



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)**

Dydd Mawrth 2 Gorffennaf 2002

Tuesday 2 July 2002

Cynnwys
Contents

- 3 Cynnig Trefniadol
Procedural Motion
- 3 Ethol i'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig
Election to the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee
- 4 Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru
Questions to the First Minister
- 23 Datganiad ar yr Ymateb i Adolygiad Polisi Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth ar Drafnidiaeth Gyhoeddus
Statement on the Response to the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee's Policy Review on Public Transport
- 40 Datganiad Busnes
Business Statement
- 41 Datganiad gan y Llywydd
Statement by the Presiding Officer
- 50 Cymeradwyo Cyfarwyddiadau Gwasanaethau Cymorth Ieuenctid (Cymru) 2002
Approval of the Youth Support Services Directions (Wales) 2002
- 59 Cynlluniau Gweithredu Coetir a Biomas a Garddwriaeth
Woodland and Biomass and Horticulture Action Plans
- 73 Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru): Y Cwricwlwm Cenedlaethol
Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru): The National Curriculum
- 100 Pwynt o Drefn
Point of Order

Yn y golfn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golfn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion

Y Gweinidog dros Lywodraeth Agored **The Minister for Open Government**
(Carwyn Jones): Cynigiaf fod **(Carwyn Jones):** I propose that

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.16, yn dwyn ymlaen y cynnig heb ddyddiad trafod ar ethol i'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig a gyflwynwyd ar 27 Mehefin 2002. *the National Assembly, under Standing Order No. 6.16, brings forward the no named day motion on an election to the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee tabled on 27 June 2002.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 29, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Essex, Sue
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Hart, Edwina
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Thom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Ethol i'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig Election to the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee

Y Gweinidog dros Lywodraeth Agored **The Minister for Open Government**
(Carwyn Jones): Cynigiaf fod **(Carwyn Jones):** I propose that

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 8.4, yn ethol Christine Chapman (Llafur) i'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig. (NNDM1110) *the National Assembly, in accordance with Standing Order No. 8.4, elects Christine Chapman (Labour) to the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee. (NNDM1110)*

*Cynnig: O blaid 33, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 33, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Hart, Edwina
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Law, Peter
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri,
Pugh, Alun
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru Questions to the First Minister

Gwefan 'Gafael ar Gaffael' 'Winning Our Business' Website

Q1 Jonathan Morgan: Will the First Minister make a statement on how the National Assembly website, 'Winning Our Business' is making life easier for small and medium-sized businesses in Wales to sell to

C1 Jonathan Morgan: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am sut y mae gwefan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol 'Gafael ar Gaffael' yn ei gwneud yn haws i fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint werthu i'r Cynulliad?

the Assembly? (OAQ18685)

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): That is an excellent question. Through the excellence of your question and the transparency of my answer, I hope to publicise the fact that we have removed the need for small and medium-sized enterprises to submit three years' accounts before being considered for inclusion on our tender lists for contracts valued below £100,000. For contracts above that threshold, the requirement is now reduced to two years' accounts. We want to enable more small and medium-sized enterprises in Wales and elsewhere to sell to the Assembly.

Jonathan Morgan: You have developed a voluntary code of practice for suppliers in order to ensure that companies adhere to the Assembly's principles of sustainable development, equal opportunities, social inclusion and so on. For many small companies facing a serious problem of capacity, it may be difficult to adhere to supporting the Assembly's principles. Therefore, how will you ensure fairness in the procurement process?

The First Minister: The only requirement that we now have for organisations that wish to become contractors to the Assembly is that they must not be over-reliant on our business. If they supply goods, no more than 25 per cent of their turnover can come from Assembly business; if they supply services, the figure is 40 per cent. That is literally the only requirement that we have for companies wishing to be on the tender list.

Mick Bates: Do you agree that it is time that the Assembly became more proactive in encouraging local procurement by holding seminars throughout Wales to encourage the whole of our public sector to buy locally, as many people do not understand the European regulations governing procurement?

The First Minister: We have made it as simple as possible, as you can see from my answer to Jonathan's question. We are the only part of the UK Government to make it that simple. Most other Government organisations still require three years'

(OAQ18685)

Prif Weinidog Cymru (Rhodri Morgan): Mae hwnnw'n gwestiwn ardderchog. Drwy eich cwestiwn ardderchog chi a thryloywder fy ateb i, gobeithiaf roi cyhoedduswydd i'r ffaith ein bod wedi dileu'r angen i fusnesau bach a chanolig gyflwyno cyfrifon tair blynedd cyn cael eu hystyried i'w cynnwys ar ein rhestrau tendro ar gyfer contractau gwerth llai na £100,000. Ar gyfer contractau dros y trothwy hwnnw, gostyngir y gofyniad yn awr i gyfrifon dwy flynedd. Mae arnom eisiau galluogi mwy o fusnesau bach a chanolig yng Nghymru ac mewn mannau eraill i werthu i'r Cynulliad.

Jonathan Morgan: Yr ydych wedi datblygu cod ymarfer gwirfoddol i gyflenwyr er mwyn sicrhau bod cwmnïau'n glynu at egwyddorion y Cynulliad o ran datblygu cynaliadwy, cyfle cyfartal, cynhwysiant cymdeithasol ac ati. I lawer o gwmnïau bach sy'n wynebu problem ddifrifol o ran capasiti, gall fod yn anodd glynu at gefnogi egwyddorion y Cynulliad. Sut, felly, y gwnewch chi sicrhau tegwch yn y broses gaffael?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr unig ofyniad a wnawn bellach ar sefydliadau sy'n dymuno bod yn gontractwyr i'r Cynulliad yw bod yn rhaid iddynt beidio â bod yn or-ddibynnol ar ein busnes ni. Os ydynt yn gyflenwyr nwyddau, ni chaiff mwy na 25 y cant o'u trosiant ddod o fusnes y Cynulliad; os ydynt yn gyflenwyr gwasanaethau, 40 y cant yw'r ffigur. Dyna'n llythrennol yr unig ofyniad sydd gennym ar gyfer cwmnïau sy'n dymuno bod ar y rhestr dendro.

Mick Bates: A gytunwch ei bod yn bryd i'r Cynulliad fod yn fwy rhagweithiol o ran annog caffael lleol drwy gynnal seminarau ar hyd a lled Cymru i annog y cyfan o'n sector cyhoeddus i brynu'n lleol, gan fod llawer o bobl heb ddeall y rheoliadau Ewropeaidd ynglŷn â chaffael?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr ydym wedi ei wneud mor syml ag sy'n bosibl, fel y gwelwch oddi wrth fy ateb i gwestiwn Jonathan. Ni yw'r unig ran o Lywodraeth y DU i'w gwneud mor syml â hynny. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o sefydliadau eraill y Llywodraeth

accounts before a company can join the tender list. We also encourage companies to form a group if they are too small to handle, for example, a printing contract. Providing that the companies fulfil the tender criteria, that group can then take on the contract. If the group provides a good service, which is compatible with our quality requirements, at reasonable cost, it should be able to get Assembly work. The procurement unit set up by Edwina Hart is promoting selling to the Assembly, to ensure that as little Assembly business goes outside Wales as possible.

yn dal i fynnu cyfrifon tair blynedd cyn y caiff cwmni ymuno â'r rhestr dendro. Byddwn hefyd yn annog cwmnïau i ffurfio grŵp os ydynt yn rhy fach i drin contract argraffu, er enghraifft. Ar yr amod fod y cwmni'n cyflawni'r meini prawf ar gyfer tendro, yna gall y grŵp ymgymryd â'r contract. Os darpara'r grŵp wasanaeth da, sy'n gydnaws â'n gofynion ansawdd, am gost resymol, dylai allu cael gwaith gan y Cynulliad. Mae'r uned gaffael a sefydlwyd gan Edwina Hart yn hyrwyddo gwerthu i'r Cynulliad, er mwyn sicrhau yr aiff cyn lleied o fusnes y Cynulliad allan o Gymru ag sy'n bosibl.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Mae'n debyg y gwyddoch fod nifer o gwmnïau bellach yn cynnal eu busnes ar y we. A ydych yn ymwybodol bod 18 y cant o fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yng Nghymru heb gyfrifiadur, ac felly, ni allant ddefnyddio'r we? A gredwch y byddai'n fuddiol i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ystyried y broblem, a thrafod gyda Ffederasiwn y Busnesau Bach sut y gallwn sicrhau bod mwy o fusnesau yn gallu prynu cyfrifiaduron ac felly ddefnyddio'r we i gael mwy o fusnes?

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): You are probably aware that many companies now conduct their business over the internet. Are you aware that 18 per cent of small and medium-sized businesses in Wales do not have a computer, and cannot, therefore, use the internet? Do you agree that it would be beneficial for the Assembly Government to consider the problem and to discuss with the Federation of Small Businesses how we can ensure that more businesses can buy computers and thus use the internet to get more business?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae dau gwestiwn. Ai prinder cyfrifiaduron sydd yn rhwystro busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint rhag defnyddio'r we, neu'r ffaith nad oes gan weinyddwyr y busnesau hyn y sgiliau perthnasol i ddefnyddio'r we? Dyna brif bwrpas un o'n cynlluniau pwysicaf o dan Amcan 1, sef OpportunitE Wales, a weithredir ar y cyd â British Telecom a chwmnïau eraill. Mae'r cynllun hwnnw'n delio'n llwyddiannus â'r problemau hyn.

The First Minister: There are two questions. Is it a lack of computers that prevents small and medium-sized businesses from using the internet, or the fact that the administrators do not have the relevant skills to use the internet? That is the main purpose of one of our most important Objective 1 projects, OpportunitE Wales, which is being implemented in conjunction with British Telecom and other companies. That project successfully deals with these issues.

Diwydiant Dillad yng Ngheredigion a Sir Benfro Clothing Industry in Ceredigion and Pembrokeshire

C2 Cynog Dafis: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi eu cael gyda'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd parthed y diwydiant dillad yng Ngheredigion a Sir Benfro? (OAQ18686)

Q2 Cynog Dafis: What discussions has the First Minister had with the Minister for Economic Development about the clothing industry in Ceredigion and Pembrokeshire? (OAQ18686)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr ydym wedi cael llawer o drafodaethau. Ar ôl cyhoeddiad Dewhirst ynglŷn â'i ffatri yn Abertawe, yr oedd pobl, yn naturiol, yn troi eu sylw at y

The First Minister: We have had many discussions. After Dewhirst's announcement regarding its Swansea factory, people naturally turned their attention to the factories

ffatrïoedd y mae cymunedau Abergwaun ac Aberteifi a'r cylch yn dibynnu arnynt. Mae'r ffatrïoedd hyn wedi gwneud lles mawr i Abergwaun ac Aberteifi a'r cylch dros y 30 mlynedd ddiwethaf, ac fe achosodd datganiad diweddar Dewhirst ynglŷn â dyfodol y ddwy ffatri hynny bryder mawr yn yr ardaloedd hynny.

Cynog Dafis: Yn ôl datganiad cyhoeddus Dewhirst yr wythnos diwethaf, mae'r sefyllfa'n edrych yn ddu i ffatri Aberteifi, sydd yn cyflogi 378 o bobl. Byddai cau'r ffatri honno'n ergyd arswydus i'r gweithwyr a'r economi leol. A allwch warantu bod trefniadau ar y gweill i fesur effaith cau'r ffatri, pe digwyddai hynny, ac y bydd pecyn ariannol sylweddol ar gael i fuddsoddi yn yr economi leol, fel yr oedd yn achos y colledion swyddi yn y diwydiant dur, a fydd yn gymesur â graddfa'r argyfwng?

2:10 p.m.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Cytunaf fod y ffatrïoedd hynny'n bwysig i'r ardal, ac yr ydym yn gwneud paratoadau yn sgîl datganiad cyfarwyddwyr Dewhirst ar ddyfodol y ffatrïoedd yn y Gorllewin, ac wrth ystyried yr hyn a ddigwyddodd yn Abertawe. Yr ydym yn trefnu pecyn. Yn ogystal â hynny, gweithiwn gydag un o gwsmeriaid Dewhirst, Marks and Spencer, sy'n parhau yn fwy gobeithiol na Dewhirst, os gellir gwneud y gymhariaeth honno, ynglŷn â'r posibilïadau o fwrw ymlaen gyda chynhyrchu dillad yn y wlad hon. Dywed rhai nad oes dyfodol i gynhyrchu dillad yn y wlad hon oherwydd cyflogau. Er nad yw cyflogau yn uchel yng Nghymru, maent tua deuddeg gwaith yn uwch na chyflogau yng ngogledd Affrica, Dyna lle y mae'r cwmnïoedd yn mynd â'r gwaith. Fodd bynnag, nid yw Marks and Spencer, fel cwsmer, wedi rhoi'r gorau iddi. Os yw Dewhirst eisiau symud i'r neilltu, rhaid inni ystyried a fyddai cwmni arall yn gallu gweithio gyda Marks and Spencer er mwyn bwrw ymlaen â'r gwaith a defnyddio sgiliau gweithwyr ffatrïoedd Dewhirst yn Abergwaun ac Aberteifi.

Glyn Davies: Rhannaf bryder Cynog Dafis. A ydych wedi cael trafodaethau ar economi gorllewin Cymru gyda Marks and Spencer?

upon which the communities in Fishguard and Cardigan, and the surrounding area, are dependent. These factories have benefited those areas greatly over the past 30 years, and Dewhirst's latest statement on the future of those two factories caused much concern in those areas.

Cynog Dafis: According to Dewhirst's public statement last week, the situation looks bleak for the Cardigan factory, which employs 378 people. The closure of that factory would be a terrible blow to the workers and to the local economy. Can you guarantee that arrangements are in hand to measure the impact of the factory's closure, should it happen, and that a substantial financial package will be available to invest in the local economy, as it was in the case of the job losses in the steel industry, that will match the scale of the crisis?

The First Minister: I agree that those factories are important to the area, and we are making preparations, following the statement by the Dewhirst directors on the future of the factories in west Wales, and bearing in mind what happened in Swansea. We are arranging a package. Furthermore, we are working with one of Dewhirst's customers, Marks and Spencer, which remains more hopeful than Dewhirst, if such a comparison can be made, about the possibilities of continuing to manufacture clothes in this country. Some say that clothes manufacturing has no future in this country because of wages. Although wages are not high in Wales, they are around 12 times higher than in north Africa, which is where companies take the work. However, Marks and Spencer, as a customer, has not given up. If Dewhirst wants to step aside, we must consider the possibility of another company working with Marks and Spencer in order to continue the work and use the skills of the workers at the Dewhirst factories in Fishguard and Cardigan.

Glyn Davies: I share Cynog Dafis's concern. Have you had discussions on west Wales's economy with Marks and Spencer? Have you

A ydych wedi trafod effaith polisiau'r cwmni ar ei gynhyrchwyr, fel Dewhirst yn Sir Benfro, Abertawe a Cheredigion?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid wyf yn siŵr am Andrew Davies, ond nid wyf fi wedi cyfarfod â Marks and Spencer ers argyfwng Bairdwear ddwy neu dair blynedd yn ôl. Ni allaf siarad am Andrew ond gwn fod cysylltiadau wedi'u gwneud gyda Marks and Spencer yn ddiweddar. Ni chredaf fod Marks and Spencer wedi gollwng gafael ar y posibilrwydd o gynhyrchu dillad yn economaidd ym Mhrydain Fawr yn hytrach na rhoi'r gwaith yn gyfan gwbl iogledd Affrica.

Rhaid cydnabod y lles a wnaeth Dewhirst—neu Slimma (Wales) Ltd. fel y'i gelwid ers talwm a chyn hynny E. Walters Ludlow—i Aberteifi ac Abergwaun. Ers 30 mlynedd mae wedi bod yn gyflogwr pwysig yn y Canolbarth, yn Aberteifi ac yn Abergwaun. Byddai colli'r ddwy ffatri a'u cannoedd o swyddi yn Abergwaun ac Aberteifi yn ergyd enfawr.

Richard Edwards: I share the concerns about Dewhirst. However, I turn to another facet of the clothing industry in Pembrokeshire. Are you aware that the Athlons shoe factory in Milford Haven ceased to trade around 18 or 19 months ago? The owners did a midnight flit, having been awarded public moneys, including a grant of £250,000 in regional selective assistance, to help provide jobs that have not materialised. Can you assure me that the Government is taking appropriate steps to recover this substantial sum of taxpayers' money?

The First Minister: I will have to write to you about that matter as I do not have the details to hand. I recall the pleasant surprise when Athlons arrived. It was the first direct investment in Wales by a company based in the People's Republic of China. There were two Chinese shoe companies in the Milford Haven area at one time, but I am not sure whether they are still there. If there is a question of repayment of a grant, I will write to you and let you know where matters stand.

discussed in particular the effect of the company's policies on its suppliers, such as Dewhirst in Pembrokeshire, Swansea and Ceredigion?

The First Minister: I am not sure about Andrew Davies, but I have not met with Marks and Spencer since the Bairdwear crisis some two or three years ago. I cannot speak for Andrew, but I know that links have been established recently with Marks and Spencer. I do not think that Marks and Spencer has given up on the possibility of manufacturing clothes economically in Great Britain rather than moving the whole operation to north Africa.

We must acknowledge the benefit that Dewhirst—or Slimma (Wales) Ltd. as it used to be called, and before that, E. Walters Ludlow—brought to Cardigan and Fishguard. For 30 years, it has been an important employer in mid Wales, Cardigan and Fishguard. Losing those factories in Fishguard and Cardigan, and their hundreds of jobs, would be an enormous blow.

Richard Edwards: Rhannaf y pryderon ynglŷn â Dewhirst. Fodd bynnag, trof at elfen arall o'r diwydiant dillad yn Sir Benfro. A wyddoch fod ffatri esgidiau Athlons yn Aberdaugleddau wedi rhoi'r ffidil yn y to ryw 18 neu 19 mis yn ôl? Diflannodd y perchenogion yng nghanol y nos, ar ôl derbyn arian cyhoeddus, gan gynnwys grant o £250,000 ar ffurf cymorth dewisol rhanbarthol, i helpu darparu swyddi na ddaeth. A allwch fy sicrhau bod y Llywodraeth yn cymryd camau priodol i adennill y swm sylweddol hwn o arian y trethdalwyr?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Bydd yn rhaid imi ysgrifennu atoch ynglŷn â'r mater hwnnw gan nad yw'r manylion gennyf wrth law. Cofiaf y syndod pleserus pan gyrhaeddodd Athlons. Hwn oedd y buddsoddiad uniongyrchol cyntaf yng Nghymru gan gwmni â'i bencadlys yng Ngweriniaeth Tsieina. Yr oedd dau gwmni esgidiau o Tsieina yn ardal Aberdaugleddau ar un adeg, ond nid wyf yn siŵr a ydynt yn dal yno. Os oes cwestiwn o ad-dalu grant, ysgrifennaf atoch a rhoddaf wybod ichi sut y mae

pethau'n sefyll.

Gwasanaethau a Chyfleusterau mewn Ardaloedd Gwledig Services and Facilities in Rural Areas

Q3 Kirsty Williams: What is being done to tackle the inequality in facilities and services that exist in rural areas? (OAQ18664)

C3 Kirsty Williams: Beth sy'n cael ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â'r diffyg cydraddoldeb o ran cyfleusterau a gwasanaethau a welir mewn ardaloedd gwledig? (OAQ18664)

The First Minister: People are distant from services in rural services; that is the nature of rural areas and you cannot ignore that. However, despite that, people should have reasonable access to the full range of public services that makes civilisation, in the modern sense, possible, and in line with expectations. There is pressure on services in a wide range of areas following economy measures. If your constituents have raised concerns with you, perhaps you could draw them to my attention.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae pobl yn bell oddi wrth wasanaethau mewn ardaloedd gwledig; dyna natur ardaloedd gwledig ac ni allwch anwybyddu hynny. Fodd bynnag, er gwaethaf hynny, dylai pobl gael mynediad rhesymol at yr amrediad llawn o wasanaethau cyhoeddus sy'n gwneud gwareiddiad, yn yr ystyr fodern, yn bosibl, a hynny'n unol â'u disgwyliadau. Mae pwysau ar wasanaethau mewn llawer o ardaloedd yn dilyn mesurau cynilo. Os yw eich etholwyr wedi codi materion gyda chi, efallai y gallech eu dwyn i'm sylw.

Kirsty Williams: I would be happy to do so. Coleg Powys has recently decided to rationalise many of its courses, with the result that many of my constituents must travel an hour or more to attend vital information technology courses in an area that is poorly served by public transport. How can this rationalisation be justified?

Kirsty Williams: Byddwn yn hapus i wneud hynny. Yn ddiweddar, penderfynodd Coleg Powys resymoli llawer o'i gyrsiau, nes bod rhaid i lawer o'm hetholwyr deithio awr neu fwy i fynychu cyrsiau technoleg gwybodaeth hanfodol mewn ardal sydd heb wasanaeth cludiant cyhoeddus da. Sut y gellir cyfiawnhau'r rhesymoli hwn?

The First Minister: If you give me the exact details, I will take that up with Coleg Powys. Although further education colleges are autonomous bodies and make their own decisions, we can bring a degree of political pressure to bear, especially in information technology, where it is possible to use distance learning. Provided that there is a telephone at home and reasonable telephone services it should be possible for some of the course to be taught using the latest distance learning technology, without students having to travel for an hour to the college.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Os rhoddwch yr union fanylion imi, fe godaf hynny â Choleg Powys. Er bod colegau addysg bellach yn gyrrff annibynnol sy'n gwneud eu penderfyniadau eu hunain, gallwn roi rhyw radd o bwysau gwleidyddol, yn enwedig ym maes technoleg gwybodaeth, lle mae modd defnyddio dysgu o bell. Os oes ffôn yn y cartref a gwasanaethau ffôn rhesymol dylai fod modd dysgu rhywfaint o'r cwrs gan ddefnyddio'r dechnoleg ddiweddaraf ym maes dysgu o bell, heb i fyfyrwyr orfod teithio am awr i'r coleg.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: O ran pobl sydd yn byw yng nghefn gwlad Cymru, a diffyg cydraddoldeb o ran mynediad i wasanaethau, a gytuna'r Prif Weinidog fod diffyg cydraddoldeb rhwng pobl sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd gwledig yng Nghymru a phobl sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn yr

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Regarding people living in rural areas in Wales, and the lack of equality of access to services, does the First Minister agree that there is a lack of equality between people who live in rural areas in Wales and those who live in rural areas in Scotland? People receive free personal care

Alban? Mae pobl yn cael gofal personol yn rhad ac am ddim yn yr Alban, nad yw ar gael yng Nghymru.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Dyna beth yw natur datganoli, Rhodri Glyn. Byddech yn disgwyl hynny. Ni allwch gael datganoli a sawl corff gyda blaenoriaethau gwahanol, ac weithiau pwerau gwahanol, a sicrhau safonau cyson. Byddai pobl yn amau'r diben o gael gwleidyddion os dânt â'r un ateb i faterion cymdeithasol pwysig o'r math hwn. Gŵyr pawb am yr hyn a gyflwynwyd yn yr Alban ddoe a byddwn yn ystyried derbyniad y system honno. Problem fawr y system a gyflwynwyd yn yr Alban yw bod pobl yn colli lwfans gweini. Os yw claf yn cael gofal personol am ddim, ni all hawlio rhai budd-daliadau o'r Asiantaeth Budd-daliadau

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): You will be aware of the serious situation regarding the performance of the ambulance service in rural areas. That is not a reflection on the people who work in the ambulance service. However, in the last few months, Ceredigion Community Health Council has made representations because a patient had to be taken in the back of a patrol car to Bronglais Hospital and there was a similar incident last week in Bala. Unison has made representations to me about the dreadful situation in north Powys and I know of the serious situation in south Powys in the Crickhowell area. Powys has the poorest emergency response time in Wales, with only 43.9 per cent of emergencies being met within the target time. What is the Government of Wales doing to address this serious problem?

The First Minister: The ambulance service is a classic example of where you must, for reasons of distance, set different standards for ambulance response times in urban and rural areas. Even with slower response times, there will clearly be occasions when there are too many calls at once. I agree that this is not a criticism of the ambulance crews. I have experience in my own family of the excellent crews in that part of Wales. I commend them for the work that they do. I see them at the

in Scotland, which is not available in Wales.

The First Minister: That is the nature of devolution, Rhodri Glyn. You would expect that. You cannot have devolution and a number of organisations with different priorities, and sometimes different powers, and ensure consistent standards. People would begin to question whether politicians are at all necessary if they come up with the same solutions to important social issues of this kind. We are all aware of what was introduced in Scotland yesterday and we will consider how that system will be received. The problem with the Scottish system is that people lose attendance allowances. If a patient has free personal care, they cannot receive certain benefits from the Benefits Agency.

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): Gwyddoch am sefyllfa ddifrifol perfformiad y gwasanaeth ambiwlans mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Nid adlewyrchiad o'r bobl sy'n gweithio yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yw hynny. Fodd bynnag, yn yr ychydig fisoedd diwethaf, mae Cyngor Iechyd Cymuned Ceredigion wedi cyflwyno sylwadau oherwydd bu'n rhaid cario claf yng nghefn car heddlu i Ysbyty Bronglais, a chafwyd digwyddiad tebyg yr wythnos diwethaf yn y Bala. Mae Unsain wedi cyflwyno sylwadau imi am y sefyllfa ofnadwy yng ngogledd Powys a gwn am y sefyllfa ddifrifol yn ne Powys yn ardal Crucywel. Ym Mhowys y mae'r amserau ateb argyfwng gwaethaf yng Nghymru, a dim ond 43.9 y cant o argyfyngau a gaiff sylw o fewn yr amser targed. Beth mae Llywodraeth Cymru'n ei wneud i ddatrys y broblem ddifrifol hon?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn enghraifft glasurol o faes lle y mae'n rhaid, am resymau pellter, osod safonau gwahanol ar gyfer amserau ymateb ambiwlans mewn ardaloedd trefol a gwledig. Hyd yn oed gydag amserau ymateb arafach, fe geir achlysuron, yn amlwg, lle ceir gormod o alwadau ar unwaith. Cytunaf nad beirniadaeth o'r criwiau ambiwlans yw hyn. Mae gennyf brofiad yn fy rheulu fy hun o'r criwiau ardderchog yn y rhan honno o

standby points on the coast road when I holiday in that part of Wales. However, occasionally, if three calls are received at the same time, there is nothing that can be done. I need to examine the particular incidents to which you refer. If you specify the dates, to ensure that there is no misunderstanding, we will examine whether there is a reasonable explanation of that kind or whether we need to consider the provision.

Gymru. Fe'u cymeradwyaf am y gwaith a wnânt. Fe'u gwelaf yn aros am alwadau wrth ochr ffordd yr arfordir pan fyddaf ar wyliau yn y rhan honno o Gymru. Fodd bynnag, yn achlysurol, os daw tair galwad i mewn ar yr un pryd, nid oes dim y gellir ei wneud. Rhaid imi edrych ar y digwyddiadau penodol y cyfeiriwch chi atynt. Os nodwch y dyddiadau, er mwyn sicrhau nad oes camddealltwriaeth, fe wnawn archwilio a oes eglurhad rhesymol ynteu a oes angen inni styried y ddarpariaeth.

Symud Deunyddiau Niwclear Nuclear Movements

Q4 Richard Edwards: Has the First Minister had any discussions with the Secretary of State for Wales regarding nuclear movements in the Irish Sea? (OAQ18679)

C4 Richard Edwards: A yw'r Prif Weinidog wedi cael unrhyw drafodaethau gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynghylch symud deunyddiau niwclear ar fôr Iwerddon? (OAQ18679)

The First Minister: I meet the Secretary of State regularly but we have not discussed this issue. Shipping matters are the responsibility of the Department for Transport and have not been devolved.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Byddaf yn cyfarfod yn rheolaidd â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol ond nid ydym wedi trafod y mater hwn. Cyfrifoldeb yr Adran Drafnidiaeth yw materion llongau ac nid ydynt wedi'u datganoli.

Richard Edwards: Are you aware that, probably next month, a shipment from Japan of rejected mixed oxide containing 255 kg of weapons-usable plutonium equivalent to 25 nuclear weapons is due to reach the Irish sea on its return to Sellafield after British Nuclear Fuels admitted to falsifying critical safety data? Are you also aware that, as part of a global nuclear-free seas campaign, flotillas from Pembrokeshire and Ireland will form a Celtic link in peaceful protest when the shipment passes through St George's channel? Will you join me in supporting the flotillas and in urging Members to sign my statement of opinion to demonstrate this Assembly's overwhelming opposition to an unlawful cargo, which adds substantially to the threat of nuclear proliferation and terrorism, as well as posing huge hazards of environmental contamination, for which there is no adequate provision.

Richard Edwards: A wyddoch y bydd llwyth o ocsid cymysg gwrthodedig o Siapan, yn cynnwys 255kg o blwtoniwm y gellid ei ddefnyddio i wneud 25 arf niwclear, yn cyrraedd môr Iwerddon y mis nesaf, mae'n debyg, ar ei ffordd yn ôl i Sellafield wedi i British Nuclear Fuels Ltd gyfaddef ffugio data diogelwch allweddol? A wyddoch hefyd y bydd cychod bach o Sir Benfro ac Iwerddon yn ffurfio cadwyn Geltaidd mewn protest heddychlon fel rhan o ymgyrch moroedd di-niwclear byd-eang wrth i'r llwyth basio drwy sianel San Siôr? A wnewch chi ymuno â mi i gefnogi'r cychod ac i annog Aelodau i lofnodi fy natganiad barn i fynegi gwrthwynebiad llethol y Cynulliad hwn i gargo anghyfreithlon, sy'n ychwanegu'n sylweddol at fygythiad lluosogi arfau niwclear a therfysgaeth, yn ogystal â chreu peryglon enfawr o halogi'r môr, heb fod darpariaeth ddigonol ar ei gyfer?

2:20 p.m.

The First Minister: I understand the strength of feeling in Pembrokeshire and Ireland on

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Deallaf gryfder y teimladau yn Sir Benfro ac Iwerddon ar y

this issue. I am not clear on the alternative course of action that you commend, Richard. Once we accept that Sellafield massively falsified safety data, and that the Japanese utility, Kansai Electric Power Co. in Takahama, says that the fuel is not what Sellafield said it was, Sellafield has a moral duty to take it back. How you get it back is another matter. I understand the strength of feeling, but Sellafield has a moral duty to accept the fuel back via as safe a route as is possible.

Dafydd Wigley: A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn derbyn bod perygl gwirioneddol i bobl Cymru os caiff y deunydd plwtoniwm ymbelydrol hwn ei gludo dros y môr ar hyd arfordir Cymru? Pe bai damwain—a gwyddwn heddiw sut y gall damweiniau ddigwydd, gydag awyrennau yn bomio pobl Affganistan—gall fod cynnydd yn lefelau ymbelydredd y môr a fyddai'n codi lefelau'r canser mewn pobl sy'n byw ar hyd yr arfordir, a phe bai'r tanwydd yn cyrraedd Sellafield, byddai'r fan honno'n darged. Pe bai terfysgwyr yn ymosod ar Sellafield, gallent ddinistrio cylch o 200 milltir o gwmpas y safle. Onid yw'n hen bryd i'r Cynulliad godi ei lais er lles pobl Cymru?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid ydych yn awgrymu beth arall y gellid ei wneud â'r tanwydd. Unwaith y bu'n rhaid i Sellafield fod yn onest o ran y camsyniadau yn y data—ac efallai eu bod yn rhai bwriadol—o ran natur y tanwydd, rhaid oedd ei dderbyn yn ôl. Gall ddyn areithio hyd at sgrechian am y ffaith na ddylai hyn ddigwydd ar hyd arfordir Cymru. Ni wyddwn pryd y bydd y llongau yn gadael Siapan, gan nad oes ganddynt yr hawl eto. Bydd hynny tua diwedd y flwyddyn. Rhaid inni gynnig un ai ffordd arall o gael y deunydd yn ôl i Sellafield, neu gynnig rhywle arall iddo fynd.

mater hwn. Nid wyf yn glir ar y gweithredu arall a argymhellwch, Richard. Unwaith y derbyniwn fod Sellafield wedi ffugio data diogelwch ar raddfa enfawr, a bod y cwmni Siapaniaidd, Kansai Electric Power Co. yn Takahama, yn dweud nad yw'r tanwydd yr hyn y dywedodd Sellafield ydoedd, mae gan Sellafield ddyletswydd foesol i'w gymryd yn ôl. Mater arall yw sut mae ei gael yn ôl. Deallaf gryfder y teimladau, ond mae gan Sellafield ddyletswydd foesol i gymryd y tanwydd yn ôl yn y ffordd mwyaf diogel posibl.

Dafydd Wigley: Does the First Minister accept that there is a real danger to the people of Wales if this radioactive plutonium material is transported by sea along Wales's coastline? Should an accident occur—and today we know how accidents can happen, with aeroplanes and the bombing of Afghan people—the sea's radioactivity levels could increase which would increase the levels of cancer in people living along the coast, and if it arrived at Sellafield, it would be a target. If terrorists were to attack Sellafield, they could destroy 200 miles of land around the site. Is it not high time that the Assembly raised its voice for the sake of the people of Wales?

The First Minister: You do not offer any alternative as to what to do with fuel. Once Sellafield had to be honest about the mistakes—and perhaps they were intentional—in the data about the nature of the fuel, it had to be accepted back. One can lecture until blue in the face about the fact that this should not happen along Wales's coastline. We do not know when the shipment will leave Japan, as it does not yet have permission. It should be around the end of the year. We must suggest either alternative means of returning the material to Sellafield, or somewhere else for it to go.

Ffonau Cyhoeddus mewn Ardaloedd Gwledig Public Telephones in Rural Areas

Q5 David Davies: What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to ensure that vulnerable sections of society in rural areas continue to have access to public telephones? (OAQ18667)

C5 David Davies: Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod ffonau cyhoeddus yn dal i fod ar gael mewn ardaloedd gwledig ar gyfer y rhannau hynny o'r gymdeithas sy'n agored i niwed? (OAQ18667)

The First Minister: The number of public call boxes in Wales is an issue here. Wales has one call box for every 584 head of the population, while the figure for the UK is one for every 618 heads. That relates to the nature of the terrain in Wales; we have more widespread, low-density areas of population in rural Wales.

Public call boxes are also suffering from the price increase, from 5 pence to 10 pence, following privatisation. I expect that you remember that disastrous decision back in 1986. Mobile telephones have also since helped to kill the trade; there has been a 40 per cent drop in the use of public call boxes as so many more people have mobile phones. However, vulnerable communities can continue to request the provision of a public call box.

David Davies: You were correct in drawing attention to the fact that the hugely successful privatisation of British Telecom led to an enormous increase in the number of people owning their own telephones. That has affected the viability of some public call boxes. However, some people will never be able to afford either mobile or conventional telephones. Will you support them and, if so, how?

The First Minister: The Office of Telecommunications has BT's assurance that it will remove call boxes mainly in urban and suburban areas. Such areas are currently well provided for with other public call boxes, some of which are little used. Oftel does not expect BT to close down. The long walking distances between call boxes, poor social housing and the poor level of alternative provision in vulnerable or remote rural communities means that we do not expect a major reduction in the number of public call boxes in such areas.

Peter Black: Given the Assembly's interest in rural development and the need to protect isolated rural communities where people may not have access to their own phones, will the First Minister hold talks with telecommunications companies to ensure that, if a phone box is to be removed, the

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae nifer y blychau ffôn cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn bwnc o bwys yma. Mae gan Cymru un blwch ffôn am bob 584 pen o'r boblogaeth, tra mai un i bob 618 pen yw'r ffigur ar gyfer y DU. Mae hynny'n adlewyrchu natur y tirwedd yng Nghymru; mae gennym fwy o ardaloedd gwasgaredig, isel eu poblogaeth yng nghefn gwlad Cymru.

Mae blychau ffôn cyhoeddus yn dioddef hefyd o'r codiad, o 5 ceiniog i 10 ceiniog, yn sgîl preifateiddio. Mae'n debyg y cofiwch y penderfyniad trychinebus hwnnw yn ôl yn 1986. Mae ffonau symudol wedi helpu i ladd y busnes hefyd; bu cwmp o 40 y cant yn y defnydd o flychau ffôn cyhoeddus gan fod gan gymaint yn fwy o bobl ffonau symudol. Er hynny, gall cymunedau diamddiffyn barhau i ofyn am gael blwch ffôn cyhoeddus.

David Davies: Yr oeddech yn iawn i dynnu sylw at y ffaith fod y broses hynod o lwyddiannus o breifateiddio Telecom Prydain wedi arwain at gynnydd aruthrol yn y nifer o bobl sy'n berchen ar eu ffôn eu hunain. Effeithiodd hynny ar hyfywra rhai blychau ffôn cyhoeddus. Er hynny, ni fydd rhai pobl fyth yn gallu fforddio ffôn symudol na ffôn confensiynol. A wnewch chi eu cefnogi hwy ac, os felly, sut?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae BT wedi sicrhau'r Swyddfa Delathrebu y gwnaiff dynnu blychau ffôn o ardaloedd trefol a maestrefol yn bennaf. Mae nifer helaeth o flychau ffôn cyhoeddus eraill yn yr ardaloedd hynny, rhai ohonynt heb fawr o ddefnydd arnynt. Nid yw Oftel yn disgwyl i BT gau. Mae'r pellteroedd cerdded hir rhwng blychau ffôn, tai cymdeithasol gwael a lefel isel y ddarpariaeth amgen mewn cymunedau gwledig diamddiffyn neu ddiarffordd yn golygu na ddisgwyliwn gwtogi mawr ar nifer y blychau ffôn cyhoeddus mewn ardaloedd o'r fath.

Peter Black: O gofio diddordeb y Cynulliad mewn datblygu gwledig a'r angen i warchod cymunedau gwledig diarffordd lle efallai nad oes gan bobl eu ffôn eu hunain, a wnaiff y Prif Weinidog gynnal trafodaethau gyda'r cwmnïau telathrebu i sicrhau yr ymgynghorir â'r Cynulliad cyn tynnu unrhyw flwch ffôn?

Assembly will be consulted first? Will you also take account of the need for public telephones when considering how we can develop those communities in future?

The First Minister: Oftel has that understanding with British Telecom at present. We can enquire whether Oftel is satisfied that when it contests a proposed decision to remove a call box from a vulnerable community—not necessarily a rural one; it may be in a small, vulnerable, urban community, a small council estate or whatever—and it does not feel that it has enough protection to dissuade BT from doing that, we can consider whether we can inject our views into the process. At present it seems that Oftel is fairly happy that BT does not propose to remove call boxes from vulnerable communities.

A wnewch chi ystyried hefyd yr angen am ffonau cyhoeddus pan fyddwch yn ystyried sut y gallwn ddatblygu'r cymunedau hynny yn y dyfodol?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae gan Oftel y ddealltwriaeth honno gyda Thelecom Prydain ar hyn o bryd. Gallwn holi a yw Oftel yn fodlon, pan ddadleua yn erbyn cynnig i dynnu blwch ffôn allan o gymuned ddiamddiffyn—nid un wledig, o reidrwydd; gall fod mewn cymuned drefol fach, ddiamddiffyn, stad cyngor fach neu beth bynnag—a phan nad yw'n teimlo bod ganddo ddigon o warchodaeth i ddarbwylllo BT rhag gwneud hynny, y gallwn ni ystyried a allwn ni gyfrannu'n sylwadau i'r broses. Ar hyn o bryd mae'n ymddangos fod Oftel yn weddol hapus nad yw BT'n bwriadu tynnu blychau ffôn allan o gymunedau diamddiffyn.

Tîm Mabolgampau Cymru Welsh Athletics Team

C6 Dafydd Wigley: Pa gamau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cymryd i sicrhau bod tîm mabolgampau Cymru yn cael yr adnoddau angenrheidiol er mwyn perfformio hyd eithaf ei allu yng Ngemau'r Gymanwlad? (OAQ18684)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid wyf yn siŵr beth yw'r dystiolaeth fod unrhyw amheuaeth ynglŷn â digonedd adnoddau tîm mabolgampau Cymru. Bydd dros 300 o athletwyr Cymru yn mynd i Fanceinion a'r canolfannau eraill i gymryd rhan yng Ngemau'r Gymanwlad ddiwedd y mis. Mae Cyngor Chwaraeon Cymru wedi rhoi £35,000 i Gyngor Gemau'r Gymanwlad Cymru. Yn ogystal â hynny, mae £500,000 yng nghronfa wrth gefn Cyngor Gemau'r Gymanwlad Cymru, felly nid oes amheuaeth nad oes digon o arian gan y cyngor i ddarparu adnoddau digonol i'r athletwyr.

Dafydd Wigley: Daw'r dystiolaeth o enau swyddogion y cyngor. Beth bynnag a ddigwyddodd y tro hwn, a dderbyniwch fod cyfrifoldeb arnom ar lefel genedlaethol Gymreig—fel Cynulliad ac fel Llywodraeth—ac ar Gyngor Chwaraeon Cymru, i sicrhau y caiff pob athletwr yng Nghymru sydd wedi cyrraedd y safon

Q6 Dafydd Wigley: What steps has the First Minister taken to ensure that the Welsh athletics team gets the resources needed to be able to perform to the best of its ability in the Commonwealth Games? (OAQ18684)

The First Minister: I am not sure what the evidence is that there is any doubt about the sufficiency of the Welsh athletics team's resources. Over 300 Welsh athletes will go to Manchester and the other centres to take part in the Commonwealth Games at the end of the month. The Sports Council for Wales has given £35,000 to the Commonwealth Games Council for Wales. In addition, there is £500,000 in the Commonwealth Games Council for Wales's reserves, so there is no question that the council does not have enough money to provide sufficient resources to the athletes.

Dafydd Wigley: The evidence comes from council officials. Whatever happened this time, do you accept that there is a responsibility on us at a national Welsh level—as an Assembly and as a Government—and on the Sports Council for Wales, to ensure that every athlete in Wales who achieves the necessary standard gets the

angenrheidiol gyfle, nid yn unig i fynd i gemau o'r fath yn y dyfodol, ond hefyd i gael cefnogaeth ar gyfer hyfforddi ac ar gyfer y costau ychwanegol a wynebant wrth fynychu'r gemau, ac y dylem sicrhau o hyn ymlaen ein bod yn ysgwyddo ein cyfrifoldeb?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ni allwch ysgwyddo cyfrifoldeb pan fo £500,000 yng nghronfa wrth gefn Cyngor Gemau'r Gymanwlad Cymru. Mae'n rhaid iddo ddefnyddio'r gronfa honno cyn pledio tlodi a gofyn inni am ragor o arian. Mae ganddo ddigonedd o arian yn y gronfa wrth gefn.

Alun Pugh: Have you noticed that in the Commonwealth Games team, north Wales is not represented as its population would indicate? On a team of 11 or 15 you cannot choose on the basis of geography, but on a team of 300, the laws of large numbers and statistical inference apply. Do you think that there is something wrong here?

The First Minister: Please write to me if you have evidence of north Wales athletes—or people of Welsh origin who live outside Wales—who are better than the athletes from mid or south Wales that have been picked for the team. If you have evidence you could perhaps give me a list of half a dozen or so north Wales athletes who have performed better and who would be better qualified to take part than the ones that have been selected. I know of no such evidence, but if you do, please let me have it.

opportunity, not only to go to these kind of games in the future, but to get the support for training and the additional costs that they face when attending the games, and that we should ensure from now on that we accept our responsibility?

The First Minister: You cannot accept responsibility when there is £500,000 in the reserves of the Commonwealth Games Council for Wales. It must use those before pleading poverty and asking us for more money. It has enough money in its reserves.

Alun Pugh: A ydych wedi sylwi nad yw gogledd Cymru wedi'i gynrychioli yn nhîm Gemau'r Gymanwlad yn gymesur â'i boblogaeth? Ar dîm o 11 neu 15 ni ellir dewis ar sail daearyddiaeth, ond ar dîm o 300, mae deddfau rhifau mawr a chasgliadau ystadegol yn weithredol. A gredwch fod rhywbeth o'i le yma?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ysgrifennwch ataf os oes gennych dystiolaeth o athletwyr o'r gogledd—neu bobl o dras Gymreig sy'n byw y tu allan i Gymru—sy'n well na'r athletwyr o'r canolbarth neu'r de a ddewiswyd i'r tîm. Os oes gennych dystiolaeth efallai y gallech roi rhestr o ryw hanner dwsin o athletwyr o'r Gogledd sydd wedi perfformio'n well ac a fyddai'n fwy cymwys i gymryd rhan na'r rhai a ddewiswyd. Ni wn i am unrhyw dystiolaeth o'r fath, ond os gwyddoch chi, gadewch imi ei chael, da chi.

Gwerthu Cyffuriau Drug Trafficking

Q7 David Melding: Has the First Minister discussed the problem of drug trafficking within the British isles and Ireland during the meetings of the British-Irish Council? (OAQ18688)

The First Minister: This was the main focus of the British-Irish Council summit meeting held in Dublin on 30 November 2001, which I attended with Jane Hutt and Jenny Randerson, the then acting Deputy First Minister. We discussed the enormous steps forward taken by the Republic of Ireland in sequestering drug dealers' assets. Even if

C7 David Melding: A yw'r Prif Weinidog wedi trafod problem gwerthu cyffuriau yn ynysoedd Prydain ac Iwerddon yn ystod cyfarfodydd y Cyngor Prydeinig-Gwyddelig? (OAQ18688)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Dyma oedd prif bwnc trafod uwch-gynhadledd y Cyngor Prydeinig-Gwyddelig a gynhaliwyd yn Nulyn ar 30 Tachwedd 2001, a fynychais ynghyd â Jane Hutt a Jenny Randerson, y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog gweithredol ar y pryd. Trafodasom y camau breision ymlaen a gymerwyd gan Weriniaeth Iwerddon er mwyn atafaelu

dealers cannot be brought to court for drug dealing, it is possible to use the procedure that Ireland brought in following the assassination of journalist Veronica Guerin of getting at their assets to reduce the incentive for any would be criminal to enter organised crime and drugs racketeering. They may enter drugs racketeering, but they will not profit from it if they keep losing their assets.

David Melding: Do you agree that it is merely a counsel of despair when some people urge us to decriminalise certain drugs, and that we should concentrate on law enforcement and ensure that all Governments in the British Isles do their duty and protect their citizens accordingly?

2:30 p.m.

The First Minister: That is broadly in line with my views. However, Edwina and I will be meeting the four chief constables before the summer recess, and I know that they have differing views on this subject. I would therefore rather not reveal my colours before we have that meeting in two or three weeks' time.

Eleanor Burnham: Given the previous request to hold a summit on drugs in Wales, have you considered further whether that is practical, and if so, how would such a summit learn lessons from other parts of the British Isles?

The First Minister: The key to this issue is that best practice exists here and there. Sometimes the best practice will have been established in Welsh communities, in Scotland, Dublin, or elsewhere in Ireland, and all over England as the largest country. We want to learn from that best practice and apply it at the appropriate level in communities, particularly in light of Assistant Chief Constable Francis' letter—and the anecdotal evidence that goes with it—to all Assembly Members, MPs and council leaders in Wales, apart from north Wales. The letter indicates a major attempt to flood south and mid-Wales with cheap heroin and crack

asedau gwerthwyr cyffuriau. Hyd yn oed os na ellir dod â gwerthwyr i'r llys am werthu cyffuriau, y mae modd defnyddio'r drefn a gyflwynodd Iwerddon yn dilyn llofruddiaeth y newyddiadurwraig Veronica Guerin, sef mynd am eu hasedau i leihau'r cymhelliant i unrhyw ddarpar ddrwgweithredwr ymuno â byd dihirod proffesiynol a gwerthu cyffuriau. Efallai y byddant yn gwerthu cyffuriau, ond ni wnânt elw ohono os collant eu hasedau o hyd.

David Melding: A gytunwch mai dim ond cyngor anobaith a geir wrth i rai pobl ein hannog i ddatgrimmaleiddio rhai cyffuriau, ac y dylem ganolbwyntio ar gynnal y gyfraith a sicrhau bod pob Llywodraeth yng ngwledydd Prydain yn gwneud eu dyletswydd ac yn gwarchod eu dinasyddion yn briodol?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Cytunaf â hynny'n fras. Fodd bynnag, bydd Edwina a mi'n cwrdd â'r pedwar prif gwnstabl cyn toriad yr haf, a gwn fod ganddynt hwy syniadau gwahanol ar y pwnc hwn. Felly byddai'n well gennyf beidio â dangos fy lliwiau cyn inni gael y cyfarfod hwnnw ymhen dwy neu dair wythnos.

Eleanor Burnham: Ynglŷn â'r cais blaenorol i gynnal uwch-gynhadledd ar gyffuriau yng Nghymru, a ydych wedi ystyried ymhellach a yw hynny'n ymarferol, ac os ydych, sut y byddai uwch-gynhadledd o'r fath yn dysgu gwersi oddi wrth rannau eraill o ynysoedd Prydain?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr allwedd i'r mater hwn yw bod arfer gorau'n bodoli yma ac acw. Weithiau bydd yr arfer gorau wedi'i sefydlu mewn cymunedau yng Nghymru, yn yr Alban, Delyn neu fannau eraill yn Iwerddon, a ledled Lloegr fel y wlad fwyaf. Mae arnom eisiau dysgu oddi wrth yr arfer gorau hwnnw a'i gymhwyso ar y lefel briodol mewn cymunedau, yn enwedig ar ôl derbyn llythyr y Prif Gwnstabl Cynorthwyol Francis—a'r dystiolaeth anecdotaidd sydd ynghlwm wrtho—at holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad, ASau ac arweinyddion cyngor yng Nghymru, ac eithrio'r Gogledd. Mae'r llythyr yn disgrifio ymgais fawr i foddio'r De a'r

cocaine to get people hooked on it, which will mean that the price will go up. There could be disastrous consequences, as seen on the fringes of Wales, in Bristol and Liverpool.

Geraint Davies: Are you aware of the United States of America Department of State's recent report, which praises developments in Ireland to tackle drug trafficking? Do you believe that there are lessons to be learned in this country from Ireland's good practice?

The First Minister: I did not hear where this had taken place, other than in the United States of America.

Geraint Davies: It was a report from the United States Department of State.

The First Minister: I am not familiar with the report. Perhaps you could give me a copy, and I will digest it before the meeting with the four chief constables and Edwina, which will happen in the final week of the Assembly's proceedings before the summer recess.

The Presiding Officer: Question 8 (OAQ18675) has been withdrawn.

Canolbarth â heroin a chocên crac rhad er mwyn cael pobl yn gaeth iddo, a fydd yn golygu y bydd y pris yn codi. Gallai hyn gael canlyniadau trychinebus, fel a welwyd ar gyrlon Cymru, ym Mryste a Lerpwl.

Geraint Davies: A ydych yn ymwybodol o adroddiad diweddar Adran Gwladwriaeth Unol Daleithiau America, sy'n canmol datblygiadau yn Iwerddon i atal masnachu cyffuriau? A gredwch fod gwersi i'w dysgu yn y wlad hon oddi wrth arfer da Iwerddon?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ni chlywais ymhle yr oedd hyn wedi digwydd, ac eithrio ei fod yn Unol Daleithiau America.

Geraint Davies: Adroddiad gan Adran Gwladwriaeth yr Unol Daleithiau ydoedd.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid wyf yn gyfarwydd â'r adroddiad. Efallai y gallech roi copi imi, ac fe'i hystyriaf cyn y cyfarfod gyda'r pedwar prif gwnstabl ac Edwina, a gynhelir yn wythnos olaf sesiwn y Cynulliad cyn toriad yr haf.

Y Llywydd: Mae cwestiwn 8 (OAQ18675) wedi'i dynnu'n ôl.

Nifer y Bobl sy'n cael eu Lladd ar Ffyrdd Road Fatalities in Wales

Q9 William Graham: Will the First Minister make a statement on discussions he has held with the Secretary of State for Wales concerning the number of people killed on roads in Wales? (OAQ18666)

The First Minister: I have not had recent discussions with the Secretary of State for Wales on this matter. Improving road safety is one of the Assembly Government's priorities, and Sue Essex will soon be announcing a road safety strategy for Wales.

William Graham: In 2001, road deaths in Wales increased by 11 per cent. You will no doubt agree that hidden in this increase is the alarming fact that the number of children who died in road accidents rose from 8 to 13,

C9 William Graham: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am drafodaethau y mae wedi'u cynnal gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynghylch nifer y bobl sy'n cael eu lladd ar ffyrdd Cymru? (OAQ18666)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid wyf wedi cael trafodaethau diweddar gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ar y mater hwn. Mae gwella diogelwch y ffyrdd yn un o flaenoriaethau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, a bydd Sue Essex cyn hir yn cyhoeddi strategaeth diogelwch ffyrdd i Gymru.

William Graham: Yn 2001, bu cynnydd o 11 y cant mewn marwolaethau ar y ffyrdd yng Nghymru. Mae'n siŵr y cytunwch fod y cynnydd hwn yn cuddio'r ffaith arswydus fod nifer y plant a fu farw mewn damweiniau

which is an increase of over 60 per cent. We all hope that it is a one-off increase, and would welcome any initiatives you may have to reduce this road death toll.

The First Minister: I have seen the 2001 figures and they are worrying. In any year's statistics there will be a tendency to drift from serious casualties where death does not result, to death. However, on this occasion, there was an increase in deaths, and a reduction in serious casualties. Those figures are easily changeable. There is no reason to presume that we are failing to get road deaths down further. All manner of suggestions have been made, mostly with regard to speed reduction, the effect of hidden or obvious speed cameras and other ways in which we can reduce the impact of speeding cars, which are likely to bring about death rather than minor injury.

John Griffiths: I share William Graham's concern regarding accidents and deaths on our roads. The Assembly has introduced various good initiatives and a strategy will shortly be announced, as you said. In addition, do you agree that we should support 20 mph speed limits in our inner-urban areas, such as our council estates in Wales, where, unfortunately, there are still far too many accidents?

The First Minister: I have heard that suggested as the biggest single contributor to reduce deaths, particularly among children who play on the edges of streets or occasionally follow an errant tennis ball across the street when a car is coming round the corner. Accidents are not usually fatal if the car is travelling at 15 or 18 mph, but they are at 30 mph. This matter will await the publication of Sue Essex's road accident strategy.

Janet Davies: One of the big moves to reduce accidents today is the establishment of areas of traffic calming. In some places, they are important, and in other places, one wonders whether they are the best way forward, particularly on some main roads. Are you considering monitoring to compare accidents on these stretches of road before

ffyrdd wedi codi o 8 i 13, sef cynnydd o dros 60 y cant. Gobeithia pob un ohonom mai cynnydd annodweddiadol yw hwn, a chroesawem unrhyw gynlluniau a fo gennych i leihau'r marwolaethau hyn.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Gwelais ffigurau 2001 ac maent yn destun pryder. Yn ystadegau unrhyw flwyddyn bydd tuedd i ddrifftio o anafiadau difrifol lle nad achoswyd marwolaeth, i farwolaeth. Fodd bynnag, ar yr achlysur hwn, cafwyd cynnydd yn y marwolaethau, a lleihad yn yr anafiadau difrifol. Gellir cyfnewid y ffigurau hynny yn hawdd. Nid oes dim rheswm i dybio ein bod yn methu cael niferoedd marwolaethau i lawr ymhellach. Gwnaethpwyd pob math o awgrymiadau, yn bennaf yn ymwneud â gostwng cyflymder, effaith camerâu cyflymder cudd neu amlwg, a ffyrdd eraill o leihau effaith ceir yn gor-yrru, sy'n debygol o achosi marwolaeth yn hytrach na mân anafiadau.

John Griffiths: Rhannaf bryder William Graham am ddamweiniau a marwolaethau ar ein ffyrdd. Mae'r Cynulliad wedi cyflwyno amryw o gynlluniau da a chyhoeddir strategaeth cyn bo hir, fel y dywedaso. At hynny, a gredwch y dylem gefnogi cyfyngiadau cyflymder 20 mya yn ein hardaloedd trefol, fel ein stadau cyngor yng Nghymru, lle, yn anffodus, ceir llawer gormod o ddamweiniau o hyd?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Clywais yr awgrym mai dyna fyddai'r cyfraniad unigol mwyaf i leihau marwolaethau, yn enwedig ymysg plant sy'n chwarae yn agos at ffyrdd neu sydd weithiau'n dilyn pêl denis sy'n rholio ar draws y stryd ar yr ennyd y daw car o gwmpas y tro. Nid yw damweiniau fel arfer yn angheuol os yw'r car yn teithio ar 15 neu 18 mya, ond y maent ar 30 mya. Bydd y mater hwn yn disgwyl cyhoeddi strategaeth Sue Essex ar ddamweiniau ffyrdd.

Janet Davies: Un o'r symudiadau mawr i leihau damweiniau heddiw yw sefydlu manau tawelu traffig. Mewn rhai lleoedd, maent yn bwysig, ac mewn lleoedd eraill, gellir amau ai dyma'r ffordd orau ymlaen, yn enwedig ar rai prif ffyrdd. A ydych yn ystyried monitro i gymharu damweiniau ar y darnau ffordd hyn cyn y mesurau tawelu

traffic calming and afterwards?

The First Minister: My understanding is that traffic calming measures—subject to the views of ambulance drivers, who do not like speed bumps for obvious reasons—are successful. The design of speed bumps and so on must be compatible with ambulances, as they sometimes carry patients who are critically ill for whom going over speed bumps is not a good idea; we always face a clash between the interests of the person in the ambulance and the potential for serious injuries in road accidents. Your comments are helpful, and will no doubt be reflected in Sue Essex's road accident strategy.

traffig ac wedyn?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Fy nealltwriaeth i yw bod mesurau tawelu traffig—yn amodol ar sylwadau gyrwyr ambiwlans, nad ydynt yn hoffi ponciau atal cyflymder am resymau amlwg—yn llwyddiannus. Rhaid i gynllun ponciau atal cyflymder ac ati fod yn addas i ambiwlansiau, gan eu bod hwy weithiau'n cario cleifion difrifol wael na ddylai fynd dros bonciau o'r fath; byddwn bob amser yn wynebu gwrthdaro rhwng buddiannau'r person yn yr ambiwlans a'r potensial am anafiadau difrifol mewn damweiniau ffyrdd. Mae'ch sylwadau yn fuddiol, ac mae'n siŵr y'u hadlewyrchir yn strategaeth damweiniau ffyrdd Sue Essex.

Credydau Treth i Deuluoedd sy'n Gweithio ac i Bobl Anabl Working Families and Disabled Persons Tax Credits

Q10 Brian Hancock: What discussions has the First Minister had with the Secretary of State for Wales with respect to working families tax credit and disabled persons tax credits? (OAQ18678)

The First Minister: I meet with the Secretary of State for Wales regularly and discuss with him a range of matters which affect our mutual efforts to benefit Wales. This subject is going out of fashion, as the tax credits to which you refer are being replaced; the working families tax credit is being replaced by the new tax credit and child tax credit from 1 April 2003. I believe that these credits have had a beneficial effect to date, but the more advanced models of tax credit which are being introduced will extend the tax credit regime, making it more effective in helping children and assisting people in low income employment who do not have children and who cannot currently benefit.

Brian Hancock: I am glad that you mentioned the new models. Do you agree that assessing tax benefits over a longer period—through the P60 earnings system—and paying it gross, which is different to the current situation, where it is done on a short period of 26 weeks and on net, will not help people who are not well off? Do you also

C10 Brian Hancock: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cael gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru mewn perthynas â'r credyd treth i deuluoedd sy'n gweithio a'r credydau treth i bobl anabl? (OAQ18678)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Byddaf yn cyfarfod ag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru yn rheolaidd i drafod amrediad o faterion sy'n effeithio ar ein cyd-ymdrechion dros Gymru. Mae'r pwnc hwn yn mynd allan o ffasiwn, wrth i'r credydau treth y cyfeiriwch chi atynt gael eu disodli; disodlir y credyd treth i deuluoedd sy'n gweithio gan y credyd treth a'r credyd treth plant newydd o 1 Ebrill 2003. Credaf y cafodd y credydau hyn effaith fuddiol hyd yma, ond bydd y modelau diweddaraf o greddyd treth a gyflwynir yn ymestyn y drefn credyd treth, gan sicrhau ei bod yn fwy effeithiol o ran helpu plant a chynorthwyo pobl mewn swyddi incwm isel sydd heb blant ac sy'n methu cael budd-dal ar hyn o bryd.

Brian Hancock: Yr wyf yn falch ichi grybwyll y modelau newydd. A gytunwch na fydd asesu credyd treth dros gyfnod hwy—drwy'r system enillion P60—a'i dalu'n gros, sy'n wahanol i'r sefyllfa gyfredol, lle y'i gwneir am gyfnod byr o 26 wythnos, ac yn net, na fydd hynny'n helpu pobl nad ydynt yn gefnog? A gytunwch hefyd fod gan fusnesau

agree that small businesses in particular have the onerous task of running comprehensive tax systems, which prevents businesses from employing people? We miss out twice.

The First Minister: We have all heard these complaints about the working families tax credit and the disabled persons tax credit, but we also accept that they changed the psychology of many people about making work pay. During the period of falling unemployment over the last five years, it has been important to reach people who may have written themselves out of the labour market, telling them that the tax credits ensure that they are better off. People would not lose all their benefits: they would still be payable even if they were in a low paid job. We have worked in that way for three or four years, but an improved model will be introduced in April to take that work further. I believe that the psychology of people who got used to the idea of mass unemployment has changed as unemployment has fallen.

David Melding: You will know that in Old Testament times it was the policy of the last Conservative Government to simplify the tax system. [*Interruption.*] In the New Testament then. Do you agree that the Labour Government's decision to complicate the system, and introduce various forms of tax credits, has put people off applying for such credits? It has led to a reduction in the number of people taking up the entitlements for which they are eligible.

The First Minister: I have always wondered who was the author of the book of Jeremiah: I now know that it is you, David. You are right about trying to keep the situation as uncomplicated as possible; the biggest complaint heard about the working families tax credit was that it made the employer an administrator of the benefit system. We accept that that was one of the drawbacks of the system. Nevertheless, employers tended to be happy to avail themselves of the working families tax credit. It created a different type of secondary labour market. It helped people who had not previously considered work as an option because, for example, if they had three children and received relatively high benefit payments,

bach yn arbennig y dasg lafurus o redeg systemau treth cynhwysfawr, sy'n atal busnesau rhag cyflogi pobl? Yr ydym ar ein colled ddwywaith.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr ydym i gyd wedi clywed y cwynion hyn am y credyd treth i deuluoedd sy'n gweithio a'r credyd treth i bobl anabl, ond derbyniwn hefyd eu bod wedi newid seicoleg llawer o bobl ynglŷn â gwneud i waith dalu. Yn ystod cyfnod cwmp diweithdra dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf, bu'n bwysig cyrraedd pobl a allai fod wedi ymeithrio o'r farchnad lafur, i ddweud wrthynt fod y credydau treth yn golygu eu bod yn well eu byd. Ni fyddai pobl yn colli eu budd-daliadau i gyd: byddent yn dal yn daladwy hyd yn oed pe byddent mewn swydd ar gyflog isel. Yr ydym wedi gweithio felly ers tair neu bedair blynedd, ond cyflwynir model newydd gwell yn Ebrill i fynd â'r gwaith hwnnw ymhellach. Credaf i seicoleg pobl a oedd wedi ymgyfarwyddo â'r syniad o ddiweithdra mawr newid wrth i ddiweithdra gwympto.

David Melding: Byddwch yn ymwybodol mai polisi'r Llywodraeth Geidwadol ddiwethaf yn nyddiau'r Hen Destament oedd symleiddio'r system dreth. [*Torri ar draws.*] Yn y Testament Newydd felly. A gytunwch fod polisi'r Llywodraeth Lafur i gymhlethu'r system, a chyflwyno gwahanol ffurfiau o gredydau treth, wedi troi pobl oddi ar wneud cais am y credydau hyn? Mae wedi arwain at leihad yn y nifer o bobl sy'n cymryd y manteision y mae ganddynt hawl iddynt.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr wyf wedi dyfalu erioed pwy oedd awdur llyfr Jeremeia: gwn yn awr mai chi ydoedd, David. Yr ydych yn gywir ynglŷn â cheisio cadw'r drefn mor syml ag sy'n bosibl; y gŵyn fwyaf a glywyd am y credyd treth i deuluoedd sy'n gweithio oedd ei fod yn gwneud i'r cyflogwr fod yn weinyddwr y system fudd-dal. Derbyniwn fod hynny'n un o wendidau'r system. Serch hynny, tueddai cyflogwyr i fod yn hapus i fanteisio ar y credyd treth i deuluoedd sy'n gweithio. Creodd fath gwahanol o farchnad lafur eilaidd. Helpodd bobl nad oedd wedi ystyried gwaith fel opsiwn o'r blaen oherwydd, er enghraifft, pe bai ganddynt dri o blant a'u bod yn derbyn budd-daliadau cymharol uchel, ac nad oeddent yn meddwl y

they did not think that, with their qualifications, they would find a job that paid more than their benefit payments. The working families tax credit broke through that way of thinking, even though the employer got involved in a great deal of paperwork.

llwyddent, gyda'u cymwysterau hwy, i gael swydd a dalai fwy na'u budd-daliadau. Chwalwyd y meddylfryd hwnnw gan y credyd treth i deuluoedd sy'n gweithio, er iddo olygu llawer iawn o waith papur i'r cyflogwr.

'Cynllun i Gymru 2001'
'Plan for Wales 2001'

Q11 Nick Bourne: Will the First Minister make a statement on delivering policies outlined in the 'Plan for Wales 2001'? (OAQ18681)

C11 Nick Bourne: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am weithredu'r polisiau a amlinellir yn y 'Cynllun i Gymru 2001'? (OAQ18681)

The First Minister: I will be reporting back formally on progress in the First Minister's report in the autumn. As an example, I could mention the commitment in the 'Plan for Wales 2001' to provide free bus passes and travel for pensioners and disabled people on local buses. That was successfully introduced in April 2002, and will include men aged 60 and over—I declare an interest—from April 2003. Secondly, I will mention the commitment to develop a new policy for small and rural schools, which will be addressed in a revised circular on school organisation proposals, to be issued shortly.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Byddaf yn adrodd yn ôl yn ffurfiol ar yr hyn a gyflawnwyd yn adroddiad Prif Weinidog Cymru yn yr hydref. Fel enghraifft, gallwn grybwyll yr ymrwymiad yn y 'Cynllun i Gymru 2001' i ddarparu tocynnau a theithio ar fws am ddim i bensiynwyr a phobl anabl ar fysis lleol. Cyflwynwyd hynny'n llwyddiannus yn Ebrill 2002, a bydd yn cynnwys dynion 60 oed a throsgodd—datganaf fuddiant—o Ebrill 2003. Yn ail, soniaf am yr ymrwymiad i ddatblygu polisi newydd ar gyfer ysgolion bach a gwledig, a gaiff sylw mewn cylchlythyr diwygiedig ar gynigion trefniadaeth ysgolion, a gyhoeddir cyn bo hir.

2:40 p.m.

Nick Bourne: A topical aspect of the 'Plan for Wales 2001' is the section 'Wales and the World'. Little did we realise when that plan was presented that it would become the exclusive preserve of Mike German, as minister for intergalactic warfare. When you originally made your announcement, you said that you would ensure that he was Chair of the European and External Affairs Committee. That was subsequently amended when you realised that it was not in your gift to put his name forward as Chair. It was in last week's business and has now been withdrawn. Will that be presented again to the Assembly before or after the summer recess, or will you continue as Chair? The latter would be the most desirable outcome.

Nick Bourne: Un agwedd amserol yn y 'Cynllun i Gymru 2001' yw'r adran 'Cymru a'r Byd'. Prin inni sylweddoli pan gyflwynwyd y cynllun hwnnw y byddai'n dod yn faes cyfyngedig i Mike German, fel gweinidog dros ryfela rhyngblanedol. Pan wnaethoch eich cyhoeddiad yn wreiddiol, dywedasoeh y byddech yn sicrhau ei fod yn Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd ac Allanol. Newidiwyd hynny wedyn ar ôl ichi sylweddoli nad oedd yr hawl gennych chi i gynnig ei enw fel Cadeirydd. Yr oedd ym musnes yr wythnos diwethaf a bellach fe'i tynnwyd yn ôl. A gyflwynir hynny eto i'r Cynulliad cyn neu wedi toriad yr haf, ynteu a wnewch chi barhau yn y Gadair? Yr olaf fyddai'r canlyniad mwyaf dymunol.

The First Minister: I am grateful for your solicitude for my chairmanship, Nick. I will

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am eich sêl dros fy

chair the next meeting, but such matters of business and procedure are for the Minister for Open Government. We will return to the topic at the appropriate time.

Nick Bourne: I note that you have not done your sums on what will happen in the autumn. You are the lesser of two evils, First Minister: I am not saying that you are necessarily the best Chair, but when it comes to whether we would rather have you or Mike German, there is no contest. However, there is a more serious issue. You appointed the Deputy First Minister as Minister for Wales Abroad and many regarded that as a massive misjudgement. He would have been happy being made minister for morris dancing and the mid-week lottery. Is it not much better that you take responsibility for Wales abroad? We understand that Mike German will shortly be going off in his stetson to a world trade food fair in Texas or somewhere. The post is a bauble, but is it not important that you represent the Assembly overseas? He will not be answering questions on Wales abroad and he is not being shadowed by a Committee; it is a meaningless bauble. Why do you not take back the job that matters to Wales?

The First Minister: As in previous designations in the Assembly's three year history, I will continue—as did Alun Michael—to represent Wales abroad frequently. However, Mike German will do so also, as he will on 8 and 9 July. It is important that we realise that such jobs with representational aspects are shared between different Ministers. I will undertake some of them and Mike will do others. When it is specific to an individual portfolio, other Ministers will go abroad. Andrew Davies will go to the Lorient Interceltic Festival, early next month, where Wales is this year's featured Celtic country. It is important that these duties are shared and everybody understands that, despite your penny-in-the-slot polemics, Nick.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Trof yn ôl at y 'Cynllun i Gymru 2001'. Mae'n debyg y byddwch yn gobeithio bod nifer o'ch cynlluniau yn elwa

nghadeiryddiaeth, Nick. Fi fydd yn cadeirio'r cyfarfod nesaf, ond materion i'r Gweinidog dros Lywodraeth Agored yw materion busnes a gweithdrefnol o'r fath. Deuwn yn ôl at y pwnc ar yr adeg briodol.

Nick Bourne: Nodaf nad ydych wedi gwneud eich symiau ar yr hyn fydd yn digwydd yn yr hydref. Chi yw'r lleiaf o ddau ddrwg, Brif Weinidog: nid wyf yn dweud mai chi yw'r Cadeirydd gorau o reidrwydd, ond pan ddaw'n fater o ddewis a fyddai'n well gennym eich cael chi ynteu Mike German, nid oes dim cystadleuaeth. Fodd bynnag, y mae mater mwy difrifol. Bu ichi benodi'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn Weinidog Cymru Dramor ac ystyriwyd hynny fel annoethineb mawr gan lawer. Buasai ef yn hapus o gael ei wneud yn weinidog dros ddawnsio morys a'r loteri canol wythnos. Onid yw'n llawer gwell i chi gymryd cyfrifoldeb am Gymru dramor? Deallwn y bydd Mike German yn mynd i ffwrdd cyn hir yn ei het gowboi i ffair fasnachu bwyd yn Texas neu rywle. Tegan yw'r swydd, ond onid yw'n bwysig mai chi sy'n cynrychioli'r Cynulliad dramor? Ni fydd ef yn ateb cwestiynau ar Gymru dramor ac nid oes Pwyllgor yn ei gysgodi; tegan diystyr ydyw. Pam na wnewch chi ailymgymryd â'r swydd sy'n bwysig i Gymru?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Fel y bu mewn cyfnodau cynt yn hanes tair blynedd y Cynulliad, byddaf fi'n parhau—fel y gwnaeth Alun Michael—i gynrychioli Cymru dramor yn aml. Fodd bynnag, bydd Mike German yn gwneud hynny hefyd, fel y gwnaiff ar 8 a 9 Gorffennaf. Mae'n bwysig inni sylweddoli y caiff swyddi o'r fath ag iddynt agweddau cynrychioliadol eu rhannu rhwng gwahanol Weinidogion. Ymgymeraf fi â rhai ohonynt a bydd Mike yn gwneud eraill. Pan fo'n benodol i bortffolio arbennig, bydd Gweinidogion eraill yn mynd dramor. Bydd Andrew Davies yn mynd i Wyl Ryngeltaidd An Orient yn gynnar y mis nesaf, lle mai Cymru yw'r wlad Geltaidd sydd dan y llifolau eleni. Mae'n bwysig rhannu'r dyletswyddau hyn ac mae pawb yn deall hynny, er gwaethaf eich dadlau ceiniog-yn-y-twill, Nick.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I will return to the 'Plan for Wales 2001'. It is likely that you will be hoping that a number of your schemes will

ar yr arian a ddaw o'r adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant y mis hwn. Mae'n debyg ichi weld adroddiad ddoe bod tîm o arbenigwyr y Trysorlys wedi amcangyfrif pe câi fformiwla Barnett ei adolygu ar sail angen, byddai Cymru yn elwa yn sylweddol. A gytunwch â Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Gyfunol sy'n dweud bellach fod yn rhaid diwygio fformiwla Barnett? Os ydych, a dderbyniwch yn awr ffigurau'r Trysorlys sy'n dangos y byddai Cymru'n elwa'n sylweddol o adolygu'r fformiwla?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid wyf yn siŵr am ba adroddiad yr ydych yn sôn. Yr unig adroddiad diweddar a welais oedd adroddiad gan—os cofiaf yn iawn—arbenigwyr academiaidd yn ne-orllewin Lloegr. Dywedodd yr adroddiad, er bod gan Gymru wariant cyhoeddus y pen uwch na Lloegr, y gwahaniaeth mawr yw'r gwahaniaeth rhwng Gogledd Iwerddon a'r Alban. Dywedodd hefyd y byddai gogledd-ddwyrain Lloegr yn cael tua'r un faint â Chymru o dan y gyfundrefn bresennol. Nid wyf yn siŵr a ydych yn sôn am adroddiad gwahanol gan y Trysorlys. Byddai gennyf ddiddordeb darllen hynny ond nid wyf wedi gweld cyfeiriad ato yn y wasg Gymreig na thrwy'r ffynonellau swyddogol. Edrychwn arno gyda diddordeb mawr.

Datganiad yn Ymateb i Adolygiad Polisi Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth ar Drafnidiaeth Gyhoeddus
Statement on the Response to the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee's Policy Review on Public Transport

The Minister for Environment (Sue Essex): I am pleased to make a statement today on our position on public transport, meeting my commitment at the Plenary debate in December to report on our progress. The Welsh Assembly Government believes that efficient public transport is an essential part of modern society. Increasing the quality and availability of public transport to improve accessibility and mobility and to help meet our global obligations on reducing emissions is at the heart of our policy as set out in the transport framework.

Good public transport is also a key element of our social inclusion policies. It is worth

profit from the comprehensive spending review this month. You have probably seen yesterday's report that a team of Treasury specialists have estimated that if the Barnett formula were to be revised on the basis of need, Wales would benefit significantly. Do you agree with the United Kingdom Government that now says that the Barnett formula must be reformed? If so, do you now accept the Treasury's figures that show that Wales would benefit significantly from a review of the formula?

The First Minister: I am not sure what report you are talking about. The only recently published report that I have seen was a report by—if I remember correctly—academic specialists in south-west England. The report said that although Wales's public spending per capita is higher than in England, the big difference is between Northern Ireland and Scotland. It also said that north-east England would receive a similar amount to Wales under the present system. I am not sure whether you are talking about a different report by the Treasury. I would be interested to read it, but I have not seen a reference to it in the Welsh press or in official sources. I would examine it with great interest.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd (Sue Essex): Yr wyf yn falch o wneud datganiad heddiw ar ein safbwynt ar drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus, gan gyflawni f'addewid yn y ddadl Lawn ym mis Rhagfyr i roi adroddiad ar yr hyn a gyflawnwyd. Cred Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru fod trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus effeithlon yn rhan hanfodol o gymdeithas fodern. Mae cynyddu ansawdd ac argaeledd trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus i wella hygyrchedd a symudedd ac i helpu cyflawni ein dyletswyddau byd-eang i leihau allyriadau wrth galon ein polisi fel a ddisgrifiwyd yn y fframwaith trafnidiaeth.

Mae trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus dda yn elfen allweddol hefyd yn ein polisiau cynhwysiant

remembering that around 30 per cent of households in Wales do not possess a car and that that increases to 40 per cent in more deprived communities. People with disabilities or people who live in remote communities face additional burdens. The interim report published by the Cabinet's social exclusion unit on transport and social exclusion identified ways in which poor transport contributes to social exclusion and isolation. Lack of accessibility restricts access to essential activities including work, learning, healthcare, food shopping and other key activities.

Additionally, better public transport will reduce reliance on the car. The continuing increase in car use is creating congestion in some parts of Wales. It is clear that car ownership will increase, but we need to reduce car dependency. To do this, public transport has to be a high quality and reliable alternative. The Assembly Government is providing considerable extra resources to back its policies. In 1998-99 local authorities received £36 million in transport grants; this year it is £64 million—an 82 per cent increase. This involves funding all types of transport, including the Safe Routes to School programme, which has risen by 237 per cent. That is the scale of increase that we are talking about. Local road safety grants introduced in 2001 now total £5.7 million. Grants for bus services and community transport have increased by 241 per cent over 3 years.

Our most significant initiative is free travel for pensioners and disabled people. It has proved enormously popular and gives public transport a strong focus. Early evidence shows that it has improved the provision of bus services through increased demand in many places.

Turning to public transport organisation, I was asked to report back to Plenary on structural issues, which can bring about a step change in performance. At the all-Wales level, account has to be taken of geographical

cymdeithasol. Mae'n werth cofio bod rhyw 30 y cant o aelwydydd yng Nghymru heb gar a bod hynny'n codi i 40 y cant mewn cymunedau mwy difreintiedig. Mae pobl ag anableddau neu bobl sy'n byw mewn cymunedau diarffordd yn wynebu beichiau ychwanegol. Yn yr adroddiad interim a gyhoeddwyd gan uned allgáu cymdeithasol y Cabinet ar drafnidiaeth ac allgáu cymdeithasol nodwyd ffyrdd y mae trafnidiaeth wael yn cyfrannu at allgáu cymdeithasol ac arwahaniad. Mae diffyg cyfleoedd teithio yn cyfyngu mynediad at weithgareddau hanfodol gan gynnwys gwaith, addysg, gofal iechyd, siopa am fwyd a gweithgareddau allweddol eraill.

Ar ben hynny, bydd gwell trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus yn lleihau dibyniaeth ar y car. Mae'r cynnydd parhaus yn y defnydd o geir yn creu tagfeydd mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru. Mae'n glir mai cynyddu wnaiff perchenogaeth ceir, ond mae angen lleihau dibyniaeth ar geir. I wneud hyn, rhaid i drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus fod yn ddewis dibynadwy ac o ansawdd da. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn darparu adnoddau ychwanegol sylweddol i gefnogi'i pholisïau. Yn 1998-99 cafodd awdurdodau lleol £36 miliwn mewn grantiau trafnidiaeth; eleni mae'n £64 miliwn—cynydd o 82 y cant. Mae hyn yn cynnwys arian ar gyfer pob math o drafnidiaeth, gan gynnwys y rhaglen Ffyrdd Diogel i'r Ysgol, sydd wedi codi 237 y cant. Dyna faint y cynnydd yr ydym yn sôn amdano. Mae grantiau diogelwch ffyrdd lleol a gyflwynwyd yn 2001 bellach yn gyfanswm o £5.7 miliwn. Mae grantiau ar gyfer gwasanaethau bysus a thrafnidiaeth gymunedol wedi codi 241 y cant dros dair blynedd.

Ein cynllun mwyaf arwyddocaol yw teithio am ddim i bensynwyr a phobl anabl. Mae wedi profi'n eithriadol o boblogaidd ac mae'n rhoi ffocws cryf i drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus. Dengys tystiolaeth gynnar ei fod wedi gwella darpariaeth gwasanaethau bysus drwy gynyddu'r galw mewn sawl lle.

A throi at gynllunio trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus, gofynnwyd imi adrodd yn ôl i'r Cyfarfod Llawn ar faterion strwythurol, a all arwain at wella perfformiad. Dros Gymru gyfan, rhaid ystyried gwahaniaethau daearyddol a'r

differences and the varying degrees of opportunity for developing public transport. Different solutions are appropriate in different areas.

I have met with all existing consortia in Wales. The most advanced consortia is the South East Wales Transport Forum. Two public transport consortia—the South Wales Integrated Fast Transit consortium and the Transport Intergration in the Gwent Economic Region consortium of local authorities—will be reporting to a newly created South East Wales Transport Board. This could deliver our policy objectives in an effective way. I strongly welcome this development. The other consortia have also indicated support for a more formal approach.

The case for a public transport authority/public transport executive for the whole of Wales has not been made. The model is normally designed for a large urban area with a comprehensive and self-contained bus and rail network. It would duplicate the Assembly Government's own role in setting the strategic approach, but would be too remote to deal effectively with local issues. However, I am particularly keen to make best use of the provisions in the Transport Act 2000 to enhance bus services. We have established a group with local authorities, bus operators and users to take forward the quality bus partnerships. I would like to explore with them the opportunities for introducing formal contracts or other measures.

A case could yet be made for establishing a PTA/PTE for the area covered by the ten authorities in south-east Wales from Bridgend eastwards. The greatest problems of traffic congestion are faced in this area and there is a potential for public transport to bring about significant change in travel patterns. These opportunities will be enhanced by the re-opening of the Vale of Glamorgan and Ebbw Vale railway lines to passengers.

The Welsh Assembly Government wants to ensure that public transport in Wales is given

gwahanol raddau o gyfle i ddatblygu trafniadaeth gyhoeddus. Mae gwahanol atebion yn briodol mewn gwahanol ardaloedd.

Yr wyf wedi cyfarfod a'r holl gonsortia yng Nghymru. Y consortia sydd wedi symud bellaf ymlaen yw Fforwm Trafnidiaeth De-ddwyrain Cymru. Bydd dau gonsortiwm trafniadaeth gyhoeddus—consortiwm Cludiant Cyflym Integredig De Cymru a'r Integreiddiad Trafnidiaeth yng nghonsortiwm awdurdodau lleol Rhanbarth Economaidd Gwent—yn adrodd i Fwrdd Trafnidiaeth newydd y De-ddwyrain. Gallai hyn gyflawni'n hamcanion polisi mewn modd effeithiol. Croesawaf y datblygiad hwn yn fawr. Mae'r consortia eraill wedi mynegi cefnogaeth hefyd i ddull mwy ffurfiol.

Nid yw'r achos dros awdurdod trafniadaeth gyhoeddus neu weithrediaeth trafniadaeth gyhoeddus i Gymru gyfan wedi'i wneud. Mae'r model wedi'i gynllunio'n arferol ar gyfer ardal drefol fawr gyda rhwydwaith bws a thrên cynhwysfawr a hunan-gynhwysol. Byddai'n dyblygu rôl Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ei hun wrth sefydlu'r ffordd strategol o fynd ati, ond byddai'n rhy bell i ffwrdd i ddelio'n effeithiol â materion lleol. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn arbennig o awyddus i wneud y defnydd gorau o'r darpariaethau yn Neddf Drafnidiaeth 2000 i wella gwasanaethau bysus. Yr ydym wedi sefydlu grŵp gydag awdurdodau lleol, cwmnïau bysus a defnyddwyr i symud ymlaen â'r partneriaethau bysus o ansawdd. Hoffwn archwilio gyda hwy y cyfleoedd ar gyfer cyflwyno contractau ffurfiol neu fesurau eraill.

Gellid gwneud achos o hyd dros sefydlu awdurdod neu weithrediaeth trafniadaeth gyhoeddus dros yr ardal a gynrychiolir gan y deg awdurdod yn y de-ddwyrain, o Ben-y-bont ar Ogwr i'r dwyrain. Yn yr ardal hon y wyneb y problemau mwyaf gyda thagfeydd traffig ac mae potensial i drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus ysgogi newid arwyddocaol mewn patrymau teithio. Ategir y cyfleoedd hyn pan ailagorir rheilffyrdd Bro Morgannwg a Glynabwy i deithwyr.

Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru eisiau sicrhau y rhoddir proffil uchel i drafnidiaeth

a high profile here and beyond our borders. To create this focus, I am announcing two new changes today. First, within the transport directorate of the Assembly, a public transport unit will be established to drive forward the policy and technical work that is needed to implement our commitments.

Secondly, I also propose setting up a national public transport alliance as a non-executive body to keep an overview across public transport activity and to provide expertise to the PTU. This body will include representatives of the key stakeholders who will work in collaboration with the Assembly and experts to get the best from public transport resources in Wales. Bearing in mind that public transport is a commercial operation, albeit with public funding support, I look to an increasingly productive partnership with the private sector.

2:50 p.m.

I am convinced that it is essential to enhance the statutory functions of the Assembly to get the best from our public transport and obtain the vision set out in our transport framework. I intend to seek powers along the lines of the Greater London Authority Act 1999 whereby the Mayor and Authority can develop and implement policies for the promotion and encouragement of safe, integrated, efficient and economic transport facilities. London boroughs are required to prepare local implementation plans. Provided resources are in place, the boroughs implement the plans once approved and the Mayor has default powers. This power would require close collaboration and enable us to set targets for implementation, without removing transport functions from local authorities.

I will seek to incorporate two further powers: to enable the Assembly to establish a joint authority along the lines of a PTE to allow for the possibility in any part of Wales, and to seek power to direct the Strategic Rail Authority and to appoint a member to the authority. We will be working towards establishing an office of the traffic commissioner in Wales.

gyhoeddus yng Nghymru yma a thu hwnt i'n ffiniau. I greu'r ffocws yma, cyhoeddaf ddau newid newydd heddiw. Yn gyntaf, yng nghyfarwyddiaeth drafnidiaeth y Cynulliad, sefydlir uned drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus i fwrw ymlaen â'r polisi a'r gwaith technegol sydd ei angen i gyflawni'n hymrwymiaidau.

Yn ail, bwriadaf hefyd sefydlu cynghrair trafndiaeth gyhoeddus genedlaethol fel corff anweithredol i gadw golwg gyffredinol ar weithgaredd trafndiaeth gyhoeddus a chynnig arbenigedd i'r uned drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus. Bydd y corff hwn yn cynnwys cynrychiolwyr y rhanddeiliaid allweddol a fydd yn cydweithio â'r Cynulliad ac arbenigwyr i gael y gorau o adnoddau trafndiaeth gyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Gan gofio mai gweithgaredd masnachol yw trafndiaeth gyhoeddus, er y caiff gefnogaeth cyllid cyhoeddus, edrychaf at bartneriaeth gynyddol gynhyrchiol gyda'r sector preifat.

Yr wyf yn argyhoeddedig ei bod yn hanfodol cryfhau swyddogaethau statudol y Cynulliad i gael y gorau o'n trafndiaeth gyhoeddus a sicrhau'r weledigaeth a amlinellir yn ein fframwaith trafndiaeth. Bwriadaf geisio pwerau ar linellau Deddf Awdurdod Llundain Fwyaf 1999 lle gall y Maer a'r Awdurdod ddatblygu a gweithredu polisiâu ar gyfer hyrwyddo ac annog cyfleusterau trafndiaeth diogel, integredig, effeithlon a darbodus. Mae'n ofynnol i fwrdeistrefi Llundain baratoi cynlluniau gweithredu lleol. Os yw'r adnoddau yn eu lle, bydd y bwrdeistrefi'n gweithredu'r cynlluniau unwaith y cânt eu cymeradwyo ac mae gan y Maer bwerau pallu. Byddai'r pŵer hwn yn gofyn am gydweithio agos ac yn ein galluogi i osod targedau ar gyfer gweithredu, heb dynnu swyddogaethau trafndiaeth oddi wrth awdurdodau lleol.

Ceisïaf ymgorffori dau bŵer ychwanegol: i alluogi'r Cynulliad i sefydlu cyd-awdurdod ar linellau gweithrediaeth trafndiaeth gyhoeddus i ganiatáu ar gyfer y posibilrwydd mewn unrhyw ran o Gymru, ac i geisio pŵer i gyfarwyddo'r Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Statudol ac i benodi aelod i'r awdurdod. Byddwn yn gweithio tuag at sefydlu swydd y comisiynydd traffig yng Nghymru.

In conclusion, the Welsh Assembly Government has made a substantial difference to the profile and operation of public transport in Wales, and it will continue to do so by increasing the level of resources; seeking greater powers to participate in its implementation; creating new government structures which are designed to focus on getting the best results from our resources; and supporting our partners and the local authority consortia in delivering commitments.

Janet Davies: First, I thank you for ensuring that I had a written copy of the statement at the beginning of this session; that was helpful.

We agree on many issues, including the need to set up an integrated and efficient public transport system to address global warming, social exclusion and overcrowded roads. Do you acknowledge that we have a mountain to climb given that all car owners—and I include myself in that group—are totally addicted to travelling in their own cars? We have to offer the tempting carrot of integration, efficiency and reasonable comfort for when private car journeys reach the point, not only of no return but of no start either.

Do you agree that this is not easy to address given that responsibility for the railways is fragmented between the network and franchise services, strategy is centralised at the UK level of Government and bus services are deregulated with each company now accustomed to doing its own thing? We must congratulate the consortia that are working in south-east Wales, particularly TIGER and SWIFT, which seem to have got their acts together in terms of co-ordination. The country needs a strategy and the means to put it into practice. As you may recall, in the last Environment, Planning and Transport Committee meeting, I proposed that we consider a model of a passenger transport partnership, which was supported by consumer groups. I suggested that the tier of consortia should work underneath this at a regional level. You now propose to set up the passenger transport unit, which is similar, but

I gloi, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi gwneud gwahaniaeth sylweddol i broffil a gweithrediad trafniadaeth gyhoeddus yng Nghymru, a bydd yn parhau i wneud hynny drwy gynyddu lefel adnoddau; ceisio pwerau mwy i gyfranogi yn ei gweithrediad; creu strwythurau llywodraeth newydd gyda'r nod o ganolbwyntio ar gael y canlyniadau gorau o'n hadnoddau; a chefnogi'n partneriaid a chonsortia'r awdurdodau lleol i wireddu ymrwymadau.

Janet Davies: Yn gyntaf, diolch am sicrhau y cefais gopi ysgrifenedig o'r datganiad ar ddechrau'r sesiwn hon: yr oedd hynny o gymorth.

Cytunwn ar sawl peth, gan gynnwys yr angen i sefydlu system drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus integredig ac effeithlon i ddelio â chynhesu byd-eang, allgáu cymdeithasol a ffyrdd gorlawn. A gydnabyddwch fod gennym fynydd i'w ddringo o gofio fod pawb sy'n berchen car—a chynhwysaf fy hun yn y grŵp hwnnw—wedi mopio'n lân ar deithio yn eu ceir eu hunain? Rhaid inni gynnig moronen ddeniadol integreiddio, effeithlonrwydd a chysur rhesymol ar gyfer yr adeg pan gyrhaedda siwrneiau car preifat bwynt, nid yn unig na ellir dychwelyd ohono, ond ni ellir cychwyn ohono ychwaith.

A gytunwch nad yw'n hawdd gwneud hyn gan fod cyfrifoldeb am y rheilffyrdd wedi'i ddarnio rhwng y rhwydwaith a gwasanaethau trwyddedfaint, bod strategaeth wedi'i chanoli ar lefel Llywodraeth y DU, a bod gwasanaethau bws wedi'u dadreoleiddio a phob cwmni bellach wedi arfer plesio'i hun? Rhaid llongyfarch y consortia sy'n gweithio yn y De-ddwyrain, yn enwedig TIGER a SWIFT, sydd fel pe baent wedi cael trefn ar bethau o ran cydlyn. Mae ar y wlad angen strategaeth a'r modd i'w gweithredu. Fel y cofiwch efallai, yng nghyfarfod diwethaf Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth, cynigiais ein bod yn ystyried model o bartneriaeth trafniadaeth teithwyr, a gefnogid gan grwpiau defnyddwyr. Awgrymais y dylai'r haen o gonsortia weithio o dan hyn ar lefel ranbarthol. Yr ydych yn awr yn cynnig sefydlu'r uned drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus, sy'n debyg, ond nid

not exactly the same; could you expand on whether it will have strategic, problem-solving and monitoring powers? In what way will it work with the regional authorities, by which I mean the current consortia? Will those bodies have a statutory role of co-ordination and integration?

On the powers of the Greater London Authority Act 1999, can you give any indication of the likely timescale of achieving similar powers? On appointing a member to represent Wales on the SRA, I understood that we would get a progress report after six months; that time has now passed. What progress has been made on that? Can you give me any information on delegation of responsibility for the Valleys line, which you did not mention in your statement?

Sue Essex: As you say, we have a mountain to climb, but in my view it is climbable. History shows us that people climb even the most difficult mountains. There has been a history of underfunding, which has not helped. The figures show that we have attempted to address that. In perfect circumstances, we would want a different public transport system to the one that we have inherited. The Westminster Government has set a 10-year strategy, and we have a transport framework that shows all the different players in the transport industry—be they public, private or voluntary—where we want to go and how we will get there.

It is not impossible to get people out of their cars. Many people tell me that they do not have a choice; they would like to travel by public transport—certainly by train—if the system was reliable and if there was quality accommodation. We must make the proper provisions, and we are starting to do that. There are much better buses on our roads, and new trains are being delivered. The Virgin trains that are being introduced in north and south Wales offer top of the range accommodation. Many people tell me that congestion is deterring them from travelling by car, and that they want public transport to be an option. The number of people who travel on Valley Lines is increasing. We

yn union yr un fath; a allech ymhelaethu ar p'run ai y bydd ganddi bwerau strategol, datrys problemau a monitro? Ym mha ffordd y bydd yn gweithio gyda'r awdurdodau rhanbarthol, sef y consortia presennol? A fydd gan y cyrff hynny rôl statudol cydlynu ac integreiddio?

Ar bwerau Deddf Awdurdod Llundain Fwyaf 1999, a allwch roi unrhyw arwydd o'r amserlen debygol ar gyfer sicrhau pwerau tebyg? Ar benodi aelod i gynrychioli Cymru ar yr Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol, deallais y caem adroddiad ar y datblygiadau ymhen chwe mis; mae'r cyfnod hwnnw bellach wedi mynd heibio. Beth sydd wedi'i gyflawni ar hynny? A allwch roi unrhyw wybodaeth imi ar ddirprwyo cyfrifoldeb am lein y Cymoedd, na chrybwyllasoch yn eich datganiad?

Sue Essex: Fel y dywedwch, mae gennym fynydd i'w ddringo, ond credaf fod ei ddringo. Dengys hanes inni fod pobl yn dringo hyd yn oed y mynyddoedd anoddaf. Bu hanes o danariannu, sydd heb fod o gymorth. Dengys y ffigurau ein bod wedi ceisio mynd i'r afael â hynny. Mewn amgylchiadau perffaith, dewisem system drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus wahanol i'r un yr ydym wedi'i hetifeddu. Mae Llywodraeth San Steffan wedi gosod strategaeth 10-mlynedd, ac mae gennym fframwaith trafnidiaeth sy'n dangos i'r holl wahanol chwaraewyr yn y diwydiant trafnidiaeth—boed hwy'n gyhoeddus, preifat neu wirfoddol—ble mae arnom eisiau mynd a sut yr awn yno.

Nid yw'n amhosibl cael pobl allan o'u ceir. Dywed llawer o bobl wrthyf nad oes dewis ganddynt; fe hoffent deithio ar drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus—yn sicr ar y trê—pe bai'r system yn ddibynadwy a bod ansawdd da i'r cerbydau. Rhaid inni wneud y darpariaethau iawn, ac yr ydym yn dechrau gwneud hynny. Mae bysus llawer gwell ar ein ffyrdd, ac mae trenau newydd yn cael eu darparu. Mae'r trenau Virgin sy'n cael eu cyflwyno yn y Gogledd a'r De yn cynnig cyfleusterau o'r radd flaenaf. Dywed llawer o bobl wrthyf fod tagfeydd yn eu troi i ffwrdd oddi wrth deithio yn y car, ac yr hoffent gael y dewis o ddefnyddio trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus. Mae'r nifer o bobl sy'n teithio ar Reilffyrdd y

should not be too despondent about this. It is a challenge, but we can meet it.

I attended a recent meeting with members and officers of TIGER and SWIFT and I was encouraged by how they are moving forward. They are taking an innovative approach which they must all work together to deliver. They have my full support, which will be provided through the new unit that we are establishing.

We discussed your suggestion about passenger transport partnership at the last Committee meeting. My proposal today is different. The national public transport alliance is not an executive body. The responsibility remains with the Assembly. That is important, as it is what the public wants. Having voted for the Assembly, people expect us to take the strategic lead. The public transport unit—part of the transport directorate—will give focus to this issue. Unit staff can work on the ground with consortia to deliver our proposals. The alliance will offer wider support on an all-Wales level. It will monitor, collate examples of good practice and support the consortia in practical ways, such as by supplying information.

We have an opportunity to do something different in Wales. We must encourage regional groups to provide the necessary support to their communities and set that within the all-Wales framework of expert knowledge, support, monitoring and so on. That is an encouraging way forward.

I do not know the timescale for changes in legislation. I met Don Touhig yesterday and we discussed what might come forward in the next legislative session and where some of these issues could be included. Having a member on the SRA would also require a change in legislation, as I understand it.

I cannot remember your last point, although I know that it was something about delegation.

Janet Davies: It was on the Valleys line.

Cymoedd yn cynyddu. Ni ddylem fod yn rhy ddigalon ynglŷn â hyn. Mae'n her, ond gallwn ei hateb.

Bûm mewn cyfarfod yn ddiweddar gydag aelodau a swyddogion TIGER a SWIFT ac yr oedd yn galonogol gweld sut y maent yn symud ymlaen. Mae ganddynt ymagwedd arloesol sy'n galw am gydweithio gan bawb i'w weithredu. Cânt fy nghefnogaeth lawn, a hynny drwy'r uned newydd a sefydlir gennym.

Trafodasom eich awgrym am bartneriaeth trafniadaeth teithwyr yn y cyfarfod Pwyllgor diwethaf. Mae fy nghynnig heddiw yn wahanol. Nid corff gweithredol yw'r gynghrair trafniadaeth gyhoeddus genedlaethol. Erys y cyfrifoldeb gyda'r Cynulliad. Mae hynny'n bwysig, gan mai dyna y mae'r cyhoedd yn dymuno. Wedi pleidleisio dros y Cynulliad, mae pobl yn disgwyl inni roi arweiniad strategol. Bydd yr uned trafniadaeth gyhoeddus—rhan o'r gyfarwyddiaeth drafnidiaeth—yn rhoi ffocws i'r mater hwn. Gall staff yr uned weithio ar y ddaear gyda chonsortia i weithredu ein cynigion. Bydd y gynghrair yn cynnig cefnogaeth ehangach ar sail Cymru gyfan. Bydd yn monitro, yn casglu ynghyd enghreifftiau o arfer da ac yn cefnogi'r consortia mewn ffyrdd ymarferol, er enghraifft drwy gyflenwi gwybodaeth.

Mae gennym gyfle i wneud rhywbeth gwahanol yng Nghymru. Rhaid inni annog grwpiau rhanbarthol i roi'r gefnogaeth angenrheidiol i'w cymunedau a gosod hynny o fewn y fframwaith o wybodaeth arbenigol, cefnogaeth, monitro ac ati dros Gymru gyfan. Mae hynny'n ffordd galonogol ymlaen.

Ni wn yr amserlen ar gyfer newidiadau mewn deddfwriaeth. Cyfarfûm â Don Touhig ddoe a thrafodasom beth allai ddod gerbron yn y sesiwn ddeddfwriaethol nesaf a ble y gellid cynnwys rhai o'r materion hyn. Byddai cael aelod ar yr Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol yn gofyn am newid y ddeddfwriaeth hefyd, yn ôl a ddeallaf fi.

Ni allaf gofio'ch pwynt olaf, er y gwn ei fod yn rhywbeth ynglŷn â dirprwyo.

Janet Davies: Lein y Cymoedd oedd dan

sylw.

Sue Essex: Yes. Sorry, Janet. I do not know the answer to that. It will be part of the franchise. As it can be run as a separate management unit, it could be part of the SWIFT/TIGER consortia framework. However, I am talking hypothetically and I would not want to bind anyone to this. In terms of integration, that type of arrangement could be implemented.

Tom Middlehurst: Your statement demonstrates that this Labour-led Government has committed substantial additional resources to public transport. A 240 per cent increase in funding for bus services and community transport is significant by anyone's standards, as is the significant investment in the popular Safe Routes to School initiative, which you have driven forward. I welcome your acknowledgement that an all-Wales public transport authority is not appropriate to deal with the differing needs of various parts of the country. One size does not fit all. I am pleased that Plaid Cymru has softened its position and moved away from its earlier demand for an all-Wales PTA. North Wales, inevitably, has close social and economic links with the English borders, and, while acknowledging that there are all-Wales considerations, the region can best address its own needs. Will you join me in congratulating the north Wales consortium, TAITH, on its excellent work in recent years, and will you express your confidence in its ability to meet the needs of the people of north Wales?

3:00 p.m.

Sue Essex: The Assembly's commitment to public transport is important, because we believe there is a real role for public transport in Wales. Indeed, it is essential, because, if we are to provide jobs for the many people who need them, they will have to depend on public transport. They will also depend on public transport in terms of accessing health facilities and so on. Community transport is included in this wide definition of public transport because, in many parts of Wales, it is an essential provider. It helps to state that

Sue Essex: Ie. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Janet. Ni wn yr ateb i hynny. Bydd yn rhan o'r fasnachfaint. Gan y gellir ei rhedeg fel uned reoli ar wahân, gallai fod yn rhan o fframwaith consortia SWIFT/TIGER. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siarad yn ddamcaniaethol ac ni hoffwn rwymo neb i hyn. O ran integreiddiad, gellid gweithredu'r math hwnnw o drefniant.

Tom Middlehurst: Mae eich datganiad yn dangos fod y Llywodraeth hon, dan arweiniad Llafur, wedi ymrwymo adnoddau ychwanegol sylweddol i drafndiaeth gyhoeddus. Mae cynnydd o 240 y cant yng nghyllid gwasanaethau bysus a thrafnidiaeth gymunedol yn sylweddol yn ôl safonau unrhyw un, ynghyd â'r buddsoddiad sylweddol yn y cynllun poblogaidd Llwybrau Diogel i'r Ysgol, a yrrwyd ymlaen gennych chi. Croesawaf eich cydnabyddiaeth nad yw awdurdod trafndiaeth gyhoeddus i Gymru gyfan yn briodol ar gyfer delio â gwahanol anghenion amryfal rannau o'r wlad. Nid yw un maint yn ffitio pawb. Yr wyf yn falch fod Plaid Cymru wedi lleddfu'i safiad ac wedi symud oddi wrth ei galwad flaenorol am awdurdod trafndiaeth gyhoeddus i Gymru gyfan. Mae gan y Gogledd, yn anochel, gysylltiadau cymdeithasol ac economaidd agos â gororau Lloegr, ac, er y cydnabyddir fod yna ystyriaethau i Gymru gyfan, y rhanbarth sydd yn y sefyllfa orau i ddelio â'i anghenion ei hun. A wnewch chi ymuno â mi i longyfarch consortiwm y Gogledd, TAITH, ar ei waith rhagorol mewn blynyddoedd diweddar, ac a wnewch chi fynegi'ch hyder yn ei allu i ateb anghenion pobl y Gogledd?

Sue Essex: Mae ymrwymiad y Cynulliad i drafndiaeth gyhoeddus yn bwysig, oherwydd credwn fod rôl wirioneddol i drafndiaeth gyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Yn wir, mae'n hanfodol, oherwydd os ydym am ddarparu swyddi i'r niferoedd mawr sydd eu hangen, bydd yn rhaid iddynt ddibynnu ar drafndiaeth gyhoeddus. Bydd raid iddynt ddibynnu ar drafndiaeth gyhoeddus hefyd yn nhermau cyrraedd cyfleusterau iechyd ac ati. Mae trafndiaeth gymunedol wedi'i chynnwys yn y diffiniad eang hon o

we see public transport as part of an integrated way forward, and that is what the transport framework says. We must then address how it is delivered. As you rightly said, it must be delivered in a way that corresponds to the way people live their lives. In north Wales, people need to travel across the region and the border, as well as travel south. It is no good standing on ceremony and saying, as you said, one size fits all; we must respond to geographical, economic and social circumstances.

drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus oherwydd, mewn llawer rhan o Gymru, mae'n ddarparwr hanfodol. Mae'n helpu datgan y gwelwn drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus fel rhan o ffordd integredig ymlaen, a dyna beth ddywed y fframwaith trafndiaeth. Rhaid inni wedyn drafod sut y'i gweithredir. Fel y dywedasoch yn hollol gywir, rhaid ei weithredu mewn ffordd sy'n cyfateb i'r ffordd y mae pobl yn byw. Yn y Gogledd, mae pobl angen teithio ar draws y rhanbarth a thros y ffin, yn ogystal â theithio i'r de. Nid yw'n dda i ddim bod yn ddefodol a dweud, fel y dywedasoch chi, mae un maint yn ffitio pawb; rhaid inni ymateb i amgylchiadau daearyddol, economaidd a chymdeithasol.

I was pleased to see, at my recent meeting with TAITH, that it is confident enough to work across the whole of north Wales. We must put faith and trust in these organisations and support them. The test will be whether the outcome of all this is what the public wants. From my point of view, and as the Committee's report makes clear, we want to see outcomes in terms of quality. I hope and trust that the way we take this forward will deliver. This will be monitored, and the organisational structures will have to deliver the quality of public transport services that people want. This must be the guiding light.

Da oedd gweld, yn fy nghyfarfod diweddar gyda TAITH, eu bod yn ddigon hyderus i weithio ar draws y Gogledd i gyd. Rhaid inni gael ffydd ac ymddiriedaeth yn y sefydliadau hyn a'u cefnogi. Y prawf fydd ai canlyniad hyn i gyd fydd yr hyn y mae'r cyhoedd ei eisiau. O'm safbwynt i, ac fel y dywedir yn glir yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor, mae arnom eisiau gweld canlyniadau yn nhermau ansawdd. Gobeithiaf a hyderaf y bydd y ffordd yr awn ati gyda hyn yn dwyn ffrwyth. Caiff hyn ei fonitro, a bydd yn rhaid i'r strwythurau trefniadol sicrhau gwasanaethau trafndiaeth gyhoeddus o ansawdd y mae pobl ei heisiau. Rhaid i hynny ein harwain.

David Davies: Does the Minister agree that the fundamental problem in the provision of public transport over the past 40 years was not underinvestment, but rather the increase in the number of cars as a result of rising standards of living? Most people, given the choice, would prefer to use cars rather than buses. Thus we have seen a steady fall in the numbers using public transport. We have become locked in a vicious circle: lower numbers means a reduction in services available, which, in turn, leads to lower numbers. Does the Minister accept that this is the true cause of many of public transport's problems, and not any perceived lack of investment? Does the Minister also agree that public transport policy should be concerned with offering a cheap and convenient alternative to the motorcar, and not with penalising motorists, as we see happening all too often?

David Davies: A gytuna'r Gweinidog nad tanfuddsoddi oedd y broblem sylfaenol yn narpariaeth trafndiaeth gyhoeddus dros y 40 mlynedd diwethaf, ond yn hytrach y cynnydd yn y nifer o geir yn sgîl safonau byw uwch? O gael y dewis, byddai'n well gan y rhan fwyaf o bobl ddefnyddio car na bws. Felly gwelsom gwymmp graddol yn y niferoedd sy'n defnyddio trafndiaeth gyhoeddus. Erbyn hyn yr ydym wedi'n cloi mewn cylch dieflig: golyga niferoedd is ostyngiad yn y gwasanaethau sydd ar gael, sydd yn ei dro yn arwain at niferoedd is. A ydyw'r Gweinidog yn derbyn mai dyma wir achos llawer o broblemau trafndiaeth gyhoeddus, ac nid unrhyw ddiffyg buddsoddi tybiedig? A gytuna'r Gweinidog hefyd y dylai polisi trafndiaeth gyhoeddus ganolbwyntio ar gynnig dewis arall rhad a chyfleus yn lle'r car, ac nid ar gosbi modurwyr, sef rhywbeth a welwn yn llawer rhy aml?

The Minister referred to emissions. Does she accept that, over the last five years, new technology has greatly decreased motorcar emissions? In many cases it could be argued that a large number of people using motorcars cause fewer emissions than a load of empty buses. What discussions has the Minister had with the Welsh Local Government Association regarding the imposition of yet another obligation, namely to prepare a local implementation plan? She has talked about increased funding, but I have not yet been able to get her to tell me—and I understand if you do not have the figures to hand, but I would appreciate a written response—what percentage of the Welsh block grant was spent by her department for the last two financial years, and what will be spent during this financial year.

The public will always support best practice initiatives such as free bus passes or greater use of information technology. However, does the Minister agree that confidence in her department is undermined by a multimillion-pound monorail system in Cardiff bay and excessive bus lanes? People have been climbing mountains for years, and they have also been falling off them.

Sue Essex: Not me, David, because I do not climb them. If you want an analysis of the problem, car availability and increased affluence has played a part, as has dispersal of population. There has been a move away from the tight urban areas—compared with 40 or 50 years ago—into counter-urbanisation and the rural hinterland. Many people have become dependent on cars. Services have decentralised and there are now out of town shopping centres. All these factors have played their part in changing the nature of transport patterns. However, I do not agree that investment has been adequate. There has been underinvestment for a long time. If you compare the situation with many of our continental colleagues, they invest a huge amount of money in public transport because they see it as an essential service. That is the difference. We must say that public transport is an essential service. It is there to complement our other policies. It is the blood of life: if transport is available, people can do the things that they wish to do

Cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog at allyriadau. A ydyw'n derbyn bod technoleg newydd, dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf, wedi lleihau allyriadau o geir modur yn ddirfawr? Mewn llawer achos gellid dadlau fod llawer o bobl mewn ceir yn achosi llai o allyriadau na llwyth o fysis gwag. Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ynglŷn â gosod rhwymedigaeth arall eto byth, sef fod yn rhaid paratoi cynllun gweithredu lleol? Soniodd am gynyddu cyllid, ond nid wyf eto wedi gallu ei chael i ddweud wrthyf—a deallaf os nad yw'r ffigurau gennyh wrth law, ond gwerthfawrogwn ymateb ysgrifenedig—pa ganran o'r grant bloc i Gymru a wariwyd gan ei hadran hi am y ddwy flynedd ariannol ddiwethaf, a beth a werir yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol hon.

Bydd y cyhoedd bob amser yn cefnogi mentrau arfer gorau fel tocynnau bws am ddim neu fwy o ddefnydd o dechnoleg gwybodaeth. Fodd bynnag, a gytuna'r Gweinidog y caiff hyder yn ei hadran ei danseilio gan gynllun monoreilffordd sy'n costio miliynau o bunnau ym mae Caerdydd a gormod o lonydd bysus? Mae pobl yn dringo mynyddoedd ers blynyddoedd, ac yn syrthio oddi arnynt hefyd.

Sue Essex: Nid y fi, David, achos ni fyddaf yn eu dringo. Os oes arnoch eisiau dadansoddiad o'r broblem, mae perchenogaeth ceir a chyfoeth cynyddol wedi chwarae rhan, ynghyd â gwasgariad poblogaeth. Bu symudiad i ffwrdd o'r ardaloedd trefol tynn—o gymharu â 40 neu 50 o flynyddoedd yn ôl—i gynlluniau gwrth-drefoli a'r gefnwlod wledig. Mae llawer o bobl wedi mynd i ddibyynu ar geir. Mae gwasanaethau wedi datganoli a cheir canolfannau siopa newydd y tu allan i drefi. Mae'r ffactorau hyn i gyd wedi chwarae eu rhan i newid natur patrymau trafndiaeth. Fodd bynnag, ni chytunaf y cafwyd buddsoddi digonol. Cafwyd tanfuddsoddi ers amser maith. Os cymharwch y sefyllfa â llawer o'n cyfeillion cyfandirol, buddsoddant hwy swm aruthrol o arian mewn trafndiaeth gyhoeddus oherwydd y'i gwelant fel gwasanaeth hanfodol. Dyna'r gwahaniaeth. Rhaid inni ddweud bod trafndiaeth gyhoeddus yn wasanaeth hanfodol. Mae yno i ategu ein polisïau eraill. Dyma fara'r bywyd:

in modern society. It is not just about changes in affluence. In surveys, people say that they want public transport opportunities because it gives them the chance to move away from dependency on cars. It gives a whole section of society, such as young people, older people and people who cannot drive, the opportunity to get out and about. As such, it is part of our commitment to equal opportunities.

You mentioned penalising motorists. I am not sure what you are talking about. We do not have congestion charging in Wales at present. We have major investment in trunk roads and in local roads. I recently announced extra money for road surfacing and maintenance. I do not understand what you are talking about, and nothing that you produce shows that we are penalising motorists.

New technology is improving emissions and making a difference. However, we know that transport is responsible for 30 per cent of our total emissions. In areas such as Neath Port Talbot, emissions play a strong part in the poor air quality. It is right that we try to cut down those emissions and it is right that we try to reduce congestion, where that is possible, and offer people an alternative.

The WLGA has completed its regional bus strategies, so that question is irrelevant. On the percentage of the block grant, I thought that I had given you a written answer on that subject: your researcher or private office may have it. If not, please come back to me. Your last point was about supporting innovation on public transport, making it environmentally friendly and accessible. As a Government, we are prepared to support measures that show some innovation. If you are in Government, you cannot take the soft option all the time. You cannot sit and wait for other people to deliver. We have a practical example of how we can innovate in public transport. Some people would say that they do not want that and others would say, 'good on you, you are trying something different'. That is your answer. However, it is not an excuse for what we are doing elsewhere. I have talked about

os oes trafndiaeth ar gael, gall pobl wneud y pethau y dymunant eu gwneud mewn cymdeithas fodern. Nid mater o newidiadau mewn cyfoeth yn unig ydyw. Mewn arolygon, dywed pobl fod arnynt eisiau trafndiaeth gyhoeddus oherwydd ei bod yn rhoi cyfle iddynt symud i ffwrdd oddi wrth ddibyniaeth ar geir. Mae'n rhoi cyfle i gyfran gyfan o gymdeithas, fel pobl ifanc, pobl oedrannus a phobl sy'n methu gyrru, fynd o gwmpas. Yn hynny o beth, mae'n rhan o'n hymrwymiad i gyfle cyfartal.

Fe sonioch am gosbi modurwyr. Nid wyf yn siŵr am beth yr ydych yn sôn. Nid oes gennym gynllun codi tâl am dagfeydd yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd. Mae gennym fuddsoddiad mawr mewn cefnffyrdd a ffyrdd lleol. Yn ddiweddar cyhoeddais arian ychwanegol ar gyfer adnewyddu a chynnal arwyneb ffyrdd. Nid wyf yn deall am beth yr ydych yn sôn, ac nid oes dim a gyflwynwch yn dangos ein bod yn cosbi modurwyr.

Mae technoleg newydd yn gwella allyriadau ac yn gwneud gwahaniaeth. Er hynny, gwyddom fod trafndiaeth yn gyfrifol am 30 y cant o'n cyfanswm allyriadau. Mewn ardaloedd fel Castell-nedd Port Talbot mae allyriadau'n chwarae rhan fawr yn ansawdd gwael yr aer. Mae'n iawn ein bod yn ceisio lleihau'r allyriadau hynny ac mae'n iawn ein bod yn ceisio lleihau tagfeydd, lle bo modd gwneud hynny, a chynnig dewis arall i bobl.

Mae Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru wedi cwblhau ei strategaeth bysus rhanbarthol, felly mae'r cwestiwn hwnnw'n amherthnasol. Ar y ganran o'r grant bloc, yr oeddwn yn meddwl fy mod wedi rhoi ateb ysgrifenedig ichi ar y pwnc hwnnw: efallai ei fod gyda'ch ymchwilydd neu eich swyddfa breifat. Os na, dewch yn ôl ataf. Eich pwynt olaf oedd cefnogi arloesi mewn trafndiaeth gyhoeddus, gan ei gwneud yn garedig i'r amgylchedd ac yn hawdd ei chael. Fel Llywodraeth, yr ydym yn barod i gefnogi mesurau sy'n dangos rhywfaint o ddyfeisgarwch. Os ydych mewn Llywodraeth, ni allwch gymryd y dewis braf bob tro. Ni allwch eistedd ac aros i bobl eraill gyflawni. Mae gennym enghraifft ymarferol o sut y gallwn arloesi mewn trafndiaeth gyhoeddus. Dywedai rhai pobl nad oes arnynt eisiau hynny a dywedai eraill, 'da iawn chi,

how all the money is invested. This is mainstreaming a commitment to public community transport across Wales. We are receiving positive reports, particularly from rural areas, about how this is happening. However, as Janet said, it will be a long slog. This is an oil tanker that we will not turn around overnight, but the difference between this Government and past Governments, including yours, is that we are committed to public transport, and we will carry that commitment through.

The Presiding Officer: Order. I had not realised that this statement was about oil tankers.

Eleanor Burnham: The Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome this statement, the extra resources, the delivery of our partnership agreement regarding SRA direction and representation, and the move towards a more integrated public transport system. However, with the demise of Railtrack, it is essential that Wales is represented on any successor body. Will you inform the Chamber of any discussions regarding this important issue? The policy review makes clear that the National Assembly must secure significant investment from its own resources or from the Westminster Government, together with investment from the private sector, or the vision for integrated, accessible and affordable public transport in Wales will not be realised. Has increased investment been secured and is there any likelihood of additional funding for transport in Wales in the upcoming comprehensive spending review? I commend TAITH, particularly in my own region in north Wales, for its effective work and leadership. I am also concerned about the north-south link. I recently had a heated discussion with the managing director of Wales and Borders Trains about the problems that exist when alighting the train at Shrewsbury and boarding at Wrexham, which is like going back to the nineteenth century. Having travelled on this train for many months, I have noticed that one seat is perpetually out

am roi cynnig ar rywbeth gwahanol'. Dyna'ch ateb. Er hynny, nid yw'n esgus am yr hyn a wnawn mewn mannau eraill. Yr wyf wedi sôn am y ffordd y buddsoddir yr holl arian. Dyma osod ymrwymiad i drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus gymunedol yn y brif ffordd ar draws Cymru. Yr ydym yn derbyn adroddiadau cadarnhaol, yn enwedig o ardaloedd gwledig, ynghylch y modd y mae hyn yn digwydd. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedodd Janet, bydd yn waith hir. Dyma dancer olew na throir yn ei ôl dros nos, ond y gwahaniaeth rhwng y Llywodraeth hon a Llywodraethau'r gorffennol, gan gynnwys eich Llywodraeth chi, yw bod gennym ymrwymiad i drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus, ac fe gyflawnwn yr ymrwymiad hwnnw.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid oeddwn wedi sylweddoli mai datganiad am danceri olew oedd hwn.

Eleanor Burnham: Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n croesawu'r datganiad hwn, yr adnoddau ychwanegol, a'r ffaith y gwiredwyd ein cytundeb partneriaeth ynghylch cyfeiriad a chynrychiolaeth yr Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol, a'r symudiad tuag at system drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus fwy integredig. Fodd bynnag, gyda thranc Railtrack, mae'n hanfodol y caiff Cymru ei chynrychioli ar unrhyw gorff sy'n ei olynu. A wnewch chi hysbysu'r Siambr am unrhyw drafodaethau ynglŷn â'r mater pwysig hwn? Dywed yr adolygiad polisi yn glir fod yn rhaid i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol sicrhau buddsoddiad sylweddol o'i adnoddau ei hun neu gan Lywodraeth San Steffan, ynghyd â buddsoddiad gan y sector preifat, neu ni wireddir y weledigaeth o drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus integredig, hwylus a fforddiadwy yng Nghymru. A sicrhawyd buddsoddiad ychwanegol ac a oes unrhyw debygolrwydd y ceir cyllid ychwanegol ar gyfer trafnidiaeth yng Nghymru yn yr adolygiad gwariant cynhwysfawr sydd i ddod? Cymeradwyaf TAITH, yn enwedig yn fy ardal i yn y Gogledd, am ei arweiniad a'i waith effeithiol. Yr wyf yn bryderus am y cyswllt de-gogledd. Cefais drafodaeth wresog yn ddiweddar gyda rheolwr gyfarwyddwr Trenau Cymru a'r Gororau am y problemau a geir wrth ddod oddi ar y trên yn Amwythig a mynd ar y trên yn Wrecsam, sydd fel mynd yn ôl i'r 19eg ganrif. Wedi teithio ar y trên hwn am rai

of order—it is on the floor. We must get to grips with these kinds of issues.

3:10 p.m.

Sue Essex: As a result of your frequent meetings with the managing director of Wales and Borders Trains, he may be considering tagging you so that he knows which train you are on. It would be foolish for the Assembly Government to discuss faulty seats. As I have said, most public transport in Wales is delivered through the commercial and private sector, and we can only seek to influence and set standards. We are seeking better standards, and that will be included in the franchise; however, there is a long way to go.

On membership of the Strategic Rail Authority, I recently gave evidence to the Welsh Affairs Select Committee in London, and as discussed in the Committee report, I made it clear that we had a right to appoint to the SRA, and that we wanted to do so. I will continue to say that while I hold this post, and perhaps we will succeed.

On increased funding, Richard Bowker of the SRA has made a commitment to reconsider the authority's strategic plan. We do not know whether that will give us more money—I hope that it will not give us less—but Rhodri Morgan and I have made representations on the situation in Wales. The rail partnership fund is effective in delivering additional money into Wales. It has received a bid for the Ebbw Vale railway line, which we hope will be successful, and a large bid from SWIFT. Therefore, local authorities are gearing themselves up via the consortia to access this money. The recent opening of Haverfordwest station was a result of a rail partnership bid, as was the extra train, and so on, on the Valleys line.

We must be alert to all funding opportunities. In addition to investing our money, we must tell private operators to invest, as it is about private investment as well as public investment. In terms of money from central

misoedd, yr wyf wedi sylwi bod un sedd nad yw byth mewn defnydd—y mae ar y llawr. Rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â'r mathau hyn o bethau.

Sue Essex: Yn sgîl eich cyfarfodydd mynych gyda rheolwr gyfarwyddwr Wales and Borders Trains, efallai y bydd yn ystyried rhoi tag arnoch er mwyn iddo gael gwybod ar ba drên yr ydych yn teithio. Ffolineb fyddai i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad drafod seddau diffygiol. Fel y dywedais, darperir y rhan fwyaf o drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus yng Nghymru drwy'r sector masnachol a phreifat, ac ni allwn ond ceisio dylanwadu a gosod safonau. Yr ydym yn ceisio safonau gwell, a chynhwysir hynny yn y fasnachfrait; serch hynny, mae cryn bellter i fynd.

Ar aelodaeth yr Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol, rhoddais dystiolaeth yn ddiweddar i'r Pwyllgor Dethol ar Faterion Cymreig yn Llundain, ac fel a drafodir yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor, dywedais yn glir fod gennym hawl i benodi i'r awdurdod, a bod arnom eisiau gwneud hynny. Daliaf ati i ddweud hynny tra byddaf yn y swydd hon, ac efallai y cawn y maen i'r wal.

Ar gynnydd yn y cyllid, mae Richard Bowker o'r Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol wedi ymrwmo i ailystyried cynllun strategol yr awdurdod. Ni wyddom a rydd hynny fwy o arian inni—gobeithiaf na fydd yn rhoi llai—ond mae Rhodri Morgan a mi wedi cyflwyno sylwadau ar y sefyllfa yng Nghymru. Mae cronfa bartneriaeth y rheilffyrdd yn effeithiol o ran sicrhau arian ychwanegol i Gymru. Derbyniodd gais ar gyfer rheilffordd Glynebwy, a fydd, gobeithio, yn llwyddiannus, a chais mawr gan SWIFT. Felly, mae awdurdodau lleol yn cymryd camau drwy'r consortia i gael gafael ar yr arian hwn. Yr oedd agoriad diweddar gorsaf Hwlffordd yn ganlyniad i gais partneriaeth rheilffyrdd, fel yr oedd y trên ychwanegol, ac ati, ar linell y Cymoedd.

Rhaid inni fod yn effro i bob cyfle ariannu. Yn ogystal â buddsoddi'n harian, rhaid inni ddweud wrth gwmnïau preifat am fuddsoddi, gan fod a wnelo hyn â buddsoddiad preifat yn ogystal â buddsoddiad cyhoeddus. O ran

Government, we must continue to bang the drum. The comprehensive spending review will be decided upon in due course.

The Presiding Officer: Order. There are less than two minutes remaining for this statement, and nine Members wish to be called.

Karen Sinclair: Do you agree that one of the important consequences of free transport for the elderly—I have particularly noticed this in my area—is increased viability for transport companies? Therefore, the policy's ramifications extend beyond the advantages enjoyed by the elderly.

Sue Essex: As I said in my statement, it gives a real focus and commitment to public transport. The feedback we have had, particularly from rural areas, is that it is helping to sustain routes that may have been marginal.

Alun Cairns: I note from your statement that you want to increase your powers by establishing a public transport unit, a national public transport alliance and by extending your powers to match those of the Greater London Assembly with regard to public transport. If you obtain these powers, will you be able to influence local authorities to set up a public transport initiative, which could be of strategic importance to areas such as Cardiff bay, where there is a significant lack of public transport at present, but which is of strategic investment importance?

Sue Essex: The public transport unit and the national public transport alliance will not require additional powers, and we will set them up. However, establishing a passenger transport authority will require primary legislation.

It is important to see Cardiff bay as part of the strategic, integrated network. Part of the problem relates to the former Cardiff Bay Development Corporation. I hope that by combining the SWIFT and TIGER consortia, if it happens, we will see that kind of integration on the ground. We will be looking

arian gan Lywodraeth ganolog, rhaid inni ddal i guro'r drwm. Penderfynir ar yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant maes o law.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae llai na dau funud ar ôl ar gyfer y datganiad hwn, ac mae ar naw Aelod eisiau cael eu galw.

Karen Sinclair: A gytunwch mai un o ganlyniadau pwysig trafndiaeth am ddim i'r henoed—yr wyf wedi sylwi ar hyn yn arbennig yn fy ardal i—yw cynyddu hyfywdra cwmnïau teithio? Felly, mae goblygiadau'r polisi'n ymestyn ymhellach na'r manteision a fwyneir gan yr henoed.

Sue Essex: Fel y dywedais yn fy natganiad, mae'n rhoi gwir ffocws ac ymrwymiad i drafndiaeth gyhoeddus. Yr ymateb a gawsom, yn enwedig o ardaloedd gwledig, yw ei fod yn helpu cynnal teithiau a allasai fod yn rhai ymylol.

Alun Cairns: Nodaf o'ch datganiad fod arnoch eisiau cynyddu'ch pwerau drwy sefydlu uned drafndiaeth gyhoeddus, cynghrair drafndiaeth gyhoeddus genedlaethol a thrwy ymestyn eich pwerau i lefel pwerau Cynulliad Llundain Fwyaf dros drafndiaeth gyhoeddus. Os cewch y pwerau hyn, a fyddwch yn gallu dylanwadu ar awdurdodau lleol i sefydlu menter trafndiaeth gyhoeddus, a allai fod o bwysigrwydd strategol i ardaloedd fel bae Caerdydd, lle ceir prinder mawr o drafndiaeth gyhoeddus ar hyn o bryd, ond sydd o bwysigrwydd buddsoddi strategol?

Sue Essex: Ni fydd angen pwerau ychwanegol ar gyfer yr uned drafndiaeth gyhoeddus a'r gynghrair drafndiaeth gyhoeddus genedlaethol, a byddwn yn eu sefydlu. Fodd bynnag, bydd angen deddfwriaeth sylfaenol i sefydlu awdurdod trafndiaeth teithwyr.

Mae'n bwysig gweld bae Caerdydd fel rhan o'r rhwydwaith integredig strategol. Mae a wnelo rhan o'r broblem â chyn Gorfforaeth Ddatblygu Bae Caerdydd. Gobeithiaf, os cyfunir consortia SWIFT a TIGER, y gwelwn y math hwnnw o integreiddio ar y ddaear. Byddwn yn anelu at ategu hynny drwy

to back that up through transport grants and so on.

Val Lloyd: I agree that good public transport is key in addressing social inclusion. I know from my constituents that improvements to their local bus services are needed and are much valued when they happen. Could you confirm your commitment to ensuring that bus services are enhanced and improved throughout Wales, and that within the quality bus partnerships, quality contracts will also be highlighted?

Sue Essex: We have a working group on the development of quality partnerships. The Committee report mentions the quality kitemark, which emphasises that routes are not just services, but that the quality of provision is important, particularly regarding disabled access. We hope to move on to quality contracts. If my memory serves me right, some authorities will introduce pilot work on this, which we will support.

Brian Hancock: Could you give me an update on a couple of schemes? On the Vale of Glamorgan passenger rail service, are you still wedded to a scheme that will drop passengers away from Cardiff international airport and then shuttle them in? You mentioned the Ebbw Vale via Islwyn to Newport and Cardiff link. Will you reassure us that that is a top priority, because I have heard rumours of a slippage in dates—such as 2009—due to problems with the scheme? The people of Ebbw Vale and all the way down to Newport look forward to that service. Will you also support an integrated system that will support Coleg Gwent, Crosskeys to achieve funding for rail engineering courses in my constituency?

Sue Essex: On the Vale of Glamorgan passenger rail service, the intention is to look for a shuttle connection from Rhoose station to the airport, which will provide the necessary integration. On the Ebbw Vale rail link, I do not know of a slippage. To the best of my knowledge there is no major problem, but I will let you know if I am wrong.

grantiau trafnidiaeth ac ati.

Val Lloyd: Cytunaf fod trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus dda yn allweddol i hybu cynhwysiant cymdeithasol. Gwn o'r hyn a ddywed fy etholwyr fod angen gwelliannau ar eu gwasanaethau bws lleol ac y'u gwerthfawrogi yn fawr pan ddigwyddant. A allech gadarnhau'ch ymrwymiad i sicrhau y caiff gwasanaethau bysus eu gwella ledled Cymru, ac yr amlygir contractau o ansawdd da hefyd o fewn y partneriaethau bysus o ansawdd?

Sue Essex: Mae gennym weithgor ar ddatblygu partneriaethau o ansawdd. Mae adroddiad y Pwyllgor yn crybwyll y nod barcod ansawdd, sy'n pwysleisio nad gwasanaethau yn unig yw'r teithiau bws, ond bod ansawdd y ddarpariaeth yn bwysig, yn enwedig o ran mynediad i'r anabl. Gobeithiwn symud ymlaen at gontractau o ansawdd. Os cofiaf yn iawn, bydd rhai awdurdodau'n cyflwyno gwaith peilot ar hyn, a gefnogir gennym ni.

Brian Hancock: A allech roi diweddariad imi ar un neu ddau gynllun? Ar wasanaeth rheilffordd teithwyr Bro Morgannwg, a ydych yn dal yn ymrwymedig i gynllun a fydd yn gollwng teithwyr i ffwrdd oddi wrth faes awyr rhyngwladol Caerdydd ac wedyn yn eu cludo i mewn? Soniasoch am y cysylltiad o Lynebwy drwy Islwyn i Gasnewydd a Chaerdydd. A wnewch chi ein sicrhau bod hynny'n flaenoriaeth uchel, oherwydd clywais sibrydion am lithriad yn y dyddiadau—fel 2009—oherwydd problemau gyda'r cynllun? Mae pobl Glynebwy a'r holl ffordd i lawr i Gasnewydd yn edrych ymlaen at y gwasanaeth hwnnw. A wnewch chi gefnogi hefyd system integredig a fydd yn cefnogi Coleg Gwent, Crosskeys i sicrhau cyllid ar gyfer cyrsiau peirianeg rheilffyrdd yn fy etholaeth?

Sue Essex: Ar wasanaeth lein deithwyr Bro Morgannwg, y nod yw edrych am gysylltiad gwennol o orsaf Rhws i'r maes awyr, a fydd yn darparu'r integreiddiad angenrheidiol. Ar gyswllt rheilffordd Glynebwy, ni wn am lithriad. Hyd y gwn i nid oes problem fawr, ond rhoddaf wybod ichi os wyf yn anghywir. Bu trafodaethau'n canolbwyntio ar a ddylai

Discussions have been concentrating on whether it will be a single or double track. It looks as if the operation of freight will continue, so we are contemplating a double track. That will increase the price but will probably give a more sustainable service. I would not be too pessimistic about that. Everyone is still committed to this. The integrated system is necessary if we are to allow people to access training and jobs—particularly in Valleys communities—bearing in mind that people must often make three journeys or more before reaching their destination. That is the nature of transport movements at the top end of the Valleys in particular. Connections and integration are necessary. Combining the SWIFT and TIGER consortia can allow for such links across the Islwyn-Caerphilly border, if you like, in a way that has not perhaps been happening to date.

Peter Law: I congratulate you on the steam express of a portfolio that you are running, and on today's statement. Your comments about the south-east Wales transport board are first class. You recognise the need, which has been a long held aspiration of many of us, for control of the Strategic Rail Authority, for the ability to make an SRA appointment and for power over the passenger transport authority. I compliment you on that. I also thank you for your good work in recognising social exclusion, particularly in places such as Blaenau Gwent, which has the lowest level of car ownership, and where you are replacing the railway from Ebbw Vale to Cardiff. Do you agree that this Labour-led Government, unlike previous Tory Governments, allows you to give more funding to our local authority partners? You are funding them so that we can harness their expertise, their local knowledge and commitment in order to provide a quality public transport service for all the people of Wales.

Sue Essex: We are sticking by public transport, and improving it, in order to give people confidence, and to demonstrate that it is not a thing of the past, as some people have said. That is nonsense: it is an essential part of modern society. The transport grant—I know that you are keen on transport grant

fod yn drac sengl ynteu ddwbl. Mae'n edrych yn debygol y parheir i weithredu gwasanaeth cludo nwyddau, felly yr ydym yn ystyried trac dwbl. Bydd hynny'n cynyddu'r pris ond yn rhoi gwasanaeth mwy cynaliadwy, mae'n debyg. Ni fyddwn yn rhy ddigalon am hynny. Mae pawb yn dal yn ymroddedig i hyn. Mae angen y system integredig os ydym am ganiatáu i bobl gyrraedd hyfforddiant a swyddi—yn enwedig yng nghymunedau'r Cymoedd—o gofio fod pobl yn aml yn gorfod gwneud tair siwrnai neu fwy cyn cyrraedd pen eu taith. Dyna natur symudiadau trafndiaeth ym mhen uchaf y Cymoedd yn arbennig. Mae angen cysylltiadau ac integreiddiad. Gall cyfuno consortia SWIFT a TIGER ganiatáu cysylltiadau o'r fath ar draws ffin Islwyn-Caerffili, os mynnwch, mewn modd sydd efallai heb fod yn digwydd hyd yma.

Peter Law: Fe'ch llongyfarchaf ar y trêrn stêm o bortffolio yr ydych yn ei redeg, ac ar ddatganiad heddiw. Mae eich sylwadau am fwrdd trafndiaeth y de-ddwyrain yn rhai dosbarth cyntaf. Yr ydych yn cydnabod yr angen, a fu'n ddyhead ers tro byd gan lawer ohonom, am reolaeth ar yr Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol, am y gallu i benodi i'r awdurdod ac am bŵer dros yr awdurdod trafndiaeth teithwyr. Fe'ch cymeradwyaf ar hynny. Diolchaf ichi hefyd am eich gwaith da yn cydnabod allgáu cymdeithasol, yn enwedig mewn lleoedd fel Blaenau Gwent, sydd â'r lefel isaf o berchenogaeth ceir, a lle'r ydych yn ailsefydlu'r rheilffordd o Lynebwy i Gaerdydd. A gytunwch fod y Llywodraeth hon, dan arweiniad Llafur, yn wahanol i Lywodraethau Torïaidd blaenorol, yn caniatáu ichi roi mwy o gyllid i'n partneriaid mewn llywodraeth leol? Yr ydych yn ariannu awdurdodau lleol fel y gallwn ni harneisio'u harbenigedd, eu gwybodaeth leol a'u hymrwymiad er mwyn darparu gwasanaeth trafndiaeth gyhoeddus o ansawdd da i holl bobl Cymru.

Sue Essex: Yr ydym yn glynu wrth drafndiaeth gyhoeddus, ac yn ei gwella, er mwyn rhoi hyder i bobl, ac i ddangos nad peth yn perthyn i'r gorffennol ydyw, fel y mae rhai pobl wedi dweud. Dwli yw hynny: mae'n rhan hanfodol o gymdeithas fodern. Cynyddwyd y grant trafndiaeth—gwn eich

mechanisms, as I am—has been increased to demonstrate that commitment to local authorities. We will fund local authorities for the kind of policies that we want and that they can deliver. It is important to consider the figures about car ownership—30 per cent of households in Wales do not have a car, increasing to 40 per cent in some areas, including your neck of the woods at the top end of the Valleys. These figures are high. People are utterly dependent on public transport. They do not have quality of life without reliable public transport. We would be abrogating our responsibility, in terms of a consistent approach to supporting those who most need help, if we did not make public transport a top priority.

3:20 p.m.

Richard Edwards: Thank you, Minister, for your statement and strong personal commitment to public transport. The Environment, Planning and Transport Committee's report recommended that the consortia be strengthened in the short term, but we felt that statutory pressure may be needed for the system to deliver. How can you ensure that the consortia will deliver the necessary improvements to public transport? Will there be a three-step approach: first, through partnership; secondly by requiring that local transport plans be implemented in line with a national strategy, along the lines of the Greater London Authority Act 1999; and, finally, through threatening to establish a new fit-for-purpose body? Will you give a commitment to using the necessary powers to deliver improvement if the consortia fail to deliver?

Sue Essex: The Committee's report has played an important part and our discussions were a spur to the consortia to consider how they are organised and whether they can make more organised, formal and fit-for-purpose arrangements. It is about supporting partnership, because we believe in that. We must remember that local authorities have highway powers and are local transport operators in their own right. Therefore, working with local government is crucial. We hope that establishing this way forward,

bod yn frwd ynghylch peirianweithiau grant trafnidiaeth, fel fi—i ddangos yr ymrwymiad hwnnw i awdurdodau lleol. Byddwn yn ariannu awdurdodau lleol am y math o bolisiau y mae arnom ni eu heisiau ac y gallant hwy eu darparu. Mae'n bwysig ystyried y ffigurau ynghylch perchenogaeth ceir—mae 30 y cant o aelwydydd yng Nghymru heb gar, a hynny'n codi i 40 y cant mewn rhai ardaloedd, gan gynnwys eich ardal chi ym mhen uchaf y Cymoedd. Mae'r ffigurau hyn yn uchel. Mae pobl yn gwbl ddibynol ar drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus. Nid oes ganddynt ansawdd bywyd heb drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus ddibynadwy. Byddem yn esgeuluso'n cyfrifoldeb, o ran agwedd gyson at gefnogi'r rhai sydd angen cymorth fwyaf, pe na roddem flaenoriaeth gyda'r uchaf i drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus.

Richard Edwards: Diolch, Weinidog, am eich datganiad a'ch ymrwymiad personol cryf i drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus. Argymhellodd adroddiad Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth y dylid cryfhau'r consortia yn y tymor byr, ond yr oeddem yn teimlo efallai fod angen pwysau statudol i'r system wneud ei gwaith. Sut y gallwch chi sicrhau y bydd y consortia'n cyflawni'r gwelliannau angenrheidiol i drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus? A eir ati mewn tri cham: yn gyntaf, drwy bartneriaeth; yn ail drwy fynnu y gweithredir cynlluniau trafnidiaeth lleol yn unol â strategaeth genedlaethol, ar linellau Deddf Awdurdod Llundain Fwyaf 1999; ac, yn olaf, drwy figwth sefydlu corff newydd addas i'r pwrpas? A ymrwymwch i ddefnyddio'r pwerau angenrheidiol i sicrhau gwelliant os metha'r consortia â'i sicrhau?

Sue Essex: Mae adroddiad y Pwyllgor wedi chwarae rhan bwysig a bu ein trafodaethau'n sbardun i'r consortia i ystyried sut y maent wedi'u trefnu ac a allant wneud trefniadau mwy trefnus, ffurfiol ac addas i'r pwrpas. Cefnogi partneriaeth yw'r nod, oherwydd credwn yn hynny. Rhaid inni gofio fod gan awdurdodau lleol bwerau priffyrdd a'u bod yn weithredwyr trafnidiaeth leol eu hunain. Felly, mae'n hollbwysig gweithio gyda llywodraeth leol. Gobeithiwn y bydd sefydlu'r ffordd hon ymlaen, darparu hynny o

providing the resources that we can, and providing a back-up through the national public transport alliance, will be sufficient to encourage the consortia to work. I cannot guarantee delivery and, as I said earlier, the chief test for people on the ground is the outcome. If the outcome is not satisfactory and we have the powers, I am sure that the Welsh Assembly Government will take steps to ensure delivery—if it comes to that. However, it is important to say that, as well as seeking those powers, we will also support the consortia to deliver. We will monitor the situation and work closely with local government, transport operators and others, to ascertain whether we can secure that.

adnoddau a allwn, a darparu gwasanaeth wrth gefn drwy'r gynghrair drafndiaeth gyhoeddus genedlaethol, yn ddigon i annog y consortia i weithio. Ni allaf warantu llwyddiant ac, fel y dywedais yn gynharach, y prif brawf i bobl ar y llawr yw'r canlyniad. Os nad yw'r canlyniad yn foddhaol a bod y pwerau gennym, yr wyf yn siŵr y cymer Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gamau i sicrhau llwyddiant—os daw i hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig dweud y byddwn, yn ogystal â cheisio'r pwerau hynny, yn cefnogi'r consortia i lwyddo. Byddwn yn monitro'r sefyllfa ac yn cydweithio'n agos gyda llywodraeth leol, cwmnïau trafndiaeth ac eraill i ganfod a allwn sicrhau hynny.

Datganiad Busnes Business Statement

The Minister for Open Government (Carwyn Jones): There are no further additions to this week's business, except for the election to the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee, which was held earlier. As regards the next three weeks' business, the Business Committee discussed this morning my draft business statement, as shown on the Chamberweb under supporting documents. The Deputy Presiding Officer determined that, under Standing Order No. 22.5, the following legislation need not be referred to Subject Committees for extended consideration: the Local Authorities (Allowances for Members of County and County Borough Councils and National Park Authorities) (Wales) Regulations 2002, the Town and Country Planning (Use Classes) (Amendment) (Wales) Order 2002, the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000 (Commencement No. 3) (Wales) Order 2002, the Seeds (Fees) (Amendment) (Wales) (No. 2) Regulations 2002, the Education (Assisted Places) (Incidental Expenses) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2002 and the Education (Assisted Places) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2002.

Y Llywydd: Gwela'n nad oes gwrthwynebiad i'r datganiad. A oes sylwadau ar y datganiad?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Mae'r Gweinidog yn gwybod i mi wneud cais am ddadl mewn

Y Gweinidog dros Lywodraeth Agored (Carwyn Jones): Nid oes ychwanegiadau at fusnes yr wythnos hon, ac eithrio'r etholiad i'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig, a gynhaliwyd yn gynharach. O ran busnes y tair wythnos nesaf, trafododd y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma fy natganiad busnes drafft, fel a ddangosir ar we'r Siambur dan ddogfennau atodol. Penderfynodd y Dirprwy Lywydd, dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.5, nad oedd angen cyfeirio'r ddeddfwriaeth ganlynol i Bwyllgorau Pwnc ar gyfer ystyriaeth estynedig: Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Lwfansau i Aelodau Cynghorau Sir a Chynghorau Bwrdeistref Sirol ac Awdurdodau Parciau Cenedlaethol) (Cymru) 2002, Gorchymyn Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Dosbarthiadau Defnydd) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2002, Gorchymyn Deddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000 (Cychwyn Rhif 3) (Cymru) 2002, Rheoliadau Hadau (Ffioedd) (Diwygio) (Cymru) (Rhif 2) 2002, Rheoliadau Addysg (Lleoedd a Gynorthwyr) (Mân Dreuliau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2002 a Rheoliadau Addysg (Lleoedd a Gynorthwyr) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2002.

The Presiding Officer: I see that there are no objections to the statement. Are there any comments on the statement?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: The Minister knows that I have called for a debate in Plenary on

Cyfarfod Llawn ar yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant. Gan nad yw hynny wedi'i gynnwys yn y datganiad busnes, sut y bydd y Gweinidog yn sicrhau y bydd mewnbwn gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i'r adolygiad, nid yn unig gan y Cabinet a'r Llywodraeth, fel y câi'r Aelodau gyfle i sicrhau bod pynciau o bwys i Gymru yn cael eu codi yng nghydestun yr adolygiad?

Nick Bourne: When I questioned the Minister on the business statement two weeks ago, he said that the Deputy First Minister would answer questions on rural development and Wales abroad. He said at the time that 'that must be the case'. Will he confirm whether the Deputy First Minister's question time on 18 July will encompass both matters?

Y Gweinidog dros Lywodraeth Agored (Carwyn Jones): O ran sylwadau Rhodri Glyn Thomas, bydd yn rhaid imi siarad â'm cyd-Aelod, Edwina Hart, er mwyn sicrhau fy mod yn gwybod beth yn union y mae hi am ei wneud ynglŷn â thrafod yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant. O ran sylwadau Nick Bourne, mater i'r Llywydd yw dweud beth yw cylch gwaith y Gweinidog newydd yn hynny o beth, a bydd yn rhaid egluro hynny cyn gynted â phosibl.

Y Llywydd: Diolch i'r Gweinidog am ei sylwadau doeth bob amser.

*Derbyniwyd y datganiad busnes.
Business statement adopted.*

Datganiad gan y Llywydd Statement by the Presiding Officer

The Presiding Officer: Last week, in response to points of order made by Ron Davies and other Members, I made a statement that the situation regarding the questioning of Ministers with cross-cutting responsibilities needed to be regularised. I have now seen a copy of a document from the Cabinet and constitutional affairs branch, entitled 'Responsibilities of the Assembly Cabinet', which has been provided to the Table Office. Members will have heard me refer on several occasions to section 56(3) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, which

the comprehensive spending review. As that is not included in the business statement, how will the Minister ensure that there is input from the National Assembly into the review, and not just from the Cabinet and Government, so that Members have the opportunity to ensure topics important to Wales are raised in the context of the review?

Nick Bourne: Pan holais y Gweinidog ar y datganiad busnes bythefnos yn ôl, dywedodd y byddai'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn ateb cwestiynau ar ddatblygu gwledig a Chymru dramor. Dywedodd ar y pryd, 'mae'n rhaid mai felly y gwneir'. A wnaiff gadarnhau a fydd sesiwn holi'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ar 18 Gorffennaf yn cynnwys y ddau fater?

The Minister for Open Government (Carwyn Jones): In terms of Rhodri Glyn Thomas's comments, I will have to discuss this with my colleague, Edwina Hart, in order to ensure that I know exactly what she wishes to do in terms of discussing the comprehensive spending review. As regards Nick Bourne's comments, it is for the Presiding Officer to outline the remit of the new Minister in that regard, and that must be clarified as soon as possible.

The Presiding Officer: I thank the Minister for his wise remarks, as always.

Y Llywydd: Yr wythnos diwethaf, mewn ymateb i bwyntiau o drefn a wnaethpwyd gan Ron Davies ac Aelodau eraill, gwneuthum ddatganiad fod angen rheoleiddio'r sefyllfa ynghylch holi Gweinidogion â chyfrifoldebau trawsbynciol. Yr wyf bellach wedi gweld copi o ddogfen gan y Cabinet a'r gangen materion cyfansoddiadol, dan y pennawd 'Cyfrifoldebau Cabinet y Cynulliad', a ddarparwyd i'r Swyddfa Gyflwyno. Bydd Aelodau wedi fy nghlywed yn cyfeirio ar sawl achlysur at adran 56(3) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, sy'n gofyn bod

requires the First Minister to

‘allocate accountability in the fields in which the Assembly has functions’

to Ministers,

‘so that, in the case of each of those fields, accountability in the field is allocated’

either to a Minister or to him. This means that Members and the public can be clear about what Ministers are accountable for in law. They may hold other responsibilities, but there is no accountability for them in our founding legislation.

Standing Order No. 6.3(iv) provides that Ministers other than the First Minister, the Minister with responsibility for finance, and the Minister responsible for Assembly business, answer questions only in respect of their fields of accountability. That is clear in Standing Orders. I do not regard the document, ‘Responsibilities of the Assembly Cabinet’, as providing a satisfactory basis for me, and my hard-pressed staff in the Table Office, to judge whether questions are in order. It does not differentiate sufficiently between the accountability of Ministers in their statutory fields, in the relevant sections of the Act and our Standing Orders, and their responsibilities.

I understand that the Business Committee has already requested that the First Minister provide Members with a detailed and comprehensive list of ministerial accountabilities in fields under section 56(3) of the Government of Wales Act. I hope that this document can be provided without delay. In the meantime, I have instructed the Table Office to circulate the document, ‘Responsibilities of the Assembly Cabinet’, to Members. However, the Table Office will take decisions on the admissibility of questions having full regard to the First Minister’s letter to me on 24 June, a copy of which is available in the Library. That letter makes it clear that accountability for cross-cutting issues falls on the Minister who has accountability under section 56(3) for the field in which such an issue arises. I hope that this complicated situation can be resolved without further delay so that Members can be

Prif Weinidog Cymru yn

‘allocate accountability in the fields in which the Assembly has functions’

i Weinidogion,

‘so that, in the case of each of those fields, accountability in the field is allocated’

un ai i Weinidog neu iddo ef. Golyga hyn y gall Gweinidogion a’r cyhoedd fod yn glir ynghylch beth y mae Gweinidogion yn atebol amdano dan y gyfraith. Gallant ddal cyfrifoldebau eraill, ond nid oes atebolrwydd amdanynt yn ein deddfwriaeth sylfaenu.

Mae Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.3(iv) yn darparu i Weinidogion ar wahân i’r Prif Weinidog, y Gweinidog â chyfrifoldeb dros gyllid, a’r Gweinidog sy’n gyfrifol am fusnes y Cynulliad, ateb cwestiynau dim ond mewn perthynas â’u meysydd atebolrwydd. Mae hynny’n glir yn y Rheolau Sefydlog. Ni farnaf fod y ddogfen ‘Cyfrifoldebau Cabinet y Cynulliad’ yn rhoi sail foddhaol i mi, ac i’m staff prysur yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno, farnu a yw cwestiynau mewn trefn. Nid yw’n gwahaniaethu’n ddigonol rhwng atebolrwydd Gweinidogion yn eu meysydd statudol, yn adrannau perthnasol y Ddeddf a’n Rheolau Sefydlog, a’u cyfrifoldebau.

Deallaf fod y Pwyllgor Busnes eisoes wedi gofyn i’r Prif Weinidog ddarparu rhestr fanwl a chynhwysfawr i’r Aelodau o’r meysydd y mae Gweinidogion yn atebol amdanynt dan adran 56(3) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru. Gobeithiaf y gellir darparu’r ddogfen hon yn ddi-oed. Yn y cyfamser, yr wyf wedi cyfarwyddo’r Swyddfa Gyflwyno i gylchredeg y ddogfen, ‘Cyfrifoldebau Cabinet y Cynulliad’, i’r Aelodau. Fodd bynnag, bydd y Swyddfa Gyflwyno’n gwneud penderfyniadau ar dderbynioldeb cwestiynau gan roi ystyriaeth lawn i lythyr y Prif Weinidog ataf fi ar 24 Mehefin, y mae copi ohono ar gael yn y Llyfrgell. Mae’n glir yn ôl y llythyr hwnnw fod atebolrwydd am faterion trawsbynciol yn syrthio ar y Gweinidog sydd ag atebolrwydd dan adran 56(3) am y maes lle cyfyd y cyfryw bwnc. Gobeithiaf y gellir datrys y sefyllfa gymhleth hon heb oedi pellach fel y gall Aelodau fod

clear about the matters for which each Minister is accountable within a field in which the Assembly has functions. I also hope that any necessary changes to Standing Orders, arising out of the Business Committee's deliberation on these procedures, are made soon, so that Ministers can be questioned on their cross-cutting responsibilities. The effective scrutiny of Ministers is in the interest of us all.

3:30 p.m.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I listened with great care to your statement, Presiding Officer, which builds on your statement last week in response to the First Minister's letter. I am pleased that a copy of the letter is now available to Members in the Library. It is difficult for Members not only to determine where responsibility and accountability lie in relation to the Deputy First Minister's portfolio, but also to understand the exact nature of his job as Minister with responsibility for Wales abroad.

I have referred to the documents with which Members were provided to try to ascertain what this Cabinet post means in practice. In the press notice issued by the Cabinet on 17 June, the responsibilities of the Deputy First Minister in relation to Wales abroad are broad-brush. No precise indication was given as to the nature of the job. The only clear statement in that press notice was that the Deputy First Minister would chair the Committee on European and External Affairs. For some reason, the request for the Assembly to elect him as Chair has been withdrawn and no explanation has been given for that. Although, it was clear in the Cabinet statement on 17 June that he was to chair that Committee, for some reason—of which Members have not been informed—a decision was made to withdraw from that position. It is now clear, from all the information that we can gather, that there is no prospect of a vote being held on electing the Deputy First Minister to chair the Committee on European and External Affairs. Therefore, the only definitive statement made by the Cabinet on 17 June is now not the case.

yn glir ynghylch y materion y mae pob Gweinidog yn atebol amdanynt o fewn maes lle mae gan y Cynulliad swyddogaethau. Gobeithiaf hefyd y caiff unrhyw newidiadau angenrheidiol i'r Rheolau Sefydlog, yn codi o drafodaethau'r Pwyllgor Busnes ar y trefniadau hyn, eu gwneud yn fuan, fel y gellir holi Gweinidogion ar eu cyfrifoldebau trawsbynciol. Mae craffu effeithiol ar Weinidogion yn beth buddiol i bawb ohonom.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Gwrandewais yn ofalus iawn ar eich datganiad, Lywydd, sy'n adeiladu ar eich datganiad yr wythnos diwethaf mewn ymateb i lythyr y Prif Weinidog. Yr wyf yn falch fod copi o'r llythyr bellach ar gael i Aelodau yn y Llyfrgell. Mae'n anodd i Aelodau nid yn unig benderfynu ymhle y mae'r cyfrifoldeb a'r atebolrwydd mewn perthynas â phortffolio'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog, ond hefyd ddeall union natur ei swydd fel Gweinidog â chyfrifoldeb dros Gymru dramor.

Yr wyf wedi cyfeirio at y dogfennau a ddarparwyd i'r Aelodau i geisio sicrhau beth yw ystyr y swydd Gabinet hon yn ymarferol. Yn yr hysbysiad i'r wasg a gyhoeddwyd gan y Cabinet ar 17 Mehefin, mae cyfrifoldebau'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog mewn perthynas â Chymru dramor yn rhai cyffredinol. Ni roddwyd unrhyw arwydd manwl gywir ynghylch natur y swydd. Yr unig ddatganiad clir yn yr hysbysiad hwnnw i'r wasg oedd y byddai'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn cadeirio'r Pwyllgor ar Faterion Ewropeaidd ac Allanol. Am ryw reswm, mae'r cais am i'r Cynulliad ei ethol yn Gadeirydd wedi'i dynnu'n ôl ac ni roddwyd esboniad am hynny. Er ei bod yn glir yn natganiad y Cabinet ar 17 Mehefin y byddai'n cadeirio'r Pwyllgor hwnnw, am ryw reswm—na ddatgelwyd i'r Aelodau—penderfynwyd tynnu'n ôl o'r sefyllfa honno. Mae'n glir yn awr, o'r holl wybodaeth y gallwn ei chasglu, nad oes unrhyw ragolwg o gynnal pleidlais ar ethol y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog i gadeirio'r Pwyllgor ar Faterion Ewropeaidd ac Allanol. Felly, mae'r unig ddatganiad pendant a wnaeth y Cabinet ar 17 Mehefin wedi peidio â bod.

If one considers the press notice issued at the time, it is clear that the Deputy First Minister's responsibilities for Wales abroad fall into three broad areas. First, he will look after the Assembly's relationship with Europe. Secondly, he will be responsible in some way for the growth of the EU and enlargement, although it is not clear what his responsibility would be in that regard, and thirdly, which is interesting, he will be responsible for the introduction of the euro. I cannot find that any responsibilities for the euro have been devolved to the Assembly. However, the press was told that those would be his responsibilities.

However, Presiding Officer, you have referred to the only document that counts in this regard, namely the paper that has now been produced by WAG—'Responsibilities of the Assembly Cabinet'. If one considers this document in detail, one can ascertain what the Minister's responsibilities are in terms of rural development because they are listed in the form of 18 bullet points. We therefore know how to frame our questions to him, when he will appear before this Assembly to be held to account and when he will appear before the Committee to be scrutinised. All those issues are clear.

We then come to the grand title of 'Wales abroad' under which he has cross-cutting responsibility for the promotion of Wales abroad. What does that mean? Does it mean that he is now responsible for attracting industry or tourists to Wales? Of course not, because those are the responsibilities of the Minister for Economic Development; that is clear from this document. The Minister for Economic Development is responsible for attracting inward investment to Wales, promoting exports from Wales and tourism in and to Wales, including the promotion of Wales as a tourist destination. Therefore, what does responsibility for the promotion of Wales abroad mean? If it does not include the economy, tourism or culture—and he is not responsible for those—what does it include?

The document also states that he is responsible for relations with the institutions of the European Union, which is interesting in light of the letter that was sent to you,

Os ystyrir yr hysbysiad i'r wasg a gyhoeddwyd ar y pryd, mae'n glir fod cyfrifoldebau'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog dros Gymru dramor yn cwmpo i dri phrif faes. Yn gyntaf, bydd yn edrych ar ôl perthynas y Cynulliad ag Ewrop. Yn ail, bydd yn gyfrifol mewn rhyw ffordd am dwf yr UE ac ehangu, er nad yw'n eglur beth fyddai ei gyfrifoldeb yn hynny o beth, ac yn drydydd, sydd yn ddiddorol, bydd yn gyfrifol am gyflwyniad yr ewro. Ni allaf ganfod fod unrhyw gyfrifoldebau am yr ewro wedi'u datganoli i'r Cynulliad. Er hynny, dywedwyd wrth y wasg mai dyna fyddai ei gyfrifoldebau.

Fodd bynnag, Lywydd, yr ydych wedi cyfeirio at yr unig ddogfen sy'n cyfrif yn hyn o beth, sef y papur sydd yn awr wedi'i baratoli gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad—'Cyfrifoldebau Cabinet y Cynulliad'. O ystyried y ddogfen hon yn fanwl, gellir canfod beth yw cyfrifoldebau datblygu gwledig y Gweinidog oherwydd fe'u rhestrir ar ffurf 18 pwynt bwled. Gwyddom felly sut i fframio'n cwestiynau iddo, pan ddaw gerbron y Cynulliad hwn i gael ei alw i gyfrif a phan ymddengys ger bron y Pwyllgor i gael ei archwilio. Mae'r materion hynny i gyd yn glir.

Wedyn deugn at y teitl crand 'Cymru dramor' sy'n rhoi cyfrifoldeb trawsbynciol iddo dros hyrwyddo Cymru dramor. Beth mae hynny'n ei olygu? A ydyw'n golygu ei fod bellach yn gyfrifol am ddenu diwydiant neu dwristiaid i Gymru? Wrth gwrs nad ydyw, oherwydd cyfrifoldebau'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd yw'r rheini; mae hynny'n glir o'r ddogfen hon. Mae'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd yn gyfrifol am ddenu buddsoddiad i Gymru, hyrwyddo allforion o Gymru a thwristiaeth yng Nghymru ac i Gymru, gan gynnwys hyrwyddo Cymru fel cyrchfan i dwristiaid. Felly, beth mae cyfrifoldeb dros hyrwyddo Cymru dramor yn ei olygu? Os nad yw'n cynnwys yr economi, twristiaeth na diwylliant—ac nid yw'n gyfrifol am y rheini—beth mae'n ei gynnwys?

Dywed y ddogfen hefyd ei fod yn gyfrifol am gysylltiadau gyda sefydliadau'r Undeb Ewropeaidd, sy'n ddiddorol yng ngolau'r llythyr a anfonwyd atoch chi, Lywydd. Nid

Presiding Officer. He is not responsible for education in relation to the EU because that is the responsibility of Jane Davidson. He is not responsible for economic development in relation to the EU, because that is the responsibility of Andrew Davies. He is not responsible for health in that regard either, because that is the responsibility of Jane Hutt. What is he responsible for? It seems that he can have all the trips at his disposal and not have to answer to anyone—[*Interruption.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order. This is a serious matter because it relates to our proceedings and to the tabling of questions.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: The Minister cannot be asked questions on his responsibility for Wales abroad, and he does not appear before a Committee for Wales abroad. He can spend money on behalf of Wales, but he is not answerable for all the money that he spends. It is not good enough for the Assembly to be told by the press, or anyone else, what his responsibilities include when there is no accountability to this Assembly for any of those responsibilities. Is it not now the First Minister's responsibility to make a full statement to the Assembly on the responsibilities and accountability of the Deputy First Minister so that we know what his new job is?

Nick Bourne: As you rightly say, Presiding Officer, this is an important issue. It is right that Members should have clear guidance on what questions we can table to which Minister and on which Minister is responsible for which portfolio. What we have here is the usual horlicks that arises when Rhodri and Mike get together to sort out the spoils. We all know what happens. Mike German comes along with his career path on the back of an envelope and Rhodri agrees it. Consequently no-one knows who is responsible for what.

Today, we received a list of the Deputy First Minister's responsibilities. We are told that he has cross-cutting responsibility—whatever that means—for the promotion of Wales abroad; in other words, in all countries except the United Kingdom. Does that mean—as it should in my opinion—that we can ask him questions on that? Does it mean that he will

yw'n gyfrifol am addysg mewn perthynas â'r UE oherwydd cyfrifoldeb Jane Davidson yw hynny. Nid yw'n gyfrifol am ddatblygu economaidd mewn perthynas â'r UE, oherwydd cyfrifoldeb Andrew Davies yw hynny. Nid yw'n gyfrifol am iechyd yn hynny o beth ychwaith, gan mai cyfrifoldeb Jane Hutt yw hynny. Am beth y mae'n gyfrifol? Mae'n ymddangos y gall gael pob trip a ddymuna, heb orfod ateb i neb—[*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae hwn yn fater difrifol oherwydd mae'n ymwneud â'n gweithdrefnau ac â chyflwyno cwestiynau.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Ni ellir holi'r Gweinidog am ei gyfrifoldeb dros Gymru dramor, ac nid yw'n ymddangos gerbron Pwyllgor dros Gymru dramor. Gall wario arian ar ran Cymru, ond nid yw'n atebol am yr holl arian a waria. Nid yw'n ddigon da i'r Cynulliad gael gwybod gan y wasg, na neb arall, beth mae ei gyfrifoldebau'n ei gynnwys pan nad oes atebolrwydd i'r Cynulliad hwn am unrhyw un o'r cyfrifoldebau hynny. Onid cyfrifoldeb y Prif Weinidog yn awr yw gwneud datganiad llawn i'r Cynulliad ar gyfrifoldebau ac atebolrwydd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog fel y cawn wybod beth yw ei swydd newydd?

Nick Bourne: Fel y dywedwch yn gywir, Lywydd, mae hwn yn fater pwysig. Mae'n iawn y dylai Aelodau gael canllawiau clir ynghylch pa gwestiynau y cawn eu cyflwyno i ba Weinidog ac ynghylch pa Weinidog sy'n gyfrifol am ba bortffolio. Yr hyn sydd gennym yma yw'r cawllach arferol sy'n codi pan ddaw Rhodri a Mike at ei gilydd i rannu'r ysbail. Gwyddom i gyd beth sy'n digwydd. Daw Mike German draw gyda'i lwybr gyrfaol ar gefn amlen a bydd Rhodri'n cytuno. O ganlyniad ni wŷr neb pwy sy'n gyfrifol am beth.

Heddiw, cawsom restr o gyfrifoldebau'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog. Dywedir wrthym fod ganddo gyfrifoldeb trawsbynciol—beth bynnag yw ystyr hynny—dros hyrwyddo Cymru dramor; mewn geiriau eraill, ym mhob gwlad ond y Deyrnas Unedig. A ydyw hynny'n golygu—fel y dylai, yn fy marn i—y cawn ei holi ar hynny? A ydyw'n golygu y

be shadowed in this responsibility? How can he be responsible for an issue and not accountable for it?

He is also responsible—and again many of us are unhappy about this—for the international image and profile of Wales. Therefore, surely it must follow—and this was previously confirmed by the Minister responsible for Assembly business—that we can ask him questions on his expanded portfolio? We are told that he is also responsible for relations with other national and sub-national Governments generally, and with the institutions of the EU. Therefore, we should be able to ask him questions on that, and the Committee should shadow his responsibilities. If there is any point to the document that was circulated today setting out ministerial portfolios and responsibilities, it must be to give Members an indication of what questions they can ask of which Ministers.

Llywydd, it is not clear to me whether the spectacle of the Deputy First Minister answering questions on his expanded portfolio will take place on 18 July, or whether we are saying that this is a meaningless bauble given to him by the First Minister to keep him on board in this coalition. If that is the case, let the First Minister say so; at least then we know where we stand. The document does not mention his role in terms of the euro and EU enlargement. Has that now been forgotten? Is he no longer responsible for that? Can we have a clear indication from the First Minister what the Deputy First Minister's responsibilities include, because they are the ones for which he must be answerable to us in writing and orally and which the Committee must be able to shadow?

Ron Davies: I am grateful to you, Llywydd, for facilitating this discussion, because you readily agreed to respond to the matters that were raised and you have given them careful consideration. The Government has now circulated this document to Members. I have not yet had the opportunity to scrutinise it, therefore I do not have the advantage that Nick or Ieuan had. I hope that you accept that further written representations may have to be made to you on this matter.

caiff ei gysgodi yn y cyfrifoldeb hwn? Sut y gall fod yn gyfrifol am fater ac nid yn atebol amdano?

Mae'n gyfrifol hefyd—ac eto mae llawer ohonom yn anhapus ynglŷn â hyn—am ddelwedd a phroffil rhyngwladol Cymru. Felly, mae'n dilyn, mae'n rhaid—a chadarnhawyd hyn yn flaenorol gan y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am fusnes y Cynulliad—y cawn ei holi ar ei bortffolio ehangedig? Dywedir wrthym ei fod yn gyfrifol hefyd am gysylltiadau â Llywodraethau cenedlaethol ac is-genedlaethol eraill yn gyffredinol, ac â sefydliadau'r UE. Felly, dylem allu ei holi ar hynny, a dylai'r Pwyllgor gysgodi ei gyfrifoldebau. Os oes unrhyw bwynt i'r ddogfen a gylchredwyd heddiw yn amlinellu portffolios a chyfrifoldebau gweinidogion, rhaid mai'r pwynt yw rhoi syniad i Aelodau pa gwestiynau y gallant eu gofyn i ba Weinidogion.

Lywydd, nid yw'n glir i mi a welir y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn ateb cwestiynau ar ei bortffolio ehangedig ar 18 Gorffennaf, ynteu ai dweud yr ydym mai tegan diystyr yw hwn a roddir iddo gan y Prif Weinidog i'w gadw ar fwrdd y glymblaid hon. Os mai felly y mae, dywedded y Prif Weinidog hynny; o leiaf wedyn cawn wybod lle'r ydym yn sefyll. Nid yw'r ddogfen yn sôn am ei rôl yn nhermau'r ewro ac ehangu'r UE. A anghofwyd am hynny bellach? Onid yw'n gyfrifol mwyach am hynny? A gawn ni arwydd clir gan y Prif Weinidog ynghylch cyfrifoldebau'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog, oherwydd dyma'r rhai y bydd yn rhaid iddo fod yn atebol i ni ar bapur ac ar lafar ac y bydd yn rhaid i'r Pwyllgor allu eu cysgodi?

Ron Davies: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i chi, Lywydd, am ganiatáu'r drafodaeth hon, oherwydd cytunasoch yn syth i ymateb i'r materion a godwyd ac yr ydych wedi rhoi ystyriaeth ofalus iddynt. Mae'r Llywodraeth bellach wedi anfon y ddogfen hon at yr Aelodau. Nid wyf wedi cael cyfle i graffu'n fanwl arni eto, felly nid oes gennyf y fantais a oedd gan Nick na Ieuan. Gobeithiaf y derbyniwch efallai y bydd raid cyflwyno sylwadau ysgrifenedig pellach ichi ar y mater

hwn.

We must consider three essential principles. First, the Deputy First Minister's additional responsibilities are important. Dare I suggest that he would not have wanted them had they not been important? However, they are related to the image of Wales, the euro and the rest of the world.

3:40 p.m.

Secondly, one of the founding principles of the Assembly was that of accountability. We would not be here unless we wanted accountability. What is the point of having an Assembly if a Minister cannot be held to account? Thirdly, we have a mechanism of questions and a committee structure to ensure that when Ministers are given clearly identified responsibilities, they are held to account. Do you agree, Llywydd, that it would be a complete travesty of our proceedings if a Minister with important functions were excused the inconvenience of being held to account for his decisions? That is at the heart of this issue. We owe a debt to you for your actions on this so far, but I hope that you will acknowledge your responsibility in ensuring that the fundamental principle enshrined in the Act and in Standing Orders is fulfilled, and that the Ministers who discharge functions in this place on behalf of the Government of Wales are held to account.

The Presiding Officer: I am grateful for your comments and the other points that were raised. My sole concern—and there can be no other for any Presiding Officer—is with our founding legislation, our constitution in the Government of Wales Act 1998 and our consequent Standing Orders. Those Standing Orders, as I indicated in my initial statement, may be amended. The Business Committee may well recommend an amendment in this case. However, as it stands, Standing Order No. 2.4 on the Assembly Cabinet states clearly:

‘As soon as possible after being elected the First Minister shall appoint Ministers and allocate responsibilities and accountability to them. The First Minister shall notify the Assembly of the membership of the Assembly Cabinet and of each member’s

Rhaid inni ystyried tair egwyddor hanfodol. Yn gyntaf, mae cyfrifoldebau ychwanegol y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn rhai pwysig. A fentraf ddweud na fyddai wedi eu deisyfu pe na baent yn bwysig? Fodd bynnag, y maent yn gysylltiedig â delwedd Cymru, yr ewro a gweddill y byd.

Yn ail, atebolrwydd oedd un o egwyddorion sylfaenol y Cynulliad. Ni fyddem yma oni bai fod arnom eisiau atebolrwydd. Beth yw'r pwynt cael Cynulliad os na ellir dal Gweinidog i gyfrif? Yn drydydd, mae gennym beirianwaith holi a strwythur pwyllgorau i sicrhau y caiff Gweinidogion a gafodd gyfrifoldebau wedi'u diffinio'n glir eu dal i gyfrif. A gytunwch, Lywydd, y byddai'n gwbl groes i'n holl weithdrefnau pe câi Gweinidog â swyddogaethau pwysig ei esgusodi rhag yr anghyfleustra o gael ei ddal i gyfrif am ei benderfyniadau? Dyna sydd wrth galon y mater. Mae arnom ddyled ichi am y modd y bu ichi weithredu ar hyn hyd yma, ond gobeithiaf y cydnabyddwch eich cyfrifoldeb i sicrhau y cyflawnir yr egwyddor sylfaenol a geir yn y Ddeddf ac yn y Rheolau Sefydlog, ac y caiff y Gweinidogion sy'n cyflawni swyddogaethau yn y lle hwn ar ran Llywodraeth Cymru eu dal i gyfrif.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich sylwadau a'r pwyntiau eraill a godwyd. Mae fy unig bryder—a dyma unig bryder unrhyw Lywydd—yn ymwneud â'n deddfwriaeth sylfaenu, ein cyfansoddiad yn Neddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 a'n Rheolau Sefydlog yn sgîl hynny. Gellir diwygio'r Rheolau Sefydlog hynny, fel y dywedais yn fy natganiad cyntaf. Yn wir, gallai'r Pwyllgor Busnes argymhell gwelliant yn yr achos hwn. Fodd bynnag, fel y saif, dywed Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 2.4 ar Gabinet y Cynulliad yn glir:

‘Cyn gynted ag y bo modd ar ôl ei ethol bydd y Prif Weinidog yn penodi Gweinidogion ac yn clustnodi cyfrifoldebau ac atebolrwydd ar eu cyfer. Bydd y Prif Weinidog yn hysbysu'r Cynulliad ynglŷn ag aelodaeth Cabinet y Cynulliad a chyfrifoldebau ac atebolrwydd

responsibilities and accountability, and shall also notify the Assembly of any changes as soon as possible after they have been made.'

That Standing Order governs our present context. Similarly, Standing Order No. 6.3 states that Ministers answer questions 'in relation to that field'—that is, the field of their accountability. Therefore, I cannot allow questions on responsibility. They must be related to the field of accountability. Any other questions will not be in order, until the Standing Orders are changed. That is the current nature of our scrutiny.

Last week, I requested the Business Committee look for consistency in these matters. If, in the past, I allowed questions on responsibility, I was wrong to do so. I should have interpreted Standing Order No. 6.3 clearly in that questions should relate only to those matters where there is a field of accountability, which is what I have asked the Business Committee to consider.

Nick Bourne: To summarise, despite the Deputy First Minister's job title and the fact that he is responsible for certain matters, he is not accountable to the Assembly or to a Committee for the matter of Wales abroad. Therefore, to whom is he accountable? Or is he accountable to no-one, as many of us are beginning to suspect?

The Presiding Officer: Order. Only one of the points that you raised is for me. I am still considering how these matters apply to the Committee. Accountability under Standing Order No. 6.3(iv) relates to answering oral questions. I will have to discuss this further with the Chair of the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee—this evening if he is available—so that we can try to establish what issues may or may not arise in relation to this matter in that Committee.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I wish to clarify your response. The First Minister stated today that the Deputy First Minister would undertake a visit in the next fortnight on behalf of the Assembly in relation to his responsibility for Wales abroad. The First Minister told us that the Deputy First Minister was representing

pob aelod, a bydd hefyd yn hysbysu'r Cynulliad ynglŷn ag unrhyw newidiadau cyn gynted ag y bo modd ar ôl eu gwneud.'

Mae'r Rheol Sefydlog honno'n rheoli ein cyd-destun presennol. Yn yr un modd, dywed Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.3 fod Gweinidogion yn ateb cwestiynau 'sy'n ymwneud â'r maes hwnnw'—hynny yw, maes eu hatebolrwydd. Felly, ni allaf ganiatáu cwestiynau ynghylch cyfrifoldeb. Rhaid iddynt ymwneud â'r maes atebolrwydd. Bydd unrhyw gwestiynau eraill allan o drefn, hyd nes newidir y Rheolau Sefydlog. Dyna natur gyfredol ein craffu.

Yr wythnos diwethaf, gofynnais i'r Pwyllgor Busnes edrych am gysondeb yn y materion hyn. Os, yn y gorffennol, y bu imi ganiatáu cwestiynau ar gyfrifoldebau, nid oeddwn yn iawn i wneud hynny. Dylaswn fod wedi dehongli Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.3 yn glir sef na ddylai cwestiynau ond ymwneud â'r materion hynny lle mae maes atebolrwydd, a dyna'r hyn yr wyf wedi gofyn i'r Pwyllgor Busnes ei ystyried.

Nick Bourne: I grynhoi, er gwaethaf teitl swydd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r ffaith ei fod yn gyfrifol am rai materion, nid yw'n atebol i'r Cynulliad nac i Bwyllgor am fater Cymru dramor. Felly, i bwy y mae'n atebol? Neu a ydyw'n atebol i neb, fel y mae llawer ohonom yn dechrau amau?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Dim ond un o'r pwyntiau a godasoch sydd yn berthnasol i mi. Yr wyf yn dal i ystyried sut y mae'r materion hyn yn berthnasol i'r Pwyllgor. Mae atebolrwydd dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.3(iv) yn ymwneud ag ateb cwestiynau llafar. Bydd yn rhaid imi drafod hyn ymhellach gyda Chadeirydd y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig—heno os ydyw ar gael—fel y gallwn geisio sefydlu pa faterion a all neu na all godi mewn perthynas â'r mater hwn yn y Pwyllgor hwnnw.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Hoffwn eglurhad o'ch ymateb. Dywedodd y Prif Weinidog heddiw y byddai'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn ymgymryd ag ymweliad yn y pythefnos nesaf ar ran y Cynulliad mewn perthynas â'i gyfrifoldeb dros Gymru dramor. Dywedodd y Prif Weinidog wrthym fod y Dirprwy Brif

the Assembly Government. This is a serious issue because if, as a result of your ruling today, that visit is undertaken in relation to his responsibility and not his field of accountability, we will not be allowed to question either him or anyone else about the visit even though he is representing us abroad. That shatters the principle on which the democratic function of the Assembly was founded.

The Minister for Open Government (Carwyn Jones): Further to that, I can assist the leader of the opposition. The Deputy First Minister will visit New York at the end of this week. The visit was organised some time ago, and is undertaken in his capacity as Minister for Rural Development. The Welsh Development Agency arranged this visit at the request of those who export food to North America because they wanted a Minister there to support them in their endeavours. I am sure that Members would support that. The Deputy First Minister will therefore be accountable and will report back to the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee. I am happy to clarify the situation for Members' benefit.

David Davies: If we are saying that a Minister is allowed to undertake a visits on the Assembly's behalf when he is responsible, but not accountable, for certain matters, then that undermines the purpose of the Assembly, which was meant to be about transparency. We now have a Minister who is less accountable than John Redwood was in the old days before the Assembly was set up.

David Melding: I have tried to follow your judgment carefully, Presiding Officer, and until I read it, I fear that I do not have the analytical, philosophical skills to follow it. I am at a loss to understand how Ministers are accountable for anything other than their responsibilities.

Glyn Davies *rose*—

The Presiding Officer: Order. I will try to reply to David Melding's point first, then I will call on the Chair of the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee. These two terms, 'responsibility' and 'accountability',

Weinidog yn cynrychioli Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae hyn yn fater difrifol oherwydd os, yn sgîl eich dyfarniad heddiw, y gwneir yr ymweliad hwnnw mewn perthynas â'i gyfrifoldeb ac nid â'i faes atebolrwydd, ni chaniateir inni ei holi ef na neb arall am yr ymweliad er ei fod yn ein cynrychioli ni dramor. Mae hynny'n chwâlur egwyddor y sylfaenydd swyddogaeth ddemocrataidd y Cynulliad arni.

Y Gweinidog dros Lywodraeth Agored (Carwyn Jones): Ymhellach i hynny, gallaf gynorthwyo arweinydd yr wrthblaid. Bydd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn ymweld ag Efrog Newydd ddiwedd yr wythnos hon. Trefnwyd yr ymweliad beth amser yn ôl, ac fe'i gwneir yn rhinwedd ei swydd fel Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig. Trefnodd Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru yr ymweliad hwn ar gais y rheini sy'n allforio bwyd i Ogledd America am fod arnynt eisiau Gweinidog yno i'w cefnogi yn eu hymdrechion. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'r Aelodau'n cefnogi hynny. Felly bydd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn atebol a bydd yn adrodd yn ôl i'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig. Yr wyf yn hapus i egluro'r sefyllfa er mwyn yr Aelodau.

David Davies: Os ydym yn dweud y caniateir i Weinidog wneud ymweliadau ar ran y Cynulliad pan yw'n gyfrifol, ond nid yn atebol, am rai materion, yna mae hynny'n tanseilio pwrpas y Cynulliad, a oedd i fod i ymwneud â thryloywder. Yn awr mae gennym Weinidog sydd yn llai atebol nag yr oedd John Redwood yn yr hen ddyddiau cyn sefydlu'r Cynulliad.

David Melding: Yr wyf wedi ceisio dilyn eich dyfarniad yn ofalus, Lywydd, a hyd nes byddaf wedi'i ddarllen, ofnaf nad oes gennyf y medrau dadansoddol, athronyddol i'w ddilyn. Ni allaf yn fy myw ddeall sut y mae Gweinidogion yn atebol am ddim heblaw eu cyfrifoldebau.

Glyn Davies *a gododd*—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Ceisiaf ateb pwynt David Melding yn gyntaf, wedyn galwaf ar Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig. Mae'r ddau derm hyn, 'cyfrifoldeb' ac 'atebolrwydd', yn deillio o'n

derive from our Standing Orders. Both are used in the two Standing Orders that I have quoted. The term that is of particular relevance to ministerial responsibilities—if I may use that term widely—is ‘accountability’. That has been set out clearly in section 56(3) of the Government of Wales Act 1998. That is what defines the accountability of Ministers to the Assembly: the fields that they have been allocated. I am advised that those two terms are technical ones in relation to our Standing Orders. Indeed, ‘accountability’, as Ron Davies—who first raised this matter—knows, arises from that section of the Act, which I seek to interpret as closely as I can.

Glyn Davies: I am looking forward to discussing this matter with you this evening, as it poses difficulties for me as Chair of the Committee. Do you not have the authority to ask the First Minister to explain what he thought he was doing when he got us into this shambles in the first place?

The Presiding Officer: Order. The First Minister and the Cabinet have produced a document. I have merely indicated in the politest way possible that this study could be taken a little further in relation to our Standing Orders.

Nick Bourne: This is an important issue because we need to table questions for the Deputy First Minister this Thursday. Are you confirming that we can only table questions to him on rural development and not on the other vital issues that are a part of his portfolio?

The Presiding Officer: The questions will be accepted or rejected by the Table Office in the way that I have indicated this afternoon, according to the field of accountability. I have no alternative other than to do that.

Rheolau Sefydlog. Defnyddir y ddau yn y ddwy Reol Sefydlog a ddyfynnwyd gennyf. Y term sy'n arbennig o berthnasol i gyfrifoldebau gweinidogion—os caf ddefnyddio'r term hwnnw yn gyffredinol—yw 'atebolrwydd'. Mae hynny wedi'i amlinellu'n glir yn adran 56(3) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Dyna sy'n diffinio atebolrwydd Gweinidogion i'r Cynulliad: y meysydd a glustnodwyd iddynt. Fe'm cynghorir mai termau technegol yw'r ddau derm hynny mewn perthynas â'n Rheolau Sefydlog. Yn wir, mae 'atebolrwydd', fel y gŵyr Ron Davies—a gododd y mater hwn gyntaf—yn codi o'r adran honno yn y Ddeddf, y ceisiaf ei dehongli mor glòs ag y gallaf.

Glyn Davies: Yr wyf yn edrych ymlaen at drafod y mater hwn gyda chi heno, gan ei fod yn peri anawsterau i mi fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor. Onid oes gennych yr awdurdod i ofyn i'r Prif Weinidog egluro beth yr oedd yn meddwl yr oedd yn ei wneud pan roddodd ni yn y cawlach hwn yn y lle cyntaf?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae'r Prif Weinidog a'r Cabinet wedi llunio dogfen. Dim ond nodi a wneuthum i yn y modd mwyaf cwrtais posibl y gellid mynd â'r astudiaeth hon ychydig ymhellach mewn perthynas â'n Rheolau Sefydlog.

Nick Bourne: Mae hwn yn fater pwysig oherwydd mae angen inni gyflwyno cwestiynau i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ddydd Iau. A ydych yn cadarnhau na allwn ond cyflwyno cwestiynau iddo ar ddatblygu gwledig ac nid ar y materion allweddol eraill sy'n rhan o'i bortffolio?

Y Llywydd: Caiff y cwestiynau eu derbyn neu eu gwrthod gan y Swyddfa Gyflwyno yn y modd a nodais y prynhawn yma, yn ôl y maes atebolrwydd. Nid oes gennyf ddewis ond gwneud hynny.

Cymeradwyo Cyfarwyddiadau Gwasanaethau Cymorth Ieuenctid (Cymru) 2002 Approval of the Youth Support Services Directions (Wales) 2002

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly considers the y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried

principle of the Youth Support Services Directions (Wales) 2002, which was laid in Table Office on 13 June 2002. (NDM1097)

I propose that

the National Assembly, acting under Standing Order No. 27.2 (iii), considers the Youth Support Services Directions (Wales) 2002, which was laid in Table Office on 13 June 2002. (NDM1098)

3:50 p.m.

I am grateful for this opportunity to talk about the Youth Support Services Directions (Wales) 2002, which is good news for the young people of Wales. Colleagues will remember that we discussed the initial 'Extending Entitlement' report in Plenary in November 2000. This made-in-Wales initiative was the first Assembly policy to receive universal cross-party support. This legislation represents a significant step forward. For the first time in Wales it provides a statutory basis for youth support services. Each local authority in Wales will now be legally required to provide youth support services, secure the provision of youth support services, or participate in the provision of youth support services, but, best of all, this is only happening in Wales. We are once again leading the way in how our services for young people are being developed. I say 'once again' because we have already been recognised within the European Commission as being progressive in the way in which our policies for young people are being taken forward. We have been included in the European White Paper on youth as an example of good practice. Other countries are only starting to think about initiatives that we are taking forward in Wales. We are therefore delivering on our promise of ensuring that all 11 to 25-year-olds in Wales, regardless of their circumstances, receive their basic universal entitlement to the opportunities, services and support that they need to lead full and productive lives.

egwyddor y Cyfarwyddiadau Gwasanaethau Cymorth Ieuencid (Cymru) 2002 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Mehefin 2002. (NDM1097)

Cynigiau fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 27.2 (iii), yn ystyried Cyfarwyddiadau Gwasanaethau Cymorth Ieuencid (Cymru) 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Mehefin 2002. (NDM1098)

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle hwn i siarad am y Cyfarwyddiadau Gwasanaethau Cymorth Ieuencid (Cymru) 2002, sy'n newyddion da i bobl ifanc Cymru. Bydd yr Aelodau'n cofio inni drafod yr adroddiad cyntaf, 'Ymestyn Hawliau', yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ym mis Tachwedd 2000. Y fenter hon, a wnaethpwyd yng Nghymru, oedd y polisi cyntaf gan y Cynulliad i gael cefnogaeth yr holl bleidiau. Mae'r ddeddfwriaeth hon yn cynrychioli cam arwyddocaol ymlaen. Am y tro cyntaf yng Nghymru mae'n darparu sail statudol i wasanaethau cymorth ieuencid. Bydd yn gyfreithiol ofynnol bellach i bob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru ddarparu gwasanaethau cymorth ieuencid, sicrhau darpariaeth gwasanaethau cymorth ieuencid neu gyfranogi yn narpariaeth gwasanaethau cymorth ieuencid, ond, yn well na dim, dim ond yng Nghymru y mae hyn yn digwydd. Yr ydym unwaith eto'n arwain y ffordd yn y modd y datblygwn ein gwasanaethau i bobl ifanc. Dywedaf 'unwaith eto' oherwydd yr ydym eisoes wedi'n cydnabod o fewn y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd am ein blaengarwch yn y modd y datblygir ein polisiâu ar gyfer pobl ifanc. Fe'n cynhwyswyd yn y Papur Gwyn Ewropeaidd ar ieuencid fel esiampl o arfer da. Dim ond dechrau meddwl y mae gwledydd eraill am fentrau yr ydym ni'n camu ymlaen â hwy yng Nghymru. Yr ydym felly yn cadw ein haddewid i sicrhau bod pawb rhwng 11 a 25 mlwydd oed yng Nghymru, beth bynnag fo'u hamgylchiadau, yn cael eu hawl cyffredinol sylfaenol i'r cyfleoedd, y gwasanaethau a'r cymorth sydd arnynt ei angen i fyw bywydau llawn a chynhyrchiol.

What will this mean in practice? It will mean better opportunities for achievement in all its forms. There will be tailored personal support and advice at a time and a place that is convenient and accessible to the young person, with clear ground rules on confidentiality. There will be more opportunities to provide social and recreational opportunities in a safe and accessible environment. In addition, young people will have a greater say in the decisions being made about the design of services and the support provided for them. I am sure that you will agree that this ethos and the many other principles being promoted through 'Extending Entitlement: Supporting Young People in Wales' are worth struggling for. These directions, and the accompanying guidance, have been developed collaboratively by a number of organisations, interested individuals, as well as young people themselves across Wales. This evolutionary process has taken time, but with the positive result that everyone feels that they have ownership of the extending entitlement policy and its principles. Having attended conferences and spoken to many organisations and young people, I can also say that there is a widespread commitment to deliver and make it a success. Your support throughout this process is also gratefully acknowledged.

Helen Mary Jones: Mae Plaid Cymru yn falch o gefnogi'r cynnig hwn, ac yn croesawu'r cyfarwyddiadau. Mae rhoi'r gwasanaeth ieuencid ar sylfaen statudol unwaith eto yng Nghymru yn gam positif, a chroesawaf y ffaith ein bod ar flaen y gad. Mae llawer o bobl, yn enwedig y rhai na chawsant brofiadau positif yn yr ysgol, y coleg neu mewn sefydliadau ffurfiol, neu'r rhai nad ydynt yn mynychu sefydliadau ffurfiol, yn dibynnu ar y gwasanaethau ieuencid, yn eu cyd-destun ehangaf, am addysg anffurfiol yn ogystal â gweithgareddau hamdden a chyngor. Mae gwasanaethau ieuencid yn hanfodol iddynt, a rhaid inni dderbyn bod gwasanaethau ieuencid wedi bod o dan bwysau, yn enwedig pwysau ariannol, ers amser.

Mae dwy elfen hollbwysig i weithredu'r cyfarwyddiadau. Y gyntaf yw adnoddau, sef arian. Chwe wythnos yn ôl, trafododd y

Beth fydd hyn yn ei olygu yn ymarferol? Bydd yn golygu cyfleoedd gwell i gyflawni ymhob ffurf. Bydd cymorth a chyngor wedi'i deilwra'n bersonol ar adeg ac mewn lle sy'n gyfleus ac yn hawdd ei gyrraedd i'r person ifanc, gyda rheolau sylfaenol eglur ynghylch cyfrinachedd. Bydd mwy o gyfleoedd i ddarparu cyfleoedd cymdeithasol ac adloniadol mewn amgylchedd diogel a hygyrch. Yn ogystal, caiff pobl ifanc fwy o lais yn y penderfyniadau a wneir am gynllun gwasanaethau a'r cymorth a ddarperir ar eu cyfer. Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch fod yr ethos hwn a'r llu o egwyddorion eraill a hyrwyddir drwy 'Ymestyn Hawliau: Cefnogi Pobl Ifanc yng Nghymru' yn werth ymgyrraedd tuag atynt. Datblygwyd y cyfarwyddiadau hyn, a'r canllawiau sy'n cydfynd â hwy, ar y cyd gan nifer o gyrff, unigolion â diddordeb, yn ogystal â phobl ifanc eu hunain ledled Cymru. Mae'r broses esblygol hon wedi cymryd amser, ond y canlyniad cadarnhaol yw bod pawb yn teimlo bod ganddynt berchenogaeth ar y polisi ymestyn hawliau a'i egwyddorion. Wedi mynychu cynadleddau a siarad gyda llawer o sefydliadau a phobl ifanc, gallaf ddweud hefyd bod ymrwymiad cyffredinol i gyflawni a sicrhau llwyddiant. Cydnabyddir yn ddiolchgar eich cefnogaeth chithau drwy gydol y broses hon.

Helen Mary Jones: Plaid Cymru is pleased to support this motion, and welcomes the directions. Giving the youth service a statutory foundation once again in Wales is a positive step, and I welcome the fact that we are leading the way. Many people, particularly those who did not have positive experiences in school, college, or in formal establishments, or those who do not attend formal establishments, depend on youth services, in their broadest context, for informal education, as well as leisure activities and advice. Youth services are essential to them, and we must accept that youth services have been under pressure, particularly financial pressure, for a long time.

There are two important elements to implementing the directions. The first is resources, namely money. Six weeks ago, the

Cynulliad adroddiad Estyn, a dynnodd sylw at gyflwr gwael presennol llawer o ganolfannau ieuenctid a'r problemau ariannol sydd yn eu hwynebu. Galwaf ar y Gweinidog heddiw i sicrhau bod gan gynghorau sir ddigon o adnoddau ychwanegol i ddarparu gwasanaethau ieuenctid o'r safon uchaf, heb orfod ystyried tynnu adnoddau oddi wrth wasanaethau sylfaenol eraill, megis ysgolion.

Yr ail elfen yw'r canllawiau, a chyfeiriodd y Gweinidog atynt eisoes. Mae'r canllawiau yn gosod y fframwaith cenedlaethol am weithgareddau lleol, a rhaid iddynt fod yn ddigon hyblyg i sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol yn gallu ymateb i anghenion lleol. Fodd bynnag, mae hefyd yn bwysig eu bod yn gosod sylfaen genedlaethol.

Anogaf y Gweinidog heddiw—os nad yw hynny wedi digwydd yn barod—i fynnu yn y canllawiau fod llywodraeth leol yn cydweithio gyda'r sector gwirfoddol wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau ieuenctid. Mae'r sector gwirfoddol yn hynod o bwysig ar hyn o bryd, ond mae'r patrwm o gydweithio ac ariannu yn amrywio o sir i sir. Byddem yn croesawu gweld y canllawiau yn rhoi'r sylfaen orau ac yn hybu ymarfer gorau yn y maes hwn. Mawr obeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn cytuno i hynny, a gobeithiaf y bydd cyfle rywbryd yn y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i drafod y canllawiau ac i weld sut y maent yn cael eu gweithredu a'u monitro. Maent yn hollbwysig. Croesawaf y cyfarwyddiadau, a chefnogaf y cynnig.

Christine Chapman: I broadly welcome these directions. What assurances can the Minister give that they fulfil the intention of 'Extending Entitlement: Supporting Young People in Wales' to place a statutory requirement on all local authorities in Wales to secure a youth service as described in the curriculum statement for youth work in Wales? This is a cause of concern, because, historically, youth service provision in Wales has been rather patchy.

David Melding: I am pleased that we are back in the concrete world of an accountability that has been delegated by the First Minister to the appropriate Cabinet Minister. This real world seems a little easier

Assembly discussed the Estyn report, which drew attention to the present poor state of many youth centres and the financial problems that they face. I call on the Minister today to ensure that county councils have enough additional resources to provide youth services of the highest standard, without having to consider taking resources from other fundamental services, such as schools.

The second element is the guidance, to which the Minister referred earlier. The guidance sets out the national framework for local activities, and it must be sufficiently flexible to ensure that local authorities can respond to local needs. However, it is also important that it sets a national foundation.

I urge the Minister today—if that has not already happened—to insist in the guidance that local government works with the voluntary sector to provide youth services. The voluntary sector is vital at present, but the pattern of co-operation and funding varies from county to county. We would welcome seeing the guidance giving the best foundation and promoting best practice in this area. I hope that the Minister will agree to that, and I hope that there will be an opportunity sometime in the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee to discuss the guidance and to see how it is being implemented and monitored. It is essential. I welcome these directions, and I support the motion.

Christine Chapman: Croesawaf y cyfarwyddiadau hyn yn gyffredinol. Pa sicrwydd y gall y Gweinidog ei roi eu bod yn cyflawni bwriad 'Ymestyn Hawliau: Cefnogi Pobl Ifanc yng Nghymru' i osod gofyniad statudol ar bob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru i sicrhau gwasanaeth ieuenctid fel a ddisgrifir yn y datganiad cwricwlwm ar gyfer gwaith ieuenctid yng Nghymru? Mae hyn yn achos pryder, oherwydd, yn hanesyddol, bu darpariaeth gwasanaeth ieuenctid yng Nghymru braidd yn dameidiog.

David Melding: Yr wyf yn falch ein bod yn ôl ym myd concret atebolrwydd sydd wedi'i ddirprwyo gan y Prif Weinidog i'r Gweinidog Cabinet priodol. Mae'r byd real hwn yn ymddangos ychydig yn haws byw

to live in. The Government has, broadly, pursued quite enlightened policies in this area. I am particularly pleased to note that local authorities must now engage with the voluntary sector and young people in the community to ensure that the services provided are appropriate. The youth forum in the Vale of Glamorgan is a model for how forums should operate. I commend to the Minister the survey that was conducted by the Vale of Glamorgan youth forum asking young people what sort of services they require, which was published by the Vale of Glamorgan Council. Such a joint endeavour is appropriate. I am sure that you would want to add your congratulations for that work. It is one thing to emphasise the importance of youth services—that is important—but we want youth services that young people will benefit from and that will meet the needs that they have today. It is difficult, as I approach my fortieth birthday, to remember those halcyon days of youth.

Eleanor Burnham: The Welsh Liberal Democrats support these directions, as we support youth services to aid the development of our young people. Extra youth support should give them a better opportunity of finding suitable employment after finishing their education and aid their development into well-rounded individuals. It should also help them to learn about health education and issues such as drug abuse. We need to give the next generation an opportunity to have a successful future. The provision of youth services generally will help in achieving this objective. The more support that we can afford our youth the better. It is vital to ensure that they feel valued members of a positive society. My previous work with disaffected 14 to 16-year-olds on a youth access programme in schools throughout north-east Wales, and as a magistrate, gave me invaluable insights into the hopelessness that many of these youngsters feel in their lives. Many come from caring families, but fall by the wayside for a variety of reasons, often complicated by learning difficulties and compounded by a loss of interest in formal and mainstream education. I commend some of the work that is being done in Wrexham and other parts of north Wales. We should do our best for our youth and our future.

ynddo. Mae'r Llywodraeth, yn gyffredinol, wedi dilyn polisiau eithaf goleuedig yn y maes hwn. Yr wyf yn arbennig o falch o nodi bod yn rhaid i awdurdodau lleol bellach ymwneud â'r sector gwirfoddol a phobl ifanc yn y gymuned i sicrhau bod y gwasanaethau a ddarperir yn briodol. Mae'r fforwm ieuentid ym Mro Morgannwg yn fodel o'r modd y dylai fforymau weithredu. Cymeradwyaf i'r Gweinidog yr arolwg a wnaed gan fforwm ieuentid Bro Morgannwg yn holi pobl ifanc pa fath o wasanaethau a hoffent, arolwg a gyhoeddwyd gan Gyngor Bro Morgannwg. Mae cyd-fenter o'r fath yn briodol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y dymunech ychwanegu'ch llongyfarchiadau am y gwaith hwnnw. Un peth yw pwysleisio pwysigrwydd gwasanaethau ieuentid—mae hynny'n bwysig—ond mae arnom eisiau gwasanaethau ieuentid y bydd pobl ifanc yn elwa ohonynt ac a fydd yn ateb yr anghenion sydd ganddynt heddiw. Mae'n anodd, wrth imi nesáu at fy 40 oed, cofio dyddiau hirfelyn tesog fy ieuentid.

Eleanor Burnham: Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n cefnogi'r cyfarwyddiadau hyn, oherwydd cefnogwn wasanaethau ieuentid i helpu datblygiad ein pobl ifanc. Dylai mwy o gymorth ieuentid roi cyfle gwell iddynt gael gwaith addas ar ôl gorffen eu haddysg a chynorthwyo eu datblygiad yn unigolion cytbwys. Dylai eu helpu hefyd i ddysgu am addysg iechyd a materion fel camddefnydd cyffuriau. Mae angen inni roi cyfle i'r genhedlaeth nesaf gael dyfodol llwyddiannus. Bydd darparu gwasanaethau ieuentid yn gyffredinol yn helpu cyflawni'r nod hwn. Gorau po fwyaf o gefnogaeth y gallwn ei rhoi i'n hieuentid. Mae'n hollbwysig sicrhau eu bod yn teimlo eu bod yn aelodau gwerthfawr o gymdeithas gadarnhaol. Rhoddodd fy ngwaith blaenorol gyda phobl ifanc ddadrithiedig 14 i 16 oed ar raglen mynediad ieuentid mewn ysgolion trwy ogledd-ddwyrain Cymru, ac fel ynad, gipolwg gwerthfawr imi ar yr anobaith a deimla llawer o'r bobl ifanc hyn yn eu bywydau. Daw llawer ohonynt o deuluoedd gofalgar, ond maent yn mynd ar gyfeiliorn am wahanol resymau, a hynny'n aml wedi'i gymhlethu gan anawsterau dysgu a'i waethygu gan ddiffyg diddordeb mewn addysg ffurfiol a phrif ffrwd. Cymeradwyaf beth o'r gwaith a wneir yn Wrecsam a

rhannau eraill o'r Gogledd. Dylem wneud ein gorau dros ein hieuenctid a'n dyfodol.

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): Thank you for your comments. Although today is a landmark occasion I am aware that this is the start of an ongoing process. The Assembly is taking an impressive step today, namely to make youth work statutory in Wales. We are unique, as the only part of the UK where this has happened. On your point, Christine, it will fulfil the intention of the extending entitlement agenda in providing all young people in Wales with the support and services that they need to access the basic universal entitlement, and requiring all local authorities in Wales to secure a statutory and/or voluntary youth service in their area. That relationship will be through the young people's partnerships.

Karen Sinclair: I welcome these directions—they are far superior to anything that we have had in the past. However, how much obligation is there on local authorities to ensure that all communities are covered in a way that is right for the young people who want to take up that service? As people who have worked with young people will know, unfortunately many young people can be quite tribal about where they go to receive a service. I would like an assurance that local authorities cannot say that they have provided a service and that young people can travel four miles down the road for that service when we know that those young people will never do that. Can you confirm that local authorities will not be able to say that they have fulfilled their obligation, and that it is up to the young people to take up the service, without considering its relevance for them, which is imperative if they are to take up a service?

4:00 p.m.

Jane Davidson: That goes to the heart of the matter, namely, young people's entitlement to services that meet their needs. For too long, all Members have felt—which is why we have universal support for these directions—that services have been targeted to meet the needs of providers rather than

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Diolch am eich sylwadau. Er bod heddiw'n achlysur o bwys yr wyf yn ymwybodol mai dechrau proses barhaus yw hyn. Mae'r Cynulliad yn cymryd cam pwysig heddiw, sef sicrhau bod gwaith ieuenctid yn statudol yng Nghymru. Yr ydym yn unigryw, fel yr unig ran o'r DU lle mae hyn wedi digwydd. Ar eich pwynt chi, Christine, bydd yn cyflawni bwriad yr agenda ymestyn hawliau gan ddarparu'r gefnogaeth a'r gwasanaethau sydd eu hangen ar holl bobl ifanc Cymru i gael mynediad at yr hawl gyffredinol sylfaenol, a mynnu bod pob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru'n sicrhau gwasanaeth ieuenctid statudol a/neu wirfoddol yn eu hardal. Sicrheir y berthynas honno drwy'r partneriaethau pobl ifanc.

Karen Sinclair: Croesawaf y cyfarwyddiadau hyn—maent yn llawer gwell nag unrhyw beth a fu gennym yn y gorffennol. Fodd bynnag, faint o reidrwydd sydd ar awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau bod pob cymuned wedi'i chynnwys mewn ffordd sy'n iawn i'r bobl ifanc sydd eisiau manteisio ar y gwasanaeth hwnnw? Fel y gŵyr pobl sydd wedi gweithio gyda phobl ifanc, yn anffodus gall pobl ifanc fod yn eithaf llwythol o ran ble yr ânt i gael gwasanaeth. Hoffwn sicrwydd na fydd modd i awdurdodau lleol ddweud eu bod wedi darparu gwasanaeth ac y caiff pobl ifanc deithio bedair milltir i lawr y ffordd am y gwasanaeth hwnnw, a ninnau'n gwybod na wnaiff y bobl ifanc dan sylw byth wneud hynny. A allwch gadarnhau na fydd awdurdodau lleol yn gallu dweud eu bod wedi cyflawni'u dyletswydd, ac mai mater i'r bobl ifanc yw manteisio ar y gwasanaeth, heb ystyried ei berthnasedd iddynt, sydd yn hanfodol os am iddynt fanteisio ar y gwasanaeth?

Jane Davidson: Aiff hynny at galon y mater, sef hawl pobl ifanc i gael gwasanaethau sy'n ateb eu hanghenion. Ers gormod o amser, mae'r Aelodau i gyd wedi teimlo—dyna pam y mae cefnogaeth unfrydol i'r cyfarwyddiadau hyn—fod gwasanaethau wedi'u targedu i ateb anghenion y darparwyr

users. Therefore, just as we have shifted the whole of the education agenda to focus on the needs of the learner, this is also a dramatic shift in emphasis.

Supporting guidance, a draft of which was distributed and discussed, has been issued to colleagues in the 22 young people's partnerships. This will be extended to all of our partners over the next few weeks so that everyone can play their part in making our shared aspirations a reality. The young people's forums across Wales will also play an important role. The Vale of Glamorgan youth forum is a good example. Jane Hutt showed me the work that that forum is doing, and it contributed to our examination of service delivery. I have also seen information from Powys, and a new youth council is now up and running in Rhondda Cynon Taff. We want every area of Wales to have ways for young people to access other young people's views. Part of the learning country agenda is to consider establishing school councils throughout Wales so that we build up opportunities at a local, regional and national level for young people's voices to be heard.

On Helen Mary's point about buildings, whenever I have spoken about the extending entitlement agenda, we have acknowledged that all organisations have pulled resources out of youth services over the years. We are now putting our political commitment into ensuring that informal learning opportunities are given a high priority alongside formal learning opportunities. That means ensuring that buildings are fit for purpose. We are investing more money to make this happen, and we also expect local authorities to use general capital funding to ensure that buildings become fit for purpose. One of the clear messages from young people is that this must be cross-cutting. It must be linked to health issues, access to better health advice in an informal and confidential environment, better access to information and communication technology and better careers advice. The extending entitlement agenda must improve young people's quality of life.

Brian Hancock: On greater opportunities for young people, how does this set of directions sit with the careers education regulations that

yn hytrach na'r defnyddwyr. Felly, yn union fel y symudasom yr agenda addysg gyfan i ganolbwyntio ar anghenion y dysgwyr, mae hwn hefyd yn symudiad pwyslais dramatig.

Mae canllawiau ategol, y dosbarthwyd drafft ohonynt ac y'u trafodwyd, wedi'u cyflwyno i gydweithwyr yn y 22 o bartneriaethau pobl ifanc. Estynnir hyn i'n partneriaid i gyd dros yr ychydig wythnosau nesaf fel y gall pawb chwarae eu rhan i wireddu'n cyd-ddyheadau. Bydd y fforymau pobl ifanc ledled Cymru'n chwarae rôl bwysig hefyd. Mae fforwm ieuenctid Bro Morgannwg yn enghraifft dda. Dangosodd Jane Hutt y gwaith y mae'r fforwm hwnnw'n ei wneud imi, ac fe gyfrannodd at ein harchwiliad o'r gwasanaeth a ddarperir. Gwelais wybodaeth o Bowys hefyd, ac mae cyngor ieuenctid newydd bellach ar waith yn Rhondda Cynon Taf. Mae arnom eisiau i bob ardal yng Nghymru gael ffyrdd i bobl ifanc gael mynediad at syniadau pobl ifanc eraill. Rhan o agenda'r wlad sy'n dysgu yw ystyried sefydlu cynghorau ysgol drwy Gymru gyfan fel y gallwn adeiladu cyfleoedd ar lefel leol, rhanbarthol a chenedlaethol i leisiau pobl ifanc gael eu clywed.

Ar bwynt Helen Mary ynglŷn ag adeiladau, pryd bynnag yr wyf wedi siarad am yr agenda ymestyn hawliau, yr ydym wedi cydnabod bod pob corff wedi tynnu adnoddau allan o wasanaethau ieuenctid dros y blynyddoedd. Yr ydym yn awr yn rhoi ein hymrwymiad gwleidyddol i sicrhau y caiff cyfleoedd dysgu anffurfiol flaenoriaeth uchel ochr yn ochr â chyfleoedd dysgu ffurfiol. Golyga hynny sicrhau bod adeiladau'n addas i'r pwrpas. Yr ydym yn buddsoddi mwy o arian i sicrhau hyn, a disgwyliwn i awdurdodau lleol ddefnyddio cyllid cyfalaf cyffredinol hefyd i sicrhau bod adeiladau'n addas i'w pwrpas. Un o'r negeseuon clir gan bobl ifanc yw fod yn rhaid i hyn fod yn drawsbynciol. Rhaid ei gysylltu â materion iechyd, mynediad at well cyngor iechyd mewn amgylchedd anffurfiol a chyfrinachol, gwell mynediad at dechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu a gwell cyngor gyrfaol. Rhaid i'r agenda ymestyn hawliau wella ansawdd bywyd pobl ifanc.

Brian Hancock: Ar gynyddu cyfleoedd i bobl ifanc, sut y mae'r set hon o gyfarwyddiadau'n cydorwedd â'r rheoliadau

you brought forward as a result of my debate under Standing Order No. 29?

Jane Davidson: All statutory regulations require bodies to deliver. The extending entitlement agenda is the overarching agenda to ensure better services for young people. These directions instruct local authorities to ensure that they deliver their new statutory obligations and contribute to that agenda in the same way as the careers regulations that we put in place for young people. That obligation starts in September.

We asked the youth partnerships across Wales to dream the dream by 2008, and there are some exciting ideas coming forward. They have audited provision and we now know that there are some huge gaps across Wales. As an Assembly Government, we will be keeping a close eye on local government's delivery of these statutory obligations in terms of ensuring that we all improve the quality of experience for Wales's young people.

Y Llywydd: Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar egwyddor y cyfarwyddiadau.

addysg yrfaol a gyflwynasoch yn sgîl fy nadd o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29?

Jane Davidson: Mae rheoliadau statudol i gyd yn gofyn ar i gyrff gyflawni. Yr agenda ymestyn hawliau yw'r agenda gyffredinol i sicrhau gwasanaethau gwell i bobl ifanc. Mae'r cyfarwyddiadau hyn yn cyfarwyddo awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau eu bod yn cyflawni eu dyletswyddau statudol newydd ac yn cyfrannu at yr agenda honno yn yr un modd â'r rheoliadau gyrfaoedd a sefydlwyd gennym ar gyfer pobl ifanc. Dechreuâ'r ddyletswydd honno ym mis Medi.

Gofynasom i'r partneriaethau ieuenticid ledled Cymru freuddwydio'r freuddwyd erbyn 2008, ac mae syniadau cyffrous yn dod i law. Maent wedi archwilio'r ddarpariaeth a gwyddom bellach fod bylchau enfawr ar hyd a lled Cymru. Fel Llywodraeth Cynulliad, byddwn yn cadw llygad barcud ar y modd y cyflawnna llywodraeth leol y dyletswyddau statudol hyn yn nhermau sicrhau ein bod i gyd yn gwella ansawdd y profiad i bobl ifanc Cymru.

The Presiding Officer: We will now vote on the principle of the directions.

*Cynnig: O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gwyther, Christine
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina

Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Law, Peter
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Y Llywydd: Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar y cynnig i gymeradwyo'r cyfarwyddiadau. **The Presiding Officer:** We will now vote on the motion to approve the directions.

*Cynnig: O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gwyther, Christine
Hancock, Brian
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn

Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Law, Peter
 Melding, David
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Rogers, Peter
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Kirsty
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.06 p.m.
 The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.06 p.m.*

Cynlluniau Gweithredu Coetir a Biomas a Garddwriaeth Woodland and Biomass and Horticulture Action Plans

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1, 2 and 3 in the name of Jocelyn Davies and amendment 4 in the name of Jonathan Morgan.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2 a 3 yn enw Jocelyn Davies a gwelliant 4 yn enw Jonathan Morgan.

We are short of time. We have 25 minutes for this item, as I must protect the time for the minority party debate. The Minister has agreed to take only half of his time. Although this debate is important, I hope that Members will agree that it is not unreasonable in view of its content that we can limit speeches to three minutes. If we can do that, I am sure that we can get through all the points that need to be made. Otherwise, we will not have enough time for the minority party debate.

Yr ydym yn fyr o amser. Mae gennym 25 munud ar gyfer yr eitem hon, gan fod yn rhaid imi warchod yr amser ar gyfer y ddadl plaid leiafrifol. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi cytuno i ddefnyddio hanner ei amser yn unig. Er bod y ddadl hon yn bwysig, gobeithiaf y cytuna'r Aelodau nad yw'n afresymol, o ystyried ei chynnwys, cyfyngu areithiau i dri munud. Os gallwn wneud hynny, yr wyf yn siŵr y gallwn fynd drwy'r holl bwyntiau y mae angen eu gwneud. Fel arall, ni fydd gennym ddigon o amser ar gyfer y ddadl plaid leiafrifol.

The Deputy First Minister and Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad (Michael German): I propose that

Dirprwy Brif Weinidog Cymru a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor (Michael German): Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly welcomes the intention to publish action plans for the woodland and biomass and horticulture

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn croesawu'r bwriad i gyhoeddi cynlluniau gweithredu ar gyfer y sectorau coetir a biomas a

sectors and endorses the establishment of strategy groups to oversee the implementations of the plans. (NDM1099)

garddwriaeth ac yn rhoi ei gymeradwyaeth i sefydlu grwpiau strategaeth i oruchwylio'r broses o roi'r cynlluniau ar waith. (NDM1099)

This is an important debate on the scope of Welsh agriculture to develop into new and more diversified activities. I will recount some history. In December 1999 the National Assembly, together with the rural policy unit of the Welsh Development Agency, commissioned a study into the alternative sectors with the most commercial benefit to farmers in Wales. As a result of the studies, a new strategy group covering horticulture and woodland and biomass has been established. We are now debating the progress of its action plan, which was discussed in Committee.

Mae hon yn ddadl bwysig ar allu'r sector amaeth yng Nghymru i ymgymryd â gweithgareddau newydd a mwy arallgyfeiriol. Adroddaf ychydig o hanes. Yn Rhagfyr 1999 comisiynodd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ynghyd ag uned polisi gwledig Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, astudiaeth i ganfod y sectorau amgen a gynigiai'r budd masnachol mwyaf i ffermwyr yng Nghymru. O ganlyniad i'r astudiaethau hyn, sefydlwyd grŵp strategaeth newydd i ymdrin â garddwriaeth a choetir a biomas. Yr ydym yn awr yn trafod hynt ei gynllun gweithredu, a drafodwyd yn y Pwyllgor.

First, on the woodland development and biomass strategy action plan, this is now in its final draft. It was discussed in Committee on 19 June, and copies have been circulated to Members. The plan examines the potential for the contribution of woodland development and biomass to growth in farm incomes, and to a sustainable rural economy. For the purposes of the action plan, woodland development examined the role of private woodland in relation to improving farm incomes and benefiting the wider rural economy of Wales. Biomass was defined in the report as referring to wood, its co-products and energy crops. The potential sources of biomass included small round wood, co-products from timber processing industries, harvesting residues, and specially grown energy crops, such as grasses and short rotation crop poppies. Three sectors are involved in woodland development and biomass, namely agriculture, forestry, and the biomass from the renewable energy sector. The action plan examined the interaction between these three sectors. It was found that there were considerable barriers to planting biomass, new woodlands or the management of woodlands. These were the loss of agricultural subsidies on the land concerned and a need to develop existing or new markets for the resulting material, which is usually low-quality timber and associated co-products from timber processing, such as bark, sawdust and off-cuts.

Yn gyntaf, ynglŷn â'r cynllun gweithredu strategaeth biomas a datblygu coetiroedd, mae hwn bellach yn ei ddrafft terfynol. Fe'i trafodwyd yn y Pwyllgor ar 19 Mehefin, ac anfonwyd copïau at yr Aelodau. Mae'r cynllun yn archwilio cyfraniad potensial datblygu coetir a biomas at dwf incwm ffermydd, ac at economi wledig gynaliadwy. I ddibenion y cynllun gweithredu, yr oedd datblygu coetir yn golygu archwilio rôl coetiroedd preifat yng nghyswllt gwella incwm ffermydd a rhoi budd i economi wledig ehangach Cymru. Diffiniwyd biomas yn yr adroddiad fel cyfeirio at goed, is-gynhyrchion coed a chnydau ynni. Yr oedd ffynonellau posibl biomas yn cynnwys coed cylch bach, is-gynhyrchion o ddiwydiannau prosesu pren, gwaddodion cynaeafu, a chnydau ynni a dyfir yn arbennig, fel glaswelltau a chnydau pabi cylchdro byr. Mae tri sector yn ymwneud â datblygu coetiroedd a biomas, sef amaethyddiaeth, coedwigaeth, a'r biomas o'r sector ynni adnewyddadwy. Archwiliodd y cynllun gweithredu y berthynas rhwng y tri sector hyn. Gwelwyd fod rhwystrau sylweddol i blannu biomas, coetiroedd newydd neu reoli coetiroedd. Y rhwystrau oedd y ffaith bod cymorthdaliadau amaethyddol ar y tir dan sylw wedi eu colli, ynghyd â'r angen i ddatblygu'r marchnadoedd presennol neu farchnadoedd newydd ar gyfer y defnydd a geid o ganlyniad, sef fel arfer bren o ansawdd isel ac is-gynhyrchion cysylltiedig prosesu coed, fel rhisgl, blawd llif a thorion.

The action plan acknowledges the current work and initiatives aimed at adding value to farm timber to provide alternative income sources or cost savings to farmers. Highlighting the economic benefits of utilising farm timber can bring additional benefits, such as improved woodland habitats, sustainable landscape features and improved timber quality for management. However, markets for the co-products of processing need to be found to make adding value to farm timber more viable. The action plan identifies 24 action points needed to develop the farm woodland and biomass sectors, including research demonstration projects, economic and market analysis, awareness raising, training, grant assistance, and the examination of the current agricultural subsidies system. The plan also recommends that the Welsh Assembly Government appoints a steering group of industry-wide representatives, including delivery agents, Assembly Government officials, and other interested parties to monitor and co-ordinate the delivery of the action plan.

4:10 p.m.

I am keen to take forward the action plan urgently, and I will seek to promote small-scale demonstration projects with biomass working in real situations. I am also contemplating a conference to bring together those representing the demand side, such as house builders and architects, and suppliers and biomass producers, in order to bring together the supply side and the demand side. As a matter of urgency, since this is the action plan's crucial issue, I am establishing a small ministerial advisory group to help me to take forward the action plan. I hope that the group will meet for the first time in August. This will ease the process, as recommended in the action plan, and will give its work a kick-start.

Work on the horticulture strategy has so far involved a series of face-to-face interviews with a broad spectrum of organisations and individuals from across the industry in Wales

Mae'r cynllun gweithredu'n cydnabod y gwaith a'r mentrau cyfredol sy'n anelu at ychwanegu gwerth i goed ffermydd er mwyn darparu ffynonellau incwm amgen neu arbed costau i ffermwyr. Gall pwysleisio manteision economaidd defnyddio coed fferm ddod â manteision ychwanegol, fel gwell cynefinoedd coetir, nodweddion tirwedd cynaliadwy a gwell ansawdd coed ar gyfer rheoli. Fodd bynnag, mae angen dod o hyd i farchnadoedd i is-gynhyrchion prosesu er mwyn sicrhau bod ychwanegu gwerth i goed ffermydd yn bosibilrwydd mwy ymarferol. Mae'r cynllun gweithredu'n nodi 24 pwynt gweithredu angenrheidiol i ddatblygu'r sectorau coetir fferm a biomas, gan gynnwys prosiectau arddangos ymchwil, dadansoddi'r economi a'r farchnad, codi ymwybyddiaeth, hyfforddi, cymorth grantiau, ac archwilio'r system gymorthdaliadau amaethyddol bresennol. Mae'r cynllun yn argymhell hefyd fod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn penodi grŵp llywio o gynrychiolwyr ar draws y diwydiant, gan gynnwys asiantau dosbarthu, swyddogion Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, a chyfranogion eraill, i fonitro a chydlynu'r gwaith o weithredu'r cynllun gweithredu.

Yr wyf yn awyddus i symud ymlaen â'r cynllun gweithredu ar fyrder, a byddaf yn ceisio hyrwyddo prosiectau arddangos ar raddfa fach gyda biomas yn gweithio mewn sefyllfaoedd go iawn. Yr wyf hefyd yn ystyried cynnal cynhadledd er mwyn i'r rheini sy'n cynrychioli ochr y galw, fel adeiladwyr tai a phenseiri, ddod i gyswllt â chyflenwyr a chynhyrchwyr biomas, fel bo'r cyflenwyr a'r cwsmer yn dod at ei gilydd. Fel mater o frys, gan mai dyma bwynt allweddol y cynllun gweithredu, yr wyf yn sefydlu grŵp ymgynghorol bach o Weinidogion i'm helpu i weithredu'r cynllun gweithredu. Gobeithiaf y bydd y grŵp yn cyfarfod am y tro cyntaf ym mis Awst. Bydd hyn yn hwyluso'r broses, fel yr argymhellwyd yn y cynllun gweithredu, ac yn rhoi hwb cychwynnol i'w gwaith.

Hyd yn hyn mae gwaith ar y strategaeth garddwriaeth wedi golygu cyfres o gyfweiliadau wyneb-yn-wyneb ag amrediad eang o sefydliadau ac unigolion o bob rhan

and in other parts of the UK. Welsh horticultural growers in future will probably need to achieve greater economies of scale and operate in a smarter, more professional and innovative manner. Overall, Wales is a small-scale player, but growing groups based in south Wales have a history of supplying the Welsh-based stores of the major retail multiples. Landscaping has been a major growth area of the Welsh horticultural sector over the last five years, and the WDA has a vibrant and well-organised landscaping industry group in place already.

I will not support any of the amendments, and will briefly explain why. In terms of amendment 1, we are trying to promote the future and we need to bring together the demand and supply sides as indicated in the action plan. I will make every effort to ensure that that happens. Funding streams are now in place, at a Welsh, UK and EU level, and we will therefore take the matter forward.

Amendment 2 fulfils no function; amendment 3 is already being dealt with in the action plan; and amendment 4 adds nothing to the arrangements that are already in place. I have described today how I propose to take these arrangements forward.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 1: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn gresynu na wnaeth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystod ei dair blynedd cyntaf gymryd unrhyw gamau at ddefnyddio biomas i gynhyrchu trydan, er bod arian ar gael i ddatblygu ynni adnewyddadwy o wastraff coedwigoedd a chnydau ynni;

Cynigiaf welliant 2. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn pwysleisio'r angen i ddatblygu strategaeth gadarn ar gyfer cnydau ynni fel cyfle i ffermwyr arallgyfeirio;

Cynigiaf welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn nodi mai dim ond rhyw 70 y cant o'r

o'r diwydiant yng Nghymru ac mewn rhannau eraill o'r DU. Mae'n debyg y bydd angen i dyfwyr garddwriaethol Cymru yn y dyfodol sicrhau darbodion maint mwy, a gweithredu mewn modd clyfrach, mwy proffesiynol ac arloesol. Yn gyffredinol, rhan fach sydd gan Gymru yn hyn o beth, ond mae grwpiau tyfwyr yn y De wedi bod yn cyflenwi siopau'r cwmnïau manwerthu mawr yng Nghymru. Bu tirlunio'n faes twf mawr i sector garddwriaethol Cymru yn y pum mlynedd diwethaf, ac mae'r WDA eisoes wedi sefydlu grŵp diwydiant tirlunio sy'n weithgar ac wedi'i drefnu'n dda.

Yr wyf am egluro'n gryno pam na fyddaf yn cefnogi yr un o'r gwelliannau. O ran gwelliant 1, yr ydym yn ceisio hyrwyddo'r dyfodol ac mae angen dod â'r cyflenwyr a'r cwsmer ynghyd fel a nodir yn y cynllun gweithredu. Gwnaf bob ymdrech i sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd. Mae ffrydiau ariannu yn eu lle bellach, yng Nghymru, y DU a'r UE, ac felly fe awn â'r mater yn ei flaen.

Nid yw gwelliant 2 yn cyflawni dim; mae gwelliant 3 eisoes yn cael sylw yn y cynllun gweithredu; ac nid yw gwelliant 4 yn ychwanegu dim at y trefniadau a wnaed eisoes. Yr wyf wedi disgrifio heddiw sut y bwriadaf ddatblygu'r trefniadau hynny.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 1: add a new point at the end of the motion:

regrets that in the first three years of the National Assembly, despite the funds available for the development of renewable energy from forestry waste and energy crops, no progress has been made towards the generation of electricity from biomass;

I propose amendment 2. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

emphasises the need to develop a vigorous strategy for energy crops as a diversification opportunity for farmers;

I propose amendment 3. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

notes that at the end of April the total level of

grantiau a oedd i fod wedi'u dyrannu erbyn diwedd Ebrill oedd wedi'u dyrannu i Fesur 3, Blaenoriaeth 5, Rhaglen Amcan 1 (coedwigaeth) erbyn hynny, a dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad roi llawer mwy o flaenoriaeth i ddefnyddio ein coetiroedd a'n coedwigoedd yn llawn.

Yr wyf wedi fy siomi gan ymateb y Gweinidog i'r gwelliannau. Cyfeiriodd at welliannau Plaid Cymru gan awgrymu nad ydynt yn ychwanegu dim i'r cynnig. Gallaf sicrhau'r Gweinidog mai ein bwriad wrth gyflwyno'r gwelliannau oedd bod yn gadarnhaol ac yn adeiladol ac i geisio ychwanegu at y cynnig.

Gan fod amser yn brin, yr wyf am ganolbwyntio ar gnydau ynni yn unig. A yw'r Gweinidog, mewn difrif calon, yn dweud wrthym nad oes problem gyda chnydau ynni yng Nghymru? Os mai dyna y mae'n honni, mae'r wybodaeth a gasglodd am ei bortffolio newydd yn wallus. Gŵyr y Gweinidog fod modd i ffermwyr â thir â'r drosglwyddo cymorthdaliadau cynyddu i'w defnyddio ar gyfer cynyddau ynni. Yr wyf yn gobeithio bod y Gweinidog yn gwybod erbyn hyn nad yw cynyddau yn rhan fawr o gynnyrch ffermwyr Cymru. Mae'r rhan fwyaf ohonynt yn magu da byw, ond nid oes modd trosglwyddo'r cymorthdaliadau a dderbyniant i'r diben hwnnw. Os yw'r Gweinidog yn dweud nad oes angen cynyddau ynni yng Nghymru, derbynïaf hynny. Serch hynny, os yw yntau, fel ninnau, yn cydnabod yr angen i roi cyfleoedd i ffermwyr drosglwyddo cymorthdaliadau i gnydau ynni, sut y mae'n bwriadu mynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon, neu a fydd yn ei hanwybyddu fel yr anwybyddodd welliant 2?

A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno bod tirwedd a hinsawdd Cymru yn addas ar gyfer tyfu cynyddau ynni? Os felly, pam y mae'n anwybyddu'r cyfle sydd ganddo i wneud rhywbeth gwerthfawr dros amaethyddiaeth yng Nghymru? Bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o waith mewn gwledydd megis y Ffindir, Sweden ac Awstria, lle y mae biomas yn cynhyrchu tua 20 y cant o'u hynni adnewyddadwy. Onid yw'n credu y gellid gwneud hynny yng Nghymru hefyd? A wnaiff y Gweinidog sicrhau bod arferion da prosiectau yn y Canolbarth, megis Salix, ac

grants allocated to Objective 1, Priority 5, Measure 3 (forestry) was only about 70 per cent of the total that should have been allocated by that date, and urges that the Assembly Government should give far greater priority to making full use of our woodlands and forests.

I was disappointed with the Minister's response to the amendments. In referring to Plaid Cymru's amendments he suggested that they do not add anything to the motion. I assure the Minister that our intention in tabling these amendments was to be positive, constructive and to build on the motion.

As time is short, I will focus solely on energy crops. Is the Minister saying, in all honesty, that there is no problem with energy crops in Wales? If so, his understanding of his new portfolio is so far inaccurate. The Minister will know that arable farmers can transfer crop subsidies for use on energy crops. I would hope that the Minister realises by now that crops do not constitute a major part of Wales's agricultural produce. Most Welsh farmers breed livestock, but they cannot transfer the subsidies they receive for that purpose. If the Minister is stating that we do not need energy crops in Wales, then I accept that. However, if, like us, he recognises the need to offer farmers the opportunity to transfer subsidies to energy crops, how does he intend to get to grips with the problem, or will he ignore it just as he ignored amendment 2?

Does the Minister agree that Wales's landscape and climate make it an ideal place to grow energy crops? If so, why is he not taking this opportunity to make a valuable contribution to agriculture in Wales? The Minister will be aware of work in countries such as Finland, Sweden and Austria, where biomass produces some 20 per cent of their renewable energy. Does he not believe that this would also be possible in Wales? Will the Minister ensure that the good practices of projects in mid Wales, such as Salix and Powys Energy Agency, and Green Heat, are

Asiantaeth Ynni Powys, a Green Heat, yn cael eu rhannu drwy Gymru gyfan?

shared throughout Wales?

I gloi, beth y mae'r Gweinidog yn bwriadu ei wneud gyda ffermio dŵr? Clywsom dros 18 mis yn ôl yn y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig fod hwn yn faes lle y mae potensial mawr i Gymru. A fydd y Gweinidog yn symud hyn ymlaen ac, os felly, beth yn union y mae'n bwriadu'i wneud yn y maes pwysig hwn?

In conclusion, does the Minister have any plans for aquaculture? The Agriculture and Rural Development Committee was told over 18 months ago that there is great potential for Wales in this field. Will the Minister be taking this forward and, if so, what exactly does he intend to do in this important field?

Peter Rogers: I propose amendment 4 in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Peter Rogers: Cynigiau welliant 4 yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

calls for the interests of the private sector to be fully recognised in each of the action plans and that representatives of the private sector are incorporated in each of the strategy groups.

yn mynnu bod buddiannau'r sector preifat yn cael eu cydnabod yn llawn ym mhob un o'r cynlluniau gweithredu a bod cynrychiolwyr o'r sector preifat yn cael eu cynnwys ym mhob un o'r grwpiau strategol.

There is no better example of where the private sector is not represented than in farm woodland development and biomass. Mike German said that he will not support our amendment because arrangements are already in place. I strongly dispute that, because only one major woodland owner is represented and there are no representatives from the Forestry and Timber Association. The area is dominated by farmers and farm woodland representatives and misses out the private forest sector altogether. Why has this sector, which has the expertise and experience necessary to develop and take forward a strategy, been omitted?

Nid oes enghraifft well o fan lle nad yw'r sector preifat wedi'i gynrychioli nag ym myd datblygu coetiroedd ffermydd a biomas. Dywedodd Mike German na wnaiff gefnogi ein gwlliant am fod trefniadau eisoes yn eu lle. Anghytunaf yn gryf â hynny, oherwydd dim ond un perchennog coetir mawr sydd wedi'i gynrychioli ac nid oes dim cynrychiolwyr o'r Gymdeithas Goedwigaeth a Phren. Dominyddir y maes gan ffermwyr a chynrychiolwyr coetiroedd ffermydd ac anwybyddir y sector coedwigoedd preifat yn llwyr. Pam na chynhwyswyd y sector hwn, sydd a chanddo'r arbenigedd a'r profiad angenrheidiol i ddatblygu strategaeth a'i symud ymlaen?

Another glaring omission is substandard timber, of which a tremendous amount is lying about because no market has been developed for it. We are talking about windblown and stressed timber, and thinning dead timber, which is unsuitable for products such as high-quality tanalised fencing and sawn timber. With the appropriate developments, biomass would be an ideal use for these types of timber.

Bwlch amlwg arall yw pren is-safonol, y mae peth wmbredd ohono'n gorwedd o gwmpas am nad oes marchnad wedi'i datblygu ar ei gyfer. Yr ydym yn sôn am bren wedi'i chwythu gan y gwynt a'i lurgunio, ac am deneuo coed marw, sy'n anaddas ar gyfer cynhyrchion fel ffensys o ansawdd uchel a phren wedi'i lifio. Gyda'r datblygiadau priodol, byddai biomas yn ddefnydd delfrydol i'r mathau hyn o bren.

The paper seems to be addressing farm incomes. After 50 years in operation, private saw mills that received grants and encouragement are yet to cover their establishment costs, which include costs for

Mae'r papur fel pe bai'n cyfeirio at incwm ffermydd. Wedi 50 mlynedd o weithredu, mae melinau llifio preifat a dderbyniodd grantiau ac anogaeth dal heb dalu costau eu sefydlu, sy'n cynnwys costau rheoli, teneuo a

management, thinning and felling trees, construction of roads and re-stocking. If they have struggled to cover those costs, it is not surprising that Forest Enterprise made a £5.25 million loss in 2001, as was reported in the *Forest Machine Journal* last year. The under-management of forestry has now led to job losses, and it is being abandoned to natural vegetation. These forest holdings do not receive support from the common agricultural policy as less favoured areas or environmentally sensitive areas or from Tir Gofal. We must ensure that the private sector is recognised and its expertise used fully.

Mick Bates: I declare an interest as a partner in a farming business and a member of the Pontbren group.

I welcome this debate although I regret that it is being curtailed because the discussion on this issue in the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee was also curtailed to a meaningless few minutes. I hope that the Committee will revisit this important issue. A vision for sustainable Welsh agriculture and a viable rural economy is at the heart of our strategy. In future, the industry will be based on high-quality, value-added, branded products, whether farm timber or shellfish, produced by a viable industry. These reports were prepared as a result of a consideration of alternative sources of income, as much of existing production is unprofitable. Various parts of the industry are in crisis because of the inability to retain young people. It costs 19p on average to produce a litre of milk yet the price currently received by producers is 16p or less. In examining these strategies, we must ensure that they will result in establishing commercial businesses. I hope that due consideration will be given to ensuring that these plans have capital finance. The infrastructure must be in place to help producers control the means of processing, so that the added value in the product is recycled back to the producer, and not lost in the retail industry, as has so often happened in the past. I note that there is a suggestion for a suprema and team in the horticultural plan. I assume that he will manage that.

thorri coed, adeiladu ffyrdd ac ailstocio. Os ydynt wedi cael anhawster talu'r costau hyn, nid yw'n syndod i'r Fenter Coedwigaeth wneud colled o £5.25 miliwn yn 2001, fel a adroddwyd yn y *Forest Machine Journal* y llynedd. Mae tan-reolaeth coedwigoedd wedi arwain at golli swyddi, ac maent bellach yn fannau lle ceir llystyfiant naturiol. Ni chaiff y coedwigoedd hyn gefnogaeth gan y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin fel ardaloedd llai ffafriol neu ardaloedd amgylcheddol sensitif na chan Tir Gofal. Rhaid inni sicrhau y caiff y sector preifat ei gydnabod ac y defnyddir ei arbenigedd yn llawn.

Mick Bates: Datganaf fuddiant fel partner mewn busnes ffermio ac aelod o grŵp Pontbren.

Croesawaf y ddadl hon er fy mod yn gresynu iddi gael ei chwtoegi oherwydd cafodd y drafodaeth ar y mater hwn yn y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Materion Gwledig ei chwtoegi hefyd i ychydig o funudau disylwedd. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Pwyllgor yn aildrafod y mater pwysig hwn. Gweledigaeth ar gyfer amaethyddiaeth gynaliadwy yng Nghymru ac economi wledig hyfyw sydd wrth wraidd ein strategaeth. Yn y dyfodol, seilir y diwydiant ar gynnyrch o ansawdd uchel wedi'u brandio â gwerth ychwanegol, boed yn goed fferm neu'n bysgod cregyn, wedi'u cynhyrchu gan ddiwydiant hyfyw. Paratowyd yr adroddiadau hyn yn sgil ein hystyriaeth o ffynonellau incwm amgen, gan fod llawer o'r cynnyrch presennol yn amhroffidiol. Mae amryfal rannau o'r diwydiant mewn argyfwng oherwydd yr anallu i gadw pobl ifanc. Mae'n costio 19c ar gyfartaledd i gynhyrchu litr o laeth, ond eto mae'r pris a delir i'r cynhyrchwyr yn 16c neu lai. Wrth archwilio'r strategaethau hyn, rhaid inni sicrhau yr arweiniant at sefydlu busnesau masnachol. Gobeithiaf y rhoddir ystyriaeth ddyledus i sicrhau y caiff y cynlluniau hyn gyllid cyfalaf. Rhaid i'r seilwaith fod yn ei le i helpu cynhyrchwyr i reoli'r dulliau prosesu, er mwyn sicrhau bod gwerth ychwanegol y cynnyrch yn cyrraedd y cynhyrchydd, yn hytrach na chael ei golli yn y diwydiant manwerthu, fel a ddigwyddodd mor aml yn y gorffennol. Nodaf fod y cynllun garddwriaeth yn awgrymu penodi pen-swyddog a thîm. Tybiaf mai ef fydd yn rheoli hynny.

4:20 p.m.

Woodland development and biomass holds the greatest potential for land management and the Welsh rural economy. The technology already exists to convert plant material into fuel at a commercial return and, again, I emphasise the need to make this a commercial operation, so that people who enter these alternative sectors can earn a viable living.

A series of well supported grants exist to help woodlands—the woodland grant, and the farm woodland premium scheme. Grants would be even better if there were a destocking arrangement, as with the Pontpren scheme. With the Assembly's commitment to sustainable development, biomass can be used to produce renewable energy. This is the greatest challenge. I urge the Minister and the Cabinet to reiterate their support for a renewable energy industry in Wales. I also urge the removal of one of the biggest obstacles: the review of 'Technical Advice Note 8: Renewable Energy'. We have yet to see how TAN 8 will encourage renewable energy.

Phil Williams: It is incredible that, as we enter the Assembly's fourth year, we are asked to merely welcome the intention to publish plans. There is no sense of urgency here, yet we certainly need plans. The purpose of forestry in Wales has already changed and must now change again. After the first world war, conifer forests were planted to provide pit props. Later, we saw a new outlet for timber with the growth of the paper industry. Wales has always been too small for a self-sustaining paper industry, and with the conversion of the Shotton plant to processing recycled paper, we urgently need a new market.

That is why our amendments stress the importance of developing biomass. If we are to phase out fossil fuel, our portfolio of renewable energy will need biomass generators with a guaranteed output to compensate for the variable output of wind power. Our existing forests could provide the initial fuel for biomass generators until three

Mae datblygu coetiroedd a biomas yn dal y potensial mwyaf ar gyfer rheoli tir ac ar gyfer economi wledig Cymru. Mae'r dechnoleg yn bodoli eisoes i droi deunydd planhigion yn danwydd am elw masnachol. Pwysleisiaf eto yr angen i wneud hyn yn broses fasnachol, fel y gall pobl sy'n ymgymryd â'r math hwn o waith amaethyddol amgen ennill bywoliaeth hyfyw.

Mae nifer o grantiau i helpu coetiroedd, megis y grant coetir a'r cynllun premiwm coetir ffermydd, yn derbyn cryn gefnogaeth. Byddai grantiau'n well fyth pe bai trefniant datstocio, yn debyg i gynllun Pontpren. Gydag ymrwymiad y Cynulliad i ddatblygu cynaliadwy, gellir defnyddio biomas i gynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy. Dyma'r her fwyaf. Anogaf y Gweinidog a'r Cabinet i ailddatgan eu cefnogaeth i ddiwydiant ynni adnewyddadwy yng Nghymru. Anogaf hefyd ddileu un o'r rhwystrau mwyaf: yr adolygiad o 'Nodyn Cyngor Technegol 8: Ynni Adnewyddadwy'. Nid ydym wedi gweld eto sut y bydd TAN 8 yn annog ynni adnewyddadwy.

Phil Williams: Mae'n anhygoel, a ninnau'n cychwyn ar bedwaredd flwyddyn y Cynulliad, mai'r cyfan y gofynnir inni ei wneud yw croesawu'r bwriad i gyhoeddi cynlluniau. Nid oes unrhyw ymdeimlad o frys yma, ond yn sicr mae angen cynlluniau. Mae pwrpas coedwigaeth yng Nghymru eisoes wedi newid a rhaid iddo newid eto'n awr. Ar ôl y rhyfel byd cyntaf, plannwyd coedwigoedd conwydd i ddarparu pyst pyllau glo. Yn ddiweddarach, gwelsom farchnad newydd i goed gyda thwf y diwydiant papur. Mae Cymru wedi bod yn rhy fach erioed i gael diwydiant papur hunangynhaliol, ac wrth i waith Shotton ddechrau prosesu papur wedi'i ailgylchu, mae angen marchnad newydd arnom ar fyrder.

Dyna pam y mae ein gwelliannau'n tanlinellu pwysigrwydd datblygu biomas. Os ydym am roi'r gorau'n raddol i ddefnyddio tanwydd ffosil, bydd ar ein portffolio ynni adnewyddadwy angen generaduron biomas gydag allbwn gwarantedig i ddigolledu am allbwn amrywiol ynni gwynt. Gallai ein coedwigoedd presennol ddarparu'r tanwydd

of four years later when an additional supply would be available from energy crops. It is serendipitous that, for biomass electricity to be competitive, the waste energy must be used, and the manufacture of chipboard and other timber products requires a large supply of low-grade heat.

A biomass generator—such as that proposed at Newbridge-on-Wye—would help to meet our renewable energy obligation by 2010, would provide a market for forestry residues and would secure the future of timber-based manufacture. Unfortunately, the Newbridge proposal suffered an intolerable delay in the planning process. To make matters worse, just the possibility of it going ahead meant that the necessary supply of forestry residues was reserved for it, and could not be guaranteed for any alternative biomass proposal. The term ‘logjam’ is appropriate.

Nothing is happening, as best measured by the up-take of Objective 1 money. Three measures in Objective 1 are potentially available to support the use of energy crops. All are seriously under-committed. The allocation of grants to the forestry industry is 30 per cent below the level planned for July 2002. However, that is a magnificent achievement compared with the two measures specifically committed to clean energy. Two and a half years into Objective 1, only 1.6 per cent of the budget for clean energy has been allocated, and virtually nothing spent. That figure reliably measures the Government’s success in pursuing its obligation to sustainable development.

William Graham: I refer the Minister to some recently published research by Oxford University on woodland strategies. Most conifers will reach maturity in the next 10 years, particularly those planted on ancient woodland sites. Will the Minister consider giving high priority to the restoration of ancient woodland and target incentives for such restoration? Will she adopt a policy to restock all conifer-planted ancient woodlands with native species? Will she also review the United Kingdom woodland assurance

cychwynnol i generaduron biomas am dair neu bedair blynedd nes byddai cyflenwad ychwanegol ar gael o gnydau ynni. Mae’n gyd-ddigwyddiad ffodus, i ynni biomas fod yn gystadleuol mae’n rhaid defnyddio’r ynni gwastraff, ac mae cynhyrchu sglodfwrdd a chynhyrchion pren eraill yn galw am gyflenwad mawr o wres gradd isel.

Byddai generadur biomas—fel hwnnw a gynigir ar gyfer Pontnewydd ar Wy—yn helpu i gwrdd â’n hymrwymiad ynni adnewyddadwy erbyn 2010, yn darparu marchnad ar gyfer gwaddodion coedwigaeth ac yn sicrhau dyfodol cynhyrchu seiliedig ar goed. Yn anffodus, cafodd cynnig y Bontnewydd ei oedi’n annioddefol yn y broses gynllunio. I wneud pethau’n waeth, golygodd y posibilrwydd y byddai’n mynd yn ei flaen y cadwyd y cyflenwad angenrheidiol o waddodion coedwigaeth ar ei gyfer, ac na ellid ei warantu ar gyfer unrhyw gynnydd biomas arall. Mae’r term ‘logjam’ yn briodol.

Nid oes dim yn digwydd, fel a fesurir orau drwy faint o arian Amcan 1 sydd wedi’i glustnodi. Mae tri mesur yn Amcan 1 a allai fod ar gael i gefnogi defnyddio cnydau ynni. Mae’r tri wedi’u tan-ymrwymo’n ddifrifol. Mae dyraniad grantiau i’r diwydiant coedwigaeth 30 y cant yn is na’r lefel a gynlluniwyd ar gyfer Gorffennaf 2002. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny’n gamp wych o gymharu â’r ddau fesur sy’n ymrwymo’n benodol i ynni glân. Ddwy flynedd a hanner i mewn i Amcan 1, dim ond 1.6 y cant o’r gyllideb ar gyfer ynni glân sydd wedi’i ddyrannu, ac nid oes nemor ddim wedi’i wario. Mae’r ffigur hwnnw’n fesur dibynadwy o lwyddiant y Llywodraeth i gyflawni’i ymrwymiad i ddatblygu cynaliadwy.

William Graham: Cyfeiriaf y Gweinidog at ymchwil a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar gan Brifysgol Rhydychen ar strategaethau coetir. Bydd y rhan fwyaf o goed conwydd yn cyrraedd aeddfedrwydd yn y 10 mlynedd nesaf, yn enwedig y rheini a blannwyd ar safleoedd coetiroedd hynafol. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ystyried rhoi blaenoriaeth uchel i adfer coetiroedd hynafol a thargedu cymhellion ar gyfer gwaith adfer o’r fath? A wnaiff hi fabwysiadu polisi i sicrhau y caiff pob coetir hynafol lle plannwyd coed

standard to include certification of sustainably-produced timber in the light of recent research? The UK native woodland habitat action plan should be redefined to reflect the need to conserve the characteristic species of Wales.

We must do all we can to change the hearts and minds of foresters and woodland owners who have, for decades, been geared towards growing conifers and convince them that there is a future in growing broadleaved trees. The Douglas fir is twice as profitable as any other conifer crop, but good quality ash is more profitable still. We must consider gradually restoring a site by maintaining a continuous cover, which is generally more profitable, rather than using the clearfelling approach.

Minimum intervention might be attractive, particularly for ecologists, but most of the recent economic analysis shows this to be expensive for the woodland owner and equally damaging to ecological interests in the long term. We must make a commitment to biodiversity in woodland.

The executive summary recognises that there are

‘considerable barriers to the planting of biomass, new woodlands or the management of woodlands’

and it recognises the need to develop existing or new markets. This must only be the beginning. To be successful, this strategy must recognise the likely recommendations of the consultative groups, whose views we will welcome.

The Deputy First Minister and Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad (Michael German): I will respond to as many points as possible. I tried to indicate to Peter Rogers that the private sector is strongly represented on the woodland development and biomass strategy group to which he referred. Judith Webb of the Timber

conwydd ei ailstocio â rhywogaethau brodorol? A wnaiff hi hefyd adolygu safon sicrwydd coetiroedd y Deyrnas Unedig i gynnwys tystysgrifiad i bren a gynhyrchwyd yn gynaliadwy yn sgîl ymchwil ddiweddar? Dylid ailddiffinio cynllun gweithredu cynefinoedd coetir brodorol y DU i adlewyrchu'r angen i gadw rhywogaethau nodweddiadol Cymru.

Rhaid inni wneud popeth a allwn i newid calonnau a meddyliau coedwigwyr a pherchenogion coetiroedd sydd, ers degawdau, wedi'u gerio tuag at gynhyrchu coed conwydd, a'u darbwylllo bod dyfodol mewn tyfu coed llydanddail. Mae ffynidwydden Douglas ddwy waith mor broffidiol ag unrhyw gnwd conwydd arall, ond mae onnen o ansawdd da yn fwy proffidiol eto. Rhaid inni ystyried adfer safle'n raddol drwy gynnal gorchudd di-dor, sy'n gyffredinol yn fwy proffidiol, yn hytrach na defnyddio'r dull clirdorri.

Efallai ei bod yn ddeniadol ymyrryd cyn lleied ag sy'n bosibl, yn enwedig i ecolegwyr, ond dengys y rhan fwyaf o'r dadansoddi economaidd diweddar fod hyn yn gostus i berchennog y coetir a'r un mor niweidiol i fuddiannau ecolegol yn y tymor hir. Rhaid inni wneud ymrwymiad i fioamrywiaeth mewn coetir.

Mae'r crynodeb gweithredol yn cydnabod bod

‘rhwystrau sylweddol i blannu biomas, coetiroedd newydd neu reoli coetiroedd’

ac mae'n cydnabod yr angen i ddatblygu marchnadoedd presennol neu newydd. Rhaid i hyn fod yn ddechrau yn unig. I lwyddo, rhaid i'r strategaeth gydnabod argymhellion tebygol y grwpiau ymgynghori, y croesewir eu sylwadau.

Dirprwy Brif Weinidog Cymru a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor (Michael German): Ymatebaf i gynifer o bwyntiau ag y gallaf. Ceisiais ddangos i Peter Rogers fod y sector preifat wedi'i gynrychioli'n gryf ar y grŵp strategaeth datblygu coetiroedd a biomas y cyfeiriodd ato. Mae Judith Webb o

Growers Association is a member, although Peter claimed that the association was not represented on the group.

I will quickly discuss other points raised. I accept that we must tackle funding issues involving energy crops. Our intention to develop energy crops is inherent in the plan. I agree that Wales's climate and land is suitable. We must now take the action plan forward. I intend to do that as quickly as possible by establishing a small advisory group, which will pave the way for the steering group.

Forest Enterprise's losses were mentioned. They have nothing to do with under-management; they are the result of low world prices. It is the strength of sterling against the euro that has led to this. William, the Forestry Commission is taking up the conservation of ancient woodlands and is currently replanting with broadleaved species. That is important. I regret that I do not have time to deal with horticulture. The action plan will be completed by the end of July and will come to Committee in due course.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I am grateful to the Minister for being so quick, and I thank Members for enabling us to finish this debate with time to spare.

Jenny Randerson: Point of order. I declare an interest because of the nature of my husband's work.

Val Lloyd: Point of order. I asked a question on the public transport statement and forgot to declare an interest as a councillor in Swansea City and County Council.

Karen Sinclair: I request that the division bell be rung.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Under Standing Order No. 6.21, at least three Members must request that the bell be rung. Do three Members support the request? I see that they do. Please ring the bell.

4:30 p.m.

Gymdeithas y Tyfwyr Coed yn aelod, er i Peter honni nad oedd y gymdeithas wedi'i chynrychioli ar y grŵp.

Trafodaf yn sydyn y pwyntiau eraill a godwyd. Derbyniaf fod yn rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â materion ariannu ynglŷn â chnydau ynni. Mae ein bwriad i ddatblygu cnydau ynni yn gynhenid yn y cynllun. Cytunaf fod hinsawdd a thir Cymru'n addas. Yn awr rhaid inni fynd â'r cynllun gweithredu yn ei flaen. Bwriadaf wneud hynny cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl drwy sefydlu grŵp cynghori bach, a fydd yn paratoi'r ffordd i'r grŵp llywio.

Soniwyd am golledion Menter Coedwigaeth. Nid oes a wnelont ddim â than-reoli; canlyniad prisiau isel drwy'r byd ydynt. Cryfder y bunt yn erbyn yr ewro sydd wedi arwain at hyn. William, mae'r Comisiwn Coedwigaeth yn ymgymryd â chadw coetiroedd hynafol ac mae ar hyn o bryd yn ailblannu â rhywogaethau llydanddail. Mae hynny'n bwysig. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf nad oes gennyf amser i ddelio â garddwriaeth. Caiff y cynllun gweithredu ei gwblhau erbyn diwedd Gorffennaf a daw i'r Pwyllgor maes o law.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am fod mor gyflym, a diolchaf i'r Aelodau am ein galluogi i gloi'r ddadl hon gydag amser dros ben.

Jenny Randerson: Pwynt o drefn. Datganaf fuddiant oherwydd natur gwaith fy ngŵr.

Val Lloyd: Pwynt o drefn. Gofynnais gwestiwn ar y datganiad ar drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus ac anghofiais ddatgan buddiant fel cynghorydd yng Nghyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe.

Karen Sinclair: Gofynnaf am ganu cloch y bleidlais.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.21, rhaid i o leiaf dri Aelod ofyn am i'r gloch gael ei chanu. A oes tri Aelod yn cefnogi'r cais? Gwelaf fod. Canwch y gloch, os gwelwch yn dda.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.
Amendment 1: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 17, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 33.
Amendment 2: For 17, Abstain 0, Against 33.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Lloyd, David
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina

Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 19, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
 Amendment 3: For 19, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
 Cairns, Alun
 Dafis, Cynog
 Davies, David
 Davies, Geraint
 Davies, Glyn
 Graham, William
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Elin
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Rogers, Peter
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Chapman, Christine
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Ron
 Edwards, Richard
 Essex, Sue
 Evans, Delyth
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lloyd, Val
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
 Amendment 4: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
 Cairns, Alun
 Dafis, Cynog

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter

Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Elin
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Dafis, Cynog
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin

Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Law, Peter
 Melding, David
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Rogers, Peter
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Kirsty
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru) Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru)

Y Cwricwlwm Cenedlaethol The National Curriculum

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Carwyn Jones and amendment 2 in the name of Jonathan Morgan.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Carwyn Jones a gwelliant 2 yn enw Jonathan Morgan.

Helen Mary Jones: I propose that
the National Assembly

Helen Mary Jones: Cynigiau fod
y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

1. notes the deficiencies of the current curriculum framework, including its over-prescriptive nature and excessive bureaucratic burdens;

1. yn nodi diffygion fframwaith presennol y cwricwlwm, gan gynnwys ei natur or-benodol a'i feichiau biwrocratig llethol;

2. recognises the need to develop a curriculum that is fully responsive to the particular social, economic and cultural needs of Wales; and

2. yn cydnabod bod angen datblygu cwricwlwm sy'n ymateb yn llwyr i anghenion cymdeithasol, economaidd a diwylliannol penodol Cymru; ac

3. calls upon the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to begin the necessary research and consultation to enable the development of a new curriculum as soon as possible. (NDM1100)

3. yn galw ar y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i ddechrau'r gwaith ymchwil ac ymgynghori angenrheidiol fel y gellir datblygu cwricwlwm newydd cyn gynted ag y bo modd. (NDM1100)

I declare an interest as a registered teacher. I ask the Assembly to reject both amendments

Datganaf fuddiant fel athrawes gofrestredig. Gofynnaf i'r Cynulliad wrthod y ddau

for reasons that I will outline shortly and to support the motion. I thank Professor Richard Daugherty of the University of Wales, Aberystwyth for undertaking the research and drafting the document that led Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales to table this motion. A former chair of the Curriculum Council for Wales and a leading academic expert, his views are challenging and invaluable, and we would all do well to take his advice.

No-one who has any contact with the teaching profession—indeed, no-one who has any acquaintance with a school-age child—can be in any doubt that there are serious problems with the national curriculum in Wales as it stands. It is overly prescriptive and rigid, leaving little space for teachers to foster learners' individual interests and talents. It places too much emphasis on the memorising and retention of facts, calling to mind Mr Gradgrind from Charles Dickens's *Hard Times*, who insisted that education, especially for the working class, should be about facts and nothing else, lest they get above themselves. Conversely, the curriculum as it stands does not place nearly enough emphasis on enabling pupils to learn 'how to'—how to learn, how to communicate and so on—or, in other words, to develop skills.

4:40 p.m.

Important aspects of the curriculum experience should be offered to young people—notably the opportunity to develop an understanding of the social, political and economic world around them—that are not easily accommodated within a curriculum defined largely in terms of academic subjects. The system of testing and examination is rigid, outdated and overly complex, leading far too many young people to leave formal education with a profound sense of failure, a deep dislike of anything that they perceive as formal learning and, sometimes, lasting anger.

Employers tell us that many of the skills that they want in new employees, such as communication skills and creativity, are often sadly lacking in young people leaving school and college. They also say that they find the

welliant am resymau a amlinellaf ymhen ychydig, a chefnogi'r cynnig. Diolchaf i'r Athro Richard Daugherty o Brifysgol Cymru, Aberystwyth, am wneud yr ymchwil a drafftio'r ddogfen a arweiniodd Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales i gyflwyno'r cynnig hwn. Yn gyn-gadeirydd Cyngor Cwricwlwm Cymru ac yn arbenigwr academiaidd blaenllaw, mae ei syniadau'n heriol ac yn dra gwerthfawr, a byddem oll yn elwa o ddilyn ei gyngor.

Ni all neb sydd ag unrhyw gysylltiad â'r proffesiwn dysgu—yn wir, neb sydd ag unrhyw berthynas â phlentyn oed ysgol—fod mewn unrhyw amheuaeth nad oes problemau difrifol gyda'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol yng Nghymru fel ag y saif. Mae'n or-benodol ac anhyblyg, heb adael fawr o le i athrawon feithrin diddordebau a doniau unigol dysgwyr. Mae'n rhoi gormod o bwyslais ar gofio a chadw ffeithiau, gan ddwyn i gof Mr Gradgrind o *Hard Times* Charles Dickens, a fynnai y dylai fod a wnelo addysg, yn enwedig i'r dosbarth gweithiol, â ffeithiau a dim arall, rhag iddynt fynd uwchlaw eu hunain. Yn groes i hynny, nid yw'r cwricwlwm fel ag y mae yn rhoi yn agos ddigon o bwyslais ar alluogi disgyblion i ddysgu 'sut i wneud'—sut i ddysgu, sut i gyfathrebu ac ati—neu, mewn geiriau eraill, i ddatblygu sgiliau.

Dylid cynnig agweddau pwysig ar brofiad y cwricwlwm i bobl ifanc—yn benodol, y cyfle i ddatblygu dealltwriaeth o'r byd cymdeithasol, gwleidyddol ac economaidd o'u cwmpas—na chânt eu cynnwys yn hawdd o fewn cwricwlwm a ddiffinnir i raddau helaeth yn nhermau pynciau academiaidd. Mae'r system o brofion ac arholiadau'n anhyblyg, yn hen-ffasiwn ac yn or-gymhleth, gan achosi i lawer gormod o bobl ifanc adael addysg ffurfiol â theimlad dwfn o fethiant, anhoffter dwfn o unrhyw beth a welant fel dysgu ffurfiol, ac, weithiau, ddieter parhaus.

Dywed cyflogwyr wrthym fod llawer o'r sgiliau yr hoffent weld mewn gweithwyr newydd, fel sgiliau cyfathrebu a chreadigrwydd, yn aml yn druenus o ddiffygiol yn y bobl ifanc sy'n gadael yr

qualifications system so complex that they are sometimes at a loss as to which qualifications they should ask for when advertising a post. One employer told me, 'I often ask for A-levels because at least I know what they are, when I probably need someone with more practical skills.'

In our aim of creating a truly learning country, we are hamstrung by a national curriculum that does not meet the needs of learners or employers and which frustrates and stifles teachers and pupils. The new Education Bill will give the Assembly full power to create a new curriculum that could truly meet the educational, economic, social and cultural needs of all our communities. Plaid Cymru is giving the Assembly an opportunity to put in train a process that would deliver on this radical and challenging agenda.

We believe that a new national curriculum should be shaped around four main phases: a foundation curriculum for those aged up to seven; a common primary curriculum for seven to 11-year-olds; a common secondary curriculum for 11 to 14-year-olds; and a curriculum framework for individual choices at 14-plus. Each curriculum programme would contain common elements and themes, adjusted for the student's age and level of attainment. These elements would include: learning to communicate; learning to live and work together; becoming an autonomous, self-directed learner; fostering individual talents; building a broad personal knowledge base; and acquiring the skills and knowledge to be an active citizen.

The requirement to cover specific content would be greatly reduced to give more space for the development of skills and, importantly, to enable teachers to develop topics and themes of interest and relevance to pupils' lives. The framework for individual choices would contain common core elements, but would allow for much more individual choice, and facilitate parity of esteem between academic and vocational learning. Gareth Jones will discuss this further later in the debate.

ysgol a'r coleg. Dywedant hefyd eu bod yn gweld y system gymwysterau mor gymhleth fel eu bod weithiau'n methu meddwl pa gymwysterau y dylent ofyn amdanynt wrth hysbysebu swydd. Dywedodd un cyflogwr wrthyf, 'Byddaf yn aml yn gofyn am lefel-A am fy mod o leiaf yn gwybod beth ydyw, ond mae'n debyg fod angen rhywun â sgiliau mwy ymarferol arnaf.'

Yn ein nod o greu gwir wlad sy'n dysgu, cawn ein llyffetheirio gan gwricwlwm cenedlaethol nad yw'n ateb anghenion dysgwyr na chyflogwyr, ac sy'n rhwystro a diflasu athrawon a disgyblion. Bydd y Mesur Addysg newydd yn rhoi grym llawn i'r Cynulliad greu cwricwlwm newydd a allai'n wirioneddol ateb anghenion addysgol, economaidd, cymdeithasol a diwylliannol ein cymunedau i gyd. Mae Plaid Cymru'n rhoi cyfle i'r Cynulliad gychwyn proses a fyddai'n bwrw'r maen i'r wal ar yr agenda radical a heriol hon.

Credwn y dylid ffurfio cwricwlwm cenedlaethol newydd o gwmpas pedwar prif gam: cwricwlwm sylfaen i rai hyd at saith mlwydd oed; cwricwlwm cynradd cyffredin i blant saith i 11 mlwydd oed; cwricwlwm uwchradd cyffredin i blant 11 i 14 oed; a fframwaith cwricwlwm ar gyfer dewisiadau unigol i rai 14 oed a throsodd. Byddai pob rhaglen gwricwlwm yn cynnwys elfennau a themâu cyffredin, wedi'u haddasu at oed a lefel cyrhaeddiad y myfyriwr. Byddai'r elfennau hyn yn cynnwys: dysgu cyfathrebu; dysgu cyd-fyw a chydweithio; mynd yn ddysgwr annibynnol, hunan-gyfeiriol; meithrin talentau unigol; adeiladu sylfaen eang o wybodaeth bersonol; a chaffael y sgiliau a'r wybodaeth i fod yn ddinesydd gweithredol.

Byddai'r gofyniad i fynd dros gynnwys penodol yn cael ei leihau'n fawr i roi mwy o le ar gyfer datblygu sgiliau ac, yn bwysig, i alluogi athrawon i ddatblygu pynciau a themâu o ddiddordeb a pherthnasedd i fywydau'r disgyblion. Byddai'r fframwaith ar gyfer dewisiadau'r unigolyn yn cynnwys rhai elfennau craidd cyffredin, ond byddai'n caniatáu llawer mwy o ddewis i'r unigolyn, ac yn hyrwyddo parch cyfartal rhwng dysgu academiaidd a dysgu galwedigaethol. Bydd Gareth Jones yn trafod hyn ymhellach yn

ddiweddarach yn y ddadl.

Today's rigid and divisive testing regimes—designed as they were to measure school rather than individual pupil performance and, sadly, to set school against school in damaging, Thatcherite competition—would be replaced by assessment for learning, with off-the-peg tests available to enable teachers to test pupil progress when the individual is ready for testing, so that teachers, pupils and parents can assess how pupils are performing. There would also be periodic sampling to monitor overall pupil and student performance across the nation.

Yn lle'r drefn brofi anhyblyg ac ymrannol sydd ohoni—a gynlluniwyd i fesur perfformiad ysgolion yn hytrach na disgyblion unigol ac, ysywaeth, i osod ysgol yn erbyn ysgol mewn cystadleuaeth niweidiol, Thatcheriaid—ceid asesiad ar gyfer dysgu, gyda phroffion parod i alluogi athrawon i brofi cynnydd disgyblion pan fo'r unigolyn yn barod i'w brofi, fel y gall athrawon, disgyblion a rhieni asesu sut y mae'r disgyblion yn perfformio. Ceid samplio cyfnodol hefyd i fonitro perfformiad cyffredinol disgyblion a myfyrwyr ledled y wlad.

Such a regime would give due credence to the professionalism of teachers, who constantly monitor and evaluate their pupils' progress as a matter of course. It would also reduce bureaucratic burdens. Likewise, our proposed new curriculum would enable teachers to use their creativity and individual skills and talents much more freely in the classroom than currently. Both initial and continuing teacher training would need to be adapted to allow for this.

Byddai trefn o'r fath yn rhoi'r hygredd dyledus i broffesiynoldeb athrawon, sy'n gyson yn monitro a gwerthuso gwaith eu disgyblion fel mater o drefn. Byddai'n lleihau'r baich biwrocraidaidd hefyd. Hefyd, byddai ein cwricwlwm newydd arfaethedig yn galluogi athrawon i ddefnyddio'u creadigrwydd, sgiliau a'u talentau unigol yn llawer mwy rhydd yn yr ystafell ddosbarth nag ar hyn o bryd. Byddai angen addasu hyfforddiant cychwynnol a pharhaus athrawon i alluogi hynny.

Such far-reaching and radical change would take time, and that is why this process must start now. Wide consultation will be essential, as will a public awareness campaign, to explain changes as they are being implemented. There are positives to build on. Elements of the current Curriculum Cymreig have been broadly welcomed, and the Minister is reviewing the curriculum for 14 to 19-year-olds, with consultation beginning in the autumn. We welcome this, but much more radical change is needed and that process must start now.

Byddai newid mor bellgyrhaeddol a radical yn cymryd amser, a dyna pam y mae'n rhaid i'r broses hon ddechrau'n awr. Bydd yn rhaid ymgynghori'n eang, ynghyd ag ymgyrchu i godi ymwybyddiaeth y cyhoedd, i egluro'r newidiadau wrth iddynt ddigwydd. Mae pethau cadarnhaol i adeiladu arnynt. Cafwyd croeso cyffredinol i elfennau o'r Cwricwlwm Cymreig cyfredol, ac mae'r Gweinidog yn adolygu'r cwricwlwm i ddisgyblion 14 i 19 oed, gan ddechrau ymgynghori yn yr hydref. Croesawn hyn, ond mae angen newid llawer mwy radical a rhaid i'r broses honno ddechrau yn awr.

Finally, I will comment on the amendments. I ask the Assembly to reject the Government's amendment 1 on the grounds that it is the Government's usual, self-congratulatory tosh. It is meaningless and smug. It stubbornly ignores the experience of teachers and learners and the advice of experts. It does nothing to develop the debate on the curriculum and it is, sadly, another example of this Government's refusal to accept any

Yn olaf, rhoddaf sylwadau ar y gwelliannau. Gofynnaf i'r Cynulliad wrthod gwelliant 1 y Llywodraeth ar y sail mai sothach hunanlongyfarchol arferol y Llywodraeth ydyw. Mae'n ddiystyr a hunanfodlon. Mae'n anwybyddu'n benstiff brofiad yr athrawon a'r dysgwyr a chyngor yr arbenigwyr. Nid yw'n gwneud dim i ddatblygu'r ddadl ar y cwricwlwm ac y mae, gwaetha'r modd, yn enghraifft arall o wrthodiad y Llywodraeth

positive input from the opposition.

hon i dderbyn unrhyw fewnbwn cadarnhaol gan yr wrthblaid.

We cannot support the amendment in the name of Jonathan Morgan either. Although we endorse the need for a new curriculum to include provision for individuals to develop their talents, we reject the concept of specialist schools, as the Assembly has done on several occasions. Specialist schools inevitably lead to an element of selection, which is elitist and divisive. It is irrelevant to much of our nation where geography renders community schools the only viable option, as well as the preferred option.

Ni allwn gefnogi'r gwelliant yn enw Jonathan Morgan ychwaith. Er ein bod yn ategu'r angen am gwricwlwm newydd i gynnwys darpariaeth i unigolion ddatblygu eu talentau, gwrthodwn gysyniad ysgolion arbenigol, fel y gwnaeth y Cynulliad ar sawl achlysur. Mae ysgolion arbenigol yn anochel yn arwain at elfen o ddethol, sy'n elitaidd ac yn ymrannol. Mae'n amherthnasol i lawer o'n cenedl lle golyga daearyddiaeth mai ysgolion cymunedol yw'r unig ddewis, yn ogystal â'r dewis a ffafrir.

I look forward to this debate and to the opportunity to respond.

Edrychaf ymlaen at y ddatl hon ac at y cyfle i ymateb.

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I propose amendment 1 in the name of Carwyn Jones. Delete all after 'National Assembly' and replace with:

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Cynigiau welliant 1 yn enw Carwyn Jones. Dileu popeth ar ôl 'Cynulliad Cenedlaethol' a rhoi yn eu lle:

1. welcomes the vision for, and commitment to, education in Wales set out in 'The Learning Country';

1. yn croesawu'r weledigaeth ar gyfer addysg yng Nghymru, a'r ymrwymiad iddi, fel ag a nodir yn 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu';

2. welcomes the developments in the curriculum and their responsiveness to the social, economic and cultural needs of Wales;

2. yn croesawu'r datblygiadau yn y cwricwlwm a'r ffaith eu bod yn ymateb i anghenion cymdeithasol, economaidd a diwylliannol Cymru ;

3. endorses the way in which policies are being developed and implemented in consultation with all relevant stakeholders.

3. yn ardystio'r modd y caiff polisiau eu datblygu a'u rhoi ar waith mewn ymgynghoriad â'r holl garfanau perthnasol.

Jonathan Morgan: I propose amendment 2. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Jonathan Morgan: Cynigiau welliant 2. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

calls upon the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to ensure a greater degree of flexibility in the curriculum to allow schools to develop a specialist agenda.

yn galw ar y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i sicrhau mwy o hyblygrwydd yn y cwricwlwm i ganiatáu i ysgolion ddatblygu agenda arbenigol.

We will not support the Government's amendment which, as Helen Mary Jones rightly said, is self-congratulatory. However, if my amendment is not carried, we will not support Plaid Cymru's motion. Having listened to Helen Mary Jones, you would assume that the curriculum in Wales is an absolute disaster and does nothing to enhance

Ni chefnogwn welliant y Llywodraeth, sydd, fel y dywedodd Helen Mary Jones yn gywir, yn hunan-longyfarchol. Fodd bynnag, os na dderbynnir fy ngwelliant, ni wnawn gefnogi cynnig Plaid Cymru. Wedi gwrandao ar Helen Mary Jones, gallech dybio fod y cwricwlwm yng Nghymru yn drychineb llwyr ac nad yw'n gwneud dim i wella gallu addysgol,

the educational, academic and personal abilities of this nation's young people. That is grossly inaccurate and an insult to the many teaching professionals who do so much excellent work to raise educational standards, promote diversity and academic excellence, and contribute to attaining the skills that we need in Wales. The motion is dangerous and divisive. I listened with interest to Helen Mary Jones's social, political and economic vision for the world, and her attempt to create and socially engineer young people for the future. She seems to have a blueprint for what a young person should be, what a young person should learn and how a young person should think. Orwell's *1984* comes to mind. It is divisive and dangerous.

I will address her remarks about schools pushing the retention of facts and testing children too much. I believe that a child's ability to think and retain facts and information, and the education system's ability to test young people and examine how well they have developed in retaining that information, is educationally sound. It is right and proper that an education system promotes the learning of facts and judges how young people are developing. I heard nothing in what she said that leads me to conclude that she offers a new system for Wales that will radically improve our teaching methods, our young people's ability to learn, or our ability to test them to see how they are developing. Plaid Cymru's contribution is astonishing.

To consider the current situation, we have an Education Bill that will become law, hopefully, this month—

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Having listened to your contribution, I can only assume that you have not studied the motion or the accompanying document, written by Professor Richard Daugherty. Are you saying that Professor Daugherty does not understand the curriculum and has no contribution to make to improving it?

Jonathan Morgan: I will happily respond to the document to which you referred. I have not read it and Professor Daugherty has not circulated it to me as a member of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee.

academaidd a phersonol pobl ifanc y genedl hon. Mae hynny ymhell ohoni ac yn sarhad ar y nifer o athrawon proffesiynol sy'n gwneud cymaint o waith ardderchog i godi safonau addysgol, hyrwyddo amrywiaeth a rhagoriaeth academaidd, a chyfrannu at sicrhau'r sgiliau y mae eu hangen arnom yng Nghymru. Mae'r cynnig yn beryglus ac yn ymrannol. Gwrandewais â diddordeb ar weledigaeth gymdeithasol, wleidyddol ac economaidd Helen Mary Jones ar gyfer y byd, a'i hymgais i greu a chyflyru pobl ifanc ar gyfer y dyfodol. Mae'n ymddangos fod ganddi lasbrint ar gyfer yr hyn y dylai person ifanc fod, beth y dylai person ifanc ei ddysgu a sut y dylai person ifanc feddwl. Daw *1984* Orwell i'r meddwl. Mae'n ymrannol ac yn beryglus.

Atebaf ei sylwadau fod ysgolion yn gwthio gormod ar gael plant i gadw ffeithiau a gosod profion iddynt. Credaf fod gallu plentyn i feddwl a chadw ffeithiau a gwybodaeth, a gallu'r gyfundrefn addysg i brofi pobl ifanc ac arholi pa mor dda y maent wedi datblygu o ran cadw'r wybodaeth honno, yn addysgol gadarn. Mae'n iawn ac yn briodol fod cyfundrefn addysg yn hyrwyddo dysgu ffeithiau ac yn barnu'r modd y mae pobl ifanc yn datblygu. Ni chlywais ddim yn yr hyn a ddywedodd i'm harwain at y casgliad ei bod yn cynnig cyfundrefn newydd i Gymru a fydd yn creu gwellhad radical yn ein dulliau dysgu, yng ngallu ein pobl ifanc i ddysgu, nac yn ein gallu ni i'w profi i weld sut y maent yn datblygu. Mae cyfraniad Plaid Cymru yn syfrdanol.

Ac ystyried y sefyllfa gyfredol, mae gennym Fesur Addysg a ddaw yn gyfraith, gobeithio, y mis yma—

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Wedi gwrandao ar eich cyfraniad, ni allaf ond tybio nad ydych wedi astudio'r cynnig na'r ddogfen atodol, a ysgrifennwyd gan yr Athro Richard Daugherty. A ydych yn dweud nad yw'r Athro Daugherty yn deall y cwricwlwm ac nad oes ganddo gyfraniad wrth geisio'i wella?

Jonathan Morgan: Ymatebaf yn llawen i'r ddogfen y cyfeirioch ati. Nid wyf wedi ei darllen ac nid yw'r Athro Daugherty wedi ei hanfon ataf fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Cyfeiriaf at fy mhrofiadau

I refer to my experiences of visiting schools and talking to teachers. You would be far better off spending your time talking to people who work in our schools. It is easy to sit in ivory towers and provide information that is of interest to you.

David Melding: I fear that you have been naughty in not reading the document. I am sure that Plaid Cymru will send you one of its political education courses.

Jonathan Morgan: I would be happy to examine any research that Plaid Cymru wanted me to consider. You might want to table it on the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee's agenda so that we can tear it limb from limb and examine the details.

4:50 p.m.

Cynog Dafis: Edrychaf ymlaen at weld Jonathan Morgan yn mynd i'r afael â dogfen y mae un o brif arbenigwyr y maes wedi gweithio mor ofalus arni. Caiff gyfle i wirio'r ddogfen yn ofalus gan ein bod yn bwriadu ei rhyddhau ar gyfer ymgynghori helaeth. Yr wyf hefyd yn ei sicrhau fy mod yn siarad ag athrawon ac yn mynd i ysgolion yn gyson.

Jonathan Morgan: I am sure that you will send me a copy so that I can be involved in your consultation process. We have consulted every school in Wales and have received approximately 500 responses so far; that holds more weight than a response from one individual. The Education Bill is hugely significant and mentions the curriculum. It would have been wise to wait for that Bill to have been enacted, and for us to have debated the Government's response. The Qualifications Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales's review of the curriculum is also hugely significant, and I am sure that it will produce interesting results.

To turn to amendment 2 in my name, I believe that we in Wales lack vision. I agree that the curriculum must be far more flexible. Schools should develop a more specialist agenda where possible, if they so wish. The Education Bill provides the English

o ymweld ag ysgolion a siarad ag athrawon. Byddai'n llawer gwell i chi dreulio'ch amser yn siarad â phobl sy'n gweithio yn ein hysgolion. Mae'n hawdd eistedd mewn tyrau ifori a darparu gwybodaeth sydd o ddiddordeb i chi.

David Melding: Ofnaf eich bod wedi bod yn fachgen drwg yn peidio â darllen y ddogfen. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnaiff Plaid Cymru anfon un o'i chyrtsiau addysg wleidyddol atoch.

Jonathan Morgan: Byddwn yn hapus i ddarllen unrhyw ymchwil y dymunai Plaid Cymru imi ei ystyried. Efallai yr hoffech ei gyflwyno ar agenda'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes fel y gallwn ei ddatgymalu ac archwilio'r manylion.

Cynog Dafis: I look forward to seeing Jonathan Morgan getting to grips with a document that has been so carefully thought through by one of the leading specialists in the subject. He will get the opportunity to examine the document carefully as we intend to release it for extensive consultation. I also assure him that I regularly talk to teachers and visit schools.

Jonathan Morgan: Yr wyf yn siŵr yr anfonwch gopi ataf fel y gallaf gymryd rhan yn eich proses ymgynghori. Yr ydym wedi ymgynghori â phob ysgol yng Nghymru ac wedi derbyn oddeutu 500 ymateb hyd yn hyn; mae hynny'n cario mwy o bwysau nag ymateb un unigolyn. Mae'r Mesur Addysg yn aruthrol o arwyddocaol ac mae'n crybwyll y cwricwlwm. Buasai'n ddoeth aros hyd nes deddfu'r Mesur hwnnw, ac inni fod wedi trafod ymateb y Llywodraeth. Mae adolygiad Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru o'r cwricwlwm yn aruthrol o arwyddocaol hefyd, ac yr wyf yn siŵr yr esgora ar ganlyniadau diddorol.

A throi at welliant 2 yn fy enw, credaf ein bod yng Nghymru'n brin o weledigaeth. Cytunaf fod yn rhaid i'r cwricwlwm fod yn llawer mwy hyblyg. Dylai ysgolion ddatblygu agenda fwy arbenigol lle bo modd, os dymunant. Mae'r Mesur Addysg yn

education system with far greater diversity in allowing the establishment of academies and specialist schools. Wales will not be able to do that, despite the fact that the Secretary of State for Education and Skills, Estelle Morris, says that, in many respects, she would not touch comprehensive schools with a bargepole, and the Prime Minister says that the comprehensive system is bog standard. I do not agree with that: I believe that the comprehensive system has produced some good results, but it needs improving. I fear that the Education Bill and the ensuing Act will result in a two-tier system in the United Kingdom, with the education system in England being far more progressive, and offering more opportunities for young people to develop, than the education system in Wales. Wales should have the same opportunities.

Plaid Cymru's motion echoes the principles of the Welsh baccalaureate, which is a dangerous addition to the education system in Wales. I do not believe that this debate contributes one iota to developing a real, diverse, flexible curriculum for Wales.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I appeal for short speeches, as there is not enough time for everyone who wishes to contribute to this debate to do so.

Cynog Dafis: Ceisiaf roi ymateb byr. Bydd Plaid Cymru yn rhyddhau cyfres o ddogfennau polisi ar wahanol feysydd dros y misoedd nesaf, a chredaf y byddai'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yn ystyried hynny'n gyfraniad cadarnhaol tuag at ddatblygu polisi, ac nid fel sail ymosodiad, fel y mae Jonathan Morgan yn ei ystyried. Nid yw wedi dechrau deall sylfaen y mater.

Cyfeiriaf at rai o brif elfennau'r argymhellion, gan gychwyn gyda'r angen i wneud y gofynion ar athrawon, plant a phobl ifanc yn llai haearnaidd a chyfyngus o lawer nag y maent ar hyn o bryd. Dylem ganiatáu i athrawon fod yn fwy creadigol, sy'n rhan o'u parchu fel pobl broffesiynol, ac maent yn gofyn am hynny. Dylem hefyd sicrhau gofod ac amser i ddilyn trywyddau a ddewisir gan yr athrawon a'r disgyblion. Mae'r papur, felly, yn argymhell ein bod yn lleihau yn sylweddol gynnwys gosodedig y pynciau.

caniatáu llawer mwy o amrywiaeth i'r gyfundrefn addysg yn Lloegr wrth ganiatáu sefydlu academiâu ac ysgolion arbenigol. Ni fydd Cymru'n gallu gwneud hynny, er gwaethaf y ffaith fod yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Addysg a Sgiliau, Estelle Morris, yn dweud na fyddai hi, ar lawer cyfrif, yn dymuno cael dim i'w wneud ag ysgolion cyfun, a bod Prif Weinidog y DU yn dweud bod y system gyfun yn gyffredin iawn. Ni chytunaf â hynny: credaf fod y gyfundrefn gyfun wedi cynhyrchu rhai canlyniadau da, ond mae angen ei gwella. Ofnaf y bydd y Mesur Addysg a'r Ddeddf a ddaw ohono'n creu cyfundrefn ddwy-haen yn y Deyrnas Unedig, gyda chyfundrefn addysg Lloegr llawer yn fwy blaengar, ac yn cynnig mwy o gyfleoedd i bobl ifanc ddatblygu, na chyfundrefn addysg Cymru. Dylai Cymru gael yr un cyfleoedd.

Mae cynnig Plaid Cymru yn adleisio egwyddorion y fagloriaeth Gymreig, sy'n ychwanegiad peryglus i gyfundrefn addysg Cymru. Ni chredaf fod y ddadl hon yn cyfrannu yr un iot at ddatblygu cwricwlwm amrywiol, hyblyg go iawn i Gymru.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Apeliaf am areithiau byr, gan nad oes digon o amser i bawb sy'n dymuno cyfrannu at y ddadl hon wneud hynny.

Cynog Dafis: I will try to respond briefly. Over the next months, Plaid Cymru will release a series of policy documents on various subjects, and I believe that the majority of people will consider this a positive contribution to policy development, and not as a basis for attack, as Jonathan Morgan considers it. He has not even begun to understand the basics of the matter.

I will refer to some of the main elements of the recommendations, beginning with the need to make the demands on teachers, children and young people much less rigid and restrictive than they are at present. We should allow teachers to be more creative, which is part of respecting them as professionals, and they have asked for that. We should also ensure space and time for following paths chosen by teachers and pupils. The paper, therefore, recommends that we significantly decrease the set content

Mae hefyd yn argymhell ein bod yn gohirio'r amserlen ffurfiol o bryd i'w gilydd er mwyn canolbwyntio ar raglenni megis addysg bersonol, iechyd a chymdeithasol, a dysgu'n seiliedig ar y gymuned. Dylai'r pynciau hyn ddod yn rhan ganolog o'r cwricwlwm yn hytrach nag yn eitemau ychwanegol, fel y maent ar hyn o bryd.

Yn ail, dylem symleiddio'r cwricwlwm drwy leihau nifer y camau sy'nddo—yr ydym eisoes wedi cael esboniad o hyn, felly, nid wyf am ei ailadrodd. Mae hefyd angen gostyngiad sylweddol yn y baich o asesu a phrofi ar athrawon a disgyblion. Nid yw'r maes hwn wedi cael ei dargedu'n ddigon gofalus i gael y wybodaeth angenrheidiol.

Yn drydydd, dylem geisio sicrhau cydbwysedd.

Jonathan Morgan: On the burden of assessment and testing, I assume that you support an element of testing somewhere during a child's school career. Therefore, at which stage do you support it?

Cynog Dafis: Cewch weld hynny i gyd ym manylion y ddogfen. Meddylwyd am hynny. Nid oes amser gennyf mewn araith bum munud i ddisgrifio'r system o brofi ac asesu y credwn sy'n briodol. Rhaid cael dealltwriaeth glir o'r hyn sy'n digwydd i'r plentyn, cam datblygiadol y plentyn, a gwybodaeth hefyd ynglŷn â pherfformiad y system yn gyffredinol. Ar hyn o bryd, mae gennym un system o brofion haearnidd ac anhyblyg sy'n ceisio gwneud y cwbl. Rhaid newid hynny.

Y trydydd pwynt yw'r angen am gydbwysedd. Rhaid sicrhau pwyslais, ar y naill law, ar adlewyrchu a chynnal yr hyn sy'n benodol ac yn wahanol ynghylch cymdeithas a diwylliant Cymru. Rhaid i hwn, am y tro cyntaf erioed, fod yn gwricwlwm cenedlaethol Cymreig. Ni ddylai hynny fod yn simplistig ac yn gul. Rhaid iddo gynnwys yr holl amrywiaeth sy'n rhan o fywyd Cymru heddiw, gyda'r nod clir o greu Cymru ddwyieithog. Ar y llaw arall, rhaid cael pwyslais ar ddinasyddiaeth fyd, cyfrifoldeb i ddynol ryw yn gyffredinol, a phwyslais ar gynnal y byd ar gyfer pobl y dyfodol ac yn y blaen.

within subjects. It also recommends that we suspend the formal timetable periodically to concentrate on programmes such as personal, health and social education, and community-based learning. These should become core curriculum subjects rather than add-ons, as they are at present.

Secondly, we should simplify the curriculum by decreasing the number of steps within it—we have already had an explanation of this, and therefore I will not repeat it. We should also significantly reduce the burden of assessing and testing on teachers and pupils. This area has not been targeted carefully enough to obtain the necessary information.

Thirdly, we should try to ensure a balance.

Jonathan Morgan: Ar y baich o asesu a phrofi, cymeraf eich bod yn cefnogi elfen o brofi rhywbryd yn ystod gyrfa ysgol plentyn. Ar ba gam, felly, yr ydych yn ei gefnogi?

Cynog Dafis: You will see all of that in the document's details. That has been thought through. I do not have time in a five-minute speech to describe the system of testing and assessing that we believe is appropriate. There must be a clear understanding of what is happening to the child, what developmental stage the child is at, and there must be information about the performance of the system in general. At present, we have a rigid and inflexible system of testing that tries to do everything. That must be changed.

The third point is the need for balance. There must be an emphasis, on the one hand, on reflecting and maintaining what is specific and different about society and culture in Wales. This, for the first time ever, must be a Welsh national curriculum. It should not be simplistic and narrow. It must include all the diversity that is a part of Welsh life today, with the clear aim of creating a bilingual Wales. On the other hand, there must be an emphasis on world citizenship, a responsibility to mankind in general, and an emphasis on sustaining the world for future generations and so on.

Y pedwerydd pwynt yw cwricwlwm sy'n darparu cydbwysedd rhwng gofynion yr unigolyn, sy'n meithrin doniau personol i'r eithaf, yn rhoi sylfaen eang o wybodaeth, yn meithrin sgiliau i ymdopi â byw a gwneud bywoliaeth ar y naill llaw, a gofynion y gymdeithas ar y llaw arall. Mae'r pwyslais ar gyd-fyw a chydweithio a meithrin sgiliau i fod yn ddinesydd gweithredol—pwyntiau sy'n cael eu hesgeuluso'n ddifrifol yn y cwricwlwm ar hyn o bryd. Mae angen pwyslais ar yr amgylchedd lleol, cenedlaethol a byd eang. Mae angen gwell cydbwysedd rhwng 'gwybod am' a 'gwybod i'. Mae'n wahaniaeth pwysig, ac ar hyn o bryd, mae'r pwyslais yn drwm ar y 'gwybod am' oherwydd gorlwytho ar fanylion yn y cwricwlwm. Mae angen creu dysgwyr ymreolus, hunangyfeiriedig.

Mae angen cwricwlwm sy'n addas i gyflwr datblygiadol yr unigolyn. Nid yw hynny i'w weld yn glir yn y cwricwlwm ar hyn o bryd. Mae trafodaeth yn y ddogfen ar y cyfnod gosod sylfaen, sef y cyfnod rhwng genedigaeth a saith mlwydd oed, ac awgrym y gellid trefnu'r cwricwlwm—[*Torri ar draws.*]

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Please switch off that mobile phone.

Cynog Dafis: Mae'r larwm yn canu i'r Gweinidog mewn mwy nag un ystyr.

Jane Davidson: It was not my phone.

Cynog Dafis: Cloc larwm siŵr o fod.

Soniais am ymdopi â'r byd ffisegol; er enghraifft, gwybod sut mae trafod ffonau symudol. Mae'r fframwaith ar gyfer y cyfnod rhwng genedigaeth a saith mlwydd oed yn cynnwys arferion cyfathrebu, cydberthynas pobl â'i gilydd, arferion mewn celf a dylunio a gwersi am werthoedd a chredo. Mae angen gweld cwricwlwm yr ysgol fel rhan o gontinwmm sy'n dechrau cyn yr ysgol ac yn parhau wedyn. Dylai fod yn baratoad ar gyfer dysgu gydol oes. Dylai'r cyfnod o 14 i 18 oed fod yn bont rhwng addysg orfodol ac addysg o ddewis. Mae'r papur yn disgrifio argymhellion ar gyfer hynny, yn seiliedig ar y

The fourth point is a curriculum that provides a balance between the needs of individuals, which nurtures personal skills to the greatest degree possible, provides a broad base of information, and nurtures skills for life and making a living on the one hand, and society's requirements on the other hand. The emphasis is on living and working together and acquiring the skills to become an active citizen—points that are severely neglected in the current curriculum. Emphasis should be placed on the local, national and worldwide environment. A much better balance is needed between 'knowing about' and 'knowing for'. That is an important difference, and at present, the emphasis is strong on 'knowing about' because of an overload of details in the curriculum. Autonomous, self-directed learners must be created.

The curriculum must be appropriate for the developmental state of the individual. That is not evident in the present curriculum. There is a debate in the document on the set foundation period, namely the period from birth to seven years old, and a suggestion that the curriculum could be arranged—[*Interruption.*]

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Diffoddwch y ffôn symudol honno, os gwelwch yn dda.

Cynog Dafis: Alarm bells are ringing for the Minister, in more than one sense.

Jane Davidson: Nid fy ffôn i oedd hi.

Cynog Dafis: An alarm clock, probably.

I was talking about coping with the physical world; for example, knowing how to deal with mobile phones. The framework for the period between birth and seven years of age includes communication practices, people's relationships with each other, art and design practices and lessons on values and beliefs. The school curriculum must be seen as part of a continuum, which starts before school and continues after it. It should be a preparation for lifelong learning. The period between 14 and 18 years of age should be a bridge between compulsory education and optional education. The paper describes

fagloriaeth, ond heb sôn yn ganmoliaethus am fagloriaeth bresennol y Gweinidog.

Papur Plaid Cymru yw hwn—dyna pam nad ydym wedi dosbarthu copïau i bawb arall eto, ond fe’u cewch am bris rhesymol—ac fe gynhelir ymgynghori eang arno. Mae’n rhan o’n proses ni o arwain datblygu polisi dros y misoedd nesaf. Gallwch ddisgwyl llawer mwy o hyn. Fe’n gwahoddiwyd i gyfrannu’n gadarnhaol at syniadau polisi, ac yr ydym yn gwneud hynny. Rhagwelwn y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn cychwyn y broses ymgynghori cyn bo hir.

David Melding: Point of order. Is it in order for a Minister to be absent when her mobile phone rings?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have no idea to whom this mobile phone belongs. However, I deprecate mobile phones going off in Plenary. It is a discourtesy that should not happen.

5:00 p.m.

Lorraine Barrett: It was not my phone. It sounded like my tune, but it was not mine.

I am amazed at Plaid Cymru’s sad attempts today to discredit the Curriculum Cymreig. There is nothing new in its education paper. We already have a curriculum framework for three to seven-year-olds, eight to 11-year-olds, 11 to 14-year-olds, and 14 to 19-year-olds, and ACCAC—as I believe Jonathan already mentioned—is reviewing the curriculum for 14 to 19-year-olds. The paper suggests cutting key stage 1 tests. That is already being done, and a range of distinctive measures in ‘The Learning Country’ set out a radical vision for education in Wales. Helen Mary Jones mentioned off-the-peg testing—I apologise if those were not her exact words—to be done when each child is ready. I wonder whether the bureaucracy that that would mean for teachers has been thought through; they would have to test at times to suit each child. I did not want to stop Helen in full flow, but during her contribution I wanted to

recommendations for that, which are based on the baccalaureate, but are not complimentary about the Minister’s current baccalaureate.

This is Plaid Cymru’s paper—that is why we have not yet distributed copies to everyone else, but you will get them for a reasonable price—and it will be the subject of wide consultation. It is part of our process of leading policy development over the coming months. You can expect a great deal more of this. We have been invited to contribute constructively to policy ideas, and we are doing that. We foresee that the Government of Wales will begin the consultation process soon.

David Melding: Pwynt o drefn. A ydyw mewn trefn i Weinidog fod yn absennol pan fydd ei ffôn symudol yn canu?

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Nid oes gennyf syniad pwy biau’r ffôn symudol hon. Fodd bynnag, anghymeradwyaf ffonau symudol yn canu mewn Cyfarfod Llawn. Mae’n anghwrteisi ac ni ddylai ddigwydd.

Lorraine Barrett: Nid fy ffôn i ydoedd. Yr oedd yn swnio’n debyg i fy alaw i, ond nid f’un i ydoedd.

Yr wyf yn rhyfeddu at ymgeision trist Plaid Cymru heddiw i ddifrio’r Cwricwlwm Cymreig. Nid oes dim byd newydd yn ei phapur addysg. Mae gennym fframwaith cwricwlwm eisoes i blant tair i saith mlwydd oed, wyth i 11 oed, 11 i 14 oed a 14 i 19 mlwydd oed, ac mae ACCAC—fel y crybwyllodd Jonathan yn barod, mi gredaf—yn adolygu’r cwricwlwm i rai 14 i 19 oed. Mae’r papur yn awgrymu dileu profion cyfnod allweddol 1. Mae hynny’n digwydd eisoes, ac mae amrediad o fesurau arbennig yn ‘Y Wlad sy’n Dysgu’ yn amlinellu gweledigaeth radical ar gyfer addysg yng Nghymru. Soniodd Helen Mary Jones am brofion parod—ymddiheuraf os nad dyna oedd ei hunion eiriau—i’w gwneud pan fydd pob plentyn yn barod. Tybed a feddyliwyd trwy’r fiwrocratiaeth y byddai hynny’n ei olygu i athrawon; byddai’n rhaid iddynt brofi ar adegau sy’n addas i bob plentyn. Nid oedd

ask whether she remembered Gareth Jones's words on 19 January 2000, during the debate on the outcome of the national curriculum review. The motion to welcome the first curriculum to be developed in Wales was unanimously carried and Gareth Jones said:

'the reviewed curriculum deserves to be warmly welcomed and acknowledged as an important milestone in the history and development of education in Wales.... For the first time ever we will have a national curriculum that will have been developed in Wales and that will reflect the special needs of Wales.'

It is rather worrying that we are only two years down the road and Plaid Cymru is already talking about changing that curriculum. If that does not cause unrest and disquiet in our schools and extra work for teachers, I do not know what will.

Gareth Jones: Yr wyf yn falch o'r cyfle i gyfrannu at ddadl o bwys a sbardunwyd gan ddadansoddiad meistrolgar yr Athro Richard Daugherty ar gwricwlwm sydd, yn ei farn ef, yn lobsgows o Orchmynion Llywodraeth, diwygiadau marchnatgar a beichiau biwrocratig. Dyna gyfraniad y Ceidwadwyr, a dyna ddigon amdanynt hwy. Eglura ymhellach bod gor-ganoli'r cwricwlwm ac asesu yn nwylo'r Llywodraeth ganolog yn addysgiadol niweidiol ac yn arwain at gwricwlwm cenedlaethol diffygiol. Yn wir, o gyflysu sylwadau'r athro a darganfyddiadau Estyn ar brofiadau dysgu a bodloni anghenion a buddiannau ein disgyblion, gwelwn bod lle i bryderu. Dywed Estyn:

'bod nifer o ysgolion yn canolbwyntio'n ormodol ar bynciau'r cwricwlwm craidd, yn enwedig ym mlwyddyn 5 a 6 i baratoi disgyblion ar gyfer y profion cenedlaethol ac yn esgeuluso agweddau megis celf, cerddoriaeth, addysg gorfforol, dylunio a thechnoleg.'

Yn ôl Estyn eto, mae'r arfer o amserlennu i

arnaf eisiau teui Helen ar ganol ei llifeiriant, ond yn ystod ei chyfraniad yr oeddwn am ofyn a oedd hi'n cofio geiriau Gareth Jones ar 19 Ionawr 2000, yn ystod y ddadl ar ganlyniad yr adolygiad o'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol. Derbyniwyd y cynnig i groesawu'r cwricwlwm cyntaf i'w ddatblygu yng Nghymru yn unfrydol, a dywedodd Gareth Jones:

'mae'r cwricwlwm ar ei newydd wedd yn haeddu derbyniad gwresog a chydabyddiaeth fel carreg filltir bwysig yn hanes a datblygiad addysg yng Nghymru.... Am y tro cyntaf erioed bydd gennym gwricwlwm cenedlaethol a fydd wedi ei ddatblygu yng Nghymru ac a fydd yn adlewyrchu anghenion arbennig Cymru.'

Mae'n destun pryder braidd mai dim ond dwy flynedd sydd ers hynny, ac mae Plaid Cymru'n sôn am newid y cwricwlwm hwnnw yn barod. Os nad yw hynny'n achosi anniddigrwydd ac aflonyddwch yn ein hysgolion a gwaith ychwanegol i athrawon, ni wn beth a wnaiff.

Gareth Jones: I am glad of the opportunity to contribute to this important discussion, which was inspired by Professor Richard Daugherty's masterly analysis of a curriculum that is, in his view, a hotchpotch of Government Orders, reforms aimed at the market and bureaucratic burdens. That was the Conservatives' contribution, and that is enough about them. He goes on to explain that over-centralising the curriculum and assessment in the hands of central Government harms education and leads to a deficient national curriculum. Indeed, in combining the professor's remarks and Estyn's findings on teaching experiences and satisfying our pupils' needs and interests, we see that there is room for concern. Estyn says:

that several schools concentrate excessively on the core curriculum subjects, especially in years 5 and 6 to prepare pupils for the national tests and neglect aspects such as art, music, physical education, design and technology.

Again, according to Estyn, the practice of

drefnu setiau yn ôl gallu disgyblion yn aml yn gallu arwain at osod gwaith yn rheolaidd sy'n rhy anodd neu'n rhy hawdd iddynt.

Mae nifer o enghreifftiau eraill nad oes gennyf amser y prynhawn yma i'w dyfynnu. Maent oll yn ategu darganfyddiadau'r athro. Mae'n amlwg, er y cynnydd da a wneir mewn rhai agweddau ar addysg, bod y gwasanaeth bellach wedi datblygu i hwyluso gwaith a dibenion pawb ond y disgybl. Mae hyd yn oed dymhorau ein hysgolion yn seiliedig ar anghenion cymdeithas fel ag yr oedd yn yr ugeinfed ganrif, a chyn hynny. Mae trefniadau gweinyddol, amserlennu, trefniadaeth, a gofynion asesiadau allanol yn gor-lywodraethu. Maent yn mynnu sylw ein hathrawon a'n rheolwyr ar draul rhyddid i wasanaethu a diwallu anghenion yr unigolyn. Caiff profiadau dysgu perthnasol a dychmygus eu haberthu er mwyn asesu, cofnodi, ysgrifennu adroddiadau, ac yn y blaen.

Yn wir, mae'n glod i'n hathrawon eu bod yn gallu cyflawni ac yn gwella safonau o gwbl o dan y fath drefn, sydd bellach yn llyffethair i'r athro a'r disgybl yn hytrach nag yn gyfrwng i agor meddyliau, ehangu gorwelion, a helpu'r disgybl i 'ddysgu sut' yn hytrach na 'dysgu am'. Os derbynnir gwelliant 2 Jonathan Morgan, bydd yn dwysáu'r anawsterau yn hytrach na'u lleihau. Y mae ef am ganolbwytio ar arbenigedd a delwedd ysgol, yn hytrach nag ar ofynion addysgol y disgybl. Er mor bwysig yw delwedd ac enw da ysgol, ail beth ydyw i ymateb i anghenion a datblygu arbenigedd pob disgybl. Mae hyrwyddo cryfderau pob unigolyn yn llawer mwy o her ac o bwys na datblygu arbenigedd sefydliad.

Jonathan Morgan: I do not understand why pupils in Wales are so different from pupils across the border. Pupils in England are allowed to develop along the lines of a more specialist agenda if that is the school's wish. Why is Wales so different? Are we from Mars, or are they odd?

Gareth Jones: The difference is that, in England, where they specialise, consideration

timetabling to arrange sets according to pupils' ability can often lead to regularly setting work that is too difficult or too easy for them.

There are several other examples, which I do not have time to quote this afternoon. They all support the professor's findings. It is obvious, despite the good progress being made in some aspects of education, that the service has been developed to facilitate the work and aims of everyone but the pupil. Even our school terms are based on society's needs as they stood in the twentieth century and before that. Administrative arrangements, timetabling, organisation, and external assessment requirements predominate. They demand our teachers' and managers' attention at the expense of their freedom to serve and satisfy the individual's needs. Relevant and imaginative teaching experiences are sacrificed in order to assess, record, write reports, and so on.

Indeed, it is to our teachers' credit that they can achieve and improve standards at all under such a system, which now acts as an encumbrance to the teacher and the pupil, rather than as a means of opening minds, expanding horizons, and helping the pupil to 'learn how' rather than 'learn about'. If Jonathan Morgan's amendment 2 is carried, it will intensify the difficulties rather than reduce them. He wants to concentrate on specialism and school image, rather than on the pupil's educational needs. A school's image and good name are important, but that is secondary to responding to the needs and developing the specialism of each pupil. Promoting each individual's strengths is far more challenging and important than developing an establishment's specialism.

Jonathan Morgan: Nid wyf fi'n deall pam y mae disgyblion yng Nghymru mor wahanol i ddisgyblion o dros y ffin. Caniateir i ddisgyblion yn Lloegr ddatblygu yn ôl agenda fwy arbenigol os mai dyna ddymuniad yr ysgol. Pam mae Cymru mor wahanol? A ydym o'r blaned Mawrth, ynteu ai hwy sy'n od?

Gareth Jones: Y gwahaniaeth yw, yn Lloegr, lle byddant yn arbenigo, rhoddir

is given to the school. The image of the school in a community is important. In Wales, we prefer to place the emphasis on the pupil and his or her needs. That is where you and I differ and we cannot agree on that point. Our concern is for the pupil.

Rhaid cydnabod nad yw lles yr unigolyn yn cael ei hyrwyddo yn effeithiol ar hyn o bryd. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn cydnabod hynny gan fod y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes eisoes wedi dechrau ymgynghori ag ACCAC a chyrff eraill ar gynlluniau i ail-lunio'r cwricwlwm ôl-14. Cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog yn ddiweddar at becynnau dysgu sydd wedi eu teilwra'n bersonol ar gyfer yr unigolyn. Cyfeiria 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu' yn gyson at yr angen i wasanaethu'r unigolyn. Y gobaith yw y bydd Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru ac, ymhen amser, y fagloriaeth Gymreig yn darparu'r gwasanaeth hwnnw.

Fodd bynnag, mae angen llawer mwy na datganiad o fwriad i newid pethau mewn difrif. Rhaid gwneud newidiadau sylfaenol i'r modd y trefnir ac y cyflwynir y cwricwlwm. Nid ydym, hyd yn hyn, wedi llwyddo i benderfynu ar y cydbwysedd delfrydol rhwng yr elfennau academiaidd, galwedigaethol, gyrfaol a sgiliau allweddol yn ein hysgolion. Erbyn hyn, beth yw pwysigrwydd TGAU? A ddylid asesu'n haearnaidd yn 14, 16, 17 a 18 oed? Rhaid ymgynghori er mwyn argyhoeddi'r proffesiwn y dylid newid y fframwaith cwricwlaidd. Mae hynny'n gofyn am raglen oleuedig ac effeithiol o hyfforddiant mewn swydd. Mae papur Richard Daugherty yn gosod her i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Ni feiddiwn ac ni fedrwn ei hanwybyddu.

Mae gennym le i ymfalchïo yng nghyraeddiadau pobl ifanc a'u hathrawon. Fodd bynnag, erys gwendidau sylfaenol, endemig a pharhaus ym myd addysg. Fe'u hamlygir mewn triwantiaeth, diffyg disgyblaeth, ymwrthod, siomedigaethau, methiannau, rhwystredigaeth, twf mewn datganiadau ac unedau cyfeirio disgyblion. Mae'r problemau hyn, yn eu tro, yn achosi allgáu cymdeithasol.

ystyriaeth i'r ysgol. Mae delwedd yr ysgol mewn cymuned yn bwysig. Yng Nghymru, mae'n well gennym roi'r pwyslais ar y disgybl a'i anghenion ef neu hi. Dyna lle'r ydych chi a mi'n anghytuno ac ni allwn gyd-weld ar y pwynt hwnnw. Dros y disgybl y mae'n consyrn ni.

We must acknowledge that the welfare of the individual is not being promoted effectively at present. The Government acknowledges that problem because the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning has already embarked on consultation with ACCAC and other bodies on plans to restructure the post-14 curriculum. The Minister recently referred to learning packages that have been tailored to suit the individual's needs. 'The Learning Country' often refers to the need to provide a service for the individual. The hope is that Education and Learning Wales and, in time, the Welsh baccalaureate, will provide that service.

However, we need much more than a statement of intent to change things. We must make basic changes to how the curriculum is arranged and delivered. We have not managed to agree to date on the ideal balance between academic, vocational, career and basic skills elements in our schools. How important are GCSEs now? Should we be rigidly assessing at 14, 16, 17 and 18 years of age? We must consult in order to convince the teaching profession of the need to change the curricular framework. That requires an enlightened and effective programme of in-service training. Richard Daugherty's paper has given the National Assembly a challenge. We cannot and dare not ignore it.

There are many reasons for us to be proud of the achievements of our young people and teachers. However, there are basic, endemic and continuing weaknesses in the education sector. These weaknesses manifest themselves in truancy, lack of discipline, disaffection, disappointments, failures, frustration, an increase in statements and pupil referral units. These problems, in time, lead to social exclusion.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Will you please wind-up?

Gareth Jones: Mae'r elfennau negyddol hyn yn deillio o brofiadau ein plant yn ein hysgolion. Rhaid cofio hynny. Rhaid newid y sefyllfa. Os ydych am weld y newid hwnnw, rhaid i ni newid y cwricwlwm. Cefnogwch gynnig Plaid Cymru.

Mick Bates: I declare an interest as a registered teacher; also, my wife is a headteacher.

The Welsh Liberal Democrats support the Welsh Assembly Government in its commitment to education in Wales and its policies to ensure that the national curriculum reflects and responds to the social, economic and cultural needs of the people of Wales. We will therefore support amendment 1.

Undoubtedly, many teachers and parents consider the national curriculum to be too detailed, constraining and inflexible. There is a danger that it will become a straitjacket when it should, rather, be providing guidelines to ensure that standards in schools rise from year to year. However, this partnership Government is already tackling the prescriptive nature of the national curriculum and the problem of excess bureaucracy in schools. The scrapping of the test for seven-year-olds is one step that the partnership Government has already taken to reduce teachers' bureaucratic workload—and we are receiving envious looks from teachers across the border. That is essential to encourage a culture of learning, rather than a culture of testing and examining, and the associated paper workload for teachers. In scrapping standard assessment tests and tasks for seven-year-olds, the Welsh Assembly Government should be congratulated on moving in that direction and on reducing the paper workload.

The Welsh Assembly Government is also tackling bureaucracy by increasing support for Information and Communications Technology and ensuring that all schools can complete administrative tasks electronically. It is also ensuring that schools are connected to the internet so that they can access

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. A wnewch chi ddirwyn i ben, os gwelwch yn dda?

Gareth Jones: These negative elements are caused by children's experience of school. We must remember that. We must change the situation. If you want to see that change, we must change the curriculum. Support Plaid Cymru's motion.

Mick Bates: Datganaf fuddiant fel athro cofrestredig; hefyd, mae fy ngwraig yn brifathrawes.

Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n cefnogi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei hymrwymiad i addysg yng Nghymru a'i pholisïau i sicrhau bod y cwricwlwm cenedlaethol yn adlewyrchu ac yn ymateb i anghenion cymdeithasol, economaidd a diwylliannol pobl Cymru. Cefnogwn welliant 1 felly.

Yn ddi-os, mae llawer o athrawon a rhieni o'r farn fod y cwricwlwm cenedlaethol yn rhy fanwl, cyfyngus ac anhyblyg. Mae perygl y gall ein caethiwo pan ddylai, yn hytrach, fod yn darparu canllawiau i sicrhau bod safonau yn yr ysgol yn codi o flwyddyn i flwyddyn. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth hon eisoes yn mynd i'r afael â natur or-benodol y cwricwlwm cenedlaethol a phroblem gormod o fiwrocratiaeth mewn ysgolion. Mae dileu'r prawf i blant saith mlwydd oed yn un cam y mae'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth eisoes wedi ei chymryd i leihau'r baich gwaith biwrocraidd ar athrawon—ac mae athrawon o ochr arall y ffin yn edrych arnom yn eiddigeddus. Mae hynny'n hanfodol i annog diwylliant o ddysgu, yn hytrach na diwylliant o brofi ac arholi, a'r baich gwaith papur cysylltiedig i athrawon. Wrth ddileu profion a thasgau asesu safonol i blant saith oed, dylid llongyfarch Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru am symud i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw ac am leihau'r baich gwaith papur.

Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru hefyd yn mynd i'r afael â biwrocratiaeth drwy gynyddu cefnogaeth i Dechnoleg Gwybodaeth a Chyfathrebu a sicrhau y gall pob ysgol gwblhau tasgau gweinyddol yn electronig. Mae'n sicrhau hefyd fod ysgolion wedi'u cysylltu â'r we fel y gallant gael

Assembly and national curriculum documents electronically. Public examination bureaucracy is also under review.

dogfennau'r Cynulliad a'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol yn electronig. Mae biwrocratiaeth arholiadau cyhoeddus dan adolygiad hefyd.

5:10 p.m.

I read with interest in *The Western Mail* yesterday about Plaid Cymru's education review. It calls for the abolition of all standard assessment and for them to be replaced with continuous assessment. As I have taught under systems of examinations and continuous assessment, I know that there is no guarantee that continuous assessment will reduce the burden of bureaucracy. It is possible that continuous assessment would increase the workload. There is room for both systems. We must retain a way of assessing the progress of an individual through testing. However, I also accept that continuous assessment should play a role in the classroom. That is standard procedure for most of our schools and good practice.

Helen Mary Jones: Do you acknowledge that all good teachers are carrying out continuous assessment anyway? You would not have to increase their workload because they are making the assessment anyway. It would just be a question of filling a form. Any system of assessment could increase the workload, but it would not have to do so.

Mick Bates: Thank you for that somewhat strange explanation. The review seemed to suggest replacing all these tests with continuous assessment and some other tests. Perhaps Plaid Cymru should have presented the paper to us first. The Welsh Liberal Democrats also support examining whether SATs at key stage 2 should be abolished. However, it is also important to bear in mind that national assessment, whether by testing or other means, must take place to ensure that schools throughout Wales are meeting the standards. In that respect, I ask Plaid a further question. Yesterday, its health spokesperson said that health was its number one priority. Where does that leave education on Plaid's agenda?

Cynog Dafis: Yn gyntaf, mae angen system er mwyn gweld sut mae ysgolion yn symud ymlaen. Dylai'r athro gynnal asesu parhaus

Darllenais â diddordeb yn *The Western Mail* ddoe am adolygiad addysg Plaid Cymru. Mae'n galw am ddileu pob asesu safonol a sefydlu asesu parhaus yn ei le. Gan fy mod wedi dysgu dan systemau arholiadau ac asesu parhaus, gwn nad oes unrhyw warant y bydd asesu parhaus yn lleihau baich biwrocratiaeth. Mae'n bosibl y byddai asesu parhaus yn cynyddu'r baich gwaith. Mae lle i'r ddwy system. Rhaid inni gadw ffordd o asesu cynnydd unigolyn drwy brofion. Er hynny, derbynïaf hefyd y dylai asesu parhaus chwarae rhan yn yr ystafell ddosbarth. Mae hynny'n drefn safonol i'r rhan fwyaf o'n hysgolion ac yn arfer da.

Helen Mary Jones: A ydych yn cydnabod fod pob athro ac athrawes dda yn gwneud asesu parhaus beth bynnag? Ni fyddai'n rhaid ichi gynyddu eu baich gwaith oherwydd maent yn gwneud yr asesu beth bynnag. Dim ond cwestiwn o lanw ffurflen fyddai. Gallai unrhyw drefn asesu gynyddu'r baich gwaith, ond ni fyddai'n rhaid iddi wneud.

Mick Bates: Diolch am yr eglurhad braidd yn rhyfedd hwnnw. Yr oedd yr adolygiad fel pe bai'n awgrymu disodli'r holl brofion hyn ag asesu parhaus a rhai profion eraill. Efallai y dylasai Plaid Cymru fod wedi cyflwyno'r papur inni yn gyntaf. Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru hefyd o blaid edrych a ddylid dileu TASau ar gyfnod allweddol 2. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig cofio bod yn rhaid cael asesu cenedlaethol, boed drwy brofion neu ryw fodd arall, i sicrhau bod ysgolion trwy Gymru'n cyrraedd y safonau. Yn hynny o beth, gofynnaf gwestiwn arall i'r Blaid. Ddoe, dywedodd ei llefarydd ar iechyd mai iechyd oedd ei phrif flaenoriaeth. Ble mae hynny'n gadael addysg ar agenda'r Blaid?

Cynog Dafis: First, we need a system to show how schools are progressing. The teacher should carry out daily continuous

beunyddiol er mwyn darganfod hanes y plentyn. Mae hynny'n digwydd yn barod. Yn ail, mae angen system o brofion parod ar gyfer mesur cyrhaeddiad y plentyn. Yn drydydd, rhaid cael system o samplu cenedlaethol er mwyn gweld sut mae'r system yn gweithio drwy Gymru. Dylai hynny arwain at leihad sylweddol yn y baich asesu a dylai'r wybodaeth fod ar gael yn fwy hygyrch.

Mick Bates: Thank you for that further explanation, Cynog. I still feel that your review is not well thought out and would mean much more red tape and bureaucracy in schools.

It is vital that teachers are freed from red tape and form-filling. They should be able to concentrate on teaching in the classroom. The Welsh Liberal Democrats want to help them to achieve that. We propose that teachers receive extra administrative support during their working week, which would relieve some of the pressure caused by red-tape and also give them time to draw up teaching plans and get their marking done. The Welsh Liberal Democrats will not support the Conservatives' amendment 2 as it seeks to promote specialist schools. We do not wish to follow that route. It is divisive. Specialist schools and the additional funding that they receive divides pupils and schools into haves and have nots. It restricts opportunities for some, while promoting them for others.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Can you please wind up, Mick?

Mick Bates: With high-quality and valued teachers and well-equipped classrooms, there is no reason why all schools in Wales cannot become centres of excellence. We do not need specialist schools.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I remind Members that I must call the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to respond at 5.17 p.m.

Owen John Thomas: Y polisi mewn ysgolion cynradd yw diddymu gweddill y

assessment to find out the child's history. That already happens. Secondly, we need a system of off-the-peg tests to measure the child's achievement. Thirdly, we need a system of national sampling to show how the system is working throughout Wales. That should lead to a considerable decrease in the burden of assessment and ensure that information is more accessible.

Mick Bates: Diolch am yr eglurhad pellach hwnnw, Cynog. Yr wyf yn dal i feddwl nad ydych wedi myfyrio digon dros eich adolygiad ac y golygai lawer mwy o dâp coch a biwrocratiaeth mewn ysgolion.

Mae'n hanfodol rhyddhau athrawon oddi wrth dâp coch a llanw ffurflenni. Dylent allu canolbwyntio ar ddysgu yn yr ystafell ddosbarth. Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n awyddus i'w helpu i wneud hynny. Cynigiwn y dylai athrawon gael cymorth gweinyddol ychwanegol yn ystod eu hwythnos waith, a fyddai'n codi rhywfaint o'r pwysau a achosir gan dâp coch a hefyd yn rhoi amser iddynt lunio cynlluniau dysgu a gwneud eu gwaith marcio. Ni wnaiff Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru gefnogi gwelliant 2 gan y Ceidwadwyr gan ei fod yn ceisio hyrwyddo ysgolion arbenigol. Nid oes arnom eisiau dilyn y llwybr hwnnw. Mae'n ymrannol. Mae ysgolion arbenigol a'r cyllid ychwanegol a dderbyniant yn rhannu disgyblion ac ysgolion yn dldion a chyfoethogion. Mae'n cyfyngu cyfleoedd i rai, tra'n eu hyrwyddo i eraill.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. A allwch ddirwyn i ben os gwelwch yn dda, Mick?

Mick Bates: Gydag athrawon o ansawdd da a gaiff eu gwerthfawrogi, ac ystafelloedd dosbarth gydag adnoddau da, nid oes dim rheswm pam na all pob ysgol yng Nghymru fod yn ganolfan ragoriaeth. Nid oes arnom angen ysgolion arbenigol.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Atgoffaf yr Aelodau fod yn rhaid imi alw'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i ymateb am 5.17 p.m.

Owen John Thomas: The policy in primary schools is to abolish the remaining standard

profion asesu safonol ar ddiwedd cyfnod allweddol 2. Yn hytrach na'r profion hynny a'r gyfundrefn asesu sy'nghlwm wrthynt, byddwn yn sefydlu proses naturiol o asesu parhaol, wedi'i seilio ar ymateb yr athro i ddatblygiad addysgol pob plentyn. Mae'r broses bwysig hon, sy'n dibynnu ar adnabyddiaeth yr athro o'i ddisgyblion, yn adfer sgiliau allweddol addysgu ac yn cael gwared â'r hunllef fiwrocraidd.

Ar hyn o bryd, llesteirir cyflwyno addysg ymhellach oherwydd y rhaniad i chwe sector allweddol. Ar y lefel gynradd, mae diffyg dilyniant yng ngwaith plant yn yr adran feithrin, adran y babanod a'r adran iau. Byddai dynodi cyfnod blynyddoedd cynnar—y cyfnod rhwng genedigaeth a saith mlwydd oed—yn diddymu un rhwystr i ddilyniant. Byddai hefyd yn darparu trefn integredig i symbylu'r profiadau a'r cynefin cyffrous a fyddai'n arwain at ddatblygiad cymdeithasol, corfforol a meddyliol plant yn eu blynyddoedd cynnar. Byddai pwyslais y dysgu ar iechyd, ffyniant, sgiliau ieithyddol a datblygu. Byddai hyn yn gosod y seiliau ar gyfer datblygiad addysgol pellach. Byddai'r dull hwnnw yn cael ei estyn i'r cyfnod rhwng tair a saith mlwydd oed, â dysgu strwythurol o fewn sefyllfaoedd cydnaws â phrofiad y plant, gan gynnwys arferion sylfaenol y bywyd cyfoes, fel y soniodd Cynog eisoes.

Dychwelaf at asesu. Rhaid iddo gyd-fynd ag oedran y plentyn, a rhaid iddo fod yn sail ar gyfer llunio dysgu pellach. Daw felly'n rhan hanfodol o'r broses ddysgu, yn hytrach nag ychwanegiad sy'n graddio gwaith y disgyblion. Mae'n rhaid cydnabod bod plant yn cyrraedd cyfnodau pan fônt yn barod i ddysgu—yn barod i ddysgu darllen, er enghraifft—ar adegau amrywiol. Ar yr adegau hyn, dylai athrawon allu tynnu ar storfa o ddeunydd prawf wedi'u seilio ar egwyddor parodrwydd i brofi i'w helpu i gadw llygad ar ddatblygiad disgyblion.

I gloi, atgoffaf yr Aelodau bod trefnu addysg blynyddoedd cynnar i redeg dros gyfnod o saith mlynedd o oedran geni yn arfer cydnabyddedig yn llawer o wledydd blaengar Ewrop. Mae'n ddull sy'n rhoi cyfle inni yng Nghymru frasgamu ymlaen â'n haddysg, ac ni allwn gollu'r cyfle i osod sylfaen i Gymru

assessment tests at the end of key stage 2. Instead of those tests and the associated assessment system, we will establish a natural process of continuous assessment, based on the teacher's response to the educational development of each child. This important process, which is dependent upon the teacher's knowledge of his pupils, reinstates key teaching skills and eliminates the bureaucratic nightmare.

At present, the delivery of education is further hindered because of the division into six key sectors. At the primary level, there is a lack of continuity in children's work in nursery, infant and junior classes. Denoting an early years stage—the period between birth and seven years of age—would eliminate one obstacle to continuity. It would also provide an integrated system to stimulate experiences and exciting surroundings that would lead to the social, physical and mental development of children in the early years. The emphasis of the teaching would be on health, wellbeing, linguistic skills and development. It would provide a foundation for further educational development. That approach would be extended to the period between three and seven years of age, with structured learning within situations compatible with children's experiences, including the fundamental practices of modern life, as Cynog has already mentioned.

I return to assessment. It must correspond to a child's age, and it must be a basis for shaping further learning. It therefore becomes an essential part of the learning process, rather than an add-on that grades pupils' work. We must acknowledge that children reach stages when they are ready to learn—ready to learn to read, for example—at various times. At these times, teachers should be able to use a store of test material based on the readiness to test principle in order to help them keep an eye on pupils' development.

In closing, I remind Members that organising early years education so that it runs for a period of seven years from birth is a recognised practice in many of Europe's progressive countries. It is an approach that gives us in Wales an opportunity to make great strides forwards in education and we

hyderus lle bydd medr a menter yn arwain y ffordd.

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I find myself in unreal territory because, as Lorraine said, it is less than two years since Assembly Members voted unanimously for the curriculum. Plaid Cymru's education spokesperson, Gareth Jones, strongly welcomed the fact that we had a national curriculum, which was developed in Wales and which reflected Wales's needs. Yet, less than two years later, the party calls for the system to be changed completely. The Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales—the Government's adviser—is not aware of any reliable evidence to support this. As a Minister, I am committed to evidence-based working and am always happy to consider evidence.

In broad terms, I welcome the Plaid policy paper launched yesterday, not least because it supports the radical education agenda that we are already implementing. The key elements of our vision for education and training were set out last September in 'The Learning Country' and were broadly welcomed by those who value educational excellence, continuous improvement and the widest possible access to learning in the context of a strategic vision.

Plaid's document outlines four main phases of the curriculum, which I have already advocated to the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee: a new foundation phase for three to seven-year-olds; key stage 2 for eight to 11-year olds; key stage 3 for 11 to 14-year-olds, and the agenda for 14 to 19-year-olds, on which a project team is currently working. The document outlines a foundation phase building on desirable outcomes. That is exactly what we are doing. I am proud of our distinctive and radical plans, which have been warmly welcomed, particularly by the early years sector. It is appropriate that we should radically review the current provision where appropriate.

cannot miss the opportunity to lay the foundation for a confident Wales where skill and enterprise will lead the way.

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Caf fy hun mewn tiriogaeth afreal oherwydd, fel y dywedodd Lorraine, mae llai na dwy flynedd ers i Aelodau'r Cynulliad bleidleisio'n unfrydol o blaid y cwricwlwm. Rhoddodd llefarydd Plaid Cymru ar addysg, Gareth Jones, groeso gwresog i'r ffaith fod gennym gwricwlwm cenedlaethol a ddatblygwyd yng Nghymru ac a adlewyrchai anghenion Cymru. Eto, lai na dwy flynedd yn ddiweddarach, mae'r blaid yn galw am newid y system yn llwyr. Nid yw Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru—corff cynghori'r Llywodraeth—yn ymwybodol o unrhyw dystiolaeth ddibynadwy i gefnogi hyn. Fel Gweinidog, yr wyf yn ymroddedig i weithio ar sail tystiolaeth ac yr wyf bob amser yn hapus i ystyried tystiolaeth.

Yn gyffredinol, croesawaf bapur polisi'r Blaid a lansiwyd ddoe, nid yn lleiaf oherwydd ei fod yn cefnogi'r agenda addysg radical yr ydym yn ei gweithredu'n barod. Amlinellwyd elfennau allweddol ein gweledigaeth ar gyfer addysg a hyfforddiant fis Medi diwethaf yn 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu' a gafodd groeso cyffredinol gan y rheini sy'n gwerthfawrogi rhagoriaeth addysgol, gwella parhaus a'r mynediad ehangaf bosibl at addysg yng nghyd-destun gweledigaeth strategol.

Mae dogfen Plaid Cymru yn amlinellu pedwar prif gyfnod y cwricwlwm, yr wyf eisoes wedi'u hargymhell i'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes: cyfnod sylfaen newydd i blant tair i saith mlwydd oed; cyfnod allweddol 2 i blant wyth i 11 oed; cyfnod allweddol 3 i blant 11 i 14 oed, a'r agenda ar gyfer rhai 14 i 19 mlwydd oed, y mae tîm prosiect yn gweithio arni ar hyn o bryd. Mae'r ddogfen yn amlinellu cyfnod sylfaen gan adeiladu ar y canlyniadau a ddeisyfir. Dyna'n union beth yr ydym yn ei wneud. Yr wyf yn falch o'n cynlluniau neilltuol a radical, a gafodd groeso gwresog, yn enwedig gan y sector blynyddoedd cynnar. Mae'n briodol ein bod yn adolygu'r ddarpariaeth gyfredol mewn modd radical lle bo hynny'n briodol.

Our approach on early years provision was supported by all parties. Successful approaches in other countries focus on more directed play type curricula, and later on formal learning. We are keen to consider that. I have appointed a specialist adviser to work with the Early Years Advisory Panel and other bodies, to take that forward.

5:20 p.m.

Plaid Cymru advocated that key stage 1 tests should go—they have been abolished. As several Members have remarked, Plaid Cymru does not seem to have noticed that they have gone. We will continue to review testing at all levels, but will only do what is appropriate for learners. As Minister, I will never be prepared to compromise on achievement, or on our crucial transition agenda. Key stage 1 tests were scrapped because of the close relationship between teacher assessment and testing results. It releases time for teaching, and demonstrates our faith in established teacher assessment. It was not change for change's sake. It was appropriate, because it best met learners' needs.

The Welsh Assembly Government is leading the way on ensuring a smooth transition for pupils moving from primary to secondary school.

Cynog Dafis *rose*—

Jane Davidson: I will be happy to take an intervention when I have made my main points. In the Education Bill, we are using Wales-only clauses to improve the transition between primary and secondary schools, requiring governing bodies to collaborate. Plaid Cymru proposes replacing key stage 2 tests with alternative national school-administered tests. When I scrapped the key stage 1 tests, I stated clearly that it was not appropriate at that time to remove key stage 2 tests. Although our results are good, they are not being carried through to key stage 3, and I am not prepared to compromise on achievement. Key stage 2 tests are a key

Cefnogwyd ein hagwedd at ddarpariaeth blynyddoedd cynnar gan y pleidiau i gyd. Mae dulliau llwyddiannus mewn gwledydd eraill yn canolbwyntio ar gwricwlwm â mwy o chwarae cyfeiriedig, a dysgu ffurfiol yn nes ymlaen. Yr ydym yn awyddus i ystyried hynny. Yr wyf wedi penodi ymgynghorydd arbenigol i weithio gyda'r Panel Cynghori ar y Blynyddoedd Cynnar a chyrrff eraill, i fynd â hyn yn ei flaen.

Argymhellodd Plaid Cymru y dylai profion cyfnod allweddol 1 fynd—fe'u diddymwyd. Fel y mae sawl Aelod wedi nodi, nid yw'n ymddangos fod Plaid Cymru wedi sylwi eu bod wedi mynd. Byddwn yn parhau i adolygu profion ar bob lefel, ond ni wnawn ond yr hyn sy'n briodol i ddysgwyr. Fel Gweinidog, ni fyddaf byth yn barod i gyfaddawdu ar gyflawniad, nac ar ein hagenda bontio hollbwysig. Gwnaethpwyd i ffwrdd â phrofion cyfnod allweddol 1 oherwydd y berthynas agos rhwng asesu athrawon a chanlyniadau profion. Mae'n rhyddhau amser i ddysgu, ac yn dangos ein ffydd yn y dull sefydledig o asesu athrawon. Nid newid er mwyn newid ydoedd. Yr oedd yn briodol am mai dyna oedd yn ateb anghenion dysgwyr orau.

Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn arwain y ffordd ar sicrhau newid esmwyth i ddisgyblion sy'n symud o'r ysgol gynradd i'r uwchradd.

Cynog Dafis *a gododd*—

Jane Davidson: Byddaf yn hapus i gymryd ymyriad pan fyddaf wedi gwneud fy mhrif bwyntiau. Yn y Mesur Addysg, yr ydym yn defnyddio cymalau Cymru'n-unig i wella'r pontio rhwng ysgolion cynradd ac uwchradd, gan fynnu bod cyrrff llywodraethol yn cydweithio. Mae Plaid Cymru yn cynnig disodli profion cyfnod allweddol 2 â phrofion cenedlaethol amgen a weinyddir gan yr ysgolion. Pan ddiddymais brofion cyfnod allweddol 1, dywedais yn glir nad oedd yn briodol bryd hynny dileu profion cyfnod allweddol 2. Er bod ein canlyniadau'n dda, nid ydynt yn cael eu cario drwodd i gyfnod allweddol 3, ac nid wyf yn barod i

element in forming that transition. I speak to parents every day, and they agree.

We must work on benchmarks that are right for our children. We cannot abandon testing at key stages 2 and 3 without the proper benchmarks, but our transition policy, worked out between primary and secondary schools, may give us alternative future benchmarks. We must have what is best for children in Wales, and Estyn has stated clearly to the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee that schools should not teach to tests. The schools that had the best test results in Wales were those that taught a broad and balanced curriculum. The issue is to ensure that all schools do that.

Cynog Dafis: Dywedodd y Gweinidog ei bod yn croesawu cynnwys y ddogfen a gyhoeddwyd gennym ddoe. Os felly, beth sy'n achosi cymaint o dramgwydd iddi yn ein cynnig heddiw? A yw'n derbyn, mewn egwyddor, y dylai fod cwricwlwm cenedlaethol i Gymru?

Jane Davidson: I said that I welcomed some of the content of your document. There are a range of issues surrounding the Welsh language. Your document, 'Towards a Truly National Curriculum', supports bilingualism, and so do we. Only last week, the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee finalised the report of its review of Welsh in education, which focuses on improving progression and continuity. I have been fully engaged in those discussions. The commitment to establishing a second entry point into Welsh-medium education in primary schools is based on the Canadian model. We are actively taking forward our agendas.

Last week, I awarded the contract for the national grid for learning Cymru to Curriculum Data Wales, a consortium consisting of local authorities, the Welsh Joint Education Committee, BT Wales, Learn.co.uk and BBC Wales. It is a Welsh initiative that will provide bilingual curriculum materials.

Jane Davidson: Plaid Cymru advocates a

gyfaddawdu ar gyflawniad. Mae profion cyfnod allweddol 2 yn elfen allweddol wrth ffurfio'r bont honno. Siaradaf â rhieni bob dydd, a chytunant hwy.

Rhaid inni weithio ar feincnodau sy'n iawn i'n plant. Ni allwn roi'r gorau i brofi ar gyfnodau allweddol 2 a 3 heb y meincnodau iawn, ond fe all ein polisi pontio, wedi'i drefnu rhwng ysgolion cynradd ac uwchradd, roi meincnodau amgen inni yn y dyfodol. Rhaid inni gael yr hyn sydd orau i blant yng Nghymru, ac mae Estyn wedi dweud yn glir wrth y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes na ddylai ysgolion ddysgu i brofion. Yr ysgolion a gafodd y canlyniadau profion gorau yng Nghymru oedd y rheini a ddysgai gwricwlwm eang a chytbwys. Y peth yw sicrhau bod pob ysgol yn gwneud hynny.

Cynog Dafis: The Minister said that she welcomes the content of the document that we published yesterday. If so, what in our motion today causes her so much offence? Does she accept, in principle, that there should be a national curriculum for Wales?

Jane Davidson: Dywedais fy mod yn croesawu rhywfaint o gynnwys eich dogfen. Y mae amrediad o faterion yn ymwneud â'r Gymraeg. Mae eich dogfen 'Tuag at Gwricwlwm Gwir Genedlaethol', yn cefnogi dwyieithrwydd, ac yr ydym ninnau hefyd. Dim ond yr wythnos diwethaf, cwblhaodd y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yr adroddiad ar ei adolygiad o'r Gymraeg mewn addysg, sy'n canolbwyntio ar wella dilyniant a pharhad. Yr wyf ffinau wedi cymryd rhan lawn yn y trafodaethau hynny. Mae'r ymrwymiad i sefydlu ail bwynt mynediad i addysg Gymraeg mewn ysgolion cynradd yn seiliedig ar batrwm Canada. Yr ydym yn symud ymlaen â'n hagendâu.

Yr wythnos diwethaf, dyfernais y contract ar gyfer grid cenedlaethol dysgu Cymru i Data Cwricwlwm Cymru, consortiwm yn cynnwys awdurdodau lleol, Cyd-Bwyllgor Addysg Cymru, BT Cymru, Learn.co.uk a BBC Cymru. Mae'n fenter Gymreig a fydd yn darparu deunyddiau cwricwlwm dwyieithog.

Jane Davidson: Mae Plaid Cymru'n annog

review of the curriculum for 14 to 19-year-olds based on the learner's needs yet we are already doing that. We made a firm commitment to the review back in September, and I announced the project team in Plenary.

Geraint Davies *rose*—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. The Minister is not giving way.

Jane Davidson: We are developing a distinctive approach that is popular outside the Assembly, meeting the needs of young people, schools, colleges, communities, training providers, employers and the higher education sector. It is already different from the approach in other parts of the UK. If you examine the contents of the national curriculum at key stage 4, you will see that we have our own national curriculum in Wales. We have it already, and we continue, through every curriculum review, to refine it to our own needs: the Welsh language, the Welsh baccalaureate, Extending Entitlement not Connexions, our exciting credit transfer qualifications framework, and our all-age basic skills and careers strategies. We are taking measures differently to get them right.

We are developing the Welsh baccalaureate to meet the needs of 16 to 19-year-olds, and 19 schools and colleges are actively engaged in the pilot scheme. Teachers in Wales do not support elitism and neither do I. The baccalaureate is designed to attract and retain more young people in post-16 education.

The key issue is not promoting separatism, but ensuring that our qualifications are recognised throughout Wales and beyond. I value the common framework, and reject any call for a separatist approach to qualifications. We are acting to meet our own needs in Wales, while ensuring that we can also compete in the market in Wales, in the UK, in Europe and across the globe, to ensure that our learners have the best opportunities. We would never compromise on that.

adolygu'r cwricwlwm i rai 14 i 19 oed ar sail anghenion y dysgwyr ond yr ydym eisoes yn gwneud hynny. Gwnaethom ymrwymiad pendant i'r adolygiad yn ôl ym mis Medi, a chyhoeddais y tîm prosiect yn y Cyfarfod Llawn.

Geraint Davies *a gododd*—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Nid yw'r Gweinidog yn ildio.

Jane Davidson: Yr ydym yn datblygu ein harddull ein hunain sy'n boblogaidd y tu allan i'r Cynulliad, sy'n diwallu anghenion pobl ifanc, ysgolion, colegau, cymunedau, darparwyr hyfforddiant, cyflogwyr a'r sector addysg uwch. Eisoes mae'n wahanol i'r dull yn rhannau eraill y DU. Os edrychwch ar gynnwys y cwricwlwm cenedlaethol ar gyfnod allweddol 4, gwelwch fod gennym ein cwricwlwm cenedlaethol ein hunain yng Nghymru. Mae hwnnw gennym yn barod, ac yr ydym yn parhau, drwy bob adolygiad cwricwlwm, i'w gyfaddasu i'n hanghenion ein hunain: yr iaith Gymraeg, y fagloriaeth Gymreig, Ymestyn Hawliau nid Connexions, ein fframwaith cyffrous i drosglwyddo credydau cymwysterau, a'n strategaethau gyrfaoedd a sgiliau sylfaenol i bob oed. Yr ydym yn cymryd mesurau ar wahân er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn iawn.

Yr ydym yn datblygu'r fagloriaeth Gymreig i ateb anghenion y rhai 16 i 19 mlwydd oed, ac mae 19 o ysgolion a cholegau'n cymryd rhan weithredol yn y cynllun peilot. Nid yw athrawon yng Nghymru'n cefnogi elitiaeth, ac nid wyf finnau ychwaith. Amcan y fagloriaeth yw denu a chadw mwy o bobl ifanc mewn addysg ôl-16.

Y mater allweddol yw nid hyrwyddo ymwahaniaeth, ond sicrhau y cydnabyddir ein cymwysterau drwy Gymru gyfan a thu hwnt. Gwerthfawrogaf y fframwaith cyffredin, a gwrthodaf unrhyw alwad am agwedd ymwahanol at gymwysterau. Yr ydym yn gweithredu i ddiwallu ein hanghenion ein hunain yng Nghymru, wrth sicrhau y gallwn gystadlu hefyd yn y farchnad yng Nghymru, yn y DU, yn Ewrop a thros y byd, i sicrhau y caiff ein dysgwyr y cyfleoedd gorau. Ni fyddem byth yn cyfaddawdu ar hynny.

To refer briefly to Jonathan's amendment, he knows that I disagree with the part of it that refers to specialism, but I agree with his point about flexibility, and I am glad that Plaid Cymru does too. Flexibility means having a greater degree of subject choice within an overall curriculum, and enables schools to build on their strengths.

John Griffiths *rose*—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. There is no time; the Minister is about to finish.

Jane Davidson: However, I will not support the amendment, because I oppose the development of specialist schools in Wales. Our geography means that schools need to serve and provide for all children. We are firmly opposed to the selection of pupils, and we are now doing better than other parts of the UK with our comprehensive system.

We are putting forward a new and radical agenda for education and lifelong learning in Wales. In the *Financial Times* a few weeks ago, our education policy in Wales was described as radical and distinctive, and

'proof that the Welsh Assembly can affect its citizens in a big way'.

I know from Helen Mary's initial comments that Plaid Cymru intends to vote against the Government amendment. We are working responsibly and will continue to do so in partnership and by consulting and listening to teachers, parents and pupils across Wales, creating the best conditions for teaching and learning and implementing our distinctive and radical agenda. I am sorry that Plaid Cymru rejects the spirit of partnership, to which I remain committed, and which has been so welcomed outside this Chamber.

Helen Mary Jones: I am not sorry that I disagree wholeheartedly with my friend and colleague Jonathan Morgan. Our policy is far from seeking to create an Orwellian blueprint

A chyfeirio'n fyr at welliant Jonathan, mae'n gwybod fy mod yn anghytuno a'r rhan ohono sy'n cyfeirio at addysg arbenigol, ond cytunaf â'i bwynt am hyblygrwydd, ac yr wyf yn falch bod Plaid Cymru hithau'n cytuno hefyd. Ystyr hyblygrwydd yw cael mwy o ddewis pynciau o fewn cwricwlwm cyffredinol, a galluogi ysgolion i adeiladu ar eu cryfderau.

John Griffiths *a gododd*—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Nid oes amser; mae'r Gweinidog ar fin gorffen.

Jane Davidson: Fodd bynnag, ni chefnogaf y gwelliant, oherwydd gwrthwynebas ddatblygu ysgolion arbenigol yng Nghymru. Golyga ein daearyddiaeth fod angen i ysgolion wasanaethu a darparu ar gyfer pob plentyn. Yr ydym yn gadarn yn erbyn dethol disgyblion, ac yr ydym yn awr yn gwneud yn well na rhannau eraill o'r DU gyda'n system gyfun.

Yr ydym yn cynnig agenda newydd a radical ar gyfer addysg a dysgu gydol oes yng Nghymru. Yn y *Financial Times* ychydig wythnosau yn ôl, disgrifiwyd ein polisi addysg yng Nghymru fel un radical a neilltuol, ac

'mae'n profi bod Cynulliad Cymru'n gallu effeithio'n sylweddol ar ei ddinasyddion'.

Gwn yn sgîl sylwadau agoriadol Helen Mary fod Plaid Cymru'n bwriadu pleidleisio yn erbyn gwelliant y Llywodraeth. Yr ydym yn gweithio'n gyfrifol a pharhawn i wneud hynny mewn partneriaeth a thrwy ymgynghori a gwrandao ar athrawon, rhieni a disgyblion ar draws Cymru, gan greu'r amodau gorau ar gyfer addysgu a dysgu a gweithredu ein hagenda neilltuol a radical. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf fod Plaid Cymru'n ymwrthod â'r ysbryd o bartneriaeth, yr wyf fi'n parhau'n ymrwymedig iddo, ac sydd wedi'i groesawu gymaint y tu allan i'r Siambr hon.

Helen Mary Jones: Nid ymddiheuraf am anghytuno'n llwyr â'm cyfaill a'm cyd-Aelod Jonathan Morgan. Mae ein polisi ymhell o geisio creu glasbrint Orwelliaidd o'r math o

of the kind of young person that our educational institutions ought to be turning out; quite the reverse. We seek to enable young people to understand the system so that they can challenge it—what used to be called a ‘built-in nonsense detector’ when I was a teacher.

David Melding *rose—*

Helen Mary Jones: I am sorry, I do not have time to give way, David. It is not surprising that Jonathan is such a fan of fact. Facts are important, but so are skills and the nonsense detector—which Mr Gradgrind did not believe young people, particularly working young people, ought to have. He did not want them to have ideas, and Jonathan Morgan does not want too many ideas either.

Turning to Mick Bates’s contribution, the Liberal Democrats will, unsurprisingly, support the Government of Wales, although he admits that the current curriculum is a straitjacket, that tests must be abolished and that Plaid Cymru is right. Once again, the Liberal Democrats will vote against their consciences for the sake of some people’s jobs—no surprises there, then.

The Minister, once again, claims that all is right with the world, and that anything that is not is being put right. While there have been welcome changes, our concern is that change is piecemeal. Our proposal—far from being separatist—would put the Welsh curriculum firmly in the European mainstream. Change must take place now.

As Lorraine Barrett and the Minister said, Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales welcomed the changes made two years ago, which were steps in a positive direction. There is no doubt about that. However, two years down the line, those measures have been—and are being—found wanting, as Richard Daugherty, one of the authors of these changes, has pointed out. Change always presents challenges, which is why we believe that now is the time to start this work, to enable change to be gradual, thoroughly researched and widely consulted upon. I heard the Minister make a sedentary

person ifanc y dylai ein sefydliadau addysgol eu cynhyrchu, i’r gwrthwyneb yn wir. Ceisiwn alluogi pobl ifanc i ddeall y system fel y gallant ei herio—yr hyn yr arferid ei alw’n ‘synhwyrdd lol mewdol’ pan oeddwn i’n athrawes.

David Melding *a gododd—*

Helen Mary Jones: Mae’n ddrwg gennyf, nid oes gennyf amser i ildio. Nid yw’n syndod bod Jonathan mor hoff o ffeithiau. Mae ffeithiau’n bwysig, ond felly hefyd sgiliau a’r synhwyrdd lol—na chredai Mr Gradgrind y dylai pobl ifanc, yn enwedig pobl ifanc y dosbarth gweithiol—ei gael. Nid oedd arno eisiau iddynt gael syniadau, ac nid oes ar Jonathan Morgan eisiau gormod o syniadau ychwaith.

A throi at gyfraniad Mick Bates, bydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, yn ôl y disgwyl, yn cefnogi Llywodraeth Cymru, er ei fod yn cyfaddef fod y cwricwlwm cyfredol yn gaethiwus, fod yn rhaid diddymu profion a bod Plaid Cymru’n iawn. Unwaith eto, bydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn pleidleisio yn erbyn eu cydwybod er mwyn swyddi rhai pobl—dim byd i’n synnu yn y fan honno, felly.

Mae’r Gweinidog, unwaith eto, yn honni bod popeth yn dda, a bod unrhyw beth nad yw’n dda yn cael ei gywiro. Tra bu newidiadau i’w croesawu, ein pryder yw mai fesul tamaid y digwyddant. Byddai ein cynnig ni—ymhell o fod yn ymwahanol—yn gosod y cwricwlwm Cymreig yn gadarn ym mhrif ffrwd Ewrop. Rhaid cael newid yn awr.

Fel y dywedodd Lorraine Barrett a’r Gweinidog, croesawodd Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales y newidiadau a wnaethpwyd ddwy flynedd yn ôl, a oedd yn gamau i gyfeiriad cadarnhaol. Nid oes amheuaeth ynglŷn â hynny. Fodd bynnag, ddwy flynedd yn ddiweddarach, canfuwyd—a chanfyddir—fod y mesurau hynny’n ddiffygiol, fel y nododd Richard Daugherty, un o awduron y newidiadau hyn. Mae newid bob amser yn codi her, a dyna pam y credwn mai dyma’r amser i ddechrau’r gwaith hwn, fel y gall newid ddigwydd yn raddol, wedi ymchwil drwyadl ac ymgynghori eang. Clywais y

comment that change has begun. Has it? Is it to be comprehensive, or is it to be piecemeal again? We must have radical change. It is curious that the Minister, having created the opportunity for radical change in the Education Bill, does not seem prepared to take it up. Perhaps her masters and mistresses in London do not allow her to go too far down an independent road, who knows?

The Minister has also said that she wants to make the most of any opportunity that comes to hand to achieve excellent results. It is a pity that she does not want to take this opportunity. However unwilling the Minister is to distance herself from the Westminster Government's control freak, centralist agenda on the curriculum—which, frankly, even it is beginning to doubt—the debate will not go away. We must have a new curriculum that meets the needs of twenty-first century Wales. Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales has been proud to kick-start this debate today. If the Minister will not implement the change, we will have to do it in 2003. I commend this motion to the Assembly, and ask you to reject both amendments. My apologies, Deputy Presiding Officer, to those Members whose interventions I could not take. We ran out of time owing to the Government's gratuitous request to ring the divisional bell earlier.

5:30 p.m.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 22.
Amendment 1: For 29, Abstain 0, Against 22.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Griffiths, John

Gweinidog yn gwneud sylw ar ei heistedd fod y newid wedi dechrau. Felly wir? A fydd yn gynhwysfawr, ynteu a fydd yn dameidiog eto? Rhaid cael newid radical. Mae'n rhyfedd bod y Gweinidog, wedi creu'r cyfle ar gyfer newid radical yn y Mesur Addysg, yn ymddangos yn amharod i fanteisio arno. Efallai nad yw ei meistri a'i meistresi yn Llundain yn caniatáu iddi fynd yn rhy bell i lawr ffordd annibynnol, pwy a wŷr?

Mae'r Gweinidog wedi dweud hefyd fod arni eisiau gwneud y gorau o unrhyw gyfle a ddaw i law i sicrhau canlyniadau ardderchog. Mae'n drueni nad oes arni eisiau cymryd y cyfle hwn. Pa mor anafodlon bynnag yw'r Gweinidog i ymbellhau oddi wrth agenda ganolyddol, unbennaidd Llywodraeth San Steffan ar y cwricwlwm—y mae'r Llywodraeth honno ei hun, a dweud y gwir, yn dechrau ei hamau—nid aiff y ddadl i ffwrdd. Rhaid inni gael cwricwlwm newydd sy'n ateb anghenion Cymru'r unfed ganrif ar hugain. Mae Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales wedi bod yn falch o roi hwb cychwynol i'r ddadl hon heddiw. Os na wnaiff y Gweinidog weithredu'r newid hwn, bydd yn rhaid i ni wneud hynny yn 2003. Cymeradwyaf y cynnig hwn i'r Cynulliad, a gofynnaf ichi wrthod y ddau welliant. Ymddiheuraf, Ddirprwy Lywydd, i'r Aelodau hynny na allais gymryd eu hymyriadau. Aeth amser yn drech na ni oherwydd cais ddi-alwamdani y Llywodraeth am i gloch y bleidlais gael ei chanu yn gynharach.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Elin
Lloyd, David

Gwyther, Christine
 Halford, Alison
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lloyd, Val
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Williams, Kirsty

Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Rogers, Peter
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Thomas, Owen John
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 2: O Blaid 8, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 43.
 Amendment 2: For 8, Abstain 0, Against 43.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Graham, William
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Rogers, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Chapman, Christine
 Dafis, Cynog
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Geraint
 Davies, Ron
 Edwards, Richard
 Essex, Sue
 Evans, Delyth
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Halford, Alison
 Hancock, Brian
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Law, Peter
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd

Williams, Kirsty
Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment rejected.*

Amended motion:

the National Assembly

1. welcomes the vision for, and commitment to, education in Wales set out in 'The Learning Country';

2. welcomes the developments in the curriculum and their responsiveness to the social, economic and cultural needs of Wales;

3. endorses the way in which policies are being developed and implemented in consultation with all relevant stakeholders.

Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol

1. yn croesawu'r weledigaeth ar gyfer addysg yng Nghymru, a'r ymrwymiad iddi, a nodir yn 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu';

2. yn croesawu'r datblygiadau yn y cwricwlwm a'r ffaith eu bod yn ymateb i anghenion cymdeithasol, economaidd a diwylliannol Cymru;

3. yn ardystio'r modd y caiff polisiau eu datblygu a'u rhoi ar waith mewn ymgynghoriad â'r holl randdeiliaid perthnasol.

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 22.
Amended motion: For 29, Abstain 0, Against 22.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Edwards, Richard
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, David
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Elin
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Thomas, Owen John
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.

Amended motion carried.

**Pwynt o Drefn
Point of Order**

Janet Ryder: Point of order. I should have declare an interest as a registered teacher. My husband is also a working teacher.

Janet Ryder: Pwynt o drefn. Dylaswn fod wedi datgan buddiant fel athrawes gofrestredig. Mae fy ngŵr yn athro wrth ei waith hefyd.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That is recorded.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae hynny wedi'i gofnodi.

Several Assembly Members *rose—*

Sawl Aelod o'r Cynulliad *a gododd—*

Lorraine Barrett: I declare an interest as a school governor.

Lorraine Barrett: Datganaf fuddiant fel llywodraethwraig ysgol.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Will Members please be quiet while I confirm that I have down correctly those Members who are declaring an interest? I note that Jane Davidson, Jenny Randerson, Janet Ryder, Mike German, Gareth Jones, Owen John Thomas, Rhodri Glyn Thomas, Val Lloyd, Lorraine Barrett, Christine Gwyther, Gwenda Thomas and Peter Black have declared interests.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. A wnaiff Aelodau fod yn dawel os gwelwch yn dda tra cadarnhaf fy mod wedi nodi'n gywir enwau'r Aelodau hynny sy'n datgan buddiant? Nodaf fod Jane Davidson, Jenny Randerson, Janet Ryder, Mike German, Gareth Jones, Owen John Thomas, Rhodri Glyn Thomas, Val Lloyd, Lorraine Barrett, Christine Gwyther, Gwenda Thomas a Peter Black wedi datgan buddiannau.

That brings today's proceedings to a close.

Dyna ddiwedd y cyfarfod am heddiw.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.32 p.m.
The session ended at 5.32 p.m.*