



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)**

Dydd Iau 20 Mehefin 2002

Thursday 20 June 2002

Cynnwys
Contents

- 3 Cynnig Trefniadol
Procedural Motion
- 3 Ethol i Bwyllgorau
Election to Committees
- 5 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg
Questions to the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language
- 16 Cwestiynau i Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog Cymru a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor
Questions to the Deputy First Minister and Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad
- 24 Datganiad ar Ymweliad y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg â'r Cyngor Prydeinig-Gwyddelig
Statement on the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language's Visit to the British-Irish Council
- 29 Datganiad gan y Dirprwy Lywydd
Statement by the Deputy Presiding Officer
- 31 Pwynt o Drefn
Point of Order
- 31 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Plaleiddiaid (Uchafswm y Lefelau o Waddod mewn Cnydau, Bwydydd a Phorthiant) (Diwygio) 2002
Approval of the Pesticides (Maximum Residue Levels in Crops, Food and Feeding Stuffs) (Amendment) Regulations 2002
- 32 Y Comisiwn ar Bwerau a Threfniadau Etholiadol y Cynulliad
The Commission on Assembly Powers and Electoral Arrangements
- 65 Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru): Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol
Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru): Specialised Health Services
- 98 Pwynt o Drefn
Point of Order
- 98 Dadl Fer: Yr Argyfwng yn ein Cartrefi Gofal
Short Debate: The Crisis in our Care Homes

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambur.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 9.05 a.m. gyda'r Dirprwy Lywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 9.05 a.m. with the Deputy Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion

The Minister for Open Government **Y Gweinidog dros Lywodraeth Agored**
(Carwyn Jones): I propose that **(Carwyn Jones):** Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly, under Standing Order No. 6.16, brings forward the two no-named day motions tabled on 17 June, relating to Committee elections. *y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.16, yn dwyn ymlaen y ddau gynnig heb ddyddiad trafod a gyflwynwyd ar 17 Mehefin, yn ymwneud ag etholiadau i Bwyllgorau.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 30, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 30, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Davies, David
Davies, Ron
Davies, Jocelyn
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
German, Michael
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Law, Peter
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Ethol i Bwyllgorau Election to Committees

The Deputy Presiding Officer (John Y Dirprwy Lywydd (John Marek):

Marek): I propose that

Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly, in accordance with section 57(8) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, elects Mick Bates (Liberal Democrat) to the Economic Development Committee to fill the vacancy consequent upon the resignation of Mike German (Liberal Democrat). (NNDM1086)

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn unol ag adran 57(8) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn ethol Mick Bates (Democrat Rhyddfrydol) i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd i lenwi'r lle gwag ar y Pwyllgor hwnnw yn dilyn ymddiswyddiad Mike German (Democrat Rhyddfrydol). (NNDM1086)

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly, in accordance with Standing Order No. 14, elects Carwyn Jones (Labour) to chair the Committee on Equality of Opportunity in place of Edwina Hart (Labour). (NNDM1087)

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 14, yn ethol Carwyn Jones (Llafur) yn Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal yn lle Edwina Hart (Llafur). (NNDM1087)

First, I should explain that I am in the Chair today because the Presiding Officer is indisposed.

Yn gyntaf, dylwn egluro fy mod yn y Gadair heddiw am fod y Llywydd yn wael.

Ron Davies: Point of order. The Presiding Officer indicated on Tuesday that he would reflect on a point of order that I raised in Plenary that day. Will he be present later?

Ron Davies: Pwynt o drefn. Nododd y Llywydd ddydd Mawrth y byddai'n myfrio ynghylch pwynt o drefn a godais yn y Cyfarfod Llawn y diwrnod hwnnw. A fydd yn bresennol yn ddiweddarach?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I will make a statement on behalf of the Presiding Officer on that matter later today.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Gwnaf ddatganiad ar ran y Llywydd ar y mater hwnnw'n ddiweddarach heddiw.

If Members are content, these motions will be taken under Standing Order No. 8.4A, which allows the Assembly to vote on such motions together, without debate. Are there any objections? I see that there are not. I therefore call for one vote on both motions.

Os yw'r Aelodau'n fodlon, cymerir y cynigion hyn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 8.4A, sy'n caniatáu i'r Cynulliad bleidleisio ar gynigion o'r fath gyda'i gilydd, heb gynnal dadl. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Gwelaf nad oes. Galwaf felly am un bleidlais ar y ddau gynnig.

*Cynigion: O blaid 33, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motions: For 33, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Ron
Davies, Jocelyn

Essex, Sue
 Evans, Delyth
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 German, Michael
 Halford, Alison
 Hancock, Brian
 Hutt, Jane
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Law, Peter
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Melding, David
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynigion.
 Motions carried.*

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg Questions to the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language

Hybu'r Celfyddydau i Bobl Ifanc Promoting the Arts to Young People

Q1 Jocelyn Davies: Will the Minister outline what new measures she is introducing to promote the participation of young people in the arts in Wales? (OAQ18412)

C1 Jocelyn Davies: A wnaiff y Gweinidog sôn am y mesurau newydd y mae hi'n eu cyflwyno i annog pobl ifanc i gymryd rhan yn y celfyddydau yng Nghymru? (OAQ18412)

The Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language (Jenny Randerson): I believe in the benefit of arts for everyone. 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol' recognises the importance of engaging young people in the arts and of providing them with opportunities to participate. It contains several action points on promoting participation. For example, I have asked the Arts Council of Wales to establish a youth arts fund and to increase the number of pilot youth arts strategies across Wales. We plan to launch that fund later this year.

Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg (Jenny Randerson): Credaf y gall pawb gael budd o'r celfyddydau. Mae 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol' yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd denu pobl ifanc at y celfyddydau a darparu cyfleoedd iddynt gymryd rhan. Mae'n cynnwys sawl pwynt gweithredu ar hybu cyfranogiad. Er enghraifft, gofynnais i Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru sefydlu cronfa celfyddydau ieuentid a chynyddu nifer y strategaethau celfyddydau ieuentid peilot ledled Cymru. Bwriadwn lansio'r gronfa honno'n ddiweddarach eleni.

Jocelyn Davies: Your strategy states that schools must maximise the opportunities for pupils to become involved in the arts through the curriculum, and that a survey of provision in key stages 2 and 3 will begin this year. Has

Jocelyn Davies: Mae'ch strategaeth yn datgan bod yn rhaid i ysgolion amlhau'r cyfleoedd i ddisgyblion gymryd rhan yn y celfyddydau drwy gyfrwng y cwricwlwm, ac y bydd arolwg o'r ddarpariaeth yng

that survey begun, and when do you expect it to be completed?

Jenny Randerson: To my knowledge, it has not begun yet. I will write to you with further details.

Eleanor Burnham: Do you agree that we should commend and welcome the work of Clwyd Theatr Cymru in schools?

Jenny Randerson: Yes, and I am pleased that the Arts Council of Wales is close to reaching an agreement on the funding for the mobile theatre tour, which Clwyd Theatr Cymru has undertaken in previous years. The tour's future was in doubt at one point because of funding problems.

Jonathan Morgan: One way of improving the participation and enjoyment of the arts by young people and people generally in Wales would be to ensure a greater display of the wonderful talent that exists in Wales by establishing a national gallery for Wales to showcase our home-grown talent and the talent of those who live and work in Wales.

Jenny Randerson: I refer you to the over 250 pictures by artists from Wales displayed in the National Museum of Wales, and to the consultation document issued yesterday by the national museum on this issue. I suggest, Jonathan—given your many questions on this subject—that you participate in that consultation.

nghyfnodau allweddol 2 a 3 yn cychwyn eleni. A yw'r arolwg hwnnw wedi cychwyn, a pha bryd y disgwyliwch iddo gael ei gwblhau?

Jenny Randerson: Hyd y gwn, nid yw wedi cychwyn eto. Ysgrifennaf atoch i roi manylion pellach.

Eleanor Burnham: A ydych yn cytuno y dylem gymeradwyo a chroesawu gwaith Clwyd Theatr Cymru mewn ysgolion?

Jenny Randerson: Ydwyf, ac yr wyf yn falch bod Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru ymron â dod i gytundeb ar y cyllid ar gyfer y daith theatr symudol, a gynhaliodd Clwyd Theatr Cymru mewn blynyddoedd blaenorol. Yr oedd amheuaeth ynghylch dyfodol y daith ar un adeg oherwydd problemau cyllido.

Jonathan Morgan: Un modd i wella'r cyfranogiad yn y celfyddydau a'r mwynhad ohonynt gan bobl ifanc a phobl yn gyffredinol yng Nghymru fyddai sicrhau yr arddangosir mwy o'r doniau rhyfeddol a geir yng Nghymru drwy sefydlu oriel genedlaethol i Gymru i arddangos ein doniau cynhenid a doniau'r rhai sy'n byw ac yn gweithio yng Nghymru.

Jenny Randerson: Fe'ch cyfeiriaf at y 250 rhagor o ddarluniau gan arlunwyr o Gymru a arddangosir yn Amgueddfa Genedlaethol Cymru, ac at y ddogfen ymgynghori a gyhoeddwyd ddoe gan yr amgueddfa genedlaethol ar y mater hwn. Awgrymaf, Jonathan—o ystyried y nifer fawr o gwestiynau yr ydych wedi'u gofyn ar y pwnc hwn—y dylech gymryd rhan yn yr ymgynghoriad hwnnw.

Mynediad i'r Celfyddydau Access to the Arts

Q2 Janice Gregory: Will the Minister make a statement on access to the arts in the south Wales Valleys? (OAQ18401)

Jenny Randerson: Between January 2001 and March 2002, the Arts Council of Wales allocated 73 Arts for All grants to Valleys-based projects, worth over £1.45 million. Such investment helps to promote access to the arts.

C2 Janice Gregory: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar fynediad i'r celfyddydau yng Nghymoedd y De? (OAQ18401)

Jenny Randerson: Rhwng Ionawr 2001 a Mawrth 2002, dyrannodd Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru 73 o grantiau Celfyddyd i Bawb i brosiectau yn y Cymoedd, gwerth dros £1.45 miliwn. Mae buddsoddi o'r fath yn helpu i hybu mynediad i'r celfyddydau.

Janice Gregory: Thank you for that and for your reply to Jocelyn Davies's question earlier. I look forward to receiving information on the new initiative. Will you join me in congratulating the Cwm Ogwr Project for Youth in my constituency, which has recently opened a new youth resource centre without Arts Council of Wales funding? It has imaginative plans to facilitate dance and drama for the young people of Ogmores Valley. What action can be taken to co-ordinate arts activities with Communities First initiatives to ensure that people who might have been traditionally excluded from the arts have every opportunity to participate?

Jenny Randerson: I congratulate any project that makes progress without funding. It is a sad fact that not every project can get funding. The arts council's schemes have increased in popularity this year; they are easier to access and it is difficult to fund everyone. A key aim of my cultural strategy, 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol', is to make cultural policy an integral part of the Communities First initiative. I believe that there are five Communities First areas in your constituency, Janice. Bridgend County Borough Council has yet to claim funding for those areas, but we expect it to do so. Local authorities were subsequently invited to submit funding bids for sub-wards that show similar levels of deprivation; Bridgend council did not submit any bids.

Owen John Thomas: The Valleys communities come under Cardiff's bid for Cultural Capital of Europe 2008. They have contributed a great deal—more than any other part of Wales in my opinion—to working people's history through the paintings of Josef Herman, Valerie Ganz, Zobole, the work of Jack Jones—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. This is a question and answer session.

Owen John Thomas: If Cardiff's bid is to be an all-Wales effort, the Valleys should be encouraged to participate fully and those

Janice Gregory: Diolchaf i chi am hynny ac am eich ateb i gwestiwn Jocelyn Davies yn gynharach. Edrychaf ymlaen at dderbyn gwybodaeth am y fenter newydd. A wnewch ymuno â mi i longyfarch Prosiect i Ieuentid Cwm Ogwr yn fy etholaeth i, a agorodd ganolfan adnoddau ieuentid newydd yn ddiweddar heb arian gan Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru? Mae ganddo gynlluniau dyfeisgar i hwyluso dawnys a drama ar gyfer pobl ifanc Cwm Ogwr. Pa gamau y gellir eu cymryd i gydlynu gweithgareddau celfyddydol â mentrau Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf i sicrhau bod rhai a allai fod wedi'u cau allan yn draddodiadol o'r celfyddydau'n cael pob cyfle i gymryd rhan?

Jenny Randerson: Llongyfarchaf unrhyw brosiect sy'n gwneud cynnydd heb gael ei gyllido. Mae'n ffaith drist nad yw pob prosiect yn gallu cael cyllid. Mae cynlluniau cyngor y celfyddydau'n fwy poblogaidd eleni; mae'n haws cael atynt ac mae'n anodd rhoi cyllid i bawb. Un o nodau allweddol fy strategaeth ddiwylliannol, 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol', yw gwneud polisi diwylliannol yn rhan annatod o'r fenter Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf. Credaf fod pum ardal Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf yn eich etholaeth chi, Janice. Nid yw Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr wedi hawlio arian ar gyfer yr ardaloedd hynny eto, ond yr ydym yn disgwyl iddo wneud hynny. Wedi hynny gwahoddwyd yr awdurdodau lleol i gyflwyno ceisiadau am arian i is-wardiau sy'n amlygu graddau tebyg o amddifadedd; ni chyflwynodd cyngor Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr unrhyw geisiadau.

Owen John Thomas: Daw cymunedau'r Cymoedd o dan gais Caerdydd i fod yn Brifddinas Diwylliant Ewrop 2008. Maent wedi cyfrannu llawer iawn—mwy na'r un rhan arall o Gymru yn fy marn i—i hanes y werin drwy beintiadau Josef Herman, Valerie Ganz, Zobole, gwaith Jack Jones—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Sesiwn holi ac ateb yw hwn.

Owen John Thomas: Os yw cais Caerdydd i fod yn ymdrech gan Gymru gyfan, dylid annog y Cymoedd i gymryd rhan lawn a

communities should benefit from this experience. How will you facilitate that, Minister?

Jenny Randerson: We have urged Cardiff's bid team to ensure that it visits all parts of Wales to solicit support and projects. Our funding and assistance for the bid depends upon it taking an all-Wales approach.

dylai'r cymunedau hynny elwa o'r profiad hwn. Sut y byddwch yn hwyluso hynny, Weinidog?

Jenny Randerson: Yr ydym wedi annog tîm cais Caerdydd i sicrhau ei fod yn ymweld â phob rhan o Gymru i geisio cefnogaeth a phrosiectau ganddynt. Mae ein cyllid a'n cymorth i'r cais yn dibynnu ar a yw'r tîm yn dilyn dull gweithredu Cymru gyfan.

9:15 a.m.

Hyrwyddo Dramâu Newydd Promoting New Drama

C3 David Lloyd: Pa fesurau newydd sy'n cael eu cyflwyno, drwy gyfrwng y strategaeth ddiwylliant, i hyrwyddo drama newydd yng Nghymru? (OAQ18414)

Q3 David Lloyd: What new measures are being introduced, through the culture strategy, to promote new drama in Wales? (OAQ18414)

Jenny Randerson: My culture strategy, 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol', requests the Arts Council of Wales to develop a new drama strategy as part of its five-year arts development plan.

Jenny Randerson: Mae fy strategaeth diwylliant, 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol', yn gofyn i Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru ddatblygu strategaeth drama newydd fel rhan o'i gynllun pum mlynedd i ddatblygu'r celfyddydau.

David Lloyd: Bu beirniadaeth yn ystod Eisteddfod Genedlaethol yr Urdd yn ddiweddar am ddiffyg cefnogaeth Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru dros gynhyrchu a hyrwyddo cystadlaethau dramâu yn yr ŵyl. Pam hynny? Ai oherwydd diffyg adnoddau, neu a yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno â chyngor y celfyddydau nad yw'r syniad yn ddigon cynhyrfus?

David Lloyd: There was criticism during the recent Urdd National Eisteddfod about the lack of support from the Arts Council of Wales for producing and promoting drama competitions in the festival. Why is that? Is it because of a lack of resources, or does the Minister agree with the arts council that the idea is not sufficiently exciting?

Jenny Randerson: I was not aware of any such criticism; the Urdd Eisteddfod received considerably more funding this year. We are considering the future. The arts council had a strong presence at the eisteddfod, with a much-admired display of art produced for a competition. Please write to me with details of the criticisms that you heard. No such criticisms were expressed to me by the festival organisers.

Jenny Randerson: Nid oeddwn yn ymwybodol o unrhyw feirniadaeth o'r fath; cafodd Eisteddfod yr Urdd fwy o gyllid o lawer eleni. Yr ydym yn ystyried y dyfodol. Yr oedd cyngor y celfyddydau'n amlwg iawn yn yr eisteddfod, a chafodd ei arddangosfa o gelfyddyd a gynhyrchwyd ar gyfer cystadleuaeth lawer o ganmoliaeth. A ysgrifennwch ataf i roi manylion y feirniadaeth a glywsoch? Ni fynegodd trefnwyr yr ŵyl unrhyw feirniadaeth o'r fath i mi.

Peter Black: The BBC currently has problems distinguishing between current affairs and fiction. However, will you tell us what the Assembly Government is doing to

Peter Black: Mae'r BBC yn ei chael yn anodd gwahaniaethu rhwng materion cyfoes a ffuglen ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, a wnewch ddweud wrthym beth y mae

encourage broadcasters to commission new drama in Wales?

Jenny Randerson: You understand, Peter, that I do not have control over the BBC. I certainly do not have control over the content of its programmes, though it might be an interesting future goal. On the serious point, I am working closely with the broadcasters in considering regional programming, in the context of the Communications Bill in particular. That Bill has significant implications for the future of regional broadcasting. We all take the issue to heart and are working closely on it.

David Melding: Do you agree that if Wales had a national theatre, perhaps based in north Wales, it would go a long way to encourage new drama?

Jenny Randerson: Wales has a national theatre; I invite you to visit Clwyd Theatr Cymru, which was designated as such by the arts council a considerable time ago. Clwyd Theatr Cymru and the arts council are working together to develop its role as a national theatre. I also point out the considerably increased funding for Sgript Cymru, which is responsible for developing new writing for the theatre in English and Welsh.

Lorraine Barrett: Will you continue to support funding for Hijinx Theatre? It does marvellous work in conjunction with Mencap in staging dramas such as last night's production at City Hall, which the First Minister attended, which dealt with the challenging situations faced by people with learning difficulties.

Jenny Randerson: I hope that support for Hijinx in the future will be strong, particularly as it will be located in the Wales Millennium Centre from the end of 2004. Hijinx's work pinpoints the important cross-cutting nature of cultural issues—they are at the heart of social inclusion and regeneration.

Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei wneud i annog darlledwyr i gomisiynu dramâu newydd yng Nghymru?

Jenny Randerson: Yr ydych yn deall, Peter, nad oes gennyf reolaeth dros y BBC. Yn sicr, nid oes gennyf reolaeth dros gynnwys ei raglenni, er y gallai hynny fod yn nod ddi-ddorol ar gyfer y dyfodol. Ynghylch y pwynt difrifol, yr wyf yn cydweithio'n agos â'r darlledwyr wrth ystyried rhaglennu rhanbarthol, yng nghyd-destun y Mesur Cyfathrebu'n enwedig. Mae i'r Mesur hwnnw oblygiadau pwysig i ddyfodol darlledu rhanbarthol. Yr ydym oll o ddifrifol ynghylch y mater hwnnw ac yr ydym yn gweithio arno'n fanwl.

David Melding: A ydych yn cytuno, pe byddai gan Gymru theatr genedlaethol, wedi'i lleoli yn y Gogledd efallai, y byddai hynny'n cyfrannu'n fawr at hybu dramâu newydd?

Jenny Randerson: Mae theatr genedlaethol gan Gymru; fe'ch gwahoddaf i ymweld â Clwyd Theatr Cymru, a ddynodwyd felly gan gyngor y celfyddydau gryn amser yn ôl. Mae Clwyd Theatr Cymru a chyngor y celfyddydau'n cydweithio i ddatblygu ei rôl fel theatr genedlaethol. Tynnaf sylw hefyd at y cynnydd sylweddol mewn cyllid ar gyfer Sgript Cymru, sy'n gyfrifol am ddatblygu ysgrifennu newydd ar gyfer y theatr yn y Gymraeg a'r Saesneg.

Lorraine Barrett: A wnewch barhau i gefnogi cyllid i Theatr Hijinx? Mae'n gwneud gwaith ardderchog ar y cyd â Mencap drwy lwyfannu dramâu fel cynhyrchiad neithiwr yn Neuadd y Ddinas, y bu Prif Weinidog Cymru'n bresennol ynddo, a oedd yn ymdrin â'r sefyllfaoedd ymestynnol a wynebir gan bobl sydd ag anawsterau dysgu.

Jenny Randerson: Gobeithiaf y bydd cefnogaeth gryf i Hijinx yn y dyfodol, yn enwedig gan y bydd wedi'i leoli yng Nghanolfan Mileniwm Cymru o ddiwedd 2004. Mae gwaith Hijinx yn amlygu natur drawsbynciol bwysig materion diwylliannol—maent yn rhan hanfodol o gynhwysiant ac adfywio cymdeithasol.

Hyrwyddo Chwaraeon ymysg Merched **Promotion of Sport among Girls**

Q4 Brian Gibbons: What is the Minister doing to promote sporting activities among girls? (OAQ18454)

Jenny Randerson: Increasing female participation in sport in Wales is a priority in the Assembly Government's 'Plan for Wales 2001'. I have asked the Sports Council for Wales to focus on this and it has, for example, introduced the women and girls action plan, the girls first initiative and the golf development plan.

Brian Gibbons: Apart from the obvious intrinsic benefit of such activities, we know that participation in sport by boys leads to other positive benefits in terms of lifestyle and health. Anecdotally, it seems that, after girls leave school in their mid to late teens, their participation in sport declines. What evidence do you have of the level of girls' participation in sport when they reach early adulthood?

Jenny Randerson: The sports council has compiled detailed evidence in a series of studies of physical education and sport in primary and secondary schools. The council has a wide range of statistics, which are available in the Library, showing the decline to which you referred. That is why one of the aims of the girls first initiative is to halve the gap between boys' and girls' participation by 2005. That may not sound good enough in the long term—one would like there not to be a gap—but it is a realistic and challenging target. I draw Members' attention to the statistics available in the Library.

Pauline Jarman: Women sport commentators, such as Amanda Protheroe Thomas and Angharad Mair, do much to promote and encourage sport among girls and women. Do you agree that improving the quality of changing rooms is key to promoting participation in sport among girls, and has any new opportunities fund money

C4 Brian Gibbons: Beth y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud i hyrwyddo gweithgareddau chwaraeon ymysg merched? (OAQ18454)

Jenny Randerson: Mae cynyddu cyfranogiad menywod mewn chwaraeon yng Nghymru'n flaenoriaeth yn 'Cynllun i Gymru 2001' Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Yr wyf wedi gofyn i Gyngor Chwaraeon Cymru ganolbwyntio ar hyn ac mae wedi cyflwyno'r cynllun gweithredu menywod a merched, y fenter merched yn gyntaf a'r cynllun datblygu golff, er enghraifft.

Brian Gibbons: Ar wahân i fudd cynhenid amlwg gweithgareddau o'r fath, gwyddom fod cyfranogiad mewn chwaraeon gan fechgyn yn arwain at fanteision cadarnhaol eraill o ran eu ffordd o fyw a'u hiechyd. Yn anecdotaid, mae'n ymddangos bod cyfranogiad merched mewn chwaraeon yn dirywio ar ôl iddynt adael yr ysgol rhwng canol a diwedd eu harddegau. Pa dystiolaeth sydd gennych o gyfraddau cyfranogiad merched mewn chwaraeon fel oedolion ifanc?

Jenny Randerson: Mae'r cyngor chwaraeon wedi casglu dystiolaeth fanwl mewn cyfres o astudiaethau o addysg gorfforol a chwaraeon mewn ysgolion cynradd ac uwchradd. Mae gan y cyngor amrediad eang o ystadegau, sydd ar gael yn y Llyfrgell, sy'n dangos y dirywiad y cyfeiriasoch ato. Dyna pam mai un o nodau'r fenter merched yn gyntaf yw haneru'r bwlch rhwng cyfranogiad bechgyn a merched erbyn 2005. Efallai nad yw hynny'n swnio'n ddigon da yn y tymor hir—byddai'n dda gan rywun pe na fyddai bwlch—ond mae'n darged realistig ac ymestynnol. Tynnaf sylw'r Aelodau at yr ystadegau sydd ar gael yn y Llyfrgell.

Pauline Jarman: Mae menywod sy'n sylwebu ar chwaraeon, fel Amanda Protheroe Thomas ac Angharad Mair, yn gwneud llawer i hybu a hyrwyddo chwaraeon ymysg merched a menywod. A ydych yn cytuno bod gwella ansawdd ystafelloedd newid yn hollbwysig er mwyn annog merched i gymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon, ac a

been channelled in that direction?

Jenny Randerson: I agree that issues such as good quality changing rooms are key. The sports council identified that as part of the work that needs to be done to halve the gap in participation to which I referred. The new opportunities fund money is being rolled out at present in accordance with local authority priorities. It is early days in terms of spending the money but, undoubtedly, providing improved changing rooms will be one priority, and there will be projects to that end.

John Griffiths: You are aware of the success of Hartridge High School in my constituency, in football activities, for example, in the sixth form. Are you also aware of the strenuous efforts that it has made to establish a girls' football team? Unfortunately that has had limited success so far, for some of the reasons to which Brian Gibbons alluded. It now has plans for a dance academy. Will you take an interest in that and offer what support you can?

Jenny Randerson: The school has a tremendous reputation for success and excellence in sporting activities. One interesting point about the school curriculum since 2000 is that, for those pupils who do not want to participate in competitive team games, movement, dance, and so on are now an accepted part of the curriculum and are good, viable alternatives. That points to the way forward. Great importance is also placed on encouraging pupils to undertake extra curricular sport. The physical education and school sport taskforce report, which is being implemented on a pilot scheme basis by my colleague, Jane Davidson, concentrated on that.

Peter Rogers: I welcome your response on the gender divide and encouraging ladies to play sport. Do you agree that, apart from the state of changing rooms, another problem is ensuring that we have the facilities and sports pitches available to play on, particularly in atrocious weather? Much time is wasted because of that.

sianelwyd unrhyw arian o'r gronfa cyfleoedd newydd i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw?

Jenny Randerson: Cytunaf fod materion fel ystafelloedd newydd o ansawdd da'n hollbwysig. Mae'r cyngor chwaraeon wedi nodi hynny fel rhan o'r gwaith y mae'n rhaid ei wneud i haneru'r bwlch mewn cyfranogiad y cyfeiriais ato. Mae arian y gronfa cyfleoedd newydd yn cael ei ddosbarthu ar hyn o bryd yn unol â blaenoriaethau'r awdurdodau lleol. Megis dechrau y mae'r gwario ar yr arian ond, yn ddi-os, bydd darparu gwell ystafelloedd newid yn un flaenoriaeth, a bydd prosiectau i'r perwyl hwnnw.

John Griffiths: Yr ydych yn ymwybodol o lwyddiant Ysgol Uwchradd Hartridge yn fy etholaeth i, mewn gweithgareddau pêl-droed, er enghraifft, yn y chweched dosbarth. A wyddoch hefyd am ei hymdrechion mawr i sefydlu tîm pêl-droed merched? Ychydig o lwyddiant a gafodd hyd yn hyn, gwaetha'r modd, am rai o'r rhesymau y cyfeiriodd Brian Gibbons atynt. Mae ganddi gynlluniau'n awr ar gyfer academi ddawns. A wnewch ymddiddori yn honno a chynnig hynny o gymorth a allwch?

Jenny Randerson: Mae gan yr ysgol enw rhagorol am lwyddiant a rhagoriaeth mewn gweithgareddau chwaraeon. Un pwynt diddorol am y cwricwlwm ysgolion ers 2000 yw bod symud, dawn, ac yn y blaen, yn rhan dderbyniol o'r cwricwlwm bellach i'r disgyblion hynny nad ydynt am gymryd rhan mewn gemau tîm cystadleuol, ac maent yn ddewisiadau amgen ymarferol a da. Mae hynny'n dangos y ffordd ymlaen. Rhoddir pwys mawr hefyd ar annog disgyblion i gymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon allgwrwicwlaidd. Yr oedd adroddiad y tasglu addysg gorfforol a chwaraeon ysgol, a weithredir ar sail cynlluniau peilot gan fy nghyd-Weinidog, Jane Davidson, yn canolbwyntio ar hynny.

Peter Rogers: Croesawaf eich ymateb ar y rhaniad rhwng y merched a bechgyn ac ar annog menywod i gymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon. A ydych yn cytuno mai problem arall, ar wahân i gyflwr ystafelloedd newid, yw sicrhau bod cyfleusterau a chaeau chwaraeon ar gael i chwarae arnynt, yn enwedig ar adegau o dywydd gwael?

Gwastraffir llawer o amser oherwydd hynny.

Jenny Randerson: The new opportunities fund money, which is £48.75 million, is focused on small projects, of which providing good pitches would be a prime example, as well as providing good changing rooms and so on. It will not be focused on grandiose projects, but on smaller projects that will have been prioritised by local education authorities. They are working with the sports council and the new opportunities fund to consider the overall spread of facilities in an area. Those facilities will be mainly, though not exclusively, located in schools, but will also be open to the community as part of the grant conditions.

Jenny Randerson: Anelir arian y gronfa cyfleoedd newydd, sef £48.75 miliwn, at brosiectau bach, a byddai darparu caeau da'n enghraifft ragorol o hynny, yn ogystal â darparu ystafelloedd newid da ac yn y blaen. Ni chaiff ei anelu at brosiectau mawreddog, ond at brosiectau llai a fydd wedi'u blaenoriaethu gan yr awdurdodau addysg lleol. Maent yn gweithio gyda'r cyngor chwaraeon a'r gronfa cyfleoedd newydd i ystyried gwasgariad cyffredinol y cyfleusterau yn eu hardaloedd. Lleolir y cyfleusterau hynny mewn ysgolion yn bennaf, ond nid yn gyfan gwbl, ond byddant ar agor i'r gymuned hefyd fel rhan o amodau'r grant.

9:25 a.m.

Cyllido Theatr Cyfrwng Cymraeg Funding Welsh-medium Theatre

C5 Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y lefelau cyllid sydd ar gael i theatr drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg? (OAQ18413)

Q5 The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Will the Minister make a statement on the funding levels available to Welsh-medium theatre? (OAQ18413)

Jenny Randerson: In 2001-02 the Arts Council of Wales revenue grant to Welsh-medium theatres totalled nearly £840,000, and £74,000 was also allocated from lottery funds. Revenue spend this year is expected to be around £986,000. In addition, nearly £47,000 was allocated to Welsh language performances for the night out scheme in 2001-02. The arts council has also set aside £250,000 for this year to make a start on its proposals for a Welsh language national theatre.

Jenny Randerson: Yn 2001-02 yr oedd cyfanswm grant refeniw Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru i theatrau cyfrwng Cymraeg bron yn £840,000, a dyrannwyd £74,000 o'r cronfeydd loteri hefyd. Mae disgwyl y bydd y gwariant refeniw eleni tua £986,000. Yn ogystal â hynny, dyrannwyd bron £47,000 i berfformiadau Cymraeg ar gyfer y cynllun noson allan yn 2001-02. Mae cyngor y celfyddydau hefyd wedi neilltuo £250,000 ar gyfer eleni i ddechrau ar ei gynigion ar gyfer theatr genedlaethol Gymraeg.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Yr wyf yn siŵr yr hoffech fynegi cefnogaeth i fentrau cymunedol i ddatblygu drama drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, megis theatr ieuenctid ym Môn sydd ar hyn o bryd yn sefydlu menter o'r fath. A wnewch gefnogi hefyd—a gwrandawais yn astud ar eich sylwadau ynglŷn â'r cyllid sydd ar gael—ffynonellau cyllid iddynt? Mae'r mentrau hyn yn cynnig cyfle unigryw ac amhrisiadwy i bobl ifanc a byddai eich cefnogaeth yn rhoi arwydd i gyngor y celfyddydau mai dyna'r math o fentrau yr hoffech iddo'u cefnogi.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I am sure that you will wish to express support for community initiatives to develop drama through the medium of Welsh, such as the youth theatre in Anglesey that is currently establishing such an initiative. Would you also—and I listened carefully to your comments on the funding available—support funding streams for them? These initiatives offer a unique and invaluable experience to young people and your support would indicate to the arts council that this is the kind of initiative you want it to support.

Jenny Randerson: Such projects are in the strategy, 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol'. The arts council is developing its own detailed five-year strategy, which is based on 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol'. That strategy will be available in July. The arts council has also received a considerable increase in funding this year. Projects, such as the undoubtedly valuable one to which you referred, will be considered in light of those strategies.

David Davies: Nid oes digon o arian ar gael ar gyfer y theatr yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, gwariwn arian mawr ar gynhyrchu dogfennau. A yw hi'n bryd i ni newid ein blaenoriaethau?

Jenny Randerson: Those two points are totally unconnected. I take issue with your bald statement that there is not enough money available. There is never enough money for any project in any country. We can always spend more money. However, the arts council has received an increase in funding of almost 30 per cent this year. That is a dramatic increase by anyone's standards.

Jenny Randerson: Mae cynlluniau o'r fath yn y strategaeth, 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol'. Mae cyngor y celfyddydau'n datblygu ei strategaeth bum mlynedd fanwl ei hun, sy'n seiliedig ar 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol'. Bydd y strategaeth honno ar gael yng Ngorffennaf. Mae cyngor y celfyddydau wedi cael cryn gynnydd yn ei gyllid eleni hefyd. Caiff prosiectau, fel yr un diamheuol o werthfawr y cyfeiriasoch ato, eu hystyried yng ngoleuni'r strategaethau hynny.

David Davies: There is not enough funding currently available for the theatre in Wales. However, we spend a great deal of money on producing documents. Is it time to change our priorities?

Jenny Randerson: Nid oes cysylltiad o gwbl rhwng y ddau bwynt hynny. Anghytunaf â'ch datganiad moel nad oes digon o arian ar gael. Nid oes byth ddigon o arian i unrhyw brosiect mewn unrhyw wlad. Mae lle inni wario mwy o arian bob amser. Fodd bynnag, mae cyngor y celfyddydau wedi cael cynnydd yn ei gyllid o ymron i 30 y cant eleni. Mae hynny'n gynnydd sylweddol yn ôl unrhyw safon.

Hyrwyddo Chwaraeon ymysg Plant ac mewn Cymunedau Promoting Sport among Children and in Communities

Q6 The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): Will the Minister make a statement on the promotion of sport among children and local communities? (OAQ18405)

Jenny Randerson: The promotion of sport among children and in local communities is vital. It acts as a catalyst to encourage more children to participate in sport and helps them to consider adopting a healthier and more active lifestyle. Current initiatives, such as Dragon Sport, focus on that.

Nick Bourne: Will you join me in congratulating the community group in Fishguard, which opposed Pembrokeshire County Council's plan to build another school on the Haylett Grange school playing fields. I was associated with that campaign. The good news is that at long last

C6 Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar hyrwyddo chwaraeon ymysg plant a chymunedau lleol? (OAQ18405)

Jenny Randerson: Mae'n hollbwysig hyrwyddo chwaraeon ymysg plant ac mewn cymunedau lleol. Mae'n gweithredu fel catalydd i annog mwy o blant i gymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon ac mae'n eu helpu i ystyried mabwysiadu ffordd o fyw iachach a mwy bywiog. Mae'r mentrau presennol, fel Campau'r Ddraig, yn canolbwyntio ar hynny.

Nick Bourne: A wnewch ymuno â mi i longyfarch y grŵp cymunedol yn Abergwaun, a wrthwynebodd gynllun Cyngor Sir Benfro i godi ysgol arall ar gaeau chwarae ysgol Haylett Grange. Bûm yn gysylltiedig â'r ymgyrch honno. Y newyddion da yw bod Cyngor Sir Benfro

Pembrokeshire County Council has climbed down; a new school will not be built on those valuable playing fields and they will continue to be available to the schoolchildren of the Fishguard area.

Jenny Randerson: It is difficult for me to respond to that because that matter lies within the portfolio of my colleague, Sue Essex. I suggest that you write to her about it.

Alun Pugh: Many children in north Wales have the talent to represent Wales, but many sporting governing bodies arrange their training and coaching in, or near, Cardiff. Do you accept that this is not fair play and will you ensure that grant conditions ensure equal sporting opportunities?

Jenny Randerson: I know that you are concerned about this, Alun, because you have raised the matter with me before. I have pursued it with the Sports Council for Wales. Governing bodies receive funding from the sports council under strict conditions, one of which is that training should be held throughout Wales. However, given that the majority of the population live in south Wales, it is likely that more training will be available in the south than in the north. If you have examples, I would be happy to raise them with the sports council. The council is anxious to ensure that governing bodies fulfil their obligations in this regard, as in every other regard.

Brian Hancock: The new opportunities fund has already been mentioned today. How is it being used to promote athletics in school? I raise this issue as chair of Newport Harriers Athletic Club.

Jenny Randerson: As I said earlier, communities fund money is being distributed according to local authorities' priorities. Some of the money will be used to support athletics. You could contact your local authority to ask what set of priorities it has established. I draw your attention to the excellent series of studies on each local authority area by the Sports Council for Wales. It shows its success in contrast with

wedi syrthio ar ei fai o'r diwedd; ni chodir ysgol newydd ar y caeau chwarae gwerthfawr hynny a byddant yn dal i fod ar gael i blant ysgol ardal Abergwaun.

Jenny Randerson: Mae'n anodd imi ymateb i hynny gan fod y mater o fewn portffolio fy nghyd-Weinidog, Sue Essex. Awgrymaf eich bod yn ysgrifennu ati hi yn ei gylch.

Alun Pugh: Mae llawer o blant yn y Gogledd yn ddigon talentog i gynrychioli Cymru, ond mae llawer o'r cyrff llywodraethu chwaraeon yn trefnu eu hyfforddiant yng Nghaerdydd neu'i chyffiniau. A ydych yn derbyn nad yw hynny'n rhoi chwarae teg ac a wnewch sicrhau bod amodau grantiau'n sicrhau cyfleoedd cyfartal mewn chwaraeon?

Jenny Randerson: Gwn eich bod yn bryderus iawn am hyn, Alun, gan eich bod wedi codi'r mater gyda mi o'r blaen. Yr wyf wedi holi Cyngor Chwaraeon Cymru yn ei gylch. Mae cyrff llywodraethu'n derbyn arian gan y cyngor chwaraeon dan amodau manwl, ac un ohonynt yw y dylid cynnal hyfforddiant ledled Cymru. Fodd bynnag, gan fod y rhan fwyaf o'r boblogaeth yn byw yn y De, mae'n debygol y bydd mwy o hyfforddiant ar gael yn y De nag yn y Gogledd. Os oes gennych enghreifftiau, byddwn yn falch o'u codi gyda'r cyngor chwaraeon. Mae'r cyngor yn awyddus i sicrhau bod y cyrff llywodraethu'n cyflawni eu hymrwymadau yn hyn o beth, fel ym mhob peth arall.

Brian Hancock: Cyfeiriwyd at y gronfa cyfleoedd newydd eisoes heddiw. Sut y caiff ei defnyddio i hyrwyddo athletau mewn ysgolion? Codaf y mater hwn fel cadeirydd Clwb Athletig Rhedwyr Traws Gwlad Casnewydd.

Jenny Randerson: Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, dosbarthir arian y gronfa cymunedau yn ôl blaenoriaethau'r awdurdodau lleol. Defnyddir rhywfaint o'r arian i hybu athletau. Gallech gysylltu â'ch awdurdod lleol i holi am y set o flaenoriaethau a sefydlodd. Tynnaf eich sylw at y gyfres ragorol o astudiaethau ar bob ardal awdurdod lleol gan Gyngor Chwaraeon Cymru. Mae'n dangos ei lwyddiant mewn

other local authorities because that always pinpoints the areas of weakness in any particular area, as well as the areas of strength.

cyferbyniad ag awdurdodau lleol eraill gan fod hynny bob amser yn tynnu sylw at y meysydd gwan mewn unrhyw ardal benodol, yn ogystal â'r meysydd cryf.

Ailstrwythuro Undeb Rygbi Cymru Restructuring the Welsh Rugby Union

Q7 Mick Bates: Will the Minister make a statement on the restructuring of the Welsh Rugby Union? (OAQ18395)

C7 Mick Bates: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ailstrwythuro Undeb Rygbi Cymru? (OAQ18395)

Jenny Randerson: I am disappointed that the Sir Tasker Watkins Committee recommendations did not receive more support at the extraordinary general meeting on 26 May. However, the clubs and affiliated bodies of the Welsh Rugby Union voted for a structure, which they believe is the best way forward for the good of the game.

Jenny Randerson: Yr wyf yn siomedig nad oedd mwy o gefnogaeth i argymhellion Pwyllgor Syr Tasker Watkins yn y cyfarfod cyffredinol arbennig ar 26 Mai. Er hynny, pleidleisiodd clybiau a chyrff cysylltiedig Undeb Rygbi Cymru dros strwythur y maent yn credu ei fod yn cynnig y ffordd orau ymlaen er budd y gêm.

Mick Bates: I share your disappointment. However, I am sure you will join me in congratulating our team on its vastly improved performances in South Africa. Will you undertake to convey that sentiment to our team and to the WRU?

Mick Bates: Rhannaf eich siom. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn sicr yr ymunwch â mi i longyfarch ein tîm ar ei berfformiadau gwell o lawer yn Ne Affrica. A wnewch ymrwymo i gyfleu'r teimlad hwnnw i'n tîm ac i Undeb Rygbi Cymru?

Jenny Randerson: I am happy to do so, and I delight in the fact that its performances against South Africa have improved. However, South Africa has been experiencing its own rugby problems and has recently voted for a dramatic restructuring of its rugby union, along the same lines that the Tasker Watkins report recommended for the WRU.

Jenny Randerson: Byddaf yn falch o wneud hynny, ac ymhyfrydaf yn y ffaith bod ei berfformiadau yn erbyn De Affrica wedi gwella. Fodd bynnag, mae De Affrica hithau wedi profi anawsterau mewn rygbi ac wedi pleidleisio'n ddiweddar dros ailstrwythuro ei hundeb rygbi'n sylweddol, mewn modd tebyg i'r hyn a argymhellodd adroddiad Tasker Watkins ar gyfer Undeb Rygbi Cymru.

Hyrwyddo Diwylliant a Chwaraeon ymhlith Pobl Ifanc Promoting Culture and Sport among Young People

Q8 Jonathan Morgan: How is the Minister promoting culture and sport among young people in South Wales Central? (OAQ18392)

C8 Jonathan Morgan: Sut y mae'r Gweinidog yn hyrwyddo diwylliant a chwaraeon ymhlith pobl ifanc yng Nghanol De Cymru? (OAQ18392)

Jenny Randerson: 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol' demonstrates the Welsh Assembly Government's commitment to artistic freedom and the pursuit of excellence. We also wish to see arts, culture and sport readily accessible to all and we must recognise the value of community-based initiatives. For example, over £4 million was paid out in arts

Jenny Randerson: Mae 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol' yn dangos ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ryddid celfyddydol a'r ymgais tuag at ragoriaeth. Yr ydym hefyd yn dymuno i'r celfyddydau, diwylliant a chwaraeon fod ar gael yn rhwydd i bawb a rhaid inni gydnabod gwerth mentrau mewn cymunedau. Er enghraifft,

council grants to the South Wales Central area in the last year. The Assembly Government will continue to promote sport throughout Wales by working in partnership with the Sports Council for Wales.

Jonathan Morgan: We have already heard a great deal about the links between sporting opportunities and healthy lifestyles. This is important in the South Wales Valleys area of the region that I represent. Will the Government outline what special measures it is considering to promote healthy lifestyles in deprived communities?

Jenny Randerson: We have received a report, which relates to the links between healthy lifestyles and sport. It is at the centre of our discussions. It has been discussed at the Cabinet sub-committee on young people, and my colleague, Jane Hutt, is taking forward the work on promoting a healthy lifestyle. Sport is a strong theme in our thinking on that.

talwyd dros £4 miliwn ar ffurf grantiau cyngor y celfyddydau yn ardal Canol De Cymru y llynedd. Bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn parhau i hyrwyddo chwaraeon ledled Cymru drwy weithio mewn partneriaeth â Chyngor Chwaraeon Cymru.

Jonathan Morgan: Yr ydym wedi clywed llawer iawn eisoes am y cysylltiadau rhwng cyfleoedd mewn chwaraeon a ffyrdd o fyw iach. Mae hyn yn bwysig yn ardal Cymoedd y De yn y rhanbarth a gynrychiolaf. A wnaiff y Llywodraeth amlinellu pa gamau arbennig y mae'n eu hystyried i hyrwyddo ffyrdd o fyw iach mewn cymunedau difreintiedig?

Jenny Randerson: Yr ydym wedi derbyn adroddiad, sy'n ymwneud â'r cysylltiadau rhwng ffyrdd o fyw iach a chwaraeon. Mae'n ganolog i'n trafodaethau. Fe'i trafodwyd yn is-bwyllgor y Cabinet ar bobl ifanc, ac mae fy nghyd-Weinidog, Jane Hutt, yn bwrw ymlaen â'r gwaith ar hyrwyddo ffordd o fyw iach. Mae chwaraeon yn thema gryf yn ein hystyriaeth o hynny.

Cwestiynau i Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog Cymru a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor

Questions to the Deputy First Minister and Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Question 1 (OAQ18393) has been withdrawn.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Y mae cwestiwn 1 (OAQ18393) wedi'i dynnu yn ôl.

Y Diciau mewn Gwartheg Tuberculosis in Cattle

Q2 Jonathan Morgan: What discussions has the Minister had with Westminster colleagues regarding tuberculosis in cattle? (OAQ18380)

C2 Jonathan Morgan: Pa drafodaethau y mae wedi'u cael gyda'i gyd-Weinidogion yn San Steffan ynghylch y diciâu mewn gwartheg? (OAQ18380)

Q4 William Graham: Will the Minister make a statement concerning the adequacy of resources currently available for testing livestock for bovine tuberculosis? (OAQ18446)

C4 William Graham: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ynghylch digonolrwydd yr adnoddau sydd ar gael i gynnal profion am y diciâu mewn gwartheg ar dda byw? (OAQ18446)

The Deputy First Minister and Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad (Michael German): The UK and Welsh Assembly Governments are committed to finding a long-term solution to bovine tuberculosis. I met with Margaret Beckett

Dirprwy Brif Weinidog Cymru a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor (Michael German): Mae Llywodraethau'r DU a Chynulliad Cymru wedi ymrwymo i ddarganfod ateb tymor hir i'r diciâu mewn gwartheg. Cyfarfûm â

yesterday to discuss this and other issues. In addition, the Welsh Assembly Government is represented on all the relevant working groups. The interim programme of action to tackle TB gives top priority to tackling the backlog of overdue tests. Twenty five additional staff have been deployed by the State Veterinary Service, and the Welsh Assembly Government is working closely with the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs to expand the programme.

Jonathan Morgan: Do you agree that the SVS has been unable to carry out all of its disease control functions effectively because of the inadequate Government funding and resources? What are you doing to ensure that this problem is resolved quickly?

Michael German: As you know Jonathan, the Assembly has responsibility for TB, but DEFRA controls delivery mechanisms, including the SVS. I hope that you will seek a view within your group as to how you might help us decide what changes should be made to those legislative processes. However, I raised the issue of funding with Margaret Beckett yesterday. I am pressing the UK Government to enable us to put more money into this service.

9:35 a.m.

William Graham: If you are not slipping and sliding up and down your steep learning curve, will you specify a test schedule that will give our farmers confidence that you are committed to addressing the problem of bovine tuberculosis?

Michael German: Two additional measures have been introduced to enhance the testing programme. The gamma-interferon blood test will be piloted in some areas; the traditional tuberculin skin test will also be used. There will also be a wider application of the severe interpretation of skin test results.

Mick Bates: You will be aware of the increased incidence of TB and the restrictions

Margaret Beckett ddoe i drafod hyn a materion eraill. Yn ogystal â hynny, cynrychiolir Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar yr holl weithgorau perthnasol. Mae'r rhaglen weithredu interim i ymladd y diciáu yn rhoi'r flaenoriaeth bennaf i fynd i'r afael â'r ôl-groniad o brofion hwyr. Mae 25 o staff ychwanegol wedi'u gosod i wneud y gwaith gan y Gwasanaeth Milfeddygol Gwladol, ac mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cydweithio'n agos ag Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig i ehangu'r rhaglen.

Jonathan Morgan: A ydych yn cytuno nad yw'r Gwasanaeth Milfeddygol Gwladol wedi gallu cyflawni ei holl swyddogaethau rheoli clefydau'n effeithiol am fod yr arian a'r adnoddau gan y Llywodraeth yn annigonol? Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i sicrhau ateb buan i'r broblem hon?

Michael German: Fel y gwyddoch, Jonathan, gan y Cynulliad y mae'r cyfrifoldeb dros y diciáu, ond DEFRA sy'n rheoli'r mecanweithiau darparu, gan gynnwys y Gwasanaeth Milfeddygol Gwladol. Gobeithiaf y byddwch yn ceisio barn o fewn eich grŵp ynghylch sut y gallech ein helpu i benderfynu ar y newidiadau y dylid eu gwneud i'r prosesau deddfwriaethol hynny. Fodd bynnag, codais fater ariannu gyda Margaret Beckett ddoe. Yr wyf yn pwysu ar Lywodraeth y DU i'n galluogi i roi mwy o arian i'r gwasanaeth hwn.

William Graham: Os nad ydych yn llithro i fyny ac i lawr eich cromlin ddysgu serth, a wnewch bennu amserlen profion a wnaiff roi hyder i'n ffermwyr eich bod wedi ymrwymo i ymdrin â phroblem y diciáu mewn gwartheg?

Michael German: Cyflwynwyd dau fesur ychwanegol i wella'r rhaglen brofi. Rhagbrofir y prawf gwaed gama-interfferon mewn rhai ardaloedd; defnyddir y prawf croen twbercwlin traddodiadol hefyd. Bydd defnydd helaethach hefyd o'r dehongli manwl ar ganlyniadau profion croen.

Mick Bates: Byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r cynnydd yn nifer achosion y diciáu a'r

placed on farms. One of the biggest problems relates to pedigree herds. Under restriction, farmers cannot sell their stock and if they do, the fat price is nothing compared with the compensation price. Will you undertake to try to relieve these cash flow problems by allowing inconclusive reactors to be taken from farms at a full rate of compensation?

Michael German: Compensation is a crucial issue for farmers who are suffering from the effects of TB on their farms. I take a keen interest in compensation and the associated costs because it is of immediate concern to the farming community in Wales. The farming unions have raised it with me.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Mae Mick Bates wedi cyfeirio'n rhannol at y problemau sy'n codi o ran symud anifeiliaid, nid i ffermydd a heintiwyd gan y diciáu, ond i'r rheini o dan amheuaeth o fod wedi eu heintio. Mae nifer ohonynt yn fy etholaeth ac etholaethau Aelodau eraill. Beth y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud i geisio darganfod ffyrdd o ganiatáu symudiadau anifeiliaid—derbyniwn fod angen rheolau manwl ar hyn—rhwng ffermydd sydd o dan amheuaeth o fod wedi eu heintio?

Michael German: We must act on scientific and veterinary advice. I have met with the Chief Veterinary Officer for Wales and I will have a much more detailed discussion with him next week. We must seek that advice first because we do not want to expose any farm to the consequences of the dangerous spread of this disease. I will report back when I have had those discussions.

cyfyngiadau ar ffermydd. Mae un o'r problemau mwyaf yn ymwneud â gyrroedd pedigri. O dan y cyfyngiad, ni all ffermwyr werthu eu stoc ac os gwnânt, nid yw'r pris am dda tew yn ddim o'i gymharu â'r pris iawndal. A wnewch ymgymryd i geisio lliniaru'r problemau llif arian drwy ganiatáu symud adweithyddion amhendant o ffermydd ar gyfradd iawndal lawn?

Michael German: Mae iawndal yn fater hollbwysig i ffermwyr sy'n dioddef gan effeithiau'r diciáu ar eu ffermydd. Ymddiddoraf yn fawr mewn iawndal a'r costau cysylltiedig gan fod hynny'n destun pryder ar hyn o bryd i'r gymuned ffermio yng Nghymru. Mae'r undebau ffermio wedi'i godi gyda mi.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Mick Bates has referred partly to the problems that arise in terms of moving animals, not to farms that are infected with TB, but to those under suspicion of being infected. Many of them are in my constituency and in the constituencies of other Members. What is the Minister doing to try to find ways of permitting the movement of animals—we accept that we need detailed regulations on this—between farms that are suspected of being infected?

Michael German: Rhaid inni weithredu'n ôl y cyngor gwyddonol a milfeddygol. Cyfarfûm â Phrif Swyddog Milfeddygol Cymru a chaf drafodaeth fwy manwl o lawer ag ef yr wythnos nesaf. Rhaid inni geisio'r cyngor hwnnw'n gyntaf gan nad ydym am beri i unrhyw fferm fod yn agored i ganlyniadau ymlediad peryglus y clefyd hwn. Adroddaf yn ôl wedi imi gael y trafodaethau hynny.

Hyrwyddo Diwydiant Caws Cymru Promoting the Welsh Cheese Industry

Q3 David Melding: Will the Minister make a statement on measures to promote the Welsh cheese industry? (OAQ18450)

Michael German: Through the Welsh Assembly Government, the Welsh Development Agency food directorate and the Agri-Food Partnership, work is being carried out continuously to aid the promotion

C3 David Melding: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y mesurau i hyrwyddo diwydiant caws Cymru? (OAQ18450)

Michael German: Gwneir gwaith yn barhaus drwy Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, cyfarwyddiaeth bwyd Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a'r Bartneriaeth Bwyd-Amaeth i helpu i hyrwyddo diwydiant caws Cymru.

of the Welsh cheese industry. All are heavily involved in pursuing opportunities with supermarkets in Wales to promote and encourage the supply of high quality cheese.

David Melding: Be assured that it is a great privilege for me to ask this question of such a 'Big Cheese' as yourself. Do you agree with me that you are in an excellent position to lead the most assertive campaign throughout Britain to promote Welsh cheese?

Michael German: I am grateful for the opportunity to do what I can to assist the Welsh cheese industry. It is one of Wales's great quality products. Many Members were present a few days ago when the cheeses of Wales were on display in the Assembly's Welsh food fayre. There is no doubt that this will be one of the key areas that the WDA food directorate under its new Chair, Bill Goldsworthy, will be able to take forward. I will do all that I can to assist.

Cynog Dafis: Mae twf y diwydiant caws yn ystod yr wythdegau a'r nawdegau yn un o'r hanesion calonogol ynghylch economi wledig Cymru, ond y mae'r diwydiant caws yn dibynnu ar gyflenwad digonol o laeth o ansawdd uchel. Pryderaf, fel eraill, ynghylch cyflwr presennol y diwydiant llaeth a'i hyfywedd yn wyneb y pris chwerthinllyd o isel y mae ffermwyr yn ei dderbyn am laeth. A wnaiff y Gweinidog fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn ar frys ac ystyried beth y gellir ei wneud i laesu a gwella'r sefyllfa?

Michael German: I met with staff yesterday and with those who are concerned about strengthening the relationship with supermarkets in and outside Wales. I will make every attempt to ensure that that relationship is as strong as possible and I hope to have an early meeting with senior figures from the six major supermarkets in the country. I am concerned about the impact of low milk prices on the dairy sector and I will act on that when I meet with officials next week.

Peter Law: I heard that they make excellent cheese on Lundy Island. Is it true that as part of your responsibilities for Wales and the

Mae pob un yn ymwneud yn helaeth â cheisio cyfleoedd gydag archfarchnadoedd yng Nghymru i hyrwyddo a hybu'r cyflenwad o gaws o ansawdd da.

David Melding: Gallwch fod yn sicr ei bod yn ffrainc fawr imi ofyn y cwestiwn hwn i rywun mor bwysig â chi. A ydych yn cytuno â mi eich bod mewn sefyllfa ragorol i arwain ymgyrch gryf iawn ledled Prydain i hyrwyddo caws Cymru?

Michael German: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i wneud yr hyn a allaf i gynorthwyo diwydiant caws Cymru. Mae'n un o'r cyhyrchion o ansawdd gwych a ddaw o Gymru. Yr oedd llawer o'r Aelodau'n bresennol ychydig ddyddiau'n ôl pan y cafodd cawsiau Cymru eu harddangos yn ffair bwyd Cymreig y Cynulliad. Nid oes amheuaeth na fydd hwn yn un o'r prif feysydd y bydd cyfarwyddiaeth bwyd y WDA dan ei Chadeirydd newydd, Bill Goldsworthy, yn gallu ei hyrwyddo. Gwnaf bopeth a allaf i gynorthwyo.

Cynog Dafis: The growth of the cheese industry during the eighties and nineties is one of the most encouraging tales connected with the rural economy of Wales, but the cheese industry is dependent on an adequate supply of high quality milk. Like others, I am concerned about the current state of the dairy industry and its viability in the light of the ridiculously low price that farmers receive for their milk. Will the Minister address this matter urgently and consider what can be done to ease and improve the situation?

Michael German: Cyfarfûm ddoe â'r staff a'r rhai sy'n awyddus i gryfhau'r berthynas ag archfarchnadoedd yng Nghymru a thu hwnt. Gwnaf bob ymdrech i sicrhau bod y berthynas honno mor gryf ag y bo modd ac yr wyf yn gobeithio cael cyfarfod yn fuan â phobl amlycaf y chwe phrif archfarchnad yn y wlad. Yr wyf yn bryderus ynghylch effaith prisiau llaeth isel ar y sector llaeth a gweithredaf ar hynny pan gyfarfyddaf â'r swyddogion yr wythnos nesaf.

Peter Law: Clywais eu bod yn gwneud caws rhagorol ar Ynys Wair. A yw'n wir eich bod yn paratoi cynlluniau cyfrinachol, fel rhan

world, you are drawing up secret plans to annex Lundy Island and take over its cheese making for Wales?

Michael German: No.

o'ch cyfrifoldebau dros Gymru a'r byd, i gyfeddiannu Ynys Wair a chymryd drosodd ei gwaith gwneud caws dros Gymru?

Michael German: Nac ydyw.

Cynyddu Nifer y Marchnadoedd Ffermwyr Swyddogol yng Nghymru Increasing the Number of Official Farmers' Markets in Wales

Q5 Nick Bourne: Will the Minister make a statement on what is being done to increase the number of official farmers' markets in Wales? (OAQ18407)

Michael German: Over the past years the number of farmers' markets in Wales has grown considerably. The WDA food directorate through the agri-food partnership is supporting many initiatives throughout Wales. Many of our regions have seen the development of new markets.

Nick Bourne: Will you join me in welcoming the news that the Llandoverly farmers' market will open on 29 June? I have been closely associated with it and have attended meetings to support it. It will be used by farmers from eastern Carmarthenshire and the Sennybridge and Eppynt areas. Do you welcome that and will you ensure that that message is propagated around the world on your trips overseas?

Michael German: I welcome the growth in farmers' markets. They are recovering strongly from problems caused by foot and mouth disease and there are indications that they will continue to increase steadily. All regions in Wales have seen their development in principal towns, which should be encouraged. The Assembly will consider providing 50 per cent of financial assistance under the marketing development scheme to develop farmers' markets. I hope that that will grow along with appropriate support from local authorities and food hygiene authorities.

Kirsty Williams: You may be aware that the sustainability of the Brecon farmers' market is in doubt. Will you agree to meet its representatives to discuss how it can access the grants that you mentioned and to pursue

C5 Nick Bourne: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ynghylch beth sy'n cael ei wneud i gynyddu nifer y marchnadoedd ffermwyr swyddogol yng Nghymru? (OAQ18407)

Michael German: Dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf bu cryn gynnydd yn nifer y marchnadoedd ffermwyr yng Nghymru. Mae cyfarwyddiaeth bwyd y WDA drwy'r bartneriaeth amaeth-bwyd yn cefnogi llawer o fentrau ledled Cymru. Mae marchnadoedd newydd wedi datblygu mewn llawer o'n rhanbarthau.

Nick Bourne: A wnewch ymuno â mi i groesawu'r newyddion y bydd marchnad ffermwyr Llanymddyfri'n agor ar 29 Mehefin? Bùm â chysylltiad agos â hi a mynychais gyfarfodydd i'w chefnogi. Fe'i defnyddir gan ffermwyr o ddwyrain sir Gaerfyrddin ac ardaloedd Pontsenni ac Epynt. A ydych yn croesawu hynny ac a wnewch sicrhau y caiff y neges honno ei lledaenu o gwmpas y byd ar eich teithiau tramor?

Michael German: Croesawaf dwf y marchnadoedd ffermwyr. Maent yn ymadfer yn dda ar ôl y problemau a achoswyd gan glwy'r traed a'r genau ac mae arwyddion y byddant yn parhau i dyfu'n gyson. Maent wedi datblygu yn y prif drefi ym mhob rhanbarth yng Nghymru, a dylid annog hynny. Bydd y Cynulliad yn ystyried darparu cymorth ariannol o 50 y cant o dan y cynllun datblygu marchnata i ddatblygu marchnadoedd ffermwyr. Gobeithiaf y byddant yn tyfu ochr yn ochr â'r cymorth priodol gan yr awdurdodau lleol a'r awdurdodau glanweithdra bwyd.

Kirsty Williams: Efallai y gwyddoch fod amheuaeth ynghylch cynaliadwyedd marchnad ffermwyr Aberhonddu. A wnewch gytuno i gwrdd â'i chynrychiolwyr i drafod sut y gall gael y grantiau y cyfeiriasoch atynt

the difficulties that it has had in dealings with Powys County Council? The council gives it a grant and then charges inordinate amounts of money for advertising the market on grass verges on the highways of Powys?

Michael German: I know that you have vigorously defended this matter and I thank you for bringing it to my attention. The two crucial issues relating to farmers' markets are the range of quality products offered and the regularity of the markets so that people always know when they are held. I will be happy to meet with representatives from Brecon's farmers' markets and to do all that I can to assist in ensuring its sustainability.

Dafydd Wigley: Dymunaf bob llwyddiant i'r Gweinidog yn ei waith. Mae angen pob cymorth posibl ar gefn gwlad Cymru. A yw'r Gweinidog yn ymwybodol bod rhai stondinwyr yn teithio o bell i'r marchnadoedd hyn heb fod ganddynt hwy na'u cynnyrch unrhyw gysylltiad â'r ardal. Sut y gallwch helpu hyrwyddo'r marchnadoedd hyn mewn ffordd sy'n seiliedig ar gynnyrch lleol?

Michael German: Ensuring that Welsh produce is marketed properly is a serious issue. Farmers' markets sometimes sell exclusively Welsh products but often—and I have observed this myself—offer produce from other areas. It is a matter of promoting the markets and their Welsh produce in Wales and elsewhere. I have initiated discussions to discover what opportunities there are for offering Welsh food markets, such as farmers' markets, outside Wales.

ac i ymchwilio i'r anawsterau a gafodd yn ei thrafodion â Chyngor Sir Powys? Mae'r cyngor wedi rhoi grant iddi ac wedyn wedi codi crocbris am hysbysebu'r farchnad ar y lleiniau glaswellt ar briffyrdd Powys.

Michael German: Gwn eich bod wedi dadlau'n gryf dros y mater hwn a diolchaf ichi am ddod ag ef i'm sylw. Y ddau fater hollbwysig ynghylch marchnadoedd ffermwyr yw amrediad y cynhyrchion o ansawdd da a gynigir a rheoleidd-dra'r marchnadoedd fel bod pobl yn gwybod yn wastad pryd y'u cynhelir. Byddaf yn falch o gwrdd â chynrychiolwyr o farchnad ffermwyr Aberhonddu ac i wneud popeth a allaf i sicrhau y caiff ei gynnal.

Dafydd Wigley: I wish the Minister every success in his work. Rural Wales needs every possible support. Is the Minister aware that some stall holders travel great distances to these markets and that neither they nor their produce have any connection with the area. How can you help to promote these markets in a way that is based on local produce?

Michael German: Mae sicrhau y caiff cynnyrch o Gymru ei farchnata'n briodol yn fater pwysig. Weithiau mae marchnadoedd ffermwyr yn gwerthu cynhyrchion Cymreig yn unig ond yn aml—ac yr wyf wedi sylwi ar hyn fy hun—maent yn cynnig cynnyrch o ardaloedd eraill. Mae'n fater o hyrwyddo'r marchnadoedd a'u cynnyrch Cymreig yng Nghymru ac mewn mannau eraill. Yr wyf wedi cychwyn trafodaethau i ddarganfod pa gyfleoedd a geir i gynnig marchnadoedd bwyd Cymreig, fel marchnadoedd ffermwyr, y tu allan i Gymru.

Hyrwyddo'r Arfer Gorau o ran Iechyd a Diogelwch mewn Amaethyddiaeth yng Nghymru

Promoting Best Health and Safety Practice in Welsh Farming

Q6 Brian Gibbons: Will the Minister make a statement on whether there are any plans to promote best health and safety practice in Welsh farming? (OAQ18447)

Michael German: The Health and Safety Executive and the Assembly already work closely together on health and safety matters,

C6 Brian Gibbons: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ynghylch a oes cynlluniau i hyrwyddo'r arfer gorau o ran iechyd a diogelwch mewn amaethyddiaeth yng Nghymru? (OAQ18447)

Michael German: Mae'r Awdurdod Gweithredol Iechyd a Diogelwch a'r Cynulliad eisoes yn cydweithio'n agos ar

which include Farming Connect demonstration farms where HSE inspectors provide guidance on managing open days while using the farms to provide positive messages on farm safety. The HSE also undertakes a full range of promotional activities including organising stands at major shows and liaising with organisations such as the Powys safety group and the Ceredigion agricultural injuries group.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. The question relates to Welsh farming, Brian. It is a minor point, but we must stick precisely to the question on the agenda.

Brian Gibbons: The agriculture industry is probably the most dangerous in terms of health and safety, even more so than mining or construction. What evidence do you have of health and safety performance in Welsh farming?

9:45 a.m.

Michael German: You are right to say that it is a dangerous industry—the number of fatal accidents in Welsh farming was 12 in 1996-97; five in 1997-98; seven in 1998-99; five in 1999-2000 and seven in 2000-01. There does not appear to be a trend of growth but those figures are far too high and the Health and Safety Executive is trying to do all it can to reduce them.

David Davies: You may be aware that new legislation from Brussels will limit the amount of time that farmers can spend in their tractors. Of course it is important to safeguard farmers' health, but is it not also important to safeguard their livelihoods? What will you do to prevent such legislation from being implemented?

Michael German: People's lives and safety are paramount and concern us all. Farms are homes as well as workplaces, as reflected in the number of accidents and deaths on farms that involve people aged under 16 or over 65. We must protect people. Many such

faterion iechyd a diogelwch, sy'n cynnwys ffermydd arddangos Cyswllt Ffermio lle y mae arolygwyr yr Awdurdod Gweithredol Iechyd a Diogelwch yn rhoi cyfarwyddyd ar reoli diwrnodiau agored tra'n defnyddio'r ffermydd i roi negeseuon cadarnhaol ar ddiogelwch ar ffermydd. Mae'r Awdurdod Gweithredol Iechyd a Diogelwch hefyd yn cynnal amrediad cynhwysfawr o weithgareddau hyrwyddo sy'n cynnwys trefnu stondinau yn y sioeau mawr a chysylltu â chyrff fel grŵp diogelwch Powys a grŵp anafiadau amaethyddol Ceredigion.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae'r cwestiwn yn ymwneud â ffermio yng Nghymru, Brian. Pwynt bach yw hwnnw, ond rhaid inni gadw'n union at y cwestiwn ar yr agenda.

Brian Gibbons: Mae'n debyg mai'r diwydiant amaethyddol yw'r peryclaf o ran iechyd a diogelwch, yn fwy felly na chloddio neu adeiladu hyd yn oed. Pa dystiolaeth sydd gennych o'r perfformiad iechyd a diogelwch mewn ffermio yng Nghymru?

Michael German: Yr ydych yn iawn wrth ddweud ei fod yn ddiwydiant peryglus—nifer y damweiniau angheuol mewn ffermio yng Nghymru oedd 12 yn 1996-97; pump yn 1997-98; saith yn 1998-99; pump yn 1999-2000 a saith yn 2000-01. Nid yw'n ymddangos bod tuedd gynyddol ond mae'r ffigurau hynny'n rhy uchel o lawer ac mae'r Awdurdod Gweithredol Iechyd a Diogelwch yn ceisio gwneud popeth yn ei allu i'w gostwng.

David Davies: Efallai y gwyddoch y bydd deddfwriaeth newydd o Frwsel yn cyfyngu ar yr amser y caiff ffermwyr ei dreulio ar eu tractorau. Wrth gwrs, mae'n bwysig diogelu iechyd ffermwyr, ond onid yw'n bwysig diogelu eu bywoliaeth hefyd? Beth a wnewch i atal gweithredu deddfwriaeth o'r fath?

Michael German: Mae bywydau a diogelwch pobl o'r pwys mwyaf ac yn bwysig i bob un ohonom. Mae ffermydd yn gartrefi yn ogystal â bod yn weithleoedd, fel y dangosir gan y nifer o ddamweiniau a marwolaethau ar ffermydd sy'n gysylltiedig â

accidents relate to the use of tractors and other vehicles. That will be an important consideration for me, but people's safety should be paramount.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yr wyf yn falch iawn bod y Gweinidog yn derbyn bod cyfrifoldeb arnom oll i sicrhau diogelwch ar ffermydd. Cyfeiriodd at y ffaith fod nifer o ddamweiniau yn digwydd gyda pheiriannau. A yw'r Gweinidog yn derbyn ei bod yn anodd i ffermwyr ymateb i'r galwadau diogelwch sydd arnynt, a fyddai'n golygu buddsoddi mewn peiriannau, oherwydd y wasgfa ar eu cyflogau? Gan ei fod yn derbyn bod cyfrifoldeb ar bawb, a fydd yn rhoi cymorth i ffermwyr gyrraedd y safonau iechyd a diogelwch uchaf ar eu ffermydd?

Michael German: As you know, health and safety is not a devolved matter. Although we have a good working relationship with the Health and Safety Executive, the National Assembly does not determine its financing or its role.

phobl o dan 16 neu dros 65 oed. Rhaid inni amddiffyn pobl. Mae llawer o ddamweiniau o'r fath yn gysylltiedig â defnyddio tractorau a cherbydau eraill. Bydd honno'n ystyriaeth bwysig gennyf, ond diogelwch pobl a ddylai fod yn bwysicaf.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I am pleased that the Minister has accepted that we are all responsible for ensuring safety on farms. He referred to the fact that many accidents are connected to machinery. Does the Minister accept that it is difficult for farmers to respond to the safety demands placed upon them, which would involve investment in machinery, owing to the squeeze on their incomes? As he accepts that it is everyone's responsibility, will he assist farmers to reach the highest health and safety standards on their farms?

Michael German: Fel y gwyddoch, nid yw iechyd a diogelwch yn fater a ddatganolwyd. Er bod gennym berthynas waith dda â'r Awdurdod Gweithredol Iechyd a Diogelwch, nid yw'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn pennu ei gyllid na'i rôl.

Mewnforio Bwyd a Chynhyrchion Cig Importing Food and Meat Products

Q7 William Graham: Will the Minister make a statement on the import of food and meat products? (OAQ18445)

Michael German: The Government is making progress on the individual components of the action plan announced by Carwyn Jones in March. The Welsh Assembly Government is represented on all the relevant working groups, and I am in contact with Margaret Beckett on these issues.

William Graham: Indications are that imported meat produce was the source of the foot and mouth disease crisis. The sharp increase in bovine tuberculosis cases, along with the problems associated with farms put under a four-month restriction due to the disclosure of a single reactor, suggest stricter controls governing food producers and, particularly, importers. What action is the Minister taking to address that problem?

C7 William Graham: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar fewnforio bwyd a chynhyrchion cig? (OAQ18445)

Michael German: Mae'r Llywodraeth yn gwneud cynnydd ar elfennau unigol y cynllun gweithredu a gyhoeddwyd gan Carwyn Jones ym Mawrth. Cynrychiolir Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar yr holl weithgorau perthnasol, ac yr wyf mewn cysylltiad â Margaret Beckett ar y materion hyn.

William Graham: Yr arwyddion yw mai cynnyrch cig a fewnforiwyd oedd man cychwyn argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau. Mae'r cynnydd sydyn yn yr achosion o'r diciâu mewn gwartheg, ynghyd â'r problemau sy'n gysylltiedig â ffermydd a roddwyd dan gyfyngiad pedwar mis o ganlyniad i ddatgelu un adweithydd, yn awgrymu bod angen rheolaethau llymchwi i lywodraethu cynhyrchwyr ac, yn enwedig, mewnforwyr bwyd. Pa gamau y mae'r

Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i ymdrin â'r broblem honno?

Michael German: On imported food, the action plan included a comprehensive risk assessment to inform our decisions to concentrate our efforts on reducing the risk of exotic diseases. Illegally importing food can be commercial or individual, so it is important that publicity is improved. A range of measures are in place, including x-ray machines and improving co-operation between agencies. Dogs are also being used at entry points, for their trained sense of smell. Work is increasing on these matters, as announced in the action plan.

Michael German: Ynghylch bwyd a fewnforiwyd, yr oedd asesiad risg cynhwysfawr yn y cynllun gweithredu i oleuo ein penderfyniadau er mwyn canolbwyntio ein hymdrechion i leihau'r risg o glefydau ecsotig. Gall bwyd gael ei fewnforio'n anghyfreithlon yn fasnachol neu gan unigolion, felly mae'n bwysig gwella'r cyhoeddusrwydd. Mae amrediad o fesurau ar waith, gan gynnwys peiriannau pelydr x a gwella'r cydweithrediad rhwng asiantaethau. Defnyddir cŵn hefyd yn y manau mynediad, oherwydd eu synnwyr arogleuo hyfforddedig. Gwneir mwy a mwy o waith ar y materion hyn, fel y cyhoeddwyd yn y cynllun gweithredu.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: One issue that you will need to deal with, Minister, is the collapse of milk prices to around 14 or 16 pence per litre. Will you examine that carefully, as there are reports that milk is being imported from countries such as Ireland at seven pence per litre, which would undermine our milk producers? Will you discuss with your Westminster and Assembly Cabinet colleagues ways to ensure that Welsh milk producers are not disadvantaged as a result of uncompetitive imports? Will you ensure that Welsh producers have a realistic future, because they are currently producing milk at a loss?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Un mater y bydd yn rhaid ichi ymdrin ag ef, Weinidog, yw'r cwmp ym mhrisiau llaeth i tua 14 neu 16 ceiniog y litr. A wnewch archwilio hynny'n ofalus, gan fod adroddiadau bod llaeth yn cael ei fewnforio o wledydd fel Iwerddon am saith geiniog y litr, a fyddai'n tanseilio ein cynhyrchwyr llaeth ni? A wnewch drafod gyda'ch cyd-Weinidogion yn San Steffan a Chabinet y Cynulliad ddulliau o sicrhau na fydd cynhyrchwyr llaeth Cymru dan anfantais o ganlyniad i fewnforion anghystadluel? A wnewch sicrhau dyfodol realistig i gynhyrchwyr Cymru, gan eu bod yn cynhyrchu llaeth ar golled ar hyn o bryd?

Michael German: I hope that you are not suggesting that the milk is being illegally imported but rather that it is uncompetitive. Having a level playing field is important to the farming community, and is a matter of European import. I will do what I can, within the National Assembly's powers, to ensure that we have as level a playing field as possible. I will also ensure that our influence in Westminster and in Europe is brought to bear.

Michael German: Gobeithiaf nad ydych yn awgrymu bod llaeth yn cael ei fewnforio'n anghyfreithlon ond yn hytrach ei fod yn anghystadluel. Mae'n bwysig i'r gymuned ffermio gael chwarae teg, ac mae hynny'n fater o bwys ledled Ewrop. Gwnaf yr hyn a allaf, o fewn pwerau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, i sicrhau sefyllfa mor deg â phosibl. Byddaf hefyd yn sicrhau ein bod yn dylanwadu yn San Steffan ac yn Ewrop.

Datganiad ar Ymweliad y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg â'r Cyngor Prydeinig-Gwyddelig

Statement on the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language's Visit to the British-Irish Council

The Minister for Culture, Sport and the Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant,

Welsh Language (Jenny Randerson): Andrew Davies and I attended the third meeting of the British-Irish Council in Jersey last Friday. Senator Pierre Horsfall OBE, president of the States of Jersey policy and resources committee, chaired the meeting. The British and Irish Governments were represented by the Prime Minister, the Right Honourable Tony Blair MP and the Taoiseach, Mr Bertie Ahern TD respectively. The Scottish Executive, the Northern Ireland Executive, the Isle of Man and Guernsey were also represented.

The main item on the summit's agenda was the knowledge economy, on which Jersey had prepared a paper. The meeting highlighted that all British-Irish Council administrations are actively working on a range of strategies to address knowledge economy issues, and members exchanged information and views on the wide variety of policies, methods of working and projects underway. We discussed the paper in detail and the council agreed areas for future co-operation. We also discussed the work that other administrations within the council are leading. Currently the areas of work are environment, transport, drugs, social inclusion—on which we share lead responsibility with Scotland—tourism and telemedicine.

Further to this, on behalf of the Welsh Assembly Government, I proposed that Wales should be the council's lead member for minority and lesser-used languages. I am delighted that the council agreed. We will consider ways to share our expertise in this field with other members of the council, many of whom face the same issues as we do in Wales, and to learn from them at the same time. We recognise that action is necessary to sustain the Welsh language in the twenty-first century, and this is just one of the innovative and positive initiatives that I shall pursue to ensure that. The council also formally agreed that Wales will host a summit in autumn 2003, at which I anticipate that the lead topic will be our work on minority languages.

Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg (Jenny Randerson): Bu Andrew Davies a minnau'n bresennol yn nhrydydd cyfarfod y Cyngor Prydeinig-Gwyddelig yn Jersey ddydd Gwener diwethaf. Y Seneddwr Pierre Horsfall OBE, llywydd pwyllgor polisi ac adnoddau Taleithiau Jersey, a gadeiriodd y cyfarfod. Cynrychiolwyd Llywodraethau Prydain ac Iwerddon gan y Prif Weinidog, y Gwir Anrhydeddus Tony Blair AS a'r Taoiseach, Mr Bertie Ahern TD yn y drefn honno. Yr oedd cynrychiolaeth hefyd gan Weithrediaeth yr Alban, Gweithrediaeth Gogledd Iwerddon, Ynys Manaw a Guernsey.

Y brif eitem ar agenda'r uwch-gynhadledd oedd yr economi wybodaeth, ac yr oedd Jersey wedi paratoi papur ar hynny. Dangosodd y cyfarfod fod holl weinyddiaethau'r Cyngor Prydeinig-Gwyddelig yn gweithio'n egniol ar amryw o strategaethau i ymdrin â materion sy'n codi ynghylch yr economi wybodaeth, a chyfnewidiwyd gwybodaeth a barn gan yr aelodau ar amrywiaeth eang o bolisiau, dulliau gweithio a phrosiectau sydd ar waith. Gwnaethom drafod y papur yn fanwl a chytunodd y cyngor ar feysydd ar gyfer cydweithredu yn y dyfodol. Bu inni hefyd drafod y gwaith y mae gweinyddiaethau eraill o fewn y cyngor yn ei arwain. Y meysydd gwaith ar hyn o bryd yw'r amgylchedd, trafnidiaeth, cyffuriau, cynhwysiant cymdeithasol—y rhannwn gyfrifoldeb arweiniol drostynt â'r Alban—twristiaeth a thelefeddygaeth.

Ymhellach i hyn, ar ran Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, cynigiais y dylai Cymru fod yn aelod arweiniol y cyngor dros ieithoedd lleiafrifol a llai eu defnydd. Yr wyf wrth fy modd bod y cyngor wedi cytuno. Byddwn yn ystyried dulliau o rannu ein harbenigedd yn y maes hwn ag aelodau eraill y cyngor, gan fod nifer ohonynt yn wynebu'r un materion ag yr ydym ni yng Nghymru, ac i ddysgu ganddynt hwy yr un pryd. Yr ydym yn cydnabod bod rhaid gweithredu i gynnal y Gymraeg yn yr unfed ganrif ar hunain, ac nid yw hon ond yn un o'r mentrau arloesol a chadarnhaol a weithredaf i sicrhau hynny. Cytunodd y cyngor yn ffurfiol y bydd Cymru'n cynnal uwch-gynhadledd yn yr hydref 2003, a disgwyliaf mai'r prif bwnc

yno fydd ein gwaith ar ieithoedd lleiafrifol.

Following the summit's conclusion, the new British-Irish Council website was launched, which was developed as part of Jersey's work on the knowledge economy. Further information on the British-Irish Council, including the communiqué from the Jersey summit is on the website at www.British-IrishCouncil.org.

The British-Irish Council was conceived as part of the Northern Ireland peace process, but is rapidly becoming a highly valuable means of sharing ideas and developing policy in an innovative way. The Jersey summit was a further example of that, and my colleagues and I will continue to play a full and active role in the council's work.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Diolchaf yn gynnes i'r Gweinidog am ei datganiad, yn arbennig oherwydd bod gwaith y cyngor, sy'n dod â syniadau cyrff datganoledig gwahanol Prydain at ei gilydd, yn bwysig.

Yr wyf hefyd yn falch ei bod wedi llwyddo i gael ymrwymiad y cyngor i ystyried y problemau sy'n wynebu ieithoedd lleiafrifol, yn enwedig y Gymraeg. Yn naturiol, croesawn y ffaith y bydd profiadau gwledydd eraill y cyngor yn gymorth inni wireddu syniadau.

Tra bo sefyllfa ieithoedd fel yr Aeleg yn Iwerddon a'r Alban o ddiddordeb inni, tybed a fyddai'r Gweinidog hefyd yn fodlon cymharu'r Gymraeg gydag ieithoedd lleiafrifol, fel y Fasgeg a Chatalaneg, mewn gwledydd eraill ar y cyfandir. Gall Cymru ddysgu o'r gwledydd hynny, o gofio y bu ganddynt system ddatganoledig o fewn y drefn gyfansoddiadol ers dros 20 mlynedd.

Gan fod hwn yn bwnc mor bwysig—ac y mae'r Gweinidog yn arwain ar hyn—a wnaiff gynnal trafodaeth yn y Cynulliad naill ai mewn Cyfarfod Llawn neu yn y Pwyllgor Diwylliant er mwyn inni gyflwyno syniadau i'w chynorthwyo wrth iddi symud y drafodaeth yn ei blaen?

9:55 a.m.

Wedi i'r uwch-gynhadledd ddod i ben, lanswyd gwefan newydd y Cyngor Prydeinig-Gwyddelig, a ddatblygwyd fel rhan o waith Jersey ar yr economi wybodaeth. Mae gwybodaeth bellach am y Cyngor Prydeinig-Gwyddelig, gan gynnwys y cyhoeddiad o uwch-gynhadledd Jersey, ar y wefan yn www.British-IrishCouncil.org.

Sefydlwyd y Cyngor Prydeinig-Gwyddelig fel rhan o broses heddwch Gogledd Iwerddon, ond mae'n datblygu'n gyflym yn gyfrwng tra gwerthfawr i rannu syniadau a datblygu polisi mewn modd arloesol. Yr oedd uwch-gynhadledd Jersey yn enghraifft bellach o hynny, a bydd fy nghyd-Weinidogion a minnau'n parhau i chwarae rhan lawn ac egniol yng ngwaith y cyngor.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I warmly thank the Minister for her statement, especially as the council's work is important in drawing together the ideas of the different devolved bodies of Britain.

I am also pleased that she managed to secure a commitment from the council to considering the problems facing minority languages, particularly the Welsh language. Naturally, we welcome the fact that the experiences of the other countries on the council will help us to realise ideas.

While the situation of languages such as Irish and Scottish Gaelic are of interest to us, is the Minister also willing to compare the Welsh language with minority languages, such as Basque and Catalan, in other continental counties. Wales can learn from those countries, since they have had a devolved system in the constitutional system for over 20 years.

Since this is such an important issue—and the Minister is taking the lead on this—will she hold a debate either in Plenary or in the Culture Committee so that we can present ideas that will assist her as she takes the discussion forward?

Jenny Randerson: I endorse your comments on the importance and significance of the gathering: the fact that the council takes place at all is profoundly significant. You referred to the Basque country, which I visited with representatives of the Welsh Language Board and Assembly officials. The issues arising from that visit have been discussed in the Culture Committee. I do not think that it is appropriate to take it further in Plenary. When the Welsh Assembly Government decided that it wanted the Committee to lead on the issue of minority languages, it was showing the importance of language to cultural identity. The British-Irish Council is associated with the issue of cultural identity. The Welsh Assembly Government is aware that the work we will be doing on language is cross-cutting. I raised it in the context of social inclusion and regeneration. Those issues are at the heart of the British-Irish Council and were referred to frequently last Friday. I am sure that they will be of great importance in the work on language in the future. Our work on language will share practical experience. It is not concerned with issues such as official status but with sharing practical ideas.

David Melding: Do you agree that this council is an example of how the British Isles, Northern Ireland and the Republic of Ireland are capable of regeneration, so that in the new world as far as economic challenges and political stability are concerned, this body can lead the way and be productive?

I was pleased to note some of the policy areas that you discussed. The Minister has probably received—as all Members have—a letter from South Wales Police about the increasing availability of drugs in towns and cities in south Wales and that this is often the result of markets being more restricted in other parts of Great Britain and also potentially Ireland. Smugglers can get into the British Isles and Ireland via many air and sea routes. I hope that that issue was examined and will be the subject of further discussion so that practical solutions can be achieved.

Jenny Randerson: Ategfaf eich sylwadau am bwysigrwydd ac arwyddocâd y cyfarfod: mae'r ffaith bod y cyngor yn digwydd o gwbl yn hynod o arwyddocaol. Cyfeiriasoch at wlad y Basg, yr ymwelais â hi gyda chynrychiolwyr o Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg a swyddogion y Cynulliad. Mae'r materion sy'n codi o'r ymweliad hwnnw wedi'u trafod yn y Pwyllgor Diwylliant. Ni chredaf ei bod yn briodol mynd ymhellach â hynny yn y Cyfarfod Llawn. Pan benderfynodd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ei fod yn dymuno i'r Pwyllgor arwain ar fater ieithoedd lleiafrifol, yr oedd yn dangos pwysigrwydd iaith i hunaniaeth ddiwylliannol. Mae'r Cyngor Prydeinig-Gwyddelig yn ymwneud â mater hunaniaeth ddiwylliannol. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ymwybodol bod y gwaith a wnawn ar iaith yn drawsbynciol. Fe'i codais yng nghyd-destun cynhwysiant ac adfywio cymdeithasol. Mae'r materion hynny wrth wraidd y Cyngor Prydeinig-Gwyddelig a chyfeiriwyd yn aml atynt ddydd Gwener diwethaf. Yr wyf yn sicr y byddant o bwys mawr yn y gwaith ar iaith yn y dyfodol. Bydd ein gwaith ar iaith yn rhannu profiad ymarferol. Nid yw'n ymwneud â materion fel statws swyddogol ond â rhannu syniadau ymarferol.

David Melding: A gytunwch fod y cyngor hwn yn enghraifft o sut y mae Ynysoedd Prydain, Gogledd Iwerddon a Gweriniaeth Iwerddon yn gallu ymadfywio, fel bod y corff hwn, mewn byd sy'n newydd o ran yr heriau economaidd a sefydlogrwydd gwleidyddol, yn gallu arwain y ffordd a bod yn gynhyrchiol?

Yr oeddwn yn falch o sylwi ar rai o'r meysydd polisi y gwnaethoch eu trafod. Mae'n siŵr bod y Gweinidog wedi derbyn llythyr—fel y gwnaeth pob Aelod—oddi wrth Heddlu De Cymru ynghylch y cynnydd yn argaeledd cyffuriau mewn trefi a dinasoedd yn y De a'r ffaith bod hyn yn ganlyniad yn aml i'r ffaith bod y marchnadoedd yn fwy cyfyngedig mewn rhannau eraill o Brydain Fawr, ac Iwerddon hefyd o bosibl. Gall smyglwyr ddod i Ynysoedd Prydain ac Iwerddon ar sawl llwybr awyr a môr. Gobeithiaf fod y mater hwnnw wedi'i ystyried ac y bydd yn destun trafod pellach fel y gellir sicrhau atebion

ymarferol.

I am pleased that the Northern Ireland Executive was represented. The Unionists, which are the largest parliamentary designation in the Northern Ireland Assembly, is not represented on the parliamentary body that shadows the council's work and predates it by many years. Were there any discussions about how Unionists could be encouraged to participate in the parliamentary body?

Jenny Randerson: I endorse your comments on the significance of the drugs-related issues raised in the letter from South Wales Police to all Members recently. Discussions on drugs took up almost all of the previous meeting of the British-Irish Council, which the First Minister, Jane Hutt and I attended. The emphasis was on sharing ideas on practical solutions. An interesting outcome of the previous meeting, which was in February, I believe, was that the countries agreed to co-operate on these issues in terms of trafficking.

Like an iceberg, we only see the part of the British-Irish Council that is above the water, but officials are continually working on these topics, unseen. In addition to this day-to-day work, there are conferences, such as that on drug-related issues. There were no discussions on the question of Unionist participation in the parliamentary body at an official level, but the Taoiseach, David Trimble and the Prime Minister had private discussions during the conference.

Brian Gibbons: David Melding's point is important. Do you agree that if we could persuade Irish nationalists and, paradoxically, the Unionists to use and learn from the experience of devolution in the United Kingdom, and to work together through these agencies, they too may be able to live in peace and harmony, and build a constructive future in Ireland?

Jenny Randerson: I agree. The existence of the British-Irish Council is important, and its formal structure enables co-operation, which would not otherwise be possible. Every time

Yr wyf yn falch yr oedd cynrychiolaeth o Weithrediaeth Gogledd Iwerddon. Nid oes gan yr Unoliaethwyr, sef y dynodiad seneddol mwyaf yng Nghynulliad Gogledd Iwerddon, gynrychiolaeth ar y corff seneddol sy'n dilyn gwaith y cyngor ac yn ei ragflaenu ers blynyddoedd lawer. A fu unrhyw drafodaethau ar sut y gellid cymell yr Unoliaethwyr i gymryd rhan yn y corff seneddol?

Jenny Randerson: Atefaf eich sylwadau ar bwysigrwydd y materion sy'n gysylltiedig â chyffuriau a godwyd llythyr diweddar Heddlu De Cymru at yr holl Aelodau. Yr oedd trafodaethau ar gyffuriau wedi mynd â bron y cwbl o gyfarfod blaenorol y Cyngor Prydeinig-Gwyddelig, y bu Prif Weinidog Cymru, Jane Hutt a minnau'n bresennol ynddo. Yr oedd y pwyslais ar rannu syniadau ar atebion ymarferol. Un canlyniad diddorol i'r cyfarfod blaenorol, a oedd yn Chwefror, fe gredaf, oedd i'r gwledydd gytuno i gydweithredu ar y materion hyn yng nghydestun masnachu.

Fel y mynydd iâ, nid ydym ond yn gweld y rhan o'r Cyngor Prydeinig-Gwyddelig sydd uwchlaw'r dŵr, ond mae'r swyddogion yn gweithio'n barhaus ar y pynciau hyn, heb eu gweld. Yn ogystal â'r gwaith beunyddiol hwn, ceir cynadleddau, fel yr un ar faterion yn ymwneud â chyffuriau. Ni fu trafodaethau ar bwnc cyfranogiad yr Unoliaethwyr yn y corff seneddol ar lefel y swyddogion, ond cafodd y Taoiseach, David Trimble a'r Prif Weinidog drafodaethau preifat yn ystod y gynhadledd.

Brian Gibbons: Mae pwynt David Melding yn bwysig. A gytunwch, pe gallem ddarbwylllo cenedlaetholwyr Iwerddon ac, yn barodsaidd, yr Unoliaethwyr i ddefnyddio a dysgu oddi wrth y profiad o ddatganoli yn y Deyrnas Unedig, ac i gydweithio drwy'r asiantaethau hyn, y gallent hwythau fyw'n heddychlon ac yn gytûn, a chreu dyfodol adeiladol yn Iwerddon?

Jenny Randerson: Cytunaf. Mae bodolaeth y Cyngor Prydeinig-Gwyddelig yn bwysig, ac mae ei strwythur ffurfiol yn hwyluso cydweithrediad, na fyddai'n bosibl fel arall.

a body such as this meets, peace in Ireland is strengthened because of the symbolic association. Unfortunately, the British-Irish Council did not meet for many months—this was only its third meeting—because of the problems in Northern Ireland.

Peter Black: I welcome this statement and the continuing co-operation between the Governments of the British Isles on this issue. I support David Melding's comments on drugs, and it is important that work on this issue continues in the British-Irish Council. Now that Edwina Hart is Wales's drug tsar, which brings the drugs policy together with crime and disorder, it is important that we use that position to influence discussions with other Governments within the British Isles to try to achieve a common approach on this issue. It is also important that any council initiative on minority languages feeds into our Welsh language strategy. As we have the lead on this—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You must ask a question.

Peter Black: I am the lead speaker on this issue for my party, Deputy Presiding Officer. Will you use this role to promote full legal recognition of British sign language in all the member countries?

Jenny Randerson: Discussion on drugs at the previous council meeting related to law and order issues as well as successful treatment for addiction. You also made a valid point about sign language, and I will draw this to the attention of the officials who set up the processes by which we plan to take this topic forward.

10:05 a.m.

Datganiad gan y Dirprwy Lywydd Statement by the Deputy Presiding Officer

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I will make a statement, on behalf of the Presiding Officer, under Standing Order No. 1.10.

Bob tro y bydd corff fel hwn yn cwrdd, cryfheir heddwch yn Iwerddon oherwydd y cysylltiad symbolaidd. Gwaetha'r modd, ni chyfarfu'r Cyngor Prydeinig-Gwyddelig am fisoedd lawer—nid oedd hwn ond yn drydydd cyfarfod iddo—oherwydd y problemau yng Ngogledd Iwerddon.

Peter Black: Croesawaf y datganiad hwn a'r cydweithredu parhaus rhwng llywodraethau Ynysoedd Prydain ar y mater hwn. Ategap sylwadau David Melding am gyffuriau, ac mae'n bwysig bod y gwaith ar y mater hwn yn parhau yn y Cyngor Prydeinig-Gwyddelig. Gan mai Edwina Hart yw tsar cyffuriau Cymru bellach, sy'n dod â'r polisi cyffuriau a throeddu ac anhrefn at ei gilydd, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn defnyddio'r swydd honno i ddylanwadu ar y trafodaethau â Llywodraethau eraill Ynysoedd Prydain i geisio sicrhau dull gweithredu cyffredin ar y mater hwn. Mae hefyd yn bwysig bod unrhyw fenter gan y cyngor ar ieithoedd lleiafrifol yn cyfrannu i'n strategaeth ar y Gymraeg. Gan mai nyni sy'n arwain ar hyn—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Rhaid ichi ofyn cwestiwn.

Peter Black: Myfi yw prif siaradwr fy mhlaid ar y mater hwn, Ddirprwy Lywydd. A wnewch ddefnyddio'r rôl hon i hyrwyddo cydnabyddiaeth gyfreithiol lawn i iaith arwyddion Prydain yn yr holl aelod-wledydd?

Jenny Randerson: Yr oedd y drafodaeth ar gyffuriau yng nghyfarfod blaenorol y cyngor yn ymwneud â materion cyfraith a threfn yn ogystal â thrin dibyniaeth ar gyffuriau'n llwyddiannus. Gwnaethoch bwynt dilys hefyd am iaith arwyddion, a gwnaf ddwyn hynny i sylw'r swyddogion sy'n paratoi'r prosesau y bwriadwn eu defnyddio i drafod y pwnc hwn.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Gwnaf ddatganiad, ar ran y Llywydd, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 1.10.

Nick Bourne and Ron Davies raised points of order in Tuesday's Plenary consequent upon the changes to the Assembly Cabinet announced by the First Minister. I have subsequently received representations from other Members on this subject. I promised that I would make a further statement today.

The first matter on which I must rule is whether it would be possible for the election of the Chair of the Committee on European and External Affairs to be conducted by secret ballot. The only provision in our Standing Orders for a secret ballot is under Standing Order No. 1.4, which deals with the election of the Presiding Officer and Deputy Presiding Officer. Elections to Committee Chairs are governed by Standing Order No. 8.4. Under that Standing Order, elections are by motions, and motions are voted upon following our normal procedure under Standing Order No. 6.20, which deals with voting. It has been suggested that I should allow a procedural motion under Standing Order No. 6.16, to permit the Assembly to decide to conduct the election of the Chair of the Committee on European and External Affairs Committee by means of a secret ballot. Neither am I prepared to do this, since it would be tantamount to allowing a motion to suspend a Standing Order, for which we already have a procedure under Standing Order No. 34.4. I am not prepared either to allow this issue to be discussed under Standing Order No. 6.9, which deals with matters of urgent public importance. Of course, should Members wish to propose amendments to Standing Orders, there is a procedure for them to do so under Standing Order No. 34.1.

I was also asked to rule under section 57(4) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, which provides that the division between Subject Committees of the fields in which they have responsibilities and the division between Cabinet members of the fields in which they have accountability should be the same. I have sought further advice from the First Minister on his allocation of accountability and will make a further oral statement after I have received and considered this advice.

Cododd Nick Bourne a Ron Davies bwyntiau o drefn yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ddydd Mawrth a oedd yn dilyn newidiadau i Gabinet y Cynulliad a gyhoeddwyd gan Brif Weinidog Cymru. Cefais sylwadau wedyn gan Aelodau eraill ar y pwnc hwn. Addewais y byddwn yn gwneud datganiad pellach heddiw.

Y mater cyntaf y mae'n rhaid imi ddyfarnu arno yw a fyddai'n bosibl cynnal etholiad Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd ac Allanol drwy bleidlais ddirgel. Yr unig ddarpariaeth yn ein Rheolau Sefydlog ar gyfer pleidlais ddirgel yw honno o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 1.4, sy'n ymwneud ag ethol y Llywydd a'r Dirprwy Lywydd. Rheolir etholiadau Cadeiryddion Pwyllgor gan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 8.4. O dan y Rheol Sefydlog honno, cynhelir yr etholiadau drwy gynigion, a phleidleisir ar y cynigion yn ôl ein gweithdrefn arferol o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.20, sy'n ymdrin â phleidleisio. Awgrymwyd y dylwn ganiatáu cynnig trefniadol o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.16, i ganiatáu i'r Cynulliad benderfynu cynnal etholiad Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd ac Allanol drwy bleidlais ddirgel. Nid wyf yn barod i wneud hyn, gan y byddai'n gyfystyr â chaniatáu cynnig i atal Rheol Sefydlog, y mae gennym weithdrefn eisoes ar ei gyfer o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 34.4. Nid wyf yn barod ychwaith i ganiatáu trafod y mater hwn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.9, sy'n ymdrin â materion brys o bwys cyhoeddus. Wrth gwrs, pe bai Aelodau'n dymuno cynnig newidiadau i'r Rheolau Sefydlog, mae gweithdrefn iddynt wneud hynny o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 34.1.

Gofynnwyd imi hefyd ddyfarnu o dan adran 57(4) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, sy'n nodi y dylai'r rhaniad rhwng y meysydd y mae gan Bwyllgorau Pwnc gyfrifoldebau drostynt a'r rhaniad rhwng y meysydd y mae gan aelodau'r Cabinet atebolrwydd drostynt fod yr un fath. Yr wyf wedi ceisio gwybodaeth bellach gan Brif Weinidog Cymru ar ei ddyraniad o atebolrwydd a gwnaf ddatganiad llafar pellach wedi imi gael y wybodaeth honno a'i hystyried.

Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

Nick Bourne: Point of order. This relates to last week's royal visit. Regardless of whether one is a monarchist or not—I am a constitutional monarchist—we would all like to extend our thanks to Assembly staff for a successful visit that did the Assembly and Wales no harm at all a week ago. We were pleased to see a red carpet being used on that occasion. Will you confirm the rumour that you are making the carpet available to the Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad for him to carry with him in the boot of his car to maximise its use on visits to farms, and to the Spar shop in Tredegar when he tries to use euros there?

Nick Bourne: Pwynt o drefn. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â'r ymweliad brenhinol yr wythnos diwethaf. Ni waeth a yw rhywun yn freniniaethwr neu beidio—breniniaethwr cyfansoddiadol wyf fi—byddem oll yn hoffi diolch i staff y Cynulliad am ymweliad llwyddiannus wythnos yn ôl na wnaeth unrhyw ddrwg o gwbl i'r Cynulliad a Chymru. Yr oeddem yn falch o weld defnydd o'r carped coch ar yr achlysur hwnnw. A wnewch gadarnhau'r si eich bod yn darparu'r carped i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor iddo gael mynd ag ef yng nghist ei gar i amlhau'r defnydd ohono ar ymweliadau â ffermydd, ac â'r siop Spar yn Nhredeggar pan yw'n ceisio defnyddio ewros yno?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I agree with the first part of your point of order. I suggest that you take up the second part with the Chair of the House Committee.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Cytunaf â rhan gyntaf eich pwynt o drefn. Awgrymaf eich bod yn codi'r ail ran gyda Chadeirydd Pwyllgor y Tŷ.

Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Plaleiddiaid (Uchafswm y Lefelau o Waddod mewn Cnydau, Bwydydd a Phorthiant) (Diwygio) 2002 Approval of the Pesticides (Maximum Residue Levels in Crops, Food and Feeding Stuffs) (Amendment) Regulations 2002

The Minister for Open Government (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Lywodraeth Agored (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly, acting under Standing Order No. 23.10, approves the draft Pesticides (Maximum Residue Levels in Crops, Food and Feeding Stuffs) (Amendment) Regulations 2002, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 11 June 2002. (NDM1085)

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 23.10, yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Plaleiddiaid (Uchafswm y Lefelau o Waddod mewn Cnydau, Bwydydd a Phorthiant) (Diwygio) 2002 drafft, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Mehefin 2002. (NDM1085)

*Cynnig: O blaid 34, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 34, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine

Davies, David
 Davies, Geraint
 Davies, Ron
 Davies, Janet
 Evans, Delyth
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Halford, Alison
 Hancock, Brian
 Hart, Edwina
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Law, Peter
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Johnathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Rogers, Peter
 Ryder, Janet
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Y Comisiwn ar Bwerau a Threfniadau Etholiadol y Cynulliad The Commission on Assembly Powers and Electoral Arrangements

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1, 2 and 3 in the name of Jonathan Morgan.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2 a 3 yn enw Jonathan Morgan.

The First Minister: I propose that

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly:

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

1. welcomes the establishment of the commission on the Assembly's powers and electoral arrangements;

1. yn croesawu sefydlu'r comisiwn ar bwerau'r Cynulliad a threfniadau etholiadol;

2. approves the commission's terms of reference, which was e-mailed to Members on 13 June 2002;

2. yn cymeradwyo cylch gwaith y comisiwn, a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau ar 13 Mehefin 2002;

3. looks forward to the appointment of commission members in July and the development of its work programme thereafter. (NDM1084)

3. yn edrych ymlaen at benodi aelodau'r comisiwn ym mis Gorffennaf ac at ddatblygiad ei waith maes o law. (NDM1084)

I am glad to have this debate because it is an important landmark in the Assembly's development and a launch pad to the commission, which will be chaired by Lord

Yr wyf yn falch o gael y ddatl hon gan ei bod yn garreg filltir o bwys yn natblygiad y Cynulliad ac yn fan cychwyn i'r comisiwn, a fydd o dan gadeiryddiaeth yr Arglwydd

Richard. I am glad to welcome back to Cardiff today Lord Richard of Ammanford, Ivor Richard, who is keen to take this opportunity to hear Members' views and to take the Assembly's temperature on this subject.

I have never regarded it as my job as First Minister to navel gaze on the current settlement, but to operate that settlement to the best of our collective abilities. I am always conscious of the great advantages of an unwritten constitution whenever I talk to my European opposite numbers. We try to solve problems as they arise and it has never seemed sensible to me to be obsessed with whether this particular version of the settlement is the best that we might have. We simply get on with the job. The real test is our ability to make this settlement work.

Nothing is forever. We are approaching the final sessions of the first Assembly term, and we have established this commission. The commission will start its work this side of the next election and will complete it on the other side of it. The commission can therefore look back at a full first Assembly term, and take the opportunity, before it reports back to us, to consider the broader terms of the settlement. It will ask, among other questions, fundamental questions on whether the present arrangements could be improved. Could they work better on Wales's behalf? Could the Assembly's electoral system be improved and be more representative? Could the Assembly's powers be amended? Could the settlement as a whole be made more effective for the people of Wales?

It is important to remind ourselves this morning from where the impetus for the commission came. The partnership agreement of October 2000 contained the following commitment:

'We will, before the end of the Assembly's first term, establish an independent Commission into the powers and electoral arrangements of the National Assembly in order to ensure that it is able to operate in the best interests of the people of Wales. This review should investigate *inter alia* the

Richard. Yr wyf yn falch o groesawu'n ôl i Gaerdydd heddiw yr Arglwydd Richard o Rydaman, Ivor Richard, sy'n awyddus i achub ar y cyfle hwn i glywed barn yr Aelodau ac i fesur gwres y Cynulliad ar y pwnc hwn.

Nid wyf erioed wedi'i ystyried yn waith i mi fel Prif Weinidog Cymru fogailsyllu ar y setliad presennol, ond i weithredu'r setliad hwnnw hyd eithaf ein gallu gyda'n gilydd. Yr wyf bob amser yn ymwybodol o'r manteision mawr o gael cyfansoddiad anysgrifenedig pryd bynnag y siaradaf â'm cymheiriaid Ewropeaidd. Yr ydym yn ceisio datrys problemau wrth iddynt godi ac nid yw erioed wedi ymddangos yn synhwyrrol imi fod ag obsesiwn â meddwl ai'r fersiwn penodol hwn o'r setliad yw'r gorau y gallem ei gael. Y cwbl a wnawn yw mynd ymlaen â'r gwaith. Y gwir brawf yw ein gallu i beri i'r setliad hwn weithio.

Nid oes dim yn parhau am byth. Yr ydym yn dod at sesiynau olaf tymor cyntaf y Cynulliad, ac yr ydym wedi sefydlu'r comisiwn hwn. Bydd y comisiwn yn dechrau ar ei waith cyn yr etholiad nesaf a bydd yn ei gwblhau ar ei ôl. Felly gall y comisiwn edrych yn ôl ar dymor llawn cyntaf y Cynulliad, ac achub ar y cyfle, cyn iddo adrodd yn ôl i ni, i ystyried amodau ehangach y setliad. Bydd yn gofyn cwestiynau sylfaenol, ymysg cwestiynau eraill, ynghylch a ellid gwella'r trefniadau presennol. A allent weithio'n well dros Gymru? A ellid diwygio system etholiadol y Cynulliad gan ei gwneud yn fwy cynrychioladol? A ellid newid pwerau'r Cynulliad? A ellid gwneud y setliad yn ei gyfanrwydd yn fwy effeithiol er mwyn pobl Cymru?

Mae'n bwysig ein hatgoffa ein hunain o ble y daeth y symbyliad i'r comisiwn. Yr oedd y cytundeb partneriaeth yn Hydref 2000 yn cynnwys yr ymrwymiad a ganlyn:

'Cyn diwedd tymor cyntaf y Cynulliad, byddwn yn sefydlu Comisiwn annibynnol i edrych ar bwerau a threfniadau etholiadol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol er mwyn sicrhau ei fod yn gallu gweithredu er budd pennaf pobl Cymru. Dylai'r arolwg hwn ymchwilio ymysg pethau eraill i ehangu cyfranoldeb yng

extension of proportionality in the composition of the Assembly, and of the relevant competencies devolved. The review shall publish its recommendations in the first year of the second term of the National Assembly in order to enable adequate reflection on the Assembly's first complete term.'

In pursuit of this commitment, I announced on 18 April 2002 the appointment of Lord Richard of Ammanford as chair of the commission. Membership of the commission has been set at eight or nine, in addition to the chair. Four of those members will be selected through party nomination and the remaining members will be selected through an open Nolan-Neill process of advertisement, application and selection. An advertisement appeared in the press on 5 and 6 June, with an application deadline of 27 June. Hundreds of people have replied. Interviews will be held in the week commencing 22 July. The fact that hundreds have already applied does not mean that we do not welcome more applications in the final week before the deadline. Depending on practicalities, and subject to the holiday arrangements of the appointed individuals, the intention is to hold the first full meeting of the commission before the end of July.

You will already be familiar with the detailed terms of reference for the commission, as they have been circulated to Members. They include commitments that the commission will, for example, consider the sufficiency of the Assembly's current powers, and whether the breadth and depth of the Assembly's powers are adequate to permit policy-making on issues where there is a clear and separate Welsh agenda. In line with the original intention, the commission will consider the adequacy and suitability of the Assembly's electoral arrangements: in particular, whether the Assembly's size is adequate to allow it to operate effectively within a normal working week, without placing undue pressure on Members. It will also consider whether the means of electing the Assembly, including the degree of proportionality, adequately and accurately represents all significant interests in Wales.

The commission will report on its

nghyfansoddiad y Cynulliad, a'r grymoedd perthnasol a ddatganolwyd. Bydd yr arolwg yn cyhoeddi ei argymhellion ym mlwyddyn gyntaf ail dymor y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol fel y gellir pwysu a mesur tymor llawn cyntaf y Cynulliad yn ddigonol.'

Yn unol â'r ymrwymiad hwn, ar 18 Ebrill 2002 cyhoeddais benodi'r Arglwydd Richard o Rydaman yn gadeirydd y comisiwn. Pennwyd mai wyth neu naw fydd nifer aelodaeth y comisiwn, yn ogystal â'r cadeirydd. Detholir pedwar o'r aelodau hynny drwy enwebiad y pleidiau a detholir yr aelodau sy'n weddill drwy broses agored o hysbysebu, ymgeisio a dethol yn null Nolan-Neill. Ymddangosodd hysbyseb yn y wasg ar 5 a 6 Mehefin, gyda dyddiad cau i geisiadau o 27 Mehefin. Mae cannoedd wedi ateb. Cynhelir y cyfweiliadau yn yr wythnos sy'n dechrau 22 Gorffennaf. Nid yw'r ffaith bod cannoedd wedi ymgeisio eisoes yn golygu nad ydym yn croesawu rhagor o geisiadau yn yr wythnos olaf cyn y dyddiad cau. Os bydd yn ymarferol, ac yn amodol ar drefniadau gwyliau'r rhai a benodir, bwriedir cynnal cyfarfod llawn cyntaf y comisiwn cyn diwedd Gorffennaf.

Byddwch yn gyfarwydd eisoes â chylch gorchwyl y comisiwn, gan ei fod wedi'i gylchredeg i'r Aelodau. Mae'n cynnwys ymrwymadau y bydd y comisiwn, er enghraifft, yn ystyried a yw pwerau presennol y Cynulliad yn ddigonol, ac a yw lled a dyfnder pwerau'r Cynulliad yn ddigon i ganiatáu llunio polisi ar faterion lle y mae agenda Gymreig bendant ac ar wahân. Yn unol â'r bwriad gwreiddiol, bydd y comisiwn yn ystyried a yw trefniadau etholiadol y Cynulliad yn ddigonol ac yn addas: yn benodol, a yw maint y Cynulliad yn ddigon i ganiatáu iddo weithredu'n effeithiol o fewn wythnos waith arferol, heb roi gormod o bwysau ar yr Aelodau. Bydd hefyd yn ystyried a yw'r dull o ethol y Cynulliad, gan gynnwys y graddau o gyfranodeb, yn cynrychioli'r holl fuddiannau pwysig yng Nghymru'n ddigonol ac yn gywir.

Bydd y comisiwn yn adrodd ar ei drafodion,

deliberations, including its recommendations on the above matters, by the end of 2003. However, it may make interim reports of recommendations if it sees fit. I am determined that the commission, in coming to its conclusions, should be free from influence from either the Assembly as a whole, or its Government. The commission will determine its own agenda and priorities within the terms of reference, and will determine its working procedures. It will decide how to take evidence and from whom, and what studies or comparisons it chooses to consider as regards Scotland or any other devolved dispensations.

As the commission gets into its stride, it will be able to determine the more detailed arrangements for reviewing the Assembly's experience over its first full Assembly term, and for taking evidence from Members here and elsewhere who have an interest in the development of our democracy.

10:15 a.m.

All of us here, by virtue of our involvement in this institution, are on record as holding views on the fundamental points with which the commission will engage. My stance on primary powers, for example, has long been known. However, your personal stance and the manifesto on which you stood in 1997 and 1999 are not the same. That experience is not unique to me. Today, however, is not the occasion for me to rehearse my position. It is an opportunity for Members who have not been closely involved in establishing the Richard commission, to make a contribution at its formative stage, before it starts its work. I look forward to hearing the debate and the ideas that will emerge from it.

Today is also an opportunity to set the commission on its work, with the support of the Assembly. As I hope that such support will be wholehearted, I will not support the somewhat nit-picking amendments in the name of Jonathan Morgan. They do not oppose how we have set up, or the fact that we have set up, the Richard commission, but their tone does not rise to the occasion, and I urge Members not to support them. I am

gan gynnwys ei argymhellion ar y materion uchod, erbyn diwedd 2003. Fodd bynnag, caiff wneud adroddiadau dros dro ar ei argymhellion os yw'n ystyried hynny'n briodol. Yr wyf yn benderfynol y dylai'r comisiwn, wrth ddod i'w gasgliadau, fod yn rhydd oddi wrth ddylanwad y Cynulliad fel cyfangorff, a'i Lywodraeth. Bydd y comisiwn yn pennu'i agenda a'i flaenoriaethau ei hun o fewn y cylch gorchwyl, a bydd yn pennu ei weithdrefnau. Bydd hefyd yn penderfynu sut i gymryd tystiolaeth ac oddi wrth bwy, a pha astudiaethau neu gymariaethau y mae'n dewis eu hystyried o ran yr Alban neu unrhyw oruchwyliaethau datganoledig eraill.

Wrth i'r comisiwn fagu momentwm, bydd yn gallu pennu trefniadau manylach i adolygu profiad y Cynulliad dros dymor llawn cyntaf y Cynulliad, ac i gymryd tystiolaeth gan yr Aelodau yma a chan y rhai mewn mannau eraill sydd â buddiant yn natblygiad ein democratiaeth.

Mae pob un ohonom sydd yma, yn rhinwedd y rhan a gymerwn yn y sefydliad hwn, yn arddel safbwyntiau sydd ar gofnod ar y pwyntiau sylfaenol y bydd y comisiwn yn ymdrin â hwy. Mae fy safbwynt i ar bwerau sylfaenol, er enghraifft, yn hysbys ers tro. Fodd bynnag, nid yr un yw'ch safbwynt personol chi ag un y maniffesto y gwnaethoch ymladd drosto yn 1997 a 1999. Nid yw'r profiad hwnnw'n unigryw i mi. Er hynny, nid heddiw yw'r adeg imi ailadrodd fy safbwynt. Mae'n gyfle i'r Aelodau na fuont â chysylltiad agos â sefydlu comisiwn Richard gyfrannu yn ei gyfnod ffurfiannol, cyn iddo ddechrau ar ei waith. Edrychaf ymlaen at glywed y ddadl a'r syniadau a ddaw ohoni.

Mae heddiw'n gyfle hefyd i gychwyn y comisiwn ar ei waith, gyda chefnogaeth y Cynulliad. Gan fy mod yn gobeithio y bydd y gefnogaeth honno'n frwdfrydig, ni chefnogaf y gwelliannau cwenclyd braidd yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Nid ydynt yn gwrthwynebu'r modd y bu inni sefydlu comisiwn Richard, neu'r ffaith ein bod wedi'i sefydlu, ond nid yw eu cywair yn gydnaws â'r achlysur, ac anogaf yr Aelodau i beidio

grateful to all party leaders for giving of their time and advice in getting the commission's arrangements confirmed and timetabled. While we, or our successors, will want to debate the final outcome of its work, now is the time, above everything else, to wish the commission every success in the important work on which it is embarking. Devolution is a process and does not stand still. I joined the Welsh Office in 1966 as a young civil servant, when it was coming to the end of its second year. The functions that were administratively devolved to the Welsh Office in 1964 were totally different to the functions that the Assembly inherited from the Welsh Office in 1999. Today's motion provides the framework in which such development can best take place. Rather than heat being generated in consideration of the issues involved, it will cast light on them. I hope that you will all support the motion.

Nick Bourne: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Amendment 1: in point 1 delete 'welcomes' and replace with 'notes'.

I propose amendment 2. In point 2 delete 'approves' and insert 'notes'.

I propose amendment 3. Delete point 3 and insert new point:

'notes the commission members will be appointed in July and the work programme will develop thereafter.'

In general, I welcome the First Minister's comments in introducing the debate. They were a fair assessment, apart from his summary of the amendments, with which I obviously disagree. However, I also disagree with the basic premise that he put forward. This commission is a Liberal Democrat inspired idea—if that is not a contradiction in terms. It was essentially the Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad's idea. However, I have other concerns about it.

When the people of Wales voted for devolution in 1997 by a narrow majority, they did so in the belief that we, the elected

â'u cefnogi. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r holl arweinyddion plaid am roi o'u hamser a'u cyngor wrth gadarnhau ac amserlennu trefniadau'r comisiwn. Er y byddwn ni, neu ein holynwyr, am gael dadl ar ganlyniad terfynol ei waith, dyma'r adeg, yn fwy na dim, i ddymuno pob llwyddiant i'r comisiwn yn y gwaith pwysig y mae'n dechrau arno. Mae datganoli'n broses ac nid yw'n sefyll yn ei unfan. Ymunais â'r Swyddfa Gymreig yn 1966 yn was sifil ifanc, pan oedd yn dod i ddiwedd ei hail flwyddyn. Yr oedd y swyddogaethau a oedd wedi'u datganoli'n weinyddol i'r Swyddfa Gymreig yn 1964 yn gwbl wahanol i'r swyddogaethau a etifeddodd y Cynulliad gan y Swyddfa Gymreig yn 1999. Mae'r cynnig heddiw'n darparu'r fframwaith gorau i ddatblygu o'r fath. Yn hytrach na chynhyrchu gwres wrth ystyried y materion dan sylw, bydd yn taflu goleuni arnynt. Gobeithiaf y byddwch oll yn cefnogi'r cynnig.

Nick Bourne: Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Gwelliant 1: yn pwynt 1, dileu 'croesawu' a rhoi 'nodi' yn ei le.

Cynigiaf welliant 2. Yn pwynt 2, dileu 'cymeradwyo' a rhoi 'nodi' yn ei le.

Cynigiaf welliant 3. Dileu pwynt 3, ac ychwanegu pwynt newydd:

yn nodi y bydd aelodau'r comisiwn yn cael eu penodi ym mis Gorffennaf ac y bydd y rhaglen waith yn datblygu o hynny ymlaen.

Yn gyffredinol, croesawaf sylwadau Prif Weinidog Cymru wrth gyflwyno'r ddadl. Yr oeddent yn asesiad teg, ar wahân i'w grynodedeb o'r gwelliannau, yr anghytunaf ag ef, wrth gwrs. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf hefyd yn anghytuno â'r rhagosodiad sylfaenol a gyflwynodd. Mae'r comisiwn hwn yn syniad a ysbrydolwyd gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol—os nad yw hynny'n groesddywediad. Syniad y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor ydoedd yn y bôn. Fodd bynnag, mae gennyf bryderon eraill yn ei gylch.

Pan bleidleisiodd pobl Cymru dros ddatganoli yn 1997 o fwyafrif bach, gwnaethant hynny gan gredu y byddem ni, y

representatives, would seek to carry out the substance of what they were voting for. That is what we are charged to do. The Welsh Conservative Party pledged to accept the settled will of the people. Everything we have done since has illustrated that acceptance. That remains our unequivocal position. I accept the First Minister's point that some tidying up needs to be done on the margins, particularly in relation to the transfer of functions. It is true that that has gone on since 1964. That has been the case under Labour and Conservative Governments. There is now talk of transferring functions from the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs to the Assembly. Another function to be transferred, albeit too slowly, is that on large-scale windfarm developments. Other functions, such as broadcasting, could also be considered for transfer. We remain open-minded on the transfer of functions as opposed to the transfer—[*Interruption.*]

If the Minister for Rural Development and Wales Abroad wants to intervene, I would be happy to give way.

We remain opposed to the transfer of primary legislative powers or tax-raising powers to the Assembly. The recent Liberal Democrat spin on the new 'foreign Minister' for Wales should give everyone pause for thought and cause them to stop in their tracks.

Peter Law: Do you accept that there is a distinct danger, in light of recent comments, that if broadcasting were devolved, Liberal Democrat Ministers, who wish to suppress the rights of the BBC, would interfere?

Nick Bourne: I agree that that is a worrying prospect. However, I refer Peter to his own party's stance and to the great danger in putting Liberal Democrats in any position of power. The deficiencies and shortcomings of the present Secretary of State for Foreign and Commonwealth Affairs's deficiencies and shortcomings, whatever they are, are small compared to what we would experience had we a foreign secretary for Wales. We all sleep easier at night knowing that Jack Straw, not Mike German, is Foreign Secretary.

cynrychiolwyr etholedig, yn ceisio cyflawni sylwedd yr hyn yr oeddent yn pleidleisio drosto. Dyna'r dasg y'n hymddiriedwyd â hi. Addawodd Plaid Geidwadol Cymru dderbyn penderfyniad y bobl. Mae popeth a wnaethom ers hynny wedi dangos ein bod yn ei dderbyn. Dyna ein safbwynt diamwys o hyd. Derbyniaf bwynt Prif Weinidog Cymru bod angen rhywfaint o waith tacluso ar yr ymylon, yn enwedig o ran trosglwyddo swyddogaethau. Mae'n wir bod hynny'n digwydd ers 1964. Felly y bu o dan Lywodraethau Llafur a Cheidwadol. Mae sôn yn awr am drosglwyddo swyddogaethau o Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig i'r Cynulliad. Swyddogaeth arall sydd i'w throsglwyddo, er yn rhy araf, yw honno sy'n ymwneud â datblygiadau fferm wynt mawr. Gellid ystyried trosglwyddo swyddogaethau eraill, fel darlledu. Yr ydym yn agored ein meddwl o hyd ynghylch trosglwyddo swyddogaethau yn hytrach na throsglwyddo—[*Torri ar draws.*]

Os yw'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Gwledig a Chymru Dramor yn dymuno ymyrryd, byddwn yn falch o ildio.

Yr ydym yn dal i wrthwynebu trosglwyddo pwerau deddfu sylfaenol neu bwerau codi trethi i'r Cynulliad. Dylai sbin diweddar y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ynghylch y 'Gweinidog tramor' newydd i Gymru beri i bawb aros i feddwl a stopio'n stond.

Peter Law: A ydych yn derbyn bod perygl pendant, yng ngolwg rhai sylwadau diweddar, os câi darlledu ei ddatganoli, y byddai Gweinidogion y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, sy'n dymuno dileu hawliau'r BBC, yn ymyrryd?

Nick Bourne: Cytunaf fod y posibiliad hwnnw'n peri pryder. Fodd bynnag, cyfeiriaf Peter at safbwynt ei blaid ei hun ac at y perygl mawr o roi Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol mewn unrhyw swydd bwerus. Mae gwendidau a diffygion yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Faterion Tramor a Materion y Gymanwlad presennol, beth bynnag y bôn, yn fach o'u cymharu â'r hyn a brofem pe byddai gennym ysgrifennydd tramor dros Gymru. Yr ydym oll yn cysgu'n dawelach o wybod mai Jack Straw, ac nid Mike German, yw'r Ysgrifennydd Tramor.

However, that is not to say that we will not play a full part in the commission on Assembly powers and electoral arrangements. We will do so in the knowledge that the majority of the people of Wales are opposed to the transfer of legislative and tax-raising powers to the Assembly. We will represent their viewpoint, and not just that of the Welsh Conservatives, on the commission.

I thank the First Minister for his comments on co-operation. There has certainly been co-operation among party leaders in establishing this commission. If we are to have a commission, it must run effectively. I took issue with the First Minister on advertisements being placed in only one national newspaper, *The Guardian*. I do not know whether that was changed.

The First Minister: That is an issue for the consultants. Ministers have no involvement in it.

Nick Bourne: I accept that. However, it is sad that, as well as rightly choosing to advertise in the Welsh press and media, they only advertised in one national newspaper. That will undoubtedly skew the response that we receive. *The Guardian* is dear to the Minister for Wales Abroad, but he will accept that it would be fairer had the advertisement been placed in other newspapers as well. I do not object to the advertisement appearing in *The Guardian*, but it is reasonable to expect other national newspapers to be used. That did not happen.

I return to the main point. [*Interruption.*] I would be happy to give way to Liberal Democrat Members, though they always seem to have more to say to each other than to anybody else. We are charged with ensuring that the devolution settlement is carried into effect and with tackling the issues that matter to people—healthcare provision, the disturbing length of waiting lists, the decline of rural Wales, the closure of rural post offices, the difficulty in recruiting general practitioners and dentists in rural areas and the importance of delivering on

Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n golygu na fyddwn yn chwarae rhan lawn yn y comisiwn ar bwerau a threfniadau etholiadol y Cynulliad. Fe wnawn hynny gan wybod bod y rhan fwyaf o bobl Cymru yn erbyn trosglwyddo pwerau deddfu a chodi trethi i'r Cynulliad. Cynrychiolwn eu safbwynt hwy, ac nid un Ceidwadwyr Cymru'n unig, ar y comisiwn.

Diolchaf i Brif Weinidog Cymru am ei sylwadau ar gydweithredu. Bu cydweithredu, yn sicr, rhwng yr arweinyddion plaid wrth sefydlu'r comisiwn hwn. Os ydym i gael comisiwn, rhaid iddo redeg yn effeithiol. Anghytunais â Phrif Weinidog Cymru ynghylch gosod hysbysebion mewn un papur newydd cenedlaethol yn unig, *The Guardian*. Ni wn a newidiwyd hynny.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae hynny'n fater i'r ymgynghorwyr. Nid oes gan Weinidogion ran ynddo.

Nick Bourne: Derbyniaf hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'n drist, yn ogystal â dewis yn briodol hysbysebu yn y wasg a'r cyfryngau yng Nghymru, eu bod wedi hysbysebu mewn un papur newydd cenedlaethol yn unig. Bydd hynny'n sicr o gamystumio'r ymateb a gawn. Mae *The Guardian* yn annwyl gan y Gweinidog dros Gymru Dramor, ond a wnaiff dderbyn y byddai'n decach pe byddai'r hysbyseb wedi'i gosod mewn papurau newydd eraill hefyd. Nid wyf yn gwrthwynebu gosod yr hysbyseb yn *The Guardian*, ond mae'n rhesymol disgwyl y caiff papurau newydd cenedlaethol eraill eu defnyddio. Ni ddigwyddodd hynny.

Dychwelaf at y prif bwynt. [*Torri ar draws.*] Byddwn yn falch o ildio i Aelodau'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, er ei bod bob tro'n ymddangos bod ganddynt fwy i'w ddweud wrth ei gilydd nag wrth neb arall. Fe'n hymddiriedir â'r gwaith o sicrhau y caiff y setliad datganoli ei roi ar waith ac o fynd i'r afael â'r materion sydd o bwys i bobl—darparu gofal iechyd, y rhestrau aros poenus o hir, dirywiad y Gymru wledig, cau swyddfeydd post gwledig, yr anhawster wrth recriwtio ymarferwyr cyffredinol a deintyddion mewn ardaloedd gwledig a

Objective 1, which is currently floundering. It is economic delivery and the delivery of public services that matter to people, and the Assembly will be judged on those issues. That is why we have tabled amendments to the effect that these arrangements should be noted rather than welcomed.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Croesawaf y ddadl hon. Dof ati o safbwynt cwbl wahanol i'r Prif Weinidog ac, o bosibl, i arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru. Mae'n amlwg i nifer o bobl bod ar y Cynulliad angen pwerau deddfu llawn yn yr holl feysydd datganoledig. Cododd problemau dros y tair blynedd diwethaf yn sgîl Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, diffyg eglurder ynglŷn â'n pwerau, a'n hanallu i wneud cynnydd ar faterion y mae'r pleidiau'n gytûn arnynt. Dylem sicrhau pwerau deddfu llawn ar fyrder.

Clywsom y diwn gron bod yn rhaid i'r Cynulliad brofi'i hun â'i bwerau presennol—bod yn rhaid inni ddysgu crocian cyn cerdded. Gwrthodaf hynny. Gan fod y setliad presennol mor wan a chymhleth, ac ynddo broblemau sylfaenol, ni allwn fforddio gwastraffu mwy o amser yn ceisio'i weithredu. Nid ydym eisiau treulio blynyddoedd yn ceisio codi'r niwl a'r caddug sy'n amgylchynu'r setliad.

It is obvious that the current constitutional settlement is fundamentally flawed. No-one doubts that it is a significant improvement; the First Minister mentioned the situation under the former Welsh Office. However, if we are to make devolution work in a meaningful sense, we must strengthen and clarify the powers. We lack clarity at present. We do not have powers over all devolved areas. As much secondary legislation—if not more in some areas—is passed for Wales in Westminster as in the National Assembly, on areas that most people think are devolved. I suspect that it would surprise many, including Welsh Labour Members of Parliament, to know that as many statutory instruments affecting Wales pass through Westminster every week as pass through the National Assembly on issues over which the Assembly has powers, such as health, education, transport and the environment.

phwysigrwydd llwyddo o ran Amcan 1, sy'n ddrwsych ar hyn o bryd. Llwyddiant economaidd a darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus sy'n bwysig i bobl, a bernir y Cynulliad ar y materion hynny. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi cyflwyno gwelliannau i'r perwyl y dylid nodi'r trefniadau hyn yn hytrach na'u croesawu.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I welcome this debate. I approach it from an entirely different viewpoint to that of the First Minister and, possibly, the leader of the Welsh Conservatives. It is evident to many people that the Assembly needs full legislative powers in all the devolved areas. Problems have arisen over the last three years as a result of the Government of Wales Act 1998, lack of clarity on our powers and our inability to make progress on issues on which all parties are agreed. We should ensure full legislative powers as soon as possible.

We have heard the same old line that the Assembly must prove itself under its present powers—that we must learn to crawl before we can walk. I reject that. As the current settlement is so weak and complex, and as it has such fundamental problems, we cannot afford to waste more time in trying to implement it. We do not want to spend years trying to clear the mist and fog surrounding the settlement.

Mae'n amlwg bod diffyg sylfaenol yn y setliad cyfansoddiadol presennol. Nid oes neb yn amau nad yw'n welliant sylweddol: cyfeiriodd Prif Weinidog Cymru at y sefyllfa o dan y gyn Swyddfa Gymreig. Fodd bynnag, os ydym i beri i ddatganoli weithio'n ystyrlon, rhaid inni gryfhau ac egluro'r pwerau. Nid oes gennym eglurder ar hyn o bryd. Nid ydym yn meddu ar bwerau dros yr holl feysydd a ddatganolwyd. Gwneir cymaint o ddeddfwriaeth eilaidd—os nad mwy mewn rhai meysydd—ar gyfer Cymru yn San Steffan ag yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ar feysydd y mae'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yn credu eu bod wedi'u datganoli. Yr wyf yn amau y byddai'n syndod i lawer, gan gynnwys Aelodau Seneddol Llafur Cymru, wybod bod cynifer o offerynnau statudol sy'n effeithio ar Gymru yn mynd drwy San Steffan bob wythnos ag sy'n mynd drwy'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar faterion y mae gan

y Cynulliad bwerau drostynt, megis iechyd, addysg, trafnidiaeth a'r amgylchedd.

10:25 a.m.

Although the current Government of Wales uses phrases such as 'Welsh policies for Welsh solutions', in the case of legislation this is more spin than substance. There have been few distinctively Welsh statutory instruments. The vast majority of the statutory instruments that we approve through the National Assembly replicate existing legislation in England. Often, and this is a real problem, there is a time lag before they are introduced in Wales, so that Welsh law, in the sense of secondary legislation, is often old law.

Peter Black: Many people may agree with your point. However, we work within the powers that we have. If you are so keen to have distinctive Welsh legislation, why has Plaid Cymru never brought any forward in its minority party debates, as the Liberal Democrats did when it was in opposition?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: We have done so, as you well know. Several of our proposals, which were rejected by you and the Government, would have changed secondary legislation to enable, for example, schools not to be built on contaminated land. Why did you vote against that? Of course, you do not want to respond to that.

I return to what happens under the current settlement. There is considerable cross-party support for many issues, but we cannot persuade Westminster to legislate for us. Not only does Westminster pass statutory instruments for us, but we have lost powers to Westminster in some matters, such as the environment, and legislation that should transfer powers to the Assembly, such as on animal health, does not even mention Wales. Even when there is a unanimous view here in favour of legislation, such as on making St David's Day a bank holiday, nothing happens. If we want to make devolution work for the people of Wales, the sooner we move to being a legislative parliament, the better. I understand why we must set up the commission. It is for reasons of political

Er bod y Llywodraeth Cymru bresennol yn defnyddio ymadroddion fel 'polisiau Cymreig ar gyfer atebion Cymreig', yn achos deddfwriaeth mae hynny'n fwy o droelli nag o sylwedd. Ychydig o offerynnau statudol neilltuol Gymreig a fu. Mae mwyafrif helaeth yr offerynnau statudol a gymeradwywn drwy'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn atgynhyrchu'r ddeddfwriaeth bresennol yn Lloegr. Yn aml, ac mae hon yn broblem wirioneddol, mae oedi cyn eu cyflwyno yng Nghymru, fel bod cyfraith Cymru, o ran deddfwriaeth eilaidd, yn aml yn hen gyfraith.

Peter Black: Mae'n bosibl bod llawer o bobl yn cytuno â'ch pwynt. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn gweithio o fewn y pwerau sydd gennym. Os ydych mor awyddus i gael deddfwriaeth neilltuol Gymreig, pam nad yw Plaid Cymru erioed wedi cyflwyno dim yn ei dadleuon plaid leiafrifol, fel y gwnaeth y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol pan oedd yn wrthblaid?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Fe wnaethom hynny, fel y gwyddoch yn iawn. Byddai nifer o'n cynigion, a wrthodwyd gennych chi a'r Llywodraeth, wedi newid deddfwriaeth eilaidd, i ysgolion beidio â chael eu codi ar dir halogedig, er enghraifft. Pam y gwnaethoch bleidleisio yn erbyn hynny? Wrth gwrs, nid ydych am ymateb i hynny.

Dychwelaf at yr hyn sy'n digwydd dan y setliad presennol. Mae cryn gefnogaeth drawsbleidiol i lawer o faterion, ond ni allwn ddarbwylllo San Steffan i ddeddfu drosom. Nid yn unig y mae San Steffan yn gwneud offerynnau statudol drosom, ond yr ydym yn colli pwerau i San Steffan mewn rhai materion, fel yr amgylchedd, ac nid oes hyd yn oed sôn am Gymru mewn deddfwriaeth a ddylai drosglwyddo pwerau i'r Cynulliad, fel hynny ar iechyd anifeiliaid. Hyd yn oed pan fo barn unfrydol yma o blaid deddfwriaeth, fel hynny ar wneud Dydd Gŵyl Ddewi'n ŵyl banc, nid oes dim yn digwydd. Os ydym am beri i ddatganoli weithio dros bobl Cymru, gorau po gyntaf y symudwn at fod yn senedd ddeddfwriaethol. Deallaf pam y mae'n rhaid inni sefydlu'r comisiwn. Mae er mwyn

expediency. The need for clarity and extra powers is obvious. The First Minister agrees with that, but he does not carry all of his party with him at present. If you cannot act immediately, you put action off until such time as you might not have to act at all, or until more of your Members come on board and you can move forward.

In our view, it was not necessary to establish the commission, as the case for reform is patently obvious. However, it is a useful step forward in view of the current difficulties between Labour and the Liberal Democrats in the partnership agreement. It is important, now that it is established, that we wish Lord Richard well in chairing the commission. At least it will give us an opportunity to have an open, public debate in Wales about the way forward for the National Assembly. I have no doubt—and I am sure that, in their hearts, many in the Assembly have no doubt—that the commission will come out in favour of full primary legislative powers over devolved matters. However, we do not know whether the current Government has the political will to drive forward any changes that might be proposed by this commission. It would be helpful if the Government would make a commitment today to accept the commission's recommendations and act on them accordingly.

Kirsty Williams: This is an important debate in the development of the process of devolution, which Ron Davies has spoken about. This process began a long time ago, when the first home rule Bill was introduced in Parliament. This is an important step in that process to develop a truly representative and powerful body to act on behalf of the people of Wales.

I am proud that Nick Bourne, the leader of the Welsh Conservatives, claims that this is a Liberal Democrat idea, and I am proud to associate myself, and my party, with the commission. It was outlined in our manifesto and included in the partnership agreement.

As Ieuan said, in light of our experiences over the last three years, now is the right time

hwylustod gwleidyddol. Mae'r angen am eglurder a phwerau ychwanegol yn amlwg. Mae Prif Weinidog Cymru yn cytuno â hynny, ond nid yw'n dwyn pawb yn ei blaid gydag ef ar hyn o bryd. Os na allwch weithredu ar unwaith, yr ydych yn gohirio gweithredu nes ei bod yn bosibl na fydd yn rhaid i chi weithredu o gwbl, neu hyd nes bydd rhagor o'ch Aelodau'n ymuno â chi a chithau'n gallu symud ymlaen.

Yn ein barn ni, nid oedd yn rhaid sefydlu'r comisiwn, gan fod y ddadl dros ddiwygio'n gwbl amlwg. Er hynny, mae'n gam buddiol ymlaen yng ngolwg yr anawsterau presennol rhwng Llafur a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn y cytundeb partneriaeth. Mae'n bwysig, a'r comisiwn bellach wedi'i sefydlu, ein bod yn dymuno'n dda i'r Arglwydd Richard wrth ei gadeirio. O leiaf y bydd yn rhoi cyfle inni gael dadl agored, gyhoeddus yng Nghymru am y ffordd ymlaen i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Nid wyf yn amau—ac yr wyf yn sicr, yn eu calonnau, nad yw llawer yn y Cynulliad yn amau—na fydd y comisiwn yn datgan o blaid pwerau deddfu sylfaenol dros faterion a ddatganolwyd. Fodd bynnag, ni wyddom a yw'r Llywodraeth bresennol yn meddu ar ddigon o ewyllys gwleidyddol i hyrwyddo unrhyw newidiadau y gallai'r comisiwn hwn eu cynnig. Byddai o gymorth pe byddai'r Llywodraeth yn ymrwymo heddiw i dderbyn argymhellion y comisiwn a gweithredu'n unol â hwy.

Kirsty Williams: Mae hon yn ddadl bwysig yn natblygiad y broses ddatganoli, y siaradodd Ron Davies amdani. Dechreuodd y broses hon amser maith yn ôl, pan gyflwynwyd y Mesur ymreolaeth cyntaf yn y Senedd. Mae hwn yn gam pwysig yn y broses honno i ddatblygu corff gwirioneddol gynrychioladol a phwerus i weithredu ar ran pobl Cymru.

Yr wyf yn falch fod Nick Bourne, arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru, yn honni mai syniad y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yw hwn, ac yr wyf yn falch o'm cysylltu fy hun, a'm plaid, â'r comisiwn. Fe'i hamlinellwyd yn ein maniffesto a'i gynnwys yn y cytundeb partneriaeth.

Fel y dywedodd Ieuan, hon yw'r adeg briodol, yng ngoleuni ein profiadau dros y

to consider the possibility of extending our powers and extending the electoral arrangement, and perhaps the number of Assembly Members. The time is right. We are strongly placed to consider whether our current powers are delivering. As Ieuan rightly said, we have powers over many matters but we often find ourselves hamstrung and unable to act, often on matters on which we are unanimous in what we want to do. For example, although we are in a much stronger position now than we were under the Welsh Office, we are still unable to introduce free universal dental checks. We were able to introduce free dental checks for certain people in Welsh society but not universally, because the Assembly does not have the power to do that. The same is true for eye tests; I dare say that we would have support in the Chamber for the introduction of universal free eye tests but that requires primary legislation.

Although Members are aware of the difficulties and strangeness, in some ways, of our settlement, it is difficult to explain to people outside this Chamber and this insular body, who think that we are in charge of the health service, why we cannot act on certain measures. It is difficult for them to understand that.

As Ieuan rightly said, there are many issues on which the Assembly voted unanimously to take matters forward, such as on a St David's Day holiday or the Rees report on tuition fees, but we have to rely on the goodwill of Westminster to allow time in its timetable to take these matters forward. I hate to be critical, but we have not been singularly successful in identifying time-slots in Westminster for specifically Welsh legislation.

The starkest example demonstrating the limitations of our powers was the issue of the Children's Commissioner for Wales, which had the unanimous support of political parties here. We spent much time working out the proposals and developing what we considered to be the appropriate role for the children's commissioner. However, we then

tair blynedd diwethaf, i ystyried y posibiliad o ymestyn ein pwerau ac ymestyn y drefniadaeth etholiadol, ac efallai nifer yr Aelodau Cynulliad. Hon yw'r adeg briodol. Yr ydym mewn sefyllfa gryf i allu ystyried a yw ein pwerau presennol yn llwyddo. Fel y dywedodd Ieuan, mae gennym bwerau dros lawer o faterion ond yn aml cawn ein bod wedi'n llyffetheirio ac yn methu â gweithredu, yn aml ar faterion yr ydym yn unfrydol am yr hyn yr ydym am ei wneud yn eu cylch. Er enghraifft, er ein bod mewn sefyllfa gryfach o lawer yn awr nag yr oeddem o dan y Swyddfa Gymreig, yr ydym heb y gallu o hyd i gyflwyno archwiliadau deintyddol i bawb am ddim. Yr oeddem yn gallu cyflwyno archwiliadau deintyddol am ddim i rai yn y gymdeithas yng Nghymru, ond nid i bawb, am nad yw'r Cynulliad yn meddu ar y pŵer i wneud hynny. Mae'r un peth yn wir am brofion llygaid; mentraf ddweud y caem gefnogaeth yn y Siambr i gyflwyno profion llygaid am ddim i bawb ond mae angen deddfwriaeth sylfaenol i wneud hynny.

Er bod yr Aelodau'n ymwybodol o anawsterau ein setliad, a'i hynodrwydd, mewn rhai ffyrdd, mae'n anodd egluro i bobl y tu allan i'r Siambr hon a'r corff ynysig hwn, sy'n credu ein bod â rheolaeth dros y gwasanaeth iechyd, pam na allwn weithredu ar rai mesurau. Mae'n anodd iddynt ddeall hynny.

Fel y dywedodd Ieuan, mae llawer o faterion y pleidleisiodd y Cynulliad yn unfrydol i fynd ymlaen â hwy, fel y diwrnod o wyliau ar Ddydd Gŵyl Ddewi neu adroddiad Rees ar ffioedd dysgu, ond rhaid inni ddibynnu ar ewyllys da San Steffan i ganiatáu amser ar ei hamserlen i fynd â'r materion hyn ymlaen. Mae'n gas gennyf fod yn feiriadol, ond ni fuom yn arbennig o lwyddiannus wrth ganfod rhiciau amser yn San Steffan i ddeddfwriaeth benodol Gymreig.

Yr enghraifft amlycaf sy'n dangos mor gyfyng yw ein pwerau oedd mater Comisiynydd Plant Cymru, a gefnogwyd yn unfrydol gan y pleidiau gwleidyddol yma. Treuliasom lawer o amser yn paratoi'r cynigion a datblygu'r hyn a ystyriem yn rôl briodol i'r comisiynydd plant. Wedyn, fodd bynnag, yr oedd yn rhaid inni fynd â'n cap yn

had to go cap in hand to the Government in Westminster for the Bill to be introduced. Initially, the Bill produced at Westminster did not reflect the unanimous will of the National Assembly. The Minister for Health and Social Services and members of the Welsh Affairs Select Committee had to fight for amendments to that Bill so that we could have the children's commissioner that the Assembly had envisaged. We were reliant on Westminster for that. That is the starkest example that I can think of in the last three years, and shows that the commission is desperately needed so that we can begin a debate on the way forward. That goes beyond the leader of the Welsh Conservatives' points about transfers of functions. There is a fundamental difference between being able to introduce primary legislation to create a children's commissioner and tinkering at the edges, which is what he is suggesting in the transfer of functions.

I wish Lord Rogers—sorry, Lord Richard; that was a Freudian slip—and his team well on the start of their journey. I had the privilege of serving as a member of the National Assembly Advisory Group prior to the Assembly's establishment. We travelled the length and breadth of Wales, talking to people about their vision for the Assembly. I am sure that the commission will have an equally enjoyable experience in debating with people what powers the Assembly should have in terms of legislation, raising its own finance—especially in light of the plans for English devolution—and how it can be better constituted to deliver for the people of Wales. Nick is right; we must continue with our daily work in the Assembly, but we could tackle some of the problems that he highlighted so much better, had we the powers to do so.

David Davies: Four years ago the people of Wales voted by the narrowest margin for an Assembly for Wales—not a parliament. At that time I opposed the Assembly, not just because of the cost but also because I, and others, predicted that, step by step, the people elected to the Assembly would try to gain extra powers to turn the assembly into a parliament. No-one could have predicted how quickly that has happened. The commission

ein llaw at y Llywodraeth yn San Steffan i ofyn am gyflwyno'r Mesur. Ar y dechrau, nid oedd y Mesur a gynhyrchwyd yn San Steffan yn adlewyrchu penderfyniad unfrydol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Bu'n rhaid i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ac aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Dethol ar Faterion Cymreig ymladd dros newidiadau i'r Mesur hwnnw fel y gallem gael y comisiynydd plant yr oedd y Cynulliad wedi'i ragweld. Yr oeddem yn ddibynol ar San Steffan am hynny. Dyna'r enghraifft amlycaf y gallaf feddwl amdani yn y tair blynedd diwethaf, ac mae'n dangos bod taer angen y comisiwn fel y gallwn ddechrau dadl ar y ffordd ymlaen. Mae hynny'n mynd y tu hwnt i bwyntiau arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru am drosglwyddo swyddogaethau. Mae gwahaniaeth sylfaenol rhwng gallu cyflwyno deddfwriaeth sylfaenol i greu comisiynydd plant a chwarae ar yr ymylon, sef yr hyn y mae'n ei awgrymu wrth sôn am drosglwyddo swyddogaethau.

Dymunaf yn dda i'r Arglwydd Rogers—mae'n ddrwg gennyf, yr Arglwydd Richard, llithriad Freudaidd oedd hwnnw—a'i dîm ar ddechrau eu taith. Cefais y fraint o wasanaethu fel aelod o Grŵp Ymgynghorol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol cyn sefydlu'r Cynulliad. Teithiasom ar hyd a lled Cymru, gan siarad â phobl am eu gweledigaeth ar gyfer y Cynulliad. Yr wyf yn sicr y caiff y comisiwn brofiad yr un mor bleserus wrth drafod â phobl ba bwerau y dylai'r Cynulliad feddu arnynt o ran deddfu, codi ei gyllid ei hun—yn enwedig yng ngoleuni'r cynlluniau ar gyfer datganoli yn Lloegr—a sut y gellir ei gyfansoddi'n well i gyflawni dros bobl Cymru. Mae Nick yn iawn; rhaid inni barhau â'n gwaith beunyddiol yn y Cynulliad, ond gallem fynd i'r afael â rhai o'r problemau y tynnodd sylw atynt yn well o lawer o gael y pwerau i wneud hynny.

David Davies: Bedair blynedd yn ôl, pleidleisiodd pobl Cymru o drwch blewyn dros Gynulliad i Gymru—nid senedd. Bryd hynny fe wrthwynebais y Cynulliad, nid yn unig oherwydd y gost ond hefyd am fy mod i, ac eraill, yn darogan y byddai'r rhai a etholid i'r Cynulliad yn ceisio ennill pwerau ychwanegol, fesul cam, i droi'r cynulliad yn senedd. Ni allai neb fod wedi darogan mor gyflym y digwyddai hynny. Y comisiwn yw'r

is the latest manifestation of a desire among the political classes in Wales to give themselves further powers. Where will this end? There is a Parliament in Scotland, an Assembly in Wales, and there are already plans for regional parliaments and assemblies across the rest of England. It is a constitutional shambles—a fact admitted by many, including the leader of Plaid Cymru, who just called it a ‘fundamentally flawed’ solution. He did not say that when he campaigned for a Welsh assembly, although people in the ‘No’ campaign did. We should all be aware of the dangers of tampering with a constitution in this manner—

amlygiad diweddaraf o’r awydd ymysg y dosbarthiadau gwleidyddol yng Nghymru i roi pwerau pellach iddynt hwy eu hunain. Ym mhle y bydd hyn yn gorffen? Mae Senedd yn yr Alban, Cynulliad yng Nghymru, ac mae cynlluniau eisoes ar gyfer seneddau a chynulliadau rhanbarthol yng ngweddill Lloegr. Mae’n llanastr cyfansoddiadol—ffaith y mae llawer yn ei chydnabod, gan gynnwys arweinydd Plaid Cymru, sydd newydd ei alw’n ateb ‘â diffyg sylfaenol’. Ni ddywedodd hynny pan oedd yn ymgyrchu dros gynulliad i Gymru, er bod y rhai yn yr ymgyrch ‘Na’ wedi gwneud. Dylem oll gofio am y peryglon o chwarae â chyfansoddiad fel hyn—

10:35 a.m.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Gan eich bod wedi derbyn bod y sefyllfa fel ag y mae yn annigonol ac yn sylfaenol ddiffygiol, a ydych yn dadlau o blaid senedd â phwerau deddfwriaethol llawn, neu a ydych yn dadlau o blaid dileu’r Cynulliad? Rhaid ichi benderfynu un ffordd neu’r llall.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: As you have accepted that the situation as it stands is inadequate and fundamentally flawed, are you arguing in favour of a parliament with full legislative powers or are you arguing in favour of abolishing the Assembly? You must decide one way or another.

David Davies: I do not have to come down on either side. I will answer that question, but let me come back to it, because it will be my final point. I am speaking for the majority of people in Wales who did not vote for an Assembly for Wales. Members should remember that only one in four people wanted us to be in this Chamber today. I am a Welshman, but I am also a British citizen. I see no conflict in that, but I will always put my loyalty to Britain first. I am worried that this onward march towards regional nationalism and a parliament in Wales encourages people to think of themselves as exclusively Welsh or, in Scotland, as exclusively Scottish or, when we have regional parliaments across the rest of England, exclusively as Cornishmen, Yorkshiremen or whatever.

David Davies: Nid oes rhaid imi benderfynu’r naill ffordd neu’r llall. Atebaf y cwestiwn hwnnw, ond gadewch imi ddod yn ôl ato, gan mai hwnnw fydd fy mhwynt olaf. Yr wyf yn siarad dros y rhan fwyaf o bobl Cymru na wnaethant bleidleisio dros Gynulliad i Gymru. Dylai’r Aelodau gofio mai dim ond un ym mhob pedwar a oedd am inni fod yn y Siambr hon heddiw. Cymro ydwyf fi, ond yr wyf hefyd yn ddinesydd Prydeinig. Ni welaf unrhyw wrthdaro yn hynny, ond byddaf bob amser yn deyrngar i Brydain yn gyntaf. Yr wyf yn pryderu bod y camau hyn tuag at genedlaetholdeb rhanbarthol a senedd yng Nghymru yn cymell pobl i’w hystyried eu hunain yn Gymry’n unig neu, yn yr Alban, yn Albanwyr yn unig neu, pan fydd gennym seneddau rhanbarthol dros weddill Lloegr, yn Gernywiaid, neu’n Efrogiaid neu beth bynnag yn unig.

Kirsty Williams *rose*—

Kirsty Williams *a gododd*—

David Davies: I will not give way; I want to finish. There are great dangers in encouraging this kind of nationalism. For centuries, the UK has been one of the most stable and cohesive countries in Europe. That

David Davies: Ni wnaf ildio; yr wyf am orffen. Mae peryglon mawr mewn hybu cenedlaetholdeb o’r fath. Ers canrifoedd, bu’r DU yn un o wledydd mwyaf sefydlog a chydlynol Ewrop. Mae hynny am inni bob

is because we have always put our loyalty to Britain first. When people in a shared country or state start to define themselves primarily or exclusively by the regions in which they live, by their religion, or by any other characteristic, the resulting instability can lead to disaster. There are examples of that today across Africa, the middle east, in the Balkans, and even in Northern Ireland—the one corner of the UK where a significant number of people do not put their loyalty to the British state first. We have an Assembly and, as the leader of Plaid Cymru said, a constitutional imbalance. England could ignore it, or it could be rectified in Westminster. We must wait and see. However, if we go ahead with a parliament, we will have an even bigger constitutional imbalance. Further powers would create a further imbalance. Let us forget about this constitutional debate, and let us get on with the job that we were elected to do—to improve the health and education services and to concentrate on trunk roads and all the other issues. That may seem mundane, but that is what we were elected to do. If we do anything other than that, then we are on a road to potential disaster.

Peter Law: I am pleased to speak on this issue today. First, we should thank Lord Richard for giving his time to chair this commission. We will be well served by his distinguished presence. However, let us not be under any misapprehension. Ultimately, a political judgment must be made. I will be interested to see the result of this, as will everybody else in Wales. Many people still believe that we must do more with what we have. Perhaps we must convince them on the way. I am pleased to pay tribute to my colleague, Ron Davies and to Labour. Labour—and Ron Davies as the architect—gave us the National Assembly for Wales. It was established after 600 years and we should never forget that, nor underestimate it. We would not be sitting here today if it were not for the Labour Government and Ron Davies's work. A democratic Assembly was delivered for the people of Wales.

When I was in the Executive, there were

amser fod yn deyrngar i Brydain yn gyntaf. Pan yw pobl mewn gwlad neu wladwriaeth a gydrennir yn dechrau eu diffinio'u hunain yn bennaf neu'n gyfan gwbl yn ôl y rhanbarthau lle y maent yn byw, yn ôl eu crefydd, neu yn ôl unrhyw nodwedd arall, gall yr ansefydlogrwydd sy'n dilyn arwain at drychineb. Mae enghreifftiau o hynny heddiw ledled Affrica, y dwyrain canol, yn y Balcanau, a hyd yn oed yng Ngogledd Iwerddon—yr unig gornel o'r DU lle y mae nifer sylweddol o bobl nad ydynt yn deyrngar i'r wladwriaeth Brydeinig yn gyntaf. Mae gennym Gynulliad ac, fel y dywedodd arweinydd Plaid Cymru, anghydbwysedd cyfansoddiadol. Gallai Lloegr ei anwybyddu, neu gellid ei gywiro yn San Steffan. Rhaid inni aros i weld. Fodd bynnag, os awn ymlaen â senedd, bydd gennym anghydbwysedd cyfansoddiadol mwy byth. Byddai pwerau pellach yn creu mwy o anghydbwysedd. Gadewch inni anghofio am y ddadl gyfansoddiadol hon a bwrw ymlaen â'r gwaith y'n hetholwyd i'w wneud—gwella'r gwasanaethau iechyd ac addysg a chanolbwyntio ar gefnffyrdd a'r holl faterion eraill. Gallai hynny ymddangos yn ddi-ddidda, ond i wneud hynny y'n hetholwyd. Os gwnawn rywbeth heblaw hynny, gallem fod ar y ffordd i drychineb.

Peter Law: Yr wyf yn falch o siarad ar y mater hwn heddiw. Yn gyntaf, dylem ddiolch i'r Arglwydd Richard am roi o'i amser i gadeirio'r comisiwn hwn. Bydd ei bresenoldeb nodedig yn gymorth mawr i ni. Fodd bynnag, gadewch inni ddeall hyn yn iawn. Yn y pen draw, bydd yn rhaid gwneud penderfyniad gwleidyddol. Bydd o ddiddoreb imi weld canlyniad hyn, fel y bydd i bawb arall yng Nghymru. Mae llawer yn credu o hyd fod rhaid inni wneud mwy â'r hyn sydd gennym. Efallai y bydd yn rhaid inni eu hargyhoeddi ar y ffordd. Yr wyf yn falch o dalu teyrnged i'm cyd-Aelod, Ron Davies ac i Lafur. Llafur—a Ron Davies yn bensaer—a roddodd inni Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Fe'i sefydlwyd ar ôl 600 mlynedd ac ni ddylem byth anghofio hynny, na'i fychanu. Ni fyddem yn eistedd yma heddiw oni bai am waith y Llywodraeth Lafur a Ron Davies. Rhoddwyd Cynulliad democrataidd i bobl Cymru.

Pan oeddwn yn y Weithrediaeth, bu adegau

times when I was disappointed; I felt that we did not always have a fair deal. There are people in the UK Government, in the civil service particularly, who do not understand devolution. There are issues to be considered and this will be a useful exercise in that regard. We need to consider whether the fire and police services should be devolved. If English regions are given revenue-raising powers, Wales should not be left out; we have only read about that recently.

There is important work to be done and I wish Lord Richard and the commission well. I am pleased to hear that hundreds have applied for membership of the commission. I do not know whether it will be the First Minister or someone else who will appoint the members. I am told that it will be done under Nolan-Neill principles; I just hope that the commission will not be stuffed with Liberal Democrats, because that has been a pattern in some public bodies over the last year or so. We will watch that carefully.

That brings me to another point that is within the commission's remit, namely whether the means of electing the Assembly, including the degree of proportionality, adequately and accurately represent all significant interests in Wales. Most Members know my view on proportional representation. However, it behoves me to repeat it today. PR is a distortion of reality. That phenomenon has proven to be a disaster in the Assembly. You only have to look at the Conservative mausoleum representation, where we have the resuscitation of the politically undead. Apart from one, they would not be here were it not for PR. That shows what a perversion of democracy it is.

If you do not believe that, you need only look to the front of the Chamber, where the newly appointed Deputy First Minister gives credibility to the saying, 'the lunatics are running the asylum'. When someone comes third in a first-past-the-post election in Caerphilly, with 12 per cent of the vote, and then gets the second most powerful position in Wales, you have to wonder where democracy has gone wrong. That is what people say to me.

pan oeddwn yn siomedig; teimlwn nad oeddem bob amser yn cael bargaen deg. Mae rhai yn Llywodraeth y DU, yn y gwasanaeth sifil yn enwedig, nad ydynt yn deall datganoli. Mae materion i'w hystyried a bydd hyn yn ymarfer defnyddiol yn hynny o beth. Rhaid inni ystyried a ddylid datganoli'r gwasanaethau tân a heddlu. Os rhoddir pwerau codi refeniw i ranbarthau Lloegr, ni ddylai Cymru gael ei gadael allan; dim ond yn ddiweddar y darllenasom am hynny.

Mae gwaith pwysig i'w wneud a dymunaf yn dda i'r Arglwydd Richard a'r comisiwn. Yr wyf yn falch o glywed bod cannoedd wedi ymgeisio am aelodaeth o'r comisiwn. Ni wn ai Prif Weinidog Cymru neu rywun arall a wnaiff benodi'r aelodau. Dywedir wrthyf y caiff hynny ei wneud yn unol ag egwyddorion Nolan-Neill; nid wyf ond yn gobeithio na chaiff y comisiwn ei lanw â Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, gan y bu patrwm o hynny mewn rhai cyrff cyhoeddus dros y flwyddyn neu ddwy ddiwethaf. Byddwn yn cadw llygad barcud ar hynny.

Daw hynny â mi at bwynt arall sydd o fewn cylch gwaith y comisiwn, sef a yw'r dull o ethol y Cynulliad, gan gynnwys y graddau o gyfranoldeb, yn adlewyrchu'n ddigonol ac yn gywir yr holl fuddiannau pwysig yng Nghymru. Fe wŷr y rhan fwyaf o'r Aelodau am fy marn i am gynrychiolaeth gyfrannol. Er hynny, fe ddylwn ei hailadrodd heddiw. Mae cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol yn ystumio realiti. Mae'r ffenomen honno wedi profi'n drychineb yn y Cynulliad. Nid oes ond rhaid ichi edrych ar y gynrychiolaeth o'r beddrod Ceidwadol, lle y mae'r meirwon gwleidyddol wedi'u hadfywio. A wahân i un, ni fyddent yma oni bai am gynrychiolaeth gyfrannol. Mae hynny'n dangos y fath ystumiad o ddemocratiaeth ydyw.

Os na chredwch hynny, nid oes ond rhaid ichi edrych tua blaen y Siambr, lle y mae'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog Cymru newydd-benodedig yn rhoi hygrededd i'r dywediad, 'mae'r lloerigion yn rhedeg y gwallgofdy'. Pan yw rhywun yn dod yn drydydd mewn etholiad y cyntaf heibio i'r postyn yng Nghaerffili, gyda 12 y cant o'r bleidlais, ac wedyn yn cael y swydd fwyaf pwerus ond un yng Nghymru, rhaid ichi feddwl tybed ym mhle yr aeth democratiaeth o chwith. Dyna a

ddywed pobl wrthyf fi.

The majority of people do not understand, want or believe in PR. They support the traditional first-past-the-post democratic system that has been the mainstay of Britain for so long. I am surprised that the Conservatives have not tabled an amendment on this issue today. They used to call PR all sorts of names until they got into the Assembly. They never believed in devolution or voted for the Assembly. Theirs is a hypocritical party. It is now pleased to have eight Members here, taking salaries and being part of the system.

Nid yw'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yn deall, yn dymuno nac yn credu mewn cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol. Maent yn cefnogi system ddemocrataidd draddodiadol y cyntaf heibio i'r postyn a fu'n brif gynheiliad i Brydain gyhyd. Yr wyf yn synnu nad yw'r Ceidwadwyr wedi cyflwyno gwelliant ar y mater hwn heddiw. Arferent alw cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol yn bob math o enwau nes iddynt ddod i'r Cynulliad. Nid oeddent erioed wedi credu mewn datganoli ac ni wnaethant bleidleisio dros y Cynulliad. Plaid ragrithiol yw eu plaid hwy. Mae'n falch yn awr o gael wyth Aelod yma, yn derbyn cyflogau ac yn rhan o'r system.

PR is a perversion of democracy. When you consider the best interests of the people of Wales, PR and the list system does not represent people fairly and adequately across Wales. I have said that many times before, particularly to the leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat group. He usually turns around, or perhaps his underling, otherwise known as 'Blackey the Lackey', does and tells me that he was elected with 24,000 votes on the South Wales East list. The Labour Party had 84,000 votes on the South Wales East list and we did not get a seat. People ask me 'is that democracy?' We have been short-changed. Not everybody likes the way—

Mae cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol yn ystumiad o ddemocratiaeth. Pan ystyriwch yr hyn sydd o'r budd mwyaf i bobl Cymru, nid yw cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol a'r system restr yn cynrychioli pobl ledled Cymru'n deg ac yn ddigonol. Dywedais hynny lawer gwaith o'r blaen, yn enwedig wrth arweinydd grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru. Fel arfer mae'n troi ataf, neu efallai y bydd ei was bach, a elwir fel arall yn 'Black y Cynffonnwr', yn gwneud, ac yn dweud wrthyf iddo gael ei ethol â 24,000 o bleidleisiau ar restr Dwyrain De Cymru. Cafodd y Blaid Lafur 84,000 o bleidleisiau ar restr Dwyrain De Cymru ac ni chawsom sedd. Mae pobl yn gofyn i mi 'ai peth felly yw democratiaeth?' Cawsom ein twyllo. Nid pawb sy'n hoffi'r modd—

David Davies: I agree that PR is a travesty of democracy. However, the Labour Party designed that system. The Conservatives have only played by the rules imposed upon us. Nobody has ever asked the Liberal Democrats, or anyone else who does not support the first-past-the-post system, why they are prepared to take their seats in Parliament. Why, therefore, do you ask us why we took our seats under the rules that you devised? Why do you not address your comments to the people who imposed these awful rules upon us?

David Davies: Cytunaf fod cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol yn ystumiad o ddemocratiaeth. Fodd bynnag, y Blaid Lafur a gynlluniodd y system honno. Nid yw'r Ceidwadwyr ond wedi chwarae yn ôl y rheolau a orfodwyd arnom. Ni ofynnodd neb erioed i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, nac i neb arall nad yw o blaid system y cyntaf heibio i'r postyn, pam y maent yn barod i gymryd eu seddau yn y Senedd. Pam, felly, yr ydych yn gofyn i ni pam y cymerasom ein seddau o dan y rheolau a ddyfeisiwyd gennych chi? Pam na chyfeiriwch eich sylwadau at y rhai a orfododd y rheolau ofnadwy hyn arnom?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Peter, you must wind-up now. I also invite you to withdraw the phrase 'Blackey the Lackey';

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Peter, rhaid ichi orffen yn awr. Yr wyf hefyd yn eich gwahodd i dynnu'n ôl yr ymadrodd 'Black y

substitute another phrase, if you wish. That remark goes too far.

Peter Law: I think that it is reasonable, Deputy Presiding Officer. There is nothing insulting about it.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Well, I do not believe that it is reasonable, but I know that you are, therefore I ask you to please withdraw it.

Peter Law: There was nothing racial about the remark; I make that clear. However, I will withdraw it if you think it appropriate to do so. I will just call him the lackey of Mike German, the leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat group. He is a lackey, because he is also a Deputy Minister. How can you be given such a position, when you only receive 12 per cent of the vote?

10:45 a.m.

Kirsty Williams: Given your obsession with Mike German and the difficulties that you have with his position, you must be disappointed that the last two council by-elections in your constituency were won by Liberal Democrats, in campaigns with which Mike German was heavily involved. Your constituents are not accepting whatever you are spoon-feeding them, Peter.

Peter Law: They were just two blips and the result of Liberal Democrat disinformation, with which we are all familiar.

I accept that people are here because the system was designed that way. I do not take any credit for that system. However, those Conservative Members who still want to abolish the Assembly are being hypocritical when they accept salaries as Assembly Members.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I do not wish to prolong the matter, but 'lackey' is not a suitable word to use in the Chamber. No Member is a lackey. We are elected Members who use our judgment in the interests of our

Cynffonwr'; rhowch ymadrodd arall yn ei le, os dymunwch. Â'r sylw hwnnw yn rhy bell.

Peter Law: Credaf ei fod yn rhesymol, Ddirprwy Lywydd. Nid oes dim sarhaus yn ei gylch.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Wel, ni chredaf fi ei fod yn rhesymol, ond gwn eich bod chi, felly gofynnaf ichi ei dynnu'n ôl, os gwelwch yn dda.

Peter Law: Nid oedd dim hiliol ynghylch y sylw; gwnaf hynny'n glir. Fodd bynnag, fe'i tynnaf yn ôl os credwch ei bod yn briodol gwneud hynny. Ni wnaaf ond ei alw'n gynffonwr i Mike German, arweinydd grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru. Cynffonwr ydyw, gan ei fod yntau'n Ddirprwy Weinidog. Sut y gellir rhoi swydd o'r fath i chi, a chithau ond wedi cael 12 y cant o'r bleidlais?

Kirsty Williams: O ystyried eich obsesiwn â Mike German a'ch anfodlonrwydd â'i swydd, mae'n rhaid eich bod yn siomedig mai Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a enillodd y ddau is-etholiad cyngor diwethaf yn eich etholaeth, mewn ymgyrchoedd y bu gan Mike German ran fawr ynddynt. Nid yw'ch etholwyr yn derbyn beth bynnag yr ydych yn ei borthi iddynt, Peter.

Peter Law: Nid oedd hynny ond yn ddau anghysonder bach o ganlyniad i gamhysbysrwydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, yr ydym oll yn gyfarwydd ag ef.

Derbyniaf fod pobl yma am fod y system wedi'i chynllunio felly. Nid wyf yn cymryd unrhyw glod am y system honno. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Aelodau Ceidwadol hynny sy'n dal i ddymuno diddymu'r Cynulliad yn rhagrithio pan dderbyniant gyflogau fel Aelodau Cynulliad.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Nid wyf yn dymuno ymestyn y mater, ond nid yw 'cynffonwr' yn air addas i'w ddefnyddio yn y Siambr. Nid yw yr un Aelod yn gynffonwr. Yr ydym yn Aelodau etholedig

constituents. No Member should suggest that we do anything other than that.

Peter Law: I will withdraw my comment; it only appeared that he behaved in that way.

Janet Davies: I disagree with the previous two speakers. To talk of the British state is old-fashioned. The nation state is a nineteenth-century concept. These days, we should talk of appropriate government at different levels. I note that nothing was said about our being European citizens. However, I wish to focus on electoral arrangements. I disagree with Peter Law on proportional representation. It is a system that has come late to the political scene in Britain and which is about trying to get a closer relationship between the proportion of votes cast for a group and the seats it gains. It is about being fair to the electorate, not to politicians, and about elected representatives needing to listen and act upon the wishes of those who vote for them. It is also about developing close links between politicians and the electorate. There is a contradiction there, because the most proportional system is one whereby one large constituency exists and people are elected in proportion to the votes received by the party that they represent. The main difficulty with that scenario is that no-one has particular responsibility for particular areas. Also, the parties can decide who is at the top of the list instead of there being an open list.

That does not mean that we should get rid of the system. Efforts have been made to tailor a system that achieves the best balance between proportionality and accountable representation and is stronger than holding an election once every four or five years. Some efforts have been complex—the Assembly's system is fairly complex, as I know, having tried to explain it to many people. However, such systems are better than the first-past-the-post system, which can enable a party with a low percentage of votes in some areas to hold power election after election. The often-cited advantage of the system is that it results in strong government. That is not true. One

sy'n arfer ein doethineb er budd ein hetholwyr. Ni ddylai unrhyw Aelod awgrymu ein bod yn gwneud dim heblaw hynny.

Peter Law: Tynnaf fy sylw'n ôl; nid oedd ond yn ymddangos ei fod yn ymddwyn felly.

Janet Davies: Anghytunaf â'r ddau siaradwr blaenorol. Mae sôn am y wladwriaeth Brydeinig yn hen-ffasiwn. Mae'r genedl-wladwriaeth yn gysyniad o'r bedwaredd ganrif ar bymtheg. Y dyddiau hyn, dylem sôn am lywodraeth briodol ar wahanol lefelau. Sylwaf na ddywedwyd dim am y ffaith ein bod yn ddinasyddion Ewropeaidd. Fodd bynnag, dymunaf ganolbwyntio ar y trefniadau etholiadol. Anghytunaf â Peter Law ar gynrychiolaeth gyfrannol. Mae'n system a ddaeth yn hwyr i'r byd gwleidyddol ym Mhrydain ac mae'n ymwneud â cheisio cael cysylltiad agosach rhwng y gyfran o bleidleisiau a gaiff eu bwrw dros grŵp a nifer y seddau y mae'n eu hennill. Mae'n ymwneud â bod yn deg â'r etholwyr, nid â'r gwleidyddion, a'r angen i gynrychiolwyr etholedig wrando a gweithredu yn ôl dymuniadau'r rhai sy'n pleidleisio drostynt. Mae'n ymwneud hefyd â datblygu cysylltiadau agos rhwng gwleidyddion a'r etholwyr. Mae gwrthddywediad yn hynny o beth, oherwydd y system fwyaf cyfrannol yw'r un lle y ceir un etholaeth fawr a lle yr etholir pobl mewn cyfrannedd â'r pleidleisiau a gaiff y blaid y maent yn ei chynrychioli. Y prif anhawster ynghylch y senario hwnnw yw nad oes gan neb gyfrifoldeb penodol dros ardaloedd penodol. Hefyd, gall y pleidiau benderfynu pwy fydd ar ben y rhestr yn lle cael rhestr agored.

Nid yw hynny'n golygu y dylem gael gwared â'r system. Cafwyd ymdrechion i ddyfeisio system sy'n sicrhau'r cydbwysedd gorau rhwng cyfranoldeb a chynrychiolaeth atebol ac sy'n gryfach na chynnal etholiad bob pedair neu bum mlynedd. Bu rhai o'r cynigion yn gymhleth—mae system y Cynulliad yn eithaf cymhleth, fel y gwn, a minnau wedi ceisio ei hegluro i lawer o bobl. Fodd bynnag, mae systemau o'r fath yn well na system y cyntaf heibio i'r postyn, a all alluogi plaid a chanddi ganran fach o'r pleidleisiau mewn rhai ardaloedd i gadw grym y naill etholiad ar ôl y llall. Un fantais i'r system hon y cyfeirir ati'n aml yw ei bod

third of UK local councils do not have a party in overall control. Also, while it is easy to talk about the advantages of strong government, there are also disadvantages. Such governments can be less accountable, consult less and be uncaring towards minorities. In extreme cases, it can lead to authoritarian government.

The Assembly was given a new system of proportional representation. As a list Member, I see the disadvantages of trying to represent a large constituency area. There may well be a better system; a single transferable vote system delivers many needs, but there is no perfect option. It is important to have the best system for Wales and a Government and parliament that are responsive, accountable and open, while giving fair representation for all voters and being able to deliver the strategies—and, in future, I hope, legislation—that will promote equality and make Wales a pleasant place in which to live.

Huw Lewis: I will support the Government motion this morning, but it is important to put on record some of my serious reservations about this debate. This is an important debate, but it has come far too soon in the life of this institution. It means that we are in danger of being seen by people in the way that politicians are too often seen, namely full of our own self-importance and most animated when talking about ourselves. I am pleased that the terms of reference have been tightly drafted, though I am not entirely convinced that they should have been drafted before we have completed one full term.

I hope that the commission recognises the legitimate role of local government in its work. Our powers affect its role as much as they do the relationship between the Assembly and the UK Parliament. Equally, the role of the UK Parliament must be recognised and given voice. Changes to our powers will themselves require primary legislation—a function that Members of Parliament were elected to discharge. However, in general, the terms rightly focus on the existing policy arrangements and on whether they are sufficient to deliver reform and the change we require. This issue is

yn arwain at lywodraeth gryf. Nid yw hynny'n wir. Ar un rhan o dair o'r cynghorau lleol yn y DU nid oes plaid â mwyafrif dros bawb. Hefyd, er ei bod yn hawdd sôn am fanteision llywodraeth gryf, mae anfanteision hefyd. Gall llywodraethau o'r fath fod yn llai atebol, ymgynghori'n llai a bod yn ddiotal o leiafrifoedd. Mewn achosion eithafol, gall arwain at lywodraeth unbenaethol.

Rhoddyd system newydd o gynrychiolaeth gyfrannol i'r Cynulliad. Fel Aelod rhestr, gwelaf yr anfanteision o geisio cynrychioli ardal etholaethol fawr. Mae'n ddigon posibl bod system well; mae system y bleidlais sengl drosglwyddadwy yn diwallu llawer o anghenion, ond nid oes dewis perffaith. Mae'n bwysig cael y system orau i Gymru a Llywodraeth a senedd sy'n ymatebol, yn atebol ac yn agored, gan roi cynrychiolaeth deg i'r holl bleidleiswyr a gallu cyflawni'r strategaethau hynny—a deddfwriaeth yn y dyfodol, yr wyf yn gobeithio—a fydd yn hybu cydraddoldeb ac yn gwneud Cymru'n lle dymunol i fyw.

Huw Lewis: Cefnogaf gynnig y Llywodraeth y bore yma, ond mae'n bwysig cofnodi rhai o'm hamheuron difrifol ynghylch y ddadl hon. Mae hon yn ddadl bwysig, ond fe ddaeth yn rhy fuan o lawer yn oes y sefydliad hwn. Mae'n golygu bod perygl i bobl ein gweld yn y modd y gwelir gwleidyddion yn rhy aml, sef rhai sy'n llawn hunanbwysigrwydd ac yn fwyaf brwd pan ydym yn sôn amdanom ein hunain. Yr wyf yn falch bod y cylch gorchwyl wedi'i ddrafftio'n fanwl, er nad wyf yn gwbl argyhoeddedig y dylai fod wedi'i ddrafftio cyn inni gwblhau un tymor llawn.

Gobeithiaf y bydd y comisiwn yn cydnabod y rôl ddilys sydd i lywodraeth leol yn ei waith. Mae ein pwerau'n effeithio ar ei rôl hi'n gymaint ag y maent ar y berthynas rhwng y Cynulliad a Senedd y DU. Yn yr un modd, rhaid cydnabod rôl Senedd y DU a rhoi llais iddi. Bydd newidiadau i'n pwerau'n gofyn deddfwriaeth sylfaenol hefyd—swyddogaeth yr etholwyd Aelodau Seneddol i'w chyflawni. Fodd bynnag, yn gyffredinol, mae'r cylch gorchwyl yn canolbwyntio'n briodol ar y trefniadau polisi presennol ac a ydynt yn ddigonol i gyflawni'r newid a'r diwygio y mae arnom eu hangen. Mae'r

central to the debate.

I have supported and campaigned for devolution all of my adult life, but I would turn my back on it tomorrow if I thought there was a better and more effective way of delivering social justice. Devolution is not here for its own sake. This institution does not exist simply to provide us with employment. It is a natural tendency for all institutions to seek to gain greater powers and influence, but I would be concerned if this was sought after only four years in office. Furthermore, it would be distasteful if we were to seek to do this without first asking for the consent of the people once again. I hope that the commission will recognise that it is politically honest, after the referendum decision of the people of Wales, that we again consult them before we implement any constitutional change in future.

We won a fragile agreement in 1997 to establish this institution, but if we are to change the terms of that agreement, we should only do so with renewed consent. There has not been a huge ground swell of support for the Assembly since the revolution—[*Laughter.*] Sorry, that was part of an old speech. There has not been a huge ground swell of support for the Assembly since the referendum, and it is natural that people want to give the institution time to work. People will not respond to politicians always looking to re-run the referendum campaign, and there is no reason for us to do that. However, they will respond positively to seeing the Assembly delivering change and social justice.

There are many unexplored ways in which our existing powers could be employed to deliver positive change for the people of Wales. This is by far the most important challenge for the Assembly. This debate and this commission are needed, but to start before we have finished even one full term is premature. The many ways in which our existing powers could be used would allow us to be deeply radical in the way we address the problems of Wales, if we had the courage to take on the vested interests that stand in the way of social justice in our country.

mater hwn yn ganolog i'r ddadl.

Yr wyf wedi cefnogi ac ymgyrchu dros ddatganoli ar hyd fy oes fel oedolyn, ond byddwn yn cefnu arno yfory pe credwn fod dull gwell a mwy effeithiol i sicrhau cyfiawnder cymdeithasol. Nid yw datganoli'n bod er ei fwyn ei hun. Nid yw'r sefydliad hwn yn bod dim ond i roi gwaith i ni. Mae'n duedd naturiol i bob sefydliad geisio ennill mwy o bwerau a dylanwad, ond byddwn yn bryderus pe byddem yn ceisio hynny ar ôl dim ond pedair blynedd mewn grym. Ar ben hynny, byddai'n annymunol pe byddem yn ceisio gwneud hynny heb ofyn yn gyntaf am gydsyniad y bobl unwaith eto. Gobeithiaf y bydd y comisiwn yn cydnabod ei bod yn wleidyddol onest, ar ôl penderfyniad pobl Cymru yn y refferendwm, inni ymgynghori â hwy eto cyn inni roi unrhyw newid cyfansoddiadol ar waith yn y dyfodol.

Enillasom gytundeb bregus yn 1997 i sefydlu'r sefydliad hwn, ond os ydym i newid amodau'r cytundeb hwnnw, ni ddylem ond gwneud hynny ar ôl cael cydsyniad o'r newydd. Ni fu ymchwydd mawr o gefnogaeth i'r Cynulliad ers y chwyldro—[*Chwerthin.*] Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, rhan o hen araith oedd hynny. Ni fu ymchwydd mawr o gefnogaeth i'r Cynulliad ers y refferendwm, ac mae'n naturiol bod pobl am roi amser i'r sefydliad weithio. Ni fydd pobl yn ymateb i wleidyddion sydd bob amser am ailgynnal ymgyrch y refferendwm, ac nid oes rheswm inni wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, fe fyddant yn ymateb yn gadarnhaol o weld y Cynulliad yn dod â newid a chyfiawnder cymdeithasol.

Gellid defnyddio ein pwerau presennol mewn llawer o ddulliau nas ymchwiliwyd iddynt i sicrhau newid cadarnhaol i bobl Cymru. Hon yw'r her bwysicaf o lawer i'r Cynulliad. Mae angen y ddadl hon a'r comisiwn hwn, ond cynamserol yw cychwyn cyn inni gwblhau hyd yn oed un tymor llawn. Byddai'r nifer fawr o ddulliau posibl o ddefnyddio ein pwerau presennol yn caniatáu inni fod yn radical iawn yn y modd yr ydym yn ymdrin â phroblemau Cymru, pe byddem yn ddigon eofn i fynd i'r afael â'r buddiannau breintiedig sy'n rhwystro cyfiawnder cymdeithasol yn ein gwlad.

Alun Pugh: I welcome the establishment of this commission. This is a wise step with a realistic timetable, and I intend to give evidence to the commission. Any fair-minded review would conclude that primary law-making powers should reside in Cardiff, as well as in Belfast and Edinburgh. The National Assembly has responsibility for education, health, transport and a host of other subjects. Yet it is unable to legislate. Legislation for Wales must compete with all the other Bills in the parliamentary logjam. Good proposals from the Assembly Government are sometimes not turned into law simply because of lack of Westminster time. Indeed, it is only possible for the current settlement to work effectively if the Secretary of State for Wales and the First Minister dance in perfect harmony, showing neat footwork and perfect co-ordination over some thin constitutional ice. We are indeed fortunate that, in Paul Murphy and Rhodri Morgan, we have a modern-day Torvill and Dean.

For example, the statutory role of a children's commissioner for Wales was set up by grafting clauses onto the Care Standards Act 2000. A second set of legislation had to follow later on to give the commissioner the powers to do the job. This cannot disguise the fact that a single Act for Wales, rather than a legal lash-up would have been a more fitting response to the Waterhouse inquiry into widespread child abuse in north Wales.

10:55 a.m.

Gareth Jones: Mae'r Blaid Lafur a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn ymfalchïo yn nyletswyddau a chyfrifoldebau Comisiynydd Plant Cymru. Pam, felly, yr anwybyddwyd ei sylwadau pwysig ar beidio ag adeiladu ysgolion yng Nghymru ar diroedd halogedig?

Alun Pugh: That is a separate issue and the Minister for Environment has already given you a satisfactory explanation on it.

The flagship reforms of post-16 education funding in Wales, including the establishment of Education and Learning Wales, a much needed post-16 planning and funding body, was also achieved by tagging a set of Wales-

Alun Pugh: Croesawaf sefydlu'r comisiwn hwn. Cam doeth ydyw gydag amserlen realistig, a bwriadaf roi tystiolaeth i'r comisiwn. Byddai unrhyw adolygiad teg yn dod i'r casgliad y dylid cael pwerau deddfu sylfaenol yng Nghaerdydd, yn ogystal ag yn Belfast ac yng Nghaeredin. Mae gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gyfrifoldeb dros addysg, iechyd, trafnidiaeth a llu o bynciau eraill. Eto, nid yw'n gallu deddfu. Rhaid i ddeddfwriaeth i Gymru gystadlu â'r holl Fesurau eraill yn y dagfa seneddol. Ar rai adegau, yr unig reswm dros beidio â throi cynigion da gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ddeddf yw diffyg amser yn San Steffan. Yn wir, nid yw ond yn bosibl i'r setliad presennol weithio'n effeithiol os yw Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru a Phrif Weinidog Cymru'n dawnsio'n gwbl gytûn, gan droedio'n ddeheuig ac yn gwbl gyd-drefnus ar rew cyfansoddiadol tenau. Yr ydym yn wirioneddol ffodus bod Paul Murphy a Rhodri Morgan yn Torvill a Dean i'n hoes ni.

Er enghraifft, sefydlwyd rôl statudol comisiynydd plant i Gymru drwy impio cymalau ar Ddeddf Safonau Gofal 2000. Yr oedd yn rhaid i ddeddfwriaeth pellach ddilyn yn ddiweddarach i roi'r pwerau i'r comisiynydd wneud y gwaith. Ni all hynny gelu'r ffaith y buasai un Ddeddf i Gymru, yn hytrach na blerwch cyfreithiol, yn ymateb mwy addas i ymchwiliad Waterhouse i'r gamdriniaeth eang o blant yn y Gogledd.

Gareth Jones: The Labour Party and the Liberal Democrats pride themselves on the duties and responsibilities of the Children's Commissioner for Wales. Why, therefore, were his important comments on not building schools in Wales on contaminated land ignored?

Alun Pugh: Mae hynny'n fater ar wahân ac mae'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd wedi rhoi eglurhad boddhaol ichi am hynny eisoes.

Yr oedd y diwygiadau pwysig mewn ariannu addysg ôl-16 yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys sefydlu Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru, corff cynllunio ac ariannu ôl-16 yr oedd ei fawr angen, hefyd wedi'u sicrhau drwy atodi

only clauses onto the Learning and Skills Act 2000.

The latest Education Bill is remarkable as it contains two different sets of proposals for education in England and Wales, and is the product of much shuttling between Cardiff and London. The current settlement can work when two sets of politicians and officials from the same party actively co-operate. However, this spirit of mutual respect and co-operation to secure different outcomes in one Act could never survive the election of governments of different parties in Cardiff bay and Westminster.

Cynog Dafis: Pe bai llywodraeth Plaid Cymru wedi cynnig cynnig tebyg mewn perthynas â'r Mesur Addysg, a ydych yn awgrymu y byddai'r Llywodraeth Lafur yn Llundain wedi gwrthod cydweithredu â'i hargymhellion?

Alun Pugh: That is a good point. It is difficult to speculate on how the current settlement would work if there were governments of different parties in Cardiff and London.

It has been said that once the Assembly has proved itself by some vague criteria, primary powers may follow in due course. This is like asking a man in a straitjacket to dig a deep trench with his bare hands, and rewarding his success by removing the jacket and presenting him with a shovel. The reforms that I propose should not be seen as a chattering class indulgence when we should be concentrating on the delivery of public services. I want change because the current constitutional arrangement is an unnecessary impediment to the Assembly's ability to deliver for the people of Wales.

The Labour-led Government of Wales has done many good things, ranging from providing free transport for pensioners to student grants for our young people. We have done much, but we could do more with those primary powers.

Eleanor Burnham: I pay tribute to all those who were instrumental in establishing the National Assembly for Wales. The Welsh

cyfres o gymalau i Gymru'n unig i'r Ddeddf Dysgu a Sgiliau 2000.

Mae'r Mesur Addysg diweddaraf yn hynod gan ei fod yn cynnwys dwy set wahanol o gynigion i addysg yng Nghymru a Lloegr, ac mae'n ganlyniad i lawer o fynd a dod rhwng Caerdydd a Llundain. Gall y setliad presennol weithio pan yw dwy set o wleidyddion a swyddogion o'r un blaid yn cydweithredu'n egniol. Fodd bynnag, ni allai'r ysbryd hwn o gydweithredu a pharch gan y naill at y llall i sicrhau gwahanol ganlyniadau mewn un Ddeddf byth barhau ar ôl ethol llywodraethau o wahanol bleidiau ym mae Caerdydd a San Steffan.

Cynog Dafis: If a Plaid Cymru government had proposed a similar motion in relation to the Education Bill, are you suggesting that the Labour Government in London would have refused to co-operate with its recommendations?

Alun Pugh: Mae hynny'n bwynt da. Mae'n anodd dyfalu sut y byddai'r setliad presennol yn gweithio pe byddai llywodraethau o wahanol bleidiau yng Nghaerdydd a Llundain.

Bu sôn mai unwaith y bydd y Llywodraeth wedi'i phrofi ei hun yn ôl rhyw feini prawf annelwig, y gallai pwerau sylfaenol ddilyn ymhen amser. Mae hynny'n debyg i ofyn i ddyn â siaced gaeth amdano dorri ffos ddwfn â'i ddwylo noeth, a'i wobrwyo drwy dynnu'r siaced a chyflwyno rhaw iddo. Ni ddylid ystyried y diwygiadau a gynigaf fi'n faldod i ddsbarth y clebrynnod ar adeg pan ddylem ganolbwyntio ar ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Yr wyf am weld newid am fod y trefniant cyfansoddiadol presennol yn rhwystr diangen i allu'r Cynulliad i gyflawni dros bobl Cymru.

Mae Llywodraeth Cymru dan arweiniad Llafur wedi gwneud llawer o bethau da, yn amrywio o ddarparu trafniadaeth am ddim i bensynwyr i grantiau myfyrwyr i'n pobl ifanc. Fe wnaethom lawer, ond gallem wneud rhagor gyda'r pwerau sylfaenol hynny.

Eleanor Burnham: Talaf deyrnged i bawb a fu'n gyfrwng i sefydlu Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Mae Democratiaid

Liberal Democrats welcome this commission, and believe that the time is right to strengthen our position. The Liberal Democrats in Wales believe in a federal Britain and in the re-establishment of the Assembly as a Welsh *Senedd*, with the same powers as the Scottish Parliament. A Parliament for Wales has been our party's policy for over 100 years. E. T. John, the Liberal Member of Parliament, introduced the first home rule Bill for Wales in 1914. We favour a Welsh *Senedd* with tax-bearing powers, but only subject to the support of the people of Wales in a referendum.

The Welsh Liberal Democrats believe, despite Peter Law's assertion, that everyone's vote should count; not just the votes of 100,000 people in marginal seats, as is the case in Westminster elections. Proportional representation is fairer and more representative than the first-past-the-post system. Eighty Members should be elected by the single transferable vote in multi-Member constituencies. This would ensure a more representative Parliament, with greater equality between Members, more influence for voters and less influence for political parties.

The Assembly does not have powers over significant areas of transport policy. Railways, air transport and buses, in particular, remain largely under the control of the Westminster Government. This increases the difficulty of achieving the important aim of an integrated transport system, which is long overdue in Wales, to regenerate communities and help confirm social inclusion.

If we wish to establish a passenger transport authority for Wales, we cannot go ahead and do it. If we all vote in favour of it, we must wait for primary legislation to be passed in Westminster. The leader of the Welsh Conservatives, Nick Bourne, appears to be completely confused about the direction that his party should take on the issue of more powers for the Assembly. Normally he insists that his party does not believe that the Assembly should receive more powers. However, during his short debate on windfarms on 28 February 2002, he called for

Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n croesawu'r comisiwn hwn, a chredaf ei bod yn adeg briodol inni gryfhau ein sefyllfa. Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yng Nghymru'n credu mewn Prydain ffederal ac ailsefydlu'r Cynulliad yn Senedd Gymreig, gyda'r un pwerau â Senedd yr Alban. Senedd i Gymru yw polisi ein plaid ers dros 100 mlynedd. E. T. John, yr Aelod Seneddol Rhyddfrydol, a gyflwynodd y Mesur ymreolaeth gyntaf i Gymru yn 1914. Yr ydym o blaid Senedd Gymreig a chanddi bwerau i godi trethi, ond dim ond os bydd pobl Cymru'n cefnogi hynny mewn refferendwm.

Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n credu, er gwaethaf haerid Peter Law, y dylai pleidlais pawb gyfrif; nid yn unig pleidleisiau 100,000 o bobl mewn seddau ymylol, fel a ddigwydd yn etholiadau San Steffan. Mae cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol yn decach ac yn fwy cynrychioliadol na system y cyntaf heibio i'r postyn. Dylid ethol 80 o Aelodau drwy'r bleidlais sengl dros glwyddadwy mewn etholaethau aml-Aelod. Byddai hynny'n sicrhau Senedd fwy cynrychioladol, gyda mwy o gydraddoldeb rhwng yr Aelodau, mwy o ddylanwad i'r pleidleiswyr a llai o ddylanwad i'r pleidiau.

Mae meysydd pwysig mewn polisi trafniadaeth nad oes gan y Cynulliad bwerau drostynt. Mae rheilffyrdd, trafniadaeth awyr a bysiau, yn benodol, yn dal i fod o dan reolaeth Llywodraeth San Steffan i raddau helaeth. Mae hynny'n ei gwneud yn fwy anodd cyrraedd y nod bwysig o system drafniadaeth integredig, y mae'n hen bryd ei chael yng Nghymru, er mwyn adfywio cymunedau a helpu i gadarnhau cynhwysiant cymdeithasol.

Os dymunwn sefydlu awdurdod trafniadaeth teithwyr i Gymru, ni allwn fynd ymlaen a gwneud hynny. Os yw pob un ohonom yn pleidleisio o'i blaid, rhaid inni ddisgwyl am ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol yn San Steffan. Mae'n ymddangos bod arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru, Nick Bourne, mewn penbleth ynghylch y cyfeiriad y dylai'i blaid fynd iddo ar y mater o fwy o bwerau i'r Cynulliad. Fel arfer, mae'n mynnu bod ei blaid yn credu na ddylai'r Cynulliad gael rhagor o bwerau. Fodd bynnag, yn ystod ei ddadl fer ar ffermydd gwynt ar 28 Chwefror

the power to decide on planning applications relating to wind farms of 50 kilowatt and above to be transferred to the Assembly. Was this the start of a conversion to believing that the Assembly should have more powers?

David Davies: The Welsh Office had extensive powers over planning, so Nick was not really asking for anything additional. Lloyd George had every opportunity to fulfil that Labour promise, and he turned his back on it, so it has not always been the party's policy.

Eleanor Burnham: The Conservative Party last year issued a leaflet stating that no further powers should be given to the National Assembly for Wales, and demanded that any referendum on giving the Assembly more powers should include the option of getting rid of the Assembly altogether. I rest my case.

Delyth Evans: Croesawaf y ddadl hon, yn ogystal â phenodiad yr Arglwydd Richard. Yr wyf yn falch o'i weld yma heddiw. Y mae'n unigolyn addas dros ben i ymgymryd â'r dasg fawr hon, ac mae pobl Rhydaman yn fy rhanbarth i yn falch ohono.

Mae cyfrifoldeb mawr ar y comisiwn, a gobeithiaf y bydd yn cadw'i ffocws yn glir ar sut y gallwn ymateb yn fwy effeithiol i anghenion pobl Cymru. Ni chytunaf ag arweinydd Plaid Cymru fod gwendidau sylfaenol yn y trefniadau presennol. Os mai'r enghraifft orau sydd ganddo yw'r angen i greu gŵyl banc ar Ddydd Gŵyl Dewi, nid wyf wedi fy argyhoeddi. Ni chredaf ychwaith y dylem ddilyn yn slafaidd y drefn yn yr Alban, gwlad sydd â chefnidir a sefydliadau tra gwahanol inni yng Nghymru. Yr her inni yw datblygu trefn o ran pwerau sy'n briodol i anghenion pobl Cymru yng nghyd-destun ein perthynas ddofn a gwerthfawr â gweddill y Deyrnas Gyfunol.

Cytunaf â Huw Lewis fod llawer mwy y gallwn ei wneud o fewn y pwerau presennol. Dyna'r her fwyaf inni fel Cynulliad, nid creu'r argraff ffug a chwbl gamarweiniol bod modd datrys holl broblemau Cymru drwy newid y setliad. Nid yw hynny'n wir. Rhaid

2002, galwodd am drosglwyddo'r pŵer i benderfynu ar geisiadau cynllunio sy'n ymwneud â ffermydd gwynt o 50 cilowat a mwy i'r Cynulliad. Ai hynny oedd dechrau tröedigaeth at gredu y dylai'r Cynulliad gael rhagor o bwerau?

David Davies: Yr oedd gan y Swyddfa Gymreig bwerau helaeth dros gynllunio, felly nid oedd Nick yn gofyn am ddim byd ychwanegol. Cafodd Lloyd George bob cyfle i wireddu'r addewid hwnnw gan Lafur, ond cefnodd arno, felly nid yw'n bolisi i'r blaidd erioed.

Eleanor Burnham: Y llynedd cyhoeddodd y Blaid Geidwadol daflen a ddywedai na ddylid rhoi unrhyw bwerau pellach i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, a mynnai y dylai unrhyw refferendwm ar roi rhagor o bwerau i'r Cynulliad gynnwys y dewis o gael gwared â'r Cynulliad yn gyfan gwbl. Dyna gloi fy nadl.

Delyth Evans: I welcome this debate, as well as Lord Richard's appointment. I am glad to see him here today. He is an extremely appropriate person to undertake this great task, and the people of Ammanford in my region are proud of him.

The commission has a great responsibility, and I hope that it will focus clearly on how we can respond more effectively to the needs of the people of Wales. I do not agree with the leader of Plaid Cymru that there are fundamental flaws in the present arrangements. If the best example he can give is the need to create a bank holiday on St David's Day, I am not convinced. I do not believe either that we should be slavishly following Scotland, which has a quite different background and institutions to us in Wales. The challenge for us is to develop a power arrangement that is appropriate to the needs of the people of Wales in the context of our strong and valuable relationship with the rest of the United Kingdom.

I agree with Huw Lewis that we can do much more within the present powers. That is the greatest challenge for us as an Assembly, not creating the false and totally misleading impression that it is possible to solve all of Wales's problems by changing the

i'r comisiwn ystyried yr holl feysydd polisi yn eu cyfanrwydd, ac edrychaf ymlaen yn eiddgar at ei gasgliadau. Gwnaf un cais ynglŷn â phenodiadau i'r comisiwn. Gobeithiaf y caiff pwyslais anrhydeddus y Cynulliad ar gyfle cyfartal ei adlewyrchu yn y penodiadau ac y bydd cynrychiolaeth dda o bobl ifanc, ynghyd â grwpiau lleiafrifol, yn y comisiwn.

John Griffiths: I join others in wishing the commission well in its important work for Wales's future. Members have mentioned the history of the Welsh Office and its ongoing and inevitable development. It is the same for the Assembly. The challenge is to ensure that that development is effective and timely. It is clear from our experience thus far—and many Members have pointed to examples during this debate—that there is a need for primary law making powers for the Assembly if we are to properly serve the people of Wales.

Many organisations and people have told me that they are impressed with the Assembly in terms of how it engages with the people of Wales, and have said what a huge improvement there has been compared with the former Welsh Office, which had just a few Ministers. Access to those Ministers was poor. People could not get their points of view across, and consultation and engagement was much weaker than it is now. It is frustrating for people when that process, that engagement, that openness, that transparency, and so on results in a widespread consensus as to the way forward for Wales on a particular matter, only to have that will of the people of Wales frustrated by the Assembly's lack of primary law making powers. That has happened on numerous occasions, and we have heard examples today. Our challenge is to ensure that that does not continue to happen in future. The crowded legislative timetable at Westminster is a problem in that context, of which we are all aware.

11:05 a.m.

I turn briefly to the Assembly's size. From experience it is clear that 60 Members are not

settlement. That is not true. The commission must consider all policy areas as a whole, and I look forward eagerly to its conclusions. I make one request regarding appointments to the commission. I hope that the Assembly's honourable emphasis on equality of opportunity will be reflected in the appointments and that there will be a good representation of young people, as well as minority groups, on the commission.

John Griffiths: Ymunaf ag eraill i ddymuno'n dda i'r comisiwn yn ei waith pwysig er mwyn dyfodol Cymru. Mae rhai Aelodau wedi sôn am hanes y Swyddfa Gymreig a'i datblygiad parhaus ac anorfod. Mae'r un peth yn wir am y Cynulliad. Yr her yw sicrhau bod y datblygiad hwnnw'n effeithiol ac yn amserol. Mae'n amlwg o'n profiad hyd yn hyn—ac mae llawer o'r Aelodau wedi cyfeirio at enghreifftiau yn ystod y ddadl hon—fod angen cael pwerau deddfu sylfaenol i'r Cynulliad os ydym i wasanaethu pobl Cymru'n briodol.

Mae llawer o gyrff a phobl wedi dweud wrthyf fod ganddynt feddwl mawr o'r Cynulliad o ran y modd y mae'n ymwneud â phobl Cymru, ac wedi dweud cymaint o welliant a fu o'i gymharu â'r Swyddfa Gymreig gynt, nad oedd ganddi ond ychydig o Weinidogion. Yr oedd y mynediad at y Gweinidog hynny'n wael. Ni allai pobl gyfleu eu safbwyntiau, ac yr oedd yr ymgynghori a'r cysylltu'n wannach o lawer nag y maent yn awr. Mae'n peri rhwystredigaeth i bobl pan yw'r broses, y cysylltu, y gweithredu agored, y tryloywder, ac yn y blaen yn arwain at gonsensws cyffredinol ynghylch y ffordd ymlaen i Gymru ar fater penodol, dim ond i weld llesteirio ewylllys pobl Cymru gan ddiffyg pwerau deddfu sylfaenol y Cynulliad. Mae hynny wedi digwydd yn aml, a chlywsom enghreifftiau heddiw. Yr her i ni yw sicrhau na fydd hynny'n dal i ddigwydd yn y dyfodol. Mae amserlen ddeddfwriaethol orlawn San Steffan yn broblem yn y cyddestun hwnnw, yr ydym oll yn ymwybodol ohoni.

Trof yn fyr at faint y Cynulliad. O brofiad, mae'n amlwg nad yw 60 o Aelodau'n ddigon

enough to enable proper and effective discharge of our duties and responsibilities. For example, with just 60 Members it is difficult even to adequately fulfil our committee duties and responsibilities.

Cynog Dafis: Hoffwn osod y pwnc mewn cyd-destun ehangach a gofyn a yw'r trefniadau presennol i lywodraethu Cymru ar bob lefel yn briodol ac yn effeithiol. Dylai'r cwestiwn hwnnw gwmpasu llywodraeth leol a holl strwythur y cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad. Mae hynny y tu hwnt i gylch gwaith comisiwn Richard ond bydd angen y drafodaeth ehangach honno rywbryd.

Byddai rhoi hawliau deddfu cyflawn, fel y mae John Griffiths newydd ei ddweud, yn golygu cynyddu maint y Cynulliad, o ran yr Aelodau a'r gwasanaeth sifil. Byddai angen mwy o Aelodau iddynt wneud eu gwaith yn iawn ac fel y byddai dewis digonol i ddethol gweinidogion o'u mysg. Mae'n rhaid i gomisiwn Richard ystyried maint a strwythur y gwasanaeth sifil. Gwiredd yw dweud bod ansawdd llywodraeth gwlad ac felly ansawdd bywydau pobl—a dyna ateb efallai i bwynt Huw Lewis—yn dibynnu ar ansawdd ei gwasanaeth sifil. Dyna'r corff o bobl sydd wedi ymrwymo i wasanaethu'r wlad ym mhob dull. Nid wyf yn amau am funud ymroddiad y gwasanaeth sifil yn y Cynulliad, sydd wedi cyflawni gwrhydri er ei adnoddau annigonol. Mae pob Aelod yn ei ddyled ac mae pobl Cymru yn ei ddyled, yn fwy nag y mae neb yn ei sylweddoli.

Mae'n glir bod bodolaeth y Cynulliad a realiti datganoli yn creu meddylfryd newydd mwy Cymreig, llai trefedigaethol a mwy cenedlaetholgar ymysg gweision sifil. Mae hynny'n iach ond mae eisiau meddwl ymhellach yn fwy radical ac yng nghyd-destun y ffaith mai cenedl yw Cymru ac mai creu dyfodol cenedlaethol yw'r dasg o'n blaenau.

Rhan o'r gwasanaeth sifil cartref yw ein gwasanaeth sifil. Mae hynny'n anochel ac yn angenrheidiol, ond nid yw'n barhaol anochel. Yn naturiol, byddai Plaid Cymru am weld

i'n galluogi i gyflawni ein dyletswyddau a'n cyfrifoldebau'n briodol ac yn effeithiol. Er enghraifft, gyda dim ond 60 Aelod mae'n anodd hyd yn oed gyflawni ein dyletswyddau a'n cyfrifoldebau pwyllgor yn ddigonol.

Cynog Dafis: I wish to place the issue in a wider context and ask whether the current arrangements for the governance of Wales at all levels are appropriate and effective. That question should encompass local government and the entire structure of Assembly sponsored public bodies. That is beyond the remit of the Richard commission but that wider discussion will be needed at some point.

Awarding full legislative powers would entail, as John Griffiths has just said, increasing the size of the Assembly, in terms of Members and the civil service. More Members would be needed for them to carry out their functions properly and so that there would be a sufficient pool from which to select ministers. The Richard commission must examine the size and structure of the civil service. It is a truism to say that the quality of a country's government and therefore the quality of people's lives—which answers Huw Lewis' point perhaps—depends on the quality of its civil service. That is the body of people who are committed to serving the country in every way. I do not doubt for a minute the commitment of the Assembly's civil service, which has distinguished itself despite its insufficient resources. Every Member is indebted to them and the people of Wales are indebted them, to a greater extent than anyone realises.

It is clear that the Assembly's existence and the reality of devolution is creating a new, more Welsh frame of mind among civil servants, which is less colonial and more nationalistic. That is healthy but we need to think further and more radically, in the context of the fact that Wales is a nation and that the task before us is to create a national future.

Our civil service is part of the home civil service. That is inevitable and necessary, but it will not be permanently inevitable. Naturally, Plaid Cymru would want to see a

newid sylfaenol yn hynny. Pa fath o drefniadau fyddai'n briodol? Gwasanaeth cyhoeddus cenedlaethol integredig i wahanol haenau ac elfennau llywodraeth ddylai fod y nod: y Cynulliad, llywodraeth leol, cyrff cyhoeddus ac eraill. Mae secondiadau eisoes yn digwydd rhwng y lefelau hynny, sy'n gychwyn defnyddiol. Byddai'r gwasanaeth cyhoeddus integredig yn golygu: cronfa ehangach o dalent, gallu ac arbenigedd ar gael i wahanol feysydd; creu meddylfryd Cymreig yn y gweision cyhoeddus; cryfhau cyd-ddealltwriaeth rhwng gwahanol haenau llywodraeth; a chreu strwythurau a llwybrau gyrfaol yng Nghymru, sy'n nodwedd bwysig o fywyd cenedlaethol.

Gwenda Thomas: A ydych yn barod yn awr i fod yn agored â phobl Cymru a dweud beth y mae datganoli yn ei olygu i'ch plaid chi? Ai cam nodweddiadol ydyw ar y ffordd at annibyniaeth?

Cynog Dafis: Ie, wrth gwrs. Yr ydym yn rhagweld Cymru ym mhen draw'r daith yn cyrraedd beth yr ydym yn ei alw'n statws cenedlaethol llawn yn Ewrop. Er hynny, mae gennyf ddi-ddordeb mewn llywodraeth dda yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd a dyna pam yr ydym yn cefnogi'n gryf greu senedd yng Nghymru ar batrwm yr Alban. Mater i bobl Cymru wedyn fyddai penderfynu pa mor bell y tu hwnt i hynny y byddent am fynd.

I gloi, ynglŷn â'm syniad o wasanaeth cyhoeddus integredig, fe allaf glywed rhai yn awr yn gwneud y cyhuddiad y byddai hynny'n arwain at feddylfryd ynysig, mewnblyg, ac yn y blaen. I'r gwrthwyneb, nid dyna'r sefyllfa yng ngwasanaethau sifil gwledydd a rhanbarthau cenedlaethol bychain eraill Ewrop. Byddwn am weld systemau o gyfnewidiadau a secondiadau rhwng y gwasanaeth cyhoeddus Cymreig a gwasanaethau cyhoeddus tair cenedl eraill Prydain, a'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd a gwladwriaethau a rhanbarthau eraill Ewrop. Gweledigaeth y tymor hir yw hynny, efallai, ond mae angen meddwl amdani yn awr ac mae angen braenaru'r tir ar ei chyfer. Gwn fod pobl sy'n uchel yn y gwasanaeth sifil hwn yn meddwl ar y trywydd hwn eisoes, sy'n ddefnyddiol.

Gobeithiaf y bydd comisiwn Richard yn

fundamental change to that. What kinds of arrangements would be appropriate? The aim should be an integrated national public service for the different tiers and components of government: the Assembly, local government, public bodies and others. We are already seeing secondments between those tiers, which is a useful start. The integrated public service would mean: a wider pool of talent, ability and expertise being available to different areas; the creation of a Welsh mindset in public servants; a strengthened understanding between different levels of government; and the creation of career structures and paths in Wales, which is an important aspect of national life.

Gwenda Thomas: Are you now prepared to be open with the people of Wales and say what devolution means to your party? Is it a characteristic step on the path to independence?

Cynog Dafis: Yes, of course. We envisage Wales at the end of its journey achieving what we call full national status in Europe. However, I have an interest in the good governance of contemporary Wales and that is why we strongly support the creation of a parliament in Wales on the Scottish model. It would then be a matter for the people of Wales to decide how far they want to go beyond that.

To conclude, concerning my idea of an integrated public service, I can already hear some making the accusation that that would lead to a mindset that would be insular, introverted, and so on. On the contrary, that is not the situation in the civil services of other European small countries and national regions. I would want systems of exchanges and secondments between the Welsh public service and the public services of the three other British nations, the European Commission and the other states and regions of Europe. That may be a long-term vision, but it needs to be considered now and we need to prepare the way for it. I know that there are people high up in this civil service already thinking along those lines, which is helpful.

I hope that the Richard commission will think

meddwl o ddirif mewn termau o'r math.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Gofynnais am amrywiaeth yn ystod y ddadl, er mwyn gallu rhoi canllawiau i gomisiwn yr Arglwydd Richard, a dyna a gefais. Dywedir inni ddechrau'r comisiwn yn rhy gynnar, neu yn rhy hwyr. Dylwn fod wedi symud ymlaen heb y comisiwn, neu ddechrau'r comisiwn yn y misoedd yn syth ar ôl creu'r Cynulliad, dair blynedd yn ôl.

Nid gohirio penderfyniad, fel yr awgrymodd Ieuan Wyn Jones, oedd y syniad y tu ôl i benodi'r comisiwn—nid ydych yn prynu car Rolls Royce er mwyn ei gadw yn y garej. Defnyddiwn y comisiwn i bontio'r misoedd diwethaf gyda thymor cyntaf y Cynulliad, i astudio a dadansoddi'r setliad. Yna, gallwn weld a allwn gael model gwell a mwy effeithiol. Ni allwn wneud hynny cyn gorffen un tymor yn y Cynulliad gyda'r setliad presennol, neu byddai pobl yn meddwl ein bod yn cwyno heb reswm. Rhaid gweld a chlywed tystiolaeth. Rhaid clywed yr un fath o amrywiaeth ond nid gan ddsbarthiadau gwleidyddol fel y soniodd David Davies, mi gredaf, ond oddi wrth bobl gyffredin Cymru. Hwy fydd â'r hawl i roi tystiolaeth gerbron y comisiwn.

The interesting mini spat between Eleanor Burnham and David Davies will be significant for the commission's work. David Davies referred to David Lloyd George's involvement in this issue. If you were to enter the original foyer of Cathays Park and read the two brass plates paying tribute to those who fell in the two world wars, you would learn more about Welsh devolutionary self-government in Britain. The first plaque refers to staff who fell between 1914 and 1918 as the staff of the Welsh Board of the National Insurance Commissioners. In devolving the national insurance in 1911, Lloyd George set Wales down the road of devolution. That was devolution at the time. The second plate refers to the fallen staff of the Welsh Board of Health. Had there been a third world war—and luckily, there has not—that plaque might have referred to the staff of the Welsh Office or even the Assembly. That shows the tangled history of devolutionary self-government, and how we have reached where we are today in Wales.

seriously in such terms.

The First Minister: I asked for variety during the debate, to enable me to give guidance to Lord Richard's commission, and that is what I got. Some say that we have set up the commission too early, and others that it is too late. We should have moved forward without the commission, or should have started it in the months following the Assembly's inception, three years ago.

The idea behind appointing the commission was not to delay a decision, as Ieuan Wyn Jones suggested—you do not buy a Rolls Royce just to keep it in the garage. We will use this commission to bridge the past months with the Assembly's first term, to study and analyse the settlement. Then, we can see whether we could have an improved, more effective model. We cannot do that before concluding one Assembly term under the current settlement, or people would think that we were complaining without reason. Evidence must be seen and heard. The same kind of variety must be heard, but not from the political classes as I think David Davies mentioned, but from the general public of Wales. It is they who will have the right to give evidence to the commission.

Bydd y ffræ fach ddiddorol rhwng Eleanor Burnham a David Davies yn berthnasol i waith y comisiwn. Cyfeiriodd David Davies at ran David Lloyd George yn y mater hwn. Pe byddech yn mynd i'r cyntedd gwreiddiol ym Mharc Cathays ac yn darllen y ddau blât pres sy'n talu teyrnged i'r rhai a fu farw yn y ddau ryfel byd, fe ddysgech ragor am hunanlywodraeth ddatganoliadol Gymreig ym Mhrydain. Mae'r plac cyntaf yn cyfeirio at y staff a fu farw rhwng 1914 a 1918 fel staff Bwrdd Cymreig y Comisiynwyr Yswiriant Gwladol. Wrth ddatganoli yswiriant gwladol yn 1911, gwnaeth Lloyd George roi Cymru ar ben ffordd datganoli. Datganoli oedd hynny ar y pryd. Mae'r ail blât yn cyfeirio at staff Bwrdd Iechyd Cymru a fu farw. Pe buasai trydydd rhyfel byd—ac yn ffodus, ni fu un—gallai'r plac hwnnw fod wedi cyfeirio at staff y Swyddfa Gymreig neu hyd yn oed y Cynulliad. Mae hynny'n dangos hanes cymhleth hunanlywodraeth ddatganoliadol, a sut yr ydym wedi cyrraedd y fan yr ydym heddiw yng Nghymru.

David Davies: That sounds interesting and I will read those plaques. My point is that Lloyd George originally supported home rule for Wales, but then went back on it. That is where my 'mini spat' came in. The Liberal Democrats have not always supported home rule; when they were presented with an opportunity to implement it, they refused to do so.

The First Minister: The definition of 'home rule'—whether devolutionary self-government or independence—arose several times during the debate in another spat, between Gwenda Thomas and Cynog Dafis, which I also thought was illustrative for the Richard commission. Nationalism in a devolutionary context can cause problems. Plaid Cymru frequently tells the people of Wales that it would have been better if we had had the same settlement as Scotland. However, their colleagues in Scotland, the Scottish National Party, manifest the same dissatisfaction with the Scottish settlement. To them, it is not the real thing, in the same way as our settlement is not the real thing to Plaid Cymru.

I compliment Janet Davies on her contribution, which she set in a European context. That is why the timing of the Richard commission is so significant in a European context. A major revision of European treaties will take place at an inter-governmental conference in early 2004. The Laeken convention has been set up to cover the next 12 months, and the double subsidiarity question will be considered. What should Europe, member states and regional tier governments be doing? That was Tony Blair and Gerhard Schröder's deal at the Nice summit late in 2001. That is why the Laeken convention is in full swing now, and is why any recommendations by the Richard commission would be relevant to the conclusions of the inter-governmental conference in the first quarter of 2004.

11:15 a.m.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: You have gone off on a philosophical tangent about the nature of devolution, nationalism, identity, and what certain words mean to people. Although you

David Davies: Mae hynny'n swnio'n ddi-ddorol ac fe ddarllenaf y placiau hynny. Fy mhwynt i yw bod Lloyd George wedi cefnogi ymreolaeth i Gymru'n wreiddiol, ond wedi gwrthgilio wedyn. Dyna oedd pwnc fy 'ffrae fach'. Nid yw'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn cefnogi ymreolaeth erioed; pan gawsant gyfle i'w gweithredu, gwnaethant wrthod gwneud hynny.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Cododd y diffiniad o 'ymreolaeth'—boed yn hunanlywodraeth ddatganoliadol neu'n annibyniaeth—sawll gwaith yn ystod y ddatl mewn ffrae fach arall, rhwng Gwenda Thomas a Cynog Dafis, y credais ei bod yn un enghreifftiol i gomisiwn Richard. Mae cenedlaetholdeb yng nghyd-destun datganoli'n gallu peri problemau. Mae Plaid Cymru'n dweud yn aml wrth bobl Cymru y buasai'n well pe byddem wedi cael yr un setliad â'r Alban. Fodd bynnag, mae eu cymheiriaid yn yr Alban, Plaid Genedlaethol yr Alban, yn amlygu'r un anafodlonrwydd ar setliad yr Alban. Iddynt hwy, nid hwnnw yw'r peth go iawn, ac yn yr un modd nid ein setliad ni yw'r peth go iawn i Plaid Cymru.

Canmolaf Janet Davies ar ei chyfraniad, a roddodd mewn cyd-destun Ewropeaidd. Dyna pam y mae amseriad comisiwn Richard mor arwyddocaol mewn cyd-destun Ewropeaidd. Bydd y cytundebau Ewropeaidd yn cael eu diwygio'n helaeth mewn cynhadledd rynglywodraethol ddechrau 2004. Sefydlwyd cynhadledd Laeken ar gyfer y 12 mis nesaf, ac ystyrir pwnc is-reolaeth ddwbl. Beth y dylai Ewrop, yr aelod wladwriaethau a llywodraethau'r haen ranbarthol fod yn ei wneud? Dyna oedd y fargen rhwng Tony Blair a Gerhard Schröder yn uwch-gynhadledd Nice ar ddiwedd 2001. Dyna pam y mae cynhadledd Laeken ar ei hanterth yn awr, a dyna pam y byddai unrhyw argymhellion gan gomisiwn Richard yn berthnasol i gasgliadau'r gynhadledd rynglywodraethol yn chwarter cyntaf 2004.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Yr ydych wedi crwydro i gyfeiriad athronyddol i sôn am natur datganoli, cenedlaetholdeb, hunaniaeth, a'r hyn y mae rhai geiriau'n ei olygu i bobl. Er

have commented on the Conservatives' viewpoint, and we know that Plaid Cymru wants to move to a Scottish model quickly, and that the Liberal Democrats support this, we have not yet heard your view. Will you tell us what you think should happen?

The First Minister: I referred to my personal view in my opening speech. It differs from the standpoint in our manifesto, and I did not want to press my view as First Minister, as I have plenty of opportunity at other times to do so. However, I want the commission to begin its work having heard the diversity of opinions, and I pay tribute to all of those who contributed to the debate.

Cododd Delyth Evans bwynt pwysig ynglŷn â natur cymdeithas sifil Cymru. Mae'n wahanol i'r hyn sydd yn yr Alban. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn penodi pobl i'r comisiwn sydd yn cynrychioli gwahanol hiliau ac ardaloedd Cymru.

We will also try to get a blend of political appointees, experts and citizenry, who will be appointed under the Nolan-Neill principles, to ensure that they represent all strands, areas and generations in Wales.

John Griffiths made an important point about the size of the Assembly's membership. I do not agree with Alun Pugh's point, although it was important and illustrative. The English Government tagged onto the Welsh Bill, not the other way around. It used our model, and that shows you that it can work both ways. The Richard commission will examine what lessons can be learnt from that, and whether or not we are frustrated in getting Measures through Parliament. Every Government suffers frustration, including the Westminster Government, and the President of the United States of America. The commission must consider whether or not these are unusual frustrations that can be eradicated by revising or changing the powers.

I urge Members again to vote against the amendments and thank everybody who contributed to this first class debate.

eich bod wedi gwneud sylw am safbwynt y Ceidwadwyr, a gwyddom fod Plaid Cymru am symud yn gyflym at fodel yr Alban, a bod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn cefnogi hyn, nid ydym wedi clywed eich barn chi eto. A wnewch chi ddweud wrthym beth y credwch a ddylai ddigwydd?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Cyfeiriais at fy marn bersonol yn fy araith agoriadol. Mae'n wahanol i'r safbwynt yn ein manifest, ac nid oeddwn am wthio fy marn i fel Prif Weinidog Cymru, gan fy mod yn cael digon o gyfle i wneud hynny ar adegau eraill. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf am i'r comisiwn ddechrau ar ei waith wedi clywed yr amrywiaeth o farnau, a thalaf deyrnged i bawb a gyfrannodd i'r ddadl.

Delyth Evans raised an important issue about the nature of civil society in Wales. It is different to that of Scotland. It is important that we appoint people to the commission that represent the different races and regions of Wales.

Byddwn hefyd yn ceisio sicrhau cymysgedd o benodiadau gwleidyddol, ynghyd â phenodi arbenigwyr a dinasyddion, yn unol ag egwyddorion Nolan-Neill, i sicrhau eu bod yn cynrychioli pob elfen, ardal a chenhedlaeth yng Nghymru.

Gwnaeth John Griffiths bwynt pwysig am faint aelodaeth y Cynulliad. Nid wyf yn cytuno â phwynt Alun Pugh, er ei fod yn bwysig ac yn eglurhaol. Llywodraeth Lloegr a ymgysylltodd wrth Fesur Cymru, nid fel arall. Defnyddiodd ein model ni, ac mae hynny'n dangos ichi y gall weithio'r ddwy ffordd. Bydd comisiwn Richard yn ystyried pa wersi y gellir eu dysgu o hynny, ac a ydym yn cael ein llesteirio neu beidio wrth fynd â Mesurau drwy'r Senedd. Mae pob Llywodraeth yn profi rhwystredigaeth, gan gynnwys Llywodraeth San Steffan, ac Arlywydd Unol Daleithiau America. Rhaid i'r comisiwn ystyried a ydynt yn rhwystrau anarferol y gellir eu dileu drwy adolygu neu newid y pwerau.

Pwysaf eto ar yr Aelodau i beidio â chefnogi'r gwelliannau a diolchaf i bawb a gyfrannodd i'r ddadl ragorol hon.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 7, Ymatal 12, Yn erbyn 26.
Amendment 1: For 7, Abstain 12, Against 26.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Graham, William
Melding, David
Morgan, Johnathan
Rogers, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davies, Andrew
Davidson, Jane
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Law, Peter
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Essex, Sue
Randerson, Jenny
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Cynog, Dafis
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 7, Ymatal 12, Yn erbyn 25.
Amendment 2: For 7, Abstain 12, Against 25.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Graham, William
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane

Davies, Andrew
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 7, Ymatal 12, Yn erbyn 25.
Amendment 3: For 7, Abstain 12, Against 25.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Graham, William
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Morgan, Rhodri

Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 26, Ymatal 12, Yn erbyn 7.
Motion: For 26, Abstain 12, Against 7.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Halford, Alison
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Graham, William
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline

Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

**Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru)
Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru)**

**Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol
Specialised Health Services**

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Carwyn Jones and amendment 2 in the name of Jonathan Morgan.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Carwyn Jones a gwelliant 2 yn enw Jonathan Morgan.

Brian Gibbons: Point of order.

Brian Gibbons: Pwynt o drefn.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I will not take a point of order now; we have started the debate.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Ni wnaif gymryd pwynt o drefn yn awr; yr ydym wedi dechrau'r ddadl.

Brian Gibbons: Point of order.

Brian Gibbons: Pwynt o drefn.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Only one person should be standing at any one time. Resume your seat, Brian.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Dim ond un a ddylai fod ar ei draed ar y tro. Ailgymerwch eich sedd, Brian.

David Lloyd: Cynigiaf fod

David Lloyd: I propose that

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

the National Assembly:

1. yn ailddatgan ei ymrwymiad i gefnogi gwasanaethau iechyd arbenigol i blant yng Nghymru, a ddylai fod ar gael drwy Gymru gyfan ac a ddylai adlewyrchu anghenion y claf;

1. reaffirms its commitment towards supporting specialised health services for children in Wales, which should be accessible throughout Wales and reflect the need of the patient;

2. yn condemnio'r argymhelliad yn adroddiad Comisiwn Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru i symud llawdriniaeth nerfol pediatrig o Abertawe i Gaerdydd;

2. condemns the recommendation contained in the Specialised Health Services Commission for Wales's report to move paediatric neurosurgery from Swansea to Cardiff;

3. yn cefnogi'r gwaith o ehangu a datblygu canolfannau rhagoriaeth a sefydliadau hyfforddi a fydd yn atgyfnerthu ysgolion meddygol clinigol yng Nghymru. (NDM1083)

3. supports the expansion and continual development of centres of excellence and training establishments that will consolidate clinical medical schools in Wales. (NDM1083)

Datganaf fuddiant fel meddyg teulu. Mae'r ddadl hon yn lwyfan ar gyfer trafod mynediad at driniaethau i bobl Cymru, nid yn unig o ran gwasanaethau arbenigol i blant ond hefyd o ran gwasanaethau cynradd, eilradd a thrydyddol ar gyfer pawb yng Nghymru. Mae deddf gofal gwrthgyfartal Dr Julian Tudor-Hart yn fyw ac iach—y sawl sydd fwyaf angen triniaeth yw'r lleiaf tebygol o'i dderbyn. Clywsom gan gynrychiolydd grŵp iechyd lleol Ynys Môn mewn cyfarfod yn y Cynulliad ddydd Iau diwethaf fod trigolion yr ynys, lle mae cyfraddau uchel o glefyd y galon, yn gorfod mynd i Fanceinion am driniaeth. Yr ydym wedi clywed am nifer o esiamplau tebyg dros y misoedd diwethaf. Mae angen cydbwysedd rhwng arbenigedd a mynediad i driniaethau yn lleol. Yn gefndir i hyn, ein hystadegau iechyd yw'r gwaethaf ym Mhrydain ac maent ymhlith y gwaethaf yn Ewrop. Yn amlwg—

Gwenda Thomas: A ydych wedi newid eich barn ar y mater hwn yn ystod yr ymgyrch hon?

David Lloyd: Nac ydwyf, ac fe esboniaf hynny maes o law.

Mae'r ddarpariaeth o wasanaethau yn siomi pobl Cymru. Nid yw parhau i gynnig gwasanaethau sydd yn methu, neu ffosileiddio darpariaeth, yn ddigon da pan fo gennym yr ystadegau iechyd gwaethaf. Mae'r ffaith bod iechyd yn fater datganoledig yn rhoi'r cyfle i ni ystyried o'r newydd sut y gallwn ddarparu gwasanaethau gyda'r dewrder a'r weledigaeth sy'n angenrheidiol i fynnu y caiff arbenigedd ei ddatblygu yng Nghymru. Gallwn drin pobl o Loegr, os bydd angen, er mwyn cyrraedd y más critigol ar gyfer darparu triniaeth, ond lleoli'r canolfannau yng Nghymru. Yng Nghymru y mae'r salwch; mae 11 y cant yn fwy o blant sâl yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr. Hefyd, mae'r tlodi sydd yn bodoli yng Nghymru yn golygu na all pobl fforddio teithio'n bell i gael eu trin.

My postbag and surgeries have been dominated in recent weeks by one subject, namely the Specialised Health Service Commission for Wales's report on the future of specialised children's services in Wales, and its proposal to move paediatric

I declare an interest as a general practitioner. This debate is a platform to discuss access to treatment for the people of Wales, not only in terms of specialised services for children but also in terms of primary, secondary and tertiary services for everyone in Wales. Dr Julian Tudor-Hart's inverse care law is alive and well—those who need treatment the most are the least likely to receive it. A representative from the Anglesey local health group told us in an Assembly meeting last Thursday that the residents of the island, where there are high rates of heart disease, have to go to Manchester for treatment. We have heard of many similar examples over the last few months. We need a balance between expertise and access to local treatment. As a backdrop to this, our health statistics are the worst in Britain and among the worst in Europe. Obviously—

Gwenda Thomas: Have you changed your opinion on this subject during this campaign?

David Lloyd: No, I have not and I will explain that later.

The provision of services is failing the people of Wales. Continuing to provide services which have failed, or fossilising provision, is not good enough when we have the worst health statistics. The fact that health is a devolved matter gives us the opportunity to consider anew how we can provide services with the courage and the vision to insist that expertise be developed in Wales. If needs be, we could treat people from England in order to reach the critical mass needed to provide treatment, but have the centres in Wales. Wales is where the ill health exists; we have 11 per cent more sick children in Wales than England does. Also, the poverty that exists in Wales means that people cannot afford to travel far for treatment.

Bu un pwnc yn flaenaf yn fy mag post a'm cyngorfeydd yn yr wythnosau diwethaf hyn, sef adroddiad Comisiwn Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru ar ddyfodol gwasanaethau plant arbenigol yng Nghymru, a'i gynnig i symud y ddarpariaeth o

neurosurgery provision from Swansea to Cardiff. That has provoked anger and outrage among clinicians, families, patients and the public in Swansea, Neath and the whole of south-west Wales and Pembrokeshire. As a GP in Swansea, I can testify that Swansea provides excellent paediatric services. The proposal to move paediatric neurosurgery will affect how head injuries sustained in road traffic accidents and so on, are treated.

Peter Law: Dai, I am always impressed with your contributions from a professional point of view, but I am a little confused. Have you not supported developing a children's hospital for Wales in Cardiff in the past?

David Lloyd: Indeed. We need a children's hospital for Wales in Cardiff. That is a separate issue to developing regional centres of excellence throughout Wales. We already have a world-class centre in Cardiff; we also want regional centres of excellence in Swansea and the North.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Will you confirm that, during discussions with you, the staff of the excellent paediatric unit in Swansea did not say that there should not be a world-class facility in Cardiff, and that it should not be a matter of 'either/or' and that we need facilities in Cardiff and in Swansea?

David Lloyd: Indeed. That is the case.

Time is of the essence when head injuries are sustained in road traffic accidents. A paediatric neurosurgery report maintains that the maximum time that should be taken to reach a regional paediatric neurosurgery unit for treatment is two hours. Swansea is central to most of mid, west and south-west Wales in terms of providing access to treatment within two hours, as Cardiff can never be. The Swansea paediatric neurosurgery unit treats 350 children annually; twice the number treated in the unit in Cardiff. The report notes that the paediatric cardiology and paediatric nephrology departments have already been transferred from Cardiff to Bristol.

lawfeddygaeth niwrolegol bediatrig o Abertawe i Gaerdydd. Mae hynny wedi ennyn dicter a digofaint ymysg clinigwyr, teuluoedd, cleifion a'r cyhoedd yn Abertawe, Castell-nedd a'r cyfan o'r De-orllewin a sir Benfro. Fel meddyg teulu yn Abertawe, gallaf dystio bod Abertawe'n darparu gwasanaethau pediatrig rhagorol. Bydd y cynnig i symud llawfeddygaeth niwrolegol bediatrig yn effeithio ar y dull o drin anafiadau i'r pen a geir mewn damweiniau traffig ffyrdd ac yn y blaen.

Peter Law: Dai, yr wyf bob amser yn edmygu'ch cyfraniadau o safbwynt proffesiynol, ond yr wyf mewn penbleth braidd. Onid ydych wedi cefnogi datblygu ysbyty plant i Gymru yng Nghaerdydd yn y gorffennol?

David Lloyd: Yn wir. Mae arnom angen ysbyty plant i Gymru yng Nghaerdydd. Mae hynny'n fater gwahanol i ddatblygu canolfannau rhagoriaeth rhanbarthol ledled Cymru. Mae gennym ganolfan o'r safon orau yng Nghaerdydd eisoes; mae arnom angen canolfannau rhagoriaeth rhanbarthol yn Abertawe a'r Gogledd hefyd.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: A wnewch gadarnhau nad oedd staff yr uned bediatreg ragorol yn Abertawe, yn ystod eu trafodaethau gyda chi, wedi dweud na ddylid cael cyfleuster o'r safon orau yng Nghaerdydd ac na ddylai fod yn fater o'r naill neu'r llall, a bod arnom angen cyfleusterau yng Nghaerdydd ac yn Abertawe?

David Lloyd: Yn wir. Felly yr oedd.

Mae amser yn hanfodol pan geir anafiadau i'r pen mewn damweiniau traffig ffyrdd. Mae un adroddiad ar lawfeddygaeth niwrolegol bediatrig yn mynnu mai'r amser mwyaf y dylid ei gymryd i gyrraedd uned llawfeddygaeth niwrolegol bediatrig ranbarthol i gael triniaeth yw dwy awr. Mae Abertawe'n lle canolog i'r rhan fwyaf o'r Canolbarth, y Gorllewin a'r De-orllewin o ran darparu mynediad i driniaeth o fewn dwy awr, ac ni all Caerdydd byth fod felly. Mae uned llawfeddygaeth niwrolegol bediatrig Abertawe'n trin 350 o blant bob blwyddyn; dwywaith y nifer a gaiff ei thrin yn yr uned yng Nghaerdydd. Mae'r adroddiad yn nodi

bod yr adrannau cardioleg bediatrig a neffroleg bediatrig eisoes wedi'u trosglwyddo o Gaerdydd i Fryste.

11:25 a.m.

Morrison Hospital in Swansea has a helicopter pad; the University Hospital of Wales does not. Morrison already provides a specialised tertiary service in its burns and plastic surgery unit, which will remain there. That unit was based in Morrison because of the hospital's central location. The air ambulance for Wales is based in Swansea, again because of its central location, as is its helipad. We should also remember the huge cost for patients and their families should they have to travel to treatment a long distance away from areas such as Pembrokeshire.

Despite all this, the Specialised Health Services Commission for Wales's report presents no options, but firm recommendations. It was originally only for consultation within the five health authorities and it hardly mentions the reality of devolution or the development of clinical medical schools in Swansea, the North and elsewhere in Wales. Swansea has a clinical medical school, and if you start to take away specialised services, our proud new clinical schools will be undermined and begin to stagnate. People want our excellent paediatric services and want the present regional tertiary services to develop. That would cement our fledging clinical schools and enable them to flower and grow. Given that we have some of the worst morbidity statistics in Europe, services need to be developed, not dismantled.

In conclusion, the issue is how we provide a balance between excellence and specialism and local access to treatment over large rural areas. One way to do that is to use a city such as Swansea to service its large rural hinterland. Swansea fringes the large rural area of mid, west and south-west Wales. In addition, the paediatric neurosurgery unit in Cardiff sounds close, geographically, to a paediatric neurosurgery unit in Bristol.

Ceir glanfa hofrenyddion yn Ysbyty Treforys yn Abertawe, ond nid yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru. Mae Treforys eisoes yn darparu gwasanaeth trydyddol arbenigol yn ei uned llosgiadau a llawfeddygaeth blastig, a fydd yn aros yno. Sefydlwyd yr uned honno yn Nhreforys am fod yr ysbyty mewn lle canolog. Mae ambiwlans awyr Cymru â'i ganolfan a'i lanfa yn Abertawe, a hynny eto oherwydd ei lleoliad canolog. Dylem hefyd gofio'r gost aruthrol i gleifion a'u teuluoedd os ydynt yn gorfod teithio'n bell i gael triniaeth o ardaloedd fel sir Benfro.

Er gwaethaf hyn oll, nid yw adroddiad Comisiwn Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru'n cynnig dim dewisiadau, dim ond argymhellion pendant. Yn wreiddiol, nid oedd ond ar gyfer ymgynghori o fewn y pum awdurdod iechyd a phrin yw'r sôn ynddo am realiti datganoli neu ddatblygu ysgolion meddygol clinigol yn Abertawe, y Gogledd a manau eraill yng Nghymru. Mae gan Abertawe ysgol feddygol glinigol, ac os dechreuwch fynd â gwasanaethau arbenigol oddi yno, caiff ein hysgolion clinigol newydd gwych eu tanseilio a byddant yn dechrau marweiddio. Mae pobl am weld ein gwasanaethau pediatrig rhagorol a'r gwasanaethau trydyddol rhanbarthol presennol yn datblygu. Byddai hynny'n cryfhau ein hegin-ysgolion clinigol ac yn eu galluogi i flodeuo a thyfu. O ystyried mai gennym ni y mae rhai o'r ystadegau afiachusrwydd gwaethaf yn Ewrop, mae angen datblygu gwasanaethau, nid eu datgymalu.

I derfynu, y pwnc dan sylw yw sut yr ydym yn darparu cydbwysedd rhwng rhagoriaeth ac arbenigaeth gyda mynediad lleol i driniaeth ar draws ardaloedd gwledig eang. Un dull o wneud hynny yw defnyddio dinas fel Abertawe i wasanaethu ei chefnwlad wledig fawr. Mae Abertawe ar gyrion ardal wledig fawr y Canolbarth, y Gorllewin a'r De-orllewin. Yn ogystal â hynny, mae'r uned llawfeddygaeth niwrolegol bediatrig yng

Nghaerdydd yn swnio'n agos, yn ddaearyddol, i'r uned llawfeddygaeth niwrolegol bediatrig ym Mryste.

As I said to Peter Law, Cardiff is already developing into a world-class centre for many specialities. The children's hospital, when it comes on-stream, will further boost that, and research and development budgets will increase dramatically. There are exciting opportunities for Cardiff.

Fel y dywedais wrth Peter Law, mae Caerdydd eisoes yn datblygu'n ganolfan o'r safon orau i lawer o arbenigaethau. Bydd yr ysbyty plant, ar ôl dechrau ar ei waith, yn hwb pellach i hynny, a bydd cynnydd sylweddol yn y cyllidebau ymchwil a datblygu. Mae cyfleoedd cyffrous i Gaerdydd.

It behoves Swansea and north Wales to also develop high-class regional centres of excellence otherwise we will have just one world-class centre in Wales, which will be in Cardiff, and rudimentary and elementary care across the rest of Wales. Justice for patients, access to treatment, and a level playing field for the funding of specialised services throughout Wales, demands that centres of excellence be retained and developed in Swansea and the North.

Dylai Abertawe a'r Gogledd ddatblygu canolfannau rhagoriaeth rhanbarthol o safon dda hefyd, neu fel arall ni fydd gennym ond un ganolfan o'r safon orau yng Nghymru, wedi'i leoli yng Nghaerdydd, a gofal anghyflawn ac elfennol yng ngweddill Cymru. Er mwyn diogelu cyfiawnder i gleifion, mynediad i driniaeth, a chwarae teg i ariannu gwasanaethau arbenigol ledled Cymru, rhaid cadw a datblygu canolfannau rhagoriaeth yn Abertawe a'r Gogledd.

Cefnogwch y cynnig.

Support the motion.

Brian Gibbons: Point of order. I raise this under Standing Order No. 7. I seek your guidance, Deputy Presiding Officer, on the order in which you will be asking people to contribute to this debate. I submitted my name to this debate on Tuesday morning—

Brian Gibbons: Pwynt o drefn. Codaf hyn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 7. Ceisiaf eich cyfarwyddyd, Ddirprwy Lywydd, ar y drefn y byddwch yn galw ar bobl i gyfrannu i'r ddadl hon. Cyflwynias fy enw ar gyfer y ddadl hon fore Mawrth—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Whom I choose to call is a matter for me as the debate develops. I can give no further guidance except that you will have to wait and see. I remind you that Deputy Ministers will not be called to speak on subjects within their responsibility unless they are speaking in Executive time. Subject to that, who is called depends on the Chair—*[Interruption.]* Order. There can be nothing further to that point of order. *[Interruption.]* Order. You are trying my patience, Brian. Please sit down. *[Interruption.]* It is disgraceful that a Deputy Minister should say that the Chair is out of order. I will not have it. If you do not stop shouting and sit down, Brian, a motion will be proposed to exclude you. This is disgraceful behaviour.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mater i mi yw pwy y galwaf arno wrth i'r ddadl ddatblygu. Ni allaf roi unrhyw gyfarwyddyd pellach ac eithrio y bydd yn rhaid ichi ddisgwyl i weld. Yr wyf yn eich atgoffa na elwir ar Ddirprwy Weinidogion i siarad ar bynciau y maent yn gyfrifol amdanynt oni bai eu bod yn siarad yn amser y Weithrediaeth. Yn amodol ar hynny, y Cadeirydd fydd yn penderfynu ar y rhai y gelwir arnynt—*[Torri ar draws.]* Trefn. Nid oes dim mwy i'w ddweud ar y pwynt o drefn hwnnw. *[Torri ar draws.]* Trefn. Yr ydych yn trethu fy amynedd, Brian. Eisteddwch, os gwelwch yn dda. *[Torri ar draws.]* Mae'n warthus bod Dirprwy Weinidog yn dweud bod y Cadeirydd allan o drefn. Ni wnaif oddef hynny. Os na pheidiwch â gweiddi ac eistedd, Brian, cynigir cynnig i'ch cau allan. Mae hyn yn ymddygiad gwarthus.

The Minister for Health and Social Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau

Services (Jane Hutt): I propose amendment 1 in the name of Carwyn Jones. Delete points 2 and 3 and replace with new points 2 and 3:

2. notes that the recommendations contained in the Specialised Health Service Commission for Wales's report on specialist services for children in relation to paediatric neurosurgery will be subject to full public consultation between July and September this year;

3. supports the expansion of medical education and training as set out in 'Improving Health in Wales'.

David Melding: I propose amendment 2 in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Add a new point:

4. believes that major planned changes to NHS services should be adjudicated by an independent body or commission.

It is difficult for us to engage with this subject at present because consultation on the report has only just begun and the Health and Social Services Committee will be considering it in the autumn. It may be possible for us to have a fuller debate on the technicalities of the recommendations then. I thank Plaid Cymru for raising this matter this morning. There is an issue about how we engage in public consultation and how we commission various authorities, which are answerable to us, to plan structural changes to the NHS. The purpose of amendment 2 is to consider how to get independent advice on what a direct agency of the Assembly, or the Assembly itself, recommends.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Your comments are important. If a consultation process is based on a report that is fundamentally flawed and argues a case, rather than sets out the context for the debate that should take place during the consultation, then the consultation process itself is flawed as a result. Do you agree?

David Melding: Public consultation should involve the public, patients and organisations,

Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Cynigiau welliant 1 yn enw Carwyn Jones. Dileu pwyntiau 2 a 3 a rhoi y canlynol yn eu lle:

2. yn nodi y bydd ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus llawn ar yr argymhellion yn adroddiad Comisiwn Gwasanaeth Iechyd Arbenigol i Gymru ar wasanaethau arbenigol i blant mewn perthynas â llawdriniaeth nerfol pediatrig rhwng Gorffennaf a Medi eleni;

3. yn cefnogi'r gwaith o ehangu addysg a hyfforddiant meddygol fel y nodir yn 'Gwella Iechyd yng Nghymru'.

David Melding: Cynigiau welliant 2 yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd:

4. yn credu y dylai newidiadau mawr a gynllunnir i wasanaethau'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol gael eu barnu gan gorff neu gomisiwn annibynnol.

Mae'n anodd inni ymhel â'r pwnc hwn ar hyn o bryd gan mai newydd ddechrau y mae'r ymgynghori ar yr adroddiad a bydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn ei ystyried yn yr hydref. Gallai fod yn bosibl inni gael dadl lawnach ar fanylion technegol yr argymhellion bryd hynny. Diolchaf i Blaid Cymru am godi'r mater hwn y bore . Mae mater yn codi ynghylch sut yr ydym yn ymwneud ag ymgynghori cyhoeddus a sut yr ydym yn comisiynu gwahanol awdurdodau, sy'n atebol i ni, i gynllunio newidiadau yn strwythur y GIG. Pwrpas gwelliant 2 yw ystyried sut i gael cyngor annibynnol ar yr hyn y mae asiantaeth uniongyrchol i'r Cynulliad, neu'r Cynulliad ei hun, yn ei argymhell.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Mae'ch sylwadau'n bwysig. Os yw proses ymgynghori'n seiliedig ar adroddiad sydd â diffyg sylfaenol ac sy'n dadlau achos, yn hytrach na chyflwyno'r cyd-destun i'r ddadl a ddylai ddigwydd yn ystod yr ymgynghori, yna mae'r broses ymgynghori ei hun yn ddiffygiol o ganlyniad. A ydych yn cytuno?

David Melding: Dylai ymgynghori cyhoeddus gynnwys y cyhoedd, cleifion a

such as community health councils, early on in the process. The best way to do that would have been to have produced an initial paper suggesting that certain issues and challenges needed to be examined and that responses to them needed to be developed, and then to have invited discussion, rather than drawing conclusions before consultation. In the Specialised Health Services Commission for Wales's report, we have the old, brutal bureaucratic system of publish and consult, with the 'consult' part of that equation being limited. That is the weakness.

We must realise that, over the next few years, we will face many difficult issues regarding how services are structured. It is not only about tertiary services relating to particular children's services. Other tertiary, and many secondary services, are now becoming highly specialised. They must be examined regionally rather than through the traditional district general hospital model. If we are not engaging effectively with people, we will not take anyone with us when we need to make those structural changes. I am not referring to this particular matter; I will reserve judgment on that.

Janet Ryder: Do you not agree that we need to consider the needs of the whole of Wales, and in particular the needs of north Wales? There are many regions where centres of excellence do not exist. People must travel to Liverpool or, with osteoporosis cases, to Gobowen. That can be a painful journey, especially if you live on the tip of the Llŷn peninsula. Do you agree that we should consider developing centres that treat painful conditions close to where the patient lives?

David Melding: I have always believed that ease of access to specialised services cannot be ignored. We are not just dealing with abstract mathematical equations. It is important that a child from Haverfordwest, for example, who has been knocked over and is suffering from a head injury can access a specialist service quickly. That seems to be at the heart of the Plaid Cymru argument, and I sympathise with it. Such issues must be completely resolved before you can move on to specific recommendations.

chyrrff a mudiadau, fel y cynghorau iechyd cymunedol, yn gynnar yn y broses. Y dull gorau o wneud hynny fuasai cynhyrchu papur dechreuol a awgrymai fod angen ystyried rhai materion a heriau a bod angen datblygu ymatebion iddynt, ac wedyn gwahodd trafodaeth, yn hytrach na thynnu casgliadau cyn yr ymgynghori. Yn adroddiad Comisiwn Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru, mae gennym yr hen system fiwrocraidaidd greulon o gyhoeddi ac ymgynghori, a'r rhan 'ymgynghori' o'r hafaliad hwnnw'n gyfyngedig. Dyna'r gwendid.

Rhaid inni sylweddoli y byddwn yn wynebu llawer o faterion anodd, dros y blynyddoedd nesaf hyn, o ran y dull o strwythuro gwasanaethau. Mae a wnelo hyn â mwy na gwasanaethau trydyddol sy'n gysylltiedig â gwasanaethau plant penodol. Mae gwasanaethau trydyddol eraill, a llawer o rai eilaidd, yn mynd yn dra arbenigol yn awr. Rhaid eu hystyried yn rhanbarthol yn hytrach na thrwy'r model ysbyty dosbarth cyffredinol traddodiadol. Os nad ydym yn ymwneud yn effeithiol â phobl, ni fyddwn yn argyhoeddi neb pan fydd angen inni wneud y newidiadau strwythurol hynny. Nid wyf yn cyfeirio at y mater penodol hwn; gohiriaf y ddedfryd ar hynny.

Janet Ryder: Onid ydych yn cytuno bod angen inni ystyried anghenion Cymru gyfan, ac yn enwedig anghenion y Gogledd? Mae llawer o ranbarthau lle nad oes canolfannau rhagoriaeth. Rhaid i bobl deithio i Lerpwl neu, mewn achosion o osteoporosis, i Gobowen. Gall hynny fod yn daith boenus, yn enwedig os ydych yn byw ym mhen draw Llŷn. A gytunwch y dylem ystyried datblygu canolfannau sy'n trin anhwylderau poenus yn agos i gartref y claf?

David Melding: Yr wyf yn credu erioed na ellir anwybyddu pa mor hwylus yw mynediad i wasanaethau arbenigol. Nid ydym yn ymdrin â rhyw hafaliadau mathemategol haniaethol. Mae'n bwysig bod plentyn o Hwlfordd, er enghraifft, sydd wedi'i fwrw i lawr ac sy'n dioddef gan anaf i'w ben yn gallu cael gwasanaeth arbenigol yn gyflym. Mae'n ymddangos mai hynny sydd wrth wraidd dadl Plaid Cymru, ac yr wyf yn cydymdeimlo ag ef. Rhaid datrys materion o'r fath yn llwyr cyn y gallwch symud

ymlaen at argymhellion penodol.

I propose that we adopt the system that is being introduced in England whereby an independent authority reviews any major changes that are proposed to NHS services. The Assembly could either establish an independent authority, or, when we see the new structure for community health councils, that power could be given to an all-Wales body for CHCs. That can be done in many ways. However, we need a system. For that central body, one of the criteria would be proper public and patient consultation from an initial stage—not just in a ‘publish and consult’ model—in which local people had been engaged in discussion. Until we have that, we must expect such public response as there has been to this proposal in the Swansea area. There was never any attempt to develop a more all-inclusive approach. That is why we have had a highly political response from the media to this issue. We need to examine the current system because this is the first of many hard issues that we face. Until we have a system that allows for effective public consultation, we will face this situation over and over again.

Cynigiai ein bod yn mabwysiadu'r system a gyflwynir yn Lloegr sy'n adolygu unrhyw newidiadau mawr a gynigir i wasanaethau'r GIG drwy awdurdod annibynnol. Gallai'r Cynulliad un ai sefydlu awdurdod annibynnol neu, pan welwn y strwythur newydd i'r cynghorau iechyd cymunedol, gellid rhoi'r pŵer hwnnw i gorff Cymru-gyfan i gynghorau iechyd cymunedol. Gellir gwneud hynny mewn llawer modd. Fodd bynnag, mae arnom angen system. I'r corff canolog hwnnw, un o'r meini prawf fyddai ymgynghori priodol â'r cyhoedd a chleifion, o'r cyfnod dechreuol ymlaen—nid mewn model 'cyhoeddi ac ymgynghori' yn unig—gan gynnwys y bobl leol yn y drafodaeth. Hyd nes y cawn hynny, dylem ddisgwyl y math o ymateb cyhoeddus a fu i'r cynnig hwn yn ardal Abertawe. Ni fu unrhyw ymgais o gwbl i ddatblygu dull mwy hollgynhwysol. Dyna pam y cawsom ymateb tra gwleidyddol gan y cyfryngau i'r mater hwn. Rhaid inni archwilio'r system bresennol am mai hwn yw'r cyntaf o nifer fawr o faterion anodd yr ydym yn eu hwynebu. Hyd nes y cawn system sy'n darparu ar gyfer ymgynghori cyhoeddus effeithiol, byddwn yn wynebu'r sefyllfa hon dro ar ôl tro.

11:35 a.m.

Geraint Davies: Datganaf fuddiant fel fferylllydd. Mae Dai Lloyd eisoes wedi cyflwyno'r ddadl dros yr angen i ddarparu gwasanaethau arbenigol i ddiwallu anghenion poblogaeth Cymru. Dadl Plaid Cymru yw y dylid gwneud hyn drwy rannu adnoddau ac nid drwy greu tensiynau a gwanhau a darnio'r gwasanaethau presennol.

Geraint Davies: I declare an interest as a pharmacist. Dai Lloyd has already presented the case for the need to provide specialist services to meet the needs of the people of Wales. Plaid Cymru argues that that should be done by sharing resources and not by creating tensions and weakening and carving up current services.

The report states that the children of Wales should have fair access to treatment. It also recommends that neurosurgical services should be centralised in Cardiff. How can those two statements be squared? The neurosurgical unit at Morriston serves a wide catchment area: Swansea, Neath Port Talbot, Carmarthenshire, Pembrokeshire, and mid Wales. The Society of British Neurological Surgeons has stated that children should have access to neurological intervention within two hours of need. What will the children of west Wales do if neurological services are

Dywed yr adroddiad y dylai plant Cymru gael mynediad teg i driniaeth. Mae hefyd yn argymhell y dylid canoli gwasanaethau llawfeddygaeth niwrolegol yng Nghaerdydd. Sut y gellir cysoni'r ddau ddatganiad hynny? Mae'r uned llawfeddygaeth niwrolegol yn Nhreforys yn gwasanaethu dalgylch eang: Abertawe, Castell-nedd Port Talbot, sir Gaerfyrddin, sir Benfro a'r Canolbarth. Mae Cymdeithas Llawfeddygon Niwrolegol Prydain wedi datgan y dylai plant gael mynediad i driniaeth niwrolegol o fewn dwy awr pan fo'i hangen. Beth a wnaiff plant y

centralised in Cardiff? They will no longer be able to receive attention within two hours of need. Not only would Cardiff fail to meet such a target, given its distance from west Wales, but accessibility would be further reduced by the perennial problem of congested roads, with the danger of adding further unquantifiable time to a journey.

Dai has already mentioned Morryston's helipad. Why waste such an important facility when people's lives are at stake? If these recommendations are implemented they would, at worst, lead to fatalities in cases where urgent surgical attention is vital. Paediatric neurology requires a multi-disciplinary approach. Patients need specialist services and treatment throughout their lives. Centralising these services is contrary to the report's avowed target accessibility and fairness. The report recommends that paediatric neurosurgery should transfer to the University Hospital of Wales 'as soon as possible'. However, the financial impact of such a move is yet to be evaluated. In addition, the transfer cannot be made until theatre capacity at UHW has been made available; it may not be readily available.

There are so many options that are not discussed or even mentioned in the report and many questions that could be asked. The report noted its concern about children receiving brain surgery at Morryston without the back-up of paediatric intensive care and specialist paediatric oncology services. Why do they not consider placing intensive care beds in Morryston and appointing a second neurosurgeon? Surely that would be a more appropriate and viable option than transferring an entire service. The report fails to support the need for a second paediatric neurologist in Swansea. There is a centre for adults suffering from cancer at Swansea. Why does it not mention the option of developing paediatric services alongside that?

Perhaps an explanation for that lies in the composition of the Specialised Health

Gorllewin os canolir y gwasanaethau niwrolegol yng Nghaerdydd? Ni fyddant bellach yn gallu derbyn sylw o fewn dwy awr pan fo'i angen. Nid yn unig y byddai Caerdydd yn methu targed o'r fath, oherwydd ei phellter o'r Gorllewin, ond byddai'n llai hygyrch byth oherwydd y broblem barhaol o dagfeydd ar ffyrdd, gyda'r perygl o ychwanegu amser amhenodol at y siwrnai.

Mae Dai wedi sôn am y lanfa i hofrenyddion yn Nhreforys eisoes. Pam y dylid gwastraffu cyfleuster mor bwysig, a bywydau pobl yn y fantol? Os rhoddir yr argymhellion hyn ar waith, byddent, ar y gwaethaf, yn arwain at farwolaethau mewn achosion lle y mae'n hollbwysig cael sylw llawfeddygol brys. Mae niwroleg bediatrig yn gofyn dull gweithredu amlddisgyblaethol. Mae ar gleifion angen gwasanaethau a thriniaeth lawfeddygol ar hyd eu hoes. Mae canoli'r gwasanaethau hyn yn groes i darged addefedig yr adroddiad ar hygyrchedd a thegwch. Mae'r adroddiad yn argymhell trosglwyddo llawfeddygaeth niwrolegol bediatrig i Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru 'cyn gynted â phosibl'. Fodd bynnag, nid yw effaith ariannol symudiad o'r fath wedi'i gwerthuso eto. Yn ogystal â hynny, ni ellir ei throsglwyddo nes caiff capasati theatr ei ddarparu yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru; mae'n bosibl na fydd hynny ar gael yn rhwydd.

Mae cynifer o ddewisiadau nad oes trafod arnynt neu sôn amdanynt hyd yn oed yn yr adroddiad a llawer o gwestiynau y gellid eu gofyn. Nododd yr adroddiad bryder ynghylch plant a gâi lawdriniaeth i'r ymennydd yn Nhreforys heb fod cymorth gofal dwys pediatrig a gwasanaethau oncoleg bediatrig arbenigol ar gael iddynt. Pam nad ydynt yn ystyried rhoi gwelyau gofal dwys yn Nhreforys a phenodi ail lawfeddyg niwrolegol? Siawns na fyddai hynny'n ddewis mwy priodol ac ymarferol na throsglwyddo gwasanaeth cyfan. Mae'r adroddiad yn methu â chefnogi'r angen am ail niwrolegydd pediatrig yn Abertawe. Mae canolfan i oedolion sy'n dioddef gan ganser yn Abertawe. Pam nad yw'n sôn am y dewis o ddatblygu gwasanaethau pediatrig ochr yn ochr â honno?

Efallai fod eglurhad am hynny yng nghyfansoddiad bwrdd Comisiwn

Service Commission for Wales's board. There were two representatives from UHW, one from the Royal Glamorgan Hospital in Llantrisant, one from Rhyl and two consultants based in England. Which of those people were aware of the service provided in Swansea? How many paediatricians from Swansea were consulted during the drafting of this report?

These recommendations are further compounded by the reality of the situation. Even if the services were transferred to Cardiff, there is no guarantee that they would remain there. Cardiff has already lost paediatric nephrology and cardiosurgery units to Bristol because it could not retain consultants. Why risk destabilising these services in Wales further with this inappropriate centralisation?

Val Lloyd: I know that all Members will agree that the care of children is paramount. That must be central and uppermost in all our minds. I know that it has already been said, but it cannot be said too often, too clearly or too forcibly. Some of our most vulnerable children rely upon specialist healthcare. As the report says, they are frequently 'children in need'. We must consider and do what is best for all children in Wales. Point 1 of Plaid Cymru's motion does just that, but the second, which merely picks out one recommendation from the Specialised Health Service Commission for Wales's report, is gesture politics. I have repeatedly voiced my concern and dissatisfaction with this report, its recommendations and its overall effect on specialist children's health services in Wales.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: You have just stated that you criticise the entire report, including its recommendations, yet you also say that you are happy for a consultation process to take place based on a report that you argue is flawed. Is the report not directing the consultation process? Would it not be better to have a more even-handed report in terms of considering the need for specialist provision for children?

Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru. Yr oedd dau gynrychiolydd o Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru, un o Ysbyty Brenhinol Morgannwg yn Llantrisant, un o'r Rhyl a dau ymgynghorydd sydd wedi'u lleoli yn Lloegr. Pa rai ohonynt a oedd yn ymwybodol o'r gwasanaeth a ddarperir yn Abertawe? Pa sawl pediatregydd o Abertawe yr ymgynghorwyd ag ef wrth ddrafftio'r adroddiad hwn?

Gwaethygir yr argymhellion hyn ymhellach gan realiti'r sefyllfa. Hyd yn oed os câi'r gwasanaethau eu trosglwyddo i Gaerdydd, nid oes sicrwydd y byddent yn aros yno. Mae Caerdydd eisoes wedi colli unedau neffroleg a llawfeddygaeth gardiaidd bediatrig i Fryste am na allai gadw ymgynghorwyr. Pam y dylid dadsefydlogi'r gwasanaethau hynny ymhellach yng Nghymru drwy'r canoli amhriodol hwn?

Val Lloyd: Gwn y bydd yr holl Aelodau'n cytuno bod gofal am blant o'r pwys mwyaf. Rhaid i hynny fod yn ganolog ac yn flaenaf yn ein meddwl. Gwn fod hynny wedi'i ddweud eisoes, ond ni ellir ei ddweud yn rhy aml, yn rhy glir ac yn rhy rymus. Mae rhai o'n plant mwyaf diamddiffyn yn dibynnu ar ofal iechyd arbenigol. Fel y dywed yr adroddiad, maent yn aml yn 'blant mewn angen'. Rhaid inni ystyried a gwneud yr hyn sy'n orau i holl blant Cymru. Mae pwynt 1 o gynig Plaid Cymru'n gwneud yr union beth hwnnw, ond mae'r ail, nad yw ond yn dewis un argymhelliad o adroddiad Comisiwn Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru, yn wleidyddiaeth er mwyn sioe. Yr wyf wedi datgan dro ar ôl tro fy mhryder a'm anfonlonrwydd ar yr adroddiad hwn, ei argymhellion a'i effaith gyffredinol ar wasanaethau iechyd plant arbenigol yng Nghymru.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yr ydych newydd ddweud eich bod yn beirniadu'r adroddiad cyfan, gan gynnwys ei argymhellion, ac eto fe ddywedwch eich bod yn fodlon i broses ymgynghori ddigwydd ar sail adroddiad yr ydych yn dadlau ei fod yn ddiffygiol. Onid yw'r adroddiad yn cyfeirio'r broses ymgynghori? Oni fyddai'n well cael adroddiad mwy cytbwys o ran ystyried yr angen am ddarpariaeth arbenigol i blant?

Val Lloyd: I have not finished my speech; I will come to that later. Before this report was published, Labour colleagues and I had already met local consultants, surgeons and the health trust to voice our concerns over the future of children's services in Swansea.

My colleagues and I have previously asked for the entire SHSCW report to undertake a full, in-depth consultation exercise—the full report, not individual sections of it. That way, the future of all children's services can be considered together, to see where and how they fit, to provide the best possible service to all children. Simply to cherry-pick one recommendation, however flawed I believe it to be, is not the way forward. Services for children, and discussions on them, are far too important for the debate to degenerate into pitting one area against another.

Janet Ryder: Will you give way?

Val Lloyd: No, I want to carry on and make my important points. Why has Plaid Cymru isolated one specialised service, important though it is? I know that it is important, as I have worked in that service. The report makes recommendations on at least 11 specialised services, all vital to the quality care that must be provided for the children of Wales. It is wrong to pick only one of those services. What is Plaid Cymru's reason for doing so?

Alun Cairns: Will the Member give way?

Val Lloyd: No, I wish to continue. Why, if its commitment is to support accessible, specialised health services for all children in Wales, does Plaid Cymru isolate one service? Why not show concerns at other recommendations and, more importantly, at how the report has been offered as the only way forward?

This report is flawed, premature, prejudices the outcome and has not taken account of the

Val Lloyd: Nid wyf wedi gorffen fy araith; deufaf at hynny'n ddiweddarach. Cyn cyhoeddi'r adroddiad hwn, yr oedd fy nghyd-Aelodau Llafur a minnau eisoes wedi cwrdd ag ymgynghorwyr lleol, llawfeddygon a'r ymddiriedolaeth iechyd i ddatgan ein pryderon ynghylch dyfodol gwasanaethau plant yn Abertawe.

Mae fy nghyd-Aelodau a minnau eisoes wedi gofyn am ymgynghoriad llawn a manwl ar adroddiad Comisiwn Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru—ar yr adroddiad yn ei gyfanrwydd, nid adrannau unigol ohono. Drwy hynny, gellir ystyried dyfodol yr holl wasanaethau plant gyda'i gilydd, i weld ym mhle a sut y maent yn ffitio, i ddarparu'r gwasanaeth gorau posibl i bob plentyn. Nid dethol un argymhelliaid, pa mor ddiffygiol bynnag y credaf ei fod, yw'r ffordd ymlaen. Mae gwasanaethau i blant, a'r trafodaethau arnynt, yn rhy bwysig o lawer i'r ddadl ddirywio'n fater o roi un maes i gystadlu yn erbyn un arall.

Janet Ryder: A wnewch chi ildio?

Val Lloyd: Na wnaif, yr wyf am fynd ymlaen a gwneud fy mhwyntiau pwysig. Pam y mae Plaid Cymru wedi dethol un gwasanaeth arbenigol, er ei bwysiced? Gwn ei fod yn bwysig, gan fy mod wedi gweithio yn y gwasanaeth hwnnw. Mae'r adroddiad yn gwneud argymhellion ar o leiaf 11 o wasanaethau arbenigol, a phob un yn hollbwysig i'r gofal o ansawdd da y mae'n rhaid ei ddarparu i blant Cymru. Nid yw'n iawn dethol dim ond un o'r gwasanaethau hynny. Beth yw rheswm Plaid Cymru dros wneud hynny?

Alun Cairns: A wnaiff yr Aelod ildio?

Val Lloyd: Na wnaif, dymunaf fynd ymlaen. Pam, os yw wedi ymrwymo i gefnogi gwasanaethau iechyd arbenigol, hygyrch i holl blant Cymru, y mae Plaid Cymru'n sôn am un gwasanaeth yn unig? Pam nad yw'n dangos ei phryderon ynghylch yr argymhellion eraill ac, yn bwysicach, ynghylch y modd y cynigiwyd yr adroddiad fel yr unig ffordd ymlaen?

Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn ddiffygiol ac yn gynamserol, mae'n rhagfarnu'r canlyniad ac

wider context in which health services are provided. As David said, it makes recommendations but does not appraise the options or give a meaningful range of possible alternatives. I welcome the consultation process, but this is not the place to individualise my specific concerns.

The report has raised concerns among people in Swansea and south-west Wales, who have expressed their concerns most forcibly. I urge all sections of the community to respond to the consultation exercise: make your views known. We must ensure that the consultation process is not hijacked by any sectional interest, and that is not used to score political points.

11:45 a.m.

Elin Jones: Trafodaf yr argymhelliad i symud y gwasanaeth llawdriniaeth niwrolegol pediatrig o Abertawe i Gaerdydd, ac nid ymddiheuraf am hynny, am ei fod yn fater pwysig i'r Cynulliad ac i'm hetholwyr yng Ngheredigion. Gwelaf yr argymhelliad fel cam gwag.

Dim ond argymhelliad mewn dogfen ymgynghorol yw; nid yw'n derfynol ar hyn o bryd, felly nawr yw'r amser imi ddangos fy ngwrthwynebiad iddo. Mae fy mhrofiad yn y Cynulliad wedi dysgu imi fod amharodrwydd rhonc i newid unrhyw argymhelliad unwaith iddo ffurfio rhan o ddogfen derfynol. Ambell waith, mae'r broses hon a'r dogfennau ymgynghorol di-rif yn cael eu defnyddio i dagu ac i flaenori ar bwysigrwydd democrataidd y Cynulliad, ac ar fy rôl innau fel cynrychiolydd etholedig democrataidd. Rhyfeddaf at rai o sylwadau Val Lloyd. Dyma'r union le y dylai hi, fel cynrychiolydd pobl Dwyrain Abertawe, a finnau fel cynrychiolydd pobl Ceredigion, fod yn gwneud y pwyntiau sydd yn ei phryderu fel unigolyn ac fel cynrychiolydd, ac nid drwy'r broses ymgynghori bob tro. A yw Val Lloyd, a'r Democrataid Rhyddfrydol, wrth ystyried eu datganiadau hwy heddiw, yn credu mai fy rôl innau yw ymateb i brosesau ymgynghorol a defnyddio'r dulliau hynny, neu i siarad a phleidleisio ar faterion sydd yn poeni pobl Ceredigion?

nid yw wedi ystyried y cyd-destun ehangach lle y darperir gwasanaethau iechyd. Fel y dywedodd David, mae'n gwneud argymhellion ond nid yw'n arfarnu'r dewisiadau neu'n cynnig amrediad ystyrllon o ddewisiadau eraill posibl. Croesawaf y broses ymgynghori, ond nid hwn yw'r lle imi sôn am fy phryderon penodol personol i.

Mae'r adroddiad wedi achosi pryderon ymysg pobl yn Abertawe a'r De-orllewin, sydd wedi mynegi eu pryderon yn rymus iawn. Pwysaf ar bob rhan o'r gymuned i ymateb i'r ymgynghoriad: rhowch wybod am eich barn. Rhaid inni sicrhau na chaiff y broses ymgynghori ei chymryd drosodd gan unrhyw fuddiant adrannol, ac na ddefnyddir hi i sgorio pwyntiau gwleidyddol.

Elin Jones: I will discuss the recommendation to move the paediatric neurosurgery service from Swansea to Cardiff, and I make no apology for that as it is an important matter for the Assembly and for my constituents in Ceredigion. I regard this recommendation as a false step.

It is only a recommendation in a consultation document; it is not final at present, therefore now is the time for me to voice my opposition to it. My experience in the Assembly has taught me that there is a stubborn reluctance to change any recommendation once it forms part of a final document. Sometimes, this process and these numerous consultation documents are used to stifle and override the democratic importance of this Assembly and my role as a democratically elected representative. I am amazed at some of Val Lloyd's comments. This is exactly the place where she, as the representative for the people of Swansea East, and I, as the representative of the people of Ceredigion, should be making the points which are of concern to her as an individual, and as a representative, and not through a consultation process each time. Do Val Lloyd, and the Liberal Democrats, given their statements today, believe that my role is to respond to consultation processes and to use those methods, or to speak and vote on matters which are of concern to the people of Ceredigion?

Caiff ymgynghori yn aml ei ddefnyddio gan y Llywodraeth, a chan Aelodau eraill, fel modd o osgoi gweithredu. Cofiaf pan gyflwynais innau is-ddeddfwriaeth, fe'i gwrthodwyd gan y Llywodraeth a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol oherwydd nad oedd proses ymgynghori wedi digwydd. Mae hynny'n tagu democratiaeth.

Peter Black: Your role in this Chamber is to scrutinise the Government and make decisions on the outcome of consultation. As no recommendation or decision has yet been made, then it is appropriate that we have a consultation process for recommendations to be made and for you to scrutinise the Government on the outcome of that process.

Elin Jones: Mae tair blynedd o brofiad yn y Cynulliad hwn yn dangos amharoddrwydd y Llywodraeth, unwaith y mae ymgynghoriad wedi digwydd, i newid unrhyw faterion o ganlyniad i drafodaeth ddemocratiaidd. Mae proses ymgynghorol yn aml yn ffordd o siwtio cynlluniau'r Llywodraeth, yn hytrach na bod yn broses agored. Mae'r ymgynghoriad hwn yn unochrog oherwydd bod yr argymhellion wedi'u creu cyn bod yr ymgynghoriad yn digwydd mewn ffordd deg. Yr wyf wedi gwyro i drafod prosesau a heb drafod y pwyntiau pwysig eto.

Gwnaethpwyd nifer o bwyntiau eisoes gan Dai Lloyd a Geraint Davies. Nid wyf am fod yn blwyfol y bore yma. Pe bawn am fod yn blwyfol, gofynnwn am leoli'r gwasanaethau arbenigol hyn ym Mronglais. Derbyniaf fod angen canolfannau rhanbarthol arbenigol, a derbyniaf fod Treforys yn darparu gwasanaeth pwysig, drwy gysylltiad yr ambiwlans awyr yn aml. Mae'r ysbyty o fewn cyrraedd gweddol i bobl Ceredigion ac mae darpariaeth bwysig o wasanaethau plant arbenigol yno. Cam gwag fyddai canoli'r gwasanaethau hynny. Nid wyf wedi clywed rhesymau meddygol dros wneud hynny. Pe bai rhesymau meddygol dros ganoli yng Nghaerdydd, byddwn yn barod i wrando arnynt. Fodd bynnag, nid oes rhesymau meddygol yn cael eu hamlygu ar hyn o bryd, ac hebddynt, cam gwag fyddai canoli.

Dylem wrthod canoli, a byddaf innau'n

Consultation is often used by the Government, and by other Members, as a way of avoiding action. I remember when I proposed subordinate legislation, the Government and the Liberal Democrats rejected it because a consultation process had not taken place. That stifles democracy.

Peter Black: Eich rôl chi yn y Siambr hon yw archwilio'r Llywodraeth a gwneud penderfyniadau ar ganlyniad ymgynghori. Gan nad oes unrhyw argymhelliad neu benderfyniad wedi'i wneud eto, mae'n briodol inni gael proses ymgynghori fel y gellir gwneud argymhellion ac fel y gallwch chi archwilio'r Llywodraeth ar ganlyniad y broses honno.

Elin Jones: Three years of experience in this Assembly shows the Government's reluctance, once a consultation has happened, to change any matters in response to democratic debate. Consultation is often a means to suit the Government's plans, rather than being an open process. This consultation is one-sided because the recommendations have been drawn up before the consultation has taken place in a fair way. I have digressed to discuss processes and have not discussed the important points yet.

Dai Lloyd and Geraint Davies have already made many of those points. I do not want to be parochial this morning. If I wanted to be parochial, I would ask for these specialist services to be located in Bronglais. I accept that we need regional specialist centres and I accept that Morriston provides an important service, often through the air ambulance link. The hospital is within relatively easy reach of the people of Ceredigion and it is an important provider of specialist children's services. It would be wrong to centralise those services. I have not heard any medical reasons for doing so. If there were medical reasons for centralising in Cardiff, I would be willing to listen to them. However, no medical reasons are being highlighted at present, and without them, it would be wrong to centralise.

We should reject centralisation, and I will

dangos fy ngwrthwynebiad drwy godi'r materion hyn yn y Cynulliad, eu trafod a phleidleisio arnynt. Gobeithiaf y bydd pawb arall sydd yn gwrthwynebu'r canoli hwn yn gwneud yr un peth.

Kirsty Williams: There is nothing more controversial in politics than an issue that relates both to children and to changes in hospital services. However, I will tease out a number of points of principle arising from Plaid Cymru's motion today. Firstly, considering tertiary services for children must be done in the light of balancing clinical excellence and child-centred practice, as well as geographical location.

The report of the Royal College of Paediatrics and Child Health, 'Paediatrics and Child Health—the next 10 years', discusses the principle of a two-hour journey time. It does that in the context of the need to concentrate service delivery and ensure that service advice is available around the clock based on three practising consultants. Professor Kennedy's report following the Bristol heart scandal called for specialist care to be concentrated where staff have the necessary skills. This view was supported by the Carlile review. No-one this morning has mentioned delivering services in the context of the Kennedy and Carlile reports. The National Assembly for Wales unanimously backed these significant reports. We cannot talk about service delivery and conveniently forget about these reports simply because it might be, in this instance, too uncomfortable to remember their conclusions. As you already know, I am concerned about the pull towards centralisation and what it will mean in terms of access.

Janet Ryder: Do you not think that lessons should be learnt from north Wales, where children's services have been moved to Liverpool? Many parents have to spend a great deal of time and money travelling to Liverpool when their children receive treatment there. This can cause severe family problems and poverty in some cases where parents have to give up work. Will you not learn the lessons from that and realise that people need to be treated close to home, where possible, and that we should not be closing centres like the one in Swansea?

show my objection by raising these matters in the Assembly, discussing them and voting on them. I hope that everyone else who opposes this centralisation will do the same.

Kirsty Williams: Nid oes dim sy'n fwy dadleuol mewn gwleidyddiaeth na mater sy'n ymwneud â phlant a newidiadau i wasanaethau ysbyty. Fodd bynnag, af ar ôl nifer o bwyntiau o egwyddor sy'n codi o gynnyg Plaid Cymru heddiw. Yn gyntaf, rhaid ystyried gwasanaethau trydyddol i blant yng ngoleuni cydbwysio rhagoriaeth glinigol ac ymarfer plant-ganolog, yn ogystal â lleoliad daearyddol.

Mae adroddiad Coleg Brenhinol Pediatreg ac Iechyd Plant, 'Paediatrics and Child Health—the next 10 years', yn trafod yr egwyddor o amser teithio o ddwy awr. Gwnaiff hynny yng nghyd-destun yr angen i grynhoi darpariaeth y gwasanaeth a sicrhau bod cyngor y gwasanaeth ar gael ddydd a nos yn seiliedig ar drefniant o dri ymgynghorydd gweithredol. Galwodd adroddiad yr Athro Kennedy ar ôl sgandal y galon ym Mryste am grynhoi gofal arbenigol lle y mae'r staff yn meddu ar y sgiliau angenrheidiol. Ategir y farn hon gan adolygiad Carlile. Nid oes neb y bore hwn wedi sôn am ddarparu gwasanaethau yng nghyd-destun adroddiadau Kennedy a Carlile. Cafwyd cefnogaeth unfrydol gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru i'r adroddiadau pwysig hyn. Ni allwn sôn am ddarparu gwasanaethau ac anghofio'n gyfleus am yr adroddiadau hyn dim ond am y gallai fod yn rhy annifyr cofio eu casgliadau yn yr achos hwn. Fel y gwyddoch eisoes, yr wyf yn bryderus ynghylch y dynfa i ganoli a beth fydd yn ei olygu o ran mynediad.

Janet Ryder: Oni chreddech y dylid dysgu gwersi o'r hyn a ddigwyddodd yn y Gogledd, lle y mae'r gwasanaethau plant wedi'u symud i Lerpwl? Mae llawer o rieni'n gorfod treulio llawer iawn o amser a gwario llawer iawn o arian yn teithio i Lerpwl pan fydd eu plant yn cael triniaeth yno. Gall hynny beri problemau teuluol difrifol a thlodi mewn rhai achosion lle y mae'r rhieni'n gorfod rhoi'r gorau i'w gwaith. Oni wnewch ddysgu'r gwersi o hynny a sylweddoli bod angen trin pobl yn agos i'w cartrefi, lle y bo modd, ac na ddylem gau canolfannau fel yr un yn

Abertawe?

Kirsty Williams: You are right that it causes upset and pain to have to travel to a service. I would suggest that we must also learn from people's experience at Bristol. We are not merely talking about the inconvenience of distance in the Bristol case, we are talking about children who lost their lives. The overriding principle for any service must be that it is safe. As someone who lives in Powys and is a parent of a small child, I would be willing to travel to a safe service. We must ensure that services are safe.

Janet Ryder, Rhodri Glyn Thomas, David Lloyd and Alun Cairns *rose—*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Kirsty Williams is not giving way.

Kirsty Williams: We cannot consider service development without looking at clinical governance. To do that would be irresponsible, because what would happen if something went wrong in a service whose sustainability had been questioned? This is a question of sustainability. What happens to children in Pembrokeshire when the highly skilled surgeon in Swansea is away on study leave or away from the hospital? They would be operated upon by a non-paediatric specialist, or they would have to come to Cardiff for treatment. These questions cannot be ignored. Neither can we ignore the legitimate concerns of parents in Pembrokeshire who want to know what will happen if the service is withdrawn from Swansea.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas and David Lloyd *rose—*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I do not think that Kirsty Williams is giving way.

Kirsty Williams: The centre of excellence concept is all very well but, Dai, as a clinician, you will know that the service must be used by a critical mass of patients to make it a safe service. It is not acceptable to have a surgeon working on three or four patients a month. That surgeon needs to use his or her skills constantly in the context of peer

Kirsty Williams: Yr ydych yn iawn bod teithio i gael gwasanaeth yn peri gofid a phoen. Byddwn yn awgrymu bod yn rhaid inni ddysgu hefyd oddi wrth brofiad pobl ym Mryste. Nid sôn am anghyfleuster y pellter yn unig yr ydym yn achos Bryste, yr ydym yn sôn am blant a gollodd eu bywydau. Yr egwyddor bennaf i unrhyw wasanaeth yw bod yn rhaid iddo fod yn ddiogel. Fel un sy'n byw ym Mhowys ac sy'n rhiant i blentyn bach, byddwn yn barod i deithio i gael gwasanaeth diogel. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod gwasanaethau'n ddiogel.

Janet Ryder, Rhodri Glyn Thomas, David Lloyd ac Alun Cairns *a godasant—*

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Nid yw Kirsty Williams yn ildio.

Kirsty Williams: Ni allwn ystyried datblygu gwasanaethau heb edrych ar lywodraethu clinigol. Anghyfrifol fyddai hynny, oherwydd beth a ddigwyddai pe byddai rhywbeth yn mynd o'i le mewn gwasanaeth yr oedd amheuaeth ynghylch ei gynaliadwyedd? Mae hyn yn fater o gynaliadwyedd. Beth sy'n digwydd i blant yn sir Benfro pan fo'r llawfeddyg tra medrus yn Abertawe i ffwrdd ar seibiant astudio neu i ffwrdd o'r ysbyty? Caent lawdriniaeth gan arbenigwr nad oedd yn bediatregydd, neu byddai'n rhaid iddynt ddod i Gaerdydd i'w trin. Ni ellir anwybyddu'r cwestiynau hyn. Ni allwn ychwaith anwybyddu pryderon rhieni yn sir Benfro sydd am wybod beth a ddigwydd os tynnir y gwasanaeth yn ôl yn Abertawe.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas a David Lloyd *a godasant—*

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Nid wyf yn credu bod Kirsty Williams yn ildio.

Kirsty Williams: Mae cysyniad y ganolfan rhagoriaeth yn un purion ond, Dai, fel clinigydd, fe wyddoch fod yn rhaid i wasanaeth gael ei ddefnyddio gan fâs critigol o gleifion i'w wneud yn wasanaeth diogel. Nid yw'n dderbyniol cael llawfeddyg sy'n gweithio ar dri neu bedwar o gleifion y mis. Rhaid i'r llawfeddyg hwnnw ddefnyddio'i

support, not in isolation.

David Lloyd: To respond to your point about critical mass, the figure of four million, which means the Bristol area and Wales, is accepted. Therefore, how will the Bristol area and Wales, in terms of paediatric neurosurgery, be best served by a unit in Bristol and a unit in Cardiff? What about the rest of Wales?

Kirsty Williams: This is why we must address concerns about what will happen if the Swansea service is withdrawn. This debate on consolidating children's services because of the way in which the SHSCW report was presented is not the best way forward. We must take on board the concerns of the local population in Swansea, and we must consider service delivery options. However, you cannot ignore clinical governance and the contents of the Kennedy and Carlile reports simply because it is a difficult issue. We must ensure that services are acceptable and sustainable.

I offer a word of caution—if we do not address this debate sensibly, Wales could lose the service altogether. If we do not debate it sensibly and consider an appropriate way forward and consolidate services, the royal colleges will act independently. They will do what they did in Caerphilly and remove accreditation, which will mean no service in Swansea or in Cardiff. We are responsible politicians who were elected to the Assembly to debate issues, and do so with a wider perspective. Let us look at how we can best deliver neurosurgery for children in Wales. I do not know whether the service would be best located in Swansea or Cardiff, but I know that it needs to be consolidated. If we do not do that, the service will probably be lost to Wales altogether. None of us want that to happen, therefore we must consider these views.

11.55 a.m.

I agree with David Melding that lay people

sgiliau'n gyson yng nghyd-destun cefnogaeth gan gymheiriaid, nid ar wahân.

David Lloyd: I ymateb i'ch pwynt am fâs critigol, derbynir y ffigur o bedair miliwn, sy'n golygu ardal Bryste a Chymru. Felly, yng nghyd-destun llawfeddygaeth niwrolegol bediatrig, sut y caiff ardal Bryste a Chymru ei gwasanaethu orau gan uned ym Mryste ac uned yng Nghaerdydd? Beth am weddill Cymru?

Kirsty Williams: Dyma pam y mae'n rhaid inni ymdrin â'r pryderon ynghylch yr hyn a fydd yn digwydd os tynnir y gwasanaeth yn Abertawe'n ôl. Nid y ddadl hon ar gyfuno gwasanaethau plant oherwydd y dull o gyflwyno adroddiad Comisiwn Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru yw'r ffordd orau ymlaen. Rhaid inni ystyried pryderon y boblogaeth leol yn Abertawe, a rhaid inni ystyried y dewisiadau o ran darparu gwasanaethau. Er hynny, ni allwch anwybyddu llywodraethu clinigol a chynnwys adroddiadau Kennedy a Carlile dim ond am ei fod yn fater anodd. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod gwasanaethau'n dderbyniol ac yn gynaliadwy.

Cynigiau air o rybudd—os nad ymdriniwn â'r ddadl hon yn synhwyrol, gallai Cymru gollir gwasanaeth yn gyfan gwbl. Os na wnawn ei thrafod yn synhwyrol ac ystyried ffordd briodol ymlaen a chyfuno gwasanaethau, bydd y colegau brenhinol yn gweithredu'n annibynnol. Fe wnânt yr hyn a wnaethant yng Nghaerffili a dileu achrediad, sy'n golygu na fydd gwasanaeth yn Abertawe nac yng Nghaerdydd. Yr ydym yn wleidyddion cyfrifol a etholwyd i'r Cynulliad i drafod pynciau, gan wneud hynny o safbwynt ehangach. Gadewch inni ystyried sut y gallwn ddarparu llawfeddygaeth niwrolegol i blant orau yng Nghymru. Ni wn ai gwell fyddai lleoli'r gwasanaeth yn Abertawe neu yng Nghaerdydd, ond gwn fod angen ei gryfhau. Os na wnawn hynny, mae'n debyg y bydd Cymru'n colli'r gwasanaeth yn gyfan gwbl. Nid oes yr un ohonom am i hynny ddigwydd, felly rhaid inni ystyried y barnau hyn.

Cytunaf â David Melding fod ar leygwyr fel

like ourselves need good, independent advice on which to base our decisions. We have already seen that standards will be set by the National Institute for Clinical Excellence. The son or daughter of SHSCW will be the perfect instrument to provide Ministers with independent clinical advice before they make these difficult and emotive decisions.

Alun Cairns: I welcome the opportunity to contribute to this debate, and I extend my thanks to Plaid Cymru for choosing this subject.

There is no doubt that this is the key debate in south-west Wales, and I pay tribute to the *South Wales Evening Post* for highlighting the threat of paediatric neurosurgery centralisation in Cardiff. The purpose of devolution was to bring decision making and services closer to the people of Wales and make them more relevant. The argument used during the referendum campaign was that the Welsh Office in Cardiff was perceived, in practical terms, to be far away—as was London—and that an assembly with members from west and north Wales could argue their case strongly and stand up for regions.

Over the last three years, since the Assembly's inception, I cannot think of an occasion when the influence of Members representing west and north Wales has been more important.

Nick Bourne: It is vital for west Wales, and a large part of mid Wales, that these services, excellent as they are in Morryston Hospital, are provided. I do not know what those Members who commented that this debate is political thought that we were elected to do. It is vital that we make these points by taking a view on behalf of all of Wales, not a narrow party-political view. Morryston Hospital's paediatric neurosurgery services are vital for west and south-west Wales. I congratulate the Member on his work, along with others, in spearheading this campaign in Swansea.

Alun Cairns: I am grateful to Nick Bourne for his kind comments. If the removal of

ni angen cyngor annibynnol da yn sail i'n penderfyniadau. Gwelsom eisoes y caiff safonau eu gosod gan y Sefydliad Rhagoriaeth Glinigol Genedlaethol. Olynydd Comisiwn Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru fydd y cyfrwng perffaith i ddarparu cyngor clinigol annibynnol ar gyfer Gweinidogion cyn iddynt wneud y penderfyniadau anodd ac emosiynol hyn.

Alun Cairns: Croesawaf y cyfle i gyfrannu i'r ddadl hon, a diolchaf i Blaid Cymru am ddewis y pwnc hwn.

Nid oes amheuaeth nad hon yw'r ddadl allweddol yn y De-orllewin, a thalaf deyrnged i'r *South Wales Evening Post* am dynnu sylw at y perygl o ganoli llawfeddygaeth niwrolegol bediatrig yng Nghaerdydd. Pwrpas datganoli oedd dod â phenderfynu a gwasanaethau'n agosach at bobl Cymru a'u gwneud yn fwy perthnasol. Y ddadl a ddefnyddiwyd yn ystod ymgyrch y refferendwm oedd bod canfyddiad bod y Swyddfa Gymreig yng Nghaerdydd yn bell, yn ymarferol—fel yr oedd Llundain—ac y byddai cynulliad ag ynddo aelodau o'r Gorllewin a'r Gogledd yn gallu dadlau eu hachos yn gryf a sefyll dros y rhanbarthau.

Dros y tair blynedd diwethaf, ers dechreuad y Cynulliad, ni allaf feddwl am achlysur pan fu dylanwad yr Aelodau sy'n cynrychioli'r Gorllewin a'r Gogledd yn bwysicach.

Nick Bourne: Mae'n hollbwysig i'r Gorllewin, ac i ran helaeth o'r Canolbarth, fod y gwasanaethau rhagorol hyn yn Ysbyty Treforys yn cael eu darparu. Ni wn beth y mae'r Aelodau hynny a ddywedodd fod y ddadl hon yn wleidyddol yn credu y cawsom ein hethol i'w wneud. Mae'n hollbwysig ein bod yn gwneud y pwyntiau hyn drwy ffurfio barn ar ran Cymru gyfan, nid barn bleidiol wleidyddol gul. Mae gwasanaethau llawfeddygaeth niwrolegol bediatrig Ysbyty Treforys yn hollbwysig i'r Gorllewin a'r De-orllewin. Llongyfarchaf yr Aelod ar ei waith, ynghyd ag eraill, wrth arwain yr ymgyrch hon yn Abertawe.

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Nick Bourne am ei sylwadau caredig. Os byddai

paediatric neurosurgery from Swansea would benefit children in Wales, specifically in Swansea and west Wales, I would be the first to support such a measure. However, the health of children in west Wales would be put at risk if such a move were followed through. This is not convenient rhetoric, it is the advice of the Society of British Neurological Surgeons. Its latest advice, issued earlier this year, states that:

‘The working group considered that, in common with adults, children with neurosurgical emergencies requiring urgent neurosurgical intervention should have access to appropriate neurosurgical help within two hours’.

I would like Kirsty Williams to reflect on some of her comments. Safety is critical, and the location of services in Cardiff does not meet the safety needs of children in Swansea and west Wales. I agree that safety is important and hope that Kirsty accepts my point.

Kirsty Williams: Do you accept that it is not desirable to have a consultant practising on his own? Do you also accept that the Royal College of Paediatricians and Child Health, having stated that it wants services to be delivered within two hours, also wants them delivered by a team of at least three neurosurgeons? It also recommends a round-the-clock service, which is not possible at present in Cardiff or Swansea. Therefore we are failing children in west and east Wales because we cannot provide the services outlined by the royal college; we are not doing it.

Alun Cairns: I accept part of Kirsty Williams’s point. However, the turnover of paediatric neurosurgeons in Cardiff is extremely high and, as a result, you rightly made the point that we do not have enough paediatric neurosurgeons in Cardiff or in Swansea. Therefore, why are you arguing for centralisation in Cardiff when a safe service could just as easily be located in Swansea?

symud llawfeddygaeth niwrolegol bediatrig o Abertawe er budd plant yng Nghymru, yn Abertawe a’r Gorllewin yn benodol, myfi fyddai’r cyntaf i gefnogi cam o’r fath. Fodd bynnag, byddai iechyd plant yn y Gorllewin mewn perygl pe cymerid y fath gam. Nid rhethreg gyfleus yw hon, cyngor Cymdeithas Llawfeddygon Niwrolegol Prydain ydyw. Mae ei chyngor diweddaraf, a gyhoeddwyd yn gynharach eleni, yn datgan:

‘Yr oedd y gweithgor o’r farn y dylai plant ag argyfwng niwrolegol lawfeddygol a oedd yn gofyn ymyrryd niwrolegol lawfeddygol brys gael mynediad i gymorth niwrolegol lawfeddygol o fewn dwy awr, yn yr un modd ag oedolion’.

Fe hoffwn i Kirsty Williams fyfyrion ynghylch rhai o’i sylwadau. Mae diogelwch yn hollbwysig, ac nid yw lleoli gwasanaethau yng Nghaerdydd yn diwallu anghenion plant yn Abertawe a’r Gorllewin. Cytunaf fod diogelwch yn bwysig a gobeithiaf fod Kirsty yn derbyn fy mhwynt.

Kirsty Williams: A ydych yn derbyn nad yw’n ddymunol cael ymgynghorydd yn ymarfer ar ei ben ei hun? A ydych hefyd yn derbyn bod Coleg Brenhinol Pediatreg ac Iechyd Plant, ac yntau wedi datgan ei fod am weld darparu gwasanaethau o fewn dwy awr, hefyd yn dymuno iddynt gael eu darparu gan dîm o o leiaf dri o lawfeddygon niwrolegol? Mae hefyd yn argymhell gwasanaeth ddydd a nos, nad yw’n bosibl ar hyn o bryd yng Nghaerdydd neu Abertawe. Felly yr ydym yn methu yn ein dyletswydd at blant yn y Gorllewin a’r Dwyrain gan na allwn ddarparu’r gwasanaethau a ddisgrifiwyd gan y coleg brenhinol; nid ydym yn gwneud hynny.

Alun Cairns: Derbyniaf ran o bwynt Kirsty Williams. Fodd bynnag, mae trosiant y llawfeddygon niwrolegol pediatrig yng Nghaerdydd yn uchel iawn ac felly yr oeddech yn iawn wrth wneud y pwynt nad oes gennym ddigon o lawfeddygon niwrolegol pediatrig yng Nghaerdydd neu yn Abertawe. Felly, pam yr ydych yn dadlau dros ganoli yng Nghaerdydd gan y gellid lleoli gwasanaeth diogel yn Abertawe yr un mor rhwydd?

Kirsty Williams: I did not say where the service should be based. What I said was that it should be consolidated to ensure that the service is sustainable for Wales. I am not making a judgment on whether it should be in Cardiff or Swansea; I am saying that the service must be sustainable, which is not the case at present.

Alun Cairns: Bearing in mind Kirsty Williams's earlier point about safety being the critical element, would consolidation in Swansea be acceptable to her, as it would meet the Society of British Neurological Surgeons's demand that children need neurosurgical intervention within two hours? That could be achieved for children in west Wales if services were centralised in Swansea, but centralisation in Cardiff would make it physically impossible. The University Hospital of Wales, unlike Swansea's Morriston Hospital, does not have a helipad. If services were centralised in Swansea, people in mid Wales, including your constituents, could have the necessary neurosurgical intervention within the stated two hours that the Society of British Neurological Surgeons rightly demands for the safety of patients.

I will move on.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You have 40 seconds left.

Alun Cairns: As I have given way to several Members, I hope that you will allow me a little leeway.

The recommendations of SHSCW's report clearly do not meet the medical need of safety, which we should all make a medical right. I am staggered that the cross-party support that seemed to be presented in the *South Wales Evening Post* is not reflected here. Andrew Davies, Edwina Hart and Val Lloyd were quoted on 16 May, in an article that bore the headline 'Just Bin It', as saying:

'We are writing to SHSCW asking that this

Kirsty Williams: Ni ddywedais ymhle y dylid lleoli'r gwasanaeth. Yr hyn a ddywedais oedd y dylid ei gryfhau i sicrhau bod y gwasanaeth yn gynaliadwy i Gymru. Nid wyf yn barnu ynghylch a ddylai fod yng Nghaerdydd neu yn Abertawe; yr wyf yn dweud bod yn rhaid i'r gwasanaeth fod yn gynaliadwy, ac nid ydyw ar hyn o bryd.

Alun Cairns: Gan gofio pwynt cynharach Kirsty Williams mai diogelwch yw'r elfen hollbwysig, a fyddai cryfhau'r gwasanaeth yn Abertawe'n dderbyniol ganddi, gan y byddai'n ateb galw Cymdeithas Llawfeddygon Niwrolegol Prydain o ran yr angen i blant gael ymyrraeth niwrolegol lawfeddygol o fewn dwy awr? Gellid cyflawni hynny ar gyfer plant yn y Gorllewin pe canolid y gwasanaethau yn Abertawe, ond byddai canoli yng Nghaerdydd yn peri bod hynny'n ffisegol amhosibl. Yn wahanol i Ysbyty Treforys yn Abertawe, nid yw Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru'n meddu ar lanfa hofrenyddion. Pe canolid y gwasanaethau yn Abertawe, byddai pobl yn y Canolbarth, gan gynnwys eich etholwyr chi, yn gallu cael yr ymyrraeth niwrolegol lawfeddygol angenrheidiol o fewn y ddwy awr y mae Cymdeithas Llawfeddygon Niwrolegol Prydain yn mynnu eu bod yn briodol er diogelwch cleifion.

Symudaf ymlaen.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae gennych 40 eiliad ar ôl.

Alun Cairns: Gan fy mod wedi ildio i sawl Aelod, gobeithiaf y byddwch yn caniatáu ychydig o amser i mi.

Mae'n amlwg nad yw argymhellion adroddiad Comisiwn Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru'n bodloni'r angen meddygol am ddiogelwch, y dylem oll ei wneud yn hawl feddygol. Yr wyf yn synnu'n fawr nad yw'r gefnogaeth drawsbleidiol yr ymddangosai ei bod yn bresennol yn y *South Wales Evening Post* wedi'i hadlewyrchu yma. Dyfynnwyd y geiriau hyn o'r eiddo Andrew Davies, Edwina Hart a Val Lloyd ar 16 Mai, mewn erthygl o dan y pennawd 'Rhowch ef yn y bin':

'Yr ydym yn ysgrifennu at Gomisiwn

report be withdrawn.’

I was, therefore, staggered by Val Lloyd’s earlier contribution, and I cannot understand why those Members cannot support today’s motion. They are prepared to say in a newspaper article that they are writing to SHSCW asking that the report be withdrawn because they:

‘believe that the process by which this report into vital children’s services has been produced is crucially flawed.’

We cannot have a consultation on a document that is crucially flawed.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You need to finish your contribution.

Alun Cairns: I hope that the Members I named, as well as others who have been happy to be quoted in the *South Wales Evening Post* and who enjoyed the publicity, will vote with their conscience and support Plaid Cymru’s motion.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Before I call Rhodri Glyn Thomas, I recognise in the gallery a delegation from the General People’s Congress of Libya, led by their Secretary of Foreign Affairs. Welcome. [*Applause.*]

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Mae’r ddadl hon yn bwysig am ei bod yn adlewyrchu trafodaeth sy’n mynd rhagddi ar y gwasanaeth a ddarperir yn Abertawe. Yr wyf am annog Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i edrych ar Gofnod y Trafodion ac ystyried yn ofalus y geiriau a ddefnyddiodd heddiw. Clywais gyfeirio at wasanaeth anghynaliadwy ac annigol. Yr wyf am ddweud ar goedd fy mod yn gwybod, o ganlyniad i’r berthynas rhyngof ag Ysbyty Treforys, fod y gwasanaeth a gynigir i’r hetholwyr i, ac i etholwyr Aelodau eraill, yn gynaliadwy a diogel. Os nad yw Kirsty Williams yn teimlo bod Cofnod y Trafodion yn adlewyrchu ei barn yn deg, dylai sicrhau ei fod yn cael ei gywiro.

Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru gan ofyn am dynnu’n ôl yr adroddiad hwn.’

Felly, yr oeddwn yn synnu’n fawr at gyfraniad Val Lloyd yn gynharach, ac ni allaf ddeall pam na all yr Aelodau hynny gefnogi’r cynnig hwn heddiw. Maent yn barod i ddweud mewn erthygl papur newydd eu bod yn ysgrifennu at Gomisiwn Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru gan ofyn am dynnu’n ôl yr adroddiad gan eu bod:

‘yn credu bod diffyg sylfaenol yn y broses o gynhyrchu’r adroddiad hwn ar wasanaethau hollbwysig i blant.’

Ni allwn gael ymgynghoriad ar ddogfen sydd â diffyg sylfaenol.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Rhaid ichi orffen eich cyfraniad.

Alun Cairns: Gobeithiaf y bydd yr Aelodau a enwais, yn ogystal ag eraill a fu’n fodlon cael eu dyfynnu yn y *South Wales Evening Post* ac a fwynhaodd y cyhoeddusrwydd, yn pleidleisio yn ôl eu cydwybod ac yn cefnogi cynnig Plaid Cymru.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Cyn imi alw ar Rhodri Glyn Thomas, cydnabyddaf ddirprwyaeth yn yr oriel o Gyngres Gyffredinol Pobl Libia, o dan arweiniad eu Hysgrifennydd Materion Tramor. Croeso. [*Cymeradwyaeth.*]

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: This debate is important as it reflects an ongoing discussion on the service provided in Swansea. I urge the Chair of the Health and Social Services Committee to look at the Record of Proceedings and consider carefully the words she used today. Reference was made to a service that is neither sustainable nor safe. I want to put on record that, as a result of my relationship with Morriston Hospital, I know that the service offered to my constituents, and those of other Members, is sustainable and safe. If Kirsty Williams feels that the Record of Proceedings does not fairly reflect her view, she should ensure that it is amended.

12:05 p.m.

Yr hyn sydd yn bwysig yw ein bod yn sôn am broses ymgynghorol a seilir ar adroddiad sydd yn dod i gasgliad cyn y cynhelir yr ymgynghoriad. Yr ydym yn sôn am symud gwasanaeth o Abertawe i Gaerdydd. Nid ydym yn ystyried yr opsiynau na'r posibiladau—yr ydym yn trafod yn benodol symud gwasanaeth o Abertawe i Gaerdydd. Nid ydym yn sôn mewn unrhyw fodd yn ein cynnig, nac mewn unrhyw gyfraniad a wnaed o ochr hon y Siambr, am geisio tanseilio na gwanhau'r ddarpariaeth yng Nghaerdydd. Derbyniwn y ddadl dros ysbyty arbenigol yng Nghaerdydd, ond dadleuwn hefyd dros unedau rhanbarthol o arbenigedd—nid yn unig yn Aberawe, ond yn y Gogledd hefyd. Mae hwn i fod yn adroddiad am y gwasanaeth yng Nghymru gyfan, ond nid oes unrhyw sôn am y ddarpariaeth i bobl yn y Gogledd.

Os ydym am sôn am gynnig gwasanaeth diogel, beth sy'n digwydd i blentyn yn fy etholaeth i pan fo damwain? Sut y bydd y plentyn hwnnw yn mynd o Ddwyrain Caerfyrddin a Dinefwr i Gaerdydd heb lanfa hofrenyddion i sicrhau bod y plentyn hwnnw yn cyrraedd y gwasanaeth cyn gynted ag sydd bosibl? Mewn llawer o achosion, nid ansawdd y gwasanaeth a ddarperir pan fo'r plentyn yn cyrraedd sydd yn bwysig, ond pa mor gyflym y gall y plentyn hwnnw gyrraedd y gwasanaeth. Nid oes ystyriaeth o hynny o gwbl.

Tybiais fy mod wedi cytuno i gymryd rhan mewn ymgyrch drawsbleidiol, â phob Aelod Cynulliad sydd â buddiant etholaethol yn y gwasanaeth a gynigir o Dreforus yn gytûn bod y gwasanaeth hwnnw yn hanfodol i'w hetholwyr. Yr wyf yn dra siomedig o ddarganfod bod buddiannau gwleidyddol yn dod i mewn i'r drafodaeth hon. Yr unig fuddiant sydd gen i yw'r gwasanaeth a gynigir i blant yn fy etholaeth. Mae'n warthus bod gennym broses ymgynghorol sydd wedi ei seilio ar adroddiad sydd yn datgan y dylid cymryd y gwasanaeth hwnnw i ffwrdd oddi wrth blant yn fy etholaeth i.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I ask Members to keep their speeches short if possible.

What is important is that we are talking about a consultation exercise based on a report that draws conclusions prior to that consultation. We are talking about relocating a service from Swansea to Cardiff. We are not considering the options or the possibilities—we are specifically discussing moving a service from Swansea to Cardiff. We do not mention in any way in our motion, or in any contributions from this side of the Chamber, trying to undermine or weaken the provision in Cardiff. We accept the argument for a specialist hospital in Cardiff, but we also argue for specialist regional units—not only in Swansea, but in north Wales also. This report is supposed to be about the service in the whole of Wales, but there is no mention of the provision for people in north Wales.

If we are going to talk about offering a safe service, what happens to a child in my constituency when there is an accident? How will that child travel from Carmarthen East and Dinefwr to Cardiff without a helipad to ensure that that child reaches the service as soon as possible? In many cases, it is not the quality of the service provided when the child arrives that is important, but how quickly that child reaches the service. There is no consideration of that at all.

I thought that I had agreed to take part in a cross-party campaign, with each Assembly Member that has a constituency interest in the service that is provided from Morriston agreed that that service is crucial to their constituents. I am exceedingly disappointed to find that political interests have crept into this discussion. My only interest is the service that is provided to children in my constituency. It is disgraceful that we have a consultation process that is based on a report that states that that service should be taken away from children in my constituency.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Gofynnaf i'r Aelodau am areithiau byr os oes modd.

Gwenda Thomas: I will happily support Carwyn Jones's amendment 1, which asks the Assembly to note that a consultation process will take place between July and September 2002. I question, however, how meaningful this process will be, given that it will take place during recess. I also question whether mounting public concern has played a crucial part in prompting that public consultation.

I was pleased to join the *South Wales Evening Post's* campaign, and I congratulate the paper on its initiative. I note, however, that Brian Walters, a journalist for whom I have much respect, suggests that today's motion by Plaid Cymru may be an attempt to put Labour AMs on the spot. Why on earth should it want to do that? I also have my suspicions about the motives behind its timing. From the outset of this campaign, I have shared the hope of a leading Plaid Cymru politician, who is also a paediatric consultant, that this debate would rise above partisan politics.

Janet Ryder: Do you not accept that we asked you to bring this debate forward in Government time, and that you refused to do so? That is why we had to propose it as a minority party debate.

Gwenda Thomas: My commitment to this campaign is as strong and sincere as that of your party. The recommendations contained in the Specialised Health Service Commission for Wales's report are premature, as is today's debate. In seeking to represent my constituency, and the mounting concern that has been expressed—

Alun Cairns: How can you support an amendment that seeks consultation on a document that your colleagues—two of whom are Ministers and one who is a Deputy Minister—have described as being fundamentally flawed?

Gwenda Thomas: We must use that consultation process to make our views known.

Gwenda Thomas: Gwnaf gefnogi'n llawen welliant 1 Carwyn Jones, sy'n gofyn i'r Cynulliad nodi y bydd proses ymgynghori rhwng Gorffennaf a Medi 2002. Er hynny, amheuf i ba raddau y bydd y broses hon yn ystyrllon, o ystyried y bydd yn digwydd yn ystod y toriad. Yr wyf yn amau hefyd na fu i'r pryder cynyddol ymysg y cyhoedd chwarae rhan hollbwysig wrth symbylu'r ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus hwnnw.

Yr oeddwn yn falch o ymuno ag ymgyrch y *South Wales Evening Post*, a llongyfarchaf y papur hwnnw ar ei fenter. Fodd bynnag, sylwaf fod Brian Walters, newyddiadurwr y mae gennyf lawer o barch ato, yn awgrymu y gallai'r cynnig heddiw gan Plaid Cymru fod yn ymgais i achosi helynt i Aelodau Cynulliad Llafur. Pam ar y ddaear y byddai am wneud hynny? Mae gennyf finnau amheuon ynghylch y cymhellion yn ei amseriad. Ers dechrau'r ymgyrch hon, yr wyf yn rhannu gobaith un o wleidyddion blaenllaw Plaid Cymru, sydd hefyd yn ymgynghorydd pediatrig, y byddai'r ddadl hon yn codi uwchlaw gwleidyddiaeth ddallbleidiol.

Janet Ryder: Onid ydych yn derbyn inni ofyn ichi ddod â'r ddadl hon yn ei blaen yn amser y Llywodraeth, a'ch bod wedi gwrthod gwneud hynny? Dyna pam y bu'n rhaid inni'i chynnig fel dadl plaid leiafrifol.

Gwenda Thomas: Mae fy ymrwymiad i i'r ymgyrch hon mor gryf a didwyll ag un eich plaid chi. Mae'r argymhellion a geir yn adroddiad Comisiwn Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru'n gynamserol, fel y mae'r ddadl heddiw. Wrth geisio cynrychioli fy etholaeth, a'r pryder cynyddol a fynegwyd—

Alun Cairns: Sut y gallwch gefnogi gwelliant sy'n ceisio ymgynghori ar ddogfen y mae'ch cyd-Aelodau—y mae dau ohonynt yn Weinidogion ac un yn Ddirprwy Weinidog—wedi'i disgrifio'n un sydd â diffyg sylfaenol?

Gwenda Thomas: Rhaid inni ddefnyddio'r broses ymgynghori honno i gyfleu ein barn.

In seeking to represent my constituency and address the mounting concerns being expressed, I will campaign against moving paediatric neurosurgery services from Morriston Hospital to Cardiff. If there must be centralisation of the service, Morriston is much more accessible to Cardiff than Cardiff is from many areas of south-west Wales. I know, from family experience, how important it is that children's health services are accessible where there is a regular and prolonged need, or when an emergency arises. The benefits of retaining this service at Morriston are well documented, such as the availability of the helipad and the excellent road infrastructure, leaving aside professional medical opinions, which are better expressed by those competent and qualified to do so.

The forthcoming public consultation must be meaningful—

Nick Bourne: I agree with much of your contribution, Gwenda. You seem to support the *South Wales Evening Post's* campaign. You asked why it is trying to put Labour AMs on the spot. That is a fair question. However, is it not to see whether you have the courage to stand by the campaign which you purport to support and vote in favour of Plaid's policy, as set out in the motion, rather than reneging on your comments in the newspaper and stepping down your support for its campaign? We will support Plaid's policy because it is the correct policy.

Gwenda Thomas: You know me well enough to know that I do not lack personal courage. You are playing on words.

The forthcoming public consultation must be meaningful and wideranging. That would be assisted were the Specialised Health Services Commission for Wales to withdraw any of the recommendations in its report that may be based on preconceived views.

Brian Gibbons: We are dealing with several major issues and a small number of young patients in Wales. This complex range of services requires a high level of clinical expertise, a highly skilled support team

Wrth geisio cynrychioli fy etholaeth ac ymdrin â'r pryderon cynyddol a fynegir, byddaf yn ymgyrchu yn erbyn symud gwasanaethau llawfeddygaeth niwrolegol bediatrig o Ysbyty Treforys i Gaerdydd. Os oes rhaid canoli'r gwasanaeth, mae Treforys yn llawer mwy hygyrch i Gaerdydd nag y mae Caerdydd i lawer o ardaloedd yn y De-orllewin. Fe wn, o brofiad teuluol, mor bwysig ydyw i wasanaethau iechyd plant fod yn hygyrch pan fo angen rheolaidd ac estynedig, neu pan fydd argyfwng. Mae cryn dystiolaeth i'r manteision o gadw'r gwasanaeth hwn yn Nhreforys, fel y ffaith bod glanfa hofrenyddion ar gael a'r isadeiledd ffyrdd rhagorol, heb sôn am farn gweithwyr meddygol proffesiynol, y mae'n well ei mynegi gan y rhai sy'n alluog ac yn gymwys i wneud hynny.

Rhaid i'r ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus sydd ar ddod fod yn un ystyrlon—

Nick Bourne: Cytunaf â llawer yn eich cyfraniad, Gwenda. Mae'n ymddangos eich bod yn cefnogi ymgyrch y *South Wales Evening Post*. Gwnaethoch ofyn pam y mae'n ceisio rhoi Aelodau Cynulliad Llafur mewn helynt. Mae'n deg gofyn hynny. Fodd bynnag, onid y pwrpas yw gweld a ydych yn ddigon eofn i arddel yr ymgyrch yr ydych yn honni ei chefnogi a phleidleisio o blaid polisi Plaid Cymru, fel y'i nodir yn y cynnig, yn hytrach na chefnu ar eich sylwadau yn y papur newydd a lleihau'ch cefnogaeth i'w ymgyrch? Gwnawn ni gefnogi polisi Plaid Cymru am mai hwnnw yw'r polisi cywir.

Gwenda Thomas: Yr ydych yn fy adnabod yn ddigon da i wybod nad wyf yn brin o ddewrder. Yr ydych yn chwarae ar eiriau.

Rhaid i'r ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus sydd ar ddod fod yn un ystyrlon a chynhwysfawr. Fe hwylusid hynny pe byddai Comisiwn Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru'n tynnu'n ôl unrhyw argymhellion yn ei adroddiad a allai fod yn seiliedig ar ragdybiaethau.

Brian Gibbons: Yr ydym yn delio â sawl mater pwysig a nifer fach o gleifion ifanc yng Nghymru. Mae'r amrediad cymhleth hwn o wasanaethau'n gofyn llawer iawn o arbenigedd clinigol, seilwaith tîm

infrastructure and, most importantly, a critical number of patients to maintain the skill levels and expertise of those providing this complex care.

This is a service for about 400 children, which is less than 1 per cent of the child population of Wales. Faced with this number and the need to maintain the necessary clinical expertise, we must discuss the number of facilities that we can securely and safely provide for our children.

The status quo is not an option. Neither is it an option to expect a specialist to provide 24-hour cover seven days a week, 52 weeks a year. It is not sustainable for us to continue with the present arrangement. We know what has happened to paediatric cardiac surgery and paediatric nephrology. These services are only deliverable in south Wales through strong clinical networks with our colleagues in Bristol. If we do not get this right, the issue will not be where in Wales these services should be located, but whether they will be in Wales at all.

I am no groupie or follower of those who believe that services should be unnecessarily centralised. My record in securing a local general hospital in Port Talbot is evidence of that. My experience of that campaign taught me that we will only achieve the right result by making a strong intellectual case, being willing to defend it in public and achieving effective political mobilisation.

I do not have time to discuss in detail the important issues that must be addressed. However, I will list some of the most important. If services need to be centralised, where should that be? If we have a centre of excellence, do we have excellence of access? If we are to have specialist paediatric facilities, how extensive should they be? It is no good having a unit with two or three beds if it is not sufficient to sustain the population. Finally, what are the views of paediatricians across Wales who will be referring patients to these centres? I have been informed that all paediatricians across south Wales—from Dyfed Powys, through Carmarthen to

cynorthwyol tra medrus ac, yn bwysicaf oll, nifer gritigol o gleifion i gynnal lefelau sgiliau ac arbenigedd y rhai sy'n darparu'r gofal cymhleth hwn.

Mae hwn yn wasanaeth i tua 400 o blant, sy'n llai nag 1 y cant o boblogaeth plant Cymru. Yng ngolwg y nifer hon a'r angen i gynnal yr arbenigedd clinigol angenrheidiol, rhaid inni drafod y nifer o gyfleusterau y gallwn eu darparu'n sicr ac yn ddiogel i'n plant.

Nid yw'r sefyllfa sydd ohoni'n ddewis dichonol. Ni ellir ychwaith ddisgwyl i arbenigwr ddarparu gofal ddydd a nos saith niwrnod yr wythnos, 52 wythnos yr flwyddyn. Ni allwn barhau â'r trefniant presennol yn gynaliadwy. Gwyddom beth sydd wedi digwydd i lawfeddygaeth gardiaidd bediatrig a neffroleg bediatrig. Yr unig fodd i ddarparu'r gwasanaethau hyn yn y De yw drwy rwydweithiau clinigol cadarn gyda'n cydweithwyr ym Mryste. Os na chawn hyn yn iawn, nid ymhle yng Nghymru y dylid lleoli'r gwasanaethau hyn fydd y cwestiwn, ond a fyddant yng Nghymru o gwbl.

Nid wyf yn grwpi nac yn ddilynwr i'r rhai sy'n credu y dylid canoli gwasanaethau heb fod angen hynny. Mae fy record o ran sicrhau ysbyty cyffredinol lleol yn Port Talbot yn dyst i hynny. Dysgais drwy fy mhrofiad yn yr ymgyrch honno mai'r unig fodd inni sicrhau'r canlyniad iawn yw cyflwyno dadl ddeallusol gryf, bod yn barod i'w hamddiffyn yn gyhoeddus a sicrhau ymgyrchu gwleidyddol effeithiol.

Nid oes gennyf ddigon o amser i drafod yn fanwl y materion pwysig y mae'n rhaid ymdrin â hwy. Fodd bynnag, gwnaf restru rhai o'r pwysicaf. Os oes angen canoli gwasanaethau, ym mhle y dylid gwneud hynny? Os oes gennym ganolfan rhagoriaeth, a oes gennym ragoriaeth o ran mynediad? Os ydym i gael cyfleusterau pediatrig arbenigol, pa mor gynhwysfawr y dylent fod? Nid yw'n werth cael uned ag ynddi ddau neu dri o welyau os nad yw'n ddigon i ddiwallu anghenion y boblogaeth. Yn olaf, beth yw barn y pediatregwyr ledled Cymru a fydd yn atgyfeirio cleifion i'r unedau hyn? Fe'm hysbyswyd bod yr holl bediatregwyr ledled y

Bridgend, Pontypridd and Rhondda, Cardiff and Gwent—strongly support the SHSCW proposals, with the exception of paediatricians in Swansea. We must explore these difficulties and differences of opinion. Unless we have a full, open debate on what is best for children, where services can be best provided and how we can ensure that they are available when they are needed, we will be doing a disservice to the people whom we purport to serve.

12:15 p.m.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): We all agree that we must provide first-class services to meet children's health needs, with safe, sustainable and high-quality specialist healthcare for children based on fair access, effectiveness and stability. The child's interest is paramount in our discussions, and that is what we will be judged upon in our debates and decisions. I am pleased to support the first part of Jocelyn's motion and I reaffirm my commitment.

In recent years, specialist services for children in Wales—which affect approximately 1 per cent of the child population, as Brian said—have experienced difficulties, particularly in terms of staffing and the maintenance of required standards. In recognition of this, in September 2000 the five health authorities asked the Specialised Health Services Commission for Wales to carry out a review and prepare an all-Wales strategy for the future. Since then, three relevant reports have been published: Kirsty mentioned the Kennedy report on the Bristol Royal Infirmary inquiry; there was also the Redfern report on the Alder Hey organ retention scandal and our own Carlile report. The Royal College of Paediatricians and Child Health's report, 'The Next Ten Years', is also relevant. I urge Members to read those reports again if they want to engage in this debate.

SHSCW published two reports on 2 May—'Review of Tertiary Services for Children' and 'The Future of Specialised Healthcare for

De—o Ddyfed Powys, drwy Gaerfyrddin i Ben-y-bont ar Ogwr, Pontypridd a Rhondda, Caerdydd a Gwent—yn gryf o blaid cynigion Comisiwn Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru, heblaw am bediatregwyr yn Abertawe. Rhaid inni ymchwilio i'r anawsterau a'r gwahaniaethau barn hyn. Os na chawn ddadl agored, lawn ar yr hyn sy'n orau i blant, y lle gorau i ddarparu gwasanaethau a sut y gallwn sicrhau eu bod ar gael pan fo'u hangen, byddwn yn gwneud anghymwynas â'r bobl yr ydym yn honni eu gwasanaethu.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Yr ydym oll yn cytuno bod rhaid inni ddarparu gwasanaethau o'r safon orau i ddiwallu anghenion iechyd plant, gyda gofal iechyd arbenigol o ansawdd da sy'n ddiogel ac yn gynaliadwy ac yn seiliedig ar fynediad teg, effeithiolrwydd a sefydlogrwydd. Budd y plentyn yw'r peth pwysicaf yn ein trafodaethau, ac ar hynny y cawn ein barnu yn ein dadleuon a'n penderfyniadau. Yr wyf yn falch o gefnogi'r rhan gyntaf o gynnis Jocelyn ac ailddatganaf fy ymrwymiad.

Yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf, mae'r gwasanaethau arbenigol i blant yng Nghymru—sy'n effeithio ar tua 1 y cant o'r boblogaeth plant, fel y dywedodd Brian—wedi profi anawsterau, yn enwedig o ran staffio a chynnal y safonau gofynnol. Gan gydnabod hynny, ym Medi 2000 fe ofynnodd y pum awdurdod iechyd i Gomisiwn Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru gynnal adolygiad a pharatoi strategaeth Cymru-gyfan ar gyfer y dyfodol. Ers hynny, cyhoeddwyd tri adroddiad perthnasol: cyfeiriodd Kirsty at adroddiad Kennedy ar ymchwiliad Ysbyty Brenhinol Bryste; hefyd cafwyd adroddiad Redfern ar sgandal cadw organau Alder Hey a'n hadroddiad Carlile ni. Mae adroddiad Coleg Brenhinol Pediatreg ac Iechyd Plant, 'The Next Ten Years', yn berthnasol hefyd. Anogaf yr Aelodau i ddarllen yr adroddiadau hynny eto os dymunant ymwneud â'r ddadl hon.

Cyhoeddodd Comisiwn Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru ddau adroddiad ar 2 Mai—'Review of Tertiary Services for

the Children of Wales'. The review outlined the issues that must be addressed in Wales, and the strategy made several recommendations on how to do so. These include a reconfiguration of some services in south Wales, a strengthening of existing specialised services and continuing partnership arrangements with specialist hospitals in England for the treatment of Welsh children where appropriate. Large sections of the reports are uncontroversial and have been widely welcomed across Wales.

Do not undermine, Dai, the recognition of the excellent paediatric services provided in our district general hospitals. We all agree on their excellence, and we must ensure that that message is conveyed in today's debate. Do not forget our discussions on 'Access and Excellence', when we decided that we needed to keep Wales's 18 district general hospitals and ensure that they were accessible and provided quality healthcare. Do not forget either the investment in the health service. On your constituency, we discussed yesterday the £8.6 million for a new accident and emergency unit at Morriston Hospital, and a CT scanner at Singleton Hospital, which I visited last week.

We are investing in all the services provided in our district general hospitals, including children's services. I announced £1 million, which is recurrent, for specialist children's services. That is for investment this year and will be ongoing. It will meet the immediate needs of specialist children's services across Wales. I will announce my decision on the use of that money at the Health and Social Services Committee meeting on 17 July. I inform David that adequate time will be given to discuss this issue. We will discuss it in Committee in July and in Committee and Plenary in the autumn. This issue requires full, open debate.

SHSCW has decided to undertake formal consultation between July and September on

Children' a 'The Future of Specialised Healthcare for the Children of Wales'. Yn yr adolygiad amlinellwyd y materion y mae'n rhaid ymdrin â hwy yng Nghymru, a gwnaeth y strategaeth nifer o argymhellion ar sut i wneud hynny. Yn eu plith yr oedd ailgyflunio rhai gwasanaethau yn y De, cryfhau'r gwasanaethau arbenigol presennol a pharhau â'r trefniadau partneriaeth ag ysbytai arbenigol yn Lloegr i drin plant o Gymru pan fo'n briodol. Mae rhannau helaeth o'r adroddiadau yn annadleuol a chawsant groeso cyffredinol ledled Cymru.

Peidiwch â thanseilio'r gydnabyddiaeth i'r gwasanaethau pediatreg rhagorol a ddarperir yn ein hysbytai dosbarth cyffredinol, Dai. Yr ydym oll yn cytuno eu bod yn rhagorol, a rhaid inni sicrhau y caiff y neges honno ei chyfleu yn y ddadl heddiw. Peidiwch ag anghofio ein trafodaethau ar 'Mynediad a Rhagoriaeth', pan benderfynasom fod angen inni gadw 18 ysbyty dosbarth cyffredinol Cymru a sicrhau eu bod yn hygyrch yn ogystal â darparu gofal iechyd o ansawdd da. Nac anghofiwch ychwaith y buddsoddi yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. O ran eich etholaeth, gwnaethom drafod ddoe y swm o £8.6 miliwn ar gyfer uned damweiniau ac achosion brys newydd yn Ysbyty Treforys, a sganiwr tomograffeg gyfrifiadurol yn Ysbyty Singleton, yr ymwelais ag ef yr wythnos diwethaf.

Yr ydym yn buddsoddi yn yr holl wasanaethau a ddarperir yn ein hysbytai dosbarth cyffredinol, gan gynnwys gwasanaethau plant. Cyhoeddais £1 filiwn o wariant rheolaidd ar gyfer gwasanaethau plant arbenigol. Mae hynny i'w fuddsoddi eleni a bydd yn barhaus. Gwnaiff ddiwallu anghenion presennol gwasanaethau iechyd plant ledled Cymru. Cyhoeddaf fy mhenderfyniad ar y defnydd o'r arian hwnnw yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar 17 Gorffennaf. Hysbysaf David y bydd digon o amser yn cael ei neilltuo i drafod y mater hwn. Gwnawn ei drafod yn y Pwyllgor yng Ngorffennaf ac yn y Cyfarfod Llawn yn yr hydref. Mae'r mater hwn yn galw am drafodaeth lawn ac agored.

Mae Comisiwn Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru wedi penderfynu cynnal

the report's proposals that involve major service changes, such as those relating to paediatric neurosurgery and paediatric nephrology. We must have full consultation. The essence of consultation is that, before a final view is reached, all interested parties are offered an opportunity to make comments that will be fully considered. That is what I expect to happen.

Alun Cairns: I note your comments on the consultation. However, bearing in mind that some of your Cabinet colleagues have said that the document is fundamentally flawed, how can we have consultation on such a document? Will that consultation therefore not be flawed, because the source of the consultation and the information is, in the words of her colleagues, flawed?

Jane Hutt: In this Chamber, particularly on the health service and the healthcare of our most vulnerable children, we try to examine the evidence before us and then consult. Are you trying to make decisions before we reach our conclusions on that consultation? That is what you suggest, Alun.

Andrew Davies: I would not normally intervene in such a debate but Members have referred to me twice. I and my colleagues Edwina Hart and Val Lloyd said that the process was deeply flawed. We did not comment directly on the recommendations at that stage because it was some time ago and we were concerned that there was a lack of consultation on the whole process. Edwina Hart, Val Lloyd and I have been working on this case with consultants in Swansea for over six months to try to resolve this issue. I regret the fact that Plaid Cymru is using it as a political football. As Kirsty Williams said, so graphically and eloquently, we should be trying to provide the best solutions for the children—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. This is supposed to be an intervention, Andrew.

Andrew Davies: Will Jane take on board the concerns expressed in our meetings with her

ymgyngoriad ffurfiol rhwng Gorffennaf a Medi ar y cynigion yn yr adroddiad sy'n golygu newidiadau mawr i'r gwasanaeth, fel y rhai sy'n ymwneud â llawfeddygaeth niwrolegol bediatrig a neffroleg bediatrig. Rhaid inni gael ymgynghoriad llawn. Hanfod ymgynghori yw cynnig cyfle i bawb sydd â buddiant wneud sylwadau a gaiff eu hystyried yn llawn, cyn dod i benderfyniad terfynol. Dyna'r hyn yr wyf yn disgwyl iddo ddigwydd.

Alun Cairns: Nodaf eich sylwadau ar yr ymgynghoriad. Fodd bynnag, gan gofio bod rhai o'ch cyd-aelodau yn y Cabinet wedi dweud bod diffyg sylfaenol yn y ddogfen, sut y gallwn gael ymgynghoriad ar ddogfen o'r fath? Oni fydd yr ymgynghori hwnnw'n ddiffygiol o'r herwydd, gan fod ffynhonnell yr ymgynghoriad a'r wybodaeth, yn ngeiriau ei chyd-aelodau, yn ddiffygiol?

Jane Hutt: Yn y Siambr hon, yn enwedig mewn cysylltiad â'r gwasanaeth iechyd a gofal iechyd y plant sy'n fwyaf agored i niwed, yr ydym yn ceisio archwilio'r dystiolaeth o'n blaen ac ymgynghori wedyn. A ydych yn ceisio gwneud penderfyniadau cyn inni ddod i'n casgliadau ar yr ymgynghoriad hwnnw? Dyna'r hyn yr ydych yn ei awgrymu, Alun.

Andrew Davies: Fel arfer ni fyddwn yn ymyrryd mewn dadl o'r math hwn ond mae'r Aelodau wedi cyfeirio ataf ddwywaith. Dywedais i a'm cyd-aelodau Edwina Hart a Val Lloyd fod diffyg mawr yn y broses. Ni wnaethom sylwadau'n uniongyrchol ar yr argymhellion bryd hynny gan fod hynny gryn amser yn ôl ac yr oeddem yn bryderus bod diffyg ymgynghori ar yr holl broses. Mae Edwina Hart, Val Lloyd a minnau'n gweithio gydag ymgynghorwyr yn Abertawe ers dros chwe mis i geisio datrys y mater hwn. Mae'n ofid imi fod Plaid Cymru'n ei ddefnyddio fel pêl wleidyddol. Fel y dywedodd Kirsty Williams, yn eglur ac yn huawdl, dylem geisio darparu'r atebion gorau i'r plant—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Ymyriad ydyw hwn i fod, Andrew.

Andrew Davies: A wnaiff Jane ystyried y pryderon a fynegwyd yn ein cyfarfodydd â hi

and, in terms of her response to the Plaid Cymru motion, clarify what the process is about and what outcome she seeks?

Jane Hutt: I welcome that intervention. I was going to comment on Val Lloyd's responsible contribution as a local elected Member and—with the authority of her experience—her recognition that consultation is a process.

Alun Cairns *rose*—

Jane Hutt: I have already taken an intervention from you once, Alun.

The consultation is a process designed to ensure that those consulting make well-founded arguments and I take on board the points made by Andrew, Val and Gwenda Thomas. We must ensure that those arguments are well founded, and it will be up to the health authorities, through SHSCW, to make those arguments and to capture and take account of the views of interested individuals. Clearly, that is how we must inform the final decision.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I want to clarify a matter in the Minister for Economic Development's intervention. He said that his complaint referred to the process and not the plans. I remind you that this is what the three Swansea Members were quoted as saying in the *South Wales Evening Post* on 16 May:

'We are writing to SHSCW asking that the report be withdrawn. We believe the process by which this report on a vital service has been produced is equally flawed.'

This is what they say in today's statement:

'We, as Assembly Members representing South Wales West are working constructively to address the recommendations of the flawed report.'

Do you agree that the report is flawed? Why has it not been withdrawn at their request?

a rhoi ar ddeall, o ran ei hymateb i gynnig Plaid Cymru, beth y mae'r broses yn ymwneud ag ef a pha ganlyniad y mae'n ei geisio?

Jane Hutt: Croesawaf yr ymyriad hwnnw. Yr oeddwn am wneud sylw ar gyfraniad cyfrifol Val Lloyd fel Aelod etholedig lleol a oedd yn cydnabod—ar sail yr awdurdod sydd ganddi oherwydd ei phrofiad—fod ymgynghori'n broses.

Alun Cairns *a gododd*—

Jane Hutt: Yr wyf eisoes wedi derbyn un ymyriad gennyh, Alun.

Mae'r ymgynghoriad yn broses sydd â'r bwriad o sicrhau bod y rhai sy'n ymgynghori'n rhoi dadleuon rhesymol ac yn ystyried y pwyntiau a wnaed gan Andrew, Val a Gwenda Thomas. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod y dadleuon hynny'n rhesymol, a lle'r awdurdodau iechyd, drwy Gomisiwn Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru, fydd rhoi'r dadleuon hynny a chael ac ystyried barn yr unigolion sydd â buddiant. Mae'n amlwg mai felly y bydd yn rhaid inni oleuo'r penderfyniad terfynol.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Yr wyf am sicrhau eglurder ar fater yn ymyriad y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd. Dywedodd fod ei gŵyn yn ymwneud â'r broses ac nid y cynlluniau. Yr wyf yn eich atgoffa o eiriau'r tri Aelod o Abertawe a ddyfynnwyd yn y *South Wales Evening Post* ar 16 Mai:

'Yr ydym yn ysgrifennu at Gomisiwn Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru gan ofyn am dynnu'r adroddiad yn ôl. Credwn fod y broses o gynhyrchu'r adroddiad hwn ar wasanaeth hollbwysig yr un mor ddiffygiol.'

Dyma'r hyn a ddywedant yn y datganiad heddiw:

'Yr ydym ni, fel Aelodau Cynulliad sy'n cynrychioli De-orllewin Cymru, yn gweithio'n adeiladol i ymdrin ag argymhellion yr adroddiad diffygiol.'

A ydych yn cytuno bod yr adroddiad yn ddiffygiol? Pam nad yw wedi'i dynnu'n ôl ar eu cais?

Jane Hutt: By presenting this motion today and by making party political points you have undermined this issue. As Gwenda Thomas said, it is undermining one of the most sensitive issues that we will discuss in this Chamber. It is vital that we take party politics out of this issue and that we examine the evidence and ensure that the consultation procedure is robust. Everybody agrees that the consultation must be robust. However, Members also have responsibilities, to take note of the evidence and to read the review—because there is a review as well as a report from SHSCW. That review included an advisory group, which conducted working meetings and visits to hospitals.

It is up to all Members to then consider all the evidence and respond to that in terms of the consultation. As Minister, I have a responsibility to take note and cognisance of all the points that are submitted.

Janet Ryder *rose*—

Jane Hutt: Janet, Geraint and Alun, will you consult with clinicians and parents in your communities? This is an all-Wales report, Janet. Are you considering the whole picture of tertiary services in Wales?

12:25 p.m.

Janet Ryder *rose*—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I know that it is an important debate, but we have already spent over an hour on it. I therefore ask that we move on quickly.

Janet Ryder: Minister, could you clarify a matter that Val Lloyd mentioned? She said that the Labour AMs in south Wales had serious concerns about the children's services in Swansea before the report was published. Can you tell me what those concerns were?

Jane Hutt: I will finish by commenting on Jonathan Morgan's amendment 2, which

Jane Hutt: Drwy gyflwyno'r cynnig hwn heddiw a thrwy wneud pwyntiau pleidiol wleidyddol yr ydych wedi tansilio'r mater hwn. Fel y dywedodd Gwenda Thomas, mae'n tansilio un o'r materion mwyaf sensitif a drafodwn yn y Siambr hon. Mae'n hollbwysig ein bod yn tynnu gwleidyddiaeth plaid allan o'r mater hwn a'n bod yn archwilio'r dystiolaeth ac yn sicrhau bod y weithdrefn ymgynghori'n gadarn. Mae pawb yn cytuno bod yn rhaid i'r ymgynghoriad fod yn gadarn. Fodd bynnag, mae cyfrifoldebau gan yr Aelodau hefyd, i nodi'r dystiolaeth a darllen yr adolygiad—gan fod adolygiad yn ogystal ag adroddiad gan Gomisiwn Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru. Yr oedd yr adolygiad hwnnw'n cynnwys grŵp ymgynghorol, a gynhaliodd gyfarfodydd gweithio ac ymweliadau ag ysbytai.

Mater i'r holl Aelodau wedyn yw ystyried yr holl dystiolaeth ac ymateb iddi yn yr ymgynghoriad. Fel y Gweinidog, yr wyf yn gyfrifol am nodi a chymryd sylw o'r holl bwyntiau a ddaw i law.

Janet Ryder *a gododd*—

Jane Hutt: Janet, Geraint ac Alun, a wnewch ymgynghori â'r clinigwyr a'r rhieni yn eich cymunedau? Adroddiad i Gymru gyfan yw hwn, Janet. A ydych yn ystyried y darlun cyfan o'r gwasanaethau trydyddol yng Nghymru?

Janet Ryder *a gododd*—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Fe wn ei bod yn ddadl bwysig, ond yr ydym eisoes wedi treulio dros awr arni. Felly gofynnaf am inni symud ymlaen yn gyflym.

Janet Ryder: Weinidog, a allech egluro mater y cyfeiriodd Val Lloyd ato? Dywedodd fod gan yr Aelodau Cynulliad Llafur yn y De bryderon difrifol ynghylch y gwasanaethau plant yn Abertawe cyn cyhoeddi'r adroddiad. A allwch ddweud wrthyf beth oedd y pryderon hynny?

Jane Hutt: Terfynaf drwy wneud sylw am welliant 2 Jonathan Morgan, sy'n awgrymu y

suggests that we should set up an independent body to adjudicate these difficult decisions. We have been elected to conduct difficult debates of this kind. We also have guidance on how to undertake consultation on substantial changes in the NHS by which we must abide. We must ensure that all Members have the opportunity to include their views in the consultation process, to which I will respond as Minister.

Val Lloyd: In her intervention, Janet Ryder referred to an issue that I mentioned earlier. I wanted Jane to confirm that our discussions were on a reconfiguration of Swansea's paediatric services to make the best use of services in Singleton and Morriston and to make them separate but unified. Both responded positively.

Jane Hutt: As I said earlier, we must look to the positive contributions that paediatric services are making, including those in Morriston, Singleton and all district general hospitals across Wales. I thank Members for their comments.

David Lloyd: I am grateful to colleagues for their contributions to today's debate. In winding up, it is only fair that I pay tribute to the *South Wales Evening Post* for raising awareness of this issue and for its petition, which has collected 52,000 signatures, and registers the outrage felt in Swansea and south-west Wales at the proposed moving of paediatric neurosurgery from Morriston to Cardiff.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I have a copy of the petition in my constituency office and I offer my constituents the opportunity to sign it. I read the motion carefully and its wording reflects that of the petition that I am offering my constituents the opportunity to support. It is therefore consistent for me to argue this case in the Assembly.

David Lloyd: Exactly.

Alun Cairns: I am grateful to Dai for mentioning the petition and the fact that 52,000 people have now signed it. Should not that number be 51,994, because some who have signed the *South Wales Evening Post*

dylem sefydlu corff annibynnol i ddyfarnu ynghylch y penderfyniadau anodd hyn. Fe'n hetholwyd i gynnal dadleuon anodd o'r math hwn. Mae gennym ganllawiau hefyd ar y modd i ymgynghori ar newidiadau sylweddol yn y GIG y mae'n rhaid inni gadw atynt. Rhaid inni sicrhau y caiff yr holl Aelodau gyfle i gynnwys eu barn yn y broses ymgynghori, yr ymatebaf iddi fel Gweinidog.

Val Lloyd: Yn ei hymyriad, cyfeiriodd Janet Ryder at fater a grybwyllais yn gynharach. Yr oeddwn am i Jane gadarnhau bod ein trafodaethau yn ymwneud ag ailgyflunio gwasanaethau pediatrig Abertawe i wneud y defnydd gorau o'r gwasanaethau yn Singleton a Threforys a pheri eu bod ar wahân ond yn unedig. Cafwyd ymateb cadarnhaol gan y ddau.

Jane Hutt: Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, rhaid inni edrych ar y cyfraniadau cadarnhaol gan y gwasanaethau pediatrig, gan gynnwys y rhai yn Nhreforys, Singleton a'r holl ysbytai dosbarth cyffredinol ledled Cymru. Diolchaf i'r Aelodau am eu sylwadau.

David Lloyd: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'm cyd-Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau i'r ddadl heddiw. Wrth derfynu, nid yw ond yn deg imi dalu teyrnged i'r *South Wales Evening Post* am hybu'r ymwybyddiaeth o'r mater hwn ac am ei ddeiseb, a gafodd 52,000 o lofnodion, sy'n dangos y dicter a deimlir yn Abertawe a'r De-orllewin ynghylch y bwriad i symud llawfeddygaeth niwrolegol bediatrig o Dreforys i Gaerdydd.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Mae gennyf gopi o'r ddeiseb yn fy swyddfa etholaeth a chynigiai gyfle i'm hetholwyr ei harwyddo. Darllenais y cynnig yn fanwl ac mae'r geiriad yn adlewyrchu geiriad y ddeiseb y cynigiai gyfle i'm hetholwyr ei chefnogi. Felly, yr wyf yn gyson wrth ddadlau'r achos hwn yn y Cynulliad.

David Lloyd: Yn union.

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Dai am sôn am y ddeiseb a'r ffaith bod 52,000 o bobl wedi'i harwyddo bellach. Oni ddylai'r rhif hwnnw fod yn 51,994, gan ei bod yn bosibl bod rhai a arwyddodd ddeiseb y *South Wales*

petition may have been under a different impression, given the views expressed by some Members today?

David Lloyd: That may well be a moot point. However, this debate is about the balance between excellence and specialised centres on the one hand and local access to treatments on the other, as I said in my opening speech.

The SHSCW report is out for consultation, and this debate could provide an input into that consultation, given that Members' views were included in the Postcomm consultation after we debated postal services. Based on the representations that I have received, there is outrage and fear in Swansea and south-west Wales at the potential loss of expertise and excellence from a hospital that serves a large rural hinterland, outrage at what this will mean in terms of access and travelling costs for patients and outrage at the time it will take to treat patients in neurosurgical emergencies.

How will the downgrading of the head injury service at Morriston help to improve our health statistics, which are the worst in the UK? There is fear for the development of regional centres of excellence in Wales and for the growth—or not—of our fledgling clinical medical schools in Swansea and in north Wales. There is also fear about the future of specialist treatments for the children of Wales. Fifty-two thousand people signed the petition—what price a patient-centred NHS?

Evening Post wedi bod dan argraff wahanol, o ystyried y farn a fynegwyd gan rai Aelodau heddiw?

David Lloyd: Gellid dadlau ynghylch hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ddadl hon yn ymwneud â'r cydbwysedd rhwng rhagoriaeth a chanolfannau arbenigol ar y naill law a mynediad lleol i driniaethau ar y llall, fel y dywedais yn fy araith agoriadol.

Mae adroddiad Comisiwn Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru wedi'i ddsbarthu ar gyfer ymgynghori, a gallai'r ddadl hon fod yn fewnbwn i'r ymgynghoriad hwnnw, o ystyried bod barn yr Aelodau wedi'i chynnwys yn ymgynghoriad Postcomm ar ôl inni drafod gwasanaethau post. Yn ôl y sylwadau a dderbyniais i, mae dicter ac ofn yn Abertawe a'r De-orllewin ynghylch y posibiliad o golli arbenigedd a rhagoriaeth o ysbyty sy'n gwasanaethu cefnwlad wledig fawr, dicter ynghylch yr hyn y bydd yn ei olygu o ran mynediad a chostau teithio i gleifion a dicter ynghylch yr amser a gymer i drin cleifion mewn argyfyngau niwrolegol lawfeddygol.

Sut y bydd israddio'r gwasanaeth anafiadau i'r pen yn Nhreforys yn helpu i wella ein hystadegau iechyd, sef y rhai gwaethaf yn y DU? Mae pryder ynghylch datblygu canolfannau rhagoriaeth rhanbarthol yng Nghymru ac ynghylch twf—neu ddiffyg twf—ein hegin-ysgolion meddygol clinigol yn Abertawe a'r Gogledd. Mae pryder hefyd ynghylch dyfodol triniaethau arbenigol i blant Cymru. Arwyddwyd y ddeiseb gan 52,000 o bobl—pa werth sydd i GIG claf-ganolog?

Gwelliant 1: O blaid 25, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 18.

Amendment 1: For 25, Abstain 0, Against 18.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Graham, William
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Elin

Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 7, Ymatal 12, Yn erbyn 6.
Amendment 2: For 7, Abstain 12, Against 6.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Graham, William
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

Amended motion:

Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:

the National Assembly:

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

1. reaffirms its commitment towards supporting specialised health services for children in Wales, which should be accessible throughout Wales and reflect the need of the patient.

1. yn ailddatgan ei ymrwymiad i gefnogi gwasanaethau iechyd arbenigol i blant yng Nghymru, a ddylai fod ar gael drwy Gymru gyfan ac a ddylai adlewyrchu anghenion y claf.

2. notes that the recommendations contained in the Specialised Health Service Commission for Wales's report on specialist services for children in relation to paediatric neurosurgery will be subject to full public consultation between July and September this year.

2. yn nodi y bydd ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus llawn ar yr argymhellion yn adroddiad Comisiwn Gwasanaeth Iechyd Arbenigol i Gymru ar wasanaethau arbenigol i blant mewn perthynas â llawdriniaeth nerfol pediatrig rhwng Gorffennaf a Medi eleni

3. supports the expansion of medical education and training as set out in 'Improving Health in Wales'.

3. yn cefnogi'r gwaith o ehangu addysg a hyfforddiant meddygol fel y nodir yn 'Gwella Iechyd yng Nghymru: cynllun i'r GIG ynghyd â'i bartneriaid'.

Cynnig: O blaid 26, Ymatal 12, Yn erbyn 7.

Motion: For 26, Abstain 12, Against 7.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Davidson, Jane
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Graham, William
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Rogers, Peter

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Janet
Hancock, Brian
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried*

Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

Janice Gregory: Point of order. During questions to Jenny Randerson this morning, I failed to declare an interest as a patron of Cwm Ogwr project for youth before asking question 3 on arts in the Valleys.

Janice Gregory: Pwynt o drefn. Yn ystod y cwestiynau i Jenny Randerson y bore hwn, methais â datgan buddiant fel noddwr y prosiect i ieuenctid Cwm Ogwr cyn gofyn cwestiwn 3 am y celfyddydau yn y Cymoedd.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Your interest has been recorded.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Cofnodwyd eich buddiant.

Dadl Fer Short Debate

Yr Argyfwng yn ein Cartrefi Gofal The Crisis in Our Care Homes

Peter Rogers: The crisis in our care homes has become particularly acute over the past year. Almost daily we hear about the impending closure of local authority and independent sector homes. Up to 10 homes across Wales are closing every week. If they continue to close at this rate, we will run out of places in five years. The Assembly Government must take responsibility for this situation. It is particularly distasteful that the Minister and her Liberal Democrat supporters put some of our most vulnerable people through the distress of knowing that they will lose their homes. This distress is a killer. I do not doubt that the trauma of being turned out of your home and separated from all that is familiar is severely damaging to people who are already frail.

Peter Rogers: Mae'r argyfwng yn ein cartrefi gofal wedi mynd yn arbennig o ddifrifol dros y flwyddyn a aeth heibio. Bron bob diwrnod clywn am fygythiad i gau cartrefi awdurdod lleol a sector annibynnol. Mae hyd at 10 cartref yn cau drwy Gymru bob wythnos. Os byddant yn dal i gau mor gyflym â hyn, ni fydd gennym leoedd ar ôl ymhen pum mlynedd. Rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad dderbyn y cyfrifoldeb am y sefyllfa hon. Mae'n arbennig o annymunol bod y Gweinidog a'i chefnogwyr Democrataidd Rhyddfrydol yn rhoi rhai o'n pobl fwyaf bregus drwy'r gofid o wybod y byddant yn colli eu cartref. Mae'r gofid hwn yn lladd. Nid wyf yn amau nad yw'r ysgytwad o gael eich troi o'ch cartref a'ch gwahanu oddi wrth bopeth sy'n gyfarwydd yn niweidiol iawn i bobl sydd eisoes yn fregus.

The Minister frequently tells me that it is none of her business and is up to local authorities, but by 2005 there will be over 600,000 pensioners in Wales, many of whom will need residential care. It is a national problem and the Assembly Government has not done enough to tackle it. A time will come when local authorities will no longer be able to cope with the current position. Only last week we heard how Wrexham was to lose more than 100 beds after three private homes announced that they were to close. This terrible news is made worse by the fact that another two are likely to follow suit, and that Wrexham County Borough Council has recently closed two of its homes. Those closures mean that Wrexham alone has lost around 40 per cent of its private nursing care beds. On Monday, I learnt that millions of pounds will be spent by Carmarthenshire County Council on its homes to meet the new Assembly standards. Over time, that could also result in the loss of over 70 beds.

12:35 p.m.

Across north Wales, we face a deepening capacity crisis as homes are closed or put out of business because of lack of support from the Assembly Government. These homes provide an invaluable social service that is not recognised by this Government. The homes have been put in a position of having to subsidise a public service. In business terms, that is a recipe for disaster. Many of us have tried to point out the deepening crisis, but Ministers have buried their heads in the sand.

In Plenary on 8 January, I raised the issue with the First Minister, who seemed oblivious to it. He had the cheek to say that the current fee structure arrangements were a way of preventing escalating demands from providers. The First Minister should say that to the valued local employers who have contributed so much to the community and are being forced to cut their losses and give up. They were not just in it for the money. They spent decades building up businesses

Dywed y Gweinidog wrthyf yn aml nad yw'n fusnes iddi hi ac mai mater i'r awdurdodau lleol ydyw, ond erbyn 2005 bydd dros 600,000 o bensynwyr yng Nghymru, y bydd ar lawer ohonynt angen gofal preswyl. Problem genedlaethol yw hon ac nid yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi gwneud digon i fynd i'r afael â hi. Fe ddaw adeg pan na fydd modd bellach i'r awdurdodau lleol ymdopi â'r sefyllfa bresennol. Nid oes ond wythnos ers inni glywed y bydd Wrecsam yn colli mwy na 100 o welyau ar ôl i dri chartref preifat gyhoeddi y byddant yn cau. Mae hyn yn newydd ofnadwy a waethygir gan y ffaith bod dau arall yn debygol o'u dilyn, a bod Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Wrecsam wedi cau dau o'i gartrefi'n ddiweddar. Mae cau'r cartrefi hynny'n golygu bod Wrecsam ar ei ben ei hun wedi colli tua 40 y cant o'i welyau gofal nyrsio preifat. Ddydd Llun, cefais wybod y bydd Cyngor Sir Gaerfyrddin yn gwario miliynau o bunnoedd ar ei gartrefi i gyrraedd y safonau Cynulliad newydd. Dros amser, gallai hynny hefyd arwain at golli dros 70 o welyau.

Ledled y Gogledd, yr ydym yn wynebu argyfwng cynyddol o ran capasiti wrth i gartrefi gau neu gael eu gorfodi i gau oherwydd diffyg cymorth gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae'r cartrefi hyn yn darparu gwasanaeth cymdeithasol amhrisiadwy nas cydnabyddir gan y Llywodraeth hon. Rhoddwyd y cartrefi mewn sefyllfa o orfod sybsideiddio gwasanaeth cyhoeddus. O ran busnes, mae'n ffordd sicr o wneud llanastr. Mae llawer ohonom wedi ceisio tynnu sylw at yr argyfwng cynyddol, ond mae'r Gweinidogion wedi cuddio eu pennau yn y tywod.

Yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 8 Ionawr, codais y mater gyda Phrif Weinidog Cymru, a ymddangosai'n anymwybodol ohono. Yr oedd ganddo'r wyneb i ddweud bod trefniadau presennol y strwythur ffioedd yn fodd i rwystro gofynion cynyddol gan y darparwyr. Dylai Prif Weinidog Cymru ddweud hynny wrth y cyflogwyr lleol gwerthfawr a gyfrannodd gymaint i'r gymuned ac a orfodir i dorri eu colledion a rhoi'r gorau iddi. Nid oeddent ynnddi am yr

whereby profits were ploughed back in to improve homes for the residents. The First Minister has responsibility for north Wales; I hope that he now realises that there is a crisis.

We are in a situation where fees do not cover the costs that the Assembly Government has imposed on care homes. Clearly, we all support the introduction of the new care standards, but there has been no recognition of the fact that they have placed significant financial burdens on homes that are already under pressure. Care homes have been pushed into a corner. They are increasingly unable to pay good wages and therefore find it difficult to retain fully qualified staff. The knock-on effect is that homes are only able to attract staff with high training needs, which again, adds great cost. In addition, we cannot get an accurate picture of what local authorities have been doing with their money. Instead of acting as commissioners of care, too many concentrate on their role as providers. Massive savings could be made if councils stopped over subscribing their own homes.

There is strong evidence that we could get a more effective and high quality service from the independent sector. The warning is that we must start to work in partnership with it. Councils attempt to disguise their costs, but the truth is that best value is not being served. My rough calculations for the Isle of Anglesey County Council indicate that it could save up to £1 million every year if only it were to shift to commissioning in the independent sector. While Anglesey councillors voted to increase their standard charge by 15 per cent, they had the cheek to offer independent homeowners around 3 per cent. Therefore, the council is paying itself around £70 more per person than it could commission in the independent sector. As it happens, that £70 difference is what the Joseph Rowntree Foundation calculates is the necessary extra amount for homes to operate properly.

The Isle of Anglesey County Council cannot be trusted to deliver a cost-effective service

arian yn unig. Buont am ddegawdau'n adeiladu busnesau lle yr ailfuddsoddwyd yr elw er mwyn gwella'r cartrefi i'r preswylwyr. Mae gan Brif Weinidog Cymru gyfrifoldeb dros y Gogledd; gobeithiaf ei fod bellach yn sylweddoli bod argyfwng.

Yr ydym mewn sefyllfa lle nad yw'r ffioedd yn talu am y costau y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi'u gorfodi ar y cartrefi gofal. Wrth gwrs, yr ydym oll o blaid cyflwyno'r safonau gofal newydd, ond ni chydabuwyd eu bod wedi rhoi beichiau ariannol sylweddol ar gartrefi sydd eisoes o dan bwysau. Mae'r cartrefi gofal wedi'u gwthio i gornel. Maent yn fwyfwy analluog i dalu cyflogau da ac felly maent yn ei chael yn anodd cadw staff sydd â chymwysterau llawn. O ganlyniad i hynny nid yw'r cartrefi ond yn gallu denu staff sydd â llawer o anghenion hyfforddi ac mae hynny hefyd yn ychwanegu cost fawr. Yn ogystal â hynny, ni allwn gael darlun cywir o'r hyn a wnaeth yr awdurdodau lleol â'u harian. Yn lle gweithredu fel comisiynwyr gofal, mae gormod ohonynt yn canolbwyntio ar eu rôl fel darparwyr. Gellid cael arbedion anferth pe byddai'r cynghorau'n rhoi'r gorau i ordanysgrifio i'w cartrefi eu hunain.

Mae tystiolaeth gref y gallem gael gwasanaeth mwy effeithiol o ansawdd da gan y sector annibynnol. Fy rhybudd yw bod yn rhaid inni ddechrau gweithio mewn partneriaeth ag ef. Mae'r cynghorau'n ceisio celu eu costau, ond y gwir yw na cheir y gwerth gorau ganddynt. Yn ôl fy mras gyfrifiadau am Gyngor Sir Ynys Môn, gallai arbed hyd at £1 filiwn bob blwyddyn pe na bai ond yn symud at gomisiynu yn y sector annibynnol. Er bod cynghorwyr Ynys Môn wedi pleidleisio i gynyddu eu tâl safonol o 15 y cant, yr oedd ganddynt yr wyneb i gynnig tua 3 y cant i berchnogion y cartrefi annibynnol. Felly, mae'r cyngor yn talu tua £70 y preswlydd yn fwy iddo'i hun nag y gallai ei gomisiynu yn y sector annibynnol. Fel y mae'n digwydd, y gwahaniaeth hwnnw o £70 yw'r hyn y mae Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree yn ei gyfrifo yw'r swm ychwanegol y mae ei angen i gartrefi allu gweithredu'n briodol.

Ni ellir ymddiried yng Nghyngor Sir Ynys Môn i ddarparu gwasanaeth cost-effeithiol

or deal fairly with the independent sector. For example, despite guidance from the Assembly, the council recently tried to discriminate against residents of independent homes, which were formerly on preserved rights. The council tried to pay a lower fee for other residents and to force the shortfall to be made up from a third-party contribution such as residents' families. I raised this issue with the Minister and thankfully the council was brought to book and the authority had to reverse its position. That is just another example of how some local authorities do not play fairly. The temptation is for councils such as Anglesey to act in their own interests and not those of the elderly. Some people feel that it is time to take the decision on the fee structure away from these councils. Unless the Minister acts to establish a fair system in Wales, that call will grow much louder.

The fee structure must be rigorous and fair. Decisions should be made on the merits of each case, not according to local political prejudice. This is an issue for the Minister for Health and Social Services and the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities. Our care system is in crisis, and our money is being wasted. I do not pretend that there are easy answers; the issue boils down to extra funding.

A report on care home costs published by the Joseph Rowntree Foundation this week proposes the introduction of a care home modernisation grant, payable to each council in line with local homes' compliance with the new care standards. The foundation suggests that that would avoid overpaying those who do not comply, and would give them an incentive to invest in meeting the standards. Either way, something needs to be done urgently.

The Minister will, no doubt, tell me about the money that has been invested in tackling delayed transfers of care, or how she has set up another of those task and slumber groups. However, the money to alleviate bedblocking is not well spent if the homes to which many people need to go are closing down, which

neu ymwneud yn deg â'r sector annibynnol. Er enghraifft, er gwaethaf y cyfarwyddyd gan y Cynulliad, ceisiodd y cyngor wahaniaethu'n ddiweddar yn erbyn y preswylwyr mewn cartrefi annibynnol, a oedd gynt â hawliau diogel. Ceisiodd y cyngor dalu ffi is ar gyfer y preswylwyr eraill a gorfodi talu'r diffyg o gyfraniadau gan drydydd parti fel teuluoedd y preswylwyr. Codais y mater hwn gyda'r Gweinidog a, diolch byth, fe alwyd y cyngor i gyfrif a bu'n rhaid i'r awdurdod wrthdroi ei benderfyniad. Nid yw hynny ond yn un enghraifft arall o annhegwch rhai awdurdodau lleol. Mae temtasiwn i gynghorau fel Ynys Môn weithredu er eu budd eu hunain ac nid er budd yr henoed. Mae rhai pobl yn teimlo ei bod yn bryd mynd â'r penderfyniad ar y strwythur ffioedd oddi ar y cynghorau hyn. Os na weithreda'r Gweinidog i sefydlu system deg yng Nghymru, bydd yr alwad honno'n mynd yn gryfach o lawer.

Rhaid i'r strwythur ffioedd fod yn drylwyr ac yn deg. Dylid gwneud penderfyniadau yn ôl rhinweddau pob achos, nid yn ôl rhagfarn wleidyddol leol. Mae hyn yn fater i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau. Mae ein system gofal mewn argyfwng, a gwastraffir ein harian. Nid wyf yn cymryd arnaf fod atebion syml; mater o arian ychwanegol ydyw yn y bôn.

Mae adroddiad ar gostau cartrefi gofal a gyhoeddwyd gan Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree yr wythnos hon yn awgrymu cyflwyno grant moderneiddio cartrefi gofal, a gâi ei dalu i bob cyngor yn ôl cydymffurfiad y cartrefi lleol â'r safonau gofal newydd. Mae'r sefydliad yn awgrymu y byddai hynny'n osgoi gordalu'r rhai nad ydynt yn cydymffurfio, ac yn gymhelliad iddynt fuddsoddi i gyrraedd y safonau. Y naill ffordd neu'r llall, rhaid gwneud rhywbeth ar frys.

Mae'n siŵr y bydd y Gweinidog yn dweud wrthyf am yr arian a fuddsoddwyd i fynd i'r afael â'r oedi wrth drosglwyddo mewn gofal, neu'n dweud ei bod wedi sefydlu un arall o'r grwpiau gorchwyl a chysgu hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n werth gwario arian i leddfu blocio gwelyau os yw'r cartrefi y mae ar

means that our elderly people have nowhere to go. Not only do we have waiting lists to get into hospitals, we now have waiting lists to get out. It is a ridiculous and absurd position for the Minister to be in.

To the untrained eye, people would be forgiven for thinking that the Minister was deliberately delaying addressing the fee structure issues until there were fewer homes to go to. It seems to be a perverse streamlining exercise, and the Minister's victims are the most vulnerable members of society. I appeal to the Minister to stop playing games. The shock of being uprooted from these homes can kill, and I call on the Minister to act now.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Peter am ganiatáu munud neu ddwy imi siarad. O ran y sefyllfa yn Sir Gaerfyrddin y cyfeiriodd Peter ati, mae'n gywir i ddweud bod angen gwario £30 miliwn i godi safon cartrefi i'r lefel uchaf bosibl. Gobeithiaf ein bod oll yn cytuno bod angen codi safonau mewn cartrefi gofal yng Nghymru, ond a oes angen eu codi i'r fath safon? A ydym yn gosod y fath gost ar ein hawdurdodau lleol fel y bydd yn rhaid trosglwyddo cartrefi gofal o'u gofal?

A wnaiff y Gweinidog ymrwymo y caiff awdurdodau lleol hawl i fenthyg arian i'w galluogi i gadw cartrefi gofal ar gyfer yr henoed o fewn eu cyfrifoldeb? Dyna ddymuniad y bobl sy'n derbyn y gwasanaeth yn Nwyrain Caerfyrddin a Dinefwr. A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r sicrwydd hwnnw inni?

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): I welcome this opportunity to respond to the concerns that have been raised about the care sector. This sector plays a vital role in supporting vulnerable people and in providing employment for over 70,000 people in Wales. I continue to monitor the condition of the sector carefully. The balance between demand and supply varies from area to area in Wales. Provisional statistics for the year ending 31 March 2002 suggest that the position is beginning to stabilise. It is

lawer o bobl angen mynd iddynt yn cau, sy'n golygu nad oes gan ein hen bobl unman i fynd iddo. Yn ogystal â rhestrau aros i fynd i ysbytai, mae gennym bellach restrau aros i'w gadael. Mae sefyllfa'r Gweinidog yn un chwerthinllyd ac abswrdd.

Gellid maddau i rywun anghyfarwydd am gredu bod y Gweinidog yn gohirio mynd i'r afael â materion y strwythur ffioedd o fwriad nes y bydd llai o gartrefi y gellir mynd iddynt. Mae'n ymddangos fel pe bai'n ymarfer symleiddio gwrthnysig, a'r rhai sy'n dioddef dan law'r Gweinidog yw aelodau mwyaf bregus cymdeithas. Erfyniaf ar y Gweinidog i roi'r gorau i chwarae gêm. Mae'r ysgytwad o ddadwreiddio rhywun o'r cartrefi hyn yn gallu lladd, a galwaf ar y Gweinidog i weithredu'n awr.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I am grateful to Peter for giving me a minute or two in which to speak. As regards the situation in Carmarthenshire, to which Peter referred, it is true to say that £30 million needs to be spent to bring homes up to the highest possible standard. I hope that we all agree that standards of care homes in Wales need to be raised, but do they need to be raised to such a standard? Are we imposing such a cost on our local authorities that care homes for the elderly will have to be transferred out of their responsibility?

Will the Minister give a commitment that local authorities will have the right to borrow money so that care homes for the elderly stay within their responsibility? That is the wish of those who receive the service in Carmarthen East and Dinefwr. Will the Minister give us that assurance?

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Croesawaf y cyfle hwn i ymateb i'r pryderon a fynegwyd ynghylch y sector gofal. Mae'r sector hwn yn chwarae rôl hollbwysig drwy gynorthwyo pobl fregus a thrwy ddarparu cyflogaeth i dros 70,000 o bobl yng Nghymru. Parhaf i fonitro cyflwr y sector yn ofalus. Mae'r cydbwysedd rhwng y cyflenwad a'r galw yn amrywio o ardal i ardal yng Nghymru. Mae'r ystadegau dros dro am y flwyddyn a ddaeth i ben ar 31 Mawrth 2002 yn awgrymu bod y sefyllfa'n dechrau ymsefydlogi. Mae'n

important that we enter a period of consolidation and of upgrading standards, and consider the kind of services that we will need to serve vulnerable people in response to future demographic, social and economic changes. We must always put elderly people first, and serve them in our policies and decisions.

12:45 p.m.

The independent residential and nursing home sector currently provides over 80 per cent of residential care in Wales. In addition to providing vital services to vulnerable people, these homes are important businesses that employ substantial numbers of the social care workforce, and make valuable contributions to the local economy. I recognise that fee levels are of great concern to many. Local authorities are legally responsible for commissioning care and, as you know, I do not have the powers to tell them how much they should pay. However, the Welsh Local Government Association will include rising costs in its submission on social services spending pressures, and this will need to be considered in the Assembly's budget planning process. I have announced £17 million over two years to recognise the pressures on the sector and to help tackle delayed transfers of care. Local authorities have used some of this money to fund increased fees as part of their plans to tackle delayed transfers of care.

You cannot say, Peter, that, as Minister for Health and Social Services, this is none of my business. I agreed to set up the Wales care strategy group in March, and trying to undermine that group is not clever. It has an important strategic role and all the stakeholders and partners are involved. The group is chaired by Professor Ken Woodhouse, an eminent geriatrician and Dean of the University College of Medicine, and it held its first full meeting earlier this month. It will consider, at a strategic level, how we can assist the sector and local authorities in carrying out their respective roles. It will receive and give advice on the

bwysig inni ddechrau ar gyfnod o gryfhau a chodi safonau, ac ystyried y math o wasanaethau y bydd arnom eu hangen i wasanaethu pobl fregus mewn ymateb i newidiadau demograffig, cymdeithasol ac economaidd yn y dyfodol. Rhaid inni roi pobl oeddrannus yn gyntaf bob amser, a'u gwasanaethu yn ein polisiau a'n penderfyniadau.

Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r sector cartrefi preswyl a nyrsio annibynnol yn darparu dros 80 y cant o'r gofal preswyl yng Nghymru. Yn ogystal â darparu gwasanaethau hollbwysig i bobl fregus, mae'r cartrefi hyn yn fusnesau pwysig sy'n cyflogi niferoedd sylweddol yn y gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol, ac maent yn werthfawr o ran eu cyfraniad i'r economi leol. Cydnabyddaf fod y lefelau ffioedd yn peri pryder mawr i lawer. Mae'r awdurdodau lleol yn gyfrifol o dan y gyfraith am gomisiynu gofal ac, fel y gwyddoch, nid wyf yn meddu ar bwerau i ddweud wrthynt faint y dylent ei dalu. Fodd bynnag, bydd Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru'n cynnwys costau cynyddol yn ei chyflwyniad ar y pwysau ar wariant gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, a bydd yn rhaid ystyried hynny ym mhroses cynllunio cyllideb y Cynulliad. Yr wyf wedi cyhoeddi £17 miliwn dros ddwy flynedd i gydnabod y pwysau ar y sector ac i helpu i fynd i'r afael â'r oedi wrth drosglwyddo mewn gofal. Mae'r awdurdodau lleol wedi defnyddio rhywfaint o'r arian hwn i ariannu ffioedd uwch fel rhan o'u cynlluniau i fynd i'r afael â'r oedi wrth drosglwyddo mewn gofal.

Ni allwch ddweud, Peter, nad yw hyn yn fusnes i mi, fel y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Cytunais i sefydlu grŵp strategaeth gofal Cymru ym Mawrth, ac nid peth doeth yw ceisio tanseilio'r grŵp hwnnw. Mae iddo rôl strategol bwysig ac mae'r holl randdeiliaid a phartneriaid yn cymryd rhan. Cadeirydd y grŵp yw'r Athro Ken Woodhouse, sy'n geriatregydd amlwg ac yn Ddeon Coleg Meddygaeth y Brifysgol, a chynhaliodd ei gyfarfod llawn cyntaf yn gynharach y mis hwn. Bydd yn ystyried, ar lefel strategol, sut y gallwn gynorthwyo'r sector a'r awdurdodau lleol i gyflawni eu priod rolau.

local structures, information, and other issues that need to be considered to ensure that there is a rational process for fee setting. The Welsh Assembly Government's role must be strategic. David Melding raised this issue in the Health and Social Services Committee meeting yesterday, and I promised to provide a paper on our analysis to feed into the group's discussions on fee setting. The paper will also be provided to the Committee

We must take a holistic view of the delivery of care for vulnerable elderly people. It is our policy that they should be cared for in their homes as far as possible, and we need a strong domiciliary care sector to support them. Examples of action taken in Wales include the six weeks free home care scheme, statutory guidance to achieve greater fairness in charging for domiciliary care, and I have commissioned further work on the disregard of the disability-related benefits system for care charging. We will also consult shortly on draft regulations and standards for domiciliary care under the Care Standards Act 2000. These will address the substantial variation in the quality of domiciliary care services and, through the new registration inspection regime, improve protection for vulnerable people using care services. Later this summer, I will issue revised statutory guidance to local authorities on their commissioning and contracting practices for care services. This is key, Peter, because local authorities, the care sector and others have all been engaged in developing this new guidance, and it represents a major step forward in promoting good, consistent practice and recognises the impact that commissioning practices can have on the process. The draft has been welcomed by those involved in its development.

The sector's full involvement is key in the strategic planning of services. Current and future statutory planning guidance and the development of health and wellbeing strategies will ensure that the independent sector's voice is clearly heard in the local planning process, as it was in the discussions on the minimum standards for the Care Standards Act 2000. We need to ask, Rhodri

Bydd yn derbyn ac yn rhoi cyngor ar y strwythurau lleol, yr wybodaeth, a'r materion eraill y mae angen eu hystyried i sicrhau bod proses resymegol ar gyfer pennu ffioedd. Rhaid i rôl Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru fod yn un strategol. Cododd David Melding y mater hwn yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ddoe, ac addewais ddarparu papur ar ein dadansoddiad i gyfrannu i drafodaethau'r grŵp ar bennu ffioedd. Darperir y papur i'r Pwyllgor hefyd.

Rhaid inni gymryd golwg cyfannol ar ddarparu gofal i bobl oedranus fregus. Ein polisi ni yw y dylid gofalu amdanynt yn eu cartrefi hyd y bo modd, ac mae arnom angen sector gofal yn y cartref cryf i'w cynorthwyo. Rhai enghreifftiau o'r camau a gymerwyd yng Nghymru yw'r cynllun gofal yn y cartref am ddim am chwe wythnos a'r cyfarwyddyd statudol i sicrhau mwy o degwch wrth godi tâl am ofal yn y cartref, ac yr wyf wedi comisiynu gwaith pellach ar yr anwybyddiad i'r tâl a godir am ofal yn y system budd-daliadau sy'n gysylltiedig ag anabled. Byddwn yn ymgynghori cyn hir hefyd ar reoliadau a safonau drafft ar gyfer gofal yn y cartref o dan y Ddeddf Safonau Gofal 2000. Byddant yn ymdrin â'r amrywiad sylweddol yn ansawdd gwasanaethau gofal yn y cartref a, drwy'r gyfundrefn cofrestru ac arolygu newydd, byddant yn gwella'r amddiffyniad i bobl fregus sy'n defnyddio gwasanaethau gofal. Yn ddiweddarach yr haf hwn, byddaf yn cyhoeddi cyfarwyddyd statudol diwygiedig i'r awdurdodau lleol ar eu harferion comisiynu a chontractio ar gyfer gwasanaethau gofal. Mae hyn yn hollbwysig, Peter, gan fod yr awdurdodau lleol, y sector gofal ac eraill i gyd wedi cymryd rhan yn y gwaith o ddatblygu'r cyfarwyddyd newydd hwn, ac mae'n gam mawr ymlaen o ran hybu arfer da cyson ac yn cydnabod effaith bosibl arferion comisiynu ar y broses. Croesawyd y drafft gan y rhai a fu â rhan yn ei ddatblygu.

Mae'n hollbwysig bod y sector yn cymryd rhan lawn yn y gwaith o gynllunio strategaeth i'r gwasanaethau. Bydd y canllawiau cynllunio statudol yn awr ac yn y dyfodol a datblygu'r strategaethau iechyd a lles yn sicrhau y bydd llais y sector annibynnol i'w glywed yn eglur yn y broses cynllunio lleol, fel y digwyddodd yn y trafodaethau ar y safonau sylfaenol i'r Ddeddf Safonau Gofal

Glyn Thomas, what we would want for our elderly parents and relatives and for ourselves. Neither we nor the independent care sector in Wales wants to slip behind in terms of quality and standards. We must ensure that we all support the public and private care sectors, in moving this forward so that we have quality services of which we can be proud.

Peter is right to say that we cannot provide high quality services without high quality staff deployed across the sector. We must support and strengthen staff's skills and qualifications and tackle recruitment and retention difficulties. The task and finish group has discussed that.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I am grateful for your comments on the issue that I raised about local authorities. I agree that we must ensure the highest possible standards within the care service. However, I highlighted the fact that local authorities cannot draw down or borrow money in order to address the care standards needs in their homes. I understand that Gordon Brown will allow local authorities to do this in the near future. Will you lobby on behalf of local authorities in Wales to give them the right to draw down money so that they can keep the provision within the local authority?

Jane Hutt: I will make two points. First, in terms of the support through the revenue support grant to local authorities, I mentioned that the Welsh Local Government Association is voicing its concerns about the increasing pressures on finance for social services. Secondly, your point about borrowing ability is an issue for the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities. Discussions are ongoing with all relevant Ministers. We must be committed to moving forward to achieve the highest possible quality.

We can only move forward in partnership and by working closely together. Blame and conflict is not the way forward. These have been a difficult few months in terms of relationships. We must ensure that we return to engaging with local partnerships, with the

2000. Rhaid inni ofyn, Rhodri Glyn Thomas, beth fyddem am ei gael i'n rhieni a'n perthnasau oedrannus ac i ni'n hunain. Nid ydym ni na'r sector gofal annibynnol yng Nghymru am lithro'n ôl o ran ansawdd a safonau. Rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod ni i gyd yn cefnogi'r sectorau gofal cyhoeddus a phreifat wrth fwrw ymlaen â hyn fel bod gennym ansawdd yn ein gwasanaethau y gallwn ymfalchïo ynddo.

Mae Peter yn iawn wrth ddweud na allwn ddarparu gwasanaethau o ansawdd da heb drefnu bod staff o ansawdd da ar draws y sector. Rhaid inni hybu a chryfhau sgiliau a chymwysterau'r staff a mynd i'r afael â phroblemau recriwtio a chadw. Mae'r grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen wedi trafod hynny.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich sylwadau ar y mater a godais ynghylch awdurdodau lleol. Cytunaf fod yn rhaid inni sicrhau'r safonau uchaf posibl o fewn y gwasanaeth gofal. Fodd bynnag, tynnais sylw at y ffaith na all awdurdodau lleol dynnu i lawr neu fenthyca arian er mwyn ymdrin â'r anghenion o ran safonau gofal yn eu cartrefi. Deallaf y bydd Gordon Brown yn caniatáu i awdurdodau lleol wneud hyn yn y dyfodol agos. A wnewch lobïo ar ran yr awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru i roi hawl iddynt dynnu arian i lawr fel y gallant gadw'r ddarpariaeth o fewn yr awdurdod lleol?

Jane Hutt: Gwnaf ddau bwynt. Yn gyntaf, o ran y cymorth drwy'r grant cynnal refeniw i'r awdurdodau lleol, soniais fod Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru'n mynegi pryderon ynghylch y pwysau cynyddol ar y cyllid i wasanaethau cymdeithasol. Yn ail, mae'ch pwynt ynghylch y gallu i fenthyca'n fater i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau. Mae trafodaethau'n mynd ymlaen gyda'r holl Weinidogion perthnasol. Rhaid inni ymroi i symud ymlaen i sicrhau'r ansawdd gorau posibl.

Yr unig fodd inni symud ymlaen yw drwy bartneriaeth a chydweithio agos. Nid beio a gwrthdaro yw'r ffordd ymlaen. Bu'r misoedd diwethaf hyn yn rhai anodd o ran cydberthnasau. Rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn ailafael yn y partneriaethau lleol, gyda

Welsh Assembly Government providing strategic guidance, overview and financial support.

We must recognise the strides that have been made and the difficulties in the sector. We are working closely with Care Forum Wales and the Registered Nursing Homes Association, among others. The independent sector is sitting at the table with us, alongside local government, as we try to work through needs and issues for the benefit of those whom we all serve.

As a result of the establishment of the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales, we have a new body working in the Assembly to help us deliver on the requirements of the Care Standards Act 2000 and to ensure that we work through the new arrangements and expectations. We are monitoring the inspectorate's work carefully in these early days.

We must raise our sights above the current difficulties and consider what care services we need for the future. The strategy for older people, the steering group for which was chaired by Brian Gibbons, addressed this and other issues affecting older people. We need greater variety of provision. We have an independent sector in domiciliary care as well as in the residential and nursing homes sector. I am sure that Peter and other colleagues will question me regularly on the Wales care strategy group, and I welcome that.

Brian Hancock: You mentioned care homes for the elderly. Will you confirm that care homes for the disabled and for educationally subnormal people will be included in the overall strategy?

Jane Hutt: The strategy group will review care in Wales in general. The emphasis has been on the elderly, and particularly on nursing and residential care. Peter's contribution did not focus on the rest of the care sector. We will consider whether there is a need to examine strategic issues, which are already covered by the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales.

chyfarwyddyd strategol, arolygu a chymorth ariannol gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Rhaid inni gydnabod y camau bras a gymerwyd a'r anawsterau yn y sector. Yr ydym yn cydweithio'n agos â Fforwm Gofal Cymru a Chymdeithas y Cartrefi Nyrsio Cofrestredig, ymysg eraill. Mae'r sector annibynnol yn eistedd wrth y bwrdd gyda ni, ochr yn ochr â llywodraeth leol, wrth inni geisio trafod anghenion a materion er lles y rhai yr ydym oll yn eu gwasanaethu.

O ganlyniad i sefydlu Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru, mae gennym gorff newydd sy'n gweithio yn y Cynulliad i'n helpu i ateb gofynion y Ddeddf Safonau Gofal 2000 ac i sicrhau ein bod yn cyflawni'r trefniadau a'r disgwyliadau newydd. Yr ydym yn monitro gwaith yr arolygiaeth yn fanwl yn y cyfnod cynnar hwn.

Rhaid inni godi ein golygon uwchlaw'r anawsterau presennol ac ystyried pa wasanaethau gofal y mae arnom eu hangen ar gyfer y dyfodol. Ymdriniwyd â hyn a'r materion eraill sy'n effeithio ar bobl hŷn yn y strategaeth i bobl hŷn, y bu Brian Gibbons yn gadeirydd ar ei grŵp llywio. Mae arnom angen darpariaeth fwy amrywiol. Mae gennym sector annibynnol mewn gofal yn y cartref yn ogystal ag yn y sector cartrefi preswyl a nyrsio. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd Peter a'i gyd-aelodau'n fy holi'n rheolaidd ynghylch grŵp strategaeth gofal Cymru, ac yr wyf yn croesawu hynny.

Brian Hancock: Gwnaethoch gyfeirio at gartrefi gofal i'r henoed. A wnewch gadarnhau y bydd cartrefi gofal i bobl anabl a phobl addysgol isnormal wedi'u cynnwys yn y strategaeth gyffredinol?

Jane Hutt: Bydd grŵp y strategaeth yn adolygu gofal yng Nghymru'n gyffredinol. Bu'r pwyslais ar yr henoed, ac yn enwedig ar ofal preswyl a nyrsio. Nid oedd cyfraniad Peter yn canolbwyntio ar weddill y sector gofal. Gwnawn ystyried a oes angen archwilio'r materion strategol, sydd eisoes o dan ofal Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â
today's proceedings to a close. thrafodion heddiw i ben.

Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 12.55 p.m.
The session ended at 12.55 p.m.