student maintenance from Whitehall to Wales. We will come back with a clear proposal once we have done that and know what resources will be required to accompany the transfer of responsibility for student support to Wales. I hope to be able to report back to the Assembly on that soon. However, we first need to carry out that exercise properly, so that the necessary resources accompany the functions transferred, whatever they may be.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Hyd y gwn i, Prifysgol Caerdydd yw'r unig brifysgol yng Nghymru sy'n aelod o Grŵp Prifysgolion Russell. Mae dwy brifysgol yn yr Alban yn aelodau hefyd, ond mae'r mwyafrif llethol yn brifysgolion yn Lloegr. Tybir bod y prifysgolion hynny'n debygol o ddefnyddio'r gallu i godi ffioedd o hyd at £3,000 a nodir yn y Papur Gwyn a gyhoeddodd Charles Clarke wythnos i ddydd Mercher diwethaf. Ar hyn o bryd yr ydym yn pwysu a mesur y manteision a'r anfanteision o ran trosglwyddo swyddogaethau dros gynnal myfyrwyr o Whitehall i Gymru. Deuwn yn ôl â chynnig pendant wedi inni wneud hynny a chael gwybod pa adnoddau y bydd eu hangen i gyd-fynd â throsglwyddo cyfrifoldeb dros gymorth i fyfyrwyr i Gymru. Gobeithiaf allu adrodd yn ôl i'r Cynulliad ar hynny cyn hir. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gyflawni'r gorchwyl hwnnw'n briodol yn gyntaf, fel bod yr adnoddau angenrheidiol yn dod gyda'r swyddogaethau a drosglwyddir, beth bynnag a fyddant.

#### **Gwelyau mewn Cartrefi Gofal Provision of Care Home Beds**

**Q4 Janet Ryder:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the provision of care home beds in north-east Wales? (OAQ22132)

**C4 Janet Ryder:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar y gwelyau mewn cartrefi gofal a ddarperir yn y Gogledd-ddwyrain? (OAQ22132)

**The First Minister:** Local authorities are responsible for planning and commissioning

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Awdurdodau lleol sy'n gyfrifol am gynllunio a chomisiynu

care services, and have a duty to ensure that appropriate care services are provided for those who are assessed as needing care. Those services include residential care, domiciliary care and care provided with housing. Between April 2002 and January 2003, some 13 care homes closed and two opened in the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales's north-east region. Along with variations in the number of beds registered in existing care homes, those closures have meant the loss of 210 beds. However, none of those closures were the result of enforcement action taken by the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales.

**Janet Ryder:** One main reason why care homes in the private residential and nursing sector are closing is the low level of fees paid to them. When will your Government address the low level of fees paid to residential and nursing homes?

**The First Minister:** We are not sure that it is a matter of fees. We accept the information provided to us by the Care Homes Forum, and we accept the view of local authorities. There are always some clashes. One or two local authorities take a harder line and tend to fall out more with their local care homes than other authorities do. There was a problem in Swansea a year or so ago, and I am aware of recent comments made by Mario Kreft on behalf of the Care Homes Forum in the Wrexham area. After the process of contesting the proper level of fees, there is usually agreement, which means that people can continue to provide excellent and affordable care in care homes. However, it is a difficult issue.

**David Ian Jones:** While one understands that some councils take a harder line than others, do you not agree that, in providing support for those in care homes, councils should try to achieve a level playing field as far as possible? Will you join me in deploring the fact that the basic rate of support for residents of council-run care homes in Flintshire is £303 per week, compared to £252 for private homes? The equivalent figures in Wrexham are £308 and £245 respectively. Will you urge both councils to

gwasanaethau gofal, ac maent o dan ddyletswydd i sicrhau y caiff gwasanaethau gofal priodol eu darparu ar gyfer y rhai yr asesir bod angen gofal arnynt. Mae'r gwasanaethau hynny'n cynnwys gofal preswyl, gofal yn y cartref a gofal a ddarperir gyda thai. Rhwng Ebrill 2002 ac Ionawr 2003, caeodd rhyw 13 o gartrefi gofal ac agorwyd dau yn rhanbarth gogledd-ddwyrain Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru. Gyda'r amrywiadau yn nifer y gwelyau sydd wedi'u cofrestru yn y cartrefi gofal presennol, mae cau'r cartrefi hynny wedi golygu colli 210 o welyau. Fodd bynnag, nid oedd yr un o'r cartrefi hynny wedi cau o ganlyniad i gamau gorfodi gan Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru.

**Janet Ryder:** Un o'r prif resymau y mae cartrefi gofal yn y sector cartrefi preswyl a nyrsio preifat yn cau yw lefel isel y ffioedd a delir iddynt. Pa bryd y gwnaiff eich Llywodraeth roi sylw i'r lefel isel o ffioedd a delir i gartrefi preswyl a nyrsio?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid ydym yn sicr mai ffioedd yw'r rheswm. Derbyniwn y wybodaeth a gawn gan y Fforwm Cartrefi Gofal, a derbyniwn farn awdurdodau lleol. Mae rhywfaint o wrthdaro bob amser. Mae un neu ddau o'r awdurdodau lleol yn sefyll yn fwy di-ildio ac yn tueddu i anghytuno'n fwy â'u cartrefi gofal lleol nag y mae awdurdodau eraill. Bu problem yn Abertawe tua blwyddyn yn ôl, a gwn am sylwadau a wnaed yn ddiweddar gan Mario Kreft ar ran y Fforwm Cartrefi Gofal yn ardal Wrecsam. Ar ôl o broses o drafod y lefel briodol o ffioedd, ceir cytundeb fel arfer, a golyga hynny y gall pobl barhau i ddarparu gofal rhagorol a fforddiadwy mewn cartrefi gofal. Er hynny, mae'n fater anodd.

**David Ian Jones:** Er deall bod rhai cynghorau'n sefyll yn fwy di-ildio nag eraill, onid ydych yn cytuno y dylai cynghorau geisio sicrhau cymaint o chwarae teg ag y bo modd wrth roi cymorth i'r rhai mewn cartrefi gofal? A wnewch ymuno â mi i resynu at y ffaith bod cyfradd sylfaenol y cymorth i breswylwyr cartrefi gofal sy'n cael eu rhedeg gan y cyngor yn Sir y Fflint yn £303 yr wythnos, o'i gymharu â £252 ar gyfer cartrefi preifat? Y ffigurau cyfatebol yn Wrecsam yw £308 a £245 yn y drefn honno. A wnewch

ensure that residents in private care homes receive financial support equivalent to those in council-run homes? [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Hear, hear.']

annog y ddau gyngor i sicrhau bod preswylwyr mewn cartrefi gofal preifat yn cael yr un maint o gymorth ariannol â rhai mewn cartrefi sy'n cael eu rhedeg gan y cyngor? [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'Clywch, clywch.']

**The First Minister:** We can hear the Care Home Forum lobby at work in the noises off. This is a difficult issue. What are you trying to achieve? Are you trying to achieve a level playing field between those in residential care and those in domiciliary care? As far as I know, the official policy of the Conservative Party in the Assembly and in Westminster, and of the other parties here, is that if domiciliary care packages can be organised, that is better than residential care, provided that it is right for the person concerned. The same holds true for nursing care. We try to ensure that funding is available to provide what patients need. In terms of comparing the situation of those in local authority homes and those in private care homes, other regulations concerning pocket money and so on mean that there is not a level playing field at present. We are always willing to listen to advice, but the overwhelming majority of homes in Wales will not be provided by councils, and therefore the case mix may well be different, because council homes may take people whom private residential care homes would not take. I do not know. Until you know whether the case mix is the same, you cannot make that monetary comparison. It may not be relevant, because the case mix may be different.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gallwn glywed lobi'r Fforwm Cartrefi Gofal ar waith yn y sŵn y tu ôl. Mae hyn yn fater anodd. Beth yr ydych yn ceisio'i gyflawni? A ydych yn ceisio sicrhau cyfartaledd rhwng y rhai mewn gofal preswyl a'r rhai mewn gofal yn y cartref? Hyd y gwn i, polisi swyddogol y Blaid Geidwadol yn y Cynulliad ac yn San Steffan, a'r pleidiau eraill sydd yma, yw, os gellir trefnu pecynnau gofal cartref, fod hynny'n well na gofal preswyl, ar yr amod ei fod yn iawn i'r person dan sylw. Mae'r un peth yn wir am ofal nyrzio. Ceisiwn sicrhau bod cyllid ar gael i ddarparu'r hyn y mae ar gleifion ei angen. O ran cymharu sefyllfa'r rhai mewn cartrefi awdurdod lleol a'r rhai mewn cartrefi gofal preifat, mae rheoliadau eraill ynghylch arian poced ac yn y blaen yn golygu nad oes cyfartaledd ar hyn o bryd. Yr ydym bob amser yn barod i wrando ar eiriau o gyngor, ond nid y cynghorau sy'n darparu'r mwyafrif llethol o gartrefi yng Nghymru, ac felly gallai'r cymysgedd achosion fod yn wahanol, gan y gallai cartrefi cyngor dderbyn pobl na fyddai cartrefi gofal preswyl preifat yn eu derbyn. Nid wyf yn gwybod. Hyd nes y gwyddoch a yw'r cymysgedd achosion yr un fath, ni allwch wneud y gymhariaeth ariannol honno. Mae'n bosibl nad yw'n berthnasol, oherwydd gallai'r cymysgedd achosion fod yn wahanol.

### **Gweithgarwch Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru yn Sir Gaerfyrddin Welsh Development Agency Activity in Carmarthenshire**

**Q5 Helen Mary Jones:** What discussions has the First Minister had with the Minister for Economic Development with regard to WDA activity in Carmarthenshire? (OAQ22135)

**C5 Helen Mary Jones:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cael gyda'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd ynghylch gweithgarwch Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru yn Sir Gaerfyrddin? (OAQ22135)

**The First Minister:** I have regular discussions with the Minister for Economic Development about economic development issues facing Wales as a whole and Carmarthenshire in particular. I also discuss these matters frequently with the chair and

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Caf drafodaethau rheolaidd â'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd ynghylch materion datblygu economaidd sy'n wynebu Cymru gyfan a Sir Gaerfyrddin yn benodol. Yr wyf hefyd yn trafod y materion hyn yn aml gyda

chief executive of the Welsh Development Agency.

**Helen Mary Jones:** You will be aware of an application for support that caused me, and others in my constituency, concern. That application has taken over a year to process, and we have already lost 150 potential jobs. I understand that a final decision is likely to be made today, and I do not want you to comment on the merits of the application itself. However, do you think that taking a year to process a relatively simple application is acceptable? Most of us would regard that as a dismal performance. Are you prepared to set and monitor targets in terms of the time taken to process applications for support in order to avoid this happening again? Although, given the Government's progress on targets such as waiting lists, perhaps setting such targets would not be that helpful.

**The First Minister:** That rant is based on a simple, ghastly factual error on your part, namely your claim that this application was 'relatively simple'. The application was anything but 'relatively simple'. It is one of the most complex regional selective assistance applications that the Welsh Assembly Government has faced in a long time. If it had been simple, it would have been processed quickly; it was because it was not simple that it has taken a long time. I am sure that you would not want us to authorise the expenditure of large sums of public money without due diligence. It is ensuring due diligence in terms of this application that has taken the time.

chadeirydd a phrif weithredwr Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Byddwch yn gwybod am gais am gymorth sydd wedi peri pryder i mi, ac i eraill yn fy etholaeth. Cymerwyd dros flwyddyn i brosesu'r cais hwnnw, ac yr ydym eisoes wedi colli 150 o swyddi posibl. Deallaf fod penderfyniad terfynol yn debygol o gael ei wneud heddiw, ac nid wyf am ichi wneud sylw am rinweddau'r cais ei hun. Fodd bynnag, a ydych yn credu ei bod yn dderbyniol cymryd blwyddyn i brosesu cais cymharol syml? Byddai'r rhan fwyaf ohonom yn ystyried bod hynny'n berfformiad truenus. A ydych yn barod i bennu a monitro targedau ynghylch yr amser a gymerir i brosesu ceisiadau am gymorth er mwyn osgoi digwyddiad o'r fath eto? Er hynny, o ystyried y cynnydd y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei wneud ar dargedau fel y rhai ar gyfer rhestrau aros, efallai na fyddai gosod targedau o'r fath yn fawr o gymorth.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r truth hwnnw'n seiliedig ar gamgymeriad ffeithiol syml ac ofnadwy ar eich rhan chi, sef eich honiad bod y cais hwn yn 'gymharol syml'. Yr oedd y cais ymhell o fod yn 'gymharol syml'. Mae'n un o'r ceisiadau mwyaf cymhleth am gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi'i wynebu ers talwm. Pe buasai'n syml, byddai wedi'i brosesu'n gyflym; am nad ydoedd yn syml y cymerodd gyfnod hir. Yr wyf yn siŵr na fydddech yn dymuno inni awdurdodi gwario symiau mawr o arian cyhoeddus heb astudrwydd priodol. Sicrhau astudrwydd priodol yng nghyd-destun y cais hwn sydd wedi cymryd amser.

#### **Amddifadedd ac Anghyfartaledd Cymdeithasol (Canol De Cymru) Social Deprivation and Inequality (South Wales Central)**

**Q6 Owen John Thomas:** What plans does your Government have to eradicate social deprivation and inequality among the residents of South Wales Central? (OAQ22131)

**The First Minister:** I am concerned that areas of South Wales Central suffer from significant levels of deprivation and inequality. Some of those areas are located in

**C6 Owen John Thomas:** Pa gamau sydd gan eich Llywodraeth mewn golwg i ddileu amddifadedd ac anghyfartaledd cymdeithasol ymhlith trigolion Canol De Cymru? (OAQ22131)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn bryderus bod rhai rhannau o Ganol De Cymru yn profi amddifadedd ac anghyfartaledd sylweddol. Mae rhai o'r ardaloedd hynny ger yr arfordir,

the coastal belt, and are being addressed by Communities First. Some of them are located in the Valleys, and there are a large number of Communities First designations in the Valleys area of South Wales Central. Of the 142 Communities First projects in Wales, 24 are in South Wales Central. The most fundamental means of resolving social deprivation and poverty is to increase the number of jobs available, and I am sure that you will want to welcome the fact that there has been a net increase of 16,000 in employment in South Wales Central in the year up to November 2002.

**Owen John Thomas:** You will know that many jobs are not well paid, particularly those in call centres. Many young people who were born and bred in Cardiff, as were their parents, cannot afford to buy homes here. Over 8,000 people are on the waiting list for social housing in Cardiff. What are you doing to help local authorities tackle this burgeoning problem, which is a key facet of deprivation?

**The First Minister:** There is no real expectation in the short term of being able to resume large-scale municipal house building. There is small-scale building by housing associations, which we fund to try to solve some of the problems of homelessness in the Cardiff area, which, unfortunately, tends to be a hotspot for homelessness.

The other phenomenon that you have described, of people from Cardiff no longer being able to afford homes here, is probably quite natural. That has been the case throughout my lifetime, and certainly over the last 40 years. Whenever there is a house-price boom in Cardiff, people tend to move 10 or 20 miles up the Valleys to search out cheaper properties. That is perhaps a natural process that we can do nothing about. That means additional commuters, but at least it solves the problem of where people live in the short term when there is a house-price boom, as there is every 20 years.

**Jonathan Morgan:** You will be aware that a wealth of evidence suggests that children from socially deprived areas face particular

ac maent yn derbyn sylw drwy Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Mae rhai ohonynt yn y Cymoedd, ac mae nifer fawr o ardaloedd wedi'u dynodi o dan Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn ardal y Cymoedd yng Nghanol De Cymru. O blith y 142 o brosiectau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yng Nghymru, mae 24 yng Nghanol De Cymru. Y dull mwyaf sylfaenol o ddatrys amddifadedd cymdeithasol a thlodi yw cynyddu nifer y swyddi sydd ar gael, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch am groesawu'r ffaith bod cynnydd net o 16,000 mewn cyflogaeth yng Nghanol De Cymru yn y flwyddyn hyd fis Tachwedd 2002.

**Owen John Thomas:** Gwyddoch fod llawer o swyddi nad oes tâl da ar eu cyfer, yn enwedig y rhai mewn canolfannau galwadau. Mae llawer o bobl ifanc a gafodd eu geni a'u magu yng Nghaerdydd, fel y cawsai eu rhieni, na allant fforddio tai yma. Mae mwy nag 8,000 o bobl ar y rhestr aros am dai cymdeithasol yng Nghaerdydd. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i helpu awdurdodau lleol i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem gynyddol hon, sy'n agwedd allweddol ar amddifadedd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid oes disgwyl gwirioneddol y bydd modd aildddechrau codi tai cyngor ar raddfa eang yn y tymor byr. Ceir adeiladu gan gymdeithasau tai ar raddfa fach, a ariannir gennym i geisio datrys rhai o'r problemau o ran digartrefedd yn ardal Caerdydd, sydd, gwaetha'r modd, yn tueddu i fod â nifer uchel o bobl ddigartref.

Mae'r ffenomen arall yr ydych wedi'i disgrifio, sef bod pobl o Gaerdydd yn methu â fforddio tai yma bellach, yn un eithaf naturiol, yn ôl pob tebyg. Felly y bu ar hyd fy oes, a thros y 40 mlynedd diwethaf yn sicr. Pryd bynnag y ceir ymchwydd ym mhrisiau tai yng Nghaerdydd, mae pobl yn tueddu i symud 10 neu 20 milltir i fyny'r Cymoedd i chwilio am dai rhatach. Efallai fod hynny'n broses naturiol na allwn wneud dim yn ei chylch. Mae hynny'n golygu y ceir rhagor o gymudwyr, ond o leiaf y mae'n datrys y broblem o ran lle y mae pobl yn byw yn y tymor byr pan geir ymchwydd ym mhrisiau tai, fel y ceir bob 20 mlynedd.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod toreth o dystiolaeth sy'n awgrymu bod plant o ardaloedd cymdeithasol

challenges when it comes to their schooling. They find it more difficult to succeed in school than perhaps their friends and colleagues from slightly wealthier areas. There are schools in Cardiff that attempt to meet those challenges. In future, they will find it difficult to do that, because of your party's review of Cardiff's funding formula. First Minister, how will schools in certain parts of the city be able to meet the challenge of combating social deprivation if your party reduces the amount of money available to them?

2.30 p.m.

**The First Minister:** I am somewhat baffled as to what you are trying to claim. You were implying some 20 minutes ago that you were in favour of Cardiff schools that were well funded—in parts of my constituency and in Cardiff North—maintaining their significant level of extra funding. Now you are saying that the formula should be revised so that schools with the greatest need should get additional money. You cannot have it both ways, Jonathan.

I agree with the principle that need, not just numbers, should determine how much money local authorities give to schools. There is also the question of whether we should meet the cost of actual teacher salaries instead of average teacher salaries. Some schools have many experienced teachers who are at the top of the salary scale, and therefore have financial difficulties, while schools with many new teachers, who are at the bottom of the salary scale, are well funded as a result. To get away from that, we must encourage local authorities to revise their formulas. New guidelines are being produced. In answer to your earlier question, I said that we would be consulting on a new guidance note to assist local authorities in setting the formula. Ultimately, the local authorities must revise the formula. I am sure that they will take account of the comments made today.

ddifreintiedig yn wynebu heriau penodol o ran addysg. Fe'i cânt yn fwy anodd llwyddo yn yr ysgol, o bosibl, na'u ffrindiau a'u cyddisgyblion o ardaloedd sydd ychydig yn fwy cefnog. Ceir ysgolion yng Nghaerdydd sy'n ceisio ateb yr heriau hynny. Yn y dyfodol, byddant yn ei chael yn fwy anodd gwneud hynny, oherwydd adolygiad eich plaid chi o fformiwla gyllido Caerdydd. Brif Weinidog, sut y bydd ysgolion mewn rhai rhannau o'r ddinas yn gallu ateb yr her o ymladd amddifadedd cymdeithasol os yw'ch plaid chi'n lleihau'r swm o arian sydd ar gael iddynt?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf mewn penbleth braidd ynghylch yr hyn yr ydych yn ceisio'i honni. Yr oeddech yn awgrymu tua 20 munud yn ôl eich bod yn credu y dylai ysgolion yng Nghaerdydd sy'n cael eu cyllido'n dda—mewn rhannau o'm hetholaeth i ac yng Ngogledd Caerdydd—gael cadw'r cyllid ychwanegol sylweddol sydd ganddynt. Yn awr yr ydych yn dweud y dylid adolygu'r fformiwla fel bod yr ysgolion mwyaf anghenus yn cael arian ychwanegol. Ni allwch ei chael bob ffordd, Jonathan.

Cytunaf â'r egwyddor mai angen, nid niferoedd yn unig, a ddylai bennu pa faint o arian y mae awdurdodau lleol yn ei roi i ysgolion. Mae angen ystyried hefyd a ddylem dalu am wir gostau cyflogau athrawon yn hytrach na chyfartaledd cyflogau athrawon. Mae gan rai ysgolion lawer o athrawon profiadol sydd ar ben y raddfa gyflogau, ac yn profi anawsterau ariannol o'r herwydd, tra bo ysgolion sydd â llawer o athrawon newydd, sydd ar waelod y raddfa gyflogau, yn cael eu cyllido'n dda o ganlyniad. Er mwyn symud oddi wrth hynny, rhaid inni annog awdurdodau lleol i adolygu eu fformiwlâu. Mae canllawiau newydd yn cael eu paratoi. I ateb eich cwestiwn cynharach, dywedais y byddem yn ymgynghori ar nodyn cyfarwyddyd newydd i helpu awdurdodau lleol i osod y fformiwla. Yn y pen draw, yr awdurdodau lleol a fydd yn gorfod adolygu'r fformiwla. Yr wyf yn sicr yr ystyriant y sylwadau a wnaed heddiw.



**Gwasanaethau Rheilffordd yn Etholaeth Ogwr  
Rail Services in the Ogmore Constituency**

**Q7 Janice Gregory:** What action is the First Minister's Government taking to improve rail services in the Ogmore constituency? (OAQ22126)

**The First Minister:** Sue Essex, the Minister with responsibility for transport, announced on 30 January the Assembly transport grant allocations for the year commencing 1 April 2003. Grants were announced for design and survey work for a new station at Brackla; preparatory works for a Maesteg passing loop to increase service frequency on the Llynfi valley line; and the provision of a new station at Llanharan. The provision at Llanharan is, however, dependent upon the Strategic Rail Authority ratifying a consultant's report on train timetabling issues: nobody wants local stopping trains to reduce the speed of the high-speed services on the Great Western main line between Swansea and Cardiff.

**Janice Gregory:** I welcome last week's announcement on the latest transport grant settlement. My constituents in Llanharan and Bryncae will welcome the money for the new station, and the money for the passing loop on the Maesteg line is also welcome. On Llanharan, given the recent problems with the SRA, will you do all that you can to ensure that the SRA addresses the timetabling issues that you mentioned so that, when there is a station in Llanharan, it will be well served?

**The First Minister:** Absolutely. Everybody can understand why you would want stopping services on the Cardiff to Bridgend section of the main line. However, if you have too many and do not have the right signalling, they will slow down the services on the main line or will run at inconvenient times. Reconciling the demands of high-speed and stopping trains is not easy and we hope that the consultant's report will propose solutions to the SRA.

**C7 Janice Gregory:** Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth y Prif Weinidog yn eu cymryd i wella gwasanaethau rheilffordd yn etholaeth Ogwr? (OAQ22126)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gwnaeth Sue Essex, y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am drafnidiaeth, gyhoeddi ar 30 Ionawr y dyraniadau o grantiau trafnidiaeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer y flwyddyn sy'n dechrau ar 1 Ebrill 2003. Cyhoeddwyd grantiau am waith dylunio a mesur ar gyfer gorsaf newydd yn Brackla; gwaith paratoi ar gyfer llinell osgoi ym Maes-teg er mwyn cael gwasanaeth amlach ar reilffordd cwm Llynfi; a darparu gorsaf newydd yn Llanharan. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ddarpariaeth yn Llanharan yn amodol ar gael cadarnhad gan yr Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol ar adroddiad gan ymgynghorydd ar faterion amserlennu trenau: nid oes neb am i drenau sy'n stopio'n lleol arafu'r gwasanaethau cyflym ar brif linell y Great Western rhwng Abertawe a Chaerdydd.

**Janice Gregory:** Croesawaf y cyhoeddiad yr wythnos diwethaf am y setliad grantiau trafnidiaeth diweddaraf. Bydd fy etholwyr yn Llanharan a Bryn-cae yn croesawu'r arian ar gyfer yr orsaf newydd, ac mae croeso hefyd i'r arian ar gyfer y llinell osgoi ar reilffordd Maes-teg. Ynghylch Llanharan, yng ngolwg y problemau diweddar o ran yr Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol, a wnewch bopeth a allwch i sicrhau bod yr awdurdod yn ymdrin â'r materion amserlennu y cyfeiriasoch atynt fel y bydd yr orsaf yn Llanharan, pan geir hi, yn cael ei gwasanaethu'n dda?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn hollol. Gall pawb ddeall pam y dymunir cael gwasanaethau sy'n stopio ar y rhan o'r brif reilffordd rhwng Caerdydd a Phen-y-bont ar Ogwr. Fodd bynnag, os ceir gormod ohonynt, ac os nad oes signalau priodol, byddant yn arafu'r gwasanaethau ar y brif reilffordd neu'n rhedeg ar adegau anghyfleus. Nid yw'n hawdd cysoni gofynion trenau cyflym a rhai sy'n stopio a gobeithiwn y bydd adroddiad yr ymgynghorydd yn cynnig atebion i'r awdurdod.

**Janet Davies:** You will be aware that the Llanilid development of film studios, a leisure complex and a theme park and so on, is near Llanharan. It is expected that 25 per cent of the people taking up the planned 3,400 new jobs there will travel by public transport. Therefore, will you provide further assurance that any plans concerning Llanharan railway station taken forward by your Government will give full consideration to the possible number of people travelling to work through it?

**The First Minister:** That is a sensible suggestion and I am sure that it will be incorporated into the SRA's final decision. I am not an expert on railway signalling, however, common sense tells me that there is a problem. If you have trains travelling at 100 mph to Bridgend, and have to slot in not only the freight services, but also stopping services at Llanharan, Pen-coed and so on, then signalling and frequency issues must be reconciled to avoid clashes. When we have the report, and when the SRA has given an appropriate response, I am sure that we will want to urge it to take into account the potential demand created if and when the Dragon International Studios Ltd park development at Llanilid gets underway and starts to employ the numbers of people that you mentioned.

**Janet Davies:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod y datblygiad o stiwdios ffilm, cyfadeilad hamdden a pharc thema ac yn y blaen yn Llanilid, yn agos i Lanharan. Disgwylir y bydd 25 y cant o'r rhai sy'n ymgymryd â'r 3,400 swydd newydd arfaethedig yno'n teithio ar drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus. Gan hynny, a wnewch roi sicrwydd pellach y bydd unrhyw gynlluniau sy'n ymwneud â gorsaf reilffordd Llanharan a weithredir gan eich Llywodraeth yn ystyried yn llawn y nifer o bobl a allai deithio i'w gwaith drwyddi?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hwnnw'n awgrym synhwyrol ac yr wyf yn siŵr y caiff ei ymgorffori ym mhenderfyniad terfynol yr Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol. Er nad wyf yn arbenigwr ar signalau rheilffyrdd, mae synnwyr cyffredin yn dweud wrthyf fod problem. Os oes trenau sy'n teithio ar 100 milltir yr awr i Ben-y-bont ar Ogwr, ac sy'n gorfod ffitio rhwng y gwasanaethau trenau nwyddau yn ogystal â'r gwasanaethau sy'n stopio yn Llanharan, Pen-coed ac yn y blaen, rhaid cysoni materion sy'n ymwneud â signalau ac amllder er mwyn peidio â chael gwrthdaro. Pan fydd yr adroddiad gennym, a phan fydd yr awdurdod wedi rhoi ymateb priodol, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwn am ei gymell i ystyried y galw posibl a greir os bydd y datblygiad parc gan Dragon International Studios Cyf. yn Llanilid yn mynd rhagddo ac yn dechrau cyflogi'r niferoedd y cyfeiriasoch atynt.

### **Cynllun Cefnffordd Maes Awyr Rhyngwladol Caerdydd Trunk Road Scheme for Cardiff International Airport**

**Q8 David Melding:** What meetings has the First Minister had with organisations regarding the effects on economic development of a trunk road scheme for Cardiff international airport? (OAQ22148)

**The First Minister:** The Assembly recognises that Cardiff international airport and its continued development is crucial to economic growth in south Wales. As part of our 2002 'Review of Trunk Roads', the public was consulted on proposals for the network, including a trunk road to the airport. The responses will be submitted to Sue

**C8 David Melding:** Pa gyfarfodydd y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cael gyda sefydliadau ynghylch effeithiau cynllun cefnffordd maes awyr rhyngwladol Caerdydd ar ddatblygu economaidd? (OAQ22148)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r Cynulliad yn cydnabod bod maes awyr rhyngwladol Caerdydd a'r parhad yn ei ddatblygiad yn hollbwysig i dwf economaidd yn y De. Fel rhan o'n 'Adolygiad o'r Cefnffyrdd' yn 2002, ymgynghorwyd â'r cyhoedd ar gynigion ar gyfer y rhwydwaith, a oedd yn cynnwys cefnffordd i'r maes awyr. Cyflwynir yr

Essex, the Minister for Environment, later this month. Sue Essex meets Jon Horne, the managing director of Cardiff international airport, and representatives of the Confederation of British Industry, regularly to discuss these and other matters, and she keeps me well informed. I will meet Digby Jones, director general of the CBI, on 21 February and, knowing his trenchant views on this, it is likely that the matter will be raised.

**David Melding:** First Minister, a range of bodies, including the CBI, has called for this road to be built and become a trunk road scheme. Do you not agree that, until that road is in place, speculation about a Severnside airport will continue, to the detriment of those seeking to develop Cardiff international airport? That will adversely affect the economy of South Wales Central.

**The First Minister:** You are making bricks without straw, David; that is way over the top. Cardiff international airport's progress depends on the general prosperity of the airline industry and on the success of bmibaby as the key operator there, following British Airways' withdrawal. It must ensure that passengers can easily and successfully access the 20 or so destinations that the airport will soon serve. This successful development has occurred without any commitment on our part. That does not mean that we should not consider the issue. However, I do not think that you should make any connection between that and the proposal for an airport at Severnside; no-one would sensibly say that there will always be speculation about building an airport at Severnside until a trunk road is built to Cardiff international airport.

ymatebion i Sue Essex, y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, yn ddiweddarach y mis hwn. Mae Sue Essex yn cwrdd yn rheolaidd â Jon Horne, rheolwr gyfarwyddwr maes awyr rhyngwladol Caerdydd, a chynrychiolwyr Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain, i drafod y materion hyn ac eraill, ac mae'n fy hysbysu'n llawn am yr hyn sy'n digwydd. Byddaf yn cwrdd â Digby Jones, cyfarwyddwr cyffredinol y cydffederasiwn, ar 21 Chwefror ac, o wybod am ei farn bendant am hyn, mae'r mater hwn yn debygol o gael ei godi.

**David Melding:** Brif Weinidog, mae amryw o gyrff, gan gynnwys Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain, wedi galw am adeiladu'r ffordd hon a'i gwneud yn gynllun cefnffordd. Onid ydych yn cytuno, hyd nes y bydd y ffordd honno wedi'i hagar, y bydd y dyfalu ynghylch maes awyr yng Nglannau Hafren yn parhau, er anfantais i'r rhai sy'n ceisio datblygu maes awyr rhyngwladol Caerdydd? Bydd hynny'n niweidiol i economi Canol De Cymru.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych yn gwneud priddfeini heb wellt, David; mae hynny'n mynd dros ben llestri. Mae cynnydd maes awyr rhyngwladol Caerdydd yn dibynnu ar ffyniant cyffredinol y diwydiant cwmnïau awyrennau ac ar lwyddiant bmibaby fel y prif weithredwr yno, ar ôl ymadawiad British Airways. Rhaid iddo sicrhau bod teithwyr yn gallu cyrraedd yr 20 o gyrchfannau, fwy neu lai, y bydd y maes awyr yn eu gwasanaethu cyn hir, yn rhwydd ac yn llwyddiannus. Cafwyd y datblygiad llwyddiannus hwn heb unrhyw ymrwymiad ar ein rhan ni. Nid yw hynny'n golygu na ddylem ystyried y mater. Er hynny, ni chredaf y dylech wneud unrhyw gysylltiad rhwng hynny a'r cynllun ar gyfer maes awyr yng Nglannau Hafren; ni fyddai'n ddoeth i neb ddweud y bydd dyfalu o hyd ynghylch adeiladu maes awyr yng Nglannau Hafren hyd nes y gwneir cefnffordd i faes awyr rhyngwladol Caerdydd.

### **Pobl Ifanc a Gwleidyddiaeth** **Young People and Politics**

**Q9 Eleanor Burnham:** What is being done to encourage young people to get involved in the political process in Wales? (OAQ22133)

**C9 Eleanor Burnham:** Beth sy'n cael ei wneud i annog pobl ifanc i fod yn rhan o'r broses wleidyddol yng Nghymru?

(OAQ22133)

**The First Minister:** The Welsh Assembly Government is keen to encourage young people to take part in decision-making because we hope that it will lead them to take a greater interest in citizenship and politics. We have the Funky Dragon scheme, with which you are probably familiar, which is the children and young people's Assembly for Wales, children and young people's fora at local authority level, and a commitment to have school councils in every primary and secondary school.

**Eleanor Burnham:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats believe in reducing the voting age to 16, as recently recommended for council elections in a Scottish Parliament report. First Minister, do you agree that it is inconsistent that 16-year-olds, who have to pay tax and fight for their country, are denied the right to vote, which could help to engage them in the political process and enhance democracy?

**The First Minister:** I have some sympathy with that point of view, but I will have to take further advice on the matter, as there is no formal proposal before us in that regard. However, I have considerable sympathy with those arguments.

**William Graham:** Do you agree, First Minister, that including the teaching of citizenship and community values in the curriculum would have a greater impact on involving younger people in the political process in Wales than would lowering the voting age?

**The First Minister:** Those measures are not necessarily mutually exclusive, and your suggestion is one proposal in the Welsh baccalaureate that is currently being piloted. It involves considerably increasing and improving participation in citizenship. Citizenship cannot necessarily be taught by talk-and-chalk methods; participation and community involvement is what teaches that lesson. It is more of a show-and-tell than a talk-and-chalk teaching method that is required. That is the best way forward in

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn awyddus i annog pobl ifanc i gymryd rhan mewn penderfynu gan ein bod yn gobeithio y bydd hynny'n peri iddynt ymddiddori'n fwy mewn dinasyddiaeth a gwleidyddiaeth. Mae'r cynllun Draig Ffyni gennym, y byddwch yn gyfarwydd ag ef, yn ôl pob tebyg, sef y Cynulliad i blant a phobl ifanc yng Nghymru, fforymau plant a phobl ifanc ar lefel yr awdurdodau lleol, ac ymrwymiad i gael cynghorau ysgol ym mhob ysgol gynradd ac uwchradd.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn credu y dylid gostwng yr oed pleidleisio i 16, fel yr argymhellwyd yn ddiweddar ar gyfer etholiadau i gynghorau mewn adroddiad gan Senedd yr Alban. Brif Weinidog, a ydych yn cytuno ei bod yn anghyson nad yw rhai 16 mlwydd oed, sy'n gorfod talu trethi ac ymladd dros eu gwlad, yn cael yr hawl i bleidleisio, a allai helpu i'w cynnwys yn y broses wleidyddol a hybu democratiaeth?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae gennyf beth cydymdeimlad â'r safbwynt hwnnw, ond bydd yn rhaid imi gymryd cyngor pellach ar y mater, gan nad oes cynnig ffurfiol ger ein bron yn hynny o beth. Er hynny, mae gennyf gryn gydymdeimlad â'r dadleuon hynny.

**William Graham:** A gytunwch, Brif Weinidog, y byddai cynnwys dysgu am ddinasyddiaeth a gwerthoedd cymunedol yn y cwricwlwm yn cael mwy o effaith o ran cynnwys pobl iau yn y broses wleidyddol yng Nghymru nag y byddai gostwng yr oed pleidleisio?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid yw'r mesurau hynny'n annibynnol ar ei gilydd o reidrwydd, ac mae eich awgrym yn un cynnig o fewn y fagloriaeth Gymreig sy'n cael ei rhagbrofi ar hyn o bryd. Mae'n golygu cynnydd a gwelliant sylweddol yn y cyfranogiad mewn dinasyddiaeth. Ni ellir dysgu dinasyddiaeth drwy ddulliau siarad-a-sialc, o bosibl; cyfranogi a chymryd rhan yn y gymuned yw'r hyn sy'n dysgu'r wers honno. Dull dysgu dangos-a-dweud yn hytrach na siarad-a-sialc yw'r hyn sydd ei angen. Dyna'r ffordd

terms of improving awareness of citizenship responsibilities among the young.

**John Griffiths:** Rhodri, do you agree that events on voter participation, such as that starting in the Assembly on Friday, are welcome in addressing the issues raised in this question? The Presiding Officer will chair the opening session on Friday morning. Will you encourage Assembly Members to support that event?

**The First Minister:** It says in my notes here that if the Presiding Officer chairs it, it will be a guaranteed success. [*Laughter.*] I am sure that it will be a great event that will revolutionise people's attitudes to citizenship in general. If the Presiding Officer could chair meetings for adults as well as for young people, it would be even better.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The Deputy Presiding Officer will, in fact, chair that meeting, so it has an even greater guarantee of success.

2.40 p.m

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr wyf yn siŵr bod y Prif Weinidog yn ymwybodol mai un mater sy'n poeni pobl ifanc yw addysg a'r gallu i'w ddarparu. Gwyddoch fod gan bobl 18 oed ddi-ddordeb mawr yn y ffaith mai Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru sydd bellach yn gyfrifol am addysg ôl-16 a chyllido colegau addysg bellach a phrifysgolion Cymru. Cafodd eu hyder yng ngallu ELWa i ddarparu hynny gnoc sylweddol yn ystod yr wythnosau diwethaf. Fe gofiwch, Brif Weinidog, fod adroddiad gwreiddiol Peter Hain a'r grŵp gweithredu addysg a hyfforddiant wedi argymhell y dylai ELWa gael blwyddyn gysgodi cyn iddo gael ei sefydlu a bod Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 y Cynulliad, dan gadeiryddiaeth Cynog Dafis, wedi argymhell hynny hefyd. Fodd bynnag, penderfynodd y Llywodraeth nad oedd angen y flwyddyn honno. Yn sgîl yr helyntion diweddar, ai camgymeriad oedd bwrw ymlaen â sefydlu ELWa yn syth?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Unwaith eto, Ieuan, yr ydych yn cymysgu'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn y

orau ymlaen o ran cynyddu ymwybyddiaeth o gyfrifoldebau'r dinesydd ymysg pobl ifanc.

**John Griffiths:** Rhodri, a ydych yn cytuno bod digwyddiadau sy'n ymwneud â chyfranogiad pleidleiswyr, fel yr un sy'n dechrau yn y Cynulliad ddydd Gwener, yn rhai i'w croesawu o ran ymdrin â'r materion a godir yn y cwestiwn hwn? Y Llywydd fydd yn cadeirio'r sesiwn agoriadol fore Gwener. A wnewch annog Aelodau'r Cynulliad i gefnogi'r digwyddiad hwnnw?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dywedir yn fy nodiadau yma y bydd yn sicr o lwyddo os mai'r Llywydd sy'n ei gadeirio. [*Chwerthin.*] Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yn ddigwyddiad gwych a fydd yn chwyldroi agweddau pobl at ddinasyddiaeth yn gyffredinol. Os gallai'r Llywydd gadeirio cyfarfodydd ar gyfer oedolion yn ogystal â phobl ifanc, byddai'n well byth.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Y Dirprwy Lywydd a fydd yn cadeirio'r cyfarfod hwnnw, mewn gwirionedd, felly mae'n sicrach byth o lwyddo.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I am sure that the First Minister is aware that one matter that worries young people is education and the ability to provide it. You know that 18-year-olds take a great interest in the fact that Education and Learning Wales is now responsible for post-16 education and for funding further education colleges and universities in Wales. Their confidence in ELWa's ability to deliver that has been dealt a considerable blow during the past few weeks. You will remember, First Minister, that the original report by Peter Hain and the education and training action group recommended that ELWa have a shadowing year before it was established and that the Assembly's Post-16 Education and Training Committee, under the chairmanship of Cynog Dafis, made the same recommendation. However, the Government decided that that was unnecessary. Given the recent troubles, was it a mistake to immediately establish ELWa?

**The First Minister:** Once again, Ieuan, you are confusing what takes place in the Audit

Pwyllgor Archwilio gyda materion polisi i Weinidogion. Mae'r helyntion y cyfeiriwch atynt yn ymwneud â gweision sifil neu brif swyddogion, megis y rhai â chyfrifoldeb dros gyfrifon. Hwy a wnaeth rywbeth y mae'r Pwyllgor Archwilio yn cwyno amdano. Mater i'r Pwyllgor yw hynny a dylai holi'r swyddogion penodol. Nid yw'n fater sy'n ymwneud â pholisi. Nid yw'r Pwyllgor Archwilio mewn sefyllfa i ddelio â materion polisi i Weinidogion. Yr wyf wedi dweud hynny sawl gwaith. Gofynnwch unwaith eto am wers pum munud gan Dafydd Wigley. Ni fydd yma am fwy na dau fis arall ond, tra ei fod yma, gofynnwch iddo am y canllawiau o ran locws y Pwyllgor Archwilio ac Archwilydd Cenedlaethol Cymru, Syr John Bourn.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** That was a case of the First Minister protesting too much. The decision to do away with the shadowing year for ELWa was a policy decision by your Government. Do you accept that that was a mistake?

**The First Minister:** Why do you say that you can present this issue as something that is the consequence of what you refer to as the 'helyntion'—difficulties—of the past few weeks? Those 'helyntion' were dealt with by civil servants or accounting officers responsible for ELWa and are nothing to do with matters relating to ministerial responsibility. The Auditor General has no locus to consider ministerial responsibility. Turn around and ask Dafydd Wigley to give you a little lesson on the responsibilities of the Audit Committee and the Auditor General: he will tell you about that. It does not have any locus to consider ministerial decisions and responsibilities. I am sorry, Ieuan, but that is the nature of our constitution. The auditor's work is different. You are using what has happened as some sort of desperately thin base on which to try to drag the issue of ministerial responsibility into the debate. The decision taken three years ago on whether or not ELWa should have been given a shadowing year has nothing to do with the Auditor General. I do not know why you are dragging this issue up now.

Committee with policy issues for Ministers. The troubles to which you have referred involve civil servants or senior officials, such as those responsible for accounts. They are responsible for the issues of which the Audit Committee is critical. That is a matter for the Committee and it should question the relevant officials. It is not a policy matter. The Audit Committee is not in a position to deal with policy issues for Ministers. I have said that several times. Ask Dafydd Wigley once again for a five-minute lesson. He will only be here for another two months but, while he is here, ask him for the guidelines regarding the locus of the Audit Committee and the Auditor General for Wales, Sir John Bourn.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr oedd y Prif Weinidog yn rhy brotestiol. Yr oedd y penderfyniad i gael gwared â'r flwyddyn gysgodi ar gyfer ELWa yn benderfyniad polisi gan eich Llywodraeth chi. A ydych yn derbyn mai camgymeriad oedd hynny?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Pam y dywedwch y gallwch gyflwyno'r mater hwn fel rhywbeth sy'n ganlyniad i'r hyn a alwch yn 'helyntion' yr wythnosau diwethaf? Ymdriniwyd â'r 'helyntion' hynny gan weision sifil neu swyddogion cyfrifo sy'n gyfrifol am ELWa ac nid oes a wnelont ddim o gwbl â materion sy'n ymwneud â chyfrifoldeb gweinidogol. Nid oes gan yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol locws i ystyried cyfrifoldeb gweinidogol. Trowch at Dafydd Wigley a gofyn iddo roi gwers fach i chi am gyfrifoldebau'r Pwyllgor Archwilio a'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol: dywed wrthyhch am hynny. Nid oes ganddo locws i ystyried penderfyniadau a chyfrifoldebau gweinidogol. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Ieuan, ond dyna natur ein cyfansoddiad. Mae gwaith yr archwilydd yn wahanol. Yr ydych yn defnyddio'r hyn a ddigwyddodd yn rhyw fath o sail ofnadwy o wan i geisio llusgo mater cyfrifoldeb gweinidogol i'r ddadl. Nid yw'r penderfyniad a wnaed dair blynedd yn ôl ynghylch a ddylid rhoi blwyddyn gysgodi i ELWa ai peidio yn ymwneud â'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol o gwbl. Ni wn pam yr ydych yn codi'r mater hwn yn awr.

**Polisïau Amgylcheddol (De-orllewin Cymru)**  
**Environment Policies (South-west Wales)**

**Q10 Janet Davies:** Will the First Minister make a statement on what effect the implementation of his Government's environment policies have had upon south-west Wales? (OAQ22136)

**The First Minister:** The policies will result in a major improvement. I was able to witness one of those major improvements as I was present at the inauguration of the new blast furnace No. 5 at Port Talbot yesterday. The previous blast furnace No. 5, which tragically blew up in November 2001, did not have fume arresters because it was quite an old furnace. However, the new furnace has fume arresters and that will result in a major reduction of PM10s and other environmental problems in the Port Talbot area. There are many other examples whereby the environment has been undergoing major improvements, including the 100 per cent compliance with the European Blue Flag beach standard.

**Janet Davies:** You have mentioned the issue that I was going to raise, namely the steelworks. We are pleased, and relieved to an extent, that the blast furnace was rebuilt to much higher environmental standards than the old furnace. Will you provide information on your actions and policies for the remainder of the steelworks? It is important for the area's economy, but it is an environmental problem in terms of air quality.

**The First Minister:** The new blast furnace meets the latest standards for reducing PM10s. That is the basis on which it was designed. It is a similar design to that of blast furnace No. 4 in terms of fume arresting equipment, although there have been some improvements since that furnace was built. If you want to write to me on particular aspects of this, I will ensure that either I, Helen Phillips of the Environment Agency, or Sue Essex, the Minister for Environment, will respond. We discussed this at length during yesterday's ceremony. Undoubtedly, with a

**C10 Janet Davies:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar yr effaith y mae polisïau amgylcheddol ei Lywodraeth wedi'i chael ar dde-orllewin Cymru? (OAQ22136)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Bydd y polisïau'n arwain at welliant mawr. Yr wyf wedi gallu gweld un o'r gwelliannau mawr hynny gan imi fod yn bresennol ddoe wrth gychwyn y ffwrnais chwyth Rhif 5 newydd ym Mhort Talbot. Nid oedd atalwyr nwyon yn y ffwrnais chwyth Rhif 5 flaenorol, a ffrwydrodd yn drychinebus yn Nhachwedd 2001, am ei bod yn un eithaf hen. Fodd bynnag, mae atalwyr nwyon yn y ffwrnais newydd a bydd hynny'n arwain at ostyngiad mawr mewn PM10 a phroblemau amgylcheddol eraill yn ardal Port Talbot. Mae llawer o enghreifftiau eraill lle y bu gwelliannau mawr yn yr amgylchedd, gan gynnwys y cydymffurfriad llwyr â safon traeth y Faner Las Ewropeaidd.

**Janet Davies:** Yr ydych wedi sôn am y mater yr oeddwn i am ei godi, sef y gwaith dur. Yr ydym yn falch, ac wedi cael rhyddhad i ryw raddau, am fod y ffwrnais chwyth wedi'i hailadeiladu gan ddilyn safonau amgylcheddol uwch o lawer na rhai'r hen ffwrnais. A wnewch ddarparu gwybodaeth am eich camau gweithredu a'ch polisïau ar gyfer gweddill y gwaith dur? Mae'n bwysig i economi'r ardal, ond mae'n peri problem amgylcheddol yng nghyd-destun ansawdd aer.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r ffwrnais chwyth newydd yn bodloni'r safonau diweddaraf ar gyfer lleihau PM10. Ar y sail honno y cynlluniwyd hi. Mae ei chynllun yn debyg i un ffwrnais chwyth Rhif 4 o ran offer atal nwyon, er bod rhai gwelliannau wedi bod ers adeiladu'r ffwrnais honno. Os dymunwch ysgrifennu ataf ynghylch agweddau penodol ar hyn, gwnaf sicrhau y byddaf fi, Helen Phillips o Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, neu Sue Essex, y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, yn ymateb. Cawsom drafodaeth hir ar hyn yn ystod y seremoni ddoe. Mae'n

major steelworks next to a large town and a big range of mountains behind, there is always the danger of temperature inversion and other forms of air trapping over the houses. However, the key problem with the four streets of houses near the old blast furnace No. 5 has been solved—though we remember the tragic events that led to building that furnace. There is a major reduction now in particulate matter 10, the tiny bits of grit that can ruin washing or roofing nails and generally cause breathing problems for people living in that area. That problem has now been solved.

**Peter Black:** One of the environmental concerns for citizens in Swansea and Neath Port Talbot is the newly licensed incinerator at Crumlin Burrows. They were assured that, when the incinerator comes online, dioxins released would be subject to a continuous monitoring process. They have now been told that that will not happen. Have you considered making representations to the Environment Agency to ensure that this promise is kept and that this monitoring process takes place?

**The First Minister:** I understand that the Crumlin Burrows incinerator commissioning process is ongoing and that Environment Agency officers have visited, and continue to visit, the site regularly to ensure that the company complies with its pollution prevention and control permit. They expect to continue that activity during this commissioning phase. There may be changes following the commissioning phase, and that may be your point, but we have not yet reached that stage.

**Alun Cairns:** There are many concerns within the Bridgend County Borough Council area about the way in which current environmental policies are pursued. The make-up of the county borough's planning authority is being amended, seemingly in favour of one application. What is the Assembly Government's role in overseeing that procedure to ensure propriety in every regard, particularly as the independent

sicr, o gael gwaith dur mawr ger tref fawr a chadwyn fawr o fynyddoedd y tu ôl iddynt, fod perygl bob amser o gael gwrthdro tymheredd a mathau eraill o ddal aer uwchben y tai. Fodd bynnag, datryswyd y brif broblem ynghylch y pedair stryd o dai ger hen ffwrnais chwyth Rhif 5—er ein bod yn cofio'r digwyddiadau trychinebus a arweiniodd at adeiladu'r ffwrnais honno. Mae gostyngiad mawr bellach mewn defnydd gronynnol 10, y darnau bach iawn o raeau sy'n gallu difetha dillad golchi neu hoelion toi ac sy'n peri problemau anadlu'n gyffredinol i bobl sy'n byw yn yr ardal honno. Mae'r broblem honno wedi'i datrys bellach.

**Peter Black:** Un o'r pryderon ynghylch yr amgylchedd sydd gan ddinasyddion Abertawe a Chastell-nedd Port Talbot yw'r llosgydd sydd newydd ei drwyddedu yn Nhwyni Crymlyn. Fe'u sicrhawyd y byddai'r deuocsinau a ollyngir, pan fydd y llosgydd yn dechrau gweithredu, yn cael eu monitro'n barhaus. Dywedwyd wrthynt bellach na fydd hynny'n digwydd. A ydych wedi ystyried cyflwyno sylwadau i Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd i sicrhau y cedwir yr addewid hon ac y bydd y broses monitro hon yn digwydd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Deallaf fod y broses o baratoi'r llosgydd yn Nhwyni Crymlyn yn mynd rhagddi a bod swyddogion Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd wedi ymweld â'r safle'n rheolaidd a'u bod yn parhau i wneud hynny, er mwyn sicrhau bod y cwmni'n cydymffurfio â'i drwydded atal a rheoli difwyniant. Disgwylant barhau â'r gweithgaredd hwnnw yn ystod y cyfnod paratoi. Efallai y bydd newidiadau ar ôl y cyfnod paratoi, ac efallai mai hwnnw yw'r pwynt sydd gennych, ond nid ydym wedi dod at hynny eto.

**Alun Cairns:** Mae llawer o bryderon yn ardal Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr am y dull o weithredu'r polisïau amgylcheddol presennol. Mae cyfansoddiad awdurdod cynllunio'r fwrdeistref sirol yn cael ei ddiwygio, a hynny er mwyn ffafrio un cais, yn ôl pob golwg. Beth yw rôl Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o ran arolygu'r weithdrefn honno er mwyn sicrhau gweithredu priodol ym mhob agwedd ohoni,



planning inspector is due to report on the parcel of land in question within two months?

**The First Minister:** I am not sure to which piece of land or planning application you are referring. If you have a complaint about some impropriety in the planning procedure, you will have to take it through our complaints procedure, if you believe that it is a matter that could be best dealt with by ministerial involvement. However, there is also the possibility of the local government ombudsman and there are other avenues such as Bridgend County Borough Council's complaints procedure or its scrutiny committee. However, I am not aware of this issue. There must be reasons why you do not identify the piece of land or the planning application. Perhaps you could correct that in a letter.

**Brian Gibbons:** Do you welcome the Environment Agency's expectation that, once the pilot stage of continuous dioxin monitoring is complete, the facility to which Peter Black referred will install this continuous monitoring equipment? Do you agree that opening the Port Talbot dock and the development of the peripheral distributor road in Port Talbot will improve tremendously the visual environment and air quality through traffic diversion and so on?

**The First Minister:** There are so many exciting projects in the Neath Port Talbot area that you almost lose count—the Llandarcy urban village; the exciting £300 million environmentally extremely advanced General Electric power station; the Baglan energy park, which is another major energy saver for the companies that move there; the new blast furnace that we mentioned; the relief road for Port Talbot town centre and finally, the Crumlin Burrows waste reclamation centre. I do not have anything to add to my earlier remarks to Peter Black. When the Environment Agency is responsible for checking that the commissioning is going well, you assume that it will also wish to check what happens afterwards, although it will not be on the same basis. I have every reason, and every confidence, to suppose that the environmental future of Neath Port Talbot will be far cleaner

yn enwedig gan fod yr arolygydd cynllunio annibynnol i fod i adrodd ar y darn o dir dan sylw o fewn dau fis?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn sier at ba ddarn o dir neu gais cynllunio yr ydych yn cyfeirio. Os oes gennych gŵyn ynghylch rhyw weithredu amhriodol yn y weithdrefn gynllunio, bydd yn rhaid ichi fynd â hi drwy ein gweithdrefn gwynion, os credwch ei fod yn fater y gellid ymdrin ag ef orau drwy law Gweinidog. Fodd bynnag, gellid hefyd fynd at yr ombwdsmon llywodraeth leol ac mae ffyrdd eraill fel gweithdrefn gwynion Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr neu ei bwyllgor archwilio. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn ymwybodol o'r mater hwn. Rhaid bod rhesymau pam nad ydych yn enwi'r darn o dir neu'r cais cynllunio. Efallai y gallech gywiro hynny mewn llythyr.

**Brian Gibbons:** A ydych yn croesawu'r disgwyliad gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd y bydd y cyfleuster y cyfeiriodd Peter Black ato'n gosod yr offer monitro dan sylw ar ôl cwblhau'r cyfnod peilot o fonitro parhaus ar ddeuocsinau? A ydych yn cytuno y bydd agor doc Port Talbot a datblygu'r ffordd ddosbarthu amgylchol ym Mhort Talbot yn peri gwelliant aruthrol yn yr amgylchedd gweledol ac ansawdd yr aer drwy ddargyfeirio traffig ac yn y blaen?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae cynifer o brosiectau cyffrous yn ardal Castell-nedd Port Talbot fel bod rhywun bron â cholli cyfrif—pentref trefol Llandarcy; gorsaf drydan gyffrous General Electric sy'n werth £300 miliwn ac sy'n dra datblygedig o ran yr amgylchedd; parc ynni Baglan, sydd hefyd yn cynnig arbedion ynni mawr i'r cwmnïau sy'n symud yno; y ffwrnais chwyth newydd y bu inni gyfeirio ati; y ffordd liniaru ar gyfer canol tref Port Talbot ac, yn olaf, canolfan adfer gwastraff Twyni Crymlyn. Nid oes gennyf ddim i'w ychwanegu at fy sylwadau blaenorol i Peter Black. Gan fod Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn gyfrifol am wirio bod y gwaith paratoi'n mynd rhagddo'n dda, mae rhywun yn cymryd y bydd hefyd am wirio'r hyn a ddigwydd wedyn, er na wneir hynny ar yr un sail. Mae gennyf bob lle i dybio, a hyderu, y bydd amgylchedd Castell-nedd Port Talbot yn llawer glanach a gwyrddach yn y

and greener than ever before.

dyfodol nag y bu erioed o'r blaen.

## **Datganiad Busnes Business Statement**

**The Business Minister (Carwyn Jones):** There are three changes to this week's business. Today's motion to approve the Voluntary Adoption Agencies and the Adoption Agencies (Miscellaneous Amendments) Regulations 2003, and tomorrow's motion to approve the Education (Pupil Referral Units) (Appeals Against Permanent Exclusion) (Wales) Regulations 2003 have been moved to Tuesday 11 February. Tomorrow, the Minister for Economic Development will make a statement on the acquisition by Celsa of the former Allied Steel and Wire site in Cardiff.

**Y Trefnydd (Carwyn Jones):** Mae tri newid i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Mae'r cynnig ar gyfer heddiw i gymeradwyo Rheoliadau Asiantaethau Mabwysiadu Gwirfoddol a'r Asiantaethau Mabwysiadu (Diwygiadau Amrywiol) 2003, a'r cynnig ar gyfer yfory i gymeradwyo Rheoliadau Addysg (Unedau Cyfeirio Disgyblion) (Apelau yn erbyn Gwaharddiadau Parhaol) (Cymru) 2003 wedi'u symud i ddydd Mawrth 11 Chwefror. Yfory, bydd y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd yn gwneud datganiad am gaffael safle Allied Steel and Wire gynt yng Nghaerdydd gan Celsa.

2.50 p.m.

As for the next three weeks' business, the draft statement can be found on the Chamberweb, under supporting documents. Following the Business Committee meeting this morning, the Deputy Presiding Officer determined that, under Standing Order No. 22.5, the following items of legislation need not be referred to a Subject Committee for extended consideration: the Non-Domestic Rating (Demand Notices) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2003; the Agricultural Subsidies (Appeals) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2003; the Prohibition of Keeping or Release of Live Fish (Specified Species) (Amendment) (Wales) Order 2003; the Undersized Lobsters (Wales) Order 2003; the General Teaching Council for Wales (Constitution) (Amendment) Regulations 2003; the Police Reform Act 2002 (Commencement) (Wales) Order 2003; the Council Tax (Administration and Enforcement) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2003; the Education (Supply of Information) (Wales) Regulations 2003; the Local Authority Adoption Service and Miscellaneous Amendments (Wales) Regulations 2003; and the Education (Induction Arrangements for School Teachers) (Wales) Regulations 2003.

Am fusnes y tair wythnos nesaf, gellir gweld y datganiad drafft ar we'r Siambr, o dan ddogfennau ategol. Ar ôl y cyfarfod o'r Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, penderfynodd y Dirprwy Lywydd, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.5, nad oes angen cyfeirio'r eitemau deddfwriaeth a ganlyn i Bwllgor Pwnc i'w hystyried yn helaethach: Rheoliadau Ardrethu Annomestig (Hysbysiadau Galw am Dalu) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003; Rheoliadau Cymorthdaliadau Amaethyddol (Apelau) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2003; Gorchymyn Gwahardd Cadw neu Ollwng Pysgod Byw (Rhywogaethau Penodedig) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003; Gorchymyn Cimychiaid Rhy Fach (Cymru) 2003; Rheoliadau Cyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru (Cyfansoddiad) (Diwygio) 2003; Gorchymyn Deddf Diwygio'r Heddlu 2002 (Cychwyn) (Cymru) 2003; Rheoliadau'r Dreth Gyngor (Gweinyddu a Gorfodi) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2003; Rheoliadau Addysg (Cyflenwi Gwybodaeth) (Cymru) 2003; Rheoliadau Gwasanaethau Mabwysiadu Awdurdodau Lleol a Diwygiadau Amrywiol (Cymru) 2003; a Rheoliadau Addysg (Trefniadau Ymsefydlu ar gyfer Athrawon Ysgol) (Cymru) 2003.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes gwrthwynebiadau i'r datganiad busnes? Gwelaf nad oes. A oes

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there any objections to the business statement? I see

sylwadau?

**Jonathan Morgan:** Minister, you will recall that I have requested that the Minister for Environment make a statement to the Assembly on the Government's support for Cardiff's ULTra transport scheme, which, up until the end of last week according to press reports, was receiving Government expenditure to the tune of £18 million to £20 million. We understand that that has now been scrapped, and the Government does not intend to continue supporting that project. We have opposed this scheme from the outset, and are delighted that the leader of the Liberal Democrats in Cardiff County Council now also supports our view. Therefore, will the Government make a statement on this policy change, which has been announced to the press, but not to the Assembly Chamber?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Minister, you will be aware that I have asked on several occasions for the debate on the approval of the Genetically Modified Organisms (Deliberate Release) (Wales) Regulations 2002, which took place on 18 December, to be held again. I make that request because we were not aware of all the facts, because a report, which was of material significance to that debate, was withheld from us. I understand that the Government argues that the report was not of material significance to the debate. However, the report states quite clearly that it is impossible to contain GM crops such as oilseed rape, which has wild relatives and where cross-pollination may occur, and that, where rotations are practised, GM varieties may reappear unexpectedly years after GM crops have been grown. The bio-security—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This is not an opportunity to make a substantive speech; it is an opportunity to comment on the business statement.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** If the Business Minister were to allow us to debate this issue, I could raise these matters then.

**The Presiding Officer:** That is the whole point.

that there are none. Are there any comments?

**Jonathan Morgan:** Drefnydd, byddwch yn cofio fy mod wedi gwneud cais am ddatganiad gan y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd i'r Cynulliad ar gefnogaeth y Llywodraeth i gynllun trafniadaeth ULTra Caerdydd a oedd, hyd ddiwedd yr wythnos diwethaf yn ôl adroddiadau yn y wasg, yn derbyn gwariant gan y Llywodraeth o £18 miliwn i £20 miliwn. Deallwn y taflwyd hynny ar y domen bellach, ac nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn bwriadu parhau i gefnogi'r prosiect hwnnw. Yr ydym yn gwrthwynebu'r cynllun hwn ers y cychwyn, ac yr ydym wrth ein bodd bod arweinydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yng Nghyngor Sir Caerdydd yn cefnogi ein barn yn awr hefyd. Gan hynny, a wnaiff y Llywodraeth ddatganiad am y newid polisi hwn, a gyhoeddwyd i'r wasg, ond nid yn Siambr y Cynulliad?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Drefnydd, byddwch yn ymwybodol fy mod wedi gofyn ar sawl achlysur am ailgynnal y ddadl ar gymeradwyo Rheoliadau Organebau a Addaswyd yn Enetig (Eu Gollwng yn Fwriadol) (Cymru) 2002, a gynhaliwyd ar 18 Rhagfyr. Gofynnaf am hynny am nad oeddem yn ymwybodol o'r holl ffeithiau, am fod adroddiad, a oedd yn berthnasol i'r ddadl honno, wedi'i gadw oddi wrthym. Deallaf fod y Llywodraeth yn dadlau nad oedd yr adroddiad yn berthnasol i'r ddadl. Fodd bynnag, dywed yr adroddiad yn gwbl eglur ei bod yn amhosibl rheoli cynydau a addaswyd yn enetig fel had rêp olew, y mae iddi berthnasau gwyllt y gellir cael croesbeillio â hwy, a, lle y cylchdroir cynydau, y gall amrywogaethau a addaswyd yn enetig ailymddangos yn annisgwyl flynyddoedd ar ôl tyfu cynydau a addaswyd yn enetig. Y diogelwch biolegol—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw hyn yn gyfle i wneud araith ar bwnc; mae'n gyfle i wneud sylwadau am y datganiad busnes.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Pe byddai'r Trefnydd yn caniatáu inni gael dadl ar y mater hwn, gallwn godi'r materion hyn bryd hynny.

**Y Llywydd:** Dyna'r pwynt sydd gennyf.

**Alun Pugh:** It has been brought to my attention by people who work with children that they are concerned about the inappropriate use of mobile camera phones, particularly in changing rooms where children may be present. Will you schedule a statement by the appropriate Minister so that local authorities may be given guidance on how paedophiles may be prevented from abusing this latest technology?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni ddylid trafod dadleuon y ceisiwyd eu codi mewn dadl o'r blaen.

**Carwyn Jones:** I will deal first with Alun Pugh's point, which he has raised before, and which is of great concern to us all. The Ministers responsible for this issue will have heard what you said. You have taken up this campaign, Alun. This needs to be considered, and if further action needs to be taken, I am sure that Ministers will do so.

On Jonathan Morgan's call for a statement on ULTra, the letters that were sent out to local authorities—including to Cardiff County Council—will be made available and placed in the Library. The reasoning will be set out in that letter. It is then up to opposition parties to consider that letter and decide whether they wish to take up the matter in Committee, where the Minister can be fully questioned.

On the GM release regulations, we have not grown oilseed rape as a crop in Wales recently. It is a category B release. We have had category C releases in Wales, if I remember rightly, which include maize. The conditions in Wales are not necessarily right for growing oilseed rape, therefore it is not a good example. If you had mentioned maize, you would have presented a sounder argument. The Government contends that the report that has now been made available would not have had a material effect on Members' views in terms of the debate last year. However, Members will no doubt wish to raise this matter in Committee.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae rhai sy'n gweithio â phlant wedi tynnu fy sylw at y ffaith eu bod yn bryderus ynghylch defnydd amhriodol ar ffonau camera symudol, yn enwedig mewn ystafelloedd newid lle y gallai plant fod yn bresennol. A wnewch amserlennu datganiad gan y Gweinidog priodol fel y gellir rhoi canllawiau i awdurdodau lleol ar y modd y gellir atal pedoffiliaid rhag camddefnyddio'r dechnoleg ddiweddaraf hon?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Members should not debate issues when an attempt has been made to raise them in a previous debate.

**Carwyn Jones:** Ymdriniaf yn gyntaf â phwynt Alun Pugh, a godwyd o'r blaen ganddo, ac sy'n peri pryder mawr i bob un ohonom. Bydd y Gweinidogion sy'n gyfrifol am y mater hwn wedi clywed yr hyn a ddywedaso. Yr ydych wedi ymgymryd â'r ymgyrch hon, Alun. Rhaid ystyried hyn, ac os bydd angen cymryd camau pellach, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Gweinidogion yn gwneud hynny.

Ynghylch yr alwad gan Jonathan Morgan am ddatganiad ar ULTra, bydd y llythyrau a anfonwyd i awdurdodau lleol—gan gynnwys Cyngor Sir Caerdydd—yn cael eu darparu a'u gosod yn y Llyfrgell. Nodir yr ymresymu yn y llythyr hwnnw. Mater i'r gwrthbleidiau wedyn fydd ystyried y llythyr hwnnw a phenderfynu a ydynt yn dymuno codi'r mater yn y Pwyllgor, lle y gellir holi'r Gweinidog yn drylwyr.

Ynghylch y rheoliadau ar ollwng organebau a addaswyd yn enetig, nid ydym wedi tyfu had rēp olew fel cnwd yng Nghymru'n ddiweddar. Mae'n ollyngiad categori B. Cawsom ollyngiadau categori C yng Nghymru, os cofiaf yn iawn, sy'n cynnwys india-corn. Nid yw'r amodau a geir yng Nghymru o reidrwydd yn addas ar gyfer tyfu had rēp olew, felly nid yw'n enghraifft dda. Pe byddech wedi sôn am india-corn, byddech wedi cyflwyno dadl gadarnach. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn dadlau na fyddai'r adroddiad sydd wedi'i ddarparu bellach wedi cael effaith o bwys ar farn Aelodau o ran y ddadl y llynedd. Fodd bynnag, mae'n siŵr y bydd Aelodau am godi'r mater hwn yn y Pwyllgor.

*Derbyniwyd y datganiad busnes.  
Business statement adopted.*

## **Cynnig o Gerydd Censure Motion**

**Y Llywydd:** Mae hanner awr wedi'i neilltuo ar gyfer y ddadl hon. Bydd gan y rhai sy'n cynnig y cynnig wyth munud i agor a chloi'r ddadl; bydd y Gweinidog a phrif lefarydd yr wrthblaid yn cael pum munud yr un, ac yna byddaf yn galw pedwar siaradwr—neu fwy os bydd y siaradwyr hynny'n siarad am lai na thair munud yr un.

**Peter Rogers:** I propose the following motion in my name and the names of Nick Bourne, Glyn Davies, Jonathan Morgan, David Melding, David Davies, Alun Cairns, William Graham, David Ian Jones. I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales censures the Deputy First Minister and Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad for his incompetence. (NNDM1331)*

Minister, if you had any decency or principles you would have resigned a long time ago over your incompetence. I have been involved with your self-made support payments fiasco since last May. I have tried, through the Presiding Officer, to get you to make an urgent statement on the serious problems on three occasions. I have also made three attempts to do that under Assembly business. Everything you have inflicted on rural Wales is the result of your unparalleled incompetence.

How can you deny a young dairy farmer in Anglesey, with a working wife and two young children, his environmentally sensitive areas payment, which was due last June? I wrote to you in October: you did nothing. I even e-mailed you on Christmas Eve. The emotional strain that you have placed that family under must never happen again. Is that not incompetence, Minister?

Another of the matters I raised at Christmas concerned a claim submitted on 6 June for

**The Presiding Officer:** Half an hour has been allocated for this debate. Those proposing the motion will have eight minutes to open and close the debate; the Minister and the main opposition spokesperson will have five minutes each, and I will then call four other speakers—or more if those speakers speak for less than three minutes each.

**Peter Rogers:** Cynigiau y cynnig canlynol yn fy enw i, Nick Bourne, Glyn Davies, Jonathan Morgan, David Melding, David Davies, Alun Cairns, William Graham, a David Ian Jones. Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ceryddu'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor am ei anallu. (NNDM1331)*

Weinidog, pe byddai gennych unrhyw barch neu egwyddorion, byddech wedi ymddiswyddo amser maith yn ôl oherwydd eich anallu. Yr wyf ynghlwm yn eich ffiasgo cymorthdaliadau, sydd o'ch gwneuthuriad eich hun, ers mis Mai diwethaf. Yr wyf wedi ceisio, drwy'r Llywydd, eich cael i wneud datganiad brys ar y problemau difrifol ar dri achlysur. Yr wyf wedi ceisio gwneud hynny dair gwaith hefyd o dan fusnes y Cynulliad. Mae pob aflwydd yr ydych wedi'i beri i'r Gymru wledig yn ganlyniad i'ch anallu digymar.

Sut y gallwch wrthod taliad ardal amgylchedd arbennig i ffermwr laeth ifanc yn Ynys Môn, sydd â gwraig sy'n gweithio a dau blentyn ifanc, a oedd yn ddyledus fis Mehefin diwethaf? Ysgrifennais atoch ym mis Hydref; ni wnaethoch ddim. Gwneuthum hyd yn oed anfon neges e-bost atoch noswyl Nadolig. Ni chaiff y straen emosiynol a barasoch i'r teulu hwnnw fyth ddigwydd eto. Onid anallu yw hynny, Weinidog?

Yr oedd un o'r materion eraill a godais adeg y Nadolig yn ymwneud â hawliad a

£4,800 and the inability to get hold of livestock declaration forms. That farmer telephoned for six weeks without success. That was not covered by a payment window period. Is that not incompetence? Then we received the famous letter from the Assembly, which caused such a furore with the First Minister, stating that a bank payment could be made. Three weeks later the money had still not been paid, although you had written to the bank. Is that not incompetence?

You know why Rhodri shouted ‘rollocks’—because you had told him that the hardship cases raised by banks were being processed. You were wrong again. Is that not incompetence? In January, at the National Farmers Union annual general meeting in Llangollen, you gave a hell-raising speech, marvelling at your performance in supporting Welsh farmers and stating that your mother had always made sure that you ate all your carrots so that you would have curly hair. Following on from that, you made a statement that anyone experiencing cash-flow problems needed to get a letter from the bank, which would trigger a manual payment. A young farmer at the back of the room immediately jumped up to tell you that he had been told by his bank manager that that would be a waste of time, because he had already written two letters for other farmers and you had not responded. Is that not incompetence?

What about your support for auctions? You told them that you had offered grants to upgrade their computers. Given your record, was that incompetence or just misguided? Auctions pay on the day and have traceability of animals that is far superior to the Assembly’s. Will anyone understand your incompetence? Are you listening, First Minister—and you, Ieuan Wyn Jones, because this relates to your constituency? My local auction has had nearly £0.25 million sitting in its account for suckler cow and quota sales for a few months. That is just the amount in Anglesey. That money should be in the rural economy. It is not Assembly nor European Union money, but trading money between farmers. It is still in the account because the paperwork has not been

gyflwynwyd ar 6 Mehefin am £4,800 a'r anallu i gael gafael ar ffurflenni datganiad da byw. Ffoniodd y ffermwr hwnnw am chwe wythnos heb lwyddo. Nid oedd cyfnod talu ar gyfer hwnnw. Onid anallu yw hynny? Wedyn cawsom y llythyr enwog oddi wrth y Cynulliad, a barodd y fath gynnwrf gyda'r Prif Weinidog, yn dweud y gellid gwneud taliad banc. Dair wythnos yn ddiweddarach nid oedd yr arian wedi'i dalu byth, er eich bod wedi ysgrifennu i'r banc. Onid anallu yw hynny?

Gwyddoch pam y gwaeddodd Rhodri ‘rollocks’—am eich bod wedi dweud wrtho fod yr achosion o galedi a godwyd gan fanciau'n cael eu prosesu. Yr oeddech yn anghywir eto. Onid anallu yw hynny? Yn Ionawr, yng nghyfarfod blynyddol cyffredinol Undeb Cenedlaethol yr Amaethwyr yn Llangollen, rhoesoch araith danllyd, gan ryfeddu at eich perfformiad wrth gefnogi ffermwyr Cymru a dweud bod eich mam wedi ymorol bob amser eich bod yn bwyta'ch holl foron er mwyn ichi gael gwallt cyrliog. Ar ôl hynny, dywedasoch fod yn rhaid i unrhyw un sy'n profi problemau o ran llif arian gael llythyr gan y banc, ac y byddai hynny'n arwain at daliad â llaw. Cododd ffermwr ifanc yng nghefn yr ystafell ar ei draed ar unwaith i ddweud wrthyfch fod ei reolwr banc wedi dweud wrtho mai gwastraff amser fyddai hynny, gan ei fod eisoes wedi ysgrifennu dau lythyr ar gyfer ffermwyr eraill ac nad oeddech wedi ymateb. Onid anallu yw hynny?

Beth am eich cymorth i arwerthiannau? Dywedasoch wrthynt eich bod wedi cynnig grantiau er mwyn iddynt wella eu cyfrifiaduron. O ystyried eich record, ai anallu oedd hynny neu a oeddech wedi'ch camarwain? Telir ar y diwrnod mewn arwerthiannau a gallant olrhain anifeiliaid yn llawer gwell na'r Cynulliad. A wnaiff rhywun amgyffred eich anallu? A ydych yn gwrando, Brif Weinidog—a chithau, Ieuan Wyn Jones, gan fod hyn yn ymwneud â'ch etholaeth? Bu ymron i £0.25 miliwn yn sefyll yng nghyfrif fy arwerthiant lleol ar gyfer gwerthu buchod sugno a chwotâu am ychydig fisoedd. Dim ond y swm yn Ynys Môn yw hynny. Dylai'r arian hwnnw fod yn yr economi wledig. Nid arian y Cynulliad neu'r Undeb Ewropeaidd ydyw, ond arian

processed. That is nothing to do with the computer system. Is that not incompetence?

What about the rural payments for the over 30 months scheme? There is £20,000 to £40,000 owing beyond the 14-day payment charter. Is that not incompetence? Half these schemes are not covered by a payment window period. I am still waiting for a written response about that from last week. Again, this is due to the bungling incompetence of the Minister for Rural Development.

I know of farmers who are being told that they are being penalised and that their payments are not due—

**Phil Williams:** Will you give way?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Peter Rogers is not giving way.

**Peter Rogers:** Farmers could have been told about some of those disqualifications in April or May last year: because you did not do that, they are now blocking up the system and ringing up the divisional offices. The independent appeals panel for farmers has been brought into disrepute because of the length of time that the Minister takes to make final decisions. The last two decisions have gone before the Welsh ombudsman, again because of the Minister's incompetence. What about the farmer in Anglesey, whose sheep annual premium scheme payment was disallowed on a technicality, because he failed to enter one sale in his book? He was fined £2,000. Worse than that, he is now being penalised a further £2,000 this year. I e-mailed you last night from the auctions to ask about that, because the farmer is fed up and wants to sell his SAPS form now, but is in danger of not being able to do that because you have not processed the procedure. That, again, is incompetence. [*Interruption.*]

3.00 p.m.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order.

masnachu rhwng ffermwyr. Mae'n dal i fod yn y cyfrif am nad yw'r gwaith papur wedi'i brosesu. Nid oes a wnelo hynny â'r system gyfrifiadurol. Onid anallu yw hynny?

Beth am y taliadau gwledig ar gyfer y cynllun dros 30 mis? Mae rhwng £20,000 a £40,000 yn ddyledus y tu hwnt i'r siarter dalu 14 diwrnod. Onid anallu yw hynny? Nid oes cyfnod talu ar gyfer hanner y cynlluniau hyn. Yr wyf yn dal i ddisgwyl ateb ysgrifenedig am hynny ers yr wythnos diwethaf. Unwaith eto, mae hyn yn ganlyniad i anallu di-glem y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig.

Gwn am ffermwyr y dywedwyd wrthynt eu bod yn cael eu cosbi ac nad yw eu taliadau'n ddyledus—

**Phil Williams:** A wnewch ildio?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw Peter Rogers yn ildio.

**Peter Rogers:** Gellid bod wedi dweud wrth ffermwyr am rai o'r gwaharddiadau hynny ym mis Ebrill neu fis Mai y llynedd: am na wnaethoch hynny, maent bellach yn blocio'r system ac yn ffonio'r swyddfeydd rhanbarthol. Ducpwyd anfri ar y panel apelau annibynnol i ffermwyr oherwydd yr amser y cymer y Gweinidog i wneud penderfyniadau terfynol. Aeth y ddau benderfyniad diwethaf gerbron ombwdsmon Cymru, unwaith eto oherwydd anallu'r Gweinidog. Beth am y ffermwr yn Ynys Môn, y gwrthodwyd iddo daliad o dan y cynllun premiwm blynyddol defaid oherwydd manylyn technegol, am ei fod wedi methu â chofnodi un gwerthiant yn ei lyfr? Cafodd ddirwy o £2,000. Yn waeth na hynny, mae'n cael cosb bellach o £2,000 eleni. Anfonais neges e-bost atoch neithiwr o'r arwerthiannau i holi am hynny, am fod y ffermwr wedi hen flino ac yn dymuno gwerthu ei ffurflen cynllun premiwm blynyddol defaid yn awr, ond mae mewn perygl o beidio â gallu gwneud hynny am nad ydych wedi prosesu'r weithdrefn. Anallu yw hynny eto. [*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn.

**Peter Rogers:** Thank you, Presiding Officer.

The buzzwords in this fiasco are the 'validation of claims forms'. It is not to do with the payment. This can only be done in the divisional offices. The Minister told farmers in north Wales that it was done in Cardiff. He is wrong again, and again incompetent. The Minister told the Assembly in January that SAPS was being paid to up to 4,000 farmers per day. Within four days, you would have paid the 12,500 farmers eligible and the situation would have been resolved. This goes beyond the actual payment of the cheques; the situation continues because of the validation of the forms. To you in Plaid Cymru—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Peter, you have taken over five minutes, so your leader will have less than three minutes to wind up the debate.

**Mick Bates:** It is interesting to compare Peter's words with those of his prospective replacement. Brynle Williams told the Farmers Union of Wales annual general meeting at Dolgellau last week that we are lucky to have a chap like Mike German looking after us. I wonder who speaks— [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Give way.'] No; sit down.

It is, sadly, inevitable that we should be having this debate now. After all, an election is looming. During an election, a party has two choices: to attack others or to campaign on its record and present a positive alternative. The Conservatives have chosen a policy of personal attack, negativity, proceduralism and opposition for its own sake. With declining support in the polls, their attacks—focusing on procedure and negative opposition—appear more desperate by the day. It is true that farmers face problems. Like that of many people, their livelihood is challenging and difficult. Many of their businesses are in a precarious situation and they often live hand to mouth. The payments from the Assembly are in many cases a lifeline, which keep those businesses going. The prompt receipt of those

**Peter Rogers:** Diolch i chi, Lywydd.

Y geiriau ffasiynol yn y ffasgo hwn yw 'dilysu ffurflenni hawliad'. Nid yw'n ymwneud â'r taliad. Dim ond yn y swyddfeydd rhanbarthol y gellir gwneud hyn. Dywedodd y Gweinidog wrth ffermwyr yn y Gogledd mai yng Nghaerdydd y gwneid hyn. Mae'n anghywir eto, ac yn analluog eto. Dywedodd y Gweinidog wrth y Cynulliad yn Ionawr fod taliadau'r cynllun premiwm blynyddol defaid yn cael eu talu i hyd at 4,000 o ffermwyr y diwrnod. O fewn pedwar diwrnod, byddech wedi talu'r 12,500 o ffermwyr sy'n gymwys a byddai'r sefyllfa wedi'i datrys. Mae hyn yn mynd y tu hwnt i dalu'r sieciau eu hun; mae'r sefyllfa'n parhau oherwydd dilysu'r ffurflenni. I chi ym Mhlaid Cymru—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Peter, yr ydych wedi cymryd dros bum munud, felly bydd gan eich arweinydd lai na thri munud i gloi'r ddadl.

**Mick Bates:** Diddorol yw cymharu geiriau Peter â rhai'r darpar ymgeisydd sy'n cymryd ei le. Dywedodd Brynle Williams yng nghyfarfod blynyddol Undeb Amaethwyr Cymru yn Nolgellau yr wythnos diwethaf ein bod yn ffodus i gael rhywun fel Mike German i ofalu amdanom. Yr wyf yn meddwl tybed pwy sy'n siarad—[AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'Ildiwch.'] Na wnaif; eisteddwch.

Gwaetha'r modd, mae'n anochel ein bod yn cael y ddadl hon yn awr. Wedi'r cwbl, mae etholiad ar y gorwel. Yn ystod etholiad, mae dau ddewis gan blaid: ymosod ar eraill neu ymgyrchu ar sail ei record a chyflwyno dewis cadarnhaol. Mae'r Ceidwadwyr wedi dewis polisi o ymosod personol, negyddoldeb, manteisio ar drefniadaeth a gwrthwynebu ei ei fwyn ei hun. Wrth i'w cefnogaeth ddisgyn yn yr arolygon barn, mae eu hymosodiadau—sy'n canolbwyntio ar drefniadaeth a gwrthwynebu negyddol—yn ymddangos yn fwy anobeithiol wrth y dydd. Mae'n wir bod ffermwyr yn wynebu problemau. Mae eu bywoliaeth hwy, fel un llawer o bobl, yn ymestynnol ac yn anodd. Mae llawer o'u busnesau mewn cyflwr bregus ac maent yn aml yn byw o'r llaw i'r genau. Mae'r taliadau oddi wrth y Cynulliad yn rhaff achub mewn



payments is important for cashflow.

However, it is also true that the Minister has done all he can to ensure that the majority of farmers receive payments as quickly as possible. Farmers have received payments: 96 per cent of sheep annual premium payments have been made, and 70 per cent of arable payments have been made. This debate will do nothing to ensure that the remaining payments are made quicker, nor will it bring the new computer system up to speed quicker, nor put 1p extra in the pockets of a single Welsh farmer.

The partnership Government is doing a good job for agriculture in Wales. Under the incompetent Conservatives, the British dairy industry was decimated. They abolished the Milk Marketing Board and their handling of BSE was disgusting. This Government has been imaginative. For example, it has provided free school milk and supported the procurement of food locally by the public sector. Under the incompetent Conservatives, the British Government failed to take up millions of pounds that were available to Welsh farmers. Under this Government—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. You are out of time.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Ar ôl gwranddo ar Peter Rogers yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod oll yn glir ynglŷn â pham y mae'r Ceidwadwyr wedi cynnig y cynnig o gerydd hwn. Hyd y gallwn ddirnad, canolbwyntiodd fwy neu lai ar daliadau yn ei araith. Hysbysaf Peter mai Plaid Cymru a gyflwynodd ddadl ar daliadau i ffermwyr yn y Siambr, ac i'r Ceidwadwyr geisio cwtogi'r ddadl drwy chwarae plant a gofyn i'r gloch gael ei chanu byth a hefyd y prynhawn hwnnw.

Plaid Cymru sydd hefyd wedi sicrhau bod mater y taliadau yn cael ei ymchwilio'n llawn yn y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig. Os yw Peter Rogers am sôn am fethiant y Gweinidog i ddod â'r adroddiad

llawer achos, ac maent yn cadw'r busnesau hynny ar eu traed. Mae'n bwysig derbyn y taliadau hynny'n brydlon er mwyn eu llif arian.

Fodd bynnag, mae hefyd yn wir bod y Gweinidog wedi gwneud popeth yn ei allu i sicrhau bod y mwyafrif o ffermwyr yn cael eu taliadau cyn gyflymed ag y bo modd. Mae ffermwyr wedi derbyn taliadau: talwyd 96 y cant o'r taliadau premiwm blynyddol defaid, a gwnaed 70 y cant o'r taliadau tir âr. Ni wnaiff y ddadl hon ddim i sicrhau y gwneir y taliadau sy'n weddill yn gynt, ac ni fydd ychwaith yn rhoi'r system gyfrifiadurol newydd ar waith yn gynt, nac yn rhoi ceiniog yn ychwanegol ym mhoced yr un ffermwr yng Nghymru.

Mae'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth yn gwneud gwaith da dros amaethyddiaeth yng Nghymru. O dan y Ceidwadwyr analluog, anrheithiwyd diwydiant llaeth Prydain. Gwnaethant ddiddymu'r Bwrdd Marchnata Llaeth ac yr oedd eu dull o drafod BSE yn warthus. Bu'r Llywodraeth hon yn llawn dychymyg. Er enghraifft, darparodd laeth am ddim mewn ysgolion a chefnogi caffael bwyd yn lleol gan y sector cyhoeddus. O dan y Ceidwadwyr analluog, methodd Llywodraeth Prydain â chymryd miliynau o bunnoedd a oedd ar gael i ffermwyr Cymru. O dan y Llywodraeth hon—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae eich amser ar ben.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** After listening to Peter Rogers, I am sure that we are all clear as to why the Conservatives have proposed this censure motion. As far as I could make out, he concentrated for the most part on payments in his speech. I inform Peter that it was Plaid Cymru that tabled a debate on payments for farmers in the Chamber, and that the Conservatives tried to curtail that debate by playing games and endlessly requesting that the bell be rung that afternoon.

It is also Plaid Cymru that has ensured that the issue of payments is being fully investigated in the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee. If Peter Rogers wants to raise the issue of the Minister's

ynglŷn â threialon maes o gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig gerbron y Cynulliad, dylai wybod fy mod yn cyflwyno cŵyn yn erbyn y Gweinidog i'r Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad ar y mater hwnnw. Dyna sut y gallwn sicrhau y dysgir gwersi ac na fydd hyn yn digwydd eto. Ni allaf weld sut y gall y cynnig hwn gyflawni unrhyw beth.

What does the Conservative Party intend to achieve by way of this motion? According to the Conservatives, the Minister is incompetent. We would not disagree with that. However, is this motion going to make Mike German competent? From everything that is said about him, Mike German has been incompetent for most of his working life. Are we hoping that, by Peter Rogers waving a magic wand, Mike German will suddenly become competent?

How do you quantify competence? Is Mike German less competent than other Ministers? Is he more competent than Jane Hutt? She told us that no-one would wait over six months for an appointment, but the number of people waiting has increased by 278 per cent. Is he more competent than Jane Davidson, who has overlooked the fiasco of the financial management of ELWa? Is he more competent than Andrew Davies, in whose case we need only point to Objective 1?

If we get rid of Mike German, who will replace him? Is there someone else who is more competent to do his job—Brian Gibbons, Lynne Neagle or Huw Lewis perhaps? Could it be Peter Rogers, or even Mick Bates, who made a spirited defence of the Minister? I look forward to seeing Mick trying to defend the Minister's record on agriculture to farmers in Montgomery marts; I am sure that he will get a warm welcome as a result.

We know that Mike German is incompetent, but the farmers of Wales will not have competence until there is a change of Government in the Assembly on 1 May, and we have a Plaid Cymru Government, which is committed to the countryside and to farming.

failure to bring the report on field trials of genetically-modified crops before the Assembly, he should know that I am making a complaint against the Minister to the Committee on Standards of Conduct on that issue. That is how to ensure that lessons are learnt and that this does not happen again. I cannot see how this motion will achieve anything.

Beth y mae'r Plaid Geidwadol yn bwriadu ei gyflawni drwy'r cynnig hwn? Yn ôl y Ceidwadwyr, mae'r Gweinidog yn analluog. Nid anghytunem â hynny. Er hynny, a fydd y cynnig hwn yn peri i Mike German fod yn alluog? Yn ôl popeth a ddywedir amdano, bu Mike German yn analluog y rhan fwyaf o'i oes waith. A ydym yn gobeithio, drwy gael gan Peter Rogers chwifio hudlath, y bydd Mike German yn dod yn alluog yn sydyn?

Sut yr ydych yn mesur gallu? A yw Mike German yn llai galluog na Gweinidogion eraill? A yw'n fwy galluog na Jane Hutt? Dywedodd hi wrthym na fyddai neb yn aros am fwy na chwe mis am apwyntiad, ond mae nifer y rhai sy'n aros wedi codi o 278 y cant. A yw'n fwy galluog na Jane Davidson, sydd wedi diystyru ffiasgo rheolaeth ariannol ELWa? A yw'n fwy galluog nag Andrew Davies, nad oes ond rhaid inni gyfeirio at Amcan 1 yn ei achos ef?

Os cawn wared â Mike German, pwy a ddaw yn ei le? A oes rhywun sy'n fwy galluog i gyflawni ei swydd—Brian Gibbons, Lynne Neagle neu Huw Lewis efallai? Ai Peter Rogers, neu hyd yn oed Mick Bates, a amddiffynnodd y Gweinidog yn angerddol? Edrychaf ymlaen at weld Mick yn ceisio amddiffyn record y Gweinidog ar amaethyddiaeth gerbron ffermwyr ym marchnadoedd Trefaldwyn; yr wyf yn sicr y caiff goeso cynnes o ganlyniad.

Gwyddom fod Mike German yn analluog, ond ni chaiff ffermwyr Cymru rai sy'n alluog hyd nes y ceir newid Llywodraeth yn y Cynulliad ar 1 Mai, a hyd nes y cawn Lywodraeth Plaid Cymru, sydd wedi ymrwymo i gefn gwlad ac i ffermio.

**Karen Sinclair:** It is important that the people of Wales know and understand what is going on today, despite Peter's passion—and, boy, was he passionate. If the Conservatives think that they can fool anyone into thinking that this motion is the result of concern for farmers, they should think again. We all know that this motion is about crocodile tears, not sheep premiums. We saw such behaviour at the beginning of this Assembly and, unfortunately, it is being repeated at its end.

This censure motion is sheer opportunism. There is no originality of purpose or intent, and it devalues the currency of the censure motion. A censure motion is the nuclear option—the last resort—and it should be reserved for occasions when the Assembly as a whole, across the parties, may agree that a Minister has fallen below the standards of conduct that we have a right to expect. This motion does not fall anywhere within such territory.

This is an attempt to hold a political argument by the back door. The time is quickly approaching when such arguments will be heard, namely 1 May. Of course, the Conservative Party fights shy of that sort of debate because it knows that, when the people of Wales cast their votes, they will deliver the same verdict upon the Tories that has been reserved for them for the past 100 years in Wales. They know that they have no chance of making an impression outside the Chamber, so they think that they can find a way of concentrating attention on what goes on inside it. The Labour group has always opposed the abuse of the censure motion. Devaluing its currency by means of the nonsense that we have heard today is sad. The Labour group will vote against the motion.

3.10 p.m.

**Ron Davies:** I will talk briefly about the missing DEFRA report on GM crops. I will not vote in favour of today's motion, but serious questions must be answered. I hope that the First Minister in particular will consider the Ministerial Code after this debate. I read it carefully last night and there is no reference to Ministers being

**Karen Sinclair:** Mae'n bwysig bod pobl Cymru'n gwybod ac yn deall beth sy'n mynd ymlaen heddiw, er mor angerddol oedd Peter—a, bois bach, yr oedd yn llawn angerdd. Os yw'r Ceidwadwyr yn credu y gallant dwyllo neb i feddwl mai pryder ynghylch ffermwyr a roddodd fod i'r cynnig hwn, dylent ailfeddwl. Gwyddom fod y cynnig hwn yn ymwneud â dagrau crocodeil, nid premiymau defaid. Gwelsom ymddygiad o'r fath ar ddechrau'r Cynulliad hwn a, gwaetha'r modd, fe'i ceir eto ar ei ddiwedd.

Manteisiaeth lwyr yw'r cynnig o gerydd hwn. Nid oes iddo bwrpas neu fwriad gwreiddiol, ac mae'n dibrisio gwerth y cynnig o gerydd. Cynnig o gerydd yw'r dewis terfynol—yr hyn y troir ato olaf—a dylid ei gadw ar gyfer achlysuron pan fo'r Cynulliad fel cyfangorff, ar draws y pleidiau, yn cytuno bod Gweinidog wedi ymddwyn islaw'r safon y mae gennym hawl i'w disgwyl. Nid yw'r cynnig hwn yn perthyn i'r maes hwnnw o gwbl.

Mae hon yn ymgais i gynnal dadl wleidyddol drwy'r drws cefn. Mae'r adeg yn prysur ddynesu pan glywir dadleuon o'r fath, sef 1 Mai. Wrth gwrs, mae'r Blaid Geidwadol yn osgoi dadl o'r math hwnnw am y gŵyr, pan fydd pobl Cymru'n bwrw eu pleidlais, mai'r un fydd eu dyfarniad am y Toriaid bryd hynny ag y bu yn y 100 mlynedd diwethaf yng Nghymru. Gwyddant nad oes ganddynt gyfle i wneud argraff y tu allan i'r Siambr, felly credant y gallant ddod o hyd i fodd i ddenu sylw at yr hyn sy'n digwydd y tu mewn iddi. Mae'r grŵp Llafur yn gwrthwynebu'r camddefnydd o'r cynnig o gerydd erioed. Mae dibrisio ei werth drwy'r lol a glywsom heddiw yn beth trist. Bydd y grŵp Llafur yn pleidleisio yn erbyn y cynnig.

**Ron Davies:** Siaradaf yn fyr am yr adroddiad gan DEFRA ar gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig, adroddiad a aeth ar goll. Ni phleidleisiaf o blaid y cynnig heddiw, ond mae cwestiynau difrif y bydd yn rhaid eu hateb. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Prif Weinidog yn benodol yn ystyried y Cod Gweinidogol ar ôl y ddadl hon. Fe'i darllenais yn ofalus neithiwr ac nid oes

accountable for their actions, or those of their officials, in running their departments. It seems to me that the Minister's response to the GM report has been guided by the principle of 'Can I get away with it?', not by what is best for the National Assembly. We are told that a mistake by his department's officials was at the heart of this matter. They did not realise that they had received a crucial report from DEFRA, or how important it was. They filed it away and did not tell the Minister. Let us assume that that is true. What does that say about the Minister and the running of his department? For four months, he did not know that he had received the DEFRA report. His officials did not inform him that he had received a crucial report, from a companion department of central Government, which formed an essential part of his work within this National Assembly. For four months, neither he, nor his officials, discussed with DEFRA its latest research on genetic modification, when this matter was crucially important to Wales.

When preparing a regulation, which we debated in December, controlling the release of GM technology, for which this report was essential, neither the Minister, nor his officials, realised the huge gap in their knowledge. Even after DEFRA had published the report on its website prior to Christmas, and that report was public knowledge, neither he nor his officials individually or collectively, realised that they had not received and addressed that report. Finally, despite repeated questions in Committee and in Plenary, the Minister was still incapable of checking with his officials whether they had received this report. I do not believe that the Minister was dishonest, and I give him credit for apologising to the National Assembly last week for the mistake. However, we must ask whether this state of affairs indicates a Minister who is discharging his political and constitutional responsibilities in scrutinising and leading his department in such a way as to inspire confidence. I do not think so. The Minister is responsible for the actions of his officials. In this case, both he and his officials have been found wanting. There is only one course of action that the Minister can

cyfeiriad at atebolrwydd Gweinidogion am eu gweithredoedd hwy, na rhai eu swyddogion, wrth redeg eu hadrannau. Ymddengys i mi fod ymateb y Gweinidog i'r adroddiad ar gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig yn seiliedig ar egwyddor 'A allaf osgoi cael fy nal?', nid ar yr hyn sydd orau i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Dywedir wrthym mai camgymeriad gan swyddogion ei adran a oedd wrth wraidd y mater hwn. Ni sylweddolasant eu bod wedi cael adroddiad tyngedfennol gan DEFRA, na pha mor bwysig ydoedd. Fe'i rhoesant i'w gadw heb ddweud wrth y Gweinidog. Gadewch inni gymryd bod hynny'n wir. Beth a ddywed hynny am y Gweinidog ac am y dull o redeg ei adran? Am bedwar mis, ni wyddai ei fod wedi cael yr adroddiad gan DEFRA. Ni roddodd ei swyddogion wybod iddo ei fod wedi cael adroddiad hollbwysig, oddi wrth gyd-adran mewn Llywodraeth ganolog, a oedd yn rhan hanfodol o'i waith yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol hwn. Am bedwar mis, ni fu trafod rhyngddo ef, na'i swyddogion, gyda DEFRA ar ei hymchwil ddiweddaraf i addasu genetig, er bod y mater hwn yn un hollbwysig i Gymru.

Wrth baratoi rheoliad, y cawsom ddadl arni yn Rhagfyr, sy'n rheoli rhyddhau technoleg addasu genetig, yr oedd yr adroddiad hwn yn anhepgor ar ei chyfer, ni sylweddolodd y Gweinidog, na'i swyddogion, fod bwch anferth yn eu gwybodaeth. Hyd yn oed ar ôl i DEFRA gyhoeddi'r adroddiad ar ei gwefan cyn y Nadolig, pan oedd yr adroddiad hwnnw'n wybodaeth gyhoeddus, ni sylweddolodd ef na'i swyddogion, yn unigol na chymysg, na chawsant yr adroddiad hwnnw a rhoi sylw iddo. Yn olaf, er gofyn dro ar ôl tro yn y Pwyllgor ac yn y Cyfarfod Llawn, ni allai'r Gweinidog holi ei swyddogion i ganfod a oeddent wedi cael yr adroddiad hwn. Ni chredaf fod y Gweinidog yn anonest, ac fe'i canmolaf am ymddiheuro i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yr wythnos diwethaf am y camgymeriad. Er hynny, rhaid inni ofyn a yw'r sefyllfa hon yn arwydd o Weiniadog sy'n cyflawni ei gyfrifoldebau gwleidyddol a chyfansoddiadol wrth archwilio ac arwain ei adran yn y fath fodd ag i ennyn hyder. Ni chredaf hynny. Mae'r Gweinidog yn gyfrifol am weithredoedd ei swyddogion. Yn yr achos hwn, cafwyd ef a'i swyddogion yn eisiau. Nid oes ond un ffordd

honourably take if he wishes to restore the good name of his officials, his department and the National Assembly for Wales, and that is to resign on a matter of principle.

**David Davies:** This motion has been proposed today, not only because of the Agriculture Department's incompetence, but because of the Minister's failure to recognise or accept that that incompetence exists. We have heard about a series of problems today, and I will mention two others. The first is the Farming Connect scheme, which has put £7 million into the hands of consultants, and the fallen stock regulations—nobody knows how they will be implemented, least of all the farmers. The First Minister did not appear even to know what they were about last week. The focus has been on the Agriculture Department and on support payments, the lateness of which has caused so much hardship to farmers across Wales. Farmers have been further angered by the attitude of the Minister and the First Minister, who have repeated the mantra that the payments are not late, but are being paid within European Union guidelines. You know perfectly well, Minister, that you are insulting everybody's intelligence. The EU guidelines are not a recommended timetable for payments. They specify the point at which a lack of payment will trigger financial penalties. You stated that anyone suffering hardship as a result of the payments not being made could be entitled to a special one-off payment—if they send in humiliating bank slips and letters from their bank managers.

Until now, that has been criticised as a humiliation of hard-working people who have done no wrong. However, we should also reflect on the fact that the use of that procedure is an admission that the payments are late. If these payments were on time, why would it be necessary to bring forward special measures? In my efforts to get at the truth, I have spoken informally to civil servants in the Agriculture Department. They are not all muddled, Minister, much as you would like them to be. One of them told me an interesting tale. He said that it was not your fault. Do not blame Mike, he said, he inherited this mess. I therefore made further inquiries and I was told that people had been

o weithredu y gall y Gweinidog ei ddilyn yn anrhydeddus os yw'n dymuno adfer enw da ei swyddogion, ei adran a Chynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, a hynny yw ymddiswyddo ar fater o egwyddor.

**David Davies:** Cynigiwyd y cynnig hwn heddiw, nid yn unig oherwydd anallu'r Adran Amaethyddiaeth, ond am fod y Gweinidog wedi methu â chydabod neu dderbyn bodolaeth yr anallu hwnnw. Clywsom am gyfres o broblemau heddiw, a soniaf am ddau arall. Y gyntaf yw cynllun Cyswllt Ffermio, sydd wedi rhoi £7 miliwn yn nwylo ymgynghorwyr, a'r rheoliadau anifeiliaid marw—ni w'yr neb, a'r ffermwyr yn lleiaf oll, sut y cânt eu gweithredu. Ymddangosai yr wythnos diwethaf nad oedd y Prif Weinidog hyd yn oed yn gwybod â beth yr oeddent yn ymwneud. Canolbwyntiwyd ar yr Adran Amaethyddiaeth ac ar gymorthdaliadau, y mae eu hwyrni wedi peri cymaint o galedi i ffermwyr ledled Cymru. Mae ffermwyr wedi'u digio ymhellach gan agwedd y Gweinidog a'r Prif Weinidog, sydd wedi ailadrodd y mantra nad yw'r taliadau'n hwyr, a'u bod yn cael eu talu'n unol â chanllawiau'r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Gwyddoch yn iawn, Weinidog, mai sarhad ar ddeallusrwydd pawb yw dweud hynny. Nid yw canllawiau'r UE yn amserlen a argymhellir ar gyfer taliadau. Maent yn nodi'r adeg y bydd diffyg talu yn arwain at gosbau ariannol. Dywedasoeh y gallai rhywun sy'n dioddef caledi am na wnaed taliadau fod â hawl i gael taliad unigryw arbennig—os anfonai slipiau banc a llythrau oddi wrth ei reolwr banc, a fyddai'n codi cywilydd arno.

Hyd yma, bu beirniadu ar hynny am ei fod yn codi cywilydd ar bobl weithgar na wnaethant ddim o'i le. Fodd bynnag, dylem hefyd fyfyrion ynghylch y ffaith bod defnyddio'r weithdrefn honno'n gyfaddefiad bod y taliadau'n hwyr. Os oedd y taliadau hyn yn brydlon, pam y byddai angen cyflwyno mesurau arbennig? Wrth ymdrechu i gael at y gwir, yr wyf wedi siarad yn anffurfiol â gweision sifil yn yr Adran Amaethyddiaeth. Nid ydynt i gyd yn ddrislyd, Weinidog, er cymaint y dymunech iddynt fod. Gwnaeth un ohonynt ddweud hanes diddorol wrthyf. Dywedodd nad arnoch chi yr oedd y bai. Peidiwch â bwrw'r bai ar Mike, meddai, fe etifeddodd ef y llanastr hwn. Gan hynny,

warning for months that the new computer system would be a disaster. Despite that, someone made the decision to go ahead with it. When it was clear that it would be a disaster, as if by magic, along came Mike German looking for a ministerial job and he became the patsy who would take the blame for everything that went wrong.

I have no way of knowing how much of this is true. For all I know the Minister could have told him to say those things to me, knowing that I was to speak in this debate. I have no way of knowing. However, Mike, you have been in politics for longer than I have. If there is any truth in this—and it has the ring of truth about it—you have made a big political mistake. You have bought the lie that nothing is wrong and have repeated it endlessly when what you should have done, and you can still do it now, was to find out how much of this shambles resulted from decisions made by the previous Minister for Rural Development, or at least when he was the Minister—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. You are out of time.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Minister, I will quote some words that have come back to haunt you. Can you remember when you said them and about whom? I admit that I have taken some sentences out of context, but I could not resist doing so today. You said:

‘The result has been unexciting, underwhelming and uninspiring. We must change...starting with a change of leadership.’

‘Therefore for the real people of the south Wales Valleys, of the west and north of our country, for the future credibility of the Assembly and for the very principle of devolution...we ask you to go.’

‘We move this motion today...not because of her lack of enthusiasm but her lack of

gwneuthum ymholiadau pellach a dywedwyd wrthyf fod pobl yn rhybuddio ers misoedd y byddai'r system gyfrifiadurol newydd yn drychineb. Er hynny, penderfynodd rhywun fwrw ymlaen â hi. Pan oedd yn amlwg y byddai'n drychineb, megis drwy hudoliaeth, dyma Mike German yn dod heibio gan chwilio am swydd weinidogol ac ef a ddaeth yn fwch dihangol a gâi'r bai am bob dim a âi o'i le.

Nid oes gennyf unrhyw fodd i wybod faint o hynny sy'n wir. Am wn i, gallai'r Gweinidog fod wedi dweud wrtho am ddweud y pethau hynny wrthyf, gan wybod fy mod i siarad yn y ddadl hon. Nid oes gennyf fodd i wybod. Fodd bynnag, Mike, buoch mewn gwleidyddiaeth yn hwy na mi. Os oes unrhyw wir yn hynny—ac mae tinc gwirionedd ynddo—gwnaethoch gamgymeriad gwleidyddol mawr. Yr ydych wedi coelio'r celwydd nad oes dim o'i le ac wedi'i ailadrodd yn ddiidwedd, yn hytrach na gwneud yr hyn y dylech fod wedi'i wneud, ac y gallwch ei wneud o hyd, sef darganfod faint o'r llanestr hwn sy'n ganlyniad i benderfyniadau y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig blaenorol, neu o leiaf pan oedd ef yn Weinidog—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'ch amser ar ben.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Weinidog, gwnaf ddyfynnu ychydig o eiriau sydd wedi dod yn ôl i'ch plagio. A allwch gofio pa bryd y gwnaethoch eu llefaru ac am bwy? Yr wyf yn cyfaddef fy mod wedi tynnu rhai o'r brawddegau o'u cyd-destun, ond ni allwn ymatal rhag gwneud hynny heddiw. Dywedasoeh:

‘Bu'r canlyniad yn ddigynnwrf, yn ddiysgogiad ac yn anysbyrdolgar. Rhaid inni newid...gan ddechrau gyda newid arweinyddiaeth.’

‘Felly, er mwyn pobl go iawn cymoedd y de, pobl gorllewin a gogledd ein gwlad, er mwyn hygrededd y Cynulliad i'r dyfodol ac er mwyn holl egwyddor datganoli...gofynnwn ichi fynd.’

‘Yr ydym yn rhoi'r cynnig hwn gerbron heddiw...nid oherwydd ei diffyg brwdfrydedd

competence.’

‘...is still in charge of Welsh agriculture by dint of an astonishing affront to democracy.’

Minister, the biggest affront to democracy is your being a Minister and Deputy First Minister when you only received 3,543 votes. However, I will not be as cruel as you were when you censured Christine Gwyther and Alun Michael, mainly because I do not want to play Tory games, but I assure you that I am sorely tempted to press the ‘for’ button when it comes to the vote.

**The Deputy First Minister and Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad (Michael German):** I thank the Conservatives for reminding us how crucial censure motions are to the agricultural policies of the Conservative Party and how shabby it is to politicise these serious issues.

We all have our eyes on the upcoming election and there is nothing wrong with campaigning to win an election. However, even if we accept that today’s debate is all about electioneering, because it clearly does nothing to scrutinise Government policy, what does it say about the state of the Conservatives’ election campaign? It says that the Conservatives have no policies to offer Welsh agriculture, that they have no ideas, and that the party led by the silent man can only offer noise. I have already responded to the points at issue in this Chamber, but I am happy to do so again.

First, on farming subsidies, we all share the objective of making payments to farmers promptly. The delays have concerned many. Payments are now going through and are accelerating by the day: 96 per cent of sheep annual payments and 70 per cent of arable payments have been made. Payments for farm improvement, farm enterprise and woodland grants are restarting this week.

I am taken aback by the suggestion, however veiled, that the information that I gave to the Assembly last week on the GM crop report

ond oherwydd ei diffyg cymhwysedd.’

‘...yn dal i fod â gofal dros amaethyddiaeth Cymru er sarhad rhyfeddol i ddemocratiaeth.’

Weinidog, y sarhad mwyaf i ddemocratiaeth yw’r ffaith eich bod yn Weinidog ac yn Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog a chithau ond wedi cael 3,543 o bleidleisiau. Er hynny, ni fyddaf mor greulon ag y buoch chi pan wnaethoch geryddu Christine Gwyther a Alun Michael, yn bennaf am nad wyf am chwarae gemau’r Toriaid, ond yr wyf yn eich sicrhau y caf fy nhentio’n arw i bwyso’r botwm ‘o blaid’ pan ddaw at y bleidlais.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a’r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor (Michael German):** Diolchaf i’r Ceidwadwyr am ein hatgoffa mor hanfodol yw cynigion o gerydd i bolisiau amaethyddol y Blaid Geidwadol ac mor wael yw gwleidyddoli’r materion difrifol hyn.

Mae pawb ohonom â’n golygon ar yr etholiad sy’n dod ac nid oes dim o’i le ar ymgyrchu i ennill etholiad. Fodd bynnag, hyd yn oed os derbyniwn fod y ddadl heddiw’n ymwneud yn gyfan gwbl ag ymgyrchu, gan ei bod yn amlwg nad yw’n gwneud dim i graffu ar bolisi’r Llywodraeth, beth y mae’n ei ddweud am gyflwr ymgyrch etholiadol y Ceidwadwyr? Dywed nad oes gan y Ceidwadwyr unrhyw bolisiau i’w cynnig i amaethyddiaeth yng Nghymru, nad oes ganddynt syniadau, ac mai’r cwbl y gall y blaid a arweinir gan y dyn distaw ei gynnig yw sŵn. Yr wyf eisoes wedi ymateb i’r pwyntiau dan sylw yn y Siambr hon, ond yr wyf yn falch o wneud hynny eto.

Yn gyntaf, ynghylch cymorthdaliadau ffermio, yr ydym oll yn rhannu’r amcan o roi taliadau i ffermwyr yn brydlon. Bu’r oedi’n destun pryder i lawer. Mae taliadau’n mynd drwodd yn awr a hynny’n gyflymach bob dydd: gwnaed 96 y cant o’r taliadau blynyddol defaid a 70 y cant o’r taliadau tir âr. Mae taliadau am wella ffermydd, menter ffermydd a grantiau coetir yn ailgychwyn yr wythnos hon.

Fe’m synnwyd gan yr awgrym, ni waeth pa mor aneglur ydoedd, fod y wybodaeth a roddais i’r Cynulliad yr wythnos diwethaf am

was in some way still obscuring the truth. Today, as promised, I have published a full chronology of the events relating to that report. There is nothing questionable about what happened and it is absurd to suggest otherwise. I also refute the idea that this report would have had a substantive effect on the debate on the deliberate release directive in December. The report's evidence broadly supports the Assembly's policy of adopting a restrictive approach to GM crops. We are under an obligation to implement this European directive, and the report reinforces our policy.

Given the wide-ranging nature of today's motion, I welcome the opportunity to promote the imaginative, comprehensive and effective programme being pursued by this Government. The Welsh Assembly Government has put in place a programme signed up to by all stakeholders and parties, and which has been backed by substantial additional funding. This year, the Welsh Assembly Government has announced an almost 10 per cent increase on last year's budget—that is worth £22 million—which has been channelled into supporting agriculture and rural Wales. This includes an extra £4.5 million for Tir Gofal; an extra £10 million over three years to tackle scrapie; and just over £3 million for rural community action, helping businesses and local services in rural areas—all unique to Wales. The reduction of livestock movement restrictions from 20 days to six days was not achieved without a great deal of hard discussion with DEFRA Ministers. It also came about because I listened to farmers' concerns and acted upon them. Wales is leading the way in the agri-food strategy. In Wales, the amount of grant awarded to support investment in food processing now stands at £16.8 million—more than is available for the whole of England.

3.20 p.m.

I am proud to be a member of the

yr adroddiad ar gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig yn dal i guddio'r gwirionedd mewn rhyw fodd. Heddiw, fel yr addawyd, yr wyf wedi cyhoeddi cronoleg lawn o'r digwyddiadau sy'n gysylltiedig â'r adroddiad hwnnw. Nid oes dim amheus ynghylch yr hyn a ddigwyddodd ac afresymol yw awgrymu fel arall. Yr wyf hefyd yn gwrthod y syniad y byddai'r adroddiad wedi cael effaith o bwys ar y ddadl ar y gyfarwyddeb ar ollwng yn fwriadol yn Rhagfyr. Mae'r dystiolaeth yn yr adroddiad yn ategu'n gyffredinol bolisi'r Cynulliad o gymryd agwedd gyfyngiadol at gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig. Yr ydym yn gorfod rhoi'r gyfarwyddeb Ewropeaidd hon ar waith, ac mae'r adroddiad yn argyferthu ein polisi.

O ystyried natur gynhwysfawr y cynnig heddiw, croesawaf y cyfle i sôn am rinweddau'r rhaglen effeithiol, gynhwysfawr a llawn dychymyg a weithredir gan y Llywodraeth hon. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi rhoi rhaglen ar waith a gafodd gefnogaeth yr holl randdeiliaid a phleidiau, ac a ategwyd drwy gyllid ychwanegol sylweddol. Eleni, cyhoeddodd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gynnydd o ymron i 10 y cant o'i gymharu â'r gyllideb ar gyfer y flwyddyn ddiwethaf—sy'n werth £22 miliwn—a gyfeiriwyd at hybu amaethyddiaeth a'r Gymru wledig. Mae hyn yn cynnwys £4.5 miliwn yn ychwanegol ar gyfer Tir Gofal; £10 miliwn yn ychwanegol dros dair blynedd i ymdrin â'r ysfaf; ac ychydig dros £3 miliwn ar gyfer gweithredu cymunedol gwledig, sy'n cynorthwyo busnesau a gwasanaethau lleol mewn ardaloedd gwledig—y cwbl yn unigryw i Gymru. Ni chyflawnwyd y gostyngiad yn y cyfyngiadau ar symud da byw o 20 niwrnod i chwe diwrnod heb lawer iawn o drafod caled gyda Gweinidogion DEFRA. Digwyddodd hefyd am fy mod wedi gwrandao ar bryderon ffermwyr ac wedi gweithredu ar sail hynny. Mae Cymru'n arwain y ffordd yn y strategaeth bwyd-amaeth. Yng Nghymru, mae'r swm o grantiau a ddyfernir i gynnal buddsoddi mewn prosesu bwyd bellach yn £6.8 miliwn—mwy na'r hyn sydd ar gael i Loegr gyfan.

Yr wyf yn falch o fod yn aelod o'r



Government that has delivered for farmers. These achievements compare positively with 18 years of Tory misrule; they compare even more positively with the incoherent alternative suggested by the Conservatives. The Conservatives failed to take up millions of pounds from Europe that could have gone—and would still be going—to Welsh farmers; the Welsh Assembly Government has substantially increased the budget for agriculture. The Conservatives saw farming lurch from crisis to crisis in Wales without any long-term vision or positive action; the Welsh Assembly Government has put ‘Farming for the Future’ in place, a long-term vision made in Wales which attracts all-party support. The Conservatives presided over cuts to rural services, to our schools, our health service, public transport and local businesses; the Welsh Assembly Government has increased investment in all of those services. We have made a massive investment in rate relief to assist rural businesses. Rural development is a key objective of the Welsh Assembly Government; for the Conservatives, it is just another vessel for noise and no policy.

When people turn their attention to the Assembly in the May election, they will appraise Iain Duncan Smith’s Conservative Party and censure it for being a party with no ideas, no policies and no stomach for government.

Beth a ddisgwyliech gan ful ond cic?

**Nick Bourne:** It is disappointing that the Minister did not have anything constructive to say. Indeed, he had little at all to say about late payments and nothing constructive to say about GM crops. We had hoped to at least highlight these issues today.

I will first pick up on some of the contributions. Most notable today has been how little support the Minister has had from speakers from any part of the Assembly.

Llywodraeth a aeth â’r maen i’r wal dros ffermwyr. Mae’r cyflawniadau hyn yn cymharu’n ffafriol â 18 mlynedd o gamreolaeth Doriaidd; maent yn fwy ffafriol byth o’u cymharu â’r dewis aneglur a awgrymir gan y Ceidwadwyr. Methodd y Ceidwadwyr â chymryd miliynau o bunnoedd gan Ewrop a allai fod wedi mynd—ac a fyddai’n mynd o hyd—i ffermwyr Cymru; mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi cynyddu’r gyllideb ar gyfer amaethyddiaeth yn sylweddol. O dan y Ceidwadwyr, aeth ffermio o’r naill argyfwng i’r llall yng Nghymru heb unrhyw weledigaeth dymor hir na gweithredu cadarnhaol; mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi rhoi ‘Ffermio i’r Dyfodol’ ar waith, sy’n weledigaeth dymor hir a wnaed yng Nghymru ac a gefnogir gan yr holl bleidiau. Cafwyd toriadau o dan law’r Ceidwadwyr mewn gwasanaethau gwledig, yn ein hysgolion, ein gwasanaeth iechyd, trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus a busnesau lleol; mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi buddsoddi mwy ym mhob un o’r gwasanaethau hynny. Yr ydym wedi rhoi buddsoddiad anferth mewn rhyddhad o drethi i gynorthwyo busnesau gwledig. Mae datblygu gwledig yn amcan allweddol gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru; i’r Ceidwadwyr, nid yw ond un llestr arall i wneud sŵn a dim polisi.

Pan fydd pobl yn troi eu sylw at y Cynulliad yn etholiad mis Mai, byddant yn pwysu a mesur Plaid Geidwadol Iain Duncan Smith ac yn ei cheryddu am ei bod yn blaid heb syniadau, heb bolisiâu a heb awydd llywodraethu.

What should you expect from an ass but a kick?

**Nick Bourne:** Mae’n siomedig nad oedd gan y Gweinidog unrhyw beth adeiladol i’w ddweud. Yn wir, ychydig a oedd ganddo i’w ddweud o gwbl am daliadau hwyr ac nid oedd ganddo ddim byd adeiladol i’w ddweud am gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig. Yr oeddem wedi gobeithio tynnu sylw at y materion hynny o leiaf heddiw.

Yn gyntaf, cyfeiriaf at rai o’r cyfraniadau. Yr hyn a oedd yn fwyaf trawiadol heddiw oedd cyn lleied o gefnogaeth a gafodd y Gweinidog gan siaradwyr o unrhyw garfan

Obviously, he had some half-hearted support from the Liberal Democrat member, who I am surprised wanted to quote Brynle Williams. I have before me exactly what he said about the Minister; I will read it for you.

‘As far as I am concerned, Minister, you haven’t got a clue. What really concerns me about Mike German is that he may be a very nice man, but he knows blankety-blank-all about farming.’

I am glad that you think his views are important, Mick. Brynle Williams may want Mike German in post, but probably only so that he is sure to win the election—I can well understand that. The Labour Chief Whip was rolled out, as chief whips are, to say something positive about the Minister, but she struggled to do so. Ron Davies spoke for many people in his contribution; we felt a frisson run along the front bench and among the Liberal Democrat Members when he spoke, because we all knew that he spoke the truth. Lorraine Barrett made a brave speech, and I am disappointed that she cannot vote in favour of this motion.

This motion is about improving agriculture and ensuring that farmers get a fair deal in Wales, which currently they do not. The most disappointing contribution—although I realise that he was ill-prepared—was from Plaid Cymru’s spokesman, Rhodri Glyn Thomas. On 28 January—just a week ago—he thought it best for the Minister to go. Addressing the First Minister, he said:

‘When we returned to the Assembly in the autumn, many of us believed that the rural economy’s situation could not get any worse. However, you decided to appoint Michael German as the Minister responsible for agriculture and rural development. In the face of calls from two representative and informed groups for his resignation because of two separate matters, and the constant criticism by many individuals and groups of his failure to deal with matters within his portfolio, do you accept that the biggest contribution that

yn y Cynulliad. Wrth gwrs, cafodd ychydig o gefnogaeth lugoer gan yr Aelod Democratiaidd Rhyddfrydol, y synnais ei fod am ddyfynnu geiriau Brynle Williams. Mae’r union eiriau a lefarodd am y Gweinidog gennyf o’ m blaen; fe’u darllenaf i chi.

Yn fy marn i, Weinidog, nid oes gennych syniad. Yr hyn sy’n fy mhoeni o ddifrif am Mike German yw y gallai fod yn ddyn dymunol iawn, ond mae’n gwbl ddi-glem am ffermio.

Yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn credu bod ei farn yn bwysig, Mick. Efallai fod Brynle Williams yn dymuno i Mike German fod yn ei swydd, ond nid yw hynny ond i sicrhau ei fod yn ennill yr etholiad, yn ôl pob tebyg—gallaf ddeall hynny’n iawn. Daethpwyd â Phrif Chwip Llafur allan, fel y gwneir â phrif chwipiaid, i ddweud rhywbeth cadarnhaol am y Gweinidog, ond fe’i cafodd yn anodd gwneud hynny. Siaradodd Ron Davies dros lawer yn ei gyfraniad ef; teimlem ias ar hyd y fainc flaen ac ymysg Aelodau’r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol pan siaradodd, am fod pob un ohonom yn gwybod ei fod yn dweud y gwir. Gwnaeth Lorraine Barrett araith ddewr, ac yr wyf yn siomedig na all bleidleisio o blaid y cynnig hwn.

Mae’r cynnig hwn yn ymwneud â gwella amaethyddiaeth a sicrhau bod ffermwyr yn cael bargaen deg yng Nghymru, ac nid ydynt yn cael hynny ar hyn o bryd. Y cyfraniad mwyaf siomedig—er fy mod yn sylweddoli bod diffyg paratoi ar ei ran—oedd yr un gan lefarydd Plaid Cymru, Rhodri Glyn Thomas. Ar 28 Ionawr—dim ond wythnos yn ôl—credai mai’r peth gorau fyddai i’r Gweinidog fynd. Wrth annerch y Prif Weinidog, dywedodd:

‘Pan ddychwelasom i’r Cynulliad yn yr hydref, credai llawer ohonom na allai sefyllfa’r economi wledig waethygu. Fodd bynnag, bu ichi benderfynu penodi Michael German yn Weinidog â chyfrifoldeb dros amaeth a datblygu gwledig. Yn wyneb galwadau gan ddau grŵp cynrychioladol, gwybodus am ei ymddiswyddiad oherwydd dau fater gwahanol, a’r feirniadaeth gyson ohono gan lu o unigolion a grwpiau am iddo fethu â delio â materion o fewn ei bortffolio, a dderbyniwch mai’r cyfraniad mwyaf y

you could make to advance the rural economy would be to get rid of him and that that would be warmly welcomed in rural areas?’

I realise that politicians change their minds on issues; I have done so myself on occasion, but a cartwheel in a week?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The time for this debate has elapsed.

Galwaf am bleidlais ar y cynnig o gerydd.

O blaid pedwar, ymatal deg, yn erbyn 26. Felly, gwrthodwyd y cynnig.

**Alun Cairns:** Point of order. I wish to protest about the result; it is inaccurate. I saw seven lights in favour of the motion on the voting panels. Members’ voting intentions are clearly not reflected in the result.

**The Presiding Officer:** Which Members voted for the motion? I ask for a show of hands. We now have a record of that.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Ymhellach i’r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, credaf fod y nifer a ymataliodd yn anghywir hefyd.

**Y Llywydd:** O’r gorau, gofynnaf i’r Aelodau a ymataliodd i godi eu dwylo. Cofnodir y nifer gywir yng Nghofnod y Trafodion.

**Karen Sinclair:** Further to that point of order, I request the number who voted against the motion also be checked.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae’n debyg bod nam ar ein system pleidleisio. Felly, bydd rhaid inni bleidleisio drwy alw enwau.

gallech ei wneud i hybu’r economi wledig yw cael gwared ohono ac y byddai hynny’n cael ei groesawu’n fawr yng nghefn gwlad?’

Sylweddolaf fod gwleidyddion yn newid eu meddwl am bynciau; gwneuthum hynny fy hun o bryd i’w gilydd, ond troi fel olwyn o fewn wythnos?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae’r amser ar gyfer y ddadl hon wedi dod i ben.

I call for a vote on this censure motion.

For 4, abstain 10, against 26. Therefore, the motion has been rejected.

**Alun Cairns:** Pwynt o drefn. Dymunaf brotestio am y canlyniad; mae’n anghywir. Gwelais saith golau o blaid y cynnig ar y paneli pleidleisio. Mae’n amlwg nad yw bwriadau pleidleisio Aelodau wedi’u hadlewyrchu yn y canlyniad.

**Y Llywydd:** Pa Aelodau a bleidleisiodd o blaid y cynnig? Gofynnaf ichi ddangos eich dwylo. Mae gennym gofnod o hynny’n awr.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Further to that point of order, I believe that the number of those who abstained is also incorrect.

**The Presiding Officer:** Very well, I ask the Members who abstained to raise their hands. The correct number will be recorded in the Record of Proceedings.

**Karen Sinclair:** Ymhellach i’r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, gofynnaf am wirio’r nifer a bleidleisiodd yn erbyn y cynnig hefyd.

**The Presiding Officer:** It seems that we have a problem with our voting system. Therefore, it will be necessary to vote by roll call.

*Cynnig (NNDM1331): O blaid 7, Ymatal 14, Yn erbyn 32.*

*Motion (NNDM1331): For 7, Abstain 14, Against 32.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter

Jones, David Ian  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Rogers, Peter

Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.  
Motion rejected.*

3.30 p.m.

### **Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Gwasanaethau Maethu (Cymru) 2003 Approval of the Fostering Services (Wales) Regulations 2003**

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Fostering Services (Wales) Regulations 2003 laid in the Table Office on 24 January 2003. (NDM1328)*

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Gwasanaethau Maethu (Cymru) 2003 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Ionawr 2003.*

(NDM1328)

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

1. *considers the report of the Legislation Committee which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the Fostering Services (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 21 January 2002;*

1. *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5, mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Gwasanaethau Maethu (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 21 Ionawr 2002;*

2. *approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft and the regulatory impact assessment laid in the Table Office on 24 January 2003. (NDM1329)*

2. *yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a'r asesiad o effaith rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Ionawr 2003. (NDM1329)*

These regulations, which only apply to Wales, provide a new regulatory framework for fostering services, whether local authorities, voluntary organisations or independent fostering agencies provide them. In Wales, the regulations will replace the Foster Placement (Children) Regulations 1991, which govern the approval of foster parents by local authorities, voluntary organisations and independent fostering agencies and the placement of children with foster parents under the Children Act 1989. The proposed national minimum standards, to be considered separately under Standing Order No. 27 procedure, will support and supplement the specific requirements of the regulations.

Mae'r rheoliadau hyn, sy'n berthnasol i Gymru'n unig, yn darparu fframwaith rheoliadol newydd ar gyfer gwasanaethau maethu, boed y rheini wedi'u darparu gan awdurdodau lleol, cyrff gwirfoddol neu asiantaethau maethu annibynnol. Yng Nghymru, bydd y rheoliadau'n cymryd lle Rheoliadau Lleoliadau Maethu (Plant) 1991, sy'n llywodraethu'r cymeradwyo ar rieni maeth gan awdurdodau lleol, cyrff gwirfoddol ac asiantaethau maethu annibynnol a lleoli plant gyda rhieni maeth o dan y Ddeddf Plant 1989. Bydd y safonau cenedlaethol gofynnol, sydd i'w hystyried ar wahân o dan weithdrefn Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 27, yn ategu ac yn ychwanegu at y gofynion penodol yn y rheoliadau.

Consultation with local authorities and a wide range of other stakeholders on the draft regulations and national minimum standards ended on 30 October 2001. Overall responses received were positive and respondents understood that new regulations and common minimum standards for fostering services were both necessary and desirable.

Daeth yr ymgynghori ag awdurdodau lleol ac amrywiaeth eang o randdeiliaid eraill ar y rheoliadau a'r safonau cenedlaethol gofynnol drafft i ben ar 30 Hydref 2001. Mae'r ymatebion a gafwyd yn gadarnhaol at ei gilydd ac yr oedd y rhai a ymatebodd yn deall ei bod yn angenrheidiol ac yn ddymunol cael rheoliadau newydd a safonau gofynnol cyffredin ar gyfer gwasanaethau maethu.

The regulations will require the registration and inspection of fostering agencies for the first time and the inspection of the fostering functions of local authorities by the National Assembly for Wales through the Care Standards Inspectorate. It has long been recognised that independent fostering

Bydd y rheoliadau'n mynnu y caiff asiantaethau maethu eu cofrestru a'u harolygu am y tro cyntaf ac y caiff swyddogaethau maethu awdurdodau lleol eu harolygu gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru drwy'r Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal. Cydnabyddir ers amser maith bod rhaid

agencies must be regulated to protect the safety and promote the welfare of children who are being provided with carers. These regulations provide the statutory basis for bringing independent fostering agencies within the regulatory framework in Wales.

The regulations require independent fostering agencies to register with the Care Standards Inspectorate before they will be allowed to operate. They must meet the requirements for registration that are set out in the Care Standards Act 2000 and in these regulations, which are amplified in the proposed national minimum standards. Voluntary organisations, such as Barnardo's, which provide fostering services in their own right, will be required to register in the same way with the Care Standards Inspectorate. The regulations also require the inspection of local authority fostering services. Provision is made for the payment of fees for registration and inspection by agencies and for inspection by local authorities. The aim is to achieve a consistent standard across the fostering services provided by local authorities, independent agencies and voluntary organisations.

**Pauline Jarman:** These regulations are welcome. Minimum standards will allow much greater transparency and clarity about what can be expected from a fostering service. The regulations will create consistent standards that can be applied across the independent, voluntary and public sectors. They are welcome because they advance the area of child protection and they provide for the continued support of those children who are being looked after by foster carers. They will also assist in the recruitment and retention of foster carers as standards and perceptions of fostering are increased.

The Minister will be aware that these regulations came into effect in England in April 2002. Given that some agencies have their head offices in England, but operate their fostering service in Wales, which inspection teams will inspect the service in Wales in those circumstances? Will it be the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales or its equivalent in England?

rheoleiddio asiantaethau maethu annibynnol er mwyn diogelu a hyrwyddo lles plant y darperir gofalwyr ar eu cyfer. Y rheoliadau hyn yw'r sylfaen statudol i ddod ag asiantaethau maethu annibynnol i mewn i'r fframwaith rheoliadol yng Nghymru.

Mae'r rheoliadau'n mynnu bod asiantaethau maethu annibynnol yn cofrestru gyda'r Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal cyn y caniateir iddynt weithredu. Rhaid iddynt fodloni'r gofynion ar gyfer cofrestru a nodir yn y Ddeddf Safonau Gofal 2000 ac yn y rheoliadau hyn, yr ymhelaethir arnynt yn y safonau cenedlaethol gofynnol arfaethedig. Bydd cyrff gwirfoddol, fel Barnardos, sy'n darparu gwasanaethau maethu drwy eu hawl eu hun, yn gorfod cofrestru yn yr un modd gyda'r Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal. Mae'r rheoliadau hefyd yn mynnu y caiff gwasanaethau maethu awdurdodau lleol eu harolygu. Darperir ar gyfer talu ffioedd am gofrestru ac arolygu gan asiantaethau ac am arolygu gan awdurdodau lleol. Y nod yw sicrhau safon gyson yn yr holl wasanaethau maethu a ddarperir gan awdurdodau lleol, asiantaethau annibynnol a chyrff gwirfoddol.

**Pauline Jarman:** Mae'r rheoliadau hyn i'w croesawu. Bydd safonau gofynnol yn caniatáu llawer mwy o dryloywder ac eglurder o ran yr hyn y gellir ei ddisgwyl gan wasanaeth maethu. Bydd y rheoliadau'n creu safonau cyson y gellir eu cymhwyso ar draws y sectorau annibynnol, gwirfoddol a chyhoeddus. Maent i'w croesawu am eu bod yn hyrwyddo maes amddiffyn plant a darparant ar gyfer cymorth parhaus i'r plant hynny sy'n derbyn gofal gan ofalwyr maeth. Byddant o gymorth hefyd i recriwtio a chadw gofalwyr maeth wrth godi safonau a gwella canfyddiadau o faethu.

Bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol bod y rheoliadau hyn wedi dod i rym yn Lloegr yn Ebrill 2002. O ystyried bod rhai asiantaethau â'u prif swyddfeydd yn Lloegr, ond yn gweithredu eu gwasanaeth maethu yng Nghymru, pa dimau arolygu a fydd yn arolygu'r gwasanaeth yng Nghymru o dan yr amgylchiadau hynny? Ai Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru neu'r hyn sy'n cyfateb iddi yn Lloegr?

To be responsible for the care of a child or children who have been placed in your home by an authority, to work with that authority and with all who are involved in helping children to fulfil their potential, requires a remarkable commitment. I trust that the standards that are set out in these regulations will ensure that foster carers can continue in their role of providing day-to-day care for the children whom they look after, and can continue accommodating the particular demands of children who are separated from their families. These regulations will create a level playing field for the fostering service throughout Wales. Will the Minister indicate how these services will be inspected?

**Kirsty Williams:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats commend these regulations, and will gladly support them today.

**David Melding:** The Welsh Conservative group also welcomes these regulations. It is important that, as a matter of national policy, we encourage those who provide fostering services. The retention, training and recruitment of foster carers is an important part of delivering better children's services. Those services, as various joint reviews have revealed, are poor. I welcome the regulations as part of a package that will improve the quality of care that we can deliver in this area.

We must be vigilant. Nobody wants to see mistakes similar to those that were made in residential children's homes being repeated in a system where foster care has largely replaced residential homes. We must assure the public that the highest standards will be applied, and that the children who are being looked after receive the basic human right to a loving and nurturing home.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I thank Pauline, Kirsty and David for their support. As David said, most children who require it are now in foster care. These regulations will improve the quality of foster care. We are supporting local authorities through Children First; we are expanding the budget for local authorities so that they can take forward the work involved in supporting our most vulnerable children.

Er mwyn bod yn gyfrifol am ofal plentyn neu blant y mae awdurdod wedi'u lleoli yn eich cartref, a gweithio gyda'r awdurdod hwnnw a phawb sy'n gysylltiedig â helpu plant i gyflawni eu potensial, rhaid wrth ymrwymiad rhyfeddol. Hyderaf y bydd y safonau a nodir yn y rheoliadau hyn yn sicrhau bod gofalwyr maeth yn gallu parhau â'u rôl o ddarparu gofal o ddydd i ddydd ar gyfer y plant yn eu gofal, ac y gallant barhau i ddarparu ar gyfer gofynion penodol plant sydd wedi'u gwahanu oddi wrth eu teuluoedd. Bydd y rheoliadau hyn yn creu sefyllfa deg ar gyfer y gwasanaeth maethu ledled Cymru. A wnaiff y Gweinidog nodi sut y caiff y gwasanaethau hyn eu harolygu?

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn cymeradwyo'r rheoliadau hyn, a byddant yn falch o'u cefnogi heddiw.

**David Melding:** Mae grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru hefyd yn croesawu'r rheoliadau hyn. Mae'n bwysig, fel mater o bolisi cenedlaethol, ein bod yn cefnogi'r sawl sy'n darparu gwasanaethau maethu. Mae cadw, hyfforddi a recriwtio gofalwyr maeth yn bwysig wrth sicrhau gwell gwasanaethau plant. Mae'r gwasanaethau hynny, fel y mae amryw o adolygiadau ar y cyd wedi dangos, yn wael. Croesawaf y rheoliadau fel rhan o becyn a fydd yn gwella ansawdd y gofal y gallwn ei ddarparu yn y maes hwn.

Rhaid inni fod yn wylidwrus. Nid oes neb am weld ailadrodd camgymeriadau tebyg i'r rhai mewn cartrefi plant preswyl mewn system lle y mae gofal maeth wedi cymryd lle cartrefi preswyl i raddau helaeth. Rhaid inni sicrhau'r cyhoedd y bydd y safonau uchaf yn cael eu cymhwyso, a bod y plant sy'n derbyn gofal yn cael yr hawl ddynol sylfaenol i gartref cariadus i'w magu.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Diolchaf i Pauline, Kirsty a David am eu cefnogaeth. Fel y dywedodd David, mae'r rhan fwyaf o blant y mae ei angen arnynt yn derbyn gofal maeth bellach. Bydd y rheoliadau hyn yn gwella ansawdd gofal maeth. Yr ydym yn cynorthwyo awdurdodau lleol drwy Rhoi Plant yn Gyntaf; yr ydym yn cynyddu'r gyllideb ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol fel y

Regarding the matter of regulating foster agencies that are working in England and Wales, the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales will do the regulation and registration in Wales for those children and those organisations working in Wales. That will happen regardless of whether regulation and inspection has also taken place in England. I urge Members to support the motion.

gallant fwrw ymlaen â'r gwaith sy'n gysylltiedig â chynnal y plant sy'n fwyaf agored i niwed. Ynghylch y mater o reoleiddio asiantaethau maethu sy'n gweithio yng Nghymru a Lloegr, Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru fydd yn gwneud y gwaith rheoleiddio a chofrestru yng Nghymru ar gyfer y plant hynny a'r cyrff hynny sy'n gweithio yng Nghymru. Bydd hynny'n digwydd pa un a fu rheoleiddio ac arolygu yn Lloegr hefyd ai peidio.

**Y Llywydd:** Cynhaliwn y bleidlais nesaf yn electronig. Os bydd anhawster, fe bleidleisiwn drwy ddangos dwylo.

**The Presiding Officer:** We will take the next vote electronically. If there is any difficulty, we will vote by a show of hands.

*Cynnig (NDM1328): O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1328): For 42, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hancock, Brian  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn



Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM1329): O blaid 41, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM1329): For 41, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hancock, Brian  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.39 p.m.*

*The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.39 p.m.*

**Dadl o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29: Deddfwriaeth ar Daliadau Presgripsiwn  
Debate under Standing Order No. 29: Legislation on Prescription Charges**

**Kirsty Williams:** I propose that

**Kirsty Williams:** Cynigiaf fod

*under Standing Order No. 29.2, the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. instructs the Minister for Health and Social Services to bring forward draft subordinate legislation under sections 77, 83, 83(a) and 126(4) and paragraph (1) of Schedule (12) of the National Health Service Act 1977 to make provision to enable a person suffering from a chronic lifelong condition which requires regular medication to be exempt from prescription charges.*

*2. notes that this will eradicate unnecessary financial barriers for people to effectively manage their illness in the long term. (NDM1283)*

As we fast approach the end of this historic first four years of the National Assembly for Wales, the motion before us once more gives us an opportunity, collectively, to make a difference for the people of Wales. I am extremely fortunate to be able to make these proposals, and I am delighted that so many organisations have joined the campaign to exempt persons suffering from chronic, long-term conditions from prescription charges. I would like to place on record my thanks to those outside the Assembly who have helped me to develop these proposals: the Wales Council for Voluntary Action health and social care network, the Long-Term Medical Conditions Alliance, the Welsh Kidney Patients Association and, in particular, Arthritis Care.

3.40 p.m.

The principle behind the motion is to overhaul the system of exemptions to make it fairer and more equitable and to break down barriers to healthcare. It builds on the Assembly Government's record of action on this issue. By freezing prescription charges for two consecutive years and amending age-related exemptions, we have already demonstrated our commitment to bringing down the barriers that prevent patients from obtaining the drugs that they need.

*o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29.2, Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn cyfarwyddo'r Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i ddwyn is-ddeddfwriaeth gerbron o dan Adrannau 77, 83, 83 (a) a 126 (4) a pharagraff (1) atodlen (12) Deddf Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol 1977 i ddarparu bod person sy'n dioddef o gyflwr cronig gydol-oes y mae angen meddyginiaeth reolaidd arno yn cael ei eithrio rhag talu am bresgripsiynau;*

*2. yn nodi y bydd hyn yn chwalu'r rhwystrau ariannol diangen sy'n rhwystro pobl rhag gallu rheoli eu salwch yn effeithiol yn y tymor hir. (NDM1283)*

A ninnau'n dynesu'n gyflym at ddiwedd y pedair blynedd cyntaf hanesyddol hyn o Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, mae'r cynnig sydd ger ein bron yn rhoi cyfle unwaith eto inni wneud gwahaniaeth, gyda'n gilydd, ar gyfer pobl Cymru. Yr wyf yn dra ffodus i allu gwneud y cynigion hyn, ac yr wyf wrth fy modd bod cynifer o gyrff wedi ymuno â'r ymgyrch i eithrio rhai sy'n dioddef anhwylderau cronig, tymor-hir rhag talu am bresgripsiynau. Carwn roi ar gof a chadw fy niolch i'r rhai y tu allan i'r Cynulliad sydd wedi fy helpu i ddatblygu'r cynigion hyn: rhwydwaith iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol Cyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru, y Gynghrair Anhwylderau Meddygol Tymor-Hir, Cymdeithas Cleifion Arennau Cymru ac, yn benodol, Gofal Llid y Cymalau.

Egwyddor sylfaenol y cynnig hwn yw'r angen i ailwampio'r system o eithriadau i'w gwneud yn decach ac yn fwy cyfiawn ac i chwalu rhwystrau i ofal iechyd. Mae'n adeiladu ar sail record Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o weithredu ar y mater hwn. Drwy rewi taliadau presgripsiwn am ddwy flynedd ar ôl ei gilydd a newid yr eithriadau sy'n gysylltiedig ag oed, yr ydym eisoes wedi dangos ein hymrwymiad i ddymchwel y rhwystrau sy'n atal cleifion rhag cael y cyffuriau y mae arnynt eu hangen.

The current system was developed in 1968, when the British Medical Association approved a list of medical conditions, the sufferers of which should be exempt from prescription charges. The list was partially based on the best medical knowledge at the time. However, I am sure that we are all thankful for the immense medical advances made since then in terms of disease management, intervention and treatment. Many have acknowledged that the system is due for a complete overhaul. *Health Which?* concluded that the current system is irrational and the Wanless report to the Chancellor of the Exchequer described the system as neither logical nor rooted in the principles of the NHS.

**Brian Gibbons:** I agree that the present system is fairly chaotic and in need of attention, although I do not know whether it is a £20 million priority. How will your proposal address the situation of people with asthma, whose condition may not necessarily be lifelong; of people with cancer, who, hopefully, are not suffering from a lifelong condition; and of people with blood pressure problems, many of whom can stop their treatment? How can people decide in the early stages of a condition whether it will be a lifelong condition?

**Kirsty Williams:** I accept that, in moving these proposals forward, we would need to consult widely with medical professionals and the organisations representing the interests of these patients to implement a much fairer and more equitable system than the current one. That was done in 1968, and I am sure that it is not beyond us now to devise a system of exemption charges that is fair and equitable.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Do you agree that motor neurone disease should also be considered for inclusion on the list? The Motor Neurone Disease Association in north Wales has been vigorously lobbying me.

**Kirsty Williams:** We are proposing a complete overhaul, and we would focus on conditions such as the one you mentioned, Eleanor.

Datblygwyd y system bresennol yn 1968, pan gymeradwyodd Cymdeithas Feddygol Prydain restr o anhwylderau meddygol, y dylai'r rhai sy'n eu dioddef gael eu heithrio rhag talu am bresgripsiynau. Yr oedd y rhestr wedi'i seilio'n rhannol ar y wybodaeth feddygol orau ar y pryd. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn sicr ein bod i gyd yn ddiolchgar am y cynnydd aruthrol mewn meddygaeth a gafwyd ers hynny o ran rheoli clefydau, ymyrraeth a thriniaeth. Mae llawer wedi cydnabod ei bod yn bryd ailwampio'r system yn llwyr. Daeth *Health Which?* i'r casgliad bod y system bresennol yn afresymegol ac yn adroddiad Wanless i Ganghellor y Trysorlys, dywedwyd nad oedd y system yn rhesymegol nac yn seiliedig ar egwyddorion y GIG.

**Brian Gibbons:** Cytunaf fod y system bresennol yn eithaf anhrefnus a bod angen rhoi sylw iddi, er nad wyf yn gwybod a yw'n flaenoriaeth o £20 miliwn. Sut y bydd eich cynnig yn ymdrin â sefyllfa pobl sydd ag asthma, nad yw eu hanhwylder yn un a wnaiff barhau ar hyd eu hoes, o reidrwydd; pobl sydd â chanser na fyddant, gobeithio, yn dioddef yr anhwylder ar hyd eu hoes; a phobl sydd â phroblemau o ran pwysau gwaed, y gall llawer ohonynt roi'r gorau i'w triniaeth? Sut y gall pobl benderfynu yng nghyfnod cynnar unrhyw anhwylder a yw'n anhwylder a fydd yn parhau ar hyd eu hoes?

**Kirsty Williams:** Yr wyf yn derbyn y byddai'n rhaid inni ymgynghori'n eang, wrth fwrw ymlaen â'r cynigion hyn, â gweithwyr meddygol proffesiynol a'r cyrff sy'n cynrychioli buddiannau'r cleifion hyn er mwyn rhoi system ar waith sy'n decach o lawer ac yn fwy cyfiawn na'r un bresennol. Gwnaed hynny yn 1968, ac yr wyf yn siŵr ei bod o fewn ein gallu'n awr i ddyfeisio system o eithrio rhag talu sy'n deg ac yn gyfiawn.

**Eleanor Burnham:** A gytunwch y dylid ystyried cynnwys clefyd niwronau motor ar y rhestr hefyd? Mae'r Gymdeithas Clefyd Niwronau Motor yn y Gogledd wedi bod yn fy lobio'n egniol.

**Kirsty Williams:** Yr ydym yn cynnig ailwampiad llwyr, a byddem yn canolbwyntio ar anhwylderau fel yr un y cyfeiriasoch ato, Eleanor.

The system needs to be looked at for two reasons. First, there is the issue of inconsistency. Motor neurone disease is not on the list, and neither are many other conditions. I will highlight two examples. The first involves transplant patients. Patient A receives a kidney transplant, and the surgeon leaves the working fistula, which is used to deliver dialysis to the patient, in his arm. Following the transplant, the patient no longer needs dialysis and is exempt from paying prescriptions. Patient B also receives a kidney transplant, carried out by the same surgeon, in the same hospital. However, that patient's working fistula is removed, which means that he is not exempt from paying prescription charges.

Secondly, when the list was compiled in 1968, the average life expectancy of cystic fibrosis sufferers meant that no-one envisaged that they would reach adulthood, and, therefore, be required to pay for prescriptions. Thank goodness, that is not the case now. Thousands of cystic fibrosis sufferers across the UK now live into adulthood and are expected to pay for their life-saving drugs. Those are only two examples of a whole range of inconsistencies that exist in the current system.

**Ron Davies:** As I understand it, your thirst is for consistency and removing these anomalies. Is your definition of a chronic lifelong condition the only test, and will everyone who suffers from such conditions be eligible for free prescriptions? For the sake of clarity, as Brian Gibbons mentioned, will you confirm that that definition extends not only to conditions such as asthma and cystic fibrosis, but also to cancer, AIDS/HIV, drug addiction, chronic coronary conditions, and long-term mental illness? Will you also confirm that, in the cost-benefit analysis that accompanies this legislation, you have made a detailed, costed provision for all those conditions?

**Kirsty Williams:** The definition of long-term chronic illness to which we have been working is the one accepted by the Long-Term Medical Conditions Alliance. The

Mae angen ystyried y system am ddau reswm. Yn gyntaf, dyna fater anghysondeb. Nid yw clefyd niwronau motor ar y rhestr, na llawer o anhwylderau eraill ychwaith. Tynnaf sylw at ddwy enghraifft. Mae'r gyntaf yn ymwneud â chleifion trawsblannu. Trawsblannir aren i glaf A, ac mae'r llawfeddyg yn gadael y ffistwla sy'n gweithio, a ddefnyddir i ddialysu'r claf, yn ei fraich. Ar ôl y trawsblaniad, nid oes ar y claf angen dialysis bellach ac mae wedi'i eithrio rhag talu am bresgripsiynau. Mae claf B hefyd yn cael aren a drawblannir gan yr un llawfeddyg, yn yr un ysbyty. Tynnir y ffistwla sy'n gweithio o'r claf hwnnw, sy'n golygu na chaiff ei eithrio rhag talu am bresgripsiynau.

Yn ail, pan luniwyd y rhestr yn 1968, yr oedd disgwyliad einioes cyfartalog y rhai a oedd yn dioddef ffibrosis systig yn golygu nad oedd neb yn rhagweld y byddent yn cyrraedd eu llawn dwf ac, felly, yn gorfod talu am bresgripsiynau. Diolch byth, nid felly y mae'n awr. Erbyn hyn, mae miloedd o'r rhai sy'n dioddef ffibrosis systig ledled y DU yn byw nes cyrraedd eu llawn dwf a disgwylir iddynt dalu am y cyffuriau sy'n achub eu bywyd. Dyna ddwy enghraifft yn unig o amrywiaeth mawr o anghysonderau a geir yn y system bresennol.

**Ron Davies:** Fel yr wyf fi'n ei ddeall, yr hyn yr ydych yn dyheu amdano yw cysondeb a dileu'r anomaledau hyn. Ai'ch diffiniad o anhwylder cronig gydol-oes yw'r unig faen prawf, ac a fydd pawb sy'n dioddef anhwylderau o'r fath yn gymwys i gael presgripsiynau am ddim? Er mwyn eglurder, fel y dywedodd Brian Gibbons, a wnewch gadarnhau nad anhwylderau fel asthma a ffibrosis systig yn unig a gynhwysir yn y diffiniad hwnnw, ac y cynhwysir cancer, AIDS/HIV, dibyniaeth ar gyffuriau, anhwylderau coronaidd cronig, a salwch meddwl tymor-hir hefyd? A wnewch gadarnhau hefyd eich bod wedi gwneud darpariaeth fanwl, brisiedig ar gyfer yr holl anhwylderau hyn yn y dadansoddiad cost a budd sydd gyda'r ddeddfwriaeth?

**Kirsty Williams:** Y diffiniad o salwch cronig tymor-hir y buom yn ei ddilyn yw'r un a dderbynnir gan y Gynghair Anhwylderau Meddygol Tymor-Hir. Mae'r prisiadau a

costings provided have been worked out carefully, with the help of civil servants who have a long history in this field, and are based on individual items for which a charge is made. In the cost benefit analysis, although it was not particularly difficult to consider the cost of individual drugs, it was more difficult to prove the benefits that would accrue from this proposal.

I will turn to the issue of cost, and will describe the case of a patient who lives in north Wales. Sue Auld is 50 years old. She lives with her husband and one grown-up child. She developed osteoarthritis 14 years ago, a condition, which, at that time, she did not know much about. She was not aware that arthritis could strike at such an early age, or that it could be as painful and debilitating as she has found it to be. Over the years her drugs prescription has increased from a couple of items to eight items per month.

For Sue Auld, the numerous monthly prescription medications have become a financial burden to her not only at a time when her prescription bills are increasing, but also when her home needs more adaptations and she needs more equipment to help her cope with her disability. Despite this, Sue Auld is not eligible for prescription exemption on medical grounds. Arthritis is not one of the chronic conditions outlined in 1968. She receives incapacity benefit, and a small pension from her working life. That small income prevents her from receiving free prescriptions on a low-income basis. The family's circumstances have worsened since her husband had an accident. His small pension and disability living allowance means that he must continue to pay for his prescriptions.

Because of the costs that she is forced to pay, Sue Auld has found herself reducing her dosage of medication over recent years and postponing buying her prescriptions to make ends meet. When patients do that, they compromise the management of their condition, which could eventually lead to a requirement for more costly and intensive treatment, often in a hospital setting.

3.50 p.m.

ddarparwyd wedi'u cyfrifo'n ofalus, gyda chymorth gweision sifil a fu yn y maes hwn yn hir, ac maent yn seiliedig ar eitemau unigol y codir tâl amdanynt. Yn y dadansoddiad cost a budd, er nad oedd yn arbennig o anodd ystyried cost cyffuriau unigol, yr oedd yn fwy anodd profi'r buddion a geid o'r cynnig hwn.

Trof yn awr at fater cost, a disgrifiâf achos claf sy'n byw yn y Gogledd. Mae Sue Auld yn 50 mlwydd oed. Mae'n byw gyda'i gŵr ac un plentyn mewn oed. Dangosodd arwyddion o osteoarthritis 14 blynedd yn ôl, ac yr oedd hwnnw'n anhwylder na wyddai lawer amdano ar y pryd. Ni wyddai y gallai arthritis daro mor gynnar yn ei hoes, neu y gallai fod mor boenus a gwanychol ag y cafodd ei fod. Dros y blynyddoedd mae ei phresgripsiwn am gyffuriau wedi cynyddu o ychydig o eitemau i wyth eitem y mis.

Yn achos Sue Auld, mae'r meddyginiaethau niferus a gaiff ar bresgripsiwn bob mis wedi dod yn faich ariannol arni a hynny ar adeg pan yw ei biliau presgripsiwn yn codi, a hefyd pan fo angen rhagor o addasiadau yn ei chartref a mwy o offer i'w helpu i ymdopi â'i hanabledd. Er hynny, nid yw Sue Auld yn gymwys i gael ei heithrio rhag talu am bresgripsiynau ar sail feddygol. Nid yw arthritis yn un o'r anhwylderau cronig a ddisgrifiwyd yn 1968. Caiff fudd-dal analluogrwydd, a phensiwn bach ar ôl ei bywyd gweithiol. Mae'r incwm bach hwnnw yn ei hatal rhag cael presgripsiynau am ddim oherwydd incwm isel. Mae amgylchiadau'r teulu wedi gwaethygu ers i'w gŵr gael damwain. Oherwydd ei bensiwn bach a'i lwfans byw i'r anabl, rhaid iddo barhau i dalu am ei bresgripsiynau.

Oherwydd y costau y mae'n gorfod eu talu, mae Sue Auld wedi cael ei bod yn lleihau ei dognau o feddyginiaeth dros y blynyddoedd diweddar ac yn gohirio prynu ei phresgripsiynau er mwyn cael deupen llinyn ynghyd. Pan wnaiff cleifion hynny, maent yn peryglu eu gallu i reoli eu hanhwylder, a gallai hynny arwain yn y pen draw at yr angen am driniaeth ddrutach a dwysach, a hynny mewn ysbyty mewn llawer achos.

A survey conducted by the National Association of Citizens Advice Bureaux found that at least 37 per cent of those suffering from a long-term chronic illness had admitted that, on occasion, they had decided not to pay for a prescription as their financial resources were needed for other aspects of their lives. The Welsh Liberal Democrats recently conducted a survey of pharmacies across Wales. Of the pharmacists who returned the survey, 44 had encountered cases where patients had not taken up a prescription because of the cost involved. One reported that a customer had asked him which item was the most important as he could not afford to buy them all. He asked the pharmacist for advice as to which one he could best do without.

We have a prepayment certificate system in England and Wales and that should be welcomed. However, it has been noted that awareness of the existence of prepayment certificates is limited across the nation. Not everyone who could apply for the certificates does so. It is difficult for people on low incomes to buy prepayment certificates. At £86.20 for 12 months or £31.40 for four months, the lump sum required may prohibit people from using that system of paying for their drugs. Only this morning, I received a telephone call from a gentleman from Milford Haven who was a leading ambulance man for 25 years and who now has a chronic illness. He must take 14 items of medication every day and uses a prepayment certificate. However, his wife is also on multiple medication, so she too needs a certificate. This means that they must pay £62.80 every four months for their prescription certificates. It is patients with chronic long-term illness who can benefit most from prepayment certificates, but there is a problem in accessing them.

Anyone whose income exceeds income support level, if only by a few pence, is required to pay prescription charges. There is much evidence from across Wales that shows that people are making choices as to whether they manage their condition appropriately, as their clinicians would want, or whether they

Mewn arolwg a gynhaliwyd gan Gymdeithas Genedlaethol y Canolfannau Cyngor ar Bopeth, cafwyd bod o leiaf 37 y cant o'r rhai sy'n dioddef salwch cronig tymor-hir yn cyfaddef eu bod wedi penderfynu peidio â thalu am bresgripsiwn, ar adegau, am fod agweddau eraill ar eu bywyd yn galw am adnoddau ariannol. Yn ddiweddar, gwnaeth Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru gynnal arolwg o fferyllfeydd ledled Cymru. O blith y fferyllwyr a ddychwelodd yr arolwg, yr oedd 44 wedi dod ar draws achosion lle'r oedd cleifion heb gymryd presgripsiwn oherwydd y gost a oedd ynglŷn â hynny. Dywedodd un fod cwsmer wedi gofyn iddo pa eitem oedd y bwysicaf gan na allai fforddio prynu pob un ohonynt. Gofynnodd am gyngor gan y fferyllfeydd ynghylch pa un a fyddai'r un orau i'w hepgor.

Mae gennym system tystysgrifau talu ymlaen llaw yng Nghymru a Lloegr a dylid croesawu hynny. Fodd bynnag, sylwyd nad oes fawr o ymwybyddiaeth o fodolaeth tystysgrifau talu ymlaen llaw drwy'r wlad. Nid yw pawb a allai ymgeisio am y tystysgrifau'n gwneud hynny. Mae'n anodd i bobl sydd ar incwm isel brynu tystysgrifau talu ymlaen llaw. Gallai'r cyfandaliad sydd ei angen o £82.20 am 12 mis neu £31.40 am bedwar mis fod yn rhwystr i bobl rhag defnyddio'r system honno o dalu am eu cyffuriau. Fore heddiw, cefais alwad ar y teleffon oddi wrth ŵr bonheddig yn Aberdaugleddau a fu'n brif swyddog ambiwlans am 25 mlynedd ac sydd bellach â salwch cronig. Rhaid iddo gymryd 14 eitem o feddyginiaeth bob dydd ac mae'n defnyddio tystysgrif talu ymlaen llaw. Fodd bynnag, mae ei wraig yn cymryd nifer o wahanol feddyginiaethau hefyd, ac mae arni hi angen tystysgrif yn ogystal. Golyga hynny fod rhaid iddynt dalu £62.80 bob pedwar mis am eu tystysgrifau talu ymlaen llaw. Cleifion sydd â salwch tymor-hir cronig sy'n gallu cael y budd mwyaf o dystysgrifau talu ymlaen llaw, ond mae anhawster o ran eu cael.

Mae unrhyw un y mae ei incwm yn uwch na lefel cymhorthdal incwm, o ddim ond ychydig o geiniogau hyd yn oed, yn gorfod talu am bresgripsiwn. Ceir llawer o dystiolaeth ym mhob rhan o Gymru sy'n dangos bod pobl yn dewis rhwng rheoli eu hanhwylder yn briodol, fel y dymunai eu

use their resources for other things. These people, more often than not, suffer from chronic illnesses, and are therefore the most vulnerable. They may find themselves with a small income that takes them above the payment threshold and this causes great problems.

This issue has been widely recognised for many years, but despite repeated demands in the House of Commons, the Secretary of State for Health has refused to take action. The Assembly has an opportunity today to take on board the concerns of many organisations—I know that they have contacted all Members directly—and strike a difference once again between the regime in Wales and the regime in London, to make a difference to the lives of people in Wales.

**David Lloyd:** Yr wyf yn falch o'r cyfle i siarad yn y ddadl bwysig hon. Ers blynyddoedd credai Plaid Cymru y dylid dileu taliadau presgripsiwn ar y sail eu bod yn dreth ar salwch—nid yw person iach o'r un oedran yn gorfod gwneud y fath daliadau. Dylid hefyd eu dileu am nad yw'r system bresennol o eithrio rhag talu am bresgripsiwn yn seiliedig ar egwyddorion y gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae'r system yn annheg. Hefyd, mae dros 88 y cant o bresgripsiynau yng Nghymru am ddim ar hyn o bryd beth bynnag. Mae angen ystyried creu cyffurlyfr cenedlaethol y gellid ei ddiwygio er mwyn sicrhau bod y dewis gorau o gyffuriau ar gael.

Byddwn yn cefnogi cynnig Kirsty Williams y prynhawn yma am ei fod yn gam sylweddol yn y cyfeiriad cywir, hynny yw, tuag at ddileu holl daliadau presgripsiwn ac ailwampio'r system yn gyffredinol. Mae'n gynnig synhwyrol, ond ni fydd hynny ynddo'i hun yn gwarantu llwyddiant, fel y gwelsom ym methiant cynigion synhwyrol gan rai o'm cyd-Aelodau o Blaid Cymru.

Plaid Cymru will support this motion to extend prescription exemptions as we have long worked towards the abolition of all prescription charges, which are a tax on illness. The present system of complicated exemptions is both anachronistic and unfair because it means that living with one type of chronic medical condition provides

clinigwyr, a defnyddio eu hadnoddau ar gyfer pethau eraill. Gan mwyaf, mae'r bobl hyn yn dioddef salwch cronig, a hwy felly yw'r rhai mwyaf hygryw. Gallant gael bod ganddynt incwm bach sydd ychydig yn uwch na'r trothwy talu ac mae hyn yn peri problemau mawr.

Mae'r mater hwn yn cael ei gydnabod gan lawer ers blynyddoedd lawer, ond er bod galwadau wedi bod dro ar ôl tro yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin, mae'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Iechyd wedi gwrthod gweithredu. Mae gan y Cynulliad gyfle heddiw i ystyried pryderon llawer o gyrff—gwn eu bod wedi cysylltu â'r holl Aelodau'n uniongyrchol—a pheri gwahaniaeth rhwng y gyfundrefn yng Nghymru a'r gyfundrefn yn Llundain, i wneud gwahaniaeth ym mywydau pobl Cymru.

**David Lloyd:** I am glad to have the opportunity to speak in this important debate. For years, Plaid Cymru has believed that all prescription charges should be abolished on the basis that they are a tax on illness—a healthy person of the same age does not have to make such payments. They should also be abolished as the present system of exemption from prescription payment is not based on health service principles. The system is unfair. Also, over 88 per cent of prescriptions in Wales are free at present anyway. We must consider creating a national formulary that could be amended to ensure that the best choice of drugs is available.

We will support Kirsty Williams's motion this afternoon, as it is a significant step in the right direction, namely the abolition of all prescription charges and the reorganisation of the system in general. It is a sensible motion, but this in itself will not ensure its success, as has been demonstrated by the failure of sensible motions proposed by some of my Plaid Cymru colleagues.

Bydd Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi'r cynnig hwn i ymestyn yr eithriadau rhag talu am bresgripsiynau gan ein bod yn gweithio ers talwm i ddiddymu'r holl daliadau presgripsiwn, sy'n dreth ar salwch. Mae'r system bresennol o eithriadau cymhleth yn anacronistig ac yn annheg am ei bod yn golygu bod byw ag un math o anhwylder

exemption while living with another may not. Over 88 per cent of prescription items are free in Wales anyway. Therefore, this is a proposal to extend free prescriptions to cover other chronic conditions that require regular prescriptions, of which there is a long list: hypertension, cardiac failure, angina, asthma, rheumatoid arthritis, hypercholesterolemia, lupus, chronic mental illness and so on. Such conditions—

**Brian Gibbons:** That is true insofar as it goes, but the crucial word in the motion is 'lifelong'. As you know, many of the conditions that you have listed are not necessarily lifelong conditions.

**David Lloyd:** I was careful to list those which tend to be lifelong, such as hypertension, cardiac failure, angina, hypercholesterolemia, lupus and so on. Most of those qualify for a prescription prepayment certificate at present but, as we have heard from Kirsty, this involves prohibitive up-front costs of £31 for four months and £86 for a year. Exemption is therefore preferable to prescription prepayment. Cost undermines the clinical management of many of these conditions, such as asthma, hypertension, and rheumatoid arthritis, which may require up to five medications at a time, at £6 each. For example, two inhalers are required to treat asthma, as Brian Gibbons and others should know: the blue salbutamol inhaler, which expands the airways and treats the wheeze, and the brown steroid inhaler that treats the underlying inflammation causing the wheeze. The brown inhaler should be the basis of treatment and should be used regularly. However, the blue inhaler provides immediate effect, and therefore, when cash is short, people tend to opt for the blue inhaler and drop the brown inhaler, which is the opposite of what they should be doing. Evidence shows that asthma control is best when both inhalers are used.

meddygol cronig yn eithrio rhywun tra na fydd byw ag un arall yn gwneud hynny. Mae dros 88 y cant o'r eitemau ar bresgripsiwn yng Nghymru yn rhad ac am ddim beth bynnag. Gan hynny, mae hwn yn gynnig i ymestyn presgripsiynau am ddim i gynnwys anhwylderau cronig eraill sy'n galw am bresgripsiynau rheolaidd, y ceir rhestr hir ohonynt: pwysedd gwaed uchel, pall ar y galon, angina, asthma, crydcymalau gwynegol, hypercolesterolemia, lwpws, salwch meddwl cronig ac yn y blaen. Mae anhwylderau o'r fath—

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae hynny'n wir i ryw raddau, ond y gair hollbwysig yn y cynnig yw 'gydol-oes'. Fel y gwyddoch, nid yw llawer o'r anhwylderau yr ydych wedi'u rhestru'n rhai sy'n parhau gydol oes o reidrwydd.

**David Lloyd:** Bûm yn ofalus i restru'r rhai sy'n tueddu i barhau gydol oes, fel pwysedd gwaed uchel, pall ar y galon, angina, hypercolesterolemia, lwpws ac yn y blaen. Mae'r rhan fwyaf ohonynt yn cymhwyso rhywun i gael tystysgrif talu am bresgripsiwn ymlaen llaw ar hyn o bryd ond, fel y clywsom gan Kirsty, mae hynny'n golygu talu crochris o £31 am bedwar mis a £86 am flwyddyn ymlaen llaw. Felly, mae eithrio'n fwy dymunol na thalu am bresgripsiwn ymlaen llaw. Mae'r gost yn tansilio'r rheolaeth glinigol ar lawer o'r anhwylderau hyn, fel asthma, pwysedd gwaed uchel, a chrydcymalau gwynegol, a allai alw am hyd at bum meddyginiaeth ar y tro, am £6 yr un. Er enghraifft, mae angen dau ymanadlwr i drin asthma, fel y dylai Brian Gibbons ac eraill wybod: yr ymanadlwr salbutamol glas, sy'n ehangu'r pibellau anadlu ac yn trin y gwichian, a'r ymanadlwr steroid brown sy'n trin y llid sylfaenol sy'n achosi'r gwichian. Yr ymanadlwr brown a ddylai fod yn sail i'r driniaeth a dylid ei ddefnyddio'n rheolaidd. Fodd bynnag, yr ymanadlwr glas sy'n cael effaith uniongyrchol, ac felly, pan fo arian yn brin, mae pobl yn dueddol i ddewis yr ymanadlwr glas a hepgor yr un brown, sef y gwrthwyneb i'r hyn y dylent ei wneud. Dengys tystiolaeth fod y rheolaeth ar asthma ar ei gorau pan ddefnyddir y ddau ymanadlwr.

The benefits of free prescriptions for the Rhaid ymestyn y buddion o gael



university population that I treat at present must be extended to other age groups and to cover chronic diseases that are not included on the present exemption list, so that people do not agonise over whether to drop a vital part of their treatment for blood pressure, angina or rheumatoid arthritis because of the cost. That undermines the clinical management of the condition and increases the long-term cost to the NHS because of the poorer control of blood pressure, angina, rheumatoid arthritis and other illnesses. For example, poor control of blood pressure results in stroke, and huge personal and financial costs ensue.

The British Medical Association in Wales states that prescription charges have no part to play in a fair and equitable health system, as we have heard, and should be abolished, as they act as a barrier to health for disadvantaged groups and those most in need. Plaid Cymru agrees. Please support the motion.

**Ann Jones:** I support this motion in principle. I and my party have long held the view that access to medical treatment should be based on need, not ability to pay. The Welsh Assembly Government has made a difference in Wales by freezing prescription charges at £6 an item for the last two years; this will continue in April. We have also introduced an exemption for under 25s, which does not exist across the border. However, we would have difficulty in reaching a robust definition of chronic illness, as even private medical insurance companies have differing views on its definition. Whereby one company may be willing to insure a person who has a certain illness, another will refuse. If these companies cannot find a definition of the word chronic, we will certainly get into difficulties and become bogged-down in the definition. Such a definition could also be the subject of a judicial review. Therefore, it is sensible for the Welsh Assembly Government to examine alternative ways of providing help for people on low incomes to get their prescriptions.

One method that I want us to consider—and

presgripsiynau am ddim sydd gan y boblogaeth brifysgol yr wyf yn ei thrin ar hyn o bryd i gynnwys grwpiau oedran eraill ac anhwylderau cronig nad ydynt ar y rhestr bresennol o eithriadau, fel na fydd pobl yn ymboeni ynghylch a ddylent hepgor rhan hollbwysig o'u triniaeth ar gyfer pwysau gwaed, angina neu grydcymalau gwynegol oherwydd y gost. Mae hynny'n tanseilio'r rheolaeth glinigol ar yr anhwylder ac yn cynyddu'r gost i'r GIG yn y tymor hir oherwydd y rheolaeth salach ar bwysau gwaed, angina, crydcymalau gwynegol a chlefydau eraill. Er enghraifft, mae rheolaeth wael ar bwysau gwaed yn arwain at strôc, a cheir costau personol ac ariannol anferth o ganlyniad i hynny.

Dywed Cymdeithas Feddygol Prydain yng Nghymru nad oes lle i daliadau presgripsiwn mewn system iechyd deg a chyfiawn, fel y clywsom, a dylid eu diddymu, gan eu bod yn rhwystr i iechyd ymysg grwpiau difreintiedig a'r rhai mwyaf anghenus. Mae Plaid Cymru yn cytuno. Cefnogwch y cynnig, os gwelwch yn dda.

**Ann Jones:** Cefnogaf y cynnig hwn mewn egwyddor. Yr wyf fi a'm plaid yn credu ers talwm y dylai'r gallu i gael triniaeth feddygol fod yn seiliedig ar angen, nid ar y gallu i dalu. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi gwneud gwahaniaeth yng Nghymru drwy rewi taliadau presgripsiwn ar £6 yr eitem yn y ddwy flynedd diwethaf; bydd hyn yn parhau yn Ebrill. Yr ydym hefyd wedi cyflwyno eithriad ar gyfer y rhai dan 25 oed, nas ceir dros y ffin. Fodd bynnag, byddem yn ei chael yn anodd cyrraedd diffiniad pendant o salwch cronig, gan fod hyd yn oed gwmnïau yswiriant meddygol preifat yn gwahaniaethu o ran eu barn ar y diffiniad ohono. Tra gallai un cwmni fod yn barod i yswirio rhywun sydd â salwch penodol, gallai un arall wrthod. Os nad yw'r cwmnïau hyn yn gallu dod o hyd i ddiffiniad o'r gair cronig, byddwn ni'n sicr o fynd i drafferthion ac o fynd i gors wrth geisio ei ddiffinio. Gallai diffiniad o'r fath fod yn destun i adolygiad barnwrol hefyd. Gan hynny, mae'n ddoeth i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ymchwilio i ddulliau eraill o helpu pobl sydd ar incwm isel i gael presgripsiwn.

Un dull yr wyf yn dymuno inni ei ystyried—

Kirsty mentioned it in her opening speech—is that of prepayment certificates. I am disappointed that so few people know about prepayment certificates and therefore do not take it up. Another reason cited for the lack of take-up is that people cannot afford it. We may need to consider this and allow a monthly payment of the charge, or even reduce the charge to allow people on lower incomes to use prepayment certificates. A reform of the prepayment certificate system is within the Assembly's powers, and it would enable the Assembly to tackle the problem of prescription charges and allow more people to access medication as needed.

a chyfeiriodd Kirsty at hyn yn ei haraith agoriadol—yw tystysgrifau talu ymlaen llaw. Yr wyf yn siomedig bod cyn lleied o bobl yn gwybod am dystysgrifau talu ymlaen llaw ac felly'n peidio ag ymgymryd â hwy. Un rheswm a grybwyllir am y diffyg defnydd ohonynt yw na all pobl eu fforddio. Efallai y bydd yn rhaid inni ystyried hynny a chaniatáu talu amdanynt yn fisol, neu hyd yn oed ostwng y tâl fel y gall rhai ar incwm is ddefnyddio tystysgrifau talu ymlaen llaw. Mae'r Cynulliad yn meddu ar y pŵer i ddiwygio'r system tystysgrifau talu ymlaen llaw, a byddai hynny'n galluogi'r Cynulliad i fynd i'r afael â phroblem taliadau presgripsiwn ac yn caniatáu i fwy o bobl gael meddyginiaeth yn ôl yr angen.

4.00 p.m.

We must take away with us the horror stories referred to by Kirsty, whereby people must decide between paying for their prescription and paying their heating bill. We must also consider the definition of 'chronic', which would create great difficulties. The costings are flawed on that basis, and I would like the Assembly Government to take further steps to review this before we sign on the dotted line.

Rhaid inni fyfyrto ynghylch yr hanesion ofnadwy y cyfeiriodd Kirsty atynt, lle y mae pobl yn gorfod dewis rhwng talu am eu presgripsiwn a thalu eu bil gwresogi. Rhaid inni hefyd ystyried y diffiniad o 'cronig', a byddai hynny'n creu anawsterau mawr. Mae'r prisiau'n ddiffygiol oherwydd hynny, a charwn weld Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cymryd camau pellach i adolygu hyn cyn inni gytuno arno.

**David Melding:** The more effective management of long-term chronic conditions has perhaps been responsible for most of the health gain in this country over the last 20 years. We all want that trend to continue. Several Members have mentioned practical examples of difficulties faced by people with various long-term conditions. It is important for us to consider this issue and review it seriously, because we want to encourage effective self-management among patients and provide access to the best possible treatment. As we have heard, many conditions are now treatable with drugs, which are getting better and better. This is an area of public interest, and it should be thoroughly reviewed.

**David Melding:** Y rheoli mwy effeithiol ar anhwylderau cronig tymor-hir a fu'n gyfrifol, o bosibl, am y rhan fwyaf o'r cynnydd mewn iechyd yn y wlad hon yn yr 20 mlynedd diwethaf. Mae pawb ohonom am weld y tuedd hwnnw'n parhau. Mae sawl Aelod wedi sôn am enghreifftiau ymarferol o'r anawsterau a wynebwr gan bobl sydd â gwahanol anhwylderau tymor-hir. Mae'n bwysig inni ystyried y mater hwn a'i adolygu o ddifrif, gan ein bod am annog hunanreoli effeithiol ymysg cleifion a sicrhau bod y driniaeth orau posibl ar gael. Fel y clywsom, erbyn hyn gellir trin llawer o anhwylderau â chyffuriau, ac mae'r rhain yn gwella drwy'r amser. Mae gan y cyhoedd fuddiant yn y maes hwn, a dylid ei adolygu'n drwyadl.

However, I must tell Kirsty Williams that I am not yet convinced by her argument, because the vast majority of people with chronic conditions are exempt on the grounds of income. Those who would be exempt, if we extended this, would be exempt from all

Er hynny, rhaid imi ddweud wrth Kirsty Williams nad wyf wedi fy argyhoeddi eto gan ei dadl, gan fod y mwyafrif llethol o bobl sydd ag anhwylderau cronig wedi'u heithrio ar sail incwm. Byddai'r rhai a gâi eu heithrio, os byddwn yn ymestyn hyn, yn cael eu

prescription charges, not just those relating to their long-term condition. Some of those people may have incomes as good as those of members of the general population who are deemed chargeable because they have enough disposable wealth.

There are general principles to consider, and we should remember that £20 million is a substantial amount of money that represents a considerable opportunity cost. I have fought hard over the last four years for people with, for example, rheumatoid arthritis to gain access to the most modern drugs available. The drugs that are now coming on to the market can transform the quality of life of people with potentially debilitating conditions. There is now an excellent treatment available for rheumatoid arthritis that costs about £10,000 per year per patient. I consider that to be money well spent. If society is prepared to allow the many people who suffer from such conditions—we are not necessarily talking about a small number of people—to have access to such drugs as a right, a modest amount of prescription charging for certain people who are wealthy enough to pay may still be acceptable. That is why we need a review and a wider public debate. The Welsh Conservative Party cannot support this motion at the moment and will abstain.

**Alun Cairns:** This motion has highlighted an important issue. Kirsty Williams should be recognised for bringing the matter to the Assembly. There is no doubt that there is a need for a review of the rules and exemptions relating to prescription charges. It is wholly inconsistent that some sufferers of certain diseases are exempt while others are forced to pay.

Kirsty has highlighted some of the specific details, as have other Members. There is clearly a need for a change in the legislation and a review of policy. This motion, however, deals specifically with exemptions, and I am concerned that it pre-empts a review of policy. The Audit Committee conducted a review into income from prescription charges. The first paragraph of the report on that issue highlighted that the income generated by prescription charges would

heithrio rhag talu am bob presgripsiwn, nid yn unig y rhai sy'n gysylltiedig â'u hanhwylder tymor-hir. Gallai incwm rhai o'r bobl hynny fod yn gymaint â rhai'r boblogaeth gyffredinol y bernir y gellir codi tâl arnynt am fod digon o gyfoeth ar gael ganddynt.

Mae egwyddorion cyffredinol i'w hystyried, a dylem gofio bod £20 miliwn yn swm sylweddol o arian sy'n gost cyfle mawr. Yr wyf wedi ymladd yn galed dros y pedair blynedd diwethaf i bobl sydd â chrydcymalau gwynegol, er enghraifft, gael y cyffuriau mwyaf modern sydd ar gael. Mae'r cyffuriau sy'n cyrraedd y farchnad yn awr yn gallu trawsnewid ansawdd bywyd pobl sydd ag anhwylderau a allai eu gwanychu. Mae triniaeth ragorol ar gael yn awr ar gyfer crydcymalau gwynegol sy'n costio tua £10,000 y flwyddyn y claf. Ystyriaf fod hynny'n wariant priodol. Os yw cymdeithas yn barod i ganiatáu i lawer o bobl sy'n dioddef anhwylderau o'r fath—nid ydym yn sôn am nifer fach o bobl o reidrwydd—gael yr hawl i gael cyffuriau o'r fath, gallai fod yn dderbyniol o hyd godi swm rhesymol am bresgripsiwn ar rai pobl sy'n ddigon cyfoethog i'w dalu. Dyna pam y mae arnom angen adolygiad a dadl gyhoeddus ehangach. Ni all Plaid Geidwadol Cymru gefnogi'r cynnig hwn ar hyn o bryd a bydd yn ymatal.

**Alun Cairns:** Mae'r cynnig hwn wedi tynnu sylw at fater pwysig. Dylid cydnabod Kirsty Williams am ddod â'r mater hwn i sylw'r Cynulliad. Nid oes dwywaith nad oes angen adolygu'r rheolau a'r eithriadau sy'n gysylltiedig â thaliadau presgripsiwn. Mae'n gwbl anghyson bod y rhai sy'n dioddef clefydau penodol yn cael eu heithrio tra bo eraill yn gorfod talu.

Mae Kirsty wedi tynnu sylw at rai o'r manylion penodol, fel y mae Aelodau eraill. Mae'n amlwg bod angen newid yn y ddeddfwriaeth ac adolygiad o bolisi. Fodd bynnag, mae'r cynnig hwn yn ymdrin ag eithriadau'n benodol, ac yr wyf yn bryderus am ei fod yn achub y blaen ar adolygiad o bolisi. Cynhaliodd y Pwyllgor Archwilio adolygiad o'r incwm oddi wrth daliadau presgripsiwn. Yr oedd paragraff cyntaf yr adroddiad ar y mater hwnnwn'n pwysleisio y

amount to £23 million. If this measure, as it stands, would cost £20 million, only a surplus of £3 million would remain. Given that the income would be so small, it calls into question the whole concept and principle of prescription charging. Therefore, today's motion pre-empts any form of review. However, it has served an important purpose in terms of prompting a review so that we can take a holistic approach to prescription charging, thereby delivering fair play to everyone.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** These are important issues, on which the Welsh Assembly Government has taken the lead. I start by placing my response in the context of the reports on prescription charges that were considered by the Audit Committee, one of which Alun Cairns has just mentioned. While those reports were mainly about maximising income, issues of eligibility formed part of their consideration, as my reply to the Committee in January 2002 made clear. Other steps that we have taken include freezing prescription charges at £6. They have risen to £6.20 elsewhere in the UK. We have exempted all those under 25 thereby ensuring that around 250,000 people in Wales, including the less well-off, have access to free prescriptions.

Extending our work in the field of prescriptions is important for two reasons. First, it shines clearly alongside Labour's anti-poverty strategy. There are people suffering from chronic conditions who earn just above the income level where existing help begins. We need to find new ways of offering assistance to them. Secondly, there are important health implications. David Melding mentioned the health gain that has been achieved for patients suffering from chronic conditions. If they are unable to afford their medication, their conditions may deteriorate and the health service must then intervene in other ways.

I have heard many representations from organisations suggesting different ways

byddai'r incwm a greid gan daliadau presgripsiwn yn gymaint â £23 miliwn. Os byddai'r mesur hwn, fel y mae, yn costio £20 miliwn, dim ond £3 miliwn o warged a fyddai ar ôl. Gan y byddai'r incwm mor fach, mae'n codi amheuaeth ynghylch yr holl gysyniad ac egwyddor o godi tâl am bresgripsiynau. Gan hynny, mae'r cynnig heddiw'n achub y blaen ar unrhyw fath o adolygiad. Er hynny, mae wedi cyflawni pwrpas pwysig o ran cymell adolygiad fel y gallwn gymryd ymagwedd gyfannol at godi tâl am bresgripsiynau, fel y gellir rhoi chwarae teg i bawb.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Mae'r rhain yn faterion pwysig, y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi arwain arnynt. Dechreuaf drwy roi fy ymateb yng nghydestun yr adroddiadau ar daliadau presgripsiwn a ystyriwyd gan y Pwyllgor Archwilio, y cyfeiriodd Alun Cairns at un ohonynt gynnu. Er bod yr adroddiadau hynny'n ymdrin â mwyhau incwm yn bennaf, yr oeddent yn ymdrin â materion cymhwyster, fel y rhoddwyd ar ddeall yn fy ateb i'r Pwyllgor yn Ionawr 2002. Ymhlith y camau eraill yr ydym wedi'u cymryd y mae rhewi taliadau presgripsiwn ar £6. Maent wedi codi i £6.20 mewn manau eraill yn y DU. Yr ydym wedi eithrio pawb o dan 25 oed gan sicrhau bod tua 250,000 o bobl yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys y rhai llai cefnog, yn gallu cael presgripsiynau am ddim.

Mae ymestyn ein gwaith ym maes presgripsiynau'n bwysig am ddau reswm. Yn gyntaf, mae'n amlwg bod hynny'n cyd-fynd â strategaeth wrth-dlodi Llafur. Ceir rhai sy'n dioddef gan anhwylderau cronig sy'n ennill ychydig bach yn fwy na'r lefel lle y mae'r cymorth presennol yn dechrau. Rhaid inni ddod o hyd i ddulliau newydd o estyn cymorth iddynt. Yn ail, mae goblygiadau pwysig o ran iechyd. Soniodd David Melding am y cynnydd mewn iechyd a gafwyd yn achos cleifion sy'n dioddef anhwylderau cronig. Os na allant fforddio eu meddyginiaeth, gallai eu hanhwylderau waethygu ac wedyn rhaid i'r gwasanaeth iechyd ymyrryd mewn ffyrdd eraill.

Yr wyf wedi clywed llawer o sylwadau gan gyrrff yn awgrymu gwahanol lwybrau i'w

ahead. Ann Jones and Dai Lloyd mentioned prepayment certificates and ways of addressing that issue, such as allowing the charges to be paid in instalments. I am sympathetic to Derek Wanless's recent comments, which were quoted this afternoon, on the rationale of the current exemption policies. The present arrangements have been criticised for many years on two grounds: first, in terms of the list of medical conditions—we have heard those arguments today—and, secondly, on the logic of allowing a medically exempt person to have free prescriptions for drugs that are not related to his or her exemption, irrespective of that person's ability to pay. Derek Wanless has suggested that we need to think this through, which is why I had already instigated work on this matter before the motion was tabled.

We need to consider the way forward in detail, as Kirsty has acknowledged. Therefore, I have decided to establish a review group to develop an appropriate definition of a chronic lifelong condition and to review the rationale for the current arrangements that relate to prescription charges, exemptions and remissions. It is essential that legislation is workable, fair and robust in the face of possible legal challenge. I will announce the review group's terms of reference shortly.

I am broadly sympathetic with the aims that underline this motion and am prepared to support it in principle.

**Ron Davies:** You are, quite properly, presenting your interpretation of this issue today, but our problem, as an Assembly, is that we are being asked to vote for a motion that instructs you to make provision for people to receive free prescriptions. That is not what you are saying. Can you clarify whether you are prepared to accept that the figure of £20 million—which Kirsty has helpfully provided in her financial assessment—is binding? Can you give us an idea of the timescale? I am sure that we will now be inundated with requests from individuals stating that they suffer from a chronic illness and enquiring as to when they will get free prescriptions. Can you give us

dilyn. Soniodd Ann Jones a Dai Lloyd am dystysgrifau talu ymlaen llaw a dulliau o ymdrin â'r mater hwnnw, fel caniatáu talu amdanynt drwy randaliadau. Cydymdeimlaf â'r sylwadau diweddar gan Derek Wanless, a ddyfynnwyd y prynhawn yma, ymghylch sail resymegol y polisiau presennol ar eithrio. Bu beirniadu ar y trefniadau presennol ers llawer blwyddyn am ddau reswm: yn gyntaf, yng nghyd-destun y rhestr o anhwylderau meddygol—clywsom y dadleuon hynny heddiw—ac, yn ail, am y rhesymeg o ganiatáu i rywun sydd wedi'i eithrio'n feddygol gael presgripsiynau am ddim am gyffuriau nad ydynt yn gysylltiedig â'i eithriad, pa un a yw'r person hwnnw'n gallu talu neu beidio. Mae Derek Wanless wedi awgrymu bod angen inni ystyried hyn yn drwyadl, a dyna pam yr wyf eisoes wedi cychwyn gwaith ar y mater hwn cyn cyflwyno'r cynnig.

Rhaid inni ystyried y ffordd ymlaen yn fanwl, fel y mae Kirsty wedi cydnabod. Gan hynny, yr wyf wedi penderfynu sefydlu grŵp adolygu i ddatblygu diffiniad priodol o anhwylder cronig gydol-oes ac adolygu'r sail resymegol i'r trefniadau presennol sy'n ymwneud â thaliadau presgripsiwn, eithriadau a dileadau. Mae'n hollbwysig i ddeddfwriaeth fod yn ymarferol, yn deg ac yn gadarn yn wyneb y posibilrwydd o'i herio'n gyfreithiol. Byddaf yn cyhoeddi cylch gorchwyl y grŵp adolygu cyn hir.

Yr wyf yn cydymdeimlo'n gyffredinol ag amcanion sylfaenol y cynnig ac yr wyf yn barod i'w gefnogi mewn egwyddor.

**Ron Davies:** Yr ydych, yn gwbl briodol, yn cyflwyno'ch dehongliad chi o'r mater hwn heddiw, ond ein problem ni, fel Cynulliad, yw y gofynnir inni bleidleisio o blaid cynnig sy'n eich cyfarwyddo i ddarparu ar gyfer derbyn presgripsiynau am ddim. Nid hynny yr ydych yn ei ddweud. A allwch egluro a ydych yn barod i dderbyn bod y ffigur o £20 miliwn—y mae Kirsty wedi'i ddarparu'n gymwynasgar yn ei hasesiad ariannol—yn rhwymol? A allwch roi rhyw syniad inni o'r amserlen? Yr wyf yn siŵr y cawn lif o geisiadau'n awr oddi wrth unigolion sy'n datgan eu bod yn dioddef gan salwch cronig ac yn holi pa bryd y cânt bresgripsiynau am ddim. A allwch roi rhyw syniad i ni o ran y

some idea as to the process, cost and time, so that when we come to vote, we will know on what we are voting?

**Jane Hutt:** My final comment will answer your question. The mechanisms for achieving these aims will have to be subject to the review group's advice. It will influence the steps that we will need to take to bring any necessary legislation before the Assembly. That is my response: I approve this in principle, but the mechanisms used will be subject to the review group's advice.

**Kirsty Williams:** I wholeheartedly welcome Dai Lloyd's comments and Plaid Cymru's support. It clearly understands what we are trying to achieve in terms of breaking down barriers for people who need to access drugs. On Ann Jones's comments, I am glad that she accepts that the current system is flawed and that some people who have to pay for their prescriptions should not have to do so. Ann raised the issue of judicial review. I understand that the current system is open to judicial review, but no-one has bothered to pursue that. Perhaps, after today's debate, some of the groups who currently pay for prescriptions will think about this differently. The current system is open to judicial review in terms of its robustness. I accept your point that there are other ways of helping low-income groups. I have discussed that at length with the Minister, as I am sure that she would confirm.

4.10 p.m.

David, the stark fact is that 88 per cent of patients in Wales already receive free prescriptions. That so many people are currently exempt gives a stark picture of the kind of country in which we live. I am trying to target those vulnerable groups of people who often require numerous types of medication and are just above the income criteria for exemption. It is difficult to deny, Alun, that if one takes up the cause of this group, that challenges the continuation of prescription charges. Given that we already pay to exempt so many people, I cannot deny that if we also exempt this group of

broese, y gost a'r amser, fel y gwyddom, pan ddeuwn at y bleidlais, ar beth yr ydym yn pleidleisio?

**Jane Hutt:** Bydd fy sylw olaf yn ateb eich cwestiwn. Bydd yn rhaid cael cyngor gan y grŵp adolygu ar y mecanweithiau i gyflawni'r nodau hyn. Bydd yn dylanwadu ar y camau y byddwn yn gorfod eu cymryd i ddwyn unrhyw ddeddfwriaeth sydd ei hangen gerbron y Cynulliad. Dyna fy ymateb i: cymeradwyaf hyn mewn egwyddor, ond bydd y mecanweithiau a ddefnyddir yn dibynnu ar y cyngor a geir gan y grŵp adolygu.

**Kirsty Williams:** Croesawaf sylwadau Dai Lloyd a chefnogaeth Plaid Cymru yn galonnog. Mae'n amlwg ei bod yn deall yr hyn yr ydym yn ceisio'i gyflawni o ran chwalu rhwystrau ar gyfer pobl y mae'n rhaid iddynt gael cyffuriau. Ynghylch sylwadau Ann Jones, yr wyf yn falch ei bod yn derbyn bod y system bresennol yn ddiffygiol a bod rhai sy'n gorfod talu am eu presgripsiynau na ddylent orfod gwneud hynny. Gwnaeth Ann godi mater arfarniad barnwrol. Yr wyf yn deall bod y system bresennol yn agored i adolygiad barnwrol, ond nid oes neb wedi trafferthu mynd ynghylch hynny. Efallai, ar ôl y ddadl heddiw, y bydd rhai o'r grwpiau sy'n talu am bresgripsiynau ar hyn o bryd yn newid eu meddwl am hynny. Mae'r system bresennol yn agored i adolygiad barnwrol o ran ei chadernid. Yr wyf yn derbyn y pwynt a wnaethoch am ddulliau eraill sydd ar gael i helpu grwpiau sydd ar incwm isel. Yr wyf wedi trafod hynny'n faith gyda'r Gweinidog, fel y byddai'n cadarnhau, yr wyf yn siŵr.

David, y gwir plaen amdani yw bod 88 y cant o'r cleifion yng Nghymru'n cael presgripsiynau am ddim. Mae'r ffaith bod cynifer wedi'u heithrio ar hyn o bryd yn cynnig darlun cignoeth o'r math o wlad yr ydym yn byw ynddi. Yr wyf yn ceisio targedu'r grwpiau hynny sy'n agored i niwed y mae arnynt angen nifer o fathau o feddyginiaeth yn aml ac y mae eu hincwm ond ychydig yn uwch na'r maen prawf ar gyfer eithrio. Anodd gwadu, Alun, os yw rhywun yn pledio achos y grŵp hwn, nad yw hynny'n ddadl yn erbyn parhau â thaliadau presgripsiwn. Gan ein bod eisoes yn talu i

individuals, we are questioning the fundamental basis of the system that we operate. I would not try to deny or hide from that.

I am glad that the Minister acknowledged the principle of what we are trying to achieve today. That is in stark contrast to Alan Milburn in 1998, who steadfastly refused to review this situation on an England and Wales basis. I am glad that the Minister will announce a review of these procedures. On Ron Davies's comments, all the Labour Members can do today is to look at their consciences and at the motion and decide whether they want to support people with long-term illnesses.

eithrio cynifer o bobl, ni allaf wadu, os byddwn yn eithrio'r grŵp hwn hefyd, nad ydym yn bwrw amheuaeth ar sail y system a weithredwn. Ni fyddwn yn ceisio gwadu neu osgoi hynny.

Yr wyf yn falch bod y Gweinidog wedi cydnabod egwyddor yr hyn yr ydym yn ceisio'i gyflawni heddiw. Mae hynny mewn cyferbyniad llwyr i Alan Milburn yn 1998, a oedd yn ddiwyro ei wrthwynebiad i adolygu'r sefyllfa hon ar sail Cymru a Lloegr. Yr wyf yn falch y bydd y Gweinidog yn cyhoeddi adolygiad o'r gweithdrefnau hyn. Yngghylch sylwadau Ron Davies, y cwbl y gall yr Aelodau Llafur ei wneud heddiw yw chwilio eu cydwybod ac edrych ar y cynnig a phenderfynu a ydynt am gynorthwyo pobl sydd â salwch tymor-hir.

*Cynnig (NDM1283): O blaid 44, Ymatal 6, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1283): For 44, Abstain 6, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun

Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Jones, David Ian  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Rogers, Peter

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

## **Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru) Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru)**

### **Cyfathrebu Communications**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1 and 2 in the name of Carwyn Jones and amendments 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, and 8 in the name of Jonathan Morgan.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 2 yn enw Carwyn Jones a gwelliannau 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, a 8 yn enw Jonathan Morgan.

**Phil Williams:** I propose that

**Phil Williams:** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*deplores the failure of the Government to produce a detailed plan that mobilises available resources to create efficient physical and electronic communications throughout Wales as an essential element of a successful modern economy;*

*yn gresynu at fethiant y Llywodraeth i lunio cynllun manwl sy'n caniatáu defnyddio'r adnoddau sydd ar gael i sefydlu dulliau cyfathrebu ffisegol ac electronig effeithlon ledled Cymru fel elfen allweddol o economi fodern lwyddiannus;*

*and further deplores the failure to set up appropriate bodies with power to implement strategies for Wales within those policy areas regulated overall by the Strategic Rail Authority and the proposed Office of Communications. (NDM1327)*

*ac yn gresynu hefyd at y methiant i sefydlu cyrff priodol gyda'r pŵer i weithredu strategaethau ar gyfer Cymru o fewn y meysydd polisi hynny a reoleiddir yn gyffredinol gan yr Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol a'r swyddfa gyfathrebu arfaethedig. (NDM1327)*

Communications have always been essential for the economy. In the nineteenth century, industry depended on railways; in the twentieth century, good roads were the key factor and, in this century, broadband

Mae cyfathrebu'n hanfodol i'r economi erioed. Yn y bedwaredd ganrif ar bymtheg, yr oedd diwydiant yn dibynnu ar reilffyrdd; yn yr ugeinfed ganrif, ffyrdd da oedd y ffactor allweddol ac, yn y ganrif hon, bydd



connectivity will be just as important. We will review the record of Labour in developing good communications. I will give an overview, but all I need to do is to collect news headlines from the last few months to demonstrate Labour's failure.

Take roads; there is a depressing fatalism that accepts that total gridlock will become more and more common in areas with a complex network of motorways, but, in Wales, we still lack a complete network of basic roads. In 1944, when I was five, a report on economic reconstruction gave the highest priority to the Cardiff to Holyhead road. When I was 25, Jim Griffiths gave the highest priority to a north-south road. Now that I am close to retirement, the road is far from complete and significant improvements will not begin until 2008. There have been no major improvements in Welsh roads since the completion of the A55. In 1966, I remember attacking Ness Edwards because the heads of the Valleys road between Hirwaun and Abergavenny was a single carriageway, almost uniquely among new trunk roads at that time. Therefore, we welcome the plans to dual that stretch of the road, but most of the work will not start until 2008 while the Valleys are in urgent need of economic regeneration now.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Jane, you cannot hold a conversation with Andrew during Plenary.

**Phil Williams:** As someone who is concerned about global warming, I would perhaps accept a smaller road budget if there were significant improvements in our railways. Our hopes were boosted when a new Labour Government announced a huge investment in railways. There might even be enough to reopen lines from Riwabon to Bermo, or Porthmadog to Bangor—the kind of lines that have recently been reopened in Germany. Then we learned that we would only receive 0.3 per cent of the capital investment. However, even that was optimistic. We now face a possible reduction in rail support, and if we want a service to Ebbw Vale or to the airport, we will have to pay for a large part of it ourselves, even

cysylltedd band eang yr un mor bwysig. Gwnawn adolygu record Llafur yng nghydestun datblygu cyfathrebu da. Cynigiad drosolwg, ond y cwbl y mae'n rhaid imi ei wneud yw casglu penawdau newyddion o'r misoedd diwethaf i ddangos methiant Llafur.

Cymerwch ffyrdd; ceir tyngediaeth ddigalon sy'n derbyn y bydd tagfeydd llwyr yn dod yn fwyfwy cyffredin mewn ardaloedd sydd â rhwydwaith cymhleth o draffyrdd, ond, yng Nghymru, yr ydym yn dal i fod heb rwydwaith cyfan o ffyrdd sylfaenol. Yn 1944, pan oeddwn yn bump oed, yr oedd adroddiad ar ailadeiladu economaidd yn rhoi'r flaenoriaeth bennaf i'r ffordd o Gaerdydd i Gaerdybi. Pan oeddwn yn 25 oed, rhoddodd Jim Griffiths y flaenoriaeth bennaf i ffordd o'r De i'r Gogledd. A minnau'n agos at oed ymddeol, mae'r ffordd ymhell o fod wedi'i chwblhau ac ni fydd gwelliannau sylweddol yn dechrau tan 2008. Ni fu gwelliannau o bwys yn ffyrdd Cymru ers cwblhau'r A55. Yn 1966, cofiaf ymosod ar Ness Edwards am mai un lôn oedd ar ffordd blaenau'r Cymoedd o Hirwaun i'r Fenni, ac yr oedd yn unigryw bron yn hynny o beth ymysg cefnffyrdd newydd ar y pryd. Gan hynny, yr ydym yn croesawu'r cynlluniau i ddeuoli'r rhan honno o'r ffordd, ond ni fydd y rhan fwyaf o'r gwaith yn dechrau tan 2008 tra bo taer angen ar y Cymoedd am adfywio economaidd yn awr.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Jane, ni chewch sgwrsio ag Andrew yn ystod Cyfarfod Llawn.

**Phil Williams:** Fel un sy'n ymboeni ynghylch y cynhesu byd-eang, byddwn yn derbyn cyllideb lai ar gyfer ffyrdd, efallai, pe byddai gwelliannau sylweddol yn ein rheilffyrdd. Rhoddwyd hwb i'n gobeithion pan gyhoeddodd Llywodraeth Lafur newydd y byddai buddsoddiad anferth mewn rheilffyrdd. Gallai fod digon hyd yn oed i ailagor rheilffyrdd o Riwabon i Abermaw, neu o Borthmadog i Fangor—y math o reilffyrdd sydd wedi'u hailagor yn ddiweddar yn yr Almaen. Wedyn cawsom wybod na fyddem ond yn cael 0.3 y cant o'r buddsoddiad cyfalaf. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd hyd yn oed hynny'n optimistaidd. Yn awr yr ydym yn wynebu'r posibilrwydd o ostyngiad yn y cymorth i reilffyrdd, ac os ydym am gael

though we do not get a single penny of railway money in the Barnett block. Since the comprehensive spending review, Scotland now gets £230 million a year. On the same basis, we should get £130 million. However, we do not get a penny—the whole matter is out of our control. Others today will deal with our lack of full representation on the Strategic Rail Authority.

With a grossly unfair Barnett formula, we have a shortage of resources. However, even when we have resources—as I pointed out last week—they are not always used. There is a budget in Objective 1 to cover transport infrastructure. Three years into the programme, less than 10 per cent of it has been allocated. That indicates a serious lack of urgency in tackling a serious problem.

One form of communication remains to be discussed, which is even more important than the others—information communication. In 1944, Plaid Cymru published a plan to bring broadband to every town and village. I have a summary of the plan before me. It was based on the knowledge that there was already a substantial backbone of optic fibre linking the main exchanges—ahead of most countries—and that Wales was the major producer of fibre with a large opto-electronic sector. Therefore, we realistically proposed a systematic programme that would first link universities, colleges, hospitals and industrial estates, then extend to schools, libraries, surgeries and town centres, and, finally, deliver broadband via optic fibre to every group of houses, where the final stage could be carried by copper.

Our plan in 1944 was technically and financially realistic and it could have been completed by 2001, putting Wales at the forefront in a technology that removes the geographic disadvantage of remoteness. Instead, Wales is today at the bottom of the UK table, with—

gwasanaeth i Lynebwy neu i'r maes awyr, bydd yn rhaid inni dalu am ran helaeth o hynny ein hunain, er nad ydym yn cael yr un geiniog o arian ar gyfer rheilffyrdd ym mloc Barnett. Ers yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant, mae'r Alban bellach yn cael £230 miliwn y flwyddyn. Ar yr un sail, dylem ni gael £130 miliwn. Fodd bynnag, nid ydym yn cael yr un geiniog—mae'r holl fater y tu hwnt i'n rheolaeth. Bydd eraill heddiw yn ymdrin â'r ffaith nad oes gennym gynrychiolaeth lawn ar yr Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol.

Oherwydd annhegwch dybryd fformiwlâ Barnett, yr ydym yn brin o adnoddau. Er hynny, hyd yn oed pan fo'r adnoddau gennym—fel y nodais yr wythnos diwethaf—ni chânt eu defnyddio bob amser. Mae cyllideb yn Amcan 1 ar gyfer seilwaith trafniadaeth. Wedi i dair blynedd o'r rhaglen fynd heibio, llai na 10 y cant ohoni sydd wedi'i ddyrannu. Mae hynny'n arwydd o ddiffyg brys difrifol wrth fynd i'r afael â phroblem ddifrifol.

Mae un math o gyfathrebu'n aros i'w drafod, sy'n bwysicach hyd yn oed na'r lleill—cyfathrebu gwybodaeth. Yn 1944, cyhoeddodd Plaid Cymru gynllun i ddod â'r band eang i bob tref a phentref. Mae gennyf grynoded o'r cynllun o'm blaen. Yr oedd yn seiliedig ar y wybodaeth bod asgwrn cefn sylweddol o ffeibrau optig eisoes yn cysylltu'r prif gyfnewidfeydd—o flaen y rhan fwyaf o wledydd—ac mai Cymru oedd y prif gynhyrnydd ffeibrau a chanddi sector opto-electronig mawr. Gan hynny, gwnaethom gynnig yn realistig raglen systematig a fyddai'n cysylltu prifysgolion, colegau, ysbytai ac ystadau diwydiannol yn gyntaf, ac wedyn yn ymestyn i ysgolion, llyfrgelloedd, meddygfeydd a chanolau trefi, ac, yn olaf, yn dod â'r band eang drwy ffeibrau optig i bob grŵp o dai, lle y gellid cludo'r rhan olaf drwy gopor.

Yr oedd ein cynllun yn 1944 yn dechnegol ac yn ariannol realistig a gallai fod wedi'i gwblhau erbyn 2001, gan roi Cymru ar y blaen mewn technoleg sy'n dileu'r anfantais o fod yn ddiaffordd. Yn lle hynny, mae Cymru heddiw ar waelod tabl y DU, gyda—

**Alison Halford:** Did you say 1944, when the war was on?

**Phil Williams:** I meant 1994. Sorry, I made a mistake.

**Alison Halford:** I thought that we were into carrier pigeon mode in those days.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. It is useful to explain matters, but we must keep to the rules of debate.

**Phil Williams:** Only 31 per cent of homes in Wales have possible access to ADSL, compared with 63 per cent in the UK as a whole. To make matters worse, according to the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, the UK lies in twenty-second place among industrialised countries in the provision of broadband. Wales could have been in the premier league, but after six years of Labour Government, we are at the bottom of the third division. Despite ambitious targets and sun-drenched press releases, the gap is growing, but that is not due to a lack of resources. Given today's exchange rate, there is £70 million in the Objective 1 programme for information technology infrastructure, yet, at the end of 2002, three years into the Objective 1 programme, not a penny of this money has been allocated. I could not check the latest figures because the Welsh European Funding Office website is unavailable, which may be understandable. We have been held back by a lack of urgency, competence, preparation and, above all, strategy. Last week, at long last, the Government presented its IT policy to the Economic Development Committee in a meeting where British Telecom, TNS from the wireless sector and Professor Mike Tedd, chair of the Wales Advisory Committee on Telecommunications, also presented papers. The difference between the Government document and the other papers was stark. I have my quarrels with BT, especially regarding its definition of broadband, however, the BT document was a recognisable strategy, with a geographic plan dividing Wales into three bands. In each case, it described the present situation, outlined realistic targets, set firm criteria for development, and indicated which

**Alison Halford:** Ai 1944 a ddywedasocho, pan oedd y rhyfel ymlaen?

**Phil Williams:** Mil naw cant naw deg a phedwar yr oeddwn yn ei feddwl. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, gwneuthum gamgymeriad.

**Alison Halford:** Yr oeddwn yn meddwl ein bod yn oes y golomen gludo bryd hynny.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae'n fuddiol egluro materion, ond rhaid inni gadw at reolau dadlau.

**Phil Williams:** Dim ond 31 y cant o gartrefi yng Nghymru a all gyrraedd ADSL, o'i gymharu â 63 y cant yn y DU gyfan. Yn waeth na hynny, yn ôl y Gymdeithas Cydweithrediad a Datblygiad Economaidd, mae'r DU yn yr ail safle ar hugain ymysg y gwledydd diwydiannol o ran darparu'r band eang. Gallasai Cymru fod yn y brif gynghrair, ond ar ôl chwe blynedd o Lywodraeth Lafur, yr ydym ar waelod y drydedd adran. Er gwaethaf y targedau uchelgeisiol a'r datganiadau heulog i'r wasg, mae'r bwlch yn ymledu, ond nid oherwydd diffyg adnoddau y mae hynny. Oherwydd y gyfradd gyfnewid heddiw, mae £70 miliwn yn rhaglen Amcan 1 ar gyfer seilwaith technoleg gwybodaeth, ac eto, ar ddiwedd 2002, dair blynedd ar ôl dechrau rhaglen Amcan 1, nid oes yr un geiniog o'r arian hwn wedi'i ddyrannu. Ni allwn weld y ffigurau diweddaraf am nad yw gwefan Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru ar gael, a gallai hynny fod yn ddealladwy. Yr ydym wedi ein dal yn ôl gan ddiffyg brys, diffyg gallu, diffyg paratoi ac, yn fwy na dim, diffyg strategaeth. Yr wythnos diwethaf, o'r diwedd, cyflwynodd y Llywodraeth ei pholisi TG i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd mewn cyfarfod lle y cyflwynwyd papurau hefyd gan British Telecom, TNS o'r sector technoleg ddi-wifr a'r Athro Mike Tedd, cadeirydd Pwyllgor Ymgynghorol Cymru ar Delathrebu. Yr oedd gwahaniaeth trawiadol rhwng dogfen y Llywodraeth a'r papurau eraill. Byddaf yn anghytuno o bryd i'w gilydd â BT, yn enwedig ynghylch ei ddiffiniad o'r band eang ond, er hynny, gellid gweld mai strategaeth oedd dogfen BT, ac ynddi gynllun daearydol a oedd yn rhannu Cymru'n dair ardal. Ym mhob achos, disgrifiai'r sefyllfa bresennol, amlinellai dargedau realistig, pennai feini prawf cadarn

technologies were most suitable. I do not agree with it all, but at least we knew where it stood. That is what we have been demanding from the Government. We have asked for a clear analysis of which urban areas will be best served by DSL in a cost effective way and asked how the fibre used to carry broadband to a village school can be shared with the surrounding houses, which rural areas will need wireless links, what frequencies will serve them best, and how the limited number of satellite channels can be best allocated.

4.20 p.m.

A responsible and well-prepared strategy would provide that information, which is what we wanted three years ago. Instead, we have heard the phrase 'we are technologically neutral', which is why the Government celebrates wireless broadband in Cardiff—the part of Wales that needs it least—and places the greatest emphasis on the roll-out of subsidised one-way satellite broadband, which is a medium that in the long-term will only have enough VDSL channels to satisfy a limited number of customers in a niche market for which it must be reserved.

Finally, the important message is that, in sparsely populated rural areas, such as the one in which I live, wireless has a crucial role to play and a well-planned allocation of the frequencies available in Wales will fill the final gap in broadband coverage. We now learn that Wales will not be treated as a unit in the allocation of the 3.4 GHz band. In the 15 regions designated by the London Government, north Wales will be linked with Yorkshire and North Lancashire. Mid-Wales will be linked with Lincolnshire—knowing both areas well, I see a similarity in their topography. South Wales will be linked with west England, except for a Severnside cut-out straddling the border. Moreover, the terms of the allocation do not impose any obligation on companies to provide a uniform service and the decision will apparently be made on the size of the bid and not on the merit of the proposal. Those boundaries and this process do not make any sense, either technically or

ar gyfer datblygu, a nodai pa dechnolegau oedd y rhai mwyaf addas. Nid wyf yn cytuno â'r cwbl ohoni, ond o leiaf y gwyddem beth oedd ei safbwynt. Dyna'r hyn y buom yn galw amdano gan y Llywodraeth. Yr ydym wedi gofyn am ddadansoddiad eglur o ba ardaloedd trefol a gaiff eu gwasanaethu orau gan DSL mewn modd cost-effeithiol ac wedi gofyn sut y gellir rhannu'r ffeibrau a ddefnyddir i gludo'r band eang i ysgol bentref â'r tai o gwmpas, pa ardaloedd gwledig y bydd arnynt angen cysylltiadau di-wifr, pa amleddau a fydd yn eu gwasanaethu orau, a sut y gellir dyrannu'r nifer gyfyngedig o sianeli lloeren yn y modd gorau.

Byddai strategaeth gyfrifol a gofalus wedi darparu'r wybodaeth honno, sef yr hyn yr oeddem am ei gael dair blynedd yn ôl. Yn lle hynny, clywsom yr ymadrodd 'yr ydym yn dechnolegol niwtral', sef y rheswm y mae'r Llywodraeth yn clodfori'r band eang di-wifr yng Nghaerdydd—y rhan o Gymru y mae arni ei angen leiaf—ac yn rhoi'r pwyslais mwyaf ar ledaenu band eang lloeren unffordd drwy gymhorthdal, sef y cyfrwng na fydd ganddo ond digon o sianeli VDSL yn y tymor hir i fodloni nifer gyfyngedig o gwsmeriaid mewn marchnad arbenigol y mae'n rhaid ei gadw ar ei chyfer.

Yn olaf, y neges bwysig yw, mewn ardaloedd gwledig tenau eu poblogaeth, fel yr un lle'r wyf fi'n byw, mae rôl hollbwysig i dechnoleg ddi-wifr a bydd dyrannu'r amleddau sydd ar gael yng Nghymru yn ôl cynllun da yn llenwi'r bwlch olaf yn y ddarpariaeth o'r band eang. Cawsom wybod bellach na chaiff Cymru ei thrin fel uned wrth ddyrannu'r band 3.4 GHz. Yn y 15 rhanbarth a ddyrannwyd gan Lywodraeth Llundain, bydd y Gogledd yn gysylltiedig â Swydd Efrog a Gogledd Swydd Gaerhirfryn. Bydd y Canolbarth yn gysylltiedig â Swydd Lincoln—gan fy mod yn adnabod y ddwy ardal yn dda, gwelaf y tebygrwydd yn eu topograffi. Cysylltir y De â gorllewin Lloegr, heblaw am ddarn o Lannau Hafren o boptu'r ffin. At hynny, nid yw telerau'r dyraniad yn rhoi unrhyw orfodaeth ar gwmnïau i ddarparu gwasanaeth unffurf ac ymddengys y bydd y penderfyniad yn dibynnu ar faint y cynnig ac nid ar rinweddau'r cynllun. Nid yw'r ffiniau hynny

commercially. They are as absurd as the BBC plans in the 1930s that would not allow the existence of BBC Wales. This situation could not have come about if the Radiocommunications Agency had been presented with a proper strategy for broadband in Wales, indicating the special role of wireless, where it was to be allocated and what frequencies were topographically ideal. If that had been presented, the Radiocommunications Agency could not have devised this absurd map. This decision shows that the UK Government has shown total contempt for the Government plans for IT in Wales. Perhaps I agree with the UK Government: the failure of the Assembly Government to provide sufficient resources and to use them effectively to develop communications in Wales is one of a long list. What is most damning is the excuse that we hear time and time again that more time is needed to prepare the plans and that the Government has to get it just right. What was the Labour Party in Wales doing during the 1990s? It came into Government with a blank sheet of paper and, when it exits in May, all that we will inherit is a page of scribbles.

**The Minister for Economic Development (Andrew Davies):** I propose the following amendments in the name of Carwyn Jones. Amendment 1: delete

*deplores the failure of the Government to produce a detailed plan that mobilises*

and replace with ‘*welcomes Government initiatives that mobilise*’.

I propose amendment 2. Delete all after ‘*successful modern economy*;’.

**Alun Cairns:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Amendment 3: delete all after ‘*further*’ and replace with:

*believes Wales should be represented in all bodies that affect Wales within those areas regulated by the Strategic Rail Authority and Ofcom.*

a’r broses hon yn gwneud synnwyr o gwbl, yn dechnegol nac yn fasnachol. Maent mor afresymegol â chynlluniau’r BBC yn y 1930au nad oeddent yn caniatáu bodolaeth BBC Cymru. Ni allasai’r sefyllfa hon godi pe buasai strategaeth briodol wedi’i chyflwyno i’r Asiantaeth Cysylltiadau Radio ar gyfer y band eang yng Nghymru, yn nodi rôl arbennig technoleg ddi-wifr, ym mhle yr oedd i’w dyrannu a pha amleddau a oedd orau o ystyried topograffi. Pe byddai honno wedi’i chyflwyno, ni allasai’r Asiantaeth Cysylltiadau Radio ddyfeisio’r map gwirion hwn. Dengys y penderfyniad hwn fod Llywodraeth y DU wedi amlygu dirmyg llwyr tuag at gynlluniau’r Llywodraeth ar gyfer TG yng Nghymru. Efallai y cytunaf â Llywodraeth y DU: mae methiant Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ddarparu adnoddau digonol a’u defnyddio’n effeithiol i ddatblygu cyfathrebu yng Nghymru’n un mewn rhestr hir. Yr hyn sy’n fwyaf damniol yw’r esgus a glywn dro ar ôl tro bod angen mwy o amser i baratoi’r cynlluniau a bod rhaid i’r Llywodraeth ei gael yn union gywir. Beth yr oedd y Blaid Lafur yng Nghymru’n ei wneud yn ystod y 1990au? Daeth i Lywodraeth gyda darn o bapur gwag a, pan aiff ym mis Mai, y cwbl a gawn ar ei hôl fydd tudalen o sgribladau.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd (Andrew Davies):** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Carwyn Jones. Gwelliant 1: dileu

*yn gresynu at fethiant y Llywodraeth i lunio cynllun manwl*

ac yn ei le rhei ‘*yn croesawu mentrau gan y Llywodraeth*’

Cynigiau welliant 2. Dileu popeth ar ôl ‘*economi fodern lwyddiannus*;’.

**Alun Cairns:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Gwelliant 3: dileu’r ail bwynt ac yn ei le rhei:

*yn credu y dylai Cymru gael ei chynrychioli ar bob corff sy’n effeithio ar Gymru o fewn y meysydd a reoleiddir gan yr Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol ac Ofcom.*

I propose amendment 4. Add at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to negotiate with the UK Government to deliver a fixed wireless access licence for broadband communications that meets the needs of all of Wales in the 3.4 GHz auction in the first instance and all subsequent auctions, together with demands of roll-out obligations.*

I propose amendment 5. Add at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government and its public sector agencies to use the broadband network available to the private sector wherever possible, after appropriate security considerations, to stimulate demand for telecommunication companies to enable lower cost connection charges to be made available to the business and domestic communities.*

I propose amendment 6. Add at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to commit to an M4 relief road from Castleton to Magor, taking traffic away from the Brynglas Tunnels at Newport.*

I propose amendment 7. Add at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to commit to improvements to the A470, the main link road between north and south Wales.*

I propose amendment 8. Add at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to commit to the delivery of a modern access road to Cardiff airport.*

This debate relates to physical and electronic communication links. The motion is timely in that a discussion at last week's Economic Development Committee meeting exposed a gaping hole in the Assembly Government's

Cynigiaf welliant 4. Ychwanegu ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i drafod gyda Llywodraeth y DU a oes modd iddi sicrhau y darperir trwydded mynediad di-wifr sefydlog ar gyfer cyfathrebu band eang—yn yr arwerthiant 3.4 GHz i ddechrau ac ym mhob arwerthiant wedi hynny—sy'n diwallu anghenion Cymru gyfan, yn ogystal ag yn bodloni'r gofynion o ran lledaenu'r gwasanaeth.*

Cynigiaf welliant 5. Ychwanegu ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'i hasiantaethau yn y sector preifat i ddefnyddio'r rhwydwaith band eang sydd ar gael i'r sector preifat lle bynnag y bo modd, ar ôl rhoi ystyriaeth briodol i ddiogelwch, er mwyn creu mwy o alw fel y bydd y cwmnïau telegyfathrebu yn gallu cynnig costau cysylltu is i fusnesau ac i gartrefi.*

Cynigiaf welliant 6. Ychwanegu ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ymrwymo i ddarparu ffordd liniaru'r M4 o Gas-bach i Fagwyr, a fyddai'n golygu bod llai o draffig yn mynd drwy dwnelau Brynglas yng Nghasnewydd.*

Cynigiaf welliant 7. Ychwanegu ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ymrwymo i wneud gwelliannau i'r A470, y brifffordd gyswllt rhwng y Gogledd a'r De.*

Cynigiaf welliant 8. Ychwanegu ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ymrwymo i ddarparu ffordd fodern i fynd i faes awyr Caerdydd.*

Mae'r ddadl hon yn ymwneud â chysylltiadau cyfathrebu ffisegol ac electronig. Mae'n gynnig amserol i'r graddau bod trafodaeth yn y cyfarfod o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yr wythnos diwethaf wedi

strategy, which hopes to deliver world-quality electronic communication links in Wales.

It is disappointing that the e-Minister has avoided every opportunity to discuss the Government's broadband strategy. We have previously noted that the initiative was launched at Cardiff University, where questions could be conveniently avoided. There is no doubt that effective communication links could offer the Welsh economy an enormous competitive advantage. Their importance is demonstrated by the fact that the Confederation of British Industry has made ICT and broadband links the top priority in its manifesto for the Assembly elections in May. Broadband communications and physical communication networks offer the opportunity to liberate some rural economies that have faced almost insurmountable barriers thus far, preventing them from entering the market place.

**Nick Bourne:** Do you agree that the Assembly Government should not only ensure that large businesses in business parks have access to broadband—important as that is—but that there are initiatives involving communities, such as that being sponsored by Brecon town council which involves local residents and smaller businesses? It is important that smaller communities get involved in that way in rural Wales.

**Alun Cairns:** Certainly, although I do not know the details of—

**Eleanor Burnham:** Will the Member give way?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Alun must reply to Nick first.

**Alun Cairns:** I am not familiar with the details of the Brecon town council initiative, but that is true devolution: the town council is taking the initiative. It needs to be empowered so that it can deliver for the people in its community according to local need.

In exploiting this opportunity—

datgelu bwlech anferth yn strategaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, sy'n anelu at ddarparu cysylltiadau cyfathrebu electronig o'r safon orau yn y byd yng Nghymru.

Mae'n siomedig bod yr e-Weinidog wedi osgoi pob cyfle i drafod strategaeth band eang y Llywodraeth. Yr ydym wedi nodi o'r blaen fod y fenter wedi'i lansio ym Mhrifysgol Caerdydd, lle y gellid osgoi cwestiynau'n gyfleus. Nid oes amheuaeth na allai cysylltiadau cyfathrebu effeithiol gynnig mantais gystadleuol aruthrol i economi Cymru. Amlygir eu pwysigrwydd yn y ffaith bod Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain wedi gwneud cysylltiadau TGCh a band eang yn flaenoriaeth gyntaf yn ei fanifesto ar gyfer etholiadau'r Cynulliad ym mis Mai. Mae rhwydweithiau cyfathrebu band eang a chysylltiadau ffisegol yn cynnig cyfle i ryddhau rhai economïau gwledig sydd wedi wynebu rhwystrau anorchfygol hyd yma, a'u hataliodd rhag bod yn rhan o'r farchnad.

**Nick Bourne:** A gytunwch nad ar gyfer busnesau mawr mewn parciau busnes yn unig y dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad sicrhau darpariaeth o'r band eang—er pwysiced hynny—ac y ceir mentrau sy'n cynnwys cymunedau, fel yr un a noddir gan gyngor tref Aberhonddu sy'n cynnwys trigolion lleol a busnesau llai? Mae'n bwysig bod cymunedau llai yn cymryd rhan yn y modd hwnnw yn y Gymru wledig.

**Alun Cairns:** Yn sicr, er na wn fanylion—

**Eleanor Burnham:** A wnaiff yr Aelod ildio?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Rhaid i Alun ateb Nick yn gyntaf.

**Alun Cairns:** Nid wyf yn gyfarwydd â manylion menter cyngor tref Aberhonddu, ond dyna wir ddatganoli: mae'r cyngor tref yn mentro. Rhaid ei alluogi fel y gall fynd â'r maen i'r wal ar ran y bobl yn ei gymuned yn ôl yr angen lleol.

Wrth achub ar y cyfle hwn—

**Eleanor Burnham:** If Beeching managed to decimate communities such as the Dee valley in one fell swoop by getting rid of railways under the Tory regime, why are the Tories suddenly so interested in regenerating those communities?

**Alun Cairns:** My colleague, David Davies, informs me that that happened under Wilson's Government, which was a Labour Government, in 1964. I will happily take another intervention if the Member wants to clarify the position. However, she has got it wrong.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I understand that it was at least 1961 or 1962 and it was not during Wilson's Government. Even if it had been during that Government, it was at the behest of a certain Mr Beeching.

**David Davies** *rose—*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Alun must reply to Eleanor first.

**Alun Cairns:** Bearing in mind the number of u-turns in UK Government policy over the past six years, if the party wanted to change its policy from that of 1964, it might well have an opportunity to do so.

**David Davies:** Beeching's report was published in 1963 when there was a Conservative Government. However, it was implemented from 1964 onwards under Harold Wilson's Government. That is fact.

**Alun Cairns:** I am grateful to David Davies, who obviously has all the facts to hand and who has, no doubt, put Eleanor Burnham in her place.

In exploiting this opportunity, a holistic strategy is necessary to deliver a range of services and networks that are based on local need, as Nick Bourne highlighted with his example of the actions of Brecon town council. The electronic communication solution for rural Wales will be different from that for urban areas, where the cost of fibre connection is much lower. In that respect, an obvious way to end the digital divide for the most rural areas is to establish an effective fixed wireless link. The

**Eleanor Burnham:** Gan fod Beeching wedi llwyddo i ddifrodi cymunedau fel Glyn Dyfrdwy ag un ergyd drwy gael gwared â rheilffyrdd o dan law'r Toriaid, pam y mae'r Toriaid yn ymddiddori'n sydyn mewn adfywio'r cymunedau hynny?

**Alun Cairns:** Mae fy nghyd-Aelod, David Davies, yn fy hysbysu mai o dan Lywodraeth Wilson y digwyddodd hynny, ac yr oedd honno'n Llywodraeth Lafur, yn 1964. Byddaf yn falch o dderbyn ymyriad arall os yw'r Aelod yn dymuno rhoi gwedd eglurach ar y sefyllfa. Fodd bynnag, mae wedi camgymryd.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Deallaf ei fod wedi digwydd cyn gynhared â 1961 neu 1962 ac nid yn ystod Llywodraeth Wilson. Hyd yn oed pe buasai yn ystod y Llywodraeth honno, ar gais rhyw Mr Beeching y'i gwnaed.

**David Davies** *a gododd—*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Rhaid i Alun ateb Eleanor yn gyntaf.

**Alun Cairns:** O gofio nifer y troeon pedol ym mholisi Llywodraeth y DU dros y chwe blynedd diwethaf, os oedd y blaid yn dymuno newid ei pholisi o'r hyn ydoedd yn 1964, gallai gael cyfle i wneud hynny.

**David Davies:** Cyhoeddwyd adroddiad Beeching yn 1963 pan oedd Llywodraeth Geidwadol. Fodd bynnag, fe'i gweithredwyd o 1964 ymlaen o dan Lywodraeth Harold Wilson. Mae honno'n ffaith.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i David Davies, sydd â'r holl ffeithiau wrth law, mae'n amlwg, ac sydd, yn ddi-os, wedi rhoi Eleanor Burnham yn ei lle.

Wrth achub ar y cyfle hwn, mae angen strategaeth gyfannol i ddarparu amryw o wasanaethau a rhwydweithiau sy'n seiliedig ar angen lleol, fel y pwysleisiodd Nick Bourne drwy gynnig y camau a gymerodd cyngor tref Aberhonddu yn enghraifft. Bydd yr ateb o ran cyfathrebu electronig ar gyfer y Gymru wledig yn wahanol i'r un ar gyfer ardaloedd trefol, lle y mae cost cysylltu â ffeibrau'n is o lawer. Yn hynny o beth, un modd amlwg i ddod â'r rhaniad digidol i ben ar gyfer y rhan fwyaf o ardaloedd gwledig yw



Radiocommunications Agency will hold an auction of the 3.4 GHz band in the coming months. If implemented effectively, it should form the foundation of a broadband network in rural parts of Wales. It could act as the baseline or the minimum standard that rural Wales could expect in terms of broadband communication. However, as the situation stands, Wales has been fragmented into four parts, with the largest geographical area—including Powys, Ceredigion and Snowdonia—being lumped with Lincolnshire and Northamptonshire. North Wales is linked with the North Yorkshire franchise. That clearly demonstrates the lack of co-ordination between the Assembly Government and its counterpart in Westminster.

The successful bidder for the licence will not be under any obligation to deliver the network in Wales by a particular deadline. It is likely to be a private company that will prioritise more urban areas, such as the east and west midlands where the return on capital will be quicker, while ignoring Wales. The digital divide between rural Wales and the rest of the UK will grow even wider. There was an opportunity, however, to arrange appropriate boundaries in Wales and to tie in the necessary obligations on coverage in line with a strategy agreed in the Assembly. If the Radiocommunications Agency was concerned about the lack of bidders, I would understand it. However, Total Network Solutions Ltd, a Welsh-based company, has been lobbying the Minister for an all-Wales solution since, as far as I am aware, last autumn. High-value jobs in media and communications will be lost either because of the Minister's inaction or because the corresponding Westminster department is not prepared to listen to the devolved bodies.

Finally, we are left with an auction that will lead to a broader digital divide between those who have and those who have not.

4.30 p.m.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Cododd Phil **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Phil Williams and

sefydlu cyswllt di-wifr sefydlog effeithiol. Bydd yr Asiantaeth Cysylltiadau Radio yn cynnal arwerthiant o'r band 3.4 gigahertz yn y misoedd i ddod. Os caiff ei weithredu'n effeithiol, dylai fod yn sail i rwydwaith band eang yn y rhannau gwledig o Gymru. Gallai fod yn llinell sylfaen neu'n safon sylfaenol y gallai'r Gymru wledig ei disgwyl o ran cyfathrebu band eang. Fodd bynnag, fel y mae'r sefyllfa ar hyn o bryd, mae Cymru wedi ei thorri'n bedwar darn, ac mae'r ardal ddaearyddol fwyaf—sy'n cynnwys Powys, Ceredigion ac Eryri—wedi ei thafu i'r un fasedg â Swydd Lincoln a Swydd Northampton. Cysylltwyd gogledd Cymru â masnachfaint Gogledd Swydd Efrog. Mae hyn yn amlwg yn arwydd o ddiffyg cydlynw rhwng Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'i chymar yn San Steffan.

Ni fydd yr ymgeisydd sy'n ennill y drwydded yn gorfod cwblhau'r rhwydwaith yng Nghymru erbyn unrhyw ddyddiad penodol. Mae'n debygol o fod yn gwmni preifat a fydd yn rhoi blaenoriaeth i ardaloedd mwy trefol, fel dwyrain a gorllewin canolbarth Lloegr lle y ceir elw buan o'r cyfalaf y mae'n ei fuddsoddi, gan anwybyddu Cymru. Bydd y rhaniad digidol rhwng y Gymru wledig a gweddill y DU yn mynd yn fwy byth. Yr oedd cyfle, fodd bynnag, i drefnu ffiniau priodol yng Nghymru ac i gynnwys y rhwymedigaethau angenrheidiol o ran y ddarpariaeth yn unol â strategaeth a gytunwyd yn y Cynulliad. Pe byddai'r Asiantaeth Cysylltiadau Radio yn bryderus ynghylch diffyg ymgeiswyr, byddwn yn deall hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae Total Network Solutions Cyf., cwmni sydd wedi ei leoli yng Nghymru, wedi bod yn llobio'r Gweinidog i gael ateb ar gyfer Cymru gyfan ers yr hydref diwethaf, hyd y gwn i. Collir swyddi gwerthfawr yn y cyfryngau a chyfathrebu un ai oherwydd diffyg gweithredu'r Gweinidog neu am nad yw'r adran gyfatebol yn San Steffan yn barod i wrando ar y cyrff datganoledig.

Yn olaf, fe'n gadawyd ag arwerthiant a fydd yn arwain at raniad digidol mwy rhwng y rhai sydd â digon a'r rhai sydd heb ddim.

Williams ac Alun Cairns nifer o bwyntiau y dylech ymateb iddynt, Weinidog. A ydych yn derbyn mai'r band mwyaf effeithiol ar gyfer system ddi-wifr yng Nghymru yw 3.4 GHz? Os ydych yn derbyn hynny, a ydych yn derbyn y byddai'n fuddiol i Gymru gael ei hystyried fel gwlad yn ei chyfanrwydd wrth gynllunio system gyfathrebu, er mwyn i bob rhan o'r wlad elwa ohoni? Neu a ydych yn fodlon, fel Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, i rannau o Gymru gael eu cysylltu â Lloegr, gyda'r posibilrwydd real o'r fasnachfaint yn cael ei lleoli yn Lloegr, heb unrhyw fodd o ddatblygu system ddi-wifr yn effeithiol yng Nghymru? Neu a oes gennych weledigaeth fawr—er fy mod yn amau hynny—yn y maes hwn? Os felly, a wnewch rannu gyda ni sut y byddwch yn darparu band eang ar gyfer Cymru gyfan pan nad oes modd i ddatblygu'r system ddi-wifr yn effeithiol yn yr ardaloedd gwledig?

Ar Amcan 1, a ydych yn fodlon gyda'r sefyllfa o ran cyllido'r dechnoleg ddiweddaraf yng Nghymru? Sylwais o'r darn ar gais Amcan 1 yn eich adroddiad i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, fod uned band eang Cymru yn y broses—fe'ch atgoffaf i dair blynedd o raglen Amcan 1 fynd heibio eisoes—o baratoi cais am £20 miliwn o arian Amcan 1 i weithio ar brosiectau lleol y cynllun gweithredu. Yr ydym wedi clywed bod rheolwr prosiectau lleol wedi ymuno â'r uned ddoe, a'i brif waith yw sicrhau bod y cais *proforma* Amcan 1 yn cael ei ystyried gan y bartneriaeth seilwaith yn ystod Chwefror a Mawrth. Ble bu'r cais am y tair blynedd diwethaf? Er eich bod wedi dod yn Weinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd yn gymharol ddiweddar, buoch yn gyfrifol am e-dechnoleg yn y Cynulliad o'r cychwyn. Beth fuoch yn ei wneud ers tair blynedd? Pam yr ydym wedi gwastraffu tair blynedd o amser Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, heb wneud y gwaith rhagbaratoadol hwn? Wrth i bob blwyddyn fynd heibio, yr ydym flwyddyn ar ôl yn y datblygiadau hyn. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod pawb yn cytuno bod y datblygiadau hyn yn hollbwysig ar gyfer cyfathrebu yng Nghymru. Pa gysur allwch roi i'm hetholwyr yn Nwyrain Caerfyrddin a Dinefwr? Sylwaf o'r map yr ydych wedi ei gynnwys o'r cysylltiadau sydd ar gael fod modd derbyn band 1, band 2, a band 3. Yn fy etholaeth i,

Alun Cairns have raised several points to which you should respond, Minister. Do you accept that the most effective band for a wireless system in Wales is 3.4 GHz? If so, do you accept that, in planning an electronic communications system, it would be beneficial to consider Wales in its entirety, so that every part of the country benefits from it? Or, are you happy, as the National Assembly for Wales's Minister for Economic Development, for parts of Wales to be linked with England, with the real possibility of the franchise being located in England, with no way of developing a wireless system effectively in Wales? Or do you have a great vision—which I doubt—for this area? If so, will you tell us how you will provide broadband for the whole of Wales when there is no way of developing a wireless system effectively in rural areas?

On Objective 1, are you happy with the situation in terms of funding cutting-edge technology in Wales? I noticed in the section on the Objective 1 bid in your report to the Economic Development Committee, that the broadband Wales unit is in the process—I remind you that we are three years into Objective 1—of preparing a bid for £20 million of Objective 1 money to work on the action plan's local projects. We have heard that the local projects manager joined the unit yesterday and that his main task will be to ensure that the proforma Objective 1 bid is considered by the foundation partnership in February and March. Where has this bid been for the last three years? Although you only appointed Minister for Economic Development relatively recently, you have been responsible for e-technology in the Assembly from the outset. What have you been doing for three years? Why have we wasted three years of National Assembly for Wales time, without doing this preparatory work? As every year goes by, we fall another year behind in these developments. I am sure that everyone agrees that these developments are essential for communication in Wales. What comfort can you give to my constituents in Carmarthen East and Dinefwr? I notice from the map that you have included showing the available connections that it is possible to receive band 1, band 2

hyd y gwelaf, byddem yn lwcus i gael hyd i band 3. Sut y byddwch yn sicrhau darpariaeth gyfartal drwy Gymru gyfan?

Mae hynny'n dod â mi yn ôl at fy nghwestiwn gwreiddiol a sylfaenol: a ydych yn fodlon i'r fasnachfaint a fydd yn darparu di-wifr ar 3.4 GHz fynd y tu allan i Gymru, ac a ydych yn hyderus y gallwch sicrhau y ddarpariaeth honno drwy Gymru?

**John Griffiths:** I will concentrate on transport, and refer to the amendments dealing with road access to Cardiff international airport, the M4 relief road, and the Ebbw Vale to Newport and Cardiff passenger rail route. First, concerning Cardiff international airport, it is common knowledge that although road access is significant, it is far from the most important factor in the current situation or in the future prospects of the international airport. If you compare it with Bristol airport, Cardiff airport has far better road access.

**Alun Cairns:** Will you expand on that and explain your rationale to us? Without doubt, upgrading the road links to Cardiff airport is the number one priority in Wales for Digby Jones, the director general of the Confederation of British Industry, as he has repeatedly highlighted at UK conferences. The problem is clearly not selling the product here in Wales.

**John Griffiths:** I was not referring to the CBI's UK view. It is clear from the views of airport operators that many other factors are more significant and important to them than road access. I hope that they move forward quickly in terms of expanding the range of prime destinations offered to travellers and restoring the route to Brussels as quickly as possible. Many factors are involved. Access is just one of them, but I am trying to set it in context. Comparisons are repeatedly made between Cardiff and Bristol, yet the road access to Cardiff airport is far better than that to Bristol airport.

and band 3. In my constituency, as far as I am aware, we would be lucky to receive band 3. How will you ensure equal provision throughout Wales?

That brings me back to my original and fundamental question: are you happy for the franchise to provide wireless on 3.4 GHz to go outside Wales, and are you confident that you can ensure that provision throughout Wales?

**John Griffiths:** Canolbwyntiaf ar drafnidiaeth, a chyfeirio at y gwelliannau sy'n ymdrin â mynediad ar ffyrdd i faes awyr rhyngwladol Caerdydd, ffordd liniaru'r M4, a llwybr y rheilffordd deithwyr o Lynebwy i Gasnewydd a Chaerdydd. Yn gyntaf, ynghylch maes awyr rhyngwladol Caerdydd, mae'n hysbys i bawb, er bod mynediad ar ffyrdd yn bwysig, nad hwnnw yw'r ffactor pwysicaf o bell ffordd yn y sefyllfa bresennol neu ar gyfer rhagolygon y maes awyr rhyngwladol yn y dyfodol. Os cymharwch ef â maes awyr Bryste, mae mynediad gwell o lawer ar ffyrdd i faes awyr Caerdydd.

**Alun Cairns:** A wnewch ymhelaethu ar hynny ac egluro'ch rhesymu i ni? Heb os, gwella'r cysylltiadau ffyrdd â maes awyr Caerdydd yw'r flaenoriaeth bwysicaf yng Nghymru gan Digby Jones, cyfarwyddwr cyffredinol Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain, fel y mae wedi pwysleisio dro ar ôl tro mewn cynadleddau ar gyfer y DU. Mae'n amlwg nad gwerthu'r cynnyrch yma yng Nghymru yw'r problem.

**John Griffiths:** Nid oeddwn yn cyfeirio at farn Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain yn y DU. Mae'n amlwg yn ôl barn gweithredwyr maes awyr fod llawer o ffactorau eraill yn fwy pwysig ac arwyddocaol yn eu golwg hwy na mynediad ar ffyrdd. Gobeithiaf y byddant yn symud ymlaen yn fuan o ran ehangu'r amrediad o brif gyrchfannau a gynigir i deithwyr ac adfer y llwybr i Frwsel mor gyflym ag y bo modd. Mae llawer o ffactorau'n gysylltiedig. Dim ond un yw mynediad, ond yr wyf yn ceisio ei roi yn ei gyd-destun. Cymherir Caerdydd a Bryste yn aml, ac eto mae'r mynediad ar ffyrdd i faes awyr Caerdydd yn well o lawer na hynny i faes awyr Bryste.

Turning to the M4, I have long expressed my concerns regarding the number of accidents on the M4 around Newport, especially around the Brynglas tunnels. Much is happening in terms of managing that traffic and improving signage, and I hope that a scheme is implemented soon to deal effectively with the continuing catalogue of accidents. It takes its toll on people's health and wellbeing, not to mention the effect it has on traffic congestion.

Much is happening with other road developments around Newport. The southern distributor road will partially address the problems, and improvements may result from the land and road access freed up around Llanwern and possible links with that southern distributor road. However, I hope that real progress can be made quickly. Consider what would happen if there were to be an accident—heaven forbid—in the Brynglas tunnels. Emergency planners must have nightmares about such a scenario. Public transport features here again. It would ease those problems if we could transport more freight and passengers by rail.

Finally, I hope that we pay great heed to the regeneration study of the Newport to Ebbw Vale rail link carried out following the Corus closures in Ebbw Vale. That clearly showed that Newport is the natural destination for Ebbw Vale residents in terms of seeking jobs and economic prosperity. For that reason, and for many others, it is vital that we establish that passenger rail link from Ebbw Vale to Newport as quickly as possible.

**Janet Davies:** To allow people to get to their jobs and to control pollution and road building, we need a good-quality public transport system. That will mean improvements to some roads, but amendments 6, 7 and 8 in the name of Jonathan Morgan are inappropriate in this debate. This is not the place to seek commitments to specific schemes. They should be considered within the whole programme.

Gan droi at yr M4, yr wyf yn mynegi pryderon ers talwm ynghylch y nifer o ddamweiniau ar yr M4 ger Casnewydd, yn enwedig ger twneli Bryn-glas. Mae llawer yn digwydd o ran rheoli'r traffig hwnnw a gwella'r arwyddion, a gobeithiaf y caiff cynllun ei roi ar waith cyn hir i ddelio'n effeithiol â'r damweiniau sy'n dal i ddigwydd. Mae'n niweidiol i iechyd a lles pobl, heb sôn am ei effaith ar dagfeydd traffig.

Mae llawer yn digwydd o ran y datblygiadau ffyrdd eraill yng nghyffiniau Casnewydd. Bydd y ffordd ddosbarthu ddeheuol yn ateb y problemau'n rhannol, ac efallai y ceir gwelliannau yn sgîl rhyddhau'r tir a'r mynediad ar ffyrdd o gwmpas Llanwern a chysylltiadau posibl â'r ffordd ddosbarthu ddeheuol honno. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiaf y gellir gwneud cynnydd gwirioneddol yn gyflym. Ystyriwch beth a ddigwyddai pe byddai damwain—Duw a'n gwaredo rhag hynny—yn nhwneli Bryn-glas. Mae cynllunwyr argyfwng yn sicr o gael hunllefau ynghylch senario o'r fath. Mae trafndiaeth gyhoeddus yn fater sy'n codi yma eto. Gellid lliniaru'r problemau hyn os gallem gludo rhagor o nwyddau a theithwyr ar reilffyrdd.

Yn olaf, gobeithiaf y byddwn yn cymryd sylw mawr o'r astudiaeth adfywio o'r cyswllt rheilffordd rhwng Casnewydd a Glynebwy a gynhaliwyd ar ôl cau gwaith Corus yng Nglynebwy. Yr oedd yn dangos yn eglur mai Casnewydd yw'r cyrchfan naturiol i drigolion Glynebwy o ran chwilio am swyddi a ffyniant economaidd. Am y rheswm hwnnw, a llawer o rai eraill, mae'n hollbwysig ein bod yn sefydlu'r cyswllt rheilffordd deithwyr hwnnw o Lynebwy i Gasnewydd cyn gynted ag y bo modd.

**Janet Davies:** Er mwyn caniatáu i bobl gyrraedd eu gwaith ac i reoli llygredd ac adeiladu ffyrdd, mae arnom angen system drafndiaeth gyhoeddus o ansawdd da. Bydd hynny'n golygu gwelliannau i rai ffyrdd, ond mae gwelliannau 6, 7 ac 8 yn enw Jonathan Morgan yn amhriodol yn y ddadl hon. Nid hwn yw'r lle i geisio ymrwymiad i gynlluniau penodol. Dylid eu hystyried o fewn y rhaglen gyfan.

Two major requirements stand out into which local and regional strategies can feed. One is a figure of eight of adequate roads to link the four corners of Wales; the other is an efficient rail system to link north and south, east and west, the hinterland with the major cities, and to provide fast links to the rest of the United Kingdom and Europe.

During the past few weeks, the Strategic Rail Authority has destroyed the work that the Assembly has done since it was established. To anyone who thinks that this is an exaggeration, links to the major cities of England and Scotland have been drastically reduced, hopes of improvement between the North and the South seem unlikely, work on the Vale of Glamorgan and Mountain Ash line is uncertain, and the Assembly must take money out of the block grant to ensure that Ebbw Vale passenger rail services come to fruition. A question mark still hovers over northern links to Manchester airport. We have all been looking for significant improvements in the new franchise as a stepping stone towards a really good rail service. I doubt if this will happen. Wales is at the mercy of an uncaring SRA; our representation on it is minimal and totally ineffective. The only member who is supposed to represent our interests has signally failed to do so or else is steamrollered by the other members. Worse, the SRA did not even bother to consult the Assembly Government. It is clear that Railtrack and Network Rail have failed to handle contracts effectively on the west coast main line. Money that has been wasted in setting them up, changing them and reducing them. That has used up finance available from the UK Government. Unfortunately, it is we in Wales who are clobbered. Plaid Cymru has proposed, time and again, both short and medium term strategies to address our lack of clout in achieving an effective railway system. In the short term, we need powers and direction over the SRA for services in Wales and the right to be consulted and heeded on services in and out of the country.

Mae dau angen mawr amlwg y gall strategaethau lleol a rhanbarthol gyfrannu at eu diwallu. Un ohonynt yw ffigur wyth o ffordd digonol i gysylltu pedair cornel Cymru; y llall yw system reilffyrdd effeithlon i gysylltu'r de a'r gogledd, y dwyrain a'r gorllewin, y berfeddwlad a'r dinasoedd mawr, ac i ddarparu cysylltiadau cyflym â gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig ac Ewrop.

Yn ystod yr wythnosau diwethaf, mae'r Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol wedi dinistrio'r gwaith a wnaeth y Cynulliad ers ei sefydlu. Os yw rhywun yn credu mai gor-ddweud yw hynny, mae cysylltiadau â phrif ddinasoedd Lloegr a'r Alban wedi eu lleihau'n drawiadol, ymddengys yn annhebygol y bydd gwelliant rhwng y De a'r Gogledd, mae'r gwaith ar reilffordd Bro Morgannwg ac Aberpennar yn ansicr, a rhaid i'r Cynulliad gymryd arian o'r grant bloc i sicrhau bod y gwasanaethau rheilffyrdd teithwyr o Lynebwy yn dwyn ffrwyth. Mae amheuaeth o hyd ynghylch y cysylltiadau rhwng y Gogledd a maes awyr Manceinion. Buom oll yn chwilio am welliannau sylweddol yn y fasnachfrait newydd fel cam ymlaen at wasanaeth rheilffyrdd gwirioneddol dda. Yr wyf yn amau a fydd hynny'n digwydd. Mae Cymru ar drugaredd Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol dihidio; mae ein cynrychiolaeth arno'n fach iawn ac yn gwbl aneffeithiol. Mae'n amlwg bod yr unig aelod sydd i fod i gynrychioli ein buddiannau wedi methu â gwneud hynny neu ei fod yn cael ei fathru dan draed yr aelodau eraill. Yn waeth na hynny, ni thrafferthodd yr awdurdod ymgynghori â Llywodraeth y Cynulliad hyd yn oed. Mae'n amlwg bod Railtrack a Network Rail wedi methu â thrafod contractau'n effeithiol ar gyfer prif reilffordd arfordir y gorllewin. Gwastraffwyd arian ar eu sefydlu, eu newid a'u lleihau. Mae hynny wedi dihysbyddu'r cyllid a oedd ar gael oddi wrth Lywodraeth y DU. Gwaetha'r modd, ni yng Nghymru a gaiff ein taro'n galed. Mae Plaid Cymru wedi cynnig, dro ar ôl tro, strategaethau tymor byr a thymor canolig i ymdrin â'n diffyg dylanwad wrth sicrhau system reilffyrdd effeithiol. Yn y tymor byr, mae arnom angen pwerau a rheolaeth dros yr Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol ar gyfer gwasanaethau yng Nghymru a'r hawl i ymgynghoriad a gwrandawriad ar wasanaethau sy'n mynd i

mewn ac allan o'r wlad.

4.40 p.m.

**Geraint Davies:** Do you agree that not enough importance has been given to improvements at Queen Street station? That improvement has been continually delayed; it would double the capacity of railway lines into the Valleys, which is important for their development.

**Janet Davies:** I agree with you, because this would do an immense amount to reduce the commuter traffic coming in from the north of Cardiff.

In the short term, we need these powers and direction over the SRA, and Plaid Cymru has been ignored and denigrated by the First Minister who, unfortunately, is not present. He said:

'The question of transferring responsibility for the railways from the administration in London to the Assembly is not relevant.'

Not relevant? Plaid Cymru points to the need in the medium term for a passenger transport board to establish an overall strategy for all our public transport. Plaid Cymru policy is that the board would have representation from grass-roots and involved organisations. It would not be an imitation of passenger transport authorities that operate in big city areas in England. It would be tailored to Welsh needs. In the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee, in the face of the Minister's obvious hostility towards such a body, I asked instead for a unit within the Assembly to at least get some basic overall strategy. I thought that I had made it clear then that this was a compromise, but there seemed to be some confusion. I hope that I have now clarified the Plaid Cymru position.

Without any of these methods, the Assembly's plans will always be undermined. It is a classic example of how the Assembly Government has failed Wales. We have been told many times that, because it is of the same political party as the UK Government,

**Geraint Davies:** A gytunwch na roddwyd digon o bwys ar welliannau yng ngorsaf Stryd y Frenhines? Mae'r gwelliant hwnnw wedi ei ohirio dro ar ôl tro; byddai'n dyblu capasiti'r rheilffyrdd i'r Cymoedd, ac mae hynny'n bwysig er mwyn eu datblygu.

**Janet Davies:** Cytunaf â chi, oherwydd gwnâi hynny lawer iawn i leihau'r traffig cymudwyr a ddaw i mewn o ogledd Caerdydd.

Yn y tymor byr, mae arnom angen y pwerau hyn a rheolaeth dros yr Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol, ac mae Plaid Cymru wedi ei hanwybyddu a'i phardduo gan y Prif Weinidog nad yw'n bresennol, gwaetha'r modd. Ei eiriau oedd:

Mae cwestiwn trosglwyddo cyfrifoldeb dros y rheilffyrdd o'r weinyddiaeth yn Llundain i'r Cynulliad yn amherthnasol.

Yn amherthnasol? Mae Plaid Cymru yn dangos yr angen yn y tymor canolig am fwrdd trafndiaeth teithwyr i sefydlu strategaeth gyffredinol ar gyfer ein holl drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus. Polisi Plaid Cymru yw y byddai cynrychiolaeth ar y bwrdd gan gyrrff lleol a chyrrff cysylltiedig. Ni fyddai'n efelychiad o awdurdodau trafndiaeth teithwyr sy'n gweithredu yn ardaloedd dinasoedd mawr yn Lloegr. Câi ei addasu i anghenion Cymru. Ym Mhwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth, yn wyneb gelyniaeth amlwg y Gweinidog i gorff o'r fath, gofynnais yn hytrach am uned yn y Cynulliad i gael rhyw strategaeth gyffredinol sylfaenol o leiaf. Credais fy mod wedi rhoi ar ddeall mai cyfaddawd oedd hwnnw, ond ymddangosai fod peth dryswch. Gobeithiaf fy mod wedi rhoi gwedd eglurach ar safbwynt Plaid Cymru yn awr.

O beidio â chael unrhyw un o'r dulliau hyn, caiff cynlluniau'r Cynulliad eu tanseilio bob tro. Mae'n enghraifft glasurolo o'r modd y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi siomi Cymru. Dywedwyd wrthym lawer gwaith y gall sicrhau bargaen well am ei bod o'r un

it can get a better deal. Once again, this claim has been destroyed. It is obvious that, when the chips are down, this Labour Government will submit to the demands of the UK Government, regardless of the needs of Wales.

**Mick Bates:** We all want a successful, modern economy for Wales, a country which has for so long been a colony of England. Our roads—and our wealth—have left the country at the expense of internal communication. For too long, there has not been a choice about what to do in Wales. For the first time ever, we have started on a journey that is under our control. It is a long journey—nobody would deny that—to improve our neglected transport infrastructure and create a digital economy that will help Wales to keep and attract more business. I hope that the improvements that have already been undertaken by this partnership Government will improve the quality of people's lives.

The Welsh Liberal Democrats are passionate about building a future. In this partnership Government, we have taken the first steps. However, as I will outline, I am impatient to see an increase in the pace of broadband roll-out to rural Wales and improvement in community transport.

There is a strategy—which I am sure the Minister will outline later—for broadband that is comprehensive and sets targets, including increasing the availability of terrestrial broadband by 30 per cent in the next five years, developing local and regional initiatives, and broadband-enabling an additional 1,200 public sector sites.

**Alun Cairns:** Will you give way?

**Mick Bates:** I will give way in a minute; let me finish discussing broadband first.

We have also enabled Logical (UK) Ltd to create a country-wide broadband network linking all 22 local education authorities with eight universities. We also have a digital all-Wales network that links hospitals. Therefore, efforts are being made in the

blaid wleidyddol â Llywodraeth y DU. Unwaith eto, chwalwyd yr honiad hwn. Mae'n amlwg, pan ddaw i'r pen, y gwnaiff y Llywodraeth Lafur hon ildio i alwadau Llywodraeth y DU, beth bynnag fo anghenion Cymru.

**Mick Bates:** Yr ydym i gyd am gael economi fodern, lwyddiannus i Gymru, gwlad a fu'n drefedigaeth i Loegr gyhyd. Mae ein ffyrdd—a'n cyfoeth—wedi gadael y wlad ar draul cysylltiadau mewnol. Am gyfnod rhy hir, ni fu dewis o ran yr hyn y gellid ei wneud yng Nghymru. Am y tro cyntaf erioed, yr ydym wedi cychwyn ar daith sydd o dan ein rheolaeth ni. Mae'n daith hir—ni fyddai neb yn gwadu hynny—i wella ein seilwaith trafndiaeth esgeulusedig ac i greu economi ddigidol a fydd yn helpu Cymru i gadw a denu rhagor o fusnes. Gobeithiaf y bydd y gwelliannau a wnaed eisoes gan y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth hon yn gwella ansawdd bywyd pobl.

Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn credu'n angerddol mewn adeiladu dyfodol. Yn y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth hon, cymerasom y camau cyntaf. Fodd bynnag, fel y nodaf, yr wyf yn dyheu am weld y band eang yn cael ei ledaenu'n gyflymach yn y Gymru wledig ac am welliant mewn trafndiaeth gymunedol.

Mae strategaeth ar gyfer y band eang—yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Gweinidog yn ei disgrifio'n ddiweddarach—sy'n gynhwysfawr ac yn gosod targedau, sy'n cynnwys cynyddu argaeledd y band eang daearol o 30 y cant yn y pum mlynedd nesaf, datblygu mentrau lleol a rhanbarthol, a galluogi 1,200 o safleoedd sector cyhoeddus ychwanegol i ddefnyddio'r band eang.

**Alun Cairns:** A wnewch ildio?

**Mick Bates:** Ildiaf mewn munud; gadewch imi orffen sôn am fand eang yn gyntaf.

Yr ydym hefyd wedi galluogi Logical (UK) Cyf i greu rhwydwaith band eang ar draws y wlad sy'n cysylltu pob un o'r 22 awdurdod addysg lleol ag wyth brifysgol. Yn ogystal â hynny, mae gennym rwydwaith digidol i Gymru gyfan sy'n cysylltu ysbytai. Felly,

public sector. However, I will mention last week's Economic Development Committee meeting, as many other Members have done, regarding the roll-out in rural areas. We have not faced this issue full on or addressed it properly. A few weeks ago, I visited a company across the border in Portishead, called Internet Access Point Ltd. It has rolled out a community wireless programme for broadband. That wireless provision, for example, is just as good as ADSL or cable connections. It also does not suffer from the time lag that affects satellite, and wireless broadband can run at speeds far in excess of that of ADSL. It also seems economic—for domestic customers it is about £30 a month, and connection for over 1,024 kHz is £40 a month. That is a reasonable, sustainable price. As part of this we must increase the market, as well as roll out the technology. I was amazed to hear people say, for example, that once they had broadband they downloaded double the amount from the internet in two months that they had downloaded in the past two years. Therefore, we increase use by rolling it out. However, it must also be sustainable. I hope that we will make progress to make it commercially sustainable to roll out broadband throughout Wales.

**Alun Cairns:** You mention the partnership Government's broadband strategy. Where in that strategy does north Wales fit in with north Yorkshire, and mid Wales fit in with Lincolnshire? I do not want to place all the responsibility on the current Minister for Economic Development—because economic development is the thrust behind this—so what part of the responsibility should the leader of the Liberal Democrats accept for this?

**Mick Bates:** None at all. You know as well as I do, Alun, that process points, of which I am sure you are aware, are under the auspices of the Department of Trade and Industry, and any submissions have been made to it. You know that the current Minister for Economic

gwneir ymdrechion yn y sector cyhoeddus. Fodd bynnag, gwnaf sôn am gyfarfod y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yr wythnos diwethaf, gan fod llawer o Aelodau eraill wedi gwneud hynny, ynghylch y lledaenu mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Nid ydym wedi wynebu'r mater hwn yn llawn na'i drafod yn briodol. Ychydig wythnosau'n ôl, ymwelais â chwmni dros y ffin yn Portishead, o'r enw Internet Access Point Cyf. Mae wedi rhoi rhaglen technoleg ddi-wifr gymunedol ar waith ar gyfer y band eang. Mae'r ddarpariaeth ddi-wifr honno'n llawn cystal, er enghraifft, ag ADSL neu gysylltiadau cebl. Nid yw ychwaith yn profi'r oedi sy'n effeithio ar dechnoleg lloeren, ac mae'r band eang di-wifr yn gallu rhedeg yn gynt o lawer nag ADSL. Mae'n ymddangos yn ddull economaidd hefyd—codir tua £30 y mis ar gwsmeriaid domestig, ac mae cysylltiad ar gyfer mwy na 1,024 cilohertz yn £40 y mis. Mae hwnnw'n bris rhesymol, cynaliadwy. Yn rhan o hyn, rhaid inni ehangu'r farchnad, yn ogystal â lledaenu'r dechnoleg. Synnais glywed pobl yn dweud, er enghraifft, eu bod wedi dadlwytho dwywaith cymaint o'r rhyngwyd mewn dau fis, ar ôl cael y band eang, ag yr oeddent wedi'i ddadlwytho yn y ddwy flynedd diwethaf cyn hynny. Felly, yr ydym yn cynyddu'r defnydd arno drwy ei ledaenu. Er hynny, rhaid iddo fod yn gynaliadwy hefyd. Gobeithiaf y gwnawn gynnydd er mwyn iddi fod yn fasnachol gynaliadwy lledaenu'r band eang ledled Cymru.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr ydych yn sôn am strategaeth band eang y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth. Ym mhle yn y strategaeth honno y mae gogledd Cymru'n ffitio gyda gogledd Swydd Efrog, a chanolbarth Cymru'n ffitio gyda Swydd Lincoln? Nid wyf am briodoli'r holl gyfrifoldeb am hynny i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd presennol—oherwydd datblygu economaidd sy'n ysgogi hyn—felly pa ran o'r cyfrifoldeb y dylai arweinydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ei derbyn am hyn?

**Mick Bates:** Dim o gwbl. Gwyddoch gystal â minnau, Alun, fod pwyntiau prosesu, y gwyddoch amdanynt yr wyf yn siŵr, o dan adain yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant, ac y gwnaed unrhyw geisiadau iddi hi. Gwyddoch fod y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu



Development has worked hard to ensure a fair deal for Wales. I am hopeful, and am certain in many ways, that there will be some provision that will enable us to take part in that process.

On transport, the Assembly Government has increased funding for bus services and community transport. A lobby group from Newtown Dial-a-Ride is here today, Minister. It is trying to expand the use of community transport, particularly for those who can claim free bus passes—pensioners and disabled people. There is often no public transport in rural areas, therefore those free bus passes remain in people's purses and wallets. When will those people be able to use their free bus passes on community transport so that they too can meet their friends and do their shopping easily?

Finally, there is a long way to go to ensure that the rural bus grant and our community transport grant are used effectively by local authorities. All too often I see empty buses running around rural areas. Big buses are the most expensive way of transporting fresh air around rural Wales. We need a demand-responsive community transport system.

**Eleanor Burnham** *rose—*

**Mick Bates:** I give way to Eleanor Burnham.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** You have 20 seconds left, Mick.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Do you still share my concern, Mick, that the SRA, under the auspices of the Westminster Government, needs to do much more to help us in Wales? I know that Sue Essex, as Minister for Environment, is doing her best. However, do you not believe that we need more teeth?

**Mick Bates:** Absolutely, and I hope that those teeth will bite.

4.50 p.m.

Economaidd presennol wedi gweithio'n galed i sicrhau bargaen deg i Gymru. Yr wyf yn gobeithio, ac yn sicr ar lawer ystyr, y bydd rhyw ddarpariaeth a fydd yn ein galluogi i gymryd rhan yn y broses honno.

Ynghylch trafndiaeth, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi rhoi mwy o gyllid ar gyfer gwasanaethau bysiau a thrafnidiaeth gymunedol. Mae grŵp lobïo o Newtown Dial-a-Ride yma heddiw, Weinidog. Mae'n ceisio ehangu'r defnydd o drafnidiaeth gymunedol, yn enwedig gan y rhai sy'n gallu hawlio tocynnau bws am ddim—pensiynwyr a phobl anabl. Yn aml, ni cheir trafndiaeth gyhoeddus mewn ardaloedd gwledig, felly mae'r tocynnau bws am ddim hynny yn aros ym mhysiau a waledi pobl. Pa bryd y bydd y bobl hynny'n gallu defnyddio eu tocynnau bws am ddim ar drafnidiaeth gymunedol fel y gallant hwythau gwrdd â'u ffrindiau a siopa'n ddiraffferth?

Yn olaf, mae llawer i'w wneud eto i sicrhau bod y grant bysiau gwledig a'n grant trafndiaeth gymunedol yn cael eu defnyddio'n effeithiol gan awdurdodau lleol. Yn rhy aml o lawer gwelaf fysiau gwag yn rhedeg o gwmpas ardaloedd gwledig. Bysiau mawr yw'r dull drutaf o gludo awyr iach o gwmpas y Gymru wledig. Mae arnom angen system drafnidiaeth gymunedol sy'n ymateb i'r galw.

**Eleanor Burnham** *a gododd—*

**Mick Bates:** Ildiaf i Eleanor Burnham.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae gennych 20 eiliad ar ôl, Mick.

**Eleanor Burnham:** A ydych yn dal i bryderu, fel minnau, Mick, fod angen i'r Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol, sydd o dan nawdd Llywodraeth San Steffan, wneud mwy o lawer i'n helpu ni yng Nghymru? Gwn fod Sue Essex, fel y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, yn gwneud ei gorau. Fodd bynnag, oni chredwch fod arnom angen rhagor o ddannedd?

**Mick Bates:** Yn hollol, a gobeithiaf y bydd y dannedd hynny'n brathu.

**Brian Hancock:** When I was elected to the National Assembly nearly four years ago, I wanted to radically improve communications—by road, rail, and air—and information. I had three projects in mind, which I still believe are important. These are: north-south road and rail links; links by road, and particularly by rail, to Cardiff international airport so that it can become truly international; and the reintroduction of a passenger railway system in the Ebbw valley throughout Islwyn—people would expect me to mention that again.

The passenger rail system should be fully integrated, linking with bus stops and stations that are not more than half a mile away, and should have through-ticketing and CCTV so that car parks and bike racks are safe. There should be a fast service to Cardiff, and a more comprehensive one to Newport. If you ask people in the Valleys, particularly the Ebbw valley, if they are going to town at the weekend, they always say that they are going to Newport, not to Cardiff. Therefore, that link must be worked out. Every village and town should have a halt or a station so that everybody can use these links. This scheme has been talked about for longer than Corus. John Griffiths is not in the Chamber at present. The Corus closure has exacerbated the problems in the area, but this scheme was being developed and talked about many years before that, and I was involved in it.

Let us consider the present situation. I hear from other Members of the constant problems on the north-south rail links—long journeys, cold, dirty carriages; basically, an unfriendly journey. There is no strategic rail authority for Wales, and we have just one member on the UK Strategic Rail Authority. It is no wonder that Wales's priorities do not figure as prominently as those of the rest of the UK on the SRA. The Ebbw valley line is not fully integrated, it has few stations, it is not dual lined, there are not enough platforms, and signalling is so sensitive that if someone dared to touch it, it might have a major

**Brian Hancock:** Pan etholwyd fi i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ymron i bedair blynedd yn ôl, yr oeddwn am wella cyfathrebu—ar ffyrdd, ar reilffyrdd, ac yn yr awyr—a gwybodaeth, mewn modd sylfaenol. Yr oedd gennyf dri phrosiect mewn golwg, y credaf eu bod yn bwysig o hyd. Y rhain yw: cysylltiadau ffyrdd a rheilffyrdd o'r de i'r gogledd; cysylltiadau ar ffyrdd, ac yn enwedig ar reilffyrdd, â maes awyr rhyngwladol Caerdydd fel y gall fod yn wirioneddol ryngwladol; ac ailgyflwyno system rheilffordd deithwyr yng nglyn Ebwy ledled Islwyn—byddai pobl yn disgwyl imi sôn am hynny eto.

Dylai'r system rheilffordd deithwyr fod yn gwbl integredig, gan gysylltu ag arosfannau a gorsafydd bysiau nad ydynt yn fwy na hanner milltir i ffwrdd, a dylai fod â thocynnau drwodd a theledu cylch caeëdig fel bod meysydd parcio a rheseli beiciau'n ddiogel. Dylid cael gwasanaeth cyflym i Gaerdydd, ac un mwy cynhwysfawr i Gasnewydd. Os holwch bobl yn y Cymoedd, yn enwedig yng nglyn Ebwy, a fyddant yn mynd i'r dref ar y penwythnos, dywedant bob tro mai i Gasnewydd y byddant yn mynd, nid i Gaerdydd. Felly, rhaid sicrhau'r cysylltiad hwnnw. Dylai pob tref a phentref fod â'i arhosfa neu'i orsaf fel y gall pawb ddefnyddio'r cysylltiadau hynny. Mae'r cynllun hwn wedi'i drafod yn hwy na Corus. Nid yw John Griffiths yn y Siambr ar hyn o bryd. Mae'r problemau yn yr ardal wedi gwaethygu am fod gwaith Corus wedi'i gau, ond yr oedd y cynllun hwn yn cael ei ddatblygu a'i drafod flynyddoedd lawer cyn hynny, ac yr oeddwn i'n gysylltiedig ag ef.

Gadewch inni ystyried y sefyllfa bresennol. Clywaf gan Aelodau eraill am y problemau cyson ynghylch y cysylltiadau rheilffyrdd o'r de i'r gogledd—teithiau hir, cerbydau oer a budr; taith annymunol, yn y bôn. Nid oes awdurdod rheilffyrdd strategol ar gyfer Cymru, ac nid oes gennym ond un aelod ar Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol y DU. Nid oes rhyfedd nad oes lle mor amlwg i flaenoriaethau Cymru ag i rai gweddill y DU ar yr awdurdod. Nid yw rheilffordd glyn Ebwy wedi'i hintegreiddio'n llwyr, ychydig o orsafoedd sydd arni, nid yw'n rheilffordd ddeuol, nid oes digon o blatfformau, ac mae'r

impact on the south Wales line. On top of this we must wait until 2009. At present, the only location readily available for a park and ride station is the former Navigation Colliery at Crumlin. I will return to that.

The need for railway transport is obvious. Our roads are getting more congested; more cars equal more roads and more pollution. We need an efficient, integrated transport system to access work, social and cultural events, and leisure activities. That can also lead to tourism. At present, the emphasis must be on work. If my colleague, Peter Law, were here talking about Blaenau Gwent, he would mention access to work in Cardiff and Newport. I would say Newport and Cardiff. The reality is that if we could develop and generate jobs in our Valleys, we would have a flow of traffic going both ways.

Therefore, work and economic value must be the object in the Valleys. If we had to agree on only one Objective 1 project, Minister, it would be to ensure broadband communication throughout Wales. Everybody would applaud that. It would aid education, training, and skills development, and would improve business connections, commerce and industries. It would afford opportunities to join the global community and access a wealth of information.

I have previously promoted the former Navigation Colliery site at Crumlin. It is a useful, prominent site on the main road from Newport to Ebbw Vale. It is about halfway between Newport and Ebbw Vale, 100m of rail track goes through it, and it links between the development at Oakdale business park and Pen-y-Fan industrial estate, and in the other direction to Pontypool. It is a crossroads for economic development. In the Economic Development Committee last week it was announced that the exchanges in Bargoed, Blackwood, Hengoed and Newbridge will be ADSL-enabled. That is great news. Newbridge is the only place in the Ebbw valley that has ADSL, from Newport to Ebbw Vale. We need to develop

signalau mor sensitif fel y gallent gael effaith fawr ar reilffordd de Cymru pe byddai rhywun yn meiddio cyffwrdd â hwy. Ar ben hynny, rhaid inni aros hyd 2009. Ar hyn o bryd, yr unig leoliad sydd ar gael yn rhwydd i fod yn orsaf parcio a theithio yw cyn-lofa'r Navigation yng Nghrymlyn. Deuaf yn ôl at hynny.

Mae'r angen am drafnidiaeth reilffyrdd yn amlwg. Ceir mwy o dagfeydd ar ein ffyrdd; mae rhagor o geir yn golygu rhagor o ffyrdd a rhagor o ddifwyniant. Mae arnom angen system drafnidiaeth effeithlon ac integredig i gyrraedd gwaith, digwyddiadau cymdeithasol a diwylliannol, a gweithgareddau hamdden. Gall hynny arwain at dwristiaeth hefyd. Ar hyn o bryd, rhaid rhoi'r pwyslais ar waith. Pe byddai fy nghyd-Aelod, Peter Law, yma'n sôn am Flaenau Gwent, byddai'n sôn am y gallu i gyrraedd gwaith yng Nghaerdydd a Chasnewydd. Casnewydd a Chaerdydd a ddywedwn i. Y gwir amdani yw os gallem ddatblygu a chreu swyddi yn ein Cymoedd, y caem lif traffig y ddwy ffordd.

Gan hynny, gwaith a gwerth economaidd yw'r nod priodol i'r Cymoedd. Pe byddem yn gorfod cytuno ar ddim ond un prosiect Amcan 1, Weinidog, sicrhau cyfathrebu ar y band eang ledled Cymru fyddai hwnnw. Byddai pawb yn cymeradwyo hynny. Byddai'n hwb i addysg, hyfforddi, a datblygu sgiliau, a byddai'n gwella cysylltiadau busnes, masnach a diwydiannau. Cynigiad gyfleoedd i ymuno â'r gymuned fyd-eang a chyrraedd toreth o wybodaeth.

Yr wyf wedi sôn o'r blaen am rinweddau safle cyn-lofa'r Navigation yng Nghrymlyn. Mae'n safle defnyddiol ac amlwg ar y brif ffordd o Gasnewydd i Lynebwy. Mae tua hanner ffordd rhwng Casnewydd a Glynebwy, mae 100 metr o drac rheilffordd yn rhedeg drwyddo, ac mae'n cysylltu'r datblygiad ym mharc busnes Oakdale ac ystâd ddiwydiannol Pen-y-fan, ac yn cysylltu â Phont-y-pŵl i'r cyfeiriad arall. Mae'n groesffordd ar gyfer datblygu economaidd. Yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yr wythnos diwethaf, cyhoeddwyd y bydd y cyfnewidfeydd ym Margoed, y Coed-duon, Hengoed a Threcelyn yn gallu trafod ASDL. Mae hynny'n newyddion gwych. Trecelyn yw'r unig le yng nglyn Ebwy sydd ag ASDL,

that even further. There are opportunities for Navigation Colliery—a server farm could be set up there. A company called Pedagog is interested in that and wants to support the all-Wales infrastructure trials. It has letters of support from companies such as Cisco, Sun Microsystems, IBM, Oracle and Orange. The opportunities are wide-ranging.

We must consider the major opportunity that we have in the Valleys, where there have been major job losses. We need to speculate in communication technologies to give meaningful work to the people of Wales.

**David Ian Jones:** I commend Phil Williams for initiating this important debate. I am also a member of the Economic Development Committee, and it has been a privilege to work alongside him, not only because of his messianic zeal for broadband, but also because of the vast reservoir of knowledge that he possesses on the subject. That is just the sort of knowledge that one would expect from a future member of the House of Lords. I hope that he will take up that appointment when it is surely offered to him.

I will focus on one important aspect of this debate, which has been touched on by previous speakers. It is possibly the most important aspect of all: the forthcoming auction of the 3.4 GHz band, which has been initiated by the Radio Communications Authority. I strongly believe that the future development of Wales will depend significantly on broadband technology. Because of our topography, we need an efficient, wireless broadband. Last week in the Economic Development Committee, we were advised that the 3.4 GHz frequency is fundamental if broadband in Wales is to be rolled-out effectively. I have seen the map proposed by the Radio Communications Authority, and it looks as if a lunatic has prepared it with a felt tip pen. It is illogical. It contains one plum franchise, the Cardiff-Newport franchise, which is coupled with the Bristol franchise. The rest is a communications desert. North Wales is linked with north Yorkshire: it is illogical. It should have been rejected out of hand.

rhwng Casnewydd a Glynwby. Rhaid inni ddatblygu hynny ymhellach byth. Mae cyfleoedd i lofa'r Navigation—gellid sefydlu fferm wasanaethu yno. Mae cwmni o'r enw Pedagog yn ymddiddori yn hynny ac yn dymuno cefnogi'r profion seilwaith i Gymru gyfan. Mae wedi cael llythyrau o gefnogaeth gan gwmnïau fel Cisco, Sun Microsystems, IBM, Oracle ac Orange. Mae'r cyfleoedd yn amrywiol iawn.

Rhaid inni ystyried y cyfle mawr sydd gennym yn y Cymoedd, lle y bu colledion swyddi mawr. Rhaid inni fentro yn y technolegau cyfathrebu er mwyn rhoi gwaith ystyrlon i bobl Cymru.

**David Ian Jones:** Canmolaf Phil Williams am gychwyn y ddadl bwysig hon. Yr wyf finnau'n aelod o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, a bu'n ffrainthio ochr yn ochr ag ef, nid yn unig oherwydd ei sêl feseianaidd dros y band eang, ond oherwydd y stôr enfawr o wybodaeth sydd ganddo ar y pwnc. Dyna'r union fath o wybodaeth y byddai rhywun yn ei ddisgwyl mewn un a ddeuai'n aelod o Dŷ'r Arglwyddi. Gobeithiaf y bydd yn derbyn y swydd honno pan y'i cynigir iddo, fel y gwneir yn sicr.

Canolbwyntiaf ar un agwedd bwysig ar y ddadl hon, y mae siaradwyr blaenorol wedi cyfeirio ati. Hon yw'r agwedd bwysicaf oll, o bosibl: yr arwerthiant sydd ar ddod o'r band 3.4 gigahertz, a gyflwynwyd gan yr Awdurdod Cysylltiadau Radio. Credaf yn gryf y bydd datblygiad Cymru yn y dyfodol yn dibynnu'n helaeth ar dechnoleg band eang. Oherwydd ein topograffi, mae arnom angen band eang di-wifr, effeithlon. Yr wythnos diwethaf yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, fe'n hysbyswyd bod yr amledd 3.4 gigahertz yn hollbwysig os yw'r band eang i'w ledaenu'n effeithiol yng Nghymru. Gwelais y map a gynigiwyd gan yr Awdurdod Cysylltiadau Radio, ac mae'n ymddangos fel pe bai wedi'i lunio gan wallgofddyn â phin ffelt. Mae'n afresymegol. Mae'n cynnwys un fasnachfaint benignamp, y fasnachfaint i Gaerdydd a Chasnewydd, sydd wedi'i chyplysu â masnachfaint Bryste. Mae'r gweddill yn anialwch o ran cyfathrebu. Cysylltir gogledd Cymru â gogledd Swydd Efrog: mae'n afresymegol. Dylai fod wedi'i wrthod yn y fan a'r lle.

The Economic Development Committee objected most strongly to the plan: there was cross-party outrage when the plan was announced last week. I understand that the Minister for Economic Development has also objected to it. Minister, your objection was lame. You said that you objected to this plan, but, notwithstanding, the maps have been drawn up. You said:

‘Policy is everything, and if central Government steams ahead, which it seems determined to do, it will be to the detriment of Wales.’

I repeat, it will be to the detriment of Wales. At that stage—

**Helen Mary Jones:** Do you agree that the Minister’s complete powerlessness in this vital matter, shows that it is useless for the people of Wales to have a Labour Government in Cardiff and in Westminster?

**David Ian Jones:** We need a bulldog that will chew the heels off the Department of Trade and Industry. In fact, we have an Andrex puppy.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** You said that we need a bulldog. Do you agree that we have a Chihuahua instead, who makes a lot of noise, but who is ineffective?

**David Ian Jones:** I will stick with the Andrex puppy analogy.

Broadband is fundamental to the future of economic development in Wales. If the Assembly gets one message across to the outside world today, it must be that that proposed auction must be scrapped, and that we must insist on an all-Wales licence for the 3.4 GHz frequency.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I want to call the Minister at about 5.01 p.m.

**Delyth Evans:** Yr oeddwn innau hefyd yn bresennol yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yr wythnos diwethaf, ac nid yw dehongliad aelodau’r pleidiau eraill

Gwrthwynebodd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd y cynllun yn y modd cryfaf: bu dicter ymysg yr holl bleidiau pan gyhoeddwyd y cynllun yr wythnos diwethaf. Deallaf fod y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd wedi’i wrthwynebu hefyd. Weinidog, yr oedd eich gwrthwynebiad yn dila. Dywedasoeh eich bod yn gwrthwynebu’r cynllun hwn, ond, er hynny, mae’r mapiau wedi’u llunio. Eich geiriau oedd:

Polisi yw popeth, ac os aiff Llywodraeth ganolog yn ei blaen, fel y mae’n ymddangos ei bod yn benderfynol o wneud, bydd hynny er anfantais i Gymru.

Dywedaf eto, bydd er anfantais i Gymry. Ar y pryd—

**Helen Mary Jones:** A ydych yn cytuno bod diymadferthedd llwyr y Gweinidog yn y mater hollbwysig hwn, yn dangos mai diwerth i bobl Cymru yw cael Llywodraeth Lafur yng Nghaerdydd ac yn San Steffan?

**David Ian Jones:** Mae arnom angen ci tarw a fydd yn cnoi sodlau’r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant. Mewn gwirionedd, mae gennym gi Andrex.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Dywedasoeh fod arnom angen ci tarw. A ydych yn cytuno mai shiwawa sydd gennym, yn hytrach, sy’n gwneud llawer o sŵn, ond sy’n aneffeithiol?

**David Ian Jones:** Daliaf at y gymhariaeth â chi Andrex.

Mae’r band eang yn hollbwysig i ddatblygu economaidd yn y dyfodol yng Nghymru. Os yw’r Cynulliad i gyfleu un neges i’r byd y tu allan heddiw, honno yw bod rhaid rhoi’r gorau i’r arwerthiant arfaethedig hwnnw, a bod rhaid inni fynnu cael trwydded i Gymru gyfan ar gyfer yr amledd 3.4 gigahertz.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Dymunaf alw ar y Gweinidog tua 5.01 p.m.

**Delyth Evans:** I was also present in the Economic Development Committee meeting last week and Members of other parties’ depiction of it does not ring true. People must

o'r cyfarfod hwnnw yn taro deuddeg. Mae'n rhaid i bobl sylweddoli bod y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd, grwpiau eraill yn y Cynulliad, a'r sector preifat yn cydweithio ar ddatblygu ein hanghenion technolegol yng Nghymru, ar sail arweiniad clir gan y Cynulliad yn y maes hwn. Nid oes gennyf amheuaeth fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn deall yn iawn bwysigrwydd band eang i'n dyfodol fel cenedl. Yn y drafodaeth hon hyd yma, ni gyfeiriodd neb at y cynnydd mawr a wnaed yn y sector cyhoeddus. Yr ydym ar y blaen i'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn Lloegr o ran darparu band eang yn ein hysgolion. Erbyn diwedd y mis nesaf, bydd yn agos at hanner ysgolion Cymru â mynediad at fand eang. Nid yw'r sefyllfa yn Lloegr yn agos at gyrraedd yr hyn a gyflawnwyd yng Nghymru o ran darparu'r adnodd pwysig hwn i'n hysgolion. Mae'n rhan ganolog o'n strategaeth.

5.00 p.m.

**Geraint Davies:** Dywedasoeh bod y Llywodraeth yn deall anghenion Cymru o ran band eang ond beth yw eich barn am y sefyllfa yn y Cymoedd, lle mae trothwy uchel i'w gyrraedd mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig, tra bo rhai ardaloedd heb drothwy o gwbl? A ydyw hynny'n dderbyniol i chi?

**Delyth Evans:** Cymeraf eich bod yn cyfeirio at drothwy BT. Dyna un o broblemau Cymru: mae'r ddarpariaeth yn ddibynnol i raddau helaeth ar allu neu barodrwydd y sector preifat i ddarparu mynediad i ADSL. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn pwyso'n galed ar BT i gydweithio yn y maes hwn. Mae'n bwysig inni gydnabod y gwaith da y mae BT wedi'i wneud ond hoffwn ei weld yn mynd ymhellach o ran ei gyfrifoldeb yn y maes hwn.

Gadewch inni ystyried y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn sicrhau y darperir band eang ar draws y gwasanaeth iechyd. Golyga hyn gynnydd anferth yn ein gallu i wella iechyd ac i ddarparu gwasanaethau effeithiol i gleifion ledled Cymru.

**Brian Hancock** *a gododd—*

**Delyth Evans:** Mae'n ddrwg gen i Brian,

realise that the Minister for Economic Development, other groups in the Assembly, and the private sector, are working together to develop the technological requirements of Wales on the basis of clear leadership by the Assembly in this area. I do not doubt that the Assembly Government understands the importance of broadband to our future as a nation. In this discussion so far, no-one has referred to the progress made in the public sector. We are way ahead of England in terms of providing broadband in our schools. By the end of next month, nearly half the schools of Wales will be able to access broadband. The situation in England is nowhere near to reaching what we are achieving in Wales in terms of providing this important resource to our schools. It is a central part of our strategy.

**Geraint Davies:** You said that the Government understands the needs of Wales in terms of broadband, but what do you think about the situation in the Valleys, where disadvantaged areas must reach a high threshold, while some areas do not have a threshold at all? Is that acceptable to you?

**Delyth Evans:** I take it that you are referring to the BT threshold. That is one of the problems in Wales: the provision is dependent to a large extent upon the ability or the willingness of the private sector to provide access to ADSL. The Assembly Government is exerting pressure on BT to work with us in this regard. It is important that we acknowledge the good work that BT has done, but I would like to see it go further in terms of its responsibilities in this sector.

Let us consider the health service in Wales. The Assembly Government is ensuring that broadband will be provided across the health service, which will mean a significant increase in our ability to improve health and to provide effective services for patients throughout Wales.

**Brian Hancock** *rose—*

**Delyth Evans:** I am sorry Brian, but I do not

ond nid oes gennyf ddigon o amser.

Y mae'r gwaith a wnawn i gynyddu'r galw ac i gynyddu ymwybyddiaeth y sector preifat o bwysigrwydd band eang o ran gallu busnesau i gystadlu yn hanfodol. Daw'r arweiniad ar gyfer y gwaith hwn o'r Cynulliad. Mae gwaith arloesol yn mynd rhagddo i helpu busnesau i sicrhau mynediad i fand eang drwy loeren, ac mae'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd yn arwain ar hynny. Mae nifer o brosiectau di-wifr ar y gweill ledled Cymru sydd eto yn tystio i'n deallwriaeth a'n cydnabyddiaeth o'r posibilïadau y mae hyn yn ei gynnig i gymunedau ledled Cymru. Unwaith eto daw'r arweiniad gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Felly yn lle ceryddu, gadewch inni longyfarch y Llywodraeth am ei gwaith da ac am y cynnydd a wneir. Mae'r sylfeini yn eu lle. Mae mwy i'w wneud ac mae sialensau mawr o'n blaenau, ond deallwn y sialensau hynny a gweithiwn tuag at gyrraedd nod gyffredin.

**Andrew Davies:** I agree that good electronic and transport links play a vital role in the economy and are a prerequisite for economic development. Both are fundamental to meeting our aims of creating a strong, modern, knowledge-based economy, a cleaner environment and thriving rural and urban communities. That is why they were set out as clear priorities in 'A Winning Wales' and why we now have Cymru Ar-lein.

Cymru Ar-lein is held up by many international bodies—such as the Sustainable Development Commission—as an exemplar of regional government action in the development of information and communications technology. We also have Broadband Wales, which I launched last July and which is the largest comprehensive UK broadband initiative to address the market failure in Wales. Professor Mike Tedd, the chair of the Welsh Advisory Committee on Telecommunications, warmly welcomed it. Let Members be in no doubt: Broadband Wales was launched because of market failure.

I can understand that BT would wish to

have enough time.

The work that we are doing to increase demand and to raise the private sector's awareness of the importance of broadband in terms of businesses' ability to compete is essential. The Assembly is leading the way in this area. Innovative work is in hand to help businesses to access broadband through satellite, and the Minister for Economic Development is leading on that. Several wireless projects are in the pipeline across Wales, which again testifies to our understanding and recognition of the possibilities this offers communities across Wales. Once again the lead on that comes from the Assembly Government. Therefore instead of castigating, let us congratulate the Government on its good work and on the progress that is being made. The foundations are in place. There is more to be done and great challenges ahead of us, but we understand those challenges and we are working to achieve a common goal.

**Andrew Davies:** Cytunaf fod cysylltiadau electronig a thrafnidiaeth yn chwarae rôl hollbwysig yn yr economi a'u bod yn angenrheidiol ar gyfer datblygu economaidd. Mae'r ddau'n hanfodol i gyrraedd ein nodau o greu economi gadarn a modern sy'n seiliedig ar wybodaeth, amgylchedd glanach a chymunedau gwledig a threfol ffyniannus. Dyna pam y'u nodwyd yn flaenoriaethau pendant yn 'Cymru'n Ennill' a dyna'r rheswm y mae Cymru Ar-lein gennym yn awr.

Cyfeirir at Cymru Ar-lein gan lawer o gyrff rhyngwladol—fel y Comisiwn Datblygu Cynaliadwy—fel patrwm o weithredu gan lywodraeth ranbarthol mewn datblygu technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu. Mae Band Eang Cymru gennym hefyd, a lansiais fis Gorffennaf diwethaf, sef y fenter band eang gynhwysfawr fwyaf yn y DU, i ymdrin â methiant y farchnad yng Nghymru. Rhoddwyd croeso cynnes iddi gan yr Athro Mike Tedd, cadeirydd Pwyllgor Ymgynghorol Cymru ar Delathrebu. Caiff Aelodau fod yn gwbl sicr o hyn: lanswyd Band Eang Cymru oherwydd methiant y farchnad.

Gallaf ddeall y byddai BT yn dymuno osgoi

deflect criticism from its failure to roll-out broadband: a failure accepted at the highest corporate level of the company in London. BT said that there were absolute trigger levels for the roll-out of ADSL. However, under both market and political pressure, trigger levels have been reduced. It also said that broadband could not be provided at a lower price. However, after Oftel intervened, BT reduced its wholesale prices. Broadband Wales has been accepted by senior BT executives, and I have heard it said that, in terms of broadband, Wales and the G7 countries are on one side of the equation while England and Scotland are on the other. I will discuss broadband in greater detail later.

We need a transport framework that delivers road and rail schemes that directly address our economic needs in Wales. My colleague, Sue Essex, is achieving that through the trunk road and transport grant programmes.

Last week, Sue Essex announced a transport grant allocation of £76 million for the next financial year. The programme includes 18 road and rail infrastructure schemes, for example, the Neath Port Talbot peripheral distributor road and the Bargoed community regeneration scheme, which have a direct impact on economic development.

We were disappointed by the Strategic Rail Authority's recent announcement, but today Sue Essex secured an agreement with it so that the necessary revenue support will be available to provide additional rail services to Aberdare, as well as to reopen the Vale of Glamorgan line to rail passengers. That shows our commitment to sustaining our transport infrastructure.

It is not just the physical road and rail infrastructure that we need to consider. We launched the intelligent transport systems programme last year and the bilingual Traffic Wales information service last month. That shows how we are using ICT to deliver improved travel information and to manage road networks more effectively.

beirniadaeth am ei fethiant i ledaenu'r band eang: methiant a dderbynnir ar y lefel gorfforaethol uchaf yn y cwmni yn Llundain. Dywedodd BT y byddai lefelau cychwyn absoliwt ar gyfer lledaenu ASDL. Fodd bynnag, o dan bwysau'r farchnad a phwysau gwleidyddol, gostyngwyd y lefelau cychwyn. Dywedodd hefyd na ellid darparu'r band eang yn rhatach. Fodd bynnag, wedi i Oftel ymyrryd, gwnaeth BT ostwng ei brisiau cyfanwerthu. Mae Band Eang Cymru wedi'i dderbyn gan uwch swyddogion gweithredol BT, a chlywais ddweud, yng nghyd-destun y band eang, fod Cymru a gwledydd G7 ar un ochr i'r hafaliad tra bo Lloegr a'r Alban ar y llall. Gwnaf drafod y band eang yn fanylach yn ddiweddarach.

Mae arnom angen fframwaith trafndiaeth a gynnig gynlluniau ffyrdd a rheilffyrdd sy'n ymdrin yn uniongyrchol â'n hanghenion economaidd yng Nghymru. Mae fy nghyd-Weinidog, Sue Essex, yn cyflawni hynny drwy'r rhaglenni cefnffyrdd a grant trafndiaeth.

Yr wythnos diwethaf, cyhoeddodd Sue Essex ddyrannu grant trafndiaeth o £76 miliwn ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf. Mae'r rhaglen yn cynnwys 18 cynllun seilwaith ffyrdd a rheilffyrdd, er enghraifft, ffordd ddsbarthu amgylchol Castell-nedd Port Talbot a chynllun adfywio cymunedol Bargoed, a gaiff effaith uniongyrchol ar ddatblygu economaidd.

Cawsom ein siomi yn y cyhoeddiad diweddar gan yr Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol, ond heddiw mae Sue Essex wedi sicrhau cytundeb ag ef fel y bydd y cymorth refeniw angenrheidiol ar gael i ddarparu gwasanaethau rheilffyrdd ychwanegol i Aberdâr, a hefyd i ailagor rheilffordd Bro Morgannwg ar gyfer teithwyr rheilffyrdd. Mae hynny'n dangos ein hymrwymiad i gynnal ein seilwaith trafndiaeth.

Nid y seilwaith ffyrdd a rheilffyrdd ffisegol yn unig y dylem ei ystyried. Gwnaethom lansio'r rhaglen systemau trafndiaeth deallus y llynedd a gwasanaeth gwybodaeth dwyieithog Traffig Cymru y mis diwethaf. Dengys hynny'r modd yr ydym yn defnyddio TGCh i ddarparu gwell gwybodaeth am deithio ac i reoli rhwydweithiau ffyrdd yn



fwy effeithiol.

Our cross-cutting approach to ICT through Cymru Ar-lein is making a difference to people's lives in Wales. Cymru Ar-lein enhances the best work that is taking place in all sectors. It seeks to address content and capability as well as connectivity. I regret that the opposition have not yet referred to content and capability; instead they have concentrated on connectivity. I used to believe that Phil Williams was merely naive, but some of his points today were misleading. Has Phil read the Analysys report on which Broadband Wales and Cymru Ar-lein have been based? Has Phil read the Broadband Wales or Cymru Ar-lein strategy documents? They are strategic documents. The paper I gave to the Committee last week—as I stated then—was a report on the actions that have been taken so far. It was not a report on the Broadband Wales programme.

**Phil Williams:** I had already read on the internet the strategy to which you refer. However, I assumed that there was a full strategic document. In my terms, that is, in the setting of numerical targets and a geographical strategy, that document does not amount to a strategy.

**Andrew Davies:** You still have not answered my question about the Analysys report, but I will put that aside. The Broadband Wales programme is bringing £115 million to supply and demand side initiatives to overcome market failure in many parts of Wales. It is interesting that the Conservatives do not have anything to say about market failure. I can understand that they do not wish to address that, because they privatised what was once a public monopoly.

**Alun Cairns:** Will you give way?

**Andrew Davies:** No. Our strategy is based on public sector intervention—[*Interruption.*]

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Intemperate Members who do not get their

Mae ein hymagwedd drawsbynciol at TGCh drwy Cymru Ar-lein yn gwneud gwahaniaeth i fywydau pobl yng Nghymru. Mae Cymru Ar-lein yn hyrwyddo'r gwaith gorau sy'n digwydd yn yr holl sectorau. Mae'n ceisio ymdrin â chynnwys a gallu yn ogystal â chysylltedd. Mae'n ofid imi nad yw'r wrthblaid wedi cyfeirio eto at gynnwys a gallu; yn hytrach, maent wedi canolbwyntio ar gysylltedd. Yr oeddwn yn arfer credu mai naif yn unig yr oedd Phil Williams, ond yr oedd rhai o'r pwyntiau a gododd heddiw'n gamarweiniol. A yw Phil wedi darllen yr adroddiad gan Analysys y mae Band Eang Cymru a Cymru Ar-lein wedi'u seilio arno? A yw Phil wedi darllen dogfennau strategaeth Band Eang Cymru neu Cymru Ar-lein? Maent yn ddogfennau strategol. Yr oedd yr adroddiad a roddais i'r Pwyllgor yr wythnos diwethaf—fel y dywedais bryd hynny—yn adroddiad ar y camau a gymerwyd hyd yn hyn. Nid oedd yn adroddiad ar raglen Band Eang Cymru.

**Phil Williams:** Yr oeddwn eisoes wedi darllen y strategaeth y cyfeiriwch ati ar y rhyngwyd. Fodd bynnag, cymerais fod dogfen strategol lawn yn bod. Yn ôl fy niffiniad i, sef o ran gosod targedau rhifiadol a strategaeth ddaearyddol, nid yw'r ddogfen honno'n strategaeth.

**Andrew Davies:** Yr ydych yn dal i fod heb ateb fy nghwestiwn am adroddiad Analysys, ond rhoddaf hynny o'r neilltu. Mae rhaglen Band Eang Cymru yn darparu £115 miliwn i fentrau ar gyfer y galw a'r cyflenwad er mwyn gwneud iawn am fethiant y farchnad mewn llawer rhan o Gymru. Mae'n ddiddorol nad oes gan y Ceidwadwyr ddim i'w ddweud am fethiant y farchnad. Gallaf ddeall nad ydynt yn dymuno ymdrin â hynny, oherwydd gwnaethant breifateiddio'r hyn a oedd unwaith yn fonopoli cyhoeddus.

**Alun Cairns:** A wnewch ildio?

**Andrew Davies:** Na wna. Mae ein strategaeth yn seiliedig ar ymyrraeth gan y sector cyhoeddus—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw Aelodau aflywodraethus nad ydynt yn cael eu ffordd

way cannot stand up and disrupt the process of Plenary.

**Andrew Davies:** The Broadband Wales strategy is using public sector intervention and public sector expenditure on broadband to better advantage, building on the major successes of the NHS network, DAWN2, and the lifelong learning network. As Delyth Evans has pointed out, nearly 50 per cent of schools in Wales will be on the internet by the end of this financial year. The Prime Minister has set the target of all schools in England being on the internet by the end of 2006. Wales is ahead of the game. DAWN2, the NHS network, has put nearly 70 per cent of all GPs online. That is using broadband to deliver better public services in Wales.

**David Ian Jones:** Will you give way?

**Andrew Davies:** No. Delivering financial intervention through the Broadband Wales programme ranges from small, tactical subsidy schemes, such as that for satellite broadband, to large-scale strategic intervention through a reverse subsidy option to enhance large parts of the Welsh infrastructure. Broadband Wales also addresses high-end broadband users and international connectivity, as well as the entry-level ADSL-type services that some suppliers would have us believe are all that matters.

**Brian Hancock:** Will you give way?

**Andrew Davies:** I do not have time, sorry. Broadband Wales will support between 50 and 100 local projects and initiatives over the length of the programme, such as the e-fro programme in Dyffryn Ogwen and Arwain in Cardiff, to show us what different technologies can do. Ours is a technology-neutral approach. I am glad to see that Phil and Plaid Cymru have changed their tune. Only last year they were saying that broadband could only be delivered by fibre optics. Now they say that wireless is key. I accept that. Ours was always going to be a technology-neutral approach.

yn cael sefyll a tharfu ar broses y Cyfarfod Llawn.

**Andrew Davies:** Mae strategaeth Band Eang Cymru yn defnyddio ymyrraeth gan y sector cyhoeddus a gwariant gan y sector cyhoeddus ar y band eang yn fwy effeithiol, gan adeiladu ar sail llwyddiannau mawr rhwydwaith y GIG, DAWN2, a'r rhwydwaith dysgu gydol oes. Fel y nododd Delyth Evans, bydd ymron i hanner yr ysgolion yng Nghymru ar y rhyngwyd erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn ariannol hon. Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi gosod targed o gael yr holl ysgolion yn Lloegr ar y rhyngwyd erbyn diwedd 2006. Mae Cymru ar y blaen. Mae DAWN2, rhwydwaith y GIG, wedi rhoi bron 70 y cant o'r holl feddygon teulu ar lein. Dyna ddefnyddio'r band eang i ddarparu gwell gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.

**David Ian Jones:** A wnewch ildio?

**Andrew Davies:** Na wnaif. Mae'r ymyrraeth ariannol a geir drwy raglen Band Eang Cymru yn amrywio o gynlluniau cymhorthdal tactegol bach, fel yr un ar gyfer y band eang drwy loeren, i ymyrraeth strategol ar raddfa fawr drwy gynnig y dewis o gymhorthdal gwrthdro i wella rhannau helaeth o'r seilwaith yng Nghymru. Mae Band Eang Cymru yn ymdrin â defnyddwyr band eang yn y pen uchaf a chysylltedd rhyngwladol, yn ogystal â gwasanaethau o'r math ASDL ar gyfer dechreuwyr y byddai rhai cyflenwyr am inni gredu mai hwy'n unig sy'n cyfrif.

**Brian Hancock:** A wnewch ildio?

**Andrew Davies:** Nid oes gennyf ddigon o amser, mae'n ddrwg gennyf. Bydd Band Eang Cymru yn cynorthwyo rhwng 50 a 100 o brosiectau a mentrau lleol dros gyfnod y rhaglen, fel y rhaglen e-fro yn Nyffryn Ogwen ac Arwain yng Nghaerdydd, i ddangos yr hyn y gall gwahanol dechnolegau ei wneud. Mae gennym ymagwedd niwtral at dechnolegau. Yr wyf yn falch o weld bod Phil a Phlaid Cymru wedi newid eu cân. Y llynedd yr oeddent yn mynnu mai dim ond drwy opteg ffeibr y gellid darparu'r band eang. Bellach maent yn dweud bod technoleg ddi-wifr yn allweddol. Yr wyf yn derbyn hynny. Ymagwedd niwtral at dechnolegau

fydd gennym ni bob amser.

5.10 p.m.

I am delighted to see such a sudden interest in the 3.4 GHz licence auction. Until last week, I think that David Ian Jones and Rhodri Glyn Thomas thought it was a rock band. Such is his technical grasp of the subject that David Ian Jones called it 3.4 megabits last week. We have to assume therefore that his grasp of the issues is pretty limited. We continue to lobby the UK Government to ensure that the needs of Wales are met on non-delegated matters. As I reported to Committee last week, I was disappointed—and my disappointment is on record—that the Radio Communications Agency launched its final consultation on the 3.4 GHz licence based on a map with built-in disadvantages to Wales. That was despite heavy lobbying from many parts of Wales, including from Professor Mike Tedd, and communications from me and the First Minister that set out a simple, clear alternative, which WACT supported. I will continue to urgently address this matter with the DTI and the Radio Communications Agency. I urge everyone, along with the Economic Development Committee, to make their mark through the consultation process.

In conclusion, we have comprehensive plans and actions in hand for both physical and electronic infrastructures in Wales. I therefore ask you to support amendments 1 and 2 in the name of Carwyn Jones, which recognise that we are already mobilising resources to achieve a successful modern economy. If amendment 2 is carried, all the subsequent amendments fall and I do not, therefore, intend to cover them other than to ask you to oppose them.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Your comments on the amendments were not quite right; I will explain the situation later.

**Cynog Dafis:** Mae'r ddadl hon wedi bod yn ddefnyddiol. Mae strategaeth ar gyfathrebu'n allweddol ar gyfer datblygu economaidd, hygyrchedd a chynhwysiant cymdeithasol—clywsom Mick Bates yn sôn am Dial-a-Ride

Yr wyf wrth fy modd o weld diddordeb mor sydyn yn yr arwethiant trwyddedau 3.4 gigahertz. Hyd yr wythnos diwethaf, credaf fod David Ian Jones a Rhodri Glyn Thomas yn meddwl mai band roc ydoedd. Cymaint yw gafael dechnolegol David Ian Jones ar y pwnc fel y bu iddo'i alw'n 3.4 megabit yr wythnos diwethaf. Rhaid inni gymryd felly mai eithaf cyfyngedig yw ei afael ar y materion hyn. Parhawn i lobïo Llywodraeth y DU i sicrhau y diwellir anghenion Cymru ar faterion sydd heb eu dirprwyo. Fel yr adroddais i'r Pwyllgor yr wythnos diwethaf, fe'm siomwyd—ac mae fy siom wedi'i chofnodi—fod yr Asiantaeth Cysylltiadau Radio wedi lansio ei hymgyngoriad terfynol ar y drwydded 3.4 gigahertz ar sail map sydd ag anfanteision annatod i Gymru. Yr oedd hynny er gwaethaf lobïo caled o lawer rhan o Gymru, gan gynnwys hynny gan yr Athro Mike Tedd, a negeseuon oddi wrthyf fi a'r Prif Weinidog a oedd yn nodi dewis arall syml ac eglur, a gefnogwyd gan Bwyllgor Ymgynghorol Cymru ar Delathrebu. Parhaf i roi sylw brys i'r mater hwn gyda'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant a'r Asiantaeth Cysylltiadau Radio. Anogaf bawb, ynghyd â'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, i adael eu hól drwy'r broses ymgynghori.

I gloi, mae gennym gynlluniau cynhwysfawr a chymau gweithredu ar waith ar gyfer seilweithiau ffisegol ac electronig yng Nghymru. Gan hynny, gofynnaf ichi gefnogi gwelliannau 1 a 2 yn enw Carwyn Jones, sy'n cydnabod ein bod eisoes yn rhoi adnoddau ar waith i sicrhau economi fodern lwyddiannus. Os derbynnir gwelliant 2, bydd yr holl welliannau sy'n ei ddilyn yn methu ac, felly, ni fwriadaf ymdrin â hwy heblaw am ofyn ichi eu gwrthwynebu.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Nid oedd eich sylwadau am y gwelliannau'n gwbl gywir; egluraf y sefyllfa'n ddiweddarach.

**Cynog Dafis:** This has been a useful debate. A communications strategy is vital for economic development, access and social inclusion—we heard Mick Bates mention Dial-a-Ride in Montgomeryshire. It is vital

yn Sir Drefaldwyn. Mae'n hollbwysig y datblygir gwasanaeth yn ôl y galw yn yr ardaloedd gwledig ar frys. Mae hefyd yn bwysig i undod a chyfanrwydd cenedlaethol Cymru ac yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed Mick Bates yn pwysleisio hynny. Mae'n fater a anwybyddir yn rhy aml. Mae'r angen am system gyfathrebu sy'n uno Cymru yn fater strategol o bwys, a esgeuluswyd erioed. Am y tro cyntaf erioed, mae gennym gyfle yng Nghymru i fynd i'r afael â hynny. Fodd bynnag, ni fydd yn digwydd oni bai bod ewyllys wleidyddol i'w gyflawni—ac yr wyf yn amau a ydyw'r ewyllys honno'n bodoli. Cawsom enghraifft berffaith o fethiant yn achos yr Asiantaeth Cysylltiadau Radio, a rannodd Gymru yn ddarnau a'u gosod gyda rhannau o Loegr. Dyna enghraifft berffaith o drin Cymru â dirmyg. Gwnaeth Phil Williams bwynt pwysig pan ddywedodd nad oedd yn credu y meiddiai'r asiantaeth wneud hynny pe bai'r Cynulliad wedi llunio strategaeth gysylltiadau glir a'i chyflwyno—ei chyfathrebu, os hoffech—i'r asiantaeth. Mae'r sefyllfa yn fy atgoffa o drefniadau radio'r 1930au pan gyfiawnhawyd gosod rhannau o Gymru gyda de-orllewin Lloegr oherwydd bod hynny'n cyfateb i deyrnas y Brenin Arthur. Dyna'r esgus a roddwyd bryd hynny.

'Integreiddio' yw'r gair pwysig. Rhaid integreiddio. Y gwir trist yw bod integreiddio'n amhosibl o dan y trefniadau presennol. Pwysleisiodd Janet Davies hynny yn ei haraith bwerus. Ein gwendid yw'n hanallu i ddylanwadu ar benderfyniadau'r SRA. Mae angen inni gael gwir bwerau i dynnu'r cyfan ynghyd.

O ran cysylltiadau electronig, sy'n fater creiddiol, mae Plaid Cymru wedi cydnabod er 1992 yr angen am strategaeth, ac wedi disgrifio gam wrth gam sut i gyflawni'r amcan o gael cysylltedd cyffredinol ar draws Cymru. Mae Llywodraethau ers hynny wedi colli'r cyfle hwnnw, a'i fradychu. Rhaid cydnabod bod y Llywodraeth bresennol hefyd wedi colli'r cyfle, nid oherwydd diffyg adnoddau ond oherwydd diffyg strategaeth. Mae mater adnoddau Barnett ac yn y blaen i'w ystyried, ond mae'r ffaith bod £70 miliwn yn y rhaglen Amcan 1 ar gyfer isadeiledd technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu heb ei ddyrranu o hyd yn gollfarn ar y Llywodraeth

that a demand-led service is developed in rural areas urgently. It is also important for the unity and the national integrity of Wales, and I was pleased to hear Mick Bates stress that point. It is an issue that is too often ignored. The need for a communications system that unites Wales is an important strategic issue, which has always been neglected. For the first time ever, we have an opportunity in Wales to tackle that. However, it will not happen without the political will to achieve it—and I doubt that it exists. We saw a perfect example of failure in the case of the Radio Communications Agency, which split Wales into small sections and linked them to parts of England. That is a perfect example of treating Wales with contempt. Phil Williams made an important point when he said that he did not think that the agency would have dared to do that if the Assembly had formulated a clear communications strategy and presented it—communicated it, as it were—to the agency. The situation reminds me of radio provision in the 1930s when the justification for placing parts of Wales with south-west England was that it corresponded to King Arthur's kingdom. That was the excuse given on that occasion.

'Integration' is the key word. We must integrate. The sad fact is that integration is impossible under the present arrangements. Janet Davies stressed that in her powerful speech. Our weakness is our inability to influence the decisions of the SRA. We need real powers to draw everything together.

With regard to electronic communications, which is a central issue, since 1992 Plaid Cymru has acknowledged the need for a strategy, and has given a step-by-step description of how to achieve the objective of general connectivity across Wales. Governments since then have missed that opportunity, and have betrayed it. It must be recognised that the existing Government has also missed that opportunity, not because of a lack of resources but because of a lack of strategy. There is the issue of the Barnett resources and so on to consider, but the fact that £70 million in the Objective 1 programme for ICT infrastructure has still not

hon.

Yn ôl Phil Williams, dangoswyd gwendid hyn yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yr wythnos diwethaf—nid oes strategaeth. Mae sôn y bydd £115 miliwn ar gael dros y pum mlynedd nesaf, ac mai honno fydd y rhaglen fwyaf uchelgeisiol yn y Deyrnas Gyfunol. Dylai fod, oherwydd rhaglen Amcan 1 ydyw. Daw hanner y cyllid hwnnw o raglen Amcan 1. Fodd bynnag, nid oes dim o'r arian hwnnw wedi cael ei ddyrannu ar gyfer y rhaglen uchelgeisiol hon. Mae Mike Tedd wedi mynegi ei bryder ynglŷn ag arafwch y broses.

Soniasoch am agwedd Plaid Cymru at gysylltiadau di-wifr. Mae safbwynt Plaid Cymru yn glir ar hyn. Dylai'r rhwydwaith sylfaenol fod yn ffeibr optig ond dylai fod lle i dechnolegau di-wifr a lloeren fel technolegau atodol. [*Torri ar draws.*] Dywed Andrew Davies nad dyna oedd ein safbwynt y llynedd. Efallai ein bod wedi newid ein safbwynt ar hynny. Mae Plaid Cymru yn dysgu ac yn barod i symud ymlaen. Mae ein safbwynt a'n bwriad yn glir. Mae'n rhaglen a'n targed ar gyfer cael rhwydwaith teilwng yn ei le erbyn 2007 yn glir. Gorau i gyd bod gennym adnoddau ychwanegol, ond mae angen eglurder pwrpas a strategaeth glir.

Mae hyn yn ategu pwynt a wnes bythefnos yn ôl, sef nad yw Llafur Cymru erioed wedi arfer creu polisi. Peiriant ennill pleidleisiau ydyw. Daeth i'r Cynulliad yn 1999 gyda llechen lân, neu tabula rasa. Ni wyddai beth i'w wneud, ac yr ydym yn medi ffrwyth y gwacter polisi hwnnw yn awr. A oes unrhyw arwyddion bod hynny yn dechrau newid? Ni welaf arwydd o hynny. Rhaid i'r Blaid Lafur yng Nghymru ailstrwythuro'i hunan fel plaid wirioneddol Gymreig cyn y gall lunio rhaglen bolisi ar gyfer Cymru.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I should explain that amendment 3 will fall if amendment 2 is carried.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 30, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 20.  
Amendment 1: For 30, Abstain 0, Against 20.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

been allocated is a condemnation of this Government.

According to Phil Williams, the weakness of this was demonstrated in the Economic Development Committee last week—there is no strategy. It is said that £115 million will be available over the next five years, and that it will be the most ambitious programme in the UK. It should be, because it is the Objective 1 programme. Half of that funding comes from the Objective 1 programme. However, to date none of that money has been allocated for this ambitious programme. Mike Tedd has expressed his concern about the slowness of the process.

You mentioned Plaid Cymru's attitude towards wireless communication. Plaid Cymru's stance on this is clear. The basic network should be fibre optic, but there should be a place for satellite and wireless technologies as supplementary technologies. [*Interruption.*] Andrew Davies says that that was not our stance last year. Perhaps we have shifted our stance on that. Plaid Cymru learns and is willing to move forward. Our stance and our intention is clear. Our programme and target to have a suitable network in place by 2007 is clear. We welcome the additional resources, but we want clarity of purpose and a clear strategy.

This reinforces a point that I made a fortnight ago, namely that Labour in Wales has no history of policy development. It is a vote-winning machine. It came to the Assembly in 1999 with a clean slate, or a tabula rasa. It did not know what to do, and we are reaping the harvest of that policy vacuum now. Are there any indications of that beginning to change? I see no sign of it. The Labour Party in Wales must restructure itself as a truly Welsh party before it can draw up a policy programme for Wales.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Dylwn egluro y bydd gwelliant 3 yn methu os derbynnir gwelliant 2.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Kirsty

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Jones, David Ian  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment accepted.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 30, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 20.  
 Amendment 2: For 30, Abstain 0, Against 20.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Jones, David Ian  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Phil

Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment accepted.*

Methodd gwelliant 3.  
 Amendment 3 fell.

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
 Amendment 4: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Jones, David Ian  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 German, Michael  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant  
 Amendment rejected.*

5.20 p.m.

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 7, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 43.  
 Amendment 5: For 7, Abstain 0, Against 43.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Jones, David Ian  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Dafis, Cynog

Rogers, Peter

Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 7, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 43.  
 Amendment 6: For 7, Abstain 0, Against 43.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Jones, David Ian  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Rogers, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John



Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 7, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 43.  
 Amendment 7: For 7, Abstain 0, Against 43.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Jones, David Ian  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Rogers, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Middlehurst, Tom

Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 8: O blaid 7, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 42.  
 Amendment 8: For 7, Abstain 0, Against 42.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Jones, David Ian  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Rogers, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*

*Amendment rejected.*

Motion NDM1327 as amended:

Cynnig NDM1327 wedi'i ddiwygio:

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*welcomes Government initiatives that mobilise available resources to create efficient physical and electronic communications throughout Wales as an essential element of a successful modern economy.*

*yn croesawu mentrau gan y Llywodraeth sy'n caniatáu defnyddio'r adnoddau sydd ar gael i sefydlu dulliau cyfathrebu ffisegol ac electronig effeithlon ledled Cymru fel elfen allweddol o economi fodern lwyddiannus.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 30, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 20.*

*Amended motion: For 30, Abstain 0, Against 20.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Hancock, Brian  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.*

*Amended motion carried.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings today's proceedings to a close.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.21 p.m.*

*The session ended at 5.21 p.m.*

