



Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)

The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)

Dydd Mawrth 21 Ionawr 2003

Tuesday 21 January 2003

Cynnwys
Contents

- 3 Ethol i'r Pwyllgor Deddfau
Election to the Legislation Committee
- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog
Questions to the First Minister
- 25 Datganiad ar Raglen Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i Wella Praidd Defaid Cymru
Statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's Programme to Improve the Welsh Sheep Flock
- 31 Datganiad Busnes
Business Statement
- 35 Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion
Composite Motion: Approval of Orders
- 37 Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau Deddf Iechyd Anifeiliaid 2002
Delegation of Functions of the Animal Health Act 2002
- 40 Gorchymyn Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Datgymhwysu) 2003
The National Assembly for Wales (Disqualification) Order 2003
- 43 Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ynghylch Ynni Adnewyddadwy
The Economic Development Committee's Report on Renewable Energy
- 65 'Ffermio i'r Dyfodol'
'Farming for the Future'

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Ethol i'r Pwyllgor Deddfau Election to the Legislation Committee

Y Trefnydd (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiaf fod **The Business Minister (Carwyn Jones):** I propose that

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order No. 8.4, elects Tom Middlehurst (Labour) and Huw Lewis (Labour) to replace Ann Jones (Labour) and Karen Sinclair (Labour) on the Legislation Committee. (NDM1295)

*Cynnig (NDM1295): O blaid 27, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1295): For 27, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Janet
Evans, Delyth
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, David Ian
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister

Dosbarthu Band Eang yng Nghymru Distribution of Broadband in Wales

Q1 Brian Hancock: Will the First Minister make a statement on the distribution of **C1 Brian Hancock:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar ddosbarthiad

broadband in Wales? (OAQ21628)

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): Since Andrew Davies, the Minister for Economic Development, launched the Broadband Wales programme in July 2002, several initiatives have taken place. They include: securing a further £15 million for the programme; the satellite subsidy scheme to reduce the cost of satellite broadband for businesses is now operational; 'try before you buy' broadband showcasing facilities are available at many information and communications technology support centres throughout Wales; the lifelong learning network is in place and most local authorities are connected—all will be by the end of March 2003.

Brian Hancock: As you know, I have been promoting the regeneration of the former Navigation Colliery site at Crumlin, which could greatly improve the local economy, and is ideal because it has a park and ride station. Will you welcome and support the all-Wales broadband infrastructure trials proposed in the area, which have the support of knowledge-based companies such as Cisco, Sun Microsystems, Oracle, IBM and Orange? If it were to come to Crumlin, it could act as a generation unit and could link the economic units of Newport and Ebbw Vale.

The First Minister: You listed an almost mouth-watering number of top information technology companies, Brian, and it would be difficult to resist your blandishment, but I would like to know more about the scheme. If you write to Andrew Davies or me, I am sure you will receive a positive response.

Ann Jones: Do you agree that broadband should be available in all areas of Wales so that businesses and even home users can access its benefits? Will you join me in calling for more discussion on trigger ballots? Under the current system, you have to arrange to reach a target before you can even be considered for broadband. The best way to achieve those targets should be discussed with local communities. Those targets could be reduced in areas such as Prestatyn where broadband is needed desperately to assist the

technolog band eang yng Nghymru? (OAQ21628)

Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan): Ers i Andrew Davies, y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd, lansio rhaglen Band Eang Cymru yng Ngorffennaf 2002, mae sawl menter wedi bod. Yn eu plith y mae: sicrhau £15 miliwn pellach i'r rhaglen; mae'r cynllun cymhorthdal lloeren i leihau cost technoleg band eang lloeren i fusnesau bellach ar waith; mae cyfleusterau arddangos band eang 'profi cyn prynu' ar gael mewn llawer o ganolfannau cymorth technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu ledled Cymru; mae'r rhwydwaith dysgu gydol oes ar waith ac mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r awdurdodau lleol wedi'i gysylltu—bydd pob un ohonynt wedi'i gysylltu erbyn diwedd Mawrth 2003.

Brian Hancock: Fel y gwyddoch, bûm yn hyrwyddo adfywio safle cyn-lofa Navigation yng Nghrymlyn, a allai fod yn fodd i wella'r economi leol yn fawr, ac sy'n ddelfrydol am fod gorsaf parcio a theithio ar ei gyfer. A wnewch groesawu a chefnogi'r rhagbrofion seilwaith band eang Cymru-gyfan a gynigir yn yr ardal, sydd wedi'u cefnogi gan gwmnïau sy'n seiliedig ar wybodaeth fel Cisco, Sun Microsystems, Oracle, IBM ac Orange? Pe deuai i Grymlyn, gallai fod yn uned gynhyrchu a darparu cysylltiadau ar gyfer unedau economaidd Casnewydd a Glynebwy.

Y Prif Weinidog: Rhoesoch restr o nifer o'r prif gwmnïau technoleg gwybodaeth sydd bron â thynnu dŵr o'r dannedd, Brian, a byddai'n anodd gwrthsefyll eich perswâd, ond carwn wybod rhagor am y cynllun. Os ysgrifennwch at Andrew Davies neu ataf fi, yr wyf yn siŵr y cewch ymateb cadarnhaol.

Ann Jones: A gytunwch y dylai technoleg band eang fod ar gael ym mhob rhan o Gymru fel y gall busnesau a hyd yn oed ddefnyddwyr yn eu cartrefi gael budd ohoni? A wnewch ymuno â mi i alw am ragor o drafod am bleidleisiau cychwyn? O dan y system bresennol, rhaid trefnu i gyrraedd targed cyn y gellir hyd yn oed ystyried rhywun ar gyfer y band eang. Dylid trafod y modd gorau i gyrraedd y targedau hynny gyda chymunedau lleol. Gellid gostwng y targedau hynny mewn ardaloedd fel Prestatyn

local community and economy.

The First Minister: This is the most frequently raised complaint or issue about spreading broadband, namely the need to get business and big residential customers—people who work from home and so forth—onto broadband. I am not sure how BT decides on the target number. I know the target number for the Blackwood area from my briefing for Brain's question, but I think the numbers are different throughout Wales. It may depend on telephone exchange configuration. In the case of Blackwood, BT is looking for 300 pre-registrations before it will install ADSL in the exchange; it has received just under 200 so far. That figure may be higher in Prestatyn. BT has some methodology by which it decides on a figure because it wants that figure to act as a carrot to persuade as many businesses as possible to pre-register. Clearly, we hope that the demand stimulation measures within Broadband Wales will stimulate enough demand to reach the level where BT thinks it is commercially viable to offer broadband in all local exchanges in Wales.

William Graham: Scandinavia, which has broadly similar geographical problems as Wales, makes widespread use of the electricity supply grid to supply electronic communication. After all, an electricity supply goes to every house in Wales. What measures have you put in place to ensure that broadband utilises this effective grid?

The First Minister: I am not technically competent to comment on individual types of technology. I am only familiar with three, namely standard ADSL, satellite and wireless. There have been some exciting developments in wireless in north Wales through the eFro scheme, and in the Cardiff area through the Arwain scheme. We are promoting satellite heavily, as well as standard ADSL, by using the copper wire infrastructure, which goes into everyone's home. I am not familiar with the technology that you are discussing, but I will draw it to Andrew Davies's attention.

lle y mae taer angen technoleg band eang i gynorthwyo'r gymuned a'r economi leol.

Y Prif Weinidog: Dyma'r gŵyn neu'r mater a godir amlaf ynghylch lledaenu technoleg band eang, sef yr angen i symud busnesau a chwsmeriaid preswyl mawr—rhai sy'n gweithio yn eu cartrefi ac yn y blaen—at dechnoleg band eang. Nid wyf yn sicr sut y mae BT yn penderfynu ar y nifer targed. Gwn beth yw'r nifer targed i ardal y Coed-duon ar sail y briff a gefais ar gyfer cwestiwn Brian, ond credaf fod y niferoedd yn wahanol ledled Cymru. Gallai ddibynnu ar gyfluniad cyfnewidfeydd teleffon. Yn achos y Coed-duon, mae BT yn ceisio 300 o gofrestradau o flaen llaw cyn y gwnaiff osod ADSL yn y gyfnewidfa; mae wedi derbyn ychydig yn llai na 200 hyd yn hyn. Gallai'r ffigur hwnnw fod yn uwch ym Mhrestatyn. Mae gan BT fethodoleg a ddefnyddia i benderfynu ar ffigur gan ei fod am i'r ffigur hwnnw fod yn abwyd i ddarbwylllo cynifer o fusnesau ag y bo modd i ymgofrestru o flaen llaw. Wrth gwrs, gobeithiwn y bydd y camau i symbylu galw yn Band Eang Cymru yn symbylu digon o alw i gyrraedd y lefel lle y mae BT yn credu ei bod yn fasnachol ymarferol cynnig technoleg band eang yn yr holl gyfnewidfeydd lleol yng Nghymru.

William Graham: Mae Llychlyn, sydd â phroblemau daearyddol gweddol debyg i Gymru, yn gwneud defnydd helaeth o'r grid cyflenwi trydan i gyflenwi cyfathrebu electronig. Wedi'r cwbl, mae cyflenwad trydan ar gyfer pob tŷ yng Nghymru. Pa gamau yr ydych wedi'u cymryd i sicrhau defnydd o'r grid effeithiol hwn gan dechnoleg band eang?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oes gennyf ddigon o wybodaeth dechnolegol i allu gwneud sylw am fathau neilltuol o dechnoleg. Nid wyf ond yn gyfarwydd â thri, sef y dechnoleg ASDL arferol, technoleg lloeren a thechnoleg ddi-wifr. Bu rhai datblygiadau cyffrous mewn technoleg ddi-wifr yn y Gogledd drwy'r cynllun eFro, ac yn ardal Caerdydd drwy gynllun Arwain. Yr ydym yn hyrwyddo technoleg ddi-wifr yn egnïol, yn ogystal â'r dechnoleg ADSL arferol, drwy ddefnyddio'r seilwaith gwifrau copor, a aiff i gartref pawb. Nid wyf yn gyfarwydd â'r dechnoleg yr ydych yn ei thrafod, ond fe'i tynnaf i sylw

Andrew Davies.

Hedfan rhwng Caerdydd a Brwsel
Flights from Cardiff to Brussels

Q2 Janet Davies: Has the First Minister had any discussions with the appropriate business organisations regarding the effects on economic development of the termination of flights from Cardiff to Brussels? (OAQ21633)

The First Minister: Sue Essex has discussed this with Cardiff international airport. It is at an exploratory stage in its discussions to find a successor airline to British Airways following its regrettable decision to withdraw from the Paris and Brussels services. You will be aware that it was quick to find a replacement for the Paris service as bmibaby took that on. There was almost no discontinuity. However, replacing the Brussels service is proving more difficult. The airport is in discussions with an operator because I have already expressed my regret at BA's decision to withdraw.

Janet Davies: I am pleased to hear that discussions are ongoing. However, given that this was a slap in the face for Wales, particularly for business, do you propose to take any other actions?

The First Minister: You are only allowed to subsidise airlines in absolutely extreme circumstances. For example, it is allowed on the Scottish islands so as not to risk life and limb, because there are no doctors, and for practical reasons because there are no schools in an area. Those are the only circumstances under which you can subsidise an airline service.

We can promote and assist. We are currently assisting Cardiff international airport in terms of finding a successor operator and we hope to be successful soon because I share your concerns about the loss of connection with Brussels. That was vital for public and private sector businesses because you need to get to and from the institutions of the European community as easily as possible.

C2 Janet Davies: A yw'r Prif Weinidog wedi cynnal unrhyw drafodaethau gyda'r mudiadau busnes perthnasol ynghylch effaith y penderfyniad i beidio â hedfan rhwng Caerdydd a Brwsel ar ddatblygu economaidd? (OAQ21633)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae Sue Essex wedi trafod hyn gyda maes awyr rhyngwladol Caerdydd. Mae'r maes awyr wedi cychwyn trafodaethau i ddarganfod cwmni awyrennau i olynu British Airways wedi ei benderfyniad anffodus i dynnu'r gwasanaethau i Baris a Brwsel yn ôl. Byddwch yn ymwybodol ei fod wedi dod o hyd i gwmni i gymryd ei le ar gyfer y gwasanaeth i Baris gan fod bmibaby wedi ymgymryd â hwnnw. Bron na fu toriad ynddo o gwbl. Fodd bynnag, mae'n ei chael yn fwy anodd cael cwmni yn ei le i redeg y gwasanaeth i Frwsel. Mae'r maes awyr yn cynnal trafodaethau gyda gweithredwr oherwydd yr wyf eisoes wedi mynegi fy ngofid ynghylch penderfyniad BA i dynnu'n ôl.

Janet Davies: Yr wyf yn falch o glywed bod trafodaethau'n mynd ymlaen. Fodd bynnag, gan fod hyn yn ergyd gas i Gymru, yn enwedig i fusnes, a ydych yn bwriadu cymryd unrhyw gamau eraill?

Y Prif Weinidog: Dim ond o dan amgylchiadau cwbl eithafol y caniateir rhoi cymhorthdal i gwmnïau awyrennau. Er enghraifft, caniateir hynny ar ynysoedd yr Alban er mwyn peidio â pheryglu bywyd, gan nad oes meddygon, ac am resymau ymarferol am nad oes ysgolion mewn ardal. Dim ond o dan yr amgylchiadau hynny y ceir rhoi cymhorthdal i wasanaeth cwmni awyrennau.

Gallwn hyrwyddo a chynorthwyo. Yr ydym yn cynorthwyo maes awyr rhyngwladol Caerdydd ar hyn o bryd o ran dod o hyd i weithredwr olynol a gobeithiwn lwyddo cyn hir oherwydd rhannaf eich pryderon am golli cysylltiad â Brwsel. Yr oedd hwnnw'n hollbwysig i fusnes yn y sectorau cyhoeddus a phreifat gan fod rhaid gallu cyrraedd a gadael sefydliadau'r gymuned Ewropeaidd

cyn rhwydded â phosibl.

David Melding: Do you agree that the success in attracting bmibaby demonstrates that if slots are available, an airport like Cardiff international airport will attract some of the world-beating airlines that are currently operating?

David Melding: A ydych yn cytuno bod y llwyddiant o ran denu bmibaby yn dangos, os oes rhicynnau ar gael, y bydd maes awyr fel maes awyr rhyngwladol Caerdydd yn denu rhai o'r cwmnïau awyrennau gorau yn y byd sy'n gweithredu ar hyn o bryd?

The First Minister: Yes. Bmibaby has been a great success story at East Midlands airport. We have every confidence that it will repeat its success at its second base in the UK in Cardiff. Last year was not a good year for Cardiff, like many—if not all—British airports. All airports saw a decline in passenger numbers for the first time in many years. However, with the arrival of bmibaby, it is anticipated that the number of passengers using Cardiff international airport will cross the magic 2 million barrier during 2003.

Y Prif Weinidog: Ydwyf. Bu bmibaby yn llwyddiant mawr ym maes awyr East Midlands. Yr ydym yn gwbl ffyddiog y caiff yr un llwyddiant yn ei ail ganolfan yn y DU yng Nghaerdydd. Nid oedd y flwyddyn ddiwethaf yn un dda i Gaerdydd, yn yr un modd â llawer—os nad pob un—o'r meysydd awyr ym Mhrydain. Bu gostyngiad yn niferoedd y teithwyr yn yr holl feysydd awyr am y tro cyntaf mewn blynnyddoedd lawer. Er hynny, gyda dyfodiad bmibaby, disgwylir y bydd nifer y teithwyr sy'n defnyddio maes awyr rhyngwladol Caerdydd yn croesi'r terfyn hudol o 2 filiwn yn ystod 2003.

2:10 p.m.

Eleanor Burnham: Do you agree that, while we should consider environmental impact, we should strengthen links between Cardiff international airport and Hawarden and Caernarfon airports in north Wales? Routes to north Wales are just as important as routes to Europe.

Eleanor Burnham: A ydych yn cytuno, er y dylem ystyried yr effaith ar yr amgylchedd, y dylem gryfhau'r cysylltiadau rhwng maes awyr rhyngwladol Caerdydd a meysydd awyr Penarlâg a Chaernarfon yn y Gogledd? Mae llwybrau i'r Gogledd cyn bwysiced â rhai i Ewrop.

The Presiding Officer: Order. This question is about Cardiff and Brussels, and does not mention Caernarfon or Hawarden.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae'r cwestiwn hwn yn ymwneud â Chaerdydd a Brwsel, ac nid yw'n sôn am Gaernarfon neu Benarlâg.

Problemau Amgylcheddol a achosir gan Fagiau Plastig Environmental Problems created by Plastic Carrier Bags

Q3 Brian Gibbons: Has the First Minister had any discussions with the Secretary of State for Wales on UK Government plans to tackle environmental problems created by plastic carrier bags? (OAQ21638)

C3 Brian Gibbons: A yw'r Prif Weinidog wedi cynnal unrhyw drafodaethau gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynghylch cynlluniau Llywodraeth y DU i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau amgylcheddol a achosir gan fagiau plastig? (OAQ21638)

The First Minister: I have not discussed the issue of plastic bags specifically with the Secretary of State, although we regularly discuss environmental matters. You will be aware of a statement Sue Essex made recently, in which she expressed her concerns at the environmental costs of single-use

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf wedi trafod mater bagiau plastig yn benodol gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol, er ein bod yn trafod materion amgylcheddol yn rheolaidd. Byddwch yn ymwybodol o ddatganiad a wnaeth Sue Essex yn ddiweddar, lle y mynegodd ei phryderon ynghylch y costau i'r

plastic shopping bags, and their effect on finite resources, both in terms of making the plastic and in terms of landfill resources in dealing with these bags when they have been used.

Brian Gibbons: You will be aware that between 400 million and 500 million plastic bags are distributed in Wales annually. Fewer than 5 per cent are recycled; that is scandalous. In the Irish republic, the amount of plastic bags used fell by 90 per cent when a levy on their use was introduced and, more importantly, a cultural change was achieved. Do you believe that it is appropriate to consider what we can do in Wales to achieve a similar cultural change?

The First Minister: You are right to draw the success of the Irish experiment—if it is fair to call it that—to our attention. I do not believe that they would change the situation now, as it has been a roaring success, in the way that you describe. Sue Essex made her statement at a British-Irish Council meeting on the environment; she stated the need to consider this issue in a Welsh context, given where the plastic comes from and where it ends up. We will consider how the UK Government, as the landfill tax credit authority, and the devolved administrations can best take this issue forward given the success of the Irish experiment. I always re-use my plastic shopping bags, as they make perfect ties for black bin bags, once the air has been expelled from them; that is an example worth following from the Morgan household.

David Ian Jones: Do you agree that people are increasingly warming to the idea of recycling where recycling facilities are available? One problem in this regard is that not many facilities have been available hitherto in Wales for recycling plastic products. To that end, do you agree that Tesco, which has recently introduced a policy of providing plastic recycling facilities at each of its supermarkets across the country, should be commended? It deals with the plastic bags of other supermarkets as well as its own. Will you urge other supermarkets to

amgylchedd o fagiau siopa plastig a ddefnyddir unwaith, a'u heffaith ar adnoddau cyfyngedig, o ran gwneud y plastig ac o ran adnoddau tirlenwi wrth ddelio â'r bagiau hynny ar ôl eu defnyddio.

Brian Gibbons: Byddwch yn ymwybodol y caiff rhwng 400 miliwn a 500 miliwn o fagiau plastig eu dosbarthu yng Nghymru bob blwyddyn. Caiff llai na 5 y cant eu hailgylchu; mae hynny'n warthus. Yng ngweriniaeth Iwerddon, bu gostyniad o 90 y cant yn nifer y bagiau plastig a ddefnyddid pan gyflwynwyd treth ar eu defnyddio ac, yn bwysicach na hynny, sicrhawyd newid mewn arferion. A greddwch ei bod yn briodol ystyried beth y gallwn ei wneud yng Nghymru i sicrhau newid tebyg mewn arferion?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'n briodol ichi dynnu ein sylw at lwyddiant yr arbrawf—os mai teg yw ei alw'n hynny—yn Iwerddon. Ni chredaf y byddent yn newid y sefyllfa'n awr, gan iddi fod yn llwyddiant aruthrol, yn y modd a ddisgrifiwch. Gwnaeth Sue Essex ei datganiad mewn cyfarfod o Gyngor Prydain-Iwerddon ar yr amgylchedd; nododd yr angen i ystyried y mater hwn mewn cyd-destun Cymreig, o ystyried o ble y daw'r plastig ac i ble'r aiff yn y diwedd. Gwnawn ystyried y modd gorau i Lywodraeth y DU, fel yr awdurdod credyd treth tirlenwi, a'r gweinyddiaethau datganoledig fwrw ymlaen â'r mater hwn o ystyried llwyddiant yr arbrawf yn Iwerddon. Yr wyf bob amser yn aildefnyddio fy magiau siopa plastig, gan mai hwy yw'r union beth i glymu sachau sbwriel du, ar ôl gwasgu'r aer ohonynt; dyna esiampl gan deulu'r Morganiaid y mae'n werth ei dilyn.

David Ian Jones: A ydych yn cytuno bod pobl yn cael eu denu fwyfwy at y syniad o ailgylchu lle y mae cyfleusterau ailgylchu ar gael? Un broblem yn hynny o beth yw na fu llawer o gyfleusterau ar gael hyd yn hyn yng Nghymru i ailgylchu cynhyrchion plastig. I'r perwyl hwnnw, a gytunwch y dylid canmol Tesco, sydd wedi cyflwyno polisi'n ddiweddar o ddarparu cyfleusterau ailgylchu plastig ym mhob un o'i archfarchnadoedd ledled y wlad? Mae'n delio â bagiau plastig archfarchnadoedd eraill yn ogystal â'i rai ei hun. A wnewch annog archfarchnadoedd

adopt the same policy?

The First Minister: Yes, but I do not want to endorse one supermarket—that would be invidious. Many supermarkets appreciate that the problem of single-use, non-biodegradable shopping bags is regrettable, and that it will have to be dealt with at some stage. The question is whether you do so by means of tax. That is what Ireland did; it bit the bullet and found that the cultural change necessary to cut down on the use of plastic shopping bags came about remarkably easily. People are more nervous about whether or not we would dare take the same step here. If we did so, would we see the same cultural change come about as quickly? I do not know what promotional devices the Irish Government, or its environmental bodies, used to promote that cultural change, but its scheme was a roaring success. Inevitably, it will be considered by the UK Government and the devolved administrations.

eraill i fabwysiadu'r un polisi?

Y Prif Weinidog: Gwnaf, ond nid wyf am gymeradwyo un archfarchnad—byddai hynny'n annheg. Mae llawer o archfarchnadoedd yn sylweddoli bod problem bagiau siopa amhyradwy a ddefnyddir unwaith yn destun gofid, ac y bydd yn rhaid ymdrin â hi rywbryd. Y cwestiwn yw a wneir hynny drwy dreth. Dyna a wnaeth Iwerddon; gwasgodd ei dannedd a chael bod y newid mewn arferion sydd ei angen i gwtogi ar y defnydd o fapiau siopa plastig yn digwydd yn hynod o rwydd. Mae pobl yn fwy nerfus ynghych a fyddem yn meiddio cymryd yr un cam yma. Os gwnaem hynny, a welem yr un newid mewn arferion yn digwydd mor gyflym? Ni wn pa gynlluniau hyrwyddo a ddefnyddiodd Llywodraeth Iwerddon, neu ei chyrrff amgylcheddol, i hyrwyddo'r newid hwnnw mewn arferion, ond bu ei chynllun yn llwyddiant aruthrol. Bydd yn sicr o gael ei ystyried gan Lywodraeth y DU a'r gweinyddiaethau datganoledig.

Pobl Ifanc yng Nghanolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru Young People in Mid and West Wales

C4 Delyth Evans: Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn eu cymryd i gefnogi pobl ifanc yng Nghanolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru? (OAQ21647)

Q4 Delyth Evans: What action is the Welsh Assembly Government taking to support young people in the Mid and West Wales region? (OAQ21647)

Y Prif Weinidog: Ein blaenoriaeth ar gyfer rhanbarth y Canolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru, yn yr un modd â gweddill Cymru, yw symud ymlaen â'r agenda ymestyn hawliau y mae'r Cynulliad wedi rhoi sêl bendith iddi. Y nod yw sicrhau bod pobl ifanc ym mhob rhan o Gymru yn gallu manteisio ar wasanaethau gwybodaeth a chymorth o safon uchel, gan arwain at lefel uwch o gyfraniad gan bobl ifanc fel dinasyddion Cymru.

The First Minister: Our priority for the Mid and West Wales region, as for the rest of Wales, is to progress the extending entitlement agenda endorsed by the Assembly. The aim is to ensure that young people in all parts of Wales are able to take advantage of high quality information and support services, leading to a higher level of contribution by young people as citizens of Wales.

Delyth Evans: Byddai mynediad i ganolfannau hamdden ac ati yn helpu bywyd bob dydd pobl ifanc. Croesewais eich datganiad beth amser yn ôl ynglŷn ag ystyried agor canolfannau hamdden i blant a phobl ifanc am ddim yn ystod gwyliau ysgol. Pa waith a wneir ar hynny ar hyn o bryd?

Delyth Evans: Access to leisure centres and so on would help the everyday lives of young people. I welcomed your announcement some time ago on considering opening leisure centres to children and young people free of charge during school holidays. What are the latest developments in this area?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae tasglu'r Cynulliad yn gweithio gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ar y pwnc hwn. Yr ydym wedi

The First Minister: The Assembly task force is working with the Welsh Local Government Association on this issue. We

cytuno yn fras ynglŷn ag agor pyllau nofio yn rhad ac am ddim i bobl ifanc o dan 18 oed erbyn gwyliau'r haf nesaf. Mae hynny'n gam ymlaen. Mae plant mewn rhai teuluoedd yn cael blas ar nofio am ddiwrnod neu ddau yn ystod gwyliau'r haf, ond nid yw'r fam a'r tad yn gallu fforddio mynd â'r plant i nofio am weddill yr wythnos, neu am weddill gwyliau hir yr haf. Os yw'r mynediad yn rhad ac am ddim—fel ag y mae yn yr Unol Daleithiau—mae hynny'n llesol i ieuchyd plant, mae'n rhan o unrhyw strategaeth yn erbyn tlodi i blant yng Nghymru, ac mae o les o ran atal troseddu ieuencid.

Jonathan Morgan: Much has been said in the past couple of years about involving young people in decision-making. Your Government announced the establishment of young people's partnerships in Wales some time ago. However, do you share my concern that no stipulation was made that young people should be part of these partnerships?

The First Minister: A variety of arrangements exist and the management is a matter that must be determined locally. Would we be accused of being heavy handed if we said that this is the way that it must be done, or is it better to leave the matter to be determined locally, which is the same principle that you mention? It equals bringing young people in, but in the way that they choose to do it locally.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Bydd cyllid myfyrwyr yn denu sylw pobl ifanc yng nghanolbarth Cymru, cartref Prifysgol Cymru, Aberystwyth. Deallwn gan y BBC heddiw y bydd y Llywodraeth yn cyhoeddi yfory y bydd yr holl gyfrifoldeb am gyllid myfyrwyr yn cael ei drosglwyddo i'r Cynulliad. A wnech gadarnhau mai eich polisi chi yw na fydd prifysgolion Cymru yn cael yr hawl i godi ffioedd ychwanegol i'r ffi o £1,100 a godir ar hyn o bryd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Gwn ei bod yn anodd gofyn am amynedd gan unrhyw arweinydd gwrthblaid, ond gan y cyhoeddir y Papur Gwyn yfory, gwell fyddai aros tan hynny.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Mae'n rhyfedd eich bod

are broadly agreed on opening swimming pools free of charge to under 18-year-olds by the next summer holidays. That is a step forward. Children in some families might enjoy swimming for a day or two during the school holidays, but the mother and father cannot afford to take them for the rest of the week or for the duration of the long summer holidays. If access is free of charge—as it is in the United States—it is of great benefit to children's health, it is part of any anti-poverty strategy for children in Wales, and it is beneficial as regards preventing youth offending.

Jonathan Morgan: Bu llawer o sôn yn y ddwy flynedd diwethaf am gynnwys pobl ifanc mewn penderfynu. Cyhoeddodd eich Llywodraeth beth amser yn ôl y byddid yn sefydlu partneriaethau pobl ifanc yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, a ydych yn pryderu fel minnau na fynnwyd y dylai pobl ifanc fod yn rhan o'r partneriaethau hyn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae amrywiaeth o drefniadau'n bodoli ac mae'r dull o'u rheoli'n fater y mae'n rhaid penderfynu arno'n lleol. A gaem ein cyhuddo o fod yn ormesol os dywedem mai felly y dylid ei wneud, neu ai gwell gadael y mater i'w benderfynu'n lleol, sef yr un egwyddor â'r un y cyfeiriwch ati? Mae'n gyfystyr â chynnwys pobl ifanc, ond yn y modd a ddewisant yn lleol.

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Student funding will be of interest to young people in mid Wales, the home of the University of Wales, Aberystwyth. We understand from the BBC today that the Government will announce tomorrow that all responsibility for student funding will be transferred to the Assembly. Will you confirm that your policy is that the universities of Wales will not be given the right to charge top-up fees in addition to the fee of £1,100, which is charged at present?

The First Minister: I know that it is difficult to ask for patience from any opposition leader, but as the White Paper is to be published tomorrow, it would be better to wait until then.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: It is strange that you are

yn fodlon dweud wrth y BBC yr hyn nad ydych yn fodlon ei ddweud wrth Aelodau'r Cynulliad.

willing to tell the BBC what you are unwilling to tell Assembly Members.

I quote from the BBC website, which was published at 11.15 a.m. today, and clearly briefed by the Labour Government:

Dyfynnaf o wefan y BBC, a gyhoeddwyd am 11.15 a.m. heddiw, ac a gafodd ei briffio gan y Llywodraeth Lafur, mae'n amlwg:

'It means students in Wales will not have to pay the top-up fees likely to be introduced at universities in England.'

Mae'n golygu na fydd myfyrwyr yng Nghymru'n gorfod talu'r ffioedd ychwanegol sy'n debygol o gael eu cyflwyno mewn prifysgolion yn Lloegr.

Why can you not say that to the National Assembly today, when you are prepared to say it to the BBC? If it is your policy that universities in Wales will not be allowed to charge top-up fees, will you also confirm that when the responsibility for student finance is transferred, you will receive an additional £100 million from the Treasury to make up that deficit when it is introduced?

Pam na allwch ddweud hynny wrth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol heddiw, a chithau'n barod i'w ddweud wrth y BBC? Os mai'ch polisi yw na chaniateir i brifysgolion yng Nghymru godi ffioedd ychwanegol, a wnewch hefyd gadarnhau y derbyniwch £100 miliwn ychwanegol oddi wrth y Trysorlys, pan drosglwyddir y cyfrifoldeb dros gyllid myfyrwyr, i wneud iawn am y diffyg hwnnw pan gyflwynir ef?

The First Minister: There has been no briefing by this Labour Government, if you mean this Labour-led administration, Ieuan. We have not briefed the *Daily Mirror* or the BBC website. I am not in a position to answer all the other questions, but I trust that we will be when the White Paper is published tomorrow. You must exercise patience. Government must not be based on newspaper or website content. It is based on the processes of good, solid and sound administration. You always chase after press releases like a rat up a drainpipe; you should not do so. You should wait until the White Paper is published tomorrow, and your patience will be rewarded.

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni fu unrhyw friffio gan y Llywodraeth Lafur hon, os mai'r weinyddiaeth hon dan arweiniad Llafur a olygwch, Ieuan. Nid ydym wedi briffio'r *Daily Mirror* na gwefan y BBC. Nid wyf mewn sefyllfa i allu ateb yr holl gwestiynau eraill, ond hyderaf y byddwn yn gallu gwneud hynny pan gyhoeddir y Papur Gwyn yfory. Rhaid ichi fod yn amyneddgar. Ni ddylid seilio Llywodraeth ar gynnwys papurau newydd neu wefannau. Fe'i seilir ar brosesau o weinyddu da, cadarn a dibynadwy. Yr ydych bob amser yn mynd ar ôl datganiadau i'r wasg fel llygoden fawr yn dringo peipen law; ni ddylech wneud hynny. Dylech ddisgwyl tan gyhoeddi'r Papur Gwyn yfory, a gwobrwyir eich amynedd.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 5 (OAQ21645) yn ôl.

The Presiding Officer: Question 5 (OAQ21645) has been withdrawn.

2:20 p.m.

Y Diwydiant Ffermio yng Nghymru The Farming Industry in Wales

C6 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ynghylch effaith polisiau amaethyddol ei Lywodraeth ar y diwydiant ffermio yng Nghymru? (OAQ21626)

Q6 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Will the First Minister make a statement on the impact of his Government's agricultural policies on the farming industry in Wales? (OAQ21626)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi paratoi 'Ffermio i'r Dyfodol', sy'n rhoi cyfeiriad strategol clir i amaethyddiaeth am y tro cyntaf erioed yng Nghymru, a bydd yn creu diwydiant cynaliadwy sydd yn seiliedig ar y fferm deuluol, draddodiadol Gymreig. Bydd yn rhaid i'r diwydiant benderfynu sut y bydd yn addasu er mwyn wynebu her y dyfodol, gan fanteisio ar y gefnogaeth sydd ar gael gan Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'n partneriaid.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Diolch am y datganiad hwnnw ar ddyfodol amaethyddiaeth. Fodd bynnag, byddai'n dda o beth pe bai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn canolbwyntio ar y problemau sydd yn wynebu'r diwydiant ar hyn o bryd. O ran y llwyddiannau honedig, a fyddai'r Prif Weinidog yn cytuno eu bod yn enghraifft o obsesiwn y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol gyda chyhoeddusrwydd? Eu tuedd yw hawlio clod am yr hyn a gyflawnwyd gan eraill. O ystyried methiant llwyr y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog i ddelio â'r rheol 20 diwrnod, ac i dalu ffermwyr mewn pryd, a fyddai'r Prif Weinidog yn ategu'r disgrifiad a roddodd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ohono: sef, nad oes ganddo unrhyw weledigaeth, nad yw'n gallu llywodraethu ac nad oes ganddo unrhyw syniadau gwreiddiol o gwbl?

Y Prif Weinidog: Unwaith eto, mae darllen y *Daily Mirror* wedi disodli ceisio datblygu strategaeth. Os nad oes gennych gŵyn ynglŷn â'n polisiau, yr ydych yn darllen y *Daily Mirror* neu *The Western Mail* neu wefan y BBC, yn lle ceisio datblygu polisiau gwahanol. Mae'r ffaith nad ydych yn gallu cwyno am ein polisiau yn ganmoliaeth i ni. Nid ydych yn gallu meddwl am unrhyw syniadau eich hunain, felly yr ydych yn darllen y papurau ac yn ailadrodd yr hyn yr ydych yn ei ddarllen. Mae hynny'n warthus.

Mick Bates: Do you agree that young people are key to the future of rural Wales? While we accept that more can always be done, this partnership Government can be proud of Farming Connect, which is unique in offering 10 per cent more funding to assist young farmers. As the leader of the opposition rightly says, that policy was taken off the Liberal Democrat shelf.

The First Minister: The Welsh Assembly Government has prepared 'Farming for the Future', which gives a clear strategic direction to agriculture for the first time in Wales and which will create a sustainable industry based on the traditional Welsh family farm. The industry will have to decide how it will adapt to meet the challenge of the future, taking advantage of the support available from the Assembly Government and our partners.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Thank you for that statement on the future of agriculture. However, it would be more fitting if the Assembly Government focused on the problems facing the industry at present. As regards the alleged successes, would the First Minister agree that they are an example of the Liberal Democrats' obsession with publicity? They have a tendency to seek credit for the achievements of others. Given the Deputy First Minister's abject failure to deal with the 20-day rule and to pay farmers on time, would the First Minister endorse the Deputy First Minister's description of him: that he has no vision, that he cannot govern and that he does not have any original ideas whatsoever?

The First Minister: Once again, reading the *Daily Mirror* has taken the place of trying to develop a strategy. If you do not have any complaints about our policies, you read the *Daily Mirror*, *The Western Mail*, or the BBC's website instead of trying to develop alternative policies. The fact that you cannot complain about our policies does us credit. You cannot think of any ideas yourselves, so you read the newspapers and repeat what you have read. That is appalling.

Mick Bates: A ydych yn cytuno bod pobl ifanc yn allweddol i ddyfodol y Gymru wledig? Er ein bod yn derbyn y gellir gwneud rhagor bob amser, gall y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth hon ymfalchïo yn Cyswllt Ffermio, sy'n unigryw o ran y ffaith ei fod yn cynnig 10 y cant yn rhagor o gyllid i gynorthwyo ffermwyr ifanc. Fel y dywed arweinydd yr wrthblaid, cymerwyd y polisi

hwnnw oddi ar silff y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol.

The First Minister: I do not think that one should comment on that; the issue is whether or not it is a good policy. The opposition parties cannot come up with any policies at all. If the newspapers were to go on strike in this country, there would be Trappist silence from them. How many good policies can they come up with? If they do not have any policies, why do they not admit it and say that this administration is doing a damn good job for agriculture?

Peter Rogers: Another of those policies was the independent appeals panel for farmers, which has effectively collapsed under the stewardship of the Deputy First Minister. How do you intend to show leadership on this matter after your coalition colleague's damning comments last week?

The First Minister: You obviously do not have anything specific to say, Peter. Again, you have just been reading the newspapers. What is important is that dairy hygiene charges have been abolished; that we are about to, or have recently, signed the thousandth Tir Gofal agreement; that we have 600 agreements in the bag for our organic conversion scheme—and 50 per cent of those agreements are already in organic production—that there are no genetically-modified crop trials in Wales; and that the £450-million worth rural development plan is now operational. I assume that you are impressed with those achievements, Peter, because you did not mention them in your question and did not have anything to contribute.

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni chredaf y dylid gwneud sylw am hynny; y peth pwysig yw a ydyw'n bolisi da ai peidio. Ni all y gwrthbleidiau feddwl am unrhyw bolisiau o gwbl. Pe bai'r papurau newydd yn mynd ar streic yn y wlad hon, byddent yn ddistaw fel Trapyddion. Pa sawl polisi da y gallant feddwl amdano? Os nad oes ganddynt unrhyw bolisiau, pam na chyfaddefant hynny a dweud bod y weinyddiaeth hon yn gwneud gwaith da gynddeiriog dros amaethyddiaeth?

Peter Rogers: Un arall o'r polisiau hynny oedd y panel apelau annibynnol i ffermwyr, sydd wedi methu i bob pwrpas o dan stiwardiaeth y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog. Sut yr ydych yn bwriadu dangos arweiniad ar y mater hwn ar ôl y sylwadau damniol gan eich cyd-aelod o'r glymblaid yr wythnos diwethaf?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'n amlwg nad oes gennych ddim penodol i'w ddweud, Peter. Unwaith eto, y cwbl a wnaethoch oedd darllen y papurau newydd. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw bod y taliadau hylendid llaeth wedi'u dileu; ein bod ar fin llofnodi'r milfed cytundeb Tir Gofal, neu ein bod newydd wneud hynny; bod gennym 600 o gytundebau ar gyfer ein cynllun trawsnewid organig—ac mae cynhyrchu organig yn digwydd o dan 50 y cant o'r cytundebau hynny'n barod—nad oes rhagbrofion ar gnydau a addaswyd yn enetig yng Nghymru; a bod y cynllun datblygu gwledig gwerth £450 miliwn ar waith bellach. Cymeraf fod y cyflawniadau hynny wedi gwneud argraff arnoch, Peter, oherwydd ni soniasoch amdanynt yn eich cwestiwn ac nid oedd gennych ddim i'w gyfrannu.

Adfywio Economi Sir Benfro Regenerating the Economy of Pembrokeshire

C7 Cynog Dafis: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar weithredoedd y Llywodraeth i adfywio economi Sir Benfro? (OAQ21629)

Q7 Cynog Dafis: Will the First Minister make a statement on steps taken by the Government to regenerate the economy of Pembrokeshire? (OAQ21629)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd yn arwain ymgyrch Tîm Cymru i ddatblygu strategaeth ar gyfer

The First Minister: The Minister for Economic Development is leading the Team Wales effort to develop a strategy for south

de Ceredigion a gogledd Sir Benfro ar y cyd ag awdurdodau lleol. Cyfarfu'r Gweinidog â chynrychiolwyr lleol ym mis Tachwedd ac, ers hynny, cynhaliwyd dau gyfarfod gydag uwch swyddogion er mwyn darganfod maint y broblem, ffurfio gweledigaeth glir ar gyfer y dyfodol a phennu camau ymarferol er mwyn cyflawni'r weledigaeth honno. Caiff cynlluniau gweithredu ar gyfer adfwyio'r ddwy ardal eu cyhoeddi fis nesaf.

Cynog Dafis: Ni wn a all y Prif Weinidog ddweud wrthym pryd fis nesaf y cyhoeddir y cynlluniau hynny, ond edrychwn ymlaen at eu gweld, yn enwedig yng ngoleuni addewid y Prif Weinidog y byddai miliynau o bunnoedd ar gael ar gyfer adfywio economi Abergwaun yn enwedig. A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn cytuno y byddai uwchraddio amgylchedd adeiledig y dref, a datrys y problemau traffig sydd yno, yn gyfraniad pwysig i ddatblygu potensial Abergwaun o ran datblygu economaidd, a bod hynny'n teilyngu buddsoddiad? A wnaiff gadarnhau bod yr opsiynau hynny yn dal i sefyll?

Y Prif Weinidog: Credaf i Cynog a minnau ffraeo ynghylch pwysigrwydd mesurau felly i adfywio economaidd o'r blaen. Disgrifiais y rhestr o brosiectau yr oeddech wedi eu henwi fel rhestr siopa nad oedd yn ffurfio strategaeth economaidd, er y gall manteision ddeillio o fuddsoddiadau mewn trafndiaeth. Y flaenoriaeth yw creu swyddi. Rhaid ystyried beth yw'r prosiectau a fydd yn denu'r sector preifat i greu swyddi yn lle'r rhai a gollwyd yn Dewhirst. Nid wyf wedi anobeithio'n llwyr ynghylch cael buddsoddwyr i fuddsoddi yn y ffatrioedd yng Ngwdig ac Aberteifi.

Alun Cairns: Onid yw'n bryd i'r Llywodraeth, ac i'r Prif Weinidog yn arbennig, roi yr un flaenoriaeth i orllewin Cymru ag i dde-ddwyrain Cymru? Mae'n amlwg bod rhyw fath o gynllun gan y Prif Weinidog i'w gyflwyno yn yr wythnosau cyn yr etholiad. Oni ddylid bod wedi cyflwyno'r cynllun hwn fisoedd neu hyd yn oed flynyddoedd yn ôl oherwydd y llanastr economaidd sydd yng ngorllewin Cymru? A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog gadarnhau y caiff de-orllewin Cymru yr un fath o adnoddau ag a gafodd y de-ddwyrain yn sgîl colli swyddi yn

Ceredigion and north Pembrokeshire jointly with the local authorities. In November, the Minister met local representatives, and, since then, two meetings have been held with senior officials to identify the scale of the problem, to form a clear vision for the future and to decide on practical steps to ensure that that vision is realised. Action plans for the regeneration of both areas will be published next month.

Cynog Dafis: I do not know whether or not the First Minister can tell us when next month those plans will be published, but we look forward to seeing them, particularly in the light of the First Minister's pledge that millions of pounds will be available to regenerate Fishguard's economy in particular. Does the First Minister agree that upgrading the town's built environment and solving its traffic problems would make an important contribution to developing Fishguard's potential for economic development and that it merits investment? Will he confirm that all those options remain open?

The First Minister: I believe that Cynog and I have argued before about the importance of such measures for economic regeneration. I described the list of projects that he named as a shopping list that did not add up to an economic strategy, although investment in transport may lead to advantages. The priority is job creation. We must consider which projects will attract the private sector to create jobs in place of those lost at Dewhirst. I have not given up hope that investors may be found to invest in the factories in Goodwick and Cardigan.

Alun Cairns: Is it not time that the Government, and the First Minister in particular, gave the same priority to west Wales as it gives to south-east Wales? It is obvious that the First Minister has some sort of plan to unveil in the weeks leading up to the election. Should that not have been presented months, if not years, ago, given the economic mess in west Wales? Will the First Minister confirm that south-west Wales will receive resources comparable to those made available to the south-east following job losses in the steel industry?

y diwydiant dur?

Y Prif Weinidog: Clywais Alun Cairns yn ailadrodd y chwedl hon droeon yn y gred—yn debyg i Josef Goebbels cyn y rhyfel—os ailadroddwch rywbeth ganwaith, rywsut y mae'n troi'n wirionedd. Os ystyriwch y ffeithiau, mae'r flaenoriaeth yr un yn y Ddeddwyrain ag yn y Gorllewin. Mae'n bosibl sicrhau swyddi newydd drwy'r modd confensiynol o geisio dod o hyd i fuddsoddwyr newydd i brynu Dewhurst, fel y disgwyliwn ei wneud. Nid yw hynny angen yr un flaenoriaeth â chreu strategaeth newydd, fel y bu'n rhaid ei llunio yn achos Corus. Mae'r sefyllfa yn y Gorllewin yn debyg i sefyllfa Allied Steel and Wire; gan ein bod yn disgwyl i gwmni arall ei brynu—ac yr wyf yn sicrhau eich bod yn croesawu bod Celsa wedi prynu asedau ASW oddi wrth y derbynnydd—felly nid oedd angen yr un strategaeth ar ASW ag ar Lynebwy a Chasnewydd yn sgîl colli swyddi Corus. Mae'r flaenoriaeth yr un os yw'r amgylchiadau yr un, fel y gwelir yn neddwyrain Cymru yn achos ASW yng Nghaerdydd ac yng ngorllewin Cymru gyda Dewhurst.

Elin Jones: Nid wyf yn gofyn y cwestiwn hwn am fy mod wedi darllen y *Daily Mirror* neu *The Western Mail*, ond am imi ddarllen adroddiad swyddogol a osododd eich Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd yn Llyfrgell y Cynulliad. Dywed yr adroddiad hwnnw mai dim ond 44.2 o swyddi a grewyd hyd yn hyn drwy arian Amcan 1. Mae'n debyg eich bod erbyn hyn yn honni bod y ffigurau swyddogol hyn yn anghywir. Os felly, pam wnaeth y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd osod adroddiad gwallus yn y Llyfrgell? Sut y bu ichi greu ffigur newydd o 6,000 o swyddi? Ai ffigur dychmygol ydyw i gael Andrew Davies allan o dwll? Nid oes gan eich e-Weinidog lawer o hygredded gan iddo feio ei anallu cyfrifiadurol am y gwall.

Y Prif Weinidog: Enwyd 700 o brosiectau yn yr adroddiad, ac y mae dros 1,000 o dudalennau. Deallaf fod tri gwall ynddo: dylai'r colofn sydd yn nodi faint o swyddi sydd wedi eu creu, fod wedi aros yn wag, gan nad yw'r ffigurau ar gael tan fis Chwefror. Yn lle hynny, cynhwyswyd ffigurau tri allan

The First Minister: I have heard Alun Cairns recite this myth time and again in the belief—like Josef Goebbels before the war—that if you say something often enough it somehow becomes true. If you consider the facts, the priority is the same in south-east Wales as in west Wales. It is possible to secure new jobs by the conventional means of attempting to find a new investor to buy Dewhurst, as we expect to do. That does not require the same priority as creating a new strategy, which had to be done in the case of Corus. The situation in west Wales is similar to that at Allied Steel and Wire; since we are expecting another company to buy it—and I am sure that you welcome Celsa's decision to buy ASW's assets from the receiver—the situation at ASW did not necessitate the kind of strategy required in Ebbw Vale and Newport as a result of the Corus job losses. The priority is the same if the circumstances are the same, as can be seen in south-east Wales in the case of ASW in Cardiff, and in west Wales with Dewhurst.

Elin Jones: I do not ask this question because I have read the *Daily Mirror* or *The Western Mail*, but because I have read an official report that your Minister for Economic Development placed in the Assembly Library. That report states that only 44.2 jobs have thus far been created through Objective 1 funding. It seems that you are now claiming that these official figures are incorrect. If so, why did the Minister for Economic Development place an inaccurate report in the Library? How did you come by the new figure of 6,000 jobs? Is it an imaginary figure to get Andrew Davies out of a hole? Your e-Minister does not have much credibility since he has blamed his incompetence with computers for the error.

The First Minister: The report names 700 projects and is over 1,000 pages long. I understand that it contains three errors: the column that notes how many jobs have been created should have remained empty, as the figures are not available until February. Instead, figures for three out of the 700

o'r 700 o brosiectau heb i neb sylwi. Ni chredaf, Elin, eich bod yn meddwl mai 44 yw'r ffigur cywir. Pam y bu ichi roi'r ffigur hwnnw gyda'ch awdurdod i *The Western Mail*? Pam yr obsesiwn hwn gyda'r wasg? Ewch at y BBC neu *The Western Mail* bob tro yn syth er mwyn niweidio Amcan 1. Ni chredaf i chi feddwl am eiliad bod y ffigur yn iawn. Pam rhoi eich awdurdod chi yn lle ysgrifennu llythyr at John Clarke neu at Andrew Davies er mwyn egluro'r broblem? Yr oedd yn bosibl ichi weld bod y golofn yn wag heblaw am dri allan o 700 o brosiectau. Mae'r ffigurau sydd gennym yn dangos bod 6,000 o swyddi wedi eu creu yn barod a 7,000 wedi eu diogelu. Dyna'r ffigurau a gyfrifwyd drwy law a byddant mewn colofn fydd yn cynnwys rhestr gyflawn erbyn i'r adroddiad chwarterol nesaf ymddangos ym mis Chwefror.

projects were inadvertently included. I do not believe, Elin, that you believed 44 to be the correct figure. Why did you give that figure with your authority to *The Western Mail*? Why this obsession with the press? You always go straight to the BBC or *The Western Mail* in order to damage Objective 1. I do not believe that you thought for one moment that the figure was correct. Why did you give your authority instead of writing a letter to John Clarke or Andrew Davies to clarify the problem? You could see that the column was empty apart from three out of the 700 projects. The figures that we have show that 6,000 jobs have been created and a further 7,000 have been safeguarded. Those are the figures that were counted by hand and they will appear in a column containing the full list in the next quarterly report that will appear in February.

2:30 p.m.

Rheoleiddio Tân Gwyllt Regulation of Fireworks

Q8 Janice Gregory: What discussions has the First Minister had with the UK Government regarding the regulation of fireworks? (OAQ21625)

C8 Janice Gregory: Pa drafodaethau y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi'u cynnal â Llywodraeth y DU ynghylch rheoleiddio tân gwyllt? (OAQ21625)

The First Minister: It is better to discuss fireworks than Plaid Cymru's damp squibs. The Department of Trade and Industry is discussing with other Government departments how it can address the issue of firework nuisance. In October, the Parliamentary Under-Secretary of State for Competition, Consumers and Markets, Melanie Johnson, announced tougher measures to curb firework nuisance and to reduce injuries. In Westminster, the all-party parliamentary group on fireworks is monitoring the progress of the Private Member's Bill on fireworks that is currently before Parliament.

Y Prif Weinidog: Gwell trafod tân gwyllt na matsis gwlyb Plaid Cymru. Mae'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant yn trafod gydag adrannau Llywodraeth eraill sut y gall ymdrin â mater niwsans tân gwyllt. Ym mis Hydref, gwnaeth yr Is-Ysgrifennydd Seneddol dros Gystadleuaeth, Defnyddwyr a Marchnadoedd, Melanie Johnson, gyhoeddi mesurau llymach i gyfyngu ar niwsans tân gwyllt ac i ostwng nifer yr anafiadau. Yn San Steffan, mae'r grŵp seneddol trawsbleidiol ar dân gwyllt yn cadw golwg ar hynt y Mesur Aelod Preifat ar dân gwyllt sydd gerbron y Senedd ar hyn o bryd.

Janice Gregory: I am not a spoilsport, but fireworks are being increasingly abused throughout Wales. Are you aware that a petition organised by my colleague in Parliament, Huw Irranca-Davies MP, calling for stricter controls on fireworks, has attracted over 16,000 signatures, some 5,000 of which come from our constituency? I am

Janice Gregory: Nid wyf am ddifetha hwyl neb, ond mae tân gwyllt yn cael ei gamddefnyddio fwyfwy ledled Cymru. A ydych yn ymwybodol bod deiseb a drefnwyd gan fy nghyd-aelod yn y Senedd, Huw Irranca-Davies AS, sy'n galw am reolaethau caethach ar dân gwyllt, wedi'i harwyddo gan 16,000 o bobl, y mae tua 5,000 ohonynt yn

grateful to the Members who have signed my statement of opinion and I remind those who have not that they still have time to do so. Will you discuss this issue in your next meeting with the Secretary of State for Wales and press the case for the UK Government to take positive action to solve this increasing problem?

The First Minister: I will, because we can make a contribution on two issues here. North Wales Police is one of the four authorities piloting a scheme from 2 September 2002 whereby fixed penalty notices of £40 are given to people aged over 18 who are caught throwing fireworks in the street. When it has had a chance to assess how much assistance that was in the period around 5 November, that will be of use to us all. The voluntary ban on the sale of air bombs to the public—a particularly cheap, within-reach-of-pocket-money firework, which caused a fifth of all firework accidents in 2001—came into effect on 1 January 2003. Subject to consultation, the DTI intends introducing regulations, under the Consumer Protection Act 1987, to enforce the ban. I will undertake to discuss this matter further with the Secretary of State for Wales.

David Lloyd: A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn cefnogi'r alwad gynyddol i gyfyngu ar werthiant tân gwyllt i'r rhai sy'n trefnu digwyddiadau cyhoeddus, swyddogol yn unig?

Y Prif Weinidog: Y mae hynny'n croesi'r ffin rhwng amddiffyn y cyhoedd—yn enwedig plant, a llygaid ac yn y blaen—a mynd yn wladwriaeth warchodol a gwladwriaeth *Big Brother*. Gallai hynny arwain at gyhuddiadau o ormod o reoliadau. Nid wyf yn sicr ynglŷn â'r mater, ond gwnaf ei ystyried ac efallai yr ysgrifennaf at Dai Lloyd cyn bo hir.

David Davies: Do you agree that there is possibly a third way that would please all parties? A licensing system could be established that would allow responsible individuals, such as youth group leaders, to organise firework displays, while preventing

hanu o'n hetholaeth ni? Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Aelodau a arwyddodd fy natganiad barn ac yr wyf yn atgoffa'r rhai sydd heb wneud fod digon o amser i wneud hynny o hyd. A wnewch drafod y mater hwn yn eich cyfarfod nesaf ag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru a chymhell Llywodraeth y DU i gymryd camau cadarnhaol i ddatrys y broblem gynyddol hon?

Y Prif Weinidog: Gwnaf, oherwydd gallwn gyfrannu at ddau fater yn hyn o beth. Heddlu Gogledd Cymru yw un o'r pedwar awdurdod sy'n rhagbrofi cynllun ers 2 Medi 2002 sy'n eu galluogi i gyflwyno hysbysiadau o gosb benodol o £40 i bobl dros 18 oed a gaiff eu dal yn taflu tân gwyllt ar y stryd. Wedi iddo gael cyfle i asesu faint o gymorth yr oedd hynny yn y cyfnod o gwmpas 5 Tachwedd, bydd hynny'n ddefnyddiol i ni i gyd. Daeth y gwaharddiad gwirfoddol ar werthu bomiau awyr i'r cyhoedd—tân gwyllt arbennig o rad y gellir ei fforddio ag arian poced, a achosodd un rhan o bump o'r holl ddamweiniau tân gwyllt yn 2001—i rym ar 1 Ionawr 2003. Yn amodol ar yr ymgynghori, mae'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant yn bwriadu cyflwyno rheoliadau, o dan Ddeddf Diogelu Defnyddwyr 1987, i orfodi'r gwaharddiad. Ymgymeraf i drafod y mater hwn ymhellach gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru.

David Lloyd: Does the First Minister support the increasing demand to limit the sale of fireworks to those organising public, official events only?

The First Minister: That crosses the boundary between protecting the public—especially children, and eyes and so forth—and becoming a nanny or *Big Brother* state. It could lead to allegations of excessive regulation. I am not certain about the matter, but I will consider it and perhaps I will write to Dai Lloyd in the near future.

David Davies: A ydych yn cytuno bod trydedd ffordd o bosibl a allai fodloni pawb sy'n gysylltiedig? Gellid sefydlu system drwyddedu a fyddai'n caniatáu i unigolion cyfrifol, fel arweinyddion grwpiau ieuencid, drefnu arddangosfeydd tân gwyllt, ac yn atal

fireworks from being sold to youths, who use them irresponsibly to terrorise the neighbourhood.

The First Minister: Absolutely. There is a voluntary code of practice. The DTI has stated that it does not have the powers, and does not yet wish to seek the powers, to turn the voluntary code of practice into a full-scale law, thus banning the sale of fireworks to the public. I agree with the objective that you have outlined and I think that most people in the Assembly would agree that it would be desirable if all fireworks were seen in organised displays, run by qualified people. The DTI is discussing with other Government departments how it can address the issue of firework nuisance. However, so far, it has rejected the idea of bringing the voluntary code within a statutory framework.

gwerthu tân gwyllt i lanciau, sy'n eu defnyddio'n anghyfrifol i godi braw ar y gymdogaeth.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn hollol. Mae cod ymarfer gwirfoddol. Mae'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant wedi dweud nad yw'n meddu ar bwerau, ac nid yw'n dymuno ceisio pwerau o'r fath eto, i droi'r cod ymarfer gwirfoddol yn ddeddf lawn, gan wahardd gwerthu tân gwyllt i'r cyhoedd. Cytunaf â'r amcan yr ydych wedi'i ddisgrifio a chredaf y byddai'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yn y Cynulliad yn cytuno mai dymunol fyddai gwylio pob tân gwyllt mewn arddangosfeydd trefnedig, sy'n cael eu rhedeg gan bobl gymwysedig. Mae'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant yn trafod gydag adrannau Llywodraeth eraill sut y gall ymdrin â mater niwsans tân gwyllt. Fodd bynnag, hyd yn hyn, mae wedi gwrthod y syniad o roi'r cod gwirfoddol mewn fframwaith statudol.

Camddefnyddio Cyffuriau a Throsedd yng Nghymru Drug Abuse and Crime in Wales

Q9 Peter Rogers: Will the First Minister make a statement on the rising instance of drug abuse and crime in Wales? (OAQ21646)

The First Minister: There is no disputing the link between drugs and crime. Some chief constables give a figure as high as 80 per cent for the link between drugs and crime, although it is not necessarily a causative link. Police forces in Wales have a policy of rigorous enforcement regarding drug-related crime. They are committing considerable resources to operations to tackle drug-related crime, focusing on convicting major drug dealers. The police are tough on those dealing in drugs, but they encourage those with substance misuse problems to seek rehabilitation. We are supporting the three police forces in south and mid Wales in terms of Operation Tarian. North Wales Police has not wished to become a member of Operation Tarian as yet, but I think it is getting close to the point of wanting to be put on the same basis as the other three forces in Wales.

C9 Peter Rogers: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ynghylch y cynnydd yn nifer yr achosion o gamddefnyddio cyffuriau a throsedd yng Nghymru? (OAQ21646)

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni ellir amau nad oes cysylltiad rhwng cyffuriau a throsedd. Mae rhai prif gwnstabiliaid yn rhoi ffigur cyfuwch â 80 y cant ar gyfer y cysylltiad rhwng cyffuriau a throsedd, er nad yw o reidrwydd yn gysylltiad achosol. Mae gan heddluoedd yng Nghymru bolisi o orfodi trwyadl ynghylch trosedd sy'n gysylltiedig â chyffuriau. Maent yn neilltuo adnoddau sylweddol at weithrediadau i fynd i'r afael â throsedd sy'n gysylltiedig â chyffuriau, gan ganolbwyntio ar gael euogfarnau yn erbyn y prif werthwyr cyffuriau. Mae'r heddlu'n llym ar y sawl sy'n gwerthu cyffuriau, ond maent yn annog y rhai sydd â phroblemau camddefnyddio sylweddau i geisio cael eu hailsefydlu. Yr ydym yn cynorthwyo'r tri heddlu yn y De a'r Canolbarth yng nghydestun Ymgyrch Tarian. Nid yw Heddlu Gogledd Cymru wedi dymuno dod yn aelod o Ymgyrch Tarian hyd yn hyn, ond credaf ei fod yn dynesu at ddymuno cael ei roi ar yr un sylfaen â'r tri heddlu arall yng Nghymru.

Peter Rogers: Will you join me in congratulating the police on their initiatives to tackle this problem, particularly those for young people? For example, there is an initiative, called 'get hooked on fishing', which began in England and to which there has been an overwhelming response by young people across the country. Demand far exceeds the places available. It has given children the opportunity to go into the country and to realise its benefits. The latest initiative involves children taking part in rural pursuits and, in particular, the possibility of taking children out hunting with dogs in the countryside, so that they can get fresh air and mix, is being considered. Do you agree that we could support that initiative?

The First Minister: I agreed with you up to a certain point, but I would be inclined to choose different healthy, outdoor, challenging and adventurous activities. Special Communities First police squads try to find diversions for young people so that they do not get their kicks from drug or solvent abuse or binge drinking. The activities provided for young people might include scrambler-bike riding, mountain biking, skate boarding, good, old-fashioned five-a-side football, or rugby. It does not matter what activity the teenagers take part in as long as they and the police come to an agreement as to what will give them their kicks. They can then take part, commit themselves and have a stake in the project. There are many examples of best practice throughout Wales with regard to this and I witnessed many of them last week.

John Griffiths: Do you agree that when considering drug abuse and crime we should not lose sight of the problems that legal drugs, such as alcohol, present, especially in terms of young people binge drinking and becoming involved in violent crime? Many people, including myself, believe that we need to tackle the culture of hard drinking in Wales and the problems of violent crime that that far too often creates.

The First Minister: We are discussing two

Peter Rogers: A wnewch ymuno â mi i longyfarch yr heddlu ar ei fentrau i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon, yn enwedig ar gyfer pobl ifanc? Er enghraifft, mae menter, o'r enw 'get hooked on fishing', a gychwynnodd yn Lloegr ac y bu ymateb ysgubol iddi ymysg pobl ifanc ledled y wlad. Mae'r galw'n fwy o lawer na'r lleoedd sydd ar gael. Mae wedi rhoi cyfle i blant fynd i'r wlad a sylweddoli ei manteision. Yn y fenter ddiweddaraf mae plant yn cymryd rhan mewn gweithgareddau gwledig ac, yn benodol, ystyrir y posibilrwydd o fynd â phlant i hela gyda chŵn yng nghefn gwlad, fel y gallant gael awyr iach a chymysgu. A ydych yn cytuno y gallem gefnogi'r fenter honno?

Y Prif Weinidog: Cytunaf â chi i ryw raddau, ond byddwn yn dueddol o ddewis gweithgareddau iach, ymestynnol ac anturus eraill yn yr awyr agored. Mae carfanau heddlu Cymunedau yn Gyntaf arbennig yn ceisio dod o hyd i ddifyrrwch i bobl ifanc fel nad ydynt yn cael gwefr o gamddefnyddio cyffuriau neu doddyddion neu sesiynau yfed. Ymhlith y gweithgareddau y gellid eu darparu ar gyfer pobl ifanc y mae mynd ar gefn beiciau sgrialu, beicio mynydd, mynd ar sgrialfyrddau, pêl droed pump bob ochr da hen-ffasiwn, neu rygbi. Nid yw o bwys pa weithgaredd y mae'r rhai yn eu harddegau'n cymryd rhan ynddo cyhyd â'u bod hwy a'r heddlu'n dod i gytundeb ar yr hyn a fydd yn rhoi gwefr iddynt. Gallant wedyn gymryd rhan, ymrwymo a bod â rhan yn y prosiect. Mae llawer o enghreifftiau o arfer da yn hyn o beth ledled Cymru a gwelais lawer ohonynt yr wythnos diwethaf.

John Griffiths: A ydych yn cytuno na ddylem golli golwg, wrth ystyried camddefnyddio cyffuriau a throsedd, ar y problemau a achosir gan gyffuriau cyfreithlon, fel alcohol, yn enwedig yng nghyd-destun pobl ifanc sy'n cael sesiynau yfed ac yn cymryd rhan mewn troseddau treisiol? Mae llawer o bobl, a minnau yn eu plith, yn credu bod angen inni fynd i'r afael â'r diwylliant o yfed trwm yng Nghymru a'r problemau o ran trosedd dreisiol y mae hynny'n eu creu'n rhy aml o lawer.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym yn trafod dau

different types of violent crime. Hard drinking tends to lead to a well-established pattern in Wales on Friday and Saturday nights of people becoming involved in fights after pubs and clubs close. Arguments over who booked a taxi first and so on are used as excuses to start a fight so that people can get rid of the excess testosterone that seems to result from drinking 10 pints. That is one type of violent crime. Drug-related violent crime is frequently gang related and involves drive-by shootings. Operation Tarian was established to try to prevent the type of drive-by shootings and gang-related turf war episodes that have occurred in Birmingham, Bristol and Liverpool and to ensure that they do not cross the border into Wales. We are co-operating closely with the police to ensure that that poison does not enter Wales.

Janet Ryder: Police operations such as Operation Tarian, which you have described, are necessary to tackle drugs. However, there are other initiatives in Wales that we can pursue that will be equally valuable in the war against drugs, namely the development of detox and rehabilitation facilities. How many detox beds are there in Wales today and where are they located?

The First Minister: I cannot give you the figures now, but I will write to you on that issue. However, the £18 million that Edwina Hart recently announced for the drug and alcohol teams can fund 1,000 anti-alcohol or anti-drug detox treatment episodes throughout Wales. North Wales has better facilities than south Wales for such treatment at present through the superb initiatives of Cyngor Alcohol Information Services in Wrexham and Colwyn Bay. You, Alun Pugh and I have seen those at various times. Treatment is important because most alcoholics and many drug addicts have a time in their lives when a window opens and they realise that they will be dead within a year if they carry on as they are. It is then that they must have treatment. That treatment has not been available thus far, but will be from April.

fath o drosedd treisiol. Mae yfed trwm yn tueddu i arwain at batrwm sefydledig yng Nghymru ar nos Wener a nos Sadwrn lle y mae pobl yn cymryd rhan mewn ysgarmesoedd wedi i dafarnau a chlybiau gau. Defnyddir dadleuon ynghylch pwy a alwodd darsi'n gyntaf ac yn y blaen yn esgus i ddechrau ymladd fel bod pobl yn gallu cael gwared â'r gormodedd o destosteron a geir yn sgîl yfed 10 pint, yn ôl pob golwg. Dyna un math o drosedd treisiol. Mae trosedd dreisiol sy'n gysylltiedig â chyffuriau'n ymwneud yn aml â gangiau ac yn golygu saethu wrth yrru heibio. Sefydlwyd Ymgyrch Tarian i geisio atal o math o saethu wrth yrru heibio a digwyddiadau o ryfela tiriogaethol sy'n gysylltiedig â gangiau a fu yn Birmingham, Bryste a Lerpwl ac i sicrhau nad ydynt yn croesi'r ffin i Gymru. Yr ydym yn cydweithredu'n agos â'r heddlu i sicrhau na ddaw'r gwenwyn hwnnw i Gymru.

Janet Ryder: Mae gweithrediadau gan yr heddlu megis Ymgyrch Tarian, a ddisgrifiwyd gennych, yn angenrheidiol i ymladd cyffuriau. Fodd bynnag, mae mentrau eraill yng Nghymru y gallwn ymwneud â hwy a fydd yr un mor werthfawr yn y rhyfel yn erbyn cyffuriau, sef datblygu cyfleusterau dadwenwyno ac ailsefydlu. Faint o welyau dadwenwyno sydd yng Nghymru heddiw ac ym mhle y maent?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni allaf roi'r ffigurau ichi'n awr, ond ysgrifennaf atoch ar y mater hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, mae'r £18 miliwn a gyhoeddodd Edwina Hart yn ddiweddar ar gyfer y timau alcohol a chyffuriau'n gallu ariannu 1,000 o episodau triniaeth ddadwenwyno gwrth-alcohol neu wrth-gyffuriau ledled Cymru. Mae cyfleusterau gwell yn y Gogledd nag yn y De ar gyfer triniaeth o'r fath ar hyn o bryd drwy fentrau rhagorol gwasanaeth gwybodaeth Cyngor Alcohol Information Services yn Wrecsam a Bae Colwyn. Yr ydych chi, Alun Pugh a minnau wedi'u gweld ar wahanol adegau. Mae triniaeth yn bwysig oherwydd mae adeg ym mywyd y rhan fwyaf o alcoholigion a llawer sy'n gaeth i gyffuriau pan fo ffenestr yn agor a hwythau'n sylweddoli y byddant yn farw ymhen blwyddyn os ânt ymlaen fel y buont. Dyna pryd y mae'n rhaid eu trin. Ni fu'r driniaeth honno ar gael hyd yn hyn, ond bydd ar gael o Ebrill ymlaen.

Peter Black: Do you share the concern of many chief constables that the resources that they need to fight drug abuse and crime will be severely curtailed by the Home Office settlement and the changes in the funding formula for police authorities? What representations will the Government make to resolve that problem?

2:40 p.m.

The First Minister: This argument always occurs at this time of year between the Home Office, individual chief constables, and police authorities. A great deal of publicity always coincides with the shadow boxing that takes place during the period immediately before the settlement is announced. We are involved because much of the funding comes through the local government rate support grant settlement; there are also crime fighting fund and crime reduction partnership fund aspects to be considered. In general, our record stands good comparison, and many police forces have enjoyed the experience of working with the Assembly Government over the past few years.

Peter Black: A ydych yn rhannu pryder llawer prif gwnstabl y bydd yr adnoddau y mae arnynt eu hangen i ymladd camddefnyddio cyffuriau a throedd yn cael eu cwtdogi'n llym drwy setliad y Swyddfa Gartref a'r newidiadau i'r fformiwla ariannu ar gyfer awdurdodau heddlu? Pa sylwadau y bydd y Llywodraeth yn eu cyflwyno i ddatrys y broblem honno?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r ddadl hon yn codi bob tro yr adeg hon o'r flwyddyn rhwng y Swyddfa Gartref, prif gwnstabliaid unigol, ac awdurdodau heddlu. Ceir llawer iawn o gyhoeddusrwydd ar yr un pryd â'r esgus paffio sy'n digwydd yn ystod y cyfnod yn union cyn cyhoeddi'r setliad. Yr ydym ni'n gysylltiedig gan fod llawer o'r cyllid yn dod drwy setliad y grant cynnal trethi ar gyfer llywodraeth leol; mae agweddau i'w hystyried o ran y gronfa ymladd trosedd a'r gronfa gostwng troseddu hefyd. At ei gilydd, mae ein record yn cymharu'n dda, ac mae llawer o heddluoedd wedi mwynhau'r profiad o weithio gyda Llywodraeth y Cynulliad dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf.

Llywodraeth y Glymblaid The Coalition Government

Q10 Helen Mary Jones: Will the First Minister make a statement on any future plans for his coalition Government? (OAQ21630)

The First Minister: I do not intend to endorse the suggestions made by Adam Price in *Tribune* recently. We intend to continue with all the important tasks of governing Wales through to the election of a new National Assembly in May 2003. I will mention some of the initiatives that are '*ar y gweill*', as we say in Welsh—on the knitting needles, or underway—including the palliative care strategy, which was announced last week. Within the next six weeks we will provide the Government's response to the outline business case for the north Wales clinical school, which will ensure that more doctors are available in north Wales, and in the rest of Wales. We will then move on to the next stage, with regard to graduate entry

C10 Helen Mary Jones: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ynghylch unrhyw gynlluniau ar gyfer y dyfodol o ran ei Lywodraeth glymblaid? (OAQ21630)

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn bwriadu cymeradwyo'r awgrymiadau gan Adam Price yn *Tribune* yn ddiweddar. Bwriadwn barhau â'r holl dasgau pwysig o lywodraethu Cymru hyd at ethol Cynulliad Cenedlaethol newydd ym Mai 2003. Gwnaf sôn am rai o'r mentrau sydd ar y gweill gan gynnwys y strategaeth gofal lliniarol, a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos diwethaf. O fewn y chwe wythnos nesaf, rhoddwn ymateb y Llywodraeth i'r achos busnes amlinellol ar gyfer ysgol glinigol y Gogledd, a fydd yn sicrhau bod rhagor o feddygon ar gael yn y Gogledd, ac yng ngweddill Cymru. Wedyn symudwn ymlaen at y cam nesaf, ynghylch derbyn graddedigion yn Abertawe ac yn ysgol glinigol Gwent. Bydd llawer o fentrau

at Swansea and the Gwent clinical school. Many other exciting initiatives will come to fruition in health and in other fields over the next few weeks.

Helen Mary Jones: I do not know about knitting needles, but we have certainly seen a lot of prickliness. Given your avowed aim of sweeping the Liberal Democrats out of the National Assembly, and your deputy's published opinion that you are unfit to govern and that you live in cloud-cuckoo-land—I do not know how he can take a salary from you—has the time not come to dismantle this grubby, venal, self-serving little coalition, and give Wales honest Government for the last few months of this Assembly?

The First Minister: Adam Price plays a part in the honest Government for which you are looking, although I cannot work out how that can be when he is a Member of Parliament. According to the *Tribune* article, Plaid Cymru has given up hope of forming a majority Government. However, whether we have majority Government or coalition Government is down to the people of Wales. They will give their verdict on 1 May; I am confident about the outcome.

Kirsty Williams: Do you agree that the coalition Government has brought stability to this institution? Do you also agree that the ability of our two parties to come together to work on behalf of the people of Wales is in stark contrast to the failure of the Conservative Party, which has ruled out working with anybody in this institution, and Plaid Cymru—with the exception of Adam Price—which has admitted that it cannot form a majority administration, and is not willing to work with anybody else?

The First Minister: You have your views about that; I am not sure about your comments on the Conservatives—I do not believe that anybody else would work with them, so there is no point in them putting themselves forward as partners. I would not say that they are the lepers of Welsh political society, but they have struggled in gaining the confidence of the people of Wales since the secret ballot was introduced around 140 years ago. Other parties may want to take

cyffrous eraill yn dwyn ffrwyth mewn iechyd ac mewn meysydd eraill dros yr wythnosau nesaf.

Helen Mary Jones: Nid wyf yn gwybod dim am weill, ond yr ydym wedi gweld llawer o bigogrwydd yn sicr. Gan eich bod wedi addef mai'ch nod yw ysgubo'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol o'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ac yng ngolwg barn gyhoeddedig eich dirprwy eich bod yn anaddas i lywodraethu a'ch bod yn byw ym myd dychmygion—nid wyf yn gwybod sut y gall gymryd cyflog gennych—oni ddaeth yn bryd datgymalu'r glymblaid fach aflan, anonest a hunangeisiol hon a rhoi Llywodraeth onest i Gymru ym misoedd olaf y Cynulliad hwn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae Adam Price yn chwarae rhan yn y Llywodraeth onest a geisiwch, er na allaf ddeall sut y gall hynny fod ac yntau'n Aelod Seneddol. Yn ôl yr erthygl yn *Tribune*, mae Plaid Cymru wedi anobeithio am ffurfio Llywodraeth fwyafrifol. Fodd bynnag, mater i bobl Cymru yw a gawn Lywodraeth fwyafrifol neu Lywodraeth glymblaid. Rhoddant eu dyfarniad ar 1 Mai; yr wyf yn ffyddiog ynghylch y canlyniad.

Kirsty Williams: A ydych yn cytuno bod y Llywodraeth glymblaid wedi dod â sefydlogrwydd i'r sefydliad hwn? A ydych hefyd yn cytuno bod gallu ein dwy blaid i ddod at ei gilydd i weithio ar ran pobl Cymru yn gwrthgyferbynnu'n llwyr â methiant y Blaid Geidwadol, sydd wedi diystyru cydweithio â neb yn y sefydliad hwn, a Phlaid Cymru—ac eithrio Adam Price—sydd wedi cyfaddef nad yw'n gallu ffurfio gweinyddiaeth fwyafrifol, ac sy'n amharod i weithio gyda rhywun arall?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae gennych eich barn eich hun am hynny; nid wyf yn sicr ynghylch eich sylwadau am y Ceidwadwyr—ni chredaf y byddai neb arall yn cydweithio â hwy, felly nid oes diben iddynt eu cynnig eu hunain yn bartneriaid. Ni ddywedwn mai hwy yw gwahangleifion cymdeithas wleidyddol yng Nghymru, ond maent wedi'i chael yn anodd ennill ymddiriedaeth pobl Cymru ers cyflwyno'r bleidlais ddirgel tua 140 o flynyddoedd yn ôl. Efallai y bydd pleidiau

part in coalitions, but that is up to the people of Wales. If they want a majority Government, that is the model they will go for. We have tried minority Government and we have tried coalition Government, but we have not yet tried majority Government. I hope that that is what we will be able to offer the people of Wales from 2 May.

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): There were some harsh words there, which is disappointing, because I am always concerned about your welfare; while Mike German is your anointed no. 2, we do not want to lose you. On a more serious point, do you not agree that the Assembly Government is made to look like a basket case, and that Wales in general is brought into disrepute when your chosen deputy, Mike German, says that you inhabit cloud-cuckoo-land and are unfit to govern? You ducked that question from Helen Mary Jones; will you answer it now? Will you call off this hopeless coalition Government? Will you slap down your deputy who, after all, has presided over the greatest debacle ever seen on agricultural payments? Will you sack him, and strike a blow for all of us, not least the rural communities?

The First Minister: Figures published last week demonstrated an increase of 36,000 in a year in the number of jobs in Wales; I was pleased to see that there was an increase of 223,000 in the number of jobs in the UK. Of the increase in employment in the UK, 15 per cent was in Wales, compared to only 5 per cent of the population. That arises from co-operation between the Westminster Government and us, and means that we have a healthy record. If you believe that an increase of 36,000 jobs in a year is evidence of a basket-case administration, how do you define the success, or failure, of the Thatcher Government of your political party? In 1986, unemployment in Wales was four times higher than it is at present, and when Labour came into office in 1997, it was twice as high as it is now. If we are a basket case, what were the Tories when they were last in power in Wales?

eraill am gymryd rhan mewn clymbleidiau, ond mater i bobl Cymru ydyw. Os ydynt am gael Llywodraeth fwyafrifol, byddant yn dewis y model hwnnw. Rhoesom gynnig ar Lywodraeth leiafrifol ac ar Lywodraeth glymblaid, ond ni roesom gynnig ar Lywodraeth fwyafrifol eto. Gobeithiaf mai hynny y gallwn ei gynnig i bobl Cymru o 2 Mai ymlaen.

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): Dywedwyd rhai pethau cas yn y fan honno, sy'n siomedig, oherwydd yr wyf bob amser yn poeni am eich lles; tra bo Mike German wedi'i eneinio'n ddirprwy i chi, nid ydym am eich colli. Ar bwynt mwy difrifol, onid ydych yn cytuno bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ymddangos yn anobeithiol, a bod Cymru'n gyffredinol yn cael enw drwg pan ddywed eich dirprwy dewisedig, Mike German, eich bod yn byw ym myd dychmygion ac nad ydych yn addas i lywodraethu? Gwnaethoch osgoi'r cwestiwn hwnnw gan Helen Mary Jones; a wnewch ei ateb yn awr? A wnewch roi pen ar y Llywodraeth glymblaid anobeithiol hon? A wnewch roi'ch dirprwy yn ei le ac yntau, wedi'r cwbl, wedi goruchwyllo'r llastr mwyaf a welwyd erioed mewn taliadau amaethyddol? A wnewch ei ddiswyddo, a tharo ergyd dros bawb ohonom, a'r cymunedau gwledig yn anad neb?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae ffigurau a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos diwethaf yn dangos cynnydd o 36,000 mewn blwyddyn yn nifer y swyddi yng Nghymru; yr oeddwn yn falch o weld bod cynnydd o 223,000 yn nifer y swyddi yn y DU. O'r cynnydd mewn cyflogaeth yn y DU, yr oedd 15 y cant yng Nghymru, o'i gymharu â phoblogaeth o ddim ond 5 y cant. Mae hynny'n deillio o gydweithio rhwng Llywodraeth San Steffan a ninnau, ac mae'n golygu bod gennym record iach. Os credwch fod cynnydd o 36,000 o swyddi mewn blwyddyn yn dystiolaeth o weinyddiaeth anobeithiol, sut yr ydych yn diffinio llwyddiant, neu fethiant, Llywodraeth Thatcher eich plaid chi? Yn 1986, yr oedd diweithdra yng Nghymru bedair gwaith yn uwch nag y mae'n awr, a phan ddaeth Llafur i rym yn 1997, yr oedd ddwywaith yn uwch nag y mae'n awr. Os ydym ni'n anobeithiol, beth oedd y Torïaid pan oeddent hwy mewn grym yng Nghymru ddiwethaf?

Nick Bourne: You answered a question that was not asked, if you can class it as an answer. You have dodged the question on your coalition partners and your deputy for the second time. On jobs, we know that the computer has been blamed for the fact that Objective 1 funding has resulted in a net total of 44 jobs, which you previously tried to rubbish, and a computer fault has been blamed for agricultural payments not being made. It is only a matter of time before the Assembly building debacle and the position on NHS waiting lists are also blamed on the computer. However, to take you back to the point that your coalition Government is coming apart at the seams, your deputy said that you had no vision and that you could not govern. Is this not a serious issue? He also said that you had no original ideas, although we can clear you of that accusation because you made him your deputy and put him in charge of agriculture. Do you not believe that this disunity is deeply damaging to your Government, and to Wales by extension, and that you should sack him and call off the coalition? Will you answer that simple question?

The First Minister: You are revealing your political illiteracy. Look across the water to Ireland—it is not far, Nick, and they speak English there so a simple phone call will do the job—and ask what happens in the last three or four months of coalition Governments. They all attempt to walk the tightrope that we are walking, namely campaigning separately but governing together. That is why it is important to say on behalf of the whole administration that our job numbers in Wales have increased by 36,000. To rebut the claim that you made—you say it was not your question, but it was part of your preamble, so I have every right to rebut it—job numbers have increased by 36,000 and unemployment is a quarter of what it was in the worst year of the Tory administration, and half of what it was in the last Tory year in charge. It is important to remind the Welsh people of the success of the co-operation between the Assembly Government and the Westminster Government in creating jobs in Wales. Look

Nick Bourne: Gwnaethoch ateb cwestiwn nas gofynnwyd, os gallwch ei alw'n ateb. Yr ydych wedi osgoi'r cwestiwn ar eich partneriaid yn y glymblaid a'ch dirprwy am yr ail dro. Ynghylch swyddi, gwyddom mai'r cyfrifiadur a gafodd y bai am y ffaith, y gwnaethoch geisio'i diystyru yn gynharach, fod cyllid Amcan 1 wedi arwain at gyfanswm clir o 44 o swyddi, a rhoddwyd y bai ar ddiffyg cyfrifiadurol am beidio â gwneud taliadau amaethyddol. Nid yw ond yn fater o amser cyn y rhoddir y bai am lanastr adeilad y Cynulliad a sefyllfa rhestrau aros y GIG ar y cyfrifiadur hefyd. Fodd bynnag, er mwyn mynd â chi'n ôl at y pwynt bod eich Llywodraeth glymblaid yn dod oddi wrth ei gilydd, dywedodd eich dirprwy nad oedd gennych weledigaeth ac na allech lywodraethu. Onid yw hyn yn fater difrifol? Dywedodd hefyd nad oes gennych syniadau gwreiddiol, er y gallwn brofi'ch bod yn ddieuog o'r cyhuddiad hwnnw oherwydd fe'i gwnaethoch yn ddirprwy i chi a'i wneud yn gyfrifol am amaethyddiaeth. Onid ydych yn credu bod yr ymrannu hwn yn niweidiol iawn i'ch Llywodraeth, ac i Gymru o ganlyniad, ac y dylech ei ddiswyddo a rhoi'r gorau i'r glymblaid? A wnewch ateb y cwestiwn syml hwnnw?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych yn amlygu'ch anllythrennedd gwleidyddol. Edrychwch dros y môr i Iwerddon—nid yw'n bell, Nick, ac maent yn siarad Saesneg yno felly gwnaiff galwad ffôn syml y tro—a gofyn beth sy'n digwydd yn nhri neu bedwar mis olaf Llywodraethau clymblaid. Maent i gyd yn ceisio cerdded ar raff fel yr ydym ni, sef ymgyrchu ar wahân ond llywodraethu gyda'i gilydd. Dyna pam y mae'n bwysig dweud ar ran y weinyddiaeth gyfan fod nifer y swyddi yng Nghymru wedi cynyddu o 36,000. Er mwyn gwrthbrofi'r honiad a wnaethoch—dywedwch nad eich cwestiwn chi ydoedd, ond yr oedd yn rhan o'ch rhagymadrodd, felly mae gennyf bob hawl i'w wrthbrofi—mae nifer y swyddi wedi cynyddu o 36,000 ac mae diweithdra'n chwarter yr hyn ydoedd ym mlwyddyn waethaf y weinyddiaeth Dori'aidd, ac yn hanner yr hyn ydoedd ym mlwyddyn olaf y Toriaid wrth y llyw. Mae'n bwysig atgoffa pobl Cymru am lwyddiant y cydweithredu rhwng Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a Llywodraeth San Steffan wrth

across the water and consider what happens in other coalition Governments in countries such as Ireland and Holland in the final quarter before the election. The verdict on political changes will be a decision for the people of Wales.

greu swyddi yng Nghymru. Edrychwch dros y môr ac ystyried beth sy'n digwydd mewn Llywodraethau clymblaid eraill mewn gwledydd fel Iwerddon a'r Iseldiroedd yn y chwarter olaf cyn yr etholiad. Bydd y dyfarniad ar newidiadau gwleidyddol yn fater i'w benderfynu gan bobl Cymru.

Datganiad ar Raglen Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i Wella Praidd Defaid Cymru

Statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's Programme to Improve the Welsh Sheep Flock

The Deputy First Minister and Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad (Michael German): I am pleased to announce the launch of a consultation exercise on the Welsh ewe genotyping scheme—WEGS II. This is a three-year, £10.5 million scheme, which is being developed to increase the scrapie resistance of the Welsh flock.

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor (Michael German): Yr wyf yn falch o gyhoeddi lansiio ymgynghoriad ar gynllun genoteipio mamogiaid Cymru—WEGS II. Cynllun tair blynedd, gwerth £10.5 miliwn yw hwn, a ddatblygir er mwyn cynyddu'r gallu i wrthsefyll clefyd y crafu ym mhraidd Cymru.

Scrapie is a sheep disease that has been endemic in the British isles for at least 200 years. There is no evidence that it is harmful to humans but it is part of the transmissible spongiform encephalopathy, or TSE, family and is related to bovine spongiform encephalopathy, or BSE. The symptoms are similar and scientists have advised that the most effective way of removing vulnerability to TSEs is to breed-in resistance to all TSEs and to ensure that produce is derived from flocks with a high degree of resistance. I emphasise that, while it is known that sheep have contracted BSE under laboratory conditions, there is no evidence that the disease has occurred naturally in the sheep flock.

Mae clefyd y crafu'n afiechyd mewn defaid sy'n endemig yn ynysoedd Prydain ers o leiaf 200 mlynedd. Nid oes tystiolaeth ei fod yn niweidiol i bobl ond mae'n un o deulu enseffalopathi sbyngffurf trosglwyddadwy, neu TSE, ac mae'n perthyn i enseffalopathi sbyngffurf buchol, neu BSE. Mae'r symptomau'n debyg ac mae gwyddonwyr wedi rhoi gwybod mai'r dull mwyaf effeithiol o ddileu clwyfadwyedd oddi wrth TSE yw meithrin gwrthiant i bob math o TSE a sicrhau y ceir cynnyrch o breiddiau sydd â llawer o wrthiant. Pwysleisiaf, er ei bod yn hysbys bod defaid wedi cael BSE o dan amodau labordy, nad oes tystiolaeth bod y clefyd wedi digwydd yn naturiol yn y praidd defaid.

The reasoning behind this scheme is that improving the genetic resistance of the sheep flock will protect Wales against possible future doubts about the safety of sheep meat, and will place the Welsh flock in a better position to withstand market difficulties, should scrapie resistance become a market requirement.

Y rhesymu sy'n sail i'r cynllun hwn yw y bydd gwella gwrthiant genetig y praidd defaid yn amddiffyn Cymru rhag amheuon posibl yn y dyfodol am ddiogelwch cig defaid, ac y bydd yn rhoi praidd Cymru mewn gwell sefyllfa i allu gwrthsefyll anawsterau yn y farchnad, os daw gwrthiant i glefyd y crafu'n ofyniad gan y farchnad.

The principle of genotyping—blood testing a sheep to discover its resistance or susceptibility to scrapie—has been endorsed by the Spongiform Encephalopathy Advisory

Mae'r egwyddor o genoteipio—profi gwaed dafad i ddarganfod ei gwrthiant neu ragdueddiad i gael clefyd y crafu—wedi'i chymeradwyo gan Bwyllgor Ymgynghorol

Committee, which advises the Government, the Food Standards Agency and the European Union on BSE matters. Genotyping is already available to Welsh flocks through the centrally-funded British national scrapie plan. The national scrapie plan's ram genotyping scheme was launched in 2001, and, so far, 45 per cent of eligible Welsh farmers have signed up to it and 25,000 rams have been genotyped.

Proposals are currently being discussed in Europe for an EU-wide programme for genotyping and scrapie eradication, which are in line with the UK's approach and policies for dealing with scrapie and with the Assembly Government's commitment to genotyping through WEGS II.

2:50 p.m.

These measures underline the need for Welsh farmers to take advantage of free genotyping now so that the Welsh flock will be in a better position to withstand difficulties in the market should scrapie resistance become a market requirement.

Modelling commissioned by the Assembly shows that the genetic structure of the Welsh hill flock makes it more susceptible than average to scrapie. WEGS II has, therefore, been developed as a unique National Assembly initiative tailored to meet the particular circumstances of the Welsh sheep industry. It is the result of close working with the sheep industry in Wales. Some Welsh farmers were first given the opportunity of joining a ewe genotyping scheme in Wales through WEGS I, which was run in 2001. This highly successful scheme enabled farmers, as part of the Welsh sheep strategy, to have their ewes tested in time for breeding decisions in autumn 2001.

Following the successful completion of WEGS I, an Assembly/industry joint working group met during the winter of 2001-02 to discuss how a higher level of scrapie resistance could be achieved in Wales. The group proposed an enlarged ewe genotyping scheme backed up by an artificial

Enseffalopathi Sbyngffurf, sy'n cynghori'r Llywodraeth, yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd a'r Undeb Ewropeaidd ar faterion BSE. Mae genoteipio ar gael eisoes i breiddiau Cymru drwy gynllun clefyd y crafu cenedlaethol Prydain a ariannir yn ganolog. Lanswyd cynllun genoteipio hyrddod y cynllun clefyd y crafu cenedlaethol yn 2001 a, hyd yn hyn, mae 45 y cant o'r ffermwyr cymwys yng Nghymru wedi ymuno ag ef ac mae 25,000 o hyrddod wedi'u genoteipio.

Trafodir cynigion ar hyn o bryd yn Ewrop ar gyfer rhaglen genoteipio a dileu clefyd y crafu ledled yr UE, sy'n unol â dull gweithredu a pholisiau'r DU ar gyfer delio â chlefyd y crafu ac ymrwymiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i genoteipio drwy WEGS II.

Mae'r mesurau hyn yn tynnu sylw at yr angen i ffermwyr Cymru fanteisio ar genoteipio am ddim yn awr fel y bydd praidd Cymru mewn gwell sefyllfa i allu gwrthsefyll anawsterau yn y farchnad os daw gwrthiant i glefyd y crafu'n ofyniad gan y farchnad.

Mae modelu a gomisiynwyd gan y Cynulliad yn dangos bod strwythur genetig praidd mynydd Cymru yn peri ei fod yn fwy tueddol na'r cyfartaledd i gael clefyd y crafu. Gan hynny, mae WEGS II wedi'i ddatblygu'n fenter unigryw gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol sydd wedi'i haddasu i amgylchiadau penodol diwydiant defaid Cymru. Mae'n ganlyniad i gydweithio agos â'r diwydiant defaid yng Nghymru. Cafodd rhai o ffermwyr Cymru y cyfle i ymuno â chynllun genoteipio mamogiaid yng Nghymru'n gyntaf drwy WEGS I, a weithredwyd yn 2001. Bu'r cynllun tra llwyddiannus hwn yn fodd i ffermwyr gael profi eu mamogiaid mewn pryd ar gyfer penderfyniadau bridio yn hydref 2001, fel rhan o strategaeth defaid Cymru.

Ar ôl cwblhau WEGS I yn llwyddiannus, cyfarfu gweithgor ar y cyd o'r Cynulliad a'r diwydiant yn ystod gaeaf 2001-02 i drafod sut y gellid sicrhau mwy o wrthiant i'r ysfaf yng Nghymru. Cynigiodd y gweithgor gynllun genoteipio mamogiaid mwy, wedi'i ategu gan gynllun semenu artiffisial.

insemination scheme. Proposals were worked up and the Assembly Government agreed to fund an ambitious three-year scheme starting this year. These are the proposals on which we are now asking for comments.

The key features of the scheme are as follows: it will be open to Welsh farmers with pedigree or pure-bred flocks on farms in time for this year's breeding season; it will be run as a national scrapie plan scheme, and farmers will be able to have all their replacement ewe lambs tested—which goes further than any other NSP scheme—with the testing carried out by the State Veterinary Service at no cost to the farmer; it will require farmers to cull scrapie susceptible sheep after the first year; and farmers will have the opportunity to access scrapie-related breeding advice through Farming Connect and, subject to state aid approval, an artificial insemination scheme.

I am pleased to launch this consultation paper today. It is an ambitious scheme that will help place the Welsh flock in a better market position to respond to any possible demands for meat from scrapie-resistant flocks. I welcome further comments from the sheep industry on the contents of the scheme and look forward to its success when the scheme is up and running later in the year.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Pan welais fod datganiad gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor ar raglen Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wella praidd defaid Cymru ar yr agenda, yr oeddwn yn falch bod y Gweinidog yn cymryd cyfrifoldeb am rywbeth o fewn y byd amaeth ac yr oeddwn yn aros â chryn gywreinrwydd i glywed beth y bwriadai ei wneud. Yr wyf yn falch mai'r hyn a gyhoeddodd oedd cynllun i gael gwared ar yr ysfa.

Yr ydym oll yn derbyn bod hwn yn gynllun pwysig. Mae gan nifer o wledydd sy'n cystadlu â ni o ran cynnyrch, megis Unol Daleithiau America, yr Iseldiroedd, Ffrainc a Seland Newydd, gynlluniau tebyg eisoes. Mae gan y gwledydd hynny fantais o ran

Paratowyd y cynigion a chytunodd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ariannu cynllun tair blynedd uchelgeisiol sy'n dechrau eleni. Dyma'r cynigion y gofynnwn am sylwadau arnynt yn awr.

Mae nodweddion allweddol y cynllun fel a ganlyn: bydd yn agored i ffermwyr yng Nghymru sydd â phreiddiau o dras neu ddiledryw ar ffermydd mewn pryd ar gyfer tymor bridio eleni; caiff ei weithredu fel rhan o gynllun cenedlaethol yr ysfa, a bydd ffermwyr yn gallu cael profi eu holl wŷn benyw newydd—sy'n mynd ymhellach nag unrhyw gynllun cenedlaethol yr ysfa arall—a gwneir y profion gan y Gwasanaeth Milfeddygol Gwladol heb godi tâl ar y ffermwr; bydd yn mynnu bod ffermwyr yn difa defaid sydd â thuedd i ddioddef yr ysfa ar ôl y flwyddyn gyntaf; a chaiff ffermwyr gyfle i gael cyngor ar fridio mewn cysylltiad â'r ysfa drwy Cyswllt Ffermio ac, os cymeradwyir y cymorth gwladol, cynllun semenu artiffisial.

Yr wyf yn falch o gyhoeddi'r papur ymgynghori hwn heddiw. Mae'n gynllun uchelgeisiol a fydd o gymorth i roi praidd Cymru mewn gwell sefyllfa yn y farchnad i ymateb i unrhyw alwadau posibl am gig o breiddiau sydd â gwrthiant i'r ysfa. Croesawaf sylwadau pellach gan y diwydiant defaid ar gynnwys y cynllun ac edrychaf ymlaen at ei lwyddiant pan fydd ar waith yn ddiweddarach yn y flwyddyn.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: When I saw that the Deputy First Minister and Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad was to make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's programme to improve the Welsh sheep flock, I was pleased that the Minister was taking responsibility for something within agriculture and I was curious to hear what his intentions were. I am pleased that what he announced was a scheme to eradicate scrapie.

We all accept that this is an important scheme. Several countries that compete with us in terms of produce, such as the United States of America, the Netherlands, France and New Zealand already have similar schemes. Those countries have a marketing

marchnata gan eu bod yn cael eu dynodi fel gwledydd lle y rheolir yr ysfa yn systematig, ac felly fel gwledydd sy'n rhydd o'r ysfa i raddau helaeth.

Er bod cryn wybodaeth ar gael am yr ysfa ac am TSE yn gyffredinol, a yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno bod llawer i'w ddysgu o hyd ac felly y bydd angen bod yn wylidwrus wrth gyflwyno'r cynllun hwn? Croesawn y cynllun, ond a yw'r Gweinidog yn derbyn bod peryglon yn gysylltiedig ag ef, ac y bydd yn rhaid bod yn ofalus nad ydym yn cael gwared ar rai bridiau pwysig o ddefaid o Gymru wrth geisio ymdrin â'r broblem hon? Pa sicrwydd y gall ei roi inni ei fod yn ymwybodol o hynny ac y bydd yn mynd i'r afael â'r mater? Deallaf y clustnodwyd £7.5 miliwn dros dair blynedd ar gyfer y cynllun hwn a chroesawaf hynny. A yw'r Gweinidog yn fodlon bod y swm hwnnw'n ddigonol a bod digon o adnoddau ar gael i weinyddu a gweithredu'r cynllun yn effeithiol a chyflym? Beth y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud o ran bridiau defaid o dras? Os bydd yn rhaid difa o fewn y bridiau hynny, beth a wnaiff i sicrhau y caiff ffermwyr eu digolledu? Mae ffermwyr wedi buddsoddi'n helaeth ynddynt, ac wedi diogelu preiddiau defaid o dras. Croesawaf ddatganiad y Gweinidog y prynhawn yma, ond cyfyd rhai cwestiynau.

Michael German: Thank you for your support, Rhodri. Information is an important issue. We must ensure that Farming Connect provides the right level of information for farmers, which is part of our Welsh scheme. It is also important to look at the current scientific knowledge, as this is an inexact area of science. I reiterate that there is no evidence that BSE has got into the national sheep flock—

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: TSE?

Michael German: No, I said that there is no evidence that BSE has got into the national sheep flock. There is not yet a reliable test to distinguish between scrapie and BSE. However, this year, probably around £16 million has gone into researching TSE in the UK, which is a substantial sum.

I am very much aware of the crucial issue you raised about the loss of breeds. We do

advantage as they are denoted as countries where scrapie is systematically controlled, and therefore as being scrapie-free to a large extent.

Although there is much information available about scrapie and about TSE in general, does the Minister agree that there is still much to be learnt and that we must therefore be cautious in introducing this scheme? We welcome the scheme, but does the Minister accept that there are risks associated with it and that we must be careful not to eradicate important breeds of sheep from Wales in trying to address this problem? What assurance can he give us that he is aware of that and that he will address the issue? I understand that £7.5 million has been allocated for this scheme over three years and I welcome that. Is the Minister satisfied that that sum is adequate and that sufficient resources are available to administrate and implement the scheme effectively and quickly? What is the Minister doing as regards pedigree breeds of sheep? If culling is needed within those breeds, what will he do to ensure that farmers are compensated? Farmers have invested heavily in them, and have conserved pedigree sheep flocks. I welcome the Minister's statement this afternoon, but some questions arise.

Michael German: Diolch i chi am eich cefnogaeth, Rhodri. Mae gwybodaeth yn fater pwysig. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod Cyswllt Ffermio yn darparu gwybodaeth ar lefel briodol ar gyfer ffermwyr, sy'n rhan o'n cynllun yng Nghymru. Mae hefyd yn bwysig ystyried y wybodaeth wyddonol gyfredol, gan nad yw hwn yn faes gwyddonol fanwl. Dywedaf eto nad oes tystiolaeth bod BSE wedi mynd i'r praid defaid cenedlaethol—

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: TSE?

Michael German: Nage, dywedais nad oes tystiolaeth bod BSE wedi mynd i'r praid defaid cenedlaethol. Nid oes prawf dibynadwy eto i wahaniaethu rhwng yr ysfa a BSE. Fodd bynnag, mae'n debyg bod tua £16 miliwn wedi'i roi eleni er mwyn ymchwilio i TSE yn y DU, sy'n swm sylweddol.

Yr wyf yn ymwybodol iawn o'r mater hollbwysig y gwnaethoch ei godi ynghylch

not want to lose the desirable characteristics of certain breeds that have susceptible genotypes, which is why a gene archive has been established and taken forward on a GB-basis as part of the national scrapie plan.

Peter Rogers: I welcome this plan, particularly as our competitors have already implemented similar plans—New Zealand in particular. However, I have misgivings about you administering any agricultural scheme given the mess that you have got the industry into over the last three or four months. Given that compensation money will now be involved, what assurance does the Welsh farmer have that you have the means of providing it? Have you got your computer to administer this compensation money, or have you some other system? The scheme will hinge, particularly when slaughtering the stock of pedigree breeders, on compensation being paid immediately. There can be no going back now, and no blaming computers or other inefficiencies in your ministerial duties. You must ensure that you deliver: this is serious.

We must also ensure that, while eradicating scrapie, we do not also erase other important breed characteristics. Returning to Rhodri Glyn Thomas's point, much work is needed to fully understand the problem with scrapie. If it is to be done, we must ensure that it is administered quickly and effectively, and that no time is wasted. We require urgency and efficient organisation. I want your commitment that you can deliver that.

Michael German: As you know, today, I am announcing a six-week consultation period to allow the industry to give its views on this plan.

You raised the contract between the farmer and the National Assembly. It is simple: in return for genotyping and registering the stock electronically, farmers with scrapie-susceptible ewes will have to slaughter them before the end of the first year. That is my proposal. However, there is a derogation in the first year, whereby farmers can mate susceptible ewes to a terminal sire, providing

colli bridiau. Nid ydym am gollu nodweddion dymunol rhai bridiau sydd â genoteipiau rhagdueddol, a dyna pam y sefydlwyd archif genynnau a gaiff ei gweithredu ledled Prydain Fawr fel rhan o gynllun cenedlaethol yr ysfa.

Peter Rogers: Croesawaf y cynllun hwn, yn enwedig am fod y rhai sy'n cystadlu â ni wedi rhoi cynlluniau tebyg ar waith eisoes—Seland Newydd yn enwedig. Fodd bynnag, teimlaf betruster wrth feddwl amdanoch yn gweinyddu unrhyw gynllun amaethyddol o ystyried y llanastr a wnaethoch yn y diwydiant dros y tri neu bedwar mis diwethaf. O wybod y bydd iawndal yn gysylltiedig â hyn yn awr, pa sicrwydd sydd gan ffermwyr Cymru eich bod yn meddu ar y modd i'w ddarparu? Ai drwy'ch cyfrifiadur y byddwch yn gweinyddu'r iawndal hwn, neu ryw system arall? Bydd y cynllun yn dibynnu, yn enwedig wrth ladd anifeiliaid bridwyr pedigri, ar dalu iawndal ar unwaith. Ni ellir troi'n ôl yn awr, a rhoi'r bai ar gyfrifiaduron neu aneffeithlonrwydd arall yn eich dyletswyddau gweinidogol. Rhaid ichi sicrhau eich bod yn mynd â'r maen i'r wal: mae hyn yn fater difrifol.

Rhaid inni sicrhau hefyd nad ydym, wrth ddileu'r ysfa, yn dileu nodweddion bridiau pwysig eraill. Gan fynd yn ôl at y pwynt a wnaeth Rhodri Glyn Thomas, mae angen llawer o waith i lawn ddeall y broblem ynghylch yr ysfa. Os gwneir hyn, rhaid inni sicrhau y caiff ei weinyddu'n gyflym ac yn effeithiol, ac na wastraffir amser. Mae arnom angen gweithredu brys a threfnu effeithlon. Yr wyf am ichi ymrwymo y gallwch gyflawni hynny.

Michael German: Fel y gwyddoch, heddiw yr wyf yn cyhoeddi cyfnod ymgynghori o chwe wythnos i ganiatáu i'r diwydiant roi ei farn am y cynllun hwn.

Gwnaethoch godi mater y contract rhwng y ffermwr a'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Mae'n syml: yn gyfnewid am genoteipio a chofrestru'r anifeiliaid yn electronig, bydd ffermwyr â mamogiaid sydd â thuedd i ddioddef yr ysfa yn gorfod eu lladd cyn diwedd y flwyddyn gyntaf. Dyna'r hyn yr wyf yn ei gynnig. Fodd bynnag, ceir rhanddirymiad yn y flwyddyn gyntaf, sy'n

that they guarantee not to use the offspring for breeding. On that point, access to the artificial insemination scheme can help farmers increase the scrapie resistance of their flock.

The final part of the proposal is currently before the European Commission, to get European state aid. I want to emphasise that this scheme is not compulsory but voluntary, in which people choose to engage. That is the nature of the contract between farmers and the National Assembly Government.

3:00 p.m.

Mick Bates: The six-week consultation on this process is important to the sheep industry in Wales, because there is anxiety about our market's being vulnerable unless action is taken to increase resistance to scrapie in the national flock. It is a high priority in terms of the industry, public health and the continued prosperity of rural Wales. Although this is the beginning of the consultation, there are questions that need answers now. Will you implement monitoring of the effects of slaughtering susceptible animals? It may be that that will inflate the market price and make replacements expensive; we must examine how that policy would work. Also, can you assure me that rare Welsh breeds, such as the Llandoverly Whiteface and the Hill Radnor, will be brought into the remit of WEGS II? Finally, this may place an administrative burden on the farmer. Will WEGS II require a significant computer resource for the farmers to keep pace with it?

Michael German: Rare breeds will be included. The scheme is open to farmers who stock rare breeds. A major advantage of using the bonus system is the registration and tagging of the animals, which will give us a firm knowledge base. Monitoring will then become much easier, as the information will be maintained on a central register, which will, of course, be available to the farmer. That means that we will have a proper count of the animals and their susceptibility. Bar-coding will mean that, with a simple electronic counter, it will be possible to

caniatáu i ffermwyr baru mamogiaid sydd â rhagdueddiad â thad terfynol, ar yr amod eu bod yn gwarantu na fyddant yn defnyddio'r epil i fridio. Bryd hynny, bydd y cynllun semenu artiffisial ar gael i helpu ffermwyr i gynyddu gwrthiant eu praidd i'r ysgaf.

Mae rhan olaf y cynnig gerbron y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd ar hyn o bryd, er mwyn cael cymorth gwladol Ewropeaidd. Yr wyf am bwysleisio nad cynllun gorfodol yw hwn, ond un gwirfoddol, y gall pobl ddewis cymryd rhan ynddo. Dyna natur y contract rhwng y ffermwyr a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Mick Bates: Mae'r ymgynghori chwe wythnos ar y broses hon yn bwysig i'r diwydiant defaid yng Nghymru, gan fod pryder y bydd gwendid yn ein marchnad os na chymerir camau i gynyddu gwrthiant yn y praidd cenedlaethol i'r ysgaf. Mae'n flaenoriaeth uchel yng nghyd-destun y diwydiant, iechyd cyhoeddus a ffyniant parhaus y Gymru wledig. Er mai dechrau'r ymgynghori yw hwn, mae cwestiynau sy'n rhaid eu hateb yn awr. A wnewch roi monitro ar waith i ganfod effeithiau lladd anifeiliaid sydd â rhagdueddiad? Mae'n bosibl y byddai hynny'n chwyddo pris y farchnad gan beri ei bod yn ddud prynu anifeiliaid newydd; rhaid inni archwilio sut y byddai'r polisi hwnnw'n gweithio. Hefyd, a allwch fy sicrhau y bydd bridiau Cymreig prin, fel y Llandoverly Whiteface a'r Hill Radnor, yn cael eu cynnwys yng nghylch gorchwyl WEGS II? Yn olaf, gallai hyn roi'r ffermwr o dan faich gweinyddol. A fydd WEGS II yn gofyn adnoddau cyfrifiadurol sylweddol i alluogi'r ffermwyr i fynd bob yn gam ag ef?

Michael German: Cynhwysir bridiau prin. Mae'r cynllun ar gael i ffermwyr sy'n cadw bridiau prin. Un fantais bwysig wrth ddefnyddio'r system bonws yw cofrestru a labelu'r anifeiliaid, a fydd yn rhoi sylfaen wybodaeth gadarn i ni. Bydd yn llawer haws monitro wedyn, gan y cedwir y wybodaeth ar gofrestr ganolog, a fydd ar gael i'r ffermwr, wrth gwrs. Mae hynny'n golygu y bydd gennym gyfrif iawn o'r anifeiliaid ac o'u rhagdueddiad. O gael codau bar, bydd modd dilysu gwybodaeth â chyfrifydd electronig syml. Bydd mantais gan y rhai sy'n ymuno

verify information. Those who take up this scheme—and I remind you that it is a voluntary scheme—will have the advantage of being able to track and manage their flocks electronically in a way that other farmers perhaps cannot.

David Davies: Everyone will welcome this scheme. Indeed, people tend to welcome virtually every statement that the Government makes, because they are rarely controversial. However, the sad reality is that we are hearing warm words while the sheep industry is collapsing—not least, as Peter Rogers pointed out, because so many farmers are still awaiting payments. Peter Rogers asked two important questions, which you failed to answer. Will the compensation payments for rare breeds be administered by the Agriculture Department of the National Assembly for Wales? If so, what guarantee can you give that the computers will work this time, without glitches? Also, as Minister for Rural Development, do you appreciate that timely payments are an integral part of rebuilding Wales's sheep-farming industry?

Michael German: I refer you the answer that I gave earlier, in which I gave an exact explanation of the contract between the farmer and the Welsh Assembly Government. [*Interruption.*] I gave you the answer; you should listen to it.

On the state of the sheep-farming industry, you should consider the prices that farmers have been getting, compared to what they were getting previously. Look at the change in the marketplace and the Farmers Union of Wales's own research. It shows that there is growing confidence in this industry. Instead of talking the industry down, look at the reality.

Datganiad Busnes Business Statement

The Business Minister (Carwyn Jones): I have made the following changes to this week's business. There will be two statements tomorrow. The Minister for Environment will make a statement on rail

â'r cynllun hwn—ac yr wyf yn eich atgoffa mai un gwirfoddol ydyw—o allu dilyn trywydd a rheoli eu preiddiau'n electronig mewn modd na fydd yn bosibl i ffermwyr eraill efallai.

David Davies: Bydd pawb yn croesawu'r cynllun hwn. Yn wir, mae pobl yn tueddu i groesawu bron bob datganiad a wnaiff y Llywodraeth, gan mai'n anaml y maent yn ddadleuol. Fodd bynnag, y gwir trist amdani yw ein bod yn clywed geiriau braf tra bo'r diwydiant defaid yn methu—a hynny'n fwy na dim, fel y nododd Peter Rogers, am fod cynifer o ffermwyr yn dal i ddisgwyl taliadau. Gofynnodd Peter Rogers ddau gwestiwn pwysig, y gwnaethoch fethu â'u hateb. A gaiff y taliadau iawndal ar gyfer bridiau prin eu gweinyddu gan Adran Amaethyddiaeth Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru? Os felly, pa sicrwydd a allwch ei roi y bydd y cyfrifiaduron yn gweithio y tro hwn, heb drafferthion? Hefyd, fel y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig, a ydych yn gwerthfawrogi bod taliadau amserol yn rhan annatod o'r gwaith o ailgodi diwydiant ffermio defaid Cymru?

Michael German: Fe'ch cyfeiriaf at yr ateb a roddais yn gynharach, pan roddais eglurhad manwl o'r contract rhwng y ffermwr a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. [*Torri ar draws.*] Rhoddais yr ateb i chi; dylech wrando arno.

Ynghylch cyflwr y diwydiant ffermio defaid, dylech ystyried y prisiau y mae ffermwyr wedi'u cael, o'u cymharu â'r hyn a gaent o'r blaen. Edrychwch ar y newid yn y farchnad ac ymchwil Undeb Amaethwyr Cymru. Dengys fod hyder cynyddol yn y diwydiant hwn. Yn hytrach na bychanu'r diwydiant, gwelwch sut y mae mewn gwirionedd.

Y Trefnydd (Carwyn Jones): Yr wyf wedi gwneud y newidiadau a ganlyn i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Bydd dau ddatganiad yfory. Bydd y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd yn gwneud datganiad am wasanaethau

services, followed by a statement on the higher education strategy by the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning. The debate on the Wales Tourist Board's quinquennial review, originally scheduled for tomorrow, has been moved to 5 February to make room for those statements. The draft statement for the next three week's business can be found on the Chamberweb under supporting documents.

Y Llywydd: A oes gwrthwynebiadau i'r datganiad busnes? Gwelaf nad oes. A oes sylwadau?

Janet Ryder: The Assembly can debate any issue that affects Wales. There can be few issues that have a more crucial effect on Wales than the present firefighters' strike. Firefighters do not want to strike, but they have been forced into doing so by the Westminster Government's mishandling of this dispute. The Westminster Government has ruled negotiations out of the question and is demanding the implementation of the Bain report. That report, if implemented, would have massive implications for the shape of the fire service in Wales and for the safety and security of people in Wales.

Along with many of my colleagues, I spent time with firefighters at Cardiff central fire station today. Those firefighters want the Assembly to debate the Bain report and the handling of the issue of firefighters' pay and conditions. They want the Assembly to express a view in favour of the firefighters and of the safety of people in Wales. Plaid Cymru feels strongly that we should debate this matter, and we ask the Business Minister to schedule such a debate, in the Government's time, at the earliest available opportunity.

Peter Black: Will the Business Minister talk to the Minister for Economic Development about scheduling a statement on today's announcement that Alcoa Extrusions and End Products in Swansea is to close within the next five or six months, and on the consequent loss of jobs? This important announcement is a body blow for Swansea and must be tackled by the Assembly Government. I hope that the Assembly

rheilffyrdd, ac ar ôl hynny bydd datganiad ar y strategaeth addysg uwch gan y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Mae'r ddadl ar adolygiad pum-mlyneddol Bwrdd Croeso Cymru, a amserlennwyd yn wreiddiol ar gyfer yfory, wedi'i symud i 5 Chwefror i wneud lle i'r datganiadau hynny. Gellir gweld y datganiad drafft ar gyfer busnes y tair wythnos nesaf ar we'r Siambr o dan ddogfennau ategol.

Presiding Officer: Are there any objections to the business statement? I see that there are none. Are there any comments?

Janet Ryder: Caiff y Cynulliad gynnal dadl ar unrhyw fater sy'n effeithio ar Gymru. Prin bod llawer o faterion a gaiff effaith fwy tyngedfennol ar Gymru na streic bresennol y diffoddwyr tân. Nid yw'r diffoddwyr tân am fynd ar streic, ond fe'u gorfodwyd i wneud hynny oherwydd camdriniwyd yr anghydfod hwn gan Lywodraeth San Steffan. Mae Llywodraeth San Steffan wedi diystyru negodiadau ac yn galw am weithredu adroddiad Bain. Os câi'r adroddiad hwnnw ei weithredu, byddai goblygiadau aruthrol ar gyfer ffurf y gwasanaeth tân yng Nghymru ac ar gyfer diogelwch a sicrwydd pobl yng Nghymru.

Fel llawer o'm cyd-Aelodau, treuliais amser gyda'r diffoddwyr tân yng ngorsaf dân ganolog Caerdydd heddiw. Mae'r diffoddwyr tân hynny'n dymuno i'r Cynulliad drafod adroddiad Bain a'r dull o ymdrin â mater tâl ac amodau'r diffoddwyr tân. Dymunant i'r Cynulliad fynegi barn o blaid y diffoddwyr tân a diogelwch pobl yng Nghymru. Mae Plaid Cymru'n teimlo'n gryf y dylem gael dadl ar y mater hwn, a gofynnwn i'r Trefnydd amserlennu dadl o'r fath, yn amser y Llywodraeth, ar y cyfle cynharaf posibl.

Peter Black: A wnaiff y Trefnydd siarad â'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd ynghylch amserlennu datganiad ar y cyhoeddiad heddiw y bydd Alcoa Extrusions ac End Products yn Abertawe yn cau o fewn y pump neu chwe mis nesaf, ac ar y colledion swyddi o ganlyniad i hynny? Mae'r cyhoeddiad pwysig hwn yn ergyd drom i Abertawe a rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ymdrin ag ef. Gobeithiaf y bydd Llywodraeth

Government can act as soon as possible to mitigate the impact of the announcement.

Nick Bourne: The Business Minister will be aware, as will the First Minister, that I sought a statement from the Government of Wales on asylum seekers. I am disappointed, but not surprised, that the First Minister has not shown leadership on this issue. If my postbag, and those of others, is anything to go by, people in Wales consider this to be a vital issue. In the interests of all asylum seekers, many of whom have every right to be here because of threats to life and limb, this issue should be debated. The Business Minister will be aware that, on Friday, there were reports of a member of the Taleban seeking asylum in Wales. Since then we have learned that the application was successful.

A government owes its first duty to the people and to their security, and we need to consider this issue urgently. I have asked the First Minister and the Home Secretary to consider the issue. I have sent two letters to the Home Secretary asking for the issue to be addressed and copied those letters to the First Minister. He should have them: they were sent on Friday and on Monday respectively. I ask the Business Minister to ensure that we can debate the issue, because that is in everyone's interests, not least those of genuine asylum seekers in Wales.

Alun Pugh: I draw the Business Minister's attention to the widespread anger in Abergele that a private company wants to locate there what is, in effect, a prison for people with personality disorders. There is currently a large gap in planning law in terms of the change-of-use regulations. Will he schedule an urgent statement on the matter by the Minister responsible for planning?

The Business Minister (Carwyn Jones): To answer Janet Ryder's point, the firefighters' dispute is not a devolved matter: the Assembly does not have a role in it, nor is it able to influence the outcome. It is dangerous for this body to give the impression that it has influence over settling a dispute when it does not, because that creates expectations among

y Cynulliad yn gallu gweithredu mor fuan ag y bo modd i liniaru effaith y cyhoeddiad.

Nick Bourne: Bydd y Trefnydd yn ymwybodol, fel y bydd y Prif Weinidog, fy mod wedi gofyn am ddatganiad gan Lywodraeth Cymru ar geiswyr lloches. Testun siom, ond nid syndod, i mi yw nad yw'r Prif Weinidog wedi dangos arweiniad ar y mater hwn. Os gellir barnu yn ôl y llythyrau yr wyf fi ac eraill yn eu cael, mae pobl yng Nghymru yn credu bod hwn yn fater hollbwysig. Er budd yr holl geiswyr lloches, y mae gan lawer ohonynt bob hawl i fod yma oherwydd bygythiadau i einioes, dylid cynnal dadl ar y mater hwn. Bydd y Trefnydd yn ymwybodol y bu adroddiadau, ar ddydd Gwener, am aelod o'r Taleban a oedd yn ceisio lloches yng Nghymru. Ers hynny cawsom wybod bod y cais wedi bod yn llwyddiannus.

Dyletswydd gyntaf llywodraeth yw'r un tuag at y bobl a'u diogelwch, a rhaid inni ystyried y mater hwn ar frys. Yr wyf wedi gofyn i Brif Weinidog Cymru ac i'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref ystyried y mater. Yr wyf wedi anfon dau lythyr at yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref yn gofyn am roddi sylw i'r mater hwn ac wedi anfon copïau o'r llythyrau hynny at Brif Weinidog Cymru. Dylai fod wedi'u cael: fe'u hanfonwyd ar ddydd Gwener ac ar ddydd Llun. Gofynnaf i'r Trefnydd sicrhau y gallwn gael dadl ar y mater, gan fod hynny er budd pawb, ac yn anad neb y ceiswyr lloches dilys yng Nghymru.

Alun Pugh: Tynnaf sylw'r Trefnydd at y dicter cyffredinol yn Abergele am fod cwmni preifat yn dymuno lleoli yno yr hyn sydd, i bob pwrpas, yn garchar i bobl ag anhwylderau ar eu persoliaeth. Mae bwch mawr mewn cyfraith cynllunio ar hyn o bryd o ran y rheoliadau newid defnydd. A wnaiff amserlennu datganiad brys ar y mater gan y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am gynllunio?

Y Trefnydd (Carwyn Jones): Er mwyn ateb y pwynt a wnaeth Janet Ryder, nid yw anghydfod y diffoddwyr tân yn fater a ddatganolwyd: nid oes gan y Cynulliad rôl ynddo, ac nid yw'n gallu dylanwadu ar y canlyniad ychwaith. Mae'n beryglus i'r corff hwn roi'r argraff y gall ddylanwadu er mwyn datrys anghydfod ac yntau heb y gallu i

people that this body is able to intervene proactively in the management of a dispute. Therefore, we do not intend to bring forward a debate on the firefighters' dispute.

In relation to Peter Black's point, the Minister for Economic Development is not here at the moment. Nevertheless, I am sure that your point will be conveyed to him, and that he will consider what he wants to do in relation to the news that you have outlined to the Chamber.

The Minister for Environment is in the Chamber and she will have heard what Alun Pugh said. I know that you have taken up this matter with great gusto in your constituency, Alun, and that your constituents look to you to provide a lead on it, as you have done. The Minister has heard your point and I am sure that she will consider what needs to be done.

Regarding asylum seekers, yesterday I heard the story on the radio about a former Taleban fighter who has received asylum within the United Kingdom. However, the name of that person has not been disclosed, nor are the whereabouts or any further details about that person known, and that is the difficulty with dealing with the situation. The situation of asylum seekers in general would not merit a statement, because there is nothing new to say in that regard. Were more information to be provided, the Assembly might need to consider that. However, I stress that this is not a devolved matter; it is a matter for the Home Office. More information needs to be provided before further consideration can be given to the matter.

3:10 p.m.

Nick Bourne: Point of order. I have looked at the concordat and it is clear that asylum issues impinge on both Westminster and the Assembly. Asylum seekers are referred to explicitly in the concordat. It states that:

'[t]he responsibilities of the Assembly and the Home Office impinge on each other...Most of these areas of impinging responsibilities are summarised below...A safe society in which to live'

wneud hynny, gan fod hynny'n creu disgwyliadau ymysg pobl y gall y corff hwn ymyrryd yn rhagweithiol i reoli'r anghydfod. Gan hynny, nid ydym yn bwriadu cynnal dadl ar anghydfod y diffoddwyr tân.

Ynghylch y pwynt a wnaeth Peter Black, nid yw'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd yma ar hyn o bryd. Er hynny, yr wyf yn sicr y bydd y pwynt a wnaethoch yn cael ei gyfleu iddo, ac y bydd yn ystyried yr hyn y mae am ei wneud mewn cysylltiad â'r newyddion yr ydych wedi'u hamlinellu yn y Siambr.

Mae'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd yn y Siambr a bydd wedi clywed yr hyn a ddywedodd Alun Pugh. Gwn eich bod wedi ymgymryd yn frwdfrydig â'r mater hwn yn eich etholaeth, Alun, a bod eich etholwyr yn disgwyl ichi roi arweiniad arno, fel y gwnaethoch. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi clywed y pwynt a wnaethoch ac yr wyf yn sicr y bydd yn ystyried beth y dylid ei wneud.

Ynghylch ceiswyr lloches, ddoe clywais yr hanes ar y radio am gyn-ymladdwr dros y Taleban sydd wedi cael lloches yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Fodd bynnag, ni ddatgelwyd enw'r person hwnnw, ac ni wyddys ym mhle y mae nac unrhyw fanylion pellach amdano, a dyna'r anhawster wrth ymdrin â'r sefyllfa. Ni fyddai sefyllfa ceiswyr lloches yn gyffredinol yn teilyngu datganiad, gan nad oes dim newydd i'w ddweud am hynny. Pe darperid rhagor o wybodaeth, efallai y byddai'n rhaid i'r Cynulliad ystyried hynny. Fodd bynnag, pwysleisiaf nad yw hwn yn fater a ddatganolwyd; mae'n fater i'r Swyddfa Gartref. Mae angen darparu rhagor o wybodaeth cyn y gellir ystyried y mater ymhellach.

Nick Bourne: Pwynt o drefn. Yr wyf wedi edrych ar y concordat ac mae'n amlwg bod materion lloches yn cyffwrdd â San Steffan a'r Cynulliad. Cyfeirir at geiswyr lloches yn benodol yn y concordat. Dywed fod:

'cyfrifoldebau'r Cynulliad a'r Swyddfa Gartref yn gorgyffwrdd â'i gilydd...Crynoir y rhan fwyaf o'r meysydd hyn sy'n gorgyffwrdd isod...Cymdeithas ddiogel i fyw ynddi'

and goes on, under 'Equality issues', to make specific reference to asylum seekers and refugees. Indeed, we have previously had statements on asylum seekers in Cardiff prison. I therefore remind the Business Minister that we can legitimately consider these issues.

Carwyn Jones: Regarding the Home Office's responsibility, it would have been better had I said 'immigration'. I am not saying that asylum issues cannot be raised in the Chamber, but it is important that further information should be provided about these alleged cases—about which I heard yesterday. Before we take the matter further, we should know exactly what the situation is. At the moment, matters are somewhat vague.

The Presiding Officer: I am grateful to the Business Minister for responding to the detail of that point of order and for clarifying his earlier statement.

*Derbyniwyd y datganiad busnes.
Business statement adopted.*

ac aiff ymlaen, o dan 'Materion cydraddoldeb', i gyfeirio'n benodol at geiswyr lloches a ffoaduriaid. Yn wir, cawsom ddatganiadau o'r blaen am geiswyr lloches yng ngharchar Caerdydd. Felly atgoffaf y Trefnydd bod gennym yr hawl i ystyried y materion hyn.

Carwyn Jones: Ynghylch cyfrifoldeb y Swyddfa Gartref, buasai'n well pe bawn wedi dweud 'mewnfudo'. Nid wyf yn dweud na ellir codi materion lloches yn y Siambr, ond mae'n bwysig i wybodaeth bellach gael ei darparu am yr achosion honedig hyn—y clywais amdanynt ddoe. Cyn inni fynd â'r mater ymhellach, dylem wybod yn union beth yw'r sefyllfa. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r materion hyn braidd yn annelwig.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Trefnydd am ymateb i fanylion y pwynt o drefn hwnnw ac am roi gwedd eglurach ar ei ddatganiad cynharach.

Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion Composite Motion: Approval of Orders

Y Llywydd: O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

The Presiding Officer: Under Standing Order No. 22.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

Y Trefnydd (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiaf fod

The Business Minister (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25,

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 22.25,

1. yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Mynediad i Gefn Gwlad (Cyflwyno Tir fel Tir Mynediad) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Rhagfyr 2002;

1. approves the Countryside Access (Dedication of Land as Access Land) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 10 December 2002;

2. yn ystyried:

2. considers:

a) adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw faterion sy'n destun pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Mynediad i Gefn Gwlad (Cyflwyno Tir fel Tir Mynediad) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Rhagfyr 2002;

a) the report of the Legislation Committee, which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Countryside Access (Dedication of Land as Access Land) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 17 December 2002;

- b) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Ionawr 2003; ac b) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office on 13 January 2003; and
- c) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Ionawr 2003; c) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 13 January 2003;
3. yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Mynediad i Gefn Gwlad (Gwahardd neu Gyfyngu Mynediad) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Rhagfyr 2002; 3. approves the Countryside Access (Exclusion or Restriction of Access) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 10 December 2002;
4. yn ystyried: 4. considers:
- a) adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw faterion sy'n destun pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Mynediad i Gefn Gwlad (Gwahardd neu Gyfyngu Mynediad) (Cymru) 2003, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Rhagfyr 2002; a) the report of the Legislation Committee, which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Countryside Access (Exclusion or Restriction of Access) (Wales) Regulations 2003, laid in the Table Office on 17 December 2002;
- b) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Ionawr 2003; ac b) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office on 13 January 2003; and
- c) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Ionawr 2003. (NDM1291) c) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 13 January 2003. (NDM1291)

*Cynnig (NDM1291): O blaid 36, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 6.
Motion (NDM1291): For 36, Abstain 0, Against 6.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, David Ian
Jones, Elin
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Morgan, Rhodri

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick
Davies, David
Graham, William
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter

Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Kirsty
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau Deddf Iechyd Anifeiliaid 2002 Delegation of Functions of the Animal Health Act 2002

The Deputy First Minister and Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad (Michael German): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under section 62(1)(b) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, resolves to delegate all the functions of the National Assembly contained in or under the Animal Health Act 2002 to the Assembly First Minister, save those which by law cannot be so delegated.

Nothing in the motion will have the effect of reducing the pre-eminence of the authority of the full Assembly or of reducing the role of the Assembly Committees in the exercise of the above functions.

This delegation will be made in the knowledge that those functions will, as appropriate, be further delegated to the appropriate Assembly Minister and to staff. (NDM1293)

The Act has two main purposes: to provide additional powers to tackle foot and mouth disease and for those powers to be extendable to other animal diseases by Order; and to provide additional powers to deal with transmissible spongiform encephalopathies. The Act also makes a number of amendments to the enforcement provisions of the Animal Health Act 1981. I will focus on the two sections of the Act which provide for the National Assembly to prepare contingency plans for animal disease outbreaks, and to receive an annual report on disease prevention in relation to imports of animal

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor (Michael German): Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan adran 62(1)(b) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn penderfynu dirprwyo holl swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a gynhwysir yn neu o dan Ddeddf Iechyd Anifeiliaid 2002 i Brif Weinidog y Cynulliad, ac eithrio'r rhai na ellir yn ôl y gyfraith eu dirprwyo yn y modd hwnnw.

Ni fydd dim yn y cynnig hwn yn lleihau goruchafiaeth awdurdod y Cynulliad llawn nac yn lleihau rôl Pwyllgorau'r Cynulliad wrth arfer y swyddogaethau uchod.

Bydd y dirprwyo hwn yn cael ei wneud gan wybod y caiff y swyddogaethau hynny eu dirprwyo ymhellach, lle y bo hynny'n briodol, i'r Gweinidog priodol yn y Cynulliad ac i staff. (NDM1293)

Mae dau brif bwrpas i'r Ddeddf: darparu pwerau ychwanegol i fynd i'r afael â chlwy'r traed a'r genau ac ar gyfer ymestyn y pwerau hynny i gynnwys clefydau anifeiliaid eraill drwy Orchymyn; a darparu pwerau ychwanegol i ddelio ag enseffalopathïau sbyngffurf trosglwyddadwy. Mae'r Ddeddf hefyd yn gwneud sawl diwygiad i ddarpariaethau gorfodi Deddf Iechyd Anifeiliaid 1981. Canolbwyntiaf ar ddwy adran y Ddeddf sy'n darparu i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol baratoi cynlluniau wrth gefn ar gyfer achosion o glefydau anifeiliaid, ac iddo dderbyn adroddiad blynyddol ar atal clefydau

products. These are covered in the explanatory memorandum, which has been sent to all Assembly Members.

Disease contingency planning comes under section 18 of the Act. During the foot and mouth disease outbreak, all Members will have seen at first hand the concern and heartbreak that arose over the actions taken as part of the Great Britain contingency plan. Communities failed to get an exact understanding of what was happening. That has been well recorded, not only in the Assembly, but in the inquiries. Section 18 requires us to ensure, in consultation with other Government departments, that we are properly prepared for the likelihood of animal disease outbreaks and gives us the powers to produce appropriate contingency plans.

Section 17 of the Act relates to the Assembly receiving an annual report on import controls to prevent animal disease from entering the country. Much has been said in the Assembly about illegal imports; I do not think that this is the occasion to debate the existing action programme or any further measures that may be announced following current assessments. There are other opportunities to do that. However, section 17 places a requirement on Ministers to produce a report to be laid before the Assembly and the Houses of Parliament at the same time. That provision recognises that we have an important stake in the fight against animal disease.

This Act amends the Animal Health Act 1981 and was not the appropriate means by which to pursue the further transfer of powers over animal health and welfare that the Welsh Assembly Government has in mind. That transfer is being pursued separately. However, it is right that these powers should transfer as soon as possible. I commend the motion to Members.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Diolch, Weinidog, am gyflwyno hyn. Mae'n rhaid trosglwyddo'r pwerau cyfyngedig hyn o fewn y ddeddfwriaeth. Cyfyd rhai o'r mesurau a

mewn cysylltiad â mewnfario cynnyrch anifeiliaid. Ymdrinnir â'r rhain yn y memorandwm eglurhaol, a anfonwyd at holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad.

Daw cynllunio wrth gefn ar gyfer clefydau o dan adran 18 y Ddeddf. Yn ystod clwy'r traed a'r genau, gwelodd yr holl Aelodau yn uniongyrchol y pryder a'r torcalon a gododd oherwydd y camau a gymerwyd fel rhan o gynllun wrth gefn Prydain Fawr. Methodd cymunedau â deall beth yn union a oedd yn digwydd. Mae hynny wedi'i gofnodi'n dda, nid yn unig yn y Cynulliad, ond yn yr ymchwiliadau. Mae adran 18 yn mynnu ein bod yn sicrhau, wrth ymgynghori ag adrannau Llywodraeth eraill, ein bod yn llawn barod ar gyfer y tebygolrwydd o achosion o glefydau anifeiliaid ac y mae'n rhoi pwerau inni gynhyrchu cynlluniau wrth gefn priodol.

Mae adran 17 y Ddeddf yn ymwneud â'r Cynulliad yn derbyn adroddiad blynyddol ar reolaethau mewnfario i atal clefydau anifeiliaid rhag dod i'r wlad. Dywedwyd llawer yn y Cynulliad am fewnfario anghyfreithlon; ni chredaf mai hon yw'r adeg briodol i drafod y rhaglen weithredu bresennol nac unrhyw fesurau pellach y gellid eu cyhoeddi ar ôl yr asesiadau presennol. Mae cyfleoedd eraill i wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae adran 17 yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i Weinidogion gynhyrchu adroddiad i'w osod gerbron y Cynulliad a dau Dŷ'r Senedd ar yr un pryd. Mae'r ddarpariaeth honno'n cydnabod bod gennym ran bwysig yn y frwydr yn erbyn clefydau anifeiliaid.

Mae'r Ddeddf hon yn diwygio'r Ddeddf Iechyd Anifeiliaid 1981 ac nid oedd yn gyfrwng priodol i fynd ynghylch y trosglwyddo pellach ar bwerau dros iechyd a lles anifeiliaid sydd dan sylw gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Eir ynghylch y trosglwyddo hwnnw ar wahân. Fodd bynnag, mae'n briodol trosglwyddo'r pwerau hyn cyn gynted ag y bo modd. Cymeradwyaf y cynnig i'r Aelodau.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Thank you, Minister, for moving this. These limited powers must be transferred within the legislation. Some of the measures permitted in the legislation raise

ganiateir yn y ddeddfwriaeth gwestiynau mawr ynglŷn â hawliau ffermwyr, gan ystyried bod modd mynd â'u stoc—hyd yn oed anifeiliaid anwes—oddi wrthynt, a'u difa.

Fodd bynnag, nid oes gennym wrthwynebiad i'r swyddogaethau hyn gael eu trosglwyddo. Fel yr esboniodd y Gweinidog, mae'n rhaid iddynt gael eu trosglwyddo. Fel y dywedodd hefyd, mae materion ehangach i'w trafod yn nes ymlaen ynglŷn â throsglwyddo mwy o gyfrifoldeb dros iechyd anifeiliaid i'r Cynulliad. Yr ydym yn hapus i'r swyddogaethau hyn gael eu trosglwyddo, ac yn gweld gwerth a phwysigrwydd hynny.

Mick Bates: The Welsh Liberal Democrats also welcome this legislation. Here, and in Westminster, our party has consistently argued for the devolution of all animal health powers to the National Assembly. If that had been done previously, we would have tackled foot and mouth disease more effectively in Wales. Bob Parry of the Farmers Union of Wales has said that a lesson to be learned from the foot and mouth disease outbreak is that the National Assembly is better positioned to control animal health powers in Wales than the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs. We are travelling down that path, and I welcome that.

The Animal Health Act is a big improvement on the original Bill. One improvement was the introduction of a requirement for the Government to produce an annual report on the effectiveness of import controls of animal products and meat to be put before Westminster and the Assembly. It is immensely important that the Assembly receive that report. A Westminster colleague, Roger Williams, has worked tirelessly to ensure that import controls are tightened in Britain. We welcome this requirement, and hope that it leads to genuine improvements in animal health in Wales.

Peter Rogers: I have great reservations about anything that the Assembly does regarding agriculture. There does not seem to be the

major questions about farmers' rights, considering that their stock—even pets—can be taken from them and culled.

However, we have no objection to these functions being transferred. As the Minister explained, they must be transferred. As he also said, there are wider issues to be discussed later regarding delegating more responsibility over animal health to the Assembly. We are happy for these functions to be transferred, and see the value and importance of that.

Mick Bates: Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn croesawu'r ddeddfwriaeth hon hefyd. Yma, ac yn San Steffan, mae ein plaid wedi dadlau'n gyson dros ddatganoli'r holl bwerau dros iechyd anifeiliaid i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Pe bai hynny wedi'i wneud o'r blaen, byddem wedi mynd i'r afael â chlwy'r traed a'r genau yn fwy effeithiol yng Nghymru. Mae Bob Parry o Undeb Amaethwyr Cymru wedi dweud mai un wers i'w dysgu oddi wrth y cychwyniad o glwy'r traed a'r genau yw bod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol mewn gwell sefyllfa i reoli pwerau iechyd anifeiliaid yng Nghymru nag y mae Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig. Yr ydym yn mynd i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw, a chroesawaf hynny.

Mae'r Ddeddf Iechyd Anifeiliaid yn well o lawer na'r Mesur gwreiddiol. Un gwelliant oedd cyflwyno gofyniad i'r Llywodraeth gynhyrchu adroddiad blynyddol ar effeithiolrwydd y rheolaethau ar fewnforio cynnyrch anifeiliaid a chig i'w osod gerbron San Steffan a'r Cynulliad. Mae'n bwysig dros ben bod y Cynulliad yn cael yr adroddiad hwnnw. Mae un o'm cydweithwyr yn San Steffan, Roger Williams, wedi gweithio'n ddiflino i sicrhau y caiff rheolaethau fewnforio eu tynhau ym Mhrydain. Croesawn y gofyniad hwn, a gobeithiwn y bydd yn arwain at welliannau gwirioneddol mewn iechyd anifeiliaid yng Nghymru.

Peter Rogers: Mae gennyf amheuan mawr ynghylch unrhyw beth a wnaiff y Cynulliad mewn cysylltiad ag amaethyddiaeth. Nid

will to support the industry. Appalling things happened during the foot and mouth disease outbreak and there was no fight or commitment in the Assembly to support the industry. I understand that, when all these powers are transferred here, we will be wholly responsible for animal health. I hope that we can use those powers to support an industry that has not been recognised by the Assembly.

The Deputy First Minister and Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad (Michael German): I have nothing to add. I commend the motion to Members.

yw'n ymddangos bod ewyllys i gefnogi'r diwydiant. Digwyddodd pethau ofnadwy yn ystod y cychwyniad o glwy'r traed a'r genau ac nid oedd unrhyw ymdrech neu ymroddiad yn y Cynulliad i gefnogi'r diwydiant. Yr wyf yn deall y bydd gennym gyfrifoldeb llwyr dros iechyd anifeiliaid pan drosglwyddir yr holl bwerau hyn i'r fan hon. Gobeithiaf y gallwn ddefnyddio'r pwerau hynny i gefnogi diwydiant nad yw'r Cynulliad wedi'i gydnabod.

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor (Michael German): Nid oes gennyf ddim i'w ychwanegu. Cymeradwyaf y cynnig i'r Aelodau.

*Cynnig (NDM1293): O blaid 38, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1293): For 38, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Butler, Rosemary
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, David Ian
Jones, Elin
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Gorchymyn Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Datgymhwysu) 2003 The National Assembly for Wales (Disqualification) Order 2003

The Business Minister (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under section 12 (7) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, requests that the Secretary of State for Wales recommend to Her Majesty in Council that the National Assembly for Wales (Disqualification) Order 2003 be made. The draft Order was laid in the Table Office on 13 January 2003. (NDM1292)

Today's debate is rather unusual in terms of the process that is being used to bring this matter forward. This is the first occasion on which the Assembly is being invited to use its powers under section 12 (7) of the Government of Wales Act 1998 to request that the Secretary of State for Wales takes forward an Order disqualifying certain office holders from being elected to the Assembly. If we agree, the Secretary of State can proceed without recourse to Parliament.

3:20 p.m.

Free and fair competition between candidates is the essence of a democracy, and that means that anybody who wishes to stand for election should generally be free to do so. However, there will always be marginal cases of individuals whose circumstances make it inappropriate for them to serve in this capacity, and the Government of Wales Act 1998 deals with some of those cases directly. For instance, it disqualifies civil servants, judges and some prisoners from being Assembly Members and allows holders of specified public offices to be disqualified by Order in Council, which is what we are dealing with today.

The main aim of the Order before us is to

Y Trefnydd (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan adran 12 (7) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn gofyn i Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru argymhell i'w Mawrhydi yn y Cyfrin Gyngor bod Gorchymyn Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Datgymhwysu) 2003 yn cael ei wneud. Gosodwyd y Gorchymyn drafft yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Ionawr 2003. (NDM1292)

Mae'r ddadl heddiw braidd yn anarferol o ran y broses a ddefnyddir i ddod â'r mater hwn gerbron. Dyma'r tro cyntaf i'r Cynulliad gael ei wahodd i ddefnyddio ei bwerau o dan adran 12 (7) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 i ofyn i Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru fwrw ymlaen â Gorchymyn i ddatgymhwysu rhai deiliaid swyddi rhag eu hethol i'r Cynulliad. Os cytunwn, caiff yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol fynd ymlaen heb droi at y Senedd.

Cystadlu rhydd a theg rhwng ymgeiswyr yw hanfod democratiaeth, ac mae hynny'n golygu y dylai unrhyw un sy'n dymuno sefyll mewn etholiad fod yn rhydd i wneud hynny'n gyffredinol. Er hynny, bydd achosion ymylol bob amser o unigolion y mae eu hamgylchiadau'n peri ei bod yn amhriodol iddynt wasanaethu yn y cymhwyster hwnnw, ac mae Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 yn ymdrin yn uniongyrchol â rhai o'r achosion hynny. Er enghraifft, mae'n datgymhwysu gweision sifil, barnwyr a rhai carcharorion rhag bod yn Aelodau Cynulliad ac yn caniatáu datgymhwysu deiliaid swyddi cyhoeddus penodol drwy Orchymyn yn y Cyfrin Gyngor, a dyna'r hyn yr ydym yn ei drafod heddiw.

Prif nod y Gorchymyn sydd ger ein bron yw

disqualify from election those individuals holding offices that are incompatible with the duties of an Assembly Member, because a material conflict of interest would arise. It is, for instance, wrong in principle that a member of the board of a major Assembly sponsored public body should also be an Assembly Member, given our role in funding, directing and making appointments to ASPBs. That principle accounts for a great deal of the draft Order. Also, bodies such as S4C, while not directly our responsibility, have a direct impact on the Assembly and devolved matters and therefore the draft Order would also disqualify members of the boards of such bodies in order to avoid conflict of interest.

Disqualifying public office holders from standing for election is not a novel idea. The initial National Assembly for Wales (Disqualification) Order 1999 was made in March 1999, and applied at the first Assembly elections that year. Naturally, that Order is now a little out of date; it includes some bodies and offices that no longer exist, for example the Welsh National Board for Nursing, Midwifery and Health Visiting, and does not include new ones such as the Office of the Children's Commissioner for Wales. The Order before us corrects that and, for ease of reference, consolidates the remaining provisions of the 1999 Order. It would apply to the forthcoming Assembly elections.

The new Order is essentially no more than an update of the 1999 Order but, if we wish to maintain the highest standards of probity in the Assembly and in wider public life in Wales, it is important that it is supported.

Y Llywydd: Gan nad oes neb arall am siarad ar y mater, galwaf am bleidlais.

datgymhwysu rhag eu hethol yr unigolion hynny sy'n dal swyddi sy'n anghymharus â dyletswyddau Aelod o'r Cynulliad, am y byddai gwrthdaro sylweddol rhwng buddiannau. Er enghraifft, mae'n anghywir mewn egwyddor i aelod bwrdd corff cyhoeddus pwysig a noddir gan y Cynulliad fod yn Aelod o'r Cynulliad hefyd, yng ngolwg ein rôl wrth gyllido, cyfarwyddo a gwneud penodiadau i gyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad. Yr egwyddor honno sy'n gyfrifol am lawer iawn sydd yn y Gorchymyn drafft. Hefyd, mae cyrff fel S4C, er nad ydynt yn gyfrifoldeb uniongyrchol i ni, yn cael effaith uniongyrchol ar y Cynulliad a materion a ddatganolwyd ac felly byddai'r Gorchymyn drafft hefyd yn datgymhwysu aelodau o fyrddau cyrff o'r fath er mwyn osgoi gwrthdaro rhwng buddiannau.

Nid syniad newydd yw datgymhwysu deiliaid swyddi cyhoeddus rhag sefyll mewn etholiad. Gwnaed y Gorchymyn Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Datgymhwysu) 1999 cychwynnol ym Mawrth 1999, ac yr oedd yn berthnasol i etholiadau cyntaf y Cynulliad yn y flwyddyn honno. Wrth gwrs, mae'r Gorchymyn hwnnw wedi dyddio braidd erbyn hyn; mae'n cynnwys rhai cyrff a swyddi nad ydynt yn bodoli bellach, er enghraifft, Bwrdd Cenedlaethol Cymru dros Nyrsio Bydwreigiaeth a Gwasanaethau Ymwelwyr Iechyd, ac nid yw'n cynnwys rhai newydd fel swydd Comisiynydd Plant Cymru. Mae'r Gorchymyn sydd ger ein bron yn cywiro hynny ac, er hwylustod cyfeirio, mae'n cyfuno'r darpariaethau yng Ngorchymyn 1999 sy'n parhau. Byddai hefyd yn berthnasol i'r etholiadau Cynulliad sydd ar ddod.

Yn y bôn, nid yw'r Gorchymyn newydd ond yn ddiweddariad o Orchymyn 1999 ond, os dymunwn gynnal y safonau uchaf o onestrwydd yn y Cynulliad ac mewn bywyd cyhoeddus yn fwy cyffredinol yng Nghymru, mae'n bwysig ei gefnogi.

The Presiding Officer: As no-one else wishes to speak on this matter, I call for a vote.

*Cynnig (NDM1292): O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1292): For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gibbons, Brian
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, David Ian
Jones, Elin
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.20 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.20 p.m.*

Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd ynghylch Ynni Adnewyddadwy The Economic Development Committee's Report on Renewable Energy

Phil Williams: I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales notes the report of the Economic Development Committee entitled, 'Review of Energy Policy in Wales, Renewable Energy—Final Report'. (NDM1294)

Phil Williams: Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, 'Adolygiad o Bolisi Ynni yng Nghymru, Ynni Adnewyddadwy—Adroddiad Terfynol'. (NDM1294)

In other circumstances, Christine Gwyther would have presented this report and we all feel deep sympathy for her grievous loss. The last few months must have been extremely difficult for her, yet she showed total dedication as she continued her responsibilities as Chair of the Committee and the person leading this study. It is a privilege for me to stand in for her today, as this is a fine report. Much work went into it from Members of all parties and it was agreed upon unanimously. This report reflects the Assembly at its best.

As I have often said, global warming prompted me to return to politics, and the report's first recommendation reaffirms the strong scientific consensus that fossil fuels are causing significant climate change and that to mitigate this we must move towards a zero-carbon system. This point needs to be reaffirmed as, only last week, I, and probably many other Members, received an e-mail from the Confederation of UK Coal Producers repeating the claim that all climate change is the result of solar activity. Studying the effects of solar activity has been my main career for many years, and I deplore the way that valid scientific results are sometimes distorted by those with a vested interest who select misleading fragments of information to promote their own business.

It is to the credit of our expert adviser, Professor Jake Chapman, and the Committee clerk, John Grimes—and what a bonus it is to have a real mathematician as a clerk—that, in a scrupulously fair summary of the evidence submitted during consultation, all points of view were considered, whether for or against. However, where evidence was based on claims that were demonstrably untrue, this was pointed out. Alas, renewable energy is a subject plagued by disinformation: one respondent, for example, claimed that, over its lifetime, a wind turbine does not generate as much energy as is used in its construction. That could be checked by a straightforward calculation. Wind turbines actually repay the embedded energy quicker than any

O dan amgylchiadau eraill, Christine Gwyther a fyddai wedi cyflwyno'r adroddiad hwn ac yr ydym i gyd yn cydymdeimlo'n fawr â hi yn ei cholled drist. Mae'n sicr bod y misoedd diwethaf wedi bod yn rhai anodd dros ben iddi, ac eto amlygai ymroddiad llwyr wrth barhau â'i chyfrifoldebau fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor a'r un a oedd yn arwain yr astudiaeth hon. Braint i mi yw dirprwyo drosti heddiw, gan fod hwn yn adroddiad rhagorol. Mae Aelodau o bob plaid wedi cyfrannu'n fawr ato a chytunwyd arno'n unfrydol. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn adlewyrchu'r Cynulliad ar ei orau.

Fel y dywedais yn aml, y cynhesu byd-eang a'm cymhellodd i ailafael mewn gwleidyddiaeth, ac mae argymhelliad cyntaf yr adroddiad yn ailddatgan y consensws gwyddonol cadarn bod tanwyddau ffosil yn peri newid sylweddol yn yr hinsawdd a bod rhaid i ni, er mwyn lliniaru hynny, symud tuag at system ddi-garbon. Rhaid ailddatgan y pwynt hwn oherwydd, yr wythnos diwethaf, cefais i, a llawer o Aelodau eraill yn ôl pob tebyg, neges e-bost oddi wrth Gydffederasiwn Cynhyrchwyr Glo y DU a oedd yn ailadrodd yr honiad bod yr holl newid yn yr hinsawdd yn ganlyniad i weithgaredd yr haul. Bum yn astudio effeithiau gweithgaredd yr haul fel gwaith pennaf am flynyddoedd lawer, a gresynaf at y modd y caiff canlyniadau gwyddonol dilys eu camystumio weithiau gan rai sydd â buddiant breintiedig sy'n dethol darnau camarweiniol o wybodaeth i hyrwyddo eu busnes eu hun.

Clod i'n cynghorwr arbenigol, yr Athro Jake Chapman, ac i glerc y Pwyllgor, John Grimes—a'r fath gaffaeliad yw cael gwir fathemategydd yn glerc—yw bod pob safbwynt wedi'i ystyried, mewn crynodeb cydwybodol o deg o'r dystiolaeth a gyflwynwyd yn ystod yr ymgynghori, boed hwnnw o blaid neu yn erbyn. Serch hynny, os seiliwyd dystiolaeth ar honiadau y gellid profi nad oeddent yn wir, tynnwyd sylw at hynny. Gwaetha'r modd, mae ynni adnewyddadwy'n bwnc a gaiff ei blagio gan wybodaeth anghywir: yr oedd un ymatebydd, er enghraifft, yn honni nad yw tyrbîn gwynt, yn ystod ei oes, yn cynhyrchu cymaint o ynni ag a ddefnyddiwyd i'w adeiladu. Gellid gwirio hynny drwy gyfrifiad syml. Mewn

alternative. The Assembly has a duty to counter disinformation. For its annex on myths and legends alone, I commend this report.

The second recommendation is the substance of the report. Wales should aim at a benchmark of 4 terawatt hours of electricity per annum from renewable sources by 2010. That would be a little more than 10 per cent of the electricity generated in Wales, but close to 20 per cent of our consumption. We recognise that if the UK is to meet an overall target of 10 per cent by 2010, richly endowed areas such as Wales must do better than that to compensate for areas such as London, where a similar 10 per cent target would be unrealistic. This benchmark is challenging, but it can be achieved by projects that have already been proposed, at least in outline. About one third of the electricity would come from onshore wind, one third from offshore wind, and a third from hydro-electric schemes, biomass, landfill gas, photo-voltaic cells, and from exploiting tidal currents with underwater turbines.

That does not mean covering every hill in Wales with turbines. If you work out the sums, an extra 200 turbines are required on land, and perhaps 150 at sea. These should be built on the optimum locations, and I commend the work of the Countryside Council for Wales, which is using geographic information systems data to define those areas. These include areas that are out of sight of any national park and are remote from any housing, areas that do not affect any sites of special scientific interest, special areas of conservation, Ramsar sites, or any sites of archaeological significance, and areas that do not infringe any ancient forestry. If you apply all reasonable restraints to location, there are still plenty of sites with high average wind speed—

Cynog Dafis: Cefnogaf waith Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru. Mae'n drueni bod pwyslais ar leoli melinau gwynt allan o'r golwg. Un o bleserau mawr fy mywyd yw codi yn y bore

gwirionedd, mae tyrbinau gwynt yn ad-dalu'r ynni a ddefnyddiwyd i'w gosod yn gynt nag unrhyw ddewis arall. Mae'r Cynulliad o dan ddyletswydd i wrthweithio gwybodaeth anghywir. Cymeradwyaf yr adroddiad hwn ar sail ei atodiad ar fythau a chwedlau yn unig.

Yr ail argymhelliad yw sylwedd yr adroddiad. Dylai Cymru anelu at feincnod o 4 terawatt-awr o drydan y flwyddyn o ffynonellau adnewyddadwy erbyn 2010. Byddai hynny ychydig yn fwy na 10 y cant o'r trydan a gynhrychir yng Nghymru, ond yn agos at 20 y cant o'n defnydd. Yr ydym yn cydnabod, os yw'r DU i gyrraedd targed cyffredinol o 10 y cant erbyn 2010, fod rhaid i ardaloedd sydd â llawer o ffynonellau adnewyddadwy fel Cymru wneud yn well o lawer na hynny i wneud iawn am ardaloedd fel Llundain, lle y byddai targed tebyg o 10 y cant yn anymarferol. Mae'r feincnod hon yn un ymestynnol, ond gellir ei chyrraedd drwy brosiectau sydd wedi'u cynnig eisoes, ar ffurf amlinellol o leiaf. Deuai tua un rhan o dair o'r trydan o wynt ar y tir, un rhan o dair o wynt ar y môr, ac un rhan o dair o gynlluniau trydan dŵr, biomas, nwy tirlenwi, celloedd ffoto-foltäig, ac o ddefnyddio ceryntau llanwol i droi tyrbinau dan ddŵr.

Nid yw hynny'n golygu gorchuddio pob bryn yng Nghymru â thyrbinau. Os gwnewch y symiau, mae angen 200 o dyrbinau ychwanegol ar dir, a 150 efallai ar y môr. Dylid eu codi yn y lleoliadau gorau posibl, a chymeradwyaf waith Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru, sy'n defnyddio data systemau gwybodaeth ddaearyddol i ddiffinio'r ardaloedd hynny. Maent yn cynnwys ardaloedd na ellir eu gweld o unrhyw barc cenedlaethol ac sy'n bell o unrhyw dai, ardaloedd nad ydynt yn effeithio ar unrhyw safleoedd o ddiddordeb gwyddonol arbennig, ardaloedd arbennig cadwraeth, safleoedd Ramsar, neu unrhyw safleoedd o bwys archaeolegol, ac ardaloedd nad ydynt yn ymyrryd ag unrhyw goedwigoedd hynafol. Os cymhwyswch bob cyfyngiad rhesymol at leoli, mae digon o safleoedd ar ôl sydd â buanedd gwynt cyfartalog uchel—

Cynog Dafis: I also support the work of the Countryside Council for Wales. It is a shame that there is such an emphasis on erecting the turbines out of sight. One of the great

ac edrych allan drwy ffenestr y tŷ a gweld y fferm wynt gerllaw—mae'n hyfrydwch pur.

Phil Williams: The point is—at least at this stage and in looking towards 2010—that if we apply all the constraints that represent any significant opinion, there are still plenty of sites that are suitable for turbines and that we can use to meet the benchmark.

That leads to another important recommendation: the Government should seek ways to clarify and streamline the planning process. While it is essential to preserve proper democratic control, we cannot accept indefinite delay in granting planning approval for projects that meet all reasonable criteria. The continuing delay in the publication of technical advice note 8 on renewable energy is causing concern.

I will discuss one other recommendation; it is technical, but important. At present, there are obstacles to renewable energy because there are difficulties in getting grid connections for distributed generation, and the regulators impose severe penalties on variable output under the new electricity trading agreement. We urge the Assembly Government to bring maximum pressure to bear on the UK Government to remove these obstacles.

I have mentioned some difficulties. Some people may think that all this is desirable, but not realistic. I only wish that you could all have come to the National Assembly sustainable energy group last Thursday, although, on second thoughts, we would not have had enough chairs. I am a member of several all-party groups, but they do not compare to the enthusiasm displayed, and the work carried out by the sustainable energy group. We meet most months, with audiences of between 50 and 100 coming from every part of Wales. Sometimes, attendance is so good that we must send for extra chairs. If that is not enough, we discreetly ask our support staff to give up their seats to visitors. I wish that all all-party groups were the same. However, last Tuesday, we had an especially important meeting, which was packed out, to

pleasures of my life is to wake up in the morning and look out of the window and see a windfarm on the horizon—it is a joy to behold.

Phil Williams: Y pwynt yw—ar hyn o bryd, beth bynnag, ac wrth edrych ymlaen i 2010—os cymhwyswn yr holl gyfyngiadau sy'n cynrychioli unrhyw farn o bwys, fod digon o safleoedd ar ôl sy'n addas ar gyfer tyrbinau ac y gallwn eu defnyddio i gyrraedd y feincnod.

Mae hynny'n arwain at argymhelliad pwysig arall: dylai'r Llywodraeth geisio dulliau o symleiddio'r broses cynllunio a rhoi gwedd eglurach arni. Er ei bod yn hollbwysig cadw rheolaeth ddemocrataidd briodol, ni allwn dderbyn oedi amhenodol cyn rhoi caniatâd cynllunio ar gyfer prosiectau sy'n bodloni pob maen prawf rhesymol. Mae'r oedi parhaus cyn cyhoeddi nodyn cyngor technegol 8 ar ynni adnewyddadwy yn peri pryder.

Trafodaf un argymhelliad arall: mae'n dechnegol, ond yn bwysig. Ar hyn o bryd, mae rhwystrau i ynni adnewyddadwy am fod anawsterau wrth gael cysylltiadau â'r grid ar gyfer cynhyrchu sydd ar wasgar, ac mae'r rheoleiddwyr yn rhoi cosbau llym ar allbwn amrywiol o dan y cytundeb masnachu trydan newydd. Anogwn Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i roi'r pwysau mwyaf posibl ar Lywodraeth y DU i symud y rhwystrau hyn.

Yr wyf wedi sôn am rai o'r anawsterau. Efallai fod rhai yn credu bod hyn i gyd yn ddymunol, ond nad yw'n realistig. Byddai'n dda gennyf pe byddech i gyd wedi gallu dod i gyfarfod grŵp ynni cynaliadwy'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ddydd Iau diwethaf, ond, erbyn meddwl, ni fuasai digon o gadeiriau gennym. Yr wyf yn aelod o sawl grŵp trawsbleidiol, ond ni ellir eu cymharu â'r grŵp ynni cynaliadwy o ran y brydfrydedd a amlygir a'r gwaith a wneir ganddo. Yr ydym yn cwrdd yn y rhan fwyaf o fisoedd y flwyddyn, a daw cynulleidfaoedd o 50 i 100 o bob rhan o Gymru. Cystal yw'r presenoldeb, weithiau, fel bod rhaid inni anfon am ragor o gadeiriau. Os nad oes digon wedyn, yr ydym yn gofyn yn gyfrinachgar i'n staff cynorthwyol roi eu seddau i ymwelwyr. Byddai'n dda gennyf pe byddai'r holl grwpiau trawsbleidiol yr un

hear a presentation by two visitors from Navarra. Listen carefully to this: Navarra is half the area of Wales and has one sixth of its population. Its Government decided in 1995 to use renewable energy resources to become self-sufficient. Until then it had almost no capacity for generating electricity. The Navarra Government did everything right. First it set up meteorological stations to determine where best to locate wind farms. It used that information to draft a spatial plan. Three quarters of the potential sites were rejected, and work went ahead on those remaining.

fath. Fodd bynnag, ddydd Mawrth diwethaf, cawsom gyfarfod arbennig o bwysig, a oedd dan ei sang, i wrando cyflwyniad gan ddau ymwelydd o Navarra. Gwrandewch yn astud ar hyn: mae arwynebedd Navarra yn hanner cymaint ag un Cymru ac mae ganddi un rhan o chwech o'i phoblogaeth. Yn 1995, penderfynodd ei Llywodraeth ddefnyddio adnoddau ynni adnewyddadwy i ddod yn hunangynhaliol. Hyd hynny nid oedd ganddi bron ddim gallu i gynhyrchu trydan. Gwnaeth Llywodraeth Navarra bopeth yn iawn. Yn gyntaf, sefydlodd orsafoedd meteorolegol i bennu'r manau gorau i leoli ffermydd gwynt. Defnyddiodd y wybodaeth honno i ddrafftio cynllun gofodol. Gwrthodwyd tri chwarter o'r safleoedd dichonol, ac aeth y gwaith ymlaen ar y rhai a oedd yn aros.

3:30 p.m.

By 2005 Navarra's renewable energy output will more or less equal its total energy consumption, and by 2010 it will be producing 6.7 terra watt hours. Opinion polls in Navarra show that 85 per cent support wind power, 1 per cent are against and 14 per cent are undecided.

Erbyn 2005 bydd allbwn ynni adnewyddadwy Navarra yn gymaint, fwy neu lai, â chyfanswm yr ynni y mae'n ei ddefnyddio, ac erbyn 2010 bydd yn cynhyrchu 6.7 terawatt-awr. Mae arolygon barn yn Navarra yn dangos bod 85 y cant yn cefnogi ynni gwynt, bod 1 y cant yn ei erbyn a bod 14 y cant heb benderfynu.

Navarra depends heavily on tourism. The pilgrim's way to Santiago di Compostela passes through some of the wind farms. Since the wind farms were established there has been a substantial increase in the annual levels of tourism. That increase might not be directly due to renewable energy, but there is no evidence that the wind farms had any negative affect.

Mae Navarra yn dibynnu'n helaeth ar dwristiaeth. Mae llwybr y pererinion i Santiago di Compostela yn mynd drwy rai o'r ffermydd gwynt. Ers sefydlu'r ffermydd gwynt yno bu cynnydd sylweddol yn y lefelau blynyddol o dwristiaeth. Efallai nad yw'r cynnydd hwnnw'n ganlyniad uniongyrchol i ynni adnewyddadwy, ond nid oes unrhyw dystiolaeth bod y ffermydd gwynt wedi cael unrhyw effaith negyddol.

At present the renewable energy sector in Navarra employs 2,036 people.

Ar hyn o bryd mae'r sector ynni adnewyddadwy yn Navarra yn cyflogi 2,036 o bobl.

The Economic Development Committee's final recommendation is that the Assembly Government identifies the renewable energy sector of high growth potential in Wales. We should enthusiastically support that. At that meeting in Navarra we all saw the future, and it works.

Argymhelliad olaf y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yw y dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ganfod y sector ynni adnewyddadwy sydd â photensial twf uchel yng Nghymru. Dylem gefnogi hynny'n frwd. Yn y cyfarfod hwnnw yn Navarra gwnaethom oll weld y dyfodol, ac mae'n gweithio.

The energy review is continuing with a study

Mae'r adolygiad o ynni'n parhau ag

of energy conservation. We started with renewable energy because that is a field where appropriate Government action could have the biggest immediate affect. I urge Members to read the report. I urge the Government to accept it.

Ron Davies: It gives me great pleasure to support Phil Williams's comments. I thank Christine Gwyther, who was exemplary as Chair of the Economic Development Committee during our enquiry into renewable energy. Every Committee Member knew the difficulties that she was working under, but she remained committed and diligent throughout the process. I am sure that the report is a fitting comment on her time as Chair of that Committee.

I also support Phil's remarks concerning Jake Chapman, our expert advisor, and John Grimes, the clerk. I did not realise that John was a scientist—if I had known that we had two scientists on the Committee I would have thought that it was fixed. Finally, I thank you, Phil. That was the first time that I ever heard you confess that global warming brought you back to politics. I conclude from that that we now have the solution to global warming since you have decided to leave politics at the next election.

Phil played a significant role in that Committee when we discussed what might be politically feasible, and what might be attractive to the public. With your scientific rigour, you ensured that we were brought back to the agenda at all times. Every Committee Member benefited from your experience and wisdom.

The Committee's principal aim was to reach agreement. At the outset we could not have forecast that we would achieve agreement, owing to the large number of issues that could have been divisive. The Committee can draw credit from the fact that we resolved those issues through consensus.

It was important that we reached agreement on the problem of carbon emissions. We were all conscious of the difficulties surrounding

astudiaeth o arbed ynni. Gwnaethom ddechrau ag ynni adnewyddadwy am ei fod yn faes lle y gallai camau priodol gan y Llywodraeth gael yr effaith uniongyrchol fwyaf. Anogaf yr Aelodau i ddarllen yr adroddiad. Anogaf y Llywodraeth i'w dderbyn.

Ron Davies: Pleser mawr i mi yw ategu sylwadau Phil Williams. Diolchaf i Christine Gwyther, a oedd yn benigamp fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn ystod ein hymchwiliad i ynni adnewyddadwy. Gwyddai pob aelod o'r Pwyllgor am yr anawsterau yr oedd yn eu profi wrth weithio, ond daliodd yn ymroddedig ac yn ddiwyd drwy gydol y broses. Yr wyf yn sicr bod yr adroddiad yn deyrnged addas i'r amser a dreuliodd yn Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor hwnnw.

Yr wyf hefyd yn ategu sylwadau Phil am Jake Chapman, ein cynghorwr arbenigol, a John Grimes, y cler. Ni sylwedolwn mai gwyddonydd oedd John—pe gwybuaswn fod gennym ddau wyddonydd ar y Pwyllgor byddwn wedi credu bod hynny wedi'i drefnu ymlaen llaw. Yn olaf, diolch i chi, Phil. Dyna'r tro cyntaf erioed imi'ch clywed yn cyfaddef mai'r cynhesu byd-eang a ddaeth â chi'n ôl i wleidyddiaeth. Casglaf ar sail hynny fod yr ateb i'r cynhesu byd-eang gennym bellach gan eich bod wedi penderfynu rhoi'r gorau i wleidyddiaeth yn yr etholiad nesaf.

Gwnaeth Phil chwarae rôl bwysig yn y Pwyllgor pan oeddem yn trafod yr hyn a allai fod yn wleidyddol ymarferol, a'r hyn a allai apelio i'r cyhoedd. Gyda'ch manyldeb gwyddonol, gwnaethoch sicrhau ein bod yn cael ein tynnu'n ôl at yr agenda bob amser. Cafodd pob aelod o'r Pwyllgor fudd o'ch profiad a'ch doethineb.

Prif nod y Pwyllgor oedd dod i gytundeb. Ar y dechrau ni fyddem wedi gallu rhagweld y byddem yn cael cytundeb, oherwydd y nifer fawr o faterion a allasai beri rhwyg. Gall y Pwyllgor gymryd clod am ein bod wedi datrys y materion hynny drwy gonsensws.

Yr oedd yn bwysig inni ddod i gytundeb ar broblem gollyngiadau carbon. Yr oeddem oll yn ymwybodol o'r anawsterau ynghylch

carbon emissions, but, at an early stage we recognised that we had to face the problem of global warming, it was not something that was going to go away whether Phil was or was not in politics. We recognised that we were faced with the problem of rising sea levels. That had an international dimension, which we in Britain were not immune from. Renewable energy was central to the problem of carbon emissions, and as such, we recognised that we would have to make hard choices.

There was a wish—certainly at the outset of our investigations—to believe that we could find some comfortable solution that would not involve hard choices. Because we identified the hard choices that had to be made, the Committee was wiser as a result. All Committee members agreed with the conclusion that Wales must play its part.

I have two concerns. First, it is disappointing that the motion merely asks the Assembly to note the report. As the Minister was a member of the Committee, he is aware of our deliberations and knows the importance that we attached to this work. It is disappointing that the motion merely asks Members to note the report and does not give any indication of whether the Government of Wales accepts the recommendations and, if so, how it intends to take them forward.

Alun Cairns: Can you shed any light as to where the Minister is, bearing in mind that he is a member of the Committee?

Ron Davies: He is a member of the Committee; however, he is not my closest confidant. I presume that someone will be replying on the behalf of the Government of Wales.

The Government is merely noting the report. I had hoped for something more positive, and that the Government of Wales would say that it would accept, endorse and draw up an implementation strategy for the Committee's recommendations and that it was also prepared to respond to the wider issues identified during the investigation,

gollyngiadau carbon, ond gwnaethom gydnabod yn gynnar fod rhaid inni wynebu problem y cynhesu byd-eang. Nid oedd yn rhywbeth a ddiplannai pa un a oedd Phil yn gwleidyddai ai peidio. Gwnaethom gydnabod ein bod yn wynebu problem y codiad yn lefelau'r môr. Yr oedd dimensiwn rhyngwladol i hynny, nad oeddem ni ym Mhrydain yn ddiogel oddi wrtho. Yr oedd lle canolog i ynni adnewyddadwy ym mhroblem gollyngiadau carbon, ac oherwydd hynny, gwelsom y byddai'n rhaid inni wneud dewisiadau anodd.

Yr oedd awydd—ar ddechrau ein hymchwiliadau'n sicr—i gredu y gallem ddod o hyd i ryw ateb cyfforddus na fyddai'n golygu dewisiadau anodd. Am ein bod wedi canfod y dewisiadau anodd yr oedd yn rhaid eu gwneud, yr oedd y Pwyllgor yn ddoethach o ganlyniad. Yr oedd holl aelodau'r Pwyllgor yn cytuno â'r casgliad bod rhaid i Gymru chwarae ei rhan.

Mae dau fater yn peri pryder i mi. Yn gyntaf, mae'n siomedig nad yw'r cynnig ond yn gofyn i'r Cynulliad nodi'r adroddiad. Gan fod y Gweinidog yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor, mae'n ymwybodol o'n trafodaethau ac yn gwybod am y pwys a roddwn ar y gwaith hwn. Mae'n siomedig nad yw'r cynnig ond yn gofyn i Aelodau nodi'r adroddiad ac nad yw'n rhoi unrhyw arwydd ynghylch a yw Llywodraeth Cymru yn derbyn yr argymhellion ac, os ydyw, sut y mae'n bwriadu bwrw ymlaen â hwy.

Alun Cairns: A allwch daflu unrhyw oleuni ynghylch lle y mae'r Gweinidog, o gofio ei fod yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor?

Ron Davies: Mae'n aelod o'r Pwyllgor; fodd bynnag, nid ef yw fy nghyfrinachwr pennaf. Cymeraf y bydd rhywun yn ymateb ar ran Llywodraeth Cymru.

Dim ond nodi'r adroddiad y mae'r Llywodraeth. Yr oeddwn wedi gobeithio cael rhywbeth mwy cadarnhaol, ac y dywedai Llywodraeth Cymru y byddai'n derbyn, yn cymeradwyo ac yn paratoi strategaeth weithredu ar gyfer argymhellion y Pwyllgor a'i bod hefyd yn barod i ymateb i'r materion mwy cyffredinol a ganfuwyd yn ystod yr

particularly those in relation to energy consumption and energy efficiency. Although the Committee touched on those issues, we did not reach any conclusions on them.

Energy efficiency is particularly important. Phil mentioned the benchmarks on which the Committee agreed. Even if we meet the benchmark of 4 TWh for the production of electricity from renewable sources, we must still find a further 2 TWh from conventional sources. We must address that, as a solution has not yet been found. The Government must consider how to develop a strategy to deal with the forecasts of extra consumption and with efficiency.

My second concern—this is partly the Committee's fault, although I understand why Committee members were minded not to go down this road—is that we have not addressed the issue of nuclear power. There was an understanding among us that we did not necessarily want to explore it as it was potentially divisive. We knew that if we attempted to address carbon-free energy production, we would face the issue of nuclear power. We visited Wylfa and examined it in a scientifically rigorous manner. Its contribution to the local community as well as to the energy industry was an eye-opener for me. It is easy for politicians to be superficial and say that we should forget about nuclear energy because it is dangerous. We have not addressed that issue. If Wylfa is to be decommissioned within 20 or 25 years, that will increase the need to generate carbon-free electricity in Wales.

We must recognise that a range of small-scale, near-market technologies are available, including wave power, tidal power, solar power and biomass power. We must raise public awareness of this. We must also have a clear declaration from the Assembly Government that it supports the Committee's recommendations and that it will provide the policy and the resources required to encourage the development of such small-scale, near-market energy sources.

Alun Cairns: All Members agree that the

ymchwiliad, yn enwedig y rhai sy'n ymwneud â defnyddio ynni ac effeithlonrwydd ynni. Er bod y Pwyllgor wedi cyffwrdd â'r materion hynny, ni ddaethom i unrhyw gasgliadau arnynt.

Mae effeithlonrwydd ynni'n arbennig o bwysig. Soniodd Phil am y meincnodau y cytunodd y Pwyllgor arnynt. Hyd yn oed os cyrhaeddwn y feincnod o 4 terawatt-awr ar gyfer cynhyrchu trydan o ffynonellau adnewyddadwy, byddwn yn dal i orfod dod o hyd i 2 terawatt-awr o ffynonellau confensiynol. Rhaid inni ymdrin â hynny, gan na chafwyd hyd i ateb eto. Rhaid i'r Llywodraeth ystyried sut i ddatblygu strategaeth i ddelio â'r darogan am ddefnydd ychwanegol ac i ymdrin ag effeithlonrwydd.

Yr ail bryder sydd gennyf—a bai'r Pwyllgor yw hyn yn rhannol, er fy mod yn deall pam nad oedd aelodau'r Pwyllgor o blaid dilyn y trywydd hwn—yw nad ydym wedi ymdrin â mater ynni niwclear. Yr oedd dealltwriaeth yn ein mysg nad oeddem o reidrwydd am ymchwilio iddo gan y gallai beri cynnen. Yr oeddem yn gwybod, os ceisïem ymdrin â chynhyrchu ynni heb garbon, y byddem yn wynebu mater ynni niwclear. Bu inni ymweld â'r Wylfa a'i harchwilio mewn modd gwyddonol drylwyr. Yr oedd ei chyfraniad i'r gymuned leol yn ogystal â'r diwydiant ynni'n agoriad llygad i mi. Mae'n hawdd i wleidyddion fod yn arwynebol a dweud y dylem anghofio am ynni niwclear am ei fod yn beryglus. Nid ydym wedi ymdrin â'r mater hwnnw. Os yw'r Wylfa i'w digomisiynu o fewn 20 neu 25 mlynedd, bydd hynny'n creu mwy o angen i gynhyrchu trydan heb garbon yng Nghymru.

Rhaid inni gydnabod bod amryw o dechnolegau bach sy'n agos i'r farchnad ar gael, gan gynnwys ynni tonnau, ynni llanw, ynni haul ac ynni biomas. Rhaid inni hybu ymwybyddiaeth o hynny ymysg y cyhoedd. Rhaid inni hefyd gael datganiad pendant gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ei bod yn cefnogi argymhellion y Pwyllgor ac y bydd yn darparu'r polisi a'r adnoddau sydd eu hangen i hybu datblygiad ffynonellau ynni bach o'r fath sy'n agos i'r farchnad.

Alun Cairns: Mae pob Aelod yn cytuno ei

development of sustainable energy is important and that this report should be taken seriously. I recognise the efforts of the Committee Chair, Christine Gwyther, and I am sorry that she cannot be with us today. I also recognise the efforts of the Committee clerk, John Grimes, and the deputy clerk, Siân Wilkins. The Committee's expert adviser, Jake Chapman, also provided much support. We must recognise that there will be limitations because of the scale of the subject that the Committee sought to investigate.

All those involved agree that renewable sources are important for our future. I am glad to see that the Minister for Economic Development has arrived for this important debate. I look forward to hearing his response.

3:40 p.m.

Although the report includes careful analysis by a range of people and several views with limited scientific evidence to support them, all the consultees should be thanked for their input. However, we must recognise that there is still a need for a great deal of scientific research to further the cause.

I support wholeheartedly the concern shared by the majority of the contributors who recognised the visual impact that the generators of renewable sources, primarily wind turbines, would have on tourism. Almost everyone who mentioned this thought that there would be negative effects. One consultee suggested that wind farms would have a positive effect as a tourist attraction because that had been the case in England. However, that individual failed to take an important concept into consideration. The report highlights that in order to generate enough electricity—bearing in mind the lack of wind on occasions and excessive wind on others—there would have to be a network of wind farms stretching from the north of Scotland through Wales to the south of England. If that policy were implemented, given such a massive distribution of wind farms, it is highly unlikely that people would go somewhere specific to see them because they would be visible from wherever they were in the UK. The alternative proposed in the paper is a reliance on offshore wind

bod yn bwysig datblygu ynni cynaliadwy ac y dylid cymryd yr adroddiad hwn o ddifrif. Yr wyf yn cydnabod gwaith Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor, Christine Gwyther, ac mae'n ddrwg gennyf na all fod gyda ni heddiw. Yr wyf hefyd yn cydnabod gwaith clerck y Pwyllgor, John Grimes, a'r dirprwy glerc, Siân Wilkins. Rhoddwyd llawer o gymorth hefyd gan gynghorwr arbenigol y Pwyllgor, Jake Chapman. Rhaid inni gydnabod y bydd cyfyngiadau oherwydd maint y pwnc y ceisiodd y Pwyllgor ymchwilio iddo.

Mae pawb sy'n gysylltiedig yn cytuno bod ffynonellau adnewyddadwy'n bwysig i'n dyfodol. Yr wyf yn falch o weld bod y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd wedi cyrraedd ar gyfer y ddadl bwysig hon. Edrychaf ymlaen at glywed ei ymateb.

Er bod yr adroddiad yn cynnwys dadansoddi gofalus gan amryw o bobl a sawl barn heb fawr o dystiolaeth wyddonol i'w hategu, dylid diolch i bawb yr ymgynghorwyd â hwy am eu mewnbwn. Er hynny, rhaid inni gydnabod bod angen llawer iawn o ymchwil wyddonol o hyd i hyrwyddo'r achos.

Llwyr ategaf y pryder a fynegwyd gan y rhan fwyaf o'r cyfranwyr a gydnabu'r effaith weledol a gâi cynhyrchwyr ffynonellau adnewyddadwy, tyrbinau gwynt yn bennaf, ar dwristiaeth. Yr oedd bron pawb a soniodd am hyn yn credu y byddai effeithiau negyddol. Awgrymodd un o'r ymgynghoredigion y byddai ffermydd gwynt yn cael effaith gadarnhaol fel atyniad i ymwlewyr am mai felly y bu yn Lloegr. Fodd bynnag, methodd yr unigolyn hwnnw ag ystyried un cysyniad pwysig. Mae'r adroddiad yn tynnu sylw at y ffaith—gan gofio na fyddai gwynt ar brydiau ac y byddai gormod o wynt ar adegau eraill—y byddai'n rhaid cael rhwydwaith o ffermydd gwynt yn ymestyn o ogledd yr Alban drwy Gymru hyd dde Lloegr er mwyn cynhyrchu digon o drydan. Os câi'r polisi hwnnw ei roi ar waith, o gofio y byddai nifer aruthrol o ffermydd gwynt ar wasgar, mae'n dra annhebygol yr âi pobl i rywle penodol i'w gweld oherwydd gellid eu gweld ym mhle bynnag yr oeddent yn y DU. Y dewis arall a gynigir yn y papur yw y dylid dibynnu ar ffermydd gwynt ar y môr. Mae honno'n

farms. That is a relatively unproven technology and an equally obtrusive blot on sea views and tourist activities.

More consideration should be given to the opinions of people who live in areas affected by wind turbines. From the great uproar in Porthcawl, I know that the majority of people in my region of South Wales West are vehemently opposed to offshore windfarms off Rest Bay. Locals and visitors go to Porthcawl to relax on the beaches, surf the waves and bathe in the waters. Thirty offshore wind turbines are proposed for one of the most picturesque locations in south Wales. Each would be 400 feet high. As a comparison, that is 95 feet taller than the Statue of Liberty and there would be 30 of these structures in the sea. It would cause enormous damage to the tourist economy, particularly that generated by surfers. I am advised by an experienced surfer, David Davies, that that area has one of the highest rises and falls of sea in the world. Therefore, the effect on the tourist economy would be enormous and unacceptable.

Another suggestion for a source of renewable energy that would have a negative impact on the local environment and on tourism is the Severn barrage. That would destroy the tidal bore along the Severn—one of only two tidal bores in the world—which is also a major tourist attraction. Clearly, the Economic Development Committee's report is an important starting point for the debate. However, more scientific research needs to be conducted, which may give rise to new opportunities and proposals. In fact, the average cost of wind-generated electricity in Europe is expected to decrease by 10 times over the next decade. The falling cost of wind power would influence the debate in several ways.

The report suggests an almost total reliance on wind farms. Wales has a variety of options for renewable energy sources that go well beyond wind farms. Despite plentiful opportunities for generating hydro-power, the report only mentions them in passing. We must be careful not to blindly rush into a heavy reliance on wind farms, which are opposed on local and national levels.

dechnoleg gymharol amhrofedig ac yn amharu i'r un graddau ar olygfeydd o'r môr a gweithgareddau i ymwelwyr.

Dylid rhoi mwy o ystyriaeth i farn pobl sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd y mae tyrbinau gwynt yn effeithio arnynt. Ar ôl y stŵr ym Mhorthcawl, gwn fod y rhan fwyaf o bobl yn fy rhanbarth i, Gorllewin De Cymru, yn daer yn erbyn ffermydd gwynt yn y môr oddi ar Rest Bay. Mae pobl leol ac ymwelwyr yn mynd i Borthcawl i ymlacio ar y traethau, brigo tonnau ac ymdrochi yn y dŵr. Cynigir 30 o dyrbinau gwynt ar y môr ar gyfer un o'r lleoliadau prydferthaf yn y De. Byddai pob un yn 400 troedfedd o uchder. Er mwyn cymharu, mae hynny'n 95 troedfedd yn uwch na'r Statue of Liberty a byddai 30 o'r adeiladweithiau hyn yn y môr. Parai niwed dirfawr i'r economi twristiaeth, yn enwedig yr hyn a gynhyrchir gan frigwyr tonnau. Dywed brigwr tonnau profiadol, David Davies, wrthyf y ceir llanw a thrai sydd gyda'r mwyaf yn y byd yn yr ardal honno. Gan hynny, byddai effaith enfawr ac annerbyniol ar yr economi twristiaeth.

Awgrym arall ar gyfer ffynhonnell ynni adnewyddadwy a fyddai'n amharu ar yr amgylchedd lleol ac ar dwristiaeth yw morglawdd Hafren. Byddai hwnnw'n dinistrio'r eger ar afon Hafren—un o ddim ond dau eger yn y byd—sydd hefyd yn atyniad mawr i dwristiaid. Wrth gwrs, mae adroddiad y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn fan cychwyn pwysig i'r ddadl. Serch hynny, rhaid cynnal rhagor o ymchwil wyddonol, a allai arwain at gyfleoedd a chynigion newydd. Mewn gwirionedd, disgwylir y bydd cost gyfartalog trydan a gynhyrchir gan wynt yn Ewrop yn gostwng 10 gwaith dros y degawd nesaf. Byddai gostyngiad yng nghost ynni gwynt yn dylwanwadu ar y ddadl mewn sawl modd.

Mae'r adroddiad yn awgrymu dibyniaeth lwyr bron ar ffermydd gwynt. Mae amryw o ddewisiadau yng Nghymru ar gyfer ffynonellau ynni adnewyddadwy sy'n mynd ymhell y tu hwnt i ffermydd gwynt. Er gwaethaf y cyfleoedd lu i gynhyrchu ynni dŵr, nid yw'r adroddiad ond yn cyfeirio atynt wrth fynd heibio. Rhaid inni ochel rhag rhuthro'n ddifeddwl i ddibyniaeth helaeth ar ffermydd gwynt, a wrthwynebir ar lefelau

lleol a chenedlaethol.

Cynog Dafis: Beth yw eich barn ynghylch potensial pellach datblygu trydan o gyfeiriad cynlluniau dŵr? Deallaf mai cymharol gyfyngedig yw'r cyfanswm posibl o gynhyrchu ynni o ddŵr.

Cynog Dafis: What is your view on the further potential of developing electricity from hydro schemes? I understand that the total possible output from hydro-power is relatively limited.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: You only have 20 seconds in which to answer.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Dim ond 20 eiliad sydd gennych i ateb.

Alun Cairns: Given the time limitations, I suggest that we do not rush ahead in one particular direction without the scientific evidence to explore others. We need a diverse range of energy supplies, and the nuclear option cannot be ruled out. Further scientific research is needed. It has been a long time since Sellafield was upgraded, or had any major investment in terms of reprocessing the nuclear apparatus. That may well provide one of the important options—not a major one—in terms of the whole spectrum of energy sources available.

Alun Cairns: Oherwydd y cyfyngiadau ar amser, awgrymaf na ddylem ruthro yn ein blaenau i un cyfeiriad penodol heb dystiolaeth wyddonol i ymchwilio i rai eraill. Mae arnom angen amrywiaeth o gyflenwadau ynni, ac ni ellir diystyru'r dewis niwclear. Mae angen rhagor o ymchwil wyddonol. Aeth llawer o amser heibio ers uwchraddio Sellafield, neu unrhyw fuddsoddi helaeth ynddo o ran ailbrosesu'r cyfarpar niwclear. Mae'n ddigon posibl mai hwnnw fydd un o'r dewisiadau pwysig—nid un mawr—yng nghyd-destun yr holl sbectrwm o ffynonellau ynni sydd ar gael.

Mick Bates: I join others in paying tribute to the way that Christine Gwyther handled the evidence and this Committee report. It is a tribute to her inclusive attitude that we have an agreement in this report and that it is such a landmark document in the development of renewable energy in Wales. I also thank all the people who put it together—the clerk, John Grimes, did a wonderful job—and the consultees who presented evidence.

Mick Bates: Ymunaf ag eraill i dalu teyrnged i'r modd y mae Christine Gwyther wedi trafod y dystiolaeth a'r adroddiad Pwyllgor hwn. Teyrnged i'w hymagwedd gynhwysol yw bod gennym gytundeb ar yr adroddiad hwn a'i fod yn ddogfen mor nodedig yn natblygiad ynni adnewyddadwy yng Nghymru. Diolchaf hefyd i bawb a'i lluniodd—gwnaeth y cler, John Grimes, waith rhagorol—a'r ymgynghoredigion a gyflwynodd dystiolaeth.

We must start with the question of why we need to consider this document so seriously, not only in the context of sustainable development and our duty under the Government of Wales Act 1998 (121), but also, to reiterate why climate change is such an important issue. I draw your attention to a recent comment by the National Farmers' Union:

Rhaid inni ddechrau drwy ofyn pam y mae'n rhaid inni ystyried y ddogfen hon mewn modd mor ddifrifol, nid yn unig yng nghyd-destun datblygu cynaliadwy a'n dyletswydd o dan Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 (121), ond hefyd, i ailddatgan pam y mae newid yn yr hinsawdd yn fater mor bwysig. Tynnaf eich sylw at sylw diweddar gan Undeb Cenedlaethol Ffermwyr:

'Climate change is the biggest challenge we face today'.

Newid yn yr hinsawdd yw'r her fwyaf a wynebwn heddiw.

Many people will be aware of the impact of climate change around the world. For example, it is estimated that by 2050, over 100 million people a year will be victims of

Bydd llawer o bobl yn ymwybodol o effaith newid yn yr hinsawdd o gwmpas y byd. Er enghraifft, amcangyfrifir y bydd mwy na 100 miliwn o bobl y flwyddyn erbyn 2050 yn

global warming related disasters, such as floods, droughts and windstorms. That is why we must carry forward this report's recommendations; they contain significant challenges to the Assembly. Accepting the report is one stage, but acting on it and implementing its recommendations is another. It is urgent. In the next 20 years, half of the power stations in England and Wales will be shut down. There will be an energy gap, and therefore, there will be massive potential in Wales to exploit that gap by creating a renewable energy industry here.

We are not considering one source in particular. We are looking at a mix of on and offshore wind energy, biomass, solar, wave and tidal power. The crucial point of this report is that we are considering a mix of renewable energies to reduce carbon emissions. I know from the experience in Montgomeryshire, where there have been the first large onshore wind farms, that there are no difficulties in development. That is the Minister's first challenge. We established a group a long time ago, which is examining the aspects of technical advice note 8, to give encouragement to renewable energy development. I am sure that the Minister for Environment and the Minister for Economic Development are aware that the Scottish Executive took the bull by the horns immediately and offered great incentives to companies who wanted to develop there. That issue must be urgently considered. Similarly, in the planning process, we now have all the necessary data in Wales to identify areas with great potential for renewable energy. The Countryside Council for Wales undertook the GIS exercise.

We must ensure that we co-ordinate this planning process with developing this report and taking forward its recommendations. It has six broad recommendations, but we will never realise them unless the planning procedures are right and supportive. Equally important is embedded generation, and we must ensure that we can receive electricity from the point that it is produced. There is a tremendous role to play, and I know that the Minister sees the economic potential of this,

dioddef gan drychinebau sy'n gysylltiedig â'r cynhesu byd-eang, fel llifogydd, cyfnod o sychder a stormydd gwynt. Dyna pam y mae'n rhaid inni fwrw ymlaen ag argymhellion yr adroddiad hwn; mae ynddynt heriau sylweddol i'r Cynulliad. Mae derbyn yr adroddiad yn un cam, ond mae gweithredu arno a rhoi ei argymhellion ar waith yn un arall. Mae hyn yn fater brys. Yn yr 20 mlynedd nesaf, caeir hanner y gorsafoedd trydan yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Bydd bwlch ynni, ac, felly, bydd potensial aruthrol yng Nghymru i elwa ar y bwlch hwnnw drwy greu diwydiant ynni adnewyddadwy yma.

Nid ydym yn ystyried un ffynhonnell yn benodol. Yr ydym yn ystyried cymysgedd o ynni gwynt ar y tir ac ar y môr, ynni biomas, ynni haul, ac ynni tonnau a'r llanw. Y pwynt hollbwysig yn yr adroddiad hwn yw ein bod yn ystyried cymysgedd o fathau o ynni adnewyddadwy i leihau gollyngiadau carbon. Gwn oddi wrth y profiad yn Sir Drefaldwyn, lle y cafwyd y ffermydd gwynt mawr cyntaf ar y tir, nad oes anawsterau wrth ddatblygu. Dyna'r her gyntaf i'r Gweinidog. Bu inni sefydlu grŵp amser maith yn ôl, sy'n archwilio agweddau ar nodyn cyngor technegol 8, i hybu datblygu ynni adnewyddadwy. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd yn ymwybodol bod Gweithrediaeth yr Alban wedi plymio iddi ar unwaith a chynnig anogaethau mawr i gwmnïau a oedd am ddatblygu yn y fan honno. Rhaid ystyried y mater hwnnw ar frys. Yn yr un modd, yn y broses gynllunio, mae gennym yr holl ddata y mae arnom eu hangen yng Nghymru i ddynodi ardaloedd sydd â photensial mawr ar gyfer ynni adnewyddadwy. Ymgymrodd Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru â'r gwaith systemau gwybodaeth ddaearyddol.

Rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn cydlynu'r broses gynllunio hon â'r gwaith o ddatblygu'r adroddiad hwn a bwrw ymlaen â'i argymhellion. Mae ynddo chwe argymhelliad cyffredinol, ond ni wnawn byth eu cyflawni os nad yw'r gweithdrefnau cynllunio'n gywir ac yn gefnogol. Mae defnyddio cynhyrchwyr dosbarthu lleol yr un mor bwysig, a rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn gallu derbyn trydan o'r man y'i cynhyrchir. Mae rôl aruthrol i'w chwarae, a gwn fod y Gweinidog yn gweld y

but we must ensure that these companies are encouraged. Look at the tidal schemes that are now available with lagoons. We must support these schemes to ensure that they have the funding to establish a robust feasibility of their potential, otherwise, we will never move forward. Owen adhered to the issue of public perception in his speech on these recommendations. There is some way to go on this matter. I recommend having exemplars throughout Wales and an advertising campaign to bring home to people the necessity of producing energy from renewable sources. Every member of the Economic Development Committee signed up to this report. Let us ensure that we continue with what Chris would like to see, namely an inclusive attitude to implementing it, since that remains the critical stage.

3:50 p.m.

Finally, I listened with interest to the Spanish experiences described at the National Assembly sustainable energy group meeting last week. This goal is possible. Many people in the field of renewable energy say that it is impossible to achieve; but the example that we saw—which Phil described—means that it is possible to achieve something in Wales. I share other Members' impatience to ensure that Wales becomes an exemplar to the rest of the world, with renewable energy projects throughout the country. It is high time that we heard how that will be actioned. The recommendations are here; let us hear about implementing them.

Janet Davies: I congratulate the Committee and the officials on producing this report. Plaid Cymru is committed to moving as quickly as possible towards increasing renewable energy production. We are pleased to see that the majority of respondents to the public consultation accept the theory of global warming and support the National Assembly's plans to reduce carbon emissions. However, they are also right to raise the issue of reduction in energy consumption. I was pleased to hear Phil say that the Committee will consider energy conservation, but it is important that it was

potensial economaidd sydd yn hyn, ond rhaid inni sicrhau anogaeth i'r cwmnïau hyn. Edrychwch ar y cynlluniau llanwol sydd bellach ar gael gyda morlynnoedd. Rhaid inni gefnogi'r cynlluniau hyn i sicrhau bod ganddynt y cyllid i gynnal astudiaeth dichonoldeb ddibynadwy ar eu potensial, neu, fel arall, ni fyddwn byth yn symud ymlaen. Daliodd Owen at fater canfyddiad y cyhoedd yn ei araith ar yr argymhellion hyn. Mae cryn ffordd i fynd ar mater hwn. Yr wyf yn argymhell y dylid cael esiamplau ledled Cymru ac ymgyrch hysbysebu i beri i bobl sylweddoli bod angen cynhyrchu ynni o ffynonellau adnewyddadwy. Mae pob aelod o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd wedi cytuno ar yr adroddiad hwn. Gadewch inni sicrhau ein bod yn parhau â'r hyn y carai Chris ei weld, sef ymagwedd gynhwysol at ei weithredu, gan mai hwnnw yw'r cam hollbwysig.

Yn olaf, gwrandewais gyda diddordeb ar y profiadau a gafwyd yn Sbaen a ddisgrifiwyd yn y cyfarfod o grŵp ynni cynaliadwy'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yr wythnos diwethaf. Mae'r nod hon yn bosibl. Dywed llawer o bobl ym maes ynni adnewyddadwy ei bod yn amhosibl ei chyrraedd; ond mae'r enghraifft a welsom—y bu i Phil ei disgrifio—yn golygu ei bod yn bosibl cyflawni rhywbeth yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn dyheu yn yr un modd ag Aelodau eraill am sicrhau y bydd Cymru'n esiampl i weddill y byd, gyda phrosiectau ynni adnewyddadwy ledled y wlad. Mae'n hen bryd inni glywed sut y rhoddir hynny ar waith. Mae'r argymhellion yma; gadewch inni glywed am y dull o'u gweithredu.

Janet Davies: Llongyfarchaf y Pwyllgor a'r swyddogion ar gynhyrchu'r adroddiad hwn. Mae Plaid Cymru wedi ymrwymo i symud ymlaen mor fuan ag y bo modd tuag at gynhyrchu mwy o ynni adnewyddadwy. Yr ydym yn falch bod y rhan fwyaf o'r rhai a ymatebodd i'r ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus yn derbyn damcaniaeth y cynhesu byd-eang ac yn cefnogi cynlluniau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i leihau gollyngiadau carbon. Fodd bynnag, maent hefyd yn iawn i godi mater lleihau'r ynni a ddefnyddir. Yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed Phil yn dweud y bydd y Pwyllgor yn ystyried arbed ynni, ond mae'n

raised at this moment.

At present, wind is the most common renewable energy source in Wales, although we look forward to more diverse methods of production in the future. Wind power has aroused a small number of objectors who have mounted a strong campaign. Onshore windfarms have been opposed for some time, and many opponents have suggested that they should be located offshore. However, now that an offshore windfarm has been proposed at Scarweather Sands at Porthcawl and Port Talbot, it is interesting to note that objections to that are running high. The nearest proposed windfarm is three and half miles offshore. I disagree quite strongly with some of Alun Cairns's comments. It is important that, in supporting a principle, you have the courage to keep to it when practical issues emerge. The lesson from these objections is that developers should understand the sensitivity of such proposals.

Alun Cairns: The view that I aired in my speech is consistent with the principles that I have been advocating for many years. I am not calling for windfarms not to be established at Porthcawl because I do not happen to believe that they should be there. That is in line with the principles that I have upheld for many years.

Janet Davies: The Committee, of which you are a member, unanimously supported this report.

Alun Cairns: That is cheap.

Janet Davies: It is not cheap; it is true.

The lesson in this matter is that developers should not only ensure that people understand particular developments, but that they should also include the rationale behind wind energy generation. It seems inevitable that, if issues are not properly debated in schools and colleges, on radio, television and other media or in pubs and clubs and on the streets of Wales, every form of renewable energy production will give rise to protest. The Assembly Government should get the debate underway quickly.

bwysig ei fod wedi'i godi ar yr adeg hon.

Ar hyn o bryd, gwynt yw'r ffynhonnell ynni adnewyddadwy fwyaf cyffredin yng Nghymru, er ein bod yn edrych ymlaen at ddulliau cynhyrchu mwy amrywiol yn y dyfodol. Mae ynni gwynt wedi cynhyrfu nifer fach o wrthwynebwyr sydd wedi sefydlu ymgyrch gref. Gwrthwynebir ffermydd gwynt ar y tir ers cryn amser, ac mae llawer o wrthwynebwyr wedi awgrymu y dylid eu lleoli ar y môr. Fodd bynnag, a fferm wynt ar y môr wedi'i chynnig bellach ar Scarweather Sands ym Mhorthcawl ac ym Mhort Talbot, diddorol yw nodi bod gwrthwynebiadau cryf i hynny. Mae'r fferm wynt arfaethedig agosaf yn dair milltir a hanner oddi ar yr arfordir. Anghytunaf yn eithaf cryf â rhai o sylwadau Alun Cairns. Mae'n bwysig, wrth gefnogi egwyddor, ichi fod yn ddigon dewr i'w harddel pan fo materion ymarferol yn codi. Y wers sy'n codi o'r gwrthwynebiadau hyn yw y dylai datblygwyr ddeall sensitifrwydd cynigion o'r fath.

Alun Cairns: Mae'r farn a wyntyllais yn fy araith yn gyson â'r egwyddorion yr wyf yn eu cymell ers blynyddoedd lawer. Nid wyf yn galw am beidio â sefydlu ffermydd gwynt ym Mhorthcawl am fy mod yn digwydd credu na ddylent fod yno. Mae hynny'n unol â'r egwyddorion yr wyf yn eu harddel ers blynyddoedd lawer.

Janet Davies: Mae'r Pwyllgor, yr ydych yn aelod ohono, wedi cefnogi'r adroddiad hwn yn unfrydol.

Alun Cairns: Mae hwnnw'n sylw gwael.

Janet Davies: Nid yw'n wael; mae'n wir.

Y wers i'w dysgu yn y mater hwn yw nid yn unig y dylai datblygwyr sicrhau bod pobl yn deall datblygiadau penodol, ond y dylent hefyd gynnwys sail resymegol cynhyrchu trydan o wynt. Mae'n ymddangos yn anochel, os na thrafodir materion yn briodol mewn ysgolion a cholegau, ar y radio, y teledu a'r cyfryngau eraill neu mewn tafarnau a chlybiau ac ar strydoedd Cymru, y bydd pob math o gynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy yn arwain at wrthdystio. Dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad gychwyn y ddadl yn fuan.

The appendix to the report, on myths about wind generation, is of value. There is no doubt that there can be an adverse visual impact in some circumstances, and the report agrees. However, you get nothing for nothing. In other words, to benefit from reducing carbon emissions, something will be lost. Plaid Cymru's view, however, is that the visual impact disbenefits of wind energy generation are small compared to the great benefits that should ensue.

The report points out that the European Union's water framework directive could give rise to difficulties in hydro-generation. I ask the Assembly Government to lobby the European Commission for a derogation for Wales.

I note that there is virtually no comment in the report on the recommendation for an embedded generation, which is how renewable energy and combined heat and power sources are fed into the network, although Phil mentioned it in his speech. However, there is a need for modification and I want to know how the Assembly Government proposes to pursue it. For the longer term, will the Assembly Government bear in mind that to rise above the level of 20 per cent of energy derived from renewable sources, additional funding is required?

Plaid Cymru has been opposed to nuclear power generation for many years. The environmental issues have always been clear to me. On safety, however carefully nuclear power has been operated, no satisfactory solution has been found for the long-term storage of high-level radioactive waste, or for the permanent disposal of plants at the end of their lives. However, as nuclear plants are located in rural areas where there is little other employment, we must ensure that, when they come to the end of their lives, alternative employment is available. Plaid Cymru sees renewable sources of power generation, in as wide a range of types as possible, as the future and as a foundation for economic opportunities. However, the Assembly Government has a responsibility for acquiring the skills and for ensuring that

Mae'r atodiad i'r adroddiad, ar fythau ynghylch cynhyrchu ynni o wynt, yn werthfawr. Nid oes dwywaith y gall bod effaith weledol anffafriol o dan rai amgylchiadau, a dyna'r farn a geir yn yr adroddiad. Er hynny, ni chewch ddim am ddim. Mewn geiriau eraill, er mwyn cael budd o leihau gollyngiadau carbon, collir rhywbeth. Barn Plaid Cymru, fodd bynnag, yw bod anfanteision cynhyrchu ynni o wynt o ran ei effaith weledol yn fach o'u cymharu â'r manteision mawr a ddylai ddilyn.

Mae'r adroddiad yn nodi y gallai cyfarwydddeb fframwaith dŵr yr Undeb Ewropeaidd beri anawsterau mewn cynhyrchu trydan dŵr. Gofynnaf i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad lobïo'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd i gael rhan-ddirywiad ar gyfer Cymru.

Nodaf nad oes bron ddim sylw yn yr adroddiad ar yr argymhelliad ar gyfer defnyddio cynhyrchwyr dosbarthu lleol, sef y modd y caiff ffynonellau ynni adnewyddadwy a gwres a phŵer ar y cyd eu bwydo i'r rhwydwaith, er bod Phil wedi sôn am hyn yn ei araith. Er hynny, mae angen newid ac yr wyf am wybod sut y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn bwriadu mynd ynghylch hynny. Ar gyfer y tymor hwy, a wnaiff Llywodraeth y Cynulliad gofio bod angen cyllid ychwanegol i godi uwchlaw'r lefel o 20 y cant o ynni a geir o ffynonellau adnewyddadwy.

Mae Plaid Cymru wedi gwrthwynebu cynhyrchu ynni niwclear ers blynyddoedd lawer. Mae'r materion amgylcheddol yn glir i mi erioed. Ynghylch diogelwch, ni waeth pa mor ddiogel y gweithredwyd ynni niwclear, ni chafwyd ateb boddhaol ar gyfer storio gwastraff ymbelydrol iawn yn y tymor hir, nac ar gyfer gwaredu gweithfeydd yn barhaol ar ddiwedd eu hoes. Fodd bynnag, gan fod gweithfeydd niwclear wedi'u lleoli mewn ardaloedd gwledig lle nad oes fawr o gyflogaeth arall, rhaid inni sicrhau bod gwaith arall ar gael pan ddeuant i ddiwedd eu hoes. Mae Plaid Cymru o'r farn mai ffynonellau adnewyddadwy ar gyfer cynhyrchu ynni, ar gymaint o wahanol ffurfiau ag y bo modd, biau'r dyfodol a'u bod yn cynnig sylfaen i gyfleoedd economaidd. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad

the investment is in place.

In supporting the recommendations of this report, Plaid Cymru expects the Assembly Government to draw-up a strategy to implement them. What will the timescale be and will it address the issues of consumption and efficiency? Mick Bates, I think, mentioned that the level of energy generation in Wales is forecast to be about 40 terawatt hours by 2010, a rise of six TWh from today. Therefore, the benchmark of four TWh from renewable energy sources will only lessen the growth—it will not reduce the current carbon emissions. A reduction in demand and an increase in efficiency are thus crucial to meet the spirit of the Committee's wishes rather than meeting its superficial recommendations. A public education campaign is desperately needed and I hope that the National Assembly and its sponsored bodies will begin by making a real statement, by using green energy themselves.

David Davies: There is no doubt that, over the next 15 years, we face an energy crisis. We face a lack of energy and we may run out of electricity at times—in a situation similar to that seen in California—because of the number of power stations, of all types, that will close over the next 10 to 15 years.

As yet, there has not been as full a discussion as I would have liked, as to what constitutes clean, green energy. Phil Williams began this debate by mentioning that climate change results from carbon and other emissions; however, there is a certain amount of doubt as to whether or not the earth is warming up—some people say that it is cooling down and that an ice age is long overdue. Leaving that aside, unlike Ron Davies, Phil did not mention nuclear energy. Whatever the pros and cons of nuclear energy, there is no doubt that, in terms of emissions into the atmosphere, it is the cleanest form of energy. Of course there are many disadvantages, the main one being residue. However, there is no doubt that, using the strict measure of carbon dioxide emissions, nuclear energy is very clean and we must begin considering it with

ymgymryd â'r cyfrifoldeb dros feithrin y sgiliau a sicrhau y ceir buddsoddi.

Wrth gefnogi argymhellion yr adroddiad hwn, mae Plaid Cymru yn disgwyl i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad lunio strategaeth i'w rhoi ar waith. Beth fydd yr amserlen ac a fydd yn ymdrin â materion defnydd ac effeithlonrwydd? Credaf mai Mick Bates a ddywedodd mai'r darogan yw y bydd maint yr ynni a gynhyrchir yng Nghymru tua 40 awr terawatt erbyn 2010, cynnydd o chwe awr terawatt o'i gymharu â heddiw. Felly, ni fydd y feincnod o bedwar awr terawatt o ffynonellau ynni adnewyddadwy ond yn lleihau'r cynnydd—ni fydd yn lleihau'r gollyngiadau carbon presennol. Felly, mae'n hollbwysig cael gostyngiad yn y galw a mwy o effeithlonrwydd er mwyn dilyn ysbryd dymuniadau'r Pwyllgor yn hytrach na dilyn ei argymhellion arwynebol. Mae taer angen ymgyrch addysg gyhoeddus a gobeithiaf y bydd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a'r cyrff y mae'n eu noddi yn dechrau drwy wneud datganiad go-iawn, drwy ddefnyddio ynni gwyrdd eu hunain.

David Davies: Nid oes dwywaith nad ydym yn wynebu argyfwng ynni dros y 15 mlynedd nesaf. Yr ydym yn wynebu prinder ynni a gallem fod heb drydan ar brydiau—mewn sefyllfa debyg i'r un a welwyd yng Nghaliffornia—oherwydd y nifer o orsafoedd trydan, o bob math, a fydd yn cau dros y 10 i 15 mlynedd nesaf.

Hyd yn hyn, ni fu trafodaeth mor llawn ag y dymunaswn, o ran yr hyn yw ynni gwyrdd, glân. Agorodd Phil Williams y ddadl hon drwy ddweud bod newid yn yr hinsawdd yn ganlyniad i ollyngiadau carbon a gollyngiadau eraill; er hynny, mae rhywfaint o amheuaeth ynghylch a yw'r ddaear yn cynhesu ai peidio—dywed rhai ei bod yn oeri a bod disgwyl oes iâ ers tro. Gan adael hynny o'r neilltu, yn wahanol i Ron Davies, ni soniodd Phil am ynni niwclear. Beth bynnag fo manteision ac anfanteision ynni niwclear, nid oes amheuaeth, o ran gollyngiadau i'r awyrgylch, nad hwnnw yw'r math glanaf o ynni. Mae llawer o anfanteision, wrth gwrs, a'r un bennaf yw gweddillion. Er hynny, nid oes dwywaith, gan ddefnyddio gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid fel yr unig ffon fesur, nad yw ynni niwclear yn lân iawn a rhaid inni

an open mind.

ddechrau ei ystyried â meddwl agored.

4:00 p.m.

Phil said that the answer lies with windfarms. There is no doubt that windfarms make a contribution, but the contribution of two-thirds that he mentioned appears to be too optimistic. Perhaps I should not do this, but I take issue with him over some of the figures that he used. I understand that a wind turbine will generate about 3 megawatts of electricity. If I noted Phil Williams' words correctly, he mentioned installing some 350 turbines over the next couple of years—200 on land and 150 offshore. That would generate a total of a 1,050 megawatts. It might interest you to know, Phil, that a nuclear power station the size of Oldbury will generate some 850 megawatts, which is enough to power a city the size of Bristol. The population of Bristol is much smaller than Wales, therefore, with the best will in the world, your windmills will not be enough to power the whole of Wales over the years to come. There is another problem with wind turbines: they do not generate a constant source of electricity, unlike many other energy forms. It is difficult to keep electricity; there is technology to put it into batteries, but you lose a great deal of the power. The best way to use electricity is straight from the national grid, but you cannot always do that with wind turbines. We must consider the alternative forms that exist, such as solar power, which has the potential to be developed much further. However, at present, it is highly expensive and does not generate the vast quantities of electricity that we need. Similarly, biomass has potential, but it will not be reached for many years yet. We should be considering the way that we use electricity. We could achieve the most spectacular results by using existing technology, which could cut the amount of domestic electricity we use by 30 to 50 per cent. I am sure that that statistic would also apply to electricity in the workplace. However, no matter what alternative forms of electricity we consider, because of the planning problems and the length of time that it takes to build a power station, whether it is, nuclear, gas, coal or whatever, they will not be enough to supply us with the power that we will need over the next 15 or 20 years.

Dywedodd Phil mai ffermydd gwynt yw'r ateb. Nid oes dwywaith nad yw ffermydd gwynt yn cyfrannu, ond mae'r cyfraniad o ddwy ran o dair a grybwyllodd yn ymddangos yn rhy optimistaidd. Efallai na ddylwn wneud hyn, ond anghytunaf ag ef ynghylch rhai o'r ffigurau a ddefnyddiodd. Deallaf y bydd tyrbin gwynt yn cynhyrchu tua 3 megawatt o drydan. Os nodais eiriau Phil yn gywir, soniodd am osod tua 350 o dyrbinau dros y ddwy flynedd nesaf—200 ar y tir a 150 ar y môr. Cynhyrchai hynny gyfanswm o 1,050 megawatt. Gallai fod o ddiddordeb ichi wybod, Phil, fod gorsaf drydan niwclear o faint un Oldbury yn cynhyrchu tua 850 megawatt, sy'n ddigon o ynni ar gyfer dinas o faint Bryste. Mae poblogaeth Bryste yn llai o lawer nag un Cymru, felly, gyda phob ewyllys da yn y byd, ni fydd eich melinau gwynt yn ddigon i ddarparu ynni ar gyfer Cymru gyfan dros y blynyddoedd nesaf. Mae problem arall ynghylch tyrbinau gwynt: ni chynhyrchant ffynhonnell drydan gyson, yn wahanol i lawer o fathau eraill o ynni. Mae'n anodd cadw trydan; ceir technoleg i'w roi mewn batris, ond collir llawer iawn o'r ynni. Y modd gorau o ddefnyddio trydan yw ei gymryd yn syth o'r grid cenedlaethol, ond ni ellir gwneud hynny bob amser gyda thyrbinau gwynt. Rhaid inni ystyried y gwahanol fathau sydd ar gael, fel ynni haul, y gellid ei ddatblygu ymhellach o lawer. Fodd bynnag, ar hyn o bryd, mae'n ddrud dros ben ac nid yw'n cynhyrchu'r symiau enfawr o drydan y mae arnom eu hangen. Mae potensial mewn biomas, yn yr un modd, ond ni chyflawnir hynny am flynyddoedd lawer. Dylem ystyried sut y defnyddiwn drydan. Gallem sicrhau'r canlyniadau mwyaf syfrdanol drwy ddefnyddio'r dechnoleg bresennol, a allai dorri maint y trydan a ddefnyddiwn yn y cartref o 30 i 50 y cant. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'r ystadegyn hwnnw'n berthnasol i'r gweithle hefyd. Fodd bynnag, ni waeth pa fathau eraill o drydan a ystyriwn, oherwydd y problemau cynllunio a'r amser a gymerir i godi gorsaf drydan, boed honno'n un niwclear, nwy, glo neu beth bynnag, ni fyddant yn ddigon i'n cyflenwi â'r ynni y bydd arnom ei angen dros y 15 i 20 mlynedd

nesaf.

We must make some decisions now, and they will be tough ones. It could take 10 years to build a nuclear power station and five or six years to develop a windfarm, and time is running out. The best solution is to have a good mix of all forms of alternative electricity, but we cannot go on with our head in the sand. We must take some tough decisions to safeguard future energy supplies and to ensure that our towns, cities and countryside have the electricity that we will need.

The Minister for Economic Development (Andrew Davies): I join colleagues in thanking members of the Economic Development Committee for this report, particularly the Chair; I also express my sorrow for her recent bereavement. I also thank the Committee clerk and the secretariat for producing this report. I apologise for not being present for the start of this debate, but that does not mean that I do not take this issue seriously. I have been working closely with my Cabinet colleagues, particularly Sue Essex, on the issue of energy. I will respond to the Committee's report in early February, giving the Assembly Government's formal position on energy and future energy generation. The significance that I attach to this subject is indicated by my visit to Aberthaw power station last Thursday to discuss its future with the management. It makes a huge contribution to energy production in south Wales, and I was particularly pleased to hear its announcement yesterday that it was considering a feasibility study into flue-gas desulphurisation technology, which will improve the station's environmental performance. I also gave an early indication of my views when I responded to Richard Edwards last year in the short debate on nuclear power generation. However, I will give a considered response after discussing this with Cabinet colleagues, particularly technical advice note 8 and planning issues, which I have been discussing closely with Sue Essex.

Renewable energy is a key mechanism in meeting the challenge of reducing carbon emissions, as indicated by the Kyoto treaty. It

Rhaid inni wneud rhai penderfyniadau'n awr, a byddant yn rhai anodd. Gallai gymryd 10 mlynedd i godi gorsaf drydan niwclear a phump i chwe mlynedd i ddatblygu fferm wynt, ac mae amser yn mynd yn brin. Yr ateb gorau yw cael cymysgedd da o bob math o drydan gwahanol, ond ni allwn ddal i guddio'n pennau yn y tywod. Rhaid inni wneud rhai penderfyniadau anodd i ddiogelu cyflenwadau ynni ar gyfer y dyfodol ac i sicrhau y caiff ein trefi, ein dinasoedd a chefn gwlad y trydan y bydd arnom ei angen.

Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd (Andrew Davies): Ymunaf â chyd-Aelodau i ddiolch i aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd am yr adroddiad hwn, yn enwedig y Cadeirydd; yr wyf finnau'n mynegi fy nhriswch ynghylch ei phrofedigaeth ddiweddar. Diolchaf hefyd i glerc y Pwyllgor a'r ysgrifenyddiaeth am gynhyrchu'r adroddiad hwn. Ymddiheuraf am beidio â bod yn bresennol ar gyfer dechrau'r ddadl hon, ond nid yw hynny'n golygu nad wyf yn cymryd y mater hwn o ddifrif. Bûm yn cydweithio'n agos â'm cyd-Weinidogion yn y Cabinet, yn enwedig Sue Essex, ar fater ynni. Ymatebaf i adroddiad y Pwyllgor ddechrau Chwefror, gan roi safbwynt ffurfiol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar ynni a chynhyrchu ynni yn y dyfodol. Dangosir y pwys a roddaf ar y pwnc hwn gan fy ymweliad â gorsaf drydan Aberddawan ddydd Iau diwethaf i drafod ei dyfodol gyda'r rheolwyr. Mae ei chyfraniad i gynhyrchu ynni yn y De yn anferth, ac yr oeddwn yn arbennig o falch o glywed y cyhoeddiad ganddi ddoe ei bod yn ystyried cynnal astudiaeth dichonoldeb ar dechnoleg disyllffyrn nwy ffliwiau, a fydd yn gwella perfformiad amgylcheddol yr orsaf. Rhoddais arwydd cynnar o'm barn hefyd pan ymatebais i Richard Edwards y llynedd yn y ddadl fer ar gynhyrchu ynni niwclear. Fodd bynnag, rhoddaf ymateb ystyriol ar ôl trafod hyn gyda'm cyd-Weinidogion yn y Cabinet, yn enwedig nodyn cyngor technegol 8 a materion cynllunio, y bûm yn eu trafod yn fanwl gyda Sue Essex.

Mae ynni adnewyddadwy yn fecanwaith allweddol i ateb yr her o leihau gollyngiadau carbon, fel y nododd cytundeb Kyoto. Mae'n

allows Wales to demonstrate its commitment and become a global showcase for clean energy development. It also demonstrates our commitment to sustainable development. As I have indicated previously, in Committee and in Plenary, the Economic Development Committee's work will contribute to setting realistic and credible Welsh targets for renewable energy generation. It can also provide a significant contribution to economic regeneration, particularly in rural areas. I have been working with Sue Essex on the sustainable business action plan and on environmental goods and services—in which renewable energy sits—which can make a significant contribution to generating energy in Wales and to employment. However, for the foreseeable future, our energy needs will be supplied by traditional means of generating power: gas, coal and nuclear. Renewable energy gives us a good opportunity to develop and support this area of technology to present Wales as a global showcase for sustainable energy generation.

I agree with David Davies, but we need a balance. We need to preserve present and future generations' energy supplies, and for the foreseeable future, coal, gas and nuclear energy will provide for those needs. However, we need to move increasingly towards more renewable energy-production sources. As I said, I will make a statement early in February on our energy policy in Wales, which we hope will inform the UK Government's White Paper so that we contribute towards that policy at a UK level. I also welcome the Economic Development Committee's contribution in terms of informing the Welsh Assembly Government's policy.

Phil Williams: I wish that we could have had more time to debate this because it is an important topic. Ron Davies mentioned that by 2010 we might still be increasing production for non-renewable sources, but a great deal depends on part two of our study because we should also be aiming to cut our demand by 20 to 30 per cent. If we do so, we can eliminate the need for the increase in non-renewable energy sources. Moreover, as Mick Bates and others mentioned, the position will be different by 2020. Most of our current generating capacity in Wales will

caniatáu i Gymru ddangos ei hymrwymiad a dod yn ffenestr siop fyd-eang ar gyfer datblygu ynni glân. Mae hefyd yn dangos ein hymrwymiad i ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Fel y nodais o'r blaen, yn y Pwyllgor ac yn y Cyfarfod Llawn, bydd gwaith y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd yn cyfrannu at osod targedau realistig a chredadwy i Gymru ar gyfer cynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy. Gall gyfrannu'n helaeth hefyd at adfywio economaidd, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Bûm yn gweithio gyda Sue Essex ar y cynllun gweithredu busnes cynaliadwy ac ar nwyddau a gwasanaethau amgylcheddol—sy'n cynnwys ynni adnewyddadwy—a all gyfrannu'n helaeth at gynhyrchu ynni yng Nghymru ac at gyflogaeth. Er hynny, hyd y gellir rhagweld, bodlonir ein hanghenion ynni drwy ddulliau cynhyrchu ynni traddodiadol: nwy, glo a niwclear. Mae ynni adnewyddadwy yn cynnig cyfle da inni ddatblygu a hybu'r maes technoleg hwn i gyflwyno Cymru fel ffenestr siop fyd-eang ar gyfer cynhyrchu ynni cynaliadwy.

Cytunaf â David Davies, ond mae arnom angen cydbwysedd. Rhaid inni gadw cyflenwadau ynni ar gyfer cenedlaethau'r presennol a'r dyfodol a, hyd y gellir rhagweld, glo, nwy ac ynni niwclear fydd yn bodloni'r anghenion hynny. Er hynny, rhaid inni symud fwyfwy at gael rhagor o ffynonellau cynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy. Fel y dywedais, gwnaf ddatganiad ar ddechrau Chwefror ar ein polisi ynni yng Nghymru, a gobeithiwn y bydd yn goleuo Papur Gwyn Llywodraeth y DU fel ein bod yn cyfrannu at y polisi hwnnw ar lefel y DU. Yr wyf hefyd yn croesawu cyfraniad y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd o ran goleuo polisi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Phil Williams: Byddai'n dda gennyf pe byddem wedi cael rhagor o amser i drafod hyn gan ei fod yn bwnc pwysig. Dywedodd Ron Davies ei bod yn bosibl, erbyn 2010, y byddwn yn dal i gynyddu'r cynnyrch o ffynonellau anadnewyddadwy, ond mae llawer iawn yn dibynnu ar ail ran ein hastudiaeth oherwydd dylem anelu hefyd at dorri ein galw o 20 i 30 y cant. Os gwnawn hynny, gallwn ddileu'r angen am gynnydd yn y ffynonellau ynni anadnewyddadwy. At hynny, fel y dywedodd Mick Bates ac eraill, bydd y sefyllfa'n wahanol erbyn 2020. Bydd

have disappeared and we will need to replace enough capacity to meet our needs. For security of supply and to avoid carbon dioxide, the choice—and I agree with David Davies and others—is between renewable energy and nuclear. What we must recognise, and let us be absolutely clear on this, is that nuclear energy is the most expensive form of electricity apart from photo-voltaic energy—which has not been developed yet—and it has serious environmental and security hazards that have not been solved. However, that is the choice and given our resources in Wales, we should choose in such a way as to ensure that we take advantage of renewable sources.

David Davies stressed the need to have 15 years to plan ahead and I agreed with almost everything he said. We need a portfolio of techniques. We cannot rely entirely on wind because it is intermittent. Twenty per cent of wind energy is okay in a self-consistent system, if you can sell it to a grid and get a return when you are short of energy. However, any system must have a limit. Alun Cairns clearly has not read the report because it states that we anticipate a reduction in the proportion of wind energy beyond 2010. Wind energy is developing at this stage because at the moment it is the one way in which we can go ahead. It leaves no permanent environmental scar and is currently the cheapest form of electricity. However, of course we still have to use other forms and I would like to see strong support for pilot schemes such as the tidal current scheme off Pembrokeshire so that, between 2010 and 2020, we will see the whole portfolio. However, it must be balanced. At the moment, the Committee has reached a balanced and sensible view.

In my speech, I mentioned how I deplored people who rejected a sensible and balanced consideration because of a vested interest. Alun Cairns disappointed me. On tourism, we need more hard evidence. A survey was conducted in Scotland in which nine out of 10 people stated that windfarms would make absolutely no difference to tourism. Of those who said that they would make a difference,

y rhan fwyaf o'n gallu cynhyrchu presennol yng Nghymru wedi diflannu a bydd arnom angen ailosod digon o gapasiti i fodloni ein hanghenion. Er mwyn cael cyflenwad sicr ac osgoi cynhyrchu carbon deuocsid, mae'r dewis—a chytunaf â David Davies ac eraill—yn un rhwng ynni adnewyddadwy ac ynni niwclear. Yr hyn y mae'n rhaid inni ei gydnabod, a gadewch inni fod yn gwbl glir ynghylch hyn, yw mai ynni niwclear yw'r math drutaf o drydan ar wahân i ynni ffotofoltäig—nad yw wedi'i ddatblygu eto—ac mae iddo beryglon amgylcheddol a diogelwch difrifol sydd heb eu datrys. Fodd bynnag, dyna'r dewis ac o gofio'r adnoddau sydd gennym yng Nghymru, dylem ddewis yn y fath fodd fel ein bod yn manteisio ar ffynonellau adnewyddadwy.

Pwysleisiodd David Davies yr angen i gael 15 mlynedd i gynllunio ymlaen a chytunaf â bron bob dim a ddywedodd. Mae arnom angen portffolio o dechnegau. Ni allwn ddibynnu'n gyfan gwbl ar wynt gan ei fod yn ysbeidiol. Mae 20 y cant o ynni gwynt yn iawn mewn system sy'n ei chysoni ei hun, os gallwch ei werthu i grid a'i gael yn ôl pan ydych yn brin o ynni. Fodd bynnag, rhaid wrth derfyn mewn unrhyw system. Mae'n amlwg nad yw Alun Cairns wedi darllen yr adroddiad oherwydd dywed ein bod yn rhagweld gostyngiad yn y gyfran o ynni gwynt ar ôl 2010. Mae ynni gwynt yn datblygu'n awr am mai hwn yw'r unig fodd inni symud ymlaen ar hyn o bryd. Nid yw'n gadael creithiau parhaol ar yr amgylchedd a hwnnw yw'r math rhataf o drydan ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn dal i orfod defnyddio mathau eraill, wrth gwrs, a charwn weld cefnogaeth gadarn i gynlluniau peilot fel y cynllun ceryntau llanw oddi ar Sir Benfro fel y cawn weld yr holl bortffolio rhwng 2010 a 2020. Er hynny, rhaid iddo fod yn gytbwys. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r Pwyllgor wedi dod i farn gytbwys a synhwyrol.

Yn fy araith, dywedais fy mod yn gresynu at bobl sy'n gwrthod ystyriaeth synhwyrol a chytbwys oherwydd buddiant breintiedig. Cefais fy siomi yn Alun Cairns. Ynghylch twristiaeth, mae arnom angen rhagor o dystiolaeth bendant. Mewn arolwg a gynhaliwyd yn yr Alban dywedodd naw o bob 10 o bobl na wnâi ffermydd gwynt unrhyw wahaniaeth o gwbl i dwristiaeth. O

twice the amount of people who disagreed, agreed that tourists would be more likely to return because of renewable energy.

Alun Cairns: I hope that you recognise that I highlighted these views in the Committee, therefore the point raised about unanimity earlier was not a fair one.

4:10 p.m.

Phil Williams: I cannot remember there being any objections to the North Hoyle windfarm or to the project at Rhyl Flats. However, when the windfarm at Porthcawl was discussed, there was a great amount of disinformation. There may be a valid point to be made about the visual impact of windfarms—I sometimes disagree with Cynog on that issue—and that must be considered. However, when people say that wind turbines set 50 meters apart and more than 6 kilometres offshore will destroy the surf and take all the sand away, and that we will be ankle-deep in dead birds, the disinformation must be challenged.

David Davies: If many obstacles are placed far out at sea, they will affect the surf coming in from the Atlantic. There have been examples around the world of people changing the nature of the surf on the beach by deliberately building obstacles at sea.

Phil Williams: I have not found anyone who understands hydrodynamics who says that there is any possibility that windfarms so far offshore and with turbines so widely spaced could have any great effect.

We must have a balanced view on the subject. Alun Cairns is right that the choice will ultimately be nuclear or wind power. Nuclear power stations need to be built by the sea and near a major super gridline. I can think of a suitable spot for one, which would not be far from Porthcawl. [*Laughter.*]

I welcome the fact that the Minister will give

blith y rhai a ddywedodd y gwnaent wahaniaeth, yr oedd dwywaith y nifer a anghytunai yn cytuno y byddai twristiaid yn fwy tebygol o ddychwelyd oherwydd ynni adnewyddadwy.

Alun Cairns: Gobeithiaf eich bod yn cydnabod fy mod wedi tynnu sylw at fy marn ar hyn yn y Pwyllgor, felly nid oedd y pwynt a godwyd ynghylch unfrydedd yn gynharach yn un teg.

Phil Williams: Ni allaf gofio bod unrhyw wrthwynebiadau i fferm wynt North Hoyle neu'r prosiect yn Fflatiau'r Rhyl. Fodd bynnag, pan drafodwyd y fferm wynt ym Mhorthcawl, bu llawer iawn o wybodaeth anghywir. Efallai fod pwynt dilys i'w wneud ynghylch effaith weledol ffermydd gwynt—yr wyf weithiau'n anghytuno â Cynog ar y mater hwnnw—a rhaid ystyried hynny. Fodd bynnag, pan ddywed rhai y bydd tyrbinau gwynt a osodir 50 medr oddi wrth ei gilydd a mwy na chwe chilomedr oddi ar y lan yn difetha'r beistonnau ac yn mynd â'r holl dywod oddi yno, ac y byddwn hyd at ein fferau mewn adar marw, rhaid herio'r wybodaeth anghywir honno.

David Davies: Os gosodir llawer o rwystrau yn y môr yn bell o'r lan, byddant yn effeithio ar y beistonnau a ddaw o Fôr Iwerydd. Bu enghreifftiau o gwmpas y byd o bobl yn newid natur y beistonnau ar y traeth drwy godi rhwystrau ar y môr yn fwiadol.

Phil Williams: Ni chefais neb sy'n deall hydrodynameg a ddywed fod unrhyw bosibilrwydd y byddai ffermydd gwynt mor bell o'r lan a'u tyrbinau wedi'u lleoli mor bell oddi wrth ei gilydd yn gallu cael unrhyw effaith sylweddol.

Rhaid inni gael barn gytbwys ar y pwnc. Mae Alun Cairns yn iawn wrth ddweud mai'r dewis yn y pen draw fydd ynni niwclear neu ynni gwynt. Rhaid codi gorsafoedd trydan niwclear ger y môr ac yn agos i brif uwchlinell grid. Gallaf feddwl am le addas i un ohonynt, nad yw'n bell o Borthcawl. [*Chwerthin.*]

Croesawaf y ffaith y bydd y Gweinidog yn

a statement in early February. This is an urgent issue and includes balance considerations, including the points made by the Minister and my last point. Placing all other matters aside, this is an important economic driver. One reason why 85 per cent of the people in Navarra support wind energy and only 1 per cent are against it is that it has brought jobs—2,036 thus far and there will more by the time it reaches its target in 2010—to a region that has one sixth of the population of Wales. I hope that the Minister in his response takes full advantage of our potential to be a world showcase and to bring prosperity to all parts of Wales—I urge him to do so.

gwneud datganiad ar ddechrau Chwefror. Mae hyn yn fater brys ac mae'n cynnwys ystyriaethau o gydbwysedd, gan gynnwys y pwyntiau a wnaeth y Gweinidog a'r pwynt olaf a wneuthum i. Gan roi pob mater arall o'r neilltu, mae hyn yn ysgogydd economaidd pwysig. Un rheswm pam y mae 85 y cant o bobl Navarra yn cefnogi ynni gwynt a dim ond 1 y cant yn ei wrthwynebu yw ei fod wedi dod â swyddi—2,036 hyd yn hyn a bydd rhagor erbyn iddi gyrraedd ei tharged yn 2010—i ranbarth sydd ag un rhan o chwech o boblogaeth Cymru. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog, yn ei ymateb, yn manteisio'n llawn ar ein potensial i ddod yn ffenestr siop i'r byd ac i ddod â ffyniant i bob rhan o Gymru—fe'i hanogaf i wneud hynny.

*Cynnig (NDM1294): O blaid 41, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM1294): For 41, Abstain 5, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Graham, William
Jones, David Ian
Melding, David

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

‘Ffermio i’r Dyfodol’ ‘Farming for the Future’

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1, 3, 4 and 5 in the name of Jocelyn Davies and amendment 2 in the name of Jonathan Morgan.

The Deputy First Minister and Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad (Michael German): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales welcomes the significant progress made by the Welsh Assembly Government and its partners in implementing the actions contained in ‘Farming for the Future: a new direction for farming in Wales’;

reaffirms the long-term strategy to enable farming to adapt as set out in ‘Farming for the Future’ based on support for the traditional Welsh family farm and the principles of sustainability in all its aspects—economic, environmental, social and culture;

supports the proposal to continue to develop the action programme in partnership with stakeholders, through regular scrutiny in the Assembly’s Agriculture and Rural Development Committee and via an annual stocktake by the farming futures advisory group. (NDM1296)

The purpose of today’s debate is to provide a progress report on the programme of actions set out in ‘Farming for the Future’ and it follows on from Plenary sessions held in January and December 2001. It gives us an

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 3, 4 a 5 yn enw Jocelyn Davies a gwellant 2 yn enw Jonathan Morgan.

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a’r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor (Michael German): Cynigaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn croesawu’r cynnydd sylweddol a wnaed gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a’i phartneriaid o ran gweithredu’r argymhellion yn ‘Ffermio i’r Dyfodol: cyfeiriad newydd i ffermio yng Nghymru’;

yn aildatgan y strategaeth hirdymor a fydd yn galluogi’r byd ffermio i ymaddasu, fel y’i nodwyd yn ‘Ffermio i’r Dyfodol’; strategaeth a seiliwyd ar gynorthwyo’r fferm deuluol Gymreig draddodiadol ac ar egwyddorion cynaliadwyedd yn ei holl agweddau—yn economaidd, yn amgylcheddol, yn gymdeithasol ac yn ddiwylliannol;

yn cefnogi’r cynnig i barhau i ddatblygu’r rhaglen weithredu mewn partneriaeth â’r rhanddeiliaid, gan gynnal proses graffu reolaidd ym Mhwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig y Cynulliad a phroses gloriannu flynyddol gan y grŵp cynghori ar ddyfodol ffermio. (NDM1296)

Pwrpas y ddadl heddiw yw darparu adroddiad ar gynnydd y rhaglen o gamau gweithredu a nodir yn ‘Ffermio i’r Dyfodol’ ac mae’n dilyn sesiynau yn y Cyfarfod Llawn a gynhaliwyd yn Ionawr a Rhagfyr 2001.

opportunity to assess the progress of actions that aim, over the medium to long term, to support farmers' decisions on reshaping their businesses. We need to be clear that there are no easy answers or quick fixes that can properly respond to the needs of farming in Wales.

I remind the Assembly that the strategy document was first published in November 2001, providing, for the first time, a distinct, Welsh-made strategy for farming in Wales. It provided a framework of actions to support the industry to meet the challenge of adaptation and it is unique because it places retaining the family farm at the heart of the strategy and seeks to deliver across the range of sustainability issues, namely economical, social, environmental and cultural issues. That is in stark contrast to the strategic approach in England, where economic considerations predominate.

On the direction of Welsh farming, the strategy's core message is that Welsh farming cannot survive in today's increasingly competitive market on price alone. In reality, we must focus on quality, and markets that will provide added value for Welsh produce. That is not to say that current outlets served by Farming Wales plc are not important: they clearly are. However, we must be realistic about the future.

A stronger farming industry reinforces the social fabric of rural communities and contributes significantly to local economies and to the environment and, in particular, to the Welsh language and culture.

'Farming for the Future' contains a programme of 52 actions to support farmers' decisions on the long-term direction of their businesses. There has been significant progress on all the actions in its first year. The details are in the papers circulated to Members. I thank key partners for their commitment and support. The Welsh Development Agency, the Meat and Livestock Commission, the farming unions and the voluntary sector have all played their

Mae'n rhoi cyfle inni asesu'r cynnydd a wnaed ar gamau sydd â'r nod o hyrwyddo penderfyniadau gan ffermwyr ar ailffurfio eu busnesau, dros y tymor canolog a hir. Rhaid inni ddeall nad oes atebion hawdd neu sydyn sy'n gallu ymateb yn briodol i anghenion ffermio yng Nghymru.

Yr wyf yn atgoffa'r Cynulliad bod y ddogfen strategaeth wedi'i chyhoeddi'n gyntaf yn Nhachwedd 2001, gan roi, am y tro cyntaf, strategaeth neilltuol a wnaed yng Nghymru ar gyfer ffermio yng Nghymru. Darparodd fframwaith o gamau gweithredu i hybu'r diwydiant i ateb yr her o ymaddasu ac mae'n unigryw am ei bod yn rhoi lle canolog yn y strategaeth i'r nod o gadw'r fferm deuluol ac yn ceisio mynd â'r maen i'r wal yn yr holl amrediad o faterion cynaliadwyedd, sef materion economaidd, cymdeithasol, amgylcheddol a diwylliannol. Mae hynny'n gwrthgyferbynnu'n llwyr â'r strategaeth yn Lloegr, lle y mae ystyriaethau economaidd yn tra-arglwyddiaethu.

Ynghylch cyfeiriad ffermio yng Nghymru, neges ganolog y strategaeth yw na all ffermio yng Nghymru oroesi yn y farchnad fwyfwy cystadleuol a geir heddiw ar sail pris yn unig. Mewn gwirionedd, rhaid inni ganolbwyntio ar ansawdd, a marchnadoedd a fydd yn ychwanegu gwerth at gynnyrch o Gymru. Nid yw hynny'n gyfystyr â dweud nad yw'r marchnadoedd presennol a wasanaethir gan Ffermio Cymru ccc yn bwysig; mae'n amlwg eu bod. Er hynny, rhaid inni fod yn realistig ynghylch y dyfodol.

Mae diwydiant ffermio cryfach yn atgyfnerthu gwead cymdeithasol cymunedau gwledig ac yn cyfrannu'n sylweddol at economïau lleol ac at yr amgylchedd ac, yn benodol, at y Gymraeg a'i diwylliant.

Mae 'Ffermio i'r Dyfodol' yn cynnwys rhaglen o 52 o gamau gweithredu i hyrwyddo penderfyniadau ffermwyr ar gyfeiriad eu busnesau yn y tymor hir. Bu cynnydd sylweddol ar yr holl gamau gweithredu yn ei flwyddyn gyntaf. Mae'r manylion yn y papurau a ddosbarthwyd i Aelodau. Diolchaf i'r partneriaid allweddol am eu hymrwymiad a'u cefnogaeth. Mae Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, y Comisiwn Cig a Da Byw, yr undebau ffermio a'r sector gwirfoddol oll

part in the achievements thus far. The responses from farmers are equally important. The Assembly Government is providing help through a range of measures that are distinct to Wales. These include the agri-food strategy, Farming Connect, Tir Gofal, Tir Mynydd and initiatives such as the establishment of a unified and co-ordinated structure for the red meat industry in Wales and a monthly newsletter, *Gwlad*, for farming families.

The Assembly Government is providing additional resources. The £22 million that I announced for the agriculture and rural development budget in 2003-04 is an increase of almost 10 per cent. A central feature of the help available to farmers is Farming Connect, a scheme that is unique to Wales and which helps many families to reach decisions about their future business intentions. Over 5,000 farmers have registered for the business planning service, and nearly 1,050 plans have been completed. Over 360 capital grants have been approved, involving some £4.5 million. More than 5,000 farmers have attended demonstration events and nearly 800 farms are participating in information and communications technology training. There are several good examples emerging of farmers embracing change through collaboration: the farm-led Llŷn beef group working with others to add value to and to develop innovative products; the recent joint venture between the Welsh Meat Company and Wynnstay Farmers to add value to bull calves; the partnership between the producer co-operative, South Caernarfon Creameries, and local farmers to supply Welsh milk to Marks and Spencer; and the establishment of integrated structures for the Welsh cheese and meat sectors. Real, practical help is forthcoming. Substantial support is available under the agri-food strategy in the form of over £16 million awarded under the processing and marketing grant, attracting a total investment that is worth around £49 million.

The strategy has been subject to review by the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee—we will be reporting to the Committee again in March—and by Members here today. The farming futures

wedi chwarae eu rhan yn y cyflawniadau hyd yn hyn. Mae'r ymatebion oddi wrth ffermwyr yr un mor bwysig. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn darparu cymorth drwy amryw o fesurau sy'n arbennig i Gymru. Yn eu plith y mae'r strategaeth bwyd-amaeth, Cyswllt Ffermio, Tir Gofal, Tir Mynydd a mentrau fel sefydlu strwythur unedig a chydlynol ar gyfer y diwydiant cig coch yng Nghymru a chylchlythyr misol, *Gwlad*, ar gyfer teuluoedd sy'n ffermio.

Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn darparu adnoddau ychwanegol. Mae'r £22 miliwn a gyhoeddais ar gyfer y gyllideb amaethyddiaeth a datblygu gwledig yn 2003-04 yn gynydd o ymron i 10 y cant. Agwedd ganolog ar y cymorth sydd ar gael i ffermwyr yw Cyswllt Ffermio, cynllun sy'n unigryw i Gymru ac sy'n helpu llawer o deuluoedd i ddod i benderfyniadau am eu bwriadau ar gyfer eu busnesau yn y dyfodol. Mae mwy na 5,000 o ffermwyr wedi ymgofrestru i dderbyn y gwasanaeth cynllunio busnes, a chwblhawyd bron 1,050 o gynlluniau. Cymeradwywyd dros 360 o grantiau cyfalaf, sy'n cynnwys tua £4.5 miliwn. Bu 5,000 a rhagor o ffermwyr mewn digwyddiadau arddangos ac mae bron 800 o ffermydd yn cymryd rhan mewn hyfforddiant technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu. Mae sawl enghraifft dda yn datblygu o ffermwyr yn croesawu newid drwy gydweithio: grŵp cig eidion Llŷn a arweinir gan ffermydd sy'n gweithio gydag eraill i ddatblygu ac ychwanegu gwerth at gynhyrchion arloesol; y gyd-fenter ddiweddar rhwng Cwmni Cig Cymru a Wynnstay Farmers i ychwanegu gwerth at loi gwryw; y bartneriaeth rhwng y cynhyrchydd cydweithredol, Hufenfa De Arfon, a ffermwyr lleol i gyflenwi Marks and Spencer â llaeth o Gymru; a sefydlu strwythurau integredig ar gyfer sectorau caws a chig Cymru. Cynigir cymorth ymarferol, go-iawn. Mae cymorth sylweddol ar gael o dan y strategaeth bwyd-amaeth ar ffurf £16 miliwn a rhagor a ddyfarnwyd o dan y grant prosesu a marchnata, gan ddenu buddsoddiad sy'n werth cyfanswm o tua £49 miliwn.

Mae'r strategaeth wedi'i hadolygu gan y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig—byddwn yn adrodd i'r Pwyllgor eto ym mis Mawrth—a chan Aelodau yma heddiw. Mae grŵp ymgynghorol dyfodol

advisory group meets annually to review the progress made. It met last month and agreed that the core direction remains the right approach for Wales. However, it is still important that we all continue to build on progress. There is no reason for complacency. I am encouraged by the recent survey by the Farmers Union of Wales, which points to greater confidence in the future for Welsh farming.

On the common agricultural policy, 'Farming for the Future' is clear on the need for reform of the direct subsidy regimes to provide flexibility for farmers to reshape their businesses. Rural development measures also need to be strengthened. The belief in Wales that this is the right direction for farming is shared by the European Commission, given that decoupling and stronger pillar 2 arrangements are fundamental to the mid-term review package on the future of the common agricultural policy. The Assembly Government continues to be actively involved in London and Brussels in order to safeguard Welsh producers. My key objective is still to deliver the best possible deal for Wales and for Welsh farming.

The younger generation holds the key to the future. The FUW survey pointed to a growing confidence among young people about wanting to stay in farming. The best way to encourage new entrants into farming is to have a viable, innovative and sustainable industry.

Elin Jones *rose*—

Michael German: You can speak in a moment, Elin.

That is at the heart of the long-term direction for the industry set out in 'Farming for the Future'. We also have new resources over the next three years to help young people into rural businesses, as I outlined in the rural young entrepreneurs' scheme. I have also announced a new rural community action programme, which is worth around £3 million, to promote rural community regeneration and retail services. It includes provision for the Wales rural observatory to

ffermio yn cwrdd bob blwyddyn i adolygu'r cynnydd a wnaed. Cyfarfu'r mis diwethaf a chytuno mai'r cyfeiriad craidd yw'r un priodol i'w ddilyn gan Gymru o hyd. Er hynny, mae'n bwysig o hyd i bawb ohonom barhau â'r cynnydd hwn. Nid oes rheswm dros fod yn ddifater. Fe'm calonogwyd gan yr arolwg diweddar gan Undeb Amaethwyr Cymru, sy'n dangos bod mwy o hyder yn nyfodol ffermio yng Nghymru.

Ynghylch y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin, mae 'Ffermio i'r Dyfodol' yn bendant ynghylch yr angen am ddiwygio'r cyfundrefnau cymhorthdal uniongyrchol er mwyn i ffermwyr gael hyblygrwydd i ailffurfio eu busnesau. Rhaid cryfhau mesurau datblygu gwledig hefyd. Mae'r gred yng Nghymru mai hwn yw'r cyfeiriad iawn i ffermio yn cael ei rhannu gan y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd, gan fod datgyplu a threfniadau cadarnach ar gyfer piler 2 yn rhan sylfaenol o'r adolygiad canol tymor ar ddyfodol y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn parhau i gymryd rhan weithredol yn Llundain ac ym Mrwsel er mwyn amddiffyn cynhyrchwyr yng Nghymru. Fy mhrif amcan yw parhau i sicrhau'r fargen orau posibl i Gymru ac i ffermio yng Nghymru.

Gan y genhedlaeth iau y mae'r allwedd i'r dyfodol. Tynnwyd sylw yn arolwg Undeb Amaethwyr Cymru at yr hyder cynyddol ymysg pobl ifanc ynghylch dymuno parhau i ffermio. Y modd gorau i ddenu rhai newydd i ffermio yw bod â diwydiant hyfyw, arloesol a chynaliadwy.

Elin Jones *a gododd*—

Michael German: Cewch siarad mewn eiliad, Elin.

Mae hynny'n ganolog i'r cyfeiriad tymor hir ar gyfer y diwydiant a nodir yn 'Ffermio i'r Dyfodol'. Mae gennym adnoddau newydd hefyd dros y tair blynedd nesaf i helpu pobl ifanc i ymgymryd â busnesau gwledig, fel yr amlinellais yn y cynllun entrepreneuriaid ifanc gwledig. Yr wyf hefyd wedi cyhoeddi rhaglen gweithredu cymunedol gwledig newydd, sy'n werth tua £3 miliwn, i hyrwyddo'r gwaith o adfywio cymunedau gwledig a gwasanaethau adwerthu. Mae'n

improve our knowledge and understanding of rural Wales and rural policy development. That will work alongside an action programme flowing from the age balance communities study to tackle outward migration from the countryside and to encourage young people to return to rural Wales.

4:20 p.m.

Elin Jones: Byddwch yn gwybod bod nifer o ffermwyr dal heb dderbyn eu taliadau amaethyddol. Yr wythnos hon, daeth ffermwyr ifanc o'm hetholaeth, sydd yn derbyn taliadau amaethyddol am y tro cyntaf, i'm gweld i ddweud nad ydynt yn credu bod ffermwyr ifanc yn cael chwarae teg yn y broses hon. Felly, gofynnaf ichi ofyn i'ch swyddogion roi blaenoriaeth i ffermwyr ifanc o ran sicrhau taliadau prydlon i'r sawl sydd yn disgwyl am eu cymorthdaliadau amaethyddol cyntaf. Mae ar ffermwyr ifanc, o bawb, angen derbyn taliadau cymhorthdal yn brydlon.

Michael German: That is an interesting point. I will inquire into the situation on your behalf to see what we can do to alleviate the problem.

I cannot support the amendments for two reasons. First, we are already engaged in taking forward the issues raised, such as the common agricultural policy mid-term review. I am on record as setting out the Assembly Government's key objectives on the CAP, and I made our objectives clear when I met Commissioner Fischler in November. Secondly, I do not accept the premise on which the amendments are based.

In conclusion, I believe that we have made significant progress. It would be wrong to respond negatively for short-term political goals. There are no quick fixes for farming. The industry continues to need nurturing and the Welsh Assembly Government is committed to maintaining momentum, and will continue to work with its partners and respond to farmers on their decisions about the future direction of their businesses and of the industry.

cynnwys darpariaeth ar gyfer arsyllfa wledig Cymru i wella ein gwybodaeth a'n dealltwriaeth o'r Gymru wledig a datblygu polisi gwledig. Bydd honno'n gweithio ochr yn ochr â rhaglen weithredu sy'n deillio o'r astudiaeth ar gymunedau cytbwys eu hoedran er mwyn mynd i'r afael ag allfudo o gefn gwlad ac i annog pobl ifanc i ddod yn ôl i'r Gymru wledig.

Elin Jones: You will know that many farmers have still not received their agricultural payments. This week, young farmers from my constituency, who are receiving agricultural payments for the first time, came to see me to say that they believe that young farmers are not treated fairly in this process. I therefore ask you to ask your officials to give priority to young farmers in terms of ensuring timely payments to those waiting for their first agricultural subsidies. Young farmers, more than anyone else, need to receive subsidy payments promptly.

Michael German: Mae hwnnw'n bwynt diddorol. Ymchwiliad i'r sefyllfa ar eich rhan i weld beth y gallwn ei wneud i liniaru'r broblem.

Ni allaf gefnogi'r gwelliannau am ddau reswm. Yn gyntaf, yr ydym eisoes yn bwrw ymlaen â'r materion a godir, fel adolygiad canol tymor y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin. Yr wyf wedi nodi amcanion allweddol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin ar goedd, ac eglurais ein hamcanion pan gyfarfûm â'r Comisiynydd Fischler ym mis Tachwedd. Yn ail, nid wyf yn derbyn y rhagosodiad sy'n sail i'r gwelliannau.

I derfynu, credaf ein bod wedi gwneud cynnydd sylweddol. Ni fyddai'n briodol ymateb yn negyddol er mwyn cyrraedd nodau gwleidyddol tymor byr. Nid oes atebion sydyn ar gyfer ffermio. Mae angen meithrin y diwydiant o hyd ac mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ymrwmo i gynnal y momentwm, a bydd yn dal i weithio gyda'i phartneriaid ac i ymateb i ffermwyr ynghylch eu penderfyniadau ar gyfeiriadau eu busnesau a'r diwydiant yn y dyfodol.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Cynigiau welliannau 1, 3, 4 a 5 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 1: dileu ‘*yn croesawu'r cynnydd sylweddol*’ a rhoi yn ei le ‘*yn nodi'r cynnydd sylweddol*’.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I propose amendments 1, 3, 4 and 5 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 1: delete ‘*welcomes the significant*’ and replace with ‘*notes the*’

Cynigiau welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

I propose amendment 3. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

yn galw ar y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig a Chymru Dramor i sicrhau y crybwyllir anghenion Cymru yn ystod trafodaethau ynghylch adolygiad canol tymor y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin.

calls upon the Minister for Rural Affairs to ensure that the needs of Wales are addressed during negotiations regarding the mid-term review of the common agricultural policy.

Cynigiau welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

I propose amendment 4. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

yn galw ar y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig i drafod ychwanegedd lawn ar gyfer cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol o dan biler 2 y cynllun datblygu gwledig.

calls upon the Minister for Rural Affairs to negotiate for full additionality for agri-environmental schemes under pillar 2 within the rural development plan.

Cynigiau welliant 5. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

I propose amendment 5. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

yn galw ar y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig i ymdrin â goblygiadau niweidiol parhau â'r rheol 20 diwrnod a'r oedi parhaus o ran talu cymorthdaliadau Ewropeaidd.

calls upon the Minister for Rural Affairs to address the damaging implications of prolonging the 20-day rule and the continuing delays in the payment of European subsidies.

Yr wyf yn siomedig gydag ymateb y Gweinidog i'r gwelliannau; mae'n gwrthod eu cefnogi. Yr ydym wedi geirio'r gwelliannau fel hyn gan fod y Gweinidog am inni groesawu'r ‘cynnydd sylweddol’ ym mholisïau hir dymor y Llywodraeth hon ynglŷn ag amaethyddiaeth yng Nghymru. Dywedaf wrtho eto nad yw'r diwydiant amaethyddol yng Nghymru, sydd mewn sefyllfa argyfyngus ar hyn o bryd, yn gwerthfawrogi'r hunan-ganmoliaeth hunan-foddhaus y mae'r Gweinidog yn mynnu ei fynegi ynglŷn â'i waith yn y maes hwn. Mewn sefyllfa o argyfwng, y peth olaf y dylai Gweinidog ag unrhyw ymwybyddiaeth o'r problemau y mae'r ffermwyr yn eu wynebu ei wneud yw tynnu sylw ato ef ei hun, a cheisio'i ganmol ei hun. Efallai fod y Prif Weinidog yn iawn i ddrwgdybio'r ffordd y mae'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn mynnu ceisio'r clod am bopeth, hyd yn oed pan nad oes clod i'w gael.

I am disappointed with the Minister's response to the amendments; he refuses to support them. We have worded these amendments in this way because the Minister wants us to welcome the ‘significant progress’ on this Government's long-term policies for agriculture in Wales. I say to him again that the agricultural industry in Wales, which is in crisis at present, does not appreciate the complacent self-congratulation that this Minister insists on expressing with regard to his work in this area. In a crisis situation, the last thing that a Minister with any awareness of the problems facing farmers in Wales should do is draw attention to himself and attempt to praise himself. The First Minister may be right to be suspicious of the way in which the Deputy First Minister insists on claiming credit for everything, even when credit is not due.

Yr ydym yn fodlon nodi'r cynnydd sydd wedi'i wneud—nid ydym yn dibrisio'r hyn sydd wedi'i gyflawni gyda pholisiau hir dymor—ond awgrymaf i'r Gweinidog y byddai ychydig o wyleidd-dra yn gwneud byd o les iddo yn y sefyllfa bresennol.

Cefnogwn welliant 2 y Ceidwadwyr gan fod lle i farnu'r Gweinidog a Llywodraeth Cymru am eu methiant i sicrhau bod y taliadau hyn yn cael eu gwneud ar amser i ffermwyr Cymru. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r gwelliant yn mynd yn ddigon pell gan nad yw barnu yn unig o unrhyw werth; mae'n rhaid inni ddysgu gwersi o'r sefyllfa bresennol a sicrhau bod y taliadau hyn yn cael eu gwneud ar amser yn y dyfodol.

A oes gan y Gweinidog unrhyw amgyffred o'r problemau ariannol sydd yn wynebu ffermwyr oherwydd bod y taliadau hyn yn hwyr? Yr wyf fi, a phob Aelod arall sydd yn cynrychioli etholaeth amaethyddol yr wyf yn siŵr, yn derbyn galwadau ffôn yn feunyddiol gan ffermwyr mewn dagrau oherwydd y sefyllfa sy'n eu hwynebu.

Dafydd Wigley: A ydych yn ymwybodol o'r broblem benodol i'r rhai sydd yn derbyn taliadau ardal amgylchedd arbennig? Maent wedi gwario'r arian eisoes ac yn gorfod disgwyl am fisoedd i'w gael yn ôl. Mae'n ddigon iddynt golli'u busnesau.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yn sicr, mae'r taliad hwnnw yn broblem, ond mae pob ffermwr, ar anogaeth y Llywodraeth—yr wyf yn falch o weld bod un Gweinidog Llafur wedi cyrraedd i gefnogi'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig; yr oedd yn ddiddorol nad oedd un ohonynt eisieu bod yn bresennol pan gyhoeddodd y strategaeth hon ar ran Llywodraeth Cymru—yn cynnwys y taliadau hyn yn eu cynlluniau busnes. Seiliwyd eu cynlluniau busnes ar y gred y byddent yn cael eu talu mewn pryd. Beth am bolisi Llywodraeth San Steffan ynglŷn â busnesau bach, y dylid talu arian dyledus iddynt o fewn 30 diwrnod?

The Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language (Jenny Randerson): May I make a correction? I have been here throughout the session.

We are willing to note the progress that has been made—we do not disregard what has been achieved with long-term policies—but I suggest to the Minister that a degree of modesty would do him the world of good in the present situation.

We will support the Conservatives' amendment 2 because there is cause to condemn the Minister and the Government of Wales with regard to their failure to ensure that payments are made on time to farmers in Wales. However, the amendment does not go far enough because condemnation alone is of no value; we must learn lessons from the present situation and ensure that these payments are made on time in future.

Does the Minister have any comprehension of the financial problems facing farmers because these payments are late? I am sure that all Member representing agricultural constituencies receive telephone calls daily, as do I, from farmers in tears as a result of the situation that they face.

Dafydd Wigley: Are you aware of the particular problems facing those receiving environmentally sensitive area funding? They have already spent the money and have to wait months to be reimbursed. It is enough to put them out of business.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: That payment is certainly a problem, but all farmers, at the Government's behest—I am pleased to see that one Labour Minister has arrived to support the Minister for Rural Development; it was interesting that no other Minister wanted to be present when he announced this strategy on behalf of the Government of Wales—include these payments in their business plans. Their business plans were based on the belief that they would be paid on time. What about the Westminster Government's policy regarding small businesses, which states that money that is due to them should be paid within 30 days?

Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg (Jenny Randerson): A gaf wneud cywiriad? Bùm yma drwy gydol y sesiwn.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Dywedais i nad oedd aelod Llafur o'r Cabinet yn bresennol. Nid oeddwn yn sylweddoli bod y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg wedi trosglwyddo ei hymlyniad pleidiol i'r Blaid Lafur. O ystyried pwy yw aelod arall ei phlaid yn y Cabinet, nid wyf yn synnu iddi ddewis ymuno â phlaid arall. Dywedais 'Llafur' yn ddigon clir.

Yr wyf yn synnu nad yw'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor yn barod i dderbyn y cyfrifoldeb dros fynd i'r afael â'r problemau hyn. Yr unig beth a ofynna'n gwelliannau yw i chi fynd i'r afael â'r broblem talu'n hwyr. A ydych yn derbyn y cyfrifoldeb sydd ar Lywodraeth i dalu o fewn 30 diwrnod o'r adeg y daw'r taliad yn ddyledus? Yr wyf yn gwybod y byddwch yn ateb drwy sôn am ffenestr. Fodd bynnag, os ydych yn dweud bod ffenestr yn agor ar ddyddiad arbennig, onid yw'n ddealladwy i ffermwyr ddisgwyl derbyn y taliad ar y dyddiad hwnnw? Os nad yw'r arian wedi'i dalu o fewn 30 diwrnod, oni ddylech chithau dderbyn y cyfrifoldeb?

Yn y trafodaethau ynglŷn â diwygio'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin, pam nad ydych yn derbyn y dylech bledio achos Cymru? A ydych yn credu bod achos Cymru yr un peth ag unrhyw achos arall? Beth am eich holl gynlluniau ynglŷn â pholisïau amaeth-amgylcheddol sy'n dibynnu ar arian ychwanegol? A fyddwch yn dadlau o blaid ychwanegedd llawn i Gymru er mwyn eu gweithredu? Mae'n eithriadol o bwysig ein bod yn ystyried piler 2, sydd yn rhan allweddol o'ch cynlluniau, Weinidog. A gredwch y byddwch yn gallu gweithredu bwriadau'r cynllun datblygu gwledig, o ran cynlluniau piler 2, heb ichi sicrhau bod trafodaethau PAC y Gymuned Ewropeaidd yn gweddu i Gymru? Y cyfan yr ydym yn ei ofyn yw eich bod yn wynebu problemau'r presennol er mwyn cynllunio ar gyfer y dyfodol ac i chi ddadlau achos Cymru o ran adolygiad PAC. Yn anffodus, yr ydych am gynllunio'r dyfodol heb geisio ateb problemau'r presennol.

Peter Rogers: I propose amendment 2 in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Amendment 2:

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I said that there were no Labour members of the Cabinet present. I was not aware that the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language had transferred her allegiance to the Labour Party. Considering who her party colleague in the Cabinet is, I am not surprised that she has chosen to join another party. I said 'Labour' quite clearly.

I am surprised that the Deputy First Minister and Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad is not willing to take responsibility for addressing these problems. All our amendments ask is that you address the late-payment problem. Do you accept that the Government has a responsibility to make payments within 30 days of when they are due? I know that you will answer by mentioning a window. However, if you say that a window opens on a particular date, is it not understandable that farmers expect to receive payment on that date? If the money is not paid within 30 days, should you not accept the responsibility?

In the discussions on the reform of the common agricultural policy, why will you not accept that you should argue the case for Wales? Do you believe that the case for Wales is the same as any other case? What about all your schemes concerning agri-environmental policies that depend on additional money? Will you argue for full additionality for Wales in order to implement them? It is exceptionally important that we consider pillar 2, which is a crucial part of your schemes, Minister. Do you believe that you will be able to implement the intentions of the rural development scheme, in terms of pillar 2 schemes, without ensuring that the European Community's CAP discussions are relevant to Wales? All we are asking is that you face the present problems in order to plan for the future and that you argue Wales's case in terms of the CAP review. Unfortunately, you want to plan for the future without dealing with the problems of the present.

Peter Rogers: Cynigiaf welliant 2 yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu ar

add at the end of point 1:

but condemns the Government's failure to make payments to farmers in a reasonable time, as compared to farmers in the rest of the UK.

I am appalled that a motion designed only to produce more back-slapping for the coalition Government has come before the Assembly. We have a strategy to encourage young people into agriculture—an industry that this coalition is doing its utmost to destroy.

I will give you my credentials, so that you appreciate where my passion and anger comes from. In my school days I was a townie, living in Birkenhead. I was not an academic but I had other skills and attributes, which were recognised by the careers officer; one of those attributes was a big pair of hands. Camel Lairds was a major employer in the area and most of my friends went to work there as apprentice platers, joiners, welders, metal workers and administrators. However, I went away to learn to farm and moved around the country, gaining experience. I finally became my own boss at 30 years of age—I was a farmer. Before I came to the Assembly, I was employing five men. My son now manages with one part-time employee and his mother, who is working harder than ever. That does not reflect on my abilities, but on the economic situation and on the desperate outward migration that we are witnessing from Wales. I have also put back into the industry. I sent young people on training courses, I employed apprentices and I am proud that three of my ex-employees now farm on their own.

Huw Lewis *rose*—

Peter Rogers: I am not taking interventions; it is time that you began listening to the problems of this industry. In the last four years, two of my neighbours—who were both farming relatively large areas of land—have packed it in. I do not know of any farm in my area where someone is not working off-farm to subsidise the agricultural business. This bleak picture is set to worsen with Mike

ddiwedd pwynt 1:

ond yn barnu methiant y Llywodraeth i dalu ffermwyr yng Nghymru yn brydlon, o'u cymharu â ffermwyr yng ngweddill y DU.

Credaf ei bod yn ofnadwy bod cynnig nas dyfeisiwyd ond i gael rhagor o guro cefnau ar gyfer y Llywodraeth glymblaid wedi dod gerbron y Cynulliad. Mae gennym strategaeth i ddenu pobl ifanc i amaethyddiaeth—diwydiant y mae'r glymblaid hon yn gwneud ei gorau glas i'w ddiristrio.

Rhoddaf fy nghymwysterau i chi, fel y byddwch yn gwerthfawrogi'r rheswm dros fy angerdd a'm dicter. Trefwr oeddwn yn fy nyddiau ysgol, ac yn byw ym Mhenbedw. Nid oeddwn yn academaidd ond yr oedd gennyf sgiliau a phriodoleddau eraill, a ganfu'r swyddog gyrfaodd; un o'r priodoleddau hynny oedd dwylo mawr. Yr oedd Camel Lairds yn gyflogwr mawr yn yr ardal ac aeth y rhan fwyaf o'm ffrindiau i weithio yno'n brentisiaid o blatwyr, seiri coed, weldwyr, gweithwyr metel a gweinyddwyr. Fodd bynnag, euthum i ffwrdd i ddysgu ffermio a symud o gwmpas y wlad, gan ennill profiad. Yn y diwedd deuthum yn feistr arnaf fy hun yn 30 mlwydd oed—yr oeddwn yn ffermwr. Cyn dod i'r Cynulliad, cyflogwn bump o ddynion. Mae fy mab yn llwyddo i wneud y gwaith yn awr gydag un gweithiwr rhan-amser a'i fam, sy'n gweithio'n galetach nag erioed. Ni ellir priodoli hynny i'm gallu i, ond yn hytrach i'r sefyllfa economaidd a'r allfudo truenus o Gymru a welwn. Yr wyf hefyd wedi rhoi'n ôl i'r diwydiant. Yr wyf wedi anfon pobl ifanc ar gyrsiau hyfforddi, wedi cyflogi prentisiaid ac yn falch bod tri o'm cyn-weithwyr yn ffermio ar eu pen eu hunain bellach.

Huw Lewis *a gododd*—

Peter Rogers: Nid wyf yn derbyn ymyriadau; mae'n bryd ichi ddechrau gwrando ar broblemau'r diwydiant hwn. Yn y pedair blynedd diwethaf, mae dau o'm cymdogion—a oedd ill dau'n ffermio tiroedd eithaf helaeth—wedi rhoi'r gorau iddi. Ni wn am unrhyw fferm yn fy ardal i lle nad oes rhywun sy'n gweithio oddi ar y fferm i sybsideiddio'r busnes amaethyddol. Bydd y

German's inflicted farm support fiasco, which is ripping the heart out of young farmers across Wales. What is the point in wasting time on farming futures when the industry is being destroyed by ignorance and incompetence? That is a serious accusation; allow me to explain it.

4:30 p.m.

What started out as a computer blip has turned out to be far more serious: it is now a disgrace—and this is where the ignorance and incompetence comes in. In a proper world, Mike German would be sent packing, and his office searched to try to understand the backlog of letters lying around because he does not know how to answer them. I tried to raise the question of the independent appeal panel for farmers, and we have heard that it is in chaos. The last three cases before it are being referred to the Welsh Administration Ombudsman. We know that those decisions will not be made before Mike German has left the Assembly. You must begin to understand about mitigating losses. That is the challenge.

We heard about organic conversions and organic schemes today. Why can those grants not be paid? They are nothing to do with the computer payment problem. It is because they have not been calculated. Cases are before you now, Minister, on suckler cow disqualification, on the quota scheme, but you will not reply. All other grants are held up because you will not do anything about it. One man is fed up with trying to fight the system, and has sold his suckler cow quota for £14,000. That was purchased but the money is sitting with the auctioneers. They are not allowed to give the money to him, because of the ongoing problem, which you are administering by merely sitting there.

We have another problem. I know of a man who had an audit, and the only thing wrong was that he had sold 28 ewes in an auction 14 days prior to the audit and, rather than recording that in his moving flock stock records in ink, he had placed the receipt within the pages. As a result, his disqualification funds for 2001 have been

darlun digalon hwn yn gwaethygu gyda'r fflasgo cymorth ffermio y mae Mike German yn ei orfodi, sy'n torri calonnau ffermwyr ifanc ledled Cymru. Pa ddiben gwastraffu amser ar ddyfodol ffermio a'r diwydiant yn cael ei ddinistrio drwy anwybodaeth ac aflerwch? Mae hwnnw'n gyhuddiad difrifol; gadewch imi ei egluro.

Mae'r hyn a oedd ar y dechrau'n fân broblem gyfrifiadurol wedi troi'n rhywbeth llawer mwy difrifol: mae'n gywilydd o beth bellach—a dyma lle y mae'r anwybodaeth a'r aflerwch. Mewn byd iawn, byddid yn cael gwared â Mike German, a byddid yn chwilio ei swyddfa i geisio deall y rheswm dros yr ôl-groniad o lythyrau sy'n sefyll am na wŷr sut i'w hateb. Ceisiais godi mater y panel apêl annibynnol i ffermwyr, a chlywsom ei fod mewn anhrefn. Cyfeirir y tri achos diwethaf a fu ger ei fron at Ombwdsmon Gweinyddiaeth Cymru. Gwyddom na wneir y penderfyniadau hynny cyn i Mike German ymadael â'r Cynulliad. Rhaid ichi ddechrau deall sut i liniaru colledion. Dyna'r her.

Clywsom am droi at ffermio organig a chynlluniau organig heddiw. Pam na ellir talu'r grantiau hynny? Nid oes a wnelont ddim â'r broblem gyfrifiadurol wrth wneud taliadau. Y rheswm yw eu bod heb eu cyfrifo. Mae achosion ger eich bron yn awr, Weinidog, ynghylch datgymhwyso buchod sugno, yn y cynllun cwotâu, ond ni wnewch ateb. Mae'r holl grantiau eraill yn cael eu dal yn ôl am na wnewch ddim yn ei gylch. Mae un gŵr wedi blino ar geisio ymladd y system, ac wedi gwerthu ei gwota buchod sugno am £14,000. Prynwyd hwnnw ond mae'r arian gan yr arwerthwyr o hyd. Ni chânt roi'r arian iddo, oherwydd y broblem gyfredol, yr ydych chi'n ei gweinyddu drwy ddim ond eistedd yno.

Mae gennym broblem arall. Gwn am un gŵr a fu'n destun archwiliad, a'r unig beth a oedd o'i le oedd ei fod wedi gwerthu 28 o famogiaid mewn arwerthiant 14 diwrnod cyn yr archwiliad a'i fod, yn hytrach na chofnodi hynny mewn inc yn ei gofnodion stoc am symud preiddiau, wedi rhoi'r dderbynneb rhwng y dalennau. O ganlyniad i hynny, mae

held back and—worse than that—because you will not make up your mind, he has also had this year's funds stopped. Two punishments for one offence. There is no way that the Assembly should withhold that payment.

Another man had twin calves. He sent the heifer for slaughter, but was called back to be told that the heifer was over 30 months old. He was banned from selling its meat for human consumption, and the meat had to be binned. It was then discovered that the scanner had mistaken a figure three for an eight. His steer was then sold three days later, and was sent through as being fit for human consumption. How can we have an administration that does that?

Farming needs support now. Let us not start talking of bringing in more young farmers. Let us start with getting a system in place. Let us start with a First Minister who fully understands the situation. When I held up a letter in Plenary and the First Minister shouted at me, he did not understand what that letter said. Not only was the farmer concerned denied his money for a further three weeks—even with his letter of hardship—but the less-favoured area supplement promised for November was not paid until January.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Peter, you must wind up now.

Peter Rogers: First Minister, Mike German is throwing sand into your eyes. You do not understand what is going on. Order an immediate inquiry, for goodness' sake.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I allowed Peter to go on a little too long, but I appeal to Members to be aware of the time and to keep within their allocated time.

Ron Davies: We must all recognise that Peter feels genuinely about this and is committed to his industry. He has the right to speak as vigorously as he does. However, I remind him that, in 1997, the incoming

ei arian datgymhwyso ar gyfer 2001 wedi'i ddal yn ôl ac—yn waeth na hynny—am na wnewch chi benderfynu, ataliwyd ei arian ar gyfer eleni hefyd. Dwy gosb am un drosedd. Nid oes rheswm pam y dylai'r Cynulliad ddal y taliad hwnnw'n ôl.

Yr oedd gan ŵr arall loi a oedd yn efeilliaid. Anfonodd yr heffer i'w lladd, ond fe'i galwyd yn ôl a'i hysbysu bod yr heffer dros 30 mis oed. Fe'i gwaharddwyd rhag gwerthu ei chig i'w fwyta gan bobl, a bu'n rhaid taflu'r cig. Darganfuwyd wedyn fod y sganiwr wedi camgymryd y ffigur tri am wyth. Gwerthwyd bustach o'i eiddo dri diwrnod yn ddiweddarach, a'i yrru drwodd fel cig a oedd yn addas i'w fwyta gan bobl. Sut y gallwn dderbyn gweinyddiaeth a wnaiff beth felly?

Mae angen cymorth ar ffermio'n awr. Gadewch inni beidio â dechrau sôn am ddod â rhagor o ffermwyr ifanc i mewn. Gadewch inni ddechrau drwy roi system ar waith. Gadewch inni ddechrau drwy gael Prif Weinidog sy'n llawn ddeall y sefyllfa. Pan ddaliais lythyr i fyny yn y Cyfarfod Llawn a'r Prif Weinidog yn gweiddi arnaf, ni ddeallai beth oedd yn y llythyr. Nid yn unig y gwrthodwyd rhoi arian i'r ffermwr dan sylw am dair wythnos bellach—hyd yn oed gyda'i lythyr caledi—ni thalwyd yr atodiad ardal llai ffafriol a addawyd ar gyfer mis Tachwedd tan fis Ionawr.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Peter, rhaid ichi gloi'n awr.

Peter Rogers: Brif Weinidog, mae Mike German yn taflu llwch i'ch llygaid. Nid ydych yn deall beth sy'n mynd ymlaen. Gorchmynnwch gynnal ymchwiliad ar unwaith, er mwyn popeth.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Gadewais i Peter fynd ymlaen ychydig yn rhy hir, ond erfyniaf ar Aelodau i fod yn ymwybodol o'r amser a chadw o fewn yr amser a ddyrannwyd iddynt.

Ron Davies: Rhaid inni oll gydnabod bod Peter yn ddiffuant ar y mater hwn a'i fod yn ymrwymedig i'w ddiwydiant. Mae ganddo hawl i siarad mor gryf ag y mae. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn ei atgoffa nad oedd y

Labour Government did not exactly inherit the placid, tranquil and prosperous agricultural scene that he would suggest. It had to deal with the horrific aftermath of BSE, which cost us the best part of £8 billion, and had to restore our relations with Europe.

Peter Rogers: Will you give way?

Ron Davies: Allow me to make my point and I will certainly give way. It was the incoming Labour Government that had to deal with the chaos in the Welsh Office at the time. At the urging of Dafydd Wigley and others, the Labour Government launched JIGSAW, joint initiatives for Government services across Wales. That introduced some system into the agricultural offices which, unfortunately, the Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad currently seems incapable of taking forward. The incoming Labour Government then ensured that adequate resources were available to start building up our countryside economy. We have seen a transition from the enormously difficult scene that we inherited in 1997 to the subsequent developments.

Peter Rogers: I am sure that you agree, Ron—and I take your point—that, to be honest, we have never got to the bottom of BSE in particular. Many questions remain unanswered.

Ron Davies: Now is not the time to debate BSE, but may I remind you that I was the first person to raise the matter on the floor of the House of Commons, in 1988. I told the agriculture Minister precisely what would happen, and he denied it. Eight years later, he had to go to the Dispatch Box of the House of Commons to admit what a fiasco it had been. However, that is not the thrust of the point that I want to make today.

Initiatives implemented since 1997 have been very much Labour-led: Labour Government and Labour administration. I was surprised and disappointed to read an article in the *Daily Mirror* last week. Presumably in his ministerial capacity, the Deputy First Minister described the First Minister—who, during the Deputy First Minister's darkest

Llywodraeth Lafur, wrth ddod i rym yn 1997, wedi etifeddu darlun amaethyddol tawel, heddychlon a ffyniannus fel y byddai ef yn awgrymu. Bu'n rhaid iddi ddelio â chanlyniadau arswydus BSE, a gostiodd ymron i £8 biliwn i ni, a bu'n rhaid iddi adfer ein cysylltiadau ag Ewrop.

Peter Rogers: A wnewch ildio?

Ron Davies: Gadewch imi wneud y pwynt a gwnaf ildio, yn sicr. Y Llywodaeth Lafur a ddaeth i rym a oedd yn gorfod delio â'r anhrefn yn y Swyddfa Gymreig ar y pryd. Ar anogaeth Dafydd Wigley ac eraill, lansiodd y Llywodraeth Lafur JIGSAW, mentrau ar y cyd ar gyfer gwasanaethau Llywodraeth ledled Cymru. Cyflwynodd hynny rywfaint o drefn systematig i'r swyddfeydd amaethyddol y mae'n ymddangos na all y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor fwrw ymlaen â hi ar hyn o bryd, gwaetha'r modd. Wedyn sicrhaodd y Llywodraeth Lafur a ddaeth i rym fod digon o adnoddau ar gael i ddechrau cryfhau economi cefn gwlad. Gwelsom drawsnewidiad o'r darlun anodd iawn a etifeddwyd gennym yn 1997 i'r datblygiadau a fu wedyn.

Peter Rogers: Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch, Ron—ac yr wyf yn derbyn y pwynt a wnaethoch—nad ydym erioed wedi mynd at waelod BSE yn benodol, a dweud y gwir. Mae llawer o gwestiynau heb eu hateb.

Ron Davies: Nid hon yw'r adeg i drafod BSE, ond a gaf eich atgoffa mai myfi oedd y cyntaf i godi'r mater hwn ar lawr Tŷ'r Cyffredin yn 1988. Dywedais wrth y Gweinidog dros amaethyddiaeth beth yn union a ddigwyddai, ac fe'i gwadodd. Wyth mlynedd yn ddiweddarach, bu'n rhaid iddo fynd at y Blwch Dogfennau yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin a chyfaddef y fath ffiasgo a fu. Fodd bynnag, nid hynny yw byrdwn y pwynt yr wyf am ei wneud heddiw.

Mae'r mentrau a weithredwyd er 1997 wedi'u harwain gan Lafur i raddau helaeth: Llywodraeth Lafur a gweinyddiaeth Lafur. Siom a syndod i mi oedd darllen erthygl yn y *Daily Mirror* yr wythnos diwethaf. Yn rhinwedd ei swydd fel Gweinidog, mae'n debyg, galwodd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog y Prif Weinidog—a gefnogodd y Dirprwy Brif

hour last year stood by him as stalwartly as anyone could possibly want, against the better judgment of many of us—as ‘unfit to govern’. He said that he is ‘living in cloud cuckoo land’, and that

‘Rhodri Morgan has no vision, can’t govern, and has no original ideas’.

David Melding *rose*—

Ron Davies: I will give way in a moment. I am sure, David, that you have plenty of ammunition that you want to use on the Minister, but let me enjoy my little moment.

That was a personal attack on the First Minister and I must tell the First Minister that something is wrong with a coalition that allows a senior partner to make such a personal attack. It is not as though he made a political argument; it was not a debate about one policy versus another nor about a strategy for the future. It was a personal attack that undermines not only the integrity of the First Minister but that of every Labour Member in the National Assembly, which is why I find those comments difficult to accept.

Having listened to the Deputy First Minister’s comments about the First Minister being unfit to govern, you would have thought that he himself was fit to govern. You would have thought that, under his administration, everything was going well.

Cynog Dafis: Moral incompetence.

Ron Davies: Indeed. He is living in cloud-cuckoo-land. Indeed, I sometimes get the impression from the Deputy First Minister that he is living in the land where people who normally live in cloud-cuckoo-land go for their holidays. [*Laughter.*] When he attends Committee, his tenuous grasp on reality is a cause for wonder. You would have thought that this was a man with vision. He has been our Deputy First Minister for several years now—more years than I care to recall. Where is his vision? Where are his policies? I sat with him on the Economic Development Committee and all we had from him was a clutch of new committees to deal with

Weinidog yn ystod ei oriau duaf y llynedd, a hynny mor gadarn ag y gallai neb ddymuno, er anfodd llawer ohonom—yn un a oedd yn anaddas i lywodraethu. Dywedodd ei fod yn byw ym myd dychmygion, ac nad oes

gan Rhodri Morgan unrhyw weledigaeth, ni all lywodraethu, ac nid oes ganddo unrhyw syniadau gwreiddiol.

David Melding *a gododd*—

Ron Davies: Ildiaf mewn eiliad. Yr wyf yn siŵr, David, fod gennych ddigon o fwledi yr ydych am eu defnyddio ar y Gweinidog, ond gadewch imi fwynhau fy eiliad fach i.

Yr oedd hwnnw’n ymosodiad personol ar y Prif Weinidog a rhaid imi ddweud wrth y Prif Weinidog fod rhywbeth o’i le ar glymblaid sy’n caniatáu i bartner mewn swydd uchel ymosod mewn modd mor bersonol. Ni chyflwynodd ddadl wleidyddol hyd yn oed; nid oedd yn ddadl am un polisi yn erbyn un arall neu am strategaeth ar gyfer y dyfodol. Yr oedd yn ymosodiad personol sy’n tanseilio nid yn unig uniondeb y Prif Weinidog ond uniondeb pob Aelod Llafur yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, a dyna pam y caf y sylwadau hynny’n rhai anodd eu derbyn.

Wedi gwrandao ar sylwadau’r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog am anaddasrwydd y Prif Weinidog i lywodraethu, byddech yn credu ei fod ef ei hun yn addas i lywodraethu. Byddech yn meddwl bod popeth yn mynd yn dda o dan ei weinyddiaeth.

Cynog Dafis: Anghymhwyster moesol.

Ron Davies: Yn wir. Ef sy’n byw ym myd dychmygion. Yn wir, caf yr argraff weithiau gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ei fod ef yn byw lle y mae’r rhai sy’n byw fel arfer ym myd dychmygion yn mynd ar eu gwyliau. [*Chwerthin.*] Pan ddaw i Bwyllgor, mae ei afael wan ar realiti’n peri syndod. Byddech yn credu mai dyn a chanddo weledigaeth oedd hwn. Mae’n Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog i ni ers sawl blwyddyn bellach—mwy o flynyddoedd nag y caraf eu cofio. Ym mhle y mae ei weledigaeth? Ym mhle y mae ei bolisiau? Bûm yn eistedd gydag ef ar y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a’r cwbl a gawsom ganddo oedd dyrnoid o bwyllgorau

Objective 1 and he said that it was fixed. However, Objective 1 is hardly the glorious success story that I would like to see.

Cynog Dafis: Will the Member give way?

Ron Davies: I will, but I must conclude briefly.

Cynog Dafis: I just thought it worth mentioning the rural observatory.

Ron Davies: That is worthy of a speech in its own right, but the Deputy Presiding Officer will not allow me the time to make it.

Let us look at some of the initiatives taken in agriculture. 'Farming for the Future' was introduced by a Labour Minister and funded by a Labour Government. Reform of the common agricultural policy was driven forward by a Labour Government. Our work in the Welsh Development Agency's Food Directorate was a Labour initiative driven forward by a Labour Government. The concept of a National Assembly for Wales, and Objective 1 funding were both Labour initiatives driven forward by a Labour Government—

Dafydd Wigley: Helped by others.

Ron Davies: Yes, helped by others.

The organic farming scheme is a Labour initiative driven forward by a Labour Government. The same is true of the three marketing strategy groups; new impetus for a broad and shallow environmental scheme; the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000; Tir Gofal; and a new forestry strategy. All of those illustrate clearly that the Labour Party has initiative and has a vision for a sustainable future for our countryside. If anybody is lacking in imagination and vision, if anybody is more concerned with manipulating a position of power for short-term political gain at the expense of long-term investment in this country, it is the Deputy First Minister of this National Assembly Government.

4:40 p.m.

newydd i ddelio ag Amcan 1 a dywedodd ef ei fod wedi'i ddatrys. Fodd bynnag, prin bod Amcan 1 wedi llwyddo mor wych ag y carwn i weld.

Cynog Dafis: A wnaiff yr Aelod ildio?

Ron Davies: Gwnaf, ond rhaid imi orffen yn gryno.

Cynog Dafis: Nid oeddwn ond yn meddwl ei bod yn werth crybwyll yr arsyllfa wledig.

Ron Davies: Mae honno'n haeddu araith iddi'i hun, ond ni wnaiff y Dirprwy Lywydd ganiatáu amser imi ei gwneud.

Gadewch inni fwrw golwg ar rai o'r mentrau mewn amaethyddiaeth. Cyflwynwyd 'Ffermio i'r Dyfodol' gan Weinidog Llafur a'i ariannu gan Lywodraeth Lafur. Yr oedd diwygio'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin wedi'i hyrwyddo gan Lywodraeth Lafur. Yr oedd ein gwaith yng Nghyfarwyddiaeth Bwyd Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru'n fenter Llafur a hyrwyddwyd gan Lywodraeth Lafur. Yr oedd y cysyniad o Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, a chyllid Amcan 1 yn fentrau gan Lafur ill dwy a hyrwyddwyd gan Lywodraeth Lafur—

Dafydd Wigley: Gyda chymorth eraill.

Ron Davies: Ie, gyda chymorth eraill.

Mae'r cynllun ffermio organig yn fenter Lafur a hyrwyddir gan Lywodraeth Lafur. Mae'r un peth yn wir am y tri grŵp strategaeth marchnata; ysgogiad newydd ar gyfer cynllun amgylcheddol eang a bas; Deddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000; Tir Gofal; a strategaeth coedwigaeth newydd. Mae pob un o'r rhain yn dangos yn glir bod y Blaid Lafur yn flaengar a bod ganddi weledigaeth ar gyfer dyfodol cynaliadwy i gefn gwlad. Os oes rhywun sydd heb ddychymyg a gweledigaeth, os oes rhywun sy'n ymboeni'n fwy am ddefnyddio grym ei swydd er elw gwleidyddol tymor byr ar draul buddsoddi tymor hir yn y wlad hon, Dirprwy Brif Weinidog Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yw hwnnw.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Bydd dilyn araith ddeifiol Ron Davies yn anodd. Nid araith Aelod cyffredin mohoni, ond araith gan un sy'n gwybod am beth y mae'n siarad gan ei fod, am gyfnod, yn Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru. Mae'n gwybod llawer am gefndir y materion dan sylw. Ni ddywedaf ragor am hynny.

Canolbwyntiaf ar y materion na chyfeiriodd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog atynt o gwbl. Mae hynny'n tanlinellu sylwadau Rhodri Glyn Thomas, sef bod y Gweinidog yn gallu ymddangos yn ofnadwy o hunanfodhaus. Deliodd y Gweinidog â rhai gwelliannau, ond nid â gwelliant 2, sy'n gofyn am wybodaeth ynglŷn â'r taliadau i ffermwyr. Gwnaf hi'n berffaith glir—mae pryder. Yn wir, mae teimlad yn ein cymunedau gwledig bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn methu â thalu cymorthdaliadau yn brydlon. Cefais gyfarfod â changen Ynys Môn o Undeb Amaethwyr Cymru nos Wener diwethaf. Dywedodd yr aelodau wrthyf na thalwyd ar hyn o bryd weddill taliadau'r cynllun premiwm blynyddol defaid, taliadau'r cynllun ardal amgylchedd arbennig, taliadau atodol ardaloedd llai ffafriol, ac ni thalwyd ychwaith breimiwm arbennig eidion yn llawn gyda'r premiwm buchod sugno, a thaliadau cymorth tir â'r ill dau heb ddechrau. Pam na dderbyniodd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yr hyn a ddywedodd nifer o Aelodau ac o leiaf gydnabod bod problem? Yr oedd peidio â sôn am hyn yn ei araith yn warthus.

Mae ffermwyr Cymru am wybod, os na wnaed y taliadau hyn yng Nghymru pan gafwyd hwy yn Lloegr, beth sy'n bod ar y system yng Nghymru? Pam mae ffermwyr Lloegr yn cael y taliadau hyn wythnosau, os nad misoedd, cyn ffermwyr Cymru? Rhaid cofio bod ffermwyr Cymru wedi dioddef yn ofnadwy, nid yn unig o BSE, fel y cyfeiriodd Ron Davies ato, ond o glwy'r traed a'r genau hefyd; dioddefodd ffermwyr Ynys Môn yn ddifrifol o'i herwydd. Felly, pan fydd y Gweinidog yn ateb y ddadl, a ddywed wrthym sut y cawn ni'r system hon i weithio er lles y diwydiant? Mae'n rhaid iddo ateb.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: O'ch profiad yn San Steffan, Ieuan, onid yw'n arfer mewn gwleidyddiaeth i Weinidogion dderbyn cyfrifoldeb am broblemau a all godi yn eu

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Following Ron Davies's scathing speech will be difficult. It was not a speech from just any Member, but from one who knows what he is talking about since he was, for a time, the Secretary of State for Wales. He knows a great deal about the background to the matters under discussion. I will say no more on that.

I will focus on issues that the Deputy First Minister did not refer to at all. That underlines Rhodri Glyn Thomas' comment that the Minister can appear to be terribly complacent. The Minister dealt with some of the amendments, but not with amendment 2, which requests information regarding payments to farmers. I will make it perfectly clear—there is concern. Indeed, there is a feeling in our rural communities that the Assembly Government is failing to pay grants on time. I met the Anglesey branch of the Farmers Union of Wales last Friday evening. The members told me that, to date, the balance of the sheep annual premium scheme payments has not been paid, nor have the environmentally sensitive area payments or the less favoured areas supplement, and the beef special premium has not been paid in full while both the suckler cow premium and the arable aid payments have not commenced. Why has the Deputy First Minister not accepted what several Members have said and at least acknowledged that there is a problem? Not mentioning it in his speech was disgraceful.

Welsh farmers want to know, if these payments have not been made in Wales, when they have in England, what is wrong with the system in Wales? Why do English farmers receive these payments weeks, if not months, before Welsh farmers? We must remember that Welsh farmers have suffered terribly, not just from BSE as Ron Davies mentioned, but from foot and mouth disease too; the farmers of Anglesey suffered terribly because of it. Therefore, when the Minister replies to the debate, will he tell us how we will get this system to work for the benefit of the industry? He must answer.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: From your experience at Westminster, Ieuan, is it not the convention in politics for Ministers to take responsibility for problems that may arise in

hadrannau yn hytrach na cheisio trosglwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb i swyddogion sy'n gweithio'n eithriadol o galed i wneud y taliadau hyn dan amodau anodd, neu feio cyfrifiaduron? Dylent dderbyn mai mater iddynt hwy ddelio ag ef ydyw.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Atebodd Rhodri Glyn Thomas ei gwestiwn ei hun. Pan edrychwch ar y cynnig hunanfodddhaus hwn, sy'n llongyfarch ac yn canmol y Llywodraeth, gofynnwch pryd y bydd y Gweinidog yn dechrau cymryd cyfrifoldeb am yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn y diwydiant. Ni ddywedodd unrhyw beth am y rheol 20 diwrnod ychwaith, y cyfeirir ato yng ngwelliant 5. Pryd gawn ni ddatganiad gan y Llywodraeth ar ei safbwynt ynglŷn â'r rheol 20 diwrnod? Yr ydym yn disgwyl am ddatganiad o Lundain ers wythnosau. Disgwylasom un yr wythnos diwethaf; dywedodd rhai efallai y daw yr wythnos hon ac mae rhai yn dweud efallai yr wythnos nesaf. Gan fod hwn yn destun trafod yn y diwydiant, byddech yn meddwl y byddai'r Gweinidog o leiaf wedi cyfeirio at y mater yn ei araith, ond ni wnaeth. Gobeithiaf y dywed wrthym fod Llywodraeth Cymru o blaid newid y rheol 20 diwrnod ac—os caiff y rheol ei lleihau—y bydd yn chwarae rhan yn y broses. Mae'n bwysig inni a'r ffermwyr wybod hynny.

Mae fy mhwynt olaf yn ymwneud â'r effaith y gall prynu Safeway ei chael ar y diwydiant amaethyddol. Gwyddom beth yw grym yr archfarchnadoedd yn hyn o beth. Os caiff Safeway ei brynu gan un o'r archfarchnadoedd mawr eraill, bydd un cwmni'n llai i brynu stoc ffermwyr Cymru a bydd ffermwyr a'r economi wledig yn dioddef. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Llywodraeth yn ystyried yr effaith ar y diwydiant ac yn anfon ei sylwadau at y Llywodraeth yn Llundain.

Yr wyf yn hynod siomedig ynglŷn ag araith y Gweinidog a gobeithiaf y bydd yn ateb y cwestiynau a ofynnwyd pan fydd yn ymateb i'r ddadl.

Mick Bates: I want to clarify two fundamental issues. First, the Minister has worked tirelessly to solve the problems facing the industry, and all Members can testify to that. I would go as far as to say that the attitude of some Members creates more

their departments rather than to try to shift the responsibility onto the officials who are working exceptionally hard to get these payments out under difficult conditions, or to blame computers? They should accept that it is a matter for them to deal with.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Rhodri Glyn Thomas answered his own question. When you look at this complacent motion, which congratulates and praises the Government, you ask yourself when will the Minister start to take responsibility for what is happening in the industry? He said nothing about the 20-day rule either, to which amendment 5 refers. When will we have a statement from the Government on its standpoint on the 20-day rule? We have been waiting for a statement from London for weeks. We expected one last week; some said that it would perhaps come this week and others say perhaps next week. As it is an issue in the industry, you would think that the Minister would have at least referred to the matter in his speech, but he did not. I hope that he will inform us that the Government of Wales supports changing the 20-day rule and—if the rule is reduced—that it will play a part in the process. It is important that we and the farmers know that.

My final point is on the effect that the purchase of Safeway could have on the farming industry. We know the power of the supermarkets in this regard. If Safeway is bought by one of the other great supermarkets, there will be one less company to buy Welsh farmers' stock and farmers and the rural economy will suffer. I hope that the Government will consider the impact on the industry and make representations to the Government in London.

I was extremely disappointed by the Minister's speech and I hope that he will answer the questions asked when he replies to the debate.

Mick Bates: Yr wyf am egluro dau fater sylfaenol. Yn gyntaf, mae'r Gweinidog wedi gweithio'n ddiflino i ddatrys y problemau sy'n wynebu'r diwydiant, a gall yr holl Aelodau dystio i hynny. Awn mor bell â dweud bod agwedd rhai Aelodau'n creu mwy

anxiety. The success of the Minister and 'Farming for the Future'—which, I admit, was launched by a Labour Minister—is reflected by the fact that Ron Davies feels that he must mention a few Labour Party successes. The concept of partnership has worked in this case.

Secondly, the subsidy payments are vital to the survival of many farms. No-one can defend late payments, and I have apologised to many people because the payments are late. However, this situation demonstrates how critical the payments are. The purpose of 'Farming for the Future', and our aim as a member of the coalition Government, is to ensure that agriculture is a commercially profitable business in Wales, and that family farms can survive.

Ron Davies: Do you believe that the Deputy First Minister's description of the First Minister as someone who is unfit to govern is a manifestation of a successful partnership?

Mick Bates: Do you believe that that was said? You know of the power of the press from experience, Ron—perception is often more important than the truth. You would do well to consider the truth, and the Minister's efforts to solve the problems facing the industry. These problems are not new; you alluded to the chaos that previously existed. We all know of the difficulties caused by previous Governments' cuts in support payments; the farming unions will tell you about those difficulties.

We should focus on what is being debated: 'Farming for the Future'. We must realise that there is not one solution to the problem of the industry's profitability. Providing more activity is the only way to give family farms security and a chance of survival, whichever party is in power. I know from personal experience that it is almost impossible to expect a 120-acre farm to obtain a full income from its products. Some farmers can do so—that is a testimony to their skills; it is not due to the commercial market, which is dominated by supermarkets. The proposed amalgamation of two supermarkets, which has already been mentioned, fills me with

o bryder. Adlewyrchir llwyddiant y Gweinidog a 'Ffermio i'r Dyfodol'—a lansiwyd, yr wyf yn cyfaddef, gan Weinidog Llafur—yn y ffaith bod Ron Davies yn teimlo bod rhaid iddo sôn am ychydig o lwyddiannau'r Blaid Lafur. Mae'r cysyniad o bartneriaeth wedi llwyddo yn yr achos hwn.

Yn ail, mae'r cymorthdaliadau'n hollbwysig i barhad llawer o ffermydd. Ni all neb amddiffyn taliadau hwyr, ac yr wyf wedi ymddiheuro i lawer o bobl am fod y taliadau'n hwyr. Fodd bynnag, mae'r sefyllfa hon yn dangos mor bwysig yw'r taliadau. Pwrpas 'Ffermio i'r Dyfodol', a'n nod fel aelod o'r Llywodraeth glymblaid, yw sicrhau bod amaethyddiaeth yn fusnes masnachol-broffidiol yng Nghymru, a bod ffermydd teuluol yn gallu parhau.

Ron Davies: A ydych yn credu bod disgrifio'r Prif Weinidog gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn un sy'n anaddas i lywodraethu'n amlygu partneriaeth lwyddiannus?

Mick Bates: A ydych yn credu mai hynny a ddywedwyd? Gwyddoch am bŵer y wasg o brofiad, Ron—mae canfyddiad yn bwysicach na'r gwir yn aml. Byddai'n ddoeth ichi ystyried y gwir, ac ymdrechion y Gweinidog i ddatrys y problemau sy'n wynebu'r diwydiant. Nid yw'r problemau hyn yn rhai newydd; gwnaethoch gyfeirio at yr anhrefn a oedd yn bod o'r blaen. Yr ydym oll yn gwybod am yr anawsterau a achoswyd gan y torri ar gymorthdaliadau gan Lywodraethau blaenorol; gwnaiff yr undebau ffermio ddweud wrthyhych am yr anawsterau hynny.

Dylem ganolbwyntio ar destun y ddadl: 'Ffermio i'r Dyfodol'. Rhaid inni sylweddoli nad un ateb yn unig sydd i broblem proffidioldeb y diwydiant. Darparu rhagor o weithgaredd yw'r unig fodd i roi sicrwydd i ffermydd teuluol a chyfle iddynt oroesi, ni waeth pa blaid sydd mewn grym. Gwn o brofiad personol ei bod bron yn amhosibl disgwyl cael incwm llawn o gynhyrchion fferm 120 erw. Gall rhai ffermwyr wneud hynny—mae hynny'n dyst i'w sgiliau; nid yw'n ganlyniad i'r farchnad fasnachol, a draarglwyddiaethir gan archfarchnadoedd. Mae'r bwriad i gyfuno dwy archfarchnad, a grybwyllwyd eisoes, yn codi ofn arnaf.

fear. It is accepted that the industry can no longer compete on price. That is why this document, which emphasises the need to produce quality goods, is important. There are challenges, such as tackling tuberculosis, which is causing chaos on some farms. We want to solve disease-related problems.

4:50 p.m.

We want to create powerful local economies based on local produce and local co-operatives; that is the only way to secure a future for the farms that I and many Members love. In order to do that, we must consider the positive aspects. We have long taken a positive attitude in Montgomeryshire. We have lived with late payments, but we know that those payments are important. If there are administrative problems, we hope that they will be solved. No Government that I have yet seen has solved the late payment problem. Let us hope that we will be able to get close to a solution eventually. On moving forward—

Peter Law *rose*—

Mick Bates: I will just finish my point, Peter. I would commend to you strongly a disk that I am going to send to you as a result of this debate called 'Farm Diversification in Mid Wales.' A group of us got together many years ago to provide that pluri-activity that we knew would help our businesses to survive. That is contained in this document. The disk, made by the Festival of the Countryside, which is based in Newtown in mid Wales, and is sponsored by Barclays Bank, shows the way in which we learned to work in partnership to secure prosperity.

Derbynnir nad yw'r diwydiant bellach yn gallu cystadlu ar sail pris. Dyna pam y mae'r ddogfen hon, sy'n rhoi pwys ar yr angen i gynhyrchu nwyddau o ansawdd da, yn un bwysig. Mae heriau, fel ymladd twbercwlosis, sy'n peri anhrefn ar rai ffermydd. Yr ydym am ddatrys problemau sy'n gysylltiedig â chlefydau.

Yr ydym am greu economïau lleol grymus sy'n seiliedig ar gynnyrch lleol a mentrau cydweithredol lleol; dyna'r unig fodd i sicrhau dyfodol i'r ffermydd yr wyf fi a llawer o Aelodau'n eu caru. Er mwyn gwneud hynny, rhaid inni ystyried yr agweddau cadarnhaol. Mae gennym ymagwedd gadarnhaol ers tro byd yn Sir Drefaldwyn. Yr ydym wedi dygymod â thaliadau hwyr, ond gwyddom fod y taliadau hynny'n bwysig. Os oes problemau gweinyddol, gobeithiwn y cânt eu datrys. Nid yw'r un Llywodraeth a welais i wedi datrys problem y taliadau hwyr. Gadewch inni obeithio y byddwn yn gallu nesáu at ateb yn y diwedd. Ynghylch symud ymlaen—

Peter Law *a gododd*—

Mick Bates: Ni wnaaf ond gorffen y pwynt sydd gennyf, Peter. Cymeradwyaf ddisg i chi y byddaf yn ei anfon atoch o ganlyniad i'r ddatl hon o'r enw 'Farm Diversification in Mid Wales.' Daeth grŵp ohonom at ein gilydd flynyddoedd lawer yn ôl i ddarparu'r gweithgaredd lluosog hwnnw y gwyddem y byddai'n helpu ein busnesau i oroesi. Ceir hynny yn y ddogfen hon. Mae'r disg, a wnaed gan Festival of the Countryside, sydd wedi'i leoli yn y Drenewydd yn y Canolbarth, ac sydd wedi'i noddi gan Fanc Barclays, yn dangos y modd y gwnaethom ddysgu i weithio mewn partneriaeth i sicrhau ffyniant.

Peter Law: There are many farmers in Wales who will not be convinced by your hope that late payments are being sorted out. You know that, because it has been said to you many times before. Having said that, I have listened to the way in which you lauded the Deputy First Minister and his work as Minister for Rural Development. In response to Ron Davies, you talked about this happy partnership and all manner of positive things. You did not answer Ron's earlier question about whether the Deputy First Minister has withdrawn or apologised for his statement of last week in which he criticised the First Minister, which I regret and which was seen by some 1 million people. Will you clarify that?

Mick Bates: As someone who has great experience of criticising the First Minister, you had better sit down and not bother making any more interventions like that. Thank you very much. We have a better voting record for his partnership than you. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh'.]

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Mick, you have run out of time, but you may finish off.

Mick Bates: Finally, as someone who believes that action is the best form of eloquence, I hope that you will all look at the discussion paper, and I hope that you will all support any moves to curtail the power of the supermarkets. This would help to make sure that farming becomes a commercially viable business in Wales through the effort and the progress made in 'Farming for the Future'.

Glyn Davies: There is nothing particularly controversial in 'Farming for the Future.' I did not disagree with it in 2001 when I first read it, or indeed when I read it again this morning. The Agriculture and Rural Development Committee did not contribute to the process of preparing the document at all. For various reasons we were not able to take advantage of the opportunities that we had to do that. It is fair to say that the document incorporates the Committee's thinking on the direction in which agriculture should go to a great extent.

Peter Law: Mae llawer o ffermwyr yng Nghymru na chânt eu hargyhoeddi gan eich gobaith y bydd y taliadau hwyr yn cael eu datrys. Gwyddoch hynny, oherwydd dywedwyd hynny wrthych lawer gwaith o'r blaen. Wedi dweud hynny, yr wyf wedi gwrando ar eich canmoliaeth i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'i waith fel y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig. Mewn ymateb i Ron Davies, gwnaethoch sôn am y bartneriaeth ddedwydd hon a phob math o bethau cadarnhaol. Ni wnaethoch ateb cwestiwn cynharach Ron ynghylch a yw'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog wedi tynnu'n ôl neu ymddiheuro am ei ddatganiad yr wythnos diwethaf lle y beirnododd y Prif Weinidog, sy'n destun gofid i mi ac a welwyd gan ryw 1 filiwn o bobl. A wnewch egluro hynny?

Mick Bates: Fel un sydd â phrofiad helaeth o feirniadu'r Prif Weinidog, byddai'n well ichi eistedd a pheidio â thrafferthu â rhagor o ymyriadau fel hwnnw. Diolch yn fawr i chi. Mae gennym ni well record o bleidleisio dros ei bartneriaeth na chi. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O'.]

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mick, mae'ch amser wedi dod i ben, ond cewch gloi.

Mick Bates: Yn olaf, fel un sy'n credu mai gweithredu yw'r huodledd gorau, gobeithiaf y byddwch i gyd yn bwrw golwg ar y papur trafod, a gobeithiaf y byddwch i gyd yn cefnogi unrhyw gamau i gwtogi ar rym yr archfarchnadoedd. Byddai hynny o gymorth i sicrhau y bydd ffermio'n fusnes masnachol hyfyw yng Nghymru drwy'r ymdrech a'r cynnydd a wneir yn 'Ffermio i'r Dyfodol'.

Glyn Davies: Nid oes dim sy'n arbennig o ddadleuol ynghylch 'Ffermio i'r Dyfodol'. Nid oeddwn yn anghydweld ag ef yn 2001 pan ddarllenais ef gyntaf, nac yn wir pan ddarllenais ef eto y bore yma. Ni chyfrannodd y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig at y broses o baratoi'r ddogfen o gwbl. Am wahanol resymau nid oeddem yn gallu achub ar y cyfleoedd a oedd gennym i wneud hynny. Teg yw dweud bod y ddogfen yn ymgorffori meddwl y Pwyllgor ar y cyfeiriad y dylai amaethyddiaeth ei ddilyn i raddau helaeth.

I have never thought of the document as groundbreaking, as Ministers claimed. Neither do I consider that the document outlines some new direction for farming; I always thought that that claim was questionable. All it does, is to build on the changes in direction that have already taken place. Ron Davies talked about some of them. Many of them had been started under Conservative Governments, or, in some cases, they were anticipating the direction of change that was being forced on the United Kingdom by the reform of the common agricultural policy. To be fair, the Labour/Liberal Democrat administration document 'Farming for the Future' is fairly sensible, which is perhaps not surprising since it was drawn up with the help of a farming futures group made up of 18 sensible people. What matters to farmers, and what matters to the countryside, is delivery. The coalition Government does not have a good record—it has not delivered. The broadest objective is encapsulated in line one of chapter one, which is the first basic point. It says that Wales needs a strong, viable industry. No-one connected with Welsh agriculture will give the Minister or the Government any marks whatsoever for its delivery on that objective.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Do you recall, prior to the Assembly elections in 1999, attending a meeting with me at the Carmarthen mart, which was attended by representatives of all the political parties? At that meeting, we were told in stringent tones that the Conservative Party did not understand agriculture; the Labour Party did not understand agriculture; Plaid Cymru—the Party of Wales did not understand agriculture and that the only party that understood agriculture or the rural economy was the Liberal Democrat Party. We were told that we would not be able to face the problems of the agriculture industry until the Liberal Democrats were in charge. We now have a Liberal Democrat Minister. Do you agree that he has showed no signs of being able to get to grips with, or even to understand, the problems that face the agriculture industry?

Nid wyf erioed wedi ystyried y ddogfen yn un arloesol, fel y mae Gweinidogion wedi honni. Ni chredaf ychwaith fod y ddogfen yn disgrifio rhyw gyfeiriad newydd ar gyfer ffermio; yr wyf yn credu erioed fod yr honiad hwnnw'n un amheus. Y cwbl a wnaiff yw adeiladu ar sail y newidiadau mewn cyfeiriad sydd wedi digwydd eisoes. Soniodd Ron Davies am rai ohonynt. Cychwynnwyd llawer ohonynt dan Lywodraethau Ceidwadol, neu, mewn rhai achosion, yr oeddent yn achub y blaen ar y newid cyfeiriad a orfodwyd ar y Deyrnas Unedig drwy ddiwygio'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin. A bod yn deg, mae dogfen 'Ffermio i'r Dyfodol' y weinyddiaeth Lafur/Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn eithaf synhwyrol, ac nid yw hynny'n syndod, o bosibl, gan ei bod wedi'i pharatoi gyda chymorth grŵp dyfodol ffermio sy'n cynnwys 18 o bobl synhwyrol. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig gan ffermwyr, a'r hyn sy'n bwysig i gefn gwlad, yw mynd â'r maen i'r wal. Nid yw record y Llywodraeth glymblaid yn un dda—nid yw wedi mynd â'r maen i'r wal. Crynhoir yr amcan mwyaf cyffredinol yn y llinell gyntaf o bennod un, sef y pwynt sylfaenol cyntaf. Dywed fod ar Gymru angen diwydiant cryf, hyfyw. Ni wnaiff neb sy'n gysylltiedig ag amaethyddiaeth yng Nghymru roi unrhyw farciau o gwbl i'r Gweinidog neu'r Llywodraeth am yr hyn a gyflawnodd ar yr amcan hwnnw.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: A gofiwch fod mewn cyfarfod gyda mi ym marchnad Caerfyrddin, cyn etholiadau'r Cynulliad yn 1999, lle'r oedd cynrychiolwyr yr holl bleidiau gwleidyddol yn bresennol? Yn y cyfarfod hwnnw, dywedwyd wrthym yn awdurdodol nad oedd y Blaid Geidwadol yn deall amaethyddiaeth; nad oedd y Blaid Lafur yn deall amaethyddiaeth; nad oedd Plaid Cymru—the Party of Wales yn deall amaethyddiaeth ac mai'r unig blaid a oedd yn deall amaethyddiaeth neu'r economi wledig oedd Plaid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Dywedwyd wrthym na fyddem yn gallu wynebu problemau'r diwydiant amaethyddiaeth hyd nes y byddai'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wrth y llyw. Bellach mae gennym Weinidog Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. A ydych yn cytuno nad yw wedi dangos unrhyw arwydd ei fod yn gallu mynd i'r afael â'r problemau sy'n wynebu'r diwydiant amaethyddiaeth, neu hyd yn oed

Glyn Davies: When I heard his speech in Carmarthen mart, I did not give much credence to it. The Minister's performance gives me good reason to believe that I took the right view at the time.

The greatest failure is not to have moved the agri-environment agenda forward at anything like an acceptable pace. Agri-environment schemes have been operating for over a decade in Wales. Environmentally sensitive area schemes and Tir Cymen were the pilot schemes that developed a new direction and showed their environmental and economic potential. They were groundbreaking. The all-Wales scheme, Tir Gofal, was introduced by Ron Davies when he was Secretary of State, prior to the Assembly's establishment and with a limited budget. It took some time to be accepted by the industry. Major change always does. However, it was accepted and the Government has failed to harness the industry's enthusiastic acceptance. It is a good scheme with the potential to transform the farming industry and deliver what the non-farming public want. However, it has, at best, no more than stuttered into life. That is the current position. The coalition Government has preferred to spend millions of pounds driving through its appalling right-to-roam legislation rather than to use that money to adequately support the Tir Gofal scheme, which delivers much better access on an entirely voluntary basis.

A hugely important influence on farming will be the reform of the common agricultural policy. This document refers to how the coalition Government will work for reform. However, it is vague. Even today, when the Minister has discussed defending Welsh agriculture, he has given us little indication of what his views are or what he will do. He prefers to operate by not telling us what his intention is. It is one way of not being held to account.

Let us consider what we know about the Minister and the Government. We know that he has reneged on the document's assurance

eu deall?

Glyn Davies: Pan glywais ei araith ym marchnad Caerfyrddin, ni roddais fawr o goel arni. Mae perfformiad y Gweinidog yn rhoi lle imi gredu fy mod wedi barnu'n gywir ar y pryd.

Y methiant mwyaf yw nad yw'r agenda amaeth-amgylchedd wedi symud yn ei blaen ar gyflymder sy'n agos at fod yn dderbyniol. Mae cynlluniau amaeth-amgylchedd yn gweithredu ers dros ddegawd yng Nghymru. Cynlluniau ardal amgylchedd arbennig a Tir Cymen oedd y cynlluniau peilot a ddatblygodd gyfeiriad newydd a dangos eu potensial amgylcheddol ac economaidd. Yr oeddent yn arloesol. Cyflwynwyd y cynllun i Gymru gyfan, Tir Gofal, gan Ron Davies pan oedd yn Ysgrifennydd Gwladol, cyn sefydlu'r Cynulliad a chyda chyllideb gyfyngedig. Cymerodd gryn amser iddo gael ei dderbyn gan y diwydiant. Felly y mae yn achos unrhyw newid mawr. Fodd bynnag, fe'i derbyniwyd ac mae'r Llywodraeth wedi methu â harneisio'r derbyniad brwd a gafodd gan y diwydiant. Mae'n gynllun da ac mae ynddo'r potensial i drawsffurfio'r diwydiant ffermio a chyflawni dymuniad y cyhoedd nad ydynt yn ffermio. Er hynny, nid yw ond wedi ffrwtian mynd ers ei gychwyn, ar y gorau. Dyna'r sefyllfa ar hyn o bryd. Bu'n well gan y Llywodraeth glymblaid wario miliynau o bunnoedd yn gyrru drwodd ei deddfwriaeth hawl-i-grwydro ofnadwy yn hytrach na rhoi digon o arian i gynnal y cynllun Tir Gofal, sy'n rhoi gwell mynediad o lawer ar sail gwbl wirfoddol.

Un dylanwad aruthrol o bwysig ar ffermio fydd diwygio'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin. Mae'r ddogfen hon yn cyfeirio at y modd y bydd y Llywodraeth glymblaid yn gweithio i'w ddiwygio. Fodd bynnag, mae'n annelwig. Hyd yn oed heddiw, pan yw'r Gweinidog wedi trafod amddiffyn amaethyddiaeth Cymru, ychydig a ddywedodd wrthym am ei farn na'r hyn a wnaiff. Mae'n well ganddo weithredu drwy beidio â dweud wrthym beth yw ei fwriad. Mae'n un modd i rywun beidio â chael ei alw i gyfrif.

Gadewch inni ystyried beth a wyddom am y Gweinidog a'r Llywodraeth. Gwyddom ei fod wedi methu â dal at y sicrhad yn y

that, following the decoupling of less favoured areas support, a new system of land identification would be introduced to limit radical redistribution of support. Action 12 refers to the need to deal with bovine tuberculosis. However, the situation in Wales is worsening. I accept that action 19 to deliver a red meat promotion body has finally been agreed, but that's after an almost farcical, cack-handed attempt to bring it about, sacrificing the red meat marketing lead built up in Wales over recent years.

I accept that Farming Connect has been introduced, albeit slowly. However, all I hear from the industry is that it is faced by a failure to pay out promised grants. Action 43 mentions reducing red tape. That must provoke derisive snorts from everyone associated with agriculture. We have seen the damage caused by the 20-day rule and the problems of not knowing what to do about on-farm burials—no-one can tell you that. A system of sheep identification will be introduced in a few months' time. That is a totally unworkable scheme. All we have seen is more red tape.

The fundamental principles underlying 'Farming for the Future' are sound enough—greater cross-compliance with team production, care for the countryside, animal welfare and food safety. No-one can disagree with the concept of a countryside rich in diversity, which creates economic benefits through tourism. Stating objectives is easy enough, but the coalition Government has given us nothing but talk, more talk and no delivery.

John Griffiths: Mae ffermio yn parhau i wynebu nifer o newidiadau a datblygiadau. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn benderfynol o sicrhau dyfodol ymarferol a chynaliadwy ar gyfer ffermio yng Nghymru. Mae 'Ffermio i'r Dyfodol' yn gosod y ffordd ymlaen yn glir—gweledigaeth newydd i greu fframwaith sy'n cefnogi newid. Mae gan y fframwaith agwedd gyfrifol tuag at yr amgylchedd ac mae'r rhan amlwg o fywyd cefn gwlad Cymru. Mae'n rhoi gwerth uchel

ddogfen y byddid yn cyflwyno system newydd o ddynodi tir, ar ôl datgyplu cymorth ardal llai ffafriol, i gyfyngu ar ailddosbarthu sylfaenol ar gymorth. Mae cam gweithredu 12 yn cyfeirio at yr angen i ymdrin â thwbercwlosis buchol. Serch hynny, mae'r sefyllfa yng Nghymru'n gwaethygu. Derbyniaf fod cytundeb wedi bod o'r diwedd ar gam gweithredu 19 i sicrhau corff i hyrwyddo cig coch, ond mae hynny wedi digwydd ar ôl ymgais drwsogl a ffarsaidd bron i'w wireddu, gan aberthu'r fantais mewn marchnata cig coch a ddatblygwyd yng Nghymru dros y blynyddoedd diweddar.

Derbyniaf fod Cyswllt Ffermio wedi'i gyflwyno, er mai'n araf y gwnaed hynny. Fodd bynnag, y cwbl a glywaf gan y diwydiant yw'r methiant i dalu grantiau a addawyd sy'n ei wynebu. Mae cam gweithredu 43 yn sôn am leihau biwrocratiaeth. Mae hynny'n sicr o beri wfftio ymysg pawb sy'n gysylltiedig ag amaethyddiaeth. Gwelsom y newid a achoswyd gan y rheol 20 diwrnod a'r problemau o beidio â gwybod beth y dylid ei wneud ynghylch claddu ar ffermydd—ni all neb ddweud wrthyhych. Cyflwynir system adnabod defaid ymhen ychydig fisoedd. Cynllun cwbl anymarferol yw hwnnw. Y cwbl a welsom yw rhagor o fiwrocratiaeth.

Mae'r egwyddorion sy'n sail i 'Ffermio i'r Dyfodol' yn ddigon cadarn—mwy o drawsgydymffurfio gyda chynhyrchu tîm, gofalu am gefn gwlad, lles anifeiliaid a diogelwch bwyd. Ni all neb anghytuno â'r cysyniad o gefn gwlad â chyfoeth o amrywiaeth, sy'n creu buddion economaidd drwy dwristiaeth. Digon hawdd yw datgan amcanion, ond ni chawsom ddim gan y Llywodraeth glymblaid ond siarad, mwy o siarad a dim gweithredu.

John Griffiths: Farming continues to face a great many changes and developments. The Welsh Assembly Government is determined to ensure a viable and sustainable future for farming in Wales. 'Farming for the Future' clearly outlines the way forward—a new vision to create a framework that supports change. The framework adopts a responsible attitude towards the environment, which is an important part of rural life in Wales. It places high value on produce according to consumer

ar gynnyrch yn ôl galw'r prynwr. Mae 94 y cant o'r mesurau yn y ddogfen ar y gweill neu wedi eu cwblhau. Rhaid i amaethyddiaeth yng Nghymru barhau i wella drwy gryfhau a datblygu cwmnïau bach. Golyga hynny ffurfio cwmnïau cydweithredol ac adeiladu ar farchnadoedd ffermwyr poblogaidd.

5:00 p.m.

I gloi, mae gan Gymru y ddelwedd o fod yn wlad ddymunol dros ben, sydd yn ein galluogi i hybu a datblygu mwy o farchnadoedd ar gyfer ein cynnyrch, sydd o safon uchel.

Kirsty Williams: I want to put the record straight with regard to Rhodri Glyn Thomas's wonderful recollection of that meeting in Carmarthen—I am flattered that he remembered my speech so well. He said that all political parties were there that evening, but I would like to correct him on that, because the representative of the Labour Party did not show up.

In 1998, the year before I was elected to the Assembly, I remember the markets of Abergavenny and Tal-y-bont well; old ewes failed to sell in Abergavenny and it was the worst year on record for cut prices in Tal-y-bont. Following the disastrous cuts by the Conservatives in less favoured areas payments and the disasters, which have already been alluded to, due to BSE, agriculture was in the depths of a crisis, and that was even before the living nightmare of foot and mouth disease.

Prices then were in stark comparison with the prices that we currently see and have seen this year. Nobody in this Chamber can deny that prices have improved this year. On average, I believe that lambs are selling for £20 per head more than they were last year. I spoke to a leading farming union representative this morning who said that he could make the same amount of money with half of his lamb stock this year, as he could have with his entire lamb harvest last year. Cattle prices are also up, and, whereas as in Tal-y-bont in the autumn of 1998, tups did not sell, this year, it was a pleasure to see many tups reaching over 1,000 guineas a

demand. Ninety-four per cent of the measures in the document are in progress or have been completed. Agriculture in Wales must continue to improve by strengthening and developing small companies. That means setting up co-operative companies and building on the popular farmers' markets.

To conclude, Wales has the image of being a very pleasant country, which allows us to promote and develop more markets for our high quality produce.

Kirsty Williams: Dymunaf gywiro gwall yn ymwneud ag atgof rhyfeddol Rhodri Glyn Thomas o'r cyfarfod hwnnw yng Nghaerfyrddin—yr wyf yn ei chymryd yn ganmoliaeth ei fod yn cofio fy araith gystal. Dywedodd fod yr holl bleidiau gwleidyddol yno y noson honno, ond carwn ei gywiro ar hynny, oherwydd ni ddaeth cynrychiolyd y Blaid Lafur.

Yn 1998, y flwyddyn cyn imi gael fy ethol i'r Cynulliad, cofiaf farchnadoedd y Fenni a Thal-y-bont yn dda; methid â gwerthu hen famogiaid yn y Fenni a honno oedd y flwyddyn waethaf erioed am dorri prisiau yn Nhal-y-bont. Ar ôl y toriadau trychinebus gan y Ceidwadwyr yn y taliadau ardal llai ffafriol a'r trychinebau, y cyfeiriwyd atynt eisoes, oherwydd BSE, yr oedd amaethyddiaeth mewn argyfwng enbyd, ac yr oedd hynny cyn hunllef clwy'r traed a'r genau hyd yn oed.

Yr oedd y prisiau bryd hynny'n dra gwahanol i'r rhai a welwn ar hyn o bryd a'r rhai a welsom eleni. Ni all neb yn y Siambr hon wadu nad yw prisiau wedi gwella eleni. Ar gyfartaledd, credaf fod ŵyn yn cael eu gwerthu am £20 y pen yn fwy na'r llynedd. Siaredais ag un o brif gynrychiolwyr undeb ffermio y bore yma a dywedodd y gallai gael yr un swm o arian am hanner ei stoc o ŵyn eleni, ag y gallai ei gael am y cwbl o'r ŵyn a fagodd y llynedd. Mae prisiau gwartheg wedi codi hefyd a, tra nad oedd gwerthu ar hyrddod yn Nhal-y-bont yn hydref 1998, yr oedd yn braf gweld y prisiau am lawer o hyrddod yn cyrraedd dros 1,000 gini yr un

piece.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas and Dafydd Wigley
rose—

Kirsty Williams: No, I will not give way.

That is not to deny that there are huge problems, and that these prices are not being mirrored in the dairy sector. That creates the problem of people getting out of milk production and entering beef and sheep production, which will potentially upset the balance that has long existed in Welsh farming. The fact that there is such anxiety about the payments of subsidies this year belies the fact that even with these price increases—and no-one in this Chamber can deny that if you have good quality stock, and the market wants, it will sell—agriculture has been in a terrible state over the last four to six years, and that businesses are dependent on that money to move forward. Will the Minister say what steps he has taken to ensure that as many payments as possible are made, and, particularly, about what he is doing for those farmers who submitted SAP claims that were registered on 22 November, but which disappeared from the computer system? There are problems with payments that were authorised on that day.

Despite the good prices, there are continuing problems owing to the restrictions that have been in place since the foot and mouth disease outbreak. The 20-day rule causes huge problems and can force farmers to take actions of which no-one in this Chamber would approve. I know that the Minister will have been working hard in representing Wales to ensure that, as far as possible, the restrictions are removed.

There is a growing concern in my constituency over tuberculosis. Many farms have become infected and have been unable to trade. However, there is light at the end of the tunnel. That is reflected in some of the surveys that the farming unions are presenting. It is also reflected in the fact that we are able to achieve some of the points outlined in 'Farming for the Future'.

eleni.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas a Dafydd Wigley
gododd—

Kirsty Williams: Na, ni wnaif ildio.

Nid yw hynny'n gyfystyr â gwadu bod problemau aruthrol, ac nad adlewyrchir y prisiau hyn yn y sector llaeth. Mae hynny'n creu'r broblem o bobl yn gadael cynhyrchu llaeth a dechrau cynhyrchu cig eidion a defaid, a allai amharu ar y cydbwysedd a fu ers talwm mewn ffermio yng Nghymru. Mae'r ffaith bod y fath bryder ynghylch talu cymorthdaliadau eleni'n cuddio'r ffaith, er gwaethaf y cynnydd hwn mewn prisiau—ac ni all neb yn y Siambr hon wadu, os oes gan rywun anifeiliaid o ansawdd da y mae'r farchnad am eu cael, y cânt eu gwerthu—fod amaethyddiaeth wedi bod mewn cyflwr ofnadwy dros y pedair i chwe blynedd diwethaf, a bod busnesau'n dibynnu ar yr arian hwnnw i symud ymlaen. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddweud pa gamau y mae wedi'u cymryd i sicrhau y gwneir cynifer o daliadau ag y bo modd, ac, yn benodol, beth y mae'n ei wneud dros y ffermwyr hynny a gyflwynodd hawliadau premiwm blynyddol defaid a gofrestrwyd ar 22 Tachwedd, ond a ddiflannodd o'r system gyfrifiadurol? Mae problemau ynghylch taliadau a awdurdodwyd ar y diwrnod hwnnw.

Er y prisiau da, mae problemau'n parhau oherwydd y cyfyngiadau a osodwyd ers i o glwy'r traed a'r genau gychwyn. Mae'r rheol 20 diwrnod yn peri problemau aruthrol a gall orfodi ffermwyr i gymryd camau na fyddai neb yn y Siambr hon yn eu cymeradwyo. Gwn fod y Gweinidog wedi bod yn gweithio'n galed wrth gynrychioli Cymru i sicrhau, hyd y bo modd, y caiff y cyfyngiadau eu codi.

Mae pryder cynyddol yn fy etholaeth i ynghylch twbercwlosis. Mae llawer o ffermydd wedi'u heintio ac wedi methu â masnachu. Er hynny, mae goleuni ym mhen draw'r twnnel. Adlewyrchir hynny yn rhai o'r arolygon a gyflwynir gan yr undebau ffermio. Fe'i hadlewyrchir hefyd gan y ffaith ein bod yn gallu cyflawni rhai o'r pwyntiau sydd wedi'u hamlinellu yn 'Ffermio i'r Dyfodol'.

I am particularly pleased at the progress being made with local procurement, and ensuring that our school children, hospital patients, and county council officials are fed on the best of Welsh produce. I am also pleased that we are moving forward with programmes to reconnect people with the food production process. It is shocking that many children simply do not know where their free school milk comes from or how something they see in a field—or may not see, if they live in an urban area—ends up on their plates. There is still much to be done to ensure that children and young people know how to prepare food safely. By connecting consumers with the process, we will convince them that it is worth paying a premium price in the supermarket for better quality food.

Janet Ryder: I am somewhat amazed to hear Kirsty outline—I believe that she did so—the problems that late payments are causing farmers. I was also amazed to hear Mick Bates say that farmers in his area are happy to live with late payments. I assure Mick that farmers in the north are not happy, and that late payments are affecting them greatly. Those farmers are also unhappy that they cannot access Welsh-language application forms at the same time that they can access English language forms—the Welsh forms have to go in much later. For those who live their daily lives totally through the medium of Welsh, that situation is extremely difficult.

Mick Bates: Under no circumstances would I say that farmers were able to live with late payments. The question that has to be addressed is that we need commercial and profitable businesses. The support payments are welcomed by everyone, but if they come to a business late, then it is still better to have them late than never.

Janet Ryder: Unless we face the current problems, it will be difficult to build towards

Yr wyf yn arbennig o falch o'r cynnydd a wneir o ran caffael lleol, a sicrhau bod ein plant ysgol, cleifion mewn ysbytai, a swyddogion cynghorau sir yn cael y cynnyrch gorau o Gymru i'w fwyta. Yr wyf hefyd yn falch ein bod yn bwrw ymlaen â'r rhaglenni i ailgysylltu pobl â'r broses cynhyrchu bwyd. Mae'n gywilyddus nad yw llawer o blant yn gwybod o ble y daw eu llaeth ysgol am ddim neu sut y mae rhywbeth a welant mewn cae—neu rywbeth na welant, os ydynt yn byw mewn ardal drefol—yn cyrraedd eu platiau. Mae llawer i'w wneud eto i sicrhau bod plant a phobl ifanc yn gwybod sut i baratoi bwyd yn ddiogel. Drwy gysylltu defnyddwyr â'r broses, gwnawn eu hargyhoeddi ei bod yn werth talu pris uwch yn yr archfarchnad am fwyd o ansawdd gwell.

Janet Ryder: Yr wyf yn synnu braidd glywed Kirsty yn disgrifio—credaf ei bod wedi gwneud hynny—y problemau y mae taliadau hwyr yn eu hachosi i ffermwyr. Synnais hefyd glywed Mick Bates yn dweud bod ffermwyr yn ei ardal ef yn fodlon dygymod â thaliadau hwyr. Yr wyf yn sicrhau Mick nad yw ffermwyr yn y Gogledd yn fodlon, a bod taliadau hwyr yn cael effaith fawr arnynt. Mae'r ffermwyr hynny'n anfodlon hefyd na allant gael ffurflenni cais Cymraeg ar yr un pryd ag y gallant gael ffurflenni Saesneg—rhaid anfon y ffurflenni Cymraeg yn hwyrach o lawer. Yn achos y rhai sy'n byw eu bywyd pob dydd yn gyfan gwbl drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, mae'r sefyllfa honno'n un anodd tu hwnt.

Mick Bates: Ni ddywedwn o dan unrhyw amgylchiadau fod ffermwyr yn gallu dygymod â thaliadau hwyr. Y cwestiwn y mae'n rhaid ymdrin ag ef yw bod arnom angen busnesau masnachol a phroffidiol. Mae pawb yn croesawu'r cymorthdaliadau, ond os ydynt yn cyrraedd busnes yn hwyr, gwell eu cael yn hwyr na pheidio â'u cael o gwbl.

Janet Ryder: Os na wynebwn y problemau presennol, bydd yn anodd adeiladu ar gyfer y

the future. Farmers in the north are also unhappy about being given two or three different pieces of advice when they apply for change of use of agricultural buildings. The farmers along the Denbighshire-Conwy border are given different advice from Farming Connect, Denbighshire County Council and Conwy County Borough Council. What is Minister doing to address that?

Glyn Davies: I assure Janet that, as a Montgomeryshire farmer, I am not happy with late payments, even if Mick thinks that I am.

Janet Ryder: I think that Mick might be on his own this afternoon. Mick did, however, say that this debate is about creating an industry with a commercially viable future. This morning, many of us attended an excellent breakfast that was provided by the Farmers Union of Wales. The food was of superb quality and came from many different parts of Wales.

Many Members have talked about the need to develop local produce. One of the opening sentences of the report by Kevin Morgan and Adrian Morely, 'Relocalising the Food Chain: the role of creative public procurement', describes the need to provide food, not only from our own soil, but as near as possible to the source of consumption. The report goes on to state that, if that means re-opening local mills and slaughter houses, then:

'The health of the nation is more important than any large combine.'

5:10 p.m.

That statement was first made in 1943 by Lady Eve Balfour. Those sentiments are still being echoed today. Much has been said in this Chamber about developing local suppliers and local produce, but there seems to be little positive action. We must serve quality local produce, not only to visitors but to schoolchildren, the elderly and those who are in care homes and hospitals. Such produce should also be served in the canteens of businesses and county councils. The agri-food partnership has developed national food

dyfodol. Mae ffermwyr yn y Gogledd yn anfodlon hefyd ynghylch cael dau neu dri o wahanol gynghorion pan ymgeisiant am newid diben adeiladau amaethyddol. Rhoddir cyngor gwahanol i ffermwyr ar hyd y ffin rhwng Sir Ddinbych a Chonwy gan Cyswllt Ffermio, Cyngor Sir Ddinbych a Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy. Beth y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud i ymdrin â hynny?

Glyn Davies: Yr wyf yn sicrhau Janet nad wyf fi, fel ffermwr yn Sir Drefaldwyn, yn fodlon â thaliadau hwyr, hyd yn oed os yw Mick yn credu fy mod.

Janet Ryder: Credaf y gallai Mick fod ar ei ben ei hun y prynhawn yma. Serch hynny, dywedodd Mick fod y ddadl hon yn ymwneud â chreu diwydiant sydd â dyfodol sy'n fasnachol hyfyw. Y bore yma, bu llawer ohonom mewn brecwast rhagorol a arlwywyd gan Undeb Amaethwyr Cymru. Yr oedd y bwyd yn wych a daeth o lawer o wahanol rannau o Gymru.

Mae llawer o Aelodau wedi sôn am yr angen i ddatblygu cynnyrch lleol. Mae un o frawddegau agoriadol yr adroddiad gan Kevin Morgan ac Adrian Morely, 'Relocalising the Food Chain: the role of creative public procurement', yn disgrifio'r angen i ddarparu bwyd, nid yn unig o'n pridd ein hunain, ond cyn agosed ag y bo modd at y man y'i bwyteir. Aiff yr adroddiad ymlaen i ddweud, os yw hynny'n golygu ailagor melinau a lladd-dai lleol, fod:

iechyd y genedl yn bwysicach nag unrhyw gyfuned fawr.

Gwnaed y datganiad hwnnw'n gyntaf yn 1943 gan y Fonesig Eve Balfour. Mae'r teimladau hynny'n dal i gael eu hategu heddiw. Dywedwyd llawer yn y Siambr hon am ddatblygu cyflenwyr lleol a chynnyrch lleol, ond nid yw'n ymddangos bod fawr o weithredu cadarnhaol. Rhaid inni weini cynnyrch lleol o ansawdd da, nid yn unig i ymwelwyr ond i blant ysgol, yr henoed a'r rhai mewn cartrefi gofal ac ysbytai hefyd. Dylid gweini cynnyrch o'r fath hefyd yn ffreturau busnesau a chynghorau sir. Mae'r

strategies, but how many local food chains have been established or even considered in Wales? Such chains could ensure the distribution of local produce to multiple locations within local areas. In order to accomplish that, the Assembly Government should instigate the work and the Welsh Development Agency should play a lead role in supplying local businesses with local produce.

I recently had lunch with the pupils at Ysgol Clocaenog in Denbighshire. As it is a small school, the meals are prepared in the village hall. Given the ingredients with which the cook had to work, the meal was of an incredibly good standard; she did a marvellous job. However, she complained about the poor quality of the ingredients—pre-prepared and frozen vegetables and pre-packed meat bought through a large purchasing consortium, not purchased locally. When will the Minister take the lead in developing local food chains, to enable that cook to buy local produce?

At the launch of 'Relocalising the Food Chain', Jane Davidson acknowledged that this issue cuts across many ministerial portfolios and that a cross-Cabinet approach is required. She said that it was time for joined-up thinking. What action has the Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad taken to develop a cross-Cabinet approach and ensure a future for the industry for which he is responsible?

What is the Minister doing about his partners in Government, who say that we should purchase the cheapest food available and that we should adopt a free-trade approach to farming where we can obtain, in the words of one of his coalition colleagues,

'more affordable and better-quality produce from developing countries'?

What future does our industry have when the Government proposes such ideas?

The Deputy First Minister and Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad (Michael German): I will try to respond to

bartneriaeth bwyd-amaeth wedi datblygu strategaethau bwyd cenedlaethol, ond sawl cadwyn fwyd leol a sefydlwyd, neu a ystyriwyd hyd yn oed, yng Nghymru? Gallai cadwynau o'r fath sicrhau dosbarthu cynnyrch lleol i lawer o leoliadau mewn ardaloedd lleol. Er mwyn cyflawni hynny, dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad gychwyn y gwaith a dylai Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru chwarae rôl arweiniol wrth gyflenwi busnesau lleol â chynnyrch lleol.

Cefais ginio'n ddiweddar gyda'r disgyblion yn Ysgol Clocaenog yn Sir Ddinbych. Gan mai ysgol fach ydyw, paratoir y prydau yn y neuadd bentref. O ystyried y cynhwysion yr oedd y gogyddes yn gorfod eu defnyddio, yr oedd y pryd o safon anhygoel o dda; gwnaeth waith rhagorol. Fodd bynnag, cwynodd am ansawdd gwael y cynhwysion—llysiâu rhewedig parod a chig paciedig a brynwyd drwy gonsortiw m prynu mawr, ac nid yn lleol. Pa bryd y gwnaiff y Gweinidog roi arweiniad o ran datblygu cadwynau bwyd lleol, fel y gall y gogyddes honno brynu cynnyrch lleol?

Wrth lansio 'Relocalising the Food Chain', cydnabu Jane Davidson fod y mater hwn yn torri ar draws llawer o bortffolios gweinidogol a bod angen dull gweithredu ar draws y Cabinet. Dywedodd ei bod yn bryd cael meddwl cydgyssylltiedig. Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor wedi eu cymryd i ddatblygu dull gweithredu ar draws y Cabinet a sicrhau dyfodol i'r diwydiant y mae'n gyfrifol amdano?

Beth y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud ynghylch ei bartneriaid mewn Llywodraeth, a ddywed y dylem brynu'r bwyd rhataf sydd ar gael ac y dylem fabwysiadu dull masnachrydd o ffermio lle y gallwn gael, yng ngeiriau un o'i gyd-Aelodau yn y glymblaid,

cynnyrch mwy fforddiadwy o ansawdd gwell o wledydd sy'n datblygu?

Pa ddyfodol sydd i'n diwydiant pan fo'r Llywodraeth yn cynnig syniadau o'r fath?

Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor (Michael German): Ceisiaf ymateb

all the points I can within the time allowed. I will start with the issue raised by Janet, namely that of procuring local food. Janet mentioned Kevin Morgan's report, which was commissioned by the WDA on the Assembly's behalf to inform us of how we can proceed. Two key issues arose from that report. First, the report indicated how we could reduce the risk of contravening state aid legislation when allowing those who procure food, particularly local authorities and the health service, to do so locally. The second issue is the standard supply chain problem of driving costs down the supply chain and out of it in order to meet the contractual obligations which some public sector bodies will inevitably place upon those who procure. The Minister for Health and Social Services and I take this matter seriously; we are addressing it through the nutrition strategy for Wales and we are also considering how we can address it in the health service. I have established two projects that are relevant to this. One is based in Powys, and is aimed at bringing together all the procurers and the producers. The first meeting has been held, and next month there will be a conference at which legal experts will be present to assist those who procure. The second project is a supply chain mechanism project that will carefully consider how costs can be driven down. That project will probably include the health service. Therefore, we are taking the matter seriously.

On Welsh language forms, I will investigate the issue if you provide me with the details. We are not responsible for all forms; some come from the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs, and we have to sometimes remind it of its obligations under the Welsh Language Act 1993.

Brian Hancock: You mentioned your work with the Minister for Health and Social Services. Have you also discussed this with the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning? I was informed at this morning's breakfast with the WDA that a milk bar at a school in Burry Port, where Welsh milk is used to produce smoothies and other drinks,

i gymaint o bwyntiau ag y gallaf o fewn yr amser a ganiateir. Dechreuaf â'r mater a gododd Janet, sef caffael bwyd lleol. Soniodd Janet am adroddiad Kevin Morgan, a gomisiynwyd gan y WDA ar ran y Cynulliad i'n hysbysu sut y gallwn fynd ymlaen. Cododd dau fater allweddol o'r adroddiad hwnnw. Yn gyntaf, nododd yr adroddiad sut y gallem leihau'r perygl o fynd yn groes i ddeddfwriaeth cymorth gwladol wrth ganiatáu i'r rhai sy'n caffael bwyd, yn enwedig awdurdodau lleol a'r gwasanaeth iechyd, wneud hynny'n lleol. Yr ail fater yw'r broblem arferol ynghylch cadwynau cyflenwi o yrru costau i lawr y gadwyn gyflenwi ac ohoni er mwyn cwrdd â'r rhwymedigaethau cytundebol y bydd rhai cyrff sector cyhoeddus yn sicr o'u gorfodi ar y rhai sy'n caffael. Mae'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn cymryd y mater hwn o ddifrif; yr ydym yn ymdrin ag ef drwy'r strategaeth maethiad i Gymru ac yr ydym hefyd yn ystyried sut y gallwn ymdrin â hyn yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Yr wyf wedi sefydlu dau brosiect sy'n berthnasol i hyn. Mae un wedi'i leoli ym Mhowys, a'i nod yw dod â'r holl gaffaelwyr a'r cynhyrchwyr at ei gilydd. Cynhaliwyd y cyfarfod cyntaf eisoes, a'r mis nesaf bydd cynhadledd lle y bydd arbenigwyr cyfreithiol yn bresennol i gynorthwyo'r caffaelwyr. Mae'r ail brosiect yn brosiect mecanwaith cadwyn gyflenwi a fydd yn ystyried yn ofalus sut y gellir gostwng costau. Mae'n debyg y bydd y prosiect hwnnw'n cynnwys y gwasanaeth iechyd. Felly, yr ydym yn cymryd y mater o ddifrif.

Ynghylch ffurflenni Cymraeg, ymchwiliat i'r mater os gwnewch roi'r manylion i mi. Nid ydym yn gyfrifol am yr holl ffurflenni; daw rhai ohonynt oddi wrth Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig, ac weithiau rhaid inni ei hatgoffa am y rhwymedigaethau sydd arni o dan Ddeddf yr Iaith Gymraeg 1993.

Brian Hancock: Gwnaethoch sôn am eich gwaith gyda'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. A ydych wedi trafod hyn gyda'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes hefyd? Fe'm hysbyswyd yn y brecwast y bore yma gyda'r WDA fod bar llaeth mewn ysgol ym Mhorth Tywyn lle y defnyddir llaeth o Gymru i wneud

has had to be closed down because the education budget did not allow for a person to serve the children. Surely giving Welsh milk to Welsh children is beneficial to the industry?

Michael German: I am not here to answer for the actions of Carmarthenshire County Council. However, if you provide me with the details, I am sure that the issue can be raised with the council.

On the payments, which is probably at the heart of most Members' concerns, I recognise the concerns about the timing of these payments. Technically, they are not late: they are within the payment window. I know that people would like payments to be made on day one, as soon as the window opens, and they are not being approved as fast as we would like. However, during the last few months we have paid out £73 million-worth in CAP subsidies to farmers in Wales. If you consider the same period last year, that is slightly more than the industry received then in overall terms. That does not mean that we are complacent about the changes that must take place.

Huw Lewis: Do you share my frustration that, during a debate on the future of farming, opposition parties have once again dominated the debate with contributions in support of the current subsidy culture, which dominates and distorts the agricultural economy? Do you share my outrage? It is obscene that the European Union subsidises each cow in the EU to the tune of \$2.20 a day when a fifth of the world's population lives on less than \$1. We simultaneously undermine third world agriculture by dumping subsidised produce on their markets. I have been trying to—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. This is an intervention. Please come to an end.

Huw Lewis: I will come to the end. My substantial question for the Minister is, why, in the drawing up—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You

smoothies a diodydd eraill, wedi gorfod cau am nad oedd y gyllideb addysg yn darparu ar gyfer rhywun i weini ar y plant. Tebyg nad yw rhoi llaeth o Gymru i blant yng Nghymru yn fuddiol i'r diwydiant?

Michael German: Nid wyf yma i ateb dros weithredoedd Cyngor Sir Gaerfyrddin. Fodd bynnag, os rhowch y manylion i mi, yr wyf yn siŵr y gellid codi'r mater gyda'r cyngor.

Ynghylch y taliadau, sydd mae'n debyg yn ganolog i bryderon y rhan fwyaf o Aelodau, mae'n debyg, yr wyf yn cydnabod y pryderon ynghylch amseriad y taliadau hyn. Yn dechnegol, nid ydynt yn hwyr: maent o fewn y ffenestr talu. Gwn y byddai pobl yn hoffi i'r taliadau gael eu gwneud ar y diwrnod cyntaf, cyn gynted ag yr egyr y ffenestr, ac nid ydynt yn cael eu cadarnhau cyn gyflymed ag y dymunem. Fodd bynnag, yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf yr ydym wedi talu gwerth £73 miliwn o gymorthdaliadau PAC i ffermwyr yng Nghymru. Os ystyriwch yr un cyfnod y llynedd, mae hynny ychydig yn fwy na'r hyn a dderbyniodd y diwydiant bryd hynny, yn gyffredinol. Nid yw hynny'n golygu ein bod yn ddifater ynghylch y newidiadau a fydd yn gorfod digwydd.

Huw Lewis: A ydych yn teimlo'n rhwystredig, fel minnau, fod y gwrthbleidiau, yn ystod dadl ar ddyfodol ffermio, wedi llywio'r ddadl eto drwy gyfraniadau o blaid y diwylliant cymorthdaliadau presennol, sy'n tra-arglwyddiaethu ac yn camystumio'r economi amaethyddol? A ydych yn rhannu fy nictier? Mae'n gywilyddus bod yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yn rhoi cymhorthdal o \$2.20 y diwrnod ar gyfer pob buwch yn yr UE tra bo un rhan o bump o boblogaeth y byd yn byw ar lai na \$1. Ar yr un pryd, yr ydym yn tanseilio amaethyddiaeth y trydydd byd drwy waredu cynnyrch cymorthdaledig ar eu marchnadoedd. Yr wyf wedi ceisio—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Ymyriad yw hwn. Gorffennwch, os gwelwch yn dda.

Huw Lewis: Gwnaf orffen. Y cwestiwn pwysig sydd gennyf i'r Gweinidog yw, pam, wrth lunio—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Gwnewch

will come to an end now, please.

Michael German: The central issue that you raise, Huw, is being addressed by the European Union in its reform of the common agricultural policy. As I have pointed out on many occasions, this is probably the largest scale change to the industry in the last 30 years. Tomorrow, the European Commission will publish its detailed texts on how it proposes to move forward. We will have some indication as to what it has in mind—we have already had some headlines. The mid-term review of the CAP will produce decoupling, which means moving away from a regime whereby we pay subsidy per head of cattle or per hectare. ‘Farming for the Future’ recognises that decoupling is the right way to move forward. I make it clear to those who argue that we are not taking CAP reform seriously—as I have frequently told people and the Assembly in no uncertain terms—that this is the major change that we face. The key issue for me is to ensure that the financial package available to Wales will permit us to take the action that we wish to take, as outlined in ‘Farming for the Future’.

On the 20-day rule—

Peter Rogers: Will you give way?

Michael German: I had better finish, because I do not have much time to answer the points made by Members. You had your chance to make your point during the debate, Peter. If you did not make it then, then you should reconsider what you said.

On the 20-day rule, the balance between farmers being able to undertake their business and the need for appropriate biosecurity has been under question. I am hopeful that, by the end of this week, we will be able to make a substantial change to that regime. An announcement will be made toward the end of this week. The matter is still under negotiation and it is wrong for people to suggest—

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Will you give way on that point?

Michael German: I will finish the point first,

orffen yn awr, os gwelwch yn dda.

Michael German: Mae'r mater canolog a godwch, Huw, yn cael ei drin gan yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yn ei ddiwygiad o'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin. Fel y nodais ar lawer achlysur, mae'n debyg mai hwn yw'r newid mwyaf yn y diwydiant ers 30 mlynedd. Yfory, bydd y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn cyhoeddi ei destunau manwl ar y modd y mae'n bwriadu symud ymlaen. Cawn ryw arwydd o'r hyn sydd ganddo mewn golwg—cawsom rai penawdau eisoes. Bydd yr adolygiad canol tymor o'r PAC yn peri datgyplu, sy'n golygu symud oddi wrth gyfundrefn lle'r ydym yn talu cymhorthdal fesul buwch neu fesul hectar. Mae 'Ffermio i'r Dyfodol' yn cydnabod mai datgyplu yw'r ffordd gywir ymlaen. Rhoddaf ar ddeall i'r rhai sy'n dadlau nad ydym yn cymryd diwygio'r PAC o ddifrif—fel y dywedais yn aml wrth bobl ac wrth y Cynulliad yn blwmp ac yn blaen—mai hwn yw'r newid mwyaf a wynebwn. Y mater allweddol i mi yw sicrhau y bydd y pecyn ariannol sydd ar gael i Gymru'n caniatáu inni gymryd y camau a ddymunwn, fel y'u hamlinellwyd yn 'Ffermio i'r Dyfodol'.

Ynghylch y rheol 20 diwrnod—

Peter Rogers: A wnewch ildio?

Michael German: Mae'n well imi orffen, oherwydd nid oes gennyf lawer o amser i ateb y pwyntiau a wnaeth Aelodau. Cawsoch gyfle i wneud eich pwynt yn ystod y ddadl, Peter. Os na wnaethoch ef bryd hynny, dylech ailystyried yr hyn a ddywedaso.

Ynghylch y rheol 20 diwrnod, mae'r cydbwysedd rhwng gallu ffermwyr i redeg eu busnesau a'r angen am ddiogelwch biolegol priodol wedi bod dan sylw. Yr wyf yn obeithiol y byddwn yn gallu gwneud newid sylweddol i'r gyfundrefn honno erbyn diwedd yr wythnos hon. Gwneir cyhoeddiad tua diwedd yr wythnos hon. Mae'r mater yn cael ei negodi o hyd ac nid yw'n iawn i bobl awgrymu—

Ieuan Wyn Jones: A wnewch ildio ar y pwynt hwnnw?

Michael German: Gorffennaf y pwynt yn

Ieuan. It is important that people recognise that we have had our own stakeholder group in Wales. I have met the industry regularly regarding this matter and I have met and talked to UK Ministers about the change in regime. I have also been to Scotland to examine how the regime is being dealt with there. All that indicates that I take this matter seriously. The legislation requires us to make a statement jointly with the UK Parliament, and I intend to do that this week.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: May I push you a little on that? It would be helpful, in the context of today's debate, to hear that you have argued for a change in this rule. Knowing that they have somebody representing them who has argued for that change, would give farmers in Wales confidence.

Michael German: I can give you that assurance.

On Safeway, which was raised by several—

Peter Rogers: Will you give way?

Michael German: I will come back to everybody in a moment if I have time, although I probably will not.

5:20 p.m.

On Safeway, which was raised by several Members, we will need to watch the matter closely if a referral were needed on competition grounds, because that would affect the producer. However, in the context of what we can do, 'Farming for the Future' spells out the actions that we can take collectively and co-operatively in the farming industry to add value to produce to ensure that we improve our impact in the marketplace. The agri-food partnership has done that.

On pillar 2 money, which has also been mentioned, I have already made that a top priority. I have explained that to the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee, and I stand by what I said.

gyntaf, Ieuan. Mae'n bwysig i bobl sylweddoli bod gennym ein grŵp rhanddeiliaid ein hun yng Nghymru. Yr wyf wedi cwrdd â'r diwydiant yn rheolaidd ynghylch y mater hwn ac yr wyf wedi cwrdd a siarad â Gweinidogion y DU am y newid yn y gyfundrefn. Bŵm yn yr Alban hefyd i archwilio'r dull o ymdrin â'r gyfundrefn yn y fan honno. Mae hynny i gyd yn dangos fy mod yn cymryd y mater hwn o ddifrif. Mae'n ofynnol dan y ddeddfwriaeth inni wneud datganiad ar y cyd â Senedd y DU, a bwriadaf wneud hynny yr wythnos hon.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: A gaf bwyso arnoch ychydig ar hynny? Byddai'n fuddiol clywed, yng nghyd-destun y ddadl heddiw, eich bod wedi dadlau dros newid y rheol hon. Câi ffermwyr yng Nghymru hyder o wybod bod ganddynt rywun sy'n eu cynrychioli a ddadleuodd dros y newid hwnnw.

Michael German: Gallaf roi'r sicrwydd hwnnw i chi.

Ynghylch Safeway, a godwyd gan sawl—

Peter Rogers: A wnewch ildio?

Michael German: Deuaf yn ôl at bawb ymhen eiliad os bydd gennyf ddigon o amser, er bod hynny'n annhebygol.

Ynghylch Safeway, a godwyd gan sawl Aelod, bydd yn rhaid inni wyllo'r mater yn ofalus os bydd angen ei atgyfeirio ar sail cystadleuaeth, oherwydd effeithiai hynny ar y cynhyrhydd. Fodd bynnag, yng nghyd-destun yr hyn y gallwn ei wneud, mae 'Ffermio i'r Dyfodol' yn nodi'r camau y gallwn eu cymryd ar y cyd ac yn gydweithredol yn y diwydiant ffermio i ychwanegu gwerth at gynnyrch i sicrhau ein bod yn cael gwell effaith ar y farchnad. Mae'r bartneriaeth bwyd-amaeth wedi gwneud hynny.

Ynghylch arian piler 2, sydd wedi'i grybwyll, yr wyf eisoes wedi rhoi blaenoriaeth uchel i hynny. Eglurais hynny i'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig, a daliaf at yr hyn a ddywedais.

Finally, people have made comments about me today. Peter Law has made many personal attacks on me in the Chamber, which I have heard with equanimity. I recognise that you have a view, Peter, which has dominated your life for some years. However, I say to those people who reflected on comments that they attribute to me, that I was as surprised as they were to read the remarks reported in the *Daily Mirror*, and I am taking appropriate action to correct this matter.

Yn olaf, mae pobl wedi gwneud sylwadau amdanaf heddiw. Mae Peter Law wedi gwneud llawer o ymosodiadau personol arnaf yn y Siambr, ac yr wyf wedi gwrando arnynt yn ddigynnwrf. Derbynaf fod gennyh safbwynt, Peter, sy'n tra-arglwyddiaethu ar eich bywyd ers rhai blynyddoedd. Fodd bynnag, dywedaf wrth y rhai a ystyriodd sylwadau y maent yn eu priodoli i mi, imi synnu gymaint â hwythau pan ddarllenais y sylwadau a adroddwyd yn y *Daily Mirror*, ac yr wyf yn cymryd camau priodol i gywiro'r mater hwn.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 1: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Hancock, Brian
Jones, David Ian
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 2: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary

Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Graham, William
 Hancock, Brian
 Jones, David Ian
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Rogers, Peter
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Ron
 Essex, Sue
 Evans, Delyth
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Halford, Alison
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
 Amendment 3: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
 Cairns, Alun
 Dafis, Cynog
 Davies, David
 Davies, Geraint
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Graham, William
 Hancock, Brian
 Jones, David Ian
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Rogers, Peter
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Butler, Rosemary
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Ron
 Essex, Sue
 Evans, Delyth
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Halford, Alison
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
 Amendment 4: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Hancock, Brian
Jones, David Ian
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 5: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Hancock, Brian
Jones, David Ian
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny

Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment rejected.*

*Cynnig (NDM1296): O blaid 27, Ymatal 13, Yn erbyn 10.
 Motion (NDM1296): For 27, Abstain 13, Against 10.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Butler, Rosemary
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Ron
 Essex, Sue
 Evans, Delyth
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Halford, Alison
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Graham, William
 Jones, David Ian
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Rogers, Peter

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
 The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog
 Davies, Geraint
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Hancock, Brian
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â
 concludes today's business. chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.22 p.m.
The session ended at 5.22 p.m.