



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mawrth 28 Mai 2002**

**Tuesday 28 May 2002**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 3 Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru  
*Questions to the First Minister*
- 24 Cwestiwn Brys: Dewhirst  
*Urgent Question: Dewhirst*
- 31 Datganiad ar Brosiect 14 i 19 Dysgu yng Nghymru  
*Statement on the 14 to 19 Learning in Wales Project*
- 46 Datganiad Busnes  
*Business Statement*
- 48 Pwyntiau o Drefn  
*Points of Order*
- 51 Cymeradwyo'r Gorchymyn Cynlluniau Iaith Gymraeg (Cyrff Cyhoeddus) 2002  
*Approval of the Welsh Language Schemes (Public Bodies) Order 2002*
- 65 Y Diweddaraf o ran Cynyddu Cyfranogiad yn y Celfyddydau  
*Progress Towards Achieving Participation in the Arts*

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## **Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru Questions to the First Minister**

### **Sesiwn Hawl i Holi ar gyfer y Cabinet Cabinet Open Mike Session**

**Q1 Peter Rogers:** Will the First Minister make a statement on proposals to hold a Cabinet open mike session in north Wales? (OAQ17999)

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** On 28 February I announced the principle that we would be holding an open mike session for the entire Cabinet in north Wales. I am pleased to be able to announce today the details of that meeting. It will be held on Thursday 18 July at the St George's Hotel, Llandudno.

**Peter Rogers:** Do you realise that a half-hearted Cabinet question and answer session is not good enough? The Glamorgan Cabinet is one thing; the National Assembly for Wales is quite another. The people of north Wales need to be shown that the Assembly is for the whole of Wales, and not just for south Wales. A Cabinet awayday is no substitute for holding a—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Is this a speech or a question? I want succinct and clear supplementary questions.

**Peter Rogers:** Do you accept that the proposal put forward by the Welsh Conservatives to hold Plenary sessions in north Wales for one week a year is the way forward?

**The First Minister:** I agree that there is no purpose in having a half-hearted Cabinet open mike session in north Wales; it will, therefore, be a wholehearted Cabinet session.

**Dafydd Wigley:** A dderbyniwch mai cam eilradd yw symud y Cabinet i'r Gogledd? Byddai'n llawer gwell cael Aelod o'r Gogledd—ac o rannau eraill o Gymru—yn y Cabinet na bod gennym Gabinet yr M4. Pan

**C1 Peter Rogers:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar y cynlluniau i gynnal sesiwn hawl i holi ar gyfer y Cabinet yn y Gogledd? (OAQ17999)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru (Rhodri Morgan):** Ar 28 Chwefror cyhoeddais yr egwyddor y byddem yn cynnal sesiwn hawl i holi ar gyfer y Cabinet cyfan yn y Gogledd. Yr wyf yn falch heddiw o allu cyhoeddi manylion y cyfarfod hwnnw. Fe'i cynhelir ddydd Iau 18 Gorffennaf yng Ngwesty St George, Llandudno.

**Peter Rogers:** A ydych yn sylweddoli nad yw sesiwn holi ac ateb rhwng bodd ac anfodd gyda'r Cabinet yn ddigon da? Un peth yw Cabinet Morgannwg; peth arall yn gyfan gwbl yw Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Mae angen dangos i bobl y Gogledd fod y Cynulliad ar gyfer Cymru gyfan, ac nid dim ond i'r De. Ni all un diwrnod yn y Gogledd i'r Cabinet byth gymryd lle cynnal—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ai araith ynteu cwestiwn yw hwn? Mae arnaf eisiau cwestiynau atodol cryno a chllir.

**Peter Rogers:** A dderbyniwch mai'r cynnig gan Geidwadwyr Cymru y dylid cynnal Cyfarfodydd Llawn yn y Gogledd am un wythnos y flwyddyn yw'r ffordd ymlaen?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cytunaf nad oes dim pwrpas cael sesiwn hawl i holi'r Cabinet rhwng bodd ac anfodd yn y Gogledd; mi fydd, felly, yn sesiwn llawn brwdfrydedd gyda'r Cabinet.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Do you accept that taking the Cabinet to north Wales is a second rate step? It would be far better if the Cabinet included a Member from north Wales—and other parts of Wales—rather than consisting

fo'r Cabinet yn cwrdd yn y Gogledd ym mis Gorffennaf, a gawn wybod faint o'r 400 o swyddi sydd i'w datganoli o Gaerdydd i rannau eraill o Gymru sydd eisoes wedi dod i'r Gogledd?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae hynny'n dibynnu ar drafodaethau gyda'r undebau llafur sy'n cynrychioli gweision sifil. Mae'n rhaid cynnal y trafodaethau hynny er mwyn sicrhau bod y bobl sy'n gorfod gwneud trefniadau ar gyfer addysg eu plant ac yn gorfod symud tai ac ati, yn weddol hapus i gymryd rhan yn y prosiect. Dyna pam y bu inni ddweud y bydd yn cymryd rhyw bum mlynedd i drosglwyddo tua 400 o swyddi i rannau eraill o Gymru.

solely of Members representing the M4 corridor. When the Cabinet meets in north Wales in July, will we be told how many of the 400 jobs that are to be devolved from Cardiff to other parts of Wales have already been relocated to north Wales?

**The First Minister:** That depends on negotiations with the trade unions representing civil servants. Those negotiations have to run their course in order to ensure that people who have to make arrangements for their children's education and who have to move house and so on, are reasonably happy to take part in the project. That is why we have said that it will take some five years to relocated around 400 jobs to other parts of Wales.

### **Datblygu Economaidd yn Nhyndyrn Economic Development in Tintern**

**Q2 David Davies:** Will the First Minister make a statement on what his Government is doing to promote economic development in Tintern, near Chepstow? (OAQ18006)

**C2 David Davies:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar yr hyn y mae ei Lywodraeth yn ei wneud i hyrwyddo datblygu economaidd yn Nhyndyrn, ger Cas-gwent? (OAQ18006)

**The First Minister:** Before moving on to the question of tourism in Tintern, which is clearly important, I should say that small businesses in Tintern, though not eligible for Objective 1, Objective 2 or tier 2 assistance, can avail themselves of Assembly investment grants, which are now operational. It is generally accepted that Tintern is one of the jewels in the crown of the Welsh tourism industry because of the magnificent abbey and the Wye valley scenery, and it is treated as such. Two weeks ago, Andrew Davies discussed with the Wye Valley Tourism Association the prospects of helping its tourism industry to recover from the devastating effects of foot and mouth disease, which afflicted the area last year.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cyn symud ymlaen at gwestiwn twristiaeth yn Nhyndyrn, sydd yn amlwg yn bwysig, dylwn ddweud y gall busnesau bach yn Nhyndyrn, er nad ydynt yn gymwys ar gyfer cymorth Amcan 1, Amcan 2 na haen 2, fanteisio ar grantiau buddsoddi'r Cynulliad, sydd bellach yn weithredol. Derbynnir yn gyffredinol fod Tyndyrn yn un o'r gemau yng nghoron diwydiant ymwelwyr Cymru oherwydd yr abaty godidog a harddwch golygfeydd dyffryn Gwy, ac fe'i trinnir felly. Bythefnos yn ôl, trafododd Andrew Davies gyda Chymdeithas Dwristiaeth Dyffryn Gwy y posibilrwydd o helpu ei diwydiant ymwelwyr ddod dros effeithiau difaol clwy'r traed a'r genau, a heintiodd yr ardal y llynedd.

**David Davies:** Supporting the provision of a lottery machine in Tintern may seem trivial, but it would make a big difference to the village shop, which has become a focal point for the local community. It would also mean that people would no longer have to travel to Chepstow. This would therefore contribute towards community and transport sustainability. Will you support my call for Camelot to provide Tintern with a lottery

**David Davies:** Efallai fod cefnogi darparu peiriant loteri yn Nhyndyrn yn ymddangos yn beth pitw, ond fe wnâi wahaniaeth mawr i siop y pentref, sydd erbyn hyn yn ganolbwynt y gymuned leol. Byddai hefyd yn golygu na fyddai'n rhaid i bobl deithio i Gas-gwent mwyach. Byddai hyn felly'n cyfrannu tuag at gynaliadwyedd cymunedol a thrafnidiol. A wnewch chi gefnogi fy ngalwad ar i Camelot ddarparu peiriant loteri i Dyndyrn, gan y

machine, as it would make a difference to the people of that community?

**The First Minister:** I suppose that no issue is too small for discussion in the Assembly. No request has been made for the First Minister's support for a lottery machine in Tintern's local shop, but if you want to put the business case to me, I will consider it.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats (Michael German):** My question affects the bigger picture in Tintern. Do you agree that the people of Tintern are now benefiting from Assembly investment grants, which are not available on the other side of the River Severn, and that the increase in the Wales Tourist Board's funding has been an important boost for that area in enabling it to market the Wye valley? Do you also agree that the figures for tourism in the Wye valley are now significantly increasing, which bodes well for recovery?

**The First Minister:** The level of grant aid given by the Assembly Government to the Wales Tourist Board to help the tourism industry recover across Wales, including those areas affected by foot and mouth disease, means that the figures are substantially higher than last year. We have given £22 million to the Wales Tourist Board, and it will use that to promote Wales's key tourist attractions. Undoubtedly, Tintern abbey and the Wye gorge, which runs through Tintern and Chepstow, are major attractions that bring people across the border. Once the tourists have crossed the border, it is the Wales Tourist Board's job to attract them further west to see the other glories of Wales, such as Caerphilly castle. It is important that the Wales Tourist Board has an adequate budget to help the industry recover from the effects of foot and mouth disease, which affected the Wye valley area.

**Phil Williams:** I declare an interest. I am involved in a partnership seeking European funds for virtual reality. I am sure that you share my hiraeth in wishing to experience the abbey in its original splendour. Recent advances in virtual reality mean that this is now technically possible. Do you agree that the full use of virtual reality at sites such as

byddai'n gwneud gwahaniaeth i bobl y gymuned honno?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae'n debyg nad oes unrhyw fater yn rhy fach i'w drafod yn y Cynulliad. Ni wnaethpwyd cais am gefnogaeth y Prif Weinidog i gael peiriant loteri yn siop leol Tyndyrn, ond os hoffech gyflwyno'r achos busnes imi, fe'i hystyriaf.

**Arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Mae a wnelo fy nghwestiwn i â'r darlun mwy yn Nhyndyrn. A gytunwch fod pobl Tyndyrn bellach yn elwa ar grantiau buddsoddi'r Cynulliad, nad ydynt ar gael ar ochr arall afon Hafren, ac y bu'r cynnydd yng nghyllid Bwrdd Croeso Cymru yn hwb pwysig i'r ardal honno i'w galluogi i farchnata dyffryn Gwy? A gytunwch hefyd fod ffigurau twristiaeth yn nyffryn Gwy yn cynyddu'n sylweddol erbyn hyn, sy'n argoeli'n dda ar gyfer adferiad?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae lefel y cymhorthdal a roddwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i helpu adferiad y diwydiant ymwelwyr ledled Cymru, gan gynnwys yr ardaloedd hynny yr effeithiwyd arnynt gan glwy'r traed a'r genau, yn golygu fod y ffigurau'n sylweddol uwch na'r llynedd. Yr ydym wedi rhoi £22 miliwn i Fwrdd Croeso Cymru, a bydd yn defnyddio hwnnw i hyrwyddo atyniadau allweddol Cymru i ymwelwyr. Heb os, mae abaty Tyndyrn a cheunant Gwy, sy'n rhedeg drwy Dyndyrn a Chas-gwent, yn atyniadau mawr sy'n denu pobl o'r tu hwnt i'r ffin. Unwaith i dwristiaid groesi'r ffin, gwaith Bwrdd Croeso Cymru yw eu denu ymhellach i'r Gorllewin i weld gogoniannau eraill Cymru, fel castell Caerffili. Mae'n bwysig fod Bwrdd Croeso Cymru yn cael cyllideb ddigonol i helpu'r diwydiant i ddod ato'i hun yn sgîl effeithiau clwy'r traed a'r genau, a effeithiodd ar ardal dyffryn Gwy.

**Phil Williams:** Datganaf fuddiant. Yr wyf yn ymhél â phartneriaeth sy'n ceisio cyllid Ewropeaidd ar gyfer cynllun rhithwir. Yr wyf yn siŵr y rhannwch fy hiraeth a'm hawydd i brofi'r abaty yn ei ysblander gwreiddiol. Gyda datblygiadau diweddar ym maes rhithwir, mae hyn bellach yn dechnegol bosibl. A gytunwch y gallai defnydd llawn o

Tintern could be an important boost to tourism?

**The First Minister:** My definition of hiraeth is a personal recollection. I am sure that neither you nor I, Phil, old though we are, can recall 1320, which is the year that they are attempting to recreate through a virtual reality machine. It sounds amusing, but, undoubtedly, if it works, it will have a massive impact on tourism. When you look at buildings, such as Tintern abbey, you almost want to restore the roof, and although the fact that it is a ruin makes Tintern abbey glorious, it would be pleasant to see it as it was in 1320, in virtual reality form. I do not know whether virtual reality technology will enable us to recreate William Wordsworth sitting on the banks of the river Wye, composing his ode to Tintern abbey; perhaps that could be phase 2. I am hopeful that when this virtual reality machine arrives in July, we will all rush to see it, as will tourists from all over the world. Tintern abbey is one of Wales's world-famous attractions, and this is courtesy of Mr Wordsworth.

**Delyth Evans:** Yr ydych yn gweithio i gynnal swyddi ar draws Cymru gyfan. Yn dilyn newyddion trist yr wythnos diwethaf ynglŷn â chau ffatri Dewhirst yn Abertawe, a oes unrhyw—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae cwestiwn brys wedi'i ganiatáu ar y mater hwn, a sicrhaf y bydd Delyth Evans yn cael ei galw i siarad ar y cwestiwn hwnnw. Mae'r cwestiwn hwn yn ymwneud â Thyndyrn, nid Abertawe. Down at Abertawe yn y man.

### **Adolygu Targedau 'Cynllun i Gymru 2001' Review of Targets in 'Plan for Wales 2001'**

**Q3 Jocelyn Davies:** Does the First Minister have any plans to review the targets in the 'Plan for Wales 2001' strategic document? (OAQ18012)

2:10 p.m.

**The First Minister:** We constantly update the targets according to need due to successes or obstacles that may have arisen since the plan was drafted. For example, following our commitment to infant school class sizes of no

rithwir mewn safleoedd fel Tyndyrn fod yn hwb pwysig i dwristiaeth?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Atgof personol yw fy niffiniaid i o hiraeth. Yr wyf yn siŵr na allwch chi na mi, Phil, er hyned yr ydym, gofio 1320, sef y flwyddyn y maent yn ceisio'i hail-greu drwy beiriant rhithwir. Mae'n swnio'n ddigrif ond, heb amheuaeth, os y gweithia, caiff effaith aruthrol ar dwristiaeth. Pan edrychwch ar adeiladau fel abaty Tyndyrn, bron na theimlwch awydd i adfer y to, ac er bod y ffaith ei fod yn adfail yn rhoi gogoniant i abaty Tyndyrn, byddai'n braf ei weld fel yr oedd yn 1320, ar ffurf rithwir. Ni wn a wnaiff technoleg rithwir ein galluogi i ail-greu William Wordsworth yn eistedd ar lan afon Gwy, yn cyfansoddi ei gerdd i abaty Tyndyrn; efallai mai cam 2 fydd hwnnw. Yr wyf yn ffyddiog pan gyrhaedda'r peiriant rhithwir hwn ym mis Gorffennaf, y gwnawn oll ruthro i'w weld, fel y gwnaiff twristiaid o bedwar ban byd. Mae abaty Tyndyrn yn un o atyniadau bydenwog Cymru, a hynny diolch i Mr Wordsworth.

**Delyth Evans:** You are working to maintain jobs across the whole of Wales. Following last week's sad news about the closure of the Dewhirst factory in Swansea, is there—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. An urgent question has been allowed on this matter, and I will ensure that Delyth Evans is called to speak on that question. This question concerns Tintern, rather than Swansea. We will discuss Swansea in due course.

**C3 Jocelyn Davies:** A oes gan y Prif Weinidog unrhyw gynlluniau i adolygu'r targedau a nodir yn y ddogfen strategol, 'Cynllun i Gymru 2001'? (OAQ18012)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Diweddarwn y targedau o hyd yn ôl yr angen yn wyneb llwyddiannau neu rwystrau a gododd ers drafftio'r cynllun. Er enghraifft, yn dilyn ein hymrwymiad i sicrhau na fyddai maint

more than 30 pupils, which was achieved by September last year, we made the same commitment to junior school class sizes. We are getting there: 22 per cent of junior classes had over 30 pupils in September last year, but this is now down to 20 per cent and we hope that it will be 15 per cent by September this year.

**Jocelyn Davies:** When reviewing your targets, will you follow the Westminster Government, which is likely to drop a third of its performance targets as they will not be met? If not, are you confident that your 2003 targets will be achieved in time for next year's elections?

**The First Minister:** Target setting is a means of deciding on reasonably achievable objectives, if matters go the right way in terms of resources and responses by those agencies through which we work, such as in the national health service, local government, the voluntary sector and elsewhere. You cannot always adhere religiously to those targets, but we set them with the view that, with a strong shove from the Assembly Government and goodwill from the other agents, we will achieve them. There is no question of following the Westminster Government. It will attempt to achieve its targets, as we will attempt to achieve ours.

**John Griffiths:** Building confidence in Wales and the elusive feel-good factor is important to achieving our 'Plan for Wales' targets. In that context, the success of our national rugby team, and rugby in Wales in general, is significant. Will you continue to press for a streamlined, professional-era model to ensure that Welsh rugby prospers and succeeds?

**The First Minister:** Any strategy by a body such as the Welsh Rugby Union must try to achieve targets. That involves trying to be financially viable, which appears not to be the case at present, and being successful on the playing field. The one complements the other. That can only be achieved if the present amateur-style administration—which is reminiscent of the old pre-reform local government in its structure—is replaced by

dosbarthiadau babanod yn fwy na 30 disgybl, a gyflawnwyd erbyn mis Medi'r llynedd, gwnaethom yr un ymrwymiad ar gyfer meintiau dosbarthiadau ysgol iau. Yr ydym ar y ffordd: yr oedd gan 22 y cant o ddosbarthiadau iau fwy na 30 disgybl ym Medi y llynedd, ond mae hyn bellach wedi disgyn i 20 y cant a gobeithiwn y bydd yn 15 y cant erbyn mis Medi eleni.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Wrth adolygu'ch targedau, a wnewch chi ddilyn Llywodraeth San Steffan, sy'n debygol o ollwng traean o'i thargedau perfformiad oherwydd na chânt eu cyrraedd? Os na, a ydych yn hyderus y cyrhaeddir eich targedau am 2003 mewn pryd ar gyfer etholiadau'r flwyddyn nesaf?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae gosod targedau'n fodd o benderfynu ar amcanion y gellir yn rhesymol eu cyflawni, os aiff popeth yn iawn o ran adnoddau ac ymatebion gan yr asiantaethau hynny y gweithiwn drwyddynt, fel yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol, llywodraeth leol, y sector gwirfoddol a manau eraill. Ni allwch bob amser lynu'n gadarn at y targedau hynny, ond bu inni eu gosod gan feddwl eu cyflawni, gyda hwb cryf gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ac ewyllys da gan yr asiantau eraill. Nid yw'n fater o ddilyn Llywodraeth San Steffan. Bydd hi'n ceisio cyrraedd ei thargedau hi, fel y ceisiwn ninnau gyrraedd ein rhai ni.

**John Griffiths:** Mae adeiladu hyder yng Nghymru a'r teimlad da annelwig hwnnw'n bwysig i gyflawni'n targedau yn ein 'Cynllun i Gymru'. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, mae llwyddiant ein tîm rygbi cenedlaethol, a rygbi yng Nghymru'n gyffredinol, yn arwyddocaol. A wnewch chi barhau i bwysio am fodel effeithlon i'r oes broffesiynol er mwyn sicrhau bod rygbi Cymru'n ffynnu ac yn llwyddo?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Rhaid i unrhyw strategaeth gan gorff megis Undeb Rygbi Cymru geisio cyrraedd targedau. Golyga hynny geisio bod yn hyfyw yn ariannol, nad yw'n ymddangos fel pe bai'n wir ar hyn o bryd, a llwyddo ar y maes chwarae. Mae'r naill yn cyd-fynd â'r llall. Ni ellir cyflawni hynny heb ddisodli'r weinyddiaeth amaturaidd bresennol—sy'n atgoffa dyn o'r hen lywodraeth leol cyn y diwygio o ran ei

fully professional administration at the top that will generate the income to pay, train and coach the players for the Welsh team to become successful once more on the field of play.

**Mick Bates:** Are you aware that 95 per cent of books published in Wales are not available in a format that blind and partially-sighted people can read? In reviewing the targets for the 'Plan for Wales', will you support the Royal National Institute for the Blind Cymru's call for the UK Government to set up a £20 million fund for the right to read so that blind people are no longer discriminated against?

**The First Minister:** I think that you are, in the main, referring to Welsh language books. I must declare an interest as one member of my family would be keen to avail herself of such books were they available. The boredom arising from losing seven eighths of your sight—as many do with age—is a major problem. Sensory deprivation happens, and it can affect people who would enjoy reading books in Welsh. I will consider this matter further and send you a written reply.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** To return to the issue of targets, on which the question was asked, I would like to ask my question before you start your job swap with Glanmor Griffiths. Westminster is dropping all of its targets; I do not know if you intend to do the same with the targets that you set yourself at the time of the last Assembly elections to wipe out the outpatient waiting list. That currently stands at 70,000, nearly enough to fill the Millennium Stadium. Is this still a matter of confidence?

**The First Minister:** This is a matter in which we continually strive to do two things at the same time. The first is to wipe out the outpatient waiting list. However, we have also introduced service frameworks that, in effect, uncover more illness. By imposing a duty on general practitioners to approach the community to call people in for screening for cholesterol levels or whatever, more illness is uncovered, which must then be referred and adds to the outpatient waiting list. We did not

strwythur—a sefydlu gweinyddiaeth gwbl broffesiynol yn ei lle ar y brig a fydd yn cynhyrchu'r incwm i dalu a hyfforddi'r chwaraewyr er mwyn i dîm Cymru lwyddo unwaith eto ar y maes chwarae.

**Mick Bates:** A ydych yn ymwybodol nad yw 95 y cant o'r llyfrau a gyhoeddir yng Nghymru ar gael mewn fformat y gall pobl ddall a rhannol ddall ei ddarllen? Wrth adolygu'r targedau ar gyfer y 'Cynllun i Gymru', a wnewch chi gefnogi galwad Sefydliad Cenedlaethol Brenhinol y Deillion yng Nghymru ar i Lywodraeth y DU sefydlu cronfa o £20 miliwn ar gyfer yr hawl i ddarllen fel na wahaniaethir mwyach yn erbyn y deillion?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Credaf eich bod, yn bennaf, yn cyfeirio at lyfrau Cymraeg. Rhaid imi ddatgan buddiant gan y byddai un aelod o'm teulu'n falch o fanteisio ar lyfrau o'r fath pe baent ar gael. Mae'r diflastod sy'n codi o golli saith rhan o wyth o'ch golwg—fel y gwna llawer wrth heneiddio—yn broblem fawr. Amddifedir un o'r synhwyrâu, a gall effeithio ar bobl a fyddai'n mwynhau darllen llyfrau Cymraeg. Ystyriaf y mater hwn ymhellach ac anfon ateb ysgrifenedig atoch.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** A dychwelyd at fater targedau, sef pwnc y cwestiwn, hoffwn ofyn fy nghwestiwn i cyn i chi fynd ati i gyfnewid swyddi gyda Glanmor Griffiths. Mae San Steffan yn gollwng ei thargedau i gyd; ni wn a fwriadwch chi wneud yr un peth gyda'r targedau a osodasoch ichi'ch hun adeg etholiadau diwethaf y Cynulliad i ddiddymu'r rhestr aros i gleifion allanol. Saif honno ar hyn o bryd ar 70,000, bron yn ddigon i lenwi Stadiwm y Mileniwm. A ydyw hyn yn dal i fod yn fater o hyder?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Dyma fater lle ymdrechwn yn barhaus i wneud dau beth ar yr un pryd. Y cyntaf yw dileu'r rhestr aros i gleifion allanol. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym hefyd wedi cyflwyno fframweithiau gwasanaeth sydd, mewn gwirionedd, yn datguddio mwy o salwch. Drwy osod dyletswydd ar feddygon teulu i fynd i'r gymuned i alw pobl i mewn i gael eu sgrinio am lefelau colesterol neu beth bynnag, datguddir mwy o waeledd, y mae'n rhaid wedyn ei gyfeirio, gan ychwanegu at y



expect that to happen to the extent that it did when the targets were set before the last election.

**Nick Bourne:** That sounds dangerously close to blaming the patients for the extent of the waiting list. I draw your attention to a waiting list in Morriston, and this is not a reflection on the professionalism of the consultant, the clinicians or the nurses. One consultant has a waiting list of over eight years from initial outpatient appointment to operation. This is serious. When will something constructive be done about this? You are nowhere near to achieving your 1999 flagship policy. The position is worsening. I will repeat my question: is this regarded as an issue of confidence?

**The First Minister:** If you write to me about the consultant to whom you refer, I will ensure that Jane Hutt or I will reply.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Er mwyn cyrraedd y targedau a osodwyd gan y Llywodraeth yn y cynllun—os yw'n ceisio eu cyrraedd—rhaid neilltuo adnoddau. Yn eich ateb i Jocelyn Davies, bu i chi gyfeirio at y targedau ar addysg. Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod wedi gwranddo â diddordeb ar sylwadau Gordon Brown ym Mhontypridd yr wythnos diwethaf ar ei ymweliad â Phrifysgol Morgannwg. Dywedodd y byddai'n rhoi arian ychwanegol yn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant i'w wario ar addysg, ysgolion, colegau a phrifysgolion. Gan iddo siarad yng Nghymru, y disgwyl yw y bydd cynnydd sylweddol mewn gwariant ar addysg yn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant. A allwch roi addewid y bydd yr arian y byddwch yn ei dderbyn yn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant yn cyfateb i'r agenda a osodwyd gan Gordon Brown?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Fel Albanwr, mae Gordon Brown yn ymwybodol o sut y mae datganoli'n gweithio. Yr ydym yn derbyn arian ychwanegol drwy fformiwla Barnett ac wedyn yn penderfynu, drwy fecaneg arferol ein proses gyllidebol, ar beth i wario'r arian. Mae'r arian yn mynd drwy beirianwaith y Cynulliad a'r broses o sefydlu cyllid yn ôl ein blaenoriaethau. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod Gordon

rhestr aros i gleifion allanol. Nid oeddem yn disgwyl i hynny ddigwydd i'r graddau y gwnaeth pan osodwyd y targedau cyn yr etholiad diwethaf.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae hynny'n swnio'n beryglus o agos at feio'r cleifion am hyd y rhestr aros. Tynnaf eich sylw at restr aros yn Nhreforys, ac nid yw hyn yn adlewyrchiad ar broffesiynoldeb yr ymgynghorydd, y clinigwyr na'r nyrsys. Mae gan un ymgynghorydd restr aros o dros wyth mlynedd o'r apwyntiad claf allanol cyntaf i'r llawdriniaeth. Mae hyn yn ddifrifol. Pa bryd y gwneir rhywbeth adeiladol am hyn? Nid ydych yn unlle'n agos at gyflawni'ch prif bolisi o 1999. Mae'r sefyllfa'n gwaethygu. Ailadroddaf fy nghwestiwn: a ystyrir hyn yn fater o hyder?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Os ysgrifennwch ataf ynglŷn â'r ymgynghorydd y cyfeiriwch ato, sicrhaf y cewch ateb gan Jane Hutt neu gennyf fi.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** If the Government is serious about achieving the targets set out in the plan, resources must be allocated. In your reply to Jocelyn Davies, you referred to the education targets. I am sure that you listened with interest to Gordon Brown's comments in Pontypridd last week during his visit to the University of Glamorgan. He said that he would provide additional funding in the comprehensive spending review to be spent on education, schools, colleges and universities. Given that he was speaking in Wales, the expectation is that there will be a substantial increase in spending on education in the CSR. Can you promise that the funding that you receive in the CSR will correspond to the agenda that Gordon Brown has set?

**The First Minister:** As a Scot, Gordon Brown knows how devolution works. We receive additional funding through the Barnett formula and then decide through the usual budgetary mechanisms how that money should be spent. The funding is then processed through the Assembly's internal mechanisms and allocated according to our priorities. I am sure that Gordon Brown is

Brown yn ymwybodol o hynny.

Mae pawb yn derbyn bod yr hyn a ddywedodd Gordon Brown yr wythnos diwethaf ym Mhrifysgol Morgannwg yn newyddion da gan ei fod yn amcangyfrif y bydd gwariant ar addysg yn cynyddu. Yr oedd yn cyfeirio at addysg yn Lloegr ond mae'r cyllid ychwanegol yn llifo tuag at y Cynulliad a'n cyfrifoldeb ni yw gwneud penderfyniadau ar sut i'w wario.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Rhaid i mi gyfaddef y byddai pobl Cymru yn ei chael yn anodd i feddwl bod Gordon Brown yn siarad am addysg yn Lloegr tra'n siarad ym Mhrifysgol Morgannwg, Pontypridd. Os oedd yn siarad yng Nghymru am wario ar addysg, mae gan bobl Cymru yr hawl i ddisgwyl y byddai hynny'n cynnwys ymrwymiad ar gyfer Cymru.

Tynnaf eich sylw at y ffaith fod lefel gwariant ar addysg y pen yng Nghymru wedi gostwng yn ystod eich cyfnod fel Prif Weinidog yn ôl ffigurau cymharol y Trysorlys. Er enghraifft, syrthiodd gwariant yng Nghymru o 102 y cant y pen o gyfartaledd y Deyrnas Gyfunol i 98 y cant y llynedd, sydd yn dangos gostyngiad o 4 y cant. Os bydd pobl Cymru yn gwranddo ar yr hyn yr ydych chi a Gordon Brown yn ei ddweud, mae'n rhaid disgwyl y bydd y cynnydd yn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant sydd ar ddigwydd yn sylweddol uwch na'r cynnydd a neilltuwyd ar gyfer addysg yn ystod cyfnod yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant presennol. A wnewch chi roi addewid pendant na fyddwn yn syrthio yn ôl o ran gwariant y pen yn ystod cyfnod nesaf yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** O ran gwariant ar addysg, bu'r un patrwm yn datblygu dros y 10 mlynedd diwethaf mewn rhai ardaloedd o Loegr, yn enwedig yn Llundain. Nid oes un ardal yng Nghymru yn cymharu â Llundain; mae 22 o weithiau yn fwy nag unrhyw ddinas yng Nghymru. Mae'r patrwm allan o drefn oherwydd bod gwariant y pen yn Llundain dros £4,000 y flwyddyn. Nid oes ffigurau cymharol. Dyna beth sydd yn camystumio'r ystadegau hyn ac yn creu patrwm camarweiniol. Os ydych yn tynnu Llundain

aware of that.

We all agree that Gordon Brown's comments last week at the University of Glamorgan were good news because he predicted that expenditure on education will increase. He was referring to expenditure in England, but the additional funding will also be available to the Assembly and it is our responsibility to decide how it is spent.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I must admit that the people of Wales would find it difficult to believe that Gordon Brown was referring solely to education in England while speaking at the University of Glamorgan, Pontypridd. As his comments on education budgets were delivered in Wales, the people of Wales have the right to assume that they included a commitment for Wales.

I draw your attention to the fact that, according to the Treasury's comparative figures, the spending level on education per capita in Wales has decreased during your tenure as First Minister. For example, last year expenditure in Wales fell from 102 per cent per capita of the UK average to 98 per cent, which represents a drop of 4 per cent. If the people of Wales are going to listen to what you and Gordon Brown are saying, we must expect the increase in the forthcoming CSR to be substantially higher than the increase that you allocated for education in the current CSR. Will you give a firm assurance that we will not fall further behind in terms of per capita expenditure during the next CSR round?

**The First Minister:** On education expenditure, the same pattern has been emerging over the past 10 years in some areas of England, particularly in London. No area in Wales compares with London; it is 22 times larger than any city in Wales. The pattern is out of kilter because expenditure per capita in London is over £4,000 per annum. There are no comparative figures. That is what skews these statistics and creates a misleading pattern. If you exclude London from the statistics, given that it is unique, the

o'r ystadegau gan ei bod yn enghraifft unigryw, mae gwariant y pen yng Nghymru yn uwch na gwariant y pen yn Lloegr.

per capita expenditure in Wales is higher than that in England.

### **Cysylltiadau rhwng y Cynulliad a Seneddau Datganoledig Hŷn Links between the Assembly and Older Devolved Parliaments**

**Q4 Peter Black:** What is being done to strengthen links between the National Assembly for Wales and the older devolved parliaments that exist in the UK—the Isle of Man, Jersey and Guernsey? (OAQ17995)

**C4 Peter Black:** Beth sy'n cael ei wneud i gryfhau'r cysylltiadau rhwng Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a'r Seneddau datganoledig hŷn yn y DU—Ynys Manaw, Jersey a Guernsey? (OAQ17995)

2:20 p.m.

**The First Minister:** These are interesting and ancient parliaments; the Tynwald is sometimes said to be the most ancient parliament in the world in continuous existence. The Assembly is at the other end of the scale. We communicate with other parliaments in the British isles via the British-Irish Council, which will soon meet again. The Isle of Man parliament is running a project on telemedicine on behalf of the council. The next meeting of telemedicine experts involved in this project will be held in Cardiff on 10 June.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Seneddau diddorol a hynafol yw'r rhain; dywedir weithiau mai'r Tynwald yw'r senedd fwyaf hynafol yn y byd mewn bodolaeth barhaus. Mae'r Cynulliad ar ben arall y raddfa. Cyfathrebwn â seneddau eraill yn ynysoedd Prydain drwy'r Cyngor Prydeinig-Gwyddelig, a fydd yn cyfarfod eto'n fuan. Mae senedd Ynys Manaw'n rhedeg prosiect ar delefeddygaeth ar ran y cyngor. Cynhelir y cyfarfod nesaf o'r arbenigwyr ar delefeddygaeth sy'n ymwneud â'r prosiect hwn yng Nghaerdydd ar 10 Mehefin.

**Peter Black:** We share a common interest with some members of the British-Irish Council in terms of our support of minority languages. How is the National Assembly taking forward support for minority languages within that forum?

**Peter Black:** Rhannwn ddiddordeb cyffredin gyda rhai o aelodau'r Cyngor Prydeinig-Gwyddelig yn nhermau'n cefnogaeth i ieithoedd lleiafrifol. Sut y mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn datblygu cefnogaeth i ieithoedd lleiafrifol o fewn y fforwm hwnnw?

**The First Minister:** Luckily, the state of the Welsh language in Wales is not comparable to that of the Manx language in the Isle of Man, which I think died out some 200 years ago, although it has been revived in recent times; in Jersey and Guernsey there is some interest in reviving the use of French. Language is one area of common interest. Sellafield is another as regards the north Wales coast, the Isle of Man, Northern Ireland and the Irish Republic. However, such developments are being taken forward creatively under the umbrella of the British-Irish Council.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yn ffodus, ni ellir cymharu cyflwr yr iaith Gymraeg yng Nghymru â chyflwr y Fanaweg yn Ynys Manaw, a fu farw o'r tir ryw 200 mlynedd yn ôl, yr wyf yn credu, er iddi gael ei hadfer yn y cyfnod diweddar; yn Jersey a Guernsey ceir rhywfaint o ddiddordeb mewn adfer y defnydd o Ffrangeg. Un maes diddordeb cyffredin yw iaith. Un arall yw Sellafield, o safbwynt arfordir gogledd Cymru, Ynys Manaw, Gogledd Iwerddon a Gweriniaeth Iwerddon. Fodd bynnag, eir â datblygiadau o'r fath yn eu blaen yn greadigol dan ymbarél y Cyngor Prydeinig-Gwyddelig.

**William Graham:** I am not sure that those parliaments agree that they are devolved. However, do you agree that we should endeavour to learn from these established

**William Graham:** Nid wyf yn siŵr bod y seneddau hynny'n cytuno eu bod wedi'u datganoli. Fodd bynnag, a gredwch y dylem geisio dysgu oddi wrth y seneddau sefydledig

parliaments and retain direct electoral representation for Wales so that the Westminster Government remains supreme?

**The First Minister:** Their relationship with the UK was not correctly expressed in Peter's question. They are not part of the United Kingdom, but of the British isles, which is why I answered the question as I did. They are quite independent except with regard to defence and foreign policy, which they subcontract to the British Government. They are not, therefore, members of the European Union, although they are obliged, following various pressures relating to offshore finance and tax evasion, to abide by certain EU regulations, which I understand they are happy to do.

**John Griffiths:** Do you agree that links between Wales and the Channel Islands have developed apace since devolution and that one important vehicle for that has been our membership of the Commonwealth Parliamentary Association? We recently hosted a successful regional conference attended by the Channel Islanders and I hope to visit the Tynwald, the Isle of Man's open-air parliament, in July.

**The First Minister:** I referred to the relationship between governments in my answer and I am pleased, John, that you referred to the relationship between parliaments in order to enhance the picture. I am always slightly thrown by the word 'Tynwald', which I understand means 'the power thing' in old Norse. Therefore, I tend to consider the relationship between governments rather than parliaments. However, the open-air parliament is notable and is similar to the parliament in Iceland. Such parliaments are wonders of the world and long may they continue.

**Brian Hancock:** In order to strengthen the links between Wales and other devolved parliaments it is important that Wales has a strong sense of identity. In response to a Treasury Select Committee report, published last Friday, the UK Government conceded that the National Assembly for Wales should have a more formal role in agreeing the content of the census form in future. Will you

hyn a chadw cynrychiolaeth etholiadol uniongyrchol i Gymru fel bod Llywodraeth San Steffan yn parhau i deyrnasu?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ni fynegwyd eu perthynas â'r DU yn gywir yng nghwestiwn Peter. Nid ydynt yn rhan o'r Deyrnas Unedig, ond o ynysoedd Prydain, a dyna pam yr atebais y cwestiwn fel y gwneuthum. Maent yn gwbl annibynnol ac eithrio ym materion amddiffyn a pholisi tramor, y maent yn eu his-gontractio i Lywodraeth Prydain. Nid ydynt, felly, yn aelodau o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd, er fod yn rhaid iddynt, yn dilyn amryfal bwysau ynghylch cyllid alltraeth ac osgoi trethi, gadw at reoliadau penodol o eiddo'r UE, y deallaf eu bod yn ddigon bodlon gwneud.

**John Griffiths:** A gytunwch fod cysylltiadau rhwng Cymru ac Ynysoedd y Sianel wedi datblygu'n gyflym ers datganoli ac mai un cyfrwng pwysig ar gyfer hynny fu ein haelodaeth o Gymdeithas Seneddol y Gymanwlad? Yn ddiweddar, cynaliasom gynhadledd ranbarthol lwyddiannus a fynychwyd gan Ynyswyr y Sianel a gobeithiaf ymweld â'r Tynwald, senedd awyr-agored Ynys Manaw, ym mis Gorffennaf.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cyfeiriais at y berthynas rhwng llywodraethau yn fy ateb ac yr wyf yn falch, John, ichi gyfeirio at y berthynas rhwng seneddau er mwyn ychwanegu at y llun. Caf fy nhaflu oddi ar fy echel braidd gan y gair 'Tynwald', sydd yn ôl a ddeallaf yn golygu 'y peth grym' mewn hen Norseg. Felly, tueddaf i ystyried y berthynas rhwng llywodraethau yn hytrach na seneddau. Fodd bynnag, mae'r senedd awyr-agored yn nodedig ac yn debyg i'r senedd yng Ngwlad yr Iâ. Mae seneddau o'r fath ymhlith rhyfeddodau'r byd a boed iddynt hir oes.

**Brian Hancock:** Er mwyn cryfhau'r cysylltiadau rhwng Cymru a seneddau datganoledig eraill mae'n bwysig fod gan Gymru synnwyr hunaniaeth cryf. Mewn ymateb i adroddiad gan Bwyllgor Dethol y Trysorlys, a gyhoeddwyd ddydd Gwener diwethaf, addefodd Llywodraeth y DU y dylai Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru gael rôl fwy ffurfiol wrth gytuno ar gynnwys ffurflen

ensure that a Welsh tick box will be included and that—

y cyfrifiad yn y dyfodol. A wnewch chi sicrhau y cynhwysir blwch tic i'r Cymry ac y—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This question is not about tick boxes.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid cwestiwn am flychau ticio yw hwn.

### **Hyrwyddo'r Gogledd fel Atyniad i Dwristiaid Promotion of North Wales as a Tourist Attraction**

**Q5 Janet Ryder:** How does the First Minister intend to promote north Wales as a popular tourist attraction? (OAQ18008)

**C5 Janet Ryder:** Sut y mae'r Prif Weinidog yn bwriadu hyrwyddo'r Gogledd o ran bod yn atyniad poblogaidd i dwristiaid? (OAQ18008)

**The First Minister:** The record budget of £22.6 million provided to the Wales Tourist Board for this financial year has enabled it to substantially increase the resources for developing and marketing the whole of Wales as a tourist destination. Regarding north Wales, you will probably be pleased to hear that I can now convert the anecdotal evidence that I previously referred to into reasonably accurate figures. The first quarter of this tourist season in north Wales has been good. In March, the occupation rate of hotel bed space increased to 37 per cent compared to 31 and 32 per cent in previous years. The occupation rate of guest house bed space increased to 28 per cent compared to 19 and 9 per cent in previous years.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae'r gyllideb uchaf erioed o £22.6 miliwn a ddarparwyd i Fwrdd Croeso Cymru am y flwyddyn ariannol hon wedi galluogi iddo gynyddu yn sylweddol yr adnoddau ar gyfer datblygu a marchnata Cymru gyfan fel cyrchfan i ymwelwyr. O ran y Gogledd, mae'n debyg y byddwch yn falch o glywed y gallaf bellach droi'r dystiolaeth anecdotaidd y cyfeiriais ati'n flaenorol yn ffigurau eithaf cywir. Bu chwarter cyntaf y tymor ymwelwyr hwn yn y Gogledd yn dda. Ym mis Mawrth, cododd canran y gwelyau mewn gwestai a oedd wedi'u cymryd i 37 y cant, o gymharu â 31 a 32 y cant mewn blynyddoedd blaenorol. Cynyddodd canran y gwelyau llawn mewn gwestai bach i 28 y cant o gymharu â 19 a 9 y cant mewn blynyddoedd blaenorol.

**Janet Ryder:** I am sure that you would agree that Ruthin is one of the most popular tourist destinations in north Wales and that Denbighshire County Council is to be congratulated on opening the old jail as a new attraction. Do you also agree that the town would greatly benefit from developing Nantclwyd House as a third attraction in Ruthin? Will you do everything you can to support Denbighshire County Council's bid to develop Nantclwyd House as a museum?

**Janet Ryder:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunech fod Rhuthun yn un o'r cyrchfannau twristiaidd mwyaf poblogaidd yn y Gogledd a bod Cyngor Sir Ddinbych i'w longyfarch ar agor yr hen garchar fel atyniad newydd. A gytunwch hefyd y byddai'r dref ar ei hennill yn fawr pe datblygid Tŷ Nantclwyd yn drydydd atyniad yn Rhuthun? A wnewch chi bopeth a allwch i gefnogi cais Cyngor Sir Ddinbych i ddatblygu Tŷ Nantclwyd fel amgueddfa?

**The First Minister:** If you write to me, I will take up that point. As far as I know, Ruthin is not located within the four tourism growth areas designated by the Wales Tourist Board. Those areas are: Llandudno, Conwy, Deganwy, which constitute one area and has received £2 million of ring-fenced funding; Caernarfon, which has received £1 million of ring-fenced funding; Wrexham, Llangollen

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Os ysgrifennwch ataf, fe roddaf sylw i'r pwynt hwnnw. Hyd y gwn i, nid yw Rhuthun o fewn y pedair ardal twf twristiaeth a ddynodwyd gan Fwrdd Croeso Cymru. Dyma'r ardaloedd hynny: Llandudno, Conwy, Deganwy, sy'n cyfrif fel un ardal ac sydd wedi derbyn £2 filiwn o gyllid penodol; Caernarfon, a gafodd £1 filiwn o gyllid penodol; Wrecsam, Llangollen

and the Dee Valley, which has received £1.5 million; and Betws-y-Coed, which has received £500,000. I am sorry that Ruthin is not on that list but I did not choose those priorities. If you write to me about that particular project, I will ensure that you get a reply either from me or from the chair of the Wales Tourist Board.

**Alun Pugh:** I do not know whether you have ever had the chance to ride a bicycle on your many and frequent visits to north Wales, but do you agree that completing the north Wales coast cycle path would be a fantastic asset for sustainable tourism in north Wales?

**The First Minister:** I do not know the details of that project but activity tourism is the right way forward. The traditional seaside holiday will probably not be the source of growth in future for our traditional resorts, big and small. However, activity holidays will provide that growth. Some people will want to cycle on the flat and others, with the best quality mountain bikes and legs like oak trees, may be able to cycle up Snowdon. The marketing of Wales as a mountain biking and cycling country will be a source of growth in activity holidays.

**Alun Cairns:** Do you accept that in order to have a thriving and prosperous tourism industry, we need to attract more people into the industry to exploit the opportunities provided? Do you also accept that compulsory registration will prevent people from entering the industry?

**The First Minister:** That question is a two edged sword. This issue has developed between the Wales Tourist Board and the accommodation providers, and the Welsh registration method, which is being sold as an accommodation registering package to other countries, is seen as having a beneficial effect. People accept the quality of the accommodation because they know that it has been verified by grading scheme inspectors. It is a much better scheme than the one operating in England, which tells you if your bedroom has a trouser press, but does not tell you if your cup of tea will be nice. The Welsh method concentrates on the quality of services and not just on the tick-in-the-box

a Glyn Dyfrdwy, a gafodd £1.5 miliwn; a Betws-y-Coed, a gafodd £500,000. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf nad yw Rhuthun ar y rhestr honno ond nid fi a ddewisodd y blaenoriaethau hynny. Os ysgrifennwch ataf ynglŷn â'r prosiect arbennig hwnnw, fe sicrhaf y cewch ateb naill ai gennyf fi neu gan gadeirydd Bwrdd Croeso Cymru.

**Alun Pugh:** Ni wn a gawsoch gyfle erioed i reidio beic ar eich ymweliadau niferus a mynych â'r Gogledd, ond a gytunwch y byddai cwblhau lôn feicio arfordir y Gogledd yn gaffaeliad gwych i dwristiaeth gynaliadwy yn y Gogledd?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid wyf yn gyfarwydd â manylion y prosiect hwnnw, ond twristiaeth gweithgareddau yw'r ffordd ymlaen. Mae'n debyg na fydd y gwyliau glan môr traddodiadol yn ffynhonnell twf yn y dyfodol i'n trefi gwyliau traddodiadol, yn fawr a bach. Fodd bynnag, bydd gwyliau gweithgareddau'n darparu'r twf hwnnw. Bydd rhai pobl eisiau reidio beic ar dir gwastad a bydd eraill, gyda'r beiciau mynydd gorau a choesau fel coed derw, yn gallu seiclo i fyny'r Wyddfa. Bydd marchnata Cymru fel gwlad seiclo a beicio mynydd yn creu twf mewn gwyliau gweithgareddau.

**Alun Cairns:** A dderbyniwch, er mwyn cael diwydiant ymwelwyr ffyniannus a llewyrchus, fod angen inni ddenu mwy o bobl i'r diwydiant i ecsbloetio'r cyfleoedd sydd ar gael? A dderbyniwch hefyd y bydd cofrestru gorfodol yn rhwystro pobl rhag ymuno â'r diwydiant?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cleddyf deufin yw'r cwestiwn hwnnw. Mae'r mater hwn wedi datblygu rhwng Bwrdd Croeso Cymru a'r darparwyr llety, a gwelir fod y dull cofrestru Cymreig, sy'n cael ei werthu fel pecyn cofrestru llety i wledydd eraill, yn cael effaith fuddiol. Mae pobl yn derbyn ansawdd y llety oherwydd y gwyddant ei fod wedi'i gadarnhau gan arolygwyr y cynllun graddio. Mae'n gynllun llawer gwell na'r un sy'n weithredol yn Lloegr, sy'n dweud wrthyh os oes gwasgydd trowsus yn eich ystafell, ond nid a fydd eich cwpanaid o de yn un dda. Mae'r dull Cymreig yn canolbwyntio ar ansawdd gwasanaethau ac nid dim ond ar yr agwedd ticio blychau.

aspect.

As regards people finding it more difficult to enter the industry at the bottom level, I am not sure if the future of the tourism industry is at that level. You must provide a high-quality tourism product to compete against the hotter and dryer countries of southern Europe, made easy to reach by cheap charter flights.

O ran bod pobl yn ei chael yn fwy anodd ymuno â'r diwydiant ar y lefel isaf, nid wyf yn siŵr ai ar y lefel honno y mae dyfodol y diwydiant ymwelwyr. Rhaid darparu cynnyrch twristiaeth o ansawdd uchel i gystadlu yn erbyn gwledydd poethach a sychach de Ewrop, sydd bellach o fewn cyrraedd hawdd drwy deithiau hedfan siarter rhad.

### **Cynyddu Ymwybyddiaeth o Fusnes y Cynulliad Increased Awareness of Assembly Business**

**C6 Glyn Davies:** Beth y mae'r Prif Weinidog yn ei wneud i gynyddu ymwybyddiaeth o fusnes y Cynulliad ymysg pobl y Gogledd? (OAQ18007)

**Q6 Glyn Davies:** What is the First Minister doing to increase awareness of the Assembly's business among the people of north Wales? (OAQ18007)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf eisoes wedi cyfeirio at y materion hyn. Yr wyf yn benderfynol o sicrhau bod holl bobl Cymru—yn y Gogledd ac yn y rhanbarthau eraill—yn ymwybodol o sut y mae gwaith Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o fantais uniongyrchol iddynt. Dyna pam ein bod yn cynnal sesiwn hawl i holi yn Llandudno ym mis Gorffennaf. Dyna hefyd un o'r rhesymau pam y bydd y strategaeth adleoli yn arwain at gael mwy o swyddi'r gwasanaeth sifil mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru.

**The First Minister:** I have already referred to this matter. I am determined to ensure that all the people of Wales—in the north and in other regions—know how they benefit directly from the Welsh Assembly Government's work. That is why we are holding an open mike session in Llandudno in July. It is also one of the reasons why the relocation strategy will relocate more civil service jobs to other parts of Wales.

**Glyn Davies:** Beth yw eich barn ar bwynt cynharach Peter Rogers? A gytunwch y gellid cysylltu'n fwy effeithiol â phobl gogledd Cymru pe bai Cyfarfod Llawn y Cynulliad yn cael ei gynnal yng ngogledd Cymru unwaith y flwyddyn?

**Glyn Davies:** What is your opinion on Peter Rogers's earlier point? Do you agree that more effective links could be forged with people in north Wales if Assembly Plenary sessions were held in north Wales on an annual basis?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr ydych yn anghofio gwaith Pwyllgor Rhanbarth y Gogledd. Mae poblogeiddrwydd y pwyllgor hwnnw yn parhau i synnu pawb. Mae 100, 200 neu 300 o bobl yn mynychu cyfarfodydd y Pwyllgor hwnnw yn gyson. Dyna'r ffordd ymlaen. Rhaid sicrhau bod Gweinidogion y Llywodraeth yn bresennol ac yn ateb cwestiynau gwirioneddol pobl y Gogledd er mwyn cael gwybod ble yn union y mae'r esgid yn gwasgu.

**The First Minister:** You are forgetting the work of the North Wales Regional Committee. That committee's popularity never ceases to amaze people. The Committee frequently attracts 100, 200 or even 300 people. That is the way forward. We must ensure that Government Ministers are present, to field questions from the people of north Wales so that we know exactly what is causing concern.

2:30 p.m.

**Peter Law:** Will you bring pressure to bear

**Peter Law:** A wnewch chi ddwyn pwysau ar

on the Permanent Secretary to ensure that important Government advertisements in the press are spread fairly across Wales's quality evening newspapers, such as the *South Wales Argus*, and not concentrated, as at present, in one or—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. As far as I am aware, the *South Wales Argus* is not sold in north Wales.

**Peter Law:** I said 'across Wales', and mentioned newspapers such as the *South Wales Argus*.

**The Presiding Officer:** Your question will be in order if you include the *Wrexham Evening Leader*.

**Peter Law:** I am sure that the *Wrexham Evening Leader*, the *South Wales Echo* and the *South Wales Evening Post* are as good, but the *South Wales Argus* covers the area that I represent. Will the First Minister bring pressure to bear on the Permanent Secretary—there is another career gone—to ensure that he advertises fairly and not only in two daily newspapers which, on several occasions, fail to reach the Welsh people?

**The First Minister:** That issue has been discussed on many occasions. Our recruitment consultants, the Permanent Secretary and the Assembly's Personnel Division have views on this. Those views are not necessarily shared by evening newspapers' editors and advertising managers. I will consider this issue with the Permanent Secretary and will report back to you and any other interested Members.

**Gareth Jones:** A gytunwch mai'r ffordd orau o gynyddu ymwybyddiaeth pobl y Gogledd o waith y Cynulliad—yn enwedig mewn etholaethau megis Conwy, lle ceir y lefelau cyflog isaf ym Mhrydain Fawr—fyddai trwy wella cyfleoedd cyflogaeth a chael swyddi parhaol o safon? Byddai hynny'n gwella ansawdd bywyd unigolion. Sut y bwriadwch gyflawni hynny?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Fel y gwyddoch, gall lefel cyflogau fod yn isel mewn ardaloedd lle mae diwydiannau fel y diwydiant gofal a'r

yr Ysgrifennydd Parhaol i sicrhau y caiff hysbysebion pwysig yn y wasg gan y Llywodraeth eu gwasgaru'n deg ar draws papurau nos safonol Cymru, fel y *South Wales Argus*, ac nid eu crynhoi, fel a wneir ar hyn o bryd, mewn un neu—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Hyd y gwn i, ni werthir y *South Wales Argus* yn y Gogledd.

**Peter Law:** 'Ar draws Cymru' a ddywedais i, gan grybwyll papurau newydd fel y *South Wales Argus*.

**Y Llywydd:** Bydd eich cwestiwn mewn trefn os soniwch hefyd am y *Wrexham Evening Leader*.

**Peter Law:** Yr wyf yn siŵr fod y *Wrexham Evening Leader*, y *South Wales Echo* a'r *South Wales Evening Post* lawn crystal, ond y *South Wales Argus* yw papur yr ardal a gynrychiolaf fi. A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddwyn pwysau ar yr Ysgrifennydd Parhaol—dyna yrfa arall wedi mynd—i sicrhau ei fod yn hysbysebu'n deg ac nid dim ond mewn dau bapur dyddiol sydd, ar lawer achlysur, yn methu â chyrraedd pobl Cymru?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Trafodwyd y mater hwnnw ar sawl achlysur. Mae gan ein hymgynghorwyr recriwtio, yr Ysgrifennydd Parhaol ac Adran Bersonél y Cynulliad farn ar hyn. Ni rennir y farn honno o reidrwydd gan olygyddion a rheolwyr hysbysebion y papurau min nos. Ystyriaf y mater hwn gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Parhaol ac adroddaf yn ôl i chi ac unrhyw Aelodau eraill sydd â diddordeb.

**Gareth Jones:** Do you agree that the best way of increasing awareness of the Assembly's work among the people of north Wales—particularly in constituencies such as Conwy, which has the lowest salary levels in Great Britain—would be to improve employment opportunities and attract quality permanent jobs to these areas? That would improve quality of life. How do you intend to achieve that?

**The First Minister:** As you know, wage levels can be low in areas where industries such as the care industry and the tourism



diwydiant twristiaeth yn flaenllaw. Dyna broblem ardal fel Conwy. Yr ateb yw amrywio natur yr economi fel bod llawer o fathau gwahanol o swyddi â chyflogau gwahanol ar gael. Mae'r strategaeth honno wedi lleihau diweithdra yng Nghonwy, ond efallai nad yw wedi effeithio ar lefelau cyflog hyd yn hyn.

industry are prominent. That is the problem in areas such as Conwy. The solution is to diversify the economy so that many different kinds of jobs with different salaries are available. That strategy has reduced unemployment in Conwy, but perhaps it has not yet had an effect on salary levels.

### **Trafodaethau ar Ddeddfwriaeth Iechyd Discussions on Health Legislation**

**Q7 Alun Pugh:** Will the First Minister make a statement on discussions he has had with the Secretary of State for Wales on forthcoming health legislation? (OAQ17993)

**C7 Alun Pugh:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar unrhyw drafodaethau y mae wedi'u cael gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynghylch deddfwriaeth arfaethedig ar iechyd? (OAQ17993)

**The First Minister:** I have only had brief communications with the Secretary of State for Wales on the draft NHS (Wales) Bill. It is mentioned frequently, but the main communications at this stage of the proceedings on the draft Bill involve the Minister for Health and Social Services, Jane Hutt, and Don Touhig, the Parliamentary Under-Secretary of State at the Wales Office who is guiding the Bill through the House of Commons. I should also mention the Tobacco Advertising and Promotion Bill, which is a backbench Bill that has been introduced in the House of Lords. The Government has said that it will find time for the passage of that Bill to be completed. There will be an implication for us, as draft regulations will be issued when the Bill receives Royal Assent. We have been told that we will be consulted on the content of those draft regulations.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Trafodaethau byr yn unig a gefais gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ar Fesur drafft y GIG (Cymru). Sonnir amdano'n aml, ond mae'r prif drafodaethau ar hyn o bryd yn y drefn ar y Mesur drafft yn digwydd gyda'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, Jane Hutt, a Don Touhig, yr Is-Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Seneddol yn Swyddfa Cymru sy'n tywys y Mesur drwy Dŷ'r Cyffredin. Dylwn grybwyll hefyd y Mesur Hysbysebu a Hyrwyddo Tybaco, sy'n Fesur meinciau cefn a gyflwynwyd yn Nhŷ'r Arglwyddi. Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi dweud y gwnaiff ganfod amser ar gyfer cwblhau hynt y Mesur hwnnw. Bydd goblygiadau i ni, gan y cyhoeddir rheoliadau drafft pan gaiff y Mesur Gydsyniad Brenhinol. Dywedwyd wrthym yr ymgynghorir â ni ar gynnwys y rheoliadau drafft hynny.

**Alun Pugh:** You will have seen the article in *The Lancet* on 13 April, which concluded that advertising bans on smoking work, as do smoking restrictions in public places. Will you join me in congratulating the UK Government on banning advertising? Do you agree that the draft NHS (Wales) Bill gives the Assembly the opportunity to cut the death toll from coronary heart disease and lung cancer in Wales?

**Alun Pugh:** Byddwch wedi gweld yr erthygl yn *The Lancet* ar 13 Ebrill, a ddaeth i'r casgliad fod gwahardd hysbysebion ysmegu yn gweithio, ynghyd â chyfyngu ar ysmegu mewn mannau cyhoeddus. A wnewch chi ymuno â mi i longyfarch Llywodraeth y DU am wahardd hysbysebu? A gytunwch fod Mesur drafft y GIG (Cymru) yn rhoi cyfle i'r Cynulliad leihau'r nifer fawr o farwolaethau o glefyd coronaidd y galon a chanser yr ysgyfaint yng Nghymru?

**The First Minister:** We all welcome the fact that the Tobacco Advertising and Promotion Bill has come into the Government fold via a

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr ydym i gyd yn croesawu'r ffaith fod y Mesur Hysbysebu a Hyrwyddo Tybaco wedi dod i gorlan y

Liberal Democrat backbencher in the House of Lords. All being well, it will become law before long and regulations will have to be passed. Smoking in public places is a different and much wider issue. Both factors have the potential to greatly reduce deaths and chronic ill health as a result of smoking, and I am sure that the Government will promote them appropriately. They may not be appropriate for the draft NHS (Wales) Bill, but they will be appropriate for legislation at the right time. I hope that that is soon.

**David Lloyd:** Datganaf fuddiant fel meddyg teulu. Beth sy'n digwydd yn awr o ran gofal personol am ddim i'r henoed?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr ydym yn dal i wasgu ar y Llywodraeth o ran gofal personol am ddim i'r henoed wedi'r chwe wythnos gyntaf. Yr wyf yn siŵr fod Dai'n croesawu'r ffaith bod y chwe wythnos gyntaf o ofal personol am ddim ers 1 Ebrill. Wedi'r chwe wythnos gyntaf, mae cymhlethdod yn codi o ran rheolau budd-daliadau—byddech yn colli'ch budd-dâl pe baech yn derbyn gofal personol am ddim. Dyna'r broblem a gododd yn yr Alban, ac nid ydym am gwympto i'r un fagl yng Nghymru. Dyna pam y bu inni lywio'r strategaeth ar hyd argymhellion y grŵp ymgynghorol ar y strategaeth i bobl hŷn, a sefydlwyd gan y Llywodraeth.

**David Melding:** As the First Minister knows, the draft NHS (Wales) Bill will be discussed in the Health and Social Services Committee meeting tomorrow, and amendments have been tabled. If amendments are carried in Committee and Plenary, will you have a briefing session with the Wales Office team to defend those amendments when the Bill enters the formal parliamentary process?

**The First Minister:** Yes, of course, as must be the case. There is one exception to that, which is where amendments are intended to wreck the Bill. That would be thoroughly undesirable, as it would risk the loss of the Bill altogether.

Llywodraeth drwy gyfrwng Democrat Rhyddfrydol o'r meinciau cefn yn Nhŷ'r Arglwyddi. Os bydd popeth yn dda, bydd yn ddeddf cyn hir a bydd yn rhaid pasio rheoliadau. Mae ysmegu mewn mannau cyhoeddus yn fater gwahanol a llawer ehangach. Mae gan y ddau ffactor y potensial i sicrhau lleihad mawr mewn marwolaethau ac afiechyd cronig o ganlyniad i ysmegu, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Llywodraeth yn eu hyrwyddo'n briodol. Efallai na fyddant yn briodol ar gyfer Mesur drafft y GIG (Cymru), ond byddant yn briodol ar gyfer deddfwriaeth ar yr adeg iawn. Gobeithiaf y bydd hynny'n fuan.

**David Lloyd:** I declare an interest as a general practitioner. What is happening now in terms of free personal care for the elderly?

**The First Minister:** We are continuing to put pressure on the Government on the issue of free personal care for the elderly after the first six weeks. I am sure that Dai welcomes the fact that the first six weeks of personal care have been free since 1 April. After the first six weeks, problems arise with benefits regulations—you would lose your benefit payments if you received free personal care. That problem arose in Scotland, and we do not want to fall into the same trap in Wales. That is why we have guided the strategy along the recommendations of the advisory group on the strategy for older people, established by the Government.

**David Melding:** Fel y gŵyr y Prif Weinidog, trafodir Mesur drafft y GIG (Cymru) yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yfory, ac mae gwelliannau wedi'u cyflwyno. Os caiff gwelliannau eu derbyn yn y Pwyllgor a'r Cyfarfod Llawn, a gewch chi sesiwn briffio gyda thîm Swyddfa Cymru i amddiffyn y gwelliannau hynny pan aiff y Mesur i'r broses seneddol ffurfiol?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Caf, wrth gwrs; rhaid i hynny ddigwydd. Mae un eithriad i hynny, sef lle bwriedir i welliannau ddifetha'r Mesur. Byddai hynny'n gwbl annymunol, gan y byddai perygl o gollir Mesur yn gyfan gwbl.

## **Creu Cymunedau Cryf Creating Strong Communities**

**Q8 Nick Bourne:** What progress is being made in creating the strong communities described in ‘Plan for Wales 2001’? (OAQ18004)

**The First Minister:** Several Assembly programmes and initiatives are aimed at creating strong communities. For example, the Communities First programme—now firmly established as a successor to People in Communities—drives regeneration in Wales’s most deprived communities. We are also working closely with the Youth Justice Board to develop an all-Wales youth offending strategy, and it is reviewing the services available to tackle substance misuse problems.

**Nick Bourne:** One way to create strong communities is to ensure that unitary authorities devolve functions to local community and town councils. What thought has the administration given to this? Some time ago, I attended an inaugural meeting of such a process in Knighton, Radnorshire. I am keen to support it, and it has cross-party and cross-community support. Is anything constructive being done about it?

**The First Minister:** Community and town councils vary greatly in their ambitions, and some have no wish to raise a precept to carry out improvements to the local playing fields or village halls. A massive initiative is underway the length and breadth of Wales to improve village halls, with resources coming mostly from the lottery, via the Wales Council for Voluntary Action. That initiative is at the behest of village hall owners, which tend to be the councils to which you refer.

**Kirsty Williams:** Do you accept that an important part of a strong community, especially in rural areas, is the existence of a village post office? Do you regret SWALEC’s recent decision to prevent people from paying their electricity bills by cheque at village post offices? Such payments will now attract a £1.15 fee per transaction. That

**C8 Nick Bourne:** Pa gamau sy’n cael eu cymryd tuag at greu’r cymunedau cryf a ddisgrifir yn y ‘Cynllun i Gymru 2001’? (OAQ18004)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae llawer o raglenni a mentrau’r Cynulliad yn anelu at greu cymunedau cryf. Er enghraifft, mae rhaglen Rhoi Cymunedau’n Gyntaf—sydd bellach wedi hen ennill ei phlwyf fel olynnydd i Bobl mewn Cymunedau—yn gyrru adfywiad yng nghymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig Cymru. Yr ydym yn gweithio’n agos hefyd gyda’r Bwrdd Cyfiawnder Ieuenctid i ddatblygu strategaeth troseddwyd ifanc i Gymru gyfan, ac mae’n adolygu’r gwasanaethau sydd ar gael i fynd i’r afael â phroblemau camddefnyddio sylweddau.

**Nick Bourne:** Un ffordd i greu cymunedau cryf yw sicrhau bod awdurdodau unedol yn datganoli swyddogaethau i gynghorau tref a chymuned. Pa ystyriaeth y mae’r weinyddiaeth wedi’i rhoi i hyn? Ychydig yn ôl, mynychais gyfarfod cyntaf proses o’r fath yn Nhrefyco, Sir Faesyfed. Yr wyf yn awyddus i gefnogi hyn, a chaiff gefnogaeth ar draws y pleidiau ac ar draws y gymuned. A oes unrhyw beth adeiladol yn cael ei wneud yn ei gylch?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae cynghorau tref a chymuned yn amrywio’n fawr o ran eu huchelgeisiau, ac mae rhai sydd heb unrhyw awydd codi treth i wneud gwelliannau i’r cae chwarae lleol neu neuadd y pentref. Mae cynllun enfawr ar droed ar hyd a lled Cymru i wella neuaddau pentref, gydag adnoddau a ddaw’n bennaf oddi wrth y loteri, drwy Gyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru. Cychwynwyd hyn ar gais perchenogion y neuaddau pentref, sef, fel arfer, y cynghorau y cyfeiriwch atynt.

**Kirsty Williams:** A dderbyniwch mai rhan bwysig o gymuned gryf, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd gwledig, yw bodolaeth swyddfa bost pentref? A ydych yn gresynu ynghylch penderfyniad diweddar SWALEC i atal pobl rhag talu eu biliau trydan â siec mewn swyddfeydd post pentref? Bellach bydd rhaid talu ffi o £1.15 am bob trafodiad o’r fath.

will have a dramatic effect on elderly people in rural constituencies, as well as on the long-term survival of those post offices.

**The First Minister:** I regret anything that undermines the viability of the local post office, particularly where it is the only shop in an area as well as being a provider of benefits, services and advice. We are about to go through something of a revolution in the purpose of post offices as they cease to be the providers of benefits. Benefits are to be paid directly into people's accounts. The Government is experimenting in Leicestershire; it is promoting post offices there by making them providers of general Government services, including driving licences. We will lose benefit payments, but will gain a universal bank and gain the general package of Government services.

**Pauline Jarman:** Will you announce when and how much money will be available in Wales for round 2 of the Coalfield Regeneration Trust, bearing in mind that the Department for Transport, Local Government and the Regions announced a further £45 million in England, and that the Scottish Executive was given £3 million?

**The First Minister:** I will have to write to you on that matter. However, I will ensure that the services provided—whether via the Coalfield Regeneration Trust or via a package in which it may play a part—are fully on a par with, if not better than, what is available in England and Scotland.

2:40 p.m.

### **Gwella Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus yng Nghymru Improving Public Services in Wales**

**Q9 Ieuan Wyn Jones:** What discussions has the First Minister had with the Secretary of State for Wales regarding improving public services in Wales? (OAQ18013)

Caiff hynny effaith ddramatig ar bobl oedranus mewn etholaethau gwledig, yn ogystal ag ar oroesiad y swyddfeydd post hynny yn y tymor hir.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Gresynaf at unrhyw beth sy'n tanseilio hyfywedd y swyddfa bost leol, yn enwedig lle mai hi yw'r unig siop mewn ardal yn ogystal â bod yn ddarparwr budd-daliadau, gwasanaethau a chyngor. Yr ydym ar fin mynd trwy fath o chwyldro ym mhwrpas swyddfeydd post wrth iddynt beidio â bod yn ddarparwyr budd-daliadau. Bwriedir talu budd-daliadau yn syth i gyfrifon pobl. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn arbrofi yn Swydd Gaerlŷr; mae'n hyrwyddo swyddfeydd post yno drwy eu gwneud yn ddarparwyr gwasanaethau cyffredinol y Llywodraeth, gan gynnwys trwyddedau gyrru. Byddwn yn colli budd-daliadau, ond yn ennill banc cyffredinol ac yn ennill y pecyn cyffredinol o wasanaethau'r Llywodraeth.

**Pauline Jarman:** A wnewch chi gyhoeddi pa bryd a faint o arian a fydd ar gael yng Nghymru ar gyfer rownd 2 Ymddiriedolaeth Adfywio'r Meysydd Glo, o gofio bod yr Adran Drafnidiaeth, Llywodraeth Leol a'r Rhanbarthau wedi cyhoeddi £45 miliwn pellach yn Lloegr, ac y rhoddwyd £3 miliwn i Weithrediaeth yr Alban?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Bydd yn rhaid imi ysgrifennu atoch ar y mater hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, fe sicrhaf fod y gwasanaethau a ddarperir—boed drwy Ymddiriedolaeth Adfywio'r Meysydd Glo neu drwy becyn y gallai chwarae rhan ynddo—yn gwbl gyfwerth, os nad yn well, na'r hyn sydd ar gael yn Lloegr a'r Alban.

**C9 Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cael gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynghylch gwella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru? (OAQ18013)

**The First Minister:** That is Plaid Cymru's penny-in-the-slot question, with one word changed from last week's question. I think that last week's question was about 'reforming' and we have 'improving' this week. I refer you to the answer I gave you last week and our exchanges on that issue.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Let us see if the penny-in-the-slot gives us a different answer this time. Last week you gave an interesting reply:

'We do not have a policy of believing that greater commercialisation benefits the national health service. That does not exclude the use of private finance here and there.'

However, Paul Murphy was much more specific about the use of private finance. He said, in the lion's den of the Wales Trades Union Congress conference in Llandudno:

'Where working with the private sector will bring in more investment and increase capacity, of course we will examine it. We have made that clear—'

and this is the interesting part,

'—in the United Kingdom Government and it has also been made clear by my colleagues in the Assembly.'

What discussions have you had with him about using the private sector? Will you be more specific about the meaning of 'here and there'?

**The First Minister:** It means 'where appropriate'. It is difficult to give an answer that specifies all investment in the health service over the next few years, in the light of the huge increase in the sums we will have to invest, and to detail which investments will be carried out via private companies and which via conventional funding. You will be aware that there are ongoing projects, such as the major hospital construction at Baglan, and St David's hospital—which is almost completed—in my constituency of Cardiff West, which are being carried out by the private finance initiative. You will also be

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Dyna gwestiwn ceiniog-yn-y-twill Plaid Cymru, wedi newid un gair o gwestiwn yr wythnos diwethaf. Credaf mai 'diwygio' oedd pwnc cwestiwn yr wythnos diwethaf ac mae gennym 'wella' yr wythnos hon. Fe'ch cyfeiriaf at yr ateb a roddais ichi'r wythnos diwethaf a'n sgwrs ar y mater hwnnw.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Gadewch inni weld a rydd y geiniog yn y twll ateb gwahanol inni y tro yma. Yr wythnos diwethaf rhoesoch ateb diddorol:

'Nid oes gennym bolisi o gredu bod mwy o fasnacholi'n fanteisiol i'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Nid yw hynny'n golygu na ellir defnyddio cyllid preifat yma ac acw.'

Fodd bynnag, yr oedd Paul Murphy'n llawer mwy penodol ynghylch defnyddio cyllid preifat. Dywedodd ef, yn ffau llewod cynhadledd Cyngres Undebau Llafur Cymru yn Llandudno:

'Lle bydd gweithio gyda'r sector preifat yn dod â mwy o fuddsoddiad ac yn cynyddu capasiti byddwn, wrth gwrs, yn edrych ar hynny. Yr ydym wedi nodi hynny'n glir—'

a dyma'r darn diddorol,

'—yn Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig ac fe'i gwnaed yn glir hefyd gan fy ngydweithwyr yn y Cynulliad.'

Pa drafodaethau a gawsoch gydag ef ynglŷn â defnyddio'r sector preifat? A wnewch chi fod yn fwy penodol ynghylch ystyr 'yma ac acw'?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae'n golygu 'lle bo'n briodol'. Mae'n anodd rhoi ateb sy'n enwi pob buddsoddiad yn y gwasanaeth iechyd dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf, yn wyneb y codiadau enfawr yn y symiau a fydd gennym i'w buddsoddi, a phennu pa fuddsoddiadau a wneir drwy gwmnïau preifat a pha rai drwy ariannu confensiynol. Byddwch yn ymwybodol fod prosiectau ar y gweill, fel prosiect mawr adeiladu'r ysbyty ym Maglan, ac ysbyty Dewi Sant—sydd bron wedi'i gwblhau—yn fy etholaeth i, Gorllewin Caerdydd, a gyflawnir gan y fenter cyllid preifat. Byddwch yn ymwybodol hefyd o

aware of the Rhondda cottage hospital and the new Porthmadog hospital for the southern part of Dafydd Wigley's constituency, which will not use PFI. They will be conventionally funded by taxpayers' money. I cannot tell you now which will be used where. I can give you the principle that there are large areas of Wales where it is not possible to carry out a PFI scheme and where it is then ruled out. In the areas where PFI is possible, private finance can be considered and, if it is attractive, can be used to increase the amount of resources.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Have you discussed Welsh rugby with the Secretary of State of Wales or are you following Glanmor Griffiths's suggestion that you keep your nose out?

**The First Minister:** Paul Murphy and I discuss rugby very infrequently, as he is more interested in Edward Elgar and the finer things in life, even though he comes from Pontypool. Rugby is an interest of mine and that is why I spoke out, on behalf of—I believe—the majority of the people of Wales, who want a successful rugby team, and a Welsh Rugby Union and Millennium Stadium that are commercially viable. That is not true at the moment. People note that the Scottish Rugby Union makes a profit in a soccer-mad country, and that the Welsh Rugby Union makes a loss in a rugby-mad country. That is considered strange and it may be connected with the fact that the Scottish Rugby Union has gone through a revolution and has gone for professional administration. We have not managed to persuade the WRU to go through the fires of hell and come out as a profitable, well-run, professional organisation.

ysbyty'r bwthyn yn y Rhondda ac ysbyty newydd Porthmadog ar gyfer rhan ddeheuol etholaeth Dafydd Wigley, na fydd yn defnyddio cyllid preifat. Telir am y rheini'n gonfensiynol gydag arian y trethdalwyr. Ni allaf ddweud wrthyh yn awr pa ddull a ddefnyddir ar gyfer gwahanol gynlluniau. Gallaf roi'r egwyddor ichi fod ardaloedd mawr o Gymru lle nad yw'n bosibl gwneud cynllun PFI a lle dywedwyd felly na fydd yn digwydd. Yn yr ardaloedd lle mae PFI yn bosibl, gellir ystyried cyllid preifat ac, os yw'n ddeniadol, gellir ei ddefnyddio i gynyddu'r adnoddau.

**Jonathan Morgan:** A ydych wedi trafod rygbi Cymru gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynteu a ydych yn dilyn awgrym Glanmor Griffiths y dylech gadw'ch trwyn allan?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Anaml iawn y byddaf i a Paul Murphy yn trafod rygbi, gan fod ganddo fwy o diddordeb yn Edward Elgar a phethau gorau bywyd, er ei fod yn dod o Bont-y-pŵl. Mae rygbi'n un o'm diddordebau a dyna pam y siaradais, ar ran—mi gredaf—y rhan fwyaf o bobl Cymru, sydd eisiau tîm rygbi llwyddiannus, ac eisiau gweld bod Undeb Rygbi Cymru a Stadiwm y Mileniwm yn fasnachol hyfyw. Nid yw hynny'n wir ar hyn o bryd. Mae pobl yn sylwi fod Undeb Rygbi'r Alban yn gwneud elw mewn gwlad sydd wedi gwirioni ar bêldroed, a bod Undeb Rygbi Cymru'n gwneud colled mewn gwlad sydd wedi gwirioni ar rygbi. Gwelir fod hynny'n rhyfedd, ac efallai ei fod yn gysylltiedig â'r ffaith fod Undeb Rygbi'r Alban wedi mynd trwy chwyldro ac wedi dewis gweinyddiaeth broffesiynol. Nid ydym wedi perswadio Undeb Rygbi Cymru i fynd drwy fflamau uffern a dod allan yn gorff proffesiynol proffidiol, wedi'i reoli'n dda.

## Transport Links in Rural Wales Cysylltiadau Trafnidiaeth yng Nghefn Gwlad Cymru

**Q10 Eleanor Burnham:** What is being done to promote rural Wales in terms of transport links to attract economic investment? (OAQ17996)

**The First Minister:** We all recognise the key contribution that good local transportation can make to ensuring the expansion of companies as well as to attracting inward investors—be they from England, Ireland or wherever—who will be interested in being able to deliver any goods that they make.

The trunkroad forward programme now includes a commitment in principle to upgrading the A40 west of St Clears, subject to an environmental impact assessment. Over the past two years, Sue Essex has announced a rolling programme, totalling £430 million, across Wales, supporting local authority schemes, such as the A499 Aberdesach to Llanaelhaearn, the A497 Aber-erch to Llanystumdwy and the A486/B4336 Ceredigion link road, among many others.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Do you agree that it is vital to upgrade and integrate transport? If you consider north Wales, for example, there are areas where employees find it difficult to get to work if they do not have a car. If their salaries are low they cannot afford a car and could not afford public transport, even if it were available. Do you not believe that we must do all we can to improve the situation?

**The First Minister:** I agree that when roads are built, they can be used by buses, which could then go more rapidly to where people need to travel to get to work—industrial estates, town centres, bus stations and so on. Public transport is important, but private transport will remain a major factor. We must ensure that they complement each other. That is the whole principle of integration, particularly in the more densely populated areas such as north-east or south-east Wales. It is important that sufficient public transport, both by bus and rail, is available in those areas. That must be combined with better highways to service those areas where public

**C10 Eleanor Burnham:** Beth sy'n cael ei wneud i hyrwyddo'r Gymru wledig o ran cysylltiadau trafndiaeth er mwyn denu buddsoddiad economaidd? (OAQ17996)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr ydym i gyd yn cydnabod cyfraniad allweddol trafndiaeth leol dda i sicrhau twf cwmnïau yn ogystal ag i ddenu buddsoddwyr oddi allan—boed hynny o Loegr, Iwerddon neu ble bynnag—a fydd â diddordeb mewn gallu danfon unrhyw nwyddau a wnânt.

Mae'r rhaglen gefnffyrdd dymor-hir yn awr yn cynnwys ymrwymiad mewn egwyddor i uwchraddio'r A40 i'r gorllewin o Sanclêr, yn amodol ar asesiad o'r effaith amgylcheddol. Dros y ddwy flynedd diwethaf, cyhoeddodd Sue Essex raglen dreigl, ar gyfanswm o £430 miliwn, ar draws Cymru, i gefnogi cynlluniau awdurdodau lleol, fel yr A499 Aberdesach i Llanaelhaearn, yr A497 Aber-erch i Lanystumdwy a'r A486/B4336 ffordd gyswllt Ceredigion, ymhlith llawer o rai eraill.

**Eleanor Burnham:** A gytunwch ei bod yn hanfodol uwchraddio ac integreiddio trafndiaeth? Os ystyriwch y Gogledd, er enghraifft, y mae ardaloedd lle caiff gweithwyr anhawster cyrraedd y gwaith os nad oes ganddynt gar. Os yw eu cyflogau'n isel ni allant fforddio car ac ni allent fforddio cludiant cyhoeddus, hyd yn oed pe bai ar gael. Oni chredwch fod yn rhaid inni wneud popeth a allwn i wella'r sefyllfa?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cytunaf pan adeiledir ffyrdd, y gellir eu defnyddio gan fysus, a allai wedyn fynd yn gynt i'r manau y mae angen i bobl deithio iddynt er mwyn cyrraedd gwaith—stadau diwydiannol, canol trefi, gorsafoedd bysus ac ati. Mae cludiant cyhoeddus yn bwysig, ond bydd cludiant preifat yn dal i fod yn ffactor pwysig. Rhaid inni sicrhau eu bod yn ategu ei gilydd. Dyna holl egwyddor integreiddio, yn enwedig yn yr ardaloedd mwy poblog fel y Gogledd-ddwyrain neu'r De-ddwyrain. Mae'n bwysig fod cludiant cyhoeddus digonol, ar fws a thrên, ar gael yn yr ardaloedd hynny. Rhaid cyfuno hynny â gwell ffyrdd i wasanaethu'r

transport is not available.

ardaloedd hynny lle nad oes cludiant cyhoeddus i'w gael.

## Cwestiwn Brys Urgent Question

### Dewhirst

**The Presiding Officer:** I have allowed an urgent question under Standing Order No. 6.31.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi caniatáu cwestiwn brys dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.31.

**David Lloyd:** Will the Minister make a statement with regard to the 435 job losses following the announcement of the closure of the Dewhirst factory in Fforestfach, Swansea? (EAQ18204)

**David Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y 435 o swyddi a gollir o ganlyniad i'r cyhoeddiad y bydd ffatri Dewhirst yn Abertawe yn cau? (EAQ18204)

**The Minister for Economic Development (Andrew Davies):** I was sad to hear of the announcement regarding Dewhirst in Fforestfach, Swansea and am sad about the effects it will have on those involved. I am particularly saddened as the factory is in my constituency, and I know many of the people who work there. The company issued redundancy notices last Friday. That started the 90-day consultation period between the company, staff and the trade unions at Swansea. There are a mix of employees at Swansea, with staff involved in sewing, manufacturing, administration, and in the technical and development side of the business. Of the 500 employees at the site, 435 have received redundancy notices. Those notices have largely been issued to those involved in manufacturing clothing. The remainder of the employees will stay at the Swansea site. In a discussion I had with the managing director, Terry Jones, last Thursday, he indicated that he intended to retain the product design and research and development function at the Fforestfach site. We believe that the announcement did not indicate that the whole factory would be closed.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd (Andrew Davies):** Yr oeddwn yn drist o glywed y cyhoeddiad ynglŷn â Dewhirst yn Fforestfach, Abertawe ac yr wyf yn drist am yr effeithiau a gaiff ar bobl. Yr wyf yn tristáu'n arbennig gan fod y ffatri yn fy etholaeth, ac yr wyf yn adnabod llawer o'r bobl sy'n gweithio yno. Cyflwynodd y cwmni rybuddion diswyddo ddydd Gwener diwethaf. Cychwynnodd hynny'r cyfnod ymgynghori 90 diwrnod rhwng y cwmni, staff ac undebau llafur yn Abertawe. Mae cymysgedd o weithwyr yn Abertawe, gyda staff yn ymwneud â gwnïo, cynhyrchu, gweinyddu, ac yn yr ochr dechnegol a datblygiadol i'r busnes. O'r 500 o weithwyr ar y safle, cafodd 435 rybuddion diswyddo. Rhoddwyd y rhybuddion hynny'n bennaf i rai sy'n ymwneud â chynhyrchu dillad. Bydd gweddill y gweithwyr yn aros ar safle Abertawe. Mewn trafodaeth a gefais gyda'r rheolwr gyfarwyddwr, Terry Jones, ddydd Iau diwethaf, dywedodd ei fod yn bwriadu cadw'r swyddogaeth dylunio cynnyrch ac ymchwilio a datblygu ar safle Fforestfach. Credwn nad oedd y cyhoeddiad yn awgrymu y câi'r ffatri gyfan ei chau.

Dewhirst at Swansea is part of the Dewhirst group, which is based in Derbyshire. It is an international company in the textile and clothing sector. It has manufacturing sites in the UK, three of which are in Wales, in Swansea, Cardigan and Fishguard. Its sites

Mae Dewhirst yn Abertawe'n rhan o grŵp Dewhirst, sydd â'i brif swyddfa yn Swydd Derby. Mae'n gwmni rhyngwladol yn y sector tecstilau a dilladau. Mae ganddo safleoedd cynhyrchu yn y DU, tri ohonynt yng Nghymru, yn Abertawe, Aberteifi ac



abroad include factories in Morocco and Malaysia. The management, trade unions and the workforce have fought long and hard over many years to maintain production and employment at Fforestfach. I pay tribute to the work of my parliamentary colleague, Alan Williams, who saved the factory over 20 years ago when it was the old Slimma factory. The management has carefully considered the factors influencing its decision on whether to continue manufacturing in Swansea or to manufacture the products abroad. In an industry where margins are tight, production costs are a critical factor. The average wage in the UK is £250 per week, while in Morocco, it is £30 per week. The difficult step towards moving the manufacturing to other Dewhirst factories outside of the UK has not been taken lightly, particularly given the high quality of the workforce at Swansea. The management recognises the quality of the workforce, and the way in which it has reacted in light of the announcement has been remarkable.

Team Wales has reacted promptly to this situation. The Assembly Government, with its Team Wales partners, will continue to do everything within its powers to assist those who have been made redundant. The Employment Service and Education and Learning Wales are already fully engaged and will be on hand to offer help and advice on reskilling, a redundancy action fund or job seeker's assistance as appropriate. The Welsh Development Agency, the Welsh Assembly Government and the City and County of Swansea Council are all in contact with the company to offer every assistance possible. All parties met the management yesterday at the Swansea site. As I said earlier, I have spoken to the company's management, to trade union representatives and to the Executive Director of the WDA's south-west division regarding the situation at Fforestfach. I will visit the Dewhirst site later this week to discuss the position arising from the announcement with the management and unions at Swansea.

**David Lloyd:** I declare an interest as a county councillor for the Cockett ward, which includes Fforestfach, the site of the Dewhirst factory. I was previously a general

Abergwaun. Mae ei safleoedd tramor yn cynnwys ffatrioedd ym Moroco a Malaysia. Mae'r rheolwyr, yr undebau llafur a'r gweithlu wedi ymladd yn hir a chaled dros flynyddoedd lawer i gadw gwaith cynhyrchu a chyflogaeth yn Fforestfach. Talaf deyrnged i waith fy nghydweithiwr, yr Aelod Seneddol, Alan Williams, a achubodd y ffatri dros 20 mlynedd yn ôl. Hen ffatri Slimma ydoedd bryd hynny. Mae'r rheolwyr wedi ystyried yn ofalus y ffactorau a ddylanwadodd ar eu penderfyniad naill ai i ddal i gynhyrchu yn Abertawe neu i gynhyrchu dramor. Mewn diwydiant lle mae'r elw'n dynn, mae costau cynhyrchu'n ffactor allweddol. Mae'r cyfartaledd cyflog yn y DU yn £250 yr wythnos, tra ym Moroco mae'n £30 yr wythnos. Nid yn ysgafn y cymerwyd y cam anodd tuag at symud y gwaith cynhyrchu i ffatrioedd eraill Dewhirst y tu allan i'r DU, yn enwedig yn wyneb ansawdd uchel y gweithlu yn Abertawe. Mae'r rheolwyr yn cydnabod ansawdd y gweithlu, a bu'r ffordd yr ymatebodd i'r cyhoeddiad yn hynod.

Mae Tîm Cymru wedi ymateb yn brydlon i'r sefyllfa hon. Bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, gyda'i phartneriaid yn Nhîm Cymru, yn dal i wneud popeth o fewn ei gallu i helpu'r rheini a gollodd eu gwaith. Mae'r Gwasanaeth Cyflogaeth a Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru eisoes yn cyfranogi'n llawn a byddant wrth law i gynnig cymorth a chynghor ar ddysgu sgiliau newydd, cronfa weithredol i'r rhai a ddiswyddwyd neu gymorth i chwilwyr am swyddi, fel y bo'n briodol. Mae Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a Chyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe i gyd mewn cysylltiad â'r cwmni i gynnig pob cymorth posibl. Cyfarfu'r holl bartïon â'r rheolwyr ddoe ar y safle yn Abertawe. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, yr wyf wedi siarad â rheolwyr y cwmni, â chynrychiolwyr yr undebau llafur ac â Chyfarwyddwr Gweithredol adran de-orllewin y WDA ynglŷn â'r sefyllfa yn Fforestfach. Ymwelaf â safle Dewhirst yn ddiweddarach yr wythnos hon i drafod y sefyllfa sy'n deillio o'r cyhoeddiad gyda'r rheolwyr a'r undebau yn Abertawe.

**David Lloyd:** Datganaf fuddiant fel cynghorydd sir dros ward Cocyd, sy'n cynnwys Fforestfach, lleoliad ffatri Dewhirst. Bûm gynt yn feddyg teulu yn Fforestfach, ac

practioner in Fforestfach, and consequently a doctor to many of the employees at the Dewhirst factory.

2:50 p.m.

The loss of these 435 jobs is an economic and social calamity for Fforestfach and the surrounding area. Locally, the feeling is one of devastation. People are numbed and shocked after last Thursday's dramatic announcement. Four years ago, Dewhirst closed in Ystradgynlais with many job losses. Two years ago, Dewhirst closed in Lampeter with, as I recall, 165 job losses. Now, Dewhirst in Fforestfach is shedding jobs.

What is the Minister doing for the workforce and to salvage at least some of the jobs at Fforestfach? I know of the ongoing talks involving Swansea council, ELWa and the WDA. Can the Minister outline the details of any rescue package? There is much work to be done; otherwise, the outlook is bleak for the Dewhirst workers of Fforestfach.

**Andrew Davies:** I cannot at present indicate any details of what is being proposed. There have been discussions—in addition to those on reskilling or training packages—about alternative uses of the site, or on proposals for further business. However, it is too early to say what those are. I will discuss that with management and trade unions when I visit the site later this week.

**Val Lloyd:** This is sad news for Dewhirst's loyal workforce, their families and for the whole Swansea travel-to-work area, which covers your constituency and mine, as well as several adjacent constituencies. I am pleased that the local authority, ELWa, the WDA and the Employment Service are working together to address the issues. Could consideration be given to a strong regeneration package similar to that put in place following the redundancies at Corus? That has made excellent progress in addressing the relevant issues for those affected.

**Andrew Davies:** I share your feelings. Many of the workers at Dewhirst have been made

wedyn yn feddyg i lawer o'r gweithwyr yn ffatri Dewhirst.

Mae colli'r 435 o swyddi hyn yn drychineb economaidd a chymdeithasol i Fforestfach a'r cylch. Yn lleol, teimlad o golled fawr sydd. Mae pobl wedi'u fferru a'u syfrdanu ar ôl cyhoeddiad dramatig dydd Iau diwethaf. Bedair blynedd yn ôl, caeodd Dewhirst yn Ystradgynlais a chollwyd llawer o swyddi. Ddwly flynedd yn ôl, caeodd Dewhirst yn Llanbedr Pont Steffan a chollwyd, yn ôl a gofiat, 165 o swyddi. Yn awr, mae Dewhirst yn Fforestfach yn colli swyddi.

Beth mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud dros y gweithlu ac i achub o leiaf rai o'r swyddi yn Fforestfach? Gwn am y trafodaethau sy'n digwydd gyda chyngor Abertawe, ELWa a'r WDA. A all y Gweinidog amlinellu manylion unrhyw becyn achub? Mae llawer o waith i'w wneud; fel arall, mae'r dyfodol yn llwm i weithwyr Dewhirst Fforestfach.

**Andrew Davies:** Ni allaf roi unrhyw fanylion ar hyn o bryd am yr hyn sy'n cael ei gynnig. Cafwyd trafodaethau—yn ogystal â'r rheini am ddysgu sgiliau newydd neu am becynnau hyfforddi—am ddefnyddiau eraill i'r safle, neu am gynigion am fusnes pellach. Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhy gynnar i ddweud beth yw'r rheini. Trafodaf hynny gyda'r rheolwyr a'r undebau llafur pan ymwelaf â'r safle yn ddiweddarach yr wythnos hon.

**Val Lloyd:** Mae hyn yn newyddion trist i weithlu ffyddlon Dewhirst, i'w teuluoedd ac i'r cyfan o ardal deithio-i'r-gwaith Abertawe, sy'n cynnwys eich etholaeth chi a f'un innau, yn ogystal â sawl etholaeth gyfagos. Yr wyf yn falch bod yr awdurdod lleol, ELWa, y WDA a'r Gwasanaeth Cyflogaeth yn cydweithio i ddelio â'r materion hyn. A ellid ystyried pecyn adfywio cryf tebyg i hwnnw a sefydlwyd yn dilyn y colli swyddi yn Corus? Mae hwnnw wedi gwneud gwaith ardderchog i fynd i'r afael â'r materion perthnasol i'r rheini yr effeithiwyd arnynt.

**Andrew Davies:** Rhannaf eich teimladau. Mae llawer o weithwyr Dewhirst wedi colli

redundant several times already, some from other Dewhirst factories, as well as from Bairdwear. That affected other Members' constituencies and I assure you that I will do all I can as the local Member and as a Minister—as I would in response to any minor or major redundancy announcement—to help our workers in terms of trying to recover some of that business or, if that is not possible, to ensure that those who are being made redundant are offered appropriate training and, where appropriate, helped to access other assistance.

**Alun Cairns:** Does this not fly in the face of your statements over the last fortnight or so? You stood in Swansea, just miles away from where this plant closed down, and claimed that it was a record year for economic development in Swansea. Only the weekend before last, you said that it was a record year for economic development in Wales. How can you reconcile such statements with recent major job losses—1,000 ITV Digital jobs lost in Pembrokeshire, and over 400 jobs lost in Swansea? Is not that the reality of the Welsh economy, not the statements that you are making in an attempt to put a favourable gloss on your policies?

You said that Team Wales had acted promptly. When were you and Team Wales first advised of these job losses? Was it before or after the announcement? If it was afterwards, is that not a little late in the day? Should not your department, as well as the WDA, be seeking to develop a strategy with such companies and with some of the few remaining manufacturers in Wales? This announcement follows closures in Lampeter and Ystradgynlais, as has already been mentioned. The rationale given for those closures was, in part, to centralise production at the Fforestfach plant. What guarantee can you give that Dewhirst's plant outside Ammanford will survive, or is it Dewhirst's pattern to close down one factory after another?

Finally, can you advise us what impact has the increase in the national insurance contributions of employers, which will take

eu gwaith sawl gwaith yn barod, rhai o ffatrioedd eraill Dewhirst, yn ogystal ag o Bairdwear. Effeithiodd hynny ar etholaethau Aelodau eraill ac fe'ch sicrhaf y gwnaf bopeth a allaf fel yr Aelod lleol ac fel Gweinidog—fel y byddwn mewn ymateb i unrhyw gyhoeddiad diswyddiadau bach neu fawr—i helpu ein gweithwyr drwy geisio adennill peth o'r busnes hwnnw neu, os nad yw hynny'n bosibl, i sicrhau bod y rheini sy'n colli eu swyddi'n cael cynnig hyfforddiant priodol a, lle bo'n briodol, y cânt eu helpu i gael cymorth o fannau eraill.

**Alun Cairns:** Onid yw hyn yn mynd yn groes i'ch datganiadau dros y pythefnos diwethaf? Safasoch yn Abertawe, dim ond ychydig filltiroedd o'r fan lle caewyd y gwaith hwn, a honni mai hon oedd y flwyddyn orau erioed o ran datblygu economaidd yn Abertawe. Dim ond y penwythnos cyn y diwethaf, dywedasoch mai dyma'r flwyddyn orau erioed o ran datblygu economaidd yng Nghymru. Sut y gallwch gysoni'r datganiadau hynny â cholledion swyddi mawr diweddar—1,000 o swyddi ITV Digital wedi'u colli yn Sir Benfro, a dros 400 o swyddi wedi'u colli yn Abertawe? Onid dyna realiti economi Cymru, nid y datganiadau yr ydych yn eu gwneud er mwyn ceisio rhoi sglein ffafriol ar eich polisïau?

Dywedasoch fod Tîm Cymru wedi gweithredu'n brydlon. Pa bryd y cawsoch chi a Thîm Cymru wybod gyntaf am y colledion swyddi hyn? Ai cyn ynteu wedi'r datganiad yr oedd hynny? Os mai wedyn, onid yw hynny ychydig yn hwyr? Oni ddylai'ch adran chi, yn ogystal â'r WDA, fod yn ceisio datblygu strategaeth gyda chwmnïau o'r fath a chyda rhai o'r ychydig wneuthurwyr sydd ar ôl yng Nghymru? Mae'r cyhoeddiad hwn yn dilyn cau ffatrioedd yn Llanbedr Pont Steffan ac Ystradgynlais, fel y soniwyd eisoes. Y rhesymau a roddwyd dros gau'r rheini, yn rhannol, oedd er mwyn canoli'r cynhyrchu yn ffatri Fforestfach. Pa warant allwch chi ei rhoi y bydd ffatri Dewhirst y tu allan i Rydaman yn parhau'n agored, ynteu ai patrwm Dewhirst yw cau un ffatri ar ôl y llall?

Yn olaf, a allwch ddweud wrthym pa effaith a gafodd y cynnydd yng nghyfraniadau yswiriant gwladol cyflogwyr, a ddaw i rym y

effect next year, had on the company's decision, particularly following the climate change levy, which recently took effect? Furthermore, what effect has the threat of returning business rates to local authorities had on the company's decision? Are not these policies bad for business, the price of which is being paid by these employees?

**Andrew Davies:** I regret the tone of those questions. At this time, our thoughts are with those who have been given the 90-day notice of redundancy. However, as you have asked the questions, I am more than happy to respond. When I mentioned the economic position, I was referring to the fact that Swansea now has the lowest unemployment for a generation. That is still the case. Jobs are created and lost constantly. That has been the case over the past 50 to 100 years. More jobs are being created at present than have been lost over the last few years, which is why we have record low unemployment. For example, the Pension Service has created 500 jobs in Swansea in the enterprise zone in Val Lloyd's constituency. People are now being recruited to those posts. That is true across the board. I reject any accusations that this announcement is the result of policies followed by the Assembly or Westminster Governments. The Chancellor's economic policies have led to record low unemployment. That is why the agencies involved are confident that those being made redundant will find alternative employment or be offered high-quality training.

The ITV Digital situation was outside the economies of Pembrokeshire and Wales. It was the result of a commercial consideration entered into by ITV Digital and the Football League.

On your question about increased national insurance contributions, it is rather strange to suggest that this announcement is a result of that increase, when it has not yet been implemented. As you indicated, the increase will take effect next year. On the issue of when my officials and I became aware of the situation, we were informed by the management two or three weeks ago. That is

flwyddyn nesaf, ar benderfyniad y cwmni, yn enwedig yn dilyn yr ardoll newid hinsawdd, a ddaeth i rym yn ddiweddar? Yn ogystal, pa effaith a gafodd y bygythiad o ddychwelyd trethi busnes i awdurdodau lleol ar benderfyniad y cwmni? Onid yw'r polisiau hyn yn ddrwg i fusnes, ac onid yw'r gweithwyr hyn yn talu'r pris am hynny?

**Andrew Davies:** Gresynaf at dôn y cwestiynau hynny. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'n meddyliau gyda'r rheini a gafodd y rhybudd 90 diwrnod eu bod yn colli eu gwaith. Fodd bynnag, gan ichi ofyn y cwestiynau, yr wyf yn fwy na bodlon ymateb. Pan soniais am y sefyllfa economaidd, cyfeirio yr oeddwn at y ffaith fod diweithdra yn Abertawe yn awr ar ei isaf ers cenhedlaeth. Mae hynny'n dal i fod yn wir. Caiff swyddi eu creu a'u colli o hyd. Bu hynny'n wir dros yr 50 i 100 mlynedd diwethaf. Mae mwy o swyddi'n cael eu creu ar hyn o bryd nag a gollwyd dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf, a dyna pam y mae diweithdra ar ei isaf ers cenhedlaeth. Er enghraifft, mae'r Gwasanaeth Pensiwn wedi creu 500 o swyddi yn Abertawe yn yr ardal fenter yn etholaeth Val Lloyd. Mae pobl yn cael eu recriwtio i'r swyddi hynny yn awr. Mae hynny'n wir yn gyffredinol. Gwrthodaf unrhyw gyhuddiadau fod y cyhoeddiad hwn yn ganlyniad polisiau a ddilynir gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad neu Lywodraeth San Steffan. Mae polisiau economaidd y Canghellor wedi arwain at ddiweithdra is nag erioed. Dyna pam y mae'r asiantaethau sy'n ymwneud â hyn yn hyderus y bydd y rheini sy'n colli eu gwaith yn dod o hyd i waith arall neu'n cael cynnig hyfforddiant o ansawdd uchel.

Yr oedd sefyllfa ITV Digital y tu allan i economïau Sir Benfro a Chymru. Yr oedd yn ganlyniad sefyllfa fasnachol yr aeth ITV Digital a Chynghrair Bêl-droed Lloegr i mewn iddi.

Ar eich cwestiwn ynglŷn â chynyddu cyfraniadau yswiriant gwladol, braidd yn od yw awgrymu fod y cyhoeddiad hwn yn ganlyniad i'r cynnydd hwnnw, ac yntau heb ei weithredu eto. Fel y dywedaso, bydd y cynnydd yn digwydd y flwyddyn nesaf. O ran pa bryd y deuthum i a fy swyddogion i wybod am y sefyllfa, hysbyswyd ni gan y rheolwyr ddwy neu dair wythnos yn ôl. Dyna

why agencies and Assembly Government officials have been in negotiation with the company and preparing an action plan. When the company announced the 90-day consultation, my officials, ELWa, the WDA and other Government bodies, were able to swing into action and meet the company and the unions to take appropriate action.

**Peter Black:** I agree that our thoughts must be with the workers who have been given the redundancy notices and who now face the tragedy of possible unemployment. It is important that skills assessments are carried out and that retraining is provided as soon as possible, and I welcome your assurances today in that respect. What further aid package might be made available, once the assessments and retraining are underway, to assist Dewhirst employees to find alternative employment?

**Andrew Davies:** It is still early days, as you recognise, Peter. As we have always done when faced with such a situation, we will consider this in the round and return with an appropriate response. That is what we did with Corus, and it is what my ministerial colleague, Jane Davidson, and I have done with the Cleddau Bridge call centre. The eligibility period was extended from three months to six months as a result of the concerns of those made redundant. If there is a need to put together an aid package in addition to what is already available to Dewhirst employees, we will consider it sympathetically. However, at this stage, it is too early to say what that package might include.

3:00 p.m.

**Cynog Dafis:** Fel y gallwch ddychmygu, bydd pryder mawr yn Abergwaun ac Aberteifi yn sgîl y cyhoeddiad hwn. Mae Dewhirst yn cyflogi rhwng 500 a 600 o bobl yno, sydd yn nifer fawr mewn economi wledig a bregus. Pa ddyfodol a welwch i'r ddwy ffatri honno, a pha wybodaeth sydd gennych ynghylch hynny? Pa drafodaethau a gawsoch, neu yr ydych yn eu trefnu, o ran y ddwy ffatri hon? Pa weithredu sydd yn digwydd, a phwy sydd yn gweithredu, i sicrhau bod sylfaen gynaliadwy yn cael ei

pam y mae asiantaethau a swyddogion Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi bod yn negodi gyda'r cwmni ac yn paratoi cynllun gweithredu. Pan gyhoeddodd y cwmni y cyfnod ymgynghori 90 diwrnod, gallodd fy swyddogion, ELWa, y WDA a chyrff eraill y Llywodraeth weithredu'n syth a chyfarfod â'r cwmni a'r undebau er mwyn cymryd camau priodol.

**Peter Black:** Cytunaf fod yn rhaid i'n meddyliau fod gyda'r gweithwyr a gafodd y rhybuddion diswyddo ac sydd bellach yn wynebu trasiedi diweithdra posibl. Mae'n bwysig y gwneir asesiadau sgiliau ac y darperir ailhyfforddiant cyn gynted ag y bo modd, a chroesawaf eich geiriau o sicrwydd heddiw yn hynny o beth. Pa becyn cymorth arall y gellid ei ddarparu, unwaith y bydd yr asesiadau a'r ailhyfforddi ar droed, i gynorthwyo gweithwyr Dewhirst i ganfod gwaith arall?

**Andrew Davies:** Mae'n dal i fod yn ddyddiau cynnar, fel yr ydych chi'n cydnabod, Peter. Fel y gwnaethom bob amser wrth wynebu sefyllfa o'r fath, ystyriwn hyn yn ei holl agweddau a dychwelwn gydag ymateb priodol. Dyna beth a wnaethom gyda Corus, a dyna beth a wnaeth fy nghyd-Weinidog, Jane Davidson, a mi gyda chanolfan alwadau Pont Cleddau. Estynnwyd y cyfnod cymhwyster o dri mis i chwe mis o ganlyniad i bryderon y rheini a gollodd eu gwaith. Os bydd angen rhoi pecyn cymorth at ei gilydd yn ychwanegol i'r hyn sydd eisoes ar gael i weithwyr Dewhirst, fe ystyriwn hynny gyda chydymdeimlad. Fodd bynnag, ar hyn o bryd, mae'n rhy gynnar i ddweud beth y gallai'r pecyn hwnnw ei gynnwys.

**Cynog Dafis:** As you can imagine, this announcement will cause great concern in Fishguard and Cardigan. Dewhirst employs between 500 and 600 people there, which is a significant number in a vulnerable rural economy. What future do you see for those two factories, and what information do you have in that regard? What discussions have you had, or are arranging to have, regarding these two factories? What action is being taken, and by whom, to ensure that a sustainable foundation is created for the

chreu i'r diwydiant dillad yn y De-orllewin, gan ei bod yn ymddangos bod y sylfaen bresennol yn fregus? Pa gefnogaeth ydych chi'n ei rhoi i'r dibenion hynny?

**Andrew Davies:** The company has not given any indication of its plans for the other sites in west Wales. It has only discussed the Swansea site with us. At present, therefore, I do not know of any plans that it has in that regard. The company has always kept us informed, and it has not raised the issue of the other sites in west Wales. I have no further information at present.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call Delyth Evans.

**Delyth Evans:** The question I had has already been answered.

**Nick Bourne:** I will try to be helpful to the Minister for Economic Development. I believe that he inadvertently said that he would be acting as the local Member and as a Minister. I remind him of the Ministerial Code. I appreciate his concern, but that concern would have to be the same throughout Wales. He might wish to retrace his steps on that point.

Our thoughts are certainly with those who are losing their jobs, and with their families. That is a great concern. However, now is not the time for complacency. I remember raising the issue of an early warning system at the time of the ITV Digital job losses in Pembroke Dock. Are we any further down the road of getting an early warning when these situations arise? That might enable us to take action. You said that employment costs are a relevant factor, hence the loss of those jobs overseas and Alun Cairns raised the valid point that extra employment costs are being created via the increased national insurance contribution. We are losing manufacturing jobs in Wales—I am sure that you agree. Unemployment went up last month—not by a lot, but it went up. That must be watched. We cannot afford to be complacent. What are you doing to ensure that employment costs are kept down so that we do not lose any more jobs, such as those in Fishguard? That must now be the major concern. I remember that two years ago, when jobs were lost in

clothing industry in south-west Wales, as it appears that the present foundation is vulnerable? What support are you giving to that end?

**Andrew Davies:** Nid yw'r cwmni wedi rhoi unrhyw arwydd o'i gynlluniau ar gyfer y safleoedd eraill yn y Gorllewin. Dim ond safle Abertawe y mae wedi'i drafod gyda ni. Ar hyn o bryd, felly, ni wn am unrhyw gynlluniau sydd ganddo yn hynny o beth. Mae'r cwmni bob amser wedi rhoi pob gwybodaeth inni, ac nid yw wedi codi mater y safleoedd eraill yn y Gorllewin. Nid oes gennyf ragor o wybodaeth ar hyn o bryd.

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf ar Delyth Evans.

**Delyth Evans:** Mae'r cwestiwn a oedd gennyf fi eisoes wedi'i ateb.

**Nick Bourne:** Ceisiaf gynorthwyo'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd. Credaf iddo ddweud yn ddamweiniol y byddai'n gweithredu fel yr Aelod lleol ac fel Gweinidog. Fe'i hatgoffaf o God y Gweinidogion. Gwerthfawrogaf ei bryder, ond byddai'n rhaid i'r pryder hwnnw fod yr un fath drwy Gymru gyfan. Efallai yr hoffai gamu'n ôl ar y pwynt hwnnw.

Mae ein meddyliau yn sicr gyda'r rheini sy'n colli eu swyddi, a chyda'u teuluoedd. Mae hynny'n bryder mawr. Fodd bynnag, nid dyma'r amser i laesu dwylo. Cofiaf godi'r mater o system rhybudd cynnar pan gollwyd swyddi ITV Digital yn Noc Penfro. A ydym rywfaint ymhellach i lawr y ffordd at gael rhybudd cynnar pan gyfyd y sefyllfaoedd hyn? Gallai hynny ganiatáu inni weithredu. Dywedasoeh fod costau cyflogi'n ffactor perthnasol, ac mai dyna pam y collwyd y swyddi hynny dros y môr, a chododd Alun Cairns y pwynt dilys fod costau ychwanegol yn cael eu creu i gyflogwyr drwy'r cynnydd yn y cyfraniad yswiriant gwladol. Yr ydym yn colli swyddi cynhyrchu yng Nghymru—yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch. Cynyddodd diweithdra y mis diwethaf—nid llawer, ond fe gynyddodd. Rhaid gwyllo hynny. Ni allwn fforddio llaesu dwylo. Beth ydych chi'n ei wneud i sicrhau y cedwir costau cyflogwyr i lawr fel na chollwn ragor o swyddi fel y rheini yn Abergwaun? Dyna'r prif bryder yn awr, o reidrydd. Cofiaf ddwy flynedd yn ôl,

Lampeter, we were told that those at Fforestfach were safe. We now know that that was not true.

**Andrew Davies:** On your correction, I have an interest as a local Member, but I am acting as a Minister.

On an early warning system, mechanisms are in place whereby we are able to gather early intelligence. Usually companies inform us of their actions, or Government agencies do so. Often, unfortunately, we are not able to get early intelligence but we would want to do so. In this case, as I said, the company informed Assembly officials and the WDA, and we have been working to put in place actions to deal with the situation that has been created by Dewhirst's decision.

I put on record, and emphasise, that Dewhirst's decision is almost entirely down to the fact that its cost base here was so difficult compared with the cost of production in Morocco, where it also has operations. The average weekly wage in Morocco is £30; in the UK it is £250. In a sector such as clothing and textiles, where the margins are quite tight, it is difficult for companies and workforces to deal with that differential. Issues such as national insurance contributions were not a factor in the company's decision. It stated that the relevant factors were its cost base and, largely, the differential compared with production overseas.

### **Datganiad ar Brosiect 14 i 19 Dysgu yng Nghymru Statement on the 14 to 19 Learning in Wales Project**

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I wish to report progress on the commitment made in 'The Learning Country' to reviewing 14 to 19 learning in Wales. 'The Learning Country' set out the issues for Wales in developing appropriate provision for all our young people, especially between the ages of 14 and 19. In this paving document I undertook to consult on these developments.

pan gollwyd swyddi yn Llanbedr Pont Steffan, y dywedwyd wrthym fod y swyddi yn Fforestfach yn ddiogel. Gwyddom yn awr nad oedd hynny'n wir.

**Andrew Davies:** Ar eich pwynt o gywiriad, mae gennyf ddiddordeb fel Aelod lleol, ond yr wyf yn gweithredu fel Gweinidog.

Ynghylch system rhybuddio cynnar, mae mecanweithiau wedi'u sefydlu er mwyn inni gasglu gwybodaeth gynnar. Fel arfer bydd cwmnïau'n rhoi gwybod inni beth y maent yn ei wneud, neu bydd asiantaethau'r Llywodraeth yn gwneud hynny. Yn aml, yn anffodus, nid ydym yn llwyddo i gael gwybodaeth gynnar ond byddem yn dymuno gwneud hynny. Yn yr achos hwn, fel y dywedais, hysbysodd y cwmni swyddogion y Cynulliad a'r WDA, ac yr ydym wedi bod yn gweithio i drefnu gweithredu i ddelio â'r sefyllfa a grëwyd gan benderfyniad Dewhirst.

Cofnodaf, a phwysleisïaf, fod penderfyniad Dewhirst i'w briodoli bron yn gyfan gwbl i'r ffaith fod ei sylfaen gostau yma mor anodd o gymharu â chost cynhyrchu ym Moroco, lle mae ganddo weithfeydd hefyd. Ym Moroco, £30 yw cyfartaledd cyflog wythnosol; mae'n £250 yn y DU. Mewn sector fel dillad a thecstilau, lle mae'r elw'n dynn iawn, mae'n anodd i gwmnïau a gweithluoedd ddelio â'r gwahanrediad hwnnw. Nid oedd materion fel cyfraniadau yswiriant gwladol yn ffactor ym mhenderfyniad y cwmni. Dywedodd mai'r ffactorau perthnasol oedd ei sylfaen gostau ac, yn bennaf, y gwahanrediad o gymharu â chynhyrchu dramor.

**Y Gweinidog Dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Hoffwn roi adroddiad ar yr hyn a gyflawnwyd yn sgîl yr ymrwymiad a wnaethpwyd yn 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu' i adolygu dysgu 14 i 19 yng Nghymru. Amlinellodd 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu' y materion pwysig i Gymru o ran datblygu darpariaeth briodol i'n holl bobl ifanc, yn enwedig rhwng 14 a 19 oed. Yn y ddogfen baratoadol hon ymgymerais i ymgynghori ar y datblygiadau hyn.

Developing learning pathways for 14 to 19-year-olds in the twenty-first century is not about a narrow view of education. It is about raising standards for every child at school in Wales—we must continue to encourage Wales's high level of achievement at GCSE and A-level. However, it is also about academic and vocational balance and parity of esteem, training, skills, creativity, entrepreneurship, and the personal and social skills needed by our young people to give them the confidence to grasp opportunities and shape the future. My department's youth policy team is leading these developments, alongside 'Extending Entitlement: Supporting Young People in Wales', to ensure that all aspects of provision for young people contribute to this ambitious agenda. The youth policy team will work in partnership with all those with an interest in provision for 14 to 19-year-olds—inside and outside the Assembly—and report on how we might better develop the potential of all our young people, whatever their talents and abilities.

I want to emphasise that our commitment to working in partnership is genuine. In developing our proposals we intend to involve the widest possible range of those with the best expertise and experience in the field, namely those who are at the forefront of delivery: teachers, lecturers, careers advisers, training providers, employers, the voluntary sector, and the organisations and agencies responsible for securing quality and delivery. We also want to involve those who have the best experience of being on the receiving end. Young people who are in the system have a valuable contribution to make to shaping future developments. I want that depth of involvement to feature in formulating the recommendations. It will be necessary to ensure that they build on best practice in Wales, and truly meet the needs of individuals and of the country as a whole.

There is a great deal that we can be proud of in Wales. We have pioneered a range of distinctive policies which will help us take forward these developments, including

Nid agwedd gul at addysg sydd wrth wraidd datblygu llwybrau dysgu i rai 14 i 19 oed yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Mae'n ymwneud â chodi safonau i bob plentyn ysgol yng Nghymru—rhaid parhau i annog lefel cyrhaeddiad uchel Cymru mewn TGAU a lefel A. Fodd bynnag, mae a wnelo hefyd â chydbwysedd academiaidd a galwedigaethol a chydaddoldeb parch, hyfforddiant, sgiliau, creadigrwydd, entrepreneuriaeth, a'r sgiliau personol a chymdeithasol sydd eu hangen ar ein pobl ifanc i roi'r hyder iddynt i fanteisio ar gyfleoedd a ffurfio'r dyfodol. Mae tîm polisi ieuenctid fy adran yn arwain y datblygiadau hyn, ochr yn ochr ag 'Ymestyn Hawliau: Cefnogi Pobl Ifanc yng Nghymru', er mwyn sicrhau bod holl agweddau'r ddarpariaeth ar gyfer pobl ifanc yn cyfrannu at yr agenda uchelgeisiol hon. Bydd y tîm polisi ieuenctid yn gweithio mewn partneriaeth gyda phawb sydd â diddordeb yn y ddarpariaeth i rai 14 i 19 mlwydd oed—oddi mewn ac oddi allan i'r Cynulliad—ac yn adrodd ar sut y gallem ddatblygu potensial ein holl bobl ifanc yn well, beth bynnag fo'u doniau a'u galluedd.

Mae arnaf eisiau pwysleisio fod ein hymrwymiad i weithio mewn partneriaeth yn ddiwyll. Wrth ddatblygu ein cynigion bwriadwn gynnwys yr amrediad ehangaf bosibl o bobl a chanddynt yr arbenigedd a'r profiad gorau yn y maes, sef y rheini sydd ar flaen y gad o ran cyflwyno'r ddarpariaeth: athrawon, darlithwyr, cynghorwyr gyrfaoedd, darparwyr hyfforddiant, cyflogwyr, y sector gwirfoddol, a'r sefydliadau a'r asiantaethau sy'n gyfrifol am sicrhau ansawdd a sicrhau bod y ddarpariaeth yn cael ei chyflwyno. Mae arnom eisiau cynnwys hefyd y rheini sydd â'r profiad gorau o dderbyn y ddarpariaeth hon. Mae gan bobl ifanc sydd yn y system gyfraniad gwerthfawr i'w wneud at ffurfio datblygiadau'r dyfodol. Mae arnaf eisiau i'r dyfnder ymwneud hwnnw fod yn nodweddi wrth lunio'r argymhellion. Bydd angen sicrhau eu bod yn adeiladu ar yr arferion gorau yng Nghymru, a'u bod yn wir yn ateb anghenion unigolion a'r wlad gyfan.

Mae llawer y gallwn ymfalchio ynddo yng Nghymru. Yr ydym wedi arloesi gydag amrediad o bolisïau a fydd yn ein helpu i fynd â'r datblygiadau hyn yn eu blaenau, gan



Credis, the Welsh baccalaureate, 'Extending Entitlement: Supporting Young People in Wales' and our all-age basic skills strategy.

We now need to focus on practical issues: tailored personal learning packages; out of school learning experiences which complement school-based learning; whether we need to disapply aspects of the national curriculum more widely, and what young people might do instead; what should the basic entitlement for young people look like, and should it be age related or about achievement of a certain standard; how we can help young people learn to learn, and keep on learning; increasing the status and quality of vocational pathways; better partnership and coherence between various learning providers so that learners can access the appropriate teaching, resources and equipment in an environment where they can flourish. There is also much more.

One of the aims of our 14 to 19 developments must be to combat disaffection. The right provision, together with good support systems, will keep young people involved and stop them dropping out. There are lessons to be learned from existing initiatives, including Estyn's report on the youth access initiative, with designated co-ordinators, effective collaborative work between schools and further education colleges, good referral systems, mentoring, counselling and other appropriate support for young people, and monitoring of their progress.

There is also the innovative work undertaken in developing Youth Gateway and the New Deal. We must mainstream best practice in engaging those who are threatened by school, but also look for opportunities to apply the successful innovative practice to provision for others within the school system who may not be reaching their full potential.

We can also learn from some of our European neighbours. Denmark, for example, has had great success in increasing the number of young people constructively involved in education or training up to the age of 19, and in the level and extent of

gynnwys Credis, y fagloriaeth Gymreig, 'Ymestyn Hawliau: Cefnogi Pobl Ifanc yng Nghymru', a'n strategaeth sgiliau sylfaenol i bob oed.

Mae angen inni ganolbwyntio'n awr ar faterion ymarferol: pecynnau dysgu wedi'u teilwra'n bersonol; profiadau dysgu y tu allan i'r ysgol sy'n ategu dysgu yn yr ysgol; a oes angen datgymhwyso agweddau ar y cwricwlwm cenedlaethol yn fwy eang, a beth y gallai pobl ifanc ei wneud yn eu lle; beth y dylai'r hawl sylfaenol i bobl ifanc ymdebygu iddo, ac a ddylai fod yn gysylltiedig ag oedran ynteu ymwneud â chyrraedd safon arbennig; sut y gallwn helpu pobl ifanc ddysgu sut i ddysgu, a dal ati i ddysgu; cynyddu statws ac ansawdd llwybrau galwedigaethol; gwell partneriaeth a chydlynid rhwng gwahanol ddarparwyr addysg fel y gall dysgwyr gael mynediad at yr addysg, yr adnoddau a'r offer priodol mewn amgylchedd lle gallant flodeuo. Mae llawer rhagor hefyd.

Un o amcanion hanfodol ein datblygiadau 14 i 19 fydd ymladd yn erbyn ymddieithrio. Bydd y ddarpariaeth iawn, ynghyd â systemau cefnogi da, yn cadw pobl ifanc yn brysur ac yn eu cadw rhag disgyn allan. Mae gwersi i'w dysgu oddi wrth fentrau sy'n bodoli, gan gynnwys adroddiad Estyn ar y fenter mynediad ieuentid, gyda chydgyssylltwyr penodedig, cydweithio effeithiol rhwng ysgolion a cholegau addysg bellach, systemau cyfeirio da, mentora, cwnsela a chymorth priodol arall i bobl ifanc, a monitro'u hynt.

Mae gwaith arloesol yn digwydd hefyd wrth ddatblygu'r Porth Ieuentid a'r Fargen Newydd. Rhaid inni brif-ffrydio arferion gorau o ran sicrhau cyfranogiad y rheini sy'n teimlo fod ysgol yn fygythiad, ond chwilio hefyd am gyfleoedd i gymhwyso'r arferion newydd llwyddiannus i ddarpariaeth i eraill o fewn y system ysgol nad ydynt efallai yn cyrraedd eu llawn botensial.

Gallwn ddysgu hefyd oddi wrth rai o'n cymdogion Ewropeaidd. Mae Denmarc, er enghraifft, wedi cael llwyddiant mawr yn cynyddu nifer y bobl ifanc sy'n cymryd rhan adeiladol mewn addysg neu hyfforddiant hyd at 19 oed, ac yn lefel a nifer y cymwysterau a

qualifications gained. It has also made significant progress in establishing parity of esteem for academic and vocational routes. That is the challenge.

Many of the relevant organisations have already nominated representatives to work with my officials in the Training and Education Department, as part of a project team and reference group which will be the mechanism for extensive preliminary consultation with all those who want to contribute. The representatives include schools, further and higher education institutions, careers bodies, training providers, Education and Learning Wales, the Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales, Estyn, the Welsh Local Government Association, the Association of Directors of Education in Wales, Education Business Partnership, youth work and the voluntary sector.

3:10 p.m.

I hope there will be widespread debate in all sectors, which can be fed into development for those in the 14 to 19 age range. We must make concrete proposals on what works best for young people and what we must do to provide the best opportunities for all. I want those who want to have a say to make their views heard between now and August. This will feed into the development of recommendations that will be published for formal consultation at the end of October, when there will be time to comment on the proposals as a whole. We can then develop an action plan for implementation by April 2003, which will be based on this substantial exercise in partnership. I want to take a phased approach to introducing those recommendations that are accepted. Details about the consultation process, and work in progress, will shortly appear on the Assembly's intranet and internet sites. I urge everybody who is able to make a contribution to do so. The future is ours to shape, to secure a distinctive, innovative and inclusive 14 to 19 phase in the context of lifelong learning in Wales.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales agrees with much of this statement.

enillir. Mae hefyd wedi symud ymlaen yn arwyddocaol o ran sefydlu cydraddoldeb parch i lwybrau academiaidd a galwedigaethol. Dyna'r her.

Mae llawer o'r cyrff perthnasol eisoes wedi enwebu cynrychiolwyr i weithio gyda fy swyddogion yn yr Adran Addysg a Hyfforddiant, fel rhan o dîm prosiect a grŵp cyfeirio a fydd yn darparu'r peirianwaith ar gyfer ymgynghori rhagarweiniol helaeth gyda phawb sydd eisiau cyfrannu. Mae'r cynrychiolwyr yn cynnwys ysgolion, sefydliadau addysg bellach ac uwch, cyrff gyrfaoedd, darparwyr hyfforddiant, Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru, Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru, Estyn, Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, Cymdeithas Cyfarwyddwyr Addysg Cymru, Partneriaeth Addysg Busnes, gwaith ieuentid a'r sector gwirfoddol.

Gobeithiaf y bydd trafod helaeth ym mhob sector, y gellir ei fwydo i mewn i ddatblygiad ar gyfer y rheini yn yr ystod oedran 14 i 19. Rhaid inni wneud cynigion pendant ar yr hyn sy'n gweithio orau i bobl ifanc a beth y mae'n rhaid inni ei wneud i ddarparu'r cyfleoedd gorau i bawb. Hoffwn i bawb sydd eisiau cael dweud eu dweud fynegi eu barn rhwng yn awr a mis Awst. Bydd hyn yn ein helpu i ddatblygu argymhellion a gyhoeddir ar gyfer ymgynghori ffurfiol ddiwedd mis Hydref, pryd y ceir amser i roi sylwadau ar y cynigion yn gyffredinol. Wedyn gallwn ddatblygu cynllun gweithredu i'w roi ar waith erbyn Ebrill 2003, a fydd yn seiliedig ar yr ymarfer partneriaeth sylweddol hwn. Mae arnaf eisiau mynd fesul cam i gyflwyno'r argymhellion hynny a dderbynnir. Bydd manylion am y broses ymgynghori, a'r gwaith sy'n mynd rhagddo, yn ymddangos cyn hir ar safleoedd mewnwyd a rhyngwyd y Cynulliad. Anogaf bawb sy'n gallu gwneud cyfraniad i wneud hynny. Ein lle ni yw ffurfio'r dyfodol, i sicrhau cyfnod 14 i 19 unigryw, arloesol a chynhwysol yng nghyd-destun dysgu gydol oes yng Nghymru.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Mae Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales yn cytuno â llawer o'r

Given that it contains little that is new and nothing that is controversial it would be difficult not to do so. It is somewhat of a filler and it is interesting that it takes the place of a statement, potentially more controversial, on the palliative care strategy. However, this is a valuable statement and I agree with the Minister's comments on engaging disaffected people aged 14 to 19.

We look forward to contributing to the ongoing debate on this matter, and I join the Minister in urging the greatest possible number of groups and individuals to participate in this important consultation. I would welcome her response to my questions either today or in another forum as appropriate given the long timescale for this agenda. The Minister mentioned the collaboration between schools and colleges in the statement. What steps is she currently taking, while the consultation proceeds, to ensure more effective co-operation between schools and colleges? Evidence suggests that the development of community consortia for education and training is patchy at present. Although there is good practice, it must be robustly promoted to ensure that, when the 14 to 19 age group agenda is introduced, schools and colleges are ready for it.

Does the Minister share my concern about the rapidly increasing economic inactivity rates, as opposed to unemployment rates, among young people? I believe that the figure for the last 12 months was a 33 per cent increase, which suggests that we now have disaffected people registering as sick and disabled rather than appearing in the unemployment figures. Will the Minister give a commitment to ensuring that the action plan effectively addresses the need for strong links between education providers and local employers at an early age, to support young people, especially those who are disaffected, in developing positive attitudes to work and employment?

I welcome the Minister's valuable comments on involving children and young people in the consultation process. However, how will she include the most disaffected young

datganiad hwn. Gan nad yw'n cynnwys fawr ddim sy'n newydd a dim o gwbl sy'n ddadleuol byddai'n anodd peidio. Ychydig o ddeunydd llenwi ydyw ac mae'n ddiddorol ei fod yn cymryd lle datganiad, a allai fod yn fwy dadleuol, ar y strategaeth gofal lliniarol. Er hynny, mae hwn yn ddatganiad gwerthfawr a chytunaf â sylwadau'r Gweinidog ar sicrhau cyfranogiad pobl ifanc 14 i 19 oed sydd wedi ymddieithrio.

Edrychwn ymlaen at gyfrannu i'r ddadl barhaus ar y mater hwn, ac ymunaf â'r Gweinidog i annog y nifer fwyaf posibl o grwpiau ac unigolion i gyfranogi yn yr ymgynghoriad pwysig hwn. Byddwn yn croesawu ei hymateb i'm cwestiynau naill ai heddiw neu mewn fforwm arall fel y bo'n briodol, yn wyneb yr amserlen hir ar gyfer yr agenda hon. Soniodd y Gweinidog am y cydweithio rhwng ysgolion a cholegau yn y datganiad. Pa gamau y mae hi'n eu cymryd ar hyn o bryd, tra bod yr ymgynghori'n mynd rhagddo, i sicrhau cydweithredu mwy effeithiol rhwng ysgolion a cholegau? Awgryma tystiolaeth fod datblygiad consortia cymunedol dros addysg a hyfforddiant yn dameidiog ar hyn o bryd. Er y ceir arferion da, rhaid eu hyrwyddo'n gryf er mwyn sicrhau, pan gyflwynir yr agenda ar gyfer grŵp oedran 14 i 19, y bydd ysgolion a cholegau'n barod amdani.

A ydyw'r Gweinidog yn rhannu fy mhryder ynghylch y cyfraddau segurddod economaidd sy'n cynyddu'n gyflym, yn hytrach na chyfraddau diweithdra, ymhlith pobl ifanc? Credaf fod y ffigur am y 12 mis diwethaf yn dangos cynnydd o 33 y cant, sydd yn awgrymu fod gennym yn awr bobl sydd wedi ymddieithrio yn cofrestru'n sâl ac anabl yn hytrach na'u bod yn ymddangos yn y ffigurau di-waith. A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi ymrwymiad i sicrhau bod y cynllun gweithredu'n mynd i'r afael yn effeithiol â'r angen am gysylltiadau cryf rhwng darparwyr addysg a chyflogwyr lleol ar oedran cynnar, i gefnogi pobl ifanc, yn enwedig y rhai sydd wedi dadrithio, i ddatblygu agweddau cadarnhaol at waith a chyflogaeth?

Croesawaf sylwadau gwerthfawr y Gweinidog ynghylch cynnwys plant a phobl ifanc yn y broses ymgynghori. Fodd bynnag, sut y gwnaiff hi gynnwys y bobl ifanc mwyaf

people in that process—those for whom this agenda is most relevant—particularly those in care? I suggest that the Minister directly involve Voices from Care, as it would have a valuable input.

Finally, does the Minister agree that children and young people in care are often the most disaffected by education? We all know that that is true. The 14 to 19 age group agenda must address their needs. Does she also share my concern about the capacity of children and young people currently in the care of Cardiff County Council to participate in training and education given recent evidence of the dangerous state of child protection in the city? Will she and her colleagues intervene urgently in the situation to ensure that these young people do not lose their one-off opportunities?

**Jane Davidson:** The reason I made this statement today, and not on Thursday as initially planned, is because I am in Brussels on Thursday representing the UK at the youth council. The statement was, therefore, brought forward.

It is important that we have established the project team as promised and named individuals. I will ensure that all members of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee are sent a list of those on the project team. There is a wider external reference group in terms of contributing ideas to this process. We said that we would do that within this timescale and we are delivering on that. This project happened and transition was considered partly because it is so important to have this kind of overall collaboration between schools and colleges. In the education agenda—and my portfolio covers education and lifelong learning—we are considering all the periods of transition, with the Committee's support. We are looking at early years, key stage 2 to key stage 3 and post-16 education in terms of facilitating opportunities for lifelong learning. I meet regularly with my colleague, Andrew Davies, to discuss the employment agenda, which links so closely with the education and skills agenda, and I will

ymddieithriedig yn y broses honno—y rhai y mae'r agenda hon yn fwyaf perthnasol iddynt—yn enwedig y rhai sydd mewn gofal? Awgrymaf fod y Gweinidog yn derbyn cyfraniad uniongyrchol gan Voices from Care, gan y byddai ganddo fewnbwn gwerthfawr.

Yn olaf, a ydyw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno mai plant a phobl ifanc mewn gofal sydd yn aml yn fwyaf ymddieithriedig ynglŷn ag addysg? Gwyddom i gyd fod hynny'n wir. Rhaid i agenda'r grŵp oed 14 i 19 fynd i'r afael â'u hanghenion. A ydyw hi'n rhannu fy mhryder hefyd ynghylch gallu plant a phobl ifanc sydd ar hyn o bryd yng ngofal Cyngor Sir Caerdydd i gyfranogi mewn addysg a hyfforddiant yn wyneb tystiolaeth ddiweddar o gyflwr peryglus y drefn amddiffyn plant yn y ddinas? A wnaiff hi a'i chyd-Weinidogion ymyrryd ar fyrder yn y sefyllfa er mwyn sicrhau na fydd y bobl ifanc hyn yn colli'u cyfleoedd unwaith-ac-am-byth?

**Jane Davidson:** Y rheswm y gwneuthum y datganiad hwn heddiw, ac nid ddydd Iau fel a gynlluniwyd yn wreiddiol, yw oherwydd y byddaf ym Mrwsel ddydd Iau yn cynrychioli'r DU ar y cyngor ieuenctid. Cafodd y datganiad, felly, ei symud ymlaen.

Mae'n bwysig ein bod wedi sefydlu'r tîm prosiect fel y bu inni addo, a'n bod wedi enwi unigolion. Sicrhaf yr anfonir rhestr at holl aelodau'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes o'r rheini sydd ar y tîm prosiect. Y mae grŵp cyfeirio allanol ehangach ar gyfer cyfrannu syniadau i'r broses hon. Dywedasom y gwnaem hynny o fewn yr amserlen hon ac yr ydym yn cadw'n gair ar hynny. Digwyddodd y prosiect hwn ac ystyriwyd trawsnewid yn rhannol oherwydd ei bod mor bwysig cael y math hwn o gydweithio rhwng ysgolion a cholegau. Yn yr agenda addysg—ac mae fy mhortffolio i'n cynnwys addysg a dysgu gydol oes—yr ydym yn ystyried yr holl gyfnodau trawsnewid, gyda chefnogaeth y Pwyllgor. Yr ydym yn edrych ar flynyddoedd cynnar, cyfnod allweddol 2 i gyfnod allweddol 3, ac addysg ôl-16 o ran hyrwyddo cyfleoedd ar gyfer dysgu gydol oes. Byddaf yn cyfarfod yn rheolaidd gyda'm cyd-Weinidog, Andrew Davies, i drafod yr agenda cyflogaeth, sy'n cysylltu mor agos â'r agenda addysg a

consider the economic inactivity rate.

However, we must also celebrate some improvements in terms of those currently staying on in education. Our 2002 target for reducing the number of 16 to 18-year-olds without qualifications will be reached. The number of 19-year-olds without national vocational qualification level 2 equivalents has now fallen. There are far fewer people between 16 and 19 who are not involved in education, employment or training. That has improved by 15 per cent from 1999 to 2001. There are positive messages and our 2002 targets for 19-year-olds have already been reached. We must strike the balance between encouraging those who are succeeding—we have the best success ever in Wales in all those areas—and encouraging ways in which those who are not participating can actively contribute.

We endorse the need for good work-related education, which is why I sought advice from ACCAC on making that statutory. We are also working closely on that with Careers Wales. I endorse Helen Mary's view about seeking the input of looked-after children. I attended a conference with Voices from Care last week, and expressed the Assembly's support for looked-after children. I am sure that my colleague, Jane Hutt, is considering the broad agenda of child protection issues in Wales.

**John Griffiths:** Do you agree that sport is important for young people in terms of fitness and health, enjoyment and interest, and providing a sense of achievement that can raise self-esteem and confidence and feed into academic and career success? That is perhaps particularly relevant to areas of social deprivation. A prime example is Hartridge High School in my constituency, which has achieved a great deal of sixth form academic and sporting success through football and rugby and will extend this to cricket during the next school year and hopefully to girls' football and dance in the near future. It serves a Communities First area and is combining academic and sporting achievement with the social inclusion agenda.

sgiliau, ac fe ystyriaf y gyfradd segurdod economaidd.

Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni ddathlu rhai gwelliannau hefyd o ran y rheini sydd ar hyn o bryd yn aros mewn addysg. Byddwn yn cyrraedd ein targed 2002 ar gyfer lleihau nifer y bobl 16 i 18 mlwydd oed sydd heb gymwysterau. Mae nifer y bobl 19 oed heb gymwysterau cyfwerth â lefel 2 NVQ bellach wedi cwmpo. Mae llawer llai o bobl rhwng 16 a 19 nad ydynt yn ymwneud ag addysg, cyflogaeth neu hyfforddiant. Gwelwyd gwelliant o 15 y cant yn hynny o 1999 i 2001. Mae negeseuon cadarnhaol, ac mae'n targedau 2002 ar gyfer pobl 19 oed wedi eu cyrraedd yn barod. Rhaid inni daro'r cydbwysedd rhwng annog y rhai sy'n llwyddo—mae gennym y llwyddiant gorau erioed yng Nghymru yn yr holl feysydd hynny—ac annog ffyrdd y gall y rheini nad ydynt yn cyfranogi wneud cyfraniad gweithredol.

Ategwn yr angen am addysg dda, berthnasol i waith, a dyna pam y gofynnais am gyngor gan ACCAC ar wneud hynny'n statudol. Yr ydym yn gweithio'n agos ar hynny hefyd gyda Gyrfaoedd Cymru. Ategaf farn Helen Mary ynghylch ceisio mewnbwn plant sydd mewn gofal. Mynychais gynhadledd gyda Voices from Care yr wythnos diwethaf, a mynegais gefnogaeth y Cynulliad i blant y gofelig amdanynt. Yr wyf yn siŵr fod fy nghyd-Weinidog, Jane Hutt, yn ystyried agenda eang materion amddiffyn plant yng Nghymru.

**John Griffiths:** A gytunwch fod chwaraeon yn bwysig i bobl ifanc o ran ffitrwydd a iechyd, mwynhad a diddordeb, a rhoi synnwyr o gyflawni a all godi hunan-barch a hyder a bwydo llwyddiant academiaidd a gyrfaoel? Mae hynny efallai'n arbennig o berthnasol i ardaloedd lle ceir amddifadedd cymdeithasol. Enghraifft amlwg yw Ysgol Uwchradd Hartridge yn fy etholaeth, lle mae'r chweched dosbarth wedi cyflawni llawer iawn o lwyddiant academiaidd ac mewn chwaraeon drwy bêl-droed a rygbi, a bydd yn ymestyn hyn i griced yn ystod y flwyddyn ysgol nesaf a, gobeithio, i bêl-droed merched a dawns yn y dyfodol agos. Mae'n gwasanaethu ardal Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf ac mae'n cyfuno cyflawniad

It encourages academic achievement through interest in sport and builds the status and confidence of the school for the good of everyone. Do you agree that that is a good example of what sport can help to achieve?

**Jane Davidson:** Sport in schools and encouraging healthy activity is important. Jane Hutt, Jenny Randerson and myself are all closely engaged with that. We have provided an extra £0.5 million this year, part of which will be used to develop our 16 curriculum development centres, where we encourage groups of schools to work together, offering wide sporting opportunities. From this year, £48 million of new opportunities fund money will be invested in the system over four years to enhance sporting facilities in schools. We are also considering continuous professional development for teachers and ensuring that initial teacher training institutions have the right framework in place to encourage that. It is important that, when we consider the more vocational curriculum, there are more opportunities to gain qualifications in sport for those young people who want to do that, which will set them on the learning ladder.

**Jonathan Morgan:** We agree with Helen Mary Jones and congratulate you on the small amount of detail and the large amount of padding in your statement. I will focus on the small amount of detail. First, has the team met? A number of people have been nominated to be part of an official-led team, but has the team met? If so, what priorities has it established and what areas of policy will it examine? You said in your statement that we now need to focus on practical issues and you listed them. However, has the team has made real progress thus far?

3:20 p.m.

In referring to the areas that you want to focus on, you seem to support a measure of diversity in the education system, whereby you wish not to apply some aspects of the national curriculum. Do you agree that one way of supporting greater diversity in the education system would be by ensuring that

academaidd a chwaraeon gyda'r agenda cynhwysiant cymdeithasol. Mae'n annog cyflawniad academaidd drwy ddiddordeb mewn chwaraeon ac yn adeiladu statws a hyder yr ysgol er lles pawb. A gytunwch fod honno'n enghraifft dda o'r hyn y gall chwaraeon helpu i'w gyflawni?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae chwaraeon yn yr ysgol, ac annog gweithgaredd iach, yn bwysig. Mae Jane Hutt, Jenny Randerson a mi i gyd yn ymwneud yn agos â hynny. Yr ydym wedi darparu £0.5 miliwn ychwanegol eleni, a defnyddir rhan o hynny i ddatblygu ein 16 canolfan ddatblygu cwricwlwm, lle anogwn grwpiau o ysgolion i weithio gyda'i gilydd, gan gynnig cyfleoedd chwaraeon eang. O eleni, buddsoddir £48 miliwn o arian y gronfa cyfleoedd newydd yn y system dros bedair blynedd i wella cyfleusterau chwaraeon mewn ysgolion. Yr ydym hefyd yn ystyried datblygu proffesiynol parhaus i athrawon a sicrhau bod gan y sefydliadau hyfforddi athrawon cychwynnol y fframwaith iawn i annog hynny. Mae'n bwysig, pan ystyriwn y cwricwlwm mwy galwedigaethol, fod mwy o gyfleoedd i ennill cymwysterau mewn chwaraeon i'r bobl ifanc sydd eisiau gwneud hynny, a fydd yn eu gosod ar yr ysgol ddysg.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Cytunwn â Helen Mary Jones a llongyfarchwn chi ar yr ychydig bach o fanylion a'r llawer iawn o ddeunydd llenwi yn eich datganiad. Canolbwytiaf ar yr ychydig bach o fanylion. Yn gyntaf, a yw'r tîm wedi cyfarfod? Enwebwyd nifer o bobl i fod yn rhan o dîm a arweinir gan swyddogion, ond a ydyw'r tîm wedi cyfarfod? Os do, pa flaenoriaethau y mae wedi'u sefydlu a pha feysydd polisi y gwnaiff eu harchwilio? Dywedasoich yn eich datganiad fod angen yn awr inni ganolbwyntio ar faterion ymarferol, ac fe'u rhestrwyd gennych. Fodd bynnag, a ydyw'r tîm wedi gwneud gwir gynnydd hyd yma?

Wrth gyfeirio at y meysydd yr hoffech chi ganolbwyntio arnynt, mae'n ymddangos eich bod yn cefnogi mesur o amrywiaeth yn y system addysg, gan ddewis peidio â chymhwyso rhai agweddau ar y cwricwlwm cenedlaethol. A gytunwch mai un ffordd o gefnogi mwy o amrywiaeth yn y system

the new Education Bill enables the Assembly to promote specialist schools or academies? That choice will be available to our colleagues in England.

In terms of developing the practical ideas that the team will consider, your statement referred to education and business partnerships. We are aware of the excellent work of mid Glamorgan's education and business partnership, which is the best in Wales. In its work on mentoring, employability, skills, industry days, and so on, it leads the field. As the work of education and business partnerships in Wales is patchy, what can the Government do to encourage those who do not have as good a record as mid Glamorgan's? The work of such partnerships could be pivotal in supporting some of the issues that you wish to focus on.

On combating disaffection, one problem that we know about from the evidence collated so far is the lack of appropriate skills levels among parents. That can affect their children, not only in terms of how much homework they can help them with, but also in terms of their attitudes towards school. I would like reference to how we continue to improve adults' skills levels and confidence, so that parents can do more to raise awareness and promote good schooling for their children. Do you support your UK party's policy position of locking up parents who fail to ensure that their children attend school?

**Jane Davidson:** I do not think that the team has met yet, but I cannot give a categorical assurance either way. The members from all the organisations that comprise the team have been identified, as have the members of the external reference group. I will report on the team's progress in my next Minister's report to the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee.

In 'The Learning Country' we proposed inviting ACCAC to offer advice on possible options for increasing the flexibility available to schools through disapplication of the national curriculum, taking account of the different shape and option structure at key stage 4 in Wales. That was keenly welcomed

addysg fyddai drwy sicrhau bod y Mesur Addysg newydd yn galluogi'r Cynulliad i hyrwyddo ysgolion arbenigol neu academiâu? Bydd y dewis hwnnw ar gael i'n cyfeillion yn Lloegr.

O safbwynt datblygu'r syniadau ymarferol y bydd y tîm yn eu hystyried, cyfeiriodd eich datganiad at bartneriaethau addysg a busnes. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol o waith ardderchog partneriaeth addysg a busnes Morgannwg ganol, sef y gorau yng Nghymru. Yn ei gwaith ar fentora, cyflogadwyedd, sgiliau, dyddiau diwydiant, ac ati, mae'n arwain y maes. Gan fod gwaith partneriaethau addysg a busnes yng Nghymru yn ddarniog, beth all y Llywodraeth ei wneud i annog y rheini sydd heb record gystal ag un Morgannwg ganol? Gallai gwaith partneriaethau o'r fath fod yn ganolog o ran cefnogi rhai o'r materion y dymunwch ganolbwyntio arnynt.

Ynghylch ymladd ymddieithrio, un broblem y gwyddom amdani ar sail y dystiolaeth a gasglwyd hyd yma yw'r diffyg lefelau sgiliau priodol ymhlith rhieni. Gall hynny effeithio ar eu plant, nid yn unig yn nhermau faint y gallant eu cynorthwyo gyda'u gwaith cartref, ond hefyd yn nhermau eu hagweddu tuag at ysgol. Hoffwn gyfeiriad at sut yr ydym yn parhau i wella lefelau sgiliau a hyder oedolion, fel y gall rhieni wneud mwy i godi ymwybyddiaeth a hyrwyddo gyrfya ysgol dda i'w plant. A gytunwch â safle polisi eich plaid yn y DU o garcharu rhieni sy'n methu sicrhau bod eu plant yn mynd i'r ysgol?

**Jane Davidson:** Nid wyf yn meddwl bod y tîm wedi cyfarfod eto, ond ni allaf roi sicrwydd pendant y naill ffordd na'r llall. Mae'r aelodau o'r holl sefydliadau sy'n rhan o'r tîm wedi'u henwi, ynghyd ag aelodau'r grŵp cyfeirio allanol. Adroddaf ar hynt y tîm yn fy adroddiad Gweinidog nesaf i'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes.

Yn 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu' cynigiasom y dylid gwahodd ACCAC i gynnig cyngor ar opsiynau posibl ar gyfer cynyddu'r hyblygrwydd sydd ar gael i ysgolion drwy ddatgymhwyso'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol, gan ystyried gwahanol siâp a strwythur dewisiadau cyfnod allweddol 4 yng

by the entire education sector. That is exactly the sort of issue that the team will explore. I remind you that specialist schools are established under current legislation and therefore a new Education Bill is not needed for that; the provisions are already in place. We will consider a range of options that we included in the Education Bill, which will demonstrate that we have fulfilled our obligations under 'The Learning Country' and are taking forward the agenda in a way that is appropriate to Wales.

I strongly endorse your support for education and business partnerships. They are an important link in the project group, linking the work-related educational aspects, entrepreneurial activity, the education system and other different aspects of formal and informal learning that the project group will consider.

Tackling disaffection is high on our agenda, as you know. We presented a report to the Committee last week and had a good discussion on those issues. When we tackle truancy issues we need to take a carrot and stick approach. The Assembly's focus, under the powers allocated to it, is putting the right incentives in place to ensure that all young people want to participate in education.

**Mick Bates:** Your statement is welcome. It embodies the belief that we must develop the full academic, vocational, personal and social potential of all our children. I am convinced that developing a Welsh baccalaureate will play a crucial role in achieving those aims. Do you agree that the continuity and consistency of the qualification's delivery across Wales will be a great challenge? What robust systems will you put in place to ensure that monitoring, evaluation and feedback will be used to achieve the aim of using best practice?

I am particularly interested in the issue of disaffection because we all meet teachers whose efforts in the classroom are destroyed by destructive individuals. Those people are disaffected by the system in which they work.

Nghymru. Croesawyd hynny'n frwd gan y sector addysg i gyd. Dyna'n union y math o fater y bydd y tîm yn ymchwilio iddo. Fe'ch atgoffaf fod ysgolion arbenigol wedi'u sefydlu dan y ddeddfwriaeth bresennol, ac felly nid oes angen Mesur Addysg newydd ar gyfer hynny; mae'r darpariaethau'n bodoli eisoes. Fe ystyriwn amrediad o ddewisiadau a gynhwyswyd gennym yn y Mesur Addysg, a fydd yn dangos ein bod wedi cyflawni ein dyletswyddau dan 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu' a'n bod yn mynd â'r agenda yn ei blaen mewn ffordd sy'n briodol i Gymru.

Ategaf yn gryf eich cefnogaeth i bartneriaethau addysg a busnes. Maent yn ddolen gyswllt bwysig yn y grŵp prosiect, gan gysylltu'r agweddau addysgol perthnasol i waith, gweithgaredd entrepreneuriaid, y system addysg ac agweddau gwahanol eraill ar ddysgu ffurfiol ac anffurfiol y bydd y grŵp prosiect yn eu hystyried.

Mae delio ag ymddieithrio yn uchel ar ein hagenda, fel y gwyddoch. Cyflwynasom adroddiad i'r Pwyllgor yr wythnos diwethaf a chawsom drafodaeth dda ar y materion hynny. Pan ymdriniwn â materion triwantiaeth mae angen mynd ati gyda moronen a ffon. Ffocws y Cynulliad, dan y pwerau a roddwyd iddo, yw sefydlu'r cymhellion iawn i sicrhau bod pawb ifanc eisiau cyfranogi mewn addysg.

**Mick Bates:** Croesewir eich datganiad. Mae'n ymgorffori'r gred fod yn rhaid inni ddatblygu potensial academiaidd, galwedigaethol, personol a chymdeithasol ein plant i gyd. Yr wyf yn argyhoeddedig y bydd datblygu bagloriaeth Gymreig yn chwarae rôl allweddol wrth gyflawni'r amcanion hynny. A gytunwch y bydd sicrhau dilyniant a chysondeb i gyflwyniad y cymhwyster ledled Cymru yn her fawr? Pa systemau cadarn a sefydlwch i sicrhau y defnyddir monitro, arfarnu ac adborth i wireddu'r nod o ddefnyddio arfer gorau?

Mae gennyf ddiddordeb arbennig ym mater ymddieithrio oherwydd byddwn i gyd yn cyfarfod ag athrawon y caiff eu hymdrechion yn yr ystafell ddosbarth eu distrywio gan unigolion dinistriol. Mae'r bobl hynny wedi'u hymddieithrio gan y system y gweithiant ynddi.



Our target-driven national curriculum has led to an emphasis on the academic nature of education. I am concerned about the different status of academic and vocational qualifications. How can we ensure a more equal status for these qualifications throughout schools in Wales?

I am also interested to hear about the development of partnerships, which other Members have mentioned. The partnership with social services often works best, whereby skilled people can mediate and address the psychological problems that young people often suffer. Consulting young people is important, especially if they have a disability. Will you ensure that the project group will talk to those with disabilities and ensure that they also have the resources to help them achieve their full potential?

**Jane Davidson:** I agree that the Welsh baccalaureate offers a real opportunity for the future and that it will be an important qualification for the young people of Wales.

Unless it was misreported, I believe that a statement was made at the Conservative Party conference, which said that only 19 schools and colleges took part in the pilot scheme. That misrepresented the position, as 19 was the maximum number that could take part. I am delighted to confirm once again that the maximum number of schools and colleges took part in the pilot.

Your point about good practice is well made. The project group will address the issue of identifying good practice and ensuring that we spread it across Wales. Much good practice exists but we do not always know where.

In terms of monitoring and evaluation, we have already ensured that Estyn will have an area inspection role for 14 to 19-year-olds. That is important as it will take on board the whole provision.

I was disappointed last year to find that the

Mae ein cwricwlwm cenedlaethol a yrrir gan dargedau wedi arwain at bwyslais ar natur academiaidd addysg. Yr wyf yn anfodlon â'r gwahaniaeth statws a roddir i gymwysterau academiaidd a galwedigaethol. Sut y gallwn ni sicrhau statws mwy cyfartal i'r cymwysterau hynny mewn ysgolion ledled Cymru?

Mae gennyf ddiddordeb mewn clywed hefyd am ddatblygiad partneriaethau, y mae Aelodau eraill wedi eu crybwyll. Y bartneriaeth gyda'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol sy'n gweithio orau yn aml, lle gall pobl fedrus ganoli a rhoi sylw i'r problemau seicolegol y mae pobl ifanc yn eu dioddef yn aml. Mae'n bwysig ymgynghori â phobl ifanc, yn enwedig os oes ganddynt anabledd. A wnewch chi sicrhau y bydd y grŵp prosiect yn trafod â phobl ag anableddau a sicrhau y cânt yr adnoddau hefyd i'w helpu i gyflawni eu llawn botensial?

**Jane Davidson:** Cytunaf fod y fagloriaeth Gymreig yn cynnig gwir gyfle ar gyfer y dyfodol ac y bydd yn gymhwyster pwysig i bobl ifanc Cymru.

Oni chafodd ei gamadrodd, credaf y gwnaethpwyd datganiad yng nghynhadledd y Blaid Geidwadol, a ddywedodd mai dim ond 19 o ysgolion a cholegau a gymerodd ran yn y cynllun peilot. Camliwiad o'r sefyllfa oedd hynny, gan mai 19 oedd y nifer mwyaf a gâi gymryd rhan. Yr wyf yn falch o gadarnhau unwaith eto fod y nifer fwyaf posibl o ysgolion a cholegau wedi cymryd rhan yn y peilot.

Mae'ch pwynt am arfer da wedi'i wneud yn dda. Bydd y grŵp prosiect yn delio â mater nodi arferion da a sicrhau y cânt eu lledaenu ar draws Cymru. Mae llawer o arfer da'n bodoli, ond nid ydym bob amser yn gwybod ym mhle.

O ran monitro ac arfarnu, yr ydym eisoes wedi sicrhau y bydd gan Estyn rôl archwilio fesul ardal ar gyfer rhai 14 i 19 oed. Mae hynny'n bwysig gan y bydd yn derbyn y ddarpariaeth gyfan.

Yr oeddwn yn siomedig y llynedd o ganfod

proportion of schools in Wales that were offering both vocational and academic qualifications was relatively small. I am pleased that that has increased dramatically this year, not least because the schools which offer both types of qualifications, particularly in deprived areas, have better take-up rates of vocational qualifications, better rates in terms of dealing with disaffected young people, and improved GCSE results. That is a strong testament to providing the right kind of curriculum and how that attracts people into education.

I will undertake to consult with young people, particularly those with disabilities, because the new requirements under the disability legislation are relevant to this issue. We must ensure that all young people have access to the services being provided through the education system.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Regarding disability, in your statement you referred to all our young people, whatever their talents and abilities. In order to ensure a widespread debate, will you also express the hope that it will include young people with special educational needs?

**Jane Davidson:** It is important that we ensure that our services are fit for all young people. When we consider reviewing the 14 to 19 curriculum, we must consider how appropriately young people's needs are met at present. I will ensure that we take into account the needs of all young people, including those with special educational needs. On the 11 plus agenda we are talking about extending entitlement. Young people in Wales have a right to a decent education, delivered effectively, and we want to ensure that we put the mechanisms in place to achieve that.

3:30 p.m.

**David Davies:** The amount spent by 'The Learning Country' on advertising has increased five times. You are also spending millions of pounds on advertising helplines served by call centres in the midlands. A total of £3.2 million was spent on the reading, writing and arithmetic public information

fod y ganran o ysgolion yng Nghymru a oedd yn cynnig cymwysterau galwedigaethol ac academiaidd ill dau yn gymharol fach. Yr wyf yn falch fod hynny wedi cynyddu'n ddramatig eleni, nid yn lleiaf oherwydd bod yr ysgolion sy'n cynnig y ddau fath o gymwysterau, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig, yn cael gwell niferoedd yn ymgymryd â chymwysterau galwedigaethol, gwell cyfraddau o ran delio â phobl ifanc sydd wedi ymddieithrio, a gwell canlyniadau TGAU. Mae hynny'n destament cryf i ddarparu'r math iawn o gwricwlwm a'r modd y mae hynny'n denu pobl at addysg.

Ymgymeraf i ymgynghori â phobl ifanc, yn enwedig y rhai ag anableddau, oherwydd mae'r gofynion newydd dan y ddeddfwriaeth anabledd yn berthnasol i hyn. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod gan bob person ifanc fynediad at y gwasanaethau a ddarperir drwy'r system addysg.

**Gwenda Thomas:** O safbwynt anabledd, yn eich datganiad gwnaethoch gyfeirio at ein pobl ifanc i gyd, beth bynnag fo'u doniau a'u galluoedd. Er mwyn sicrhau dadl eang, a wnewch chi fynegi'r gobaith hefyd y gwnaiff gynnwys pobl ifanc ag anghenion addysgol arbennig?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn sicrhau bod ein gwasanaethau yn addas i bob person ifanc. Pan ystyriwn adolygu'r cwricwlwm 14 i 19, rhaid inni ystyried pa mor briodol yw'r ddarpariaeth ar gyfer anghenion pobl ifanc ar hyn o bryd. Byddaf yn sicrhau yr ystyriwn anghenion pob person ifanc, gan gynnwys y rheini ag anghenion addysgol arbennig. Ar agenda'r 11 plws yr ydym yn sôn am ymestyn hawliau. Mae gan bobl ifanc yng Nghymru hawl i addysg dda, wedi'i chyflwyno'n effeithiol, ac mae arnom eisiau sicrhau ein bod yn gosod y mecanweithiau i gyflawni hynny.

**David Davies:** Mae'r swm a wariwyd gan 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu' ar hysbysebu wedi cynyddu bum gwaith. Yr ydych yn gwario miliynau o bunnoedd hefyd ar hysbysebu llinellau cymorth a wasanaethir gan ganolfannau galwadau yng nghanoldir Lloegr. Gwariwyd cyfanswm o £3.2 miliwn

campaign. What was the total amount spent by 'The Learning Country' on advertising and public information campaigns in the last financial year, and how much do you intend to spend in this financial year? If you cannot give me an answer—and I am sure that it is information that you will not have to hand—will you write to me? Many other Members would also be interested to know the answer.

**Jane Davidson:** 'The Learning Country' is a document, therefore it has never made expenditure. If you would like to write to me with a clear question about the information you require, I will provide a clear response.

**Lorraine Barrett:** You have answered most of my questions in your response to Gwenda Thomas. However, can you assure me that the representatives on the project team undertaking the consultation will reflect properly the views of young people and that they will consult directly with them, not merely represent them? Will they contact projects such as the Penarth Youth Project and undertake outreach work on the streets in order to reach disaffected young people?

**Jane Davidson:** One reason why this project team is being led by the youth policy team, rather than a branch of the Training and Education Department, is to ensure that it corresponds with the extending entitlement agenda. In the early stages, we are, in a sense, talking about a project and about specialists being invited to come together to work up proposals by October, which will then be the subject of extensive consultation. I will urge the youth policy team to use all its links during that period to canvass the views of young people as far as is possible. I can assure you that, during the second stage, from October to April, we will actively seek the views of young people. It remains to be seen how easy it will be for the project team to do that during the first stage. However, we will look for every opportunity to contact young people.

**Gareth Jones:** Croesawaf y datganiad hwn gan ei fod yn ymdrin â maes hollbwysig.

ar yr ymgyrch gwybodaeth gyhoeddus dros ddarllen, ysgrifennu a rhifydddeg. Beth oedd y cyfanswm a wariwyd gan 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu' ar ymgyrchoedd hysbysebu a rhoi gwybodaeth i'r cyhoedd yn y flwyddyn ariannol ddiwethaf, a faint y bwriadwch ei wario yn y flwyddyn ariannol hon? Os na allwch roi ateb imi—ac yr wyf yn siŵr mai gwybodaeth ydyw na fydd wrth law gennyh—a wnewch chi ysgrifennu ataf? Byddai gan lawer o Aelodau eraill ddiddordeb mewn gwybod yr ateb hefyd.

**Jane Davidson:** Dogfen yw 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu', felly nid yw erioed wedi gwario. Os hoffech ysgrifennu ataf gyda chwestiwn clir ynghylch yr wybodaeth yr hoffech ei chael, rhoddaf ateb clir ichi.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Yr ydych wedi ateb y rhan fwyaf o'm cwestiynau i wrth ateb Gwenda Thomas. Fodd bynnag, a allwch roi sicrwydd imi y bydd y cynrychiolwyr ar y tîm prosiect sy'n gwneud yr ymgynghori yn adlewyrchu'n briodol farn pobl ifanc ac y byddant yn ymgynghori'n uniongyrchol â hwy, nid dim ond yn eu cynrychioli? A wnânt gysylltu â phrosiectau fel Prosiect Ieuencid Penarth a gwneud gwaith ymestyn allan ar y strydoedd er mwyn cyrraedd pobl ifanc sydd wedi ymddieithrio?

**Jane Davidson:** Un rheswm pam y mae'r tîm prosiect hwn yn cael ei arwain gan y tîm polisi ieuencid, yn hytrach na chan gangen o'r Adran Addysg a Hyfforddiant, yw er mwyn sicrhau ei fod yn cyfateb â'r agenda ymestyn hawliau. Yn y cyfnod cynnar, yr ydym, gellid dweud, yn sôn am brosiect ac am wahodd arbenigwyr i ddod ynghyd i lunio cynigion erbyn mis Hydref, a fydd wedyn yn destun ymgynghori helaeth. Byddaf yn annog y tîm polisi ieuencid i ddefnyddio'i gysylltiadau i gyd yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw i ganfasio barn pobl ifanc cyn belled ag y bo modd. Gallaf eich sicrhau y byddwn, yn ystod yr ail gam, o Hydref hyd Ebrill, yn mynd ati i geisio barn pobl ifanc. Amser a ddengys pa mor hawdd fydd i'r tîm prosiect wneud hynny yn ystod y cam cyntaf. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn chwilio am bob cyfle i gysylltu â phobl ifanc.

**Gareth Jones:** I welcome this statement, as it deals with an important sector. However, the

Serch hynny, caiff datblygu un polisi ym myd addysg oblygiadau i eraill. Yr ydych yn iawn i bwysleisio'r ystod o 14 i 19 oed ond, wrth gyfeirio at y Fagloriaeth Gymreig fel dull newydd o asesu i'r dyfodol, rhaid inni atgoffa ein hunain fod disgyblion yn sefyll cyfres o arholiadau allanol pan fônt yn 14 oed, 16 oed ac 18 oed, a hefyd yn 17 oed gyda'r Safon Uwch Atodol. Efallai fod disgyblion yn wynebu gormod o asesu rhwng 14 a 19 oed, a gall hynny arwain at ymddieithrio. O gofio bod y rhan fwyaf o bobl ifanc yn parhau â'u haddysg tan yn 18 oed, neu'n hŷn, a ydych yn bwriadu ystyried dyfodol tystysgrif gyffredinol addysg uwchradd fel arholiad?

Yr ydym yn cymeradwyo'r ffaith eich bod yn mynd i'r afael â thriwantiaeth ac â phobl ifanc sy'n eithrio'u hunain o ysgolion am eu bod wedi diflasu ag addysg. Yr ydych yn chwilio am enghreifftiau o arfer da yn hyn o beth. Er mwyn sicrhau bod colegau ac ysgolion Cymru yn gallu dygymod ag anawsterau o'r fath—cyfeiriodd Jonathan Morgan at sgiliau rhieni—rhaid i athrawon feithrin sgiliau priodol. Mae gan rai athrawon y sgiliau hynny eisoes ond, os ydym am sicrhau llwyddiant, rhaid eu paratoi ar gyfer gofynion ychwanegol er mwyn dygymod â'r hyn sydd dan sylw. Pa fath o fuddsoddiad yr ydych yn barod i'w wneud er mwyn sicrhau hyfforddiant effeithiol ar gyfer y proffesiwn?

**Jane Davidson:** I should make it clear that this project team is not about getting rid of GCSE, AS-level or A-level exams in Wales. It would be ridiculous to suggest that the project team would deliver such major decisions for the future between May and October. However, the project team will, hopefully, generate relevant proposals on how to foster appropriate collaborations and partnerships between organisations to enhance learning opportunities that are focused on the learners and young people. As I said in my statement, I will seek to build on the success of Wales's high level of achievement in GCSE, AS and A-levels, all of which are recognised by employers and used to move on to further and higher education. However, we must also ensure that the consultation, which will lead to phased proposals for the future, will also lead to the Assembly's curriculum review.

development of one education policy has implications for others. You are right to emphasise the importance of the 14 to 19 age range but, in referring to the Welsh baccalaureate as a new assessment tool for the future, we must bear in mind that students sit a series of external examinations at the ages of 14, 16 and 18, as well as at the age of 17 with the AS-level. Perhaps students are over-assessed between the ages of 14 and 19, and that can lead to disaffection. Given that the majority of young people continue with their education up to the age of 18, and sometimes beyond, do you intend to consider the future of the general certificate of secondary education as an examination?

We commend the fact that you are tackling truancy and young people who opt out of schools because they are disaffected with education. You are seeking examples of good practice in this respect. In order to ensure that Wales's colleges and schools can cope with such difficulties—Jonathan Morgan referred to parenting skills—teachers must have the appropriate skills. Some teachers already possess those skills but, if we are to succeed, they must be given further training in order to be able to cope with what we have in mind. What type of investment are you prepared to make to secure effective training for the profession?

**Jane Davidson:** Dylwn ddweud yn glir nad amcan y tîm prosiect hwn yw cael gwared o arholiadau TGAU, lefel AS na lefel A yng Nghymru. Byddai'n chwerthinlyd awgrymu y byddai'r tîm prosiect yn gwneud penderfyniadau mor fawr ar gyfer y dyfodol rhwng mis Mai a mis Hydref. Fodd bynnag, bydd y tîm prosiect, gobeithio, yn llunio cynigion perthnasol ar sut i feithrin cydweithredu a phartneriaethau priodol rhwng cyrff er mwyn gwella cyfleoedd dysgu sy'n canolbwyntio ar y dysgwyr a phobl ifanc. Fel y dywedais yn fy natganiad, byddaf yn ceisio adeiladu ar lwyddiant lefel cyrhaeddiad uchel Cymru mewn TGAU, lefel AS a lefel A, sydd i gyd yn cael eu cydnabod gan gyflogwyr ac a ddefnyddir i symud ymlaen i addysg bellach ac uwch. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni sicrhau hefyd y bydd yr ymgynghori, a fydd yn arwain at gynigion cam wrth gam ar gyfer y dyfodol, yn arwain

hefyd at adolygiad cwricwlwm y Cynulliad.

The Assembly can hold a curriculum review every five years and I expect this whole agenda to feed into that. The initial emphasis is on the fact that we have made several structural changes. We have some good high-level success results, but some young people are still not engaged in this. How we fully engage them is important. For example, I visited an inclusion project last week in Presteigne in Powys and I was impressed. It is led by a person with careers qualifications. In talking to the young people there, who are between the ages of 16 and 18—some of whom had returned specifically to talk to me—what was most notable was that every one of them was going on to further education provision as a result of the inclusion project's intervention. It had given them some time out of the curriculum, supported their learning needs, and then enabled them to participate in learning in the future. That must be our aim.

The project will cost about £125,000. That is the current cost. However, the funding for the recommendations that emerge from it, once agreed by the Assembly Government, will be included in successive budget planning rounds. You will also be interested to know that, in terms of teachers' skills, a number of personal development programmes have been submitted to the General Teaching Council for Wales by teachers who are looking to develop skills in these matters. We are keen to continue that approach.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Point of order. I raise this under Standing Order No. 6.8 on Cabinet statements and Standing Order No. 5.3 on the business statement. It relates to the organisation of business for the following two weeks. It is relevant to this statement because the Minister, in reply to Helen Mary Jones, said that this statement had been rescheduled from Thursday this week to today. I have just checked the draft business statement issued by the Minister for Rural Affairs and Assembly Business last week and it made no reference to this particular statement between this week and 20 June,

Gall y Cynulliad gynnal adolygiad cwricwlwm bob pum mlynedd, a disgwyliaf i'r holl agenda hon fwydo i mewn i hynny. Mae'r pwyslais dechreuol ar y ffaith ein bod wedi gwneud sawl newid strwythurol. Cawn rai canlyniadau da o ran llwyddiant ar lefel uchel, ond mae rhai pobl ifanc yn dal i beidio â chymryd rhan yn hyn. Mae sut y llwyddwn i'w cynnwys yn llawn yn bwysig. Er enghraifft, ymwelais â phrosiect cynnwys yr wythnos diwethaf yn Llanandras ym Mhowys a chefais argraff dda. Fe'i harweinir gan berson â chymwysterau gyrfaoedd. Wrth siarad â'r bobl ifanc yno, sydd rhwng 16 a 18 oed—rhaid ohonynt wedi dychwelyd yn benodol i siarad â mi—yr hyn oedd yn fwyaf nodedig oedd bod pob un ohonynt yn mynd ymlaen i ddarpariaeth addysg bellach o ganlyniad i ymyriad y prosiect cynnwys. Yr oedd wedi rhoi cyfnod allan o'r cwricwlwm iddynt, wedi cefnogi eu hanghenion dysgu, ac wedyn wedi eu galluogi i gyfranogi mewn addysg yn y dyfodol. Rhaid inni anelu at hynny.

Bydd y prosiect yn costio tua £125,000. Dyna'r gost gyfredol. Fodd bynnag, caiff y cyllid ar gyfer yr argymhellion a ddaw allan ohono, unwaith y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cytuno arnynt, ei gynnwys yng nghylchoedd cynllunio'r gyllideb wedyn. Bydd gennyh ddiddordeb i wybod hefyd bod nifer o raglenni datblygu personol, o ran sgiliau athrawon, wedi'u cyflwyno i Gyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru gan athrawon sy'n awyddus i ddatblygu sgiliau yn y materion hyn. Yr ydym yn awyddus i barhau hynny.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Pwynt o drefn. Codaf hwn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.8 ar ddatganiadau'r Cabinet a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 5.3 ar y datganiad busnes. Mae'n ymwneud â threfniant busnes ar gyfer y pythefnos dilynol. Mae'n berthnasol i'r datganiad hwn oherwydd dywedodd y Gweinidog, mewn ateb i Helen Mary Jones, fod y datganiad hwn wedi'i symud o ddydd Iau yr wythnos hon i heddiw. Yr wyf newydd edrych ar y datganiad busnes drafft a gyhoeddwyd gan y Gweinidog Materion Gwledig a Threfnydd y Cynulliad yr wythnos diwethaf ac ni wnaeth unrhyw gyfeiriad at y

which is the final date in my business papers. Will the Government confirm that this item was not scheduled for a slot in the timetable last week, this week or anytime until the end of June? I believe that the Minister unwittingly gave a different impression.

datganiad arbennig hwn rhwng yr wythnos hon a 20 Mehefin, sef y dyddiad olaf yn fy mhapurau busnes. A wnaiff y Llywodraeth gadarnhau nad oedd yr eitem hon wedi'i rhaglennu ar gyfer lle ar yr amserlen yr wythnos diwethaf, yr wythnos hon nac unrhyw bryd tan ddiwedd Mehefin? Credaf fod y Gweinidog wedi rhoi argraff wahanol drwy amryfusedd.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I am about to call the Minister for Rural Affairs and Assembly Business to make his business statement. He may wish to respond to your point then. My understanding is that statements can be made at any time during Plenary at the request of the relevant Government Minister and I welcome that.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr wyf ar fin galw ar y Gweinidog Materion Gwledig a Threfnydd y Cynulliad i wneud ei ddatganiad busnes. Efallai y dymuna ymateb i'ch pwynt bryd hynny. Fy nealltwriaeth i yw y gellir gwneud datganiadau unrhyw bryd yn ystod Cyfarfod Llawn ar gais y Gweinidog perthnasol o'r Llywodraeth a chroesawaf hynny.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Further to that point of order, and taking account of your comments, the accuracy of what the Minister has told us is an issue. If there was an intention to schedule this statement for Thursday, it was not communicated to anybody else. She has told us that that was the intention. The question is: was that the intention or not?

**Helen Mary Jones:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, a chan ystyried eich sylwadau, mae cwestiwn ynghylch cywirdeb yr hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog wrthym. Os oedd bwriad i gynnwys y datganiad hwn ar raglen dydd Iau, ni chafodd ei gyfathrebu i neb arall. Dywedodd hi wrthym mai dyna oedd y bwriad. Y cwestiwn yw: ai dyna oedd y bwriad ai peidio?

**The Presiding Officer:** That is not the question. Ministers' intentions are of no interest to me. My interest is in the outcomes of Plenary sessions.

**Y Llywydd:** Nid dyna'r cwestiwn. Nid yw bwriadau Gweinidogion o unrhyw ddiddordeb i mi. Yng nghanlyniadau Cyfarfodydd Llawn y mae fy niddordeb i.

3:40 p.m.

### **Datganiad Busnes Business Statement**

**The Minister for Rural Affairs and Assembly Business (Carwyn Jones):** There are some minor changes to this week's business. On Thursday, we will not propose the motion to approve the race equality scheme. This will now occur on Thursday 27 June. However, the First Minister will make an oral statement this Thursday on race equality. Also on Thursday, with your permission, Llywydd, I will propose a procedural motion to allow the Assembly to consider the no-named day motion on the approval of two items of joint legislation that were tabled last Thursday. That was discussed in the Business Committee this

**Y Gweinidog Materion Gwledig a Threfnydd y Cynulliad (Carwyn Jones):** Mae rhai mân newidiadau i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Ddydd Iau, ni wnawn gyflwyno'r cynnig i gymeradwyo'r cynllun cydraddoldeb hiliol. Bydd hyn yn digwydd bellach ddydd Iau 27 Mehefin. Fodd bynnag, bydd y Prif Weinidog yn gwneud datganiad llafar ddydd Iau yma ar gydraddoldeb hiliol. Ddydd Iau hefyd, gyda'ch caniatâd, Lywydd, cynigiau gynnig trefniadol i ganiatáu i'r Cynulliad ystyried y cynnig heb ddyddiad ar gymeradwyo dwy eitem o gyd-ddeddfwriaeth a gyflwynwyd ddydd Iau diwethaf. Trafodwyd hynny yn y Pwyllgor Busnes y

morning and the party business managers were content with that arrangement.

The Business Committee also discussed this morning my draft business statement for the next three weeks, as shown on the Chamberweb under supporting documents.

Finally, the Deputy Presiding Officer determined, under Standing Order No. 22.5, that the following items of legislation need not be referred to Subject Committees for extended consideration: the Education (Recognised Bodies) (Wales) Order 2002, the Education (Listed Bodies) (Wales) Order 2002 and the Further Education (Teachers' Qualifications) (Wales) Regulations 2002.

**Y Llywydd:** Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad i'r datganiad. A oes gan Aelodau sylwadau arno?

**Jonathan Morgan:** Although I do not believe everything I read in *The Western Mail*, according to that illustrious publication this morning, the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning is apparently due to make a statement before the end of the month—presumably this week therefore—about additional funding to address the deficiency in the budget and cover the costs of teachers' performance-related pay. If a statement is to be made, will it be an oral statement on Thursday and, if so, why were we not told in the Business Committee? If it will be a written statement, will it be made available to Members as quickly as possible?

**Owen John Thomas:** Will the Minister ask the Minister for Health and Social Services to make a statement on the crisis in child protection and in Cardiff County Council's social services more generally? The content of last night's BBC *Week in, week out* programme and the fact that the child protection register was leaked to the media raise grave concerns about the safety of children in the care of the local authority. The Minister should now intervene as a matter of urgency. She should consider taking special measures and I ask that she makes a statement to the Assembly, setting out her proposals for action.

bore yma ac yr oedd rheolwyr busnes y pleidiau'n fodlon â'r trefniant hwnnw.

Trafododd y Pwyllgor Busnes hefyd y bore yma fy natganiad busnes drafft am y tair wythnos nesaf, fel a ddangosir ar we'r Siambr dan ddogfennau atodol.

Yn olaf, penderfynodd y Dirprwy Lywydd, dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.5, nad oes angen cyfeirio'r eitemau deddfwriaeth canlynol i Bwyllgorau Pwnc am ystyriaeth estynedig: Gorchymyn Addysg (Cyrrff Cydnabyddedig) (Cymru) 2002, Gorchymyn Addysg (Cyrrff Rhestredig) (Cymru) 2002 a'r Rheoliadau Addysg Bellach (Cymwysterau Athrawon) (Cymru) 2002.

**The Presiding Officer:** I see that there is no objection to the statement. Do Members have any comments on it?

**Jonathan Morgan:** Er na chredaf bopeth a ddarllenaf yn *The Western Mail*, yn ôl y cyhoeddiad clodwiw hwnnw y bore yma, mae'n debyg fod y Gweinidog Dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn mynd i wneud datganiad cyn diwedd y mis—yr wythnos yma, mae'n debyg, felly—ynghylch cyllid ychwanegol i ateb y diffyg yn y gyllideb ac i dalu costau tâl cysylltiedig â pherfformiad i athrawon. Os bydd datganiad i'w wneud, ai datganiad llafar fydd hwnnw ddydd Iau ac, os felly, pam na ddywedwyd wrthym yn y Pwyllgor Busnes? Os bydd yn ddatganiad ysgrifenedig, a ddarperir ef i'r aelodau cyn gynted ag y bo modd?

**Owen John Thomas:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ofyn i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wneud datganiad ar yr argyfwng ym maes amddiffyn plant ac yng ngwasanaethau cymdeithasol Cyngor Sir Caerdydd yn fwy cyffredinol? Mae cynnwys rhaglen *Week in, week out* y BBC neithiwr a'r ffaith y rhyddhawyd y gofrestr amddiffyn plant i'r cyfryngau yn codi pryderon difrifol ynghylch diogelwch plant yng ngofal yr awdurdod lleol. Dylai'r Gweinidog ymyrryd yn awr fel mater o frys. Dylai ystyried cymryd camau arbennig, a gofynnaf iddi wneud datganiad i'r Cynulliad, gan amlinellu beth y mae'n bwriadu ei wneud.

**Carwyn Jones:** There are no plans for the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to make an oral statement this week. If a written statement is forthcoming, it will be made available as soon as possible.

On Owen John Thomas's point, the Minister for Health and Social Services is present and will have heard what has been said. I am sure that she will consider the matter.

*Derbyniwyd y datganiad busnes.  
Business statement adopted.*

### **Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order**

**Nick Bourne:** Point of order. This relates to Standing Orders Nos. 6.8 and 6.11 on Cabinet statements. Although I recognise that statements are sometimes necessary—we have just heard of one such instance where it would be—I am concerned at the number of Cabinet statements since Easter; we have had 21. You will recall, Llywydd, that in the Assembly Review of Procedure report, it was agreed unanimously, and that includes by the First Minister and the then Minister for Assembly Business, Andrew Davies, that such statements would only be used:

‘to inform the Assembly of urgent matters or crises (as often happens in response to a request for an urgent question); or to give updates to the Assembly on major Ministerial visits such as trade missions, or continuing issues of concern; or to set out Ministerial thinking at the early stages of policy development, prior to any public consultation exercise.’

We have a plethora of these statements. We have had statements à go-go, quite a few of which do not fall into the above categories. We had one last week on museums, which seemed to be a self-congratulatory exercise on the part of the administration in the run up to the Assembly elections. I urge that we ask the administration to keep to the spirit of what all Members agreed upon in that review of procedure.

**Carwyn Jones:** Nid oes unrhyw gynlluniau i'r Gweinidog Dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes wneud datganiad llafar yr wythnos hon. Os daw datganiad ysgrifenedig, bydd ar gael cyn gynted ag y bo modd.

Ar bwynt Owen John Thomas, mae'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn bresennol a chlywodd yr hyn a ddywedwyd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnaiff ystyried y mater.

**Nick Bourne:** Pwynt o drefn. Mae a wnelo hyn â Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 6.8 a 5.11 ar ddatganiadau'r Cabinet. Er fy mod yn cydnabod bod datganiadau weithiau'n angenrheidiol—yr ydym newydd glywed am enghraifft o'r fath lle y byddai—yr wyf yn bryderus ynghylch y nifer o ddatganiadau Cabinet ers y Pasg; cawsom 21. Fe gofiwech, Llywydd, yn adroddiad Adolygiad Gweithdrefn y Cynulliad, cytunwyd yn unfrydol, ac mae hynny'n cynnwys y Prif Weinidog a'r Trefnydd ar y pryd, Andrew Davies, na ddefnyddid datganiadau o'r fath ddim ond:

‘i hysbysu'r Cynulliad am faterion brys neu am argyfyngau (fel sy'n digwydd yn aml mewn ymateb i gais am gwestiwn brys); neu i roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i'r Cynulliad ar ymweliadau o bwys gan Weinidogion megis teithiau masnach, neu am faterion sy'n parhau i fod yn destun pryder; neu i wyntyllu syniadau Gweinidogion yn ystod camau cynnar gwaith datblygu polisi, cyn unrhyw ymarfer ymgynghori â'r cyhoedd.’

Yr ydym yn cael llu o'r datganiadau hyn. Cawsom ddatganiadau rif y gwllith, a nifer go lew ohonynt heb fod yn y categorïau uchod. Cawsom un yr wythnos diwethaf ar amgueddfeydd, a ymddangosai fel ymarfer hunan-longyfarchiadol ar ran y weinyddiaeth yn y cyfnod cyn etholiadau'r Cynulliad. Anogaf ein bod yn gofyn i'r weinyddiaeth gadw at ysbryd yr hyn y cytunwyd arno gan yr Aelodau i gyd yn yr adolygiad gweithdrefn



hwnnw.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am grateful to the leader of the Welsh Conservatives for giving me notice of that point of order, which has allowed me to reflect on it. In reply I quote the earlier paragraph in 3.9 of the Assembly Review of Procedure report which indicates:

‘Statements can have a valuable role to play in the policy-making and scrutiny process.’

Where statements are initiated—and I appreciate the other points that Nick quoted—as this document was agreed by all Assembly Members, I urge Government Ministers and the Minister responsible for Assembly business to, at all times, keep within those parameters. However, if the opposition feels at any stage that Government statements are attempts at propaganda, then it is up to the opposition spokespeople, when asking questioning on statements, to demolish them.

**Alun Cairns:** Point of order. I raise this under Standing Order No. 6.33, which relates to Assembly questions. On 20 March, I tabled four written questions to the First Minister, among others, relating to task and finish groups. These followed up on the answer to a question I had asked previously, which highlighted that more than 70 task and finish groups had been established. The questions inquired about the gender ratio of the groups, whether Nolan principles were involved, whether the First Minister would list the groups’ members and what measures he had introduced to prevent conflict of interest. The First Minister replied on 26 March, within the appropriate timescale, stating:

‘I will write to the Member and place a copy of my reply in the Library’.

My office has chased the First Minister’s office for an answer on many occasions. Given that we are approaching recess, I suspect that the answers might be given to me after 5 p.m. on Friday or around that time, which will prevent me from scrutinising them appropriately before recess.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru am roi rhybudd imi am y pwynt o drefn hwnnw, gan ganiatáu amser imi fyfyrto arno. Mewn ymateb, dyfynnaf y paragraff cynharach yn 3.9 yn adroddiad Adolygiad Gweithdrefn y Cynulliad, sy’n dweud:

‘Gall datganiadau chwarae rhan werthfawr o safbwynt prosesau creu polisi a chraffu.’

Lle cyflwynir datganiadau—a gwerthfawrogaf y pwyntiau eraill a ddyfynnodd Nick—gan y cytunwyd ar y ddogfen hon gan holl Aelodau’r Cynulliad, anogaf Weinidogion y Llywodraeth a’r Trefnydd i gadw o fewn y paramedrau hynny bob amser. Fodd bynnag, os teimla’r gwrthbleidiau ar unrhyw adeg fod datganiadau’r Llywodraeth yn ymdrechion ar bropaganda, yna mater i lefarwyr y gwrthbleidiau, wrth ofyn cwestiynau ar ddatganiadau, yw eu dymchwel.

**Alun Cairns:** Pwynt o drefn. Codaf hwn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.33, sy’n ymwneud â chwestiynau’r Cynulliad. Ar 20 Mawrth, cyflwynais bedwar cwestiwn ysgrifenedig i’r Prif Weinidog, ymhlith eraill, ynglŷn â’r grwpiau gorchwyl a gorffen. Yr oedd y rhain yn ddilyniant i’r ateb i gwestiwn yr oeddwn wedi’i ofyn ynghynt, a amlygai’r ffaith fod mwy na 70 o grwpiau gorchwyl a gorffen wedi’u sefydlu. Holai’r cwestiynau ynghylch cymhareb rhywiau’r grwpiau, a ddilynid egwyddorion Nolan, a fyddai’r Prif Weinidog yn rhestru aelodau’r grwpiau a pha fesurau yr oedd wedi’u cyflwyno i atal gwrthdaro buddiannau. Atebodd y Prif Weinidog ar 26 Mawrth, o fewn yr amser priodol, gan ddweud:

‘Ysgrifennaf at yr Aelod a gosod copi o’m hateb yn y Llyfrgell’.

Mae fy swyddfa wedi mynd ar ôl swyddfa’r Prif Weinidog am ateb ar sawl achlysur. Gan ein bod yn nesáu at y toriad, yr wyf yn amau efallai y rhoddir yr atebion imi ar ôl 5 o’r gloch ddydd Gwener neu oddeutu’r amser hwnnw, a fydd yn fy atal rhag eu harchwilio’n briodol cyn y toriad.

**The Presiding Officer:** The Ministers will have heard your comments. That is not a point of order for me. I am certain that Assembly Ministers and officials would not seek to impede proper scrutiny by Assembly Members.

**David Davies:** Point of order. At the Economic Development Committee meeting following the budget, the Minister for Economic Development made a startling claim that Britain was now the best place in the world to conduct business. I asked him to give me some information to back that up and he promised that it would be forthcoming. I have been chasing him ever since and it is still is not forthcoming. Given the urgent question that he had to answer today, I would appreciate it if you could bring pressure to bear to allow me to see this information which he claims to have.

**The Presiding Officer:** While I am always anxious to please Members, because I owe my position to them, I am not going to bring inordinate pressure to bear on any Member, even a Minister, as it is not my place to do so. However, I will ensure that Members have the opportunity in the Chamber and Committee to bring pressure to bear themselves. What Ministers say in Committee is not my responsibility, thank goodness.

**David Davies:** Point of order. I raise this under Standing Order No. 6. It relates to the clarification of a statement by a Minister. In his answer to question 9 today, the First Minister commented that the Secretary of State for Wales enjoyed opera and the finer things, even though he comes from Pontypool. I hope that Members will agree that the people of Pontypool are just as capable of appreciating culture, arts and what he calls the finer things as anyone else. Will he clarify his comments?

**The First Minister:** I am sorry if I gave the impression that people from Pontypool do not enjoy the finer things in life. To put it in context, I said that I tend to enjoy rugby and take an interest in it and that the Secretary of State, although he comes from Pontypool, tends not to because he concentrates on the finer things in life.

**Y Llywydd:** Bydd y Gweinidogion wedi clywed eich sylwadau. Nid pwynt o drefn i mi yw hwnnw. Yr wyf yn sicr na fyddai Gweinidogion a swyddogion y Cynulliad yn ceisio rhwystro craffu priodol gan Aelodau'r Cynulliad.

**David Davies:** Pwynt o drefn. Yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd wedi'r gyllideb, gwnaeth y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd honiad syfrdanol mai Prydain bellach oedd y lle gorau yn y byd i wneud busnes. Gofynnais iddo roi gwybodaeth imi i gefnogi hynny, ac addawodd yntau y gwnâi. Yr wyf wedi bod yn rhedeg ar ei ôl byth ers hynny ac ni chefais yr wybodaeth fyth. Yn wyneb y cwestiwn brys y bu'n rhaid iddo ei ateb heddiw, gwerthfawrogwn pe gallech ddwyn pwysau i ganiatáu imi weld yr wybodaeth hon y mae'n honni ei bod yn ei feddiant.

**Y Llywydd:** Er fy mod bob amser yn awyddus i blesio Aelodau, gan fy mod yn ddyledus iddynt am fy safle, nid wyf am ddwyn pwysau gormodol ar unrhyw Aelod, hyd yn oed os ydyw'n Weinidog, gan nad fy lle i yw gwneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, mi wnaef sicrhau y caiff Aelodau gyfle yn y Siambr ac mewn Pwyllgorau i ddwyn pwysau eu hunain. Nid fy nghyfrifoldeb i yw'r hyn a ddywed Gweinidogion mewn Pwyllgorau, diolch i'r drefn.

**David Davies:** Pwynt o drefn. Codaf hwn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6. Mae a wnelo ag eglurhad o ddatganiad gan Weinidog. Yn ei ateb i gwestiwn 9 heddiw, dywedodd Prif Weinidog Cymru fod Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru'n mwynhau opera a'r pethau gorau, er ei fod yn dod o Bont-y-pŵl. Gobeithiaf y cytuna'r Aelodau fod pobl Pont-y-pŵl yr un mor alluog i werthfawrogi diwylliant, y celfyddydau a'r hyn a eilw ef y pethau gorau, â neb arall. A wnaiff egluro'i sylwadau?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf os rhoddais yr argraff nad yw pobl Pont-y-pŵl yn mwynhau pethau gorau bywyd. I'w roi yn ei gyd-destun, dywedais fy mod i'n tueddu i fwynhau ac ymddiddori mewn rygbi a bod yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol, er ei fod yn hanu o Bont-y-pŵl, yn tueddu i beidio, am ei fod yn canolbwyntio ar bethau gorau bywyd.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am grateful to the First Minister for glossing his earlier reply.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Brif Weinidog Cymru am esbonio'i ateb cynharach.

### **Cymeradwyo'r Gorchymyn Cynlluniau Iaith Gymraeg (Cyrff Cyhoeddus) 2002 Approval of the Welsh Language Schemes (Public Bodies) Order 2002**

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 to the first motion in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 i'r cynnig cyntaf yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

**The Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language (Jenny Randerson):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg (Jenny Randerson):** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly considers the principle of the Welsh Language Schemes (Public Bodies) Order 2002, laid in the Table Office on 30 April 2002. (NDM1063)*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Cynlluniau Iaith Gymraeg (Cyrff Cyhoeddus) 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 30 Ebrill 2002. (NDM1063)*

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly:*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the Welsh Language Schemes (Public Bodies) Order 2002, laid in the Table Office on 14 May 2002;*

*1. ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5 mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Cynlluniau Iaith Gymraeg (Cyrff Cyhoeddus) 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Mai 2002;*

*2. approves:*

*2. yn cymeradwyo:*

*a) that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 30 April 2002; and*

*a) bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 30 Ebrill 2002; a'r*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in Table office on 30 April 2002. (NDM1064)*

*b) arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 30 Ebrill 2002. (NDM1064)*

I am pleased to have been allocated time to discuss this Order today. I am delighted to bring forward a further piece of subordinate legislation under section 6(1)(o) of the Welsh Language Act 1993, within 11 months of the last. I have fulfilled my undertaking of 12 July 2001 to bring forward further legislation as quickly as reasonably practicable. In doing so, I am making practical use of the Assembly's powers to extend the coverage of

Yr wyf yn falch fod amser wedi'i ddyrannu imi i drafod y Gorchymyn hwn heddiw. Pleser mawr imi yw cyflwyno darn pellach o is-ddeddfwriaeth dan adran 6(1)(o) o Ddeddf yr Iaith Gymraeg 1993, o fewn 11 mis i'r un diwethaf. Yr wyf wedi cyflawni'r ymrwymiad a roddais ar 12 Gorffennaf 2001 i gyflwyno ddeddfwriaeth bellach cyn gynted ag y bo'n rhesymol ymarferol. Wrth wneud hynny, yr wyf yn gwneud defnydd ymarferol

public bodies for the purposes of the Welsh Language Act.

o bwerau'r Cynulliad i ymestyn pwerau dros gyrff cyhoeddus i ddibenion Deddf yr Iaith Gymraeg.

3:50 p.m.

When the Act was drafted, section 6 was drawn up to give maximum scope to apply the principles of the Act to public life in Wales. During the passage of the Welsh Language Bill, the Government of the time made it clear that the provisions contained within the Act would extend in due course to all branches of the public sector providing services to and on behalf of the public in Wales. This was the reasoning behind the drafting of section 6(1)(o). In addition to the bodies named in section 6 of the Act, section 6(1)(o) allows the National Assembly to designate any additional body that it considers to be exercising functions of a public nature in Wales. Bodies so named can be notified by the Welsh Language Board that they must prepare a Welsh language scheme.

Pan ddrafftwyd y Ddeddf, lluniwyd adran 6 i roi'r cyfle mwyaf i gymhwyso egwyddorion y Ddeddf i fywyd cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Yn ystod hynt Mesur yr Iaith Gymraeg, datganodd Llywodraeth y dydd yn glir y byddai'r darpariaethau a roddwyd yn y Ddeddf yn ymestyn maes o law i holl ganghennau'r sector cyhoeddus sy'n darparu gwasanaethau i'r cyhoedd ac ar ran y cyhoedd yng Nghymru. Dyma oedd y rhesymeg y tu ôl i ddrafftio adran 6(1)(o). Yn ogystal â'r gyrff a enwir yn adran 6 y Ddeddf, mae adran 6(1)(o) yn caniatáu i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ddynodi unrhyw gorff ychwanegol y barna ei fod yn gweithredu'n gyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Gall gyrff a enwir fel hyn gael eu hysbysu gan Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg fod yn rhaid iddynt baratoi cynllun iaith Gymraeg.

The Welsh Language Board has approved 192 public sector Welsh language schemes. Some of the recently approved schemes belonged to bodies named in subordinate legislation last year. Two of the main lottery distributors are among those bodies, as are the local probation boards and the rent assessment panel for Wales. It is heartening to see the inroads made into the comprehensive cover of the public administration sector. Those with approved schemes include all kinds of bodies, such as councils and health bodies, colleges and courts, Government departments and agencies. A significant number of these bodies, such as the Child Support Agency, are based outside Wales and are funded by Whitehall departments rather than the Assembly. This represents a considerable achievement by the board and recognises the goodwill that now exists towards the Welsh language and the needs of the population for whom it is their first or preferred language.

Mae Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg wedi cymeradwyo 192 o gynlluniau iaith Gymraeg yn y sector cyhoeddus. Yr oedd rhai o'r cynlluniau a gymeradwywyd yn ddiweddar yn perthyn i gyrff a enwyd mewn is-ddeddfwriaeth y llynedd. Mae dau o'r prif ddsbarthwyr loteri ymysg y gyrff hynny, ynghyd â'r byrddau prawf lleol a phanel asesu rhenti Cymru. Mae'n galonogol gweld gymaint y treiddwyd i mewn i wasanaethau cynhwysfawr y sector gweinyddu cyhoeddus. Mae'r rheini sydd â chynlluniau wedi'u cymeradwyo'n cynnwys pob math o gyrff, megis cynghorau a chyrff iechyd, colegau a llysoedd, adrannau ac asiantaethau'r Llywodraeth. Mae prif swyddfeydd nifer arwyddocaol o'r gyrff hyn, fel yr Asiantaeth Cynnal Plant, y tu allan i Gymru ac fe'u hariennir gan adrannau San Steffan yn hytrach na gan y Cynulliad. Mae hyn yn gryn gamp gan y bwrdd ac yn cydnabod yr ewyllys da sydd bellach yn bodoli tuag at yr iaith Gymraeg ac anghenion y boblogaeth sy'n ei harddel fel mamiaith neu ddewis iaith.

The approval of this number of schemes since 1996, when the first scheme was approved, is a tremendous achievement, not only by the board, but also by the bodies

Mae cymeradwyo cynifer o gynlluniau ers 1996, pryd y cymeradwywyd y cynllun cyntaf, yn gamp aruthrol, nid yn unig gan y bwrdd, ond hefyd gan y gyrff dan sylw. Wedi

concerned. Having launched the consultation on the Assembly's own language scheme recently, I am well aware of the hard work that goes into developing schemes and ensuring that they are implemented successfully. Language schemes are the practical effect of the Welsh Language Act. The implementation of schemes enables the Welsh-speaking public in Wales to access a service in a language of their choice. This is the principle that guides the development of schemes, and bodies are asked to aspire to meeting this principle, as far as is appropriate in the circumstances and reasonably practicable.

The list of bodies included in the proposed legislation has been drawn up following consultation within the Assembly, with UK Government departments, with the Welsh Language Board and, of course, with the bodies themselves. I am grateful to members of the Culture Committee for warmly welcoming this draft Order at our meeting on 27 February. Some of the bodies included in the draft legislation are of higher profile than others, as far as the public in Wales is concerned. Some of the bodies on the list already provide bilingual services, and this is particularly true of those funded by the Assembly. Some of the bodies are UK bodies, but nevertheless provide services on behalf of the public in Wales. I am particularly pleased that it has been possible to include social care bodies, such as the Care Council for Wales and the Office of the Children's Commissioner for Wales. The list also includes several regulatory bodies, not only in the health sector, but also in finance. I was also pleased to be able to include the Sector Skills Development Agency, which is a new non-departmental body responsible for the new sector skills councils being established to promote skills and productivity across the UK economy. These examples show the importance of an ongoing review of new bodies, so that they provide a bilingual service from the outset.

If you agree with my proposals in this draft legislation, the way will be open for the Welsh Language Board to approach these bodies for schemes. The board welcomes this legislation and the further scope it will

lansio'r ymgynghoriad ar gynllun iaith y Cynulliad ei hun yn ddiweddar, yr wyf yn ymwybodol iawn o'r gwaith caled sy'n mynd i mewn i ddatblygu cynlluniau a sicrhau y cânt eu gweithredu'n llwyddiannus. Cynlluniau iaith yw effaith ymarferol Deddf yr Iaith Gymraeg. Mae gweithredu cynlluniau'n galluogi'r Cymry Cymraeg i gael gwasanaeth yn yr iaith a ddewisant. Dyma'r egwyddor sy'n llywio datblygiad cynlluniau, a gofynnir i gyrff geisio anelu at yr egwyddor hon, cyn belled ag y bo'n briodol yn yr amgylchiadau ac yn rhesymol ymarferol.

Lluniwyd y rhestr o gyrff a gynhwyswyd yn y ddeddfwriaeth arfaethedig ar ôl ymgynghori o fewn y Cynulliad, gydag adrannau Llywodraeth y DU, gyda Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg ac, wrth gwrs, gyda'r gyrff eu hunain. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i aelodau'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant am roi croeso cynnes i'r Gorchymyn drafft hwn yn ein cyfarfod ar 27 Chwefror. Mae gan rai o'r gyrff a gynhwysir yn y ddeddfwriaeth ddrafft broffil uwch nag eraill, o safbwynt y cyhoedd yng Nghymru. Mae rhai o'r gyrff ar y rhestr eisoes yn darparu gwasanaethau dwyieithog, ac mae hyn yn arbennig o wir am y rhai hynny a noddir gan y Cynulliad. Mae rhai o'r gyrff yn gyrff Prydeinig, ond sydd eto'n darparu gwasanaethau ar ran y cyhoedd yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn arbennig o falch y llwyddwyd i gynnwys gyrff gofal cymdeithasol, fel Cyngor Gofal Cymru a Swyddfa Comisiynydd Plant Cymru. Mae'r rhestr yn cynnwys sawl corff rheoleiddiol hefyd, nid yn unig yn y sector iechyd, ond ym myd cyllid hefyd. Yr oeddwn yn falch hefyd o allu cynnwys yr Asiantaeth Datblygu Sgiliau Sector, corff anadrannol sy'n gyfrifol am y cynghorau sgiliau sector newydd sy'n cael eu sefydlu i hybu sgiliau a chynhyrchiant ym mhob rhan o economi'r DU. Mae'r enghreifftiau hyn yn dangos pwysigrwydd adolygu gyrff newydd yn barhaus, i sicrhau y darparant wasanaeth dwyieithog o'r cychwyn.

Os cytunwch â'm cynigion yn y ddeddfwriaeth ddrafft hon, bydd yn bosibl i Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg holi'r gyrff hyn i ddrafftio cynlluniau. Mae'r bwrdd yn croesawu'r ddeddfwriaeth hon a'r cyfle

provide to ensure that the principle embodied in the Welsh Language Act is extended as far as possible. The board will have its own priorities and ideas on when these approaches will be made. It will look for the greatest gains for the Welsh public. I would like to bring forward more legislation of this sort in future.

I will not support Jocelyn Davies's amendment 1. Last July, I agreed to look into the issue of whether utility companies could be named in future legislation. Although work on today's Order has had to take priority, dialogue has begun with the regulators of the suppliers of water and energy to the Welsh public. Meetings will be held next month, and I will report on progress to the Culture Committee before the recess. We all want utility companies to provide an acceptable bilingual service to the public in Wales. I want to include utility companies in future legislation so that they will adopt statutory Welsh language schemes, and am already pursuing that policy. However, considerable consultation must take place before bodies can be named in legislation.

Given the nature of the service providers, several issues make the consultation more complex. They are already subject to regulation by bodies such as the Office of Water Services and the Office of Gas and Electricity Markets. We need to discuss with them the possible conflicts that could arise from companies adopting statutory schemes. Issues of competition must also be addressed. I assure Jocelyn that I am already pursuing the line that she proposes in her amendment, and therefore recommend that it be rejected. I welcome the views of Members on other bodies—

**Helen Mary Jones:** I was about to suggest another body, namely the Criminal Records Bureau, which undertakes police checks. I understand from Welsh-speaking voluntary groups—particularly churches—that obtaining forms in Welsh is hugely difficult. The bureau's response centrally has been dismissive. It described people who ask for Welsh-language forms as a 'nuisance', to

ychwanegol a ddarperir ganddi i sicrhau y caiff yr egwyddor a ymgorfforir yn Neddf yr Iaith Gymraeg ei hymestyn cyn belled ag sy'n bosibl. Bydd gan y bwrdd ei flaenoriaethau a'i syniadau ei hun ynghylch pa bryd i gysylltu â'r cyrff. Bydd yn edrych am y manteision gorau i bobl Cymru. Hoffwn gyflwyno mwy o ddeddfwriaeth o'r math hwn yn y dyfodol.

Ni chefnogaf welliant 1 gan Jocelyn Davies. Fis Gorffennaf diwethaf, cytunais i edrych i mewn i'r cwestiwn a ellid enwi cwmnïau cyfleustodau mewn deddfwriaeth yn y dyfodol. Er y bu'n rhaid rhoi blaenoriaeth i waith ar Orchymyn heddiw, mae deialog wedi dechrau gyda rheoleiddwyr y cyflenwyr dŵr ac ynni i'r cyhoedd yng Nghymru. Cynhelir cyfarfodydd y mis nesaf, ac adroddaf ar y datblygiadau i'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant cyn y gwyliau. Hoffem i gyd weld cwmnïau cyfleustodau'n darparu gwasanaeth dwyieithog derbyniol i'r cyhoedd yng Nghymru. Mae arnaf fi eisiau cynnwys cwmnïau cyfleustodau mewn deddfwriaeth yn y dyfodol i sicrhau y mabwysiadant gynlluniau iaith Gymraeg, ac yr wyf yn mynd ar ôl y polisi hwnnw'n barod. Er hynny, rhaid wrth gryn dipyn o ymgynghori cyn y gellir enwi cyrff mewn deddfwriaeth.

O gofio natur y darparwyr gwasanaethau, mae sawl mater yn peri fod yr ymgynghori'n fwy cymhleth. Maent eisoes yn cael eu rheoleiddio gan gyrff fel y Swyddfa Gwasanaethau Dŵr a'r Swyddfa Marchnadoedd Nwy a Thrydan. Mae angen inni drafod gyda hwy y gwrthdrawiadau posibl a allai godi wrth i gwmnïau fabwysiadu cynlluniau statudol. Rhaid edrych ar faterion cystadleuaeth hefyd. Yr wyf yn sicrhau Jocelyn fy mod eisoes yn gweithio ar y llinellau a gynigir ganddi yn ei gwelliant, ac felly argymhellaf ei wrthod. Croesawaf sylwadau'r Aelodau ar gyrff eraill—

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yr oeddwn ar fin awgrymu corff arall, sef y Biwro Cofnodion Troseddol, sy'n gwneud archwiliadau ar ran yr heddlu. Deallaf oddi wrth grwpiau gwirfoddol Cymraeg eu hiaith—eglwysi yn enwedig—ei bod yn ofnadwy o anodd cael ffurflenni yn Gymraeg. Wfftio'r mater fu ymateb y biwro yn ganolog. Disgrifiodd bobl sy'n gofyn am ffurflenni Cymraeg fel

quote one telephone call. I would be grateful if future legislation could name the Criminal Records Bureau, to make it clear to the bureau that it is bound by the Welsh Language Act 1993, and that it should treat our language with respect.

**Jenny Randerson:** I am pleased that you mentioned that. I am aware of that issue, and have raised it with the Welsh Language Board. Indeed, its staff are already in discussion with the Criminal Records Bureau about the issues that you raised, which others have also raised.

I would welcome Members' views on other bodies that could be considered—apart from the utilities and housing associations, which are already under consideration—as candidates for inclusion in further such legislation. I commend the regulations to you.

**Owen John Thomas:** Cynigiaf welliant 1 i'r cynnig cyntaf yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*galw ar y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg i gyflwyno deddfwriaeth bellach i ddod â'r hen gyfleustodau cyhoeddus o dan amodau Deddf yr Iaith Gymraeg 1993 cyn gynted ag y bo modd.*

Croesawaf y cynigion, ond rhaid imi fynegi fy mhryder nad yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad eto mewn sefyllfa i gyflwyno cynnig a fyddai'n rhoi'r hen gyfleustodau o fewn cylch gorchwyl Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg, yn unol â gwelliant Plaid Cymru.

Ceisiodd dau aelod o'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant dderbyn eu biliau trydan gan SWALEC yn y Gymraeg, ond bu iddynt fethu. Dylai'r biliau fod yn ddwyieithog fel y gall pawb yng Nghymru ddewis pa ran i'w darllen.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Nid yn unig y mae anhawster cael biliau'n ddwyieithog, ond am flwyddyn, gwrthododd SWALEC ateb llythyrau yn y Gymraeg.

**Owen John Thomas:** Mae hynny'n warthus. Mae'n anurddasol bod yn rhaid i rywun sydd am dderbyn bil yn Gymraeg ffonio cwmni yn

'niwsans', a dyfynnu un alwad ffôn. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallai deddfwriaeth yn y dyfodol enwi'r Biwro Cofnodion Troseddol, i ddangos yn glir i'r biwro ei fod dan rwymedigaeth Deddf yr Iaith Gymraeg 1993, ac y dylai drin ein hiaith â pharch.

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr wyf yn falch ichi grybwyll hynny. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r mater hwnnw, ac wedi ei godi gyda Bwrdd yr Iaith. Yn wir, mae ei staff eisoes mewn trafodaethau gyda'r Biwro Cofnodion Troseddol am y materion a godwyd gennych, sydd wedi'u codi gan eraill hefyd.

Croesawn sylwadau'r Aelodau ar gyrfff eraill y gellid eu hystyried—ar wahân i'r cyfleustodau a chymdeithasau tai, sydd eisoes dan ystyriaeth—ar gyfer eu cynnwys mewn deddfwriaeth bellach o'r fath. Cymeradwyaf y rheoliadau ichi.

**Owen John Thomas:** I propose amendment 1 to the first motion in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls upon the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language to bring forward further legislation to bring the former public utilities under the terms of the Welsh Language Act 1993 at the earliest possible opportunity.*

I welcome the motions, but must express my concern that the Assembly Government is not yet in a position to table a motion that would bring the former utilities within the remit of the Welsh Language Board, in line with Plaid Cymru's amendment.

Two members of the Culture Committee requested their electricity bills from SWALEC in Welsh, but were denied. The bills should be bilingual so that everyone in Wales can choose which part to read.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Not only are bills not sent bilingually, but for a year, SWALEC refused to answer letters written in Welsh.

**Owen John Thomas:** That is disgraceful. It is degrading that someone wishing to receive a bill in Welsh must telephone a company in

Glasgow i ofyn am un. Ai dyma'i barch tuag at un o ieithoedd hynaf Ewrop? Mae'n hen bryd inni symud ar y mater hwn. Rhaid inni beidio â thafllu geiriau ato, ond dangos ein hymroddiad i'r Gymraeg a'n balchder ynddi. Yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn ystyried y mater, ond yr wyf yn teimlo'n rhwystredig ei fod yn cymryd cymaint o amser.

4:00 p.m.

**Eleanor Burnham:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats have a commitment to human rights, diversity and a respect for all cultures. The preamble to our constitution states that:

'The Liberal Democrats exist to build and safeguard a fair, free and open society, in which we seek to balance the fundamental values of liberty, equality and community, and in which no-one shall be enslaved by poverty, ignorance or conformity.'

Gwraidd rhyddfrydiaeth yw'r gred y dylai pawb gael y rhyddid i wneud fel y mynnont ar yr amod nad yw hynny yn rhwystro rhyddid pobl eraill. Mae ein safbwynt ar y Gymraeg yn adlewyrchu hynny. Dylai pawb gael yr hawl i ddefnyddio'r Saesneg os dymunant. Nid oes neb yn anghytuno â'r safbwynt hwnnw. Mae'r un ddadl yn gweithio gyda'r Gymraeg. Bydd y cynnig hwn yn galluogi pobl i ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg neu'r Saesneg pryd bynnag y defnyddiant wasanaethau cyhoeddus.

Ein nod tymor-hir yw creu Cymru wirioneddol ddwyieithog, neu amlieithog hyd yn oed. Byddai hynny'n galluogi cael poblogaeth sydd nid yn unig yn gallu siarad y ddwy iaith, ond sydd yn eu defnyddio. Rhaid galluogi pobl i ddefnyddio'r iaith yn aml, ac mae'r cynnig hwn wedi ei dargedu at wneud union hynny.

We believe that the political consensus is beginning to shift away from centralisation toward decentralisation, as devolution suggests. It is with some amusement and incredulity that we hear the leader of the Conservatives declaring that he is in favour of devolving power to local government. Are these the same Conservatives who created the

Glasgow to ask for one. Does this constitute respect for one of the oldest languages in Europe? It is high time that we acted on this matter. We must not merely discuss it, but demonstrate our commitment to the language and our pride in it. I am glad that you are considering the matter, but I am frustrated that it is taking so much time.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae gan Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru ymrwymiad i iawnderau dynol, amrywiaeth a pharch at bob diwylliant. Dywed y rhagymadrodd i'n cyfansoddiad:

'Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru am adeiladu cymdeithas deg, rhydd ac agored, sy'n ceisio diogelu gwerthoedd hanfodol megis rhyddid, cydraddoldeb a lles cymunedau ac un ble nad yw pobl yn gorfod dioddef tlodi, anwybodaeth neu gydymffurfiaeth.'

The root of liberalism is the belief that everyone should have the freedom to do as they choose, on condition that that does not impede upon the freedom of others. Our position on the Welsh language reflects that. Everyone should have the right to use English should they wish to do so. Nobody disagrees with that point of view. The same argument applies to the Welsh language. This motion will enable people to use Welsh or English whenever they use public services.

Our long-term aim is to create a truly bilingual, even multilingual, Wales. That would enable us to have not only a population that is able to speak both languages but one that uses them. We must enable people to use the language frequently, and this motion is targeted at achieving exactly that.

Credwn fod y consensws gwleidyddol yn dechrau symud i ffwrdd oddi wrth ganoli tuag at ddatganoli, fel yr awgryma ein sefyllfa ni. Testun cryn ddifyrrwech ac anghrediniaeth yw clywed arweinydd y Ceidwadwyr yn datgan ei fod o blaid datganoli grym i lywodraeth leol. Ai dyma'r un Ceidwadwyr a greodd y llywodraeth



most centralised government in the western world? Whatever the motives behind his dramatic u-turn—

**David Melding:** I am just curious to know what the second most centralised government in the western world would be?

**Eleanor Burnham:** I do not have the time to go into everything—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. When Members feel that they do not have time, they should not give way to idle interventions.

**Eleanor Burnham:** While some people may be determined to see an anti-English agenda behind this motion—despite the fact that that view bears no relation to reality—we believe that the vast majority of people will see it for what it is: a small step to allow people who speak the main languages of Wales the chance to use the language of their choice.

We thoroughly support this extension of the Welsh Language Act 1993. It is an important piece of secondary legislation, and we will be in favour of further similar legislation. Political parties should be judged on what they do, rather than what they say.

**Glyn Davies:** I am generally in favour of extending Welsh language schemes to wherever they can be appropriately introduced, but only if they are not a threat to the competitiveness of Wales and our economy. That could ultimately damage Wales and the Welsh language. Welsh language schemes should be developed without generating antipathy towards the language.

Inevitably, views will always differ on the precise extent of the Act's application. I personally hope that public utilities—particularly those that were public when the Act was passed but are now private—will work with the Welsh Language Board to voluntarily introduce schemes. I hope that we can proceed without matters being tested in the courts.

fwyaf canoledig yn y byd gorllewinol? Beth bynnag yw'r cymhellion dros ei dro pedol dramatig—

**David Melding:** Dim ond eisiau gwybod yr wyf fi beth fyddai'r ail lywodraeth fwyaf canoledig yn y byd gorllewinol?

**Eleanor Burnham:** Nid oes gennyf amser i fanylu ar bopeth—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Pan deimla Aelodau nad oes ganddynt amser, ni ddylent ildio i ymyriadau gwag.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Tra bo rhai pobl efallai'n benderfynol o weld agenda gwrth-Seisnig y tu ôl i'r cynnig hwn—er gwaethaf y ffaith nad oes unrhyw berthynas rhwng y farn honno â'r gwirionedd—credwn y bydd y mwyafrif llethol o bobl yn ei weld am yr hyn ydyw: cam bach i ganiatáu i bobl sy'n siarad prif ieithoedd Cymru gael y cyfle i ddefnyddio'r iaith a ddewisant.

Cefnogwn yn llawn yr estyniad hwn i Ddeddf yr Iaith Gymraeg 1993. Mae'n ddarn pwysig o is-ddeddfwriaeth, a byddwn o blaid deddfwriaeth bellach debyg. Dylid barnu pleidiau gwleidyddol ar yr hyn a wnânt, yn hytrach na'r hyn a ddywedant.

**Glyn Davies:** Yr wyf yn gyffredinol o blaid estyn cynlluniau iaith Gymraeg i ble bynnag y gellir yn briodol eu cyflwyno, ond dim ond os nad ydynt yn fygythiad i gystadleurwydd Cymru a'n heconomi. Gallai hynny yn y pen draw niweidio Cymru a'r Gymraeg. Dylid datblygu cynlluniau iaith Gymraeg heb gynhyrchu drwgdeimlad tuag at yr iaith.

Yn anochel, bydd gwahaniaeth barn bob amser ar union rychwant cyrhaeddiad y Ddeddf. Gobeithiaf fi'n bersonol y gwnaiff y cyfleustodau cyhoeddus—yn enwedig y rheini a oedd yn gyhoeddus pan basiwyd y Ddeddf ond sydd bellach yn breifat—weithio gyda Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg i gyflwyno cynlluniau'n wirfoddol. Gobeithiaf y gallwn symud ymlaen heb i faterion gael eu profi yn y llysoedd.

We will support the motion but not the amendment. The Minister is right to use the existing Act as it was intended. I have supported her in the Culture Committee on behalf of my party, and I support her general approach. However, I will not support amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, and I was disappointed that Plaid Cymru had tabled it. It damages the cross-party goodwill that we are developing toward the language. I understand Plaid Cymru's need to make ritual noises to keep Simon Glyn's faction at bay or on board, but today the demand for new legislation has been brought onto the Chamber floor. I have worked determinedly over a long time to advocate the Conservative Party's positive approach to the language, and have been thrilled by the responses of party members. I have no doubt that, over many years, the Conservative Party has committed itself considerably to reviving and supporting the language. It wants to be a part of, and lead where possible, an all-party campaign to see the Welsh language prosper. However, a new Welsh Language Act—I have made this point many times—would damage Wales, its economy and its language because it would generate a great deal of ill-will. I am against it, even when it is proposed that it enter by the back door.

**The Presiding Officer:** As a result of visibility problems in our Chamber, you may not have been able to see Helen Mary Jones, who was trying to intervene.

**Glyn Davies:** I have finished my speech.

**Alun Cairns:** This extension of the Welsh Language Act 1993 to other public bodies is a tribute to the last Conservative government for introducing the Act, and I hope that other Members acknowledge that. It is also a tribute to Lord Roberts of Conwy and his contribution to furthering the Welsh language, not only by introducing the Welsh Language Act, but by setting up S4C and dramatically increasing the spending on the Welsh language, as well as increasing the opportunity to learn the Welsh language in schools—

**Helen Mary Jones** *rose*—

Cefnogwn y cynnig ond nid y gwelliant. Mae'r Gweinidog yn iawn i ddefnyddio'r Ddeddf bresennol fel y'i bwriadwyd. Yr wyf wedi ei chefnogi yn y Pwyllgor Diwylliant ar ran fy mhlaid, a chefnogaf ei dull cyffredinol o weithredu. Fodd bynnag, ni chefnogaf welliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, ac yr oeddwn yn siomedig fod Plaid Cymru wedi ei gyflwyno. Mae'n niweidio'r ewyllys da trawsbleidiol yr ydym yn ei ddatblygu tuag at yr iaith. Deallaf angen Plaid Cymru i wneud synau defodol i gadw criw Simon Glyn yn dawel neu ar eu hochr, ond heddiw, daethpwyd â'r galw am ddeddfwriaeth newydd i lawr y Siambr. Yr wyf wedi gweithio'n benderfynol ers tro byd i ddadlau dros agwedd gadarnhaol y Blaid Geidwadol at yr iaith, ac wedi cael gwefr gan ymatebion aelodau'r blaid. Nid oes gennyf amheuaeth nad yw'r Blaid Geidwadol, dros flynyddoedd lawer, wedi ymrwymo'n sylweddol i adfer a chefnogi'r iaith. Mae arni eisiau bod yn rhan o ymgyrch gan y pleidiau i gyd i sicrhau ffyniant y Gymraeg, a'i arwain lle bo modd. Er hynny, byddai Deddf Iaith newydd—yr wyf wedi gwneud y pwynt hwn lawer gwaith—yn niweidio Cymru, ei heconomi a'i hiaith oherwydd y byddai'n creu llawer iawn o ddrwgdeimlad. Yr wyf yn ei herbyn, hyd yn oed pan gynigir iddi ddod i mewn drwy'r drws cefn.

**Y Llywydd:** Oherwydd problemau gweld yn ein Siambr, efallai nad oeddech yn gallu gweld Helen Mary Jones, a oedd yn ceisio dweud gair.

**Glyn Davies:** Yr wyf wedi gorffen fy araith.

**Alun Cairns:** Mae'r estyniad hwn i Ddeddf Iaith Gymraeg 1993 i gyrff cyhoeddus eraill yn deyrnged i'r llywodraeth Geidwadol ddiwethaf am gyflwyno'r Ddeddf, a gobeithiaf y gwnaiff Aelodau eraill gydnabod hynny. Mae'n deyrnged hefyd i'r Arglwydd Roberts o Gonwy a'i gyfraniad i hyrwyddo'r iaith Gymraeg, nid yn unig drwy gyflwyno Deddf yr Iaith Gymraeg, ond drwy sefydlu S4C a chynyddu'n ddramatig y gwariant ar y Gymraeg, yn ogystal â chynyddu'r cyfle i ddysgu'r Gymraeg mewn ysgolion—

**Helen Mary Jones** *a gododd*—

**Alun Cairns:** I will give way in a moment. I hope that when I do so, Helen Mary will recognise Lord Roberts's contribution. It now allows the Assembly Government to use that as a lever to extend it further. The amendment seeks to extend Lord Roberts's groundwork, although it is a little misjudged on this occasion.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I acknowledge Lord Roberts's contribution. We all know that he is a friend of the nation and its language. I do not have a problem with that. However, do you also acknowledge that there are important gaps in the current legislation? For example, it does not guarantee the right of Welsh-speaking workers to speak their own language in their workplace without risk of dismissal. Do you, Glyn Davies, and your party believe that that is acceptable? I do not. That right must be protected. To suggest an extension of legislation is not to denigrate current legislation, but to say that it needs to be built upon and extended to protect individuals' rights in the interest of promoting equality of opportunity.

**Alun Cairns:** I am glad that Helen Mary Jones acknowledged Lord Roberts's contribution to the Welsh language, as well as the last Conservative government's contribution. I will develop her points. Amendment 1 deals with the public utilities, which have now been privatised. Privatisation introduced competition. People have the right to choose which utility company to purchase their services from, be that an electricity, energy or any other utility, and the Welsh language is a benefit that is offered by some of those companies. The major providers of the utilities in Wales already offer that benefit. People can choose their providers, based on a whole range of issues. Cost and quality of service are major factors, but language may be a factor to many other people. Competition will protect the Welsh consumer and allow companies to develop their Welsh language strategies. There is a risk with regard to the message that it could send to the private sector. If we are prepared to extend the provisions of the Welsh Language Act 1993 to any private company, what message would that send to potential inward investors? Is it not better for

**Alun Cairns:** Ildiaf mewn munud. Gobeithiaf pan wnaif hynny, y gwnaiff Helen Mary gydnabod cyfraniad yr Arglwydd Roberts. Mae hwnnw'n caniatáu'n awr i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ddefnyddio hynny fel trosol i'w ymestyn ymhellach. Ymgais i ymestyn gwaith sylfaenol yr Arglwydd Roberts yw'r gwelliant, er ei fod ychydig yn annoeth y tro hwn.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Cydnabyddaf gyfraniad yr Arglwydd Roberts. Gŵyr pawb ohonom ei fod ef yn gyfaill i'r genedl a'i hiaith. Nid oes gennyf broblem gyda hynny. Fodd bynnag, a ydych yn cydnabod hefyd fod bylchau pwysig yn y ddeddfwriaeth gyfredol? Er enghraifft, nid yw'n gwarantu hawl gweithwyr Cymraeg i siarad eu hiaith yn eu gweithle heb berygl o gael eu diswyddo. A ydych chi, Glyn Davies, a'ch plaid yn credu bod hynny'n dderbyniol? Nid wyf fi. Rhaid gwarchod yr hawl honno. Nid lladd ar y ddeddfwriaeth gyfredol yw awgrymu ehangu'r ddeddfwriaeth, ond dweud bod angen adeiladu arni a'i hymestyn i warchod hawliau unigolion er mwyn hyrwyddo cyfle cyfartal.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr wyf yn falch bod Helen Mary Jones wedi cydnabod cyfraniad yr Arglwydd Roberts i'r iaith Gymraeg, yn ogystal â chyfraniad y llywodraeth Geidwadol ddiwethaf. Datblygaf ei phwyntiau hi. Mae gwelliant 1 yn ymdrin â'r cyfleustodau cyhoeddus, sydd bellach wedi eu preifateiddio. Cyflwynwyd cystadleuaeth gyda phreifateiddio. Mae gan bobl yr hawl i ddewis pa gwmni cyfleustodau i brynu eu gwasanaethau oddi wrtho, boed hynny'n drydan, ynni neu unrhyw gyfleustod arall, ac mae'r iaith Gymraeg yn fantais a gynigir gan rai o'r cwmnïau hynny. Mae prif ddarparwyr y cyfleustodau yng Nghymru yn cynnig y fantais honno'n barod. Gall pobl ddewis eu darparwyr, ar sail amrediad cyfan o faterion. Mae cost ac ansawdd gwasanaeth yn ffactorau pwysig, ond gall iaith fod yn ffactor i lawer o bobl eraill. Bydd cystadleuaeth yn gwarchod y defnyddiwr Cymraeg ac yn caniatáu i gwmnïau ddatblygu eu strategaethau iaith Gymraeg. Mae perygl o ran y neges a allai gael ei hanfon i'r sector preifat. Os ydym yn barod i ymestyn darpariaethau Deddf yr Iaith Gymraeg 1993 i unrhyw gwmni preifat, pa neges fyddai

the company to invest in Wales and appreciate how important the Welsh Language Act is to us as a nation and then develop the Welsh language as part of their marketing strategy when they present their products? Taking such a strong stance on extending the provisions of the Act—no matter how well meaning it is—could put off many private companies that would like to invest in Wales—

**Owen John Thomas:** Yr ydych yn ymwybodol y bu SWALEC, Dŵr Cymru a Nwy Prydain o fewn cylch gorchwyl Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg. Nid mater o ymestyn y cylch gorchwyl i'w cynnwys am y tro cyntaf yw hwn, ond adfer y gwasanaeth a fodolai ynghynt. Nid yw'r gwasanaeth dwyieithog a oedd yno ynghynt yn bodoli bellach.

4:10 p.m.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr wyf yn derbyn eich pwynt i raddau. Rhaid inni hefyd dderbyn bod gan bobl ddewis yn awr. Os nad yw cwmni sy'n cyflenwi nwy yn cynnig gwasanaeth yn y Gymraeg, mae gan yr unigolyn ddewis i brynu'r nwy, neu ba ynni bynnag, oddi wrth gwmni arall. Mae'r cyfrifoldeb yn syrthio ar ysgwyddau'r cwmni. Os ydym am fod yn llwyddiannus ac am dderbyn strategaeth a fydd yn effeithiol yng Nghymru, rhaid i'r cwmnïau dderbyn y sialens a'r cyfle. Gallwn sôn am nifer o gwmnïau, er enghraifft, cwmni Te Glengettie neu rai o fanciau'r stryd fawr, sy'n darparu gwasanaeth drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg am eu bod yn sylweddoli pa mor bwysig yw'r Gymraeg i bobl Cymru. Rhydd hyn gyfle i'r cwmnïau preifat dderbyn ein diwylliant a rhannu'r diwylliant gyda phobl Cymru.

**The Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language (Jenny Randerson):** I will respond to the comments made. On Owen John Thomas's contribution, we are fully aware of those issues because we have discussed them in great detail in the Culture Committee. As Eleanor said, it is easy to be impatient when you only have to talk and do not have to act. It is better to do this properly rather than do it in haste badly and face possible legal challenges as a consequence. I

hynny'n ei hanfon i ddarpar fewnffuddsoddwyr? Onid yw'n well i'r cwmni fuddsoddi yng Nghymru a gwerthfawrogi mor bwysig yw Deddf yr Iaith Gymraeg i ni fel cenedl ac wedyn ddatblygu'r Gymraeg fel rhan o'u strategaeth farchnata pan gyflwynant eu cynhyrchion? Gallai gwneud safiad mor gadarn ar ehangu darpariaethau'r Ddeddf—ni waeth pa mor dda yw'r bwriad—beri i lawer o gwmnïau preifat a hoffai fuddsoddi yng Nghymru beidio â gwneud hynny—

**Owen John Thomas:** You are aware that SWALEC, Welsh Water and British Gas were formerly within the Welsh Language Board's remit. This is not a matter of extending the remit to include them for the first time, but of restoring the service that existed previously. The bilingual service that existed previously does not exist any more.

**Alun Cairns:** I accept your point to a certain extent. We must also accept that people now have a choice. If a company supplying gas does not provide services through the medium of Welsh, the individual has a right to buy gas, or whatever other energy, from another company. The responsibility lies with the company. If we are to be successful and accept a strategy that will work effectively in Wales, these companies must embrace that challenge and opportunity. I could mention many companies, for example, Glengettie Tea, or some of the high street banks, which provide a service in Welsh because they realise how important the Welsh language is to the people of Wales. This gives private companies the opportunity to embrace our culture and to share the culture with the people of Wales.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Iaith Gymraeg (Jenny Randerson):** Ymatebaf i'r sylwadau a wnaethpwyd. Ynghylch cyfraniad Owen John Thomas, yr ydym yn gwbl ymwybodol o'r materion hynny oherwydd yr ydym wedi eu trafod mewn cryn fanylder yn y Pwyllgor Diwylliant. Fel y dywedodd Eleanor, mae'n hawdd bod yn ddiamynedd pan mai dim ond siarad sy'n rhaid ichi ei wneud, nid gweithredu. Mae'n well gwneud hyn yn iawn

can assure you that, in legislative terms, the few months that have elapsed since I made that commitment is a very short period. It is much quicker than it would take for a new language Act to pass through the House of Commons. It is important that we wait for the report, and it should come before the Committee before the summer recess.

Glyn, I agree with you on the importance of consensus, and of taking account of competition and competitiveness. The utilities were, by and large, under the umbrella of the Welsh Language Act 1993 when it was passed, but as a result of privatisation they are now outside its scope. However, it is important that we take into account the competitive picture in Wales.

Helen Mary referred to legislation on other issues, in particular, the right to speak Welsh in the workplace. I think that everyone in this Chamber would agree with that. However, it is important to bear in mind that the Welsh Language Act is not the only Act that deals with the Welsh language. Other pieces of legislation—in this case human rights legislation—would deal with that issue. We have taken every opportunity to influence UK legislation where there is a capacity to promote equality for the Welsh language.

The NHS Reform and Health Care Professions Bill adds local health boards to the list of bodies under Section 6 (1) of the Welsh Language Act 1993. We are approaching that differently: rather than incorporating the health boards into the Welsh Language Act, they have been included by means of primary legislation that is currently going through Parliament.

**Helen Mary Jones:** As regards the individual rights that I mentioned, the Minister will know that there is case law under race discrimination legislation, but that the precedents that it sets are conflicting. That is why there is a need for some legislative measures. We believe that a separate Act would be better, but the Government of Wales has lost the opportunity under the Race Relations

yn hytrach na'i wneud ar frys yn wael a wynebu heriau cyfreithiol posibl o ganlyniad. Gallaf eich sicrhau bod yr ychydig fisoedd a aeth heibio ers imi wneud yr ymrwymiad hwnnw yn gyfnod byr iawn mewn termau deddfwriaethol. Mae'n llawer cynt nag a gymerai i Ddeddf Iaith newydd fynd drwy Dŷ'r Cyffredin. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn aros am yr adroddiad, a ddylai ddod gerbron y Pwyllgor cyn gwyliau'r haf.

Glyn, cytunaf â chi ynghylch pwysigrwydd consensws, a'r angen i ystyried cystadleuaeth a chystadleurwydd. Yr oedd y cyfleustodau, ar y cyfan, dan ymbarél Deddf yr Iaith Gymraeg 1993 pan basiwyd honno, ond yn sgîl preifateiddio maent bellach y tu allan i'w rhychwant. Er hynny, mae'n bwysig inni ystyried y darlun cystadleuol yng Nghymru.

Cyfeiriodd Helen Mary at ddeddfwriaeth ar faterion eraill, yn enwedig yr hawl i siarad Cymraeg yn y gweithle. Yr wyf yn meddwl y byddai pawb yn y Siambr hon yn cytuno â hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig cofio nad Deddf yr Iaith Gymraeg yw'r unig Ddeddf sy'n delio â'r iaith Gymraeg. Byddai darnau eraill o ddeddfwriaeth—deddfwriaeth hawliau dynol yn yr achos hwn—yn delio â'r mater hwnnw. Yr ydym wedi cymryd pob cyfle i ddylanwadu ar ddeddfwriaeth y DU lle mae lle i hyrwyddo cydraddoldeb i'r iaith Gymraeg.

Mae Mesur Diwygio'r GIG a'r Proffesiynau Gofal Iechyd yn ychwanegu byrddau iechyd lleol at y rhestr o gyrff dan Adran 6 (1) Deddf yr Iaith Gymraeg 1993. Yr ydym yn ymdrin â hynny mewn ffordd wahanol: yn hytrach nag ymgorffori'r byrddau iechyd i mewn i Ddeddf yr Iaith, fe'u cynhwyswyd drwy gyfrwng deddfwriaeth sylfaenol sy'n mynd drwy'r Senedd ar hyn o bryd.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Ynglŷn â'r hawliau dynol a grybwyllais, bydd y Gweinidog yn gwybod y ceir cyfraith achosion dan ddeddfwriaeth gwahaniaethu hiliol, ond bod y cynseiliau a osodir ganddi yn anghyson. Dyna pam y mae angen rhyw fesurau deddfwriaethol. Credwn y byddai Deddf ar wahân yn well, ond mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi colli'r cyfle dan Ddeddf Cysylltiadau Hil (Diwygio) 2000 i ddatrys yr anghysonder

(Amendment) Act 2000 to sort out this anomaly. I suggest that a piecemeal approach, although I respect the Minister's attempts and goodwill, will not ultimately deliver that basic right. I am glad to hear the Minister endorsing that basic right today.

**Jenny Randerson:** Much of the case law predates the most recent human rights legislation and its application to Wales. It is a changing situation.

On Alun Cairns's contribution, I agree with the basic point about competition. The Basque Country, which has been successful in increasing the percentage of Basque speakers from 17 per cent of the population to 25 per cent, has not introduced legislation to deal with the private sector. It is sometimes suggested that we should do so in Wales. The Basque Country has average European Union gross domestic product per capita. Wales is 20 per cent below the EU average for GDP per capita. We should not consider introducing any legislation that would make us less economically competitive. That is my view and it is based on what I have listened to in the Culture Committee over the last year.

Three previous Orders have been made under Section 6 (1) of the Welsh Language Act 1993. They were made in 1996, 1999 and 2001. The first two statutory instruments were made in Westminster. This Order is the second that has been brought to the National Assembly. I am delighted that we have made so much progress in expanding the scope of the Welsh Language Act since the Assembly was established.

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf am bleidlais ar y gwelliant i egwyddor Gorchymyn Cynlluniau Iaith Gymraeg (Cyrff Cyhoeddus) 2002.

hwn. Awgrymaf na fydd dull tameidiog o fynd ati, er y parchaf ymdrechion ac ewylllys da'r Gweinidog, ddim yn sicrhau'r hawl sylfaenol hwnnw yn y pen draw. Yr wyf yn falch o glywed y Gweinidog yn cadarnhau'r hawl sylfaenol hwnnw heddiw.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae llawer o'r gyfraith achosion yn perthyn i adeg cyn y ddeddfwriaeth ddiweddaraf ar hawliau dynol a'i chymhwysiad i Gymru. Mae'n sefyllfa sy'n newid.

Ynghylch cyfraniad Alun Cairns, cytunaf â'r pwynt sylfaenol am gystadleuaeth. Nid yw Gwlad y Basg, a lwyddodd i gynyddu canran y siaradwyr Basgeg o 17 y cant o'r boblogaeth i 25 y cant, wedi cyflwyno deddfwriaeth i ddelio â'r sector preifat. Awgrymir weithiau y dylem ni wneud hynny yng Nghymru. Mae cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen yng Ngwlad y Basg yn hafal i gyfartaledd yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Mae Cymru 20 y cant o dan gyfartaledd yr UE o ran CMC y pen. Ni ddylem ystyried cyflwyno unrhyw ddeddfwriaeth a fyddai'n ein gwneud yn llai cystadleuol yn economaidd. Dyna fy marn i ac mae'n seiliedig ar yr hyn a glywais yn y Pwyllgor Diwylliant dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf.

Gwnaethpwyd tri Gorchymyn o'r blaen dan Adran 6 (1) Deddf yr Iaith Gymraeg 1993. Fe'u gwnaethpwyd yn 1996, 1999 a 2001. Gwnaethpwyd y ddau offeryn statudol cyntaf yn San Steffan. Y Gorchymyn hwn yw'r ail i ddod gerbron y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Yr wyf wrth fy modd ein bod wedi symud mor bell ymlaen i ehangu rhychwant Deddf yr Iaith Gymraeg ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call for a vote on the amendment to the principle of the Welsh Language Schemes (Public Bodies) Order 2002.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 13, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 31.  
Amendment 1: For 13, Abstain 0, Against 31.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter

Gibbons, Brian  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd

Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf am bleidlais ar **The Presiding Officer:** I call for a vote on  
egwyddor y Gorchymyn. the principle of the Order.

*Cynnig: O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 44, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hutt, Jane

Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf am bleidlais i **The Presiding Officer:** I call for a vote to  
gymeradwyo'r Gorchymyn. approve the Order.

*Cynnig: O blaid 41, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 41, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom



Morgan, Jonathan  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.17 p.m.  
 The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.17 p.m.*

### **Y Diweddaraf o ran Cynyddu Cyfranogiad yn y Celfyddydau Progress Towards Achieving Participation in the Arts**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies and amendments 2 and 3 in the name of Jonathan Morgan.

**The Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language (Jenny Randerson):** I propose that

*the National Assembly:*

*1. acknowledges that the culture strategy 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol' promotes participation in the arts in Wales through:*

*a) community arts*

*b) young people*

*c) diversity and cultural inclusion*

*d) arts and the economy;*

*2. welcomes the significant increase in the Arts Council of Wales's budget;*

*3. agrees that the newly restructured arts council is now better equipped to respond to the needs of the arts sector through:*

*a) newly streamlined procedures*

*b) decentralisation of services*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies a gwelliannau 2 a 3 yn enw Jonathan Morgan.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg (Jenny Randerson):** Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:*

*1. yn cydnabod bod y strategaeth diwylliant 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol' yn hybu cyfranogiad ym maes y celfyddydau yng Nghymru drwy:*

*a) gelfyddyd yn y gymuned*

*b) pobl ifanc*

*c) amrywiaeth a chynhwysiant diwylliannol*

*d) y celfyddydau a'r economi;*

*2. yn croesawu'r cynnydd sylweddol yng nghyllideb Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru;*

*3. yn cytuno bod Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru, fel y mae wedi'i ailstrwythuro, mewn sefyllfa well yn awr i ymateb i anghenion y sector celfyddydau oherwydd:*

*a) gweithdrefnau symlach newydd*

*b) bod gwasanaethau wedi'u datganoli*

- c) *the strengthening of the council's management team;*
4. *welcomes progress made by the Arts Council of Wales on a five-year arts development strategy, particularly:*
- a) *the core value to 'increase the accessibility of the arts to the public'*
- b) *full and open public consultation with the arts sectors and the public*
- c) *realistic time-scales for consultation and for introduction of the various aspects of the five year plan*
- d) *implementation of the priorities in 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol' through the five year plan. (NDM1062)*
- c) *bod tîm rheoli'r cyngor wedi'i gryfhau;*
4. *yn croesawu'r cynnydd y mae cyngor y celfyddydau wedi'i wneud ar strategaeth bum mlynedd i ddatblygu'r celfyddydau, yn enwedig:*
- a) *y nod craidd o 'alluogi mwy o bobl i fwynhau'r celfyddydau yng Nghymru'*
- b) *ymgynghori llawn ac agored â'r sector celfyddydau ac â'r cyhoedd*
- c) *caniatáu amser realistig ar gyfer ymgynghori ac ar gyfer cyflwyno'r gwahanol agweddau ar y cynllun pum mlynedd*
- d) *rhoi'r blaenoriaethau yn 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol' ar waith drwy'r cynllun pum mlynedd. (NDM1062)*

I am pleased to propose this motion because I am eager to inform Members of the progress made by the Welsh Assembly Government and the Arts Council of Wales towards increasing participation in the arts, and our plans for the future. In 2000, the percentage of the population attending at least one arts performance a year was almost 39.5 per cent. In 2002, it was more than 41 per cent. I want to see this percentage continuing to rise even further. I firmly believe that the recent policy developments will encourage further participation and inclusion. I launched 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol' in February. It gives direction to the cultural bodies for which the Assembly Government is responsible and cuts across policy not normally regarded as being cultural. 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol' has many important features that tackle head-on barriers to participation and inclusion in the arts. It acknowledges that culture and the arts are central to public policy and cannot be realised unless we put our communities at the heart of our vision or mobilise local authorities and community organisations.

4:20 p.m.

Our national arts bodies must make greater

Yr wyf yn falch o gyflwyno'r cynnig hwn gan fy mod yn awyddus i hysbysu'r Aelodau am y camau breision a gymerwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a Chyngor Celfyddydau Cymru tuag at gynyddu cyfranogiad yn y celfyddydau, a'n cynlluniau ar gyfer y dyfodol. Yn 2000, yr oedd y ganran o'r boblogaeth a fynychai o leiaf un perfformiad celfyddydol y flwyddyn bron yn 39.5 y cant. Yn 2002, yr oedd yn fwy na 41 y cant. Mae arnaf eisiau gweld y ganran hon yn dal i godi eto fyth. Credaf yn bendant y bydd y datblygiadau polisi diweddar yn annog mwy o gyfranogiad a chynhwysiant. Lansiais 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol' yn Chwefror. Mae'n rhoi cyfarwyddyd i'r cyrff diwylliannol y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gyfrifol amdanynt ac yn torri ar draws polisi nad ystyrir fel arfer yn bolisi diwylliannol. Mae gan 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol' lawer o nodweddion pwysig sy'n mynd i'r afael benben â rhwystrau i gyfranogiad a chynhwysiant yn y celfyddydau. Mae'n cydnabod bod diwylliant a'r celfyddydau'n ganolog i bolisi cyhoeddus ac na ellir eu cyflawni oni roddwn ein cymunedau wrth galon ein gweledigaeth neu roi awdurdodau lleol a chyrrff cymunedol ar waith.

Rhaid i'n cyrrff celfyddydau cenedlaethol

use of our home-grown talent in Wales. 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol' sets out the national remit companies' involvement in supporting grass-roots development and their activity in education and community outreach. 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol' establishes agreements between the arts council and all the national remit companies on their outreach work as well as the extent of their touring of central productions. This move will be key to nurturing home-grown talent. For example, Clwyd Theatr Cymru's mobile touring theatre has finished a six-week tour of three non-art venues in north Wales and three in south Wales. In addition to mobile touring to leisure centres, which attracts people who might not necessarily visit a theatre, the education department at Clwyd Theatr Cymru has developed a range of services, principally for schools in north Wales, centred on the producing activities of the company. Those include professional theatre-in-education, production-related workshops, activities and workpacks, youth theatre, youth dance, public courses and workshops at venues throughout the area and an education advisory and liaison service.

The Welsh National Opera also undertakes similar work. In Swansea, the WNO is now in its fifth year of a programme involving more than 200 young people from all walks of life in quality productions and coaching from WNO staff, concerts by the WNO chorus and educational workshops in schools. The WNO's youth opera also works in Cardiff, and plans are developing well for similar work in north Wales. The WNO leads by example, by taking its work to our most deprived communities. I have been impressed with its work in Blaenau Gwent in Nantyglo, Abertillery and Tredegar comprehensive schools.

Engaging people in the arts at an early age can have enormous benefits, and I have asked the arts council to establish a youth arts fund. It will take this forward in the context of its five-year arts development strategy, and an official launch is planned for later this year.

wneud mwy o ddefnydd o'n talentau cartref yng Nghymru. Mae 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol' yn amlinellu cyfraniad y cwmnïau cylch gwaith cenedlaethol i gefnogi datblygiad o'r gwreiddiau a'u gweithgaredd mewn addysg ac ymestyn i'r gymuned. Mae 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol' yn sefydlu cytundebau rhwng cyngor y celfyddydau a'r holl gwmnïau cylch gwaith cenedlaethol ar eu gwaith estyn allan yn ogystal â faint o deithio a wnânt gyda chynyrchiadau canolog. Bydd y symudiad hwn yn allweddol i feithrin talentau cartref. Er enghraifft, mae theatr deithiol symudol Clwyd Theatr Cymru wedi cwblhau taith chwe wythnos i dair canolfan anghelfyddydol yn y Gogledd a thair yn y De. Yn ogystal â theithio i ganolfannau hamdden, sy'n denu pobl na fyddai o reidrwydd yn mynd i theatr, mae'r adran addysg yn Clwyd Theatr Cymru wedi datblygu amrediad o wasanaethau, i ysgolion yn y Gogledd yn bennaf, wedi eu canoli ar weithgareddau cynhyrchu'r cwmni. Mae'r rheini'n cynnwys theatr-mewn-addysg broffesiynol, gweithdai, gweithgareddau a pheccynnau gwaith cysylltiedig â chynyrchiadau, theatr ieuencid, dawns ieuencid, cyrsiau a gweithdai cyhoeddus mewn canolfannau ledled yr ardal a gwasanaeth cyngor a chyswllt addysg.

Mae Cwmni Opera Cenedlaethol Cymru yn gwneud gwaith tebyg hefyd. Yn Abertawe, mae'r cwmni bellach yn ei bumed flwyddyn o raglen sy'n cynnwys dros 200 o bobl ifanc o bob cefndir mewn cynyrchiadau o safon gyda hyfforddiant gan staff y cwmni opera, cyngherddau gan gorws y cwmni, a gweithdai addysgol mewn ysgolion. Mae opera ieuencid y Cwmni Opera Cenedlaethol yn gweithio yng Nghaerdydd hefyd, ac mae cynlluniau'n datblygu'n dda ar gyfer gwaith tebyg yn y Gogledd. Mae'r cwmni opera'n arwain drwy esiampl, drwy fynd â'i waith allan i'n cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig. Yr wyf wedi edmygu ei waith ym Mlaenau Gwent yn ysgolion cyfun Nant-y-glo, Abertyleri a Thredeggar.

Gall cynnwys pobl yn y celfyddydau o oed cynnar roi buddiannau enfawr, ac yr wyf wedi gofyn i gyngor y celfyddydau sefydlu cronfa gelfyddydau ieuencid. Aiff â hyn yn ei flaen yng nghyd-destun ei strategaeth ddatblygu pum mlynedd i'r celfyddydau, a

'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol' acknowledges that we must ensure that schools can make the most of the opportunities implicit in the curriculum and provide further opportunities including regular exposure to and contact with the professional arts.

The arts council is increasing support for all art forms. Lottery awards of around £500,000 were made in the final round of applications for the last financial year. These projects include work to develop the National Youth Choir and Orchestra of Wales, BBC National Orchestra of Wales and projects with Community Music Wales. The music development fund has committed £8 million over three years through the grants for education support and training scheme. This scheme has been extended for a further year and we are considering how to develop future schemes.

Organisations such as Community Music Wales, which receives funding from the Arts Council of Wales, the National Lottery and the Welsh Music Foundation, play an important role in nurturing young musicians and are key in terms of helping to build the necessary infrastructure to do so more effectively and to sustain musical talent in our communities.

Another key element of 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol' is cultural diversity. The Welsh Assembly Government is committed to promoting equality of opportunity and giving everyone access to the arts. I am aware that there are barriers to cultural activities being available to everyone and I am particularly concerned to ensure that 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol' contributes to the improvement of facilities available and access to cultural activity for all the people of Wales.

The Government expects all of its cultural sponsored public bodies to work with practitioners in black and minority ethnic communities to ensure that they fully understand the needs of these communities and design policies to meet those needs. In

cheir lansiad swyddogol yn ddiweddarach eleni. Mae 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol' yn cydnabod fod yn rhaid inni sicrhau y gall ysgolion fanteisio i'r eithaf ar y cyfleoedd sydd ymhlyg yn y cwricwlwm a darparu cyfleoedd pellach gan gynnwys profiad a chysylltiad yn rheolaidd â'r celfyddydau proffesiynol.

Mae cyngor y celfyddydau'n cynyddu cefnogaeth i bob ffurf ar gelfyddydau. Rhoddwyd tua £500,000 o arian loteri yn y cylch terfynol o geisiadau am y flwyddyn ariannol ddiwethaf. Mae'r prosiectau hyn yn cynnwys gwaith i ddatblygu'r Côr a Cherddorfa Ieuenctid Genedlaethol Cymru, Cerddorfa Genedlaethol Gymreig y BBC a phrosiectau gyda Cherddoriaeth Gymunedol Cymru. Mae'r gronfa datblygu cerddoriaeth wedi ymrwymo i ddarparu £8 miliwn dros dair blynedd drwy'r cynllun grantiau cynnal addysg a hyfforddiant. Estynnwyd y cynllun am flwyddyn arall ac yr ydym yn ystyried sut i ddatblygu cynlluniau i'r dyfodol.

Mae sefydliadau fel Cerddoriaeth Gymunedol Cymru, sy'n derbyn arian oddi wrth Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru, y Loteri Cenedlaethol a Sefydliad Cerddoriaeth Gymreig, yn chwarae rhan bwysig o ran meithrin cerddorion ifanc ac maent yn allweddol o ran helpu i adeiladu'r isadeiledd angenrheidiol i wneud hynny'n fwy effeithiol ac i gynnal talent gerddorol yn ein cymunedau.

Elfen allweddol arall o 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol' yw amrywiaeth ddiwylliannol. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ymrwymo i hyrwyddo cyfle cyfartal a rhoi mynediad i'r celfyddydau i bawb. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol fod rhwystrau sy'n peri nad yw gweithgareddau diwylliannol ar gael i bawb ac yr wyf yn arbennig o awyddus i sicrhau bod 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol' yn cyfrannu at wella'r cyfleusterau sydd ar gael a sicrhau mynediad i weithgaredd diwylliannol i holl bobl Cymru.

Disgwylia'r Llywodraeth i'r holl gyrff cyhoeddus diwylliannol a noddir ganddi weithio gydag ymarferwyr mewn cymunedau croenddu a lleiafrifoedd ethnig i sicrhau eu bod yn deall anghenion y cymunedau hyn yn llawn ac yn cynllunio polisiau i ateb yr

this modern and mature democracy, this aspiration sits comfortably with our determination to treasure and protect our distinctiveness. The Assembly Government is also committed to seeking more black and minority ethnic candidates for membership of ASPBs and to seeing that the heritage of all communities in Wales is properly recognised. We must support bilingualism, multiculturalism and equality of opportunity, ensure that the arts and culture help tackle social disadvantage, improve access to our cultural wealth, promote and support access and ensure that black and minority ethnic communities are properly served by all cultural organisations and that they are properly represented.

We endorse the arts council's cultural diversity strategy. Last Friday in Blackwood Miners' Institute, I launched the council's cultural diversity funding scheme, which was made possible through an additional £150,000 provided by the Assembly Government. 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol' strongly acknowledges that arts and cultural activities make a substantial and fast-growing contribution to the Welsh economy. The turnover of the arts and cultural industries exceeded £1 billion in 1998 when 29,000 people were working in the sector in Wales. These figures will now be even higher. The WDA and the arts council have established an economic forum for the creative industries and this sector will be fully taken into account in the entrepreneurship action plan. I have also asked the arts council to ensure that its arts database for Wales includes details of all companies and events and links effectively with the Wales Tourist Board's proposed destination management system.

On funding, the arts council has received an increase of nearly £3 million this year on top of the £1.9 million increase already planned. This brings its grant in aid from the Assembly to £20.8 million. That will enable it to increase its level of support to all aspects of the arts in Wales and will also make an

anghenion hynny. Yn y ddemocratiaeth gyfoes ac aeddfed hon, mae'r awydd hwn yn cydeistedd yn gyfforddus â'n penderfyniad i drysori a gwarchod ein harwahanrwydd. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ymrwymo hefyd i geisio mwy o bobl ddu ac o leiafrifoedd ethnig i ymgeisio am aelodaeth o gyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad ac i sicrhau cydnabyddiaeth briodol i dreftadaeth pob cymuned yng Nghymru. Rhaid inni gefnogi dwyieithrwydd, amlddiwylliannaeth a chyfleoedd cyfartal, sicrhau bod y celfyddydau a diwylliant yn helpu mynd i'r afael ag anfantais gymdeithasol, hwyluso mynediad at ein cyfoeth diwylliannol, hyrwyddo a chefnogi mynediad a sicrhau y gwasanaethir cymunedau du a lleiafrifoedd ethnig yn briodol gan bob corff diwylliannol ac y cânt gynrychiolaeth briodol.

Ategwn strategaeth cyngor y celfyddydau ar amrywiaeth ddiwylliannol. Ddydd Gwener diwethaf yn Sefydliad y Glowyr, y Coed Duon, lansiais gynllun ariannu amrywiaeth diwylliannol y cyngor, a wnaethpwyd yn bosibl drwy £150,000 ychwanegol a ddarparwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol' yn cydnabod yn gryf fod gweithgareddau celfyddydol a diwylliannol yn gwneud cyfraniad sylweddol a chynyddol i economi Cymru. Yr oedd trosiant y diwydiannau celfyddydol a diwylliannol yn fwy nag £1 biliwn yn 1998 pan weithiai 29,000 o bobl yn y sector yng Nghymru. Bydd y ffigurau hynny'n uwch byth erbyn hyn. Mae Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a chyngor y celfyddydau wedi sefydlu fforwm economaidd i'r diwydiannau creadigol a rhoddir ystyriaeth lawn i'r sector hwn yn y cynllun gweithredu entrepreneuriaeth. Yr wyf hefyd wedi gofyn i gyngor y celfyddydau sicrhau bod ei gronfa ddata celfyddydau ar gyfer Cymru'n cynnwys manylion pob cwmni a digwyddiad ac yn cysylltu'n effeithiol â system reoli cyrchfannau arfaethedig Bwrdd Croeso Cymru.

O ran cyllid, mae cyngor y celfyddydau wedi cael cynnydd o bron £3 miliwn eleni ar ben y cynnydd o £1.9 miliwn a oedd wedi'i gynllunio'n barod. Daw hyn â chyfanswm ei gymhorthdal oddi wrth y Cynulliad i £20.8 miliwn. Bydd hynny'n ei alluogi i gynyddu ei lefel o gefnogaeth i bob agwedd ar y

additional £2 million a year available to the arts outside of Cardiff when the Wales Millennium Centre comes on-stream. The arts council has increased support to all of its revenue clients this year by 15 per cent. I am pleased to report that the arts council's restructuring action plan has now been implemented. The new council is better equipped to respond to the needs of the arts sector.

The council has put in place a regional structure delivering national aims locally, which enables it to have much closer and more effective contact with its clients and communities and to be responsive to local as well as national needs. I congratulate it on simplifying and integrating its grant schemes with fewer, more inclusive schemes so that support and advice is easier to access and procedures are simpler to administrate.

The council's five-year arts development strategy for 2002-07 sets out its proposals for increasing access to the arts throughout Wales. The council has held consultation meetings throughout Wales on the plan, which will be finalised this summer. The consultation has been transparent and inclusive and the council has gone to great lengths to ensure that as many people as possible have been involved from all aspects of the arts as well as members of the public.

I am also pleased that the arts council continues to develop its relationship with the voluntary cultural sector and will introduce a working group to monitor relationships. The council is committed to extending access to the arts sector and took on 20 community arts organisations as revenue clients last year. I firmly believe that the arts and culture have the power to transform ideas, people and attitudes. They are instrumental in regeneration, training and education and in encouraging participation by disenfranchised groups, promoting social inclusion and active citizenship. We have made an excellent start.

celfyddydau yng Nghymru a hefyd yn sicrhau bod £2 miliwn y flwyddyn yn ychwanegol ar gael i'r celfyddydau y tu allan i Gaerdydd pan ddaw Canolfan y Mileniwm i fodolaeth. Mae cyngor y celfyddydau wedi cynyddu cefnogaeth i'w holl gleientau refeniw eleni o 15 y cant. Mae'n dda gennyf adrodd fod cynllun gweithredu ailstrwythuro cyngor y celfyddydau bellach wedi'i weithredu. Mae'r cyngor newydd mewn sefyllfa well i ymateb i anghenion sector y celfyddydau.

Mae'r cyngor wedi sefydlu strwythur rhanbarthol i sicrhau amcanion cenedlaethol yn lleol, sy'n golygu y gall gael cysylltiad llawer agosach a mwy effeithiol gyda'i gleientau a chymunedau a bod yn ymatebol i anghenion lleol yn ogystal â rhai cenedlaethol. Fe'i llongyfarchaf ar symleiddio ac integreiddio'i gynlluniau grant gyda llai o gynlluniau, a'r rheini'n fwy cynhwysol, fel ei bod yn haws cael cymorth a chyngor a bod gweithdrefnau'n symlach i'w gweinyddu.

Mae strategaeth bum mlynedd y cyngor ar gyfer datblygu'r celfyddydau am 2002-07 yn amlinellu'i gynigion ar gyfer cynyddu mynediad at y celfyddydau ledled Cymru. Mae'r cyngor wedi cynnal cyfarfodydd ymgynghori drwy Gymru ar y cynllun, a sefydlir yn derfynol yr haf hwn. Bu'r ymgynghori'n dryloyw ac yn gynhwysol ac aeth y cyngor i gryn drafferth i sicrhau bod cymaint o bobl ag sy'n bosibl o bob agwedd ar y celfyddydau yn ogystal ag aelodau'r cyhoedd wedi'u cynnwys.

Yr wyf yn falch hefyd fod cyngor y celfyddydau'n parhau i ddatblygu'i berthynas gyda'r sector diwylliannol gwirfoddol ac y bydd yn cyflwyno gweithgor i gadw llygad ar berthnasau. Mae'r cyngor wedi ymrwymo i ehangu mynediad i sector y celfyddydau a derbyniodd 20 o sefydliadau celfyddydau cymunedol fel cleientau refeniw y llynedd. Credaf yn gryf fod gan y celfyddydau a diwylliant y grym i drawsnewid syniadau, pobl ac agweddau. Maent yn cyfrannu at adfywiad, hyfforddi ac addysg ac at annog cyfranogiad gan grwpiau difreintiedig, gan hyrwyddo cynhwysiant cymdeithasol a dinasyddiaeth weithredol. Yr ydym wedi gwneud dechrau rhagorol.

4:30 p.m.

I will not support the three amendments to the motion. Amendments 1 and 2 seek to introduce courses of action that already form part of Assembly Government policy. Amendment 3 would commit us to a national gallery, but the national museum is about to issue a public consultation document on how the collections should be displayed, and poses several options, including a national gallery. It is therefore inappropriate for us to make a decision on the museum's proposals before the public has expressed its views. I therefore commend the motion to you unamended.

**Owen John Thomas:** Cynigiaf welliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ym mhwynt 4 a) ar ôl 'yng Nghymru', rhoi 'trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg a'r Saesneg'.

Pe buasech yn y Siambr union dri mis yn ôl, ar 28 Chwefror, ac wedi syrthio i gysgu, gan ddeffro heddiw, ni fydddech yn credu bod unrhyw beth wedi digwydd yn y cyfamser. Mae'r cynnig hwn, ymhlith pethau eraill, yn croesawu'r cynnydd sylweddol yng nghyllideb cyngor y celfyddydau, ac yn cytuno bod cyngor y celfyddydau wedi'i ailstrwythuro mewn gwell sefyllfa i ymateb i anghenion y sector oherwydd gweithdrefnau symlach, datganoli gwasanaethau, a thîm rheoli cryfach.

Yn rhyfedd, trafodwyd yr union faterion hyn dri mis yn ôl. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gofyn inni bleidleisio ar gynnig a dderbyniwyd eisoes. Ym mis Chwefror, gwrthododd y Gweinidog gefnogi gwelliannau Plaid Cymru ar y sail eu bod yn ddiangen. Os oes unrhyw beth yn ddiangen, awgrymaf mai dadl heddiw yw hynny. Yn waeth na bod yn ddiangen, mae cynnig heddiw yn profi yn ddi-os fod cwpwrdd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn wag. Mae cyn lleied o syniadau a pholisïau ganddi, mae'n rhaid iddi ailgylchu hen ddadl gan geisio rhoi'r argraff bod ganddi rywbeth newydd i'w gynnig.

Wedi dweud hynny, rhaid canmol, croesawu a gwerthfawrogi unrhyw gamau a fydd yn symbylu mwy o bobl i gymryd rhan yn y celfyddydau. Ni fyddai neb yn y Siambr yn

Ni chefnogaf y tri gwelliant i'r cynnig. Mae gwelliannau 1 a 2 yn ceisio cyflwyno ffyrdd o weithredu sydd eisoes yn rhan o bolisi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Byddai gwelliant 3 yn ein hymrwymo i oriel genedlaethol, ond mae'r amgueddfa genedlaethol ar fin cyhoeddi dogfen ymgynghorol gyhoeddus ar sut y dylid arddangos y casgliadau, ac mae'n cynnig sawl opsiwn, gan gynnwys oriel genedlaethol. Mae'n amhriodol felly i ni wneud penderfyniad ar gynigion yr amgueddfa cyn i'r cyhoedd gael mynegi barn. Cymeradwyaf y cynnig ichi heb welliannau felly.

**Owen John Thomas:** I propose amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. In point 4 a) after 'public', insert 'through the medium of both the Welsh and English languages'.

Had you been in the Chamber exactly three months ago, on 28 February, fallen asleep, and woken up today, you would not believe that anything had changed in the meantime. This motion, among other things, welcomes the significant increase in the arts council's budget, and agrees that the restructured arts council is in a better position to respond to the sector's needs because of simpler procedures, the decentralisation of services, and a stronger management team.

Strangely, these same matters were discussed here three months ago. The Assembly Government is asking us to vote on a motion that has already been carried. In February, the Minister refused to support Plaid Cymru's amendments on the basis that they were unnecessary. I suggest that if anything is unnecessary, it is today's debate. Not only is it unnecessary, but today's motion proves beyond doubt that the Welsh Assembly Government's cupboard is bare. It has so few ideas and policies that it has to recycle an old debate while trying to give the impression that it has something new to offer.

Having said that, we must praise, welcome and appreciate any measures that will motivate more people to participate in the arts. No-one in the Chamber would disagree

anghytuno â hynny. Croesawn, felly, strategaeth y Gweinidog, ac yr ydym o blaid pob ymdrech i hybu diddordeb pobl, yn enwedig pobl ifanc, yn y celfyddydau ar lefel gymunedol.

Croesawn gynnydd cyngor y celfyddydau ar ei strategaeth bum mlynedd, ond mae Plaid Cymru am danlinellu pwysigrwydd dwyieithrwydd yn y celfyddydau, fel ym mhob maes arall. Yr ydym yn falch o'r modd y mae cyngor y celfyddydau yn hybu'r Gymraeg yn ei weithredoedd a'i weithgareddau, a diben ein gwelliant yw cydnabod hynny.

Yr ydym wedi galw yn y gorffennol am yr hyn a geir yng ngwelliannau 2 a 3 yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Er inni gefnogi sefydlu Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru, yr ydym yr un mor awyddus i weld cymorth i'r celfyddydau ar draws y wlad, ac, os cofiaf yn iawn, Plaid Cymru oedd y blaid gyntaf i ofyn am oriel genedlaethol i Gymru.

Mae 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol' yn nodi nad yw llenyddiaeth wedi cael ei chyfran deg o gefnogaeth yn y gorffennol o ran creu amgylchiadau lle y gall awduron wneud bywoliaeth iawn, na symbylu cyhoeddwr i adeiladu ar ein doniau llenyddol. Gobeithiwn y bydd modd gwella hyn. Mae'r strategaeth hefyd yn cyfeirio at gerddoriaeth draddodiadol, gan awgrymu ein bod yn cymharu'n wael â gwledydd Celtaidd eraill. Beth yw syniadau'r Gweinidog ar hyn?

Bydd cryfhau presenoldeb cyngor y celfyddydau ar draws y wlad yn fodd, gobeithio, o ymateb yn well i anghenion y gynulleidfa. Mae'r ddadl hon yn ymwneud â chyfranogiad y cyhoedd yn ogystal â chyfranogiad pobl greadigol.

Yr ydym yn falch bod cynllun pum mlynedd y cyngor yn sôn am agor swyddfa i ddeddwyrain Cymru, y tu allan i Gaerdydd—yn y Cymoedd, gobeithio. Gwnaethom yr argymhelliad hwn mewn gwelliant i'r cynnig a drafodwyd dri mis yn ôl, ond ni welodd y Gweinidog yr angen amdano bryd hynny.

**Glyn Davies:** I propose amendments 2 and 3 in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Amendment 2: at the end of the motion, add a

with that. Therefore, we welcome the Minister's strategy, and support every effort to promote interest, especially among young people, in the arts at a community level.

We welcome the arts council's progress on its five-year strategy, but Plaid Cymru wants to emphasise the importance of bilingualism in the arts, as in every other field. We are pleased with the way in which the arts council promotes the Welsh language in its actions and activities, and the purpose of our amendment is to recognise that.

We have called in the past for the points contained in amendments 2 and 3 in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Although we supported the establishment of the Wales Millennium Centre, we are just as eager to see assistance for the arts across the country, and if I remember rightly, Plaid Cymru was the first party to call for a national gallery for Wales.

'Creative Future: Cymru Creadigol' notes that literature has not received its fair share of support in the past in terms of creating an environment where authors can make a decent living, or motivating publishers to nurture and develop our literary talents. We hope that this can be improved. The strategy also refers to traditional music, and implies that we compare unfavourably with other Celtic countries. What are the Minister's views on this?

I hope that strengthening the arts council's presence across the country is a way of responding more effectively to the needs of the audience. This debate is about participation by the public, in addition to participation by creative people.

We are pleased that the council's five-year strategy mentions opening a south-east Wales office outside Cardiff—hopefully in the Valleys. We made this recommendation in an amendment to the motion debated three months ago, but at the time, the Minister did not consider it necessary.

**Glyn Davies:** Cynigiau welliannau 2 a 3 yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y



new point:

*calls on the Government to ensure Government expenditure on the arts is distributed fairly throughout Wales taking full account of public support for the Wales Millennium Centre.*

I propose amendment 3. At the end of the motion, add a new point:

*calls on the Government to make a commitment to a national gallery.*

I used to be a physical young man—

**Peter Law:** I am surprised that you can remember that far back.

**Glyn Davies:** I had no interest in having time to stand and stare, but the mystery and magic of the garden introduced an aesthetic element into my life. My wife was responsible for this, as she was for my early, clumsy and embarrassing fumbblings in the world of art. I had not progressed far down this road when my group leader asked me to be the Conservative Assembly spokesman on the arts. I have never before been so dependent on my wife, who, as luck would have it, is something of an authority on this subject.

Wales has an incredibly rich cultural history, and I suspect that—although I cannot know it for a fact—there is a greater realisation in Wales than in any other part of the United Kingdom that culture is a good thing. I also suspect that in Wales we understand, more than any other region, that art is for everyone; not just the well-heeled or well-bred. However, we have not been so smart in fully exploiting our cultural heritage and using our cultural richness to be outward-looking on the world. We have not fully grasped the economic potential of this cultural heritage and wealth. Even today, there is an inward-looking strand of Welshness that believes that it can protect its heritage by building the modern day equivalent of Offa's Dyke. It is a mindset that sees heartlands as bunkers.

However, I believe that things are changing.

cynnig:

*yn galw ar y Llywodraeth i sicrhau bod gwariant y Llywodraeth ar y celfyddydau yn cael ei ddosbarthu'n deg ledled Cymru gan roi ystyriaeth lawn i gefnogaeth y cyhoedd i Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru.*

Cynigiad welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar y Llywodraeth i ymrwymo i oriel genedlaethol.*

Yr oeddwn i'n arfer bod yn ddyn ifanc corfforol—

**Peter Law:** Yr wyf yn synnu y gallwch gofio mor bell yn ôl â hynny.

**Glyn Davies:** Nid oedd gennyf ddiddordeb mewn sefyll a syllu, ond cyflwynodd dirgelwch a hud yr ardd elfen esthetig i'm bywyd. Fy ngwraig oedd yn gyfrifol am hyn, ac am fy mwnglera cynnar clogyrnaidd a chwithig ym myd celf. Nid oeddwn wedi mynd ymhell i lawr y ffordd hon pan ofynnodd fy arweinydd grŵp imi fod yn llefarydd y Ceidwadwyr yn y Cynulliad ar y celfyddydau. Nid wyf erioed wedi dibynnu cymaint ar fy ngwraig, sydd, drwy lwc, yn dipyn o awdurdod ar y pwnc.

Mae gan Gymru hanes diwylliannol anhygoel o gryf, ac yr wyf yn amau—er na allaf wybod hyn fel ffaith—fod mwy o bobl yng Nghymru nag mewn unrhyw ran arall o'r Deyrnas Unedig yn sylweddoli fod diwylliant yn beth da. Amheuaf hefyd ein bod yng Nghymru'n deall, fwy nag unrhyw ranbarth arall, mai rhywbeth i bawb yw celf; nid dim ond i'r cefnog neu'r bonedd. Er hynny, nid ydym wedi bod mor glyfar o ran manteisio ar ein hetifeddiaeth ddiwylliannol a defnyddio'n cyfoeth diwylliannol i edrych allan ar y byd. Nid ydym wedi llawn amgyffred potensial economaidd yr etifeddiaeth a chyfoeth diwylliannol hwn. Hyd yn oed heddiw, mae cainc o Gymreictod mewnblyg sy'n credu y gall warchod ei hetifeddiaeth drwy adeiladu'r hyn sy'n cyfateb i Glawdd Offa'n hoes ni. Dyma feddylfryd sy'n gweld cadarnleoedd fel bynceri.

Fodd bynnag, credaf fod pethau'n newid.

There is a greater sense of purpose in using our culture to elevate Wales's position in the world. In my view—and I hope that I will not be castigated for saying this—this extension of our horizons flows in great part from devolution.

We will support this motion, and we hope that Members will support our amendments, but if our political opponents are churlish enough to withhold their support, we will support the motion anyway. The only difficult aspect for us is point 2, where reference is made to increasing budgets for the arts council. Conservatives are always touchy about demanding greater budgets, but the fact that it refers to a past budget makes even this point acceptable to us.

Two years ago, I believed that the Arts Council of Wales should be abolished. It was despised by the arts community and its only purpose seemed to be to offer opportunities for public exhibitions of internal feuding—not unlike the Welsh Rugby Union or the Irish national football team. However, the situation has improved. We are prepared to accept that the Arts Council of Wales is now better equipped to respond to the needs of the arts sector. The existence of a Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language and a Culture Committee have changed the purpose of the arts council, but at present, we are more than content for it to live on. I accept that that is not saying much, but it is saying something.

In my preparations for this speech, I have drawn on my wife's judgment, which I describe as my 'in-house advice'. Our combined judgment is that there is a new attempt to celebrate Wales in the world and to promote a new international positioning of our nation. One manifestation of this new cultural internationalisation is the proposed participation in the Venice Biennale in 2003. I greatly approve of this exciting development. I will be interested to hear about the Government's arrangements for ensuring success and making Wales's presence meaningful.

We will support amendment 1 in the name of

Mae mwy o ymdeimlad o bwrpas o ddefnyddio ein diwylliant i godi safle Cymru yn y byd. Yn fy marn i—a gobeithio na chaf fy nghollfarnu am ddweud hyn—mae'r ehangu gorwelion hwn ar ein rhan yn tarddu i raddau helaeth o ddatganoli.

Cefnogwn y cynnig hwn, a gobeithiwn y gwnaiff Aelodau gefnogi ein gwelliannau, ond os yw ein gwrthwynebwyr gwleidyddol yn ddigon surbwch i atal eu cefnogaeth, cefnogwn y cynnig beth bynnag. Yr unig agwedd anodd i ni yw pwynt 2, lle cyfeirir at gynyddu cyllidebau i gyngor y celfyddydau. Mae Ceidwadwyr bob amser yn anniddig ynghylch mynnu cyllidebau mwy, ond mae'r ffaith mai cyfeirio at gyllideb yn y gorffennol a wneir yn golygu fod hyd yn oed y pwynt hwn yn dderbyniol gennym.

Ddwy flynedd yn ôl, credwn y dylid diddymu Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru. Yr oedd y gymuned gelfyddydol yn ei gasáu a'i unig bwrpas ymddangosiadol oedd cynnig cyfleoedd ar gyfer arddangosiadau cyhoeddus o gecru mewnol—nid yn annhebyg i Undeb Rygbi Cymru neu dîm pêl-droed cenedlaethol Iwerddon. Fodd bynnag, mae'r sefyllfa wedi gwella. Yr ydym yn barod i dderbyn fod Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru bellach mewn sefyllfa well i ymateb i anghenion y sector celfyddydau. Mae bodolaeth Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Iaith Gymraeg a Phwyllgor Diwylliant wedi newid pwrpas cyngor y celfyddydau, ond ar hyn o bryd, yr ydym yn fwy na bodlon iddo barhau. Derbyniaf nad yw hynny'n dweud llawer, ond mae'n dweud rhywbeth.

Yn fy mharatodau ar gyfer yr araith hon, yr wyf wedi dibynnu ar farn fy ngwraig, barn a ddisgrifiad fi fel fy 'nghyngor mewnol'. Ein barn gyfun yw fod ymgais newydd ar droed i ddathlu Cymru yn y byd ac i hyrwyddo safle rhyngwladol newydd i'n cenedl. Un arwydd o'r rhyngwladoldeb diwylliannol newydd hwn yw'r bwriad i gymryd rhan yn y Biennale yn Fenis yn 2003. Cymeradwyaf yn fawr y datblygiad cyffrous hwn. Bydd yn ddiddorol clywed am drefniadau'r Llywodraeth ar gyfer sicrhau llwyddiant a sicrhau presenoldeb ystyrion i Gymru.

Cefnogwn welliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies,

Jocelyn Davies, and I hope that you will support amendment 2. I believe that there is real concern throughout Wales that this Government concentrates resources on the south-east corner of Wales. We must reassure the people of Wales that, at the very least, our aspiration is to be fair to all of Wales.

When we gave our support to the Wales Millennium Centre earlier this year, we proposed the same sort of amendment. It drew wide support from all parties, including, I believe, the Government, which is now operating different strategies. However, I hope that we can achieve the same level of support today.

I also ask you to support amendment 3, and I hope that there will be time for my colleagues to join in this debate, and address this later on.

4:40 p.m.

**Tom Middlehurst:** I cannot claim to have engaged my wife in writing this speech. I think that she would be more strident than I will be. I welcome the significant increases in the Arts Council of Wales's budget, as they consolidate the increases planned by Alun Michael's Government. However, we should recognise that they have been made possible through the partnership that matters—that is, the partnership between the Labour Government in Westminster and the Labour-led Assembly in Cardiff, working jointly on behalf of the people of Wales. It is Gordon Brown's largesse and Edwina Hart's willing support that has made this possible.

I acknowledge the considerable progress made by the arts council following the publication of the critical Wallace report. Perhaps we should reflect on that. The report provided the basis for essential restructuring. I recognise the arts council's willingness to embrace change, as envisaged in the report. However, there is some unfinished business in terms of the Wallace report. Will the Minister consider the future role, function, qualification—in the broadest sense—and impartiality of the arts council and, possibly, the remuneration of the chair, so that we can increase its credibility?

a gobeithiaf y gwnewch chithau gefnogi gwelliant 2. Credaf fod gwir bryder ledled Cymru fod y Llywodraeth hon yn canolbwyntio adnoddau ar gornel ddeddwyreiniol y wlad. Rhaid inni roi sicrwydd i bobl Cymru mai ein dyhead, o leiaf, yw sicrhau chwarae teg i Gymru gyfan.

Pan roesom ein cefnogaeth i Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru yn gynharach eleni, cynigiasom yr un math o welliant. Cafodd gefnogaeth eang gan bob plaid, gan gynnwys, mi gredaf, y Llywodraeth, sydd bellach yn gweithredu strategaethau gwahanol. Er hynny, gobeithiaf y gallwn sicrhau'r un lefel o gefnogaeth heddiw.

Gofynnaf hefyd ichi gefnogi gwelliant 3, a gobeithiaf y bydd amser i'm cyd-Aelodau ymuno yn y ddadl hon, a siarad ar hyn yn nes ymlaen.

**Tom Middlehurst:** Ni allaf honni imi gael cymorth fy ngwraig i ysgrifennu'r araith hon. Yr wyf yn meddwl y byddai hi'n fwy llafar nag y byddaf fi. Croesawaf y codiadau arwyddocaol yng nghyllideb Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru, gan eu bod yn cyfnerthu'r codiadau a gynlluniwyd gan Lywodraeth Alun Michael. Fodd bynnag, dylem gydnabod eu bod yn bosibl oherwydd y bartneriaeth sy'n cyfrif—hynny yw, y bartneriaeth rhwng y Llywodraeth Lafur yn San Steffan a'r Cynulliad dan arweiniad Llafur yng Nghaerdydd, yn cydweithio ar ran pobl Cymru. Haelioni Gordon Brown a chefnogaeth barod Edwina Hart a wnaeth hyn yn bosibl.

Cydnabyddaf y cynnydd sylweddol a wnaethpwyd gan gyngor y celfyddydau yn dilyn cyhoeddiad allweddol adroddiad Wallace. Efallai y dylem fyfyrion ar hynny. Darparodd yr adroddiad sail ar gyfer ailstrwythuro hanfodol. Cydnabyddaf baroddrwydd cyngor y celfyddydau i gofleidio newid, fel a ragwelir yn yr adroddiad. Fodd bynnag, mae rhyw gymaint o fusnes anorffenedig o ran adroddiad Wallace. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ystyried rôl, swyddogaeth, cymhwyster—yn yr ystyr ehangaf—ac amhleidioldeb cyngor y celfyddydau yn y dyfodol ac, efallai, ystyried

talun i'r cadeirydd, er mwyn cynyddu ei hygredd?

I was pleased to hear the Minister acknowledge the important contribution of the national remit organisations, or the flagship companies, the Welsh national performing arts companies or whatever you want to call them. The strategy recognises their important contribution to arts and cultural life in Wales. That contribution involves international recognition, promoting professional excellence, reaching out to communities, building audiences, extending and supporting young people through educational links and providing opportunities for Welsh talent to develop.

Yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed y Gweinidog yn cydnabod cyfraniad pwysig y sefydliadau cylch gwaith cenedlaethol, neu'r cwmnïau blaenllaw, y cwmnïau celfyddydau perfformio cenedlaethol neu beth bynnag y dymunwch eu galw. Mae'r strategaeth yn cydnabod eu cyfraniad pwysig i'r celfyddydau a bywyd diwylliannol yng Nghymru. Mae'r cyfraniad hwnnw'n ymwneud â chydabyddiaeth ryngwladol, hyrwyddo rhagoriaeth broffesiynol, estyn allan i gymunedau, adeiladu cynulleidfaoedd, ymestyn a chefnogi pobl ifanc drwy gysylltiadau addysgol a darparu cyfleoedd i ddoniau Cymreig ddatblygu.

Given the importance of that work, I urge the Minister to consider the future funding of those national remit companies. Although I have asked this of the Minister in the past, will she revisit this issue? This is an opportunity to increase the accountability of those national remit organisations and subject them to the Assembly's three tests of sustainability, social inclusion and equality of opportunity. Doing so, and addressing the funding issues—and perhaps funding the organisations directly—would not undermine the arts council's work, as it would still be involved in delivering support for important aspects of the strategy; doing so would give added focus to the aspects that are given such prominence in the culture strategy.

Yn wyneb pwysigrwydd y gwaith hwnnw, anogaf y Gweinidog i ystyried y modd y cyllidir y cwmnïau cylch gwaith cenedlaethol hynny yn y dyfodol. Er fy mod wedi gofyn hyn i'r Gweinidog o'r blaen, a wnaiff hi edrych eto ar y mater? Dyma gyfle i gynyddu atebolrwydd y cwmnïau cylch gwaith cenedlaethol hynny a gwneud iddynt wynebu tri phrawf y Cynulliad sef cynaliadwyedd, cynhwysiant cymdeithasol a chyfle cyfartal. Ni fyddai gwneud hynny, a rhoi sylw i'r cwestiynau cyllid—ac ariannu'r cwmnïau'n uniongyrchol, efallai—yn tanseilio gwaith cyngor y celfyddydau, gan y byddai yn dal i ymwneud â chefnogi agweddau pwysig o'r strategaeth; byddai gwneud hynny'n rhoi ffocws ychwanegol i'r agweddau a gaiff le mor flaenllaw yn y strategaeth ddiwylliant.

I stated earlier that the Minister acknowledged the important work of the national remit organisations, including the Welsh National Opera, Clwyd Theatr Cymru, Diversions Dance Company and the BBC National Orchestra of Wales. However, we must consider introducing financial stability for those organisations. The arts council's annual budgetary process precludes long-term planning and mitigates against those organisations achieving the best possible outcomes. It does not allow for a capital spending programme to meet the needs of the buildings that house those organisations.

Dywedais yn gynharach fod y Gweinidog yn cydnabod gwaith pwysig y sefydliadau cylch gwaith cenedlaethol, gan gynnwys y Cwmni Opera Cenedlaethol Cymru, Clwyd Theatr Cymru, Cwmni Dawns Diversions a Cherddorfa Genedlaethol Gymreig y BBC. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni ystyried cyflwyno sefydlogrwydd ariannol i'r cyrff hynny. Mae proses gyllidebol flynyddol cyngor y celfyddydau yn milwrio yn erbyn cynllunio hirdymor ac yn rhwystro'r cyrff hynny rhag cael y canlyniadau gorau posibl. Nid yw'n caniatáu ar gyfer rhaglen wariant cyfalaf i ateb anghenion yr adeiladau sy'n gartref i'r cyrff hynny.

Will you examine Clwyd Theatr Cymru's

A wnewch chi edrych ar drefniadau ariannu

funding arrangements, which see a disproportionate contribution by Flintshire County Council to a programme that is largely determined by the arts council by virtue of its contribution to the budget? Will you take the opportunity to show your commitment to north Wales? Will you hold discussions with the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities and demonstrate jointly that there is equal commitment to north Wales to that which has been demonstrated for south Wales—and I applaud you for it—by the huge investment in building the Wales Millennium Centre? It is time to show an equal commitment to Clwyd Theatr Cymru and other organisations outside the south Wales enclave.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Datganaf fuddiant gan fy mod yn derbyn nawdd i gyhoeddi llyfrau yn y Gymraeg, a chan fod Elinor, fy ngwraig, yn berfformwraig gerddorol. Pe bai Elinor wedi ysgrifennu fy arai, efallai y byddai fy nghyfraniad yn fwy. Fodd bynnag, fi sy'n gyfrifol am ysgrifennu fy areithiau.

Yr wyf yn falch o gyfrannu i'r ddadl, gan fod heddiw'n ddiwrnod pwysig i mi, ac yn ddiwrnod arbennig i'm hetholaeth. Cyhoeddodd y Llywodraeth heddiw ei bod yn rhoi sêl ei bendith i'r grant gan Fwrdd Croeso Cymru i ganolfan celfyddydau Doc Fictoria yng Nghaernarfon. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Andrew Davies a'i gydweithwyr. Bydd y prosiect yn costio bron i £6 miliwn, a bydd y ganolfan yn agor yng Ngorffennaf 2004. Bydd hynny mewn da bryd i gydweithio â chanolfan y mileniwm yng Nghaerdydd—thema y soniodd Tom amdani. Gobeithiaf y bydd perfformiadau canolfan y mileniwm yn ymweld â chanolfan Doc Fictoria yng Nghaernarfon ac â chanolfannau eraill o amgylch Cymru, gan gynnwys canolfannau yn yr Wyddgrug, Aberystwyth ac Abertawe. Gobeithiaf hefyd y gall y grwpiau perfformio a fydd yn cael cartref newydd yng nghanolfan Doc Fictoria, Caernarfon ddod i Gaerdydd i berfformio. Bydd hynny o fantais iddynt hwy ac i'r boblogaeth yma. Gobeithiaf y defnyddir y £2 filiwn y flwyddyn o'r gronfa a neilltuwyd gan Edwina Hart i hybu gweithgarwch o'r fath.

Pwysleisiaf werth cyfraniad y celfyddydau i'r economi. Cafodd hynny ei gydnabod gan y

Clwyd Theatr Cymru, sy'n gweld cyfraniad anghymesur gan Gyngor Sir y Fflint at raglen a benderfynir i raddau helaeth gan gyngor y celfyddydau yn rhinwedd ei gyfraniad at y gyllideb? A gymerwch y cyfle i ddangos eich ymrwymiad i'r Gogledd? A wnewch chi gynnal trafodaethau gyda'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau a dangos eich dau fod ymrwymiad yr un mor gryf i'r Gogledd â'r hyn a ddangoswyd i'r De—ac fe'ch cymeradwyaf amdano—gan y buddsoddiad enfawr i adeiladu Canolfan y Mileniwm? Mae'n bryd dangos ymrwymiad cyfartal i Glwyd Theatr Cymru a chyrrff eraill y tu allan i gilfach y De.

**Dafydd Wigley:** I declare an interest as I receive sponsorship to publish Welsh language books, and as Elinor, my wife, is a performing musician. Had Elinor written my speech, perhaps my contribution would be greater. However, I am responsible for writing my own speeches.

I am pleased to contribute to the debate, as today is an important day for me, and a special day for my constituency. The Government announced today that it has given its blessing to the Wales Tourist Board grant for the Victoria Dock arts centre in Caernarfon. I am grateful to Andrew Davies and his colleagues. The project will cost almost £6 million, and the centre will open in July 2004. The centre will, therefore, be well placed to collaborate with the millennium centre in Cardiff—a theme mentioned by Tom. I hope that millennium centre performances will tour the Victoria Dock centre in Caernarfon, and other centres around Wales, including centres in Mold, Aberystwyth and Swansea. I also hope that the performing groups housed at the Victoria Dock centre in Caernarfon will be able to come to Cardiff to perform. That will be beneficial to them and to the population here. I hope that the £2 million a year allocated by Edwina from the fund will be used to promote such activities.

I emphasise the value of the contribution the arts make to the economy. That has been

Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a Bwrdd Croeso Cymru. Fel y dywedwyd eisoes, mae'r diwydiannau creadigol yng Nghymru yn sylweddol, gyda throsiant o dros £1 biliwn y flwyddyn. Caiff un gweithiwr o bob 40 ei gyflogi o fewn y diwydiannau hyn.

Sut y gallwn hyrwyddo ac ehangu'r cyfleoedd economaidd a diwylliannol hyn? Rhaid gwneud tri pheth. Yn gyntaf, sbarduno diddordeb, yn arbennig ymhlith pobl ifanc. Mae'r defnydd o gelfyddydau o fewn addysg yn ein hysgolion yn allweddol i hynny. Yn ail, meithrin a hyfforddi talent. Rhaid i'r systemau hyfforddi a'r hyfforddwyr fod o fewn cyrraedd hawdd i bobl yn eu cynefinoedd, a heb rwystrau ariannol. Yn drydydd, rhaid i'r rhai sydd wedi datblygu eu talentau eu defnyddio er mwyn creu manteision economaidd a diwylliannol.

O ran sbarduno diddordeb ymhlith pobl a chanddynt alluoedd celfyddydol, rhaid inni ystyried adeiladu ar eu talentau i greu cyflogaeth, a fyddai'n rhan amser yn gyntaf o bosibl. Efallai fod angen cynlluniau i alluogi pobl i adael eu prif waith yn rhan amser er mwyn datblygu eu diddordebau celfyddydol. Gellid ymestyn hynny wedyn i fod yn waith amser llawn. A allai'r bobl hynny symud ymlaen i sefydlu eu busnesau eu hunain? Cyfeiriwyd at ein cynllun entrepreneuriaeth. Rhaid inni ddatblygu'r cynllun hwnnw os ydyw am gael effaith uniongyrchol yn y maes hwn. Gobeithiaf y gwneir hynny, ac y bydd y fforwm y cyfeiriodd Jenny ato yn helpu i sicrhau hynny.

Er mwyn hyrwyddo datblygiad, rhaid cael fframwaith o gefnogaeth gyllidol nad yw'n dibynnu ar nawdd preifat yn unig, oherwydd ni ellir dibynnu ar hynny yn y tymor hir.

Croesawaf y cynlluniau i hybu addysg a datblygu talent unigolion a grwpiau, y bu'r Cynulliad yn rhan o'u datblygu. Rhaid troi hyn yn dalent a all adeiladu ar ein sector busnes. Dyma'r her i'r Cynulliad: gobeithiaf y gellir rhoi'r sylw, yr adnoddau a'r fframwaith o gynhaliaeth i bobl a chanddynt dalent er mwyn iddynt hwy a'r gymdeithas fanteisio arni, a thrwy hynny gynyddu safon byw.

acknowledged by the Economic Development Committee, the Welsh Development Agency and the Wales Tourist Board. As has been said, the creative industries in Wales are significant, with a turnover of over £1 billion a year. One in 40 workers is employed within these industries.

How can we promote and expand these economic and cultural opportunities? We must take three steps. First, we must spark interest, particularly among young people. The use of arts within our schools is key to that work. Secondly, we must nurture and train our talent. The training system and the trainers must be accessible to people in their own areas, and without financial barriers. Thirdly, those who have developed their talents must use them to create economic and cultural advantages.

In terms of sparking interest among people with artistic abilities, we must consider building on their talents to create employment, which could possibly be part time at first. Perhaps we need schemes to enable people to leave their day jobs on a part time basis in order to develop their cultural interests. That could then be extended to full time work. Could these people move on to establish their own businesses? Reference has been made to our entrepreneurship scheme. We must develop that scheme if it is to have a direct influence in this field. I hope that that will be done, and that the forum to which Jenny referred will help to secure that.

In order to promote development, we must have a framework of financial support that is not wholly reliant on private sponsorship alone, because that cannot be relied upon in the long term.

I welcome the schemes to promote education and to develop the talents of individuals and groups, which the Assembly participated in developing. We must convert this into talents that can flourish in the business sector. This is the challenge to the Assembly: I hope that the attention, the resources and the support framework can be given to those who have a talent so that they and society can benefit from that talent, and that quality of life is

enhanced as a result.

**Janice Gregory:** I welcome the opportunity to comment again on participation in the arts. This is not the first time that we have discussed this; many of us have been concerned about participation in the arts in deprived communities for a considerable time. I will concentrate on those communities. In my short debate on community funding in March, I said that there is a problem in deprived communities in drawing down money from organisations such as the National Lottery and the Arts Council of Wales. By 4 March, only £4 million of lottery money had been spent in my constituency, Ogmere, from over £503 million in Wales.

4:50 p.m.

Part of the £4 million for arts projects was valued at just over £800,000. This compares to £6.5 million in Ceredigion, for example, and almost £34 million for the four Cardiff constituencies. During 2000–01, my constituency received £747,000 of lottery money compared to almost £65 million spent across Wales. During that same year, the Arts Council of Wales approved grants of only £90,000 for my constituency, compared with an all-Wales total of £13 million. The perception among the community groups, community workers and volunteers that I speak to is that the arts council is an elitist organisation. However, I hope that the measures detailed by Jenny today will go some way to ensuring that deprived communities get their fair share of funding.

There is a clear problem with community capacity and I hope that the Communities First initiative will help remedy that. I want a concerted effort to break down the barriers currently hindering communities to ensure that applications come forward, and that those applications are for projects that meet the relevant criteria and can proceed successfully.

**David Melding:** I will talk about Welsh

**Janice Gregory:** Croesawaf y cyfle i siarad eto ar gyfranogiad yn y celfyddydau. Nid dyma'r tro cyntaf inni drafod hyn; mae llawer ohonom yn bryderus ynghylch cyfranogiad yn y celfyddydau mewn cymunedau difreintiedig ers cryn amser. Canolbwyntiaf ar y cymunedau hynny. Yn fy nadl fer ar ariannu cymunedol ym Mawrth, dywedais fod problem mewn cymunedau difreintiedig o ran tynnu'r arian i lawr oddi wrth sefydliadau fel y Loteri Cenedlaethol a Chyngor Celfyddydau Cymru. Erbyn 4 Mawrth, dim ond £4 miliwn o arian loteri oedd wedi'i wario yn fy etholaeth i, Ogwr, o'r dros £503 miliwn yng Nghymru.

Yr oedd rhan o'r £4 miliwn ar gyfer prosiectau celfyddydol wedi'i phrisio ar ychydig dros £800,000. Mae hyn yn cymharu â £6.5 miliwn yng Ngheredigion, er enghraifft, a bron i £34 miliwn i bedair etholaeth Caerdydd. Yn ystod 2000-01, derbyniodd fy etholaeth i £747,000 o arian loteri o gymharu â bron i £65 miliwn a wariwyd ledled Cymru. Yn ystod yr un flwyddyn honno, cymeradwyodd Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru grantiau o ddim ond £90,000 i'm hetholaeth i, o gymharu â chyfanswm o £13 miliwn i Gymru gyfan. Y canfyddiad ymhlith y grwpiau cymunedol, y gweithwyr cymunedol a'r gwirfoddolwyr y siaradaf fi â hwy yw fod cyngor y celfyddydau yn gorff elitaidd. Er hynny, gobeithiaf yr aiff y mesurau a ddisgrifiwyd gan Jenny heddiw beth ffordd i sicrhau y caiff cymunedau difreintiedig eu cyfran deg o gyllid.

Mae problem glir gyda gallu cymunedau a gobeithiaf y bydd y fenter Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf yn helpu i unioni hynny. Mae arnaf eisiau cyd-ymdrech i chwalu'r muriau sydd yn rhwystr i gymunedau ar hyn o bryd, i sicrhau y daw ceisiadau gerbron, a bod y ceisiadau hynny ar gyfer prosiectau sy'n ateb y meini prawf perthnasol ac a all fynd yn eu blaenau'n llwyddiannus.

**David Melding:** Siaradaf am arlunio yng

painting. We have a great tradition in the visual arts in Wales, but it is often undervalued. Last Saturday, *The Times* ran a large article on Welsh art. The splendid headline read 'Jubilee show of 'Old Masters' from Wales'. It talked about a renaissance in Welsh painting, and modern artists such as Sir Kyffin Williams. We have a splendid picture by him in the Chamber, of Snowdon in winter. An equally splendid pastoral scene by him, of Snowdon in summer, hangs in one of the committee rooms. Other artists such as Brendan Burns, Iwan Bala, Deborah Lloyd, Vivienne Williams, David Humphreys, Stan and Judith Rosenthal and Nicholas Evans were all mentioned in a national newspaper. That shows the capacity of Welsh art to astonish and delight. However, it is not something that is commonly on view in Wales. In fact, all the exhibitions referred to, bar one, are currently showing in English galleries. That is disappointing.

However, the article in *The Times* reserved particular praise for the Neath-born artist, Will Roberts. I am particularly proud, as I am from Neath, to read of his fame and appreciation. He is now gaining an international reputation. A fine example of his work hangs in the milling area, 'Old Man with a Watch'. It is on the left as you leave the Chamber. He has been called by *The Times*, 'The first of Wales's "Old Masters"'.

That is a wonderful accolade. However, it is ironic that you must come to the National Assembly to see much of this splendid art that is not held in a coherent public collection anywhere in Wales.

To be fair, we should pay tribute to the National Library of Wales and the National Museums and Galleries Wales, as they do sterling work to promote the visual arts in Wales. I noticed that the Minister referred to the possibility of a national gallery on a separate, discrete site being open to public consultation. The Minister ought to give a lead and make a policy decision. It is alright for our agents to consult on public policy, but we should be initiating. A national gallery could hold an international collection, but it

Nghymru. Mae gennym draddodiad gwych yn y celfyddydau gweledol yng Nghymru, ond caiff ei ddibrisio'n aml. Ddydd Sadwrn diwethaf, rhedodd *The Times* erthygl fawr ar gelfyddyd Cymru. Y pennawd ardderchog oedd 'Jubilee show of 'Old Masters' from Wales'. Soniai am ddadenni mewn arlunio Cymreig, ac arlunwyr modern megis Syr Kyffin Williams. Mae gennym lun gwych ganddo yn y Siambr, o'r Wyddfa yn y gaeaf. Mae golygfa wledig yr un mor hyfryd ganddo, o'r Wyddfa yn yr haf, yn crogi yn un o'r ystafelloedd pwyllgor. Enwyd arlunwyr eraill fel Brendan Burns, Iwan Bala, Deborah Lloyd, Vivienne Williams, David Humphreys, Stan a Judith Rosenthal a Nicholas Evans i gyd mewn papur newydd cenedlaethol. Dyna ddangos gallu celfyddyd Cymru i synnu a swyno. Er hynny, nid yw'n rhywbeth a welir yn gyffredin yng Nghymru. Yn wir, mae pob un o'r arddangosfeydd y cyfeiriwyd atynt, namyn un, ar ddangos ar hyn o bryd mewn orielau yn Lloegr. Mae hynny'n siomedig.

Fodd bynnag, rhoddodd yr erthygl yn *The Times* glod arbennig i'r arlunydd Will Roberts, sy'n enedigol o Gastell-nedd. Yr wyf yn arbennig o falch, gan fy mod innau o Gastell-nedd, o ddarllen am ei enwogrwydd a'r gwerthfawrogiad ohono. Mae'n ennill enw rhyngwladol erbyn hyn. Mae enghraifft dda o'i waith ar y wal yn y neuadd, 'Hen Ŵr ag Oriawr'. Mae ar y chwith wrth ichi adael y Siambr. 'The first of Wales's "Old Masters"' oedd disgrifiad *The Times* o Will Roberts.

Dyna anrhydedd o fri. Fodd bynnag, mae'n eironig fod yn rhaid ichi ddod i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i weld llawer o'r gwaith celf bendigedig hwn na welir mewn casgliad cyhoeddus cydlynol yn unman yng Nghymru.

A bod yn deg, dylem dalu teyrnged i Lyfrgell Genedlaethol Cymru ac Amgueddfeydd ac Oriellau Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan y gwnânt waith rhagorol i hyrwyddo'r celfyddydau gweledol yng Nghymru. Sylwais fod y Gweinidog yn sôn fod y posibilrwydd o gael oriel genedlaethol ar safle ar wahân yn agored i ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus. Dylai'r Gweinidog roi arweiniad a gwneud penderfyniad polisi. Mae'n iawn i'n hasiantau ymgynghori ar bolisi cyhoeddus, ond dylem fod yn gwthio'r cwch i'r dŵr.



could also present to the people of Wales and the world a thematic and chronological collection of Welsh art.

**Phil Williams:** Would you include the Museum of Modern Art at Machynlleth, in Tabernacl, which in small premises shows the absolute excellence of Welsh art and gives us some idea of what a national gallery could be like?

**David Melding:** Such galleries could be part of the national gallery movement. Although I strongly believe that City Hall ought to be the main site—it would be my preferred site, subject to consultation and ability to purchase—it would be important to have satellite galleries linked to the national gallery.

If we project—[*Interruption.*]

**Peter Law:** Given that so many people are suffering throughout Wales as a result of poverty, why does the Conservative Party—which underwent a transformation last weekend and is supposed to be caring for people—want to pour more millions of pounds into a project in Cardiff? Some people in Wales are excluded and suffering great deprivation. How can you justify spending more?

**David Melding:** Art is the world of ideas and if we take ourselves seriously, I have a vision to present it as a more coherent world, make Wales central to it, set up a national gallery and ask people to visit Wales and Cardiff to see its outstanding collection. They could then visit the sites that inspired the art, namely industrial Wales, Snowdonia and so on. That is my vision. It would be a splendid aspect of our nationhood if, at last, we had this national gallery.

On participation in the arts, not only does Wales have an outstanding but undervalued—at least at home—tradition in the visual arts, but that tradition is firmly based in the community. Will Roberts was a chemist and therefore a part-time artist in a sense. Nicholas Evans was a miner and

Gallai oriel genedlaethol ddal casgliad rhyngwladol, ond gallai hefyd gyflwyno i bobl Cymru a'r byd gasgliad thematig a chronolegol o gelfyddyd Gymreig.

**Phil Williams:** A fyddech yn cynnwys yr Amgueddfa Gelf Fodern ym Machynlleth, yn y Tabernacl, sydd, mewn adeilad bach, yn dangos gwir ardderchogrwydd celf Cymru ac yn rhoi rhyw syniad inni o beth y gallai oriel genedlaethol fod?

**David Melding:** Gallai orielau o'r fath fod yn rhan o fudiad yr oriel genedlaethol. Er fy mod yn credu'n gryf mai Neuadd y Ddinas ddylai fod y prif safle—dyna'r safle a ddewiswn i, yn amodol ar ymgynghoriad a'r gallu i brynu—byddai'n bwysig cael orielau allanol yn gysylltiedig â'r oriel genedlaethol.

Os rhagamcanwn—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Peter Law:** Gan fod cymaint o bobl yn dioddef drwy Gymru gyfan oherwydd tlodi, pam y mae'r Blaid Geidwadol—a gafodd weddnewidiad y penwythnos diwethaf ac sydd i fod i ofalu am bobl—eisiau tywallt mwy o filiynau o bunnoedd i brosiect yng Nghaerdydd? Mae rhai pobl yng Nghymru wedi'u hallgáu ac yn dioddef amddifadedd mawr. Sut allwch chi gyfiawnhau gwario mwy?

**David Melding:** Byd y syniadau yw celfyddyd ac os cymerwn ein hunain o ddifrif, mae gennyf weledigaeth i'w gyflwyno fel byd mwy cydlynol, gwneud Cymru'n ganolog iddo, sefydlu oriel genedlaethol a gofyn i bobl ddod i Gymru a Chaerdydd i weld ei chasgliad arbennig. Gallent wedyn ymweld â'r safleoedd a ysbrydolodd y gwaith celf, sef Cymru ddiwydiannol, Eryri ac ati. Dyna fy ngweledigaeth. Byddai'n agwedd fendigedig ar ein cenedligrwydd pe caem yr oriel genedlaethol hon o'r diwedd.

O ran cyfranogiad yn y celfyddydau, nid yn unig y mae gan Gymru draddodiad eithriadol ond heb ei werthfawrogi—gartref, o leiaf—yn y celfyddydau gweledol, ond mae'r traddodiad hwnnw wedi'i seilio'n gadarn yn y gymuned. Yr oedd Will Roberts yn fferylllydd ac felly'n arlunydd rhan-amser ar

mostly painted in retirement, as did Kyffin Williams. These people have been rooted in their communities. We can give great encouragement to the people of Wales in the Eisteddfod tradition to get involved in the arts, not only community art, but art that can reach out to the international stage.

Finally, and this will be regarded as my final flight of fancy for which I will be shot down in flames, the Assembly should consider awarding a national, annual prize or medal for the visual arts. We want to be world leaders in the visual arts and we can be. If we start with the establishment of a national gallery, we will be well on our way to success.

**Peter Law:** I am pleased to speak in this debate because if we want to make a difference for people, this is our chance. I hear much hot air about wanting to include people who live in impoverished surroundings; this strategy must work towards achieving that. I hope that the arts council will move forward from its previous 'that will do' approach that I witnessed in my area. I have met its Chief Executive, Peter Tyndall, and he is a listener and a hands-on leader. He visits deprived areas, which is positive.

A great deal remains to be done in deprived communities—not only in my area but throughout Wales. We must be concerned about those areas. I was pleased that the Minister mentioned the WNO visits to the three comprehensive schools in Blaenau Gwent for which I thank her. However, it will take more millions of pounds to redress the balance as far as cultural investment in Wales is concerned.

I pay tribute to my local authority, Blaenau Gwent County Borough Council, which I cannot praise enough because it is strong on arts and leisure. It carries this burden in a deprived community and needs more support in its efforts to increase accessibility to the arts; it currently does so on a limited budget and I admire that. The Chair of the Culture Committee, Rhodri Glyn, must ensure that

un olwg. Glöwr oedd Nicholas Evans, a pheintiai'n bennaf wedi iddo ymddeol, fel y gwnâi Kyffin Williams. Yr oedd gan y bobl hyn wreiddiau yn eu cymunedau. Gallwn roi anogaeth fawr i bobl Cymru yn y traddodiad Eisteddfodol i ymwneud â'r celfyddydau, nid yn unig gelfyddyd gymunedol, ond celf a all gyrraedd allan i'r llwyfan rhyngwladol.

Yn olaf, a gellir ystyried hyn fel fy ehediad dychymyg olaf, y caf fy saethu i lawr mewn fflamau amdano, dylai'r Cynulliad ystyried rhoi gwobr neu fedal flynyddol genedlaethol am y celfyddydau gweledol. Mae arnom eisiau arwain y byd yn y celfyddydau gweledol a gallwn wneud hynny. Os dechreuwn gyda sefydlu oriel genedlaethol, byddwn ymhell ar ein ffordd i lwyddiant.

**Peter Law:** Yr wyf yn falch o siarad ar y ddadl hon oherwydd os ydym am wneud gwahaniaeth i bobl, dyma'n cyfle. Clywaf lawer o falu awyr ynghylch bod eisiau cynnwys pobl sy'n byw mewn amgylchiadau tlawd; rhaid i'r strategaeth hon weithio tuag at gyflawni hynny. Gobeithiaf y gwnaiff cyngor y celfyddydau symud ymlaen o'i agwedd 'mi wnaiff y tro' flaenorol, a welais yn fy ardal i. Yr wyf wedi cyfarfod â'i Brif Weithredwr, Peter Tyndall, ac mae'n wrandawr ac yn arweinydd ymarferol. Mae'n arfer ymweld ag ardaloedd difreintiedig, sydd yn gadarnhaol.

Mae llawer iawn i'w wneud o hyd mewn cymunedau difreintiedig—nid yn unig yn fy ardal i ond ledled Cymru. Rhaid inni bryderu am yr ardaloedd hynny. Yr oeddwn yn falch i'r Gweinidog grybwyll ymweliadau'r Cwmni Opera Cenedlaethol â'r tair ysgol gyfun ym Mlaenau Gwent, a diolchaf iddi am hynny. Fodd bynnag, bydd angen miliynau o bunnoedd eto i adfer y cydbwysedd o safbwynt buddsoddi diwylliannol yng Nghymru.

Talaf deyrnged i'm hawdurdod lleol, Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Blaenau Gwent, na allaf ei ganmol ddigon oherwydd y mae'n gryf ar gelfyddydau a hamdden. Mae'n cario'r baich hwn mewn cymuned ddifreintiedig ac mae arno angen mwy o gefnogaeth yn ei ymdrechion i hwyluso mynediad i'r celfyddydau; gwna hynny ar hyn o bryd ar gyllideb gyfyngedig ac edmygaf hynny.

the arts council focuses on these areas because he represents some of them and understands my points. I look to him as a guardian of fair play. Everyone here has that duty. Scrutiny committees are not in place for us to exchange platitudes, but for us to find out what is going on and represent people throughout Wales, not only in Cardiff city. That has been one of our weaknesses.

Therefore, what will we do about deprived areas and communities outside this capital in terms of the arts? The Conservative amendments presented by Uncle Mott must make him feel uncomfortable bearing in mind that he has said that he believes in a fairer distribution of resources, for which I respect him. However, he is being set up in having to put forward these amendments.

Amendment 2 is the height of hypocrisy, given their full support for the opera house development and its £56 million budget in the face of much opposition in Wales.

5:00 p.m.

**Gareth Jones:** Yr ydych yn edliw canolfan y mileniwm bron bob tro yr ydych yn sôn am y celfyddydau. Sut ydych yn cysoni hynny â bron i biliwn o bunnoedd y gwastraffodd Llywodraeth Lafur Llundain ar Dôm y Mileniwm? Oni fyddai'r arian hwnnw wedi ei groesawu yn eich etholaeth chi?

**Peter Law:** The money wasted on the dome in London was a disgrace. I do not condone that. However, the fact that you voted for the £56 million budget to build the millennium centre was also a disgrace. Ask the opinion of the people of Conwy, not me, because they are asking questions about you, Gareth. It is a fact that £56 million of public funding is being given to build the centre—I have done the sums—and £10 million was purloined from the arts council.

Rhaid i Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Diwylliant, Rhodri Glyn, sicrhau bod cyngor y celfyddydau yn canolbwyntio ar yr ardaloedd hyn oherwydd mae yntau'n cynrychioli rhai ohonynt ac yn deall fy mhwyntiau. Edrychaf ato ef fel gwarchodwr chwarae teg. Mae'r ddyletswydd honno ar bawb yma. Ni sefydlwyd pwyllgorau archwilio er mwyn i ni gael cyfnewid ystrydebau, ond er mwyn inni ddarganfod beth sy'n mynd ymlaen a chynrychioli pobl drwy Gymru gyfan, nid dim ond yn ninas Caerdydd. Dyna fu un o'n gwendidau ni.

Felly, beth a wnawn ni ynghylch ardaloedd a chymunedau difreintiedig y tu allan i'r brifddinas hon o safbwynt y celfyddydau? Mae'n rhaid fod gwelliannau'r Ceidwadwyr a gyflwynwyd gan Ewythr Mott yn gwneud iddo deimlo'n anghyfforddus o gofio ei fod wedi dweud ei fod yn credu mewn dosbarthu adnoddau'n decach, rhywbeth yr wyf yn ei barchu amdano. Fodd bynnag, mae'n cael ei wneud yn gocyn hitio o orfod cyflwyno'r gwelliannau hyn.

Rhagrith noeth yw gwelliant 2, o gofio'u cefnogaeth lawn i ddatblygiad y tŷ opera a'i gyllideb o £56 miliwn yn wyneb gwrthwynebiad mawr yng Nghymru.

**Gareth Jones:** You whinge about the millennium centre almost every time you mention the arts. How do you reconcile that with the billion pounds or so that the London Labour Government wasted on the Millennium Dome? Would some of that money not have been welcomed in your constituency?

**Peter Law:** Yr oedd yr arian a wastraffwyd ar y Dôm yn Llundain yn warth. Nid wyf yn amddiffyn hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ffaith i chi bleidleisio dros y gyllideb £56 miliwn i adeiladu canolfan y mileniwm yn warth hefyd. Holwch farn pobl Conwy, nid fi, oherwydd maent hwy'n gofyn cwestiynau amdano chi, Gareth. Mae'n ffaith fod £56 miliwn o arian cyhoeddus yn cael ei roi i adeiladu'r ganolfan—yr wyf wedi gwneud y symiau—a chymerwyd £10 miliwn oddi wrth gyngor y celfyddydau.

Amendment 3 is remarkable. The Conservatives, with their hidden agenda, want a national gallery. This is one of only two of their Assembly policies. The first was fox hunting and the second is a national gallery in City Hall.

**Nick Bourne:** Before the Member moves on to the national gallery, which is something that we all need, will he remind us why he was suspended from the Labour group? Was it not because of his stance on the Wales Millennium Centre? I ask this in case anyone is given the impression that the Labour/Liberal administration is not in favour of it.

**Peter Law:** It is a notable historical fact that I was expelled from the Labour group for voting against the millennium centre and the £56 million budget. Thousands of people in Wales believed that I did the right thing. Therefore, I am not unhappy about that incident and my constituency party and the people of Blaenau Gwent in particular believe that what I did was right.

The people of Blaenau Gwent and many other constituencies will support me when I say that the Tories have raised the issue of an arts gallery but have not mentioned a children's hospital today. They disingenuously mentioned it when we discussed the new Assembly building and did not mention it at all when they wanted £56 million for the opera house. The fact that they have not mentioned it today shows their hypocrisy for using such a wonderful concept as the children's hospital as a throwaway idea. They now want another £50 million to build an arts gallery in Cardiff. There are Members from all parties who may support that. The people of Wales—

**Jonathan Morgan:** I bring groups from my constituency around this building, which is probably the largest art gallery in Wales at present. I have six works of art in my office waiting to be displayed in the milling area by an artist from Pembrokeshire called Stan Rosenthal, who is a good friend of mine and his works of arts were displayed this week—*[Interruption.]* It is not commercialism. The work of a renowned artist has to be displayed in this building when it should be displayed

Mae gwelliant 3 yn hynod. Mae ar y Ceidwadwyr, gyda'u hagenda gudd, eisiau oriel genedlaethol. Dyma un o ddau yn unig o'u polisiau yn y Cynulliad. Hela llwynogod oedd y cyntaf ac oriel genedlaethol yn Neuadd y Ddinas yw'r ail.

**Nick Bourne:** Cyn i'r Aelod symud ymlaen at yr oriel genedlaethol, sy'n rhywbeth y mae arnom i gyd ei angen, a wnaiff ein hatgoffa pam y cafodd ei ddiarddel o'r grŵp Llafur? Onid oherwydd ei safiad ar Ganolfan y Mileniwm ydoedd? Gofynnaf hyn rhag ofn i rywun gael yr argraff nad yw'r weinyddiaeth Lafur/Ryddfrydol o'i phlaid.

**Peter Law:** Mae'n ffaith hanesyddol nodedig y cefais fy niarddel o'r grŵp Llafur am bleidleisio yn erbyn canolfan y mileniwm a'r gyllideb £56 miliwn. Credodd miloedd o bobl yng Nghymru fy mod wedi gwneud y peth iawn. Felly, nid wyf yn anhapus ynglŷn â'r digwyddiad hwnnw ac mae fy mhlaid yn yr etholaeth a phobl Blaenau Gwent yn enwedig yn credu fod yr hyn a wneuthum yn iawn.

Bydd pobl Blaenau Gwent a llawer o etholaethau eraill yn fy nghefnogi pan ddywedaf fod y Torïaid wedi codi mater oriel gelf ond nad ydynt wedi sôn am ysbyty plant heddiw. Soniasant amdano'n ddigon ffuantus pan oeddem yn trafod adeilad newydd y Cynulliad ac ni soniasant amdano o gwbl pan oedd arnynt eisiau £56 miliwn ar gyfer y tŷ opera. Mae'r ffaith nad ydynt wedi sôn amdano heddiw'n dangos eu rhagrith am ddefnyddio cysyniad mor wych ag ysbyty plant fel syniad ffwrdd-â-hi. Yn awr mae arnynt eisiau £50 miliwn arall i adeiladu oriel gelf yng Nghaerdydd. Mae Aelodau o bob plaid sydd efallai'n cefnogi hynny. Ni fyddai pobl Cymru'n—

**Jonathan Morgan:** Deuaf â grwpiau o'm hetholaeth o gwmpas yr adeilad hwn, sydd ar hyn o bryd yr oriel gelf fwyaf yng Nghymru fwy na thebyg. Mae gennyf chwe darn o gelfyddyd yn fy swyddfa'n aros i gael eu harddangos yn y neuadd gan arlunydd o Sir Benfro o'r enw Stan Rosenthal, sy'n gyfaill da imi a chafodd ei weithiau celfyddydol eu harddangos yr wythnos hon—*[Torri ar draws.]* Nid masnacheiddiwch mohono. Mae'n rhaid arddangos gwaith arlunydd o fri

in a national art gallery. Do you not believe that we should have a vision for an art gallery and put that into place as soon as possible?

**Peter Law:** I will come to that in a moment. I am sad about that situation.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You will need to come to it fairly quickly.

**Peter Law:** I am trying but I was interrupted. The people of Wales would not accept another multi-million pound arts development in the capital at the expense of the rest of Wales. I am not against such a development, but it is not acceptable to build it in Cardiff at the expense of the rest of Wales. However, if the Government wishes to fly in the face of public opinion—I remind you of the thousands of *Welsh Mirror* readers who wrote in about the issue—then I propose a formula today. For every million pounds that is put into a major national leisure facility in Cardiff, the Government should set up a fund for a matching million pounds to be spent in any other part of Wales such as Ogmere, Blaenau Gwent and Rhondda so that the money is shared by all the people of Wales. That is what we want. If you are excluded and have no opportunity then you need to be given that chance. That is why I ask that the Government takes note of my suggestion. We cannot afford to see another £50 million squandered on an airy-fairy scheme to develop an art gallery in Cardiff.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yn gyntaf, hoffwn ymateb i sylwadau pwysig Peter Law bod angen i Aelodau sy'n cynrychioli etholaethau nad ydynt yn y gorffennol efallai wedi derbyn eu siâr o'r celfyddydau sicrhau bod y celfyddydau yn weladwy ac ar gael i bobl yn yr etholaethau hynny. Yr oeddwn yn falch i Peter symud tua diwedd ei araith oddi wrth feirniadu'r hyn sy'n digwydd ym mhrifddinas Cymru—rhaid inni beidio ag anghofio mai Caerdydd yw'r brifddinas—ac yn hytrach yn ystyried hynny fel her a chyfle i sbarduno buddsoddiad yn y celfyddydau mewn etholaethau fel ei etholaeth ef a'm hetholaeth i. Gallaf ei sicrhau fy mod yn cytuno ag ef yn hynny o beth ac y caiff y pwynt ei godi'n gyson yn y Pwyllgor Diwylliant. Mae

yn yr adeilad hwn pan ddylid ei arddangos mewn oriel gelf genedlaethol. Oni chredwch y dylem gael gweledigaeth ar gyfer oriel gelf a rhoi honno yn ei lle cyn gynted ag y bo modd?

**Peter Law:** Deuaf at hynny mewn munud. Yr wyf yn drist am y sefyllfa honno.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Bydd angen ichi ddod ato'n weddol fuan.

**Peter Law:** Yr wyf yn ceisio, ond torrwyd ar fy nhraws. Ni fyddai pobl Cymru'n derbyn datblygiad celfyddydol arall ar gost o filiynau o bunnoedd yn y brifddinas ar draul gweddill Cymru. Nid wyf yn erbyn datblygiad o'r fath, ond nid yw'n dderbyniol ei adeiladu yng Nghaerdydd ar draul gweddill Cymru. Fodd bynnag, os dymuna'r Llywodraeth fynd yn groes i'r farn gyhoeddus—fe'ch atgoffaf am y miloedd o ddarllenwyr y *Welsh Mirror* a ysgrifennodd lythyr am y mater—yna cynigiau fformiwla heddiw. Am bob miliwn o bunnoedd a roddir i gyfleuster hamdden cenedlaethol mawr yng Nghaerdydd, dylai'r Llywodraeth sefydlu cronfa i wario miliwn o bunnoedd cyfatebol mewn unrhyw ran arall o Gymru fel Ogwr, Blaenau Gwent a'r Rhondda fel y caiff yr arian ei rannu â holl bobl Cymru. Dyna beth sydd arnom ei eisiau. Os cewch eich cau allan heb unrhyw gyfle yna mae angen rhoi'r cyfle hwnnw ichi. Dyna pam y gofynnaf i'r Llywodraeth nodi fy awgrym. Ni allwn fforddio gweld gwastraffu £50 miliwn arall ar gynllun penchwiban i ddatblygu oriel gelf yng Nghaerdydd.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** First, I would like to respond to Peter Law's important comments that Members who represent constituencies which perhaps have not received their share of the arts in the past need to ensure that the arts are visible and available in those constituencies. I was glad that towards the end of his speech Peter moved away from criticising what is happening in the capital city of Wales—we must not forget that Cardiff is the capital—but rather considered that as a challenge and an opportunity to attract investment in the arts into constituencies such as his own and mine. I assure him that I agree with him in that respect and that the subject will be raised regularly at the Culture Committee. Other

aelodau eraill y Pwyllgor hwnnw'n ymwybodol o'u cyfrifoldeb i graffu ar fuddsoddiad yn y celfyddydau er mwyn sicrhau dosbarthiad teg. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar iddo am godi'r pwynt hwnnw mewn ffordd adeiladol.

O ran y cynnig sydd ger ein bron, efallai ein bod yn mynd dros hen dir, ond mae'n dir pwysig sydd hefyd yn ffrwythlon erbyn hyn. Croesawaf 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol' yn ddiamod. Nid oedd y drafft cyntaf a ddaeth i'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant yn dderbyniol gan yr aelodau ac felly fe'i beirniadwyd yn adeiladol. Talaf deyrnged i'r Gweinidog am aildrafftio rhannau helaeth o'r ddogfen ac, yn fwy na hynny, am iddi ymgynghori'n helaeth, nid yn unig â'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant ond hefyd â phobl ym myd y celfyddydau, er mwyn sicrhau mewnbwn cadarnhaol ac adeiladol. Mae'r ddogfen yn esiampl berffaith o'r modd y gall proses ymgynghorol fod yn adeiladol ac yn greadigol, a dylid talu teyrnged i'r Gweinidog am hynny. Mae'r ddogfen hefyd yn sail i ddatblygu'r celfyddydau yng Nghymru.

Yr wyf hefyd yn croesawu'r buddsoddiad sylweddol a hollbwysig yng Nghyngor Celfyddydau Cymru, a gaiff, yn ei dro, ei fuddsoddi'n adeiladol ledled Cymru. Croesawaf ymhellach ailstrwythuro'r cyngor. Ymunaf â Peter Law wrth dalu teyrnged i Peter Tyndall am ei waith mewn byr amser, ac i'r cadeirydd, Sybil Crouch, am y ffordd y mae'r cyngor wedi rheoli'r newidiadau. Derbyniaf rai o'r pwyntiau a wnaed gan Tom Middlehurst, a dychwelaf atynt mewn munud.

Ynglŷn â'r sylwadau cyffredinol a wnaeth y Gweinidog, cefais gyfle i wyllo perfformiad Clwyd Theatr Cymru yng nghanolfan hamdden Castell-nedd. Talaf deyrnged i elfen symudol y cwmni gan ei bod yn hollbwysig bod pobl yn gallu mynd i ganolfannau hamdden a neuaddau ledled Gymru a mwynhau'r profiad theatrig llawn. Mae'n bwysig cydnabod a chefnogi'r ffaith fod Clwyd Theatr Cymru, drwy'r fenter bwysig hon, yn sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd. Croesawn hefyd y gronfa gelfyddydau i ieuencid, ynghyd â chymorthdaliadau'r loteri.

members of that Committee are aware of their responsibility in scrutinising arts investment to ensure fair distribution. I am grateful to him for raising the point in a constructive manner.

In terms of the motion before us, perhaps it rakes over old ground, but it is important ground that is also, by now, bearing fruit. I welcome 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol' unconditionally. The first draft that came before the Culture Committee was unacceptable to members and was therefore criticised constructively. I pay tribute to the Minister for redrafting substantial passages and, more importantly, for the extensive consultation she undertook, not only with the Culture Committee but also with people in the arts world in order to gain a positive and constructive input. The document is a perfect example of how consultation can be constructive and creative, and tribute should be paid to the Minister for that. The document is also a basis for the development of the arts in Wales.

I also welcome the substantial and crucial investment in the Arts Council of Wales, which, in turn, will be constructively invested throughout Wales. Restructuring within the council is also welcome. I join Peter Law in paying tribute to Peter Tyndall for his achievements in such a short period of time, and to the chair, Sybil Crouch, for the way the council has managed these changes. I accept some of Tom Middlehurst's points, and will return to them shortly.

On some of the Minister's more general points, I had an opportunity to see a Clwyd Theatr Cymru performance at Neath leisure centre. I pay tribute to the company's travelling theatre, as it is vital that people are able to go to leisure centres and halls throughout Wales and enjoy the full theatric experience. It is important to recognise and support the fact that, through this important initiative, Clwyd Theatr Cymru ensures that that happens. We also welcome the youth arts fund, along with the lottery grants.

I turn to the charge of elitism directed at the WNO and other flagship initiatives. The Minister referred to the fact that it is important to remind Members of the important community work that the Welsh National Opera undertakes. It recently unveiled its plans for the WNO MAX initiative. A total of £500,000 has been earmarked for this important project, and Sarah Alexander has been appointed to oversee the work as project director. I am sure that all the people who had an opportunity to see the Katarina project in Merthyr Tydfil would agree that it was an unmitigated success. The Wise Eye Spring 2002 music initiative is an attempt to stimulate and engage children with special needs, which is to be commended. The WNO's youth opera offers opportunities for the youth of Wales to participate in music at the highest level possible. The partnership with Diversions dance company has led to the shake and shout workshop for 10 to 13-year-olds, which will be available during the summer. We need to get away from the idea that the WNO is an elitist organisation that only offers entertainment to those who enjoy opera.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You need to wind up now, Rhodri.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** May I ask three specific questions?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. No, you cannot. You do not have enough time.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Having referred to the important restructuring of the arts council, will the Minister accept that problems remain, and that there is a need to look critically at what has happened. We accept that there has been movement, but let us not think that all the arts council's problems have suddenly disappeared. There is more work to be done. I hope that the Minister and the Culture Committee will look critically at some of the things that still happen within the arts council.

5:10 p.m.

**Eleanor Burnham:** The Welsh Liberal

Trof at y cyhuddiad o elitiaeth a anelir at y Cwmni Opera Cenedlaethol a mentrau pwysig eraill. Cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog at y ffaith ei bod yn bwysig atgoffa Aelodau am y gwaith cymunedol pwysig a wna'r Cwmni Opera Cenedlaethol. Yn ddiweddar, dadorchuddiodd ei gynlluniau ar gyfer menter WNO MAX. Clustnodwyd cyfanswm o £500,000 ar gyfer y prosiect pwysig hwn, a phenodwyd Sarah Alexander i oruchwylio'r gwaith fel cyfarwyddwr y prosiect. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai pawb a gafodd gyfle i weld prosiect Katarina ym Merthyr Tudful yn cytuno ei fod yn llwyddiant diymwad. Mae menter gerddorol gwanwyn 2002 'Wise Eye' yn ymgais i symbylu ac ysgogi plant ag anghenion arbennig, sydd i'w chymeradwyo. Mae opera ieuenctid y cwmni cenedlaethol yn cynnig cyfleoedd i ieuenctid Cymru gymryd rhan mewn cerddoriaeth ar y lefel uchaf bosibl. Arweiniodd y bartneriaeth â chwmni dawns Diversions at y gweithdy ysgwyd a gweiddi i blant 10 i 13 mlwydd oed, a fydd ar gael yn ystod yr haf. Mae angen symud oddi wrth y syniad fod y Cwmni Opera Cenedlaethol yn sefydliad elitaidd nad yw ond yn cynnig adloniant i'r rheini sy'n mwynhau opera.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae angen ichi ddirwyn i ben yn awr, Rhodri.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A gaf fi ofyn tri chwestiwn penodol?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Na chewch. Nid oes gennych ddigon o amser.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Wedi cyfeirio at ailstrwythuro pwysig cyngor y celfyddydau, a wnaiff y Gweinidog dderbyn fod problemau o hyd, a bod angen edrych yn feiriadol ar yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd? Derbyniwn y bu datblygiad, ond na foed inni feddwl fod holl broblemau cyngor y celfyddydau wedi diflannu'n sydyn. Mae mwy o waith i'w wneud. Gobeithiaf yr edrycha'r Gweinidog a'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant yn graff ar rai o'r pethau sy'n dal i ddigwydd o fewn cyngor y celfyddydau.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae Democratiaid

Democrats welcome this debate. The culture strategy, 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol', is a significant step forward in Wales's cultural life, especially given its emphasis on young people, communities and cultural diversity. The strategy rightly recognises the intrinsic value of the arts and cultural activities. Arts help to make us better, more rounded and more fulfilled people. It is important to encourage greater participation in the arts and cultural activities, especially among young people, as it enriches lives. Despite what Peter Law said, many people, from all walks of life and from all social backgrounds, can and want to participate in all sorts of artistic activity.

The restructuring of the Arts Council of Wales was vital. We are delighted that, given its effective emphasis on local and community input, Clwyd Theatr Cymru, for instance, is doing such a wonderful job. That has already been mentioned. However, it needs increased financial support as we in north Wales know.

The partnership Government, in creating the post of Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language, has greatly assisted Wales's cultural life, as has Jenny Randerson's superb performance as Minister. Free entry to museums, for instance, which widens people's access to the arts, is brilliant. In 2001-02, more was spent in Wales on the arts per head of population than in the rest of the UK: £10 was spent on the arts per person in Wales whereas England spent only £8.50 per person. Scotland spent £9.87 and Northern Ireland spent £9.80 per person. Furthermore, the culture budget has increased by 11 per cent.

According to the digest of Welsh statistics 2001, of 1,400 people questioned during 2001 on their activities in the preceding month, 21 per cent had attended the cinema, 5 per cent had attended the theatre, ballet or opera, 3 per cent had attended a pop concert, 15 per cent had taken part in outdoor sport, and 4 per cent had taken part in indoor sport.

Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n croesawu'r ddatl hon. Mae'r strategaeth ddiwylliant, 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol', yn gam arwyddocaol ymlaen ym mywyd diwylliannol Cymru, yn enwedig o gofio'i phwyslais ar bobl ifanc, cymunedau ac amrywiaeth diwylliannol. Mae'r strategaeth yn deg yn cydnabod gwerth cynhenid y celfyddydau a gweithgareddau diwylliannol. Mae celfyddydau'n helpu i'n gwneud yn bobl well, mwy cyflawn a mwy bodlon. Mae'n bwysig annog mwy o gyfranogiad yn y celfyddydau a gweithgareddau diwylliannol, yn enwedig ymhlith pobl ifanc, gan ei fod yn cyfoethogi bywydau. Er gwaethaf yr hyn a ddywedodd Peter Law, mae llawer o bobl, o bob cefndir mewn bywyd, yn gallu ac yn dymuno cymryd rhan mewn pob math o weithgaredd celfyddydol.

Yr oedd ailstrwythuro Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru yn hanfodol. Yr ydym wrth ein bodd, o ystyried ei phwyslais effeithiol ar gyfraniad y gymuned leol, fod Clwyd Theatr Cymru, er enghraifft, yn gwneud gwaith mor dda. Crybwyllwyd hynny eisoes. Fodd bynnag, mae arni angen mwy o gefnogaeth ariannol, fel y gwyddom ni yn y Gogledd.

Mae'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth, wrth greu swydd y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Iaith Gymraeg, wedi cynorthwyo bywyd diwylliannol Cymru'n fawr, fel y mae perfformiad campus Jenny Randerson fel Gweinidog. Mae mynediad am ddim i amgueddfeydd, er enghraifft, sy'n agor y drws i bobl fwynhau'r celfyddydau, yn wych. Yn 2001-02, gwariwyd mwy yng Nghymru ar y celfyddydau am bob pen o'r boblogaeth nag yng ngweddill y DU: gwariwyd £10 y pen ar y celfyddydau yng Nghymru, a dim ond £8.50 y pen yn Lloegr. Gwariodd yr Alban £9.87 a gwariodd Gogledd Iwerddon £9.80 y pen. Ar ben hynny, mae'r gyllideb ddiwylliant wedi cynyddu 11 y cant.

Yn ôl crynodeb ystadegau Cymru 2001, o'r 1,400 o bobl a holwyd yn ystod 2001 am eu gweithgareddau yn y mis blaenorol, yr oedd 21 y cant wedi mynychu'r sinema, 5 y cant wedi mynychu'r theatr, bale neu opera, 3 y cant wedi mynychu cyngerdd pop, 15 y cant wedi cymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon awyr agored, a 4 y cant wedi cymryd rhan mewn



These figures highlight the low participation in regional cultural and sporting activities in Wales. The culture strategy rightly addresses that issue. Participation in cultural and sporting activities can be extremely rewarding as well as enjoyable. Taking part in cultural activities broadens the mind and, in terms of improving health, sport is beneficial and cost-effective. Both activities provide social opportunities and an active social life, which can help reduce stress as well as promoting good mental health and supporting community life.

**John Griffiths:** I will return to the theme that Janice developed earlier, in terms of encouraging and widening participation in, and an appreciation of, the arts. I welcome the year of cultural diversity in the arts recently announced in Wales by the Minister and the Arts Council of Wales. I especially welcome the focus on targeting artists from ethnic minority backgrounds, who have previously been under-represented in grant awards, to ensure that they have the opportunities that they should. As a representative of a constituency with a significant ethnic minority population, I welcome that.

As Rhodri Glyn Thomas mentioned, the Welsh National Opera MAX scheme is welcome and is impressive. It has appointed a director and has a core budget, which will hopefully lever in other moneys. It recognises the need to get out into schools and to the elderly in care, and encourages young people to take an interest in opera, with a new angle developed by the WNO. There are encouraging developments, which I am sure we all welcome, but I hope that the Arts Council of Wales and the Welsh National Opera will build on the recent developments that they have introduced, because much more needs to be done.

We have often talked in this context about the need to ensure that works of art are spread across many more venues in Wales. That has difficulties but, with political will and energy and commitment, it can be done. If we could

chwaraeon dan-do. Mae'r ffigurau hyn yn amlygu'r cyfranogiad isel mewn gweithgareddau diwylliannol a chwaraeon rhanbarthol yng Nghymru. Mae'r strategaeth ddiwylliant yn mynd i'r afael â hynny, a iawn hynny. Gall cyfranogi mewn gweithgareddau diwylliannol a chwaraeon roi budd yn ogystal â mwynhad. Mae cymryd rhan mewn gweithgareddau diwylliannol yn ehangu'r meddwl, ac, o safbwynt gwella iechyd, mae chwaraeon yn fuddiol ac yn gost-effeithiol. Mae'r ddau weithgaredd yn darparu cyfleoedd cymdeithasol a bywyd cymdeithasol llawn, a all helpu lleihau straen yn ogystal â hybu iechyd meddwl da a chynnal bywyd cymunedol.

**John Griffiths:** Dychwelaf at y thema a ddatblygodd Janice yn gynharach, o ran annog ac ehangu cyfranogiad yn y celfyddydau, a gwerthfawrogiad ohonynt. Croesawaf y flwyddyn amrywiaeth diwylliannol yn y celfyddydau a gyhoeddwyd yng Nghymru'n ddiweddar gan y Gweinidog a Chyngor Celfyddydau Cymru. Croesawaf yn arbennig y canolbwyntio ar dargedu artistiaid o leiafrifoedd ethnig, na chafodd gynrychiolaeth deg pan ddyfarnwyd grantiau yn y gorffennol, er mwyn sicrhau y cânt y cyfleoedd y dylent. Fel cynrychiolydd etholaeth â chyfran sylweddol o boblogaeth o leiafrifoedd ethnig, croesawaf hynny.

Fel y soniodd Rhodri Glyn Thomas, mae cynllun MAX y Cwmni Opera Cenedlaethol i'w groesawu ac yn drawiadol. Mae wedi penodi cyfarwyddwr ac mae ganddo gyllideb graidd, a fydd, gobeithio, yn denu arian o fannau eraill. Mae'n cydnabod yr angen i fynd allan i ysgolion a chartrefi henoed, ac yn annog pobl ifanc i ymddiddori mewn opera, gyda'r cwmni'n darparu ongl newydd. Mae datblygiadau calonogol, a groesewir gan bawb ohonom, yr wyf yn siŵr, ond gobeithiaf y gwnaiff Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru a'r Cwmni Opera Cenedlaethol adeiladu ar y datblygiadau diweddar a gyflwynwyd ganddynt, oherwydd mae angen gwneud llawer mwy.

Yr ydym wedi siarad yn aml yn y cyd-destun hwn am yr angen i sicrhau y caiff gweithiau celf eu gwasgaru ar draws llawer mwy o ganolfannau yng Nghymru. Mae anawsterau ynghlwm wrth hynny, ond gydag ewyllys

get works of art into our libraries, community centres, colleges, schools and commercial environments, we would take art to a far wider audience and encourage a greater appreciation of and involvement in the arts. As the Minister said, it is important that we mobilise local authorities, as they have an important role to play. In Newport, the local authority was imaginative and courageous in introducing an impressive schedule of public works of art, street art and public sculptures. It was controversial at the time, and it faced all the usual charges of wasting public money when there were far greater priorities and bread and butter issues such as pavements and roads and so on. However, it went ahead with the programme and those works of public art and street sculptures are popular in Newport and are increasing in popularity. Works of art such as the giant red steel wave by the riverfront in Newport give an identity to the town. It was useful in the campaign to gain city status for Newport and makes a meaningful statement about the town's tradition and history, including its maritime and steel industries. It is a fantastic work of art and has quickly become symbolic of Newport. Therefore, it is useful in marketing terms. If local authorities show some imagination, great dividends can accrue. The works of art in Newport encourage the people of the town to take more interest in the arts and to be more aware of them. That will feed into participation and appreciation across the board.

There are interesting developments, but much more needs to happen. We must ensure that all our communities develop an appreciation of, and participate in, the arts in Wales. If we can build on what has already happened, we can achieve a great deal for the people of Wales.

**The Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language (Jenny Randerson):** I am amazed by Owen John Thomas's contribution. That Plaid Cymru's arts and culture spokesperson should complain that we discuss the arts once every three months

gwleidyddol ac egni ac ymrwymiad, gellir ei wneud. Pe gallem gael gweithiau celf i mewn i'n llyfrgelloedd, ein canolfannau cymuned, ein colegau, ein hysgolion a'n canolfannau masnachol, aem â chelfyddyd at gynulleidfa lawer mwy gan annog gwerthfawrogiad a chyfranogiad llawer mwy yn y celfyddydau. Fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn ysgogi awdurdodau lleol, gan fod ganddynt hwy ran bwysig i'w chwarae. Yng Nghasnewydd, bu'r awdurdod lleol yn ddychmygus a dewr wrth gyflwyno rhaglen dda o weithiau celf cyhoeddus, celf stryd a cherfluniau cyhoeddus. Yr oedd yn ddadleuol ar y pryd, ac wynebai'r holl gyhuddiadau arferol o wastraffu arian cyhoeddus pan oedd blaenoriaethau llawer uwch a materion bara menyn fel palmentydd a ffyrdd ac ati. Fodd bynnag, aeth ymlaen â'r rhaglen ac mae'r gweithiau celf cyhoeddus a cherfluniau stryd hynny'n boblogaidd yng Nghasnewydd ac yn cynyddu o ran poblogrwydd. Mae gweithiau celf fel y don enfawr o ddur coch ar lan yr afon yng Nghasnewydd yn rhoi hunaniaeth i'r dref. Bu'n ddefnyddiol yn yr ymgyrch i gael statws dinas i Gasnewydd ac mae'n gwneud datganiad ystyrlon am draddodiad a hanes y dref, gan gynnwys ei diwydiannau morwrol a dur. Mae'n waith celf ffantastig a daeth yn fuan iawn i fod yn symbol o Gasnewydd. Felly, mae'n ddefnyddiol yn nhermau marchnata. Os dengys awdurdodau lleol ddychmyg, gall budd mawr ddeillio ohono. Mae'r gweithiau celf yng Nghasnewydd yn annog pobl y dref i gymryd mwy o ddiddordeb yn y celfyddydau a bod yn fwy ymwybodol ohonynt. Bydd hynny'n arwain at gyfranogi a gwerthfawrogi yn gyffredinol.

Y mae datblygiadau diddorol, ond rhaid i lawer mwy ddigwydd. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod ein holl gymunedau'n datblygu gwerthfawrogiad o'r celfyddydau yng Nghymru, ac yn cyfranogi ynddynt. Os gallwn adeiladu ar yr hyn a ddigwyddodd eisoes, gallwn gyflawni llawer iawn dros bobl Cymru.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Iaith Gymraeg (Jenny Randerson):** Mae cyfraniad Owen John Thomas yn fy syfrdanu. Mae'n anhygoel fod llefarydd Plaid Cymru ar y celfyddydau a diwylliant yn cwyno ein bod yn trafod y

is amazing. I make no apology for the fact that we are back here only three months later discussing the considerable progress on this. I refer Owen to the arts council's integrated schemes, its cultural diversity plan and its five-year development plan, all of which have been produced during the last three months. 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol' is hardly a bare cupboard. Owen John asked for my comments on music. I recommend the strategy to him, as there is much on music in it. It is a good read, and Owen should read it some time.

I welcome Glyn's international perspective, as that is important. I assure him that the arts council is funding our commitment to the Venice Biennale.

Tom said that there is unfinished business in terms of the Wallace report. He also mentioned the remuneration of the chair of the arts council. That is under discussion. I do not regard the arts council as the sole vehicle for delivery of arts funding. Clwyd Theatr Cymru's situation is under discussion, and I have discussed it with the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities.

Dafydd rightly emphasised the contribution of the arts to the economy. I am working closely with the Minister for Economic Development on the economic development potential of the arts. There are roughly 30,000 people employed in the arts in Wales. The arts make an important contribution to our economy. I am delighted at the contributions of the Wales Tourist Board and the Welsh Development Agency to Cymru'n Creu. They are active participants in it. The Wales Tourist Board has recently produced a cultural tourism strategy, which demonstrates its agenda.

I inform Janice that the lottery distributors are making concerted efforts to address areas where there are problems with the take-up of grants. However, if you had been in Blackwood Miners' Institute with Brian Hancock and me last Friday evening, where a few hundred primary school pupils were

celfyddydau un waith bob tri mis. Nid ymddiheuraf am y ffaith ein bod yn ôl yma ddim ond dri mis yn ddiweddarach yn trafod y datblygiadau sylweddol ar hyn. Tynnaf sylw Owen at gynlluniau integredig cyngor y celfyddydau, ei gynllun amrywiaeth diwylliannol a'i gynllun datblygu pum mlynedd, pob un wedi'i lunio yn ystod y tri mis diwethaf. Prin fod 'Creative Future: Cymru Greadigol' yn gwpwrdd gwag. Gofynnodd Owen John am fy sylwadau ar gerddoriaeth. Argymhellaf y strategaeth iddo, gan fod llawer am gerddoriaeth ynddi. Mae'n ddarllen da, a dylai Owen ei darllen ryw bryd.

Croesawaf safbwynt rhyngwladol Glyn, gan fod hynny'n bwysig. Fe'i sicrhaf fod cyngor y celfyddydau'n ariannu ein hymrwymiad i'r Biennale yn Fenis.

Dywedodd Tom fod busnes anorffenedig o ran adroddiad Wallace. Soniodd hefyd am dâl cadeirydd cyngor y celfyddydau. Mae hynny dan drafodaeth. Nid wyf yn ystyried mai cyngor y celfyddydau yw'r unig gerbyd i ddarparu cyllid i'r celfyddydau. Mae sefyllfa Clwyd Theatr Cymru dan drafodaeth, ac yr wyf wedi'i drafod â'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau.

Yr oedd Dafydd yn iawn i bwysleisio cyfraniad y celfyddydau i'r economi. Yr wyf yn cydweithio'n agos â'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd ar botensial y celfyddydau o safbwynt datblygu economaidd. Cyflogir oddeutu 30,000 o bobl yn y celfyddydau yng Nghymru. Gwna'r celfyddydau gyfraniad pwysig i'n heconomi. Yr wyf wrth fy modd gyda chyfraniadau Bwrdd Croeso Cymru ac Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru i Cymru'n Creu. Maent yn gyfranogwyr gweithredol ynddo. Yn ddiweddar cyhoeddodd y bwrdd croeso strategaeth twristiaeth ddiwylliannol, sy'n dangos beth yw ei agenda.

Hysbysaf Janice fod dosbarthwyr y loteri'n gwneud ymdrechion glew i edrych ar fannau lle ceir problemau o ran manteisio ar grantiau. Fodd bynnag, pe buasech chithau yn Sefydliad Glowyr y Coed Duon gyda Brian Hancock a mi nos Wener diwethaf, lle'r oedd rhai cannoedd o blant ysgol gynradd yn

participating in a cultural diversity day, you would not regard the Arts Council as elitist—quite the reverse.

David, I agree that the history of the visual arts in Wales, for example, the Rhondda group, shows the importance of visual arts in the community. However, there seems to be a clash of views between you and Glyn. Glyn said that he wanted more money to go to the rest of Wales, and you asked for money to come to a gallery in Cardiff. The museum is consulting on the matter, but it has several ideas. It is not just a matter of a building, but of what you put in it, as well as finding the money. Peter, you overlook the 70 per cent of people in your constituency who attend arts events every year. It is important to bear that in mind. Rhodri Glyn and John Griffiths rightly brought us back to the importance of community development in the arts, which is what I hoped this debate was about.

cyfranogi mewn diwrnod amrywiaeth diwylliannol, ni fydddech yn galw Cyngor y Celfyddydau yn elitaidd—i'r gwrthwyneb yn wir.

David, cytunaf fod hanes y celfyddydau gweledol yng Nghymru, er enghraifft, grŵp y Rhondda, yn dangos pwysigrwydd celfyddydau gweledol yn y gymuned. Fodd bynnag, mae'n ymddangos fod gwahaniaeth barn rhyngoch chi a Glyn. Dywedodd Glyn fod arno eisiau i fwy o arian fynd i weddill Cymru, a gofynasoch chi am ddarparu arian i oriel yng Nghaerdydd. Mae'r amgueddfa'n ymgynghori ar y mater, ond mae ganddi nifer o syniadau. Nid mater o adeilad yn unig ydyw, ond o beth a roddwch i mewn ynddo, yn ogystal â dod o hyd i'r arian. Peter, nid ydych yn ystyried y 70 y cant o bobl yn eich etholaeth sy'n mynychu digwyddiadau celfyddydol bob blwyddyn. Mae'n bwysig cofio hynny. Daeth Rhodri Glyn a John Griffiths â ni'n ôl at bwysigrwydd datblygu cymunedol yn y celfyddydau, sef yr hyn y gobeithiwn oedd craidd y ddadl hon.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 19, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26.*

*Amendment 1: For 19, Abstain 0, Against 26.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Janet  
Graham, William  
Hancock, Brian  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Melding, David  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*

*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 19, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 25.  
Amendment 2: For 19, Abstain 0, Against 25.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Janet  
Graham, William  
Hancock, Brian  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Melding, David  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendmen defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 19, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.  
Amendment 3: For 19, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Janet  
Graham, William  
Hancock, Brian  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Melding, David  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Thomas

Morgan, Rod  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â  
today's proceedings to a close. thrafodion heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.20 p.m.*  
*The session ended at 5.20 p.m.*